



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 7 Tachwedd 2012  
Wednesday, 7 November 2012**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau<br>Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills                                                                                                     |
| 21  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau<br>Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Communities                                                                            |
| 42  | Datganiad: Cyflwyno Bil Arfaethedig Aelod—Bil Safleoedd Rheoleiddiedig Cartrefi Symudol (Cymru)<br>Statement: Introduction of a Member Proposed Bill—the Regulated Mobile Home Sites (Wales) (Bill) |
| 57  | Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Y Lluoedd Arfog<br>Welsh Conservatives Debate: The Armed Forces                                                                                                          |
| 84  | Dadl Plaid Cymru: Gwella Ysgolion<br>Plaid Cymru Debate: School Improvement                                                                                                                         |
| 111 | Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru: Cyllideb Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru<br>Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate: The Welsh Ambulance Service Budget                                                     |
| 137 | Cyfnod Pleidleisio<br>Voting Time                                                                                                                                                                   |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

**The Presiding Officer:** Good afternoon. The National Assembly for Wales is now in session.

**Y Llywydd:** Prynhawn da. Dyma ddechrau trafodion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education and Skills**

### **Darpariaeth Addysg Bellach**

**1. Mark Drakeford:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fuddsoddi mewn darpariaeth addysg bellach yn ardal Caerdydd. OAQ(4)0197(ESK)*

**The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews):** The Welsh Government has agreed in principle with the development of a new city-centre campus at a cost of £40 million, with the Welsh Government contributing 50% of the overall cost. This investment is subject to approval of the necessary business case in line with the Treasury five-case model.

**Mark Drakeford:** I was a member of the South Glamorgan education committee in the 1980s when Coleg Glan Hafren was established as the first further education college in Cardiff.

**Ann Jones:** You were a mere boy. [*Laughter.*]

**Simon Thomas:** You are not old enough, Mark. [*Laughter.*]

**Mark Drakeford:** I welcome the additional £10 million that the Deputy Minister announced recently as a boost to a new post-16 further education campus in Cardiff city centre. Do you agree that this represents a step-change in the nature of the offer that will be made to young people in Cardiff looking for further education, and that the Welsh Government investment has been pivotal in bringing that about?

**Leighton Andrews:** I think that the Member

### **Further Education Provision**

**1. Mark Drakeford:** *Will the Minister make a statement on investment in further education provision in the Cardiff area. OAQ(4)0197(ESK)*

**Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews):** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cytuno mewn egwyddor â chynnig i ddatblygu campws newydd yng nghanol y ddinas ar gost o £40 miliwn, gyda Llywodraeth Cymru yn cyfrannu 50% o gyfanswm y gost. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwn yn amodol ar gymeradwyo'r achos busnes angenrheidiol yn unol â model pum achos y Trysorlys.

**Mark Drakeford:** Roeddwn yn aelod o bwyllgor addysg De Morgannwg yn yr 1980au pan sefydlwyd Coleg Glan Hafren fel y coleg addysg bellach cyntaf yng Nghaerdydd.

**Ann Jones:** Megis bachgen ifanc oeddech bryd hynny. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Simon Thomas:** Nid ydych yn ddigon hen, Mark. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Mark Drakeford:** Croesawaf y £10 miliwn ychwanegol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Dirprwy Weinidog fel hwb i gampws addysg bellach ôl-16 newydd yng nghanol dinas Caerdydd. A gytunwch fod hyn yn newid sylweddol yn natur yr hyn a gynigir i bobl ifanc yng Nghaerdydd sy'n chwilio am addysg bellach, a bod buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bod yn greiddiol yn hynny o beth?

**Leighton Andrews:** Credaf fod yr Aelod

for Cardiff West has shocked other colleagues by admitting to such high office in his teens. [*Laughter.*]

The investment is very good news for the capital city. There has been a feeling for many years that there has been something of a hole at the centre of further education provision in Cardiff. This will add to the quality of provision available to young people post 16 and it is a good development if considered alongside investments that I am sure will be made over time in the post-16 provision in the Cardiff school system.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Andrew R.T. Davies):** The Member for Cardiff West touched on the offer for post-16 education in FE colleges in Cardiff. Across South Wales Central, it is important that there is an offer and a genuine choice. Do you support sixth-form provision in our secondary schools in the form of A-levels, so that when students make their choice, they can do so based on the information provided to them and the possibility within their catchment area of staying in their secondary school or going to an FE college to study for their A-levels?

**Leighton Andrews:** It is important that young people have available the post-16 provision that is relevant to their needs. That may well be through further education colleges or it may well be through sixth forms. That will vary, I suspect, depending on the provision available in different institutions. If what you are seeking is a commitment in terms of sixth forms, while we believe that local authorities must work with further education colleges to ensure that there is no unnecessary duplication, we have no central plans to eliminate sixth forms.

**Julie Morgan:** A few weeks ago, I was delighted to attend the annual awards of the Cardiff and Vale College, which was an exciting occasion. Is there anything that the Minister could do about the stereotyping of subjects that takes place in all further

dros Orllewin Caerdydd wedi dychryn cyd-Aelodau eraill drwy gyfaddef ei fod mewn swydd mor uchel yn ystod ei ardeggau. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae'r buddsoddiad yn newyddion da iawn i'r brifddinas. Bu teimlad ers sawl blwyddyn bod rhywfaint o fwlch yng nghanol y ddarpariaeth addysg bellach yng Nghaerdydd. Bydd hyn yn ychwanegu at ansawdd y ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc ôl-16 ac mae'n ddatblygiad da o'i ystyried ochr yn ochr â buddsoddiadau a gaiff eu gwneud, rwy'n siŵr, dros gyfnod o amser yn narpariaeth ôl-16 system ysgolion Caerdydd.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Andrew R.T. Davies):** Crybwyllodd yr Aelod dros Orllewin Caerdydd y cynnig o ran addysg ôl-16 mewn colegau AB yng Nghaerdydd. Ledled Canol De Cymru, mae'n bwysig bod cynnig a dewis go iawn. A ydych o blaid darpariaeth chweched dosbarth yn ein hysgolion uwchradd ar ffurf cymwysterau Safon Uwch, er mwyn sicrhau pan fydd myfyrwyr yn gwneud eu dewis, y gallant wneud hynny yn seiliedig ar y wybodaeth a roddir iddynt a'r posibilrwydd o fewn eu dalgylch o aros yn eu hysgol uwchradd neu fynd i goleg AB i astudio ar gyfer eu cymwysterau Safon Uwch?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n bwysig bod y ddarpariaeth ôl-16 sy'n berthnasol i'w hanghenion ar gael i bobl ifanc. Gallai hynny fod drwy golegau addysg bellach neu gallai fod drwy ddarpariaeth chweched dosbarth. Bydd hynny'n amrywio, fe dybiaf, yn ôl y ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael mewn sefydliadau gwahanol. Os ydych am gael ymrwymiad o ran darpariaeth chweched dosbarth, er ein bod o'r farn bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda cholegau addysg bellach i sicrhau nad oes unrhyw ddyblygu diangen, nid oes gennym unrhyw gynlluniau canolog i ddileu'r ddarpariaeth chweched dosbarth.

**Julie Morgan:** Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, roedd yn bleser gennyf fynd i ddigwyddiad gwobrwyo blynyddol Coleg Caerdydd a'r Fro, a oedd yn achlysur cyffrous. A oes unrhyw beth y gallai'r Gweinidog ei wneud am y ffordd y caiff pynciau eu stereoteipio

education colleges, in particular regarding apprenticeships, where men do engineering and women do hairdressing, which leads to a pattern throughout life?

**Leighton Andrews:** The point you make is a very good one. My colleague the Deputy Minister for Skills has been able to highlight a number of examples where young women have been involved in construction or engineering, and given clear signals that there are strong role models in these fields; it is clear that we want to develop those opportunities. In the context of the new facilities that will be available in Cardiff, with proper co-operation with the secondary schools, there is good scope for expanding the awareness of what can be achieved on a non-gender-specific basis.

### Addysg Uwch

**2. Mohammad Asghar:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau i ad-drefnu Addysg Uwch yn ne ddwyrain Cymru. OAQ(4)0191(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** I made a statement yesterday on higher education reconfiguration in south-east Wales.

**Mohammad Asghar:** In view of your statement yesterday, backing down on plans to enforce the merger of the University of Glamorgan and the University of Wales, Newport with Cardiff Metropolitan University—for the time being, at least—will the Minister now publish the costed business case in support of the original three-way merger, which Barbara Wilding believes was legally and financially flawed?

**Leighton Andrews:** I am delighted with the progress that is being made by the University of Glamorgan and the University of Wales, Newport in their merger talks. This is excellent news for the staff and students at those institutions, and for future students of those institutions. In respect of the business case, we were developing a business case on the basis of the Treasury five-case model. That involved, in the first stage, the publication of a strategic outline case, which we published. I am sorry that the chair of Cardiff Metropolitan University has not

ymhob coleg addysg bellach, yn arbennig o ran prentisiaethau, lle mae dynion yn gwneud peirianeg a menywod yn trin gwallt, sy'n arwain at batrwm gydol oes?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae eich pwynt yn un da iawn. Llwyddodd fy nghyd-Aelod, y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau i dynnu sylw at nifer o enghreifftiau lle mae merched ifanc wedi bod yn ymwneud ag adeiladu neu beirianeg, ac wedi cael arwyddion clir bod modelau rôl cryf yn y meysydd hyn; mae'n amlwg ein bod am ddatblygu'r cyfleoedd hynny. Yng nghyd-destun y cyfleusterau newydd a fydd ar gael yng Nghaerdydd, gan gydweithredu'n briodol â'r ysgolion uwchradd, mae cyfle da i wella'r ymwbyddiaeth o'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni ar sail nad yw'n rhyw-benodol.

### Higher Education

**2. Mohammad Asghar:** *Will the Minister provide an update on plans to reconfigure Higher Education in south east Wales. OAQ(4)0191(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Gwneuthum ddatganiad ddoe ar ad-drefnu addysg uwch yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru.

**Mohammad Asghar:** O ystyried eich datganiad ddoe, a oedd yn cefnu ar gynlluniau i orfodi Prifysgol Morgannwg a Phrifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd i uno â Phrifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd—am y tro, o leiaf—a wnaiff y Gweinidog yn awr gyhoeddi'r achos busnes wedi'i gostio a oedd yn ategu'r cynnig gwreiddiol i uno'r tri sefydliad, a oedd, ym marn Barbara Wilding, yn ddiffygiol yn gyfreithiol ac yn ariannol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwy'n falch iawn gyda'r cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud gan Brifysgol Morgannwg a Phrifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd yn eu trafodaethau uno. Mae hyn yn newyddion gwych i staff a myfyrwyr y sefydliadau hynny, ac i fyfyrwyr y sefydliadau hynny yn y dyfodol. O ran yr achos busnes, rydym yn datblygu achos busnes ar sail model pump achos y Trysorlys. Roedd hynny, yn ystod y cam cyntaf, yn cynnwys cyhoeddi achos amlinellol strategol, a gyhoeddwyd gennym. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw cadeirydd Prifysgol Fetropolitan

understood the process.

**Julie Morgan:** Following the announcement yesterday, and the welcome go ahead for a business plan to be made between Newport and Glamorgan universities, concern has been expressed about the financial future for Cardiff Met. As many of the students come from my constituency of Cardiff North—and I must declare an interest, as my granddaughter attends Cardiff Met—what reassurance can the Minister give to those students that the decisions that have been made by the governing body will not jeopardise their educational chances?

**Leighton Andrews:** Questions about the decisions taken by the governing body of Cardiff Metropolitan University should be addressed to the governing body of Cardiff Metropolitan University. Cardiff Metropolitan University is now largely marginal to the Welsh Government's higher education strategy. We will not be wasting time, energy and resources on institutions that are marginal to our higher education strategy.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I would like to put on record that my daughter is currently a student at Cardiff Met. Following your July announcement on the future of HE funding post 2015, and your statement yesterday, as well as what you have just said, will you clarify whether Cardiff Met will still be able to access funding from the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales into the future?

**Leighton Andrews:** Decisions on funding by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales are a matter for HEFCW itself.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 3, OAQ(4)0195(ESK), is withdrawn.

#### Adeiladau Ysgolion

**4. Peter Black:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ei gynlluniau i fuddsoddi mewn uwchraddio a gwella adeiladau ysgolion. OAQ(4)0196(ESK)*

Caerdydd wedi deall y broses.

**Julie Morgan:** Yn dilyn y cyhoeddiad ddoe, a'r caniatâd a roddwyd ac a groesawyd i brifysgolion Casnewydd a Morgannwg lunio cynllun busnes ar y cyd, mynegwyd pryder am ddyfodol ariannol Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd. Gan fod llawer o'r myfyrwyr yn dod o'm hetholaeth, sef Gogledd Caerdydd—a rhaid imi ddatgan buddiant, gan fod fy wyres yn mynd i Brifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd—pa sicrwydd y gall y Gweinidog ei roi i'r myfyrwyr hynny na fydd y penderfyniadau a wnaed gan y corff llywodraethu yn rhoi eu cyfleoedd addysgol yn y fantol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Dylid cyfeirio unrhyw gwestiynau am y penderfyniadau a wnaed gan gorff llywodraethu Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd at gorff llywodraethu Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd. Mae Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd yn awr i raddau helaeth ar gyrion strategaeth addysg uwch Llywodraeth Cymru. Ni fyddwn yn gwastraffu amser, egni nac adnoddau ar sefydliadau sydd ar gyrion ein strategaeth addysg uwch.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Hoffwn gofnodi bod fy merch ar hyn o bryd yn fyfyrwraig ym Mhrifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd. Yn dilyn eich cyhoeddiad ym mis Gorffennaf ar ddyfodol cyllido AU ar ôl 2015, a'ch datganiad ddoe, yn ogystal â'r hyn rydych newydd ei ddweud, a wnewch chi egluro a fydd Prifysgol Fetropolitan Caerdydd yn parhau i allu cael cyllid gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn y dyfodol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mater i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ei hun yw penderfyniadau ar gyllido gan CCAUC.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ(4)0195(ESK), yn ôl.

#### School Buildings

**4. Peter Black:** *Will the Minister provide an update on his plans to invest in upgrading and improving school buildings. OAQ(4)0196(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** In December 2011, I announced an investment of £700 million over the next seven years to support the delivery of the twenty-first century schools programme. A further £15 million of investment for the programme has been secured through the Welsh infrastructure investment plan, which will allow the acceleration of priority projects.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. As you know, there is a fairly big controversy about asbestos in schools. Could you give an update on the current situation, with regard to your own investigations into that matter and how it impacts on this programme?

**Leighton Andrews:** We have received responses from all local authorities in respect of asbestos. Rather than trying to give a complex answer here as to the position across Wales, I will seek to publish a written statement on the basis of those responses that we have received. I will be happy to take further questions from Members on that.

**Mike Hedges:** Does the Minister share my concern about the way some school buildings, such as Manselton Primary School in my constituency, have been left to deteriorate under the neglect of the previous City and County of Swansea council administration? Furthermore, does he agree with me that, where it is economically feasible, nineteenth century schools should be renovated, rather than just left?

**Leighton Andrews:** As the Member for Swansea East will understand, last December we announced approval of Swansea's first wave of £51 million of investment in its schools. As part of the first wave of investment in my twenty-first century schools programme, I understand that replacement schools have been identified already, with some priority projects. In addition to the £15 million that was recently announced by the Minister for Finance to support early priority projects, I want to deploy my own capital budget next year to support other priority projects where capital investment is much needed to address the poor condition of school buildings. Therefore, I would

**Leighton Andrews:** Ym mis Rhagfyr 2011, cyhoeddais fuddsoddiad o £700 miliwn dros y saith mlynedd nesaf i ategu'r broses o roi rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain ar waith. Llwyddwyd i sicrhau buddsoddiad o £15 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y rhaglen drwy gynllun buddsoddi yn seilwaith Cymru, a fydd yn caniatáu i brosiectau blaenoriaeth gael eu rhoi ar waith yn gyflymach.

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Fel y gwyddoch, mae asbestos mewn ysgolion yn bwnc llosg. A allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa bresennol, o ran eich ymchwiliadau eich hun i'r mater hwnnw a sut y mae'n effeithio ar y rhaglen hon?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym wedi cael ymatebion gan bob awdurdod lleol mewn perthynas ag asbestos. Yn hytrach na cheisio rhoi ateb cymhleth o ran y sefyllfa ledled Cymru, anelaf at gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar sail yr ymatebion hynny a gawsom. Byddaf yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn cwestiynau pellach gan Aelodau ar hynny.

**Mike Hedges:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn rhannu fy mhryder o ran y ffordd y mae adeiladau rhai ysgolion, megis Ysgol Gynradd Manselton yn fy etholaeth, wedi cael eu gadael i ddirywio o dan esgeulustod gweinyddiaeth cyngor blaenorol Dinas a Sir Abertawe? At hynny, a yw'n cytuno â mi, lle y bo'n economaidd ddichonadwy, y dylid adnewyddu ysgolion y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, yn hytrach na'u gadael?

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y bydd yr Aelod dros Ddwyrain Abertawe yn deall, fis Rhagfyr diwethaf cymeradwywyd ton gyntaf buddsoddiad gwerth £51 miliwn gan Abertawe yn ei ysgolion. Fel rhan o don gyntaf y buddsoddiad yn fy rhaglen ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, rwyf ar ddeall bod ysgolion newydd eisoes wedi'u nodi, gyda rhai prosiectau blaenoriaeth. Yn ychwanegol at y £15 miliwn a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Gweinidog Cyllid i gefnogi prosiectau blaenoriaeth cynnar, rwyf am ddefnyddio fy nghyllideb gyfalaf fy hun y flwyddyn nesaf i gefnogi prosiectau blaenoriaeth eraill lle mae angen dirfawr am

welcome further conversations with the Member to discuss projects in his own constituency in that context.

**Russell George:** Minister, the standard of school toilets has been a long-term problem in Welsh schools. The Children's Commissioner for Wales, Keith Towler, has repeatedly raised this issue. Earlier this year, we saw the publication of best practice non-statutory guidance for school toilets in primary and secondary schools, and that was a welcome step. Can you provide us with an update on what you are doing, working with local authorities, school governors and headteachers, to ensure the widespread implementation of that guidance? I am sure that you will agree that good access and well-maintained school toilets is a very important issue.

**Leighton Andrews:** It is an important issue and it is often one of the biggest issues that young people themselves raise through their school council meetings, whether in primary or secondary schools. The Member is right to say that the children's commissioner has highlighted this issue. We publish the guidance, and it is now down to local authorities to ensure that they are compliant in following that guidance and implementing whatever changes may be necessary.

**Christine Chapman:** I recently attended the topping out ceremony of the new £11.5 million Abercynon Community Primary School, which is a very welcome investment in the future education of children from the local community. Do you agree that it is critical that we provide our children with inspirational and aspirational learning environments? That being the case, will you continue to invest in our Welsh schools, which is an approach that stands in sharp contrast to the short-sightedness of the UK Government?

**Leighton Andrews:** As my colleague the Member for Cynon Valley will be well aware, the UK Government has cut our own

fuddsoddiad cyfalaf i ymdrin â chyflwr gwael adeiladau ysgolion. Felly, byddwn yn croesawu sgysiau pellach gyda'r Aelod i drafod prosiectau yn ei etholaeth ei hun yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

**Russell George:** Weinidog, mae safon toiledau mewn ysgolion wedi bod yn broblem hirdymor yn ysgolion Cymru. Mae Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, Keith Towler, wedi codi'r mater hwn droeon. Yn gynharach eleni, cyhoeddwyd canllawiau arfer gorau anstatudol ar gyfer toiledau mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd, ac roedd hynny i'w groesawu. A allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am yr hyn rydych yn ei wneud, gan weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol, llywodraethwyr ysgolion a phenaethiaid, i sicrhau bod y canllawiau hynny yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yn gyffredinol? Rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod mynediad da a sicrhau bod toiledau mewn ysgolion yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n briodol yn fater pwysig iawn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n fater pwysig ac mae'n aml yn un o'r materion mwyaf a godir gan bobl ifanc eu hunain drwy gyfarfodydd cyngor yr ysgol, boed hynny mewn ysgolion cynradd neu uwchradd. Mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod y comisiynydd plant wedi tynnu sylw at y mater hwn. Ni sy'n cyhoeddi'r canllawiau, a chyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio drwy ddilyn y canllawiau hynny a rhoi pa bynnag newidiadau sydd eu hangen ar waith.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn ddiweddar, euthum i seremoni cwblhau Ysgol Gynradd Gymunedol newydd Abercynon, a oedd yn brosiect gwerth £11.5 miliwn, sy'n fuddsoddiad i'w groesawu'n fawr yn addysg plant o'r gymuned leol yn y dyfodol. A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol ein bod yn darparu amgylcheddau dysgu ysbrydoledig ac uchelgeisiol i'n plant? Os felly, a fyddwch yn parhau i fuddsoddi yn ein hysgolion yng Nghymru, sy'n ymagwedd gwbl groes i ddiffyg gweledigaeth Llywodraeth y DU?

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod dros Gwm Cynon yn ymwybodol, mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi torri ein cyllidebau



capital budgets very significantly, by around 40% over the period of this comprehensive spending review. However, there has been no stopping of investment in schools here in Wales. We have ensured that all funding commitments have been honoured, such as the investment in Abercynon, and we have provided surety of a long-term capital programme for the first wave of investment in twenty-first century schools, which I announced last December. That means that all 22 local authorities will receive a portion of Welsh Government grant support of some £700 million in that first wave of investment. I have asked my officials to work closely with local authorities to identify projects that can be accelerated earlier than planned and, as a result, funding of some additional £15 million has been secured to support priority projects a year earlier than the original programme start date.

cyfalaf yn sylweddol iawn, o tua 40% dros gyfnod yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr hwn o wariant. Fodd bynnag, ni fu terfyn ar fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion yma yng Nghymru. Rydym wedi sicrhau yr anrhydeddwyd yr holl ymrwymadau cyllido, megis y buddsoddiad yn Abercynon, ac rydym wedi rhoi sicrwydd drwy raglen gyfalaf hirdymor ar gyfer y don gyntaf o fuddsoddiad mewn ysgolion ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, a gyhoeddais fis Rhagfyr diwethaf. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd pob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yn cael cyfran o gymorth grant Llywodraeth Cymru, sy'n werth tua £700 miliwn fel rhan o'r don gyntaf honno o fuddsoddiad. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion weithio'n agos ag awdurdodau lleol i nodi prosiectau y gellir eu rhoi ar waith yn gynt na'r disgwyl ac, o ganlyniad, sicrhawyd tua £15 miliwn ychwanegol i gefnogi prosiectau blaenoriaeth flwyddyn yn gynharach na dyddiad dechrau gwreiddiol y rhaglen.

### Blaenoriaethau

**5. Paul Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill y Pedwerydd Cynulliad. OAQ(4)0189(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill tymor y Cynulliad hwn wedi eu nodi yn y rhaglen lywodraethu.

**Paul Davies:** Rwy'n siŵr mai un o flaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog yw sicrhau bod y rhaglenni a'r cyrsiau cywir yn cael eu darparu yn ein hystafelloedd dosbarth. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o adroddiad diweddar Ymgyrch Tarian a ddaeth i'r casgliad bod cyffuriau hamdden fel mephedrone yn fwy na dwywaith mor gyffredin yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â 12 mis yn ôl, er enghraifft. Yn ddiweddar, cysylltodd etholwr â mi sy'n edrych i gyflwyno rhaglen ymwybyddiaeth cyffuriau i ysgolion yn sir Benfro, ond yn anffodus ni all wneud hynny oherwydd diffyg ariannu. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym ba raglenni ymwybyddiaeth cyffuriau sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn cael eu cyflwyno i ysgolion ledled Cymru er mwyn addysgu disgyblion am beryglon a risgiau cymryd cyffuriau?

### Priorities

**5. Paul Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities for the remainder of the Fourth Assembly. OAQ(4)0189(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** My priorities for the remainder of this Assembly term are set out in the programme for government.

**Paul Davies:** I am sure that one of the Minister's priorities is to ensure that the correct programmes and courses are provided in our classrooms. The Minister will be aware of the recent report by Operation Tarian that came to the conclusion that recreational drugs such as mephedrone are more than twice as common in Wales as they were 12 months ago, for example. Recently, I was contacted by a constituent who is looking to introduce a drug awareness programme in schools in Pembrokeshire, but unfortunately he cannot do that because of a lack of funding. Can the Minister tell us which drug awareness programmes are currently being introduced in schools across Wales in order to educate pupils about the dangers and risks of taking drugs?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym wedi cefnogi rhaglenni gyda'r heddlu yng Nghymru, i gyfeirio at y pwynt sy'n cael ei wneud gan yr Aelod. Os oes problemau ganddo yn sir Benfro, rwy'n awgrymu ei fod yn ysgrifennu ataf a byddaf yn hapus i ystyried y pwnc.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A fydddech yn barod, o ran eich blaenoriaethau, i edrych ar sefyllfa'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith fel pwnc o fewn y cwricwlwm? A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn annerbyniol bod disgyblion yn gallu mynd drwy'r ysgol uwchradd yn astudio'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith heb sefyll arholiad, heb ennill unrhyw gymhwyster, a heb feithrin fawr o sgiliau yn yr iaith neu fagu unrhyw hyder i'w defnyddio? A wnewch ystyried ei gosod fel pwnc craidd o fewn y cwricwlwm fel bod y buddsoddiad hwnnw yn sicrhau bod disgyblion yn meddu sgiliau o ran y ddwy iaith yng Nghymru?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf yn barod wedi sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen i ystyried pwnc y Gymraeg fel ail iaith. Rwy'n disgwyl derbyn ei adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf.

**Leighton Andrews:** We have supported programmes with the police in Wales, to refer to the point being made by the Member. If he has encountered any problems in Pembrokeshire, I suggest that he writes to me and I will be happy to consider the point.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Would you be willing, as regards your priorities, to consider the position of Welsh as a second language as a subject within the curriculum? Do you agree that it is unacceptable that pupils are able to go through secondary school studying Welsh as a second language without having to sit an exam, without gaining a qualification and without developing language skills or any confidence in using the language? Will you consider making it a core subject within the curriculum so that that investment ensures that pupils possess skills in both languages in Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** I have already established a task and finish group to consider the issue of Welsh as a second language. I expect to receive its report next year.

1.45 p.m.

**Aled Roberts:** Minister, during your evidence to the Children and Young People Committee on 18 October, you outlined concerns that you had about the quality of spending plans that have been handed into the department by local authorities and schools with regard to the pupil deprivation grant; you referred to them as being 'weak'. Have the regional consortia carried out any quality assurance of the plans prior to their submission and are you now satisfied with the standards of plans that have been received by your department?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Member is aware that we were not satisfied with the plans that were first submitted to us. I am not sure that I necessarily see it as a role for the regional consortia to get into the detail of the spending plans for the pupil deprivation grant. I would expect local authorities to develop coherently, with their local schools, precisely how that money will be spent. As a local Assembly Member, I have written to all the schools in my constituency to ask how they

**Aled Roberts:** Weinidog, yn ystod eich tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar 18 Hydref, gwnaethoch amlinellu pryderon a oedd gennych o ran ansawdd y cynlluniau gwariant a gyflwynwyd i'r adran gan awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion o ran y grant amddifadedd disgyblion; nodwyd gennych eu bod yn 'wan'. A yw'r consortia rhanbarthol wedi ymgymryd ag unrhyw waith i sicrhau ansawdd y cynlluniau cyn eu cyflwyno ac a ydych yn awr yn fodlon ar safon y cynlluniau y mae eich adran wedi'u derbyn?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r Aelod yn ymwybodol nad oeddem yn fodlon ar y cynlluniau a gyflwynwyd inni gyntaf. Nid wyf o reidrwydd yn cytuno mai rôl y consortia rhanbarthol yw ystyried manylion y cynlluniau gwariant ar gyfer y grant amddifadedd disgyblion. Byddwn yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu sut yn union y caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario mewn ffordd gydlynus, gyda'u hysgolion lleol. Fel Aelod Cynulliad lleol, rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at bob

are now putting that money into operation. I know that other Members have also done so, including my colleague the Member for the Vale of Clwyd, I think. So, I would encourage Members to follow through directly with schools to see how that money is being spent, but we will obviously monitor the plans from local authorities.

**Aled Roberts:** You will be aware of the article in the *Times Educational Supplement* last week regarding problems and we have a debate scheduled this afternoon on the regional consortia. Are you satisfied with the progress that has been made, given that they were supposed to be effective from September and that it is quite clear that a number of posts within each consortium remain unfilled?

**Leighton Andrews:** I am satisfied up to a point. However, these are consortia of local authorities and it is for them to get it right.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, you were talking about your future priorities and I know that you are looking at a Masters programme and at reviewing teacher training qualifications. Can you give us an idea as to whether you are looking in anyway now at how we might encourage more business people or people from other backgrounds into the teaching profession to bring their strengths to the existing strengths in the profession, or will you leave thoughts on that until a Masters programme has been looked at?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Masters programme has been highly successful. There has been huge enthusiasm for it. We have seen that from newly qualified teachers. We are seeing mentors coming through to support them as well, and that is an important element. We have also consulted on the qualifications around literacy and numeracy for new teachers and we are reviewing initial teacher training provision. We would certainly want to encourage people from all kinds of backgrounds into teaching, including people from business, but also people from the armed forces and others who may wish to make career changes. We are open to

ysgol yn fy etholaeth i ofyn sut y maent yn awr yn rhoi'r arian hwnnw ar waith. Gwn fod Aelodau eraill hefyd wedi gwneud hynny, gan gynnwys fy nghyd-Aelod, yr Aelod dros Ddyffryn Clwyd, credaf. Felly, byddwn yn annog Aelodau i gysylltu'n uniongyrchol ag ysgolion i weld sut mae'r arian hwnnw yn cael ei wario, ond byddwn yn amlwg yn monitro'r cynlluniau gan awdurdodau lleol.

**Aled Roberts:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r erthygl yn y *Times Educational Supplement* yr wythnos diwethaf ynghylch problemau ac rydym wedi trefnu dadl y prynhawn yma ar y consortia rhanbarthol. A ydych yn fodlon ar y cynnydd a wnaed, o ystyried bod disgwyl iddynt fod yn weithredol o fis Medi a'i bod yn gwbl amlwg bod nifer o swyddi o fewn pob consortiwm yn parhau heb eu llenwi?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwy'n fodlon i ryw raddau. Fodd bynnag, consortia o awdurdodau lleol ydynt a'u cyfrifoldeb hwy yw gwneud pethau'n iawn.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, roeddech yn sôn am eich blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwn eich bod yn ystyried rhaglen Meistr a'r posibilrwydd o adolygu cymwysterau hyfforddi athrawon. A allwch roi syniad inni o ran pa un a ydych wrthi'n ystyried mewn unrhyw ffordd sut y gallwn annog mwy o bobl fusnes neu bobl o gefndiroedd eraill i ymuno â'r proffesiwn addysgu er mwyn cyfuno eu cryfderau hwy â chryfderau presennol y proffesiwn, neu a fyddwch yn gadael y mater hwnnw hyd nes y byddwch wedi ystyried rhaglen Meistr?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r rhaglen Meistr wedi bod yn hynod lwyddiannus. Bu brwdfrydedd mawr tuag ati. Rydym wedi gweld hynny gan athrawon newydd gymhwyso. Rydym yn gweld mentoriaid yn dod i'w cefnogi hefyd, ac mae hynny'n elfen bwysig. Rydym hefyd wedi ymgynghori ar y cymwysterau sy'n seiliedig ar lythrennedd a rhifedd i athrawon newydd ac rydym yn adolygu'r ddarpariaeth hyfforddiant cychwynnol athrawon. Byddem yn sicr am annog pobl o bob math o gefndiroedd i ymuno â'r proffesiwn addysgu, gan gynnwys pobl o fyd busnes, ond hefyd pobl o'r lluoedd arfog a phobl eraill a allai fod yn awyddus i

discussions on any suggestions Members might have as to how we do that.

**Angela Burns:** Staying with the Masters programme, do you have any views or have you asked officials to look at what element or weight might be given in the Masters programme to ensuring that people who undertake it have more experience in psychology, sociology, the managing of classrooms and the ability to draw the best out of children and students? An awful lot of people who go into teacher training are very young and, when they get to the Masters programme, one of the big benefits would be to give them the strength and certainty that they can control and encourage children in great numbers.

**Leighton Andrews:** I have explained in the past that the elements within the Masters programme are very much focused on practical experience. They include such things as literacy and numeracy, behaviour management and identification of additional learning needs, which will include those pupils who are more gifted and talented. So, all of those things to which the Member referred are addressed in the curriculum of the Masters programme.

### Consortia Addysg

**6. Lindsay Whittle:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael am gonsortia addysg yn ne ddwyrain Cymru. OAQ(4)0194(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** My officials and I continue to engage with each consortium regularly on their plans to work collaboratively to raise education standards. Progress is reported to me via my regular meetings with the Welsh Local Government Association and its education spokesperson.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Minister, there have been some problems with regard to proposed education consortia, particularly with universities in the south-east perhaps, but recently problems have come to light at the local authority level too. What actions have

newid gyrfa. Rydym yn ddigon parod i ni drafod unrhyw awgrymiadau a allai fod gan yr Aelodau ynglŷn â sut y gellid gwneud hynny.

**Angela Burns:** Gan aros gyda'r rhaglen Meistr, a oes gennych unrhyw farn neu a ydych wedi gofyn i swyddogion edrych ar ba elfen neu bwysau y gellid eu rhoi, fel rhan o'r rhaglen Meistr, ar sicrhau bod gan bobl sy'n ei dilyn fwy o brofiad ym maes seicoleg, cymdeithaseg, rheoli ystafelloedd dosbarth a'r gallu i gael y gorau allan o blant a myfyrwyr? Mae cyfran helaeth o'r bobl sy'n ymgymryd â hyfforddiant athrawon yn ifanc iawn a, phan fyddant ar y rhaglen Meistr, un o'r buddiannau pennaf fyddai rhoi'r cryfder a'r sicrwydd iddynt y gallant reoli ac annog plant mewn niferoedd mawr.

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf wedi egluro yn y gorffennol bod yr elfennau o fewn y rhaglen Meistr yn canolbwyntio i raddau helaeth ar brofiad ymarferol. Maent yn cynnwys pethau megis llythrennedd a rhifedd, rheoli ymddygiad a nodi anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, a fydd yn cynnwys y disgyblion hynny sy'n fwy abl a thalentog. Felly, ymdrinnir â phob un o'r pethau hynny y cyfeiriodd yr Aelod atynt yng nghwricwlwm y rhaglen Meistr.

### Education Consortia

**6. Lindsay Whittle:** *What discussions has the Minister had with regard to education consortia in south east Wales. OAQ(4)0194(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae fy swyddogion a minnau'n parhau i ymgysylltu â phob consortiwm yn rheolaidd ar eu cynlluniau i gydweithredu er mwyn gwella safonau addysg. Caf adroddiadau ar gynnydd drwy fy nghyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'i llefarydd addysg.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Weinidog, bu rhai problemau o ran y consortia addysg arfaethedig, yn enwedig gyda phrifysgolion yn y de-ddwyrain o bosibl, ond yn ddiweddar daeth problemau i'r amlwg ar lefel awdurdodau lleol hefyd. Pa gamau a

you taken to try to rectify the problem of 2,400 laptops sitting unused at a significant cost to the taxpayer? Why did you agree to part-fund the purchase of those laptops for schools in the south-east when there were clearly not enough local authorities on board to participate?

**Leighton Andrews:** I do not think that the Member has quite got the situation right. An initial proposal for funding was brought to us in June 2010. The plan was eventually approved in January 2011, with approval given to Torfaen in February. The original plan involved three local authorities, I think, but we were advised in August 2011 by Torfaen that Newport had withdrawn from the project. There was an attempt subsequently to engage another local authority in that project. Those negotiations were quite advanced until a couple of months ago when the authority in question withdrew. We are now engaging actively with Torfaen in trying to ensure that those laptops are put to good use for young people.

**William Graham:** The Minister will be well aware that the 2009 Programme for International Student Assessment results showed education in Wales in a very poor light. Estyn has yet to find an excellent authority in Wales. The first six reports identified four authorities as satisfactory and placed two in special measures. How can the Minister assure us that the new consortia are doing their best to ensure that secondary schools are kept out of the lowest tier of his own Government's banding system?

**Leighton Andrews:** We invested in schools in bands 4 and 5 and we are currently looking at the summer results to see what the impact of that investment has been. Early indications are that there has been progress among a significant proportion of schools in bands 4 and 5 in relation to their results.

gymerwyd gennych i geisio datrys y broblem bod 2,400 o liniaduron yn eistedd yn segur ar gost sylweddol i'r trethdalwr? Pam y gwnaethoch gytuno i ran-ariannu cost prynu'r gliniaduron hynny i ysgolion yn y de-ddwyrain pan oedd yn amlwg nad oedd digon o awdurdodau lleol wedi ymrwymo i gymryd rhan?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ni chredaf fod yr Aelod wedi llawn ddeall y sefyllfa. Cyflwynwyd cynnig cychwynnol am arian ger ein bron ym mis Mehefin 2010. Cymeradwywyd y cynllun yn y pen draw ym mis Ionawr 2011, a rhoddwyd cymeradwyaeth i Dor-faen ym mis Chwefror. Roedd y cynllun gwreiddiol yn cynnwys tri awdurdod lleol, credaf, ond fe'n hysbyswyd ym mis Awst 2011 gan Dorfaen fod Casnewydd wedi tynnu'n ôl o'r prosiect. Ymdrechwyd wedi hynny i gynnwys awdurdod lleol arall yn y prosiect hwnnw. Roedd y trafodaethau hynny ar gam cymharol ddatblygedig tan ychydig fisoedd yn ôl pan dynnodd yr awdurdod dan sylw yn ôl. Rydym bellach wrthi'n ymgysylltu â Thor-faen i geisio sicrhau bod defnydd da yn cael ei wneud o'r gliniaduron ar gyfer pobl ifanc.

**William Graham:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol iawn bod canlyniadau Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr 2009 yn rhoi argraff wael iawn o addysg yng Nghymru. Nid yw Estyn wedi llwyddo hyd yma i ddod o hyd i awdurdod ardderchog yng Nghymru. Nododd y chwe adroddiad cyntaf fod pedwar awdurdod yn foddhaol a gwnaed dau ohonynt yn destun mesurau arbennig. Sut y gall y Gweinidog ein sicrhau bod y consortia newydd yn gwneud eu gorau i sicrhau na fydd ysgolion uwchradd yn cael eu rhoi yn haen isaf system fandiio ei Lywodraeth ef ei hun?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym yn buddsoddi mewn ysgolion sydd ym mandiau 4 a 5 ac rydym yn ystyried canlyniadau'r haf ar hyn o bryd er mwyn canfod effaith y buddsoddiad hwnnw. Dengys arwyddion cynnar y bu cynnydd ymhlith cyfran sylweddol o ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5 mewn perthynas â'u canlyniadau.

**Hyfforddi Llywodraethwyr Ysgol**

**School Governor Training**

**7. Lindsay Whittle:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch hyfforddi llywodraethwyr ysgol yn Nhorfaen. OAQ(4)0193(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** We have established stakeholder groups to discuss the scope and content of the new mandatory training provisions I am bringing into force. The governor support officer from Torfaen was a member of one of the groups.

**Lindsay Whittle:** The consultation on the compulsory training of school governors closed on 10 July. Certain training is now mandatory and the Party of Wales welcomes the Welsh Government's proposals because the training will give school governors in Torfaen the skills, knowledge and confidence that they need to carry out this very important job. It is stated on the Welsh Government website that:

'Subject to the outcome of the consultation it is proposed that the regulations will come into force in October 2012.'

Minister, when will you be publishing the outcome of the consultation?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Member will be aware that during the course of the One Wales Government we put the Education (Wales) Measure 2011 through, which allowed us to introduce the regulations for mandatory training for governors on certain topics. Several local authorities already operate a process of providing training for governors, but I will ensure that the full results of the consultation are available to Members.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Minister, I think that you have already partly answered my question. However, with regard to Fairwater High School in Cwmbran, Torfaen County Borough Council initially applied to remove the school governing body and subsequently withdrew the application, which demonstrates the importance of training to provide governors with a clear understanding of their role and responsibilities. What is the Minister doing to ensure that high standards of training for school governors are

**7. Lindsay Whittle:** *What discussions has the Minister had regarding the training of school governors in Torfaen. OAQ(4)0193(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym wedi sefydlu grwpiau rhanddeiliaid i drafod cwmpas a chynnwys y darpariaethau hyfforddiant gorfodol newydd yr wyf yn eu rhoi ar waith. Roedd swyddog cymorth i lywodraethwyr Tor-faen yn aelod o un o'r grwpiau.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Daeth yr ymgynghoriad ar hyfforddiant gorfodol i lywodraethwyr ysgol i ben ar 10 Gorffennaf. Mae elfennau hyfforddiant penodol bellach yn orfodol ac mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu cynigion Llywodraeth Cymru gan y bydd yr hyfforddiant yn rhoi'r sgiliau, y wybodaeth a'r hyder sydd eu hangen ar lywodraethwyr ysgol yn Nhor-faen i gyflawni'r gwaith pwysig iawn hwn. Nodir ar wefan Llywodraeth Cymru:

'Yn amodol ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad, y gobaith yw y daw'r rheoliadau i rym ym mis Hydref 2012.'

Weinidog, pryd y byddwch yn cyhoeddi canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad?

**Leighton Andrews:** Bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol inni gyflwyno Mesur Addysg (Cymru) 2011 fel rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, a oedd yn caniatáu inni gyflwyno'r rheoliadau ar gyfer hyfforddiant gorfodol i lywodraethwyr ar bynciau penodol. Mae gan sawl awdurdod lleol broses ar waith eisoes lle y darperir hyfforddiant i lywodraethwyr, ond byddaf yn sicrhau bod canlyniadau llawn yr ymgynghoriad ar gael i'r Aelodau.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Weinidog, credaf eich bod eisoes wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn yn rhannol. Fodd bynnag, o ran Ysgol Uwchradd Fairwater yng Nghwmbbrân, gwnaeth Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen gais yn wreiddiol i ddiddymu corff llywodraethu'r ysgol ond tynnwyd y cais hwnnw yn ôl, sy'n dangos pwysigrwydd hyfforddiant er mwyn sicrhau bod gan lywodraethwyr dealltwriaeth glir o'u rôl a'u cyfrifoldebau. Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i sicrhau y caiff safonau uchel eu cynnal o ran hyfforddiant i

maintained across local authorities in Wales to deliver consistent, efficient and effective school governance?

**Leighton Andrews:** Llywydd, I answered that question in my previous answer.

### Rheoleiddwyr Arholiadau

**8. Simon Thomas:** *Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cael gyda rheoleiddwyr arholiadau. OAQ(4)0200(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae swyddogion Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd gydag Ofqual, Cyngor y Cwricwlwm, Arholiadau ac Aseu, ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau'r Alban—y rheoleiddwyr arholiadau yn Lloegr, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Alban. Mae'r trafodaethau hyn yn cwmpasu amrywiaeth o faterion yn ymwneud â chymwysterau.

**Simon Thomas:** Minister, on 29 August 2012 your director of education wrote to the exam regulator in England, Ofqual, stating explicitly that it was agreed that, for GCSE English and English language only, WJEC would report against the key stage 2 predictors. This decision is the decision you described in a statement to this Chamber as failing the pupils of Wales. If, in a letter on 29 August, your director can admit that this decision was initially taken by your Government, why can you not admit it to the Chamber?

**Leighton Andrews:** The Member, I am afraid, is taking that out of context. We published a full report, I would remind him, on this issue on 10 September, and we adopted an approach of the regrading of GCSE English language, which he supported. I will be giving evidence in full on this subject tomorrow to a committee of the National Assembly, and I will give the full background to the entire issue.

**Simon Thomas:** I thank the Minister for his reply. He will know that the e-mail trail and the responses to freedom of information

lywodraethwyr ysgol ymhob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau y caiff ysgolion eu llywodraethu mewn ffordd gyson, effeithlon ac effeithiol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Lywydd, atebais y cwestiwn hwnnw yn fy ateb blaenorol.

### Exam Regulators

**8. Simon Thomas:** *What recent discussions has the Welsh Government had with exam regulators. OAQ(4)0200(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Welsh Government officials have regular discussions with Ofqual, the Council for the Curriculum, Examinations and Assessment, and the Scottish Qualifications Authority—the examinations regulators in England, Northern Ireland and Scotland. Discussions cover a range of qualifications issues.

**Simon Thomas:** Weinidog, ar 29 Awst 2012, ysgrifennodd eich cyfarwyddwr addysg at y rheoleiddiwr arholiadau yn Lloegr, Ofqual, gan ddatgan yn eglur, ar gyfer TGAU Saesneg a Saesneg iaith yn unig, y cytunwyd y byddai CBAC yn adrodd yn erbyn rhagfynegyddion cyfnod allweddol 2. Dyma'r penderfyniad a ddisgrifiwyd gennych mewn datganiad i'r Siambr hon fel penderfyniad a oedd yn methu disgyblion Cymru. Os gall eich cyfarwyddwr, mewn llythyr ar 29 Awst, gyfaddef mai eich Llywodraeth chi a wnaeth y penderfyniad hwn i ddechrau, pam na allwch chi gyfaddef hynny i'r Siambr?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae arnaf ofn fod yr Aelod yn tynnu hynny allan o gyd-destun. Hoffwn ei atgoffa ein bod wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad llawn ar y mater hwn ar 10 Medi, gan fabwysiadu dull gweithredu o ailraddio TGAU Saesneg iaith, a gefnogwyd ganddo. Byddaf yn rhoi tystiolaeth llawn ar y pwnc hwn yfory i un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a byddaf yn nodi cefndir llawn y mater cyfan.

**Simon Thomas:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Bydd yn gwybod bod y llwybr e-bost a'r ymatebion i'r ceisiadau rhyddid

requests that I have received show clearly that his Government was in agreement with Ofqual's take on the GCSE up until it decided to revise that decision. I support that, but I do not support the initial decision by his department to agree with using key stage 2 predictors. Further to that, where does this leave the qualifications system in Wales? On 7 September the head of WJEC wrote to the Minister's department saying that implementing changes for Wales alone would create a split standard for WJEC's qualification that would seriously damage the integrity of the qualification. As we now have that split standard, what is his view of the integrity of the qualification in Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** I regard the GCSE qualification in Wales as having considerable integrity and I am glad that my colleague the Minister for education in Northern Ireland regards GCSEs as having considerable integrity and quality as well. I dispute the conclusion of the Member and tomorrow at the committee I will give a full account, including the content of e-mails between my department and Ofqual, of what was actually agreed. I am afraid the Member will have to wait until then, but he may be rather surprised by the outcome, because it will challenge to a degree what he has just said.

In respect of qualifications overall, he is well aware that we have a qualifications review under way that is due to report at the end of this month, and, when we receive that report, we will decide how to take matters forward.

### Cymraeg fel Ail Iaith

**9. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am addysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith. OAQ(4)0192(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae angen gwella safonau dysgu ac addysgu Cymraeg ail iaith. Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddais gynllun i wella safonau Cymraeg ail iaith ac mae'r cynllun eisoes yn cael ei weithredu. Ymhlith camau

gwybodaeth a gefais yn dangos yn glir bod ei Lywodraeth wedi cytuno â safbwynt Ofqual o ran y TGAU hyd nes iddi benderfynu newid y penderfyniad hwnnw. Rwy'n cefnogi hynny, ond nid wyf yn cefnogi'r penderfyniad cychwynnol gan ei adran i gytuno i ddefnyddio rhagfynegyddion cyfnod allweddol 2. At hynny, beth mae hyn yn ei olygu i'r system cymwysterau yng Nghymru? Ar 7 Medi, ysgrifennodd pennaeth CBAC at adran y Gweinidog yn dweud y byddai rhoi newidiadau ar waith i Gymru yn unig yn creu safon ddeuran i gymhwyster CBAC a fyddai'n cael effaith andwyol ddifrifol ar uniondeb y cymhwyster. Gan fod y safon ddeuran honno bellach ar waith, beth yw ei farn am uniondeb y cymhwyster yng Nghymru?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf o'r farn fod gan y cymhwyster TGAU yng Nghymru gryn uniondeb ac rwy'n falch fod fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Addysg yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, o'r farn bod gan gymwysterau TGAU gryn uniondeb ac ansawdd hefyd. Rwy'n anghytuno â chasgliad yr Aelod ac yfory yn y pwyllgor, byddaf yn rhoi adroddiad llawn, gan gynnwys yr hyn a nodwyd mewn negeseuon e-bost rhwng fy adran ac Ofqual, o ran yr hyn y cytunwyd arno mewn gwirionedd. Yn anffodus, bydd yn rhaid i'r Aelod aros tan hynny, ond efallai y caiff ei synnu braidd gan y canlyniad, gan y bydd yn herio i raddau yr hyn y mae newydd ei ddweud.

O ran cymwysterau yn gyffredinol, mae'n ymwybodol iawn bod adolygiad cymwysterau yn mynd rhagddo ac y disgwylir i'r adolygiad hwnnw gyflwyno adroddiad ddiweddedd y mis, a, phan ddaw'r adroddiad hwnnw i law, byddwn yn penderfynu sut i weithredu.

### Welsh as a Second Language

**9. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the teaching of Welsh as a second language. OAQ(4)0192(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Standards of teaching and learning in Welsh second language need to improve. I recently announced a plan to improve standards in Welsh as a second language and the plan is being implemented.



gweithredu eraill, mae'r cynllun yn cynnwys adolygiad allanol o Gymraeg ail iaith yng nghyfnodau allweddol 3 a 4.

**Simon Thomas:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Fel rhywun sydd wedi dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith—a chithau, Weinidog, yn croesi'r bont o ran dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith—rwy'n croesawu'r tasglu rydych wedi ei sefydlu a chylch gorchwyl y tasglu hwnnw. Beth bynnag, fel dywedodd fy nghyfaill Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn gynharach, mae cymaint o ddisgyblion yn dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith nad ydynt llwyddo magu sgiliau yn yr iaith o gwbl. A allech chi roi eich bys ar y broblem yn y system ac esbonio pam rydym yn gwario cymaint o amser ac arian yn addysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith gyda chyn lleied o gynnydd ymysg disgyblion Cymru?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rydym wedi sefydlu grŵp i edrych ar y mater. Y bore yma, roeddwn yng nghyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp sy'n fy nghynghori fel Gweinidog ar y strategaeth addysg trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac rwy'n hapus i ddweud wrth Aelodau bod y trafodaethau wedi dechrau'n dda iawn, ac rwy'n hapus i gwrdd â'r aelodau. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen yn gwneud argymhellion i wella'r sefyllfa yn y dyfodol agos.

**Suzy Davies:** Like my colleagues, Minister, I have received concerns from a number of sources about the effectiveness of the teaching of Welsh as a second language, and in particular the short GCSE. We could be more ambitious for Welsh second language teaching if language learning could be brought into children's comfort zone at a much earlier age. Do you agree that primary schools could reproduce for all children the advantage that children from multilingual households, and not necessarily Welsh-speaking households, already have?

2.00 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** I have said before in the Chamber that the issue that must be considered is this: to expand the range of foreign-language qualifications into primary schools, you would have to tell me which

Among other actions, the plan includes an external review of Welsh as a second language at key stages 3 and 4.

**Simon Thomas:** I would like to thank the Minister for his statement. As someone who has learned Welsh as a second language—and you, Minister, are crossing the bridge in terms of learning Welsh as a second language—I welcome the taskforce that you have established and the remit of that taskforce. However, as my colleague Rhodri Glyn Thomas said a little earlier, there are so many pupils learning Welsh as a second language who do not develop any skills in the language whatsoever. Can you put your finger on the problem here and explain to us why we are spending so much time and money teaching Welsh as a second language with such little progress among Welsh pupils?

**Leighton Andrews:** We have established a group to look at the matter. This morning, I attended the first meeting of the group that is advising me as Minister on the Welsh-medium education strategy, and I am happy to tell Members that the discussions started very well, and I am happy to meet with the members. I hope that the task and finish group will make recommendations to improve the situation in the near future.

**Suzy Davies:** Fel fy nghyd-Aelodau, Weinidog, rwyf wedi derbyn pryderon gan nifer o ffynonellau am effeithiolrwydd y broses o addysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith, ac yn arbennig y cymwysterau TGAU byr. Gallem fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol o ran addysgu Cymraeg ail iaith pe gellid cyflwyno'r broses o ddysgu iaith i blant ar oedran iau o lawer gan sicrhau eu bod yn gyfforddus â'r broses honno. A gytunwch y gallai ysgolion cynradd atgynhyrchu'r budd sydd eisoes gan blant o gartrefi amlieithog, ac nid o reidrwydd aelwydydd Cymraeg, i bob plentyn?

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf wedi dweud o'r blaen yn y Siambr bod yn rhaid ystyried y mater canlynol: er mwyn ehangu'r amrywiaeth o gymwysterau ieithoedd tramor i ysgolion cynradd, byddai'n rhaid ichi

priority languages you would seek to determine. It seems to me that the real issue would be the capacity to teach a wider range of languages in primary school, and that would require prioritisation.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 10, OAQ(4)0199(ESK), has been transferred for written answer.

### Asbestos mewn Adeiladau Ysgolion

**11. William Graham:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefel yr asbestos mewn adeiladau ysgol. OAQ(4)0198(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** I have asked all authorities to undertake a review of their plans and submit their updated asbestos management plans to me. Responses show that local authorities are undertaking their statutory duties appropriately and that there are robust procedures in place for the management of asbestos in school buildings.

**William Graham:** Thank you for your reassuring answer, Minister. Will you join me in calling on the Welsh Government to support the Right to Know: Asbestos in Schools Wales campaign, which is calling for the establishment of a voluntary online school asbestos database for Wales?

**Leighton Andrews:** What we first need to do is review in detail the responses received from local authorities. There are some authorities that we feel we need to revisit to seek further information. We know that each authority has an asbestos management plan in place and, as far as we can tell from the evidence so far submitted, there are appropriate procedures in place in line with current legislation. The plans also confirm that there are strict guidelines in place to ensure adherence to existing legislation, especially in relation to building repair and maintenance works, and that appropriate training is in place. As I said in answer to the Liberal Democrat Member for South Wales West, I will be happy to publish a further written statement to Members and to take further question in due course.

ddweud wrthyf pa ieithoedd blaenoriaeth y byddech am eu cyflwyno. Ymddengys i mi mai'r broblem wirioneddol fyddai'r capasiti i addysgu amrywiaeth ehangach o ieithoedd mewn ysgolion cynradd, a byddai angen blaenoriaethu hynny.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 10, OAQ(4)0199(ESK), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

### Asbestos in School Buildings

**11. William Graham:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the level of asbestos in school buildings. OAQ(4)0198(ESK)*

**Leighton Andrews:** Rwyf wedi gofyn i bob awdurdod gynnal adolygiad o'u cynlluniau a chyflwyno eu cynlluniau rheoli asbestos diweddaraf imi. Dengys yr ymatebion fod awdurdodau lleol yn ymgymryd â'u dyletswyddau statudol yn briodol a bod gweithdrefnau cadarn ar waith ar gyfer rheoli asbestos mewn adeiladau ysgolion.

**William Graham:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb calonogol hwnnw, Weinidog. A ymunwch â mi i alw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi'r ymgyrch Right to Know: Asbestos in Schools Wales, sy'n galw am sefydlu cronfa ddata wirfoddol ar-lein i Gymru mewn perthynas ag asbestos mewn ysgolion?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr hyn sydd angen inni ei wneud yn gyntaf yw cynnal adolygiad manwl o'r ymatebion a gafwyd gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae rhai awdurdodau o'r farn bod angen inni ofyn am ragor o wybodaeth. Gwyddom fod gan bob awdurdod gynllun rheoli asbestos ar waith a, hyd y gallwn ddweud o'r dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd hyd yma, mae gweithdrefnau priodol ar waith yn unol â deddfwriaeth gyfredol. Mae'r cynlluniau hefyd yn cadarnhau bod canllawiau caeth ar waith i sicrhau y cydymffurfir â deddfwriaeth bresennol, yn enwedig o ran gwaith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw adeiladau, a bod hyfforddiant priodol ar waith. Fel y dywedais wrth ateb yr Aelod o'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol dros Orllewin De Cymru, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig pellach i Aelodau ac i ymateb i gwestiynau pellach maes o law.

**Mick Antoniw:** The key issue that rises out of the asbestos regulations is really that of information and awareness. Will you make a statement at some stage on how that information and awareness will be dealt with by the Welsh Government?

**Leighton Andrews:** As my colleague, the Member for Pontypridd, will appreciate, what is important is that the information be provided in context. As Members will appreciate, this is a subject that can raise considerable concern at a local level, and it is important that people understand that, managed safely, asbestos is not, in context, necessarily a threat to health. The issue is what happens in the context of repairs and maintenance work, for example. We are willing to take further steps with regard to this issue, but we need to be careful about the way in which we communicate these issues publicly.

**William Powell:** Given the revelation that Caerphilly County Borough Council had been conducting only visual surveys of asbestos in its school buildings rather than full invasive surveys, how confident are you that local authorities across Wales are complying with the obligations of the Control of Asbestos at Work Regulations 2002, which require such thorough surveys?

**Leighton Andrews:** As I said in answer to an earlier question, we have had the material back and we are broadly confident—no, let me put that a bit better: we are satisfied—that local authorities are compliant. There are areas on which we would like to receive further information from one or two authorities. We will follow up on that and, as I said, I will make a further statement to Members.

#### Prentisiaethau (Gorllewin Cymru)

**12. Paul Davies:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynediad at brentisiaethau yng ngorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0190(ESK)*

**Mick Antoniw:** Y mater allweddol sy'n deillio o'r rheoliadau asbestos mewn gwirionedd yw gwybodaeth ac ymwybyddiaeth. A wnewch ddatganiad rywbryd ar sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw o ran gwybodaeth ac ymwybyddiaeth?

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, yr Aelod dros Bontypridd, yn gwerthfawrogi, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod y wybodaeth yn cael ei darparu yn ei gyddestun. Fel y bydd yr Aelodau yn gwerthfawrogi, gall y pwnc hwn beri cryn bryder ar lefel leol, ac mae'n bwysig bod pobl yn deall nad yw asbestos, mewn cyddestun, o'i reoli yn ddiogel, o reidrwydd yn fygythiad i iechyd. Y broblem yw beth sy'n digwydd yng nghyd-destun gwaith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw, er enghraifft. Rydym yn barod i gymryd camau pellach mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn, ond mae angen inni fod yn ofalus o ran sut y caiff y materion hyn eu cyfleu i'r cyhoedd.

**William Powell:** O ystyried y datguddiad mai dim ond arolygon gweledol o asbestos roedd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili wedi bod yn eu cynnal yn adeiladau ei ysgolion yn hytrach nag arolygon mewnol llawn, pa mor hyderus ydych chi fod awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru yn cydymffurfio â rhwymedigaethau Rheoliadau Rheoli Asbestos yn y Gwaith 2002, sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol cynnal arolygon trylwyr o'r fath?

**Leighton Andrews:** Fel y dywedais mewn ateb i gwestiwn cynharach, rydym wedi cael y deunydd yn ôl ac rydym yn gymharol hyderus—na, gadewch imi gyfleu hynny ychydig yn well: rydym yn fodlon—bod awdurdodau lleol yn cydymffurfio. Mae meysydd lle yr hoffem gael rhagor o wybodaeth gan un neu ddau awdurdod. Byddwn yn mynd ar drywydd hynny ac, fel y dywedais, byddaf yn gwneud datganiad arall i Aelodau.

#### Apprenticeships (West Wales)

**12. Paul Davies:** *Will the Minister make a statement on access to apprenticeships in west Wales. OAQ(4)0190(ESK)*

**The Deputy Minister for Skills (Jeff Cuthbert):** Thank you for that question. We invest approximately £90 million a year to support Welsh businesses to take on apprentices as part of our all-age programme. West Wales has two work-based learning consortia, delivering 150 apprenticeship frameworks: Pathways to Apprenticeships is running in nine sectors, supporting 446 learners; and 29% of the Young Recruits programme support is in this region.

**Paul Davies:** I am grateful to the Deputy Minister for that answer. I am sure that he agrees with me that it is important that apprenticeships be tailored to the needs of local industries. Given that Pembrokeshire is now recognised as the energy capital of the UK, it is vital for local apprenticeships to be available to equip young adults in the area with the necessary skills to enter that workforce. Will the Deputy Minister outline what the Welsh Government is doing specifically to encourage local businesses to offer apprenticeships, and what practical work is being undertaken with small businesses in particular in Pembrokeshire to deliver more apprenticeships on the ground?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I agree with your basic scenario of the importance of apprenticeships, both to the young person involved and certainly to businesses. To support smaller businesses, we provide the Young Recruits programme, which provides a wage subsidy of £50 per week to businesses that can take on additional apprentices, and we also have the shared apprenticeship scheme, which enables smaller businesses to collaborate in order to offer the full framework to young people.

On the more general points, we will certainly be working with particular sector skills councils, such as Semta in engineering and Cogent in energy and life sciences, to ensure that our offer in any particular part of Wales is as relevant as it can be to the local economy.

**Rebecca Evans:** The Enterprise and

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau (Jeff Cuthbert):** Diolch ichi am y cwestiwn hwnnw. Rydym yn buddsoddi tua £90 miliwn y flwyddyn i helpu busnesau yng Nghymru i gyflogi prentisiaid fel rhan o'n rhaglen pob oed. Mae dau gonsortiw dysgu seiliedig ar waith yng Ngorllewin Cymru, lle mae 150 o fframweithiau prentisiaeth ar waith: mae Llwybrau at Brentisiaethau ar waith mewn naw sector, gan gefnogi 446 o ddysgwyr; ac mae 29% o gymorth y rhaglen Recriwtiaid Ifanc wedi'i fuddsoddi yn y rhanbarth hwn.

**Paul Davies:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. Rwy'n siŵr ei fod yn cytuno â mi ei bod yn bwysig bod prentisiaethau yn cael eu teilwra i ddiwallu anghenion diwydiannau lleol. O ystyried bod Sir Benfro bellach yn cael ei chydnabod fel prifddinas ynni'r DU, mae'n hanfodol bod prentisiaethau lleol ar gael i sicrhau bod oedolion ifanc yn yr ardal yn meddu ar y sgiliau angenrheidiol i ymuno â'r gweithlu hwnnw. A wnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud yn benodol i annog busnesau lleol i gynnig prentisiaethau, a pha waith ymarferol sy'n mynd rhagddo gyda busnesau bach yn arbennig yn Sir Benfro i ddarparu rhagor o brentisiaethau ar lawr gwlad?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Cytunaf â'ch senario sylfaenol o ran pwysigrwydd prentisiaethau, i'r person ifanc dan sylw ac yn sicr i fusnesau. Er mwyn cefnogi busnesau llai, rydym yn cynnig y rhaglen Recriwtiaid Ifanc, sy'n rhoi cymhorthdal cyflog o £50 yr wythnos i fusnesau a all gyflogi prentisiaid ychwanegol, ac rydym hefyd yn cynnig y cynllun rhannu prentisiaeth, sy'n galluogi busnesau llai i gydweithio er mwyn cynnig y fframwaith llawn i bobl ifanc.

O ran y pwyntiau mwy cyffredinol, byddwn yn sicr yn gweithio gyda chynghorau sector sgiliau penodol, fel Semta mewn peirianeg a Cogent yn y gwyddorau ynni a bywyd, i sicrhau bod yr hyn a gynnigir gennym mewn unrhyw ran benodol o Gymru mor berthnasol â phosibl i'r economi leol.

**Rebecca Evans:** Clywodd y Pwyllgor

Business Committee heard evidence from young people in Haverfordwest who said that the cost, availability and timing of transport were barriers to their accessing apprenticeships. Will you undertake to explore with the Minister for transport how these barriers can be addressed?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** All apprentices should have employed status, so transport should not be a barrier to their being recruited into an apprenticeship. However, if there are problems delivering the apprenticeship framework, where transport is an issue, we would certainly take that up. If you are aware of specific instances, it would be very helpful if you would write to me with those.

Menter a Busnes dystiolaeth gan bobl ifanc yn Hwlfordd a ddywedodd fod cost, argaeledd ac amseroedd trafndiaeth yn eu hatal rhag ymgymryd â phrentisiaethau. A ymrwymwch i ystyried sut y gellir ymdrin â'r rhwystrau hyn gyda'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Dylai fod gan bob prentis statws cyflogedig, felly ni ddylai trafndiaeth eu hatal rhag cael eu recriwtio i brentisiaeth. Fodd bynnag, os oes problemau o ran cynnig y fframwaith prentisiaethau, a bod trafndiaeth yn broblem, byddem yn sicr yn ymchwilio i hynny. Os ydych yn ymwybodol o achosion penodol, byddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn pe gallech ysgrifennu ataf gyda'r rheini.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau Questions to the Minister for Local Government and Communities**

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 1, OAQ(4)0196(LGC), has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 1, OAQ(4)0196(LGC), yn ôl.

#### **Clystyrau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf**

#### **Communities First Clusters**

**2. Mike Hedges:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am greu clystyrau rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ardal Abertawe. OAQ(4)0198(LGC)*

**2. Mike Hedges:** *Will the Minister provide an update on the creation of Communities First programme clusters in the Swansea area. OAQ(4)0198(LGC)*

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** I thank the Member for Swansea East for his question. The City and County of Swansea submitted applications for five Communities First clusters. The applications are currently being assessed and I hope to take decisions shortly.

**Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ddwyrain Abertawe am ei gwestiwn. Cyflwynodd Dinas a Sir Abertawe geisiadau am bum clwstwr Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'r ceisiadau wrthi'n cael eu hasesu ar hyn o bryd a'r gobraith yw y gallaf wneud penderfyniadau yn fuan.

**Mike Hedges:** Thank you for your response, Minister. I would like to echo my support for the creation of Communities First clusters. It is a direction that will improve Communities First provision in the Swansea area as, I am sure, in the rest of Wales.

**Mike Hedges:** Diolch am eich ymateb, Weinidog. Hoffwn adleisio fy nghefnogaeth o blaid creu clystyrau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae'n gyfeiriad a fydd yn gwella'r ddarpariaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ardal Abertawe, felly hefyd, rwy'n siŵr, yng ngweddill Cymru.

There are a number of people currently employed who are under redundancy notices. What assurances can I give them, or what assurances can be given to them, that they will know shortly whether they will be able

Mae nifer o bobl sydd wedi'u cyflogi ar hyn o bryd sydd o dan hysbysiadau diswyddo. Pa sicrwydd y gallaf ei roi iddynt, neu pa sicrwydd y gellir ei roi iddynt, y byddant yn gwybod yn fuan pa un a fyddant yn gallu

to continue in employment?

**Carl Sargeant:** The applications have to be considered very carefully, and I have already approved some funding streams for clusters across Wales. I will consider the question that you raise. The most important part of the Communities First organisation is its staff. I recognise that, and I will take that into consideration in making my decisions for the future.

### Bil Teithio Llesol

**3. Suzy Davies:** *Beth yw ymateb y Gweinidog i'r sylwadau a gyflwynwyd gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru i'r ymgynghoriad ar Fil Teithio Llesol (Cymru). OAQ(4)0199(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** All submissions in relation to the active travel White Paper have been analysed and the Welsh Government's response is available on the website.

**Suzy Davies:** Thank you for that answer, because that response is also immediately relevant to the safety of routes to school. Minister, local authorities are devising safe walking routes, based on new standard guidelines that still cite case law from the 1950s, but which fail to take into account the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Learner Travel (Wales) Measure 2008. Will you undertake to have a look at that, please, to ensure that both those documents are taken into account, putting child protection at the heart of safe routes to school?

**Carl Sargeant:** Yes.

**Julie Morgan:** It is encouraging that there has been a significant increase in Cardiff in the number of children who cycle to school. As part of the Cardiff Cycle Festival, organised in June by Sustrans and Cardiff Council, there was a cycling to school challenge, and Gabalfa Primary School in my constituency of Cardiff North gained the top results, with 23% of students cycling to school every day during the festival.

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for her positive comment. I also wish to congratulate

parhau i weithio?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'n rhaid ystyried y ceisiadau yn ofalus iawn, ac rwyf eisoes wedi cymeradwyo rhai ffrydiau cyllid ar gyfer clystyrau ledled Cymru. Ystyriaf y cwestiwn a godwyd gennych. Rhan bwysicaf y sefydliad Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yw ei staff. Rwy'n cydnabod hynny, ac fe ystyriaf hynny wrth wneud fy mhenderfyniadau ar gyfer y dyfodol.

### Active Travel Bill

**3. Suzy Davies:** *What is the Minister's response to the Children's Commissioner for Wales' submission to the Active Travel (Wales) Bill consultation. OAQ(4)0199(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Dadansoddwyd yr holl gyflwyniadau mewn perthynas â'r Papur Gwyn ar deithio llesol ac mae ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru ar gael ar y wefan.

**Suzy Davies:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, oherwydd mae hefyd yn uniongyrchol berthnasol i ddiogelwch llwybrau i'r ysgol. Weinidog, mae awdurdodau lleol yn llunio llwybrau cerdded diogel, yn seiliedig ar ganllawiau safonol newydd sy'n dal i ddyfynnu cyfraith achosion o'r 1950au, ond sy'n methu ag ystyried Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn a Mesur Teithio gan Ddysgwyr (Cymru) 2008. A ymrwymwch i fwrw golwg ar hynny, os gwelwch yn dda, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff y ddwy ddogfen honno eu hystyried, gan sicrhau bod amddiffyn plant wrth wraidd llwybrau diogel i'r ysgol?

**Carl Sargeant:** Gwnaf.

**Julie Morgan:** Mae'r cynnydd yn nifer y plant sy'n beicio i'r ysgol yng Nghaerdydd yn galonogol. Fel rhan o Wyl Beicio Caerdydd, a drefnwyd ym mis Mehefin gan Sustrans a Chyngor Caerdydd, cynhaliwyd her beicio i'r ysgol, gydag Ysgol Gynradd Gabalfa yn fy etholaeth i, sef Gogledd Caerdydd, yn fuddugol, gyda 23% o'r disgyblion yn beicio i'r ysgol bob dydd yn ystod yr ŵyl.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei sylw cadarnhaol. Hoffwn hefyd longyfarch Cyngor

Cardiff Council and the other organisations involved in that project. I have been out with young people across Cardiff on the Bike It scheme and on the walk-to-school events. I thoroughly enjoyed it and would encourage more authorities across Wales to contribute to this active travel debate.

**Rebecca Evans:** In his response, the Children's Commissioner for Wales calls for the suitability of routes through communities and to places of education and recreation to be subject to an assessment by children and young people to ensure that they feel comfortable and safe on the route. Minister, what is your vision for the role of children and young people in the development of safe walking and cycling routes?

**Carl Sargeant:** Of course, new routes are designed and developed by people who build roads, footpaths and cycle paths. It is really important to have community engagement in these processes to enable those who we want to use the routes to do so because they are of the correct design and correspond to what people want. Young people's views on this are extremely important to me, and I will be working with the department for education and skills to ensure that we can embrace opportunities to improve interaction for young people in relation to the development of Welsh Government policy.

#### Blaenoriaethau

**4. Elin Jones:** *Beth yw blaenoriaethau eich adran am y chwe mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0193(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** My priorities are to deliver on our programme for government commitments to reduce poverty, to make our communities safer, and to support the delivery of effective and efficient public services in Wales.

**Elin Jones:** Weinidog, nid wyf yn disgwyl ichi adeiladu ac ailagor rheilffordd rhwng Caerfyrddin ac Aberystwyth yn y chwe mis nesaf, ond gan fod deiseb wedi'i chyflwyno i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn dymuno gweld ailagor y rheilffordd hon, ac rwy'n sicr yn

Caerdydd a'r sefydliadau eraill a fu'n ymwneud â'r prosiect hwnnw. Rwyf wedi bod allan gyda phobl ifanc ledled Caerdydd fel rhan o'r cynllun Beiciwch Hi ac ar y digwyddiadau cerdded i'r ysgol. Gwneuthum fwynhau'n arw a byddem yn annog mwy o awdurdodau ledled Cymru i gyfrannu at y ddadl teithio llesol hon.

**Rebecca Evans:** Yn ei ymateb, mae Comisiynydd Plant Cymru yn galw am asesiad o addasrwydd llwybrau drwy gymunedau ac i leoedd addysg a hamdden gan blant a phobl ifanc er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn teimlo'n gyfforddus ac yn ddiogel ar y llwybr. Weinidog, beth yw eich gweledigaeth ar gyfer rôl plant a phobl ifanc yn y gwaith o ddatblygu llwybrau cerdded a beicio diogel?

**Carl Sargeant:** Wrth gwrs, caiff llwybrau newydd eu cynllunio a'u datblygu gan bobl sy'n adeiladu ffyrdd, llwybrau troed a llwybrau beicio. Mae'n bwysig iawn ymgysylltu â chymunedau fel rhan o'r prosesau hyn er mwyn galluogi'r rhai sydd am ddefnyddio'r llwybrau i wneud hynny gan eu bod wedi'u cynllunio'n briodol ac yn cyfateb i'r hyn y mae pobl am ei gael. Mae barn pobl ifanc yn hyn o beth yn hynod bwysig imi, a byddaf yn gweithio gyda'r adran addysg a sgiliau i sicrhau y gallwn fanteisio ar gyfleoedd i wella trefniadau rhyngweithio i bobl ifanc mewn perthynas â datblygu polisi Llywodraeth Cymru.

#### Priorities

**4. Elin Jones:** *What are your department's priorities for the next six months. OAQ(4)0193(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Fy mlaenoriaethau yw cyflawni ein hymrwymadau o ran y rhaglen lywodraethu sef lleihau tlodi, gwneud ein cymunedau yn fwy diogel, a helpu i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol ac effeithlon yng Nghymru.

**Elin Jones:** Minister, I do not expect you to build and reopen the railway line between Carmarthen and Aberystwyth in the next six months, but given that a petition has been submitted to the National Assembly seeking the reopening of this railway line, and I

cefnogi hynny gan ei bod yn rheilffordd a gafodd ei chau yn y 1960au, a wnewch chi ofyn i'ch swyddogion edrych ar sut y gellid astudio ac asesu dichonoldeb yn y tymor rhagweladwy ailagor rheilffordd o'r math er mwyn gwella trafndiaeth gynaliadwy yn y gorllewin?

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome the Member's question given its importance to her local community. However, I refer the Member to the priorities within the national transport plan. I will note her question and ask my officials to look at that appropriately.

**Mick Antoniw:** Minister, as local authorities increasingly raise the issue of a living wage, will you give an indication of how many workers in Wales earn less than the current living wage? What are the Government's priorities with regard to this issue?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Welsh Government has made a commitment on the living wage, and I refer the Member to the statement that we made some time ago. I will be updating that this week. As you will be aware, there has been a lot of interest in the national agenda on the living wage, and many political statements have been made this week. I am very supportive of the living wage, but it has to be based on evidence. The working group that we have established in Wales, which works with the Welsh Government and partners, will give us some more information regarding whether and how we can develop that further.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Minister, Bridgend County Borough Council was recently criticised after it emerged that one councillor pocketed over £9,500 of taxpayers' money for being the chairperson of a committee that existed in name only. It has also emerged since that a further four councils have yet to fulfil the requirements of the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011 that you brought in. As the driver of that Measure, will you tell us how many of the 22 local authorities in Wales have fulfilled its requirements by setting up a democracy committee?

certainly support that as it is a railway line that was closed in the 1960s, will you ask your officials to consider how the feasibility of reopening a railway line of this type in the foreseeable term can be studied and assessed in order to improve sustainable transport in west Wales?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwy'n croesawu cwestiwn yr Aelod o ystyried ei bwysigrwydd i'w chymuned leol. Fodd bynnag, cyfeiriaf yr Aelod at y blaenoriaethau o fewn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol. Nodaf ei chwestiwn a gofynnaf i'm swyddogion edrych ar hynny yn briodol.

**Mick Antoniw:** Weinidog, gan fod awdurdodau lleol yn gynyddol yn codi mater cyflog byw, a wnewch roi syniad o faint o weithwyr yng Nghymru sy'n ennill llai na'r cyflog byw ar hyn o bryd? Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth yn hyn o beth?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi gwneud ymrwymiad ar y cyflog byw, a chyfeiriaf yr Aelod at y datganiad a wnaethom beth amser yn ôl. Byddaf yn ei ddiweddarau yr wythnos hon. Fel y byddwch yn ymwybodol, bu cryn dipyn o ddiddordeb yn yr agenda genedlaethol ar y cyflog byw, a gwnaed sawl datganiad gwleidyddol yr wythnos hon. Rwy'n gadarn o blaid y cyflog byw, ond rhaid iddo fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Bydd y gweithgor a sefydlwyd gennym yng Nghymru, sy'n gweithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru a phartneriaid, yn rhoi rhagor o wybodaeth inni o ran pa un a allwn ddatblygu hynny ymhellach a sut i wneud hynny.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Weinidog, cafodd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr ei feirniadu'n ddiweddar ar ôl iddi ddod i'r amlwg bod un cynghorydd yn cael dros £9,500 o arian trethdalwyr am gadeirio pwyllgor a oedd ond yn bodoli mewn enw yn unig. Daeth i'r amlwg hefyd ers hynny fod pedwar cyngor arall wedi methu â chyflawni gofynion Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011 a gyflwynwyd gennych. Fel ysgogwr y Mesur hwnnw, a ddywedwch wrthym faint o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru sydd wedi cyflawni ei ofynion drwy sefydlu pwyllgor democratiaeth?



**Carl Sargeant:** I am the Minister who introduced the Measure, but the delivery is the responsibility of all local government authorities across Wales.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. According to the legal requirements of the 2011 Measure, these democratic services committees need meet only once a year. Given that the accompanying special responsibility allowance is over £9,000 per year, do you consider that meeting only once is a good use of taxpayers' money? What are you doing, as Minister, to ensure that this Measure is implemented and is achieving its real aims?

**Carl Sargeant:** Local democracy is important to me and to many across the community. If we are talking about performance-related pay, the Member might want to consider her own salary.

2.15 p.m.

**Christine Chapman:** Minister, I was disappointed to learn that at least one commuter rail service operating during the rush hour this morning between my constituency and Cardiff consisted of just two train carriages, making the journey less safe and comfortable for passengers and staff, and possibly deterring users. While I understand that emergencies or last-minute changes may mean that there is no other option, do you agree that this is simply unacceptable as a matter of course, and will you as a priority enter into discussions with service providers to ensure adequate provision of carriages?

**Carl Sargeant:** The pressure on the network is something that the Member has raised with me before, and I share her concerns. The operators are in an interesting agreement in relation to the franchises that are operated, but, with the electrification of the Valleys lines and the main line, and with new progress with integrated transport across Wales, who knows? We aspire to making sure that we have a system suitable for the future in Wales.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fi yw'r Gweinidog a gyflwynodd y Mesur, ond yr holl awdurdodau llywodraeth leol ledled Cymru sy'n gyfrifol am ei roi ar waith.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Yn ôl gofynion cyfreithiol Mesur 2011, dim ond unwaith y flwyddyn y mae angen i'r pwyllgorau gwasanaethau democrataidd hyn gyfarfod. O ystyried bod y lwfans cyfrifoldeb arbennig cysylltiedig yn cyfateb i fwy na £9,000 y flwyddyn, a ydych o'r farn bod cyfarfod unwaith y flwyddyn yn unig yn ddefnydd da o arian trethdalwyr? Beth rydych yn ei wneud, fel Gweinidog, i sicrhau y caiff y Mesur hwn ei roi ar waith a'i fod yn cyflawni ei nodau gwirioneddol?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae democratiaeth leol yn bwysig i mi ac i lawer ymhob rhan o'r gymuned. Os ydym yn sôn am gyflog sy'n gysylltiedig â pherfformiad, efallai yr hoffai'r Aelod ystyried ei chyflog hi ei hun.

**Christine Chapman:** Weinidog, rwy'n siomedig o glywed mai dim ond dau gerbyd trên oedd ar o leiaf un gwasanaeth rheilffordd i gymudwyr a oedd yn gweithredu yn ystod yr awr frys y bore yma rhwng fy etholaeth a Chaerdydd, gan olygu bod y daith yn llai diogel a chyfforddus i deithwyr a staff, ac o bosibl yn atal defnyddwyr. Er fy mod yn deall y gallai argyfyngau neu newidiadau munud olaf olygu nad oes unrhyw ddewis arall, a gytunwch fod hyn yn gwbl annerbyniol fel mater o drefn, ac a wnewch gynnal trafodaethau gyda darparwyr gwasanaethau, fel mater o flaenoriaeth, i sicrhau bod digon o gerbydau yn cael eu darparu?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r pwysau ar y rhwydwaith yn rhywbeth y mae'r Aelod wedi'i godi gyda mi eisoes, ac rwy'n rhannu ei phryderon. Mae gan y gweithredwyr gytundeb diddorol o ran y masnachfreintiau a gaiff eu gweithredu, ond, wrth i reilffordd y Cymoedd a'r brif linell rheilffordd gael eu trydaneiddio, ac o ystyried cynnydd newydd o ran trafndiaeth integredig ledled Cymru, pwy a wŷr? Rydym yn anelu at sicrhau bod gennym system sy'n addas ar gyfer y dyfodol

yng Nghymru.

**William Powell:** Given yesterday's statement by the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science on the future of the Powys local growth zones, what modifications would you consider making to your department's priorities to ensure that the essential infrastructure projects envisaged to deliver those zones are able to come forward? I am thinking particularly of the hourly service from Aberystwyth to Shrewsbury, which would contribute greatly to the economic vitality of Newtown.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome the Member's question. The discussions between me and the Minister for business are ongoing. There is no change to my priorities for the hourly service, which have been well documented in this Chamber.

**Sandy Mewies:** Minister, in recognising how important all transport links, including rail, are to the economy and the social wellbeing of north Wales, will you ask your officials to look in the next six months at the possibility of electrification of the north Wales line?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for her important question. I am also grateful for the recent meeting that you, Ann Jones and Ken Skates held regarding the interest in the electrification of the north Wales line. This is something that I have raised with the Minister for transport in Westminster, and it is something that we will pursue with vigour in Wales.

#### Awdurdodau Lleol

**5. Gwyn R. Price:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol Cymru. OAQ(4)0203(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Collaboration between local authorities is critical if we are to survive the tough financial challenges ahead. Following the compact for change between local government and the Welsh Government, I am continuing to encourage and support this with

**William Powell:** O ystyried datganiad ddoe gan y Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ar ddyfodol parthau twf lleol Powys, pa addasiadau y byddech yn ystyried eu gwneud i flaenoriaethau eich adran er mwyn sicrhau y gall y prosiectau seilwaith hanfodol a ragwelir er mwyn cyflawni'r parthau hynny gael eu rhoi ar waith? Rwy'n meddwl yn benodol am y gwasanaeth bob awr o Aberystwyth i'r Amwythig, a fyddai'n cyfrannu'n sylweddol at hyfywedd economaidd y Drenewydd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf gwestiwn yr Aelod. Mae'r trafodaethau rhyngof i a'r Gweinidog Busnes yn mynd rhagddynt. Nid oes unrhyw newid i'm blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth bob awr, a ddogfennwyd yn helaeth yn y Siambr hon.

**Sandy Mewies:** Weinidog, wrth gydnabod pa mor bwysig yw'r holl gysylltiadau trafnidiaeth, gan gynnwys rheilffyrdd, i economi a lles cymdeithasol gogledd Cymru, a ofynnwch i'ch swyddogion ymchwilio, yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf, i'r posibilrwydd o drydaneiddio prif linell rheilffordd y gogledd?

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei chwestiwn pwysig. Rwyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar am y cyfarfod diweddar y gwnaethoch chi, Ann Jones a Ken Skates ei gynnal o ran y diddordeb yn y posibilrwydd o drydaneiddio llinell rheilffordd y gogledd. Rwyf wedi codi'r mater gyda'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth yn San Steffan, ac mae'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn ymchwilio'n frwd iddo yng Nghymru.

#### Local Authorities

**5. Gwyn R. Price:** *Will the Minister make a statement on collaboration between Welsh local authorities. OAQ(4)0203(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn hollbwysig er mwyn inni oresgyn yr heriau ariannol anodd sydd o'n blaenau. Yn dilyn y compact ar gyfer newid rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth Cymru, rwy'n parhau i annog a chefnogi hyn

a new £10 million regional collaboration fund.

**Gwyn R. Price:** Minister, protecting front-line services must be a priority for councils across Wales. Do you agree that the collaboration that we are seeing between Caerphilly and Blaenau Gwent councils in social services should be an example for all other local authorities to follow?

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome collaboration across all parts of Wales, and I am grateful to the Member for highlighting the activities local to his constituency. You are quite right to say that collaboration should be the new key word for organisations across Wales, not just within local government but in organisations working with the public sector. I am encouraged by the many opportunities that have been presented to me, but there is an awfully long way to go.

**Mark Isherwood:** How do you respond to concerns raised with me by some local authority leaders in north Wales that the £10-million top-slice for regional collaboration will equate to £5 million less for prudential borrowing for each £300,000 that will be cut? Concerns were also raised about your letter to the Welsh Local Government Association saying that health and social service budgets are to be ring-fenced, as this equates to 65% of their influencable budget and will generate far bigger cuts to front-line services such as leisure and youth services, libraries, trading standards, economic development, regeneration, the housing strategy and the homelessness strategy.

**Carl Sargeant:** I suggest that the Member's contribution—wherever he got that information from—is nonsense. If the leaders that he refers to wish to come to see me to talk to me about that, I would be more than happy to have that discussion. Ten million pounds is 0.25% of what would be the revenue support grant settlement. It is a collaboration fund, but it is still local government money—it is not a reduction. It is in addition to the money that local

gyda chronfa cydweithio rhanbarthol newydd o £10 miliwn.

**Gwyn R. Price:** Weinidog, rhaid i ddiogelu gwasanaethau rheng flaen fod yn flaenoriaeth i gynghorau ledled Cymru. A gytunwch y dylai'r trefniadau cydweithio sydd ar waith rhwng cyngor Caerffili a chyngor Blaenau Gwent ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fod yn esiampl i bob awdurdod lleol arall ei dilyn?

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf ymdrechion i gydweithio ymhob rhan o Gymru, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r Aelod am dynnu sylw at y gweithgareddau lleol yn ei etholaeth. Rydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud y dylid ystyried cydweithio fel y gair allweddol newydd i sefydliadau ledled Cymru, nid yn unig ym maes llywodraeth leol ond o fewn sefydliadau sy'n gweithio gyda'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r cyfleoedd niferus a gyflwynwyd ger fy mron yn galonogol, ond mae cryn dipyn i'w wneud o hyd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Beth yw eich ymateb i bryderon a godwyd gyda mi gan arweinwyr rhai awdurdodau lleol yn y gogledd y bydd y brigdoriad o £10 miliwn ar gyfer cydweithio rhanbarthol yn golygu £5 miliwn yn llai ar gyfer benthycia darbodus am bob £300,000 a gaiff ei dorri? Codwyd pryderon hefyd am eich llythyr i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn dweud y caiff cyllidebau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol eu clustnodi, gan fod hyn yn cyfateb i 65% o'r gyllideb y gallant ddylanwadu arni ac y bydd yn creu toriadau llawer mwy i wasanaethau rheng flaen, megis gwasanaethau hamdden ac ieuencid, llyfrgelloedd, safonau masnach, datblygu economaidd, adfywio, y strategaeth dai a'r strategaeth ddigartrefedd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Awgrymaf mai nonsens yw cyfraniad yr Aelod—ni waeth ble y cafodd y wybodaeth honno. Os hoffai'r arweinwyr y cyfeiria atynt ddod i'm gweld i drafod y mater, byddwn yn fwy na pharod i gynnal y drafodaeth honno. Mae £10 miliwn yn cyfateb i 0.25% o setliad y grant cynnal refeniw. Mae'n gronfa cydweithio, ond arian llywodraeth leol ydyw o hyd—nid gostyngiad mohono. Mae'n ychwanegol at y cynnydd ariannol y mae llywodraeth leol

government has already had in an increase, and it has been welcomed by many authorities. However, if the authorities that do not want to take part in the collaboration deal do not want to access it, they will not get any money either.

**Lindsay Whittle:** Has the Minister considered the idea of promoting joint initiatives between neighbouring authorities in order to ensure economic growth?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member raises a really important point. I work with the Minister for Business, Enterprise, Technology and Science and Cabinet members collectively to look at how we can best use the limited funding available to encourage further collaboration deals, bearing in mind that the Welsh Government has received £2.1 billion less from the UK Government in Westminster.

**Peter Black:** Minister, you may have heard the evidence given to the Finance Committee on the draft budget by local councils, which indicated that one of the problems they are having with collaboration is that, when they try to work with health authorities, or health boards as they are now known, the boards are trying to pass costs on to them and avoid the pooled budget approach that we all support. What work have you done to look into this particular problem?

**Carl Sargeant:** The public service leadership group has members from across the public sector, including local health boards, fire services, the police and local authorities, working very closely together. I have seen many projects that are transformational in their operation across Wales involving local authorities and health boards. The Gwent frailty project is one of those models, and it is an example of local authorities and health boards working very well together. Often, there are many obstacles placed in the way of working differently from the traditional ways local authorities or health boards have always worked. These are often overcome by trust, and I am pushing opportunities to develop new ideas very hard. One example in north Wales is the north Wales social services improvement collaborative. There is also the

eisoes wedi'i gael, ac fe'i croesawyd gan lawer o awdurdodau. Fodd bynnag, os nad yw'r awdurdodau nad ydynt am gymryd rhan yn y cytundeb cydweithio am gael gafael arno, ni fyddant yn cael unrhyw arian ychwaith.

**Lindsay Whittle:** A yw'r Gweinidog wedi ystyried y syniad o hyrwyddo mentrau ar y cyd rhwng awdurdodau cyfagos er mwyn sicrhau twf economaidd?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn codi pwynt pwysig iawn. Rwy'n gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog Busnes, Menter, Technoleg a Gwyddoniaeth ac aelodau'r Cabinet ar y cyd i ganfod y ffordd orau o ddefnyddio'r arian cyfyngedig sydd ar gael i annog cytundebau cydweithio pellach, o gofio bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cael £2.1 biliwn yn llai gan Lywodraeth y DU yn San Steffan.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, efallai eich bod wedi clywed y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ar y gyllideb ddrafft gan gynghorau lleol, a oedd yn nodi mai un o'r problemau maent yn ei chael o ran cydweithio yw, pan fyddant yn ceisio gweithio gydag awdurdodau iechyd, neu fyrddau iechyd fel y'u gelwir yn awr, mae'r byrddau yn ceisio trosglwyddo costau iddynt hwy ac osgoi'r dull rhannu cyllideb a gefnogir gan bob un ohonom. Pa waith rydych wedi'i wneud i ymdrin â'r broblem benodol hon?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae grŵp arwain y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn cynnwys aelodau o bob rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys byrddau iechyd lleol, gwasanaethau tân, yr heddlu ac awdurdodau lleol, yn gweithio'n agos iawn gyda'i gilydd. Rwyf wedi gweld llawer o brosiectau trawsnewidiol ledled Cymru sy'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd. Mae prosiect eiddilwch Gwent yn un o'r modelau hynny, ac mae'n enghraifft o awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd yn gweithio yn dda iawn gyda'i gilydd. Yn aml, mae nifer o rwystrau wrth geisio gweithio mewn ffordd sy'n cefnu ar ddulliau traddodiadol awdurdodau lleol neu fyrddau iechyd. Yn aml caiff y rhwystrau hyn eu goresgyn drwy ymddiriedaeth, ac rwy'n annog cyfleoedd i ddatblygu syniadau newydd i'r eithaf. Un enghraifft yng

Gwent frailty project. So this is working; it is just that, sometimes, individuals are not the willing partner.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that, Minister. It would be nice to have an example of how collaboration can work other than the Gwent frailty project. I accept your last point that not everyone is willing to be a partner. That is precisely the point being made on the ground, namely that local authorities are willing to work with each other but that, when they try to work with organisations outside local government, and particularly with health boards, they are finding that there is reluctance and that attempts are made to use the collaboration to pass on costs that they do not believe they should bear. Clearly, there is an issue in the sense that you are the only Minister who seems to be promoting the collaboration agenda. Do you think that that is fair?

**Carl Sargeant:** I do not accept your last point. Of course, colleagues right across Cabinet support me on this. It was a collective decision to develop collaboration. Earlier, the Minister for Education and Skills answered questions on this very issue. You asked for examples other than the Gwent frailty project. I mentioned earlier what is happening in north Wales. There is also a social care commissioning hub in north Wales. There is the Western bay health and social care programme in the Western bay footprint area. There is the regional collaborative committee's Supporting People programme in Cwm Taf. I could refer to many more. If the Member wishes for more details, he might wish to write to me requesting those.

### Gweithio'n Drawsffiniol

**6. Mark Drakeford:** *Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i annog awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i weithio'n drawsffiniol. OAQ(4)0201(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Collaboration between local

ngogledd Cymru yw rhaglen welliant gydweithredol gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gogledd Cymru. Dylid nodi prosiect eiddilwch Gwent hefyd. Felly mae'r broses yn gweithio; ond, weithiau, nid yw unigolion yn barod i gymryd rhan.

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am hynny, Weinidog. Byddai'n braf cael enghraifft o sut y gall cydweithredu weithio ar wahân i brosiect eiddilwch Gwent. Derbyniaf eich pwynt olaf nad yw pawb yn barod i gymryd rhan. Dyna'r union bwynt sy'n dod i'r amlwg ar lawr gwlad, sef bod awdurdodau lleol yn barod i weithio gyda'i gilydd ond, pan fyddant yn ceisio gweithio gyda sefydliadau y tu allan i lywodraeth leol, ac yn arbennig gyda byrddau iechyd, eu bod yn wynebu amharodrwydd ac ymdrechion i ddefnyddio'r trefniadau cydweithio i drosglwyddo costau nad ydynt o'r farn y dylent orfod eu talu. Yn amlwg, mae problem yn yr ystyr mai chi yw'r unig Weinidog, yn ôl pob tebyg, sy'n hyrwyddo'r agenda cydweithio. A dydych o'r farn bod hynny'n deg?

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt olaf. Wrth gwrs, mae cyd-Aelodau ymhob rhan o'r Cabinet yn fy nghefnogi yn hyn o beth. Gwnaed penderfyniad cyfun i ddatblygu trefniadau cydweithio. Yn gynharach, atebodd y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau gwestiynau ar yr union fater hwn. Gofynasoch am enghreifftiau ar wahân i brosiect eiddilwch Gwent. Soniais yn gynharach am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae yna hefyd ganolfan comisiynu gofal cymdeithasol yng ngogledd Cymru. Mae rhaglen iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ym mae'r Gorllewin yn ardal ôl-troed bae'r Gorllewin. Mae rhaglen Cefnogi Pobl y pwyllgor cydweithredol rhanbarthol yng Nghwm Taf. Gallwn gyfeirio at sawl enghraifft arall. Os hoffai'r Aelod ragor o fanylion, mae croeso iddo ysgrifennu ataf yn gofyn amdanynt.

### Cross-border Working

**6. Mark Drakeford:** *What steps is the Minister taking to encourage cross-border working between local authorities in Wales. OAQ(4)0201(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cydweithio rhwng

authorities is critical if we are to survive the tough challenges ahead. Following the compact for change between local government and the Welsh Government, I am continuing to encourage and support this.

**Mark Drakeford:** Thank you, Minister. Cross-border working between local authorities is essential to the achievement of a whole series of Welsh Government priorities, including the production of sensible local development plans and making a reality of the city-regions concept. What leadership are Welsh Ministers able to provide to help local authorities overcome some difficult histories in this area so that they are better able to work together to create the sort of services people in their areas are entitled to expect?

**Carl Sargeant:** It has been challenging to get people who have traditionally worked in one area to work beyond the normal boundaries they have been comfortable with. My team operates through the PSLG, as I mentioned earlier, working with the Minister for business on city regions to develop relationships that are clearly working in many areas. As I said earlier in response to your colleague's question, where people wish to participate, we will encourage and help them all the way. Where people fail to do this, they will be left behind and will start to fail on service delivery. That is where we will step in to make that difference.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Minister, you have attempted to present this year's local government settlement as a generous gift from the Welsh Government to local authorities. However, the £10 million of top-slicing that you have taken away from the revenue support grant for collaboration means that authorities now face a double whammy as they are losing out on that—in Conwy it is £400,000—and as it now affects their prudential borrowing capacity. Minister, is it not the case that the £10 million that you have top-sliced is an admission that your collaboration agenda has, so far, failed and

awdurdodau lleol yn hollbwysig er mwyn goresgyn yr heriau anodd sydd o'n blaenau. Yn dilyn y compact ar gyfer newid rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth Cymru, rwy'n parhau i annog a chefnogi hyn.

**Mark Drakeford:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog. Mae gweithio trawsffiniol rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn hanfodol er mwyn cyflawni cyfres gyfan blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cymru, gan gynnwys llunio cynlluniau datblygu lleol synhwyrol a throi'r cysyniad o ddinas-ranbarthau yn realiti. Pa arweinyddiaeth y gall Gweinidogion Cymru ei darparu er mwyn helpu awdurdodau lleol i oresgyn rhai hanesion anodd yn y maes hwn er mwyn iddynt fod mewn sefyllfa well i gydweithio i greu'r math o wasanaethau y mae gan bobl yn eu hardaloedd yr hawl i'w disgwyl?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae darbwylllo pobl sydd wedi gweithio mewn un maes yn draddodiadol i weithio y tu hwnt i'w ffiniau cysur arferol wedi bod yn her. Mae fy nhîm yn gweithredu drwy'r adran Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Llywodraeth Leol, fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach, gan weithio gyda'r Trefnydd ar ddinas-ranbarthau i ddatblygu cydberthnasau sy'n amlwg yn gweithio mewn sawl ardal. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach mewn ymateb i gwestiwn eich cyd-Aelod, lle mae pobl yn awyddus i gymryd rhan, byddwn yn eu hannog ac yn eu helpu drwy gydol y broses. Pan fydd pobl yn methu â gwneud hyn, byddant yn cael eu gadael ar ôl a byddwn yn dechrau methu o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Dyna lle byddwn yn camu i mewn i wneud y gwahaniaeth hwnnw.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Weinidog, rydych wedi ceisio cyflwyno setliad llywodraeth leol eleni fel rhodd hael gan Lywodraeth Cymru i awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r brigdoriad o £10 miliwn rydych wedi'i dynnu o'r grant cynnal refeniw ar gyfer cydweithio bellach yn golygu bod awdurdodau yn colli allan ddwywaith gan eu bod yn colli allan ar hwnnw—gwerth £400,000 yng Nghonwy—a'i fod yn awr yn effeithio ar eu gallu benthyca darbodus. Weinidog, onid yw'r £10 miliwn a frigidorrwyd gennych yn cydnabod bod eich agenda cydweithio, hyd yma, wedi methu, a'ch bod, i bob pwrpas, yn cosbi'r

that you are simply punishing those compliant authorities in order to, almost, bribe those authorities that are not listening to you at all? Is this the best that you can do?

**Carl Sargeant:** I am impressed by the Member's question yet again, but the Member is ill informed again. If the Member looks at the budget line, she will see that the £10 million is not part of the RSG; it is RSG plus £10 million. If this is the worst I can do, as the Member suggests, I wonder what the Member's comments would be on the basis that, in Wales, Welsh local government, over the three-year settlement, will be getting an average of a 0.6% increase, whereas, in England, under her administration in Westminster, local government will be receiving a reduction of 0.6% to its settlement. I think that she has got this all wrong.

#### Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus

**7. Simon Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru. OAQ(4)0195(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I am grateful for the Member's question. My priorities for public transport in Mid and West Wales are set out in the national transport plan.

**Simon Thomas:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod cryn dipyn o siom wedi'i fynegi yn dilyn ei ddatganiad heddiw, a datganiad y Prif Weinidog ddoe, y bydd rhaid aros tan 2015, i bob pwrpas, am y gwasanaeth bob awr ar hyd lein y Cambrian o Amwythig i Aberystwyth a thu hwnt; nid y tu hwnt i Aberystwyth, hynny yw, ond lan i'r gogledd. [*Torri ar draws.*] Byddai hynny'n achosi tipyn o drafferth. [*Chwerthin.*]

Mae hwn yn wasanaeth hanfodol nid yn unig ar gyfer y lein, ond ar gyfer agor gwelliannau pellach i'r lein, yn benodol gorsafoedd trên newydd yn Bow Street a Charno, achos gallai'r ddwy orsaf newydd hynny

awdurdodau hynny sy'n cydymffurfio er mwyn, i ryw raddau, llwgrwobrwyo'r awdurdodau hynny nad ydynt yn gwrando arnoch o gwbl? Ai dyna'r gorau y gallwch ei wneud?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cwestiwn yr Aelod wedi creu argraff arnaf unwaith eto, ond mae gwybodaeth yr Aelod yn ddiffygiol unwaith eto. Pe edrychai'r Aelod ar linell y gyllideb, gwêl nad yw'r £10 miliwn yn rhan o'r grant cynnal refeniw; nodir y grant cynnal refeniw a £10 miliwn ychwanegol. Os mai dyma'r ymdrech waethaf gennyf, fel yr awgryma'r Aelod, tybed pa sylwadau fyddai gan yr Aelod ar y sail y bydd llywodraeth leol, yng Nghymru, dros gyfnod y setliad tair blynedd, yn cael cynnydd cyfartalog o 0.6%, lle y bydd llywodraeth leol yn Lloegr, o dan ei gweinyddiaeth hi, yn cael gostyngiad o 0.6% yn ei setliad. Credaf ei bod wedi gwneud cam.

#### Public Transport

**7. Simon Thomas:** *Will the Minister outline his priorities for public transport in Mid and West Wales. OAQ(4)0195(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am gwestiwn yr Aelod. Nodir fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol.

**Simon Thomas:** I thank the Minister for that response. The Minister will know that considerable disappointment has been expressed following his statement today and that of the First Minister yesterday that we will have to wait until 2015, to all intents and purposes, for the hourly service on the Cambrian line from Shrewsbury to Aberystwyth and beyond; not beyond Aberystwyth as such, but onwards to north Wales. [*Interruption.*] That would lead to quite a few problems. [*Laughter.*]

This is a vital service not just for the line, but for further improvements to the line. I am thinking in particular of new stations in Bow Street and Carno, because new stations at those locations could enrich the line

gyfoethogi'r lein cryn dipyn. A fydd y Gweinidog o leiaf yn rhoi pwysau ar y cyrff lleol a rhanbarthol a galw arnynt i sicrhau bod y gwaith paratoadol ar gyfer gorsafoedd newydd yn digwydd nawr?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his question. I am surprised that he is disappointed today, as I am giving him the same answer today as I gave him last month, when he was not disappointed. The timetable has not changed; we still expect to deliver the hourly service in 2014-15. Much of the work and improvements that we aspire to in Wales are dependent on finances that the Westminster Government provides to us, and we have other pressures in Welsh Government. However, this is still a priority for me and nothing has changed.

**Russell George:** I note the Minister's response to a recent written question regarding the public inquiry for the Newtown bypass. Minister, you stated that the public inquiry is scheduled to take place in 2014. I am pleased that the First Minister confirmed yesterday during questions that the construction of the Newtown bypass is scheduled to start in late 2014 or early 2015. However, I am concerned that the timescale for holding the public inquiry in 2014 seems rather tight for construction to start in the same year. Will the Minister explain what processes need to take place following the public inquiry? Will the Minister also consider bringing forward the public inquiry, to ensure that construction starts in late 2014?

**Carl Sargeant:** I do not expect that the Member has had much experience of public inquiries. Therefore, he raises the right questions with me today in terms of the detail that he requires. I will point the Member to the final date; the construction is currently scheduled to start in late 2014 or early 2015. That has not changed. Prior to that, there may be some variances as to when the public inquiry starts or does not start and the process for public engagement. However, the end date is still the same.

considerably. Will the Minister at least bring pressure to bear on the local and regional authorities and urge them to ensure that the preparatory work for the new stations takes place now?

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn. Rwy'n synnu ei fod yn siomedig heddiw, gan fy mod yn rhoi'r un ateb iddo heddiw ag y rhoddais iddo fis diwethaf, pan nad oedd yn siomedig. Nid yw'r amserlen wedi newid; rydym yn dal i ddisgwyl darparu'r gwasanaeth bob awr yn 2014-15. Mae llawer o'r gwaith a'r gwelliannau rydym yn anelu atynt yng Nghymru yn dibynnu ar gyllid y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn ei roi inni, ac mae gennym bwysau eraill o fewn Llywodraeth Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth imi ac nid oes unrhyw beth wedi newid.

**Russell George:** Nodaf ymateb y Gweinidog i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig diweddar ynghylch yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ar gyfer ffordd osgoi'r Drenewydd. Weinidog, dywedasoed fod yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus wedi'i drefnu i'w gynnal yn 2014. Rwy'n falch bod y Prif Weinidog wedi cadarnhau ddoe yn ystod cwestiynau bod disgwyl i'r gwaith o adeiladu ffordd osgoi'r Drenewydd ddechrau ddiwedd 2014 neu ddechrau 2015. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n pryderu bod yr amserlen ar gyfer cynnal yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn 2014 yn ymddangos braidd yn dynn er mwyn i'r gwaith adeiladu ddechrau yn ystod yr un flwyddyn. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro pa brosesau y bydd angen eu rhoi ar waith yn dilyn yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus? A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd ystyried cynnal yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn gynharach, er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwaith adeiladu yn dechrau ddiwedd 2014?

**Carl Sargeant:** Tybiaf nad oes gan yr Aelod lawer o brofiad o ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus. Felly, mae'n codi'r cwestiynau priodol gyda mi heddiw o ran y manylion sydd eu hangen arno. Cyfeiriaf yr Aelod at y dyddiad terfynol; ar hyn o bryd, disgwylir i'r gwaith adeiladu ddechrau ddiwedd 2014 neu ddechrau 2015. Nid yw hynny wedi newid. Cyn hynny, mae'n bosibl y bydd rhywfaint o amrywiad o ran dyddiad dechrau'r ymchwiliad cyhoeddus a'r broses ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, bydd y dyddiad



terfynol yn parhau yr un fath.

**Yr Arglwydd Elis-Thomas:** Rwyf am ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ymdrechion ef, ei swyddogion a Chyngor Gwynedd i ddiogelu'r sefyllfa ynglŷn â'r coridor rhwng Bangor, Porthmadog, Dolgellau ac Aberystwyth, ac am y gwasanaeth cymorthdaledig newydd, T2. A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn derbyn ei fod yn hen bryd i ni edrych ar integreiddio gwasanaethau bysiau gyda'r gwasanaeth trên y cyfeiriwyd ato? Er bod gennym wasanaeth safonol bellach gan Lloyds Coaches ac Express Motors yn yr ardal, ni fydd y mater hwn yn cael ei ddatrys hyd nes bod gennym amserlen gyffredin ar gyfer trenau a bysiau yn y canolbarth.

2.30 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his comments and for the regular letters that he sends me on this issue. I agree that we must have an integrated rail and road service across Wales. I have asked my department to look at that, and I will keep him updated.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** Could you inform the Assembly of whether a risk analysis was carried out before the Government purchased the new buses that travel the TrawsCambria T4 route between Newtown and Cardiff? Many of my constituents, while grateful for that service, would feel more comfortable travelling on it if they were able to wear seatbelts for the journey. The buses are classed as providing a local service—I do not regard a journey between Newtown to Cardiff as being particularly local—but did you carry out a risk analysis before you purchased buses that did not allow seatbelts to be used?

**Carl Sargeant:** I have had correspondence with you on this issue. My officials inform me that the bus service and the buses on that route are appropriate for that route.

### Cydweithio

**8. Mike Hedges:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gydweithio*

**Lord Elis-Thomas:** I wish to thank the Minister for his and his officials' efforts, and those of Cyngor Gwynedd, in safeguarding the situation as regards the corridor between Bangor, Porthmadog, Dolgellau and Aberystwyth, and for the new T2 subsidised service. Would the Minister accept that it is about time that we looked at integrating bus services with the train service that has been mentioned? Even though we now have a quality service provided by Lloyds Coaches and Express Motors in the area, this matter will not be resolved until we have a common timetable for trains and buses in mid Wales.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei sylwadau ac am y llythyrau rheolaidd y mae'n eu hanfon ataf ar y mater hwn. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid inni gael gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd a ffyrdd integredig ledled Cymru. Rwyf wedi gofyn i'm hadran ymchwilio i hynny, a byddaf yn ei hysbysu'n rheolaidd.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** A allech hysbysu'r Cynulliad pa un a gynhaliwyd dadansoddiad risg cyn i'r Llywodraeth brynu'r bysiau newydd sy'n teithio ar hyd llwybr TrawsCambria T4 rhwng y Drenewydd a Chaerdydd? Byddai llawer o'm hetholwyr, er eu bod yn ddiolchgar am y gwasanaeth hwnnw, yn teimlo'n fwy cyfforddus yn teithio arno pe gallent wisgo gwregysau diogelwch ar gyfer y daith. Dosberthir y bysiau fel rhai sy'n darparu gwasanaeth lleol—nid yw taith rhwng y Drenewydd a Chaerdydd yn lleol iawn, yn fy marn i—ond a wnaethoch gynnal dadansoddiad risg cyn ichi brynu bysiau na ellir defnyddio gwregysau diogelwch arnynt?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi gohebu â chi ar y mater hwn. Dywed fy swyddogion wrthyf fod y gwasanaeth bws a'r bysiau ar y llwybr hwnnw yn briodol ar gyfer y llwybr hwnnw.

### Collaboration

**8. Mike Hedges:** *Will the Minister provide an update on collaboration between local*

*rhwng awdurdodau lleol. OAQ(4)0197(LGC) authorities. OAQ(4)0197(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Collaboration between local authorities is critical if we are to survive the tough financial challenges ahead.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn hollbwysig er mwyn goresgyn yr heriau ariannol anodd sydd o'n blaenau.

**Mike Hedges:** First, I welcome the £10 million that you have put forward to aid collaboration. I always believe that it is better to have a carrot than a stick to try to get things done. Could you outline how you intend to drive this agenda forward and how it will fit in with the city-region model?

**Mike Hedges:** Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y £10 miliwn rydych wedi'i gyflwyno i hwyluso trefniadau cydweithio. Credaf yn gryf ei bod yn well defnyddio moronen na ffon i geisio annog pobl i weithredu. A allech amlinellu sut rydych yn bwriadu rhoi'r agenda hon ar waith a sut y bydd yn gydnaws â model dinas-ranbarthau?

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his question. The final detail is being worked through with the Organisational Design and Simpson Implementation board and with the Welsh Local Government Association in terms of how access to the additional £10 million will be available. I envisage this being based on the regional footprint of funding, where authorities can work with partners outside local authorities to access this in order to develop new collaborative projects beyond the Simpson agenda that is currently in train. I am grateful for the Member's support, as I am grateful for the many authorities across Wales that are also grateful for the £10 million collaboration fund.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn. Mae'r manylion terfynol yn cael eu trafod gyda bwrdd Dylunio Sefydliadol a Gweithredu Simpson a chyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru o ran sut y cynigir cyfleoedd i gael gafael ar y £10 miliwn ychwanegol. Rwy'n rhagweld y bydd hyn yn seiliedig ar ôl troed rhanbarthol ariannol, lle y gall awdurdodau weithio gyda phartneriaid nad ydynt yn awdurdodau lleol i gael gafael arno er mwyn datblygu prosiectau cydweithredol newydd y tu hwnt i agenda Simpson sy'n mynd rhagddi ar hyn o bryd. Rwy'n ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth yr Aelod, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar i'r awdurdodau niferus ledled Cymru sydd hefyd yn ddiolchgar am y gronfa cydweithio £10 miliwn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Gweinidog y prynhawn yma wedi bod yn amharod i dderbyn beirniadaeth oddi wrth lefarwyr pob un o'r gwrthbleidiau, ac nid wyf yn disgwyl i feincwyr cefn y Plaid Lafur ei gwestiynu'n rhy galed. Ond, ni all wrthod y feirniadaeth gan berchnogion cwmnïau bysiau bod y modd y mae wedi ymdrin ag ariannu'r gwasanaethau bysiau yng Nghymru wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle mae llai o wasanaethau ar gael i ddefnyddwyr ac mae'r gost wedi cynyddu yn hytrach na gostwng.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** This afternoon, the Minister has been unwilling to accept criticism from the spokespeople of all opposition parties, and I do not expect Labour backbenchers to question him too severely. However, he cannot repudiate the criticism levelled by bus company owners that the way in which he has dealt with funding bus services in Wales has led to a situation where there are fewer services available for passengers and where the cost has increased rather than decreased.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am surprised that the Member is being negative on the basis that we are now trying to fund routes as opposed to mileage. It is clear that Plaid Cymru is supporting a fuel subsidy as opposed to a route subsidy. I am disappointed that he has not given his support to this today.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwy'n synnu bod yr Aelod yn negyddol ar y sail ein bod yn awr yn ceisio ariannu llwybrau yn hytrach na milltiroedd. Mae'n amlwg bod Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi cymhorthdal tanwydd yn hytrach na chymhorthdal llwybr. Rwy'n siomedig nad yw wedi cefnogi hyn heddiw.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn anffodus i chi, nid fi sy'n eich beirniadu, ond perchnogion cwmnïau bysiau sydd wedi canfod eu hunain mewn sefyllfaedd eithriadol o anodd oherwydd eich methiant i reoli'r gyllideb arbennig hon.

O ran y dyfodol, mae'r Llywodraeth yn Lloegr yn ymgynghori ynghylch dyfodol tocynnau teithio rhatach a'r grantiau sydd ar gael i gyflenwyr gwasanaethau bysiau. Beth yw eich bwriad chi yng Nghymru? Yng nghyd-destun unrhyw ymgynghoriad neu drafodaethau ar hynny, sut y byddwch yn diogelu tocynnau teithio rhatach, er gwaethaf eich methiant i wneud hynny yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf?

**Carl Sargeant:** You are clearly misquoting any issue regarding failure to protect bus passes and concessionary fares. I have not made any cuts to concessionary fares. Free bus travel is still available in Wales, which is quite different from what is happening in the rest of the UK, particularly in England. The Member is now championing private bus operators in Wales. He is clearly unable to develop the arguments and the basis of support for route transport, as opposed to fuel subsidy. The Member may wish to go back to the drawing board, because I believe that we are on the right side of the argument.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Unfortunately for you, it is not me who is criticising you, but the owners of bus companies who have found themselves in extremely difficult situations because of your failure to manage this particular budget.

Going forward, the Government in England is consulting on the future of concessionary fares and the grants available to bus service operators. What do you intend to do in Wales? In the context of any consultation or debate on this, how will you safeguard concessionary fares, despite your failure to do so over the last 18 months?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rydych yn amlwg yn camddyfynnu unrhyw fater o ran methu ag amddiffyn tocynnau bws a thocynnau teithio rhatach. Nid wyf wedi gwneud unrhyw doriadau i docynnau teithio rhatach. Mae teithiau bws am ddim ar gael yng Nghymru o hyd, sy'n dra gwahanol i'r sefyllfa yng ngweddill y DU, yn enwedig yn Lloegr. Mae'r Aelod yn awr yn hyrwyddo gweithredwyr bysiau preifat yng Nghymru. Mae'n amlwg na all ddatblygu'r dadleuon a'r sail dros gefnogi trafndiaeth llwybr, yn hytrach na chymhorthdal tanwydd. Efallai yr hoffai'r Aelod ailedrych ar y sefyllfa, oherwydd, yn fy marn i, mae gennym ddadl gymhellol.

### Seilwaith Trafnidiaeth

**9. Antoinette Sandbach:** *Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog ar gyfer y seilwaith trafndiaeth yng Ngogledd Cymru. OAQ(4)0205(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Our programme for improving transport infrastructure in north Wales is set out in the prioritised national transport plan, which was published last December.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I am grateful that you appear to share the Secretary of State for Wales's ambition to see the case made for the electrification of the main line in north Wales, and I heard your earlier answer to the Member for Delyn. Following the recent meeting with the UK Government, can you

### Transport Infrastructure

**9. Antoinette Sandbach:** *What are the Minister's priorities for transport infrastructure in North Wales. OAQ(4)0205(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Nodir ein rhaglen ar gyfer gwella'r seilwaith trafndiaeth yng ngogledd Cymru yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol sy'n cynnwys blaenoriaethau, a gyhoeddwyd fis Rhagfyr diwethaf.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar eich bod, yn ôl pob tebyg, yn rhannu uchelgais Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru i gyflwyno'r achos dros drydaneiddio'r brif linell rheilffordd yng ngogledd Cymru, a chlywais eich ateb cynharach i'r Aelod dros Delyn. Yn dilyn y cyfarfod diweddar gyda

confirm what progress you are making in building support and gathering evidence, particularly from councils and business groups? Will you confirm at the start of this process how soon you expect the business case to be published, because time is an important factor in convincing Network Rail and the Department for Transport of the case for electrification?

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome the new Secretary of State for Wales's contribution to support the Welsh Government in developing the business case for the electrification of the north Wales line. As before, there must be cross-party agreement to develop this new network. I have already met the Secretary of State for Transport in London. I hope to hold further discussions with representatives of Taith and north Wales authorities, and I have met several Assembly Members and Members of Parliament regarding this issue to date.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol, Weinidog, fod nifer o ddamweiniau wedi bod ar yr A55 yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf. Mae hyn wedi creu pob math o drafferthion o safbwynt symudoledd trafniadaeth ar hyd y llwybr hwnnw. A fydech yn cytuno, tra bo ambell un yn dechrau gwneud synau ynglŷn â'r angen i ledu'r A55, y byddai trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd ar draws y gogledd yn fodd o gymryd y pwysau—neu beth o'r pwysau—oddi ar y ffordd honno? Byddem i gyd am groesawu hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** I share the Member's view.

**Aled Roberts:** Gofynnodd Dafydd Elis-Thomas gwestiwn ynglŷn ag integreiddio gwasanaethau TrawsCymru gyda gwasanaethau rheilffordd. A ydych wedi dylanwadu ar yr amserlen yn ddigonol? Ar hyn o bryd, os ydych yn teithio o Lanbedr Pont Steffan i Fangor—fel mae rhai myfyrwyr yn ei wneud—deallaf fod yn rhaid aros yn Aberystwyth am awr gyda'r gwasanaeth newydd, lle, cyn hynny, dim ond rhyw bum awr yr oedd y daith yn ei gymryd.

**Carl Sargeant:** There are issues around timetabling; the Member is right to say that

Llywodraeth y DU, a allwch gadarnhau pa gynnydd rydych yn ei wneud o ran meithrin cefnogaeth a chasglu tystiolaeth, yn enwedig gan gynghorau a grwpiau busnes? A gadarnhewch ar ddechrau'r broses hon pa mor fuan y disgwyliwch i'r achos busnes gael ei gyhoeddi, gan fod amser yn ffactor pwysig o ran darbwyllo Network Rail a'r Adran Drafnidiaeth bod achos o blaid trydaneiddio?

**Carl Sargeant:** Croesawaf gyfraniad Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd Cymru i gefnogi Llywodraeth Cymru i ddatblygu achos busnes dros drydaneiddio prif linell rheilffordd gogledd Cymru. Fel o'r blaen, rhaid sicrhau cytundeb trawsbleidiol er mwyn datblygu'r rhwydwaith newydd hwn. Rwyf eisoes wedi cyfarfod â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth yn Llundain. Rwy'n gobeithio cynnal trafodaethau pellach gyda chynrychiolwyr o Taith ac awdurdodau gogledd Cymru, ac rwyf wedi cyfarfod â nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac Aelodau Seneddol ynghylch y mater hwn hyd yn hyn.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** You will be aware, Minister, that there have been a number of accidents on the A55 over the last few months. This has created all manner of difficulties with regard to mobility along that route. Would you agree that, while some people are starting to make noises about the need to widen the A55, rail electrification across north Wales would be a way of taking the pressure—or some of the pressure—away from that road? We would all want to welcome that.

**Carl Sargeant:** Cytunaf â barn yr Aelod.

**Aled Roberts:** Dafydd Elis-Thomas asked a question about the integration of TrawsCymru services with rail services. Have you adequately influenced the timetable? At present, if you travel from Lampeter to Bangor—as some students do—I understand that you must wait for an hour in Aberystwyth for the new service, while the previous service meant a total journey time of some five hours.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae problemau o ran amserlennu; mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei le yn

we need to work with our partners to address that. One way in which we can address this is that, when we invest £100 million plus in bus services in Wales, we have some leverage to designate what routes are acceptable and what routes are not, and how we integrate them between train and bus routes. I hope that the Member supports me in the principle of directing companies to say when they should be at the station to meet the train, as opposed to giving them fuel subsidy, as other Members may wish to support today.

dweud bod angen inni weithio gyda'n partneriaid i ymdrin â hynny. Un ffordd y gallwn ymdrin â hyn yw sicrhau, pan fyddwn yn buddsoddi £100 miliwn a mwy mewn gwasanaethau bysiau yng Nghymru, bod gennym rywfaint o hyblygrwydd i ddynodi pa lwybrau sy'n dderbyniol a pha lwybrau nad ydynt yn dderbyniol, a sut y gallwn eu hintegreiddio rhwng llwybrau trenau a bysiau. Gobeithio bod yr Aelod yn fy nghefnogi o ran yr egwyddor o gyfarwyddo cwmnïau i nodi pryd y dylent fod yn yr orsaf i gwrdd â'r trêrn, yn hytrach na rhoi cymhorthdal tanwydd iddynt, fel y bydd Aelodau eraill o bosibl am ei gefnogi heddiw.

### Blaenoriaethau Portffolio

**10. Antoinette Sandbach:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau portffolio ar gyfer Gogledd Cymru dros y 12 mis nesaf. OAQ(4)0204(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for her question. My priorities for the whole of Wales are to deliver on our programme for government commitments to reduce poverty, to make our communities safer and to support the delivery of effective and efficient public services across Wales.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** The performance of your department is, naturally, a matter of significant public interest, as is your Government's decision to spend hundreds of thousands of pounds on a delivery unit to monitor this performance. Can you confirm what the Welsh Government's delivery unit has delivered for local government and transport so far during this Assembly, and what new work will you be taking forward during the next 12 months as a result of the delivery unit?

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member asks me about the delivery unit. She may wish to refer that question to the First Minister, in respect of the responsibility for that unit. However, the delivery unit features heavily in terms of ensuring that my department works across Government to ensure that interactions that I have in my department match and support other interventions that other Ministers work on too.

### Portfolio Priorities

**10. Antoinette Sandbach:** *Will the Minister make a statement on his portfolio priorities for North Wales in the next 12 months. OAQ(4)0204(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei chwestiwn. Fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer Cymru gyfan yw cyflawni ymrwymadau ein rhaglen lywodraethu, sef lleihau tlodi, gwneud ein cymunedau yn fwy diogel a helpu i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithiol ac effeithlon ledled Cymru.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Mae perfformiad eich adran, yn naturiol, o gryn ddiddordeb i'r cyhoedd, felly hefyd benderfyniad eich Llywodraeth i wario cannoedd ar filoedd o bunnoedd ar uned gyflawni i fonitro'r perfformiad hwn. A allwch gadarnhau beth y mae uned gyflawni Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i gyflawni ar gyfer llywodraeth leol a thrafnidiaeth hyd yma yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn, a pha waith newydd y byddwch yn ei wneud yn ystod y 12 mis nesaf o ganlyniad i'r uned gyflawni?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn holi am yr uned gyflawni. Efallai yr hoffai gyfeirio'r cwestiwn hwnnw i'r Prif Weinidog, gan mai ef sy'n gyfrifol am yr uned honno. Fodd bynnag, mae gan yr uned gyflawni ran bwysig i'w chwarae o ran sicrhau bod fy adran yn gweithio ar draws pob rhan o'r Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod y rhyngweithio yn fy adran i yn cyd-fynd ag ymyriadau eraill y mae Gweinidogion eraill yn gweithio arnynt hefyd, ac yn ategu'r ymyriadau hynny.

**Gwelliannau Angenrheidiol i'r A494**

**11. Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** *Pryd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwriadu cwblhau'r gwelliannau angenrheidiol i'r A494 o Frynsaithmarchog i Wyddelwern. OAQ(4)0200(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his question. We are considering the feasibility of improvement on this junction. The timing of any scheme will depend on the availability of funds and the priority against other schemes.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Diolch am yr ateb. Mae'n dweud cyfrolau, pan rydym yn sôn am drofa fel trofa Maes Gamedd, fel mae'n cael ei hadnabod yng Ngwyddelwern, bod dwy ddamwain wedi bod yno ers i mi gyflwyno'r cwestiwn yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn sgîl un o'r damweiniau, rhwng lori a bws, bu'r brif ffordd o Ruthun i Gorwen ar gau o 10 a.m. tan 4 p.m.. A ydych yn rhannu gofidiau trigolion lleol ynglŷn â pha mor wirioneddol beryglus yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, ac a wnewch chi flaenoriaethu'r rhan hon o'r A494 o fewn eich cyllideb, fel bod gweithredu yn digwydd yn gynharach yn hytrach nag yn hwyrach?

**Carl Sargeant:** Any intervention that we make to upgrade or amend the style of road is generally based on issues around safety—enhancing signage and road markings et cetera. Bearing in mind the issue that the Member raises today, this is something that I will ask my department to look at more sensitively in the future.

**Darren Millar:** As you know, this stretch of the trunk road network is in my constituency, and I have raised concerns about this junction in the past. You will also be aware of some of the subsidence that has taken place on the A494. I know that there have been discussions with a landowner in my constituency about trying to address the problems there and the options that you had developed in order to improve highway safety. I understand that another option is now on the table, which could resolve this issue, and I wonder whether you could give us an

**Necessary Improvements to the A494**

**11. Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** *When does the Welsh Government intend to complete the necessary improvements to the A494 between Brynsaithmarchog and Gwyddelwern. OAQ(4)0200(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn. Rydym yn ystyried dichonoldeb gwelliannau ar y gyffordd hon. Bydd amseriad unrhyw gynllun yn dibynnu ar yr arian sydd ar gael a'r flaenoriaeth yn erbyn cynlluniau eraill.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Thank you for that reply. It speaks volumes, when talking about a junction such as the Maes Gamedd junction, as it is known in Gwyddelwern, that there have been two accidents there since I tabled this question last week. Following one of those accidents, between a lorry and a bus, the main road between Rhuthun and Corwen was closed from 10 a.m. to 4 p.m.. Do you share the concerns of local people about the real danger posed by the current situation, and will you prioritise this part of the A494 within your budget, so that action is taken sooner rather than later?

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae unrhyw ymyriad rydym yn ei wneud i uwchraddio neu newid y math o ffordd yn gyffredinol yn seiliedig ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch—gwella arwyddion a marciau ffordd ac yn y blaen. O ystyried y mater a godir gan yr Aelod heddiw, mae hyn yn rhywbeth y gofynnaf i'm hadran ei ystyried mewn ffordd fwy sensitif yn y dyfodol.

**Darren Millar:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r darn hwn o'r rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yn fy etholaeth, ac rwyf wedi codi pryderon am y gyffordd hon yn y gorffennol. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol o achosion o ymsuddiant a fu ar yr A494. Gwn fod trafodaethau wedi'u cynnal gyda thirfeddiannwr yn fy etholaeth o ran ceisio ymdrin â'r problemau yno a'r opsiynau roeddech wedi'u datblygu er mwyn gwella diogelwch y briffordd. Deallaf fod opsiwn arall bellach wedi'i gyflwyno, a allai ddatrys y mater hwn. Tybed a allech roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am yr opsiwn

update on that option here today.

hwennw heddiw.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am not able to update the Member on the specific item to which he refers today, but I will write to him accordingly.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ni allaf roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelod am yr eitem benodol y mae'n cyfeirio ati heddiw, ond ysgrifennaf ato mewn ymateb i hynny.

### Cyllido Bysiau Cyhoeddus

### Financing of Public Buses

**12. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido bysiau cyhoeddus. OAQ(4)0202(LGC)*

**12. Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** *Will the Minister make a statement on the financing of public buses. OAQ(4)0202(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for his question. I am committed to providing the best level of support for local bus services in Wales. This year, I am providing nearly £100 million to support local bus and community transport services and our flagship concessionary travel scheme. This is a significant outcome, given the very difficult financial system that we find ourselves working within.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod am ei gwestiwn. Rwy'n ymrwymedig i ddarparu'r lefel o gymorth orau i wasanaethau bws lleol yng Nghymru. Eleni, rwy'n darparu bron i £100 miliwn i gefnogi gwasanaethau bws a gwasanaethau trafndiaeth cymunedol lleol a'n cynllun teithio rhatach blaenllaw. Mae hwn yn swm arwyddocaol, o ystyried y system ariannol anodd iawn rydym yn gweithio o'i mewn.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Let us try this one again, Minister. There is a difference between concessionary fares and free passes—I hope you understand that; if you do not, we are in deep waters. In terms of concessionary fares, will you now accept that bus operators are stating quite clearly that the way in which you have changed the system this year has led to a situation where there are fewer services available and where concessionary fares have been increased, especially with regard to children, on services throughout Wales? Will you now accept responsibility for that? The bus operators themselves state quite clearly that it is your responsibility.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gadewch inni roi cynnig arall arni, Weinidog. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng tocynnau teithio rhatach a thocynnau teithio am ddim—gobeithio eich bod yn deall hynny; os nad ydych, rydym mewn dyfroedd dyfnion. O ran tocynnau rhatach, a dderbyniwch yn awr bod gweithredwyr bysiau yn datgan yn gwbl glir bod y ffordd y newidiwyd y system gennych eleni wedi arwain at sefyllfa lle mae llai o wasanaethau ar gael a lle mae pris tocynnau rhatach wedi codi, yn enwedig o ran plant, ar wasanaethau ledled Cymru? A dderbyniwch gyfrifoldeb am hynny yn awr? Mae'r gweithredwyr bysiau eu hunain yn datgan yn gwbl glir mai chi sy'n gyfrifol am y sefyllfa.

**Carl Sargeant:** The Member raises the argument for private bus operators in Wales, to which we contribute much initial funding. I remind the Member that we made no changes to the bus service operators grant rate, to concessionary fares or to the scheme. The bus operators then increased their fares and reduced services. Is that what the Member is here to stand up for today, or is he here to stand up for better routes for his constituents? He may want to reconsider his question.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r Aelod yn codi'r ddadl dros weithredwyr bysiau preifat yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn cyfrannu swm sylweddol o arian cychwynnol atynt. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelod na wnaed unrhyw newidiadau gennym i gyfradd grant gweithredwyr bysiau, i docynnau rhatach nac i'r cynllun. Yna aeth y gweithredwyr bysiau ati i godi prisiau eu tocynnau ac i leihau gwasanaethau. Ai dyna y mae'r Aelod yn awyddus i'w gefnogi yma heddiw, neu a yw yma i gefnogi llwybrau gwell i'w etholwyr? Efallai yr hoffai ailystyried ei gwestiwn.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** People living in rural areas not only face a high cost of living, which is some 20% higher than in urban areas, but a considerable number also experience transport poverty, due to dependence on car transport and a lack of access to a regular and reliable bus service. When addressing poor public transport access, which was a key issue in your programme for government, we are finding that, in regions outside the south-west Wales area, which is covered by Bwcabus, services continue to deteriorate. What work are you taking forward, therefore, to extend support for on-demand bus services to other rural areas, particularly those in north Wales, which have had their funding cut by you?

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Yn ogystal â chostau byw uchel, sydd ryw 20% yn uwch nag ardaloedd trefol, mae nifer sylweddol o bobl sy'n byw mewn ardaloedd gwledig hefyd yn wynebu tloedi trafniadaeth, gan eu bod yn dibynnu ar geir a bod diffyg mynediad i wasanaeth bws rheolaidd a dibynadwy. Wrth ymdrin â mynediad gwael i drafniadaeth gyhoeddus, a oedd yn fater allweddol yn eich rhaglen lywodraethu, rydym yn gweld, mewn rhanbarthau y tu allan i ardal y de-orllewin, lle mae gwasanaeth Bwcabus ar waith, bod gwasanaethau yn parhau i ddirywio. Pa waith sy'n mynd rhagddo gennyh, felly, i ehangu'r cymorth ar gyfer gwasanaethau bws ar-alw i ardaloedd gwledig eraill, yn enwedig y rheini yn y gogledd, yr ydych wedi lleihau'r arian a roddir iddynt?

2.45 p.m.

**Carl Sargeant:** You had a good start to the question, but a bad ending. [*Laughter.*] It was all going really well. The Bwcabws service is exceptionally well thought of; it is an excellent service and I am grateful that the Member is supportive of it. I would like to extend it to other areas, depending upon funding. The Member is right to say that the funding for the transport department is reducing; that is as a consequence of £2.1 billion less from the UK Government that the Member is supportive of.

**Carl Sargeant:** Roedd dechrau da i'ch cwestiwn, ond diweddglo gwael. [*Chwerthin.*] Roedd popeth yn mynd yn dda iawn. Mae parch mawr tuag at wasanaeth Bwcabws; mae'n wasanaeth ardderchog ac rwy'n ddiolchgar bod yr Aelod yn ei gefnogi. Hoffwn ehangu'r gwasanaeth i ardaloedd eraill, gan ddibynnu ar y sefyllfa ariannol. Mae'r Aelod yn llygad ei lle wrth ddweud bod yr arian a gaiff yr adran drafniadaeth yn lleihau: mae hynny'n deillio o'r ffaith ein bod yn cael £2.1 biliwn yn llai gan Lywodraeth y DU, y mae'r Aelod yn ei chefnogi.

### Trefniadau Llywodraethu

### Governance Arrangements

**13. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am drefniadau llywodraethu mewn awdurdodau lleol. OAQ(4)0194(LGC)*

**13. Ieuan Wyn Jones:** *Will the Minister make a statement on governance arrangement in local authorities. OAQ(4)0194(LGC)*

**Carl Sargeant:** I thank the Member for Ynys Môn for his question. Governance arrangements in local authorities have been strengthened by the introduction of the Local Government (Wales) Measure 2011. I have also allocated funding to increase the capacity of members and officers to carry out more effective scrutiny and further ensure the accountability of the executive.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch i'r Aelod dros Ynys Môn am ei gwestiwn. Atgyfnerthwyd trefniadau llywodraethu mewn awdurdodau lleol drwy gyflwyno Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2011. Rwyf hefyd wedi dyrannu cyllid i wella gallu aelodau a swyddogion i gyflawni gwaith craffu mwy effeithiol ac i sicrhau ymhellach atebolrwydd y weithrediaeth.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am ei ateb. Mae'n debyg y byddai'n rhagdybio y byddai gennyf gwestiwn ynglŷn â'r trefniant llywodraethu

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I thank the Minister for that response. I am sure that he will have anticipated that I will have a question on governance arrangements in Anglesey



yng Nghyngor Sir Ynys Môn yn sgîl y penderfyniad i leihau nifer y comisiynwyr ac i sefydlu bwrdd adfer ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth addysg. Mae tipyn o aneglurder, o'i roi'n garedig, ynglŷn â phwy sy'n gyfrifol am beth ar yr ynys yn awr. A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn fodlon ysgrifennu ataf gan osod allan yn union beth yw cyfrifoldebau'r comisiynwyr newydd ac ar ba sail y gallent ymyrryd gyda phenderfyniad y pwyllgor gwaith? Yn ail, beth yn union yw cyfrifoldeb y bwrdd adfer ar addysg a phwy sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb pennaf am osod cyfeiriad strategol addysg ar gyfer y sir?

**Carl Sargeant:** I am grateful for the Member's question, and I will be more than happy to write to him with the details that he has requested. I refer him also to the statements that I made earlier with regard to the return of powers to the council, but I also extend an invitation to the Member for a meeting, should he wish it, with my department to explain further on any questions that he may have.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Collaboration between local authorities is very much a hallmark of your tenure as Minister for local government. However, concerns remain as to whether you are driving this agenda forward or whether you have any real involvement in it. If that is the case, will you please provide us with an update on the north Wales CCTV project, to include what has happened and where exactly the £805,000 of Welsh taxpayers' money that has been allocated to the scheme has gone? Will you give us a progress update, please?

**Carl Sargeant:** I will write to the Member regarding that specific scheme. On the basis that we have many hundreds of collaborative schemes, the Member will understand that I do not have the detail on every one of them now. However, I will write to the Member accordingly. Collaboration deals and collaboration are driven by my department, but owned by the people who wish to collaborate. I am glad that many authorities across north Wales and across the whole of Wales wish to collaborate, but there are some

County Council in light of the decision to reduce the number of commissioners and to put in a recovery board in terms of the education service. There is a lack of clarity, to put it kindly, in terms of who is now responsible for what on the island. Would the Minister be willing to write to me setting out exactly what the responsibilities of the new commissioners are and on what basis they would be able to intervene with decisions taken by the executive? Secondly, what exactly are the responsibilities of the education recovery board and who now has the main responsibility for setting the strategic direction for education in the county?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am gwestiwn yr Aelod, a byddwn yn fwy na pharod i ysgrifennu ato gyda'r manylion y gofynnodd amdanynt. Hoffwn ei gyfeirio hefyd at y datganiadau a wneuthum yn gynharach ynglŷn â dychwelyd pwerau i'r cyngor, ond hoffwn hefyd wahodd yr Aelod am gyfarfod, os hoffai hynny, gyda'm hadran i roi esboniad pellach o ran unrhyw gwestiynau a allai fod ganddo.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Mae cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn sicr yn nodwedd amlwg o'ch cyfnod fel Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol. Fodd bynnag, erys pryderon o ran pa un a ydych yn hyrwyddo'r agenda hon neu pa un a oes gennych unrhyw gyfranogiad gwirioneddol ynddi. Os felly, a allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am brosiect CCTV gogledd Cymru, gan gynnwys yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd a ble yn union y mae'r £805,000 o arian trethdalwyr Cymru a ddyrannwyd i'r cynllun wedi mynd? A wnewch roi adroddiad ar gynnydd inni, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Carl Sargeant:** Ysgrifennaf at yr Aelod am y cynllun penodol hwnnw. O gofio bod gennym gannoedd lawer o gynlluniau cydweithredol, bydd yr Aelod yn deall nad yw manylion pob un ohonynt gennyf wrth law. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennaf at yr Aelod mewn ymateb i hynny. Caiff cytundebau cydweithredol a threfniadau cydweithio eu hysgogi gan fy adran, ond y bobl sy'n awyddus i gydweithio sy'n berchen arnynt. Rwy'n falch bod llawer o awdurdodau ledled gogledd Cymru a ledled Cymru gyfan yn

that could do better.

awyddus i gydweithio, ond mae rhai a allai wneud yn well.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 14, OAQ(4)0206(LGC), has been withdrawn.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 14, OAQ(4)0206(LGC), yn ôl.

**Datganiad: Cyflwyno Bil Arfaethedig Aelod—Bil Safleoedd Rheoleiddiedig  
Cartrefi Symudol (Cymru)  
Statement: Introduction of a Member Proposed Bill—the Regulated Mobile  
Home Sites (Wales) (Bill)**

**Peter Black:** On Thursday 25 October, I laid the Regulated Mobile Home Sites (Wales) Bill, together with an explanatory memorandum, before the National Assembly for Wales. I have also issued a written statement, and I am pleased to introduce the Bill for Assembly Members' consideration today. I want to acknowledge the support and hard work put into producing this Bill by Assembly Commission staff and my researchers, who have worked with me to produce it. I should also acknowledge the support of the Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage. Although this is a Member's Bill, he has allowed his officials to work with me on it, and their constructive comments and searching questions have been invaluable in producing the Bill.

A formal consultation was undertaken prior to the drafting of this Bill, and I also conducted a survey of 2,008 park home residents, which elicited 906 responses. The responses indicated that over 95% of these residents are older than 55 years of age, and more than half are above the age of 70. Over 86% of respondents said that they were retired, suggesting that many are on a fixed income. It is clear from all the research undertaken that a number of park home residents will be considered to be vulnerable because of age or ill health. That is why reports of harassment, intimidation, exploitation, and sharp practice by a small minority of site operators are so disturbing. Many residents have reported that they do not feel that they have the protection of the law and the support of local councils in countering such practices. It is the reason that I and others believe that this Bill is necessary.

**Peter Black:** Ddydd Iau 25 Hydref, gosodais Fil Safleoedd Rheoleiddiedig Cartrefi Symudol (Cymru), ynghyd â memorandwm esboniadol, gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Rwyf hefyd wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig, ac rwy'n falch o gyflwyno'r Bil i'w ystyried gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad heddiw. Hoffwn gydnabod cymorth a gwaith caled staff Comisiwn y Cynulliad a'm hymchwilyr, sydd wedi gweithio gyda mi i gynhyrchu'r Bil hwn. Dylwn hefyd gydnabod cymorth y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth. Er mai Bil Aelod yw hwn, mae wedi caniatáu i'w swyddogion weithio gyda mi arno, ac mae eu sylwadau adeiladol a chwestiynau treiddgar wedi bod yn amhriiadwy wrth gynhyrchu'r Bil.

Cynhaliwyd ymgynghoriad ffurfiol cyn drafftio'r Bil hwn, a chynhaliiais arolwg hefyd o 2,008 o drigolion cartrefi mewn parciau, a ysgogodd 906 o ymatebion. Dynododd yr ymatebion fod dros 95% o'r trigolion hyn dros 55 mlwydd oed, a bod mwy na'u hanner dros 70 oed. Dywedodd mwy na 86% o'r ymatebwyr eu bod wedi ymddeol, gan awgrymu bod llawer ar incwm sefydlog. Mae'n amlwg o'r holl ymchwil a wnaed yr ystyrir bod nifer o drigolion cartrefi mewn parciau yn agored i niwed oherwydd oedran neu afiechyd. Dyna pam mae adroddiadau o aflonyddu, brawychu, camfanteisio, ac ymarfer diegwyddor gan leiafrif bach o weithredwyr safle yn peri cymaint o bryder. Mae llawer o drigolion wedi dweud nad ydynt yn teimlo eu bod yn cael diogelwch gan y gyfraith a chefnogaeth cynghorau lleol pan ddônt ar draws arferion o'r fath. Dyma'r rheswm pam fy mod i ac eraill o'r farn bod y Bil hwn yn angenrheidiol.

The Bill will create a licensing regime that is a modern, fit-for-purpose framework that can be consistently implemented across Wales. Local authorities will remain the licensing authorities, but there will be a new statutory duty for them to consider exercising their powers of collaboration with other local authorities when licensing regulated sites. Such arrangements could allow expertise to be shared and costs to be reduced. It may also simplify record-keeping requirements, such as details of licensed sites and copies of site rules.

Authorised agents or officers of licensing authorities will have powers of entry should they need to enter a regulated site for matters connected with licensing. Local authorities will be permitted to charge a fee for processing and issuing a site licence, which will last for up to five years, but be renewable thereafter.

Currently, licensing authorities have no discretion to refuse an application. The Bill will permit a local authority to refuse to grant a licence where it is not satisfied as to certain matters outlined in the Bill. The licensing authority will also ensure that a site meets the standards set down by regulation for the stationing of the agreed number of mobile homes, while the site licence will include a number of mandatory conditions.

In order to be granted a licence the owner and manager, or other persons involved in the management of the site, will need to pass a fit and proper person test. There will be a duty on local authorities to request sufficient information from applicants for a licence to determine whether the licence holder and any person involved in the management of the site are fit and proper persons. This test will consider relevant criminal offences, contraventions of any provision of relevant legislation, as well as any breaches of any code of practice or regulations made under provisions in this Bill that relate to the management of sites.

Bydd y Bil yn creu cyfundrefn drwyddedu sy'n fframwaith modern, yn addas at y diben y gellir ei roi ar waith yn gyson ledled Cymru. Awdurdodau lleol fydd yr awdurdodau trwyddedu o hyd, ond bydd dyletswydd statudol newydd iddynt ystyried arfer eu pwerau cydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol eraill wrth drwyddedu safleoedd a reoleiddir. Gallai trefniadau o'r fath olygu y gellir rhannu arbenigedd a lleihau costau. Efallai y byddant hefyd yn symleiddio'r gofynion cadw cofnodion, megis manylion safleoedd trwyddedig a chopiau o reolau'r safle.

Bydd gan asiantau awdurdodedig neu swyddogion awdurdodau trwyddedu bwerau mynediad os bydd angen iddynt fynd i mewn i safle a reoleiddir ar gyfer materion sy'n gysylltiedig â thrwyddedu. Bydd gan awdurdodau lleol hawl i godi ffi am brosesu a chyhoeddi trwydded safle, a fydd yn para am hyd at bum mlynedd, ond gellir ei adnewyddu ar ôl hynny.

Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gan awdurdodau trwyddedu unrhyw ddisgresiwn i wrthod cais. Bydd y Bil yn caniatáu i awdurdod lleol wrthod rhoi trwydded os nad yw'n fodlon ynghylch materion penodol a amlinellir yn y Bil. Bydd yr awdurdod trwyddedu hefyd yn sicrhau bod safle yn bodloni'r safonau a bennwyd gan reoliad ar gyfer lleoli'r nifer o gartrefi symudol y cytunwyd arni, er y bydd y drwydded safle yn cynnwys nifer o amodau gorfodol.

Er mwyn cael trwydded, bydd angen i'r perchennog a'r rheolwr, neu unigolion eraill sy'n ymwneud â'r gwaith o reoli'r safle, basio prawf unigolyn addas a phriodol. Bydd dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i ofyn am wybodaeth ddigonol gan ymgeiswyr am drwydded i benderfynu a yw deiliad y drwydded ac unrhyw unigolyn sy'n ymwneud â'r gwaith o reoli'r safle yn unigolyn addas a phriodol. Bydd y prawf hwn yn ystyried troseddau perthnasol, achosion o dorri unrhyw ddarpariaeth o ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol, yn ogystal ag unrhyw achosion o dorri unrhyw god ymarfer neu reoliadau a wneir o dan ddarpariaethau yn y Bil hwn sy'n ymwneud â rheoli safleoedd.

As the site rules will form part of the licence, in future they may only be changed following consultation with occupiers and, if one exists, any qualifying residents association. The licensing authority will need to be satisfied that the majority of occupiers agree to the variation. The Bill outlines a number of circumstances where the licensing authority may consider revoking a site licence either on its own initiative or, in certain cases, at the request of a qualifying residents association. As an alternative to revocation, the licensing authority may instead appoint an interim manager.

Site owners will have a right of appeal in relation to the decisions of licensing authorities to the residential property tribunal. In addition, the licensing authority or the licence holder may refer certain matters to the tribunal to decide any disputes about the extent of any works, the time limits specified in the notice, whether the work has been completed before the authority executed the works, and the reasonable costs incurred.

The Bill will introduce far more realistic penalties for the breach of licensing conditions and other offences. It will also introduce a repayment order provision whereby site operators who sell and collect pitch fees, or collect commission on sales for unlicensed sites, may be ordered to repay these moneys, together with any reasonable costs incurred. Local authorities will also be able to issue a fixed penalty as an alternative to prosecution for certain offences. Provisions for the recognition of a qualifying residents association remain as present; however, the Bill amends the 1983 Act to require a membership list, which should be up to date, to be presented to the licensing authority and not made public. The association's rules and constitution will also be held by the local authority, but these will be open to public inspection.

The Bill makes provision for rights of succession, so that any person who is a

Oherwydd y bydd rheolau'r safle yn ffurfio rhan o'r drwydded, yn y dyfodol dim ond ar ôl ymgynghori â deiliaid ac unrhyw gymdeithas trigolion cymwys, os oes un yn bodoli, y gellir eu newid. Bydd angen i'r awdurdod trwyddedu fod yn fodlon bod mwyafrif y deiliaid yn cytuno i'r amrywiad. Mae'r Bil yn amlinellu nifer o amgylchiadau lle gall yr awdurdod trwyddedu ystyried diddymu trwydded safle naill ai o'i ben a'i bastwn ei hun neu, mewn rhai achosion, ar gais cymdeithas preswylwyr cymwys. Fel dewis arall i ddiddymiad, gall yr awdurdod trwyddedu yn hytrach benodi rheolwr dros dro.

Bydd gan berchenogion safleoedd hawl i apelio mewn perthynas â phenderfyniadau awdurdodau trwyddedu i'r tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl. Yn ogystal, gall yr awdurdod trwyddedu neu ddeiliad y drwydded gyfeirio rhai materion at y tribiwnlys i benderfynu ar unrhyw anghydfod ynghylch maint unrhyw waith, y terfynau amser a bennir yn yr hysbysiad, p'un a yw'r gwaith wedi'i gwblhau cyn i'r awdurdod gyflawni'r gwaith, a'r costau rhesymol yr eir iddynt.

Bydd y Bil yn cyflwyno cosbau llawer mwy realistig am dorri amodau trwyddedu a throeddau eraill. Bydd hefyd yn cyflwyno darpariaeth gorchmynion ad-dalu lle gellir gorchymyn gweithredwyr safleoedd sy'n gwerthu ac yn casglu ffioedd lleiniau, neu'n casglu comisiwn ar werthiannau ar gyfer safleoedd heb drwydded, i ad-dalu'r arian hwn, ynghyd ag unrhyw gostau rhesymol yr eir iddynt. Bydd awdurdodau lleol hefyd yn gallu cyhoeddi cosb benodedig fel dewis amgen i erlyn am droseddau penodol. Mae'r darpariaethau ar gyfer cydnabod cymdeithas drigolion gymwys yn aros fel y maent; fodd bynnag, mae'r Bil yn diwygio Deddf 1983 i gynnwys yr angen i restr aelodaeth, a ddylai gael ei diweddarau'n rheolaidd, gael ei chyflwyno i'r awdurdod trwyddedu ac na ddylai gael ei chyhoeddi. Bydd rheolau a chyfansoddiad y gymdeithas yn cael eu cynnal gan yr awdurdod lleol hefyd, ond bydd y rhain yn agored i'r cyhoedd eu harchwilio.

Mae'r Bil yn darparu ar gyfer hawliau olyniaeth, fel bod gan unrhyw unigolyn sy'n

widow, widower, surviving civil partner or other family member, if there is no widow et cetera, and living in the mobile home as their only or main residence, will be entitled to take over the written agreement.

Under the terms of the Bill, pitch fees will only be able to be increased in line with the consumer price index, which is the measure that pensions are currently linked to, rather than the higher retail prices index. There are provisions as to what must be taken into account when calculating any increase or decrease in the pitch fee, while the Bill also specifies that the site operator must not pass on any costs that are incurred by them in order to implement changes made by it.

The Bill seeks to clarify the law as to when a mobile home owner can make internal alterations to their home, and under what circumstances a site operator can relocate a mobile home to a different pitch. Unless there is a need for an urgent relocation, this will require the agreement of both parties or the consent of the residential property tribunal. I hope that, following detailed scrutiny and debate, this Bill will command the support of the Assembly. I look forward to working with Members over the next few months to make that a reality.

**The Minister for Housing, Regeneration and Heritage (Huw Lewis):** The Welsh Government welcomes Peter's statement today and the Bill that has been formally laid before the Assembly. The effort that Peter has put into the task of producing this Bill is fully appreciated. We would like a few points to be considered.

The explanatory memorandum that accompanies the Bill lists 16 regulation, Order and guidance powers, including commencement, that the Welsh Government will need to make in order to fully describe and implement the new site licensing scheme—a hefty total. The question is whether scrutiny of the Bill will require more than merely empowering the Welsh Government to make these items of secondary legislation, and we would ask whether Peter has fully considered that. It is

wraig weddw, yn ŵr gweddw, yn bartner sifil sydd wedi goroesi neu'n aelod arall o'r teulu, os nad oes gwraig weddw ac ati, ac yn byw yn y cartref symudol fel ei unig neu brif breswylfa, hawl i gymryd y cytundeb ysgrifenedig drosodd.

O dan delerau'r Bil, dim ond yn unol â'r mynegai prisiau defnyddwyr, sef y mesur y mae pensiynau wedi'u cysylltu ag ef ar hyn o bryd, yn hytrach na'r mynegai prisiau manwerthu uwch, y gellir codi ffioedd lleiniau. Mae darpariaethau ynghylch yr hyn y mae'n rhaid ei ystyried wrth gyfrifo unrhyw gynnydd neu ostyngiad yn y ffi llain, ac mae'r Bil hefyd yn nodi na ddylai gweithredwr y safle drosglwyddo unrhyw gostau yr eir iddynt ganddo er mwyn gweithredu newidiadau a wneir ganddo.

Mae'r Bil yn ceisio egluro'r gyfraith o ran pryd y gall perchennog cartref symudol wneud newidiadau mewnol i'w cartref, ac o dan ba amgylchiadau y gall gweithredwr safle adleoli cartref symudol i lain wahanol. Oni bai bod angen adleoli ar frys, bydd hyn yn gofyn am gytundeb y ddwy ochr neu ganiatâd y tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl. Gobeithiaf, yn dilyn craffu manwl a dadl, y bydd y Bil hwn ennyn cefnogaeth y Cynulliad. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gydag Aelodau dros y misoedd nesaf i wireddu hynny.

**Y Gweinidog Tai, Adfywio a Threftadaeth (Huw Lewis):** Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn croesawu datganiad Peter heddiw a'r Bil sydd wedi cael ei osod yn ffurfiol gerbron y Cynulliad. Mae'r ymdrech y mae Peter wedi ei roi i'r dasg o gynhyrchu'r Bil hwn yn cael ei werthfawrogi'n llawn. Hoffem i rai pwyntiau gael eu hystyried.

Mae'r memorandwm esboniadol sy'n cydfynd â'r Bil yn rhestru 16 o reoliadau, Gorchmynion a phwerau arwain, gan gynnwys Gorchmynion cychwyn, y bydd angen i Lywodraeth Cymru eu gwneud er mwyn disgrifio'r cynllun trwyddedu safle newydd yn llawn a'i roi ar waith—cyfanswm sylweddol. Y cwestiwn yw a fydd craffu ar y Bil yn golygu mwy na dim ond grymuso Llywodraeth Cymru i wneud y rhain yn eitemau o is-ddeddfwriaeth, a byddem yn gofyn a yw Peter wedi ystyried hynny'n

quite clear that there is still some work to be done around finalising the content of the Bill, and this is particularly the case where the transitional arrangements for movement from the existing site licensing regime to the new arrangements are concerned. It is not really apparent whether Mr Black intends the new licensing regime to involve revoking the existing site licensing system, or whether it should just apply to new applications for site licences. Clarification on that point would be very helpful.

It might also be useful for colleagues to have more of an idea about the basis of how the figures in the explanatory memorandum associated with implementing the new site licensing regime have been arrived at. The Welsh Government would also value comments on the potential effect that the new site licensing arrangements are likely to have on mixed sites, where the existing licence covers holiday accommodation and a specified number of units that are licensed for permanent accommodation. I will again take this opportunity to reiterate the Welsh Government's supportive stance regarding Peter Black's Bill, and we look forward to working co-operatively to produce good law on this issue.

**Peter Black:** I thank the Minister for his remarks and again for stating his support for the Bill and the principles behind it. I would like to deal briefly with some of the points that he raised.

The Minister is quite correct that there are 14 regulation- and Order-making powers within the Bill, and there is also provision for two sets of guidance. Clearly, there is a lot of detail involved in this licensing regime, not all of which can be put on the face of the Bill. I would like to point out that not all of the regulation powers need to be taken up by the Minister; some of them are discretionary, for example, the one whereby the Minister can vary the amount of the fixed fee. He can leave it at £100, which is on the face of the Bill, or he can change it at some point later on. Obviously, I have had discussions with the Minister and his civil servants about this, and I have indicated that I am happy to work with them in bringing forward amendments at

llawn. Mae'n gwbl glir bod yna rywfaint o waith i'w wneud o hyd mewn perthynas â chwblhau cynnwys y Bil, ac mae hyn yn arbennig o wir lle mae'r trefniadau trosiannol ar gyfer symud o'r drefn trwyddedu safle bresennol i'r trefniadau newydd yn y cwestiwn. Nid yw'n glir iawn a yw Mr Black yn bwriadu i'r gyfundrefn drwyddedu newydd gynnwys diddymu'r system trwyddedu safle bresennol, neu a ddylai ond bod yn berthnasol i geisiadau newydd am drwyddedau safle. Byddai eglurhad ar y pwynt hwnnw'n ddefnyddiol iawn.

Gallai hefyd fod yn ddefnyddiol i gyd-Aelodau gael mwy o syniad ynghylch sail sut y daethpwyd i'r ffigurau yn y memorandwm esboniadol sy'n gysylltiedig â gweithredu'r gyfundrefn trwyddedu safle newydd. Byddai Llywodraeth Cymru hefyd yn gwerthfawrogi cael sylwadau ar yr effaith bosibl y mae'r trefniadau trwyddedu safle newydd yn debygol o'i chael ar safleoedd cymysg, lle mae'r drwydded bresennol yn cwmpasu llety gwyliau a nifer benodol o unedau sydd wedi'u trwyddedu ar gyfer llety parhaol. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn unwaith eto i ategu safbwynt cefnogol Llywodraeth Cymru o ran Bil Peter Black, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gydweithio i greu cyfraith dda ar y mater hwn.

**Peter Black:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei sylwadau ac eto am ddatgan ei gefnogaeth i'r Bil a'r egwyddorion y tu ôl iddo. Hoffwn ymdrin yn fyr â rhai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd ganddo.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn hollol iawn bod 14 o bwerau llunio rheoliadau a Gorchmynion yn y Bil, a bod yna hefyd ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dwy set o ganllawiau. Yn amlwg, mae llawer o fanylion yn gysylltiedig â'r gyfundrefn drwyddedu hon, ac na ellir rhoi pob un ohonynt ar wyneb y Bil. Hoffwn nodi nad oes raid i'r Gweinidog gymryd yr holl bwerau rheoleiddio; mae rhai ohonynt yn ddewisol, er enghraifft, yr un lle y gall y Gweinidog amrywio swm y ffi sefydlog. Gall adael y ffi yn £100, sydd ar wyneb y Bil, neu gall ei newid ar ryw bwynt yn nes ymlaen. Yn amlwg, rwyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog a'i weision sifil am hyn, ac rwyf wedi nodi fy mod yn hapus i weithio gyda nhw i gyflwyno gwelliannau yng Nghyfnod 2

Stage 2 of the Bill if we can reduce the number of regulations. I am happy to give that undertaking again. However, the resources available to me as an individual Member are not substantial, and I would be relying quite a lot on the Minister's civil servants and officials to come forward with those amendments and to help me draft them, if that is what we want. I have a meeting with the Minister's officials next week to discuss that issue further.

In terms of licensing, residential sites still have to be licensed under the Caravan Sites and Control of Development Act 1960, but they will also have to be licensed under the new regime. The 1960 Act is primarily a rubber-stamping exercise concerned with whether the appropriate planning permission is in place. As I indicated in my statement, local authorities cannot turn down an application for a licence under that particular Act. The new regime, as proposed in the Bill, would primarily be concerned with the suitability of the applicant. As such, I would envisage that every site operator around Wales would need to apply, once this Bill comes into force. There would need to be a period of grace to allow them to do that before the Bill can be implemented properly. I would envisage that all 92 sites would have a licensed owner operating them.

3.00 p.m.

With regard to the figures—sorry, I will go on to the mixed sites. There is provision in the Bill for mixed sites. Right at the very beginning of the Bill, there is a provision for a part of a site to be licensed where part of the site is for holiday homes and part is residential; only the residential part will need to be included. I take the Minister's point with regard to costings. We have done a lot of work to try to get the costings as accurate as possible. A lot of it is going to be speculative, because it depends on decisions that he will have to take, particularly in relation to the level of fees that local authorities will charge for the licences. However, we have a lot of detail in the Bill, which I am happy to be scrutinised on at the committee stage, and I would contend that we

y Bil os gallwn leihau nifer y rheoliadau. Rwy'n barod i roi'r addewid hwnnw eto. Fodd bynnag, nid oes llawer o adnoddau ar gael i mi fel Aelod unigol, a byddwn yn dibynnu gryn dipyn ar weision sifil a swyddogion y Gweinidog i gyflwyno'r diwygiadau hynny a'm helpu i'w ddrafftio, os mai dyna beth yr ydym ei eisiau. Mae gen i gyfarfod â swyddogion y Gweinidog yr wythnos nesaf i drafod y mater hwnnw ymhellach.

O ran trwyddedu, mae'n rhaid i safleoedd preswyl gael eu trwyddedu o hyd o dan Ddeddf Safleoedd Carafanau a Rheoli Datblygu 1960, ond bydd yn rhaid iddynt hefyd gael eu trwyddedu o dan y gyfundrefn newydd. Ymarfer rhoi sêl bendith yw Deddf 1960 yn bennaf, sy'n ymwneud â ph'un a yw'r caniatâd cynllunio priodol yn ei le. Fel y nodais yn fy natganiad, ni all awdurdodau lleol wrthod cais am drwydded o dan y Ddeddf benodol honno. Byddai'r drefn newydd, fel y cynigir yn y Bil, yn ymwneud yn bennaf ag addasrwydd yr ymgeisydd. Fel y cyfryw, byddwn yn rhagweld y byddai angen i bob gweithredwr safle ledled Cymru wneud cais, unwaith y bydd y Bil hwn yn dod i rym. Byddai angen cael cyfnod o ras i ganiatáu iddynt wneud hynny cyn y gellir cyflwyno'r Bil yn iawn. Byddwn yn rhagweld y byddai gan bob un o'r 92 o safleoedd berchennog trwyddedig yn eu gweithredu.

O ran y ffigurau—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, symudaf ymlaen i'r safleoedd cymysg. Mae darpariaeth yn y Bil ar gyfer safleoedd cymysg. Ar ddechrau'r Bil, mae darpariaeth ar gyfer trwyddedu rhan o safle lle mae rhan o'r safle ar gyfer cartrefi gwyliau a rhan ar gyfer cartrefi preswyl; dim ond y rhan breswyl y bydd angen ei chynnwys. Rwy'n derbyn pwynt y Gweinidog o ran costau. Rydym wedi gwneud llawer o waith i geisio sicrhau bod y costau mor gywir â phosibl. Bydd llawer o hyn yn hapfasnachol, gan ei fod yn dibynnu ar benderfyniadau y bydd yn rhaid iddo eu cymryd, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â lefel y ffioedd y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn eu codi am y trwyddedau. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym llawer o fanylion yn y Bil, yr wyf yn hapus

have more detail in the costings than there has been in a number of Government Bills that I have scrutinised in the past.

**Mark Isherwood:** We recognise the harassment, intimidation and exploitation that you detail. Thank you for bringing forward this Bill and for the hard work that you and so many others have put into this. We also welcome the fact that site owners will have a right of appeal to the residential property tribunal, recognising, as you say, that only a small minority of site operators are guilty of the worst offences. We support the proposals for a more robust site licensing regime and for a fit-and-proper-person test. Do you envisage that that test will include a Criminal Records Bureau check? Will it take account of the Rehabilitation of Offenders Act 1974, which enables some criminal convictions to be ignored after a rehabilitation period?

We welcome the removal of the site operators' veto on the sale of a home. That would also apply to a person who might acquire a home and come onto the site—currently owners can, in effect, veto individuals or households from coming onto the site. However, what consideration have you given to a role for the residents association in terms of overcoming concerns expressed by the British Holiday and Home Park Association and others that there needs to be some sort of mechanism to ensure that people who would not be welcome to the majority of the local resident population do not come onto the site? Is there a role for residents, as opposed to the site owners, in those circumstances? How do you respond to the additional calls by Consumer Focus Wales with regard to a number of matters—I will not list them all as I am sure that you have seen its paper—that it is keen for you to include, based on the detailed research that it undertook and that you have incorporated into your work?

I have three final points. With regard to utilities, how will your proposals address the concerns highlighted by Consumer Focus Wales that one of the biggest concerns for

iddynt gael eu craffu yn ystod y cam pwyllgor, a byddwn yn dadlau bod mwy o fanylion yn y costau nag a fu mewn nifer o Filiau Seneddol yr wyf wedi craffu arnynt yn y gorffennol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Rydym yn cydnabod yr achosion o aflonyddu, brawychu a chamfanteisio a nodwch. Diolch am gyflwyno'r Bil hwn ac am y gwaith caled rydych chi a chymaint o bobl eraill wedi'i roi i mewn i hyn. Rydym hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd gan berchnogion safle hawl i apelio i'r tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl, gan gydnabod, fel y dywedwch, mai dim ond lleiafrif bach o weithredwyr safle sy'n euog o'r troseddau gwaethaf. Rydym yn cefnogi'r cynigion ar gyfer cyfundrefn trwyddedu safle fwy cadarn ac ar gyfer prawf unigolion addas a phriodol. A ydych yn rhagweld y bydd y prawf yn cynnwys gwiriad gan y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol? A fydd yn ystyried Deddf Ailsefydlu Troseddwyr 1974, sy'n sicrhau y gellir anwybyddu rhai collfarnau troseddol ar ôl cyfnod ailsefydlu?

Rydym yn croesawu'r cam i ddileu fetô'r gweithredwyr safle ar werthu cartref. Byddai hynny hefyd yn gymwys i unigolyn a allai gael cartref a dod ar y safle—ar hyn o bryd, gall perchenogion, i bob pwrpas, atal unigolion neu aelwydydd rhag dod i'r safle. Fodd bynnag, pa ystyriaethau a roddwyd gennych i roi rôl i'r gymdeithas trigolion o ran goresgyn pryderon a fynegwyd gan Gymdeithas Parciau Gwyliau a Pharciau Cartrefi Prydain ac eraill bod angen rhyw fath o ddull o sicrhau nad yw pobl na fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o'r trigolion lleol yn eu croesawu yn dod ar y safle? A oes rôl i drigolion, yn hytrach na pherchnogion safle, yn yr amgylchiadau hynny? Sut ydych chi'n ymateb i'r galwadau ychwanegol gan Lais Defnyddwyr Cymru ynglŷn â nifer o faterion—ni wna eu rhestru i gyd oherwydd rwy'n siŵr eich bod wedi gweld ei bapur—ei fod yn awyddus ichi gynnwys, yn seiliedig ar y gwaith ymchwil manwl a wnaeth ac rydych wedi ei ymgorffori yn eich gwaith?

Mae gennyf dri phwynt terfynol. O ran cyfleustodau, sut y bydd eich cynigion yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a amlygwyd gan Lais Defnyddwyr Cymru, sef mai un o'r



owners of park homes was a lack of choice and transparency in the supply of utilities and the impact of that on fuel poverty, among other things? Your proposals will address home parks and sites that are partly home parks and partly holiday parks. What implications, if any, will this have for people living in holiday parks as their permanent residence? Finally, with regard to the potential negative impacts on site profitability and bank lending, what dialogue have you had, or do you propose to have, with bank lenders to ensure that those concerns meet the practical limitations on their lending that they must meet by law?

**Peter Black:** I thank Mark Isherwood for his general support for the Bill and his comments. I will try to respond to his concerns and questions in order. In relation to the CRB check and other criminal record checks, section 6(5) of the Bill requires the licensing authority to specify the information that applicants must provide when applying for a licence. That must include sufficient information to enable the authority to apply the fit-and-proper person test. That is also subject to regulations made under subsection 8, so either the regulations will specify what information applicants must provide, or licensing authorities must specify what is needed. We do not believe that it was sensible to put a particular check on the face of the Bill, because that may change over time. There is, therefore, flexibility to allow licensing authorities or the Minister through regulation to specify exactly what is required to determine whether a person is a fit-and-proper person. So, I think that we have covered that in those particular subsections.

With regard to the veto and who can come to live on the site, there will still be site rules; those will be agreed with residents and can cover such issues as who is a suitable person to live on the site. You will be aware that the UK Government has just brought in an amendment to the Equality Act 2010 that, in effect, exempts holiday home sites and mobile home parks from that Act. So, for

pryderon mwyaf i berchnogion cartrefi mewn parciau oedd diffyg dewis a thryloywder wrth gyflenwi cyfleustodau ac effaith hynny ar dlodi tanwydd, ymhlith pethau eraill? Bydd eich cynigion yn mynd i'r afael â pharciau cartrefi a safleoedd sy'n rhannol yn barciau cartrefi ac yn rhannol yn barciau gwyliau. Pa oblygiadau a gaiff hyn, os o gwbl, ar bobl sy'n byw mewn parciau gwyliau fel eu cartref parhaol? Yn olaf, o ran yr effeithiau negyddol posibl ar broffidioldeb safle a benthyciadau banc, pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael, neu rydych yn bwriadu eu cael, â benthycwyr banc er mwyn sicrhau bod y pryderon hynny yn bodloni'r cyfyngiadau ymarferol ar eu benthycia y mae'n rhaid iddynt eu bodloni yn ôl y gyfraith?

**Peter Black:** Diolch i Mark Isherwood am ei gefnogaeth gyffredinol i'r Bil a'i sylwadau. Byddaf yn ceisio ymateb i'w bryderon a'i gwestiynau yn eu trefn. Mewn perthynas â gwiriadau y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol a gwiriadau cofnodion troseddol eraill, mae adran 6(5) y Bil yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r awdurdod trwyddedu nodi'r wybodaeth y mae'n rhaid i ymgeiswyr ei darparu wrth wneud cais am drwydded. Mae'n rhaid cynnwys digon o wybodaeth i alluogi'r awdurdod i gymhwyso'r prawf unigolyn addas a phriodol. Mae hynny hefyd yn ddarostyngedig i reoliadau a wneir o dan isadran 8, felly naill ai bydd y rheoliadau yn nodi pa wybodaeth y mae'n rhaid i ymgeiswyr ei darparu, neu mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau trwyddedu nodi beth sydd ei angen. Ni chredwn ei bod yn synhwyrol rhoi gwiriad penodol ar wyneb y Bil, oherwydd gall hynny newid dros amser. Felly, mae mwy o hyblygrwydd i ganiatáu i awdurdodau trwyddedu neu'r Gweinidog drwy reoliad nodi'n union beth sydd ei angen i bennu a yw unigolyn yn addas a phriodol. Felly, credaf ein bod wedi rhoi sylw i hynny yn yr isadrannau penodol hynny.

O ran y fetu a phwy a all ddod i fyw ar y safle, bydd rheolau safle o hyd; cytunir arnynt gyda phreswylwyr, a gallant ymdrin â materion megis pwy sy'n unigolyn addas i fyw ar y safle. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth y DU wedi cyflwyno diwygiad i Ddeddf Cydraddoldeb 2010 sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn eithrio safleoedd cartrefi gwyliau a pharciau cartrefi symudol o'r Ddeddf

example, if residents wanted to specify that no-one under the age of 60 can live on the site, that would be allowed. However, that is a matter for each particular park and the rules that they set out; I do not want to do that for them, and I would not be advocating that particular restriction. It is a matter for the residents and the operator.

In terms of Consumer Focus Wales's concerns, the only one that Mark mentioned was about utilities and fuel poverty. That is outside the scope of this Bill, and I do not think that I can do much about it. A lot of the abuses that I have come across in relation to utilities are illegal acts in my view and are matters for consumer protection bodies and Ofgem. When residents have come to me with such abuses, I have always referred them to those authorities. There are issues around fuel poverty to do with the design of the homes themselves and the fact that it is very difficult to clad them or make them more fuel efficient. The Bill contains provisions about what is allowed in terms of making alterations to the home that will make it easier to make the homes more fuel efficient, but the grants and other things that are available are a matter for the Welsh and UK Governments and the schemes that they have in place. On bank lenders, I do not think that the introduction of a licensing fee would jeopardise the financial viability of these sites; these are multi-million pound businesses and the fees imposed will be small compared to the profits of the site operators. Where there are licensing regimes already, such as for houses of multiple occupation, there has been no problem in securing bank finance, and I do not envisage a problem in relation to mobile home sites either.

**Rebecca Evans:** I congratulate Peter Black on bringing this issue forward, and I welcome his statement today. I put on record that I very much support what he is seeking to achieve. I particularly welcome the proposals to introduce a fit-and-proper person test for site operators, which is a vital tool to protect park home residents.

honno. Felly, er enghraifft, pe byddai trigolion yn awyddus i nodi na all unrhyw un o dan 60 oed fyw ar y safle, byddai hynny'n cael ei ganiatáu. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n fater i bob parc penodol a'r rheolau a nodir ganddynt; ni fyddwn am wneud hynny ar eu rhan, ac ni fyddwn yn argymhell y cyfyngiad penodol hwnnw. Mater i'r trigolion a'r gweithredwr ydyw.

O ran pryderon Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru, yr unig un y soniodd Mark amdano oedd ynghylch cyfleustodau a thlodi tanwydd. Mae hynny y tu allan i gwmpas y Bil hwn, ac ni chredaf y gallaf wneud llawer am y peth. Mae llawer o'r achosion yr wyf wedi dod ar eu traws mewn perthynas â chamdefnyddio cyfleustodau yn weithredoedd anghyfreithlon yn fy marn i ac yn faterion i gyrff diogelu defnyddwyr ac Ofgem. Pan mae trigolion wedi dod ataf gydag achosion o'r fath, rwyf bob amser wedi eu cyfeirio at yr awdurdodau hynny. Mae materion yn ymwneud â thlodi tanwydd yn ymwneud â dyluniad y cartrefi eu hunain a'r ffaith ei bod yn anodd iawn rhoi cladid arnynt neu eu gwneud yn fwy effeithlon o ran tanwydd. Mae'r Bil yn cynnwys darpariaethau ynghylch yr hyn a ganiateir o ran gwneud addasiadau i'r cartref a fydd yn golygu ei bod yn haws gwneud y cartrefi'n fwy effeithlon o ran tanwydd, ond mater i Lywodraeth Cymru a Llywodraeth y DU yw'r grantiau a'r pethau eraill sydd ar gael a'r cynlluniau sydd ganddynt ar waith. O ran benthydwyr banc, ni chredaf y byddai cyflwyno ffi drwyddedu yn peryglu hyfywedd ariannol y safleoedd hyn; mae'r rhain yn fusnesau gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd a bydd y ffioedd a osodir yn fach o'u cymharu ag elw gweithredwyr safleoedd. Lle ceir cyfundrefnau trwyddedu eisoes, megis ar gyfer tai amlfeddiannaeth, ni fu unrhyw broblem o ran sicrhau cyllid banc, ac nid wyf yn rhagweld problem mewn perthynas â safleoedd cartrefi symudol chwaith.

**Rebecca Evans:** Hoffwn longyfarch Peter Black ar gyflwyno'r mater hwn, a chroesawaf ei ddatganiad heddiw. Hoffwn gofnodi fy mod yn cefnogi'r hyn y mae'n ceisio ei gyflawni yn fawr iawn. Croesawaf yn arbennig y cynigion i gyflwyno prawf unigolyn addas a phriodol ar gyfer gweithredwyr safle, sydd yn arf hanfodol i

You acknowledge in your consultation document that the HMO model for a fit-and-proper person test may not be fully effective; I wonder whether you have explored aspects of other models that have been suggested by bodies looking at this issue at the past, such as the liquor licensing system or the Consumer Credit Act 1974, both of which might provide useful inspiration for you. Having said that, I am pleased to hear your response to Mark Isherwood; it seems that you are seeking a system with a good degree of flexibility.

Presumably a licence could be revoked if a site operator acts in a way that breaches the fit-and-proper person conditions, so would you envisage that local authorities would have the power to issue a management order in such a situation? How do you propose to ensure that residents are not negatively affected in such a situation?

I am keen to know whether you are proposing to apply the test retrospectively, or whether it would just be applied to new applicants, but I think you answered that in response to the Minister. Applying it retrospectively could lead to some problems, but also real benefits, so what consideration have you given to that?

With regards to the model standards to which you refer in your consultation document, you say the Bill would make it a condition of each site licence that all applicable Welsh Government model standards for mobile home sites in Wales are adhered to. Are you satisfied that the model standards as currently written are sufficiently robust, or are there improvements or changes that you would like to be made to those standards? Have you made any assessment of to what extent the model standards are already being adhered to?

**Peter Black:** Thank you for those questions, Rebecca, and for your support for the Bill. I considered a number of models for the

ddiogelu preswylwyr cartrefi mewn parciau.

Rydych yn cydnabod yn eich dogfen ymgynghori efallai na fydd y model HMO ar gyfer prawf unigolyn addas a phriodol yn gwbl effeithiol; tybed a ydych wedi archwilio agweddau ar fodolau eraill sydd wedi cael eu hawgrymu gan gyrff sydd wedi edrych ar y mater hwn yn y gorffennol, megis y system trwyddedu gwirodydd neu Ddeddf Credyd Defnyddwyr 1974, y gall y ddau ohonynt fod yn ysbrydoliaeth ddefnyddiol ichi. Wedi dweud hynny, rwy'n falch o glywed eich ymateb i Mark Isherwood; mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn chwilio am system gyda chryn dipyn o hyblygrwydd.

Mae'n debyg y gellid diddymu trwydded os bydd gweithredwr safle yn gweithredu mewn ffordd sy'n torri'r amodau unigolyn addas a phriodol, felly a fydddech yn rhagweld y byddai gan awdurdodau lleol y pŵer i gyhoeddi gorchymyn rheoli mewn sefyllfa o'r fath? Sut ydych chi'n bwriadu sicrhau nad effeithir yn negyddol ar drigolion mewn sefyllfa o'r fath?

Rwy'n awyddus i wybod a ydych yn bwriadu cymhwyso'r prawf yn ôl-weithredol, neu a fyddai ond yn cael ei gymhwyso i ymgeiswyr newydd, ond credaf eich bod wedi ateb hynny mewn ymateb i'r Gweinidog. Gallai ei gymhwyso'n ôl-weithredol arwain at rai problemau, ond hefyd at fanteision gwirioneddol, felly pa ystyriaeth ydych wedi'i rhoi i hynny?

O ran y safonau model y cyfeiriwch atynt yn eich dogfen ymgynghori, dywedwch y byddai'r Bil yn ei gwneud yn un o amodau pob trwydded safle y dylid cadw at bob un o safonau enghreifftiol Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer safleoedd cartrefi symudol yng Nghymru. A ydych yn fodlon bod y safonau enghreifftiol fel y'i hysgrifennwyd ar hyn o bryd yn ddigon cadarn, neu a oes gwelliannau neu newidiadau yr hoffech eu gwneud i'r safonau hynny? Ydych chi wedi gwneud unrhyw asesiad ynghylch i ba raddau y cedwir at y safonau enghreifftiol ar hyn o bryd?

**Peter Black:** Diolch ichi am y cwestiynau, Rebecca, ac am eich cefnogaeth i'r Bil. Ystyriais nifer o fodolau ar gyfer trwyddedu'r

licensing of the sites. Certainly, the Consumer Credit Act could be taken into account by local authorities when they come to consider whether someone is a fit-and-proper person. There is flexibility in the Bill to enable them to do that. However, the Bill has been based on that particular model. I think that it is an appropriate model and, hopefully, we have made the relevant adjustments to make it workable. I suspect that that will be tested in scrutiny in committee, and I look forward to those questions when they come up.

There is provision for management orders in the Bill and also for a local authority to, in effect, take over the running of a site on a temporary basis if someone ceases to be a fit-and-proper person and arrangements need to be made to ensure that the site continues to be run. The local authority will be able to recover the costs of doing that; that is also included in the Bill. Therefore, we are trying to make provisions as best as we can to ensure that local authorities can exercise their duties responsibly without impinging on the rights and security of the residents in the mobile homes.

On the model standards, I think that the last set was in 2008, and I would envisage that, should this Bill become law, they will have to be reviewed and revised. I suspect that they are out of date and they will certainly need to be looked at. However, that is a matter for the Minister. I do not think that it is an imperative and I am sure that the Minister will not need to do it immediately before commencing the Bill. However, they certainly have to be looked at.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawaf yn fawr iawn y datganiad hwn gan Peter Black, a hefyd y Bil. Mae hyn yn bwnc sydd wedi'i godi ar nifer o achlysuron gan nifer o Aelodau o'r Cynulliad hwn dros y 13 blynedd diwethaf. Mae 3,400 o gartrefi parc ledled Cymru, ac mae meysydd ar gyfer cartrefi parc yn 19 o'r 22 awdurod lleol. Felly, mae'r hyn yn effeithio ar y mwyafrif o Aelodau o'r Cynulliad hwn—mwy na thebyg ei fod yn effeithio ar bob un o'r Aelodau rhanbarthol, a'r mwyafrif hefyd o'r Aelodau

safleoedd. Yn sicr, gallai awdurdodau lleol ystyried y Ddeddf Credyd Defnyddwyr pan ddônt i ystyried a yw rhywun yn unigolyn addas a phriodol. Mae hyblygrwydd yn y Bil er mwyn eu galluogi i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Bil yn seiliedig ar y model penodol hwnnw. Credaf ei fod yn fodel priodol a, gobeithio, byddwn wedi gwneud yr addasiadau perthnasol i'w wneud yn ymarferol. Rwy'n amau y caiff hynny ei brofi wrth graffu yn y pwyllgor, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y cwestiynau hynny pan fyddant yn codi.

Mae darpariaeth ar gyfer gorchmynion rheoli yn y Bil a hefyd i awdurdod lleol, i bob pwrpas, gymryd drosodd y gwaith o redeg safle dros dro os bydd rhywun yn peidio â bod yn unigolyn addas a phriodol ac mae angen gwneud trefniadau i sicrhau bod y safle yn parhau i gael ei redeg. Bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn gallu adennill y costau o wneud hynny; caiff hynny ei gynnwys yn y Bil hefyd. Felly, rydym yn ceisio gwneud darpariaethau hyd eithaf ein gallu er mwyn sicrhau y gall awdurdodau lleol arfer eu dyletswyddau yn gyfrifol heb amharu ar hawliau a diogelwch y trigolion yn y cartrefi symudol.

O ran y safonau enghreifftiol, credaf mai yn 2008 y gwnaed y set ddiwethaf, a byddwn yn rhagweld, pe byddai'r Bil hwn yn dod yn gyfraith, y bydd yn rhaid iddynt gael eu hadolygu a'u diwygio. Rwy'n amau eu bod wedi dyddio a bydd angen edrych arnynt yn sicr. Fodd bynnag, mater i'r Gweinidog yw hwnnw. Ni chredaf ei fod yn hanfodol ac rwy'n siŵr na fydd angen i'r Gweinidog wneud hynny yn union cyn cychwyn y Bil. Fodd bynnag, mae angen edrych arnynt yn sicr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I very much welcome this statement by Peter Black, and also the Bill. This is a subject that has been raised on a number of occasions by a number of Assembly Members over the past 13 years. There are 3,400 park homes throughout Wales, and there are park home sites in 19 of the 22 local authorities. Therefore, this affects the majority of Assembly Members—more than likely it affects every regional Member, and also the majority of the constituency Members.

etholaethol.

Fel y mae Peter eisoes wedi'i ddweud, rydym yn sôn gan fwyaf am bobl hŷn—pobl sydd wedi gwerthu'u cartrefi ac wedi buddsoddi mewn cartrefi parc er mwyn ceisio gwneud y gorau o'r ecwiti oedd ganddynt yn eu cartrefi a sicrhau bywyd ychydig bach yn fwy hwylus a llewyrchus yn eu blynyddoedd hŷn. Mae Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru wedi cynnal arolwg o 236 o breswylwyr cartrefi parc yng Nghymru, ac roedd 62% o'r rheini yn dweud eu bod wedi wynebu problemau, ac roedd 11% ohonynt yn dweud eu bod wedi wynebu ychydig rhyw fath o fygythiad, geiriol neu gorfforol, gan berchennog y maes lle'r oedd eu cartrefi parc wedi'u lleoli.

Felly, mae'r Bil hwn yn eithriadol o bwysig. Nid oes modd i'r Bil ymwneud â phob un o'r problemau, ond bydd yn fodd i ddiogelu buddiannau perchnogion y cartrefi parc a bydd yn fodd hefyd i reoleiddio'r bobl sy'n rheoli'r parciau hyn ac i sicrhau safon.

Fy nghwestiwn sylfaenol yw hyn: a ydych yn gobeithio ac yn hyderus y bydd y Bil hwn nid yn ateb yr holl broblemau yn ei hun ond yn arwain at ddatblygiadau a fydd yn golygu y bydd y problemau hyn yn cael eu harchwilio ymhellach gan awdurdodau lleol, gan y Llywodraeth hon a chan Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig, ac y bydd y Bil yn mynd i'r afael â'r ystod eang o broblemau sy'n bodoli ac bydd o leiaf yn fan cychwyn priodol inni geisio sicrhau bod hawliau perchnogion y cartrefi parc hyn yn cael eu diogelu i'r dyfodol?

**Peter Black:** Yes, I do, and I hope that, once this Bill comes in, the duty that is placed on local authorities and the resources that are made available to them will enable them to be more proactive in policing the licences that they will then be responsible for granting. As part of that policing, a number of the abuses that have been brought to our attention by Consumer Focus Wales and others will be tackled.

3.15 p.m.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank Peter for his statement this afternoon, and I congratulate

As Peter has already said, we are talking primarily about older people—people who have sold their homes and have invested in park homes in order to try to optimise the equity that they had in their homes and to ensure a somewhat easier and more prosperous life in their later years. Consumer Focus Wales carried out a survey of 236 park home residents in Wales, and 62% said that they had faced problems, and 11% said that they had faced some kind of threat, either verbal or physical, from the owner of the site where their park homes were located.

Therefore, this Bill is exceptionally important. It is not possible for the Bill to address all of the problems, but it will be a means of protecting the interests of park home owners, and it will also be a means of regulating the people who manage these parks and of ensuring standards.

My basic question is this: do you hope and are you confident that this Bill will not answer all the problems in itself but lead to developments that will mean that these problems will be investigated further by local authorities, by this Government and by the UK Government, and that the Bill will address a wide range of the problems that exist and will at least be an appropriate starting point for us to endeavour to ensure that the rights of park home owners are protected in future?

**Peter Black:** Ydw, gobeithiaf, unwaith y daw'r Bil hwn yn weithredol, y bydd y ddyletswydd a roddir ar awdurdodau lleol a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael iddynt yn eu galluogi i fod yn fwy rhagweithiol wrth blismona'r trwyddedau y byddant wedyn yn gyfrifol am eu cyflwyno. Fel rhan o'r gwaith plismona hwnnw, eir i'r afael â nifer o'r achosion o gamddefnyddio a gafodd eu dwyn at ein sylw gan Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru ac eraill.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i Peter am ei ddatganiad y prynhawn yma, a hoffwn ei

him on the work done to date. I am only slightly miffed that his name was pulled out of the hat rather than mine, having submitted the same proposal on every single occasion I have had the opportunity to do so. However, I am very grateful on behalf of my constituents that Peter has been able to bring this forward.

For the last 13 years, I have worked alongside people in Brecon and Radnorshire who have been subject to some vile treatment by the owners of the sites on which they live. As part of my work, I have myself encountered that vile behaviour from some park owners, who have questioned me on why I was pursuing these issues. My interaction with them is enough to tell me that this law is badly needed.

These residents are often very vulnerable and do not have anyone to stick up for them. Local authorities, for whatever reasons, have been slow to respond to the needs of this particular section of our population, as have the police. I hope that, as a result of your work, Peter, and the work of Consumer Focus Wales, all authorities will now take these issues seriously. I will ask two specific questions.

First, several times in your statement, you mentioned the role of tenants' associations within park sites. Sometimes, individuals interested in setting up tenants' associations have been subjected to abuse, because the site owners recognise that, by working together, residents have more of a chance to make their voices heard. Do your proposals look to address how we can make such associations more successful in residential parks?

Secondly, on regulation, I know that, in the Minister's contribution, he said that he had concerns about the levels of regulation, but what discussions have you had with him to ensure that the regulations that would enact some of the provisions of this Bill will be carried out for the Government? I would welcome support for you, as an individual Member, to develop this legislation so that the need for regulations is diminished, because I have grave concerns that if regulation is left to the Welsh Government,

longyfarch ar y gwaith a wnaed ganddo hyd yn hyn. Rwyf ychydig yn siomedig fod ei enw wedi ei dynnu allan o'r het yn hytrach na fy un i, wedi i mi gyflwyno'r un cynnig ar bob un achlysur posibl. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn ar ran fy etholwyr bod Peter wedi gallu ei gyflwyno.

Dros y 13 mlynedd diwethaf, rwyf wedi gweithio ochr yn ochr â phobl ym Mrycheiniog a Maesyfed sydd wedi cael eu trin yn warthus gan berchnogion y safleoedd lle maent yn byw. Fel rhan o'm gwaith, rwyf wedi dod ar draws ymddygiad gwael o'r fath gan rai perchenogion parciau, a wnaeth fy holi pam fy mod yn mynd ar drywydd y materion hyn. Roedd hyn yn ddigon i ddweud wrthyf fod angen dirfawr am y gyfraith hon.

Mae'r trigolion hyn yn aml yn agored iawn i niwed ac nid oes ganddynt unrhyw un i sefyll i fyny drostynt. Mae awdurdodau lleol a'r heddlu, am ba resymau bynnag, wedi bod yn araf i ymateb i anghenion y gyfran arbennig hon o'n poblogaeth. Gobeithio, o ganlyniad i'ch gwaith, Peter, a gwaith Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru, y bydd pob awdurdod bellach yn cymryd y materion hyn o ddifrif. Hoffwn ofyn dau gwestiwn penodol.

Yn gyntaf, soniasoch sawl gwaith yn eich datganiad am rôl cymdeithasau tenantiaid mewn safleoedd parciau. Weithiau, mae unigolion sydd â diddordeb mewn sefydlu cymdeithasau tenantiaid wedi bod yn destun cam-drin, oherwydd bod perchnogion y safle yn cydnabod, drwy weithio gyda'i gilydd, y gall trigolion gael mwy o gyfle i leisio'u barn. A yw eich cynigion yn ystyried sut y gallwn wneud cymdeithasau o'r fath yn fwy llwyddiannus mewn parciau preswyl?

Yn ail, o ran rheoleiddio, yng nghyfraniad y Gweinidog, gwn iddo ddweud ei fod yn pryderu am y lefelau rheoleiddio, ond pa drafodaethau rydych wedi'u cael gydag ef i sicrhau bod y rheoliadau a fyddai'n gweithredu rhai o ddarpariaethau'r Bil hwn yn cael eu cyflawni ar gyfer y Llywodraeth? Byddwn yn croesawu cefnogaeth i chi, fel Aelod unigol, i ddatblygu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon fel bod yr angen am reoliadau yn lleihau, oherwydd mae gennyf bryderon dybryd os bydd rheoleiddio'n cael ei adael i

those regulations will never appear.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that contribution, Kirsty, and thank you for your support for the Bill. I certainly recognise the huge contribution that you and your constituents have made to the work on drafting this Bill's contents. Certainly, a lot of the stuff that you and your constituents have brought to my attention has led directly to provisions within the Bill.

In relation to tenants' associations, the current law is that 50% of the tenants need to be signed up before an association can be recognised. However, there have been problems in the past, with reports of intimidation on sites to try to prevent tenants from joining, to make sure that the required 50% was not reached. The Bill makes provision for the membership list of a tenants' association to be lodged with a local authority and not made public, so that the owner of a site will not be able to determine who is a member and who is not. He will have to take the local authority's certification on face value in that regard, and the local authority will act as an independent arbiter. Hopefully, that will enable more tenants' associations to be set up to carry out their very important work, as is done at the moment by those currently in situ.

Another provision in the Bill is that we have exempted from the Freedom of Information Act 2000 any requests for data about the membership of tenants' associations, so a local authority will not be required to give that information if an FOI request is made.

In relation to the regulations, as I said to the Minister, I am more than happy to work with him and his officials to try to reduce the number of regulations. If you go through the explanatory memorandum and look at the list, you will see that a large number of them are for basic administrative issues that need to be put in place before the Bill can be commenced. Obviously, I do not want to second-guess what the Minister wants to do on a number of those issues, so it is important that his officials come forward and offer

Lywodraeth Cymru, na fydd y rheoliadau hynny fyth yn ymddangos.

**Peter Black:** Diolch am y cyfraniad hwnnw, Kirsty, a diolch ichi am eich cefnogaeth i'r Bil. Rwyf yn sicr yn cydnabod y cyfraniad enfawr rydych chi a'ch etholwyr wedi'i wneud i'r gwaith ar ddrafftio cynnwys y Bil hwn. Yn sicr, mae llawer o'r materion y gwnaethoch chi a'ch etholwyr eu tynnu at fy sylw wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at ddarpariaethau yn y Bil.

Mewn perthynas â chymdeithasau tenantiaid, y gyfraith ar hyn o bryd yw bod angen i 50% o'r tenantiaid fod wedi cofrestru cyn y gellir cydnabod cymdeithas. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd problemau yn y gorffennol, gydag adroddiadau o frawychu ar safleoedd i geisio atal tenantiaid rhag ymuno, er mwyn sicrhau na chyrhaeddir y nod o 50%. Mae'r Bil yn gwneud darpariaeth er mwyn i restr aelodaeth cymdeithas tenantiaid i gael ei chyflwyno gydag awdurdod lleol ac iddi beidio â chael ei chyhoeddi, fel na fydd y perchennog safle yn gallu penderfynu pwy sy'n aelod a phwy sydd ddim yn aelod. Bydd yn rhaid iddo gymryd gair yr awdurdod lleol yn hynny o beth, a bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn gweithredu fel canolwr annibynnol. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n golygu y caiff mwy o gymdeithasau tenantiaid eu sefydlu i wneud eu gwaith pwysig iawn, fel y gwneir ar hyn o bryd gan y rheini sy'n bodoli eisoes.

Un o ddarpariaethau eraill y Bil yw ein bod wedi eithrio o Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000 unrhyw geisiadau am ddata ynghylch aelodaeth o gymdeithasau tenantiaid, felly ni fydd yn ofynnol i awdurdod lleol roi'r wybodaeth honno os gwneir cais am ryddid gwybodaeth.

Mewn perthynas â'r rheoliadau, fel y dywedais wrth y Gweinidog, rwy'n fwy na pharod i weithio gydag ef a'i swyddogion i geisio lleihau nifer y rheoliadau. Os byddwch yn mynd drwy'r memorandwm esboniadol ac yn edrych ar y rhestr, fe welwch fod nifer fawr ohonynt ar gyfer materion gweinyddol sylfaenol y mae angen eu rhoi ar waith cyn y gellir gweithredu'r Bil. Yn amlwg, nid wyf am ragfynegei'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog am ei wneud ar nifer o'r materion hynny, felly mae'n bwysig bod ei swyddogion yn dod

suggestions and amendments so that we can reduce the number of those regulations. The English Bill on mobile homes contains a huge number of regulations, and we have a lot more on the face of our Bill than it does. However, if we can reduce the number of regulations, that will happen. I have every confidence that the Minister will implement these regulations. I think that the issue is really one of time and of how quickly those regulations can be put in place so that the Bill can be commenced. I do not want an unnecessary delay, if it can be avoided, and I am sure that the Minister agrees with me on that. We will certainly do our best to reduce the burden on his officials.

**Darren Millar:** I want to add my congratulations to Peter on his work so far on this issue, and to note the contribution that Consumer Focus Wales has made to the debate and to the development of the Bill. However, I am a little concerned that the scope of the Bill may be too narrow to address some of the concerns that I see in my own constituency, because the harassment, intimidation, exploitation and sharp practice that is clearly evident on some of the park home sites is also evident on some of the caravan sites and holiday parks in my area.

I am not trying to confuse the two issues here, as I know the distinction between the two, but I am simply making the point that there is a growing number of people whose main accommodation is a mobile home on a caravan park. We must not overlook that fact in the development of this legislation, because they need protection, too, and we need to ensure that there is an effective licensing regime for those holiday parks where mobile homes have people living in them for sometimes nine, 10, 11 or even 12 months of the year, certainly in my constituency. I ask you Peter—and I know that we have had some discussions about this outside the Chamber—whether at the next stage of this legislation, as it continues to develop and enters committee stage, there will be an opportunity for the licensing issues of holiday caravan parks to be addressed also, so that caravan owners can also have some protection from what some have described as the ‘extortion’ and very poor practice on

ymlaen ac yn cynnig awgrymiadau a diwygiadau fel y gallwn leihau nifer y rheoliadau hynny. Mae Bil Lloegr ar gartrefi symudol yn cynnwys nifer fawr o reoliadau, ac mae gennym fwy o lawer ar wyneb ein Bil ni o gymharu â hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, os gallwn leihau nifer y rheoliadau, bydd hynny’n digwydd. Mae gennyf bob hyder y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu’r rheoliadau hyn. Credaf mai amser sy’n bwysig a pha mor gyflym y gellir rhoi’r rheoliadau hynny ar waith fel y gellir gweithredu’r Bil. Nid wyf am weld oedi diangen, os gellir ei osgoi, ac rwy’n siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno â mi ar hynny. Byddwn yn sicr yn gwneud ein gorau i leihau’r baich ar ei swyddogion.

**Darren Millar:** Hoffwn innau longyfarch Peter ar ei waith hyd yma ar y mater hwn, a nodi cyfraniad Llais Defnyddwyr Cymru at y ddatl ac at ddatblygu’r Bil. Fodd bynnag, rwyf ychydig yn bryderus y gallai cwmpas y Bil fod yn rhy gul i fynd i’r afael â rhai o’r pryderon a welaf yn fy etholaeth fy hun, oherwydd bod yr achosion o aflonyddu, brawychu, camfanteisio ac ymarfer diegwyddor sydd yn amlwg ar rai o’r safleoedd cartrefi mewn parciau hefyd yn amlwg ar rai o’r safleoedd carafanau a pharciau gwyliau yn fy ardal i.

Nid wyf yn ceisio cymysgu’r ddau fater hwn, gan fy mod yn gwybod y gwahaniaeth rhwng y ddau, rwyf ond yn gwneud y pwynt bod nifer gynyddol o bobl y mae eu prif lety yn gartref symudol ar barc carafanau. Rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio’r ffaith honno wrth ddatblygu’r ddeddfwriaeth hon, oherwydd mae angen eu hamddiffyn hwy hefyd, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod trefn drwyddedu effeithiol ar gyfer y parciau gwyliau hynny lle mae pobl wedi bod yn byw mewn cartrefi symudol am naw, 10, 11 neu hyd yn oed 12 mis y flwyddyn weithiau, yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i. Gofynnaf ichi Peter—a gwn ein bod wedi cael rhai trafodaethau am hyn y tu allan i’r Siambr—a fydd cyfle yn ystod cam nesaf y ddeddfwriaeth hon, wrth iddi gael ei datblygu a mynd i gyfnod pwyllgor, i fynd i’r afael â materion yn ymwneud â thrwyddedu parciau carafanau gwyliau hefyd, fel y gellir amddiffyn perchnogion carafanau rywfaint hefyd rhag yr hyn y mae rhai wedi ei ddisgrifio fel ‘cribdeiliaeth’ ac arfer gwael



those particular sites. I note that, as it stands, the Caravan Sites and Control of Development Act 1960 is not amended in any way by this particular piece of legislation, and it may well be that there is an opportunity at a later date to do that.

**Peter Black:** I thank Darren for his comments. This is a matter that he has raised before, of course. The legal basis for caravan sites and for mobile homes is slightly different. For that reason, holiday sites fall outside the scope of this Bill. In fact, holiday caravans are mainly regulated under the Caravan Sites and Control of Development Act 1960 and the Caravan Sites Act 1968, which also apply to mobile homes. However, the Mobile Homes Act 1983 and the Housing Act 2004 do not apply to holiday caravans, and they form the basis of the legislation that I am bringing forward and also define the scope of that legislation. Therefore, any provisions relating to holiday caravans would introduce quite a complex set of amendments and regulations, which would be very difficult to accommodate within the existing Bill.

There is also a different economic factor for holiday caravans than is the case for residential sites, simply because the holiday industry has an impact on tourism and other factors, while the residential mobile home sites that I am seeking to regulate here are largely—as it says on the tin—residential homes for the people living there, and they do not, as such, impact on the tourism offer of a particular area. Therefore, with those considerations, any legislation relating to holiday caravans would need to be a part of a separate piece of legislation. I am sure that, if you are successful next time, Darren, you might consider doing that.

iawn ar y safleoedd penodol hynny. Nodaf, fel y mae, nad yw Deddf Safleoedd Carafanau a Rheoli Datblygu 1960 yn cael ei diwygio mewn unrhyw ffordd gan y darn penodol hwn o ddeddfwriaeth, ac mae'n bosibl iawn y bydd cyfle yn ddiweddarach i wneud hynny.

**Peter Black:** Diolch i Darren am ei sylwadau. Mae hwn yn fater a gododd o'r blaen, wrth gwrs. Mae'r sail gyfreithiol i'r safleoedd carafanau a chartrefi symudol ychydig yn wahanol. Am y rheswm hwnnw, ni chaiff safleoedd gwyliau eu cynnwys o fewn cwmpas y Bil hwn. Yn wir, caiff carafanau gwyliau eu rheoleiddio yn bennaf o dan Ddeddf Safleoedd Carafanau a Rheoli Datblygu 1960 a Deddf Safleoedd Carafanau 1968, sydd hefyd yn gymwys i gartrefi symudol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw Deddf Cartrefi Symudol 1983 a Deddf Tai 2004 yn gymwys i garafanau gwyliau, ac maent yn ffurfio sail y ddeddfwriaeth yr wyf fi'n ei chyflwyno, a hefyd yn diffinio cwmpas y ddeddfwriaeth honno. Felly, byddai unrhyw ddarpariaethau sy'n ymwneud â charafanau gwyliau yn cyflwyno set eithaf cymhleth o ddiwygiadau a rheoliadau, a fyddai'n anodd iawn darparu ar eu cyfer yn y Bil presennol.

Ceir hefyd ffactor economaidd gwahanol ar gyfer carafanau gwyliau o gymharu â safleoedd preswyl, yn syml oherwydd bod y diwydiant gwyliau yn cael effaith ar dwristiaeth a ffactorau eraill, tra bod y safleoedd cartrefi symudol preswyl yr wyf yn ceisio eu rheoleiddio yma i raddau helaeth—fel sy'n amlwg o'r disgrifiad—yn gartrefi preswyl i'r bobl sy'n byw yno, ac nid ydynt, fel y cyfryw, yn effeithio ar arlwy twristiaeth ardal benodol. Felly, gyda'r ystyriaethau hynny, byddai angen i unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â charafanau gwyliau fod yn rhan o ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth ar wahân. Rwy'n siŵr, os byddwch yn llwyddiannus y tro nesaf, Darren, y gallech ystyried gwneud hynny.

## **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

**Y Lluoedd Arfog  
The Armed Forces**

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt.

**Y Llywydd:** Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt.

*Cynnig NDM5084 William Graham*

*Motion NDM5084 William Graham*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn talu teyrnged i aberth ac ymrwymiad aruthrol y rheini sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ein Lluoedd Arfog;*

*1. Pays tribute to the immense sacrifice and commitment of those who have served in our Armed Forces;*

*2. Yn mynegi pryder am ddiffyg cydlyniant a chapasiti gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i gefnogi cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef anhwylder straen wedi trawma ac yn nodi'r rôl y gall y trydydd sector ei chwarae wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau wedi'u cydlynu i gyn-filwyr;*

*2. Expresses concern at the lack of coordination and capacity of services in Wales to support ex-service personnel suffering with post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and notes the role that the third sector can play in the delivery of coordinated services to ex-service personnel;*

*3. Yn nodi canfyddiadau Adroddiad Gofal Iechyd a Chymuned y Lluoedd Arfog yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried yn fanwl sefydlu canolfan breswyl yng Nghymru ar gyfer cyn-filwyr gydag anhwylder straen wedi trawma; ac*

*3. Notes the findings of the Healthcare and the Armed Forces Community in Wales Report and calls on the Welsh Government to give careful consideration to establishing a residential centre in Wales for ex-service personnel with PTSD; and*

*4. Yn cydnabod y rôl hanfodol y mae cofebion rhyfel yn ei chwarae wrth sicrhau nad yw aberth y bobl hynny sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ein Lluoedd Arfog byth yn mynd yn angof, ac yn nodi pwysigrwydd gwarchod cofebion rhyfel yn rhan allweddol o dreftadaeth Cymru ac fel canolbwynt ar gyfer cofio.*

*4. Recognises the vital role that war memorials play in ensuring that the sacrifices of many who have served in our Armed Forces are never forgotten, and notes the importance of protecting war memorials as an essential part of Welsh heritage and a focal point for remembrance.*

**Mark Isherwood:** I move the motion.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf y cynnig.

In this remembrance week, we pay tribute to the immense sacrifice and commitment of those who have served in our armed forces, remembering those who have given their lives in all conflicts over the years. The repatriation to the UK tomorrow of the bodies of two soldiers from 1<sup>st</sup> Battalion The Royal Gurkha Rifles reminds us that this remains an ever-present reality today.

Yn yr wythnos goffa hon, talwn deyrnged i aberth ac ymrwymiad aruthrol y rhai sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ein lluoedd arfog, gan gofio'r rhai sydd wedi marw ym mhob rhyfel dros y blynyddoedd. Mae dychwelyd cyrff dau filwr o Fataliwn Cyntaf Reifflwyr Brenhinol y Gurkhas i'r DU yfory yn ein hatgoffa bod hyn yn parhau i fod yn realiti bythol o hyd heddiw.

As I heard as a guest at Llay Royal British Legion's festival of remembrance last Saturday, this is also about the growing need created by the pressures on family life for

Fel y clywais fel gwestai yng ngŵyl goffa Lleng Brydeinig Frenhinol Llai ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf, mae a wnelo hyn hefyd â'r angen cynyddol a grëwyd gan y pwysau sydd

those in the armed forces, and by the dislocation for those moved on to civvy street. Some of those will be medically discharged and in need of assistance, while others will be dealing with the isolation, loneliness and depression that can result from dislocation.

Our motion expresses concern at the lack of co-ordination and capacity of services in Wales to support ex-service personnel suffering from post-traumatic stress disorder, or PTSD. It also notes the role that the third sector can play in the delivery of co-ordinated services to ex-service personnel, notes the findings of the 'Healthcare and the Armed Forces Community in Wales' report, and calls on the Welsh Government to give careful consideration to establishing a residential centre in Wales for ex-service personnel who have PTSD. It also notes the importance of protecting war memorials.

I campaigned with CAIS, the north Wales-based voluntary sector provider of drug and alcohol services, on behalf of the traumatised ex-forces personnel who had come to rely on the Tŷ Gwyn ex-service treatment unit in Llandudno. Their complex needs had not been met by the NHS or by Combat Stress. When I visited Tŷ Gwyn, I met a group of veterans aged from their 80s to their early 20s, who had served in engagements spanning rearguard action at Dunkirk through to Gulf 2. Initial bravado was followed by tears as they told me their stories.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 3.27 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 3.27 p.m.*

Despite our campaign, Tŷ Gwyn closed in late 2005. CAIS undertook a feasibility study into the possibility of its delivering a replacement service. The need was there but the funding was not. It is something that the Pathways centre treating ex-service personnel for PTSD also found when it subsequently came and went in Bangor.

Whenever I challenge the Welsh Government over this, it insists that the services required can be provided by the NHS. Steven Hughes,

ar fywyd teuluol i'r rhai yn y lluoedd arfog, a chan y dadleoli i'r rhai sy'n symud ymlaen i fywyd arferol. Caiff rhai o'r rheini eu rhyddhau am resymau meddygol a bydd angen cymorth arnynt, tra bydd eraill yn delio â'r arwahanrwydd, yr unigedd a'r iselder a all ddeillio o ddadleoli.

Mae ein cynnig yn mynegi pryder am y diffyg cydlyniant a chapasiti gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i gefnogi cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef anhwylder straen wedi trawma, neu PTSD. Mae hefyd yn nodi'r rôl y gall y trydydd sector ei chwarae i ddarparu gwasanaethau wedi'u cydlynu i gyn-filwyr, yn nodi canfyddiadau'r adroddiad 'Gofal Iechyd a Chymuned y Lluoedd Arfog yng Nghymru', ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried yn ofalus sefydlu canolfan breswyl yng Nghymru ar gyfer cyn-filwyr sydd ag anhwylder straen wedi trawma. Mae hefyd yn nodi pwysigrwydd amddiffyn cofebion rhyfel.

Ymgyrchais â CAIS, darparwr gwasanaethau cyffuriau ac alcohol o'r sector gwirfoddol yn y gogledd, ar ran y cyn-filwyr a oedd yn dioddef trawma ac a oedd wedi dod i ddibynnu ar uned driniaeth Tŷ Gwyn i gyn-filwyr yn Llandudno. Nid oedd eu hanghenion cymhleth wedi'u diwallu gan y GIG na chan Combat Stress. Pan ymwelais â Tŷ Gwyn, cyfarfûm â grŵp o gyn-filwyr ag ystod oedran o'r wythdegau i'r ugeiniau cynnar, a oedd wedi gwasanaethu mewn brwydrau o'r ymladd yn Dunkirk i Gwlff 2. Wedi'r ymffrost ar y dechrau daeth y dagrau wrth iddynt adrodd eu hanes i mi.

Er gwaethaf ein hymgyrch, caewyd Tŷ Gwyn ddiwedd 2005. Cynhaliodd CAIS astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i'r posibilrwydd o ddarparu gwasanaeth newydd. Roedd yr angen yno, ond nid y cyllid. Mae'n rhywbeth hefyd a welodd y ganolfan Llwybrau a oedd yn trin cyn-filwyr am anhwylder straen wedi trawma pan ddaeth am gyfnod byr wedi hynny i Fangor.

Pryd bynnag y byddaf yn herio Llywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn â hyn, mae'n mynnu y gall y gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen gael eu

regimental medical officer of 2<sup>nd</sup> Battalion The Parachute Regiment in the Falkland Islands in 1982, and also director of front-line resuscitation at the Bluff Cove disaster, who presented with PTSD himself a decade later, has said that,

‘With no disrespect to NHS Mental Health professionals, it is likely that the first time they encounter an ex-serviceman with Combat Related – PTSD will be their first appreciation of a complex psychological condition that correlates poorly with the usual spectrum of “civilian” mental health disorders’.

He also said that,

‘If conventional Mental Health Services were so comprehensive there would not be such a high veteran rate of suicide, high prison population, and large number of veterans sleeping rough.’

Complex military PTSD is, by definition, not within the routine practice of NHS mental health services, other than the specialist trauma day unit in Cardiff.

In March 2010, the Welsh Government announced funding for veteran-specific community mental health specialists as part of a hub-and-spoke all-Wales veterans health and wellbeing service. This does not address the need for short-term residential treatment for those who have complex needs. We call on the Welsh Government to engage. Surely there is no need to complicate the referral pathway for veterans in Wales. A simple grass-roots third sector approach is all that it would take, backed by proven results and delivered in partnership with health boards.

The Healthcare Inspectorate Wales report published in May, ‘Healthcare and the Armed Forces Community in Wales’, recommends the establishment of an armed forces forum,

darparu gan y GIG. Mae Steven Hughes, swyddog meddygol catrodol o 2<sup>il</sup> Fataliwn Catrawd y Parasiwtwyr yn rhyfel Ynysoedd Falkland yn 1982, a hefyd gyfarwyddwr dadebru yn y rheng flaen yn nhrychineb Bluff Cove, a gafodd anhwylder straen wedi trawma ei hun ddegawd yn ddiweddarach, wedi dweud,

Heb unrhyw amharch i weithwyr proffesiynol Iechyd Meddwl y GIG, mae’n debygol mai’r tro cyntaf y byddant yn dod ar draws cyn-filwr gydag Anhwylder Straen wedi Trawma sy’n Gysylltiedig ag Ymladd fydd y tro cyntaf y bydd yn rhaid iddynt orfod deall cyflwr seicolegol cymhleth nad oes ganddo fawr o gysylltiad â sbectrwm arferol anhwylderau iechyd meddwl “sifilaidd”.

Dyweddodd hefyd,

Pe bai Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl confensiynol mor gynhwysfawr, ni fyddai’r gyfradd hunanladdiad ymhlith cyn-filwyr mor uchel, ni fyddai poblogaeth y carchardai mor uchel, ac ni fyddai nifer fawr o gyn-filwyr yn cysgu ar y stryd.

Nid yw anhwylder straen wedi trawma milwrol cymhleth, drwy ddiffiniad, yn rhan o feddygaeth arferol gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl y GIG, ar wahân i’r uned ddydd trawma arbenigol yng Nghaerdydd.

Ym mis Mawrth 2010, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth Cymru gyllid ar gyfer arbenigwyr iechyd meddwl cymunedol sy’n ymwneud yn benodol â chyn-filwyr fel rhan o wasanaeth canolog a chysylltiedig ym maes iechyd a lles i gyn-filwyr ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Nid yw hyn yn mynd i’r afael â’r angen am driniaeth breswyl tymor byr i’r rhai sydd ag anghenion cymhleth. Galwn ar Lywodraeth Cymru i roi sylw i hyn. Nid oes angen cymhlethu’r llwybr atgyfeirio i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru. Dull gweithredu syml gan y trydydd sector ar lawr gwlad yw’r cyfan fyddai ei angen, wedi’i ategu gan ganlyniadau profedig ac wedi’i gyflwyno mewn partneriaeth â byrddau iechyd.

Mae adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mai, ‘Gofal Iechyd a Chymuned y Lluoedd Arfog yng Nghymru’, yn argymhell y dylid sefydlu

bringing together the public sector with service charities, the third sector and members of the armed forces themselves. This has merit, provided that the experts in the armed forces and ex-forces communities are listened to and that services are designed with them, not for them. The report states that the issue of mental health problems amongst veterans caused as a result of experiences during service was the subject of a significant proportion of the responses received. The report proposes that each health board build on the new hub-and-spoke all-Wales veterans health and wellbeing service by establishing a veterans mental health clinical network within each health board area. However, we lack data to assess the effectiveness of the hub-and-spoke out-patient treatment option run by Dr Bisson in Cardiff.

3.30 p.m.

We do not know how many returning forces personnel are now living in Wales with impairments due to physical or mental injuries suffered on duty. It is understood that Dr Bisson established an extensive assessment, but what are the results of that? What are the outcome measures from his service and, crucially, what is the service user's feedback on this service.

Regarding a residential centre for veterans in Wales, the Healthcare Inspectorate Wales report quotes a Royal Marines veteran, who states:

'This would serve as a tangible example of visible commitment to Welsh Servicemen, who account for at least eight percent of the total UK veteran population.'

It also quotes a former Welsh guardsmen and former Falkland Islands veteran, who had to travel across the border into England for treatment for post-traumatic stress disorder. He identified,

'a need to give careful consideration to establishing a residential centre in Wales'.

fforwm y lluoedd arfog, gan ddwyn ynghyd y sector cyhoeddus gydag elusennau'r lluoedd arfog, y trydydd sector ac aelodau o'r lluoedd arfog eu hunain. Mae gwerth i hyn, ar yr amod y gwrandewir ar yr arbenigwyr yn y lluoedd arfog a chymunedau'r cyn-filwyr a bod y gwasanaethau'n cael eu cynllunio gyda hwy, ac nid iddynt hwy. Noda'r adroddiad mai problemau iechyd meddwl ymhlith cyn-filwyr a achosir o ganlyniad i brofiadau wrth wasanaethu oedd testun cyfran sylweddol o'r ymatebion a gafwyd. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig bod pob bwrdd iechyd yn adeiladu ar y gwasanaeth iechyd a lles canolog a chysylltiedig newydd i gyn-filwyr ar gyfer Cymru gyfan drwy sefydlu rhwydwaith clinigol iechyd meddwl o gyn-filwyr ym mhob ardal bwrdd iechyd. Fodd bynnag, nid oes gennym ddata i asesu effeithiolrwydd yr opsiwn triniaeth i gleifion allanol ar ffurf gwasanaeth canolog a chysylltiedig a redir gan Dr Bisson yng Nghaerdydd.

Ni wyddom faint o aelodau'r lluoedd arfog sydd wedi dychwelyd ac sydd bellach yn byw yng Nghymru sydd â nam o ganlyniad i anafiadau corfforol neu feddyliol a gafwyd pan oeddent ar ddyletswydd. Deellir i Dr Bisson lunio asesiad helaeth, ond beth yw canlyniadau hynny? Beth yw'r dulliau o fesur canlyniadau o'i wasanaeth, ac, yn hollbwysig, beth yw adborth y defnyddiwr gwasanaeth ar y gwasanaeth hwn.

O ran canolfan breswyl i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru, mae adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru yn dyfynnu cyn-filwr o'r Môr-filwyr Brenhinol, sy'n dweud:

'Byddai hyn yn enghraifft bendant o ymrwymiad gwladwy i Filwyr Cymru, sy'n cynrychioli o leiaf wyth y cant o gyfanswm poblogaeth cyn-filwyr y DU.'

Mae hefyd yn dyfynnu cyn-aelod o'r Gwarchodlu Cymreig a chyn-filwr yn rhyfel Ynysoedd Falkland, a oedd yn gorfod teithio ar draws y ffin i Loegr i gael triniaeth ar gyfer anhwylder straen wedi trawma. Nododd fod,

'angen rhoi ystyriaeth ofalus i sefydlu canolfan breswyl yng Nghymru'.

The report states that many members of the armed forces community commented on the desirability of having a residential centre for veterans in Wales as,

‘something that you can see, touch and feel...of real psychological benefit’

The report also recommends that:

‘The Welsh Government should consider the utility of establishing a form of residential facility within Wales.’

In evidence to the Welsh Affairs Committee this week, Plaid Cymru Westminster leader, Elfyn Llwyd, warned that too many armed forces personnel fail to get the help they need when returning to civilian life and called for a centre to be established in Wales to help veterans suffering from trauma. I applaud his dedicated commitment to this issue.

Among combat veterans, there is a common pattern of complex PTSD and attempted symptom suppression through alcohol and/or drug abuse. That leads to a downward spiral of employment difficulties, relationship problems, confrontation with the law and even suicide. A report from the Howard League for Penal Reform, entitled ‘Leave No Veteran Behind’, asked why so many veterans find themselves caught in the criminal justice system, stating that it is vital that the complex needs of armed forces personnel are adequately addressed and that we do everything that we can to help those who serve their countries to adjust to civilian life.

Welsh guardsman, Lance Sergeant Dan Collins, tragically and unnecessarily took his life on New Year’s Day. He desperately sought help for his post-traumatic stress, first through the Ministry of Defence’s medical assessment programme. He was subsequently referred to an NHS mental health ward, where he spent four weeks without being treated with anything other than various medications.

Noda’r adroddiad fod llawer o aelodau o gymuned y lluoedd arfog wedi nodi pa mor ddymunol fyddai cael canolfan breswyl i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru fel,

‘rhywbeth y gallwch ei weld, ei gyffwrdd a’i deimlo ... o fudd seicolegol gwirioneddol’

Mae’r adroddiad hefyd yn argymhell:

‘Dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried defnyddioldeb sefydlu cyfleuster preswyl o ryw fath yng Nghymru.’

Mewn tystiolaeth i’r Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig yr wythnos hon, rhybuddiodd arweinydd Plaid Cymru yn San Steffan, Elfyn Llwyd, fod gormod o aelodau’r lluoedd arfog yn methu â chael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt wrth ddychwelyd i fywyd sifilaidd a galwodd am sefydlu canolfan yng Nghymru i helpu cyn-filwyr sy’n dioddef trawma. Cymeradwyaf ei ymroddiad i’r mater hwn.

Ymhlith cyn-filwyr sydd wedi ymladd mewn brwydrau, ceir patrwm cyffredin o anhwylder straen wedi trawma cymhleth ac ymgais i atal symptomau trwy gamdefnyddio alcohol a/neu gyffuriau. Mae hynny’n arwain at batrwm o anawsterau cynyddol o ran gwaith, problemau yn eu perthynas ag eraill, gwrthdaro â’r gyfraith a hyd yn oed hunanladdiad. Gofynnodd adroddiad gan y Gynghrair dros Ddiwygio’r Drefn Gosbi, o’r enw ‘Leave No Veteran Behind’, pam mae cymaint o gyn-filwyr yn cael eu dal yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol, gan nodi ei bod yn hanfodol bod anghenion cymhleth aelodau’r lluoedd arfog yn cael sylw digonol a’n bod yn gwneud popeth a allwn i helpu’r rhai sy’n gwasanaethu eu gwlad i addasu i fywyd sifilaidd.

Cyflawnodd aelod o’r Gwarchodlu Cymreig sef yr Is-ringyll Dan Collins, hunanladdiad yn drasig a diangen ar Ddydd Calan. Taer ofynnodd am help ar gyfer ei straen wedi trawma, yn gyntaf drwy raglen asesiad meddygol y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn. Cafodd ei atgyfeirio wedyn at ward iechyd meddwl y GIG, lle y treuliodd bedair wythnos heb gael ei drin gydag unrhyw beth heblaw gwahanol feddyginiaethau.

Last night, by sheer coincidence, I met a decorated young ex-soldier who served in the Royal Regiment of Wales and Parachute Regiment in Kosovo, Northern Ireland and Iraq. After leaving the army, he was jailed after being convicted in Cardiff Crown Court of criminal damage, assault and harassment. His barrister told the court that if he were still in the army, he would get help and that his scars were not of his own making and that no-one seemed interested. The judge told him that he was a brave and outstanding soldier who saw and experienced dreadful things from which the rest of us are protected because of the bravery of people like him. However, having heard that there was no funding available for further assessment and treatment, the judge told him that it was his duty to say that there was a risk to members of the public, who must be protected, and he was sent to prison. Those are only two tragic incidents, resulting from the inadequate services within Wales.

The Welsh charity, Healing the Wounds, which delivers PTSD support, is campaigning for a place where people can receive support for PTSD and where they can recover. After a recent visit by the Surgeon Captain Royal Navy and Defence Professor of Mental Health, Professor Greenberg, he stated that the MoD would be interested in the results of its successful therapy model. It now needs the support of the Welsh Government to move forward in clinical trials to demonstrate that the outcomes and statistical analysis collected will show an effective therapy that can be recognised by the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. After all, the NICE PTSD guidelines state that treatment and care should take into account patients' individual needs and preferences. It tells me that it has requested a meeting with the Minister for Health and Social Services but has not yet been given an answer. I hope that it will receive one soon. The excellent work and results of volunteer organisations on the ground must be supported by the Welsh Government. We therefore call on the Welsh Government to heed their call, to remove its amendment and to support our motion.

Neithiwr, drwy gyd-ddigwyddiad llwyr, cyfarfûm â chyn-filwr ifanc medalog a wasanaethodd yng Nghatrawd Brenhinol Cymru a Chatrawd y Parasiwtwyr yn Kosovo, Gogledd Iwerddon ac Irac. Ar ôl gadael y fyddin, cafodd ei garcharu ar ôl cael ei ddyfarnu'n euog yn Llys y Goron Caerdydd o ddifrod troseddol, ymosod ac aflonyddu. Dywedodd ei fargyfreithiwr wrth y llys, pe bai yn y fyddin o hyd y byddai'n cael help ac nad oedd yn gyfrifol am ei greithiau ei hun ac nad oedd gan neb ddiddordeb ynddo yn ôl pob golwg. Dywedodd y barnwr wrtho ei fod yn filwr dewr a rhagorol a welodd ac a brofodd bethau ofnadwy y mae'r gweddill ohonom yn cael ein diogelu rhagddynt oherwydd dewrder pobl tebyg iddo ef. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl clywed nad oedd unrhyw gyllid ar gael ar gyfer asesiad a thriniaeth bellach, dywedodd y barnwr wrtho mai ei ddyletswydd ef oedd dweud bod risg i aelodau o'r cyhoedd, y mae'n rhaid eu diogelu, a chafodd ei anfon i'r carchar. Dim ond dau ddigwyddiad trasig yw'r rhain, yn deillio o wasanaethau annigonol yng Nghymru.

Mae'r elusen Gymreig, Healing the Wounds, sy'n rhoi cymorth ar gyfer anhwylder straen wedi trawma, yn ymgyrchu dros gael lleoliad lle y gall pobl gael cymorth ar gyfer anhwylder straen wedi trawma a lle y gallant wella. Ar ôl ymweliad diweddar gan Gapten Llawfeddygol y Llynges Frenhinol ac Athro Amddiffyn Iechyd Meddwl, yr Athro Greenberg, dywedodd y byddai gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn ddiddordeb yng nghanlyniadau ei model therapi llwyddiannus. Yn awr mae angen cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cymru arni i symud ymlaen mewn treialon clinigol i ddangos y bydd y canlyniadau a'r dadansoddiad ystadegol a gasglwyd yn dangos therapi effeithiol y gall y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol (NICE) ei chydabod. Wedi'r cyfan, mae canllawiau NICE ar gyfer anhwylder straen wedi trawma yn nodi y dylai triniaeth a gofal ystyried anghenion a dymuniadau unigol cleifion. Mae'n dweud wrthyf ei bod wedi gofyn am gyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ond nid yw wedi cael ateb eto. Gobeithio y caiff un yn fuan. Rhaid i waith a chanlyniadau ardderchog sefydliadau gwirfoddol ar lawr gwlad gael eu cefnogi gan

Lywodraeth Cymru. Galwn felly ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wrando arnynt, i ddileu ei gwelliant a chefnogi ein cynnig.

*Gwelliant 1—Jane Hutt*

*Ym mhwynt 2, dileu popeth cyn 'rôl' a rhoi yn ei le: 'Yn nodi'r buddsoddiad diweddar a wnaed mewn gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i gynorthwyo cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ac yn derbyn pa mor bwysig yw'r'.*

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** I am extremely grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. Everyone in Wales, and in the rest of the UK, owes a debt of gratitude to our armed forces—to the 250,000 Welsh veterans who have served their country, as well as to the thousands who currently do so, conducting operations in some of the most dangerous and demanding places on earth. The Welsh Guards have returned in October from a tour of duty in Afghanistan. The 1st Battalion the Royal Welsh are currently deployed as part of Operation Herrick 16 in Afghanistan. There is a homecoming parade for the Welsh Guards on 30 November, and I know that the First Minister has been invited to that parade. I very much hope that he will go to it.

It is not the members of the armed forces who decide whether or not to go to war; that is the responsibility of elected governments. However, they are the ones who serve and defend their country. It is an inevitable consequence that many will return from active duty with physical injuries and that others will be left with psychological scars in the form of post-traumatic stress disorder, which may emerge in the months, or even, as Mark Isherwood outlined, in the years and decades, after the events. Actions are being carried out by the third sector, and, in this respect, I wish to highlight the role of the Welsh Guards Afghanistan appeal. I know that my colleague Mick Antoniw has been active in promoting that appeal. The appeal helps those who are seriously injured and

*Amendment 1—Jane Hutt*

*In point 2, delete all before 'the role' and replace with: 'Notes the recent investment in services in Wales to support ex-service personnel suffering with post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and accepts the importance of'.*

**Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt.

**Antoinette Sandbach:** Rwy'n hynod ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddaid hon. Mae pawb yng Nghymru, ac yng ngweddill y DU, yn ddiolchgar i'n lluoedd arfog—i'r 250,000 o gyn-filwyr o Gymru sydd wedi gwasanaethu eu gwlad, yn ogystal â'r miloedd sy'n gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd, sy'n cynnal ymgyrchoedd yn rhai o'r manau mwyaf peryglus ac anodd ar wyneb y ddaear. Mae'r Gwarchodlu Cymreig wedi dychwelyd ym mis Hydref ar ôl taith ar ddyletswydd yn Affganistan. Mae Bataliwn Cyntaf y Cymry Brenhinol yn rhan o Ymgyrch Herrick 16 yn Affganistan ar hyn o bryd. Mae gorymdaith croeso'n ôl wedi'i threfnu ar gyfer y Gwarchodlu Cymreig ar 30 Tachwedd, a gwn fod y Prif Weinidog wedi cael gwahoddiad i'r orymdaith honno. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y bydd yn bresennol.

Nid yr aelodau o'r lluoedd arfog sy'n penderfynu p'un ai i fynd i ryfel ai peidio, cyfrifoldeb llywodraethau etholedig yw hynny. Fodd bynnag, hwy yw'r rhai sy'n gwasanaethu ac yn amddiffyn eu gwlad. Mae'n ganlyniad anochel y bydd llawer yn dychwelyd ar ôl cyfnod ar faes y gad gydag anafiadau corfforol, ac y gadewir eraill â chreithiau seicolegol ar ffurf anhwylder straen wedi trawma, a all ddod i'r amlwg yn y misoedd, neu hyd yn oed, fel y soniodd Mark Isherwood, yn y blynyddoedd a degawdau ar ôl y digwyddiadau. Mae camau gweithredu'n cael eu cymryd gan y trydydd sector, ac, yn hyn o beth, rwyf am dynnu sylw at rôl apêl Affganistan y Gwarchodlu Cymreig. Gwn fod fy nghyd-Aelod Mick Antoniw wedi bod yn weithgar yn



helps families that have suffered bereavement. However, it is a responsibility on Government to deal with the issues that arise from post-traumatic stress disorder, and it is entirely right that veterans and service personnel receive the recognition and the support they need from society, which has been protected through their self-sacrifice.

I am sure that Members from all the parties that are represented here will share the concern of the Welsh Conservatives that there remain significant shortcomings in the way that support for veterans in Wales, particularly for post-traumatic stress disorder, is co-ordinated and delivered. The British Medical Association describes PTSD services as patchy, with significant variations from area to area. The former Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee's inquiry into PTSD noted that the current system is still not up to the standard that our veterans deserve.

Too often, when veterans and their families are struggling with the consequences of PTSD, with depression, alcohol and drug abuse, they are unable to get the help that they need quickly enough. On a practical basis, when veterans approach their GP, many find that few GPs have an understanding of the conditions related to the armed forces, and their eligibility for priority treatment is not always reflected in the referral process for secondary care. It is a regrettable situation that when veterans and their families need urgent help, they experience a service that is patchy and inconsistent.

The Welsh Government has introduced its 10-year strategy for mental health. However, there is only one passing reference in that strategy to PTSD, and no mention is made of the support that is needed by veterans' families. There is a clear case for the voluntary sector in delivering the co-ordination and the understanding of the needs of veterans that is so lacking at present.

hyrwyddo'r apêl honno. Mae'r apêl yn helpu'r rhai sy'n cael eu hanafu'n ddifrifol ac yn helpu teuluoedd sydd wedi dioddef profedigaeth. Fodd bynnag, cyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth yw ymdrin â'r materion sy'n codi o anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ac mae'n gwbl briodol bod cyn-filwyr ac aelodau'r lluoedd arfog yn cael y gydnabyddiaeth a'r cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt gan gymdeithas, sydd wedi cael ei diogelu drwy eu hunan-aberth.

Rwy'n siŵr y bydd Aelodau o'r holl bleidiau a gynrychiolir yma yn rhannu pryder y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig bod rhai diffygion sylweddol o hyd yn y ffordd y mae cefnogaeth i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ar gyfer anhwylder straen wedi trawma, yn cael ei chydgyssylltu a'i darparu. Mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn dweud bod gwasanaethau anhwylder straen wedi trawma yn rhai sy'n dameidiog, gydag amrywiadau mawr o ardal i ardal. Nododd Ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol blaenorol i anhwylder straen wedi trawma bod y system bresennol yn methu o hyd â chyrraedd y safon y mae ein cyn-filwyr yn ei haeddu.

Yn rhy aml, pan fydd cyn-filwyr a'u teuluoedd yn cael trafferth gyda chanlyniadau anhwylder straen wedi trawma, iselder ysbryd, a phroblemau camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau, ni allant gael y cymorth sydd ei angen arnynt yn ddigon cyflym. Yn ymarferol, pan fydd cyn-filwyr yn mynd at eu meddyg teulu, mae llawer yn gweld mai prin yw'r meddygon teulu sy'n deall y cyflyrau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r lluoedd arfog, ac ni chaiff eu cymhwysedd i gael triniaeth flaenoriaethol ei adlewyrchu bob amser yn y broses atgyfeirio ar gyfer gofal eilaidd. Mae'n anffodus ond, pan fydd angen help ar frys ar gyn-filwyr a'u teuluoedd, cânt wasanaeth sy'n dameidiog ac yn anghyson.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi cyflwyno ei strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer iechyd meddwl. Fodd bynnag, dim ond un cyfeiriad sydd yn y strategaeth honno at anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ac ni sonnir am y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen ar deuluoedd cyn-filwyr. Mae achos clir i'r sector gwirfoddol ymgymryd â'r gwaith o gydlynu a deall anghenion cyn-filwyr sydd mor brin ar hyn o

Undoubtedly, the merits of a residential centre for veterans, as recommended by Healthcare Inspectorate Wales, should be given serious consideration. The Welsh Government also has the opportunity to demonstrate its commitment to veterans by supporting Blind Veterans UK, formerly St Dunstan's, which has a centre in my north Wales constituency. This is a multimillion pound facility, which is funded entirely by charity and has, to my knowledge, not received so much as a penny from Welsh Government despite the excellent service that it offers. Our veterans have made great sacrifices for their country and I would hope that the Welsh Government would recognise this, support the Welsh Conservative motion and commit to giving our veterans the support they deserve.

**Mick Antoniw:** I, too, would like to place on record my tribute, and that of all my colleagues, because, as the last speaker said so eloquently, our military services do what they are commanded to do; they are not there to take the decisions, but the consequences belong to all of us within a democratic society. This must be about the fifth time that we have discussed this particular issue, and I raise no criticism of that fact because this is the sort of complex and difficult issue to which we must continually pay our attention. One of the difficulties with the issue, particularly with regard to psychological injury and post-traumatic stress, is that there is no one-size-fits-all solution to it. People who have been through significant trauma need access to support, care and counselling when problems arise, and for the duration, and that can be almost at any time during their life. You are talking about someone who may today leave the armed services traumatised, but who may, 20 or 30 years down the road, experience further problems, and it may even be a consequence of a combination of problems. Vulnerability is created, and then at a certain stage in life, additional traumas combine to tip the individual over the edge. We are talking about a system that needs to be monitored and adapted so that there is care and access for life.

bryd. Heb os, dylid rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i werth canolfan breswyl i gyn-filwyr, fel yr argymhellwyd gan Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru. Mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru gyfle hefyd i ddangos ei hymrwymiad i gyn-filwyr drwy gefnogi Blind Veterans UK, sef St Dunstan's gynt, sydd â chanolfan yn fy etholaeth yn y gogledd. Mae hwn yn gyfleuster a gostiodd filiynau o bunnoedd, sy'n cael ei ariannu'n gyfan gwbl gan yr elusen ac nad ydyw, hyd y gwn i, wedi cael yr un geiniog gan Lywodraeth Cymru er gwaethaf y gwasanaeth rhagorol a gynigir ganddo. Mae ein cyn-filwyr wedi gwneud aberth mawr dros eu gwlad a byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn cydnabod hyn, yn cefnogi cynnig y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ac yn ymrwmo i roi'r gefnogaeth y maent yn ei haeddu i'n cyn-filwyr.

**Mick Antoniw:** Hoffwn innau hefyd gofnodi fy nheyrnged i, a theyrnged fy holl gyd-Aelodau, oherwydd, fel y dywedodd y siaradwr diwethaf mor huawdl, mae ein gwasanaethau milwrol yn gwneud yr hyn y gorchmynnir iddynt ei wneud; nid ydynt yno i wneud y penderfyniadau, ond mae'r goblygiadau yn eiddo i bob un ohonom mewn cymdeithas ddemocrataidd. Mae'n rhaid ein bod yn trafod hyn am tua'r pumed tro, ac nid wyf yn beirniadu'r ffaith honno oherwydd dyma'r math o fater cymhleth ac anodd y mae'n rhaid inni barhau i roi sylw iddo. Un o'r problemau, yn enwedig o ran anaf seicolegol a straen wedi trawma, yw nad oes un ateb sy'n addas i bawb. Mae angen i bobl sydd wedi dioddef trawma sylweddol allu cael gafael ar gymorth, gofal a gwasanaeth cwnsela pan fydd problemau'n codi, a thra phery'r problemau hynny, a gall hynny fod bron ar unrhyw adeg yn ystod eu bywyd. Rydych yn sôn am rywun a all heddiw adael y gwasanaethau arfog yn dioddef trawma, ond a all, ymhen 20 neu 30 mlynedd, wynebu rhagor o broblemau, a gall hyd yn oed fod o ganlyniad i gyfuniad o broblemau. Mae'n golygu bod rhywun yn mynd yn agored i niwed, ac yna ar ryw adeg mewn bywyd, mae sawl tramwa ychwanegol yn dod ynghyd ac yn llethu'r unigolyn yn llwyr. Rydym yn sôn am system y mae angen ei monitro a'i haddasu fel bod gofal a mynediad am oes.

Another big issue that a number of veterans have raised with me is the problem of confidence because there is still considerable stigma attached to psychological injury, mental injury and so on. First is the actual recognition that the person may need help, and then there is the stage of seeking and accessing that help. The situation becomes further complicated because many of our ex-servicemen, when they leave the forces and go into jobs, go into other forms of uniformed services, be that the police, fire or ambulance service, or as train drivers and so on. In many of these occupations they will continue to be exposed to significant trauma; we know that suicide on train lines is a massive trauma for train drivers for example. I recall meeting ex-servicemen who had had bad experiences in the forces who then became train drivers only to face and deal with the trauma of incidents in their working lives. That is without going on to the specific circumstances of members of the ambulance, fire, and police services, who will see this as a part of their daily lives.

Organisations and ex-servicemen have said to me that they welcome the fact that there is this attention within Wales and that steps have been taken in Wales that some of their counterparts in England wished had been taken there, with the same level of focus and support. If there is one point to be made, particularly this week, it is that I do not think there are any grounds for complacency or for turning around and saying that we have done enough. This is something that we will have to deal with, monitor and review almost annually as time goes on because of the nature of the problem and the extent to which we are learning from the consequences of psychological injury from trauma, which is ongoing and developing. I very much welcome the Conservative debate and the opportunity to put on record my recognition of what a relatively small number of people do for society and for the population as a whole.

3.45 p.m.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I welcome the

Mater pwysig arall y mae nifer o gyn-filwyr wedi ei godi gyda mi yw'r broblem o hyder oherwydd mae cryn stigma o hyd ynghlwm wrth anaf seicolegol, anaf meddyliol ac yn y blaen. Yn gyntaf mae'r gydnabyddiaeth wirioneddol y gall fod angen cymorth ar yr unigolyn, ac yna mae'r cam o geisio a chael gafael ar y cymorth hwnnw. Cymhlethir y sefyllfa ymhellach oherwydd mae llawer o'n cyn-filwyr, pan adawant y lluoedd arfog a chael swyddi, yn mynd i fathau eraill o wasanaethau mewn lifrai, boed hynny gyda'r heddlu, y gwasanaeth tân neu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, neu fel gyrwyr trenau ac yn y blaen. Mewn llawer o'r galwedigaethau hyn byddant yn parhau i fod yn agored i drawma sylweddol; gwyddom fod hunanladdiad ar linellau trên yn drawma enfawr i yrwyr trenau er enghraifft. Rwy'n cofio cyfarfod â chyn-filwyr a oedd wedi cael profiadau gwael yn y lluoedd arfog a aeth ymlaen wedyn i weithio fel gyrwyr trenau ond i wynebu a delio â thrawma digwyddiadau yn eu bywydau gwaith. Mae hynny heb sôn am amgylchiadau penodol aelodau o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y gwasanaeth tân a'r heddlu, a fydd yn gweld hyn fel rhan o'u bywydau beunyddiol.

Mae sefydliadau a chyn-filwyr wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y sylw hwn yng Nghymru a bod camau wedi eu cymryd yng Nghymru y byddai rhai o'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr wedi dymuno eu gweld yn cael eu cymryd yno, gyda'r un lefel o ffocws a chefnogaeth. Os oes un pwynt i'w wneud, yn enwedig yr wythnos hon, yna'r pwynt hwnnw yw nad wyf yn credu bod unrhyw sail dros laesu dwylo na thros ddweud ein bod wedi gwneud digon. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd rhaid inni ymdrin ag ef, ei fonitro a'i adolygu bron yn flynyddol wrth i amser fynd heibio oherwydd natur y broblem a'r graddau rydym yn dysgu o ganlyniadau anaf seicolegol o drawma, sy'n parhau ac yn datblygu. Rwy'n croesawu'n fawr ddadl y Ceidwadwyr a'r cyfle i ddweud ar goedd fy mod yn cydnabod yr hyn y mae nifer cymharol fach o bobl yn ei wneud dros gymdeithas a thros y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Croesawaf y cyfle i

opportunity to contribute to this debate today in the lead up to Remembrance Sunday. Many people—if not everyone—in this Chamber are wearing a poppy, and when you drive around or walk up the high street you see many people taking part in this act of remembrance for the people who have given so much for this country. However, we also need to reflect on the very positive aspect of what our armed services offer many young people in our country today. They offer a great opportunity for a career and they mould and shape many young individuals to become upstanding people in our communities. The training and experience that many of our young people get in our armed services shape them, as the Member for Pontypridd touched on, in their careers beyond the armed services. I do not have the figure to hand, but I would think that the average tenure in the armed services today is about five to 10 years. Given that an individual's working life is 40 to 50 years, you can see how the grounding that people get in the armed services helps to shape many of the other key services that we rely on as a society and a nation.

In my region, it is a huge privilege to host so many ex-servicemen and ex-servicewomen as well as current service personnel, with Maindy barracks here in Cardiff and RAF St Athan in the Vale of Glamorgan. The Valleys—Pontypridd, the Rhondda and the Cynon Valley—are also traditional recruiting grounds for our armed services, offering such great hope for many people who leave the Valleys and return as more rounded individuals to offer more back to the communities that they came from. I also recognise the improvements that, in fairness, the Government has made. The Minister for Local Government and Communities has special responsibility for the armed services. The chairman of the all-party group, Darren Millar, sits on my right here, and the Assembly itself now has a mechanism that integrates it with the armed services education and information network, which is a very positive way forward for this democratic institution of Wales to engage with the armed services.

gyfrannu at y ddadl hon heddiw yn y cyfnod cyn Sul y Cofio. Mae llawer o bobl—os nad pawb—yn y Siambr hon yn gwisgo pabi, a phan fyddwch yn gyrru o gwmpas neu'n cerdded i fyny'r stryd fawr rydych yn gweld llawer o bobl yn cymryd rhan yn y weithred hon o gofio am y bobl sydd wedi rhoi cymaint dros y wlad hon. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni hefyd fyfyrto ar yr agwedd gadarnhaol iawn o'r hyn y mae ein lluoedd arfog yn ei gynnig i lawer o bobl ifanc yn ein gwlad heddiw. Maent yn cynnig cyfle gwych am yrfa ac yn paratoi llawer o unigolion ifanc ar gyfer dod yn bobl a berchir yn ein cymunedau. Mae'r hyfforddiant a'r profiad a gaiff llawer o'n pobl ifanc yn ein lluoedd arfog yn eu paratoi, fel y soniodd yr Aelod dros Bontypridd, ar gyfer eu gyrfaedd y tu hwnt i'r lluoedd arfog. Nid yw'r ffigur gennyf wrth law, ond byddwn yn credu bod unigolion ar gyfartaledd yn treulio oddeutu pum i 10 mlynedd yn y lluoedd arfog heddiw. O gofio bod bywyd gwaith unigolyn yn 40 i 50 o flynyddoedd, gallwch weld sut y mae'r sylfaen a gaiff pobl yn y lluoedd arfog yn helpu i lunio llawer o'r gwasanaethau allweddol eraill yr ydym yn dibynnu arnynt fel cymdeithas ac fel cenedl.

Yn fy rhanbarth i, mae'n fraint enfawr bod yn gartref i gymaint o gyn-filwyr, yn ddyinion a merched, yn ogystal ag aelodau presennol, gyda barics Maendy yma yng Nghaerdydd ac RAF Sain Tathan ym Mro Morgannwg. Mae'r Cymoedd—Pontypridd, y Rhondda a Chwm Cynon—hefyd yn ardaloedd recriwtio traddodiadol ar gyfer ein lluoedd arfog, ac yn cynnig llawer o obaith i lawer o bobl sy'n gadael y Cymoedd ac yn dychwelyd fel unigolion mwy aeddfed i gynnig mwy yn ôl i'r cymunedau y maent yn hanu ohonynt. Rwyf hefyd yn cydnabod y gwelliannau y mae'r Llywodraeth, gyda phob tegwch, wedi'u gwneud. Mae gan y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau gyfrifoldeb arbennig am y gwasanaethau arfog. Mae cadeirydd y grŵp hollbleidiol, Darren Millar, yn eistedd ar fy ochr dde yma, ac mae gan y Cynulliad ei hun erbyn hyn ddull sy'n ei integreiddio â rhwydwaith addysg a gwybodaeth y gwasanaethau arfog, sy'n ffordd gadarnhaol iawn ymlaen ar gyfer y sefydliad democrataidd hwn yng Nghymru i ymgysylltu â'r gwasanaethau arfog.

I remember Armed Forces Day here some two or three years ago. There was an event this year as well, but the one held in Roald Dahl Plass was the national event at which all the armed services combined to create a spectacle that really showed them in their best light. There is also a cadet force. Treorchy Comprehensive School, from my region, for example, visited the all-party group in the Assembly some two or three years ago. It was one of the first schools to attend that group's meetings and showed that, at such a young age, you can start accessing the benefits that the armed services offer many strands of public life here in Wales.

I also want to reflect on the support that is required for the albeit small proportion of people who leave the armed services with challenging medical issues. Post-traumatic stress disorder has been focused on extensively here today, but there are obviously other medical conditions that need to be considered, and the speed with which our veterans can access the support and help that they need to enable them to live as full a life as possible is a critical issue that the Government of the day must help deal with. I hope that the Minister might be able to reconsider the idea of a veterans card, which we proposed in the Assembly election campaign. This was not a political gesture; it came about as a result of discussions with various armed services charities and the armed services themselves. It would be an easy way to identify the needs of veterans.

As the Member for Pontypridd touched on, the episode during which a person requires care, particularly in the case of PTSD, can be 20, 30 or 40 years after the event that caused it. It became evident to us when we took evidence in the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee in the last Assembly that there is a critical need for medical notes to follow the ex-serviceman or ex-servicewoman back to their registered GP so that, if these events happen later in life, the GP, who is their gateway to services, can build as full a picture as possible. I would be grateful if the Minister could indicate whether the Government has had any success

Rwy'n cofio Diwrnod y Lluoedd Arfog yma tua dwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Cynhaliwyd digwyddiad eleni hefyd, ond yr un a gynhaliwyd yn Roald Dahl Plass oedd y digwyddiad cenedlaethol lle daeth yr holl luoedd arfog ynghyd i greu sioe a'u dangosodd ar eu gorau. Mae corfflu cadetiaid hefyd ar gael. Ymwelodd Ysgol Gyfun Treorci, o'm rhanbarth i, er enghraifft, â'r grŵp hollbleidiol yn y Cynulliad tua dwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl. Roedd yn un o'r ysgolion cyntaf i fynychu cyfarfodydd y grŵp hwnnw a dangosodd y gallwch, yn ifanc iawn, ddechrau manteisio ar y buddiannau y mae'r lluoedd arfog yn eu cynnig i lawer o feysydd o fywydd cyhoeddus yma yng Nghymru.

Rwyf hefyd am fyfyrto ar y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen ar gyfer cyfran o bobl, er ei bod yn fach, sy'n gadael y lluoedd arfog â phroblemau meddygol heriol. Canolbwyntiwyd yn helaeth ar anhwylder straen wedi trawma yma heddiw, ond mae cyflyrau meddygol amlwg eraill y mae angen eu hystyried, ac mae gwybod pa mor gyflym y gall ein cyn-filwyr gael mynediad at y gefnogaeth a'r cymorth sydd eu hangen arnynt i'w galluogi i fyw bywyd mor llawn â phosibl yn fater hollbwysig y mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth bresennol helpu i ddelio ag ef. Gobeithiaf y gallai'r Gweinidog ailystyried y syniad o gerdyn cyn-filwyr, a gynigiwyd gennym yn ymgyrch etholiad y Cynulliad. Nid arwydd gwleidyddol ydoedd; cododd o ganlyniad i drafodaethau ag elusennau amrywiol wasanaethau arfog a'r gwasanaethau arfog eu hunain. Byddai'n ffordd hawdd o nodi anghenion cyn-filwyr.

Fel y crybwyllodd yr Aelod dros Bontypridd, gall y cyfnod y mae angen gofal ar unigolyn, yn enwedig yn achos anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ddigwydd 20, 30 neu 40 mlynedd ar ôl y digwyddiad a'i achosodd. Daeth yn amlwg inni pan gymerwyd tystiolaeth yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol yn y Cynulliad diwethaf fod angen dybryd am nodiadau meddygol i ddilyn y cyn-filwyr yn ôl i'w meddyg teulu cofrestredig, er mwyn sicrhau, os bydd y digwyddiadau hyn yn codi yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd, y gall y meddyg teulu, sef eu porth hwy i wasanaethau, gael darlun mor llawn â phosibl. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r

in accessing that facility, because I know that, at the time, there were various obstacles to that facility being made available.

Today is about celebrating the armed services but also about reflecting on the obligation that we as a society owe the armed services. In particular, on Remembrance Day, we remember the fallen men and women of this country who have allowed us the democratic freedoms that we enjoy today, which, sadly, some people take for granted. Democracy can never be taken for granted and we owe them a great debt of gratitude.

**Elin Jones:** Rwyf i hefyd yn falch o gael y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, yn enwedig gan ein bod yn agosáu at Sul y Cofio. Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig heddiw ac yn gwrthod y gwelliant. Mae'r cynnig yn nodi diffyg cydlyniant gwasanaethau i gyn-filwyr a diffyg pasio gwybodaeth a chofnodion am gyn-filwyr rhwng y gwahanol awdurdodau cyhoeddus a'r trydydd sector. Mae angen protocol i ganiatáu rhannu gwybodaeth rhwng y lluoedd arfog, y gwasanaeth iechyd, y sector cyfiawnder troseddol a'r sector gwirfoddol. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu cymorth llawer mwy integredig i'r cyn-filwyr sydd angen hynny.

Ym marn Plaid Cymru, mae angen trefn *debrief* mwy trwyadl i aelodau'r lluoedd arfog cyn iddynt adael y lluoedd, gan gynnwys asesiadau seicolegol, profion cyffuriau ac alcohol a sesiynau gwybodaeth ar sut i dynnu'r stigma o ofyn am help. Mae'r adroddiad sydd wedi'i osod ar gyfer y ddadl hon heddiw yn adrodd profiad un cyn-filwr o Gymru wrth adael y lluoedd arfog yn dilyn rhyfel y Faulklands yn 1993. Gwnaethpwyd ei asesiad meddygol terfynol gan filwr cyffredin arall yn ticio cyfres o focsys, yn hytrach na chan feddyg o unrhyw fath.

Mae'r ddadl hon heddiw yn cyfeirio at yr angen am gartref preswyl PTSD yng Nghymru; rydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r uchelgais hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae cyn-filwyr yn dioddef o ystod eang o gyflyrau iechyd meddwl. Mae adroddiad diweddar gan King's College London yn

Gweinidog nodi a yw'r Llywodraeth wedi cael unrhyw lwyddiant wrth ddefnyddio'r cyfleuster hwnnw, oherwydd gwn fod sawl rhwystr ar y pryd yn atal y cyfleuster hwnnw rhag bod ar gael.

Dathlu'r lluoedd arfog yw diben heddiw ond mae a wnelo hefyd â myfyrio ar y ddyletswydd sydd gennym ni fel cymdeithas i'r lluoedd arfog. Yn benodol, ar Ddydd y Cofio, cofiwn am ddynion a merched y wlad hon a fu farw sydd wedi rhoi'r rhyddid democrataidd yr ydym yn ei fwynhau heddiw, y mae rhai pobl, yn anffodus, yn ei gymryd yn ganiataol. Ni ellir byth gymryd democratiaeth yn ganiataol, ac mae ein dyled yn fawr iddynt.

**Elin Jones:** I, too, am pleased to have the opportunity to contribute to this debate, particularly as we edge towards Remembrance Sunday. Plaid Cymru will support the motion today and reject the amendment. The motion notes the lack of co-ordination in terms of services for former soldiers and the deficiencies in passing information between local authorities and the third sector. We need a protocol to allow the sharing of information between the armed forces, the health service, the criminal justice sector and the voluntary sector. That would allow for a far more integrated approach for former service personnel.

Plaid Cymru believes that we need a much more thorough *debrief* system for armed forces personnel before they leave the forces, including psychological assessments, drug and alcohol testing and information sessions on how to take the stigma out of asking for assistance. The report tabled for today's debate mentions the experience of one former Welsh soldier following the Falklands war on leaving the armed forces in 1993. His final medical assessment was done by another ordinary soldier, ticking a series of boxes, rather than by a doctor of any kind.

This debate today refers to the need for a PTSD residential home in Wales; we in Plaid Cymru support that ambition. However, former soldiers do suffer a range of mental health problems. A recent report by King's College London shows that the vast majority of former soldiers who suffer mental health

dangos bod mwyafrif llethol y cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef o afiechydon meddwl yn ddyddion, yn ganol oed ac yn rhai sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn y fyddin yn benodol. Yn ychwanegol, canfu'r astudiaeth bod 80% o'r rhain yn camddefnyddio alcohol a bod 25% ohonynt wedi torri'r gyfraith. Mae'r Aelod Seneddol Elfyn Llwyd—clywsom gydnabyddiaeth i'w waith ef yn y maes hwn gan Mark Isherwood wrth iddo agor y ddadl—wedi gwneud gwaith sylweddol ar sefyllfa cyn-filwyr yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol. Yn gwbl ryfeddol, nid oes data ar gael ar nifer y cyn-filwyr sydd yn y carchar. Nid oes cwestiynau'n cael eu gofyn na data'n cael eu cofnodi ar nifer y carcharorion sy'n gyn-filwyr. Yn 2001, gwnaeth y Swyddfa Gartref arolwg a nododd bod 6% o garcharorion yn gyn-filwyr. Mae astudiaeth o garchar Dartmoor yn 2007 yn dweud bod 17% o'r carcharion, o bosibl, yn gyn-filwyr. Pa un ai yw'r ffigur yn 6% neu'n 17%, mae'n rhy uchel.

Nid wyf yn arbenigwraig o gwbl ar brofiadau milwyr mewn rhyfel. Nid wyf chwaith wedi cefnogi pob rhyfel mae'r milwyr hyn wedi ymladd ynddynt dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n gwybod digon i gredu eu bod yn haeddu gwell na bod yn ddibynnol ar alcohol neu gyffuriau, yn droseddwyr, yn garcharorion neu'n gleifion. Maent yn haeddu llawer gwell na hynny gan y Llywodraeth yn Nghymru a'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan.

Rwy'n croesawu'r ffaith bod y cynnig hwn heddiw hefyd yn sôn am bwysigrwydd cofebion rhyfel. Byddaf, fel nifer ohonom, yn mynychu dau ddigwyddiad pabi coch yn fy etholaeth dros y dyddiau nesaf. Bydd rhai yn fy etholaeth hefyd yn mynychu digwyddiad pabi gwyn wrth y gofeb rhyfel yng nghastell Aberystwyth, wedi'i drefnu gan Gyngor Tref Aberystwyth. Mae'r cyngor i'w gymeradwyo am gynnal seremoni o'r fath; nid mewn cystadleuaeth â seremonïau cofio traddodiadol, ond i roi cydnabyddiaeth gyhoeddus i'r hawl i gredu mewn heddych yn ogystal â, neu'n hytrach na, rhyfel.

Mewn dwy flynedd, byddwn yn cydnabod canmlwyddiant dechrau'r rhyfel byd cyntaf. Fel fy nghyfaill Jonathan Edwards, rwyf hefyd yn fwy cyfforddus gyda chydabod

issues are men, they are middle aged and they have served in the army specifically. In addition, the study found that 80% of them misused alcohol and that 25% had also broken the law. Elfyn Llwyd MP—we heard recognition of his work in this field from Mark Isherwood in opening the debate—has done significant work on the situation of former soldiers within the criminal justice system. Shockingly, there are no data available on the number of former soldiers who are in prison. No questions are asked and no data are gathered on the number of prisoners who are former soldiers. In 2001, the Home Office carried out a survey that showed that 6% of prisoners were former soldiers. A study conducted in Dartmoor prison in 2007 states that 17% of the inmates were, possibly, former soldiers. Whether it is 6% or 17%, it is too high.

I am no expert on soldiers' wartime experiences, nor have I supported every war that they have fought over the past few years, but I know enough to know that they deserve better than to end up dependent on alcohol or drugs, as offenders, prison inmates or patients. They deserve far better than that from the Welsh Government and from the Westminster Government.

I welcome the fact that this motion today also mentions the importance of war memorials. Like many Members, I will attend two red poppy events in my constituency over the coming days. Some in my constituency will also attend a white poppy event at the war memorial at Aberystwyth castle, organised by Aberystwyth Town Council. The council is to be praised for holding such a ceremony, not in competition with the traditional remembrance ceremonies, but to give public acknowledgment to the right to believe in pacifism as well as, or rather than, war.

In two years, we will mark 100 years since the start of the first world war. Like my colleague Jonathan Edwards, I would be more comfortable with marking the end of

diwedd y rhyfel yn hytrach na'i ddechrau. Fodd bynnag, fel rhan o gydnabod y rhyfel, erchylltra'r rhyfel ac aberth cenhedlaeth o Gymry ifanc, byddwn yn gobeithio y gallai'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru, yn y gwaith mae Carwyn Jones wedi comisiynu Deian Hopkin i'w wneud ar ran y Llywodraeth, ystyried mabwysiadu pabi coch penodol Gymreig ar gyfer ein cof ni fel cenedl o'r rhyfel byd cyntaf a gweithio gyda'r Llang Brydeinig Frenhinol a mudiadau eraill sydd yn ymwneud â'r pabi coch i ddatblygu pabi penodol ar gyfer cofio'r rhyfel byd cyntaf.

I gloi, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn edrych eto yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o 2014 i 2018 ar ofalu yn gynyddol am anghenion ein milwyr a chyn-filwyr.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Thank you, Dirprwy Lywydd for calling me to contribute to this important debate. There can be no doubt that our British armed forces are among the best in the world and that Wales's contribution to the ranks of our brave men and women in uniform is substantial. There are currently an estimated 5,000 regular and 3,000 reservist personnel from Wales serving in our armed forces and a further 220,000 veterans living in Wales. In order to place that in context, that is like talking about the population of Swansea, which stands at around 238,000 people. Today's motion seeks not only to pay tribute to our brave service personnel and the immense contribution that they have made to the peace and security of our nation, but also to highlight some of the challenges that they face in accessing services and the urgent need for those challenges to be addressed.

The 2012 Healthcare Inspectorate Wales report entitled 'Healthcare and the Armed Forces Community in Wales' outlined a number of difficulties faced by service personnel, their families and veterans. With regard to accessing health services, the report found that GPs do not always

'seem to understand the rigours of service life – even when made aware of a patient's veteran status.'

that war rather than its start. However, as part of marking the start of the first world war, and the horrors of that conflict and the sacrifice of a generation of young Welsh people, I would hope that the Assembly and the Welsh Government, in the work that Carwyn Jones has commissioned Deian Hopkin to do on behalf of the Government, could consider adopting a specifically Welsh red poppy for our remembrance as a nation of the first world war, and work with the Royal British Legion and other organisations involved with the red poppy to develop a specific poppy for commemorating the first world war.

In conclusion, what is important is that we look again during the period from 2014 to 2018 at taking increasing care of the needs of soldiers and former soldiers.

**Janet Finch-Saunders:** Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd am fy ngalw i gyfrannu at y ddatblygiad hon. Yn ddiaw mae ein lluoedd arfog Prydeinig gyda'r gorau yn y byd ac mae cyfraniad Cymru i rengoedd ein dynion a'n merched dewr mewn lifrai yn fawr. Ar hyn o bryd mae tua 5,000 o filwyr parhaol a 3,000 o rai wrth gefn o Gymru yn gwasanaethu yn ein lluoedd arfog a 220,000 o gyn-filwyr eraill yn byw yng Nghymru. Er mwyn gosod hynny mewn cyd-destun, mae'n debyg i boblogaeth Abertawe, sef tua 238,000 o bobl. Mae cynnig heddiw nid yn unig yn ceisio talu teyrnged i aelodau dewr ein lluoedd arfog a'r cyfraniad enfawr a wnaethant dros heddwch a diogelwch ein gwlad, ond hefyd yn tynnu sylw at rai o'r heriau sy'n eu hwynebu o ran cael gafael ar wasanaethau a'r angen dybryd i ymdrin â'r heriau hynny.

Nododd adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd 2012 o'r enw 'Gofal Iechyd a Chymuned y Lluoedd Arfog yng Nghymru' nifer o anawsterau a wynebir gan aelodau'r lluoedd arfog, eu teuluoedd a chyn-filwyr. O ran mynediad at wasanaethau iechyd, canfu'r adroddiad nad yw'n ymddangos bod meddygon teulu bob amser yn

'deall pa mor galed oedd bywyd yn y Lluoedd Arfog – hyd yn oed pan oeddynt yn ymwybodol o statws y claf fel cyn-filwr'



There was a general feeling that eligibility for priority treatment was not always reflected in the referral process and that

‘the role of the Reservist was not well understood by the NHS.’

This included

‘on more than one occasion that a serving Reservist had been categorised as a ‘veteran’.’

Veterans, along with serving personnel and their families, face a range of mental health and wellbeing challenges that need expert time and resources to tackle, and there is no denying or getting away from that. A common problem is post-traumatic stress disorder, which, according to NHS figures, can affect up to 30% of people who experience a traumatic event during their lives. A growing concern is the level of stress and anxiety faced by service families. For instance, the 2012 report highlighted the fact that both unit welfare officers and the army welfare service have noted an increasing level of mental health issues among service families, along with an increase in alcohol misuse, and that there is a lack of knowledge and self-awareness among older veterans and their families regarding service-related mental health issues.

To look at solutions, such as residential care and centres, the Welsh Conservatives want to see action across the board to support our servicemen and servicewomen and veterans. Healing the Wounds stated last year that the Welsh Government’s refusal to fund a residential unit due to costs puts Wales ‘at a distinct disadvantage’. I do not need to remind many of you that we had such a fantastic residential facility in Tŷ Gwyn—a service that was, sadly, withdrawn by the Welsh Labour Government some years ago. That is why the Welsh Government should and must now look to establish a residential centre for veterans as an absolute priority.

The 2012 report also found that veteran

Roedd teimlad cyffredinol nad oedd cymhwysedd i gael triniaeth flaenoriaethol yn cael ei adlewyrchu bob amser yn y broses atgyfeirio ac

‘nad oedd gan y GIG ddealltwriaeth dda o swyddogaeth y Lluoedd Wrth Gefn.’

Roedd hyn yn cynnwys

‘ar fwy nag un achlysur bod aelod o’r Lluoedd Wrth Gefn a oedd yn gwasanaethu wedi ei gategoreiddio fel ‘cyn-filwr’.’

Mae cyn-filwyr, ynghyd ag aelodau sy’n gwasanaethu a’u teuluoedd, yn wynebu amrywiaeth o heriau iechyd a lles meddyliol y mae angen amser ac adnoddau arbenigol i fynd i’r afael â hwy, ac ni ellir gwadu nac anwybyddu hynny. Problem gyffredin yw anhwylder straen wedi trawma, sydd, yn ôl ffigurau’r GIG, yn effeithio ar hyd at 30% o bobl sy’n profi digwyddiad trawmatig yn ystod eu bywydau. Pryder cynyddol yw lefel y straen a’r pryder a wynebwr gan deuluoedd y lluoedd arfog. Er enghraifft, tynnodd adroddiad 2012 sylw at y ffaith bod swyddogion lles uned a gwasanaeth lles y fyddin wedi nodi lefel gynyddol o broblemau iechyd meddwl ymhlith teuluoedd y lluoedd arfog, ynghyd â chynnydd yn y camddefnydd o alcohol, a bod diffyg gwybodaeth a hunanymwybyddiaeth ymysg cyn-filwyr hŷn a’u teuluoedd o ran problemau iechyd meddwl sy’n gysylltiedig â gwasanaeth.

I edrych ar atebion, megis gofal preswyl a chanolfannau preswyl, mae’r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am weld gweithredu cyffredinol i gefnogi ein milwyr a’n cyn-filwyr. Nododd Healing the Wounds y llynedd fod penderfyniad Llywodraeth Cymru i wrthod ariannu uned breswyl oherwydd costau yn rhoi Cymru o dan anfantais amlwg. Nid oes angen imi atgoffa llawer ohonoch o’r cyfleuster preswyl gwych a oedd gennym yn Nhŷ Gwyn—gwasanaeth a gafodd ei ddileu, yn anffodus, gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cymru rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Dyna pam y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru yn awr ystyried sefydlu canolfan breswyl i gyn-filwyr fel blaenoriaeth lwyr.

Canfu adroddiad 2012 hefyd fod grwpiau

support groups are a helpful complement to therapy. Third sector organisations and charities must and can play a vital role in providing the additional emotional support that our service personnel, veterans and their families need, and funding for such organisations should be prioritised and protected, as far as is possible.

We need action across Government, local authorities and the police to end the despicable and wanton vandalism of Wales's 3,000 war memorials. I know that I have raised concerns about metal theft previously, which affects all kinds of areas, but none more so than when people desecrate a memory and recognition of the service and the lives placed on the line so that we can sit or even stand here to debate this issue.

4.00 p.m.

Two years since the Welsh Government established an expert group on the needs of the armed forces community in Wales, it remains to be seen as to whether there has been any significant improvement in the provision of services for our armed forces personnel and veterans. I know that it is only a year since we discussed this matter; it was exactly at the same time, in the same week. I am not too convinced that anything other than words have taken place. I want to know where I can see some actions for what has happened in the last 12 months. We are still waiting to see any moves towards establishing a residential centre for ex-service personnel in Wales. We are still waiting for greater investment in PTSD—the £485,000 for a veterans mental health service does not take into account inflation. We are still waiting for co-ordinated action to protect our war memorials. The Welsh Conservatives want to see more ambition, more action and more achievement from this Welsh Government to help those who have given this country so much.

**Kirsty Williams:** I begin by thanking the Welsh Conservatives for tabling today's debate, at this most appropriate time of year.

cymorth i gyn-filwyr yn adnodd defnyddiol sy'n ategu therapi. Gall y sefydliadau yn y trydydd sector ac elusennau chwarae rôl hanfodol i ddarparu'r cymorth emosiynol ychwanegol sydd ei angen ar ein haelodau yn y lluoedd arfog, cyn-filwyr a'u teuluoedd a rhaid iddynt wneud hynny, a dylai cyllid ar gyfer sefydliadau o'r fath gael ei flaenoriaethu a'i ddiogelu, cyn belled ag y bo modd.

Mae angen gweithredu ym mhob rhan o'r Llywodraeth, awdurdodau lleol a'r heddlu i roi diwedd ar y fandaliaeth ffaidd a di-hid o 3000 o gofebion rhyfel Cymru. Gwn fy mod wedi codi pryderon am achosion o ddwyn metel o'r blaen, sy'n effeithio ar bob math o feysydd, ond yn enwedig pan fydd pobl yn halogi cof a chydnyddiaeth o'r gwasanaeth a'r bywydau a roddwyd yn y fantol er mwyn i ni allu eistedd neu hyd yn oed sefyll yma i drafod y mater hwn.

Ddwy flynedd ers i Lywodraeth Cymru sefydlu grŵp arbenigol ar anghenion y gymuned lluoedd arfog yng Nghymru, rhaid aros i weld a fu unrhyw welliant sylweddol o ran y gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar gyfer aelodau ein lluoedd arfog a chyn-filwyr. Gwn mai dim ond blwyddyn sydd ers inni drafod y mater hwn; roedd yr union amser, yn yr un wythnos. Nid wyf yn rhy argyhoeddedig bod unrhyw beth heblaw geiriau wedi digwydd. Rwyf am wybod ble y gallaf weld rhai camau gweithredu ar gyfer yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Rydym yn dal i aros i weld unrhyw gamau tuag at sefydlu canolfan breswyl i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru. Rydym yn dal i aros am fwy o fuddsoddiad mewn anhwylder straen wedi trawma—nid yw'r £485,000 ar gyfer gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl i gyn-filwyr yn cymryd chwyddiant i ystyriaeth. Rydym yn dal i aros am gamau wedi'u cydlynu i ddiogelu ein cofebion rhyfel. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am weld mwy o uchelgais, mwy o weithredu a mwy o gyflawniad gan Lywodraeth Cymru i helpu'r rhai sydd wedi rhoi cymaint i'r wlad hon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig am gyflwyno'r ddadl heddiw, ar yr adeg briodol hon o'r flwyddyn.

It is a motion that the Welsh Liberal Democrats will support. As a party, we have great pride in and a huge amount of gratitude to our armed forces for their service to our country and for the sacrifice made by individual members of the armed forces and their families, who often have a huge burden to bear when they have members of their family serving overseas in particular.

As leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, and as the Assembly Member for Brecon and Radnor, I am extremely proud to represent the garrison town of Brecon, the headquarters of the Welsh army, and of 160 (Wales) Brigade under the great leadership of Brigadier Napier, as well as the infantry training school at Dering Lines, the Sennybridge camp, of course, and the Epynt ranges. In fact, I suspect that there is not a member of the British army who has not, at some point in their career, spent some time on those infamous hills in the wet, the wind, and the cold. I have been privileged in the past to go out onto the ranges with the army, doing the Cambrian march, which is not to be entered into lightly. It was a great experience to go up to have a look at it as my own grandfather completed the Cambrian march three times as a sergeant major following the second world war.

I am pleased that Powys County Council recently signed a military compact with the armed forces—it was one of the first local authorities in Wales to do so—which recognised the council and the local health board's responsibilities towards the armed services within the county of Powys. It also recognised the huge contribution that the armed services make to the county of Powys, and that there are people in the armed services, along with their families, who are willing to give of their free time to assist non-military personnel within the area of Brecon.

One of the great discussions at that meeting was the need to have appropriate medical services. Much of this afternoon has been taken up by discussions about post-traumatic stress disorder, and it has rightly been said by many Members here that it can take many years to manifest itself. Given the recent long-term military engagement in which the UK has been involved, we can expect a long

Mae'n gynnig y bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ei gefnogi. Fel plaid, rydym yn ymfalchïo yn ein lluoedd arfog ac yn ddiolchgar iawn iddynt am eu gwasanaeth i'n gwlad ac am yr aberth a wnaed gan aelodau unigol o'r lluoedd arfog a'u teuluoedd, sydd yn aml yn ysgwyddo baich enfawr pan fydd aelodau o'u teulu yn gwasanaethu dramor yn arbennig.

Fel arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, ac fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, rwy'n hynod o falch o gynrychioli tref garsiwn Aberhonddu, pencadlys byddin Cymru, a Brigâd 160 (Cymru) dan arweiniad cadarn y Brigadydd Napier, yn ogystal â'r ysgol hyfforddiant i droedfilwyr yn Dering Lines, gwersyll Pontsenni, wrth gwrs, a meysydd ymarfer saethu Epynt. Yn wir, rwy'n amau nad oes aelod o fyddin Prydain nad yw, ar ryw adeg yn ei yrfa, wedi treulio rhywfaint o amser ar y brynïau drwgenwog hynny yn y gwynt a'r glaw a'r oerfel. Mae wedi bod yn fraint imi fynd ar y meysydd ymarfer saethu yn y gorffennol gyda'r fyddin, a oedd yn gwneud ymdaith Cymru, sy'n dipyn o her. Roedd yn brofiad gwych mynd i fyny i edrych ar hyn gan fod fy nhad-cu fy hun wedi cwblhau'r ymdaith dair gwaith fel uwch-ringyll yn dilyn yr ail ryfel byd.

Rwy'n falch bod Cyngor Sir Powys wedi llofnodi cytundeb milwrol yn ddiweddar â'r lluoedd arfog—roedd yn un o'r awdurdodau lleol cyntaf yng Nghymru i wneud hynny—a oedd yn cydnabod cyfrifoldebau'r cyngor a'r bwrdd iechyd lleol tuag at y lluoedd arfog yn sir Powys. Roedd hefyd yn cydnabod y cyfraniad enfawr y mae'r lluoedd arfog yn ei wneud i sir Powys, a bod yna bobl yn y lluoedd arfog, ynghyd â'u teuluoedd, sy'n barod i roi o'u hamser rhydd i helpu aelodau anfilwrol yn ardal Aberhonddu.

Un o'r trafodaethau mawr yn y cyfarfod hwnnw oedd yr angen i gael gwasanaethau meddygol priodol. Mae llawer o amser y prynhawn yma wedi ei dreulio yn trafod anhwylder straen wedi trawma, a dywedwyd yn briodol gan lawer o Aelodau yma y gall gymryd blynyddoedd lawer i ddod i'r amlwg. O ystyried yr ymgyrchoedd milwrol hirdymor diweddar y mae'r DU wedi bod yn

legacy of military personnel coming forward with symptoms. The army and the medical services within the armed forces have become very adept at saving people's lives and treating them physically. They are at the cutting-edge of the latest trauma medical experience. However, as a country, we have been less good at developing the skills to treat the mental scars and wounds of military service.

Levels of mental health disorder in the army are rising. The MOD admits that, and it also admits that someone who has seen service in Afghanistan is six times more likely to go on to suffer from mental health disorders than other service personnel. We need a comprehensive strategy to deal with these problems that links the statutory NHS services with the efforts of voluntary groups. I have been delighted to see my own constituency's ex-service personnel working together to develop a voluntary drop-in centre where people can simply get together to have a cup of tea or coffee, away from the pub and alcohol, and are able to have a chat about their own service history and what they are doing in their lives now. We need to have a range of options, from the extreme of a simple, local drop-in centre, right the way through to the more extensive comprehensive services that a residential setting would allow. If the Minister is interested in developing such a unit, I would like to offer up the site of Bronllys Hospital in my own constituency. There is a great deal of local interest in whether that site could host such a service. Local people would very much welcome such a service being hosted locally and would be very supportive of that.

However, Mick Antoniw was right to highlight the fact that PTSD is not just an issue for the military services. We need PTSD services that look at the impact on other service personnel, whether they are police officers, firefighters, paramedics or other emergency service personnel who often see such terrible things. We need to ensure that their needs are met as part of the Government's mental health programme.

gysylltiedig â hwy, gallwn ddisgwyl cyfnod hir o weld aelodau milwrol yn datblygu symptomau. Mae'r fyddin a'r gwasanaethau meddygol yn y lluoedd arfog wedi dod yn fedrus iawn o ran arbed bywydau pobl a'u trin yn gorfforol. Maent ar flaen y gad o ran y profiad meddygol trawma diweddaraf. Fodd bynnag, fel gwlad, rydym wedi bod yn llai llwyddiannus o ran datblygu'r sgiliau i drin creithiau a chlwyfau meddyliol gwasanaeth milwrol.

Mae lefelau anhwylder iechyd meddwl yn y fyddin yn codi. Mae'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn cyfaddef hynny, ac mae hefyd yn cyfaddef bod rhywun sydd wedi gweld gwasanaeth yn Affganistan chwe gwaith yn fwy tebygol o ddiodeff anhwylderau iechyd meddwl nag aelodau eraill o'r lluoedd arfog. Mae angen strategaeth gynhwysfawr arnom i ddelio â'r problemau hyn sy'n cysylltu'r gwasanaethau GIG statudol ag ymdrechion grwpiau gwirfoddol. Rwyf wedi bod yn falch o weld cyn-filwyr yn fy etholaeth fy hun yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i ddatblygu canolfan galw heibio wirfoddol lle y gall pobl ddod ynghyd i gael paned o de neu goffi, i ffwrdd oddi wrth y dafarn ac alcohol, a chael sgwrs am hanes eu gwasanaeth eu hunain a'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud yn eu bywydau yn awr. Mae angen inni gael ystod o ddewisiadau, o ganolfan galw i mewn leol, syml, hyd at y gwasanaethau cynhwysfawr mwy helaeth y byddai lleoliad preswyl yn gallu eu cynnig. Os oes gan y Gweinidog ddiddordeb mewn datblygu uned o'r fath, hoffwn gynnig safle Ysbyty Bronllys yn fy etholaeth fy hun. Mae llawer iawn o ddiddordeb lleol o ran p'un a allai'r safle hwnnw gynnal gwasanaeth o'r fath. Byddai pobl leol yn falch iawn o weld gwasanaeth o'r fath yn cael ei gynnal yn lleol a byddent yn gefnogol iawn i hynny.

Fodd bynnag, roedd Mick Antoniw yn iawn i dynnu sylw at y ffaith nad yw anhwylder straen wedi trawma yn fater i'r gwasanaethau milwrol yn unig. Mae angen gwasanaethau anhwylder straen wedi trawma arnom sy'n edrych ar yr effaith ar aelodau gwasanaethau eraill, boed yn swyddogion yr heddlu, diffoddwyr tân, parafeddygon neu aelodau eraill o'r gwasanaeth brys sy'n aml yn gweld pethau ofnadwy o'r fath. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod eu hanghenion yn cael eu diwallu fel rhan o raglen iechyd meddwl y

Llywodraeth.

In conclusion, I welcome the mention of war memorials. There is also the issue of regimental museums. I am proud to host one in Brecon. There is a great discussion about where the great collection of the Zulu war room should be held in the future. If the Minister would like to visit the museum with me to talk about how we can secure its future, I would be very pleased to welcome him to Brecon.

**The Minister for Local Government and Communities (Carl Sargeant):** I am grateful for the opportunity to discuss the armed forces community with Members today. I support the motion to pay tribute to the immense sacrifice and commitment of those who have served in the armed forces. It is a particularly poignant time of the year for this debate, with services of remembrance being held across the country on Sunday.

War memorials are an important part of commemoration, and volunteers do a fantastic job in ensuring that they are protected. The Welsh Government provides for the conservation of war memorials, and support is also available through the War Memorials Trust. As well as paying tribute to our veterans, we need to show our support for the whole armed forces community. In June, we provided funding for two Armed Forces Day events in north and south Wales, which the First Minister and I attended. I am pressing local authorities to introduce local community covenants, and I am pleased to report that 16 of the 22 local authorities in Wales have either signed or are about to introduce community covenants. That is over two-thirds of the local authorities in Wales, and we should be particularly proud of that.

It is almost a year since the Welsh Government published a package of support for the armed forces. In fact, I had already tabled a debate for 20 November to report back on the progress made over the last 12 months. I will instead take this opportunity to provide a brief update. During November, I will be publishing the annual update report on the package of support, and during 2013

I gloi, croesawaf y sôn am gofebion rhyfel. Cyfyd mater amgueddfeydd catrodol hefyd. Rwy'n falch fod un yn Aberhonddu. Mae trafodaeth fawr ynghylch ble y dylai casgliad mawr ystafell rhyfel y Zulu gael ei gynnal yn y dyfodol. Os hoffai'r Gweinidog ymweld â'r amgueddfa gyda mi i drafod sut y gallwn sicrhau ei dyfodol, byddwn yn falch iawn o'i groesawu i Aberhonddu.

**Y Gweinidog Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau (Carl Sargeant):** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i drafod cymuned y lluoedd arfog gyda'r Aelodau heddiw. Cefnogaf y cynnig i dalu teyrnged i aberth ac ymrwymiad aruthrol y rhai sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn y lluoedd arfog. Mae'n adeg o'r flwyddyn sy'n arbennig o ingol ar gyfer y ddadl hon, gyda gwasanaethau coffa yn cael eu cynnal ledled y wlad ddydd Sul.

Mae cofebion rhyfel yn rhan bwysig o goffáu, ac mae gwirfoddolwyr yn gwneud gwaith gwyb i sicrhau eu bod yn cael eu diogelu. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn darparu ar gyfer gwarchod cofebion rhyfel, ac mae cymorth ar gael hefyd drwy'r Ymddiriedolaeth Cofebion Rhyfel. Yn ogystal â thalu teyrnged i'n cyn-filwyr, mae angen inni ddangos ein cefnogaeth i gymuned gyfan y lluoedd arfog. Ym mis Mehefin, gwnaethom ddarparu cyllid ar gyfer dau ddigwyddiad Diwrnod y Lluoedd Arfog yn y gogledd a'r de, yr aeth y Prif Weinidog a minnau iddynt. Pwysaf ar awdurdodau lleol i gyflwyno cyfamodau cymunedol lleol, ac rwy'n falch o nodi bod 16 o'r 22 awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru naill ai wedi llofnodi neu ar fin cyflwyno cyfamodau cymunedol. Mae hynny'n golygu dros ddwy ran o dair o'r awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a dylem fod yn arbennig o falch o hynny.

Mae bron blwyddyn ers i Lywodraeth Cymru gyhoeddi pecyn o gymorth ar gyfer y lluoedd arfog. Yn wir, roeddwn eisoes wedi cyflwyno dadl ar gyfer 20 Tachwedd i adrodd yn ôl ar y cynnydd a wnaed dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Yn hytrach, manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i roi crynodeb o'r newyddion diweddaraf. Yn ystod mis Tachwedd, byddaf yn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad diweddarau blynyddol ar y pecyn

we will update the package to include new developments and further commitments. We have already delivered on many of the commitments, and I will come back to the more detailed health matters shortly. On the other issues, we have progressed on housing, including the extension of the homebuy scheme to cover widows and widowers of personnel killed in action. We have also made arrangements for the disabled facilities grants means-testing process to change. In 2012, we published guidance for local authorities on the allocation of accommodation for homeless people; this includes priority status for social housing for seriously injured and disabled servicemen and servicewomen, and references certificates of cessation as proof of independent homelessness.

We have consulted on the housing White Paper, and we will be working with veterans organisations on the implementation of the homeless prevention proposals that it contains. We have also progressed developments in education, including changes to the school administration policy to support families being posted here in Wales. Officials have established a standing committee on education services in Wales, and the committee will consider all of the issues that children and families face on educational matters in Wales. We are also working with key partners to develop a pilot scheme to provide free swimming to service personnel and veterans, and the results of the pilot will inform our plans.

As far as the issues regarding PTSD are concerned, I am rightly proud of this Government's record in treating PTSD. We have invested heavily in this area and established the all-Wales veterans health and wellbeing service with almost £0.5 million of funding annually. The service is led by an internationally renowned figure in the treatment of PTSD and provides dedicated veteran therapists in each of the local health board areas. I will give examples of waiting times in some of the services, which Members have raised with me today. As regards services at Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board—I recognise

cymorth, ac yn ystod 2013 byddwn yn diweddarau'r pecyn i gynnwys datblygiadau newydd ac ymrwymadau pellach. Rydym eisoes wedi cyflawni llawer o'r ymrwymadau, a byddaf yn dod yn ôl at y materion iechyd manylach maes o law. O ran y materion eraill, rydym wedi gweithredu o ran tai, gan gynnwys ymestyn y cynllun cymorth prynu i gynnwys gwagedd a gwŷr gweddw aelodau a fu farw ar faes y gad. Rydym hefyd wedi gwneud trefniadau i newid proses prawf modd y grant cyfleusterau i'r anabl. Yn 2012, cyhoeddwyd canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol ar ddyrannu llety i bobl ddiartref; mae hyn yn cynnwys statws blaenoriaeth ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol i filwyr a anafwyd yn ddifrifol a milwyr anabl, ac yn cyfeirio at dystysgrifau hawl wedi dod i ben fel prawf o ddiartrefedd annibynnol.

Rydym wedi ymgynghori ar y Papur Gwyn ar dai, a byddwn yn gweithio gyda sefydliadau cyn-filwyr ar weithredu'r cynigion atal diartrefedd sydd ynddo. Rydym wedi bwrw ymlaen â datblygiadau hefyd ym maes addysg, gan gynnwys newidiadau i bolisi gweinyddol ysgol i gefnogi teuluoedd sy'n cael eu hanfon i fyw yma yng Nghymru. Mae swyddogion wedi sefydlu pwyllgor sefydlog ar wasanaethau addysg yng Nghymru, a bydd y pwyllgor yn ystyried yr holl faterion y mae plant a theuluoedd yn eu hwynebu o ran materion addysgol yng Nghymru. Rydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda phartneriaid allweddol i ddatblygu cynllun peilot i ddarparu nofio am ddim i aelodau'r lluoedd arfog a chyn-filwyr, a bydd canlyniadau'r cynllun beilot yn sail i'n cynlluniau.

O ran y materion ynghylch anhwylder straen wedi trawma, rwy'n falch o record y Llywodraeth hon o drin anhwylder straen wedi trawma a hynny'n briodol. Rydym wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth yn y maes hwn ac wedi sefydlu gwasanaeth iechyd a lles i gyn-filwyr i Gymru gyfan gyda bron £0.5 miliwn o gyllid yn flynyddol. Mae'r gwasanaeth yn cael ei arwain gan ffigwr rhyngwladol enwog ym maes triniaeth anhwylder straen wedi trawma ac mae'n darparu therapyddion penodedig i gyn-filwyr ym mhob ardal bwrdd iechyd lleol. Byddaf yn rhoi enghreifftiau o amseroedd aros yn rhai o'r gwasanaethau, y mae Aelodau wedi'u codi gyda mi heddiw. O

the excellent work undertaken by the Member who is in the armed forces group within the Assembly and who is interested in this LHB, which is within his own region—individuals are assessed within seven days and they start therapy the following week if that is required. In Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, assessment takes place within two weeks and therapy starts within six months, if indicated as necessary. There are many access points across the health boards and that compares favourably to other facilities that are offered across the UK.

Almost 400 veterans were referred to the service between April 2010 and March 2012. It is important to recognise that the service only became fully operational across Wales in the last year. Even so, the service has already established good links with veteran charities that many Members have raised with me today, such as Combat Stress and other veteran agencies in Wales. The service has developed a common pathway to which the main veteran charities and agencies have signed up. This recognises the role of the third sector in providing support to veterans and establishing the services as the gatekeeper, central to the assessment and management of veterans with mental health problems.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** You talk about access to services and I do not doubt that there have been improvements and I welcome your acknowledgement that local government is signing up to the covenants. However, there is an issue, as identified by the all-Wales mental health service that it takes 119 days from referral to assessment and 151 days from assessment to treatment, whereas in England that figure is a 22-day wait. Do you recognise that that is an issue and that it is something that the Government needs to focus on when working with partners in the health service?

**Carl Sargeant:** Of course, as has been acknowledged by many within the Chamber today. I also acknowledge that there is ever-increasing demand on the service and

ran gwasanaethau ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr—rwy'n cydnabod y gwaith rhagorol a wnaed gan yr Aelod sydd yn y grŵp lluoedd arfog yn y Cynulliad ac sydd â diddordeb yn y Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol hwn, sydd yn ei ranbarth ef—asesir unigolion o fewn saith diwrnod ac maent yn dechrau therapi yr wythnos ganlynol os oes angen. Ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro, asesir o fewn pythefnos ac mae'r therapi yn dechrau o fewn chwe mis, os nodir bod angen hynny. Mae sawl pwynt mynediad ar draws y byrddau iechyd ac mae hynny'n cymharu'n ffafriol â chyfleusterau eraill a gynigir ledled y DU.

Atgyfeiriwyd bron i 400 o gyn-filwyr at y gwasanaeth rhwng Ebrill 2010 a Mawrth 2012. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod na ddaeth y gwasanaeth yn gwbl weithredol ledled Cymru tan y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Er hynny, mae'r gwasanaeth eisoes wedi creu cysylltiadau da ag elusennau cyn-filwyr y mae llawer o'r Aelodau wedi eu codi gyda mi heddiw, megis Combat Stress ac asiantaethau cyn-filwyr eraill yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwasanaeth wedi datblygu llwybr cyffredin y mae'r prif elusennau ac asiantaethau cyn-filwyr wedi ymrwymo iddo. Mae hyn yn cydnabod rôl y trydydd sector o ran darparu cymorth i gyn-filwyr a sefydlu'r gwasanaethau fel y porthgeidwad, yn ganolog i'r gwaith o asesu a rheoli cyn-filwyr sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Rydych yn sôn am fynediad at wasanaethau ac nid wyf yn amau na fu gwelliannau a chroesawaf eich cydnabyddiaeth bod llywodraeth leol yn ymrwymo i'r cyfamodau. Fodd bynnag, cyfyd problem, fel y nodwyd gan wasanaeth iechyd meddwl Cymru gyfan sef ei bod yn cymryd 119 diwrnod rhwng atgyfeirio ac asesu a 151 diwrnod rhwng asesu a thriniaeth, ond yn Lloegr 22 diwrnod y mae'n rhaid aros. A ydych yn cydnabod bod hynny'n broblem a'i fod yn rhywbeth y mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ganolbwytio arno wrth weithio gyda phartneriaid yn y gwasanaeth iechyd?

**Carl Sargeant:** Wrth gwrs, fel sydd wedi ei gydnabod gan lawer yn y Siambr heddiw. Rwyf hefyd yn cydnabod bod galwadau bythol-gynyddol ar y gwasanaeth ac

because of current and past conflicts, there will be higher demand. We have to make sure that there is a streamlined approach to access to services.

Part of the issue, which I know that Members have raised, is the recognition of former service personnel who may be suffering from PTSD, so that when they present through the voluntary sector or NHS services, they are recognised as veterans. The Member raised the all-Wales veterans card. In the last meeting of the ministerial advisory group on the armed forces, I asked for this to be taken forward because of the benefits of it. It may not be exactly what opposition members requested during their debate, but I have asked the group to consider the opportunities that it would give ex-service personnel in Wales to present without question and say, 'We are ex-service personnel and we should either be prioritised or get access to these services'. That is something that we will be presenting in the near future.

**Mohammad Asghar:** I am grateful for this debate on the armed forces. I come from an air force family and I know exactly how the armed forces live. The built-in connector for the armed forces, whether they are veterans or not, is pride, discipline, never surrender and never beg. These are some of the characteristics that are built into all armed forces personnel. When they come out of the armed forces, whether they are veterans or retired, how can your Government help them to bring them into the civic society in which we live?

**Carl Sargeant:** I have alluded to some of the issues that were taken through the ministerial advisory group with regard to the armed forces veterans card or the potential for that. One other element of this is the discharge process that takes place within the armed forces. I have already had conversations with Brigadier Napier from the Welsh army in Brecon and his colleagues across the Navy and armed forces regarding how this process will get better in supporting Welsh serving personnel and their families upon exiting the armed forces family.

4.15 p.m.

oherwydd rhyfeloedd ar hyn o bryd ac yn y gorffennol, bydd mwy o alwadau. Mae'n rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr bod dull symlach o gael mynediad at wasanaethau.

Rhan o'r broblem, a godwyd gan Aelodau mi wn, yw adnabod cyn-aelodau o'r lluoedd arfog a all fod yn dioddef anhwylder straen wedi trawma, fel y cânt eu hadnabod fel cyn-filwyr pan gyflwynant eu hunain i'r sector gwirfoddol neu wasanaethau'r GIG. Cododd yr Aelod gerdyn y cyn-filwyr i Gymru gyfan. Yng nghyfarfod diwethaf grŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog ar y lluoedd arfog, gofynnais i hyn gael ei ddatblygu oherwydd ei fanteision. Efallai na fydd yn union yr hyn y gofynnodd aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau amdano yn ystod eu dadl, ond rwyf wedi gofyn i'r grŵp ystyried y cyfleoedd y byddai'n eu rhoi i gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru gyflwyno eu hunain yn ddigwestiwn a dweud, 'Rydym yn gyn-filwyr a dylem naill ai gael ein blaenoriaethu neu gael mynediad at y gwasanaethau hyn'. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn ei gyflwyno yn y dyfodol agos.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y ddadl hon ar y lluoedd arfog. Rwy'n dod o deulu awyrlu ac yn gwybod yn union sut y mae'r lluoedd arfog yn byw. Y cysylltydd annatod ar gyfer y lluoedd arfog, boed yn gyn-filwyr ai peidio, yw balchder, disgyblaeth, byth yn ildio a byth yn cardota. Dyma rai o'r nodweddion sy'n perthyn i bobl yn y lluoedd arfog. Pan fyddant yn gadael y lluoedd arfog, p'un a ydynt yn gyn-filwyr neu wedi ymddeol, sut y gall eich Llywodraeth helpu i'w cyflwyno i'r gymdeithas ddinesig yr ydym yn byw ynddi?

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf wedi cyfeirio at rai o'r materion a drafodwyd yng ngrŵp cynghori'r Gweinidog o ran cerdyn y lluoedd arfog i gyn-filwyr neu'r potensial ar gyfer hynny. Un elfen arall o hyn yw'r broses ryddhau sy'n digwydd o fewn y lluoedd arfog. Rwyf eisoes wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r Brigadydd Napier o fyddin Cymru yn Aberhonddu a'i gydweithwyr yn y Llynges a'r lluoedd arfog ynghylch sut y bydd y broses hon yn gwella o ran cefnogi aelodau sy'n gwasanaethu Cymru a'u teuluoedd pan fyddant yn gadael teulu'r lluoedd arfog.



Going back to the issue around the third sector, it is important that we ensure that the charities that are delivering services for personnel deliver the right service. While they all, I am sure, have good intentions and seek to deliver services for the right reasons, we often see many charities that work outside the NICE guidance and guidelines on service delivery, and we have to be very cautious about ensuring that the service delivered is the right service for the person who is requesting it and is based around the evidence.

On the third proposal in the HIW report, the report paints a broadly positive picture of healthcare provision for the community, although there are things that we could do better, and I acknowledge that. As I said earlier in relation to the demand for services, we must make sure that, wherever we are placed now, we get better in the future in delivering these services. Officials met earlier in the week—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I have been generous, Minister. Conclude now.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am very grateful, Deputy Presiding Officer. I will not be long; I will be as quick as I can. Officials met earlier this week with the NHS armed forces champions to discuss the implementation of the recommendations, and that work is ongoing.

I thank Members for their constructive contributions today. We as the Welsh Government will of course continue to support the armed forces and their families here in Wales.

**Darren Millar:** I will not have time to refer to everybody's contributions in the four minutes that I have to wrap up this debate, but I want to thank everybody for taking part in what has been a very good debate, with lots of cross-party agreement on the deficiencies in the current provision for our armed forces in Wales, as well as on how we need to move forward to tackle that. It is

Gan fynd yn ôl at y mater sy'n ymwneud â'r trydydd sector, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau bod yr elusennau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau ar gyfer aelodau yn darparu'r gwasanaeth iawn. Er eu bod i gyd, mae'n siŵr gennyf, yn llawn bwriadau da ac yn ceisio darparu gwasanaethau am y rhesymau cywir, gwelwn lawer o elusennau yn aml sy'n gweithio y tu allan i arweiniad a chanllawiau NICE ar ddarparu gwasanaethau, a rhaid i nni fod yn ofalus iawn ynghylch sicrhau mai'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir yw'r gwasanaeth cywir i'r person sy'n gofyn amdano a'i fod yn seiliedig ar y dystiolaeth.

O ran y trydydd cynnig yn adroddiad AGIC, mae'r adroddiad yn rhoi darlun cadarnhaol ar y cyfan o'r ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd ar gyfer y gymuned, er bod pethau y gallem eu gwneud yn well, ac rwy'n cydnabod hynny. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach mewn perthynas â'r galw am wasanaethau, rhaid inni sicrhau, beth bynnag yw ein sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, ein bod yn gwella yn y dyfodol o ran darparu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Cyfarfu swyddogion yn gynharach yn yr wythnos—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rwyf wedi bod yn hael, Weinidog. Rhaid ichi ddod i ben yn awr.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Ni fyddaf yn hir; byddaf mor gyflym â phosibl. Cyfarfu swyddogion yn gynharach yr wythnos hon â hyrwyddwyr lluoedd arfog y GIG i drafod y gwaith o weithredu'r argymhellion, ac mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo.

Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau adeiladol heddiw. Byddwn ni, fel Llywodraeth Cymru wrth gwrs, yn parhau i gefnogi'r lluoedd arfog a'u teuluoedd yma yng Nghymru.

**Darren Millar:** Ni fydd gennyf amser i gyfeirio at gyfraniadau pawb yn y pedwar munud sydd gennyf i ddod â'r dadl hon i ben, ond rwyf am ddiolch i bawb am gymryd rhan mewn dadl a fu'n un dda iawn, gyda llawer o gytundeb trawsbleidiol ar y diffygion yn y ddarpariaeth bresennol ar gyfer ein lluoedd arfog yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â sut y mae angen inni ddatblygu i

appropriate that we have this debate, and we will continue to table such debates annually, if the Government does not, so that we can keep an eye on progress and ensure that we continue to move in the right direction.

I welcome the Minister's response. I believe that he has a genuine interest in improving the lot of the armed forces in Wales, and I am delighted that he is moving things forward in terms of the responsibility of public services in Wales to make sure that that covenant that we all have with our armed forces family is honoured at every level of government. I pay particular tribute to him for doing something that not many Labour Ministers do, and that is accepting that we in the Welsh Conservatives had a good idea in the armed forces card. It is something that we brought to the table that we felt would make a real difference in identifying veterans, whether in a GP practice, at a local authority desk when presenting a housing request, or wherever the veteran might be, to flag up that this person is a veteran and deserves the appropriate treatment. I am grateful for that, Minister, and I look forward to engaging in further discussions with you about how that might be taken forward in Wales.

However, that does not mean that we can rest on our laurels. There is still a great deal more to do. Lots of people have made reference to mental health services for veterans with PTSD and we on this side of the Chamber absolutely welcome the establishment of the all-Wales mental health service for veterans across the country. However, we were very disappointed at the pace at which it has been established. The commitment was given about three years ago and yet it is only just getting off the ground in north Wales. That is why the waiting times are very short—because nobody knows it exists. We have to ensure that we do everything we can to promote awareness of that among veterans and their family members, so that people can be referred when appropriate.

Reference has also been made to the need for

fynd i'r afael â hwy. Mae'n briodol ein bod yn cael y ddadl hon, a byddwn yn parhau i gyflwyno dadleuon o'r fath yn flynyddol, os nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud hynny, fel y gallwn gadw llygad ar gynnydd a sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Croesawaf ymateb y Gweinidog. Credaf fod ganddo ddiddordeb gwirioneddol mewn gwella ansawdd bywyd y lluoedd arfog yng Nghymru, ac rwyf wrth fy modd ei fod yn datblygu pethau o ran cyfrifoldeb gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru i wneud yn siŵr bod y cyfamod sydd gan bob un ohonom â theulu'r lluoedd arfog yn cael ei gadw ar bob lefel mewn llywodraeth. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged arbennig iddo am wneud rhywbeth nad yw llawer o Weinidogion Llafur yn ei wneud, sef derbyn bod y syniad a gawsom yn y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig o gerdyn y lluoedd arfog yn un da. Mae'n rhywbeth a gyflwynwyd gennym a fyddai'n gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yn ein barn ni o ran nodi cyn-filwyr, boed mewn practis meddyg teulu, wrth ddesg awdurdod lleol wrth gyflwyno cais am dŷ, neu ble bynnag y gallai cyn-filwr fod, i dynnu sylw at y ffaith mai cyn-filwr yw'r unigolyn hwn a'i fod yn haeddu'r driniaeth briodol. Rwy'n ddiolchgar am hynny, Weinidog, ac edrychaf ymlaen at drafodaethau pellach â chi i weld sut y gellid datblygu hyn yng Nghymru.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu y gallwn laesu dwylo. Mae llawer iawn mwy i'w wneud. Mae llawer o bobl wedi cyfeirio at wasanaethau iechyd meddwl i gyn-filwyr ag anhwylder straen wedi trawma ac rydym ni ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr yn croesawu'r gwaith o sefydlu gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl Cymru gyfan i gyn-filwyr ledled y wlad. Fodd bynnag, roeddem yn siomedig pa mor araf y sefydlwyd hyn. Rhoddwyd yr ymrwymiad tua thair blynedd yn ôl ac eto newydd ddechrau y mae yn y gogledd. Dyna pam y mae'r amseroedd aros yn fyr iawn—am nad oes neb yn gwybod ei fod yn bodoli. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth o hynny ymhlith cyn-filwyr ac aelodau o'u teulu, fel y gall pobl gael eu hatgyfeirio pan fo hynny'n briodol.

Cyfeiriwyd hefyd at yr angen am ganolfan

a residential centre, and I know that the Welsh Government will be pondering upon that.

**Carl Sargeant:** I ran out of time, so I could not deal with all the detail of the report. In terms of a residential care centre, there is some work going on with my ministerial advisory group, the third sector and the Welsh Government to look at the provision in Wales and whether there should be further provision. There will be an update for Members in the Chamber.

**Darren Millar:** I am grateful for that, because John Skipper's report, which was absolutely excellent in pulling together all of the issues, recognised that there was merit in the idea of developing a residential centre. I believe that there are partners out there who are prepared to put their hands in their pockets—organisations such as Help for Heroes and Alabaré, a Christian charity that wants to establish support centres around Wales. They have acknowledged that they are prepared to work with the Welsh Government to achieve these things. Let us not forget that Wales makes a larger contribution to the armed forces than the UK on average in terms of its population. Therefore, it is only appropriate that we should have one of these facilities in Wales so that we can give the best possible services to those people who suffer from these problems.

In the time that I have left, I will refer briefly to war memorials and the need to commemorate the hundredth anniversary of the Great War. It is important to remember that this is a commemoration of the event, not a celebration of it. No-one wants to celebrate war in any way, but it is important that we remind ourselves of the events that took place 100 years ago next year and that we ensure that they can never happen again. I encourage the Government to move more swiftly to establish a national commemoration of the Great War in our schools and in our communities across Wales so that we can learn from that experience. Time does not permit me to go on, but I thank everyone for their contribution and the Minister for his generous response.

breswyl, a gwn y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn myfyrio ar hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** Daeth fy amser i ben, felly ni allwn ddelio â holl fanylion yr adroddiad. O ran canolfan gofal preswyl, mae rhywfaint o waith yn cael ei wneud gyda fy ngrŵp cynghori, y trydydd sector a Llywodraeth Cymru i edrych ar y ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru ac a ddylid sicrhau darpariaeth bellach. Bydd diweddariad i'r Aelodau yn y Siambr.

**Darren Millar:** Rwy'n ddiolchgar am hynny, oherwydd cydnabu adroddiad John Skipper, a oedd yn wych o ran tynnu ynghyd yr holl faterion, fod y syniad o ddatblygu canolfan breswyl yn werth ei ystyried. Credaf fod partneriaid ar gael sy'n barod i roi eu dwylo yn eu pocedi—sefydliadau megis Help for Heroes ac Alabaré, elusen Gristnogol sydd am sefydlu canolfannau cymorth ledled Cymru. Maent wedi cydnabod eu bod yn barod i weithio gyda Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflawni'r pethau hyn. Gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio bod Cymru yn gwneud cyfraniad mwy i'r lluoedd arfog na'r DU ar gyfartaledd o ran ei phoblogaeth. Felly, mae ond yn briodol bod un o'r cyfleusterau hyn yng Nghymru fel y gallwn roi'r gwasanaethau gorau posibl i'r bobl hynny sy'n dioddef o'r problemau hyn.

Yn yr amser sydd gennyf ar ôl, cyfeiriai yn fras at gofebion rhyfel a'r angen i goffáu canmlwyddiant y Rhyfel Mawr. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod hwn yn achlysur sy'n coffáu'r digwyddiad, ac nid yw'n ddatliad ohono. Nid oes neb am ddatliu rhyfel mewn unrhyw ffordd, ond mae'n bwysig ein bod yn atgoffa ein hunain o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd 100 mlynedd yn ôl y flwyddyn nesaf a'n bod yn sicrhau na all byth ddigwydd eto. Anogaf y Llywodraeth i symud yn gyflym i sefydlu coffadwriaeth genedlaethol o'r Rhyfel Mawr yn ein hysgolion ac yn ein cymunedau ledled Cymru fel y gallwn ddysgu o'r profiad hwnnw. Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi fynd ymlaen, ond hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am eu cyfraniad ac i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb hael.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection, therefore I defer voting on this item until voting time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw y dylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad, felly gohiriaf y pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

## **Dadl Plaid Cymru Plaid Cymru Debate**

### **Gwella Ysgolion School Improvement**

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 3, 6, 7 a 8 yn enw Aled Roberts, gwelliannau 2 a 4 yn enw Jane Hutt, a gwelliannau 5, 9 a 10 yn enw William Graham.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 3, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Aled Roberts, amendments 2 and 4 in the name of Jane Hutt, and amendments 5, 9 and 10 in the name of William Graham.

*Cynnig NDM5086 Jocelyn Davies*

*Motion NDM5086 Jocelyn Davies*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn nodi bod:*

*1. Notes that:*

*a) Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dynodi mai partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol yw'r ateb ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â'r methiant systematig ym myd addysg;*

*a) regional school improvement partnerships have been identified by the Welsh Government as the answer to address the systemic failure in education;*

*b) y cynllun bandio ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd wedi dynodi bod angen gwella ysgolion ym Mandiau 4 a 5 ar fyrder;*

*b) the banding scheme for secondary schools has identified schools in Bands 4 and 5 as in need of urgent improvement;*

*2. Yn gresynu nad oedd yr holl bartneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol ar waith erbyn mis Medi 2012 fel yr addawyd; a*

*2. Regrets that all the regional school improvement partnerships were not operational by September 2012 as promised; and*

*3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod:*

*3. Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that:*

*a) y consortia addysg rhanbarthol ar waith yn llawn cyn gynted â phosibl; a*

*a) the regional education consortia are fully operational as soon as possible; and*

*b) bod yr ysgolion a roddwyd yn y bandiau is yn cael y cymorth angenrheidiol ar unwaith i fynd i'r afael â methiant systematig.*

*b) the schools placed in lower bands are immediately provided with the necessary support to address systemic failure.*

**Simon Thomas:** I move the motion.

**Simon Thomas:** Cynigiaf y cynnig.

I am grateful for the opportunity to move this motion and to open the debate on the role of regional education consortia in helping our underperforming schools in Wales. The purpose of this debate is to focus on one aspect of the Government's programme of actions—the 20-point action plan that the Minister for Education and Skills set out—which is designed to close the attainment gap with regard to deprivation and poverty and address poor attainment generally in Welsh schools and also to deal with what the Minister himself has described as a systemic failure in the Welsh education system.

It was not Plaid Cymru, or indeed any other party here, that chose regional consortia as the answer to that systemic failure, but the Minister himself. I particularly want to draw the Chamber's attention to a response that the Minister gave to a written question on 28 May this year. He clearly said that he had had assurances from the 22 local education leaders that education was their No. 1 priority, that a radical overhaul was needed to address the systemic failure in education, and that the evidence all points to regional partnership working as the answer. That is the reason for bringing forward this debate today, and that is why we cannot support the Government's amendments, which muddy the waters around the answer. If the Government, in response to a written question and in a statement, states that regional working is the answer to systemic failure, then we should hold the Government to account on its belief in that regard.

Our purpose today is to put on record our belief that regional education consortia need to be up and running as soon as possible to help schools improve literacy and numeracy and to cut the gap in attainment relating to poverty. We do that today not in order to seek to blame local authorities or even to blame the Government, but simply to draw attention to and to express our regret about the fact that the system is not yet up and running fully, and to draw the Government's attention to the need to take action as soon as possible. The evidence that we are gathering on the ground suggests that the various consortia are either not formally constituted—that is

Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gynnig y cynnig hwn ac i agor y ddadl ar rôl consortia addysg rhanbarthol i helpu ein hysgolion sy'n tanberfformio yng Nghymru. Diben y ddadl hon yw canolbwyntio ar un agwedd ar raglen weithredu'r Llywodraeth—y cynllun gweithredu 20 pwynt a amlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau—sydd â'r nod o gau'r bwlch o ran cyrhaeddiad sy'n gysylltiedig ag amddifadedd a thlodi a mynd i'r afael â chyrhaeddiad gwael yn gyffredinol yn ysgolion Cymru a hefyd i ymdrin â'r hyn sydd, yng ngeiriau'r Gweinidog ei hun, yn fethiant systemtig yng nghyfundrefn addysg Cymru.

Nid Plaid Cymru, nac yn wir unrhyw blaid arall yma, a ddewisodd gonsortia rhanbarthol fel yr ateb i'r methiant systematig hwnnw, ond y Gweinidog ei hun. Rwy'n awyddus iawn i dynnu sylw'r Siambr at ymateb a roddodd y Gweinidog i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig ar 28 Mai eleni. Dywedodd yn glir ei fod wedi cael sicrwydd gan y 22 o arweinwyr addysg lleol mai addysg oedd eu prif flaenoriaeth, bod angen newid radical i fynd i'r afael â'r methiant systematig mewn addysg, a bod y dystiolaeth i gyd yn awgrymu mai gweithio mewn partneriaeth ranbarthol oedd yr ateb. Dyna'r rheswm dros gyflwyno'r ddadl hon heddiw, a dyna pam na allwn gefnogi gwelliannau'r Llywodraeth, sy'n peri dryswch ynghylch yr ateb. Os yw'r Llywodraeth, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig ac mewn datganiad, yn datgan mai gweithio rhanbarthol yw'r ateb i fethiant systematig, yna dylem ddwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif am ei chred yn hynny o beth.

Ein pwrpas heddiw yw datgan ar goedd ein cred bod angen i gonsortia addysg rhanbarthol fod yn weithredol cyn gynted ag y bo modd er mwyn helpu ysgolion i wella llythrennedd a rhifedd a chau'r bwlch mewn cyrhaeddiad sy'n gysylltiedig â thlodi. Gwnawn hynny heddiw nid er mwyn ceisio rhoi bai ar yr awdurdodau lleol na hyd yn oed ar y Llywodraeth, ond er mwyn tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad yw'r system yn gwbl weithredol eto a gresynu at hynny, a thynnu sylw'r Llywodraeth at yr angen i gymryd camau cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Mae'r dystiolaeth yr ydym yn ei chasglu ar lawr gwlad yn awgrymu nad yw'r gwahanol gonsortia

certainly true in one case—or not fully functioning as yet. The evidence also suggests that the consortia have been struggling to get their work done and to set up in the timetable set by the Government, particularly in relation to some of the changes that have happened along the way, for example asking the consortia and school performance consortia to look at schools in bands 2 and 3, as well as the so-called failing schools in bands 4 and 5.

For us in the Chamber, a few weeks here or three or six months there perhaps do not make a great deal of difference, but, to a pupil, six months of failing to get the right support in school is the difference between succeeding or failing at the different key stages. That is why we want to see a focus on immediate action today. It is all well and good to say that these things are bureaucratic and take time to set up, but this has been described by the Government itself as the answer to poor attainment. Every week that goes past means that we are failing pupils in some of our worst performing schools, and we need to address that.

The Minister in the now well-known speech that he made about 18 months ago, when he set out his 20-point action plan, said that he not only expected local authorities to participate in consortia arrangements but that they would suffer financial penalties, including the withdrawal of better schools funding, if they did not do that. Therefore, one purpose of the debate today is to drill down to see whether the Minister still intends to use those financial penalties, given the current situation, and, in particular, to see how the Minister intends to deliver improvement in the poorer performing schools, if, in effect, he is cutting off their nose to spite their face. I hope that he will say something about his intentions in that regard.

We also know that the Minister said very clearly that, by this September, as well as the consortia being in place, he wanted to see that schools had 80% of local education funding delegated to them. That was also supposed to happen by this September.

wedi'u sefydlu'n ffurfiol—mae hynny'n sicr yn wir yn un achos—neu nad ydynt yn gwbl weithredol eto. Awgryma'r dystiolaeth hefyd fod y consortia wedi cael anhawster i gwblhau eu gwaith ac ymsefydlu yn unol â'r amserlen a osodwyd gan y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig o ran rhai o'r newidiadau sydd wedi digwydd ar hyd y ffordd, er enghraifft, gofyn i'r consortia a'r consortia perfformiad ysgol edrych ar ysgolion ym mandiau 2 a 3, yn ogystal â'r ysgolion sy'n methu, fel y'u gelwir, ym mandiau 4 a 5.

I ni yn y Siambr, nid yw oedi o ychydig wythnosau fan hyn neu dri i chwe mis fan draw yn gwneud rhyw lawer o wahaniaeth, ond, i ddisgybl, chwe mis o fethu â chael y cymorth cywir yn yr ysgol yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng llwyddo neu fethu yn y gwahanol gyfnodau allweddol. Dyna pam yr ydym am weld ffocws ar weithredu ar unwaith heddiw. Mae'n ddigon hawdd dweud bod y pethau hyn yn fiwrocraidd ac yn cymryd amser i'w sefydlu, ond mae hyn wedi cael ei ddisgrifio gan y Llywodraeth ei hun fel yr ateb i gyrraeddian gwael. Mae pob wythnos sy'n mynd heibio yn golygu ein bod yn siomi disgyblion mewn rhai o'n hysgolion sy'n perfformio waethaf, ac mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hynny.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei araith adnabyddus erbyn hyn tua 18 mis yn ôl, pan amlinellodd ei gynllun gweithredu 20 pwynt, ei fod nid yn unig yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol gymryd rhan mewn trefniadau consortia, ond y byddent yn cael eu cosbi'n ariannol, gan gynnwys tynnu'n ôl arian ysgolion gwell, os nad oeddent yn gwneud hynny. Felly, un diben i'r ddadl heddiw yw darganfod a yw'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu defnyddio'r cosbau ariannol hynny o hyd, o ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol, ac, yn benodol, gweld sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu sicrhau gwelliant yn yr ysgolion sy'n perfformio waethaf, os yw, mewn gwirionedd, yn torri eu trwyn i sbeitio eu hwyneb. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn dweud rhywbeth am ei fwriadau yn hynny o beth.

Gwyddom hefyd i'r Gweinidog ddweud yn glir iawn, erbyn y mis Medi hwn, yn ogystal â sefydlu'r consortia, ei fod am weld bod 80% o gyllid addysg lleol yn cael ei ddirprwyo i'r ysgolion. Dylai hynny hefyd fod wedi digwydd erbyn y mis Medi hwn.

Therefore, this debate is also an opportunity to ask the Minister as to whether he is satisfied that that has been achieved, because, to be frank, we do not have evidence one way or the other.

The Government has made it very clear that schools in bands 4 and 5 will receive an extra £10,000. That is about £16.58 for each child. It is a small sum of money, but I am sure that the schools will not reject it. However, once again, this was linked to a clear action plan with improvement targets, linked into the local consortia. If the consortia are not yet fully functioning, how can we see clear action plans for improving schools in bands 4 and 5, and has that money been released to those schools, despite the consortia not necessarily being fully in place? I hope that the Minister will be able to say something about that.

That links to the pupil deprivation grant, and we will be able to support at least one of the amendments from the Liberal Democrats, although we will be leaving the one about budget negotiations to them and the Labour Party to sort out.

There is no doubt that the setting up of the consortia has been somewhat fraught with difficulty. We were promised that it would happen by September on several occasions by the Minister. However, some Members will know that the *Times Educational Supplement* on 26 October pointed out that the consortia had been having difficulty in appointing systems leaders, a leadership programme that has been identified by the Minister himself as being essential for driving school improvement in Wales. One official involved, Bryan Jeffreys, the interim director of the Central South Consortium Joint Education Service, said that the consortium advertised, but did not get enough suitable candidates and so had to re-advertise. In response, Anna Brychan, of the National Association of Headteachers, said:

‘There is a fair measure of agreement that this is the model we need, but we are worried

Felly, mae'r ddadl hon hefyd yn gyfle i ofyn i'r Gweinidog a yw'n fodlon bod hynny wedi cael ei gyflawni, oherwydd, a siarad yn blaen, nid oes gennym dystiolaeth y naill ffordd na'r llall.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i gwneud yn glir iawn y bydd ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5 yn cael £10,000 ychwanegol, sef tua £16.58 fesul plentyn. Mae'n swm bach o arian, ond rwy'n siŵr na fydd yr ysgolion yn ei wrthod. Fodd bynnag, unwaith eto, mae hyn yn gysylltiedig â chynllun gweithredu clir gyda thargedau gwella, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r consortia lleol. Os nad yw'r consortia yn gwbl weithredol eto, sut y gallwn weld cynlluniau gweithredu clir ar gyfer gwella ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5, ac a yw'r arian hwnnw wedi cael ei ryddhau i'r ysgolion hynny, er nad yw'r consortia o reidrwydd ar waith yn llawn? Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu dweud rhywbeth am hynny.

Mae hynny'n cysylltu â'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion, a byddwn yn gallu cefnogi o leiaf un o'r gwelliannau gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, er y byddwn yn gadael yr un am drafodaethau cyllidebol iddynt hwy ac i'r Blaid Lafur i'w datrys.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r broses o sefydlu'r consortia wedi bod braidd yn anodd. Cawsom addewid y byddai'n digwydd erbyn mis Medi ar sawl achlysur gan y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhai Aelodau yn gwybod i'r *Times Educational Supplement* nodi ar 26 Hydref bod y consortia wedi bod yn cael anhawster i benodi arweinwyr systemau, rhaglen arweinyddiaeth sydd wedi cael ei nodi gan y Gweinidog ei hun fel rhywbeth hanfodol i hyrwyddo gwelliant mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Dywedodd un swyddog sydd ynghlwm wrth y broses, Bryan Jeffreys, cyfarwyddwr dros dro Consortiwm Canolbarth y De Gwasanaeth Addysg ar y Cyd, fod y consortiwm wedi hysbysebu, ond nad oedd wedi cael digon o ymgeiswyr addas, ac felly bod yn rhaid iddo ailhysbysebu. Mewn ymateb, dywedodd Anna Brychan, o Gymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon:

Mae cryn gytundeb mai dyma'r model sydd ei angen arnom, ond rydym yn poeni am faint

about the amount of time it seems to be taking to get there.'

I suppose that the point of the debate today is to try to get the Minister to realise that it is a matter of urgency not to let the consortia become another level of bureaucracy and organisation that we have to go through, and not to lose focus on the need to drive improvements in literacy and numeracy and to close the poverty gap. If the consortia are not up and working, there are things that the Government can do now, including delivering those sums of money directly to schools, which I hope that he will consider.

The whole programme is linked to a series of banding issues that Plaid Cymru, certainly, does not agree with, and I think that some of my colleagues may say a little more about that. However, we agree with the Government in its central purpose, in that we need to see school improvement policies for the whole of education for children in Wales and that social deprivation is the main obstacle to that. We have seen the poverty gap grow in Wales. It was 32% in 2007 and 35% in 2010. We all agree that we need to bear down and be more closely focused on this.

One of my concerns is that we have perhaps lost sight of families and family support in addressing the poverty gap and the attainment gap in schools. Looking at reports such as Save the Children's 'Communities, Families and Schools Together' and Estyn's 'Tackling poverty and disadvantage in schools: working with the community and other services', we see support for the model of regional consortia, but also clear evidence that working with parents and helping parents to work with children, giving parents the skills they might not have had from their own education in order to improve children's literacy and numeracy, makes a significant difference. For example, the Save the Children's Families and Schools Together programme has reported a 10% improvement in children's reading, writing and maths after completing that programme. That is a programme that has been piloted in some parts of Wales.

o amser y mae'n ei gymryd i gyrraedd yno yn ôl pob golwg.'

Mae'n debyg mai diben y ddadl heddiw yw ceisio cael y Gweinidog i sylweddoli ei fod yn fater o frys inni beidio â gadael i'r consortia ddod yn lefel arall o fiwrocratiaeth a threfniadaeth y mae'n rhaid inni ymdopi â hi, a pheidio â cholli golwg ar yr angen i hyrwyddo gwelliannau mewn llythrennedd a rhifedd a chau'r bwloch tlodi. Os nad yw'r consortia yn weithredol, mae pethau y gall y Llywodraeth ei wneud yn awr, gan gynnwys rhoi'r symiau hynny o arian yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, y gobeithiaf y bydd yn ystyried ei wneud.

Mae'r rhaglen gyfan yn gysylltiedig â chyfres o faterion bandio nad yw Plaid Cymru, yn sicr, yn cytuno â hwy, a chredaf y bydd rhai o'm cyd-Aelodau yn dweud ychydig mwy am hynny. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn cytuno â'r Llywodraeth o ran ei diben canolog, yn yr ystyr bod angen inni weld polisïau gwella ysgolion ar gyfer addysg gyfan plant yng Nghymru ac mai amddifadedd cymdeithasol yw'r prif rwystr i hynny. Rydym wedi gweld y bwloch tlodi yn tyfu yng Nghymru. Cafwyd bwloch o 32% yn 2007 a 35% yn 2010. Rydym i gyd yn cytuno bod angen inni ganolbwyntio'n fanylach ar hyn.

Un o'm pryderon yw ein bod o bosibl wedi colli golwg ar deuluoedd a chymorth teuluol wrth fynd i'r afael â'r bwloch tlodi a'r bwloch o ran cyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion. Gan edrych ar adroddiadau fel 'Communities, Families and Schools Together' gan Achub y Plant a 'Mynd i'r afael ag anfantais mewn ysgolion: cydweithio â'r gymuned a gwasanaethau eraill' gan Estyn, gwelwn gefnogaeth i fodel y consortia rhanbarthol, ond tystiolaeth glir hefyd bod gweithio gyda rhieni a helpu rhieni i weithio gyda phlant, gan ddysgu'r sgiliau i rieni na fyddent wedi'u dysgu o bosibl yn eu haddysg eu hunain er mwyn gwella llythrennedd a rhifedd plant, yn gwneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol. Er enghraifft, mae rhaglen Teuluoedd ac Ysgolion Gyda'i Gilydd Achub y Plant wedi nodi gwelliant o 10% yn sgiliau darllen, ysgrifennu a mathemateg plant ar ôl cwblhau'r rhaglen honno. Mae honno'n rhaglen sydd wedi cael ei threalu mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru.



Therefore, although we accept the principle of regional consortia, we think that a focus has been lost on the need to work more closely and directly with families through family support and with some third sector organisations as well. In other words, there is a danger that the consortia themselves will become the objective, and the objective must be to deliver improvements in standards of numeracy and literacy in all schools in Wales, but certainly focusing and starting in those schools that are not delivering.

That is the purpose of the debate today. We thought, hopefully not in any sort of adversarial way, that in bringing forward a focus on this and in examining one aspect of the Government's policy and showing how that was not yet working fully and properly, we might be able to ensure that the Government was delivering the support mechanisms needed directly to schools, if necessary. The consortia themselves show a way forward for partnership working, and there is no doubt that partnership working improves school outcomes. However, if it has become about the bureaucracy, there is no doubt that it can also become a hindrance in itself.

4.30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1—Aled Roberts*

*Cynnwys pwynt 1 newydd ac ail-rifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Yn nodi'r gwaith pwysig y mae penaethiaid, athrawon a llywodraethwyr yn ei wneud o ddydd i ddydd i sicrhau'r addysg orau bosibl i'n plant.*

*Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts*

*Ym mhwynt 1b, dileu popeth ar ôl 'ysgolion uwchradd,' a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:*

*yn ddiffygiol iawn, ac nad oes gan athrawon, rhieni na disgyblion hyder ynddo.*

*Gwelliant 6—Aled Roberts*

*Ym mhwynt 3a, dileu popeth ar ôl 'rhanbarthol,' a rhoi'r canlynol yn ei le:*

Felly, er ein bod yn derbyn egwyddor consortia rhanbarthol, credwn fod ffocws wedi cael ei golli ar yr angen i weithio'n agosach ac yn fwy uniongyrchol gyda theuluoedd drwy gymorth teuluol a chyda rhai sefydliadau yn y trydydd sector hefyd. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae perygl mai sefydlu'r consortia eu hunain fydd y nod yn y pen draw, a rhaid sicrhau mai gwella safonau rhifedd a llythrennedd ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru yw'r nod, ond yn sicr canolbwyntio a dechrau yn yr ysgolion hynny nad ydynt yn cyflawni.

Dyna ddiben y ddadl heddiw. Roeddem yn meddwl wrth dynnu sylw at hyn, nid mewn unrhyw ffordd wrthwynebus gobeithio, ac ystyried un agwedd ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth a dangos ym mha ffordd nad oedd yn gwbl weithredol eto, y gallem o bosibl sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn cyflwyno'r systemau cymorth sydd eu hangen yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion, os oes angen. Mae'r consortia eu hunain yn dangos ffordd ymlaen ar gyfer gweithio mewn partneriaeth, ac nid oes amheuaeth nad yw gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn gwella deilliannau ysgol. Fodd bynnag, os yw wedi dod yn rhywbeth biwrocataidd, nid oes amheuaeth na all hefyd fod yn rhwystr ynddo'i hun.

*Amendment 1—Aled Roberts*

*Insert as new point 1 and renumber accordingly:*

*Notes the important work that head teachers, teachers and governors carry out on a day to day basis to secure the best possible education for our children.*

*Amendment 3—Aled Roberts*

*In point 1b delete all after 'secondary schools' and replace with:*

*is seriously flawed and does not enjoy the confidence of teachers, parents or pupils.*

*Amendment 6—Aled Roberts*

*In point 3a delete all after 'are' and replace with:*

*yn cynnwys ymgeiswyr o'r safon uchaf bosibl ac yn gwbl weithredol cyn gynted â phosibl ac, os nad yw hyn yn bosibl yn y chwe mis nesaf, bod rôl y consortia addysg rhanbarthol yn nyfodol system addysg Cymru yn cael ei hadolygu.*

*Gwelliant 7—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn nodi sut y gallai gweithredu'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn llwyddiannus gael effaith fuddiol ar gyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion.*

*Gwelliant 8—Aled Roberts*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gydag ysgolion, athrawon a phartneriaethau gwella ysgolion i sicrhau bod y Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn cael ei ddefnyddio yn y modd gorau posibl, er mwyn sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn gallu cyflawni ei botensial.*

**Aled Roberts:** Cynigiau gwelliannau 1, 3, 6, 7 ac 8 yn fy enw i ac ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.

Diolch i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn i'r Siambr y prynhawn yma. Credaf ei bod yn adlewyrchu'r pryder sydd o ran y cynnydd. Yr ydym i gyd, fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas, yn cefnogi ymdrechion y Llywodraeth i wella safonau, ond credaf fod pryder ein bod yn syrthio y tu ôl o ran yr amserlen a bennwyd gan y Gweinidog.

Er ein bod yn cytuno bod yn rhaid inni wella safonau, mae hefyd yn ddyletswydd arnom fel Aelodau Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn gweithredu yn ôl y rhaglen benodol y mae wedi'i dewis i godi'r safonau hynny. Rydym wedi clywed ar sawl achlysur yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgorau am y bwch gweithredu o ran gwaith y Llywodraeth. Mae gwir oedi o ran gweithredu ar ran y consortia. Fel y dywedodd Simon Thomas, credaf mai'r bwriad gwreiddiol oedd y byddai'r consortia

*populated with the highest possible quality of candidate and fully operational as soon as possible, and if this is not possible in the next six months, to review the role of regional education consortia in the future of the Welsh education system.*

*Amendment 7—Aled Roberts*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Notes the beneficial impact that the successful implementation of the Pupil Deprivation Grant could have on attainment in schools.*

*Amendment 8—Aled Roberts*

*Add as a new point at the end of motion:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to work with schools, teachers and school improvement partnerships to ensure the optimum use of the Pupil Deprivation Grant to ensure that every child can achieve their potential.*

**Aled Roberts:** I move amendments 1, 3, 6, 7 and 8 in my name and on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats.

I thank Plaid Cymru for tabling this motion for debate in the Chamber this afternoon. I believe that it is a reflection of the concern that exists about the way forward. As Simon Thomas said, we all support the Government's efforts to raise standards, but there is a concern that we are falling behind on the schedule set by the Minister.

While we agree that we need to raise standards, it is also incumbent upon us as Assembly Members to ensure that the Government operates according to the specific programme that it has chosen as the vehicle to raise those standards. We have heard on several occasions in the Chamber and in committees about the implementation gap on the part of the Government. There has been genuine delay in taking action on the consortia. As Simon Thomas said, I think that

yn weithredol erbyn mis Medi 2011; rwyf wedi gweld cynlluniau gan y consortia, a dderbyniwyd gan y Llywodraeth, sy'n dangos eu bod yn credu y bydd llawer iawn o'u hymdrechion yn weithredol o fis Mawrth ymlaen. Felly, mae'n anodd gwybod yn union lle ydym o ran y cynlluniau hyn.

Bu i Simon Thomas grybwyll erthygl o *The Times Educational Supplement* sy'n dweud bod digon o dystiolaeth erbyn hyn fod bylchau yn y swyddi yn y consortia a bod hynny'n creu problemau i wasanaethau llywodraeth leol. Y cwestiwn yw os nad oes digon o bobl yn fodlon neu yn gallu llenwi'r rolau hyn, sut y gall y Cynulliad fod yn sicr bod y gyfundrefn addysg yn symud ymlaen yn ôl bwriad y Gweinidog. Eto, rydym eisoes wedi clywed bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn bod methiant systematig o fewn y gwasanaeth addysg yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n destun pryder, felly, nad oes digon o ymgeiswyr addas, er ein bod yn gwybod bod gennym arbenigedd yn y maes hwn yng Nghymru.

As Simon Thomas has already mentioned, part of the Government's policy on banding for secondary schools was that the consortia would facilitate addressing the problems of underachievement in the schools. In view of the delay in the consortia, we need to understand from the Minister this afternoon what action is being taken to support those schools, as has already been mentioned. At the time, the Minister also announced the formation of a practitioners' panel, which would advise him on good practice and other ways forward as far as raising attainment is concerned. It is disappointing that, as far as I can see, there is no record available publicly of the work that the panel has carried out to date, or any details of its meetings.

Additionally, as I have already stated, the four plans submitted by the regional consortia in support of their own bids for finance made it clear that they felt that system leaders would be in place by October 2011, with follow-up in March this year. Clearly, that has not happened. Therefore, we need to know what action has been taken by the Minister and his department to ensure that work is under way.

the original intention was for the consortia to be operational by September 2011; I have seen plans from the consortia, which were agreed by the Government, which show that they believed that many of their initiatives would be implemented from March. Therefore, it is hard to know exactly were we stand with those plans.

Simon Thomas mentioned an article in *The Times Educational Supplement* that says that there is ample evidence now of gaps with vacancies in the consortia and that that creates problems for local government services. The question is, if there are not enough people willing or able to fill those roles, how can the Assembly be assured that the education system is moving forward in accordance with the Minister's wishes. Again, we have already heard that the Minister accepts that there is a systematic failure within the education service in Wales at the moment. It is a cause for concern, therefore, that there are not enough suitable candidates, although we know that we have the expertise in this area here in Wales.

Fel y soniodd Simon Thomas eisoes, un rhan o bolisi'r Llywodraeth ar fandio ysgolion uwchradd oedd y byddai'r consortia yn hwyluso'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael â phroblemau tangyflawni yn yr ysgolion. Yn wyneb yr oedi cyn sefydlu'r consortia, mae angen inni gael gwybod gan y Gweinidog y prynhawn yma pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i gefnogi'r ysgolion hynny, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes. Ar y pryd, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog hefyd y câi panel o ymarferwyr ei ffurfio, a fyddai'n ei gynghori ar arfer da a ffyrdd eraill ymlaen o ran gwella cyrhaeddiad. Mae'n siomedig, hyd y gwelaf, nad oes cofnod ar gael i'r cyhoedd o'r gwaith y mae'r panel wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn, nac unrhyw fanylion am ei gyfarfodydd.

Yn ogystal â hynny, fel y dywedais eisoes, fe'i gwnaed yn glir yn y pedwar cynllun a gyflwynwyd gan y consortia rhanbarthol i ategu eu ceisiadau eu hunain am gyllid eu bod yn teimlo y byddai arweinwyr system ar waith erbyn mis Hydref 2011, gyda gwaith dilynol ym mis Mawrth eleni. Yn amlwg, nid yw hynny wedi digwydd. Felly, mae angen inni gael gwybod pa gamau a gymerwyd gan y Gweinidog a'i adran i sicrhau bod gwaith

yn mynd rhagddo.

In view of the numerous questions surrounding the current situation, we support amendment 5 tabled by the Conservatives. I ask the Minister to reassure us and tell us when he believes the consortia will be fully functional. For example, I understand that the north Wales consortium now states that it will not be functional until April of next year. What discussions have taken place with the lead directors of each consortium in the run-up to the recruitment campaign, and when was it realised that there were real issues as far as recruitment was concerned?

It will come as no surprise from my comments to hear that we will not be supporting amendment 4 from the Government. However, we support amendments 9 and 10. As Simon Thomas would expect of me, I take this opportunity to welcome the potential benefits of the pupil deprivation grant, because if it works successfully it can raise achievement and attainment levels in schools in Wales. Our amendment 8 calls on the Welsh Government to work with the teaching profession in this regard.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gorffennwch, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Aled Roberts:** There must be confidence within the sector that the Government can keep its side of the bargain and deliver what has been promised. Uncertainty in an already uneasy sector is a very difficult basis on which to expect improvements.

*Gwelliant 2—Jane Hutt*

*Yn is-bwynt 1a, ar ôl 'partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol', ychwanegu ' ynghyd â'r diwygiadau addysgol eraill a gefnogir gan y cynllun gweithredu i wella ysgolion a lansiwyd yn ddiweddar a chydweithredu effeithiol ehangach rhwng gwasanaethau cyhoeddus,'*

*Gwelliant 4—Jane Hutt*

*Dileu pwynt 2.*

O ystyried y cwestiynau lu ynghylch y sefyllfa bresennol, rydym yn cefnogi gwelliant 5 a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni a dweud wrthym pryd y bydd y consortia yn gwbl weithredol yn ei farn ef. Er enghraifft, caf ar ddeall bod consortiwm y gogledd bellach wedi nodi na fydd yn weithredol tan fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Pa drafodaethau sydd wedi digwydd gyda chyfarwyddwyr arweiniol pob consortiwm yn y cyfnod hyd at yr ymgyrch recriwtio, a phryd y sylweddolwyd bod problemau gwirioneddol o ran recriwtio?

Yn dilyn fy sylwadau ni fydd yn syndod ichi glywed na fyddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 4 gan y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, rydym yn cefnogi gwelliannau 9 a 10. Fel y byddai Simon Thomas yn ei ddisgwyl gennyf, hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i groesawu manteision posibl y grant amddifadedd disgyblion, oherwydd os bydd yn gweithio'n llwyddiannus gall godi lefelau cyflawniad a chyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae ein gwelliant 8 yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda'r proffesiwn addysgu yn hyn o beth.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please conclude.

**Aled Roberts:** Rhaid bod hyder o fewn y sector y gall y Llywodraeth gadw ei rhan hi o'r fargen a chyflawni'r hyn a addawyd. Mae ansicrwydd mewn sector sydd eisoes yn anesmwyth yn sail anodd iawn dros ddisgwyl gwelliannau.

*Amendment 2—Jane Hutt*

*In sub-point 1a, after 'regional school improvement partnerships' insert ' along with the other educational reforms supported through the recently launched school improvement implementation plan and wider effective collaboration between public services,'*

*Amendment 4—Jane Hutt*

*Delete point 2.*

**Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews):** Cynigiad welliannau 2 a 4 yn enw Jane Hutt.

*Gwelliant 5—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo yn unol â hynny:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i egluro pam y methwyd â rhoi partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol ar waith cyn y dyddiad a bennwyd.*

*Gwelliant 9—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn gresynu bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu â gweithredu pecyn cymorth helaeth a gwahaniaethol ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd ym Mandiau 4 a 5 y mae angen eu gwella ar frys.*

*Gwelliant 10—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn nodi nad yw 96.5% o benaethiaid ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru yn credu y bydd cynigion ar gyfer bandio ysgolion o fudd i'w hysgol, ac yn credu y gallai diffyg cefnogaeth o'r fath gan y sector i un o bolisiau allweddol Llywodraeth Cymru gael effaith negyddol ar unrhyw agenda i wella ysgolion.*

**Angela Burns:** I move amendments 5, 9 and 10 in the name of William Graham.

I thank Plaid Cymru for bringing forward this important debate, because it brings a fresh focus on a topic that has been discussed many times in the Chamber. I want to start at the very beginning, with the first part your motion, which states that,

‘regional school improvement partnerships have been identified by the Welsh Government as the answer to address the systemic failure in education’.

**The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews):** I move amendments 2 and 4 in the name of Jane Hutt.

*Amendment 5—William Graham*

*Add as new point 3 and re-number accordingly:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to explain why the deadline for the implementation of regional school improvement partnerships was missed.*

*Amendment 9—William Graham*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Regrets that the Welsh Government has failed to implement an extensive and differentiated support package for secondary schools in Bands 4 and 5 in need of urgent improvement.*

*Amendment 10—William Graham*

*Add as new point at end of motion:*

*Notes that 96.5 per cent of head teachers in Welsh primary schools do not believe school banding proposals will benefit their school, and believes that such a lack of support from the sector for a key Welsh Government policy could impact negatively on any school improvement agenda.*

**Angela Burns:** Cynigiad welliannau 5, 9 a 10 yn enw William Graham.

Diolch i Blaid Cymru am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon, oherwydd mae'n rhoi ffocws newydd ar bwnc sydd wedi cael ei drafod lawer gwaith yn y Siambr. Rwyf am ddechrau ar y dechrau, gyda'r rhan gyntaf o'ch cynnig, sy'n datgan bod,

‘partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol wedi cael eu nodi gan Lywodraeth Cymru fel yr ateb i fynd i'r afael â'r methiant systematig mewn addysg’.

It is important to reinforce the comments that you made. A delay of some six months because of protocol, process or bureaucracy does not seem much to a group of people of our age and in our place, but if you are a child, it makes all the difference in the world. To remind ourselves about that systemic failure, we are talking about 40% of our pupils starting secondary school with a reading age at least six months behind what it should be; about being well behind other UK nations in the Programme for International Student Assessment results; about there being a decline in our exam performance; and about our education budgets not being used effectively.

Although the Welsh Conservatives have supported the Government drive through the front-line resources review to shift resources to teaching and learning, it still concerns us that some 32% of resources seem to be spent on support costs. While we welcome the focus on literacy and numeracy skills, and, like Plaid Cymru, believe that closing that educational gap should be the focus of all our endeavours, we are very concerned that we are still not giving organisations the tools that they need to achieve these objectives. Surely this is one of the tools.

We would like the Welsh Government to explain why the deadline for implementation was missed. That is the crux of our amendment 5. One of our biggest contentions about this current Government is that it is usually poor on policy, but even when the policy is good, planning tends to go adrift. We can cite tonnes of examples, starting with the initial implementation of the excellent foundation phase in the third Assembly and going all the way through. It is not good enough. We have to be good at planning and good on performance, but you are poor on policy, poor on planning and poor on performance, and I am concerned that this is yet another example of where a policy directive has come together but not been carried through, leading to its being a complete waste of time.

We totally support the Liberal Democrat amendment 3 that clearly states that banding

Mae'n bwysig ategu'r sylwadau a wnaethoch. Nid yw oedi o ryw chwe mis oherwydd protocol, proses neu fiwrocratiaeth yn ymddangos yn rhywbeth difrifol i grŵp o bobl o'n hoedran ni ac yn ein sefyllfa ni, ond os ydych yn blentyn, mae'n gwneud byd o wahaniaeth. I atgoffa ein hunain am y methiant systematig, rydym yn sôn am 40% o'n disgyblion sy'n dechrau'r ysgol uwchradd ag oedran darllen o leiaf chwe mis y tu ôl i'r hyn y dylai fod; am fod ymhell y tu ôl i wledydd eraill y DU yng nghanlyniadau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr; am ddirywiad yn ein perfformiad mewn arholiadau, ac am fethiant i ddefnyddio ein cyllidebau addysg yn effeithiol.

Er bod y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig wedi cefnogi ymgyrch y Llywodraeth drwy'r adolygiad o adnoddau rheng flaen i drosglwyddo adnoddau i addysgu a dysgu, erys yn achos pryder inni fod tua 32% o adnoddau yn cael eu gwario ar gostau cymorth yn ôl pob golwg. Er ein bod yn croesawu'r ffofws ar sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd, ac, fel Plaid Cymru, yn credu mai ar gau'r bwlch addysgol y dylem ganolbwyntio ein holl ymdrechion, rydym yn bryderus iawn nad ydym eto yn rhoi'r cymorth i sefydliadau y mae ei angen arnynt i gyflawni'r amcanion hyn. Onid yw hyn yn rhan o'r cymorth?

Hoffem pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru yn egluro pam na weithredwyd o fewn y terfyn amser. Dyna graidd ein gwelliant 5. Un o'n dadleuon mwyaf ynglŷn â'r Llywodraeth gyfredol hon yw ei bod fel arfer yn wael o ran polisi, ond hyd yn oed pan fo'r polisi'n dda, mae'r gwaith cynllunio yn tueddu i fynd ar gyfeiliorn. Gallwn ddyfynnu lluo o enghreifftiau, gan ddechrau gyda gweithredu'r cyfnod sylfaen ardderchog ar y cychwyn yn y trydydd Cynulliad a mynd yr holl ffordd ar ôl hynny. Nid yw'n ddigon da. Rhaid inni fod yn dda o ran cynllunio ac yn dda o ran perfformiad, ond rydych yn wael o ran polisi, yn wael o ran cynllunio ac yn wael o ran perfformiad, a phryderaf fod hon yn enghraifft arall eto lle y mae cyfarwyddyd polisi wedi dod at ei gilydd, ond nid yw wedi cael ei roi ar waith, gan ei droi'n wastraff amser llwyr.

Rydym yn llwyr gefnogi gwelliant 3 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol sy'n datgan yn

is seriously flawed. People do not believe in banding and do not trust it, and that includes parents, teachers and students. Worse still, primary school headteachers are concerned about the banding proposals. Therefore, I will mention amendment 10 where we talk about this in great detail, because this reinforces our amendment about the lack of trust in banding and why we believe that it needs to be reviewed. As the Minister knows, we sent out a survey to every primary school in Wales, and we had more than 35% respond. I am very happy to share the physical evidence, because I know that doubt has been cast on it before. I was horrified that the First Minister, Carwyn Jones, dismissed in the Chamber the concern of primary school headteachers in Wales. He said that,

‘Any opinion poll showing results in the 90s in terms of support or opposition is suspect’.

However, surely the higher return rate of more than 35% suggests extensive concern in the sector concerning Welsh Government policy. To run through it very quickly, 96.5% of primary schools do not think that banding will help them, and two thirds of headteachers feel that the new policy could be compromised. That is just primary school teachers. Let us look at secondary school teachers and consider where banding is not supporting them. There are schools in bands 4 and 5, to which the Government promised targeted help, which have been given £10,000 to spread around wherever they like.

That brings me to the pupil deprivation grant—and I am sure that the Liberal Democrats will not be surprised to hear that we will not support that amendment. However, we will support the other Liberal Democrat amendment because, again, there is money sloshing around being given to schools, but where are the outcomes? Where is the focus? *[Interruption.]* It is absolutely sloshing around, Minister. Once again, we are throwing money at a problem but we are not waiting to see whether the money solves the problem or stopping to correct things and

glir bod gan y broses fandio ddiffygion difrifol. Nid yw pobl yn credu mewn bandio ac nid ydynt yn ymddiried ynddo, ac mae hynny'n cynnwys rhieni, athrawon a myfyrwyr. Yn waeth fyth, mae penaethiaid ysgolion cynradd yn pryderu am y cynigion bandio. Felly, cyfeiriaf at welliant 10 lle rydym yn sôn am hyn yn fanwl iawn, oherwydd mae hyn yn atgyfnerthu ein gwelliant ynghylch y diffyg ymddiriedaeth mewn bandio a pham mae angen ei adolygu yn ein barn ni. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, anfonwyd arolwg i bob ysgol gynradd yng Nghymru, ac ymatebodd dros 35%. Rwy'n fodlon rhannu'r dystiolaeth ffisegol, am fy mod yn gwybod iddi gael ei hamau o'r blaen. Roeddwn yn arswydo bod y Prif Weinidog, Carwyn Jones, wedi wfftio pryderon penaethiaid ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru yn y Siambr. Dywedodd fod,

‘Unrhyw arolwg barn sy'n dangos canlyniadau yn y 90au o ran cefnogaeth neu wrthwynebiad yn amheus’.

Fodd bynnag, onid yw'r gyfradd ddychwelyd uwch o fwy na 35% yn awgrymu bod cryn bryder yn y sector ynglŷn â pholisi Llywodraeth Cymru. Os caf fynd drwy'r manylion yn gyflym iawn, mae 96.5% o ysgolion cynradd o'r farn na fydd bandio yn eu helpu, ac mae dwy ran o dair o'r penaethiaid yn teimlo y gallai'r polisi newydd gael ei beryglu. Dim ond athrawon ysgolion cynradd yw hynny. Gadewch inni edrych ar athrawon ysgolion uwchradd ac ystyried lle nad yw bandio yn eu cefnogi. Mae ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5, yr addawodd y Llywodraeth roi cymorth wedi'i dargedu iddynt, sydd wedi cael £10,000 i'w wario fel y mynnont.

Mae hynny'n dod â mi at y grant amddifadedd disgyblion—ac rwy'n siŵr na fydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn synnu o glywed na fyddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant arall y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oherwydd, unwaith eto, mae llif sylweddol o arian ar gael sy'n cael ei roi i ysgolion, ond ble mae'r canlyniadau? Ble mae'r ffocws? *[Torri ar draws.]* Yn sicr mae'n llifo, Weinidog. Unwaith eto, rydym yn taflu arian at broblem ond nid ydym yn aros i weld a yw'r arian yn datrys y broblem nac yn aros i

put the money where it needs to be.

Monitoring, achieving value for money, being outcome-focused—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Conclude now, please.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, that is all we are asking of you. One of the outcomes that you could certainly focus on is getting the regional consortia up and running.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I would like to focus on two points in my contribution: the quasi-league tables, or banding as the Government calls it, and the sharing of best practice in the education consortia. I reiterate our opposition to banding. However, I acknowledge that, in the context of this debate, it is clear that the original concept of the regional consortia was based on supporting and assisting schools that have been branded as being in bands 4 and 5. As we have already heard, these consortia are not yet functioning. That means that the schools in the lowest bands have all the disadvantages of being seen as the worst performers without the support and assistance that they need to improve the literacy, numeracy and attainment levels of pupils. Furthermore, the teaching unions have said that these schools face a potential spiral of decline with teachers and pupils abandoning them for schools in the higher bands.

Contrary to the Minister's claim that banding is not naming and shaming schools and that it is not the return of league tables, placing schools in bands without the focus of sharing best practice with, and giving support to, the schools in the lower bands is no different from placing them in league tables. The Welsh Government's aim should be to see the bottom two bands empty. However, as set out clearly by Simon Thomas recently, any examination of the statistical analysis and the statistical relationship within the banding system shows clearly that all bands will continue to be populated. Every band will have a number of schools in it and we are therefore bound to continue to have schools in bands 4 and 5. Under the School Standards

unioni pethau a rhoi'r arian lle mae ei angen.

Monitro, sicrhau gwerth am arian, canolbwyntio ar ganlyniadau—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dewch i ben yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, dyna'r cyfan yr ydym yn gofyn i chi ei wneud. Un o'r deilliannau y gallech yn sicrhau ganolbwyntio arno yw sicrhau bod consortia rhanbarthol yn weithredol.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar ddau bwynt yn fy nghyfraniad: y lled-dablau cynghrair, neu fandio fel y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei alw, a rhannu arfer gorau yn y consortia addysg. Datganaf unwaith eto ein gwrthwynebiad i fandio. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf, yng nghyd-destun y ddadl hon, ei bod yn amlwg mai cefnogi a chynorthwyo ysgolion sydd wedi cael eu rhoi ym mandiau 4 a 5 oedd wrth wraidd cysyniad gwreiddiol y consortia rhanbarthol. Fel yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes, nid yw'r consortia hyn ar waith eto. Mae hynny'n golygu bod yr ysgolion yn y bandiau isaf yn wynebu'r holl anfanteision o gael eu hystyried fel y perfformwyr gwaethaf heb y gefnogaeth na'r cymorth sydd eu hangen arnynt i wella llythrennedd, rhifedd a lefelau cyrhaeddiad disgyblion. At hynny, mae undebau'r athrawon wedi dweud bod yr ysgolion hyn yn wynebu dirywiad graddol o bosibl wrth i athrawon a disgyblion gefnu arnynt a throi at ysgolion yn y bandiau uwch.

Yn groes i honiad y Gweinidog nad enwi a chywilyddio ysgolion yw bandio ac nad yw'n dychwelyd at dablau cynghrair, nid yw gosod ysgolion mewn bandiau heb y ffocws ar rannu arfer gorau gyda'r ysgolion yn y bandiau isaf, a rhoi cymorth iddynt, yn ddim byd amgenach na'u gosod mewn tablau cynghrair. Fel nod, dylai Llywodraeth Cymru anelu at weld y ddau fand ar y gwaelod yn wag. Fodd bynnag, fel yr amlinellwyd yn glir gan Simon Thomas yn ddiweddar, mae unrhyw ystyriaeth o'r dadansoddiad ystadegol a'r berthynas ystadegol o fewn y system fandio yn dangos yn glir y bydd pob band yn parhau i gael ei boblogi. Ym mhob band bydd nifer o ysgolion ac felly byddwn yn sicrhau barhau i weld ysgolion ym mandiau



and Organisation (Wales) Bill, banding will be part of the data used to decide whether there are grounds for intervention in schools and schools' improvement guidance will be statutory. That provides additional reasons for the regional consortia to be up and running as soon as possible.

I know that I do not have much time so, to finish, I just wish to say that I am delighted that the Minister gave us assurances earlier today that the laptops purchased by Torfaen council will be put to use by Welsh pupils soon. However, perhaps the Minister will tell us whether he thinks that such projects would be more effectively handled by the regional consortia in future. Minister, as Simon Thomas mentioned earlier, you told us in March that all the local authority leaders had assured you that education was their No. 1 priority. Since then, we have had the local government elections, so I wonder whether you can assure us this afternoon whether education remains the No. 1 priority for all our councils across Wales.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Children have a right to expect that every school is a good school because they do not get to choose, in the main, particularly not at primary school level. In many cases, their families do not choose either because, if they are suffering deprivation, they probably have an awful lot of other issues on their plates and agonising about which school to go to, rather than whether to go to school, is not the issue.

4.45 p.m.

In addition, in many parts of Wales and in rural areas, there is not a great choice of schools because of the difficulties in terms of transport. So, we have an obligation to ensure that all our schools are good schools and I am sure that that is the objective for us all. However, as Angela Burns has already highlighted, we have some way to go. I do not think that any of us are in denial about the challenges that we face. It is not that we have

4 a 5. O dan Fil Safonau a Threfniadaeth Ysgolion (Cymru), bydd bandio yn rhan o'r data a ddefnyddir i benderfynu a oes sail dros ymyrryd mewn ysgolion a bydd canllawiau gwella ysgolion yn statudol. Mae hynny'n rhoi rhesymau ychwanegol dros sicrhau bod y consortia rhanbarthol yn weithredol cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Gwn nad oes gennyf lawer o amser felly, i orffen, y cyfan yr hoffwn ei ddweud yw fy mod yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi rhoi sicrwydd inni yn gynharach heddiw y bydd y gliniaduron a brynwyd gan gyngor Torfaen yn cael eu dosbarthu at ddefnydd disgyblion yng Nghymru cyn hir. Fodd bynnag, efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym a yw o'r farn y byddai prosiectau o'r fath yn cael eu cynnal yn fwy effeithiol gan y consortia rhanbarthol yn y dyfodol. Weinidog, fel y soniodd Simon Thomas yn gynharach, dywedasoeh wrthym ym mis Mawrth fod pob arweinydd awdurdod lleol wedi rhoi sicrwydd ichi mai addysg oedd eu prif flaenoriaeth. Ers hynny, cynhaliwyd etholiadau llywodraeth leol, felly tybed a allwch roi sicrwydd inni y prynhawn yma ynghylch a yw addysg yn parhau i fod yn brif flaenoriaeth i'n holl gynghorau ledled Cymru.

**Jenny Rathbone:** Mae gan blant yr hawl i ddisgwyl bod pob ysgol yn ysgol dda am nad ydynt yn cael dewis, ar y cyfan, yn enwedig ar lefel ysgol gynradd. Mewn llawer o achosion, nid yw eu teuluoedd yn dewis ychwaith oherwydd, os ydynt yn wynebu amddifadedd, y tebyg yw bod ganddynt lawer iawn o faterion eraill i'w hystyried ac nid ymboeni ynghylch pa ysgol i'w dewis yw'r peth pwysig, ond penderfynu mynd i'r ysgol ai peidio.

At hynny, mewn sawl rhan o Gymru ac mewn ardaloedd gwledig, nid oes llawer o ddewis o ysgolion oherwydd yr anawsterau o ran trafniadaeth. Felly, mae dyletswydd arnom i sicrhau bod pob un o'n hysgolion yn ysgol dda, ac rwy'n siŵr mai dyna'r nod inni i gyd. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae Angela Burns eisoes wedi amlygu, mae gennym dipyn o ffordd i fynd. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw un ohonom yn gwadu'r heriau sy'n ein

not improved, it is just that other countries or regions have improved even better than we have. We continue to have a challenge that we all have to rise up to, to ensure that all our children are achieving to the best of their ability and that we collectively are able to pay our way in the world.

I commend that Minister's approach to focusing on the basics—the three Rs—rather than lots of new initiatives. I would also like to remind everyone about the importance of the Government's initiatives around the Flying Start programme. We are doubling the number of children living in deprivation who are going to get that support from birth, because that is when the deprivation begins. We will continue to have children arriving at school unable to speak more than three words at the age of three unless we have much more intervention in ensuring that all parents understand the importance of talking to their children. Where the attachment process is disrupted, there is no question that it has a huge impact on children's abilities to learn. In addition to that, we have the foundation phase. Estyn highlights the benefits that we have already seen from the foundation phase, particularly to boys, of outdoor lessons and of being able to run, jump, explore and experiment, which has been hugely important in that approach of learning through play.

Consortia are one way of sharing good practice and we absolutely have to do that. We have to be much cleverer in ensuring that we are not reinventing the wheel. It does not remove the statutory function of all LEAs, which is unchanged and which is the obligation to raise school standards in all their schools. However, getting local authorities to collaborate, as we heard in earlier questions to the Minister for local government, is not particularly easy. That does not mean to say that we do not need pursue the consortia idea as a way of ensuring that people are sharing good practice.

I would like to mention an excellent example of good practice that has been going on at Llanedeyrn High School, where I am a governor. This is a school that is due to close

hwynebu. Nid methu â gwella yr ydym wedi'i wneud, ond bod gwledydd neu ranbarthau eraill wedi gwella hyd yn oed yn fwy na ni. Rydym yn parhau i wynebu her y mae'n rhaid inni i gyd ymateb iddi, er mwyn sicrhau bod ein holl blant yn cyflawni hyd eithaf eu gallu ac y gallwn gyda'n gilydd dalu ein ffordd yn y byd.

Cymeradwyaf y ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog yn canolbwyntio ar yr hanfodion—darllen, ysgrifennu a rhifedd—yn hytrach na lluo o fentrau newydd. Hoffwn hefyd atgoffa pawb am bwysigrwydd mentrau'r Llywodraeth yng nghyswllt y rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg. Rydym yn dyblu nifer y plant sy'n byw mewn amddifadedd a fydd yn cael y cymorth hwnnw o enedigaeth, oherwydd dyna pryd y mae'r amddifadedd yn dechrau. Byddwn yn parhau i weld achosion o blant sy'n cyrraedd yr ysgol heb fedru siarad mwy na thri gair yn dair oed oni bai bod llawer mwy o ymyrraeth i sicrhau bod pob rhiant yn deall pwysigrwydd siarad â'i blant. Os amherir ar y broses o ffurfio perthynas, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'n cael effaith enfawr ar allu plant i ddysgu. Yn ogystal â hynny, ceir y cyfnod sylfaen. Mae Estyn yn tynnu sylw at y manteision yr ydym eisoes wedi'u gweld o'r cyfnod sylfaen, yn enwedig i fechgyn, o gynnal gwersi yn yr awyr agored a rhoi cyfle iddynt redeg, neidio, archwilio ac arbrofi, sydd wedi bod yn hynod bwysig yn y dull o ddysgu drwy chwarae.

Consortia yw un ffordd o rannu arfer da a rhaid inni wneud hynny yn sicr. Rhaid inni fod yn fwy craff o lawer o ran sicrhau nad ydym yn ailddyfeisio'r olwyn. Nid yw'n cael gwared ar swyddogaeth statudol pob AALL, nad yw wedi newid, sef y rhwymedigaeth i godi safonau ysgol ym mhob un o'u hysgolion. Fodd bynnag, nid tasg hawdd yw cael awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio, fel y clywsom mewn cwestiynau cynharach i'r Gweinidog llywodraeth leol. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes angen inni fynd ar drywydd y syniad o gonsortia fel ffordd o sicrhau bod pobl yn rhannu arfer da.

Hoffwn sôn am enghraifft ardderchog o arfer da a welir yn Ysgol Uwchradd Llanedeyrn, lle yr wyf yn llywodraethwraig. Mae hon yn ysgol a fydd yn cau yn weddol fuan. Serch

in the not-too-distant future. Nevertheless, it has an approach of developing a professional learning community involving all the staff—all teachers, all support staff and the senior management team—and ensuring that the in-service training time that all schools have is used to address collectively aspects of reading and writing and to address the gap of deprivation. They share good practice and shortcomings that they each can acknowledge, taking them back to what they have learnt from their INSET, taking it back to the classroom and then coming back at the subsequent session to explain how their practice has improved. That sort of learning is very effective in ensuring that all members of staff are actively ensuring that they are doing the very best for their children. That is the sort of thing that can be shared in consortia as well across local education authorities.

On the question of system leaders, obviously it is disappointing that we do not have all the system leaders in place. However, we have to have system leaders that are capable of doing that particular job. As I recall, when the National Association of Head Teachers came to speak to the Children and Young People committee, it highlighted the fact that there are not enough headteachers going on to work in school improvement, particularly at secondary level. It is no use having a system leader who does not have a clue and does not have the experience to be able to challenge senior management teams about the ineffectiveness of their work. If they have never done it themselves and do not have the experience, they are simply not going to be taken seriously. So, I wonder whether the Minister could tell us how we can resolve that problem, to ensure that headteachers go on to share their experience with other headteachers.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Wrth reswm, rydym i gyd yn awyddus i weld safonau addysg yn gyffredinol yn codi yng Nghymru. Rydym yn ymwybodol o'r math o ystadegau sydd wedi cael eu cyhoeddi dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf sydd yn dangos ein bod yn tanberfformio yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae perygl, wrth ganolbwyntio ar yr ystadegau moel, ein bod yn dod i'r casgliad bod pob plentyn yn dechrau ar yr un lefel ac

hynny, mae'n mynd ati i ddatblygu cymuned ddysgu broffesiynol sy'n cynnwys yr holl staff—yr holl athrawon, yr holl staff cymorth a'r uwch dîm rheoli—gan sicrhau y caiff yr amser hyfforddiant mewn swydd y mae pob ysgol yn ei gael ei ddefnyddio i fynd i'r afael ar y cyd ag agweddau ar ddarllen ac ysgrifennu a mynd i'r afael â bwlch amddifadedd. Maent yn rhannu arferion da a diffygion y gall pob un ohonynt eu cydnabod, gan fynd â hwy yn ôl at yr hyn y maent wedi'i ddysgu yn eu HMS, gan fynd â hwy yn ôl i'r ystafell ddosbarth, ac yna dod yn ôl yn y sesiwn ddilynol i egluro sut y mae eu harfer wedi gwella. Mae'r math hwnnw o ddysgu yn effeithiol iawn o ran sicrhau bod pob aelod o staff yn mynd ati i sicrhau eu bod yn gwneud y gorau dros eu plant. Dyna'r math o beth y gellir ei rannu mewn consortia yn ogystal ag mewn awdurdodau addysg lleol.

O ran arweinwyr system, yn amlwg mae'n siomedig nad yw'r holl arweinwyr system yn eu lle. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni benodi arweinwyr system sy'n gallu gwneud y gwaith penodol hwnnw. Fel y cofiaf, pan ddaeth Cymdeithas Genedlaethol y Prifathrawon i siarad â'r Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc, tynnodd sylw at y ffaith nad oes digon o benaethiaid yn mynd yn eu blaenau i weithio ym maes gwella ysgolion, yn enwedig ar lefel uwchradd. Nid oes diben cael arweinydd system nad oes ganddo syniad ac nad oes ganddo'r profiad i allu herio uwch dimau rheoli am aneffeithiolrwydd eu gwaith. Os nad ydynt erioed wedi gwneud hynny eu hunain ac nad ydynt yn meddu ar y profiad, yn syml ni chânt eu cymryd o ddifrif. Felly, tybed a allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y gallwn ddatrys y broblem honno, er mwyn sicrhau bod penaethiaid yn mynd ati i rannu eu profiad gyda phenaethiaid eraill.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Naturally, we are all eager to see education standards in general being raised in Wales. We are aware of the kinds of statistics that have been published over the last few years that show that we are underperforming generally. However, there is a danger that, in concentrating on the bare statistics, we come to the conclusion that all children start off at the same level and that what needs to be done is to improve the

mai'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud yw gwella lefelau addysgiadol a chyrhaeddiad pob plentyn yn yr un modd.

Wrth feddwl am rôl y consortia rhanbarthol, mae'n ymddangos i mi fod ganddynt rôl arbennig ar gyfer disgyblion sydd ag anghenion arbennig, yn enwedig pan fo'r anghenion hynny yn rhai prin. Mae'n siŵr bod Aelodau Cynulliad eraill, wrth geisio sicrhau bod plentyn yn cael addysg arbenigol, wedi cael yr un profiad â minnau o ganfod nad yw'r arbenigedd hwnnw yn bodoli o fewn adran addysg yr awdurdod lleol a bod yr adran honno'n teimlo y gall unrhyw un sydd ag unrhyw fath o gymhwyster i ddysgu plant ag anghenion arbennig ddarparu addysg ar gyfer y plentyn hwnnw, beth bynnag fo'r angen.

Yn fy ngwaith etholaethol, rwyf wedi wynebu sefyllfaoedd fel hyn gydag anghenion arbennig yn gyffredinol, ond, yn arbennig, rwyf wedi wynebu'r sefyllfa hon gyda rhieni sy'n dymuno i'w plant gael addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn meysydd arbenigol, ond, oherwydd bod y niferoedd yn llai, fod awdurdodau unigol yn methu â darparu hynny. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod fy mod wedi codi gydag ef, ar nifer o achlysuron erbyn hyn, yr anghenion o ran dyslecsia drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Mae'r un peth yn wir am anghenion o ran awtistiaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a nifer o feysydd eraill. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi ymrwymiad y prynhawn yma y bydd y consortia rhanbarthol, fel rhan o'u cyfrifoldebau, yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffygion hyn sydd yn bodoli o fewn awdurdodau unigol a sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth honno ar gael yn rhanbarthol a bod modd i bob awdurdod addysg sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth hwnnw ar gael i ddisgyblion yn yr ardal y maent yn gyfrifol amdani?

Roeddwn mewn seminar ddoe gyda Phwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yn Treviso yn sôn am dwristiaeth a mynediad i bawb at dwristiaeth. Dywedodd un o brif weithredwyr cadwyn o westai drwy Ewrop, 'Does gennym ni ddim pobl anabl yn aros yn ein gwystai ni. Does gennym ni ddim pobl ag anghenion arbennig yn aros yn ein gwystai ni. Mae gennym ni gwsmeriaid yn aros yn ein gwystai ni a'n cyfrifoldeb ni yw darparu ar gyfer eu

educational and attainment levels of each child uniformly.

Thinking about the role of the regional consortia, it seems to me that they have a special role to play on behalf of pupils who have special needs, especially those whose needs are rare. I am sure that other Assembly Members will have discovered, in trying to ensure that a child receives specialist education, that the expertise does not exist within local authorities' education departments and that those departments are often of the view that anyone who has any sort of qualification to teach children with special needs will be able provide education for that child, regardless of the need.

In my constituency work, I have come across such situations in the context of special needs in general, but I have also faced this situation with parents who want their children to have the specialist education they need through the medium of Welsh. However, because the numbers are smaller, local authorities cannot make that provision. The Minister will know that I have raised with him, on a number of occasions by now, the issue of dyslexia provision through the medium of Welsh. The same is true of provision for autism through the medium of Welsh, and several other areas. Will the Minister make a commitment this afternoon that the regional consortia, as part of their responsibilities, will tackle the deficiencies within individual authorities in order to ensure that the provision is available on a regional level so that all education authorities can ensure that the service is available to all pupils within the area for which they are responsible?

I attended a seminar yesterday with the Committee of the Regions in Treviso, which was all about tourism and people's access to it. A chief executive of a chain of European hotels said, 'We do not have any disabled people staying in our hotels. We do not have people with special needs staying in our hotels. We have customers staying in our hotels and it is our responsibility to provide for their needs, whatever those needs may

hanghenion nhw, beth bynnag fo'r anghenion hynny.' A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, fod hynny'n wir am addysg hefyd—nid plant ag anghenion arbennig neu blant anabl sydd gennym, ond disgyblion, a disgyblion ag ystod o anghenion y mae'n gyfrifoldeb ar awdurdodau addysg, y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad i ddarparu ar eu cyfer? Yr hyn rwy'n ei geisio gennych y prynhawn yma yw ymrwymiad sy'n dweud y byddwch chi'n gwneud yn siŵr, pan fydd awdurdod addysg lleol am ba reswm bynnag—nid wyf yn bod yn feiriadol o'r awdurdodau hynny yn hyn o beth—yn methu â darparu ar gyfer nifer cyfyngedig o ddisgyblion, fod y ddarpariaeth honno ar gael yn llawn i'r disgyblion hynny drwy gonsortiw m rhanbarthol, boed yn un neu ddau o blant, yn ddegau, yn gannoedd neu yn filoedd o blant, fel sy'n wir drwy Gymru gyfan. Bydd hyn yn sicrhau bod gan bob plentyn yr un hawl i gael addysg o'r safon uchaf a'r cyfle i ddatblygu i'w potensial llawn yn addysgiadol yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** It is hard to think of a subject that is more important to the future prosperity of Wales than what is done now to address what even the Minister has admitted have been systemic failures in the education system presided over by a succession of Labour-led Welsh Governments. The Minister has, of course, announced a range of measures to tackle the failures that were so evident in, for example, in the Programme for International Student Assessment and the persistent attainment gap between Welsh and English students in top grades at GCSE and A-level. While the Minister has focused on structures, regional school improvement partnerships and on banding for secondary and primary schools, ultimately, the success or the failure of the Welsh Government's approach hinges on whether it delivers the results in schools.

In terms of the banding proposals for primary schools, it is worrying that there was such a widespread lack of confidence in the Welsh Government's plans. Our colleague Angela Burns referred to the survey of primary headteachers, carried out by the Welsh Conservatives, which found that more than

be.' Do you agree, Minister, that that is also true of education—it is not children with special needs or disabled children that we have, but pupils, and pupils with a range a needs for which it is the responsibility of education authorities, the Government and the Assembly to provide? What I am seeking from you this afternoon is a commitment to ensure that, when a local education authority, for whatever reason—and I am not being critical of those authorities in this respect—is unable to provide for a limited number of pupils, the provision is made fully available for those pupils through the regional consortia, regardless of whether it is needed by one or two children, by tens of children, or by hundreds or thousands, as is the case throughout Wales. This will ensure that each child has the same right to education of the highest possible standard and the opportunity to develop fully their educational potential in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae'n anodd meddwl am bwnc sy'n bwysicach i ffyniant Cymru yn y dyfodol na'r hyn a wneir yn awr i fynd i'r afael â'r hyn y mae hyd yn oed y Gweinidog wedi cyfaddef sydd wedi bod yn fethiannau systematig yn y gyfundrefn addysg o dan un llywodraeth yng Nghymru ar ôl y llall o dan arweiniad Llafur. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi nifer o fesurau i fynd i'r afael â'r methiannau a fu mor amlwg, er enghraifft, yn y Rhaglen Ryngwladol Asesu Myfyrwyr a'r bwlch cyson o ran cyrhaeddiad rhwng myfyrwyr yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn y graddau uchaf mewn TGAU a Safon Uwch. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi canolbwyntio ar strwythurau, partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol ac ar fandio ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd a chynradd, yn y pen draw, bydd llwyddiant neu fethiant dull gweithredu Llywodraeth Cymru yn dibynnu ar ba un a yw'n cael y canlyniadau mewn ysgolion.

O ran y cynigion bandio ar gyfer ysgolion cynradd, mae'n destun pryder bod cymaint o ddiffyg hyder yng nghynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru. Cyfeiriodd ein cyd-Aelod Angela Burns at arolwg o benaethiaid cynradd, a gynhaliwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, a ganfu fod mwy na naw o bob 10 ysgol

nine out of 10 primary schools did not believe that they would benefit from banding and said that they were not consulted on the proposals or adequately informed. It is also concerning that the Welsh Government is pressing ahead with its approach without an effective package of support for those secondary schools in bands 4 and 5. Instead, there is just a one-off payment of £10,000 for each of these schools. Each school in bands 4 and 5 were assessed as poorly performing in any combination of 12 different criteria. Therefore a one-size-fits-all response is unlikely to be ideally suited to the needs of each school, and is a far cry from the extensive and differentiated support that the Minister has proposed. It does not come close to closing the £604 funding gap between Welsh and English students on average, admittedly with London included.

I share the concerns of many of my constituents who have contacted me about their children's education. These are concerns that the Welsh Government appears to be focusing its intention on banding and structures while taking its eye off the ball on the poor standards that prompted these changes in the first place. There are concerns too that while, overall, exclusions are falling, which is good news, and the number of statements for additional learning needs have also been falling—which could be good or bad news—the number of exclusions of children with special or additional learning needs has been rising significantly.

I am sure that the Minister will accept that it would be of little use to Welsh students, and little comfort to their parents, if Wales ends up with first-rate structures for the education system when standards continue to fall so short. I urge him to listen carefully to the contributions made by Members from all parties here today—as made previously and, no doubt, as will be made in the future—and provide assurances that he is focusing on what matters, which is delivering the results for Welsh pupils whatever their additional or non-additional educational needs may be, so that they have the best opportunity to succeed in life.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Mae consortia addysg

gynradd o'r farn na fydd bandio o fudd iddynt hwy gan ddweud nad ymgynghorwyd â hwy ynglŷn â'r cynigion ac na chawsant ddigon o wybodaeth. Mae'n achosi pryder hefyd bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â hyn heb becyn effeithiol o gymorth i'r ysgolion uwchradd hynny ym mandiau 4 a 5. Yn hytrach, bydd un taliad untro o £10,000 i bob un o'r ysgolion hyn. Aseswyd bod pob ysgol ym mandiau 4 a 5 yn perfformio'n wael mewn unrhyw gyfuniad o 12 o feini prawf gwahanol. Felly mae un ateb i bawb yn annhebygol o fod yn addas ar gyfer anghenion pob ysgol, ac mae'n wahanol iawn i'r cymorth helaeth a gwahaniaethol a gynigiwyd gan y Gweinidog. Nid yw'n dod yn agos at gau'r bwlch cyllido o £604 rhwng myfyrwyr yng Nghymru a Lloegr ar gyfartaledd, o gynnwys Llundain rhaid cyfaddef.

Rhannaf bryderon llawer o'm hetholwyr sydd wedi cysylltu â mi ynglŷn ag addysg eu plant. Y pryderon yw bod Llywodraeth Cymru i bob golwg yn canolbwyntio ar fandio a strwythurau ac yn colli golwg ar y safonau gwael a ysgogodd y newidiadau hyn yn y lle cyntaf. Mae pryderon hefyd, er bod nifer y gwaharddiadau yn gostwng yn gyffredinol, sy'n newyddion da, a bod nifer y datganiadau am anghenion dysgu ychwanegol hefyd wedi bod yn gostwng—a allai fod yn newyddion da neu ddrwg—mae nifer y gwaharddiadau ymhlith plant ag anghenion arbennig neu anghenion dysgu ychwanegol wedi bod yn cynyddu'n sylweddol.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn, mae'n siŵr, na fyddai fawr o werth i fyfyrwyr o Gymru, na fawr o gysur i'w rhieni, pe bai gan Gymru strwythurau o'r radd flaenaf ar gyfer y gyfundrefn addysg ond bod safonau'n parhau i fod mor siomedig. Apeliaf arno i wrando'n ofalus ar y cyfraniadau a wnaed gan Aelodau o bob plaid yma heddiw—fel y'u gwnaed o'r blaen ac, yn ddiaw, fel y cânt eu gwneud yn y dyfodol—a rhoi sicrwydd ei fod yn canolbwyntio ar yr hyn sy'n bwysig, sy'n sicrhau'r canlyniadau i ddisgyblion Cymru beth bynnag fo'u hanghenion addysg ychwanegol neu eu hanghenion addysg nad ydynt yn ychwanegol, fel eu bod yn cael y cyfle gorau i lwyddo mewn bywyd.

**Llyr Huws Gruffydd:** Regional educational

rhanbarthol yn rhoi cyfle i ailgyfeirio adnoddau o reolaeth a biwrocratiaeth i'r ystafell ddosbarth. Maent hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i awdurdodau lleol rannu profiadau ac arbenigedd, ac i rannu, ond yn bwysicach i ddysgu oddi wrth, arfer da. Dyna paham rwyf wedi derbyn yr egwyddor o sefydlu'r consortia a pham yr wyf yn credu mai nhw ddylai fod yn gyrru tair blaenoriaeth Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer addysg, sef gwella llythrennedd, gwella rhifedd ac—fel y clywsom sawl gwaith—torri'r cysylltiad rhwng cyrhaeddiad addysgol ac amddifadedd. Fodd bynnag, mae sefydlu'r consortia wedi bod yn llawn anawsterau. Addawodd y Gweinidog, fel y clywsom, y byddai'r consortia yn weithredol erbyn mis Medi eleni, ond nid yw hynny wedi digwydd.

Daeth adroddiad blynyddol Estyn ar gyfer 2010-11 allan ddiwedd Ionawr eleni ac fe ddangosodd nad yw gweithio mewn partneriaeth wedi cael digon o effaith ar wella canlyniadau i ddysgwyr hyd yma. Mae hefyd yn dweud er bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn ymgysylltu â'u consortia addysg rhanbarthol a lleol, dim ond ychydig iawn ohonynt sy'n medru adrodd yn glir ar effaith y gwaith ar y cyd yma ar wella gwasanaethau neu ganlyniadau. Mae angen felly i'r consortia fod yn weithredol cyn gynted ag y bo modd er mwyn cefnogi'r ysgolion sydd wedi eu gosod yn y bandiau is, ac er mwyn gyrru gwelliannau o safbwynt y blaenoriaethau y soniais amdanynt yn gynharach. Gallech chi ddweud bod i'r Gweinidog ddisgwyl yn y lle cyntaf i'r consortia fod yn weithredol erbyn Medi 2012 yn uchelgeisiol. Yn sicr, roedd yr awdurdodau lleol yn gweld yn glir y gwaith sylweddol yr oedd ei angen er mwyn aildrefnu gwasanaeth fel hyn, gyda sawl penderfyniad yn gorfod mynd yn ôl i'r awdurdod lleol ar hyd y daith o ddod yn wasanaeth gweithredol. I mi, mae hynny'n adlewyrchu'r holl fodd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi delio gyda'r mater yma: mynd ati i greu system fandio heb sicrhau'r trefniadau angenrheidiol i gefnogi'r ysgolion hynny a oedd angen y gefnogaeth fwyaf. Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog y drefn fandio ym mis Rhagfyr y llynedd, gan roi ymrwymiad clir y byddai'r ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5 yn cael cefnogaeth gan y consortia. Nid yw'r

consortia give an opportunity to redirect resources from management and bureaucracy into the classroom. They also give local authorities an opportunity to share experiences and expertise, and to share, but more importantly learn from, best practice. That is why I have accepted the principle of establishing these consortia, and it is why I believe that they should be driving the three Welsh Government priorities for education: improving literacy, improving numeracy, and—as we have heard on a number of occasions—breaking the link between educational attainment and deprivation. However, establishing these consortia has been fraught with difficulty. The Minister pledged, as we have heard, that the consortia would be operational by September this year, but that has not been the case.

The annual Estyn report for 2010-11 was published at the end of January, and it showed that working in partnership has not had an inadequate impact on improving outcomes for learners to date. It also states that although all local authorities liaise with their regional and local education consortia, very few of them are able to report clearly on the impact of this joint working in improving services or outcomes. Therefore, these consortia need to become operational as soon as possible in order to support the schools that have been placed in the lower bands, and in order to drive forward improvements in relation to the priorities I mentioned earlier. You could argue that for the Minister to expect the consortia to be in place by September 2012 was ambitious in the first place. Certainly, the local authorities clearly saw the significant work that was required to reorganise services in this way, with many decisions having to be referred back to the local authority, and so forth, along the way to becoming a fully operational service. To me, that once again reflects the whole way that the Government has dealt with this issue: creating a banding system without ensuring the necessary arrangements to support those schools that most needed the support. The Minister announced the banding system in December last year, with a clear commitment that schools in bands 4 and 5 would be given support by the consortia. The consortia are still not fully operational. In the meantime, we have schools that have been stigmatised

consortia yn dal i weithredu'n llawn. Yn y cyfamser, mae gennym ysgolion sydd wedi cael y stigma o fandio heb y gefnogaeth a addawyd.

5.00 p.m.

Deallaf fod y consortia hyn am greu ysgolion arweiniol a fydd yn gyfrifol am helpu ysgolion eraill yn eu rhanbarthau. Serch hynny, mae'n parhau i fod yn aneglur ar ba sail y bydd yr ysgolion arweiniol hyn yn cael eu dewis a beth fydd y goblygiadau i'r ysgolion hyn o safbwynt athrawon. A fyddant efallai'n cael eu tynnu allan o'r dosbarth i ddarparu cefnogaeth i eraill, gan roi pwysau gwaith ychwanegol ar yr ysgolion a'r unigolion hynny? Yn ogystal, wrth gwrs, mae cwestiynau ynghylch yr arian a fydd yn dod i dalu am hyn. Rwyf wedi clywed consyrn gan rai am y ffaith y bydd ysgolion ag arnynt angen cymorth yn gorfod cyfrannu at y gost ychwanegol hon. Os felly, bydd hynny'n creu problemau pellach. Yn ogystal, fel y clywsom yn gynharach yn y ddadl hon, mae cwestiwn ynghylch sut y bydd ysgolion yn cael hyder yn y consortia tra'n bod yn darllen yn y wasg eu bod yn cael cryn drafferth recriwtio pobl i rai o'r swyddi allweddol. Fel y dywedais ar y cychwyn, mae cryn gytundeb mai dyma'r model sydd ei angen, ond mae'n dod yn fwyfwy amlwg bod cwestiynau mawr i'w gofyn am y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi mynd o'i chwmpas hi.

Rwyf hefyd am wneud ychydig o sylwadau am y ddarpariaeth Gymraeg o fewn y drefniadaeth newydd hon. Teimlaf efallai y bydd angen canllawiau ar y ddarpariaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, gan fod modd rhagweld y gallai rhai awdurdodau lleol anghydweld o ran sut i flaenoriaethu darpariaeth yn yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae adnoddau ar gyfer Cymraeg fel ail iaith wedi bod yn brin o fewn consortiwm canolbarth y de, er enghraifft. Mae'r rhwydwaith dysgu a blaengaredd i ysgolion—neu LINKS, i ddefnyddio'r acronym Saesneg—wedi cael ei sefydlu yno i gefnogi ysgolion, ond dim ond un rôl sydd wedi cael ei sefydlu o fewn LINKS i ymdrin ag addysg Gymraeg. Mae hynny mewn ardal lle mae 60 o adrannau Cymraeg fel ail iaith o fewn y consortia, gyda 19 ohonynt yng Nghaerdydd yn unig. Mae rhai o'r materion sy'n wynebu'r adrannau

by banding without the support promised.

I understand that these consortia will create lead schools that will be responsible for assisting other schools in their areas. However, it is still unclear how these lead schools will be selected and what the implications will be for the schools in terms of teachers. Will they, perhaps, be taken out of classrooms to provide support elsewhere, putting additional burdens on the schools and individuals involved? In addition, of course, there are questions about the funds that will be available to pay for this. I have heard concerns from some that schools that require assistance will have to contribute to this additional cost. If so, that will, in itself, create further problems. Additionally, as we heard earlier in this debate, there is a question about how schools are to have confidence in the consortia when we read in the press that they are having difficulty in recruiting people to some of their key posts. As I said at the outset, there is some agreement that this is the model that is needed, but it is becoming more and more apparent that there are significant questions to be asked about the way in which the Government has gone about this.

I also want to make a few comments on the Welsh-medium provision within this new regime. I feel that, perhaps, guidelines will be required on Welsh-medium provision, because one can anticipate some disagreement between certain local authorities on how to prioritise Welsh-medium provision. Resources for Welsh as a second language have been scarce within the south Wales central consortium, for example. The learning and innovation network for schools—or LINKS, to use its acronym—has been established to support schools but there is only one role that has been established within LINKS to deal with Welsh-medium education in an area where there are 60 Welsh second language departments, with 19 in Cardiff alone. Some of the issues facing those departments include not enough teachers with the necessary training and



hyn yn cynnwys dim digon o athrawon sy'n meddu ar yr hyfforddiant angenrheidiol a'r sgiliau iaith Gymraeg angenrheidiol i ddysgu'r pwnc. Oherwydd y diffyg athrawon, mae'n anodd rhyddhau'r athrawon sydd yno i fynd allan a rhannu eu harferion da yn ehangach o fewn y rhanbarth. Mae hefyd yn anodd sicrhau adnoddau ar gyfer y pwnc, gan nad yw'n bwnc craidd—mater y soniwyd amdano yn ystod cwestiynau yn gynharach y prynhawn yma.

Rwy'n sicr bod pawb yma, gan gynnwys Llywodraeth Cymru, am weld twf yr iaith Gymraeg ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Mae'n rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio y bydd rôl allweddol i'r consortia rhanbarthol wrth geisio gwireddu'r nod hwnnw.

**The Minister for Education and Skills (Leighton Andrews):** I welcome the debate this afternoon. The reason that we are in this situation in relation to the establishment of regional consortia is because, in the mid 1990s, local government support for education was fragmented. We went from having eight education authorities to 22. That dispersed expertise across Wales and it weakened the support that was available to schools. We have seen the consequence of that over time, and in the evidence that has been cited during this debate. We have no local authorities that are marked as 'excellent' by Estyn. We have a number that are clearly failing. The move to regional consortia was supported by the report of the task and finish group, chaired by Viv Thomas, on the structure for delivery of education in Wales. The consortia are up and running. In particular, they have established shared school-improvement services. We have agreed a review of consortia and their readiness to deliver, which will be completed before Christmas and will help inform policy direction for future delivery.

At the end of the day, it is down to the local authorities involved in the consortia to ensure that they are functioning and that they are providing the support. It is disappointing that the region that probably began ahead of the others—north Wales—is now probably not as far advanced as the others, in terms of its delivery of services. Members really have to

Welsh language skills to actually teach the subject. Given the shortage of teachers, it is then difficult to free up the teachers who are available to go out to spread best practice more widely within the region. It is also difficult to secure resources for the subject as it is not a core subject—something that was touched upon earlier this afternoon in questions.

I am sure that we all here, including the Welsh Government, want to see the Welsh language grow in all parts of Wales. We must not forget that there will be a key role for the regional consortia in trying to achieve that aim.

**Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau (Leighton Andrews):** Croesawaf y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Y rheswm ein bod yn y sefyllfa hon mewn perthynas â sefydlu consortia rhanbarthol yw oherwydd, yng nghanol y 1990au, aeth cymorth llywodraeth leol i addysg yn dameidiog. O sefyllfa lle bu wyth awdurdod addysg cafwyd 22. O ganlyniad cafodd arbenigedd ei wasgaru ledled Cymru gan beri i'r cymorth a oedd ar gael i ysgolion wanhau. Rydym wedi gweld canlyniad hynny dros amser, ac yn y dystiolaeth y cyfeiriwyd ati yn ystod y ddadl hon. Nid oes gennym unrhyw awdurdodau lleol sy'n cael eu nodi'n 'rhagorol' gan Estyn. Mae gennym nifer sydd yn amlwg yn methu. Cafodd y newid tuag at gonsortia rhanbarthol ei gefnogi gan adroddiad y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Viv Thomas, ar y strwythur ar gyfer darparu addysg yng Nghymru. Mae'r consortia yn weithredol. Yn benodol, maent wedi sefydlu gwasanaethau gwella ysgolion ar y cyd. Rydym wedi cytuno ar adolygiad o'r consortia a'u parodrwydd i gyflawni, a gaiff ei gwblhau cyn y Nadolig ac a fydd yn helpu i lywio cyfeiriad polisi ar gyfer cyflawni yn y dyfodol.

Yn y pen draw, mae'n dibynnu ar yr awdurdodau lleol sy'n cymryd rhan yn y consortia i sicrhau eu bod yn weithredol a'u bod yn rhoi'r cymorth. Mae'n siomedig bod y rhanbarth a ddechreuodd ar y blaen i'r gweddill siŵr o fod—gogledd Cymru—bellach ar ei hôl hi yn ôl pob tebyg o'i gymharu â'r lleill, o ran darparu

make up their minds about this: do they want me to run education from the centre, or do they want local authorities to run the consortia? There is no two ways about that. That is the choice that faces them. In which case, there is bound to be a degree of unevenness in the way that these organisations are put together and in the way that they deliver.

A number of colleagues have made reference to funding. We have raised the funding that is available to schools by 1% above the block grant that we receive from the UK Government, even at a time of severe restriction on our budgets. We have also forced the agreement of local authorities to the 80% delegation rates. That has been achieved across Wales as a whole and by most local authorities. They have to move to 85% delegation by September 2014. I have met with local authority leaders since the elections in May and I think that the commitment to education remains with them, as it did before the election, despite changes in the authorities. There are still question marks over the delivery in some areas.

People have made reference to schools in bands 4 and 5. We made money available, not to be 'sloshing around', as the Conservative education spokesperson said, but against agreed plans, which had to be agreed in conjunction with local authorities and the consortia. That money is being used in specific and targeted ways and we have had reports back on how it is being used. I was disappointed when the Plaid Cymru spokesperson referred to schools in bands 4 and 5 as 'so-called failing schools'. That is not the terminology that I would use. I would see these schools as keys to the success of our system. If we can improve the performance of schools in bands 4 and 5, we will see a disproportionate level of improvement across the entire system. We are going through the results from the summer at the moment to see how the work has impacted within those band 4 and 5 schools.

Let me remind colleagues and the opposition parties that the approach of grading schools was a commitment in our party's manifesto.

gwasanaethau. Rhaid i'r Aelodau fod yn glir eu meddwl am hyn: a ydynt am imi redeg addysg o'r canol, neu a ydynt am i awdurdodau lleol redeg y consortia? Nid oes dwywaith amdani. Dyna'r dewis sy'n eu hwynebu. Os felly, mae'n sicr y bydd rhywfaint o anghysondeb yn y ffordd y mae'r sefydliadau hyn yn cael eu sefydlu ac yn y ffordd y maent yn cyflawni.

Cyfeiriodd nifer o gyd-Aelodau at gyllid. Rydym wedi cynyddu'r cyllid sydd ar gael i ysgolion 1% yn uwch na'r grant bloc yr ydym yn ei dderbyn gan Lywodraeth y DU, hyd yn oed ar adeg o gyfyngu mawr ar ein cyllidebau. Rydym hefyd wedi gorfodi awdurdodau lleol i gytuno i'r cyfraddau dirprwyo o 80%. Mae hynny wedi cael ei gyflawni ledled Cymru gyfan a chan y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid iddynt symud i ddirprwyo 85% erbyn mis Medi 2014. Rwyf wedi cyfarfod ag arweinwyr awdurdodau lleol ers yr etholiadau ym mis Mai a chredaf fod yr ymrwymiad i addysg yn parhau fel y bu cyn yr etholiad, er gwaethaf y newidiadau yn yr awdurdodau. Mae amheumon o hyd ynglŷn â darpariaeth mewn rhai meysydd.

Cyfeiriodd pobl at ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5. Rydym wedi darparu arian, nid 'llif sylweddol o arian', fel y dywedodd llefarydd addysg y Ceidwadwyr, ond yn unol â chynlluniau y cytunwyd arnynt, y bu'n rhaid cytuno arnynt ar y cyd ag awdurdodau lleol a'r consortia. Mae'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei ddefnyddio mewn ffyrdd penodol ac wedi'u targedu ac rydym wedi cael adroddiadau yn ôl ar y ffordd y caiff ei ddefnyddio. Cefais fy siomi pan gyfeiriodd llefarydd Plaid Cymru at ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5 fel 'ysgolion sy'n methu fel y'u gelwir'. Nid dyna'r derminoleg y byddwn yn ei defnyddio. Byddwn yn ystyried yr ysgolion hyn yn allwedd i lwyddiant ein system. Os gallwn wella perfformiad ysgolion ym mandiau 4 a 5, byddwn yn gweld lefel anghymesur o welliant ar draws y system gyfan. Rydym yn mynd drwy ganlyniadau'r haf ar hyn o bryd i weld sut mae'r gwaith wedi effeithio ar yr ysgolion hynny ym mandiau 4 a 5.

Gadewch imi atgoffa fy nghyd-Aelodau a'r gwrthbleidiau fod y dull o raddio ysgolion yn ymrwymiad ym manifest o ein plaid. Rydym

We are implementing that and will be implementing it for the primary sector as well. The Conservative spokesperson offered to send me the details of her survey of primary schools a few weeks ago. I am still waiting to receive them and look forward to getting them from her.

We have published a comprehensive improvement plan for the whole of the Welsh education system, which makes it clear what our responsibilities are as Government, as well as those of the consortia, local authorities and schools. That is very much focused on meeting the international challenges that my colleague the Member for Cardiff Central spoke about, and on identifying in very clear ways the kinds of best practice that we would expect to see being rolled out. Where schools are adopting best practice, we are seeing transformation in performance. Some Members made reference to the issue of family support, which is key. Some schools are making use of the pupil deprivation grant to ensure that family support arrangements are in place to assist in the development of overall improvement. The Member for Cardiff Central also rightly said that we are committed to and are rolling out the doubling of support on Flying Start, which will give pre-school support to so many young people across Wales in our poorest communities.

Reference was made by the Liberal Democrat spokesperson to the practitioner panel. It has now had a number of meetings. It has been a valuable resource to me and to officials in testing ideas and getting engagement from the profession. I have no problem with sharing information about discussions that have gone on within that.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd asked specific questions about Welsh-medium provision within the consortia; that is a genuine issue about which I have some concerns myself. I endorse what he said and discussed it with UCAC earlier this week.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas asked me whether I could guarantee that the regional consortia would ensure additional support for additional learning needs. I do not think that I

yn gweithredu hynny, a byddwn yn ei weithredu ar gyfer y sector cynradd hefyd. Cynigiodd llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr anfon manylion ei harolwg o ysgolion cynradd ataf ychydig wythnosau yn ôl. Rwy'n dal i aros i'w derbyn ac edrychaf ymlaen at eu cael ganddi.

Rydym wedi cyhoeddi cynllun gwella cynhwysfawr ar gyfer cyfundrefn addysg Cymru gyfan, sy'n ei gwneud yn glir beth yw ein cyfrifoldebau fel Llywodraeth, yn ogystal â rhai'r consortia, awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion. Mae hynny'n canolbwyntio'n fawr iawn ar ateb yr heriau rhyngwladol y soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod dros Ganol Caerdydd amdanynt, ac ar nodi mewn ffyrdd clir iawn y mathau o arfer gorau y byddem yn disgwyl eu gweld yn cael ei gyflwyno. Lle mae ysgolion yn mabwysiadu arfer gorau, rydym yn gweld perfformiad yn cael ei drawsnewid. Cyfeiriodd rhai Aelodau at gymorth i deuluoedd, sy'n allweddol. Mae rhai ysgolion yn defnyddio'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion i sicrhau bod trefniadau cymorth i deuluoedd ar waith i helpu i sicrhau gwelliant cyffredinol. Nododd yr Aelod dros Ganol Caerdydd hefyd, a hynny'n gwbl gywir, ein bod wedi ymrwymo i ddyblu'r cymorth i Dechrau'n Deg a'n bod yn cyflwyno hynny, a fydd yn rhoi cymorth cyn ysgol i gymaint o bobl ifanc ledled Cymru yn ein cymunedau tlotaf.

Cyfeiriodd llefarydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol at y panel o ymarferwyr. Mae wedi cyfarfod sawl gwaith bellach. Bu'n adnodd gwerthfawr imi ac i swyddogion er mwyn profi syniadau ac ymgysylltu â'r proffesiwn. Nid oes gennyf broblem o ran rhannu gwybodaeth am drafodaethau sydd wedi mynd rhagddynt o fewn y panel hwnnw.

Gofynnodd Llyr Huws Gruffydd gwestiynau penodol am ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg o fewn y consortia; mae hynny'n broblem wirioneddol y mae gennyf rai pryderon fy hun yn ei chylch. Cefnogaf yr hyn a ddywedodd a thrafodais hynny gydag UCAC yn gynharach yr wythnos hon.

Gofynnodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas imi a allwn roi sicrwydd y byddai'r consortia rhanbarthol yn rhoi cymorth ychwanegol ar gyfer anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Ni chredaf y

can give that guarantee. Nothing in the creation of regional consortia removes the responsibilities of local authorities to deliver in this area as in every other area. However, their focus at the moment is on the development of school improvement services. They are making progress, but they need to make progress faster. There will come a time, during the lifetime of this Assembly, when we will have to look very carefully at the delivery by local government of education services, and whether their co-operation in regional consortia has worked. If it has not, then there may be other models that we will need to look at, for ensuring support for schools. We are open to that, and I have made it clear in the Chamber before that there are a number of other models that we could adopt, and I have not ruled out support for those.

In terms of today's debate, we will support amendments 1, 2, 4, 6, 7 and 8 and we will oppose amendments 3, 5, 9 and 10. We are committed to raising standards in education in Wales. We have a programme that is fully under way. I appreciate that some parties in this Chamber do not support aspects of that programme, but we are determined to raise standards.

**Simon Thomas:** Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a gyfrannodd at y ddadl, a diolch yn arbennig am gael dadl gymesur, resymol. Nid pwrpas y ddadl, fel y dywedais ar y cychwyn, oedd bwrw bai, ond yn hytrach edrych yn ofalus ar yr agwedd hon ar ddelifro gan y Llywodraeth a oedd, yn ein barn ni, yn wan mewn rhannau o Gymru. Mae'r ddadl wedi cefnogi'r hyn roeddem yn ei dybio, ac rwy'n credu iddi fod yn werthfawr i daflu goleuni ar hyn, gan ei fod mor bwysig; mae'r Llywodraeth ei hun wedi dweud mai'r consortia rhanbarthol yw'r ffordd allweddol o wella cyrhaeddiad ymlith ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

Rwyf eisiau cloi drwy fynd dros rai o'r dadleuon sydd wedi'u gwneud gan Aelodau, a nodi'n glir lle mae Plaid Cymru yn sefyll arnynt. Roedd Aled yn ddigon clir, fel ni, ei fod yn cefnogi consortia mewn egwyddor, ond ei fod am eu gweld yn gweithio. Mae ganddo bwynt—ac mae pwynt yng ngwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—yn glŷn â'r angen i ystyried canllawiau

gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw. Wrth greu consortia rhanbarthol nid oes dim yn dileu cyfrifoldebau awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu yn y maes hwn fel ym mhob maes arall. Fodd bynnag, maent yn canolbwyntio ar hyn o bryd ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau gwella ysgolion. Maent yn gwneud cynnydd, ond mae angen iddynt wneud cynnydd yn gynt. Daw amser, yn ystod oes y Cynulliad hwn, pan fydd yn rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y modd y mae llywodraeth leol yn darparu gwasanaethau addysg, a pha un a yw eu cydweithrediad mewn consortia rhanbarthol wedi gweithio. Os nad ydyw, yna efallai y bydd angen inni edrych ar fodolau eraill, er mwyn sicrhau cymorth i ysgolion. Rydym yn agored i ystyried hynny, ac rwyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir yn y Siambr o'r blaen fod nifer o fodolau eraill y gallem eu mabwysiadu, ac nid wyf wedi'u diystyru.

O ran y ddadl heddiw, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliannau 1, 2, 4, 6, 7 ac 8 a byddwn yn gwrthwynebu gwelliannau 3, 5, 9 a 10. Rydym yn ymrwymedig i godi safonau mewn addysg yng Nghymru. Mae gennym raglen sy'n mynd rhagddi. Sylweddolaf nad oes rhai pleidiau yn y Siambr hon yn cefnogi agweddau ar y rhaglen honno, ond rydym yn benderfynol o godi safonau.

**Simon Thomas:** I thank everyone who contributed to the debate, and thank them particularly for a measured, rational debate. It was not the purpose of the debate to cast blame, but to look carefully at this aspect of delivery by Government, which we felt was weak in parts of Wales. The debate has supported our preconceptions, and it has been valuable therefore to shed light on this, because it is such an important issue; the Government itself has said that regional consortia are the key method for improving attainment among our children and young people.

I want to conclude by rehearsing some of the arguments put forward by Members and to make clear where we in Plaid Cymru stand on these. Aled was quite clear, as we are, that he supports the consortia in principle, and wants to see them working. He had a point—there is a point in the Liberal Democrat amendment—that there is a need to consider stronger guidelines for using the pupil

cryfach ar gyfer defnyddio'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion. Mae digon o dystiolaeth yn Lloegr nad yw'r grant hwnnw wedi'i ddefnyddio'n berffaith, o bell ffordd, ac mae gofyn inni ddysgu gwersi yn fuan yng Nghymru, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydym yn gwastraffu'r adnodd hwnnw. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi adrodd sawl gwaith yma sut mae'r grant yn cael ei ddefnyddio, mae angen inni fod yn glir a ffocysu'n fwy ar y materion hynny.

Roedd Angela yn iawn i'n hatgoffa am gam gwag y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â bandio; rwy'n cytuno ag Angela yn hynny o beth. Gallwn gytuno ar ddau o welliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, ond nid ydym yn cytuno ar welliant 10, sy'n sôn am eu harolwg o ysgolion. Rwy'n derbyn yr arolwg, ac yn derbyn bod prifathrawon yn teimlo felly, ond nid wyf yn meddwl ei fod yn arolwg y gallwn ei gymeradwyo fel Cynulliad mewn gwelliant, sef yr hyn rydych yn gofyn inni'i wneud. Felly, ni fyddaf yn ildio i'r temtasiwn hwnnw. Derbyniodd Angela y pwynt a wneuthum i, bod unrhyw oedi yn y system yn effeithio ar y plant, a dyna'r hyn rydym yn canolbwyntio arno yma. Ar ddiwedd y dydd, nid yw strwythurau ddim yma nac acw i mi, nac i'r Gweinidog, gobeithio; yn hytrach, mater i'r plant yw hwn.

Roedd Jocelyn Davies yn ddigon clir bod bandio yn gallu arwain at gylch o ddirywiad o fewn ysgolion, ac roedd yn ein hatgoffa mai cynghrair sydd gennym, i bob pwrpas, os nad oes gennym system lle mae'r bandiau isaf yn gwagio. Nid yw Plaid Cymru yn cytuno â hynny. Dyna pam y dywedais, wrth agor y ddadl, bod yr ysgolion hyn yn cael eu hystyried yn ysgolion sy'n methu. Nid fi sy'n eu disgrifio felly—defnyddiais y geiriau '*so called*'. Rwy'n cofio, pan gyhoeddwyd y bandiau, bod rhieni a disgyblion yn dweud bod eu hysgolion yn methu oherwydd y band y'u rhoddwyd ynddo. Dyna oedd y si ar yr iard, ac mae hynny'n realiti.

Atgoffodd Jocelyn ni am y *laptops* yn Torfaen, ac mae'n ddiddorol bod y Llywodraeth hon wedi caniatáu i bedair gwaith yn fwy o arian gael ei wario ar *laptops* sydd mewn warws yn Nhorfaen nag ar y cynllun peilot *laptops* dan y Llywodraeth flaenorol. Yn sicr, nid yw Plaid Cymru wedi colli ffydd yn y

deprivation grant. There is plenty of evidence from England that that grant has not been used perfectly, by any means, and we need to learn lessons quickly in Wales, to ensure that we do not waste that resource. The Minister himself has reported on a number of occasions how that grant is used, but we need to be clearer and more focused on those issues.

Angela appropriately reminded us of the mistake made by the Government on banding, and I agree with her in that regard. I could agree to two of the Conservatives' amendments, but not to amendment 10, which mentions their survey of schools. I accept the survey, and that headteachers feel that way, but I do not think that that is something that we as an Assembly could approve, which is what you are asking us to do. I will not give in to that particular temptation this afternoon. Angela accepted the point that I made, that any delays in this system will have an impact on children. Structures, at the end of the day, are neither here nor there for me, and nor, I hope for the Minister; this is, rather, an issue for pupils.

Jocelyn Davies was quite clear in her comments that banding can lead to a vicious circle in schools, and she reminded us that, if we do not have a system where the lower bands are emptied, to all intents and purposes you have a league table. Plaid Cymru does not agree with that, which is why I said that the schools are considered to be failing schools. I am not the one calling them that—I did use the words '*so-called*'. I remember, on the publication of bands, that parents and teachers were saying that their schools were failing, because of the banding. That was the word in the playground, if you like, and that is the reality.

Jocelyn also reminded us of the laptops in Torfaen. It is interesting, is it not, that this Government allowed four times more funds to be spent on laptops that are now in a warehouse in Torfaen than on the pilot laptop scheme under the previous Government? Certainly, Plaid Cymru has not lost faith in

ffaith bod *laptops* i blant—yn enwedig o ardaloedd difreintiedig—yn allweddol i ddelifro gwelliant yn eu cyrhaeddiad.

the fact that laptops for pupils, particularly in deprived areas, are crucial in delivering improved educational achievement.

Roedd Jenny Rathbone yn ffocysu ar deuluoedd a chefnogaeth deuluol. Cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny—dywedais hynny wrth agor y ddadl. Mae'n rhaid inni beidio â cholli ffocws ar yr angen am y gefnogaeth agos honno ar deuluoedd. Mae'n gefnogaeth sy'n gallu costio'n ddrud, ond mae'n gefnogaeth sy'n talu ar ei chanfed o ran plant yn gwella. Cytunaf â sylwadau Jenny; mae'n dda clywed enghreifftiau da hefyd o sut mae ysgolion yn trefnu'u hunain fel canolfannau dysgu gydol oes, fel petai.

Jenny Rathbone focused on families and family support, and I agree entirely with that. I made that point in opening the debate: we cannot lose focus on the need for that close support for families. That support can be expensive, but it pays for itself in terms of the improvements made in educational achievement. I agree with Jenny's comments; it is also good to hear positive examples of how schools organise themselves as lifelong learning centres, for example.

5.15 p.m.

Soniodd Rhodri Glyn a Mark Isherwood yn benodol am blant ag anghenion arbennig, neu, dylwn i ddweud, disgyblion ag anghenion arbennig. Bu i Rhodri Glyn ffocysu'n arbennig ar addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Rwyf innau hefyd wedi ffeindio yn y gwaith etholaethol rwyf yn ei wneud bod problem fawr o ran awtistiaeth a dyslecsia, yn arbennig o ran cael cefnogaeth yn y cyddestun hwnnw, megis therapydd lleferydd ar gyfer plant. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod hynny. Rwy'n derbyn nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gallu gwarantu pethau; dof i at sylwadau'r Gweinidog yn fuan.

Rhodri Glyn and Mark Isherwood specifically mentioned children with special needs, or, I should say, pupils with special needs. Rhodri Glyn focused particularly on Welsh-medium education. I have also found in the constituency work that I have carried out that there is a real problem with autism and dyslexia, especially in terms of support such as speech and language therapy for children in that situation. It is important that we acknowledge that. I accept that the Government cannot make guarantees; I will come to the Minister's comments in due time.

Mae Llyr Huws Gruffydd yn gywir i danlinellu potensial y consortia, a hynny ar gyfer arallgyfeirio adnoddau o fiwrocratiaeth i'r dosbarth. Y broblem ar hyn o bryd, fodd bynnag, yw nad oes gennym dystiolaeth o hynny. Rwy'n derbyn ei bod yn eithaf cynnar, ond rydym eisiau gweld y dystiolaeth honno. Rwyf hefyd wedi cwrdd ag athrawon Cymraeg ail iaith o gylch Caerdydd, ac rwyf innau wedi clywed yr un peth ag yr amlinellodd Llyr, sef bod diffyg darpariaeth sylweddol yn y cynllun hwn. Roeddwn yn falch clywed bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod y broblem honno, a'i fod yn rhywbeth y bydd yn rhaid inni ei ystyried.

Llyr Huws Gruffydd is right to underline the potential of the consortia to redirect resources from bureaucracy to the classroom. The problem at present, however, is that we have no evidence of that. I accept that it is at an early stage, but we want to see that evidence. I have met teachers of Welsh as a second language from the Cardiff area, and I have also heard the same issues that Llyr outlined, that there is a significant shortage of provision in this area. I was pleased to hear that the Minister has acknowledged that problem and that it is something that we will need to address.

Roedd y Gweinidog yn glir wrth ateb, ac rwy'n ddiolchgar am ei ateb. Rwy'n edrych ymlaen at weld adolygiad cyn y Nadolig ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd datganiad gan y Gweinidog ar hynny. Credaf fod angen

The Minister was clear in his response and I am grateful for that response. I look forward to a review before Christmas and I hope that there will be a statement from the Minister on that. I think that we need confirmation that

cadarnhad bod y £10,000 hwn yn cyrraedd pob ysgol sydd ei angen ar hyn o bryd, a hefyd bod gennym ddealltwriaeth well o sut mae'r grant amddifadedd yn cael ei ddefnyddio.

Gofynnodd y Gweinidog yn olaf a ydyw'n gyfrifol am yr holl bethau sy'n digwydd yn ein hysgolion. Nac ydyw; dyna pam mae gennym ni awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud hyn: ein job ni yw dal y Gweinidog i gyfrif am y pethau y mae wedi'u haddo i'r Siambr. Mae wedi addo y bydd y consortia yn weithredol, a dyna pam rydym yma heddiw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad, felly gohiriaf y pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

this £10,000 is reaching every school that needs it at the moment, and we also need confirmation that we have a better understanding of how the pupil deprivation grant is being used.

The Minister finally asked whether he is responsible for everything that happens in our schools. No, he is not; that is why we have local education authorities. However, I have to say this: our job is to hold the Minister to account for the things that he has pledged in the Chamber. He did pledge that these consortia would be operational and that is why we are here today.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is that the motion without amendment be agreed. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

## **Dadl Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats Debate**

### **Cyllideb Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru The Welsh Ambulance Service Budget**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 4 and 7 in the name of Jane Hutt, amendments 2, 3 and 5 in the name of Aled Roberts, amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 8, 9 and 10 in the name of William Graham. If amendment 4 is moved amendment 5 will be deselected. If amendment 6 is agreed amendment 7 will be deselected.

*Cynnig NDM5085 Aled Roberts*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. Yn nodi:*

*a) nad yw Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, ar 31 Hydref 2012, wedi cytuno ar gyllideb gyda Gwasanaeth*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Rwyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 4 a 7 yn enw Jane Hutt, gwelliannau 2, 3 a 5 yn enw Aled Roberts, gwelliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 8, 9 a 10 yn enw William Graham. Os derbynnir gwelliant 4, bydd gwelliant 5 yn cael ei ddad-ddethol. Os derbynnir gwelliant 6 caiff gwelliant 7 ei ddad-ddethol.

*Motion NDM5085 Aled Roberts*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Notes that:*

*a) the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee has not agreed a budget with the Wales Ambulance Service for the 2012/13*

*Ambiwlans Cymru ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2012-13;* *financial year, as of 31/10/2012;*

*b) nad yw Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru yn gallu paratoi cynlluniau gwasanaeth priodol oherwydd diffyg eglurder ariannol; ac* *b) the Welsh Ambulance Service is unable to prepare proper service plans due to a lack of financial clarity; and*

*c) am y pedwar mis diwethaf yn olynol, nid yw Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru wedi cyflawni ei darged Cymru gyfan lle mae ambiwlansys yn ymateb o fewn wyth munud i 65% o alwadau Categori A (lle mae bywyd yn y fantol).* *c) for the last four successive months the Welsh Ambulance Service has failed to meet its all-Wales target of 65% of Category A (immediately life-threatening) calls receiving an ambulance response time within 8 minutes.*

*2. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i:*

*2. Calls on the Welsh Government to:*

*a) sicrhau bod Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru yn cytuno ar gyllideb gydag Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2012-13 fel mater o frys;* *a) ensure that the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee agrees a budget with the Welsh Ambulance Service Trust for the 2012/13 year as a matter of urgency;*

*b) amlinellu rôl Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru o ran ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth a'r effaith y gallai'r ad-drefnu hwnnw ei chael ar eu cyllideb a'u perfformiad;* *b) outline the role of the Wales Ambulance Service Trust with regard to service reconfiguration and the impact that reconfiguration could have on their budget and performance;*

*c) asesu ar fyrder y cymorth sydd ar gael i Wasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru fel y gall gyrraedd ei darged amser ymateb o 65% y cytunwyd arno; a* *c) urgently assess the support available to the Wales Ambulance Service so they can meet their agreed 65% response time targets; and*

*d) adolygu'r trefniadau ar fyrder lle mae Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, sef pwyllgor sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o'r holl Fyrddau Iechyd Lleol, yn gorfod cytuno ar gyllideb ar gyfer ymddiriedolaeth arall.* *d) urgently review arrangements whereby the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee, a committee comprising representatives of all the Local Health Boards, has to agree the budget for another trust.*

**Kirsty Williams:** I move the motion.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf y cynnig.

I will also be moving the subsequent amendments to that motion that were tabled in the name of Aled Roberts.

Byddaf hefyd yn cynnig y diwygiadau dilynol i'r cynnig hwnnw a gyflwynwyd yn enw Aled Roberts.

Over the years, this Chamber has been the setting for many debates regarding the ambulance service in Wales and, today, the Welsh Liberal Democrats make no apology for bringing this important subject to the Chamber once again. An ambulance service that is able to respond quickly, with well-skilled, motivated staff, is often the crucial first stage in a response to a medical

Dros y blynyddoedd, bu llawer o ddadleuon yn y Siambr hon ynghylch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru a, heddiw, nid yw Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ymddiheuro am ddod â'r mater pwysig hwn gerbron y Siambr unwaith eto. Yn aml, gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n gallu ymateb yn gyflym, gyda staff medrus, uchel eu cymhelliant, yw'r cam cyntaf hanfodol mewn



emergency. That initial response by the ambulance service and its paramedics can mean the difference between life and death for a patient. After all, you can have the best trauma teams in the world, with all the latest equipment, waiting in your accident and emergency departments, but if that patient has not arrived at that A&E department in those crucial early minutes of an episode, it can often be too late for them to do anything.

Those minutes waiting for that ambulance to arrive must be the longest minutes in the life of a patient and their relatives. Those 8.5 minutes must sometimes seem like 8.5 years. We know what a good service should look like, but, too often, that is not what Welsh patients get. Delays in responses are often the case and staff in the ambulance service are often demoralised. They are often racing to calls many miles away from their usual practices. In my constituency, I have cases where the ambulance based in Ystradgynlais has been asked to respond to calls in areas as far afield as Hay-on-Wye and Newbridge-on-Wye. That is the equivalent of a citizen of Cardiff ringing 999 and waiting for the ambulance to arrive from Llanelli. I suspect that a resident of Cardiff would not put up with it, and I do not see why my constituents should either. The crews do the best that they can, often putting their own lives at risk to try to respond to a call. They are left frustrated, often holding on to patients in ambulances, or standing by them in corridors of A&E departments, because they are unable to hand over their care to A&E staff.

The Government, in its delivery document, identifies response times to ambulance calls and waits at A&E as some of the key indicators of whether the Government is delivering on behalf of the people of Wales. After all, as the First Minister says, this Government is all about delivery. The reality is that in the last nine months, which are the most recent figures available, the Government has met its response time target

ymateb i argyfwng meddygol. Gall yr ymateb cychwynnol hwnnw gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'i barafeddygon olygu'r gwahaniaeth rhwng bywyd a marwolaeth i glaf. Wedi'r cyfan, gallwch gael y timau trawma gorau yn y byd, gyda'r holl offer diweddaraf, yn aros yn eich adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ond os nad yw'r claf hwnnw wedi cyrraedd yr adran damweiniau ac achosion brys honno yn ystod y munudau cynnar hollbwysig hynny o achos brys, yn aml gall fod yn rhy hwyr iddynt wneud unrhyw beth.

Rhaid mai'r munudau hynny yn aros i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gyrraedd yw'r munudau hiraf ym mywyd claf a'u perthnasau. Rhaid bod yr 8.5 munud weithiau'n teimlo'n 8.5 mlynedd. Gwyddom sut beth y dylai gwasanaeth da fod, ond, yn rhy aml, nid dyna'r hyn a gaiff cleifion yng Nghymru. Ceir oedi mewn ymatebion yn aml ac mae staff yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn aml wedi digalonni. Maent yn aml yn brysio i ymateb i alwadau filltiroedd lawer i ffwrdd o'u practisau arferol. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae gennyf achosion lle y gofynnwyd i'r ambiwlans yn Ystradgynlais ymateb i alwadau mewn ardaloedd mor bell i ffwrdd â'r Gelli Gandryll a'r Bontnewydd-ar-Wy. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i ddinesydd yng Nghaerdydd yn ffonio 999 ac yn aros i'r ambiwlans gyrraedd o Lanelli. Ni chredaf y byddai trigolion Caerdydd yn goddef hynny, ac ni welaf pam y dylai fy etholwyr innau oddef hynny ychwaith. Mae'r criwiau yn gwneud eu gorau, yn aml yn peryglu eu bywydau eu hunain i geisio ymateb i alwad. Fe'u gadewir yn teimlo'n rhwystredig, yn aml yn gorfod cadw cleifion mewn ambiwlansys, neu'n aros gyda hwy yng nghoridorau adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, am na allant eu trosglwyddo i ofal staff yr adrannau hynny.

Mae'r Llywodraeth, yn ei dogfen ynghylch cyflawni, yn nodi bod amseroedd ymateb i alwadau ambiwlans ac amseroedd aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn rhai o'r dangosyddion allweddol sy'n dynodi a yw'r Llywodraeth yn cyflawni dros bobl Cymru. Wedi'r cyfan, fel y dywed y Prif Weinidog, cyflawni yw prif nod y Llywodraeth hon. Y gwir yw i'r Llywodraeth, yn y naw mis diwethaf, sef y

of reaching 65% of calls—only 65% of calls—within 8 minutes in only four of the last nine months. It has missed that target for five months. Actually, it has missed that target for the last four months: four months that are summer months, which is not the time of year that ambulance crews and the ambulance service are under the greatest pressure.

Often, I am told that we cannot expect anything better in Wales, because we are a rural country, but, actually, if one looks at the figures of individual areas, some rural areas fare better than others. Pembrokeshire has some of the better response times in Wales and areas such as Blaenau Gwent have some of the worst. In Blaenau Gwent's case, if you ring an ambulance, only 53% of the time will it get to you in 8 minutes—that is just over half; half the time you will wait longer.

That 65% target is already significantly lower than the targets that are set for the ambulance trusts in England and Scotland. I wonder what the justification is for that. If an ambulance needs to arrive within 8 minutes 75% of the time in England and Scotland, why is that not the case for our patients? Do Welsh patients not deserve a similar response? Actually, no area of Wales would reach the 75% target, if that was applied to this country—nowhere in Wales.

Lost ambulance hours, which is part of the cause of the difficulty in meeting response times, are the highest that they have ever been. Between January 2011 and February 2012, ambulances spent 821 days outside hospitals, waiting to transfer their patients. That is the equivalent of 2.3 years spent waiting outside. In the Royal Gwent Hospital alone, ambulances spent 125 days outside the A&E department, waiting to transfer their patients.

There are some very real challenges facing

fffigurau mwyaf diweddar sydd ar gael, gyflawni ei darged amser ymateb o gyrraedd o 65% o alwadau—dim ond 65% o alwadau—o fewn 8 munud mewn dim ond pedwar o'r naw mis diwethaf. Mae wedi methu'r targed hwnnw am bum mis. Mewn gwirionedd, mae wedi methu'r targed hwnnw am y pedwar mis diwethaf: pedwar mis yn ystod misoedd yr haf, nad yw'n adeg o'r flwyddyn pan fo criwiau ambiwlans a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans o dan y pwysau mwyaf.

Yn aml, dywedir wrthyf na allwn ddisgwyl dim byd gwell yng Nghymru, a hithau'n wlad wledig, ond, mewn gwirionedd, os edrychir ar ffigurau ardaloedd unigol, mae rhai ardaloedd gwledig yn gwneud yn well nag eraill. Mae gan sir Benfro rai o'r amseroedd ymateb gorau yng Nghymru ac mae gan ardaloedd fel Blaenau Gwent rai o'r amseroedd gwaethaf. Yn achos Blaenau Gwent, os ffoniwch am ambiwlans, dim ond 53% o'r amser y bydd yn eich cyrraedd o fewn 8 munud—mae hynny ychydig dros hanner; hanner yr amser y byddwch yn aros yn hwy.

Mae'r targed hwnnw o 65% eisoes dipyn yn is na'r targedau a osodir ar gyfer yr ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Tybed beth yw'r cyfiawnhad dros hynny. Os oes angen i ambiwlans gyrraedd o fewn 8 munud 75% o'r amser yn Lloegr a'r Alban, pam nad yw hynny'n wir i'n cleifion ni? Onid yw cleifion Cymru yn haeddu ymateb tebyg? A dweud y gwir, ni fyddai unrhyw ardal yng Nghymru yn cyrraedd y targed o 75%, os oedd hwnnw'n berthnasol i'r wlad hon—dim unman yng Nghymru.

Mae nifer yr oriau ambiwlans a gollir, sy'n rhan o'r rheswm dros yr anhawster i gyflawni'r amseroedd ymateb, yn uwch nag erioed. Rhwng mis Ionawr 2011 a mis Chwefror 2012, treuliodd ambiwlansys 821 diwrnod y tu allan i ysbytai, yn aros i drosglwyddo eu cleifion. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i 2.3 o flynyddoedd a dreulir yn aros y tu allan. Yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent yn unig, treuliodd ambiwlansys 125 diwrnod y tu allan i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys, yn aros i drosglwyddo eu cleifion.

Mae rhai heriau gwirioneddol yn wynebu

the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, and the solution, of course, does not lie solely within the hands of the ambulance organisation itself. The issue around lost hours is something that the NHS family as a whole needs to solve. A&E beds need to be released by transferring patients to wards. Wards need beds by releasing patients into the community, and we need community services for those patients to be released into. There is a vicious circle. However, of course, the ambulance service, I would argue, has not been helped in its ability to deliver on the Government's own targets, by the wrangling over the budget.

The reality is that, before this motion was tabled, there was no agreed budget for this financial year for the Welsh ambulance trust. I asked the First Minister about it prior to the half term holiday. I do not know what the First Minister keeps in his fancy red files, but it truly is not the answer to the problems, or the answer to the questions. He simply was not aware that this situation existed. He said that we were in the middle of budget negotiations, and it would all be solved as a part of that, but we are talking about this financial year—a budget that was agreed by the Assembly back in December. However, it has taken until the eighth month of the financial year for there to be a final agreed settlement. The Minister is shaking her head, and I would be very grateful if, in her contribution, she would explain the situation. If the Minister is convinced that such a budget existed in its entirety, I would be very grateful to hear what the figure is, because to date nobody has been able to supply that figure. Perhaps she could also explain, if there was such a budget, why there was subsequently an announcement a day after this motion was tabled that a final budget had been agreed and reached. Perhaps the difference lies in that little word, 'core', does it not? Perhaps we can understand better a little later on what 'core' means.

The result of this delay in agreeing a budget has been the laying off and the restriction of overtime for ambulance crews as the organisation looked to protect its financial

Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru, ac nid yw'r ateb, wrth gwrs, yn nwylo'r sefydliad ambiwlansys ei hun yn unig. Mae'r broblem o ran oriau a gollir yn rhywbeth y mae angen i'r GIG cyfan ei datrys. Mae angen i welyau brys gael eu rhyddhau drwy drosglwyddo cleifion i wardiau. Mae angen i welyau mewn wardiau gael eu rhyddhau drwy ryddhau cleifion i'r gymuned, ac mae angen gwasanaethau cymunedol er mwyn rhyddhau'r cleifion hynny iddynt. Mae'n gylch dieflig. Fodd bynnag, wrth gwrs, nid yw'r ffræo ynglŷn â'r gyllideb wedi helpu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans i gyflawni targedau'r Llywodraeth ei hun, fe dybiwn i.

Y gwir yw, cyn i'r cynnig hwn gael ei gyflwyno, na chytunwyd ar gyllideb ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Holais y Prif Weinidog amdani cyn gwyliau hanner tymor. Ni wn beth mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei gadw yn ei ffeiliau crand coch, ond yn sicr nid ydynt yn cynnwys yr ateb i'r problemau, na'r ateb i'r cwestiynau. Nid oedd yn ymwybodol bod y sefyllfa hon yn bodoli. Dywedodd ein bod yng nghanol trafodaethau ynglŷn â'r gyllideb, a byddai'r cyfan yn cael ei ddatrys fel rhan o hynny, ond sôn am y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol yr ydym—cyllideb y cytunwyd arni gan y Cynulliad yn ôl ym mis Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi cymryd tan yr wythfed mis o'r flwyddyn ariannol cyn inni gael setliad terfynol y cytunwyd arno. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ysgwyd ei phen, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe bai, yn ystod ei chyfraniad, yn esbonio'r sefyllfa. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn argyhoeddedig bod cyllideb o'r fath yn bodoli yn ei chyfanrwydd, byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn o glywed beth yw'r ffigur, oherwydd hyd yn hyn nid oes neb wedi llwyddo i ddarparu'r ffigur hwnnw. Efallai y gallai hefyd egluro, pe bai cyllideb o'r fath, pam bod cyhoeddiad ddiwrnod ar ôl i'r cynnig hwn gael ei gyflwyno fod cytundeb ynglŷn â chyllideb derfynol. Ai'r gair bach, 'craidd' yw'r gwahaniaeth tybed? Efallai y byddwn yn deall yn well ychydig yn nes ymlaen beth yw ystyr 'craidd'.

Oherwydd yr oedi hwn cyn cytuno ar gyllideb bu'n rhaid diswyddo criwiau ambiwlans a chyfyngu ar oramser wrth i'r sefydliad geisio diogelu ei sefyllfa ariannol.

position. After all, if you do not know how much you have to spend, you have to start making some cuts in order to protect that financial position. It is impossible to plan and run a service without knowing your final budget. The difference between 'core' and 'extras' is, I believe, a false one. We are not talking about added extras, or perhaps new bits of kit and equipment; we are talking about the budget that keeps ambulance crews and ambulances on our roads. The inability of the ambulance trust to do so was reflected in a flurry of media stories by whistleblowing from within the organisation, from ambulance crews who were sick and tired of what they had to face. Is that really the way to run an emergency service in this day and age? I do not believe that it is.

This afternoon, we will be supporting amendment 6 proposed by Plaid Cymru, that the Minister needs to take responsibility for setting the Welsh ambulance service's budget. We need to know that the budget is based on a proper assessment of need. We still do not know what figure was agreed last Friday, and we do not know whether that figure will allow the ambulance trust to reach the Government's own stated targets. We simply do not know whether that money is adequate, and I would welcome the Government's assurances that it is. Therefore, we will support that amendment. We shall also be supporting amendments 8 and 9 tabled by the Welsh Conservatives, which recognise the vital role that the air ambulance service plays within our country and the efforts of volunteer fundraisers throughout Wales, which keep that helicopter in the skies.

We are in the middle of discussions about fundamental changes to the way in which our health services are delivered. Those changes will mean that there will be a greater call on the service of the Welsh ambulance trust as patients will need to be transferred to centres of excellence. We need to ensure that the financial arrangements for the ambulance trust and the way in which those budgets are set and monitored are robust before we can allow those changes to go forward.

Wedi'r cyfan, os na wyddoch faint sydd gennych i'w wario, rhaid ichi ddechrau gwneud rhai toriadau er mwyn diogelu'r sefyllfa ariannol honno. Mae'n amhosibl cynllunio a rhedeg gwasanaeth heb wybod beth yw eich cyllideb derfynol. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng 'craidd' a 'phethau ychwanegol' yn un ffug, yn fy marn i. Nid ydym yn sôn am bethau ychwanegol, nac offer a chyfarpar newydd efallai; sôn yr ydym am y gyllideb sy'n cadw criwiau ambiwlans ac ambiwlansys ar ein ffyrdd. Cafod anallu yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans i wneud hynny ei adlewyrchu mewn lluo o straeon yn y cyfryngau gan rai a oedd yn chwythu'r chwiban o fewn y sefydliad, gan griwiau ambiwlans a oedd wedi hen syrffedu ar y sefyllfa yr oeddent yn ei hwynebu. Ai dyna'r ffordd y dylai gwasanaeth brys gael ei redeg yn yr oes sydd ohoni? Ni chredaf felly.

Y prynhawn yma, byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 6 a gynigiwyd gan Blaid Cymru, fod angen i'r Gweinidog gymryd cyfrifoldeb am bennu cyllideb gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Mae angen inni wybod bod y gyllideb yn seiliedig ar asesiad cywir o angen. Ni wyddom o hyd beth oedd y ffigwr y cytunwyd arno ddydd Gwener diwethaf, ac ni wyddom a fydd y ffigur hwnnw yn rhoi cyfle i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans gyrraedd targedau datganedig y Llywodraeth ei hun. Yn syml, ni wyddom a yw'r arian yn ddigonol, a byddwn yn croesawu sicrwydd y Llywodraeth ei fod yn ddigonol. Felly, byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw. Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliannau 8 a 9 a gyflwynwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, sy'n cydnabod y rôl hollbwysig y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr yn ei chwarae yn ein gwlad ac ymdrechion codwyr arian gwirfoddol ledled Cymru, sy'n cadw'r hofrennydd hwnnw yn yr awyr.

Rydym yng nghanol trafodaethau ar newidiadau sylfaenol i'r ffordd y mae ein gwasanaethau iechyd yn cael eu darparu. Bydd y newidiadau hynny yn golygu y bydd mwy o alw ar wasanaeth ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru gan y bydd angen i gleifion gael eu trosglwyddo i ganolfannau rhagoriaeth. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod y trefniadau ariannol ar gyfer yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans a'r ffordd y caiff y cyllidebau hynny eu pennu a'u monitro yn

Otherwise, the shocking stories that we have heard, that we have talked about in the Chamber, and that have been reported on by the ombudsman will only increase in number and get worse. Welsh patients deserve a first-class emergency service response. The paramedics and technicians who work on the ambulances deserve to have the tools to allow them to do the job that they were trained for. Let us use this opportunity today to ensure that we have a robust system, going forward, so that we are never faced with a similar situation again, when an organisation tasked with such an important job has to wait until the eighth month of the financial year to know how much money it has to spend.

*Gwelliant 1—Jane Hutt*

*Dileu pwynt 1.*

*Gwelliant 4—Jane Hutt*

*Dileu is-bwynt 2a.*

*Gwelliant 7—Jane Hutt*

*Dileu is-bwynt 2d a rhoi yn ei le: ‘parhau i asesu’r trefniadau rhwng Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru er mwyn sicrhau bod trefniadau llywodraethu ac ariannu cadarn yn dal ar waith.’*

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** I move amendments 1, 4 and 7 in the name of Jane Hutt.

*Gwelliant 2—Aled Roberts*

*Ym mhwynt 1a, dileu ‘yw’ a rhoi ‘oedd’ yn ei le.*

*Gwelliant 3—Aled Roberts*

*Ym mhwynt 1b, dileu ‘yw’ a rhoi ‘oedd’ yn ei le.*

**Kirsty Williams:** I move amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Aled Roberts.

gadarn cyn y gallwn ganiatáu i’r newidiadau hynny fynd rhagddynt. Fel arall, bydd y straeon brawychus yr ydym wedi’u clywed, yr ydym wedi sôn amdanynt yn y Siambr, ac y mae’r ombwdsmon wedi cyflwyno adroddiadau arnynt ond yn cynyddu ac yn gwaethygu. Mae cleifion Cymru yn haeddu ymateb gwasanaeth brys o’r radd flaenaf. Mae’r parafeddygon a’r technegwyr sy’n gweithio ar yr ambiwlansys yn haeddu cael yr offer i’w galluogi i wneud y gwaith y maent yn cael eu hyfforddi i’w wneud. Gadewch inni fachu ar y cyfle hwn heddiw i sicrhau bod gennym system gadarn, yn y dyfodol, fel nad ydym byth yn wynebu sefyllfa debyg eto, pan fydd sefydliad sy’n gyfrifol am waith mor bwysig yn gorfod aros tan yr wythfed mis o’r flwyddyn ariannol i wybod faint o arian sydd ganddo i’w wario.

*Amendment 1—Jane Hutt*

*Delete point 1.*

*Amendment 4—Jane Hutt*

*Delete sub-point 2a.*

*Amendment 7—Jane Hutt*

*Delete sub-point 2d. and replace with: ‘continue to assess arrangements between the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee, Local Health Boards and WAST, to ensure robust governance and funding arrangements remain in place.’*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Cynigïaf welliannau 1, 4 a 7 yn enw Jane Hutt.

*Amendment 2—Aled Roberts*

*In point 1a delete ‘has’ and replace with ‘had’*

*Amendment 3—Aled Roberts*

*In point 1b delete ‘is’ and replace with ‘was’.*

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigïaf welliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Aled Roberts.

*Gwelliant 6—Jocelyn Davies*

*Dileu is-bwynt 2d a rhoi yn ei le:*

*Galw ar y Gweinidog i gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros osod cyllideb Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru.*

5.30 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** I move amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

I welcome the debate tabled by the Liberal Democrats and its timeliness. Most public sector organisations would be in complete panic if their annual budget was not agreed by 2 April, let alone 2 November, but that is what has happened to our ambulance trust this year. There is no doubt that it has created uncertainty and internal turmoil, even, for the ambulance trust to not have an agreed budget until 2 November. The system whereby all health boards have to agree the ambulance trust's budget is no longer workable in my view. The motion calls for this system to be reviewed immediately. Plaid Cymru's amendment 6 goes a step further and

'Calls on the Minister to take responsibility for setting the Welsh Ambulance Service's budget.'

Here's a novel thought for this Assembly and for the Minister: why not have a budget line in the Minister's annual health budget with a specified allocation for the ambulance trust? That would achieve transparency and accountability in one fell swoop. Had that been the case, the ambulance trust would have had its budget for 2012-13 agreed by our vote in our Plenary in December last year, not last week, halfway through its financial year.

The Government's amendment 7 indicates that it prefers, even after this year's wholly unsatisfactory experience, to carry on with

*Amendment 6—Jocelyn Davies*

*Delete sub-point 2d and replace with:*

*Calls on the Minister to take responsibility for setting the Welsh Ambulance Service's budget.*

**Elin Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Croesawaf y ddadl a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'i hamseroldeb. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o sefydliadau yn y sector cyhoeddus mewn panig llwyr pe na baent wedi cael cytundeb ynglŷn â'u cyllideb flynyddol erbyn 2 Ebrill, heb sôn am 2 Tachwedd, ond dyna'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i'n hymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans eleni. Nid oes amheuaeth bod y ffaith nad oedd gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans gyllideb y cytunwyd arni tan 2 Tachwedd wedi creu ansicrwydd a chynnwrf mewnol, hyd yn oed. Mae'r system lle mae'n rhaid i bob un o'r byrddau iechyd gytuno ar gyllideb yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans bellach yn anymarferol, yn fy marn i. Mae'r cynnig yn galw am adolygu'r system hon ar unwaith. Mae gwelliant 6 Plaid Cymru yn mynd gam ymhellach ac

'Yn galw ar y Gweinidog i gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros osod cyllideb Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru.'

Dyma ichi syniad newydd i'r Cynulliad hwn ac i'r Gweinidog: beth am gael llinell cyllideb yng nghyllideb iechyd flynyddol y Gweinidog gyda dyraniad penodol ar gyfer yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans? Byddai hynny'n sicrhau tryloywder ac atebolrwydd mewn amrantiad. Pe bai hynny wedi digwydd, byddai gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans gyllideb ar gyfer 2012-13 y cytunwyd arni gan ein pleidlais yn ein Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Rhagfyr y llynedd, nid yr wythnos diwethaf, hanner ffordd drwy ei blwyddyn ariannol.

Noda gwelliant 7 y Llywodraeth y byddai'n well ganddi, hyd yn oed ar ôl y profiad cwbl anfoddfaol eleni, barhau â'r system

the current system. All I can say is that the managers and paramedics of the ambulance trust deserve a better system. A lack of adequate resources has had an effect on ambulance response times. The ambulance trust has failed to meet its target of responding to 65% of category A calls within eight minutes for the last four months. The ambulance trust corporate risk register, last published on 25 September, stated that the increasing demand on 999 services was outstripping the resources available to achieve the standards. In 2011-12, there was an 8% increase in the number of 999 emergency calls compared with the previous year. So, the trust itself is clear that demand is outstripping the resources available to achieve the set standards and has identified this as a risk.

Local information provided by whistleblowers within the service in the Swansea area for the week from 15 October to 22 October clearly illustrates the very real impact of a lack of resources on local ambulance crews and stations. Information provided by a paramedic on Monday 15 October was that Glynneath station was closed night and day, Gorseinon was closed during the day, Pontardawe closed during the night and that rapid response vehicles were down by two. There was a similar pattern off and on for the rest of the week, including single manned nights only in Morriston, and one crew day and night in Swansea.

Apparently, these cutbacks were the result of needing to break-even financially towards the end of the month of October. This has had a real effect on response times. On Monday 15 October, only 35% of ambulances arrived within the target time in the Swansea area, compared with 55% in the whole of Wales on that day—the Welsh Government target, of course, is 65%.

The ambulance trust's corporate risk register for September, which I have already referred to, also identifies several other serious issues around excessive turnaround times at hospitals, leading, in some cases, to delays in treatment for patients, to delays in the crew available for other emergencies and to a lack

bresennol. Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod rheolwyr a pharafeddygon yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn haeddu gwell system. Mae prinder adnoddau wedi cael effaith ar amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans wedi methu â chyrraedd ei tharged o ymateb i 65% o alwadau categori A o fewn wyth munud am y pedwar mis diwethaf. Nododd cofrestr risg gorfforaethol yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, a gyhoeddwyd ddiwethaf ar 25 Medi, fod y galw cynyddol ar wasanaethau 999 yn fwy na'r adnoddau a oedd ar gael i gyrraedd y safonau. Yn 2011-12, cafwyd cynnydd o 8% yn nifer y galwadau 999 brys o gymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Felly, mae'r ymddiriedolaeth ei hun yn glir bod y galw yn fwy na'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i gyrraedd y safonau a osodwyd ac mae wedi nodi hyn fel risg.

Dengys gwybodaeth leol a ddarparwyd gan chwythwyr chwiban yn y gwasanaeth yn ardal Abertawe ar gyfer yr wythnos o 15 Hydref i 22 Hydref yn glir effaith wirioneddol prinder adnoddau ar griwiau ambiwlans lleol a gorsafodd. Yn ôl yr wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gan barafeddyg ddydd Llundun 15 Hydref roedd gorsaf Glynneath ar gau ddydd a nos, roedd Gorseinon ar gau yn ystod y dydd, roedd Pontardawe ar gau yn ystod y nos ac roedd cerbydau ymateb cyflym yn brin o ddau. Gwelwyd patrwm tebyg o gau ac agor am weddill yr wythnos, gan gynnwys nosweithiau criwiau un parafeddyg yn unig yn Nhreforys, ac un criw ddydd a nos yn Abertawe.

Ymddengys bod y toriadau hyn yn deillio o'r angen i fantoli'r gyllideb tua diwedd mis Hydref. Cafodd hyn effaith wirioneddol ar amseroedd ymateb. Ddydd Llundun 15 Hydref, dim ond 35% o ambiwlansys a gyrhaeddodd o fewn yr amser targed yn ardal Abertawe, o gymharu â 55% dros Gymru gyfan ar y diwrnod hwnnw—targed Llywodraeth Cymru, wrth gwrs, yw 65%.

Nododd cofrestr risg gorfforaethol yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ar gyfer mis Medi, yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio ati, nifer o broblemau difrifol eraill o ran amseroedd trosglwyddo cleifion a oedd yn rhy hir mewn ysbytai, gan arwain, mewn rhai achosion, at oedi cyn bod cleifion yn cael triniaeth, oedi o

of time for the training of staff and to regularly clean vehicles and equipment to a satisfactory standard.

If we put all of this into the context of health board service reconfiguration, we know that the national clinical forum wants to see far fewer full A&E admission hospitals. If that becomes the eventual model of patient care, it will have a significant impact on ambulance services as it will require them to transfer patients over longer distances and mean that they are not available to respond to emergencies for longer periods. That will require more resources to be put into the system, and that is clearly not in any of the current plans that we have seen for hospital reconfiguration.

Plaid Cymru will support the Conservatives' amendments 8 and 9, in recognising the importance of the air ambulance service for Wales. We will support those two amendments this afternoon.

*Gwelliant 8—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn nodi'r rôl hanfodol y mae Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru yn ei chwarae wrth gynorthwyo Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru i ymateb i achosion brys yng Nghymru.*

*Gwelliant 9—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gyda Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru i gynllunio gofal brys a darparu digon o gyllid uniongyrchol i'r gwasanaethau hynny, er mwyn helpu Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru i gyflawni ei amcanion allweddol.*

*Gwelliant 10—William Graham*

*Ychwanegu ar ddiwedd y cynnig:*

*Yn gresynu bod GIG Cymru yn wynebu'r toriadau iechyd termau real mwyaf o holl wledydd y DU, ac y gallai hyn gael effaith andwyol ar Wasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru.*

ran y criw a oedd ar gael ar gyfer argyfyngau eraill a phrinder amser i hyfforddi staff a glanhau cerbydau ac offer yn rheolaidd i safon foddhaol.

Os rhoddwn hyn i gyd yng nghyd-destun ad-drefnu gwasanaethau byrddau iechyd, gwyddom fod y fforwm clinigol cenedlaethol am weld llawer llai o ysbytai derbyn achosion brys llawn. Os mai dyna'r model o ofal claf yn y pen draw, bydd yn cael effaith sylweddol ar wasanaethau ambiwlans gan y bydd angen iddynt drosglwyddo cleifion dros fwy o bellter ac yn golygu nad ydynt ar gael i ymateb i argyfyngau am gyfnodau hirach. Bydd hynny'n gofyn am fwy o adnoddau yn y system, ac nid yw hynny'n amlwg yn unrhyw un o'r cynlluniau presennol yr ydym wedi'u gweld ar gyfer ad-drefnu ysbytai.

Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi gwelliannau 8 a 9 y Ceidwadwyr, sy'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans awyr i Gymru. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r ddau welliant hynny y prynhawn yma.

*Amendment 8—William Graham*

*Add at the end of motion:*

*Notes the critical role played by the Wales Air Ambulance Service in assisting the Wales Ambulance Service to respond to emergencies in Wales.*

*Amendment 9—William Graham*

*Add at the end of motion:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to work with the Wales Air Ambulance Service in the planning of emergency care and to provide adequate direct funding for those services, in order to assist the Wales Ambulance Service to meet its key objectives.*

*Amendment 10—William Graham*

*Add at the end of motion:*

*Regrets that the Welsh NHS is facing the largest real-term health cuts of any of the UK nations and that this has the potential to have a detrimental impact on the Welsh Ambulance Service.*



**Darren Millar:** I move amendments 8, 9 and 10 in the name of William Graham.

We all know how important ambulance services are and we all know the problems that can occur when they go wrong, and, boy, are they not going wrong at the moment in Wales? We know that the target for an eight-minute response time has not been met in the previous four months, including over the summer period. That was down to summer pressures, so we were told. Therefore, in addition to the winter pressures we now have annually, we have introduced summer pressures to the vocabulary here in the Assembly. No doubt, we will see spring pressures once the new year is out of the way. I am very concerned that we must get a grip of this to get it right because people are paying the price with their lives and in the outcomes they have following their illnesses and emergencies. We cannot tolerate this continuing poor performance and we have to ensure that there are adequate resources for the Welsh ambulance service so that it can deliver the high-quality service that the people of Wales need.

People in my constituency are asking why on earth they pay national insurance at the same rate as other parts of the United Kingdom when they have an inferior ambulance service. Minister, I have to say that I keep saying that they should ask you that question because, ultimately, it is your responsibility. We know that, as a result of a debacle last week, a budget was finally agreed towards the end of the week, after having not been agreed for an eight-month period during a financial year in which the NHS is facing the biggest cuts in its history. Record-breaking cuts are being imposed on the NHS. The one year when the health boards need some financial certainty so that they can plan in order to get to grips with that financial challenge is the one year that no agreement was reached on a budget until very late in the day. Either the Minister knew about that situation and did nothing, which would be a pretty awful situation, or she did not know about it and did nothing, which would be an even worse situation given that she is the

**Darren Millar:** Cynigiau welliannau 8, 9 a 10 yn enw William Graham.

Rydym i gyd yn gwybod pa mor bwysig yw'r gwasanaethau ambiwlans ac yn ymwybodol o'r problemau a all godi pan fydd rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le arnynt, a, bois bach, onid oes rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le arnynt ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru? Gwyddom na chyrrhaeddwyd y targed ar gyfer amser ymateb o wyth munud yn y pedwar mis blaenorol, gan gynnwys dros gyfnod yr haf. Pwysau'r haf oedd y rheswm dros hynny, o'r hyn a ddeallwn. Felly, yn ychwanegol at bwysau'r gaeaf sy'n codi bob blwyddyn, rydym wedi ychwanegu pwysau'r haf i'r eirfa yma yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n siŵr y byddwn yn gweld pwysau'r gwanwyn unwaith y bydd y flwyddyn newydd wedi mynd heibio. Rwy'n poeni'n fawr bod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod popeth yn iawn oherwydd mae pobl yn talu'r pris gyda'u bywydau ac yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd iddynt ar ôl eu salwch ac argyfyngau. Ni allwn oddef y perfformiad gwael hwn sy'n parhau, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol ar gyfer gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru fel y gall ddarparu'r gwasanaeth o safon uchel sydd ei angen ar bobl Cymru.

Mae pobl yn fy etholaeth yn gofyn pam ar y ddaear eu bod yn talu yswiriant gwladol ar yr un gyfradd â rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig er bod ganddynt wasanaeth ambiwlans israddol. Weinidog, rhaid imi ddweud fy mod bob amser yn dweud wrthynt am ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw i chi oherwydd, yn y pen draw, eich cyfrifoldeb chi ydyw. Gwyddom, o ganlyniad i'r helynt yr wythnos diwethaf, y cytunwyd ar gyllideb derfynol tua diwedd yr wythnos, ar ôl cyfnod o wyth mis lle y methwyd â chytuno ar gyllideb yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol lle y mae'r GIG yn wynebu'r toriadau mwyaf yn ei hanes. Mae'r GIG yn wynebu'r toriadau mwyaf erioed. Yr union flwyddyn pan fo angen rhywfaint o sicrwydd ariannol ar fyrddau iechyd fel y gallant gynllunio er mwyn ateb yr her ariannol yw'r union flwyddyn na chafwyd cytundeb ar gyllideb tan yn hwyr iawn. Naill ai roedd y Gweinidog yn gwybod am y sefyllfa honno ac yn gwneud dim, a fyddai'n sefyllfa eithaf erchyll, neu nid oedd yn gwybod am y peth ac yn gwneud dim, a

Minister responsible for ensuring that adequate resources are given to that part of the NHS.

I listened carefully to what Elin Jones said a few moments ago about the need for adequate resources for the Welsh NHS and the ambulance service, but you were in Government when these cuts were agreed, Elin. You agreed the forward budget when you were a Minister. You were party to the discussions on the resources for the NHS for a number of years in advance and you voted them through. Therefore, I am a little disappointed that you are now crying crocodile tears about resources, but, hey, there is always time for you to come round to our point of view, which is that the NHS ought to have a protected budget, that additional resources ought to be invested in it and that it ought not to be facing these record-breaking cuts, which other parts of the United Kingdom are not facing.

We know that not all of the pressures on the ambulance service result from the ambulance service's decisions. Some of them are a result of other NHS organisations not getting the transfers of care right at accident and emergency departments. We have all been there at hospitals when there have been seven, eight, nine, 10 or 11 ambulances stacked up outside an A&E department with people waiting in them to get in. I have had constituents come to my office who have been sat in the back of those ambulances, sometimes for up to an hour before they have been transferred into the A&E department because of the pressures on NHS finances and the unavailability of medical beds. So, no matter which way you slice it, at the end of the day, the heart of the problem is the resources available to the NHS.

One service that is facing increasing demand is the Wales Air Ambulance service. It is a wonderful charity that provides a terrific service across Wales, particularly in those areas that are rural and difficult to reach, because of awkward terrain, for traditional ambulance response vehicles. However, despite this being an embedded part of health

fyddai'n sefyllfa hyd yn oed yn waeth o ystyried mai hi yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau bod adnoddau digonol yn cael eu rhoi i'r rhan honno o'r GIG.

Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Elin Jones ychydig funudau yn ôl am yr angen am adnoddau digonol ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ond roeddech mewn grym pan gytunwyd ar y toriadau hyn, Elin. Gwnaethoch gytuno ar y flaengyllideb pan oeddech yn Weinidog. Buoch yn rhan o'r trafodaethau ar yr adnoddau ar gyfer y GIG am nifer o flynyddoedd ymlaen llaw a gwnaethoch bleidleisio o'u plaid. Felly, rwyf braidd yn siomedig eich bod bellach yn wylo ffug ddagrau am adnoddau, ond, dyna ni, mae amser o hyd ichi gytuno â ni, y dylai fod gan y GIG gyllideb a ddiogelir, y dylid buddsoddi adnoddau ychwanegol ynddo ac na ddylai fod yn wynebu'r toriadau mwyaf erioed hyn, nad yw rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn eu hwynebu.

Gwyddom nad yw'r holl bwysau ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn deillio o benderfyniadau'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae rhai ohonynt yn deillio o'r ffaith nad yw trefniadau trosglwyddo gofal sefydliadau eraill yn y GIG yn gweithio'n iawn mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Rydym i gyd wedi bod yn yr ysbyty ac wedi gweld saith, wyth, naw, 10 neu 11 o ambiwlansys yn aros y tu allan i adran damweiniau ac achosion brys gyda phobl yn aros ynddynt i fynd i mewn. Mae rhai o'm hetholwyr wedi dod i'm swyddfa sydd wedi bod yn eistedd yng nghefn yr ambiwlansys hynny, weithiau am hyd at awr cyn iddynt gael eu trosglwyddo i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys oherwydd y pwysau ar gyllid y GIG a'r ffaith nad oes gwelyau meddygol ar gael. Felly, nid oes ots pa ffordd edrychwch ar y sefyllfa, y broblem yn y pen draw yw'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r GIG.

Un gwasanaeth sy'n wynebu galw cynyddol yw gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru. Mae'n elusen wych sy'n rhoi gwasanaeth rhagorol ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd hynny sy'n wledig ac yn anodd eu cyrraedd, oherwydd tir anodd i gerbydau ymateb ambiwlans traddodiadol. Fodd bynnag, er bod hyn yn rhan annatod o

provision in Wales, it does not receive a single penny of investment from the Welsh Government to enable it to do what it does really well. It is because of the generosity of the Welsh public that the service has a brand spanking new helicopter in mid Wales. It is not because of any generosity on the part of the Welsh Government. Therefore, I hope that you will support these amendments, Minister, to ensure that a sustainable resource is made available by the Welsh Government to allow the Wales Air Ambulance to expand its good work across Wales, particularly in the wake of the reorganisation that is taking place, which will mean that many more ambulances are likely to be off the road outside hospitals or on the road transferring people to hospitals much further away than is currently the case.

**Aled Roberts:** We make no apology, as in the previous debate, for bringing this matter before the Assembly, as Kirsty Williams outlined. There is a need for the Assembly to hold Ministers to account where it is clearly the case that a service is underperforming. As Darren Millar mentioned, I am sure that we all know of constituents who have been held up outside hospitals. In my region, in Glan Clwyd Hospital in particular there are big issues with regard to the number of ambulances that are stuck outside the A&E department. Like Elin Jones, I, too, have been receiving correspondence and e-mails from paramedics, and the situation that she referred to is not limited to an area in south-west Wales. The reality is that, throughout Wales, paramedics are complaining about the pressures that they are being put under and that they are being asked to crew ambulances single-handedly, which is in clear contradiction to what is considered to be best practice. That is as a result of decisions that have been taken in terms of crisis management, due to the budget pressures that the ambulance service faces.

Given the current situation, we have to ask whether we should be surprised that, as we believe, a budget for the ambulance service was not agreed until last Friday. The setup, as far as the ambulance trust is concerned is—believe it or not—that the health boards sit as a committee and agree the amount of money that is to be given to the ambulance trust. We

ddarpariaeth iechyd yng Nghymru, nid yw'n cael ceiniog o fuddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth Cymru i'w alluogi i wneud yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud mor dda. Haelioni'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru sy'n cyfrif am y ffaith bod gan y gwasanaeth hofrennydd newydd sbon yn y canolbarth. Nid oherwydd unrhyw haelioni ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru. Felly, gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn, Weinidog, i sicrhau bod adnoddau cynaliadwy ar gael gan Lywodraeth Cymru i alluogi Ambiwlans Awyr Cymru i ymestyn ei waith da ledled Cymru, yn enwedig yn sgîl yr ymarfer ad-drefnu sy'n mynd rhagddo, a fydd yn golygu y bydd llawer mwy o ambiwlansys yn debygol o fod oddi ar y ffordd y tu allan i ysbytai neu ar y ffordd yn trosglwyddo pobl i ysbytai lawer ymhellach i ffwrdd nag sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

**Aled Roberts:** Nid ydym yn ymddiheuro, fel yn y ddadl flaenorol, am ddod â'r mater hwn gerbron y Cynulliad, fel yr amlinellodd Kirsty Williams. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad ddwyn Gweinidogion i gyfrif os yw'n amlwg bod gwasanaeth yn tanberfformio. Fel y soniodd Darren Millar, rwy'n siŵr ein bod i gyd yn gwybod am etholwyr sydd wedi gorfod aros y tu allan i ysbytai. Yn fy rhanbarth i, yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd yn benodol ceir problemau mawr o ran nifer yr ambiwlansys sy'n gorfod aros y tu allan i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys. Fel Elin Jones, rwyf innau hefyd wedi bod yn cael gohebiaeth a negeseuon e-bost gan barafeddygon, ac nid dim ond yn y de-orllewin y mae'r sefyllfa y cyfeiriodd ati yn digwydd. Y gwir yw bod parafeddygon, ledled Cymru, yn cwyno am y pwysau a roddir arnynt a'r ffaith y gofynnir iddynt fod ar ddyletswydd ar eu pennau eu hunain mewn ambiwlansys, sy'n hollol groes i'r hyn a ystyrir yn arfer gorau, a hynny o ganlyniad i benderfyniadau a wnaed o ran rheoli mewn argyfwng, oherwydd y pwysau cyllidebol a wyneba'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

O ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol, rhaid inni ofyn a ddylem fod yn synnu na chytunwyd ar gyllideb y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, fel y credwn, tan ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Y drefn, o ran yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans—credwch fi neu beidio—yw bod y byrddau iechyd yn eistedd fel pwyllgor ac yn cytuno ar y swm o arian sydd i'w roi i'r

know full well that those health boards are under significant financial pressures themselves. Would we, were we financial directors or chief executives of those health boards, suggest transferring funds to the ambulance service, even though we may recognise the increased demands on that service, when we are being placed under pressure by the Government to realise cash efficiencies?

**Darren Millar:** I seem to recall you voting for the budget that was set last year for the NHS—you adopted the Welsh Government's budget and voted for it as a party. How can you complain about resources, when you supported it?

**Aled Roberts:** I am talking about the system, not the resources. The reality is that it is not as simple as you suggest to transfer resources to the NHS, because, as we have said, social services and education would then have to be cut. So, it is not as simple as you would suggest, Darren, to transfer money between one budget and another.

We do have to accept, however, that, if there are resources available, we need to set up systems that are transparent and that provide for proper budgetary planning. The current situation is not good enough. We are pleased that both the Government and Plaid Cymru would appear to agree with that.

We cannot support amendment 7. We do, however, believe that what is suggested in amendment 6 is worthy of consideration, as Kirsty outlined, if only because at the very least there needs to be a recognition, as far as the Minister is concerned, that perhaps there should be a line within the budget so that the management in the ambulance service can know from day one in the financial year the basis upon which it needs to plan in the coming year. The Government must take responsibility with regard to this matter and it must make the necessary changes to ensure that the situation does not reoccur next year. We know full well that the reconfiguration proposals in Hywel Dda LHB area and in north Wales will lead, if accepted, to

ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Gwyddom yn iawn fod y byrddau iechyd hynny o dan bwysau ariannol sylweddol eu hunain. A fyddem ni, pe baem yn gyfarwyddwr ariannol neu'n brif weithredwyr y byrddau iechyd, yn awgrymu trosglwyddo arian i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, er ein bod yn cydnabod bod galw cynyddol ar y gwasanaeth hwnnw, a ninnau o dan bwysau gan y Llywodraeth i wireddu arbedion effeithlonrwydd arian parod?

**Darren Millar:** Os cofiaf yn iawn, gwnaethoch bleidleisio o blaid y gyllideb a osodwyd y llynedd ar gyfer y GIG—gwnaethoch fabwysiadu cyllideb Llywodraeth Cymru a phleidleisio i'w derbyn fel plaid. Sut y gallwch chi gwyno am adnoddau, ar ôl ichi ei chefnogi?

**Aled Roberts:** Sôn am y system ydwyf, nid yr adnoddau. Y gwir amdani yw nad yw mor syml ag yr awgrymwch i drosglwyddo adnoddau i'r GIG, oherwydd, fel y dywedasom, byddai'n rhaid torri gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac addysg wedyn. Felly, nid yw mor syml ag yr awgrymwch, Darren, i drosglwyddo arian rhwng y naill gyllideb a'r llall.

Rhaid inni dderbyn, fodd bynnag, os oes adnoddau ar gael, fod angen inni sefydlu systemau sy'n dryloyw ac sy'n darparu ar gyfer gwaith cynllunio cyllidebol priodol. Nid yw'r sefyllfa gyfredol yn ddigon da. Mae'n dda gennym nodi yr ymddengys bod y Llywodraeth a Phlaid Cymru yn cytuno â hynny.

Ni allwn gefnogi gwelliant 7. Fodd bynnag, credwn fod yr hyn a awgrymir yng ngwelliant 6 yn werth ei ystyried, fel yr amlinellodd Kirsty, a hynny am fod angen cydnabyddiaeth o leiaf, o ran y Gweinidog, efallai y dylai fod llinell o fewn y gyllideb fel y gall rheolwyr yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wybod o'r diwrnod cyntaf yn y flwyddyn ariannol beth yw'r sail ar gyfer eu gwaith cynllunio yn y flwyddyn sydd i ddod. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn a rhaid iddi wneud y newidiadau angenrheidiol i sicrhau na fydd y sefyllfa yn digwydd eto y flwyddyn nesaf. Gwyddom yn iawn y bydd y cynigion ad-drefnu yn ardal BILl Hywel Dda ac yn y gogledd yn arwain, os cânt eu derbyn, at

increased pressure on the ambulance service, because there will be a centralisation of services and there will be a greater need for the ambulance service in those situations.

If the Government does move towards direct funding of the ambulance service, it needs to be more open with the National Assembly about the resources that are available to the ambulance service. It would have to appear, as I have said, on the face of the budget. Its budget would then be known four months in advance, not eight months in arrears, as was the case this year.

5.45 p.m.

**Mike Hedges:** First, I will start with a comment that I believe we can all agree on, namely that the delivery of high-quality, safe and timely emergency ambulance care for those who need it is a top priority. That can be achieved only if we have a properly funded ambulance service in Wales to meet the national standards. Local health boards are currently responsible for funding ambulance services, and their core budget allocation was agreed, I am reliably informed, in April, at the start of this financial year. If it had not been, the ambulance service would have run out of money well before now. By the end of April, the ambulance service would have run out of money and would have been unable to pay its staff. Obviously, some funding has been going in to fund the ambulance service up until now. You cannot go eight months into a financial year without having had any funding. What we have ended up with, I understand, is a 2% adjustment, which equates to one week's expenditure on the ambulance service, approximately.

In performance terms, the NHS in Wales, in common with the rest of the United Kingdom, has been under an extended period of pressure, and that has resulted in a continuing increase in demand for our ambulances, along with a greater number of patients categorised as being in an immediate, life-threatening situation. It also needs to be acknowledged that patients have

bwysau cynyddol ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, oherwydd bydd gwasanaethau yn cael eu canoli a bydd mwy o angen am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y sefyllfaedd hynny.

Os bydd y Llywodraeth yn symud tuag at ariannu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn uniongyrchol, mae angen iddi fod yn fwy agored gyda'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynglŷn â'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Byddai'n rhaid i hynny ymddangos, fel y dywedais, ar wyneb y gyllideb. Yna byddai ei gyllideb yn hysbys bedwar mis ymlaen llaw, nid wyth mis yn ddiweddarach, fel y digwyddodd eleni.

**Mike Hedges:** Yn gyntaf, dechreuaf gyda sylw y gallwn i gyd gytuno arno, fe gredaf, sef bod darparu gofal ambiwlans brys diogel ac amserol o safon dda i'r rhai sydd ei angen yn flaenoriaeth bennaf. Dim ond os oes gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi'i ariannu'n briodol yng Nghymru i gyrraedd y safonau cenedlaethol y gellir cyflawni hynny. Y byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ariannu gwasanaethau ambiwlans ar hyn o bryd, a chytunwyd ar y gyllideb graidd i'w dyrannu iddynt, mae'n debyg, ym mis Ebrill, ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol hon. Pe na bai cytundeb, byddai cyllid y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi dod i ben ymhell cyn hyn. Erbyn diwedd mis Ebrill, byddai cyllid y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi dod i ben ac ni fyddai wedi bod mewn sefyllfa i dalu ei staff. Yn amlwg, mae rhywfaint o gyllid wedi'i neilltuo i ariannu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans hyd yn hyn. Ni allwch fynd wyth mis i mewn i flwyddyn ariannol heb gael unrhyw arian. Yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd, o'r hyn a ddeallaf, yw bod addasiad o 2%, sy'n cyfateb i wariant un wythnos ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, fwy na lai.

O ran perfformiad, mae'r GIG yng Nghymru, yn gyffredin â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, wedi bod o dan gyfnod estynedig o bwysau, ac mae hynny wedi arwain at gynnydd parhaus yn y galw am ein hambiwylansys, ynghyd â nifer fwy o gleifion yn cael eu categorioeddio'n rhai sydd mewn sefyllfa lle mae eu bywyd yn y fantol. Mae angen cydnabod hefyd fod gan gleifion ran i'w

a role to play to ease the pressures on emergency services. Evidence shows a growing number of inappropriate emergency calls to the ambulance service over recent years, including a recent case in my area, which was well documented in the local press, of someone using it as a free taxi service when they wanted to go from where they were to somewhere else. They called for an ambulance, and after it took them to where they were going, they got out and carried on with their lives. Many people are calling them out for non-emergency reasons.

We are also aware of people who are drunk calling for an ambulance and being abusive to ambulance personnel. As Members here will well know, it is not only the young who do this. I place on record my appreciation of the work done by those working in the ambulance service, many of whom I know personally. Patients need to consider using other NHS services, such as NHS Direct Wales, contacting GP out-of-hours services or visiting local pharmacies if their need is not an emergency. We need an appropriate use of the ambulance service.

However, if the need is urgent and potentially life-threatening, people should call the ambulance and then expect a rapid response. Local health boards are responsible for funding the Welsh ambulance service. It needs to be properly resourced in order to meet the national targets set for it and, more importantly, to meet the realistic expectations of the people of Wales.

The question has come up as to whether the ambulance service should be directly funded. I have a view on all services being directly funded. We need to examine this topic as an Assembly via the Finance Committee. We need to look at the way that we fund an organisation that then passes the funding on. I have concerns that go right the way across, but I do not think that this is the place to start. We need to look at it all. I have never been a fan of indirect funding, but it seems to be a measure that the Conservatives used when

chwarae i leihau'r pwysau ar wasanaethau brys. Dengys tystiolaeth fod nifer cynyddol o alwadau brys amhriodol i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gan gynnwys achos diweddar yn fy ardal i, a gafodd dipyn o sylw yn y wasg leol, lle roedd unigolyn wedi'i ddefnyddio fel gwasanaeth tacsï am ddim pan oedd am fynd o un lle i rywle arall. Ffoniodd am ambiwlans, ac ar ôl i'r ambiwlans fynd â hwy i ble bynnag roedd am fynd, gadawodd yr ambiwlans a chario ymlaen â'u bywyd. Mae llawer o bobl yn ffonio am ambiwlans am resymau nad ydynt yn rhai brys.

Rydym hefyd yn ymwybodol o bobl sydd wedi meddwi yn ffonio am ambiwlans ac yn amharchu personél ambiwlans. Fel y gwŷr yr Aelodau yma, nid yr ifanc yn unig sy'n gwneud hyn. Hoffwn gofnodi fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'r gwaith a wneir gan y rhai sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, yr wyf yn adnabod llawer ohonynt yn bersonol. Mae angen i gleifion ystyried defnyddio gwasanaethau eraill y GIG, megis Galw Iechyd Cymru, cysylltu â gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau neu ymweld â fferyllfeydd lleol os nad oes angen gofal brys arnynt. Mae angen inni weld defnydd priodol o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Fodd bynnag, os oes angen gofal brys ac os oes bywyd rhywun yn y fantol o bosibl, dylai pobl ffonio'r ambiwlans ac yna ddisgwyl cael ymateb cyflym. Y byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ariannu gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Mae angen iddo gael adnoddau priodol er mwyn cyflawni'r targedau cenedlaethol a osodir ar ei gyfer ac, yn bwysicach na hynny, fodloni disgwyliadau realistig pobl Cymru.

Mae'r cwestiwn wedi codi ynghylch a ddylai'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gael ei ariannu'n uniongyrchol. Yn fy marn i, dylai pob gwasanaeth gael ei ariannu'n uniongyrchol. Mae angen inni edrych ar y pwnc hwn fel Cynulliad drwy'r Pwyllgor Cyllid. Mae angen inni edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn ariannu sefydliad sydd wedyn yn trosglwyddo'r cyllid i eraill. Mae gennyf bryderon ynglŷn â hyn yn gyffredinol, ond ni chredaf mai dyma'r lle i ddechrau. Mae angen inni edrych ar y cyfan. Nid wyf erioed

they ran the Government that covered Wales. It is one that has been agreed by the current Welsh Government, and it was unopposed or agreed by every other political party in the Chamber when they were in coalition. Therefore, there does not seem to be a great movement away from indirect funding, but indirect funding needs to be looked at across the board, not just in respect of the ambulance service.

There is no extra money. The Welsh block grant is the Welsh block grant. You can pretend that you could take money out of local authorities for education, but that would mean ending all school transport to start with. It would mean ending a whole range of services that are provided within education, such as educational psychological services—

**Andrew R.T. Davies** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Do not give way to a Member who has not been present for the whole debate.

**Mike Hedges:** We have to realise that the NHS in Wales has been in an extended period of pressure and it is a fact that Wales faces an ageing population, leading to greater demand on our health service and a greater demand for ambulances. [*Interruption.*] Well, let us look at the situation as it is. I understand that, in September 2012, there were 33,000 emergency calls, of which 13,400 were category A, or immediately life-threatening. That means that more than 20,000 were not. The challenges are for the Government to make the best use of its resources, for health trusts to ensure the rapid discharge of patients from ambulances and for patients to be treated as quickly as possible, and for patients to treat the ambulance service as an emergency service rather than as a taxi service to hospitals. We all rely on the ambulance service in an emergency, and for it to be a success it needs to be well run and adequately funded.

wedi bod o blaid cyllid anuniongyrchol, ond ymddengys ei fod yn fesur a ddefnyddiwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr pan oeddent yn llywodraethu dros Gymru. Mae'n fesur y cytunwyd arno gan Lywodraeth gyfredol Cymru, a chytunodd pob plaid wleidyddol arall yn y Siambr arno neu nis gwrthwynebwyd pan oeddent mewn clymblaid. Felly, nid ymddengys bod symud mawr oddi wrth gyllid anuniongyrchol, ond mae angen edrych ar gyllid anuniongyrchol yn gyffredinol, nid yn unig o ran y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Nid oes unrhyw arian ychwanegol. Grant bloc Cymru yw grant bloc Cymru. Gallwch esgus y byddech yn gallu tynnu arian oddi ar awdurdodau lleol a'i roi i addysg, ond byddai hynny'n golygu rhoi terfyn ar gludiant ysgol i gyd i ddechrau. Byddai'n golygu rhoi terfyn ar bob math o wasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu o fewn addysg, megis gwasanaethau seicolegol addysgol—

**Andrew R.T. Davies** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peidiwch ag ildio i Aelod nad yw wedi bod yn bresennol ar gyfer y ddadl gyfan.

**Mike Hedges:** Rhaid inni sylweddoli bod y GIG yng Nghymru wedi bod o dan gyfnod estynedig o bwysau ac mae'n ffaith bod gan Gymru boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, a fydd yn arwain at fwy o alw ar ein gwasanaeth iechyd a mwy o alw am ambiwlansys. [*Torri ar draws.*] Wel, gadewch inni edrych ar y sefyllfa fel y mae. Caf ar ddeall, ym mis Medi 2012, fod 33,000 o alwadau brys, 13,400 ohonynt yn rhai categori A, lle roedd bywyd rhywun yn y fantol. Mae hynny'n golygu nad oedd dros 20,000 ohonynt yn rhai categori A. Yr heriau i'r Llywodraeth yw sicrhau ei bod yn gwneud y defnydd gorau o'i hadnoddau, bod ymddiriedolaethau iechyd yn sicrhau y caiff cleifion eu trosglwyddo o ambiwlansys yn ddi-oed a bod cleifion yn cael eu trin cyn gynted ag y bo modd, a bod cleifion yn trin y gwasanaeth ambiwlans fel gwasanaeth brys yn hytrach nag fel gwasanaeth tacsï i ysbytai. Rydym oll yn dibynnu ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn argyfwng, ac er mwyn iddo fod yn llwyddiant mae angen iddo gael ei redeg yn dda a'i ariannu'n ddigonol.

**William Powell:** I am pleased to take part in this important debate. As we all know, the ambulance service is a vital service. The majority of us will need to call upon it at some point or other in our lives. It offers us a great deal of reassurance that, when something does go wrong, help is just a phone call away, which makes it all the more important that, as Mike Hedges correctly said, we bear down on the abuse of the ambulance service. That is only right and proper. We have to commend the work of our ambulance staff and paramedics, and at the same time stand up for them when conditions and uncertainty conspire to make their jobs more difficult.

From time to time, we hear about cuts to overtime, ambulance stations being shut, the reduction of hours, and in some cases staff forgoing their meal breaks in order to be able to provide the service on which so many of us depend. All this is a direct consequence of the uncertainty of the funding regime from which the ambulance service has suffered for too long.

The response times of ambulances have recently been in decline. For the past four consecutive months, ambulances have consistently failed to meet the all-Wales target of responding to 65% of immediately life-threatening situations within eight minutes. As we heard earlier, in Blaenau Gwent, just 53.9% of such calls get a response within eight minutes. In Wrexham, it is as high as 74.9%, but as Kirsty said earlier, no areas within Wales would currently meet the English target of 75%. We need to look at why these response times are so low. It is not merely an issue of rurality, as we have previously heard. Pembrokeshire, which is largely a rural area, has the second highest response time of 71.6%, while Blaenau Gwent and Rhondda Cynon Taf, which are obviously far more urban in character, are elsewhere on the scale. There is, therefore, no correlation either with the volume of calls that are coming through. Rather, the problem seems to be one of political leadership and of ensuring that the resources are in place, and that the certainty

**William Powell:** Rwy'n falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon. Fel y gwyddon oll, mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn wasanaeth hanfodol. Bydd angen i'r rhan fwyaf ohonom ei ddefnyddio rywbyrd neu'i gilydd yn ein bywydau. Mae'n cynnig cryn sicrwydd inni pan fydd rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le, fod cymorth ar gael drwy wneud un galwad ffôn, sy'n ei gwneud hyd yn oed yn fwy pwysig, fel y dywedodd Mike Hedges yn hollol gywir, ein bod yn ymdrin yn llym ag achosion o gamddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae hynny'n hollol briodol. Rhaid inni ganmol gwaith ein staff ambiwlans a'n parafeddygon, ac ar yr un pryd, eu hamddiffyn pan fydd amodau gwaith ac ansicrwydd yn gwneud eu gwaith yn anos.

O bryd i'w gilydd, rydym yn clywed sôn am gyfyngu ar oramser, gorsafoedd ambiwlans yn cael eu cau, lleihau oriau, ac mewn rhai achosion, staff yn mynd heb amser prydau bwyd er mwyn gallu darparu'r gwasanaeth y mae cymaint ohonom yn dibynnu arno. Mae hyn i gyd yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol o ansicrwydd y drefn gyllido y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi dioddef o'r herwydd yn rhy hir.

Mae amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys wedi bod yn dirywio'n ddiweddar. Am y pedwar mis diwethaf yn olynol, mae ambiwlansys wedi methu'n gyson â chyrraedd y targed i Gymru gyfan sef ymateb i 65% o sefyllfaoedd lle mae bywyd rhywun yn y fantol o fewn wyth munud. Fel y clywsom yn gynharach, ym Mlaenau Gwent, dim ond 53.9% o alwadau o'r fath sy'n cael ymateb o fewn wyth munud. Yn Wrecsam, mae cyfuwch â 74.9%, ond fel y dywedodd Kirsty yn gynharach, ni fyddai unrhyw ardaloedd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn cyrraedd y targed o 75% yn Lloegr. Mae angen inni ystyried pam mae'r amseroedd ymateb mor isel. Nid mater o wledigrwydd yn unig ydyw, fel yr ydym wedi clywed o'r blaen. Mae gan sir Benfro, sy'n ardal wledig i raddau helaeth, yr amser ymateb gorau ond un sef 71.6%, tra bo Blaenau Gwent a Rhondda Cynon Taf, sy'n amlwg yn llawer mwy trefol eu natur, yn rhywle arall ar y raddfa. Felly, nid oes unrhyw gydbertynas ychwaith â nifer y galwadau a dderbynnir. Yn hytrach na hynny, ymddengys mai arweinyddiaeth wleidyddol



of resource is there. However, I am concerned that it could become extremely difficult if rural areas are further centralised in their service provision. People would have to travel further, but without being able to rely on ambulance cover. We are aware of the concerns out there, in the clinical forum, about some of the proposals coming forward for reconfiguration.

Only this week, it was widely claimed that, on the night of 26 October, emergency cases were being diverted from Bronglais hospital's accident and emergency department to Shrewsbury hospital, which is over two hours away. Aside from highlighting the geographic and strategic importance of Bronglais hospital, that also demonstrates what demands are placed on the ambulance service in mid Wales.

We are supporting the Conservative amendments that relate to the Wales Air Ambulance. In Mid and West Wales, the air ambulance provides a critical service that allows patients to travel the long distances to hospital, where necessary, and it forms a key part of the Welsh Government's ability to meet emergency response time targets. Our ambition should be to secure full core funding for the Wales Air Ambulance from the Welsh Government.

**Russell George:** I am pleased to take part in this important debate, and I wish to focus my contribution entirely on the vital work of the Wales Air Ambulance service, which is a particularly crucial service for rural mid Wales. I had the opportunity to meet with staff at the Wales Air Ambulance at Welshpool Airport only this Monday, and I also had the opportunity to see the new Eurocopter EC135 helicopter—and I am told by staff that the 'E' is important—which now operates out of the airport. The investment made by the Wales Air Ambulance in this new state-of-the-art technology means that mid Wales has the most advanced life-saving operation in the UK. We know that the geographical demands of living in rural mid Wales, coupled with the lack of a district general hospital, means that the facility

sydd wrth wraidd y broblem, a sicrhau bod yr adnoddau ar gael a bod sicrwydd adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf y gallai pethau fynd yn anodd iawn os caiff darpariaeth gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig eu canoli ymhellach. Byddai'n rhaid i bobl deithio ymhellach, ond heb fod yn gallu dibynnu ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Rydym yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon, yn y fforwm clinigol, am rai o'r cynigion sy'n cael eu cyflwyno o ran ad-drefnu.

Dim ond yr wythnos hon, honnwyd yn gyffredinol, ar noson 26 Hydref, fod achosion brys yn cael eu dargyfeirio o adran damweiniau ac achosion brys ysbyty Bronglais i ysbyty Amwythig, sydd dros ddwy awr i ffwrdd. Ar wahân i dynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd daearyddol a strategol ysbyty Bronglais, dengys hynny hefyd y galwadau a roddir ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn y canolbarth.

Rydym yn cefnogi gwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr sy'n ymwneud ag Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru. Yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, mae'r ambiwlans awyr yn darparu gwasanaeth hanfodol sy'n ei gwneud yn bosibl i gleifion deithio bellteroedd mawr i'r ysbyty, lle bo angen, ac mae'n rhan allweddol o allu Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflawni targedau amseroedd ymateb brys. Dylem anelu at sicrhau cyllid craidd llawn gan Lywodraeth Cymru i Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru.

**Russell George:** Rwy'n falch o gymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon, ac yn fy nghyfraniad hoffwn ganolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl ar waith hanfodol Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru, sy'n wasanaeth pwysig iawn i ardaloedd gwledig y canolbarth. Cefais gyfle i gyfarfod â staff Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru ym Maes Awyr y Trallwng mor ddiweddar â dydd Llun yma, a chafais gyfle hefyd i weld yr hofrennydd Eurocopter EC135 newydd—a dywedir wrthyf gan y staff bod yr 'E' yn bwysig—sydd bellach yn gweithredu o'r maes awyr. Mae'r buddsoddiad a wnaed gan Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru yn y dechnoleg ddiweddaraf hon, yn golygu bod gan y canolbarth y gweithrediad achub bywyd mwyaf datblygedig yn y DU. Gwyddom fod yr anawsterau daearyddol sy'n gysylltiedig â byw yn ardaloedd gwledig y canolbarth,

offered by the Wales Air Ambulance is crucial. I should remind Members that there is no district general hospital in Montgomeryshire or, indeed, the whole of Powys. Having that aircraft base at Welshpool means that mid Wales will have the continued facility to be well served by the Wales Air Ambulance's crucial pre-hospital care service.

The peace of mind that the service provides is priceless, and that is why thousands of people are inspired to raise money for this fantastic charity every year. Indeed, I did a cross-Wales walk myself for the charity, and I thank many of the Members who sponsored me on that, some of whom have not yet paid me. I will not name them, Mark Isherwood. *[Laughter.]* The question that I have for the Minister is this. Do you think that the Wales Air Ambulance is a crucial service that must be provided, especially in mid Wales? We must remember that it takes an hour and a half to travel from the centre of Montgomeryshire to the nearest district general hospital. If the answer is 'yes', would you agree, Minister, that that service should not be funded by volunteers and local fundraising alone? I put it to you, Minister, that for every £1 raised by volunteers, the Welsh Government contribute £1, up to a set ceiling. There is a cost to that, of course, but I happen to think that people in rural Wales deserve the same level of service as those in any other part of Wales. If we cannot have a district general hospital—and I understand the reasons for that—this Government should at least support this service.

We are very fortunate that a legacy left from the estate of the late Harry Boden, a local building merchant, secured the new helicopter to be based at Welshpool Airport, along with the efforts of many volunteers and local people who raised funds. I also give my sincere thanks to Anne Lewis, the local Wales Air Ambulance fundraising co-ordinator, and the many volunteers and staff who work and give their time to this charity. I hope that the Minister will be able to give a

ynghyd â diffyg ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth, yn golygu bod y cyfleuster a gynigir gan Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru yn hanfodol. Dylwn atgoffa Aelodau nad oes ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth yn sir Drefaldwyn, nac, yn wir, ym Mhowys gyfan. Mae'r ganolfan awyrennau yn y Trallwng yn golygu y bydd y canolbarth yn parhau i gael ei wasanaethu'n dda gan wasanaeth gofal cyn ysbyty hollbwysig Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru.

Mae'r tawelwch meddwl a gynigir gan y gwasanaeth yn amhrisiadwy, a dyna pam mae miloedd o bobl yn cael eu hysbrydoli i godi arian at yr elusen ardderchog hon bob blwyddyn. Yn wir, euthum ar daith gerdded ar draws Cymru fy hun i godi arian i'r elusen, a hoffwn ddiolch i lawer o'r Aelodau a'm noddodd am wneud hynny, er nad yw rhai ohonynt wedi talu eto. Ni wnaf eu henwi, Mark Isherwood. *[Chwerthin.]* Y cwestiwn sydd gennyf i'r Gweinidog yw hyn. A ydych o'r farn bod Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru yn wasanaeth hanfodol y mae'n rhaid ei ddarparu, yn enwedig yn y canolbarth? Rhaid inni gofio ei bod yn cymryd awr a hanner i deithio o ganol sir Drefaldwyn i'r ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth agosaf. Os mai'r ateb yw 'ydw', a fydddech yn cytuno, Weinidog, na ddylai gwasanaeth gael ei ariannu gan wirfoddolwyr a chodi arian yn lleol yn unig? Hoffwn wneud awgrym ichi, Weinidog, am bob £1 a godir gan wirfoddolwyr, y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gyfrannu £1, hyd at uchafswm penodol. Bydd cost yn gysylltiedig â hynny, wrth gwrs, ond rwy'n digwydd credu bod pobl yn ardaloedd gwledig Cymru yn haeddu'r un lefel o wasanaeth â'r rhai mewn unrhyw ran arall o Gymru. Os na allwn gael ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth—a deallaf y rhesymau dros hynny—dylai'r Llywodraeth hon o leiaf gefnogi'r gwasanaeth hwn.

Rydym yn ffodus iawn bod yr hofrennydd newydd yn gallu cael ei leoli ym Maes Awyr y Trallwng drwy rodd yn ewyllys y diweddar Harry Boden, masnachwr adeiladu lleol, ynghyd ag ymdrechion llawer o wirfoddolwyr a phobl leol a gododd arian. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch o galon i Anne Lewis, cyd-gysylltydd codi arian lleol Ambiwylans Awyr Cymru, a'r llu o wirfoddolwyr a staff sy'n gweithio ac yn rhoi o'u hamser i'r elusen hon. Gobeithaf y bydd y Gweinidog

few minutes of her time to pay tribute to the many people who support the Wales Air Ambulance, and give of their time to do so. Without this legacy and without these people raising funds in mid Wales, we simply would not have the ability to get people from any location in Montgomeryshire to a district general hospital within 15 minutes. It is not Government funding. We just would not have that ability, and we should therefore pay great tribute to those people. I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this debate today.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Lesley Griffiths):** The delivery of clinically safe and effective emergency care services is a top priority for this Government. I therefore welcome the debate on the role of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. Like other Members, I have the utmost admiration for the ambulance staff who work day in, day out, to respond to patients needing life-saving care. This debate presents an opportunity for me to set out very clearly my response to the key themes raised in this debate relating to funding, performance and the reconfiguration of health services.

First, on funding, let me clarify a few things. The Welsh ambulance services trust's core financial allocation was agreed at the beginning of this financial year. The discussions that have been taking place recently with health boards have been about in-year adjustments, not the substantive budget, as some Members have stated. These adjustments include the allocation of the additional £10 million of unscheduled care investment funding that I announced in July. These discussions focused on approximately 2% of the overall budget: less than £3 million. In questions to the First Minister on 30 October, the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats stated that no budget had been set for the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, and that that had led directly to the 65% category-A target being missed. That is incorrect, and I know that the chair of the trust has written to you, Kirsty, and has stated that the core funding has been known since the start of the year.

yn gallu rhoi ychydig funudau o'i hamser hithau i dalu teyrnged i'r llu o bobl sy'n cefnogi Ambiwlans Awyr Cymru, ac yn rhoi o'u hamser i wneud hynny. Oni bai am y rhodd hon, ac oni bai am y bobl hyn yn codi arian yn y canolbarth, ni fyddai modd inni gael pobl o unrhyw leoliad yn sir Drefaldwyn i ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth o fewn 15 munud. Nid cyllid y Llywodraeth ydyw. Yn syml, ni fyddai modd inni wneud hynny ac felly dylem dalu teyrnged fawr i'r bobl hynny. Rwy'n ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon heddiw.

**Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Lesley Griffiths):** Mae darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys sy'n ddiogel yn glinigol ac yn effeithiol yn flaenoriaeth fawr i'r Llywodraeth hon. Felly croesawaf y ddadl ar rôl Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru. Fel Aelodau eraill, rwy'n edmygu'n fawr iawn y staff ambiwlans sy'n gweithio ddydd ar ôl dydd, i ymateb i gleifion y mae angen gofal achub bywyd arnynt. Mae'r ddadl hon yn rhoi cyfle imi nodi'n glir iawn fy ymateb i'r themâu allweddol a godwyd yn y ddadl hon sy'n ymwneud ag ariannu, perfformiad ac ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd.

Yn gyntaf, o ran cyllid, gadewch imi egluro ychydig o bethau. Cytunwyd ar yr arian craidd i'w ddyrannu i ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans Cymru ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ariannol hon. Mae'r trafodaethau sydd wedi bod yn digwydd yn ddiweddar gyda byrddau iechyd wedi bod yn trafod addasiadau mewn blwyddyn, nid y gyllideb wreiddiol, fel y dywedodd rhai Aelodau. Mae'r addasiadau hyn yn cynnwys dyraniad o £10 miliwn ychwanegol o fuddsoddiad cyllid gofal heb ei drefnu a gyhoeddais ym mis Gorffennaf. Canolbwyntiodd y trafodaethau hyn ar tua 2% o'r gyllideb gyffredinol: llai na £3 miliwn. Yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ar 30 Hydref, dywedodd arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru nad oedd unrhyw gyllideb wedi ei phennu ar gyfer Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru, a bod hynny wedi arwain yn uniongyrchol at golli'r targed o 65% ar gyfer galwadau categori A. Mae hynny'n anghywir, a gwn fod cadeirydd yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi ysgrifennu atoch,

Kirsty, ac wedi nodi bod yr arian craidd wedi bod yn hysbys ers dechrau'r flwyddyn.

Kirsty Williams then went further in claiming that the chair of WAST had stated at a public board meeting that LHBs had been intransigent in their dealings with WAST, and that I had been personally unhelpful. Again, I believe that the letter sent by the chair of WAST has corrected any misapprehensions that the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats may have been labouring under.

Aeth Kirsty Williams ymhellach a honni bod cadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru wedi datgan mewn cyfarfod bwrdd cyhoeddus bod y byrddau iechyd lleol wedi bod yn anhyblyg wrth ymdrin â'r ymddiriedolaeth, ac nad oeddwn innau wedi bod o gymorth. Unwaith eto, credaf fod y llythyr a anfonwyd gan gadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru wedi cywiro unrhyw gamddealltwriaeth ar ran arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.

6.00 p.m.

**Peter Black:** I have a contemporaneous note of that meeting because a member of my staff was at that meeting. It is quite clear that he did say those words and if you are now saying that he did not, your officials have clearly put pressure on him to withdraw them.

**Peter Black:** Mae gennyf nodyn o'r cyfarfod hwnnw a wnaed ar y pryd am fod aelod o'm staff yn y cyfarfod hwnnw. Mae'n eithaf amlwg iddo ddweud y geiriau hynny ac os ydych yn dweud yn awr na wnaeth hynny, mae'n amlwg bod eich swyddogion wedi rhoi pwysau arno i'w tynnu'n ôl.

**Lesley Griffiths:** I have a copy of the letter that the chair of WAST wrote to Kirsty Williams stating that. If you want to take up that issue with the chair, I suggest that you do so, but he states clearly with regard to the words attributed to him in particular, that not one member of the board, executive or non-executive, recalls them being made. I am committed to ensuring that the ambulance service in Wales is appropriately funded and works in a way that enables the delivery of high-quality, fair and equitable levels of service the public expects and deserves.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Mae gennyf gopi o'r llythyr a anfonodd cadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru at Kirsty Williams yn dweud hynny. Os ydych am godi'r mater hwnnw gyda'r cadeirydd, awgrymaf eich bod yn gwneud hynny, ond mae'n datgan yn glir o ran y geiriau a briodolwyd iddo yn benodol, nad oes yr un aelod o'r bwrdd, aelodau gweithredol neu anweithredol, yn cofio'r geiriau hynny. Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru yn cael ei ariannu'n briodol ac yn gweithio mewn ffordd sy'n ei gwneud yn bosibl i ddarparu'r un lefel o wasanaeth o safon uchel y mae'r cyhoedd yn ei ddisgwyl ac yn ei haeddu.

Secondly, let me address issues related to the performance of WAST. I fully understand and share the concerns of Assembly Members about the recent variation in performance of WAST. I am determined that this variation will not continue. However, I want to bring a degree of context to the debate. The ambulance service is part of a complex system of healthcare in Wales. Our aim is to ensure that more people, particularly those with chronic conditions, can access

Yn ail, gadewch imi ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â pherfformiad Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Rwyf yn llwyr ddeall ac yn rhannu pryderon yr Aelodau Cynulliad ynglŷn â'r amrywiad diweddar ym mherfformiad Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Rwy'n benderfynol na fydd yr amrywiad hwn yn parhau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gyflwyno rhywfaint o gyd-destun i'r drafodaeth. Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn rhan o system

care closer to home and earlier in order to prevent them needing an ambulance.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Minister, what is your reaction to the fact that a Caerphilly woman who needed an emergency caesarean section last week waited two hours for an ambulance to take her from Ystrad Mynach to the Royal Gwent Hospital, where her baby then died during an attempted forceps delivery. Will you ensure that the family's wishes for a proper investigation are met? Will women have confidence in midwife-led centres if they have no confidence in an ambulance should things go wrong?

**Lesley Griffiths:** I thank the Member for that intervention. I am aware of this very distressing case. Jeff Cuthbert and you have both written to me about it and I can assure you that I will be writing to Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board to ensure that a thorough investigation is conducted.

Currently, there are clear emerging indicators showing significant demographic impacts on NHS services in Wales. This new, higher level of baseline demand is directly driving the underlying and growing pressures we are seeing on the ambulance service, A&E and many other parts of the NHS. Wales has the highest proportion of people aged over 85 compared with the rest of the UK, which is predicted to increase dramatically in the next 10 years. This has a knock-on effect, creating more demand on the NHS, and we are already seeing higher proportions of older people attending A&E. We know that they are more likely to be admitted to hospital than any other age group. The level of health need and dependency in this age group can often be much higher, having a significant impact on the demand for ambulance services and the NHS generally.

In addition, the most recent data from the

gymhleth o ofal iechyd yng Nghymru. Ein nod yw sicrhau y gall mwy o bobl, yn enwedig y rhai â chyflyrau cronig, gael gofal yn agosach at y cartref ac yn gynharach er mwyn atal yr angen am ambiwlans rhag codi.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Weinidog, beth yw eich ymateb i'r ffaith bod yn rhaid i fenyw o Gaerffili yr oedd angen iddi gael toriad cesaraidd ar frys yr wythnos diwethaf aros am ddwy awr am ambiwlans i fynd â hi o Ystrad Mynach i Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent, lle bu farw ei babi yn ystod ymgais i roi genedigaeth â chymorth gefeiliau. A wnewch chi sicrhau y caiff dymuniadau'r teulu i gael ymchwiliad priodol eu bodloni? A fydd gan ferched hyder mewn canolfannau dan arweiniad bydwagedd os nad oes ganddynt hyder mewn ambiwlans pe bai pethau yn mynd o chwith?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Diolch i'r Aelod am yr ymyriad hwnnw. Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r achos truenus hwn. Mae Jeff Cuthbert a chithau wedi ysgrifennu ataf am y mater a gallaf eich sicrhau y byddaf yn ysgrifennu at Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan i wneud yn siŵr bod ymchwiliad trylwyr yn cael ei gynnal.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae arwyddion clir yn dod i'r amlwg sy'n dangos effeithiau demograffig sylweddol ar wasanaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru. Y galw sylfaenol uwch newydd hwn sy'n arwain yn uniongyrchol at y pwysau sylfaenol a chynyddol a welwn ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a rhannau eraill o'r GIG. Gan Gymru mae'r gyfran uchaf o bobl dros 85 oed o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU, a rhagwelir y bydd yn cynyddu'n ddramatig yn ystod y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Mae hyn yn cael effaith ganlyniadol, sy'n creu mwy o alw ar y GIG, ac rydym eisoes yn gweld cyfrannau uwch o bobl hŷn yn mynd i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Rydym yn gwybod eu bod yn fwy tebygol o gael eu derbyn i'r ysbyty nag unrhyw grŵp oedran arall. Gall y lefel o angen iechyd a dibyniaeth yn y grŵp oedran hwn yn aml fod yn llawer uwch, sy'n cael effaith sylweddol ar y galw am wasanaethau ambiwlans a'r GIG yn gyffredinol.

Yn ogystal, mae'r data diweddaraf o Arolwg

Welsh Health Survey shows that over half of men and women are classified as overweight or obese. This increases the risk of developing a number of serious and potentially life-threatening diseases—issues that all play into the picture of the rising demand we are seeing. It is only fair then to view the current performance of WAST in the context of this rapidly increasing demand. Over recent months, the service is getting to more category A calls within eight minutes than ever before. Between January and September this year, there were 18,000 additional category A calls compared with last year. While it is obvious that there is now an increased baseline level of demand, it is vital that people take responsibility for using all health services appropriately.

**Kirsty Williams:** Will the Minister give way?

**Lesley Griffiths:** I cannot take any more interventions, I am sorry.

The ambulance service has met the 65% category A response standard in 11 of the last 17 months, and where it has been missed, this is often by less than 1%. However, I am determined to ensure WAST goes further to drive forward improvements to further support patient care. This includes the daily NHS executive teleconference calls. These provide an effective forum to enable collaboration and negotiation across health boards to respond to existing pressures as they arise. Thanks to this new joint initiative, in recent months there has been a 47% reduction in lost hours—those times when ambulances are held up at hospitals. This has improved significantly over the last three months. However, having laid out the context, I fully recognise there is still work to be done to raise the bar and improve overall response times.

Thirdly I would like to consider the role of the Ambulance service in the wider reconfiguration of NHS services. Members are aware that I have instigated a mid-year review of finance and performance alongside

Iechyd Cymru yn dangos bod dros hanner y dynion a'r merched yn cael eu dosbarthu'n rhy drwm neu'n ordew. Mae hyn yn cynyddu'r risg o ddatblygu nifer o glefydau difrifol a allai beryglu bywyd—problemâu sydd oll yn cyfrannu at y darlun o'r galw cynyddol a welwn. Mae ond yn deg ystyried perfformiad presennol yr ymddiriedolaeth yng nghyd-destun y galw sy'n cynyddu'n gyflym. Dros y misoedd diwethaf, mae'r gwasanaeth wedi cyrraedd mwy o alwadau categori A o fewn wyth munud nag erioed o'r blaen. Rhwng mis Ionawr a mis Medi eleni, cafodd 18,000 o alwadau categori A ychwanegol o gymharu â'r llynedd. Er ei bod yn amlwg bod galw sylfaenol ychwanegol bellach, mae'n hanfodol bod pobl yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb am ddefnyddio'r holl wasanaethau iechyd yn briodol.

**Kirsty Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog iddio?

**Lesley Griffiths:** Ni allaf dderbyn rhagor o ymyriadau, mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi cyrraedd y targed ymateb o 65% ar gyfer galwadau categori A mewn 11 o'r 17 mis diwethaf, a lle mae wedi cael ei gollu, mae hyn yn aml o lai nag 1%. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n benderfynol o sicrhau bod Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru yn hyrwyddo gwelliannau i wella cymorth gofal cleifion ymhellach. Mae hyn yn cynnwys galwadau telegynhadledd gweithredol y GIG bob dydd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnig fforwm effeithiol i alluogi cydweithio a chyd-drafod rhwng byrddau iechyd i ymateb i'r pwysau sy'n bodoli wrth iddynt godi. Diolch i'r gyd-fenter newydd hon, yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, bu gostyngiad o 47% mewn oriau a gollwyd—yr adegau hynny pan fydd ambiwlansys yn gorfod aros mewn ysbytai. Mae hyn wedi gwella'n sylweddol dros y tri mis diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl nodi'r cyd-destun, cydnabyddaf yn llawn fod gwaith i'w wneud o hyd i godi'r safon a gwella amseroedd ymateb cyffredinol.

Yn drydydd, hoffwn ystyried rôl y gwasanaeth Ambiwllans yng nghyd-destun ad-drefnu gwasanaethau'r GIG yn ehangach. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol imi sefydlu adolygiad canol blwyddyn o gyllid a

this to assist my decision making. I can assure Members that WAST has been fully involved with local health boards in developing the service reconfiguration proposals. That reconfiguration is being undertaken to ensure that patients receive the right treatment at the right time in the right place, and I can assure you, as I have mentioned, that WAST has been fully involved in those plans.

Darren Millar and Russell George referred to the Wales Air Ambulance service, and of course we support it. It is greatly valued, and I would like to pay tribute to its volunteers. We fund the paramedics on the air ambulance, but the operational costs of the helicopters are funded through charitable donations. The charity has never requested additional financial assistance from the Welsh Government.

**Darren Millar** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has said that she will not be taking any more interventions.

**Lesley Griffiths:** I have decided to undertake a review of the Welsh ambulance service. This will be a comprehensive review and will cover relationships with health boards, including funding arrangements, targets, structure, whether the current arrangements might be modified, and the relationship between emergency and non-emergency patient transport services. I will be asking officials to prepare terms of reference for the review, and I will share these with Assembly Members before the end of this month.

**Peter Black:** I only have three and a half minutes, so I will have to be succinct. I note that the Minister is announcing the ninth review in six years, I think—that is how we have added them up. If we have had eight reviews and we still cannot get it right, how will this ninth one make any difference? The Minister needs to get the basics right and make sure that the ambulance service delivers on what it is meant to be delivering, and has

pherfformiad ochr yn ochr â hyn i'm helpu i wneud penderfyniadau. Gallaf roi sicrwydd i'r Aelodau fod Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru wedi bod yn ymwneud yn llawn â'r byrddau iechyd lleol i ddatblygu'r cynigion i ad-drefnu gwasanaethau. Ad-drefnir gwasanaethau er mwyn sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael y driniaeth gywir ar yr amser cywir yn y lle cywir, a gallaf roi sicrwydd ichi, fel yr wyf wedi crybwyll, bod yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi cymryd rhan lawn yn y cynlluniau hynny.

Cyfeiriodd Darren Millar a Russell George at wasanaeth Ambiwllans Awyr Cymru, ac wrth gwrs rydym yn ei gefnogi. Mae'n cael ei werthfawrogi'n fawr, a hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'w wirfoddolwyr. Rydym yn ariannu'r parafeddygon ar yr ambiwlans awyr, ond caiff costau gweithredol yr hofrenyddion eu hariannu drwy roddion elusennol. Nid yw'r elusen erioed wedi gofyn am gymorth ariannol ychwanegol gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

**Darren Millar** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud na fydd yn derbyn rhagor o ymyriadau.

**Lesley Griffiths:** Rwyf wedi penderfynu cynnal adolygiad o wasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Bydd hwn yn adolygiad cynhwysfawr a bydd yn cynnwys y berthynas â'r byrddau iechyd, gan gynnwys trefniadau ariannu, targedau, strwythur, pa un a oes modd addasu'r trefniadau presennol, a'r berthynas rhwng y gwasanaeth cludo cleifion brys a'r gwasanaeth nad yw'n frys. Byddaf yn gofyn i swyddogion baratoi cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr adolygiad, a byddaf yn ei rannu gydag Aelodau'r Cynulliad cyn diwedd y mis hwn.

**Peter Black:** Dim ond tair munud a hanner sydd gennyf, felly bydd yn rhaid imi fod yn gryno. Nodaf fod y Gweinidog yn cyhoeddi'r nawfed adolygiad mewn chwe blynedd, fe gredaf—dyna'r cyfanswm sydd gennym. Os ydym wedi cael wyth adolygiad a'n bod yn methu o hyd i gael pethau'n iawn, sut y bydd y nawfed adolygiad yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth? Mae angen i'r Gweinidog gael y pethau sylfaenol yn iawn a gwneud yn siŵr

the budget that it needs to do so.

Both Mike Hedges and the Minister said that the core budget was agreed in April this year. The Minister says that the discussion that took place at the trust meeting on 18 October was about in-year adjustments. She then went on to talk about the massive increase in demand for the ambulance service, indicating that those in-year adjustments will have to be quite massive if they are to get anywhere near meeting those pressures. Clearly, this core budget was fairly small to start with. If you look at the press release that was put out by the Welsh NHS Confederation on 2 November, it says that:

‘the Welsh Ambulance Service and the Local Health Boards in Wales have reached agreement on funding for the ambulance service in 2012-13 to meet service pressures and support the Trust in meeting its financial duties.’

That sounds pretty core to me. The Minister says that the core budget was set in April; what exactly is that about? At the meeting on 18 October, it was made clear in the public part of that meeting—and I have contemporaneous notes here—that the Welsh ambulance service trust had set a deadline of 13 June for the conclusion of budget negotiations and warned of the consequences of failure. Despite this clear warning, no settlement was forthcoming, and the chair indicated that, in his view, there were two factors at play here—the intransigence of the health boards and the unhelpfulness of the Minister. I have seen the letter that the Minister refers to, in which the chair denies making those comments, but it seems that the only note of that meeting is the one taken by my member of staff. There is not an official note of the meeting. You wonder what pressure was brought to bear on the chair to write that letter and subsequently deny that he made those remarks. He was clearly brought in to see the Minister or her advisers, and had the riot Act read to him on what had happened. I think that is unacceptable. What

bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cyflawni'r hyn y dylai ei gyflawni, a bod ganddo y gyllideb sydd ei hangen arno i wneud hynny.

Dywedodd Mike Hedges a'r Gweinidog y cytunwyd ar y gyllideb graidd ym mis Ebrill eleni. Dywed y Gweinidog fod y drafodaeth a gynhaliwyd yng nghyfarfod yr ymddiriedolaeth ar 18 Hydref yn ymwneud ag addasiadau mewn blwyddyn. Yna aeth yn ei blaen i sôn am y cynnydd enfawr yn y galw am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gan awgrymu y bydd yn rhaid i'r addasiadau mewn blwyddyn fod yn eithaf mawr er mwyn dod yn agos at ymdrin â'r pwysau hynny. Yn amlwg, roedd y gyllideb graidd hon yn eithaf bach i ddechrau. Os edrychwch ar y datganiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan Gonffederasiwn GIG Cymru ar 2 Tachwedd, dywed:

mae Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Cymru a'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol yng Nghymru wedi dod i gytundeb ar gyllid ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn 2012-13 i ymdrin â phwysau ar y gwasanaeth a helpu'r Ymddiriedolaeth i gyflawni ei dyletswyddau ariannol.

Mae hynny'n swnio'n eithaf creiddiol i mi. Dywed y Gweinidog i'r gyllideb graidd gael ei phennu ym mis Ebrill; beth yn union yw ystyr hynny? Yn y cyfarfod ar 18 Hydref, fe'i gwnaed yn glir yn y rhan gyhoeddus o'r cyfarfod hwnnw—ac mae gennyf nodiadau a wnaed ar y pryd yma—bod ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru wedi gosod terfyn amser o 13 Mehefin ar gyfer dod â'r trafodaethau cyllidebol i ben ac wedi rhybuddio am yr hyn a fyddai'n digwydd pe bai methiant i wneud hynny. Er gwaethaf y rhybudd clir hwn, ni chafwyd setliad, a dywedodd y cadeirydd y gellid priodoli hyn i ddau ffactor, yn ei farn ef—anhyblygrwydd y byrddau iechyd a methiant y Gweinidog i helpu. Rwyf wedi gweld y llythyr y mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfeirio ato, lle mae'r cadeirydd yn gwadu gwneud y sylwadau hynny, ond ymddengys mai'r unig nodyn o'r cyfarfod yw'r un a wnaed gan fy aelod o staff. Nid oes nodyn swyddogol o'r cyfarfod. Tybed pa bwysau a roddwyd ar y cadeirydd i ysgrifennu'r llythyr hwnnw ac yna wadu iddo wneud y sylwadau hynny. Mae'n amlwg iddo gael ei ddwyn gerbron y Gweinidog neu ei



we are getting here is confuscation and misdirection to try to distract us from the failures of this Government in relation to the Welsh ambulance service trust.

We are in a situation where the trust did not have the budget to deliver its service until mid year, and we have already heard from a number of Members about the consequences of that, in terms of people having to wait long times for ambulances, and stations not being staffed. Elin Jones referred to a whole list of incidents in Swansea, my own area, where these problems have arisen, and I have also had correspondence from Porthcawl and Bridgend about similar situations. It seems to me, Minister, that you have to get a grip of this issue. I wonder whether a review will do it. Amendment 6 says that the budget should be clearly set out by the Minister so that we can have some transparency and accountability as to the way forward. I urge you to move along those lines, and to let us know as soon as possible, if you are to have this review, what the terms of reference are, who will carry it out, and what the impact will be on the pressures this winter. I think this Government has failed massively in relation to the ambulance service trust.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The question is that the motion without amendment be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is, so I defer all voting on this item until voting time.

Before I proceed to the votes, are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? I see that there are not.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Voting deferred until voting time.*

### **Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time**

*Cynnig NDM5084: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Motion NDM5084: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

hymgyngorwyr, ac iddynt ddweud y drefn wrtho ynghylch yr hyn a oedd wedi digwydd. Credaf fod hynny'n annerbyniol. Yr hyn a welwn yma yw ymgais i ddrysu a charmarwain er mwyn ceisio tynnu ein sylw oddi wrth fethiannau'r Llywodraeth hon mewn perthynas ag ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru.

Rydym mewn sefyllfa lle nad oedd gan yr ymddiriedolaeth y gyllideb i ddarparu ei wasanaeth tan ganol y flwyddyn, ac rydym eisoes wedi clywed gan nifer o Aelodau am ganlyniadau hynny, o ran pobl yn gorfod aros amser hir am ambiwlans, a gorsafoedd heb eu staffio. Cyfeiriodd Elin Jones at restr hir o ddigwyddiadau yn Abertawe, fy ardal i, lle mae'r problemau hyn wedi codi, ac rwyf hefyd wedi cael gohebiaeth o Borthcawl a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr am sefyllfaoedd tebyg. Ymddengys i mi, Weinidog, fod yn rhaid ichi fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Tybed a fydd adolygiad yn llwyddo i wneud hynny. Dywed gwelliant 6 y dylai'r gyllideb gael ei phennu'n glir gan y Gweinidog fel y gallwn gael rhywfaint o dryloywder ac atebolrwydd o ran y ffordd ymlaen. Rwy'n eich annog i symud ar hyd y llinellau hynny, a rhoi gwybod inni cyn gynted ag y bo modd, os cynhelir yr adolygiad hwn gennych, beth yw'r cylch gorchwyl, pwy fydd yn ei gynnal, a beth fydd yr effaith ar y pwysau y gaeaf hwn. Credaf fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi methu'n lân mewn perthynas â'r ymddiriedolaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly gohuriaf bob pleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

Cyn imi fynd ymlaen at y pleidleisiau, a oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5084: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.  
Amendment 1 to NDM5084: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbynniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

Cynnig NDM5084 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5084 as amended:

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

- |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>1. <i>Yn talu teyrnged i aberth ac ymrwymiad aruthrol y rheini sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ein Lluoedd Arfog;</i></p>                                                                                                                                                                                             | <p>1. <i>Pays tribute to the immense sacrifice and commitment of those who have served in our Armed Forces;</i></p>                                                                                                                                                                                |
| <p>2. <i>Yn nodi'r buddsoddiad diweddar a wnaed mewn gwasanaethau yng Nghymru i gynorthwyo cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ac yn derbyn pa mor bwysig yw'r rôl y gall y trydydd sector ei chwarae wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau wedi'u cydlynu i gyn-filwyr;</i></p>                           | <p>2. <i>Notes the recent investment in services in Wales to support ex-service personnel suffering with post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and accepts the importance of the role that the third sector can play in the delivery of coordinated services to ex-service personnel;</i></p>      |
| <p>3. <i>Yn nodi canfyddiadau Adroddiad Gofal Iechyd a Chymuned y Lluoedd Arfog yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried yn fanwl sefydlu canolfan breswyl yng Nghymru ar gyfer cyn-filwyr gydag anhwylder straen wedi trawma; ac</i></p>                                                            | <p>3. <i>Notes the findings of the Healthcare and the Armed Forces Community in Wales Report and calls on the Welsh Government to give careful consideration to establishing a residential centre in Wales for ex-service personnel with PTSD; and</i></p>                                         |
| <p>4. <i>Yn cydnabod y rôl hanfodol y mae cofebion rhyfel yn ei chwarae wrth sicrhau nad yw aberth y bobl hynny sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn ein Lluoedd Arfog byth yn mynd yn angof, ac yn nodi pwysigrwydd gwarchod cofebion rhyfel yn rhan allweddol o dreftadaeth Cymru ac fel canolbwynt ar gyfer cofio.</i></p> | <p>4. <i>Recognises the vital role that war memorials play in ensuring that the sacrifices of many who have served in our Armed Forces are never forgotten, and notes the importance of protecting war memorials as an essential part of Welsh heritage and a focal point for remembrance.</i></p> |

*Cynnig NDM5084 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.  
Motion NDM5084 as amended: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Powell, William

Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM5084 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM5084 as amended agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM5086: O blaid 6, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 35.  
Motion NDM5086: For 6, Abstain 0, Against 35.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5086: O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 2.  
Amendment 1 to NDM5086: For 39, Abstain 0, Against 2.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Graham, William  
Millar, Darren

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM5086: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 14.  
Amendment 2 to NDM5086: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 14.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark

Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM5086: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 3 to NDM5086: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM5086: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
Amendment 4 to NDM5086: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 5 i NDM5086: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
 Amendment 5 to NDM5086: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Powell, William  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM5086: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
 Amendment 6 to NDM5086: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Davies, Jocelyn  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

6.15 p.m.

*Gwelliant 7 i NDM5086: O blaid 24, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 10.  
Amendment 7 to NDM5086: For 24, Abstain 6, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren



Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 8 i NDM5086: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 8 to NDM5086: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 9 i NDM5086: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Amendment 9 to NDM5086: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 10 i NDM5086: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 10 to NDM5086: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM5086 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5086 as amended:

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn nodi'r gwaith pwysig y mae penaeithiaid, athrawon a llywodraethwyr yn ei wneud o ddydd i ddydd i sicrhau'r addysg orau bosibl i'n plant.*

*1. Notes the important work that head teachers, teachers and governors carry out on a day to day basis to secure the best possible education for our children.*

*2. Yn nodi bod:*

*2. Notes that:*

*a) Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dynodi mai partneriaethau gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol, ynghyd â'r diwygiadau addysgol eraill a gefnogir gan y cynllun gweithredu i wella ysgolion a lansiwyd yn ddiweddar a chydweithredu effeithiol ehangach rhwng gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yw'r ateb ar gyfer mynd i'r afael â'r methiant systematig ym myd addysg;*

*a) regional school improvement partnerships, along with the other educational reforms supported through the recently launched school improvement implementation plan and wider effective collaboration between public services, have been identified by the Welsh Government as the answer to address the systemic failure in education;*

*b) y cynllun bandio ar gyfer ysgolion uwchradd wedi dynodi bod angen gwella ysgolion ym Mandiau 4 a 5 ar fyrder;*

*b) the banding scheme for secondary schools has identified schools in Bands 4 and 5 as in need of urgent improvement;*

*3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod:*

*3. Calls on the Welsh Government to ensure that:*

*a) y consortia addysg rhanbarthol yn cynnwys ymgeiswyr o'r safon uchaf bosibl ac yn gwbl weithredol cyn gynted â phosibl ac, os nad yw hyn yn bosibl yn y chwe mis nesaf, bod rôl y consortia addysg rhanbarthol yn nyfodol system addysg Cymru yn cael ei hadolygu.*

*a) the regional education consortia are populated with the highest possible quality of candidate and fully operational as soon as possible, and if this is not possible in the next six months, to review the role of regional education consortia in the future of the Welsh education system.*

*b) bod yr ysgolion a roddwyd yn y bandiau is yn cael y cymorth angenrheidiol ar unwaith i fynd i'r afael â methiant systematig.*

*b) the schools placed in lower bands are immediately provided with the necessary support to address systemic failure.*

*4. Yn nodi sut y gallai gweithredu'r Grant Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn llwyddiannus gael effaith fuddiol ar gyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion.*

*4. Notes the beneficial impact that the successful implementation of the Pupil Deprivation Grant could have on attainment in schools.*

*5. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i weithio gydag ysgolion, athrawon a phartneriaethau gwella ysgolion i sicrhau bod y Grant*

*5. Calls on the Welsh Government to work with schools, teachers and school improvement partnerships to ensure the*

*Amddifadedd Disgyblion yn cael ei optimum use of the Pupil Deprivation Grant ddefnyddio yn y modd gorau posibl, er mwyn to ensure that every child can achieve their sicrhau bod pob plentyn yn gallu cyflawni ei potential.*

*Cynnig NDM5086 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 35, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.  
Motion NDM5086 as amended: For 35, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig NDM5086 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM5086 as amended agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM5085: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Motion NDM5085: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Jones, Elin  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Gething, Vaughan  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM5085: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 20.  
Amendment 1 to NDM5085: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 20.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Millar, Darren  
Powell, William  
Roberts, Aled  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM5085: O blaid 19, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
Amendment 2 to NDM5085: For 19, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM5085: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
 Amendment 3 to NDM5085: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Powell, William  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM5085: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 4 to NDM5085: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Antoniw, Mick  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Dad-ddetholwyd gwelliant 5.  
 Amendment 5 deselected.*

*Gwelliant 6 i NDM5085: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
 Amendment 6 to NDM5085: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniow, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike

Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Powell, William  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 7 i NDM5085: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 19.  
 Amendment 7 to NDM5085: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 19.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 8 i NDM5085: O blaid 41, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 8 to NDM5085: For 41, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet



George, Russell  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Powell, William  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 9 i NDM5085: O blaid 20, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 21.  
 Amendment 9 to NDM5085: For 20, Abstain 0, Against 21.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Black, Peter  
 Burns, Angela  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Davies, Paul  
 Davies, Suzy  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet  
 George, Russell  
 Graham, William  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Elin  
 Millar, Darren  
 Powell, William  
 Roberts, Aled  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Thomas, Simon  
 Whittle, Lindsay  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Antoniw, Mick  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Drakeford, Mark  
 Evans, Rebecca  
 Gething, Vaughan  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hedges, Mike  
 Jones, Ann  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Julie  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Price, Gwyn R.  
 Rathbone, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 10 i NDM5085: O blaid 10, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 25.  
 Amendment 10 to NDM5085: For 10, Abstain 6, Against 25.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Jones, Elin  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM5085 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5085 as amended:

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i:*

*1. Calls on the Welsh Government to:*

*a) amlinellu rôl Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru o ran ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth a'r effaith y gallai'r ad-drefnu hwnnw ei chael ar eu cyllideb a'u perfformiad;*

*a) outline the role of the Wales Ambulance Service Trust with regard to service reconfiguration and the impact that reconfiguration could have on their budget and performance;*

*b) asesu ar fyrder y cymorth sydd ar gael i Wasanaeth Ambiwylans Cymru fel y gall gyrraedd ei darged amser ymateb o 65% y cytunwyd arno; a*

*b) urgently assess the support available to the Wales Ambulance Service so they can meet their agreed 65% response time targets; and*

*c) parhau i asesu'r trefniadau rhwng*

*c) continue to assess arrangements between*

*Pwyllgor Gwasanaethau Iechyd Arbenigol Cymru, y Byrddau Iechyd Lleol ac Ymddiriedolaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwlans Cymru er mwyn sicrhau bod trefniadau llywodraethu ac ariannu cadarn yn dal ar waith.*

*the Welsh Health Specialised Services Committee, Local Health Boards and WAST, to ensure robust governance and funding arrangements remain in place.*

*2. Yn nodi'r rôl hanfodol y mae Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Awyr Cymru yn ei chwarae wrth gynorthwyo Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru i ymateb i achosion brys yng Nghymru.*

*2. Notes the critical role played by the Wales Air Ambulance Service in assisting the Wales Ambulance Service to respond to emergencies in Wales.*

*Cynnig NDM5085 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 10.  
Motion NDM5085 as amended: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 10.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Antoniw, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Drakeford, Mark  
Evans, Rebecca  
Gething, Vaughan  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Gruffydd, Llyr Huws  
Hart, Edwina  
Hedges, Mike  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Julie  
Neagle, Lynne  
Powell, William  
Price, Gwyn R.  
Rathbone, Jenny  
Roberts, Aled  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Thomas, Simon  
Whittle, Lindsay  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Burns, Angela  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Davies, Suzy  
Finch-Saunders, Janet  
George, Russell  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Millar, Darren

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM5085 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM5085 as amended agreed.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.20 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 6.20 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Antoni, Mick (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Byron (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Keith (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Suzy (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Drakeford, Mark (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Yr Arglwydd/Lord (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Rebecca (Llafur – Labour)  
 Finch-Saunders, Janet (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 George, Russell (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gething, Vaughan (Llafur – Labour)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gruffydd, Llyr Huws (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hedges, Mike (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru Annibynnol – Independent Plaid Cymru)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Julie (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Parrott, Eluned (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Powell, William (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Price, Gwyn R. (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Rathbone, Jenny (Llafur – Labour)  
 Rees, David (Llafur – Labour)  
 Roberts, Aled (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Sandbach, Antoinette (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Skates, Kenneth (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Simon (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Whittle, Lindsay (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)