



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3
Legislation Committee No. 3**

**Dydd Iau, 19 Tachwedd 2009
Thursday, 19 November 2009**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 4 Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch y Diwydiant Cig Coch (Cymru)—Cyfnod 1: Sesiwn
Dystiolaeth 3
Proposed Red Meat Industry (Wales) Measure—Stage 1: Evidence Session 3
- 12 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,
cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Peter Black	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Christine Chapman	Llafur Labour
William Graham	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives
Janice Gregory	Llafur Labour
Helen Mary Jones	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales
David Lloyd	Plaid Cymru (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) The Party of Wales (Committee Chair)

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

William Lloyd Williams	Cymdeithas Gweithredwyr Lladd-dai Prydain Association of British Abattoir Operators
------------------------	--

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Fay Bowen	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Cynghorydd Cyfreithiol Legal Adviser
Ruth Hatton	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk
Carys Jones	Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau Members' Research Service

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 1.28 p.m.
The meeting began at 1.28 p.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **David Lloyd:** Galwaf y cyfarfod i drefn. Fe'ch croesawaf i gyd i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am gyfarfod diweddaraf Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3. Cynhelir cynhadledd fideo ag Aberystwyth—mwy am hynny maes o law. Yr ydym yma heddiw i drafod y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch y Diwydiant Cig Coch (Cymru). Yr ydym mewn trafodaethau Cyfnod 1, a hon yw'r trydedd sesiwn dystiolaeth.

David Lloyd: I call the meeting to order. I welcome you all to the National Assembly for Wales for the latest meeting of Legislative Committee No. 3. There will be a video-conference with Aberystwyth—more on that in due course. We are here today to discuss the Proposed Red Meat Industry (Wales) Measure. We are in Stage 1 proceedings, and this is the third evidence session.

[2] Nid oes ymddiheuriadau—mae pob un o'r Aelodau yma. Os bydd larwm tân, dylid gadael yr ystafell drwy'r allanfa dân a dilyn

There are no apologies—all of the Members are here. If the fire alarm sounds, you should leave the room through the fire exit and

cyfarwyddiadau'r tywyswyr a'r staff. Nid ydym yn disgwyl prawf tân y prynhawn yma.

follow the directions of the ushers and staff. We do not expect a fire drill this afternoon.

1.30 p.m.

[3] Dylid diffodd ffonau symudol, galwyr a 'mwyar duon' gan eu bod yn amharu ar y offer darlledu. Bydd pawb yn ymwybodol bellach bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gweithredu'n ddwyieithog, ac mae clustffonau ar gael ar gyfer y cyfieithiad ar y pryd. Gellir hefyd addasu'r lefelau sain ar y clustffonau ar gyfer pobl sy'n drwm eu clyw. Gofynnaf ichi beidio â chyffwrdd y botymau ar y meicroffonau oherwydd gallant amharu ar y system, ond dylech sicrhau bod y golau coch yn disgleirio cyn i chi gychwyn siarad. Mae'r cyfieithiad ar y pryd ar sianel 1 ac mae'r darllediad gair am air ar sianel 0.

Mobile phones, pagers and BlackBerrys should be switched off, as they interfere with the broadcasting equipment. You will all know by now that the National Assembly for Wales operates bilingually, and headsets for the simultaneous translation. The audio levels on the headsets can also be adapted for people who are hard of hearing. I ask you not to touch the buttons on the microphones because it can affect the system, but you should ensure that the red light is showing before you begin to speak. Simultaneous translation is available on channel 1 and the verbatim feed is on channel 0.

1.31 p.m.

Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch y Diwydiant Cig Coch (Cymru)—Cyfnod 1: Sesiwn Dystiolaeth 3

Proposed Red Meat Industry (Wales) Measure—Stage 1: Evidence Session 3

[4] **David Lloyd:** Diben y cyfarfod yw clywed dystiolaeth ar lafar mewn perthynas â'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. I'r perwyl hwnnw, hoffwn goesawu William Lloyd Williams, sy'n cynrychioli Cymdeithas Gweithredwyr Lladd-dai Prydain, i'r cyfarfod, thrwy fideo-gynadledda o Aberystwyth. Croeso, Mr Williams.

David Lloyd: The purpose of the meeting is to hear oral evidence in relation to this proposed Measure. To that end, I welcome William Lloyd Williams, who is representing the Association of British Abattoir Operators, to the meeting, through video-conference from Aberystwyth. Welcome, Mr Williams.

[5] **Mr Williams:** Diolch yn fawr i chi.

Mr Williams: Thank you.

[6] **David Lloyd:** Mae gennym 18 o gwestiynau sydd wedi eu paratoi ymlaen llaw i chi eu hateb. Bydd Aelodau yn eu tro yn gofyn y cwestiynau hynny i chi. Mae'r cwestiynau yn cwmpasu maes y Mesur arfaethedig yn weddol drylwyr, felly gofynnaf i'm cyd-Aelodau fod yn weddol gryno gydag eu cwestiynau. Gobeithio y byddwch chwithau hefyd, Mr Williams, yn weddol gryno gydag eich atebion.

David Lloyd: We have 18 questions that have been prepared beforehand for you to answer. Members will ask you those questions in turn. The questions cover the area of the proposed Measure relatively thoroughly, so I ask Members to be relatively succinct in their questions. I hope that you will also be relatively succinct in your responses, Mr Williams.

[7] Felly, gyda gymaint o hynny o ragymadrodd, dechreuaf gyda'r cwestiwn cyntaf. Pam ei bod yn angenrheidiol cael fframwaith deddfwriaethol i hybu a marchnata'r sector cig coch Cymraeg yn eich tyb chi?

So, with that preamble, I will begin with the first question. Why is it necessary to have a legislative framework to promote and market the Welsh red meat sector in your view?

[8] **Mr Williams:** Gan fod gennym gig oen Cymraeg a chig eidion Cymraeg, mae'n bwysig fod y neges yn mynd allan fel y gallwn werthu'r cynnyrch ym Mhrydain Fawr i gychwyn, ac wedyn ei allforio.

Mr Williams: We have Welsh lamb and Welsh beef, and it is important that the message goes out so that we can sell the produce in Great Britain to begin with, and then export it.

[9] **David Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr am hynny. Mae'r cwestiynau nesaf o dan ofal Janice Gregory.

David Lloyd: Thank you for that. Janice Gregory has the next questions.

[10] **Janice Gregory:** Good afternoon, Mr Williams. What are the failings of the current legislative arrangements and how does the proposed Measure improve on those arrangements?

[11] **Mr Williams:** Speaking from my experience with regard to levy collecting, the Meat and Livestock Commission in Milton Keynes used to do that work. Following devolution, Hybu Cig Cymru did the work. The problem that smaller abattoirs have with the legislation is that HCC wishes to collect the levies weekly. We have not been given a reason for this, but we have fought it, and at present we supply the figures and the moneys monthly. Why does it want to collect them weekly? Is it because it can collect the moneys quicker? If that is the case, why have some abattoirs, especially larger abattoirs that have gone bankrupt, ended up owing HCC in the region of £150,000 this year? I cannot seem to get any daylight on that.

[12] **Janice Gregory:** Okay, thank you. What is your view of statements by previous witnesses that the proposed Measure is merely a 'housekeeping exercise'?

[13] **Mr Williams:** With regard to the term 'housekeeping', if you are paying for something, you need to see something for your money. Unfortunately, some of my members say that they are paying a levy, but they cannot see what service they are receiving for that levy.

[14] **David Lloyd:** Mae'r cwestiynau nesaf o dan ofal William Graham.

David Lloyd: William Graham has the next questions.

[15] **William Graham:** Why is it necessary for the objectives of the proposed Measure to be so broadly drafted?

[16] **Mr Williams:** The term 'flexibility' comes in here. When I deal with the Meat Hygiene Service or the Food Standards Agency, flexibility seems to come in, but all too often it is with a lower-case 'f'. It needs to be flexibility with a capital 'f' so that the Minister can take charge of what goes on. Of course, I want the industry to be consulted on this, but the abattoir industry, the Assembly Government and the farming industry want the best out of this, which is to get a good price for our product in Wales, especially as we have protected geographical indicator status.

[17] **William Graham:** This is a slightly technical question. Section 3(1) of the proposed Measure confers powers on Welsh Ministers to 'do anything' that they consider appropriate to further the objectives outlined in Section 2. What are your views on the breadth of these powers?

[18] **Mr Williams:** Again, the term 'anything' is a broad one and gives a tremendous amount of scope, but I would be willing, as a Welshman, to say 'yes' to that, as long as the industry was consulted. By 'the industry', I mean from the big abattoirs through to the small ones, and the small cutting plants that are the backbone of the Welsh meat industry.

[19] **William Graham:** Section 3(2) of the proposed Measure states that, for the purpose of furthering the objectives outlined in Section 2, Welsh Ministers may, among other things, exercise any of the functions listed in Schedule 1 of the proposed Measure. Do you think that this list of functions is appropriate?

[20] **Mr Williams:** This goes back to the previous question. At the moment, there is a lot of talk about the National Assembly having law-making powers. I am happy to pay my levy to Aberystwyth, because at least it is staying in Wales; it does not go off to the English Beef and Lamb Executive in England, which would send a little back for promotional reasons. I would be in favour of that, but with industry consultation.

[21] **William Graham:** To what extent would abolishing the Welsh Levy Board and giving direct accountability for the sector to Welsh Ministers lead to greater streamlining or efficiency with regards to the red meat levy and the promotion of the red meat sector in Wales?

[22] **Mr Williams:** I am torn on this. It is a heart and head problem. I was cautious and wary of the Meat and Livestock Commission. When we had devolution and a new body, namely Hybu Cig Cymru, I wondered whether it was a case of better the devil you know. The one thing that I really hate in our industry is duplication. It does not matter whether you are large or small; if there is duplication, it is costly. Funds coming in should certainly be streamlined, because our industry has had to streamline when you consider what we have had to put up with in the last 10 years: bovine spongiform encephalopathy and foot and mouth disease. Possibly, the small abattoir sector should no longer exist, but as Dafydd Iwan sings, '*Ry'n ni yma o hyd*'.

[23] **William Graham:** A number of witnesses have previously made reference to the need for industry-wide consultation if Welsh Ministers intend to make changes to the levy mechanism. Should a requirement to consult be contained in the proposed Measure?

[24] **Mr Williams:** If it concerns raising the levy, because I doubt very much that they will want to lower it, the industry is one of the collectors of the levy. On my way down here today, I was thinking about who collects the levy—it is the abattoirs and the livestock markets. If they want us to continue to be like bankers, we need to be consulted on what goes on.

[25] **David Lloyd:** Diolch am hynny, William. Symudwn ymlaen at y gyfres nesaf o gwestiynau sydd gan Helen Mary Jones.

David Lloyd: Thank you for that, William. We will move on to the next set of questions from Helen Mary Jones.

[26] **Helen Mary Jones:** Prynawn da.

Helen Mary Jones: Good afternoon.

[27] **Mr Williams:** Prynawn da. Sut ydych chi?

Mr Williams: Good afternoon. How are you?

[28] **Helen Mary Jones:** Iawn, diolch yn fawr. Mae rhai tystion sydd wedi siarad gyda ni'n barod wedi dweud wrthym ei fod yn bwysig bod y gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd gan Hybu Cig Cymru yn parhau i gael ei wneud gan gorff sydd hyd fraich wrth Lywodraeth Cymru. A ydych chi'n cytuno gyda hynny? A yw'n bwysig bod Hybu Cig Cymru yn parhau i fod, i ryw raddau, yn annibynnol i'r Llywodraeth?

Helen Mary Jones: Fine, thank you. Some witnesses who have already given us oral evidence have suggested that it is important that the work that is currently undertaken by Hybu Cig Cymru should continue to be undertaken by an organisation that is at arms' length from the Welsh Government. Do you agree with that? Is it important for Hybu Cig Cymru to remain, to some extent, independent of the Government?

[29] **Mr Williams:** Ar ddiwedd y dydd, yr hyn yr ydym i gyd eisiau yw bod pris mor uchel â phosibl yn cael ei dalu am gynnyrch o Gymru. Soniais am ein statws dynodiad daearyddol gwarchoddedig. Bu i'r Llywodraeth weithio'n galed ar hynny, ond mae posibilrwydd y gallai fod wedi bod yn well. Os yw hynny'n golygu bod yn rhaid inni fynd i lawr i fae Caerdydd i wneud hynny, digon teg, dyna a wnawn. Efallai byddai bod yn annibynnol yn help i ni fel lladd-dai bychain.

Mr Williams: At the end of the day, what we all want to see is that as high a price as possible is paid for what we produce in Wales. I mentioned our protected geographical indication status. The Government worked hard on that, but there is a possibility that that could have been improved upon. If achieving that means that we have to go down to Cardiff bay to do that, fair enough, that is what we will do. Perhaps being independent would be of assistance to us as small abattoirs.

1.40 p.m.

[30] **Helen Mary Jones:** Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig fel y'i drafftwyd yn caniatáu hyblygrwydd yn y drefn yn y dyfodol o safbwynt Hybu Cig Cymru yn parhau'n annibynnol o'r Llywodraeth neu'n cael ei dynnu i mewn. Yr ydych newydd ddweud y byddai'n well gennych weld Hybu Cig Cymru yn aros yn annibynnol ac yn sicrhau bod llais y diwydiant yn cael ei glywed. A gredwch fod angen cadw hyblygrwydd ar gyfer y dyfodol, neu a fyddai'n well gennych weld hynny'n cael ei dynnu allan fel na fyddai modd i'r Llywodraeth dynnu Hybu Cig Cymru yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth?

Helen Mary Jones: The proposed Measure as drafted allows for some flexibility within the arrangements in future as to whether Hybu Cig Cymru remains independent of Government or is brought into Government. You have just said that you would prefer to see Hybu Cig Cymru staying independent and ensuring that the industry's voice is heard. Do you think that we need to retain flexibility for the future, or would you prefer to see that being removed so that the Government would not be able to bring Hybu Cig Cymru into Government?

[31] **Mr Williams:** Credaf y dylai'r rhai sy'n talu'r ardoll, sef y ffermwyr a'r lladd-dai, gael llais, naill ai drwoch chi ym mae Caerdydd neu drwy Hybu Cig Cymru. Gofynnais ynghynt wrth gyfeirio at y Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw a ydyw'n fater o

Mr Williams: I think that the people who pay the levy, namely the farmers and the abattoirs, have a voice, whether in Cardiff bay with you or with Hybu Cig Cymru. I asked earlier in referring to the Meat and Livestock Commission whether it is a case of

[32] better the devil you know than the devil you don't?

[33] Nid ydym yn gwybod hyd yma, ond, i raddau, mae Hybu Cig Cymru yn gwneud rhai pethau yn well na'r Comisiwn Cig a Da Byw, ond mae rhai pethau nad yw'n gwneud cystal â'r comisiwn.

We do not know as of yet, but, to a certain extent, there are some things that Hybu Cig Cymru does better than the MLC, but there are other things that it does not do as well.

[34] **Helen Mary Jones:** A gredwch ei fod yn bwysig bod gan y diwydiant lais o safbwynt cynrychiolydd ar fwrdd Hybu Cig Cymru? Dyna yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, ond ni fyddai ganddo lais pe bai'r Gweinidog yn ei dynnu i mewn i Adran Materion Gwledig y Llywodraeth.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you think that it is important that the industry has a voice through a representative on the Hybu Cig Cymru board? That is the situation at present, but it would not have that voice if the Minister brought it into the Government's Department for Rural Affairs.

[35] **Mr Williams:** Dylem gael mwy o lais. Mae angen ystyried sawl person sy'n

Mr Williams: We should have a stronger voice. We need to consider how many

ymwneud â chig sy'n aelodau o fwrdd Hybu Cig Cymru. producers are members of the Hybu Cig Cymru board.

[36] **David Lloyd:** Mae'r gyfres nesaf o gwestiynau o dan law Christine Chapman. **David Lloyd:** The next set of questions are from Christine Chapman.

[37] **Christine Chapman:** I will ask some specific questions on the levy. This proposed Measure is broadly defined to provide Welsh Ministers with the flexibility to impose a levy on all those in the red meat supply chain, if this were required. Do you agree with this approach? If so, why is this necessary?

[38] **Mr Williams:** The levy at present is split into two—a general levy and a promotional levy. You do ask yourself what you get for that money in terms of promotion. We get a good television advertisement that makes you really hungry when you see it, but, all too often, that is only shown on S4C and people outside of Wales do not see it, and members of the Association of British Abattoir Operators ask why is it that a lady in Plymouth can get her hands on New Zealand lamb but cannot get her hands on Welsh lamb. So, I would say that the promotional side of things are not getting to where it should be getting.

[39] **Christine Chapman:** What is your view of the intention to broaden the legislation to include those involved in secondary activities in the sector? What benefits could be gained from imposing a levy on this group?

[40] **Mr Williams:** What do you mean by 'secondary activities'?

[41] **Christine Chapman:** The activities within the retail sector.

[42] **Mr Williams:** Do you mean butchers?

[43] **Christine Chapman:** Yes.

[44] **Mr Williams:** Butchers are a dying breed, so, when you talk about the retail sector, you would be talking about supermarkets. Supermarkets do not want to pay for the product, so I would not think that they would want to help to pay the levy.

[45] **Christine Chapman:** What impact would collecting a levy from other parts of the supply chain have on the Welsh red meat sector?

[46] **Mr Williams:** You have just mentioned the retail sector, but you are also looking at the primary producer, the processor or butcher, and the consumer. That is your food chain. So, if the farmers had to pay extra, I am sure that the NFU and FUW would come back to you. We have just mentioned butchers, and I am sure that Morrisons, Sainsbury's and the like would not want to dip into their pockets more, and if consumers have to pay more, they would possibly turn to another product, which would be from overseas. If we have to pay more of a levy, let us see accountability and what we are getting for our money. I am sure that you would not pay for a 20lb turkey at Christmas time only to have an 8lb turkey when you collect it. I feel that that is what is happening at present. We seem to be collecting and paying this money but, all too often, we do not have a voice in terms of where it should be spent.

[47] **Christine Chapman:** Many witnesses have raised concerns about the impact that abattoir closures could have on the amount of levy collected in Wales. How would a change in the method of collecting the levy affect the sector you represent?

[48] **Mr Williams:** As I said earlier, the Meat and Livestock Commission wanted to collect it on a weekly basis, and that was the crux of the matter. I can go into the terms now. A small

abattoir that kills two cows, 50 lambs and maybe 10 pigs a month would be looking at a levy somewhere in the region of £300 a month. If you take an abattoir that slaughtered 5,500 to 6,000 lambs a day—so that would be 25,000 to 30,000 a week—that could amount to a lot of money if the levy was collected on a two-monthly or three-monthly basis. Yet that is what has happened all too often in our sector, and we have had several closures. I have figures here for one plant in north Wales that has gone through three terms of administration in the last four or five years; it has received an awful lot of grant aid from Cardiff, and yet I have figures here of £143,106.71 of levies outstanding—and that is just levy. The meat inspection amounts to £63,000, and the taxman wants £166,000. The top of the pile would be the taxman; I am sure that he would not get the £166,000. When you look at a figure like £143,000 from my side of the sector—the smaller side—it is disheartening, because we are not getting enough grant money to promote Welsh products. If that £143,000 from one closure were to be spread evenly across Wales, that would be of far more benefit to the Assembly Government.

[49] **David Lloyd:** Mae'r gyfres olaf o **David Lloyd:** The last series of questions gwestiynau o dan law Peter Black. come from Peter Black.

[50] **Peter Black:** Good afternoon, Mr Williams. The proposed Measure, as you know, makes it an offence to fail to submit returns within the required timescale, or to fail to provide accurate information for the levy calculation; you could be fined up to £5,000. Is that proportionate?

[51] **Mr Williams:** This issue is close to my heart. I have just given you some figures of the kind that we have to submit on a monthly basis. We send the October cheque with the November returns; they go in the same envelope, saving postage and ensuring that all the papers are together. Last year, I might possibly have been a couple of weeks late with one payment, and I had a threatening letter sent to me, saying that unless I paid up, a figure would be calculated or action taken would be taken against me. I think that that sum outstanding was somewhere in the region of £256; ladies and gentlemen, I would not flee the country for that kind of sum. It is rather distressing when you hear of companies owing the kind of sums I just mentioned—£143,000 a year—and yet they are chasing a little man for £256, threatening him with the axe. I would like to know how that £143,000 shows up in Hybu Cig Cymru's accounts; and that is just one example.

[52] **Peter Black:** So, do you think that it was a bit over the top?

[53] **Mr Williams:** I think that it is very over the top, in my experience. It had the £256 from me, albeit two weeks late. However, no-one can tell me whether it has had the £143,106.71. It is very over the top, and if my father were alive he would advise them not to kill the goose that lays the golden egg.

[54] **Peter Black:** Can it be enforced in practice? Do you see any problems with it enforcing these fines or getting information?

[55] **Mr Williams:** If it looked at track records, it would be able to see the position. Where there is a plant with a seriously bad history, then someone needs to go in there. I am sure that the NFU and the FUW would be very concerned about a plant that could not pay the levy, because how would it pay for the livestock being processed at the plant? We need to look at that with a careful eye, but the measures should not be over the top.

1.50 p.m.

[56] **Peter Black:** You will also know that the proposed Measure provides that if you want to enter land or premises and search them to get evidence, presumably of that offence, you can go to a justice of the peace to get a warrant. Do you support that?

[57] **Mr Williams:** No, not at all. We have problems in our industry at present with beef labelling. For example, we put a list up in our business every week of where the meat comes from, that says, for example, 'Two cows from Dafydd Evans, Dolgelynen, lambs from Nant y Gaseg' and so on. That is my protected geographical indication. I have to go into that because we do stipulate that we sell Welsh products, and we are subject to on-the-spot inspections. At one such inspection, a man arrived and said that he had come to inspect the beef labelling. I said, 'No-one has made an appointment', but he replied, 'I can come when I want to'. These small plants do not work on a weekly basis; they work maybe one day a week, or one day a fortnight. I was distressed to see that the beef labelling guy had come all the way from Derby without even checking whether the plant would be working or not. To my mind, money is being spent on someone coming from Derby, staying in a hotel, and on his transportation, when a phone call could have sufficed.

[58] In addition to that, if they want this side of the industry to continue—and you have to consider that the True Taste awards are taking place this evening—they must consider that many people diversify into selling their own products, and will get those products processed by the small abattoirs. So, they should trust the abattoirs a little more instead of coming down so heavy-handedly on them. There are not many of us left.

[59] **Helen Mary Jones:** O ran yr ateb yr ydych newydd ei roi, yr wyf yn cytuno nad yw gormod o reoleiddio yn beth da, ond pe bai rhaid gwneud cais am warant cyn dod i fewn i'ch adeilad, oni fyddai hynny'n rhoi rhyw fath o amddiffyniad ichi? Oni fyddai hynny'n well na phobl yn cael dod pan y mynnant?

Helen Mary Jones: With regard to the answer that you have just given, I agree that too much regulation is not a good thing, but if a warrant had to be applied for before entering your premises, would that not give you some form of protection? Would that not be better than people being able to come when they wanted to?

[60] **Mr Williams:** Yr ydych yn gywir mewn un ffordd, ond os yw ynad heddwch yn rhoi gwarant, bydd pobl yn dechrau meddwl ein bod yn torri'r gyfraith. Cytunaf â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud, ond bydd pobl hefyd yn meddwl, os yw ynad heddwch wedi rhoi gwarant, fod rhywbeth anghyfreithlon yn mynd ymlaen. Pe bai rhywbeth anghyfreithlon yn mynd ymlaen, byddai'r Gwasanaeth Hylendid Cig yn ymateb iddo'n syth.

Mr Williams: You are right in one way, but if a justice of the peace issues a warrant, people will start to think that we are breaking the law. I agree with what you are saying, but if a justice of the peace has issued a warrant, people will think that something illegal is going on. If something illegal was going on, the Meat Hygiene Service would come down on us straight away.

[61] **David Lloyd:** A ydych yn hapus gyda hynny, Helen?

David Lloyd: Are you happy with that, Helen?

[62] **Helen Mary Jones:** Ydw; mae hynny'n helpu.

Helen Mary Jones: Yes; that is helpful.

[63] **David Lloyd:** Dyna ddiwedd y cwestiynau ffurfiol. Diolch ichi, Mr Williams. Cyn inni ddiweddu'r eitem hon, a oes gennych sylwadau ychwanegol yr hoffech eu gwneud cyn inni ddod â'r drafodaeth i ben?

David Lloyd: That brings us to the end of the formal questions. Thank you, Mr Williams. Before we close this item, do you have any further remarks that you wish to make before we bring the discussion to a close?

[64] **Mr Williams:** It is important that we preserve what we have in Wales at present. As I

have just mentioned, the True Taste awards are being held this evening, at which there will be producers of lots of local Welsh—the key words are ‘local’ and ‘Welsh’—produce. Mr Tom Thomas may have two pigs and two lambs that he needs to have slaughtered because he has customers ready for Christmas, but there are two or three large abattoirs in Wales that will not be able to facilitate his request because they are already doing 30,000 lambs a week, and so his two lambs and two pigs will be lost there. As I have mentioned, those would be single-species abattoirs.

[65] If you want awards such as the True Taste awards to carry on and to promote what we do in rural Wales, the little guys dotted around our principality have to be looked after. I am not kidding you; it is getting to be like *The Last of the Mohicans*. If we are to be burdened with more cost and legislation, there is a possibility that the trade will be driven underground, and I do not think that anyone in my sector or in the Welsh Assembly Government would want to see unfit meat coming onto the market. It is a case of our saying, ‘Push us along and help us instead of coming down strongly on us all the time’. As I have mentioned, do not kill the goose that lays the golden egg. We not only run small businesses, we also facilitate those people who keep a goat in the garden in order to keep the grass low during the summer. In the winter, when no grass is growing, the goat is no good so they kill it and eat it. The buzz words at this time are ‘sustainability’ and ‘low-carbon footprint’. These small plants slaughter and process animals as close to the point of production as possible. How low a carbon footprint do you want us to have? It is about the next stage and the continuity of our industry. If our arm does not continue, that is one fewer arm of finance for Hybu Cig Cymru or the Assembly Government. It is a case of looking after what you have got, preserving it and possibly promoting it.

[66] At present, the children and dependants of those running small abattoirs, butchers’ shops and cutting plants look at their mothers and fathers and say, ‘Sod this for a game of conkers; I do not want to do what they do’. They will look at them and see that they do not go on holiday, they have paperwork stacking up way above their heads, and instead of having a pile of £10 notes as a reward, they have forms to fill in. Let us not be silly; let us get them to want to do what their mothers and fathers do. We do not want them to see carrying on the family business as a burden. When it is gone, we will all say what a pity it was that we did not act, but it will be too late then, and we will never get this sector back. The personnel who have worked in this sector will be flitting around the countryside, processing the odd lamb, the odd goat, and the odd pig, and no levies will be collected, there will be no inspections, and there is a possibility that meat that is unfit for consumption will get into the food chain.

[67] **David Lloyd:** Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich cyfraniad ac am ateb y cwestiynau mewn ffordd mor bwerus a chyda chryn deimlad. Caiff trawsgrifiad drafft o drafodaethau'r cyfarfod y prynhawn yma ei anfon atoch gan y clerc er mwyn ichi ei gywiro cyn i'r fersiwn derfynol gael ei chyhoeddi. Hoffwn gloi rhan gyntaf y cyfarfod drwy ddiolch ichi, Mr Williams, am eich cyfraniad. Yr ydych yn rhydd i fynd yn ôl i Fachynlleth—i'r dref bell—o Aberystwyth.

David Lloyd: Thank you very much for your contribution and for answering the questions in such a powerful way and with such feeling. A draft transcript of this afternoon's proceedings will be sent to you by the clerk for you to correct before the final version is published. I close the first part of the meeting by thanking you, Mr Williams, for your contribution. You are now free to return to Machynlleth—that faraway town—from Aberystwyth.

[68] **Mr Williams:** Diolch yn fawr ichi i gyd.

Mr Williams: Thank you all very much.

1.57 p.m.

**Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion**

[69] **David Lloyd:** Byddwn yn trafod yr eitem nesaf, sef manylion yr adroddiad, yn breifat. Cynigiaf fod **David Lloyd:** We will discuss the next item, the details of the report, in a private session. I move that

y pwyllgor, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 10.37(vi), yn penderfynu gwahardd y cyhoedd o weddill y cyfarfod ac o gyfarfodydd yn y dyfodol sydd i drafod materion sy'n allweddol i'w adroddiad. *the committee, in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.37(vi), resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting and from future meetings at which matters that are vital to its report are discussed.*

[70] Gwelaf fod pawb yn gytûn. I see that everyone is in agreement.

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 1.58 p.m.
The public part of the meeting ended at 1.58 p.m.*