



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 19 Ionawr 2010  
Tuesday, 19 January 2010**

## Cynnwys Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 36 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes  
Business Statement and Announcement
- 43 Datganiad am Bosch  
Statement on Bosch
- 68 Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru  
The Annual Report of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales
- 87 Dadl Cyfnod 3 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.57 ar y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Codi  
Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru)  
Stage 3 Standing Order No. 23.57 Debate on the Proposed Social Care Charges (Wales)  
Measure
- 87 Dyletswyddau Gweinidogion Cymru mewn Perthynas â Rheoliadau (Gwelliannau 11 a 15)  
Welsh Ministers' Duties in Relation to Regulations (Amendments 11 and 15)
- 94 Y Weithdrefn ar gyfer Gwneud Is-ddeddfwriaeth (Gwelliannau 1, 9 ac 16)  
Procedure for Making Subordinate Legislation (Amendments 1, 9 and 16)
- 100 Gwybodaeth am Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 3, 2, 4, 5 a 6)  
Information about Charges (Amendments 3, 2, 4, 5 and 6)
- 104 Darparu Datganiad am Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 12 a 10)  
Provision of Charging Statement (Amendments 12 and 10)
- 113 Adolygu Penderfyniadau ar Godi Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 13, 14, 7 a 8)  
Reviews of Charging Decisions (Amendments 13, 14, 7 and 8)
- 124 Cynnig Cyfnod 4 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.58 i Gymeradwyo'r Mesur Arfaethedig  
ynghylch Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru)  
Stage 4 Standing Order No. 23.58 Motion to Approve the Proposed Social Care Charges  
(Wales) Measure
- 130 Cyfnod Pleidleisio  
Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order for questions to the First Minister.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **The Voluntary Sector**

#### **Y Sector Gwirfoddol**

**Q1 Leanne Wood:** Will the First Minister make a statement on funding for the voluntary sector? OAQ(3)2526(FM)

**C1 Leanne Wood:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllid ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol? OAQ(3)2526(FM)

**The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** The Welsh Assembly Government remains committed to working in partnership with the third sector, and to the principle that levels of funding for the sector should be determined no differently than for other sectors or agencies.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones):** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo o hyd i weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r trydydd sector, ac i'r egwyddor na ddylid pennu lefelau cyllid ar gyfer y sector mewn ffordd wahanol i'r ffordd a ddefnyddir ar gyfer sectorau neu asiantaethau eraill.

**Leanne Wood:** I recently visited Rhondda Cynon Taff Crossroads, which is a charity in Pontypridd that enables carers to take a break from their day-to-day responsibilities by offering respite services. Staff there explained the difficulties that they face by having to comply with the various directives and rulings that have come into force recently or that will do so in the near future. While the organisation has nothing against the extension of workers' rights and entitlements to pensions and holidays, it is struggling to comply with these new regulations using its existing budget. Are there any plans to look at the increasing burdens facing the voluntary sector to ensure that such demands do not have an impact on its ability to fund vital front-line services?

**Leanne Wood:** Ymwelais â Croesffyrdd Rhondda Cynon Taf yn ddiweddar, elusen ym Mhontypridd sy'n galluogi gofawyr i gael hoe o'u cyfrifoldebau beunyddiol drwy gynnig gwasanaethau seibiant. Esboniodd y staff yno yr anawsterau y maent yn eu hwynebu drwy orfod cydymffurfio â'r gwahanol gyfarwydddebau a rheolau sydd wedi'u rhoi ar waith yn ddiweddar neu a roddir ar waith yn y dyfodol agos. Er nad oes gan y mudiad ddim yn erbyn estyn hawliau gweithwyr a'u hawl i bensiynau a gwyliau, mae'n cael trafferth cydymffurfio â'r rheoliadau newydd hyn gyda'r gyllideb sydd ganddo ar hyn o bryd. A oes unrhyw gynlluniau i edrych ar y beichiau cynyddol sy'n wynebu'r sector gwirfoddol er mwyn sicrhau na chaiff gofynion o'r fath effaith ar ei allu i ariannu gwasanaethau rheng flaen hanfodol?

**The First Minister:** I am familiar with the good work of Crossroads across many parts of Wales, which, as you said, provides respite care for people who would not get it otherwise. Across Wales, we have approved a 1.1 per cent increase in funding for the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd â gwaith da Croesffyrdd mewn llawer ardal yng Nghymru, sydd, fel y dywedasoeh, yn cynnig gofal seibiant i bobl na fyddent yn ei gael fel arall. Ledled Cymru, yr ydym wedi cymeradwyo cynnydd o 1.1 y cant yn yr arian

Wales Council for Voluntary Action, county voluntary councils, and voluntary centres, and we believe that that represents a fair increase given the financial circumstances that we face at the moment.

**Mark Isherwood:** You referred to a 1.1 per cent increase in funding, but that matches exactly the decrease in funding for social enterprise. Therefore, the combined budget of social enterprise and the third sector has flatlined, which is a cut in real terms. Do you recognise that the third sector and social enterprises have a key role to play in helping Wales to recover from the recession? What action do you propose to take to address the need for core sustainable funding for those projects that are delivering key recession-beating projects, such as helping people to move from benefits to work, helping people with mental health issues to return to work, and helping families in need?

**The First Minister:** Many organisations do great work to help people in crisis and to help people to look for employment. However, we have to remember that the financial circumstances will be challenging in the years to come. Given that, 1.1 per cent represents a fair increase, to my mind, although it may not be the kind of increase that would have been expected in years gone by.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Sadly, the circumstances will be challenging because of the bankers and their bonuses, and the misadventures in the City. It is sad to think that Wales and the voluntary sector have to suffer. Do you have any views on the Network Rail WCVA magazine article published in November last year, which stated that areas that will see a decrease in funding include the older persons' strategy, inclusion, and the children and young people's strategy? You have a challenging role, First Minister. How will you rise to that challenge?

a gaiff Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, cynghorau gwirfoddol sirol, a chanolfannau gwirfoddol, a chredwn fod hwnnw'n gynnydd teg o ystyried yr amgylchiadau ariannol yr ydym yn eu hwynebu ar hyn o bryd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Soniasoch am gynnydd o 1.1 yn yr arian, ond mae hynny'n cyfateb yn union i'r gostyngiad yn yr arian a roddir i fentrau cymdeithasol. Felly, mae'r gyllideb gyfun ar gyfer mentrau cymdeithasol a'r trydydd sector wedi aros yn ei hunfan. Mewn gwirionedd, toriad yw hynny. A ydych yn cydnabod bod gan y trydydd sector a mentrau cymdeithasol rôl allweddol i'w chwarae o ran helpu Cymru i ymadfer wedi'r dirwasgiad? Pa gamau y bwriadwch eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith bod angen arian craidd cynaliadwy ar gyfer y prosiectau hynny sy'n darparu prosiectau allweddol i orchfygu'r dirwasgiad, megis cynorthwyo pobl i symud oddi ar fudd-dal i waith, cynorthwyo pobl a chanddynt anhwylder iechyd meddwl i ddychwelyd i'r gwaith, a chynorthwyo teuluoedd anghenus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae llawer o fudiadau'n gwneud gwaith gwych i gynorthwyo pobl mewn argyfwng ac i roi cymorth i bobl chwilio am waith. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio y bydd yr amgylchiadau ariannol yn anodd yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw. O gofio hynny, mae 1.1 y cant yn gynnydd teg, yn fy marn i, er nad dyma'r math o gynnydd efallai y byddai rhywun wedi'i ddisgwyl mewn blynyddoedd a aeth heibio.

**Eleanor Burnham** Yn anffodus, bydd yr amgylchiadau'n anodd oherwydd y bancwyr a'u bonysau, a'r camwri yn y Ddinas. Mae'n drist meddwl bod yn rhaid i Gymru a'r sector gwirfoddol ddiodeff. A oes gennych farn o gwbl am yr erthygl a gyhoeddwyd fis Tachwedd y llynedd yng nghylchgrawn WCVA Network Rail, a ddywedai y byddai meysydd megis y strategaeth pobl hŷn, cynhwysiant a'r strategaeth plant a phobl ifanc yn gweld eu harian yn crebachu? Mae gennych rôl i'ch herio, Brif Weinidog. Sut yr ewch i'r afael â'r her honno?

**The First Minister:** You referred to a 'Network Rail' WCVA article, which I have to say I am—

**Eleanor Burnham:** I said Network Wales.

**The First Minister:** Sorry. Given your previous history in asking questions, I am sure that I will be forgiven for confusing the term that you used.

**The Presiding Officer:** You are.

**The First Minister:** We know that it will be a challenge for many voluntary organisations to work within the budgets that they have, but it is a challenge that we all face, in the public, private and third sectors. I am confident that organisations can offer a good level of service, just as they have in the past.

### Llanfrechfa Grange

**Q2 Trish Law:** Will the First Minister give an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's plans to create a specialist and critical care centre at Llanfrechfa Grange? OAQ(3)2539(FM)

**The First Minister:** As you know, Trish, the Minister for Health and Social Services confirmed her support for Llanfrechfa Grange as the preferred site for the development of the specialist centre in July last year. At the moment, Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board is working to develop the business plans needed to underpin the delivery of the scheme.

**Trish Law:** Just before Christmas, the media, not the Welsh Assembly Government, disclosed that the specialist and critical care centre proposed at Llanfrechfa Grange might not be fully finished until 2025. That was a fine Christmas present for all those concerned with, or interested in, healthcare provision in Gwent. This 'superhospital', as

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyfeiriasoch at erthygl WCVA 'Network Rail', ac mae'n rhaid imi ddweud—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Network Wales a ddywedais.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. O gofio'ch hanes o raneofyn cwestiynau, yr wyf yn siŵr y caf faddeuant am ddrysu'r term a ddefnyddiwyd gennyh.

**Y Llywydd:** Cewch.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddom y bydd yn her i lawer o fudiadau gwirfoddol weithio o fewn y cyllidebau sydd ganddynt, ond mae'n her yr ydym i gyd yn ei hwynebu, yn y sector cyhoeddus, y sector preifat a'r trydydd sector. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gall mudiadau gynnig gwasanaeth da, yn union fel y maent wedi gwneud yn y gorffennol.

### Llanfrechfa Grange

**C2 Trish Law:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i greu canolfan gofal critigol ac arbenigol yn Llanfrechfa Grange? OAQ(3)2539(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y gwyddoch, Trish, cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei bod yn cefnogi dewis Llanfrechfa Grange yn safle a ffefrir ar gyfer datblygu'r ganolfan arbenigol, ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan yn gweithio i ddatblygu'r cynlluniau busnes y mae eu hangen i fod yn sail ar gyfer gwireddu'r cynllun.

**Trish Law:** Ychydig cyn y Nadolig, datgelodd y cyfryngau, nid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, na fyddai'r ganolfan gofal arbenigol a chritigol arfaethedig yn Llanfrechfa Grange wedi'i gorffen yn llwyr, o bosibl, tan 2025. Dyna anrheg Nadolig werth chweil i bawb sy'n ymwneud â'r ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd yng Ngwent neu i

it has been dubbed by the media, is central to the Gwent Clinical Futures programme that emerged from the challenging NHS agenda set by the Welsh Assembly Government in May 2005, 'Designed for Life'. The critical care centre is also central to the fundamental reorganisation of clinical services in Gwent, which includes a handful of local general hospitals, including one being built in Ebbw Vale in my constituency. Do you share my concern that the lengthy delay in the completion date will mean the further deterioration of our existing hospitals, not least Nevill Hall Hospital in Abergavenny? Will the Welsh Assembly Government take another look to see whether funding can be channelled more quickly to enable the critical care centre to be completed far sooner than the press reports suggest?

**The First Minister:** As you will be aware, press reports are not always accurate. You referred to Ysbyty Aneurin Bevan in your constituency, which will open next year, and on which £53.7 million has been spent. That illustrates the commitment of the One Wales Government to developing healthcare services in the Valleys.

**William Graham:** First Minister, you will be well aware that a corollary of the establishment of the new critical care centre will be the eventual closure of the Royal Gwent Hospital in Newport, and plans have been broadly agreed for a local district hospital on the Whitehead site. If this is deferred until 2025, it will be difficult for your Government, having spent £16 million on the acquisition and demolition of that site, to reserve part of it. Could you confirm your plans?

**The First Minister:** The plans have not changed since the announcement made by the Minister for Health and Social Services in July 2009. Llanfrechfa Grange has been identified as the preferred site, and work is under way to identify the level of care that will be provided there. As you would expect,

bawb â diddordeb yn hynny. Mae'r 'uwchysbyty' hwn, fel y mae'r cyfryngau wedi'i alw, yn hollbwysig i raglen Dyfodol Clinigol Gwent a ddeilliodd o'r agenda heriol a osodwyd ar gyfer y GIG gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ym mis Mai 2005, 'Cynllun Oes'. Mae'r ganolfan gofal critigol yn ganolog hefyd i'r ad-drefnu sylfaenol ar wasanaethau clinigol yng Ngwent, sy'n cynnwys llond llaw o ysbytai cyffredinol lleol, gan gynnwys un sydd wrthi'n cael ei godi yng Nglynebwy yn fy etholaeth. A ydych fel minnau'n poeni y bydd yr oedi hir cyn cwblhau'r gwaith yn golygu bod yr ysbytai sydd gennym eisoes yn dirywio eto, yn enwedig Ysbyty Nevill Hall yn y Fenni? A wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad edrych eto i weld a oes modd sianelu arian yn gyflymach er mwyn cwblhau'r ganolfan gofal critigol yn gynharach o lawer nag a awgrymir gan adroddiadau'r wasg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y gwyddoch, nid yw adroddiadau'r wasg bob tro'n gywir. Cyfeiriasoch at Ysbyty Aneurin Bevan yn eich etholaeth, a fydd yn agor y flwyddyn nesaf, ac y gwariwyd £53.7 miliwn arno. Mae hynny'n dangos ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un i ddatblygu gwasanaethau gofal iechyd yn y Cymoedd.

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, gwyddoch yn dda mai un o sgîl effeithiau sefydlu'r ganolfan gofal critigol newydd fydd cau Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent yng Nghasnewydd maes o law, a chytunwyd yn fras ar gynlluniau ar gyfer ysbyty dosbarth lleol ar safle Whitehead. Os caiff hyn ei ohirio tan 2025, bydd yn anodd i'ch Llywodraeth neilltuo rhan o'r safle hwnnw, a chithau wedi gwario £16 miliwn ar ei brynu a'i ddmchwel. A allech gadarnhau beth yw eich cynlluniau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'r cynlluniau wedi newid ers y cyhoeddiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ym mis Gorffennaf 2009. Llanfrechfa Grange yw'r safle a ffefrir, ac mae gwaith ar y gweill i benderfynu ar lefel y gofal a ddarperir yno. Fel y byddech yn disgwyl, mae'r gwaith

that work is ongoing.

**Michael German:** I declare an interest, as the site of the proposed critical care centre would affect my home.

First Minister, the issue that has been brought to my attention is that Welsh Assembly Government officials have informed the local authority in a public session that the Llanfrechfa Grange proposal will be built in phases or stages. How can a critical centre be built in stages?

**The First Minister:** It is for the Minister for Health and Social Services to explain the way in which critical care centres such as this one are to be constructed and run. I am sure that she would provide you with further details on that if you asked her for them. Our commitment remains the same. The centre is important. It has been announced that it will be taken forward, and the work is being taken forward.

### A Prison in North Wales

**Q3 Brynle Williams:** What representations has the Welsh Assembly Government made regarding the construction of a prison in North Wales? OAQ(3)2521(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have consistently made the case for additional prison capacity in Wales, and particularly in north Wales. In December, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government raised the matter with the Minister responsible for prisons to find out what the Ministry of Justice's plans were in relation to the expansion of the prison estate in Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. Do you agree that the benefits of constructing a prison in north Wales are substantial, both for the successful rehabilitation of offenders from the region who will be able to receive more frequent visits from their families, and for the local economy, which would benefit from the

hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf am ddatgan buddiant, gan y byddai safle'r ganolfan gofal critigol arfaethedig yn effeithio ar fy nghartref.

Brif Weinidog, y mater sydd wedi'i ddwyn i'm sylw yw bod swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi hysbysu'r awdurdod lleol mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus y caiff canolfan Llanfrechfa Grange ei godi fesul cyfnod neu fesul cam. Sut y gellir codi canolfan gritigol fesul cam?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwaith y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw esbonio sut y caiff canolfannau gofal critigol megis y ganolfan hon eu hadeiladu a'u cynnal. Yr wyf yn siŵr petaech yn gofyn iddi y byddai'n rhoi rhagor o fanylion ichi am hynny. Yr un yw ein hymrwymiad ni. Mae'r ganolfan yn bwysig. Cyhoeddwyd y bwrir ymlaen â hi, ac mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo.

### Carchar yng Ngogledd Cymru

**C3 Brynle Williams:** Pa sylwadau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u gwneud ynghylch adeiladu carchar yng Ngogledd Cymru? OAQ(3)2521(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi dadlau'n gyson dros gael lle ychwanegol yng ngharchardai Cymru, yn enwedig yn y gogledd. Ym mis Rhagfyr, siaradodd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol â'r Gweinidog dros garchardai i gael gwybod beth oedd cynlluniau'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder o ran ehangu'r ystâd garchardai yng Nghymru.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. A gytnwch y byddai codi carchar yn y gogledd yn cynnig manteision sylweddol. Byddai'n haws adsefydlu troseddwy'r o'r rhanbarth yn llwyddiannus, gan y byddai modd i'w teuluoedd ymweld â hwy'n amlach, a byddai o fudd i'r economi leol, a fyddai'n elwa o'r

hundreds of jobs that a prison would bring? Can you confirm that you will be doing everything possible to persuade your colleagues at Westminster of the merits of bringing this construction to north Wales? There is an ideal site in St Asaph, which is close to the A55 and the police headquarters, and I do not think that it would cause problems for residential properties, as it is a relatively rural area.

1.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** There are a number of possible sites, but what is important is that there needs to be a prison in north Wales, for the two reasons that you have outlined. Speaking as someone who has a prison in his constituency, I know that these things can be controversial when they are proposed and built, but the prison is a provider of many jobs in my area.

You raised the point about families having to travel a substantial distance, possibly to HMP Walton, to see those who are incarcerated. That is an unacceptably long distance to have to travel, and it penalises the families concerned. That is why the provision of a prison in north Wales would be welcomed. You are right to point out that a prison, particularly a large one, can sustain many hundreds of jobs.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Weinidog, mae'n drueni mawr bod y Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder yn Llundain wedi tynnu yn ôl o'i chynllun ar gyfer y safle ger Caernarfon, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith ei bod yn derbyn yr angen am garchar yn y gogledd, gan nad oes un yno ar hyn o bryd. Byddai'r manteision o safbwynt diwygio troseddwyr, lles carcharorion, eu teuluoedd a'u cymunedau, yn ogystal â lles economi gogledd Cymru, wedi bod yn sylweddol. A fedrwyd chi gadarnhau bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu i helpu i chwilio am safle addas arall yn y gogledd? A fydddech chi'n cytuno y byddai hyn yn dasg haws, fel y dadleuodd Cynghrair Howard er

cannoedd o swyddi a ddeuai yn sgîl carchar. A allwch gadarnhau y byddwch yn gwneud hynny a allwch i berswadio'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ynglŷn â manteision dod â'r adeilad hwn i'r gogledd? Mae safle delfrydol yn Llanelwy sy'n agos at yr A55 ac at bencadlys yr heddlu, ac ni chredaf y byddai'n peri problemau i eiddo preswyl, gan mai ardal gymharol wledig yw hon.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae nifer o safleoedd posibl, ond yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod angen cael carchar yn y gogledd, am y ddau reswm yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt. Gan fod gennyf garchar yn fy etholaeth, gwn y gall y pethau hyn fod yn ddadleuol pan gânt eu cynnig a'u codi, ond mae'r carchar yn darparu llawer o swyddi yn fy ardal.

Codwyd y pwynt gennych ynglŷn â theuluoedd yn gorfod teithio cryn bellter, o bosibl i Garchar Ei Mawrhydi yn Walton i weld y rhai sydd wedi'u carcharu. Mae gorfod teithio cyn belled â hynny'n annerbyniol, ac mae'n cosbi'r teuluoedd dan sylw. Dyna pam y byddai darparu carchar yn y gogledd yn cael ei groesawu. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud y gall carchar, yn enwedig carchar mawr, gynnal cannoedd lawer o swyddi.

**Gareth Jones:** First Minister, it is a great shame that the Ministry of Justice in London has withdrawn its plans for the site near Caernarfon, despite the fact that it accepts the need for a prison in north Wales, as there is no such provision currently. The benefits from the point of view of rehabilitating offenders, the welfare of prisoners, their families and communities, as well as the benefits to the north Wales economy, would have been substantial. Can you confirm that the One Wales Government is doing everything it can to help to find another suitable site in north Wales? Would you agree that that would be a far easier task if the regulation of prisons in Wales were to be



Diwygio Cosbau, sef y sefydliad sy'n pwysu am ddiwygio'r system gyfiawnder, pe bai'r rheolaeth dros garchardai Cymru wedi'i datganoli i Gymru, yn enwedig o ystyried y gall Llywodraeth Doriaidd yn Llundain o fis Mai roi'r gorau i'r holl brosiect wrth iddi weithredu cynlluniau'r blaid i dorri gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn deall cryfder y teimlad o blaid cael carchar yn y gogledd, ac yr wyf wedi siarad ag ef ynghylch y mater. O safbwynt yr ail bwynt, mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cynnwys yr angen i adolygu'r dystiolaeth sy'n ymwneud â datganoli'r system cyfiawnder troseddol i Gymru, ac mae'r gwaith hwnnw'n parhau.

#### Spending Priorities

**Q4 Nick Ramsay:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's spending priorities? OAQ(3)2530(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government's budget for 2010-11 was published in December 2009. It reflects our commitment to public services that make such a difference to people's lives, and to helping Wales to weather the economic downturn. We continue to progress the 'One Wales' agenda that was agreed by the governing parties in 2007.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You mentioned the need to help Wales to weather the economic recession. Given the news over the weekend of job losses at Bosch, I will focus my supplementary question on your Government's support for manufacturing, or rather its abject failure to provide Wales with a robust manufacturing policy. During exchanges with the Enterprise and Learning Committee in December, my colleague, David Melding, learned that your manufacturing policy will not be published for a significant amount of time, while the

devolved to Wales, as the Howard League for Penal Reform argued, which is the organisation that lobbies for reform of the justice system? That is particularly true given that a Tory Government in London from May could scrap the whole project as it implements its party's plans to cut public expenditure in Wales.

**The First Minister:** The Secretary of State for Wales appreciates the strength of feeling in favour of having a prison in north Wales, and I have discussed the issue with him. On the second point, the 'One Wales' agreement refers to the need to review the evidence relating to the devolution of the criminal justice system to Wales, and that work is ongoing.

#### Blaenoriaethau Gwario

**C4 Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau gwario Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ(3)2530(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyhoeddwyd cyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2010-11 ym mis Rhagfyr 2009. Mae'n adlewyrchu'n hymrwymiad i wasanaethau cyhoeddus sy'n gwneud cymaint o wahaniaeth i fywydau pobl, ac i gynorthwyo Cymru i wrthsefyll y dirywiad economaidd. Yr ydym yn parhau i fwrw ymlaen ag agenda 'Cymru'n Un', agenda y cytunwyd arni yn 2007 gan y pleidiau sy'n llywodraethu.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Soniasoch fod angen cynorthwyo Cymru i wrthsefyll y dirywiad economaidd. O gofio'r newydd dros y penwythnos am golli swyddi yn Bosch, canolbwytiaf yn fy nghwestiwn atodol ar y cymorth a roddir gan eich Llywodraeth i weithgynhyrchu, neu'n hytrach ei methiant llwyr o safbwynt darparu polisi gweithgynhyrchu cadarn ar gyfer Cymru. Wrth drafod gyda'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ym mis Rhagfyr, cafodd fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding, ar ddeall na chyhoeddir eich polisi gweithgynhyrchu am gryn amser, a bod

draft policy has been considered unfit for purpose. Given that the UK has had a reasonably effective manufacturing policy since 2008, would you agree that your Government's failure to provide a similarly effective strategy for Wales is seriously harming the Welsh economy and investment in that economy, which is what is needed if we want to come out of recession? Would you also agree that the job losses that we heard about over the weekend, as compared with other job losses that have happened over the past few years, are in no small measure due to your Government's failure to provide a manufacturing strategy that Wales deserves and expects?

**The First Minister:** The decision relating to Bosch will be covered in greater detail by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport in his statement later this afternoon. Closing the factory was a decision for Bosch, not for the Government. Everything was done to try to ensure the continuation of the factory but, ultimately, it is a matter for Bosch to explain to its workers and the public in general. We have shown our commitment to manufacturing and to business in Wales. The ProAct and ReAct schemes, rubbished so much of the time by the Members opposite, have been extremely useful in ensuring that up to 11,000 people have been kept in work. That comes directly as a result of ReAct in particular. Those people are aware of the work that has been put in by this Government and know that, if the Members opposite had their way, those jobs would have been lost.

**Ann Jones:** In the current economic climate, with tighter budgets, it is more important than ever to improve the effectiveness and efficiency of Government continually. I therefore welcome the second tranche of invest-to-save projects that your Minister, Jane Hutt, announced a week ago. Do you agree that consistent action by the Labour Government in spending to protect services is

y polisi drafft wedi'i ystyried yn anaddas i'w ddiben. O gofio bod gan y Deyrnas Unedig bolisi gweithgynhyrchu effeithiol ers 2008, a gytunech fod eich Llywodraeth, wrth fethu darparu strategaeth sydd yr un mor effeithiol ar gyfer Cymru, yn amharu'n ddifrifol ar ei heconomi ac ar fuddsoddi yn yr economi honno, sef yr hyn y mae ei angen arnom er mwyn camu o'r dirwasgiad? A gytunech hefyd fod y colli swyddi y clywsom amdano dros y penwythnos, o'i gymharu â'r swyddi eraill a gollwyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, wedi digwydd i raddau helaeth oherwydd bod eich Llywodraeth wedi methu darparu strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu y mae Cymru'n ei haeddu ac yn ei disgwyl.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Trafodir y penderfyniad ynglŷn â Bosch yn fanylach gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn ei ddatganiad yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Penderfyniad Bosch oedd cau'r ffatri, nid penderfyniad y Llywodraeth. Gwnaethpwyd popeth i geisio sicrhau bod y ffatri'n parhau, ond, yn y pen draw, gwaith Bosch yw esbonio hyn i'w weithwyr ac i'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol. Yr ydym wedi dangos ein hymrwymiad i weithgynhyrchu ac i fyd busnes yng Nghymru. Mae'r cynllun ProAct a'r cynllun ReAct, sy'n cael eu difrio mor aml gan yr Aelodau gyferbyn, wedi bod yn eithriadol o ddefnyddiol o ran sicrhau bod hyd at 11,000 o bobl wedi'u cadw mewn gwaith. Daw hynny'n uniongyrchol o ganlyniad i ReAct yn benodol. Mae'r bobl hynny'n ymwybodol o'r gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi'i wneud ac yn gwybod, petai'r Aelodau gyferbyn wedi cael rhwydd hynt, y byddai'r swyddi hynny wedi'u colli.

**Ann Jones:** Yn yr hinsawdd economaidd bresennol, a chyllidebau'n dynnach, mae'n bwysicach nag erioed inni wella effeithiolrwydd ac effeithlonrwydd y Llywodraeth yn barhaus. Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ail gyfran o brosiectau buddsoddi i arbed a gyhoeddwyd gan eich Gweinidog, Jane Hutt, wythnos yn ôl. A gytunwch fod gweithredu cyson gan y Llywodraeth Lafur,

in stark contrast to what those on the Tory benches would do? The Tories have made promises costing over £45 billion so far, but cannot account for how they will deliver them. In fact, they have left a £34 million underspend—[*Interruption.*] I will do the mathematics, but they still have to explain to the people where that money will come from.

**The First Minister:** Many people said to me, when I took up this job, that it would be difficult, and I accept that. However, I would rather do this job than try to explain Tory spending plans, given that there are so many holes to be found in them and that so many announcements have been made without being properly costed. We saw that with the tax breaks proposed for married couples, and the muddle that that led to. There is no doubt whatsoever that we are extremely committed as the One Wales Government to ensuring that, when the economic upturn comes, we will be riding it. The work that has been done through the economic summits, and through ProAct and ReAct, is ensuring that that will happen.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** To bring the First Minister back to Assembly business, and something that he said during the leadership battle for the Labour Party in relation to health reforms, he said that he considered that they had not been thought through. I can see what he means: the original reforms under Jane Hutt cost £15 million, since which time we have had a costly reorganisation under the current Minister for health. We welcome some of the results of that reorganisation, but we do not welcome the fact that 56 senior staff are still on the payroll despite not having a job. That is costing the taxpayer £3.7 million a year, and includes five chief executives. What are you doing about that?

wrth iddi wario i amddiffyn gwasanaethau, yn gwbl groes i'r hyn y byddai'r rhai ar feinciau'r Torïaid yn ei wneud? Mae'r Torïaid wedi gwneud addewidion a fyddai'n costio dros £45 biliwn hyd yn hyn, ond ni allant ddweud sut y byddant yn eu gwireddu. A dweud y gwir, maent wedi gadael tanwariant o £34 miliwn—[*Torri ar draws.*] Gwnaf y fathemateg, ond nid ydynt byth wedi esbonio i'r bobl o ble y daw'r arian hwnnw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedodd llawer o bobl wrthyf pan ddechreuais yn y swydd hon, y byddai'n anodd, ac yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n well gennyf wneud y gwaith hwn na cheisio esbonio cynlluniau gwario'r Torïaid, o gofio bod cynifer o dyllau ynddynt a bod cynifer o gyhoeddiadau wedi'u gwneud heb eu costio'n iawn. Gwelsom hynny gyda'r manteision treth a gynigid ar gyfer parau priod, a'r dryswch a ddaeth yn sgîl hynny. Nid oes amheuaeth o gwbl nad ydym ni, Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, yn gwbl ymroddedig i sicrhau, pan ddaw'r tro ar fyd yn economaidd, y byddwn yn barod i fanteisio arno. Mae'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud drwy'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd, a thrwy ProAct a ReAct, yn sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Hoffwn dywys y Prif Weinidog yn ôl at fusnes y Cynulliad, ac at rywbeth a ddywedodd yn ystod y frwydr i arwain y Blaid Lafur ynglŷn â diwygiadau iechyd. Dywedodd ei fod yn meddwl nad oeddent wedi'u hystyried yn drwyadl. Gallaf ddeall yr hyn sydd ganddo mewn golwg: costiodd y diwygiadau gwreiddiol o dan Jane Hutt £15 miliwn, ac ers hynny, yr ydym wedi cael ad-drefnu costus o dan y Gweinidog iechyd presennol. Yr ydym yn croesawu rhai o ganlyniadau'r ad-drefnu hwnnw, ond nid ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith bod 56 o'r staff uwch yn dal ar y gyflogres er nad oes ganddynt swydd. Mae hynny'n costio £3.7 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r trethdalwr, ac mae'n cynnwys pum prif weithredwr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny?

**The First Minister:** If you could point me to any particular article or speech in which I said that the reforms had not been thought through, I would be grateful to see that, as I have never said anything of the sort. The reforms that have been put in place have been welcomed by many parties around the Chamber, and will ensure that the health service in Wales continues to become stronger in the future. During the course of those reforms, it will be necessary to examine the employment positions of some staff, but it is not the case that they are idle and doing nothing. They are all engaged in work. However, it will be important to ensure in future that, as the structures bed down fully, we have a level of staff in place that is appropriate to deliver the health service that the people of Wales want.

**Nick Bourne:** Last year, Paul Davies, chair of the All Wales Directors of NHS Finance, as you know, pointed to the fact that £1 billion was being misspent in the health service and could be more appropriately spent. The former First Minister said that there is the potential to save £1 billion through more efficient practice, and considered it a serious issue; the Minister for health said that she would not investigate the claims made by Mr Davies. Where do you stand on this issue?

**The First Minister:** You are talking about finance directors making claims about money, and, in many ways, finance directors would be expected to make a case for their own budgets. The Minister for Health and Social Services has made the situation clear on behalf of the Government.

**Nick Bourne:** The sum of £1 billion should not be swept aside so lightly, particularly in the current circumstances, when every £1 pound in Wales matters and makes a difference to the way in which we run an excellent public service such as the health service. I invite you to consider that again. I also wish to refer you to a specific pledge made in relation to health in 'One Wales',

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe gallech fy nghyfeirio at unrhyw erthygl neu araith benodol lle y dywedais nad oedd y diwygiadau wedi'u hystyried yn drwyadl, byddwn yn ddiolchgar o weld hynny, gan nad wyf erioed wedi dweud y fath beth. Mae llawer yn y Siambr wedi croesawu'r diwygiadau a gyflwynwyd, a byddant yn sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru'n parhau i gryfhau yn y dyfodol. Yn ystod y diwygiadau hynny, bydd angen edrych ar sefyllfa cyflogaeth rhai o'r staff, ond nid yw'n wir eu bod yn segur ac nad ydynt yn gwneud dim. Maent i gyd yn gweithio. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn bwysig sicrhau bod gennym, yn y dyfodol, wrth i'r strwythurau fwrw gwreiddiau'n iawn, lefel o staff sy'n briodol ar gyfer darparu'r gwasanaeth iechyd y mae pobl Cymru am ei gael.

**Nick Bourne:** Y llynedd, tynnodd Paul Davies, cadeirydd Cyfarwyddwyr Cyllid GIG Cymru gyfan, fel y gwyddoch, sylw at y ffaith bod £1 biliwn yn cael ei gamwario yn y gwasanaeth iechyd ac y gellid ei wario'n fwy priodol. Dywedodd y cyn Brif Weinidog y gellid arbed £1 biliwn drwy arferion mwy effeithlon, ac yr oedd yn ei ystyried yn fater difrifol; dywedodd y Gweinidog dros iechyd na fyddai'n ymchwilio i'r honiadau a wnaeth Mr Davies. Beth yw eich safbwynt chi ynghylch hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn sôn am gyfarwyddwyr cyllid yn gwneud honiadau ynglŷn ag arian, ac mewn sawl ffordd, byddech yn disgwyl i gyfarwyddwyr cyllid ddadlau o blaid eu cyllidebau hwy eu hunain. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi gwneud y sefyllfa'n glir ar ran y Llywodraeth.

**Nick Bourne:** Ni ddylid ysgubo £1 biliwn o'r neilltu mor rhwydd, yn enwedig o dan yr amgylchiadau presennol, lle y mae pob £1 yng Nghymru'n cyfrif ac yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i'r ffordd yr ydym yn cynnal gwasanaeth cyhoeddus rhagorol megis y gwasanaeth iechyd. Fe'ch gwahoddaf i ystyried hynny eto. Dymunaf eich cyfeirio hefyd at addewid penodol ynglŷn ag iechyd

which is that on having one family nurse per secondary school. That was announced in 'One Wales'—I think that I have précised that correctly; the actual wording is:

'We will provide a minimum of one family nurse per secondary school by the end of the Assembly term.'

Since then, the Minister, quite correctly, has put some bones on that proposal, and £4 million came forward in September 2008. However, not one additional family nurse has been appointed to a secondary school since that time, and that was 18 months ago. Why is that?

**The First Minister:** We issued a framework for school nursing services in Wales in August 2009. On 17 November 2009, we wrote to the chief executives of the local health boards requesting local proposals for implementation, and a directive statement related to school nursing is included in the annual operating framework for the NHS for 2010-11. This is being taken forward.

1.50 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** I will come to the point. I have asked you for an explanation as to why not a single additional nurse has been appointed, given that you are hoping to reach that target by the end of the third Assembly. The policy was announced some 18 months ago, but the Royal College of Nursing confirmed to me last night that not a single additional nurse has yet been appointed. Why is that?

**The First Minister:** As you point out, the commitment is for the course of the whole term of this Assembly Government. It is now 2010 and all that needs to be put in place to deliver the nurses is ready. It will be taken forward and it will fulfil the commitment of the governing parties, as set out in 'One Wales'.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Brif Weinidog, wrth ateb sawl un y prynhawn yma, yr ydych wedi

yn 'Cymru'n Un', sef ynglŷn â chael un nyrs deulu i bob ysgol uwchradd. Cyhoeddwyd hynny yn 'Cymru'n Un'—credaf imi grynhoi hynny'n gywir; yr union eiriad yw:

'Byddwn yn darparu o leiaf un nyrs deulu i bob ysgol uwchradd erbyn diwedd tymor y Cynulliad.'

Ers hynny, mae'r Gweinidog, yn gwbl gywir, wedi rhoi ychydig o esgyrn ar y cynnig hwnnw, a daeth £4 miliwn i'r fei ym mis Medi 2008. Serch hynny, nid oes yr un nyrs deulu ychwanegol wedi'i phenodi i ysgol uwchradd ers hynny, ac yr oedd hynny 18 mis yn ôl. Pam?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyhoeddwyd fframwaith ar gyfer gwasanaethau nyrsio ysgolion yng Nghymru ym mis Awst 2009. Ar 17 Tachwedd 2009, ysgrifenasom at brif weithredwyr y byrddau iechyd lleol yn gofyn am gynigion lleol i'w rhoi ar waith, ac mae datganiad cyfarwyddyd sy'n ymwneud â nyrsys ysgol wedi'i gynnwys yn fframwaith gweithredu blynyddol y GIG ar gyfer 2010-11. Mae hyn yn mynd rhagddo.

**Nick Bourne:** Deuaf at y pwynt hwnnw. Yr wyf wedi gofyn ichi esbonio pam nad oes yr un nyrs ychwanegol wedi'i phenodi, gan eich bod yn gobeithio cyrraedd y targed hwnnw erbyn diwedd y trydydd Cynulliad. Cyhoeddwyd y polisi ryw 18 mis yn ôl, ond cefais gadarnhad gan y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol neithiwr nad oes yr un nyrs ychwanegol wedi'i phenodi eto. Pam?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y dywedwch, ymrwymiad a gyflawnir cyn diwedd tymor cyflawn y Llywodraeth hon ydyw. Mae'n 2010 yn awr ac mae'r holl waith paratoi er mwyn sicrhau'r nyrsys wedi'i wneud. Bwrir ymlaen â'r cynllun a gwiredir ymrwymiad y pleidiau sy'n llywodraethu, fel y dywedir yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

**Helen Mary Jones:** First Minister, in response to several Members this afternoon,

cyfeirio at y ffaith y byddwn yn wynebu amserau anodd yn y dyfodol o ran ariannu. Byddwch yn ymwybodol, mae'n siŵr, o waith y Pwyllgor Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â chyllido gwasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc. Pan fydd cwotgi yn anorfod, a allwch chi roi ymrwymiad imi ac i'r Cynulliad y prynhawn yma y byddwch yn gwneud eich gorau fel Llywodraeth i amddiffyn y gwasanaethau hynny, yn enwedig y rhai sydd i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc fwyaf bregus ac yn bennaf y sawl sydd â salwch meddwl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn y sefyllfa sydd ohoni, mae'n sialens i Lywodraeth sicrhau bod arian yn cael ei dargedu at y sawl sydd ei angen fwyaf. Yr ydym ni yn y Llywodraeth eisiau sicrhau bod y sefyllfa honno'n parhau at y dyfodol.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** First Minister, yesterday, your Government announced a review of the funding of schools, and I trust that that is an acknowledgement that you are not completely satisfied with the current arrangements. Could you clarify the terms of reference of that review and tell us who will carry it out, who will those people consult with, how much you anticipate your Government spending on it, and when we can expect its completion and the publication of its findings?

**The First Minister:** The review has only just been announced. Independent consultants will carry it out, and it is important for that to be in place. The reason for the review is to deal with the issue that many Assembly Members have raised in the past, namely of funding for education being provided and then, it is said, being lost in a fog further down the line. Therefore, when education money is made available by the Assembly Government, we need to ensure that it reaches front-line education, whether schools or support services for schools. If we then look to increase education funding in the future, we can make sure that it does get

you have referred to the fact that we will be facing difficult times in the future as regards funding. You will be aware, I am sure, of the work of the Children and Young People Committee on issues relating to the funding of services for children and young people. When cuts become inevitable, will you give your commitment to me and to the Assembly this afternoon that you will do your best as a Government to protect those services, particularly those for our most vulnerable children and young people and especially those who have mental health problems?

**The First Minister:** In the prevailing circumstances, it is a challenge for Government to ensure that funding is targeted at those who need it the most. We in the Government want to ensure that that continues into the future.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Brif Weinidog, ddoe, cyhoeddwyd adolygiad o ariannu ysgolion gan eich Llywodraeth, a hyderaf eich bod felly'n cydnabod nad ydych yn gwbl fodlon ar y trefniadau presennol. A allech egluro cylch gorchwyl yr adolygiad hwnnw a dweud wrthym pwy a fydd yn gwneud y gwaith, â phwy y bydd y bobl hynny'n ymgynghori, faint yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn ei wario arno, a phryd y gallwn ddisgwyl iddo gael ei gwblhau a chyhoeddi ei ganfyddiadau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Newydd gyhoeddi'r adolygiad yr ydym. Ymgynghorwyr annibynnol a fydd gwneud y gwaith, ac mae'n bwysig i hynny gael ei sefydlu. Pwrpas yr adolygiad yw mynd i'r afael â'r mater y mae llawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad wedi'i godi yn y gorffennol, sef bod arian yn cael ei ddarparu ar gyfer addysg a'i fod wedyn, meddir, yn mynd ar goll mewn niwl ymhellach ar hyd y llwybr. Felly, pan fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu arian ar gyfer addysg, mae angen inni sicrhau ei fod yn cyrraedd rheng flaen addysg, boed hynny mewn ysgolion neu yn y gwasanaethau cymorth i ysgolion. Os byddwn wedyn yn

spent on education.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister, but I will ask those questions again. How much do you anticipate spending on the independent consultants who will carry out that review? Will you publish its terms of reference so that we can all be aware of the specific work that you are asking them to carry out, and when are we likely to see the publication of the report?

I understand that you want to make your mark on education. I also understand your concerns about the so-called 'funding fog'. Therefore, I am surprised that your Government feels that it needs to carry out another review of this area. After all, people within the Assembly and others have spent a great deal of time and effort looking at this issue. In the second Assembly, the Committee on School Funding carried out a review of this area and we are still waiting for the Government to implement some of its findings, although it agreed with them at the time. Your own inspectorate has offered solutions for clearing up the funding fog. Our Finance Committee here recently published a report on streamlining individual education grants, and the Enterprise and Learning Committee also published a report on the funding fog. Can you clear up for me what exactly you hope the new review will uncover, in addition to all that work that has already been done?

**The First Minister:** First, let us be clear. Independent consultants will be carrying out the review, as I have said. There will be a procurement process and, as you would expect, we will look to ensure that we get the best value from the consultants who will be employed to carry it out. There will be a thorough procurement process to ensure that we get that value for money.

The review itself is important, especially

ystyried cynyddu'r arian ar gyfer addysg yn y dyfodol, gallwn sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei wario ar addysg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog, ond gofynnaf y cwestiynau hynny eto. Faint yr ydych yn rhagweld ei wario ar yr ymgynghorwyr annibynnol a fydd yn gwneud yr adolygiad? A fyddwch yn cyhoeddi ei gylch gorchwyl er mwyn inni i gyd wybod beth yw'r gwaith penodol yr ydych yn gofyn iddynt ei wneud, a phryd yr ydym yn debyg o weld cyhoeddi'r adroddiad?

Deallaf eich bod am adael eich ôl ar addysg. Deallaf hefyd eich pryderon ynglŷn â'r hyn a elwir yn 'niwl ariannu'. Felly, yr wyf yn synnu bod eich Llywodraeth yn teimlo bod angen iddi gynnal adolygiad arall yn y maes hwn. Wedi'r cyfan, mae pobl yn y Cynulliad ei hun ac eraill wedi treulio llawer iawn o amser ac ymdrech yn edrych ar y mater hwn. Yn yr ail Gynulliad, cynhaliwyd adolygiad o'r maes hwn gan y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion ac yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth roi rhai o'i ganfyddiadau ar waith, er iddi gytuno â hwy ar y pryd. Mae eich arolygiaeth chi eich hun wedi cynnig atebion er mwyn chwalu'r niwl ariannu. Cyhoeddodd ein Pwyllgor Cyllid yma adroddiad yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â symleiddio grantiau addysg unigol a chyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu hefyd adroddiad am y niwl ariannu. A allwch egluro imi beth yn union yr ydych yn gobeithio y bydd yr adolygiad newydd yn ei ddatgelu, ar ben yr holl waith hwnnw sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, gadewch inni fod yn glir. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, ymgynghorwyr annibynnol a fydd yn cynnal yr adolygiad. Bydd proses gaffael, ac, fel y disgwylic, byddwn yn ceisio sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gwerth gorau gan yr ymgynghorwyr a gyflogir i wneud y gwaith. Dilynir proses gaffael drwyadl er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gwerth am arian hwnnw.

Mae'r adolygiad ei hun yn bwysig, yn

now, when we are facing many future challenges with finance, because we must look at the situation carefully to ensure that the money is reaching education. The aim of the review is therefore to make sure that there are no obstacles preventing money from getting to those who need it the most in the education system.

**Kirsty Williams:** That is exactly what the Government should be doing: ensuring that as much money as possible gets to the classrooms of Welsh children. I ask you again what you hope to learn from the review that has not already been highlighted by a number of reviews within and without this institution. What additional information will you learn that is not already in the public domain? If you want to carry out yet another review—and I do not know about a funding fog, but there is certainly a fog surrounding how many reviews your Government has carried out in the field of education—tell us what we will learn from it that will be new. If you discover that additional money needs to be put into education, do we have a commitment from you that you will make that money available?

**The First Minister:** We explored that point last week. We simply need to ensure that the money that we give to local authorities, for example, that is meant to be spent on education, is spent on education. Part of the problem that has existed with the funding fog traditionally is that it has not been that easy, on occasion, to work out where the money is going. This review will get to the bottom of that and we will ensure that money gets to the students who need it.

**Kirsty Williams:** The way in which you can achieve that has already been established by a number of committees across the Assembly. It seems to me that you cannot answer the question this afternoon regarding what will be different and new about this review. While you are carrying out this review—no doubt,

enwedig yn awr, a ninnau'n wynebu llawer o heriau ariannol yn y dyfodol, oherwydd rhaid inni edrych yn ofalus ar y sefyllfa er mwyn sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd byd addysg. Nod yr adolygiad felly yw sicrhau nad oes dim rhwystrau'n atal arian rhag cyrraedd y rhai y mae arnynt fwyaf o'i angen yn y system addysg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dyna'r union beth y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn ei wneud: sicrhau bod cymaint o arian ag sy'n bosibl yn cyrraedd ystafelloedd dosbarth plant Cymru. Gofynnaf ichi eto beth yr ydych yn gobeithio'i ddysgu yn sgîl yr adolygiad nad yw wedi'i amlygu eisoes gan nifer o adolygiadau y tu mewn i'r sefydliad hwn a'r tu allan iddo. Pa wybodaeth ychwanegol a gewch nad yw eisoes yn hysbys i'r cyhoedd? Os ydych am gynnal adolygiad arall eto—a beth bynnag am niwl ariannu, yn sicr mae niwl yn amgylchynu nifer yr adolygiadau y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'u cynnal ym maes addysg—dywedwch wrthym beth y byddwn yn ei ddysgu yn ei sgîl a fydd yn newydd. Os gwelwch fod angen rhoi arian ychwanegol i addysg, a wnewch ymrwymo i sicrhau bod yr arian hwnnw ar gael?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Archwiliwyd y pwynt hwnnw yr wythnos diwethaf. Y cyfan y mae angen inni ei wneud yw sicrhau bod yr arian yr ydym yn ei roi i awdurdodau lleol, er enghraifft, y bwriedir iddo gael ei wario ar addysg, yn cael ei wario ar addysg. Rhan o'r broblem sydd wedi bod ynglŷn â'r niwl ariannu yn y gorffennol yw nad yw wedi bod mor rhwydd â hynny, weithiau, inni weld i ble y mae'r arian yn mynd. Bydd yr adolygiad hwn yn mynd at wraidd hynny a byddwn yn sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y myfyrwyr y mae angen yr arian hwnnw arnynt.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae'r ffordd o gyflawni hynny eisoes wedi'i sefydlu gan nifer o bwyllgorau- ar draws y Cynulliad. Mae'n ymddangos i mi na allwch ateb y cwestiwn y prynhawn yma ynglŷn â beth a fydd yn wahanol ac yn newydd ynglŷn â'r adolygiad hwn. Tra byddwch yn cynnal yr adolygiad



with expensive advisers—our poorest children are falling behind. This week, Estyn has seen that our disadvantaged children in key stage 4 are still not performing anywhere near their potential. In the best local authorities, our poorest children are reaching only 28 per cent of their potential and in one of the worst-performing local authorities, Blaenau Gwent, only 8 per cent of our disadvantaged children are reaching where they need to be at key stage 4. Your answer is to set up another review. That will not help the children in Blaenau Gwent and it will not help disadvantaged children across Wales. You are the First Minister, which is a job that you have coveted for many years. You are now in charge, so you can get on with it and make a difference. Why are we to have another review? Why not make the changes that are necessary?

**The First Minister:** I would not have said that I coveted the job—I am not sure that that is the phrase that I would use. It is nevertheless an honour to do the job. You made the case for the review yourself because you made suggestions, whether they are accurate or not, about performance and what is happening in Blaenau Gwent. We need to make sure that we get the full picture to ensure that the money targets the people who need it. As part of the review, we will be looking at reducing bureaucracy, as regards administration across the whole of Wales, because we need to ensure that we have more streamlined and effective ways of delivering education in Wales. It will be a key part of the review and it is not something that has been looked at in any great detail in years gone by.

#### **The Electrification of the Railway Line**

**Q5 Chris Franks:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the UK Government regarding electrification of the railway line from London to Swansea? OAQ(3)2541(FM)

hwn—gan ddefnyddio cynghorwyr drud, mae'n siŵr—mae ein plant tlotaf ar ei hôl hi. Yr wythnos hon, mae Estyn wedi gweld nad yw ein plant difreintiedig yng nghyfnod allweddol 4 yn cyflawni dim byd tebyg i'w potensial o hyd. Yn yr awdurdodau lleol gorau, nid yw ein plant tlotaf ond yn cyrraedd 28 y cant o'u potensial ac yn un o'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gwneud waethaf, Blaenau Gwent, dim ond 8 y cant o'n plant difreintiedig sy'n cyrraedd y fan lle y mae angen iddynt fod yng nghyfnod allweddol 4. Eich ateb yw sefydlu adolygiad arall. Ni wnaiff hynny gynorthwyo plant ym Mlaenau Gwent na phlant difreintiedig ledled Cymru. Chi yw'r Prif Weinidog, ac mae honno'n swydd yr ydych wedi'i chwennych ers blynyddoedd lawer. Yr ydych wrth y llyw yn awr, felly gallwch fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith a gwneud gwahaniaeth. Pam cynnal adolygiad arall? Pam na wnewch y newidiadau sy'n angenrheidiol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fyddwn wedi dweud fy mod yn chwennych y swydd—nid wyf yn siŵr ai dyna'r ymadrodd y byddwn yn ei ddefnyddio. Serch hynny, mae'n anrhydedd gwneud y swydd. Yr oedd eich dadl yn cadarnhau bod angen cynnal adolygiad oherwydd ichi sôn, boed hynny'n gywir neu beidio, am berfformiad a'r hyn sy'n digwydd ym Mlaenau Gwent. Mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael y darlun llawn er mwyn targedu'r arian ar y bobl y mae ei angen arnynt. Fel rhan o'r adolygiad, byddwn yn edrych ar leihau biwrocratiaeth, o ran gweinyddu ledled Cymru, oherwydd y mae angen inni sicrhau bod gennym ffyrdd symlach a mwy effeithiol o ddarparu addysg yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhan allweddol o'r adolygiad ac nid yw'n rhywbeth sydd wedi cael sylw manwl o gwbl yn y blynyddoedd a aeth heibio.

#### **Trydaneiddio'r Rheilffordd**

**C5 Chris Franks:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd rhwng Llundain ac Abertawe? OAQ(3)2541(FM)

**The First Minister:** I have not had any such discussions, but I know that the meetings held previously were influential in the UK Government's decision to extend the Great Western main line electrification as far as Swansea.

**Chris Franks:** The electrification of the railway line to Swansea should be seen as the first step towards bringing Wales into the twenty-first century as regards rail services. The service would boost the Welsh economy. It is especially important in view of the tragic news that we heard over the weekend regarding Bosch. It is disappointing that the UK Government has apparently withdrawn the commitment to upgrade the main line. It was only last July that the UK Secretary of State for Transport pledged to start work immediately on the scheme and it was to be completed by 2017. Wales urgently needs this investment. Would you discuss this important issue with your UK colleagues? Will you make it a priority? First Minister, we do not need any further delay or backtracking from Ministers in London regarding this matter.

**The First Minister:** I do not think that there has been a withdrawal of commitment by the UK Department for Transport as regards the electrification of the main line. However, Chris, we do know that the Conservatives have said that they would scrap the whole project. That is certainly something of which we are aware, as are the people of Wales. We will continue to work with the UK Government to ensure that electrification takes place as soon as possible.

**Alun Cairns:** Llywydd, I am grateful that you have called me at this stage so that I can dispel any untruth that the First Minister might be sharing, in saying that the Conservatives have pledged to scrap the

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi cael dim trafodaethau o'r fath, ond gwn fod y cyfarfodydd a gynhaliwyd o'r blaen wedi dylanwadu ar benderfyniad Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i ymestyn trydaneiddio prif reilffordd y Great Western cyn belled ag Abertawe.

**Chris Franks:** Dylid gweld trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd i Abertawe yn gam cyntaf at ddwyn Cymru i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain o ran gwasanaethau'r rheilffyrdd. Byddai'r gwasanaeth yn hwb i economi Cymru. Mae'n arbennig o bwysig, o gofio'r newyddion trychinebus a glywsom dros y penwythnos ynglŷn â Bosch. Mae'n siomedig bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i bob golwg wedi tynnu'n ôl ei hymrwymiad i uwchraddio'r brif lein. Ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd yr addawodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth y Deyrnas Unedig ddechrau'r gwaith ar y cynllun ar unwaith gyda'r bwriad o'i gwblhau erbyn 2017. Mae angen y buddsoddiad hwn ar Gymru ar frys. A fydddech yn trafod y mater pwysig hwn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig? A wnewch ei wneud yn flaenoriaeth? Brif Weinidog, nid oes angen rhagor o oedi arnom na chefnu ar addewidion gan Weinidogion yn Llundain yng nghyswllt y mater hwn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf fod Adran Drafnidiaeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi cefnu ar ei hymrwymiad i drydaneiddio'r brif lein. Serch hynny, Chris, gwyddom fod y Ceidwadwyr wedi dweud y byddent yn rhoi'r gorau i'r prosiect yn llwyr. Mae hynny'n sicr yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei wybod, ac mae pobl Cymru'n gwybod hynny hefyd. Byddwn yn parhau i weithio gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i sicrhau bod y trydaneiddio'n digwydd cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

**Alun Cairns:** Lywydd, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am fy ngalw yn awr er mwyn imi wadu unrhyw anwiredd y mae'r Prif Weinidog o bosibl yn ei ledu, pan ddywed fod y Ceidwadwyr wedi addo rhoi'r gorau i'r

project because that simply is not the case. It is not true and we stand by the project, as the current administration does.

First Minister, the Severn tunnel causes significant problems to the electrification of the railway. There is some evidence that says that it is possible to electrify the route through the current Severn tunnel and some evidence to suggest that a new tunnel would be cheaper and quicker, and, obviously, it could be brought up to modern standards as regards electrification. What is your latest analysis of this, as it is an important gateway to Wales?

2.00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not know whether you have spoken to your UK colleagues about electrification, but I seem to remember David Cameron saying that this project would be scrapped. I am grateful for your commitment, but you are not the ones holding the strings—that is your colleagues in London. On the Severn tunnel, Network Rail has assured the Department for Transport and the Deputy First Minister that the Severn tunnel has the capacity to deal with electrification of the line.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I join you in welcoming the electrification of this line, which not only will benefit millions of passengers but will help us to achieve our goal of reducing carbon emissions. When the time comes, with such a profound change, there will be disruption to the service provided to passengers. Can you ensure that you, or the Ministers who are involved in those discussions, will minimise any disruption, perhaps through contingency plans? Even though the work will be welcomed, there will be an element of dissatisfaction among passengers while that work is going on.

**The First Minister:** It is inevitable that there will be a level of disruption, and the public would expect that. We hope that the work

prosiect. Nid felly y mae o gwbl. Nid yw'n wir ac yr ydym yn glynu wrth y prosiect, fel y mae'r weinyddiaeth bresennol yn glynu wrtho.

Brif Weinidog, mae twnnel Hafren yn peri problemau difrifol o ran trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd. Mae rhywfaint o dystiolaeth sy'n dweud bod modd trydaneiddio'r llwybr drwy'r twnnel Hafren presennol a rhywfaint o dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu y byddai twnnel newydd yn rhatach ac yn gyflymach, ac mae'n amlwg y gellid sicrhau bod hwnnw'n cyrraedd safonau modern o ran trydaneiddio. Beth yw eich dadansoddiad diweddaraf ynglŷn â hyn, gan ei fod yn borth pwysig i Gymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn a ydych wedi siarad â'ch cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain ynglŷn â thrydaneiddio, ond yr wyf fel petawn yn cofio David Cameron yn dweud y rhoddid y gorau i'r prosiect hwn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich ymrwymiad, ond nid chi yw'r rhai sydd wrth y llyw—ond eich cyd-Aelodau yn Llundain. O ran twnnel Hafren, mae Network Rail wedi sicrhau'r Adran Drafnidiaeth a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fod twnnel Hafren yn gallu ymdopi â thrydaneiddio'r lein.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Hoffwn innau groesawu trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd hon. Bydd hynny nid yn unig o fudd i filiynau o deithwyr ond yn gymorth inni gyflawni'n nod o leihau allyriadau carbon. Pan ddaw'r adeg, bydd newid mor fawr yn sicr o darfu ar y gwasanaeth a ddarperir ar gyfer teithwyr. A allwch gadarnhau y byddwch chi, neu'r Gweinidogion sy'n rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny, yn sicrhau cyn lleied o darfu ag sy'n bosibl, drwy gyfrwng cynlluniau wrth gefn efallai? Er y bydd croeso i'r gwaith, bydd rhyw gymaint o anfonlonrwydd ymhlith teithwyr tra bydd y gwaith ar y gweill.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n anochel y bydd rhywfaint o darfu, a byddai'r cyhoedd yn disgwyl hynny. Gobeithiwn y caiff y gwaith

will be completed as quickly and with as little disruption as possible.

**Peter Black:** The announcement of the electrification of this line is welcome, and it will be important to the future of the south Wales economy. This is one of the markers put down for whichever party comes into power after the next general election to pick up. Our chance of getting this project to go ahead after the general election depends on the amount of detailed work that has been carried out on it. Therefore, can you make it a priority to talk to the UK Government about it, to try to pin it down to as detailed a timetable as possible and to get as much of it as possible planned before the general election so that we can have an understanding that this project can proceed once that contest is out of the way?

**The First Minister:** We will want to ensure that there is a timetable for construction in place as quickly as possible so that we can work towards a time when the main line is electrified.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am sure that you agree that we would encourage Alun Cairns to speak to his transport spokesperson. At a recent meeting of the Enterprise and Learning Committee, we were informed by Network Rail, in response to a question on the Severn tunnel, that it was quite capable of taking an electrified line. On electrification of the line between Cardiff and London, do you agree that it is not just an issue of being able to get to London or back to Cardiff 15 or 20 minutes faster, but about contributing to the green agenda? There is no doubt that electric trains are much cleaner than diesel-powered locomotives, and it is also important that it is seen as an excellent route for the transporting of freight as well as passengers. Finally, do you agree that this will not detract us from pursuing other key areas for electrification such as the Valleys lines? *[Interruption.]* On that note, I have a call on my mobile to take.

ei gwblhau cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl a chyda chyn lleied o darfu ag sy'n bosibl.

**Peter Black:** Mae cyhoeddi trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd hon i'w groesawu, a bydd yn bwysig i economi'r de yn y dyfodol. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd disgwyl i ba blaid bynnag a ddaw i rym ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol nesaf fynd i'r afael ag ef. Bydd sicrhau parhad y prosiect hwn ar ôl yr etholiad cyffredinol yn dibynnu ar faint o waith manwl sydd wedi'i wneud arno. Felly, a allwch roi blaenoriaeth i siarad â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn ei gylch, gan geisio cael ganddi lynu wrth amserlen mor fanwl ag sy'n bosibl a chynllunio cymaint ag sy'n bosibl ar ei gyfer cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol, er mwyn inni allu cael dealltwriaeth y gall y prosiect hwn fynd rhagddo pan fydd yr ymgiprys hwnnw ar ben?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn am sicrhau bod amserlen ar gyfer adeiladu wedi'i threfnu cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl er mwyn inni allu gweithio tuag at gyfnod pan drydaneiddir y brif reilffordd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno y byddem yn annog Alun Cairns i siarad â'i lefarydd trafniadaeth. Yn un o gyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn ddiweddar, cawsom wybod gan Network Rail, wrth iddo ateb cwestiwn ynglŷn â thwnnel Hafren, fod y twnnel hwnnw'n gallu ymdopi â rheilffordd wedi'i thrydaneiddio. O ran trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd rhwng Caerdydd a Llundain, a gytunwch nad dim ond mater o allu cyrraedd Llundain neu yn ôl i Gaerdydd 15 neu 20 munud yn gyflymach ydyw, ond mater o gyfrannu at yr agenda werdd? Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw trên trydan yn lanach o lawer na locomotif disel. Mae'n bwysig hefyd iddo gael ei weld fel llwybr rhagorol ar gyfer cludo nwyddau yn ogystal â chludo teithwyr. Yn olaf, a gytunwch na wnaiff hyn dynnu'n sylw oddi ar fynd ar drywydd ardaloedd allweddol eraill i'w trydaneiddio, megis rheilffyrdd y Cymoedd? *[Torri ar draws.]* Ar hynny, rhaid imi ateb galwad ar fy ffôn symudol.

**The First Minister:** I am impressed that Network Rail has your phone number, Jeff. It is phoning you straight away to thank you for the comments that you have made. Let me make it clear that we welcome the proposal to electrify the south Wales main line, but that does not mean that we see that as being the only appropriate electrification project. We want to see electrification in north Wales and on the Valleys lines. We know that electrification often leads to more investment, but, as you have pointed out, it is also important to reduce our greenhouse gas emissions.

### The Wales Spatial Plan

**Q6 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Wales spatial plan for north-east Wales? OAQ(3)2545(FM)

**The First Minister:** The spatial plan is the means of ensuring that the public, private and third sectors work together to join up planning and delivery in north-east Wales. What we want to do is to maximise the potential of developing a high-tech manufacturing corridor, to reduce inequalities, to improve the quality of our natural assets and to improve access to our heritage.

**Janet Ryder:** North-east Wales not only has to account to the Wales spatial plan, but it also has to account to the spatial plan that covers the west Cheshire and north-east Wales spatial area. There is growing public concern about the conflict that is arising between those two spatial plans, and growing concern that the proposed new housing figures that are being imposed on communities are being driven not by the Wales spatial plan but by the north-east Wales and west Cheshire spatial plan. I ask you to support the residents of Bodelwyddan, who have, virtually unanimously, said 'no' to the implications of the housing figures for them.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffaith bod eich rhif ffôn gan Network Rail yn creu argraff arnaf, Jeff. Mae'n eich ffonio yn unionsyth i ddiolch ichi am eich sylwadau. Gadewch imi ei gwneud yn glir ein bod yn croesawu'r cynnig i drydaneiddio prif reilffordd de Cymru, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu mai hynny yw'r unig brosiect sy'n addas ar gyfer ei drydaneiddio yn ein barn ni. Yr ydym am weld trydaneiddio yn y gogledd ac ar reilffyrdd y Cymoedd. Gwyddom fod trydaneiddio'n aml yn arwain at fwy o fuddsoddi, ond, fel yr ydych wedi dweud, mae'n bwysig hefyd er mwyn lleihau ein hallyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr.

### Cynllun Gofodol Cymru

**C6 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynllun gofodol Cymru ar gyfer gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru? OAQ(3)2545(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y cynllun gofodol yw'r dull o sicrhau bod y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat a'r trydydd sector yn cydweithio i gyfuno'r broses o gynllunio a darparu yn y gogledd-ddwyrain. Ein gweledigaeth yw gwneud y gorau o'r coridor gweithgynhyrchu uwch-dechnoleg, lleihau anghydraddoldebau, gwella ansawdd ein hasedau naturiol, a gwella mynediad at ein treftadaeth.

**Janet Ryder:** Rhaid i'r gogledd-ddwyrain nid yn unig gydymffurfio â chynllun gofodol Cymru, rhaid iddo gydymffurfio hefyd â'r cynllun gofodol ar gyfer ardal gorllewin swydd Gaer a gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Mae'r cyhoedd yn poeni fwyfwy am y gwrthdaro sy'n codi rhwng y ddau gynllun gofodol hynny, ac yn poeni fwyfwy fod y ffigurau newydd arfaethedig ar gyfer tai sy'n cael eu gorfodi ar gymunedau'n cael eu sbarduno nid gan gynllun gofodol Cymru ond gan gynllun gofodol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gorllewin swydd Gaer. Gofynnaf ichi gefnogi trigolion Bodelwyddan, sydd wedi dweud 'na' fwy neu lai'n unfrydol wrth oblygiadau'r ffigurau tai ar eu cyfer.

Every time that I have asked the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing to confirm the Welsh Government and its officials' role in imposing housing figures on county councils, the answer has very firmly been that it is a decision for county councils to take. However, when communities ask county councils about this, they are told, 'Councillors have asked for a lower figure, but Welsh Assembly Government officers are coming in and telling us that we have to take a higher housing figure than our local councillors want'. Will you again confirm Welsh Assembly Government officials' role in allocating and imposing housing figures in areas, and what the Welsh Assembly Government's response would be if county councils chose a lower housing figure than that which they were being asked to take?

**The First Minister:** You will appreciate that I cannot say anything about Bodelwyddan, because it is part of an ongoing planning process. Local authorities will now be moving ahead with their local development plans and it is a matter for them to produce those plans. Yes, we offer guidance, but the planning guidance that we issue is meant to be general and to provide the general direction. It is for local authorities to provide the details as to how those plans work. Ultimately, if there are objectors, there can be an inquiry into a local development plan. An inspector will then examine the local development plan and make recommendations that are binding on the local authority. This was not the case under the old system, when we had unitary development plans.

**Mark Isherwood:** Wales has a north-south political axis, but north Wales has also, for centuries, had a west-east socioeconomic axis running from Ireland, through all of north Wales, into north-west England. The Welsh Government's 2008 update of the Wales spatial plan states that the future prosperity of north-east Wales is closely linked with that of

Bob tro yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai gadarnhau rôl Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i swyddogion o ran gorfodi ffigurau tai ar gynghorau sir, yr ateb pendant yr wyf wedi'i gael yw mai penderfyniad i'r cynghorau sir yw hyn. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd cymunedau'n gofyn i gynghorau sir am hyn, dywedir wrthynt, 'Mae'r cynghorwyr wedi gofyn am ffigur is, ond mae swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymyrryd ac yn dweud wrthym fod yn rhaid inni bennu ffigur uwch ar gyfer tai nag y mae ein cynghorwyr lleol yn ei ddymuno'. A wnewch gadarnhau unwaith eto beth yw rôl swyddogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran dyrannu a gorfodi ffigurau tai mewn ardaloedd, a beth fyddai ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad petai cynghorau sir yn dewis ffigur is ar gyfer tai na'r ffigur y gofynnid iddynt ei bennu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn deall na allaf ddweud dim am Fodelwyddan, oherwydd ei bod yn rhan o broses gynllunio sy'n mynd rhagddi. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn awr yn bwrw ymlaen â'u cynlluniau datblygu lleol a'u gwaith hwy fydd cynhyrchu'r cynlluniau hynny. Ydym, yr ydym yn cynnig canllawiau, ond bwriedir i'r canllawiau cynllunio a gyhoeddwn fod yn ganllawiau cyffredinol, ac iddynt ddangos y trywydd cyffredinol. Gwaith yr awdurdodau lleol yw darparu'r manylion ynglŷn â sut y mae'r cynlluniau hynny'n gweithio. Yn y pen draw, os oes gwrthwynebwyr, gellir cynnal ymchwiliad i gynllun datblygu lleol. Yna, bydd archwiliwr yn archwilio'r cynllun datblygu lleol ac yn gwneud argymhellion y mae'n ofynnol i'r awdurdod lleol eu dilyn. Nid oedd hyn yn wir o dan yr hen drefn, pan oedd gennym gynlluniau datblygu unedol.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae gan Gymru echel wleidyddol sy'n rhedeg o'r gogledd i'r de, ond mae gan y gogledd hefyd, ers canrifoedd, echel economaidd-gymdeithasol sy'n rhedeg o'r gorllewin i'r dwyrain, o Iwerddon, drwy ogledd Cymru i gyd, i ogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Mae diweddariad 2008 Llywodraeth Cymru ar gynllun gofodol Cymru yn dweud

north-west England, and west Cheshire in particular. For Flintshire, Wrexham and Denbighshire the cross-border linkages to the wider area are crucial.

The north-east Wales and west Cheshire spatial plan recognises that there has been long-term migration over the border from England into Wales for a number of years, and seeks to address this issue by proposing a much higher level of housing development in west Cheshire than has previously been the case. In fact, this level represents a higher proportion of development than its share of the sub-regional population requires. Do you agree that the suggestion that the sub-regional strategy is merely a way to facilitate the expansion of the north-west of England into adjoining parts of north-east Wales is not only incorrect, but scaremongering?

**The First Minister:** We have to understand that the economy of north-east Wales is entirely bound up with that of north-west England. That does not mean that there should be a mayor for a Merseyside that incorporates Flintshire and Wrexham—that is, clearly, a crazy proposal, as north-east Wales is very firmly a part of Wales. However, we are not looking to build a wall at the bottom of Aston Hill.

There are many countries in Europe where the economy of one country is bound up in the economy of another. Look at the border between Northern Ireland and the Republic of Ireland. It is has always been a lively border in the context of trade—not always legal trade—back and forth, and there is substantial commerce between, for example, Dundalk and Newry, Lifford and Strabane, and Derry and Letterkenny, on both sides of the border. Yet there is no question of the political boundaries changing—that depends on your politics, of course, but that is the situation at the moment.

bod cysylltiad clòs rhwng ffyniant gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru yn y dyfodol a ffyniant gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, a gorllewin swydd Gaer yn benodol. Ar gyfer sir y Fflint, Wrecsam a sir Ddinbych, mae'r cysylltiadau ar draws y ffin i'r ardal ehangach yn hollbwysig.

Mae cynllun gofodol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gorllewin swydd Gaer yn cydnabod bod mudo hirdymor wedi bod dros y ffin o Loegr i Gymru ers nifer o flynyddoedd, ac mae'n ceisio mynd i'r afael â hyn drwy gynnig lefel uwch o lawer o ddatblygu tai yng ngorllewin swydd Gaer nag sydd wedi digwydd o'r blaen. A dweud y gwir, mae'r lefel hon yn golygu cyfran uwch o ddatblygu nag y mae ei chyfran o'r boblogaeth isranbarthol yn ei mynnu. A ydych yn cytuno bod yr awgrym nad yw'r strategaeth isranbarthol ond yn ffordd o hwyluso ehangu gogledd-orllewin Lloegr i rannau cyffiniol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru nid yn unig yn anghywir, ond yn enghraifft o godi bwganod?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid inni ddeall bod economi gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru'n hollol glwm wrth economi gogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Nid yw hynny'n golygu y dylid cael maer ar lannau Mersi sy'n cynnwys sir y Fflint a Wrecsam—mae hynny'n amlwg yn awgrym hurt, oherwydd y mae gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru'n rhan o Gymru yn gwbl bendant. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn bwriadu codi wal ar waelod Aston Hill.

Mae llawer o wledydd yn Ewrop lle y mae economi un wlad ynghlwm wrth economi gwlad arall. Edrychwch ar y ffin rhwng Gogledd Iwerddon a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Mae'r ffin wedi bod yn un fywiog erioed o ran masnachu—er nad yw'r masnachu hwnnw bob tro wedi bod yn gyfreithlon—yn ôl ac ymlaen, a cheir masnachu sylweddol rhwng Dundalk a Newry, rhwng Lifford a Strabane, a rhwng Derry a Letterkenny, er enghraifft, o boptu'r i'r ffin. Eto i gyd, nid oes bwriad yn y byd newid y ffiniau gwleidyddol—mae hynny'n dibynnu ar eich gwleidyddiaeth, wrth gwrs, ond dyna'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd.

Another European example is that the economies of Sweden and Denmark are linked via Malmö and Copenhagen, which are very close to each other, yet those countries firmly keep their own identities. We should not be afraid of this. We should understand that there are tremendous opportunities for our people to access the jobs market in the north-west of England, as well as to further develop the jobs market in Flintshire and Wrexham, while understanding that Flintshire and Wrexham will remain very much part of Wales.

**Ann Jones:** First Minister, Janet is right when she talks about Bodolwyddan and the problems there. People have used the north-east Wales spatial plan to get their points of view across, in some ways very unfairly. Will you undertake a review into what has gone on, given the amount of misinformation that has been spread about the north Wales spatial plan, which is crucial to north-east Wales, as you well know? Some groups, such as the Right to Be Welsh group, have been in Bodolwyddan, trying to tell people that it means that we will only be a dormitory for Merseyside, which is totally wrong. We rely on the north-east Wales spatial plan for our economic development. Can you look at what is going on there and issue a statement to that effect?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I agree with you that it is important that we understand that there are strong economic links that will continue between north-east Wales and north-west England. Any suggestion that the spatial plan is designed, in some way, to loosen the links between north-east Wales and the rest of Wales is clearly wrong. As I said, I cannot comment on the situation in Bodolwyddan, but we should be confident enough to see economic opportunities in north-west England without feeling that that represents a threat to Wales or to the livelihood of the

Enghraifft arall yn Ewrop yw bod cysylltiad rhwng economïau Sweden a Denmarc drwy Malmö a Copenhagen, sy'n agos iawn at ei gilydd. Eto i gyd, mae'r gwledydd hynny'n cadw gafael yn dynn iawn ar eu hunaniaeth eu hunain. Ni ddylem ofni hyn. Dylem ddeall bod cyfleoedd aruthrol i'n pobl fanteisio ar y farchnad swyddi yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr, yn ogystal â datblygu ymhellach y farchnad swyddi yn sir y Fflint ac yn Wrecsam, gan ddeall ar yr un pryd y bydd sir y Fflint a Wrecsam yn dal yn rhan annatod o Gymru.

**Ann Jones:** Brif Weinidog, mae Janet yn iawn pan yw'n sôn am Fodelwyddan a'r problemau yno. Mae pobl wedi defnyddio cynllun gofodol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru i fynegi eu safbwynt, a hynny weithiau mewn ffordd annheg iawn. A wnewch adolygu'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd, o ystyried faint o gamwybodaeth sydd wedi'i lledaenu am gynllun gofodol gogledd Cymru, sy'n hollbwysig i ogledd-ddwyrain Cymru, fel y gwyddoch yn dda? Mae rhai grwpiau, megis y grŵp Right to Be Welsh, wedi bod ym Modelwyddyn, yn ceisio dweud wrth bobl ei fod yn golygu na fyddwn fawr mwy na lle cysgu i lannau Mersi, sy'n gwbl anghywir. Yr ydym yn dibynnu ar gynllun gofodol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru ar gyfer ein datblygiad economaidd. A allwch edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yno a chyhoeddi datganiad i'r perwyl hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi ei bod yn bwysig inni ddeall bod cysylltiadau economaidd cryf a fydd yn parhau rhwng gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Mae unrhyw awgrym mai nod y cynllun gofodol, rywfodd, yw llacio'r cysylltiadau rhwng gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gweddill Cymru'n amlwg yn anghywir. Fel y dywedais, ni allaf sôn am y sefyllfa ym Modelwyddan, ond dylem fod yn ddigon hyderus i weld cyfleoedd economaidd yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr heb deimlo bod hynny'n fygythiad i Gymru neu i fywoliaeth



people living in Denbighshire, Flintshire and Wrexham. We should take these opportunities on board and grasp the challenges that they offer and make use of them for our own people.

### **The Wealth Gap**

**Q7 Alun Cairns:** What action does the Welsh Assembly Government intend to take to tackle the widening wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the UK? OAQ(3)2546(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have worked with our partners to introduce targeted measures, as you know, through the economic summits, to lessen the impact of the recession. This year, we will produce our economic renewal programme, which will lead to a renewed approach to economic development in order to encourage the increased prosperity of the people of Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** I could share several headline statistics with the First Minister, such as those on gross value added, where the gap has widened, despite the large increase in public expenditure in Wales. I could look at the stagnation in gross disposable household income, and at unemployment, which we know is higher in Wales than in any other nation in the United Kingdom. When we start drilling down into the detail of unemployment, it becomes particularly sad. There is a much higher rate of male unemployment in Wales than in the rest of UK, and I would say that it began from a higher rate. Even sadder is the high proportion of people under the age of 25 in Wales who are out of work. Members on this side of the Chamber have been talking about and criticising the economic activity and performance of and the actions taken by the Welsh Assembly Government for almost 10 years, but every positive proposal that we have made and every constructive criticism that we have made of the Welsh Assembly Government have been rejected outright. After 10 years of failure in economic performance, according to all the indices that

pobl sy'n byw yn sir Ddinbych, sir y Fflint a Wrecsam. Dylem fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn ac ymateb i'r her a gynnig ganddynt, gan eu defnyddio ar gyfer ein pobl ein hunain.

### **Y Bwlch Cyfoeth**

**C7 Alun Cairns:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyfoeth sy'n tyfu rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU? OAQ(3)2546(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi cydweithio â'n partneriaid, fel y gwyddoch, i gyflwyno mesurau wedi'u targedu drwy'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd i leihau effaith y dirwasgiad. Eleni, byddwn yn cynhyrchu ein rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi a fydd yn arwain at ddull newydd o ddatblygu economaidd i hybu ffyniant pobl Cymru.

**Alun Cairns:** Gallwn sôn wrth y Prif Weinidog am amryw o brif ystadegau, er enghraifft ystadegau'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, lle y mae'r bwlch wedi lledu, er gwaethaf y cynnydd mawr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Gallwn edrych ar y ffaith bod incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario wedi aros yn ei unfan, ac ar ddiweithdra, y gwyddom ei fod yn uwch yng Nghymru nag mewn dim un wlad arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Pan ddechreuwn dyrchu'n ddyfnach i fanylion diweithdra, mae'n sefyllfa arbennig o drist. Mae cyfradd diweithdra ymhlith dynion yng Nghymru'n uwch o lawer nag yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, a byddwn yn dweud i hynny ddechrau o gyfradd uwch. Tristach byth yw'r gyfran uchel o bobl o dan 25 oed yng Nghymru sy'n ddi-waith. Mae'r Aelodau ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr wedi bod yn sôn am weithgarwch economaidd a pherfformiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r camau y mae wedi'u cymryd ers bron 10 mlynedd, gan eu beirniadu, ond mae pob cynnig cadarnhaol yr ydym wedi'i wneud a phob beirniadaeth adeiladol gennym ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u gwrthod yn swta. Ar ôl 10 mlynedd o

I have highlighted, do you now accept that there is a need, under a new First Minister, for a new direction? Do you now disassociate yourself from the failure of Ieuan Wyn Jones and of Rhodri Morgan as First Minister?

**The First Minister:** I look forward to the day when Alun Cairns disassociates himself from Margaret Thatcher and the economic policies of the 1980s, something that he has signally failed to do in the 10 years that he has been here. As I have said, Wales is maintaining an employment level that is above its historic average, with a level of 91,000 since the start of the Assembly. Employment in Wales has increased by 7.5 per cent since devolution, compared with 6.7 per cent for the UK as a whole. Gross disposable household income per head in west Wales and the Valleys and in east Wales has outstripped that of the UK since 1999. We are closing the gap with the rest of the UK when it comes to GDHI. That is what has happened in Wales over the past 10 years. The Government has done a number of things in order to encourage that, as you know, and as I have said many times in the Chamber. If I were looking at Conservative achievements and Conservative proposals over the last 10 years to deal with the economy, I would be looking at a blank sheet of paper.

**Alun Davies:** We are all well used to crocodile tears and synthetic concern from the Members on the Conservative benches when we discuss poverty in Wales. Not once have they brought any constructive proposals to the Chamber. Does that not contrast with the proposals that the Government has launched in the last few days to renew the Welsh economy, to invest our way out of this recession and to build, not just jobs and careers for people, but futures in this country? Does that not contrast with the Members on the Conservative benches who

fethiant ym maes yr economi, yn ôl yr holl fynegeion yr wyf wedi sôn amdanynt, a ydych yn derbyn yn awr fod angen cyfeiriad newydd o dan Brif Weinidog newydd? A ydych yn awr yn eich datgysylltu eich hun oddi wrth fethiant Ieuan Wyn Jones a Rhodri Morgan fel Prif Weinidog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y diwrnod pan fydd Alun Cairns yn ei ddatgysylltu ei hun oddi wrth Margaret Thatcher a pholisïau economaidd yr 1980au, rhywbeth y mae'n amlwg wedi methu ei wneud yn y 10 mlynedd y mae wedi bod yma. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, mae Cymru'n cynnal lefel o gyflogaeth sy'n uwch na'i chyfartaledd hanesyddol, sef lefel o 91,000 ers dechrau'r Cynulliad. Mae cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 7.5 y cant ers datganoli, o'i chymharu â 6.7 y cant ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig drwyddi draw. Mae incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario, hynny yw, yr incwm y pen, yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd ac yn nwyrain Cymru wedi gwneud yn well na'r incwm yn y Deyrnas Unedig ers 1999. Yr ydym yn cau'r bwlch rhyngom a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig o ran incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario. Dyna sydd wedi digwydd yng Nghymru yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud nifer o bethau er mwyn annog hynny, fel y gwyddoch, ac fel yr wyf wedi dweud lawer gwaith yn y Siambr. Petawn yn edrych ar yr hyn y mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi'i gyflawni ac ar gynigion y Ceidwadwyr dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf i ymdrin â'r economi, byddwn yn edrych ar ddalen wag.

**Alun Davies:** Yr ydym i gyd yn gyfarwydd â dagrau ffug a phoen synthetig yr Aelodau ar feinciau'r Ceidwadwyr pan fyddwn yn trafod tlodi yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt erioed wedi dod â'r un cynnig adeiladol i'r Siambr. Onid yw hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu â'r cynigion y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u lansio yn ystod y diwrnodau diwethaf i adnewyddu economi Cymru, i fuddsoddi er mwyn camu o'r dirwasgiad hwn ac i feithrin, nid dim ond swyddi a gyrfaedd i bobl, ond dyfodol yn y wlad hon? Onid yw hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu â'r hyn a gawn gan

do nothing and say nothing?

**The First Minister:** ‘Yes’ is my answer to you. What concerns me is that—although I understand that Governments must be challenged and criticised by the benches opposite as part of democracy—you never hear anything positive from them. There are never any plans from the Conservatives to help the situation in Wales as regards jobs, reducing inequality, and ensuring that gross disposable household income continues to rise.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Would you comment on tackling the widening inequality in Wales? The Office for National Statistics has this week released figures showing that the richest 20 per cent in Wales possess property assets of £24.4 billion, whereas the poorest struggle under £300 million of debt. The richest 20 per cent possess 62 per cent of Welsh wealth, while the poorest 20 per cent possess 0.5 per cent of the wealth in Wales. I acknowledge that there are differences of wealth between regions of the UK, but there is also a huge disparity within Wales. Will you bring forward new radical ideas to tackle that issue?

**The First Minister:** First of all, you will know about the proposed Measure to tackle child poverty. Secondly, we need to ensure that we target skills effectively because by providing people with skills, we provide them with more opportunities. However, it is also important to understand that we still have to look for semi-skilled jobs, and ensure that they are available as well. It is critical to ensure that all parts of Wales are able to ride the economic upturn, and we must not have parts of Wales suffering from poverty while others are relatively wealthy. That is why it is important to ensure that people have access to jobs and childcare, so that we help them to overcome the many obstacles to finding someone to look after their children. The same applies to the care of elderly relatives,

Aelodau meinciau'r Ceidwadwyr nad ydynt yn gwneud dim nac yn dweud dim?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** ‘Ydyw’ yw fy ateb ichi. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni—er fy mod yn deall bod yn rhaid i'r meinciau gyferbyn herio a beirniadu Llywodraethau fel rhan o ddemocratiaeth—yw nad ydych byth yn clywed dim byd cadarnhaol ganddynt. Nid oes byth gynlluniau gan y Ceidwadwyr i gynorthwyo'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru o ran swyddi, lleihau anghydraddoldeb, a sicrhau bod incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario'n parhau i godi.

**Bethan Jenkins:** A wnewch gyflwyno sylwadau ynglŷn â mynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldeb cynyddol yng Nghymru? Mae'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol wedi rhyddhau ffigurau yr wythnos hon sy'n dangos bod yr 20 y cant cyfoethocaf yng Nghymru'n meddu ar asedau eiddo gwerth £24.4 biliwn, er bod y tlotaf yn straffaglu o dan £300 miliwn o ddyled. Mae'r 20 y cant cyfoethocaf yn berchen ar 62 y cant o gyfoeth Cymru, a'r 20 y cant tlotaf yn berchen ar 0.5 y cant ohono. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod gwahaniaethau rhwng cyfoeth gwahanol ranbarthau'r Deyrnas Unedig, ond ceir bwlch enfawr hefyd o fewn Cymru. A wnewch gyflwyno syniadau radical newydd i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf oll, gwyddoch am y Mesur arfaethedig i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant. Yn ail, mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn targedu sgiliau'n effeithiol oherwydd, drwy roi sgiliau i bobl, byddwn yn rhoi mwy o gyfleoedd iddynt. Serch hynny, mae'n bwysig deall hefyd fod yn rhaid inni chwilio am swyddi lled-grefftus o hyd, a sicrhau bod y rheini ar gael hefyd. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau bod pob rhan o Gymru'n gallu manteisio ar y tro ar fyd i'r economi pan ddaw, a rhaid inni osgoi sefyllfa lle y mae tlodi mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru tra bo eraill yn gymharol gefnog. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod pobl yn gallu cael gafael ar swyddi a gofal plant, er mwyn inni eu cynorthwyo i oresgyn y llu o rwystrau sydd ynghlwm wrth ddod o hyd i rywun i ofalu am

which can also be an obstacle to people going to work. There are other ways of dealing with the situation, such as encouraging more people to join credit unions, to ensure that they have access to credit at a reasonable rate and not at the rates of loan sharks. There is no single answer to all this, but we are doing many things to deal with that gap by the end of 2020. We know that more equal societies are happier societies.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yesterday's report from the independent think tank, Centre for Cities, disappointedly suggested that Newport is one of the UK's biggest victims in the current recession. It is clear that more new businesses and more private sector jobs are needed, as well as a higher level of skills for the local workforce. Can you assure me today that the Welsh Assembly Government will make a special effort to ensure that Newport is not left behind when the recession ends?

**The First Minister:** Absolutely. Newport is in a favourable position given its geography, with its proximity to the M4 and the main railway line. Although we have gone through difficult times recently, there have been significant investment projects in Newport—the arrival of Admiral Insurance, for example, the HM Prison Service shared services centre, Uskmouth power station, the new railway station, the university campus in the city centre, and the improvement to schools. Roughly 2,000 jobs have been created across the city between April 2008 and September 2009, which shows that Newport is still very much attracting investment, and is attractive for business.

### Targets

**Q8 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's targets for the

eu plant. Mae'r un peth yn wir am ofalu am berthnasau oedrannus, sydd hefyd yn gallu rhwystro pobl rhag mynd i'r gwaith. Mae ffyrdd eraill o ymdrin â'r sefyllfa, megis annog mwy o bobl i ymuno ag undebau credyd, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cael gafael ar greyd ar gyfradd resymol ac nid ar y cyfraddau a godir gan fenthycwyr diegwyddor. Nid oes un ateb i hyn i gyd, ond yr ydym yn gwneud llawer o bethau i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch hwnnw erbyn diwedd 2020. Gwyddom fod cymdeithasau mwy cydradd yn gymdeithasau hapusach.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr oedd yn siomedig i'r adroddiad ddoe gan y felin drafod annibynnol, Centre for Cities, awgrymu mai Casnewydd yw un o'r manau sydd wedi dioddef waethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn sgil y dirwasgiad presennol. Mae'n amlwg bod angen mwy o fusnesau newydd a mwy o swyddi yn y sector preifat, yn ogystal â lefel uwch o sgiliau i'r gweithlu lleol. A allwch fy sicrhau heddiw y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud ymdrech arbennig i sicrhau nad yw Casnewydd yn cael ei gadael ar ôl pan ddaw'r dirwasgiad i ben?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sicr. Mae Casnewydd mewn sefyllfa dda, o ystyried ei daearyddiaeth, gan ei bod yn agos at yr M4 a'r brif reilffordd. Er ein bod wedi mynd drwy gyfnodau anodd yn ddiweddar, mae prosiectau buddsoddi sylweddol wedi bod yng Nghasnewydd—Admiral Insurance yn dod yno, er enghraifft, canolfan rhannu gwasanaethau Gwasanaeth Carchardai EM, gorsaf bŵer Aber-wysg, yr orsaf reilffordd newydd, campws y brifysgol yng nghanol y ddinas a'r gwelliannau mewn ysgolion. Mae tua 2,000 o swyddi wedi'u creu ar draws y ddinas rhwng mis Ebrill 2008 a mis Medi 2009, sy'n dangos bod Casnewydd yn dal i ddenu buddsoddiad i raddau helaeth, a'i bod yn ddeniadol i fusnesau.

### Targedau

**C8 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am dargedau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y

coming year? OAQ(3)2527(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Assembly Government remains focused on delivering its declared agenda, details of which you will find in the 'One Wales Delivery Plan 2007-2011'.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am sure that you have many education targets. My colleague Kirsty Williams referred earlier to the announcement of a review of education funding. I welcome the aspect of the review that implies that your Government is, for the first time, giving a glimpse of an acceptance that there is a funding gap between Wales and England. I hope that you will take on board the fact that this funding gap will get worse next year because of the cuts to the education budget.

Your predecessor was clearly not aware of all the facts around the issue of education when he claimed here on 6 February that further education colleges were seeing a drop in numbers. That is not the case. I will give you an example from your own area, where Bridgend College has reported a surge in demand for its courses, including 173 applications for 14 places on a motor vehicle engineering course.

2.20 p.m.

Was the decision on funding for further and higher education next year taken on the basis of a drop in the number of applicants? Were you basing your funding on the idea that the number of applications was reducing? Given that the picture this year has been one of a big increase in applications, and that there will probably be an increase again next year, will you review your education budget for next year against that background?

**The First Minister:** Where pressures arise, we will look to see how they can be relieved. The budget was voted for in December of last year. It is a difficult and challenging budget, in many areas. We remain committed to education, and to further education in

flwyddyn nesaf? OAQ(3)2527(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dal i ganolbwyntio ar wireddu'r agenda a ddatganwyd ganddi. Mae manylion yr agenda honno yn 'Cynllun Cyflenwi Cymru'n Un 2007-2011'.

**Jenny Randerson;** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod gennych lawer o dargedau ar gyfer addysg. Cyfeiriodd fy nghyd-Aelod Kirsty Williams yn gynharach at gyhoeddi adolygiad o ariannu addysg. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r agwedd ar yr adolygiad sy'n awgrymu bod eich Llywodraeth, am y tro cyntaf, yn lled-dderbyn bod bwloch cyllidol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y derbyniwch y bydd y bwloch cyllidol hwn yn gwaethgu y flwyddyn nesaf oherwydd y toriadau yn y gyllideb addysg.

Mae'n amlwg nad oedd eich rhagflaenydd yn gwybod yr holl ffeithiau ynglŷn ag addysg pan honnodd yma ar 6 Chwefror fod y niferoedd yn gostwng mewn colegau addysg bellach. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Rhoddaf enghraifft ichi o'ch ardal eich hun, lle y mae Coleg Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi dweud bod ymchwydd yn y galw am ei gyrsiau, gan gynnwys 173 o geisiadau am 14 o leoedd ar gwrs peirianeg cerbydau modur.

A benderfynwyd ynglŷn ag ariannu addysg bellach ac addysg uwch y flwyddyn nesaf ar sail gostyngiad yn nifer yr ymgeiswyr? A oeddech yn seilio'ch ariannu ar y syniad bod nifer y ceisiadau'n gostwng? O gofio mai'r sefyllfa eleni yw bod cynnydd mawr yn nifer y ceisiadau, ac y bydd cynnydd eto y flwyddyn nesaf mae'n debyg, a wnewch adolygu eich cyllideb addysg ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf ar sail y cefndir hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pan fydd pwysau'n codi, byddwn yn ystyried sut y gellir lliniaru hynny. Pleidleisiwyd dros y gyllideb ym mis Rhagfyr y llynedd. Mae'n gyllideb anodd a heriol, mewn sawl maes. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i addysg, ac i addysg bellach

particular.

**Alun Davies:** First Minister, many of us are concerned about the overall levels of education funding, and most of us want to ensure that children and learners in Wales have the benefit of excellence in education across all sectors. Will you ensure that the education spending review addresses the heart of the problem? Will you travel across constituencies in Wales to make sure that all children and communities feel a part of this review, and ensure that, at the end of it, we will guarantee the people of Wales a world-class education, wherever they live?

**The First Minister:** The review is designed to improve the education service, and, importantly, to make sure, as I have said, that the money goes where it needs to be spent. Over the next few months, my colleague, Leighton Andrews, will be taking this forward. The intention is to make sure that there is a good level of spending on education on the part of local authorities across Wales.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** First Minister, you may or may not be aware of the crystallisation of continuing care claims, and that any outstanding claims for continuing care had to be lodged with the Welsh Assembly Government in December. In relation to the 800 settled claims, the Welsh Assembly Government, to date, has paid out in the region of £2.65 million in interest payments alone. What priority will the Government be giving over the next 12 months to expediting the claims that have been lodged? Answers that I have received from the Minister for health have said that the department is merely working up processes. The deadline for lodging the claims was known well in advance, and it would seem to me that the Government is dragging its feet in respect of putting the processes in place. It needs to be ensured that there is no big interest bill and that the claims are settled, so that the claimants can move on

yn benodol.

**Alun Davies:** Brif Weinidog, mae llawer ohonom yn poeni am lefelau cyffredinol yr ariannu ar gyfer addysg, ac mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom am sicrhau bod plant a dysgwyr yng Nghymru'n elwa yn sgîl rhagoriaeth ym maes addysg ar draws pob sector. A wnewch sicrhau bod yr adolygiad o wario ar addysg yn mynd at wraidd y broblem? A wnewch deithio ar hyd ac ar led etholaethau yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod pob plentyn a chymuned yn teimlo'n rhan o'r adolygiad hwn, a sicrhau, pan ddaw i ben, y byddwn yn gwarantu i bobl Cymru addysg sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd, ym mha le bynnag y maent yn byw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bwriedir i'r adolygiad wella'r gwasanaeth addysg, ac yn ogystal—ac mae hyn yn bwysig—sicrhau, fel yr wyf wedi dweud, fod yr arian yn mynd i'r fan lle y mae angen ei wario. Yn ystod y misoedd nesaf, bydd fy nghyd-Weinidog, Leighton Andrews, yn bwrw ymlaen â hyn. Y bwriad yw sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol ar draws Cymru lefel dda o wariant ar addysg.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Brif Weinidog, efallai eich bod yn gwybod, neu efallai nad ydych yn gwybod, am grisialu hawliadau am ofal parhaus, a bod yn rhaid cyflwyno unrhyw ôl-hawliadau am ofal parhaus i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ym mis Rhagfyr. Yng nghyswllt yr 800 o hawliadau sydd wedi'u setlo, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, hyd yn hyn, wedi talu tua £2.65 miliwn mewn taliadau llog yn unig. Pa flaenoriaeth y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ei rhoi dros y 12 mis nesaf i brysuru'r hawliadau a gyflwynwyd? Mae'r atebion yr wyf wedi'u cael gan y Gweinidog dros iechedd wedi dweud mai'r y cyfan y mae'r adran yn ei wneud yw paratoi'r prosesau. Yr oedd y dyddiad cau ar gyfer cyflwyno hawliadau'n hysbys ymhell ymlaen llaw, ac mae'n ymddangos i mi fod y Llywodraeth yn llusgo'i thraed o ran sefydlu'r prosesau. Mae angen iddi fod yn siŵr nad oes bil llog mawr a bod yr hawliadau'n cael eu setlo, er mwyn i'r hawlwyd allu bwrw ymlaen â'u bywydau.

with their lives.

**The First Minister:** As a Government, we will ensure that those claims are paid as quickly as possible. Where there are a number of claims, that will take a little time. Sometimes, claims have to be investigated, but it is our intention to make sure that the claims are paid as quickly as can be done.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn ni'r Llywodraeth yn sicrhau bod yr hawliadau hynny'n cael eu talu cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Pan fydd nifer o hawliadau, bydd angen ychydig o amser ar gyfer hynny. Weithiau, rhaid archwilio hawliadau, ond ein bwriad yw sicrhau bod yr hawliadau'n cael eu talu cyn gynted ag y gellir.

### Road Safety

**Q9 Lorraine Barrett:** Will the First Minister provide an update on road safety in Wales? OAQ(3)2540(FM)

**The First Minister:** We are making good progress towards meeting the challenging casualty reduction targets. Over the past decade, many lives have been saved through education, enforcement and the better engineering of roads. The 2008 casualty figures showed a 12 per cent reduction in deaths, which is a significant improvement.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for that response. The improvement in the number of fatalities is to be welcomed, but I think that you would agree that there is always more that can be done. I am particularly interested in the 20 mph zones around schools. Could we have an update at some point on how those zones have been implemented by local authorities, how many have taken part, and what the impact has been on that reduction? I am also concerned about roads such as Newport Road, which runs through my constituency, on which there is a speed limit of 40 mph. Recent surveys have shown that many motorists travel at 50 or 60 mph, or even faster, along that road. There is a school there, pedestrians, and the area is heavily populated. What work is the Government doing with local authorities to lower the speed limits of those roads in our communities that are particularly dangerous?

### Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd

**C9 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ddiogelwch ar y ffyrdd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2540(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd da tuag at wireddu'r targedau heriol i leihau'r nifer sy'n cael eu hanafu. Dros y degawd diwethaf, achubwyd llawer o fywydau drwy addysg, gorfodaeth a gwell gwaith peirianegol ar y ffyrdd. Yr oedd ffigurau anafiadau 2008 yn dangos gostyngiad o 12 y cant yn nifer y marwolaethau, sy'n welliant sylweddol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae'r gwelliant o ran nifer y marwolaethau i'w groesawu, ond credaf y byddech yn cytuno nad da lle gellir gwell. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb arbennig yn y parthau 20 mya o gwmpas ysgolion. A allem gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf rywbryd ynglŷn â sut y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi rhoi'r parthau hynny ar waith, faint sydd wedi cymryd rhan, a pha effaith a gafwyd ar y gostyngiad hwnnw? Yr wyf yn poeni hefyd am ffyrdd megis Heol Casnewydd, sy'n mynd drwy fy etholaeth, lle y mae'r terfyn cyflymder yn 40 mya. Mae arolygon yn ddiweddar wedi dangos bod llawer o fodurwyr yn teithio ar gyflymder o 50 neu 60 mya, neu'n gyflymach hyd yn oed, ar hyd y ffordd honno. Mae ysgol yno, cerddwyr, ac mae'r ardal yn ardal boblog iawn. Pa waith y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud gydag awdurdodau lleol i ostwng terfynau cyflymder y ffyrdd hyn yn ein cymunedau sy'n arbennig o beryglus?

**The First Minister:** On local authority roads, it is a matter for local authorities to assess what the appropriate speed limit should be on any particular road. You mentioned the 20 mph limit scheme; you will be aware that that is funded through the local road safety grant, Safe Routes in Communities, and the Slower Speeds initiative. Over 480 schemes were in place by August of last year, so it has been a successful scheme, which has rolled out 20 mph zones in many parts of Wales.

**Mohammad Asghar:** I wish to ask the First Minister about the variable speed limit scheme on the M4 in South Wales East. I very much welcome this scheme to help smooth the flow of traffic between junctions 24 and 28 on the M4 and to reduce the number of accidents by the Brynglas tunnels. When do you expect this work to be completed and are there any further safety measures planned for this spiral stretch of motorway?

**The First Minister:** The limit is in place because of the work that needs to be carried out on the central reserve. While that is carried out, clearly there is a need to protect the workforce that is working there.

You are right about the average speed cameras; they seem to be effective in reducing traffic speed without causing traffic jams. The first variable speed cameras, if I remember rightly, were put in various speed zones along the M25. Although it is not the most free-flowing of motorways at the best of times, those certainly had an effect at the time in keeping the speed down and ensuring that, where there were blockages on the road, people were travelling at a safe speed before they reached them. So, it has been effective and work is ongoing to ensure that the work, particularly between junctions 24 and 28, is completed as soon as possible.

**Nerys Evans:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar ffyrdd awdurdodau lleol, mater i awdurdodau lleol yw asesu beth ddylai'r terfyn cyflymder priodol fod ar unrhyw ffordd benodol. Soniasoch am y cynllun lle y mae'r terfyn cyflymder yn 20 mya; gwyddoch fod y cynllun hwnnw'n cael ei noddi drwy'r grant diogelwch ffyrdd lleol, Llwybrau Diogel mewn Cymunedau a'r fenter Gyrru Arafach. Yr oedd dros 480 o gynlluniau ar waith erbyn mis Awst y llynedd, felly mae wedi bod yn gynllun llwyddiannus sydd wedi cyflwyno'r parthau 20 mya mewn llawer ardal yng Nghymru.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Yr wyf am ofyn i'r Prif Weinidog am y cynllun terfyn cyflymder newidiol ar yr M4 yn Nwyrain De Cymru. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynllun hwn yn fawr i helpu i hwyluso llif y traffig rhwng cyffordd 24 a chyffordd 28 ar yr M4 ac i leihau nifer y damweiniau wrth dwnelau Bryn-glas. Pryd y disgwyliwch weld cwblhau'r gwaith hwn ac a oes rhagor o fesurau diogelwch yn yr arfaeth ar gyfer y darn troellog hwn o'r draffordd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pennwyd y terfyn cyflymder oherwydd y gwaith y mae angen ei wneud ar y llain ganol. Tra bydd hwnnw ar y gweill, mae'n amlwg bod angen diogelu'r gweithlu sy'n gweithio yno.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynglŷn â'r camerâu cyflymder cyfartalog; maent i'w gweld yn effeithiol o ran arafu'r traffig heb achosi tagfeydd. Gosodwyd y camerâu cyflymder newidiol cyntaf, os cofiaf yn iawn, ar barthau cyflymder amrywiol ar hyd yr M25. Er nad yw'r draffordd honno gyda'r llyfnaf o ran llif traffig ar y gorau, yn sicr cafodd y camerâu hynny ddylanwad ar y pryd o ran cadw rheolaeth ar gyflymder a sicrhau, pan oedd tagfeydd ar y ffordd, fod pobl wedi arafu'n ddiogel cyn eu cyrraedd. Felly, mae wedi bod yn effeithiol ac mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo i sicrhau bod y gwaith, yn enwedig rhwng cyffordd 24 a chyffordd 28, yn cael ei gwblhau cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

**Nerys Evans:** I am sure that you are familiar



gyfarwydd â'r brif heol o Gaerfyrddin i sir Benfro, sef yr A40, ac yn benodol pentref Llanddewi Felffre. Mae problemau mawr wedi bod yn y pentref hwnnw o ran diogelwch ei bobl. Mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi ymweld â'r pentref gyda mi i weld y problemau drosto ef ei hun. Bu iddo gadarnhau cyn y Nadolig y bydd arwyddion rhybuddio sy'n goleuo yn cael eu gosod yn y pentref. Mae hefyd yn bwriadu ystyried amrywio'r union gyflymdra yn dibynnu ar ba mor brysur yw'r heol. Gwn hefyd fod datblygiadau i ymestyn y palmant er mwyn ei wneud yn fwy diogel i'r pentrefwyr. Croesawaf y datblygiadau hyn yn fawr yn ogystal â'r ffordd osgoi a fydd yn helpu i leddfu'r problemau hyn. A allwch ein diweddarau ar y cynllun i wella diogelwch ar y ffordd honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** O ran Llanddewi Felffre, y cynllun yw sicrhau y bydd y gwaith ar y ffordd osgoi yn dechrau cyn mis Ebrill 2014.

**Mick Bates:** In your replies to many people this afternoon, you have used the word 'achievement'. On road safety in Montgomeryshire, there are three particular places where there have been many road accidents. Could you make a commitment today to look at schemes in these three places? First, the A487 at Machynlleth by Glandyfi, where there was a fatality over Christmas; secondly, the A483 at Four Crosses, where there was a fatality outside a school some years ago, and the A458 at Buttington cross. Those have been included in road schemes in this Assembly since 2002. As a First Minister, you are well respected at the moment and are considered a man of integrity. Will you prove that by ensuring that these schemes, which will enhance road safety, will be implemented as soon as possible?

**The First Minister:** Thank you for your praise, short lived though it might be for the next days or even hours—who knows? I am aware of the three roads that you mention, the Glandyfi bends are well known; they are not far from the Dyfi junction. It is well known

with the main road from Carmarthen to Pembrokeshire, the A40, and the village of Llanddewi Velfrey specifically. There have been great problems as regards safety for people in that village. Ieuan Wyn Jones has visited the village with me to see the problems for himself. He confirmed before Christmas that new warning signs that light up will be sited in the village. He also intends to consider varying the speed limit, depending on how busy the road is at any given time. I know that there are already plans to extend the pavement to make it safer for villagers. I welcome these developments as well as the bypass that would alleviate some of these problems. Can you give us an update on the plans to improve safety on that road?

**The First Minister:** As regards Llanddewi Velfrey, the plan is to ensure that the work on the bypass will start before April 2014.

**Mick Bates:** Yn eich atebion i lawer o bobl y prynhawn yma, yr ydych wedi defnyddio'r gair 'cyflawni'. O ran diogelwch y ffordd yn sir Drefaldwyn, mae tri lle penodol lle y mae llawer o ddamweiniau wedi bod ar y ffordd. A allech ymrwymo heddiw i edrych ar gynlluniau yn y tri lle hyn? Yn gyntaf, yr A487 ym Machynlleth ger Glandyfi, lle y lladdwyd rhywun dros y Nadolig; yn ail, yr A483 yn Four Crosses, lle y lladdwyd rhywun y tu allan i ysgol rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, a'r A458 yn Buttington Cross. Mae'r rheini wedi'u cynnwys mewn cynlluniau ffordd yn y Cynulliad hwn ers 2002. A chithau'n Brif Weinidog, mae parch mawr atoch ar hyn o bryd ac fe'ch ystyrir yn wr unplyg. A wnewch brofi hynny drwy sicrhau bod y cynlluniau hyn, a fydd yn gwella diogelwch ar y ffordd, yn cael eu rhoi ar waith cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl?

**Brif Weinidog:** Diolch ichi am eich canmoliaeth, er na wnaiff o reidrwydd bara ond am ychydig ddiwrnodau neu ychydig oriau hyd yn oed—pwy a wŷyr? Yr wyf yn gwybod am y tair ffordd yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt, mae troeau Glandyfi'n enwog; nid

for being a difficult area for cars, as are the other areas that you mention. There are plans in place for many roads in Powys, as you will know—the Four Crosses area is addressed by one such plan—and our intention is to move forward as quickly as we can to ensure that areas, where there are difficulties on the road network, are dealt with via the national transport plan.

### NHS Priorities

**Q10 Andrew R.T. Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his priorities for the national health service? OAQ(3)2535(FM)

**The First Minister:** Working with the Minister for Health and Social Services, my priorities are to see through NHS reform in Wales, work to improve people's health, and ensure that they have access to high-quality integrated health and social care.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** In the press today is a dramatic picture of a young girl lying unconscious in the snow in Wolverhampton because of alcohol abuse. This is a topical issue at the moment and the Government is trying to create a greater understanding of it through public health measures as well as highlight the consequences for the NHS of the long-term implications of alcohol abuse. Indeed, there has been a 68 per cent increase in alcohol-related illnesses, two-thirds of which are among the pensioner community, which indicates the build-up of pressure for our health service. What action will your Government take, along with Westminster colleagues, to come forward with proposals to address public health and to tackle the resource implications that the NHS faces, if we do not act on this time bomb currently ticking in society?

dynt ymhell o gyffordd Dyfi. Mae honno a'r manau eraill a grybwyllwyd gennych yn adnabyddus fel ardaloedd sy'n peri anhawster i geir. Mae cynlluniau ar y gweill ar gyfer llawer o ffyrdd ym Mhowys, fel y gwyddoch—mae ardal Four Crosses yn cael sylw mewn un cynllun o'r fath—a'n bwriad yw symud ymlaen cyn gynted ag y gallwn i sicrhau bod ardaloedd, lle y mae anawsterau ar y rhwydwaith ffyrdd, yn cael sylw drwy'r cynllun trafniadaeth genedlaethol.

### Blaenoriaethau'r GIG

**C10 Andrew R.T. Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol? OAQ(3)2535(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fy mlaenoriaethau yw sicrhau bod diwygio'r GIG yng Nghymru'n cael ei gwblhau, gweithio i wella iechyd pobl, a sicrhau eu bod yn gallu cael gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol integredig o safon.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yn y wasg heddiw, mae llun dramatig o ferch ifanc yn gorwedd yn anymwybodol yn yr eira yn Wolverhampton oherwydd camddefnyddio alcohol. Mae hwn yn bwnc llosg ar hyn o bryd ac mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio creu gwell dealltwriaeth ohono drwy fesurau iechyd cyhoeddus yn ogystal â thynnu sylw at y canlyniadau i'r GIG yn sgîl goblygiadau hirdymor camddefnyddio alcohol. Yn wir, mae cynnydd o 68 y cant wedi bod mewn afiechydon cysylltiedig ag alcohol ac mae dwy ran o dair o'r rheini ymhlith pensïonwyr, sy'n dangos bod y pwysau'n cynyddu i'n gwasanaeth iechyd. Pa gamau a gymer eich Llywodraeth, ynghyd â'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan, i gyflwyno cynigion i fynd i'r afael ag iechyd cyhoeddus ac i fynd i'r afael â'r goblygiadau i'r GIG o ran adnoddau, oni wnawn rywbeth ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa beryglus hon yn ein cymdeithas ar hyn o bryd?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** There is still a great need for education on alcohol consumption in society. Many people still drink far too much. It is an extreme case when someone is found almost lying in the gutter, but there are many others who still drink in a way that affects their health but who are not in that condition. Therefore, we plan to take forward the education measures that have been in place in order to ensure that people understand the dangers of drinking.

Many of the levers that could effectively deal with alcohol are outside the competence of the Assembly. Nevertheless, there are areas that we would look to push forward. One area is minimum pricing. This is not an area over which we have direct devolved control, but I believe that it would certainly have an effect by reducing the availability of cheap alcohol in shops. We need to be careful that alcohol pricing does not affect the viability, for example, of local pubs, which are important to many communities. However, these tend not to be the problem, which tends to be caused by cheap alcohol available elsewhere.

Licensing is another area that is not within our competence. However, we need to ensure that licensing is at a level that ensures that people do not have ready access to cheap drink. There are many ways in which this could be dealt with, but it starts with education. As people have learned to understand the dangers of smoking—and I do not think that anyone would go back to the days when smoking was allowed in all public places, as it was—the same needs to be done in relation to drinking and ensuring that people understand what the safe limit is. Getting that message across will be one of the big public health challenges of the next few years.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog am ymateb i'r cwestiynau.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae angen dybryd o hyd am addysg ynglŷn â defnyddio alcohol yn y gymdeithas. Mae llawer o bobl yn dal i yfed gormod o lawer. Mae'n achos eithafol pan ddeuir o hyd i rywun sydd fwy neu lai'n gorwedd yn y gwter, ond mae llawer o bobl eraill nad ydynt yn y cyflwr hwnnw sy'n dal i yfed mewn ffordd sy'n effeithio ar eu hiechyd. Felly, bwriadwn fwrw ymlaen â'r mesurau addysg sydd wedi'u sefydlu i sicrhau bod pobl yn deall peryglon yfed.

Mae llawer o'r ffactorau a allai fynd i'r afael yn effeithiol ag alcohol y tu allan i gymhwysedd y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ceir meysydd y byddem yn gobeithio rhoi hwb iddynt. Un maes yw pennu lleiafswm pris. Nid yw hwn yn faes y mae gennym reolaeth ddatganoledig uniongyrchol drosto, ond credaf y byddai'n sicr yn cael effaith drwy gyfyngu ar yr alcohol rhad sydd ar gael mewn siopau. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad yw pris alcohol yn effeithio ar hyfywedd tafarnau lleol er enghraifft, sy'n bwysig i lawer o gymunedau. Serch hynny, nid y rhain yw'r broblem fel rheol, ond alcohol rhad sydd ar gael mewn manau eraill.

Mae trwyddedu'n faes arall nad yw o fewn ein cymhwysedd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni sicrhau bod y trwyddedu'n digwydd ar lefel sy'n sicrhau nad oes diod rad ar gael yn rhwydd i bobl. Gellid mynd i'r afael â hyn mewn sawl ffordd, ond addysg yw'r man cychwyn. Fel y mae pobl wedi dysgu deall peryglon ysmegu—ac ni chredaf y byddai neb am fynd yn ôl i'r dyddiau lle y caniateid ysmegu ym mhob man cyhoeddus, fel y byddai—mae angen gwneud yr un peth yng nghyswllt yfed a sicrhau bod pobl yn deall beth yw'r terfyn diogel. Cyfleu'r neges honno fydd un o heriau iechedd cyhoeddus mawr y blynyddoedd nesaf.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the First Minister for his responses to questions.

## **Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes** **Business Statement and Announcement**

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** There are two changes to report to this week's planned Government business. Following this business statement, the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport will make a statement on Bosch. To accommodate his statement, the statement on homelessness has been postponed until 26 January. However, business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers and which are available to Members electronically.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for business for that statement. I would like to raise two issues with her. The first relates to Haiti. The whole world will have seen with horror—and I know that the Minister will have done so too—the situation there and will have seen the way in which a country that had so little has been hit by such a devastating natural event as the earthquake that has caused such problems and such loss of life.

I appreciate that the First Minister has put out a press statement and has encouraged people to give generously, and I certainly endorse that. However, will the Government bring forward a written statement regarding things that can perhaps be co-ordinated by the Government of Wales, within the powers that we have, to assist? I am conscious that we did this at the time of the tsunami, for example. I know that mid and west Wales firefighters are out there, and I have seen on the news the tremendous heroism they have displayed in bringing people out alive from under some of the rubble. However, as for medical assistance and rebuilding Haiti when it comes through this disaster, I wonder what we can do within the powers that we have. Will the Minister look at that?

The second issue is much more mundane and

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Mae dau newid i'w cyhoeddi ym musnes arfaethedig y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Ar ôl y datganiad busnes hwn, bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn gwneud datganiad am Bosch. Er mwyn gwneud lle i'w ddatganiad, mae'r datganiad ynglŷn â digartrefedd wedi'i ohirio tan 26 Ionawr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, sydd i'w weld ym mhapurau'r agenda ac sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar ffurf electronig.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros fusnes am y datganiad hwnnw. Hoffwn godi dau fater gyda hi. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â Haiti. Bydd y byd i gyd wedi arswydo wrth weld y sefyllfa yno—a gwn y bydd y Gweinidog wedi arswydo hefyd—ac wedi gweld sut y mae gwlad a chanddi gyn lleied wedi'i tharo gan ddigwyddiad naturiol mor ddirnisiol â'r daeargryn sydd wedi achosi'r fath broblemau a'r fath golli bywydau.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y Prif Weinidog wedi cyhoeddi datganiad i'r wasg ac wedi annog pobl i roi'n hael, ac yn sicr, yr wyf yn cefnogi hynny. Fodd bynnag, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth gyflwyno datganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn â phethau y gall Llywodraeth Cymru eu cydlynu efallai, o fewn y pwerau sydd gennym, er mwyn cynorthwyo? Yr wyf yn gwybod inni wneud hyn adeg y tswnami, er enghraifft. Gwn fod diffoddwyr tân y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yno, ac yr wyf wedi gweld eu harwriaeth aruthrol ar y newyddion wrth iddynt dynnu pobl yn fyw o'r rwbel. Fodd bynnag, o ran cymorth meddygol ac ailadeiladu Haiti wedi'r trychineb hwn, tybed beth y gallwn ei wneud o fewn y pwerau sydd gennym? A wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried hynny?

Mae a wnelo'r ail fater â rhywbeth llawer

relates to business rates. I realise that we crossed swords on this issue last week, but this remains a serious issue for businesses that have seen massive hikes. I know that not every business has; some have seen a reduction. However, some have seen massive increases in their rates. I know that, in England, this has been dealt with by transitional relief, but I ask the Minister whether any thought is being given to that and whether any statement can be expected on that issue.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you very much, Nick. Of course, Members across the Chamber share your concerns and commitment to do what we can in Wales to support Haiti—not just in our response to the appeal to respond to the tragedy in Haiti, but also by using the skills that we have in Wales, as you mentioned, Nick, which were offered and put to good use in response to the tsunami. I endorse the First Minister's appeal. There are other appeals. I know that the Islamic Relief appeal, for example, will be raising funds over the next week or so. I will certainly raise this with the First Minister and look to getting a written statement on this matter to identify ways in which we can contribute.

On your point about support for small businesses in relation to rate relief, I do not think that we necessarily crossed swords last week. I was pleased to be able to say how welcome it was that our Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, Carl Sargeant, announced that additional help for small businesses. Janet Jones, the chair of the Federation of Small Businesses in Wales, called it an early Christmas present for many businesses. In addition, it should be recognised that over 60 per cent of businesses will benefit from a reduction in their rate bills as a result of the revaluation, and then there is the decision that we had already made to reduce the multiplier, which is used to calculate business rate bills. That decision was taken by the former Minister for local government.

The rate relief package that Carl Sargeant has

mwy bydol—ardrethi busnes. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli inni groesi cleddyfau ynglŷn â hyn yr wythnos diwethaf, ond mae'n dal yn fater difrifol i fusnesau sydd wedi gweld eu hardrethi'n cynyddu'n aruthrol. Gwn nad yw hynny'n wir am bob busnes; mae ardrethi rhai wedi gostwng. Fodd bynnag, mae ardrethi rhai wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol. Gwn iddynt ddefnyddio cymorth pontio i ymdrin â hyn yn Lloegr, ond gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a yw hynny'n cael ei ystyried o gwbl ac a ellir disgwyl unrhyw ddatganiad ynglŷn â hynny.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr iawn, Nick. Wrth gwrs, mae Aelodau ar draws y Siambr fel chithau'n poeni ac yn ymroddedig i wneud hynny a allwn yng Nghymru i gefnogi Haiti—nid yn unig drwy ymateb i'r apêl ar gyfer y drasiedi yn Haiti, ond hefyd drwy ddefnyddio'r sgiliau sydd gennym yng Nghymru, fel y dywedasoch, Nick, sgiliau a gynigiwyd ac a ddefnyddiwyd er lles wrth ymateb i'r tswami. Yr wyf yn ategu apêl y Prif Weinidog. Ceir apeliadau eraill. Gwn y bydd apêl Cymorth Islamaidd, er enghraifft, yn codi arian yn ystod yr wythnos nesaf. Yn sicr codaf hyn gyda'r Prif Weinidog a cheisio cael datganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn â hyn i weld sut y gallwn gyfrannu.

O ran eich pwynt am gymorth i fusnesau bach yng nghyswllt rhyddhad ardrethi, ni chredaf inni o reidrwydd groesi cleddyfau yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf allu dweud mor falch oeddwn o weld ein Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, Carl Sargeant, yn cyhoeddi'r cymorth ychwanegol hwnnw i fusnesau bach. Dywedodd Janet Jones, cadeirydd Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng Nghymru, ei fod yn anrheg Nadolig gynnar i lawer o fusnesau. At hynny, dylid cydnabod y bydd dros 60 y cant o fusnesau'n elwa o ostyngiad yn eu biliau ardrethi yn sgîl yr ailbrisio, ac wedyn mae'r penderfyniad yr oeddem wedi'i wneud eisoes i leihau'r lluosydd, a ddefnyddir i gyfrifo biliau ardrethi busnes. Penderfynwyd hynny gan y cyn Weinidog dros lywodraeth leol.

Mae'r pecyn rhyddhad ardrethi a

brought in has been welcomed, and it will increase the upper limits for each category of small business rate relief by at least 20 per cent. This will mean that, from next April, over half of all business premises in Wales could qualify for this relief.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Can we have a statement from the Government with regard to correspondence between the Government and the Secretary of State for Wales on the Visteon pension issue? The fact is that Ford will not currently honour its pension obligations. I ask this because Peter Hain has not seen fit to meet me and a delegation from the campaign group to discuss this matter further, and we have had a stock reply from Yvette Cooper, which was basically an attempt to pass the buck. I want to pin the Government down on this matter. I understand that this is not a matter for the Welsh Government, but, as Welsh constituents, these people deserve a response from the Government, especially considering the protest at the National Assembly on Thursday and considering the fact that pension issues are at top of the political agenda at the moment.

My other concern relates to benefit entitlements. Cymorth Cymru has sent an e-mail to its stakeholders about a certain company that seems to have been set up without a proper address. It has a website called [benefitanswers.co.uk](http://benefitanswers.co.uk). It has been seeking to represent people who are filling out their disability living allowance forms, and, in doing so, it claims as much as £1,500 from those stakeholders or clients that we acknowledge as being among the poorest in society. I seek a statement from the Government on regulation for companies that provide support for those who receive benefits, because this company appears to be quite questionable, as it only has a website and no address to which it can be tracked down.

gyflwynwyd gan Carl Sargeant wedi'i groesawu, a bydd yn cynyddu'r terfynau uchaf ar gyfer pob categori o ryddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach o leiaf 20 y cant. Bydd hyn yn golygu, o fis Ebrill nesaf ymlaen, y gallai dros hanner yr holl eiddo busnes yng Nghymru fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y rhyddhad hwn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** A allwn gael datganiad gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r ohebiaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ynglŷn â phensiynau Visteon? Y gwir amdani yw na wnaiff Ford yn awr gyflawni ei rwymedigaethau o ran pensiynau. Gofynnaf hyn oherwydd nad yw Peter Hain wedi gweld yn dda fy nghyfarfod i a dirprwyaeth o'r grŵp ymgyrchu i drafod hyn ymhellach, ac am inni gael ymateb safonol gan Yvette Cooper, ymgais yn y bôn i daflu'r baich. Yr wyf am gael ateb pendant gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â hyn. Deallaf nad yw'n fater i Lywodraeth Cymru, ond mae'r bobl hyn yn etholwyr yng Nghymru ac felly'n haeddu ymateb gan y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig o ystyried y brotest yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddydd Iau ac o ystyried bod materion sy'n ymwneud â phensiynau ar frig yr agenda wleidyddol ar hyn o bryd.

Mae a wnelo'r peth arall sy'n fy mhoeni â'r hawl i gael budd-daliadau. Mae Cymorth Cymru wedi anfon e-bost at ei randdeiliaid ynglŷn â rhyw gwmni sydd i bob golwg wedi'i sefydlu heb fod ganddo gyfeiriad iawn. Mae ganddo wefan o'r enw [benefitanswers.co.uk](http://benefitanswers.co.uk). Mae wedi bod yn ceisio cynrychioli pobl sy'n llenwi eu ffurflenni lwfans byw i'r anabl, ac, wrth wneud hynny, mae'n hawlio cymaint â £1,500 gan y rhanddeiliaid neu'r cleientiaid hynny sydd, fel y gwyddom, ymhlith pobl dlotaf ein cymdeithas. Yr wyf yn gofyn am ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â rheoleiddio cwmnïau sy'n rhoi cymorth i bobl sy'n cael budd-daliadau, oherwydd ymddengys fod y cwmni hwn yn eithaf amheus, gan mai dim ond gwefan sydd ganddo ac nad oes ganddo gyfeiriad y gellir ei olrhain iddo.

**Jane Hutt:** I am pleased that Val Lloyd is ensuring that we recognise the impact on the Visteon workforce and recognise that this is an issue. I will not make any comments on party manifesto commitments relating to pensions at this point in time, except to say that it is critical, as you say, Bethan, that we support and recognise our workforce in Wales, their needs, their rights and entitlements. Certainly, that will be brought to the attention of the UK Government.

Also, I am concerned about any kind of misleading and fraudulent information and advice with regard to benefit entitlement. I will bring this matter to the attention not only of our Minister for social justice, but UK Government Ministers.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Minister, may I press you for three statements, please? I would like one on the school nursing strategy. This is a crucial commitment made by the One Wales Government and something that we support, especially in relation to preventative and public health measures. As the First Minister highlighted in his response to my question, if you get the education message right, you will hopefully solve a lot of the problems before they can build up later on in society.

There is grave concern, especially among the professions—I refer to the Royal College of Nursing, for example—as to when the positions will be made available. Trusts across Wales have put money into training, but when they have looked to put nurses into the school nursing strategy, they are unable to provide the placements because the money has not been made available. I am prepared to give the benefit of the doubt in hoping that the target will be met, but people in the professions, and politicians, need to understand the strategy that the Government is working to, with only 13 or 14 months of this Assembly left before the next Assembly

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn falch bod Val Lloyd yn sicrhau ein bod yn sylweddoli'r effaith ar weithlu Visteon ac yn sylweddoli bod hyn yn broblem. Ni chyflwynaf sylwadau ynglŷn ag ymrwymadau maniffesto pleidiau ynglŷn â phensiynau ar hyn o bryd, ac ni wnaaf ond dweud ei bod yn hollbwysig, fel y dywedwch, Bethan, inni gefnogi a chydabod ein gweithlu yng Nghymru, eu hanghenion, eu hawliau a'r hyn y mae ganddynt hawl i'w gael. Yn sicr, tynnir sylw Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig at hynny.

Hefyd, yr wyf yn bryderus am unrhyw fath o gamarwain neu wybodaeth a chyngor twyllodrus mewn perthynas â hawl i fuddaliadau. Byddaf yn dwyn y mater hwn i sylw'r Gweinidog dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac i Weinidogion Llywodraeth y DU.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Weinidog, a gaf bwyso arnoch am dri datganiad, os gwelwch yn dda? Hoffwn gael un am y strategaeth nyrsys ysgol. Mae'r ymrwymiad hwn gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn hollbwysig ac yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei gefnogi, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt mesurau ataliol a mesurau iechyd cyhoeddus. Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog yn ei ymateb i'm cwestiwn, wrth sicrhau bod y neges addysg yn iawn, byddwch, gobeithio, yn datrys llawer o'r problemau cyn iddynt waethygu yn y gymdeithas ymhen amser.

Testun pryder difrifol, yn enwedig ymhlith y proffesiynau—cyfeiriaf at y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol, er enghraifft—yw pryd y bydd swyddi ar gael. Mae ymddiriedolaethau ledled Cymru wedi darparu arian ar gyfer hyfforddiant, ond wrth iddynt geisio cynnwys nyrsys yn y strategaeth nyrsio mewn ysgolion, ni allant ddarparu'r lleoliadau oherwydd nad yw'r arian wedi'i ddarparu. Yr wyf yn barod i ddisgwyl a gweld beth a ddigwydd gan obeithio y cyrhaeddir y targed, ond mae angen i bobl yn y proffesiynau, a gwleidyddion ddeall y strategaeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithio tuag ati, gan nad oes ond 13 neu 14 mis ar ôl o'r Cynulliad

elections. If we could have a statement on that, I would be most grateful.

2.40 p.m.

On the serious case review published yesterday into the events at Edlington, I and other Members would be interested to know whether the Minister for social services believes that any of review's recommendations have implications for services in Wales. The key recommendation was about the breakdown in communication between organisations, which is something that sadly we hear about time and again. However, this was a particularly tragic case, because if the lights that flashed the signals had been addressed, it seems as if it could have been preventable. I would be interested to receive a written statement from the Minister to see whether or not any lessons can be learnt for services in Wales, so that we can prevent such an incident from happening here.

Finally, on the continuing care claims, the First Minister, in responding to questions, highlighted that the Government would look into this issue, but the key thing about processing these claims is that a strategy needs to be in place so that the Government does not face a massive interest bill—£2.5 million has been spent to date on addressing the continuing care claims, which is not sustainable. Above all, the claimants and the people supporting the claimants need to know how their claims will be addressed in a speedy and timely manner. I would be grateful if the Minister for health would make a statement on this issue, so that we, as politicians who deal with this matter in our constituency casework, have an understanding about the speed and the plan to which the Welsh Assembly Government is working to address the numerous claims that have been logged, and which should be crystallised by December.

hwn cyn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Pe gallem gael datganiad ynglŷn â hynny, byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn.

Ynglŷn â'r adolygiad achos difrifol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe a oedd yn ymwneud â'r digwyddiadau yn Edlington, byddai'n dda gennyf fi ac Aelodau eraill gael gwybod a yw'r Gweinidog dros wasanaethau cymdeithasol yn credu a oes i unrhyw rai o argymhellion yr adolygiad oblygiadau ar gyfer gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Yr oedd a wnelo'r prif argymhelliad â'r cyfathrebu'n chwalu rhwng sefydliadau, sy'n rhywbeth, yn anffodus, yr ydym yn ei glywed dro ar ôl tro. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr achos hwn yn arbennig o drasig, oherwydd petai sylw wedi'i roi i'r arwyddion a oedd yn fflachio, mae'n debyg y gellid bod wedi'i osgoi. Byddai'n dda gennyf gael datganiad ysgrifenedig gan y Gweinidog i weld a oes modd dysgu unrhyw wersi ar gyfer gwasanaethau yng Nghymru neu beidio, er mwyn inni allu atal digwyddiad o'r fath rhag digwydd yma.

Yn olaf, ynglŷn â'r hawliadau am ofal parhaus, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, wrth ymateb i gwestiynau, y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn edrych ar y mater hwn, ond y peth allweddol ynglŷn â phrosesu'r hawliadau hyn yw bod angen strategaeth fel nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn wynebu bil llog enfawr—mae £2.5 miliwn wedi'i wario eisoes er mwyn talu'r hawliadau am ofal parhaus. Nid oes modd cynnal hynny. Yn anad dim, mae angen i'r hawlwy'r a'r bobl sy'n cynorthwyo'r hawlwy'r wybod sut yr ymdrinnir â'u hawliadau'n gyflym ac yn brydlon. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar petai'r Gweinidog dros iechyd yn gwneud datganiad am hyn, er mwyn i ni, y gwleidyddion sy'n ymdrin â hyn yn ein gwaith achos yn ein hetholaethau, ddeall beth yw cynllun Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a pha mor gyflym y mae'n bwriadu ymdrin â'r hawliadau niferus a gyflwynwyd, ac a ddylai fod wedi'u crisialu erbyn mis Rhagfyr.



**Jane Hutt:** The First Minister responded to your question about the ‘One Wales’ commitment, on which we are not only going to deliver, but have been working over the last two and half years to make sure that we can deliver that level of service with family nurses. We particularly recognise the importance of the school nurse health service, which is at the forefront of health prevention and promotion with regard to some of the issues that were discussed earlier, such as education around alcohol abuse reduction. This is something to which the Minister for health will respond.

There was sadness about the social services reviews published yesterday as regards the failures. These were not failures in social services in Wales, but we cannot be complacent about the fact. We need to ensure that no such breakdown exists in social services in Wales. The role of the local safeguarding children boards is critical as far as this is concerned, and you will know that the Deputy Minister for Social Services, Gwenda Thomas, has already appointed a commission, led by Professor Geoffrey Pearson, to ensure that there is consistency in social services and to look at the role and effectiveness of local safeguarding boards. The commission’s review will come before the Chamber in due course.

Your point about continuing care claims is critical. This is an issue where we depend on guidance, and the updating of that guidance in light of experience in its use is important, because this leads to a difficult boundary where assessment leads to important decisions about the support of continuing care, or funding for residential care. This issue is very much on the agenda of the Deputy Minister for Social Services and the Minister for Health and Social Services, and they will take account of your points.

**Jane Hutt:** Ymatebodd y Prif Weinidog i’ch cwestiwn ynglŷn â’r ymrwymiad yn ‘Cymru’n Un’. Yr ydym yn bwriadu cyflawni hwnnw, ond yr ydym hefyd wedi bod yn gweithio ers dwy flynedd a hanner i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gwireddu gwasanaeth ar y lefel honno gyda nyrsys teulu. Yr ydym yn cydnabod yn arbennig bwysigrwydd gwasanaeth iechyd nyrsys ysgol, sydd ar flaen y gad o ran atal afiechyd a hybu iechyd gyda golwg ar rai o’r problemau a drafodwyd yn gynharach, megis addysg ynglŷn â lleihau camddefnyddio alcohol. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd y Gweinidog dros iechyd yn ymateb iddo.

Yr oedd adolygiadau’r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gyhoeddwyd ddoe ynglŷn â’r methiannau’n peri tristwch. Nid methiannau yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru oedd y rhain, ond ni allwn fod yn hunanfodlon ynglŷn â’r ffaith. Mae angen inni sicrhau nad oes chwalfa o’r fath yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru. Mae rôl y byrddau lleol diogelu plant yn hollbwysig yn y cyswllt hwn, a gwyddoch fod y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Gwenda Thomas, eisoes wedi penodi comisiwn, o dan arweiniad yr Athro Geoffrey Pearson, i sicrhau cysondeb yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac i edrych ar rôl ac effeithiolrwydd byrddau diogelu lleol. Daw adolygiad y comisiwn gerbron y Siambr maes o law.

Mae eich pwynt am hawliadau gofal parhaus yn hollbwysig. Byddwn yn dibynnu ar ganllawiau yn y cyswllt hwn, ac mae’n bwysig diweddarau’r canllawiau hynny yng ngoleuni’r profiad o’u dilyn. Mae’n arwain at ffin anodd, lle y bydd asesu’n arwain at benderfyniadau pwysig ynglŷn â chefnogi gofal parhaus, neu ariannu gofal preswyl. Mae’r mater hwn yn flaenllaw ar agenda’r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol a’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a byddant yn ystyried eich pwyntiau.

**Janet Ryder:** Minister, we heard about a number of issues last week to do with the severe weather and the closure of schools, and the effect on the timetabling of exams. However, something that was brought home to me was the effect that social networks, including e-mail and social interface web pages, have on young people. Whereas news programmes talked about the impact of the weather and the possibility of exams being delayed, young people were discussing this on these networks. Many young people were already under severe pressure as a result of their exams, but that pressure was increased. It led to uncertainty and a lack of clarity, and it brought home the sometimes detrimental impact that the discussions on these networks can have on the psyche of young people. Although these networks can be helpful and constructive, they can also have a negative side. The Government needs to start considering how to produce grounded young people who are able to face the future with confidence, and how to equip them to face a new dimension in communications. Would you consider bringing forward to the Chamber a discussion on the pros and cons of social networking?

**Jane Hutt:** Several Ministers would be interested in that point, Janet. Last week, the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning issued a written statement on the adverse effects of the weather on examinations, but one wonders how many young people read that statement.

On digital access and the use of social networking by our young people, we have to look at how we can communicate more directly with young people. With my new ministerial responsibilities for communications, I want to look at that. I know that my colleague, Lesley Griffiths, the Deputy Minister for Innovation, Science and Skills, would be very interested in this, as would the Minister for education.

**Janet Ryder:** Weinidog, clywsom am nifer o faterion yr wythnos diwethaf a oedd yn ymwneud â'r tywydd garw a chau ysgolion, a'r effaith ar amserlennu arholiadau. Fodd bynnag, rhywbeth a wnaeth argraff arnaf fi oedd yr effaith y mae rhwydweithiau cymdeithasol, gan gynnwys e-bost a thudalennau rhyngweithio cymdeithasol ar y we yn ei chael ar bobl ifanc. Pan oedd rhaglenni newyddion yn sôn am effaith y tywydd ac am y posibilrwydd y câi arholiadau eu gohirio, yr oedd pobl ifanc yn trafod hyn ar y rhwydweithiau hyn. Yr oedd llawer o bobl ifanc eisoes dan bwysau difrifol oherwydd eu harholiadau, ond cynyddwyd y pwysau hwnnw. Arweiniodd at ansicrwydd a diffyg eglurder, a dangosodd yr effaith niweidiol y gall y trafodaethau ar y rhwydweithiau hyn ei chael weithiau ar stad meddwl pobl ifanc. Er bod y rhwydweithiau hyn yn gallu bod o gymorth ac yn adeiladol, gall fod iddynt ochr negyddol hefyd. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth ddechrau ystyried sut y mae datblygu pobl ifanc synhwyrol sy'n gallu wynebu'r dyfodol yn hyderus, a sut y mae eu paratoi ar gyfer wynebu dimensiwn newydd yn y byd cyfathrebu. A fydddech yn ystyried trefnu trafodaeth yn y Siambr ynglŷn â manteision ac anfanteision rhwydweithio cymdeithasol?

**Jane Hutt:** Byddai gan sawl Gweinidog ddiddordeb yn y pwynt hwnnw, Janet. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn ag effeithiau niweidiol y tywydd ar arholiadau, ond mae rhywun yn amau faint o bobl ifanc a ddarllenodd y datganiad hwnnw.

O ran mynediad digidol a defnyddio rhwydweithio cymdeithasol gan ein pobl ifanc, rhaid inni edrych ar sut y gallwn gyfathrebu'n fwy uniongyrchol â phobl ifanc. A minnau'n ysgwyddo cyfrifoldebau newydd dros gyfathrebu fel Gweinidog, yr wyf am edrych ar hynny. Gwn y byddai gan fy nghyd-Weinidog, Lesley Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Arloesi, Gwyddoniaeth a Sgiliau, ddiddordeb mawr yn hyn, fel y byddai gan y Gweinidog dros addysg.

I fear that some of the points that you make may refer to cases that verge on cyber bullying, and so they raise those kinds of concerns as well. I will certainly consider your point about future opportunities for statements and debates.

Mae arnaf ofn bod rhai o'r pwyntiau yr ydych yn eu gwneud o bosibl yn cyfeirio at achosion sy'n ymylu ar seibr-fwlio, ac felly maent yn codi rhai o'r mathau hynny o bryderon hefyd. Byddaf yn sicr yn ystyried eich pwynt ynglŷn â chyfleoedd yn y dyfodol i gael datganiadau a dadleuon.

## **Datganiad am Bosch Statement on Bosch**

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Last week's announcement that Bosch Cardiff will close is extremely disappointing news and a significant blow to the hard-working and highly skilled employees of Bosch and the wider community. Bosch has produced alternators for the automotive industry at the site for nearly 20 years. At its peak, it employed around 1,500 employees at the plant, yet over the last 18 months, staff numbers have reduced owing to declining customer demand in the automotive sector. We have been working extremely closely with the company over the last few months to look at all options available to keep the plant running and to develop other product lines to safeguard as many of the 800 full-time jobs as possible.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae'r datganiad yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd Bosch Caerdydd yn cau'n newyddion eithriadol o siomedig ac yn ergyd sylweddol i weithwyr caled a chrefftus iawn Bosch ac i'r gymuned ehangach. Mae Bosch yn cynhyrchu eiliaduron i'r diwydiant modurol ar y safle ers bron 20 mlynedd. Yn ei anterth, yr oedd yn cyflogi tua 1,500 o weithwyr yn y ffatri, ond yn ystod y 18 mis diwethaf, mae nifer y staff wedi gostwng oherwydd lleihad yn y galw gan gwsmeriaid y diwydiant modurol. Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio'n eithriadol o glòs gyda'r cwmni yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf i ystyried yr holl opsiynau sydd ar gael er mwyn cadw'r ffatri ar agor ac i ddatblygu mathau eraill o gynnyrch i ddiogelu cynifer o'r 800 o swyddi llawnamser ag sy'n bosibl.

Following the announcement on 14 January, I met with Bosch's senior management team to press the case for keeping the plant open. The Bosch management team outlined that the Bosch Group is currently facing the worst economic downturn for many decades and has been especially hit in the automotive sector. For the first time in 60 years, the Bosch Group will show a negative operating result. In parallel to that, Bosch is reviewing its production sites in the automotive industry as core technologies are being completely transformed to accommodate the demand for smaller, more fuel-efficient and less polluting vehicles. Bosch has consistently reinvested in the Cardiff plant over the years. Most recently, it spent €54 million on new

Ar ôl y cyhoeddiad ar 14 Ionawr, cyfarfûm ag uwch dîm rheoli Bosch i bwysu arnynt i gadw'r ffatri ar agor. Dywedodd tîm rheoli Bosch fod Grŵp Bosch ar hyn o bryd yn wynebu'r dirywiad economaidd gwaethaf ers degawdau lawer a'i fod wedi cael ei daro'n arbennig o galed yn y sector modurol. Am y tro cyntaf mewn 60 mlynedd, bydd canlyniadau gweithredu Grŵp Bosch yn ganlyniadau negyddol. Ochr yn ochr â hynny, mae Bosch yn adolygu ei safleoedd cynhyrchu yn y diwydiant modurol gan fod technolegau craidd yn cael eu gweddnewid yn llwyr er mwyn ymateb i'r galw am gerbydau llai, sy'n defnyddio tanwydd yn fwy effeithlon ac sy'n llygru llai. Mae Bosch wedi ailfuddsoddi yn ffatri Caerdydd yn

production lines and machines between 2006 and 2009 for the production of the new alternator that was launched in 2005.

The reasons for the decision to close the Cardiff site were based on a study that began in 2007 to investigate the feasibility of the introduction of a next-generation alternator product. The final analysis showed that a new product could not be competitively manufactured in Cardiff. At the meeting, we discussed all options of possible support to Bosch in our efforts to reverse the company's decision. However, I deeply regret that Bosch has come to the decision to proceed with the option to phase out production, in line with the reduction in customer demand and the transfer of equipment to Hungary by the summer of 2011.

While the consultation period continues until the end of February, it was agreed that we will do everything possible to help those affected by the announcement. We will outline the ReAct programme support that will assist the workforce to find alternative employment and enhance their skills. We also agreed that Bosch would provide us with a list of its Welsh supply chain to offer support to those affected by the announcement. I have also written to Bosch management in Germany, requesting a follow-up meeting.

The news illustrates how Wales, like all of western Europe and the USA, is facing intense competition in this sector from eastern Europe, China and India. That is why we are developing a new approach to the economy, through the economic renewal programme. That will move us away from a grants culture to focus more on developing the skills of our workforce and research and development. Its aim is long-term sustained development. However, manufacturing will continue to be an important part of the Welsh economy, and we more than recognise its

gyson dros y blynyddoedd. Yn ddiweddar iawn, gwariodd \$54 miliwn ar linellau cynhyrchu a pheiriannau newydd rhwng 2006 a 2009 er mwyn cynhyrchu'r eiliadur newydd a lanswyd yn 2005.

Seiliwyd y rhesymau dros y penderfyniad i gau safle Caerdydd ar astudiaeth a ddechreuodd yn 2007 i ystyried pa mor ymarferol fyddai cyflwyno eiliadur y genhedlaeth nesaf. Dangosodd y dadansoddiad terfynol na fyddai modd gwneud cynnyrch newydd cystadleuol yng Nghaerdydd a fyddai'n gystadleuol. Yn y cyfarfod, trafodwyd pob opsiwn ar gyfer cymorth posibl i Bosch yn ein hymdrechion i wrthdroi penderfyniad y cwmni. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr fod Bosch wedi penderfynu bwrw ymlaen â'r opsiwn i roi'r gorau i gynhyrchu'n raddol, yn unol â'r lleihad yn y galw gan gwsmeriaid, gan drosglwyddo'r offer i Hwngari erbyn haf 2011.

Tra bod y cyfnod ymgynghori'n parhau tan ddiwedd mis Chwefror, cytunwyd y byddwn yn gwneud popeth posibl i gynorthwyo'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad. Byddwn yn amlinellu cymorth y rhaglen ReAct a fydd yn cynorthwyo'r gweithlu i ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth amgen a gwella'u sgiliau. Cytunwyd hefyd y byddai Bosch yn rhoi rhestr inni o'i gadwyn gyflenwi yng Nghymru er mwyn inni gynnig cymorth i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y cyhoeddiad. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ysgrifennu at reolwyr Bosch yn yr Almaen, yn gofyn am gyfarfod dilynol.

Mae'r newyddion yn dangos sut y mae Cymru, fel gorllewin Ewrop ac Unol Daleithiau America drwyddynt draw, yn wynebu cystadleuaeth ddwys yn y sector hwn o du dwyrain Ewrop, Tsieina ac India. Dyna pam yr ydym yn datblygu dull newydd o ymdrin â'r economi, drwy'r rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi. Bydd hynny'n ein symud oddi wrth ddiwylliant grantiau i ganolbwyntio mwy ar ddatblygu sgiliau ein gweithlu ac ar ymchwil a datblygu. Ei nod yw datblygiad parhaus hirdymor. Fodd bynnag, bydd gweithgynhyrchu'n dal yn rhan

value.

bwysig o economi Cymru, ac yr ydym yn llwyr gydnabod ei werth.

2.50 p.m.

**David Melding:** I must say how much the Welsh Conservative group sympathises with the local workforce, faced with losing their jobs. We wish them every success in finding new work, and we hope that they find highly paid jobs that will make use of their skills. If they are retrained, we wish them success in that. They must face a 2010 that they dread following the terrible news that Bosch will close its plant.

**David Melding:** Rhaid imi ddweud gymaint y mae grŵp y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn cydymdeimlo â'r gweithlu lleol sy'n wynebu colli eu swyddi. Dymunwn bob llwyddiant iddynt wrth iddynt geisio dod o hyd i waith newydd, gan obeithio y llwyddant i gael hyd i swyddi â chyflogau uchel a fydd yn defnyddio'u sgiliau. Os cânt eu hailhyfforddi, dymunwn lwyddiant iddynt yn hynny. Mae'n siŵr eu bod yn arswydo wrth wynebu 2010 ar ôl y newydd ofnadwy y bydd Bosch yn cau ei ffatri.

We have to ask some hard questions of the Welsh Assembly Government, and I ask them without any prejudice as you, Deputy First Minister, may be able to reassure us about the policies that have been followed and the actions that you have taken in response to this dreadful news. We want to know the nature and seniority of the contact that WAG has had to date with Bosch. Have you been to Germany to speak to head office staff? Has the First Minister gone, or did a previous First Minister go? What has happened in the last year or so since I presume your civil servants identified, through their intelligence networks, that Bosch was in serious trouble and that our plant was one of the most vulnerable? At what level was any interaction undertaken? Given that you said that you have only just written to Germany asking for a meeting at that level, I must infer that you have not had one yet. You have been relying on the branch management here and, however dedicated they are to that factory, they do not make or control strategic decisions. We need an answer on that.

Rhaid inni ofyn nifer o gwestiynau anodd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac fe'u gofynnaf heb ddim rhagfarn, oherwydd efallai y gallwch chi, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, dawelu ein meddwl ynglŷn â'r polisiau sydd wedi'u dilyn a'r camau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i ymateb i'r newydd ofnadwy hwn. Yr ydym am wybod â phwy yn Bosch y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn cysylltu, o ran natur y cysylltiad ac ar ba lefel. A ydych wedi bod yn yr Almaen yn siarad â staff y brif swyddfa? A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod yno, neu a aeth cyn Brif Weinidog yno? Beth sydd wedi digwydd yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf ers pan gafodd eich gweision sifil wybod, yr wyf yn cymryd, drwy eu rhwydweithiau gwybodaeth, fod Bosch mewn trafferthion difrifol ac mai ein ffatri ni oedd un o'r rhai a oedd yn y sefyllfa wannaf? Ar ba lefel y digwyddodd unrhyw gysylltiad? Gan eich bod wedi dweud mai newydd ysgrifennu at yr Almaen yr ydych yn gofyn am gyfarfod ar y lefel honno, yr wyf yn casglu, felly, nad ydych wedi cael un eto. Yr ydych wedi bod yn dibynnu ar reolwyr y gangen yma ac, ni waeth faint yw eu hymroddiad i'r ffatri honno, nid hwy sy'n gwneud nac yn rheoli penderfyniadau strategol. Mae angen inni gael ateb ynglŷn â hynny.

Secondly, other companies, brought into Wales a generation or so ago, are potentially

Yn ail, mae'n bosibl bod cwmnïau eraill, a ddaeth i Gymru genhedlaeth yn ôl, yn yr un

in the same situation as Bosch. Unless their plants find new product lines or increase the level of manufacturing, research and development quality, and high skills input, they could also face this sort of vulnerability to a head office withdrawing functions and closing plants in Wales. Is it your policy to identify areas that are at risk and to go to those countries to talk with the management there to convince them that Wales has a vision for the future of manufacturing, by increasing its value and the research and development component that it contains? Unless you do that, we face a very grim future. If you go to hold these meetings, what will you tell them about the manufacturing strategy that you have yet to publish? You are likely to produce it three years after the UK's strategy. How do you tell the workforce, whom you will encourage to retrain through the ReAct programme if they do not find other employment straight away, to which areas of the manufacturing economy they should turn to find and prepare for other employment? Without a manufacturing strategy, how can they anticipate where the demand is likely to be?

I will finish by reminding you that the automotive sector is one of your key areas identified for future growth. Bosch's decision sends a powerful signal to other players in this market that Wales is in a slightly vulnerable position. Unless you take action quickly, or move dramatically to other areas where you think there are manufacturing opportunities, stating that the automotive sector is a key area will not be enough. You will have to take practical action to say that you really mean it, that you see it as an expanding future force, and that our policies to back it will be following.

**The Deputy First Minister:** Thank you for your questions, David. It is right that you ask hard questions, as you put it, because this is a difficult time for Bosch and its workforce. I

sefyllfa â Bosch. Oni lwydda eu ffatrïoedd i ddod o hyd i fathau newydd o gynnyrch neu i gynyddu lefel y gweithgynhyrchu, a gwella safon eu hymchwil a'u datblygu a'u sgiliau da, gallent hwythau hefyd wynebu'r un math o sefyllfa fregus wrth i brif swyddfa roi'r gorau i swyddogaethau a chau ffatrïoedd yng Nghymru. Ai eich polisi yw gweld pa feysydd sydd mewn perygl a mynd i'r gwledydd hynny er mwyn siarad â'r rheolwyr yno i'w hargyhoeddi bod gan Gymru weledigaeth ar gyfer dyfodol gweithgynhyrchu, drwy gynyddu ei werth a'r elfen yn ymwneud ag ymchwil a datblygu y mae'n ei chynnwys? Oni wnewch hynny, yr ydym yn wynebu dyfodol du iawn. Os ewch i gynnal y cyfarfodydd hyn, beth a ddywedwch wrthynt am y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu nad ydych wedi'i chyhoeddi eto? Yr ydych yn debyg o'i chynhyrchu dair blynedd ar ôl cyhoeddi strategaeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Sut y dywedwch wrth y gweithlu, y byddwch yn ei annog i ailhyfforddi drwy gyfrwng rhaglen ReAct, os nad ydynt yn dod o hyd i waith arall ar unwaith, at ba feysydd o'r economi gweithgynhyrchu y dylent droi er mwyn dod o hyd i waith arall a pharatoi ar ei gyfer? Heb strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu, sut y gallant ragweld ymhle y mae'r galw'n debyg o fod?

Dof i ben drwy eich atgoffa mai'r sector modurol yw un o'r meysydd allweddol yr ydych wedi'i ddewis ar gyfer twf yn y dyfodol. Mae penderfyniad Bosch yn anfon neges bwerus at gwmnïau eraill yn y farchnad hon fod Cymru mewn sefyllfa fregus braidd. Oni wnewch rywbeth ar frys, neu symud yn ddramatig i feysydd eraill lle yr ydych yn meddwl bod cyfleoedd ar gael ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu, ni fydd yn ddigon dweud bod y sector modurol yn faes allweddol. Bydd yn rhaid ichi gymryd camau ymarferol i ddangos eich bod cystal â'ch gair, eich bod yn ei weld yn rym a fydd yn ehangu yn y dyfodol, ac y bydd ein polisiau'n dilyn i fod yn gefn i hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Diolch ichi am eich cwestiynau, David. Mae'n iawn ichi ofyn cwestiynau anodd, fel y dywedaso, oherwydd y mae'r cyfnod hwn yn un anodd i

assure you that, during the time in which we have been aware that Bosch was looking to restructure and looking at the viability of its plants, the contact with the company was at a very senior level. There have been no visits to Germany, but the Welsh Assembly Government has had a number of meetings with senior management from Germany. A meeting was held in November where the former First Minister and I met senior representatives from the company to discuss the plants. Therefore, there have been considerable discussions with Bosch at all levels over a sustained period. Given its importance to the Welsh economy, the Assembly Government has maintained a senior relationship at management level with the company. I have had regular reports from my officials on the nature of the discussions that they have been having with the company over a long period. The former First Minister and I have taken a keen interest in maintaining those relationships with Bosch. [Interruption.] It might help if the Members opposite listened to what I have to say. There have been considerable discussions at a senior level, and I am absolutely satisfied— [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not getting anywhere like this. You know that it is normal courtesy here to listen to Ministers when they are responding to questions. I will then call whoever wishes to be called. You know that I deplore the barracking. I spent part of my recess observing the disgusting practices of the House of Commons, and I do not want the Assembly to deteriorate to that level.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I am satisfied that the Welsh Assembly Government has done everything possible to secure the future of Bosch in Wales. David indicated that other plants, similar to Bosch, might be looking for new product lines. In other words, the number of companies that might have been investing in Wales in past decades are now looking for reinvestment to maintain the viability of their plants. We have to recognise the harsh reality of the world economy

Bosch ac i'w weithlu. Yr wyf yn eich sicrhau, ers inni gael gwybod bod Bosch yn bwriadu ailstrwythuro ac yn ystyried hyfywedd ei ffatrioedd, fod ein cysylltiad â'r cwmni wedi bod ar lefel uchel iawn. Nid oes ymweliadau â'r Almaen wedi bod, ond mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael nifer o gyfarfodydd gydag uwch reolwyr o'r Almaen. Cynhaliwyd cyfarfod ym mis Tachwedd lle y cyfarfu'r cyn Brif Weinidog a minnau ag uwch gynrychiolwyr o'r cwmni i drafod y ffatrioedd. Felly, mae cryn drafodaethau wedi bod gyda Bosch ar bob lefel dros gyfnod hir. O ystyried ei bwysigrwydd i economi Cymru, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cynnal perthynas ar lefel uchel gyda rheolwyr y cwmni. Yr wyf wedi cael adroddiadau rheolaidd gan fy swyddogion ynglŷn â natur y trafodaethau y maent wedi bod yn eu cael gyda'r cwmni dros gyfnod hir. Mae'r cyn Brif Weinidog a minnau wedi bod yn frwd ynglŷn â chynnal y berthynas honno â Bosch. [Torri ar draws.] Efallai y byddai o gymorth petai'r Aelodau gyferbyn yn gwrando ar yr hyn sydd gennyf i'w ddweud. Mae trafodaethau sylweddol wedi bod ar lefel uchel, ac yr wyf yn gwbl argyhoeddedig— [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ydym yn mynd i unman fel hyn. Gwyddoch mai'r cwrtseisi arferol yma yw ein bod yn gwrando ar Weinidogion wrth iddynt ymateb i gwestiynau. Yna, galwaf ar bwy bynnag sy'n dymuno cael ei alw. Gwyddoch fod yn gas gennyf y gweiddi ar draws Aelod. Treuliais ran o'r toriad yn gwylio arferion atgas Tŷ'r Cyffredin, ac nid wyf am i'r Cynulliad ddirywio i'r lefel honno.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud popeth posibl i sicrhau dyfodol Bosch yng Nghymru. Awgrymodd David y gallai ffatrioedd eraill, tebyg i Bosch, fod yn chwilio am fathau newydd o gynnyrch. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'r cwmnïau niferus a allai fod wedi bod yn buddsoddi yng Nghymru yn y degawdau diwethaf bellach yn chwilio am ailbuddsoddiad er mwyn sicrhau bod eu ffatrioedd yn parhau'n hyfyw. Rhaid

currently: a number of companies like Bosch have been looking to eastern Europe, India and China to lower their costs, so they say, and they will continue to do so. By that, they mean lower operating costs and lower wage costs. In that climate, I must admit that it is difficult for Wales to compete in the marketplace. That has been happening for some time now.

You asked whether we have been active in trying to secure reinvestment, and I believe that we have. I have led three trade missions during my time as Deputy First Minister—and I know that some Conservative Members have been questioning whether we should be undertaking them. I have been to Japan, India and the United States. We are living in a harsh, competitive environment, and we cannot always secure reinvestment, as the Bosch announcement indicates.

You also asked whether the Welsh Assembly Government has a vision for manufacturing. Of course we do. Even with the difficulties as a result of the recession, manufacturing in Wales is an important sector, and will continue to be into the future. On the ReAct programme, it is important that the people working at Bosch access that support, and there are already signs of companies actively looking to recruit people of high quality who have the high-level skills. You made the point that the automotive sector is the key in driving the Welsh economy forward. That will remain the case. The meetings that I held during the trade missions to those three countries have indicated that Wales will benefit from investment in the sector in the not-too-distant future.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Could the Deputy First Minister confirm from all his negotiations with Bosch that the reasons behind the tragic decision to close the alternator plant at Miskin did not include any criticism of the commitment or high productivity levels of the workforce? Would he also confirm that

inni sylweddoli realiti llym economi'r byd ar hyn o bryd; mae nifer o gwmnïau fel Bosch wedi bod yn edrych tua dwyrain Ewrop, India a Tsieina er mwyn gostwng eu costau, meddent, a byddant yn parhau i wneud hynny. Wrth sôn am hynny, yr hyn sydd ganddynt dan sylw yw costau gweithredu is a chostau cyflogau is. Yn yr hinsawdd honno, rhaid imi gyfaddef ei bod yn anodd i Gymru gystadlu yn y farchnad. Mae hynny wedi bod yn digwydd ers tro bellach.

Gofynasoch a ydym wedi bod yn gweithio i geisio sicrhau ailfuddsoddi, a chredaf ein bod. Yr wyf wedi arwain tair taith fasnach yn ystod fy nghyfnod fel Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—a gwn fod rhai Aelodau Ceidwadol wedi bod yn holi a ddylem fod yn mynd ar y teithiau hyn. Yr wyf wedi bod yn Siapan, yn India ac yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Yr ydym yn byw mewn amgylchedd anodd, cystadleuol, ac ni allwn bob tro sicrhau ailfuddsoddiad, fel y mae cyhoeddiad Bosch yn dangos.

Gofynasoch hefyd a oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weledigaeth ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu. Wrth gwrs bod gennym. Hyd yn oed gyda'r anawsterau yn sgîl y dirwasgiad, mae gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru'n sector pwysig, a bydd hynny'n parhau yn y dyfodol. O ran rhaglen ReAct, mae'n bwysig i'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn Bosch fanteisio ar y cymorth hwnnw, ac mae arwyddion eisoes fod cwmnïau'n mynd ati i geisio recriwtio pobl o safon a chanddynt sgîliau da. Dywedasoch mai'r sector modur yw'r allwedd i sbarduno economi Cymru. Bydd hynny'n dal yn wir. Mae'r cyfarfodydd a gynhaliats yn ystod y teithiau masnach i'r tair gwlad hynny wedi awgrymu y bydd Cymru'n elwa o fuddsoddi yn y sector yn y dyfodol gweddol agos.

**Rhodri Morgan:** A allai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gadarnhau, yn sgîl ei holl drafodaethau gyda Bosch, nad oedd a wnelo'r rhesymau dros y penderfyniad trasig i gau'r ffatri eiliaduron ym Meisgyn ddim byd o gwbl â beirniadaeth ar ymrwymiad nac ar lefelau cynhyrchiant uchel y gweithlu? A



the high productivity at the Miskin plant included the speed with which new products could be designed and new production lines commissioned? Would he further confirm that, if any criticism is to be borne in relation to this tragic decision to close the plant, it must be borne primarily by the Bosch management for failing to foresee the switch to smaller cars, which stranded the Miskin plant with one product line—the LIX alternator—that was devised entirely for the large car market, with no alternative alternator line available, just at the time when the market for large cars crashed?

fyddai'n cadarnhau hefyd fod y cynhyrchiant uchel yn ffatri Meisgyn yn cynnwys pa mor gyflym y gellid cynllunio cynnyrch newydd a chomisiynu llinellau cynhyrchu newydd? A fyddai hefyd yn cadarnhau, os oes beirniadaeth ar unrhyw un yng nghyswllt y penderfyniad trasig hwn i gau'r ffatri, mai ar reolwyr Bosch yn bennaf y mae'r feirniadaeth honno am fethu rhagweld y byddai pobl yn newid i geir llai, gan adael ffatri Meisgyn ag un llinell gynhyrchu—yr eiliadur LIX—a ddyfeisiwyd ar gyfer y farchnad ceir mawr yn unig, heb fod llinell ar gyfer eiliaduron eraill ar gael, a hynny ar yr union adeg pan ddymchwelodd y farchnad ar gyfer ceir mawr?

3.00 p.m.

Will you finally confirm that the bizarre and outlandish claim made by a Conservative Assembly Member during questions to the First Minister that if only the Welsh Assembly Government had published a manufacturing strategy, Bosch would not have closed the Miskin plant, bears no relationship to any economic reality? That is simply an example of the kind of synthetic crocodile tears that we have come to expect from the Tory party. They enjoy hearing news about closures because they think that they can gain political votes from them.

A wnewch gadarnhau'n olaf nad yw'r honiad rhyfedd ac eithafol gan un o Aelodau Ceidwadol y Cynulliad yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, sef na fyddai Bosch wedi cau ffatri Meisgyn petai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu, yn berthnasol o gwbl i'r realiti economaidd? Nid yw hynny'n ddim ond enghraifft o'r math o ddagrau ffug synthetig yr ydym bellach yn eu disgwyl gan y blaid Doriaidd. Maent yn mwynhau clywed newyddion ynglŷn â chau gweithfeydd oherwydd eu bod yn meddwl bod pleidleisiau gwleidyddol i'w hennill yn sgîl hynny.

**The Deputy First Minister:** It is important that we place on record the fact that even on the dark day of the announcement, the Bosch management team paid great tributes to the quality of the workforce in Cardiff and its high productivity, and said that when it was commissioning new product lines the workforce was able to implement them quickly. You are right about the company's decision because the alternator that was being produced at the Cardiff plant was no longer being used in the vehicles that were being sold. The alternator was primarily for the larger car market, but the market has shifted and the cars that are being bought are those with smaller engines that produce lower emissions. It is outlandish to suggest that if a

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n bwysig inni gofnodi'r ffaith, hyd yn oed ar ddiwrnod tywyll y cyhoeddiad, fod tîm rheoli Bosch wedi rhoi teyrnged wych i ansawdd y gweithlu yng Nghaerdydd a'i lefelau cynhyrchiant uchel, gan ddweud pan oedd yn comisiynu llinellau cynhyrchu newydd fod y gweithlu'n gallu eu rhoi ar waith yn gyflym. Yr ydych yn iawn am benderfyniad y cwmni oherwydd nid oedd yr eiliadur a gynhyrchid yn ffatri Caerdydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio rhagor yn y cerbydau a werthid. Ar gyfer marchnad ceir mwy o faint yr oedd yr eiliadur yn bennaf, ond mae'r farchnad wedi newid a'r ceir sy'n cael eu prynu yw'r rhai a chanddynt beiriannau llai sy'n cynhyrchu llai o allyriadau. Mae'n hollol wirion awgrymu

manufacturing strategy had been in place, Bosch would have decided to stay in Cardiff. The harsh economic reality is that the company has made this decision because it can produce the product cheaper in Hungary. That is clear.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for your statement, Deputy First Minister. I will start, as my colleagues have done, by expressing my sympathy for the workforce at Bosch. I extend that sympathy to those who will suffer from the knock-on effects of the job losses along the supply chain. I will come back to that in a moment.

In your statement, you say that Bosch undertook a study, which began in 2007, to investigate the feasibility of the introduction of a next-generation alternator product, and that the final analysis showed that a new product could not be competitively manufactured in Cardiff. That statement seems considerably at odds with Rhodri Morgan's assertion that it was Bosch that was to blame for stranding the workforce with an alternator that was fit only for large cars. Can you confirm whether that next-generation product would have been for a different sort of car?

I am interested in this particular issue because the statement that a new product could not be competitively manufactured in Cardiff sounds like a cry of despair for all manufacturing in Wales, that we will not be able to compete for the next generation of motor manufacturing products or products more generally. That is the most distressing part of your whole statement and the element that should be most worrying to us for the future. As a nation, we need to develop our own research and home-grown products that will not be so easily lured abroad for manufacture. We have waited for many years, hearing stories that the car market was going to move on in the face of global warming and environmental concerns, and that we were going to move on to electric cars and so on. We are now at the cusp,

petai gennym strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu y byddai Bosch wedi penderfynu aros yng Nghaerdydd. Y realiti economaidd llym yw bod y cwmni wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn am ei fod yn gallu cynhyrchu'r cynnyrch yn rhatach yn Hwngari. Mae hynny'n amlwg.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Dechreuaf, fel y mae fy nghyd-Aelodau wedi gwneud, drwy fynegi fy nghydymdeimlad â'r gweithlu yn Bosch. Estynnaf y cydymdeimlad hwnnw i'r rhai a fydd yn dioddef effeithiau canlyniadol colli swyddi ar hyd y gadwyn gyflenwi. Dychwelaf at hynny mewn munud.

Yn eich datganiad, dywedwch i Bosch gynnal astudiaeth, a ddechreuodd yn 2007, i archwilio pa mor ymarferol fyddai cyflwyno eiliadur y genhedlaeth nesaf, a bod y dadansoddiad terfynol wedi dangos na fyddai modd gwneud cynnyrch newydd cystadleuol yng Nghaerdydd. Mae'r datganiad hwnnw, i bob golwg, yn bur groes i honiad Rhodri mai Bosch oedd ar fai am adael y gweithlu gydag eiliadur nad oedd ond yn addas ar gyfer ceir mawr. A allwch gadarnhau ai ar gyfer math gwahanol o gar y buasai cynnyrch y genhedlaeth nesaf?

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y mater penodol hwn oherwydd bod y datganiad na ellid gweithgynhyrchu cynnyrch newydd cystadleuol yng Nghaerdydd yn swnio fel cri o anobaith i'r holl weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, sef na fyddwn yn gallu cystadlu ar gyfer y genhedlaeth nesaf o ran cynnyrch gweithgynhyrchu moduro, na chynnyrch yn fwy cyffredinol. Dyna'r rhan o'ch datganiad sy'n fy mhoeni fwyaf a'r elfen a ddylai fod yn peri'r pryder mwyaf inni ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fel cenedl, mae angen inni ddatblygu ein hymchwil a'n cynnyrch cartref ein hunain, cynnyrch na fyddai mor hawdd ei ddenu i'w weithgynhyrchu dramor. Yr ydym wedi aros ers blynnyddoedd lawer, yn clywed straeon bod y farchnad ceir yn mynd i symud ymlaen yn wyneb cynhesu byd-eang a phryderon amgylcheddol i geir trydan ac yn y

where these new products are starting to become serious competitors, and are beginning to be considered seriously by the general public as products that it can buy. From your statement, it appears that we are not in the running for the design and manufacture of those products.

You referred in the next paragraph of your statement to the transfer of equipment from the Bosch plant to Hungary by summer 2011. Even though Bosch has recently been investing in this equipment, it is now moving it to Hungary. Can you confirm whether any EU or Welsh Assembly Government money has been used to purchase or develop this new equipment? If any Welsh public money has been involved in the purchase of this equipment, which is now going to Hungary, what are you doing to pursue that issue and to secure its return?

Further on in your statement, you said that you have asked for a list of the Welsh supply chain to the Bosch plant in order to offer support to those affected by this announcement. I have to confess that I am extremely concerned that it is only now that you have asked for that list. I would have thought that in the months that you have known that there was a question mark over this site, the supply chain would have been one of your first thoughts, rather than one of your last. However, you have now asked for that list. Do you have an estimate of how many supply-chain jobs are affected, how many might be under threat, and where those jobs are located in Wales?

Further to the request for a meeting with Bosch management in Germany, it is quite ironic that German employment costs in the manufacturing sector are even higher than ours. I understand the argument that Bosch makes, that it can do the job for 65 per cent of the cost in Hungary, but it is still bearing the burden of very high wages in Germany.

blaen. Yn awr, yr ydym ar y dibyn, lle y mae'r cynhyrchion newydd hyn yn dechrau dod yn gystadleuwyr difrifol ac yn dechrau cael eu hystyried o ddifrif gan y cyhoedd yn gynhyrchion y gall eu prynu. Yn ôl eich datganiad, mae'n ymddangos nad ydym yn y gystadleuaeth ar gyfer dylunio a gweithgynhyrchu'r cynhyrchion hynny.

Soniasoch ym mharagraff nesaf eich datganiad am drosglwyddo offer o ffatri Bosch i Hwngari erbyn haf 2011. Er bod Bosch wedi bod yn buddsoddi yn y cyfarpar hwn yn ddiweddar, mae'n ei symud yn awr i Hwngari. A allwch gadarnhau a oes arian gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd neu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i ddefnyddio i brynu neu i ddatblygu'r cyfarpar newydd hwn? Os oes arian cyhoeddus o Gymru wedi'i ddefnyddio i brynu'r cyfarpar hwn, sydd yn awr yn mynd i Hwngari, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i fynd ar drywydd hynny ac i sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei dalu'n ôl?

Yn ddiweddarach yn eich datganiad, dywedasoch eich bod wedi gofyn am restr o'r gadwyn gyflenwi yng Nghymru i ffatri Bosch er mwyn cynnig cymorth i'r rhai y mae'r cyhoeddiad hwn yn effeithio arnynt. Rhaid imi gyfaddef fy mod yn eithriadol o bryderus mai yn awr yr ydych yn gofyn am y rhestr honno. Byddwn wedi meddwl, yn y misoedders pan ydych yn gwybod bod amheuaeth ynghylch dyfodol y safle hwn, mai'r gadwyn gyflenwi fuasai un o'r pethau cyntaf ichi feddwl amdano, yn hytrach nag un o'r pethau olaf. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn awr wedi gofyn am y rhestr honno. A oes gennyh amcangyfrif o faint o swyddi'r gadwyn gyflenwi yr effeithir arnynt, faint a allai fod o dan fygythiad, ac ymhle y mae'r swyddi hynny yng Nghymru?

Ynglŷn â'r cais am gyfarfod â rheolwyr Bosch yn yr Almaen, mae'n eithaf eironig bod costau cyflogi yn yr Almaen yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu hyd yn oed yn uwch na'n rhai ni. Yr wyf yn deall dadl Bosch y gall wneud y gwaith am 65 y cant o'r gost yn Hwngari, ond mae'n dal i ysgwyddo baich cyflogau uchel iawn yn yr Almaen. Mae hyn

This underlines the need for more home-grown business here. With that in mind, I am concerned by the long lead-in time to the potential publication of your economic renewal programme. David Melding mentioned how long the delay is in the manufacturing strategy and I am in total agreement with him on that. You said, at one point, that the new dawn that we have been promised in the economic renewal plan will take about 18 months to deliver. Can you confirm that you are now working to a much tighter timetable, and can you tell us when it will be ready? When will we be able to ask questions on, debate and give due consideration to the economic renewal programme?

**The Deputy First Minister:** It would probably be best if I clarified the timetable for the economic renewal programme. I am not quite sure where you got the idea that it is going to take 18 months to deliver as I have never indicated that it would take that amount of time and I have never made a statement to that effect. I announced the programme in October and I expect that a report will be available in June, so that is half the period of 18 months. The expectation is that any budgetary changes heralded by the economic renewal programme would be introduced in the second half of the next financial year. We are proceeding very quickly with that and I was pleased to be able to announce today the appointment of aides and advocates to work with us. They are senior people with considerable business experience, namely, Dyfrig John, Liz Davies, the founder of Next, and Gerald Davies, who has great experience from the Cardiff Business Club. They will be joining us to take the economic renewal programme forward and to liaise with business. From that kind of announcement, you can see that we are taking the issue seriously.

3.10 p.m.

I fully appreciate the point that you made, Jenny, about the impact and the knock-on

yn tanlinellu'r angen am fwy o fusnesau cartref yma. Gan gofio hynny, yr wyf yn poeni am y cyfnod paratoi hir cyn cyhoeddi eich rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi. Soniodd David Melding am yr oedi hir gyda'r strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu ac yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr ag ef ynglŷn â hynny. Dywedasoch ar un adeg y bydd y wawr newydd a addawyd inni yn y cynllun adnewyddu economaidd yn cymryd tua 18 mis i'w gwireddu. A allwch gadarnhau eich bod yn awr yn gweithio ar sail amserlen dynnach o lawer, ac a allwch ddweud wrthym pryd y bydd yn barod? Pryd y byddwn yn gallu gofyn cwestiynau am y rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi, ei thrafod a'i hystyried?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n debyg y byddai'n well imi egluro'r amserlen ar gyfer rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi. Nid wyf yn berffaith sicr o ble y cawsoch y syniad bod angen 18 mis i roi'r rhaglen ar waith gan nad wyf erioed wedi dweud y byddai angen cyhyd, nac wedi gwneud datganiad i'r perwyl hwnnw. Cyhoeddais y rhaglen fis Hydref a disgwyliaf y bydd adroddiad ar gael ym mis Mehefin, felly hanner y cyfnod o 18 mis yw hwnnw. Disgwylir y bydd unrhyw newidiadau cyllidebol a ddaw yn sgîl rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yn cael eu cyflwyno yn ail hanner y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd cyflym iawn yn hynny o beth ac yr oeddwn yn falch o allu cyhoeddi heddiw fod cynorthwywyr ac eiriolwyr wedi cael eu penodi i weithio gyda ni. Maent yn hen lawiau ac yn bobl a chanddynt brofiad busnes sylweddol, sef Dyfrig John, Liz Davies, sylfaenydd Next, a Gerald Davies, y mae ganddo gryn brofiad yng Nghlwb Busnes Caerdydd. Byddant yn ymuno â ni er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi ac i gyd-drafod gyda busnesau. Yn sgîl cyhoeddiad o'r fath, gallwch weld ein bod o ddifrif am hyn.

Yr wyf yn deall yn iawn y pwynt a wnaethoch, Jenny, ynghylch y effaith a'r

effects on the supply chain, but it was difficult to anticipate what the knock-on effects would be before the company had made its decision to stay or go. All our energies were directed at trying to persuade Bosch to stay and I would have been criticised if they had not been so directed. Once Bosch had made its decision, we were conscious of the impact on the supply chain and we are making an assessment of it. It looks as though it might not be as great as we originally feared, because a number of the companies supplying the Cardiff Bosch plant also supply Bosch's overseas plants, which will continue. In addition, a number of those suppliers did not have contracts with Bosch alone. Therefore, although there will be an impact, and we should not forget that, it might not be as significant as we originally feared. We will work with Bosch to ensure that we have a complete list of its suppliers and then we can discuss with those suppliers what the full impact will be. Let us be honest: as a result of the size of the company, the supply chain is a significant aspect of the Bosch situation.

In relation to the production of an alternative alternator, the reality is that any decision would have come too late for Bosch because it is making significant losses. If Bosch felt that the alternator that it intends to produce could be made more cheaply at another location, given its current financial circumstances, that would be the commercial decision that Bosch would take. However, just because Bosch has taken this decision, we should not believe that the other automotive companies that are involved in the supply chain in Wales are in a similar situation. Let me make it clear that Rhodri Morgan was absolutely right: a number of automotive companies in Wales are working harder through the recession than they were before it because people are moving to buy smaller cars. Some of them have ramped up production to a level that they had not seen prior to the recession. Just looking at what has happened at Bosch will not give you the complete picture, because a number of other

effeithiau canlyniadol ar y gadwyn gyflenwi, ond yr oedd yn anodd rhagweld beth fyddai'r rheini cyn i'r cwmni benderfynu aros neu adael. Nod ein holl ymdrechion oedd ceisio perswadio Bosch i aros a byddwn wedi cael fy meirniadu pe na bawn wedi canolbwyntio ar hynny. Ar ôl i Bosch benderfynu, yr oeddem yn ymwybodol o'r effaith ar y gadwyn gyflenwi ac yr ydym wrthi'n asesu'r effaith honno. Mae'n ymddangos na fydd cynddrwg, o bosibl, ag yr oeddem wedi ofni'n wreiddiol, oherwydd y mae nifer o'r cwmnïau sy'n cyflenwi ffatri Bosch yng Nghaerdydd hefyd yn cyflenwi ffatrioedd Bosch dramor, a bydd hynny'n parhau. At hynny, nid gyda Bosch yn unig yr oedd contractau nifer o'r cyflenwyr dan sylw. Felly, er y bydd effaith, ac ni ddylem anghofio hynny, efallai na fydd hynny mor sylweddol ag yr oeddem wedi ofni'n wreiddiol. Byddwn yn gweithio gyda Bosch i sicrhau bod gennym restr gyflawn o'i gyflenwyr er mwyn gallu trafod gyda'r cyflenwyr hynny beth fydd yr effaith yn llawn. Gadewch inni fod yn onest: oherwydd maint y cwmni, mae'r gadwyn gyflenwi'n elfen bwysig yn sefyllfa Bosch.

O ran cynhyrchu eiladur gwahanol, y gwir amdani yw y byddai unrhyw benderfyniad wedi bod yn rhy hwyr i Bosch gan ei fod yn gwneud colledion sylweddol. Os oedd Bosch yn teimlo y gellid gwneud yr eiliadur y mae'n bwriadu ei gynhyrchu yn rhatach mewn lleoliad arall, o ystyried ei sefyllfa ariannol bresennol, dyna'r penderfyniad masnachol y byddai Bosch yn ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, gan fod Bosch wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn, ni ddylem gredu bod y cwmnïau modurol eraill sy'n rhan o'r gadwyn gyflenwi yng Nghymru yn yr un sefyllfa. Gadewch imi ei gwneud yn glir fod Rhodri Morgan yn llygad ei le: mae nifer o gwmnïau modurol yng Nghymru yn gweithio'n galetach yn ystod y dirwasgiad nag yr oeddent cynt, a hynny am fod pobl yn dechrau prynu ceir llai eu maint. Mae rhai ohonynt yn cynhyrchu ar lefel uwch nag yr oeddent cyn y dirwasgiad. Ni chewch y darlun cyflawn drwy edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn Bosch yn unig, gan fod nifer o gwmnïau modurol eraill yn gwneud

automotive companies are doing extremely well, even though we are in a recession. It is not true to say that we will lose all our production or that we will win more business because the sector is strong in Wales. We must constantly go out into the marketplace and pitch for investment for Wales.

You are right to say that when we look to the future, at the production of new sorts of cars, whether they are electric cars or cars with lower emissions, we need to be there at the design end as well as the manufacturing end. If there is one lesson that the recession is teaching us, it is that we have to move up the supply chain and the value chain and the economic renewal programme is currently looking at that. We recognise that, in this harsh economic environment, a number of companies that would have traditionally invested and reinvested in Wales will not do so in the future. That is why the economic renewal programme is looking at how Government support in the future will have to be tailored and provided in a different way. I was pleased to hear that the opposition parties are happy to engage with us as we move ahead on that, because we want this to be an open engagement, in which people can come forward with their ideas. I am prepared to listen to ideas from wherever they come because the future of the Welsh economy is far too important to think that all wisdom comes from one source.

**Chris Franks:** We all know that you have battled to save these jobs, Deputy First Minister, and engaged with senior Bosch management and the trade unions. Your officials and you have worked hard to retain these jobs, but the crucial fact is that Bosch has made up its mind to leave Wales, but some Members cannot acknowledge that. Bosch has decided to pull the plug. What discussions have you had with interested parties to ensure that some jobs are saved? Is the Welsh Government able to offer any assistance to Bosch, or are there alternative employment prospects for this site, which is at a prime location on the M4?

yn hynod o dda, er ein bod mewn dirwasgiad. Nid yw'n wir dweud y byddwn yn colli ein holl gynhyrchu nac y byddwn yn denu rhagor o fusnes gan fod y sector yn gryf yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni fynd allan i'r farchnad yn gyson a cheisio denu buddsoddiad i Gymru.

Yr ydych yn gywir, wrth edrych tua'r dyfodol ac ar gynhyrchu mathau newydd o geir, boed yn geir trydanol neu'n geir sydd ag allyriadau is, fod angen inni fod yn rhan o bethau yng nghyd-destun y gwaith dylunio yn ogystal â gweithgynhyrchu. Os yw'r dirwasgiad yn dysgu un wers inni, mae'n rhaid inni ddringo'r gadwyn gyflenwi a'r gadwyn gwerth, ac mae rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yn edrych ar hynny ar hyn o bryd. Yn y sefyllfa economaidd anodd hon, yr ydym yn sylweddoli na fydd nifer o gwmnïau a fyddai wedi buddsoddi ac ailfuddsoddi yng Nghymru yn draddodiadol yn gwneud hynny yn y dyfodol. Dyna pam mae rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yn edrych ar sut y bydd yn rhaid teilwra a darparu cymorth gan y Llywodraeth yn y dyfodol mewn ffordd wahanol. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed bod y gwrthbleidiau yn barod i gydweithio â ni wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â hynny, oherwydd yr ydym am gael trafodaeth agored, lle y gall pobl ddod ymlaen a chynnig syniadau. Yr wyf yn barod i wrando ar syniadau gan bawb, oherwydd y mae dyfodol economi Cymru yn rhy bwysig o lawer i gredu y bydd y syniadau gorau i gyd yn dod o un ffynhonnell.

**Chris Franks:** Gwyddom oll eich bod wedi brwydro i achub y swyddi hyn, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac wedi cael trafodaethau gydag uwch-reolwyr Bosch a'r undebau llafur. Yr ydych chi a'ch swyddogion wedi gweithio'n galed i gadw'r swyddi hyn, ond y gwir amdani yw bod Bosch wedi penderfynu gadael Cymru, ac ni all rhai Aelodau gydnabod hynny. Mae Bosch wedi penderfynu rhoi diwedd ar bethau. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal gyda rhai sydd â diddordeb i sicrhau bod rhai o'r swyddi'n cael eu hachub? A oes modd i Lywodraeth Cymru gynnig unrhyw fath o gymorth i Bosch, neu a oes rhagolygon eraill

ar gyfer gwaith ar y safle hwn, sydd mewn lleoliad da iawn ar yr M4?

Unlike previous recessions in the 1980s and 1990s, we now have an Assembly and a Welsh Government that will not throw our people on the scrapheap. Unfortunately, we do not have the fiscal powers at our disposal to encourage businesses to grow and to create more employment. What talks have you had with UK Ministers to ensure that they make manufacturing more of a priority? I am pleased to hear that you are continuing to make representations to senior Bosch management in Germany to determine whether there are any opportunities to attract investment to Miskin, and I look forward to hearing the results of those discussions. What talks have taken place to ensure that workers are offered a decent redundancy package? As you indicated last night at a meeting in the Cynon valley, no-one is in denial about the challenges that we face. When will you be able to make a statement on the economic renewal programme that you mentioned earlier?

**The Deputy First Minister:** You are absolutely right about the decision that the company made. When we had the meeting with Bosch senior management last year we made it clear that we stood ready to offer whatever support, financial or otherwise, the Government could give to the company in order to retain the jobs at Bosch and have the new alternator produced there. We also made it clear to them that not only did we want to retain manufacturing capacity there, but also the research and development capacity to develop new products. We felt that, given the investment needs of the sector, it was important that we would be part of the development of new products. Sadly, Bosch senior management were not prepared to take up the offer that we made, which was a very firm offer, at that meeting. I know that they took it away and thought about it, but eventually they rejected it. That is sad and disappointing.

Yn wahanol i ddirwasgiadau blaenorol yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au, mae gennym bellach Gynulliad a Llywodraeth yng Nghymru na fyddant yn taflu ein pobl ar y domen sbwriel. Yn anffodus, nid oes gennym y pwerau ariannol i annog busnesau i dyfu ac i greu rhagor o swyddi. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig i sicrhau eu bod yn rhoi mwy o flaenoriaeth i weithgynhyrchu? Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn dal i drafod gydag uwch-reolwyr Bosch yn yr Almaen er mwyn canfod a oes cyfleoedd i ddenu buddsoddiad i Feisgyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed canlyniadau'r trafodaethau hynny. Pa drafodaethau sydd wedi'u cynnal i sicrhau bod y gweithwyr yn cael pecynnau diswyddo derbyniol? Fel y dywedasoch neithiwr mewn cyfarfod yng Nghwm Cynon, nid oes neb yn gwadu'r heriau sy'n ein hwynebu. Pryd y byddwch yn gallu gwneud datganiad am raglen adnewyddu'r economi, sef y rhaglen y soniasoch amdani'n gynharach?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynglŷn â'r penderfyniad a wnaeth y cwmni. Pan gawsom y cyfarfod gydag uwch-reolwyr Bosch y llynedd, fe'i gwnaethom yn glir ein bod yn barod i gynnig unrhyw gymorth, boed yn ariannol neu fel arall, y gallai'r Llywodraeth ei roi i'r cwmni er mwyn cadw'r swyddi yn Bosch a chynhyrchu'r eiliadur newydd yno. Fe'i gwnaethom yn glir hefyd, yn ogystal â chadw'r gallu i weithgynhyrchu yno, ein bod yn awyddus i gadw'r gwaith ymchwil a datblygu yno er mwyn datblygu cynhyrchion newydd. O ystyried anghenion buddsoddi'r sector, teimlem ei bod yn bwysig inni fod yn rhan o ddatblygu cynhyrchion newydd. Gwaetha'r modd, yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, nid oedd uwch-reolwyr Bosch yn barod i dderbyn ein cynnig, er bod hwnnw'n gynnig pendant iawn. Gwn iddynt fynd ymaith a chnoi cil ar y cynnig, ond yn y pen draw, ei wrthod a wnaethant. Mae hynny'n destun tristwch a siom.

We have had a number of discussions with the UK Government in relation to the economic situation. The Secretary of State comes to the economic summits, as do civil servants from the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills. We have had a number of discussions with the Secretary of State because we are anxious that Welsh businesses should be able to access UK-level support, whether they are in manufacturing or other sectors. There will be a meeting later this week with the trade unions representing the workforce at Bosch, and I understand from the discussions already held that they are primarily concerned with ensuring that decent redundancy packages are available to the workforce. Our prime responsibility, as I am sure that you are aware, is to ensure that all the services that we can provide—through ReAct and Careers Wales, linking in to Jobcentre Plus—are available to the workforce so that they can maximise the opportunities for new employment and training.

**The Presiding Officer:** Six further Members have indicated that they would like to ask questions on this very important statement, and I will extend the time to accommodate you all, but I would request brevity if possible. That is not directed particularly at Andrew R.T. Davies.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. I also thank the Deputy First Minister for his statement. I can remember the plant site before it was an industrial complex, when it was agricultural land. One can sympathise with the workers at the site, because it is such a modern plant, with excellent communications, and although there has been uncertainty in recent years as to what kind of product would be made there, it was to be hoped that the design of the plant and its location would swing the argument, and some form of investment would come from the parent company in Germany.

Yr ydym wedi cael nifer o drafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa economaidd. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn dod i'r uwchgynadleddau economaidd, a gweision sifil o'r Adran Busnes, Arloesedd a Sgiliau. Yr ydym wedi cael nifer o drafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol oherwydd yr ydym yn awyddus i sicrhau bod modd i fusnesau o Gymru gael y cymorth ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig, boed yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu neu mewn sectorau eraill. Cynhelir cyfarfod yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon gyda'r undebau llafur sy'n cynrychioli gweithlu Bosch, ac ar sail y trafodaethau sydd eisoes wedi'u cynnal, deallaf eu bod yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar sicrhau bod pecynnau diswyddo derbynol ar gael i'r gweithlu. Ein prif gyfrifoldeb ni, fel y gwyddoch, mae'n siŵr, yw sicrhau bod yr holl wasanaethau y gallwn eu darparu—drwy'r rhaglen ReAct a Gyrfa Cymru, ar y cyd â Canolfan Byd Gwaith—ar gael i'r gweithlu er mwyn iddynt allu manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd i gael swyddi newydd a hyfforddiant.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae chwe Aelod arall wedi nodi eu bod yn awyddus i ofyn cwestiynau am y datganiad hynod bwysig hwn, a byddaf yn estyn yr amser sydd ar gael er mwyn rhoi cyfle ichi i gyd, ond gofynnaf ichi fod yn gryno, os oes modd. Nid at Andrew R.T. Davies yn benodol yr wyf yn cyfeirio hynny.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch, Lywydd, Diolch hefyd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ei ddatganiad. Gallaf gofio safle'r gwaith hwn cyn iddo ddod yn safle diwydiannol, pan oedd yn dir amaethyddol. Gellir cydymdeimlo â gweithwyr y safle, oherwydd y mae'n waith mor fodern a chanddo seilwaith cyfathrebu gwych, ac er bod ansicrwydd wedi bod yn y blynyddoedd diweddar ynghylch pa fath o gynnyrch a fyddai'n cael ei wneud yno, gobeithid y byddai natur y safle a'i leoliad yn troi'r fantol o'i blaid, ac y byddai'r rhiant-gwmni yn yr Almaen yn gwneud rhyw fath o fuddsoddiad.

3.20 p.m.



It is a matter of deep regret that such a modern facility now has such a dark cloud hanging over it, and that the workers and their families have that dark cloud hanging over their futures. The area in which the factory sits has suffered enormous redundancies over the last few years: at L'Oréal, at Serious Food Ltd—or Sunjuice, which it traded as—and at Staedtler, the stationery company. As a result of the gradual restructuring of the Bosch enterprise, that, ultimately, led to the sad news of that factory's closure. Looking to the future, what impact has the Welsh Assembly Government had with regard to the companies that I have just mentioned in the context of supporting new employment opportunities? Does the Minister have figures today that can offer hope to the workers and their families that the measures that have been talked of at the weekend by the Welsh Assembly Government, and which will be discussed at the meeting tomorrow with the First Minister, have some substance and will benefit the workers and help them to find new, quality jobs? Conversely, from the previous experience in the area, is there, sadly, no rosy picture to be painted? I hope that you will be able to paint a very rosy picture.

I take issue with your saying that the manufacturing strategy would not have saved these jobs. On Friday, the plant manager and the division director commented that a consideration that they faced when looking at the product lines at the Bosch plant in Miskin related to consolidation of other operators in the area, as well as cost—I accept that costs in Hungary are 65 per cent of those in the UK. It is critical that the Minister acknowledge that we need the manufacturing strategy, which can be a tool to consolidate future development and opportunities in order to make sure that people have confidence that they are not standing alone and that there are other identifiable companies when the overseas arm of the Welsh Assembly Government is working to bring in inward investment. Inward investment, as well as creating natural,

Mae'n destun gofid mawr fod cwmwl mor ddu bellach dros gyfleuster mor fodern, a bod y cwmwl du hwnnw dros ddyfodol y gweithwyr a'u teuluoedd hefyd. Mae ardal y ffatri wedi gweld diswyddiadau di-rif yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf: yn L'Oréal, yn Serious Food Ltd—neu Sunjuice, o roi ei enw masnachu—ac yn Staedtler, y cwmni deunydd ysgrifennu. Mae'r broses raddol o ailstrwythuro cwmni Bosch yn y pen draw wedi arwain at y newydd trist y bydd y ffatri'n cau. Ac edrych tua'r dyfodol, pa effaith y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i chael ar y cwmnïau a grybwyllais, yng nghyd-destun cynorthwyo i greu cyfleoedd newydd i gael swyddi? A oes gan y Gweinidog ffigurau heddiw sy'n gallu rhoi gobaith i'r gweithwyr a'u teuluoedd fod unrhyw sylwedd i'r camau a grybwyllwyd dros y penwythnos gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac a drafodir yn y cyfarfod yfory gyda'r Prif Weinidog? A fydd y camau hyn o fudd i'r gweithwyr ac yn gymorth iddynt ddod o hyd i swyddi newydd o safon? Ynteu, gan gofio profiad yr ardal yn y gorffennol, ai'r gwir trist yw nad oes darlun gobeithiol? Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd modd ichi gynnig darlun gobeithiol iawn.

Yr wyf yn anghytuno â'ch honiad na fyddai'r strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu wedi achub y swyddi hyn. Ddydd Gwener, dywedodd rheolwr y gwaith a chyfarwyddwr y rhanbarth mai rhywbeth yr oeddent yn ei ystyried wrth edrych ar yr hyn a gynhyrchid yn ffatri Bosch ym Meisgyn oedd cyfuno gweithredwyr eraill yn yr ardal, ynghyd â'r costau—ac yr wyf yn cydnabod mai 65 y cant o'r costau yn y Deyrnas Unedig yw'r costau yn Hwngari. Mae'n hanfodol i'r Gweinidog gydnabod bod angen y strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu arnom. Gall y strategaeth honno fod yn fodd o atgyfnerthu datblygiadau a chyfleoedd yn y dyfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn hyderus nad ydynt ar eu pennau eu hunain a bod cwmnïau amlwg eraill o'u hamgylch pan yw cangen dramor Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio i ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad. Mae

organic growth, is critical to the prosperity of Wales and to rebalancing our economy.

Finally, what work has been undertaken with regard to companies that, over the last few years, have relocated jobs overseas, but are still supplying the British market? In a conversation that I had the other day I was led to believe that there is some work to be done on this, as many companies have not found relocation to be a panacea, given the quality of workmanship and supply problems. Does the Welsh Assembly Government have the data to rebuff the arguments that might be put to it on wage structure, if nothing else, with regard to relocating jobs abroad? Over the next five to 10 years, a robust and dynamic approach will be needed from the Welsh Assembly Government so that we do not lose out to eastern Europe and other low-wage economies, because, ultimately, rebalancing the Welsh economy is critical if our communities are to have a real future.

**The Deputy First Minister:** Your first point was about the site itself, and that it is an important, strategic location, which is very suitable for manufacturing. Chris Franks raised that point as well, and I omitted to respond to him on that point. We have held initial discussions with Bosch about the future of the site, which is owned by it. We may have to discuss making the site part of a master plan to ensure that it is retained for manufacturing. We will need to continue those discussions. It is always difficult when the site is owned by a third party, as is the case with the site that Bosch occupied. Clearly, we will want to address that with Bosch, and that will be a point of discussion with the company going forward, if the board confirms this decision.

Looking to the future, on new employment,

mewnffuddsoddiad, ynghyd â chreu twf naturiol ac organig, yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau bod Cymru'n ffynnu ac er mwyn sicrhau cydbwysedd newydd yn yr economi.

Yn olaf, pa waith sydd wedi'i wneud yng nghyd-destun y cwmnïau sydd wedi ail-leoli swyddi dramor dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ond sy'n dal i gyflenwi'r farchnad ym Mhrydain? Mewn sgwrs a gefais rai diwrnodau'n ôl, cefais ar ddeall fod rhywfaint o waith i'w wneud o hyd yn hyn o beth, gan nad yw ail-leoli wedi ateb holl broblemau llawer o gwmnïau, yn sgîl ansawdd sgiliau'r gweithwyr a phroblemau o ran cyflenwi. A oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddata i wrthbrofi'r dadleuon posibl ynghylch strwythur cyflogau, yn anad dim arall, o ran ail-leoli swyddi dramor? Yn ystod y pum i 10 mlynedd nesaf, bydd angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio mewn ffordd gadarn a dynamig fel nad ydym ar ein colled i economïau dwyrain Ewrop ac economïau eraill lle y mae cyflogau'n isel, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, mae'n hanfodol sicrhau cydbwysedd newydd yn economi Cymru er mwyn rhoi gwir ddyfodol i'n cymunedau.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr oedd a wnelo'ch pwynt cyntaf â'r safle ei hun, a'r ffaith ei fod yn lleoliad pwysig, strategol, sy'n addas iawn ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu. Gwnaeth Chris Franks y pwynt hwnnw hefyd, ac nid ymatebais iddo. Yr ydym wedi cynnal trafodaethau cychwynnol gyda Bosch ynghylch dyfodol y safle, y mae'n berchen arno. Efallai y bydd yn rhaid inni drafod gwneud y safle'n rhan o uwchgyllun i sicrhau ei fod yn dal i gael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu. Bydd angen inni barhau â'r trafodaethau hynny. Mae bob tro'n anodd pan fydd trydydd parti'n berchen ar y safle, fel yn achos y safle yr oedd Bosch yn ei ddefnyddio. Yn amlwg, byddwn yn awyddus i roi sylw i hynny gyda Bosch, a bydd hynny'n destun trafodaeth gyda'r cwmni wrth inni symud ymlaen, os bydd y bwrdd yn cadarnhau'r penderfyniad hwn.

Gan edrych tua'r dyfodol, ac at swyddi

my understanding is that a number of employers have already been looking at utilising the skills that are available among the Bosch workforce, which is a good indication of the value that many people are placing on those skills. I understand the point that you make about the need for us to assist the workforce as much as possible to secure new jobs and to create new opportunities. However, I still reject the argument that a manufacturing strategy would have saved the Bosch plant; that is simply not the case, and flies in the face of the company's decision. It has never said to us that it has decided not to invest because the Welsh Assembly Government does not have a manufacturing strategy; it says that it can produce the product cheaper in Hungary. That is the reason that it has given and we should all accept that. You have indicated the importance of inward investment and, of course, that is important, but I must also bear in mind Jenny Randerson's point about building indigenous companies and capacity within the Welsh economy. The economic renewal programme will look to strike that balance; we need to look at what the balance should be between improving the performance of indigenous companies, commercialising many of the ideas that we have available in Wales, and giving assistance to them to develop, and ensuring that we have an inward investment strategy that continues to bring companies to Wales. Having the right mix is important.

Let me re-emphasise the work that is currently being undertaken: it is a massive piece of work that is ground breaking in many ways in looking at the direction of the economic renewal programme. We are going back to the drawing board with regard to all of the support measures and interventions that the Welsh Government needs to give to businesses going forward. I agree that this work needs to be robust and dynamic. Andrew, if you have ideas as to how robust and dynamic it should be, I am prepared to listen to them, if you are happy to share those with me.

newydd, deallaf fod nifer o gyflogwyr eisoes wedi bod yn edrych ar fanteisio ar sgiliau gweithlu Bosch, ac mae hynny'n arwydd da bod y sgiliau hynny'n cael eu gwerthfawrogi. Deallaf y pwynt a wnewch ynglŷn â bod angen inni gynorthwyo'r gweithlu gymaint â phosibl er mwyn sicrhau swyddi newydd a chreu cyfleoedd newydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dal i wrthod y ddadl y byddai strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu wedi achub ffatri Bosch; nid yw hynny'n wir, ac nid dyna'r rheswm dros benderfyniad y cwmni. Nid yw'r cwmni wedi dweud wrthym o gwbl ei fod wedi penderfynu peidio â buddsoddi am nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu; mae'n dweud y gall greu'r cynnyrch yn rhatach yn Hwngari. Dyna'r rheswm y mae wedi'i roi a dylem oll dderbyn hynny. Yr ydych wedi dweud mor bwysig yw denu mewnfuddsoddiad, ac mae hynny'n bwysig, wrth gwrs, ond hefyd mae'n rhaid imi ystyried pwynt Jenny Randerson ynghylch creu cwmnïau cynhenid a chapasiti o fewn economi Cymru. Bydd rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yn ceisio sicrhau'r cydbwysedd hwnnw; mae angen inni edrych ar y cydbwysedd y dylid ceisio'i greu rhwng gwella perfformiad cwmnïau cynhenid, gwneud nifer o'r syniadau sydd gennym yng Nghymru'n rhai mwy masnachol, a'u cynorthwyo i ddatblygu, a sicrhau bod gennym strategaeth ar gyfer mewnfuddsoddi sy'n parhau i ddenu cwmnïau i Gymru. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r cyfuniad cywir.

Gadewch imi ailbwysleisio'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd: mae'n waith sylweddol iawn ac yn arloesol mewn sawl ffordd wrth edrych ar gyfeiriad rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi. Yr ydym yn gorfod ailfeddwl ynghylch yr holl gamau y mae angen i Lywodraeth Cymru eu cymryd er mwyn rhoi cymorth i fusnesau ac ymyrryd wrth inni symud ymlaen. Cytunaf fod yn rhaid i'r gwaith hwn fod yn gadarn ac yn ddynamig. Andrew, os oes gennych syniadau ynghylch pa mor gadarn a dynamig y dylai'r gwaith hwnnw fod, byddaf yn barod i wrando arnynt, os ydych yn fodlon eu rhannu â mi.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for your statement. I wanted to say a few words to represent many of my constituents who work there and, in particular, my colleague, Jane Hutt, in whose constituency the plant is. She has many constituents who work there, as do many of the other Ministers. This affects an awful lot of people. I wanted to take this opportunity to pay tribute to the workforce on their behalf, as well as on mine, and to ask what training schemes might be available for the workforce. I would like your reassurance that all the support that can be given will be provided to those workers, to find either new employment or training opportunities.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I am pleased that you have paid tribute to the workforce, because that is crucial. Bosch, even on the sad day of the announcement, emphasised the tremendous skills of the workforce at the plant. When we had our initial meeting with the company last year, with the then First Minister, Jane also attended that meeting and emphasised her interest from a constituency point of view. It is important for us to recognise that all constituency and regional Members who have constituents who work at Bosch will be concerned about the future of the site. I pay tribute to the work that everyone has done to try to save the plant and I sympathise with the workforce. I repeat that we will do everything that we can to assist the workers to find new opportunities. Through the ReAct programme, which is only available in Wales, there will be an opportunity for people, when they are taken on by new employers, to benefit substantially.

**Alun Cairns:** Your response and reaction to the Bosch job losses have been nothing but appalling. I cannot believe that you have not been to Germany to lobby on behalf of the workers and of Wales. Do you now regret that you have not been to Germany? In view of the fact that the Labour Party in Wales and half of the Welsh Assembly Government were tied up in a leadership bid in the last

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch am eich datganiad. Yr oeddwn yn awyddus i ddweud gair neu ddau i gynrychioli llawer o'm hetholwyr sy'n gweithio yno ac, yn benodol, i gynrychioli Jane Hutt, fy nghyd-Aelod, gan mai yn ei hetholaeth hi y mae'r ffatri. Mae ganddi lawer o etholwyr sy'n gweithio yno, fel sydd gan lawer o'r Gweinidogion eraill hefyd. Mae hyn yn effeithio ar nifer fawr iawn o bobl. Yr oeddwn am achub y cyfle hwn i roi teyrnged i'r gweithlu ar eu rhan, yn ogystal â rhoi fy nheyrnged fy hun, ac i ofyn pa gynlluniau hyfforddi a allai fod ar gael i'r gweithlu. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gennych y byddwch yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i'r gweithwyr hyn, naill i ganfod swyddi newydd neu i gael cyfleoedd i hyfforddi.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi rhoi teyrnged i'r gweithlu, oherwydd y mae hynny'n hanfodol. Hyd yn oed ar ddiwrnod trist y cyhoeddiad, pwysleisiodd Bosch sgiliau aruthrol gweithlu'r ffatri. Pan gawsom ein cyfarfod cychwynnol gyda'r cwmni y llynedd, gyda'r Prif Weinidog ar y pryd, yr oedd Jane hefyd yn bresennol a phwysleisiodd fod y mater yn bwysig iddi o safbwynt etholaethol. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod y bydd yr holl Aelodau etholaeth a'r Aelodau rhanbarthol a chanddynt etholwyr yn gweithio yn Bosch yn pryderu am ddyfodol y safle. Yr wyf am roi teyrnged i'r gwaith y mae pawb wedi'i wneud i geisio achub y ffatri ac yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â'r gweithlu. Ailadroddaf y gwnawn bopeth a allwn i gynorthwyo'r gweithwyr i ddod o hyd i gyfleoedd newydd. Drwy'r rhaglen ReAct, sy'n rhaglen i Gymru yn unig, bydd cyfle i bobl elwa'n sylweddol pan gânt eu cyflogi gan gyflogwyr newydd.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae eich ymateb i'r swyddi sydd wedi'u colli yn Bosch wedi bod yn echrydus a dweud y lleiaf. Ni allaf gredu nad ydych wedi bod yn yr Almaen i lobbïo ar ran y gweithwyr ac ar ran Cymru. A ydych yn difaru erbyn hyn nad ydych wedi bod yn yr Almaen? Gan gofio bod y Blaid Lafur yng Nghymru a hanner Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi bod yn rhan o ymgyrch

quarter, the leadership was down to you and you should have shown it in this area. You should have gone to Germany and you should have been lobbying at the highest level.

David Melding asked you at what levels discussions took place and your answer to him was ‘all levels’. You went on to say that you received regular updates from your officials. Will you give us a list and a breakdown of all of the negotiations and discussions that took place during the three-month consultation period as well as during the six months leading up to that, because there were some early warnings long before that three-month period? At what levels, specifically within Bosch, did you and your officials have discussions? It would be helpful to know which discussions in particular you were personally involved with, rather than just your so-called ‘regular updates’.

3.30 p.m.

The narrowing of the product lines to one alternator has taken place over a considerable period of time. Do you not accept that an effective manufacturing strategy, which we are still waiting for, would have identified the risk associated with this and would have put you in a position to encourage the company to diversify its product base so that we would not be—and the Bosch workforce would not have been—exposed as a result of that risk?

Furthermore, how many people in that area who have lost their jobs have found jobs from the Assembly Government-sponsored schemes that Andrew Davies listed earlier? What percentage and what numbers have found jobs?

Finally, Minister, will you completely dissociate yourself from the comments made by Rhodri Morgan, when he said that we take some sort of joy from people losing their jobs? Nothing could be further from the truth. It is plain wrong and outrageous for a former First Minister to come out with such a

arweinyddiaeth yn y chwarter diwethaf, chi oedd yn arwain a dylech fod wedi dangos arweiniad yn y maes hwn. Dylech fod wedi mynd i'r Almaen a lobïo ar y lefel uchaf.

Gofynnodd David Melding i chi ar ba lefel y cynhaliwyd trafodaethau a'ch ateb iddo oedd ‘ar bob lefel’. Aethoch yn eich blaen i ddweud eich bod wedi cael diweddariadau rheolaidd gan eich swyddogion. A wnewch roi rhestr inni a manylion ynghylch yr holl negodi a'r trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori o dri mis, yn ogystal ag yn ystod y chwe mis cyn hynny, gan fod rhai rhybuddion cynnar ymhell cyn y cyfnod hwnnw o dri mis? Ar ba lefel, yn benodol o fewn Bosch, y cawsoch chi a'ch swyddogion drafodaethau? Byddai'n dda cael gwybod pa drafodaethau'n benodol y buoch yn rhan ohonynt yn bersonol, yn hytrach na dim ond eich ‘diweddariadau rheolaidd’ bondigrybwyll.

Mae'r broses o gyfyngu'r llinellau cynhyrchu i un eiliadur wedi digwydd dros gyfnod hir. Onid ydych yn derbyn y byddai strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu effeithiol, yr ydym yn dal i aros amdani, wedi canfod y perygl a oedd ynghlwm wrth hyn ac wedi'ch rhoi mewn sefyllfa i annog y cwmni i gynhyrchu mwy o amrywiaeth o nwyddau fel na fyddem ni na gweithlu Bosch wedi bod yn agored i'r perygl hwnnw?

At hynny, faint o bobl yn yr ardal sydd wedi colli eu swyddi sydd wedi dod o hyd i swyddi drwy'r cynlluniau sy'n cael eu hariannu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac a restrwyd gan Andrew Davies yn gynharach? Pa ganran ohonynt a faint ohonynt sydd wedi dod o hyd i swyddi?

Yn olaf, Weinidog, a wnewch eich datgysylltu'ch hun yn llwyr oddi wrth sylwadau Rhodri Morgan pan ddywedodd ein bod yn cael rhyw fath o fwynhad wrth weld pobl yn colli eu swyddi? Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Mae'n gwbl anghywir ac yn warthus bod cyn Brif Weinidog wedi gwneud

disgusting statement.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I deeply regret the politicisation of this issue by Alun Cairns. At least David Melding kept within the bounds of responsibility while making his comments. However, yet again, Alun Cairns is making outrageous politicised statements that do no good for the workers of Bosch. What would the Conservatives have done in similar circumstances?

Over the last few months, the Welsh Assembly Government has been fully engaged at all levels in making sure that we did everything possible to save these jobs at Bosch. The red herring that was introduced about events within the Labour Party is totally irrelevant. The former First Minister and I were fully engaged in work to try to prevent Bosch from making this decision. It is therefore ludicrous to suggest that those events had any impact whatsoever on the decision.

Once again, I reject the argument that a manufacturing strategy would have had any impact whatsoever on the decision by Bosch. What I would have hoped to hear from Alun Cairns today is recognition of the harsh economic reality that led to this decision and an offer by him, as well as Andrew Davies, to suggest ways forward for the Welsh economy. He has not offered, in any statement that I have heard from him, any positive suggestions on the way forward. It is all negative from Alun Cairns.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Deputy First Minister, I thank you for your statement today. I know that I speak for everyone here when I say how disappointed we are at Bosch's decision to close its plant near Llantrisant. Indeed, a number of my constituents face losing their jobs.

We know from earlier statements that Bosch's management in Germany is on record as saying that this is one of the most

datganiad mor wrthun.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n flin iawn gennyf fod Alun Cairns yn troi'r mater hwn yn un gwleidyddol. Cadwodd David Melding o fewn ffiniau bod yn gyfrifol, o leiaf, wrth wneud ei sylwadau. Fodd bynnag, unwaith eto, mae Alun Cairns yn gwneud datganiadau gwleidyddol gwarthus nad ydynt o ddim lles i weithwyr Bosch. Beth fyddai'r Ceidwadwyr wedi'i wneud o dan amgylchiadau tebyg?

Dros y misoedd diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn gweithio ar bob lefel er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth posibl i achub y swyddi hyn yn Bosch. Codi sgwarnog sy'n gwbl amherthnasol yw sôn am y digwyddiadau o fewn y Blaid Lafur. Gwnaeth y cyn Brif Weinidog a minnau bopeth a allem i geisio atal Bosch rhag gwneud y penderfyniad hwn. Felly, mae'n hurt awgrymu bod y digwyddiadau hynny wedi cael unrhyw fath o effaith ar y penderfyniad.

Unwaith eto, yr wyf yn gwrthod y ddadl y byddai strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu wedi cael unrhyw fath o ddylanwad ar benderfyniad Bosch. Byddwn wedi gobeithio clywed Alun Cairns heddiw yn cydnabod y realiti economaidd anodd sydd wedi arwain at y penderfyniad hwn a byddwn wedi disgwyl iddo yntau, yn ogystal ag Andrew Davies, awgrymu sut y gallwn symud economi Cymru yn ei blaen. Nid yw wedi cynnig dim awgrymiadau cadarnhaol ar gyfer symud ymlaen mewn dim un datganiad a glywais ganddo. Mae popeth a ddaw gan Alun Cairns yn negyddol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, diolch ichi am eich datganiad heddiw. Gwn fy mod yn siarad dros bawb yma wrth ddweud mor siomedig yr ydym gyda phenderfyniad Bosch i gau ei ffatri ger Llantrisant. Yn wir, mae nifer o'm hetholwyr i yn wynebu colli eu swyddi.

Gwyddom yn sgîl datganiadau blaenorol fod rheolwyr Bosch yn yr Almaen wedi dweud ar goedd mai dyma un o'r penderfyniadau

difficult decisions it has ever had to make. However, the fact that it is moving all of its operations to Hungary from Wales shows that the company believes that the market will improve in the not-too-distant future. However, it is deeply regrettable that it does not see this future in Wales. There may be scope for discussions within the EU on protocols and understanding—as the discussions within Hungary have gone on for a considerable period of time—to see what ways and means can be adopted with regard to relations between different member states within the EU to try to prevent, or at least minimise the risk that this type of transfer will happen in the future.

I agree that the Welsh Assembly Government has been working closely with Bosch over the last few months to look at all of the options available. I welcome your assurance that it will provide all of the assistance it can to the employees of the company. I welcome your statements on ReAct and I am extremely thankful—as I hope everyone else in the Chamber is—that we have the ReAct programme in operation as it will provide some assistance to those facing redundancy. No-one claims that it is the solution to the problems, but it is a step in the right direction. It ought to be appreciated that we in Wales have that programme in place because it has been an effective tool in helping us to deal with the worst effects of the recession. We will not just stand by and let the workers of Bosch down. It is good to hear you say that other companies are now looking at the skills held by the Bosch employees.

Speaking in my capacity as co-ordinator of the Unite group of AMs, will you assure us that Unite and other trade unions based at the plants are and will be fully involved in discussions that affect the future of the employees? Does Bosch have an exit policy, to ensure that its employees are not left out in the cold? Also, does the Welsh Assembly

anoddaf iddo orfod ei wneud erioed. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith ei fod yn symud ei holl waith i Hwngari o Gymru yn dangos bod y cwmni'n credu y bydd y farchnad yn gwella yn y dyfodol pur agos. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hynod o siomedig nad yw'n gweld dyfodol iddo yng Nghymru. Efallai y bydd modd cael trafodaethau o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar brotocolau a dealltwriaeth—gan fod y trafodaethau yn Hwngari wedi bod yn mynd rhagddynt ers cryn amser—er mwyn gweld pa ddulliau y gellir eu mabwysiadu yng nghyd-destun y berthynas rhwng gwahanol aelod-wladwriaethau o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a cheisio rhwystro hyn rhag digwydd yn y dyfodol, neu o leiaf er mwyn sicrhau bod llai o berygl i'r math hwn o drosglwyddo ddigwydd yn y dyfodol.

Cytunaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn gweithio'n glòs gyda Bosch dros y misoedd diwethaf er mwyn edrych ar yr holl opsiynau a oedd ar gael. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r sicrwydd gennych y bydd y Llywodraeth yn rhoi pob cymorth posibl i weithwyr y cwmni. Yr wyf yn croesawu eich sylwadau am ReAct ac yr wyf yn hynod o ddiolchgar—fel y mae pawb arall yn y Siambr, gobeithio—fod y rhaglen ReAct gennym gan y bydd yn rhoi rhywfaint o gymorth i'r rhai sy'n wynebu cael eu diswyddo. Nid oes neb yn honni ei bod yn datrys y problemau i gyd, ond mae'n gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Dylid gwerthfawrogi bod gennym y rhaglen honno yng Nghymru, gan ei bod wedi bod yn ddull effeithiol o'n cynorthwyo i ymdopi ag effeithiau gwaethaf y dirwasgiad. Ni fyddwn yn sefyll o'r neilltu ac yn troi'n cefn ar weithwyr Bosch. Da yw eich clywed yn dweud bod cwmnïau eraill bellach yn edrych ar y sgiliau sydd gan weithwyr Bosch.

A minnau'n gydlynnydd grŵp Unite Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a wnewch roi sicrwydd inni fod Unite a'r undebau llafur eraill yn y ffatrioedd yn cael cyfrannu'n llawn at y trafodaethau sy'n effeithio ar ddyfodol y gweithwyr, ac y byddant yn parhau i gael cyfrannu yn y fath fodd? A oes gan Bosch bolisi ymadael, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw ei

Government have a say in what happens to the site? You have already mentioned the fact that the site is in Bosch's ownership, but we should not forget that, over many years, Bosch has claimed substantial amounts of public money, from the Government and the Vale of Glamorgan County Borough Council. I trust that this fact will be borne in mind.

**The Deputy First Minister:** On the issue of jobs moving from one member state to another, my understanding is that state aid legislation does not preclude such movement of jobs. The question remains, however, if public support is given to a particular company to move it from one member state to another, we would need to look at that. Let us remember that we are also in the market, looking for job opportunities from other countries. We therefore need to be sensitive to some of these decisions, although I understand the sentiments that were expressed in your question.

I am pleased that you referred to the benefits of the ReAct scheme. Over recent months, the ReAct scheme has kept a number of other people from being unemployed. One of the difficulties in a recession is that the levels of economic inactivity might well increase. As people become unemployed, companies tend to employ those who are recently unemployed rather than those who have been economically inactive. If we can get the ReAct programme working effectively, it will be of tremendous assistance.

You indicated the importance of skills, and you are absolutely right. I understand that there is considerable interest from a number of companies that are looking to utilise the skills that the Bosch workforce has. You can be assured that the trade unions will be engaged, as far as we as a Government are concerned, in the negotiations.

We discussed its exit policy with Bosch and

weithwyr yn cael eu hanghofio? Hefyd, a oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad lais yn yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd i'r safle? Yr ydych eisoes wedi crybwyll y ffaith mai Bosch sy'n berchen ar y safle, ond ni ddylem anghofio bod Bosch, dros nifer o flynyddoedd, wedi hawlio symiau sylweddol o arian cyhoeddus, gan y Llywodraeth a chan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Bro Morgannwg. Hyderaf y cofir hyn.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** O ran symud swyddi o'r naill aelod-wladwriaeth i'r llall, deallaf nad yw deddfwriaeth cymorth gwladwriaethol yn atal symud swyddi yn y fath fodd. Fodd bynnag, pan roddir cymorth cyhoeddus i gwmni penodol symud o'r naill aelod-wladwriaeth i'r llall, mae hynny'n codi cwestiwn, a byddai angen inni edrych ar hynny. Gadewch inni gofio ein bod ninnau yn y farchnad hefyd, yn chwilio am gyfleoedd ar gyfer swyddi o wledydd eraill. Felly, mae angen inni fod yn sensitif ynghylch rhai o'r penderfyniadau hyn, er fy mod yn deall byrdwn eich cwestiwn.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cyfeirio at fanteision cynllun ReAct. Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, mae cynllun ReAct wedi cadw nifer o bobl eraill rhag colli eu swyddi. Un o'r anawsterau mewn dirwasgiad yw ei bod yn gwbl bosibl y bydd lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd yn cynyddu. Wrth i bobl gael eu gwneud yn ddi-waith, mae cwmnïau'n dueddol o gyflogi'r rhai sydd wedi'u gwneud yn ddi-waith yn ddiweddar, yn hytrach na'r rhai sydd wedi bod yn anweithgar yn economaidd. Os gallwn sicrhau bod rhaglen ReAct yn gweithio'n effeithiol, bydd yn gymorth aruthrol.

Cyfeiriasoch at bwysigrwydd sgiliau, ac yr ydych yn gwbl gywir. Deallaf fod nifer o gwmnïau sy'n awyddus i fanteisio ar sgiliau gweithlu Bosch wedi dangos cryn ddiddordeb. Gallwch fod yn dawl eich meddwl y bydd yr undebau llafur yn rhan o'r trafodaethau, o'n rhan ni fel Llywodraeth.

Yr ydym wedi trafod ei bolisi ymadael gyda



how it will deal with the workforce. It told us that it intends to be fully engaged in that regard and do whatever it can to assist the workforce. Sadly, I have had similar experiences to that of Bosch with a number of other companies, but Bosch gave a pretty firm assurance that it would be fully engaged in that.

We have had initial discussions with the company about the site and how it will be utilised. That is not an easy discussion at the moment because the site is not in our ownership. We have agreed to explore with Bosch, however, the way in which we can utilise that site for future manufacture and production.

**Trish Law:** Deputy First Minister, you referred in your statement to the Welsh supply chain. As you know from my e-mail to you last Friday, one of its links is in my constituency, namely ZF Steering Systems, which is located on the Rassau industrial estate. The e-mail expressed my concern, shared by Dai Davies MP, at the imminent closure of this company, which is part-owned by Bosch. Its closure, with the loss of 55 skilled jobs and a dedicated workforce, demonstrates that boardroom decisions by multinationals such as Bosch can have a significant knock-on effect on small Valleys communities such as Blaenau Gwent, which can ill afford further job losses. Despite the company's plans to announce the closure of this factory in a matter of weeks, I am aware that it has orders stretching until 2012. Anything that you can do to delay this closure until then would be greatly appreciated.

**The Deputy First Minister:** Thank you for that question, Trish. We will do everything that we can to assist there. Bosch told us that because there has been an upturn in demand for its particular product, it will look to see how it can manage the closure of the plant in

Bosch a sut y bydd yn trin y gweithlu. Dywedodd wrthym ei fod yn bwriadu cyfrannu'n llawn yn hynny o beth a gwneud popeth posibl i gynorthwyo'r gweithlu. Yn anffodus, yr wyf wedi cael profiadau tebyg gyda nifer o gwmnïau eraill, ond rhoddodd Bosch sicrwydd eithaf cadarn y bydd yn cyfrannu'n llawn at hynny.

Yr ydym wedi cael trafodaethau cychwynnol gyda'r cwmni am y safle a sut y caiff ei ddefnyddio. Nid yw'r trafodaethau hynny'n rhai hawdd ar hyn o bryd oherwydd nad ni piau'r safle. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wedi cytuno i drafod gyda Bosch sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r safle ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu a chynhyrchu yn y dyfodol.

**Trish Law:** Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, cyfeiriasoch yn eich datganiad at y gadwyn gyflenwi yng Nghymru. Fel y gwyddoch yn sgîl yr e-bost a anfonais atoch ddydd Gwener diwethaf, mae un rhan o'r gadwyn gyflenwi honno yn fy etholaeth i, sef cwmni ZF Steering Systems, sydd wedi'i leoli ar ystâd ddiwydiannol Rasa. Yr oedd yr e-bost yn mynegi fy mhryder, ac mae Dai Davies AS yntau'n poeni am hyn, ynghylch y ffaith bod y cwmni hwn, sy'n eiddo'n rhannol i Bosch, ar fin cau. Mae cau'r cwmni, gan arwain at golli 55 o swyddi crefftus a gweithlu ymroddedig, yn dangos y gall penderfyniadau mewn ystafelloedd bwrdd cwmnïau rhyngwladol fel Bosch gael effaith ganlyniadol sylweddol ar gymunedau bach yn y Cymoedd fel Blaenau Gwent, na allant fforddio colli rhagor o swyddi. Er gwaethaf bwriad y cwmni i gyhoeddi y bydd y ffatri hon yn cau ymhen ychydig o wythnosau, yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod ganddo archebion sy'n para tan 2012. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr unrhyw beth y gallwch ei wneud a fydd yn gohirio cau'r ffatri tan hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Diolch am y cwestiwn, Trish. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth a allwn i gynorthwyo yno. Gan fod cynnydd wedi bod yn y galw am y cynnyrch penodol hwn, dywedodd Bosch wrthym y bydd yn ceisio gweld sut y gall reoli'r broses o gau'r

Cardiff. The indications that it has given so far are that it expects full production at the plant will cease sometime in the middle of 2011. However, we will keep pushing the company to see if we can delay that.

ffatri yng Nghaerdydd. Yn ôl yr hyn y mae wedi'i awgrymu wrthym hyd yma, mae'n disgwyl y bydd cynhyrchu llawn yn y ffatri yn dod i ben rywbryd yng nghanol 2011. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn parhau i roi pwysau ar y cwmni i weld a allwn ohirio hynny.

3.40 p.m.

**Leanne Wood:** Thank you for your statement on these job losses, Deputy First Minister. There is no doubt that this news is a severe blow to people living in the communities around Llantrisant and the surrounding Valleys. In the Rhondda where I live, everyone knows someone that is connected with Bosch in one way or another. For far too many communities, this news is nothing short of a disaster. Will you confirm, again, that the Assembly Government has left no stone unturned in trying to persuade Bosch to continue production at the site? Will you also confirm that, regardless of what was offered to the company, the reality is that Bosch decided to close the plant and relocate to Hungary? How confident are you that everything possible was done to try to persuade the company to stay? What steps can be taken to ensure that the site is utilised in the future for green manufacturing?

**Leanne Wood:** Diolch am eich datganiad am y swyddi hyn sy'n cael eu colli, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r newydd hwn yn ergyd drom i'r bobl sy'n byw yn y cymunedau o amgylch Llantrisant a'r Cymoedd cyfagos. Yn y Rhondda lle yr wyf yn byw, mae pawb yn adnabod rhywun a chanddo gysylltiad â Bosch rywsut neu'i gilydd. I ormod o gymunedau o lawer, nid yw'r newydd hwn yn ddim llai na thrychineb. A wnewch gadarnhau, unwaith eto, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud popeth posibl i geisio perswadio Bosch i barhau i gynhyrchu ar y safle? A wnewch gadarnhau hefyd, waeth pa gymorth a gynigiwyd i'r cwmni, mai'r gwir amdani yw bod Bosch wedi penderfynu cau'r ffatri a'i hail-leoli yn Hwngari? Pa mor hyderus yr ydych fod popeth posibl wedi'i wneud i geisio perswadio'r cwmni i aros? Pa gamau y gellir eu cymryd i sicrhau y caiff y safle ei ddefnyddio yn y dyfodol ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu gwyrdd?

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.41 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.41 p.m.*

There is little that the Welsh Assembly Government can do about the downturn in the global automotive industry, and as many Members have said, this closure will create big ripples. Many people are reliant upon car-part firms which have supplied Bosch or other car-related manufacturers. The future of some of those firms now looks uncertain.

Nid oes llawer y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud am y dirywiad yn y diwydiant modurol byd-eang, ac fel y mae nifer o Aelodau wedi dweud, bydd goblygiadau eang i gau'r ffatri. Mae llawer o bobl yn dibynnu ar y cwmnïau cydrannau ceir sydd wedi cyflenwi Bosch neu weithgynhyrchwyr eraill yn y byd ceir. Mae dyfodol rhai o'r cwmnïau hynny bellach yn edrych yn ansicr.

Bosch was established at that site with millions of pounds from the Welsh Development Agency. It was part of the

Sefydlwyd Bosch ar y safle gyda miliynau o bunnau gan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Yr oedd yn rhan o strategaeth aflwyddiannus i

failed inward investment strategy which was designed to provide cash incentives for firms to set up in areas which had been decimated by the pit closures that were carried out by the last Conservative Government. The news confirms that a strategy which competed on the basis of low wages could never be a success. Therefore, can you give an assurance that everything will be done to ensure that jobs are available for all those affected by the Bosch decision? Furthermore, will you give an assurance that never again will firms be offered taxpayers' cash on the basis of cheap labour? After all, the firms will only up sticks as soon as the incentives run out and when labour becomes cheaper elsewhere.

**The Deputy First Minister:** The impact of the closure on families being extremely widespread, as you indicated, in that people in the Rhondda will know someone who works there and may have family members working there, is a point well made. When you have a site that employs 800 people full time, the impact is felt over a wide area. I confirm that we left no stone unturned to persuade the company to stay. We made a number of offers to the company about what we could do to help. We engaged at the highest level within Government, and following the announcement on 14 January, it appeared that the company had decided to close the plant and relocate on the grounds of cost. Again, we did everything possible to try to make the company reach another decision.

On the future use of the site, the green jobs strategy that we announced will be an opportunity for us to see what could be utilised on that site, among a range of other opportunities. You highlighted something that I highlighted in my response to this statement, namely the harsh reality that we cannot compete with a low-cost investment, which is based on low wages. Whether we like it or not, it will no longer be the cornerstone of the way in which we attract industry in the future because we cannot compete in certain areas. This is not a unique Welsh issue—it is also an issue for the whole

ddenu mewnfuddsoddiad gyda'r nod o roi arian i gymell cwmnïau i ymsefydlu mewn ardaloedd a anrheithiwyd yn sgîl cau'r pyllau glo gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol ddiwethaf. Mae'r newydd yn cadarnhau na allai strategaeth a oedd yn cystadlu ar sail cyflogau isel fyth lwyddo. Felly, a allwch roi sicrwydd y gwneir popeth i sicrhau bod swyddi ar gael i'r rhai y mae penderfyniad Bosch yn effeithio arnynt? At hynny, a wnewch roi sicrwydd na chynigir arian trethdalwyr byth eto i gwmnïau ar sail llafur rhad? Wedi'r cyfan, bydd y cwmnïau'n codi eu pac wedi i'r cymhellion ddod i ben a phan fydd llafur yn rhatach mewn mannau eraill.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Mae'n hollol wir y bydd goblygiadau cau'r ffatri i deuluoedd yn eang iawn, fel y dywedaso, gan y bydd pobl yn y Rhondda yn adnabod rhywun sy'n gweithio yno ac efallai fod ganddynt berthnasau sy'n gweithio yno. Pan fydd gennych safle sy'n cyflogi 800 o bobl yn llawnamser, bydd yr effaith i'w themlo dros ardal eang. Gallaf gadarnhau inni wneud popeth posibl i geisio dwyn perswâd ar y cwmni i aros. Gwnaethom nifer o gynigion i'r cwmni ynghylch yr hyn y gallem ei wneud i helpu. Buom yn trafod ar y lefel uchaf o fewn y Llywodraeth, ac wedi'r cyhoeddiad ar 14 Ionawr, yr oedd yn ymddangos bod y cwmni wedi penderfynu cau'r ffatri ac ail-leoli ar sail y gost. Unwaith eto, gwnaethom bopeth posibl i geisio cael gan y cwmni wneud penderfyniad gwahanol.

O ran dyfodol y safle, bydd y strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd a gyhoeddwyd gennym yn gyfle inni edrych ar yr hyn y gellir ei wneud i ddefnyddio'r safle, ymysg nifer o gyfleoedd eraill. Cyfeiriasoch at rywbeth y cyfeiriais innau ato yn fy ymateb i'r datganiad hwn, sef y realiti llym na allwn gystadlu â buddsoddi cost isel, sy'n seiliedig ar gyflogau isel. Er gwell neu er gwaeth, ni fydd yn gonglfaen i'r ffordd y byddwn yn denu diwydiant yn y dyfodol oherwydd ni allwn gystadlu mewn rhai meysydd. Nid yw hon yn broblem unigryw i Gymru—mae'n broblem i holl orllewin Ewrop ac i Unol Daleithiau

of western Europe and the United States of America. Therefore, we must look for alternative strategies, and that is why I offer all parties an opportunity to engage in our economic renewal programme, so that we can take this forward.

America. Felly, rhaid inni edrych ar strategaethau gwahanol, a dyna pam yr wyf yn cynnig rhoi cyfle i bob plaid fod yn rhan o'n rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi, er mwyn inni allu bwrw ymlaen â hyn.

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru The Annual Report of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Alun Cairns, and amendments 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Peter Black.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Alun Cairns, a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Peter Black.

**The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I move that

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Cynigïaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*welcomes the report of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales 2008-09, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 1 December 2009. (NDM4343)*

*yn croesawu adroddiad Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru 2008-09, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Rhagfyr 2009. (NDM4343)*

I reject amendment 1 from Alun Cairns, as the majority of services for older people are provided by local authorities, which make their own local decisions on how they spend their allocated budgets. You will also recall that, last year, during the debate on the older people's strategy annual report, I announced that the grant given to local authorities to support the strategy co-ordinator was to be retained as a ring-fenced grant.

Gwrthodaf welliant 1 gan Alun Cairns, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o wasanaethau i bobl hŷn yn cael eu darparu gan awdurdodau lleol, sy'n gwneud eu penderfyniadau lleol eu hunain ynghylch sut y maent yn gwario'r cyllidebau a ddyrennir iddynt. Fe gofiwch hefyd imi gyhoeddi y llynedd, yn ystod y ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol y strategaeth i bobl hŷn, y câi'r grant a roddid i awdurdodau lleol i gynnal cydgyssylltydd y strategaeth ei chadw fel grant wedi'i neilltuo.

I support amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black. Any death of this nature is not acceptable, and officials have provided the Minister for Health and Social Services with further advice on this matter.

Cefnogaf welliant 2 yn enw Peter Black. Mae unrhyw farwolaeth o'r math hwn yn annerbyniol, ac mae swyddogion wedi rhoi cyngor pellach i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y mater hwn.

I reject amendments 3 and 4 from Peter Black. With regard to the single equality scheme, we are already doing what the amendment calls for through the six-monthly reporting on progress on the scheme. The next progress report is due to be published at the end of January.

The siting of meteorological stations and cold weather payments themselves are non-devolved matters. However, I have discussed this issue with Jane Davidson, and I can put on record that there are 85 meteorological weather stations in the UK, with eight of these located in Wales. Nevertheless, if there is strong evidence that people are losing out, then Jane Davidson should be informed so that she can take this up with the United Kingdom Government. Our revised fuel poverty strategy includes proposals to improve advice and support to householders to help reduce bills and stay warm, and to develop new ways to target households that are most vulnerable. Our Keep Well This Winter campaign highlights measures that people, particularly older people and those with chronic conditions, can take to protect their health.

Dyma ail adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yr wyf i wedi'i ddwyn ger eich bron. Unwaith eto, mae'r dasg yn dod â balchder a phleser mawr imi. I Ruth Marks, yr oedd 2008-09 yn flwyddyn o gynnydd sylweddol, a nodir hynny'n glir yn ei hadroddiad. Mae Ruth wedi dangos ei bod hi'n ffigwr allweddol yn y broses o ddatblygu hawliau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Mae hi wedi rhoi safbwyntiau a buddiannau pobl hŷn wrth wraidd ei gwaith, ac mae hynny'n bwysig tu hwnt.

Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn arwain y ffordd yn rhyngwladol wrth fynd i'r afael â'r heriau a'r manteision a ddaw yn sgîl poblogaeth sy'n heneiddio. Yn wir, mae'r ddogfen 'Polisïau er Tawelwch Meddwl? Datganoli a heneiddio yn y DU' a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan y Sefydliad Ymchwil Polisi Cyhoeddus, yn nodi mai yng Nghymru, yn ôl

Gwrthodaf welliannau 3 a 4 gan Peter Black. Ynglŷn â'r cynllun cydraddoldeb sengl, yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud yr hyn y geilw'r gwelliant amdano drwy'r adroddiadau chwemisol ar hynt y cynllun. Disgwylir i'r adroddiad cynnydd nesaf gael ei gyhoeddi ddiwedd Ionawr.

Materion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli yw lleoliad gorsafoedd meteorolegol a thaliadau tywydd oer. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda Jane Davidson, a gallaf gofnodi bod 85 o orsafoedd tywydd meteorolegol yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a bod wyth o'r rheini wedi'u lleoli yng Nghymru. Serch hynny, os oes tystiolaeth gref bod pobl yn cael cam, yna dylid hysbysu Jane Davidson er mwyn iddi hi allu codi hyn gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae ein polisi diwygiedig ar dlodi tanwydd yn cynnwys cynigion i wella cyngor a chefnogaeth i ddeiliaid tai i helpu i leihau biliau a chadw'n gynnes, ac i ddatblygu ffyrdd newydd i dargedu aelwydydd sydd fwyaf agored i niwed. Mae ein hymgyrch Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn yn tynnu sylw at gamau y gall pobl, yn enwedig pobl hŷn a rhai â chyflyrau cronig, eu cymryd i warchod eu hiechyd.

This is the second annual report of the older people's commissioner that I have brought before you. Once again, this is a task that gives me great pleasure and pride. For Ruth Marks, 2008-09 was a year of significant progress, as is outlined clearly in her report. Ruth has shown that she is a key figure in the process of developing the rights of older people in Wales. She has placed the views and interests of older people at the heart of her work, and that is an extremely important point.

We in Wales have led the way internationally in addressing the challenges and benefits that come in the wake of having an ageing population. Indeed, the document 'Policies for Peace of Mind? Devolution and older age in the UK', recently published by the Institute for Public Policy Research, notes that it appears that Wales, more than any other

pob golwg, yn fwy nag unrhyw weinyddiaeth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig dros y degawd diwethaf, y gwelir yr ymrwymiad hirdymor mwyaf cydlynol i wella bywydau pobl hŷn. Mae hefyd yn dweud mai'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yw'r un sydd fwyaf tebygol o sicrhau proffil uchel parhaus i faterion pobl hŷn, a hynny ar draws nifer o feysydd polisi ac ar lefel leol.

The creation of the office of the older people's commissioner is just one of the innovative approaches that we have adopted in Wales. However, like all else we have done in developing and implementing our strategy, it has been undertaken on a firm evidence base. This is why I was delighted last year to launch our Older People's Wellbeing Monitor for Wales. The monitor provides a national picture of the wellbeing of people aged 50 or older living in Wales. It reflects the aims and values of the Welsh Assembly Government's older people's strategy and the United Nations principles for older persons. In addition, it pulls together data from regular surveys and statistical returns as well as key findings from published research. Both the data and the research have a Welsh focus, although some UK and EU findings will be provided for context where possible and appropriate.

3.50 p.m.

Moving back to the matter in hand for today's debate, Assembly Members are all aware that the commissioner is a champion and voice for older people and is independent of the Assembly Government. She is a source of information and support for older people, and provides advocacy on their behalf.

As I have already indicated, Ruth Marks's report shows us that 2008-09 was a year in which solid foundations were put in place to ensure the success of the new post. Older people were engaged and their views and interests put at the heart of the development of her priorities. She has made significant

United Kingdom administration over the past decade, has had the most co-ordinated long-term commitment to improve the lives of older people. The document also states that Wales's older people's strategy is the one most likely to ensure a continued high profile to older people's issues across a number of policy areas and on a local level.

Dim ond un o'r camau arloesol yr ydym wedi'u cymryd yng Nghymru yw creu swydd y comisiynydd pobl hŷn. Fodd bynnag, fel popeth arall yr ydym wedi'i wneud wrth ddatblygu a gweithredu ein strategaeth, fe'i cyflawnwyd ar sail tystiolaeth gadarn. Dyna pam yr oeddwn wrth fy modd y llynedd o lansio ein Monitor Lles Pobl Hŷn Cymru. Mae'r monitor yn darparu darlun cenedlaethol o les pobl 50 oed neu hŷn sy'n byw yng Nghymru. Mae'n adlewyrchu amcanion a gwerthoedd strategaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer pobl hŷn ac egwyddorion y Cenedloedd Unedig ar gyfer pobl hŷn. At hynny, mae'n dwyn ynghyd ddata o arolygon rheolaidd a ffigurau ystadegol yn ogystal â chanfyddiadau allweddol o waith ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd. Ffocws Cymreig sydd i'r data a'r ymchwil, er y darperir rhai canfyddiadau Prydeinig ac Ewropeaidd er mwyn sefydlu'r cyd-destun lle y bo hynny'n bosibl ac yn briodol.

A symud yn ôl at y mater dan sylw ar gyfer y ddatl heddiw, mae holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ymwybodol bod y comisiynydd yn hyrwyddwr ac yn llais i bobl hŷn a'i bod yn annibynnol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n ffynhonnell gwybodaeth a chefnogaeth i bobl hŷn, ac yn darparu eiriolaeth ar eu rhan.

Fel y nodais eisoes, mae adroddiad Ruth Marks yn dangos inni fod 2008-09 yn flwyddyn pryd y gosodwyd sylfeini cadarn i sicrhau llwyddiant y swydd newydd. Gwrandawyd ar bobl hŷn a bu eu sylwadau a'u buddiannau hwy'n greiddiol i ddatblygiad ei pholisïau. Mae hi wedi cymryd camau

strides in putting in place the establishment of the commissioner's office, which includes the appointment of a deputy commissioner. In addition, systems of governance and control for her office, as required by 'Managing Public Money' as appropriate to her status as a corporation sole, have been developed and put in place.

The commissioner for older people has made a solid start, but I expect to see in the next year further progress and the full potential of the powers of this unique post being realised to benefit older people in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** I move amendment 1 in the name of Alun Cairns. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to protect services for older people in light of budgetary pressures.*

The role of the Commissioner for Older People in Wales was created to improve the lives of older people in Wales. As the report states, this involves promoting the provision of opportunities for, and the elimination of discrimination against, older people in Wales, encouraging best practice in the treatment of older people in Wales, and keeping under review the adequacy and effectiveness of the law affecting the interests of older people in Wales.

In the report, we see the concerns highlighted by older people themselves, including issues such as money, care, housing, health, discrimination and transport. This report focuses on key issues including elder abuse, fuel poverty, care home closures, carers and the cost of care.

The population of older people in Wales is growing faster than that in any other part of the United Kingdom, with the proportion of people aged over 60 in Wales expected to reach 28 per cent by 2017. An ICM Research poll found that only a third of adults living in Wales believe that older people are valued by

sylweddol o ran sefydlu swydd y comisiynydd, sy'n cynnwys penodi dirprwy gomisiynydd. At hynny, datblygwyd a sefydlwyd systemau llywodraethu a rheoli ei swydd, yn unol â gofynion 'Managing Public Money' mewn modd priodol i'w statws fel unigolyn corfforaethol.

Mae'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn wedi dechrau'n dda, ond disgwyliaf weld cynnydd pellach yn y flwyddyn nesaf a gweld gwireddu potensial llawn pŵerau'r swydd unigryw hon er budd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigïaf welliant 1 yn enw Alun Cairns. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddiogelu gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng ngoleuni pwysau cyllidebol.*

Crëwyd rôl Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru i wella bywydau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, mae hyn yn golygu hyrwyddo darparu cyfleoedd i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru a dileu gwahaniaethu yn eu herbyn, annog yr arferion gorau o ran trin pobl hŷn yng Nghymru, a chadw golwg ar effeithiolrwydd y gyfraith sy'n effeithio ar fuddiannau pobl hŷn yng Nghymru a pha mor ddigonol yw'r gyfraith honno.

Yn yr adroddiad, gwelwn y pryderon a amlygir gan bobl hŷn eu hunain, gan gynnwys materion fel arian, gofal, tai, iechyd, gwahaniaethu a chlodiant. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn canolbwyntio ar faterion allweddol gan gynnwys cam-drin pobl hŷn, tlodi tanwydd, cau cartrefi gofal, gofalywr a chost gofal.

Mae poblogaeth pobl hŷn yng Nghymru'n tyfu'n gyflymach nag yn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig, a disgwylir i'r ganran o bobl yng Nghymru sydd dros 60 oed gyrraedd 28 y cant erbyn 2017. Canfu pŵl gan ICM Research mai dim ond traean trigolion Cymru sy'n credu bod cymdeithas

society. A recent UK poll showed that one in four older people believed their quality of life had deteriorated in the previous 12 months, and Age Concern Cymru and Help the Aged in Wales research reveals that the majority of older consumers in Wales believe that businesses ignore them in favour of the 'youth market'.

yn rhoi gwerth ar bobl hŷn. Canfu pŵl yn ddiweddar yn y Deyrnas Unedig fod un o bob pedwar o bobl hŷn yn credu bod ansawdd eu bywyd wedi gwaethygu yn y 12 mis blaenorol, a dengys ymchwil gan Age Concern Cymru a Help the Aged yng Nghymru fod y rhan fwyaf o ddefnyddwyr hŷn yng Nghymru'n credu bod busnesau'n eu hanwybyddu gan ffafrio'r 'farchnad ieuenctid'.

The commissioner's report states that:

Dywed adroddiad y comisiynydd:

'The Commission received a great deal of correspondence telling us that older people were worried they could not afford to pay their fuel bills.'

'Cafodd y Comisiwn lawer iawn o ohebiaeth yn dweud wrthon ni fod pobl hŷn yn poeni na allen nhw fforddio talu eu biliau tanwydd.'

Last winter, 2,500 more people died than in other seasons in Wales, up 74 per cent. This is even greater than the 70 per cent indicated in the Liberal Democrats' amendment, which we will be supporting along with their other amendments.

Y gaeaf diwethaf, bu farw 2,500 yn fwy o bobl nag mewn tymhorau eraill yng Nghymru, cynnydd o 74 y cant. Mae hyn yn fwy hyd yn oed na'r 70 y cant a nodir yng ngwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, y byddwn ni'n ei gefnogi ynghyd â'u gwelliannau eraill.

The report states that:

Dywed yr adroddiad:

'Many people contacted us about the challenge of living on a fixed income, particularly when we saw fuel bills soar. People told us they faced a choice between eating and heating their homes'.

'Cysylltodd llawer o bobl â ni ynghylch her byw ar incwm gosod, yn enwedig wrth inni weld biliau tanwydd yn codi'n aruthrol... Roedd pobl yn dweud wrthon ni eu bod yn wynebu dewis rhwng bwyta neu gynhesu eu cartrefi.'

Ninety-three per cent of these people were aged 65 or over. Seventy-five per cent of those living in substandard housing are older people on a low income.

Yr oedd 93 y cant o'r bobl hyn yn 65 oed neu'n hŷn. Mae 75 y cant o bobl sy'n byw mewn tai is-safonol yn bobl hŷn ar incwm isel.

As the commissioner, Ruth Marks, stated:

Fel y dywedodd y comisiynydd, Ruth Marks:

'The global rise in fuel prices is no fault of older people in Wales and they should not have to live in fear of the cold.'

'Nid bai pobl hŷn yng Nghymru yw'r cynnydd byd-eang ym mhrisiau tanwydd a ddylen nhw ddim gorfod byw gan ofni'r oerfel.'

Research by Age Concern Cymru and Help the Aged in Wales found that 93 per cent of adults in Wales say they need a new law to protect them from elder abuse. I feel that the

Canfu ymchwil gan Age Concern Cymru a Help the Aged yng Nghymru fod 93 y cant o oedolion yng Nghymru'n dweud bod arnynt angen cyfraith newydd i'w diogelu rhag cam-



commissioner's report needed to say more about this.

Age Concern Cymru and Help the Aged in Wales have stated that a large number of residents of park homes are older people, and they are concerned that a lack of regulation compared with that for the rest of the housing market is allowing unscrupulous and intimidating practice across Wales. This is something that we debated recently.

Age Concern Cymru, Help the Aged in Wales and a number of older people's forums in Wales have concerns regarding the proposed transfer of the local authority strategy for older people grant to the general revenue support grant in 2010-11, causing anxiety in many forums about their future sustainability. Some local authorities have their older people's advisory groups appointed by over-50s forums, but other local authorities select the groups, thereby defeating the whole object of participation and of giving the over-50s a stronger sense of engagement and influence.

The report states that older people have told us that they desperately need an increase in the basic pension to help them to have a reasonable quality of life. They also want better information about the services and benefits that they are entitled to. A Conservative UK Government would link the basic state pension with earnings to help to stop the spread of the means test and look at simplification of the rules and regulations around pensions to encourage companies to offer high-quality pension provision to all employees.

I thank the commission for meeting me to discuss constituent concerns, and I welcome its work at a national and European level on dignity and respect for people in care home settings, whether paying or paid for. The replacement of the Human Rights Act 1998 with a Bill of rights by a UK Conservative

drin pobl hŷn. Teimlaf fod angen i adroddiad y comisiynydd ddweud mwy ynglŷn â hyn.

Mae Age Concern Cymru a Help the Aged yng Nghymru wedi dweud bod nifer fawr o drigolion cartrefi mewn parciau yn bobl hŷn, a'u bod yn bryderus bod diffyg rheoleiddio o'i gymharu â'r rheoleiddio ar weddill y farchnad dai'n caniatáu arferion diegwyddor a brawychus ar draws Cymru. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth yr ydym wedi'i drafod yn ddiweddar.

Mae gan Age Concern Cymru, Help the Aged yng Nghymru a sawl fforwm pobl hŷn yng Nghymru bryderon ynghylch y bwriad i drosglwyddo grant strategaeth pobl hŷn yr awdurdodau lleol i'r grant cynnal refferniw cyffredinol yn 2010-11, gan achosi pryder mewn sawl fforwm ynglŷn â'u cynaliadwyedd i'r dyfodol. Mae gan rai awdurdodau lleol eu grwpiau cynghori pobl hŷn a benodir gan fforymau pobl dros 50, ond bydd rhai awdurdodau lleol yn dewis y grwpiau eu hunain, sy'n gwbl groes i'r amcan yn hyn o beth, sef sicrhau cyfranogiad a rhoi i bobl dros 50 ymdeimlad cryfach o ymgysylltu a dylanwad.

Dywed yr adroddiad fod pobl hŷn wedi dweud wrthym fod arnynt ddirfawr angen cynnydd yn y pensiwn sylfaenol i'w helpu i gael ansawdd bywyd rhesymol. Mae arnynt eisiau gwell gwybodaeth hefyd am y gwasanaethau a'r budd-daliadau y mae ganddynt hawl i'w cael. Byddai Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn cysylltu pensiwn sylfaenol y wladwriaeth ag enillion i helpu atal lledaeniad y prawf modd ac yn edrych ar symleiddio'r rheolau ynghylch pensiynau er mwyn annog cwmnïau i gynnig darpariaeth pensiwn o ansawdd uchel i'w holl weithwyr.

Diolch i'r comisiwn am gwrdd â mi i drafod pryderon etholwyr, ac yr wyf yn croesawu ei waith ar lefel genedlaethol ac Ewropeaidd ynghylch urddas a pharch at bobl mewn cartrefi gofal, boed y rheini'n talu neu beidio. Wrth ddisodli Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 â Mesur hawliau, byddai Llywodraeth

Government would be an opportunity to address new and additional issues, as it also recognised. The commission also told me that it is developing dedicated guidance on care home closures, which I warmly welcome. As the commissioner states in this report, its work has just begun.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Peter Black. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi â braw y bu cynnydd o 70 y cant yn nifer marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf ymysg pobl hŷn yng Nghymru.*

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod y potensial i'r cynllun cydraddoldeb sengl wireddu dyheadau'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu manylion effeithiolrwydd y cynllun yng nghyswllt pobl hŷn cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.*

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod llawer o bobl hŷn yn dibynnu ar daliadau gaeaf oer ac yn credu y gall lleoliadau presennol gorsafoedd tywydd y swyddfa feteorolegol olygu na fydd llawer o bobl yn gallu cael y taliadau hyn.*

Diolch am y cyfle i siarad yn y drafodaeth bwysig hon. Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y comisiynydd pobl hŷn. Diolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am gefnogi un o'n gwelliannau.

I also welcome the Welsh Conservatives' amendment, which the Welsh Liberal Democrats will be supporting.

Our amendments highlight three specific and important issues for older people in Wales

Geidwadol yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn rhoi cyfle i roi sylw i faterion newydd ac ychwanegol, fel y cydnabu hefyd. Dywedodd y comisiwn wrthyf hefyd ei fod yn datblygu canllawiau penodol ar gyfer cau cartrefi gofal, rhywbeth yr wyf yn ei groesawu'n wresog. Fel y dywed y comisiynydd yn yr adroddiad hwn, newydd ddechrau y mae gwaith y comisiwn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I move the following amendments in the name of Peter Black. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with alarm that there has been a 70 per cent increase in the number of excess winter deaths among older people in Wales.*

Amendment 3: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the potential for the single equalities scheme to deliver the aspirations of the commissioner for older people and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make available details of the scheme's effectiveness in relation to older people as soon as possible.*

Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that many elderly people rely on cold winter payments and believes that the current locations of the meteorological office weather stations can mean that many will miss out on these payments.*

Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to this important debate. I welcome the report of the older people's commissioner. I also thank the Deputy Minister for supporting one of our amendments.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, y bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n ei gefnogi.

Mae ein gwelliannau'n tynnu sylw at dri mater penodol a phwysig i bobl hŷn yng

that have been eloquently outlined previously. These issues are key to the wellbeing of older people and to the success of the commissioner's work. This is boring, but I did, in a similar debate two years ago, mention some of the issues that have been problematic for older people and which are still on the table. The commissioner's report is a pertinent view of the choice that so many older people have, as has already been mentioned, between either eating or heating. That, in itself, is scandalous. We have raised the issues of excessive winter deaths, and I am pleased to hear that the Minister for environment will take up the issue raised by many of us about the data on cold weather. As I said last week, there is a huge difference between the weather in Crosby, on the coast, and in Coedpoeth, for instance. Afterwards I was provided with evidence of the weather in Coedpoeth because Lesley Griffiths kindly showed me her car, snowed in. I do not think that you would have found such extreme weather in Crosby, so I believe that the location of weather stations is important. I look forward to a positive response from our Minister for environment, as it is an important issue for the administration of cold-weather payments, which, to say the least, is potentially hazardous.

We realise that much of what we do here is dependent on the Barnett formula. I, alongside others, have mentioned the Barnett formula since we have been here, and I was pleased to see in the papers that there is a possibility that Labour in Westminster is waking up to the issue of insufficient funds and the cake being too small.

Having said that, the benefits system is not devolved and we cannot do anything about it, but I am looking at the Deputy Minister and I am sure that she is just as aware of the fact that we want to move forward on that issue. We discuss similar issues every year, and I wish that we could move on. I am sure that the older person's commission is doing an admirable job in a scenario that is difficult to improve upon, but I hope that we will not be

Nghymru sydd wedi'u hamlinellu'n huawdl eisoes. Mae'r materion hyn yn allweddol i les pobl hŷn ac i lwyddiant gwaith y comisiynydd. Mae hyn yn ddiflas, ond fe soniais, mewn dadl debyg ddwy flynedd yn ôl, am rai o'r materion sydd wedi peri problemau i bobl hŷn ac sydd yn dal ar y bwrdd. Mae adroddiad y comisiynydd yn olwg berthnasol ar y dewis sydd gan gynifer o bobl hŷn, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, rhwng bwyta a gwresogi. Mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn warthus. Yr ydym wedi codi problemau marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf, ac mae'n dda gennyf glywed y bydd y Gweinidog dros yr amgylchedd yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater a godwyd gan lawer ohonom ynglŷn â'r data ar dywydd oer. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, mae gwahaniaeth enfawr rhwng y tywydd yn Crosby, ar yr arfordir, ac yng Nghoed-poeth, er enghraifft. Rhoddwyd tystiolaeth imi wedyn o'r tywydd yng Nghoed-poeth oherwydd bu Lesley Griffiths mor garedig â dangos ei char imi, a hwnnw ac eira drosto. Nid wyf yn meddwl y cawsech dywydd mor eithafol yn Crosby, felly credaf fod lleoliad gorsafoedd tywydd yn bwysig. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb cadarnhaol gan ein Gweinidog dros yr amgylchedd, gan ei fod yn fater pwysig ar gyfer gweinyddu taliadau tywydd oer, a allai, a dweud y lleiaf, fod yn beryglus.

Sylweddolwn fod llawer o'r hyn a wnawn yma'n ddibynnol ar fformiwla Barnett. Yr wyf fi, ynghyd ag eraill, wedi crybwyll fformiwla Barnett ers pan ydym yma, ac yr oedd yn dda gennyf weld yn y papurau fod posibilrwydd bod Llafur yn San Steffan yn dechrau sylweddoli bod y cyllid yn annigonol a bod y deisen yn rhy fach.

Wedi dweud hynny, nid yw'r system fudd-daliadau wedi'i datganoli ac ni allwn wneud dim yn ei chylch, ond yr wyf yn edrych ar y Dirprwy Weinidog ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod hithau yr un mor ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod arnom eisiau symud ymlaen ar y mater hwnnw. Yr ydym yn trafod materion tebyg bob blwyddyn, a hoffwn pe gallem symud ymlaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn gwneud gwaith clodwiw mewn

standing here next year saying the same things and asking the same questions. I wish the commissioner well, because there are many pressing issues that I hope will have been sorted when we get to the stage of being that age. The series of recommendations in the report serves to focus minds and provides measurable, realistic and tangible outcomes that older people ably articulated as being required. In the end, it is down to dignity and respect—or *parch* and *urddas*. I hope that this Government can see its way to helping the situation, so that many of the people concerned do not have to choose between heating and eating.

4.00 p.m.

**Joyce Watson:** First, I welcome the report and the dedication of Ruth Marks and her team in delivering change. I commend the Deputy Minister, Gwenda Thomas, on her absolute dedication and hard work in this field.

The report of the older people's commissioner notes that it received a great deal of correspondence from older people worried about their fuel bills. We discussed that in the Chamber last week during the debate on the fuel poverty charter. In that debate, the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing made the point that, before the recession, we were on target to meet the 2010 target on tackling fuel poverty. That is no consolation to older people in Wales who are struggling to heat their homes now, but it shows the overall success of the home energy efficiency scheme in reducing fuel poverty since 2001. The commissioner acknowledges that point and reports on the work organised with Care and Repair Cymru to send out 13,000 letters informing older people of the Home Heat Helpline and HEES, the response to which, as the commissioner says, was overwhelmingly positive.

sefyllfa y mae'n anodd ei gwella, ond gobeithio na fyddwn yn sefyll yma y flwyddyn nesaf yn dweud yr un pethau ac yn gofyn yr un cwestiynau. Dymunaf bob hwyl i'r comisiynydd, oherwydd y mae llawer o faterion pwysig yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddant wedi'u datrys erbyn i ni gyrraedd yr oed hwnnw. Mae'r gyfres o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad yn fodd inni ganolbwyntio ar yr hyn sydd dan sylw ac yn darparu canlyniadau mesuradwy, realistig a gweladwy y mynegodd pobl hŷn yn huawdl fod gofyn amdanynt. Yn y pen draw, mae'n fater o barch ac urddas. Gobeithio y bydd y Llywodraeth hon yn gallu helpu'r sefyllfa, fel na fydd yn rhaid i lawer o'r bobl hyn orfod dewis rhwng bwyta a gwresogi.

**Joyce Watson:** Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad ac ymroddiad Ruth Marks a'i thîm i sicrhau newid. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Dirprwy Weinidog, Gwenda Thomas, am ei hymroddiad llwyr a'i gwaith caled yn y maes hwn.

Mae adroddiad y comisiynydd pobl hŷn yn nodi iddi gael llawer iawn o ohebiaeth oddi wrth bobl hŷn sy'n poeni am eu biliau tanwydd. Trafodasom hynny yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf yn ystod y ddadl ar y siarter tlodi tanwydd. Yn y ddadl honno, gwnaeth y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai y pwynt ein bod, cyn y dirwasgiad, yn cadw at y targed ar gyfer 2010 o ran mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd. Nid yw hynny'n gysur o fath yn y byd i bobl hŷn yng Nghymru sy'n cael anhawster gwresogi eu cartrefi'n awr, ond mae'n dangos llwyddiant cyffredinol y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref i leihau tlodi tanwydd ers 2001. Mae'r comisiynydd yn cydnabod y pwynt hwnnw ac yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar y gwaith a drefnwyd gyda Gofal a Thrwsio Cymru i ddsbarthu 13,000 o lythrau'n hysbysu pobl hŷn am y Llinell Gymorth Cartrefi Cynnes a'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, y bu'r ymateb iddynt, fel y dywed y comisiynydd, yn eithriadol o gadarnhaol.

That is an excellent example of an organised effort to communicate with older people and one that has had a direct impact by helping older people to keep warm. In the light of the recent freezing weather, it is also an effort that may, in some cases, have literally been life saving. At this point, I recognise amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black, which notes the alarming and disturbing increase of 70 per cent in the number of excess winter deaths among older people in Wales. That concerns us all.

The First Minister mentioned advocacy services earlier this afternoon. Before Christmas, I attended the Pembrokeshire 50+ central forum organised by Help the Aged. The event was an opportunity to meet forum members and learn about their hard work in championing the rights of older people in the county. The message of the meeting was that advocates are the key to making this age group aware of its entitlements, in helping older people to fill in forms for disability adaptations and benefits, and in providing other information crucial to their survival. However, research recently carried out by Age Concern suggests that there is roughly one paid advocate per 13,000 older people in Wales. That figure is perhaps lower than in previous years. Deputy Minister, do you agree that advocacy services need to be readily available to this age group, and will you outline what the Assembly Government is doing to ensure access to advocacy and advice services for older people?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I welcome the report of the older persons' commissioner and the work undertaken by the commission. I endorse amendment 1 in the name of Alun Cairns, which refers to the importance of protecting the resources put into developing strategies and initiatives that respect the role of older people in society and celebrate their positive contribution to society. I draw the Deputy Minister's attention to the major

Mae hynny'n enghraifft ragorol o ymdrech drefnus i gyfathrebu â phobl hŷn, ac yn un sydd wedi cael effaith uniongyrchol drwy helpu pobl hŷn i gadw'n gynnes. Yn wyneb y tywydd rhewllyd yn ddiweddar, mae hefyd yn ymdrech a all, mewn rhai achosion, fod wedi achub bywydau, yn llythrennol. Ar y pwynt hwn, hoffwn gydnabod gwelliant 2 yn enw Peter Black, sy'n nodi'r cynnydd dychrynlyd a brawychus o 70 y cant yn nifer marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf ymysg pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n destun pryder inni i gyd.

Soniodd y Prif Weinidog am wasanaethau eiriolaeth yn gynharach y prynhawn yma. Cyn y Nadolig, euthum i fforwm canolog sir Benfro i bobl 50 oed a hŷn, a drefnwyd gan Help the Aged. Cyfle oedd y digwyddiad i gwrrd ag aelodau'r fforwm a dysgu am eu gwaith caled yn hyrwyddo hawliau pobl hŷn yn y sir. Neges y cyfarfod oedd mai eiriolwyr yw'r allwedd i sicrhau bod y grŵp oedran hwn yn ymwybodol o'i hawliau, wrth helpu pobl hŷn i lenwi ffurflenni ar gyfer budd-daliadau ac addasiadau anabledd, ac wrth ddarparu gwybodaeth arall sy'n hanfodol iddynt oroesi. Fodd bynnag, mae ymchwil a wnaed yn ddiweddar gan Age Concern yn awgrymu bod tuag un eiriolwr cyflogedig i bob 13,000 o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n is efallai nag mewn blynyddoedd a fu. Ddirprwy Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen i wasanaethau eiriolaeth fod ar gael yn rhwydd i'r grŵp oedran hwn, ac a wnewch amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i sicrhau mynediad at wasanaethau eiriolaeth a chyngor i bobl hŷn?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y comisiynydd pobl hŷn a'r gwaith a wneir gan y comisiwn. Yr wyf yn ategu gwelliant 1 yn enw Alun Cairns, sy'n cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd gwarchod yr adnoddau a roir i ddatblygu strategaethau a mentrau sy'n parchu rôl pobl hŷn mewn cymdeithas ac yn dathlu eu cyfraniad cadarnhaol i gymdeithas. Tynnaf sylw'r Dirprwy Weinidog at y toriadau mawr yn y blynyddoedd diweddar

cutbacks in recent years in adult community learning. In responding to the debate, will she outline the type of dialogue being undertaken across Government, particularly in the fields of education and local government, to ensure that people, as they progress through their life or as they enter part or full retirement, have the opportunity to use their skills, or re-educate and retrain, so that they can find that new lease of life, over the next 10, 15 or 20 years, as they develop their retirement and pension plans?

I heard the Deputy Minister describe the report in her opening remarks as making a 'solid start'. Referring back to my own school reports, that phrase was usually used by my teachers to say that I could have done better, namely that it had not been a bad effort but there was room for improvement. Could the Deputy Minister elaborate on that 'solid start' and what developments she and the Welsh Assembly Government will be looking for over the next 12 months? How innovative do they believe the older people's commissioner should be?

I also seek assurances that the commissioner will engage with all parts of Wales to ensure that there is no duplication in the work of the bodies that seek to represent this sector of society. These bodies should be incorporated in the new structures that the older people's commissioner and her office have now created in Wales. They are a useful tool to use when creating that level of advocacy. Later on today, we will debate the Proposed Social Care Charges (Wales) Measure, and the role of advocacy in bringing opinions forward on that and other Measures progressing through the Assembly will be of critical importance as we develop strategies within our limited budgetary means over the next decade.

I also believe that it is vital that we identify the concerns raised in the report about the installations that many older people need, to adapt their homes to take account of a change

mewn addysg gymunedol i oedolion. Wrth ymateb i'r ddadl, a wnaiff hi amlinellu'r math o ddeialog sy'n digwydd ar draws y Llywodraeth, yn enwedig ym meysydd addysg a llywodraeth leol, i sicrhau bod pobl, wrth iddynt fynd yn hŷn neu wrth symud i ymddeoliad rhannol neu lawn, yn cael y cyfle i ddefnyddio'u sgiliau, neu i gael eu hailaddysgu a'u hailhyfforddi, er mwyn i gyfnod newydd agor yn eu hanes, dros y 10, 15 neu 20 mlynedd nesaf, wrth iddynt ddatblygu eu cynlluniau ymddeol a phensiwn?

Clywais y Dirprwy Weinidog yn disgrifio'r adroddiad yn ei sylwadau agoriadol fel 'dechrau'n dda'. A chyfeirio'n ôl at fy adroddiadau ysgol fy hun, defnyddid yr ymadrodd hwnnw fel arfer gan fy athrawon i ddweud y gallaswn wneud yn well, hynny yw, nad oedd wedi bod yn ymdrech wael ond bod lle i wella. A allai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ymhelaethu ar y 'dechrau da' hwnnw a pha ddatblygiadau y bydd hi a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n edrych amdanynt dros y 12 mis nesaf? Pa mor arloesol y credant y dylai'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn fod?

Gofynnaf am sicrwydd hefyd y bydd y comisiynydd yn ymgysylltu â phob rhan o Gymru i sicrhau na cheir dim dyblygu yng ngwaith y cyrff sy'n ceisio cynrychioli'r sector hwn o gymdeithas. Dylid ymgorffori'r cyrff hyn yn y strwythurau newydd y mae'r comisiynydd pobl hŷn a'i swyddfa wedi'u creu erbyn hyn yng Nghymru. Maent yn arf buddiol i'w ddefnyddio wrth greu'r lefel honno o eiriolaeth. Yn ddiweddarach heddiw, byddwn yn trafod y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru), a bydd rôl eiriolaeth o ran cyflwyno sylwadau ar hynny a Mesurau eraill sydd ar eu hynt drwy'r Cynulliad yn allweddol bwysig wrth inni ddatblygu strategaethau o fewn ein cyllideb gyfyngedig yn ystod y deng mlynedd nesaf.

Credaf hefyd ei bod yn hollbwysig inni nodi'r pryderon a godir yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â'r gosodiadau y mae ar lawer o bobl hŷn eu hangen, i addasu eu cartrefi i ymateb i

in circumstances, perhaps through illness or the progression of arthritis. It can take so long to adapt people's homes that it can be life-limiting, in that their condition may have deteriorated further following their initial assessment, and the adaptation that is finally made is way out of date. I would welcome it if the Deputy Minister could describe how she will take that work forward, again working across Government. Very often, it is the social services departments in local authorities that are charged with delivering adaptations and support for people who want to live as much of their lives as possible in the community.

The report also identifies the embarrassment that older people, quite rightly, feel when they are not placed on a single-sex ward in the Welsh NHS. From the answers to questions that I have put to the Minister for Health and Social Services in the past, I gather that progress on providing single-sex wards—a desire that is felt across all parties, to be fair—has been limited over the past couple of years. This refers back to our amendment and the need to tailor resources to that aspiration of giving patients what they want. It can be very off-putting for an older person—or any person—to find their privacy compromised, as well as their wider aspirations for how their health issues are dealt with. Therefore, often, they do not seek treatment for what may be a preventable illness, although that treatment would put them back into society to fulfil their potential in life. That is an issue that I hope the Deputy Minister can address, given that she is the deputy of the Minister for Health and Social Services.

Elder abuse is also touched on in the report. Tragically, as the Deputy Minister is well aware, there have been examples of elder abuse in care homes and in wider society. While some of the issues that are raised can be addressed via inspection and a more joined-up approach from Government and

newid mewn amgylchiadau, efallai oherwydd salwch neu am fod arthritis yn gwaethygu. Gall gymryd cyhyd i addasu cartrefi pobl nes cyfyngu ar eu heinioes, wrth i'w cyflwr efallai waethygu ymhellach wedi eu hasesiad cyntaf, nes bod yr addasiad a wneir yn y diwedd yn llawer rhy hwyr. Byddwn yn croesawu pe gallai'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddisgrifio sut y bydd hi'n bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith hwnnw, eto gan weithio ar draws y Llywodraeth. Yn aml iawn, yr adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn awdurdodau lleol a gaiff y cyfrifoldeb o gyflwyno addasiadau a chymorth i bobl y mae arnynt eisiau byw cymaint o'u bywydau ag sy'n bosibl yn y gymuned.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi hefyd yr annifyrrwch a deimlir gan bobl hŷn, gyda phob cyfiawnhad, pan na roddir hwy mewn ward un rhyw yng ngwasanaeth iechyd gwladol Cymru. Yn ôl yr atebion i gwestiynau a roddais i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn y gorffennol, casglaf na chafwyd fawr o gynnydd o ran darparu wardiau un rhyw—rhywbeth y mae pob plaid yn awyddus i'w wneud, a bod yn deg—dros y flwyddyn neu ddwy ddiwethaf. Cyfeiria hyn yn ôl at ein gwelliant a'r angen i deilwra adnoddau i'r dyhead hwnnw i roi i gleifion yr hyn y mae arnynt ei eisiau. Gall fod yn annifyr iawn i berson hŷn—neu unrhyw un—pan fydd amharu ar eu preifatrwydd, yn ogystal â'u dyheadau ehangach ar gyfer y modd yr ymdrinnir â'u materion iechyd. Felly, yn aml, ni cheisiant driniaeth ar gyfer salwch y gellid ei atal, er y byddai'r driniaeth honno'n eu gosod yn ôl yn y gymdeithas i gyflawni eu potensial mewn bywyd. Mae hynny'n fater y gobeithiaf y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog roi sylw iddo, a hithau'n ddirprwy i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Sonnir am gam-drin pobl hŷn yn yr adroddiad hefyd. Yn drasig, fel y gŵyr y Dirprwy Weinidog yn dda, bu enghreifftiau o gam-drin pobl hŷn mewn cartrefi gofal ac mewn cymdeithas yn fwy cyffredinol. Er y gellir ymdrin â rhai o'r materion a godir drwy arolygu ac agwedd fwy cydlynol gan y

local government, we as a society must also play our part. We need to make sure that we are a part of the community and that we look out for everyone in it. It is very important that the Deputy Minister addresses this when she responds to the issue of elder abuse, because of notable cases that have been brought to the public's attention in recent months.

**Janet Ryder:** Like everyone else who has spoken in this debate, I thank the Commissioner for Older People in Wales for her report. It is a very comprehensive review and, as has been said, it is a unique role that she has, and it came about because of much hard work by many different groups. It raises a number of interesting points. A number of the points that have been raised could be said to be held in common with many other different age groups, but their effects are emphasised when dealing with a more vulnerable group.

4.10 p.m.

It is also interesting that a number of the points raised have already been addressed or looked at by Assembly committees. The Committee on Equality of Opportunity recently published its report on delays in home adaptations, as Andrew R.T. Davies referred to, which we debated in the Chamber. The committee is also looking at equality of access in the workplace, so a number of these points are being picked up by different committees.

At one point, the report states that the office received 1,000 inquiries. It would have helped to include figures or percentages at that point to support the issues being put forward and to show where the emphasis lies. For instance, on fuel poverty, there has been a 74 per cent increase in winter deaths, which is totally unacceptable, but 90 per cent of those deaths involved people aged over 75. Significantly, countries such as the Scandinavian countries and Russia have lower numbers of early winter deaths than the UK. That issue needs to be looked at. With

Llywodraeth a llywodraeth leol, rhaid i ninnau fel cymdeithas chwarae ein rhan. Mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn rhan o'r gymuned a'n bod yn ofalus o bawb ynnddi. Mae'n bwysig iawn i'r Dirprwy Weinidog roi sylw i hyn wrth ymateb i fater cam-drin pobl hŷn, oherwydd achosion amlwg sydd wedi dod i sylw'r cyhoedd yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf.

**Janet Ryder:** Fel pawb arall sydd wedi siarad yn y ddadl hon, hoffwn ddiolch i Gomisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru am ei hadroddiad. Mae'n adolygiad cynhwysfawr iawn ac, fel y dywedwyd, mae ganddi rôl unigryw, a ddaeth i fod yn sgîl llawer o waith caled gan lawer o wahanol grwpiau. Mae'n codi nifer o bwyntiau diddorol. Gellid dweud bod nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn gyffredin i lawer o wahanol grwpiau oedran eraill, ond pwysleisir eu heffeithiau wrth ddelio â grŵp sy'n fwy agored i niwed.

Mae'n ddiddorol hefyd fod nifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd wedi cael sylw eisoes gan bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Yn ddiweddar cyhoeddodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ei adroddiad ar oedi wrth addasu tai, fel y crybwyllodd Andrew R.T. Davies, a drafodwyd gennym yn y Siambr. Mae'r pwyllgor yn edrych hefyd ar gydraddoldeb mynediad yn y gweithle, felly mae nifer o'r pwyntiau hyn yn cael sylw gan wahanol bwyllgorau.

Yn un man, dywed yr adroddiad fod y swyddfa wedi cael 1,000 o ymholiadau. Buasai'n gymorth cynnwys ffigurau neu ganrannau yn y fan honno i ategu'r materion a gynigir ac i ddangos lle y mae'r pwyslais. Er enghraifft, o ran tlodi tanwydd, bu cynnydd o 74 y cant mewn marwolaethau yn y gaeaf, sydd yn gwbl annerbyniol, ond yr oedd 90 y cant o'r marwolaethau hynny ymysg pobl dros 75 oed. Yn arwyddocaol, mae gan wledydd fel gwledydd Llychlyn a Rwsia niferoedd is o farwolaethau cynnar yn y gaeaf na'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae angen



some experts predicting a fuel price hike of as much as 17 per cent on domestic fuel bills, there is a need for the Government to act. I accept that it may not be the Government here but, at some point, whether it is in Cardiff or London, a Government needs to act on that so that we do not deter vulnerable people from putting on their heating when it is most needed. People living on a fixed income, a number of whom may have underlying medical conditions or rarely leave their homes, need to keep their heating on for relatively long periods. Plaid Cymru has called on the UK Government to take much more drastic measures to meet the immediate need, and we are calling for a cut in value-added tax on fuel. That is not a matter for this place, but I hope that the Deputy Minister is lobbying on behalf of pensioners to ensure that there is a cut in VAT on fuel to help pensioners in particular.

The report tells us:

‘The Commission received a great deal of correspondence telling us that older people were worried they could not afford to pay their fuel bills’.

Greater clarity in the report would have been welcomed on that. Figures or percentages at that point in the report would have helped significantly.

The Government must look at the level of pensions, which has been referred to in this debate but which also lies outside the realm of the Assembly. However, we are talking about the needs of pensioners in Wales who are facing a choice between heating their homes or buying food. Just as there has been a campaign for a living wage in Wales for many years, so there must be a strong campaign for a living pension in Wales. Plaid Cymru is looking forward to that. We are also looking forward to the commissioner continuing to work closely not just with the Assembly Government, as she has been

edrych ar hynny. Wrth i rai arbenigwyr ddarogan cynnydd ym mhrisiau tanwydd o gymaint ag 17 y cant ar filiau tanwydd domestig, mae angen i'r Llywodraeth weithredu. Derbyniaf nad y Llywodraeth yn y fan hon efallai yw honno, ond, erbyn cyrraedd rhyw bwynt, boed yn Llywodraeth yng Nghaerdydd neu yn Llundain, mae angen i Lywodraeth weithredu ar hynny fel na rwystrir pobl sy'n agored i niwed rhag cynnau eu gwres pan fydd mwyaf o'i angen. Mae angen i bobl sy'n byw ar incwm sefydlog, llawer ohonynt efallai â chwyflyrau meddygol gwaelodol neu'n lled gaeth i'w cartrefi, gadw eu gwres ynghyn am gyfnodau cymharol faith. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw ar Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i gymryd camau llawer llymach i ateb yr angen presennol, ac yr ydym yn galw am ostwng treth ar werth ar danwydd. Nid mater i'r lle hwn yw hynny, ond gobeithio bod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn lobbïo ar ran pensïynwyr i sicrhau y bydd cwtogi ar TAW ar danwydd i helpu pensïynwyr yn arbennig.

Dywed yr adroddiad wrthym:

‘Cafodd y Comisiwn lawer iawn o ohebiaeth yn dweud wrthon ni fod pobl hŷn yn poeni na allen nhw fforddio talu eu biliau tanwydd’.

Byddid wedi croesawu mwy o eglurder yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn â hynny. Byddai ffigurau neu ganrannau yn y man hwnnw yn yr adroddiad wedi bod yn gymorth sylweddol.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar lefel pensïynau, sy'n rhywbeth y cyfeiriwyd ato yn y ddadl hon ond sydd hefyd y tu allan i gylch gwaith y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn sôn am anghenion pensïynwyr yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu dewis rhwng gwresogi eu cartrefi a phrynu bwyd. Yn union fel y cafwyd ymgyrch dros gyflog byw yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd bellach, rhaid cael ymgyrch gref dros bensiwn byw yng Nghymru. Mae Plaid Cymru'n edrych ymlaen at hynny. Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen hefyd at weld y comisiynydd yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos nid yn unig â Llywodraeth

doing, but with the Government at Westminster. She is the Commissioner for Older People in Wales, and she deals not just with matters relating to the Assembly. Therefore, on behalf of all older people in Wales, she should be advocating at whatever level of government is appropriate to ensure that their needs are met.

**Nick Ramsay:** I also welcome this report and commend the work of the older people's commissioner, Ruth Marks, in producing it, as well as the work done by the Deputy Minister. I have no doubt that the Deputy Minister is dedicated to trying to improve the lot of older people in Wales. Some of us on the periphery might disagree on the best way to achieve that, but I have no doubt that that is her intention.

In a previous role, I was a member of a local authority in Wales. That was back in the day when I used to win votes on a leading group team—that seems a long time ago now. I had the privilege of being one of the youngest older people's champions in Wales, when the position was first created. I know full well the challenges and difficulties associated with doing what you can to improve the lives of that section of the population in Wales and also the need to bring together cross-cutting elements of different departments. I am well aware of the challenges that we face.

That said, I agree with my colleague, Mark Isherwood, and with his comments that this report is good but there are also a lot of grey areas. As many questions are raised as are answered by this report. I was particularly drawn to page 16, which deals with elder abuse and carers' legislation, mainly because of my interest in caring organisations in my constituency of Monmouthshire. I attended a carers' conference recently, where delegates spoke about the work that has been done for carers by the Assembly Government, but also the large amount of work that remains to be done. I have liaised with Jenny Randerson, the leader of the all-party group in this area,

y Cynulliad, fel y mae wedi bod yn gwneud, ond â'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Hi yw Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru, ac nid â materion perthnasol i'r Cynulliad yn unig y mae'n delio. Felly, ar ran yr holl bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, dylai fod yn eiriol ar ba lefel bynnag o lywodraeth sy'n briodol i sicrhau bod eu hanghenion yn cael eu diwallu.

**Nick Ramsay:** Croesawaf finnau'r adroddiad hwn a chymeradwyo gwaith y comisiynydd pobl hŷn, Ruth Marks, yn ei lunio, yn ogystal â'r gwaith a wnaed gan y Dirprwy Weinidog. Nid wyf yn amau nad yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ymroddedig i geisio gwella byd pobl hŷn yng Nghymru. Gall rhai ohonom ar yr ymylon anghytuno ar y ffordd orau i gyflawni hynny, ond nid oes gennyf amheuaeth o gwbl nad hynny yw ei bwriad.

Mewn rôl flaenorol, yr oeddwn yn aelod o awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Yr oedd hynny'n ôl yn y cyfnod pryd yr arferwn ennill pleidleisiau ar dîm grŵp arweiniol—mae hynny'n ymddangos yn amser maith yn ôl erbyn hyn. Cefais y ffrainc o fod yn un o'r eiriolwyr ieuengaf dros bobl hŷn yng Nghymru, pan grëwyd y swydd gyntaf. Gwn yn iawn am yr heriau a'r anawsterau cysylltiedig â gwneud yr hyn a allwch i wella bywyd yr adran honno o'r boblogaeth yng Nghymru a hefyd yr angen i ddod ag elfennau trawsbynciol y gwahanol adrannau ynghyd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r heriau a wynebwn.

Wedi dweud hynny, cytunaf â'm cyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, ac â'i sylwadau fod yr adroddiad hwn yn dda ond bod llawer o feysydd annelwig hefyd. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn codi cynifer o gwestiynau ag y mae'n eu hateb. Tynnwyd fy sylw'n arbennig gan dudalen 16, sy'n ymdrin â deddfwriaeth ar ofalwyr a cham-drin pobl hŷn, a hynny'n bennaf oherwydd fy niddordeb mewn sefydliadau gofalu yn fy etholaeth yn sir Fynwy. Bûm mewn cynhadledd gofalu yn ddiweddar, lle y siaradodd cynadleddwyr am y gwaith y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i wneud dros ofalwyr, ond hefyd am y gwaith mawr sydd i'w wneud o hyd. Yr wyf

to see if we can do more to better the lot of older people who are carers, and the people who care for carers. Ruth Marks has said that:

‘one of the main complaints I receive from people across Wales is that the information required to access services is too complex.’

That was exactly the criticism that I encountered when I spoke to delegates at the carers’ conference in Usk, Monmouthshire, recently. People said that, in some cases, the services are there, but they do not necessarily know how to access them or know the best way to access them, and therefore they might as well not be there. I hope that the Deputy Minister will work with the older people’s commissioner to try to address this area of concern. There is another little caveat at the side of the report that says that carers need one-stop shops. I agree with that, but sometimes it is easier said than done. One-stop shops are effective, but we have to ensure that they provide older people with the right information at the right time, not when the horse has bolted, so to speak.

Pensions were mentioned earlier—I know that Plaid Cymru has been talking about pensions this week and my colleague, Mark Isherwood, mentioned pensions too. I agree with him about the need to restore the link with earnings. I know that this is not a devolved matter, but I understand that the Deputy Minister has discussions with Westminster colleagues on such issues. When the link with earnings was broken in the 1980s, they were linked instead with inflation—

**Brian Gibbons:** That was under the Tories.

**Nick Ramsay:** The former Minister is making a big deal of that, but inflation was much higher then, so there was an argument for linking pensions to inflation. Now that

wedi cysylltu â Jenny Randerson, arweinydd y grŵp hollbleidiol yn y maes hwn, i weld a allwn wneud mwy i wella byd pobl hŷn sy’n ofalwyr, a’r bobl sy’n gofalu am ofalwyr. Mae Ruth Marks wedi dweud mai:

‘un o’r prif gwynion rwy’n ei gael gan bobl ledled Cymru yw bod yr wybodaeth angenrheidiol i gael gwasanaethau yn rhy gymhleth.’

Dyna’r union feirniadaeth a gefais pan siaredais â chynadleddwyr yn y gynhadledd i ofalwyr ym Mrynbuga, sir Fynwy, yn ddiweddar. Dywedodd pobl fod y gwasanaethau ar gael, mewn rhai achosion, ond nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn gwybod sut i’w cael neu’n gwybod beth yw’r ffordd orau i’w cael, ac felly ni fyddai waeth pe na baent yn bod o gwbl. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Dirprwy Weinidog gydweithio â’r comisiynydd pobl hŷn i geisio rhoi sylw i’r pryder hwn. Ceir cafeat arall ar ochr yr adroddiad sy’n dweud bod angen siopau un stop ar ofalwyr. Cytunaf â hynny, ond weithiau mae’n haws dweud na gwneud. Mae siopau un stop yn effeithiol, ond rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn darparu’r wybodaeth iawn i bobl hŷn ar yr adeg iawn, yn hytrach na chodi pais ar ôl piso, ys dywedir.

Soniwyd am bensiynau’n gynharach—gwn fod Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn siarad am bensiynau yr wythnos hon a soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, am bensiynau hefyd. Cytunaf ag ef am yr angen i adfer y cysylltiad ag enillion. Gwn nad mater datganoledig yw hwn, ond deallaf fod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn cael trafodaethau gyda chyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan ar faterion o’r fath. Pan dorwyd y cysylltiad ag enillion yn yr 1980au, fe’u cysylltwyd â chwyddiant yn lle hynny—

**Brian Gibbons:** O dan y Toriaid y digwyddodd hynny.

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae’r cyn-Weinidog yn gwneud môr a mynydd o hynny, ond yr oedd chwyddiant yn llawer uwch bryd hynny, felly yr oedd dadl dros gysylltu pensiynau â

inflation is low, there is no doubt that pensioners are being short changed and their pensions are not increasing as much as I think that they should. Everyone agrees that we require the best possible care for the elderly, and the highest possible standards. As was said at the start, this report provides a solid basis for moving on, but we would like to see more meat on the bones, and a bit more information on the route map for the future, which I do not think is mentioned here.

Finally, I have read this report from cover to cover, and unless I am being exceptionally dense—I heard that laugh—there is nothing in here about rural areas. That concerns me and I am sure that it would concern other Members from rural areas, or whose constituencies contain small pockets of rural areas. We have to recognise, particularly at this time of budgetary pressure, that the cost of delivering these kinds of services across a rural area is much greater than in an urban area. I would be grateful if you could go back to the older people's commissioner and ask if the next report could include a bit more about the difficulties facing local authorities and service providers in rural areas.

**The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I am grateful to Members for their contributions. There are three main issues that I will deal with. Quite a few of you brought up the issue of excess winter deaths, which is an issue that I am very concerned about. Perhaps it would help if I were to define a winter death. The Office for National Statistics defines it as a death occurring during the winter months of December to March, and excess winter deaths are defined by ONS as the difference between the number of deaths occurring during the four winter months from December to March and the average number of deaths during the preceding four months, August to November, and the following four months, April to July. I know that it is just a statistic, but it does explain it.

chwyddiant. A chwyddiant bellach yn isel, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw pensiynwyr yn cael bargaen wael ac nad yw eu pensiynau'n codi cymaint ag y dylent yn fy nhyb i. Mae pawb yn cytuno bod arnom angen y gofal gorau posibl i'r henoed, a'r safonau uchaf posibl. Fel y dywedwyd ar y dechrau, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn darparu sail gadarn ar gyfer symud ymlaen, ond hoffem weld mwy o gig ar yr esgym, ac ychydig yn rhagor o wybodaeth am y llwybr i'w ddilyn i'r dyfodol, nad oes sôn amdano yma hyd y gwn.

I gloi, yr wyf wedi darllen yr adroddiad hwn o glawr i glawr, ac os nad wyf yn bod yn ofnadwy o ddwl—clywais y chwerthiniad hwnnw—nid oes dim yma am ardaloedd gwledig. Mae hynny'n bryder i mi ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n bryder i Aelodau eraill o ardaloedd gwledig, neu rai y mae eu hetholaethau'n cynnwys pocedi bach o ardaloedd gwledig. Rhaid inni gydnabod, yn enwedig a hithau'n adeg o bwysau ar y gyllideb, fod cost darparu'r mathau hyn o wasanaethau'n llawer mwy nag mewn ardal drefol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech fynd yn ôl at y comisiynydd pobl hŷn a gofyn a allai'r adroddiad nesaf gynnwys ychydig mwy am yr anawsterau sy'n wynebu awdurdodau lleol a darparwyr gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau. Mae tri phrif fater y deliaf â hwy. Crybwyllodd amryw ohonoch fater marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf, sydd yn fater yr wyf yn bryderus iawn amdano. Efallai y byddai'n help pe bawn yn diffinio marwolaeth yn y gaeaf. Mae'r Swyddfa Ystadegau Cenedlaethol yn ei diffinio fel marwolaeth sy'n digwydd yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf, rhwng Rhagfyr a Mawrth, a diffinnir marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf gan y Swyddfa honno fel y gwahaniaeth rhwng nifer y marwolaethau yn ystod pedwar mis y gaeaf rhwng Rhagfyr a Mawrth a nifer cyfartalog y marwolaethau yn ystod y pedwar mis blaenorol, rhwng Awst a Thachwedd, a'r pedwar mis dilynol, rhwng Ebrill a

Gorffennaf. Gwn mai dim ond ystadegyn yw hynny, ond mae'n esbonio'r peth.

4.20 p.m.

The winter period can also have different rates of deaths, as can the periods both sides of it. During the winter period of December to March 2008-09, there were an estimated 36,700 more deaths in England and Wales compared with the average for the non-winter period. That is the highest number of excess winter deaths since the winter of 1999-2000, when excess winter mortality was nearly a third higher than in 2008-09. These things do fluctuate. As Janet Ryder said, the majority of deaths occur in people over the age of 75.

Influenza is often implicated in winter deaths, so I will take this opportunity to urge people to take up the vaccine, as I have done. The Keep Well This Winter policy is part of the Welsh Assembly Government's response to Health Challenge Wales. As part of that, pensioners in Wales can get advice on winter fuel payments from a help desk that is run by the pensions agency, and money is also available through carbon emissions reduction target funding, which they can access via their energy supplier. We are doing all that we can in the present climate to support and to help people to protect their health and to stay warm.

The second issue that has been expressed quite clearly is that of equality—a few Members, including Nick, Mark, and Janet, mentioned that. I would like to say a little about the single equality scheme. Older people's equality issues are covered by the scheme, and the Welsh Liberal Democrats' amendment 3 mentioned that. The single equality scheme does refer to the UN convention on the rights of older people and there are specific commitments in the scheme with regard to the strategy for older people, the older people's wellbeing monitor, the Commissioner for Older People in Wales, and the Welsh Assembly Government's

Gellir cael cyfraddau marwolaethau gwahanol hefyd yn ystod cyfnod y gaeaf, a'r un modd y cyfnodau o boptu iddo. Yn ystod cyfnod y gaeaf rhwng Rhagfyr a Mawrth 2008-09, amcangyfrifwyd bod 36,700 yn fwy o farwolaethau yng Nghymru a Lloegr o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd y cyfnod nad oedd yn aeaf. Dyna'r nifer uchaf o farwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf ers gaeaf 1999-2000, pryd yr oedd marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf bron draean yn uwch nag yn 2008-09. Mae'r pethau hyn yn amrywio. Fel y dywedodd Janet Ryder, mae'r rhan fwyaf o farwolaethau'n digwydd i bobl dros 75 oed.

Mae'r fflw'n aml yn achosi marwolaethau yn y gaeaf, felly achubaf y cyfle hwn i annog pobl i gael y brechlyn, fel yr wyf fi wedi gwneud. Mae'r polisi Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn yn rhan o ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Her Iechyd Cymru. Fel rhan o hynny, gall pensïynwyr yng Nghymru gael cyngor am daliadau tanwydd gaeaf gan ddesg gymorth a redir gan yr asiantaeth bensïynau, ac mae arian ar gael hefyd drwy gyllid y targed lleihau allyriadau carbon, y gallant ei gael drwy eu cyflenwr ynni. Yr ydym yn gwneud popeth a allwn yn yr hinsawdd bresennol i gefnogi ac i helpu pobl i warchod eu hiechyd a chadw'n gynnes.

Yr ail fater sydd wedi'i fynegi'n hollol eglur yw mater cydraddoldeb—soniodd ychydig o Aelodau, gan gynnwys Nick, Mark a Janet, am hynny. Hoffwn ddweud gair am y cynllun cydraddoldeb sengl. Mae materion cydraddoldeb pobl hŷn wedi'u cynnwys yn y cynllun, a chrybwyllwyd hynny yng ngwelliant 3 gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Mae'r cynllun cydraddoldeb sengl yn cyfeirio at gonfensiwn y Cenhedloedd Unedig ar hawliau pobl hŷn ac mae ymrwymïadau penodol yn y cynllun ynglŷn â'r strategaeth pobl hŷn, y monitor lles pobl hŷn, Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru, ac ymrwymïad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru

commitment as an age-positive employer. Individual departments have made commitments on equality for older people: the Department for the Economy and Transport monitors start-up business support for disadvantaged groups, including people over 50, and regeneration projects also target that age group; the department with responsibility for housing has a separate housing strategy; and the Department for Health and Social Services has specific targets to improve the health and wellbeing of older people.

The third main issue is dignity in care. On what has been said about abuse of the elderly, I will repeat what I have often said before, namely that it is intolerable—it should not be tolerated at all, in any circumstances. I had a useful meeting with Action on Elder Abuse. That charity was able to bring to my attention some important issues, which I am considering, and I look forward to meeting its representatives again.

There are some other issues to mention. Nick, you seem to be apologising for being a younger older people's champion, but I see nothing wrong with that. Perhaps we could get together to discuss the further development of the intergenerational strategy that we have at the Assembly. Thank you for bringing up that issue.

Eleanor also talked about abuse. I am about to publish the findings of the University of Glamorgan's work on the review of 'In Safe Hands'. As part of that, there will also be an assessment of the researchers' opinion as to whether we need further legislation. Janet, Nick and Eleanor mentioned the benefits system. There is nothing to stop the commissioner from taking up non-devolved issues or from meeting with Westminster Ministers.

I take your point, Janet, about figures and perhaps we can send that message to Ruth Marks. We must bear in mind, at all times,

fel cyflogwr cadarnhaol o safbwynt oed. Mae adrannau unigol wedi gwneud ymrwymïadau ar gydraddoldeb i bobl hŷn: mae Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn monitro'r cymorth i ddechrau busnes i grwpiau o dan anfantais, gan gynnwys pobl dros 50, ac mae prosiectau adfywio'n targedu'r grŵp oedran hwnnw hefyd; mae gan yr adran sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros dai strategaeth dai ar wahân; ac mae gan yr Adran Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol dargedau penodol ar gyfer gwella iechyd a lles pobl hŷn.

Y trydydd prif fater yw urddas mewn gofal. Ynghylch yr hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud am gam-drin yr henoed, ailadroddaf yr hyn yr wyf wedi'i ddweud droeon o'r blaen, sef na ellir ei oddef—ni ddylid ei oddef o gwbl, o dan unrhyw amgylchiadau. Cefais gyfarfod buddiol gyda Gweithredu ar Gam-drin yr Henoed. Gallodd yr elusen honno ddwyn i'm sylw rai materion pwysig, yr wyf yn eu hystyried, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gwrdd â'i chynrychiolwyr eto.

Mae rhai materion eraill i'w crybwyll. Nick, yr ydych fel pe baech yn ymddiheuro am fod yn eiriolwr iau dros bobl hŷn, ond ni welaf ddim o'i le ar hynny. Efallai y gallem ddod at ein gilydd i drafod datblygu ymhellach y strategaeth i bontio'r cenedlaethau sydd gennym yn y Cynulliad. Diolch ichi am godi'r mater hwnnw.

Siaradodd Eleanor hefyd am gam-drin. Yr wyf ar fin cyhoeddi canfyddiadau gwaith Prifysgol Morgannwg ynghylch adolygu 'Mewn Dwylo Diogel'. Fel rhan o hynny, bydd asesiad hefyd o farn yr ymchwilyr ynghylch a oes arnom angen mwy o ddeddfwriaeth. Soniodd Janet, Nick ac Eleanor am y system fudd-daliadau. Nid oes dim byd i atal y comisiynydd rhag mynd i'r afael â materion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli na rhag cyfarfod â Gweinidogion San Steffan.

Derbyniaf eich pwynt, Janet, ynghlŷn â ffigurau, ac efallai y gallwn anfon y neges honno at Ruth Marks. Rhaid inni gofio bob

that this post is independent, and must be so. When I talked about having a solid start, Andrew, I was simply referring to the fact that this is a new post, and that having such a solid start at this early stage does augur well. Again, I thank you all and wish the commissioner well in her work next year. I know that we will look forward to debating her next report.

amser mai swydd annibynnol yw hon, ac felly y mae'n rhaid iddi fod. Pan soniais am gael dechrau da, Andrew, cyfeirio yr oeddwn at y ffaith mai swydd newydd yw hon, a bod cael dechrau mor dda yn gynnar yn argoeli'n dda. Eto, diolch ichi i gyd a dymunaf yn dda i'r comisiynydd yn ei gwaith y flwyddyn nesaf. Gwn y byddwn yn edrych ymlaen at drafod ei hadroddiad nesaf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that amendment 1 be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is. Therefore, the votes will be deferred until voting time.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriwn y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.25 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.25 p.m.*

**Dadl Cyfnod 3 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.57 ar y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch  
Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru)  
Stage 3 Standing Order No. 23.57 Debate on the Proposed Social Care Charges  
(Wales) Measure**

**Y Llywydd:** Dyma sesiwn ddeddfu gyntaf y Cynulliad eleni. Cyn inni ddechrau, hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau y byddwn yn trafod y gwelliannau yn unol â'r rhestr grwpio—mae pum grŵp wedi'u cymeradwyo—ond yn pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau yn unol â'r rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli.

**The Presiding Officer:** This is the first legislative session in the Assembly this year. Before we begin, I wish to remind Members that we will debate the amendments in accordance with the groupings list—five groups have been approved—but vote on the amendments in accordance with the marshalled list.

**Dyletswyddau Gweinidogion Cymru mewn Perthynas â Rheoliadau  
(Gwelliannau 11 a 15)  
Welsh Ministers' Duties in Relation to Regulations (Amendments 11 and 15)**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r grŵp cyntaf o welliannau'n ymwneud â dyletswyddau Gweinidogion Cymru mewn perthynas â rheoliadau.

**The Presiding Officer:** The first group of amendments relates to Welsh Ministers' duties in relation to regulations.

Y prif welliant yn y grŵp hwn yw gwelliant 11. Galwaf ar Andrew R.T. Davies i gynnig a siarad am y prif welliant a siarad am y gwelliant arall yn y grŵp.

The lead amendment in this group is amendment 11. I call on Andrew R.T. Davies to move and speak to the lead amendment and speak to the other amendment in the group.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I move amendments 11 and 15 in my name.

The amendment places an obligation on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that no-one will be worse off as a result of this proposed Measure. Surely that must be an aspiration of any Measure, particularly when you are dealing with the most vulnerable people in society. When you look back at the evidence presented to Legislation Committee No. 5, many organisations felt that there was a danger that certain local authorities would see this, not as a lever to bring costs down, but as a lever to move costs up.

When the Deputy Minister provided evidence to the committee, she talked of the first-steps package, which would cost £11 million. There was some discussion as to exactly how much this proposed Measure would cost, when the Welsh Local Government Association provided evidence that it believed that it would cost £14 million. Before we even start, there is a dilemma over cost and how much it is likely to cost. Therefore, we believe that by inserting the text of amendment 11 into the proposed Measure, it will provide security for people by assuring them that they will be no worse off because of it.

Sadly, because of the limited nature of the legislative competence Order, we could go no further than to 'aim' to ensure this because the LCO's scope was not sufficiently wide enough to enable the wording of our amendment to be stronger. I hope that Members will be confident that our amendment will provide that security for people in Wales, once this proposed Measure becomes law. I hope that the Deputy Minister will reflect on the evidence provided to the committee and will seek to adopt this amendment so that people will not believe that they will be worse off because of the proposed Measure.

Importantly, amendment 15 will ensure that people have confidence that the powers, as

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cynigiaf welliannau 11 a 15 yn fy enw i.

Mae'r gwelliant yn gosod dyletswydd ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau na fydd neb yn waeth eu byd o ganlyniad i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Rhaid i hynny fod yn nod i unrhyw Fesur, siawns, yn enwedig pan ydych yn delio â'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas. O edrych yn ôl ar y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 5, teimlai llawer o sefydliadau fod perygl y byddai rhai awdurdodau lleol yn gweld hyn, nid fel modd i ostwng costau, ond fel modd i godi costau.

Pan roddodd y Dirprwy Weinidog dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, siaradodd am y pecyn camau cyntaf, a fyddai'n costio £11 miliwn. Cafwyd cryn drafod ynghylch faint yn union y byddai'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn ei gostio, pan roddodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru dystiolaeth ei bod yn credu y byddai'n costio £14 miliwn. Cyn inni hyd yn oed ddechrau, mae cyfyng gyngor ynghylch y gost a faint y mae'n debygol o'i gostio. Felly, credwn wrth osod testun gwelliant 11 yn y Mesur arfaethedig, y bydd yn rhoi sicrwydd i bobl, drwy eu sicrhau na fyddant yn waeth eu byd o'i herwydd.

Yn anffodus, oherwydd natur gyfyngedig y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol, ni allem fynd ddim pellach nag 'anelu' at sicrhau hyn oherwydd nad oedd cwmpas y Gorchymyn yn ddigon eang i alluogi geirio ein gwelliant yn gryfach. Gobeithio y bydd Aelodau'n hyderus y gwnaiff ein gwelliant roi'r sicrwydd hwnnw i bobl yng Nghymru, wedi i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ddod yn gyfraith. Gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn ystyried y dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd i'r pwyllgor ac y ceisia fabwysiadu'r gwelliant hwn fel na fydd pobl yn credu y byddant yn waeth eu byd oherwydd y Mesur arfaethedig.

Yn bwysig, bydd gwelliant 15 yn sicrhau bod gan bobl hyder y bydd y pwerau, fel y'u



proposed in the proposed Measure, will not only lie with the Minister, in that he or she will have to refer back to the Assembly and there will be checks and balances to ensure that we can see what is going on, via annual reporting and a review of the regulations. This is a critical component of legislation, in that we do not believe that once we have passed legislation we have finished the job; we see it as a work in progress. It is our job, as elected Members, to ensure that we can have the confidence that Welsh Ministers will return to Plenary to provide a regular update on the effectiveness of the proposed Measure and the protection that it affords. With those thoughts in mind, I hope that Members will look favourably on amendments 11 and 15 that we have tabled.

**Peter Black:** We support Andrew R.T. Davies with regard to these amendments. The two amendments that we have before us in this group go to the heart of the concerns that we have about this proposed Measure. Although we support the need to reduce the charges that individuals pay for care at their home, we are concerned about two particular issues.

4.30 p.m.

The first is that the maximum charge that the Deputy Minister will impose will become the standard charge around Wales. There are two local authorities that currently charge less than the £50 that has been indicated at the moment. I would not be surprised if both of those local authorities increase their charges to £50 immediately so that they will be charging at the level that the Deputy Minister has now set for the charge. In those two local authority areas, people receiving care will therefore see a substantial increase in the amount that they have to pay for their care. In the other 20 authorities, there will be a reduction.

The other issue is the need to review this regularly and to involve Assembly Members in that review, and not have that take place in

cynigir yn y Mesur arfaethedig, nid gan y Gweinidog yn unig, ond y bydd yn rhaid iddo ef neu iddi hi gyfeirio'n ôl at y Cynulliad ac y bydd rhwystrau a gwrthbwysau er mwyn sicrhau y gallwn weld beth sy'n digwydd, drwy adroddiadau blynyddol a thrwy adolygu'r rheoliadau. Mae hyn yn elfen hollbwysig o ddeddfwriaeth, gan na chredwn, wedi inni basio deddfwriaeth, y byddwn wedi cwblhau'r gwaith; i ni, gwaith sy'n mynd yn ei flaen ydyw. Ein swydd ni, fel Aelodau etholedig, yw sicrhau y gallwn fod yn hyderus y daw Gweinidogion Cymru'n ôl i'r Cyfarfod Llawn i roi diweddariad rheolaidd ar effeithiolrwydd y Mesur arfaethedig a'r warchodaeth a gynigir ganddo. O ystyried hynny, gobeithio yr edrycha'r Aelodau'n ffafriol ar welliannau 11 a 15 a gyflwynwyd gennym.

**Peter Black:** Cefnogwn Andrew R.T. Davies ynglŷn â'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae'r ddau welliant sydd ger ein bron yn y grŵp hwn yn mynd at wraidd y pryderon sydd gennym ynghylch y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Er ein bod yn cefnogi'r angen i leihau'r ffioedd a godir ar unigolion am ofal yn eu cartref, yr ydym yn bryderus am ddau fater arbennig.

Y cyntaf yw mai'r ffi uchaf a bennir gan y Dirprwy Weinidog fydd y ffi safonol a godir drwy Gymru. Mae dau awdurdod lleol sydd ar hyn o bryd yn codi llai na'r £50 sydd wedi'i grybwyll yn awr. Ni synnwn pe bai'r ddau awdurdod lleol hynny'n cynyddu eu ffioedd i £50 yn syth er mwyn codi tâl ar y lefel y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog bellach wedi'i phennu ar gyfer y ffi. Yn y ddwy ardal awdurdod lleol hyn, bydd pobl sy'n derbyn gofal yn gweld cynnydd sylweddol, felly, yn y swm y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei dalu am eu gofal. Yn yr 20 awdurdod arall, aiff y tâl i lawr.

Y mater arall yw'r angen i adolygu hyn yn rheolaidd a chynnwys Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn yr adolygiad hwnnw, yn hytrach na bod

the rarefied heights of a ministerial office only. There has been a great deal of unease in local government in particular about the sustainability of the regime that the Deputy Minister is proposing. The Deputy Minister will be funding the extra costs incurred by local authorities in reducing their charges to the proposed maximum charge. I accept that, at some stage, there will be an agreement with the Welsh Local Government Association as to what that total cost will be. No doubt both parties will not be entirely happy, but there will be a reasonable compromise and everyone will go away and work with it.

However, that relates to this year. What will happen next year and the year after? Will there be an inflationary increase in the amount of money being made available to local councils? How sustainable is the funding that is being put into this proposal? The Deputy Minister proposes to use the joint working grant, or to abolish that grant, which has been in place for seven years, to pay for this cost. That grant funds a number of long-term and valuable schemes. Most local authorities have been working on the assumption that that money would be available for some considerable time. They have now been disabused of that. What is to say that this will not go the same way in a few years' time and that local authorities will have to find substantial sums of money to meet the cost resulting from the funding being withdrawn?

Therefore, I think that what is proposed in both these amendments is reasonable. The first aims to avoid people becoming worse off as a result of this proposed Measure, and makes that a duty placed on the Minister on the face of the proposed Measure. The second provides that there should be a review every three years that the Assembly can scrutinise in some detail so that we can be satisfied that the regime is working properly, both in the interests of carers and those they are caring for, and also to ensure that the Assembly is not cutting the budget of local government

hynny'n digwydd yn uchelfannau dethol swyddfa Gweinidog yn unig. Bu llawer o anesmwythyd o fewn llywodraeth leol yn arbennig ynglŷn â chynaliadwyedd y drefn y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ei chynnig. Bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn talu'r costau ychwanegol a ddaw i ran awdurdodau lleol wrth iddynt ostwng eu ffioedd i'r ffi uchaf arfaethedig. Derbyniaf y bydd cytundeb, ryw dro, â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynghylch beth fydd y gost honno'n gyfan gwbl. Mae'n siŵr na fydd y naill ochr na'r llall yn gwbl hapus, ond bydd cyfaddawd rhesymol ac aiff pawb i ffwrdd a gweithio gyda hwnnw.

Fodd bynnag, mater i eleni yw hynny. Beth a fydd yn digwydd y flwyddyn nesaf a'r flwyddyn wedyn? A fydd cynnydd yn unol â chwyddiant yn yr arian a fydd ar gael i gynghorau lleol? Pa mor gynaliadwy yw'r cyllid sy'n cael ei roi at y cynnig hwn? Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn cynnig defnyddio'r grant cydweithio, neu ddiddymu'r grant hwnnw, sydd yn bodoli ers saith mlynedd, i dalu am y gost hon. Mae'r grant hwnnw'n ariannu nifer o gynlluniau hirdymor a gwerthfawr. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn gweithio ar sail y dybiaeth y byddai'r arian hwnnw ar gael am gyfnod tra sylweddol. Maent bellach wedi'u dadrithio ynglŷn â hynny. Pa sicrwydd sydd na fydd yr un peth yn digwydd ynglŷn â hyn ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd a bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ganfod symiau sylweddol o arian i dalu'r gost yn sgîl tynnu'r cyllid yn ôl?

Felly, credaf fod yr hyn a gynigir yn y ddau welliant hyn yn rhesymol. Nod y cyntaf yw osgoi rhoi pobl mewn sefyllfa waeth o ganlyniad i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn, a gwna hynny ar ffurf dyletswydd a osodir ar y Gweinidog yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae'r ail yn golygu y dylid cynnal adolygiad bob tair blynedd, y gall y Cynulliad graffu arno'n fanwl, er mwyn inni allu bod yn sicr bod y drefn yn gweithio'n iawn, er budd gofaluwr a'r rhai y maent yn gofalu amdanynt, a hefyd er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'r Cynulliad yn cwtogi cyllideb llywodraeth leol ac yn

and spending its own money elsewhere, as often happens.

**The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I will speak first to amendment 11. As I have said previously, I recognise the concerns that have prompted this amendment. However, I do not believe that the amendment is an appropriate way of addressing these concerns. Moreover, I believe that the proposed Measure already provides local authorities with the means required to ensure that service users are dealt with fairly and are not required to pay more than it would be reasonable for them to pay.

The clear objective of the proposed Measure is to improve the position of all service users across Wales and, in particular, to ensure greater consistency and fairness. The regulations will help to put in place a fairer and more consistent charging structure. However, the actual charge that will be made in respect of particular individuals will be determined by the local authority concerned, having regard to a variety of factors. These will include the proposed Measure and regulations made under it. However, they will also include the authority's own charging policies and, most importantly, the financial position of the individual concerned. Consequently, it is not feasible or appropriate to include, in the way proposed in the amendment, a specific requirement concerning possible changes in the financial position of each and every service user in Wales.

Furthermore, we must not forget that local authorities will retain the discretion to charge less than they might otherwise charge if a proposed change in a person's charges would cause particular problems for that individual. The proposed Measure also provides for a new review process for challenging charging decisions. This process will be common to all authorities and it is intended to provide a quick, easy-to-understand and accessible means of challenge. This procedure will exist outside of and in addition to the current social

gwario'i arian ei hun yn rhywle arall, fel sy'n digwydd yn aml.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Siaradaf yn gyntaf am welliant 11. Fel y dywedais eisoes, yr wyf yn cydnabod y pryderon sydd wedi ysgogi'r gwelliant hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu bod y gwelliant yn ffordd briodol o ymateb i'r pryderon hyn. Yn fwy na hynny, credaf fod y Mesur arfaethedig eisoes yn darparu i awdurdodau lleol y modd gofynnol i sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n deg ac na ofynnir iddynt dalu mwy nag y byddai'n rhesymol iddynt ei dalu.

Amcan clir y Mesur arfaethedig yw gwella sefyllfa pob defnyddiwr gwasanaethau ar draws Cymru ac, yn arbennig, sicrhau mwy o gysondeb a thegwch. Bydd y rheoliadau'n helpu i sefydlu strwythur tecach a mwy cyson ar gyfer codi ffioedd. Fodd bynnag, yr awdurdod lleol ei hun a fydd yn pennu'r union ffi a godir ar unigolion penodol, gan roi ystyriaeth i amryw o ffactorau. Bydd y rhain yn cynnwys y Mesur arfaethedig a rheoliadau a wneir o dan y Mesur. Fodd bynnag, byddant hefyd yn cynnwys polisiâu'r awdurdod ei hun ar godi ffioedd ac, yn bwysicaf oll, sefyllfa ariannol yr unigolyn dan sylw. Felly, nid yw'n ymarferol nac yn briodol cynnwys, yn y modd a gynigir yn y gwelliant, gofyniad penodol ynglŷn â newidiadau posibl yn sefyllfa ariannol pob un defnyddiwr gwasanaethau yng Nghymru.

At hynny, rhaid inni gofio y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn cadw'r hawl i godi llai nag y byddent yn ei godi fel arall pe bai newid arfaethedig yn ffioedd rhywun yn achosi problemau arbennig i'r unigolyn hwnnw. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn darparu hefyd ar gyfer proses adolygu newydd er mwyn herio penderfyniadau ynghylch codi ffioedd. Bydd y broses hon yn gyffredin i bob awdurdod a bwriedir iddi ddarparu modd o herio sy'n gyflym, yn hawdd ei ddeall ac yn hawdd ei ddefnyddio. Bydd y drefn hon yn

services complaints procedure.

bodoli y tu allan i drefn gwynion bresennol y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac yn ychwanegol ati.

I have previously made the committee aware that the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales is currently reviewing eligibility criteria in Wales. That is crucial to ensuring that we not only have a fairer charging regime, but have fairness and consistency in the assessment of eligibility.

Yr wyf wedi hysbysu'r pwyllgor o'r blaen fod Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru'n adolygu meini prawf cymhwysedd yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig i sicrhau nid yn unig y cawn drefn decach o godi ffioedd, ond y bydd tegwch a chysondeb wrth asesu cymhwysedd.

I have already spoken of my plans to introduce a first steps improvement package, should the proposed Measure be made, and I have announced my intention to introduce a maximum charge of £50 a week. I believe that these are positive steps that will improve the position of service users across Wales considerably.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am fy nghynlluniau i gyflwyno pecyn gwella camau cyntaf, pe bai'r Mesur arfaethedig yn cael ei basio, ac yr wyf wedi cyhoeddi fy mwriad i gyflwyno ffi uchaf o £50 yr wythnos. Credaf fod y rhain yn gamau cadarnhaol a fydd yn gwella sefyllfa defnyddwyr gwasanaethau ledled Cymru'n sylweddol.

With regard to amendment 15, I have said previously that I agree unreservedly that legislation needs to be kept under review as a matter of good governance. For this reason, I fully intend that the operation and effect of any regulations made under the Measure will be kept under review and amended as and when appropriate.

Ynglŷn â gwelliant 15, yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen fy mod yn cytuno'n llwyr fod angen cadw golwg ar ddeddfwriaeth fel mater o lywodraethu da. Am y rheswm hwn, yr wyf yn llwyr fwriadu i weithrediad ac effaith unrhyw reoliadau a wneir o dan y Mesur gael eu hadolygu a'u diwygio fel sy'n briodol.

I do not believe, however, that the proposal in the amendment, requiring an annual review and report on the regulations, is necessary or desirable. Such a rigid system is not the most effective way of ensuring that legislation is kept under review and that timely changes are made when appropriate.

Ni chredaf, fodd bynnag, fod y cynnig yn y gwelliant, sy'n gofyn am adolygiad ac adroddiad blynyddol ar y rheoliadau, yn angenrheidiol nac yn ddymunol. Nid system mor anhyblyg â hynny yw'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol o sicrhau bod deddfwriaeth yn cael ei hadolygu a bod newidiadau amserol yn cael eu gwneud pan fo'n briodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Andrew R.T. Davies, I assume that you wish to move to a vote on this amendment. I see that you do.

**Y Llywydd:** Andrew R.T. Davies, cymeraf eich bod yn dymuno symud i bleidlais ar y gwelliant hwn. Gwelaf eich bod.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you, Presiding Officer.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch, Lywydd.

It is a matter of regret to hear that the Deputy Minister is not prepared to support amendments 11 and 15, both of which seek to improve the proposed Measure, as identified

Testun gofid yw clywed nad yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn barod i gefnogi gwelliannau 11 a 15, sydd ill dau'n ceisio gwella'r Mesur arfaethedig, fel y nodwyd gan Peter Black a

by Peter Black and me in our comments. Time and again, I have sat in this Chamber, listening to various proposed Measures go through, and have heard Ministers say 'I, I, I'. I have every confidence that the current Deputy Minister shares the aspirations that we have on this side of the Chamber for this proposed Measure. However, Ministers move on, and situations develop. How can we be confident that a future Minister will review the legislation or allow scrutiny of it to assess the implications and consequences for people on a regular basis? Amendment 15 seeks to place such an obligation on the Minister, should a future Minister seek to jeopardise it otherwise. I implore the Deputy Minister to consider that she might not be in post forever and that there will be subsequent Ministers. The amendment that we on this side of the Chamber have tabled seeks to offer AMs of all parties the opportunity to review the impact of this legislation on people's lives.

Amendment 11 is based on evidence that was received by the legislation committee from various organisations that came forward to point out the risk of local authorities levelling upwards, which Peter Black mentioned. Two authorities, one of them in my regional constituency, charge a considerably lower rate than other authorities. If they see £50 as the bottom line, rather than the ceiling, the consequence for many people is that they will be penalised as a result of the proposed Measure, which is something that I am sure that the Deputy Minister and all Assembly Members would not wish to see happen.

It is with regret, but not surprise, that I have heard the Minister state that she will reject both amendments in this group.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 11. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, ac felly galwaf am bleidlais.

minnau yn ein sylwadau. Dro ar ôl tro, yr wyf wedi eistedd yn y Siambr hon, yn gwranddo ar amryfal Fesurau arfaethedig yn mynd drwodd, ac wedi clywed Gweinidogion yn dweud 'fi, fi, fi'. Yr wyf yn hollol ffyddiog bod gan y Dirprwy Weinidog presennol yr un dyheadau ag sydd gennym ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr ar gyfer y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Fodd bynnag, symud ymlaen y mae Gweinidogion, ac mae sefyllfaoedd yn datblygu. Sut y gallwn fod yn hyderus y gwnaiff Gweinidog yn y dyfodol adolygu'r ddeddfwriaeth neu ganiatáu craffu arni i asesu'r goblygiadau a'r canlyniadau i bobl yn rheolaidd? Mae gwelliant 15 yn ceisio rhoi dyletswydd o'r fath ar y Gweinidog, pe bai Gweinidog yn y dyfodol yn ceisio'i pheryglu fel arall. Erfyniaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog ystyried efallai na fydd hi yn y swydd am byth ac y daw Gweinidogion ar ei hôl. Mae'r gwelliant yr ydym ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr wedi'i gyflwyno'n ceisio cynnig i ACau o bob plaid y cyfle i adolygu effaith y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar fywydau pobl.

Mae gwelliant 11 yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth a gafodd y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth oddi wrth amryfal gyrff a ddaeth gerbron i nodi'r perygl y byddai awdurdodau lleol yn lefelu tuag i fyny, fel y crybwyllodd Peter Black. Mae dau awdurdod, un ohonynt yn fy etholaeth ranbarthol i, yn codi ffi is o lawer nag awdurdodau eraill. Os gwelant yr £50 fel y tâl arferol, yn hytrach na'r terfyn uchaf, y canlyniad i lawer o bobl yw y cânt eu cosbi yn sgîl y Mesur arfaethedig, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai'r Dirprwy Weinidog a holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dymuno ei weld yn digwydd.

Gyda gofid, ond nid syndod, y clywais y Gweinidog yn dweud y bydd hi'n gwrthod y naill welliant a'r llall yn y grŵp hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 11 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, and therefore I call for a vote.

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 11: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 11.  
Amendment 11 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Deuwn at y bleidlais ar welliant 15 yn ei dro.

**The Presiding Officer:** We will come to the vote on amendment 15 in due course.

**Y Weithdrefn ar gyfer Gwneud Is-ddeddfwriaeth (Gwelliannau 1, 9 ac 16)  
Procedure for Making Subordinate Legislation (Amendments 1, 9 and 16)**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ail grŵp yn ymwneud â'r weithdrefn ar gyfer is-ddeddfwriaeth. Y prif welliant yw gwelliant 1. Galwaf ar Peter Black i gynnig y gwelliant.

**The Presiding Officer:** The second group is on the procedure for making subordinate legislation. The lead amendment is amendment 1. I call on Peter Black to move the amendment.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 1 tabled in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Mick Bates.

4.40 p.m.

This amendment is designed to strengthen the

Amcan y gwelliant hwn yw cryfhau grym

democratic power of the Assembly to make crucial decisions that relate to policy in Wales, as well as the financing of Government. For example, making regulations that decide what the maximum charge should be involves a complex and weighty decision, and the proposed Measure gives a wide range of powers to the Minister to make decisions that have far greater consequences than the passing of this enabling proposed Measure in itself. We believe that the Assembly should have the power to decide whether or not those regulations should go forward, and have a proper debate on them. That is why we have tabled amendment 1.

Regulations in sections 2 and 3 should be made subject to the affirmative procedure to ensure that the voice of all of Wales's democratically elected representatives is heard, and to ensure that the Minister can benefit from the sound scrutiny that this Chamber provides.

I am disappointed that the Deputy Minister has tabled amendment 9, which seeks to negate an amendment made at Stage 2 on letting the Assembly have an input into which persons and services should not have a charge levied against them. Alun Davies and Lesley Griffiths supported that amendment, and I am sure that they are as disappointed as I am that the Deputy Minister has decided to expunge that progress. I hope that other Members will join me to keep the amendment that was passed at the committee stage in the proposed Measure.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We will support the amendments in group 2. The Deputy Minister said earlier that she would ensure that the regulations would be kept under review, but this is not just about ensuring that regulations are kept under review; we must be certain that there is proper scrutiny and consultation about draft regulations before they are brought into force. If we refer back to the Stage 1 report, the evidence given was clear. All witnesses agreed that there should be detailed consultation on the proposed

democrataidd y Cynulliad i wneud penderfyniadau allweddol ynglŷn â pholisi yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â'r modd yr ariennir y Llywodraeth. Er enghraifft, mae gwneud rheoliadau sy'n pennu beth y dylai'r ffi uchaf fod yn gofyn am benderfyniad cymhleth a phwysfawr, ac mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn rhoi amrediad eang o bwerau i'r Gweinidog i wneud penderfyniadau ac iddynt ganlyniadau llawer mwy pellgyrhaeddol na phasio'r Mesur galluogi arfaethedig hwn ynddo'i hun. Credwn y dylai'r Cynulliad gael y pŵer i benderfynu a ddylai'r rheoliadau hynny fynd yn eu blaen ai peidio, a chael dadl iawn arnynt. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno gwelliant 1.

Dylai rheoliadau yn adrannau 2 a 3 fod yn amodol ar y weithdrefn gadarnhaol er mwyn sicrhau y clywir llais holl gynrychiolwyr etholedig democrataidd Cymru, ac i sicrhau y gall y Gweinidog elwa o'r craffu cadarn a ddarperir gan y Siambr hon.

Yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Dirprwy Weinidog wedi cyflwyno gwelliant 9, sy'n ceisio negyddu gwelliant a wnaethpwyd yng Nghyfnod 2 ynghylch gadael i'r Cynulliad gael mewnbwn ynghylch pa bersonau a gwasanaethau na ddylid codi ffi arnynt. Cefnogodd Alun Davies a Lesley Griffiths y gwelliant hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod hwythau mor siomedig â mi fod y Dirprwy Weinidog wedi penderfynu dileu'r cynnydd hwnnw. Gobeithio yr ymuna Aelodau eraill â mi i gadw'r gwelliant a basiwyd yng ngham y pwyllgor yn y Mesur arfaethedig.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cefnogwn y gwelliannau yng ngrŵp 2. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn gynharach y byddai'n sicrhau y byddai'r rheoliadau'n cael eu hadolygu, ond nid mater o sicrhau bod y rheoliadau'n cael eu hadolygu'n unig yw hyn; rhaid inni fod yn sicr bod craffu ac ymgynghori priodol ynghylch rheoliadau drafft cyn dod â hwy i rym. Os cyfeiriwn yn ôl at yr adroddiad Cyfnod 1, yr oedd y dystiolaeth a roddwyd yn glir. Cytunai pob tyst y dylid cael ymgynghori manwl ar y rheoliadau

regulations and the maximum charging level—the Deputy Minister referred to charging levels earlier. We must ensure that the Assembly has the ability to scrutinise legislation. If we are here to do a job as a legislature that involves looking at the detail of regulations, it is not good enough for Measures to give Ministers wide-ranging powers that limit the ability of the Assembly to examine regulations. These amendments are critical.

As Peter Black pointed out, members of the coalition Government on the committee agreed with its recommendation that there should be a strengthening of the Assembly's opportunity to scrutinise and decide on the appropriateness of Welsh Ministers' proposals. Therefore, I ask those Members who served on the committee and who listened to the evidence to support these amendments, because without them the ability of the Assembly and its committees to examine this legislation in future will be severely hampered.

**Gwenda Thomas:** With regard to amendment 1, I note the Member's concerns about the use of the negative procedure. However, I believe that this is the appropriate procedure for these regulations. I reiterate the point that I made previously about the importance of ensuring the flexibility required to review and revise the regulations governing any maximum charge. Changes will need to be made to any maximum charge on a regular basis, having regard to financial matters such as relevant financial indices. I believe that such matters are best dealt with in regulations, and that the negative procedure is the most appropriate procedure for such regulations.

Amendment 16 has no legal effect on the provisions of section 10 of the proposed Measure, and is, I believe, intended to be read together with amendment 1; perhaps you will want to confirm that. As I have already said, amendment 1 seeks to provide that regulations concerning maximum charges in

arfaethedig a lefel y ffioedd uchaf—cyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Weinidog at lefelau ffioedd yn gynharach. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan y Cynulliad y gallu i graffu ar ddeddfwriaeth. Os ydym yma i gyflawni gwaith fel deddfwrfa sy'n golygu edrych ar fanylion rheoliadau, nid yw'n ddigon da i Fesurau roi pwerau eang i Weinidogion sy'n cyfyngu ar allu'r Cynulliad i archwilio rheoliadau. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn dyngedfennol.

Fel y nododd Peter Black, yr oedd aelodau o'r Llywodraeth glymblaid a oedd ar y pwyllgor yn cytuno â'i argymhellid y dylid cryfhau'r cyfle i'r Cynulliad graffu a phenderfynu ar briodoldeb cynigion Gweinidogion Cymru. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Aelodau hynny a wasanaethodd ar y pwyllgor ac a wrandawodd ar y dystiolaeth gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn, oherwydd hebddynt amherir yn ddifrifol ar allu'r Cynulliad a'i bwyllgorau i archwilio'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn y dyfodol.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Ynglŷn â gwelliant 1, nodaf bryderon yr Aelod ynglŷn â defnyddio'r weithdrefn negyddol. Fodd bynnag, credaf mai dyma'r weithdrefn briodol ar gyfer y rheoliadau hyn. Ailadroddaf y pwynt a wneuthum yn flaenorol ynghylch pwysigrwydd sicrhau'r hyblygrwydd angenrheidiol i adolygu a diwygio'r rheoliadau ynglŷn ag unrhyw ffi uchaf. Bydd angen gwneud newidiadau mewn unrhyw ffi uchaf yn rheolaidd, gan ystyried materion ariannol fel y mynegeion ariannol perthnasol. Credaf ei bod yn well ymdrin â materion o'r fath o fewn rheoliadau, ac mai'r weithdrefn negyddol yw'r weithdrefn fwyaf addas ar gyfer rheoliadau o'r fath.

Ni chaiff gwelliant 16 effaith gyfreithiol ar ddarpariaethau adran 10 yn y Mesur arfaethedig, a chredaf y bwriedir iddo gael ei ddarllen ynghyd â gwelliant 1; efallai yr hoffech gadarnhau hynny. Fel y dywedais eisoes, mae gwelliant 1 yn ceisio darparu y bydd rheoliadau ynglŷn â ffioedd uchaf yn



section 2 shall be subject to the affirmative procedure. Members will note that, in the main, regulations made under the other sections of the proposed Measure will be subject to the negative procedure. That is because they will be primarily concerned with the financial and administrative arrangements governing the operation of a revised charging regime, and, as such, will need to be updated regularly.

I believe that these matters can be appropriately dealt with in regulations, and that the negative procedure is the usual and most appropriate procedure for such regulations. It is also important to remember that any regulations that we make under this proposed Measure will be subject to public consultation, in accordance with the Assembly Government's usual consultation process, and will be informed by further discussions with relevant stakeholders. There is no question of regulations being made without proper engagement with stakeholders.

Amendment 9 would remove the recently inserted section 3(4) from the proposed Measure, thereby reinstating our intention that regulations made under section 3(1) are to be subject to the negative procedure. I am aware that some Members are concerned that the exclusion of certain services or categories of persons could have equality implications, and they have argued that the regulations should therefore be subject to the affirmative procedure. However, I have previously explained my reasoning on this and I remain of the view that the negative procedure is the most appropriate one. I can assure Members that the Welsh Assembly Government is fully aware of its equality duties and the need to have regard to issues of equality when determining policy and making legislation. I have made it clear that we are committed to carrying out a full equality and human rights assessment as part of the regulation-making process, and that the assessment will be informed by contributions from representatives of the Equality and Human Rights Commission. I am confident that those

adran 2 yn amodol ar y weithdrefn gadarnhaol. Bydd Aelodau'n sylwi, ar y cyfan, y bydd rheoliadau a wneir o dan adrannau eraill y Mesur arfaethedig yn amodol ar y weithdrefn negyddol, a hynny oherwydd y bydd a wnelont yn bennaf â'r trefniadau ariannol a gweinyddol ar gyfer gweithredu cynllun ffioedd diwygiedig, ac, felly, y bydd angen eu diweddarau'n rheolaidd.

Credaf y gellir delio â'r materion hyn yn briodol mewn rheoliadau, ac mai'r weithdrefn negyddol yw'r weithdrefn arferol a mwyaf priodol ar gyfer rheoliadau o'r fath. Mae'n bwysig cofio hefyd y bydd unrhyw reoliadau a wnawn o dan y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn destun ymgynghori cyhoeddus, yn unol â phroses ymgynghori arferol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac y'u seilir ar drafodaethau pellach gyda rhanddeiliaid perthnasol. Nid fydd yn bosibl gwneud rheoliadau heb ymgysylltu'n briodol â rhanddeiliaid.

Byddai gwelliant 9 yn dileu adran 3(4), a roddwyd yn y Mesur yn ddiweddar, o'r Mesur arfaethedig, gan ailsefydlu felly ein bwriad y bydd rheoliadau a wneir o dan adran 3(1) yn amodol ar y weithdrefn negyddol. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod rhai Aelodau'n bryderus y gallai fod goblygiadau'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb drwy hepgor rhai gwasanaethau neu gategorïau o bobl, ac maent wedi dadlau y dylai'r rheoliadau felly fod yn amodol ar y weithdrefn gadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi esbonio fy rhesymau dros hyn o'r blaen ac yr wyf yn dal o'r farn mai'r weithdrefn negyddol yw'r un fwyaf priodol. Gallaf sicrhau Aelodau fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gwbl ymwybodol o'i dyletswyddau o ran cydraddoldeb a'r angen i ystyried materion cydraddoldeb wrth benderfynu ar bolisi a llunio deddfwriaeth. Yr wyf wedi datgan yn glir ein bod wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni asesiad llawn o safbwynt cydraddoldeb a hawliau dynol fel rhan o'r broses o lunio rheoliadau, ac y gwneir yr asesiad ar sail cyfraniadau gan gynrychiolwyr y Comisiwn

arrangements will enable us to address any equality issues that may arise.

**Peter Black:** I am disappointed with the Deputy Minister's response. We agree that these issues need to be dealt with via regulation. Where we disagree is how those regulations should be treated. The Deputy Minister talks about engagement with stakeholders, consultations and so forth. However, we as Assembly Members are stakeholders in this process as well. While I agree that this is a complex process and one that has implications for a range of different people, all of whom we represent, the Deputy Minister has to understand that any change in the regulations on this issue has financial implications for local government and a number of other bodies. It is only right that, as we have an overview of the budget process, any regulations that have an impact on that should be properly scrutinised by Assembly Members as a matter of course. For that reason, we believe that the affirmative procedure is the most appropriate way of dealing with those particular regulations. I ask Members, therefore, to support this amendment and to oppose amendment 9, which undermines yet another set of changes that the committee made—changes that were quite valid in respect of the Assembly's input to which persons and services should not have a charge levied against them.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn deall eich bod am symud i bleidlais ar welliant 1. Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 1. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly symudwn i bleidlais.

Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y trefniadau hynny'n ein galluogi i ddelio ag unrhyw faterion cydraddoldeb a all godi.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn siomedig ag ymateb y Dirprwy Weinidog. Cytunwn fod angen delio â'r materion hyn drwy reoliadau. Yr hyn yr ydym yn anghytuno ynglŷn ag ef yw sut y dylid trin y rheoliadau hynny. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn sôn am ymgysylltu â rhanddeiliaid, ymgynghori ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym ni fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn rhanddeiliaid yn y broses hon hefyd. Er fy mod yn cytuno bod hon yn broses gymhleth ac yn un y mae iddi oblygiadau i amryw o bobl wahanol, a'r rheini i gyd yn cael eu cynrychioli gennym, rhaid i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ddeall bod gan unrhyw newid yn y rheoliadau ar y mater hwn oblygiadau ariannol i lywodraeth leol a nifer o gyrff eraill. Mae'n hollol briodol, a ninnau'n cael trosolwg ar broses y gyllideb, i unrhyw reoliadau sy'n effeithio ar hynny fod yn destun craffu go iawn gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad fel rhan o'r drefn. Am y rheswm hwnnw, credwn mai'r weithdrefn gadarnhaol yw'r ffordd fwyaf priodol i ddelio â'r rheoliadau arbennig hynny. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau, felly, gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn a gwrthwynebu gwelliant 9, sy'n tanseilio set arall eto fyth o newidiadau a wnaeth y pwyllgor—newidiadau a oedd yn berffaith ddilys o ran mewnbwn y Cynulliad ynglŷn â pha bobl a gwasanaethau na ddylid codi ffi arnynt.

**The Presiding Officer:** I understand that you wish to move to a vote on amendment 1. The question is that amendment 1 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.  
Amendment 1: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 1.  
Amendment 1 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yn unol â'r rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli, symudwn i waredu gwelliant 9, a drafodwyd gyda gwelliant 1. Yr wyf yn gwahodd Gwenda Thomas i gynnig gwelliant 9.

**The Presiding Officer:** In line with the marshalled list, we will now move to dispose of amendment 9, which has been discussed with amendment 1. I invite Gwenda Thomas to move amendment 9.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 9 yn fy enw i.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I move amendment 9 in my name.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 9. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 9 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore, we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.  
Amendment 9: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 9.  
Amendment 9 agreed.*

### **Gwybodaeth am Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 3, 2, 4, 5 a 6) Information about Charges (Amendments 3, 2, 4, 5 and 6)**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r trydydd grŵp o welliannau yn ymwneud â gwybodaeth am ffioedd. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp hwn yw gwelliant 3. Galwaf ar Peter Black i gynnig gwelliant 3 ac i siarad am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 3 in the name of Mick Bates.

4.50 p.m.

This proposed Measure creates an upheaval in the way that charging decisions will affect service users across Wales. I believe that everyone should have access to the information that they need in a format that they can understand before they have to pay the charges for the care that is being provided to them.

All of the amendments that are being tabled in this group relate to ensuring that information is available in a number of key

**The Presiding Officer:** The third group of amendments relate to information about charges. I call on Peter Black to move amendment 3 and to speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Mick Bates.

Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn chwyldroi'r modd y bydd penderfyniadau'n ymwneud â chodi ffioedd yn effeithio ar ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Credaf y dylai pawb gael hawl i gael y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen mewn fformat y gallant ei ddeall cyn gorfod talu'r ffioedd am y gofal a ddarperir iddynt.

Mae'r holl welliannau a gyflwynir yn y grŵp hwn yn ymwneud â sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael mewn nifer o fformatau allweddol gan

formats including plain language, in person and easy-to-read formats. That is crucial given that those in receipt of social care are members of society who are most likely to need such information. These formats need to be embedded on the face of the proposed Measure to ensure that this information is available from the first day that it comes into effect.

However, the amendments are not intended to limit how information should be presented, but to provide a basis for social care providers to ensure that information is accessible to all. I believe that these amendments are largely non-controversial, and I hope that plain language and good communication is a principle that we can all sign up to. Therefore, I hope that the Assembly will support these amendments.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** In supporting these amendments, it is interesting to note that in the previous debate on the annual report of the older people's commissioner, one of the points raised was about the language used in information to enable people to access services. I believe that the amendments tabled would greatly improve the opportunity, through this proposed Measure, for people to have information that is digestible and informative and, above all, would ensure that people understand what they are entering into and not feel excluded from the process.

It is important that local authorities are obliged to provide information on potential costs of social care in plain language, easy-reading formats or face-to-face. These amendments clearly identify that train of thought. If the Assembly were to agree these amendments today it would greatly enhance the effectiveness of the proposed Measure. As Peter indicated, these amendments do not seem controversial, and I very much hope that the Deputy Minister will be able to recommend the acceptance of these amendments to strengthen this proposed

gynnwys iaith eglur, wyneb yn wyneb a fformatau hawdd eu darllen. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig o gofio mai'r rhai sy'n derbyn gofal cymdeithasol yw'r aelodau yn ein cymdeithas sydd fwyaf tebyg o fod angen gwybodaeth o'r fath. Mae angen i'r fformatau hyn gael eu cynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun i sicrhau y bydd y wybodaeth hon ar gael o'r diwrnod cyntaf y daw i rym.

Fodd bynnag, ni fwriedir i'r gwelliannau gyfyngu'r modd y dylid cyflwyno gwybodaeth, ond darparu sail i ddarparwyr gofal cymdeithasol sicrhau bod gwybodaeth yn hygyrch i bawb. Credaf nad oes fawr sy'n ddadleuol yn y gwelliannau hyn, a gobeithio bod iaith eglur a chyfathrebu da'n egwyddor y gallwn i gyd ei chefnogi. Felly, gobeithio y gwnaiff y Cynulliad gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Wrth gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn, mae'n ddiddorol nodi mai un o'r pwyntiau a godwyd yn y ddadl flaenorol ar adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd pobl hŷn oedd yr iaith a ddefnyddir mewn gwybodaeth i alluogi pobl i gael mynediad at wasanaethau. Credaf y byddai'r gwelliannau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno'n gwella'r cyfle'n fawr, drwy'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn, i bobl gael gwybodaeth sy'n hawdd ei deall ac yn fuddiol ac, yn anad dim, y byddent yn sicrhau bod pobl yn deall yr hyn y maent yn ymrwymo iddo ac na theimlant eu bod wedi'u cau allan o'r broses.

Mae'n bwysig bod rheidrwydd ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu gwybodaeth am gostau posibl gofal cymdeithasol mewn iaith eglur, fformatau hawdd eu darllen neu wyneb yn wyneb. Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn nodi'r meddylfryd hwnnw'n glir. Pe cytunai'r Cynulliad â'r gwelliannau hyn heddiw byddai'n cynyddu effeithiolrwydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn fawr. Fel y nododd Peter, nid ymddengys fod y gwelliannau hyn yn ddadleuol, a gobeithio'n fawr y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn gallu argymhell derbyn y gwelliannau hyn i gryfhau'r Mesur

Measure. That would back-up the rhetoric in the earlier debate on the older people's commissioner report and would not be contrary to what she said a little over an hour ago.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I do not believe that amendments 2, 3 and 4 are necessary or desirable. With regard to amendments 3 and 4, the existing sections 5(1) to 5(3) place a duty on local authorities to provide general information to service users and prospective service users about charges in a range of accessible formats. Section 5(2) clearly specifies the information that local authorities must make arrangements to provide, and section 5(3) requires this to be provided in a range of accessible formats. This must include information in writing, but it could also include the provision of information in plain language, in person and easy-to-read formats.

Amendment 2 seeks to change the duty to require this general charging information to be provided in a range of accessible formats, including in writing, to an obligation to provide information in a range of accessible formats, including, but not limited to, providing it in writing. I do not believe that this amendment is necessary as there is existing provision for information in writing to be provided as one of the accessible formats, and not the only accessible format.

I believe that the existing section 5(3), which places a clear duty on local authorities to provide information about charges in a range of accessible formats, strikes the right balance between ensuring that adequate arrangements are put in place and providing a certain degree of flexibility for local authorities.

With regard to amendments 5 and 6, I am also of the view that these are not necessary or desirable. Section 5(4) clearly specifies the

arfaethedig hwn. Byddai hynny'n ategu'r rhethreg yn y ddadl flaenorol ar adroddiad y comisiynydd pobl hŷn ac ni fyddai'n groes i'r hyn a ddywedodd ychydig dros awr yn ôl.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Nid wyf yn credu bod gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn angenrheidiol nac yn ddymunol. Ynglŷn â gwelliannau 3 a 4, mae'r adrannau 5(1) i 5(3) presennol yn gosod dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu gwybodaeth gyffredinol i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau a darpar ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau ynglŷn â ffioedd mewn amryw o fformatau hygyrch. Mae adran 5(2) yn nodi'n glir y wybodaeth y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol drefnu iddi gael ei darparu, ac mae adran 5(3) yn mynnu ei bod yn cael ei darparu mewn amryw o fformatau hygyrch. Rhaid i hyn gynnwys gwybodaeth ysgrifenedig, ond gallai hefyd gynnwys darparu gwybodaeth mewn iaith eglur, wyneb yn wyneb ac mewn fformatau hawdd eu darllen.

Mae gwelliant 2 yn ceisio newid y ddyletswydd i fynnu bod y wybodaeth gyffredinol hon am ffioedd yn cael ei darparu mewn amryw o fformatau hygyrch, gan gynnwys gwneud hynny'n ysgrifenedig, i rwymedigaeth i ddarparu gwybodaeth mewn amryw o fformatau hygyrch, gan gynnwys ei darparu'n ysgrifenedig, ond heb fod yn gyfyngedig i hynny. Nid wyf yn credu bod angen y gwelliant hwn gan fod darpariaeth yn bodoli eisoes ar gyfer darparu gwybodaeth ysgrifenedig fel un o'r fformatau hygyrch, ac nid yr unig fformat hygyrch.

Credaf fod yr adran 5(3) bresennol, sy'n gosod dyletswydd glir ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu gwybodaeth am ffioedd mewn amryw o fformatau hygyrch, yn cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng sicrhau bod trefniadau digonol yn cael eu rhoi ar waith a darparu rhyw gymaint o hyblygrwydd i awdurdodau lleol.

Ynglŷn â gwelliannau 5 a 6, yr wyf hefyd o'r farn nad oes angen nac eisiau'r rhain. Mae adran 5(4) yn pennu'n glir y wybodaeth y

information that must be included in a written statement of charges and requires this information to be provided in writing, and any other accessible format that a person reasonably requests.

Such accessible formats could include the provision of information in plain language, in person, and in an easy-read format, where requested. As I have explained on previous occasions, I believe that this duty is robust, and have no doubt that it will ensure that service users receive the information that they require about any proposed charges in a format that they will be able to access.

**Peter Black:** What this boils down to is a difference of opinion between us and the Deputy Minister over exactly what is required to ensure that the information is available in an easily understood and accessible format. We all agree that that is a desirable outcome, but we feel quite strongly that it should be made much clearer, on the face of the proposed Measure, that that should be the case. For that reason, we will put the amendment to the vote.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 3. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly symudwn i bleidlais.

mae'n rhaid ei chynnwys mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig o'r ffioedd ac yn mynnu bod y wybodaeth hon yn cael ei darparu'n ysgrifenedig, ac mewn unrhyw fformat hygyrch arall y mae rhywun yn gwneud cais rhesymol amdano.

Gallai fformatau hygyrch o'r fath gynnwys darparu gwybodaeth mewn iaith eglur, wyneb yn wyneb, ac mewn fformat hawdd ei ddarllen, pan fydd cais am hynny. Fel yr wyf wedi esbonio o'r blaen, credaf fod y ddyletswydd hon yn gadarn, ac nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd yn sicrhau bod defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'n cael y wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei heisiau am unrhyw ffioedd arfaethedig mewn fformat y byddant yn gallu ei ddeall.

**Peter Black:** Yn y bôn, yr hyn a geir yma yw gwahaniaeth barn rhyngom ni a'r Dirprwy Weinidog ynghylch beth yn union sy'n ofynnol i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth ar gael mewn fformat hygyrch a hawdd ei ddarllen. Yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno bod hynny'n ganlyniad i'w ddeisyfu, ond teimlwn ni'n eithaf cryf y dylid datgan yn llawer cliriach, yn y Mesur arfaethedig, mai felly y dylai fod. Am y rheswm hwnnw, rhoddwn y gwelliant i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 3 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.*

*Amendment 3: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asgar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 3.  
Amendment 3 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yn unol a'r rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli, symudwn at waredu gwelliannau 2, 4, 5 a 6.

**The Presiding Officer:** In accordance with the marshalled list, we now come to dispose of amendments 2, 4, 5 and 6.

I call Peter Black to move amendment 2.

Galwaf ar Peter Black i gynnig gwelliant 2.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 2 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 2. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 2 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore we will move to a vote.

Mae gennym broblem dechnegol gyda'r bleidlais—nid yw hyn byth yn digwydd, wrth gwrs—felly awn ymlaen i drafod y grŵp nesaf, a down yn ôl i bleidleisio ar welliannau 2, 4, 5 a 6.

We have a technical problem with the vote—this never happens, of course—therefore we will move on to debate the next group, and come back to voting on amendments 2, 4, 5 and 6.

### **Darparu Datganiad am Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 12 a 10) Provision of Charging Statement (Amendments 12 and 10)**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'r pedwerydd grŵp o welliannau'n ymwneud â darparu datganiad am ffioedd. Y prif welliant yn y grŵp hwn yw gwelliant 12.

**The Presiding Officer:** The fourth group of amendments relates to the provision of charging statement. The lead amendment in this group is amendment 12.

I call on Andrew R.T. Davies to move

Galwaf ar Andrew R.T. Davies i gynnig



amendment 12.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I move amendment 12 in my name.

As the Presiding Officer said, this group deals with the provision of charging statements, something that we would all assume to be provided as a matter of course, so that people are aware of what is being charged and for what they will be beholden in the agreements that they enter into. We believe that an obligation should be placed on local authorities to provide information about charges to the service user and what that individual will be expected to pay, and the outcomes and means before any charge is made. We would all take that for granted, but, regrettably, should this amendment not be agreed, that would not be the case. We believe that this amendment is perfectly reasonable and rational in placing an obligation on the local authority to provide information before the charging mechanism comes into play. Amendment 10, which the Deputy Minister has tabled, allows for the charging mechanism to be put in place and that information to be made some 21 days after the charging process has begun. That seems to be contradictory, as people need to understand exactly the obligation that they and their families are taking on, and, indeed, what the service provider will provide to them. I would hope that Plenary will support this amendment because it will ensure that information is made available to individuals so that they can have confidence. Evidence on the need for this was provided by various organisations in the legislation committee, such as the National Autistic Society Wales and the Domiciliary Care Association Wales, and so it is an evidence-based amendment. I hope that the Deputy Minister will be able to support it and allow the proposed Measure to be strengthened by it.

**Peter Black:** I am happy to support Andrew R.T. Davies's amendment 12 to ensure that people have access to this information before charges are imposed or altered. Access to this

gwelliant 12.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 12 yn fy enw i.

Fel y dywedodd y Llywydd, mae'r grŵp hwn yn ymwneud â darparu datganiadau am ffioedd, rhywbeth y byddem i gyd yn tybio y'i darperid fel rhan o'r drefn, er mwyn i bobl fod yn ymwybodol o'r ffioedd a godir a'r hyn a fydd yn ddyledus ganddynt yn y cytundebau a arwyddant. Credwn y dylid gosod rhwymedigaeth ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu gwybodaeth am y ffioedd a godir ar y defnyddiwr gwasanaethau a'r hyn y bydd disgwyl i'r unigolyn hwnnw ei dalu, a'r canlyniadau a'r modd, cyn codi unrhyw dâl. Byddem i gyd yn cymryd hynny'n ganiataol, ond, ysywaeth, pe na dderbynnid y gwelliant hwn, ni fyddai hynny'n digwydd. Credwn fod y gwelliant hwn yn berffaith resymol a chall wrth osod rhwymedigaeth ar yr awdurdod lleol i ddarparu gwybodaeth cyn i'r mecanwaith ffioedd gael ei roi ar waith. Yn ôl gwelliant 10, a gyflwynwyd gan y Dirprwy Weinidog, byddai'r mecanwaith codi ffioedd yn cael ei roi ar waith a'r wybodaeth honno'n cael ei rhoi ryw 21 diwrnod wedi i'r broses codi ffioedd ddechrau. Mae hynny i'w weld yn anghyson, gan fod angen i bobl ddeall beth yn union yw'r rhwymedigaeth y maent hwy a'u teuluoedd yn ymgymryd â hi, ac, yn wir, beth y bydd y darparwr gwasanaeth yn ei ddarparu iddynt. Gobeithio y gwnaiff y Cyfarfod Llawn gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn oherwydd bydd yn sicrhau bod gwybodaeth yn cael ei darparu i unigolion fel bod ganddynt hyder. Darparwyd tystiolaeth o'r angen am hyn gan amryfal gyrff yn y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth, fel Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Awtistiaeth Cymru a Chymdeithas Gofal Cartref Cymru, ac felly mae'n welliant sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth. Gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn gallu ei gefnogi a chaniatáu i'r Mesur arfaethedig gael ei gryfhau ganddo.

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliant 12 gan Andrew R.T. Davies i sicrhau bod y wybodaeth hon ar gael i bobl cyn codi neu newid ffioedd. Mae cael y

information is important so that people know exactly what they will be charged for what service. I do not think that any one of us would get on a train and expect an invoice for an undisclosed amount up to 21 days later, and I am sure that the same is true of social care, if not more so, as people in receipt of social care generally have less access to money than the population as a whole.

It is important, when local authorities levy charges, that people have an element of choice, so that they are able to understand what the charges are and can look at alternatives. That very much underpins the direct payment regime, which I believe we all support, and which is not taken up as much as it should be in Wales. It is also especially relevant when considering the fears that many people involved in social care have in relation to the impact of this proposed Measure. We have already indicated that, in two local authorities, the charge is significantly below the £50 maximum proposed. It is therefore possible that that charge will increase substantially, so that someone who is in receipt of care and currently paying £20 or so for the service will suddenly find themselves paying £50 without advance notice or option to seek alternatives. For that reason, it is important that advance notice and the element of choice are included on the face of the proposed Measure.

**Gwenda Thomas:** While I understand the issue that has given rise to amendment 12, I do not believe that the amendment is necessary, particularly in the light of the new means assessment provision set out in the proposed Measure. I have mentioned that there will be urgent cases where services will need to be commenced before a means assessment can be undertaken. If a means assessment subsequently determines that a person has the means to contribute towards the cost of their care, then I do not agree that any charge in respect of these costs should automatically be disregarded. We must remember that in order to undertake a means assessment, full financial information must

wybodaeth hon yn bwysig er mwyn i bobl wybod beth yn union a godir arnynt am bob gwasanaeth. Nid wyf yn meddwl yr âi neb ohonom ar drên a disgwyl anfoneb am swm anhysbys hyd at 21 diwrnod yn ddiweddarach, ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod yr un peth yn wir am ofal cymdeithasol, os nad yn fwy gwir, gan fod gan bobl sy'n cael gofal cymdeithasol lai o arian at ei gilydd na'r boblogaeth yn ei chyfanrwydd.

Mae'n bwysig, pan fydd awdurdodau lleol yn codi ffioedd, i bobl gael elfen o ddewis, er mwyn iddynt allu deall beth yw'r ffioedd a gallu edrych ar ddewisiadau eraill. Mae hynny'n sylfaen i'r drefn taliadau uniongyrchol, yr ydym i gyd yn ei chefnogi, fe gredaf, ac na fanteisir cymaint arni ag y dylid yng Nghymru. Mae'n arbennig o berthnasol hefyd pan ystyrir yr ofnau sydd gan lawer o bobl sy'n ymwneud â gofal cymdeithasol ynglŷn ag effaith y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Yr ydym eisoes wedi nodi bod y ffi mewn dau awdurdod lleol yn is o lawer na'r ffi uchaf o £50 a gynigir. Mae'n bosibl felly y bydd y ffi honno'n codi'n sylweddol, nes bydd rhywun sy'n cael gofal ac yn talu rhyw £20 ar hyn o bryd am y gwasanaeth, yn sydyn iawn yn gorfod talu £50 heb rybudd ymlaen llaw na chyfle i edrych ar ddewisiadau eraill. Am y rheswm hwnnw, mae'n bwysig cynnwys rhagrybudd a'r elfen o ddewis yn y Mesur arfaethedig.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Er fy mod yn deall y mater sydd wedi ysgogi gwelliant 12, nid wyf yn credu bod angen y gwelliant, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni'r ddarpariaeth newydd ar gyfer asesu modd a amlinellir yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Yr wyf wedi sôn y bydd achosion brys lle y bydd angen dechrau cyflwyno gwasanaethau cyn y gellir gwneud asesiad modd. Os bydd asesiad modd yn penderfynu wedyn fod gan rywun y modd i gyfrannu at gostau eu gofal, yna nid wyf yn cytuno y dylid diystyru'n awtomatig unrhyw ffi i dalu am y costau hyn. Rhaid inni gofio, er mwyn ymgymryd ag asesiad modd, fod yn rhaid cael gwybodaeth ariannol lawn a'i hasesu er mwyn sicrhau na chodir mwy ar

be obtained and assessed to ensure that service users are not being charged more than it would be reasonable for them to pay. I agree that it is important to avoid undue delay between service delivery and the notification of a proposed charge, and that any means test should be undertaken as soon as possible. That is why I brought forward a number of amendments to section 4 at Stage 2. I believe that those amendments to section 4 significantly improve the means assessment process and will reduce the potential for charges to accumulate without the service users' knowledge.

Amendment 10 is a drafting improvement. This amendment makes it clear that the statement of information that must be provided under section 5(4) must be provided within 21 days of the date on which the decision to impose or alter a charge is made.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is no great surprise that the Deputy Minister is, unfortunately, not prepared to take our amendment on board. I disagree profoundly with her that her own amendment is a drafting procedure; it is the reverse of what our amendment would provide for the user. The Government's amendment actually provides for a delay in that statement reaching the user, while our amendment would ensure that the individual, the family and carers would have that information before they entered into the agreement. Above all, when considering the direction of travel of direct payments, for example, it is crucial that this type of information is made available to people before entering into the agreement. It all boils down to the original amendments to the proposed Measure, and to the risk of a levelling up by local authorities, rather than a case of people being better off. If you do not have that statement before you enter into the agreement, you are at a disadvantage before you even start.

Therefore, regrettably, Deputy Minister, by putting your own amendment forward and negating the positive possibilities that our amendment would provide for this proposed

ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau nag y byddai'n rhesymol iddynt ei dalu. Cytunaf ei bod yn bwysig osgoi gormod o oedi rhwng cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth a hysbysu am ffi arfaethedig, ac y dylid gwneud unrhyw brawf modd cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Dyna pam y cyflwynais nifer o welliannau i adran 4 yng Nghyfnod 2. Credaf fod y gwelliannau hynny i adran 4 yn gwella'r broses o asesu modd yn sylweddol ac y byddant yn lleihau'r posibilrwydd y bydd ffioedd yn cronni heb yn wybod i'r defnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

Gwelliant drafftio yw gwelliant 10. Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn nodi'n glir fod yn rhaid i'r datganiad gwybodaeth y mae'n rhaid ei ddarparu o dan adran 5(4) gael ei ddarparu o fewn 21 diwrnod i'r dyddiad pryd y gwneir y penderfyniad i godi ffi neu i newid ffi.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Nid yw'n syndod mawr nad yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog, ysywaeth, yn fodlon derbyn ein gwelliant. Yr wyf yn anghytuno'n llwyr â hi mai gweithdrefn ddrafftio yw ei gwelliant hi; mae'n gwbl groes i'r hyn y byddai ein gwelliant ni'n ei ddarparu i'r defnyddiwr. Mae gwelliant y Llywodraeth mewn gwirionedd yn darparu ar gyfer oedi cyn i'r datganiad hwnnw gyrraedd y defnyddiwr, tra byddai ein gwelliant ni'n sicrhau y câi'r unigolyn, y teulu a'r gofawyr y wybodaeth honno cyn arwyddo'r cytundeb. Yn anad dim, wrth ystyried i ba gyfeiriad y mae taliadau uniongyrchol yn mynd, er enghraifft, mae'n hanfodol darparu'r math hwn o wybodaeth i bobl cyn gwneud y cytundeb. Hanfod y mater yw'r gwelliannau gwreiddiol i'r Mesur arfaethedig, a'r perygl i awdurdodau lleol lefelu tuag i fyny, yn hytrach na bod pobl yn well eu byd. Os na chewch y datganiad hwnnw cyn ichi arwyddo'r cytundeb, yr ydych o dan anfantais cyn cychwyn, hyd yn oed.

Felly, yn anffodus, Ddirprwy Weinidog, wrth gyflwyno eich gwelliant eich hun a negyddu'r posibiliadau cadarnhaol y byddai ein gwelliant ni'n eu darparu i'r Mesur

Measure, you are putting service users at a disadvantage. I hope that Members listening to this debate in the Chamber today will enable that consensus, even if the whip will not allow them to vote on the common sense contained within the amendment.

**Y Llywydd:** Er mwyn pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau yn eu trefn, af yn ôl i alw'r bleidlais ar welliant 2 a gynigiwyd gan Peter Black.

arfaethedig hwn, yr ydych yn rhoi defnyddwyr gwasanaethau o dan anfantais. Gobeithio y gwnaiff Aelodau sy'n gwrando ar y ddadl hon yn y Siambr heddiw alluogi'r consensws hwnnw, hyd yn oed os na wnaiff y chwip ganiatáu iddynt bleidleisio dros y synnwyr cyffredin a geir yn y gwelliant.

**The Presiding Officer:** In order for us to dispose of the amendments in order, I will first call for a vote on amendment 2, which was moved by Peter Black.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment: 2 For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 2.  
Amendment 2 not agreed.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Peter Black to move amendment 4.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Peter Black i gynnig gwelliant 4.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 4 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 4. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 4 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 4: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 4.  
Amendment 4 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Peter Black i gynnig gwelliant 5.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Peter Black to move amendment 5.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 5 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiaf welliant 5 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 5. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 5 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 5: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 5.  
Amendment 5 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Peter Black i gynnig gwelliant 6.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Peter Black to move amendment 6.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 6 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau welliant 6 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 6. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 6 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 6: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asgar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 6.  
Amendment 6 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr ydym yn awr wedi dal lan gyda ni'n hunain. Felly, yr ydym wedi cyrraedd grŵp 4. Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 12. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have now caught up with ourselves. Therefore, we have reached group 4. The question is that amendment 12 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 12: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asgar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 12.  
Amendment 12 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Gwelliant 10 sydd nesaf. Yr wyf yn gwahodd Gwenda Thomas i gynnig gwelliant 10.

**The Presiding Officer:** We now come to amendment 10. I invite Gwenda Thomas to move amendment 10.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 10 yn fy enw i.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I move amendment 10 in my name.

**Y Llywydd:** Felly, y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 10. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 10 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, therefore we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 13.  
Amendment 10: For 37, Abstain 0, Against 13.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bourne, Nick  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul



Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd gwelliant 10.  
Amendment 10 agreed.*

### **Adolygu Penderfyniadau ar Godi Ffioedd (Gwelliannau 13, 14, 7 a 8) Reviews of Charging Decisions (Amendments 13, 14, 7 and 8)**

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hyn yn dod â ni at grŵp 5 sydd yn ymwneud ag adolygu penderfyniadau ar godi ffioedd. Galwaf ar Andrew R.T. Davies i gynnig y prif welliant, gwelliant 13, a siarad am y gwelliannau eraill yn y grŵp.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I move amendment 13 in my name.

These amendments will give Welsh Ministers the power to make regulations for local authorities to review charging decisions. Some stakeholders state that service users, their carers and advocates should have the right to request an independent review or appeal to challenge a local authority's original decision regarding their entitlement to receive social care. These amendments

**The Presiding Officer:** That brings us to group 5 on reviews of charging decisions. I call on Andrew Davies to move the lead amendment, which is amendment 13, and to speak to the other amendments in the group.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cynigïaf welliant 13 yn fy enw i.

Bydd y gwelliannau hyn yn rhoi'r pŵer i Weinidogion Cymru wneud rheoliadau i awdurdodau lleol adolygu penderfyniadau codi ffioedd. Dywed rhai rhanddeiliaid y dylai defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, eu gofalwyr a'u heiriolwyr gael yr hawl i ofyn am adolygiad annibynnol neu apêl i herio penderfyniad gwreiddiol awdurdod lleol ynglŷn â'u hawl i gael gofal cymdeithasol.

enshrine the right of an individual to identify the representative of their choice and request them. To us, this seems an obvious and perfectly logical conclusion to the decision-making process. It empowers the individual to call for an appeal or a review into the local authority's decisions relating to them.

They also clarify the term 'representative', which has been used in some amendments to previous sections. Using the term 'representative' suggests that it was felt that limiting the amendments to include the terms 'carer' or 'advocate' could potentially exclude a number of other groups of people. Service users, their carers and advocates should have the right to request an independent review or appeal to challenge a local authority's decision regarding their entitlement to receive social care. This amendment places a duty on Welsh Ministers to make provisions for that appeal procedure and clarifies the issues regarding which Welsh Ministers can be expected to make those provisions. To us, again, this strengthens the proposed Measure by providing the right to appeal or to a review and, in particular, clarifies the terminology of the original proposed Measure.

5.10 p.m.

I would hope that these amendments find favour with the Minister—though I do not hold my breath—as they seek to strengthen the legislation so that, ultimately, the user can have confidence in the services. Above all, they seek to ensure that they can choose representatives to advocate on their behalf in seeking redress. I urge support of the amendments in my name.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I welcome these amendments. It is vital that the proposed Measure is amended as suggested by Andrew R.T. Davies and the Welsh Liberal Democrats. We should ensure that people have the opportunity to appoint a representative, and that that representative is capable of standing up for that individual in

Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn diogelu hawl unigolyn i ddewis a gofyn am gynrychiolydd. I ni, mae hyn yn ymddangos yn ddiweddglo amlwg a chwbl resymegol i'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau. Mae'n galluogi'r unigolyn i alw am apêl neu adolygiad ar benderfyniadau'r awdurdod lleol amdano.

Maent hefyd yn gwneud y term 'cynrychiolydd' yn gliriach, term sydd wedi'i ddefnyddio mewn rhai gwelliannau i adrannau blaenorol. Mae defnyddio'r term 'cynrychiolydd' yn awgrymu y teimlid y gallai cyfyngu'r gwelliannau i gynnwys y termau 'gofalwr' neu 'eiriolwr' efallai gau allan nifer o grwpiau eraill o bobl. Dylai defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, eu gofalwyr a'u heiriolwyr gael yr hawl i ofyn am adolygiad annibynnol neu apêl i herio penderfyniad awdurdod lleol ynglŷn â'u hawl i gael gofal cymdeithasol. Mae'r gwelliant hwn yn gosod dyletswydd ar Weinidogion Cymru i wneud darpariaethau ar gyfer y drefn apêl honno ac yn gwneud yn glir y materion y gellir disgwyl i Weinidogion Cymru wneud y darpariaethau hynny ar eu cyfer. I ni, eto, mae hyn yn cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig drwy ddarparu'r hawl i apelio neu i gael adolygiad ac, yn arbennig, yn gwneud terminoleg y Mesur arfaethedig gwreiddiol yn gliriach.

Gobeithio y caiff y gwelliannau hyn groeso gan y Gweinidog—er nad wyf yn dal fy ngwynt—gan eu bod yn ceisio cryfhau'r ddeddfwriaeth er mwyn i'r defnyddiwr, yn y pen draw, fod â hyder yn y gwasanaethau. Yn anad dim, maent yn ceisio sicrhau y gallant ddewis cynrychiolwyr i eiriol ar eu rhan wrth geisio iawn. Anogaf bawb i gefnogi'r gwelliannau yn fy enw.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r gwelliannau hyn. Mae'n hollbwysig diwygio'r Mesur arfaethedig fel yr awgrymir gan Andrew R.T. Davies a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Dylem sicrhau bod pobl yn cael y cyfle i benodi cynrychiolydd, a bod y cynrychiolydd hwnnw'n gallu sefyll dros yr unigolyn i leisio'i bryderon ynghylch yr

articulating their concerns about the need for a review of a funding decision. I remind Members that when this matter came before the committee at Stage 1, the Deputy Minister said that:

‘It would be my intention for regulations under this section to enable carers and advocates to request a review on behalf of an individual, where the individual lacks capacity or has agreed for someone to make that request on his or her behalf’.

My concern is that, again, we are relying on a Minister or Deputy Minister to introduce regulations for something that could easily be dealt with in the proposed Measure itself. I know that this is part of the continuous debate about the kind of detail that should be in a Measure, and the kind that should be left to the Government. However, the principle that a service user should be able to appoint a representative or advocate—or, if they are covered by the Mental Capacity Act 2005, a family member—and request a review of a charging decision is fundamental, and should not be left to regulations. I remind Members about another concern that I have about the way that the proposed Measure is drafted. We are merely to rely on the Minister to introduce regulations, but there is no requirement in this proposed Measure for the Minister to do so. This is made crystal clear in section 6 of the proposed Measure:

‘The Welsh Ministers may by regulations make provision for and in connection with the review of decisions taken by local authorities under this Measure’.

I emphasise the word ‘may’. This section does not require the Assembly Government to introduce regulations; it merely says that, on some whim in the future, the Deputy Minister ‘may’ make such a regulation. That is a fundamental weakness in the way that we are drafting legislation. As I said, there is nothing in law, as it is written here, to require

angen i adolygu penderfyniad ariannu. Yr wyf yn atgoffa’r Aelodau, pan ddaeth y mater hwn gerbron y pwyllgor yng Nghyfnod 1, i’r Dirprwy Weinidog ddweud:

Fy mwriad fyddai i reoliadau o dan yr adran hon alluogi gofalwyr ac eiriolwyr i ofyn am adolygiad ar ran unigolyn, lle nad oes gallu gan yr unigolyn neu lle y mae wedi cytuno i rywun arall wneud y cais hwnnw ar ei ran neu ar ei rhan.

Fy mhryder yw ein bod, unwaith eto, yn dibynnu ar Weinidog neu Ddirprwy Weinidog i gyflwyno rheoliadau ar gyfer rhywbeth y gellid ymdrin ag ef yn hawdd yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Gwn fod hyn yn rhan o’r ddadl barhaus am y math o fanylion a ddylai fod mewn Mesur, a’r math y dylid ei adael i’r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae’r egwyddor y dylai defnyddiwr gwasanaethau allu penodi cynrychiolydd neu eiriolwr—neu os yw’n gymwys o dan Ddeddf Galluedd Meddyliol 2005, aelod o’r teulu—a gofyn am adolygu penderfyniad ar ffioedd yn egwyddor sylfaenol, ac ni ddylid ei gadael i reoliadau. Yr wyf yn atgoffa’r Aelodau am bryder arall sydd gennyf ynglŷn â’r modd y mae’r Mesur arfaethedig wedi’i ddrafftio. Yr ydym i fod i ddibynnu ar y Gweinidog i gyflwyno rheoliadau, ond nid oes dim gofyniad yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar i’r Gweinidog wneud hynny. Amlygir hyn yn berffaith eglur yn adran 6 yn y Mesur arfaethedig:

‘Gall Gweinidogion Cymru drwy reoliadau wneud darpariaeth ar gyfer adolygu penderfyniadau a gymerwyd gan awdurdodau lleol o dan y Mesur hwn ac mewn cysylltiad â hwy’.

Yr wyf yn pwysleisio’r gair ‘gall’. Nid yw’r adran hon yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyflwyno rheoliadau; dim ond dweud y ‘gall’ y Dirprwy Weinidog, ar sail rhyw fypwy yn y dyfodol, wneud rheoliad o’r fath. Mae hynny’n wendid sylfaenol yn y modd yr ydym yn drafftio deddfwriaeth. Fel y

the Deputy Minister to introduce regulations giving people the ability to question a charging decision. We need to look at these matters in some detail, because if we leave it up to the Government, then it could decide that it is not really interested in allowing people to appeal a charging decision, or in allowing someone to appoint a representative to question a charging decision. It is left to the good will of the Deputy Minister, and while I think highly of her, she might not be in office forever, and a future Deputy Minister might not wish to exercise the powers to make regulations as set out in section 6. This, therefore, is a fundamental weakness. If it is the Deputy Minister's intention to use regulations under section 6, where are the Government amendments to reflect her comments to the committee at Stage 1? She has clearly decided not to bring forward any amendments at this stage to outline how the regulations would be used to enable people to request a review. The only reference to requesting a review by another person is under section 6(2)(ca). That, in itself, is not strong enough, and that is why the amendments tabled by Andrew R.T. Davies and the Liberal Democrats are absolutely right in this regard.

**Peter Black:** Most of what needs to be said has already been said, so suffice it to say that the Liberal Democrats support all four amendments in this group. We believe that it is essential that an independent and scrutable review mechanism is available, and that it is robust and able to provide redress where needed. We have also provided a reasonable and legally sound definition of 'representative', to ensure that there is no abuse of the position—the rare and sad abuse of power—by those who might seek advantage. I urge Members to back this group of amendments to ensure that there is a mechanism by which decisions can be reviewed, particularly when local authorities make them on this vital subject, and so that the promises that the Minister made at Stage

dywedais, nid oes dim yn y gyfraith, fel y'i hysgrifennwyd yma, i fynnu bod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn cyflwyno rheoliadau i roi'r gallu i bobl gwestiynu penderfyniad ar ffioedd. Mae angen edrych ar y materion hyn yn fanwl, oherwydd os gadawn y mater i'r Llywodraeth, yna gallai benderfynu nad oes ganddi wir ddiddordeb mewn caniatáu i bobl apelio yn erbyn penderfyniad ar ffioedd, neu mewn caniatáu i rywun benodi cynrychiolydd i gwestiynu penderfyniad ar ffioedd. Fe'i gadewir i ewyllys da'r Dirprwy Weinidog, ac er bod gennyf gryn barch ati, efallai na fydd hi yn y swydd am byth, ac efallai na fydd Dirprwy Weinidog yn y dyfodol am arfer y pwerau i wneud rheoliadau fel y'u hamlinellir yn adran 6. Mae hyn, felly, yn wendid sylfaenol. Os mai bwriad y Dirprwy Weinidog yw defnyddio rheoliadau o dan adran 6, ble y mae gwelliannau'r Llywodraeth i adlewyrchu ei sylwadau i'r pwyllgor yng Nghyfnod 1? Mae hi'n amlwg wedi penderfynu peidio â chyflwyno gwelliannau ar hyn o bryd i amlinellu sut y defnyddid y rheoliadau i alluogi pobl i ofyn am adolygiad. O dan adran 6(2)(ca) y ceir yr unig gyfeiriad at gais am adolygiad gan rywun arall. Nid yw hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn ddigon cryf, a dyna pam y mae'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Andrew R.T. Davies a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn llygad eu lle yn hyn o beth.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn y mae angen ei ddweud eisoes wedi'i ddweud, felly digon yw dweud bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi pob un o'r pedwar gwelliant yn y grŵp hwn. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol bod mecanwaith adolygu annibynnol y gellir craffu arno ar gael, a'i fod yn gadarn ac yn gallu darparu iawn lle y bo angen. Yr ydym hefyd wedi darparu diffiniad rhesymol a diogel yn gyfreithiol o 'cynrychiolydd', i sicrhau na chamddefnyddir y swydd gan rai a allai geisio mantais—mae camddefnyddio grym yn y fath fodd yn beth trist, ond nid yw'n digwydd yn aml. Yr wyf yn annog yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r grŵp hwn o welliannau i sicrhau bod mecanwaith ar gyfer adolygu penderfyniadau, yn enwedig pan fydd awdurdodau lleol yn eu gwneud ar y

1, as Jonathan Morgan just outlined, can be put into effect.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I fully support the principle behind amendments 13 and 14, and I agree that it should be possible for others to make a request to review a charging decision on behalf of a service user. That is why I brought forward a Government amendment to the proposed Measure at Stage 2 to address that issue. That amendment was accepted, and the proposed Measure does now allow for regulations to be made that include provision as to who may request a review on behalf of another person. Consequently, I do not consider amendments 13 or 14 to be necessary.

I am unable to support amendment 7 as I believe that leaving the scope of who may request a review to regulations provides the flexibility to ensure that the permitted persons are appropriate in the circumstances. That approach will allow the issue to be reviewed as required from time to time, having regard to other relevant legislation in this area. I intend to consult fully with stakeholders over who should be able to make a request for an appeal on behalf of another person. Consequently, I do not believe that amendment 7 is either necessary or appropriate. If the amendment were to be agreed to, should it be necessary in future to amend the category of persons who could request a review on behalf of another person, it would be possible to do so only by amending the Measure itself.

Turning to amendment 8, I do not believe that such an appeals procedure is necessary or advisable, given the provision that is already made in the proposed Measure for the review of decisions and the existence of the local authority statutory complaints procedure, which has three stages. There would therefore be a review, which we are now introducing, as well as three stages of the social services complaints procedure. If the amendment were to be accepted, yet

pwnc hollbwysig hwn, ac er mwyn gallu gwireddu'r addewidion a wnaeth y Gweinidog yng Nghyfnod 1, fel y mae Jonathan Morgan newydd amlinellu.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi'r yr egwyddor sydd wrth wraidd gwelliannau 13 ac 14, a chytunaf y dylai fod modd i eraill wneud cais am adolygu penderfyniad ar ffioedd ar ran defnyddiwr gwasanaethau. Dyna pam y cyflwynais welliant gan y Llywodraeth i'r Mesur arfaethedig yng Nghyfnod 2 i ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Derbyniwyd y gwelliant hwnnw, ac mae'r Mesur arfaethedig bellach yn caniatáu gwneud rheoliadau sy'n cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer pwy a gaiff ofyn am adolygiad ar ran rhywun arall. O ganlyniad, nid wyf o'r farn bod angen gwelliannau 13 nac 14.

Ni allaf gefnogi gwelliant 7 gan fy mod yn credu bod gadael i reoliadau bennu pwy a gaiff ofyn am adolygiad yn darparu'r hyblygrwydd i sicrhau bod y personau a ganiateir yn briodol yn yr amgylchiadau. Bydd y dull hwnnw'n caniatáu adolygu'r mater yn ôl y gofyn o bryd i'w gilydd, gan ystyried deddfwriaeth berthnasol arall yn y maes hwn. Bwriadaf ymgynghori'n llawn â rhanddeiliaid ynghylch pwy a ddylai allu gwneud cais am apêl ar ran rhywun arall. O ganlyniad, nid wyf yn credu bod gwelliant 7 yn angenrheidiol nac yn briodol. Pe derbynid y gwelliant, pe bai angen yn y dyfodol i'r categori o bobl a allai ofyn am adolygiad ar ran rhywun arall gael ei ddiwygio, dim ond drwy ddiwygio'r Mesur ei hun y gellid gwneud hynny.

A throi at welliant 8, nid wyf yn credu bod gweithdrefn apêl o'r fath yn angenrheidiol nac yn ddoeth, o ystyried y ddarpariaeth sydd eisoes wedi'i gwneud yn y Mesur arfaethedig ar gyfer adolygu penderfyniadau a bodolaeth trefn gwyno statudol awdurdodau lleol, sydd â thri cham iddi. Felly, ceid adolygiad, yr ydym yn ei gyflwyno'n awr, yn ogystal â thri cham trefn gwyno'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Pe derbynid y gwelliant, cyflwynid lefel apelio arall eto fyth.

another level of appeal would be introduced.

The intention of section 6 of the proposed Measure is to allow for the establishment of a review process that is common to all authorities that will be quick, easy to understand, and accessible to all service users. It will allow for queries, for example about how a charge has been calculated or the matters taken into account as part of the means assessment, to be dealt with in a timely and effective manner. I do not see anything in the proposed Measure that would prevent that review process from being the first stage of the social services complaints procedure, if a query has not been resolved. Others may want to come back on that, but I think that that would cut down on any delay should there be a need for recourse to the social services procedure.

If, having accessed the review process, a service user remains dissatisfied with their charge, they could still access the authority's social services complaints procedure. This statutory procedure provides for the consideration of complaints about how a local authority discharges its social services functions, and will include the discharge of functions under the proposed Measure. The review mechanism to be introduced under the proposed Measure will exist separately to, and will complement, the existing social services complaints procedure. I believe that those two processes will provide an effective and comprehensive system for dealing with any concerns that service users may have. Accordingly, I do not believe that the amendment is necessary. I am also concerned that such provision could result in unnecessary duplication and confusion.

5.20 p.m.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I regret that the Deputy Minister finds herself unable to support the amendments. As I said, they are based on the evidence-gathering sessions that were held on this proposed Measure. Her inability to support them calls into question

Bwriad adran 6 yn y Mesur arfaethedig yw caniatáu ar gyfer sefydlu proses adolygu sy'n gyffredin i bob awdurdod a fydd yn gyflym, yn hawdd ei deall, ac yn hygyrch i bob defnyddiwr gwasanaethau. Bydd yn caniatáu ar gyfer ymholiadau, er enghraifft, ynghylch sut y cyfrifwyd ffi neu am y materion a ystyrir fel rhan o'r asesiad modd, yr ymdrinnir â hwy mewn modd amserol ac effeithiol. Ni welaf ddim yn y Mesur arfaethedig a fyddai'n atal y broses adolygu honno rhag bod yn gam cyntaf trefn gwyno'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, os na fydd ymholiad wedi'i ddatrys. Efallai y bydd eraill am ddod yn ôl ar hynny, ond yr wyf yn meddwl y byddai hynny'n lleihau unrhyw oedi pe bai angen troi at drefn gwyno'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol.

Wedi mynd drwy'r broses adolygu, os bydd defnyddiwr gwasanaethau'n dal yn anfodlon â'i ffi, gallai ddal i droi at drefn gwyno adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yr awdurdod. Mae'r weithdrefn statudol hon yn darparu ar gyfer ystyried cwynion am y modd y mae awdurdod lleol yn cyflawni ei swyddogaethau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a bydd yn cynnwys cyflawni swyddogaethau o dan y Mesur arfaethedig. Bydd y mecanwaith adolygu a gyflwynir o dan y Mesur arfaethedig yn bodoli ar wahân i drefn gwyno bresennol y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac yn ei hategu. Credaf y bydd y ddwy broses hyn yn darparu system effeithiol a chynhwysfawr ar gyfer delio ag unrhyw bryderon a all fod gan ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Felly, nid wyf yn credu bod angen y gwelliant. Yr wyf yn bryderus hefyd y gallai darpariaeth o'r fath arwain at ddyblygu diangen a dryswch.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Gresynaf nad yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn gallu cefnogi'r gwelliannau. Fel y dywedais, maent yn seiliedig ar y sesiynau casglu tystiolaeth a gynhaliwyd ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Mae ei hanallu i'w cefnogi yn bwrw amheuaeth ar

the point of organisations giving evidence and of trying to find a way to strengthen a proposed Measure for all concerned. Ultimately, they are seeking to improve the quality of lives of people in Wales.

There is no political motive behind these amendments relating to appeals, delegating someone to represent the individual user, or the charging decisions and the appeal that an individual may make against such a charging decision. Given her statement in one of the committee's earliest evidence-taking sessions, it is surprising that the Deputy Minister is unable to accommodate any of the amendments tabled in this group or to include in the proposed Measure, rather than in regulations, the various safeguards that we believe the amendments could ensure, which would make it a more effective piece of legislation that would be of benefit to people and their communities.

I hope that, when people reflect on this, they will see the work that we have undertaken on this side of the Chamber in basing our amendments on the evidence that was presented to the committee and in seeking to work with the Government, even though it has rejected all our amendments and does not wish to strengthen the proposed Measure, although it has the potential to improve the quality of life of users.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 13. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

ddiben rhoi tystiolaeth gan sefydliadau a cheisio canfod ffordd i gryfhau Mesur arfaethedig i bawb dan sylw. Yn y pen draw, maent yn ceisio gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl yng Nghymru.

Nid oes cymhelliad gwleidyddol wrth wraidd y gwelliannau hyn ynglŷn ag apeliadau, dirprwyo rhywun i gynrychioli'r defnyddiwr unigol, na'r penderfyniadau ar ffioedd a'r apêl y gall unigolyn ei gwneud yn erbyn penderfyniad o'r fath. O gofio ei datganiad yn un o sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth cynharaf y pwyllgor, mae'n destun syndod na all y Dirprwy Weinidog dderbyn dim un o'r gwelliannau a gyflwynir yn y grŵp hwn na chynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig, yn hytrach nag mewn rheoliadau, yr amryfal fesurau diogelu y credwn y byddai'r gwelliannau'n eu sicrhau, gan ei wneud yn ddarn mwy effeithiol o ddeddfwriaeth a fyddai o fudd i bobl a'u cymunedau.

Gobeithio, pan fydd pobl yn ailstyried hyn, y gwelant y gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr wrth seilio ein gwelliannau ar y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor ac wrth geisio gweithio gyda'r Llywodraeth, er ei bod wedi gwrthod ein gwelliannau i gyd ac nad yw'n dymuno cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig, er y gallai wella ansawdd bywyd defnyddwyr.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 13 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, so we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 13: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris

German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 13.  
Amendment 13 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yn unol â'r rhestr o welliannau wedi'u didoli, symudwn yn awr i waredu gwelliannau 14, 15, 7 ac 8. Yr wyf yn gwahodd Andrew R.T. Davies i gynnig yn ffurfiol welliant 14.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I move amendment 14 in my name.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 14. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** In line with the marshalled list, we will now move to dispose of amendments 14, 15, 7 and 8. I invite Andrew R.T. Davies to move amendment 14 formally.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cynigiau welliant 14 yn fy enw i.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 14 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, so we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 14: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 14: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice



Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 14.  
Amendment 14 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Gan fod gwelliant 1 wedi'i wrthod a gwelliant 9 wedi'i dderbyn, mae gwelliant 16 wedi methu.

**The Presiding Officer:** As amendment 1 was not agreed and amendment 9 was agreed, amendment 16 falls.

*Methodd gwelliant 16.  
Amendment 16 fell.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Andrew R.T. Davies i gynnig yn ffurfiol welliant 15.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Andrew R.T. Davies to move amendment 16 formally.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I move amendment 15 in my name.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cynigiaf welliant 15 yn fy enw i.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 15. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 15 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, so we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 15: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 15: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys

Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 15.  
Amendment 15 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Peter Black i gynig yn ffurfiol welliant 7.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Peter Black to move amendment 7 formally.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 7 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau welliant 7 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 7. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 7 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, so we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 7: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley

Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 7.  
Amendment 7 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn gwahodd Peter Black i gynnig yn ffurfiol welliant 8.

**The Presiding Officer:** I invite Peter Black to move amendment 8 formally.

**Peter Black:** I move amendment 8 in the name of Mick Bates.

**Peter Black:** Cynigaf welliant 8 yn enw Mick Bates.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid derbyn gwelliant 8. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that amendment 8 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I see that there are, so we will move to a vote.

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 8: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asgar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann

Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd gwelliant 8.  
Amendment 8 not agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd trafodion Cyfnod 3 o'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru). Yr wyf yn datgan y bernir bod pob adran ac Atodlen o'r Mesur arfaethedig wedi'u derbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** We have reached the end of our Stage 3 consideration of the Proposed Social Care Charges (Wales) Measure. I declare that all sections and Schedules of the proposed Measure are deemed agreed.

**Cynnig Cyfnod 4 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 23.58 i Gymeradwyo'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru)  
Stage 4 Standing Order No. 23.58 Motion to Approve the Proposed Social Care Charges (Wales) Measure**

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas):** Cynigiau fod

**The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas):** I move that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.58, yn cymeradwyo'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Codi Ffioedd am Wasanaethau Gofal Cymdeithasol (Cymru).*

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 23.58, approves the Proposed Social Care Charges (Wales) Measure.*

Y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yw'r cam cyntaf wrth fynd i'r afael â'r anghysonderau helaeth sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd ymhlith awdurdodau lleol wrth godi ffioedd am wasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol dibreswyl. Bydd yn galluogi sefydlu cyfundrefn ddeddfwriaethol newydd a fydd yn caniatáu i Weinidogion Cymru gyflwyno rheoliadau a chanllawiau i sicrhau mwy o gysondeb lle bydd awdurdodau yn penderfynu codi ffioedd am y gwasanaethau hyn. Bydd yn ein

This proposed Measure is the first step in addressing the extensive inconsistencies that currently exist among local authorities in relation to charging for non-residential social care services. It will enable us to establish a new legislative framework that would allow the Welsh Ministers to introduce regulations and guidance to ensure more consistency where authorities decide to levy charges for these services. It will enable us to set up a system that is fair to all client groups, that is

galluogi i sefydlu system sy'n deg i bob grŵp cleientiaid, sy'n haws ei deall, yn gost-effeithiol i'w gweinyddu ac sy'n lleihau'r baich ffioedd ar ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

For too long, there has been wide variation in the range of services charged for, the types of users who are charged, the financial assessments undertaken, and the level of charges set. This unequal treatment of users had the potential to be unfair and inequitable, and it confirms that we were right to identify this as a matter requiring further legislation.

I wish to thank all those who have contributed to the development of this proposed Measure. Throughout its passage, it has been subject to robust and professional scrutiny. It was considered by Legislation Committee No.5, by the Finance Committee, and the Subordinate Legislation Committee at Stages 1 and 2, and now by all Members at Stage 3. This scrutiny has resulted in a much strengthened Measure. At each stage, we have listened to the arguments being put forward, reflected upon them and, where appropriate, brought forward amendments to improve the proposed Measure.

It has been a privilege for me to steer this proposed Measure through the Assembly. I look forward to the next stages of the process and the introduction of the first steps improvement package, which I have announced and which will help to secure a fairer and more consistent charging regime for Wales. We must not lose sight of the fact that the service users who receive non-residential social care services represent some of the most vulnerable members of society. The proposed Measure will improve the charging process, helping to support their ability to live independently in the community and improve their quality of life. I therefore ask the Assembly for its support to pass this important proposed Measure.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** We will be abstaining from voting on this proposed Measure—

easier to understand, is cost-effective to administer, and that reduces the burden of fees on service users.

Ers gormod o amser, cafwyd amrywiaeth helaeth yn yr amrediad o wasanaethau y codir ffioedd amdanynt, y mathau o ddefnyddwyr y codir ffioedd arnynt, yr asesiadau ariannol a wneir, a lefel y ffioedd a osodir. Wrth i ddefnyddwyr gael eu trin yn anghyfartal fel hyn, yr oedd yn bosibl i hynny fod yn annheg ac anghyfiawn, ac mae'n cadarnhau ein bod yn iawn wrth farnu bod hyn yn fater sy'n galw am ddeddfwriaeth bellach.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at ddatblygu'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Drwy gydol ei daith, bu'n destun craffu llym a phroffesiynol. Fe'i hystyriwyd gan Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 5, gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid, a'r Pwyllgor Is-ddeddfwriaeth yng Nghyfnodau 1 a 2, ac yn awr gan yr Aelodau i gyd yng Nghyfnod 3. Mae'r craffu hwn wedi arwain at Fesur sydd wedi'i atgyfnerthu'n fawr. Ym mhob cam, yr ydym wedi gwrandao ar y dadleuon a gyflwynwyd, wedi'u hystyried, a phan fo hynny'n briodol, wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau i wella'r Mesur arfaethedig.

Mae wedi bod yn ffraind i mi lywio'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn drwy'r Cynulliad. Edrychaf ymlaen at gamau nesaf y broses a chyflwyno'r pecyn gwella camau cyntaf, yr wyf wedi'i gyhoeddi ac a fydd yn help i sicrhau trefn codi ffioedd sy'n decach a mwy cyson i Gymru. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y ffaith mai'r defnyddwyr gwasanaethau sy'n cael gofal cymdeithasol dibreswyl yw rhai o'r aelodau mwyaf agored i niwed yn y gymdeithas. Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn gwella'r broses o godi ffioedd, gan helpu i gynnal eu gallu i fyw'n annibynnol yn y gymuned a gwella ansawdd eu bywyd. Felly gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad am ei gefnogaeth i basio'r Mesur arfaethedig pwysig hwn.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Byddwn yn atal ein pleidlais ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn—

[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is the privilege of every group and every Member of the National Assembly to vote in whichever way they prefer. The public can judge; it is not for us to start booing and jeering when they decide to exercise their democratic right in the Chamber. Was that all right, Andrew R.T. Davies?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. It was interesting to hear the Deputy Minister say that she had listened to the arguments and that the proposed Measure is fair in relation to costs and administration. We have just spent over an hour seeking to improve this proposed Measure on the evidence that was presented by the various organisations that sought a more equitable settlement via this proposed Measure. Therefore, as far as listening to the arguments is concerned, I regret, Deputy Minister, that your Government's actions today in rejecting all the amendments that sought to ensure that the proposed Measure was equitable and fair have proven that it is against such sentiments. That is to be regretted, because this proposed Measure had the potential to make a significant difference.

As the Presiding Officer said, it is the right of the individual groups and Members to put their points in the Chamber. It is symptomatic of the attitude of this Government that the aspiration in relation to the proposed Measure was so limited and that points were not taken on board that could have delivered a far better piece of legislation. We will be abstaining from the vote on the proposed Measure because we believe that so much more could have been achieved if a consensus or a view had been taken on the evidence presented via the legislation committees.

**Peter Black:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this proposed Measure at Stage 4 because we believe that there is a need to lower care charges in authorities across Wales. However, I also wish to raise a

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn: Braint pob grŵp a phob Aelod o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yw pleidleisio ym mha fodd bynnag y mynnant. Gall y cyhoedd farnu; nid mater i ni yw dechrau hwrtian a gwatwar pan benderfynant arfer eu hawl ddemocrataidd yn y Siambr. A oedd hynny'n iawn, Andrew R.T. Davies?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch, Lywydd. Diddorol oedd clywed y Dirprwy Weinidog yn dweud ei bod wedi gwrandao ar y dadleuon a bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn deg o safbwynt costau a gweinyddu. Yr ydym newydd dreulio dros awr yn ceisio gwella'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar sail y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd gan yr amryfal sefydliadau a geisiai setliad tecach drwy'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Felly, o ran gwrandao ar y dadleuon, mae'n flin gennyf, Ddirprwy Weinidog, fod gweithredoedd eich Llywodraeth heddiw wrth wrthod yr holl welliannau a geisiai sicrhau bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn gyfiawn a theg wedi profi ei bod yn wrthwynebus i deimladau o'r fath. Mae hynny'n destun gofid, oherwydd yr oedd gan y Mesur arfaethedig hwn y potensial i wneud gwahaniaeth sylweddol.

Fel y dywedodd y Llywydd, mae gan y grwpiau a'r Aelodau unigol hawl i gyflwyno'u pwyntiau yn y Siambr. Mae'n nodweddiadol o agwedd y Llywodraeth hon fod y dyhead yng nghyswllt y Mesur arfaethedig mor gyfyngedig ac na dderbyniwyd pwyntiau a allai fod wedi sicrhau darn llawer gwell o ddeddfwriaeth. Byddwn yn ymatal rhag pleidleisio ar y Mesur arfaethedig oherwydd ein bod yn credu y gallasid cyflawni cymaint mwy pe bai consensws wedi'i feithrin neu farn wedi'i llunio ar sail y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd drwy'r pwyllgorau deddfwriaeth.

**Peter Black:** Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yng Nghyfnod 4 oherwydd ein bod yn credu bod angen gostwng ffioedd gofal mewn awdurdodau ledled Cymru. Fodd

number of concerns about the way in which the Government may implement this proposed Measure. I therefore stress that we are supporting this with reservations because of those concerns.

5.30 p.m.

If this is not fully funded, it will lead to a huge hole in the finances of local authorities. For all the Deputy Minister's commitment to compensate local councils for their losses, at least one local authority has received no correspondence from the Minister—a fact that was confirmed on Thursday. The removal of the joint working grant, which will fund this particular proposed Measure, will simply recycle money within the system.

If the joint working grant is removed, the myriad schemes themed around prevention and proactive work will be affected. Councils, voluntary organisations and health boards will therefore have to decide whether to end these projects. This includes money that is spent on improving the woefully poor child and adolescent mental health service. If the Government plans to withdraw the funding currently provided to these services, it needs a contingency to ensure that these crucial services are not lost. The way in which this is to be funded is a major concern because it will have an impact on other services that local authorities provide. It is all very well saying that you have asked local authorities to pick up the bill, but for seven years, the Assembly Government has paid for these services, and now that money is going to disappear and it will be put in this scheme instead.

I reiterate my concerns that the maximum charge will become the standard charge. If this proposed Measure is passed, a considerable number of people will lose out as a result.

I believe that this legislation is something of a wasted opportunity. This is not the best way

bynag, hoffwn innau godi nifer o bryderon ynglŷn â'r modd y gall y Llywodraeth weithredu'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Yr wyf yn pwysleisio, felly, ein bod yn cefnogi hyn gydag amheuon oherwydd y pryderon hynny.

Os na roddir cyllid llawn ar gyfer hyn, bydd yn arwain at dwll enfawr yng nghyllid awdurdodau lleol. Er gwaethaf ymrwymiad y Dirprwy Weinidog i ddigolledu cynghorau lleol am eu colledion, mae o leiaf un awdurdod lleol nad yw wedi cael dim gohebiaeth oddi wrth y Gweinidog—ffaith a gadarnhawyd ddydd Iau. Ni fydd dileu'r grant cydweithio, a fydd yn ariannu'r Mesur arfaethedig arbennig hwn, ond yn ailgylchu arian o fewn y system.

Os dilëir y grant cydweithio, effeithir ar y llu o gynlluniau sydd wedi'u trefnu o amgylch gwaith atal a rhagweithiol. Bydd yn rhaid i gynghorau, cyrff gwirfoddol a byrddau iechyd felly benderfynu a ydynt am roi terfyn ar y prosiectau hyn. Mae hyn yn cynnwys arian a werir ar wella'r gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc, sy'n druenus o wael. Os bwriada'r Llywodraeth ddileu'r cyllid a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd i'r gwasanaethau hyn, mae angen cynllun wrth gefn i sicrhau na cholli'r gwasanaethau hanfodol hyn. Mae'r modd y telir am hyn yn bryder mawr oherwydd caiff effaith ar wasanaethau eraill a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol. Digon hawdd yw dweud eich bod wedi gofyn i awdurdodau lleol dalu'r bil, ond ers saith mlynedd, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd wedi talu am y gwasanaethau hyn, ac yn awr mae'r arian hwnnw'n mynd i ddiplannu a chael ei roi yn y cynllun hwn yn lle hynny.

Ailadroddaf fy mhryderon mai'r ffi uchaf fydd y ffi safonol. Os derbynir y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, bydd nifer sylweddol o bobl ar eu colled o ganlyniad.

Credaf fod y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn dipyn o gyfle sydd wedi mynd yn ofer. Nid dyma'r

to tackle the problems that exist in social care in Wales, for three reasons. First, it will have no impact on the majority of people whose care is paid for by the council. We worry that a two-tier service will develop where councils will monitor the cost of people who receive care from them, and those who receive their care subsidised by the Welsh Government will increase the pressure on the Government's funding. Secondly, it will not affect people in residential care. They will still face the unfair situation of having to sell their home to pay for their care. In fact, there is a possibility that those who fund their own residential care currently will move to receive care in their own homes because of the cap on those charges, and that will put even greater pressure on the services provided.

**Gwenda Thomas:** On that point, do you agree that it is important that the people of Wales now engage in the 'Paying for Care in Wales' Green Paper consultation? Will you join me in raising awareness of that consultation, because that is the paper that will set out how we will go forward in future in paying for care, particularly in Wales?

**Peter Black:** I do agree with you that we need to engage with the consultation on funding for care. I am disappointed, as I said at the time, that the consultation is just a clone of the English version. However, I took heart from the fact that you praised the Welsh Liberal Democrat policy on this issue, which was discussed at our last conference. I hope therefore that you are prepared to discuss an innovation in the way that that is being dealt with, as we propose. Certainly, the debate is to be welcomed on that basis.

My final point on why this legislation is a wasted opportunity is that it does not address the problems of fairness that exist in the eligibility criteria. The Deputy Minister should have added these in the original LCO,

ffordd orau i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau sydd ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, am dri rheswm. Yn gyntaf, ni chaiff ddim effaith ar y mwyafrif o bobl y telir am eu gofal gan y cyngor. Yr ydym yn poeni y bydd gwasanaeth dwy haen yn datblygu lle y bydd cynghorau'n monitro cost pobl sy'n cael gofal ganddynt hwy, a bydd y rhai sy'n cael eu gofal gyda nawdd gan Lywodraeth Cymru yn cynyddu'r pwysau ar gyllid y Llywodraeth. Yn ail, ni fydd yn effeithio ar bobl mewn gofal preswyl. Byddant hwy'n dal i wynebu'r sefyllfa annheg lle y byddant yn gorfod gwerthu eu cartref i dalu am eu gofal. Yn wir, mae posibilrwydd y bydd pobl sy'n talu am eu gofal preswyl eu hunain ar hyn o bryd yn symud i dderbyn gofal yn eu cartrefi eu hunain oherwydd y cap ar y ffioedd hynny, a bydd hynny'n rhoi mwy fyth o bwysau ar y gwasanaethau a ddarperir.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Ar y pwynt hwnnw, a ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig i bobl Cymru yn awr gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad ar y Papur Gwyrdd 'Talu am Ofal yng Nghymru'? A wnech ymuno â mi i godi ymwybyddiaeth am yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw, oherwydd dyna'r papur a fydd yn pennu sut yr awn ymlaen yn y dyfodol i dalu am ofal, yn enwedig yng Nghymru?

**Peter Black:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi fod angen inni gymryd rhan yn yr ymgynghoriad ar ariannu gofal. Yr wyf yn siomedig, fel y dywedais ar y pryd, mai dim ond clôn o fersiwn Lloegr yw'r ymgynghoriad. Fodd bynnag, fe'm calonogwyd gan y ffaith ichi ganmol polisi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ar y mater hwn, a drafodwyd yn ein cynhadledd ddiwethaf. Gobeithio felly eich bod yn barod i drafod syniadau newydd o ran y modd yr ymdrinnir â hynny, fel y cynigiwn. Yn sicr, mae'r ddadl i'w chrosawu ar sail hynny.

Fy mhwynt olaf ynghylch pam y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn gyfle sydd wedi mynd yn ofer yw nad yw'n ymdrin â'r problemau'n ymwneud â thegwch sydd yn y meini prawf ar gyfer cymhwysedd. Dylai'r Dirprwy



and they should have been incorporated as changes in this proposed Measure.

Weinidog fod wedi ychwanegu'r rhain yn y Gorchymyn gwreiddiol, a dylid bod wedi eu hymgorffori fel newidiadau yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwn.

I hope that the Deputy Minister can immediately begin work on developing a more sustainable and long-term approach to improve conditions for those people who are in receipt of care. It is on that basis that we are happy to support this stop-gap measure, but a lot more needs to be done, and many more assurances need to be given, particularly to local authorities, as well as to carers and those who are receiving care, about the sustainability of the regime that we are about to vote into existence.

Gobeithio y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog ddechrau gweithio'n ddi-oed ar ddatblygu dull mwy cynaliadwy a hirdymor i wella amodau i bobl sy'n derbyn gofal. Ar sail hynny yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r mesur dros dro hwn, ond mae angen gwneud llawer mwy, ac mae angen rhoi llawer mwy o sicrwydd, yn enwedig i awdurdodau lleol, yn ogystal ag i ofalwyr a'r rhai sy'n derbyn gofal, am gynaliadwyedd y drefn yr ydym ar fin pleidleisio dros ei sefydlu.

**Y Llywydd:** Y cwestiwn yw a ddylid cymeradwyo'r Mesur arfaethedig. Gan fy mod i wedi cael rhybudd yn barod nad oes cymeradwyaeth unfrydol iddo, fe alwaf bleidlais a fydd yn caniatáu cofnodi barn ar y Mesur arfaethedig.

**The Presiding Officer:** The question is that the proposed Measure be agreed to. As I have been notified that there is not unanimous support for it, I will call for a vote that will allow Members to express their opinion on the proposed Measure.

*Cynnig: O blaid 38, Ymatal 12, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion: For 38, Abstain 12, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bourne, Nick  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Brynle

Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

### **Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr eitem olaf ar yr agenda yw'r cyfnod pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau a'r prif gynnig ar y ddadl flaenorol ar adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd henoed.

**The Presiding Officer:** The last item on the agenda is voting time on the amendments and the main motion of the previous debate on the annual report of the older people's commissioner.

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4343: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 32.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4343: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4343: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4343: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4343: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.  
Amendment 3 to NDM4343: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 4 i NDM4343: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 33.  
Amendment 4 to NDM4343: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 33.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

Motion NDM4343 as amended: that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the report of the older people's commissioner 2008-09, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 1 December 2009;*

*2. notes with alarm that there has been a 70 per cent increase in the number of excess winter deaths among older people in Wales.*

Cynnig NDM4343 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu adroddiad Comisiynydd Pobl Hŷn Cymru 2008-09, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Rhagfyr 2009;*

*2. yn nodi â braw y bu cynnydd o 70 y cant yn nifer marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf ymysg pobl hŷn yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig NDM4343 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion NDM4343 as amended: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Asghar, Mohammad  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Burnham, Eleanor  
Burns, Angela  
Cairns, Alun  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Paul  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jenkins, Bethan  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Ramsay, Nick  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4343 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM4343 as amended agreed.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw. **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.36 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.36 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)