



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 3 Gorffennaf 2007
Tuesday, 3 July 2007**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 27 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes
Business Statement and Announcement
- 37 Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am Gyflwyno'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Gwneud
Iawn am Gamweddau'r GIG (Cymru)
Legislative Statement on the Introduction of the Proposed NHS Redress (Wales)
Measure

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Addysg Uwch

Q1 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's higher education budget? OAQ(3)0117(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): This year's budget allocation is £432 million to the Welsh higher education institutions, via the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales. Provision for future years will be considered as part of the budget setting process set out in Standing Order No. 27.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you are aware that HEFCW produced a report last year that showed categorically a £40 million deficit between the HE funding of Wales and England. I am sure that you are also aware of the damage that that can do to every higher education institution in Wales. For example, it can prevent them from recruiting the best staff and paying them rates comparable with those paid in England, and it can make it difficult to develop the subject areas in which we need development, such as science and technology. I am sure that you would agree that given that HEFCW has produced a report that shows this gap, your Government now has a duty to address the situation. Each time that this has been raised, your Government has said that addressing the gap would affect one university more than another. Universities' funding depends on the per capita funding that they get and on the numbers of students, therefore raising the basic fee per student across all universities would be of advantage to everyone. Will you commit your Government to looking at the HEFCW report and to starting to address the funding gap that your funding body has proved exists?

Higher Education

C1 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllideb y Llywodraeth ar gyfer addysg uwch? OAQ(3)0117(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Mae £432 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn hon i sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru, drwy Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru. Ystyrir y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer blynyddoedd y dyfodol fel rhan o'r broses o bennu'r gyllideb sydd wedi'i nodi yn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad y llynedd a oedd yn dangos yn bendifaddau fod diffyg o £40 miliwn rhwng y cyllid ar gyfer addysg uwch yng Nghymru a hynny ar gyfer Lloegr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch hefyd am y drwg y gallai hynny ei achosi i bob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, gall eu hatal rhag recriwtio'r staff gorau a'u talu ar gyfraddau tebyg i'r rhai yn Lloegr, a gall beri iddi fod yn anodd datblygu'r meysydd pwnc y mae angen inni eu datblygu, fel gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech, o gofio bod y cyngor cyllido wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad sydd yn dangos bwlbh o'r fath, ei bod bellach yn ddyletswydd ar eich Llywodraeth ddelio â'r sefyllfa. Bob tro y mae'r mater hwn wedi cael ei godi, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi dweud y byddai camau i ddelio â'r bwlbh hwn yn effeithio ar rai prifysgolion yn fwy na'i gilydd. Mae cyllid prifysgolion yn dibynnu ar y cyllid y pen y maent yn ei gael ac ar niferoedd y myfyrwyr, felly byddai pawb yn cael mantais drwy gynyddu'r ffi sylfaenol am bob myfyriwr yn yr holl brifysgolion. A wnewch ymrwymo y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn ystyried adroddiad y cyngor cyllido ac yn dechrau rhoi sylw i'r bwlbh o ran cyllid y mae eich corff cyllido wedi profi ei fod yn

bodoli?

The First Minister: As I understand it, what you asked me for, and what I gave you, was the budget for higher education, which is £432 million. Universities, or students attending those universities, have many other funding streams. I understand that tuition fees will raise an additional £70 million, and student support will provide between £80 million and £90 million for those attending university. Some of these funding streams do not have comparable streams in England. Therefore, you must look at the picture as a whole and not just at how much money the Assembly Government is providing when we are only part of a set of funding streams.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ôl a ddeallaf, yr hyn y gofynasoch i mi amdano, ac a roddais ichi, oedd ffigur y gyllideb ar gyfer addysg uwch, sef £432 miliwn. Mae llawer o ffrydiau ariannu eraill gan y prifysgolion, neu'r myfyrwyr sydd yn derbyn eu haddysg yn y prifysgolion hynny. Yr wyf yn deall y bydd ffioedd dysgu'n codi £70 miliwn yn ychwanegol, a bydd cymorth i fyfyrwyr yn darparu rhwng £80 miliwn a £90 miliwn i'r rhai sydd yn derbyn eu haddysg mewn prifysgol. Nid oes ffrydiau ariannu tebyg i rai o'r ffrydiau hyn yn Lloegr. Felly, rhaid ichi edrych ar y darlun cyfan ac nid yn unig ar faint o arian y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei roi a ninnau ond yn un rhan o set o ffrydiau ariannu.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that when we consider higher education funding, it is crucial that we recognise the fact, as reported in the Graham review, that roughly half of higher education students in Wales are part-timers, and that, therefore, we must ensure that any financial regime is also fair to them?

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig, wrth inni ystyried cyllid addysg uwch, inni gydnabod y ffaith, fel y'i nodwyd yn adolygiad Graham, fod tua hanner y myfyrwyr addysg uwch yng Nghymru'n rhai rhan-amser ac, felly, fod rhaid inni sicrhau bod unrhyw gyfundrefn ariannol yn deg â hwythau?

The First Minister: I am glad that you pointed out the important issue of part-time students. Student welfare and the widening of access to students from parts of society where the propensity to attend higher education has not been as great as it has been elsewhere are important points. Access is widened by the provision of Assembly learning grants and the availability of a form of student support that is particularly attuned to part-time students. Widening access and achieving excellence are the two main objectives of our higher education policy.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi tynnu sylw at fater pwysig y myfyrwyr rhan-amser. Mae lles myfyrwyr ac ehangu mynediad ar gyfer myfyrwyr sydd mewn rhannau o gymdeithas lle na fu cymaint o duedd i fynd i addysg uwch yn bwyntiau pwysig. Ehangir mynediad drwy gynnig grantiau dysgu'r Cynulliad a thrwy ddarparu math o gymorth i fyfyrwyr sydd yn arbennig o addas i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser. Ehangu mynediad a sicrhau rhagoriaeth yw dau brif amcan ein polisi ar addysg uwch.

Priorities

Q2 Jocelyn Davies: What recent discussions has the First Minister held regarding the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for the next 12 months? OAQ(3)0128(FM)

The First Minister: There have been many such discussions and my priorities for the next 12 months include establishing a stable Government for Wales, driving ahead with

Blaenoriaethau

C2 Jocelyn Davies: Pa drafodaethau diweddar mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal ynghylch blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf? OAQ(3)0128(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu llawer o drafodaethau o'r fath ac ymhlith fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer y 12 mis nesaf y mae ffurfio Llywodraeth sefydlog i Gymru, bwrw ati i roi agenda

the implementation of a progressive policy agenda and making maximum use of the new powers available to this Assembly, and not the previous Assembly, through the Government of Wales Act 2006.

Jocelyn Davies: There have been many indeed, First Minister. Do you agree that housing must be a priority and will require radical solutions and more resources? The new UK Prime Minister is claiming that this will be one of his Government's priorities. Is there any likelihood that more money will be available to us from the Treasury?

The First Minister: Not yet; we are not aware of any additional money. During the Labour leadership conference in Manchester, I was pleased to hear Gordon Brown make affordable housing a top priority, just as we did in our election manifesto. The biggest single priority in terms of making a new budget commitment was affordable housing. There is widespread agreement that that has moved up the political scale of priorities massively across the United Kingdom.

Christine Chapman: First Minister, will you give assurances that the Heads of the Valleys strategy remains a priority, bearing in mind the importance of regeneration to an area that has suffered from a lack of investment and, dare I say, a lack of ambition on the part of previous Governments over the years?

The First Minister: Yes, I will. The Heads of the Valleys area remains a very high priority, and affordable housing is an important issue to the area. People have seen that housing is very affordable in the Valleys, but not as an indication of prosperity, let us say. We also want to encourage new housing in the Heads of the Valleys areas so that the housing market there operates in a way similar to that in the rest of Wales and the United Kingdom.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Hoffwn ddychwelyd at fater tai a godwyd gan Jocelyn Davies a chydabod ein bod ninnau, fel plaid, hefyd wedi rhoi pwyslais mawr ar dai fforddiadwy a thai ar

bolisi flaengar ar waith a defnyddio i'r eithaf y pwerau newydd sydd ar gael i'r Cynulliad hwn, nad oeddent ar gael i'r Cynulliad blaenorol, drwy Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006.

Jocelyn Davies: Cafwyd llawer ohonynt, yn wir, Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn derbyn bod rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i dai ac y bydd hynny'n galw am atebion radicalaidd a rhagor o adnoddau? Mae Prif Weinidog newydd y DU yn honni y bydd hyn yn un o flaenoriaethau ei Lywodraeth. A yw'n debygol y bydd rhagor o arian ar gael i ni gan y Trysorlys?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ddim eto; ni wyddom am arian ychwanegol. Yn ystod cynhadledd arweinyddiaeth Llafur ym Manceinion, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed gan Gordon Brown ei fod yn gwneud tai fforddiadwy'n brif flaenoriaeth, fel y gwnaethom ninnau yn ein maniffesto etholiad. Y flaenoriaeth fwyaf un o ran gwneud ymrwymiad newydd ar gyfer y gyllideb oedd tai fforddiadwy. Derbynir yn gyffredinol fod llawer mwy o flaenoriaeth wedi'i rhoi i hynny ymysg gwleidyddion ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

Christine Chapman: Brif Weinidog, a wnewch roi sicrwydd bod strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth, o gofio mor bwysig yw adfywio i ardal sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd diffyg buddsoddi ac, os caf fentro dweud, diffyg uchelgais ar ran Llywodraethau blaenorol dros y blynyddoedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Mae ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn parhau'n flaenoriaeth uchel iawn, ac mae tai fforddiadwy'n bwnc pwysig i'r ardal. Mae pobl wedi gweld bod tai'n fforddiadwy iawn yn y Cymoedd, ond nid fel arwydd o ffyniant, os cawn ddweud. Yr ydym hefyd yn dymuno hybu tai newydd yn ardaloedd Blaenau'r Cymoedd fel y bydd y farchnad dai yn y manau hynny'n gweithio mewn modd tebyg i hynny yn ngweddill Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I want to return to the matter of housing, which was raised by Jocelyn Davies, and acknowledge that, as a party, we also placed a great emphasis on affordable

rent yn ein maniffesto. Yr wyf yn falch o weld ei fod yn fater sydd bellach yn cael sylw pob plaid. Gan fod pobl yn methu â phrynu tai yn eu cymunedau na chael tai ar rent, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn y dylai hwn fod yn un o flaenoriaethau pwysicaf y Llywodraeth pan gawn wybod beth yw setliad y Cynulliad oddi wrth y Trysorlys yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth gwrs. Fel y dywedais wrth ateb cwestiwn Jocelyn gynnu, yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r hyn a ddywedodd Gordon Brown yn ei araith wrth dderbyn ei swydd fel arweinydd y Blaid Lafur, ac felly fel Prif Weinidog—sef bod tai fforddiadwy yn dod yn gyntaf ar ei restr ef o flaenoriaethau—gael ei drosglwyddo i elfen o wariant ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn fod yn siŵr nes i'r adroddiad gwariant gael ei gyhoeddi, yn ystod y misoedd nesaf. Wrth gwrs, gall dyn barhau i obeithio, a'r goblygiad sy'n dilyn o roi gwariant ychwanegol i Loegr yw y byddwn yn cael arian ychwanegol i'w wario ar ein blaenoriaeth ni yng Nghymru—os penderfynwn yn y modd hwnnw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ar wahân i'r tebygolrwydd y daw arian ychwanegol fel rhan o'r setliad yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn, mae hefyd yn fater i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau bod tai yn flaenoriaeth yn ei chyllideb. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod pwysau difrifol ar gymunedau, a bod cynghorau, oherwydd eu rhwystredigaethau, yn methu ag adeiladu tai bellach. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn mai un o'r pethau mawr i wynebu'r Llywodraeth yma fydd sicrhau ei bod yn ychwanegu'n sylweddol at y stoc dai yn y sector tai cymdeithasol, fel bod pobl sydd un ai yn methu â fforddio prynu tŷ neu yn dewis yn benodol i rentu tŷ hefyd yn cael y cyfle i symud i dŷ fforddiadwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ddwy agwedd hynny ar y pwnc llosg o dai fforddiadwy yn bwysig fel ei gilydd, sef yr hawl i rentu am bris rhesymol a fforddiadwy, a'r hawl i brynu, yn enwedig os ydych â'ch troed ar yr ysgol eiddo am y tro cyntaf. Mae'n bwysig eich bod â'r hawl i wneud hynny yn eich ardal eich hun, yn enwedig pan fydd problemau gyda'r farchnad ddeuol sydd wedi datblygu, sef lle nad oes cysylltiad rhwng

housing and rented housing in our manifesto. I am pleased to see that it is now an issue that is given attention by every party. Given that people cannot buy houses in their communities or get houses for rent, does the First Minister accept that this should be one of the Government's top priorities once we get to hear what the Assembly's settlement will be from the Treasury later in the year?

The First Minister: Of course. As I said in reply to Jocelyn's question earlier, we expect what Gordon Brown said in his acceptance speech for the office of leader of the Labour Party, and therefore of Prime Minister—namely, that affordable housing is at the top of his list of priorities—to be transferred to an element of additional spending. However, we can not be certain until the next spending review is announced, over the coming months. Of course, one can continue to hope, and the implication that follows allocating additional spending to England is that we will be given additional money to spend on our priorities in Wales—if we decide in that way.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Apart from the possibility that additional money will come to us as part of the settlement later this year, it is also a question of the Assembly Government ensuring that housing is a priority in its budget. I am sure that the First Minister is aware of the grave pressure on communities, and that councils are being frustrated from building housing any longer. Will the First Minister accept that one of the major issues facing the Government here will be ensuring that it makes substantial additions to the housing stock in the social housing sector, so that people who either cannot afford to buy a house or choose specifically to rent a house are given the opportunity to move to an affordable home?

The First Minister: Both those aspects of the burning issue of affordable homes are equally important, namely the right to rent a house for a reasonable and affordable sum, and the right to buy, especially if you want to have a foot on the property ladder for the first time. It is important that you have the right to do that in your area, particularly when there are problems with the dual market that has developed, where there is no connection

lefel y cyflogau a chost y tai yn lleol. Yr ydym wedi darllen y stori y bore yma am y *chalet* sydd ar werth am £0.5 miliwn yn Abersoch. Efallai dyna'r enghraifft waethaf imi glywed amdani erioed o'r farchnad ddeuol sydd wedi datblygu yng Nghymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Once this issue of social housing has, hopefully, been dealt with by increasing the number of houses available, does the First Minister then accept that a great constraint in the provision of affordable housing to buy is the high cost of land in the first instance, which pushes up the price of new housing by a considerable margin?

2.10 p.m.

Does the First Minister accept that we need to look at ways in which land that is not earmarked for development could be allocated for affordable housing, thereby reducing the land cost? Does he also agree that it is important that public bodies, including the Assembly and local authorities, identify publicly owned land that could be released for that purpose? We must ensure that, as well as housing for rent, there is affordable housing available on land that is not as expensive as the open market currently demands.

The First Minister: I had a long discussion about this with the UK Government's new adviser, Professor Nickell, who happens to be on our economic research advisory panel, at the meeting held last Monday. He is an economist, so takes the view that you should try to reduce the high value of all land by making it easier to release and by making the planning system a bit more flexible, following the lines of the Barker review to the former Chancellor, Gordon Brown. However, if you cannot make land cheaper generally, you can make specific pieces of land, on a covenanted basis, cheaper by releasing it—particularly public-sector land, which includes our land, local authority land, former Ministry of Defence land, former hospitals and so on—with a specific restriction that it is being sold cheaply so that houses built there will not have the problems associated with land costing £3 million an acre or whatever, as would happen in some of the most expensive parts of Wales at present.

between the level of income and the price of houses locally. We have read the story this morning about the chalet for sale in Abersoch for £0.5 million. Perhaps that is the worst example of the dual market that has developed in Wales that I have ever heard of.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ar ôl delio â mater tai fforddiadwy, fel y gobeithir, drwy beri bod mwy o dai ar gael, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn wedyn mai un cyfyngiad mawr ar ddarparu tai fforddiadwy i'w prynu yw cost uchel y tir yn y lle cyntaf, gan fod hynny'n peri cynnydd sylweddol ym mhpris tai newydd?

A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn bod angen inni ystyried dulliau posibl o neilltuo ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy dir sydd heb ei glustnodi i'w ddatblygu, fel y bydd cost y tir yn llai? A yw hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig i gyrrff cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol, nodi tir sydd yn eiddo i'r cyhoedd y gellid ei ryddhau i'r diben hwnnw? Yn ogystal â thai i'w gosod ar rent, rhaid inni sicrhau bod tai fforddiadwy ar gael ar dir nad yw mor ddrud â'r tir sy'n cael ei werthu ar y farchnad agored ar hyn o bryd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cefais drafodaeth hir am hyn gyda chynghorydd newydd Llywodraeth y DU, yr Athro Nickell, sydd yn digwydd bod yn aelod o'n panel cynghorol ar ymchwil economaidd, yn y cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd ddydd Llun diwethaf. Mae'n economegydd, felly mae o'r farn y dylid ceisio gostwng gwerth uchel yr holl dir drwy ei gwneud yn haws ei ryddhau a pheri bod y system gynllunio ychydig yn fwy hyblyg, yn unol â barn adolygiad Barker a roddwyd i'r cyn Ganghellor, Gordon Brown. Fodd bynnag, os na ellir peri i dir fod yn rhatach yn gyffredinol, gellir peri bod tiroedd penodol yn rhatach, ar sail cyfamod, drwy eu rhyddhau—yn enwedig tir y sector cyhoeddus, sydd yn cynnwys ein tir ni, tir awdurdodau lleol, tir blaenorol y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn, hen ysbytai ac yn y blaen—gan osod cyfyngiad penodol i'r perwyl eu bod yn cael eu gwerthu'n rhad fel na fydd gan y tai a godir arnynt y problemau sydd yn gysylltiedig â thir sydd yn costio £3

miliwn yr erw neu rywbeth tebyg, fel y digwyddai yn rhai o'r rhannau drutaf o Gymru ar hyn o bryd.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Having taken some time to read the 'One Wales' document on the projected partnership between your party and Plaid Cymru—it is a gripping and compelling read, if I may say so—[*Interruption.*] I have not yet exchanged notes with Ann Jones, but I suspect that we share some of the same concerns.

One such concern, no doubt, will be that there does not appear to be any mention of the nurses' pay settlement, to which I know that Plaid Cymru was committed. This was to be announced on day one—that the nurses' pay settlement would be honoured in full. I can see that Plaid Cymru remain solidly behind this, and I know that Helen Mary Jones made much of this during the election campaign. Why, therefore, is it not in the document, as it was in 'The All-Wales Accord'? Is the First Minister going to announce on the first day of the projected Government—if it becomes a Government—that this will be paid in full?

The First Minister: I am glad that you think that the 'One Wales' document was a ripping good read, because I thought that 'The All-Wales Accord' was a rattling good yarn. Our ripping good read ripped up 'The All-Wales Accord', so that is one good thing to be said for it. The point that you make about nurses' pay is a matter for Edwina Hart, who will, I am sure, wish to make any announcement at the appropriate time.

Nick Bourne: I come back to my point, even though the First Minister is, as always, very keen to shunt this off to the Minister for Health and Social Services. This is a sufficiently serious issue for the First Minister to have a view on it. We are used to this customary stance of 'It ain't me, guv'—it is always somebody else. The Minister for Health and Social Services is not here now; we know that she has written to the Minister, but surely we could expect an immediate response—it is not as if it has gone off on a

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): A minnau wedi cymryd peth amser i ddarllen y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un' ar y bartneriaeth arfaethedig rhwng eich plaid chi a Phlaid Cymru—mae'n ddeunydd darllen grymus a gafaelgar, os caf ddweud—[*Torri ar draws.*] Nid wyf wedi cyfnewid nodiadau ag Ann Jones eto, ond yr wyf yn amau bod rhai o'r un pryderon gennym ein dau.

Un pryder o'r fath, mae'n sicr, yw nad yw'n ymddangos bod dim sôn am setliad cyflog y nyrsys, y gwn fod Plaid Cymru wedi ymrwymo iddo. Yr oedd hyn i'w gyhoeddi ar y diwrnod cyntaf—y byddai setliad cyflog y nyrsys yn cael ei dalu'n llawn. Gallaf weld bod Plaid Cymru'n dal yn gadarn o blaid hynny, a gwn fod Helen Mary Jones wedi rhoi pwys mawr ar hyn yn ystod ymgyrch yr etholiad. Pam, felly, nad yw yn y ddogfen hon, fel yr oedd yn 'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan'? A fydd y Prif Weinidog yn cyhoeddi ar ddiwrnod cyntaf y Llywodraeth arfaethedig—os daw'n Llywodraeth—y caiff ei dalu'n llawn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn credu bod y ddogfen 'Cymru'n Un' yn ddeunydd darllen gwefreiddiol, gan fy mod i'n credu bod 'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan' yn stori dda gynddeiriog. Mae ein deunydd darllen gwefreiddiol ni wedi rhoi pen ar 'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan', felly dyna un peth da y gellir ei ddweud amdano. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch am gyflogau nyrsys yn fater i Edwina Hart, a fydd, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn dymuno gwneud unrhyw gyhoeddiad ar yr adeg briodol.

Nick Bourne: Deuaf yn ôl at y pwynt a wneuthum, er bod y Prif Weinidog yn awyddus iawn, fel y mae bob amser, i basio hyn ymlaen i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae hyn yn fater digon pwysig i'r Prif Weinidog fod â barn amdano. Yr ydym yn gynefin â'r ymateb arferol, sef gwthio'r cyfrifoldeb ar rywun arall bob tro. Nid yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yma ar hyn o bryd; gwyddom ei bod wedi ysgrifennu llythyr at y Gweinidog, ond, yn sicr, gallem

Wells Fargo stagecoach. Why cannot we have an immediate response? Nurses should have received their pay settlement from 1 April, but if this is not settled now it will go into the autumn, by which time it will be too late. Will the First Minister commit himself and his Government to doing that?

The First Minister: It is a new constitutional theory that nurses' pay and the Minister for Health and Social Services have nothing to do with each other—that is a fairly novel doctrine. Clearly, we have expressed the Government's strong regrets that a pay review body's recommendation is not adhered to in full on day one, and have written in similar terms to the Westminster Government. However, it is a matter on which you will have to contain your impatience. You may prefer a statement on this matter to come from me, but there is nothing unusual or improper about any such statement coming from the Minister for Health and Social Services.

Nick Bourne: It is not a question of constitutional practice; it is a question of Rhodri Morgan practice. He always wants to shuffle off responsibility and never wants to give a lead. It has been paid in Scotland, Northern Ireland and Guernsey. Why can it not be paid in Wales? Why is it not in 'One Wales'? If he intends to pay this immediately, will he say so? If not, we can draw the inevitable conclusion that he just wants to shunt this into the long grass, and does not want to pay it. You are the First Minister: start to act like it.

The First Minister: You rattle off these clichés about long grass and shuffling off responsibility, yet, almost inevitably, and in every dispensation, the health Minister tends to have something to do with announcements about nurses' pay. You may not like that, and I am sorry if that is the case, but, there again, had 'The All-Wales Accord' gone through, you might have been the Minister for Health and Social Services, and then you would have preferred to have made the announcement, would you not? Perhaps you had some other job in mind, I do not know, but, sadly, that is

ddisgwyl cael ateb ar unwaith—nid yw fel petai wedi'i anfon yn bell. Pam na allwn gael ateb ar unwaith? Dylai nyrsys fod wedi cael eu setliad cyflog er 1 Ebrill, ond os na chaiff hyn ei setlo'n awr, bydd yn mynd ymlaen i'r hydref ac, erbyn hynny, bydd yn rhy hwyr. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog a'i Lywodraeth ymrwymo i wneud hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Damcaniaeth gyfansoddiadol newydd yw nad oes cysylltiad rhwng cyflogau nyrsys a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol—mae honno'n athrawiaeth eithaf newydd. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym wedi mynegi gofid mawr fel Llywodraeth na lynwyd yn llwyr wrth argymhellion corff adolygu cyflogau o'r diwrnod cyntaf, ac yr ydym wedi anfon llythyr gan ddefnyddio geiriau tebyg at Lywodraeth San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn rhaid ichi fod yn amyneddgar ar y mater hwn. Efallai y byddai'n well gennych gael datganiad gennyf fi am y mater hwn, ond nid oes dim sydd yn anarferol neu'n amhriodol ynghylch cael datganiad o'r fath gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Nick Bourne: Nid mater o arfer cyfansoddiadol ydyw; mae'n fater o arfer Rhodri Morgan. Mae bob amser am ymwrthod â chyfrifoldeb ac nid yw byth am roi arweiniad. Fe'i talwyd yn yr Alban, yng Ngogledd Iwerddon ac yn Guernsey. Pam na ellir ei dalu yng Nghymru? Pam nad yw yn 'Cymru'n Un'? Os yw'n bwriadu talu hyn ar unwaith, a wnaiff ddweud hynny? Os nad ydyw, gallwn ddod i'r casgliad anochel nad yw ond am ei wthio o'r neilltu, ac nad yw am ei dalu. Chi yw'r Prif Weinidog: dechreuwch ymddwyn felly.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn adrodd yr ystrydebau hyn am wthio pethau o'r neilltu ac ymwrthod â chyfrifoldeb, ond, yn anochel bron, ac ym mhob gweinyddiaeth, mae'r Gweinidog iechyd yn tueddu i fod â rhyw ran mewn cyhoeddiadau am gyflogau nyrsys. Efallai nad ydych yn hoffi hynny, ac os yw hynny'n wir mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond, eto i gyd, pe bai 'Cytundeb Cymru Gyfan' wedi cael ei weithredu, efallai mai chi fyddai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac yna byddai wedi bod yn well gennych chi wneud y cyhoeddiad, oni

not about to come to pass.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): I hope that nurses' morale has been raised by your comments this afternoon. I would like to ask you about policing. Surely it is a priority of this Assembly to ensure that people feel safe in their communities, and that means dealing with safety through the police force from the strategic level down to community policing. Do you agree that the Welsh Assembly Government should play a real role in addressing these concerns? In your list of priorities, what plans do you have to boost the numbers of police officers or police community support officers in the coming year?

The First Minister: I do not have any specific proposals on that front. They will be dealt with in the usual way through the budget process. It is important that we recognise that we have a joint responsibility with Westminster for policing. We lead on funding, although there is always Home Office funding as well, and it has operational responsibility. Community safety partnerships again tend to be led via us, and that can sometimes involve the recruitment of additional persons who assist the police and may wear uniforms and may have some, albeit restricted, powers to bring about greater community safety. However, it is a partnership, and that partnership is delivering anti-crime and crime reduction measures at a local level, in co-operation with local authorities, and we are very pleased by the success of the community safety partnership movement, which began some eight or nine years ago. It has been a very successful movement, involving, at a much wider scale, not just the police and police community support officers, but neighbourhood wardens and the local authorities and attempts to design crime out of buildings, better street lighting and a whole range of measures that can bring about a greater sense of community safety and can reclaim the streets for respectable citizens.

fyddai? Efallai fod gennych ryw swydd arall mewn golwg, ni wn, ond, yn anffodus, nid yw hynny ar fin digwydd.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Gobeithiaf fod morâl y nyrsys wedi cael ei godi gan eich sylwadau y prynhawn yma. Hoffwn eich holi am blismona. Onid yw'n flaenoriaeth i'r Cynulliad hwn sicrhau bod pobl yn teimlo'n ddiogel yn eu cymunedau, ac mae hynny'n golygu delio â diogelwch drwy'r heddlu o'r lefel strategol hyd at blismona cymunedol? A ydych yn cytuno y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru chwarae rôl wirioneddol o ran rhoi sylw i'r pryderon hyn? Yn eich rhestr o flaenoriaethau, pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i gynyddu niferoedd swyddogion yr heddlu neu swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu dros y flwyddyn i ddod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf ddim cynigion penodol o ran hynny. Byddwn yn ymdrin â hwy yn y ffordd arferol drwy broses y gyllideb. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod bod gennym gyfrifoldeb ar y cyd â San Steffan am blismona. Ni sydd yn arwain o ran cyllido, er bod cyllid drwy'r amser gan y Swyddfa Gartref hefyd, a hi sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb gweithredol. Mae partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol eto yn tueddu i gael eu harwain drwom ni, a gall hynny weithiau olygu recriwtio pobl ychwanegol sy'n helpu'r heddlu ac sydd efallai yn gwisgo lifrai ac efallai y bydd ganddynt rywfaint o bwerau, er mai cyfyngedig fydd y rheini, i sicrhau mwy o ddiogelwch yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, partneriaeth ydyw, ac mae'r bartneriaeth honno'n rhoi mesurau gwrth-droseddu a gostwng lefelau troseddu ar waith ar lefel leol, mewn cydweithrediad ag awdurdodau lleol. Yr ydym yn falch iawn o lwyddiant y mudiad partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol a ddechreuodd ryw wyth neu naw mlynedd yn ôl. Mae wedi bod yn fudiad llwyddiannus iawn, yn cynnwys, ar raddfa lawer ehangach, nid dim ond yr heddlu a swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu, ond wardeiniaid cymdogaeth a'r awdurdodau lleol ac ymdrechion i ddylunio adeiladau er mwyn atal troseddu, gwell goleuadau ar strydoedd ac ystod gyfan o fesurau sy'n gallu creu ymdeimlad ehangach o ddiogelwch cymunedol ac sy'n gallu adennill y strydoedd

i ddinasyddion parchus.

Michael German: That was a long answer, but I will take the first part, which is the important bit. I asked you what plans you have to boost the numbers of police officers or police community support officers in Wales, and I thought you said—and I want to be absolutely certain that I heard you correctly—that you had no such plans at the moment and that it depends upon the budget. In other words, that means that it is not a priority, because if it were, it would be a priority in your budget. My question therefore is: did I hear you correctly and that you have no such plans at present?

The First Minister: The plans that we have will be addressed through the budget process. All plans for expenditure from 1 April next year will be addressed through the budget process—there is nothing unique about the police or about additional recruitment of PCSOs or greater local authority expenditure. Those are all matters for the budget process, as I mentioned in answer to the first question.

Michael German: Okay. I accept that you do not have any plans at the moment. Let us try another priority, the green switch agenda—you pinched that phrase from us, and are quite happy to use it, so I will use it again. Your proposals under this borrowed title did not touch upon the key area of renewable energy. Could you tell us whether, in your priorities, you will put Wales at the forefront of the green revolution by setting a target for energy produced from renewable sources for Wales?

The First Minister: We have used a figure for the four-year period of 100,000 homes to be made energy efficient and of 30,000 microgeneration units.

Biosecurity

Q3 Brynle Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on biosecurity in Wales?

Michael German: Yr oedd hwnnw'n ateb hir, ond cyfeiriaf at y rhan gyntaf, sef y darn pwysig. Holais pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i gynyddu niferoedd swyddogion yr heddlu neu swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu yng Nghymru, a chredaf ichi ddweud—ac yr wyf am fod yn berffaith siŵr imi glywed yn iawn—nad oedd gennych gynlluniau o'r fath ar hyn o bryd a bod hynny'n dibynnu ar y gyllideb. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae'n golygu nad yw'n flaenoriaeth, oherwydd pe bai, byddai'n flaenoriaeth yn eich cyllideb. Fy nghwestiwn i chi, felly, yw: a glywais i chi yn iawn ac nad oes gennych gynlluniau o'r fath ar hyn o bryd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn yn ymdrin â'r cynlluniau sydd gennym drwy broses y gyllideb. Byddwn yn ymdrin â'r holl gynlluniau gwariant o 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf drwy broses y gyllideb—nid oes dim yn unigryw ynghylch yr heddlu nac ynghylch recriwtio rhagor o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol yr heddlu nac ynghylch gwariant ychwanegol i lywodraeth leol. Mae'r rheini i gyd yn faterion i broses y gyllideb, fel y soniais wrth ateb y cwestiwn cyntaf.

Michael German: O'r gorau. Yr wyf yn derbyn nad oes gennych gynlluniau ar hyn o bryd. Gadewch inni roi cynnig ar flaenoriaeth arall, agenda'r newid gwyrdd—dwyn yr ymadrodd hwnnw oddi arnom ni a wnaethoch, ac yr ydych yn ddigon hapus i'w ddefnyddio, felly fe'i defnyddiaf fi ef eto. Nid oedd dim sôn yn eich cynigion dan y teitl benthyg hwn am faes allweddol ynni adnewyddadwy. A allwch ddweud wrthym a fyddwch, yn eich blaenoriaethau, yn rhoi Cymru ar flaen y gad yn y chwyldro gwyrdd drwy osod targed i Gymru ar gyfer ynni a gynhyrchir o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar gyfer y cyfnod pedair blynedd, y ffigur a ddefnyddiwyd gennym oedd y caiff 100,000 o gartrefi eu gwneud yn effeithlon o ran ynni ac y sefydlir 30,000 o unedau microgynhyrchu.

Bioddiogelwch

C3 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bioddiogelwch yng

OAQ(3)0135(FM)

The First Minister: Biosecurity in the farming context is a package of measures used to protect animals against the spread of infection. We promote adoption of the principle by all livestock keepers and are facilitating technical developments such as a biosecurity intensive treatment area in south-west Wales, focused on bovine TB.

Brynle Williams: It is pleasing to hear that we are at least beginning to do something about TB, but that was not what I was getting at. I am sure that you will agree that it was fortunate that the recent outbreak of avian influenza in north Wales involved the less dangerous H7N2 strain. Given the two recent outbreaks of the H5N1 strain in the Czech Republic, with migratory birds still coming over from Europe, what work is going on to ensure that the Government and animal health officials learn lessons from the recent north Wales outbreak? I would also like to know with what new instructions they have been issued.

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: The important thing is that we proceed with the investigation as to the origins of the disease. We may never find out precisely what its origins were, but we must proceed with the investigation. I will write to you with full details when that investigation has been completed. You cannot really address its implications for better practice for the future until the investigation is completed.

Mick Bates: I have just read with interest the statement by the Minister for Sustainability and Rural Development on her decisive action to carry out the legal requirements of the TB control measures and to remove Shambo from the Skanda Vale community. I think that most people will realise that it is a necessary action. Will the First Minister ensure that the Minister for Sustainability and Rural Development introduces equally decisive action to control the spread of TB, which is devastating the agriculture industry in Wales?

Nghymru? OAQ(3)0135(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yng nghyd-destun ffermio, pecyn o fesurau a ddefnyddir i amddiffyn anifeiliaid rhag i haint ymledu yw bioddiogelwch. Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo mabwysiadu'r egwyddor hon gan bawb sy'n cadw da byw ac yr ydym yn hwyluso datblygiadau technegol megis ardal driniaeth ddwys o ran bioddiogelwch yn y de-orllewin, sy'n canolbwyntio ar TB mewn gwartheg.

Brynle Williams: Mae'n dda clywed ein bod o leiaf yn dechrau gwneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â TB, ond nid hynny oedd gennyf dan sylw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno ei bod yn ffodus mai'r math llai peryglus o fflui adar, H7N2, a gafwyd yn y gogledd yn ystod yr achos diweddar. O ystyried y ddau achos diweddar o'r math H5N1 yn y Weriniaeth Tsiec, a bod adar mudol yn dal i groesi draw o Ewrop, pa waith sy'n mynd rhagddo i sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth a swyddogion iechyd anifeiliaid yn dysgu gwersi oddi wrth yr achos a gafwyd yn y gogledd yn ddiweddar? Hoffwn wybod hefyd pa gyfarwyddiadau newydd sydd wedi cael eu rhoi iddynt.

Y Prif Weinidog: Y peth pwysig yw ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'r ymchwiliad i darddiad y clefyd. Efallai na chanfyddwn byth beth yn union oedd ei darddiad, ond rhaid inni barhau â'r ymchwiliad. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion llawn pan fydd yr ymchwiliad hwnnw wedi cael ei gwblhau. Ni allwch mewn gwirionedd ymdrin â'i oblygiadau o ran gwell arferion yn y dyfodol nes bydd yr ymchwiliad wedi cael ei gwblhau.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf newydd ddarllen gyda diddordeb y datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Gynaliadwyedd a Datblygu Gwledig ar y cam pendant y mae wedi ei gymryd i weithredu gofynion cyfreithiol y mesurau rheoli TB ac i gael gwared â Shambo o gymuned Skanda Vale. Credaf y bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn sylweddoli bod yn rhaid gweithredu felly. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog sicrhau bod y Gweinidog dros Gynaliadwyedd a Datblygu Gwledig yn cyflwyno camau yr un mor bendant i reoli lledaeniad TB, sy'n gwneud niwed enfawr i'r diwydiant amaethyddol yng

Nghymru?

The First Minister: I am grateful to you for your commendation of the decision letter from the Minister, Jane Davidson, which was issued today, and for bringing it to the attention of anyone who has not seen it. At 2 p.m., when my question time started, the written Cabinet statement was made available to all Assembly Members. It describes her decision and the balance in favour of continuing with the slaughter notice procedure, because human and animal health considerations override the issues concerning human rights and respect for the Hindu faith. That process will now proceed. There may yet be a legal challenge as we are not clear as to how the community will respond.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am gymeradwyo'r llythyr penderfyniad gan y Gweinidog, Jane Davidson, a ryddhawyd heddiw, ac am ei ddwyn i sylw unrhyw un nad yw wedi ei weld. Am 2 p.m., wrth i'm sesiwn gwestiynau ddechrau, rhyddhawyd datganiad ysgrifenedig y Cabinet i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae'n disgrifio ei phenderfyniad a'i bod, wedi pwyso a mesur, o blaid parhau â gweithdrefn yr hysbysiad lladd, gan fod ystyriaethau'n ymwneud ag iechyd pobl ac anifeiliaid yn cael blaenoriaeth dros ystyriaethau'n ymwneud â hawliau dynol a pharch tuag at y ffydd Hindŵaidd. Bydd y broses honno'n mynd rhagddi yn awr. Efallai y ceir her gyfreithiol eto gan nad ydym yn glir sut y gwnaiff y gymuned ymateb.

On the wider issue of whether we are paying enough attention to the elimination of bovine TB, the disease has never been eliminated from the UK—although it was eliminated from Wales for 20 to 30 years, it remained endemic in the south-west of England. It reinvaded Wales via Somerset and Gloucestershire, spread into the Welsh border area and across into west Wales and so on. High dairying areas such as south-west Wales have a serious problem and that is the reason for the biosecurity intensive treatment area programme. We hope that, as a pilot scheme, it will achieve its intended effect.

O ran y mater ehangach, a ydym yn rhoi digon o sylw i ddileu TB mewn gwartheg, nid yw'r clefyd erioed wedi cael ei ddileu o'r DU—er iddo gael ei ddileu o Gymru am 20 i 30 o flynyddoedd, yr oedd yn dal yn endemig yn ne-orllewin Lloegr. Daeth yn ei ôl i Gymru drwy Wlad yr Haf a Swydd Gaerloyw, gan ymledu i ardal gororau Cymru ac ar draws i'r gorllewin ac yn y blaen. Mae gan ardaloedd lle y cynhyrchir llawer o laeth megis y de-orllewin broblem ddirifol a dyna'r rheswm dros raglen yr ardal driniaeth ddwys o ran bioddiogelwch. Gobeithiwn y bydd, fel cynllun peilot, yn cael yr effaith a fwriedir.

Front-line Health Services

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Rheng Flaen

Q4 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on the state of front-line health services in Wales? OAQ(3)0136(FM)

C4 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyflwr gwasanaethau iechyd rheng flaen yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)0136(FM)

The First Minister: We are continuing to make progress in all front-line health services, in particular ambulance response times, waiting times, accident and emergency waits, delayed transfers of care, and access to dentistry.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn dal i wneud cynnydd o ran yr holl wasanaethau iechyd rheng flaen, yn arbennig o ran amseroedd ymateb yr ambiwlansys, amseroedd aros mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys, oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, a mynediad at ddeintyddiaeth.

Nick Bourne: The question is not about nurses' pay this time—I hope that he will be goaded into action by what we have already

Nick Bourne: Nid cwstiwn am gyflogau nyrsys yw hwn y tro hwn—gobeithiaf y caiff ei symbylu i weithredu gan yr hyn yr ydym

said on that. This question is about the Chief Nursing Officer's report. The First Minister will be aware that there is no statutory obligation for the CNO to produce an annual report. That has been a matter of concern to nurses and to the Royal College of Nursing for some time and there is a strong case to be made for putting the report on a statutory basis, for us to debate it and for nurses to be given a chance to have an input. Is that something that the First Minister could take away and consider? I think that this is an important issue.

The First Minister: That sounds like an interesting and constructive suggestion, which I will take away and consider, in conjunction with Edwina Hart, the Minister for Health and Social Services.

Val Lloyd: First Minister, I am sure that you would agree that the future of adult neurosurgery in south Wales must be an early item on the agenda of front-line health services in Wales; therefore, can you tell me whether any progress has been made on this issue?

The First Minister: Edwina Hart has been in extensive discussions on this issue since she became health Minister a few weeks' ago. Those discussions have involved health service interests, opposition party spokespeople and her officials. She has now held her final meeting on this matter, this morning, in Swansea, and has since written to Health Commission Wales, setting out her decision to embark on a new all-Wales approach to the issue over the next 12 months. Edwina hopes to make a full statement to the Assembly on the matter tomorrow.

David Lloyd: I ehangu'r maes, pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud, fel Llywodraeth, ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau trydyddol yng Nghymru, nid dim ond niwrolawdriniaeth? Yr wyf yn cyfeirio at ddyfodol yr holl wasanaethau trydyddol arbenigol, a sut i'w cadw yng Nghymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd Edwina wedi clywed yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud ynglŷn â ddyfodol ein gwasanaethau trydyddol. Mae'n

wedi ei ddweud eisoes am hynny. Cwestiwn yw hwn am adroddiad y Prif Swyddog Nyrsio. Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol nad oes rhwymedigaeth statudol ar y Prif Swyddog Nyrsio i gynhyrchu adroddiad blynyddol. Mae hynny wedi bod yn destun pryder i nyrsys ac i Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys ers peth amser a gellir dadlau achos cryf o blaid rhoi'r adroddiad ar sail statudol, i ni ei drafod ac i nyrsys gael cyfle i gael mewnbwn. A yw hynny'n rhywbeth y gallai'r Prif Weinidog gymryd amser i'w ystyried? Credaf fod hwn yn fater pwysig.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwnnw'n swnio'n awgrym diddorol ac adeiladol, a byddaf yn cymryd amser i'w ystyried, ar y cyd ag Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Val Lloyd: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno bod rhaid i ddyfodol niwrolawdriniaeth i oedolion yn y de fod yn eitem gynnar ar agenda gwasanaethau iechyd rheng flaen yng Nghymru; felly, a allwch ddweud wrthyf a oes unrhyw gynnydd wedi cael ei wneud ar y mater hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Edwina Hart wedi cynnal trafodaethau helaeth am y mater hwn ers iddi ddod yn Weinidog iechyd rai wythnosau'n ôl. Mae'r trafodaethau hynny wedi cynnwys buddiannau ar ran y gwasanaeth iechyd, llefarwyr y gwrthbleidiau a'i swyddogion hi. Erbyn hyn mae wedi cynnal ei chyfarfod olaf am y mater hwn, y bore yma yn Abertawe, ac ers hynny mae wedi ysgrifennu at Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, yn nodi ei phenderfyniad i ymgymryd â dull newydd i Gymru gyfan o ymdrin â'r mater dros y 12 mis nesaf. Mae Edwina'n gobeithio gwneud datganiad llawn i'r Cynulliad ar y mater yfory.

David Lloyd: To take things a little further, what work are you, as a Government, doing on the future of all tertiary services in Wales, not only neurosurgery services? As I said, I refer to the future of all specialist tertiary services and how they can be retained in Wales.

The First Minister: Edwina will have heard your points about the future of tertiary services. It is important to recognise that the

bwysig ystyried bod y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru yn cynnal rhai gwasanaethau a'n bod ni hefyd yn dibynnu ar ysbytai mawr arbenigol yn Lloegr am rai gwasanaethau trydyddol eraill—ysbytai ym Mryste, Birmingham, Llundain, Lerpwl, Caer a Manceinion. Ambell waith, mae hynny'n gwneud synnwyr cyffredin, ond ambell waith gall y gwaith ddod yn ôl i Gymru os yw'r buddsoddiad a chymysgedd yr achosion sydd yn galw am y driniaeth yn ddigonol i greu gwasanaeth cynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Jenny Randerson: The latest figures on the number of people waiting more than four hours in accident and emergency departments showed, once again, that the situation is most serious in Cardiff, where an 82 per cent figure against the target is achieved; that is by far the lowest in Wales. This is yet another sign of the severe pressures on the health service in and around our capital city, where, as you know, there are tremendous burdens as a result of the fact that 80,000 people a day come to Cardiff either to work or for leisure. Will your Government undertake to review the funding to see that this pressure on the funding of the health service in our capital city is recognised?

The First Minister: In a way, we have already done that by writing off the debt of Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust. We set it a challenge some three years ago, when we said that, if it could keep its nose clean financially, there would be a fair chance that its debt would be written off. That is what we have done, and an enormous burden has been lifted from the shoulders of Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust. It is an object lesson to other trusts that are in chronic deficit that, if they make a bit more effort, they could reach a situation where their debt might be able to be written off too. They can plan services much more easily once that burden has been lifted from their accounts.

Adeilad y Cynulliad yng Nghyffordd Llandudno

C5 Gareth Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau ar gyfer adeilad newydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng

national health service in Wales provides certain services and that we also depend on some big, specialist hospitals in England for other tertiary services—hospitals in Bristol, Birmingham, London, Liverpool, Chester and Manchester. Using those hospitals is sometimes a matter of common sense, but, at other times, the work could come back to Wales if the investment is there and if the case mix is such that it gives rise to sufficient demand for sustainable services to be established in Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Dangosodd y ffigurau diweddaraf ynghylch nifer y bobl sy'n aros dros bedair awr mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, unwaith eto, fod y sefyllfa ar ei mwyaf difrifol yng Nghaerdydd, lle y cyrhaeddir ffigur o 82 y cant yn erbyn y targed; hynny yw'r isaf yng Nghymru o bellffordd. Mae hwn yn arwydd arall eto o'r pwysau difrifol sydd ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ein prifddinas a'r cyffiniau, lle y mae beichiau aruthrol, fel y gwyddoch, yn deillio o'r ffaith bod 80,000 o bobl y dydd yn dod i Gaerdydd un ai i weithio neu ar gyfer hamdden. A wnaiff eich Llywodraeth ymrwymo i adolygu'r cyllid i sicrhau bod y pwysau hwn ar gyllid y gwasanaeth iechyd yn ein prifddinas yn cael ei gydnabod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mewn ffordd, yr ydym eisoes wedi gwneud hynny drwy ddileu dyled Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Gosodasom her iddi ryw dair blynedd yn ôl, pan ddywedasom fod gobaith pur dda y câi ei dyled ei dileu pe gallai fyw o fewn ei hincwm. Dyna ydym wedi ei wneud, ac mae baich enfawr wedi cael ei godi oddi ar ysgwyddau Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro. Mae'n wers ymarferol i ymddiriedolaethau eraill sydd â diffyg cronig y gallent, pe baent yn gwneud ychydig mwy o ymdrech, gyrraedd sefyllfa lle y gallai eu dyled hwythau hefyd gael ei dileu efallai. Gallant gynllunio gwasanaethau yn llawer haws wedi i'r baich hwnnw gael ei godi oddi ar eu cyfrifon.

Assembly Building in Llandudno Junction

Q5 Gareth Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on plans for the new Welsh Assembly Government building in

Nghyffordd Llandudno? OAQ(3)0122(FM)

Llandudno Junction? OAQ(3)0122(FM)

C8 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw gynnydd ynghylch swyddfeydd newydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn Llandudno? OAQ(3)0118(FM)

Q8 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on any progress with regard to the new Welsh Assembly Government Offices in Llandudno? OAQ(3)0118(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ym mis Chwefror eleni, penderfynwyd oedi'r contract, a'i adolygu, er mwyn ystyried y manylion a'r dyluniad yn ofalus, er mwyn sicrhau bod y fanyleb yn bodloni'r gofynion yn llwyr. Nid yw'n anarferol cynnal adolygiadau o'r fath fel rhan o brosiectau a chontractau mor fawr.

The First Minister: Last February, a decision was taken to postpone and review the contract in order to give careful consideration to the details and design, and to ensure that the specification fully met the requirements. Conducting such reviews as part of large projects and contracts is common practice.

Gareth Jones: Ni fyddai neb yn gwadu hynny ond, o ystyried pwysigrwydd y fenter hon o ran datblygu'r economi leol a chyfrannau at ddelwedd y Cynulliad yn y gogledd, mae llawer ohonom yn methu â deall yr oedi. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn tri chyflwyniad ynglŷn â'r cynllun hwn a dywedwyd, o'r cychwyn cyntaf, y byddai'n adeilad eiconaidd—credaf fod yr un peth yn wir am adeilad Aberystwyth—ac mae 'eiconaidd' heddiw, o ystyried yr adeilad hwn, yn gyfystyr â bod yn ddrud. Mae pawb wedi gwybod o'r cychwyn cyntaf—yn ôl y sibrydion, beth bynnag—fod cost yn gysylltiedig â'r adeilad hwn. Felly, mae'n anodd deall yr oedi. Hefyd, pam ydych yn oedi o ran mynd i'r gogledd i drafod y mater neu wahodd arweinydd a phrif weithredwr Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy i gael gair gyda chi yma? Mae'r mater hwn yn pwysu arnynt.

Gareth Jones: No-one would deny that but, given the project's importance to the development of the local economy and its impact on the Assembly's image in north Wales, many of us cannot understand why this delay has occurred. I have attended three presentations on the scheme and I heard, from the outset, that this would be an iconic building—I think that the same can be said of the Aberystwyth building—but using the word 'iconic' today, looking at this building, is the same as saying 'expensive'. We have all been aware, from the very beginning—on hearing rumours—of the cost associated with this building. Therefore, it is difficult to understand why a delay has occurred. Furthermore, why have you not been to north Wales to discuss this matter or invited the leader and chief executive of Conwy County Borough Council to meet you? This is a matter of great import to them.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, sef ei fod yn symbol pwysig o ddelwedd y Cynulliad a'r cysylltiad rhwng y Cynulliad a'r gogledd. Serch hynny, mae dyn yn gorfod ceisio sicrhau gwerth am arian pan fo costau yn dechrau codi, er mwyn ceisio cadw yn agos at y gost wreiddiol. Ni allwch gynnal trafodaethau masnachol sydd yn ymwneud â miliynau o bunnoedd yn gyhoeddus ac yn agored; ambell waith, ni allwch hyd yn oed wneud hynny mewn cyfarfodydd gyda phrif weithredwyr llywodraeth leol, hyd yn oed. Dyna sy'n bwysig. Yr ydym yn gorfod derbyn bod yn rhaid ymdrin â rhai o'r cwestiynau masnachol hyn mewn ffordd

The First Minister: I accept your point that the building will be an important symbol of the Assembly's image and of the links between the Assembly and north Wales. However, we have to ensure value for money when costs start to escalate, so that we stay as close as possible to the original costs. Commercial negotiations that involve millions of pounds of public money cannot be held in public or openly; sometimes, you cannot even discuss the subject in meetings with local authority chief executives. That is an important point. We must accept that some of these commercial questions need to be dealt with in a commercial manner with the builder or developer.

fasnachol gyda'r adeiladwr neu'r datblygwr.

2.30 p.m.

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn dilyn cwestiwn Gareth Jones, a oedd yn nodi pwysigrwydd yr adeilad fel symbol o'r Cynulliad yn y gogledd, pwysigrwydd arall yr adeilad yw'r ffaith y bydd yn cyflogi nifer helaeth o bobl. Fodd bynnag, bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl hynny yn symud i'r adeilad o swyddfeydd eraill yn y gogledd, ac nid cyn pryd yn achos rhai o'r swyddfeydd hynny. Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn ynghylch y duedd i symud swyddogion o swyddfeydd y Llywodraeth yn y gogledd-orllewin i Llandudno, oherwydd bydd hynny'n atal llawer o bobl sydd ar hyn o bryd yn byw ym Mhen Llŷn neu Feirionnydd rhag teithio i'w gwaith. A roddwch sicrwydd na fydd pobl yn symud o swyddi yn ardal Caernarfon a Bangor i'r swyddfa newydd yn Llandudno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai'n well i mi adolygu'r sefyllfa i weld beth yn union yw'r ffigurau o ran cyfanswm y swyddi a fydd yn symud o'r de i'r gogledd, yn hytrach na'r swyddi a fydd yn symud o un man yn y gogledd i'r swyddfa newydd, er mwyn sicrhau nad wyf yn camarwain neb am y manylion. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion hynny.

Mark Isherwood: You have heard reference to the concern expressed by the local business community and local government that this was not about the status and representation of the Assembly Government in Wales but about the status and representation of north Wales in the Assembly Government. This has been taken, intentionally or otherwise—I am sure that it is otherwise—as a snub by large numbers of people in north Wales. You rightly said that, in the circumstances, lengthy discussions with local authorities and others may be inappropriate, but why could you not at least give pre-notification and have some degree of discussion? We were told by the council leader, and others, that no pre-notification was given. Can you give a clear indication of what the cost of the delay will be, which your representative in north Wales was unable to give? Can you assure us that the new building will open in 2009, and that it will not be

Alun Ffred Jones: Following on from Gareth Jones's question, which identified the building's importance as a symbol of the Assembly in north Wales, the building's other importance is the fact that it will employ a large number of people. However, most of those people will move to the building from other areas of north Wales, and not before time in the case of some of those offices. I am very concerned about the trend to move officers from Government offices in north-west Wales to Llandudno, because it will prevent many who currently live on the Llŷn Peninsula or Meirionnydd from travelling to work. Will you give an assurance that people will not move from jobs in the Caernarfon and Bangor area to the new office in Llandudno?

The First Minister: It would be better if I reviewed the situation to see what exactly the figures are in terms of the total number of jobs which will move from south Wales to north Wales, rather than the jobs which will move from one area of north Wales to the new office, to ensure that I do not mislead anyone about the details. I will write to you with those details.

Mark Isherwood: Clywsoch gyfeiriad at y pryder a fynegwyd gan y gymuned fusnes leol a llywodraeth leol nad mater o statws a chynrychiolaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yng Nghymru oedd hyn, ond mater o statws a chynrychiolaeth y gogledd yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yng ngolwg llawer iawn o bobl yn y gogledd, mae hyn yn sen, yn fwriadol neu fel arall—yr wyf yn siŵr mai fel arall y mae. Dywedaso, yn ddigon teg, fod trafodaethau hirfaith gydag awdurdodau lleol ac eraill efallai'n amhriodol dan yr amgylchiadau, ond pam na allech o leiaf roi rhagrybudd a chael rhyw gymaint o drafod? Dywedwyd wrthym gan arweinydd y cyngor, ac eraill, na roddwyd rhagrybudd. A allwch roi syniad clir inni ynghylch beth fydd cost yr oedi, rhywbeth nad oedd eich cynrychiolydd yn y gogledd yn gallu ei roi? A allwch roi sicrwydd inni yr agorir yr adeilad newydd yn 2009, ac na fydd mwy na 12 mis o oedi wedi'r dyddiad agor a fwriadwyd yn

delayed more than 12 months beyond the original intended opening date? wreiddiol?

The First Minister: I will have to give you some general principles rather than specifics; I will write to you with the specifics when I have taken the most up-to-date advice from the officials in charge of the project.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yn rhaid imi roi egwyddorion cyffredinol i chi yn hytrach na manylion penodol; ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r manylion penodol pan fyddaf wedi cael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf un gan y swyddogion sy'n gyfrifol am y prosiect.

On the question of the local authorities, I intend to enter into communication with Conwy County Borough Council very shortly, because I understand the concerns that it has expressed as the building is in its area. The Point site, as it is called, after the old Hotpoint factory that was there, is critical to the economic future of the Conwy area and that central belt of the north Wales coastal area.

O ran yr awdurdodau lleol, bwriadaf ohebu â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy'n fuan iawn, oherwydd yr wyf yn deall y pryderon a fynegwyd ganddo gan fod yr adeilad yn ei ardal. Mae safle'r Point, fel y'i gelwir, ar ôl yr hen ffatri Hotpoint a oedd yno, yn allweddol i ddyfodol economaidd ardal Conwy a'r rhanbarth canolog hwnnw o arfordir y gogledd.

On the wider issue of why we have not been able to involve the council directly, it is because it is not party to the commercial negotiations. We are trying to improve the value for money on the project, and you cannot have a third party sitting in the room when you are negotiating with the builders and the architects to bring the cost back down. The key point is that commercial negotiations can only take place with the two parties involved.

O ran y cwestiwn mwy cyffredinol ynghylch pam nad ydym wedi gallu cynnwys y cyngor yn uniongyrchol, y rheswm yw nad ydyw'n rhan o'r negodi masnachol. Yr ydym yn ceisio gwella'r gwerth am arian ar y prosiect, ac ni ellir cael trydydd parti'n eistedd yn yr ystafell wrth negodi gyda'r adeiladwyr a'r penseiri i ddod â'r gost yn ôl i lawr. Y pwynt allweddol yw mai dim ond gyda'r ddau barti perthnasol y gall negodi masnachol ddiwydd.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn gwneud fy ngorau i fynychu Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru, a gwn fod pryderon ymysg y rheini sy'n aelodau o'r fforwm—pobl sy'n ymwneud â phob agwedd ar fywyd y gogledd. Pa gyswllt neu drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda hwy am y mater pwysig hwn?

Eleanor Burnham: I try my best to attend the North Wales Economic Forum, and I am aware that there are concerns among the forum members—people who are involved in every aspect of north Wales life. What contact or discussions have you had with them about this important issue?

O ran trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, mae gan bobl bryderon mawr am orfod teithio bob bore o'r gogledd-orllewin, er enghraifft, oherwydd diffyg trafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, dim ond traean o'r maes parcio fydd ar gael ar eu cyfer, felly bydd hynny'n creu problemau ofnadwy.

On public transport, people have grave concerns about having to travel every morning from north-west Wales, for example, due to a lack of public transport. It is my understanding that only a third of the car park will be available for them, so that will create terrible problems.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd dau bwynt pwysig yn eich cyfraniad. O ran y trafodaethau yn y fforwm, yr unig berthynas gyda'r fforwm yw'r ffaith mai yno y rhyddhawyd y newyddion yn gyhoeddus am y tro cyntaf. Nid oes perthynas arall rhwng y

The First Minister: There were two important points in your contribution. On the discussions in the forum, the only relationship with the forum is the fact that the news was first released to the public there. There is no other relationship between the

fforwm a'r penderfyniad i adolygu'r cytundeb.

O ran trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, mae hwnnw'n bwynt hollbwysig. Holl fantais cael y safle hwn yw ei fod ar groesffordd bwysicaf y gogledd rhwng yr heol bwysicaf rhwng y gogledd a'r de a'r heol bwysicaf rhwng y gorllewin a'r dwyrain. Wrth sôn am y ffyrdd yn croesi, yr wyf yn cyfeirio at reilffyrdd yn yr un modd â heolydd fel yr A55, ac mae hynny o fantais fawr. Gallwch gwtogi ar nifer y lleoedd parcio y mae eu hangen i barcio ceir preifat y bobl hynny sy'n gyrru i'r gwaith gan fod gorsaf ar bwys y safle sy'n cysylltu'r rheilffordd o'r gogledd i'r de drwy ddyffryn Conwy a'r rheilffordd o'r gorllewin i'r dwyrain o Gaergybi i Wrexham ac ati.

Datblygu Economaidd

C7 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer datblygu economaidd yng Ngheredigion? OAQ(3)0119(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd lansiad datblygiad Amcan 1 yn aber Afon Teifi yn digwydd ddydd Gwener nesaf, ac mae hynny ymhlith mân brosiectau sy'n mabwysiadu ac yn cyflymu datblygiad economaidd yng Ngheredigion.

Elin Jones: Mae cysylltiadau trafndiaeth yn bwysig i hybu'r economi yng Ngheredigion, ac mae cysylltiadau trên ag Aberystwyth yn arbennig o bwysig. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 69 y cant o deithiau Trenau Arriva yn y canolbarth sy'n cyrraedd o fewn pum munud i'r amserlen, a hynny o'i gymharu â'r targed o 87.3 y cant y disgwylir i Arriva ei gyrraedd yn ôl y fasnachfrait. Dyma'r record waethaf yng Nghymru. Er mwyn gwella'r record warthus hon, mae Trenau Arriva a Network Rail yn gytûn bod angen creu lleoedd pasio ar reilffordd y canolbarth i gynnig yr hyblygrwydd sydd ei angen yn yr amserlen. Mae Network Rail wedi clustnodi hyd at £5 miliwn ar gyfer y gwaith hwn. A yw eich Llywodraeth hefyd yn barod i gydnabod bod angen buddsoddi yn y rheilffordd strategol bwysig hon?

forum and the decision to review the contract.

On public transport, that is a crucial point. The site's greatest advantage is that it is on the most important crossroads in north Wales between the most important road between north and south Wales and the most important road between west and east Wales. In talking about the roads crossing, I am referring to the railways as well as roads such as the A55, which is of great advantage. You can decrease the number of parking spaces needed for private cars used by those people who drive to work because there is a station near the site which links the railway from north to south Wales through the Conwy valley and the railway from west to east Wales from Holyhead to Wrexham, and so on.

Economic Development

Q7 Elin Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies for economic development in Ceredigion? OAQ(3)0119(FM)

The First Minister: The launch of the Objective 1 development in the Teifi estuary will take place next Friday, which is one of many minor projects which adopts and accelerates economic development in Ceredigion.

Elin Jones: Transport links are important to promote the economy in Ceredigion, and the rail links with Aberystwyth are particularly important. Currently, only 69 per cent of Arriva Trains in mid Wales arrive within five minutes of schedule, compared with a target of 87.3 per cent that Arriva is expected to reach according to the franchise. This is the worst record in Wales. To improve this disgraceful record, Arriva Trains and Network Rail are agreed that passing loops need to be created on the mid Wales railway to offer the flexibility needed in the timetable. Network Rail has earmarked up to £5 million for this work. Is your Government also ready to acknowledge that investment is needed in this important strategic railway?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn a chydabod bod problem, ond nid wyf yn fodlon derbyn na chydabod y byddwn yn trafod ymroddiad i wario'r arian heddiw am ei fod, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o'r broses o wneud ceisiadau yn ystod y broses gyllidebol a gwneud y penderfyniadau wedi hynny pan ddaw'r amser, ymhen tua chwe mis. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod Jane Hutt a'r Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros drafnidiaeth, Brian Gibbons, wedi clywed eich sylwadau. Yr ydym yn gwybod am y syniad o gael cylch pasio yng Nghyffordd Dyfi, a fydd yn helpu. Mae pawb yn derbyn hynny, ond rhaid gofyn sut mae hyn yn cymharu â'r blaenoriaethau eraill yn y maes hwn.

Alun Davies: We have succeeded in reducing unemployment in Ceredigion to 4 per cent while increasing employment to 71 per cent. Over the last few years, £23.9 million of Objective 1 money has been committed to 65 local projects in Ceredigion, safeguarding 5,400 jobs. Can you give a commitment that you will continue these polices, which have brought an economic renaissance to Ceredigion and the rest of mid and west Wales?

The First Minister: Indeed. With its low claimant count unemployment rate, Ceredigion is high up the league table. It is important that we recognise just how big the improvement in west Wales has been. The key issue is that, with Objective 1 renewed for a further seven years under its new name of convergence funding, Ceredigion remains eligible for another seven years, and we hope to see further improvements in the economy.

Denu Buddsoddiad

C9 Paul Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu pa fesurau y mae ei Lywodraeth yn golygu'u cyflwyno i ddenu buddsoddiad a busnes i mewn i orllewin Cymru? OAQ(3)0139(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Diolch am eich cwestiwn, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cwestiwn blaenorol. Gallaf roi fel enghraifft brosiect Bluestone, a fydd yn costio £67 miliwn yn y cyfnod cyntaf ac, efallai, dros £100 miliwn os daw trydydd

The First Minister: I am willing to accept and acknowledge that there is a problem, but I am not willing to accept or acknowledge that we will discuss a commitment to spend the money today because it is, of course, part of the application process during the budget round, and those decisions will be made in due course, in about six months. I am sure that Jane Hutt and the Minister with responsibility for transport, Brian Gibbons, have heard your comments. We are aware of the idea of having a passing loop at Dyfi Junction, which will help. Everyone accepts that, but one must ask how this compares with the other priorities in this area.

Alun Davies: Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i ostwng diweithdra yng Ngheredigion i 4 y cant ac mae cyflogaeth wedi codi i 71 y cant. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, addawyd £23.9 miliwn o arian Amcan 1 i 65 o brosiectau lleol yng Ngheredigion, gan ddiogelu 5,400 o swyddi. A allwch roi ymrwymiad y byddwch yn parhau â'r polisiau hyn, sydd wedi dod ag adfywiad economaidd i Geredigion a gweddill y canolbarth a'r gorllewin?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wir. Gyda'i chanran isel o bobl sy'n hawlio budd-dal diweithdra, mae Ceredigion yn uchel yn y tabl. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod cymaint o welliant a fu yn y gorllewin. Y mater allweddol, gan fod Amcan 1 wedi'i adnewyddu am saith mlynedd eto dan ei enw newydd, sef arian cydgyfeirio, yw bod Ceredigion yn parhau'n gymwys am saith mlynedd arall, a gobeithiwn weld mwy o welliannau yn yr economi.

Attracting Investment

Q9 Paul Davies: Will the First Minister outline what measures his Government intends to introduce to attract investment and business into west Wales? OAQ(3)0139(FM)

The First Minister: Thank you for your question, which is related to the previous question. I will give the Bluestone project as an example, which will cost £67 million during the first phase and possibly over £100

cyfnod. Gallai'r prosiect ddod â chynifer â 600 o swyddi ychwanegol i ardal Arberth a'r cylch.

2.40 p.m.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno bod system drafnidiaeth, fel y dywedodd Elin Jones, yn gwella economi leol unrhyw ardal. Ar y llaw arall, caiff system drafnidiaeth wael effaith negyddol ar ddenu buddsoddiad i unrhyw ranbarth. Er enghraifft, byddai gwneud yr A40 i Abergwaun, sydd yn fy etholaeth i, yn ffordd ddeuol o fantais enfawr i economi sir Benfro, a byddai'n sicr o ddenu rhagor o fuddsoddiad i'r sir. Byddai hefyd yn helpu busnesau yn yr ardal i greu rhagor o swyddi angenrheidiol. O dan yr amgylchiadau, a wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymrwymiad ar ran y Llywodraeth i wneud yr A40 yn ffordd ddeuol i Abergwaun cyn gynted â phosibl?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y dywedais eisoes, ni fyddaf byth yn rhoi ymrwymiad cyllidebol yn ystod sesiwn gwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n weddus ac ni chredaf y gall unrhyw Brif Weinidog nac unrhyw Weinidog arall wneud y cyfryw ymrwymiad wrth ateb cwestiynau. Os ydyw ffordd eisoes yn gefnffordd, megis yr A40 i Abergwaun, gellir gwneud cais i'r adran drafnidiaeth i'w gwneud yn ffordd ddeuol. Yna, rhaid ystyried maint y galw o ran y traffig ar y ffordd. Fel arfer, ni fydddech yn adeiladu ffordd ddeuol os na fyddai swm penodol o draffig yn ei defnyddio. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r ffigurau na'r isafswm y bydddech yn ei ystyried o ran yr A40; hynny yw, a ydyw'r A40 yn cario'r swm neu'r pwysau hwnnw o ran traffig y byddai ei angen. Er bod y ffordd honno'n gyfrwng pwysig, mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod galw er mwyn cyfiawnhau'r buddsoddiad o filiynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus i'w throï'n ffordd ddeuol.

Alun Davies: It never ceases to surprise me that the Conservatives demonstrate their commitment to cutting emissions by seeking to build new roads. Can you confirm, First Minister, that the convergence programmes are still on track to be launched this autumn? So far, in Wales, we have managed to achieve £1.59 billion-worth of money spent

million if there is a third phase. The project could bring as many as 600 extra jobs to the Narberth area.

Paul Davies: I am sure that the First Minister would agree that a transport system, as Elin Jones said, improves the local economy of any area. On the other hand, a poor transport system has a negative impact on attracting investment to any region. For example, dualling the A40 to Fishguard, which is in my constituency, would benefit the economy of Pembrokeshire enormously, and would certainly attract more investment to the county. It would also assist businesses in the area to create more necessary jobs. Under the circumstances, will the First Minister make a commitment on behalf of the Government to dual the A40 to Fishguard as soon as possible?

The First Minister: As I said previously, I never give budgetary commitments during First Minister's questions. I do not believe that it would be appropriate and I do not believe that any First Minister or any other Minister can make such a commitment in responding to questions. If a road is already a trunk road, as is the A40 to Fishguard, an application can be made to the transport department to convert it to a dual carriageway. The level of demand in terms of traffic on the road must then be considered. Usually, you would not build a dual carriageway if a specific amount of traffic did not use it. I am not sure what are the figures or the minimum that you would consider for the A40; that is, does the A40 have that sum or intensity of traffic that would be needed. Despite the fact that that road is an important gateway, it must be ensured that there is sufficient demand to justify the millions of pounds of public investment to convert it into a dual carriageway.

Alun Davies: Yr wyf bob amser yn synnu bod y Ceidwadwyr yn dangos eu hymrwymiad i gwtogi gollyngiadau drwy geisio adeiladu ffyrdd newydd. A allwch gadarnhau, Brif Weinidog, fod lansio'r rhaglenni cydgyfeirio'n dal ar y gweill yr hydref hwn? Hyd yn hyn, yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i sicrhau gwerth £1.59

on over 2,000 programmes, which have brought wealth and jobs to mid and west Wales. That is something that the Conservatives do not understand or realise.

The First Minister: Yes, I can confirm that. I believe that recent meetings in Brussels have confirmed that we are ahead of other parts of the United Kingdom. All of the officials in the Welsh European Funding Office and elsewhere in the Assembly have been involved in making sure that we started ahead of other parts of the United Kingdom. We have maintained our lead and we intend to stay ahead of other parts of the United Kingdom that are eligible for convergence funding in making sure that we get approval before anyone else.

Joyce Watson: Does the First Minister agree that businesses do not grow just by the building of more roads? A recent survey undertaken in Pembrokeshire shows that confidence levels among small and medium-sized enterprises are at an all-time high, therefore it might be advisable to look at the reasons for that confidence, which go beyond the creation of additional lanes in Pembrokeshire.

The First Minister: That is right. It is a question of which comes first: does the volume of business come first, which justifies the road building, or do you build the roads, initially empty, and then hope that business will emerge to fill up the roads? In value-for-money terms, I think that we have to go for the first option, thereby following the Irish example. In Ireland's regional development, Objective 1 and its predecessors were used to the full. The country let the business rip first before it got to the stage of having choking traffic jams on the highway system and turning to road development in order to cope with its business success.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I commend you on withstanding the challenging questions from Alun Davies. [*Laughter.*] I note your response to Elin Jones and Paul Davies about infrastructure in terms of roads and trains, but will you accept that in parts of south-west, north-west and mid Wales there is a need to

biluwn o wariant ar dros 2,000 o raglenni, sydd wedi dod â chyfoeth a gwaith i'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei ddeall nac yn ei sylweddoli.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf, gallaf gadarnhau hynny. Credaf fod cyfarfodydd diweddar ym Mrwsel wedi cadarnhau ein bod ar y blaen i rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r holl swyddogion yn Swyddfa Cyllid Ewropeaidd Cymru ac mewn rhannau eraill o'r Cynulliad wedi bod wrthi'n sicrhau ein bod yn dechrau o flaen rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Yr ydym wedi cadw ar y blaen a bwriadwn aros ar y blaen i rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig sy'n gymwys i gael arian cydgyfeirio drwy wneud yn siŵr ein bod yn cael cymeradwyaeth o flaen neb arall.

Joyce Watson: A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno na fydd busnesau'n tyfu dim ond wrth adeiladu rhagor o ffyrdd? Dengys arolwg diweddar a wnaethpwyd yn sir Benfro fod lefelau hyder ymysg busnesau bach a chanolig yn uwch nag erioed, felly efallai y byddai'n ddoeth edrych ar y rhesymau dros yr hyder hwnnw, sy'n mynd y tu hwnt i greu lonydd ychwanegol yn sir Benfro.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n iawn. Mae'n ymwneud â pha un sy'n dod gyntaf: a ddaw maint y busnes yn gyntaf, gan gyfiawnhau adeiladu'r ffyrdd, ynteu a ydych yn adeiladu'r ffyrdd, a fydd yn wag ar y dechrau, ac wedyn gobeithio y daw busnes i lenwi'r ffyrdd? O ran gwerth am arian, credaf mai'r dewis cyntaf sy'n mynd â hi, gan ddilyn esiampl Iwerddon. Yn natblygiad rhanbarthol Iwerddon, defnyddiwyd Amcan 1 a'i ragflaenwyr i'r eithaf. Gadawodd y wlad i fusnesau fwrw iddi'n gyntaf cyn cyrraedd y sefyllfa o fod â thagfeydd traffig difrifol ar y system briffyrdd a throi at ddatblygu ffyrdd er mwyn ymdopi â'i llwyddiant ym maes busnes.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Fe'ch cymeradwyaf am wrthsefyll y cwestiynau anodd gan Alun Davies. [*Chwerthin.*] Nodaf eich ymateb i Elin Jones a Paul Davies ynglŷn â seilwaith o ran ffyrdd a threnau, ond a dderbyniwch fod angen edrych ar ddatblygu economaidd mewn rhannau o'r de-orllewin, y gogledd-

approach economic development in a different way, and that it needs the Government to see the potential and to seek the opportunities to ensure that investment happens in those areas and that economic development takes place?

The First Minister: Nobody wants to build roads that will be empty, but investment in road infrastructure will be proportionate to demand, and simultaneous with demand—neither well in advance of demand nor after traffic jams have been allowed to build up, so that the road is well behind demand. However, we must also remember the point that you made about rural areas having a greater dependence on road transport, which is undoubtedly true. In the more populated areas, you can dream about, and plan for, modal shifts from private to public transport, and make the appropriate investment, but you cannot always do so in rural areas, simply because of the sparsity of the population.

Health Targets

Q10 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's success in achieving its health targets? OAQ(3)0120(FM)

The First Minister: Significant progress has been made over the past three years with regard to service delivery and performance levels in the national health service in Wales, particularly in reducing waiting times to a maximum of eight months for out-patient or in-patient, or day-case, treatment.

Helen Mary Jones: Any success is welcome, but would you acknowledge that many of your Government's targets over the past four years have had unintended consequences? One target with the aim of improving one aspect of healthcare has ended up having a knock-on effect on other aspects of it. I cite as an example the target for waiting times for a first out-patient appointment, at which one does not usually get treatment, as these can lead to a longer wait for the second appointment, which might lead to treatment.

orllewin a'r canolbarth mewn ffordd wahanol, a bod angen i'r Llywodraeth weld y potensial a chwilio am y cyfleon i sicrhau bod buddsoddi'n digwydd yn yr ardaloedd hynny a bod datblygu economaidd yn digwydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes ar neb eisiau adeiladu ffyrdd a fydd yn wag, ond bydd buddsoddiad mewn seilwaith ffyrdd yn gymesur â'r galw, a bydd yn digwydd yr un pryd â'r galw—nid ymhell cyn y galw nac ar ôl i'r tagfeydd traffig waethygu, fel bod y ffordd yn rhy hwyr ar gyfer y galw. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni hefyd gofio'r pwynt a wnaethpwyd gennych wrth nodi bod ardaloedd gwledig yn dibynnu mwy ar drafnidiaeth ar y ffyrdd, sy'n sicr yn wir. Yn yr ardaloedd mwy poblog, gallwch freuddwydio am newid o ddefnyddio trafnidiaeth breifat i ddefnyddio trafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, a chynllunio ar gyfer hynny, a gwneud y buddsoddiad priodol, ond ni allwch wneud hyn bob amser mewn ardaloedd gwledig, yn syml iawn oherwydd y boblogaeth wasgaredig.

Targedau ym Maes Iechyd

C10 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant y Llywodraeth wrth gyflawni ei thargedau ym maes iechyd? OAQ(3)0120(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaethpwyd cynnydd sylweddol yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf o safbwynt cyflenwi gwasanaethau a pherfformiad yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig o ran lleihau amseroedd aros i uchafswm o wyth mis ar gyfer triniaeth i gleifion allanol neu gleifion mewnol, neu achosion dydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Croesewir unrhyw lwyddiant, ond a fydddech yn cydnabod bod canlyniadau llawer o dargedau eich Llywodraeth yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf wedi bod yn anfwriadol? Mae targed a oedd i wella un agwedd ar ofal iechyd wedi cael effaith ganlyniadol ar agweddau eraill arno. Cyfeiriaf er enghraifft at y targed ar gyfer amseroedd aros am apwyntiad cyntaf i glaf allanol, lle na roddir triniaeth fel rheol, oherwydd gall y rhain arwain at fwy o oedi cyn yr ail apwyntiad, a

Would you agree with me that it is time to look at those targets to ensure that there are not too many of them, and that those unintended consequences are addressed?

The First Minister: We consider and understand the law of unintended consequences whenever a target is set. I think that that is well established in all areas of activity in both the public and private sectors. However, I would rebut your suggestion that bringing down out-patient waits has somehow led to an increased delay in the in-patient wait for treatment after seeing the consultant. There was a fear that this would happen, namely that, in bringing down the out-patient waits, you would get to see an awful lot more out-patients and therefore create a wall of demand for in-patient services that would be difficult to cope with. However, we managed to bring down out-patient waits without increasing the waits for in-patient or day-case treatment, and we are pleased about that.

Jonathan Morgan: The national health service has a lot of targets, some relating to accountancy matters and finance, others to the speed at which you can get certain surgical procedures, and yet others to the speed at which you can get a diagnosis confirmed. The Minister for Health and Social Services has already spoken about the number of targets in the national health service, so do you think that the NHS, and you as a Government, ought to spend some time reviewing the effectiveness of those targets to see whether we can get rid of some of them?

The First Minister: All targets are under permanent review, but one that I do not think will be reviewed is the target on reducing the length of the total patient journey, from original GP referral to actual treatment, if needed. We are seeking to bring this down to 26 weeks by the end of 2009. That is an important target, but my understanding is that you would scrap it if you had any influence in these matters. However, it is a target that is accepted by the public in Wales as being

allai arwain at driniaeth. A fyddech yn cytuno â mi ei bod yn bryd inni edrych ar y targedau hynny er mwyn sicrhau nad oes gormod ohonynt, a bod sylw'n cael ei roi i'r canlyniadau anfwriadol hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn ystyried ac yn deall bod canlyniadau anfwriadol yn siŵr o ddigwydd pa bryd bynnag y gosodir targed. Credaf fod hynny'n ffaith gydnabyddedig mewn gweithgareddau o bob math yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat fel ei gilydd. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ymwrthod â'ch awgrym bod lleihau amseroedd aros cleifion allanol wedi arwain rywsut neu'i gilydd at fwy o oedi cyn rhoi triniaeth i gleifion mewnol ar ôl gweld yr ymgynghorydd. Ofnid y byddai hyn yn digwydd, hynny yw, y byddech wrth leihau amseroedd aros cleifion allanol, yn gweld llawer iawn mwy o gleifion allanol ac, o ganlyniad, yn creu galw mawr, y byddai'n anodd dygymod ag ef, am wasanaethau i gleifion mewnol. Fodd bynnag, llwyddasom i leihau amseroedd aros cleifion allanol heb gynyddu'r amseroedd aros am driniaeth i gleifion mewnol neu achosion dydd, ac yr ydym yn falch o hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol lawer o dargedau, rhai'n ymwneud â materion cyfrifyddiaeth a chyllid, eraill yn ymwneud â pha mor gyflym y gallwch gael gweithdrefnau llawfeddygol penodol, ac eraill eto'n ymwneud â pha mor gyflym y gellir cadarnhau diagnosis. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol eisoes wedi siarad am yr holl dargedau sydd yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, felly a ydych yn meddwl y dylai'r GIG, a chithau fel Llywodraeth, dreulio rhywfaint o amser yn adolygu effeithiolrwydd y targedau hynny er mwyn gweld a allwn gael gwared ar rai ohonynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Adolygir pob targed yn barhaus, ond un nad wyf yn tybio y bydd yn cael ei adolygu yw'r targed ar gyfer lleihau hyd taith gyfan y claf, o atgyfeiriad gwreiddiol y meddyg teulu hyd at y driniaeth ei hun, os oes angen triniaeth. Yr ydym yn awyddus i leihau'r cyfnod hwn i 26 wythnos erbyn diwedd 2009. Mae hwn yn darged pwysig, ond yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, byddech yn cael gwared arno pe bai gennyhch unrhyw ddylanwad ar y materion hyn. Fodd bynnag,

important, and I believe by the health service. We are determined to drive through the necessary efficiencies to reach that particular target, including, for the first time, all waits for diagnostics and all waits for therapy that might occur between out-patient and final in-patient treatment.

mae'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru, a'r gwasanaeth iechyd mae'n debyg, yn derbyn ei fod yn darged pwysig. Yr ydym yn benderfynol o hyrwyddo'r arbedion sydd eu hangen er mwyn cyrraedd y targed arbennig hwn, gan gynnwys, am y tro cyntaf, bob amser aros am ddiagnosis a phob amser aros am therapi a allai godi rhwng gweld y claf allanol a thriniaeth derfynol y claf mewnol.

Improving School Buildings

Q11 Chris Franks: What plans does the Welsh Assembly Government have to make additional investment available for improving school buildings? OAQ(3)0124(FM)

The First Minister: The level of funding that currently applies is £157 million a year. However, we usually exceed that for various reasons to do with local authorities' receipts, and so on. Certainly, the budget stands at £157 million at the moment, and we would expect that to continue, at least until the end of the decade.

Chris Franks: You have promised that, by 2010, all schools will be fit for purpose. As part of that promise, will you agree to look favourably on any submission made by the Vale of Glamorgan Council for additional resources to assist the rebuilding strategy at Cowbridge, St Cyres and Llantwit Major, over and above the £9 million special grant? Will you further agree to look at the way in which councils handle reorganisation? You will be aware of the recent leaked report concerning Radyr and Cantonian schools, so what comfort can you offer the pupils who will be affected by such plans? Furthermore, can you comment on today's announcement by Cardiff council on the closure of some schools in Cardiff?

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: That is a very long question to answer. On the Vale of Glamorgan schools, we will look at any submission made about Cowbridge, St Cyres and other secondary schools that are in urgent

Gwella Adeiladau Ysgolion

C11 Chris Franks: Pa gynlluniau sydd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ryddhau mwy o fuddsoddiad er mwyn gwella adeiladau ysgolion? OAQ(3)0124(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r gyllideb ar hyn o bryd yn £157 miliwn y flwyddyn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym fel rheol yn rhoi mwy na hynny am resymau amrywiol yn ymwneud â'r arian a dderbynnir gan awdurdodau lleol, ac yn y blaen. Yn sicr, mae'r gyllideb yn £157 miliwn ar hyn o bryd, a byddem yn disgwyl i hynny barhau, o leiaf hyd ddiwedd y degawd.

Chris Franks: Yr ydych wedi addo y bydd pob ysgol, erbyn 2010, yn addas i'w diben. Fel rhan o'r addewid hwn, a wnewch gytuno i roi ystyriaeth ffafriol i unrhyw gais a gyflwynir gan Gyngor Bro Morgannwg am fwy o adnoddau i gynorthwyo'r strategaeth ailadeiladu yn y Bont-faen, St Cyres a Llanilltud Fawr, yn ychwanegol at y grant arbennig o £9 miliwn? A wnewch hefyd gytuno i edrych ar y ffordd y mae cynghorau'n ymdrin ag ad-drefnu? Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r adroddiad ynglŷn ag ysgolion Radur a Threganna y datgelwyd ei gynnwys yn ddiweddar, felly pa gysur y gallwch ei gynnig i'r disgyblion y bydd cynlluniau o'r fath yn effeithio arnynt? Yn ychwanegol at hynny, a allwch gyflwyno sylwadau ar y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd heddiw gan gyngor Caerdydd ynglŷn â chau rhai ysgolion yng Nghaerdydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn hir iawn i'w ateb. O ran ysgolion Bro Morgannwg, byddwn yn edrych ar unrhyw gais a gyflwynir ynglŷn â'r Bont-faen, St Cyres ac ysgolion uwchradd eraill y mae

need of rebuilding. We all accept that they were built in the 1960s or later and have therefore reached the end of their natural lives.

On Radyr and Cantonian schools, as a constituency AM, I am involved in a considerable number of the meetings, and so I do not wish to say any more. It would be a difficult question for me to deal with as a constituency AM.

On your third question, I am not yet aware of any statement made today by Cardiff County Council on these matters.

Three-Year Budgets

Q12 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on introducing three-year budgets for schools? OAQ(3)0134(FM)

The First Minister: That is a very important question. We are introducing three-year local government settlements next April, and we will consult on regulations under the Education Act 2005 to require local authorities to set indicative three-year budgets for schools from the same date, namely next April.

Peter Black: Thank you for that answer. The consultation and implementation of that is very welcome and long-awaited. As part of the consultation, will you be taking account of headmasters' views on the need for a stable budget for their schools? How will you ensure that parents and governors also have a say in the implementation of these particular regulations?

The First Minister: These consultations are currently taking place mostly with local government, because the transfer of the advantages of three-year funding from us to the local government side and then from the local government to the schools' side is important. We need to get that right. Your point on parents and headteachers is well made. Headteachers will be closely involved in this. I am not quite sure how we will involve them, but I am sure that either Carwyn Jones or I will write to you on that

gwir angen eu hailadeiladu. Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn eu bod wedi cael eu hadeiladu yn yr 1960au neu'n hwyrach a'u bod felly wedi cyrraedd diwedd eu hoes naturiol.

O ran ysgolion Radur a Threganna, fel AC dros etholaeth, yr wyf yn ymwneud â nifer fawr o'r cyfarfodydd, ac felly nid wyf am ddweud mwy. Byddai'n gwestiwn anodd i mi ymdrin ag ef fel AC dros etholaeth.

O ran eich trydydd cwestiwn, nid wyf yn ymwybodol eto o ddatganiad a wnaethpwyd heddiw gan Gyngor Dinas Caerdydd ynglŷn â'r materion hyn.

Cyllidebau Tair Blynedd

C12 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyflwyno cyllidebau tair blynedd ar gyfer ysgolion? OAQ(3)0134(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn pwysig iawn. Byddwn yn cyflwyno setliadau llywodraeth leol tair blynedd fis Ebrill nesaf, a byddwn yn ymgynghori ar reoliadau dan Ddeddf Addysg 2005 er mwyn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol bennu cyllidebau tair blynedd dangosol ar gyfer ysgolion o'r un dyddiad, sef Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf.

Peter Black: Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw. Mae'r ymgynghoriad a gweithredu'r rheoliadau i'w groesawu'n fawr ar ôl yr holl aros. Fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad, a fyddwch yn ystyried barn penaethiaid ynglŷn â'r angen am gyllideb sefydlog i'w hysegiolion? Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau bod rhieni a llywodraethwyr hefyd yn cael lleisio'u barn wrth weithredu'r rheoliadau arbennig hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cynhelir yr ymgynghoriadau hyn gyda llywodraeth leol yn bennaf ar hyn o bryd, gan fod trosglwyddo manteision cyllid tair blynedd oddi wrthym ni i ochr llywodraeth leol ac yna o lywodraeth leol i ochr yr ysgolion yn bwysig. Mae angen inni wneud hynny'n iawn. Mae eich pwynt ynglŷn â rhieni a phenaethiaid yn un da. Bydd penaethiaid yn ymwneud llawer iawn â hyn. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr sut y byddwn yn eu cynnwys, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y byddaf fi neu Carwyn Jones yn ysgrifennu atoch

precise point.

ynghylch yr union bwynt hwnnw.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Minister for Budget and Business Management (Jane Hutt): There is a change to today's Government business. The statement on climate change has been postponed. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which is available to Members on the agenda.

Janet Ryder: I wish to raise the issue of the Remploy factory in Wrexham and ask that the Minister for the Economy and Transport make a statement on it. I am sure that you are aware that Wrexham factory is very successful. It has a full order book and is in profit. However, employees who are currently working a shift system have recently been told that the company is moving to a system whereby they will just work days, which means that those currently working shifts will lose around 22.5 per cent of their salaries, and they cannot afford that.

You will also be aware that those same employees are currently working within the 90-day consultation period, and any changes to terms and conditions during that time would be totally illegal. Workers have been told that, unless they agree immediately to those new changes, the factory will definitely close. That is a totally unacceptable proposition to put to workers under such circumstances, particularly to vulnerable workers such as these. Will the Minister for the Economy and Transport please make a statement urgently in the Chamber, explaining how he will deal with this company, which is breaking the rules on consultation and threatening these workers with an illegal change to their terms and conditions, and how he will support the Remploy workers in Wrexham?

Jane Hutt: As I said last week, it is difficult to know when it is appropriate for the Minister to bring forward a statement in the Chamber, but I appreciate your concerns about the Wrexham factory. I am concerned

Y Gweinidog dros y Gyllideb a Rheoli Busnes (Jane Hutt): Mae newid ym musnes y Llywodraeth heddiw. Mae'r datganiad ar newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi'i ohirio. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

Janet Ryder: Hoffwn godi mater ffatri Remploy yn Wrecsam a gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth wneud datganiad arno. Mae'n siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod ffatri Wrecsam yn llwyddiannus iawn. Mae'r llyfr archebion yn llawn ac mae'n gwneud elw. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiweddar hysbyswyd gweithwyr sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gweithio system sifftiau y bydd y cwmni'n newid i ddefnyddio system lle y byddant yn gweithio diwrnodau yn unig, sy'n golygu y bydd y rhai sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gweithio sifftiau yn colli tua 22.5 y cant o'u cyflogau, ac ni allant fforddio hynny.

Byddwch yn ymwybodol hefyd fod yr un gweithwyr ar hyn o bryd yn gweithio o fewn y cyfnod ymgynghori o 90 diwrnod, ac y byddai unrhyw newidiadau mewn telerau ac amodau yn ystod y cyfnod hwn yn gwbl anghyfreithlon. Dywedwyd wrth y gweithwyr y bydd y ffatri'n cau yn bendant oni bai eu bod yn cydsynio ar unwaith â'r newidiadau hynny. Mae hwnnw'n gynnig cwbl annerbyniol i'w roi i weithwyr dan amgylchiadau o'r fath, yn enwedig i weithwyr fel y rhain sy'n agored i niwed. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ddatganiad ar fyrder yn y Siambr, yn esbonio sut y bydd yn ymdrin â'r cwmni hwn, sy'n torri'r rheolau ynglŷn ag ymgynghori ac yn bygwth y gweithwyr hyn â newid anghyfreithlon yn eu telerau a'u hamodau, a sut y bydd yn cefnogi gweithwyr Remploy yn Wrecsam?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'n anodd gwybod pa bryd y mae'n briodol i'r Gweinidog gyflwyno datganiad yn y Siambr, ond deallaf pam yr ydych yn poeni ynglŷn â ffatri Wrecsam. Yr

because the announcement on the proposal to restructure their operations was made on 22 May. On the 60-day consultation rule, we have not yet reached the point at which that type of situation would be reported by the workforce, but I know that the union is involved in this. I will certainly get an update for you on the information that you have given me today.

Ann Jones: Jane, could the Government find time to consider the findings of the recent inquest on the A547 cycling incident, when a jury passed a narrative judgment? There are clear lessons to be learned from this awful tragedy, which was the worst bike accident on record in the UK, including the need for agencies and local councils to work closer together. When can we expect the Government to issue a statement on what it is doing to ensure that those lessons are learned from this tragedy?

Jane Hutt: That tragedy in your constituency affected many families and others. Lessons have to be learned on what could have been done to avert the tragedy. I will certainly take that back to the Minister to see what would be appropriate for us to bring forward.

Alun Cairns: Minister, the non-party-political nature of the civil service is exceptionally important. There are often concerns among the public about the politicisation of civil servants, particularly given the actions of some special advisers, which is alarming to many people. Therefore, will you bring forward a statement to the Assembly showing exactly how you are ensuring that there is no politicisation of the civil service in Wales?

Jane Hutt: I wondered where your question was leading when you opened, Alun, and I am still not sure in what direction you are going. I am certain that the memoirs of Bernard Ingham are very instructive in this respect, but I see no need to bring such a statement back to the Chamber on that point.

wyf yn bryderus gan fod y cyhoeddiad ynghylch y cynnig i ad-drefnu'r gwaith wedi'i wneud ar 22 Mai. O ran y rheol ymgynghori 60 diwrnod, nid ydym eto wedi cyrraedd y pwynt lle y byddai'r gweithlu'n rhoi gwybod am sefyllfa fel hon, ond gwn fod yr undeb yn ymwneud â hyn. Byddaf yn sicr yn gadael ichi wybod beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf ynglŷn â'r wybodaeth yr ydych chi wedi'i rhoi i mi heddiw.

Ann Jones: Jane, a fyddai modd i'r Llywodraeth ganfod amser i ystyried canfyddiadau'r cwêst diweddar i ddamwain beiciau'r A547, pan gytunodd y rheithgor i gofnodi rheithfarn naratif? Mae gwersi amlwg i'w dysgu yn sgîl y trychineb dychrynlyd hwn, y ddamwain feiciau waethaf a gofnodwyd yn y DU, gan gynnwys yr angen i asiantaethau a chynghorau lleol gydweithio'n agosach. Pa bryd y gallwn ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth gyhoeddi datganiad ar yr hyn y mae'n ei wneud er mwyn sicrhau bod y gwersi hynny'n cael eu dysgu yn sgîl y trychineb hwn?

Jane Hutt: Effeithiodd y trychineb hwn yn eich etholaeth ar lawer o deuluoedd a phobl eraill. Rhaid dysgu gwersi ynglŷn â sut y gallem fod wedi osgoi'r trychineb. Byddaf yn sicr yn trafod hyn gyda'r Gweinidog er mwyn gweld beth y byddai'n briodol inni ei gyflwyno.

Alun Cairns: Weinidog, mae natur anwleidyddol y gwasanaeth sifil yn eithriadol o bwysig. Mae pryder yn aml ymhlith y cyhoedd ynglŷn â gwleidyddoli gweision sifil, yn enwedig o ystyried gweithredoedd rhai cynghorwyr arbennig, sy'n dychryn llawer o bobl. Felly, a wnewch gyflwyno datganiad i'r Cynulliad yn dangos sut yn union yr ydych yn sicrhau nad yw'r gwasanaeth sifil yn cael ei wleidyddoli yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: Yr oeddwn yn dyfalu i ba gyfeiriad yr oedd eich cwestiwn yn mynd pan ddechreuasoch, Alun, ac yr wyf yn dal yn ansicr i ba gyfeiriad yr ydych yn mynd. Yr wyf yn sicr bod atgofion Bernard Ingham yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn y cyswllt hwn, ond ni welaf fod angen dod â datganiad o'r fath yn ôl i'r Siambr ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Peter Black: Minister, you may be aware of reports in *Scotland on Sunday* and elsewhere, which say that Gordon Brown is reviewing the amount of money paid to the English regions to provide services. The reports state that he will look at the Barnett formula as part of that review. Given that we have agreed in the Chamber to set up a commission of our own to review the Barnett formula and the amount of money that Wales receives under that, will you now bring forward as a matter of urgency the proposal to set up that commission to ensure that, if Gordon Brown does carry out this review, we are ahead of the game and can put forward our evidence at the earliest possible moment?

Jane Hutt: I am glad that we agreed around a fortnight ago to set up an independent commission and, as part of that, that we would look at the funding and financing of the Assembly through the Barnett formula. I am not inclined to respond to articles in *The Scotsman*. I believe that the Prime Minister will make a statement on these issues, and I do not believe that it will reflect what has been said in the media.

Lorraine Barrett: Minister, I want the relevant Minister to bring forward a statement on the situation facing people such as my constituent, Wayne Coray, who has worked for Kwik Save for nearly 20 years. That company has treated its workforce in a shabby way, given the uncertainty over its future, and Mr Coray has been made redundant but has received no money for the past two weeks. The situation was made worse by the fact that Kwik Save told Jobcentre Plus that its employees had received 12 weeks' salary in lieu of notice as part of their redundancy package, and so he has been told that he is not entitled to claim jobseekers' allowance.

Jane Hutt: We are concerned about the plight of the workforce of Kwik Save, and this will affect many constituency AMs. Indeed, it shows the importance of the role of the Union of Shop, Distributive and Allied Workers trade union in representing Kwik Save workers. There is an issue in that the

Peter Black: Weinidog, mae'n bosibl eich bod yn ymwybodol o adroddiadau yn *Scotland on Sunday* ac mewn mannau eraill, sy'n dweud bod Gordon Brown yn adolygu faint o arian a delir i ranbarthau Lloegr er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau. Mae'r adroddiadau'n nodi y bydd yn edrych ar fformiwla Barnett fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwnnw. O gofio ein bod wedi cytuno yn y Siambr i sefydlu ein comisiwn ein hunain i adolygu fformiwla Barnett a'r arian y mae Cymru'n ei dderbyn dan y fformiwla, a wnewch yn awr gyflwyno'r cynnig i sefydlu'r comisiwn hwn fel mater o frys er mwyn sicrhau, os bydd Gordon Brown yn cynnal yr adolygiad hwn, ein bod ar y blaen ac y gallwn gyflwyno'n tystiolaeth cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cytuno tua phythefnos yn ôl i sefydlu comisiwn annibynnol ac, fel rhan o hynny, y byddem yn edrych ar ariannu a chyllido'r Cynulliad drwy fformiwla Barnett. Nid wyf yn awyddus i ymateb i erthyglau yn *The Scotsman*. Credaf y bydd Prif Weinidog Prydain yn gwneud datganiad ar y materion hyn, ac nid wyf yn credu y bydd yn adlewyrchu'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn y cyfryngau.

Lorraine Barrett: Weinidog, hoffwn i'r Gweinidog perthnasol gyflwyno datganiad ar y sefyllfa sy'n wynebu pobl fel Wayne Coray, yn fy etholaeth i, sydd wedi gweithio i Kwik Save ers bron 20 mlynedd. Mae'r cwmni hwn wedi trin ei weithlu'n wael, o ystyried yr ansicrwydd ynglŷn â'i ddyfodol, ac mae Mr Coray wedi cael ei ddiswyddo ond heb dderbyn dim arian yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf. I wneud y sefyllfa'n waeth, dywedodd Kwik Save wrth y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith fod ei weithwyr wedi derbyn cyflog 12 wythnos yn lle rhybudd fel rhan o'u pecyn diswyddo, ac felly dywedwyd wrth Mr Coray nad yw'n gymwys i hawlio lwfans ceisiwyr gwaith.

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn bryderus ynglŷn â sefyllfa gweithlu Kwik Save, a bydd hyn yn effeithio ar lawer o ACau dros etholaethau. Yn wir, mae'n dangos pa mor bwysig yw rôl Undeb Gweithwyr Siopau, Dosbarthu a Gwaith Perthynol sy'n cynrychioli gweithwyr Kwik Save. Mae problem gan fod yr Uchel

High Court in Manchester is due to reconsider this case next Thursday. We will then know whether the company will be refinanced and the jobs saved. That will have an impact, but for those who have had no payment we have to ensure that this matter is taken back and that we draw attention to it. I understand that Brian Gibbons and his officials are monitoring this carefully.

David Lloyd: I would like to raise two issues. First, I ask the Minister for Budget and Business Management to consider, with her colleague the Minister for Health and Social Services, a statement and the possibility of a review into the case of Mr Tim Buxton, a consultant paediatric neurosurgeon at Morrision Hospital. Mr Buxton was suspended for two and a half years before being dismissed two years ago. A High Court judge last week was hugely critical of the conduct of Swansea NHS Trust, which deliberately used the wrong disciplinary procedure—those are his words, not mine. Mr Buxton deserves reinstatement to his post and an inquiry into how his case was handled by Swansea NHS Trust and by Assembly officials. I would be grateful for consideration of that matter.

3.00 p.m.

I will move on to a further medical issue, also for consideration, and perhaps a statement, by the Minister for Health and Social Services. The Minister will recall our debate a few weeks ago on junior doctors' employment and the medical training application system fiasco. Junior doctors presently working in Wales who may not have a job to go to in August pending the second round of interviews in England will, potentially, find themselves unemployed for three months, with no income, through no fault of their own. Scotland and England seem to be funding extensions of posts pending clarification of those offers. It is only right that the same should be done in Wales, as this is a UK system. Money should be made available to fund the extension of posts in Wales so that junior doctors in Wales are not

Lys ym Manceinion i fod i ailystyried yr achos hwn ddydd Iau nesaf. Byddwn yn gwybod wedyn a fydd y cwmni'n cael ei ail-ariannu a'r swyddi'n cael eu hachub. Bydd hynny'n effeithio ar y sefyllfa, ond i'r rhai sydd heb gael tâl rhaid inni sicrhau bod y mater hwn yn cael ei ystyried a'n bod yn tynnu sylw ato. Deallaf fod Brian Gibbons a'i swyddogion yn monitro hyn yn ofalus.

David Lloyd: Hoffwn godi dau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros y Gyllideb a Rheoli Busnes, gyda'i chyd-Aelod, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ystyried datganiad a'r posibilrwydd o adolygiad o achos Mr Tim Buxton, llawfeddyg niwrolegol pediatrig ymgynghorol yn Ysbyty Treforys. Cafodd Mr Buxton ei wahardd o'i waith am ddwy flynedd a hanner ac yna'i ddiswyddo ddwy flynedd yn ôl. Yr oedd barnwr yn yr Uchel Lys yr wythnos diwethaf yn feirniadol iawn o ymddygiad Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe, a ddefnyddiodd y gweithdrefnau disgyblu anghywir yn fwriadol—ei eiriau ef yw'r rheini, nid fy ngeiriau i. Mae Mr Buxton yn haeddu cael ei adfer i'w swydd ac mae'n haeddu ymchwiliad i'r modd y gwnaeth Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe a swyddogion y Cynulliad ymdrin â'i achos. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gellid ystyried y mater hwnnw.

Symudaf ymlaen at fater meddygol arall y mae angen i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei ystyried ac, o bosibl, gwneud datganiad arno. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio ein dadl ychydig wythnosau'n ôl ar gyflogaeth meddygon iau a ffiasgo'r system ymgeisio am hyfforddiant meddygol. Bydd meddygon iau sydd yn gweithio yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd ac nad oes ganddynt swydd ar gyfer mis Awst tan yr ail rownd o gyfweiliadau yn Lloegr mewn sefyllfa, o bosibl, lle y byddant yn ddi-waith am dri mis, heb ddim incwm, a hynny heb fod dim bai arnynt hwy eu hunain. Ymddengys fod yr Alban a Lloegr yn darparu arian er mwyn estyn cyfnod swyddi hyd nes bydd y cynigion hynny'n dod yn eglur. Mae'n briodol gwneud yr un peth yng Nghymru, gan mai system ar gyfer y DU yw

disadvantaged by the MTAS fiasco. I would be glad of a statement by the Minister for Health and Social Services to that end.

Jane Hutt: You will know, in relation to the case that you raised, that the employment of staff in an NHS trust is a matter between the employer and the employee, and that we do not have a role to play in that relationship. However, I understand what you say with regard to this particular case and consultant, and the Minister for Health and Social Services is aware and engaged with the issue. On the second point regarding junior doctors and this transitional period, I am sure that the Minister for Health and Social Services is looking at the situation in Wales.

Nick Bourne: I have a couple of issues to raise. The first relates to Remploy, which has already been brought up by Janet with regard to a specific situation. It is a great concern, and I do not think that the Minister needs much more pushing to be convinced that we need to have a statement on it in this Chamber. I have great concerns about the proposals in Ystradgynlais and Brynman in my area, and I hope that the Minister will be convinced of the need to come forward with an oral statement to the Chamber, so that Members are able to contribute to a debate on this issue.

The second issue that I wanted to raise with the Minister relates to the Licensing Act 2003. Admittedly, the effect of the new Act has been patchy—it is perfectly fair and true to say that there have been places where it has not caused problems at all. However, it has caused problems in some areas, and it certainly has caused problems in Aberystwyth. Will the Minister look at ensuring that town and community councils have a statutory role in contributing to this issue? They do not have that role at the moment; it is a county council issue. It has caused concern in Aberystwyth, specifically

hon. Dylid darparu arian i estyn cyfnod swyddi yng Nghymru fel nad yw meddygon iau yng Nghymru dan anfantais yn sgîl ffasgo'r system ymgeisio am hyfforddiant meddygol. Byddwn yn falch o glywed datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Jane Hutt: Byddwch yn gwybod, o ran yr achos a grybwyllwyd gennych, mai mater rhwng y cyflogwr a'r sawl sydd yn cael ei gyflogi yw cyflogi staff mewn ymddiriedolaeth GIG, ac nad oes gennym ran i'w chwarae yn y berthynas honno. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn deall yr hyn a ddywedwch ynglŷn â'r achos a'r ymgynghorydd penodol hwn, ac mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ymwybodol o'r mater ac yn ymdrin ag ef. O ran yr ail bwynt ynghylch meddygon iau a'r cyfnod trosiannol hwn, yr wyf yn sicr bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn edrych ar y sefyllfa yng Nghymru.

Nick Bourne: Mae gennyf ddau fater i'w codi. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â Remploy, sydd eisoes wedi'i grybwyll gan Janet ynglŷn â sefyllfa benodol. Mae'n peri pryder mawr, ac ni chredaf bod angen llawer mwy o anogaeth ar y Gweinidog i'w darbwylllo bod angen inni gael datganiad yn ei gylch yn y Siambr hon. Mae gennyf bryderon mawr am y cynlluniau arfaethedig yn Ystradgynlais a Brynman yn fy ardal i, a gobeithiaf y caiff y Gweinidog ei darbwylllo ynghylch yr angen i gyflwyno datganiad llafar i'r Siambr, fel y gall yr Aelodau gyfrannu at drafodaeth ar y mater hwn.

Mae'r ail fater yr oedd arnaf eisiau ei godi gyda'r Gweinidog yn ymwneud â Deddf Trwyddedu 2003. Rhaid cyfaddef bod effaith y Ddeddf newydd wedi bod yn anghyson—mae'n berffaith deg a gwir dweud nad yw wedi peri problemau o gwbl mewn rhai mannau. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi peri problemau mewn rhai ardaloedd, ac mae'n sicr wedi peri problemau yn Aberystwyth. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fynd ati i sicrhau bod gan gynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned rôl statudol wrth gyfrannu at y mater hwn? Nid yw'r rôl honno ganddynt ar hyn o bryd; mater i gynghorau sir ydyw. Mae wedi peri

with regard to the situation on the pier. The town council has grave concerns, which have not been raised by the county council, but have been raised by the police. Will the Minister take this issue away and look at it, because it is causing concern in communities in Wales?

Jane Hutt: As I have said on several occasions, I do not want to resist the opportunity to have a statement on Remploy. However, it is a matter of the appropriate time to do that in relation to the consultation period, and, each week, we have had further information brought to us by Assembly Members. I will seek an update and I am sure that the Minister will be able to respond—either in an oral or a written statement—before the end of this term, hopefully. I will take that back as a key point from across this Chamber.

Secondly, on the Licensing Act 2003, it would be helpful if you would write to me in relation to the particular issue in Aberystwyth and on the role, duties and powers of town and community councils, and then we can look at the issue.

Mick Bates: I would like to raise two issues on the back of a disease that is becoming rampant in Wales, bovine tuberculosis. You will be aware that Sir John Bourne recently released the scientific evidence from the independent scientific group on bovine TB. Will you find time for the appropriate Minister to respond to this important report, upon which hinges so much of the future of our agricultural industry in Wales?

Secondly, further to the spread of TB, I note the increasing reports of TB in the human population recently, and the increased screening that is taking place. Again, will the appropriate Minister come forward with a statement on TB in the human population and government actions to control it?

Jane Hutt: I believe that the Minister has kept you updated on this issue, Mick. Furthermore, I am sure that, when we move into committee sessions, this will be a matter for scrutiny by the Sustainability Committee.

pryder yn Aberystwyth, yn benodol felly o ran y sefyllfa ar y pier. Mae gan y cyngor tref bryderon difrifol, na chawsant eu codi gan y cyngor sir ond sydd wedi cael eu codi gan yr heddlu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog fynd ar drywydd y mater hwn a'i ystyried, oherwydd y mae'n peri pryder mewn cymunedau yng Nghymru?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedais ar sawl achlysur, nid wyf am wrthod y cyfle i gael datganiad ar Remploy. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn yw pryd yw'r adeg briodol i wneud hynny mewn perthynas â'r cyfnod ymgynghori, a, bob wythnos, mae Aelodau o'r Cynulliad yn dod â rhagor o wybodaeth i ni. Gofynnaf am y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ymateb—naill ai mewn datganiad llafar neu un ysgrifenedig—cyn diwedd y tymor hwn, gobeithio. Byddaf yn ystyried hynny fel pwynt allweddol a godwyd ledled y Siambr hon.

Yn ail, o ran Deddf Trwyddedu 2003, byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe gallech ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â'r mater penodol yn Aberystwyth ac ynglŷn â rôl, dyletswyddau a phwerau cynghorau tref a chynghorau cymuned, ac yna gallwn ystyried y mater.

Mick Bates: Hoffwn godi dau fater sydd yn ymwneud â chlefyd sydd yn mynd yn rhemp yng Nghymru, sef twbercwlosis mewn gwartheg. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Syr John Bourne wedi rhyddhau tystiolaeth wyddonol y grŵp gwyddonol annibynnol ar TB mewn gwartheg yn ddiweddar. A wnewch ganfod amser i'r Gweinidog priodol ymateb i'r adroddiad pwysig hwn, y mae cymaint o ddyfodol ein diwydiant amaethyddol yng Nghymru yn dibynnu arno?

Yn ail, ac yn ychwanegol at ymlediad TB, yr wyf wedi sylwi ar yr adroddiadau cynyddol ynghylch TB mewn pobl yn ddiweddar, a bod mwy o sgrinio'n cael ei gynnal. Unwaith eto, a wnaiff y Gweinidog priodol gyflwyno datganiad ar TB mewn pobl a'r camau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i'w reoli?

Jane Hutt: Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi ar y mater hwn, Mick. Yn ogystal â hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y bydd hwn yn fater i'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd graffu arno pan symudwn i

However, it is important that we look at the Government's strategic framework for the sustainable control of bovine TB in Great Britain. That framework was published in March 2005, and aims to bring about sustainable improvement in controlling the disease over a 10-year period. In previous responses to questions, I have said that it is important that we look at the recent international science group report in relation to the causes. I will pass any issues relating to human health to the Minister for Health and Social Services; that is also a matter for the chief medical officer.

Brynle Williams: Following on from that—and I have raised this subject many times, as my colleague, Mick, has—I find it alarming that, recently, bovine TB has crossed to non-bovine species. There is a case of two alpacas in Llansantffraid-ym-Mechain, I believe, which is causing grave concern there. Those involved say that no cattle have been on that holding for some 12 years. Can we have a statement on this crossing to non-bovine animals, as well as to humans?

Jane Hutt: We note that additional information, and your concerns, which I am sure are shared in the farming community. I am sure that the Minister has also noted them.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I seek a statement, Minister, on the proliferation of ragwort in the countryside. Many people are probably not too familiar with this weed, but, year on year, every roundabout and every verge seems to have it all over the place. It is a particularly toxic weed; if an animal digests it, there is no cure—it is a long and agonising death. It is a listed weed, and local authorities should control its spread, but there does not seem to be any impetus behind that or control whatsoever. What hope do we have of continuing to try to control its spread—with private landlords now having it on their property—if local authorities do not undertake their obligations?

sesiynau pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig inni ystyried fframwaith strategol y Llywodraeth ar gyfer rheoli TB mewn gwartheg ym Mhrydain Fawr mewn modd cynaliadwy. Cyhoeddwyd y fframwaith hwnnw ym mis Mawrth 2005, a'i nod yw cyflwyno gwelliant cynaliadwy yn y modd y caiff y clefyd ei reoli dros gyfnod o 10 mlynedd. Mewn ymatebion blaenorol i gwestiynau, yr wyf wedi dweud ei bod yn bwysig inni ystyried adroddiad diweddar y grŵp gwyddonol rhyngwladol ynglŷn â'r achosion. Trosglwyddaf unrhyw faterion sydd yn ymwneud ag iechyd dynol i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol; mae hynny'n fater i'r prif swyddog meddygol hefyd.

Brynle Williams: Yn sgîl hynny—ac yr wyf wedi codi'r pwnc hwn lawer gwaith, fel y mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Mick, wedi gwneud—mae'n codi arswyd arnaf fod TB mewn gwartheg wedi croesi yn ddiweddar i rywogaethau heblaw gwartheg. Ceir achos dau alpaca yn Llansantffraid-ym-Mechain, fe gredaf, sydd yn peri pryder difrifol yno. Mae'r bobl sydd yn ymwneud â'r achos yn dweud na fu dim gwartheg ar y daliad hwnnw ers tua 12 mlynedd. A allwn gael datganiad ar TB yn croesi i anifeiliaid heblaw gwartheg, yn ogystal ag i bobl?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydym yn nodi'r wybodaeth ychwanegol honno, a'ch pryderon, ac yr wyf yn sicr eu bod yn bryderon gan y gymuned ffermio. Yr wyf yn sicr hefyd fod y Gweinidog wedi'u nodi.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Hoffwn gael datganiad, Weinidog, ar ymlediad llysiâu'r gingroen yng nghefn gwlad. Mae'n debyg nad oes llawer o bobl yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r chwyn hwn, ond, flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, mae fel petai'n gorchuddio pob cylchfan ac ymyl ffordd. Mae'n chwyn hynod o wenwynig; os yw anifail yn ei dreulio, nid oes gwellhad—mae'n farwolaeth hir ac arteithiol. Mae'n chwyn rhestredig, a dylai awdurdodau lleol reoli ei ymlediad, ond ymddengys nad oes dim ysgogiad o ran hynny na dim rheolaeth o gwbl. Pa obaith sydd gennym i barhau i geisio rheoli ei ymlediad—mae i'w ganfod ar eiddo landlordiaid preifat erbyn hyn—os nad yw awdurdodau lleol yn ymgymryd â'u

dyletswyddau?

Jane Hutt: Although you were not an Assembly Member at the time, you will know that the Assembly passed a code of practice on ragwort, which was done by the former Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside. I am sure that it is now being implemented, and I hope that you are monitoring it—you clearly are, Andrew.

William Graham: Minister, you will know that there are no questions to Ministers tomorrow. Why is that? You will know that the lack of scrutiny is a matter of concern to many. Would you comment on the rumour that our viewer is likely to switch off in protest?

Jane Hutt: I am sorry, William, there was rather a lot of noise when you asked your question; I would be grateful if you could repeat it.

The Presiding Officer: I apologise, Minister. Most of the noise has been coming from the right side of the Chamber this afternoon. [*Interruption.*] Order. I take a keen interest in these matters, and so I am prepared, in the interest of equality and fairness to all Members, to allow my esteemed colleague, Mr William Graham, to repeat his question, so that the Minister may hear it. However, I request silence from all sides of the Chamber.

William Graham: How kind of you, Llywydd. As I did not rehearse my question, forgive me if it is not identical to the previous one. On the business statement, Minister, you know that there are no questions to Ministers tomorrow. Why is that? That is a matter of concern to many—many people value that opportunity to ask questions. Could you also comment on the rumour that our viewer may switch off in protest?

Jane Hutt: Thank you, William; I apologise for not being able to hear your unrehearsed, but, I am sure, important question. All Government Ministers have been questioned rigorously over the last four or five weeks.

Jane Hutt: Er nad oeddech yn Aelod Cynulliad ar y pryd, byddwch yn gwybod bod y Cynulliad wedi pasio cod ymarfer ar lysiau'r gingroen, dan arweiniad y cyn Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad. Yr wyf yn sicr bod y cod yn cael ei weithredu bellach, a gobeithiaf eich bod yn ei fonitro—yr ydych chi'n amlwg yn gwneud hynny, Andrew.

William Graham: Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod nad oes cwestiynau i Weinidogion yfory. Pam hynny? Gwyddoch fod diffyg craffu yn fater sydd yn peri pryder i lawer o bobl. A wnewch ymateb i'r si bod ein gwyliwr yn debygol o ddiffodd y set deledu mewn protest?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, William, yr oedd cryn dipyn o sŵn wrth ichi ofyn eich cwestiwn; byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ei ailadrodd.

Y Llywydd: Ymddiheuriadau, Weinidog. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r sŵn wedi bod yn dod o ochr dde'r Siambr y prynhawn yma. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb mawr yn y materion hyn, ac felly, er mwyn rhoi cyfle cyfartal a thegwch i bob Aelod, yr wyf yn fodlon caniatáu i'm cyd-Aelod hybarch, Mr William Graham, ailadrodd ei gwestiwn fel y gall y Gweinidog ei glywed. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am dawelwch ar bob ochr i'r Siambr.

William Graham: Yr ydych yn garedig iawn, Lywydd. Gan na wneuthum ymarfer fy nghwestiwn, maddeuwch imi os nad ydyw yn union yr un fath â'r cwestiwn blaenorol. O ran y datganiad busnes, Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod nad oes cwestiynau i Weinidogion yfory. Pam hynny? Mae hynny'n fater sydd yn peri pryder i lawer o bobl—mae llawer o bobl yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyfle hwnnw i ofyn cwestiynau. A allech hefyd ymateb i'r si y gallai ein gwyliwr ddiffodd y set deledu mewn protest?

Jane Hutt: Diolch, William; ymddiheuraf nad oeddwn yn gallu clywed eich cwestiwn—un nad oeddech wedi'i ymarfer ond a oedd, yr wyf yn sicr, yn un pwysig. Mae holl Weinidogion y Llywodraeth wedi

We have all had our stint, and we then move into a new cycle. However, tomorrow, you can anticipate one, if not two, important statements from a Government Minister. I will be able to inform you shortly of the nature of those statements. Going back to the Standing Orders, as you know, we have given more time to non-Government business, in terms of the 60:40 split. The Government business that we have comprises questions, and statements, as and when they are appropriate. You will be pleased to see that there will be plenty of Government business tomorrow.

3.10 p.m.

Darren Millar: Minister, will you allow time for a statement on needle vending machines? There are proposals to use such a machine in Colwyn Bay in my constituency. It will be an unsupervised needle exchange facility, which means that there will be no opportunity for guidance or advice to be provided to drug users to sign-post them to appropriate treatment. You may be aware that the Welsh Assembly Government has funded this machine, and my constituents are extremely anxious about its being sited at the rear of the police station, adjacent to residential properties, and deem it to be wholly inappropriate, given that exchange facilities are already available in local pharmacies. Can you advise us whether you will be able to make time for a statement on this matter as soon as possible?

Jane Hutt: It is important that you write to the Minister for Social Justice and Public Service Delivery about this particular issue so that he can alleviate your concerns. It is important that we consider the whole harm-reduction strategy in relation to tackling substance misuse in Wales. I hope that we can move forward with a positive approach to this.

Mark Isherwood: Minister, I hope that you can find time for statements on two issues. The first is road safety, given the figures released by the Assembly Government before

cael eu cwestiynu yn drwyadl dros y pedair neu bum wythnos diwethaf. Yr ydym oll wedi cael ein tro, ac yna yr ydym yn symud ymlaen i gylch newydd. Fodd bynnag, yfory, gallwch ddisgwyl un os nad dau ddatganiad pwysig gan un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth. Byddaf yn gallu dweud wrthyhych beth fydd pwnc y datganiadau hynny yn y man. O fynd yn ôl at y Rheolau Sefydlog, fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi rhoi rhagor o amser i fusnes y pleidiau eraill, sef y rhaniad 60:40. Mae busnes y Llywodraeth sydd gennym yn cynnwys cwestiynau, a datganiadau, pan fydd hynny'n briodol. Byddwch yn falch o glywed y bydd digonedd o fusnes y Llywodraeth yfory.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, a wnewch ganiatáu amser ar gyfer datganiad ar beiriannau gwerthu nodwyddau? Mae cynigion i ddefnyddio peiriant o'r fath ym Mae Colwyn yn fy etholaeth. Bydd yn gyfleuster cyfenwid nodwyddau na fydd yn cael ei arolygu, ac mae hynny'n golygu na fydd cyfle i roi canllawiau na chyngor i ddefnyddwyr cyffuriau i'w cyfeirio at driniaeth addas. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ariannu'r peiriant hwn, ac mae fy etholwyr yn hynod o bryderus ynglŷn â'r ffaith y bydd yn cael ei leoli y tu ôl i swyddfa'r heddlu, ger tai preswyl, a chredant ei fod yn gwbl anaddas, gan fod cyfleusterau cyfnewid eisoes ar gael mewn fferyllfeydd lleol. A allwch roi gwybod inni a fyddwch yn gallu caniatáu amser i wneud datganiad ar y mater hwn cyn gynted â phosibl?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig ichi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus ynglŷn â'r mater penodol hwn fel y gall leddfu eich pryderon. Mae'n bwysig inni ystyried yr holl strategaeth lleihau niwed wrth fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau yng Nghymru. Gobeithiaf y gallwn symud ymlaen gydag agwedd gadarnhaol tuag at hyn.

Mark Isherwood: Weinidog, gobeithiaf y gallwch ganfod amser ar gyfer datganiadau ar ddau bwnc. Y mater cyntaf yw diogelwch ar y ffyrdd, o ystyried y ffigurau a ryddhawyd

the weekend, which show that the number of people killed and injured on the roads in north Wales increased last year, and given the figures released by the Department of Transport at the end of last week, which show a 20 per cent increase in the number of children killed on roads across England and Wales in 2005-06, I believe. The rolling average of road fatalities has been increasing since 2002; it had reduced between 1991 and 2002. Secondly, when can we have a statement on the recent reports on family and child poverty? A report by the University of London shows that 30 per cent of families in Wales live below the poverty line and that Wales now has a higher proportion of family poverty than anywhere else in the UK. The updated figures published by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation also show that no further progress has been made in tackling child poverty in Wales over the last two years. The UK-wide figures for 2005-06 show the first increase in poverty levels in nine years, and that unemployment and worklessness or inactivity figures are no longer falling.

Jane Hutt: There are links between the two issues that you mentioned. In terms of road safety and accidents that affect pedestrians, we know that the most disadvantaged children in Wales are often most adversely affected according to those statistics. This is a matter of social justice and is linked to child poverty. It is important that you drew attention to the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report on child poverty. You also drew attention to the report that was published earlier this week, 'Monitoring poverty and social exclusion in Wales 2007', which focuses on trends over time and differences across Wales, and recognises that, although we have a long way to go, we have made progress in tackling child poverty. We need to address the fact that we have a long way to go. The figure in the late 1990s for relative child poverty in Wales was 36 per cent; it is now 28 per cent. Our objective is to eradicate child poverty by 2020. The figure for pensioner poverty has fallen from 26 per cent to 20 per cent. We have to recognise what the

gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad cyn y penwythnos, sy'n dangos bod nifer y bobl a laddwyd ac a anafwyd ar y ffyrdd yng ngogledd Cymru wedi cynyddu y llynedd, ac o ystyried y ffigurau a ryddhawyd gan yr Adran Drafnidiaeth ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, sy'n dangos cynnydd o 20 y cant yn nifer y plant a laddwyd ar ffyrdd ledled Cymru a Lloegr yn 2005-06, fe gredaf. Mae cyfartaledd treigl marwolaethau ar y ffyrdd wedi bod yn cynyddu ers 2002; yr oedd wedi disgyn rhwng 1991 a 2002. Yn ail, pryd y bydd modd inni gael datganiad ar yr adroddiadau diweddar ar dlodi ymhlith teuluoedd a phlant? Mae adroddiad gan Brifysgol Llundain yn dangos bod 30 y cant o deuluoedd yng Nghymru yn byw o dan y llinell dlodi a bod gan Gymru bellach gyfran uwch o dlodi ymhlith teuluoedd nag unman arall yn y DU. Mae'r ffigurau wedi'u diweddarau a gyhoeddwyd gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yn dangos hefyd na wnaethpwyd dim cynnydd pellach o ran ymdrin â thlodi ymhlith plant yng Nghymru dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Mae ffigurau'r DU ar gyfer 2005-06 yn dangos y cynnydd cyntaf mewn lefelau tlodi ers naw mlynedd, ac nad yw ffigurau diweithdra a segurdd neu anweithgarwch yn disgyn mwyach.

Jane Hutt: Mae cysylltiadau rhwng y ddau fater yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt. O ran diogelwch ar y ffyrdd a damweiniau sy'n effeithio ar gerddwyr, gwyddom mai ar y plant mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru yr effeithir waethaf yn aml yn ôl yr ystadegau hynny. Mae hyn yn fater o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac mae cyswllt rhyngddo a thlodi ymhlith plant. Mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi tynnu sylw at adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree ar dlodi ymhlith plant. Tynasoch sylw hefyd at yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, 'Monitoring poverty and social exclusion in Wales 2007', sy'n canolbwyntio ar dueddiadau dros amser a gwahaniaethau ledled Cymru, ac sy'n cydnabod ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd o ran mynd i'r afael â thlodi ymhlith plant, er bod gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud eto. Mae angen i ni ymdrin â'r ffaith bod gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud eto. Y ffigur yn niwedd yr 1990au ar gyfer tlodi plant cymharol yng Nghymru oedd 36 y cant; 28 y cant ydyw bellach. Ein nod yw

Joseph Rowntree Foundation report says in that we have to make more progress in relation to our targets, which I believe we will when we introduce the legislative competence Order to protect vulnerable children, because it will place a duty on all public bodies to demonstrate their commitment to tackling child poverty. I hope that we get full support for that across the Chamber.

cael gwared ar dlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Mae'r ffigur ar gyfer tloidi ymhlith pensynwyr wedi disgyn o 26 y cant i 20 y cant. Mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod yr hyn a ddywed adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, sef bod yn rhaid inni wneud mwy o gynnydd o ran ein targedau, a chredaf y byddwn yn gwneud hynny pan fyddwn yn cyflwyno'r Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol i ddiogelu plant sydd yn agored i niwed, gan y bydd yn ei gwneud yn ddyletswydd ar bob corff cyhoeddus ddangos ei ymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â thloidi ymhlith plant. Gobeithiaf y cawn gefnogaeth lawn i hynny ledled y Siambr.

Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am Gyflwyno'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Gwneud Iawn am Gamweddau'r GIG (Cymru)
Legislative Statement on the Introduction of the Proposed NHS Redress (Wales) Measure

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Edwina Hart): This is an important Measure, because it will bring benefits to patients, and to the national health service as a whole. Knowing that you can make a complaint and have it taken seriously is important in any setting and particularly in public services. In the health service, people are often reluctant to raise concerns, either because they might cause problems for themselves, or because they feel that there is little point. Many people who complain feel that they do not get the outcome that they wanted, and current systems encourage defensive behaviour on the part of the health service. This not only makes patients suffer more, but it also reduces the opportunity for learning from mistakes. All this has to change. The way that the health service handles things that go wrong must be built around the needs of people and patients. People need to feel that they can complain and that they will be treated fairly.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Edwina Hart): Mae hwn yn Fesur pwysig, oherwydd daw â buddion i gleifion, ac i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn gyffredinol. Mae gwybod y cewch gwyno ac y caiff y gŵyn honno ei chymryd o ddifrif yn bwysig bob amser, ac yn enwedig mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, mae pobl yn aml yn gyndyn o fynegi pryderon, naill ai oherwydd y gallent achosi problemau iddynt eu hunain, neu am eu bod yn teimlo nad oes llawer o ddiben gwneud hynny. Mae llawer o bobl sy'n cwyno'n teimlo nad ydynt yn cael y canlyniad yr oedd arnynt ei eisiau, ac mae'r systemau presennol yn annog ymddygiad amddiffynnol ar ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae hyn yn lleihau'r cyfle i ddysgu yn sgîl camgymeriadau, yn ogystal ag achosi i gleifion ddiodef mwy. Rhaid i hyn i gyd newid. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i anghenion pobl a chleifion wrth lunio dull y gwasanaeth iechyd o ymdrin â phethau sy'n mynd o chwith. Mae angen i bobl deimlo y gallant gwyno ac y cânt eu trin yn deg.

To bring about change, Ministers need to be able to set out some basic rights and arrangements in legislation. That is why I am seeking regulation-making powers in this Measure, so that we can develop better arrangements for settling low-value clinical negligence claims without the need for legal

Er mwyn ysgogi'r newid hwn, mae angen i Weinidogion allu pennu rhai hawliau a threfniadau sylfaenol mewn deddfwriaeth. Dyna pam yr wyf yn ceisio cael pwerau gwneud rheoliadau yn y Mesur hwn, fel y gallwn ddatblygu trefniadau gwell ar gyfer setlo hawliadau esgeuluster clinigol gwerth

action. It is also why I have invited the health leads from the other parties to join me on a working group where we can take a closer look at many of these issues. The advisory group will be completely separate to the Assembly Measure committee. In its first stage, the Assembly Measure committee will look at the principles of the Measure, but it will also, in due course, consider the Measure line by line and may possibly suggest amendments to it. However, the advisory group has been established to give me a high-level political steer on the wider issues, and it might even consider what the resultant regulations should cover and even those issues for which we do not have the powers to legislate, but for which we might wish to seek framework powers in the future.

I have already had discussions with the party health leads and it is clear that there are many ideas and areas that need to be explored further. I have sent colleagues a list of key issues to consider, to which they are most welcome to add. The issues that we discuss will provide a helpful basis for developing new arrangements.

I have also discussed the issue of no-fault compensation. The current powers are restricted to cases where there is a qualifying liability in tort; they would, therefore, not allow us to set up such an arrangement. I will, however, be considering the issues further and having discussions about seeking further powers in this area. In the meantime, it makes sense to make progress now within the competence that the Measure affords us.

As well as that, my officials are already engaging with the national health service, patients and others, to look at what the problems are in the current systems and to look at better ways of doing things. The Measure will no doubt be subject to a careful level of scrutiny as it passes through the Assembly procedures, and rightly so. I am conscious that we are asking for quite wide powers in this area. At the outset, I will say that this is not about giving national health

isul heb fod angen cymryd camau cyfreithiol. Dyna hefyd y rheswm pam yr wyf wedi gwahodd arweinyddion iechyd y pleidiau eraill i ymuno â mi mewn gweithgor lle y gallwn fwrw golwg fanylach ar lawer o'r materion hyn. Bydd y grŵp cynghorol yn gwbl annibynnol ar bwyllog Mesur y Cynulliad. Yn ystod ei gam cyntaf, bydd pwyllgor Mesur y Cynulliad yn edrych ar egwyddorion y Mesur, ond bydd hefyd, yn ei dro, yn ystyried y Mesur fesul llinell a gall awgrymu diwygiadau iddo. Fodd bynnag, sefydlwyd y grŵp cynghorol i roi llyw gwleidyddol ar lefel uchel imi ar y materion ehangach, a gallai hyd yn oed ystyried yr hyn y dylai'r rheoliadau terfynol ymdrin ag ef a hyd yn oed y materion hynny nad oes gennym y pwerau i ddeddfu yn eu cylch, ond y gallem ddymuno ceisio cael pwerau fframwaith ar eu cyfer yn y dyfodol.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi cynnal trafodaethau gydag arweinyddion iechyd y pleidiau ac mae'n amlwg bod angen ymchwilio ymhellach i lawer o syniadau a meysydd. Yr wyf wedi anfon rhestr o faterion allweddol i'w hystyried at fy nghyd-Aelodau, ac mae pob croeso iddynt ychwanegu ati. Bydd y materion a drafodwn yn darparu sylfaen ddefnyddiol ar gyfer datblygu trefniadau newydd.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi trafod cwestiwn iawndal heb fai. Mae'r pwerau presennol wedi'u cyfyngu i achosion lle y mae atebolrwydd cymwys mewn camwedd; felly, ni fyddent yn caniatáu inni sefydlu trefniant o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ystyried y materion ymhellach ac yn cynnal trafodaethau ynglŷn â cheisio cael pwerau pellach yn y maes hwn. Yn y cyfamser, mae'n gwneud synnwyr bwrw ymlaen yn awr o fewn y cymhwysedd a roddir inni gan y Mesur.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae fy swyddogion eisoes yn cyfathrebu â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, cleifion ac eraill, i edrych ar y problemau sy'n bodoli yn y systemau presennol ac i ystyried gwell ffyrdd o wneud pethau. Nid oes amheuaeth na fydd craffu gofalus ar y Mesur wrth iddo fynd drwy weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad, ac mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol ein bod yn gofyn am bwerau eithaf eang yn y maes hwn. Ar y dechrau, dywedaf nad yw hyn yn

service organisations the ability to throw money at people in the hope that they will stop complaining or go away, nor is it about encouraging some sort of compensation culture, which I deplore. This Measure underpins part of what we want to achieve across the national health service in Wales, which is to give the health service the tools that it needs to put things right when they have gone wrong and to learn from its mistakes.

The Measure has the potential to cover cases of negligence relating to all NHS-funded services commissioned for, and provided to, Welsh patients. It also makes provision for a number of important principles, including the requirement that people using these arrangements should be entitled to receive legal advice and general support free of charge, to help them to decide whether to accept any offer made to them.

In conclusion, I hope that the Assembly feels able to share and support the Government's aims in bringing forward this legislation and the benefits that it will bring to patients and the national health service in Wales. I commend the Measure to the Chamber.

Helen Mary Jones: I begin by thanking the Minister, both for her statement and for the way in which she has engaged the health spokespersons of the other parties. Her manner has been open and constructive and I am grateful to her for that, as I am sure that colleagues are too.

It is clear that the current system of redress in the NHS is profoundly flawed. I am sure that all Members will have had experiences, through constituents, that demonstrate clearly that the current system is complex, costly and adversarial. It is often difficult for patients and their families to negotiate, and it can be very distressing for the staff involved. We all make mistakes in our working lives; we are fortunate, as politicians, that when we make mistakes we are, on the whole, making fools of ourselves, but our doctors, nurses and other clinicians make life-or-death decisions on a day-to-day basis. When an error has been made, it can then be difficult to be

ymwneud â galluogi sefydliadau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i daflu arian at bobl gan obeithio y byddant yn rhoi'r gorau i gwyno neu'n mynd i ffwrdd, nac annog rhyw fath o ddiwylliant iawndal, sy'n rhywbeth sy'n gas gennyf. Mae'r Mesur hwn yn sail i ran o'r hyn yr ydym yn dymuno'i gyflawni ar draws y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru, sef rhoi'r offer angenrheidiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd unioni pethau wedi iddynt fynd o chwith a dysgu o'i gamgymeriadau.

Mae'r potensial gan y Mesur hwn i ymdrin ag achosion esgeuluster sy'n ymwneud â phob gwasanaeth a ariennir gan y GIG a gomisiynir ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru ac a ddarperir iddynt. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys darpariaeth ar gyfer nifer o egwyddorion pwysig, gan gynnwys y gofyniad bod gan bobl sy'n defnyddio'r trefniadau hyn yr hawl i gael cyngor cyfreithiol a chefnogaeth gyffredinol yn ddi-dâl, er mwyn eu helpu i benderfynu a ydynt am dderbyn unrhyw beth a gynnigir iddynt.

I gloi, gobeithiaf fod y Cynulliad yn teimlo y gall rannu a chefnogi nodau'r Llywodraeth wrth gyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon a'r buddion a roddir ganddi i gleifion a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Cymeradwyaf y Mesur i'r Siambr.

Helen Mary Jones: Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ac am y ffordd y mae wedi ymgysylltu â llefarwyr y pleidiau eraill. Mae wedi bod yn agored ac yn adeiladol ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddi am hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau'n cytuno â hynny.

Mae'n amlwg bod system bresennol y GIG o ran gwneud iawn yn ddifrifol o ddiffygiol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pob Aelod wedi cael profiadau, drwy etholwyr, sy'n dangos yn amlwg fod y system bresennol yn gymhleth, yn gostus ac yn wrthwynebol. Mae'n anodd i gleifion a'u teuluoedd ymdrin â hi yn aml, a gall fod yn drallodus iawn i'r staff dan sylw. Yr ydym oll yn gwneud camgymeriadau wrth ein gwaith; yr ydym yn ffodus, fel gwleidyddion, mai dim ond gwneud ffyliaid ohonom ein hunain y byddwn, gan amlaf, wrth wneud camgymeriadau, ond mae ein meddygon, ein nyrsys a chlinigwyr eraill yn gwneud penderfyniadau sy'n peri i rywun

dragged into an adversarial process that can be painful and unnecessarily humiliating.

fyw neu farw bob dydd. Pan fydd camgymeriad wedi'i wneud, gall fod yn anodd ei lusgo i broses wrthwynebol a all fod yn boenus ac yn codi cywilydd yn ddiangen.

3.20 p.m.

I welcome the Measure that the Minister presents today as a first step towards dealing with some of these difficult issues. I also welcome the kinds of redress that are addressed in the Measure. I know from experience—and I am sure that many other Members will relate to this—that when constituents raise this issue, it is rarely about seeking financial compensation; it is much more often about seeking an explanation, an apology and, above all, some sense that what has happened to them, or to a relative or a loved one, will not happen to others. The current system makes it difficult for the national health service to provide that apology and reassurance and I hope that this Measure will be a first step towards dealing with these complex and difficult matters.

Croesawaf y Mesur a gyflwynir gan y Gweinidog heddiw fel cam cyntaf tuag at ddelio â rhai o'r materion anodd hyn. Croesawaf hefyd y mathau o wneud iawn y mae'r Mesur yn rhoi sylw iddynt. Gwn o brofiad—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd sawl Aelod arall yn gallu uniaethu â hyn—nad iawndal ariannol yw cymhelliad etholwyr wrth godi'r mater hwn fel arfer; yn amlach o lawer, mae'n ymwneud â cheisio cael esboniad, ymddiheuriad ac, yn anad dim, rhyw ymdeimlad na fydd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd iddynt, neu i un o'u perthnasau neu eu hanwyliaid, yn digwydd i eraill. Mae'r system bresennol yn ei gwneud yn anodd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol roi'r ymddiheuriad a'r tawelwch meddwl hwnnw, a gobeithiaf mai'r Mesur hwn fydd y cam cyntaf tuag at ddelio â'r materion dyrys ac anodd hyn.

In her statement, the Minister acknowledges that this is just a first step, and in the cross-party discussions that have already taken place, I sense the development of a consensus that we would wish to go further. I welcome the Minister's commitment to consider the issue of seeking additional powers. It is my personal belief that we should move towards a system of no-fault compensation, except in the most serious of cases where the negligence is demonstrably grave. We are a long way down the line from that, but that is where we need to go.

Yn ei datganiad, mae'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod mai dim ond cam cyntaf yw hwn, ac yn y trafodaethau trawsbleidiol sydd eisoes wedi'u cynnal, yr wyf yn teimlo bod consensws yn datblygu y byddem yn dymuno mynd ymhellach. Croesawaf ymrwymiad y Gweinidog i ystyried ceisio cael pwerau ychwanegol. Yn fy marn i, dylem symud tuag at system o iawndal heb fai, heblaw yn yr achosion mwyaf difrifol lle y mae'r esgeuluster yn amlwg yn ddifrifol. Yr ydym yn eithaf pell o gyflawni hynny, ond hynny yw'r nod.

I will now ask the Minister some specific questions about the Measure, which I am sure that we will have further opportunities to explore through the committee system and the working group that the Minister has established. The Assembly Government intends to specify a body to handle and consider cases under these arrangements and I would like to know whether the Minister has a current body or bodies in mind, bearing in mind that we have such a plethora of health bodies, and that one of the purposes of the legislation is to establish a consistent

Yn awr, gofynnaf rai cwestiynau penodol i'r Gweinidog am y Mesur, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cawn fwy o gyfleoedd i archwilio'r cwestiynau hyn drwy'r system pwyllgorau a'r gweithgor a sefydlwyd gan y Gweinidog. Bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw pennu corff i drin ac ystyried achosion dan y trefniadau hyn, a hoffwn wybod a oes gan y Gweinidog gorff neu gyrff sy'n bodoli eisoes dan sylw, o gofio bod cynifer o gyrff iechyd gennym, ac mai un o ddibenion y ddeddfwriaeth yw sefydlu dull cyson o ymdrin â gwneud iawn gan y GIG ledled

approach to NHS redress across Wales.

It is the Assembly Government's intention to apply the arrangements to secondary care settings from the outset and to extend the arrangements to primary care thereafter. I can see the logic in that, in that it is simpler to begin with the large hospitals and the care that takes place in those settings. However, I am concerned that, with the increasing move, which we all welcome, to the provision of care in community settings, including quite complex care and operations, we may be unnecessarily delaying the implementation of the Measure. In driving the Measure through, will the Minister keep that position under review and see whether it might be more appropriate to introduce the Measure into both settings at the same time, always supposing that that would not overly delay its implementation?

In moving forward the redress Measure, there will be financial implications to cases that have to be dealt with. What assessment has the Minister made, or what steps will she be taking to undertake an assessment, of the estimated changes in the number of cases that might be brought forward, given that this system will be simpler and easier to implement? What additional financial implications will there be, if there are additional cases?

I will conclude by thanking the Minister, once again, for her approach to this matter. I support her approach in not delaying the Measure while we seek additional powers, but I hope that we will be looking, in the longer term, to a more comprehensive and less adversarial system of redress in our NHS, and in all our public services.

Edwina Hart: I concur with your initial comments that the current system is complex, costly and adversarial and with your comments on the implications not just for patients, but for staff. I am concerned by the difficulties faced by staff when dealing with some of the complaints that are made, and how those complaints put them in an extremely vulnerable position. You are right that we sometimes have the luxury of making mistakes that mean that we only make fools

Cymru.

Bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw defnyddio'r trefniadau mewn gofal eilaidd o'r dechrau, ac ymestyn y trefniadau i ofal sylfaenol wedi hynny. Gallaf weld y rhesymeg ynglŷn â hynny, sef ei bod yn haws dechrau gyda'r ysbytai mawr a'r gofal a roddir yn y rheini. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus, gyda'r symud cynyddol, a groesewir gennym oll, tuag at ddarparu gofal yn y gymuned, gan gynnwys gofal a llawdriniaethau eithaf cymhleth, fod hyn efallai yn peri oedi diangen cyn gweithredu'r Mesur. Wrth gyflwyno'r Mesur, a fydd y Gweinidog yn parhau i adolygu'r sefyllfa honno ac ystyried a fyddai'n fwy priodol cyflwyno'r Mesur mewn gofal eilaidd a gofal sylfaenol ar yr un pryd, a bwrw na fyddai hynny'n golygu gormod o oedi o ran dechrau ei weithredu?

Wrth fwrw ymlaen â'r Mesur gwneud iawn, bydd rhai goblygiadau ariannol i achosion y mae'n rhaid delio â hwy. Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i gynnal o'r newidiadau a ragwelir yn nifer yr achosion y gellid eu cyflwyno, neu pa gamau a gymer i gynnal asesiad ohonynt, o gofio y bydd y system hon yn symlach ac yn haws ei gweithredu? Pa oblygiadau ariannol ychwanegol a fydd, os bydd achosion ychwanegol?

Gorffennaf drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog, unwaith eto, am ei hagwedd tuag at y mater hwn. Cefnogaf ei syniad o beidio â gohirio'r Mesur wrth inni geisio cael pwerau ychwanegol, ond gobeithiaf y byddwn yn chwilio, yn y tymor hwy, am system fwy cynhwysfawr a llai gwrthwynebol o wneud iawn yn ein GIG, ac yn ein holl wasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau cyntaf bod y system bresennol yn gymhleth, yn gostus ac yn wrthwynebol, ac â'ch sylwadau am y goblygiadau i'r staff, yn ogystal ag i'r cleifion. Yr wyf yn pryderu am yr anawsterau a wynebir gan staff wrth ymdrin â rhai o'r cwynion a wneir, a sut y mae'r cwynion hynny'n eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa lle y maent yn hynod o agored i niwed. Yr ydych yn iawn ein bod weithiau'n ffodus ein bod yn cael gwneud camgymeriadau sy'n golygu mai dim

of ourselves, but some mistakes in hospitals and medical services have far greater implications for patients.

I, like you, see this as a first step. I am in favour of looking at no-fault compensation, but we would have to take further powers to be able to introduce that. I am grateful that all the parties will be contributing to the working group and I see it as providing a way for us to deal with the first stage and then to look at future legislation and what further powers can be given to Wales in this respect.

I have quite an open mind on the issue of the specific body. It is a matter for discussion at our working group and as the Assembly takes procedures through. Like you, I am mindful of the fact that there are an enormous number of organisations in health that undertake a plethora of tasks and also cross boundaries. I am currently looking at all these organisations and it might be useful to look at them in the context of the body that I could use in the light of your comments.

On extending arrangements from secondary care to primary care, it is an issue of timing and the simple need to bring in the legislation. In the light of your comments about the move to community-based settings, I am more than happy to discuss that as we consider the Measure.

We also have to carefully consider the financial implications. We got an excellent settlement in the NHS of about £27 million, excluding legal fees, in 2005-06. Financial arrangements are paramount. I do not believe that it will necessarily encourage more people to go for financial settlements. I was taken with the point that you made. When constituents come to see me, sometimes all that they want is an apology. They just want somebody to say, 'I am sorry; this was not good enough and it should not have happened'. The trouble is that you are so pressured and so worried about litigation when you work in the NHS that you think, 'I cannot make that step and I cannot say it'. Therefore, it is important that we consider this Measure in those terms. However, I will

ond gwneud ffyliaid ohonom ein hunain yr ydym, ond bod i rai camgymeriadau mewn ysbytai a gwasanaethau meddygol oblygiadau llawer mwy difrifol i gleifion.

Fel chi, gwelaf hyn yn gam cyntaf. Yr wyf o blaid ystyried iawndal heb fai, ond byddai'n rhaid inni gymryd pwerau pellach er mwyn gallu cyflwyno hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar y bydd pob plaid yn cyfrannu at y gweithgor ac yr wyf yn barnu bod hyn yn golygu bod modd inni ymdrin â'r cam cyntaf ac yna edrych ar ddeddfwriaeth i'r dyfodol a pha bwerau ychwanegol y gellir eu rhoi i Gymru yn hyn o beth.

Mae gennyf feddwl eithaf agored ynghylch y corff penodol. Mae hwnnw'n fater i'w drafod yn ein gweithgor ac wrth i'r Cynulliad fwrw ymlaen â gweithdrefnau. Yr wyf finnau'n ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod nifer aruthrol o sefydliadau iechyd sy'n ymgymryd â nifer fawr o dasgau ac sydd hefyd yn croesi ffiniau. Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn edrych ar yr holl sefydliadau hyn, ac efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol edrych arnynt yng nghyd-destun y corff y gallwn ei ddefnyddio yng ngoleuni eich sylwadau.

O ran ymestyn trefniadau o ofal eilaidd i ofal sylfaenol, mae hynny'n fater o amseru a'r angen syml i gyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth. O glywed eich sylwadau am symud i leoliadau cymunedol, yr wyf yn fwy na pharod i drafod hynny wrth inni ystyried y Mesur.

Hefyd, rhaid inni ystyried y goblygiadau ariannol yn ofalus. Cawsom setliad ardderchog o tua £27 miliwn yn y GIG, heb gynnwys ffioedd cyfreithiol, yn 2005-06. Mae'r trefniadau ariannol yn hollbwysig. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd o reidrydd yn annog rhagor o bobl i geisio cael setliadau ariannol. Hoffais y pwynt a wnaethoch. Pan ddaw etholwyr i'm gweld, weithiau dim ond ymddiheuriad y bydd ei eisiau arnynt. Maent am i rywun ddweud, 'Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oedd hyn yn ddigon da ac ni ddylai fod wedi digwydd'. Y broblem yw bod gweithwyr y GIG dan gymaint o bwysau ac yn pryderu cymaint am ymgyfreitha, nes eu bod yn meddwl, 'Ni allaf gymryd y cam hwnnw ac ni allaf ddweud hynny'. Felly, mae'n bwysig inni ystyried y Mesur hwn o'r

certainly give detailed consideration to the financial implications; that may be something that we can discuss initially.

Jonathan Morgan: I also thank the Minister for the constructive meetings that we have had on this matter, along with the officials who have been open in providing as much information as possible at this stage, to show what the redress Measure will include.

I may risk being slightly unpopular with my own side and slightly more popular with the other side of the Chamber in saying this, but I agree with much of what the Minister has said in this regard. It is about achieving a balance between the rights of patients and the willingness to, in some cases, provide a level of compensation and to redress a mistake that might have been made, and ensuring that the NHS develops into the world-class service that we want to see.

I will start by saying what I think this Measure should not be about. First, it should not be about encouraging ambulance chasing. I am lucky in that I am married to a barrister, and I do not wish to offend any lawyers in the Chamber, but there are far too many lawyers in the world. I do not want to see us providing a framework that encourages the creation of a compensation culture that begins to match that of the United States of America. I could point to countless examples that show that the compensation culture is becoming completely absurd.

Secondly, this Measure should not be about persecuting health professionals. We are exceptionally fortunate in this country, and throughout the United Kingdom, to have a group of health professionals, whether that is in primary or secondary care or in the community, who are dedicated, highly trained and highly professional. Whatever system we come up with has to address the problem but should not persecute the people who work in the NHS. Sadly, an example of the NHS not dealing with people correctly is that raised by Dai Lloyd in relation to Tim Buxton from Swansea. Although that is a

safbwynt hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr, byddaf yn ystyried y goblygiadau ariannol yn fanwl; efallai fod hynny'n rhywbeth y gallwn ei drafod i ddechrau.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolchaf finnau i'r Gweinidog am y cyfarfodydd adeiladol yr ydym wedi'u cynnal ar y mater hwn, yn ogystal â'r swyddogion sydd wedi bod yn agored ac wedi rhoi cymaint o wybodaeth ag sy'n bosibl ar hyn o bryd, i ddangos beth fydd cynnwys y Mesur gwneud iawn.

Efallai fod perygl imi fod ychydig yn amhoblogaidd gyda'm hochr fy hun ac ychydig yn fwy poblogaidd gydag ochr arall y Siambr wrth ddweud hyn, ond cytunaf â llawer o'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog yn hyn o beth. Mae'n fater o sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng hawliau cleifion a'r parodrwydd, mewn rhai achosion, i ddarparu lefel o iawndal a gwneud iawn am gamgymeriad a all fod wedi digwydd, a sicrhau bod y GIG yn datblygu nes ei fod yn wasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf, rhywbeth yr ydym oll am ei weld.

Dechreuaf drwy ddweud beth na ddylai fod yn ddiben i'r Mesur hwn yn fy marn i. Yn gyntaf, ni ddylai fod yn fater o annog ymlid ambiwlansys. Yr wyf yn lwcus fy mod yn briod â bargyfreithiwr, ac ni ddimunaf dramgwyddo cyfreithwyr yn y Siambr, ond mae llawer gormod o gyfreithwyr yn y byd. Ni hoffwn ein gweld yn darparu fframwaith sy'n annog creu diwylliant iawndal sy'n agosáu at yr un a welir yn Unol Daleithiau America. Gallwn dynnu sylw at enghreifftiau di-rif sy'n dangos bod y diwylliant iawndal yn mynd yn gwbl hurt.

Yn ail, ni ddylai'r Mesur hwn fod yn fater o erlid gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol. Yr ydym yn eithriadol o ffodus yn y wlad hon, a ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, o gael grŵp o weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, mewn gofal sylfaenol neu eilaidd neu yn y gymuned, sy'n ymroddedig, wedi'u hyfforddi hyd at safon uchel ac yn broffesiynol dros ben. Rhaid i ba system bynnag a gyflwynwn fynd i'r afael â'r broblem, ond heb erlid y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y GIG. Yn anffodus, enghraifft o'r GIG yn methu ag ymdrin â phobl yn gywir yw'r un a nodwyd gan Dai Lloyd am Tim Buxton o Abertawe. Er mai achos gwahanol yw

different case, it demonstrates the way in which the NHS, as an employer, can get things dreadfully wrong on occasion. We have to send the right signal to professionals that it is not about persecuting them but merely about getting the balance right between the work that they do and ensuring that patients get the service that they deserve.

Thirdly, this should not be viewed by the public—I have already dealt with lawyers—as a way of merely making a quick buck. When you talk to constituents who have had a bad experience—and I have dealt with quite a few such cases in the last eight years—you find that many of them simply want to see the system improved. They want an NHS that provides a first-class service that is free at the point of delivery, within which they and their loved ones are cared for by professionals. At the end of the examination of their case, they want to see the health service getting better. Yes, an apology on occasion is nice, but they want to see the NHS improve. The message to the public is that we are not doing this so that people can make some cash—although, in some cases there will be a financial settlement—but to ensure that we get the NHS that we all want.

3.30 p.m.

On what this Measure should be about, it has to engage with professionals and the managers who run the NHS, whether they manage a dental clinic, a GP practice or a hospital. These people need to be involved in the development of this work, and, at this stage, the General Medical Council should be included. The GMC, as a professional body, is responsible for ensuring professional standards of conduct and maintaining professional ethics. In light of the fact that many cases go to the GMC when a patient decides to pursue a claim or a case against an individual professional, the GMC's wealth of expertise should be used. I suggest to the Minister that it should be involved at an earlier stage in examining the detail as to how the professionals could be involved.

hwnnw, mae'n dangos sut y gall y GIG, fel cyflogwr, wneud pethau'n gwbl anghywir o bryd i'w gilydd. Rhaid inni roi'r arwydd cywir i weithwyr proffesiynol nad yw'n ymwneud â'u herlid hwy ond sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng y gwaith y maent yn ei wneud a sicrhau bod cleifion yn cael y gwasanaeth y maent yn ei haeddu.

Yn drydydd, ni ddylai'r cyhoedd edrych ar hyn—yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am gyfreithwyr—fel ffordd hawdd o gael arian. Pan siaradwch ag etholwyr sydd wedi cael profiad gwael—ac yr wyf wedi ymdrin ag amryw byd o achosion o'r fath yn ystod yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf—gwelwch mai'r cwbl y mae ar lawer ohonynt ei eisiau yw gweld y system yn gwella. Mae amynt eisiau GIG sy'n darparu gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf sydd am ddim yn y man lle y mae'n cael ei ddarparu, lle y bydd gweithwyr proffesiynol yn gofalu amdanynt hwy a'u hanwyliaid. Wedi i'w hachos gael ei archwilio, maent yn dymuno gweld y gwasanaeth iechyd yn gwella. Byddai, byddai ymddiheuriad yn braf ar brydiau, ond maent yn dymuno gweld y GIG yn gwella. Y neges i'r cyhoedd yw nad ydym yn gwneud hyn er mwyn i rai pobl allu cael rhywfaint o arian—er y bydd setliad ariannol mewn rhai achosion—ond er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn cael y GIG yr ydym oll yn dymuno'i weld.

O ran yr hyn y dylai'r Mesur hwn ei wneud, rhaid iddo ymgysylltu â gweithwyr proffesiynol a'r rheolwyr sy'n rhedeg y GIG, sy'n cynnwys rheolwyr clinigau deintyddol, practisau meddygon teulu neu ysbytai. Mae angen i'r bobl hyn fod yn gysylltiedig â datblygu'r gwaith hwn, ac, ar hyn o bryd, dylid cynnwys y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol. Mae'r Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol, fel corff proffesiynol, yn gyfrifol am sicrhau safonau ymddygiad proffesiynol a chynnal moeseg broffesiynol. Yng ngoleuni'r ffaith bod llawer o achosion yn cael eu cyfeirio at y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol pan fydd claf yn penderfynu dwyn hawliad neu achos yn erbyn gweithiwr proffesiynol, dylid defnyddio profiad helaeth y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol. Awgrymaf wrth y Gweinidog y dylid ei gynnwys ynghynt i archwilio'r manylion ynghylch sut y gellid

cynnwys y gweithwyr proffesiynol.

As I mentioned earlier, this Measure should ensure that an apology in some cases, as well as a commitment to improving services, is seen as being as important as any potential financial gain. That must be central to the work that is being done in drawing up the detail of this Measure. I am pleased that it is alluded to in the detail that we ensure independent professional medical and legal advice. For many people dealing with these types of complaints, the jargon will be confusing, the processes could be seen as convoluted and the more independent expert medical and legal advice that is available to these people, the better, because we are dealing with people who do not engage with lawyers on a daily basis. They perhaps do not deal with the medical professions directly on a daily basis, and the same goes for contacting NHS trusts and GP practices. We need to ensure that they have independent advice because when it comes to offering a settlement and asking people whether they will accept the outcome of the process, they need to know that the decision that they take—saying either ‘yes’ or ‘no’—will be in their best interest. So, having that independent professional advice is important.

We have mentioned community health councils in the past. I am not against these councils’ involvement, but we need to look at their capacity to see whether or not they can handle the workload.

Where compensation is part of the outcome, I hope that a standardised framework will be used in Wales, such as a tariff system. Tariff systems within legal frameworks as set down by courts are not unusual, and it would be incomprehensible for one NHS trust to offer one level of compensation for one type of fault while another NHS trust could offer something quite different. We need to have a standardised framework so that where mistakes are made, and where it is possible to categorise those mistakes, we see a standardised level of compensation. Otherwise, it will become very confusing and people will potentially compare one NHS

Fel y soniais yn gynharach, dylai'r Mesur hwn sicrhau bod ymddiheuriad mewn rhai achosion, ynghyd ag ymrwymiad i wella gwasanaethau, yn cael ei ystyried cyn bwysiced ag unrhyw fudd ariannol posibl. Rhaid i hyn fod yn ganolog yn y gwaith a wneir i lunio manylion y Mesur hwn. Yr wyf yn falch bod sôn yn y manylion ein bod yn sicrhau cyngor cyfreithiol a meddygol proffesiynol annibynnol. I lawer o bobl sy'n delio â'r mathau hyn o gwynion, bydd y jargon yn peri dryswch, gallai'r prosesau gael eu hystyried yn astrus a gorau po fwyaf o gyngor cyfreithiol a meddygol arbenigol annibynnol sydd ar gael i'r bobl hyn, oherwydd ein bod yn delio â phobl na ddônt i gysylltiad â chyfreithwyr bob dydd. Efallai nad ydynt chwaith yn delio â gweithwyr proffesiynol meddygol yn uniongyrchol bob dydd, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am gysylltu ag ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a phractisau meddygon teulu. Mae angen inni sicrhau eu bod yn cael cyngor annibynnol oherwydd pan ddaw'n fater o gynnig setliad a gofyn i bobl a wnânt dderbyn canlyniad y broses, mae angen iddynt fod yn siŵr y bydd y penderfyniad a wnânt—wrth ddweud ‘ie’ neu ‘na’—er eu budd hwy. Felly, mae cael y cyngor proffesiynol annibynnol hwnnw'n bwysig.

Yr ydym wedi crybwyll cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn y gorffennol. Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu cynnwys y cynghorau hyn, ond mae angen inni edrych ar eu gallu er mwyn gweld a allant ymdopi â'r llwyth gwaith ai peidio.

Os bydd iawndal yn rhan o'r canlyniad, gobeithiaf y bydd fframwaith safonol yn cael ei ddefnyddio yng Nghymru, megis system dariff. Nid yw systemau tariff mewn fframweithiau cyfreithiol fel y'u pennir gan lysoedd yn anarferol, a byddai'n anodd deall sut y byddai un ymddiriedolaeth GIG yn cynnig un lefel o iawndal am un math o ddiffyg ac ymddiriedolaeth GIG arall, o bosibl, yn cynnig rhywbeth cwbl wahanol. Mae angen inni gael fframwaith safonol fel y gallwn weld lefel safonol o iawndal pan wneir camgymeriadau a phan fydd yn bosibl categoreiddio'r camgymeriadau hynny. Fel arall, bydd pethau'n mynd yn ddryslyd iawn

trust against another.

It is important that we examine how the complaints procedure will be structured and to whom cases will go. In mentioning the plethora of bodies and the prospect of one body dealing with this, I note that independence is important. For example, it would not be appropriate for the NHS trust that is the subject of a complaint to handle that complaint. If people are to see the procedure as being as open and transparent as possible, independence will be necessary to give them confidence in the system.

If an outcome is reached that is unsatisfactory, or if an outcome is not reached, is it envisaged that the patient will be able to take the case to the ombudsman? There are many examples of cases where NHS trusts in particular have not, in the eyes of the patient, reached a satisfactory outcome, and many patients take their cases to the ombudsman. Is it your suggestion that we will allow patients to follow that particular route if using the NHS redress Measure does not lead to a satisfactory conclusion? Hopefully, it will reach a satisfactory conclusion in most, if not all, cases, but there may be some examples where a patient will still be dissatisfied with the outcome.

Finally, I welcome the approach taken with this Measure, and I welcome the opportunity that will be given to Members to examine the Measure line by line. Finally, I look forward to the results of this work being implemented as quickly as possible.

Edwina Hart: Thank you, Jonathan. I agree that we want this work to be implemented as soon as possible. It is important to recognise that 60 Members, across the Chamber, will have different ideas, but your comments about engagement with the professionals are right. I am happy to take on board your point regarding the GMC and other organisations, and perhaps there are organisations that might wish to come to our informal committee to discuss this issue with us, and we could perhaps draft some things that might be of assistance to Assembly Members when they consider the procedures,

a bydd pobl o bosibl yn cymharu un ymddiriedolaeth GIG ag un arall.

Mae'n bwysig inni bwysio a mesur sut y caiff y weithdrefn gwyno ei strwythuro ac at bwy y caiff achosion eu cyfeirio. Wrth sôn am yr holl gyrff, a'r gobaith mai un corff fydd yn delio â hyn, pwysleisiaf fod annibyniaeth yn bwysig. Er enghraifft, ni fyddai'n briodol i'r ymddiriedolaeth GIG y gwneir y gwyn yn ei herbyn ddelio â'r gwyn honno. Os ydym am i bobl ystyried bod y drefn yn un mor agored a thryloyw ag sy'n bosibl, bydd annibyniaeth yn ofynnol i roi iddynt hyder yn y system.

Os deuir at ganlyniad sy'n anfoddhaol, neu os na ddeuir at ganlyniad o gwbl, a ragwelir y bydd y claf yn gallu mynd â'r achos at yr ombwdsmon? Ceir llawer o esiamplau o achosion lle nad yw ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn benodol wedi dod i ganlyniad boddhaol, ym marn y claf, ac mae llawer o gleifion yn mynd â'u hachosion at yr ombwdsmon. Ai awgrymu yr ydych ein bod yn caniatáu i gleifion ddilyn y trywydd penodol hwnnw os nad yw'r Mesur gwneud iawn am gamweddau'r GIG yn arwain at ganlyniad boddhaol? Gobeithio y deuir at ganlyniad boddhaol yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, os nad y cyfan, ond mae'n bosibl y ceir rhai esiamplau pan fydd claf yn anfodlon o hyd ar y canlyniad.

Yn olaf, croesawaf y dull o ymdrin â'r Mesur hwn, a chroesawaf y cyfle a roddir i'r Aelodau archwilio'r Mesur fesul llinell. Yn olaf, edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniadau'r gwaith hwn yn cael eu gweithredu cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

Edwina Hart: Diolch ichi, Jonathan. Cytunaf fod arnom eisiau gweithredu'r gwaith hwn cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y bydd gan 60 o Aelodau, ar draws y Siambr, syniadau gwahanol, ond mae eich sylwadau am ymgysylltu â'r gweithwyr proffesiynol yn gywir. Yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried eich pwynt ynghylch y Cyngor Meddygol Cyffredinol a sefydliadau eraill, ac efallai fod sefydliadau a allai ddymuno dod i'n pwyllgor anffurfiol i drafod y mater hwn gyda ni. Efallai y gallem ddrافتio rhai pethau a fyddai o gymorth i Aelodau'r Cynulliad, wrth iddynt ystyried y

particularly in committee.

I concur with your opening comments. This is not about ambulance chasing. It terrifies me to see what happens in other parts of the world and the type of compensation culture that we have. We certainly do not want that to develop any further in this country. I am quite horrified by some of the advertisements on television that suggest to people that they might be able to claim compensation for various things. We always have a right to compensation when something has happened to us, but this encouragement, and the manner in which it is done, is not something that I wish to see spreading in society.

Also, you are right about the persecution of health officials and health professionals. They get worried about this sometimes. If there is a more open and transparent process—one that does not attach blame—that looks at what happened and how it can be ensured that it does not happen again, the patient would feel that something has been delivered. That is important.

I noted your reference to Andrew Buxton. I have read the court's judgment, which does not make for pretty reading, and I can confirm that I will take up this matter with the trust in Swansea, as it is important that professionals are dealt with properly under their terms of employment in the trusts. Even though it is the Assembly Government's direct responsibility, I want the highest standards in the trusts regarding their dealings with staff.

Your points about the public are right, in that we have to accept as a society that there might be people who think that this is an easy way of doing something. However, we should also talk about these types of things in terms of rights and responsibilities. If we give people rights as regards how they deal with issues, they also have to take on responsibilities, so, it is a two-way process. Even though it is an extremely complex piece of legislation, once we have dealt with it, we may want to consider how we explain it to the public in terms of rights and responsibilities and show the public what it means in real terms.

gweithdrefnau, yn enwedig yn y pwyllgor.

Cytunaf â'ch sylwadau agoriadol. Nid mater o ymlid ambiwlansys yw hyn. Mae gweld yr hyn sy'n digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd a'r math o ddiwylliant iawndal sydd gennym yn fy nychryn. Yn bendant, nid ydym am i hyn ddatblygu ymhellach yn y wlad hon. Yr wyf yn dychryn wrth wyllo rhai o'r hysbysebion ar y teledu sy'n awgrymu wrth bobl y gallent hawlio iawndal am amrywiol bethau. Mae gennym bob amser hawl i gael iawndal os bydd rhywbeth wedi digwydd inni, ond nid yw'r anogaeth hon, a'r modd y'i gwneir, yn rhywbeth y dymunaf ei weld yn lledaenu drwy gymdeithas.

Yn ogystal, yr ydych yn iawn wrth sôn am erlid gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol a swyddogion iechyd. Mae hyn yn peri pryder iddynt weithiau. Os oes proses fwy agored a thryloyw—un nad yw'n rhoi bai ar neb—sy'n edrych ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd a sut y gellir sicrhau na fydd yn digwydd eto, byddai'r claf yn teimlo bod rhywbeth wedi cael ei gyflawni. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Sylwais ar eich cyfeiriad at Andrew Buxton. Yr wyf wedi darllen dyfarniad y llys; nid yw ei ddarllen yn brofiad pleserus, a gallaf gadarnhau y byddaf yn trafod y mater hwn gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth yn Abertawe, oherwydd ei bod yn bwysig delio'n briodol â gweithiwr proffesiynol dan eu telerau cyflogaeth yn yr ymddiriedolaethau. Er mai cyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ydyw, yr wyf am weld yr ymddiriedolaethau yn arddel y safonau uchaf o ran delio â'r staff.

Mae eich pwynt am y cyhoedd yn iawn, o ran bod yn rhaid inni dderbyn fel cymdeithas y gallai fod rhai pobl sy'n meddwl bod hyn yn ffordd hawdd o wneud rhywbeth. Fodd bynnag, dylem siarad hefyd am y mathau hyn o bethau o safbwynt hawliau a chyfrifoldebau. Os rhoddwn hawliau i bobl o ran sut y maent yn delio â materion, rhaid iddynt hefyd ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldebau a ddaw yn sgîl hynny, felly, mae'n broses ddwyffordd. Er ei bod yn ddeddfwriaeth eithriadol o gymhleth, wedi inni ddelio ag ef, efallai y bydd arnom eisiau ystyried sut i'w esbonio wrth y cyhoedd, o safbwynt hawliau a chyfrifoldebau, a dangos i'r cyhoedd beth y

mae'n ei olygu mewn termau real.

Some of the points that you made highlight an issue surrounding the CHCs. I am in discussion with the councils, and I would anticipate some form of advocacy role, but there must also be an independent system because, when an offer is made, there is the issue of who you go to. We are talking about people who have never dealt with anything like this before, and that is why they come to us and to MPs to ask us to write a letter to the trusts or to the primary carer; they ask us to do it because it is not a situation that they have dealt with before. You will know only too well that some of the letters that we receive from these organisations require two or three readings before you are sure of what point is being made to you, and we deal with these types of letters on a daily basis.

It is therefore important that people have access to that independence. If there is no outcome, then there are currently no real implications for the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales, as it does not directly affect him, but he has been working on our project board. I might, therefore, with the project board, discuss your points about where you go if you have not reached a satisfactory outcome. That is worth discussing so that people know how matters lie. I will speak to the ombudsman about that, and we can pick up that discussion in our informal committee.

On the Measure, it is important that we engage collectively. These are not party political issues; they are issues about the citizen's rights and responsibilities, and they are also about ensuring a fair balance between the national health service and its customers.

Jenny Randerson: I am grateful to you, Minister, for your inclusive approach on this matter, which first raised its head when your predecessor was in post, with the previous Health and Social Services Committee having given some thought and discussion to it at a preliminary level.

Mae rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaethoch yn tynnu sylw at fater sy'n ymwneud â'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Yr wyf wrthi'n trafod gyda'r cynghorau, a byddwn yn rhagweld rôl eiriol o ryw fath, ond rhaid cael system annibynnol hefyd oherwydd, pan wneir cynnig, rhaid i chi wybod at bwy y dylech fynd. Yr ydym yn sôn am bobl nad ydynt erioed wedi delio â dim byd fel hyn o'r blaen, a dyna paham y maent yn troi atom ni ac at ASau i ofyn inni ysgrifennu llythyr at yr ymddiriedolaethau neu at y gofalwr sylfaenol; gofynnant inni wneud hynny oherwydd nad yw'n sefyllfa y maent wedi delio â hi o'r blaen. Gwyddom yn iawn fod yn rhaid darllen rhai o'r llythyrau a gawn oddi wrth y sefydliadau hyn ddwywaith neu dair cyn eich bod yn sicr pa bwynt a wneir, ac yr ydym ni'n delio â'r mathau hyn o lythyrau bob dydd.

O'r herwydd, mae'n bwysig i'r annibyniaeth honno fod ar gael i bobl. Os nad oes canlyniad, yna ar hyn o bryd nid oes goblygiadau gwirioneddol i Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru, gan nad yw'n effeithio arno'n uniongyrchol, ond mae wedi bod yn gweithio ar ein bwrdd prosiect. Mae'n bosibl, felly, y byddaf yn trafod, gyda'r bwrdd prosiect, eich pwyntiau ynghylch lle i fynd os na chafwyd canlyniad boddhaol. Mae hyn yn werth ei drafod fel bod pobl yn gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa. Siaradaf â'r ombwdsmon am hyn, a gallwn barhau â'r drafodaeth honno yn ein pwyllgor anffurfiol.

O ran y Mesur, mae'n bwysig inni ymgysylltu ar y cyd. Nid materion gwleidyddol yw'r rhain; materion am hawliau a chyfrifoldebau dinasyddion ydynt, ac maent hefyd yn ymwneud â sicrhau cydbwysedd teg rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a'i gwsmeriaid.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf ddiolchgar ichi, Weinidog, am eich agwedd gynhwysol o safbwynt y mater hwn, mater a ddaeth i'r amlwg i ddechrau pan oedd eich rhagflaenydd yn y swydd, a mater y bu'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol blaenorol yn ystyried ac yn trafod rhywfaint arno ar lefel ragarweiniol.

The proposals will be an interesting test of how totally reasonable requests for powers are viewed in Westminster. In order to take a tidy approach to what is currently an extremely untidy subject, we will perhaps have to go beyond the obvious application of the powers, for example in dealing with ombudsmen's powers.

The current system is, undoubtedly, complex, cumbersome and inconsistent. Consequently, it is manifestly unfair and unjust. Above all, I would characterise it as something that encourages attitudes to become entrenched. Given that it is so complicated and largely formal, and because it takes so long, it is impossible for people to say 'sorry' in a timely manner. In my experience of dealing with constituents over a number of years, they often come to see me when they are already at their wits' end, seeking the justification that they need.

3.40 p.m.

I have people from the other side coming to see me as well—health professionals—who have been involved in long and complex cases that have caused them immense anguish and have threatened their careers. You can look at the situation and think to yourself: if only someone had dealt with this at the beginning; if only it had been possible to get what was needed at the beginning, which is not money, Minister. Almost always, people say to me, 'I do not want money, but I just want someone to say that they were wrong and that they made a mistake. All I want is an apology.' As a result, if we get this right, I believe that it will provide much more satisfaction for constituents, and it will certainly make a difficult process much easier to understand. We should be taking a kind of one-stop-shop approach to redress.

There are issues that we need to be careful about, and they have been raised by Jonathan in particular. We need to tread a fine line here because we need to improve access without creating a claim culture, and we need to

Bydd y cynigion yn brawf diddorol ar sut y caiff ceisiadau cwbl resymol am bwerau eu hystyried yn San Steffan. Er mwyn delio'n drefnus â phwnc sy'n anhrefnus dros ben ar hyn o bryd, mae'n bosibl y bydd yn rhaid inni fynd y tu hwnt i weithredu'r pwerau yn syml yn unig, er enghraifft wrth ddelio â phwerau ombwdsmyn.

Mae'r system bresennol, heb os, yn gymhleth, yn feichus ac yn anghyson. O'r herwydd, mae'n amlwg yn annheg ac yn anghyfiawn. Yn anad dim, byddwn yn ei disgrifio fel rhywbeth sy'n annog agweddau sydd wedi hen galedu. O gofio ei bod mor gymhleth ac mor ffurfiol i raddau helaeth, ac oherwydd ei bod yn cymryd cyhyd, mae'n amhosibl i bobl ddweud 'mae'n ddrwg gennym' mewn modd amserol. Yn fy mhrofiad i o ddelio ag etholwyr dros flynyddoedd lawer, dônt i'm gweld yn aml pan na fyddant yn gwybod ble i droi, gan chwilio am y cyfiawnhad y mae arnynt ei angen.

Daw pobl o'r ochr arall i'm gweld hefyd—gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol—sydd wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag achosion hir a chymhleth sydd wedi achosi gofid aruthrol iddynt ac wedi bygwth eu gyrfaoedd. Gallwch edrych ar y sefyllfa a meddwl wrthyhych eich hun: o na bai rhywun wedi delio â hyn ar y dechrau; o na fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl cael yr hyn a oedd yn angenrheidiol ar y dechrau, ac nid arian o reidrwydd, Weinidog. Bron bob amser, dywed pobl wrthyf, 'Nid oes arnaf eisiau arian, ond mae arnaf eisiau i rywun ddweud eu bod ar fai a'u bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad. Y cwbl sydd arnaf arnaf ei eisiau yw ymddiheuriad.' O'r herwydd, os gwnawn hyn yn iawn, credaf y bydd yn rhoi llawer mwy o fodlonrwydd i etholwyr, a bydd yn bendant yn gwneud proses anodd yn llawer haws ei deall. Rhaid creu rhyw fath o siop-un-stop ar gyfer ymdrin â gwneud iawn am gamweddau.

Mae materion y mae angen inni fod yn ofalus yn eu cylch, ac mae Jonathan yn benodol wedi eu crybwyll. Mae angen inni droedio'n ofalus yma oherwydd bod angen inni wella mynediad heb greu diwylliant hawliadau, ac

emphasise simplicity, and the basics, without creating a golden road for lawyers to walk down. There are great opportunities here, and I wonder if you would agree with me, Minister, that we need to look at the opportunity to establish an integrated approach with social services, because, very often, cases involve health and social services, and if we could get that co-operation between them, it would be very helpful.

I have some specific questions, the first being about the community health councils. Currently they have a role as advisers, and it would be fair to say that they feel that they are greatly stretched in that role. I wonder if you have given any thought to their future role. They have done a sterling job up to now, but if we are to bolster this system we either need to bolster the community health councils or to provide an alternative, and that is a whole debate in itself.

I want to take up the issue about the proposal to delay the application of the new process to primary care. To give an example, for a minor dermatological operation you might go to your local GP or to the local hospital. It would be manifestly unfair, if you were seeking some kind of apology or recompense, to have different systems in operation depending on where you happened to go for treatment. In fact, it could cause problems and undermine the efforts we are making to move towards a primary care-based process.

The third issue is the wording in the proposed Measure in relation to the provision of legal advice and medical expert advice. Section 7 on legal redress states:

‘(1) Subject to subsections (2) and (4), the regulations may make such provision as the Welsh Ministers think fit—

- (a) for the provision of legal advice without charge to individuals seeking redress under the regulations;
- (b) for the provision in connection with an application for redress under the regulations of other services, including the services of

mae angen inni bwysleisio'r pethau syml, a'r materion sylfaenol, heb greu llwybr aur i dwrneiod. Mae cyfleoedd gwych yma, a tybed a gytunwch â mi Weinidog, fod angen inni edrych ar y cyfle i sefydlu dull gweithredu integredig gyda'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, oherwydd bod achosion, yn aml iawn, yn cynnwys iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a phe gallem gael y cydweithrediad hwn rhyngddynt, byddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn.

Mae gennyf gwestiynau penodol, ac mae'r cyntaf ohonynt am y cynghorau iechyd cymuned. Ar hyn o bryd rôl fel cynghorwyr sydd ganddynt, a byddai'n deg dweud eu bod yn teimlo bod cryn dipyn o bwysau arnynt yn y rôl honno. Tybed a ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'w rôl i'r dyfodol? Maent wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol hyd yma, ond os ydym am gryfhau'r system hon mae angen naill ai cryfhau'r cynghorau iechyd cymuned neu ddarparu cyrff amgen, ac mae hynny'n ddadl gyflawn ynddi'i hun.

Hoffwn drafod y mater ynghylch y cynnig i ohirio gweithredu'r broses newydd o ran gofal sylfaenol. I roi esiampl, ar gyfer mân lawdriniaethau dermatolegol byddech o bosibl yn mynd at eich meddyg teulu lleol neu i'r ysbyty lleol. Byddai'n amlwg yn annheg, pe byddech yn ceisio cael rhyw fath o ymddiheuriad neu iawndal, pe byddai gwahanol systemau ar waith gan ddibynnu ar ble yr aethoch i gael eich triniaeth. Yn wir, gallai achosi problemau a thanseilio'r ymdrechion a wnawn i symud tuag at broses sy'n seiliedig ar ofal sylfaenol.

Y trydydd mater yw geiriad y Mesur arfaethedig o safbwynt darparu cyngor cyfreithiol a chyngor arbenigol meddygol. Mae Adran 7 ar wneud iawn yn gyfreithiol yn nodi:

‘(1) Yn ddarostyngedig i isadrannau (2) a (4), caiff y rheoliadau wneud y ddarpariaeth y mae Gweinidogion Cymru yn barnu ei bod yn addas-

- (a) ar gyfer darparu cyngor cyfreithiol di-dâl i unigolion sy'n ceisio iawn o dan y rheoliadau;
- (b) ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau eraill, gan gynnwys gwasanaethau arbenigwyr

medical experts’.

That gives Ministers—and you in this case, Minister—tremendous power to decide whether you have a legal aid system.

Do you intend to make the final proposal more specific and make it clear that you intend to have a legal aid process? There is a world of difference between a procedure that relies simply on amateur efforts and one that has some kind of reliance on professional efforts. I would not expect any Measure to specify the exact process, but it would be reasonable to specify whether or not there will be a legal aid process.

A key issue in all this is that we must ensure, somewhere in the process, that health professionals learn from their mistakes. This is not done often enough, simply because they are not put in a position to learn from their mistakes. In many circumstances, the system does not really allow them to admit their mistakes and so not enough learning goes on. It is important that we take advantage of lessons that are there to be learned.

To have credibility, this Measure will have to go forward on a broad front. It will have to take on board the views not just of patients but, importantly, of health professionals. This will sink or swim, depending on the attitudes of health professionals towards it. They must have faith in it, as well as patients having faith in it. I commend you for being as wide and open in your approach as possible.

Edwina Hart: Thank you, Jenny. You mentioned what had happened with constituents and how complex and cumbersome a system it is, and your point about it being timely is well made, as this is an issue that is often brought to my desk. These things go on forever, and we are usually the last resort for a person when all else has failed. Therefore, it is important that we have a system that deals with these redress issues quite expeditiously, and you

meddygol, mewn cysylltiad â chais am iawn o dan y rheoliadau’.

Mae hyn yn rhoi pŵer aruthrol i Weinidogion—a chithau yn yr achos hwn, Weinidog—i benderfynu a oes gennych system cymorth cyfreithiol.

A ydych yn bwriadu gwneud y cynnig terfynol yn fwy penodol a datgan yn glir eich bod yn bwriadu cael proses cymorth cyfreithiol? Ceir cryn wahaniaeth rhwng gweithdrefn sy’n dibynnu ar ddim ond ymdrechion amatur ac un sy’n dibynnu i ryw raddau ar ymdrechion proffesiynol. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl i ddim un Mesur bennu’r union broses, ond byddai’n rhesymol pennu a fydd proses cymorth cyfreithiol ai peidio.

Un o’r materion allweddol yn hyn oll yw sicrhau, yn rhywle yn y broses, y bydd gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn dysgu o’u camgymeriadau. Nid yw hyn yn digwydd yn ddigon aml, a hynny am y rheswm syml na chânt eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa i ddysgu o’u camgymeriadau. Yn aml iawn, nid yw’r system yn caniatáu iddynt gyfaddef eu bod wedi gwneud camgymeriadau ac o’r herwydd nid oes digon o ddysgu’n digwydd. Mae’n bwysig inni fanteisio ar y gwersi sydd i’w dysgu.

I sicrhau hygrededd, bydd yn rhaid i’r Mesur hwn fynd rhagddo’n eang. Bydd yn rhaid iddo ystyried barn gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, yn ogystal â chleifion, ac mae hynny’n bwysig iawn. Bydd hyn yn methu neu’n llwyddo, gan ddibynnu ar agweddau gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol tuag ato. Mae angen iddynt fod â ffydd ynddo, yn ogystal â bod gan gleifion ffydd ynddo. Yr wyf yn eich cymeradwyo am fod mor eang ac agored ag sy’n bosibl o ran eich dull o ymdrin â hyn.

Edwina Hart: Diolch, Jenny. Soniasoch am yr hyn a ddigwyddasai ymhlith eich etholwyr a pha mor gymhleth ac anhylaw yw’r system, ac mae eich pwynt ynglŷn â pha mor amserol ydyw’n un da, oherwydd y mae hyn yn fater y tynnir fy sylw ato yn aml. Bydd y pethau hyn yn mynd ymlaen am byth, ac fel arfer try pobl atom pan fydd popeth arall wedi methu. Felly, mae’n bwysig sicrhau y bydd gennym system a fydd yn mynd i’r afael â materion sy’n gofyn am wneud iawn yn eithaf sydyn,

are right about taking a one-stop-shop approach to dealing with them.

I also concur—as I did with Jonathan—that access is not about creating a culture of claiming. It is important that we get the publicity in order for the electorate to understand what this Measure is about.

I heard your point about the social services link, and I know that my Deputy Minister also heard you speak. I will look at that, as you are right. Some complaints—to do with delayed transfers of care, for instance—may be about various issues and not necessarily about the health service; they may involve a link with social services. It is important that we also get that right.

You are also quite right about community health councils. Over the past few years, they have had an enormous amount of work to do, with consultations, reconfigurations and all their work on behalf of patients in their area. I am in discussions with the councils about how they see and anticipate their role and function in this and, as part and parcel of that, the resource implications of that. We recognise that we are dealing with volunteers and small organisations, so it is important that we get the balance right. We would not want a Measure such as this to fall because we did not have the necessary practical measures in place elsewhere.

Helen Mary Jones raised a good point about the primary care issue, and I told her that I would look at it. We are trying to encourage more community services and get more things done in the community, and so, over the next few years, that link between primary and secondary care will become even more apparent. I am more than happy to consider that.

I hope that discussions will take place during committee stage about the wording of section 7 of the proposed Measure. However, I am minded that it gives me a wide range of powers, and perhaps how they should be exercised needs to be clarified. Therefore, I

ac yr ydych yn iawn wrth sôn am ddelio â hwy drwy ddull siop-un-stop.

Cytunaf hefyd—fel y gwneuthum â Jonathan—nad creu diwylliant hawlio yw ystyr mynediad. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau cyhoeddusrwydd er mwyn i'r etholwyr ddeall ystyr y Mesur hwn.

Clywais eich pwynt ynghylch y cysylltiad â'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a gwn fod fy Nirprwy Weinidog wedi'ch clywed yn siarad hefyd. Edrychaf ar hynny, oherwydd yr ydych yn llygad eich lle. Gallai fod a wnelo rhai cwynion—ynghylch oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, er enghraifft—ag amrywiol faterion ac nid y gwasanaeth iechyd o angenrheidrwydd; gallant ymwneud â chysylltiad â'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod hynny'n cael ei wneud yn iawn hefyd.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle hefyd ynglŷn â chynghorau iechyd cymuned. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, cawsant waith anferthol i'w wneud, o ran ymgynghori, ailgyflunio a'r holl waith a wnânt ar ran cleifion yn eu hardaloedd. Yr wyf wrthi'n trafod gyda'r cynghorau ynglŷn â sut y maent yn gweld ac yn rhagweld eu rôl yn hyn o beth ac, yn rhan annatod o hynny, goblygiadau hynny o ran adnoddau. Yr ydym yn cydnabod ein bod yn ymdrin â gwirfoddolwyr a mudiadau bach, ac felly mae'n bwysig sicrhau'r cydbwysedd iawn. Ni fyddem am i Fesur fel hwn fethu am nad oeddem wedi rhoi'r mesurau ymarferol angenrheidiol ar waith mewn lleoedd eraill.

Cododd Helen Mary Jones bwynt da ynglŷn â mater gofal sylfaenol, a dywedais innau wrthi y byddwn yn edrych arno. Yr ydym yn ceisio annog mwy o wasanaethau cymunedol a gwneud mwy o bethau yn y gymuned, ac felly, dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, daw'r cysylltiad hwnnw rhwng gofal sylfaenol a gofal eilaidd yn fwy amlwg fyth. Yr wyf yn gwbl fodlon ystyried hynny.

Gobeithiaf y bydd trafodaethau yn y pwyllgor ynglŷn â geiriad adran 7 y Mesur arfaethedig. Fodd bynnag, sylweddolaf ei fod yn rhoi imi bwerau helaeth, ac efallai fod angen egluro sut y dylid eu harfer. Felly, yr wyf yn fodlon edrych ar y materion hynny.

am also happy to look at those issues.

Your point that health professionals do not learn from their mistakes because they are not allowed to do so was absolutely valid. When a mistake is made, it is as though the boundary fences go up and no-one wants to say anything. However, mistakes can be innocent and not deliberate, and it is important that we get best practice by learning from those lessons. We will have to confront that when we discuss this, and we also have to confront attitudes to these issues in the national health service. In my opinion, the national health service needs to be more transparent and open in areas. We need to encourage that openness and transparency, which will also help patients.

Yr oedd y pwynt a wnaethoch nad yw gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn dysgu o'u camgymeriadau am na adewir iddynt wneud hynny yn hollol ddilys. Pan wneir camgymeriad, bron na ddywedech fod y ffensys terfyn yn cael eu codi ac nad oes neb am ddweud dim byd. Fodd bynnag, gall camgymeriadau ddigwydd a'r rheini'n gamgymeriadau diniwed yn hytrach na rhai bwriadol, ac mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau'r arferion gorau drwy ddysgu yn sgîl y gwersi hynny. Bydd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny pan drafodwn hyn, a bydd yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael ag agweddau at y materion hyn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol hefyd. Yn fy marn i, mae angen i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol fod yn fwy tryloyw ac agored mewn rhai meysydd. Mae angen inni annog pobl i fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw, a bydd hynny yn ei dro'n helpu'r cleifion hefyd.

3.50 p.m.

On the broader front, we need to have discussions with health professionals, because this is as much about them as it is about patients. It is as much about those who are complained about as it is about those who complain, as well as the structures in place to deal with complaints. Therefore, I hope that our positive discussion today and how we take this Measure through the Assembly can lead to improvements. I may be the one taking this Measure forward, but I am always grateful for any suggested improvements, particularly if we can get cross-party agreement so that we can all be proud of this Measure. Is it not nice that we now have the powers to deal with such matters?

Yn fwy cyffredinol, mae angen inni gynnal trafodaethau gyda gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, oherwydd y mae a wnelo hyn â hwy llawn cymaint â'r cleifion. Mae'n ymwneud cymaint â'r rhai y mae cwynion amdanynt ag ydyw â'r rhai sy'n cwyno, ynghyd â'r strwythurau sydd ar waith i ddelio â'r cwynion. Felly, gobeithiaf y gall y drafodaeth gadarnhaol a gawsom heddiw a'r modd y byddwn yn dwyn y Mesur hwn drwy'r Cynulliad arwain at welliannau. Efallai mai fi yw'r un a fydd yn mynd â'r Mesur hwn rhagddo, ond byddaf wastad yn ddiolchgar am unrhyw awgrymiadau ynghylch gwelliannau, yn enwedig os gallwn sicrhau cytundeb pob plaid fel y gallwn oll fod yn falch o'r Mesur. Onid yw'n braf bod y pwerau gennym i ymdrin â materion o'r fath?

Lorraine Barrett: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I made some notes before the debate started, but I do not suppose that any of us has anything original to say today, given that we have all been involved in dealing with these issues, or have been aware of them, for many years. As others have said, particularly Jenny, Jonathan and Helen Mary before them, sometimes all the patient wants is an explanation of what went wrong, if something went wrong, or an

Lorraine Barrett: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Gwneuthum rai nodiadau cyn i'r ddadl ddechrau, ond ni thylbiaf fod gan neb ddim byd gwreiddiol i'w ddweud heddiw, gan ein bod oll wedi bod yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn, neu wedi bod yn ymwybodol ohonynt, ers blynyddoedd lawer. Fel y dywedodd eraill, yn enwedig Jenny, Jonathan a Helen Mary o'u blaenau, weithiau nid yw'r claf yn chwennych dim mwy nag esboniad ar yr hyn a aeth o'i le, os aeth rhywbeth o'i le,

apology. However, we can understand why staff are reluctant to apologise, because they are then admitting fault and the whole legal redress process can be started as a result.

It is fair to say that, in most cases, all patients want is an explanation or an apology. Many people have told me as much over the years. I worked for Alun Michael for 12 years, and I dealt with many such cases as part of his casework. They went on and on, and unnecessarily so. I am dealing with an ongoing case at the moment, and it is all down to a bit of bureaucracy. If someone had explained the situation fully to the patient in the first week he raised his concern, it would have been dealt with, but it has now become very convoluted and is taking up a lot of the health staff's time.

We have mentioned hospitals, doctors and GPs, but we also need to think about the health service staff who work in the communities and who visit people in their homes. The protection that they need when they undertake such work also comes into play. The one point that I wanted to raise with you has already been raised by others, namely what part the community health councils can play in this. They have a lot of expertise, but, as Jenny said, they are stretched. However, I would like to see their expertise being used, even if it means providing more funding for them. The British Medical Association was mentioned earlier in this context, but I am also thinking of the other trade unions that represent all staff in the health service.

I welcome this statement. This issue is a whole new ball game. The more you think about it, the more issues you find that we will have to tackle, particularly the ambulance-chasing culture that the BMA has warned us about. We do not want to get into that compensation culture, do we? However, thank you, and I look forward to watching this Measure progress.

neu ymddiheuriad. Fodd bynnag, gallwn ddeall pam y mae staff mor gyndyn o ymddiheuro, oherwydd o wneud hynny maent yn cyfaddef bai ac o ganlyniad i hynny gellir cychwyn ar y broses o geisio cael iawn cyfreithiol.

Teg yw dweud, gan mwyaf, mai'r cwbl y mae cleifion yn dymuno'i gael yw esboniad neu ymddiheuriad. Mae llawer o bobl wedi dweud hynny wrthyf dros y blynyddoedd. Bûm yn gweithio i Alun Michael am 12 o flynyddoedd, a bûm yn delio â llawer o achosion o'r fath fel rhan o'i waith achosion. Aent ymlaen ac ymlaen, a hynny'n ddiangen. Yr wyf wrthi'n delio ag achos ar hyn o bryd, a mater o fiwrocratiaeth ydyw yn y bôn. Petai rhywun wedi esbonio'r sefyllfa'n iawn i'r claf yn yr wythnos gyntaf y bu iddo godi ei bryder, byddid wedi delio â'r mater, ond bellach aeth pethau'n ddyrys tu hwnt ac mae'n mynd â llawer o amser y staff iechyd.

Yr ydym wedi sôn am ysbytai, meddygon a meddygon teulu, ond mae angen inni feddwl am y rhai o blith staff y gwasanaeth iechyd sy'n gweithio yn y cymunedau ac sy'n ymweld â phobl yn eu cartrefi. Mae'r diogelwch y mae ei angen arnynt pan fyddant yn ymgymryd â gwaith o'r fath yn ystyriaeth hefyd. Mae'r union bwynt yr oeddwn am ei godi gyda chi eisoes wedi ei godi gan eraill, sef y rhan y gall y cynghorau iechyd cymuned ei chwarae yn hyn. Mae ganddynt lawer o arbenigedd, ond, fel y dywedodd Jenny, maent dan bwysau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld eu harbenigedd yn cael ei ddefnyddio, hyd yn oed os yw hynny'n golygu rhoi mwy o gyllid iddynt. Crybwyllwyd Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain yn gynharach yn hyn o beth, ond meddwl yr wyf hefyd am yr undebau llafur eraill sy'n cynrychioli holl staff y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r datganiad hwn. Mae'r mater hwn yn rhywbeth cwbl newydd. Po fwyaf y meddyliwch amdano, mwyaf o faterion y gwelwch fod angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy, yn enwedig y diwylliant ymlid ambiwlansys y mae Cymdeithas Feddygol Prydain wedi ein rhybuddio yn ei gylch. Nid ydym am gofleidio diwylliant iawndal, a ydym? Fodd bynnag, diolch, ac edrychaf ymlaen at wyllo'r Mesur hwn yn mynd rhagddo.

Edwina Hart: When I made my statement, I said that I considered this to be NHS redress Measure No. 1, because you are right—the more we discuss this, the more issues will be raised, and the more we will have to consider our competence in this area and what we need to do to take legislation forward.

You are also right about the unions. I will speak not only to the BMA but also to health professionals and their organisations, such as UNISON, the Royal College of Nursing, the Royal College of Midwives and everyone else, to get a feel for what they think about these issues. It is they who are at the front line when these complaints are made. As we take the Measure through, we will get an opportunity to hear the views of all of these individuals.

On the community health councils, I am also minded that I must keep a balance. Community health councils do a good job of advocacy, but I must also retain an independent element in this because if you are made an offer, you need someone to advise you on whether it is correct. Sometimes, that will require more than advocacy by someone from a community health council; it might require a solicitor to give you the necessary advice. Not only are the rights of the employees at the heart of this NHS redress Measure, but so are the rights of citizens to get the best advice in the simplified service that we envisage. As you said, sometimes, people want only to know why something went wrong and be assured that it will not go wrong for someone else. The most important part of this policy is ensuring that a practice is changed so that whatever went wrong will never go wrong again.

Even when a procedure has been changed so that something that went wrong for one patient will never go wrong again, that is never publicised. Would it not be nice for staff and others to know that some good has come out of something happening that was not right? Given the openness of this discussion, I hope that many of the issues that make the citizens of Wales terribly angry can

Edwina Hart: Pan wneuthum fy natganiad, dywedais fy mod yn ystyried mai hwn yw Mesur gwneud iawn Rhif 1 y GIG, oherwydd yr ydych yn llygad eich lle—po fwyaf y trafodwn hyn, mwyaf o faterion a godir, a mwyaf y bydd angen inni ystyried ein cymhwysedd yn y maes hwn a'r hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud i fynd â deddfwriaeth rhagddi.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle o ran yr undebau hefyd. Siaradaf nid yn unig â Chymdeithas Feddygol Prydain ond hefyd â gweithwyr iechedd proffesiynol a'u cymdeithasau, megis UNSAIN, y Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol, Coleg Brenhinol y Bydwagedd a phawb arall, er mwyn cael rhyw syniad beth yw eu barn ynghylch y materion hyn. Hwyr sydd ar flaen y gad pan wneir y cwynion. Wrth inni fynd â'r Mesur rhagddo, cawn gyfle i glywed barn yr unigolion hyn i gyd.

O ran y cynghorau iechedd cymuned, cofiaf hefyd fod angen imi gynnal cydbwysedd. Mae'r cynghorau iechedd cymuned yn gwneud gwaith da o ran eirioli, ond rhaid imi aros yn annibynnol yn hyn o beth oherwydd os cewch gynnig, mae angen rhywun i'ch cynghori a yw'n gywir ai peidio. Weithiau, bydd angen mwy yn hynny o beth nag eiriolaeth gan gyngor iechedd cymuned; gallai fod angen cyfreithiwr i roi'r cyngor angenrheidiol i chi. Nid yn unig y mae hawliau'r staff wrth wraidd y Mesur hwn i wneud iawn yn y gwasanaeth iechedd, mae hawliau'r dinasyddion hefyd i gael y cyngor gorau yn y gwasanaeth symlach yr ydym yn ei ragweld. Fel y dywedaso, weithiau, y cwbl y mae pobl am ei wybod yw pam yr aeth rhywbeth o'i le a chael sicrwydd nad aiff o'i le eto i rywun arall. Yr elfen bwysicaf yn y polisi hwn yw sicrhau bod arfer yn cael ei newid fel na fydd beth bynnag a aeth o'i le byth yn mynd o'i le eto.

Hyd yn oed os newidir gweithdrefn fel na fydd yr hyn a aeth o'i le i un claf byth yn mynd o'i le eto, ni chaiff hynny byth gyhoeddusrwydd. Oni fyddai'n braf i'r staff ac i eraill wybod bod rhywbeth da wedi digwydd yn sgîl rhywbeth a aeth o'i le? O ystyried pa mor agored yw'r ddadl hon, gobeithiaf y bydd modd unioni llawer o'r materion sy'n cynddeiriogi dinasyddion

be resolved. However, the most important issue for us as politicians is to stand firm on any notions of ambulance chasing in Wales, as that is very serious indeed.

David Lloyd: I thank the Minister for her statement. I also look forward to additional powers so that we can develop this NHS redress Measure into some form of no-fault compensation. After all, that happens in quite a few countries around the globe, and, to return to Jonathan Morgan's point, they have recognised tariffs of compensation and measures of redress.

I welcome the intention to foster a no-blame culture in the NHS and, to emphasise the point made by Lorraine among others, this needs to cover primary care. When I started in general practice 25 years ago, a GP would face a complaint every seven years on average. A GP now faces a complaint every 18 months on average. Bearing in mind that GPs see an average of 15 patients a day, which equates to 10,000 a year, that figure represents one complaint for every 15,000 consultations. I contend that that is not too bad, but you can still improve upon it—you can improve upon only one complaint.

The particular situation with regard to a complaint made about a primary care setting is the ongoing relationship the patient has with the nurses and doctors. Unless you change practice, it is difficult to avoid seeing them again. Therefore, that particular situation is prevalent in primary care but it does not necessarily exist in secondary care. Can we incorporate that?

My second point relates to the concept of medical mishaps, as opposed to medical negligence. A medical mishap is a recognised side-effect of a drug or a recognised unintended effect of an operation, which can be catastrophic in its effect but is no-one's fault. It is not the fault of a doctor, surgeon, nurse or porter. That is why that fits in quite nicely with the concept of no-fault compensation and a no-blame culture. Until

Cymru. Fodd bynnag, y mater pwysicaf i ni fel gwleidyddion yw sefyll yn gadarn ynglŷn ag unrhyw syniadau ynghylch ymlid ambiwlansys yng Nghymru, gan fod hwnnw'n fater difrifol iawn.

David Lloyd: Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Edrychaf finnau ymlaen at bwerau ychwanegol i ni allu datblygu'r Mesur hwn i wneud iawn yn y GIG yn rhyw fath o iawndal heb fai. Wedi'r cwbl, mae hynny'n digwydd mewn sawl gwlad yn y byd, ac, o ddychwelyd at bwynt Jonathan Morgan, mae ganddynt dariffau iawndal a mesurau gwneud iawn sy'n cael eu cydnabod.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r bwriad i feithrin diwylliant o beidio â rhoi bai yn y GIG ac, o bwysleisio'r pwynt a wnaeth Lorraine ymhllith eraill, mae angen i hyn gynnwys gofal sylfaenol. Pan ddechreuais fel meddyg teulu 25 o flynyddoedd yn ôl, byddai cwyn am feddyg teulu bob 7 mlynedd ar gyfartaledd. Bellach mae meddyg teulu'n wynebu cwyn bob 18 mis ar gyfartaledd. O gofio bod meddygon teulu'n gweld 15 o gleifion ar gyfartaledd bob dydd, sy'n 10,000 y flwyddyn, mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n golygu un gŵyn am bob 15,000 o ymgynghoriadau. Byddwn yn dadlau nad yw hynny'n rhy ddrwg, ond mae modd gwneud yn well na hynny—gallwch wella pe bai cyn lleied ag un gŵyn.

Y sefyllfa neilltuol o ran cwyn a wneir am ofal sylfaenol yw'r berthynas barhaus rhwng y claf a'r nyrsys a'r meddygon. Onid ewch at bractis arall, mae'n anodd osgoi eu gweld eto. Felly, mae'r sefyllfa honno'n gyffredin mewn gofal sylfaenol ond nid yw o angenrheidrwydd yn digwydd mewn gofal eilaidd. A allwn ymgorffori hynny?

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â chysyniad damweiniau meddygol, yn hytrach nag esgeuluster meddygol. Mae damweiniau meddygol yn golygu sgîl-ffeithiau cydnabyddedig cyffur neu effaith anfwriadus gydnabyddedig llawdriniaeth, a gall yr effaith fod yn drychinebus er nad oes bai ar neb. Nid oes bai ar feddyg, llawfeddyg, nyrs na phorthor. Dyna pam y mae hynny'n cyd-fynd yn ddigon twt â chysyniad iawndal heb fai a

now, with the adversarial nature of our legal system, a medical mishap that is no-one's fault has not been allowed; it always has to be someone's fault. The patient has to prove that a doctor has been negligent to get compensation. There is no other way. Compensation would be deserved for a medical mishap, but there is currently no means of getting it without proving that a doctor, nurse, or the trust is at fault. That is why we need a no-blame culture and no-fault compensation. In a case of medical mishap, patients can be pushed through exhaustive legal proceedings lasting for years and yet receive no money because the doctor is not found to be negligent. There was no negligence; it was merely a mishap. Therefore, I bring forward the concept of a medical mishap, which is no-one's fault.

That category of situation could be addressed in a no-blame culture and in relation to no-fault compensation, but it cannot be addressed currently. Currently, we have the supremely adversarial approach that increases secrecy and makes for defensive medicine. We are encouraged then to overinvestigate people and carry out more x-rays and so on, because doctors medicalise everything and have to overcompensate for the risk of getting something wrong. Therefore, I want to introduce the concept of a medical mishap that is no-one's fault. At the moment, the only way to compensate for that is to try to prove that it is someone's fault, and fail after several years in court. That is not satisfactory; indeed, it is one of the most unsatisfactory situations in the current system. As Jonathan Morgan said, we have to take the legal system out of the process, because the adversarial approach stops NHS staff from saying 'Sorry', as it would mean admitting guilt. It is interpreted, legally, as an admission of guilt, even though it is a natural human reaction to want to say 'Sorry'. We are prevented as NHS professionals from saying 'Sorry'. That is why there needs to be change. I look forward to a full gambit of powers enabling us to get proper no-fault compensation. That would certainly move the agenda forwards. Diolch yn fawr.

4.00 p.m.

diwylliant o beidio â rhoi bai. Hyd yma, oherwydd natur wrthwynebol ein system gyfreithiol, ni fu lle i'r ddamwain feddygol nad oes bai ar neb amdani; rhaid beio rhywun yn wastad. Rhaid i'r claf brofi bod meddyg wedi bod yn esgeulus er mwyn ennill iawndal. Dyna'r unig ffordd. Byddai modd cael iawndal am ddamwain feddygol, ond ar hyn o bryd nid oes modd ei gael heb brofi bod bai ar feddyg neu ar nyrs neu fod bai ar yr ymddiriedolaeth. Dyna pam y mae angen inni gael diwylliant o beidio â rhoi bai ac iawndal heb fai. Yn achos damwain feddygol, gall cleifion fynd drwy achosion cyfreithiol am flynyddoedd heb gael dim arian am na cheir bod y meddyg yn esgeulus. Nid oedd esgeuluster; damwain ydoedd. Felly, cyflwynaf gysyniad y ddamwain feddygol, nad oes neb ar fai amdani.

Gellid rhoi sylw i'r math hwnnw o sefyllfa mewn diwylliant o beidio â rhoi bai ac o ran iawndal heb fai, ond nid oes modd rhoi sylw iddo ar hyn o bryd. Ar hyn o bryd, mae gennym ddull hynod wrthwynebol sy'n cynyddu cyfrinachedd ac yn gwneud meddygaeth yn amddiffynnol. Yna cawn ein hannog i orarchwilio pobl a chymryd mwy fyth o luniau pelydr-x ac yn y blaen, oherwydd bod meddygon yn meddyginiaethu ar gyfer popeth ac yn gorfod gor-wneud rhag ofn yr aiff rhywbeth o'i le. Felly, yr wyf am gyflwyno cysyniad y ddamwain feddygol nad oes neb ar fai amdani. Ar hyn o bryd, yr unig ffordd o wneud iawn am hynny yw ceisio profi bod rhywun ar fai, a methu ar ôl blynyddoedd lawer yn y llys. Nid yw hynny'n foddhaol; yn wir, mae'n un o'r sefyllfaoedd mwyaf anfoddhaol yn y system gyfredol. Fel y dywedodd Jonathan Morgan, rhaid inni dynnu'r system gyfreithiol o'r broses, oherwydd bod y dull gwrthwynebol yn atal y GIG rhag ymddiheuro, gan y byddai hynny'n golygu cyfaddef euogrwydd. Caiff ei ddehongli, yn gyfreithiol, fel cyfaddef euogrwydd, er bod ymddiheuro'n adwaith dynol naturiol. Cawn ein rhwystro fel gweithwyr proffesiynol y GIG rhag ymddiheuro. Dyna pam y mae angen newid. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael ystod lawn o bwerau a fydd yn ein galluogi i gael iawndal priodol heb roi bai. Yn sicr byddai hynny'n symud yr agenda yn ei blaen. Thank you.

Edwina Hart: I thank Dai Lloyd for his contribution on the basis of his profession, because it gave us a valuable insight into some of the issues that we are trying to address in this regard. I was amazed when we talked about the complaints and about the fact that it has gone from one every seven years to one in every 18 months. However, given that it is one in 15,000, it is probably relatively small comparatively speaking. However, the nature of the complaints might be rather more serious in terms of treatment or what had happened during that process. I will certainly want to explore the issue of medical mishap with the professional organisations, because, sometimes, things happen that no-one would ever think could happen. It is then very difficult for the patient to have to prove that there was negligence to get compensation for something that was very serious for them. I am more than happy to take on those points in the discussions that I will be having elsewhere, and I know that Members will have listened to those points, and I am sure that they will flow through in discussions in committee on the Measure.

Eleanor Burnham: Many of the sentiments that I am about to express have probably been well expressed previously. However, I welcome the chance to speak briefly on this important subject. I am delighted that the Minister has taken such a positive cross-party approach to this, because we all have experience of the huge difficulties that many constituents face when it comes to getting redress. I thoroughly agree with everyone, and particularly with the Minister's comments earlier that all most people want is an apology. I also take on board Dr Dai Lloyd's comments, because I think that we need to bridge the gap, because there is a big gap. Most people who come to us are at the end of a long journey through the bureaucratic treacle. I believe that nipping the problem in the bud, which, hopefully, this will help to do, will probably bring about a much more positive attitude between politicians and people in the medical services.

Without being too pointed, when I had quite a severe injury last year and when I was

Edwina Hart: Hoffwn ddiolch i Dai Lloyd am ei gyfraniad ar sail ei broffesiwn, oherwydd cawsom gipolwg gwerthfawr ar rai o'r materion yr ydym yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â nhw yn y cyswllt hwn. Yr oeddwn yn synnu pan oeddem yn siarad am y cwynion a'r ffaith eu bod wedi cynyddu o un bob saith mlynedd i un bob 18 mis. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried mai un mewn 15,000 yw hyn, mae'n nifer cymharol fach mae'n debyg. Fodd bynnag, efallai fod natur y cwynion ychydig yn fwy difrifol o ran y driniaeth neu'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y broses honno. Byddaf yn sicr am drafod damweiniau meddygol gyda'r cyrff proffesiynol, oherwydd weithiau, mae pethau'n digwydd na fyddai neb yn dychmygu y gallent ddigwydd. Mae wedyn yn anodd iawn i'r claf orfod profi esgeuluster i gael iawndal am rywbeth a oedd yn ddifrifol iawn iddo ef neu hi. Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon codi'r pwyntiau hynny yn y trafodaethau y byddaf yn eu cynnal mewn manau eraill, a gwn y bydd Aelodau wedi gwrandao ar y pwyntiau hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn codi yn nhrafodaethau'r pwyllgor ar y Mesur.

Eleanor Burham: Mae llawer o'r teimladau yr wyf am eu mynegi wedi eu lleisio'n bur dda eisoes mae'n debyg. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i siarad yn gryno am y pwnc pwysig hwn. Yr wyf yn hynod falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cymryd agwedd drawsbleidiol mor gadarnhaol at hyn, oherwydd y mae gan bob un ohonom brofiad o'r trafferthion aruthrol a wynebir gan lawer o etholwyr wrth gael iawn. Cytunaf yn llwyr â phawb, ac yn enwedig â sylwadau cynharach y Gweinidog mai'r cwbl y mae ar y rhan fwyaf o bobl ei eisiau yw ymddiheuriad. Cytunaf hefyd â sylwadau Dr Dai Lloyd, oherwydd credaf fod angen inni bontio'r bwlch, oherwydd y mae'n fwch mawr. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n dod atom wedi cyrraedd diwedd siwrnai hir drwy'r triog biwrocraidd. Credaf, drwy ladd y broblem hon yn yr egin, sy'n rhywbeth y bydd hyn, gobeithio, yn helpu i'w wneud, y gwelwn agwedd lawer mwy cadarnhaol rhwng gwleidyddion a phobl yn y gwasanaethau meddygol.

Heb fod yn rhy frathog, pan gefais anaf eithaf difrifol y llynedd a phan oeddwn innau'n

navigating through the treacle in the NHS, I realised the huge difficulties that we need to surmount. Politicians, perhaps, have been quite rightly blamed for micromanaging in the past, but I think that this kind of micromanaging will, hopefully, not be seen as meddling, but as something positive. Hopefully, people in Wales will thank us for trying our best, because there are huge difficulties. The comments that Jenny Randerson and others made about community health councils are important, because they are key to the issue and, with their huge experience, many of them already have difficulties in accessing certain parts of the service. I will not be too pointed and refer to them by name, but there are many community health councils in my region that find an adversarial attitude, whereby they cannot access certain hospitals. We need to ensure that that is surmounted, because it is key to what is happening. The community health councils have huge experience of all aspects of health and social care. They see it at first hand, and have to swim through treacle. I hope that you will address the situation, Minister, and give them the support that they deserve. I look forward to watching the deliberations on the Measure and, hopefully, its positive conclusion.

Edwina Hart: If there are issues in your area in terms of community health councils' relationship with the trusts, I would like to be advised of them. As we all do, I regard community health councils as valuable organisations that are quite focused in how they deal with issues. Therefore, if there are specific problems I would be grateful if you, and any other Members, would draw them to my attention, as it is my responsibility, as Minister for Health and Social Services, to take up those issues on your behalf and to ensure that all systems are running smoothly within the health service.

This issue is not about micromanaging; it is about our responsibility in Government and within the National Assembly to introduce a fairer system for the handling of lower-value clinical negligence claims. That is what it is

ymlwybro drwy driog y GIG, sylweddolais beth yw'r trafferthion anferth sydd angen inni eu datrys. Efallai fod gwleidyddion wedi cael eu beio, ac mae hynny'n hollol iawn, am ficoreoli yn y gorffennol, ond credaf na fydd y math hwn o ficoreoli, gobeithio, yn cael ei weld fel busnesa, ond fel rhywbeth cadarnhaol. Gobeithio y bydd pobl Cymru yn diolch inni am geisio gwneud ein gorau, oherwydd y mae'r trafferthion yn aruthrol. Mae'r sylwadau a gyflwynwyd gan Jenny Randerson ac eraill am gynghorau iechyd cymuned yn bwysig, oherwydd y maent yn allweddol o ran y mater dan sylw, ac er gwaethaf eu profiad helaeth, mae llawer ohonynt eisoes yn ei chael yn anodd cael mynediad at rannau o'r gwasanaeth. Nid wyf am fod yn rhy ddeifiol drwy eu henwi, ond mae llawer o gynghorau iechyd cymuned yn fy ardal sy'n dod ar draws agwedd wrthwynebol, ac yn methu â chael mynediad at rai ysbytai. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei ddatrys, oherwydd y mae'n allweddol o ran yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Mae gan gynghorau iechyd cymuned brofiad aruthrol o bob agwedd ar iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Maent yn ei weld drostynt eu hunain, ac yn gorfod nofio drwy'r triog. Gobeithio y byddwch yn mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa, Weinidog, ac yn rhoi'r gefnogaeth y maent yn ei haeddu iddynt. Edrychaf ymlaen at wyllo'r drafodaeth am y Mesur a'i chanlyniad cadarnhaol, gobeithio.

Edwina Hart: Os oes unrhyw broblemau yn eich ardal o ran perthynas y cynghorau iechyd cymuned â'r ymddiriedolaethau, hoffwn wybod beth ydynt. Fel pob un ohonom, yr wyf yn gweld cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn gyrff gwerthfawr sy'n eithaf clir ynghylch sut y maent yn delio â phroblemau. Felly, os oes unrhyw broblemau penodol byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech chi, ac unrhyw Aelodau eraill, dynnu fy sylw atynt, oherwydd fi sy'n gyfrifol, fel y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, am godi'r materion hyn ar eich rhan a sicrhau bod yr holl systemau'n gweithredu'n llyfn o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Nid microreoli yw'r broblem hon; mae'n ymwneud â'n cyfrifoldeb ni yn y Llywodraeth ac yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gyflwyno system decach ar gyfer ymdrin â hawliadau llai yn deillio o esgeuluster

all about. It is part of a much wider piece of work looking at how the health service handles things that go wrong. It has emerged from the debate that the health service should be open, transparent, learn from its mistakes, be honest with the people that are complaining and get outcomes at a more satisfactory level. Therefore, it is not about micromanaging, but about putting in place a system that allows the management of the health service to be undertaken properly in terms of how we deal with complaints in the health service.

When we consider the amount of money that goes into the health service, we must ensure that there is satisfaction on behalf of our constituents about how things are managed, because we are talking about a lot of money. When we talk about litigation, we are talking about a lot of money. If we can start to avoid some of that, we will save money, which can then go into front-line services, rather than into administration and bureaucracy.

Jocelyn Davies: When the Audit Committee looked at clinical negligence in 2000, there were about 1,600 open cases at that time, with a potential value of more than £400 million. That is an awful lot of money, but it is also an awful lot of negligence. It is worth remembering that claims have considerable hurdles to overcome before compensation is secured. Dai made the point well that mistakes do not automatically result in a viable claim in tort. Therefore, the ability to settle these lower-value claims without legal action will save considerable sums in legal fees and time. I agree with Helen Mary, and others, that many patients who were driven to complain simply want an apology; however, they also want a demonstration that lessons have been learned from their case. That is vital. Can you assure me that this Measure will result in those valuable outcomes, when appropriate, and that this will not present yet another barrier to those who have substantial claims that should be settled in the courts?

Edwina Hart: The individual who needs to take issues to court will continue to be able to do so—no barriers will be put in anyone's way. This is to do with the low-level cases, as you indicated, to see whether we can get a

clinigol. Hynny yw'r broblem. Mae'n rhan o waith llawer ehangach sy'n edrych ar sut y mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn delio â phethau sy'n mynd o chwith. Canlyniad y drafodaeth oedd y dylai'r gwasanaeth iechyd fod yn agored, yn dryloyw, y dylai ddysgu yn sgîl ei gamgymeriadau, bod yn onest â'r bobl sy'n cwyno a chael canlyniadau sy'n fwy boddhaol. Felly, nid mater o ficoreoli ydyw, ond o roi system ar waith sy'n gadael i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gael ei reoli'n iawn o ran sut y deliwn â chwynion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Pan ystyriwn faint o arian sy'n mynd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod ein hetholwyr yn fodlon ar sut y mae pethau'n cael eu rhedeg, oherwydd yr ydym yn siarad am arian mawr. Pan siaradwn am ymglyfreitha, yr ydym yn siarad am arian mawr. Os gallwn ddechrau osgoi rhywfaint o hynny, byddwn yn arbed arian, a all fynd i'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn hytrach nag i'r ochr weinyddol a biwrocraidd.

Jocelyn Davies: Pan edrychodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar esgeuluster clinigol yn 2000, yr oedd tua 1,600 o achosion ar y gweill bryd hynny, gwerth mwy na £400 miliwn o bosibl. Mae hynny'n llawer iawn o arian, ond mae hefyd yn llawer iawn o esgeuluster. Wrth wneud hawliad, mae'n werth cofio bod rhaid goresgyn rhwystrau sylweddol cyn i iawndal gael ei roi. Gwnaeth Dai y pwynt yn dda nad yw camgymeriadau o reidrwydd yn arwain at hawliad dilys o dan gyfraith camwedd. Felly, bydd gallu setlo'r hawliadau hyn am lai o arian heb fynd i gyfraith yn arbed arian mawr o ran ffioedd ac amser cyfreithiol. Cytunaf â Helen Mary, ac ag eraill, mai'r cwbl y mae ar lawer o gleifion sy'n cwyno ei eisiau yw ymddiheuriad; fodd bynnag, maent hefyd am weld bod gwersi wedi eu dysgu yn sgîl eu hachos. Mae hynny'n hanfodol. A allwch fy sicrhau y bydd y Mesur hwn yn arwain at y canlyniadau gwerthfawr hynny, pan fo hynny'n briodol, ac na fydd hyn yn rhwystr pellach i rai sydd â hawliadau mawr a ddylai gael eu setlo yn y llysoedd?

Edwina Hart: Bydd yr unigolyn sydd am fynd â'i broblem i'r llys yn parhau i allu gwneud hynny—ni roddir dim rhwystrau ar ffordd neb. Mae hyn yn ymwneud ag achosion sy'n delio â llai o arian, fel y

fairer and more just system. The cash figures to which you referred are startling, especially considering how long ago that that report was done for the Audit Committee. I must get some up-to-date figures on this for myself.

As you said, Jocelyn, what is important is that people want a demonstration that lessons have been learned, and that is not happening now. Even though some things are learned, and are improved, no-one sees it, and no-one in the wider world realises it. If you have complained about something, and you think that it will not then happen to someone else, you then feel much better about making the complaint, because the reason why you made the complaint was not for yourself, but was probably about other people and to address your concerns. Therefore, that is an important issue.

I hope that this will simplify matters. We have the opportunity to take this Measure through, and to look at what future Measures we can do, because many systems need simplifying and to be much more transparent if we are to get the service that we deserve in Wales.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr, Weinidog, am y datganiad, ac am eich sylwadau. Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

dywedwch, er mwyn gweld a allwn gael system decach a mwy cyfiawn. Mae'r ffigurau ariannol y cyfeiriasoch atynt yn syfrdanol, yn enwedig o ystyried cymaint o amser sydd er pan wnaethpwyd yr adroddiad hwnnw i'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Bydd yn rhaid imi gael ffigurau mwy diweddar ar hyn fy hun.

Fel y dywedasoch, Jocelyn, yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod ar bobl eisiau gweld bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu, ac nid yw hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd. Er bod rhai pethau'n cael eu dysgu, ac yn cael eu gwella, nid oes neb yn gweld hynny, ac nid oes neb yn y byd mawr y tu allan yn sylweddoli hynny. Os ydych wedi cwyno am rywbeth, ac yn credu na fydd hynny'n digwydd i rywun arall wedyn, yr ydych yn teimlo'n llawer gwell ynghylch cyflwyno'r gŵyn, oherwydd ni wnaethoch gwyno er eich mwyn eich hun, ond ynghylch pobl eraill mae'n debyg ac fel bod sylw'n cael ei roi i'ch pryderon. Mae hynny, felly, yn fater pwysig.

Gobeithio y bydd hyn yn symleiddio pethau. Mae'r cyfle gennym i fynd â'r maen i'r wal o ran y Mesur hwn, ac i weld pa Fesurau y gallwn eu cyflwyno yn y dyfodol, oherwydd y mae angen symleiddio llawer o systemau a'u gwneud yn fwy tryloyw os ydym i gael y gwasanaeth yr ydym yn ei haeddu yng Nghymru.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for the statement, and for your comments. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.07 p.m.
The meeting ended at 4.07 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)