



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Y Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol
The Committee on European and External Affairs**

**Dydd Mawrth, 8 Mehefin 2010
Tuesday, 8 June 2010**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions
- 5 Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol: Y Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am Weithgareddau Aelodau'r
Cynulliad: Cynulliad Seneddol Prydeinig Gwyddelig (BIPA)
International Relations: Update on Assembly Members' Activities: British-Irish
Parliamentary Assembly (BIPA)
- 13 Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol: Uwchgynhadledd Datblygu Rhyngwladol Cymru o Blaid
Africa International Relations: Wales for Africa International Development Summit
- 21 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion

Cofnodir y trafodion hyn yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y pwyllgor. Yn ogystal,
cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

These proceedings are reported in the language in which they were spoken in the committee.
In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

Aelodau'r pwyllgor yn bresennol
Committee members in attendance

Jeff Cuthbert	Llafur Labour
Michael German	Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru Welsh Liberal Democrats
Rhodri Morgan	Llafur (Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor) Labour (Committee Chair)
Nick Ramsay	Ceidwadwyr Cymreig (yn dirprwyo ar ran Nick Bourne) Welsh Conservatives (substitute for Nick Bourne)
Rhodri Glyn Thomas	Plaid Cymru The Party of Wales

Eraill yn bresennol
Others in attendance

Rosemary Butler	Aelod Cynulliad, Llafur (Y Dirprwy Lywydd) Assembly Member, Labour (The Deputy Presiding Officer)
Robert Lloyd-Williams	Rheolwr Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol, Comisiwn y Cynulliad International Relations Manager, the Assembly Commission
Chris Johnes	Pennaeth Oxfam Cymru Head of Oxfam Cymru
Travers Merrill	Rhwydwaith Sefydliadau Datblygu Bach a Chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru Small and Medium-sized Development Organisations in Wales Network
Jon Townley	Pennaeth Datblygu Rhyngwladol Cynaliadwy/Cymru o blaid Affrica, Llywodraeth Cymru Head of International Sustainable Development/Wales for Africa, Welsh Government

Swyddogion Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn bresennol
National Assembly for Wales officials in attendance

Lara Date	Clerc Clerk
Gwyn Griffiths	Uwch-gynghorydd Cyfreithiol Senior Legal Adviser
Gregg Jones	Pennaeth Swyddfa UE Cymru, Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau Head of Wales EU Office, Members' Research Service
Sarita Marshall	Dirprwy Glerc Deputy Clerk

Dechreuodd y cyfarfod am 9.19 a.m.
The meeting began at 9.19 a.m.

Cyflwyniad, Ymddiheuriadau a Dirprwyon
Introduction, Apologies and Substitutions

[1] **Rhodri Morgan:** Good morning. I welcome Members, officials and everyone in the public gallery to this meeting of the Committee on European and External Affairs. Headsets are available for the simultaneous translation of Welsh into English, on channel 1, and sound amplification, for those who are hard of hearing like me, is available on channel 0. Please ensure that all mobile phones and other electronic devices are switched off completely, as they can interfere with the sound equipment, even if they are in silent mode. In the event of an emergency, an alarm will sound, and the ushers will direct everyone to the nearest safe exit and assembly point.

9.20 a.m.

[2] I have only received one apology this morning, from Nick Bourne. Nick Ramsay is substituting for him. We must be grateful that we have another Nick as a substitute, which means that one less brain cell gets exhausted in trying to remember who people are.

[3] Does any Member wish to make a declaration of interest under Standing Order No. 31.6?

[4] **Michael German:** I wish to make a declaration with regard to the Wales for Africa programme, as I am the honorary president of Dolen Cymru, which receives money from the Wales for Africa programme. However, I receive no personal benefit, and I do not think that it is a matter that affects me personally; it is a matter of organisation.

[5] **Rhodri Morgan:** I understand that. I also wish to congratulate you on behalf of the committee—as I am sure that everyone will want to congratulate you—on having been named as a working peer in the dissolution honours list. As the Assembly has been in Whitsun recess, this is the first opportunity we have had to congratulate you since it was announced on Friday 28 May. Would you like to say a word or two, Mike, about the implications for you as an Assembly Member and a member of the committee?

[6] **Michael German:** Thank you, Chair. The first I knew about it being announced was a text message at 10 p.m. the night before. That was a bit of a shock and it meant that I was not able to prepare in the way that one might want, although I had obviously had some warning before that. I will take my seat in the House of Lords on 29 June, and I intend to resign from the Assembly to coincide with the incoming of the new Member, who was second on the list. I hope to do that seamlessly, with it taking effect towards the end of this month or the end of term. I will give my thanks to everybody at a later stage, but that is the effect that it will have on the process here.

[7] **Rhodri Morgan:** So, it means that there will be a vacancy on this committee that will have to be filled in the normal way through inter-party negotiation or however it works—I have never quite understood it.

[8] **Michael German:** I think that it simply means that there will be a resolution of the Assembly to fill all the positions that I currently occupy.

[9] **Rhodri Morgan:** The other point that I should make is that Gregg Jones, the head of the National Assembly for Wales European Union office, is in attendance this morning. Welcome, Gregg.

[10] I have a few items to deal with as Chair. Last week, I was in Doha, the capital and only city of the incredibly wealthy Arab gulf state of Qatar, for the tenth Doha forum on democracy, development and free trade. I was there not in my capacity as Chair of this committee, but as the former First Minister. I presented a paper in the trade and business section of the forum on why middle-eastern sovereign wealth funds should invest in Wales.

The umbilical cord between Wales and the incredibly wealthy state of Qatar is the liquefied natural gas importation terminal at Milford Haven, which has, in turn, given rise to the RWE 2,000 MW gas-fired power station that is now under construction. However, my message to them and the other gulf states was that they should be thinking about the middle and longer term when, as they all say, water will become the new oil, and that they should therefore be thinking about agri-food, tourism, higher education, technology and other links between Qatar and Wales and not merely the gas pipeline project, huge though that is.

[11] Wales was particularly well represented at the forum because Kim Howells was also there. He moderated a session. Richard Burge, the head of Wilton Park, the Foreign Office's study college, who is a Cardiff boy, was there as well. He also moderated a session. As a matter of interest, I am going to Wilton Park's Anglo-German forum in July, but I think that that will be in my capacity as the Chair of this committee. That will be on rebalancing the role of the state through the teenage years of the twenty-first century. What a wonderful seminar title that is.

[12] Unless anyone wants to ask any questions about either of those two issues, we will move on.

9.24 a.m.

**Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol: Y Wybodaeth Ddiweddaraf am Weithgareddau
Aelodau'r Cynulliad: Cynulliad Seneddol Prydeinig Gwyddelig (BIPA)
International Relations: Update on Assembly Members' Activities: British-Irish
Parliamentary Assembly (BIPA)**

[13] **Rhodri Morgan:** We have two honoured guests this morning. We are discussing international relations and we will receive an update on the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly and CALRE. It is important from time to time—perhaps once or twice a year—to remind people that we are not just a committee on European affairs; we are also the specialist body of the Assembly that deals with other international activities. We thought, when we met in January, that we should try to consider external affairs in one focused meeting. So rather than have a drib here and a drab there, we will do all of the dribs and drabs together. In which case, they will cease to be dribs and drabs and become a theme. So, that is what we are doing. This is an opportunity to get updates on Members' activities in various external bodies by way of an oral update on BIPA—not bypass—or the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly and written updates on CALRE and the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association.

[14] We have not had a formal update on the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly since July 2008, almost two years ago. Rosemary Butler is here, not as Deputy Presiding Officer this morning, but as chair of the steering committee of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly. Mike, as it happens, is also a member of that committee and Committee B of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly, and he can give us an update on the macro regions' work. As it happens, Rosemary is also the Assembly's main representative on CALRE, namely, the committee of legislative regions—I think. I can never remember what that acronym stands for. However, any questions on CALRE can also be dealt with this morning directly by Rosemary.

[15] The chair of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association Wales branch, Janet Ryder, is not with us this morning, but we are happy to have a written response on its work. I also welcome Nick Ramsay, the AM for Monmouth this morning, as Nick Bourne's substitute. We also have Robert Lloyd-Williams here, the Assembly's international relations manager, who I also welcome.

[16] First, I thank Rosemary for her paper and invite her to make some brief introductory remarks, after which I will turn to Mike and ask him to make brief introductory remarks on his supplementary paper on the macro regions. We can then move to questions.

[17] **The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler):** Thank you, Chair. I do not want to start by disagreeing with you, but I am here as the Deputy Presiding Officer and I am not chair of the steering committee. I am a member of the steering committee, but I am not its chair.

[18] **Rhodri Morgan:** Right; that is fine.

[19] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I would like to make one point on your Doha experience: it would be nice if Doha International Airport could link with Cardiff Airport, because I have never seen an airport like Doha airport; it is quite amazing.

[20] Thank you for inviting me. By way of some background, I thought I would give you a brief, recent history of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly, which was set up in 1990 during the height of the Troubles, as a link between the Houses of Parliament and the Houses of the Oireachtas. In 2001, membership was enlarged to include the Scottish Parliament, the National Assembly for Wales, the Northern Ireland Assembly, the High Court of Tynwald, the States of Guernsey and the States of Jersey.

[21] In 2008, the new name of British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly or BIPA was adopted to reflect a new era of relations between Britain and Ireland. At that time, the remaining places on BIPA were available to members of the Northern Ireland Assembly and they were filled, fortunately and interestingly, by the Democratic Unionist Party and the Ulster Unionist Party.

[22] The BIPA now stands ready to take the next step of fulfilling the role envisaged by the Belfast agreement and the St Andrews agreement by becoming the east-west parliamentary forum. That will facilitate its development as an integral part of the machinery of co-operation that has developed over the past 10 years between the UK, Ireland, the devolved nations and the Crown dependencies.

[23] Our members engage in a wide range of non-legislative parliamentary activities through the biannual plenary meetings and the ongoing committee work. Post summary reports of the plenary conferences are written by the clerk and they illustrate the recent activities of our participation at the plenary conference.

[24] BIPA now has a more effective website, highlighting the work of the association at www.britishirish.org. This is really fascinating work and it is a very interesting body to be on. Due to the new role of trying to ensure a better understanding between the north and south of Ireland, in the last meeting, for example, the Taoiseach was present along with the chief constable of Northern Ireland and the police commissioner of the Republic of Ireland to discuss cross-border activities, and that just shows you the standing of this body.

9.30 a.m.

[25] The work of the committee is highlighted on page 2 of the report, which has been circulated, but I would like to say at this point, Chair, that without the excellent work of the secretariat, led by Robert Lloyd-Williams, the Assembly would not enjoy its high level of representation in the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly, and I thank him for that. As I said, the report has been circulated and if Members would like to ask questions, I will try to respond.

[26] **Rhodri Morgan:** Robert, do you want to add anything to that?

[27] **Mr Lloyd-Williams:** Not at this stage.

[28] **Rhodri Morgan:** Mike, would you like to continue on that theme?

[29] **Michael German:** Yes. I am the rapporteur for the European committee, Committee B of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly, on its study of macro regions. The intention of the assembly as a whole is to try to influence the work of the British-Irish Council. It is a parliamentary body in all senses, because I was able to question the Taoiseach on a number of issues relating to macro regions at the last plenary session of the assembly, which meets twice a year. The crucial thing is that, in this European work, the assembly looks at issues that affect all parts of the United Kingdom and Ireland in ways that might help it to create and develop its European agenda.

[30] In the past, the European committee has looked at the use of European funding in cross-border circumstances; in other words, not just between Northern Ireland and Ireland, but also between the other parts of United Kingdom and Ireland. We looked at other examples of cross-border working, in particular Sweden and Denmark, and whether or not we were making the best use of our funding for cross-border work.

[31] Macro regions are almost the flavour of the month. We have heard in this committee, when we have taken evidence from Brussels, many examples of how people are looking at larger groupings of member states and regions of member states to try to influence the changes that they want to see in the particular economic space that they occupy in Europe. As you know, when we took evidence from the chair of the European Parliament's Committee on Regional Development, Danuta Hübner, the former commissioner, this matter was at the top of her agenda. It has also been pursued in a Committee of the Regions conference that was held in Brussels recently. We now know that about 20 European Union member states are currently engaged in developing a form of macro region. So, the question that we have been posing is whether there is room for a macro region to develop around the space occupied by the UK and Ireland. The answer to that question in our interim report was that there probably is, but that it depends on the purposes for which you are seeking to engage with each other.

[32] The second stage of the report, which is being developed at the moment, will look at what areas of work might be of interest. There is already a big area of work around the Dublin, Liverpool and Irish sea area on matters relating to the sea. What became clear from the Baltic sea strategy is that there are areas around the economy, tourism, development, trade and security that are also clearly of major interest. The exploration of those ideas is moving forward. So, it is important from the European perspective of the work of this committee that we look at the alternatives and opportunities that arise from using our membership of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly, particularly through its European committee, and take them forward.

[33] **Rhodri Morgan:** There will be questions from Jeff and Rhodri Glyn, and then I also have a question.

[34] **Jeff Cuthbert:** This follows on from the point that Mike made and is just to seek some guidance. During the second Assembly, I acted as a substitute when the body convened in Ballymena. It was the first time that the Democratic Unionist Party had attended. Peter Robinson spoke—I thought that it was quite a historic moment—and seemed to embrace the notions of devolution and joint working. However, to continue with the theme of European work, my understanding is that Northern Ireland qualifies for convergence funding, as do we, of course. Is the committee that deals with European affairs, or indeed economic affairs—Committee B or C—giving any consideration to joint working, using this parliamentary

association between Wales and Northern Ireland to share best practice on the spending of structural funds?

[35] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Committee C would deal with that, and Joyce Watson has been attending those meetings. I know that Dai Lloyd's committee has been to Wales to look at how we are doing things here, and there is a lot of scope for that kind of cross-working. It is taking a bit of time to develop, because it does not necessarily affect Jersey, Guernsey and the Isle of Man, but certainly some of the topics that they are raising are interesting. I am not sure if there has been a report on that; I seem to recall that there was one. Do you recall, Mike?

[36] **Michael German:** The report I referred to earlier, about the use of cross-border funding, has looked at that issue. It would certainly be useful to look at working with Northern Ireland. The big issue for the assembly is that we need a network across the UK and Ireland. In other words, BIPA needs to look at issues that affect most parts of its membership, rather than simple bilateral relationships. That is important, and that kind of discussion is one of the benefits of being a member.

[37] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I seem to recall that some work was done on that, so I will check. We have not had a formal report, but I think that some external committee work was done.

[38] **Rhodri Morgan:** We would be grateful if you could supply us with that information. Rhodri Glyn has the next question.

[39] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydych yn cyfeirio yn eich papur at yr angen i godi ymwybyddiaeth yn y Cynulliad am waith BIPA. Cawsom drafodaeth debyg gyda Janet Ryder, cadeirydd Cymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad, ynglŷn â'r angen i godi ymwybyddiaeth. Mae'n rhaid imi gyfaddef nad oeddwn yn ymwybodol o weithgareddau BIPA nes imi ddarllen y papur ar gyfer y cyfarfod y bore yma. Sut y gellir codi'r ymwybyddiaeth hynny? Yr ydym wedi clywed am y berthynas rhwng Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon a'r posibiliadau yna o ran arian strwythurol Ewropeaidd. Beth yw'r materion o bwys sy'n berthnasol i Gymru ac i waith y Cynulliad?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You refer in your paper to the need to raise awareness within the Assembly of the work of BIPA. We had a similar discussion with Janet Ryder, the chair of the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association, regarding the need to raise awareness. I have to admit that I was not aware of the activities of BIPA until I read this paper for this morning's meeting. How can awareness be raised? We have heard about the relationship between Wales and Northern Ireland, and the possibilities that exist there with regard to European structural funds. What are the important issues that are relevant to Wales and to the work of the Assembly?

[40] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There are a range of important issues. One is trafficking, which Joyce Watson is running with at the moment. On page 4 of the report, you will note that we will now be putting the committee reports on the Assembly's website, so you can read what you are interested in there. There is a range of interesting topics, one of which is cross-border work on penalty points placed on driving licences in the Republic of Ireland and Northern Ireland. Another is tourism, as Mike has said, and cross-border drugs issues. There is a whole raft of things. Another is social services, which was really interesting, as there is a difference between social services here and in Ireland. People who came here to live many years ago and were thinking of going back to Ireland suddenly found, as a result of this report, that their old age would not be quite as comfortable as it is here, because social services in Ireland are not of the same standard. There is a whole range of topics. If there is a particular topic that you are interested in, let me know, and I will make sure that you get information on that. Generally, everything will now be on the website, which was not

previously the case.

[41] **Rhodri Morgan:** Has the mood music changed rapidly in line with the recession, which has overtaken everyone in the past two years? Previously, we almost looked up to the Celtic tiger economy of Ireland, and tried to work out how areas like Wales and Scotland could emulate Ireland's extraordinary economic success during the Clinton boom era of the 1990s and the early 2000s. However, it is now almost being seen in reverse, with people looking at Ireland for entirely different purposes, in order to emulate Ireland's willingness to dive into the area of severe public expenditure cutbacks.

9.40 a.m.

[42] It bailed out its banks in the same way that we did, but it started to cut public expenditure earlier than we did. So, is it the case that all the discussions and the mood music at BIPA, rather than being about growth, are now about how different parts of this space—what used to be called the British Isles in our geography textbooks years ago—will engage in cutting the public sector budget deficit?

[43] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Until now, the mood music, as you have called it, has been the change caused by fact that members of the Ulster Unionist Party are now coming to the conference and that there is a much more open approach. I suspect that these kinds of issues will be discussed at the next meeting, because they were not discussed formally at the last conference. I will check whether any committees will deal with it, but I assume that there will be some kind of paper and that a Minister will come for people to question. It is certainly a point that needs to be addressed.

[44] **Rhodri Morgan:** I will bring in Nick in a minute, but I just wanted to direct this question to Robert. Have officials begun to hear about different priorities for agendas for the next 12 months in relation to looking at the social impact of public sector deficit reduction programmes, and how you carry out that reduction while avoiding social dislocation, riots on the streets or the kinds of things that we have seen in Greece, and so on?

[45] **Mr Lloyd-Williams:** Nothing comes to mind at the moment, but we are still in a period of transition, with new members coming in because of the recent election. We are still trying to find out from the clerks in Parliament what BIPA's key objectives will be for the next few months. So, we are waiting to hear what the effects of the recent governmental changes will be.

[46] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We can feed that in now and say that we would like that to be discussed at the next conference.

[47] **Rhodri Morgan:** I was just wondering about Wales's involvement at your level, Rosemary, and that of Mike, Dai Lloyd and so on, and what the participation by Assembly Members would be once the new membership has settled in. The original idea was that it was about Good Friday, bringing peace to Northern Ireland and reducing inter-community tension. It then seemed to me to move on to the issue of how on earth the Irish republic managed to have such spectacular economic growth and to reverse the centuries-old diaspora from Ireland, resulting in people moving into Ireland. All of a sudden, that came to a grinding halt with the collapse of the Anglo Irish Bank, and even the two stronger banks had to be bailed out, which was followed by the consequences of having to go through the public sector deficit reduction programme, before Greece and before the UK.

[48] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Ireland's financial problems are a little ahead of the process of BIPA. You asked what our role is as Assembly Members; we are now full members. It has changed from a situation of our almost being onlookers in respect of

Northern Ireland and the Republic, and we are now involved as full members. That is shown by the fact that Mike chairs one of the committees and I am a permanent member of the British-Irish Parliamentary Assembly Steering Committee. So, we can introduce topics, and I will make sure that the clerk in London gets a copy of the paper.

[49] **Mr Lloyd-Williams:** On page 3 of the report of Committee D, we highlighted the issue of the integration of newly arrived migrants to Northern Ireland, Ireland and Wales. With Dai Lloyd, we held one of the Committee D meetings at the Assembly. That was important in order to discuss the topic and to learn about the gang leaders involved.

[50] **Rhodri Morgan:** I have one last question before I bring Nick Ramsay in—it is a question to Mike, really. Presumably, there are members of the House of Lords of the British Parliament on this committee, so, in theory, you could put your hand up and ask to continue your membership, even though you would not be a representative of the Assembly.

[51] **Michael German:** The whole matter of how the UK Parliament is represented on all these bodies is in a state of flux at the moment. I hope that I can find my way onto it at another time.

[52] I have been on this body for a number of years. It started with the agenda being dominated by the problems of Northern Ireland. There has been a sense that the members now want to shift to ways of solving the common problems that we share. The big challenge that it has is to hold the British-Irish Council to account. There are interesting signs that there may be more regular meetings with the UK Prime Minister, and the fact that the Taoiseach is chairing the British-Irish Council may mean that we will have a place at the table to influence this in a public, parliamentary way, more than we have done before.

[53] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We might not have a place at that table, but it will certainly be a much more important body. We are trying to get our meetings more in sync with the British-Irish Council meetings, because they have been quite ad hoc of late. It will be very interesting to see what the new membership will be, because that is the issue, as many members of the British-Irish Parliamentary Association have retired or lost their seats in the parliamentary elections.

[54] **Rhodri Morgan:** Yes, I can see that.

[55] **Nick Ramsay:** As the Chair said when I came in earlier, I am here as a substitute today, so I come at this with either a naïve or a fresh pair of eyes—or both.

[56] **Rhodri Morgan:** Naively fresh. [*Laughter.*]

[57] **Nick Ramsay:** I have a couple of general questions that go back to the subject of Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question at the start, which I did not hear you answer fully. You touched on the question of how you connect this to the outside world. Looking through the papers, we can see that it is all fascinating stuff and there is a lot of potential here for developing the general economic areas that I have read about. Forgive me if you have covered this partially, but I would like you to answer it more fully. How do you connect this to what is happening outside in the areas that will be affected by these decisions?

[58] Secondly, in the report of Committee B on European affairs, which is the one that Mike German had an input into, one of the conclusions on page 5 is that there is a great deal of political support for the creation of regional economic spaces, both within the European Commission and the EU member states, but there is a question over the future of this strategy and over the way in which it might develop in the future. How does that play out? Mike German said earlier that there is a state of flux at the moment, with all these issues being

discussed and the format for discussion. We might be sitting here discussing these regional economic areas, but how confident are we that, in five or 10 years' time, the world will be reflected adequately? I suppose that what I am asking is whether there is capacity to adjust to the changing world in which we live, both economically and socially. Will the structures that are in place be able to deal with that, whatever the subject matter and whatever the economic conditions?

[59] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** As Robert said, we are in transition at the moment. We have moved from looking specifically at north-south issues to looking at east-west issues, and we have developed quite a lot in the last year, since we changed the role. I will let Mike answer the question about regional development. What we must remember is that the secretariat of this organisation is not well resourced, and so we cannot give it too much work or it will not do anything properly. We need to make sure that what we are doing is relevant; otherwise, there is no point in doing it. However, as to whether we will be relevant to sub-regional economic areas in 10 years' time, I do not know. If I knew that I would not be sitting here; I would be somewhere else making a fortune.

[60] **Rhodri Morgan:** You could be running a hedge fund in Mayfair. You could be making millions—or losing millions. [*Laughter.*]

[61] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We have to be careful that we do not run too quickly. The big issue now is the representation that we will get from the House of Commons and the House of Lords, because some of the more prominent members no longer have seats. We need to ensure that we choose people who are well versed in Irish issues in particular, to make sure that we have a spearhead going forward. You have Guernsey, Jersey, and the Isle of Man, and we have done some interesting stuff there, particularly on health issues in the Isle of Man. However, we have to be careful that we do not try to do too much too quickly.

[62] **Rhodri Morgan:** I do not know whether any of you read the report in *The Sunday Times*, which included a moan about there being £24 million-worth of uncollected debts by UK hospitals, mostly in the London area, from overseas citizens who had been admitted under emergency procedures and were supposed to show their passport and address, most of which—at least in the case of the bad debts—were not completely accurate. When the patient leaves, the hospital is supposed to follow up and get the payment. The article went on to say that the Isle of Man was a problem area in that regard, and then it mentioned Wales as a problem area as well. I do not know where Wales comes into this, but it was interesting to see that the Isle of Man has now had this finger pointed at it for being in a net debtor position to Britain for health treatment.

9.50 a.m.

[63] **The Deputy Presiding Officer:** One of the major issues was British people going to the Isle of Man for TT races and having to pay for hospital care while they were there if they were injured. The motivating factor behind this was ensuring that we kept the reciprocal arrangement in place.

[64] **Michael German:** Do you want me to answer the second half of that question about the future of the macroeconomic spatial region strategy?

[65] **Rhodri Morgan:** Before you answer that, I will just put the same question in a slightly different way. The economic region that we are talking about, namely the Atlantic coast of western Europe, has seen this big shift, with the centre of gravity of the EU moving about 150 miles eastwards since the old Warsaw pact countries came in. If you are defining the centre of gravity now, and so where you want to put your big logistic depots or your car assembly plants and so on, you will find that there has been a move, and it is not one that will

favour Ireland or Wales. It is away from the Atlantic and towards the Elbe or the Oder, or those rivers somewhere between Germany and Poland and so on. The Atlantic region is now more peripheral than it used to be; it always was peripheral, but it is now much more so. You could ask what the comeback is for the Atlantic parts of Europe now that the centre of gravity has moved eastwards.

[66] **Michael German:** That has been at the heart of the committee's thinking. If you are becoming more peripheral, your needs and your engagement with the centre and with the rest of Europe become greater. The committee noted with interest the level of enthusiasm that there is for this project in the Baltic states, which were all formerly peripheral but are now increasingly peripheral. Finland, Sweden and Norway are a part of this process, as is the bit of Russia that is detached. So, the future of the strategy is very much in flux. Whether this becomes mainstream European thinking is an open question. Every time this committee of the National Assembly and the committee of the BIPA has asked that question of European officials, they say that it is far too soon to tell, but there seems to be a lot of political engagement with it from across the European Union. Will it become a part of the funding streams? At the moment, these member states and their regions are co-funding the activity that they want to engage in from their own resources. It includes lots of European money, but they are putting it all into the pot to share together. Whether that becomes a mainstream political source of funding for the next round of European funding is an open question. The only question that I raise—and I raise it as an open question here—is that, given the number of commitments from senior figures at prime ministerial and presidential level across Europe now supporting and working with these ideas, does it have more potential to become mainstream? Probably yes, rather than no—more than it was a year ago. We hear that Sarkozy is now central to a new dimension with Spain, for example—

[67] **Rhodri Morgan:** Sorry?

[68] **Michael German:** President Sarkozy has seen what has been going on and is now trying to work a new economic space with Spain and Italy, which will cover the southern part of the Mediterranean, although a Mediterranean region already exists. Where these emerge and whether it becomes a funding programme in the future is still an open question, but that is why the committee has its ear to the ground and is trying to keep the process going, so that it can aid and assist in answering that question in the coming years.

[69] **Rhodri Morgan:** So, there is quite a bit of transition going on as regards membership and a possible change of priority on subject matter, given the economic crisis, the recovery from the banking crisis, the public sector deficit programme and so on. These are big issues. There is also the issue of the greater peripherality of the Atlantic regions of Europe. Do Members have any other questions to the Deputy Presiding Officer or Robert Lloyd-Williams, or to Mike as a member of BIPA? I see that you do not. Thank you for your evidence and introductory paper, and I also want to say, in the usual way, that you will be provided with a draft transcript of the meeting so that you can check it for factual accuracy. Thank you for your presence this morning.

[70] **Jeff Cuthbert:** Chair, I wonder whether I could just raise a point. In paper 3 on the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association, which we are not discussing, there is a typographical error on page 2. It is a minor matter, but I raise it for the sake of accuracy. It is a CPA executive committee meeting—

[71] **Rhodri Morgan:** I see that our next witnesses have arrived. Sit down, please. We are just having a little discussion about typographical errors. Do not let that worry you.

[72] **Jeff Cuthbert:** It is in the section on Swaziland:

[73] ‘The employment of the CPA Secretary General and other secretarial staff’.

[74] That should read ‘secretariat staff’ rather than ‘secretarial staff’. It is the senior officers.

[75] **Rhodri Morgan:** That is very important. Okay.

9.57a.m.

**Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol: Uwchgynhadledd Datblygu Rhyngwladol Cymru o
Blaid Affrica**

International Relations: Wales for Africa International Development Summit

[76] **Rhodri Morgan:** We have three witnesses in front of us. The first is Jon Townley, who is the head of a huge bureaucratic set-up involving at least two staff. [*Laughter.*] He is head of international sustainable development and Wales for Africa, so welcome to you, Jon. We also have Travers Merrill, from SMIDOS, small and medium-sized international development organisations in Wales, and Chris Johnes, who is a former civil servant and is now head of Oxfam Cymru.

[77] Would any or all of you like to make any introductory remarks in relation to your paper, or do you want to dive straight into the questions? It is entirely up to you.

[78] **Mr Townley:** I would like to introduce the Wales for Africa programme briefly. We are nearly four years old now, and the overarching purpose of the programme is to encourage more people in Wales to do more work of better quality for international development. To that end, we core-fund a number of programmes, we have an annual grant scheme, and we support and encourage groups around Wales to get involved and to consider what they can do in support of the United Nations millennium development goals.

[79] **Rhodri Morgan:** Apropos of that, I want to refer to the event that I attended about two weeks ago in Abergavenny to celebrate the tenth anniversary of the Southern Ethiopia Gwent Health Link. I think that it is slightly wider now, but it was originally the north Gwent to southern Ethiopia healthcare link. It was started by Dr Biku Ghosh and colleagues at Nevill Hall Hospital. It has now expanded to the community and primary healthcare systems in Gwent. It has a much wider remit in assisting the development of professional healthcare standards in Ethiopia. It is trying to solve the trick of how to involve yourself in health links in an African country in a way that discourages an exodus of trained healthcare professionals from those countries and encourages them to stay in the area, and not to move to this country, the USA or the middle east, where they could make 20 times as much money. It tries to do it in such a way as to retain professionally qualified healthcare staff in the shortage areas that they come from. It has been remarkably successful, and, like PONT, the Pontypridd overseas network trust, and one or two others, it is a fairly typical example of applying a few drops of water—that is, public funding—and encouraging the civil society efforts that are already ongoing. Is that a fair description?

[80] **Mr Townley:** It is very fair.

[81] **Rhodri Morgan:** Good. Would either Travers or Chris like to comment, or make some introductory remarks before I move into the questions?

[82] **Mr Merrill:** I am happy to go straight into the questions.

[83] **Mr Johnes:** I would like to make a couple of remarks, if I may. My paper speaks for

itself, but I will make a couple of points on Wales for Africa in a wider UK context. The level of civil society activity taking place in Wales is remarkably high by the standards of all other parts of the UK and, as far as we can work out, most of Europe.

10.00 a.m.

[84] The programme has succeeded in giving, as you described, Chairman, more structure, and a small amount of public funding, which has allowed people to take it forward and become more focused.

[85] Our perspective is that the programme has achieved a great deal in its first four or five years, and now it is, in a sense, ready to become slightly more professional and focused, to provide a greater emphasis on the quality of support. We have great breadth, and there is a lot of really good stuff in there, but we can do more now to make that high-quality end of the programme more the norm and, we would argue, provide funding more towards the higher performing end of the programme than has been the case to date. It has been an excellent introduction to the programme, and it has achieved a great deal.

[86] I have to admit to one small error in my paper that has a material impact on the argument that we have made, which is that the Scottish programme is not worth £3 million a year; it is now worth £9 million a year, so it is on a completely different scale from what happened previously.

[87] **Rhodri Morgan:** Before I bring in Jeff and Rhodri Glyn, how would the three of you compare the level of activity here with that going on in Scotland? You seem to be saying at one and the same time that Scotland is operating on an entirely different scale and that Wales has more civil society involvement per head of population than anywhere else in the UK and, possibly, Europe. I cannot relate those two things to each other somehow. Can anybody explain it?

[88] **Mr Merrill:** We had the administrator from NIDOS in Scotland down to the summit, and she was amazed at the level of involvement and participation in Wales. Notwithstanding the Welsh Assembly Government's small funding component to Wales for Africa, an enormous amount is going on. It has its own programme, which has just been confirmed, and it is getting more money now, so it will presumably gear itself up.

[89] The other point to make is that we do not have the equivalent of NIDOS in Wales. Despite the fact that SMIDOS sounds like NIDOS, we are not a representative body. There are a number of different networks, and we operate very well together, but we do not operate as one organisation as happens in Scotland.

[90] **Rhodri Morgan:** Can you explain this conundrum, Jon?

[91] **Mr Townley:** The situation in Scotland is quite different. Under the Scotland Act 1998, for instance, the legal position is that international development is an entirely reserved matter except where the Scottish Executive assists the Secretary of State for International Development in exercising his duties. So it has a letter from the Secretary of State for International Development saying, 'Congratulations'.

[92] **Rhodri Morgan:** So, it is reserved; there is no difference in legal powers. Do you want to explain this letter a bit more?

[93] **Mr Townley:** In his letter, the Secretary of State welcomes the Scottish Government's programme for international development, noting that he considers it to be a contribution to the exercising of his functions. Scotland can therefore fund international

development activity in the developing world. It can give a grant to Malawi—

[94] **Rhodri Morgan:** But that does not override an Act of Parliament. If a matter is reserved, a letter from a Secretary of State—

[95] **Mr Townley:** It is reserved except where it is assisting the Secretary of State.

[96] **Rhodri Morgan:** So the expression used in the Scotland Act 1998 is that international development is a reserved matter, except where the Secretary of State for International Development considers it to be complementary to his activities. In other words, if the Secretary of State for International Development gives you a letter of comfort, you are in the clear and nobody can challenge the legality of the expenditure by Scotland.

[97] **Mr Townley:** That is my understanding. However, I am not a lawyer.

[98] **Michael German:** I am looking at Gwyn and wondering whether we could have a little note on that. It would be most helpful, especially in relation to Schedule 7 to the Government of Wales Act 2006. It might be something that we could pre-empt.

[99] **Rhodri Morgan:** Fine, but there is no such exemption, subject to a letter of comfort from the Secretary of State for International Development, in the Government of Wales Acts of 1998 and 2006.

[100] **Mr Townley:** No, there is not. We are exercising the powers that we have, which are largely for the benefit of the people of Wales.

[101] **Rhodri Morgan:** So, it has to be the two-way thing. That is, you can benefit the recipient country, provided that benefit in the form of career development and the broadening of minds for professionals from Wales comes back. We are then covered because of the good that it is doing to their career development.

[102] **Mr Townley:** Exactly. A number of different Acts of Parliament have such elements. For instance—again, I am not a lawyer, but this is my understanding—in health, we can do anything for the benefit of the people of Wales, regardless of which country we do it in. Therefore, if we are sending doctors to Ethiopia we have some great examples of where Welsh doctors and NHS staff have learned things from doing work overseas or have just learned about managing in a very resource-poor environment and have brought those skills back to use in the Welsh NHS.

[103] **Rhodri Morgan:** The thinking out of the box skills.

[104] **Mr Townley:** Yes. Similarly, there are powers in education and other areas. We have a basket of powers that we can call upon.

[105] **Rhodri Morgan:** I am sure that that is true. I now call on Jeff Cuthbert, followed by Rhodri Glyn.

[106] **Jeff Cuthbert:** It was a very interesting report. About a month ago, I was in Swaziland with the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association executive meeting, and then I went for a few days to Lesotho. Again, there were very interesting visits to Mount Royal High School in Leribe and to the new parliament building, and I met various officials. It was extremely interesting.

[107] In terms of your work, do you link in, for example, with the Commonwealth Parliamentary Association in terms of joint activities where that is possible, because it is very

concerned with providing educational and awareness-raising programmes on issues such as AIDS and diabetes? Is there a sharing of knowledge in that regard?

[108] In terms of my visit to Lesotho with Dolen Cymru, how do you identify the needs and requirements of countries such as Lesotho? Does it tend to be a bit ad hoc, and based on what people here might think is a good idea, or is it more co-ordinated in terms of involving local people about the best place?

[109] Finally, I note that you mention in page 6, paragraph 31, under ‘Small grants’, engineers for overseas development, which I think is a very good thing. One of the issues that I regularly discuss in the CPA is aid in the form of knowledge transfer, as opposed to cash, because cash sometimes cannot be as focused because it often does not end up where you hope that it would. However, when you are transferring knowledge, it is far easier to make sure that it is directed to the right place and that you get the best results. I can see that this is a relatively small scheme and you are dealing with young professional engineers. I met half a dozen or so young teachers and doctors working over there, who, quite rightly, saw it as part of their own career development, as well as helping in Lesotho. Is there any move—and Travers, in particular, you might be able to help here—in terms of trying to encourage larger private construction firms or engineering firms, for example, to allocate or second experienced engineers to provide support for a year or so in a focused way?

[110] **Mr Townley:** I have met the CPA a number of times over the years. It has its own priorities and agenda, and it does its own thing, and the Government has its programme. However, where there are opportunities to be complementary, we have taken them. You have taken an interest in Lesotho, in particular, as does Mr German. In terms of how we decide, with the exception of the climate change partnership with Uganda, we have been dealing with grant applications; therefore, Dolen Cymru will come to us with a proposal to do a particular project, or another organisation will come to say that it wants to do something with a particular community in a particular place, and then we will judge that on its merits. There are mechanisms. In the case of Lesotho, where the relationship is quite mature and multifaceted, there are very good links with the Government and, therefore, particularly in the field of health, health professionals are linking in with what the Lesotho Government wants. It is complex, and the field is very full. It is not a straightforward matter by any means.

10.10 a.m.

[111] There are a number of different engineering groups; the nature of the beast is that it is multi-headed. There is EFOD—Engineers for Overseas Development—Engineers Without Borders and RedR, which is a register of engineers and health professionals who are willing to volunteer. We are currently bringing them all together to see how they can work together. EFOD is a great example; for instance it built a health centre in Soroti, Uganda. The engineers designed the health centre, but when they got there they found that only one type of bolt was available to fix the roof on and therefore they had to change the design. So, they faced many more challenges than they would have had they been building something in Wales. So, they learned a lot and built an innovative health centre that is now up and running.

[112] **Jeff Cuthbert:** So, they changed the roof rather than the bolt. [*Laughter.*]

[113] **Mr Merrill:** On the construction side, many groups are building clinics, houses and so on with people in-country. The connections here tend to be with professionals, housing associations or with registered social landlords; that connection is developing. There is very little linking at present with construction firms, possibly because they have been somewhat under the hammer and have had other things to take account of. However, certainly in Wales, I have not come across any immediate links with the construction industry as such.

[114] **Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Adleisiaf yn y lle cyntaf y pwynt a godwyd gan y Cadeirydd ynglŷn â'r benbleth foesol sy'n ymwneud â'r ffaith nad ydym eisiau gweld perthynas fel hyn yn cymell pobl â chymwysterau proffesiynol i ddod i'r Deyrnas Unedig, neu i Gymru yn benodol, yn hytrach nag aros yn eu gwledydd eu hunain a sicrhau bod y gwledydd hynny yn manteisio ar eu sgiliau. Byddwn yn mynd gam ymhellach a dweud fod arnom ni ddyled foesol i'r gwledydd hyn, oherwydd byddai'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn y Deyrnas Unedig mewn trafferthion enfawr pe na bawn wedi manteisio ar gael pobl yma i wasanaethu'r boblogaeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I would first like to echo the point raised by the Chair about the moral dilemma relating to the fact that we do not want a relationship such as this to encourage people with professional qualifications to come to the United Kingdom, or to Wales in particular, instead of staying in their own countries and ensuring that those countries benefit from their skills. I would go a step further and say that we owe a moral debt to these countries, because the national health service in the United Kingdom would be in great difficulty had we not taken advantage of getting people here to serve the population.

[115] Deallaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am yr angen i sicrhau bod unrhyw un sy'n cymryd rhan mewn rhaglen fel hon yn manteisio o ran datblygiad proffesiynol. Sut byddwch yn monitro'r hyn y mae'r rhaglen hon yn ei gynnig i wledydd Affrica? A ydych yn wynebu penbleth arall, hynny yw: a fyddai'n well canolbwyntio ar un wlad yn unig? Byddai Lesotho yn enghraifft amlwg i Gymru oherwydd y cysylltiadau traddodiadol rhwng Cymru a Lesotho, a deallaf fod prif gysylltiad yr Alban gyda Malawi. A oes perygl eich bod yn ceisio taenu adnoddau gweddol gyfyngedig dros nifer o wledydd ac felly bod y gwaddol sydd yno ar ddiwedd y rhaglen yn brin iawn?

I understand what you say about the need to ensure that those participating in this programme benefit in terms of their professional development. How will you monitor what this programme offers to African countries, however? Do you face another dilemma, that is: would it be better to focus on one country? Lesotho is an obvious example for Wales given the traditional connections between Wales and Lesotho, and I understand that Scotland has its main connection with Malawi. Is there a danger that you are trying to spread relatively limited resources over a number of countries and therefore that the legacy that is left at the end of the programme is quite restricted?

[116] **Rhodri Morgan:** Jon, do you want to start on that question? Chris may also want to comment because, in a way, Oxfam's slightly critical comments about what more could be done relate to this question of targeting resources and monitoring the effectiveness of what you do and so on. So, we will start with Jon and then move onto Chris.

[117] **Mr Townley:** When the programme was first consulted upon, we asked whether we should focus on one country or spread the programme across Africa. It is fair to say that there was a polarisation of views—just about everyone who supports Dolen Cymru wrote in to say that it ought to focus on Lesotho. Many other people who had links elsewhere said that it was better not to focus on one country. Scotland initially focused on Malawi exclusively but has now expanded beyond that.

[118] There is a balance to be struck. You can add value to existing programmes and you can, by bringing in other professionals or other sorts of links, add to what is going on and reduce costs. You can then, if many things are focused in a particular place, do some robust monitoring of what you have done. On the other hand, we are where we are, and we now have 116 community-to-community links across Wales. Some of the longest-established links are with Lesotho, but others are with other countries. They are very good and they are long standing, and the Government has hitherto wanted to support and encourage them.

[119] Therefore, Wales has links with all sorts of places, and to say that we would only

work in one place might leave them high and dry. There is a balance to be struck. However, over time, we are seeing a clustering of efforts, as well as new initiatives. When people come forward and say that they would like to do something, but do not know where they would like to do it, we encourage them to do it in one of several places where we have other things going on.

[120] **Rhodri Morgan:** Thank you, Jon. Do you want to come in on this point, Chris?

[121] **Mr Johnes:** There are two points in response to your question, Rhodri. First, there is work that needs to be done to tighten the monitoring procedures. One reason why the monitoring still has scope for improvement is because of the scope of what the programme is there to do, which Jon and Rhodri have alluded to, in terms of benefits to Wales. The monitoring inevitably starts from that perspective and I believe that the programme could benefit from a tighter monitoring focus on the benefit to the partner programmes. There is work already in place on the health links and we are not too far behind in looking at the community links. That is an important next step to making the programme more effective.

[122] The second point is the focus on one country or more. This comes to the heart of the difference between the Scottish and the Welsh programmes, and goes back to the apparent contradiction of a larger budget for Scotland with lesser activity. Scotland succeeds in spending a larger budget because it doles out relatively large chunks of money to a small number of organisations. For example, Oxfam in Malawi gets a fair-sized chunk of the Scottish budget. CAFOD, which is our Catholic counterpart, has a Scottish-only branch, which delivers programme work in a way that the Welsh branch does not, and it also gets a fair chunk of that money. Therefore, in a sense, much larger grants are given out to a smaller number of organisations in Scotland.

[123] In Wales, because of the way in which the money is allowed to be spent at the moment, if we focused on a small number of countries, we would not get anywhere near the value for money that we are getting at the moment. There are some mild criticisms in our paper of the way the programme could be going. However, in terms of the current powers, and the current budget, the way that the money is spent at the moment is appropriate, because it makes the most of building on the wide links that exist across Africa in civil society.

[124] **Rhodri Morgan:** I am glad to hear that, because I was not clear whether it was meant to be critical, mildly critical, or broadly supportive.

[125] **Mr Johnes:** It was more about thinking where it might go in the future.

[126] **Rhodri Morgan:** Okay. Are there any other questions? I see that Nick and Mike have questions.

[127] **Nick Ramsay:** You have just touched on the issue that I wanted to ask about. I was interested to read in your paper that there is no appetite in the sector for an umbrella body, and that you feel that that would divert resources that could be better spent elsewhere. That is not always the view, is it? You often have these umbrella bodies springing up. However, that is more of a comment than a question.

[128] You mention southern partner involvement in paragraph 4 of your paper. Could you clarify how the southern partner involvement will help to develop good practice?

[129] **Mr Johnes:** Is that in my paper?

[130] **Nick Ramsay:** I am pretty sure that it is, but I may be wrong.

[131] **Mr Johnes:** I believe that it is in your paper, Travers.

[132] **Nick Ramsay:** I am sorry—it is someone else's paper.

[133] **Mr Merrill:** What we are dealing with here is the monitoring and evaluating stretching to what we are doing with southern partners. As Chris has said, that needs to be built in, possibly, to the grants mechanism, so that you enhance the quality and the level of that. One way of doing that is to involve the diaspora groups who live here, and who are all around us, in that process; that can be very helpful. There is a small group called the sub-Saharan advisory panel, which is made up of diaspora groups, which helps international development organisations to be sensitive to issues in southern countries. A number of things can be done on this to strengthen the delivery with southern partners.

[134] **Rhodri Morgan:** Mike has the next questions.

[135] **Michael German:** I have a comment on an earlier question from Jeff. Dolen is now working tentatively with Arup.

[136] **Rhodri Morgan:** That is the obvious company; it has a huge overseas development programme. I did not like to mention the names of individual companies.

[137] **Michael German:** I am sorry. It is in the early stages, but we have received some support from it.

[138] My question is about other Government bodies. Jon has already touched on the role of the Department for International Development, but there are other sources of funding, perhaps the British Council and other international partners with the UK Government.

10.20 a.m.

[139] Can you explain a bit about how those are linked together and whether there has been any difficulty in marrying what you wish to see done here in Wales with what they may have as their ambitions? That is really a follow-up to the question you were asked about framework powers.

[140] **Mr Townley:** Thank you for that. I sit on a cross-Whitehall departmental body called the Africa Capacity Building Initiative, which is organised by the Department for International Development, to which representatives of every Whitehall department and the devolved administrations come to explain what they are doing and to try to marry things together, or at least to become aware of what everyone else is doing and take advantage. We have an easier job in Wales in that it is a smaller place, which makes it possible to have a better handle on what other people are doing and trying to do. However, it is probably one of those things that is a work in progress. There has obviously just been a change of UK Government, so priorities are changing, and it is a job to keep on top of that and ensure that we are all joined up, as far as is possible.

[141] **Michael German:** Am I right to say that that is a difficult task and that it is not easy to manage that relationship?

[142] **Mr Townley:** The main body that I would relate to, other than the Scottish Government, would be the Department for International Development. It is a very big department, which faces outwards rather than inwards into the UK. So, there have been challenges in identifying the right people to engage with in order to ensure that we are genuinely complementary to what they are doing. In recent years, and particularly over the past year, the Department for International Development has seen what we have been able to

do in building a consensus on international development, and it wanted to do something similar. So, it launched a number of schemes to support community links and health links, which I believe that the new Government has suspended, pending a review. However, the Department for International Development is very much focused on devolving the responsibility for this work. So, DFID Uganda would be the body responsible for spending the money in Uganda. It is that much harder with Lesotho, obviously, as it is not there.

[143] **Rhodri Morgan:** I have a final question, which is on the issue of evaluating, monitoring and trying to look to the next five years to see whether we can do better, whether we are on the right lines and so on. When you think about evaluating initiatives such as the one to deliver magnesium sulphate anti-pre-eclampsia drugs, which are unbelievably cheap and very simple to administer, which the now retired Cardiff midwife Angela Gorman pioneered in Chad and Sierra Leone, and the one to deliver postpartum haemorrhage drugs which, again, are incredibly cheap, I suppose that you can evaluate the numbers of maternal deaths prevented by the use of magnesium sulphate if the condition is pre-eclampsia or by the use of whatever the drug is called for preventing postpartum haemorrhages. These are major causes of maternal deaths. The drugs are half a crown a throw—very cheap—and, almost invariably, they save lives. So, at one level, you can see that that has a very good impact for very small sums of money. On the other hand, the benefit for the career development of Welsh midwives is not so great, so the impact in Africa is greater than its impact back in Wales. So, what are you evaluating with such a programme? How do you evaluate that in its complementarity to what the Department for International Development might be doing? Do you say that it is brilliant because DFID did not think of it and somebody in Wales did and so it fills a gap? On the other hand, is it not really what DFID is trying to do, because maternal deaths are not right at the top of its list or whatever? I do not know. Give us some idea of how that would fit in over the next five years?

[144] **Mr Townley:** You have opened a particular can of worms there in that it demonstrates the challenge that we face. You alluded to Angela Gorman, the neonatal nurse from Cardiff who has travelled to several sub-Saharan countries, and to Chad in particular, where she was able to get a cheap supply of magnesium sulphate, train the midwives in the central hospital in N'Djamena how to use the drug and, as a result, save several thousands of lives—women who would otherwise have died.

[145] We spent a lot of time supporting and encouraging her. We enabled her to take a secondment and to finally give up work by telling her that she could make it work and that we could draw other funders in. However, the funds that we have provided, for example, have been to send midwives from Wales who would gain experience. That was the legal basis on which we did it. So, if we were to monitor and evaluate what we have done, we would be monitoring and evaluating the impact on the midwives we had sent. The total package is that Angela and her team are able to source drugs and we have contributed to the overall programme, but we could not claim the credit for having sourced the drugs and nor would we want to. However, we can be confident that Angela has had a substantial impact, and the United Nations has measured a decrease in maternal mortality in Chad. Due to the way in which the UN calculates the figures—by measuring the mortality rates at the central hospital in the capital—there has been a marked decrease in maternal mortality there because of what Angela has been able to do. However, our contribution to that was a modest one. We feel that it was great, but to monitor and evaluate—

[146] **Rhodri Morgan:** Do you have any thoughts, Chris, in the light of the comments about the need for further monitoring and evaluation?

[147] **Mr Johnes:** From our perspective, we would like to see, in a sense, both sides of the coin monitored, as well as the stuff that Jon talked about, which I understand is essential from the point of view of compliance with the legal requirements. We think that it is very important

that we also monitor the impact on the partner country, which in that case was clear and very positive. It has not always been so clear. There is no particular evidence for being particularly negative, but we could do with greater evidence of clarity. At the moment, the health links project is looking at drawing in a range of partner views from African countries to incorporate some views from the south on the direct impact of particular projects. That is the kind of step that we should encourage and support from all partners.

[148] To pick up on the wider point that you raised on complementarity, we need to try to ensure that the community links are better networked with in-country partners, which may be governmental partners like the UN, other large non-governmental organisations or domestic non-governmental organisations, to try to ensure that we are contributing to the wider jigsaw rather than just adding a little project that does not make sense to development professionals in that particular country.

[149] **Rhodri Morgan:** Thank you very much for your evidence this morning and for your papers. I also indicate in the usual way that we will send you a draft transcript for you to check for factual accuracy before the final version is published. That should happen in a couple of weeks' time.

[150] Diolch am eich presenoldeb a'ch Thank you for your attendance and for your
atebion i'n cwestiynau ni. answers to our questions.

[151] That was the last public item on today's agenda.

10.28 a.m.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

[152] **Rhodri Morgan:** I move that

the committee resolves to exclude the public from the remainder of the meeting in accordance with Standing Order No. 10.37(vi).

[153] I see that the committee is in agreement.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth rhan gyhoeddus y cyfarfod i ben am 10.28 a.m.
The public part of the meeting ended at 10.28 a.m.*