



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 11 Ionawr 2011  
Tuesday, 11 January 2011**

**Cynnwys  
Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Questions to the First Minister   |
| 30  | Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes<br>Business Statement and Announcement   |
| 40  | Datganiad am y Tywydd Garw Diweddar<br>Statement on the Recent Adverse Weather  |
| 55  | Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Egwyddorion Cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch<br>Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)<br>Motion to Approve the General Principles of the Proposed Local Government<br>(Wales) Measure                            |
| 77  | Penderfyniad Ariannol ynghylch y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol<br>(Cymru)<br>Financial Resolution in relation to the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure  |
| 78  | Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Egwyddorion Cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch<br>Diogelwch ar Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru)<br>Motion to Approve the General Principles of the Proposed Safety on Learner<br>Transport (Wales) Measure |
| 102 | Penderfyniad Ariannol ynghylch y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch ar<br>Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru) Financial Resolution in relation to the Proposed Safety<br>on Learner Transport (Wales) Measure                         |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog.  
**The Presiding Officer:** Order for questions to the First Minister.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

#### **Priorities**

**1. Nick Bourne:** Will the First Minister outline his priorities for the remainder of this Assembly. OAQ(3)3301(FM)

**2. Mohammad Asghar:** What are the First Minister's priorities for the remainder of the Third Assembly. OAQ(3)3309(FM)

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** Happy new year, Llywydd, and to you, First Minister.

**The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** Happy new year to you, Nick.

My priorities for the remainder of this Assembly remain as stated in the 'One Wales' agreement.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the First Minister for that response. I know that he is on record as saying that we should be growing the private sector in Wales. I direct him to the gross value added figures in particular and Wales's position as a nation. Wales, particularly west Wales and the Valleys as an Objective 1 and then a convergence region, has gone backwards over the last few years, compared to the rest of the United Kingdom; we went seriously backwards between 2000 and 2008. Yet other convergence areas such as Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly went massively forwards, as did every other area. Not every other area went forwards massively necessarily, but they all went forward in relative terms compared to the rest of the United Kingdom. Wales did not; we went seriously backwards. Why do you think that is?

#### **Blaenoriaethau**

**1. Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill y Cynulliad hwn. OAQ(3)3301(FM)

**2. Mohammad Asghar:** Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Prif Weinidog ar gyfer gweddill y Trydydd Cynulliad. OAQ(3)3309(FM)

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Blwyddyn newydd dda, Lywydd, ac i chithau Brif Weinidog.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones):** Blwyddyn newydd dda i chi, Nick.

Bydd fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer gweddill y Cynulliad hwn yr un fath â'r rheini a restrir yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Gwn y cofnodwyd iddo ddweud y dylem fod yn tyfu'r sector preifat yng Nghymru. Fe'i cyfeiriai at y ffigurau ar gyfer gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn benodol ac at safle Cymru fel cenedl. Mae Cymru, yn enwedig y gorllewin a'r cymoedd a fu'n rhanbarth Amcan 1 ac wedyn yn rhanbarth cydgyfeiriant, wedi llithro yn ôl dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf, o'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig; bu'r llithro yn ôl hwnnw'n ddifrifol rhwng 2000 a 2008. Eto i gyd, gwnaeth ardaloedd cydgyfeiriant eraill megis Cernyw ac Ynysoedd Sili gamau breision, fel y gwnaeth pob ardal arall. Ni wnaeth pob un o'r ardaloedd eraill lamu yn ei blaen o reidrwydd, ond fe symudodd pob un yn ei blaen o'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni wnaeth Cymru hynny; llithro yn ôl yn ddifrifol wnaethom ni. Pam dybiwch chi?

**The First Minister:** First, I must make it clear that Wales has not gone backwards. When compared to the rest of the UK, Wales has not gone forward as swiftly as other parts of the UK have. However, it is not right to give the impression that Wales has literally gone backwards. We know that GVA per head has increased by 39 to 40 per cent over the past 10 years. There was an improvement in the last set of figures that we had for 2009, where the percentage increased from 74.1 per cent to 74.3 per cent, and we are confident that the economic renewal programme, and all the plans associated with it, will close that gap even further.

**Nick Bourne:** I was very careful to say that that was in relative terms; I have the figures here. Between 2000 and 2008, Wales went backwards, from 64.6 per cent to 62.6 per cent, in relative terms. Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly, to take an example, went forward from 59.2 per cent to 64.5 per cent. That is relative, but it shows a relative decline compared to other areas in receipt of Objective 1 or convergence funding. I repeat the question: why should Wales be worse off than those other areas?

**The First Minister:** The figures to which you refer are not figures for Wales, but figures for west Wales and the Valleys, which is a different issue. We know that there are parts of Wales where GVA per head is equivalent to that of the UK, and there are other parts of Wales where that is clearly not the case. I would also refer you to gross disposable household income, which is a more accurate measure in measuring how much money people have at their disposal in relation to where they live. In those figures, we are at 87.9 per cent of the UK average. Why is that important? It is important because GDHI is measured according to where people live, and GVA is measured according to where people work. I would argue that it is a more accurate figure.

**Nick Bourne:** The figures are Office for

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, rhaid imi ei gwneud hi'n glir nad yw Cymru wedi llithro yn ôl. O'i chymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, nid yw Cymru wedi camu ymlaen cyn gyflymed ag y mae rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n iawn rhoi'r argraff fod Cymru wedi llithro yn ôl yn llythrennol. Gwyddom fod Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth y pen wedi cynyddu 39 i 40 y cant dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Roedd y set ddiwethaf o ffigurau a oedd gennym ar gyfer 2009 yn dangos gwelliant lle y cynyddodd y ganran o 74.1 i 74.3 y cant, ac rydym yn hyderus y bydd rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi, a'r holl gynlluniau sy'n gysylltiedig â hi, yn cau'r bwlch hwnnw eto fyth.

**Nick Bourne:** Roeddwn yn ofalus iawn yn dweud mai siarad o safbwynt cymharol oeddwn i. Mae'r ffigurau gennyf yma. Rhwng 2000 a 2008, llithrodd Cymru yn ei hôl, o 64.6 y cant i 62.6 y cant, o safbwynt cymharol. Camodd Cernyw ac Ynysoedd Sili, er enghraifft, yn eu blaen o 59.2 y cant i 64.5 y cant. Mae hynny'n gymharol, ond mae'n dangos dirywiad cymharol o'n cymharu ag ardaloedd eraill sydd wedi cael arian Amcan 1 neu arian cydgyfeirio. Gofynnaf y cwestiwn eto: pam y dylai Cymru fod yn waeth ei byd na'r ardaloedd eraill hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ffigurau ar gyfer Cymru yw'r ffigurau yr ydych yn cyfeirio atynt, ond ffigurau ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd sy'n fater gwahanol. Gwyddom fod rhannau o Gymru lle mae'r Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth y pen yr un fath â'r gwerth yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a bod rhannau eraill o Gymru lle nad yw hynny'n amlwg yn wir. Byddwn yn eich cyfeirio hefyd at incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario, sy'n ffordd fwy cywir o fesur faint o arian sydd gan bobl i'w wario o'i gymharu ag ymhle y maent yn byw. Yn y ffigurau hynny, rydym yn 87.9 o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig. Pam mae hynny'n bwysig? Mae'n bwysig oherwydd bod yr incwm hwnnw'n cael ei fesur ar sail man preswyllo, tra bo Gwerth Ychwanegol Crynswth yn cael ei fesur ar sail man gweithio pobl. Byddwn yn dadlau ei fod yn ffigur mwy cywir.

**Nick Bourne:** Ffigurau'r Swyddfa Ystadegau

National Statistics figures, and I do not believe that you should make light of them; this represents a rather serious challenge for the Government, and I have not heard an answer from you to the question that I have posed twice. I will move on to the Programme for International Student Assessment figures, which were recently issued, and which again showed a relative decline. We had some poor figures in 2006 and worse figures in 2009 on three different levels relating to reading, mathematics and science. We were outperformed by former Eastern bloc countries that were spending far less on education. As I say, the figures were worse in 2009 than they were in 2006. Why is that, and what are you doing about it?

**The First Minister:** That is a question that has been answered by the Minister for education, and he will be making public his plans to deal with that situation during the course of the next month.

**Nick Bourne:** The Minister for education, in all fairness, said that there can be no alibis and that countries that have spent less money on education have done better than Wales. It is not a measure of the money, but I am asking you what you think the reason is in advance of the statement, which I am sure that we all look forward to. Presumably this has been discussed. Why have we gone back from what was a very weak position in 2006, when we were outperformed by Estonia, Poland, the Czech Republic and Slovakia? The situation has got worse. We are outperformed by nearly all the former Eastern bloc countries, which spend less on education. Why is that? What is your view as to why that is the case?

**The First Minister:** It is clear, as you rightly point out, that there is not necessarily a correlation between the amount of money spent and educational performance. That has been made clear given the fact that you have pointed out—I do not dispute it—that there are some countries that spend less on education that have performed better than we have. There are some countries, such as Luxembourg, that spend more that have performed worse than we have. Leighton was

Gwladol yw'r ffigurau, ac ni chredaf y dylech eu hystyried yn ysgafn; mae hon yn her eithaf difrifol i'r Llywodraeth, ac nid wyf wedi clywed ateb gennych i'r cwestiwn yr wyf wedi'i ofyn ddwywaith. Symudaf ymlaen at ffigurau'r Rhaglen Ryngwladol Aseu Myfyrwyr, a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, ac a oedd yn dangos unwaith eto ddirywiad cymharol. Cawsom nifer o ffigurau gwael yn 2006 a ffigurau gwaeth yn 2009 ar dair lefel a'r rheini'n ymwneud â darllen, mathemateg a gwyddoniaeth. Gwnaeth rai o gyn wledydd bloc y Dwyrain yn well na ni er eu bod yn gwario llai o lawer ar addysg. Fel y dywedaf, Roedd y ffigurau'n waeth yn 2009 nag yr oeddent yn 2006. Pam, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn ei gylch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r Gweinidog dros addysg wedi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw a bydd yn cyhoeddi ei gynlluniau i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa honno yn ystod y mis nesaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros addysg, a bod yn gwbl deg, nad oes modd gwneud esgusodion a bod gwledydd sydd wedi gwario llai o arian ar addysg wedi gwneud yn well na Chymru. Nid yr arian sy'n cyfrif, ond rwyf yn gofyn ichi beth yn eich barn chi yw'r rheswm, cyn inni gael y datganiad, datganiad yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn edrych ymlaen ato. Siawns nad yw hyn wedi cael ei drafod. Pam yr ydym wedi llithro yn ôl o'n sefyllfa yn 2006, sefyllfa a oedd yn wan iawn eisoes, pan wnaeth Estonia, Gwlad Pwyl, y Weriniaeth Tsiec a Slofacia yn well na ni? Mae'r sefyllfa wedi gwaethygu. Mae pob un o wledydd hen floc y Dwyrain bron iawn yn gwneud yn well na ni, er eu bod yn gwario llai ar addysg. Pam? Beth yw'r rheswm dros hynny yn eich barn chi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n amlwg, ac rydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud hynny, nad oes cydberthynas o reidrwydd rhwng faint o arian a werir a pherfformiad addysgol. Mae hynny wedi'i wneud yn glir ac ystyried y ffaith y tynasoch sylw ato—nid wyf yn ei amau—bod rhai gwledydd sy'n gwario llai ar addysg sydd wedi gwneud yn well na ni. Mae rhai gwledydd, megis Lwcsembwrg, sy'n gwario mwy, sydd wedi gwneud yn waeth na ni. Roedd Leighton yn gwbl gywir yn dweud ein

quite right to say that we as a Government want to get a grip on this situation, but it also means working with the teaching profession and all in the field of education so that we make an honest appraisal of the situation as it stands and ensure that it improves in the future.

**Mohammad Asghar:** The 'One Wales' agreement commits the Assembly Government to promoting Wales actively in external markets. Given this, what assessment have you made of comments from the Federation of Small Businesses, stating that there has been a real failure to brand and market Wales effectively as a tourist destination? Given Wales's lack of representation at the recent World Travel Market event in London, which attracted almost 27,000 visitors, and included stallholders representing places such as Scotland, London and Yorkshire, and exhibiting partners promoting destinations from Guernsey to Kent to Fife in Scotland, how confident are you that Visit Wales and the Assembly Government are doing enough to promote Wales to key and potentially lucrative overseas tourism markets?

**The First Minister:** I give you two words—Ryder Cup. That was the event that sold Wales around the world. Many people came to Wales as a result of it, and there is still tremendous interest in visiting Wales as a result of the tournament having been held here. I am sure that many of the other territories and nations that you mentioned would have loved to have had the Ryder Cup to have sold themselves to a vastly bigger audience than attended the event that you mentioned. That said, it is important that we keep the momentum of the Ryder Cup going to ensure that the message that Wales is a great place to visit, and a place where there is a warm welcome, continues to be known throughout the world.

**Ann Jones:** I wish to paint a quick picture of what probably happened among families across Wales over the Christmas holidays. A married couple with two young children are busy setting the table to have Grandma and Granddad around; there may be an extra place for a cousin who has just finished university and who has managed to find a

bod ni'r Llywodraeth am gael gafael ar y sefyllfa hon, ond mae hyn hefyd yn golygu gweithio gyda'r proffesiwn addysgu a phawb ym maes addysg er mwyn inni arfarnu'r sefyllfa'n onest fel ag y mae a sicrhau ei bod yn gwella yn y dyfodol.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn ymrwymo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo Cymru'n frwd mewn marchnadoedd allanol. A chofio hyn, pa asesiad yr ydych wedi'i wneud o sylwadau'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, sy'n dweud bod methiant go iawn wedi bod o ran brandio a marchnata Cymru'n effeithiol yn gychfan i dwristiaid? Ac ystyried diffyg cynrychiolaeth o Gymru yn nigwyddiad Marchnad Teithio'r Byd yn Llundain a ddenodd bron 27,000 o ymwelwyr, gan gynnwys stonidwyr yn cynrychioli manau megis yr Alban, Llundain a Swydd Efrog a phartneriaid arddangos yn hyrwyddo cyrchfannau o Guernsey i Gaint i Fife yn yr Alban, pa mor hyderus ydych chi bod Croeso Cymru a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud digon i hyrwyddo Cymru i farchnadoedd twristiaeth pwysig dramor a allai fod yn werthfawr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dywedaf ddau air—Cwpan Ryder. Dyna'r digwyddiad a werthodd Cymru o gwmpas y byd. Daeth llawer o bobl i Gymru yn ei sgil, ac mae diddordeb aruthrol o hyd mewn ymweld â Chymru oherwydd i'r twrnament gael ei gynnal yma. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai llawer o'r tiriogaethau a'r cenhedloedd eraill a grybwyllwyd gennych wedi bod wrth eu bodd o gael Cwpan Ryder er mwyn gwerthu eu hunain i gynulleidfa fwy o lawer nag a aeth i'r digwyddiad y soniasoch chi amdano. Wedi dweud hynny, mae'n bwysig inni gynnal momentwm Cwpan Ryder er mwyn sicrhau bod y neges bod Cymru'n lle bendigedig i ymweld ag ef, ac yn fan lle mae croeso cynnes, yn dal i gael ei chlywed drwy'r byd.

**Ann Jones:** Rwyf am beintio llun sydyn o'r hyn a ddigwyddodd, mae'n debyg, ymhlith teuluoedd ledled Cymru dros wyliau'r Nadolig. Mae pâr priod a dau o blant bach wrthi'n brysur yn hwylio'r bwrdd i groesawu Nain a Taid; efallai fod lle arall wedi'i osod i gefnder sydd newydd orffen yn y brifysgol ac sydd wedi llwyddo i gael swydd. Mae pawb

job. Everyone has felt the strain since the Tories got in in May, and everyone has toasted a more prosperous 2011. Do you agree that such families across Wales do not deserve to lose an additional £850 due to the VAT increase that the Tories have introduced? Do you also agree that VAT is a regressive sales tax that hits the poorest hardest, which is what Cameron said before the election? Should we now tell the people of Wales that they should not listen to what the Tories say before any election?

**The First Minister:** VAT is a regressive tax. It means that those who earn the least pay the most in terms of the percentage of their income. We know that, and that is why it is inherently unfair. It is ironic that we now find that the price of fuel is at the highest level that we have ever seen, when I remember questions being posed about this by the Conservatives opposite when it was at the same level, some two or three years ago, as to what was going to be done to reduce the price of fuel. Now, with the addition to VAT, the UK Government has increased the price of fuel and of so many other commodities that attract VAT.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** I wish to return to the PISA report. As stated previously, that report demonstrated that, with regard to Welsh educational standards, the mean score in reading and mathematics was significantly lower than the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development average, and lower than that in Scotland, Northern Ireland and England. Last month, you told us that you would be taking action to ensure that, when the next PISA results come out, we will be higher up that table. Could you give us a definite date by which we will hear from your Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning the reasons why we figured so badly in these tables, and what you and he intend to do about it?

**The First Minister:** As I have already said, there will be an announcement next month about what will be done to deal with the situation. We are proud of our education policy. We have the foundation phase, which

wedi teimlo'r straen ers i'r Torïaid ddod i rym ym mis Mai, ac mae pawb wedi codi'u gwydrau i flwyddyn fwy llewyrchus yn 2011. A ydych yn cytuno nad yw teuluoedd fel hyn ledled Cymru yn haeddu colli £850 arall oherwydd y cynnydd mewn TAW y mae'r Torïaid wedi'i gyflwyno? A ydych yn cytuno hefyd mai treth anflaengar ar werthiannau yw TAW sy'n taro'r tlotaf galetaf? Dyna a ddywedodd Cameron cyn yr etholiad. A ddylem yn awr ddweud wrth bobl Cymru na ddylent wrando ar yr hyn a ddywed y Torïaid cyn unrhyw etholiad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Treth anflaengar yw TAW. Mae'n golygu mai'r rhai sy'n ennill leiaf sy'n talu fwyaf o ran canran o'u hincwm. Gwyddom hynny, a dyna pam mae'n annheg yn ei hanfod. Mae'n eironig ein bod yn awr yn gweld bod pris tanwydd yn uwch nag a welsom erioed, o gofio bod y Ceidwadwyr gyferbyn wedi gofyn cwestiynau am hyn, pan oedd ar yr un lefel, ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl, gan holi beth oedd yn cael ei wneud i ostwng pris tanwydd. Yn awr, drwy godi TAW, mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi cynyddu pris tanwydd a chynifer o nwyddau eraill y codir TAW arnynt.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Rwyf am ddychwelyd at adroddiad PISA. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, roedd yr adroddiad hwnnw'n dangos, gyda golwg ar safonau addysgol Cymru, fod y sgôr cymedrig ar gyfer darllen a mathemateg yn sylweddol is na chyfartaledd y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, ac yn is na'r cyfartaledd yn yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon a Lloegr. Fis diwethaf, dywedasoch wrthym y byddech yn cymryd camau i sicrhau y byddwn yn uwch ar y tabl hwnnw pan gyhoeddir canlyniadau nesaf PISA. A allech ddweud yn bendant erbyn pryd y cawn glywed gan eich Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol oes yn egluro pam y gwnaethom gynddrwg yn y tablau hyn, a beth yr ydych chi ac yntau'n bwriadu ei wneud yn ei gylch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel yr wyf wedi dweud eisoes, bydd cyhoeddiad fis nesaf ynglŷn â'r hyn a wneir i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa. Rydym yn falch o'n polisi addysg. Mae'r cyfnod sylfaen gennym, sef, yn fy marn i, y

I believe is the best scheme for the early years across the UK. We have the Education (Wales) Measure 2009, which enables so many learners to have a greater choice in what they study. We are also proud of the fact that, unlike in England, many young people will be able to afford to go to university, whereas, in England, the Lib Dems ditched their major pledge.

**Kirsty Williams:** One's ability to go to university is based on one's ability to do well in GCSE and A-level examinations, of course. You cannot do that when you have figures such as this that demonstrate that our students are so far behind the OECD average and their counterparts in Northern Ireland, Scotland and England. Earlier this afternoon, you returned to stating that funding is not a problem. You also used that mantra last month, when you said:

'It is worth emphasising—and I make this point very clearly—that the PISA results are not connected with funding.'

You also said:

'PISA has said that this has nothing to do with funding. Those are not my words; that is what PISA has said.'

However, if you read the PISA report published last month, it states nothing of the sort. I can understand why the Tories, given what they want to do to the education budget, want to absolve themselves of this responsibility. I can understand why they do not want to talk about money for schools, given that they want to cut money to schools. I can accept—*[Interruption.]* I can also accept that funding is not the only issue that needs to be addressed.

1.40 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Members, you have only just come back.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. As I was saying, I can accept why the Tories are trying to move away from the issue of funding, given what they want to do.

cynllun gorau ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae gennym Fesur Addysg (Cymru) 2009, sy'n galluogi cynifer o ddysgwyr i gael gwell dewis o ran yr hyn y byddant yn ei astudio. Rydym yn falch hefyd o'r ffaith y bydd llawer o bobl ifanc yn gallu fforddio mynd i'r brifysgol, sy'n wahanol i'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr lle mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi rhoi'r gorau i'w prif addewid.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae gallu rhywun i fynd i'r brifysgol yn dibynnu ar ei allu i lwyddo mewn arholiadau TGAU a Safon Uwch, wrth gwrs. Ni allwch wneud hynny pan fydd gennych ffigurau fel hyn sy'n dangos bod ein myfyrwyr gymaint ar ei hôl hi o'u cymharu â chyfartaledd yr OECD a'u cymheiriaid yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, yr Alban a Lloegr. Yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, dywedasoch eto nad yw ariannu'n broblem. Defnyddiwyd yr un mantra gennych fis diwethaf hefyd pan ddywedasoch:

'Mae'n werth pwysleisio—a gwnaf y pwyt hwn yn glir iawn—nad oes cysylltiad rhwng canlyniadau PISA ac ariannu.'

Dywedasoch hefyd:

'Mae PISA wedi dweud nad oes a wnelo hyn ddim ag ariannu. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini; dyna'r hyn y mae PISA wedi'i ddweud.'

Serch hynny, petaech yn darllen adroddiad PISA a gyhoeddwyd fis diwethaf, nid yw'n dweud hynny o gwbl. Gallaf ddeall pam mae'r Torïaid, ac ystyried yr hyn y maent am ei wneud i'r gyllideb addysg, am ddiosg y cyfrifoldeb hwn. Gallaf ddeall pam nad ydynt am siarad am arian i ysgolion, a chofio'u bod am dorri'r arian i ysgolion. Gallaf dderbyn—*[Torri ar draws]* Gallaf dderbyn hefyd nad ariannu yw'r unig beth y mae angen rhoi sylw iddo.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Aelodau, newydd ddod yn ôl yr ydych chi.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch, Lywydd. Fel yr oeddwn yn dweud, gallaf dderbyn pam mae'r Torïaid yn ceisio symud oddi wrth fater ariannu, a chofio'r hyn y maent am ei wneud.



I can also accept that funding is not the only answer, but can you accept that spending £533 less per pupil in Wales than is the case in England puts Welsh students at a disadvantage?

**The First Minister:** I would like to welcome, Presiding Officer, the resurrection of the Liberal Democrats as an independent party in the Chamber. It is said that even the dinosaurs roared before they expired.

I will deal with the points raised by Kirsty. She is quite right in accepting that funding per head is not related to PISA performance. However, we have already made a commitment to increase school spending by 1 per cent above the percentage change in the block grant. We did it in this year's budget and we would also look to do that in years to come. I doubt very much that expenditure per head is the same now, given the cuts in educational spending that are taking place in England. I suspect that when it comes to higher education, for example, the perceived or alleged higher education funding gap has now completely disappeared. Of course, we have put in place a system of support for our students. Yes, they need the qualifications—they need GCSEs and A-levels—but they also need the money to study. They will get that in Wales; they will not get that under your Government in England.

**Kirsty Williams:** First, I would like to thank the First Minister for his kind words. Perhaps the retort to that is that the reports of our death have been greatly exaggerated by you and the media in recent months. However, it is simply not credible for you to stand there and avoid answering questions about your Government's record on spending for our schools. It is not credible to say that the difference of £533 that exists between England and Wales does not have an effect on outcomes for our school children. It is not credible for you to say that the fact that children are being better funded in other parts of the United Kingdom is not the reason why we are falling behind. Your Minister for education says:

'These results cannot be excused on the basis of low socio-economic status or...relative

Gallaf dderbyn hefyd nad ariannu yw'r unig ateb, ond a allwch chithau dderbyn bod gwario £533 yn llai y disgybl yng Nghymru nag a werir yn Lloegr yn rhoi myfyrwyr Cymru o dan anfantais?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hoffwn groesawu, Lywydd, adfywiad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol fel plaid annibynnol yn y Siambr. Dywedir bod hyd yn oed y dinosoriaid wedi rhuo cyn darfod amdanynt.

Ymdriniaf â'r pwyntiau a godwyd gan Kirsty. Mae yn llygad ei lle'n dderbyn nad yw'r ariannu y pen yn gysylltiedig â pherfformiad PISA. Serch hynny, rydym eisoes wedi ymrwmo i gynyddu'r gwariant ar ysgolion 1 y cant yn uwch na'r newid canrannol yn y grant bloc. Gwnaethom hyn yn y gyllideb eleni a byddem yn gobeithio gwneud hynny mewn blynyddoedd a ddaw. Rwyf yn amau'n fawr a yw'r gwariant y pen yr un fath yn awr, ac ystyried sut mae Lloegr yn torri'r gwariant ar addysg. Rwyf yn amau, yng nghyswllt addysg uwch, er enghraifft, bod y bwch ariannu a welwyd neu yr honnwyd iddo fodoli ym maes addysg uwch wedi diflannu'n llwyr erbyn hyn. Wrth gwrs, rydym wedi creu system i gefnogi ein myfyrwyr ni. Oes, mae angen y cymwysterau arnynt—mae angen TGAU a Safon Uwch—ond mae angen yr arian i astudio arnynt hefyd. Fe gânt hynny yng Nghymru, ni chânt hynny o dan eich Llywodraeth chi yn Lloegr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Prif Weinidog am ei eiriau caredig. Efallai mai'r ateb i hynny yw bod yr adroddiadau am ein marwolaeth wedi eu gorliwio'n fawr gennych chi a'r cyfryngau yn y misoedd diwethaf. Serch hynny, nid yw'n gredadwy o gwbl ichi sefyll yno a gwrthod ateb cwestiynau am record eich Llywodraeth yn gwario ar ein hysgolion. Nid yw'n gredadwy dweud nad yw'r gwahaniaeth o £533 sy'n bodoli rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yn effeithio ar ganlyniadau i blant ein hysgolion. Nid yw'n gredadwy ichi ddweud nad y ffaith bod plant yn cael eu hariannu'n well mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig yw'r rheswm ein bod ni'n llusgo ar ei hôl hi. Dywed eich Gweinidog dros addysg:

'Ni ellir defnyddio'r esgus o statws economaidd-gymdeithasol isel na lefelau

funding levels.'

He says:

'We must all take a level of responsibility for the problem and for resolving it.'

Something needs to change. You say that it is not money, so what is it?

**The First Minister:** First, if the countries that spent the most on education produced the best results, that would be reflected in the PISA report tables. That is not the case. Having said that, as I have said many times in the Chamber, we are looking to close the funding gap that we have identified in Wales, and we have taken steps to deal with that. We are not saying that there is nothing that we can do; we are dealing with that. In Wales, we have an education system that we can be proud of. It is building for the future; it is creating opportunities for children at all ages and, importantly, for students when they reach the age of 18. They will be able to go to university, whereas in England they will not. I know of a family in which there are three children who want to study medicine. The difference for them between living in Wales and in England is £71,000. That is why we remain determined to ensure that there are no huge financial obstacles to studying at university for students who are domiciled in Wales, whereas in England, the Liberal Democrats have thrown that right in the bin.

**Kirsty Williams:** The PISA results shows that our performance, as reflected in educational standards for our school children, is getting worse. I do not think that any First Minister should stand up in the Assembly to say that he is proud of such results. It is a damning indictment of the policies pursued by you and previous Ministers for education, who sit around the cabinet table with you, over the last four years. We were told four years ago that we would never do as badly in PISA results again. However, four years later our relative performance has got worse. It is a damning indictment of the policies pursued over the last four years, and you still have not explained to the Assembly and the nation of Wales what you are going to do differently.

cyllido cymharol isel .'

Mae'n dweud:

'Mae'n rhaid i ni gyd gymryd cyfrifoldeb am y broblem a'i datrys.'

Mae angen i rywbeth newid. Rydych chi'n dweud nad arian yw hwnnw, beth felly?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, petai'r gwledydd hynny sy'n gwario fwyaf ar addysg yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau, byddai hynny'n cael ei adlewyrchu yn nhablau adroddiad PISA. Nid felly y mae. Wedi dweud hynny, fel yr wyf wedi dweud droeon yn y Siambr, rydym yn ceisio cau'r bwlch ariannu yr ydym wedi'i weld yng Nghymru, ac rydym wedi cymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Nid ydym yn dweud nad oes dim y gallwn ei wneud; rydym yn mynd i'r afael â hynny. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym system addysg y gallwn fod yn falch ohoni. Mae'n adeiladu ar gyfer y dyfodol, mae'n creu cyfleoedd i blant o bob oed, ac, ac mae hyn yn bwysig, i fyfyrwyr pan fyddant yn cyrraedd 18 oed. Byddant yn gallu mynd i'r brifysgol. Ni fyddant yn gallu gwneud hynny yn Lloegr. Gwn am deulu lle mae tri o blant sydd am astudio meddygaeth. Y gwahaniaeth iddynt hwy rhwng byw yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr yw £71,000. Dyna pam yr ydym yn benderfynol o sicrhau nad oes rhwystrau ariannol enfawr i atal myfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru rhag astudio mewn prifysgol, tra bo'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi taflu hynny ar ei ben i'r bin yn Lloegr.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae canlyniadau PISA yn dangos bod ein perfformiad, fel y'i hadlewyrchir yn safonau addysgol plant ein hysgolion yn gwaethygu. Ni chredaf y dylai'r un Prif Weinidog sefyll ar ei draed yn y Cynulliad a dweud ei fod yn falch o ganlyniadau o'r fath. Mae'n feirniadaeth ddamniol ar y polisiau yr ydych chi a chyn Weinidogion addysg wedi'u dilyn, y rhai sydd yn eistedd o gwmpas bwrdd y cabinet gyda chi, dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Dywedwyd wrthym bedair blynedd yn ôl na fyddem byth eto'n gwneud cynddrwg yng nghanlyniadau PISA. Serch hynny, bedair blynedd wedyn, mae ein perfformiad cymharol wedi gwaethygu. Mae'n feirniadaeth ddamniol ar y polisiau yr ydych

You say it is not about the money, but if it is not about the money, what is it? What are you going to do about it and when will we see our children not being let down by your Government?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that children are being let down by the Government. Having said that, I am not standing here defending the PISA figures and saying that we are happy with them, and that we want to remain where we are: of course not. That is why we will put measures in place to deal with it. The GCSE performance is improving, whereas the PISA figures have gone down. That is a major problem and there is an issue about why that is happening. Is it the case, for example, that students are being taught particular skills for GCSE that do not come through when they do the PISA tests? It is an issue, and we plan to investigate that. We will deal with this as a Government. We will ensure that the teaching profession is on board in terms of dealing with it again. There are, as has already been said by Leighton, no alibis here, and we want to ensure that the PISA figures are improved when we next see them produced.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I wish to take you to a different issue that I trust will be a priority, certainly for you as a campaigning issue, if not for you as First Minister, which is winning a successful outcome in the referendum on 3 March. That aspiration is, I think, shared across this Chamber, and we can very much welcome that. Do you share my concern that it may not be possible for the 'no' campaign to constitute itself in such a way that we can have an official 'yes' campaign? If that is the case, there will obviously be resource constraints, so what steps, in your view, can be taken to ensure that electors across Wales have the best possible information in those circumstances to enable them to make an informed decision about whether to vote 'yes' or 'no'?

**The First Minister:** We cannot fund it as a Government. As a Government, we have to

wedi'u dilyn dros y pedair blynedd diwethaf, ac nid ydych wedi esbonio eto i'r Cynulliad ac i genedl Cymru beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud yn wahanol. Dywedwch nad oes a wnelo hyn â'r arian, ond os felly, beth yw'r ateb? Beth yr ydych chi'n bwriadu'i wneud yn ei gylch a pha bryd na chaiff ein plant gam gan eich Llywodraeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn derbyn bod plant yn cael cam gan y Llywodraeth. Wedi dweud hynny, nid wyf yn sefyll yma'n amddiffyn ffigurau PISA ac yn dweud ein bod yn fodlon arnynt, a'n bod am aros yn y fan hon: wrth gwrs nad ydym. Dyna pam y byddwn yn cymryd camau i ymdrin â hyn. Mae'r perfformiad ar safon TGAU yn gwella ac mae ffigurau PISA wedi gwaethygu. Mae hynny'n broblem fawr ac mae angen deall pam mae hynny'n digwydd. Er enghraifft, a yw myfyrwyr yn dysgu sgiliau penodol ar gyfer TGAU nad ydynt yn amlwg pan fyddant yn sefyll profion PISA? Mae hynny'n ystyriaeth a bwriadwn ymchwilio i hynny. Byddwn ni'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i'r afael â hyn. Byddwn yn sicrhau bod y proffesiwn addysgu yn ymroi i fynd i'r afael ag ef eto. Fel y mae Leighton wedi dweud eisoes, nid oes dim esgusodion yn hyn o beth, ac y rydym am sicrhau bod ffigurau PISA yn well y tro nesaf y cânt eu cyhoeddi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Rwyf am eich tywys at fater gwahanol a fydd, hyderaf, yn flaenoriaeth, yn sicr fel pwnc ymgyrchu ichi, os nad yn rhinwedd eich swydd fel Prif Weinidog, sef sicrhau canlyniad llwyddiannus yn y refferendwm ar 3 Mawrth. Credaf fod pawb drwy'r Siambr hon yn rhannu'r dyhead hwnnw, ac fe allwn groesawu hynny'n fawr. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn poeni y gall fod yn amhosibl i'r ymgyrch 'na' ei chyfansoddi ei hun yn y fath fodd ag inni allu cael ymgyrch 'ie' swyddogol? Os felly, bydd cyfyngiadau amlwg ar adnoddau. Felly, pa gamau, yn eich barn chi, y gellir eu cymryd i sicrhau bod etholwyr ledled Cymru yn cael yr wybodaeth orau bosibl o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud penderfyniad doeth ynglŷn ag a ddylent bleidleisio 'ie' nteu 'na'?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chawn ni'r Llywodraeth dalu amdano. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth aros yn

remain strictly neutral. There is a severe danger that there will not be a properly constituted 'no' campaign, which means that there cannot be an official 'yes' campaign, given the strange rules that are in operation for this referendum. What is the response to that? Well, clearly, it is important that the all-party 'yes' campaign is as strong as possible, with as many volunteers as possible, and with as many donors as possible, because let no-one think that there is a river of money out there that can be used to fund the 'yes' campaign. We know that that is not the case; it will rely on individual donations, just like any other organisation. It also depends, of course, on all of us in this Chamber to go out and sell the message even more strongly. A very good start has been made to persuade the people of Wales that a 'yes' vote is in their interests, and that momentum has to be maintained.

**Lynne Neagle:** First Minister, given your commitment to protect the most vulnerable people in Wales from the worst impact of Westminster cuts, do you share my concern about the worrying changes to legal aid eligibility being proposed by the coalition Government in Westminster? The plans would leave thousands of people across Wales without access to legal advice in vital areas such as housing debt, social welfare and employment law. Given the fundamental importance of access to justice, what discussions have you had with UK Government Ministers about the potential impact of these cuts in Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is a great concern for us as a Government, and for Carl Sargeant as the Minister responsible. It is an example of a lack of joined-up thinking in Government. If you remove people's ability to employ a lawyer, they will try to represent themselves, cases will take four or five times longer, and justice will not necessarily be done. All that will happen is that the courts will clog up. That has happened in years gone by. Inevitably, when someone appears as a litigant in person before a court, it is a matter for the judge to ensure that that person is given as much help as possible, and that all takes time. So, I suspect that all that will

gwbl niwtral. Mae perygl difrifol na lwyddir i sefydlu ymgyrch 'na' sydd wedi'i chyfansoddi'n briodol. Mae hynny'n golygu na ellir cael ymgyrch 'ie' swyddogol, oherwydd y rheolau rhyfedd sydd ar waith ar gyfer y refferendwm hwn. Beth yw'r ymateb i hynny? Wel, mae'n amlwg ei bod yn bwysig bod yr ymgyrch 'ie', sy'n cynnwys pob plaid, mor gryf ag y gall fod, a bod ganddi gynifer o wirfoddolwyr ag sy'n bosibl, a chynifer o roddwyr ag sy'n bosibl, oherwydd na feddylid neb bod afon o arian ar gael i ariannu'r ymgyrch 'ie'. Gwyddom nad felly y mae; bydd yn dibynnu ar roddion unigol, yn union fel y bydd unrhyw gorff arall. Mae'n dibynnu hefyd, wrth gwrs, ar i bob un ohonom ni yn y Siambr hon fynd allan a gwerthu'r neges yn gryfach byth. Rydym wedi dechrau'n dda iawn i berswadio pobl bod pleidlais 'ie' er budd iddynt, a rhaid cynnal y momentwm hwnnw.

**Lynne Neagle:** Brif Weinidog, ac ystyried eich ymrwymiad i warchod pobl fwyaf agored i niwed Cymru rhag effaith waethaf toriadau San Steffan, a ydych chithau hefyd yn poeni am y newidiadau i'r amodau cymhwyso ar gyfer cymorth cyfreithiol y mae'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan yn eu cynnig? Byddai'r cynlluniau'n gadael miloedd o bobl ledled Cymru heb ffordd o gael cyngor cyfreithiol mewn meysydd hollbwysig megis dyledion tai, lles cymdeithasol a chyfraith cyflogaeth. A chofio pa mor sylfaenol bwysig yw sicrhau llwybr at gyfiawnder, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn ag effaith bosibl y toriadau hyn yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n destun pryder mawr i ni'r Llywodraeth, ac i Carl Sargeant, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am y maes. Mae'n enghraifft o ddiffyg meddwl cydlynol mewn Llywodraeth. Os byddwch yn dileu gallu pobl i gyflogi cyfreithiwr, byddant yn ceisio'u cynrychioli eu hunain, bydd achosion bedair neu bum gwaith yn hwy, ac ni fydd hynny o reidrwydd yn sicrhau cyfiawnder. Y cyfan a fydd yn digwydd yw y bydd tagfeydd yn y llysoedd. Mae hynny wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Mae'n anochel, pan fydd rhywun yn ei gynrychioli ei hun gerbron y llys, mai gwaith y barnwr yw sicrhau bod y person hwnnw'n cael cymaint o help ag sy'n bosibl,

happen is that money may be saved on legal aid, but people will be deprived of legal representation and more and more money will have to be found to keep the courts working. It is an example of how not to do things when it comes to thinking about joined-up Government.

ac mae hynny i gyd yn draul ar amser. Felly, rwyf yn amau mai'r cyfan a fydd yn digwydd yw yr arbedir arian o bosibl ar gymorth cyfreithiol, ond y caiff pobl eu hamddifadu rhag cael cynrychiolaeth gyfreithiol. Bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid dod o hyd i fwy a mwy o arian er mwyn i'r llysoedd allu dal i weithio. Mae'n enghraifft o sut i beidio â mynd o'i chwmpas hi o ran meddwl am Lywodraeth gydlynol.

### Hyfforddi Athrawon Cerddoriaeth

### Training Music Teachers

**3. Eleanor Burnham:** *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hyfforddi athrawon cerddoriaeth yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3315(FM)*

**3. Eleanor Burnham:** *Will the First Minister make a statement on the training of music teachers in Wales. OAQ(3)3315(FM)*

Happy new year to you too, First Minister.

Blwyddyn newydd dda i chithau hefyd, Brif Weinidog.

**The First Minister:** I had not realised that I had wished everyone a happy new year in quite the way that you implied, but there we are.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oeddwn wedi sylweddoli fy mod wedi dymuno blwyddyn newydd dda i bawb yn y ffordd yr oeddech chi'n ei awgrymu, ond dyna ni.

Leighton Andrews's Cabinet statement on the review of music education for three to 19-year-olds made clear the importance that we attach to music education and we will incorporate appropriate opportunities for teacher development in music as part of the professional development of all teachers in Wales.

Roedd datganiad Leighton Andrews am adolygu addysg gerddorol i'r rhai rhwng tair a 19 oed yn ei gwneud yn glir ein bod yn rhoi pwys ar addysg gerddorol a byddwn yn cynnwys cyfleoedd priodol i ddatblygu athrawon cerddoriaeth fel rhan o ddatblygiad proffesiynol pob athro yng Nghymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you for your answer. We know from a lot of academic evidence, and the music policy review group, that music makes an invaluable contribution to the wellbeing, learning and literacy of children and young people and is vital to community cohesion. Do you accept the recommendations, and what exactly will your Government do to improve provision? You said earlier that money is not always the most important thing, but when you look at building confidence and the general development of young people who might be vulnerable, and enabling them to make a better contribution in themselves and to the school and community, I believe that this is an important aspect. Will you clarify exactly what you are able to do, even in the next few months?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch ichi am eich ateb. Gwyddom, yn sgil llawer o dystiolaeth academiaidd, a gwaith y grŵp sy'n adolygu'r polisi cerddoriaeth, fod cerddoriaeth yn gwneud cyfraniad amhrisiadwy at les, dysgu a llythrennedd plant a phobl ifanc a'i bod yn elfen hanfodol o gydlyniant cymunedau. A ydych yn derbyn yr argymhellion, a beth yn union a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth i wella'r ddarpariaeth? Dywedasochoch gynnu nad arian yw'r peth pwysicaf bob tro ond pan ystyriwch fagu hyder a datblygiad cyffredinol pobl ifanc a'r rheini o bosibl yn rhai agored i niwed, a'u galluogi i gyfrannu mwy o'u safbwynt eu hunain ac i'r ysgol a'r gymuned, credaf fod hon yn agwedd bwysig. A wnewch egluro beth yn union y gallwch ei wneud, hyd yn oed yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf?

**The First Minister:** We are giving consideration to the recently published review on how to take that forward. I can say that, of the 28 music posts in secondary schools in Wales that were advertised during the course of 2009, each attracted an average of 13 applicants, so there is no lack of music teachers in Wales. We will, however, look at the review to see what can be done to move things forward.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym yn ystyried yr adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar ynglŷn â sut mae bwrw ymlaen â hynny. Gallaf ddweud, o blith y 28 swydd cerddoriaeth mewn ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru a hysbysebwyd yn ystod 2009, bod pob un wedi denu 13 ymgeisydd ar gyfartaledd, felly nid oes prinder athrawon cerdd yng Nghymru. Serch hynny, edrychwn ar yr adolygiad i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i symud pethau yn eu blaen.

1.50 p.m.

#### **Gwasanaethau Gwylwyr y Glannau**

#### **Coastguard Services**

**4. Joyce Watson:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u cael ynghylch darparu gwasanaethau Gwylwyr y Glannau Ei Mawrhydi yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3320(FM)*

**4. Joyce Watson:** *What discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government had on the provision of HM Coastguard services in Wales. OAQ(3)3320(FM)*

**The First Minister:** I can say that the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Transport has written to me to inform me of the Maritime and Coastguard Agency's consultation on modernising coastguard services. As a Government, we are now looking to formulate a position in response to that.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf ddweud bod yr Is Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol dros Drafnidiaeth wedi ysgrifennu ataf i roi gwybod imi am ymgynghoriad yr Asiantaeth Forol a Gwylwyr y Glannau ynglŷn â moderneiddio gwasanaethau gwylwyr y glannau. Rydym ni'r llywodraeth wrthi'n llunio ein safbwynt er mwyn ymateb i hynny.

**Joyce Watson:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You know that the Tory-led Westminster Government is currently consulting on proposals to close the coastguard centre in Milford Haven in two years' time. On Friday, I had a meeting with Carl Evans, the rescue and co-ordination manager at the centre. The figures speak for themselves: in the last five years, the rescue team at Milford Haven has co-ordinated more than 3,500 emergency call-outs and taken part in nearly 4,500 operations. Do you share my deep disappointment with the UK Government's decision to close the coastguard centre at Milford Haven, especially at a time when traffic into the harbour is increasing? Do you agree that we cannot afford to lose 23 personnel who possess exceptional life-saving knowledge of the Pembrokeshire and west Wales coast?

**Joyce Watson:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Gwyddoch fod Llywodraeth San Steffan, o dan arweiniad y Toriaid, ar hyn o bryd yn ymgynghori ynglŷn â chynigion i gau canolfan gwylwyr y glannau yn Aberdaugleddau ymhén dwy flynedd. Ddydd Gwener, cefais gyfarfod â Carl Evans, y rheolwr achub a chydlynu yn y ganolfan. Mae'r ffigurau'n siarad drostynt eu hunain: yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf mae'r tîm achub yn Aberdaugleddau wedi cydlynu mwy na 3,500 o alwadau argyfwng ac wedi cymryd rhan mewn bron 4,500 o weithrediadau. A ydych chithau mor siomedig ag yr wyf fi â phenderfyniad Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i gau canolfan gwylwyr y glannau yn Aberdaugleddau, yn enwedig yn awr a'r traffig i'r harbwr yn cynyddu? A ydych chi'n cytuno na allwn fforddio colli 23 o weithwyr sy'n meddu ar wybodaeth eithriadol ynglŷn ag achub bywydau ar arfordir sir Benfro a gorllewin Cymru?

**The First Minister:** The proposal itself is

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r cynnig ei hun yn

worrying, because it suggests that there should be sub-centres, four of which would be at Dover, Falmouth, Humber and Swansea. That would mean the Swansea centre covering the whole of the Welsh coast and the whole of the coast of the north-west of England, up to the western coast of Scotland. That is a huge area to cover; it includes Milford Haven, but it also includes some other busy ports, such as Liverpool, and the ports for the ferries that sail between the north-west of England and the Isle of Man and Northern Ireland. The worry has to be that these proposals will cause a delay in call-out times and that more people will be put in danger. That is our great concern, and it is something that we will be putting to the UK Government.

**Peter Black:** First Minister, on the closure of the coastguard centres, we know that the proposal is to maintain the Mumbles coastguard centre, effectively on a part-time basis—it will not be on a 24-hour basis. Do you share my concerns that if we do not have a full-time coastguard presence in south Wales, the lack of local knowledge in any emergency situations that may arise in the Bristol channel, the Brecon Beacons or anywhere else the coastguard may operate, could have an impact on the effective co-ordination of rescue services?

**The First Minister:** That is a worry that I share. I do not think that it is excessive to have three coastguard stations in Wales, at Holyhead, Milford Haven and Mumbles. It is not that I count myself as a mariner, but I know that expertise in terms of understanding tidal patterns, where the sandbanks are and how the sea works in different parts of Wales could be lost. I share your concern that this is several steps too far in terms of developing proper coastguard protection for Wales and the rest of Britain.

**Brian Gibbons:** First Minister, you will be aware that the situation with regard to safety at sea is even worse than the question would suggest, because the proposals to reduce the services available from RAF stations such as Chivenor will mean that the rescue response

destun pryder, oherwydd mae'n awgrymu y dylid cael is-ganolfannau, a phedair o'r rheini yn Dover, Falmouth, Humber ac Abertawe. Byddai hynny'n golygu bod canolfan Abertawe'n gwasanaethu arfordir Cymru i gyd a holl arfordir gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, hyd at arfordir gorllewin yr Alban. Mae honno'n ardal enfawr i'w gwasanaethu; mae'n cynnwys Aberdaugleddau, ond mae hefyd yn cynnwys nifer o borthladdoedd prysur eraill, megis Lerpwl, a phorthladdoedd y fferis sy'n hwylio rhwng gogledd-orllewin Lloegr ac Ynys Manaw a Gogledd Iwerddon. Mae'n destun pryder y bydd y cynigion hyn yn golygu oedi wrth i'r gwasanaeth ymateb i alwadau ac y bydd rhagor o bobl mewn perygl. Dyna ein pryder mawr ni, a byddwn yn dweud hynny wrth Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Peter Black:** Brif Weinidog, ynglŷn â chau canolfannau gwylwyr y glannau, gwyddom mai'r cynnig yw cadw canolfan gwylwyr y glannau yn y Mwmbwls ar sail ran amser mewn gwirionedd—ni fydd ar agor 24 awr y dydd. A ydych chithau hefyd yn poeni, oni fydd gennym wylwyr y glannau ar waith drwy'r amser yn ne Cymru, y gallai'r diffyg gwybodaeth leol mewn unrhyw argyfyngau a allai godi yn sianel Bryste, ym Mannau Brycheiniog neu yn unrhyw le arall lle y gallai gwylwyr y glannau weithio, ddylanwadu ar allu'r gwasanaethau achub i gydlynu eu gwaith yn effeithiol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf finnau'n poeni amdano. Ni chredaf ei bod yn ormodol cael tair gorsaf gwylwyr y glannau yng Nghymru, yng Nghaerdybi, yn Aberdaugleddau ac yn y Mwmbwls. Nid wyf yn fy nghyfrif fy hun yn forwr, ond gwn y gallai arbenigedd fynd ar goll o ran deall patrymau'r llanw, ymhle y mae'r cefnau tywod a sut mae'r môr yn gweithio mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. Rwyf finnau hefyd yn poeni bod hyn sawl cam yn rhy bell o ran datblygu gwarchodaeth briodol i Gymru ac i weddill Prydain gan wylwyr y glannau.

**Brian Gibbons:** Brif Weinidog, gwyddoch fod y sefyllfa gyda golwg ar ddiogelwch ar y môr yn waeth hyd yn oed nag y byddai'r cwestiwn yn ei awgrymu, oherwydd mae'r cynigion i gwtogi'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael gan orsafoedd yr RAF megis Chivenor

along the south Wales coast will be even further compromised. You said that you would contact the Conservative-Liberal Democrat Government in London on this matter. Is there any progress to report? Has it shown you the courtesy of offering a detailed reply?

**The First Minister:** I have not yet had a response that I can report to the Assembly. I will, however, write to you, Brian, with an up-to-date analysis of this issue.

**Nerys Evans:** I agree with the points raised by Joyce Watson on the Milford Haven coastguard centre, which covers one of the biggest ports in western Europe. I have met local union representatives, workers and the Milford Haven Port Authority to discuss these concerns. As has been said, these proposals would leave Wales with just one daytime base, in Mumbles, and if they are passed, it is unacceptable that any incidents off the coast of Wales during the night would be dealt with from Southampton. This vital extra information, which could only come from detailed, local knowledge, will be lost. As Brian said, combined with the sell-off of search and rescue helicopters, this decision by the Tories and Lib Dems is dangerous and driven by cost rather than by concerns for the safety of the people of west Wales and beyond. Do you agree that it is completely unacceptable that the Welsh Government was not even on the list of consultees for this proposal? You said that you have received correspondence from the Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State, but do you agree that it is unacceptable that the Welsh Government was not even consulted on the proposals?

**The First Minister:** I am not surprised. However, I did receive a letter, which I mentioned earlier. There is another issue here: if much of Wales is to be covered from bases outside Wales, particularly at night, because of the part-time arrangement proposed for Mumbles, there is an issue around understanding local conditions. Although this might seem a strange thing to

yn golygu y bydd yr ymateb achub ar hyd arfordir de Cymru o dan fwy o fygythiad eto. Dywedasoch y byddech yn cysylltu â Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain ynglŷn â hyn. A oes unrhyw gynnydd i sôn amdano? A yw'r Llywodraeth honno wedi bod yn ddigon cwrtais i anfon ymateb manwl atoch?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi cael ateb eto y gallaf ei gyfleu i'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, ysgrifennaf atoch, Brian, i roi'r dadansoddiad diweddaraf ichi am y mater hwn.

**Nerys Evans:** Rwyf yn cytuno â'r pwyntiau a gododd Joyce Watson ynglŷn â chanolfan gwylwyr y glannau yn Aberdaugleddau sy'n gwasanaethu un o borthladdoedd mwyaf gorllewin Ewrop. Rwyf wedi cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr undebau lleol, gweithwyr ac Awdurdod Porthladd Aberdaugleddau i drafod y pryderon hyn. Fel y dywedwyd, byddai'r cynigion hyn yn golygu na fyddai gan Gymru ond un ganolfan yn ystod y dydd, yn y Mwmbwls, ac os cânt eu pasio, mae'n annerbyniol y byddai'r ymateb i unrhyw ddigwyddiadau oddi ar y lan yng Nghymru yn ystod y nos yn dod o Southampton. Collir yr wybodaeth ychwanegol hollbwysig hon, na allai ond ddod yn sgil gwybodaeth fanwl, lleol. Fel y dywedodd Brian, o gyfuno hyn â gwerthu'r hofrenyddion chwilio ac achub, mae'r penderfyniad hwn gan y Torïaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn beryglus a chostau sy'n ei sbarduno yn hytrach na phryder am ddiogelwch pobl gorllewin Cymru a'r tu hwnt. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn gwbl annerbyniol nad oedd Llywodraeth Cymru hyd yn oed ar restr y sawl yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy ynglŷn â'r cynnig hwn? Dywedasoch ichi gael gohebiaeth gan yr Is-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Seneddol, ond a ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn annerbyniol nad ymgynghorwyd hyd yn oed â Llywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn â'r cynigion?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn synnu. Fodd bynnag, cefais lythyr, a grybwyllais gynnau. Mae mater arall i'w ystyried yma: os yw cymaint o Gymru'n mynd i gael ei gwasanaethu o ganolfannau y tu allan i Gymru, yn enwedig yn ystod y nos, oherwydd y trefniant rhan-amser a gynigir ar gyfer y Mwmbwls, mae deall amgylchiadau lleol yn rhywbeth i'w ystyried. Er bod hyn i



say, one issue that troubles me is people understanding Welsh place names. If someone based in Southampton is told that someone is in trouble off Carreg Wastad Point near Fishguard, you can imagine that it could cause some difficulty. These things are important, and can lead to misunderstandings and to people being put in danger. The same applies in Scotland. That can be a serious factor that needs to be considered in looking at round-the-clock coastguard cover for Wales.

### Camddefnyddio Alcohol

**5. Christine Chapman:** *Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio alcohol yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3308(FM)*

**The First Minister:** Our substance misuse strategy for Wales sets out how we will tackle substance misuse. Progress against the actions in the strategy is contained in the annual report on substance misuse that was published by the Minister for Health and Social Services on 18 November 2010.

**Christine Chapman:** I have new figures published by the Public Health Wales Observatory that show that almost 41,000 people were admitted to hospital last year as the result of alcohol. The Welsh health survey also shows that 52 per cent of men and 38 per cent of women drink more than the recommended daily limit for alcohol. While the effects on health are clear, the impact of alcohol problems on families and children cannot be ignored. They reach into every aspect of family life—finances, employment and relationships as well as physical and mental health. Figures also show that the children of alcoholics are four times more likely to develop alcoholism. At a time of tight budgets, First Minister, when pressure on families is increasing, will the Welsh Assembly Government ensure that it continues to do all that it can to tackle the harms associated with the misuse of alcohol?

bob golwg yn beth rhyfedd i'w ddweud, un peth sy'n fy mhoeni i yw gallu pobl i ddeall enwau lleoedd Cymraeg. Os dywedir wrth rywun yn Southampton fod rhywun mewn trafferthion oddi ar drwyn Carreg Wastad ger Aberdaugleddau, gallwch ddychmygu y gallai hynny achosi rhywfaint o anhawster. Mae'r pethau hyn yn bwysig, ac maent yn gallu arwain at gamddealltwriaeth a pheryglu bywyd pobl. Mae'r un peth yn wir yn yr Alban. Gall hwnnw fod yn ffactor difrifol y mae angen ei ystyried wrth edrych ar wasanaeth gwylwyr y glannau rownd y cloc i Gymru.

### Alcohol Abuse

**5. Christine Chapman:** *What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to tackle alcohol abuse in Wales. OAQ(3)3308(FM)*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein strategaeth ar gyfer camddefnyddio sylweddau i Gymru'n dweud sut y byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Mae'r cynnydd a wneir o'i gymharu â'r camau a restrir yn y strategaeth i'w weld yn yr adroddiad blynyddol ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau a gyhoeddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 18 Tachwedd 2010.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae gennyf ffigurau newydd a gyhoeddwyd gan Arsyllfa Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru sy'n dangos bod bron 41,000 o bobl wedi'u derbyn i'r ysbyty y llynedd o ganlyniad i alcohol. Mae arolwg iechyd Cymru yn dangos hefyd bod 52 y cant o ddynion a 38 y cant o fenywod yn yfed mwy o alcohol na'r terfyn dyddiol a argymhellir. Er bod yr effeithiau ar iechyd yn amlwg, ni ellir anwybyddu effaith problemau alcohol ar deuluoedd a phlant. Maent yn cyrraedd pob agwedd ar fywyd teulu—ei sefyllfa ariannol, cyflogaeth a'r berthynas rhwng pobl yn ogystal ag iechyd corfforol a meddyliol. Mae'r ffigurau'n dangos hefyd bod plant alcoholics bedair gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gael y clefyd eu hunain. A chyllidebau'n dynn, Brif Weinidog, a'r pwysau'n cynyddu ar deuluoedd, a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau ei bod yn gwneud popeth yn ei gallu i fynd i'r afael â'r niwed sy'n gysylltiedig â chamddefnyddio alcohol?

**The First Minister:** Yes, absolutely. It is a disappointment to us that, when we requested the devolution of powers over licensing, it was refused by the UK Government. I believe that licensing hours is now a serious issue. I do not think that we can go back to the days of licensing as it was before the last changes, but there are some real issues around all-night and all-day drinking, and the effect that it has on people's health. The hope that many of us held at one time was that, by introducing continental-style licensing hours, we would have continental-style drinking patterns; unfortunately, I think that we have had the worst of both worlds. That is why being able to deal with licensing would enable us to start to deal with the health and public order problems that are being caused by round-the-clock drinking.

**Nick Ramsay:** I concur with the sentiments eloquently expressed by Christine Chapman on the effect of alcohol abuse on families. It is not just the alcoholic who is affected by alcohol abuse—it extends to children, partners, the wider family and friends. Building on that, First Minister, 73 per cent—the statistics are truly frightening—of perpetrators of domestic violence have, at some time, been drinking prior to an assault. I am sure that you are aware that Women's Aid has been working across Wales to try to deal with the victims of alcohol-related abuse and the resulting domestic violence. Given that, in some cases, women can be assaulted up to 30 times before they report cases of domestic abuse, which can be linked to alcohol, what is your Government proposing to do to support organisations such as Women's Aid, particularly at a time of economic difficulties that could be exacerbating the situation?

2.00 p.m.

**The First Minister:** You will know what we have done in terms of the domestic violence strategy and the work that we have been doing with organisations working in the field to enable us to get a better idea of what can be done to tackle the situation. Alcohol Concern, for example, is supported by Welsh

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaiff, yn bendant. Mae'n destun siom i ni, a ninnau wedi gofyn am ddatganoli pwerau dros drwyddedu, fod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig wedi gwrthod eu rhoi inni. Credaf fod oriau trwyddedu bellach yn broblem ddifrifol. Ni chredaf y gallwn fynd yn ôl i'r dyddiau pan oedd trwyddedu fel yr oedd cyn y newidiadau diwethaf, ond mae problemau go iawn yn codi yn sgil yfed drwy'r nos a thrwy'r dydd, a'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar iechyd pobl. Roedd llawer ohonom yn gobeithio ar un adeg, drwy gyflwyno oriau trwyddedu ar batrwm y cyfandir, y byddai hynny'n arwain at yfed ar batrwm y cyfandir; yn anffodus, rwyf yn meddwl inni gael y gwaethaf o'r ddau fyd. Dyna pam y byddai gallu ymdrin â thrwyddedu'n ein galluogi i ddechrau ymdrin â'r problemau iechyd a threfn gyhoeddus sy'n cael eu hachosi yn sgil yfed rownd-y-cloc.

**Nick Ramsay:** Rwyf yn cytuno â geiriau huawdl Christine Chapman am effaith camddefnyddio alcohol ar deuluoedd. Nid dim ond ar yr alcoholic yr effeithia camddefnyddio alcohol—mae'n ymestyn i'r plant, y partneriaid, y teulu ehangach a ffrindiau. Gan adeiladu ar hynny, Brif Weinidog, mae 73 y cant—mae'r ystadegau'n wirioneddol ddychrynlyd—o'r rheini sy'n gyfrifol am drais domestig, wedi bod yn yfed ryw bryd cyn yr ymosodiad. Rwyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gwybod bod Cymorth i Fenywod wedi bod yn gweithio ledled Cymru i geisio ymdrin â'r rhai sydd wedi dioddef cam-drin sy'n gysylltiedig ag alcohol a'r trais domestig yn ei sgil. Ac ystyried bod menywod, mewn ambell achos, yn dioddef hyd at 30 o ymosodiadau cyn iddynt riportio achosion o gam-drin domestig, a'r rheini o bosibl yn gysylltiedig ag alcohol, beth mae eich Llywodraeth yn cynnig ei wneud i gefnogi mudiadau megis Cymorth i Fenywod, yn enwedig a ninnau mewn cyfnod economaidd anodd a allai fod yn gwaethygu'r sefyllfa?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddoch am yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud o ran y strategaeth trais domestig a'r gwaith yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud gyda mudiadau sy'n gweithio yn y maes er mwyn inni allu cael gwell syniad o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa. Mae Alcohol Concern, er enghraifft,

Assembly Government funding and the campaigns that it has led have been important. You are quite right to point out that it will not affect just one person, but several.

With regard to public order, you will quite often get young people ending up in the courts because of the effects of alcohol on a Friday or Saturday night. They are not deterred by what sentence they might receive for committing a public order offence or assault because they are unable to rationalise in that way because of the amount of alcohol that they have ingested. However, a substantial number of new substance misuse treatment places have been made available in Wales; we now have 1,800 such places. Therefore, in helping those people who are violent to deal with their addictions, we remove the cause of that violence in the first place.

**David Lloyd:** Ymhellach at yr holl atebion a roddwyd eisoes, Brif Weinidog, beth yw'r diweddraf ar osod y pris isaf y dylid ei dalu am alcohol yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym yn gwasgu Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i wneud hyn, ond nid oes unrhyw ffordd ymlaen wedi'i phennu hyd yma.

### Dyfodol Iach i Gymru

**6. Angela Burns:** *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddarparu dyfodol iach i Gymru. OAQ(3)3317(FM)*

**The First Minister:** 'Our Healthy Future', our first public health strategic framework, is demonstrating our commitment to achieving a healthy future for Wales.

**Angela Burns:** In your plan for 228 specific commitments to be delivered by April 2011, you tell the people of Wales that your programme is ambitious but realistic. New arrangements were apparently put in place at the beginning of your Labour-Plaid Government to ensure that each Welsh Minister would be accountable for the delivery of those commitments. In the September 2010 delivery plan update, it is

yn cael cymorth ariannol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac mae'r ymgyrchoedd y mae wedi'u cynnal wedi bod yn bwysig. Rydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud nad dim ond ar un person yr effeithir, ond ar sawl un.

O ran y drefn gyhoeddus, bydd pobl ifanc yn aml yn eu cael eu hunain yn y llysoedd oherwydd effeithiau alcohol ar nos Wener neu nos Sadwrn. Nid yw'r ddedfryd y gallant ei chael am gyflawni trosedd trefn gyhoeddus neu ymosodiad yn eu hatal oherwydd ni allant resymoli fel hynny am eu bod wedi yfed cymaint o alcohol. Serch hynny, mae nifer sylweddol o leoedd newydd i drin camddefnyddio sylweddau wedi'u darparu yng Nghymru; mae gennym 1,800 o leoedd o'r fath bellach. Felly, drwy helpu'r bobl hynny sy'n dreisgar i ddelio â'u caethiwed i sylweddau, byddwn yn cael gwared â'r hyn sy'n achosi'r trais yn lle cyntaf.

**David Lloyd:** Further to all the responses that have already been made, First Minister, may I ask for an update on setting a minimum price for alcohol in Wales?

**The First Minister:** We are pressing the UK Government to do this, but a way forward has not been designated at present.

### Healthy Future for Wales

**6. Angela Burns:** *Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to providing a healthy future for Wales. OAQ(3)3317(FM)*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae 'Ein Dyfodol Iach', ein fframwaith iechyd cyhoeddus strategol cyntaf, yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau dyfodol iach i Gymru.

**Angela Burns:** Yn eich cynllun ar gyfer cyflawni 228 o ymrwymadau penodol erbyn mis Ebrill 2011, rydych yn dweud wrth bobl Cymru fod eich rhaglen yn uchelgeisiol ond yn realistig. Sefydlwyd trefniadau newydd i bob golwg ar ddechrau eich Llywodraeth Lafur-Plaid i sicrhau y byddai pob un o Weinidogion Cymru yn gyfrifol am gyflawni'r ymrwymadau hynny. Yn niweddariad y cynllun cyflawni ym mis Medi

stated that 11 of the 38 commitments to providing a healthy future for Wales have not been delivered and that, disappointingly, many are scheduled for delivery after the date that you promised of April 2011. What actions are you and your Cabinet taking to hold the Minister for Health and Social Services to account over these concerning results and to ensure delivery of all 38 healthy future commitments by your promised date of April 2011?

**The First Minister:** We still strive to realise all of our commitments by the end of this Assembly term. I have already mentioned that we have the first public health strategic framework here in Wales and that it is important that we move forward with the initiatives that we already have in place, such as the free breakfast scheme.

**Val Lloyd:** The key to a healthy future for Wales is improving the health and wellbeing of people throughout their life's course, which starts with young people and children. While the Westminster coalition Government is abolishing maternity grants, we in Wales have maintained many key programmes, such as the national breastfeeding programme, the Change4Life scheme and the Welsh network of healthy schools. In addition to this, the Welsh Assembly Government has developed anti-smoking schemes for young people, such as Smokebugs, and delivered on its 'One Wales' commitment to introduce school nurses.

The recent progress report on 'Our Healthy Future' illustrates how the Welsh Assembly Government is developing initiatives for older people and working-age people, with a policy aimed to prevent ill-health. Do you therefore agree that success depends on cross-departmental work, and can you outline how your Government will seek to promote such working to secure a healthy future for the people of Wales?

**The First Minister:** Cross-departmental working is essential, particularly between the fields of heritage and health. We know that exercise leads to better health, which is why

2010, dywedir bod 11 o'r 38 ymrwymiad i ddarparu dyfodol iach i Gymru heb eu cyflawni ac y caiff llawer ohonynt eu cyflawni ar ôl y dyddiad a addawyd gennych, sef Ebrill 2011. Mae hynny'n siomedig. Pa gamau yr ydych chi a'ch Cabinet yn eu cymryd i ddal y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i gyfrif am y canlyniadau hyn sy'n destun pryder, ac i sicrhau bod pob un o'r 38 ymrwymiad ar gyfer dyfodol iach yn cael ei gyflawni erbyn y dyddiad a addawyd, sef Ebrill 2011?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym yn dal i ymdrechu i wireddu ein holl ymrwymadau erbyn diwedd y tymor hwn yn y Cynulliad. Rwyf eisoes wedi crybwyll bod gennym y fframwaith iechyd cyhoeddus strategol cyntaf yma yng Nghymru a'i bod yn bwysig inni symud ymlaen gyda'r cynlluniau sydd gennym ar waith eisoes, megis y cynllun brecwastau am ddim.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr allwedd i ddyfodol iach i Gymru yw gwella iechyd a lles pobl drwy gydol eu bywyd, ac mae hynny'n dechrau gyda phobl ifanc a phlant. Tra bo Llywodraeth glymblaid San Steffan yn cael gwared ar grantiau mamolaeth, rydym ni yng Nghymru wedi cynnal llawer o raglenni allweddol, megis y rhaglen genedlaethol bwydo o'r fron, cynllun Newid am Oes a rhwydwaith ysgolion iach Cymru. At hyn, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi datblygu cynlluniau atal ysmegu ymhlith pobl ifanc megis BygiauBaco ac wedi cyflawni ei hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i gyflwyno nyrsys ysgol.

Mae'r adroddiad cynnydd diweddar am 'Ein Dyfodol Iach' yn dangos sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn datblygu cynlluniau i bobl hŷn a phobl o oedran gweithio, gyda pholisi sydd wedi'i anelu at atal afiechyd. A ydych yn cytuno felly fod llwyddiant yn dibynnu ar waith trawsadrannol ac a allwch ddweud sut y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn ceisio hybu gwaith o'r fath er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol iach i bobl Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwaith trawsadrannol yn hanfodol, yn enwedig rhwng meysydd treftadaeth ac iechyd. Gwyddom fod ymarfer corff yn arwain at well iechyd, a dyna pam yr

we have produced over time a number of strategies to deal with that. It is also important that this body has the powers to take forward the issue of promoting better public health in Wales. All of us in this Chamber remember that we were the first institution to vote to ban smoking in public places, yet were almost the last to do so, because we were the only institution without the powers to do it. That is another example of the need for change, if I can put it that way, after March.

**Veronica German:** One way of ensuring a healthy future is to improve access to health services. Yesterday, I, along with several other Assembly Members, attended Community Pharmacy Wales's launch of its manifesto, at which it detailed how it could save the NHS money and improve services. One example was the introduction of a minor ailments scheme, which is already happening in Torfaen, and I have visited a pharmacy that is delivering that scheme. Unfortunately, it is under threat in that area. Do you agree that that is just the sort of scheme that we should be promoting, as it takes the pressure off GP surgeries and uses the expertise of pharmacists in our communities, giving people greater access to advice and saving money at the same time?

**The First Minister:** We always look for ways of saving money and promoting a better service for our people. If that means more involvement for pharmacists, we would be keen to support that, where appropriate. I look forward to receiving the manifesto that has been produced by community pharmacists, if I can call it that, in order to look carefully at their ideas.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** First Minister, as you know, I am the chair of the Assembly's cross-party group on healthy living and so I take an active interest in such matters. I am pleased that, in my constituency of Caerphilly, there is a new NHS course called the Fun, Food and Fitness project, or F3, which is being offered free of charge to local children who have weight problems and who want to adopt a healthier lifestyle, and to their families. That is surely an excellent way to start 2011. Therefore, would you agree, First Minister,

ydym wedi cynhyrchu nifer o strategaethau dros gyfnod i ymdrin â hynny. Mae'n bwysig hefyd bod gan y corff hwn y pwerau i fwrw ymlaen â mater hybu gwell iechyd cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Rydym i gyd yn y Siambr hon yn cofio mai ni oedd y sefydliad cyntaf i bleidleisio dros wahardd ysmygu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, ac eto i gyd, ni oedd yr olaf bron i gyflwyno'r gwaharddiad oherwydd mai ni oedd yr unig sefydliad heb y pwerau i wneud hynny. Dyna enghraifft arall sy'n dangos pam mae angen newid, os gallaf ei roi felly, ar ôl mis Mawrth.

**Veronica German:** Un ffordd o sicrhau dyfodol iach yw gwella mynediad at wasanaethau iechyd. Ddoe, ynghyd â sawl Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad, euthum i lansiad maniffesto Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru lle yr eglurwyd sut y gallai arbed arian i'r GIG a gwella gwasanaethau. Un enghraifft oedd cyflwyno cynllun mân anhwylderau, sydd eisoes ar waith yn Nhor-faen. Rwyf wedi ymweld â fferyllfa sy'n cynnig y cynllun hwnnw. Yn anffodus, mae o dan fgythiad yn yr ardal honno. A ydych yn cytuno mai dyna'r union fath o gynllun y dylem fod yn ei hyrwyddo, gan ei fod yn tynnu'r pwysau oddi ar feddygfeydd teulu ac yn defnyddio arbenigedd fferyllwyr yn ein cymunedau, gan agor y drws i bobl gael cyngor ac arbed arian ar yr un pryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym bob tro'n chwilio am ffyrdd o arbed arian a hybu gwell gwasanaeth i'n pobl. Os yw hynny'n golygu rhoi mwy o ran i fferyllwyr, byddem yn awyddus i gefnogi hynny, lle bo'n briodol. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael y maniffesto y mae'r fferyllwyr cymunedol wedi'i gyhoeddi, os caf ei alw'n hynny, er mwyn edrych yn ofalus ar eu syniadau.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Brif Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, fi yw cadeirydd grŵp trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad ar fyw'n iach ac felly, mae materion o'r fath o ddiddordeb mawr imi. Rwyf yn falch o ddweud bod cwrs GIG newydd yn fy etholaeth yng Nghaerffili a elwir yn brosiect Hwyl, Bwyd a Ffitrwydd, neu F3 yn Saesneg. Mae'n cael ei gynnig am ddim i blant lleol sydd â phroblem pwysau ac sydd am fyw'n iachach, ac i'w teuluoedd. Siawns nad yw hynny'n ffordd ragorol o ddechrau 2011. Felly, a fydddech yn cytuno,

that, far from our being a nanny state, we in Wales take a responsible and proactive stance on this matter by encouraging healthy lifestyles through Change4Life, which Val mentioned, and putting in place the free school breakfasts that give children of primary school age a healthy and focused start to the day?

**The First Minister:** Absolutely. It is important that people are given the encouragement and support that they need to live healthier lives, and particularly in order to lose weight, which always becomes topical at this time of year, although it is a perennial problem for so many people of all ages.

### GYC yng Nghymru

**7. Mark Isherwood:** *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am GYC yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3297(FM)*

**The First Minister:** I refer you to the answer that I gave to Nick Bourne.

**Mark Isherwood:** Nick Bourne, the leader of the opposition, referred to the figures for December at the beginning of questions today. Do you welcome the possibility that Wales might qualify for a third round of the highest level of European funding, as a consequence of the fact that Wales still has the lowest level of economic activity and wealth creation of all UK devolved nations and English regions? We have been at the lowest level since 1998. Flintshire and Wrexham saw the largest fall of all areas of Wales; the level in Gwynedd is only two thirds of that of the UK; Conwy and Denbighshire's figures are below 60 per cent; and, Anglesey has the lowest level in the whole of the UK. Is it not outrageous that, given that billions of pounds were received in the two previous rounds as a result of Wales having the lowest levels in the whole of the UK, which were below 75 per cent of that of the UK, the poorest parts of Wales have remained the poorest parts of the UK, blighted by worklessness and dependency, even before the recession hit us?

**The First Minister:** One thing that I am sure

Brif Weinidog, ymhell o fod yn wladwriaeth nani, ein bod ni yng Nghymru'n arddel safbwynt cyfrifol a rhagweithiol at hyn drwy annog ffyrdd iach o fyw drwy Newid am Oes a grybwyllwyd gan Val a sefydlu'r cynllun brecwastau am ddim sy'n rhoi cychwyn iach i'r diwrnod i blant oedran ysgol gynradd er mwyn iddynt allu canolbwyntio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn union. Mae'n bwysig i bobl gael yr anogaeth a'r cymorth sydd eu hangen arnynt i fyw bywydau iachach, ac yn enwedig er mwyn iddynt gollu pwysau, sydd bob tro'n bwnc poblogaidd yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, er ei bod yn broblem barhaus i gynifer o bobl o bob oed.

### GVA in Wales

**7. Mark Isherwood:** *Will the First Minister make a statement on GVA in Wales. OAQ(3)3297(FM)*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'ch cyfeirïaf at yr ateb a roddais i Nick Bourne.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cyfeiriodd Nick Bourne, arweinydd yr wrthblaid, at y ffigurau ar gyfer mis Rhagfyr ar ddechrau'r cwestiynau heddiw. A ydych yn croesawu'r posibilrwydd y gallai Cymru fod yn gymwys ar gyfer trydedd rownd ariannu ar y lefel uchaf gan Ewrop, yn sgil y ffaith mai gan Gymru o hyd y mae'r lefel gweithgarwch economaidd a chreu cyfoeth isaf ymhlith holl wledydd datganoledig y Deyrnas Unedig a rhanbarthau Lloegr? Rydym wedi bod ar y lefel isaf er 1998. Yn Sir y Fflint ac yn Wrecsam y gwelwyd y gostyngiad mwyaf o blith holl ardaloedd Cymru; nid yw'r lefel yng Ngwynedd ond yn ddwy ran o dair o lefel y Deyrnas Unedig, mae ffigurau Conwy a Sir Ddinbych o dan 60 y cant; ac, ar Ynys Môn y mae'r lefel isaf un drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig. Onid yw'n warthus, ac ystyried inni gael biliynau o bunnoedd oherwydd mai yng Nghymru yr oedd y lefelau isaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig i gyd, sef o dan 75 y cant o ffigur y Deyrnas Unedig, mai ardaloedd tlotaf Cymru yw ardaloedd tlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig o hyd? Roedd diweithdra a dibyniaeth yn bla ynddynt, hyd yn oed cyn i'r dirwasgiad ein taro.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Un peth yr wyf yn sicr

about is that if we had not had Objective 1 or convergence funding, the situation would have been a lot worse. We are still trying to cope with the legacy of the 1980s and 1990s that was left by your party, and these legacies cannot be dealt with overnight. Having said that, we know that our GVA figures in Wales have crept closer towards the UK average, and our intention is to make sure that they leap closer towards the UK average in years to come.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Weinidog, a fydddech yn cytuno bod y ffigurau y mae Mark Isherwood yn cyfeirio atynt, sef y ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru, yn dangos pam mae'r toriadau llym sy'n cael eu gorfodi ar Gymru gan ei Blaid Geidwadol a'i chydweithwyr, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yn Llundain mor beryglus i'r adfywiad economaidd yng Nghymru? Drwy gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', ac yna drwy'r rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi, y cynlluniau achub morgeisi, ProAct ac yn y blaen, yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru wedi dangos ein bod am wneud cymaint ag sy'n bosibl i helpu pobl Cymru i hyfforddi ar gyfer swyddi, dod o hyd i swyddi ac aros yn eu swyddi presennol, yn ogystal ag yn eu cartrefi eu hunain.

2.10 p.m.

A fydddech yn cytuno bod y ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn dangos mai'r hyn sydd ei angen yng Nghymru, yn fwy nag unrhyw beth arall, yw buddsoddiad mewn cyfleoedd am swyddi yn hytrach na mesurau dinistriol Llywodraeth y glymblaid yn Llundain—mesurau sy'n arwain at golli degau o filoedd o swyddi yng Nghymru yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat fel ei gilydd ac sy'n cael eu ffafrio gan Mark Isherwood a'i gydweithwyr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n iawn, Gareth; mae buddsoddiad yn bwysig dros ben. Dyma yw ein hetifeddiaeth gan y Torïaid gan eu bod hwy, yn arbennig, wedi cael gwared ar swyddi yn hytrach na'u creu. Rydym wedi gweld hynny yn y gorffennol. Rwyf yn ymwybodol iawn y bydd polisïau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn arwain at golli nifer fawr o swyddi yng Nghymru. Nid dyna'r ffordd i greu swyddi. Bydd nifer fawr

ohono yw pe na baem wedi cael arian Amcan 1 neu arian cydgyfeirio, y buasai'r sefyllfa'n waeth o lawer. Rydym yn dal i geisio ymdopi â gwaddol yr 1980au a'r 1990au a adawyd gan eich plaid chi, ac nid oes modd ymdrin â'r gwaddolion hyn dros nos. Wedi dweud hynny, gwyddom fod ein ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru wedi crocian yn nes at gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig, a'n bwriad yw sicrhau eu bod yn llamu'n nes at gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw.

**Gareth Jones:** First Minister, would you agree that the figures referred to by Mark Isherwood—Wales's gross value added figures—demonstrate why the drastic cuts being forced on Wales by his Conservative Party and its colleagues, the Liberal Democrats, in London are so dangerous to Wales's economic regeneration? Through the 'One Wales' agreement, and then through the economic renewal programme, the mortgage rescue schemes, ProAct and so on, we in Plaid Cymru have shown that we want to do as much as possible to help people in Wales train for jobs, to find jobs and to stay in their current jobs, as well as in their own homes.

Would you agree that the gross value added figures show that what is needed in Wales, more than anything else, is investment in job opportunities rather than the destructive measures introduced by the coalition Government in London—measures that lead to the loss of tens of thousands of jobs in Wales in the public and private sectors alike and which are favoured by Mark Isherwood and his colleagues?

**The First Minister:** That is right, Gareth; investment is extremely important. This is our inheritance from the Tories, as they, in particular, have shed jobs rather than created jobs. We have seen that in the past. I am well aware that the UK Government's policies will lead to the loss of many jobs in Wales. That is no way to create jobs. A large number of jobs are being lost in the public sector and many of those will be lost in Wales.

o swyddi yn cael eu colli yn y sector cyhoeddus a llawer o'r rheini yn cael eu colli yng Nghymru.

**Jenny Randerson:** The GVA figures tell a sorry tale of the Government's failure since the establishment of the Assembly to make inroads into the problems that Wales faces. Over the years, understandably, the Assembly Government has tried to turn the tide by concentrating on areas with the lowest GVA, and European money has greatly assisted this, but that approach has simply not worked. However, if you look in detail at the GVA figures, there is a good-news story in south-east Wales. Is it not time for your Government to look differently at the problems in the economy in Wales, consider the progress that has been made in south-east Wales, and concentrate on policies that develop our strengths in south-east Wales to develop a true capital region, as those countries that have turned the tide of poverty have done?

**The First Minister:** It is true that the south-east has done very well, and we know that there are parts of the south-east, and indeed the north-east, where the GVA per head is equivalent to the UK level. The strange thing is that, if you increase the number of jobs available in, for example, Cardiff, and people come in from Rhondda Cynon Taf every morning to work in those jobs, you reduce the GDP per head of west Wales and the Valleys and, arguably, the GVA as well. This is why it is so difficult to rely on figures such as GDP and GVA. I would argue that gross disposable household income is a better measure of progress, because it measures people's incomes according to where they live and not where they work.

**Brian Gibbons:** Due to the economic recession, a decline in the GVA figure for the UK would be expected. However, do you

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'r ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn adrodd hanes trist methiant y Llywodraeth ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad i ddechrau datrys y problemau y mae Cymru yn eu hwynebu. Dros y blynyddoedd, ac mae hynny'n ddealladwy, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ceisio troi'r llanw drwy ganolbwyntio ar yr ardaloedd lle mae'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ar ei isaf, ac mae arian Ewrop wedi bod o gymorth mawr yn hyn o beth, ond y gwir plaen yw nad yw hyn wedi gweithio. Serch hynny, os edrychwch yn fanwl ar ffigurau'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, mae newyddion da inni yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. Onid yw'n bryd i'ch Llywodraeth edrych yn wahanol ar broblemau'r economi yng Nghymru, ac ystyried y cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, a chanolbwyntio ar bolisiau sy'n datblygu ein cryfderau yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru er mwyn datblygu rhanbarth prifddinasol go iawn, fel y mae'r gwledydd hynny sydd wedi troi llanw tloidi wedi llwyddo i'w wneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n wir bod y de-ddwyrain wedi gwneud yn dda iawn, a gwyddom fod rhannau o'r de-ddwyrain, ac yn wir, y gogledd-ddwyrain, lle mae'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen yr un fath â'r gwerth yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Y peth rhyfedd yw, os cynyddwch nifer y swyddi sydd ar gael, er enghraifft, yng Nghaerdydd, a bod pobl yn dod yno o ardal Rhondda Cynon Taf bob bore i weithio yn y swyddi hynny, bydd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn gostwng, ac fe ellid dadlau bod y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn gostwng hefyd. Dyna pam y mae hi mor anodd dibynnu ar ffigurau megis cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth a gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Byddwn yn dadlau bod yr incwm crynswth sydd gan aelwydydd i'w wario yn ffordd well o fesur cynnydd, oherwydd ei fod yn mesur incwm pobl yn ôl ymhle y maent yn byw yn hytrach nag yn ôl ymhle y maent yn gweithio.

**Brian Gibbons:** Oherwydd y dirwasgiad economaidd, byddai rhywun yn disgwyl i ffigur y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ar



welcome the recent statistics that show that the decline in Wales has been significantly smaller than in the United Kingdom as a whole? Indeed, with the exception of Scotland, the decline has been smaller than that seen in the other devolved administrations. It is a sad fact that, over the last two decades, GVA has declined relatively by 10 per cent. However, is it not true that over 7 per cent of that decline occurred during the 10 years that the Conservatives were in power in Wales and in the United Kingdom?

**The First Minister:** A certain amount of amnesia takes place among members of the party opposite, which we are all familiar with. You are quite right, Brian, that we have weathered the storm better than most of the other parts of the UK. That is because of the measures that were put in place by the Assembly Government—of which, ProAct and ReAct are two schemes—and the figures show that. In previous years, had there been a recession, we would have expected Wales to have fared worse than other parts of the UK because of its reliance on manufacturing in particular. However, we have weathered the storm better, and that is because of the policies that are being pursued by this Assembly Government.

#### Effaith y Cynnydd mewn TAW

**8. Chris Franks:** *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch effaith y cynnydd mewn TAW ar gymunedau Cymru. OAQ(3)3318(FM)*

**The First Minister:** It is of concern to us as a Government. Although it is not a devolved matter, we are monitoring carefully the impact of the increase on the economy and on services in Wales.

**Chris Franks:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. What talks will you have regarding the impact of the tax hike on Welsh Government contracts, such as those for new schools, roads and hospitals? In addition, the VAT rise will hit people from all walks of life, but particularly pensioners and small businesses, such as those involved in the

gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig ostwng. Serch hynny, a ydych yn croesawu'r ystadegau diweddar sy'n dangos bod y dirywiad yng Nghymru wedi bod yn sylweddol lai na'r dirywiad yn y Deyrnas Unedig drwyddi draw? Yn wir, ac eithrio'r Alban, mae'r dirywiad wedi bod yn llai na'r hyn a welwyd yn y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill. Mae'n ffaith drist, dros y ddau ddegawd diwethaf, fod gwerth ychwanegol crynswth wedi dirywio 10 y cant o safbwynt cymharol. Serch hynny, onid yw'n wir bod dros 7 y cant o'r dirywiad hwnnw wedi digwydd yn ystod y 10 mlynedd yr oedd y Ceidwadwyr mewn grym yng Nghymru ac yn y Deyrnas Unedig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cof aelodau'r blaid gyferbyn yn pallu rhywfaint, ac rydym i gyd yn gyfarwydd â hynny. Rydych yn llygad eich lle, Brian, ein bod wedi gwrthsefyll y storm yn well na'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Y rheswm dros hynny yw'r camau a gymerodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—a dau o'r cynlluniau hynny yw ProAct a ReAct—ac mae'r ffigurau'n dangos hynny. Yn y gorffennol, petasai dirwasgiad, byddem wedi disgwyl i Gymru ddiodef yn waeth na rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig oherwydd ei bod yn dibynnu'n benodol ar weithgynhyrchu. Serch hynny, rydym wedi gwrthsefyll y storm yn well, a hynny oherwydd y polisiau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu dilyn.

#### Impact of VAT Rise

**8. Chris Franks:** *What discussions has the First Minister had regarding the impact of the VAT rise on Welsh communities. OAQ(3)3318(FM)*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rydym ni'r Llywodraeth yn poeni am hyn. Er nad yw'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, rydym yn monitro'n ofalus effaith y cynnydd ar yr economi ac ar wasanaethau yng Nghymru.

**Chris Franks:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Pa drafodaethau a gewch chi ynghlŷn ag effaith y cynnydd yn y dreth ar gontractau Llywodraeth Cymru, megis y rheini ar gyfer ysgolion, ffyrdd ac ysbytai newydd? At hynny, bydd cynyddu TAW yn ergyd i bobl o bob carfan o gymdeithas, ond yn enwedig i bensiynwyr a

Welsh tourism industry. Will you raise with the Westminster Government the question of whether it is prepared to delay new year tax bills? As Ieuan Wyn Jones, the Minister for the Economy and Transport, has pointed out, delaying small businesses' income tax bills for the initial months of 2011 could help these struggling firms.

**The First Minister:** I do not think that there is any chance of the Westminster Government reversing its decision. As a Government, we have to consider the impact of VAT on procurement contracts and on the NHS. An increase in VAT means an increase in the amount of money that we have to make available to meet the extra costs. It is not just a tax on spending; it is a tax on our budget. VAT has risen and we have to budget for that increase, but we do not receive any extra money from the UK Government to do that.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** First Minister, would you agree that an increase in national insurance would have entailed a far bigger hit for Welsh public services than the increase in VAT? For the health service, the hit from a national insurance hike would have been £30 million, as opposed to a £20 million hit from the VAT increase. Would you agree that, while tax rises are regrettable, the VAT increase is, given the current deficit situation, far better than the national insurance increase that your Government proposed at the last election?

**The First Minister:** Having been here for nearly 12 years, I never thought that I would see the day when a Conservative stood up and defended—indeed, advocated—tax increases. I have seen it all now. The point about VAT is that it is a regressive tax. Taxation should be fair for all those who pay it. The fact is that the less money you earn, the greater the percentage of it that you will pay with a regressive tax such as VAT. I do not think that that is fair.

#### Datblygiad Economaidd

**9. Andrew R.T. Davies:** *Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i*

busnesau bach, megis y rheini sy'n ymwneud â diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru. A wnewch ofyn i Lywodraeth San Steffan a yw'n barod i ohirio biliau treth y flwyddyn newydd? Fel y dywedodd Ieuan Wyn Jones, y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, gallai gohirio biliau treth incwm busnesau bach ym misoedd cyntaf 2011 helpu'r cwmnïau hyn sy'n straffaglu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Go brin y gwnaiff Llywodraeth San Steffan newid ei benderfyniad. Rhaid i ni'r Llywodraeth ystyried effaith TAW ar gontractau caffael ac ar y GIG. Mae cynyddu TAW yn golygu cynnydd yn yr arian y mae'n rhaid inni ei ddarparu i dalu am y costau ychwanegol. Nid dim ond treth ar wariant ydyw; mae'n dreth ar ein cyllideb. Mae TAW wedi cynyddu a rhaid inni gyllidebu ar gyfer y cynnydd hwnnw, ond ni chawn ddim rhagor o arian gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i wneud hynny.

**Andrew R. T. Davies:** Brif Weinidog, a fydddech yn cytuno y byddai cynyddu yswiriant gwladol wedi bod yn fwy o ergyd o lawer i wasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru nag y bydd cynyddu TAW? O ran y gwasanaeth ieched, yr ergyd yn sgil cynyddu yswiriant gwladol fuasai £30 miliwn, o'i gymharu ag £20 miliwn yn sgil cynyddu TAW. A fydddech yn cytuno, er bod cynyddu trethi'n resyn o beth, fod cynyddu TAW, ac ystyried sefyllfa'r diffyg presennol, yn well o lawer na chynyddu yswiriant gwladol, sef cynnig eich llywodraeth chi yn yr etholiad diwethaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ar ôl bod yma 12 mlynedd bron, ni ddychmygais erioed y gwelwn y dydd pan fyddai Ceidwadwr yn sefyll ar ei draed ac yn amddiffyn—yn wir, yn argymhell—cynyddu trethi. Rwyf wedi gweld y cyfan yn awr. Y pwynt am TAW yw ei bod yn dreth anflaengar. Dylai trethi fod yn deg i bawb sy'n eu talu. Y ffaith yw, lleiaf y byddwch yn ei ennill, mwyaf fydd y ganran o'r arian hwnnw y byddwch yn ei thalu gyda threth anflaengar megis TAW. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n deg.

#### Economic Development

**9. Andrew R.T. Davies:** *What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve*

*wella datblygu economaidd yn rhanbarth Canol De Cymru. OAQ(3)3304(FM)*

*economic development in the South Wales Central region. OAQ(3)3304(FM)*

**The First Minister:** The answer is in 'Economic Renewal: a new direction'.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ateb i'w weld yn 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd'.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. Do you share my concern at the lack of progress on the Welsh Assembly Government's aerospace park at St Athan? In answer to a question, the Minister for the Economy and Transport confirmed that £44 million in Welsh Assembly Government money has been spent on the aerospace park—not the defence training academy—which was announced as a direct consequence of the closure of the Defence Aviation Repair Agency facility at St Athan. There has been no progress to date on job creation in that aspect of the Welsh Assembly Government's economic portfolio. When can the residents of St Athan and Llantwit Major expect to see progress on this important scheme?

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. A ydych chithau hefyd yn poeni am y diffyg cynnydd o ran parc awyrofod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn Sain Tathan? Wrth ateb cwestiwn, cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth fod £44 miliwn o arian Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i wario ar y parc awyrofod—nid ar yr academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn—a gyhoeddwyd o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i gau cyfleuster yr Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn yn Sain Tathan. Nid oes dim cynnydd wedi bod hyd yn hyn o ran creu swyddi yn yr agwedd honno ar bortffolio economaidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Pa bryd y gall trigolion Sain Tathan a Llanilltud Fawr ddisgwyl gweld cynnydd gyda'r cynllun pwysig hwn?

**The First Minister:** I am now even more amazed. In order for the business park to prosper, there needs to be a decision on the rest of the site. The dithering of the UK Government and its failure to make a decision are frustrating our ability to offer long-term certainty to potential tenants. If you are a prospective tenant, you want to know what else is going to go there. Until we have a decision from the UK Government, and we until we have some clarity for the people of St Athan, Llantwit Major and the Vale of Glamorgan, it is going to be very difficult for us to attract tenants to the park. We have made our investment and we now need to see a commitment from the UK Government and the Ministry of Defence to deliver on what they said that they would deliver—a training facility at St Athan. Let us hear it.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rwyf yn fwy syfrdan byth yn awr. Er mwyn i'r parc busnes ffynnu, rhaid cael penderfyniad ynglŷn â gweddill y safle. Mae'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn mwydro ac yn methu â phenderfynu yn ein rhwystro ni rhag gallu cynnig sicrwydd tymor hir i ddarpar denantiaid. Os ydych chi'n ddarpar denant, rydych am gael gwybod beth arall sy'n mynd i fod yno. Nes inni gael penderfyniad gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac nes inni gael rhywfaint o eglurder i bobl Sain Tathan, Llanilltud Fawr a Bro Morgannwg, bydd yn anodd iawn inni ddenu tenantiaid i'r parc. Rydym wedi buddsoddi ac mae angen inni weld ymrwymiad yn awr gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Weinyddiaeth Cyfiawnder i wireddu'r hyn a ddywedwyd—sef darparu cyfleuster hyfforddi yn Sain Tathan. Gadewch inni ei glywed.

**Leanne Wood:** First Minister, the Assembly Government already supports the Wales Co-operative Centre through the co-operative enterprise hub, which provides a multi-million-pound package of advice, training and finance to help communities grow their own enterprises. I believe that there is great

**Leanne Wood:** Brif Weinidog, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn cefnogi Canolfan Cydweithredol Cymru drwy'r ganolfan mentrau cydweithredol, sy'n darparu pecyn cyngor, hyfforddiant ac arian, gwerth miliynau lawer o bunnoedd i helpu cymunedau i ddatblygu eu mentrau hwy eu

potential to expand the co-operative movement to create further employment, and to enable people and communities to become self-reliant, particularly in the former mining areas of the South Wales Central region, where jobs are in short supply. Given the recent run of bad news as a result of Westminster budget decisions, such as that on the electrification of the railways, and the poor budget settlement delivered to the Assembly, which will result in the loss of public sector jobs and a downgrading—in some cases—of public sector terms and conditions, what can the Welsh Assembly Government do to promote and support a green co-operative revolution in Wales?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** There is tremendous potential for co-operatives in Wales to begin and to expand. The one thing that we can be absolutely certain about is that the message needs to get out there that we do not see the third sector as being in some way a surrogate for the public sector. We do not want to see public sector services forced on the third sector. That said, there may well be opportunities for the third sector to take on more work and, indeed, for co-operatives to grow in future. That is perfectly fair.

With regard to the electrification of the railway, we still have no decision; we still do not know when that decision will be made. We hope that the decision will be that there will be electrification as far as Swansea. The worst possible outcome and the most difficult situation for the people of Wales to resolve would be if electrification took place only as far as Bristol. That would take some explaining on the part of the UK Government to the people of south Wales and beyond.

#### **‘Llyfrgelloedd am Oes’**

**10. Darren Millar:** *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am Strategaeth 'Llyfrgelloedd am Oes' Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. OAQ(3)3300(FM)*

**The First Minister:** The strategy represents a record £10.5 million investment by the Assembly Government to modernise

hunain. Credaf fod potensial enfawr i ehangu'r mudiad cydweithredol er mwyn creu rhagor o swyddi, ac i alluogi pobl a chymunedau i ddod yn hunan-ddibynnol, yn enwedig yn hen ardaloedd maes glo rhanbarth Canol De Cymru, lle mae swyddi'n brin. A chofio'r gyfres o straeon newyddion drwg sydd wedi dod yn sgil penderfyniadau cyllideb San Steffan, megis honno ynglŷn â thrydanu'r rheilffyrdd, a'r setliad cyllideb gwael a gafodd y Cynulliad, a fydd yn arwain at golli swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus a diraddio—mewn ambell achos—delerau ac amodau'r sector cyhoeddus, beth y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud i hybu a chefnogi chwyldro cydweithredol gwyrdd yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae potensial aruthrol ar gyfer cychwyn ac ehangu mentrau cydweithredol yng Nghymru. Yr un peth y gallwn fod yn gwbl sicr yn ei gylch yw bod angen inni gyfleu'r neges i bobl nad ydym yn gweld y trydydd sector yn rhywbeth sy'n disodli'r sector cyhoeddus mewn unrhyw fodd. Nid ydym am weld gwasanaethau'r sector cyhoeddus yn cael eu gorfodi ar y trydydd sector. Wedi dweud hynny, efallai'n wir fod cyfleoedd i'r trydydd sector ysgwyddo rhagor o waith, ac yn wir, i fentrau cydweithredol dyfu yn y dyfodol. Mae hynny'n gwbl deg.

O ran trydanu'r rheilffordd, nid ydym wedi cael penderfyniad eto, nid ydym yn gwybod o hyd pa bryd y gwneir y penderfyniad hwnnw. Rydym yn gobeithio mai'r penderfyniad fydd trydanu cyn belled ag Abertawe. Y canlyniad gwaethaf posibl a'r un mwyaf anodd i bobl Cymru ei ddatrys fyddai pe na bai'r trydanu'n mynd ymhellach na Bryste. Byddai gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dipyn o waith esbonio hynny i bobl de Cymru a'r tu hwnt.

#### **‘Libraries for Life’**

**10. Darren Millar:** *Will the First Minister provide an update on the Welsh Assembly Government's 'Libraries for Life' Strategy. OAQ(3)3300(FM)*

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r strategaeth yn golygu buddsoddiad uwch nag erioed gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, sef £10.5 miliwn i

libraries.

**Darren Millar:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. I welcome that investment in libraries, because, of course, libraries in my constituency have benefited from it. However, there are other libraries in my constituency that, unfortunately, are at threat of closure because of decisions being made by Conwy County Borough Council, including Kinmel Bay library on the north Wales coast. This library is joined to a local community centre. The viability of the community centre will be undermined if the library closes. What guidance has the Welsh Assembly Government given to local authorities that wish to close community facilities such as libraries, and how does that guidance deal with the situation of a facility, such as a community centre, being co-located with a library?

**The First Minister:** You will, of course, be aware of the Assembly Government's public library standards framework, which we expect local authorities to keep to. I understand that Conwy council is considering this issue now.

**David Lloyd:** Beth yw'r diweddaraf ar ledaenu band eang a gwasanaethau ar-lein eraill am ddim mewn llyfrgelloedd, yn enwedig yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, lle nad oes gan bawb gyfrifiadur yn y tŷ?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gan y BBC ymgyrch *First Click*, sy'n ceisio sicrhau bod pobl yn cael cyfle i ddefnyddio'r rhyngwyd. Fel rhan o'r strategaeth 'Llyfrgelloedd am Oes', mae Llyfrgell Genedlaethol Cymru wedi bod yn symud ymlaen gyda gwasanaethau ar-lein er mwyn sicrhau mynediad am ddim at adnoddau fel papurau newydd a meddalwedd hanes teuluol i bobl ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch, Brif Weinidog, am eich atebion.

foderneiddio llyfrgelloedd.

**Darren Millar:** Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Rwyf yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad hwnnw mewn llyfrgelloedd oherwydd, wrth gwrs, mae llyfrgelloedd yn fy etholaeth i wedi elwa ohono. Serch hynny, mae llyfrgelloedd eraill yn fy etholaeth sydd, yn anffodus, o dan fygythiad oherwydd y penderfyniadau sy'n cael eu gwneud gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy, gan gynnwys llyfrgell Bae Cinnel ar arfordir y gogledd. Mae'r llyfrgell hon yn gysylltiedig â chanolfan gymuned leol. Os bydd y llyfrgell yn cau, bydd yn anodd i'r ganolfan gymuned aros ar agor. Pa ganllawiau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'u rhoi i awdurdodau lleol sy'n dymuno cau cyfleusterau yn y gymuned, megis llyfrgelloedd, a sut mae'r canllawiau hynny'n ymdrin â sefyllfa lle bydd cyfleuster megis canolfan gymuned yn yr un lleoliad â llyfrgell?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs, fe wyddoch am fframwaith safonau llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a disgwylwn i awdurdodau lleol lynu wrtho. Caf ar ddeall fod cyngor Conwy yn ystyried y mater yn awr.

**David Lloyd:** What is the latest on the roll-out of broadband and other free online services in libraries, particularly in our most disadvantaged areas, where not everyone has a computer at home?

**The First Minister:** The BBC has the First Click campaign, which ensures that everyone has the opportunity to use the internet. As part of the 'Libraries for Life' strategy, the National Library of Wales has moved forward with online library services in order to ensure free access to resources such as newspapers and family history software in all parts of Wales.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you to the First Minister for his answers.

## **Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement**

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** I have two changes to report to this week's planned Government business. The legislative statement on the Proposed Organ and Tissue Donation Legislative Competence Order has been deferred until tomorrow afternoon. In its place, Carl Sargeant, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government will be making a statement on the recent adverse weather. However, business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement announcements, which can be found among the agenda papers available to Members electronically.

**Nick Ramsay:** Happy new year, Minister. Yesterday saw the launch in the Assembly of the community pharmacies manifesto for the forthcoming Assembly elections. On the back of that very successful launch, which was attended by a cross-party group of Assembly Members, could we have a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on how she sees the Assembly Government implementing some of the recommendations of community pharmacists in Wales, in particular, with regard to building on the extremely good base that community pharmacies have in rural communities? Often, when other local services have gone, the local pharmacy is the one local service left to support people of all ages, particularly older people who find it less easy to travel further afield.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Nick, and a happy new year to you too. I also attended part of that launch—there were many other launches taking place—of the manifesto for the National Assembly for Wales elections. I attended a meeting organised by Community Pharmacy Wales before Christmas at which the Minister spoke, looking particularly at some of the issues that Jenny Randerson raised earlier, as did Veronica, I believe, about the waste of medicines. The issues that were raised in the manifesto are well within

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf ddau newid i sôn amdanynt yn y busnes sydd wedi'i gynllunio gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer yr wythnos hon. Mae'r datganiad deddfwriaethol am y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol Arfaethedig ynghylch Rhoi Organau a Meinweoedd wedi'i ohirio tan brynhawn yfory. Yn ei le, bydd Carl Sargeant, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn rhoi datganiad am y tywydd garw diweddar. Serch hynny, bydd y busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i gwelir yng nghyhoeddiadau'r datganiad busnes, sydd i'w gweld ymhlith papurau'r agenda ac mae'r rheini ar gael i'r Aelodau ar ffurf electronig.

**Nick Ramsay:** Blwyddyn newydd dda, Weinidog. Ddoe, lansiyd maniffesto'r fferyllfeydd cymuned yn y Cynulliad ar gyfer etholiadau'r Cynulliad sydd ar y gweill. Yn sgil y lansiad llwyddiannus iawn hwnnw, yr oedd grŵp trawsbleidiol o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn bresennol ynddo, a allem gael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynglŷn â sut mae'n gweld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi rhai o argymhellion fferyllfeydd cymunedol Cymru ar waith, yn enwedig, gyda golwg ar adeiladu ar y sylfaen eithriadol dda sydd gan fferyllfeydd cymunedol mewn cymunedau gwledig? Yn aml, pan fydd gwasanaethau lleol eraill wedi diflannu, y fferyllfa leol yw'r un gwasanaeth lleol sydd ar ôl i helpu pobl o bob oedran, yn enwedig y bobl hŷn hynny sy'n ei chael hi'n anos teithio ymhellach.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch Nick, a blwyddyn newydd dda i chithau hefyd. Roeddwn innau'n bresennol mewn rhan o'r lansiad hwnnw — Roedd llawer o ddigwyddiadau lansio eraill hefyd—sef lansio'r maniffesto ar gyfer etholiadau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Bŵm mewn cyfarfod a drefnwyd gan Fferylliaeth Gymunedol Cymru cyn y Nadolig lle bu'r Gweinidog yn siarad, gan edrych yn benodol ar rai o'r materion a godwyd gan Jenny Randerson gynna, a Veronica hefyd, mi gredaf, ynglŷn â

the Minister's sights in terms of policy.

**Val Lloyd:** I read with interest an article that you published last week in the *Western Mail*, particularly your comment that the use of ethics would play a leading role in balancing Wales's budget. I welcome this approach and I also agree that, when allocating budgets, it is important that our public services receive a fair share and that the most vulnerable in society are protected. Unfortunately, it seems that a similar view is not shared by the Westminster coalition Government. In fact, its view is quite the opposite. As you know, Minister, as part of the comprehensive spending review, the Westminster Government published in November 2010 a Green Paper on its intention to severely reduce eligibility to legal aid, which includes excluding cases relating to educational needs, debt disputes, housing issues and many others. Should this proposal ever become law it will be the most vulnerable that will be hit the hardest. It will create real hardship and deny many people access to specialised help. Would you consider allocating some Government time so that the Assembly can debate the implication of a reduction in legal aid eligibility on the people in Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** It was very important and I made it very clear that our draft budget was prepared with a clear focus on our hopes and aims for the people of Wales, and that it enabled us to reach principled, fair and sound decisions. We have been crystal clear about our responsibilities in aiming to protect the vulnerable as well as supporting the fragile economic recovery. The issues that have been raised more than once this afternoon about the changes and reductions in eligibility for legal aid are fundamentally important in how the Assembly, through our budgetary responsibilities, can act as a shield. I am sure that the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government will be considering this in terms of how we address these changes.

gwastraffu meddyginiaethau. Mae'r Gweinidog yn sicr yn ystyried y materion a godwyd yn y maniffesto o ran polisi.

**Val Lloyd:** Darllenais gyda diddordeb erthygl a gyhoeddwyd gennych yr wythnos diwethaf yn y *Western Mail*, yn enwedig eich sylw y byddai ystyriaethau moesegol yn elfen bwysig wrth dafoli cyllideb Cymru. Rwyf yn croesawu'r ffordd hon o fynd o'i chwmpas hi ac yn cytuno hefyd, wrth ddyrannu cyllidebau, ei bod yn bwysig i'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gael cyfran deg a bod y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas yn cael eu gwarchod. Yn anffodus, mae'n ymddangos nad yw Llywodraeth glymblaid San Steffan yn cytuno â'r farn honno. A dweud y gwir, mae ei barn hi'n gwbl groes i hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, fel rhan o'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth San Steffan Bapur Gwyrdd ym mis Tachwedd 2010 ynglŷn â'i bwriad o gyfyngu'n ddifrifol ar gymhwysedd i gael cymorth cyfreithiol. Mae hynny'n cynnwys eithrio achosion sy'n ymwneud ag anghenion addysgol, anghydfodau ynglŷn â dyled, problemau tai a llawer o bethau eraill. Os daw'r cynnig hwn yn gyfraith byth, y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed a gaiff eu taro galetaf. Bydd yn creu gwir galedi ac yn gwadu cymorth arbenigol i lawer o bobl. A fydddech yn ystyried neilltuo rhywfaint o amser y Llywodraeth i'r Cynulliad allu trafod goblygiad cyfyngu ar gymhwysedd ar gyfer cymorth cyfreithiol i bobl Cymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Roedd yn bwysig iawn ac fe'i gwneuthum yn glir iawn bod ein cyllideb ddrafft wedi'i pharatoi gan ganolbwyntio'n glir ar ein gobeithion a'n hamcanion ar gyfer pobl Cymru, a'i bod wedi ein galluogi i wneud penderfyniadau teg a chadarn ar sail egwyddorion. Rydym wedi bod yn gwbl glir ynglŷn â'n cyfrifoldebau o ran ceisio gwarchod y rhai sy'n agored i niwed yn ogystal â chynnal yr adferiad economaidd bregus. Mae'r materion sydd wedi'u codi fwy nag unwaith y prynhawn yma ynglŷn â'r newidiadau yn y trefniadau cymhwyso ar gyfer cymorth cyfreithiol a'u cyfyngu'n sylfaenol bwysig o ran sut mae'r Cynulliad, drwy ein cyfrifoldebau cyllidebol, yn gallu bod yn darian. Rwyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a

Llywodraeth Leol yn ystyried hyn o ran sut yr awn i'r afael â'r newidiadau hyn.

**Peter Black:** You may be aware, Minister, of press reports that the Welsh Housing Investment Trust is faltering and may not materialise. I understand that the Chartered Institute of Housing has expressed concerns about that. Is it possible to have a written statement from the Deputy Minister on Housing and Regeneration on progress on the Welsh Housing Investment Trust and its current status?

**Jane Hutt:** I know that the Deputy Minister, Jocelyn Davies, has communicated with Members—I think that Mark Isherwood raised this point before Christmas—to update them on developments with the Welsh Housing Investment Trust. It is an important development. As you might recall, housing trusts are very involved in that, as are major registered social landlords. Housing associations have taken the leading role, as has Community Housing Cymru. The update from Jocelyn Davies to Members is a useful account of our position in what I believe will be developed as one of the vehicles to lever in money for social housing. That is where I know that you would share that objective. We are also looking at the housing bond as another financial vehicle to achieve these purposes.

2.30 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** Happy new year to you, Jane. Thank you for the statement. I have a couple of requests, one of which relates to the rural affairs and agriculture portfolio and the position on Glastir, which continues to create concern throughout rural Wales. I wonder whether the Minister could come forward with an oral statement, ideally, or a written statement on the way ahead in relation to that. I think that, across the Chamber, there will be sympathy with the view that there needs to be some clarification about how that will pan out. The second one is a request for a debate on the Welsh-medium education strategy. Again, in common with many Members here, I am getting lobbied about concerns throughout different parts of Wales, most recently yesterday in southern Powys in the Brynderi area of Ystradgynlais. I

**Peter Black:** Efallai y gwyddoch, Weinidog, am adroddiadau yn y wasg bod Ymddiriedolaeth Buddsoddi Tai Cymru yn cloffi ac na fydd o reidrwydd yn digwydd. Caf ar ddeall fod y Sefydliad Tai Siartredig wedi mynegi pryderon ynglŷn â hynny. A oes modd cael datganiad ysgrifenedig gan y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai ac Adfywio ynglŷn ag Ymddiriedolaeth Buddsoddi Tai Cymru a'i statws presennol?

**Jane Hutt:** Gwn fod y Dirprwy Weinidog, Jocelyn Davies, wedi cyfathrebu â'r Aelodau—credaf fod Mark Isherwood wedi codi'r pwynt hwn cyn y Nadolig—i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf iddynt am ddatblygiadau gydag Ymddiriedolaeth Buddsoddi Tai Cymru. Mae'n ddatblygiad pwysig. Efallai y cofiwch fod ymddiriedolaethau tai yn ymwneud llawer â hynny, a'r landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig mawr hefyd. Mae cymdeithasau tai a Chartrefi Cymunedol Cymru wedi arwain yn hyn o beth. Mae'r diweddariad gan Jocelyn Davies i'r Aelodau'n fuddiol i egluro ein safbwynt, a chredaf y bydd hwnnw'n cael ei ddatblygu'n un cyfrwng i ddenu arian ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol. Gwn y byddech chithau'n rhannu'r amcan hwnnw. Rydym hefyd yn edrych ar y bond tai fel cyfrwng ariannol arall i gyflawni'r dibenion hyn.

**Nick Bourne:** Blwyddyn newydd dda ichi Jane. Diolch am y datganiad. Mae gennyf ddau gais. Mae a wnelo un ohonynt â'r portffolio materion gwledig ac amaethyddiaeth a'r sefyllfa gyda golwg ar Glastir, sy'n dal i boeni pobl ledled y Gymru wledig. Tybed a allai'r Gweinidog roi datganiad llafar inni, yn ddelfrydol, neu ddatganiad ysgrifenedig, ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen gyda golwg ar hynny. Credaf y bydd cydymdeimlad ar draws y Siambr â'r farn bod angen cael rhywfaint o eglurhad ynglŷn â sut y bydd pethau'n datblygu yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Cais yw'r ail am ddadl am y strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Eto, fel sy'n wir am lawer o'r Aelodau yma, rwyf yn cael fy lobio gan bobl sy'n poeni mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, a digwyddodd hynny fwyaf diweddar ddoe yn ne Powys, yn



appreciate that the Minister will have problems in saying anything about some of the particular issues, but will she comment in general on how this is being received throughout Wales and on some of the issues that exist in different parts of Wales with regard to ensuring that we are making proper provision for people who want to be educated through the medium of Welsh?

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you very much, and happy new year to you too, Nick. Progress has been made on the implementation of Glastir, and it is the implementation that is of concern. That concern varies across Wales in terms of the issues that have been raised. I know that the Minister for Rural Affairs is taking account of that and is engaging very closely with stakeholders. I am sure that she will be able to update us as we move forward into this new year. On your other point about the Welsh-medium education strategy, the reason why we have a new strategy—the first ever such strategy—is to enable and provide the framework and guidelines for the changes that will develop as local education authorities and their partners seek to deliver on the expectations. That, again, is work in progress.

**Kirsty Williams:** First, Minister, I support the request for a statement on the practical implementation of the Welsh-language education policy. The policy has been welcomed across parties and across Wales, but the value of that strategy lies not within the pages of the documentation, but in the implementation and in ensuring that those involved in delivering Welsh-medium education take on board the points within that strategy and make them a reality for local people.

Will you also ask the Minister for Rural Affairs to provide a written statement on the implications of sudden oak death for the Forestry Commission in Wales and for private landowners? Members will be aware that there has been a great deal of publicity around the large scale felling of trees to try to contain sudden oak death in the south west of England. Members may not be aware that

ardal Brynderi Ystradgynlais. Sylweddolaf y bydd yn anodd i'r Gweinidog ddweud dim am rai o'r materion penodol, ond a gawn sylw cyffredinol ganddo ynglŷn â sut mae pobl Cymru'n ymateb i hyn ledled Cymru ac am rai o'r problemau sy'n bodoli mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru o ran sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'n briodol ar gyfer pobl sy'n dymuno cael eu haddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg?

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr iawn i chi, a blwyddyn newydd dda i chithau hefyd, Nick. Mae cynnydd wedi'i wneud o ran rhoi Glastir ar waith a'r gweithredu hwnnw sy'n destun pryder. Mae'r pryder hwnnw'n amrywio o fan i fan yng Nghymru o ran y materion sydd wedi cael eu codi. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn ystyried hynny, a'i bod yn ymgysylltu'n glos iawn â rhanddeiliaid. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd yn gallu dweud wrthym beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf wrth inni gamu ymlaen i'r flwyddyn newydd hon. O ran eich pwynt arall am y strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg, y rheswm dros gael strategaeth newydd—y strategaeth gyntaf erioed o'i bath—yw er mwyn galluogi a darparu'r fframwaith a'r canllawiau ar gyfer y newidiadau a fydd yn datblygu wrth i awdurdodau addysg lleol a'u partneriaid geisio gwireddu'r disgwyliadau. Unwaith eto, mae hwnnw'n waith sydd ar y gweill

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn gyntaf, Brif Weinidog, Rwyf yn cefnogi'r cais am ddatganiad ynglŷn â'r ffordd y caiff y polisi addysg Cymraeg ei roi ar waith ar lefel ymarferol. Mae'r polisi wedi'i groesawu gan bob plaid a ledled Cymru, ond nid yn nhudalennau'r dogfennau y mae gwerth y strategaeth honno, ond yn y ffordd y caiff ei rhoi ar waith ac wrth sicrhau bod y rheini sy'n ymwneud â darparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn rhoi sylw i'r pwyntiau sydd yn y strategaeth honno ac yn eu gwireddu i bobl leol.

A wnewch hefyd ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig roi datganiad ysgrifenedig am y goblygiadau i'r Comisiwn Coedwigaeth yng Nghymru ac i berchnogion tir preifat yn sgil marwolaeth sydyn y deri? Bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod bod llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd wedi bod i dorri coed ar raddfa fawr er mwyn ceisio cadw marwolaeth sydyn y deri o dan reolaeth yn ne-orllewin

cases of sudden oak death first appeared in Wales back in May of last year in the Afan forestry and that the Government made available funds to private forestry owners to fell trees to try to contain the spread of this devastating disease, which could wipe out our forestry across Wales if we do not get ahead of it. Perhaps the Minister, given the recent publicity, would feel it appropriate to issue a statement on the action that she is taking to preserve Welsh forestry, both in public and private ownership.

**Jane Hutt:** On your first point, as I said in response to Nick, it is about the practical implementation and the operational details. The Minister's officials are working closely on that with local authorities, who must take the lead in delivering on this. However, if there are particular issues, you can raise those with the Minister, as I am sure that you will. On your second point, you have enlightened the Assembly about the impact of sudden oak death and how it might be affecting our forests, and I will certainly raise this with the Minister for Rural Affairs in terms of an update on the situation.

**William Graham:** On 9 November last year, I raised the issue of Welsh-based port businesses and the payment of domestic rates. Very kindly, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government wrote a very full letter to me on 22 November outlining the practicalities and realities of the matter. Since that time, unfortunately, matters have come to a head. You may be aware that summons have been issued, or are about to be issued, in Swansea for non-payment of rates. This is a very serious situation for port-based businesses throughout Wales. I think that we would join the Minister for Economic Development in regretting yesterday's decision on funds for the regeneration of Holyhead. This will affect not only Holyhead, but Mostyn, Swansea, Barry, Cardiff and Newport. We are at a substantial disadvantage compared to England, where port-based businesses will no longer pay

Lloegr. Efallai na fydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod bod achosion o farwolaeth sydyn y deri wedi ymddangos gyntaf yng Nghymru yn ôl ym mis Mai y llynedd yng nghoedwig Afan a bod y Llywodraeth wedi rhoi arian i berchnogion coedwigoedd er mwyn iddynt dorri coed i geisio cyfyngu ar ledaenu'r clefyd dinistriol hwn, a allai ddifetha ein coedwigoedd yn llwyr drwy Gymru, oni achubwn y blaen arno. Yn sgil y cyhoeddusrwydd diweddar, efallai y byddai'r Gweinidog yn ei hystyried yn briodol cyhoeddi datganiad am y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i ddiogelu coedwigoedd Cymru, y rhai sydd mewn perchnogaeth gyhoeddus a'r rhai sydd mewn perchnogaeth breifat.

**Jane Hutt:** O ran eich pwynt cyntaf, fel y dywedais wrth ymateb i Nick, mae a wnelo hyn â'r gweithredu ymarferol a'r manylion gweithredol. Mae swyddogion y Gweinidog yn cydweithio'n glos ar hynny gydag awdurdodau lleol, a rhaid iddynt hwy afael yn yr awenau er mwyn cyflawni hyn. Serch hynny, os oes materion penodol, gallwch godi'r rheini gyda'r Gweinidog, ac rwyf yn siŵr y gwnewch hynny. O ran eich ail bwynt, rydych wedi goleuo'r Cynulliad ynglŷn ag effaith marwolaeth sydyn y deri a sut y gall hynny fod yn effeithio ar ein coedwigoedd. Yn sicr, mi godaf hyn gyda'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig er mwyn cael gwybod beth yw'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf.

**William Graham:** Ar 9 Tachwedd y llynedd, codais fater busnesau mewn porthladdoedd yng Nghymru a thalu ardrethi domestig. Roedd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol mor garedig ag ysgrifennu llythyr llawn iawn ataf ar 22 Tachwedd yn egluro efennau ymarferol y broblem a realiti'r sefyllfa. Ers hynny, yn anffodus, mae pethau wedi mynd i'r pen. Efallai y gwyddoch fod gwysiau wedi'u codi, neu ar fin cael eu codi, yn Abertawe, ar bobl sydd heb dalu ardrethi. Mae hon yn sefyllfa ddifrifol iawn i fusnesau mewn porthladdoedd ledled Cymru. Credaf y byddem yn ymuno â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd wrth iddo resynu at y penderfyniad ddoe ynglŷn ag arian i adfywio Caergybi. Nid dim ond ar Gaergybi y bydd hyn yn effeithio, ond ar Fostyn, Abertawe, y Barri, Caerdydd a Chasnewydd. Rydym o dan anfantais sylweddol o'n cymharu â

rates. Businesses clearly will think most closely about where they can reallocate their businesses most advantageously. This is a serious matter and, although the Minister has given me the technical reply, how will we regenerate our ports if we are at a substantive disadvantage to businesses in England?

**Jane Hutt:** I know that the Minister has responded to you fully on this matter. The Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport is also taking an interest in this in terms of economic renewal, and the critical opportunities for ports across Wales for regeneration as part of regeneration strategies, and the support of small and medium-sized enterprises in economic development. We are looking at the impact of these issues. However, the Minister has responded fully with regard to the current position.

**Jenny Randerson:** I was pleased yesterday to hear the UK Government's announcement in relation to compensation payments for people who have suffered from tainted blood products and have contracted hepatitis C and HIV. You will know that, when you were Minister for Health and Social Services, I came to see you about this issue. Brian Gibbons will also know that I came to see him, when he was Minister for Health and Social Services, and I failed to make any progress. I am disappointed that there has not yet been an announcement in Wales. I urge you to persuade the current Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement—preferably an oral one, as was made in Parliament yesterday—so that we can explore this issue and see what she has planned for sufferers in Wales. I say this with great sadness, because I have campaigned over many years on this issue on behalf of two of my constituents, Haydn and Gareth Lewis, both of whom died last year; Gareth died just before Christmas. It is a tragic situation. Haydn left behind a wife who has also been infected. This is an important issue for those families, and those sufferers who remain.

Lloegr, lle na fydd busnesau mewn porthladdoedd yn talu ardrethi rhagor. Mae'n amlwg y bydd busnesau'n meddwl yn ofalus iawn ynglŷn ag i ble y gallant symud eu busnes er mwyn sicrhau'r fantais fwyaf. Mae hyn yn fater difrifol ac, er bod y Gweinidog wedi rhoi'r ateb technegol imi, sut y llwyddwn i adfywio ein porthladdoedd a ninnau o dan anfantais fawr o'n cymharu â busnesau yn Lloegr?

**Jane Hutt:** Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb yn llawn ichi ynglŷn â hyn. Mae gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth hefyd ddiddordeb yn hyn o safbwynt adnewyddu'r economi, a'r cyfleoedd hollbwysig i borthladdoedd ledled Cymru adfywio fel rhan o strategaethau adfywio, a'r cymorth a roddir i fentrau bach a chanolig ym maes datblygu economaidd. Rydym yn edrych effaith y pethau hyn. Serch hynny, mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymateb yn llawn ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa bresennol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Roeddwn yn falch ddoe o glywed cyhoeddiad Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ynglŷn ag iawndaliadau i bobl sydd wedi dioddef yn sgil cael cynhyrchion gwaed sydd wedi'u llygru ac sydd wedi dal hepatitis C ac HIV. Gwyddoch, pan oeddech chi'n Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, imi ddod i'ch gweld ynglŷn â hyn. Bydd Brian Gibbons hefyd yn gwybod imi ddod i'w weld yntau, pan oedd ef yn Weinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac na lwyddais i sicrhau dim cynnydd. Rwyf yn siomedig nad oes cyhoeddiad wedi bod yng Nghymru eto. Rwyf yn pwysu arnoch i ddwyn perswâd ar y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol presennol i roi datganiad—a gorau oll os datganiad llafar fydd hwnnw, fel y cafwyd yn y Senedd ddoe—er mwyn inni allu archwilio'r mater hwn a gweld beth mae wedi'i gynllunio ar gyfer dioddefwyr yng Nghymru. Dywedaf hyn gyda thristwch mawr, oherwydd imi ymgyrchu dros hyn am flynyddoedd lawer ar ran dau o'm hetholwyr, Haydn a Gareth Lewis. Bu farw'r ddau ohonynt y llynedd; bu farw Gareth ychydig cyn y Nadolig. Mae'n sefyllfa drasig. Gadawodd Haydn wraig sydd hefyd wedi'i heintio. Mae hyn yn fater o bwys i'r teuluoedd hynny, ac i'r dioddefwyr hynny

sydd ar ôl.

**Jane Hutt:** I think that we would all recognise the tragedy of this situation. I have been involved with you in meetings over the years, as have successor Ministers for Health and Social Services. It is the first opportunity that we have had to see the report. We will review its recommendations fully and the Minister for Health and Social Services will be making a statement in response to those recommendations.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I wish to thank the Government, and to endorse the points made by Jenny Randerson about the need for an oral statement regarding the Assembly Government's moral obligation to respond to how we will ensure that those people who have suffered because of contaminated blood will receive compensation. It is right that the Assembly Government is doing that, and I am pleased that the Minister for Health and Social Services will bring forward a statement.

My request also relates to the Minister for Health and Social Services. On 6 January, the Minister for health issued a letter to all Members regarding the implementation of the adult neurosciences review. In that letter, she said that the neurosurgery service is now fully integrated into the University of Wales Hospital site, which, as you know, is in my constituency. The letter also states that clinical staff have been transferred, and that new dedicated theatre facilities are fully operational. Since that letter was sent to Members, I have been informed that two of the neurosurgeons have not come, that a recently retired neurosurgeon is not to be replaced, that the new theatre is not yet functioning, that one of the two interventional neuro-radiologists who has left will not be replaced, and that, as a result of all this, much work is being transferred to Bristol.

2.40 p.m.

It is astonishing that the Assembly Government is being put in a position of issuing a letter that states that the service is now fully integrated, when there is

**Jane Hutt:** Credaf y byddem oll yn cydnabod trasiedi'r sefyllfa hon. Rwyf wedi bod yn ymwneud â chi mewn cyfarfodydd dros y blynyddoedd, fel y mae Gweinidogion olynol dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Dyma'r cyfle cyntaf inni ei gael i weld yr adroddiad. Byddwn yn adolygu ei argymhellion yn llawn a bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn rhoi datganiad i ymateb i'r argymhellion hynny.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Rwyf am ddiolch i'r Llywodraeth, a chadarnhau'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Jenny Randerson ynglŷn â bod angen datganiad llafar am ddyletswydd foesol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymateb, gan ddweud sut y byddwn yn sicrhau y caiff y bobl hynny sydd wedi dioddef yn sgil llygru eu gwaed iawndal. Mae'n iawn bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud hynny, ac rwyf yn falch y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyflwyno datganiad.

Mae a wnelo fy nghais innau hefyd â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Ar 6 Ionawr, anfonodd y Gweinidog dros iechyd llythyr at bob Aelod ynglŷn â gweithredu'r adolygiad ar niwrowyddorau i oedolion. Yn y llythyr hwnnw, dywedodd fod y gwasanaeth niwrolawfeddygaeth bellach wedi'i integreiddio'n llawn i safle Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru, sydd, fel y gwyddoch, yn fy etholaeth. Mae'r llythyr yn dweud hefyd fod staff clinigol wedi'u trosglwyddo, a bod cyfleusterau newydd y theatr arbennig ar waith yn llwyr. Rwyf wedi cael ar ddeall bod dau o'r niwrolawfeddygon heb ddod, nad oes neb yn mynd i gael ei benodi yn lle niwrolawfeddyg sydd wedi ymddeol yn ddiweddar, nad yw'r theatr newydd ar waith eto, na phenodir neb yn lle un o'r ddau niwroradiologydd ymyrrol sydd wedi gadael, ac, yn sgil hyn, bod llawer o'r gwaith yn cael ei drosglwyddo i Fryste.

Mae'n syfrdanol bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael ei rhoi mewn sefyllfa o gyhoeddi llythyr sy'n dweud bod y gwasanaeth bellach wedi'i integreiddio'n

information in the public domain that suggests that the service is not as the Minister suggests in her letter. I am not suggesting that the Minister for health has attempted to mislead Assembly Members in any way. However, there is a mismatch between what could well be the picture at University Hospital of Wales and what the Assembly Government might have been told. Therefore, it is appropriate that the Assembly Government, particularly the Minister for Health and Social Services, makes an oral statement so that we can explore whether or not this service is now operational at the University Hospital of Wales. We cannot afford to see our neurosurgery service falter in south Wales, because any falling apart of the neurosurgery service at Cardiff means that Bristol will benefit. There are further long-term consequences of any problems in the delivery of a neurosurgery service, so it is important that the Government makes an oral statement as soon as possible.

**Jane Hutt:** This is a matter of major change in terms of the implementation of the new neurosurgery service. The Minister has heard your contribution, and I am sure that she will seek to clarify the current position with Members and you.

**Darren Millar:** I ask for an urgent statement from the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing regarding access to Welsh inland waterways and rivers. You will be aware that there has been an increasing number of conflicts between canoeists and anglers on a number of rivers in north Wales, including the Llugwy, Conwy and Dee rivers. This in spite of the efforts of local angling associations and the Welsh Canoeing Association to reach voluntary agreements; unfortunately these are not being ratified as they are being frustrated by some of the local landowners. It would be good to know what action the Assembly Government intends to take, given that it has been pushing for voluntary arrangements to be put in place in those areas.

I also ask for a statement from the Deputy First Minister and the Minister for the Economy and Transport on the latest

llwyr, er ei bod yn wybodaeth gyhoeddus nad yw'r gwasanaeth yn gweithredu fel y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei awgrymu yn ei llythyr. Nid wyf yn awgrymu bod y Gweinidog dros iechyd wedi ceisio camarwain Aelodau'r Cynulliad mewn unrhyw ffordd. Serch hynny, mae gwahaniaeth i bob golwg rhwng y darlun tebygol yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru a'r hyn a ddywedwyd o bosibl wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, mae'n briodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn enwedig y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, roi datganiad llafar er mwyn inni gael gwybod a yw'r gwasanaeth hwn ar waith yn awr yn Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru. Ni allwn fforddio gweld ein gwasanaeth niwrolawfeddygaeth yn cloffi yn ne Cymru, oherwydd os bydd y gwasanaeth niwrolawfeddygaeth yng Nghaerdydd yn dadfeilio mewn unrhyw ffordd, Bryste fydd yn elwa. Bydd unrhyw broblemau o ran darparu gwasanaeth niwrolawfeddygaeth, yn golygu canlyniadau tymor hir eraill, felly mae'n bwysig i'r Llywodraeth roi datganiad llafar cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae hyn yn newid mawr o ran gweithredu'r gwasanaeth niwrolawfeddygaeth newydd. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi clywed eich cyfraniad, ac rwyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff geisio egluro'r sefyllfa bresennol i'r Aelodau ac i chithau.

**Darren Millar:** Gofynnaf am ddatganiad brys gan y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai ynglŷn â mynediad at ddyfrffyrdd mewndirol ac afonydd Cymru. Gwyddoch fod mwy a mwy o wrthdaro rhwng canŵyr a physgotwyr ar sawl afon yn y gogledd, gan gynnwys ar afon Llugwy, afon Conwy ac afon Dyfrdwy. Mae hyn er gwaethaf ymdrechion cymdeithasau pysgota lleol a Chymdeithas Canŵio Cymru i greu cytundebau gwirfoddol; yn anffodus, nid yw'r rhain yn cael eu cadarnhau oherwydd bod rhai o'r perchnogion tir lleol yn peri rhwystrau. Byddai'n dda cael gwybod pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu eu cymryd, a hithau wedi bod yn pwysu ar bobl i wneud trefniadau gwirfoddol yn yr ardaloedd hynny.

Gofynnaf hefyd am ddatganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ynglŷn â'r

situation with regard to Diamond Coach Holidays, following reports last week that the company had ceased trading, in order to establish what support the Assembly Government is making available to employees, suppliers, customers who have lost their deposits for holidays, and also the large number of sub-contracted coach companies that have worked with Diamond over many years.

**Jane Hutt:** The issue about local implementation goes back to operational issues at a local level, the real opportunities that Welsh waterways offer, and engagement with local groups such as the Welsh Canoeing Association. That is an issue where you can ensure that the Minister is aware of local difficulties, but it is for the local partners to deliver in terms of the new arrangements, not the Welsh Assembly Government.

Your second important point was about Diamond Coach Holidays. The administrators are in discussion with several possible buyers who may wish to take over this business as a going concern, and those discussions are ongoing.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Minister, I wish to ask for a couple of statements. First of all, I endorse Jenny Randerson's comments. When I was shadow healthspokeperson, when the initial package of compensation was announced a few years ago, I raised this issue with the Minister for health. The doubling of the lump sum that the Westminster Government announced yesterday, as well as increasing the annual payment, is greatly appreciated, but it still falls short of what is being offered in the Republic of Ireland. It will be interesting to see how the Welsh Assembly Government responds to the announcement yesterday, although welcome, with regard to a Welsh perspective, because, as we heard from Jenny Randerson, people across Wales need this money to help them to get on with their lives and to deal with something that was not within their control.

You will have heard my question to the First Minister about the aerospace park in St Athan. I am concerned about the issues that

sefyllfa ddiweddaraf gyda golwg ar Diamond Coach Holidays, yn dilyn adroddiadau yr wythnos diwethaf fod y cwmni wedi rhoi'r gorau i fasnachu, er mwyn gweld pa gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei darparu ar gyfer gweithwyr, cyflenwyr, cwsmeriaid sydd wedi colli eu blaendaliadau am wyliau, a hefyd y nifer fawr o gwmnïau bysiau sy'n cael eu hisgontractio ac sydd wedi gweithio gyda Diamond ers blynnyddoedd lawer.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae sut y rhoddir pethau ar waith yn lleol yn mynd yn ôl at faterion gweithredol ar lefel leol, y gwir gyfleoedd y mae dyfrffyrdd Cymru'n eu cynnig, ac ymgysylltu â grwpiau lleol megis Cymdeithas Canŵio Cymru. Gallwch sicrhau bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o anawsterau lleol yn y cyswllt hwnnw, ond gwaith y partneriaid lleol yw gwireddu'r trefniadau newydd, nid gwaith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Roedd a wnelo'ch ail bwynt pwysig â Diamond Coach Holidays. Mae'r gweinyddwyr wrthi'n trafod â sawl prynwr posibl a all fod yn dymuno ysgwyddo'r busnes hwn fel busnes byw, ac mae'r trafodaethau hynny'n mynd rhagddynt.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Weinidog, rwyf am ofyn am ddau ddatganiad. Yn gyntaf, rwyf yn ategu sylwadau Jenny Randerson. Pan oeddwn yn llefarydd iechyd cysgodol, ac y cyhoeddwyd y pecyn iawndaliadau cychwynnol ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, codais y mater hwn gyda'r Gweinidog dros iechyd. Gwerthfawrogir yn fawr ddyblu'r taliad unswm a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan ddoe, yn ogystal â chynyddu'r taliad blynyddol, ond mae'n brin o hyd o'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnig yng Ngweriniaeth Iwerddon. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb i'r cyhoeddiad ddoe, er ei fod i'w groesawu o safbwynt Cymru, oherwydd, fel y clywsom gan Jenny Randerson, mae angen yr arian hwn ar bobl drwy Gymru i'w helpu i fwrw ymlaen â'u bywydau ac i ymdopi â rhywbeth a oedd y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth.

Byddwch wedi clywed fy nghwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog am y parc awyrofod yn Sain Tathan. Rwyf yn poeni am y materion sy'n

are being raised regarding the aerospace park and the link to the defence training academy, and also the various planning inspectors' reports that relate to the northern access road. There is a whole host of issues surrounding this development, and a statement from the Deputy First Minister as to how the Welsh Assembly Government is progressing its side of the development in St Athan, given that it was an announcement in response to the loss of the Defence Aviation Repair Agency jobs, would be greatly appreciated by the local community in order to understand the way forward.

Will you also confirm that there will be an opportunity for a statement or debate on the regulations on the kennelling and keeping of dogs that the Minister for Rural Affairs is currently consulting upon? That consultation ends on Thursday, and, as I understand it, there is a tight window, as the Minister proposes to implement those regulations at some point in February. Is it the Government's intention to bring forward a statement or a debate so that Members can question the Minister on her response to the consultation before the regulations are tabled?

**Jane Hutt:** In relation to your important first point, there is a forthcoming statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on the review of those who have been infected by contaminated blood. I completely concur with you on your second point—we need an update on the St Athan situation from the UK Government. I understand that a response is due from the UK Government in March. I have had correspondence, which I am happy to share with you, from the UK Government Minister. The Deputy First Minister will also issue a statement on St Athan in relation to Welsh Assembly Government responsibilities. On the third point, the regulations on the kennelling of dogs will be handled in the usual way, as regulations always are.

cael eu codi ynglŷn â'r parc awyrofod a'r cysylltiad â'r academi hyfforddiant amddiffyn, a hefyd y gwahanol adroddiadau gan arolygwyr cynllunio sy'n ymwneud â ffordd fynedfa'r gogledd. Mae llw o ystyriaethau ynglŷn â'r datblygiad hwn. Byddai'r gymuned leol yn gwerthfawrogi datganiad yn fawr gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwrw ymlaen â'i hochr hithau o'r datblygiad yn Sain Tathan, er mwyn iddi ddeall beth fydd yn digwydd, a chofio mai cyhoeddiad i ymateb i golli swyddi'r Asiantaeth Atgyweirio Awyrennau Amddiffyn oedd hwnnw.

A wnewch gadarnhau hefyd y bydd cyfle inni gael datganiad neu ddadl ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau ar gyfer cynela a chadw cŵn y mae'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig yn ymgynghori yn eu cylch ar hyn o bryd? Daw'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw i ben ddydd Iau, ac, fel y caf ar ddeall, mae'r ffenestr yn un gyfyng, gan mai bwriad y Gweinidog yw rhoi'r rheoliadau hynny ar waith rywbryd ym mis Chwefror. Ai bwriad y Llywodraeth yw dwyn datganiad neu ddadl gerbron er mwyn i'r Aelodau allu holi'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb i'r ymgynghoriad cyn cyflwyno'r rheoliadau?

**Jane Hutt:** O ran eich pwynt pwysig cyntaf, mae datganiad ar y gweill gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynglŷn ag adolygu sefyllfa'r rheini sydd wedi cael eu heintio gan waed a oedd wedi'i lygru. Rwyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â chi ynglŷn â'ch ail bwynt—mae angen inni gael diweddariad am y sefyllfa yn Sain Tathan gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Rwyf yn deall bod ymateb i ddod gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ym mis Mawrth. Rwyf wedi cael gohebiaeth gan Weinidog Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a byddaf yn falch o'i rhannu â chi. Bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cyhoeddi datganiad am Sain Tathan hefyd yng nghyswllt cyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. O ran y trydydd pwynt, ymdrinnir â'r rheoliadau cynela cŵn yn y ffordd arferol, fel yr ymdrinnir bob amser â rheoliadau.

## **Datganiad am y Tywydd Garw Diweddar Statement on the Recent Adverse Weather**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I welcome the opportunity to update you on the response to the period of severe weather that we experienced in Wales prior to Christmas and to inform you of the preparations that have been put in place for the remainder of the winter. In late November and throughout December, we faced exceptional and challenging conditions. It was the coldest December for some considerable time, with average temperatures 4 to 5 degrees below the norm for the month, which led to extensive disruption on some occasions and added pressures on public services for the people of Wales. We have to pay tribute to those who worked tirelessly during that period to keep our main routes, networks and hospitals open and to deliver the essential services that we all require. Without their commitment and dedication, we would have faced far more significant disruption.

Before going into greater detail on specific aspects of the severe weather, I want to explain how the strategic response has been organised and managed. The First Minister asked me to be the lead Minister in the response to the severe winter weather, and I have represented the Assembly Government on the ministerial resilience committee chaired by the Secretary of State for Transport. That committee met on a regular basis throughout the Christmas period, and it will continue to meet in order to minimise disruption and keep Britain moving until the threat has passed. Officials have been convening civil contingencies group meetings with emergency services and other responder agencies to assess the impact on Wales and to co-ordinate the response accordingly. The group works closely with the strategic co-ordinating groups in the police force areas, which manage the response operationally at the local level and organise mutual aid, where required, between responder agencies to maintain critical services. The response structure is underpinned by a close working relationship with the Met Office, with the public weather service adviser for Wales

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Rwyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi am yr ymateb i'r cyfnod o dywydd garw difrifol a gawsom yng Nghymru cyn y Nadolig ac i roi gwybod ichi am y paratodau sydd ar waith ar gyfer gweddill y gaeaf. Ddiwedd mis Tachwedd a thrwy gydol mis Rhagfyr, wynebwyd amgylchiadau eithriadol a heriol. Dyma'r Rhagfyr oeraf ers cryn amser, gyda'r tymheredd ar gyfartaledd 4 neu 5 gradd yn is na'r norm ar gyfer y mis. Achosodd hynny darfu difrifol ar adegau a phwysau ychwanegol ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus i bobl Cymru. Rhaid inni roi teyrnged i'r rheini a fu'n gweithio'n ddiflino yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw i gadw ein priffyrdd, ein rhwydweithiau a'n hysbytai ar agor ac i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hanfodol y mae eu hangen arnom i gyd. Heb eu hymrwymiad a'u hymroddiad, byddem wedi wynebu tarfu mwy sylweddol o lawer.

Cyn manylu rhagor am agweddau penodol ar y tywydd garw, rwyf am esbonio sut y trefnwyd ac y rheolwyd yr ymateb strategol. Gofynnodd y Prif Weinidog imi fod yn Weinidog arwain o ran ymateb i dywydd garw'r gaeaf, ac rwyf wedi cynrychioli Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar bwyllgor cydnerthu'r gweinidogion o dan gadeiryddiaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth. Cyfarfu'r pwyllgor hwnnw'n rheolaidd drwy gydol cyfnod y Nadolig, a bydd yn dal i gyfarfod er mwyn sicrhau cyn lleied o darfu â phosibl ac er mwyn cadw pethau'n symud ym Mhrydain nes i'r bygythiad fynd heibio. Mae swyddogion wedi bod yn cynnull cyfarfodydd grŵp argyfyngau sifil posibl gyda'r gwasanaethau brys a'r asiantaethau ymateb eraill i bwysu a mesur yr effaith ar Gymru ac i gydlynu'r ymateb yn unol â hynny. Mae'r grŵp yn gweithio'n glos gyda'r grwpiau cydlynu strategol hynny yn ardaloedd yr heddluoedd sy'n rheoli'r ymateb yn weithredol ar y lefel leol. Mae hefyd yn trefnu cyd-gymorth, lle bydd gofyn, rhwng asiantaethau ymateb, er mwyn cynnal gwasanaethau hanfodol. Yn sail i'r strwythur



providing all agencies and groups with regular weather updates and warnings to allow appropriate response arrangements to be put in place.

The severe weather caused immediate and widespread disruption to the transport network, and significant work was required to keep the main road and rail routes open. Considerable interest was shown during this period in the level of salt stocks held by the Assembly Government and local authorities to keep the main roads open. Heavy snow and relentlessly low temperatures resulted in significant amounts of salt being used, which reduced stocks, despite conservation measures being implemented. Some local authorities reported that their stocks were substantially depleted. However, aid between authorities, additional conservation measures and the re-stocking of supplies from UK suppliers and imports helped to keep stock levels going. The Welsh Assembly Government was able to share some of its motorway and trunk road salt with local authorities according to need. We are working closely with the Welsh Local Government Association and salt suppliers to co-ordinate efforts in order to ensure that adequate salt supplies are available to meet future requirements. There are sufficient salt stocks within Wales, with further supplies scheduled.

On 1 December, I provided an additional £7 million for local authorities to spend on buying salt and mending potholes this winter. I stated that I wished to see particular priority given to the gritting of town and district shopping centres to minimise the impact on trade in the Christmas period and beyond. I have also asked for priority to be given to routes used by the elderly, such as to doctors' surgeries, and routes to schools. While it is for individual local authorities to decide on the gritting of local roads, it is fair to say that some responded better than others in keeping main routes open and safe for cars and pedestrians. I have asked my officials to conduct a review of each local authority's response so that lessons can be learned across

ymateb, ceir perthynas weithio glos â'r Swyddfa Dywydd, a bydd cynghorydd gwasanaeth tywydd cyhoeddus Cymru yn rhoi'r wybodaeth a'r rhybuddion diweddaraf am y tywydd yn rheolaidd i bob asiantaeth a grŵp er mwyn iddynt allu gwneud y trefniadau ymateb priodol.

Achosodd y tywydd garw darfu ar unwaith ar y rhwydwaith trafniadaeth a hynny ar raddfa eang. Roedd gofyn gwneud gwaith sylweddol i gadw'r priffyrdd a'r rheilffyrdd ar agor. Dangoswyd cryn ddiddordeb yn ystod y cyfnod hwn yn lefel y stociau halen a gedwid gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol i gadw'r priffyrdd ar agor. Yn sgil yr eira trwm a'r tymheredd isel didostur, defnyddiwyd symiau sylweddol o halen. Aeth y stociau'n llai er bod camau wedi'u rhoi ar waith i'w harbed. Dywedodd rhai awdurdodau lleol fod eu stociau wedi'u disbyddu'n sylweddol. Serch hynny, llwyddwyd i gynnal lefel y stoc wrth i awdurdodau gynorthwyo'i gilydd a chymryd camau i arbed halen ac ailstocio'u cyflenwadau gan gyflenwyr yn y Deyrnas Unedig a'u mewnforio. Llwyddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i rannu rhywfaint o halen ei thraffyrdd a'i phriffyrdd ag awdurdodau lleol yn ôl yr angen. Rydym yn gweithio'n glos gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a chyflenwyr halen i gydlynu ymdrechion er mwyn sicrhau bod digon o gyflenwadau halen ar gael i gyflawni'r gofynion yn y dyfodol. Mae digon o stociau halen yng Nghymru, a rhagor o gyflenwadau i ddod.

Ar 1 Rhagfyr, rhoddais £7 miliwn yn ychwanegol i awdurdodau lleol ei wario ar brynu halen a thrwsio tyllau yn y ffyrdd y gaeaf hwn. Dywedais fy mod am weld blaenoriaeth arbennig yn cael ei rhoi i raeau canolfannau siopa mewn trefi a chanolfannau rhanbarthol er mwyn sicrhau cyn lleied o darfu â phosibl ar fasnachu yn ystod cyfnod y Nadolig a'r tu hwnt. Rwyf hefyd wedi gofyn iddynt roi blaenoriaeth i lwybrau a ddefnyddir gan yr henoed, megis rhai at feddygfeydd, ac i lwybrau i'r ysgolion. Er mai gwaith awdurdodau lleol unigol yw penderfynu ynglŷn â graeanu ffyrdd lleol, mae'n deg dweud bod rhai wedi ymateb yn well nag eraill o ran cadw'r prif lwybrau ar agor ac yn ddiogel i geir a cherddwyr. Rwyf

Wales.

wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion gynnal adolygiad o ymateb pob awdurdod lleol er mwyn inni ddysgu gwersi ledled Cymru.

2.50 p.m.

The cold weather, with ice and snow, had a significant impact on the NHS. It caused an increase in trauma cases and we expect an increase in cases of heart attack, stroke and pneumonia. We know that a pattern of illness is associated with prolonged low temperatures. Disruption to the transport network affected the ability of ambulances to reach 999 calls, and the ability of the patient transport service to make discharge arrangements; transport of patients to routine outpatient appointments was also disrupted. However, the NHS had planned for such eventualities and generally coped well. At the same time, seasonal influenza hit the UK earlier than usual and appears more prevalent than in recent years, although the current rates remain lower than during the 2009 H1N1 pandemic, and much lower than the 1999-2000 seasonal flu outbreak. For the majority, the flu is mild, but for a small number of people with existing medical conditions, the symptoms can be more severe and lead to complications.

Cafodd y tywydd oer, a'r rhew a'r eira, effaith sylweddol ar y GIG. Achosodd gynnydd yn nifer yr achosion trawma ac rydym yn disgwyl gweld cynnydd yn nifer yr achosion o drawiadau ar y galon, strôc a niwmonia. Gwyddom fod patrwm o salwch sy'n gysylltiedig â thymheredd oer am gyfnod hir. Amharwyd ar allu ambiwlansiau i gyrraedd galwadau 999 yn sgil tarfu ar y rhwydwaith trafniadaeth, ac ar allu'r gwasanaeth cludo cleifion i drefnu i ryddhau pobl o'r ysbytai; amharwyd hefyd ar gludo cleifion i apwyntiadau cleifion allanol rheolaidd. Serch hynny, roedd y GIG wedi cynllunio ar gyfer sefyllfaoedd fel hyn ac ymdopwyd yn dda ar y cyfan. Ar yr un pryd, trawodd y fflw tymhorol y Deyrnas Unedig yn gynharach nag arfer a chafwyd mwy o achosion i bob golwg nag yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, er bod y cyfraddau presennol yn dal yn is nag yr oeddent yn ystod pandemig H1N1 2009, ac yn is o lawer na nifer achosion y fflw tymhorol a gafwyd yn 1999-2000. I'r rhan fwyaf, clefyd diniwed yw'r fflw, ond i nifer fach o bobl sydd eisoes yn dioddef o gyflyrau meddygol, gall y symptomau fod yn fwy difrifol, gan arwain at gymhlethdodau.

Difficult driving conditions severely affected the ability of domestic fuel suppliers across Wales to maintain deliveries, particularly to remote areas away from the main road network. As a consequence, considerable effort was made by the industry to address the backlog ahead of Christmas, with priority given to vulnerable customers and those running short on fuel.

Oherwydd yr amgylchiadau gyrru anodd, tarfwyd yn ddifrifol ar allu cyflenwyr tanwydd domestig ledled Cymru i ddanfôn eu cyflenwadau, yn enwedig i ardaloedd pellennig oddi ar rwydwaith y priffyrdd. Yn sgil hynny, gwnaeth y diwydiant ymdrech sylweddol i wneud iawn am y trafferthion cyn y Nadolig, gan roi'r flaenoriaeth i gwsmeriaid agored i niwed a'r rheini a oedd yn mynd yn brin o danwydd.

The severe weather also led to a high forecast demand for gas. As a result, the National Grid had to issue a gas balancing alert to provide a signal to the market to bring in additional supplies and reduce demand from large users on interruptible contracts. Distribution network operators in Wales managed to maintain continuity of supply over this period by implementing their full emergency contingency plans.

Arweiniodd y tywydd garw hefyd at ragolygon y byddai galw mawr am nwy. Felly, bu'n rhaid i'r Grid Cenedlaethol gyhoeddi rhybudd cydbwysio nwy er mwyn rhoi arwydd i'r farchnad bod angen darparu cyflenwadau ychwanegol a lleihau'r galw gan ddefnyddwyr mawr sydd ar gontractau tarfady. Llwyddodd gweithredwyr y rhwydwaith dosbarthu yng Nghymru i gynnal cyflenwad di-dor dros y cyfnod hwn drwy roi eu cynlluniau argyfwng llawn ar waith.

Water companies experienced an unprecedented level of burst pipes during the thaw, but their services were restored to normal within four to five days. They are confident that the usual standards will be maintained throughout the remainder of the winter period.

The Welsh Assembly Government has been in contact with a number of business representatives across Wales to discuss the impact of the weather on business. We have taken on board their concerns, and will maintain this close contact, doing everything within our power to help companies that are trying to operate in these difficult conditions.

As for future planning for the winter, we will continue to monitor the position and prepare to activate the response structure at the earliest possible moment should further adverse weather be forecast. Salt stock levels will continue to be monitored, with further supplies being procured as necessary. Pressures on public services will be monitored and managed. We have not seen the last of the severe weather this winter, so we must be prepared.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I start by thanking the Minister for the statement. I am pleased that he has taken the opportunity this afternoon to respond to the way that we coped with the recent adverse weather conditions. It is appropriate that we examine how well we fared and what needs to be done in preparation for the next couple of months, and for the next few years. I join him in paying tribute to those who have worked so hard to keep our road network and our villages as clear as possible. The commitment of public servants working in local authorities in particular has been second to none. We admire their dedication and thank them for their commitment. I am sure he would also want to join me in paying tribute to the large numbers of residents who got together to keep their pavements, roads and, in some cases, villages clear where local authorities were struggling to get through. This is a great example of people pulling together to support their neighbours, families and communities. I know that, throughout Wales, there have been

Gwelodd y cwmnïau dŵr fwy o bibellau wedi'u torri nag erioed o'r blaen yn ystod y dadmer, ond llwyddwyd i adfer eu gwasanaethau i'r lefel arferol o fewn pedwar neu bum niwrnod. Maent yn hyderus y llwyddir i gynnal y safonau arferol drwy gydol gweddill cyfnod y gaeaf.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â nifer o gynrychiolwyr busnesau ledled Cymru i drafod effaith y tywydd ar fyd busnes. Rydym wedi rhoi sylw i'w pryderon a byddwn yn dal i gysylltu'n glos â hwy, gan wneud popeth yn ein gallu i helpu cwmnïau sy'n ceisio gweithredu o dan yr amgylchiadau anodd hyn.

O ran cynllunio ar gyfer y gaeaf yn y dyfodol, byddwn yn dal i fonitro'r sefyllfa ac yn paratoi i sbarduno'r strwythur ymateb cyn gynted byth ag y bo modd os bydd rhagolygon ar gyfer rhagor o dywydd garw. Byddwn yn dal i gadw golwg ar lefelau'r stociau halen, gan brynu rhagor o gyflenwadau yn ôl y gofyn. Bydd y pwysau ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cael eu monitro a'u rheoli. Nid ydym wedi gweld diwedd y tywydd garw'r gaeaf hwn, felly rhaid inni fod yn barod.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad. Rwyf yn falch iddo achub ar y cyfle y prynhawn yma i ymateb i'r ffordd yr ymdopwyd â'r tywydd garw diweddar. Mae'n briodol inni ystyried sut y gwnaethom a beth y mae angen ei wneud i baratoi ar gyfer yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf a'r ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Rwyf ffinau hefyd am roi teyrnged i'r rheini sydd wedi gweithio mor galed i gadw ein rhwydwaith ffyrdd a'n pentrefi mor glir ag y bo modd. Mae ymrwymiad gweision cyhoeddus sy'n gweithio mewn awdurdodau lleol yn benodol wedi bod heb ei ail. Rydym yn edmygu eu hymroddiad ac yn diolch iddynt am eu hymrwymiad. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai yntau hefyd am roi teyrnged i'r nifer fawr o drigolion a ddaeth at ei gilydd i gadw'u palmentydd, eu ffyrdd ac mewn ambell enghraifft, eu pentrefi, yn glir lle'r oedd awdurdodau lleol yn straffaglu i gyrraedd. Dyma enghraifft wych o bobl yn cyd-dynnu i fod yn gefn i'w cymdogion, i'w teuluoedd ac i'w cymunedau. Gwn am

some terrific examples of villages and individuals pulling together to do what they can.

The Minister said in his statement that Wales has sufficient salt stocks, with further supplies scheduled. Could the Minister outline when those further supplies will be forthcoming and how local authorities have been able to spend the £7 million that he allocated in December? We need assurances—and we need in turn to provide them to the people of Wales—that salt stocks will be maintained at a high level and that if supplies are forthcoming, we can set out some timescales as to when we will benefit from them.

I welcome the fact that the Minister is conducting a review of the response of each local authority, so that we can learn from the lessons of what happened before and during the Christmas period. In addition, I ask him to consider whether we could ask local authorities to start outlining the sort of damage that has been done during the long freeze, because I noticed, travelling around my constituency over the weekend, significant damage, in particular to the road network. We are not just talking about a couple of bumps in the road, but significant potholes that will potentially get worse during the next two months of winter. We could have more snow; this is certainly not the end of the difficulties. We need to know from local authorities the extent to which they think the damage can be addressed, what the costs are likely to be and whether or not there is something that the Assembly Government can do to help local authorities in those difficult positions.

I ask the Minister to outline to the Assembly how successful the Assembly Government has been in ensuring that the two main salt barns in Wales—one in the north and the other in the south—have been filled. They Deputy First Minister told the leader of the opposition in reply to a written question in December that the two salt barns would be filled in early January. It is important for the Assembly to know whether or not that has happened. The Deputy First Minister also said that the indication from the Welsh Local Government Association was that there are

enghreiffitiau gwyach, ledled Cymru, o bentrefi ac unigolion yn cyd-dynnu i wneud yr hyn a allant.

Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei ddatganiad fod gan Gymru ddigon o stociau halen a bod mwy o gyflenwadau ar y ffordd. A allai'r Gweinidog ddweud pa bryd y daw'r cyflenwadau ychwanegol hynny a sut mae awdurdodau lleol wedi gallu gwario'r £7 miliwn a ddyrannwyd ganddo ym mis Rhagfyr? Mae angen inni gael sicrwydd—ac mae angen i ninnau, yn ein tro, sicrhau pobl Cymru—y cedwir digon o stociau halen ac os oes cyflenwadau ar y ffordd, mae angen inni allu dweud pa bryd y byddwn yn elwa ohonynt.

Rwyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn adolygu ymateb pob awdurdod lleol, er mwyn inni ddysgu yn sgil y gwersi a ddysgwyd cyn ac ar ôl cyfnod y Nadolig. At hynny, gofynnaf iddo ystyried a allem ofyn i awdurdodau lleol ddechrau rhestru'r math o ddifrod sydd wedi'i wneud yn ystod y cyfnod hir y rhew, oherwydd sylwais, wrth deithio o gwmpas fy etholaeth dros y penwythnos, ar ddifrod sylweddol, yn enwedig i rwydwaith y ffordd. Nid sôn yr ydym am ambell dolc yn y ffordd, ond am dyllau sylweddol a fydd o bosibl yn gwaethygu yn ystod dau fis nesaf y gaeaf. Gallem gael rhagor o eira; yn sicr, nid dyma ddiwedd yr anawsterau. Mae angen inni gael gwybod gan awdurdodau lleol i ba raddau y maent yn meddwl y gellir mynd i'r afael â'r difrod, beth fydd y costau tebygol ac a oes rhywbeth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i helpu awdurdodau lleol yn y sefyllfaoedd anodd hynny.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ddweud wrth y Cynulliad pa mor llwyddiannus y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod o ran sicrhau bod y ddwy brif ysgubor halen yng Nghymru—y naill yn y gogledd a'r llall yn y de—wedi'u llenwi. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wrth arweinydd yr wrthblaid, wrth ymateb i gwestiwn ysgrifenedig ym mis Rhagfyr, y byddai'r ddwy ysgubor halen yn cael eu llenwi'n gynnar ym mis Ionawr. Mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad gael gwybod a yw hynny wedi digwydd neu beidio. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog hefyd mai'r

currently sufficient salt stock supplies in Wales to ensure that we could provide in excess of the recommended 12 days' resilience. I want further confirmation that that is the case, because I know that some local authorities in December—Cardiff being one of them—were saying that they were running out of salt quite quickly. It is therefore important to know whether we have the ability to maintain that 12 days' resilience as we go through the winter.

My final question to the Minister is about the guidance that he issues to local authorities and the work that he is doing with other Government departments in particular. I know that during particular pressures, such as what was seen over a year ago, some local authorities, including the capital city, were going into school buildings and removing salt supplies in order to keep the roads open. Some schools found it difficult to remain open and, as a consequence, the Minister then issued further guidance and notes to local authorities on the need to keep our schools open. However, it is difficult to keep a school open if it loses its salt supply. What lessons have been learned with regard to keeping schools open, not just in this period, but from over a year ago, too, when some local authorities struggled to keep their roads open, a result of which was that schools closed because their grit was being taken away?

I think that we have fared slightly better this year than over a year ago, but we need to ensure better planning to ensure that the salt supply in Wales will help us to cope with the next two months, and to put us in a better position to respond to those winter pressures 12 months from now.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Jonathan, for your questions. I agree that many acts of goodwill were performed by members of the public. That tends to happen when we find ourselves against the wall and we see many people gang together to get each other through. Therefore, I pay tribute and give my thanks to those individuals who were out

awgrym gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru oedd bod digon o gyflenwadau halen ar gael yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau y gallem wrthsefyll mwy na'r 12 diwrnod a argymhellir. Rwyf am gael cadarnhad mai felly y mae, oherwydd gwn fod rhai awdurdodau lleol ym mis Rhagfyr—Caerdydd yn un—yn dweud bod yr halen yn dirwyn i ben yn eithaf cyflym. Mae'n bwysig gwybod felly a allwn wrthsefyll y 12 diwrnod hynny wrth inni fynd drwy'r gaeaf.

Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn olaf i'r Gweinidog â'r canllawiau y mae'n eu rhoi i awdurdodau lleol a'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud gydag adrannau eraill y Llywodraeth yn benodol. Gwn, yn ystod cyfnodau penodol o bwysau, fel yr hyn a welwyd dros flwyddyn yn ôl, fod rhai awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys y brifddinas, yn mynd i mewn i adeiladau ysgolion ac yn mynd â chyflenwadau halen oddi yno er mwyn cadw'r ffyrdd ar agor. Golygai hyn fod rhai ysgolion wedi'i chael hi'n anodd aros ar agor. Yn sgil hynny, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog ragor o ganllawiau a nodiadau i awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â bod angen cadw ein hysgolion ar agor. Serch hynny, mae'n anodd cadw ysgol ar agor os bydd yn colli ei chyflenwad halen. Pa wersi sydd wedi'u dysgu gyda golwg ar gadw ysgolion ar agor, nid dim ond yn y cyfnod hwn, ond yn sgil yr hyn a ddigwyddodd dros flwyddyn yn ôl hefyd, pan oedd rhai awdurdodau lleol yn straffaglu i gadw'u ffyrdd ar agor? Canlyniad hynny oedd bod ysgolion yn cau oherwydd bod eu graean yn cael ei gymryd oddi arnynt.

Credaf inni wneud ychydig yn well eleni nag a wnaethom dros flwyddyn yn ôl, ond mae angen inni sicrhau gwell cynllunio er mwyn sicrhau bod y cyflenwad halen yng Nghymru'n help inni ymdopi'n well â'r ddau fis nesaf, er mwyn inni fod mewn gwell sefyllfa i ymateb i bwysau'r gaeaf ymhen 12 mis.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch ichi am eich cwestiynau Jonathan. Rwyf yn cytuno bod aelodau'r cyhoedd wedi dangos llawer o ewyllys da. Mae hynny'n tueddu i ddigwydd pan fyddwn yn ein cael ein hunain mewn trafferthion a byddwn yn gweld llawer o bobl yn dod at ei gilydd i fwrw'r maen i'r wal. Felly, rhoddaf deyrnged a diolch i'r unigolion

shovelling snow from footpaths around pensioner accommodation and so on, which happened right across Wales.

We found ourselves in a situation of having heavy snowfall very early on, along with adverse temperatures. I had a conference call yesterday with the resilience committee—with the Secretary of State for Transport and the Minister in Scotland, John Swinney. They said that, right across the UK, we have had temperatures that had never been seen before. In Scotland, they were expecting -18 last night. These are temperatures that we hear about elsewhere, but we do not expect them in the UK. That has meant that the difficult challenge of removing the snow has been made even more difficult, because grit does not work below -9 degrees. That is the sort of problem that we were facing across the UK.

3.00 p.m.

On capacity, not one authority in Wales, nor the Welsh Assembly Government, ran out of salt during that period. There was a lot of media coverage about some authorities running low on salt, but we were running a mutual aid programme involving local authorities and the Welsh Assembly Government, whereby we were helping those authorities that were under pressure, particularly on the west coast, where there was a significant need for more salt. If they were in need, we helped them. The WLGA collated information on that and shared it. Therefore, no authority ran out of salt.

On the position regarding re-stocking, Jonathan, I understand that just under 12,000 tonnes of salt for unitary authorities was received last week, and we await another 35,000 tonnes, which will be received at the end of January or in early February—the exact date is still to be confirmed. I can let you know the details when we know them.

The importance of the daily meetings of the UK resilience committee related to the provision of mutual aid. I know that we were better placed than Scotland and England

hynny a oedd yn rhofio eira oddi ar lwybrau o gwmpas cartrefi pensiynwyr ac ati. Digwyddodd hynny ym mhob cwr o Gymru.

Cawsom ein hunain mewn sefyllfa lle'r oedd yr eira'n disgyn yn drwm yn gynnar iawn, ynghyd â thymheredd isel. Cefais gynhadledd ffôn ddoe gyda'r pwyllgor cydnerthu—gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Drafnidiaeth a'r Gweinidog yn yr Alban, John Swinney. Dywedasant fod y tymheredd ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig wedi bod yn is nag yr oeddent wedi'i weld erioed. Yn yr Alban, roeddent yn disgwyl -18 neithiwr. Dyma'r math o dymheredd y byddwn yn clywed amdano mewn mannau eraill, ond nad ydym yn disgwyl ei weld yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hynny wedi golygu ei bod hi'n anos byth cael gwared ar yr eira oherwydd nad yw graean yn gweithio ar dymheredd is na -9 gradd. Dyna'r math o broblem yr oeddem yn ei hwynebu ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

O ran capasiti, ni wnaeth halen yr un awdurdod yng Nghymru, na halen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ddirwyn i ben yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Roedd cryn sylw ar y cyfryngau i'r ffaith bod halen rhai awdurdodau'n prinhaus, ond roedd gennym raglen gyd-gymorth ar waith a oedd yn cynnwys awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, lle'r oeddem yn helpu'r awdurdodau hynny a oedd o dan bwysau, yn enwedig ar hyd arfordir y gorllewin, lle'r oedd tipyn mwy o alw am halen. Os oedd angen cymorth arnynt, fe'i rhoesom iddynt. Casglwyd gwybodaeth am hynny gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ac fe'i rhannwyd. Felly, ni ddaeth cyflenwad halen yr un awdurdod i ben.

O ran ailstocio, Jonathan, caf ar ddeall fod ychydig yn llai na 12,000 tonnall o halen wedi cyrraedd ar gyfer yr awdurdodau unedol yr wythnos diwethaf, ac rydym yn disgwyl 35,000 tonnall arall ddiwedd Ionawr neu ddechrau mis Chwefror—ni chafwyd cadarnhad ynglŷn â'r union ddyddiad eto. Gallaf roi'r manylion ichi pan glywn ni.

Roedd cyfarfodydd dyddiol pwyllgor cyfnerthu'r Deyrnas Unedig yn bwysig o ran darparu cydgymorth. Gwn ein bod mewn gwell sefyllfa na'r Alban a Lloegr oherwydd

because of our good fortune in not being as adversely affected by the weather as some areas. All areas were standing ready to help out other areas and devolved nations, should that help be required.

On the £7 million, it was about good planning, but there may have been an element of luck involved, because, two weeks before the bad weather, I announced that that money would be given to local authorities for salt or to deal with potholes. I do not micro-manage local authorities; that is not my job. They have a duty of care and it is their duty to salt and make their road networks safe. Through our review, which aims to understand what went wrong and what went well and learn from best practice, I will look at the additional money that they have used for salting and at their risks, for example in relation to the increased number of potholes that have been found in their communities.

In relation to schools, I issued direction in connection with the additional £7 million regarding the gritting of at-risk areas, for example around doctors' surgeries, pedestrian areas and community centres, and regarding the fact that preference should be given to areas around schools, so that children and parents could get to the school safely. I know that the Minister for education has issued guidance to local education authorities recently on dealing with severe snowfall.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Obviously, in such extreme weather conditions, not everyone can get everything right, and there were great difficulties. However, in Cardiff particularly, the snow-clearing plan was uncoordinated. Those are not my words, but those of the executive member. I know that it is up to local authorities to deal with their own problems, but the leader of Cardiff Council is calling for a review, because he is concerned at the way in which the whole operation was managed. For instance, major perimeter roads were not cleared, making it difficult for people to get to work, and the economy suffered and so on. Will you review the use of that extra £7 million that you have provided to local authorities, so that you are assured that we are all getting value for

buom yn ddigon ffodus nad effeithiodd y tywydd arnom gynddrwg ag yr effeithiodd ar rai ardaloedd. Roedd pob ardal yn barod i helpu ardaloedd a gwledydd datganoledig eraill, petai angen y cymorth hwnnw.

O ran y £7 miliwn, mater o gynllunio da oedd hynny, ond efallai fod rhywfaint o lwc yn rhan o'r peth hefyd, oherwydd, bythefnos cyn i'r tywydd garw ddechrau, cyhoeddais y rhoddid yr arian hwnnw i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer halen neu i drwsio tyllau yn y ffyrdd. Ni fyddaf yn microeoli awdurdodau lleol; nid fy ngwaith i yw hynny. Mae ganddynt ddyletswydd gofal a'u ddyletswydd hwy yw halltu rhwydweithiau eu ffyrdd a'u gwneud yn ddiogel. Drwy ein hadolygiad, sy'n ceisio deall yr hyn a aeth o'i le a'r hyn a aeth yn dda a dysgu yn sgil yr arferion gorau, byddaf yn edrych ar yr arian ychwanegol y maent wedi'i ddefnyddio ar gyfer yr halltu ac ar eu risgiau, er enghraifft, o ran y nifer fwy o dyllau sydd i'w gweld ar ffyrdd eu cymunedau.

O ran ysgolion, cyhoeddais gyfarwyddyd yn gysylltiedig â'r £7 miliwn ychwanegol gyda golwg ar raeau ardaloedd risg, er enghraifft o gwmpas meddygfeydd teulu, ardaloedd i gerddwyr a chanolfannau cymuned, ac ynglŷn â'r ffaith y dylid blaenoriaethu ardaloedd o gwmpas ysgolion, er mwyn i blant a rhieni allu cyrraedd yr ysgol yn ddiogel. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros addysg wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau i awdurdodau addysg lleol yn ddiweddar ynglŷn ag ymdrin ag eira difrifol.

**Lorraine Barret:** Mae'n amlwg, pan fydd y tywydd mor eithafol o arw â hyn, na all pawb wneud popeth yn iawn, ac roedd anawsterau mawr. Serch hynny, yng Nghaerdydd yn benodol, nid oedd y cynllun ar gyfer clirio'r eira wedi'i gydlynu. Nid fy ngeiriau i yw'r rheini, ond geiriau'r aelod gweithredol. Gwn mai gwaith yr awdurdodau lleol yw ymdrin â'u problemau hwy eu hunain, ond mae arweinydd Cyngor Caerdydd yn galw am adolygiad oherwydd ei fod yn poeni am y ffordd y rheolwyd y gwaith drwyddo draw. Er enghraifft, ni chafodd ffyrdd mawr sy'n cylchu'r ddinas eu clirio, gan ei gwneud yn anodd i bobl gyrraedd eu gwaith, ac fe ddioddefodd yr economi ac ati. A wnewch adolygu sut y defnyddiwyd y £7 miliwn ychwanegol hwnnw a roesoch i awdurdodau

money? There is no use in ploughing—if you will excuse the pun—more and more money in, if it is not being used to the best advantage. It should be used not just for safety, which is obviously paramount, but in order to keep as much of the economy going as we can.

**Carl Sargeant:** It is incredibly important that we plan for difficult times and difficult weather. I am concerned that some local authorities seem to be able to deal with that better than others, and I have heard the issues that you have brought forward today regarding Cardiff. As I said, no authority, including Cardiff Council, ran out of salt; the issue was the way in which it was used and their programmes of attack as to how their vehicles and personnel dealt with these issues. Cardiff received £677,000 of the £7 million, which is more than any other local authority in Wales. I will ask my officials to consider fully the consequences of all actions taken by all authorities to identify how we can improve. People expect to be able to get the essentials and operate within their community despite the snow. We have to learn from these experiences.

**Veronica German:** Thank you, Minister, for your statement. I would also like to pay tribute to those who worked so hard. I heard about ambulance personnel driving their new four-by-four vehicles who were relentless in their work; they just did not stop. Many others also volunteered to get people to places of work because they could not otherwise get there. I know of people who were transporting staff to nursing homes and other such places in order for them to carry on with their caring roles.

In October, we had a Welsh Liberal Democrat debate on winter pressures, during which you told us that every agency in Wales had learned from the experience of last year and that seasonal pressure action plans were to be developed by local health boards and the ambulance service. Are you satisfied that lessons have been learned and that what has been learned has been put into practice

lleol, er mwyn ichi fod yn dawel eich meddwl ein bod i gyd yn cael gwerth am ein harian? Ni thâl hi ddim lluchio mwy a mwy o arian at y broblem, os nad yw'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei defnyddio er y budd gorau. Ni ddylid ei ddefnyddio er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch yn unig, er mai hynny sydd bwysicaf wrth gwrs, ond er mwyn cadw cymaint o'r economi'n troi ag y gallwn ni.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'n anhygoel o bwysig inni gynllunio ar gyfer adegau anodd a thywydd anodd. Rwyf yn poeni bod rhai awdurdodau lleol i bob golwg yn gallu delio â hynny'n well nag eraill, ac rwyf wedi clywed am y materion yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt heddiw yng nghyswllt Caerdydd. Fel y dywedais, ni wnaeth halen yr un awdurdod, gan gynnwys halen Cyngor Caerdydd, ddirwyn i ben; y broblem oedd sut y cafodd yr halen ei ddefnyddio a sut yr aeth eu cerbydau a'u gweithwyr ati i fynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn. Cafodd Caerdydd £677,000 o'r £7 miliwn, sy'n fwy nag a gafodd yr un awdurdod lleol arall yng Nghymru. Gofynnaf i'm swyddogion ystyried yn llawn ganlyniadau'r holl gamau a gymerwyd gan bob awdurdod i weld sut y gallwn wella. Mae pobl yn disgwyl gallu cael yr hanfodion a gallu gweithredu o fewn eu cymuned, er gwaethaf yr eira. Rhaid inni ddysgu yn sgil y profiadau hyn.

**Veronica German:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich datganiad. Hoffwn innau roi teyrnged i'r rheini a fu'n gweithio mor galed. Clywais am weithwyr ambiwlans a fu'n gweithio'n ddiflino'n gyrru eu cerbydau gyriant pedair olwyn newydd; buont wrthi'n ddi-baid. Bu llawer o rai eraill yn gwirfoddoli hefyd i fynd â phobl i'w manau gwaith oherwydd na allent gyrraedd fel arall. Gwn am bobl a oedd yn cludo staff i gartrefi nyrsio ac i fannau tebyg eraill er mwyn iddynt gyflawni eu gwaith gofalu.

Ym mis Hydref, cawsom ddadl gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ynglŷn â phwysau'r gaeaf. Bryd hynny, dywedasoeh wrthym fod pob asiantaeth yng Nghymru wedi dysgu yn sgil profiadau'r llynedd a bod byrddau iechyd lleol a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn mynd i ddatblygu cynlluniau gweithredu o dan bwysau tymhorol. A ydych yn fodlon bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu a bod yr



during this particular episode of bad weather? Are you also content that the action plans have been developed sufficiently and are robust enough in order to deal with such conditions? I understand that the weather was exceptional and that it coincided with the holidays, but we know when Christmas falls and we know that there could be bad weather. Is it therefore acceptable that the University Hospital of Wales in Cardiff was effectively cut off for a number of hours because of the adverse conditions? We expect that things will not work as they usually do, but is that acceptable?

You said that the response of some local authorities was better than others in keeping main routes open and that you will review their responses. At the same time, will you also review the response of the Welsh Assembly Government in relation to the road network that it is responsible for? It would be useful to be able to compare how that network worked.

You mentioned briefly the fact that influenza has hit earlier this year. We pointed out in October that there had been a poor response by at-risk groups, with less than 50 per cent taking up the influenza vaccine. I know that you have not specifically mentioned this, but we are now seeing stories in the media about there being a shortage of vaccines and questions are being asked about whether pharmacists should be allowed to sell the vaccine. Would it be sensible to take steps to ensure that, next year, those at risk are encouraged even more than usual to take up the offer of a vaccine much earlier in the winter to stop the rush that is happening now and to prevent stocks from running out?

Finally, I agree that we may not have seen the last of the severe weather this winter, so can you point to anything specific that we have learned from what happened just before Christmas that will enable local authorities and the Government to deal with any further adverse conditions that we may face in the next couple of months in a better way than the one that we might have used otherwise?

hyn a ddysgwyd wedi'i roi ar waith yn ystod y cyfnod tywydd garw penodol hwn? A ydych yn fodlon hefyd fod y cynlluniau gweithredu wedi'u datblygu'n ddigonol a'u bod yn ddigon cadarn i ymdopi ag amgylchiadau o'r fath? Rwyf yn deall bod y tywydd yn eithriadol a'i fod wedi cyd-daro â'r gwyliau, ond rydym yn gwybod pa bryd mae'r Nadolig ac rydym yn gwybod y gall y tywydd fod yn arw. A yw'n dderbyniol felly nad oedd modd cyrraedd Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru yng Nghaerdydd i bob pwrpas am nifer o oriau oherwydd y tywydd garw? Rydym yn derbyn na fydd pethau'n gweithio fel y maent fel rheol, ond a yw hynny'n dderbyniol?

Dywedasoch fod rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi ymateb yn well na'i gilydd o ran cadw'r prif ffyrdd ar agor ac y byddwch yn adolygu eu hymatebion. Ar yr un pryd, a wnewch hefyd adolygu ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yng nghyswllt rhwydwaith y ffyrdd y mae hithau'n gyfrifol amdano? Byddai'n fuddiol gallu cymharu sut y gwnaeth y rhwydwaith hwnnw weithio.

Crybwyllwyd yn fras gennych fod y ffliw wedi taro'n gynharach eleni. Ym mis Hydref, dywedasom fod grwpiau mewn perygl wedi ymateb yn wael, a bod llai na 50 y cant yn manteisio ar y brechiad rhag y ffliw. Gwn nad ydych wedi sôn yn benodol am hyn, ond rydym yn awr yn gweld straeon yn y cyfryngau bod brechlynnau'n brin ac mae rhai'n holi a ddylid caniatáu i fferyllwyr werthu'r brechlyn. A fyddai'n ddoeth, y flwyddyn nesaf, inni gymryd camau i sicrhau, bod y rheini sydd mewn perygl yn cael eu hannog, yn fwy nag arfer hyd yn oed, i fanteisio ar gynnig y brechlyn yn gynharach o lawer yn y gaeaf? Byddai hynny'n osgoi'r rhuthr sy'n digwydd yn awr ac yn atal y stociau rhag cael eu disbyddu.

Yn olaf, rwyf yn cytuno nad ydym o bosibl wedi gweld diwedd ar dywydd garw'r gaeaf hwn, felly a allwch sôn am unrhyw beth penodol yr ydym wedi'i ddysgu yn sgil yr hyn a ddigwyddodd ychydig cyn y Nadolig a fydd yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol a'r Llywodraeth i ymdrin ag unrhyw dywydd garw y gallwn ei wynebu yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, yn well nag y byddem wedi ymdrin ag ef fel arall?

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you for your questions. As you quite rightly said, this was unusual weather. We had not seen weather or temperatures like that for many years. I think that it was as far back as 1920 that temperatures fell below the temperatures that we have encountered over the last few weeks. I was not around then, but I expect that it was not good then either.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch ichi am eich cwestiynau. Roeddech yn llygad eich lle'n dweud bod y tywydd hwn yn anghyffredin. Nid oeddem wedi gweld tywydd na thymheredd fel hynny ers blynyddoedd lawer. Credaf mai cyn belled yn ôl ag yn 1921 y disgynnodd y tymheredd yn is na'r hyn a welsom dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Nid oeddwn yma bryd hynny, ond go brin bod pethau'n dda bryd hynny ychwaith.

3.10 p.m.

The question about what we can learn from this is a serious one. The groups that I have been involved with at a UK level, and local authority partnerships with which my officials have been involved, namely the strategic groups that are in place, were prepared. However, this is like asking for the length of a piece of string. We do not know what the weather is going to bring. We all expect some bad weather, but we never know what the impact will be until it comes. I believe that we were well-prepared. There are always opportunities to learn, and I am sure that we will learn something from this. The review is ongoing.

Mae'r cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r hyn y gallwn ei ddysgu yn sgil hyn yn un difrifol. Roedd y grwpiau yr wyf wedi bod yn ymwneud â hwy ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig, a phartneriaethau gydag awdurdodau lleol y mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn ymwneud â hwy, sef y grwpiau strategol sydd ar waith, yn barod. Serch hynny, mae hyn yr un fath â gofyn pa mor hir yw darn o liny. Ni wyddom beth a ddaw yn sgil y tywydd. Rydym i gyd yn disgwyl rhywfaint o dywydd garw, ond ni wyddom byth beth fydd effaith hynny nes iddo gyrraedd. Credaf ein bod wedi paratoi'n dda. Mae cyfleoedd inni ddysgu o hyd, ac rwyf yn siŵr y dysgwn rywbeth yn sgil hyn. Mae'r adolygiad yn mynd rhagddo.

This small period of reasonable weather will give us an opportunity to assess, fairly quickly, the good working practices that have been seen. As has been mentioned, I have asked my officials to look at how local authorities performed in terms of the additional funding that they received. There may have been other factors involved in cases where areas were not targeted. A couple of days into the bad weather, there was a risk that fuel, such as oil and gas supplies, would not be able to reach some elderly constituents. That was one priority; we had to make sure that the roads to the stations where fuel was collected and distributed were clear. These are all issues that we take on board as priorities within the groups. The hospital issue that you raised is one on which I will ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to respond specifically.

Bydd y cyfnod byr hwn o dywydd rhesymol yn rhoi cyfle inni bwysu a mesur, yn deg ac yn gyflym, yr arferion gweithio da a welwyd. Fel y crybwyllwyd, rwyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion edrych ar sut y gwnaeth yr awdurdodau lleol o ran yr arian ychwanegol a gawsant. Efallai fod ffactorau eraill wedi codi mewn achosion lle nad oedd ardaloedd wedi'u targedu. Ychydig o ddiwrnodau ar ôl i'r tywydd garw ddechrau, roedd perygl na fyddai cyflenwadau tanwydd, megis olew a nwy, yn gallu cyrraedd rhai etholwyr oedrannus. Dyna oedd un flaenoriaeth; bu'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ffyrdd at y gorsafoddd lle y byddai'r tanwydd yn cael ei gasglu a'i ddsbarthu'n glir. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn bethau y byddwn yn eu hystyried yn flaenoriaethau yn y grwpiau. Mae mater a godwyd gennych am yr ysbyty yn un y byddaf yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ymateb iddo'n benodol.

Regarding flu, we had a major seasonal flu vaccination campaign running in Wales. The campaign was conducted on television, on the radio, through leaflets, fact sheets and so on. I agree that we need to promote it early so that people take advantage of it. We saw that people were reluctant to go to their doctors to get their flu jabs. Then, there was some adverse publicity in the newspapers regarding people falling ill or even dying of flu and everybody suddenly thought that they had better get their flu jabs and rushed to their doctors to get it. I am informed that vaccine stocks in Wales are okay. We have released the vaccine stocks for last year's H1N1 virus. It is all in date, and we have the ability to use it. According to my reports, it is all in hand. We can learn from the actions taken in the last couple of weeks and I will encourage the transport department, the health department and my own department to ensure that we have a better understanding of how we operate together.

**David Lloyd:** Hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Hoffwn hefyd longyfarch y Gweinidog, ei adran a'n cydweithwyr oll ar eu hymateb yn yr amser anodd a fu. Ni wn a ddylwn longyfarch y Gweinidog, gan ei fod yn Weinidog dros y tywydd garw, yn benodol ar y ffaith bod y tywydd garw wedi dod i ben. Mae'n dda gweld ychydig o lwyddiant yn yr amgylchiadau hyn.

Yn naturiol, cefais beth amser i fyfyrion gyda'm cymdogaion wrth i ni dwrio gyda rhaw yn yr eira am ychydig ddyddiau. Codwyd ambell gwestiwn, gan gynnwys rhai pwyntiau nad ydynt wedi eu crybwyll eisoes heddiw. Mae gan wledydd eraill sydd wedi hen arfer â'r eira a gaeafau caled ddeddfau sy'n gosod rheidrwydd cyfreithiol ar drigolion unigol i glirio eira o'r palmant o flaen eu tai. Mae gofyniad ar drigolion i wneud hynny, pa un a ydynt am wneud hynny ai peidio. Mewn rhai gwledydd, mae gofyniad cyfreithiol i gael teiars arbennig ar geir ar gyfer yr eira. Yn ystod yr holl gyfarfodydd yr ydych wedi eu cynnal gyda'ch cyfeillion a chyda San Steffan, a oedd newidiadau cyfreithiol o'r fath yn rhan

O ran y fflw, cynhaliwyd ymgyrch fawr ynglŷn â brechu rhag fflw tymhorol yng Nghymru. Cynhaliwyd yr ymgyrch ar y teledu, ar y radio, drwy daflenni, ffeithlenni ac ati. Rwyf yn cytuno bod angen inni ei hyrwyddo'n gynnar er mwyn i bobl fanteisio arno. Gwelsom fod pobl yn gyndyn o fynd at eu meddyg i gael eu pigiad fflw. Yna, cafwyd rhywfaint o gyhoeddusrwydd negyddol yn y papurau newydd ynglŷn â phobl yn mynd yn sâl neu hyd yn oed yn marw o'r fflw ac yna, dyma bawb yn meddwl yn sydyn y byddai'n well iddynt gael eu pigiad fflw ac yn rhuthro at eu meddyg i'w gael. Caf ar ddeall fod stociau'r brechlyn yng Nghymru iawn. Rydym wedi rhyddhau stociau'r brechlyn ar gyfer firws H1N1 y llynedd. Nid yw dyddiad y brechlyn hwnnw wedi dod i ben ac felly gallwn ei ddefnyddio. Yn ôl yr adroddiadau a gefais, mae popeth mewn trefn. Gallwn ddysgu yn sgil y camau a gymerwyd yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf a byddaf yn annog yr adran drafnidiaeth, yr adran iechyd a'm hadran i fy hun i sicrhau ein bod yn deall yn well sut y byddwn yn cydweithio.

**David Lloyd:** I would like to thank the Minister for his statement. I would also like to congratulate the Minister, his department and all our colleagues on their response during difficult times. I do not know whether I should congratulate the Minister, as the Minister for adverse weather, on the fact that the adverse weather has come to an end. It is good to see a little success in current circumstances.

Naturally, I had some time to deliberate with my neighbours as we were shovelling snow for a few days. Several questions were raised, including some points that have not yet been mentioned today. Other countries that are used to snow and hard winters have legislation that places a legal requirement on individual citizens to clear snow from the pavements in front of their houses. There is a requirement for citizens to do so, whether they want to or not. In some countries, there is also a legal requirement for cars to have special snow tyres. During the many meetings that you have had with your colleagues and with Westminster, were such legislative changes part of the discussions, or are they likely to be part of the discussions?

o'r trafodaethau hynny, neu a ydynt yn debygol o fod yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hynny?

Fel rhan o'm pwynt olaf, hoffwn longyfarch y gweithwyr ar lawr gwlad, gan gynnwys gweithwyr llywodraeth leol ac, yn benodol, gweithwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd ar eu hymateb i'r eira mawr. Rwyf yn cofio, fel meddyg ifanc iawn, y tywydd garw ar ddechrau Ionawr 1982. Roeddwn yn garcharor yn hen ysbyty Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr am 10 diwrnod oherwydd yr eira. Dros y Nadolig, roedd yn rhaid i mi, a'm cydfeddygon, gerdded i'r practis i gynnal meddygfeydd. Roedd nyrsys cymunedol hefyd yn cerdded i weld eu cleifion. Bu llawer o sôn, yn naturiol, am ysbytai, ond Roedd y gwasanaeth iechyd ar lawr gwlad hefyd yn dal i weithio dan amodau anodd iawn. Roedd ymrwymiad ein staff yn annhygoel—rwyf am gydnabod hynny—gan fod ein staff cymunedol yn cynnal baich y gwaith o ddydd i ddydd.

Fel yr ydych yn sôn yn eich datganiad, mae oerfel yn achosi cynnydd syfrdanol, weithiau, mewn marwolaethau o ganlyniad i drawiadau ar y galon, strôc, niwmonia ac ati—mae mwy o salwch o gwmpas y lle. O gofio agenda newid yn yr hinsawdd, efallai y byddwn yn gweld mwy o aeafau geirwon gyda thywydd garw eithafol. O gofio'r hyn a ddywedwch yn eich paragraff olaf ynglŷn â chynllunio i'r dyfodol, efallai fod angen cadw mewn cof y gallem weld mwy o aeafau mwy garw na'r hyn a welwyd ers cenhedlaeth. Felly, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, fel ysbytai, meddygfeydd ac ati, efallai y dylem ffurfioli'r sicrwydd y gall staff gyrraedd eu gwaith—y practis neu'r ysbyty—sy'n golygu mwy o gydweithio rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd a llywodraeth leol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, Dai, for your questions. Again, we should pay tribute to all the people who operated beyond of the norm in the adverse conditions in which we found ourselves. That includes community nurses. I am aware of community nurses who walked around their areas to ensure that they saw patients. I am also aware of the fire service transporting ambulance personnel and nurses

As part of my last point, I would like to congratulate the workers on the ground, including local government staff and, specifically, health service staff, on their response to the heavy snowfall. I recall the very harsh weather at the beginning of January 1982 when I was a very young doctor. I was a prisoner in the old Bridgend hospital for 10 days because of the snow. Over Christmas, I was walking into the practice with my fellow doctors to conduct surgeries. Community nurses were also walking to see their patients. We have heard a great deal, naturally, about hospitals, but the health service at the front line was also continuing to work under extremely difficult circumstances. The commitment of our staff was incredible—I would like to recognise that—because our community staff carried the burden of the day-to-day work.

As you mention in your statement, cold weather can sometimes cause an incredible increase in deaths as a result of heart attacks, stroke, pneumonia and so on—more illness is prevalent. Bearing in mind the climate change agenda, we could see more examples of hard winters with very harsh weather. Given what you say in your final paragraph about planning for the future, we should perhaps bear in mind that we may be in for more severe winters than we have experienced for a generation. Therefore, particularly with regard to our public services, such as hospitals, GP surgeries and so on, we should perhaps formalise the guarantee that staff are able to reach their places of work—the practice or the hospital—which would mean greater collaboration between the health service and local government.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch ichi, Dai, am eich cwestiynau. Unwaith eto, dylem roi teyrnged i bawb a fu'n gweithio y tu hwnt i'r arfer yn y tywydd garw y cawsom ein hunain ynddo. Mae hynny'n cynnwys nyrsys cymunedol. Rwyf yn gwybod am nyrsys cymunedol a fu'n cerdded o gwmpas eu hardaloedd i sicrhau eu bod yn gweld cleifion. Gwn hefyd am y gwasanaeth tân yn cludo gweithwyr

to various properties in order for them to give the medical assistance needed.

With regard to the legislative side and the discussions that took place, some parts of legislation were relaxed during the process, one of which related to drivers' hours. To ensure that fuel deliveries could be made across the UK, the restrictions on driving hours were removed. The same applied to drivers of vehicles delivering animal feed in the UK. We also considered the use of snow chains in the UK, but there is certainly a problem with using snow chains related to the road conditions once you come off the snow. If you think that potholes are a problem now, start using snow chains regularly. So, that is something that was considered and that will be considered again if the weather deteriorates in any way.

At the meeting that took place yesterday, an expert said that there is limited evidence that the weather that we have had recently will occur annually. I seem to remember one brave weatherman saying something similar, so please do not attribute any of that to me. Nevertheless, it is an important issue; we should keep our eye on the weather and be prepared with our colleagues and partners delivering public services across Wales and the UK. Sometimes, there is an opportunity for us to call on our neighbours when we find ourselves under increased pressure. My team works across the Welsh Assembly Government co-ordinating this. It is something that we will continue to do with our colleagues across the UK.

3.20 p.m.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** It is interesting that time is a great healer. It is quite some time now since the bad weather was with us. The statement was rather subdued in nature. I join you in paying tribute to the excellent work that many people undertook in clearing snow, offering their vehicles to drive key workers to help assist others in the community, and the general community spirit that was ingrained by the bad weather. However, there are some serious anomalies that I hope that the Minister will be able to address today. I think

ambiwlans a nyrsys i wahanol fannau er mwyn iddynt ddarparu'r cymorth meddygol angenrheidiol.

O ran yr ochr ddeddfwriaethol a'r trafodaethau a gynhaliwyd, llaciwyd ambell ran o'r ddeddfwriaeth yn ystod y broses, ac un enghraifft o hynny oedd y rheol ynglŷn ag oriau gyrwyr. Er mwyn sicrhau bod modd cludo tanwydd ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, dilëwyd y cyfyngiadau ar oriau gyrru. Roedd yr un peth yn wir am yrwyr cerbydau a oedd yn cludo bwyd i anifeiliaid yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Ystyriwyd hefyd ddefnyddio cadwyni eira yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond yn sicr, mae defnyddio cadwyni eira i ymdopi â chyflwr y ffordd yn creu anhawster ar ôl ichi ddod oddi ar yr eira. Os credwch fod tyllau yn y ffyrdd yn broblem yn awr, arhoswch nes ichi ddechrau defnyddio cadwyni eira'n rheolaidd. Felly, mae hynny'n rhywbeth a ystyriwyd ac a gaiff ei ystyried eto os bydd y tywydd yn gwaethygu mewn unrhyw fodd.

Yn y cyfarfod a gynhaliwyd ddoe, dywedodd arbenigwr mai ychydig o dystiolaeth sydd y bydd y tywydd a gawsom yn ddiweddar yn digwydd bob blwyddyn. Mae gennyf ryw gof i un dyn tywydd dewr ddweud rhywbeth tebyg, felly, peidiwch â thadogi dim o hynny arnaf fi. Serch hynny, mae'n fater pwysig; dylem gadw ein golwg ar y tywydd a pharatoi ar y cyd â'n cydweithwyr a'n partneriaid sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig. Weithiau, bydd cyfle inni alw ar ein cymdogion pan welwn ein bod o dan fwy o bwysau. Mae fy nhîm yn gweithio ar draws Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cydlynu hyn. Mae'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn parhau i'w wneud gyda'n cydweithwyr ledled y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae'n ddiddorol sut mae pethau'n edrych yn well gyda threigl amser. Mae tipyn o amser wedi mynd heibio yn awr ers inni gael y tywydd gwael. Roedd y datganiad yn un digon digyffro. Rwyf ffinau hefyd am roi teyrnged i'r gwaith rhagorol a wnaeth llawer o bobl yn clirio eira, yn cynnig eu cerbydau i yrru gweithwyr allweddol er mwyn iddynt helpu i gynorthwyo eraill yn y gymuned, a'r ysbryd cymunedol cyffredinol a afaelodd mewn pobl yn sgil y tywydd garw. Serch hynny, mae nifer o anghysonderau

that the Minister touched upon the issue of the media hyping up quite considerably the issue of snow barns running out of salt, but there is an anomaly between English local authorities and Welsh local authorities. We heard the wonderful word 'resilience' coming up time and again. English local authorities are expected to hold 15 days' worth of salt to be resilient, but in Wales, the figure is 12 days. Is the Minister in a position to explain that difference? On the face of it, nothing jumps out at you to explain why there is a three-day difference. A road is a road, and whether it needs gritting or not is something that authorities need to take into consideration.

Secondly, the Westminster Government had a large reserve of 150,000 tonnes of salt—I am led to believe that that was new for this year. Was the Welsh Assembly Government able to access any of that salt, or does the Welsh Assembly Government go into the market in its own right to purchase salt stocks for Welsh public bodies?

My other concern is on local health boards—as touched on by Dai Lloyd—being able to get staff in to work. We can identify with that problem. Many local health boards have large estates, car parks, footpaths and so on, which rely on being cleared so that the health and safety risks for patients and staff are minimised. Are discussions being held with health boards across Wales on how they responded in making their car parks and other facilities fit for purpose? While we all welcome the ability to get key members of staff in to hospitals, it is also crucial that patients can access appointments, and that hospitals can operate as normally as possible.

I would be most grateful if the Minister could touch upon those three points. I hope that they will add to our understanding of how to react to the appalling weather that we sometimes see in this country.

difrifol Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi sylw iddynt heddiw. Credaf i'r Gweinidog grybwyll bod y cyfryngau wedi gorbwysleisio'n sylweddol bod yr halen yn dirwyn i ben yn yr ysguboriau eira, ond mae anghysonder rhwng awdurdodau lleol Lloegr ac awdurdodau lleol Cymru. Clywsom y gair rhyfeddol 'gwrthsefyll' yn codi dro ar ôl tro. Disgwylir i awdurdodau lleol Lloegr gadw gwerth 15 niwrnod o halen er mwyn gwrthsefyll anawsterau, ond yng Nghymru 12 diwrnod yw'r ffigur. A yw'r Gweinidog mewn sefyllfa i esbonio'r gwahaniaeth hwnnw? Ar y wyneb, nid oes dim byd amlwg yn esbonio pam mae gwahaniaeth o dridiau. Ffordd yw ffordd, a rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau ei ystyried yw a oes angen ei graeanu ai peidio.

Yn ail, roedd gan Lywodraeth San Steffan gronfa fawr o 150,000 tunnell o halen wrth gefn—caf ar ddeall fod y gronfa honno'n newydd ar gyfer eleni. A oedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gallu cael gafael ar rywfaint o'r halen hwnnw, ynteu a fydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n mynd i'r farchnad ei hun i brynu stociau halen i gyrrff cyhoeddus Cymru?

Y peth arall sy'n fy mhoeni yw sicrhau bod staff y byrddau iechyd lleol—ac fe grybwyllodd Dai Lloyd hyn—yn gallu cyrraedd eu gwaith. Gallwn uniaethu â'r broblem honno. Mae gan lawer o fyrddau iechyd lleol ystadau mawr, meysydd parcio, llwybrau troed ac ati, sy'n dibynnu ar gael eu clirio er mwyn sicrhau cyn lleied o berygl i iechyd a diogelwch cleifion a staff ag sy'n bosibl. A oes trafodaethau ar y gweill gyda byrddau iechyd ledled Cymru ynglŷn â'u hymateb o ran gwneud eu meysydd parcio a'u cyfleusterau eraill yn addas at y diben? Er ein bod i gyd yn croesawu'r gallu i sicrhau bod aelodau allweddol o'r staff yn gallu cyrraedd yr ysbytai, mae'n hollbwysig hefyd i gleifion allu cyrraedd eu hapwyntiadau, a bod ysbytai'n gallu gweithredu mor normal ag y bo modd.

Byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe gallai'r Gweinidog sôn am y tri phwynt hynny. Rwyf yn gobeithio y byddant yn gymorth inni ddeall yn well sut mae ymateb i'r tywydd echrydus y byddwn yn ei weld yn y wlad hon o bryd i'w gilydd.

**Carl Sargeant:** I will have to write to you on the specific technical details regarding the difference between 12 and 15 days. There is a great difference between 'some salt' and 'no salt'. No authority in Wales, or the Welsh Assembly Government, ran out of salt. That is key. As I explained earlier, where there were pressures in the system, authorities were able to share resources. That is not a bad thing—it should be normal practice for local authorities and the Welsh Assembly Government. So, let us be clear: we did not run out of salt in Wales. We had salt. I will write to you on the issue of 12 and 15 days.

**Carl Sargeant:** Bydd yn rhaid imi ysgrifennu atoch i roi'r manylion technegol penodol ichi am y gwahaniaeth rhwng 12 a 15 niwrnod. Mae gwahaniaeth mawr rhwng 'rhywfaint o halen' a 'dim halen'. Ni wnaeth cyflenwad halen yr un awdurdod yng Nghymru, na Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddirwyn i ben. Dyna'r peth pwysig. Fel yr esboniais gynnau, lle'r oedd pwysau yn y system, llwyddodd awdurdodau i rannu adnoddau. Nid yw hynny'n beth drwg—dylai hynny fod yn beth arferol i awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Felly, gadewch inni fod yn glir: ni ddisbyddwyd ein cyflenwad halen yng Nghymru. Roedd gennym halen. Ysgrifennaf atoch ynglŷn â mater y 12 a'r 15 niwrnod.

I am also keen to understand the strategic planning elements of the health boards and their estates. They do not just have their eye on the staff and how they manage the process of running their organisations. They also have to look at the whole package of car parks. I am not responsible for that part of the portfolio, but I will ask the Minister to make sure that you are fully informed of the details around the planning assessments on that. An awful lot of planning takes place behind the scenes across portfolios in this respect. I will ensure that you get a full response to your questions today.

Rwyf finnau hefyd yn awyddus i ddeall elfennau cynllunio strategol y byrddau iechyd a'u hystadau. Nid dim ond cadw golwg ar y staff ac ar sut y byddant yn rheoli proses cynnal eu sefydliadau y byddant. Rhaid iddynt hefyd edrych ar becyn cyflawn y meysydd parcio. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am y rhan honno o'r portffolio, ond gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog sicrhau eich bod yn cael gwybodaeth lawn am y manylion sy'n berthnasol i'r asesiadau cynllunio ar gyfer hynny. Mae llawer iawn o waith cynllunio'n digwydd y tu ôl i'r llenni ar draws portffolios yn y cyswllt hwn. Sicrhaf y cewch ymateb llawn i'r cwestiynau a godwyd gennych heddiw.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 3.24 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 3.24 p.m.*

**Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Egwyddorion Cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch  
Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)  
Motion to Approve the General Principles of the Proposed Local Government  
(Wales) Measure**

*Cynnig NDM4622 Carl Sargeant*

*Motion NDM4622 Carl Sargeant*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 23.24:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales in accordance with Standing Order 23.24:*

*Yn cytuno ar egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru).*

*Agrees to the general principles of the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure.*

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I move the motion.

I am pleased to discuss the general principles of the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure. The proposed Measure is wide-ranging and quite complex in parts, but its basic aims are straightforward. The proposed Measure aims to make local government in Wales more representative, accountable and connected with local people. The proposed Measure has been subject to detailed scrutiny by three Assembly committees, and I am grateful to all three for the work that they undertook in preparing the reports published before Christmas.

The conclusions of the committees' reports were generally supportive and welcoming, and I have noted the comments and the thoughtful recommendations made. The conclusions were generally supportive, and I will address each of the three reports in turn, trying to cover as many of the points raised as I can in the time available to me.

Legislation Committee No. 3 recorded that it strongly supported the general principles of the proposed Measure. The committee's comments suggested that Members believed that the proposed Measure will deliver on the aims that we set for it. The committee requested clarification on a number of provisions in the proposed Measure. First, the committee stated that it is content with sections 8 and 9, which introduce a new statutory service into local authorities' democratic services. The committee asked how the services would protect the independence and integrity of the activities in local government. We believe that this is needed to ensure that councillors have the full range of support to enable them to carry out their representational scrutiny roles without the threat of interference from the authority's executive. The functions listed in section 9 are linked to and need to be seen to be operating independently of the executive. The service will be the responsibility of an officer designated by the new democratic services committee. The operation of scrutiny

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

Rwyf yn falch o drafod egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru). Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn eang ei gwmpas ac mae rhannau ohono'n eithaf cymhleth, ond mae ei nodau sylfaenol yn syml. Nod y mesur arfaethedig yw gwneud llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'n fwy cynrychioladol, yn fwy atebol a chreu mwy o gysylltiad rhyngddi a phobl leol. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig wedi bod yn destun craffu manwl gan dri o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, ac rwyf yn ddiolchgar i bob un o'r tri am y gwaith y maent wedi'i wneud yn paratoi'r adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd cyn y Nadolig.

Roedd casgliadau adroddiadau'r pwyllgorau'n gefnogol ac yn groesawgar ar y cyfan, ac Rwyf wedi nodi'r sylwadau a'r argymhellion meddylgar a gafwyd. Roedd y casgliadau'n gefnogol ar y cyfan, a rhoddaf sylw i bob un o'r tri adroddiad yn ei dro, gan geisio trafod cynifer o'r pwyntiau a godwyd ag a gallaf yn yr amser sydd ar gael.

Cofnododd Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 ei fod yn cefnogi'n gryf egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig. Roedd sylwadau'r pwyllgor yn awgrymu bod yr Aelodau'n credu y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn gwireddu'r nodau a bennwyd gennym ar ei gyfer. Gofynnodd y pwyllgor am eglurhad ynglŷn â nifer o ddarpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig. Yn gyntaf, dywedodd y pwyllgor ei fod yn fodlon ar adrannau 8 a 9, sy'n cyflwyno gwasanaeth statudol newydd i wasanaethau democrataidd awdurdodau lleol. Gofynnodd y pwyllgor sut y byddai'r gwasanaethau'n gwarchod annibyniaeth a dilysrwydd gweithgareddau llywodraeth leol. Credwn fod angen hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod gan gynghorwyr yr ystod lawn o gymorth i'w galluogi i gyflawni eu rolau craffu cynrychioladol heb i weithrediaeth yr awdurdod fygwth tarfu arnynt. Mae cysylltiad rhwng y swyddogaethau a restrir yn adran 9 a'r weithrediaeth ac mae angen eu gweld yn gweithredu'n annibynnol arno. Cyfrifoldeb swyddog a ddynodir gan y pwyllgor gwasanaethau democrataidd



will be a key priority within the new service, but many of the others listed are clearly linked with that role.

The committee welcomed the provisions enabling scrutiny committees to scrutinise designated persons, but queried whether this should be an enabling power rather than a duty. Our view is that the duty is needed to ensure that scrutiny committees take seriously their important new role of scrutinising those organisations delivering public services in the area. An enabling power would, in reality, mean very little change to what is already happening. Local authorities already have the power to make reports or recommendations to the authority or the executive on matters that affect the authority's area. I have noted the concerns that this could place unfair burdens and responsibilities; we expect scrutiny committees to be sensible and proportionate in the way that they use this provision and views will reflect the guidance. The requirement that scrutiny committees must prepare and publish forward plans in section 80 should correct the situation if committees are scrutinising an organisation too often, or not often enough.

Legislation Committee No. 3 also requested some clarification about the possible use of the provision that will allow the Assembly Government to make grants to community councils. It is difficult to be specific on this issue, since it is a general power to pay a grant for as yet unidentified purposes. However, the power is not novel; the Local Government Act 2003 provides a similar power in relation to principal councils. The developing role of community councils may create a new demand on their finances. Their first recourse will continue to be funding through the precept, but there could be circumstances in which Welsh Ministers may consider that there is a need to provide further assistance.

The committee recommended a number of amendments to specific provisions in the

newydd fydd y gwasanaeth. Bydd gweithredu'r broses graffu'n flaenoriaeth bwysig yn y gwasanaeth newydd, ond mae'n amlwg bod llawer o'r rhai eraill a restrir yn gysylltiedig â'r rôl honno.

Croesawodd y pwyllgor y darpariaethau sy'n galluogi pwyllgorau craffu i graffu ar bobl ddynodedig, ond holodd tybed a ddylai hyn fod yn bŵer galluogi yn hytrach nag yn ddyletswydd. Ein barn ni yw bod angen y ddyletswydd er mwyn sicrhau bod pwyllgorau craffu'n ysgwyddo'u rôl newydd bwysig o ddifrif, sef craffu ar y sefydliadau hynny sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn yr ardal. Ni fyddai pŵer galluogi mewn gwirionedd yn golygu fawr ddim newid i'r hyn sy'n digwydd eisoes. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol y pŵer eisoes i gyflwyno adroddiadau neu argymhellion i'r awdurdod neu i'r weithrediaeth am faterion sy'n effeithio ar ardal yr awdurdod. Rwyf wedi nodi'r pryderon y gallai hyn greu beichiau a chyfrifoldeb annheg; disgwyliwn i bwyllgorau craffu fod yn gall ac yn gymesur yn y ffordd y byddant yn defnyddio'r ddarpariaeth hon a bydd y safbwyntiau'n adlewyrchu'r canllawiau. Dylai'r gofyniad ar i bwyllgorau craffu orfod paratoi a chyhoeddi blaengynlluniau yn adran 80 gywiro'r sefyllfa os bydd pwyllgorau'n craffu'n rhy aml ar sefydliad, neu oni fyddant yn craffu'n ddigon aml.

Gofynnodd Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 am rywfaint o eglurhad hefyd ynglŷn â'r defnydd posibl ar y ddarpariaeth a fydd yn caniatáu i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi grantiau i gynghorau cymuned. Mae'n anodd bod yn benodol ynglŷn â hyn, oherwydd pŵer cyffredinol i dalu grant at ddibenion sydd heb eu dynodi eto yw hwn. Serch hynny, nid peth newydd yw'r pŵer hwn; yn Neddf Llywodraeth Leol 2003, ceir pŵer tebyg yng nghyswllt y prif gynghorau. Wrth i rôl cynghorau cymuned ddatblygu, fe allai hynny greu gofynion newydd ar eu cyllid. Yr ateb cyntaf iddynt fydd parhau i gael eu hariannu drwy'r praesept, ond fe allai amgylchiadau godi lle y gallai Gweinidogion Cymru ystyried bod angen darparu rhagor o gymorth.

Argymhellodd y pwyllgor nifer o welliannau i ddarpariaethau penodol yn y Mesur

proposed Measure. I have noted the comments and the reasons given. I cannot give any undertakings at the moment as there are still some issues to consider. However, I assure the committee that I will give them full and careful consideration; with one exception, we are certainly minded to make changes accordingly.

The one issue on which I tend to disagree with the committee's views concerns the opposition to voting rights for co-opted members of scrutiny committees. This proposal is closely linked with our proposals for developing scrutiny of the wider public sector. Allowing co-opted members to vote in scrutiny committees should help attract experienced co-optees and increase the legitimacy of scrutiny in the eyes of other public sector and voluntary sector bodies. There are already legislative provisions that require or enable co-optees to vote in scrutiny. Education scrutiny committees must include parent governor and church representatives and give them a vote on school-related issues. There are also informal arrangements for scrutinising local service boards that already involve voting co-optees.

Legislation Committee No. 3 made a number of recommendations for us to issue guidance to help the implementation of the proposals for councillor annual reports, joint overview and scrutiny committees and the use by community councils of the power of wellbeing. I am pleased to accept these recommendations.

3.30 p.m.

Finally, Legislation Committee No. 3's report made some other suggestions, which we are happy to accept. These concern amending the explanatory memorandum to make clear our intentions about the training and development of councillors, engaging early with the authorities affected by the proposed abolition of alternative arrangements, and confirming that it is still our intention that the use of the powers to impose charters between local authorities and community councils should be a last resort.

arfaethedig. Rwyf wedi nodi'r sylwadau a'r rhesymau a roddwyd. Ni allaf addo dim ar hyn o bryd gan fod rhai materion i'w hystyried o hyd. Serch hynny, rwyf am sicrhau'r pwyllgor y byddaf yn eu hystyried yn llawn ac yn ofalus; gydag un eithriad, rydym yn sicr o blaid newid pethau'n unol â'r sylwadau.

Yr un mater yr wyf yn tueddu i anghytuno â'r pwyllgor yn ei gylch yw ei wrthwynebiad i roi hawliau pleidleisio i aelodau cyfetholedig pwyllgorau craffu. Mae cysylltiad clos rhwng y cynnig hwn â'n cynigion ar gyfer datblygu craffu ar y sector cyhoeddus ehangach. Drwy ganiatáu i aelodau cyfetholedig bleidleisio mewn pwyllgorau craffu, dylai hynny helpu i ddenu aelodau cyfetholedig profiadol a chryfhau dilysrwydd y craffu yng ngoleuni cyrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector gwirfoddol. Mae darpariaethau cyfreithiol eisoes ar waith sy'n gofyn i aelodau cyfetholedig bleidleisio wrth graffu neu sy'n eu galluogi i wneud hynny. Rhaid i bwyllgor craffu ar addysg gynnwys rhiant-lywodraethwyr a chynrychiolwyr yr eglwys a rhoi pleidlais iddynt ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r ysgol. Mae trefniadau anffurfiol ar waith hefyd ar gyfer craffu ar fyrddau gwasanaethau lleol sydd eisoes yn caniatáu i aelodau cyfetholedig bleidleisio.

Gwnaeth Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 nifer o argymhellion ynglŷn â chyhoeddi canllawiau a fyddai'n gymorth i roi ar waith y cynigion ar gyfer adroddiadau blynyddol gan gynghorwyr, cyd-bwyllgorau trosolwg a chraffu ac o ran y ffordd y byddai cynghorau cymuned yn defnyddio'r pŵer llesiant. Rwyf yn falch o dderbyn yr argymhellion hyn.

Yn olaf, cafwyd awgrymiadau eraill yn adroddiad Pwyllgor Rhif 3 yr ydym yn falch o'u derbyn. Mae a wnelo'r rhain â diwygio'r memorandwm esboniadol i egluro ein bwriadau ym maes hyfforddi a datblygu cynghorwyr, ymgysylltu'n fuan â'r awdurdodau yr effeithir arnynt gan y cynnig i ddileu trefniadau amgen, a chadarnhau mai ein bwriad o hyd yw mai dim ond pan fydd pethau wedi mynd i'r pen y dylid defnyddio'r pwerau i orfodi siarteri rhwng awdurdodau lleol a chynghorau cymuned.

Let us turn to the report published by the Constitutional Affairs Committee. The committee concluded that the proposed Measure generally achieved the correct balance between powers on the face of the proposed Measure and the subordinate legislation powers given to the Welsh Ministers, and that, despite the number of regulation-making powers, it would not be unnecessarily complex. The committee did express initial concerns about the number of subordinate legislation powers that we did not expect to use immediately, or that would be held in reserve, and requested more information. I was pleased to provide a written explanation for each of those powers. I am pleased that the explanation has, hopefully, addressed the committee's concerns. The Constitutional Affairs Committee made two recommendations, both of which would require an amendment to the current provision. I have already mentioned that I cannot give any firm undertakings today, but we are considering the recommendations very carefully. I also welcome the comments of the Finance Committee, which noted that the costs arising from the proposed Measure would be very different across the 22 authorities in Wales. The committee recognises that different authorities are at different stages of development in providing the proposed improvements.

If the committee had any reservations, they seemed to concern the cost of providing remote access to council meetings. I have noted the committee's comments on this point and confirm that we will proceed with due regard to what is practicable without imposing unreasonable financial burdens on each authority. I welcome the Finance Committee's overall conclusion that, subject to the observation that I mentioned, it saw no financial objections to the proposed Measure. I look forward to hearing the views of my colleagues today.

**David Lloyd:** Fel Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3, mae'n bleser gennyf gyfrannu at ddadl Cyfnod 1 heddiw ar y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru). Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled a'u hymagwedd gytûn. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig, fel y

Gadewch inni droi at yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol. Casgliad y pwyllgor oedd bod y Mesur arfaethedig ar y cyfan yn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd iawn rhwng pwerau yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun a'r pwerau is-ddeddfwriaeth a roddir i Weinidogion Cymru, ac, er gwaetha nifer y pwerau sydd i greu rheoliadau, na fyddai'n ddiangen o gymhleth. Roedd y pwyllgor yn poeni ar y dechrau am nifer y pwerau is-ddeddfwriaeth nad oeddem yn disgwyl eu defnyddio ar unwaith, neu nifer y rhai y byddem yn eu cadw wrth gefn, a gofynnodd am ragor o wybodaeth. Roeddwn yn falch o roi esboniad ysgrifenedig ar gyfer pob un o'r pwerau hynny. Rwyf yn falch bod yr esboniad, gobeithio, wedi tawelu meddwl y pwyllgor. Cafwyd dau argymhelliad gan y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol. Byddai angen gwelliant i'r ddarpariaeth bresennol ar gyfer y naill a'r llall. Rwyf wedi crybwyll eisoes na allaf addo dim byd pendant heddiw, ond rydym yn ystyried yr argymhellion yn ofalus iawn. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu sylwadau'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, a nododd y byddai'r costau a godai yn sgil y Mesur arfaethedig yn amrywio'n fawr ar draws 22 awdurdod Cymru. Mae'r pwyllgor yn sylweddoli bod gwahanol awdurdodau wedi cyrraedd gwahanol gamau yn eu datblygiad o ran gwireddu'r gwelliannau arfaethedig.

Os oedd gan y pwyllgor unrhyw amheuan, roedd a wnelo'r rheini i bob golwg â chost darparu mynediad o bell at gyfarfodydd cyngor. Rwyf wedi nodi sylwadau'r pwyllgor am y pwynt hwn ac rwyf am gadarnhau y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen gan roi sylw dyledus i'r hyn sy'n ymarferol, heb roi beichiau ariannol afresymol ar bob awdurdod. Rwyf yn croesawu casgliad cyffredinol y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ar wahân i'r sylw a grybwyllais, nad oedd yn gweld gwrthwynebiadau ariannol i'r Mesur arfaethedig. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed barn fy nghyd-Aelodau heddiw.

**David Lloyd:** As Chair of Legislation Committee No. 3 I am pleased to contribute to today's Stage 1 debate on the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure. I would like to thank committee members for their hard work and consensual approach. The proposed Measure, as we heard from the

clywsom gan y Gweinidog, yn cynnwys 172 o adrannau, ac mae'n ymdrin ag amrywiaeth gymhleth o faterion manwl sy'n ymwneud â chynghorau sir a chynghorau cymuned yng Nghymru. Cyflwynwyd adroddiad gennym ar 16 Rhagfyr, ar ôl cael tua 80 o ymatebion ysgrifenedig a chlywed tystiolaeth lafar gan amrywiaeth o sefydliadau. Hoffwn ddiolch ar ran y pwyllgor i bawb a gyfrannodd at y broses hon drwy fynegi eu barn i ni. Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion am roi tystiolaeth i ni ar ddau achlysur.

Roedd cytundeb cyffredinol ymysg y tystion fod egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig i gael eu croesawu. Fel pwyllgor, Roeddem hefyd yn cefnogi egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig yn llawn a chawsom ein sicrhau eu bod yn seiliedig ar ganfyddiadau sawl ymgynghoriad ac astudiaeth academiaidd a gwblhawyd yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae cydnabyddiaeth eang nad yw cynghorau lleol yn ddigon cynrychioliadol o'r cymunedau y maent i fod i'w gwasanaethu. Roedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom yn tynnu sylw at yr angen i annog unigolion o gefndiroedd mwy amrywiol i gymryd rhan mewn llywodraeth leol ar bob lefel a datblygu arferion gwaith hyblyg a fydd yn golygu y bydd amrywiaeth ehangach o bobl yn teimlo y gallant gymryd rhan.

Roedd rhai tystion yn teimlo bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn rhy gyfarwyddol ac yn holi ai cyflwyno deddfwriaeth oedd y ffordd briodol o fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion sy'n peri pryder. Fodd bynnag, daethom i'r casgliad bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cynnwys digon o hyblygrwydd i alluogi cynghorau lleol i roi llawer o'r darpariaethau ar waith mewn ffyrdd sy'n gweddu i'w ffyrdd o weithio, a sicrhau cysondeb ar draws Cymru. Barn y pwyllgor yw bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn eang ei gwmpas a bydd yn effeithio ar arferion gwaith ar draws llywodraeth leol ar wahanol lefelau. Oherwydd hyn, cytunwyd y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn help i sicrhau bod llywodraeth leol yn gynrychioliadol ac amrywiol ac y gall weithredu mewn ffyrdd sy'n adlewyrchu natur gyfnewidiol llywodraeth leol a'r newidiadau yn y ffordd y cyflenwir gwasanaethau.

Minister, contains 172 sections, and deals with a complex range of detailed issues relating to Welsh county and community councils. We reported on 16 December, after receiving around 80 written responses and taking oral evidence from a range of organisations. I would like to extend the committee's thanks to all those who contributed to this process by providing us with their views. Finally, I would like to thank the Minister and his officials for giving evidence to us on two occasions.

There was an overall consensus among witnesses that the general principles of the proposed Measure were to be welcomed. As a committee, we also fully supported the general principles of the proposed Measure and were assured that they are based on the findings of a number of consultations and academic studies completed in recent years. It is widely recognised that local councils are not sufficiently representative of the communities that they are supposed to serve. The evidence that we received highlighted the need to encourage individuals from more diverse backgrounds to participate in local government at all levels and to develop flexible working practices so that a wider range of people feel that they can get involved.

Some witnesses felt that the proposed Measure is too prescriptive and questioned whether introducing legislation was an appropriate way of addressing some of the issues of concern. However, we concluded that the proposed Measure contains sufficient flexibility to enable local councils to implement the provisions in ways that suit their ways of working, while securing a consistent approach across Wales. It is the committee's view that the proposed Measure is wide-ranging in its scope and will affect working practices across different tiers of local government. We agreed that, because of this, the proposed Measure will help to ensure that local government is diverse and representative and can operate in ways that reflect the changing nature of local government and public service delivery.

Mae Rhan 1 o'r Mesur arfaethedig yn cynnwys darpariaethau sy'n bwriadu atgyfnerthu democratiaeth leol drwy newid y ffordd y mae cynghorau lleol yn gweithredu, eu gwneud yn fwy cynrychioliadol o'u cymunedau, ac atgyfnerthu'r gefnogaeth sydd ar gael i aelodau anweithredol. Er ein bod yn fodlon ag amcanion cyffredinol Rhan 1, Roeddem yn teimlo bod nifer o feysydd lle mae angen eglurhad pellach.

Bydd adrannau 1 i 3 yn rhoi dyletswydd ar gynghorau lleol i fonitro proffiliau cydraddoldeb y rhai sy'n sefyll mewn etholiad. Ar y cyfan, ein barn oedd bod y darpariaethau hyn yn briodol ac y byddant yn darparu data defnyddiol, ond ni fyddant yn mynd i'r afael â'r diffyg amrywiaeth mewn llywodraeth leol ar eu pennau eu hunain. Ar ben hynny, ein barn oedd na fyddai dyletswydd o'r fath yn canfod y rhesymau pam mae llawer yn dewis peidio â chamu ymlaen i gael eu hethol. Felly, yr ydym wedi argymhell y dylai'r darpariaethau hyn fod yn rhan o raglen ehangach i annog mwy o gyfranogiad mewn democratiaeth leol.

Bydd adrannau 8 a 9 yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynghorau benodi pennaeth gwasanaethau democrataidd, gyda staff cymorth, i ddarparu cymorth ar gyfer gwaith craffu a sicrhau bod yr holl aelodau yn cael digon o gymorth ymchwil a gweinyddol i'w galluogi i wneud eu gwaith yn effeithiol. Er bod y pwyllgor, ar y cyfan, yn croesawu'r darpariaethau hyn, roeddem yn teimlo bod angen eglurhad o ran y ffyrdd y bydd y darpariaethau hyn yn gweithredu'n ymarferol.

Bydd Rhan 2 y Mesur arfaethedig yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i gynghorau lleol wneud darpariaeth ar gyfer gwahanol fathau o absenoldeb teuluol ar gyfer aelodau etholedig, megis absenoldeb mamolaeth, newydd-anedig, mabwysiadu a thadolaeth. Roeddem yn teimlo nad oedd digon o ystyriaeth wedi cael ei rhoi i'r ffordd y gallai aelodau o weithrediaeth awdurdodau lleol gael budd o'r hawliau hyn, ac yr ydym wedi argymhell bod y mater hwn yn cael ei ystyried yng Nghyfnod 2.

Roeddem yn fodlon, ar y cyfan, â Rhannau 3 i 5 y Mesur arfaethedig. Cytunwyd y byddant

Part 1 of the proposed Measure contains provisions that aim to strengthen local democracy by changing the way in which local councils operate, making them more representative of their communities, and strengthening support for non-executive members. While we were content with the overall aims of Part 1, we felt that there were a number of areas that needed further clarification.

Sections 1 to 3 will place a duty on local councils to monitor the equality profiles of those standing for election. Overall we felt that these provisions were appropriate and will provide useful data, but will not deal with the lack of diversity in local government on their own. Furthermore, we were of the view that such a duty will not identify the reasons why many choose not to put themselves forward for election. We have therefore recommended that these provisions should form part of a wider programme to encourage greater participation in local democracy.

Sections 8 and 9 will require councils to put in place a head of democratic services, with supporting staff, to provide support for scrutiny work and to ensure all members receive sufficient research and administrative support to enable them to carry out their duties effectively. While the committee broadly welcomed these provisions, we felt that clarification is required regarding the way these provisions will operate in practice.

Part 2 of the proposed Measure will require local councils to make provision for different types of family absence for elected members, such as maternity, newborn, adoption and paternity absence. We felt that insufficient consideration had been given to the way in which members of the local authority executives might benefit from these entitlements, and have recommended that this issue be addressed at Stage 2.

We were generally content with Parts 3 to 5 of the proposed Measure. We agreed that

yn parhau i roi digon o hyblygrwydd i gynghorau lleol roi digon o drefniadau llywodraethu priodol ar waith a fydd yn addas i'w hanghenion.

they will continue to provide sufficient flexibility for local councils to put appropriate governance arrangements in place to suit their needs.

Nod Rhan 6 y Mesur arfaethedig yw cryfhau gweithgareddau craffu awdurdodau lleol. Mae'r rhan hon o'r Mesur arfaethedig yn cynnwys nifer o ddarpariaethau manwl a fydd, ar y cyfan, ym marn y pwyllgor, yn briodol am y byddant yn helpu i sicrhau y bydd gweithgareddau craffu yn fwy cadarn.

Part 6 of the proposed Measure aims to strengthen the scrutiny activities of local authorities. This part of the proposed Measure contains a number of detailed provisions that, overall, the committee felt were appropriate in that they will help to make scrutiny activities more robust.

Rydym yn croesawu'n gryf y darpariaethau yn adrannau 57 i 61, a fydd yn galluogi dau neu fwy o awdurdodau lleol i gynnal gwaith craffu ar y cyd, a theimlwn fod hyn yn adlewyrchu'r agenda ar gyfer mwy o gydweithio wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ystyried y dystiolaeth a gafwyd gan dystion, argymhellwyd bod y Gweinidog yn rhoi eglurhad pellach o ran sut y bydd y darpariaethau hyn yn gweithredu'n ymarferol, yn benodol o ran y ddyletswydd i graffu ar waith 'personau dynodedig'.

We strongly welcome the provisions in sections 57 to 61, which will enable two or more local authorities to undertake joint scrutiny, and we feel that this reflects the agenda for increasing collaboration in the delivery of public services. However, having considered the evidence of witnesses, we recommended that the Minister provide further clarification regarding the way in which these provisions will operate in practice, specifically in relation to the duty to scrutinise 'designated persons'.

Roeddem yn cefnogi'r ddarpariaeth yn adrannau 75 i 79, a fydd yn galluogi pwyllgorau craffu i gyfethol unigolion sydd ag arbenigedd penodol i'w cynorthwyo yn eu gwaith. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud, roeddem yn gwrthwynebu'n gryf y pwerau yn adran 77 a fydd yn galluogi aelodau cyfetholedig i bleidleisio, gan ofni y gallai hyn godi materion yn ymwneud ag atebolrwydd democrataidd. Felly, yr ydym yn argymhell bod y ddarpariaeth hon yn cael ei diwygio.

We supported the provisions in sections 75 to 79, which will enable scrutiny committees to co-opt individuals with specific expertise to assist them with their work. However, as the Minister has said, we strongly opposed the powers in section 77 that will enable co-opted members to vote, fearing that this could raise issues of democratic accountability. We therefore recommend that this provision be amended.

Cafwyd safbwyntiau cryf ynghylch y ddarpariaeth yn adran 81, sydd â'r bwriad o wahardd defnyddio chwip plaid ym mhwyllgorau craffu awdurdodau lleol. Nodwyd pryderon tystion o ran gweithredu'r ddarpariaeth hon, ond roeddem o'r farn bod cynnwys y ddarpariaeth hon mewn deddfwriaeth yn cadarnhau egwyddor bwysig y dylai pwyllgorau craffu weithredu'n annibynnol.

We received strong views on the provision in section 81, which aims to prohibit the use of a party whip in local authorities' scrutiny committees. We noted witnesses' concerns regarding the implementation of this provision, but were of the view that including this provision in legislation underlines an important principle that scrutiny committees should operate independently.

Mae Rhan 7 y Mesur arfaethedig yn ymdrin yn benodol â chynghorau tref a chymuned, ac yn galluogi'r cynghorau cymuned hynny sydd am wneud mwy yn eu hardaloedd lleol

Part 7 of the proposed Measure deals specifically with town and community councils, and enables those community councils that want to do more in their local

drwy gymryd mwy o bwerau a chyfrifoldebau i wneud hynny. Roedd y pwyllgor o'r farn hefyd fod Rhan 7 yn cydweddu ag ysbryd cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig.

Fodd bynnag, nodwyd rhai pryderon gennym. Croesawyd y darpariaethau yn adrannau 129 i 131, sy'n cyflwyno pŵer newydd i gynghorau cymuned hybu lles. Er ein bod wedi clywed tystiolaeth y byddai'r ychwanegiad hwn at bwerau cynghorau cymuned yn eu galluogi i gynnig mwy o weithgareddau amrywiol, roedd y diffyg eglurder o ran diben penodol y darpariaethau hyn yn peri pryder i ni, ac argymhellwyd bod canllawiau yn ymdrin â hyn.

Nodwyd pryderon tebyg ynghylch y darpariaethau yn adran 132, a fydd yn galluogi Gweinidogion Cymru i dalu grantiau i gynghorau cymuned. Ar y cyfan, fodd bynnag, roedd y pwyllgor o'r farn y dylid croesawu'r darpariaethau ar gyfer cynghorau tref a chymuned.

Mae Rhan 8 yn ymwneud â thaliadau a phensiynau aelodau ac yn gwneud darpariaeth i'r panel taliadau annibynnol gymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn dros wneud argymhellion ar gyfer lwfansau a phensiynau cynghorwyr lleol, cynghorwyr cymuned ac aelodau awdurdodau parciau cenedlaethol ac awdurdodau tân. Ar sail y dystiolaeth a gafwyd, roeddem yn fodlon â'r darpariaethau hyn, ar y cyfan.

3.40 p.m.

Rwyf yn tynnu at y terfyn. Mae Rhan 9 yn cynnwys darpariaeth, sef adran 164, sy'n diwygio Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) 2009 drwy alluogi Gweinidogion Cymru i gyhoeddi canllawiau statudol i awdurdodau lleol ar eu pwerau a'u dyletswyddau o ran cydweithio. Er mai dim ond mynd i'r afael ag anghysondeb ym Mesur 2009 y mae, roeddem o'r farn bod y ddarpariaeth hon yn bwysig gan y bydd yn galluogi Gweinidogion i roi cyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau lleol ar adeg pan mae'n dod yn fwyfwy pwysig cydweithio. Croesawodd y pwyllgor y ddarpariaeth yn adran 164. Fodd bynnag, roeddem yn teimlo efallai ei bod yn rhy gaeth, gan ei bod yn galluogi Gweinidogion

areas by taking on more powers and responsibilities to do so. The committee was also of the view that Part 7 is in keeping with the overall spirit of the proposed Measure.

We did, however, note some concerns. We welcomed the provisions in sections 129 to 131, which introduce a new power for community councils to promote well-being. While we heard evidence that this extension of community councils' powers would enable them to increase the range of their activities, we were concerned at the lack of clarity as to the exact purpose of these provisions, and recommended that this be dealt with in guidance.

We noted similar concerns regarding the provisions in section 132, which will enable Welsh Ministers to pay grants to community councils. Overall, however, the committee was of the view that the provisions relating to town and community councils were to be welcomed.

Part 8 relates to members' payments and pensions and makes provision for the independent remuneration panel to take full responsibility for making recommendations on allowances and pensions for local councillors, community councillors and members of national park and fire and rescue authorities. Based on the evidence received, we were generally content with these provisions.

I am drawing to a close. Part 9 contains a provision, namely section 164, which amends the Local Government Measure (Wales) 2009 by enabling the Welsh Ministers to issue statutory guidance to local authorities on their powers and duties regarding collaboration. While it only seeks to address an anomaly in the 2009 Measure, we considered this provision to be significant as it will enable Ministers to direct local authorities at a time when collaborative working is becoming increasingly important. The committee welcomed the provisions in section 164. However, we felt that it may be too restrictive, because it enables the Welsh Ministers to direct local authorities only

Cymru i roi cyfarwyddyd i awdurdodau lleol ond o dan rai amgylchiadau penodol, sef pan maent yn methu yn eu dyletswydd i sicrhau gwelliant parhaus wrth arfer eu swyddogaethau.

Felly, yr ydym yn argymhell bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cael ei atgyfnerthu i gynnig dull mwy effeithiol o annog cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol y tu hwnt i'r pwerau cyfyng presennol ym Mesur 2009. Rydym wedi gofyn i'r Gweinidog ystyried ffyrdd o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn.

I gloi, os bydd y Cynulliad yn cytuno ar egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig heddiw, rwyf yn annog y Gweinidog i dderbyn y casgliadau a'r argymhellion yn ein hadroddiad, a chyflwyno gwelliannau priodol yng Nghyfnod 2.

**Angela Burns:** The Finance Committee has examined the financial consequences of this proposed Measure and would like to place on record its gratitude to the Minister and his officials for the evidence that they provided to the committee and for coming to answer Members' questions. This proposed Measure covers a range of issues and is aimed at making changes to strengthen the structures and working of local government in Wales at all levels and to ensure that local councils reach out to and engage with all sectors of the communities that they serve. The Finance Committee very much welcomed the detailed analysis of the potential costs that may arise as a result of the proposed Measure, and we appreciate the greater efforts that the Government is now making in that regard. I wish to pay particular tribute to you, Minister, because your evidence was exemplary. However, it should be recognised that your list and analysis were necessarily lengthy, reflecting the disparate nature of the proposed Measure's provisions.

The Finance Committee noted that the costings were based on the fact that all 22 authorities in Wales are at different stages of development and that many of them are already delivering good services in line with what the Minister is seeking to achieve in the proposed Measure. We noted that not all

under certain circumstances, namely where they are failing in their duty to secure continuous improvement in the exercise of their functions.

We therefore recommended that the proposed Measure be strengthened to provide a more effective tool to compel collaboration between local authorities beyond the current limited powers in the 2009 Measure. We have asked the Minister to look at ways of addressing this issue.

To conclude, in the event that the Assembly gives its agreement to the general principles of the proposed Measure today, I urge the Minister to accept the conclusions and recommendations contained in our report, and bring forward appropriate amendments at Stage 2.

**Angela Burns:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi archwilio canlyniadau ariannol y mesur arfaethedig hwn a hoffai gofnodi ei ddiolch i'r Gweinidog ac i'w swyddogion am y dystiolaeth a roesant i'r pwyllgor ac am ddod i ateb cwestiynau'r Aelodau. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn cynnwys nifer o faterion a'i nod yw newid pethau er mwyn cryfhau strwythurau a dulliau gweithio llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ar bob lefel gan sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn estyn allan at bob sector o'r cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu ac yn ymgysylltu â hwy. Roedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn croesawu'n fawr y dadansoddiad manwl o'r costau posibl a allai godi yn sgil y Mesur arfaethedig, a gwerthfawrogwn fod y Llywodraeth yn awr yn gwneud mwy o ymdrechion yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Hoffwn roi teyrnged benodol i chi, Weinidog, oherwydd roedd eich tystiolaeth yn esiampl i bawb. Serch hynny, dylid cydnabod bod eich rhestr a'ch dadansoddiad o reidrwydd yn hir, gan eu bod yn adlewyrchu natur amrywiol darpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig.

Nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod y costau wedi'u seilio ar y ffaith bod pob un o'r 22 awdurdod yng Nghymru wedi cyrraedd gwahanol gamau yn eu datblygiad a bod llawer ohonynt eisoes yn darparu gwasanaethau da yn unol â'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ceisio'i gyflawni yn y Mesur



local authorities will be starting from scratch and the differences in the costings that will apply to each of them.

We also noted that some of the contributors to the legislation committee's consultation expressed the view that the costs would be higher than stated, and we questioned the appropriateness of imposing such costs on public bodies in the current financial climate and at a time of severe financial pressure. The Minister's response was that he did not accept that costs were underestimated, and he said that he felt that many of the reforms that he proposed involved no cost at all or only marginal costs. He said that while he recognised the current difficult financial circumstances, he did not feel that the Government should shy away from driving improvement forward.

In relation to training and development, the Finance Committee asked whether, given the Minister's intention to increase the level of training and development and his desire to ensure higher standards throughout councils, it would be appropriate to increase the funding stream proportionately, rather than expecting authorities to absorb these costs, especially as some authorities may have to absorb far more substantial costs than others, because they are currently at a different place. The Minister said that he did not believe that they were asking authorities to do anything that they should not already be doing. He said that authorities had already signed up to the members' development charter, which is what they should aspire to, and that all he was doing was to place a duty upon them in that regard.

On the issue of remote access to meetings, as the Minister has already stated, the Finance Committee asked about the provisions in the proposed Measure, because we were particularly concerned about what work had been done to determine the level of variability between authorities in terms of current provision. The Minister said that he was not being prescriptive or saying that all council meetings should be web-based, but that the proposed Measure would give authorities the power to allow remote attendance at meetings if they wanted to do

arfaethedig. Nodwyd na fydd pob awdurdod lleol yn dechrau o'r dechrau a'r gwahaniaethau yn y costau a fydd yn berthnasol i bob un ohonynt.

Nodwyd hefyd fod rhai o'r cyfranwyr at ymgynghoriad y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth wedi dweud y byddai'r costau'n uwch nag a ddywedwyd, ac fe wnaethom holi pa mor briodol fyddai gorfodi costau o'r fath ar gyrff cyhoeddus yn yr hinsawdd ariannol bresennol a hwythau o dan bwysau ariannol difrifol. Ymateb y Gweinidog oedd nad oedd yn derbyn bod y costau wedi'u tanamcangyfrif, a dywedodd ei fod yn teimlo nad oedd dim cost o gwbl neu fawr o gostau ynghlwm wrth lawer o'r diwygiadau a gynigiwyd ganddo. Dywedodd, er ei fod yn cydnabod bod y sefyllfa ariannol yn anodd ar hyn o bryd, nad oedd yn teimlo y dylai'r Llywodraeth osgoi sbarduno gwella.

O ran hyfforddi a datblygu, gofynnodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ac ystyried bod y Gweinidog yn bwriadu cynyddu lefel yr hyfforddi a'r datblygu a'i fod yn dymuno sicrhau safonau uwch drwy'r cynghorau, a fyddai'n briodol cynyddu'r llif ariannu mewn ffordd gymesur, yn hytrach na disgwyl i awdurdodau dalu'r costau hyn, yn enwedig oherwydd y gallai fod yn rhaid i rai awdurdodau dalu costau mwy sylweddol o lawer nag eraill am eu bod yn dechrau o bwynt gwahanol. Dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd yn credu eu bod yn gofyn i awdurdodau wneud dim na ddylent fod yn ei wneud eisoes. Dywedodd fod yr awdurdodau eisoes wedi ymrwymo i siarter datblygu'r aelodau, sef yr hyn y dylent anelu ato, a'r cyfan roedd ef yn ei wneud oedd rhoi dyletswydd arnynt yn y cyswllt hwnnw.

O ran mynediad o bell i gyfarfodydd, fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud eisoes, gofynnodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid am y darpariaethau yn y Mesur arfaethedig, oherwydd ein bod yn poeni'n arbennig am ba waith a oedd wedi'i wneud i weld faint o amrywiaeth sydd rhwng awdurdodau o ran eu darpariaeth bresennol. Dywedodd y Gweinidog nad oedd am bennu sut y dylid gwneud pethau na dweud y dylid cynnal pob cyfarfod cyngor ar y we, ond y byddai'r Mesur arfaethedig yn rhoi'r pŵer i awdurdodau ganiatáu i bobl fod yn bresennol

so. The Minister emphasised that, in response to concerns about those costs, he will consult on the guidance that he issues, and he has just reaffirmed that in his speech to the Chamber. I was delighted to hear that and thank him for that.

Finally, in relation to the delivery of funding to support the proposed Measure, the Finance Committee noted and accepted that, in some aspects, particularly in connection with elections, it might be appropriate to use a targeted funding mechanism outside of the revenue support grant system and that systems that are, to some extent, hypothecated might be appropriate. Subject to those observations, the Finance Committee sees no financial objections to the proposed Measure.

**Janet Ryder:** The Constitutional Affairs Committee considered the proposed Measure on 13 October and received written and oral evidence from the Minister and his officials. We reported on 15 December, and our report is available as a supporting document for this debate.

As the Minister said, we were initially concerned at the number of powers that the Government was seeking where the Government appeared to have no intention of using the power, or where the power was held in reserve. Of the 23 subordinate legislation powers in the proposed Measure, 16 fell into one of those two categories. Following his evidence, we sought further explanation from the Minister of the reasons why the powers concerned were needed and why provision could not have been made on the face of the proposed Measure. The Minister's response emphasised that each power should be considered individually in the context of the particular policy objectives involved. However, he helpfully set out further explanations for each of the powers involved, which are addressed in our report.

We were content that a number of the powers concerned were mainly procedural or administrative, and that the appropriate procedure was being used in each case.

o bell mewn cyfarfodydd, os oeddent yn dymuno gwneud hynny. Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog, gan ymateb i bryderon ynglŷn â'r costau hynny, y bydd yn ymgynghori ar y canllawiau a gyhoeddir ganddo, ac mae newydd gadarnhau hynny eto yn ei araith i'r Siambr. Roeddwn wrth fy modd o glywed hynny ac yn diolch iddo.

Yn olaf, o ran darparu arian yn gefn i'r Mesur arfaethedig, nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid ac roedd yn derbyn, o ran ambell agwedd, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt etholiadau, y gallai fod yn briodol defnyddio mecanwaith ariannu sydd wedi'i dargedu, y tu allan i'r system grantiau cymorth refeniw, ac y gallai systemau sydd, i ryw raddau, wedi'u neilltuo, fod yn briodol. Ar wahân i'r sylwadau hynny, nid yw'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gweld gwrthwynebiadau ariannol i'r Mesur arfaethedig.

**Janet Ryder:** Ystyriwyd y Mesur arfaethedig gan y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol ar 13 Hydref a chafwyd tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar gan y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion. Cyflwynwyd adroddiad ar 15 Rhagfyr, ac mae ein hadroddiad ar gael ar ffurf dogfen gefndir i'r ddadl hon.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, roeddem yn poeni ar y dechrau am nifer y pwerau yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn eu ceisio er nad oedd gan y Llywodraeth i bob golwg fwriad o ddefnyddio'r pŵer, neu lle y byddai'r pŵer yn cael ei gadw wrth gefn. O blith y 23 pŵer isddeddfwriaeth yn y Mesur arfaethedig, roedd 16 yn dod o dan un o'r ddau gategori hynny. Yn sgil ei dystiolaeth, ceisiwyd rhagor o esboniad gan y Gweinidog ynglŷn â pham roedd angen y pwerau hynny a pham na fyddai modd gwneud y ddarpariaeth yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog wrth ymateb y dylid ystyried pob pŵer fesul un yng nghyd-destun yr amcanion polisi penodol dan sylw. Serch hynny, roedd yn gymorth ei fod wedi cynnig mwy o esboniadau ar gyfer pob un o'r pwerau dan sylw, ac ymdrinnir â'r rhain yn ein hadroddiad.

Roeddem yn fodlon bod nifer o'r pwerau dan sylw'n rhai gweithdrefnol neu weinyddol yn bennaf, a bod y weithdrefn briodol yn cael ei defnyddio ym mhob achos. Unwaith eto,

Again, details of these points are set out in our report. We were also content that it was appropriate to hold a number of powers in reserve in the event that a local authority or community council should fail to act in accordance with a policy objective set out on the face of the proposed Measure. These include the powers in sections 34, 74, 133 and 137.

There remained a number of areas where we considered carefully whether the procedures were sufficiently robust given the nature of the powers sought. Although we had concerns, which are set out in our report, in relation to sections 56, 62, 97, 116 and 124, we were reassured by the Minister's explanation of the need for the powers and that appropriate safeguards were in place in each case.

Section 10(1) of the proposed Measure allows Ministers to make regulations regarding standing orders relating to staff provided by the head of democratic services. However, section 10(1)(b) also allows Ministers

'to make other modifications of the authority's standing orders'.

This is wider than the current power provided by section 8 of the Local Government and Housing Act 1989 and would appear to allow Welsh Ministers to make a modification to an authority's standing orders. However, the Minister confirmed that the Government's intention is to use the power only in relation to standing orders relating to the management of staff of the head of democratic services.

We are of the view that the power as drafted is wide enough to allow the Government to make any amendment to a local authority's standing orders. As this goes beyond the Minister's policy intention, we believe that this section should be amended to make clear that any modification that the Government can make to standing orders is limited to their policy objective, given that the Minister will not always be the present incumbent.

rhoddir manylion y pwyntiau hyn yn ein hadroddiad. Roeddem yn fodlon hefyd ei bod yn briodol cadw nifer o bwerau wrth gefn rhag ofn i awdurdod lleol neu gyngor cymuned fethu â gweithredu'n unol ag un o amcanion polisi'r Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys y pwerau yn adrannau 34, 74, 133 ac 137.

Roedd nifer o feysydd o hyd lle'r ystyriwyd yn ofalus a oedd y gweithdrefnau'n ddigon cadarn ac ystyried natur y pwerau a geisid. Er ein bod yn poeni, a rhestrir ein pryderon yn ein hadroddiad, yng nghyswllt adrannau 56, 62, 97, 116 ac 124, tawelwyd ein meddwl pan esboniodd Gweinidog pam yr oedd angen y pwerau a bod camau diogelu priodol ar waith ym mhob achos.

Mae Adran 10(1) o'r Mesur arfaethedig yn caniatáu i Weinidog wneud rheoliadau ynglŷn â rheolau sefydlog sy'n berthnasol i staff a ddarperir gan bennaeth y gwasanaethau democrataidd. Serch hynny, mae adran 10(1)(b) hefyd yn caniatáu i Weinidogion

'wneud addasiadau eraill i'r rhai o blith ei reolau sefydlog'.

Mae'r pŵer hwn yn ehangach na'r pŵer a roddir drwy adran 8 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Leol a Thai 1989 ar hyn o bryd ac, i bob golwg, byddai'n caniatáu i Weinidogion Cymru addasu rheolau sefydlog awdurdod. Serch hynny, cadarnhaodd y Gweinidog mai bwriad y Llywodraeth fyddai defnyddio'r pŵer yng nghyswllt rheolau sefydlog sy'n ymwneud â rheoli staff pennaeth y gwasanaethau democrataidd yn unig.

Ein barn ni yw bod y pŵer fel y'i drafftwyd yn ddigon eang i ganiatáu i'r Llywodraeth ddiwygio rheolau sefydlog awdurdod lleol mewn unrhyw fodd. Gan fod hyn yn mynd y tu hwnt i fwriad polisi'r Gweinidog, credwn y dylid diwygio'r adran hon i'w gwneud yn glir bod unrhyw addasiad y caiff y Llywodraeth ei wneud i'r rheolau sefydlog yn cael ei gyfyngu i'w hamcan polisi, a chofio nad y sawl sy'n dal y swydd ar hyn o bryd fydd y Gweinidog am byth.

Section 143 is a so-called Henry VIII power that allows Welsh Ministers to modify primary legislation to remove or alter statutory impediments from community councils accredited under the new quality accreditation scheme, and to place impediments in the way of unaccredited community councils. Our general view is that the affirmative procedure is appropriate for Henry VIII powers unless there are good reasons otherwise. However, in this case, the negative procedure is proposed, and the Minister has argued that this was appropriate given the power's limited and specific application.

We acknowledge that the argument is more evenly balanced in this case than on other occasions when it has been proposed that Henry VIII powers should be exercised by negative resolution. However, as it is not yet clear what criteria community councils need to meet in order to become accredited, and because of our general view that the case for Henry VIII powers needs to be made on each occasion, we remain of the view that the affirmative procedure is appropriate in this case and have recommended accordingly.

Finally, a number of witnesses to our inquiry on the drafting of Welsh Government legislation have indicated that they found the explanatory memorandum for this proposed Measure to be one of the best they have seen. The committee agrees and would particularly commend the rationale it contained for the procedures for exercising each delegated power. This was welcome and might usefully be extended to future memoranda.

3.50 p.m.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We are happy to support the general principles of this proposed Measure and are content to see it progress to Stage 2.

I congratulate Legislation Committee No. 3 on its detailed report. This is a very weighty proposed Measure that seeks to achieve a great deal, and the committee has given it a significant amount of consideration and has made some useful observations about the

Gelwir Adran 143 yn bŵer Harri'r VIII. Mae'n caniatáu i Weinidogion Cymru addasu deddfwriaeth sylfaenol i ddileu neu newid rhwystrau statudol gan gynghorau cymuned a achredir o dan y cynllun achredu ansawdd newydd, ac i roi rhwystrau yn ffordd cynghorau cymuned sydd heb eu hachredu. Ein barn gyffredinol yw bod y weithdrefn gadarnhaol yn briodol ar gyfer pwerau Harri'r VIII oni fydd rhesymau da dros wneud fel arall. Serch hynny, yn y cyswllt hwn, cynigir y weithdrefn negyddol, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi dadlau bod hyn yn briodol ac ystyried bod y gallu i roi'r pŵer ar waith yn gyfyngedig ac yn benodol.

Rydym yn cydnabod bod y ddadl yn fwy cytbwys yn yr achos hwn nag ar achlysuron eraill pan gynigiwyd y dylid rhoi pwerau Harri'r VIII ar waith drwy benderfyniad negyddol. Serch hynny, gan nad yw'n glir eto pa feini prawf sydd eu hangen ar gynghorau cymuned er mwyn iddynt gael eu hachredu ac oherwydd ein barn gyffredinol bod angen cyflwyno'r ddadl dros ddefnyddio pwerau Harri'r VIII ar bob achlysur, rydym yn dal i gredu bod y weithdrefn gadarnhaol yn briodol yn yr achos hwn a dyna ein hargymhelliad.

Yn olaf, mae nifer o'r tystion i'n hymchwiliad ar ddrafftio deddfwriaeth Llywodraeth Cymru wedi awgrymu eu bod yn meddwl mai'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y mesur arfaethedig hwn oedd un o'r rhai gorau y maent wedi'i weld. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cytuno a byddai'n cymeradwyo'n benodol y rhesymwaith y mae'n ei gynnwys ar gyfer y gweithdrefnau i roi pob pŵer dirprwyedig ar waith. Roedd hyn yn rhywbeth i'w groesawu a byddai'n fuddiol dilyn yr un drefn mewn memoranda yn y dyfodol.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Rydym yn falch o gefnogi egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig hwn ac yn fodlon ei weld yn camu ymlaen i Gyfnod 2.

Rwyf yn llongyfarch Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 ar ei adroddiad manwl. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn un sylweddol iawn ac mae'n ceisio cyflawni llawer. Mae'r pwyllgor wedi rhoi cryn ystyriaeth iddo ac wedi cynnig nifer o sylwadau buddiol ynglŷn â chwmpas

scope of the proposed Measure and how it can be applied in Wales. Although the evidence seems overwhelmingly to be supportive, there is some evidence that seeks to contradict what the Minister has said. The Welsh Local Government Association was not hugely enthusiastic when it gave evidence; it said that the proposed Measure was too restrictive and prescriptive and that it therefore undermined the Assembly Government's stated objective, effectively curtailing local autonomy and discretion. Some local authorities were equally dismissive of the proposed Measure, stating clearly their view that the proposals would fail to achieve the objectives and would in fact be counterproductive.

The committee did not agree with that view, given the clear statement in its report that there is sufficient flexibility to allow local authorities to implement many of the provisions in the proposed Measure. However, we need to be careful because, very often, as we look at legislation here, local government becomes suspicious of what we are trying to achieve. On occasion, local government sees the Assembly Government as merely wanting to hit it with a very large hammer. There is an issue about the way in which we see our relationship with local government developing. Local government is not just a delivery agent of the Welsh Assembly Government. I know that we can sometimes fall into the trap of seeing local government in that way, but it is made up of democratically elected bodies, which have a significant talent of people who do a fantastic job in representing their communities. Those people develop into brilliant community leaders and run good authorities and deliver innovative services. They could probably teach us a few lessons on occasion. We therefore need to consider how that relationship is to develop over time, and I am sure that the Minister will take that on board.

I think that the proposed Measure is particularly strong with regard to how we can develop and improve accountability. Since the changes to local government—with the shift away from the old committee structure to an executive structure—there has been a

y Mesur arfaethedig a sut y gellid ei roi ar waith yng Nghymru. Er bod y dystiolaeth i bob golwg yn hynod gefnogol i hyn, mae rhywfaint o dystiolaeth sydd o bosibl yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedwyd gan y Gweinidog. Nid oedd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth leol Cymru yn ofnadwy o frwdfrydig pan roddodd dystiolaeth; dywedodd fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn rhy gyfyngol a rhagnodol a'i fod felly'n tanseilio'r amcan yn natganiad y Llywodraeth, a'i bod mewn gwirionedd yn cyfyngu ar annibyniaeth a disgresiwn lleol. Roedd rhai awdurdodau lleol yr un mor feiriadol o'r Mesur arfaethedig, gan ddweud yn groyw na fyddai'r cynigion yn cyflawni'r amcanion ac y byddent mewn gwirionedd yn wrthgynhyrchiol.

Nid oedd y pwyllgor yn cytuno â'r farn honno, a chofio'r datganiad clir yn ei adroddiad bod digon o hyblygrwydd i ganiatáu i awdurdodau lleol roi llawer o ddarpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig ar waith. Serch hynny, mae angen inni fod yn ofalus, oherwydd, yn aml iawn, wrth inni edrych ar y ddeddfwriaeth yma, mae llywodraeth leol yn dechrau amau beth yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni. Ar brydiau, bydd llywodraeth leol yn meddwl mai'r cyfan y mae llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dymuno'i wneud yw ei tharo â morthwyl mawr iawn. Mae angen ystyried y ffordd yr ydym yn gweld ein perthynas â llywodraeth leol yn datblygu. Nid dim ond asiant darparu ar ran llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw llywodraeth leol. Gwn ein bod weithiau'n gallu disgyn i'r fagl o weld llywodraeth leol felly, ond cyrff sy'n cael eu hethol yn ddemocrataidd yw'r rhain, ac mae ganddynt bobl dalentog iawn sy'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol yn cynrychioli eu cymunedau. Bydd y bobl hyn yn datblygu'n arweinwyr gwych yn eu cymuned, yn cynnal awdurdodau da ac yn darparu gwasanaethau arloesol. Mae'n siŵr y gallent ddysgu ambell wers i ni ar brydiau. Felly, mae angen inni ystyried sut mae'r berthynas honno am ddatblygu dros amser, ac rwyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff y Gweinidog gadw hynny mewn cof.

Credaf fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn arbennig o gryf o ran sut y gallwn ddatblygu a gwella atebolrwydd. Ers y newidiadau i lywodraeth leol a'r symud oddi wrth hen strwythur y pwyllgorau i strwythur gweithredol—mae lluo o bryderon wedi codi ynglŷn â sut y byddai

huge raft of concerns about how the executive would be held to account and what support there would be for members to develop their skills to ensure that they scrutinise the role of the executive effectively. The concept of developing democratic services is strong and, indeed, as someone who comes from a family steeped in local government in Cardiff, the concept of being able to develop local members' ability to scrutinise officials, to ensure that they get value from those senior officials and from executive members, is a strong one, and I strongly endorse it. We also need to see local government developing its diversity, because the range of councillors in Wales is fairly stereotypical. We need to see a more diverse number of people from our communities. I want to see younger people coming forward and developing those skills and becoming local champions and members of local authorities. There are great opportunities through this proposed Measure to achieve that.

On the concept of collaboration, senior officials and chief executives of local authorities have told me that they feel that neither we nor they are doing enough to collaborate at a greater level and in greater depth. More work can be done here, and I was pleased that collaboration is such a strong part of this proposed Measure.

However, I think that we have lost an opportunity to improve the way in which communities can trigger a referendum on directly-elected mayors. The Local Government Act 2000 is extremely restrictive; it contains many barriers to local communities triggering a referendum for a directly-elected mayor. We have lost an opportunity to reform that—it would have been an ideal means of making it easier for our communities to have a greater say in how these functions should be discharged and whether having a single person discharge many of these functions would provide greater accountability, leadership and focus in that community. I am sorry, Minister, that you have not taken that opportunity to include that in the proposed Measure.

modd dal y weithrediaeth i gyfrif a pha gymorth a fyddai ar gael i aelodau ddatblygu eu sgiliau er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn craffu'n effeithiol ar rôl y weithrediaeth. Mae datblygu gwasanaethau democrataidd yn gysyniad cryf ac, yn wir, a minnau'n rhywun sy'n dod o deulu sydd wedi'i drwytho mewn llywodraeth leol yng Nghaerdydd, mae medru datblygu gallu aelodau lleol i graffu ar swyddogion er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael gwerth gan yr uwch swyddogion hynny a chan aelodau gweithredol, yn gysyniad cryf hefyd ac rwyf yn ei gymeradwyo'n fawr. Mae angen hefyd inni weld llywodraeth leol yn datblygu o ran ei hamrywiaeth, oherwydd mae'r ystod o gynghorwyr yng Nghymru'n weddol gul. Mae angen inni weld nifer fwy amrywiol o bobl o'n cymunedau. Rwyf am weld pobl iau yn dod yn eu blaen ac yn datblygu'r sgiliau hynny ac yn dod yn eiriolwyr lleol ac yn aelodau o'u hawdurdodau lleol. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn cynnig cyfleoedd gwych i wireddu hynny.

O ran cysyniad cydweithredu, mae uwch swyddogion a phrif weithredwyr awdurdodau lleol wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo naill ai nad ydym ni neu nad ydynt hwythau'n gwneud digon i gydweithredu ar lefel uwch ac yn ddyfnach. Gellir gwneud mwy o waith yn y fan hon, ac roeddwn yn falch bod cydweithredu'n rhan mor gryf o'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn.

Serch hynny, credaf ein bod wedi colli cyfle i wella'r ffordd y gall cymunedau sbarduno refferendwm ar feiri sy'n cael eu hethol yn uniongyrchol. Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 yn eithriadol o gyfyngus; mae'n cynnwys lluo o bethau sy'n rhwystro cymunedau lleol rhag sbarduno refferendwm i ethol maer yn uniongyrchol. Rydym wedi colli cyfle i ddiwygio hynny—buasai'n ffordd ddelfrydol o'i gwneud hi'n haws i'n cymunedau gael mwy o lais yn y ffordd y dylid cyflawni'r swyddogaethau hyn ac ynglŷn ag a fyddai cael un person yn cyflawni llawer o'r swyddogaethau hyn yn darparu mwy o atebolrwydd, arweinyddiaeth a ffocws yn y gymuned honno. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Weinidog, nad ydych wedi achub ar y cyfle hwnnw i gynnwys hynny yn y Mesur arfaethedig.

I must say that I am not a fan of the concept of voting rights for co-opted members. If people want to sit on local authorities and vote, then they should get elected; it is as simple as that. Great damage could be done to the relationship between elected and co-opted members if voting rights are given to those co-opted members. I ask the Government to consider that. Ultimately, the test for the proposed Measure will take place after 3 March. If we have the welcome 'yes' vote that we all hope we will get, it will be about how this institution devolves more powers, more responsibility and more opportunities to our local communities and local authorities. I hope that the proposed Measure will be the start of that, because it will help to redefine the relationship between us and local government, and that will be important for the future.

**Christine Chapman:** The work that local government carries out probably touches the lives of the people of Wales more directly and more frequently than any other tier of government. It is therefore right that we are debating this proposed Measure. As a member of the legislation committee that scrutinised it, I think that the consultation was excellent, and I would ask the Minister to look at our report.

On the diversity of representation, we know that every day, decisions are made for us on a local basis, whether on what school transport is on offer for our children, the sort of rubbish collection in our area, which organisations are given support in our communities and so on. These decisions affect us all, but statistically, on average, they are made by a very narrow sector of society. If you look at the statistics, you will see that they are taken by a white, 57-year-old man. I do not mean any disrespect to white, 57-year-old men, but I do not believe that it is right that they are the ones who tend to make the decisions. It is no wonder that many people feel disengaged—[*Interruption.*] That is the average, statistically. It is no wonder that many people feel disengaged, because local government does not always mirror wider society as a whole. It is unacceptable that only a quarter of councillors in Wales are

Rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf o blaid rhoi hawliau pleidleisio i aelodau cyfetholedig. Os bydd pobl am fod yn aelod mewn awdurdod lleol a phleidleisio, yna dylent gael eu hethol; mae mor syml â hynny. Gellid gwneud difrod mawr i'r berthynas rhwng aelodau etholedig ac aelodau cyfetholedig pe rhoddid hawliau pleidleisio i'r aelodau cyfetholedig hynny. Rwyf yn gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ystyried hynny. Yn y pen draw, cynhelir y prawf ar gyfer Mesur arfaethedig ar ôl 3 Mawrth. Os cawn y bleidlais 'ie' yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio y cawn ni, bydd a wnelo â sut yr aiff y sefydliad hwn ati i ddatganoli mwy o bwerau, mwy o gyfrifoldeb a mwy o gyfleoedd i'n cymunedau lleol a'n hawdurdodau lleol. Rwyf yn gobeithio mai'r Mesur arfaethedig fydd y man cychwyn ar gyfer hynny, oherwydd bydd yn help i ailddiffinio'r berthynas rhyngom ni a llywodraeth leol, a bydd hynny'n bwysig i'r dyfodol.

**Christine Chapman:** Mae'n debyg bod y gwaith y bydd llywodraeth leol yn ei wneud yn cyffwrdd â bywydau pobl Cymru yn fwy uniongyrchol ac yn amlach nag unrhyw haen arall o lywodraeth. Felly, mae'n iawn inni drafod y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. A minnau'n aelod o'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a fu'n craffu arno, credaf fod yr ymgynghoriad yn rhagorol, a hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog edrych ar ein hadroddiad.

O ran amrywiaeth y gynrychiolaeth, gwyddom fod penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud drosom bob dydd yn lleol, boed y rheini'n ymwneud â pha gludiant sy'n cael ei gynnig i'r ysgol i'n plant, pa fath o wasanaeth casglu sbwriel sydd yn ein hardal, pa gyrff y rhoddir cymorth iddynt yn ein cymunedau ac ati. Mae'r penderfyniadau hyn yn effeithio arnom i gyd, ond, yn ystadegol, ar gyfartaledd, maent yn cael eu gwneud gan sector cyfyng iawn o'r gymdeithas. Os edrychwch ar yr ystadegau, gwelwch mai dyn gwyn, 57 oed sy'n eu gwneud. Nid wyf yn golygu dim amarch i ddynion gwyn 57 oed, ond ni chredaf ei bod yn iawn mai nhw yw'r rhai sy'n tueddu i wneud y penderfyniadau. Nid yw'n syndod bod llawer o bobl yn teimlo nad oes ganddynt ran mewn pethau—[*Torri ar draws.*] Dyna'r cyfartaledd, yn ystadegol, Nid yw'n syndod bod llawer o bobl yn teimlo nad oes ganddynt ran mewn pethau,

women. Despite the very welcome success of 19-year-old Luke Bouchard from Treherbert—

oherwydd nid yw llywodraeth leol bob tro'n adlewyrchu'r gymdeithas ehangach drwyddi draw. Mae'n annerbyniol mai dim ond chwarter y cynghorwyr yng Nghymru sy'n fenywod. Er gwaethaf llwyddiant Luke Bouchard sy'n 19 oed o Dreherbert, llwyddiant sydd i'w groesawu—

**Leighton Andrews:** Hear, hear.

**Leighton Andrews:** Clywch, clywch.

**Christine Chapman:** I knew that Leighton would be pleased with that. Despite the fact that he became one of the youngest county councillors in Wales, we should recognise that he is still very much an exception. I therefore welcome the aspiration in the proposed Measure to increase diversity among the elected members of local authorities and community councillors.

**Christine Chapman:** Gwyddwn y byddai hynny'n plesio Leighton. Er gwaetha'r ffaith iddo ddod yn un o gynghorwyr sir ieuengaf Cymru, dylem sylweddoli mai eithriad ydyw i raddau helaeth o hyd. Rwyf felly'n croesawu'r dyhead yn y Mesur arfaethedig i sicrhau bod aelodau etholedig awdurdodau lleol a chynghorwyr cymuned yn fwy amrywiol eu natur.

On another point, party politics aside, we should not underestimate the difference that an effective elected member can make in our communities. He or she can really help to transform the area and empower those who may feel powerless in the decision making of local government. To be truly effective elected members, backbenchers in particular need access to the right training and support to carry out their role of scrutiny, which is absolutely essential for a healthy democracy. Therefore, I welcome the greater emphasis on that aspect in the proposed Measure. It is very welcome.

Pwynt arall, ac anghofio gwleidyddiaeth plaid, yw na ddylem danamcangyfrif y gwahaniaeth y gall aelod etholedig effeithiol ei wneud yn ein cymunedau. Gall ef neu hi helpu o ddifrif i weddnewid yr ardal a grymuso'r rheini sydd o bosibl yn teimlo'n ddi-rym yng nghanol proses gwneud penderfyniadau llywodraeth leol. Er mwyn bod yn wirioneddol effeithiol, mae angen i aelodau etholedig, meincwyr cefn yn benodol allu cael gafael ar yr hyfforddiant a'r gefnogaeth iawn er mwyn iddynt gyflawni eu rôl craffu, sy'n gwbl hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau democratiaeth iach. Felly, rwyf yn croesawu'r pwyslais cryfach ar yr agwedd honno yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae i'w groesawu'n fawr.

Finally, on collaboration—and I know that a number of Members have mentioned that—there are numerous examples of excellent collaborative projects involving local authorities and the private and voluntary sectors. In my area, for example, the Heads of the Valleys regeneration programme is making progress in sharing expertise, enthusiasm and ideas, and collaborative projects on waste have also been important. I know, too, that the collaborative work between authorities on the distribution of road salt, for example, helped to get Wales through the difficult times in the recent bad weather. We know that collaboration is essential if public service delivery is to be as effective as possible for the people of Wales.

Yn olaf, o ran cydweithredu—a gwn fod nifer o Aelodau wedi crybwyll hynny—mae nifer o enghreifftiau o brosiectau cydweithredu rhagorol sy'n cynnwys awdurdodau lleol a'r sector preifat a gwirfoddol. Yn fy ardal i, er enghraifft, mae rhaglen adfywio Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn gwneud cynnydd wrth rannu arbenigedd, brwdfrydedd a syniadau, ac mae prosiectau cydweithredol ar wastraff wedi bod yn bwysig hefyd. Gwn hefyd, fod y cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau wrth ddosbarthu halen ar gyfer y ffyrdd, er enghraifft, wedi helpu Cymru i ddod drwy'r cyfnodau anodd yn y tywydd garw diweddar. Gwyddom fod cydweithredu'n hanfodol er mwyn i wasanaethau cyhoeddus gael eu darparu mewn ffordd mor effeithiol ag y bo



Therefore, we cannot afford to leave it to chance and goodwill. That is why I believe that the stronger emphasis in the proposed Measure on that aspect is needed.

**Veronica German:** I am speaking today as a member of Legislation Committee No. 3 and as the spokesperson on local government—to kill two birds with one stone. Generally, we support the principles of the proposed Measure, particularly in broadening participation in local government and in enhancing the role of backbenchers. From my experience of two local authorities, I have sometimes found that it is difficult to have your voice heard. We will support the proposed Measure at this stage, although we do believe that certain amendments need to be introduced to ensure that it is proportionate and not too prescriptive.

4.00 p.m.

With regard to Part 1 and broadening participation, although I have been persuaded that it is useful to have this survey, it is absolutely clear that we should not stop there, and I think that the Minister understands that. When the Minister first introduced this proposed Measure, I said that work is being done over the bridge in England on what it means to be a councillor and there is a big campaign, where representatives visit community groups and people who might not normally think about doing it. That is something that we should consider, although not as part of the legislation.

I have been reassured by the Minister about remote attendance. It is useful that there will be a power to enable people to do it and that councils' standing orders will then determine how and when that power should be implemented. However, I would like to express my opposition and that of my group to legislating for annual reports. This is an issue for the elected councillor and the electorate directly. If a councillor wishes to do that, then he or she should do it, and it is good practice to do it, but it is up to the councillor and to the electors to decide whether or not he or she has done a good job at the end of the term.

We welcome the introduction of the right to a

modd i bobl Cymru. Felly, ni allwn fforddio'i adael ar drugaredd siawns ac ewyllys da. Dyna pam yr wyf yn credu bod angen y pwyslais cryfach ar hynny sydd yn y Mesur arfaethedig.

**Veronica German:** Rwyf yn siarad heddiw a minnau'n aelod o Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 ac yn llefarydd ar lywodraeth leol, a lladd dau aderyn ag un ergyd. Yn gyffredinol, rydym yn cefnogi egwyddorion y Mesur arfaethedig, yn enwedig o ran ehangu cyfranogaeth mewn llywodraeth leol a chryfhau rôl meincwyr cefn. O'm profiad i mewn dau awdurdod lleol, rwyf weithiau wedi'i chael hi'n anodd cael llais. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig yn y cyfnod hwn, er ein bod yn credu bod angen cyflwyno ambell welliant er mwyn sicrhau ei fod yn gymesur ac nad yw'n rhy rhagnodol.

O ran Rhan 1 ac ehangu cyfranogaeth, er fy mod wedi cael fy narbwylllo ei bod yn fuddiol cynnal yr arolwg hwn, mae'n gwbl glir na ddylem aros yn y fan honno, a chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn deall hynny. Pan gyflwynodd y Gweinidog y Mesur arfaethedig hwn gyntaf, dywedais fod gwaith yn cael ei wneud dros y bont yn Lloegr ar yr hyn mae'n ei olygu i fod yn gynghorydd a bod ymgyrch fawr ar waith, lle bydd cynrychiolwyr yn ymweld â grwpiau cymunedol ac â phobl na fyddent fel rheol yn meddwl am wneud hyn. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y dylem ei ystyried, er nad yn rhan o'r ddeddfwriaeth.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi tawelu fy meddwl ynglŷn â phresenoldeb o bell. Mae'n beth buddiol cael pŵer i alluogi pobl i wneud hyn a bydd rheolau sefydlog cynghorau wedyn yn penderfynu sut a pha bryd y dylid rhoi'r pŵer hwnnw ar waith. Serch hynny, hoffwn ddweud fy mod i a'm grŵp yn gwrthwynebu deddfu ar gyfer adroddiadau blynyddol. Mater i'r cynghorydd etholedig a'r etholaeth yn uniongyrchol yw hyn. Os bydd cynghorydd yn dymuno gwneud hynny, yna dylai ef neu hi ei wneud, ac mae'n arfer da, ond y cynghorydd a'r etholwyr a ddylai benderfynu a yw ef neu hi wedi gwneud gwaith da ar ddiwedd y tymor neu beidio.

Rydym yn croesawu cyflwyno'r hawl i

period of family absence. However, like the committee, we would like to emphasise the issue regarding executive members and their number. I know that you will be looking at that, and I am grateful for that.

Improved scrutiny will certainly lead to improved councils and to improved services for residents, which is what it is all about in the long term. We would like to see as many people as possible being involved in these decisions and believe that the public should have a conduit into that scrutiny process. I have long been a supporter of proposals to ensure that committee chairs are politically balanced, having suffered in more than one place because that has not happened. There are not many authorities in Wales in which the opposition does not get chairs and I have been a member of two of the three where that happens. Therefore, although the mathematical formula for that looks convoluted, we broadly support that proposal.

With regard to the designated persons, like the committee, I feel that this should be a power and not a duty. This is not because we feel that people should not be doing it, but as Dai has already mentioned, were there to be a duty, authorities might be expected to have everyone in from every possible public service in the authority, which could be time-consuming.

I would also like to emphasise strongly that co-opted members should not have voting rights. If it were proposed that Assembly committees should have co-opted members with voting rights, we would be up in arms in the Chamber. Therefore, if it is not good enough for the Assembly, why would it be good enough for local government?

Although I agree that scrutiny committees should be independent and that members should not feel that they could be whipped, making that happen in practice is very difficult because no-one knows what might happen behind the bike sheds or somewhere else.

We broadly agree with the proposals relating to community councils that come from the

gyfnod o absenoldeb teulu. Serch hynny, rydym yn cytuno â'r pwyllgor yr hoffem bwysleisio'r mater ynglŷn ag aelodau gweithredol a'u nifer. Gwn y byddwch yn edrych ar hynny ac rwyf yn ddiolchgar.

Bydd gwell craffu'n sicr yn arwain at well cynghorau a gwell gwasanaethau i drigolion, a dyna holl bwynt hyn yn y tymor hir. Byddem yn hoffi gweld cynifer o bobl â phosibl yn cael eu cynnwys yn y penderfyniadau hyn a chredwn y dylai'r cyhoedd allu mynd at y broses graffu honno. Rwyf wedi bod yn cefnogi cynigion ers tro i sicrhau bod cadeiryddion pwyllgorau'n wleidyddol gytbwys, ar ôl dioddef mewn mwy nag un lle oherwydd nad yw hynny wedi digwydd. Nid oes llawer o awdurdodau yng Nghymru lle nad yw'r wrthblaid yn cael cadeiriau ac rwyf wedi bod yn aelod o ddau o'r tri lle mae hynny'n digwydd. Felly, er bod y fformiwla fathemategol ar gyfer hynny'n ymddangos yn gymhleth, rydym yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwnnw'n gyffredinol.

Gyda golwg ar y bobl ddynodedig, rwyf yn cytuno â'r pwyllgor ac yn teimlo mai pŵer ac nid dyletswydd ddylai hyn fod. Nid oherwydd ein bod yn teimlo na ddylai pobl fod yn gwneud hyn, ond fel y mae Dai eisoes wedi dweud, petai'n ddyletswydd, efallai y disgwyliad i awdurdodau ddod â phawb i mewn o bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus posibl yn yr awdurdod, ac fe allai hynny fod yn draul ar amser.

Byddwn hefyd yn hoffi pwysleisio'n gryf na ddylai aelodau cyfetholedig gael hawliau pleidleisio. Pe cynigid y dylid rhoi hawliau pleidleisio i aelodau cyfetholedig pwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, byddai hynny'n codi ein gwrychyn yn Siambr. Felly, os nad yw'n ddigon da i'r Cynulliad, pam y byddai'n ddigon da i lywodraeth leol?

Er fy mod yn cytuno y dylai pwyllgorau craffu fod yn annibynnol ac na ddylai aelodau deimlo y gallent gael eu chwipio, mae'n anodd iawn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd yn ymarferol oherwydd nad oes neb yn gwybod beth a allai ddigwydd y tu ôl i'r sied feiciau neu mewn manau eraill.

Rydym yn cytuno'n fras â'r cynigion ynglŷn â chynghorau cymuned sy'n deillio o

Aberystwyth report, which was initiated when we were in Government. There is only one issue, namely that of the promotion of wellbeing, which Dai has mentioned. Many people do not grasp what this means and we would welcome more information on that. It is interesting to see that, in England, the power for councils regarding the promotion of wellbeing is being replaced by general competency. I know that it is not directly related to this, but I see that you have opted out of that in the legislation and that you are keeping the promotion of wellbeing for Wales. The reason that England did that was because it could not define 'wellbeing', and I think that we still have that problem. Therefore, I would like clarification on that. However, generally, we are happy to support the proposed Measure at this stage with the proviso that certain amendments will be made in the future.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I thank colleagues for their contributions, particularly the committee Chairs and members who scrutinised witnesses and me during Stage 1 consideration of the proposals. I was pleased to hear the points raised by Members and the concerns that were raised at committee stage and in the Chamber today. I would like to pick up on one or two of those issues.

Some Members raised issues relating to the strength of the survey. We do not have a survey for understanding who stands for election at the moment. This is a starting point, as I said in committee. It is an opportunity for us to understand who applies to become elected representatives and to address some of the issues that Christine rightly raised about the average councillor being white, male and over 60. If we are looking at how to bring greater diversity to our councils, we need to understand what the proposals are based on and what our starting point is. The survey will hopefully help. We can return to this issue as soon as the first survey has been conducted, and we can look at the outcomes of that. I do not want this proposed local government Measure to become unreasonable and burdensome on local authorities. I want them to deliver good-quality services to the public. I think that we

adroddiad Aberystwyth, a gychwynnwyd pan oeddem ni yn y Llywodraeth. Dim ond un broblem sydd, sef hyrwyddo llesiant, ac mae Dai wedi crybwyll hynny. Mae ystyr hyn yn annelwig i lawer a byddem yn croesawu rhagor o wybodaeth am hynny. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld bod y pŵer i gynghorau ym maes hyrwyddo llesiant yn cael ei ddisodli yn Lloegr gan gymhwysedd cyffredinol. Gwn nad yw'n uniongyrchol gysylltiedig â hyn, ond gwelaf ichi ddewis peidio â gwneud hynny yn y ddeddfwriaeth a'ch bod yn cadw hyrwyddo llesiant ar gyfer Cymru. Rheswm Lloegr dros wneud hynny oedd oherwydd na allai ddiffinio 'llesiant' a chredaf fod y broblem honno gennym ni o hyd. Felly, yn gyffredinol, hoffwn gael eglurhad am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, rydym yn hapus i gefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig yn y cyfnod hwn, ar yr amod y gwneir ambell welliant yn y dyfodol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Diolch i'm cyd-Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau, yn enwedig i Gadeiryddion ac aelodau'r pwyllgorau a fu'n craffu ar dystion ac arnaf finnu wrth ystyried y cynigion yn ystod Cyfnod 1. Roeddwn yn falch o glywed y pwyntiau a godwyd gan yr Aelodau a'r pryderon a godwyd yn ystod cyfnod y pwyllgor ac yn y Siambr heddiw. Hoffwn sôn am un neu ddau o'r materion hynny.

Cododd rhai aelodau bwyntiau am gryfder yr arolwg. Nid oes gennym arolwg i ddeall pwy sy'n sefyll am etholiad ar hyn o bryd. Dyma fan cychwyn, fel y dywedais yn y pwyllgor. Mae'n gyfle inni ddeall pwy sy'n gwneud cais am ddod yn gynrychiolwyr etholedig ac i roi sylw i rai o'r materion yr oedd Christine yn ddigon teg yn eu codi ynglŷn â'r ffaith mai dyn gwyn, dros 60 oed yw'r cynghorydd nodweddiadol. Os ydym yn edrych ar sut mae dod â rhagor o amrywiaeth i'n cynghorau, mae angen inni ddeall ar beth y seilir y cynigion a beth yw ein man cychwyn. Gobeithio y bydd yr arolwg yn help. Gallwn ddychwelyd at y mater hwn cyn gynted ag y bydd yr arolwg cyntaf wedi'i gynnal, a gallwn edrych ar ganlyniadau hynny. Nid wyf am i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar gyfer llywodraeth leol fod yn afresymol ac yn feichus i awdurdodau lleol. Rwyf am iddynt ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon i'r cyhoedd.

can help them through the legislation that we provide from the Assembly.

One aspect of the proposed Measure that I hope will be welcomed is youth representation on town and community councils. We are keen to ensure that that goes through. Jonathan, I understand your concerns about directly elected mayors; I think that this reflects fundamental policy differences between our parties, but I accept your concern on that issue in the first instance.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I accept that this is a policy difference between us. However, do you accept that the Local Government Act 2000 is quite a barrier to the ability of local communities to trigger a referendum, and that there could be ways in which that could be made easier for communities in Wales? It is not a question of whether you agree with elected mayors or not; it is a question of whether communities should be empowered to be able to take those sorts of decisions.

**Carl Sargeant:** I seem to recall that we had a substantial debate several months ago on elected individuals and directly elected mayors. I did not agree with you in principle back then, and it should come as no surprise to you that I do not agree with you now. I do not think that this is a fundamental stumbling block. In terms of the numbers required, local authorities in Wales are much smaller than authorities in England. In Blaenau Gwent, for instance, there could be an opportunity to raise the numbers needed to trigger a ballot if several members stood in the market with a petition on a Saturday morning. The numbers required are significantly lower in Wales than in England, so I do not believe that this is a stumbling block to getting the proposals through.

Veronica raised many issues, and I thank her for her support for the proposed Measure in principle. I met a senior member of an English local authority this morning. English local authorities all wish that they were in Wales because they are in a very different place in terms of funding and opportunity. The reduction in funding in England is very different. I was surprised by his comments,

Credaf y gallwn eu helpu drwy'r ddeddfwriaeth yr ydym yn ei darparu gan y Cynulliad.

Un agwedd a gaiff groeso yn y Mesur arfaethedig gobeithio yw cynrychiolaeth gan bobl ifanc ar gynghorau tref a chymuned. Rydym yn awyddus i sicrhau bod hwnnw'n mynd drwodd. Jonathan, rwyf yn deall eich pryderon am feiri sy'n cael eu hethol yn uniongyrchol; credaf fod hyn yn adlewyrchu gwahaniaethau sylfaenol o ran polisi rhwng ein pleidiau, ond rwyf yn derbyn eich bod yn poeni am hynny yn y lle cyntaf.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Rwyf yn derbyn mai gwahaniaeth rhyngom o ran polisi yw hyn. Serch hynny, a ydych yn derbyn bod Deddf Llywodraeth Leol 2000 yn eithaf rhwystr i gymunedau lleol rhag gallu sbarduno refferendwm ac y gallai fod ffyrdd o wneud hynny'n haws i gymunedau yng Nghymru? Nid mater o gytuno â chael meiri etholedig neu beidio yw hi; ond a ddylid grymuso cymunedau i allu gwneud y mathau hynny o benderfyniadau.

**Carl Sargeant:** Rwyf yn cofio inni gael dadl sylweddol sawl mis yn ôl am unigolion etholedig a meiri sy'n cael eu hethol yn uniongyrchol. Nid oeddwn yn cytuno â chi mewn egwyddor bryd hynny, ac ni ddylai fod yn syndod ichi nad wyf yn cytuno â chi yn awr. Nid wyf yn credu fod hyn yn rhwystr sylfaenol. O ran y niferoedd sy'n ofynnol, mae awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru'n llai o lawer nag awdurdodau yn Lloegr. Ym Mlaenau Gwent, er enghraifft, dylech allu codi'r niferoedd sydd eu hangen i sbarduno balot petai nifer o aelodau'n sefyll yn y farchnad gyda deiseb ar fore Sadwrn. Mae'r niferoedd sy'n ofynnol yn sylweddol is yng Nghymru nag y maent yn Lloegr, felly nid wyf yn credu bod hyn yn rhwystr rhag cael y cynigion drwodd.

Cododd Veronica lawer o bethau, ac rwyf yn diolch iddi am ei chefnogaeth i'r Mesur arfaethedig mewn egwyddor. Cyfarfûm ag un o uwch-aelodau un o awdurdodau lleol Lloegr y bore yma. Mae awdurdodau lleol Lloegr i gyd yn difaru nad ydynt yng Nghymru oherwydd eu bod mewn sefyllfa wahanol iawn o ran ariannu a chyfle. Mae'r gostyngiad yn yr ariannu yn Lloegr yn

and I welcomed them. We are the envy of many colleagues in England at the moment.

wahanol iawn. Roeddwn yn synnu o glywed ei sylwadau ac yn eu croesawu. Mae llawer o'n cyfeillion yn Lloegr yn eiddigeddus iawn ohonom ar hyn o bryd.

I have read the reports and I have listened carefully to Members today. I look forward to resuming this work with Legislation Committee No. 3 next month, when we start detailed consideration of the proposed Measure at Stage 2. I thank everyone for their contributions. I will consider the amendments that have been proposed in the reports very carefully with my team, and I will act on them accordingly. Thank you for the opportunity to bring this proposed Measure to Stage 2 today.

Rwyf wedi darllen yr adroddiadau ac wedi gwrandao'n ofalus ar yr Aelodau heddiw. Edrychaf ymlaen at ailafael yn y gwaith hwn gyda Phwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 3 fis nesaf, pan fyddwn yn dechrau ystyried y Mesur arfaethedig yn ofalus yng Nghyfnod 2. Rwyf yn diolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau. Byddaf yn ystyried y gwelliannau sydd wedi'u cynnig yn yr adroddiadau'n ofalus iawn gyda fy nhîm, a byddaf yn gweithredu ar sail y rheini fel sy'n briodol. Diolch ichi am y cyfle i ddod â'r mesur arfaethedig hwn i Gyfnod 2 heddiw.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? There are no objections, and the motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Nid oes gwrthwynebiad, ac felly derbynir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

**Penderfyniad Ariannol ynghylch y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru)**  
**Financial Resolution in relation to the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure**

*Cynnig NDM4621 Carl Sargeant*

*Motion NDM4621 Carl Sargeant*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, at ddibenion unrhyw ddarpariaethau sy'n deillio o'r Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru), yn cytuno i unrhyw gynnydd mewn gwariant o'r math y cyfeiriwyd ato yn Rheol Sefydlog 23.80(ii)(b) ac (c), sy'n codi o ganlyniad i'r Mesur.*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, for the purposes of any provisions resulting from the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure, agrees to any increase in expenditure of a kind referred to in Standing Order 23.80(ii)(b) and (c), arising in consequence of the Measure.*

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I move the motion.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have no speakers. Minister, do you wish to reply to the debate?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Nid oes gennyf neb i siarad. Weinidog, a ydych am ymateb i'r ddadl?

**Carl Sargeant:** No.

**Carl Sargeant:** Nac ydwyf.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion. Are there any objections? I see that there are none.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif

Therefore, in accordance with Standing Order 7.35, derbynir y cynnig.  
No. 7.35, the motion is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

4.10 p.m.

**Cynnig i Gymeradwyo Egwyddorion Cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch  
Diogelwch ar Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru)  
Motion to Approve the General Principles of the Proposed Safety on Learner  
Transport (Wales) Measure**

*Cynnig NDM4623 Ieuan Wyn Jones*

*Motion NDM4623 Ieuan Wyn Jones*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru,  
yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 23.24:*

*To propose that the National Assembly for  
Wales in accordance with Standing Order  
23.24:*

*Yn cytuno ag egwyddorion cyffredinol y  
Mesur arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch ar  
Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru).*

*Agrees to the general principles of the  
Proposed Safety on Learner Transport  
(Wales) Measure.*

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog  
dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan  
Wyn Jones):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister  
for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan  
Wyn Jones):** I move the motion.

Mae'n bleser gennyf agor y ddaid hon ar egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch ar Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru). Nid oes llawer o bynciau sy'n bwysicach na diogelwch ein plant. Fel rhieni, gwarcheidwaid a dinasyddion, dylem allu disgwyl bod cymaint â phosibl yn cael ei wneud i leihau perygl i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc wrth iddynt deithio i'r ysgol. Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn ein galluogi i adeiladu ar y gwaith llwyddiannus sydd wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn i wella diogelwch ar gludiant i ddysgwyr. Bwriad y Mesur arfaethedig yw cyflwyno gwelliannau allweddol o safbwynt diogelwch cerbydau sy'n cario dysgwyr a chyflwyno nifer o gyfrifoldebau mewn perthynas â safonau bysiau ysgol.

It is a great pleasure to open this debate on the general principles of the Proposed Safety on Learner Transport (Wales) Measure. Few subjects are more important than the safety of our children. As parents, guardians and citizens, we should be able to expect that as much as possible is being done to reduce the dangers for our children and young people as they travel to school. This proposed Measure will enable us to build on the successful work undertaken to date on improving the safety of learner travel. The intention of the proposed Measure is to introduce key improvements to the safety of vehicles that transport learners and to put in place a wide range of duties in relation to the standards of school buses.

Ar y pwynt hwn, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i bawb sydd wedi gweithio gyda ni ar gyflawni'n hamcanion, yn Aelodau'r Cynulliad, swyddogion, cwmnïau trafndiaeth, awdurdodau lleol ac, yn bwysicaf oll, yr ymgyrchwyr sydd wedi ymroi gymaint i'r achos hwn. Rwyf yn gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno bod y Llywodraeth wedi gwrando ac wedi gweithredu yn yr achos hwn. Yn naturiol,

At this point, I would like to pay tribute to all those who have worked with us towards achieving these aims: Assembly Members, officials, transport companies, local authorities and, above all, the campaigners who dedicated so much time and energy to this cause. I hope that you will agree that the Government has listened and acted in this case. Naturally, we will continue to listen as the proposed Measure progresses. Forgive me

byddwn yn parhau i wrando yn ystod taith y Mesur arfaethedig. Maddeuwch i mi am dalu teyrnged arbennig i Ymgyrch Stuart sydd wedi cyfrannu cymaint at y broses o sicrhau newid deddfwriaethol yn y maes hwn. Rwyf yn llongyfarch yr ymgyrchwyr ar y gwaith y maent wedi ei wneud.

Mae consensws wedi datblygu bellach y dylem wneud teithio i'r ysgol yn fwy diogel, yn fwy effeithlon ac yn fwy cynaliadwy i'n plant. Yn ystod blynyddoedd cyntaf y Llywodraeth hon, cyflwynais Fesur arfaethedig ar y pwnc hwn a oedd yn gul ac yn gyfyng iawn o ran ei natur ac roedd hynny'n rhwystredig i mi ac i'r pwyllgor craffu. Rwyf yn cofio ymddangos o flaen y pwyllgor craffu dan gadeiryddiaeth Gareth Jones. Rhoddais addewid i'r pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad y byddwn yn ceisio'r pwerau angenrheidiol gan San Steffan er mwyn cryfhau'r ddeddfwriaeth honno. Ar ôl tair blynedd a tri darn o ddeddfwriaeth, rwyf o'r diwedd yn gallu cyflwyno Mesur arfaethedig y byddwn wedi'i gyflwyno yn y cychwyn pe bai'r pwerau priodol gennym yn 2008. Dyna ddadl arall o blaid pleidlais 'ie' ar 3 Mawrth.

Fel yr eglurais pan gyflwynwyd y Mesur arfaethedig ym mis Medi, mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ymwneud â chwe phrif faes. Mae'r maes cyntaf yn ymwneud â disgrifiadau o gerbydau y gellid eu defnyddio ar gyfer cludiant dan gontract i ddysgwyr. Y bwriad yw cyflwyno rheoliadau a fydd, er enghraifft, yn ein galluogi i sicrhau fod gwregysau diogelwch a chamerau teledu cylch cyfyng ar fysiau ac a fydd yn gwahardd y defnydd o fysiau deulawr. Rwyf yn deall y pryderon ynglŷn â chost cyflwyno'r rheoliadau hynny a byddaf yn ystyried sylwadau'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth ar hyn. Bydd yr adran nesaf yn ei gwneud yn bosibl recordio delweddau gweledol neu sain ar gludiant i ddysgwyr a bydd yn ei gwneud yn bosibl amlinellu trefniadau ynghylch eu defnyddio, eu storio a'u cadw.

Bydd adran 3 yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i Weinidogion Cymru ei gwneud yn ofyniad statudol i ddilyn y fethodoleg a bennir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth gwblhau asesiadau risg ynghylch cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol. Mae adran 4 y Mesur

for paying particular tribute to Stuart's Campaign, which has contributed so much to the process of bringing about legislative change in this field. I congratulate the campaigners on the work that they have undertaken.

There has been a consensus in this place that we should make travelling to school safer, more efficient and more sustainable for our children. During the early days of this Government, I introduced a proposed Measure on this issue that was very limited in scope, which was a great frustration to me and the scrutiny committee at the time. I remember appearing before that committee, chaired by Gareth Jones. I made a commitment to the committee and the Assembly that I would seek the necessary powers from Westminster in order to strengthen that legislation. Three and a half years and three pieces of legislation later, I am at last able to introduce a proposed Measure that, if we had had the appropriate powers in 2008, I would have introduced at the time. That is perhaps another argument for a 'yes' vote on 3 March.

As I explained when introducing the proposed Measure in September, this legislation covers six main areas. The first relates to the description of vehicles that may be used for contracted transport for learners. The intention is to introduce regulations that will enable us to ensure that seat belts and CCTV are fitted on buses and to prohibit the use of double-decker buses. I understand the concerns about the cost of introducing those regulations, and I will consider the comments made by the legislation committee in this regard. The next section will make it possible to record visual images or sound on learner transport and allow arrangements for their use, storage and retention to be set out.

Section 3 will enable the Welsh Ministers to make it a statutory requirement to follow the methodology set out by the Welsh Assembly Government when completing home-to-school transport risk assessments. Section 4 of the proposed Measure covers driver

arfaethedig yn ymwneud â hyfforddiant ar gyfer gyrwyr. Bydd y ddarpariaeth hon yn ei gwneud yn bosibl rhoi dyletswydd ar awdurdodau lleol i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i yrwyr cerbydau a gaiff eu defnyddio ar gyfer cludiant i ddysgwyr dderbyn hyfforddiant penodol, er enghraifft, ynghylch gweithio gyda phlant, y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol ynghylch gwregysau diogelwch ac ymdrin ag ymddygiad heriol. Bydd hyn yn rhan o'r dystysgrif cymhwysedd proffesiynol ar gyfer gyrwyr er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cynnal eu sgiliau.

Mae adran 5 yn ymwneud â goruchwylwyr ar gludiant i ddysgwyr a byddai, er enghraifft, yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i Weinidogion Cymru fynnu bod goruchwylwyr gorfodol yn bresennol ar bob cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol ar gyfer disgyblion ysgolion cynradd.

Mae'r darpariaethau sy'n cynnwys cosbau sifil a gorfodaeth yn adran 6 hyd at adran 11 ac Atodlen A1 wedi'u cynnwys er mwyn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cynnal y safonau uchaf posibl o ran diogelwch ar gerbydau ysgol.

Rwyf yn falch iawn mai canlyniad Cyfnod 1 y broses graffu yw cefnogaeth i egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig, fel y nodir yn adroddiadau Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 4 a'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol. Credaf hefyd fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn sicrhau cydbwysedd priodol rhwng y manylion y mae'n eu cynnwys ar ei wyneb a'r hyn y gall rheoliadau eu pennu. Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol yn cytuno â'r farn hon i raddau helaeth, ond gan gydnabod hefyd y cyfyngiadau o ran amser yr ydym yn eu hwynebu. Ceir nifer o argymhellion a chasgliadau yn yr adroddiadau, ac rwyf wedi'u nodi. Caiff y rhain eu hystyried yn ystod y cyfnod nesaf neu cânt eu hystyried ar yr adeg briodol wrth i'r polisi ar gludiant i ddysgwyr gael ei ddatblygu ymhellach. Rwyf hefyd yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi croesawu'r prisiau manwl a baratowyd i gyd-fynd â'r Mesur arfaethedig, a nodaf y sylwadau a wnaed yn ei adroddiad.

I will comment specifically on the Constitutional Affairs Committee's recommendation that, subject to being able to

training. This provision will enable a duty to be placed on local authorities to require that drivers of vehicles used for learner transport receive specified training, for example, in relation to working with children, current seat belt legislation and dealing with challenging behaviour. This will be part of a professional certificate for drivers to ensure that they maintain their skills.

Section 5 relates to supervisors on learner transport and would, for example, enable Welsh Ministers to require mandatory supervisors on all home to school transport provided for primary school pupils.

The provisions covering sanctions and enforcement in sections 6 through to 11 and Schedule A1 have been included to emphasise the importance of maintaining the highest standards of safety on school vehicles.

I am delighted that Stage 1 scrutiny has resulted in support for the general principles of the proposed Measure, as noted in the reports of Legislation Committee No. 4 and the Constitutional Affairs Committee. I also believe that the proposed Measure provides an appropriate balance between the detail on the face of the proposed Measure and what is left to regulations. I welcome the fact that the Constitutional Affairs Committee shares this view in the main, having acknowledged the time constraints that we are facing. There are a number of recommendations and conclusions in the reports, which I have noted. These will be considered during the next stage or taken into account at the appropriate time in the further development of learner transport policy. I am also pleased that the Finance Committee has welcomed the detailed costings that were prepared to support the proposed Measure, and I note the comments made in its report.

Soniaf yn benodol am argymhelliad y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol y dylid diwygio'r Mesur i gynnwys y gofynion



meet EU requirements, the proposed Measure should be amended to include the detailed seat belt requirements on its face.

I have listened to the calls made during Stage 1 scrutiny to place more specific requirements on the face of the proposed Measure. I advised the legislation committee on 4 November that I had given officials instructions to look at drafting a proposed amendment relating to the fitting of seat belts. I also advised that committee that the draft legislation would have to be notified to the European Commission under the technical standards directive. That directive requires member states to notify the European Commission of any technical regulations, which are described in the directive as including laws prohibiting the use of a product. The purpose of the amendment is effectively to prohibit the use of vehicles not fitted with seat belts, so it requires notification to the European Commission.

I am pleased to advise Members that an amendment to the proposed Measure has been submitted via the Department for Business, Innovation and Skills of the UK Government to the European Commission for its consideration. However, due to time constraints, it might not be possible to bring it as an amendment to this proposed Measure, and it may have to be dealt with in regulations. However, I assure the Assembly that I am doing all that I possibly can to include it on the face of the proposed Measure at the appropriate time. I have also issued a consultation in relation to the draft amendment, which commenced on 10 December. Due to the extremely tight timetable that would allow us to make the proposed Measure during this Assembly term, the consultation period ends on 4 February, and I am pleased that we have already received a number of responses.

Our legislative competence does not allow us to set technical standards for construction or equipment that differ from the standards that apply to particular vehicles. That is why the proposed amendment has been drafted as it is. It achieves the policy objective of ensuring

manwl ynglŷn â gwregysau diogelwch yn y Mesur ei hun, ar yr amod bod modd cyflawni gofynion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.

Rwyf wedi gwrandao ar y galwadau yn ystod craffu Cyfnod 1 am roi mwy o ofynion penodol yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Dywedais wrth y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth ar 4 Tachwedd fy mod wedi rhoi cyfarwyddiadau i swyddogion ystyried drafftio gwelliant arfaethedig ynglŷn â gosod gwregysau diogelwch. Dywedais wrth y pwyllgor hwnnw hefyd y byddai'n rhaid hysbysu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynghylch y ddeddfwriaeth ddrafft o dan y gyfarwyddeb safonau technegol. Mae'r gyfarwyddeb honno'n mynnu bod aelod wladwriaethau'n hysbysu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd ynghylch unrhyw reoliadau technegol, ac mae'r rheini, yn ôl y disgrifiad sydd yn y gyfarwyddeb, yn cynnwys cyfreithiau sy'n gwahardd defnyddio cynnyrch. Pwrpas y gwelliant yn ei hanfod yw gwahardd defnyddio cerbydau nad oes gwregysau diogelwch wedi'u gosod ynddynt. Felly mae gofyn hysbysu'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd.

Rwyf yn falch o roi gwybod i'r Aelodau fod gwelliant i'r Mesur arfaethedig wedi'i gyflwyno i'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd drwy Adran Fusnes, Arloesi a Sgiliau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn iddo'i ystyried. Serch hynny, oherwydd bod amser yn brin, efallai na fydd modd ei gyflwyno'n welliant i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn, ac efallai y bydd yn rhaid ymdrin ag ef mewn rheoliadau. Fodd bynnag, rwyf yn sicrhau'r Cynulliad fy mod yn gwneud popeth posibl sydd yn fy ngallu i'w gynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun ar yr adeg briodol. Rwyf hefyd wedi cynnwys ymgynghoriad ynglŷn â'r gwelliant drafft, a ddechreuodd ar 10 Rhagfyr. Oherwydd yr amserlen eithriadol o dynn a fyddai'n caniatáu inni wneud y Mesur arfaethedig yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn, daw'r cyfnod ymgynghori i ben ar 4 Chwefror, ac rwyf yn falch inni gael nifer o atebion eisoes.

Nid yw ein cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yn caniatáu inni bennu safonau technegol ar gyfer adeiladu neu offer sy'n wahanol i'r safonau sy'n berthnasol i gerbydau penodol. Dyna pam mae'r gwelliant arfaethedig wedi'i ddrafftio fel y mae. Mae'n cyflawni amcan y

that only vehicles fitted with seat belts for every child carried may be used for learner transport in Wales. It removes the 3-for-2 exemption that currently allows three children under the age of 14 to occupy two seats where those seats are not fitted with seat belts. I know that that provision is generally welcomed. Subject to the outcome of the notification and consultation process, and the additional research and analysis, I intend—if time allows—to table the amendment at Stage 3.

The Stage 1 scrutiny has endorsed the general principles of this proposed Measure and has highlighted a number of issues for us to consider further. Whichever way we proceed, the proposed Measure will enable us to make changes to improve the safety standards of motor vehicles used to provide contracted learner transport. I will be happy to respond to any comments made by Members during this debate.

4.20 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** As Chair of Legislation Committee No. 4, I am pleased to be able to contribute to this debate. I thank the committee members for their hard work and consensual approach to the scrutiny of this proposed Measure. I also extend the committee's thanks to all those who gave written and oral evidence, which was invaluable. As always, I also thank the clerks and researchers who made our business so much easier to transact. Finally, I thank the Deputy First Minister and his officials for giving evidence to us on two occasions, and for providing us with additional written information. One of those evidence sessions was quite challenging for the Deputy First Minister, because it was done from north Wales by video-conference.

The proposed Measure itself, although framework in nature, attempts to address the Government's objective of improving the safety standards of dedicated school transport. While we support the general principles of the proposed Measure, our report highlights some areas where we think

polisi, sef sicrhau mai dim ond y cerbydau hynny y gosodwyd gwregysau diogelwch ynddynt ar gyfer pob plentyn a gludir y ceir eu defnyddio i gludo dysgwyr yng Nghymru. Mae'n dileu'r eithriad 3 ar gyfer 2 sydd ar hyn o bryd yn caniatáu i dri o blant o dan 14 oed eistedd mewn dwy sedd lle nad oes gwregysau diogelwch ar y seddi hynny. Gwn fod croeso cyffredinol i'r ddarpariaeth honno. A dibynnu beth fydd canlyniad yr hysbysu a'r broses ymgynghori a'r ymchwil a'r dadansoddi ychwanegol, bwriadaf—os bydd amser yn caniatáu—gyflwyno'r gwelliant yng Nghyfnod 3.

Yn ystod craffu Cyfnod 1 cymeradwywyd egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig hwn gan dynnu sylw at nifer o faterion yr oedd gofyn inni eu hystyried rhagor. Pa ffordd bynnag y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen, bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn ein galluogi i newid pethau er mwyn gwella safonau diogelwch cerbydau modur a ddefnyddir i gludo dysgwyr o dan gontract. Byddaf yn falch o ymateb i unrhyw sylwadau gan yr Aelodau yn ystod y ddadl hon.

**Jenny Randerson:** A minnau'n Gadeirydd Pwyllgor Deddwriaeth Rhif 4, rwyf yn falch o'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled a'u hagwedd gydweithredol at graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Estynnaf ddiolch y pwyllgor hefyd i bawb sydd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig a llafar, cyfraniad a oedd yn amhrisiadwy. Fel arfer, hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r clerod a'r ymchwilwyr a wnaeth ein gwaith ni gymaint yn haws. Yn olaf, diolch i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ac i'w swyddogion am roi tystiolaeth inni ddwywaith, ac am roi gwybodaeth ysgrifenedig ychwanegol inni. Roedd un o'r sesiynau tystiolaeth hynny'n eithaf anodd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog oherwydd ei bod yn cael ei chynnal o'r gogledd drwy gynhadledd fideo.

Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig ei hun, er mai natur fframwaith sydd iddo, yn ceisio mynd i'r afael ag amcan y Llywodraeth sef gwella safonau diogelwch cludiant sy'n arbennig ar gyfer ysgolion. Er ein bod yn cefnogi egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig, mae ein hadroddiad yn tynnu

that the legislation could be improved. We are content to recommend that the Assembly agrees the general principles of the proposed Measure, insofar as it provides a framework within which the Government will further implement its policy objectives on learner transport.

Looking at the scope of the proposed Measure, in relation to travel during the school day, we note the evidence from the Deputy First Minister that the policy objective was to create a legislative framework for home to school travel only. We support this objective, but we received evidence that we should go beyond that simple home to school travel issue. I remind Members that this is the Proposed Learner Transport (Wales) Measure, not the proposed home to school transport Measure; that may be why there was some confusion and misunderstanding among people who gave evidence as to whether it could be extended to include travel during the school day. However, we believe that there should be no distinction made between learner transport provided for home to school travel and learner transport provided for travel during the school day, based on the evidence that we received. It is our view that pupils travelling on contracted school transport should be afforded the same safety standards, regardless of the time of day that they are travelling.

We note the Deputy First Minister's evidence that the decision to exclude transport provided during the school day from the scope of the proposed Measure was one of policy, not one of legislative competence. We recommend that he amends the proposed Measure to include a provision that would enable a future Minister to make regulations applying the provisions of the proposed Measure to transport provided for pupils during the school day, although we recognise that, before making any such regulations, the Minister would need to consult fully with stakeholders. I should mention that two members of the committee did not support this recommendation. Although they agreed that the evidence demonstrated a need for the safety standards to apply to learner transport during the school day, they believed that this

sylw at rai meysydd lle y credwn y gellid gwella'r ddeddfwriaeth. Rydym yn fodlon argymhell bod y Cynulliad yn cytuno ar egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig, i'r graddau y mae'n cynnig fframwaith i'r Llywodraeth roi ei hamcanion polisi ar waith yng nghyswllt cludo dysgwyr.

Ac edrych ar gwmpas y Mesur arfaethedig, o ran teithio yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol, nodwn dystiolaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mai amcan y polisi oedd creu fframwaith deddfwriaethol ar gyfer teithio rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol yn unig. Cefnogwn yr amcan hwn, ond cawsom dystiolaeth y dylem fynd y tu hwnt i'r mater syml hwnnw o deithio rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol. Atgoffaf yr Aelodau mai Mesur Arfaethedig ar gyfer Cludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru) yw hwn, nid y Mesur arfaethedig ar gyfer cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol, ac efallai mai dyna pam yr oedd rhywfaint o ddryswech a chamddealltwriaeth ymhlith y bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth ynghylch ag a fyddai modd ei ehangu i gynnwys teithio yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Serch hynny, credwn, ar sail y dystiolaeth a gawsom, na ddylid gwahaniaethu rhwng y cludiant a ddarperir i ddysgwyr deithio rhwng eu cartref a'u hysgol a'r cludiant a ddarperir i ddysgwyr deithio yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Ein barn ni yw y dylid sicrhau'r un safonau diogelwch i ddisgyblion sy'n teithio ar gludiant o dan gontract i ysgolion, ni waeth faint o'r gloch y byddant yn teithio.

Nodwn dystiolaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog mai penderfyniad polisi oedd y penderfyniad i eithrio cludiant a ddarperir yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol o gwmpas y Mesur arfaethedig ac nad penderfyniad cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ydoedd. Rydym yn argymhell ei fod yn diwygio'r Mesur arfaethedig i gynnwys darpariaeth a fyddai'n galluogi Gweinidog yn y dyfodol i wneud rheoliadau sy'n rhoi darpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig ar waith ar gyfer cludiant a ddarperir i ddisgyblion yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol, er ein bod yn sylweddoli, cyn iddo wneud rheoliadau o'r fath, y byddai angen i'r Gweinidog ymgynghori'n llawn â rhanddeiliaid. Dylwn ddweud nad oedd dau aelod o'r pwyllgor yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad hwn. Er eu bod yn cytuno bod y dystiolaeth yn dangos bod angen i safonau diogelwch fod

was a matter more appropriate for a future Measure.

In relation to the provision of school transport for pupils with additional learning needs, we received evidence from consultees that learners in special schools can often be young vulnerable adults up to the age of 19, and that they would not necessarily be provided for by the proposed Measure, which only goes up to the age of 16. We believe that the lack of provision in the proposed Measure for pupils with additional learning needs aged 17 to 19 is a clear issue that needs to be addressed. However, we realise that further work would need to be undertaken before legislating in this area, so we do not believe that the proposed Measure is the appropriate vehicle to achieve this. We recommend that the Deputy First Minister brings forward a Measure at the appropriate time in the future to apply the safety standards provided for in this proposed Measure to pupils with additional learning needs aged 17 to 19 travelling on learner transport.

Turning to the first section of the proposed Measure, which deals with descriptions of vehicles, we note the Deputy First Minister's evidence on seat-belt types, and I note what he has said today. We strongly recommend that any risk assessments promote the use of all-generation seat belts. I believe that the Deputy First Minister has dealt with that.

We consider that it would be prudent to await the outcome of the pilot schemes currently being undertaken in various parts of Wales in relation to the use of closed-circuit television cameras and supervisors on learner transport before drawing any final conclusions on the desirability of phasing out the use of double-decker vehicles. We recommend this approach to the Deputy First Minister.

We also consider that risk assessments should determine the use of double-decker vehicles

yn berthnasol i gludiant i ddysgwyr yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol, credent y byddai'n fwy priodol ymdrin â hyn mewn Mesur yn y dyfodol.

O ran darparu cludiant i ysgolion ar gyfer disgyblion a chanddynt anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, cawsom dystiolaeth gan y rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy y gall dysgwyr mewn ysgolion arbennig yn aml fod yn oedolion ifanc agored i niwed hyd at 19 oed, ac na fyddai'r Mesur arfaethedig o reidrwydd yn darparu ar gyfer y rhain gan nad yw ond yn berthnasol i bobl hyd at 16 oed. Credwn fod y diffyg darpariaeth yn y Mesur arfaethedig ar gyfer disgyblion ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol sydd rhwng 17 ac 19 oed yn amlwg yn fater y mae angen rhoi sylw iddo. Serch hynny, sylweddolwn y byddai angen gwneud rhagor o waith cyn deddfu yn y maes hwn, felly, ni chredwn mai'r Mesur arfaethedig yw'r cyfrwng priodol ar gyfer gwneud hyn. Argymhellwn y dylai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gyflwyno Mesur ar yr adeg briodol yn y dyfodol i roi'r safonau diogelwch y darperir ar eu cyfer yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar waith ar gyfer disgyblion rhwng 17 ac 19 oed sydd ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol ac sy'n teithio ar gludiant i ddysgwyr.

A throi at adran gyntaf y Mesur arfaethedig, sy'n ymdrin â disgrifiadau o gerbydau, nodwn dystiolaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am fathau o wregysau diogelwch, a nodaf yr hyn y mae wedi'i ddweud heddiw. Argymhellwn yn gryf y dylai unrhyw asesiadau risg hyrwyddo defnyddio gwregysau diogelwch i bob cenhedlaeth. Credaf fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi ymdrin â hynny.

Credwn y byddai'n ddoeth disgwyl am ganlyniad y cynlluniau peilot sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, lle y defnyddir camerâu teledu cylch cyfun a goruchwylwyr ar gludiant i ddysgwyr, cyn penderfynu'n derfynol pa mor ddymunol fyddai rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio cerbydau deulawr. Rydym yn argymhell mai fel hyn y dylai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fynd o'i chwmpas hi.

Credwn hefyd y dylid penderfynu sut y defnyddir cerbydau deulawr ar gyfer cludiant

for learner transport in relation to individual schools. Any regulations made under section 1 should enable the retention of double-decker vehicles in cases where a risk assessment had shown that their continuing use was necessary for safety reasons. Prior to any implementation of this policy, we recommend that the Deputy First Minister undertakes an audit of the number of schools in Wales that do not have adequate space on-site to accommodate an increase in the number of single-decker vehicles as a result of phasing out double-deckers.

It is important for there to be a clear line of accountability in relation to Criminal Records Bureau checks for drivers of taxis and private hire vehicles used for learner transport. We suggest that one way of achieving this would be requiring a valid CRB check as part of any contractual arrangement with a taxi or private hire vehicle company, or with an individual driver, where applicable.

In relation to section 2, we believe that there should be robust regulation of the use, storage and retention of, and access to, footage from CCTV cameras on learner transport. We note that section 2 of the proposed Measure makes provision for such regulation and we welcome the Deputy First Minister's commitment to consult on those regulations. We hope that he does so at the earliest opportunity. Regulations made under section 2 should address whether footage from CCTV cameras could be used for training purposes, and, if so, how and to what extent.

We have other comments on further sections that it is not possible to deal with within today's time allocation. As a result of the framework nature of the proposed Measure, many questions were asked during the evidence gathering that the Deputy First Minister will need to answer when consultation is undertaken on regulations.

**Angela Burns:** The Finance Committee has examined the financial consequences of this proposed Measure. It is very grateful to the Deputy First Minister, as the Minister

i ddysgwyr yng nghyswllt ysgolion unigol drwy gynnal asesiadau risg. Dylai unrhyw reoliadau a wneir o dan adran 1 alluogi awdurdodau i barhau i ddefnyddio cerbydau deulawr lle y byddai'r asesiad risg wedi dangos bod hynny'n angenrheidiol am resymau diogelwch. Cyn rhoi'r polisi hwn ar waith mewn unrhyw ffordd, rydym yn argymhell y dylai'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gynnal archwiliad i weld faint o ysgolion yng Nghymru a fyddai'n brin o le ar eu safle i ymdopi â'r cynnydd yn nifer y cerbydau unllawr, pe rhoddid y gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio rhai deulawr.

Mae'n bwysig cael llinell atebolrwydd glir yng nghyswllt archwiliadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol i yrwyr tacsis a cherbydau llogi preifat a ddefnyddir i gludo dysgwyr. Awgrymwn mai un ffordd o gyflawni hyn fyddai mynnu archwiliad dilys gan y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol fel rhan o unrhyw drefniant contract gyda chwmmi tacsis neu gerbydau llogi preifat, neu gyda gyrrwr unigol, lle bo hynny'n berthnasol.

O ran adran 2, credwn y dylid rheoleiddio'n llym ddefnyddio, storio a chadw delweddau camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng a ddefnyddir ar gludiant i ddysgwyr, yn ogystal â rheoleiddio'r hawl i'w gweld. Nodwn fod adran 2 y Mesur arfaethedig yn darparu ar gyfer rheoleiddio o'r fath ac rydym yn croesawu ymrwymiad y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i ymgynghori ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau hynny. Rydym yn gobeithio y gwnaiff hynny ar y cyfle cyntaf posibl. Dylai rheoliadau a wneir o dan adran 2 ddweud a ellid defnyddio delweddau camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng at ddibenion hyfforddi, ac os felly, sut ac i ba raddau.

Mae gennym sylwadau eraill ynglŷn ag adrannau eraill nad oes modd ymdrin â hwy o fewn yr amser sydd ar gael heddiw. Oherwydd natur fframwaith y Mesur arfaethedig, gofynnwyd llawer o gwestiynau wrth gasglu tystiolaeth y bydd angen i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog eu hateb pan ymgynghorir ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau.

**Angela Burns:** Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi archwilio canlyniadau ariannol y Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Mae'n ddiolchgar iawn i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, sef y Gweinidog

responsible for the proposed Measure, and to his officials for providing evidence to the committee and for answering Members' questions.

The explanatory memorandum says that the proposed Measure

'aims to improve the image and quality of dedicated learner transport and to ensure that safety standards are sufficiently high for the public and parents to have confidence in dedicated learner transport'.

The Finance Committee welcomes the inclusion within the proposed Measure of a detailed analysis of the likely costs. It noted the Deputy First Minister's statement that there would be consultation on the changes and that they would be phased in to local authorities' time frame for existing contracts, so that changes can occur at the point of renewal.

The overall cost of fitting seat belts to learner transport is estimated at between £1.5 million and £4.5 million. That is a wide estimate, the reason for which is a serious lack of information. While the school transport survey records that 141 buses do not have seat belts fitted, the position for a further 260 buses—almost twice as many—is not known. The Finance Committee finds it difficult to understand why local authorities are unwilling to provide this information and is disappointed that policy planning has to proceed on the basis of incomplete data. Given the tight financial situation, it is regrettable that further effort and cost will need to be incurred in order to obtain the full picture.

Annex C to the explanatory memorandum says that, according to the local government data unit, a total of 132 double-decker buses carry a total of 8,872 students. It goes on to estimate that, to replace them, there would be a need for 225 single-decker vehicles, the additional running costs for which would be some £2.8 million. The Finance Committee was concerned that on top of these, there could be hidden costs, such as for schools

sy'n gyfrifol am y Mesur arfaethedig, ac i'w swyddogion am ddarparu tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor ac am ateb cwestiynau'r Aelodau.

Dywed y memorandwm esboniadol mai nod y Mesur arfaethedig yw

'gwella delwedd ac ansawdd cludiant penodedig i ddysgwyr a sicrhau bod y safonau diogelwch yn ddigon uchel i ennyn hyder y cyhoedd a'r rhieni mewn cludiant penodedig i ddysgwyr'.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn croesawu bod dadansoddiad manwl o'r costau tebygol wedi'u cynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Nododd ddatganiad y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y byddai'n ymgynghori ynglŷn â'r newidiadau ac y byddent yn cael eu cyflwyno'n raddol yn unol ag amserlenni contractau presennol yr awdurdodau lleol, er mwyn iddynt allu newid pethau wrth adnewyddu'r contractau hynny.

Amcangyfrifir y bydd gosod gwregysau diogelwch ar gludiant i ddysgwyr yn costio rhwng £1.5 miliwn a £4.5 miliwn. Mae'r amcangyfrif hwnnw'n un eang, a'r rheswm dros hyn yw'r prinder gwybodaeth dybryd. Er bod yr arolwg cludiant i ysgolion yn cofnodi nad oes gwregysau diogelwch wedi'u gosod ar 141 o fysiau, ni wyddys beth yw'r sefyllfa ar 260 o fysiau eraill—sef bron ddwywaith gynifer. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei chael yn anodd deall pam nad yw awdurdodau lleol yn barod i ddarparu'r wybodaeth hon ac mae'n siomedig ei bod yn rhaid i'r gwaith cynllunio polisi fynd rhagddo ar sail data anghyflawn. Ac ystyried y sefyllfa ariannol dynn, mae'n resyn y bydd angen gwneud rhagor o ymdrech ac ysgwyddo mwy o gostau er mwyn cael y darlun llawn.

Mae Atodiad C i'r memorandwm esboniadol yn dweud, yn ôl yr uned ddata llywodraeth leol, y gall cyfanswm o 132 o fysiau deulawr gludo cyfanswm o 8,872 o fyfyrwyr. Aiff rhagddo i amcangyfrif y byddai angen 225 o gerbydau unllawr yn eu lle, ac mai cost ychwanegol eu rhedeg fyddai oddeutu £2.8 miliwn. Roedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn poeni y gallai fod costau cudd ar ben y rhain, megis costau i ysgolion na fyddent efallai'n gallu

that might not be able to accommodate the required number of single-decker vehicles. The committee was also interested to know whether the increase in the number of buses would lead to an increase in other costs, such as driver insurance. The Deputy First Minister said that he did not think that the hidden costs would be substantial, because the vast majority of vehicles are single decker. He was not aware of any major difficulties in accommodating a larger number of buses on school premises.

4.30 p.m.

The figures in the explanatory memorandum indicate that a significant number of vehicles do not have closed-circuit television systems installed and that the position is unknown for a further significant number. The committee noted that there is also work to be done in developing the use of these systems, including training vehicle operators. Work is also required on the ways in which data can be stored so as to meet legal and other requirements. The Finance Committee noted that, until this work is further progressed, it will be difficult to have much confidence in the estimates of costs.

In summary, the Finance Committee welcomed the detailed costings that have been prepared by the Government to support this proposed Measure, although there are still some significant uncertainties due to the lack of information available from third parties. We were disappointed at that, and we feel that there should be a more substantial and synergistic way of working between local authorities and the Welsh Assembly Government.

Despite the Deputy First Minister's confidence, the committee remains concerned that the increased number of single-decker vehicles might present difficulties for some schools due to the increased space requirement. The committee notes also that further work will be needed on the development of closed-circuit television systems in learner transport.

However, subject to these observations, and that further information coming through, the Finance Committee has no financial

dod o hyd i le i'r nifer ofynnol o gerbydau unllawr. Roedd gan y pwyllgor ddiddordeb hefyd mewn gwybod a fyddai'r cynnydd yn nifer y bysiau'n arwain at gynyddu costau eraill, megis yswiriant i yrwyr. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog nad oedd yn meddwl y byddai'r costau cudd yn sylweddol, oherwydd mai cerbydau unllawr yw mwyafrif helaeth y cerbydau. Nid oedd yn ymwybodol o unrhyw anawsterau mawr o ran dod o hyd i le i ragor o fysiau ar dir ysgolion.

Mae'r ffigurau yn y memorandwm esboniadol yn dangos bod nifer sylweddol o gerbydau nad oes systemau teledu cylch cyfyng wedi'u gosod ynddynt ac na wyddys beth yw sefyllfa nifer fawr o fysiau eraill. Nododd y pwyllgor fod gwaith i'w wneud hefyd i ddatblygu sut y defnyddir y systemau hyn, gan gynnwys hyfforddi gweithredwyr cerbydau. Mae gofyn gwneud gwaith hefyd ar sut y gellir storio data er mwyn cydymffurfio â gofynion cyfreithiol a gofynion eraill. Nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, nes y gwneir rhagor o waith ar hyn, y bydd yn anodd teimlo'n ffyddiog iawn yn yr amcangyfrifon ar gyfer y costau.

I grynhoi, croesawodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid y costau manwl y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u paratoi'n gefn i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn, er bod nifer o bethau sylweddol o hyd yn ansicr oherwydd bod yr wybodaeth sydd ar gael gan drydydd partïon yn brin. Roedd hynny'n siom inni, a theimlwn y dylai fod ffordd fwy sylweddol a chydweithredol o weithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Er gwaethaf hyder y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, mae'r pwyllgor yn poeni o hyd y gallai cynyddu nifer y cerbydau unllawr achosi anawsterau i rai ysgolion oherwydd y bydd gofyn cael mwy o le. Mae'r pwyllgor yn nodi hefyd y bydd angen gwneud rhagor o waith i ddatblygu systemau teledu cylch cyfun ar gludiant i ddysgwyr.

Serch hynny, ar wahân i'r sylwadau hyn, ac, a bwrw y daw rhagor o wybodaeth i law, nid oes gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid wrthwynebiad

objection to the proposed Measure.

**Janet Ryder:** The Constitutional Affairs Committee considered the proposed Measure on 10 November and is grateful to the Deputy First Minister for his evidence and that of his officials. We also considered additional written evidence from the Minister on 8 December 2010, and reported on 15 December. Our report is available as a supporting document to this debate.

I would like to say at the outset that I welcome the assurance given by the Minister today on the recommendations that we have made. We were made aware of some concerns, particularly from SNAP Cymru and Stuart's Campaign, that more detail should be included on the face of the proposed Measure. The Deputy First Minister indicated his willingness to include as much detail as possible on the face of the proposed Measure, particularly in relation to seatbelts. However, he also outlined, as he has done today, the constraints faced by the Welsh Government in relation to consulting the European Union on technical standards for seatbelts, and the need for the proposed Measure to be approved before the dissolution of the Assembly.

We were also aware of the delay in getting the relevant powers in the first place, because of the legislative competence Order process. We are content with the explanation that we received of the constraints the Government faces, and of the Minister's best intentions to include as much detail as possible on the face of the proposed Measure. As I said, I very much welcome the comments that he made earlier, and feel that they are very much in line with the thrust of our recommendations, which I will outline shortly.

We were further reassured by the fact that all regulations made under this proposed Measure will use the affirmative procedure, and will therefore be debated in the Assembly. Nevertheless, we do not believe

ariannol i'r Mesur arfaethedig.

**Janet Ryder:** Ystyriodd y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol y Mesur arfaethedig ar 10 Tachwedd ac mae'n ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am ei dystiolaeth ac am dystiolaeth ei swyddogion. Ystyriwyd tystiolaeth ysgrifenedig ychwanegol hefyd a gawsom gan y Gweinidog ar 8 Rhagfyr 2010, a chyflwynwyd adroddiad ar 15 Rhagfyr. Mae ein hadroddiad ar gael ar ffurf dogfen atodol i'r ddadl hon.

Hoffwn ddweud ar y dechrau fy mod yn croesawu'r sicrwydd a roddwyd gan y Gweinidog heddiw am yr argymhellion yr ydym wedi'u gwneud. Cawsom wybod am ambell beth a oedd yn destun pryder, gan SNAP Cymru ac Ymgyrch Stuart yn benodol, a oedd yn credu y dylid cynnwys rhagor o fanylion yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ei fod yn barod i gynnwys cynifer o fanylion â phosibl yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun yn enwedig yng nghyswllt gwregysau diogelwch. Serch hynny, dywedodd hefyd, fel y mae wedi gwneud heddiw, fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn cael ei chyfyngu am ei bod yn rhaid iddi ymgynghori â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd ynghylch safonau technegol gwregysau diogelwch a bod angen i'r Mesur arfaethedig gael ei gymeradwyo cyn diddymu'r Cynulliad.

Roeddem yn ymwybodol hefyd o'r oedi a fu wrth geisio cael y pwerau perthnasol yn y lle cyntaf, oherwydd proses y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol. Rydym yn fodlon ar yr esboniad a gawsom ynglŷn â'r cyfyngiadau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu hwynebu, a bod gan y Gweinidog bob bwriad da o gynnwys cynifer o fanylion ag y bo modd yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Fel y dywedais, rwyf yn croesawu'n fawr iawn y sylwadau a wnaeth gynnau, ac yn teimlo'u bod yn gydnaws iawn â byrdwn ein hargymhellion. Soniaf am y rhain maes o law.

Tawelwyd ein meddwl hefyd o glywed y bydd yr holl reoliadau a wneir o dan y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn defnyddio'r weithdrefn gadarnhaol ac felly y cynhelir dadl yn eu cylch yn y Cynulliad. Serch hynny, nid ydym



that time constraints should lead us to make laws differently. We have, therefore, called on the Deputy First Minister to do all that he can to bring forward amendments at Stage 2 to put detail on the face of the proposed Measure where appropriate.

We had a number of other relatively minor concerns that are set out in our report, but we were satisfied in each case with the explanations that we received from the Minister and his officials. In conclusion, we are satisfied that the proposed Measure generally achieves the correct balance between the powers on its face and the subordinate legislation powers given to Welsh Ministers. We also welcome the fact that the affirmative procedure is to be used for all the subordinate legislation provisions in the proposed Measure. As regards the subordinate legislation provisions it contains, we see no reason why the National Assembly should not agree to the general principles of the proposed Measure.

**Darren Millar:** I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate this afternoon. As a parent, I can honestly say that there is no more precious cargo than our children. Following the tragic incidents and accidents that have taken place in our country over the years—we can all remember the tragic death of Stuart Cunningham-Jones—it is clear that we need to make some progress in improving the safety standards on our home-to-school transport vehicles. Therefore, we welcome the principles of the proposed Measure and will be supporting the motion today. However, there are some issues that I wish to raise with the Deputy First Minister, and I hope that he will respond positively to them.

First, we recognise the time constraints that the Deputy First Minister has been working within, particularly the length of time that it has taken for the powers to be drawn down to the National Assembly for Wales. However, notwithstanding the time constraints that we are up against with regards to the Assembly election, I wonder whether you will have the opportunity, Deputy First Minister, to put some of the firm principles that we know

yn credu y dylem wneud cyfreithiau mewn ffordd wahanol dim ond oherwydd bod yr amser yn brin. Felly, rydym wedi galw ar y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i wneud popeth yn ei allu i gyflwyno gwelliannau yng Nghyfnod 2 er mwyn rhoi manylion yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun lle bo hynny'n briodol.

Roeddem yn poeni am nifer o bethau cymharol fân eraill hefyd y cyfeirir atynt yn ei hadroddiad, ond roeddem yn fodlon ym mhob achos ar yr esboniadau a gawsom gan y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion. I gloi, rydym yn fodlon bod y Mesur arfaethedig ar y cyfan yn sicrhau'r cydbwysedd iawn rhwng y pwerau sydd yn y Mesur ei hun a'r pwerau isddeddfwriaeth a roddir i Weinidogion Cymru. Rydym yn croesawu hefyd y ffaith y caiff y weithdrefn gadarnhaol ei defnyddio ar gyfer holl ddarpariaethau isddeddfwriaeth y Mesur arfaethedig. O ran y darpariaethau isddeddfwriaeth sydd ynddo, ni welwn pam na ddylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gytuno ar egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig.

**Darren Millar:** Rwyf yn croesawu'r cyfle hwn i siarad yn y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma. A minnau'n rhiant, gallaf ddweud yn onest nad oes dim byd mwy gwerthfawr yn cael ei gludo na'n plant. Ar ôl y digwyddiadau a'r damweiniau trasig sydd wedi digwydd yn ein gwlad dros y blynyddoedd—gallwn i gyd gofio marwolaeth drasig Stuart Cunningham-Jones—mae'n amlwg bod angen inni wneud rhywfaint o gynnydd o ran sicrhau gwell safonau diogelwch yn y cerbydau sy'n cludo plant rhwng eu cartref a'u hysgol. Felly, rydym yn croesawu egwyddorion y mesur arfaethedig a byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig heddiw. Serch hynny, mae ambell beth yr hoffwn ei godi gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, gan obeithio y bydd yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol iddynt.

Yn gyntaf, rydym yn cydnabod bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi bod yn gweithio o fewn cyfyngiadau amser, yn enwedig yr amser mae wedi'i gymryd i'r pwerau gael eu tynnu i lawr i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Serch hynny, er bod amser yn brin oherwydd etholiad y Cynulliad, tybed a gewch gyfle, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, i roi rhai o'r egwyddorion cadarn y gwyddom fod cytundeb trawsbleidiol yn eu cylch yn y

have cross-party agreement in the Assembly on the face of the proposed Measure, and not just the ones in respect of the seat belts, if there is a positive response from the EU on that issue. I wonder whether you will be able to respond positively to that call this afternoon.

Secondly, the issue of cost has been touched on by a number of speakers in the debate so far. There are some concerns in local government in particular about the cost of the implementation of this proposed Measure, which ranges up to £46 million. Deputy First Minister, we need to hear from you a concrete and cast-iron guarantee, if there can possibly be such a thing, stating that you will ensure that local authorities are given sufficient resources to meet the implementation costs of this proposed Measure, because otherwise it simply will not be delivered, which would be extremely regrettable. We know that there will be criminal and civil sanctions on local authorities that fail to implement the new safety regulations, therefore, with regard to enforcement costs, have you given full consideration to ensuring that those resources will be available?

The third area that I want to raise was touched on by Angela Burns, and that is the regulation of the use, storage and retention of footage from CCTV cameras on learner transport and access to it. I noted that the majority of the committee's consultees supported the use of CCTV on learner transport, but I want to echo the concerns of SNAP Cymru and the Association of School and College Learners Cymru that further clarification is needed with regard to who would own those recordings, who would be able to access them, how long they would be stored for and for what purposes they could be used. I hope that the Deputy First Minister will be able to give us some further clarification on that important point in his summary remarks at the end of this debate.

I am conscious of the time, so I will try to wrap things up. The report clearly made reference to the fact that the proposed Measure as it stands simply covers home-to-school transport, and does not cover all

Cynulliad, yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun, yn hytrach na dim ond y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r gwregysau diogelwch, os ceir ymateb cadarnhaol gan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Tybed a allwch ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r cais hwnnw y prynhawn yma.

Yn ail, crybwyllwyd mater y gost gan nifer o siaradwyr yn y ddadl hyd yn hyn. Mae rhai'n poeni, mewn llywodraeth leol yn benodol, am gost rhoi'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar waith, a all fod yn hyd at £46 miliwn. Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, mae angen inni glywed gwarant gadarn ddiamwys gennych, os oes modd cael y fath beth, yn dweud y byddwch yn sicrhau y rhoddir digon o adnoddau i awdurdodau lleol i dalu am gostau gweithredu'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn, oherwydd fel arall, ni chaiff ei gyflawni, a byddai hynny'n resyn mawr. Gwyddom y bydd cosbau troseddol a sifil i awdurdodau lleol na fyddant yn rhoi'r rheoliadau diogelwch newydd ar waith. Felly, gyda golwg ar y costau gorfodi, a ydych wedi ystyried yn llawn sicrhau y bydd yr adnoddau hynny ar gael?

Crybwyllodd Angela Burns y trydydd peth yr wyf am ei godi, sef rheoleiddio'r ffordd y defnyddir delweddau camerâu teledu cylch cyfun ar gludiant i ddysgwyr, ynghyd â sut y caiff y rheini eu storio a'u cadw a phwy gaiff eu gweld. Sylwais fod mwyafrif y rhai yr ymgynghorodd y pwyllgor â hwy yn cefnogi defnyddio teledu cylch cyfyng ar gludiant i ddysgwyr, ond rwyf am adleisio pryderon SNAP Cymru a Chymdeithas Dysgwyr Ysgolion a Cholegau Cymru fod angen rhagor o eglurhad ynghylch pwy fyddai biau'r delweddau hynny, pwy fyddai'n cael eu gweld, am faint y byddent yn cael eu cadw ac at ba ddibenion y ceid eu defnyddio. Rwyf yn gobeithio y bydd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gallu rhoi rhagor o eglurhad inni am y pwynt pwysig hwnnw wrth iddo grynhoi ei sylwadau ar ddiwedd y ddadl hon.

Rwyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser, felly ceisiaf ddirwyn pethau i ben. Roedd yr adroddiad yn cyfeirio'n amlwg at y ffaith mai dim ond cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol y mae'r Mesur yn ei gynnwys ar hyn o bryd, ac nad

learner transport. It is important that you look to extend the scope of the provisions in the proposed Measure, Deputy First Minister. Let us not forget that many of our local authorities are consulting on school modernisation proposals across Wales, which will include the federalisation of schools, which would mean that children would be carted to and from different places, even during the school day, to obtain their education. It is extremely important that to give parents the confidence that we want them to have that their children are safe when they are being transported to and from places of education, we have a proposed Measure that fully encompasses the transport of children between different places of education during the school day. Therefore, Deputy First Minister, I ask you to respond to those points in concluding the debate this afternoon.

**Christine Chapman:** As a member of the legislation committee that scrutinised this proposed Measure, I would like to thank those people who gave us some very valuable evidence. The Chair has outlined the recommendations of our report.

The making of learner transport safer will be very much welcomed by parents the length and breadth of Wales. However, while safety is paramount to the learner, there are other benefits, too, which I want to discuss for a few minutes. We know that not all children use school transport and that there are still many parents who prefer the convenience of the car. I believe that as well as increasing safety, this proposed Measure will go a long way to encourage a greater use of school transport, which must be good for the environment. Encouraging more children to use school transport also has the potential to equip more children with necessary life skills. There are some interesting debates now on the safety of children. Ensuring that children are safe is paramount, but children must also be allowed to experience a level of independence in their communities so that they can be equipped with life skills, self-confidence, and can have a greater sense of engagement with others. Darren Millar has talked about parents having confidence in

yw'n cynnwys yr holl gludiant i ddysgwyr. Mae'n bwysig ichi ystyried ymestyn cwmpas y darpariaethau yn y Mesur arfaethedig, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog. Gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio bod llawer o'n hawdurdodau lleol wrthi'n ymgynghori ynglŷn â chynigion i foderneiddio ysgolion ledled Cymru. Bydd hynny'n cynnwys ffederaleiddio ysgolion. Byddai hynny'n golygu y byddai plant yn cael eu cludo i fannau gwahanol ac oddi yno, hyd yn oed yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol, er mwyn cael eu haddysg. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig, er mwyn i rieni deimlo'n ffyddiog bod eu bod eu plant yn ddiogel wrth iddynt gael eu cludo i ganolfannau addysg ac oddi yno, a dyna ein dymuniad, fod gennym Fesur arfaethedig sy'n cwmpasu'r holl drefniadau i gludo plant rhwng gwahanol fannau addysgu yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Felly, Ddirprwy Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi ymateb i'r pwyntiau hyn wrth gloi'r ddadl y prynhawn yma.

**Christine Chapman:** A minnau'n aelod o'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a fu'n craffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, hoffwn ddiolch i'r bobl hynny a roddodd gryn dipyn o dystiolaeth werthfawr iawn inni. Mae'r Cadeirydd wedi sôn am argymhellion ein hadroddiad.

Bydd rhieni ar hyd ac ar led Cymru'n croesawu'n fawr iawn y camau i wneud cludiant i ddysgwyr yn fwy diogel. Serch hynny, er mai diogelwch yw'r peth pwysicaf i'r dysgwr, mae yna fanteision eraill hefyd, yr wyf am eu trafod am funud neu ddwy. Gwyddom nad yw pob plentyn yn defnyddio cludiant i'r ysgol a bod llawer o rieni o hyd y mae'n well ganddynt hwylustod y car. Credaf, yn ogystal â gwella diogelwch, yr aiff y Mesur arfaethedig hwn gryn ffordd i annog mwy o ddefnydd ar gludiant i ysgolion, a bydd hynny'n anochel er lles yr amgylchedd. Wrth annog rhagor o blant i ddefnyddio cludiant i'r ysgol, gallai hynny hefyd arfogi rhagor o blant â sgiliau angenrheidiol bywyd. Mae nifer o ddadleuon diddorol ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â diogelwch plant. Mae sicrhau diogelwch plant yn hollbwysig, ond rhaid caniatáu i blant hefyd brofi rhywfaint o annibyniaeth yn eu cymunedau er mwyn eu harfogi â sgiliau bywyd a hunanhyder, ac er mwyn iddynt feithrin mwy o gysylltiad â phobl eraill. Mae Darren Millar wedi sôn am

school transport, but it is also about equipping children with confidence for later life. We need to note that as well.

4.40 p.m.

On training, we took good evidence that looked at the need for adequate training for drivers and supervisors, particularly in relation to young people with additional learning needs. For example, I am aware of cases of children with autism who have not been dealt with appropriately by drivers and supervisors. Parents have told me that their autistic children function best when they have a routine, and they can be upset by change and by the insensitivity of drivers and supervisors. Parents have told me that that can be very traumatic for their children and can start the school day off badly, which clearly is not conducive to learning. I was pleased that we took that evidence, and I am pleased that an emphasis has been placed on that in the proposed Measure.

**Peter Black:** The Liberal Democrats support the proposed Measure. We also support the committee's report fully, and there are several issues that we would like the Deputy First Minister to have a look at. Many of the details have been mentioned by the Chair of the legislation committee and others, and I do not intend to repeat those. I will concentrate on three particular issues. The use of double-decker buses was of particular concern to several witnesses to the committee. When I chaired the former Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, which looked at school transport originally, the committee took evidence relating to double-decker buses, and recommended in its report that they should be phased out. However, there was a clear indication in the evidence that we received this time that there are issues with phasing out of double-decker buses. I suppose that, once you are faced with the reality of it happening, you start to see the problems, in particular, as has been mentioned, in relation to the fact that one double-decker bus takes up less room than two single-decker buses and a number of school premises would not necessarily be able to accommodate an increased number of single-decker buses.

ennyn hyder rhieni mewn cludiant i ysgolion, ond mae a wnelo hyn hefyd ag arfogi plant â'r hyder i fyw yn y dyfodol. Mae angen inni nodi hynny hefyd.

O ran hyfforddiant, clywsom dystiolaeth dda a oedd yn ystyried bod angen sicrhau hyfforddiant digonol i yrwyr a goruchwylwyr, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt pobl ifanc ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Er enghraifft, rwyf yn gwybod am blant ag awtistiaeth sydd heb gael eu trin yn briodol gan yrwyr a goruchwylwyr. Mae rhieni wedi dweud wrthyf fod eu plant awtistig ar eu gorau pan fyddant yn dilyn trefn reolaidd, a bod newid ac ansensitifrwydd gywyrwyr a goruchwylwyr yn gallu tarfu arnynt. Mae rhieni wedi dweud wrthyf y gall hynny fod yn drawmatig iawn i'w plant a'i fod yn gallu golygu eu bod yn cael dechrau gwael i'w diwrnod. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n beth da ar gyfer dysgu. Roeddwn yn falch inni gael y dystiolaeth honno, ac rwyf yn falch bod pwyslais wedi'i roi ar hynny yn y Mesur arfaethedig.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig. Rydym hefyd yn llwyr gefnogi adroddiad y pwyllgor, ac mae nifer o bethau y byddem yn hoffi i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog edrych arnynt. Mae Cadeirydd y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a phobl eraill eisoes wedi crybwyll llawer o'r manylion ac nid wyf yn bwriadu ailadrodd y rheini. Bwriadaf ganolbwyntio ar dri pheth penodol. Roedd defnyddio bysiau deulawr yn destun pryder arbennig i nifer o'r tystion a ddaeth gerbron y pwyllgor. Pan oeddwn yn cadeirio'r hen Bwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a fu'n edrych ar gludiant i ysgolion yn y lle cyntaf, clywodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth ynghylch bysiau deulawr, ac argymhelliad ei adroddiad oedd y dylid rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i'w defnyddio. Serch hynny, roedd awgrym clir yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom y tro hwn y gallai rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio bysiau deulawr beri anawsterau. Mae'n debyg mai wrth i chi wynebu realiti hyn y dechreuwch chi weld y problemau, a'r rheini'n benodol, fel y crybwyllwyd, yng nghyswllt y ffaith bod angen llai o le i un bws deulawr nag i ddau fws unllawr. Byddai nifer o ysgolion o bosibl yn ei chael hi'n anodd dod o hyd i le i

Therefore, there does need to be some flexibility in how the proposed Measure is rolled out to ensure that schools are able to embark and disembark pupils safely. It may well be the case that, in some areas, double-decker buses may need to continue to be used as part of the regime.

The second issue that I wanted to talk about is that of closed-circuit television. Again, the report of the former Education and Lifelong Learning Committee highlighted the use of CCTV, and we heard evidence of one experiment where pupils were given designated seats, which was enforced by CCTV. It was therefore always easy to identify a pupil who was misbehaving on a bus on the CCTV, and action could then be taken against that pupil. However, when CCTV is used in that way, there should be a robust code of conduct on how it will be used and what happens to the footage. Clearly, if there is an incident, headteachers will need to get hold of the footage quickly to identify the perpetrators, and, sometimes, as has been pointed out, it may be that the driver is at fault, and the CCTV might also highlight that. Therefore, having that footage available is useful, but it is important that we are clear about who has access to the footage, what happens to it, how it is stored and how long it is stored for. All that needs to be encapsulated in a code of conduct. The last thing that we want to see is footage from CCTV cameras on school buses appearing on one of those reality TV programmes that gathers up CCTV footage from around the country.

The last point that I would like to raise is the thorny issue of how we define transport that will be subject to the proposed Measure. The point has been well made that it is all very well legislating for safety and good behaviour on transport to and from school, but the current curriculum is very different to that which existed when the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee looked at this issue in relation to the 14-19 agenda. Pupils now travel much more during the school day between sites as a result of this change. There should be no difference between the

ragor o fysiau unllawr. Felly, mae angen cael rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd yn y ffordd y lledaenir y Mesur arfaethedig er mwyn sicrhau bod ysgolion yn gallu trefnu i'w disgyblion fynd ar y bysiau a dod oddi arnynt yn ddiogel. Efallai, mewn ambell ardal, y bydd angen parhau i ddefnyddio bysiau deulawr yn rhan o'r drefn.

Yr ail bwynt yr oeddwn am sôn amdano oedd teledu cylch cyfyng. Unwaith eto, roedd adroddiad yr hen Bwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn tynnu sylw at sut y defnyddid teledu cylch cyfyng, a chlywsom dystiolaeth am un arbrawf lle y neilltuwyd seddi penodol i ddisgyblion. Gorfodwyd y drefn honno drwy ddefnyddio teledu cylch cyfyng. Felly, roedd bob tro'n rhwydd adnabod disgybl a oedd yn cambyhafio ar fws ar y teledu cylch cyfyng. Yna, gellid cymryd camau yn erbyn y disgybl hwnnw. Serch hynny, os defnyddir teledu cylch cyfyng yn y modd hwn, dylid cael cod ymddygiad cadarn sy'n dweud sut y caiff ei ddefnyddio a beth sy'n digwydd i'r delweddau. Mae'n amlwg, os bydd rhywbeth yn digwydd, y bydd angen i benaethiaid gael gafael ar y delweddau'n gyflym er mwyn gweld pwy sy'n gyfrifol. Weithiau, fel y dywedwyd, efallai mai'r gyrrwr a fydd ar fai ac y bydd y teledu cylch cyfyng yn dangos hynny hefyd. Felly, mae'n beth buddiol sicrhau bod y delweddau ar gael, ond mae'n bwysig inni fod yn glir ynghylch beth sy'n digwydd iddynt, a sut ac am faint y cânt eu cadw. Mae angen cynnwys hynny i gyd mewn cod ymddygiad. Y peth olaf yr ydym am ei weld yw delweddau camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng ar fysiau ysgol yn ymddangos ar un o'r rhaglenni teledu realiti hyn sy'n casglu delweddau teledu cylch cyfyng o bob cwr o'r wlad.

Mae'r pwynt olaf yr hoffwn ei godi'n fater anodd, sef sut mae diffinio'r cludiant a fydd yn dod o dan y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae pwynt da wedi'i wneud sef ei bod yn iawn deddfu ar gyfer diogelwch ac ymddygiad da ar gludiant i'r ysgol ac oddi yno, ond mae'r cwricwlwm presennol yn wahanol iawn i'r cwricwlwm a oedd yn bodoli pan fu'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn edrych ar y mater hwn yng nghyswllt yr agenda 14-19. Yn sgil y newid hwn, bydd disgyblion bellach yn teithio mwy o lawer rhwng safleoedd yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol.

standards that we apply to the transport that pupils use in that instance and that which they use to get to and from school.

I understand the Minister's point, and I believe that he has accepted the general thrust of this argument, although he is not prepared to accept an amendment at this stage. He argues that he should not accept an amendment because there has been no proper consultation on incorporating this in the proposed Measure. However, I believe that there is also a strong argument that, because the proposed Measure is largely an enabling Measure that will be implemented through guidance over a period of time and not all at once, there is scope to include an enabling provision so that the Minister can include transport during the day within the safety measures and other measures contained within this legislation. As a result of that, at some stage in the future when the guidance is drawn up, we can have proper consultation regarding what should be in that guidance. I do not believe that consultation in this case is a barrier to including that enabling measure in the legislation. I do not think that we should use that as an excuse not to do the right thing.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Many of the issues that we have talked about today have been rehearsed previously, but I would like to thank the Minister for bringing forward the proposed Measure. I would also like to thank the legislation committee and its Chair for the work that has been done on this particular proposed Measure. I would also like to thank the young people who took part in the surveys that were conducted across the country by the external relations team of the National Assembly. After all, it is young people who will be sitting on these buses, so we need to be far more effective in consulting young people in the future.

In the evidence sessions, one aspect on which the views of young people differed from the evidence given in committee was that there was less support—but not much less—for CCTV. This may be due to questions regarding young people's civil liberties. I believe that further evidence sessions would

Ni ddylai fod gwahaniaeth o gwbl rhwng y safonau y byddwn yn eu rhoi ar waith ar gyfer y cludiant a ddefnyddir gan ddisgyblion yn y cyswllt hwnnw a'r cludiant a ddefnyddiant i fynd i'r ysgol a dod adref.

Rwyf yn deall pwynt y Gweinidog, a chredaf iddo dderbyn byrdwn cyffredinol y dadl hon, er nad yw'n barod i dderbyn gwelliant ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n dadlau na ddylai dderbyn gwelliant oherwydd nad oes ymgynghori iawn wedi bod ar gynnwys hyn yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Serch hynny, credaf y gellir dadlau'n gryf fod lle i gynnwys darpariaeth galluogi, oherwydd Mesur galluogi yw'r Mesur arfaethedig yn bennaf a gaiff ei roi ar waith drwy ganllawiau dros gyfnod ac nid i gyd ar yr un pryd. Byddai hyn yn golygu y gallai'r Gweinidog gynnwys cludiant yn ystod y diwrnod o fewn y mesurau diogelwch a mesurau eraill sydd yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Yn sgil hynny, rywbryd yn y dyfodol, pan lunnir y canllawiau, gallwn ymgynghori'n iawn ynglŷn â'r hyn y dylid ei gynnwys yn y canllawiau hynny. Ni chredaf fod ymgynghori yn y cyswllt hwn yn rhwystr rhag cynnwys y mesur galluogi hwnnw yn y ddeddfwriaeth. Ni chredaf y dylem ddefnyddio hynny'n esgus dros beidio â gwneud y peth iawn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Mae llawer o'r materion yr ydym wedi sôn amdanynt heddiw wedi cael eu trafod o'r blaen, ond hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am gyflwyno'r Mesur arfaethedig. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth ac i'w Gadeirydd am y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud ar y Mesur arfaethedig penodol hwn. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r bobl ifanc a gymerodd ran yn yr arolygon a gynhaliwyd ledled y wlad gan dîm cysylltiadau allanol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Wedi'r cyfan, pobl ifanc a fydd yn eistedd ar y bysiau hyn, felly mae angen inni fod yn fwy effeithiol o lawer wrth ymgynghori â phobl ifanc yn y dyfodol.

Yn y sesiynau tystiolaeth, un agwedd lle'r oedd barn pobl ifanc yn wahanol i'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd yn y pwyllgor oedd eu bod yn llai cefnogol—ond nid yn llawer llai cefnogol—i deledu cylch cyfyng. Efallai fod a wnelo hyn â chwestiynau ynglŷn â rhyddid sifil pobl ifanc. Credaf y byddai rhai o'r

pick out some of those key areas. However, I was heartened to hear in the evidence from, I think, SNAP Cymru, that the conduct of drivers would also be scrutinised through the closed-circuit television cameras. Therefore, it would not only be the behaviour of the children that would be scrutinised, but that of the adults on the buses, such as the escorts, and the footage could be used to determine whether their behaviour may have been questionable.

As has been noted, another area of concern is the phasing out of double-decker buses. I know that this has previously been an emotive issue, but we have to consider the fact that the WLGA and Newport Bus, for example, have said that it might be costly to implement these changes and that having CCTV on these buses can mean that they are just as safe as single-decker buses. It was also said that there is a lack of data and research to show that double-decker buses offer less support to pupils than single-decker buses. That is something for the Minister to contemplate.

I was one of the committee members who supported the proposal to enable a Minister to make regulations at some point in the future so that the provisions of this proposed Measure would apply to transport used during the school day. I supported this on the basis that, as Darren Millar and Peter Black have suggested, things are changing in the education system and it is a policy decision and not legislative. If it were legislative, I could understand that it would be beyond the remit of the National Assembly to do anything. However, because it is a policy decision, something could be done. I understand that there are constraints of time, costs, and so on, but it would be remiss of us not to consider the fact that schoolchildren do not travel only at the beginning and end of the day. Even when I was at school, we travelled during the day, so it is not as though this is something new, per se.

4.50 p.m.

I wish to conclude with a point that Christine

meysydd allweddol hynny'n codi pe cynhelid rhagor o sesiynau tystiolaeth. Fodd bynnag, fe'm calonogwyd o glywed yn y dystiolaeth gan SNAP Cymru, mi gredaf, y creffid ar ymddygiad gyrwyr hefyd drwy gamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng. Felly, nid dim ond ymddygiad y plant a fyddai'n destun craffu, ond ymddygiad yr oedolion ar y bysiau hefyd, megis yr hebryngwyr, ac fe ellid defnyddio'r delweddau i benderfynu a oedd amheuaeth efallai ynglŷn â'u hymddygiad hwythau.

Fel y nodwyd, maes arall sy'n destun pryder yw rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio bysiau deulawr. Gwn fod hyn wedi ennyn ymateb emosiynol yn y gorffennol, ond rhaid inni ystyried y ffaith fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Bysiau Casnewydd, er enghraifft, wedi dweud y gallai fod yn gostus rhoi'r newidiadau hyn ar waith ac y gall gosod teledu cylch cyfyng ar y bysiau hyn olygu eu bod yr un mor ddiogel â bysiau unllawr. Dywedwyd bod diffyg data ac ymchwil i ddangos bod disgyblion yn llai diogel ar fysiau deulawr nag ar fysiau unllawr. Rhywbeth i'r Gweinidog gnoi cil drosto yw hynny.

Roeddwn ymhlith aelodau'r pwyllgor a gefnogodd y cynnig i alluogi Gweinidog i wneud rheoliadau rywbryd yn y dyfodol er mwyn i ddarpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn fod yn berthnasol i gludiant a ddefnyddid yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Roeddwn yn cefnogi hyn oherwydd, fel yr awgrymodd Darren Millar a Peter Black, mae pethau'n newid yn y system addysg ac oherwydd mai penderfyniad polisi yn hytrach na phenderfyniad deddfwriaethol yw hwn. Petai'n ddeddfwriaethol, gallwn ddeall y byddai y tu hwnt i gylch gwaith y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Serch hynny, oherwydd mai penderfyniad polisi ydyw, gellid gwneud rhywbeth. Rwyf yn deall bod cyfyngiadau amser, costau ac ati, ond byddai'n annoeth inni beidio ag ystyried y ffaith bod plant ysgol yn teithio ar adegau eraill, yn ogystal ag ar ddechrau ac ar ddiwedd y dydd. Hyd yn oed pan oeddwn i yn yr ysgol, byddem yn teithio yn ystod y dydd, felly nid yw fel petai hyn yn rhywbeth newydd, per se.

Rwyf am gloi drwy gyfeirio at bwynt a

Chapman made, relating to the independence of young people. We found that, although lots of people who currently travel by taxi to school are well-supported and have security, they would like to have the ability to transfer to buses. Therefore, when we come to train more bus drivers and bus escorts, we should perhaps consider people with severe disabilities, or with autism, and have a handover period for them to be able to travel by bus with their school friends. They sometimes feel alienated and removed from their fellow pupils, which is something that we should consider seriously. I thank everyone who gave evidence, and I hope that we can progress with this proposed legislation.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I would like to start by saying how much I support the general principles of the proposed Measure, as one of the members of the legislation committee that examined it. It was very clear from the evidence that we took from the witnesses who came to see us, in addition to the Minister, that there is a huge amount of goodwill for ensuring that we do whatever we can to improve the way in which young people and students can get from home to school and back again in a safe environment.

When you look at the statistics, it is clear to see that this proposed Measure will apply—in terms of seatbelts—to a small number of buses. Thankfully, an overwhelming number of the buses used in Wales for learner transport are already fitted with appropriate seatbelts. They are of a modern quality, and we have seen an improvement in the bus stock in Wales in recent years, and that is to be welcomed. Sadly, the case of Stuart Cunningham-Jones, who so tragically lost his life, would not apply to this proposed Measure because he was on a service bus. This proposed Measure is about transport that is secured by local authorities and schools; it is not about service buses. However, I am delighted that we have seen a general improvement in the quality of our transport infrastructure.

This proposed Measure has a huge amount of potential. It has the ability to make pupils safer, to give parents confidence and to

wnaeth Christine Chapman, ynglŷn ag annibyniaeth pobl ifanc. Gwelsom, er bod llawer o bobl sydd ar hyn o bryd yn teithio i'r ysgol mewn tacsï yn cael cefnogaeth dda a'u bod yn ddiogel, y byddent yn hoffi gallu trosglwyddo i fysiau. Felly, pan fyddwn yn hyfforddi mwy o yrwyr bysiau a hebryngwyr bysiau, efallai y dylem ystyried pobl ag anableddau difrifol, neu awtistiaeth a threfnu cyfnod trosglwyddo er mwyn iddynt allu teithio ar fws gyda'u ffrindiau ysgol. Byddant weithiau'n teimlo wedi'u hynysu ac ar wahân i'w cyd-ddisgyblion. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y dylem roi sylw difrifol iddo. Diolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, ac rwyf yn gobeithio y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â'r ddeddfwriaeth arfaethedig hon.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud faint yr wyf yn cefnogi egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig, a minnau'n un o aelodau'r pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a fu'n ei archwilio. Roedd yn amlwg iawn o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom gan y tystion a ddaeth i'n gweld, yn ogystal â chan y Gweinidog, fod llawer iawn o ewyllys da o blaid sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud popeth yn ein gallu i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc a myfyrwyr yn fwy diogel iddynt deithio i'r ysgol ac adref eto.

Os edrychwch ar yr ystadegau, mae'n amlwg y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn berthnasol—o ran gwregysau diogelwch—i nifer fach o fysiau. Diolch byth, mae gwregysau diogelwch wedi'u gosod eisoes ar fwyafrif helaeth y bysiau a ddefnyddir i gludo dysgwyr yng Nghymru. Maent yn fodern o ran eu hansawdd ac rydym wedi gweld y stoc bysiau yng Nghymru'n gwella yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Yn anffodus, ni fyddai achos Stuart Cunningham-Jones a gollodd ei fywyd mor drasig, yn berthnasol i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn oherwydd mai ar fws gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yr oedd yn teithio. Mae a wnelo'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn â chludiant sy'n cael ei drefnu gan awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion; nid oes a wnelo â bysiau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Serch hynny, rwyf wrth fy modd o weld ansawdd ein seilwaith yn gwella'n gyffredinol.

Mae potensial enfawr i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Mae ganddo'r gallu i wneud disgyblion yn fwy diogel, i roi hyder i rieni ac i sicrhau



ensure that we minimise risk to young people on our transport system. It is something that we should all endorse wholeheartedly.

We examined a number of issues and made a number of thoughtful recommendations. The scope of the proposed Measure clearly needs to be extended. The title of the proposed Measure is the Proposed Safety on Learner Transport (Wales) Measure. It is not: ‘The Home to School and Back Again Transport Measure’. However, the concept of the proposed Measure is to make learner transport safe. We see our education system changing, with learners and students transported between different places of learning over time. It will not happen immediately, but it will happen more frequently over time. We need to be certain that the transport that we provide for those students is safe and secure and that it minimises risk. Our recommendation for amending the proposed Measure is not made in a way that suggests that the Minister ought to be legislating for this scenario immediately—it could be for a future Minister to consider. However, as we look at this proposed Measure, as it passes through the Assembly, it makes perfect sense to ensure that it is amended in a way that reflects the reality of how the education system is developing. I do not say this with any great expectation of us introducing regulations within the next year or two, as it may be something to be done further down the line. However, it would mean that the proposed Measure would at least allow a future Minister an opportunity to extend the scope of the legislation to cover those young people who travel during the school day. That is an extremely important thing for us to do, and I hope that the Government gives this further consideration.

We were given the impression that there was a requirement to phase out double-decker buses because they are somewhat less safe than single-decker buses. We did not see any evidence to suggest that double-decker buses are not a safe form of transport. We have to be clear on the practical implications of phasing out double-decker buses; what that would mean for the stock of buses required

bod cyn lleied o berygl i bobl ifanc ag y bo modd ar ein system cludiant. Mae'n rhywbeth y dylem i gyd ei gymeradwyo o waelod calon.

Archwiliwyd nifer o faterion gennym a chyflwynwyd nifer o argymhellion ystyriol. Mae'n amlwg bod angen ehangu cwmpas y Mesur arfaethedig. Teitl y Mesur arfaethedig yw Mesur Arfaethedig Diogelwch Cludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru). Nid ‘Y Mesur Cludo o'r Cartref i'r Ysgol ac Adref Eto’. Serch hynny, cysyniad y Mesur arfaethedig yw gwneud cludiant i ddysgwyr yn ddiogel. Rydym yn gweld ein system addysg yn newid gan fod dysgwyr a myfyrwyr yn cael eu cludo rhwng gwahanol fannau dysgu dros gyfnod. Ni fydd hyn yn digwydd ar unwaith, ond bydd yn digwydd yn amlach gyda threigl amser. Mae angen inni fod yn sicr bod y cludiant y byddwn yn ei ddarparu ar gyfer y myfyrwyr hynny'n saff ac yn ddiogel a bod cyn lleied o berygl ag y bo modd. Nid ydym yn argymhell diwygio'r Mesur arfaethedig mewn ffordd sy'n awgrymu y dylai'r Gweinidog fod yn deddfu ar gyfer y senario hwn ar unwaith—gallai fod yn rhywbeth i Weinidog ei ystyried yn y dyfodol. Serch hynny, wrth inni edrych ar y Mesur arfaethedig, wrth iddo fynd drwy'r Cynulliad, mae'n berffaith gall sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei ddiwygio mewn ffordd sy'n adlewyrchu realiti'r ffordd y mae'r system addysg yn datblygu. Nid wyf yn dweud hyn gydag unrhyw ddisgwyliad mawr y byddwn yn cyflwyno rheoliadau yn ystod y flwyddyn neu ddwy nesaf, oherwydd gall hyn fod yn rhywbeth i'w wneud rywbryd eto. Serch hynny, byddai'n golygu y byddai'r Mesur arfaethedig o leiaf yn caniatáu cyfle i un o Weinidogion y dyfodol estyn cwmpas y ddeddfwriaeth i gynnwys y bobl ifanc hynny sy'n teithio yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Mae hynny'n beth eithriadol o bwysig inni ei wneud, ac rwyf yn gobeithio y gwnaiff y Llywodraeth ystyried hyn eto.

Rhodddwyd yr argraff inni fod gofyn rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio bysiau deulawr oherwydd eu bod ychydig yn llai diogel na bysiau unllawr. Ni welsom ddim tystiolaeth i awgrymu nad yw bysiau deulawr yn ffordd ddiogel o deithio. Rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â goblygiadau ymarferol rhoi'r gorau'n raddol i ddefnyddio bysiau deulawr; beth fyddai hynny'n ei olygu i'r stoc bysiau

for each school; and what it would require in terms of changes to the school site. It is important to make it clear to people in Wales that we believe that double-deck buses are a safe form of travel. If they are not safe for children and young people, I am not sure why they are safe for the general population using service buses. We have to be careful about the sort of messages that people will take from this legislation, and certainly about the way in which it is being put across.

I also welcome the fact that we are going to see school supervisors on buses. However, again, we must be clear about the message. The Government's intention is to have supervisors on buses carrying primary school children. I accept that, because it is to give parents confidence about the safety and ability of those school buses to take their children to their primary schools. If you read this and listen to how the Government has promoted this, you would assume that supervisors are there to keep unruly children in check, when we know that the more unruly behaviour occurs on secondary school buses. However, what I would like to see from the Government is some consideration of providing flexibility to local authorities to extend the provision of supervisors on school buses where difficulties are encountered. I accept that the promotion of this is to give parents confidence with regard to primary school-aged children, but I believe that local authorities ought to have the ability to extend this where there are difficulties on school buses. More often than not, it is the secondary schools where we encounter those problems.

Madam Deputy Presiding Officer, I know that I have exceeded my time allocation. I am delighted to be able to support the proposed Measure this afternoon, and I look forward to it coming back at Stage 2.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am very grateful to all Members who took part in this debate and for their generally being very positive about the general principles of the proposed Measure,

sy'n ofynnol ar gyfer pob ysgol; a beth fyddai'n ei olygu o ran newid safle'r ysgol. Mae'n bwysig ei gwneud hi'n glir i bobl yng Nghymru ein bod yn credu bod bysiau deulawr yn ffordd ddiogel o deithio. Os nad ydynt yn ddiogel i blant a phobl ifanc, nid wyf yn siŵr pam y maent yn ddiogel i'r boblogaeth gyffredinol sy'n defnyddio bysiau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ynglŷn â'r math o negeseuon y bydd pobl yn eu cael yn sgil y ddeddfwriaeth hon, ac yn sicr ynglŷn â sut mae'n cael ei chyfleu.

Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith ein bod yn mynd i weld goruchwylwyr ysgolion ar fysiau. Serch hynny, unwaith eto, rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â'r neges. Bwriad y Llywodraeth yw cael goruchwylwyr ar fysiau sy'n cludo plant ysgolion cynradd. Rwyf yn derbyn hynny, oherwydd gwneir hynny er mwyn i rieni allu teimlo'n ffyddiog ynglŷn â diogelwch eu plant a gallu'r bysiau ysgol hynny i'w cludo i'w hysgolion cynradd. Os darllenwch chi hyn a gwranddo ar sut mae'r Llywodraeth wedi hyrwyddo hyn, byddech yn tybio bod y goruchwylwyr yno i gadw trefn ar blant anystywllt. Ond gwyddom mai ar fysiau ysgolion uwchradd y mae'r ymddygiad mwyaf anystywllt yn digwydd. Serch hynny, yr hyn yr hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn ei wneud yw ystyried rhoi rhywfaint o hyblygrwydd i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn iddynt allu ehangu'r ddarpariaeth a rhoi goruchwylwyr ar fysiau ysgol lle bydd anawsterau'n codi. Rwyf yn derbyn mai bwriad hyrwyddo hyn yw rhoi hyder i rieni plant ysgolion cynradd, ond credaf y dylai fod gan awdurdodau'r hawl i ymestyn hyn lle bydd anawsterau'n codi ar fysiau ysgol. Yn amlach na pheidio, yn yr ysgolion uwchradd y byddwn yn dod ar draws y problemau hynny.

Madam Ddirprwy Lywydd, gwn imi fynd heibio i'r amser a neilltuwyd imi. Rwyf yn falch iawn o allu cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig y prynhawn yma, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei weld yn dychwelyd yng Nghyfnod 2.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Rwyf yn ddiolchgar iawn i bob Aelod a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon ac am eu hagwedd gadarnhaol iawn ar y cyfan at egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur

although there have been a number of detailed points made. It will be impossible for me in the time I have to deal with them all, but I would like to deal with some of them. I am pretty sure that we will be dealing with the others at the next stage.

First, I wish to deal with something that has been raised by more than one Member, namely whether we can amend the proposed Measure to include a provision that would enable regulations on travel during the school day. That was raised by the Chair of Legislation Committee No. 4, by Peter Black, Bethan Jenkins, Darren Millar and Jonathan Morgan. We must be careful: if we are going to introduce this provision, it cannot simply be done on the face of the proposed Measure without considerable thought and consultation. We cannot simply include a framework power without any consultation or discussion with those likely to be affected. Let me tell you what would be required. The majority of travel during the day is not contracted travel with local authorities. It is usually organised by the school itself or colleges directly, and it is therefore much more complex to regulate. This would require a new set of duties on headteachers, schools and colleges. We need to understand the implications of that, because these measures have criminal and civil penalties attached to them. Therefore, are we going to say that we can introduce those in relation to bodies that we have not even considered for inclusion in the original proposed Measure? That is why, although I understand the points being made, it is much more appropriate to do that in a new proposed Measure when we have had time to do the proper consultation. *[Interruption.]* I am sorry; I do not have time to take an intervention. I am sure that we will pursue this in future.

To clarify the point that Peter Black made, this is not an excuse. He said that it may be used as an excuse; this is not an excuse. I am here to try to assist Assembly Members in creating as strong a proposed Measure as possible, so I am not using any excuses whatsoever. I am simply being honest with the Assembly that we have to think this through before we move. That is why,

arfaethedig, er bod nifer o bwyntiau manwl wedi'u codi. Bydd yn amhosibl imi ymdrin â hwy i gyd yn yr amser sydd ar gael imi ond hoffwn ymdrin â rhai ohonynt. Rwyf yn eithaf sicr y byddwn yn ymdrin â'r lleill yn ystod y cyfnod nesaf.

Yn gyntaf, rwyf am ymdrin â rhywbeth y mae mwy nag un Aelod wedi'i godi, sef a allwn ddiwygio'r Mesur arfaethedig i gynnwys darpariaeth a fyddai'n caniatáu rheoliadau ar deithio yn ystod y diwrnod ysgol. Codwyd hynny gan Gadeirydd Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 4, gan Peter Black, Bethan Jenkins, Darren Millar a Jonathan Morgan. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus: os byddwn yn cyflwyno'r ddarpariaeth hon, ni ellir gwneud hynny'n syml yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun heb feddwl yn ofalus ac ymgynghori. Ni allwn gynnwys pŵer fframwaith heb ymgynghori neu drafod â'r rheini y mae'n debygol o effeithio arnynt. Gadewch imi ddweud wrthy ch beth y byddai ei angen. Nid teithio sy'n cael ei gontractio gydag awdurdodau lleol yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r teithio a wneir yn ystod y dydd. Fel rheol, fe'i trefnir gan yr ysgol ei hun neu gan y colegau'n uniongyrchol. Felly, mae'n llawer mwy cymhleth i'w reoleiddio. Bydd gofyn cael set newydd o ddyletswyddau ar gyfer penaethiaid, ysgolion a cholegau. Mae angen inni ddeall goblygiadau hynny, oherwydd bod cosbau troseddol a sifil ynghlwm wrthynt. Felly, a ydym am ddweud ein bod yn gallu cyflwyno'r rheini ar gyfer cyrff nad ydym hyd yn oed wedi ystyried eu cynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig gwreiddiol? Dyna pam, er fy mod yn deall y pwyntiau sy'n cael eu gwneud, ei bod yn fwy priodol o lawer inni wneud hynny mewn Mesur arfaethedig newydd ar ôl inni gael amser i ymgynghori'n briodol *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n ddrwg gennyf; nid oes gennyf amser i dderbyn ymyriad. Rwyf yn siŵr yr awn ar drywydd hyn yn y dyfodol.

Er mwyn bod yn glir ynglŷn â'r pwynt a wnaeth Peter Black, nid esgus yw hyn. Dywedodd y gellid ei ddefnyddio'n esgus ond nid esgus yw hyn. Rwyf yma i geisio cynorthwyo Aelodau'r Cynulliad i greu Mesur arfaethedig sydd mor gryf ag sy'n bosibl, felly nid wyf yn gwneud dim esgusodion o gwbl. Bod yn onest â'r Cynulliad wyf fi, dyna'i gyd. Rhaid inni

although I have no objection to what is being said, it is my view that that would be more appropriately dealt with in another proposed Measure when we have had the time to consider the full implications.

I have taken some time to deal with the issue of home-to-school transport and why the proposed Measure is limited to that. I accept Jenny Randerson's point that it is possible for us, in the risk assessment, to provide some guidance on the sort of seat belts that could be used. To be clear, that will not be statutory; it will be general guidance. We cannot specify, by law, the kind of seatbelts that can be used because we do not have the powers to do so. However, we can give an indication, through the risk assessment, of the kind of seatbelts that we consider appropriate.

5.00 p.m.

You have also indicated that we need to consider the pilot schemes that are currently operating on CCTV, the use of supervisors and double-decker vehicles. There will be an opportunity in the consultation, when the regulations are introduced, to see the success of those particular pilot schemes.

I understand the points made about the costs and the constraints in relation to double-decker buses. Members will find that, in the evidence that I gave to the committees, I was careful to point out that I was not concerned about the newer kind of double-decker buses, where you often have CCTV cameras, but about the older type of double-decker buses, which sometimes cause some concern. It is highly likely that we will have to think carefully about the issue of double-decker buses and whether we just refer to the older type of double-deckers rather than all of them. I recognise that the newer double-deckers have the facilities that make the journey safer because of the CCTV cameras that are already in-built into them.

I also understand that, due to the framework nature of the legislation, we do not have the

feddwl yn ofalus am hyn cyn inni symud. Dyna pam, er nad oes gennyf wrthwynebiad i'r hyn sy'n cael ei ddweud, mai fy marn i yw y byddai'n fwy priodol ymdrin â hyn mewn Mesur arfaethedig arall ar ôl inni gael amser i ystyried yr holl oblygiadau.

Rwyf wedi treulio rhywfaint o amser yn ymdrin â mater cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol a pham y cyfyngir y Mesur arfaethedig i hynny. Rwyf yn derbyn pwynt Jenny Randerson ei bod yn bosibl inni, yn yr asesiad risg, gynnig rhywfaint o ganllawiau ynglŷn â'r math o wregysau diogelwch y gellid eu defnyddio. Er mwyn bod yn glir, ni fydd hynny'n statudol; canllawiau cyffredinol fydd y rhain. Ni allwn bennu, drwy gyfraith, pa fath o wregysau diogelwch y ceir eu defnyddio oherwydd nid oes gennym y pwerau i wneud hynny. Serch hynny, gallwn awgrymu drwy'r asesiad risg, pa fath o wregysau diogelwch sy'n briodol yn ein barn ni.

Rydych hefyd wedi dweud bod angen inni ystyried y cynlluniau teledu cylch cyfyng sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd, defnyddio goruchwylwyr a cherbydau deulawr. Bydd cyfle yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, pan gyflwynir y rheoliadau, i weld i ba raddau y mae'r cynlluniau peilot penodol hynny wedi llwyddo.

Rwyf yn deall y pwyntiau am y costau a'r cyfyngiadau yng nghyswllt bysiau deulawr. Bydd yr Aelodau'n gweld, yn y dystiolaeth a roddais i'r pwyllgorau, fy mod yn ofalus i ddweud nad oeddwn yn poeni am y math mwy newydd o fysiau deulawr, lle bydd gennych gamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng yn aml, ond am y mathau hŷn o fysiau deulawr, sydd weithiau'n achosi rhywfaint o bryder. Mae'n debygol iawn y bydd yn rhaid inni feddwl yn ofalus am fater bysiau deulawr ac a ddylem gyfeirio'n unig at y math hŷn o fysiau deulawr yn hytrach nag at bob un ohonynt. Rwyf yn sylweddoli bod gan y bysiau deulawr mwy newydd y cyfleusterau sy'n gwneud y daith yn fwy diogel oherwydd bod ganddynt eisoes gamerâu teledu cylch cyfyng.

Rwyf yn deall, oherwydd natur fframwaith y ddeddfwriaeth, nad oes gennym y manylion

detail on the face of the proposed Measure that some Members would like to see. I have made it clear that that is so because of the time constraints.

I am grateful to Angela Burns and Janet Ryder, the Chairs of the Finance Committee and the Constitutional Affairs Committee, for their comments. I understand the point about costs, and I understand that it is necessary for us to have robust costings when we consider the regulations. However, I can assure Angela that, as we go through the regulations, we will be asking for much more detailed and robust costings so that we can understand the implications. I made clear to the committee that I would be looking for ways in which I could assist local government to meet some of these costs, within the cost constraints that the Welsh Assembly Government is facing at present.

Another issue raised was the use that is to be made of the images that CCTV provides. The ownership will be held by the bus operator, clearly because it owns the buses and the equipment. There would then have to be an agreement with the local authorities on the use of that equipment and the images. We have to be careful about that. I would not want to see that widened too much because there is an issue about civil liberties that we need to have at the forefront of our minds. I would hope that the agreements that the operators and the local authorities will arrive at will mean that these CCTV cameras, and the images on them, will not be used inappropriately in the kind of way that Peter Black has mentioned. We would want to make sure that the legislation is framed in a way that makes sure that they are not used inappropriately.

In relation to the points made by Darren Miller, we have thought very carefully about what we should include on the face of the proposed Measure. I will do what I can to try to do it. I have given an assurance to the Assembly that I will do that as best as I can. I understand Christine Chapman's point about the issue of training. It is a very good point. We have to be careful to ensure that we have proper training in place, particularly in relation to children with additional learning needs. Christine made a valuable point.

yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun y byddai rhai Aelodau'n hoffi eu gweld. Rwyf wedi'i gwneud yn glir mai'r cyfyngiadau amser sy'n gyfrifol am hyn.

Rwyf yn ddiolchgar i Angela Burns a Janet Ryder, Cadeiryddion y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol, am eu sylwadau. Rwyf yn deall y pwynt am gostau, ac rwyf yn deall bod angen inni gael costau cadarn pan fyddwn yn ystyried y rheoliadau. Serch hynny, gallaf sicrhau Angela, wrth inni fynd drwy'r rheoliadau, y byddwn yn gofyn am gostau mwy manwl a chadarn o lawer er mwyn inni ddeall y goblygiadau. Fe'i gwneuthum yn glir i'r pwyllgor y byddwn yn edrych i weld sut y gallwn gynorthwyo llywodraeth leol gyda rhai o'r costau hyn, o fewn y cyfyngiadau ar gostau sy'n wynebu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar hyn o bryd.

Mater arall a godwyd oedd sut y defnyddir delweddau teledu cylch cyfyng. Gweithredwr y bysiau fydd biau'r rhain wrth gwrs oherwydd mae ef biau'r bysiau a'r offer. Yna, byddai'n rhaid cael cytundeb gyda'r awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â defnyddio'r offer hwnnw a'r delweddau. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ynglŷn â hynny. Ni fyddwn am weld hynny'n cael ei ehangu'n ormodol oherwydd rhaid inni gadw ar flaen ein meddwl ystyriaethau ynglŷn â rhyddid sifil. Byddwn yn gobeithio y bydd y cytundebau a wneir rhwng y gweithredwyr a'r awdurdodau lleol yn golygu na chaiff y camerâu teledu cylch cyfyng hyn, a'r delweddau sydd arnynt, eu defnyddio'n amhriodol yn y ffordd a grybwyllwyd gan Peter Black. Byddem am sicrhau bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn cael ei llunio yn y fath fodd ag i sicrhau na chânt eu defnyddio'n amhriodol.

O ran y pwyntiau a wnaeth Darren Miller, rydym wedi meddwl yn ofalus iawn am yr hyn y dylem ei gynnwys yn y Mesur arfaethedig ei hun. Gwnaf yr hyn a allaf i geisio gwneud hyn. Rwyf wedi sicrhau'r Cynulliad y gwnaf fy ngorau glas o ran hynny. Rwyf yn deall pwynt Christine Chapman ynglŷn â hyfforddi. Mae'n bwynt da iawn. Rhaid inni ofalu bod gennym hyfforddiant priodol ar waith, yn enwedig gyda golwg ar blant ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Gwnaeth Christine bwynt

gwerthfawr.

With those few remarks, I hope that we can now move to adopt the general principles.

Gyda'r ychydig sylwadau hynny, rwyf yn gobeithio y gallwn yn awr symud i fabwysiadu'r egwyddorion cyffredinol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

**Penderfyniad Ariannol ynghylch y Mesur Arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch ar Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru)**  
**Financial Resolution in relation to the Proposed Safety on Learner Transport (Wales) Measure**

*Cynnig NDM4624 Ieuan Wyn Jones*

*Motion NDM4624 Ieuan Wyn Jones*

*Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, at ddibenion unrhyw ddarpariaethau sy'n deillio o'r Mesur arfaethedig ynghylch Diogelwch ar Gludiant i Ddysgwyr (Cymru), yn cytuno i unrhyw gynnydd mewn gwariant o'r math y cyfeiriwyd ato yn Rheol Sefydlog 23.80(ii)(b), sy'n codi o ganlyniad i'r Mesur.*

*To propose that the National Assembly for Wales, for the purposes of any provisions resulting from the Proposed Safety on Learner Transport (Wales) Measure, agrees to any increase in expenditure of a kind referred to in Standing Order 23.80(ii)(b), arising in consequence of the Measure.*

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Cynigiau y cynnig.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I move the motion.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to agree the motion. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35. That brings today's business to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Y cynnig yw derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, derbynnir y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35. Daw hynny a busnes heddiw i ben.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.04 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.04 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Veronica (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)