



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**(Y Cofnod Swyddogol)**

**The National Assembly for Wales**  
**(The Official Record)**

**Dydd Iau 17 Ionawr 2002**

**Thursday 17 January 2002**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
*Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services*
- 13 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes  
*Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning*
- 23 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ  
*Questions to the House Committee*
- 23 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 24 Llywodraethu'r UE  
*EU Governance*
- 72 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
*Points of Order*
- 74 Dadl Fer: Cyfiawnder i Gymunedau Meysydd Glo  
*Short Debate: Justice for the Coalfield Communities*
- 89 Pwynt o Drefn  
*Point of Order*

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

*In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.*

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 9.05 a.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 9.05 a.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Gwasanaethau Ysbyty Aciwt mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig Acute Hospital Services in Rural Wales**

**C1 Cynog Dafis:** Sut y bydd y Gweinidog yn datblygu gwasanaethau ysbyty aciwt mewn ardaloedd gwledig? (OAQ14958)

**Q1 Cynog Dafis:** How will the Minister develop acute hospital services in rural areas? (OAQ14958)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Jane Hutt):** The report 'Access and Excellence' sets out the strategic direction for acute services and this is supported in 'Improving Health in Wales: A Plan for the NHS with its Partners'. The future requires a collaborative and networked approach to ensure accessible and high quality hospital services for all. That must be integrated with the work of developing primary and community care, and is now being taken forward as part of the implementation of the plan.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r adroddiad 'Mynediad a Rhagoriaeth' yn nodi'r cyfeiriad strategol ar gyfer gwasanaethau aciwt a chaiff hwn ei gefnogi yn 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru: Cynllun i'r GIG ynghyd â'i Bartneriaid.' Bydd angen ymagwedd gydweithrediadol a rhwydweithiol yn y dyfodol i sicrhau gwasanaethau ysbyty hygyrch o safon uchel i bawb. Rhaid i hynny gael ei integreiddio â'r gwaith o ddatblygu gofal sylfaenol a chymunedol, a chaiff ei ddatblygu ymhellach wrth roi'r cynllun ar waith.

**Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau ei bod yn derbyn bod angen gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau aciwt mewn ardaloedd gwledig, megis canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru, tra yn sicrhau y caiff hygyrchedd ei ddiogelu? Mae hygyrchedd yn allweddol i ragolygon iechyd person sydd, er enghraifft, yn dioddef ymosodiad sydyn megis anhwylder ar y galon. Sut y gall y Gweinidog sicrhau y caiff y ddau fater hyn eu diogelu?

**Cynog Dafis:** Will the Minister confirm that she accepts that the quality of acute services in rural areas, such as mid and west Wales needs to be improved, while ensuring that accessibility is secured? Accessibility is crucial to the health prospects of a person who, for instance, suffers a sudden attack of illness, for example a heart attack. How can the Minister ensure that these two aims are achieved?

**Jane Hutt:** The report was called 'Access and Excellence' because it concerns access to quality services and securing the excellence of those services. That report secured the future of the network of 17 major acute hospitals in Wales. The coronary heart disease framework provides guidelines and the standard for treatment and access to services. That will ensure quality services. All our other national service frameworks are adhered to also.

**Jane Hutt:** Galwyd yr adroddiad yn 'Mynediad a Rhagoriaeth' am ei fod yn ymwneud â mynediad i wasanaethau o safon a diogelu rhagoriaeth y gwasanaethau hynny. Diogelodd yr adroddiad hwnnw ddyfodol y rhwydwaith o 17 o brif ysbytai aciwt yng Nghymru. Mae fframwaith clefyd y galon yn rhoi canllawiau a'r safon ar gyfer triniaeth a mynediad i wasanaethau. Bydd hynny yn sicrhau gwasanaethau o safon. Cedwir at bob un o'n fframweithiau gwasanaeth cenedlaethol hefyd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you accept that the facilities in rural areas are a vital piece of the network of hospitals throughout Wales? If so, will you support Powys NHS Trust's plans to work with Swansea NHS Trust to provide a step-down facility at Ystradgynlais Community Hospital, thus freeing up vital acute beds in Morriston and Singleton hospitals and providing services closer to home for the people of Ystradgynlais?

**Jane Hutt:** The review of community hospitals in Powys was innovative and has secured their continuation. I am certainly interested in examining the plans to have closer collaboration between Ystradgynlais Community Hospital and Swansea NHS Trust.

**Glyn Davies:** Minister, do you agree that all NHS hospitals should be developed on the basis of providing equal pay for nurses? In Powys, nurses employed on Whitley terms can earn up to £5,000 more than nurses employed under NHS trust terms. That discrepancy is inappropriate. Will you move as quickly as possible to ensure that nurses receive equal pay for the same work?

**Jane Hutt:** Glyn, we inherited that situation from your Government, which moved away from the Whitley terms. We must now recover from that. I am seeking to implement 'Agenda for Change—Modernising the NHS Pay System', which will mean new terms of reference and pay scales for all NHS staff, based on equity and equal pay.

**Kirsty Williams:** A dderbyniwch fod y cyfleusterau mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn rhan hanfodol o'r rhwydwaith o ysbytai ledled Cymru? Os felly, a fyddwch yn cefnogi cynlluniau Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Powys i weithio gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe i ddarparu cyfleuster gofal llai dwys yn Ysbyty Cymuned Ystradgynlais, ac felly yn rhyddhau gwelyau aciwt hanfodol yn ysbyty Treforys ac ysbyty Singleton a darparu gwasanaethau yn fwy lleol ar gyfer pobl Ystradgynlais?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr oedd yr adolygiad o ysbytai cymuned ym Mhowys yn arloesol, ac mae wedi diogelu eu parhad. Yn sicr mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn astudio'r cynlluniau i sicrhau bod Ysbyty Cymuned Ystradgynlais ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe yn cydweithredu'n agosach.

**Glyn Davies:** Weinidog, a gytunwch y dylai pob ysbyty GIG gael eu datblygu ar sail darparu cyflog cyfartal i nyrsys? Ym Mhowys, gall nyrsys a gyflogir ar delerau Whitley ennill hyd at £5,000 yn fwy na nyrsys a gyflogir o dan delerau ymddiriedolaeth GIG. Mae'r gwahaniaeth hwnnw yn amhriodol. A weithredwch cyn gynted â phosibl i sicrhau bod nyrsys yn cael tâl cyfartal am yr un gwaith?

**Jane Hutt:** Glyn, etifeddwyd y sefyllfa honno o'ch Llywodraeth chi, a wyrodd oddi wrth delerau Whitley. Rhaid inni bellach ddod dros hynny. Yr wyf yn anelu at roi'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid—Moderneiddio System Gyflogau'r NHS' ar waith, a bydd hyn yn golygu cylchoedd gorchwyl newydd a graddfeydd cyflog ar gyfer holl staff y GIG, yn seiliedig ar degwch a chyflog cyfartal.

### **Defnyddio Aricept wrth Drin Clefyd Alzheimer The Use of Aricept in Treating Alzheimer's Disease**

**Q2 Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of aricept in delaying the onset of Alzheimer's disease? (OAQ14952)

**Jane Hutt:** Aricept is the brand name for the drug donepezil. Donepezil and the additional drugs—rivastigmine and galantamine—can be supplied under the national health service.

**C2 Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y defnydd o aricept er mwyn arafu symptomau clefyd Alzheimer? (OAQ14952)

**Jane Hutt:** Aricept yw'r enw gwerthu ar gyfer y cyffur donepezil. Gall donepezil a'r cyffuriau atodol—rivastigmine a galantamine—eu cyflenwi o dan y

I expect health authorities in Wales to take active steps to provide these drugs as one component in the management of people with mild and moderate Alzheimer's disease, in accordance with the guidance issued on 19 January 2001 by the National Institute for Clinical Excellence.

**Alun Cairns:** I am sure that the Minister agrees that Alzheimer's disease is dreadful and has enormous implications and consequences for family life. I note that, in her response, she mentioned that the NICE guidelines were approved in January 2001. Why, therefore, did it take health authorities up to six months to implement those recommendations, and why were some health authorities' budgets so minimal that they were used up in only two months?

**Jane Hutt:** We are working closely with the Department of Health and NICE to ensure that the NICE guidelines are implemented. We must remember that this is not just a matter of funding drugs, but of establishing and starting specialist memory clinics. Iechyd Morgannwg Health authority is also engaged in this, in terms of the AD2000 clinical research trials. However, we have recently received data that shows a material increase in the prescribing of these drugs across Wales last year.

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fy muddiant arferol fel meddyg teulu. Yn aml, mae cyffuriau newydd yn ymddangos heb wybodaeth annibynnol i'r meddyg teulu am eu heffeithiolrwydd. Beth fydd y Gweinidog yn ei wneud ynghylch hynny?

**Jane Hutt:** The National Institute for Clinical Excellence's role is to ensure that we have sound advice based on clinical evidence and trials, to ensure that GPs are guided in their prescribing.

gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Yr wyf yn disgwyl i awdurdodau iechyd yng Nghymru gymryd camau i ddarparu'r cyffuriau hyn fel un elfen o ofal pobl â chlefyd Alzheimer ysgafn a chymhedrol, yn unol â'r canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd ar 19 Ionawr 2001 gan y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod clefyd Alzheimer yn ofnadwy a bod ganddo oblygiadau a chanlyniadau sylweddol i fywyd teuluol. Nodaf, yn ei hymateb, ei bod wedi sôn bod canllawiau'r sefydliad wedi'u cymeradwyo ym mis Ionawr 2001. Pam, felly, y cymerodd hyd at chwe mis i awdurdodau iechyd roi'r argymhellion hynny ar waith, a pham fod cyllidebau rhai awdurdodau iechyd mor fach fel eu bod wedi'u defnyddio i gyd o fewn deufis yn unig?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos â'r Adran Iechyd a'r sefydliad i sicrhau y caiff canllawiau'r sefydliad eu rhoi ar waith. Rhaid inni gofio nad yw hwn yn fater o ariannu cyffuriau yn unig, ond o sefydlu a chychwyn clinigau cof arbenigol. Mae awdurdod Iechyd Morgannwg Health hefyd yn cymryd rhan yn hyn, yn nhermau treialon ymchwil clinigol AD2000. Fodd bynnag, yn ddiweddar daeth data i law sy'n dangos y bu cynnydd gwirioneddol mewn rhagnodi'r cyffuriau hyn ledled Cymru y llynedd.

**David Lloyd:** I declare my usual interest as a general practitioner. Often, new drugs appear without impartial information for GPs concerning their effectiveness. What will the Minister do about that?

**Jane Hutt:** Rôl y Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Ragoriaeth Glinigol yw sicrhau ein bod yn cael cyngor dibynadwy sy'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth glinigol a threialon, i sicrhau y caiff meddygon teulu eu harwain wrth ragnodi cyffuriau.

9:15 a.m.

**Rôl PFI yn y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol**  
**The Role of PFI in the National Health Service**

**Q3 Pauline Jarman:** Will the Minister make a brief statement on the role of the private finance initiative in the national health service? (OAQ14969)

**Jane Hutt:** The principles for using private finance initiative in the public sector in Wales, including the NHS, will be as the Minister for Finance, Local Government and Communities stated in her recent statement on investment through partnerships. That is, all such arrangements should be governed by the public interest in the quality of public services; the relationship with the private sector should be based on partnerships that improve services, rather than arrangements to access finance only; employees' interests should at least be maintained; and the partnerships between those working together to serve the public should be enhanced rather than diminished.

**Pauline Jarman:** In making a case for direct funding for the Porthmadog and Llwynypia hospitals, did you have to prove to the Minister for Finance that public funding provides better value for money and employment protection than PFI ever could?

**Jane Hutt:** Labour's manifesto showed a clear commitment to building new hospitals in Wales. The second Rhondda hospital was the most advanced hospital project. We are providing public funding for this because, as Labour came to power, I determined that we would increase the public capital programme, which was at zero when we came into office.

**Peter Black:** Can you indicate how the Assembly's capital programme is likely to grow for the NHS so that the use of PFI can be avoided if at all possible in the future?

**Jane Hutt:** The capital programme is increasing and we have recently announced a £45 million all-Wales capital renewal programme, which comes from the additional

**C3 Pauline Jarman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad byr ar rôl y fenter cyllid preifat yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol? (OAQ14969)

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd yr egwyddorion ar gyfer defnyddio menter cyllid preifat yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys y GIG, fel y nodwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, Llywodraeth Leol a Chymunedau yn ei datganiad diweddar ar fuddsoddiad drwy bartneriaethau. Hynny yw, dylai pob trefniad o'r fath gael ei reoli gan y lles a ddaw i'r cyhoedd o ganlyniad i ansawdd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus; dylai'r berthynas â'r sector preifat fod yn seiliedig ar bartneriaethau sy'n gwella gwasanaethau, yn hytrach na threfniadau i gael arian yn unig; dylid o leiaf diogelu buddiannau cyflogion; a dylai'r partneriaethau rhwng y rhai sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd i wasanaethau'r cyhoedd gael eu hehangu yn hytrach na'u lleihau.

**Pauline Jarman:** Wrth ddadlau o blaid ariannu uniongyrchol ar gyfer yr ysbytai ym Mhorthmadog a Llwynypia a oedd yn rhaid ichi brofi i'r Gweinidog dros Gyllid bod ariannu cyhoeddus yn rhoi gwerth am arian ac yn diogelu swyddi yn well nag y gallai PFI erioed ei wneud.

**Jane Hutt:** Dangosodd manifestô'r Blaid Lafur ymrwymiad clir i adeiladu ysbytai newydd yng Nghymru. Yr ail ysbyty yn y Rhondda oedd y prosiect ysbyty mwyaf blaengar. Yr ydym yn darparu arian cyhoeddus ar gyfer hyn oherwydd, ar ôl i Lafur ddod i rym, penderfynais y byddem yn cynyddu'r rhaglen gyfalaf cyhoeddus, a oedd ar ddim pan ddaeth Llafur i rym.

**Peter Black:** A allwch nodi sut y mae rhaglen gyfalaf y Cynulliad yn debygol o gynyddu ar gyfer y GIG fel y gellir osgoi defnyddio PFI yn y dyfodol, os yw hynny'n bosibl?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r rhaglen gyfalaf yn cynyddu ac yn ddiweddar cyhoeddwyd rhaglen adnewyddu cyfalaf o £45 miliwn i Gymru gyfan, sy'n dod o'r arian ychwanegol

funding from the Chancellor, and which the Assembly has endorsed. We recognise that we have a huge task before us in terms of the need, not only for new hospitals and replacement of equipment, but for refurbishment. We know that we must do more to increase that capital budget.

**David Melding:** The Prime Minister yesterday gave a ringing endorsement to PFI and said that it had brought many benefits to his constituency. Do you share his sentiments?

**Jane Hutt:** Private finance has enabled us to move forward with the Chepstow Community Hospital, which has already opened, and the St David's and Neath Port Talbot hospitals are on the way. We must go back to the principle outlined by the Minister for Finance, that the use of PFI must be governed by the public interest in the quality of public services. We must, as the Health and Social Services Committee has urged me to do, maximise a public capital programme.

a gawsom gan y Canghellor, y mae'r Cynulliad wedi'i chymeradwyo. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod gennym dasg enfawr o'n blaenau o ran yr angen, nid yn unig am ysbytai newydd a chyfarpar newydd, ond am adnewyddu adeiladau. Gwyddom fod yn rhaid inni wneud mwy i gynyddu'r gyllideb gyfalaf honno.

**David Melding:** Ddoe rhoddodd y Prif Weinidog gymeradwyaeth gryf i PFI a dywedodd ei fod wedi rhoi llawer o fuddiannau i'r etholaeth, A ydych yn rhannu ei deimladau?

**Jane Hutt:** Mae cyllid preifat wedi'n galluogi i symud ymlaen gydag Ysbyty Cymuned Cas-gwent, sydd eisoes wedi agor, ac mae ysbyty Dewi Sant ac ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot ar y ffordd. Rhaid inni ddychwelyd at yr egwyddor a amlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, sef y dylai'r defnydd o PFI gael ei reoli gan y lles a ddaw i'r cyhoedd o ansawdd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Rhaid inni, fel y mae'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi fy annog i wneud, sicrhau'r rhaglen gyfalaf cyhoeddus fwyaf bosibl.

### Oedi wrth Wneud Taliadau i Fferyllfeydd Delays in Payment to Pharmacies

**Q4 Peter Rogers:** Will the Minister make a statement on payment delays to pharmacies across Wales? (OAQ14997)

**Jane Hutt:** Community pharmacists, appliance contractors and dispensing doctors in Wales continue to be paid on the due dates, but because of continuing operational problems at Health Solutions Wales, these payments are based on estimates of the reimbursement due for drugs dispensed. The estimates are calculated using a formula that has been agreed with contractors' representatives. Payments are adjusted once the actual amount due is known.

**Peter Rogers:** Why is it that prescription payments are still six months behind, with another two years' worth in cold storage waiting to be priced, and the balance to be paid two or three years down the line? Is it

**C4 Peter Rogers:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr oedi cyn gwneud taliadau i fferyllfeydd ledled Cymru? (OAQ14997)

**Jane Hutt:** Mae fferyllfeydd cymunedol, contractwyr cyfarpar a meddygon sy'n dosbarthu cyffuriau yng Nghymru yn parhau i gael eu talu ar y dyddiadau priodol, ond oherwydd problemau gweithredol parhaus yn Atebion Iechyd Cymru, mae'r taliadau hyn yn seiliedig ar amcangyfrifon o'r ad-daliad sy'n ddyledus ar gyfer y cyffuriau a ddosbarthwyd. Cyfrifir yr amcangyfrifon gan ddefnyddio fformiwla y cytunwyd arni gyda chynrychiolwyr y contractwyr. Caiff taliadau eu newid pan fydd yr union swm sy'n ddyledus yn hysbys.

**Peter Rogers:** Pam mae taliadau presgripsiwn chwe mis ar ei hôl hi o hyd, a gwerth dwy flynedd arall yn aros i'w prasio, a'r balans i'w dalu ymhen dwy neu dair blynedd? Onid yw'n wir mai dim ond 10 y

not the case that only 10 per cent of the 180 prescription pricing jobs were retained over the last year because, once trained, these people are leaving the centres and moving to other jobs in south Wales? In line with the—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter, you have about three questions already.

**Peter Rogers:** I am coming to it. In line with the Government's commitment to making the Assembly work for the whole of Wales, a bold step would be to re-allocate these functions to north Wales. The character of the region's employment market makes it a better place for them, and we have high-tech positions in Bangor and St Asaph. Will you consider the possibility of moving this—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Peter, besides being out of order, your behaviour is anti-social. Someone at the end will be cut off because you have asked about 17 questions instead of two. Please do not do it again.

**Jane Hutt:** As I said in response to your tabled question, contractors are being paid estimates on the due dates and Health Solutions Wales envisages a return to normal working practices from July 2002. The underlying problems go back a long way, unfortunately, to your Government and the mid-1990s when pricing services were market tested. I assure you that contractors are involved in the discussions and the situation will return to normal. Payments based on estimates are being made on the due dates.

**Geraint Davies:** I declare an interest as a pharmacist. It is generally accepted that the NHS has not treated pharmacists well over the years. Delayed payment is just one example of that. One problem is the proposed clawback of money from pharmacists, not for having underachieved or underperformed, but for having completed more work for patients' benefit than anticipated at the beginning of the year. If she has not already done so, will the Minister urgently arrange meetings with pharmacists' representatives in Wales and use her powers to resolve this matter fairly?

cant o'r 180 o swyddi prisio presgripsiwn a gadwyd dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf oherwydd, ar ôl iddynt gael eu hyfforddi, mae'r bobl hyn yn gadael y canolfannau ac yn symud i swyddi eraill yn ne Cymru? Yn unol â'r—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peter, yr ydych wedi gofyn tua thri chwestiwn eisoes.

**Peter Rogers:** Yr wyf yn dod ato. Yn unol ag ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn gweithio dros Gymru gyfan, byddai'n gam dewr i symud y swyddogaethau i ogledd Cymru. Mae natur marchnad waith y rhanbarth yn ei wneud yn well lle ar eu cyfer, ac mae gennym safleoedd uwch dechnoleg ym Mangor a Llanelwy. A ystyriwch y posibilrwydd o symud—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Peter, ar wahân i'r ffaith eich bod allan o drefn, mae eich ymddygiad yn anghymdeithasol. Caiff amser rhywun ar y diwedd ei gwtogi am eich bod wedi gofyn tua 17 o gwestiynau yn lle dau. Peidiwch â gwneud hynny eto.

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y dywedais mewn ymateb i'r cwestiwn a gyflwynwyd gennych, telir amcangyfrifon i gontractwyr ar y dyddiadau priodol ac mae Atebion Iechyd Cymru yn rhagweld y bydd yn ailafael ym mhatrymau gwaith arferol o fis Gorffennaf 2002. Deillia'r problemau sylfaenol, yn anffodus, o gyfnod eich Llywodraeth yng nghanol y 1990au, pan gafodd gwasanaethau prisio eu profi ar y farchnad. Rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi bod contractwyr yn cymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau ac y gwelir y sefyllfa arferol eto. Gwneir taliadau sy'n seiliedig ar amcangyfrifon ar y dyddiadau priodol.

**Geraint Davies:** Datganaf fuddiant fel fferylllydd. Derbynnir yn gyffredinol nad yw'r GIG wedi trin fferyllwyr yn dda dros y blynyddoedd. Mae oedi wrth dalu yn un enghraifft yn unig o hynny. Un broblem yw'r cynnig i adfachu arian oddi wrth fferyllwyr, nid am eu bod wedi tangyflawni neu danberfformio, ond am eu bod wedi cwblhau mwy o waith er budd cleifion nag a ragwelwyd ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn. Os nad yw eisoes wedi gwneud, a wnaiff y Gweinidog drefnu cyfarfodydd ar fyrder â chynrychiolwyr fferyllwyr yng Nghymru a



defnyddio ei phwerau i ddatrys y mater hwn yn deg?

**Jane Hutt:** The contractors are involved in the recovery plan discussions to ensure that we make a full recovery by July of this year. Community Pharmacy Wales strongly supports our plan, 'Improving Health in Wales', and pharmacists are on our local health boards. As I assured Peter, payments are being made and we are examining any problems experienced by contractors who may wish to move or sell their businesses.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r contractwyr yn cymryd rhan yn y trafodaethau ar y cynllun adfer i sicrhau ein bod yn gweld y sefyllfa arferol erbyn mis Gorffennaf eleni. Mae Community Pharmacy Wales yn cefnogi ein cynllun 'Gwella Iechyd yng Nghymru' yn gryf, ac mae fferyllwyr yn aelodau o'n byrddau iechyd lleol. Fel y sicrheais Peter, mae'r taliadau yn cael eu gwneud ac yr ydym yn ymchwilio i unrhyw broblemau sydd gan contractwyr a all ddymuno symud neu werthu eu busnes.

### **Ysbyty Cymunedol Newydd yn Ninbych-y-pysgod A New Community Hospital in Tenby**

**C5 Cynog Dafis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad byr ar hynt y broses o ddarparu ysbyty cymunedol newydd yn Ninbych-y-pysgod? (OAQ14993)

**Q5 Cynog Dafis:** Will the Minister make a brief statement on progress in providing a new community hospital in Tenby? (OAQ14993)

**Jane Hutt:** The proposals for Tenby Cottage Hospital were originally part of wider proposals put forward by the Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust for integrated and interdependent services to modernise the community and related acute provisions for adults and older people in Pembrokeshire. The working group established to review community services in Tenby, Narberth and Saundersfoot concluded that the best solution was for the services provided by Tenby Cottage Hospital to be relocated to a new 10-bed purpose-built facility. A strategic outline case is now being prepared and will be submitted to the Assembly.

**Jane Hutt:** Yn wreiddiol yr oedd y cynigion ar gyfer Ysbyty Bwth Dinbych-y-pysgod yn rhan o gynigion ehangach a gyflwynwyd gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen ar gyfer gwasanaethau integredig a chyddibynnol i foderneiddio'r gymuned a darpariaethau aciwt cysylltiedig ar gyfer oedolion a phobl hŷn yn Sir Benfro. Daeth y gweithgor, a sefydlwyd i adolygu gwasanaethau cymunedol yn Ninbych-y-pysgod, Arberth a Saundersfoot, i'r casgliad mai'r ateb gorau oedd i'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan Ysbyty Bwth Dinbych-y-pysgod gael eu symud i gyfleuster 10-gwely pwrpasol newydd. Mae achos strategol amlinellol yn cael ei baratoi bellach a chaiff ei gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad.

**Cynog Dafis:** Ar 1 Tachwedd, rhoddodd yr awdurdod iechyd addewid i Gyfeillion Ysbyty Bwth Dinbych-y-pysgod y byddai hysbyseb ar gyfer datblygu ysbyty newydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi o fewn wythnos. Nid oes dim wedi digwydd ac mae'r sefyllfa erbyn hyn yn ymylu ar fod yn argyfyngus. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymyrryd yn awr i sicrhau bod y broblem ddirifol hon yn cael ei datrys?

**Cynog Dafis:** On 1 November, the health authority gave its word to the Friends of Tenby Cottage Hospital that an advertisement for the development of the new hospital would be published within a week. Nothing has happened and the situation is now verging on being critical. Will the Minister intervene now to ensure that this serious problem is resolved?

**Jane Hutt:** I met Christine Gwyther last week to discuss this issue and I have been assured that a meeting between trust officials

**Jane Hutt:** Cyfarfûm â Christine Gwyther yr wythnos diwethaf i drafod y mater hwn a chefais sicrwydd bod swyddogion o'r

and the Assembly is imminent.

ymddiriedolaeth a'r Cynulliad ar fin cyfarfod.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I urge the Minister to take a personal interest in this matter. This was approved as long ago as the summer by the health authority. There has been a dragging of feet on this. It is vital to the Tenby area, and I ask the Minister to intervene to ensure that this goes ahead with due dispatch as it is causing much local concern.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Apeliaf ar y Gweinidog i gymryd diddordeb personol yn y mater hwn. Cymeradwywyd hyn gan yr awdurdod iechyd yn ôl yn yr haf. Bu llusgo traed ar hyn. Mae'n hanfodol i ardal Dinbych-y-pysgod, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog i ymyrryd i sicrhau yr aiff hyn yn ei flaen â chyflymdra dyledus gan ei bod yn peri llawer o bryder yn lleol.

**Jane Hutt:** I have already given my assurance.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi sicrwydd ichi.

### **Lleihau Amseroedd Aros i Gleifion Mewnol mewn Ysbytai Reduction of Hospital In-patient Waiting Times**

**Q6 Janet Davies:** To what extent have the Minister's actions to reduce waiting times for hospital in-patient treatment been successful? (OAQ14972)

**C6 Janet Davies:** I ba raddau y bu camau'r Gweinidog i leihau amseroedd aros ar gyfer triniaeth i gleifion mewnol mewn ysbytai yn llwyddiannus? (OAQ14972)

**Jane Hutt:** In July, I announced a waiting times strategy, which shifted the emphasis from waiting lists to waiting times. Waiting times for cardiac and orthopaedic treatment are being reduced to achieve targets of 12 and 18 months respectively. Trusts are working to reduce the maximum wait for cataract treatment to four months and the numbers waiting are falling.

**Jane Hutt:** Ym mis Gorffennaf, cyhoeddais strategaeth amseroedd aros, a symudodd y pwyslais o restrau aros i amseroedd aros. Mae amseroedd aros ar gyfer triniaeth ar y galon a thriniaeth orthopedig yn cael eu lleihau i gyrraedd targedau o 12 ac 18 mis. Mae'r ymddiriedolaethau yn gweithio i leihau'r amser aros mwyaf ar gyfer triniaeth cataract i bedwar mis ac mae'r niferoedd sy'n aros yn gostwng.

**Janet Davies:** That is the theory; it may be different in practice. Given that it is forecast that many staff may leave after the 2003 restructuring, to what extent will you avoid being even less successful in future?

**Janet Davies:** Dyna'r theori; efallai ei bod yn wahanol yn ymarferol. O ystyried y rhagwelir y bydd llawer o staff yn gadael ar ôl ailstrwythuro 2003, i ba raddau y byddwch yn osgoi bod hyd yn oed yn llai llwyddiannus yn y dyfodol?

**Jane Hutt:** I have no forecasts of staff leaving next year. I have reports of staff being fully engaged, not only in delivering the waiting times strategy but also in our local health boards.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid oes gennyf ragolygon o'r staff yn gadael y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae gennyf adroddiadau am staff sy'n gwbl ymrwymedig, nid yn unig i gyflwyno'r strategaeth amseroedd aros ond hefyd yn ein byrddau iechyd lleol.

**David Davies:** Minister, you paint a rosy picture, but you must know that the number of Welsh residents waiting for a first out-patient appointment has increased from 182,000 to over 204,000. Do you agree that that is totally unacceptable and are you prepared to take responsibility for this

**David Davies:** Weinidog, yr ydych yn rhoi darlun gwych o'r sefyllfa, ond rhaid eich bod yn gwybod bod nifer y bobl yng Nghymru sy'n aros am eu hapwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol wedi cynyddu o 182,000 i dros 204,000. A gytunwch fod hynny'n gwbl annerbyniol ac a ydych yn barod i

growing crisis in the NHS in Wales?

ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros yr argyfwng cynyddol hwn yn y GIG yng Nghymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Last week, I secured an extra £31 million for health authorities. That demonstrates responsibility, as does the extra £1 million for ambulance services. I have also ensured that our waiting times strategy has been established. It is being led and monitored vigorously by my deputy, Dr Brian Gibbons. We are reducing the long waiting times, as I have described.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, sicrhais £31 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer yr awdurdodau iechyd. Mae hynny yn dangos cyfrifoldeb, fel ag y mae'r £1 filiwn ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau ambiwlans. Yr wyf hefyd wedi sicrhau bod ein strategaeth amseroedd aros wedi'i sefydlu. Caiff ei harwain a'i monitro yn drylwyr gan fy nirprwy, Dr Brian Gibbons. Yr ydym yn lleihau'r amseroedd aros hir, fel yr wyf wedi disgrifio.

9:25 a.m.

### **Y Rhaglen Ail Frechu yn Rhondda Cynon Taff The Revaccination Programme in Rhondda Cynon Taff**

**Q7 Jocelyn Davies:** How is the revaccination programme proceeding in the Rhondda Cynon Taff area? (OAQ14995)

**C7 Jocelyn Davies:** Sut y mae'r rhaglen ail frechu yn mynd rhagddi yn ardal Rhondda Cynon Taff? (OAQ14995)

**Jane Hutt:** Pupils attending Porth County Comprehensive School were offered the vaccination booster programme on 17 and 18 December. The programme for all other children commenced on 8 January and it is planned that all children will have been offered the booster doses by 17 February.

**Jane Hutt:** Cynigiwyd rhaglen brechu cyfnerthol i ddisgyblion sy'n mynychu Ysgol Gyfun Sirol y Porth ar 17 ac 18 Rhagfyr. Dechreuodd y rhaglen ar gyfer plant eraill ar 8 Ionawr a bwriedir y bydd pob plentyn wedi cael cynnig y dosau cyfnerthol erbyn 17 Chwefror.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Will you hold an official inquiry into the cause of the contamination, and make the results public?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A wnewch chi gynnal ymchwiliad swyddogol i achos yr heintio, a chyhoeddi'r canlyniadau?

**Jane Hutt:** An investigation was carried out when it was discovered that the antibody response to the vaccine in children in that area was less than that in other areas, in that we had two instances of meningitis last year. That investigation was undertaken in collaboration with local and national experts. Levels of protection in children in Taff Ely are not as high as in children in other areas. That is why the booster campaign is taking place. It will secure protection for our children. We are continuing to examine the cause of the low level of protection.

**Jane Hutt:** Cynhaliwyd ymchwiliad pan ganfuwyd bod yr ymateb gwrthgyrff i'r frechlyn mewn plant yn yr ardal honno yn llai nag yr oedd mewn ardaloedd eraill, yn yr ystyr y cawsom ddau achos o lid yr ymennydd y llynedd. Cynhaliwyd yr ymchwiliad hwnnw ar y cyd ag arbenigwyr lleol a chenedlaethol. Nid yw'r lefel o amddiffyniad ymysg plant yn Nhaf Elái gyfuch ag ymysg plant mewn ardaloedd eraill. Dyna pam bod yr ymgyrch brechu cyfnerthol yn digwydd. Bydd yn sicrhau bod ein plant yn cael eu hamddiffyn. Byddwn yn parhau i ymchwilio i'r rheswm dros y lefel isel o amddiffyn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** It is thought that the original vaccine did not work because it was stored at the wrong temperature. Can you

**Jonathan Morgan:** Credir nad oedd y brechlyn gwreiddiol yn gweithio oherwydd iddo gael ei storio ar y tymheredd anghywir.

assure us that that will not occur again?

A allwch ein sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd eto?

**Jane Hutt:** Clearly, it is important that we learn lessons from the investigation, not just for Rhondda Cynon Taff, but for the rest of the UK. The importance of how the vaccine is stored, at what temperature it is stored, of the investigation and the action we have taken, has been shared widely and that has been welcomed.

**Jane Hutt:** Yn amlwg, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn dysgu gwersi o'r ymchwiliad, nid ar gyfer Rhondda Cynon Taf yn unig, ond ar gyfer gweddill y DU. Mae pwysigrwydd y modd y dylid storio'r brechlyn, ar ba dymheredd y dylid ei storio, pwysigrwydd yr ymchwiliad a'r camau a gymerwyd gennym, wedi eu rhannu'n eang a chroesawyd hynny.

### Swyddi Ymgynghorwyr sy'n Wag Vacancies for Hospital Consultants

**Q8 Janet Davies:** How many vacancies exist for hospital consultants in each hospital authority? (OAQ14970)

**C8 Janet Davies:** Faint o swyddi ymgynghorwyr ysbytai sy'n wag ym mhob awdurdod ysbyty? (OAQ14970)

**Jane Hutt:** At September 2001, national health service trusts in Wales reported 108.5 consultant vacancies of three months' duration. This represents 6.5 per cent of the total number of consultant posts in NHS Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** Ym mis Medi 2001, cofnododd ymddiriedolaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru bod 108.5 o swyddi ymgynghorwyr a fu'n wag ers tri mis. Cynrychiola hyn 6.5 y cant o gyfanswm y swyddi ymgynghorwyr yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

**Janet Davies:** Although you have said that you are not aware of forecasts of staff leaving, the Audit Committee's report, which was published yesterday, stated that it is likely to happen. Can you give an estimate of how many vacancies for hospital consultants might exist in 2003?

**Janet Davies:** Er y dywedasoeh nad ydych yn ymwybodol o'r rhagolygon o nifer y staff sy'n gadael, dywedwyd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio, a gyhoeddwyd ddoe, ei bod yn debygol o ddigwydd. A allwch roi amcangyfrif o faint o swyddi gwag a allai fod ar gyfer ymgynghorwyr ysbyty yn 2003?

**Jane Hutt:** I recognise that we need to respond to and consider the Audit Committee's report carefully. However, the important fact is that we are increasing the number of appointments of consultants in Wales. Yesterday, I visited a hospital in north-west Wales which appointed 30 new consultants last year. We are moving forward, not just in terms of consultants, but in terms of our workforce plans, which were discussed in Committee, to recruit and, importantly, retain staff in the NHS in Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod angen inni ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio a'i ystyried yn ofalus. Fodd bynnag, y ffaith bwysig yw ein bod yn cynyddu'r nifer o ymgynghorwyr a benodir yng Nghymru. Ddoe, ymwelais ag ysbyty yng ngogledd-orllewin Cymru a benododd 30 o ymgynghorwyr newydd y llynedd. Yr ydym yn symud ymlaen, nid yn unig o ran ymgynghorwyr, ond hefyd o ran cynlluniau ar gyfer ein gweithlu, a drafodwyd yn y Pwyllgor, er mwyn recriwtio ac, yn bwysicach, er mwyn cadw staff yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

**William Graham:** Do you agree that if you were to address the problems outlined by Mr Mintowt Czyz and Dr Tayton, orthopaedic consultants at the Royal Gwent Hospital who condemned the way patients waiting for

**William Graham:** A ydych yn cytuno, pe baech yn ymdrin â'r problemau a amlinellwyd gan Mr Mintowt Czyz a Dr Tayton, sy'n ymgynghorwyr orthopedig yn Ysbyty Brenhinol Gwent a gondemniodd y

surgery were treated, you would increase the appeal of Welsh hospitals for consultants?

**Jane Hutt:** As you know, I have a target to reduce the number of people waiting for over 18 months for orthopaedic operations by next July. That target is embraced by the whole of the NHS. I believe that we will achieve it, thanks to the increased appointments of orthopaedic consultants across Wales, including in Mr Mintowt Czyz's area. I meet him regularly and hear from him and other consultants on this issue. It is key that we improve on, not only the appointment of consultants, but operating capacity and the support teams and primary care backing, to tackle our orthopaedic needs in Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Assembly Members and consultants have this in common: we should both work full time but some of us do some moonlighting. Do you think that both of us should devote 100 per cent of our time to our taxpayer-funded duties?

**Jane Hutt:** I expect NHS staff in Wales to be dedicated and I believe that that is so.

modd y cafodd cleifion a oedd yn aros am lawdriniaeth eu trin, y byddech yn cynyddu apêl ysbytai Cymru i ymgynghorwyr?

**Jane Hutt:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennyf darged i leihau'r nifer o bobl a fu'n aros ers 18 mis i gael llawdriniaethau orthopedig erbyn mis Gorffennaf nesaf. Croesewir y targed hwnnw gan y GIG cyfan. Credaf y byddwn yn ei gyflawni, diolch i'r nifer uwch o ymgynghorwyr orthopedig a benodwyd ar hyd a lled Cymru, gan gynnwys rhai yn ardal Mr Mintowt Czyz. Yr wyf yn ei gyfarfod yn rheolaidd ac yn clywed ganddo, ac ymgynghorwyr eraill, am y mater hwn. Mae'n allweddol ein bod yn gwella, nid yn unig y broses o benodi ymgynghorwyr, ond hefyd y capasiti llawdriniaeth a'r timau cymorth a chefnogaeth gofal sylfaenol, er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag anghenion orthopedig yng Nghymru.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac ymgynghorwyr hyn yn gyffredin: dylem fel ein gilydd weithio'n llawn amser ond mae rhai ohonom yn gweithio rhywfaint liw nos. A gredwch y dylem oll ymroi 100 y cant o'n hamser i'r dyletswyddau a ariennir gan y trethdalwyr?

**Jane Hutt:** Disgwyliaf i aelodau staff y GIG yng Nghymru fod yn ymroddedig a chredaf eu bod.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning**

### **Sefydlu Ysgol Gymunedol Newydd Establishing a New Community School**

**Q1 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on Torfaen County Borough Council's plan to establish a new community school? (OAQ14920)

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** Decisions on school provision are a local authority responsibility. I met with the leader of Torfaen County Borough Council on 18 December. He assured me that the council regards this project as its number-one priority. I welcome Torfaen County Borough Council's commitment to press ahead with

**C1 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar gynllun Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen i sefydlu ysgol gymuned newydd? (OAQ14920)

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw penderfyniadau ar ddarparu ysgolion. Cyfarfum ag arweinydd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen ar 18 Rhagfyr. Fe'm sicrhodd bod y cyngor yn ystyried mai'r prosiect hwn yw ei brif flaenoriaeth. Croesawaf ymrwymiad Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Tor-faen i fwrw ymlaen â'r

the project.

**Jocelyn Davies:** These proposals are highly controversial, but you say that you are content to leave them to the local authority. Where do you stand on this matter and, as Minister, do you not have a duty to play a prominent role in the negotiations and the decision?

**Jane Davidson:** If you understood legislation as I thought you did, you would know that the responsibility of developing schools in a given area falls to the relevant local authority. I remain committed to providing around £2 million of additional capital funding for this project provided that it is innovative, builds on the achievements of the two schools that it replaces, takes account of the local community's wishes, and is financially viable.

**Lynne Neagle:** I welcome your acknowledgement that the council is still committed to the school project. Although I welcome the involvement of the Confederation of British Industry in a partnership, do you agree that it is manifestly unreasonable for the CBI to want control of the governing body of a proposed community school for a contribution of £2 million out of the £12 million needed—a large proportion of which is to be paid for by local taxpayers? There is still a great deal of goodwill in the community towards the school, but do you recognise that there are also concerns and that this issue is significantly more complex than some Ams, who have come late to this debate, have recognised?

**Jane Davidson:** It is important to make two points. First, I have met with all partners in this project on many occasions to consider its development. I made it clear, when I met the CBI, that I was not looking to change the framework of governance in Wales and that any replacement school in Torfaen would have to conform with our community-maintained schools regulations. That has always been the Assembly's position.

Secondly, there has been a great deal of misinformation about how much this project will cost and where the money will come

prosiect.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae'r cynigion hyn yn hynod ddadleuol, ond dywedwch eich bod yn fodlon eu gadael i'r awdurdod lleol. Beth yw eich safbwynt ar y mater hwn ac, fel Gweinidog, onid oes gennych ddyletswydd i chwarae rhan flaenllaw yn y trafodaethau a'r penderfyniad?

**Jane Davidson:** Pe byddech yn deall deddfwriaeth fel y tybiwn eich bod, gwyddech mai cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdod lleol perthnasol yw datblygu ysgolion mewn ardal benodol. Yr wyf yn parhau yn ymrwymedig i ddarparu tua £2 filiwn o arian cyfalaf ychwanegol ar gyfer y prosiect hwn cyn belled â'i fod yn flaengar, yn adeiladu ar gyflawniadau'r ddwy ysgol y mae'n eu disodli, yn ystyried dymuniadau'r gymuned leol, ac yn ymarferol yn ariannol.

**Lynne Neagle:** Croesawaf eich cydnabyddiaeth bod y cyngor yn dal yn ymrwymedig i'r prosiect ysgolion. Er fy mod yn croesawu cyfranogiad Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain mewn partneriaeth, a gytunwch ei bod yn gwbl afresymol bod y CBI am reoli bwrdd llywodraethol ysgol gymunedol arfaethedig am gyfraniad o £2 filiwn allan o'r £12 miliwn sydd ei angen—y bydd cyfran fawr ohono yn cael ei dalu gan drethdalwyr lleol? Mae cryn ewyllys da yn y gymuned o hyd tuag at yr ysgol, ond a gydnabyddwch fod pryderon hefyd a bod y mater hwn yn llawer mwy cymhleth nag y mae rhai Aelodau'r Cynulliad, a ymunodd â'r ddadl hon yn hwyr, yn ei sylweddoli?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'n bwysig gwneud dau bwynt. Yn gyntaf, cyfarfum â'r holl bartneriaid yn y prosiect hwn ar sawl achlysur er mwyn ystyried ei ddatblygiad. Eglurais, pan gyfarfum â'r CBI, nad oeddwn yn bwriadu newid y fframwaith llywodraethu yng Nghymru ac y byddai'n rhaid i unrhyw ysgol newydd yn Nhor-faen gydymffurfio â'n rheoliadau sy'n ymwneud ag ysgolion a gynhelir gan y gymuned. Hynny fu safbwynt y Cynulliad o'r cychwyn.

Yn ail, bu cryn dipyn o wybodaeth anghywir ynglŷn â faint y bydd y prosiect hwn yn ei gostio ac o ble y daw'r arian ar ei gyfer. Yr

from. The only money that has been on the table for this project is the £2 million that the Assembly offered to put in place to encourage private sector matching and the £3 million that Torfaen County Borough Council was prepared to provide in its capital allocations over a couple of years. No other money has been forthcoming. Therefore, there has been a great deal of misinformation on this project. We now need to get back to the basis that local authorities determine the needs issues in their local areas, taking account of all those issues that I mentioned earlier.

Following meetings that I have had with Ams, Paul Murphy and all the other partners, I am pleased that this local authority remains committed to an innovative project that will offer a range of provision beyond traditional school provision. I hope that we will be able to move forward. I also hope that the CBI will consider working with the Welsh Local Government Association to consider ways in which we can develop the right public-private partnerships in Wales. We have always maintained that the private sector should not be running our schools in Wales.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Lynne started this by asking three or four questions. You should only ask one, but I will allow two. I also appeal for shorter replies from the Minister. We need to reach question six if possible.

**William Graham:** Do you agree that this has been a dreadful wasted opportunity? The Gateshead model has been an outstanding success. That would have done wonders for Torfaen, why is it not proceeding?

**Jane Davidson:** Perhaps you did not listen to my previous answer.

**Michael German:** Can you confirm that the proposal that was on the table and that originally involved the CBI was neither for a selective or a faith school? Can you also confirm that if a proposal met with local education authority support elsewhere in Wales, as a matter of principle, we would

unig arian a fu ar y bwrdd ar gyfer y prosiect hwn fu'r £2 filiwn a gynigiodd y Cynulliad ei roi ar waith er mwyn annog arian cyfatebol gan y sector preifat a'r £3 miliwn yr oedd Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Torfaen yn barod i'w ddarparu yn ei ddyraniadau cyfalaf dros ddwy flynedd. Ni chafwyd unrhyw arian arall. Felly, bu cryn dipyn o wybodaeth anghywir am y prosiect hwn. Mae angen i ni ddychwelyd yn awr at y sail mai awdurdodau lleol sy'n penderfynu ar faterion angen yn eu hardaloedd lleol, gan ystyried pob un o'r materion hynny y soniais amdanynt yn gynharach.

Yn dilyn cyfarfodydd a gefais gydag Aelodau'r Cynulliad, Paul Murphy a phob un o'r partneriaid eraill, yr wyf yn falch bod yr awdurdod lleol hwn yn dal yn ymrwymedig i brosiect blaengar a fydd yn cynnig amrywiaeth o ddarpariaethau sydd y tu hwnt i'r ddarpariaeth draddodiadol gan ysgolion. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu symud ymlaen. Gobeithiaf hefyd y bydd y CBI yn ystyried gweithio gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru er mwyn ystyried ffyrdd y gallwn ddatblygu'r partneriaethau cyhoeddus-preifat cywir yng Nghymru. Dywedasom o'r cychwyn nad y sector preifat ddylai fod yn rhedeg ein hysgolion yng Nghymru.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cychwynnwyd hyn gan Lynne pan ofynnodd dri neu bedwar cwestiwn. Dim ond un cwestiwn y dylech ei ofyn, ond caniataf ddau. Apeliaf hefyd am atebion byrrach gan y Gweinidog. Mae angen i ni gyrraedd cwestiwn chwech os oes modd.

**William Graham:** A gytunwch y bu hwn yn gyfle a wastraffwyd yn ddychrynlyd? Bu model Gateshead yn llwyddiant ysgubol. Byddai hynny wedi gwneud gwyrthiau i Dorfaen, pam nad yw'n mynd yn ei flaen?

**Jane Davidson:** Efallai na wrandawsoch ar fy ateb blaenorol.

**Michael German:** A allwch gadarnhau nad oedd y cynnig a oedd gerbron ac a oedd yn wreiddiol yn cynnwys y CBI naill ai ar gyfer ysgol ddethol nag ysgol ffydd? A allwch gadarnhau hefyd pe byddai cynnig yn derbyn cefnogaeth awdurdod addysg lleol mewn rhan arall o Gymru, y byddem, fel mater o

encourage that sort of involvement?

**Jane Davidson:** Yes, I confirm both. We do not support faith-based schools or selection. That position has been clearly stated—

**Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** I know that the Conservatives support them, but that does not count in terms of the people of Wales's support. I can confirm that we are interested in innovations, particularly in terms of looking beyond the maintained school model, and considering ways in which schools can play a greater part in their communities.

9:35 a.m.

### **Defnyddio TGCh Mewn Addysg Anghenion Arbennig The Use of ICT in Special Needs Education**

**Q2 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of information and communications technology in special needs education? (OAQ14901) [R]

I declare an interest as the chair of the governing body of Meadowbank Special School.

**Jane Davidson:** ICT can play an important part in the education of children with special educational needs. As part of its ICT for Learning programme, the Welsh Assembly Government has committed £500,000 specifically for pupils with SEN. Where a child's individual needs require specific ICT provision, this is recorded in the child's statement of SEN.

**David Melding:** Some new technology has excellent applications in terms of special needs education, and I refer in particular to whiteboard technology that is now being used across Wales. Will you ensure that we aim to put one whiteboard in each classroom in special needs education as soon as possible?

**Jane Davidson:** As part of the £18.4 million broadband funding package announced by

egwyddor, yn annog y math hwnnw o gyfranogiad?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwnaf, cadarnhaf y naill a'r llall. Ni chefnogwn ysgolion ffydd nag ysgolion dethol. Nodwyd y safbwynt hynny yn eglur—

**Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Gwn fod y Ceidwadwyr yn eu cefnogi, ond nid yw hynny'n cyfrif o ran cefnogaeth pobl Cymru. Cadarnhaf fod gennym ddiddordeb mewn mentrau newydd, yn arbennig o ran edrych y tu hwnt i'r model ysgolion a gynhelir, ac ystyried ffyrdd y gall ysgolion chwarae rhan amlycach yn eu cymunedau.

**C2 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar ddefnyddio technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu mewn addysg anghenion arbennig? (OAQ14901) [R]

Datganaf fuddiant fel cadeirydd corff llywodraethol Ysgol Arbennig Meadowbank.

**Jane Davidson:** Gall TGCh chwarae rhan bwysig wrth addysgu plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Fel rhan o'i rhaglen TGCh ar gyfer Dysgu, ymrwymodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru £500,000 yn benodol ar gyfer disgyblion ag AAA. Pan mae anghenion unigol plentyn yn gofyn am ddarpariaeth TGCh benodol, cofnodir hyn yn natganiad AAA y plentyn.

**David Melding:** Mae gan rywfaint o dechnoleg newydd gymwysiadau rhagorol o ran addysg anghenion arbennig, a chyfeiriau yn benodol at dechnoleg bwrdd gwyn a ddefnyddir bellach ar hyd a lled Cymru. A wnewch sicrhau ein bod yn anelu at roi un bwrdd gwyn ym mhob ystafell ddosbarth addysg anghenion arbennig cyn gynted â phosibl?

**Jane Davidson:** Fel rhan o'r pecyn ariannu band llydan gwerth £18.4 miliwn a



the First Minister, £9.9 million was for putting interactive whiteboards, data projectors and multi-media computers in every school in Wales by March 2002. That includes special schools. We are starting the programme by ensuring that there is one set of equipment in each primary school and at least three sets of equipment in each secondary school. There is substantial extra funding. Sixteen million pounds was allocated for ICT for Learning, and the £30 million in grants for education support and training, with another £8 million allocated for next year, will demonstrate the Assembly's commitment to continuing to ensure that we have the right ICT facilities in schools. We also have a taskforce, which is considering this issue, and we will ensure that we seek proper advice about what equipment is needed in our schools.

**Owen John Thomas:** Datganaf fuddiant fel athro cofrestredig.

Will you join me, Minister, in deploring Cardiff City and County Council's actions in seeking to drastically reduce the numbers of children eligible for special needs education?

**Jane Davidson:** If you read the Assembly's policy on special needs education, it is clear that our focus is on inclusion. Therefore, wherever children can be included in mainstream education, we would strongly support that. We also want to be clear that some children are better served by being educated in a special needs environment. Where parents make that choice and where that choice is right in terms of education, the child should be supported in a specific special needs environment. There is a level of balance regarding this issue. The special educational needs code of practice, published before Christmas, makes the rights of parents and children clearer than they have been in the past.

gyhoeddwyd gan Brif Weinidog Cymru, dyrannwyd £9.9 miliwn ohono ar gyfer rhoi byrddau gwyn rhyngweithiol, taflunwyr data a chyfrifiaduron aml-gyfrwng ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru erbyn Mawrth 2002. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ysgolion arbennig. Yr ydym yn cychwyn y rhaglen drwy sicrhau bod o leiaf un set o offer ym mhob ysgol gynradd a thair set o offer ym mhob ysgol uwchradd. Ceir arian ychwanegol sylweddol. Dyrannwyd un deg chwe miliwn o bunnoedd ar gyfer TGCh ar gyfer Dysgu, a bydd y £30 miliwn mewn grantiau ar gyfer cymorth addysg a hyfforddiant, gydag £8 miliwn arall wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, yn dangos ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i barhau i sicrhau bod gennym y cyfleusterau TGCh cywir mewn ysgolion. Mae gennym dasglu hefyd, sy'n ystyried y mater hwn, a byddwn yn sicrhau ein bod yn cael y cyngor cywir o ran pa offer sydd ei angen yn ein hysgolion.

**Owen John Thomas:** I declare an interest as a registered teacher.

A ymunwch â mi, Weinidog, i resynnu ar gamau Cyngor Dinas a Sir Caerdydd i geisio lleihau niferoedd y plant sy'n gymwys ar gyfer addysg anghenion arbennig yn sylweddol?

**Jane Davidson:** Os darllenwch bolisi'r Cynulliad ar addysg anghenion arbennig, mae'n amlwg bod ein ffocws ar gynhwysiant. Felly, lle bynnag y gellir cynnwys plant mewn addysg prif-ffrwd, byddem yn cefnogi hynny'n frwd. Yr ydym hefyd am fod yn eglur ynglŷn â'r ffaith y gwasanaethir rhai plant yn well drwy gael eu haddysgu mewn amgylchedd anghenion arbennig. Pan fo rhieni yn gwneud y dewis hwnnw a phan fo'r dewis yn iawn o ran addysg, dylid cefnogi'r plentyn mewn amgylchedd anghenion arbennig penodol. Mae lefel o gydbwysedd ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Mae'r cod ymarfer anghenion addysgol arbennig, a gyhoeddwyd cyn y Nadolig, yn gwneud hawliau rhieni a phlant yn fwy eglur nag y buont yn y gorffennol.

### **Rheoli Tâl yn Seiliedig ar Berfformiad i Athrawon** **The Management of Performance-Related Pay for Teachers**

**C3 Cynog Dafis:** Pa arweiniad sydd wedi'i roi'n ddiweddar i ysgolion ynghylch rheoli

**Q3 Cynog Dafis:** What recent guidance has been issued to schools in relation to the

tâl yn seiliedig ar berfformiad i athrawon? (OAQ15011)

**Jane Davidson:** Nid yw tâl ac amodau gwasanaeth athrawon yn faterion a ddatganolwyd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cyhoeddodd yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau ganllawiau i gyrff llywodraethu, penaethiaid ysgolion a gynhelir ac awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru a Lloegr ym Medi 2001. Yr oedd y canllawiau hyn yn cynnwys crynodeb diwygiedig o'r tâl ac amodau gwasanaeth stadudol ar gyfer athrawon mewn ysgolion a gynhelir yng Nghymru a Lloegr.

**Cynog Dafis:** O ran yr agwedd ariannol, sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r pryder ymysg prifathrawon ynghylch gallu ysgolion i gyllido'r codiadau cyflog sy'n codi o'r system hon? A yw'n derbyn y byddai'n annerbyniol pe bai penderfyniadau ar groesi'r trothwy tâl a symud ymlaen wedi hynny yn cael eu cymryd yn ôl gallu'r ysgol unigol i dalu am hynny? Beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud i ddatrys y broblem ariannol ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa hon?

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly has already guaranteed that the full threshold costs from 2000 to 2002, where they exceed what local authorities had to pay out, will be met by the Assembly. Before the end of this financial year, we will debate a special grant report on the £5.3 million or so that reflects the additional costs needed for 2000-01. The decisions on the second part of the threshold costs are being made at present. Headteachers have been evaluating this since December 2001. We will receive a similar grant report in 2002-03, looking at 2001-02.

**Jonathan Morgan:** According to a recent survey of the teaching profession's views on performance-related pay, 80 per cent felt that it caused resentment, 80 per cent felt that it increased the bureaucratic burden, and 90 per cent felt that it was divisive. Do you agree with the views of the teaching profession and teaching unions, who feel that this scheme has been the greatest source of unhappiness for many years?

management of performance-related pay for teachers? (OAQ15011)

**Jane Davidson:** Teachers' pay and conditions of service are not devolved to the National Assembly. The Department for Education and Skills issued guidelines to governing bodies, heads of maintained schools and local education authorities in England and Wales in September 2001. These guidelines included a revised summary of the statutory pay and conditions of employment of teachers in maintained schools in England and Wales.

**Cynog Dafis:** Regarding the financial aspect, how does the Minister respond to the concern among headteachers regarding the ability of schools to fund the pay increases brought about by this system? Does she accept that it would be unacceptable if decisions on crossing the pay threshold and further career progression were taken in light of the individual school's ability to pay for that? What does she intend to do to solve the financial problem arising from this?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r Cynulliad eisoes wedi gwarantu y bydd y Cynulliad yn talu'r costau trothwy llawn rhwng 2000 a 2002, lle y maent yn mynd y tu hwnt i'r hyn y bu'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ei dalu. Cyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon, byddwn yn cynnal dadl ar adroddiad grant arbennig ar y £5.3 miliwn, fwy neu lai, sy'n adlewyrchu'r costau ychwanegol sydd eu hangen ar gyfer 2000-01. Gwneir y penderfyniadau ar ail ran y costau trothwy ar hyn o bryd. Bu prifathrawon yn gwerthuso hyn ers Rhagfyr 2001. Byddwn yn derbyn adroddiad grant tebyg yn 2002-03, a fydd yn edrych ar 2001-02.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yn ôl arolwg diweddar o sylwadau'r proffesiwn addysgu ar dâl yn seiliedig ar berfformiad, teimlai 80 y cant ei fod yn achosi drwgdeimlad, teimlai 80 y cant ei fod yn cynyddu'r baich biwrocraidd, a theimlai 90 y cant ei fod yn achosi rhwygiadau. A gytunwch â sylwadau'r proffesiwn a'r undebau addysgu, sy'n teimlo mai'r cynllun hwn a achosodd yr anfodlonwydd mwyaf ers blynyddoedd?

**Jane Davidson:** The Assembly has always expressed its concern about the delivery of performance-related pay. As Minister I ensure that as many people as possible get access to the upper pay spine. I was pleased to see that some 94 per cent of those who applied for the upper pay spine were eligible. This is a tribute to the quality of our teaching profession. We now need to ensure, as I said to Cynog, that we have special grant reports so that money goes to local authorities to reflect any gap between the initial settlement and the actual cost of threshold payments for the first two years following their introduction.

**Karen Sinclair:** I have recently been alerted to problems about supply teachers and their inability to meet the criteria for threshold payments, even though some of them work full time. Will you consider this problem? I have written to you this week to highlight the concerns. Will you take it away and consider it?

**Jane Davidson:** I am happy to consider it. However, I must respond that this whole issue is, of course, the responsibility of the Department for Education and Skills, therefore, I do not have an immediate answer for you.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r Cynulliad wedi mynegi ei bryder ynghylch cyflwyno tâl yn seiliedig ar berfformiad o'r cychwyn. Fel Gweinidog yr wyf yn sicrhau bod cymaint o bobl â phosibl yn cael mynediad i'r haen tâl uwch. Yr oeddwn yn falch o weld bod tua 94 y cant o'r rhai a wnaeth gais i'r haen tâl uwch yn gymwys. Mae hyn yn deyrnged i ansawdd ein proffesiwn addysgu. Mae angen i ni sicrhau yn awr, fel y dywedais wrth Cynog, ein bod yn cael adroddiadau grant arbennig fel bod yr arian yn mynd i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn adlewyrchu unrhyw fwch rhwng y setliad cychwynol a chost wirioneddol y taliadau trothwy ar gyfer y ddwy flynedd gyntaf ar ôl eu cyflwyno.

**Karen Sinclair:** Tynnwyd fy sylw yn ddiweddar at broblemau ynglŷn ag athrawon cyflenwi a'r ffaith nad ydynt yn gallu bodloni'r meini prawf ar gyfer taliadau trothwy, er bod rhai ohonynt yn gweithio'n llawn amser. A wnewch ystyried y broblem hon? Ysgrifennais atoch yr wythnos hon er mwyn amlygu'r pryderon. A wnewch chi ei hystyried?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr wyf yn fodlon ei hystyried. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid i mi ateb mai cyfrifoldeb yr Adran Addysg a Sgiliau yw'r mater hwn, wrth gwrs, felly nid oes gennyf ateb i chi ar unwaith.

#### **Atebolrwydd Estyn Accountability of Estyn**

**C4 Gareth Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y camau y bwriada eu cymryd i wneud Estyn yn fwy atebol? (OAQ15007)

**Jane Davidson:** Mae Estyn eisoes yn hollol atebol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Pryd bynnag y bo angen cymryd camau i gryfhau effeithiolrwydd Estyn—ac yn enwedig i ddiwallu angen y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad ehangach am wybodaeth a chyngor ddiuedd—fe'u cymeraf. Mae'r gofynion ar gyfer gwelliant parhaus yn berthnasol fel ag y maent i bob corff sector cyhoeddus arall, ac yr wyf yn parhau i adolygu'r mater yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

**Gareth Jones:** I ba raddau yr ydych yn hapus

**Q4 Gareth Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the steps she intends to take to improve the accountability of Estyn? (OAQ15007)

**Jane Davidson:** Estyn is already fully accountable to the National Assembly. Whenever action is needed to enhance Estyn's effectiveness—not least to serve the Government's and the wider Assembly's needs for impartial information and advice—I take it. The requirements for continuous improvement apply as for every other public sector body and I keep the matter under review in that context.

**Gareth Jones:** To what extent are you happy

gyda'r trosiant staff uchel yn Estyn? Er enghraifft, mae naw o arolygwyr Ei Mawrhydi wedi gadael Estyn yn ddiweddar, gan gynnwys un o'r rheolwyr hŷn a benodwyd yn ddiweddar. A oes tebygrwydd y caiff dyfarniad Buddsoddwr mewn Pobl ei dynnu oddi ar Estyn oherwydd anhafuswydd cyffredinol staff ar bob lefel?

**Jane Davidson:** We are talking about a large organisation; a committed set of inspectors, who have an important role to play in the delivery of Welsh education. Estyn works in a policy framework set by the Assembly, which ensures that its work complements the Government's 'The Learning Country'. It has been awarded Investor in People status and it is working towards the European quality standards in business excellence models for continuous improvement. All of this underlines the inspectorate's ongoing commitment to meeting national and internationally recognised standards for management and quality assurance. It also appears before the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, therefore, there is always a chance to ask representatives of Estyn about these issues.

**Eleanor Burnham:** What are the processes, Minister, for replacing the outgoing chief inspector of Estyn?

**Jane Davidson:** That is probably the wrong question, because we are not talking about replacing the outgoing chief inspector. I provided an update on this matter in my report to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. I say that because Susan Lewis was appointed for five years with a contractual possibility of reappointment. Therefore, there is no vacancy at the moment. There is a contractual obligation to consider performance, which an independent panel has done. It will then make recommendations to the Secretary of State and myself before those recommendations are sent to the Privy Council.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I call Peter Rogers. Just one question please.

with the high staff turnover at Estyn? For example, nine of Her Majesty's inspectors have left Estyn recently, including one of the senior managers who was recently appointed. Is it likely that Estyn will be stripped of the Investor in People award due to the general dissatisfaction of staff at all levels?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydym yn sôn am sefydliad mawr; grŵp o arolygwyr ymroddedig, sydd â rhan bwysig i'w chwarae wrth gyflwyno addysg yng Nghymru. Mae Estyn yn gweithio o fewn fframwaith polisi a nodwyd gan y Cynulliad, sy'n sicrhau bod ei waith yn ategu agenda'r Llywodraeth, 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu'. Dyfarnwyd teitl Buddsoddwr mewn Pobl iddo ac mae'n gweithio tuag at safonau ansawdd Ewropeaidd mewn modelau rhagoriaeth busnes ar gyfer gwelliant parhaus. Tanlinella hyn i gyd ymrwymiad parhaus yr arolygiaeth i gwrdd â safonau a gydnabyddir yn genedlaethol a rhyngwladol ar gyfer rheoli a sicrwydd ansawdd. Mae hefyd yn ymddangos gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgol Gydol Oes, ac felly, mae cyfle bob amser i holi cynrychiolwyr Estyn am y materion hyn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Beth yw'r prosesau, Weinidog, ar gyfer penodi prif arolygydd newydd Estyn?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw fwy na thebyg yn anghywir, gan nad ydym yn sôn am benodi rhywun yn lle'r prif arolygydd sy'n ymadael. Rhoddais y newyddion diweddaraf ynghylch y mater hwn yn fy adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Dywedaf hynny oherwydd bod Susan Lewis wedi'i phenodi am bum mlynedd gyda phosibilrwydd cytundebol o'i ail-benodi. Felly, nid oes swydd wag ar hyn o bryd. Mae dyletswydd cytundebol i ystyried perfformiad, a gwnaethpwyd hyn gan banel annibynnol. Bydd wedyn yn gwneud argymhellion i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a minnau cyn yr anfonir yr argymhellion hynny i'r Cyfrin Gyngor.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Galwaf ar Peter Rogers. Un cwestiwn yn unig, os gwelwch yn dda.

9:45 a.m.

**Peter Rogers:** Is it not the case that Estyn tends to respond to what the Assembly is doing, and that we should concentrate on accountability here? Should we not also be supportive of the excellent work that Estyn does in helping us to raise standards across Wales?

**Jane Davidson:** That is a helpful question, as I continue to regard it as essential that we base our policy on impartial and unprejudiced evidence. It is also important that Estyn works within a policy framework that can complement the development of the Government's 'The Learning Country' agenda. I set the annual remit, the chief inspector appears before the Subject Committee regularly, and the Learning and Skills Act 2000 requires that she prepare an annual plan. Therefore, we have many accountability measures in place, none of which compromise Estyn's independence. It is important that we have the right framework to allow dialogue without compromising independence. We must have a solid evidence base for the delivery of education in Wales.

**Peter Rogers:** Onid yw'n wir bod Estyn yn tueddu i ymateb i'r hyn a wna'r Cynulliad, ac y dylem ganolbwyntio ar atebolrwydd yma? Oni ddylem hefyd gefnogi'r gwaith rhagorol a wneir gan Estyn wrth ein helpu i godi safonau ar hyd a lled Cymru?

**Jane Davidson:** Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn defnyddiol, gan fy mod yn parhau i ystyried ei bod yn hanfodol ein bod yn seilio ein polisi ar dystiolaeth ddiuedd a diragfarn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig bod Estyn yn gweithio o fewn fframwaith polisi a all ategu datblygu agenda 'Y Wlad sy'n Dysgu' y Llywodraeth. Gosodaf y cylch gorchwyl blynyddol, ymddengys y prif arolygydd gerbron y Pwyllgor Pwnc yn rheolaidd, ac mae Deddf Dysgu a Sgiliau 2000 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddi baratoi cynllun blynyddol. Felly, mae gennym sawl mesur atebolrwydd ar waith, ac nid yw'r un ohonynt yn cyfaddawdu annibynniaeth Estyn. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym y fframwaith cywir i alluogi deialog heb gyfaddawdu annibynniaeth. Rhaid i ni gael sail gadarn o ran tystiolaeth ar gyfer cyflwyno addysg yng Nghymru.

### **Y Taliadau Trothwy ar gyfer Athrawon Teacher Threshold Payments**

**Q5 Brian Gibbons:** Will the Minister make a statement in relation to the uptake of teacher threshold payments in Wales? (OAQ14910)

**Jane Davidson:** Teachers who have been successful in the threshold assessment in round 1 must be moved onto the upper pay scale, backdated to 1 September 2000. Local education authorities and schools are responsible for ensuring that the requirements of pay legislation are met. The Welsh Assembly Government gave a commitment to fully fund the effects of teachers' threshold pay arrangements in 2000-01 and 2001-02. Local education authorities have been asked to provide information on the final financial position in respect of teachers passing the threshold with effect from September 2000, and we are considering the responses at the moment.

**C5 Brian Gibbons:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch nifer yr athrawon sydd wedi manteisio ar y taliadau trothwy yng Nghymru? (OAQ14910)

**Jane Davidson:** Rhaid symud athrawon a fu'n llwyddiannus yn yr asesiad trothwy yn y rownd gyntaf i'r gyfradd tâl uwch, wedi'i ôl-ddyddio i 1 Medi 2000. Awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion sy'n gyfrifol am sicrhau bod gofynion y ddeddfwriaeth tâl yn cael eu diwallu. Ymrwymodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ariannu effeithiau trefniadau tâl trothwy athrawon yn llawn yn 2000-01 a 2001-02. Gofynnwyd i awdurdodau addysg lleol ddarparu gwybodaeth am y sefyllfa ariannol derfynol mewn perthynas â'r athrawon sy'n mynd dros y trothwy o fis Medi 2000 ymlaen, ac yr ydym yn ystyried yr ymatebion ar hyn o bryd.

**Brian Gibbons:** You indicated in your reply to Cynog earlier that over 90 per cent of eligible teachers have proceeded to the higher threshold payment, and that the Labour-led administration in Wales is willing to fund this number, which is above expectations. Do you believe that this is clear evidence of our commitment to rewarding the continuing high professional standards among teachers?

**Jane Davidson:** Yes. Although the Assembly expressed concerns about the introduction of performance related pay, 14,284 teachers went through the process in round 1, and 97 per cent of those were successful. We know that those who did not succeed, or who did not apply in round 1, have done so for round 2. It gives us a good basis for saying that we have a superb teaching profession in Wales, and that therefore we should look at rewarding teachers appropriately. We are putting much more money into education, and we will continue to work closely with the teaching profession in the interests of teachers and children.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** While I accept that you have made it clear that you will fund these payments, do you accept that that will be done in arrears? For the first year at least, local authorities will have to fund that £5 million themselves. That money will have to come from other services. Given that you now know that almost 100 per cent of teachers succeed in achieving these payments, why can you not pay local authorities up front?

**Jane Davidson:** Over the last two years, the Assembly has given local authorities good settlements. The settlement announced by Edwina Hart on Tuesday gives local authorities an increase of more than 8 per cent. If you take out the specific grants and transfers in and out, it is an additional 6.7 per cent, which is way above inflation. We are funding individuals, and therefore we have asked local authorities to give us the information so that they are paid the sum over and above their obligation. It seems to me to be a fair system. As we are funding this

**Brian Gibbons:** Dywedasoeh yn eich ateb i Cynog yn gynharach bod dros 90 y cant o athrawon cymwys wedi mynd ymlaen i'r tâl trothwy uwch, a bod y weinyddiaeth yng Nghymru a arweinir gan Lafur yn barod i ariannu'r nifer hon, sydd y tu hwnt i ddisgwyliadau. A gredwch bod hyn yn dystiolaeth eglur o'n hymrwymiad i wobrwyo safonau proffesiynol uchel parhaus ymysg athrawon?

**Jane Davidson:** Gwnaf. Er i'r Cynulliad fynegi pryderon ynghylch cyflwyno tâl yn seiliedig ar berfformiad, aeth 14,284 o athrawon drwy'r broses yn y rownd gyntaf, a bu 97 y cant ohonynt yn llwyddiannus. Gwyddom fod y rhai na fu'n llwyddiannus, neu'r rhai na wnaethant gais yn y rownd gyntaf, wedi gwneud hynny ar gyfer yr ail rownd. Rhydd hynny sail dda i ni ddweud bod gennym athrawon rhagorol yng Nghymru, ac felly dylem ystyried gwobrwyo athrawon yn briodol. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi llawer mwy o arian mewn addysg, a byddwn yn parhau i weithio'n agos gyda'r proffesiwn addysgu er budd athrawon a phlant.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Er y derbynaf i chi egluro y byddwch yn ariannu'r taliadau hyn, a dderbyniwch y gwneir hynny drwy gyfrwng ôl-daliadau? Ar gyfer y flwyddyn gyntaf o leiaf, bydd yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ariannu o leiaf £5 miliwn eu hunain. Bydd yn rhaid i'r arian hwnnw ddod o wasanaethau eraill. O gofio eich bod yn gwybod yn awr bod bron i 100 y cant o athrawon yn llwyddo i gael y taliadau hyn, pan na allwch dalu awdurdodau lleol o flaen llaw?

**Jane Davidson:** Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, rhoddodd y Cynulliad setliadau da i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r setliad a gyhoeddwyd gan Edwina Hart ddydd Mawrth yn rhoi cynnydd o fwy nag 8 y cant i awdurdodau lleol. Pe byddech yn hepgor y grantiau penodol a'r troglwyddiadau i mewn ac allan, mae hynny'n 6.7 y cant ychwanegol, sydd ymhell uwchlaw chwyddiant. Yr ydym yn ariannu unigolion, ac felly gofynasom i awdurdodau lleol roi'r wybodaeth i ni fel y telir swm iddynt sydd y tu hwnt i'r hyn sydd yn ddyledus idynt. Ymddengys i mi ei bod yn

in full, the WLGA has expressed no concerns, as it also believes it to be a fair system in terms of ensuring that local authorities are properly paid for delivering Assembly policy.

**David Davies:** Under this Labour-led administration, with its lackeys in the WLGA, more and more teachers are going to work abroad or leaving the profession altogether. Is that not clear evidence that it is high time that we got rid of these over-publicised gimmicks, such as threshold payments, and started paying teachers a decent living wage?

**Jane Davidson:** We have had to go a long way to address the deficit of the previous Conservative Government in paying teachers a living wage. I speak as one among the droves of teachers who left the profession because of the Conservative Government's attitude to public services and the teaching profession. We are now in major repair mode.

system deg. Gan ein bod yn ariannu hyn yn llawn, ni fynegodd CLILC unrhyw bryderon, gan ei bod hithau hefyd yn credu ei bod yn system deg o ran sicrhau y telir awdurdodau lleol yn briodol am gyflwyno polisi'r Cynulliad.

**David Davies:** O dan y weinyddiaeth hon a arweinir gan Lafur, gyda'i gweision bach yn CLILC, mae nifer gynyddol o athrawon yn mynd i weithio dramor neu'n gadael y proffesiwn yn gyfangwbl. Onid yw hynny'n dystiolaeth eglur ei bod yn hen bryd i ni gael gwared â'r gimics hyn a orhysbysebwyd, megis taliadau trothwy, a dechrau talu cyflog byw teg i athrawon?

**Jane Davidson:** Bu'n rhaid i ni fynd ymhell i fynd i'r afael â diffyg y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol o ran talu cyflog byw i athrawon. Siaradaf fel un a oedd ymysg haid o athrawon a adawodd y proffesiwn oherwydd agwedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol tuag at wasanaethau cyhoeddus a'r proffesiwn addysgu. Yr ydym yn awr wrthi'n gwneud gwaith atgyweirio pwysig.

### **Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Questions 1 (OAQ14928), 2 (OAQ14926), 3 (OAQ14927) and 4 (OAQ15019) have been transferred for written answer.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd Cwestiwn 1 (OAQ14928), 2 (OAQ14926), 3 (OAQ14927) a 4 (OAQ15019) ar gyfer ateb ysgrifenedig.

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Nick Bourne:** Point of order. This relates to the conduct of business in the Assembly, particularly the conduct of the Government's business, by this Labour-led administration. At the start of question time this morning, Jane Hutt was left to hang in the wind on her own. Who is in charge of Government business when no Cabinet members are present other than the Minister who is answering questions? In addition, it seems a great discourtesy to the Assembly when no Cabinet members are present.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Members of the Cabinet have heard your comments, Nick.

**Nick Bourne:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â chynnal busnes yn y Cynulliad, yn arbennig o ran cynnal busnes y Llywodraeth, gan y weinyddiaeth hon a arweinir gan Lafur. Ar ddechrau amser cwestiynau y bore yma, gadawyd Jane Hutt i sefyll yn y bwlch ar ei phen ei hun. Pwy sydd yng ngofal busnes y Llywodraeth pan nad oes aelodau'r Cabinet yn bresennol ar wahân i'r Gweinidog sy'n ateb cwestiynau? At hynny, ymddengys yn anghwrtais iawn i'r Cynulliad pan nad yw aelodau'r Cabinet yn bresennol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae aelodau'r Cabinet wedi clywed eich sylwadau, Nick.

The Presiding Officer ruled on 1 November that he would not comment on a particular Plenary session. I will follow that advice. He also said that protocols encourage all Members to be present in the Chamber whenever possible.

**Geraint Davies:** Point of order. I raise this under Standing Order No. 6.3. Earlier this morning, I asked a question to the Minister for Health and Social Services on the important issue of clawback of money from pharmacists. Unfortunately, the Minister made no attempt to answer that question. I would like a ruling on this unsatisfactory situation.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Ministers are entirely responsible for their answers. If you are dissatisfied with a particular answer, there are various ways in which you can continue to pursue the topic in the Chamber.

**Gareth Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Mae hwn yn ymwneud â'r amser y glynwn ato. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai'r ddealltwriaeth a'r drefn oedd y caniateir tri munud ar gyfer pob cwestiwn. Credaf i dua chwe munud gael ei ganiatáu ar gyfer y cwestiwn cyntaf heddiw. Yr oedd yn sicr yn bum munud da. A oes trefn ar gyfer hyn? Mae hyn yn bwysig, oherwydd mae Aelodau sy'n isel ar y rhestr o'r rhai sydd am siarad angen paratoi ymlaen llaw.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I always try to ensure that we go through enough questions. We went through eight questions during the first 15 minutes and five during the following 15 minutes. Time is allocated according to my judgment, and I judged that there was interest in the Chamber on the first question. That is why I allowed a little more time for it.

Penderfynodd y Llywydd ar 1 Tachwedd na fyddai'n gwneud sylwadau ar Gyfarfod Llawn penodol. Dilynaf y cyngor hwnnw. Dywedodd hefyd bod protocolau yn annog pob Aelod i fod yn bresennol yn y Siambr lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl.

**Geraint Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Codaf hyn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.3. Yn gynharach y bore yma, gofynnais gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am fater pwysig sef adfer arian gan fferyllwyr. Yn anffodus, ni wnaeth y Gweinidog unrhyw ymdrech i ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw. Hoffwn gael penderfyniad ar y sefyllfa anfoddfa hon.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae'r Gweinidogion yn llwyr gyfrifol am eu hatebion. Os ydych yn anfodlon ag ateb arbennig, mae amryw o ffyrdd y gallwch barhau i fynd ar drywydd y pwnc yn y Siambr.

**Gareth Jones:** Point of order. This relates to the timetable to which we adhere. I thought that the understanding and the system was that three minutes were allowed for each question. I believe that about six minutes were allowed for the first question today. It was certainly a good five minutes. Is there a protocol in place? This is important, as those Members who are towards the bottom of the list of those wanting to speak need time to prepare beforehand.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ceisiaf bob amser sicrhau ein bod yn mynd trwy ddigon o gwestiynau. Aethom drwy wyth cwestiwn yn ystod y 15 munud cyntaf a thrwy bum cwestiwn yn ystod y 15 munud dilynol. Dyrennir amser yn ôl fy nyfarniad i, a dyfernais fod diddordeb yn y Siambr ynghylch y cwestiwn cyntaf. Dyna pam y caniateais ychydig mwy o amser iddo.

### **Llywodraethu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd Governance of the European Union**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jonathan Morgan, and amendments 4, 5, 6 and 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jonathan Morgan, a gwelliannau 4, 5, 6 a 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.



**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Cynigiau fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol:

3. yn croesawu Papur Gwyn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ar lywodraethu;

2. yn cymeradwyo'r datganiad o egwyddorion sy'n rhoi arweiniad ar lywodraethu da yng nghyd-destun yr UE;

3. yn croesawu'r ddadl ehangach ar lywodraethu da yng Nghymru a ledled Ewrop sy'n deillio o'r Papur Gwyn. (NDM919)

Mae hwn yn gyfle hollbwysig i'r Cynulliad gyfrannu at y ddadl ledled yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ar y materion hyn. Gobeithiaf y bydd y ddadl yn denu cyfraniadau meddylgar o bob cornel o'r Siamb. Byddai hynny'n cryfhau'r ddadl ledled Ewrop ar y Papur Gwyn ar lywodraethu. Dechreuwyd y broses hon gan lywydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, Romano Prodi, yng Ngorffennaf 2001. Yn ystod ymweliad y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol â Brwsel ar 5 Rhagfyr, treuliasom lawer o amser yn trafod y Papur Gwyn. Cawsom drafodaeth hir a dwfn gyda Jérôme Vignon, prif swyddog y tîm llywodraethu a apwyntiwyd gan Romano Prodi.

9:55 a.m.

Mae'n bwysig i bawb sylweddoli bod hollt ar hyn o bryd rhwng sefydliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a phobl Ewrop—300 miliwn o ddinasyddion yr aelod-wladwriaethau. Felly, rhaid inni gynnal dadl ar sut y gellir lleihau'r hollt honno rhwng 'nhw' a 'ni' a geir ym mhob gwlad a chyfundrefn lywodraethol. Y cwestiwn yw sut y bydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, sydd yn dioddef yn arbennig o ganlyniad i'r broblem honno, yn llywodraethu ei hun ar ein rhan yn y dyfodol.

Yr oedd y Comisiwn yn ddoeth i estyn allan i bob math o sefydliad a phob rhan o Ewrop, a chefnogi cynnal dadl ar draws Ewrop ynglŷn â natur a siâp yr undeb. Y cwestiwn mawr yw pa fath o undeb yr ydym am ei weld. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn trafod y mater y bore yma i weld a allwn ddod o hyd i gonsensws ar ymateb y Cynulliad i'r ymgynghoriad, sydd

**The First Minister:** I propose that

the National Assembly:

1. welcomes the European Commission White Paper on governance;

2. approves the statement of principles guiding good governance in the EU context;

3. welcomes the wider debate on good governance in Wales and across Europe arising from the White Paper. (NDM919)

This is a crucial opportunity for the Assembly to contribute to the Europe-wide debate on these issues. I hope that the debate will attract meaningful contributions from all corners of the Chamber. That would contribute to the Europe-wide debate on the White Paper on governance. That process was initiated by the president of the European Commission, Romano Prodi, in July 2001. During the Committee on European and External Affairs's visit to Brussels on 5 December, we discussed the White Paper at length. We had a long and in-depth discussion with Jérôme Vignon, the chief officer of the governance team appointed by Romano Prodi.

It is important for everyone to realise that there is currently a rift between the institutions of the European Union and the people of Europe—the 300 million citizens of the member states. Therefore, we must hold a debate on how we can begin to heal that rift between 'us' and 'them' that exists in every country and governmental system. The question is how the European Union, which is suffering in particular due to that problem, will govern itself on our behalf in the future.

The Commission was wise to reach out to all sorts of institutions and to every part of Europe, and to support holding a debate across Europe on the nature and shape of the union. The big question is what kind of union do we wish to see. It is important that we discuss this issue this morning to see whether we can reach a consensus on the Assembly's

yn dod i ben ar ddiwedd Mawrth. Po fwyaf o gonsensws a geir ar yr ymateb y byddaf yn ei gyflwyno ar ran y Cynulliad, po gryfaf y bydd ein sylwadau, a pho fwyaf o sylw y bydd y comisiwn yn ei gymryd ohonynt.

I will outline some of my thoughts on the White Paper and mention some of the things that we have been doing to stimulate the debate across Wales. It may be useful for Members who are not members of the Committee on European and External Affairs, and therefore maybe less familiar with this topic, if I summarise some of the White Paper's main points.

The White Paper identifies five basic principles of good governance. They are not rocket science; they are openness, participation, accountability, effectiveness and coherence. If one can adhere to those, whether in Assembly, British Government, United Nations or European Union matters, everybody would be much happier about government and less cynical, perhaps, about the institutions that govern them.

Therefore, it is not about enlargement, the euro or the Laeken process, which is a separate issue. That is a two-year process running from the Laeken summit last month until the next treaty revision, which will follow lengthy discussion of the Laeken summit principles and the establishment of the Laeken convention. The governance White Paper is not about that and, therefore, it is important to keep those issues separate.

The basic principle that Romano Prodi tried to enunciate was that the European Union needs to move away from a diplomatic process where governments talk to each other, meetings are arranged, telephone calls run across Europe from one chancellery to another and deals are fixed. Fifteen prime ministers, foreign ministers or education ministers are then rounded together. Although, occasionally, an Assembly Minister might be one of those 15, only 15 people fix things around a table in such a diplomatic process. The EU must move to a democratic process a bit more like the

response to the consultation, which concludes at the end of March. The more consensus we can find on the response that I will present on behalf of the Assembly, the stronger our comments will be, and the more notice the commission will take of them.

Amlinellaf rai o'm sylwadau ar y Papur Gwyn a soniaf am rai o'r pethau a wnaethom i ysgogi'r ddadl ledled Cymru. Efallai y byddai'n ddefnyddiol pe bawn yn crynhoi rhai o brif bwyntiau'r Papur Gwyn i'r Aelodau nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, ac felly sy'n llai cyfarwydd efallai â'r pwnc hwn.

Noda'r Papur Gwyn bum egwyddor sylfaenol llywodraeth dda. Nid ydynt yn gymhleth; y pump yw natur agored, cyfranogiad, atebolrwydd, effeithiolrwydd a chydlyniaeth. Os gall rhywun lynu wrth y rheini, boed ym materion y Cynulliad, y Llywodraeth Brydeinig, y Cenhedloedd Unedig neu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, byddai pawb yn hapusach o lawer ynglŷn â llywodraeth ac yn llai sinigaidd, efallai, ynglŷn â'r sefydliadau sy'n eu rheoli.

Felly, nid yw'n ymwneud ag ehangu, yr ewro na phroses Laeken, sy'n fater ar wahân. Mae hynny'n broses ddwy flynedd a ddechreuodd gydag uwchgynhadledd Laeken fis diwethaf ac sy'n para tan ddiwygiad nesaf y cytundeb, a fydd yn dilyn trafodaeth hirfaith o egwyddorion uwchgynhadledd Laeken a sefydlu confensiwn Laeken. Nid yw'r Papur Gwyn ar lywodraethu yn ymwneud â hynny ac, felly, mae'n bwysig cadw'r materion hynny ar wahân.

Yr egwyddor sylfaenol yr oedd Romano Prodi wedi ceisio ei datgan oedd bod angen i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd symud i ffwrdd oddi wrth broses ddiplomyddol lle mae llywodraethau yn siarad â'i gilydd, bod cyfarfodydd yn cael eu trefnu, bod galwadau ffôn ledled Ewrop o un llys canghellor i'r llall a chytundebau yn cael eu trefnu. Yna deuir â 15 o brif weinidogion, gweinidogion tramor neu weinidogion addysg at ei gilydd. Er y gall un Aelod Cynulliad, yn achlysurol, fod ymhlith y 15 hwnnw, dim ond 15 o bobl sydd yn trefnu pethau o amgylch y bwrdd mewn proses ddiplomyddol o'r fath. Rhaid

Assembly or the processes of British, French or German governments, with which the citizens of those countries, and Wales, are more familiar. It must be an inclusive process that involves the citizenry.

**Brian Hancock:** You mentioned the Laeken summit. Interestingly, I tabled an oral question on that issue earlier this week, but we did not reach it in Plenary. Since you mention it and we are discussing the future governance of the EU, what steps have you taken to ensure that the Assembly's voice will be heard? Will you ensure that the Assembly will be represented in those discussions?

**The First Minister:** My purpose in mentioning the word 'Laeken' was to say that today's discussion is not about that. Obviously, the significance of the word 'not' has escaped you. Perhaps you could devote yourself to thinking that there will be plenty of opportunities to discuss Wales's contribution to the Laeken process, but not today.

Let us clarify some of the ideas that have emerged from the White Paper process that are relevant to Wales. The White Paper is encouraging about the positive role that can be played by local and regional authorities. We in Wales do not call ourselves a region; we call ourselves a small nation within a larger member state. However, we operate at the regional tier, so we are a regional authority. The European Commission wants the local and regional authorities to make a greater contribution than before because it believes that that will bring in the grass root citizenry of Europe. We applaud that. It also wants a code of conduct to state how the regions and the local authorities should be brought in.

The idea of tripartite agreements is also presented, although it is at a preliminary level. Instead of having a trans-Europe directive on everything, sometimes a directive will not be appropriate because the

i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd symud tuag at broses ddemocrataidd ychydig yn debycach i'r Cynulliad, neu i brosesau llywodraethau Prydain, Ffrainc neu'r Almaen, y mae dinasyddion y gwledydd hynny, a Chymru, yn fwy cyfarwydd â hwy. Rhaid iddi fod yn broses gynhwysol sy'n cynnwys y dinasyddion.

**Brian Hancock:** Bu ichi sôn am uwchgynhadledd Laeken. Yn ddi-ddorol, cyflwynais gwestiwn llafar ar y mater hwnnw yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, ond ni fu inni ei gyrraedd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Gan ichi sôn amdano a chan ein bod yn trafod llywodraethu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn y dyfodol, pa gamau a gymerwyd gennych i sicrhau y caiff llais y Cynulliad ei glywed? A sicrhewch y caiff y Cynulliad ei gynrychioli yn y trafodaethau hynny?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Fy nod wrth grybwyll y gair 'Laeken' oedd dweud nad yw trafodaeth heddiw yn ymwneud â hynny. Yn amlwg, nid yw arwyddocâd y gair 'nid' wedi tynnu'ch sylw. Efallai y gallech ymroi i feddwl y bydd digon o gyfle i drafod cyfraniad Cymru i broses Laeken, ond nid heddiw.

Gadewch inni egluro rai o'r syniadau a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn sgîl proses y Papur Gwyn sy'n berthnasol i Gymru. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn galonogol ynglŷn â'r rôl gadarnhaol y gall awdurdodau lleol a rhanbarthol ei chwarae. Nid ydym ni yng Nghymru yn galw ein hunain yn rhanbarth; galwn ein hunain yn genedl fach o fewn aelod-wladwriaeth fwy o faint. Fodd bynnag, gweithredwn ar yr haen ranbarthol, felly yr ydym yn awdurdod rhanbarthol. Mae'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd am i'r awdurdodau lleol a rhanbarthol wneud mwy o gyfraniad nag o'r blaen oherwydd cred y bydd hynny'n ffordd o gyflwyno dinasyddion gwerin gwlad Ewrop. Cymeradwywn hynny. Mae hefyd am gael cod ymddygiad i nodi'r modd y dylid cyflwyno'r rhanbarthau a'r awdurdodau lleol.

Cyflwynir y syniad o gytundebau teiran hefyd, er ei fod ar lefel ragarweiniol. Yn lle cael cyfarwyddeb draws-Ewropeaidd ar bopeth, ni fydd cyfarwyddeb yn briodol weithiau oherwydd bydd y sefyllfa mewn

situation in some parts of Europe will be so special that it will be better not to have a directive, it will be better to have a tripartite agreement—namely, Europe, the member state and the region involved. There is nothing more than that here. It is terribly preliminary but it is an interesting idea. When there will be meat on the bones of it, we will be interested to respond.

The commission wants to enhance the role of the Committee of the Regions. We would welcome that. We believe that the Committee of the Regions has not been as strong a body as was originally envisaged in the Maastricht treaty, when it was included as a counterweight to the treaty's centralising tendencies. The aim was to try to strengthen the regional voice because of the more central model proposed in Maastricht with more powers for Europe. It should have been a counterbalance but it has not worked in the way intended. They now want to try to do something about that. We normally discuss these matters through the Committee on European and External Affairs, which is an interesting Committee; the party leaders are all members and we generally operate with cross-party consensus. I hope that we can operate in that way today. There is a strong need for consensus on this issue. We can also operate through the Conference of Peripheral and Maritime Regions of Europe, because it also contributed to the Committee's meeting on 5 December 2001 in Brussels.

This is not just about this Assembly making its mind up as a body of 60 politicians. We want to involve a much wider family of people in Wales before we formulate a Welsh view, which will be well before the 30 March deadline. That is why we are organising the European forum on governance, which will take place in Llandudno on 15 February. I am very pleased that a distinguished retired diplomat from Wales, Sir John Gray—who is Welsh, despite his years in the Foreign Office—has agreed to chair the session. Invitations are being sent to a wide range of representatives from Welsh civil society and political life.

The most important aspect of this issue is not about replacing the UK as an EU member

rhai mannau yn Ewrop mor arbennig fel y bydd yn well peidio â chael cyfarwyddeb, bydd yn well cael cytundeb teiran—sef, Ewrop, yr aelod-wladwriaeth a'r rhanbarth dan sylw. Nid oes dim yn fwy na hynny yma. Mae'n rhagarweiniol iawn ond mae'n syniad diddorol. Pan fydd cnawd ar ei esgyrn, bydd diddordeb gennym mewn ymateb.

Mae'r comisiwn am ymestyn rôl Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Byddem yn croesawu hynny. Credwn na fu Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yn gorff mor gryf â'r hyn a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol yng nghytundeb Maastricht, pan gafodd ei gynnwys fel gwrthbws i dueddiadau canoli'r cytundeb. Y nod oedd ceisio cryfhau'r llais rhanbarthol oherwydd y model mwy canolog a gynigiwyd ym Maastricht gyda mwy o bwerau i Ewrop. Dylai fod wedi bod yn wrthbws ond nid yw wedi gweithio yn y ffordd y'i bwriadwyd. Yn awr, maent am geisio gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch. Fel arfer, trafodwn y materion hyn drwy'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol, sydd yn Bwyllgor diddorol; mae pob un o arweinwyr y pleidiau yn aelodau ohono ac, yn gyffredinol, gweithredwn drwy gonsensws trawsbleidiol. Gobeithiaf y gallwn weithredu yn y modd hwnnw heddiw. Mae gwir angen consensws ar y mater hwn. Gallwn hefyd weithredu drwy'r Gynhadledd ar Ranbarthau Ymylol a Morol Ewrop, oherwydd cyfranodd hefyd at gyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar 5 Rhagfyr 2001 ym Mrwsel.

Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â'r Cynulliad yn dod i benderfyniad fel corff o 60 o wleidyddion yn unig. Yr ydym am gynnwys teulu o bobl ehangach o lawer yng Nghymru cyn inni lunio barn Gymreig, a fydd ymhell cyn y dyddiad cau, sef 30 Mawrth. Dyna pam ein bod yn trefnu fforwm Ewrop ar lywodraethu, a gynhelir yn Llandudno ar 15 Chwefror. Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod diplomydd enwog o Gymru sydd wedi ymddeol, Syr John Gray—sydd yn Gymro, er gwaethaf ei flynyddoedd yn y Swyddfa Dramor—wedi cytuno i gadeirio'r sesiwn. Anfonir gwahoddiadau at ystod eang o gynrychiolwyr o sefydliadau sifil a'r byd gwleidyddol yng Nghymru.

Nid disodli'r DU fel un o aelod-wladwriaethau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yw'r

state, it is about trying to promote—while accepting that the UK is the member state; Plaid Cymru will have different views on that—a family within the European family, because we do not want to supplant the member state. What is the function of the regional tier? That is the key issue for us.

I call on the Assembly to reject all the amendments. I do not believe that it is proper to engage in the business of saying ‘welcomes’ and ‘notes’. I do not see the point of that. How we conduct this debate is more important than amendment-it is. Many of these amendments do not concern the subject under discussion today. I do not know why Members feel it necessary to table them. I hope that the sentiments that are expressed during the debate, and in the subsequent debate, are a consensus that support the provisions of our response to the citizenship and governance debate that Romano Prodi has recommended. This is not about Laeken. Therefore amendment 4 is not relevant. It is not about integration or the enlargement process, Jonathan. It is far too early to begin discussion on the pilot schemes on contractual agreements. We have not really seen what they will be. On the Flanders declaration, we have no objection to it, but it is not relevant to today’s debate. That is more relevant to the Laeken process.

Finally on Jocelyn’s amendment 7, which says ‘agrees that Wales’s voice in the European Union will be enhanced when the National Assembly acquires primary legislative powers’, I do not know with whom you think you are agreeing, because your party cannot agree within in its own boundaries as to whether you are in favour of devolution or independence. I do not know who you think you will be putting forward here to agree or disagree, and with what—I would like to know. You cannot make your minds up about independence or devolution. The partnership Government is setting up a commission that will look at that issue. It is simply not relevant.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jonathan Morgan. Amendment 1: In point one, replace

agwedd bwysicaf ar y mater hwn, ond ceisio hyrwyddo—tra’n derbyn mai’r DU yw’r aelod-wladwriaeth; bydd gan Blaid Cymru farn wahanol ar hynny—teulu o fewn y teulu Ewropeaidd, oherwydd nid ydym am ddisodli’r aelod-wladwriaeth. Beth yw swyddogaeth yr haen ranbarthol? Dyna yw’r mater allweddol i ni.

Galwaf ar y Cynulliad i wrthod pob gwelliant. Ni chredaf ei fod yn briodol inni sôn am ‘groesawu’ a ‘nodi’. Ni welaf fod diben gwneud hynny. Mae’r modd y cynhaliwn y ddadl hon yn bwysicach na gwelliannau di-ben-draw. Nid yw llawer o’r gwelliannau hyn yn ymwneud â’r pwnc sydd o dan drafodaeth heddiw. Ni wn pam bod yr Aelodau yn teimlo bod angen eu cyflwyno. Gobeithiaf y bydd y teimladau a fynegir yn ystod y ddadl, ac yn y ddadl ddilynol, yn crynhoi’r consensws sy’n ategu darpariaethau ein hymateb i’r ddadl ar ddinasyddiaeth a llywodraethu a argymhellwyd gan Romano Prodi. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â Laeken. Felly nid yw gwelliant 4 yn berthnasol. Nid yw’n ymwneud ag integreiddio na’r broses ehangu, Jonathan. Mae’n rhy gynnar o lawer i ddechrau trafod y cynlluniau peilot a’r cytundebau contract. Nid ydym wedi gweld beth fyddant hwy mewn gwirionedd. O ran datganiad Flanders, nid oes gennym unrhyw wrthwynebiad i hynny, ond nid yw’n berthnasol i ddadl heddiw. Mae hynny’n fwy perthnasol i broses Laeken.

I gloi, ar welliant 7 Jocelyn, sydd ‘yn cytuno y bydd llais Cymru yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cael ei gryfhau pan fydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cael pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol’, ni wn pwy y credwch eich bod yn cytuno â hwy oherwydd ni all eich plaid gytuno o fewn ei ffiniau ei hun pa un a ydych o blaid datganoli neu annibyniaeth. Ni wn pwy y credwch y byddwch yn ei gynnig i gytuno neu anghytuno, a chyda beth—hoffwn wybod. Ni allwch ddod i benderfyniad am annibyniaeth na datganoli. Mae’r Llywodraeth bartneriaeth yn sefydlu comisiwn a fydd yn edrych ar y mater hwnnw. Nid yw’n berthnasol.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jonathan Morgan. Gwelliant 1: Ym mhwynt un, dileu ‘yn croesawu’ a rhoi

'welcomes' with 'notes'.

I propose amendment 2. At the end of the motion add a new point:

*calls on the Government of Wales to protect the economic and political interests of Wales during the enlargement process.*

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*opposes further EU integration.*

I welcome this debate. The First Minister was right on one point, namely that the Committee on European and External Affairs is keen that these issues should be debated. This is one of the first Government-sponsored debates—if I can express it in that way—rather than a minority party debate, that has considered the issue of Europe. I am not sure that we need two hours on this.

10:05 a.m.

We need more regular debates on European issues rather than a two-hour debate. I say that knowing that at present we have not succeeded in persuading the Minister for Business to schedule a debate on the Education Bill; I hope that he will give way on that—and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, if she is the person who is blocking it. There are also questions about whether the two minority party debates can be taken on different days because of timetabling. I would have thought that those debates could be accommodated if we can spend two hours on this topic today.

I am in favour of what was the European Community and is now the European Union and I always have been, unlike many people and some parties here. My party has always been in favour of the European Union. That does not mean that we sign up slavishly to everything it does, but it has been a force for good for people in Wales, for trading in Wales, and for farmers in Wales. Let us recognise that. I was also pleased to hear Rhodri Morgan say initially that he hoped for a consensual approach on this. That was shortly before he torpedoed all the amendments without consideration of them at

'yn nodi' yn ei le.

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i warchod buddiannau economaidd a gwleidyddol Cymru yn ystod y broses ehangu.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gwrthwynebu integreiddio pellach â'r UE.*

Croesawaf y ddadl hon. Yr oedd Prif Weinidog Cymru yn gywir ar un pwynt, sef bod y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol yn awyddus i ddadl gael ei chynnal ar y materion hyn. Hon yw un o'r dadleuon cyntaf a noddwyd gan y Llywodraeth—os gallaf ei geirio felly—yn hytrach na dadl plaid leiafrifol, sydd wedi ystyried mater Ewrop. Ni chredaf fod angen dwy awr ar gyfer hyn.

Mae angen dadleuon mwy rheolaidd ar faterion Ewropeaidd yn hytrach na dadl sy'n para dwy awr. Dywedaf hynny gan wybod na lwyddwyd ar hyn o bryd i berswadio'r Trefnydd i gynnal dadl ar y Mesur Addysg; gobeithiaf y bydd yn ildio ar hynny—a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, os mai hi yw'r person sy'n ei rwystro. Mae pa un a ellir cynnal y ddwy ddadl plaid leiafrifol ar ddyddiau gwahanol oherwydd yr amserlen yn gwestiwn sy'n codi hefyd. Buaswn wedi meddwl y gellid cynnwys y dadleuon hynny os gallwn dreulio dwy awr ar y pwnc hwn heddiw.

Yr wyf o blaid yr hyn a oedd gynt yn Gymuned Ewropeaidd sef yr Undeb Ewropeaidd erbyn hyn a bûm o blaid hynny erioed, yn wahanol i lawer o bobl a rhai pleidiau yma. Bu fy mhlaid o blaid yr Undeb Ewropeaidd erioed. Ni olyga hynny ein bod yn ymuno â phopeth a wna yn wasaidd, ond bu'n gyfrwng daioni i bobl yng Nghymu, i fasnach yng Nghymru ac i ffermwyr yng Nghymru. Gadewch inni gydnabod hynny. Yr oeddwn yn falch hefyd o glywed Rhodri Morgan yn dweud ar y cychwyn ei fod yn gobeithio y byddai consensws ar hyn. Yr oedd hynny ychydig cyn iddo danseilio'r holl

all saying 'of course we will reject all the amendments out of hand'—

**The First Minister:** The reason that I will reject the amendments is because they are not relevant to the debate. You can have consensus on a debate and reject all the amendments because they are about other debates such as Laeken, enlargement, or the euro. Stick to the subject and I believe that we can achieve consensus.

**Nick Bourne:** I am glad that you have restated your position. Your terms are that we have consensus if we all agree with you. If that is how the Assembly is being run by the administration, we begin to understand why you felt it necessary to put six Liberal Democrats in the voting arrangements here and two of them initially in the Cabinet. You cannot carry other people with you if that is your approach on consensus. However, on the amendments that you say are irrelevant, I do not know whether you have read the report, but it mentions enlargement. You cannot look at qualified majority voting in isolation from what is about to happen in Europe. We know that there is a strong possibility of 10 additional members by 2004. That is relevant in relation to qualified majority voting. There is a great deal about that in the report, as you would acknowledge. We cannot look at QMV in isolation. It is a moving picture and to use the words of a former Secretary of State for Wales, what happens in Europe 'is a process not an event.' You cannot only look at what is happening now. You must have some vision of what will happen in the future. Our concern is that QMV might not properly protect the interests of Wales. I am surprised that you cannot support an amendment that seeks to protect the interests of Wales in implementing QMV. I would have thought that was something on which we could achieve consensus. I will not withdraw that amendment because it was tabled to protect Welsh interest. It is a great shame that the Labour Party, and presumably the Liberal Democrats—the sell-out six—are unable to support this amendment.

welliannau heb eu hystyried o gwbl gan ddweud 'wrth gwrs byddwn yn gwrthod pob gwelliant ar unwaith'—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Y rheswm dros wrthod y gwelliannau yw nad ydynt yn berthnasol i'r ddadl. Gallwch gael consensws ar ddadl a gwrthod pob gwelliant gan eu bod yn ymwneud â dadleuon eraill fel Laeken, ehangu neu'r ewro. Cadwch at y pwnc a chredaf y gallwn gael consensws.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi ailddatgan eich safbwynt. Yn ôl eich telerau chi cawn consensws os bydd pob un ohonom yn cytuno â chi. Os mai dyna'r ffordd y caiff y Cynulliad ei redeg gan y weinyddiaeth, dechreuwn ddeall pam y teimlasoch fod angen rhoi chwe Democrat Rhyddfrydol yn y trefniadau pleidleisio yma a dau ohonynt ar y cychwyn yn y Cabinet. Ni allwch gario pobl eraill os mai dyna yw eich ymagwedd tuag at consensws. Fodd bynnag, ynghylch y gwelliannau sy'n amherthnasol yn eich barn chi, ni wn a ydych wedi darllen yr adroddiad, ond mae'n sôn am ehangu. Ni allwch edrych ar fater pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol ar wahân i'r hyn sydd ar fin digwydd yn Ewrop. Gwyddom fod posibilrwydd cryf y cawn 10 aelod ychwanegol erbyn 2004. Mae hynny'n berthnasol o ran pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol. Sonnir llawer am hynny yn yr adroddiad, fel y byddech yn cydnabod. Ni allwn edrych ar bleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol ar ei ben ei hun. Mae'n ddarlun symudol ac, i ddefnyddio geiriau cyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Ewrop 'yn broses ac nid yn ddigwyddiad.' Ni allwch edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn awr yn unig. Rhaid ichi gael rhywfaint o weledigaeth o'r hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol. Ein pryder ni yw na fydd pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol efallai yn diogelu buddiannau Cymru yn gywir. Synnaf na allwch gefnogi gwelliant sy'n ceisio diogelu buddiannau Cymru wrth weithredu pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol. Buaswn wedi meddwl bod hynny'n rhywbeth y gallai pob un ohonom ddod i consensws arno. Ni thynnaf y gwelliant hwnnw yn ôl oherwydd cafodd ei gyflwyno i ddiogelu buddiannau Cymru. Mae'n drueni mawr na all y Blaid Lafur, a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ôl pob tebyg—y chwech a werthodd eu

hunain—gefnogi'r gwelliant hwn.

The report is also about contractual arrangements, as outlined by the First Minister. We are happy to support contractual arrangements between regional authorities—[*Interruption.*]

Mae a wnelo'r adroddiad hefyd â threfniadau cytundebol, fel yr amlinellwyd gan Brif Weinidog Cymru. Yr ydym yn falch o gefnogi trefniadau cytundebol rhwng awdurdodau rhanbarthol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

There is a dialogue going on between certain members of the Liberal Democrats and Peter Law, which must be a first.

Mae sgwrs yn mynd rhagddi rhwng rhai o aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Peter Law. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i hyn ddigwydd mae'n siŵr.

**Peter Law:** A friendly dialogue.

**Peter Law:** Sgwrs gyfeillgar.

**Nick Bourne:** We support contractual arrangements between regional authorities, local authorities and the Commission. That can work in Wales's favour. Like the First Minister, I welcome Sir John Gray's involvement, even though as the First Minister said, he is from the Foreign Office. It was once said that the Department of Trade and Industry is there to protect trade and industry, the former Ministry of Agriculture to protect agriculture and the Foreign Office to protect foreigners. [*Interruption.*] It has been said, but I do not necessarily agree with it. Sir John Gray is an exception to that principle. In terms of enlargement of the EU and this report, we must also consider the number of MEPs that Wales will have. I mention it because we will need to return to that issue. Goodness knows if we will have another European debate in the near future because we have had to push hard for this one. The number of Welsh MEPs at present is five. Under enlargement that number will go down. We must fight our corner to ensure that we do not lose MEPs. The first to go would not be a Conservative. The first one to go, on the basis of the last election result, would be a Plaid Cymru MEP and the next to go would be a Labour MEP. It is not said therefore from any narrow party perspective. Jonathan Evans was elected third and his seat is safe. However, we have concerns about this report and we would rather note it rather than welcome it. There are aspects that need further investigation and which may not be good for Wales. However, this is part of a healthy debate. I am sorry that the First Minister did not give measured attention to the amendments. He dismissed them out of hand in a cavalier and high-handed way,

**Nick Bourne:** Cefnogwn drefniadau cytundebol rhwng awdurdodau rhanbarthol, awdurdodau lleol a'r Comisiwn. Gall hynny weithio o blaid Cymru. Fel Prif Weinidog Cymru, croesawaf y rhan a chwaraeir gan Syr John Gray, er ei fod, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, o'r Swyddfa Dramor. Dywedwyd unwaith bod yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yno i ddiogelu masnach a diwydiant, bod yr hen Weinyddiaeth Amaeth yno i ddiogelu amaethyddiaeth a'r Swyddfa Dramor yno i ddiogelu tramorwyr. [*Torri ar draws.*] Fe'i dywedwyd, ond nid wyf o reidrwydd yn cytuno â hynny. Mae Syr John Gray yn eithriad i'r egwyddor honno. O ran ehangu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a'r adroddiad hwn, rhaid inni hefyd ystyried nifer yr Aelodau Senedd Ewrop a fydd gan Gymru. Crybwyllaf hyn oherwydd bydd angen inni ddychwelyd at y mater hwnnw. Duw a wŷr a gawn ddadl arall ar Ewrop yn y dyfodol agos oherwydd bu'n rhaid inni frwydro'n galed am hon. Pump o Aelodau Cymreig sydd yn Senedd Ewrop ar hyn o bryd. Wrth ehangu, bydd y nifer honno yn gostwng. Rhaid inni ymladd ein hachos er mwyn sicrhau na chollwn Aelodau Senedd Ewrop. Nid Ceidwadwr fyddai'r cyntaf i fynd. Y cyntaf i fynd, ar sail canlyniad yr etholiad diwethaf, fyddai un o Aelodau Plaid Cymru o Senedd Ewrop a'r nesaf fyddai Aelod Llafur o Senedd Ewrop. Ni ddywedir hyn felly o unrhyw bersectif pleidiol cul. Etholwyd Jonathan Evans yn drydydd ac mae ei sedd yn ddiogel. Fodd bynnag, mae gennym bryderon ynglŷn â'r adroddiad hwn a byddai'n well gennym ei nodi yn hytrach na'i groesawu. Mae agweddau y mae angen ymchwilio iddynt ymhellach na fyddent efallai er budd Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn rhan o ddadl iach. Mae'n ddrwg



which is totally at odds with his professed wish for consensus.

gennyf na roddodd y Prif Weinidog sylw ystyriol i'r gwelliannau. Fe'u hwfftiodd yn y fan a'r lle mewn ffordd ddi-hid a thrahaus, sy'n hollol groes i'w ddymuniad honedig ei hun am gonsensws.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i bledio achos cryf y dylid cynrychioli'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y Confensiwn ar Ddyfodol Ewrop, a sefydlwyd gan uwchgynhadledd ddiweddar Laeken.*

*calls on the Government of Wales to plead a strong case for the National Assembly to be represented in the Convention on the Future of Europe, set up by the recent Laeken summit.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sicrhau bod mentrau o Gymru yn cael eu cynnwys yng nghylluniau peilot cytundebau contractiol a fydd yn cael eu lansio eleni.*

*calls on the Government of Wales to ensure that initiatives from Wales will be included in the pilot schemes of contractual agreements that will be launched this year.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i lofnodi datganiad Fflandrys, a gyhoeddwyd fis Mai diwethaf, a'r penderfyniad a fabwysiadwyd gan ail gynhadledd llywyddion y rhanbarthau sydd â phwer deddfwriaethol, a gynhaliwyd yn Liège fis Tachwedd diwethaf.*

*calls on the Government of Wales to sign the Flanders declaration, which was issued last May, and the resolution adopted by the second conference of the presidents of regions with legislative power, held in Liège last November.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn cytuno y bydd llais Cymru yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn cael ei gryfhau pan fydd y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cael pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol.*

*agrees that Wales's voice in the European Union will be enhanced when the National Assembly acquires primary legislative powers.*

Cyfeiriaf at welliant 4 y mae'r Prif Weindog eisoes wedi dweud na fydd yn ei gefnogi. Bydd aelodau eraill Plaid Cymru yn siarad ar y gwelliannau eraill yn fanylach.

I will refer to amendment 4, which the First Minister has already said he will not support. Other Plaid Cymru members will speak to the other amendments in more detail.

Dyma'r tro cyntaf inni gael trafodaeth estynedig yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth ar bwnc Ewropeaidd. Mae'n hen bryd i hynny ddigwydd, gan ein bod wedi pwyso amdani droeon. Byddem wedi dymuno cael trafodaeth estynedig ar oblygiadau cytundeb

This is the first time that an extended debate on an European issue has been held during Government time. It is about time, as we have pressed for it frequently. We would have liked an extended debate on the consequences of the Nice treaty, which was a

Nice, a oedd yn ddatblygiad pellach i gytunedau Amsterdam a Maastricht. Yr oedd y cytundeb yn un pwysig i Gymru, yn enwedig yn sgîl sefydlu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yn dilyn ein trafodaeth ar yr ewro yn ystod amser y prif wrthblaid yr wythnos diwethaf, gobeithiaf hefyd y cawn drafodaeth ar effaith yr ewro ar Gymru yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth. Mae'r ddatblygiad honno yn datblygu. Mae'n bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn derbyn ei chyfrifoldeb ac yn darparu amser ar gyfer trafod materion Ewropeaidd.

Mae cyfrifoldeb gan Lywodraeth Cymru i fynegi safbwynt y Cynulliad gerbron yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Ni ddylai siarad ar ran y Cynulliad bob tro. Mae gan y Llywodraeth, yn ogystal â'r Cynulliad, rôl i'w chwarae. Dywedodd Rhodri heddiw ei fod yn disgwyl cael consensws yn y Cynulliad, eto'i gyd dywedodd y bydd yn gwrthod y gwelliannau. Gobeithiaf nad yw hynny yn ei alluogi i ddweud mai siarad ag un llais a wnaeth y Cynulliad. Dylai Rhodri hefyd sicrhau bod llais gan y Llywodraeth. Mae'n bwysig bod pob plaid wleidyddol, hyd yn oed os ceir gwahaniaethau barn, yn gallu cyfrannu i'r broses hon ar ddyfodol Ewrop.

Derbyniaf fod nifer o ddatblygiadau wedi digwydd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad sydd wedi symud Cymru ymlaen. Agorwyd swyddfa'r Cynulliad ym Mrwsel; mae hynny'n gam ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae tipyn o ffordd i fynd eto os yw Cymru am sicrhau mwy o statws ar y llwyfan Ewropeaidd. Mae Gweinidogion y Cynulliad wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion. Hoffem weld hyn yn digwydd yn amlach ac ar ystod ehangach o bynciau. Hoffem hefyd fod Gweinidogion y Cynulliad yn cael cyfle i fwrw pleidlais heb orfod ystyried safbwynt Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Gyfunol o hyd. Ar rai faterion, fel dyfodol y farchnad ddefaid, Cymru sy'n gorfod arwain. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ystod o bynciau a drafodir gan Weinidogion y Cynulliad yn Ewrop yn rhy gyfyng.

Mae gwahaniaethau mawr yn sut y mae gwledydd bach sydd â seneddau a chynulladau, megis Cymru, yn ymateb i faterion Ewropeaidd. Mae gan Länder yr Almaen a'r rhanbarthau ffederal yng ngwlad

further development to the Amsterdam and Maastricht treaties. That treaty was important for Wales, especially in the wake of the National Assembly's establishment. Following our discussion on the euro last week, during time allocated to the main opposition party, I hope that we will hold further debates on the impact of the euro during Government time. That debate is ongoing. It is important that the Government accepts its responsibility and provides time to discuss European issues.

The Welsh Government has a responsibility to make the Assembly's view known to the European Union. The Government should not always speak on behalf of the Assembly. The Government, as well as the Assembly, has a role to play. Rhodri stated today that he expects to find consensus in the Assembly, but he also said that he will reject the amendments. I hope that it does not enable him to say that the Assembly spoke with one voice. Rhodri should also ensure that the Government has a voice. It is important that every political party, even if there are differences of opinion, contributes to this process on the future of Europe.

I accept that, since the establishment of the Assembly, many developments have moved Wales forward. The Assembly office in Brussels has been opened, which is a step forward. However, there is still a long way to go to secure a higher status for Wales on the European stage. Assembly Ministers have attended Council of Ministers meetings. We would like to see that happen more often and in relation to a wider range of subjects. Assembly Ministers should also have the opportunity to vote without necessarily having to take the UK Government's position into account. On some issues, such as the future of the market for sheep, Wales must lead. The range of subjects that Assembly Ministers now discuss in Europe is too restricted.

There is a big difference in how small countries that have parliaments and assemblies, such as Wales, react to European issues. The German Länder, and the federal regions in Belgium, currently have a much

Belg lais llawer cryfach na Chymru o fewn yr Undeb ar hyn o bryd. Nid ymddiheuraf am y ffaith fy mod yn cyfeirio at gynhadledd Laeken. Dywedodd Rhodri fod yn rhaid gwahanu'r drafodaeth, ond yr un drafodaeth ydyw. Wrth drafod llywodraethu Ewrop, rhaid trafod y math o strwythur a fydd gan Ewrop er mwyn gallu sefydlu'r math hwnnw o lywodraethu. Cytunaf â Romano Prodi pan ddywedodd y dylai pob lefel o lywodraeth gymryd rhan yn y broses o siapio, gweithredu a monitro polisiau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Hoffem weld y drafodaeth yn datblygu ar hyd y llinellau hynny.

The White Paper in its current form does not offer any firm proposals on how to improve EU governance. It simply contains a set of general principles, which inform the debate. It has, in many instances, the characteristics of a Green Paper. However, because it is a Green Paper, in our view, it also gives us the opportunity to be more imaginative. We are not restricted in the kind of proposals that we want to make. This is an opportunity to be radical and bold and not to be bound into preconceived ideas.

10:15 a.m.

Let us consider the kind of frame that we want to see for Wales within the European Union, because enlargement—and Nick was right to refer to enlargement—will mean that several small countries, the size of Wales, will become member states in a few years' time, with full access to the Council of Ministers, full diplomatic status, and a voice in the appointment of commissioners. Wales will not be in that position, and therefore Wales needs a stronger voice.

Rhodri, the point in our amendment 7, which Jocelyn will develop, is that European regional bodies with legislative powers will have a stronger voice in the developing regional aspect of the European Union, than those without legislative powers. That is a simple fact, because you are only an observer in certain areas, whereas those with legislative powers are at the table. That is the danger of a two-speed Europe, not only in terms of the euro, and those who have joined

stronger voice than Wales has in the European Union. I do not apologise for the fact that I refer to the Laeken conference. Rhodri Morgan said that we must separate out the debate, but it is the same debate. In discussing European governance, we must discuss the structure that Europe will have in order to establish that kind of governance. I agree with Romano Prodi when he stated that every tier of government should participate in the process of shaping, implementing and monitoring the European Union's policies. We would like to see the debate develop along those lines.

Ni chynigia'r Papur Gwyn ar ei ffurf bresennol unrhyw gynigion cadarn ar sut i wella'r modd y llywodraethir yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'n cynnwys cyfres o egwyddorion cyffredinol, sy'n llywio'r ddadl. Mewn sawl ffordd, mae iddo nodweddion Papur Gwyrdd. Fodd bynnag, gan ei fod yn Bapur Gwyrdd, yn ein barn ni, rhydd gyfle inni hefyd fod yn fwy creadigol. Ni chawn ein cyfyngu yn y math o gynigion y dymunwn eu gwneud. Mae hwn yn gyfle i fod yn radical a dewr ac i beidio â chael ein rhwymo gan syniadau rhagdybiedig.

Gadewch inni ystyried y math o ffrâm yr ydym am ei weld ar gyfer Cymru o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, oherwydd bydd ehangu—ac yr oedd Nick yn gywir i gyfeirio at ehangu—yn golygu y bydd sawl gwlad fechan, maint Cymru, yn dod yn aelod-wladwriaethau ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd, gyda mynediad llawn i Gyngor y Gweinidogion, statws diplomataidd llawn, a llais wrth benodi comisiynwyr. Ni fydd Cymru yn y sefyllfa honno, ac felly mae angen llais cryfach ar Gymru.

Rhodri, y pwynt yn ein gwelliant 7, y bydd Jocelyn yn ei ddatblygu, yw y bydd gan gyrff rhanbarthol Ewrop sydd â phwerau deddfwriaethol lais cryfach wrth ddatblygu'r agwedd ranbarthol ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, na'r rheini heb bwerau deddfwriaethol. Ffaith syml yw honno, oherwydd dim ond sylwedydd ydych mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond gall y rheini sydd â phwerau deddfwriaethol drafod o amgylch y bwrdd. Dyna berygl Ewrop ar ddau gyflymder, nid yn unig o ran

and those who have not, but also in terms of regional bodies. Those with legislative powers will have a greater say in the development of Europe than those without.

My final point—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Make your point quickly.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Today's debate is the first of many that we should have on the development of Europe. It is vital that we see this as an opportunity. We will seek consensus, but, Rhodri, you must understand that our views must also be taken on board, and that it is not simply a one-way process.

**Ron Davies:** I welcome this White Paper and the opportunity it gives for debate in the National Assembly on how the European Union sees itself developing, and, particularly, the implications of that development for the regions and nations of Europe. Fortunately for us in Britain, the process of constitutional change and the creation of devolved governments is already underway, and the emphasis that the new Europe will place on the role of decentralised government will give us further opportunities to develop and strengthen our own institution.

The White Paper identifies a paradox because people's expectations of government, at whatever level, continue to rise while, simultaneously, their trust, faith, and interest in politics and political institutions are falling.

I think that there is another force at work. Government is becoming more complex, and as this happens, we pool our sovereignty so that, for example, foreign and defence policy becomes increasingly dependent on the United Nations, NATO, or other bilateral or multilateral arrangements with our European partners. Pooling our sovereignty also means that international trade and financial policy, for example, are increasingly dependent on international arrangements via the International Monetary Fund, General

yr ewro, a'r rheini sydd wedi ymuno a'r rheini nad ydynt wedi ymuno, ond hefyd o ran cyrff rhanbarthol. Bydd gan y rheini sydd â phwerau deddfwriaethol lais cryfach wrth ddatblygu Ewrop na'r rheini heb lais.

Fy mhwynt olaf—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Gwnewch eich pwynt yn gyflym.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Dyma'r ddadl gyntaf ymhlith llawer y dylem eu cael ar ddatblygiad Ewrop. Mae'n hanfodol inni weld hyn fel cyfle. Byddwn yn ceisio consensws, ond, Rhodri, rhaid ichi ddeall bod yn rhaid i'n safbwyntiau gael eu hystyried hefyd, ac nad proses un ffordd yn unig yw hyn.

**Ron Davies:** Croesawaf y Papur Gwyn hwn a'r cyfle a rydd i gynnal dadl yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar y modd y gwêl yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ei hun yn datblygu, ac yn arbennig, goblygiadau'r datblygiad hwnnw i ranbarthau a gwledydd Ewrop. Yn ffodus inni ym Mhrydain, mae'r broses o newid cyfansoddiadol a chreu llywodraethau datganoledig eisoes ar waith, a bydd y pwyslais a rydd yr Ewrop newydd ar rôl llywodraeth ddatganoledig yn rhoi rhagor o gyfleoedd inni ddatblygu a chryfhau ein sefydliad ein hun.

Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn nodi paradocs oherwydd mae disgwyliadau pobl o lywodraeth, ar ba lefel bynnag, yn parhau i godi ond ar yr un pryd mae eu hymddiriedaeth, eu ffydd a'u diddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth a sefydliadau gwleidyddol yn lleihau.

Credaf fod grym arall ar waith. Mae llywodraeth yn mynd yn fwy cymhleth, ac wrth i hyn ddigwydd, yr ydym yn cydrannu ein sofraniaeth fel bod, er enghraifft, bolisi tramor ac amddiffyn yn mynd yn gynyddol ddibynnol ar y Cenhedloedd Unedig, NATO, neu drefniadau dwyochrog neu amlochrog eraill gyda'n partneriaid Ewropeaidd. Mae cydrannu ein sofraniaeth hefyd yn golygu bod masnach ryngwladol a pholisi ariannol, er enghraifft, yn gynyddol ddibynnol ar drefniadau rhyngwladol drwy'r Gronfa

Agreement on Tariffs and Trade or the Group of Seven. We pool our sovereignty on a wide swathe of issues, such as economic and social policy, environmental protection, labour employment policy, migration, illegal trade, and organised crime. This means that we are increasingly dependent on our partners in the European Union. I hope that we will soon pool our sovereignty on economic policy so that interest and exchange rates and currency will be Europe-wide. These developments are a natural and a desirable response to a more complex world, with globalisation liberalising the movement or transfer of people, ideas, wealth, products, and power.

We live in an increasingly challenging world, with great inequality and insecurity, and problems such as climate change, resource distribution, religious and ethnic conflict, and so on. We are building new international structures to respond to those challenges, and slowly we are becoming—certainly at a European level, thanks to the European Union—more peaceful, more prosperous, and better equipped to face the future.

However, there is that other force at work. As we live in an increasingly complex and global world, people look for a counterbalance. That is found in changes in our democratic structures, as we seek greater control over our everyday lives, and on those matters that we can control at a local level—that is why devolution is so important. It forces us to come to terms with taking responsibility for our own affairs, and it empowers us to establish our own identity so that in having confidence in ourselves, we can understand and value the diversity of others.

We have much to do to fit the National Assembly for that purpose. Our internal procedures are currently under review, and I hope that the Assembly will emerge from that as more distinct from central Government. I hope that as an Assembly, we are more confident in ourselves as an institution, and more able to rise above the necessary daily battle of party political interest, so that we

Ariannol Ryngwladol, y Cytundeb Cyffredinol ar Dariffau a Masnach neu Grŵp y Saith. Cydrannwn ein sofraniaeth ar ystod eang o faterion, fel polisi economaidd a chymdeithasol, diogelu'r amgylchedd, polisi cyflogi llafur, ymfudo, masnach anghyfreithlon, a grwpiau o droseddwyr. Golyga hyn ein bod yn gynyddol ddibynnol ar ein partneriaid yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gobeithiaf y byddwn yn cydrannu ein sofraniaeth ar bolisi economaidd yn fuan fel y bydd cyfraddau llog a chyfnewid ac arian cyfred yn debyg ledled Ewrop. Mae'r datblygiadau hyn yn ymateb naturiol a dymunol i fyd mwy cymhleth, gyda globaleiddio yn ei gwneud yn haws i symud neu drosglwyddo pobl, syniadau, cyfoeth, cynnyrch, a phŵer.

Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd sy'n gynyddol heriol, gyda mwy o anghydraddoldeb ac ansicrwydd, a phroblemau fel newid hinsawdd, dosbarthu adnoddau, gwrthdaro crefyddol ac ethnig, ac yn y blaen. Adeiladwn strwythurau rhyngwladol newydd i ymateb i'r heriau hynny, ac yn araf deun—yn sicr ar lefel Ewropeaidd, diolch i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd—yn fwy heddychlon, yn fwy ffyniannus, a chyda gwell adnoddau i wynebu'r dyfodol.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r grym arall hwnnw ar waith. Gan ei bod yn byw mewn byd cynyddol gymhleth ac eang, gall pobl edrych am wrthbwys. Mae hyn i'w ganfod mewn newidiadau yn ein strwythurau democrataidd, gan ein bod yn ceisio cael mwy o reolaeth dros ein bywydau bob dydd, ac ar y materion hynny a all reoli ar lefel leol—dyna pam mae datganoli mor bwysig. Mae'n ein gorfodi i fod yn gyfrifol am ein materion ein hunain, ac yn ein grymuso i sefydlu ein hunaniaeth ein hunain fel y gallwn, drwy gael hyder ynom ein hunain, ddeall a gwerthfawrogi amrywiaeth eraill.

Mae gennym lawer i'w gyflawni i wneud y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn addas i'r pwrpas hwnnw. Adolygir ein gweithdrefnau mewnol ar hyn o bryd, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Cynulliad yn datblygu yn sgîl hyn fel sefydliad sy'n fwy ar wahân i Lywodraeth ganolog. Gobeithiaf ein bod, fel Cynulliad, yn fwy hyderus ynom ein hunain fel sefydliad, ac yn fwy abl i godi uwchben y

can provide a forum for our national development. We shall shortly, I hope, have the commission that Rhodri talked about, which should lead the way to removing the anomalies, inequalities and deficiencies of our present devolution settlement.

These changes are prerequisites for success within the National Assembly, and for the success of a devolved Wales within the European Union. What we are doing in Wales is very much with the European grain, which is identified in this White Paper. Power is slowly leaching out of London, upwards and downwards. It is leaching out to Europe, and leaching down to the devolved nations and regions within the United Kingdom. We should not despair at that; democracy and our structures of government are there to serve us, not govern us, and we must have the confidence to change them when the need arises. That need is now. The White Paper identifies that the need is Europe-wide. I welcome the White Paper for that, and wholeheartedly support the motion.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I welcome this debate, which is at a time when there is a great deal of disillusionment with the European Union, much of which is due to the democratic deficit of its institutions. Ways must be found of bringing Europe closer to the people, and the best way would be to involve the levels of government closest to them. To do that, effective mechanisms for the involvement of small nations and regions in the European Union must be established. This would be an essential element in a more democratic and transparent Europe.

The time has come to recognise that Europe consists of shared sovereignties based on multi-level governance, all playing their part in shaping and implementing European Union policy. We welcome the sentiments voiced by the European Parliament in calling for the amendment of treaties, to recognise and respect the political and legislative powers of small nations and regions within member states. In an enlarged EU, there will be many more small states, most of which will emerge from larger entities. However, as

frwydr feunyddiol angenrheidiol o fudd gwleidyddiaeth plaid, fel y gallwn ddarparu fforwm ar gyfer ein datblygiad cenedlaethol. Gobeithiaf y cawn, yn fuan, y comisiwn y soniodd Rhodri amdano, a ddylai arwain y ffordd i ddileu'r anomaleddau, yr anghydraddoldebau a'r diffygion yn ein setliad datganoli presennol.

Mae'r newidiadau hyn yn anhepgorion er mwyn llwyddo o fewn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac er mwyn i Gymru ddatganoledig lwyddo yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae'r hyn a wnawn yng Nghymru yn cydweddu'n agos ag Ewrop, a nodir hyn yn y Papur Gwyn hwn. Mae'r pŵer yn hidlo'n araf o Lundain, i fyny ac i lawr. Mae'n hidlo i Ewrop, ac yn hidlo i lawr i'r gwledydd datganoledig a'r rhanbarthau o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni ddylem anobeithio oherwydd hynny; mae democratiaeth a strwythurau ein llywodraeth yno i'n gwasanaethu, nid i'n llywodraethu, a rhaid inni fagu'r hyder i'w newid pan fo'r angen yn codi. Mae'r angen hwnnw yma yn awr. Noda'r Papur Gwyn fod yr angen yn un ledled Ewrop. Croesawaf y Papur Gwyn am hynny, a chefnogaf y cynnig yn llwyr.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon, a ddaw ar adeg pan fo llawer o ddadrithiad gyda'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, llawer ohono o ganlyniad i ddiffyg democrataidd ei sefydliadau. Rhaid canfod ffyrdd o ddod ag Ewrop yn agosach at y bobl, a'r ffordd orau o wneud hyn fyddai drwy gynnwys y lefelau o lywodraeth sydd agosaf atynt. I wneud hynny, rhaid sefydlu dulliau effeithiol o gynnwys gwledydd bychain a rhanbarthau yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Byddai hyn yn elfen hanfodol mewn Ewrop sy'n fwy democrataidd a thryloyw.

Mae'n bryd cydnabod bod Ewrop yn cynnwys sofraniaethau a rennir yn seiliedig ar lywodraethu ar sawl lefel, bob un yn chwarae eu rhan wrth lunio a gweithredu polisi'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Croesawn y safbwyntiau a godwyd gan Senedd Ewrop wrth alw am ddiwygio cytundebau, cydnabod a pharchu pwerau gwleidyddol a deddfwriaethol gwledydd bychain a rhanbarthau o fewn aelod-wladwriaethau. Mewn Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi ei ehangu, bydd llawer mwy o wladwriaethau bychain, y

full member states, they will take their place at the top table, with full voting rights in the council. How will similar sized nation regions of larger states, such as Wales, Scotland, Flanders and Catalonia, stand in comparison with these small member states? How will we ensure that Wales is not left behind? We have much to offer and much to gain.

As Ieuan said earlier, at present, the First Minister can only attend meetings of the Conference of European Regions as an observer. When the regions made a case, in the Flanders declaration, for regional involvement in the preparations for the next intergovernmental conference, the First Minister could not sign it. You may think that this does not really matter, but I ask the First Minister whether, in his view, we would have benefited from his signing the declaration, even though he has said that it is irrelevant to this debate. It is my understanding that the implication of this declaration for Wales would be that the UK Government would only take action in a policy area should we be unable to take action at a Welsh level. That is, of course, a completely different model of devolution to the one that we have at present. I do not think that this is irrelevant. The First Minister may be content with the UK Government's approach to Europe, however, does he imagine that this will always be the case? The result is that the regions that were able to sign the declaration, such as the Belgium and Spanish regions, the German Länder, and Scotland, are the gatekeepers of regional representation, while we are only on the fringes. This creates a two-track system of regional participation, and demonstrates another advantage of primary legislative powers, about which Plaid Cymru is clear, and most certainly wants. However, I am not sure about Rhodri Morgan's view and perhaps he will share it with us.

This White Paper offers opportunities. It contains a number of references to regional involvement. We have already heard the Government's view on the possibility of introducing target-based tripartite contracts between the European Commission, member

bydd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn deillio o endidau mwy o faint. Fodd bynnag, fel aelod-wladwriaethau llawn, cymerant eu lle wrth y prif fwrdd, gyda hawliau pleidleisio llawn yn y cyngor. Sut y bydd gwledydd llai o faint mewn gwladwriaethau mwy, fel Cymru, yr Alban, Fflandrys a Chatalonia, yn llwyddo o'u cymharu â'r aelod-wladwriaethau llai o faint hyn? Sut y sicrhawn nas gadewir Cymru ar ôl? Mae gennym lawer i'w gynnig a llawer i'w ennill.

Fel y dywedodd Ieuan yn gynharach, dim ond Prif Weinidog Cymru ar hyn o bryd all fynychu cyfarfodydd y Gynhadledd ar Ranbarthau Ewrop fel sylwedydd. Pan ddadleuodd y rhanbarthau, yn natganiad Fflandrys, dros gymryd rhan ranbarthol yn y paratodau ar gyfer y gynhadledd rynglywodraethol nesaf, ni allai'r Prif Weinidog ei lofnodi. Efallai y credwch nad yw hynny'n gwneud llawer o wahaniaeth, ond gofynnaf i'r Prif Weinidog a fyddem yn ei farn ef, wedi elwa ar lofnodi'r datganiad, er iddo ddweud fod hynny'n amherthnasol yn y ddadl hon. Deallaf mai goblygiad y datganiad hwn i Gymru yw y byddai Llywodraeth y DU ond yn gweithredu mewn mater polisi pe na allem weithredu ar lefel Gymreig. Wrth gwrs, mae hynny'n fodel datganoli hollol wahanol i'r un sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Ni chredaf fod hyn yn amherthnasol. Efallai fod Prif Weinidog Cymru yn fodlon ar ymagwedd Llywodraeth y DU tuag at Ewrop, fodd bynnag, a yw'n dychmygu mai fel hyn y bydd hi bob tro? Y canlyniad yw mai'r rhanbarthau a oedd yn gallu llofnodi'r datganiad, fel rhanbarthau Gwlad Belg a Sbaen, Länder yr Almaen a'r Alban, yw ceidwaid pyrth cynrychiolaeth ranbarthol, tra ein bod ni ar y cyrion yn unig. Mae hyn yn creu system ddwy ffordd o gyfranogiad rhanbarthol, ac yn arddangos mantais arall pwerau deddfwriaethol sylfaenol, y mae Plaid Cymru yn glir arno, ac yn sicr yn eu dymuno. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â barn Rhodri Morgan ac efallai y gwnaiff ei rhannu gyda ni.

Mae'r Papur Gwyn hwn yn cynnig cyfleoedd. Mae'n cynnwys nifer o gyfeiriadau at ymrwymiad rhanbarthol. Eisoes clywsom farn y Llywodraeth ar y posibilrwydd o gyflwyno cytundebau teiran yn seiliedig ar dargedau rhwng y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd,

states and regional governments. Rhodri said earlier that it is 'too early to comment'. I will explain: they offer the possibility of establishing direct links with the commission on specific policy areas. For example, as environment is a devolved matter and the vast majority of legislation derives directly from the European Union, it may make perfectly good sense for us to have those direct links. Agriculture is another good example. Local authorities could also be included. Therefore, will the Government push this point, so that the National Assembly and local authorities participate in the pilot contracts to be launched this year, which the First Minister referred to earlier as interesting? Has the Government done anything yet to identify policy areas where these projects would be viable? After all, that is the point of pilot projects. If the First Minister feels so cautious as to reject amendment 5, will he undertake to present this idea to the Committee on European and External Affairs where it may be taken forward.

10:25 a.m.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** The Liberal Democratic Party is pro-Europe. I remember an enjoyable occasion in 1975 when I campaigned with the Conservatives around Cardiff in order to try and convince the people that we should be in Europe.

It is crucial that we are also clear about the limits of joining the European Union and firm about its failings. I want to be clear about some first principles on this issue. What do we, as European citizens, gain from the European Union and how can we ensure that it continues to benefit us? First, and most important, it offers security. It is now inconceivable that there could be a war between any of its member states. It provides prosperity and has a huge marketplace, which will soon be bigger than that of Mexico, the USA and Canada put together, for countries such as Wales to exploit. It provides opportunity, not only to buy and sell, but to travel freely across country boundaries and to have access to the culture and education

aelod-wladwriaethau a llywodraethau rhanbarthol. Dywedodd Rhodri yn gynharach ei bod 'yn rhy gynnar i roi sylwadau'. Fe egluraf: cynigiant y posibilrwydd o sefydlu cysylltiadau uniongyrchol â'r comisiwn ar feysydd polisi penodol. Er enghraifft, gan fod yr amgylchedd yn fater datganoledig ac y deillia'r mwyafrif helaeth o ddeddfwriaeth yn uniongyrchol o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, efallai y byddai'n gwneud synnwyr da inni gael y cysylltiadau uniongyrchol hynny. Mae amaethyddiaeth yn enghraifft dda arall. Gellid cynnwys awdurdodau lleol hefyd. Felly, a wnaiff y Llywodraeth bwysleisio'r pwynt hwn, fel y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ac awdurdodau lleol gymryd rhan yn y contractau peilot a gaiff eu lansio eleni, y cyfeiriodd Prif Weinidog Cymru atynt yn gynharach fel rhai diddorol? A wnaeth y Llywodraeth unrhyw beth eto i nodi meysydd polisi lle y byddai'r prosiectau hyn yn ymaferol? Wedi'r cyfan, dyna ddiben prosiectau peilot. Os teimla'r Prif Weinidog mor wyliadwrus ag i wrthod gwelliant 5, a wnaiff ymrwymo i gyflwyno'r syniad hwn i'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol lle y gellir ei ddatblygu.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Mae Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o blaid Ewrop. Cofiaf achlysur pleserus yn 1975 pan ymgyrchais gyda'r Ceidwadwyr o amgylch Caerdydd er mwyn ceisio argyhoeddi pobl y dylem fod yn Ewrop.

Mae'n holl bwysig ein bod yn glir hefyd ynglŷn â chyfyngiadau ymuno â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ac yn gadarn ynglŷn â'i fethiannau. Yr wyf am fod yn glir ynglŷn â rhai egwyddorion sylfaenol ar y mater hwn. Beth a gawn ni, fel dinasyddion Ewrop, gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a sut y gallwn sicrhau ei fod yn parhau i fod o fudd i ni? Yn gyntaf, ac yn bwysicaf, mae'n cynnig diogelwch. Mae'n anghredadwy erbyn hyn y gallai rhyfel fod rhwng unrhyw un o'i aelod-wladwriaethau. Darpara ffyniant ac mae ganddo farchnad enfawr, a fydd yn fwy cyn bo hir na Mecsico, UDA a Chanada gyda'i gilydd, i wledydd fel Cymru fanteisio arni. Darpara gyfle, nid yn unig i brynu a gwerthu, ond i deithio'n rhydd ar draws ffiniau gwledydd a chael mynediad i



systems of many nations. It provides liberty and freedom from tyranny, the arbitrary actions of governments, unnecessary border regulations and other barriers to the easy movement of people and goods. All this comes under the context of community, which ensures fairness between Europe's regions, nations and localities and the citizens who live in them. It also allows people to work together for their common interests, which include peace, trade, and cultural and environmental heritage.

Prosperity, security, opportunity, liberty and community are the outcomes of a well-ordered European Union. This is what the European Union must aim for and be judged by. However, these goals will not be achieved unless the people of Europe have confidence in its organisation, namely in the legitimacy of Europe's institutions and how they inter-relate with the citizens.

This White Paper addresses the thoughts of many of our citizens, typified in surveys by the words, 'remote', 'unaccountable', 'wasteful', 'bossy' and 'undemocratic'. To some extent, these tags are undeserved. However, how often do European national and regional politicians fall into the easy habit of taking the credit when Europe does something well, but using it as a scapegoat when tough choices must be made?

Europe's image may be unfair, but it is powerful and damaging and must be dealt with. That is why we welcome the White Paper because it combines clarity of purpose with a substantial degree of self-criticism. The governance of the European Union needs to be reformed and we endorse the principles set out in the White Paper. It is the route for creating a more popular and dynamic European Union, better placed to deliver for all the people of Europe.

The European Union is remote. The physical distance of its institutions is bound to promote that feeling. However, there is no need for its institutions to feel so remote to its citizens. The White Paper, crucially on page 24 of the printed version, takes the

ddiwylliant ac addysg systemau llawer o wledydd. Darpara ryddid rhag gormes, gweithredoedd mympwyol llywodraethau, rheoliadau diangen ar gyfer ffiniau a rhwystrau eraill sy'n atal pobl a nwyddau rhag symud yn hawdd. Daw hyn i gyd o fewn cyd-destun cymuned, sy'n sicrhau tegwch rhwng rhanbarthau, gwledydd ac ardaloedd Ewrop a'r dinasyddion sy'n byw ynddynt. Caniatâ hefyd i bobl gydweithio er budd cyffredin, sy'n cynnwys heddwch, masnach a threftadaeth ddiwylliannol ac amgylcheddol.

Canlyniadau Undeb Ewropeaidd trefnus yw ffyniant, diogelwch, cyfle, rhyddid a chymuned. Dyna'r hyn y mae'n rhaid i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd anelu ato a rhaid iddo gael ei farnu yn ôl y pethau hyn. Fodd bynnag, ni chyflawnir y nodau hyn oni fydd gan bobl Ewrop hyder yn ei sefydliad, sef yng nghyfreithlondeb sefydliadau Ewrop a'r modd y maent yn cydberthyn â'r dinasyddion.

Ymdrinia'r Papur Gwyn hwn â safbwyntiau llawer o'n dinasyddion, a nodweddiwyd mewn arolygon gan y geiriau, 'anghysbell', 'anatebol', 'gwastraffus', 'awdurdodol' ac 'annemocrataidd'. I ryw raddau, ni haeddir y labelau hyn. Fodd bynnag, pa mor aml yr â gwleidyddion cenedlaethol a rhanbarthol Ewrop i'r arfer hawdd o gymryd y clod pan wna Ewrop rywbeth yn dda, ond ei defnyddio wedyn fel bwch dihangol pan fo'n rhaid gwneud dewisiadau anodd?

Efallai fod delwedd Ewrop yn un annheg, ond mae'n bwerus ac yn niweidiol a rhaid ymdrin â hi. Dyna pam y croesawn y Papur Gwyn gan ei fod yn cyfuno eglurder y pwrpas gyda chryn dipyn o hunanfeirniadaeth. Mae angen diwygio dull llywodraethu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a chymeradwywn yr egwyddorion a nodir yn y Papur Gwyn. Dyma'r ffordd o greu Undeb Ewropeaidd mwy poblogaidd a deinamig, sydd mewn gwell sefyllfa i gyflwyno i holl bobl Ewrop.

Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn anghysbell. Mae pellter corfforol ei sefydliadau yn sicr o hyrwyddo'r teimlad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, nid oes angen i'w sefydliadau deimlo mor anghysbell i'w ddinasyddion. Cymer y Papur Gwyn, yn holl bwysig ar dudalen 24 o'r

decentralisation agenda much further than before, involving the tripartite agreement and more joint action by member states and legislatures such as the National Assembly. That is how it should work. We are part of the decision-making and closer to the people producing and dealing with the issues that affect us most.

Openness and accountability are key. Many people in Europe simply do not trust or understand the European Union's workings or are not interested in them. The European Union must connect with its citizens in an improved and more effective way. There is much that it can do to encourage visibility and openness. The culture of secrecy must be swept away. Official minutes of the European Council of Ministers meetings, among others, should be published. There should be a freedom of information charter covering all the institutions—perhaps they should take a leaf out of our book in terms of the openness policies of the Government in Wales. The veil of secrecy which sometimes accompanies European actions needs to be ripped apart.

**David Davies:** Does Mike also agree that if European politicians are going to pass legislation that could detrimentally affect the future of businesses and individuals in the constituencies of Wales, which happened recently to a constituent in both our constituencies, they should at least have the courtesy to contact the person involved or to return their calls?

**Michael German:** The spirit of openness and accountability applies to all European Union institutions, its members and its servants. Those who work in the European Parliament and the European Commission are also covered by that. We welcome this proposal for a legal mechanism to allow the Council of Europe, and the European Parliament as the legislature, to monitor and control the European Commission's actions. That would be a great improvement in accountability.

The European Union's democracy is sometimes flawed or, at best, blurred. The European Parliament must have its legislative role enhanced, and get additional powers to

fersiwn a argraffwyd, yr agenda ddatganoli ymhellach o lawer nag o'r blaen, gan gynnwys y cytundeb teiran a mwy o gydweithredu gan aelod-wladwriaethau a deddfwrfeydd fel y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dyna sut y dylai weithio. Yr ydym yn rhan o'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau ac yn agosach at y bobl sy'n cynhyrchu ac yn delio â'r materion sy'n effeithio arnom fwyaf.

Y geiriau allweddol yw bod yn agored ac yn atebol. Nid oes llawer o bobl yn Ewrop yn ymddiried yng ngwaith yr Undeb Ewropeaidd nac yn ei ddeall neu nid oes ganddynt ddiddordeb ynddo. Rhaid i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd gysylltu â'i ddinasyddion mewn ffordd well a mwy effeithiol. Mae llawer y gall ei wneud i annog amlygrwydd a bod yn agored. Rhaid ysgubo ymaith ddiwylliant cyfrinachgarwch. Dylid cyhoeddi cofnodion swyddogol Cyngor Gweinidogion Ewrop, ymhlith eraill. Dylid sicrhau bod siarter rhyddid gwybodaeth ar gael sy'n cwmpasu pob sefydliad—efallai y dylent ddilyn ein hesiampl o ran polisiau bod yn agored y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru. Mae angen rhwygo cochl cyfrinachedd sydd weithiau yn cyd-fynd â gweithredoedd Ewropeaidd.

**David Davies:** A yw Mike yn cytuno hefyd, y dylai gwleidyddion Ewrop, os ydynt i basio deddfwriaeth a allai effeithio'n andwyol ar ddyfodol busnesau ac unigolion yn etholaethau Cymru, a ddigwyddodd yn ddiweddar i etholwr yn etholaeth y ddau ohonom, o leiaf gael y cwrteisi i gysylltu â'r person dan sylw neu i ddychwelyd eu galwadau?

**Michael German:** Mae bod yn agored ac yn atebol yn berthnasol i bob sefydliad yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ei aelodau a'i weision. Mae'n cwmpasu hefyd y rhai sy'n gweithio yn Senedd Ewrop a'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Croesawn y cynnig hwn ar gyfer dull cyfreithiol i ganiatáu i Gyngor Ewrop a Senedd Ewrop fel y ddeddfwrfa, fonitro a rheoli gweithredoedd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd. Byddai hynny'n welliant mawr o ran bod yn agored.

Weithiau mae democratiaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn wallus, neu ar y gorau, yn aneglur. Rhaid i Senedd Ewrop wella ei rôl ddeddfwriaethol, a chael pwerau ychwanegol

hold the European Commission and the Council of Europe to account. Co-decision between the Council and the Parliament is a power that should be extended.

We welcome the White Paper's emphasis on decentralised management, and the reinforced role for the regions of Europe. The White Paper's proposals for more systematic dialogue and input, in terms of policy shaping for regions and localities, will do much to improve subsidiarity. Partnership in decisions—as envisaged through the proposed contracts—should also be welcomed, building outwards and downwards from the European institutions to those who most closely represent our people.

We welcome this White Paper, because it seeks to redress the balance of democratic accountability within its current remit. The role of legislatures like ours will be enhanced. There will be a real opportunity for us to play a greater part on the European stage. With regions of like minds, we can help influence and shape the future policies of the Union.

We need a framework for Europe that increases transparency and accountability, and which ultimately provides a framework for the development of democracy founded on the interests of Europe's citizens, rather than a grand vision of Europe's elite.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I make no apology for regarding myself as pro-European. I see no problem in being Welsh, British and European. In the twenty-first century, it is wonderful to be able to say that you can regard your lifestyle and identity in three different ways, and to be proud of all three. I apologise to my own party—never have I agreed so much with the Liberal Democrat group. I suspect that that statement will damage my reselection chances. I have probably also damaged Mike German's chances.

I intend to focus on the five principles outlined in the report, which underpin the text of the report. I suspect that they will be the guiding principles of the debate for many years to come. Many of these principles are not new and have been around since the dawn

i alw'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd a Chyngor Ewrop i gyfrif. Mae cyd-benderfyniadau rhwng y Cyngor a'r Senedd yn bŵer y dylid ei ymestyn.

Croesawn bwyslais y Papur Gwyn ar reolaeth ddatganoledig, a'r rôl atgyfnerthedig ar gyfer rhanbarthau Ewrop. Bydd cynigion y Papur Gwyn ar gyfer deialog a mewnbwn mwy systematig, o ran llunio polisi i ranbarthau ac ardaloedd, yn gwneud llawer i wella is-reolaeth. Dylai partneriaeth mewn penderfyniadau—fel y rhagwelwyd drwy'r contractau arfaethedig—gael ei chrosawu hefyd, gan adeiladu tuag at allan a thuag at i lawr o'r sefydliadau Ewropeaidd i'r rheini sy'n cynrychioli ein pobl agosaf.

Croesawn y Papur Gwyn hwn, oherwydd ceisia unioni cydbwysedd atebolrwydd democrataidd o fewn ei gylch gwaith presennol. Caiff rôl deddfwrfeydd fel ein deddfwrfa ni ei hatgyfnerthu. Bydd cyfle gwirioneddol inni chwarae mwy o ran ar lwyfan Ewrop. Gyda rhanbarthau unfryd, gallwn helpu i ddylanwadu a llunio polisiau'r Undeb yn y dyfodol.

Mae angen fframwaith arnom ar gyfer Ewrop sy'n cynyddu eglurder ac atebolrwydd, ac sydd yn y pen draw yn darparu fframwaith i ddatblygu democratiaeth yn seiliedig ar fuddiannau dinasyddion Ewrop, yn hytrach na gweledigaeth fawr o etholedigion Ewrop.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid ymddiheuraf am ystyried fy hun o blaid Ewrop. Ni thybiaf fod unrhyw broblem mewn bod yn Gymro, yn Brydeiniwr ac yn Ewropead. Yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, mae'n wych i allu dweud y gallwch ystyried eich ffordd o fyw a'ch hunaniaeth mewn tair ffordd wahanol, a bod yn falch o'r tair. Ymddiheuraf i'm plaid fy hun—nid wyf erioed wedi cytuno gymaint â grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Tybiaf y bydd y datganiad hwnnw yn gwneud drwg i'm cyfle i gael fy aiddethol. Mae'n siŵr fy mod hefyd wedi difetha cyfle Mike German.

Bwriadaf ganolbwyntio ar y pum egwyddor a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad, sy'n ategu testun yr adroddiad. Tybiaf mai dyma fydd egwyddorion arweiniol y ddadl am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod. Mae llawer o'r egwyddorion hyn yn hen ac wedi bod gyda ni

of time: openness and participation; accountability; effectiveness and cohesion. The institutions of the European Union have used those words for a significant time. The fact that none of them have been adhered to demonstrates the difficulties of European governance, and the problems that relate to them have never been solved. The size and history of the European Union, its sheer geographical area dictates that the institutions are regarded as remote by the peoples of Europe. I again agree with Mike German on these points. The distance between European institutions and member states mean that people see them as remote, and feel that their decisions have no bearing on individuals' lives; they feel that they cannot influence those decisions.

The EU must come to terms with that. Although the First Minister refused to support the amendment on enlargement, a significant theme runs through the report referring to the enlargement process. Enlargement will have an impact upon this debate on European governance. You cannot continue to govern the European Union as it is now, with 25 to 30 member states. It will be impossible. Throughout, the report recognises that people do not associate with the institutions. People regard the processes as complex, difficult to understand, and rather unusual, when compared to the processes of regional and national government.

I welcome the comments that we will see a greater use of regional governance. We welcome the Assembly's involvement in the European processes, and the fact that some Assembly Members are members of the Committee of the Regions. Assembly Government members attend Council of Ministers meetings. We must consider our processes to see how the Assembly can examine European ideas and policies, and whether the Assembly Subject Committees could examine issues arising from the European Union.

10:35 a.m.

I also recognise that the action points on page 12 of the report will not necessarily see a

ers cyn cof: bod yn agored a chymryd rhan; atebolrwydd, effeithiolrwydd a chydlyniant. Mae sefydliadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi defnyddio'r geiriau hynny ers tro. Mae'r ffaith na lynwyd wrth yr un ohonynt yn dangos anawsterau'r dull llywodraethu Ewropeaidd, ac nid yw'r problemau sy'n ymwneud â hwy erioed wedi eu datrys. Mae maint a hanes yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, ei ardal ddaearyddol enfawr yn deddfu bod y sefydliadau yn cael eu hystyried yn anghysbell gan bobl Ewrop. Unwaith eto cytunaf â Mike German ar y pwyntiau hyn. Golyga'r pellter rhwng sefydliadau Ewrop a'r aelod-wladwriaethau fod pobl yn eu hystyried yn anghysbell, a theimlant na chaiff eu penderfyniadau unrhyw effaith ar fywydau unigolion; teimlant na allant ddylanwadu ar y penderfyniadau hynny.

Rhaid i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ddod i delerau â hynny. Er i Brif Weinidog Cymru wrthod cefnogi'r gwelliant ar ehangu, rhed thema o bwys drwy'r adroddiad sy'n cyfeirio at y broses ehangu. Bydd ehangu yn effeithio ar y ddadl hon ar ddull llywodraethu Ewrop. Ni allwch barhau i lywodraethu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, gyda 25 i 30 o aelod-wladwriaethau. Bydd yn amhosibl. Drwy gydol yr adroddiad, mae'n cydnabod nad yw pobl yn cysylltu â'r sefydliadau. Ystyria pobl y prosesau yn rhai cymhleth, anodd i'w deall, a braidd yn anghyffredin, o'u cymharu â phrosesau llywodraeth ranbarthol a chenedlaethol.

Croesawaf y sylwadau y gwelwn fwy o ddefnydd o lywodraethu rhanbarthol. Croesawn ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i'r prosesau Ewropeaidd, a'r ffaith bod rhai o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn aelodau o Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Mae Aelodau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynychu cyfarfodydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion. Rhaid inni ystyried ein prosesau i weld sut y gall y Cynulliad archwilio syniadau a pholisïau Ewropeaidd, ac a allai Pwyllgorau Pwnc y Cynulliad archwilio materion sy'n deillio o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Cydnabyddaf hefyd na fydd y pwyntiau gweithredu ar dudalen 12 o'r adroddiad o

surge; the democratic deficit will be exaggerated, as Jocelyn Davies mentioned. Part of the problem in this country is that the media are not fully engaged with what is happening on the mainland. The media outlets in mainland Europe tend to offer a more proactive, informed view of European Union developments.

When one examines the issue of accountability and the sense of European institutions' effectiveness, much depends on the policy processes and the commission's willingness to allow institutional reform. It is interesting that all that this report refers to is a clearer understanding of the European institutions' roles. It offers no real, meaningful reforms in altering the balance of power between the commission and the elected European Parliament. One would not have imagined that a commission-wide paper would suddenly offer a shift in the balance of power that would see its own authority reduced. In addition to that, in terms of effectiveness, you need a decent EU regulation implementation system. If you examine, as the report rightly states, the 83 internal market directives for 2000, only five of those were actually implemented by all member states. In fact, the United Kingdom, up to the 1990s, had one of the highest rates of implementation of any of the EU member states. Some of the more productive, proactive, positive EU member states have a low rate of implementation.

In conclusion, when one examines these five principles and the process of enlargement, it becomes clear that the public will not win. It will not extend democratic debate to individuals. It will extend debate among politicians and opinion formers, but this is not a debate that will engage the ordinary members of the public.

**John Griffiths:** I welcome this debate and this motion. I feel European and pro-EU. The UK's membership has brought many benefits to Wales, and as we become a more central player—as the UK's membership allows—membership will bring many more benefits,

reidrwydd yn profi cynnydd; caiff y diffyg democrataidd ei or-ddweud, fel y soniodd Jocelyn Davies. Rhan o'r broblem yn y wlad hon yw nad yw'r cyfryngau yn deall yn llawn yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar y tir mawr. Mae'r cyfryngau ar dir mawr Ewrop yn tueddu i gynnig barn fwy rhagweithiol, hyddysg ar ddatblygiadau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Pan ystyrir mater atebolrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd sefydliadau Ewropeaidd, mae llawer yn dibynnu ar brosesau'r polisi a pharodrwydd y comisiwn i ganiatáu diwygiad sefydliadol. Mae'n ddiddorol mai'r cyfan y cyfeiria'r adroddiad hwn ato yw dealltwriaeth gliriach o rolau sefydliadau Ewrop. Nid yw'n cynnig unrhyw ddiwygiadau gwirioneddol, ystyrllon wrth newid y cydbwysedd pŵer rhwng y comisiwn a'r Senedd Ewrop etholedig. Ni fyddai rhywun wedi dychmygu y byddai papur ar draws y comisiwn yn sydyn yn cynnig newid yn y cydbwysedd grym a fyddai'n gweld ei awdurdod ei hun yn cael ei leihau. Yn ogystal â hynny, o ran effeithiolrwydd, mae angen system gweithredu rheoliadau safonol ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Os archwiliwch, fel y noda'r adroddiad yn briodol, yr 83 o gyfarwydddebau'r farchnad fewnol ar gyfer 2000, dim ond pump ohonynt a weithredwyd mewn gwirionedd gan bob aelod-wladwriaeth. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd gan y Deyrnas Unedig, hyd at y 1990au, un o'r cyfraddau gweithredu uchaf o blith yr holl aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae gan rai o aelod-wladwriaethau mwy cynhyrchiol, rhagweithiol, cadarnhaol yr Undeb Ewropeaidd gyfradd weithredu isel.

I gloi, pan archwilir y pum egwyddor hyn a'r broses ehangu, daw'n eglur na fydd y cyhoedd yn ennill. Ni fydd yn ymestyn dadl ddemocrataidd i unigolion. Bydd yn ymestyn dadl ymhlith gwleidyddion a llunwyr barn, ond nid yw hon yn ddadl a fydd yn dal sylw'r cyhoedd.

**John Griffiths:** Croesawaf y ddadl hon a'r cynnig hwn. Teimlaf yn Ewropeaidd ac o blaid Ewrop. Daeth aelodaeth y DU â llawer o fuddiannau i Gymru, ac wrth inni ddod yn chwaraewr mwy canolog—fel y caniatâ aelodaeth y DU—daw'r aelodaeth â llawer

not only for the UK but also in terms of a developing role for Wales as part of that agenda. I welcome that because we can do much more on a UK level and a Welsh level to exert more influence and play a greater, more central role within the European Union. There is good cause for optimism in terms of Wales's attitude towards the European Union and all things European. We can claim to be positive and progressive on the European Union front. We can find evidence such as higher European election turnouts in Wales, an obvious appreciation of the role of structural funds, the way the agricultural community can and has benefited from membership. All of these points reinforce the positive view in Wales of the European Union and that in turn will allow Wales to play a greater, more influential role through the changes that follow this White Paper.

The Committee of the Regions obviously has a role. I have represented the Assembly on that body for some time. It is generally considered to have been floundering somewhat in terms of trying to develop a role. The White Paper is vague; it refers to giving greater weight to the Committee of the Regions' deliberations but it does not propose any radical changes to the way in which it operates. It can play a role in terms of subsidiarity and proximity, in terms of being closer to the people and being a conduit between the European Union, the commission, the regions and nation states within the Union. It could play a role. I am open-minded as to how that role might develop and to how other ways might be found to achieve that proximity and subsidiarity, especially through a greater role for institutions such as the National Assembly for Wales. It will be fascinating to see how that process develops because, as Ron Davies said, we have this process of power coming down to Wales from Westminster with power also going from Westminster to the European level. It will be fascinating to see how that and Wales's role within that process develops.

It is only fair to say that there is one party in

mwy o fuddiannau, nid yn unig i'r DU, ond hefyd o ran datblygu rôl i Gymru fel rhan o'r agenda honno. Croesawaf hynny oherwydd gallwn wneud llawer mwy ar lefel y DU a lefel Cymru i ddylanwadu mwy a chwarae rôl fwy o faint a mwy canolog o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae achos da dros deimlo'n optimistaidd o ran ymagwedd Cymru tuag at yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a phob peth Ewropeaidd. Gallwn honni ein bod yn gadarnhaol ac yn flaengar o ran yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gallwn ddod o hyd i dystiolaeth megis y ffaith bod nifer fwy o bobl wedi pleidleisio yn etholiadau Ewrop yng Nghymru, sef gwerthfawrogiad amlwg o rôl cronfeydd strwythurol, y modd y gall y gymuned amaethyddol elwa, a'r modd y mae wedi elwa, ar fod yn aelod. Atgyfnertha pob un o'r pwyntiau hyn y farn gadarnhaol yng Nghymru ar yr Undeb Ewropeaidd a bydd hynny yn ei dro yn caniatáu i Gymru chwarae rôl fwy o faint a mwy dylanwadol drwy'r newidiadau a ddaw yn sgîl y Papur Gwyn hwn.

Yn amlwg, mae gan Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau rôl. Yr wyf wedi cynrychioli'r Cynulliad ar y corff hwnnw ers peth amser. Yn gyffredinol, y gred yw y bu'n ymbalfalu ychydig o ran ceisio datblygu rôl. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn amwys; cyfeiria at roi mwy o bwys ar benderfyniadau Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau ond nid yw'n cynnig unrhyw newidiadau radical i'r ffordd y gweithreda. Gall chwarae rôl o ran is-reolaeth ac agosrwydd, o ran bod yn agosach at y bobl a bod yn bont rhwng yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, y comisiwn, y rhanbarthau a'r gwledydd o fewn yr Undeb. Fe allai chwarae rôl. Mae gennyf feddwl agored o ran y modd y gallai'r rôl honno ddatblygu a'r modd y gellid canfod ffyrdd eraill o gyflawni'r agosrwydd a'r is-reolaeth honno, yn enwedig drwy roi mwy o rôl i sefydliadau fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y datblyga'r broses honno oherwydd, fel y dywedodd Ron Davies, daw'r broses hon o rym i lawr i Gymru o San Steffan gyda phŵer hefyd yn dod o San Steffan i lefel Ewrop. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld ym mha ffordd y bydd hynny a rôl Cymru o fewn y broses honno yn datblygu.

Mae ond yn deg dweud bod un blaid yn y

this Assembly that unfortunately all too often displays xenophobia when it comes to European Union matters. I am referring to the Conservative Party—

**Jonathan Morgan and Alun Cairns** *rose*—

**John Griffiths:** In a moment, Jonathan. An intervention from Alun Cairns might be more appropriate than an intervention from Jonathan Morgan on this point. We all know that there are major divisions in the UK Conservative Party, as a whole in the UK and within the Conservative—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**John Griffiths:** In a moment, David.

**David Davies** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**John Griffiths:** I will give way in a moment, Deputy Presiding Officer. To whom, I do not know.

There are divisions. They may protest and I believe that they are about to protest too much. However, it is obvious to all of us that that is the case. We have too many—

**David Davies** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. He is not giving way.

**John Griffiths:** I will give way in a moment, I just want to reinforce this point.

Unfortunately, we have far too many little Englanders in Wales represented in the Assembly in the Conservative group—

**Jonathan Morgan:** We must recognise that we are doing ourselves a disservice if this debate strays away from being a sensible debate about European governance. There is a wide range of opinions within this Chamber. There are shades of opinions throughout political parties. We are foolish to expect one political party to have one view. Political parties and their members have a

Cynulliad hwn yn anffodus yn arddangos estrongasedd yn rhy aml pan ddaw i faterion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Cyfeiriaf at y Blaid Geidwadol—

**Jonathan Morgan ac Alun Cairns** *a gododd*—

**John Griffiths:** Mewn munud, Jonathan. Efallai y byddai ymyriad gan Alun Cairns yn fwy priodol nag ymyriad gan Jonathan Morgan ar y pwynt hwn. Gwyddom oll fod rhaniadau mawr ym Mhlaid Geidwadol y DU, yn gyffredinol yn y DU ac o fewn y Blaid Geidwadol—

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**John Griffiths:** Mewn munud, David.

**David Davies** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**John Griffiths:** Ildiaf mewn munud, Ddirprwy Lywydd. I bwy, ni wn.

Mae rhaniadau. Gallant brotestio a chredaf eu bod ar fin protestio gormod. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg i bawb ohonom mai felly y mae. Mae gennym ormod—

**David Davies** *a gododd*-

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw'n ildio.

**John Griffiths:** Ildiaf mewn munud, yr wyf am atgyfnerthu'r pwynt hwn.

Yn anffodus, mae gennym lawer gormod o bleidwyr Lloegr fechan yng Nghymru wedi eu cynrychioli yn y Cynulliad gan y grŵp Ceidwadol—

**Jonathan Morgan:** Rhaid inni gydnabod ein bod yn gwneud anghymwynas â ni ein hunain os bydd y ddadl yn crwydro oddi ar ddadl synhwyrol ar lywodraethu Ewrop. Mae barn eang ar hyn o fewn y Siambr hon. Mae pob arlliw barn mewn pleidiau gwleidyddol. Yr ydym yn wirion i ddisgwyl i un blaid wleidyddol arddel un farn. Mae pleidiau gwleidyddol a'u haelodau yn arddel

variety of views. I remind you that a Conservative Government took us into the European Community. A Conservative Prime Minister signed the Single European Act and a Conservative Prime Minister negotiated the Maastricht Treaty. The Conservative Party has made great gains in Europe on behalf of this country and those gains are for the peoples of Europe.

**John Griffiths:** I agree with that, but this debate should not pass without my points about the Conservative group's attitude to all matters within the European Union. That is deserved because of various pronouncements made on far too many occasions in our debates. A good example is last week's shambles in the debate on the euro when the leader of the Conservatives, Nick Bourne, referred to the successful launch of the euro even though an amendment was tabled by the Conservatives deleting the word 'success' from our description of that launch. That was a shambles.

**Nick Bourne:** What we said was that we wanted a successful launch for the euro. There is nothing shameful about that. I want other currencies to be a success because we trade with other countries. The point about it not being a success yet was that it was too early to say. Everybody in Britain should want it to be a success, but that does not mean that one necessarily wants to sign up to that currency. It is not a little Englander policy—there are plenty of people in your own party, Llew Smith, for example, who are against it. Let us recognise that there are divisions of opinion. Do not be belligerent. Your leader wants consensus, you should also want it. At least he said he wanted consensus, though there is little evidence of that. You would do well, particularly if you want a Cabinet post, to heed his advice.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You are well over time, John. You must wind up.

**John Griffiths:** I will wind up briefly. Thank

amrywiaeth barn. Fe'ch atgoffaf mai Llywodraeth Geidwadol a aeth â ni i'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd. Prif Weinidog Ceidwadol a lofnododd y Ddeddf Ewropeaidd Sengl a Phrif Weinidog Ceidwadol a lofnododd Gytundeb Maastricht. Sicrhaodd y Blaid Geidwadol enillion mawr yn Ewrop ar ran y wlad hon ac mae'r enillion hynny er budd pobl Ewrop.

**John Griffiths:** Cytunaf â hynny, ond ni ddylid gadael y ddadl hon heb dynnu sylw at fy mhwyntiau ynglŷn ag ymagwedd y grŵp Ceidwadol tuag at yr holl faterion o fewn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Mae hynny'n haeddiannol oherwydd y datganiadau amrywiol a wnaed ar ormod o achlysuron o lawer yn ein dadleuon. Enghraifft dda yw llanastr yr wythnos diwethaf yn y ddadl ar yr ewro pan gyfeiriodd arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr, Nick Bourne, at lansiad llwyddiannus yr ewro er i welliant gael ei gyflwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr yn dileu'r gair 'llwyddo' o'n disgrifiad o'r lansiad hwnnw. Llanastr oedd hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr hyn a ddywedasom oedd ein bod am i'r ewro gael ei lansio'n llwyddiannus. Nid oes dim yn gywilyddus ynglŷn â hynny. Yr wyf am i fathau eraill o arian fod yn llwyddiant gan ein bod yn masnachu gyda gwledydd eraill. Y pwynt ynglŷn â dweud nad oedd yn llwyddiant eto oedd ei bod yn rhy gynnar i ddweud hynny. Dylai pawb ym Mhrydain ddymuno iddo fod yn llwyddiant, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu o reidrwydd bod rhywun am ymrwymo i'r arian hwnnw. Nid polisi pleidwyr Lloegr fechan yw hyn—mae digon o bobl yn eich plaid eich hun, Llew Smith, er enghraifft, sydd yn ei erbyn. Gadewch inni sylweddoli fod gwahaniaethau barn. Peidiwch â bod yn gwerylgar. Mae eich arweinydd yn dymuno cael consensws, a dylech chi fod yn dymuno hynny hefyd. O leiaf dywedodd ei fod am gael consensws, er nad oes llawer o dystiolaeth o hynny. Byddai'n dda o beth i chi roi sylw i'w gyngor, yn arbennig os ydych am gael swydd yn y Cabinet.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cawsoc lawer gormod o amser yn barod, John. Rhaid ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**John Griffiths:** Dof i ben yn fuan. Diolch



you for that advice, Nick. I am just trying to encourage the Conservative group to adopt a more constructive attitude and be part of the consensus that is widely held among the other parties. This is an important debate and I look forward to seeing how the Assembly can continue to play a role in the unfolding process. I look forward to many more debates so that we can explore these matters, which are of great interest to everybody in Wales.

**Phil Williams:** Within a few years we will be in a union with a common currency in 27 full member states, six of them smaller than Wales. Therefore, the way the people of Wales's wishes are conveyed to the European Union, and the way we affect its decisions are of paramount importance in a debate on governance.

10:45 a.m.

There is an old Tory argument that in international affairs we are best served by the strong voice of the UK. Like all Tory arguments, it is easy to demolish: if there is agreement between England and Wales, then surely two independent voices are stronger than one. However, what if we disagree? That is not a hypothetical question. When I first stood as a candidate in a European election, 19 years ago, the main issue was milk quotas. In England, milk was a small part of agriculture, whereas in Wales it was the largest sector. Therefore, we had the position whereby a UK Minister, representing us at the council, argued strongly for the toughest cut in milk production. Our representative used his strong voice to damage the Welsh rural economy. In contrast, the Irish Taoiseach at that time, Garrett Fitzgerald, prevented quotas from being applied in the Republic of Ireland.

That pattern has often been repeated: for example, in the past, UK Governments—including the present Government—have pressed strongly for a strict limit to the budget for regional development and in negotiations on the future of structural funds after enlargement. The UK is likely to block proposals that offer full continued support for Objective 1 areas in existing member states.

ichi am y cyngor hwnnw, Nick. Yr wyf yn ceisio annog y grŵp Ceidwadol i fabwysiadu ymagwedd fwy adeiladol a bod yn rhan o'r consensws a arddelir yn gyffredinol ymhlith y pleidiau eraill. Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld sut y gall y Cynulliad barhau i chwarae rôl yn y broses sy'n datblygu. Edrychaf ymlaen at lawer mwy o ddadleuon fel y gallwn ymchwilio i'r materion hyn, sydd o ddiddordeb mawr i bawb yng Nghymru.

**Phil Williams:** Ymhen ychydig flynyddoedd byddwn mewn undeb arian cyffredin mewn 27 o aelod-wladwriaethau llawn, chwech ohonynt yn llai na Chymru. Felly, mae'r modd y cyflëir dymuniadau pobl Cymru i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, a'r modd yr effeithiwn ar ei benderfyniadau yn holl bwysig mewn dadl ar lywodraethu.

Mae yna hen ddadl Doriaidd ei bod yn well inni gael ein gwasanaethu gan lais cryf y DU mewn materion rhyngwladol. Fel pob dadl Doriaidd, mae'n hawdd ei threchu: os oes cytundeb rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, onid yw dau lais annibynnol yn gryfach nac un. Fodd bynnag, beth os ydym yn anghytuno? Nid yw hynny'n gwestiwn damcaniaethol. Pan sefais fel ymgeisydd am y tro cyntaf mewn etholiad Ewropeaidd, 19 mlynedd yn ôl, y prif fater oedd cwotâu llaeth. Yn Lloegr, yr oedd llaeth yn rhan fechan o amaethyddiaeth, er mai'r sector mwyaf ydoedd yng Nghymru. Felly, yr oedd gennym sefyllfa lle yr oedd Gweinidog y DU, a oedd yn ein cynrychioli ni yn y cyngor, yn dadlau'n gryf o blaid y cwtogiad llymaf ar gynhyrchu llaeth. Defnyddiodd ein cynrychiolydd ei lais cryf i wneud drwg i economi wledig Cymru. I'r gwrthwyneb, ataliodd y Taoiseach Gwyddelig ar y pryd, Garrett Fitzgerald, y cwotâu rhag cael eu defnyddio yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon.

Ailadroddwyd y patrwm hwnnw sawl gwaith: er enghraifft, yn y gorffennol, mae Llywodraethau'r DU—yn cynnwys y Llywodraeth bresennol—wedi pwyso'n gryf am roi terfyn caeth ar y gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu gwledig ac mewn negodiadau ar ddyfodol cronfeydd strwythurol ar ôl ehangu. Mae'r DU yn debygol o atal cynigion sy'n cynnig cymorth parhaus i ardaloedd Amcan 1

mewn aelod-wladwriaethau presennol.

Who speaks for Wales in all this? I disagree fundamentally with the First Minister when he says that our amendments are not relevant to the question of governance and ordinary people's alienation with the processes of Europe. Jocelyn referred to the Liège meeting of the conference of the regions with legislative power, which reaffirmed the demand for regional involvement in the debate on the future governance of Europe. However, it also demanded the right to make direct appeals to the European Court of Justice. The First Minister of Scotland signed the declaration to that effect, to the open and declared annoyance of the UK Government and, especially, of the Secretary of State for Foreign and Commonwealth Affairs, Jack Straw. However, in stark contrast to Scotland, our First Minister wrote to the conference, and I quote:

Pwy sy'n cynrychioli Cymru yn hyn i gyd? Anghytunaf yn y bôn â Phrif Weinidog Cymru pan ddywed nad yw ein gwelliannau yn berthnasol i'r mater o reolaeth a diethriad ynysiad pobl gyffredin oddi wrth brosesau Ewrop. Cyfeiriodd Jocelyn at gyfarfod Liège yng nghynhadledd y rhanbarthoedd â grym deddfwriaethol, a ailddatganodd y galw am gyfraniad rhanbarthol yn y ddadl ar sut y caiff Ewrop ei rheoli yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd hefyd yn galw am yr hawl i wneud apeliadau uniongyrchol i'r Llys Cyfiawnder Ewropeaidd. Llofnododd Prif Weinidog yr Alban y datganiad ar hynny, a gythruddodd Llywodraeth y DU yn amlwg a hysbys, ac yn arbennig, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Faterion Tramor a'r Gymanwlad, Jack Straw. Fodd bynnag, mewn cyferbyniad llwyr â'r Alban, ysgrifennodd ein Prif Weinidog ni at y gynhadledd, a dyfynaf yr hyn a ddywedodd:

'We have no ambitions for direct appeal to the Court of Justice.'

How well that expresses Rhodri Morgan's aspirations for Wales. However, his reason for rejecting this particular advance—at least his final reason—is worth noting. He claims that some regions, such as the richer German Länder or regions in northern Italy, are pressing for direct access to the Court of Justice to query their financial relationship with central governments and to reduce their contributions to poorer regions. That argument works two ways. I later discovered that the original thrust behind what, ironically, is called the Flanders declaration, came from Wallonia for precisely the opposite reason: to query the inadequate redistribution of finances to poorer regions. Clearly, that would be the position in Wales. With direct access to the European Court of Justice we could challenge the injustice of the Barnett formula for limiting the National Assembly's budget. We could challenge that, not only for Wales, but also on behalf of the north east of England and other deprived regions. We could certainly query the lack of additionality in the distribution of European structural funds. For the record, last year the Treasury received £69 million from Europe for projects in Wales, of which it passed £21 million on to Wales. These issues can only be

Mae hyn yn dangos dyheadau Rhodri Morgan i Gymru i'r dim. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth nodi ei reswm dros wrthod y datblygiad penodol hwn—o leiaf ei reswm terfynol. Honnodd fod rhai rhanbarthau, fel rhanbarthau cyfoethocach y Länder yn yr Almaen neu ranbarthau yng ngogledd yr Eidal, yn pwysu am fynediad uniongyrchol i'r Llys Cyfiawnder i gwestiynu eu perthynas ariannol â llywodraethau canolog ac i leihau eu cyfraniadau i ranbarthau tlotach. Mae'r ddadl hon yn gweithio'r ddwy ffordd. Canfûm yn ddiweddarach i'r ysgogiad gwreiddiol i'r hyn a elwid yn ddatganiad Fflandrys, yn eironig, ddod o Wallonia am reswm hollol wahanol: cwestiynu ailddosbarthiad annigonol yr arian i ranbarthoedd tlotach. Yn amlwg, dyna fyddai'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Gyda mynediad uniongyrchol i'r Llys Cyfiawnder Ewropeaidd gallem herio anghyfiawnder fformiwla Barnett ar gyfer cyfyngu ar gyllideb y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gallem herio hynny, nid yn unig i Gymru, ond hefyd ar ran gogledd ddwyrain Lloegr a rhanbarthau difreintiedig eraill. Gallem yn sicr gwestiynu'r diffyg ychwanegedd yn nosbarthiad cronfeydd strwythuredig Ewrop. Er gwybodaeth, derbyniodd y Trysorlys £69

challenged in Europe with a direct voice.

A direct voice for Wales in the institutions of the EU is of crucial importance for governance, and of crucial economic importance. Why, therefore, has our First Minister not joined the 51 regions of the Liège conference in demanding these powers and rights? I will ask one question: is there a conflict—as appeared in Scotland—between the interests of a nation such as Wales, and the interests of the centralised UK Labour Party? I urge our First Minister, in the discussions of future governance—and we must play the largest possible part in the consultation—always to put Wales's interests first.

**Mick Bates:** Like many other Members, I feel frustrated that we cannot influence many EU regulations. This White Paper reflects our frustrations because although it has clarity of purpose, it contains a substantial degree of self-criticism of the European process. Therefore, I will address those points and the legislative process in particular. On the whole, not only can we welcome this debate, but also the principles of good governance. None of us have any problems with that. However, it is when we come to the wider debate and how we deal with the regulatory process through the EU that I have certain reservations. We have a great opportunity to debate and discuss, as a devolved Government, how we wish to take our view forward in terms of legislation through this White Paper.

As other speakers have indicated, this issue is set against the background of wanting an increasingly decentralised Europe. However, at the same time, we acknowledge the increasing interdependence of Europe itself, particularly when you consider the great benefits, in terms of peace and prosperity that the establishment of the EU and its expansion will bring for the foreseeable future.

Welsh agriculture is a perfect example of the inherent tension between the desire to bring a local identity to bear through legislation and

miliwn y llynedd gan Ewrop ar gyfer prosiectau yng Nghymru, y trosglwyddodd £21 miliwn ohono i Gymru. Dim ond yn Ewrop, â llais uniongyrchol, y gellir herio'r materion hyn.

Mae llais uniongyrchol i Gymru yn sefydliadau'r UE yn hollbwysig i'r broses reoli, ac mae'n hollbwysig i'r economi hefyd. Felly, pam nad yw ein Prif Weinidog wedi ymuno â'r 51 rhanbarth yng nghynhadledd Liège a mynnu'r pwerau a'r hawliau hyn? Gofynnaf un cwestiwn: a oes gwrthdaro—fel yr ymddengys yn yr Alban—rhwng buddiannau gwlad fel Cymru a buddiannau'r Blaid Lafur yn llywodraeth ganolog y DU? Erfynaf ar ein Prif Weinidog, yn y trafodaethau ar reolaeth yn y dyfodol—a rhaid inni gyfranogi cymaint ag y gallwn yn yr ymgynghoriad—i roi buddiannau Cymru yn gyntaf bob amser.

**Mick Bates:** Fel llawer o Aelodau eraill, teimlaf yn rhwystredig na allwn ddylanwadu ar lawer o reoliadau'r UE. Adelewyrcha'r Papur Gwyn hwn ein rhwystredigaethau oherwydd er bod ganddo bwrpas clir, mae'n cynnwys cryn dipyn o hunan-feirniadaeth o'r broses Ewropeaidd. Felly, soniaf am y pwyntiau hynny a'r broses ddeddfwriaethol yn benodol. Ar y cyfan, dylem groesawu'r ddadl hon, ond dylem hefyd groesawu egwyddorion llywodraethu da. Nid oes gan yr un ohonom broblem gyda hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sy'n codi amheuan i mi yw'r ddadl ehangach ar sut i ddelio â'r broses reoliadol drwy'r UE. Mae gennym gyfle gwych i ddadlau a thrafod, fel Llywodraeth ddatganoledig, y modd yr hoffem leisio ein barn o ran deddfwriaeth drwy'r Papur Gwyn hwn.

Fel y soniodd y siaradwyr eraill, mae'r mater hwn wedi'i osod yn erbyn cefndir o ddymuno gweld Ewrop gynyddol ddatganoledig. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddwn ar yr un pryd ryngddibyniaeth gynyddol Ewrop ei hun, yn arbennig pan ystyriwch y manteision mawr, yn nhermau'r heddwch a ffyniant y bydd sefydlu'r UE a'i ehangu yn ei sicrhau hyd y gellir rhagweld.

Mae amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru yn enghraifft wych o'r tyndra cynhenid rhwng y dymuniad i sicrhau hunaniaeth leol drwy

the desire to have the protection of being part of a large trading block. During the foot and mouth disease crisis, we saw how significant it was to look to the EU and its leadership. Yet, so often the good things about the EU are lost because of the complexity of its regulatory process and its slowness. The EU would do well to learn from our early years and how we have taken policies forward because we have established a partnership process that has allowed detailed consultation on a particular subject with all players. That is what the EU must learn. If, as many people desire, there is a re-engagement of the EU with its 300 million citizens, it can only be achieved through good consultation on the regulatory process. We have had our own conflict with the EU, embodied in the debate on genetically modified organisms. In that debate, we wished to establish a different process, along with other EU member states and regions. However, our process was stalled because the EU did not respond quickly enough or it did not have the mechanisms to allow us to respond quickly and have our own local identity.

Wales's response to this White Paper should be to bring greater flexibility to the regulatory process. That depends, to a large extent, on 'ownership' of how that legislation is implemented. For example, consider how the legal process works in terms of the French ban on British beef, which continues despite the fact that it is illegal. Simple elements of justice must also be brought to the people as soon as possible. Otherwise, that delay based on the confusion that comes from complexity leads to a great dislike of the institution.

Finally, we must ensure that we set the standard because too much regulation is far too detailed. I implore that our response ensures regulatory impact assessments on all EU regulations. Far too often, small businesses, in particular, are burdened by this process. It is time that regulatory impact assessments were undertaken in detail on EU regulations. Prosperity and sustainability are

ddeddfwriaeth a'r dymuniad i gael y diogelwch a ddaw yn sgîl bod yn rhan o floc masnachu mawr. Yn ystod argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau, gwelsom pa mor bwysig oedd dibynnu ar yr UE am ei arweinyddiaeth. Ac eto, collir y pethau sy'n dda am yr UE yn aml oherwydd natur gymhleth ei broses reoliadol a'i natur araf. Byddai'n fuddiol i'r UE ddysgu o'n blynyddoedd cynnar ni a'r modd yr ydym wedi datblygu polisiau am ein bod wedi sefydlu proses bartneriaeth sydd wedi caniatáu ymgynghori manwl ar bwnc penodol gyda phawb sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef. Dyna sy'n rhaid i'r UE ei ddysgu. Os ailgysylltir yr UE â'i 300 miliwn o ddiynasyddion, sef rhywbeth y mae llawer o bobl am ei weld, dim ond drwy ymgynghoriad da ar y broses reoliadol y gellir cyflawni hynny. Cawsom ein gwrthdaro ein hunain gyda'r UE, yn arbennig yn y ddadl ar organebau a addaswyd yn enetig. Yn y ddadl honno yr oeddem am sefydlu proses wahanol, ynghyd ag aelod wladwriaethau a rhanbarthau eraill yr UE. Fodd bynnag, ataliwyd ein proses am nad ymatebodd yr UE yn ddigon cyflym ac nid oedd ganddo'r gweithdrefnau i'n galluogi i ymateb yn gyflym a chael ein hunaniaeth ein hunain.

Dylai ymateb Cymru i'r Papur Gwyn hwn sicrhau mwy o hyblygrwydd yn y broses reoleiddio. Mae hynny'n dibynnu, i raddau helaeth, ar 'berchenogaeth' o'r modd y gweithredir y ddeddfwriaeth honno. Er enghraifft, ystyriwch sut y mae'r broses gyfreithiol yn gweithio yn nhermau gwaharddiad Ffrainc ar gig eidion Prydeinig, sy'n parhau er gwaethaf y ffaith ei fod yn anghyfreithlon. Rhaid cyflwyno elfennau cyfiawnder syml i'r bobl hefyd cyn gynted â phosibl. Neu fel arall, bydd yr oedi hwnnw, ar sail y dryswch a ddaw yn sgîl cymhlethdod, yn arwain at gasineb tuag at y sefydliad.

Yn olaf, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gosod y safon gan fod gormod o'r rheoliadau'n rhy fanwl. Erfyniaf arnoch i sicrhau bod ein hymateb yn sicrhau asesiadau effaith rheoliadol ar holl reoliadau'r UE. Yn rhy aml o lawer, mae'r broses hon yn faich, yn arbennig, ar fusnesau bach. Mae'n hen bryd i asesiadau effaith rheoliadol manwl gael eu cynnal ar reoliadau'r UE. Mae proses yr UE

often defeated by the EU process.

yn aml yn trechu ffyniant a chynaliadwyedd.

10:55 a.m.

**Alun Cairns:** Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer, for giving me the opportunity to contribute to this debate. None of my comments should be interpreted as xenophobic. I speak in the interests of Wales, Britain and Europe, without forgetting our natural Commonwealth links, and the links with our friends in North America. I was disappointed that John Griffiths chose to use that phrase, and I will raise a point of order after the debate—with your permission, Deputy Presiding Officer—on whether accusations of xenophobia are in order in the Chamber. Jonathan Morgan was clear when he said that he is Welsh, British and European. I consider myself to be in the same school. However, that does not reject nor neglect our links with our Commonwealth cousins and our North American partners.

**Alun Cairns:** Diolch ichi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, am roi'r cyfle imi gyfrannu i'r ddadl hon. Ni ddylid dehongli unrhyw rai o'm sylwadau yn rhai senoffobig. Siaradaf er budd Cymru, Prydain ac Ewrop, heb anghofio ein cysylltiadau naturiol â'r Gymanwlad, a'r cysylltiadau â'n cyfeillion yng Ngogledd America. Mae'r ffaith bod John Griffiths wedi dewis yr ymadrodd hwnnw'n peri siom imi, a chodaf bwynt o drefn ar ôl y ddadl—gyda'ch caniatâd chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd—o ran pa un a yw honiadau o senoffobia mewn trefn yn y Siambr. Yr oedd Jonathan Morgan yn bendant pan ddisgrifiodd ei hun fel Cymro, Prydeiniwr ac Ewropead. Ystyriaf fy hun yn yr un modd. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n gwrthod nac yn esgeuluso ein cysylltiadau â'n cefndryd yn y Gymanwlad a'n partneriaid yng Ngogledd America.

The White Paper, in principle, is to be welcomed as a move toward improving governance of European institutions. Any measures to inspire confidence in European institutions should be welcomed; they can be built upon. In Mike German's words, European Union institutions are seen as 'bossy' and 'undemocratic'. I would have said that people are concerned about fraud, inefficiency and the heavy-handed approach that appears to come from Brussels.

Dylid croesawu'r Papur Gwyn, mewn egwyddor, fel ffordd ymlaen tuag at wella'r modd y rheolir sefydliadau Ewropeaidd. Dylid croesawu unrhyw fesurau sy'n ennyn hyder mewn sefydliadau Ewropeaidd; gellir adeiladu arnynt. Yng ngeiriau Mike German, ystyrir bod sefydliadau Ewropeaidd yn 'awdurdodol' ac 'annemocrataidd'. Byddwn i wedi dweud bod pobl yn poeni am dwyll, aneffeithlonrwydd a'r ymagwedd ormesol a ddaw o Frwsel yn ôl pob tebyg.

Openness and accountability are two of the document's central principles, but this is not how our European institutions have acted and reacted in recent times. In Mike German's phraseology, stitch-ups come to mind when we think of Commissioner Edith Cresson, who was recently found guilty of committing fraud in the European Commission, and how that matter was dealt with. Openness and accountability clearly were not on the agenda at that time.

Mae bod yn agored ac yn atebol yn ddwy o brif egwyddorion y ddogfen, ond nid yw ein sefydliadau Ewropeaidd wedi gweithredu nac wedi ymateb fel hyn yn ddiweddar. Gan ddefnyddio iaith Mike German, daw'r gair twyll i'r meddwl pan ystyriwn y Comisiynydd Edith Cresson, a ganfuwyd yn euog yn ddiweddar o gyflawni twyll yn y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, a sut yr ymdriniwyd â'r mater hwnnw. Mae'n amlwg nad oedd bod yn agored ac yn atebol ar yr agenda bryd hynny.

The principles are welcome. However, they can be interpreted and acted upon in many different ways. It is rare that I agree with Mick Bates, but he highlighted clear examples of European law being flouted,

Dylid croesawu'r egwyddorion. Fodd bynnag, gellir eu dehongli a gweithredu arnynt mewn sawl gwahanol ffordd. Anaml iawn y cytunaf â Mick Bates, ond nododd enghreifftiau clir o gyfraith Ewrop yn cael ei

such as the ban on British beef in France, and important points relating to regulatory appraisal. The White Paper indicates that fewer pieces of legislation are likely to come from Brussels. However, we have not seen that policy in practice recently. It is quite the reverse—the European Union is exercising more regulation and influencing our competitiveness in the global market.

Flexibility is another key word in the document. It seems to have been a dirty word in Europe recently, when successive governments have called for flexibility in different areas. John Major managed to secure some form of flexibility in gaining our opt-out of the social chapter, but the same measures were introduced under the health and safety chapter instead. That meant that Europe got its way and the United Kingdom found itself a victim of the stitch-ups and inflexibility.

Clearly, we could enter a constitutional crisis if the European Union seeks to form strong bilateral agreements with a regional government, such as the Assembly. In future, one party may control the Assembly and a different party may control the United Kingdom Parliament. We need to be aware of the possible tensions. What will be the position of the Assembly, the UK Parliament, and the European Union at that time? I do not speak wholly against bilateral agreements, but this matter needs to be considered in terms of any agreements that we may encounter. What stance will the UK Parliament take at that time, and what will the agreements be in terms of resolving such difficulties?

In closing, I remind John Griffiths, and my Labour and Plaid Cymru colleagues, that the Conservative Party has always fought a pro-European agenda. That is in contrast to the First Minister who, at the 1983 general election, would have been campaigning to withdraw from Europe. Plaid Cymru would also have been campaigning in a similar vein, if not in 1983, then previously. The Conservative Party has always wanted to be in Europe, but never to be run by Europe.

diystyru, fel y gwaharddiad ar gig eidion o Brydain yn Ffrainc, a'r pwyntiau pwysig sy'n ymwneud â gwerthusiad rheoliadol. Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn nodi y bydd yn debygol y daw llai o ddeddfwriaethau o Frwsel. Fodd bynnag, ni welsom y polisi hwnnw'n cael ei weithredu'n ddiweddar. I'r gwrthwyneb—mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn arfer mwy o reoliadau ac yn dylanwadu ar ein natur gystadleuol yn y farchnad fyd-eang.

Mae hyblygrwydd yn air allweddol arall yn y ddogfen. Ymddengys mai gair budr ydoedd yn Ewrop yn ddiweddar, pan alwodd sawl llywodraeth am hyblygrwydd mewn gwahanol feysydd. Llwyddodd John Major i sicrhau rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd o ran sicrhau ein dewis i eithrio o'r bennod gymdeithasol, ond ar yr un pryd cyflwynwyd mesurau o dan y bennod iechyd a diogelwch yn lle hynny. Sicrhaodd hyn y cafodd Ewrop ei ffordd ei hun a bod y Deyrnas Unedig yn dioddef y twyll a'r anhyblygrwydd.

Yn amlwg, galleu ddechrau argyfwng cyfansoddiadol pe bai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ceisio llunio cytundebau dwyochrog cadarn gyda llywodraeth ranbarthol, fel y Cynulliad. Yn y dyfodol, efallai y bydd un blaid yn rheoli'r Cynulliad a phlaid arall yn rheoli Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r tyndra posibl. Beth fydd sefyllfa'r Cynulliad, Senedd y DU, a'r Undeb Ewropeaidd bryd hynny? Nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu cytundebau dwyochrog yn llwyr, ond mae angen ystyried y mater hwn yn nhermau unrhyw gytundebau y gallem ddod ar eu traws. Beth fydd safbwynt Senedd y DU bryd hynny, a beth fydd y cytundebau yn nhermau datrys anawsterau o'r fath?

I gloi, hoffwn atgoffa John Griffiths, a'm cyd-Aelodau yn y blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru, bod y Blaid Geidwadol wastad wedi ymladd dros agenda o blaid Ewrop. Mae hynny'n wahanol o'i gymharu â Phrif Weinidog Cymru a fyddai, yn etholiad cyffredinol 1983 wedi bod yn ymgyrchu i adael Ewrop. Byddai Plaid Cymru hefyd wedi ymgyrchu mewn ffordd debyg, os nad ym 1983, yna yn gynharach na hynny. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi dymuno bod yn Ewrop erioed, ond heb ein rheoli gan Ewrop.

**Janet Davies:** In opening this debate, the First Minister claimed that it was nothing to do with enlargement. I was the only Assembly Member to attend a seminar discussing the White Paper on governance in Brussels last February. Several times during that seminar, it was stated that enlargement has brought the unresolved problems in the European Union's structure and operation into sharp profile. The First Minister also mentioned what I hope I can paraphrase as 'backroom fixing' by Prime Ministers as one existing problem. This is surely the opportunity to resolve many of those problems.

Plaid Cymru supports the concept of the European Union and fully recognises its value in preventing European wars over the past half century. It gives the opportunity to take decisions at the most appropriate level of government. There cannot be any case now for the outdated and rigid concept of a nineteenth-century nation state as the only form of government.

It is obvious that we need the greatest possible participation and involvement in the union. We should fight for fairness and equitable conditions and for our own country. We should fight to increase the level of democracy within the union.

We all know that the Council of Ministers takes the major decisions. This is a hierarchical form of representation. More power should be given to the European Parliament. However, fairer representation is also required in the Parliament. Equally weighted votes for all citizens should be implemented further than it is at present, although I am not saying that it could be fully implemented.

At present, the Committee of the Regions merely replicates member states' shares in parliamentary seats, instead of giving small nations and regions a forum to enable them to compensate for other proportional disadvantages. The committee currently reinforces those disadvantages. John Griffiths said that there is nothing clear in the proposals for the Committee of the Regions.

**Janet Davies:** Wrth agor y ddadl hon, honnodd y Prif Weinidog nad oedd gan hyn unrhyw beth i'w wneud ag ehangu. Fi oedd yr unig Aelod o'r Cynulliad a fynychodd seminar a oedd yn trafod y Papur Gwyn ar reolaeth ym Mrwsel fis Chwefror diwethaf. Nodwyd sawl gwaith yn ystod y seminar hwnnw bod ehangu wedi amlygu'r problemau a achosodd hyn i strwythur a dull gweithredu'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, problemau nas datryswyd. Soniodd y Prif Weinidog hefyd am yr hyn yr wyf am ei aralleirio fel 'datrys materion yn y stafell gefn' gan Brif Weinidogion fel un broblem sy'n bodoli. Mae hwn yn gyfle euraidd i ddatrys llawer o'r problemau hynny.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi cysyniad yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac yn cydnabod ei werth yn llawn o ran atal rhyfeloedd Ewropeaidd yn ystod yr hanner canrif ddiwethaf. Rhydd gyfle i wneud penderfyniadau ar y lefel fwyaf priodol o lywodraeth. Nid oes unrhyw gyfiawnhad erbyn hyn dros y cysyniad hen ffasiwn ac anhyblyg o genedl-wladwriaeth o'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg fel yr unig ddull o lywodraethu.

Mae'n amlwg bod angen sicrhau'r cyfranogiad a'r ymwneud mwyaf posibl yn yr undeb. Dylem ymladd am degwch ac amodau cyfartal ac ymladd dros ein gwlad ein hunain. Dylem frwydro i gynyddu lefel democratiaeth o fewn yr undeb.

Gwyddom oll mai Cyngor y Gweinidogion sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau pwysig. Mae hyn yn ddull hierarchaidd o gynrychiolaeth. Dylid rhoi mwy o bŵer i Senedd Ewrop. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cynrychiolaeth deg hefyd yn y Senedd. Dylid gweithredu pleidleisiau cyfartal i bob dinesydd ymhellach nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd, er nad wyf yn dweud y gellid ei weithredu'n llwyr.

Ar hyn o bryd, y cyfan a wna Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yw atgynhyrchu cyfran yr aelod-wladwriaethau o'r seddi seneddol, yn hytrach na darparu fforwm i wledydd bychain a rhanbarthau i'w digolledu am anfanteision cyfrannol eraill. Mae'r pwyllgor yn atgyfnerthu'r anfanteision hynny ar hyn o bryd. Dywedodd John Griffiths nad oes unrhyw beth yn glir yn y cynigion ar gyfer

However, it is worth spending a few minutes considering some of those proposals and how they could help Wales. The White Paper refers to enhancing the committee's role by giving it a more active part in examining policy, rather than responding to it after it has been proposed. The White Paper also notes that the committee should be able to review the local and regional impact of some directives. That may not be an enormous change, but it is a step forward.

Other specific actions include organising the exchange of best practice on the involvement of local and regional authorities before decisions are made. Plaid Cymru has long identified this as a weakness, and we welcome the proposal. Action is needed to enhance the role of small nations, and regions at member state and European Union level. Mechanisms must be established to ensure that the views of these areas are fed into the legislative process. The UK Government could foster this approach, either by using the European format for its Joint Ministerial Committee meetings or by calling meetings of its official sub-committee. All the UK nations should be involved in that.

Small nations and regions should have the opportunity to participate directly in preparatory work for the intergovernmental conference in 2004 by having representation in its convention. We also favour the representation of these areas in a second chamber, rather than this being left for the member states only.

When I attended the seminar last year, one thing about the discussion disturbed me. It is vital that the central European countries enter on terms that will allow them to become as prosperous as existing members. Setting conditions and directing funds so that these countries end up as second class members for the foreseeable future is morally wrong and exceedingly unwise. That must be taken on board by the European Union in the organisation of its governance and its allocation of funds.

Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth treulio ychydig funudau yn ystyried rhai o'r cynigion hyn a sut y gallent helpu Cymru. Cyfeiria'r Papur Gwyn at atgyfnerthu rôl y pwyllgor drwy roi swyddogaeth fwy gweithredol iddo o ran archwilio polisi, yn hytrach nag ymateb iddo ar ôl iddo gael ei gynnig. Noda'r Papur Gwyn hefyd y dylai'r pwyllgor allu adolygu effaith leol a rhanbarthol rhai o'r cyfarwyddbau. Efallai na fyddai hyn yn newid mawr, ond mae'n gam ymlaen.

Ymhlith y camau gweithredu penodol eraill mae trefnu'r broses o gyfnewid arfer gorau o ran cyfraniad awdurdodau lleol a rhanbarthol cyn y gwneir penderfyniadau. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi nodi hyn fel gwendid ers peth amser, a chroesawn y cynnig. Mae angen gweithredu er mwyn cynyddu rôl gwledydd bach a rhanbarthau ar lefel aelod-wladwriaethau ac ar lefel yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Rhaid sefydlu gweithdrefnau i sicrhau y bwydir safbwyntiau'r ardaloedd hyn i'r broses ddeddfwriaethol. Gallai Llywodraeth y DU feithrin yr ymagwedd hon, naill ai drwy ddefnyddio'r fformat Ewropeaidd ar gyfer ei gyfarfodydd Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion neu drwy alw cyfarfodydd ei is-bwyllgor swyddogol. Dylai holl wledydd y DU fod â rhan yn hynny.

Dylai gwledydd bach a rhanbarthau gael cyfle i gyfranogi'n uniongyrchol yn y gwaith paratoadol ar gyfer y gynhadledd rynglywodraethol yn 2004 drwy gael cynrychiolaeth yn ei chonfensiwn. Yr ydym hefyd o blaid sicrhau cynrychiolaeth ar gyfer yr ardaloedd hyn mewn ail siambr, yn hytrach na gadael hyn ar gyfer yr aelod-wladwriaethau yn unig.

Pan fynychais y seminar y llynedd, perodd un peth am y drafodaeth boen meddwl imi. Mae'n hanfodol bod gwledydd canol Ewrop yn ymuno ar delerau a fydd yn eu galluogi i ddatblygu yr un mor ffyniannus â'r aelodau presennol. Mae'n anghywir yn foisol ac yn annoeth iawn i osod amodau a chyfeirio arian er mwyn peri bod y gwledydd hyn yn aelodau eilradd hyd y gellir rhagweld. Rhaid i'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ystyried hynny wrth drefnu'r ffordd y caiff ei reoli ac wrth iddo ddyrannu arian.



**Rosemary Butler:** I will follow on from the excellent points made by Janet and I will talk specifically about the report. The EU faces the same problems as the Assembly. Most people understand the workings of Westminster and local government but, unfortunately, they do not seem to understand the workings of the Assembly or the EU. Both are relatively new institutions. Both institutions also have considerable powers to influence people's lives for the better, but elections, consultations, debates and decisions are not widely reported. As a result, many people see both institutions as remote and, at the same time, intrusive.

**Rosemary Butler:** Hoffwn ddilyn ymlaen o'r pwyntiau gwych a wnaeth Janet a siaradaf yn benodol am yr adroddiad. Mae'r UE yn wynebu'r un problemau â'r Cynulliad. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn deall sut y mae San Steffan a llywodraeth leol yn gweithio ond, yn anffodus, nid ydynt yn deall sut mae'r Cynulliad na'r UE yn gweithio. Mae'r naill a'r llall yn sefydliadau eithaf newydd. Mae gan y ddau sefydliad bwerau sylweddol hefyd i ddylanwadu ar fywydau pobl er gwell, ond ni roddir llawer o sylw i etholiadau, ymgynghoriadau, dadleuon a phenderfyniadau. O ganlyniad, mae llawer o bobl yn ystyried y naill sefydliad a'r llall fel sefydliadau anghysbell ac, ar yr un pryd, busneslyd.

11:05 a.m

This European report is refreshing in recognising the difficulties facing the EU, and in trying to gain wider acceptance and recognition of it by the people of Europe. Assembly Members should read the report carefully. It will be of particular interest to see what can be learned from this exercise in terms of increasing involvement and public participation, particularly in the formation of more relevant policies.

Mae'r adroddiad Ewropeaidd hwn yn wahanol am ei fod yn cydnabod yr anawsterau sy'n wynebu'r UE, ac yn ceisio sicrhau bod mwy o bobl Ewrop yn ei dderbyn ac yn ei gydnabod. Dylai Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddarllen yr adroddiad yn ofalus. Bydd o ddiddordeb arbennig inni weld yr hyn y gellir ei ddysgu o'r ymarfer hwn o ran cyfranogiad cynyddol a chyfranogiad y cyhoedd, yn arbennig o ran llunio polisiau mwy perthnasol.

However, the crucial point being made this morning—this is not just relevant to this morning's debate, but is an ongoing issue—is the future role of the Assembly in an expanding European Union. I believe that the Committee on European and External Affairs' work must be reflected more widely across the work of the whole Assembly. We must take every opportunity possible to promote Wales and its profile across Europe.

Fodd bynnag, y pwynt holl bwysig a wneir y bore yma—ac mae hyn yn fater parhaus yn hytrach na mater sydd ond yn berthnasol i'r ddadl y bore yma—yw rôl y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol mewn Undeb Ewropeaidd sy'n ehangu. Credaf fod yn rhaid i waith y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol gael ei adlewyrchu'n fwy cyffredinol yn holl waith y Cynulliad. Rhaid inni achub ar bob cyfle posibl i hyrwyddo Cymru a'i phroffil ledled Ewrop.

I welcome this report and I look forward to taking over from John Griffiths on the European Union's newly strengthened Committee of the Regions.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn ac edrychaf ymlaen at gymryd yr awenau oddi ar John Griffiths ar Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, a atgyfnerthwyd yn ddiweddar.

**Glyn Davies:** I had not intended to contribute to this debate, but I have been inspired to do so by some good contributions from colleagues in the Chamber.

**Glyn Davies:** Nid oeddwn wedi bwriadu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon, ond fe'm hysbrydolwyd i wneud hynny gan rai cyfraniadau da a wnaed gan gyd-Aelodau yn y Siambr.

I envy the certainty that many Members seem to have about European Union issues. To me these issues are the great questions of our time, and many do not seem to me to have black or white answers. So often these seem to me to be grey areas, and I envy other Members' certainty.

Normally, I am suspicious when the European Union wishes to impose on what seems to me to be a British issue. Yet for the last month I have been involved, with the leader of the Conservatives in the European Union, in seeking a committee of inquiry into the management of foot and mouth disease in Britain. That was agreed yesterday, and I welcome and am pleased about that. I wanted that to be done, and the British Government was not doing it. However, there is a conflict in that I might, on another day, view it as a somewhat suspicious trend, and might not welcome EU involvement on another matter. Therefore, in my view, these are grey areas.

One important proposal in this paper relates to openness. There must be a genuine attempt to engage at a European level. The European Union has contributed greatly to the loss of interest in politics in Britain because it is so difficult to understand what is happening in the European Union. Whenever you raise the issue with most people, their eyes glaze over. In the Conservative Party there has been much more of a genuine discussion of these issues. Sometimes people will respond to that in the way that John Griffiths did earlier; it was silly and the stuff of knock-about. The truth is that we have engaged with this issue and other parties have not. They have tended to be dominated by their party leaderships and have not engaged with the real problems. We have suffered for that in elections, and people have taken advantage of Conservative Party members' genuinely held views. It has disguised the fact that we have a genuine commitment to good healthcare and good education and transport services. That is sometimes forgotten in elections because we talk about the European issue and nobody

Yr wyf yn genfigennus o bendantrwydd llawer o'r Aelodau ynglŷn â materion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. I mi y materion hyn yw cwestiynau mawr ein hoes, ac nid ymddengys i mi bod atebion du neu wyn i lawer ohonynt. Ymddengys y rhain imi yn aml yn faterion y mae ansicrwydd yn eu cylch, ac yr wyf yn eiddigeddus o bendantrwydd yr Aelodau eraill.

Fel arfer, yr wyf yn llawn amheuaeth pan fo'r Undeb Ewropeaidd yn dymuno dylanwadu ar rywbeth sy'n ymddangos i mi fel mater i Brydain. Ond bŵm yn gweithio gydag arweinydd y Ceidwadwyr yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn ystod y mis diwethaf, gan geisio trefnu pwyllgor i ymchwilio i'r ffordd y rheolwyd clwy'r traed a'r genau ym Mhrydain. Cytunwyd ar hynny ddoe, a chroesawaf hynny ac yr wyf yn falch o weld hynny. Yr oeddwn am i hynny gael ei gyflawni ac nid oedd Llywodraeth Prydain yn gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, ceir gwrthdaro yn yr ystyr y byddwn, ar ddiwrnod arall, yn ei ystyried yn duedd braidd yn amheus ac efallai na fyddwn yn croesawu cyfraniad yr UE ar fater arall. Felly, yn fy marn i, mae'r rhain yn faterion ansicr.

Cyfeiria un cynnig pwysig yn y papur hwn at fod yn agored. Rhaid cael ymgais wirioneddol i gyfranogi ar lefel Ewropeaidd. Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi cyfrannu llawer i'r diffyg diddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth a geir ym Mhrydain am ei bod mor anodd i ddeall beth sy'n digwydd yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd. Pryd bynnag y codwch y mater gyda'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, collant ddiddordeb. Mae'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi trafod y materion hyn mewn mwy o ddyfnder. Weithiau bydd pobl yn ymateb i hynny yn yr un ffordd ag y gwnaeth John Griffiths yn gynharach; yr oedd yn wirion ac yn gecrus. Y gwirionedd yw ein bod ni wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ac nid yw pleidiau eraill wedi gwneud hynny. Maent yn dueddol o fod wedi cael eu dylanwadu gan arweinwyr eu plaid ac nid ydynt wedi mynd i'r afael â'r problemau gwirioneddol. Yr ydym wedi dioddef mewn etholiadau yn sgîl hyn, ac mae pobl wedi manteisio ar safbwyntiau dilys aelodau o'r Blaid Geidwadol. Mae wedi cuddio'r ffaith bod gennym ymrwymiad gwirioneddol tuag at

else does. In Wales, people have forgotten that we are the party that has long been committed to the promotion of the Welsh language and culture. To some extent our commitment to these issues has been disguised.

Openness is a real problem because of the extent of the British Government's contribution. The big issue at present—and it is not directly related to what we have been discussing today—is the euro. We all know that the euro is a political step forward for Europe—everybody in Europe and probably everybody in this Chamber knows that—and yet all of us watch British Government Ministers trumpeting about five tests. It is nothing but a public relations exercise and yet we accept it. We expect the British people to be able to engage with European issues and understand what is happening, when the Government's approach to the most important issue that we face in Britain today is made on a totally false premise. The Government of this country, and all those who support it, seem to accept that. It is totally unacceptable.

I fear a debate on the great question of the euro where, on the one side, you have an emotional attachment to the British currency and, on the other, unsubstantiated economic facts quoted without justification. For example, Phil Williams talked about where the responsibility for the milk quota should lie; what he said was erroneous. Ron Davies talked of it being inevitable, as if that were a reason in favour of it. Jocelyn made similar comments about Wales being left behind. She did not say how. These statements are made as if we should automatically accept them without the case being properly argued.

I will touch on another subject; I can see that time is running out. When I do not have notes, Dirprwy Lywydd, my time runs out quickly. The subject is subsidiarity—the freedom of states to take action to suit them where that is possible. I hope that, when the First Minister represents the Assembly, he takes that forward. Together with openness, it

ofal iechyd da a gwasanaethau addysg a chludiant da. Anghofir hynny weithiau mewn etholiadau am ein bod yn trafod y mater Ewropeaidd ac nid yw unrhyw un arall yn gwneud hynny. Yng Nghymru, mae pobl wedi anghofio mai ni yw'r blaid sydd wedi ymrwmo ers tro byd i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg a'i diwylliant. I ryw raddau, cuddiwyd ein hymrwymiad i'r materion hyn.

Mae bod yn agored yn broblem wirioneddol oherwydd graddau cyfraniad y Llywodraeth Brydeinig. Y mater pwysig ar hyn o bryd—ac nid oes ganddo gysylltiad uniongyrchol â'r hyn a drafodwyd heddiw—yw'r ewro. Gwyddom oll fod yr ewro yn gam gwleidyddol ymlaen i Ewrop—fe w'yr pawb yn Ewrop ac yn y Siambr hynny mae'n debyg—ac eto yr ydym oll yn gweld y Llywodraeth Brydeinig yn pwysleisio'r pum prawf. Dim ond ymarfer mewn cysylltiadau cyhoeddus ydyw ac eto yr ydym yn ei dderbyn. Disgwyliwn i bobl Prydain allu cymryd rhan mewn materion Ewropeaidd a deall beth sy'n digwydd, tra bod ymagwedd y Llywodraeth tuag at y mater pwysicaf a wynebwn ym Mhrydain heddiw yn cael ei gwneud ar sail gwbl ffug. Mae Llywodraeth y wlad hon, a'r rhai sy'n ei chefnogi, yn derbyn hynny mae'n debyg. Mae'n gwbl annerbyniol.

Ofnaf y ceir dadl ar fater pwysig yr ewro lle, ar y naill law, mae gennyh ymlyniad emosiynol wrth arian Prydain ac, ar y llaw arall, ffeithiau economaidd di-sail a ddyfynnwyd heb gyfiawnhad. Er enghraifft, gofynnodd Phil Williams pwy ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am y cwota llaeth; yr oedd yr hyn a ddywedodd yn anghywir. Dywedodd Ron Davies y byddai hyn yn anochel, fel bo hynny'n reswm dros fod o'i blaid. Gwnaeth Jocelyn sylwadau tebyg am Gymru'n cael ei gadael ar ôl. Ni ddywedodd sut. Gwneir y datganiadau hyn fel pe dylem eu derbyn yn awtomatig heb drafod y mater yn briodol.

Soniaf yn fyr am bwnc arall; gwelaf fod amser yn brin. Pan nad oes nodiadau gennyf, Ddirprwy Lywydd, daw fy amser i ben yn gyflym. Y pwnc yw is-reolaeth—rhyddid gwledydd i weithredu mewn ffordd sy'n addas iddynt hwy lle bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl. Pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn cynrychioli'r Cynulliad, gobeithiaf y bydd yn

is the key way in which the European Union should develop. State aids are increasingly being used unnecessarily to control what we do in Wales. Those are the two great issues that the First Minister can take forward on which he will find everybody in the Assembly standing behind him.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn ystod y ddadl mae llawer wedi dweud bod hyn yn fater pwysig; ategaf hynny. Mae'n braf gweld consensws yn y sefydliad hwn ynglŷn â'r angen i Gymru chwarae rhan lawn o fewn Ewrop. Gadewch inni beidio â thwylo ein hunain; ni fydd yn rhwydd i wlad fach fel Cymru gyfrannu at ddatblygiadau yn Ewrop. Soniodd Ron Davies am y newidiadau sydd yn digwydd a'r angen inni ailasesu ein cysyniadau am sofraniaeth. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig, o fewn y broses o newid, y caiff buddiannau Cymru eu hamddiffyn.

Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn golygu nad oes angen i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyfeirio at faterion Ewropeaidd. Nid oes cyfrifoldeb ar Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i hysbysu'r cyhoedd o faterion Ewropeaidd nac i hybu diddordeb neu drafodaeth ar faterion o'r fath. Nid yw Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn caniatáu yr un cyfrifoldeb i Gymru o ran cynnal ac amddiffyn buddiannau Cymru yn Ewrop ag a ganiateir i Senedd Ewrop. Mewn sefyllfa felly, mae'n bwysig bod gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cymru ewyllys gref i sicrhau y caiff llais Cymru ei glywed yn Ewrop.

Ni fydd yn rhwydd i Gymru chwarae rhan lawn yn Ewrop, ond nid yw'n amhosibl iddi wneud hynny. Yn ddiweddar, ceisiodd y Cynulliad am arian Ewropeaidd i ddatblygu cynlluniau datblygu cynaliadwy—o ganlyniad i welliant Plaid Cymru—a llwyddodd. Bellach, mae Cymru ar flaen y gad yn Ewrop ym maes creu cymunedau cynaliadwy, datblygu economi cynaliadwy a sicrhau bod ein gwasanaethau'n gynaliadwy. Nid oes dim yn bwysicach o ran dyfodol Cymru a dyfodol Ewrop. Mae Cymru ar flaen y gad oherwydd iddi benderfynu mentro ar fater lle yr oedd cyfle i wlad fach fel Cymru

cyflwyno hynny. Ochr yn ochr â bod yn agored, dyma'r ffordd allweddol y dylai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ddatblygu. Defnyddir cymhorthion y wladwriaeth fwyfwy yn ddiangen i reoli'r hyn a wnawn yng Nghymru. Dyma'r ddau fater pwysicaf y gall y Prif Weinidog eu datblygu a chredaf y bydd yn gweld bod pawb yn y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** During this debate many speakers have referred to the importance of this issue; I endorse that. It is good to see consensus in this establishment on the need for Wales to play a full role in Europe. Let us not deceive ourselves; it will not be easy for a small country like Wales to contribute to developments in Europe. Ron Davies mentioned the changes that are taking place and the need for us to reassess our perceptions of sovereignty. That is important. It is exceptionally important that, in the process of change, Wales's interests are protected.

The Government of Wales Act 1998 places no obligation on the National Assembly to refer to European matters. The National Assembly for Wales does not have a duty to inform the public of European matters, nor to promote interest in or discussion of such matters. The Government of Wales Act 1998 does not allow Wales the same responsibility in terms of upholding and protecting Wales's interests in Europe as that allowed to the European Parliament. In such a situation, it is important that the will exists within the National Assembly for Wales and the Government of Wales to ensure that Wales's voice is heard in Europe.

It will not be easy for Wales to play a full role in Europe, but it is not impossible to do so. Recently, the Assembly applied for European funding to develop sustainable development schemes—as the result of a Plaid Cymru amendment—and was successful in that application. Now, Wales is leading the way in Europe on this important issue of creating sustainable communities, developing a sustainable economy and ensuring that our services are sustainable. There is nothing more important to the future of Wales and Europe. Wales is at the forefront because we decided to take a bold

gyfrannu. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn manteisio ar gyfleoedd felly a bod gennym yr ewyllys wleidyddol i wneud hynny.

The First Minister referred to the need for consensus. The danger with consensus is that if you become too embedded in the need to ensure it, you can miss opportunities to play an integral and important part in development. You can miss opportunities to push forward boundaries and influence change. The White Paper refers, in terms of contractual arrangements, to the possibility of establishing target-based tripartite agreements. What is so radical about that idea? What is so radical about having a pilot scheme for that in Wales? The White Paper encourages that and states categorically that there should be an examination of

'how to improve the involvement of local and regional actors in EU policy-making'

and

'promote the use of contractual arrangements with their regions and localities.'

11:15 a.m.

**Jonathan Morgan** *rose*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In a minute, Jonathan. Let me finish this point. I challenge the First Minister to commit the Government of Wales to establishing a pilot scheme in Wales to explore and examine these possibilities and to respond positively to the encouragement given in this White Paper. We must consider what a small country like Wales can contribute to policy development in Europe.

**Jonathan Morgan:** A central theme of the tripartite contracts will be to allow groupings of member states or regions to implement EU policies more quickly. Do you agree that that recognises that implementing EU policies uniformly will be difficult because of the potential size of the European Union within the next five to 10 years? Do you agree that it is recognition that the EU is becoming so big that we will have to have a multi-tier, multi-

step on an issue on which a small country like Wales has an opportunity to contribute. It is important that we take advantage of such opportunities and that we possess the political will to do that.

Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at yr angen am gonsensws. Perygl consensws yw eich bod yn canolbwyntio gormod ar yr angen i'w sicrhau, gan gollu cyfle i chwarae rhan ganolog a phwysig yn y gwaith datblygu. Gallwch gollu cyfleoedd i ymestyn ffiniau a dylanwadu ar newid. Cyfeiria'r Papur Gwyn, yn nhermau trefniadau contract, at y posibilrwydd o sefydlu cytundebau teiran ar sail targedau. Beth sydd mor radical am y syniad hwn? Beth sydd mor radical ynglŷn â chael cynllun peilot ar gyfer Cymru? Mae'r Papur Gwyn yn annog hynny ac yn nodi'n bendant y dylid archwilio

'how to improve the involvement of local and regional actors in EU policy-making'

a

'promote the use of contractual arrangements with their regions and localities.'

**Jonathan Morgan** *a gododd*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mewn munud, Jonathan. Gadewch i mi orffen y pwynt hwn. Heriaf y Prif Weinidog i ymrwymo Llywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu cynllun peilot yng Nghymru i archwilio'r posibilïadau hyn ac ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r anogaeth a roddwyd yn y Papur Gwyn hwn. Rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn y gall gwlad fechan fel Cymru ei chyfrannu i ddatblygiadau polisi yn Ewrop.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Thema ganolog y contractau teiran fydd caniatáu i aelod-wladwriaethau neu ranbarthau gael eu gosod mewn grwpiau i weithredu polisïau'r UE yn gynt. A gytunwch fod hynny'n cydnabod y bydd gweithredu polisïau'r UE yn unfurf yn anodd oherwydd maint posibl yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o fewn y pum i 10 mlynedd nesaf? A gytunwch fod hyn yn cydnabod bod yr UE yn tyfu gymaint fel y bydd yn rhaid

speed Europe?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I agree, Jonathan. That is why it is important that Wales influences policy development in Europe and is not content to always be under the wing and in the shadow of the Westminster Government. Wales must be influential and ensure that issues important to Wales are raised. I return to the challenge I gave to the First Minister. Wales has an opportunity to play its part fully. Will he ensure that the Government and the National Assembly for Wales plays a full part in this policy development? Will he commit himself and his Government to a pilot scheme of contractual arrangements for Wales?

**The First Minister:** I thank all those who have taken part in this debate. I will correct some of the impressions given during the debate. You and several other people, Nick, are right in referring to the fact that the word 'enlargement' appears in the White Paper. However, it does not do so in the context of the revisions of the constitution of Europe and the question of qualified majority voting to which you referred. Janet, you gave the impression that I said that this was not about enlargement. I meant that this is not about the principle of enlargement and whether that is a good idea or not. We will have the opportunity to debate that issue at another time. We will also have several opportunities to debate the Laeken process, because we will want to contribute to that debate and ensure that our views are heard in the Committee of the Regions. I am glad that Rosemary Butler contributed to the debate and got right to the point that, as new institutions—

**Nick Bourne** *rose—*

**The First Minister:** In a second, Nick. In comparison with the older institutions, such as local government and the conventional member states, Europe and the Assembly suffer. You are right to say that we are seen as being intrusive—I am not sure about remote—and that questions are raised about why we are present. Those questions are raised because we are new. Europe suffers from that and we suffer from it. The Committee of the Regions is intended to act

inni gael Ewrop aml-haen, aml-gyflymder?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cytunaf â chi, Jonathan. Dyna pam ei bod yn bwysig bod Cymru'n dylanwadu ar ddatblygiad polisiau yn Ewrop ac nad yw'n fodlon bod o dan adain ac yng nghysgod Llywodraeth San Steffan bob amser. Rhaid i Gymru fod yn ddylanwadol a sicrhau y codir materion sy'n bwysig i Gymru. Dychwelaf at yr her a roddais i'r Prif Weinidog. Mae gan Gymru gyfle i gyfrannu'n llawn. A wnaiff sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'n chwarae rhan lawn yn y datblygiad polisi hwn? A wnaiff ymrwymo ei hun a'i Lywodraeth i gynllun peilot o drefniadau contract i Gymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolchaf i bawb a gyfranodd i'r ddadl hon. Cywiraf rai o'r argraffiadau a roddwyd yn ystod y ddadl. Yr oeddech chi a sawl person arall, Nick, yn iawn i gyfeirio at y ffaith bod y gair 'ehangu' yn ymddangos yn y Papur Gwyn. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymddangys felly yng nghyd-destun y diwygiadau o gyfansoddiad Ewrop a'r cwestiwn o bleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol y cyfeiriasoch ato. Janet, rhoddasoch yr argraff imi ddweud nad oedd hyn yn ymwneud ag ehangu. Yr hyn a olygais oedd nad oedd hyn yn ymwneud ag egwyddor ehangu ac a yw hynny'n syniad da ai peidio. Cawn gyfle i drafod y mater hwn eto. Cawn sawl cyfle hefyd i drafod proses Laeken, oherwydd byddwn am gyfrannu i'r ddadl honno a sicrhau y gwrandewir ar ein safbwyntiau ym Mhwyllgor y Rhanbarthau. Yr wyf yn falch bod Rosemary Butler wedi cyfrannu i'r ddadl ac wedi trafod y prif bwynt sef ein bod, fel sefydliadau newydd—

**Nick Bourne** *a gododd—*

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mewn munud, Nick. O'u cymharu â sefydliadau hyn, fel llywodraeth leol a'r aelod-wladwriaethau confensiynol, mae Ewrop a'r Cynulliad yn dioddef. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod pobl yn meddwl ein bod yn busnesu—ond nid wyf yn siŵr am anghysbell—ac y codir cwestiynau ynglŷn â pham ein bod yn bresennol. Codir y cwestiynau hyn am ein bod yn newydd. Mae Ewrop yn dioddef o hynny ac yr ydym ninnau'n dioddef o hynny

as a counterweight to that and I look forward to Rosemary's contribution to it. John Griffiths was rather harsh in saying that the Committee of the Regions has been floundering. I do not believe that it has made the contribution that was expected of it when it was set up originally, but I am sure that it will now be given an enhanced status and I look forward to Rosemary's contribution to it in years to come.

**Nick Bourne:** To return to enlargement, is it not the case that we cannot look at qualified majority voting in isolation from what is about to happen in Europe? We know that these member states will join by the end of 2004. That is inextricably entwined with qualified majority voting. Will you reconsider your comments and recognise that what we are saying in relation to protecting Welsh interests once enlargement occurs, has an impact on EU governance? That is why we tabled amendment 2.

**The First Minister:** The White Paper on governance strictly excludes that issue. That is the point. You cannot discuss an issue not included in the White Paper when discussing the White Paper. Also, Nick, you take too negative a line on my search for consensus. It is clear that there is no party flag-waving in the Government motion. We are reaching out for consensus. The problem is the amendments are tabled on topics that have nothing to do with the White Paper. We want to build consensus and anyone who has read the motion and is being halfway fair can see that that is its intent.

I accept that, as many Members have said, the juncture at which we hold this debate—in the run-up to enlargement—poses a problem. Romano Prodi, as President of the European Commission, is seeking to resolve that problem. With 300 million citizens in the European Union, the institutions of Europe are creaking, and they will creak even further, possibly to breaking point, if they are not changed and modernised. They must be made more transparent and less obsessed with diplomats in chancelleries fixing deals behind closed doors. If you do not open them

hefyd. Bwriedir i Bwyllgor y Rhanbarthau weithredu fel sefydliad sy'n gwrthbwysio hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniad Rosemary i hynny. Yr oedd sylwadau John Griffiths braidd yn gryf pan ddywedodd bod Pwyllgor y Rhanbarthau wedi bod yn ymbalfalu. Ni chredaf ei fod wedi cyfrannu'r hyn a ddisgwylid ohono pan gafodd ei sefydlu'n wreiddiol, ond yr wyf yn sicr y caiff statws uwch yn awr ac edrychaf ymlaen at gyfraniad Rosemary ymhen blynnyddoedd i ddod.

**Nick Bourne:** Gan ddychwelyd at ehangu, onid yw'n wir na allwn ystyried pleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol ar wahân i'r hyn sydd ar fin digwydd yn Ewrop? Gwyddom y bydd yr aelod-wladwriaethau hyn wedi ymuno erbyn diwedd 2004. Mae cyswllt anorfod rhwng hynny â phleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol. A wnewch chi ailystyried eich sylwadau a chydabod bod yr hyn a ddywedwn ynglŷn â diogelu buddiannau Cymru ar ôl i'r ehangu ddigwydd, yn effeithio ar y ffordd y rheolir yr UE? Dyna pam y cyflwynasom welliant 2.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'r Papur Gwyn ar lywodraethu yn eithrio'r mater hwnnw'n bendant. Dyna yw'r pwynt. Ni allwch drafod mater nad yw wedi'i gynnwys yn y Papur Gwyn wrth drafod y Papur Gwyn. Hefyd, Nick, mae eich agwedd yn negyddol iawn tuag at fy ymgais i sicrhau consensws. Mae'n amlwg i mi nad yw cynnig y Llywodraeth wedi'i anelu at un blaid yn unig. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau consensws. Y broblem yw nad oes unrhyw gyswllt rhwng y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd â'r Papur Gwyn. Yr ydym am sicrhau consensws a gall unrhyw un sydd wedi darllen y cynnig ac sy'n barod i'w ystyried yn deg weld mai dyna yw ei fwriad.

Derbyniaf, fel y dywedodd llawer o'r Aelodau, fod y cyd-destun y cynhelir y ddadl hon ynddo—wrth baratoi ar gyfer ehangu—yn creu problem. Mae Romano Prodi, fel Llywydd y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, yn ceisio datrys y broblem honno. Gyda 300 miliwn o ddinasyddion yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae sefydliadau Ewrop yn sigo, a byddant yn sigo ymhellach fyth, o bosibl nes y byddant wedi chwalu, os na chânt eu newid a'u moderneiddio. Rhaid eu gwneud yn fwy tryloyw a chanolbwyntio llai ar ddiplomyddion mewn cangellfeydd sy'n

up to citizens before enlargement takes place, there is a danger that the institutions will break down. That is the key issue about the timing of the White Paper on governance and determining when the Assembly wants to become involved in participating in the debate. Rhodri Glyn Thomas, in his contribution, did not recognise that we have set up the Llandudno conference, which will take place in a month's time, in order to involve the citizens of Wales. It is no good us pretending that we have a monopoly on wisdom. We want all the other potential stakeholders to—

**Brian Hancock** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I apologise for interrupting. Members are standing. No-one should be standing except for the First Minister. The First Minister is not giving way.

**The First Minister:** I apologise, Brian, but I do not have time.

On Alun Cairns's and others' contributions, this is not about whether you like Europe or whether you think you are being accused of xenophobia. An institution, of which we are a member, is proposing reforms that will have a direct impact on the regions and the local authorities of Europe. We intend to continue to strengthen Wales's voice in Europe. There has been some classic mythmaking today about how we were not as involved as we should have been in the Liège conference. I am sorry that I was not there. Our view on the Flanders declaration, as far as I am aware, is the same as Scotland's. I have discussed it with the Scots, though not recently and not with the new administration. However, I discussed it with them at the Barcelona conference, which the Scots and I attended. Their views and ours were not included there. I do not believe that the Scots have any intention of using the part of the Flanders declaration that they signed up to, because when you sign a declaration you take it as a whole. I do not think that the Scots will want to use the facility of direct access to the European Court of Justice, rather than access through the member state, even though they signed the declaration.

llunio cytundebau y tu ôl i ddrysau caeëdig. Os na fyddwch yn eu hagor i ddinasyddion cyn i'r ehangu ddigwydd, mae perygl y bydd y sefydliadau yn chwalu. Dyna yw'r mater allweddol ynglŷn ag amseriad y Papur Gwyn ar lywodraethu a phenderfynu pryd y mae'r Cynulliad am gyfrannu i'r ddatl. Ni chydabu Rhodri Glyn Thomas, yn ei gyfraniad ef, y ffaith ein bod wedi sefydlu cynhadledd Llandudno, a gynhelir ymhen mis, er mwyn cynnwys dinasyddion Cymru. Nid oes unrhyw bwynt cymryd arnom ein bod yn holl wybodus. Yr ydym am weld yr holl ran-ddeiliaid posibl eraill yn—

**Brian Hancock** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ymddiheuraf am dorri ar draws. Mae Aelodau ar eu traed. Ni ddylai unrhyw un arall sefyll ar wahân i'r Prif Weinidog. Nid yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ildio.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ymddiheuraf, Brian, ond nid oes gennyf amser.

Wrth ymateb i gyfraniad Alun Cairns a chyfraniadau eraill nid yw hyn yn golygu hoffi Ewrop ai peidio neu a ydych yn cael eich cyhuddo o estrongasedd. Mae sefydliad, yr ydym oll yn aelod ohono, yn cynnig diwygiadau a gaiff effaith uniongyrchol ar ranbarthau ac awdurdodau lleol Ewrop. Bwriadwn barhau i atgyfnerthu llais Cymru yn Ewrop. Soniwyd am lawer o fythau clasurol heddiw yn dweud nad oeddem wedi cyfrannu fel y dylem fod wedi gwneud yng nghynhadledd Liège. Ymddiheuraf nad oeddwn yno. Y mae ein safbwynt ni ar ddatganiad Fflandrys, hyd y gwn i, yr un peth â safbwynt yr Alban. Yr wyf wedi trafod y mater gyda'r Albanwyr, er nad yn ddiweddar ac nid gyda'r weinyddiaeth newydd. Fodd bynnag, trafodais hyn gyda'r Albanwyr yng nghynhadledd Barcelona, pan oeddwn i yno. Ni chafodd ein safbwyntiau hwy na'n rhai ni eu cynnwys yno. Ni chredaf fod gan yr Albanwyr unrhyw fwriad i ddefnyddio'r rhan o'r datganiad Fflandrys y maent wedi'i lofnodi, oherwydd pan fyddwch yn lofnodi datganiad byddwch yn ei dderbyn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Ni chredaf y bydd yr Albanwyr am ddefnyddio'r cyfleuster o gael mynediad uniongyrchol i Lys Cyfiawnder Ewrop, yn hytrach na chael mynediad drwy'r aelod-



wladwriaeth, er eu bod wedi llofnodi'r datganiad.

**Phil Williams** *rose*—

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, Phil, but I am way over time already.

In terms of expanding Wales's role and what we can contribute, we have already achieved a great deal in ensuring that our voice is heard. The German Länder and the Spanish regions are green with envy about our Ministers taking a direct part in Council of Ministers meetings, and that we occasionally lead the Council of Ministers delegation. The German Länder and the Spanish regions cannot do that. The Belgians can do so occasionally, but on a rota basis. One out of three regions will lead occasionally on a devolved subject. However, Wales, given the unwritten British constitution, is making full and flexible use of the Council of Ministers jointly with the member state. We have done a great deal to strengthen Wales's voice in Europe and we will take every opportunity to do so further in the context of the White Paper on governance.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Point of order. The First Minister twice said that he did not have time to take interventions. I was under the impression that this debate was scheduled to last for two hours and, therefore, could have continued until 12 p.m. The First Minister could have had another 40 minutes in which to take interventions had he wanted. It seems that he was trying to avoid taking interventions and addressing the serious issues.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The First Minister is entirely blameless. The normal guidance on the length of contributions applies, namely that members of the Government have 15 minutes in which to speak and other Members have five minutes. If this debate is finishing early it is because of lack of speakers.

11:25 a.m.

**Phil Williams** *a gododd*—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Phil, ond yr wyf eisoes ymhell dros fy amser.

Yn nhermau ehangu rôl Cymru a'r hyn y gallwn ei gyfrannu, yr ydym eisoes wedi cyflawni cryn dipyn o ran sicrhau y clywir ein llais. Mae Länder yr Almaen a rhanbarthau Sbaen yn genfigennus iawn bod ein Gweinidogion ni wedi cyfrannu'n uniongyrchol yng nghyfarfodydd Cyngor y Gweinidogion, a'n bod yn arwain cynrychiolwyr Cyngor y Gweinidogion yn achlysurol. Ni all Länder yr Almaen na rhanbarthau Sbaen wneud hynny. Gall y Belgiaid wneud hyn yn achlysurol, ond ar sail rota. Bydd un o'r tri rhanbarth yn arwain pwnc datganoledig yn achlysurol. Fodd bynnag, o ystyried cyfansoddiad llafar Prydain, mae Cymru'n gwneud defnydd llawn a hyblyg o Gyngor y Gweinidogion ar y cyd ag aelod-wladwriaethau. Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer i atgyfnerthu llais Cymru yn Ewrop ac achubwn ar bob cyfle i wneud hynny ymhellach yng nghyd-destun y Papur Gwyn ar lywodraethu.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog ddwy waith nad oedd ganddo amser i dderbyn ymyriadau. Yr oeddwn dan yr argraff fod dwy awr ar gyfer y ddadl hon ac, felly, gallai fod wedi para hyd at 12 p.m. Gallai'r Prif Weinidog fod wedi cael 40 munud arall i dderbyn ymyriadau pe bai wedi dymuno gwneud hynny. Ymddengys i mi ei fod yn ceisio osgoi derbyn ymyriadau a mynd i'r afael â'r materion difrifol.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid oes unrhyw fai ar y Prif Weinidog. Yr arweiniad arferol a roddir ar hyd y cyfraniadau yw bod gan aelodau'r Llywodraeth 15 munud i siarad a phum munud sydd gan yr Aelodau eraill. Os yw'r ddadl hon yn gorffen yn gynnar, prinder siaradwyr yw'r rheswm am hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Further to that point of order, I understand your point about the time allocated, but given that there were several points that Members wished to clarify with the First Minister, had he been asked to continue beyond his allocated time, everyone would have agreed to that.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I can only go by the guidance issued. Members will know that the normal practice, unless it is varied—and it has not been varied in this case—is that those who open and close debates will be allowed 15 minutes, while other speakers will have five minutes. I have been fairly lenient in this debate and allowed Members to go beyond the allocated time. The First Minister was also allowed to do that. Are we to make a meal of this?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Further to that point of order, I refer to your ruling on Tuesday about a contribution made by Eleanor Burnham, in which she referred to the leader of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. You said that if a speaker refers to another Assembly Member, they should give way to that Member. The First Minister referred today to contributions made by Members of my party and other parties, and yet refused to give way.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That is a slightly different situation. You are splitting hairs, Rhodri. Where clear reference to a Member is made in the course of a speech, it is normal courtesy to give way if an intervention is sought. However, when the First Minister was winding up, he was replying to points made during the debate. That is slightly different.

**The Minister for Assembly Business (Andrew Davies):** I would like to put on record that the First Minister did not attempt to avoid taking interventions. Given that we had two hours for this debate, I clarified with the Deputy Presiding Officer whether the First Minister would still have to keep to 15 minutes, or whether he would be allowed to go beyond that. I was told that he would have to keep to 15 minutes. That is what the First Minister did, and why he did not take interventions.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, deallaf eich pwynt ynghylch yr amser a bennwyd, ond o gofio bod sawl pwynt yr oedd yr Aelodau am eu hegluro i'r Prif Weinidog, pe gofynasid iddo barhau y tu hwnt i'r amser a bennwyd ar ei gyfer, byddai pawb wedi cytuno i hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gallaf ond ddilyn yr arweiniad a roddwyd. Mae'r Aelodau'n ymwybodol mai'r drefn arferol, oni cheir amrywiad—ac ni cheir amrywiad yn yr achos hwn—yw y caniateir 15 munud i'r rhai sy'n agor ac yn cau dadl, tra bydd gan siaradwyr eraill bum munud. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gymharol drugarog yn y ddadl hon ac wedi caniatáu i Aelodau siarad y tu hwnt i'r amser a bennwyd ar eu cyfer. Caniatawyd i'r Prif Weinidog wneud hynny hefyd. A ydym am wneud môr a mynydd o hyn?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt hwnnw o drefn, cyfeiriaf at eich dyfarniad ddydd Mawrth ynglŷn â chyfraniad a wnaed gan Eleanor Burnham, pan gyfeiriodd at arweinydd Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. Dywedasoch, os bydd siaradwr yn cyfeirio at Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad, y dylent ildio i'r Aelod hwnnw. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog heddiw at gyfraniadau a wnaed gan Aelodau o fy mhlaid i a phleidiau eraill, ond eto gwrthododd ildio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae hynny ychydig yn wahanol. Yr ydych yn holli blew, Rhodri. Pan gyfeirir yn amlwg at Aelod yn ystod araith, mae'n gwrteisi fel arfer i ildio os gofynnir am ymyriad. Fodd bynnag, pan oedd y Prif Weinidog ar fin gorffen ei araith, yr oedd yn ymateb i bwyntiau a wnaed yn ystod y ddadl. Mae hynny ychydig yn wahanol.

**Y Trefnydd (Andrew Davies):** Hoffwn gofnodi na wnaeth y Prif Weinidog geisio osgoi derbyn ymyriadau. O gofio bod gennym ddwy awr ar gyfer y ddadl hon, gofynnais i'r Dirprwy Lywydd a fyddai'n rhaid i'r Prif Weinidog gadw at y 15 munud, neu a fyddai'n cael mynd y tu hwnt i hynny. Dywedwyd wrthyf y byddai'n rhaid iddo gadw at y 15 munud. Dyna a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog, a dyna pam na dderbyniodd unrhyw ymyriadau.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I do not wish for further delay on this matter. We will now move to a vote.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid wyf am oedi ymhellach ar y mater hwn. Awn ymlaen yn awr i bleidleisio.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 10, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 42  
Amendment 1: For 10, Abstain 0, Against 42*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30  
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 30*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine

Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Phil

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 8, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 44  
 Amendment 3: For 8, Abstain 0, Against 44*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Williams, Phil

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
 Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Graham, William  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 20, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 5: For 20, Abstain 1, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, David  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Graham, William  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Rogers, Peter  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sinclair, Karen  
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:

The following Member abstained:

Jones, Ieuan Wyn

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 14, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 30.  
Amendment 6: For 14, Abstain 8, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Dafis, Cynog  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Hancock, Brian  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Peter

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Graham, William  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Rogers, Peter

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 34.*  
*Amendment 7: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 34*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Dafis, Cynog  
 Davies, Geraint  
 Davies, Janet  
 Hancock, Brian  
 Jarman, Pauline  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wigley, Dafydd  
 Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Ron  
 Essex, Sue  
 Evans, Delyth  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Middlehurst, Tom  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Rogers, Peter  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.*

*Motion: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Dafis, Cynog  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Geraint  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Ron  
Essex, Sue  
Evans, Delyth  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hancock, Brian  
Hutt, Jane  
Jarman, Pauline  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Middlehurst, Tom  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wigley, Dafydd  
Williams, Kirsty  
Williams, Phil

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Pugh, Alun  
Rogers, Peter

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order**

**Alun Cairns:** Point of order. I thought that I had brought it to your notice that I wanted to raise a point of order earlier. I apologise if I did not make myself clear. In the previous debate, John Griffiths referred to—

**Alun Cairns:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl i mi dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith fy mod am godi pwynt o drefn yn gynharach. Ymddiheuraf os nad oeddwn wedi egluro'n ddigonol. Yn y drafodaeth flaenorol,



cyfeiriodd John Griffiths at—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I will stop you there, Alun. I heard his comments. I did not hear anything that was out of order, but I will study the record.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Fe'ch stopiaf yn y fan honno, Alun. Clywais ei sylwadau. Ni chlywais unrhyw beth a oedd allan o drefn, ond byddaf yn archwilio'r cofnod.

**Pauline Jarman:** Point of order. I gave you notice of this, but as it has nothing to do with the previous debate, I did not take the opportunity to raise it then. Can you give a ruling on how legally enforceable a regulation which does not provide for a design feature for the free bus passes throughout Wales—

**Pauline Jarman:** Pwynt o drefn. Fe'ch hysbysais o hyn, ond gan nad yw'n ymwneud â'r drafodaeth flaenorol, ni fanteisiais ar y cyfle i'w godi bryd hynny. A roddwch ddyfarniad ar ba mor orfodadwy yn gyfreithiol yw rheoleiddiad nad yw'n darparu ar gyfer nodwedd dylunio i'r tocynnau bws am ddim drwy Gymru—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This has nothing to do with me.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid oes a wnelo hynny â mi.

**Pauline Jarman:** May I ask—

**Pauline Jarman:** A gaf i ofyn—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. No, you cannot.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Na chewch.

**Pauline Jarman:** May I have your permission to proceed, because I thought that the Presiding Officer made it clear—

**Pauline Jarman:** A gaf i eich caniatâd i barhau, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn meddwl i'r Llywydd egluro—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. No. You must use your ingenuity to bring up matters such as this in the Chamber when it is in order for you to do so. Raising it as a point of order, when it is clear to the meanest intelligence that it is not, will not get you far.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Na chewch. Rhaid ichi ddefnyddio eich dyfeisgarwch i godi materion fel hyn yn y Siambr pan fydd mewn trefn i chi wneud hynny. Ni fydd ei godi fel pwynt o drefn, pan fydd yn amlwg i unrhyw berson â deallusrwydd cymedrol nad dyna ydyw, yn mynd â chi'n bell iawn.

**Pauline Jarman:** I appeal to you, Deputy Presiding Officer, and ask you to rule on a matter on which the Presiding Officer ruled—

**Pauline Jarman:** Apeliaf atoch, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a gofynnaf i chi roi dyfarniad ar fater y dyfarnodd y Llywydd—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** What is the point of order, in one sentence?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Beth yw'r pwynt o drefn, mewn un frawddeg?

**Pauline Jarman:** Is the term 'Welsh Assembly Government' legally enforceable in that context?

**Pauline Jarman:** A yw'r enw 'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru' yn orfodadwy yn gyfreithiol yn y cyd-destun hwnnw?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not a point of order for me. However, Ministers are present and will have heard what you have said.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Nid yw hwn yn bwynt o drefn i mi. Fodd bynnag, mae Gweinidogion yn bresennol a byddant wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedasoeh.

## Dadl Fer Short Debate

### Cyfiawnder i Gymunedau'r Meysydd Glo Justice for the Coalfield Communities

**David Lloyd:** Datganaf fuddiant fel cynghorydd sir a meddyg teulu. Os bydd amser yn caniatáu, yr wyf wedi cytuno i Owen John Thomas, Lynne Neagle a Peter Black gyfrannu i'r ddadl.

**David Lloyd:** I declare an interest as a county councillor and a general practitioner. Time permitting, I have agreed that Owen John Thomas, Lynne Neagle and Peter Black may contribute to the debate.

Bûm yn feddyg teulu yn hen bentref glofaol Fforest-fach ar gyrion Abertawe am dros 15 mlynedd. Ar un adeg, yr oedd chwe phwll glo yng nghyffiniau Fforest-fach. Fe gaeodd yr olaf ohonynt ddiwedd y 1960au. Mae'r creithiau ar iechyd y bobl yn amlwg o hyd. Yr wyf wedi trin nifer o gyn-lowyr dros y blyneddoddedd yn dioddef o bronchitis ac emphysema, gydag anadlyddion, tabledi di-ri a chyflenwad ocsigen yn eu cartrefi.

I have been a GP in the former coal mining village of Fforest-fach near Swansea for over 15 years. At one time, there were six coalmines in the vicinity of Fforest-fach. The last of them closed at the end of the 1960s. The scars on people's health are still visible. I have treated many ex-miners over the years who have suffered from bronchitis and emphysema, with inhalators, various tablets and home oxygen supplies.

11:35 a.m.

Ar ben hyn, ni chaiff ein cymunedau glofaol yng Nghymru eu rhan deg o'r arian sydd ar gael i adnewyddu cymunedau glofaol, fel y clywodd Aelodau mewn cyflwyniad yn y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf. Dyna sail yr alwad hon am gyfiawnder i gymunedau'r meysydd glo.

Additionally, our coalfield communities in Wales do not receive their fair share of the money available to regenerate coalfield communities, as Members heard in a presentation in the Assembly last week. That is the basis of this call for justice for the coalfield communities.

Most Members in the Chamber at the moment represent coalfields communities. I call today for us to stand together and fight for justice for these communities.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd yn cynrychioli cymunedau'r meysydd glo. Galwaf heddiw ar bawb ohonom i sefyll gyda'n gilydd a brwydro am gyfiawnder i'r cymunedau hyn.

The hard work of the coal industry cannot fade into memory. The social and economic disadvantage that began with the pit closures is being passed on to a new generation. It is our responsibility to address these issues and to bring justice to the coalfields communities in Wales.

Ni ellir anghofio am waith caled y diwydiant glo. Mae'r anfantais gymdeithasol ac economaidd a ddechreuodd gyda chau'r pyllau bellach yn cael ei throsglwyddo i genhedlaeth newydd. Ein cyfrifoldeb ni yw mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn a dod â chyfiawnder i gymunedau meysydd glo Cymru.

Plaid Cymru feels that the National Assembly Government has failed to turn promises of social justice into positive action. England is already four years ahead of Wales in addressing the task of regenerating the coalfields. A taskforce must be established

Cred Plaid Cymru fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi methu â throi addewidion o gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn weithredoedd cadarnhaol. Mae Lloegr eisoes bedair blynedd o flaen Cymru wrth ymdrin â'r dasg o adfywio'r meysydd glo. Rhaid

immediately and asked to report to the First Minister and to the Assembly within six months. It would not be a permanent body but would be charged with the one-off job of bringing forward proposals. We need a coalfields taskforce for Wales. John Prescott established an English coalfields taskforce in 1997, which has kick-started coalfield regeneration. However, the majority of the proposals remain exclusively English. Wales is missing out on the new network space initiative to develop small workspace, among other things. It is a disgrace that the National Assembly Government did not establish such a taskforce for Wales, which has suffered as much, if not more, than anywhere else as a result of the coal industry and its decline.

Rhodri Morgan has already stated that he does not believe that such a taskforce is justified. I quote from a letter that he sent to Councillor Noel Crowley:

'I have considered carefully whether there is a need for a coalfields taskforce in Wales and concluded that this is not justified.'

We ask him to reconsider his view on this. The role of Finance Wales and the Welsh Development Agency in regenerating Wales's coalfields over the years has been insufficient. The poverty figures of Wales's coalfields communities prove this. The coalfields need joined-up thinking between agencies such as the WDA and Finance Wales, the Assembly Government, the Coalfield Communities Campaign, local authorities, the voluntary sector and trade unions. Their role would be to identify gaps in the provision of services aimed at regenerating these areas. That would be an example of the Government working in partnership with other agencies for the good of Wales. It would not be costly as it would only be a case of bringing together agencies that already exist.

An initiative arising from the English coalfields taskforce was a push to raise the amount of lottery grants received in coalfield areas. That is an issue that I would expect such a taskforce to identify in Wales, if it were given the chance. Lottery funding is not only about building national sports arenas and arts centres, but about getting money to

sefydlu tasglu ar unwaith a gofyn iddo gyflwyno adroddiad i Brif Weinidog Cymru ac i'r Cynulliad o fewn chwe mis. Ni fyddai'n gorff parhaol ond byddai'n gyfrifol am gyflwyno cynigion. Mae angen tasglu meysydd glo ar Gymru. Sefydlodd John Prescott dasglu meysydd glo yn Lloegr yn 1997, a welodd gychwyn adfywiad yn y meysydd glo. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mwyafrif o'r cynigion yn parhau i fod yn berthnasol i Loegr yn unig. Mae Cymru'n colli allan ar y fenter mannau rhwydwaith newydd i ddatblygu gweithfannau bach, ymysg pethau eraill. Mae'n warth na sefydlodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dasglu o'r fath i Gymru, sydd wedi dioddef cymaint, os nad mwy, nag unrhyw le arall o ganlyniad i'r diwydiant glo a'i ddirywiad.

Nododd Rhodri Morgan eisoes nad yw'n credu y gellid cyfiawnhau tasglu o'r fath. Dyfynnaf o lythyr a anfonodd at y Cynghorydd Noel Crowley:

Gofynnwn iddo ailystyried ei farn ar hyn. Ni fu rôl Cyllid Cymru ac Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru wrth adfywio meysydd glo Cymru dros y blynyddoedd yn ddigonol. Mae ffigurau tlodi cymunedau meysydd glo Cymru'n profi hyn. Mae angen meddwl cydgysylltiedig ar y meysydd glo rhwng asiantaethau fel y WDA a Chyllid Cymru, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol, awdurdodau lleol, y sector gwirfoddol ac undebau llafur. Eu rôl fyddai nodi bylchau yn narpariaeth y gwasanaethau wedi'u hanelu at adfywio'r ardaloedd hyn. Byddai hynny'n enghraifft o'r Llywodraeth yn cydweithio mewn partneriaeth ag asiantaethau eraill er budd Cymru. Ni fyddai'n gostus oherwydd mai dim ond mater o ddod ag asiantaethau sy'n bodoli eisoes ynghyd fyddai hyn.

Menter a ddeilliodd o dasglu'r meysydd glo yn Lloegr oedd yr ymdrech i godi nifer y grantiau loteri a dderbyniwyd yn ardaloedd y meysydd glo. Mae hynny'n fater y byddwn yn disgwyl i dasglu o'r fath ei nodi yng Nghymru, pe câi y cyfle. Nid ymwneud ag adeiladu meysydd chwaraeon cenedlaethol a chanolfannau celfyddydau yn unig y mae

the people in the poorest communities across Wales. It is a well-known fact that people living in deprived communities are the lottery's best customers. The sales of lottery tickets and scratch cards in Blaenau Gwent, Rhondda Cynon Taff and Merthyr are well above average. However, the money distributed by the lottery in these areas is well below average. Voluntary organisations in these areas often do not have the resources to go through the complex lottery bidding process.

In England, the taskforce has forced the UK Government to address this issue. What is happening in Wales? Plaid Cymru expects the Government in Wales to raise the coalfields' share of lottery funding to at least the national average through sustained action, using long-term monitoring to ensure that this aim is achieved.

The English taskforce's main result was setting up the Coalfields Regeneration Trust. In the first round of funding, the trust received £50 million to distribute to English, Welsh and Scottish coalfield areas over a three-year period. Wales's share was a mere £3.46 million. In the second round, England received £45 million and Wales received only £1 million. In relation to the number of mineworkers and ex-mineworkers who contributed to the mineworkers' pension scheme and to the staff superannuation scheme, Wales should have received between £10 million and £11 million in the first round of funding instead of £3.46 million. It is clear, therefore, that Wales is losing out once again, and that this Assembly Government has been ineffective in fighting the Welsh cause. This funding was distributed via the Barnett formula, and is another example of Wales losing out because of this outdated formula. Why not distribute the funding on the basis of how many miners and ex-miners live in Wales? If we are truly to target the most deprived areas, surely a different formula must be used to get justice for the former mining areas of Wales.

We must also examine what is happening to the miners' pension fund. Under a deal brokered in 1994, the Treasury keeps half of

arian y loteri, mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chael arian at y bobl yn y cymunedau tlotaf ledled Cymru. Mae'n ffaith hysbys mai pobl sy'n byw mewn cymunedau difreintiedig yw cwsmeriaid gorau'r loteri. Mae gwerthiannau tocynnau loteri a chardiau crafu ym Mlaenau Gwent, Rhondda Cynon Taf a Merthyr yn llawer uwch na'r cyffredin. Fodd bynnag, mae'r arian a ddosberthir gan y loteri yn yr ardaloedd hynny yn llawer is na'r cyffredin. Yn aml nid oes gan sefydliadau gwirfoddol yn yr ardaloedd hyn yr adnoddau i fynd drwy'r broses gymhleth o wneud cais am arian loteri.

Yn Lloegr, mae'r tasglu wedi gorfodi Llywodraeth y DU i ymdrin â'r mater hwn. Beth sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru? Mae Plaid Cymru yn disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth yng Nghymru godi cyfran o arian loteri'r meysydd glo i'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol o leiaf, drwy weithredu parhaus, a defnyddio dulliau monitro hirdymor i sicrhau y cyflawnir y nod hwn.

Prif ganlyniad tasglu Lloegr oedd sefydlu Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo. Yn y cylch ariannu cyntaf, derbyniodd yr ymddiriedolaeth £50 miliwn i'w ddosbarthu i ardaloedd meysydd glo Cymru, Lloegr a'r Alban dros gyfnod o dair blynedd. Dim ond £3.46 miliwn oedd cyfran Cymru. Yn yr ail gylch, derbyniodd Lloegr £45 miliwn ac £1 miliwn yn unig a gafodd Cymru. O ran nifer y glowyr a'r cyn lowyr a gyfrannodd at y cynllun pensiwn glowyr a'r cynllun pensiwn staff, dylai Cymru fod wedi derbyn rhwng £10 miliwn a £11 miliwn yn y cylch ariannu cyntaf yn lle £3.46 miliwn. Mae'n glir, felly, bod Cymru ar ei cholled unwaith eto, a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn wedi bod yn aneffeithiol wrth frwydro dros achos Cymru. Dosbarthwyd yr arian hwn drwy fformiwla Barnett, ac mae'n enghraifft arall o Gymru ar ei cholled oherwydd y fformiwla hen ffasiwn hon. Beth am ddosbarthu'r arian ar sail faint o lowyr a chyn lowyr sy'n byw yng Nghymru? Os ydym am dargedu'r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig o ddifrif, rhaid defnyddio fformiwla wahanol er mwyn sicrhau cyfiawnder i gyn ardaloedd glofaol Cymru.

Rhaid inni hefyd archwilio'r hyn sy'n digwydd i gronfa pensiwn y glowyr. O dan fargen a wnaethpwyd yn 1994, mae'r

any surplus arising from the mineworkers pension scheme and the British Coal staff superannuation scheme. The Government guarantees that core pension entitlement will always keep pace with inflation. In recent years the miners' pension fund has been massively in surplus. The Treasury is already scheduled to keep the colossal sum of £5 billion, which is about £10,000 per pensioner.

In a recent asset and liability review, the Treasury's share of the surpluses has been shown to be out of all proportion to the risk involved in providing the guarantee. The less the Treasury takes, the more will be available to enhance the pensions of former coal industry employees.

No-one wants to drop the Treasury's guarantee: it provides security for pensioners. However, the current price paid for the guarantee is far too high. Every year the Treasury receives a multi-million pound windfall from the miners' pension fund. At the same time, many retired miners must get by on low incomes, and the communities in which they live suffer some of the worst deprivation in Wales.

The Government is acting lawfully, but is it acting fairly? We call on the Assembly Government to make representations to its Westminster counterpart. This system must be changed: the Government should take a smaller share of the surplus, leaving more for the pensioners. Plaid Cymru wants a larger proportion of what the Government receives to be ploughed back into coalfield communities. As Plaid Cymru's health spokesperson, I am acutely aware of the health problems faced in these communities: no fewer than 87 of the 100 wards with the worst health problems in Wales are in the coalfields, with devastating rates of bronchitis, emphysema and heart disease.

After an historic 10-year battle, led by the miners' union, the National Association of Colliery Overmen, Deputies and Shotfirers, under the leadership of Bleddyn Hancock, miners with crippling chest diseases thought

Trysorlys yn cadw hanner unrhyw arian sy'n weddill o gynllun pensiwn y glowyr a chynllun pensiwn staff Glo Prydain. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwarantu y bydd yr hawl pensiwn graidd yn codi'n unol â chwyddiant. Mewn blynyddoedd diweddar bu gwarged sylweddol gan gronfa bensiwn y glowyr. Mae'r Trysorlys eisoes wedi trefnu i gadw'r swm anferth o £5 biliwn, sef tua £10,000 fesul pensiyner.

Mewn adolygiad asedau ac atebolrwydd, gwelwyd bod cyfran y Trysorlys o'r arian sy'n weddill ddim i'w gymharu â'r risg dan sylw wrth ddarparu'r gwarant. Po leiaf fydd y Trysorlys yn ei gymryd, y mwyaf fydd ar gael i wella pensiynau cyn weithwyr y diwydiant glo.

Ni fydd unrhyw un am ollwng gwarant y Trysorlys: mae'n darparu diogelwch i bensiynwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae'r pris presennol a dalwyd ar gyfer y warrant yn llawer rhy uchel. Bob blwyddyn mae'r Trysorlys yn derbyn arian annisgwyl o gronfa pensiwn y glowyr gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd. Ar yr un pryd, mae'n rhaid i lawer o lowyr sydd wedi ymddeol ymdopi ar incwm isel, ac mae'r cymunedau y maent yn byw ynddynt yn dioddef yr amddifadedd gwaethaf yng Nghymru.

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn gweithredu'n gyfreithlon, ond a yw'n gweithredu'n deg? Galwn ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno sylwadau i'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan. Rhaid newid y system: dylai'r Llywodraeth gymryd cyfran lai o'r gwarged, gan adael mwy i bensiynwyr. Mae Plaid Cymru am i gyfran fwy o'r hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei dderbyn gael ei dychwelyd i gymunedau'r meysydd glo. Fel llefarydd Plaid Cymru ar iechyd, yr wyf yn ymwybodol iawn o'r problemau iechyd y mae'r cymunedau hyn yn eu hwynebu: mae cymaint â 87 o'r 100 o wardiau â'r problemau iechyd gwaethaf yng Nghymru yn y meysydd glo, gyda chyfraddau dinistriol o froncitis, emffysema a chlefyd y galon.

Ar ôl brwydr hanesyddol 10 mlynedd o hyd, dan arweiniad undeb y glowyr, Cymdeithas Genedlaethol Goruchwylwyr, Dirprwyon a Thanwyr Pyllau Glo dan arweiniad Bleddyn Hancock, credai glowyr gydag afiechydon

that justice had been done at last. It is now four years since that famous court victory, and progress has been shamefully slow: in Ogmere, for example, only 207 of the 3,300 claims have been settled in full. That is a fact. Also, the miners' rehabilitation centre at Tal-y-garn, the only specialist centre of its kind in Wales, was closed by New Labour and sold off to property developers.

Add to that the serious unemployment problems in the coalfield communities: in terms of employment, 68 of the worst 100 wards in Wales are in the coalfields. In the former mining areas, especially since the 1984-85 miners' strike, there is also extensive hidden unemployment, especially among men and women who have been diverted onto sickness benefits. We have not come close to replacing the jobs lost by the demise of the coal industry. Across the former coalfields of Wales, low wages reflect a preponderance of low-skill manual jobs and a relative absence of jobs in well-paid professional occupations. Part-time working and short-term contracts are all too common. A recent Regional Studies Association survey showed that Wales needed 200,000 additional jobs to reduce unemployment to the level of the south east of England. A coalfields taskforce for Wales could assist in job creation and contribute to the ongoing economic strategy for Wales.

Educational attainment in the Welsh coalfields lags behind other areas. In areas such as Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tydfil, Caerphilly and Rhondda Cynon Taff, about one third of people of working age have no formal qualifications. The Government needs to act to raise educational attainment in those areas. A taskforce would be essential to suggest proposals and actions. National initiatives aimed at improving performance in schools across the country are not sufficient. In coalfield areas, and other areas where performance lags badly, there must be additional targeted measures if standards of achievement are ever to be pulled up to the national average.

andwyol ar y frest fod cyfiawnder wedi'i wneud o'r diwedd. Mae bellach yn bedair blynedd ers y fuddugoliaeth enwog honno yn y llys, a bu'r cynnydd yn gywilyddus o araf: yn Ogwre, er enghraifft, dim ond 207 o'r 3,300 o geisiadau a setlwyd yn llawn. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Hefyd, caewyd y ganolfan adsefydlu glowyr yn Nhal-y-garn, yr unig ganolfan arbenigol o'i bath yng Nghymru, gan Lafur Newydd a'i gwerthu i ddatblygwyr eiddo.

I ychwanegu at broblemau diweithdra difrifol yng nghymunedau'r meysydd glo: o ran cyflogaeth, mae 68 o'r 100 o wardiau gwaethaf yng Nghymru wedi'u lleoli yn y meysydd glo. Yn y cyn ardaloedd glofaol, yn enwedig ers streic y glowyr yn 1984-85, ceir hefyd ddiweithdra cudd sylweddol, yn enwedig ymysg dynion a merched a gyfeiriwyd at fudd-daliadau salwch. Nid ydym wedi dod yn agos at adfer y swyddi a gollwyd drwy dranc y diwydiant glo. Ar draws cyn feysydd glo Cymru, mae cyflogau isel yn adlewyrchu'r gormodedd o swyddi cymharol ddi-greffft lle gweithir â'r dwylo ac absenoldeb cymharol swyddi mewn galwedigaethau proffesiynol sy'n derbyn tâl da. Mae gweithio rhan amser a chytundebau tymor byr yn llawer rhy gyffredin. Dangosodd arolwg gan y Gymdeithas Astudiaethau Rhanbarthol fod angen 200,000 o swyddi ychwanegol ar Gymru i ostwng diweithdra i lefel de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Gallai tasglu maes glo i Gymru gynorthwyo i greu swyddi a chyfrannu at y strategaeth economaidd barhaus i Gymru.

Mae cyrhaeddiad addysgol yn y meysydd glo yng Nghymru yn llusgo y tu ôl i fannau eraill. Mewn ardaloedd megis Blaenau Gwent, Merthyr Tudful, Caerffili a Rhondda Cynon Taf, mae tua thraean o'r bobl o oed gweithio heb gymwysterau ffurfiol. Mae angen i'r Llywodraeth weithredu i godi cyrhaeddiadau addysgol yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Byddai tasglu yn hanfodol i awgrymu cynigion a chymau i'w gweithredu. Nid yw mentrau cenedlaethol a anelir at wella perfformiad mewn ysgolion ledled y wlad yn ddigon. Yn ardaloedd y meysydd glo, ac ardaloedd eraill lle mae perfformiad yn bell ar ei hôl hi, rhaid wrth fesurau ychwanegol wedi'u targedu er mwyn codi safonau cyrhaeddiad i'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol.

In coalfield communities, the older workers have been discarded by running down the coal industry. The Government must not discard the younger generation by failing to achieve acceptable educational standards.

Yng nghymunedau'r meysydd glo, mae'r gweithwyr hŷn wedi cael eu bwrw o'r neilltu wrth i'r diwydiant glo wanhau. Ni ddylai'r Llywodraeth daflu'r genhedlaeth ifanc o'r neilltu drwy fethu â chyflawni safonau addysgol derbynol.

11:45 a.m.

Fifty-seven of the 100 most deprived wards in Wales are in the coalfields. We can act now, as a National Assembly, to ensure that the lives of future generations are not plagued by the hangover effects of the demise of the coal industry. I am calling today for your support to establish a coalfields taskforce for Wales to set concrete proposals for the future. We call on the Assembly Government to reassess the funding it makes available to regenerate the coalfields, and to make representations to Westminster colleagues, asking them to be fairer in their treatment of the miners' pension fund surplus. That is what we can do to kick-start the mission to regenerate our coalfields. It is our duty to fight for justice for coalfield communities.

Mae 57 allan o'r 100 ward fwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru yn y meysydd glo. Gallwn weithredu'n awr, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, i sicrhau na fydd bywydau'r cenedlaethau sydd i ddod yn cael eu poeni gan effeithiau canlyniadau tranc y diwydiant glo. Galwaf heddiw am eich cefnogaeth i sefydlu tasglu i feysydd glo Cymru i osod cynigion pendant ar gyfer y dyfodol. Galwn ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ailasesu yr ariannu a rydd i adfywio'r meysydd glo ac i gyflwyno sylwadau i gyd-aelodau yn San Steffan yn gofyn iddynt fod yn decach yn eu triniaeth o warged cronfa bensiwn y glowyr. Dyna a allwn ni ei wneud i gychwyn ar yr ymgyrch i adfywio'n meysydd glo. Ein dyletswydd yw ymladd am gyfiawnder i'r cymunedau glo.

**Owen John Thomas:** Llongyfarchaf Dai Lloyd am dynnu sylw at broblem fawr yr annhegwch a'r anghyfiawnder yng Nghymru oherwydd agwedd Llywodraethau Llundain a Chaerdydd tuag at y cymunedau glo. Yr wyf am bwysleisio pwysigrwydd sicrhau cyllid teg a rhesymol ar gyfer cymunedau glo y de. Ar hyn o bryd maent yn derbyn tua 7 y cant o'r arian a werir ar gymunedau glo ym Mhrydain. Bu'n llai na hynny ar adegau. Cyfeiriodd Geraint Davies a Dai Lloyd at ddefnyddio nifer y cyn-lowyr yn y cymunedau glo, sydd bellach yn bensiynwyr, fel sail i bennu swm yr arian a roddir i'r cymunedau hynny. Byddai hynny'n rhoi cyfran o 20 y cant o'r arian a roddir i gymunedau glo ledled Prydain. Fodd bynnag, mae'r mwyafrif o bensiynwyr yn deillio o'r cyfnod cyn 1945.

**Owen John Thomas:** I congratulate Dai Lloyd for drawing attention to the serious problem of inequity and injustice in Wales because of the attitude of the London and Cardiff Governments towards the coalfield communities. I wish to emphasise the importance of ensuring fair and reasonable funding for the coalfield communities of south Wales. At present, they receive about 7 per cent of the money spent on such communities throughout Britain. It has been less than that at times. Geraint Davies and Dai Lloyd have referred to using the number of ex-miners in coalfield communities, who are now pensioners, as a basis for calculating the amount of money given to those communities. That would amount to a 20 per cent share of the money given to coalfield communities throughout Britain. However, the majority of pensioners derive from the period before 1945.

Ar eu hanterth, yr oedd meysydd glo Cymru yn gyfrifol am gynhyrchu 40 y cant o'r glo a allforiwyd gan Brydain ledled y byd, sef 33 y cant o holl allforion y byd. Galwaf arnoch—

In their heyday, the Welsh coalfields produced 40 per cent of the British coal exported throughout the world, which amounted to 33 per cent of the total world

export. I call on—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has come to an end. Peter Black will not have an opportunity to contribute unless you finish.

**Owen John Thomas:** Dof i ben drwy alw ar y Llywodraeth i ddechrau cynrychioli Cymru. Os nad y hi sy'n mynd i ofyn am chwarae teg i'r glowyr, pwy wnaiff hynny? Mae'r Saeson yn chwerthin am eich pen chi, Rhodri.

**Lynne Neagle:** Plaid Cymru and the Conservatives supporting a Wales taskforce does not stand up to scrutiny. Neither party has a proud record of putting the Valleys or coalfield communities first. Plaid Cymru has been quick to posture and pose for the cameras on the issue of miners' compensation. The real work to speed up payments is being done by Welsh Labour. Comments made by Plaid Cymru's former leader on golden handshakes for miners show exactly where the party's loyalties lie.

However, I am convinced that the arguments put forward by the Coalfield Communities Campaign—not the crocodile tears of some in this Chamber—have significant merit for this issue to be given consideration. Will Rhodri, in responding to this debate, give a commitment to meet with the Coalfield Communities Campaign, and to ask his officials to consider this issue in more depth. We should not be shy about celebrating our achievement, but neither should we be reluctant to consider establishing a taskforce.

Finally, I understand that Bleddyn Hancock's union, NACODS, takes 10 per cent commission from every compensation case it wins. I do not suppose that Plaid Cymru will be advertising that fact during the Ogmores by-election.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for the brief intervention earlier, Deputy Presiding Officer; you should not give an incentive to Owen John Thomas to continue speaking.

What we have seen today is a good example of megaphone politics and distorted facts. If there is to be a taskforce, there must be a

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daeth eich amser i ben. Ni fydd gan Peter Black gyfle i gyfrannu os na wnewch chi orffen.

**Owen John Thomas:** I conclude by calling on the Government to start representing Wales. If it does not ask for fair play for the miners, who will do so? The English are laughing at you, Rhodri.

**Lynne Neagle:** Nid yw'r ffaith bod Plaid Cymru a'r Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi tasglu i Gymru yn dal dŵr. Nid oes gan yr un o'r ddwy blaid record dda o roi'r Cymoedd neu'r cymunedau glo yn gyntaf. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn gyflym i esgus ac ystumio o flaen y camerâu ar fater iawndal i'r glowyr. Mae'r gwir waith i gyflymu'r taliadau yn cael ei wneud gan Lafur Cymru. Mae sylwadau gan gyn-arweinydd Plaid Cymru ynglŷn â thaliadau ymadael hael i lowyr yn dangos yn glir ymhle mae teyrngarwch y blaid yn gorwedd.

Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn argyhoeddedig fod gan y dadleuon a gyflwynir gan Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol—nid ffug wylofaen rhai o'r aelodau yn y Siambr hon—ddigon o deilyngdod i'r mater hwn gael ei ystyried. A wnaiff Rhodri, wrth ymateb i'r ddadl hon, roi ymrwymiad i gyfarfod Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol, a gofyn i'w swyddogion ystyried y mater hwn yn fanylch. Ni ddylem fod yn swil ynglŷn â dathlu yr hyn a wnaethom, ond ni ddylem chwaith fod yn hwyrfrydig i ystyried sefydlu tasglu.

Yn olaf, deallaf fod undeb Bleddyn Hancock, NACODS, yn mynd â 10 y cant o gomisiwn o bob achos y mae'n ei ennill. Nid wyf yn tybio y bydd Plaid Cymru yn hysbysebu'r ffaith honno yn ystod is-etholiad Ogwr.

**Peter Black:** Diolch i chi am eich ymyriad yn gynharach, Ddirprwy Lywydd; ni ddylech roi anogaeth i Owen John Thomas barhau i siarad.

Mae'r hyn a welsom heddiw yn enghraifft dda o wleidyddiaeth y megaffon a ffeithiau gwyrddoedig. Os oes tasglu i fod, rhaid bod



reason for it. We must also adopt an integrated approach. We are already doing a great deal for coalfield communities as a result of Communities First and the money given to the Coalfields Regeneration Trust. Plaid Cymru has not made a case as to why we should have a talking shop, when we should be concentrating on the action now being taken in coalfield communities.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I want to be clear that the First Minister has 15 minutes to speak. The custom is to be strict about that. We will start the clock again. Any Members can seek to intervene; I am sure that the First Minister will be accommodating.

**The First Minister:** Thank you for your guidance. I will enter into the spirit of it, if I can. The contraction of the mining industry in Wales has taken place over many decades. By 1994, there were only 400 people working in the only remaining deep mine in Wales. Fortunately, we still have a deep mine in Tower Colliery, which—owned by the workforce—represents a flag to which the people of Wales have rallied in terms of seeing what can be achieved if people take their fate into their own hands and decide to improve on the previous management. More power to the elbows of the miners in Tower Colliery.

However, the Welsh coal industry has gone from employing 270,000 miners at its peak, just before the first world war, to less than 1,000 today. In terms of output, coal production has decreased from 57 million tonnes to less than 1 million today. Politically, the defining event of the second half of the last century was probably Aberfan. It became evident that the Valleys, as a whole, had become a potential environmental disaster area. The then Labour Government tried to clear up the derelict land inheritance because it was unsightly, dangerous and going to be a major drag on the economic redevelopment of the south Wales coalfield. The Welsh Development Agency was set up the following decade, building on the derelict land unit's work and combining that unit with the old Welsh industrial estates corporation and the development corporation for Wales.

rheswm dros hynny. Rhaid i ni hefyd fabwysiadu ymagwedd integredig. Yr ydym eisoes yn gwneud cryn dipyn dros gymunedau'r meysydd glo o ganlyniad i Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a'r arian a roddwyd i Ymddiriedolaeth Adfywio'r Meysydd Glo. Ni wnaeth Plaid Cymru achos dros pam y dylem gael siop siarad, pan y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar y gweithredu sy'n digwydd yn awr yng nghymunedau'r meysydd glo.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am iddi fod yn glir fod gan y Prif Weinidog 15 munud i siarad. Yr arfer yw bod yn llym ynglŷn â hynny. Cychwynnwn y cloc unwaith eto. Gall unrhyw Aelodau geisio ymyrryd; yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn barod i ystyried ildio.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Diolch i chi am eich arweiniad. Ceisiaf fabwysiadu'r un ysbryd os medraf. Mae crebachiad y diwydiant glo yng Nghymru wedi digwydd dros nifer o ddegawdau. Erbyn 1994, 400 o bobl yn unig oedd yn gweithio yn yr unig bwlldwfn oedd ar ôl yng Nghymru. Yn ffodus, mae gennym bwlldwfn glo o hyd ym Mhwll y Tŵr, sydd—ym mherchenogaeth y glowyr—yn cynrychioli baner y gwnaeth pobl Cymru ymateb iddi o ran yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni gan bobl sy'n barod i gymryd y cyfrifoldeb dros eu dyfodol eu hunain a phenderfynu gwella ar y rheolaeth flaenorol. Pob nerth i ymdrech glowyr Pwll y Tŵr.

Fodd bynnag, mae diwydiant glo Cymru wedi mynd o gyflogi 270,000 o lowyr ar ei anterth, ychydig cyn y rhyfel byd cyntaf, i lai na 1,000 heddiw. O ran cynnyrch, gostyngodd cynhyrchiant glo o 57 miliwn o dunelli metr i lai nag 1 filiwn heddiw. Yn wleidyddol, digwyddiad diffiniol ail hanner y ganrif ddiwethaf, fwy na thebyg, oedd Aberfan. Daeth hi'n glir bod y Cymoedd yn gyffredinol wedi dod yn ardal trychineb amgylcheddol bosibl. Ceisiodd y Llywodraeth Lafur ar y pryd glirio'r etifeddiaeth tir diffaith oherwydd ei fod yn ddolur i'r llygad, yn beryglus ac yn mynd i fod yn llestair mawr i ailddatblygiad economaidd maes glo de Cymru. Sefydlwyd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn y degawd dilynol, gan adeiladau ar waith yr uned tir diffaith a chyfuno'r uned honno â hen gorfforaeth ystadau diwydiannol Cymru a

It was to be a powerful body for the economic regeneration of Wales, particularly for the less well-off areas, which involved the land reclamation programmes and the industrial development and job creation programmes in the south Wales coalfield.

The nature of that decline has given rise to a series of policy responses by previous administrations, both Labour and Conservative, before the Assembly's establishment. Those responses included the urban programmes, the Valleys initiative, the strategic development scheme and the Welsh capital challenge. The approach of this Assembly Government was to put in place a simple, understandable, limited number of significant, properly funded regeneration projects, which have been targeted at the most deprived parts of Wales. There is no project specifically for the coalfields, but because there is such a concentration of deprivation in parts of them, they are naturally the major beneficiaries of our regeneration programmes.

In recent years, we have launched the Objective 1 programme, the local regeneration fund and Communities First. Therefore, we have put in place an integrated response to the ongoing needs of deprived communities including those in former coalfield areas. I mentioned those programmes in my letter to Noel Crowley and Bob Wellington before Christmas. Those programmes give us a seamless web of services. You cannot simply react in a knee-jerk way, as Dai Lloyd has done, by saying that if they have something in England—since Plaid Cymru loves everything that happens in England—we must therefore have exactly the same in Wales. That is too much of a knee-jerk reaction.

If there is evidence of a gap in the provision in Wales, we will consider it. I set out the case for saying that there was no gap, but if I can have prima facie evidence that there is one, I will consider it and re-examine the matter to see if we are not providing something. I wrote that letter because I did not think that that was the case. From Dai Lloyd's contribution, it is not clear whether he agrees or disagrees with the content of my letter. I believe that it supports the case that

chorfforaeth ddatblygu Cymru. Yr oedd i fod yn gorff pwerus dros adfywiad economaidd Cymru, yn enwedig i'r ardaloedd llai ffyniannus, a olygai sefydlu rhaglenni adfer tir a rhaglenni datblygiad diwydiannol a chreu swyddi ym maes glo de Cymru.

Arweiniodd natur y dirywiad hwnnw at gyfres o ymatebion polisïau gan weinyddiaethau blaenorol, Llafur a'r Ceidwadwyr, cyn sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd yr ymatebion hynny'n cynnwys y rhaglenni trefol, menter y Cymoedd, y cynllun datblygiad strategol a her cyfalaf Cymru. Ymagwedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn oedd rhoi ar waith nifer gyfyngedig syml, ddealladwy o brosiectau adfywio a ariannwyd yn briodol, sydd wedi eu targedu at y rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Gymru. Nid oes prosiect sydd yn benodol i'r meysydd glo, ond oherwydd dwysedd y difreindedd mewn rhannau ohonynt, maent yn naturiol yn rhai sy'n elwa'n fawr gan ein rhaglenni adfywio.

Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi lansio rhaglen Amcan 1, y gronfa adfywio leol a Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Felly yr ydym wedi rhoi ymateb integredig ar waith ar gyfer anghenion parhaus cymunedau difreintiedig, yn cynnwys y rhai hynny yn y cyn feysydd glo. Soniais am y rhaglenni hyn yn fy llythyr at Noel Crowley a Bob Wellington cyn y Nadolig. Rhydd y rhaglenni hyn we ddiwñiad o wasanaethau. Ni allwch ymateb, fel y gwnaeth Dai Lloyd, mewn ffordd fyrbwyll drwy ddweud os oes ganddynt rywbeth ar gyfer Lloegr—gan fod Plaid Cymru yn caru popeth sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr—felly rhaid i ni gael yr un peth yn hollol yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n ymateb sy'n un llawer rhy fyrbwyll.

Os oes tystiolaeth fod bwllch yn y ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru, byddwn yn barod i'w ystyried. Nodais yr achos dros ddweud nad oes bwllch, ond os caf dystiolaeth olwg gyntaf bod yna un, byddaf yn ei ystyried ac yn ailarchwilio'r mater i weld a ydym yn methu â darparu rhywbeth. Ysgrifennais y llythyr hwnnw gan nad oeddwn o'r farn mai dyna oedd y sefyllfa. A barnu oddi wrth gyfraniad Dai Lloyd, nid yw'n glir a ydyw yn cytuno neu'n anghytuno â chynnwys fy

everything produced by the taskforce in England has already been undertaken in Wales for some years, and that Plaid Cymru, therefore, has no case. However, if we are wrong, we will be happy to consider the evidence and re-visit the matter.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you agree that it is rank hypocrisy for Plaid Cymru to talk about fair shares for mining communities, when that party failed to support the review of the local government formula that was specifically designed to give more resources to local government in the Valleys to address these problems? Do you agree that it is xenophobic racism for Owen John Thomas to make such anti-English comments during his contribution?

11:55 a.m.

**The First Minister:** We know Owen John Thomas of old and we tolerate him. However, your point about Plaid Cymru's claim to be the miners' or the coalfields' friend as being outright political, opportunistic vulturism is fair. It has no coherent strategy across Wales. It is the friend of foxhunters in rural Wales.

**Cynog Dafis** *rose*—

**The First Minister:** Here is one example, I am glad to see him standing up, but I will take Pauline's intervention first. In the Valleys, Plaid Cymru is the miners' friend. You cannot do that. You must have a coherent strategy that works across Wales. Are you the foxhunters' friend or are you the miners' friend? You cannot put those two together and paper over the cracks by coming on strong today because a by-election is pending in Ogmere and pretend in that strange, megaphone and slightly strangulated voice that Dai Lloyd uses when he is on a by-election mission, when we know he does not use that voice when discussing his usual topic of health—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order.

**The First Minister:** He should use his

llythyr. Credaf ei fod yn cefnogi'r ddadl fod popeth a gynhyrchwyd gan y tasglu yng Lloegr eisoes wedi cael ei gyflawni yng Nghymru ers blynyddoedd, ac nad oes gan Plaid Cymru, felly unrhyw ddadl. Fodd bynnag, os ydym yn anghywir, byddwn yn fodlon ystyried y dystiolaeth a dychwelyd at y mater.

**Brian Gibbons:** A gytunwch ei bod yn rhagrith noeth i Blaid Cymru siarad am gyfran deg i gymunedau'r meysydd glo, pan fethodd y blaid honno gefnogi yr adolygiad o'r fformiwla llywodareth leol a gynlluniwyd yn benodol i roi rhagor o adnoddau i lywodraeth leol yn y Cymoedd i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn? A gytunwch ei bod yn hiliaeth senoffobig i Owen John Thomas wneud sylwadau mor wrth-Seisnig yn ystod ei gyfraniad?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Yr ydym yn hen gyfarwydd ag Owen John Thomas, ac yr ydym yn ei oddef. Fodd bynnag, mae eich pwynt ynglŷn ag haerriad Plaid Cymru ei bod yn ffrind y glowyr neu'n ffrind y maes glo, yn fwlturiaeth wleidyddol ddigywilydd yn un teg. Nid oes ganddi strategaeth ystyrllon ar draws Cymru. Mae'n ffrind i helwyr llwynogod yn y Gymru wledig.

**Cynog Dafis** *a gododd*—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Dyma un enghraifft, yr wyf yn falch i'w weld yn sefyll ar ei draed, ond cymeraf ymyriad Pauline gyntaf. Yn y Cymoedd mae Plaid Cymru yw ffrind y glowyr. Ni allwch wneud hynny. Rhaid i chi gael strategaeth ystyrllon sy'n gweithio ar draws Cymru. Ai ffrind yr heliwr llwynog ydych ai ffrind y glöwr? Ni allwch roi'r ddau hyn ynghyd a cheisio cuddio'r craciau oherwydd fod is-etholiad ar fin digwydd yn Ogwr ac esgus yn y llais rhyfedd, megaffon cras hwnnw y bydd Dai Lloyd yn ei ddefnyddio pan fydd ar genhadaeth is-etholiad, pan wyddom nad yw'n defnyddio'r llais hwnnw wrth drafod ei bwnc arferol iechyd—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dylai ddefnyddio ei lais

normal voice and then he might be able to judge what he really means by his remarks.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. This must not get out of hand. I have received a request for a point of order. I will take that point of order and one from Nick, if necessary. We will extend the time on this, Rhodri.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Point of order. The First Minister was challenged some weeks ago about his use of language in referring to Members. Will he reflect on the words that he used to describe Dai Lloyd and withdraw them?

**Nick Bourne:** I do not have a point of order. It is an intervention.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry if Ieuan has taken offence on Dai Lloyd's behalf. I could see Dai Lloyd laughing and not taking offence. I welcome that because Dai Lloyd likes a bit of knockabout better than his party leader does. I am happy to withdraw the remarks if Dai is offended. Are you offended, Dai? I see that you are not.

**Nick Bourne:** I wonder if you could try this conundrum: do you believe that there is a closer link between foxhunting and mining than there is between enlargement and qualified majority voting?

**The First Minister:** You have a reputation for nit-picking. Do not make it worse, Nick.

**Pauline Jarman:** It must be understood that the Coalfield Communities Campaign represents 15 local authorities of all political persuasions throughout Wales. I am surprised that Lynne Neagle hosted a meeting a week or two ago on that. Gaps have been obvious and I illustrated that on Tuesday in a question to you about pockets of poverty within electoral divisions that do not make up the top 100 poorest in Wales. Nonetheless, those communities are equally poor. That is the gap that this taskforce could address.

**The First Minister:** I have asked you to

arferol ac yna byddai efallai'n gallu barnu beth yn hollol y mae'n ei olygu'n hollol wrth ei sylwadau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid i hyn beidio â mynd allan o reolaeth. Derbyniais gais am bwynt o drefn. Cymeraf y pwynt o drefn hwnnw ac un gan Nick, os oes raid. Byddwn yn estyn yr amser ar hyn Rhodri.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Pwynt o drefn. Heriwyd y Prif Weinidog rai wythnosau yn ôl ynglŷn â'i ddefnydd o iaith wrth gyfeirio at Aelodau. A wnaiff ystyried y geiriau a ddefnyddiodd i ddisgrifio Dai Lloyd a'u tynnu yn ôl?

**Nick Bourne:** Nid oes gennyf bwynt o drefn. Ymyriad ydyw.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os yw Ieuan wedi ei gythruddo ar ran Dai Lloyd. Gallwn weld Dai Lloyd yn chwerrthyn ac nad oedd wedi digio. Croesawaf hynny oherwydd mae Dai Lloyd yn hoffi ychydig o gecran yn fwy nag arweinydd ei blaid. Bydd yn dda gennyf dynnu'r sylwadau yn ôl os yw Dai wedi'i gythruddo. A ydych wedi'ch cythruddo Dai? Gwelaf nad ydych.

**Nick Bourne:** Tybed a allech roi cynnig ar y pôt hwn: a gredwch chi fod perthynas agosach rhwng hela llwynogod a chloddio am lo nag sydd rhwng helaethiad a phleidleisio mwyafrifol amodol?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae gennych enw am godi manion. Peidiwch â gwneud pethau'n waeth Nick.

**Pauline Jarman:** Rhaid deall fod Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol yn cynrychioli 15 awdurdod lleol o bob safbwynt gwleidyddol ar draws Cymru. Yr wyf yn synnu bod Lynn Neagle wedi croesawu cyfarfod ar hynny wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl. Bu bylchau yn amlwg a darluniais hynny ddydd Mawrth mewn cwestiwn i chi ar bocedi o dlodi o fewn ardaloedd etholaethol nad ydynt yn rhan o'r 100 tlotaf yng Nghymru. Serch hynny mae'r cymunedau hyn yr un mor dlawd. Dyna'r bwlech y gallai'r tasglu hwn fynd i'r afael ag ef.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Gofynnais i chi

write to me about that, Pauline. I am waiting for the letter in which you will put the case to me, and I will reply to you. You must accept that when a high proportion of the 100 communities that have been nominated for special assistance in Communities First are in the coalfields, you can hardly make a case for saying that Communities First ignores their needs. Likewise, Objective 1 includes, with the exception of the north-east coalfield, all of the coalfields in Wales. Around 95 per cent of the coalfields in Wales are covered by Objective 1. There is a high degree of priority to those communities—

**Owen John Thomas and Cynog Dafis** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Are you giving way, First Minister?

**The First Minister:** I will give way to Owen John first.

**Owen John Thomas:** I raise a point of order regarding Brian Gibbons' remarks—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I am beginning to lose my patience. You cannot stand up, Owen John, to intervene and then turn it into a point of order. If it is an intervention to the First Minister—

**Owen John Thomas:** I did not stand up to intervene. I was going to make a point of order.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We will take points of order at the end.

**The First Minister:** The Objective 1 programme will deliver a comprehensive package of social, economic and physical regeneration projects that will ensure the sustainable regeneration of communities throughout the Objective 1 area. Ninety two per cent of those communities lie within the Objective 1 area, with the other 8 per cent in Wrexham and Point of Ayr. Communities First will then complement other regeneration programmes by empowering communities to deliver their own economic and social regeneration initiatives. Of the 100 most deprived wards in Wales targeted by

ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â hyn, Pauline. Yr wyf yn disgwyl am y llythyr yn amlinellu'ch dadl i mi, a byddaf yn eich ateb. Mae'n rhaid i chi dderbyn pan fydd cyfran uchel o'r 100 cymuned sydd wedi eu henwebu i dderbyn cymorth arbennig yn Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn y meysydd glo, ni allwch ddadlau fod Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn anwybyddu eu hanghenion. Yn yr un modd, mae Amcan 1 yn cynnwys pob un o feysydd glo Cymru ac eithrio maes glo'r gogledd ddwyrain. Mae tua 95 y cant o ardaloedd glo Cymru yn ardal Amcan 1. Mae gan y cymunedau hyn radd uchel o flaenoriaeth—

**Owen John Thomas a Cynog Dafis** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. A ildiwch Brif Weinidog?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ildiaf i Owen John yn gyntaf.

**Owen John Thomas:** Codaf bwynt o drefn ynglŷn â sylwadau Brian Gibbons—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn dechrau colli fy amynedd. Ni allwch godi ar eich traed Owen John, i ymyrryd a throi hynny wedyn yn bwynt o drefn. Os yw'n ymyriad i'r Prif Weinidog—

**Owen John Thomas:** Ni sefais ar fy nhraed i ymyrryd. Yr oeddwn yn mynd i godi pwynt o drefn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Byddwn yn cymryd pwyntiau o drefn ar y diwedd.

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Bydd y rhaglen Amcan 1 yn cyflwyno pecyn cyffredinol o brosiectau adfywio cymdeithasol, economaidd a ffisegol a fydd yn sicrhau adfywiad cynaliadwy cymunedau ar draws yr ardal Amcan 1. Mae 92 y cant o'r cymunedau hyn ardal Amcan 1, gyda'r 8 y cant arall yn Wrecsam a'r Parlwr Du. Bydd Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf wedyn yn cefnogi rhaglenni adfywio eraill drwy rymuso cymunedau i gyflwyno'u mentrau adfywio economaidd a chymdeithasol eu hunain. O'r 100 o wardiau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru a dargedir gan Rhoi Cymunedau'n

Communities First, 57 are in the former coalfields area.

The coalfields taskforce established by the UK Deputy Prime Minister in 1997—I was pleased to hear Dai Lloyd commending his initiative for establishing that in England and I will ensure that John Prescott knows that he has a fan in Dai Lloyd—identified a specific regeneration programme for colliery closure areas. The taskforce's key recommendation was to establish the coalfields regeneration trust with a remit to promote social and economic regeneration in the coalfields communities. That has proceeded and, since 1999, the Welsh Assembly Government has supported the activities of the taskforce in Wales. It is now an established grant-giving body targeting the sustainable regeneration of our coalfields communities. I was pleased to launch it in the Hoover factory sports and social club in Merthyr Tydfil.

**Alun Cairns:** We are constantly told that the purpose of devolution is to set a different agenda in Wales. Why then has Wales been used in the English coalfields taskforce? Does this reflect the priority which the First Minister places on Welsh coalfields?

**The First Minister:** I am sorry, Alun, but I cannot make head nor tail of that question.

The problems facing deprived communities in Wales, including the former coalfields communities are well-documented, and we are committed to addressing them through the work of the WDA and Communities First. The network space initiative—

**David Lloyd:** Will the First Minister give way?

**The First Minister:** I will address this issue and then give way.

You specifically mentioned one initiative that has proceeded in England. You did not say that there was not already such an initiative in Wales, as I explained in my letter to Noel

Gyntaf mae 57 yn y cyn ardaloedd glo.

Nododd tasglu'r meysydd glo a sefydlwyd gan Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog y DU ym 1997—yr oeddwn yn falch i glywed Dai Lloyd yn canmol ei flaengaredd am sefydlu hwnnw yn Lloegr a gwnaf yn siŵr y bydd John Prescott yn cael gwybod bod Dai Lloyd yn edmygydd iddo—raglen adfywio benodol ar gyfer ardaloedd lle y caewyd pyllau glo. Argymhellion allweddol y tasglu oedd sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth adfywio'r meysydd glo gyda chylch gwaith i hyrwyddo adfywiad economaidd a chymdeithasol yn y cymunedau glo. Digwyddodd hynny, ac ers 1999, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cefnogi gweithgareddau y tasglu yng Nghymru. Y mae yn awr yn gorff rhoi grantiau sefydledig sy'n targedu adfywiad cynaliadwy ein cymunedau glo. Yr oedd yn dda gennyf ei lansio yng nghlwb chwaraeon a chymdeithasol ffatri Hoover ym Merthyr Tudful.

**Alun Cairns:** Dywedir wrthym yn gyson mai diben datganoli yw gosod agenda wahanol yng Nghymru. Pam felly y defnyddiwyd Cymru yn nhasglu meysydd glo Lloegr? A yw hyn yn adlewyrchu'r flaenoriaeth y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn ei rhoi ar feysydd glo Cymru?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Alun, ni allaf wneud pen na chwt o'r cwestiwn yna.

Mae'r problemau sy'n wynebu cymunedau difreintiedig yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys y cyn gymunedau meysydd glo, wedi eu dogfennu'n dda, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â hwy drwy waith y WDA a Rhoi Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Mae'r fenter gofod rhwydwaith—

**David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ildio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Trafodaf y mater hwn ac yna ildiaf.

Gwnaethoch sôn yn benodol am un fenter a aeth rhagddi yn Lloegr. Ni wnaethoch sôn nad oes fenter debyg iddi yn barod yng Nghymru, fel yr eglurais yn fy llythyr at Noel

Crowley. It would have been helpful to this debate—as you raised this question and I answered it—if you had mentioned my response, namely that the WDA’s local workspace programme is already in existence. Therefore, in England they may see a gap and they may say, ‘We must make good that gap’. If that gap is already being covered in Wales through the WDA’s local workspace initiative, there is no need to set up a new scheme. If we did, the Audit Committee would be on our backs saying that there is a proliferation of too many schemes doing exactly the same thing. Why not keep it simple? We would be unwinding the work that we had done if we were to fall into your knee-jerk trap of thinking that every time they do something in England, we must do exactly the same in Wales. You must first consider whether it is already covered. You must not automatically assume that we have got it wrong in Wales. That is the problem, Dai; you automatically assume that we have got it wrong. We do not assume that. We look at the facts and consider whether this issue has been covered. Have we covered the issue of local workspace? We are assured that the WDA is already carrying out the work of the network space initiative, which you said was absent in Wales. It is being covered. You should have mentioned that I have already responded to that issue.

**David Lloyd and Cynog Dafis** *rose*—

**The First Minister:** I will give way to Dai Lloyd or Cynog—I do not mind which.

**David Lloyd:** There is a queue for interventions.

I confirm that I was not offended by the First Minister’s comments. However, our coalfields communities continue to be offended by the inequity in funding, otherwise they would not have given us such a presentation last week. Some £50 million has been allocated to England and £3.5 million to Wales, and, in the second tranche, £45 million will be allocated to England and £1 million to Wales. It is offensive. At least £10 million should have been allocated to Wales each time.

Crowley. Byddai wedi bod o gymorth yn y ddatl hon—gan i chi godi’r cwestiwn ac i minnau ei ateb—pe baech wedi cyfeirio at fy ymateb, sef bod rhaglen gweithle leol y WDA eisoes yn bodoli. Felly, yn Lloegr, efallai eu bod yn gweld bwlch ac efallai eu bod yn dweud, ‘Rhaid i ni lanw’r bwlch hwnnw’. Os yw’r bwlch hwnnw’n cael ei lanw eisoes yng Nghymru drwy fenter gweithle leol y WDA, yna nid oes angen sefydlu cynllun newydd. Pe gwnaem, byddai’r Pwyllgor Archwilio ar ein gwarthaf gan ddatgan fod gormodedd o gynlluniau yn gwneud yr un peth. Pam na chadwn bethau’n syml? Byddem yn dadwneud y gwaith a wnaethom eisoes pe byddem yn syrthio i’r meddfylfryd byrbwyll gan feddwl bob tro y gwneir rhywbeth ganddynt yn Lloegr, fod yn rhaid i ni wneud yn union yr un peth yng Nghymru. Rhaid i chi’n gyntaf ystyried a ydyw yn cael ei wneud yn barod. Ni ddylech gymryd yn ganiataol ein bod ni yng Nghymru wedi gwneud camgymeriad. Dyna’r broblem Dai; yr ydych chi’n meddwl yn awtomatig ein bod wedi gwneud camgymeriad yng Nghymru. Nid ydym ni’n tybio hynny. Edrychwn ni ar y ffeithiau ac ystyried pa un ai a wynebwyd y mater hwn. A ydym wedi trafod mater y gweithle lleol? Fe’n sicrhawyd bod y WDA yn barod yn gweithredu’r fenter gofod rhwydwaith, nad yw’n bodoli yng Nghymru yn eich tyb chi. Mae yn cael ei wynebu. Dylech fod wedi sôn fy mod eisoes wedi ymateb i’r mater hwnnw.

**David Lloyd a Cynog Dafis** *a gododd*—

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Ildiaf i Dai Lloyd neu i Cynog—waeth gennyf pa un.

**David Lloyd:** Mae ciw ar gyfer ymyriadau.

Cadarnhaf na chythruddwyd mohonof gan sylwadau’r Prif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, mae ein cymunedau glo yn parhau i gael eu cythruddo gan annhegwch yr ariannu, neu ni fyddent wedi rhoi cyflwyniad o’r fath inni’r wythnos diwethaf. Dyrannwyd rhyw £50 miliwn i Loegr a £3.5 miliwn i Gymru, ac, yn yr ail ystod, dyrennir £45 miliwn i Loegr ac £1 filiwn i Gymru. Mae’n atgas. Dylid bod wedi clustnodi £10 miliwn o leiaf i Gymru ar y ddau dro.

**The First Minister:** Nothing in the programme which has been proposed for England, is not already being provided for in Wales. The same applies regarding your point about the lottery. We are already covering that in conjunction with the lottery bodies. The picture is by no means as simple as you say. There are some communities that have a low uptake of lottery funding, but the new opportunities fund and the community fund have the specific objective of addressing deprivation.

In addition, the recently announced fair share scheme is designed specifically to address cold spots of low lottery take-up. It has all been done and, if it has been done, there is no point in doing it again. If I am wrong, I am willing to accept the case of the Coalfields Communities Campaign, which should put to me its prima facie case for saying that there are gaps. However, we cannot set up a taskforce to go on a fishing expedition looking for gaps without any prima facie evidence that there are any. That is our problem. We challenge you to tell us where the gaps are on prima facie evidence. We will agree—if there is a prima facie case—to set up a taskforce to look for them. However, unless you give us a prima facie case there is simply no point in setting up a taskforce to go on a fishing expedition. I gave this information to Bob Wellington last week. I am happy to meet him, Noel Crowley, Professor Fothergill from northern England and the other members of the Coalfields Communities Campaign to discuss whether there is a prima facie case for saying that there are gaps in the provision. We do not think that there are. However, if you present a prima facie case to us, we will reconsider it

**Cynog Davies:** Yr hyn a wylltiodd y grŵp a oedd yn cynrychioli Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol, a fu'n cyfarfod yn y Cynulliad, oedd y ffaith eich bod chi, fel Prif Weinidog, wedi methu ag ymateb i'w gais i drafod mater y tasglu. Yr ydych wedi ateb erbyn hyn. Faint o amser oedd rhwng y cais cyntaf, a'ch ateb yn dilyn y cyfarfod, a'r ffaith fod Sue Essex wedi addo y byddai'n siarad â chi i sicrhau eich bod chi wedi ateb? Beth y mae'r ffaith eich bod wedi methu ag ateb llythyr o'r fath

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes dim yn y rhaglen, a gynigir ar gyfer Lloegr, nad yw eisoes yn cael ei ddarparu yng Nghymru. Mae'r un peth yn wir ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am y loteri. Yr ydym eisoes yn gofalu am hynny mewn cydweithrediad a chyrrff y loteri. Nid yw'r darlun mor syml â'r hyn a ddisgrifiwch. Bu rhai cymunedau yn araf i fynnu arian y loteri, ond mae gan y gronfa cyfleoedd newydd a'r gronfa gymunedol yr amcan penodol o fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd.

Yn ogystal, cynlluniwyd y cynllun cyfran deg a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar yn benodol i fynd i'r afael â'r manau hynny lle mae'r ceisiadau am arian loteri'n isel. Mae'r cyfan wedi ei wneud, ac os yw wedi cael ei wneud, nid oes unrhyw bwrpas ei wneud eto. Os wyf yn anghywir, yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn achos Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol, a ddylai fod wedi gosod ei achos prima facie dros ddweud fod bylchau. Fodd bynnag, ni allwn sefydlu tasglu i fynd ar drip pysgota i chwilio am fylchau heb unrhyw dystiolaeth prima facie fod rhai. Dyna yw ein problem. Fe'ch heriwn i ddweud wrthym lle mae'r bylchau ar sail dystiolaeth prima facie. Cytunwn—os oes achos prima facie—i sefydlu tasglu i chwilio amdanynt. Fodd bynnag, os na roddwch achos prima facie inni nid oes unrhyw bwynt o gwbl mewn sefydlu tasglu i fynd ar drip pysgota. Rhoddais y wybodaeth hon i Bob Wellington yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn fodlon cwrdd ag ef, Noel Crowley, yr Athro Fothergill o ogledd Lloegr ac aelodau eraill Ymgyrch y Cymunedau Glofaol i drafod a oes achos prima facie dros ddweud fod bylchau yn y ddarpariaeth. Ni chredwn fod rhai. Fodd bynnag, os cyflwynwch achos prima facie inni, byddwn yn barod i'w ailystyried.

**Cynog Davies:** The outrage felt by the group which represented the Coalfield Communities Campaign, which met in the Assembly, was caused by your failure, as First Minister, to respond to their request to discuss the matter of the taskforce. You have now answered. How much time was there between their first request, and your response following that meeting, and the fact that Sue Essex promised that she would talk to you to ensure that you had answered? What does the fact



am fisoedd yn ei brofi am eich ymrwymiad i'r achos?

that you failed to answer such a letter for months say about your commitment to the cause?

**Prif Weinidog Cymru:** Nid oes dim sail i'r cyhuddiad hwnnw. Atebwyd y llythyr ar 21 Rhagfyr. Nid oedd neb wedi cynddeiriogi pan gefais air gyda'r Athro Stephen Fothergill, Lynne Jones a'r Cynghorydd Bob Wellington ar ddechrau'r cyfarfod, nac yn ystod y derbynriad yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr oeddent yn hapus gyda'm cynnig.

**The First Minister:** There is no basis to that accusation. The letter was answered on 21 December. No-one had been angered when I spoke with Professor Stephen Fothergill, Lynne Jones and Councillor Bob Wellington at the start of the meeting, nor at the reception last week. They were happy with my offer.

Os oes sail prima facie dros hawlio bod gwallau yn ein cynlluniau, byddem yn hapus i sefydlu tasglu. Nid ydym yn fodlon sefydlu tasglu dim ond er mwyn gwneud hynny, nac oherwydd bod un yn Lloegr. Ni fyddai hynny'n synhwyrol. Caem ein cyhuddo o greu rhagor o gynlluniau fel ymateb difeddwl, ac o gredu am fod Lloegr yn creu mwy o gynlluniau, rhaid ei fod yn iawn inni wneud yr un peth yng Nghymru. Synnaf fod Plaid Cymru yn cwmpo i'r fagl honno.

If there were a prima facie basis for claiming that there are errors in our schemes, we would be happy to establish a taskforce. We are not willing to do so for the sake of it, nor because there is one in England. That does not make sense. We would be accused of creating more schemes as a knee-jerk reaction, and of thinking that if England creates more schemes, it must be right for us to do the same in Wales. I am surprised that Plaid Cymru is falling into that trap.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Owen John Thomas:** Point of order. Dr Brian Gibbons made disparaging, false and unjust remarks about me, because I told the First Minister that he should put the case for Wales, and that our contribution in the coalfields has been considerably greater than the 1 per cent or 7 per cent that we currently get from London. I told him that the English are laughing at him. There is nothing anti-English about that remark. Will the Deputy Presiding Officer ask Dr Brian Gibbons to withdraw his remarks?

**Owen John Thomas:** Pwynt o drefn. Gwnaeth Dr Brian Gibbons sylwadau dilornus, anghywir ac annheg amdanaf, gan i mi ddweud wrth y Prif Weinidog y dylai osod yr achos dros Gymru, a bod ein cyfraniad yn y meysydd glo wedi bod yn llawer mwy na'r 1 y cant neu'r 7 y cant a gawn gan Lundain ar hyn o bryd. Dywedais wrtho fod y Saeson yn chwerthin am ei ben. Nid oes dim sy'n wrth-Seisnig yn y sylw hwnnw. A wnaiff y Dirprwy Lywydd ofyn i Dr Brian Gibbons dynnu ei sylwadau yn ôl?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I will refer this matter to the Presiding Officer next week, once we have studied the Record of Proceedings. It is better to decide on this matter after due consideration. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cyfeiriaf y mater hwn at y Llywydd yr wythnos nesaf, wedi inni astudio Cofnod y Trafodion. Bydd yn well penderfynu ar y mater hwn ar ôl rhoi ystyriaeth iddo. Daw hyn â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 12.03 p.m.  
The session ended at 12.03 p.m.*

