

Y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus

Lleoliad:
Ystafell Bwyllgora 3 – y Senedd

Dyddiad:
Dydd Mawrth, 3 Gorffennaf 2012

Amser:
09:00

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



I gael rhagor o wybodaeth, cysylltwch â:

Tom Jackson
Clerc y Pwyllgor
029 2089 8597
Publicaccounts.comm@Wales.gov.uk

Agenda

1. Cyflwyniad, ymddiheuriadau a dirprwyon (9.00 – 9.05)

2. Papurau i'w nodi (Tudalennau 1 – 6)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Papur 1 – Gohebiaeth ynghylch Cymdeithas Lleiafrifoedd Ethnig Cymru Gyfan (AWEMA) oddi wrth Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cynorthwyol Cymru (19 Mehefin 2012)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Papur 2 – Gohebiaeth ynghylch AWEMA oddi wrth y Cadeirydd at Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cynorthwyol Cymru (26 Mehefin 2012)

PAC(4) 14–12 – Papur 3 – Gohebiaeth ynghylch AWEMA oddi wrth Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cynorthwyol Cymru (27 Mehefin 2012)

Cofnodion y cyfarfod blaenorol.

3. Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar gyfer y canlynol:

Eitemau 4 a 5.

4. Rheoli grantiau yng Nghymru – themâu allweddol a materion sy'n dod i'r amlwg (9.05 – 10.00) (Tudalennau 7 – 40)

5. Cynnydd o ran cyrraedd Safon Ansawdd Tai Cymru – themâu allweddol a materion sy'n dod i'r amlwg (10.00 – 11.00) (Tudalennau 41 – 77)



WALES AUDIT OFFICE
SWYDDFA ARCHWILLO CYMRU

Wales Audit Office / Swyddfa Archwilio Gymru

Mr Darren Millar, AM
Chair, Public Accounts Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff
CF99 1NA

24 Cathedral Road / Heol y Gadeiriann
Cardiff / Caerdydd
CF11 9LJ
Tel / Ffôn: 029 20 320500
Fax / Ffacs: 029 20 320600
Email / Epost: wales@wao.gov.uk
www.wao.gov.uk

Date	19 June 2012
Ref	AJB15/1am
Tel	02920 320 571
Email	anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk
Pages	1 of 2

Dear Darren

Wales Audit Office value for money examination: AWEMA

I am writing to provide you with a brief progress update on our current value for money study which is examining whether the Welsh Government, including the Welsh European Funding Office (WEFO), has managed its relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA) appropriately to protect and make good use of public funds.

In my letter of 15 February 2012, I had indicated that, acting on behalf of the Auditor General and dependent on a range of factors, I anticipated being able to publish our final report in May or June 2012. However, that timetable has proved increasingly ambitious and I can confirm that I now expect to publish our final report at the start of the National Assembly's autumn term. This extension to our study timetable will provide sufficient time for us to complete our ongoing programme of interviews and to then draft and prepare our final report for publication and translation. In line with our normal practice, this process will involve a period of clearance with the Welsh Government and other third parties as regards the factual accuracy and balance of the report.

I would emphasise that Wales Audit Office staff have been working very hard to complete what has proven to be a much more substantial programme of file reviews and interviews than we first envisaged. Although the evidence base for our work has been broadly consistent with that described in my previous letter, it is the scale of our work that means it has taken longer than expected. I can confirm that we have continued to experience full co-operation from the Welsh Government throughout our fieldwork. My study team is now nearing the point at which we will be able to step back from the process of evidence gathering in order to draw out the key findings and conclusions that will provide the basis of our report.

I should also like to take this opportunity to confirm once again the scope of our work, in light of some inaccurate recent media coverage. The Wales Audit Office has not been examining the internal workings of AWEMA itself. The responsibility for any examination of AWEMA's governance, in particular the trustees' action and decision-making in managing the charity, rests with the Charity Commission. We have also been mindful of the need to take into account the scope of any action by South Wales Police. While we are examining payments to AWEMA made by the Welsh Government and WEFO and their purpose, we are not, as has been suggested in some quarters, carrying out our own audit of AWEMA's finances.

Tudalen 1



Our interest in governance and financial management issues at AWEMA extends only to consideration of how the Welsh Government has responded throughout its relationship with AWEMA to issues or concerns that have come to its attention.

I should be grateful if you would circulate this letter to the members of your Committee, and I confirm that I would be happy for a copy of it to be placed on the Committee's website

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'A Barrett', is positioned above the printed name.

Anthony Barrett
Assistant Auditor General

PAC(4)-14-12 Paper 2

**Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus
Public Accounts Committee**

Anthony Barrett
Assistant Auditor General for
Wales
Wales Audit Office
24 Cathedral Road
Cardiff
CF11 9LJ

National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
CF99 1NA

26 June 2012

Dear Anthony

Thank you for providing an update on the progress of the Wales Audit Office value for money study which is examining whether the Welsh Government has managed its relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA) appropriately. The Committee is pleased to note the progress that the Wales Audit Office has made in its investigation and we look forward to receiving the final report at the start of the autumn term.

In your letter of 19 June, you reaffirm the scope of the Wales Audit Office investigation in response to recent inaccurate media coverage.

I am grateful for this update, however I would be grateful if you could confirm that the scope of the investigation also includes:

- details of the Welsh Government's investment in AWEMA and whether it represented value for money;
- how the grants provided to AWEMA were monitored; and
- whether action undertaken by the Welsh Government in response to concerns raised about the charity has been sufficient.

I look forward to receiving your response.

Yours sincerely



**Darren Millar AM
Chair of the Public Accounts Committee**



WALES AUDIT OFFICE
SWYDDFA ARCHWILLO CYMRU

Wales Audit Office / Swyddfa Archwilio Gymru

Mr Darren Millar, AM
Chair, Public Accounts Committee
National Assembly for Wales
Cardiff Bay
Cardiff
CF99 1NA

24 Cathedral Road / Heol y Gadeirlan
Cardiff / Caerdydd
CF11 9LJ
Tel / Ffôn: 029 20 320500
Fax / Ffacs: 029 20 320600
Email / Epost: wales@wao.gov.uk
www.wao.gov.uk

Date 27 June 2012
Ref AJB257/am
Tel 02920 320 571
Email anthony.barrett@wao.gov.uk
Pages 1 of 2

Dear Darren

Wales Audit Office value for money examination: AWEMA

Thank you for your letter of 26 June 2012 acknowledging receipt of my letter of 19 June about our examination of the Welsh Government's relationship with the All Wales Ethnic Minority Association (AWEMA). My letter of 19 June provided an update on the progress of our work, set out my revised expectation as regards the timetable for completion of our work, and re-confirmed the scope of our work following some inaccurate media coverage.

Your letter of 26 June requested further confirmation that the scope of our work includes:

- details of the Welsh Government's investment in AWEMA and whether it represented value for money;
- how the grants provided to AWEMA were monitored; and
- whether action undertaken by the Welsh Government in response to concerns raised about the charity has been sufficient.

I do expect that our final report will include details of the Welsh Government's funding of AWEMA (the sums involved and their purpose) and evidence in relation to the adequacy of the arrangements that the Welsh Government (including the Welsh European Funding Office) had put in place to monitor its grant funding.

We have been considering the available evidence in terms of whether the Welsh Government was satisfied, and can demonstrate, that it was getting value for money from its funding of AWEMA but we are not undertaking our own evaluation of AWEMA's work.

Our report will also consider the Welsh Government's response to specific concerns raised about AWEMA at different points in time, including the concerns that emerged in late 2011.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'A Barrett'.

Anthony Barrett
Assistant Auditor General

Tudalen 4

Y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus

Lleoliad: **Ystafell Bwyllgora 3 – y Senedd**

Dyddiad: **Dydd Mawrth, 19 Mehefin 2012**

Amser: **09:20 – 11:00**

Gellir gwyllo'r cyfarfod ar Senedd TV yn:

http://www.senedd.tv/archiveplayer.jsf?v=cy_400000_19_06_2012&t=0&l=cy

Cynulliad
Cenedlaethol
Cymru

National
Assembly for
Wales



Cofnodion Cryno:

Aelodau'r Cynulliad:

Mohammad Asghar (Oscar) AC
Mike Hedges
Julie Morgan
Gwyn R Price
Jenny Rathbone
Aled Roberts
Andrew RT Davies (Cadeirydd)

Tystion:

Huw Vaughan Thomas, Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru,
Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru
Paul Dimplebee, Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru
Alan Morris, Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru

Staff y Pwyllgor:

Tom Jackson (Clerc)
Daniel Collier (Dirprwy Clerc)
Joanest Jackson (Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol)

1. Cynnig i ethol Cadeirydd dros dro

1.1 Gofynnodd y Clerc am enwebiadau i benodi Cadeirydd dros dro o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.22. Gwnaeth Mohammad Asghar enwebu Andrew RT Davies, ac fe'i penodwyd ar gyfer y cyfarfod hwn.

2. Cyflwyniad, ymddiheuriadau a dirprwyon

2.1 Croesawodd y Cadeirydd dros dro yr Aelodau a'r cyhoedd i'r cyfarfod.

2.2 Cafwyd ymddiheuriadau gan Darren Millar, yr oedd Andrew RT Davies yn dirprwyo ar ei ran, a chan Lyndsay Whittle.

3. Sesiwn friffio gydag Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ar ymgysylltiad y cyhoedd â llywodraeth leol

3.1 Estynnodd y Cadeirydd wahoddiad i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ac Alan Morris, Cyfarwyddwr Grŵp – Archwilio Perfformiad, roi sesiwn friffio i'r Pwyllgor ar adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ar ymgysylltiad y cyhoedd â llywodraeth leol.

3.2 Cytunodd y Pwyllgor i wahodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i roi enghreifftiau o'r ymarferion i ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd sy'n cael eu rhoi ar waith gan gynghorau yng Nghymru.

3.3 Cytunodd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol i roi enghreifftiau o arfer da a nodwyd yn ystod ei archwiliad ac i roi adborth ar ganlyniadau'r Seminar Cyd-ddysgu ar ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru.

4. Cynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog 17.42 i benderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o'r cyfarfod ar gyfer y canlynol:

Eitemau 5 i 7.

5. Opsiynau ar gyfer ymdrin ag ymgysylltiad y cyhoedd â llywodraeth leol

5.1 Trafododd y Pwyllgor yr opsiynau ar gyfer ymdrin ag adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ar ymgysylltiad y cyhoedd â llywodraeth leol.

6. Penderfynu ar dystion ar gyfer yr ymchwiliad i benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru i gaffael a chael gwared ar westy'r River Lodge gynt, Llangollen

6.1 Cytunodd y Pwyllgor ar ba dystion yr hoffai eu gwahodd i roi tystiolaeth i'w ymchwiliad i benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru i gaffael a chael gwared ar westy'r River Lodge gynt, Llangollen.

7. Trafodaeth am broses anffurfiol Aelodau o gasglu gwybodaeth am fframwaith Rheoli Grantiau yr Alban

7.1 Trafododd y Pwyllgor yr adborth ar broses anffurfiol yr Aelodau o gasglu gwybodaeth am fframwaith rheoli grantiau yr Alban.

8. Papurau i'w nodi

8.1 Cadarnhaodd y Pwyllgor gofnodion y cyfarfod ar 12 Gorffennaf 2012.

Trawsgrifiad

Yn rhinwedd paragraff(au) vi o Reol Sefydlog 17.42

Mae cyfyngiadau ar y ddogfen hon

Yn rhinwedd paragraff(au) vi o Reol Sefydlog 17.42

Mae cyfyngiadau ar y ddogfen hon