



# **Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru** **The National Assembly for Wales**

## **Y Pwyllgor Cyllid** **The Finance Committee**

**Dydd Iau, 27 Medi 2012**  
**Thursday, 27 September 2012**

### **Cynnwys** **Contents**

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon  
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

Adolygu'r Argymhellion a Wnaed gan y Pwyllgor ar gyfer Cyllideb Ddrafft Llywodraeth  
Cymru 2012-13  
Review of Recommendations made by the Committee for the Welsh Government's Draft  
Budget 2012-13

Papurau i'w Nodi  
Papers to Note

Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from the Meeting

Cofnodir y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal, cynhwysir  
trawsgriafiad o'r cyfieithu ar y pryd.

The proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee. In  
addition, a transcription of the simultaneous interpretation is included.

#### **Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol** **Committee members in attendance**

Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Christine Chapman	Llafur Labour

Jocelyn Davies	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)
Paul Davies	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Mike Hedges	Llafur Labour
Ieuan Wyn Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
Julie Morgan	Llafur Labour

**Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol**  
**National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance**

Dan Collier	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Joanest Jackson	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Gareth Price	Clerc Clerk

*Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 1.58 p.m.*  
*The meeting began at 1.58 p.m.*

**Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon**  
**Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions**

[1] **Jocelyn Davies:** I welcome you all to this meeting of the Finance Committee. Please switch off any electronic equipment. It is a public meeting, so you do not need to operate the microphones yourself. We are not expecting a fire drill, so if you hear the alarm, take direction from the ushers. We have had one apology from Ann Jones, who is not able to be with us today.

1.59 p.m.

**Adolygu'r Argymhellion a Wnaed gan y Pwyllgor ar gyfer Cyllideb Ddrafft**  
**Llywodraeth Cymru 2012-13**  
**Review of Recommendations made by the Committee for the Welsh**  
**Government's Draft Budget 2012-13**

[2] **Jocelyn Davies:** You will see the review of the recommendations made by our committee for the Welsh Government's draft budget in paper 1. I think that the Government has accepted, or virtually accepted—

[3] **Julie Morgan:** [*Inaudible.*] Is that the last one—consideration? It is the last one, is it?

[4] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, that is right. It will give more consideration to something. Do any Members want to comment? Are there any issues?

2.00 p.m.

[5] **Paul Davies:** Under recommendation 6, the Minister has said that she is happy to provide updates as appropriate, but not quarterly reports. Has she given any justification for that?

[6] **Jocelyn Davies:** No, we have not had any specific reason. She has just said that she is happy to provide updates 'as appropriate'. Shall we go back to ask why she is not willing to provide quarterly reports, Paul?

[7] **Paul Davies:** Yes, if everyone is happy with that.

[8] **Mike Hedges:** I would assume that the Minister gets quarterly reports anyway. All that we are asking is for those to be shared with us.

[9] **Jocelyn Davies:** Perhaps the Minister does not get quarterly reports. I am not sure. However, we will get clarification on what she considers to be appropriate as it is a departure from the quarterly pattern. We asked for clarification of the role of the delivery unit and the response is perhaps not as clear as we wanted, so we could ask for further clarification on that.

[10] **Christine Chapman:** On the benefits of a delivery unit, it is about drilling down into the detail, so we need detailed answers on this one.

[11] **Jocelyn Davies:** All right. What about the answer that we have had on recommendation 9 about local health boards ensuring that the plans are finalised so that we can judge whether the funding is sufficient? How do Members feel about that?

[12] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is a fairly dismissive response really, is it not? I think that we ought to go back on that one. How do they know whether it will be sufficient when we do not know what the delivery plans are?

[13] **Jocelyn Davies:** Shall we ask how they have come to the conclusion that it is sufficient without the plans being available?

[14] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Absolutely.

[15] **Jocelyn Davies:** Is there anything else?

[16] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Recommendations 2 and 3 appear to be okay, but it depends whether Assembly Commission officials are satisfied that it is working satisfactorily. We do not know, do we?

[17] **Mr Price:** I think that the proof of that will be how it is presented this year. It is not going to be published for another week or two, but once it has been published we will see whether it has been implemented.

[18] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, and we know that an awful lot of work has gone into discussions between Commission staff and Assembly Government officials in coming to an agreement on this. I do not think that there is any resistance. It is just a matter of providing the appropriate level of detail. We will be able to see that very shortly. It is something that we can always return to at another time if we feel that there is insufficient—

[19] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** However, in a way, we would have to rely on our officials telling us because we will not directly be part of those discussions.

[20] **Jocelyn Davies:** If they encounter any problem at all, I promise that I will report back to the committee.

[21] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That is fine.

[22] **Jocelyn Davies:** Is there anything else on this paper? I see that there is not.

2.03 p.m.

### **Papurau i'w Nodi Papers to Note**

[23] **Jocelyn Davies:** We have the minutes of the previous meeting. Is everyone satisfied with those as a true reflection of proceedings? I see that you are. Thank you. We have the Government response to our report on borrowing and capital funding. You will note that nearly all of our recommendations have been accepted. I think that there is one accepted in principle and another one for further consideration. Mike, do you want to make a comment?

[24] **Mike Hedges:** No, I was just agreeing with you.

[25] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Are we having a debate on this?

[26] **Mr Price:** It has not been scheduled. It came so late in the term that we decided that it would run into this term. The other issue here is that the Silk commission is about to report.

[27] **Jocelyn Davies:** Would Members like us to request a Plenary debate on that?

[28] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The recommendation that it has refused is a key one.

[29] **Jocelyn Davies:** Which one has it refused?

[30] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Recommendation 16.

[31] **Jocelyn Davies:** It says that it is 'For further consideration', so I do not think that it has been rejected outright.

[32] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is refused according to the Welsh version.

[33] **Peter Black:** There is no asset management of the Assembly's estate.

[34] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It says that it has been refused in Welsh: 'Gwrthod'.

[35] **Jocelyn Davies:** I see. The English version says that it is for further consideration.

[36] **Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Welsh version needs to be amended to reflect that.

[37] **Jocelyn Davies:** Yes, or the English version amended to reflect the Welsh. [*Laughter.*] Do Members feel that this would be worthy of a Plenary debate? Shall we make such a request? I think that it was a report that was very well received, and I am sure that many Members would like to contribute to a debate on it.

[38] **Peter Black:** On the asset management, I was going to suggest that we do some further scrutiny on that, because, as I understand it, there is no proper asset management in the Welsh Government. It is all silos and no proper control across departments or any proper way of accounting for it, as I understand it.

[39] **Jocelyn Davies:** Shall we consider that later when we discuss our forward work programme?

[40] **Peter Black:** Yes, I think that that needs to be looked at.

[41] **Jocelyn Davies:** Okay. Are we all agreed, then, that we will request time in Plenary to debate this report? I see that we are. Are there any other matters on that paper? I see that there are not.

2.05 p.m.

**Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 17.42 i Benderfynu Gwahardd y Cyhoedd o'r  
Cyfarfod  
Motion under Standing Order No. 17.42 to Resolve to Exclude the Public from  
the Meeting**

[42] **Jocelyn Davies:** I move that

*the committee resolves to exclude the public for the remainder of the meeting, in accordance with Standing Order No. 17.42(vi).*

[43] Are all Members content? I see that they are.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 2.06 p.m.  
The public part of the meeting ended at 2.06 p.m..*