



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 28 Medi 2010
Tuesday, 28 September 2010**

Cynnwys
Contents

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
28	Cwestiwn Brys: Adolygiad ar y Cyd o Achosion Difrifol Urgent Question: Joint Serious Case Review
47	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
47	Datganiad am y Bwrdd Effeithlonrwydd ac Arloesi Statement on the Efficiency and Innovation Board
65	Datganiad am 'Eich Gwasanaeth Chi, Eich Llais Chi' Statement on 'Your Service, Your Say'
86	Adroddiad Blynyddol Datblygu Cynaliadwy The Sustainable Development Annual Report
105	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog. **The Presiding Officer:** Order for questions to the First Minister.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Toriadau Arfaethedig Llywodraeth y DU

The UK Government's Proposed Cuts

I. Irene James: *Pa asesiad y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i wneud o effeithiau toriadau arfaethedig Llywodraeth y DU ar lefelau cyflogaeth yn Islwyn. OAQ(3)3083(FM)*

I. Irene James: *What assessment has the First Minister made of the effects of the proposed UK Government cuts on employment levels in Islwyn. OAQ(3)3083(FM)*

The First Minister (Carwyn Jones): The impacts of the fiscal consolidation being imposed by the UK Government will be severe in all parts of Wales, including Islwyn.

Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones): Bydd effeithiau'r cyfuno ariannol sy'n cael ei orfodi gan Lywodraeth y DU yn ddifrifol ym mhob rhan o Gymru, gan gynnwys Islwyn.

Irene James: Thank you for your response, First Minister. Many hard-working public sector workers live in my constituency, many of whom were made redundant from previous jobs the last time the Tories were in office. Many of these people once again fear for their futures, as the Tories and their partners, the Lib Dems, wield the axe. Will you join me in telling them that we value them, and that we do not feel that their jobs and futures are expendable? Will you also join me in welcoming Ed Miliband as the new leader of the Labour Party?

Irene James: Diolch am eich ymateb, Brif Weinidog. Mae llawer o weithwyr sector cyhoeddus diwyd yn byw yn fy etholaeth i, a llawer ohonynt wedi'u diswyddo o swyddi blaenorol y tro diwethaf y bu'r Torïaid mewn grym. Mae llawer o'r bobl hyn yn ofni unwaith eto ynghylch eu dyfodol, wrth i'r Torïaid a'u partneriaid, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, baratoi'r fwyell. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ddweud wrthynt ein bod yn eu gwerthfawrogi, ac nad ydym yn teimlo bod eu swyddi a'u dyfodol yn ddiwerth? A wnewch chi ymuno â mi hefyd i groesawu Ed Miliband yn arweinydd newydd y Blaid Lafur?

The First Minister: I will indeed join you in welcoming Ed Miliband as the new leader of the Labour Party and the next Prime Minister of the United Kingdom. We will be doing all we can to protect those workers who provide important services to vulnerable people in our communities, and not allow the UK Government to undo the good work that has been done in the private sector, through schemes such as ProAct.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ymunaf â chi'n wir i groesawu Ed Miliband fel arweinydd newydd y Blaid Lafur a Phrif Weinidog nesaf ar y Deyrnas Unedig. Byddwn yn gwneud y cyfan y gallwn i amddiffyn y gweithwyr hynny sy'n darparu gwasanaethau pwysig i bobl agored i niwed yn eu cymunedau, ac i beidio â chaniatáu i Lywodraeth y DU ddadwneud y gwaith da a wnaethpwyd yn y sector preifat, drwy gynlluniau fel ProAct.

William Graham: Without necessarily going back into the realms of history, in 2001, unemployment was listed at 8.5 per cent; by March of this year, it had increased to 12 per cent. That is under a Labour Government—

William Graham: Heb ddychwelyd o reidrwydd i'r llyfrau hanes, yn 2001, cofrestrwyd bod 8.5 y cant yn ddi-waith; erbyn mis Mawrth eleni, roedd wedi cynyddu i 12 y cant. Mae hynny o dan Lywodraeth

here and at Westminster. First Minister, what are you doing to try to improve the prospects of people in Islwyn of entering meaningful employment?

The First Minister: Having said that you were not going to delve into the realms of history, you then did so. The claimant count unemployment rate in Islwyn for August 2010 was 1 percentage point lower than it was at the same time last year, which is in keeping with the level across Wales. The claimant count level in Islwyn is falling, which is a result of the policies put in place by the Assembly Government.

Gwella Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl

2. Veronica German: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3095(FM)*

The First Minister: Improving mental health services continues to be a key priority for us. The mental health programme board has recently been established to provide direction and leadership to drive forward improvements.

Veronica German: Given that one person in four in Wales—and, indeed, across the UK—is likely to experience some mental distress, it will obviously affect everyone here and everyone's families. I am particularly interested in mental health services for older people. People over the age of 65 are not always entitled to the same services as people under 65, and they are almost second-class citizens. Given that approximately 200,000 older people could experience mental distress, what will you do to ensure equality across the age spectrum of people requiring mental health services in Wales?

The First Minister: You make an assertion without providing any evidence. I do not accept that people over 65 are somehow second-class citizens when it comes to accessing mental health services. Consider dementia, for example, which is more likely to affect those over 65 than other sections of

Lafur-yma ac yn San Steffan. Brif Weinidog, beth ydych chi'n ei wneud i geisio gwella rhagolygon pobl yn Islwyn i gael cyflogaeth ystyrlon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar ôl dweud nad oeddech chi'n mynd i gloddio i'r llyfrau hanes, hynny wedyn a wnaethoch. Roedd canran y rhai a oedd yn hawlio budd-daliadau diweithdra yn Islwyn ym mis Awst 2010 yn 1 pwynt canran yn is nag ydoedd yr un pryd y llynedd, sy'n gyson â'r lefel ledled Cymru. Mae lefel y rhai sy'n hawlio budd-daliadau yn Islwyn yn gostwng, a hynny o ganlyniad i'r polisiau a roddwyd ar waith gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Improving Mental Health Services

2. Veronica German: *Will the First Minister make a statement on improving mental health services in Wales. OAQ(3)3095(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gwella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn dal yn flaenoriaeth allweddol i ni. Sefydlwyd y bwrdd rhagen iechyd meddwl yn ddiweddar i roi cyfeiriad ac arweinyddiaeth er mwyn symud gwelliannau yn eu blaenau.

Veronica German: O ystyried bod un o bob pedwar yng Nghymru—ac, yn wir, ledled y DU—yn debygol o gael rhyw fath o drallod meddwl, bydd yn amlwg yn effeithio ar bawb yma ac ar deuluoedd pawb. Rwy'n ymddiddori'n arbennig mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i bobl hŷn. Ni all pobl dros 65 oed bob amser hawlio'r un gwasanaethau â phobl o dan 65, ac maen nhw bron yn ddinasyddion eilradd. O ystyried y gallai rhyw 200,000 o bobl hŷn gael profiad o drallod meddwl, beth fyddwch chi'n ei wneud i sicrhau cydraddoldeb ar draws sbectrwm oedran y bobl y mae gofyn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl arnynt yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydych chi'n honni rhywbeth heb ddarparu tystiolaeth. Nid wyf yn derbyn bod pobl dros 65 rywsut yn ddinasyddion eilradd o ran cael at wasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Ystyriwch ddementia, er enghraifft, sy'n fwy tebygol o effeithio ar y rheini dros 65 na rhannau eraill

the population. A national dementia plan for Wales is being taken forward. That is already looking to produce a draft action plan, and it has identified priority areas where such action can be taken. Therefore, far from older people over 65 being second-class citizens, they are well catered for by the Assembly Government.

Helen Mary Jones: O ran y gwasanaeth iechyd, a fydddech yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig i bobl dderbyn gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg pan fydd angen, yn enwedig ym maes iechyd meddwl, lle mae disgrifio'r symptomau a thrafod y problemau y tu ôl iddynt yn bwysig? Pa gamau y gall eich Llywodraeth chi eu cymryd i sicrhau y gall pobl gael gofal iechyd meddwl yn eu dewis iaith?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n bwysig dros ben y gall pobl gael gwasanaethau yn eu prif iaith. Mae grŵp wedi'i sefydlu gan y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod yr iaith Gymraeg yn llifo drwy ganllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a hefyd i adolygu faint o asesiadau sydd ar gael drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg drwy Gymru gyfan. Mae'r Gweinidog hefyd yn edrych ar sut y gellir sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn elfen bwysig o'r cynllun iechyd meddwl a fydd yn para am y pum mlynedd nesaf. Cyflwynir adroddiad i'r grŵp sydd wedi'i sefydlu ar y pwnc hwn.

Darren Millar: First Minister, some of the people suffering from mental health difficulties have carers, who play a huge role in looking after their loved ones. I recently had the opportunity to meet with the Hafal carers' group in my constituency, and a great deal of concern was expressed about the level of support for carers in Wales. I know that things are improving because of the cross-party consensus that we have here in the Senedd on improving support for carers, but particular reference was made to the withdrawal of the carers' support service that had been commenced on a pilot-scheme basis in my constituency. It was withdrawn despite the fact that it was very successful during the pilot phase. Will you investigate that to see what the Assembly Government could do to ensure that, where pilot schemes are successful, they are continued and not cut off?

o'r boblogaeth. Mae cynllun dementia cenedlaethol i Gymru'n cael ei ddatblygu. Mae hwnnw eisoes yn ystyried llunio cynllun gweithredu drafft, ac mae wedi nodi meysydd â blaenoriaeth lle gellir cymryd camau felly. Felly, ymhell o fod pobl hŷn dros 65 yn ddinasyddion eilradd, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu'n dda ar eu cyfer.

Helen Mary Jones: On the health service, would you agree that it is vital that people can receive a service in Welsh, when necessary, particularly in the field of mental health, where it is important to be able to describe symptoms and discuss the underlying problems? What steps can your Government take to ensure that people can access mental health care in the language of their choice?

The First Minister: It is extremely important that people can access services in their main language. The Minister has set up a group to ensure that the Welsh language flows through the Assembly Government's guidance, and also to review how many assessments are available through the medium of Welsh throughout Wales. The Minister is also looking at how we can ensure that the Welsh language is an important element of the mental health scheme for the next five years. A report will be submitted to the group set up on this matter.

Darren Millar: Brif Weinidog, mae gofalwyr gan rai o'r bobl sy'n dioddef o anawsterau iechyd meddwl, a'r rheini'n chwarae rhan enfawr mewn gofalu am eu hanwyliaid. Cefais y cyfle'n ddiweddar i gyfarfod â grŵp gofalwyr Hafal yn fy etholaeth i, a mynegwyd llawer iawn o bryder am lefel y cymorth i ofalwyr yng Nghymru. Gwn fod pethau'n gwella oherwydd y cydsyniad trawsbleidiol sydd gennym yma yn y Senedd i wella cymorth i ofalwyr, ond cyfeiriwyd yn arbennig at dynnu'n ôl y gwasanaeth cymorth i ofalwyr a ddechreuwyd fel cynllun peilot yn fy etholaeth i. Cafodd ei dynnu'n ôl er gwaethaf y ffaith ei fod yn llwyddiannus iawn yn ystod y cyfnod peilot. A wnewch chi ymchwilio i hynny i weld beth allai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i sicrhau bod cynlluniau peilot yn parhau os ydynt yn llwyddiannus, nid dod i ben?

The First Minister: Pilot schemes are designed to assess the effectiveness of particular initiatives. I will write to you on the scheme in your area, but I join you in your recognition of the improvements that have been made in the support available to carers over the past few years.

Ysbytai Cyffredinol Dosbarth

3. Alun Davies: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am fuddsoddi mewn Ysbytai Cyffredinol Dosbarth yng Nghymru. OAQ(3)3092(FM)*

The First Minister: We have made significant investment in district general hospitals to ensure that the health needs of our people are met.

Alun Davies: I am thinking particularly of the investment that has been seen recently in Withybush General Hospital, Prince Philip Hospital, Llanelli, and Bronglais General Hospital, Aberystwyth. There have been historic levels of investment, ensuring that we have services that are provided as safely and as close to the patient as possible. That investment has led to increased levels of patient care and has enabled us to provide excellence close to patients' homes. Despite that record, First Minister, I am sure that you will be as dismayed as I was to learn that there are politicians in the Chamber who go around different parts of Wales whipping up fear among some of the most vulnerable in society, playing games with people's health and fears and with the future of our hospitals. Will you join me in condemning those politicians and the way in which they raise needless fears among the most vulnerable groups in society?

The First Minister: Yes. It is exceptionally important that politicians recognise their responsibility not to create problems where none exist. Certainly, with regard to your region, the Hywel Dda Local Health Board has confirmed that it is committed to ensuring that its four main hospitals remain major healthcare providers, and they will continue to be designated as district general

Y Prif Weinidog: Bwriad cynlluniau peilot yw asesu effeithiolrwydd mentrau arbennig. Ysgrifennaf atoch am y cynllun yn eich ardal chi, ond ymunaf â chi i gydnabod y gwelliannau a wnaethpwyd yn y cymorth sydd ar gael i ofalwyr dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf.

District General Hospitals

3. Alun Davies: *Will the First Minister make a statement on investment in District General Hospitals in Wales. OAQ(3)3092(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth i sicrhau bod anghenion iechyd ein pobl yn cael eu bodloni.

Alun Davies: Rwyf yn meddwl yn arbennig am y buddsoddiad a welwyd yn ddiweddar yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwyn Helyg, Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip, Llanelli, ac Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bronglais, Aberystwyth. Buddsoddwyd mwy nag erioed o'r blaen, gan sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau a ddarperir mor ddiogel ac mor agos at y claf â phosibl. Mae'r buddsoddiad hwnnw wedi arwain at lefelau cynyddol o ofal cleifion ac wedi'n galluogi i ddarparu rhagoriaeth yn agos at gartrefi cleifion. Er gwaethaf y record honno, Brif Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr y byddwch chi mor siomedig â minnau o glywed bod gwleidyddion yn y Siambr sy'n mynd o amgylch gwahanol rannau o Gymru yn creu ofn ymhlith rhai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn y gymdeithas, yn chwarae gemau ag iechyd ac ofnau pobl a gemau â dyfodol ein hysbytai. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gondemnio'r gwleidyddion hynny a'r ffordd y maent yn codi ofnau diangen ymhlith y grwpiau mwyaf agored i niwed mewn gymdeithas?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gwnaf. Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig i wleidyddion gydnabod eu cyfrifoldeb i beidio â chreu problemau lle nad oes rhai'n bodoli. Yn bendant, o ran eich rhanbarth chi, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Hywel Dda wedi cadarnhau ei fod wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod ei bedwar prif ysbyty'n dal yn brif ddarparwyr gofal iechyd, a byddant yn parhau i gael eu dynodi'n

hospitals. There is no need for scaremongering on these issues.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): Across three of the four political parties in the Chamber, there is concern about the document that was issued, because it appeared to indicate—indeed, it did indicate—that work had been done along with Assembly officials involving potentially downgrading services in Bronglais and Withybush and moving services to the West Wales General Hospital at Glangwili, away from Prince Philip, Bronglais and Withybush. It is not scaremongering. We have asked for clarification from the Government that, as far as it is concerned, that will not be the case and that the full range of DGH services should be provided from all four hospitals. If the Government is prepared to provide that clarification, the issue will be dead, but we have not had that yet. Will you give it?

The First Minister: Let me repeat what I said a moment ago: the Hywel Dda health board has confirmed that it is committed to ensuring that its four main hospitals remain major healthcare providers, and those designated as district general hospitals will continue to be so. I also understand that the draft document that caused so much concern has been withdrawn. That clarifies the issue.

Cynnyrch o Gymru

4. Joyce Watson: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo cynnyrch o Gymru. OAQ(3)3078(FM)*

The First Minister: We aim to give Welsh food and drink producers a competitive advantage in the marketplace by supporting a number of initiatives, such as attendance at major food events and exhibitions across the UK and overseas, the True Taste awards, food festivals and farmers' markets.

1.40 p.m.

Joyce Watson: Thank you for that response, First Minister. I recently visited a butcher's in Welshpool that had won a number of awards for the quality of its produce, all of which

ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth. Nid oes angen codi bwganod am y pethau hyn.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Ar draws tair o'r pedair plaid wleidyddol yn y Siambr, mae pryderon am y ddogfen a gyhoeddwyd, am ei bod fel petai'n nodi-yn wir, mi oedd yn nodi-bod gwaith wedi'i wneud ynghyd â swyddogion y Cynulliad ynghylch israddio gwasanaethau ym Mronglais a Llwyn Helyg o bosib a symud gwasanaethau i Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru yng Nglangwili, i ffwrdd o ysbytai'r Tywysog Philip, Bronglais a Llwyn Helyg. Nid codi bwganod mo hynny. Rydym wedi gofyn i'r Llywodraeth egluro na fydd hynny'n digwydd, hyd y gŵyr, ac y dylai'r amrywiaeth lawn o wasanaethau Ysbyty Cyffredinol Dosbarth gael ei darparu o bedwar ysbyty. Os yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i egluro hynny, bydd y mater ar ben, ond nid ydym wedi cael hynny eto. A wnewch chi ei roi?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gadewch imi ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais funud yn ôl: mae bwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda wedi cadarnhau iddo ymrwymo i sicrhau bod ei bedwar prif ysbyty'n parhau i fod y prif ddarparwyr gofal iechyd, a bod y rheini a ddynodwyd yn ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth yn parhau i fod felly. Deallaf hefyd fod y ddogfen ddrafft a achosodd gymaint o ofid wedi cael ei thynnu'n ôl. Mae hynny'n egluro'r mater.

Welsh Produce

4. Joyce Watson: *Will the First Minister make a statement on the promotion of Welsh produce. OAQ(3)3078(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Anelwn at roi mantais gystadleuaeth yn y farchnadfa i gynhyrchwyr bwyd a diod o Gymru drwy gefnogi nifer o fentrau, fel mynychu prif arddangosfeydd a digwyddiadau bwyd ledled y DU a thramor, gwobrau'r Gwir Flas, gwyliau bwyd a marchnadoedd ffermwyr.

Joyce Watson: Diolch i chi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Ymwelais yn ddiweddar â chigydd yn y Trallwng a oedd wedi ennill nifer o wobrau am ansawdd ei

was promoted proudly as being sourced locally. Similarly, I was in Harlech over the past few days and my accommodation offered local produce that, in my opinion, was as good as, if not much better than, anything that can be imported. Those are both instances of local businesses relying on local produce, which keeps money within the community. Do you agree that we should take advantage of the fantastic Welsh food and drink that is being produced, to support our local businesses and farmers? That would, in turn, lead to a prosperous local community.

The First Minister: Absolutely, Joyce. One of the big changes in the supply of food, particularly over the past 15 years, has been the tendency to source more and more food locally. There was a time not so long ago when restaurants in Wales did not advertise the fact that they sourced ingredients locally—if, indeed, they did so at all. That has changed tremendously through the work done by the Assembly Government over the past decade or so. We have also managed to open up new markets for our exports so that what we know—namely, that we produce some of the best food in the world—is made known to others so that they do not lose out.

Mohammad Asghar: Last month, a number of businesses in South Wales East won accolades in this year's Great Taste awards: Wernddu Organics, N.S. James Family Butchers, Tudor Brewery in Monmouthshire, and Avana Bakeries Limited in Newport. All picked up prizes for their fine produce. Will the First Minister join me in congratulating these businesses on their success, which is a fine achievement for produce in South Wales East? Given such exceptional regional produce, how does your Government aim to ensure that the Welsh food and drink industry benefits as fully as possible from major events such as the Ryder Cup, which will begin in the next 75 hours? While I welcome events such as the supplier forum held in Newport earlier this year, I am sure that you will agree that, given the magnitude of this event, we must maximise all opportunities to promote Wales and its produce beyond our national borders.

gynnyrch, a'r cyfan ohono wedi'i hyrwyddo'n falch yn gynnyrch lleol. Yn yr un modd, roeddwn yn Harlech dros yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf ac roedd fy llety'n cynnig cynnyrch lleol a oedd, yn fy marn i, cystal ag unrhyw beth y gellid ei fewnforio, os nad llawer gwell. Mae'r ddau beth hyn yn enghreifftiau o fusnesau lleol yn dibynnu ar gynnyrch lleol, sy'n cadw arian yn y gymuned. A ydych chi'n cytuno y dylem fanteisio ar y bwyd a diod fendigedig o Gymru sy'n cael eu cynhyrchu, i gefnogi ein busnesau a'n ffermwyr lleol? Byddai hynny, wedyn, yn arwain at gymuned leol ffyniannus.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn llwyr, Joyce. Un o'r newidiadau mawr yn y cyflenwad bwyd, yn arbennig dros y 15 mlynedd ddiwethaf, fu'r duedd i gael mwy a mwy o fwyd yn lleol. Roedd adeg heb fod yn rhy bell yn ôl pan nad oedd bwytai yng Nghymru'n hysbysebu'r ffaith eu bod yn cael eu cynhwysion yn lleol-yn wir, os o gwbl. Mae hynny wedi newid yn aruthrol drwy'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynlluniad dros y degawd diwethaf fwy neu lai. Rydym wedi llwyddo hefyd i agor marchnadoedd newydd i'n hallforion er mwyn i'r hyn yr ydym ni'n ei wybod-sef ein bod yn cynhyrchu rhywfaint o'r bwyd gorau yn y byd yn cael ei gyhoeddi i eraill fel nad ydynt hwy ar eu colled.

Mohammad Asghar: Fis diwethaf, enillodd nifer o fusnesau yn Nwyrain De Cymru glod yng ngwobrau'r Gwir Flas eleni: bwyd organig Wernddu, cigydd teuluol N.S. James, bragdy Tudor yn Sir Fynwy, ac Avana Bakeries Limited yng Nghasnewydd. Cipiasant i gyd wobrau am eu cynnyrch gwych. A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch y busnesau hyn ar eu llwyddiant, sy'n gyflawniad gwych i gynnyrch yn Nwyrain De Cymru? O ystyried cynnyrch rhanbarthol mor eithriadol, sut mae eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu sicrhau bod diwydiant bwyd a diod Cymru'n elwa cymaint â phosibl ar ddigwyddiadau mawr fel Cwpan Ryder, a fydd yn dechrau yn y 75 awr nesaf? Er fy mod i'n croesawu digwyddiadau fel y fforwm cyflenwyr a gynhaliwyd yng Nghasnewydd yn gynharach eleni, rwy'n siŵr y cytunwch ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud y mwyaf o bob cyfle i hyrwyddo Cymru a'i chynnyrch y tu hwnt i'n ffiniau cenedlaethol,

o ystyried maint y digwyddiad hwn.

The First Minister: You asked two questions. First, on what we are doing to promote Welsh food in Wales, I join you in offering congratulations to the producers that you mentioned. We do support food events in Wales. For example, 57 food festivals have received support this year, and £1.5 million has been allocated over the past three years. In addition, a local sourcing strategic action plan has been developed to fulfil the ‘One Wales’ commitment to launch a major local food initiative, and more than 90 per cent of that plan has been achieved. We look forward to receiving a report on the progress of that plan in the autumn. Secondly, on exports, we have sourced new markets in the middle east and far east that were not previously available to us, which will be increasingly important in ensuring the sustainability of Welsh farming and food production and food processing in years to come.

Leanne Wood: Just over the border, there is a very successful food centre in Ludlow, and more than 80 per cent of the produce that it sells comes from the surrounding four counties. It also employs more than 80 people. That clearly shows that there is a strong demand for locally produced food. A similar venture is planned for Aberteifi town centre, with plans to sell local food as well as to provide cheap parking to stimulate business growth. That venture is being funded by local people who have formed a co-operative to purchase the site in question. What can the Assembly Government do to support such co-operative ventures so that they can become significant drivers for local economies and provide a good outlet for local, good-quality food?

The First Minister: I applaud those efforts, and I know that towns such as Narberth and Abergavenny have also gone down that route. We will do all that we can through initiatives such as the processing and marketing grant to assist with marketing a particular area in connection with its food. I suggest that the group concerned contact officials here, and all that can be done to help them will be done.

Y Prif Weinidog: Gofynasoch ddau gwestiwn. Yn gyntaf, am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo bwyd o Gymru yng Nghymru, ymunaf â chi i longyfarch y cynhyrchwyr y soniasoch amdanynt. Rydym ni'n cefnogi digwyddiadau bwyd yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, mae 57 o wyliau bwyd wedi cael cymorth eleni, a dyrannwyd £1.5 miliwn dros y tair blynedd ddiwethaf. Hefyd, datblygwyd cynllun gweithredu strategol cyrchu lleol i fodloni ymrwymiad ‘Cymru'n Un’ i lansio menter bwyd lleol fawr, ac fe gyflawnwyd dros 90 y cant o'r cynllun hwnnw. Edrychwn ymlaen at gael adroddiad am gynnydd y cynllun hwnnw yn yr hydref. Yn ail, ar allforion, rydym wedi canfod marchnadoedd newydd yn y dwyrain canol a'r dwyrain pell nad oeddent ar gael inni'n flaenorol, a fydd yn fwyfwy pwysig i sicrhau bod ffermio a chynhyrchu bwyd a phrosesu bwyd yn gynaliadwy yng Nghymru am flynyddoedd i ddod.

Leanne Wood: Ychydig dros y ffin, mae canolfan fwyd lwyddiannus iawn yn Ludlow, ac mae dros 80 y cant o'r cynnyrch a wertha yn dod o'r pedair sir o'i hamgylch. Mae hefyd yn cyflogi dros 80 o bobl. Mae hynny'n dangos yn glir fod galw mawr am fwyd a gynhyrchir yn lleol. Mae menter debyg ar y gweill ar gyfer canol tref Aberteifi, gyda chynlluniau i werthu bwyd lleol yn ogystal â darparu lle parcio rhad i ysgogi twf y busnes. Mae'r fenter honno'n cael ei hariannu gan bobl leol sydd wedi ffurfio cydweithfa i brynu'r safle dan sylw. Beth all Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei wneud i gefnogi mentrau cydweithredol felly er mwyn iddynt fod yn sbardunau sylweddol i economïau lleol a darparu man gwerthu da i fwyd lleol o ansawdd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cymeradwyaf yr ymdrechion hynny, a gwn fod trefi fel Arberth a'r Fenni wedi dilyn y trywydd hwnnw hefyd. Byddwn yn gwneud popeth y gallwn drwy fentrau fel y grant prosesu a marchnata i helpu gwaith marchnata mewn ardal arbennig mewn cysylltiad â'i bwyd. Awgrymaf fod y grŵp dan sylw'n cysylltu â swyddogion yma, a bydd popeth y gellir ei wneud i'w helpu yn cael ei wneud.

Mick Bates: First Minister, I am sure that you are aware of the work of Llaeth Cymreig, Highmead Dairies and Milk Link UK in selling Welsh milk that is sourced and processed locally in recyclable poly bottles. For that, they have received a True Taste award and I am sure that we would all wish to congratulate them. However, according to the Welsh public sector food purchasing survey, only 50 per cent of Welsh school milk is purchased in Wales and I believe that a lot of that is sent outside Wales to be processed. What are you going to do to make sure that our schoolchildren get Welsh milk that is processed here, to help the Welsh economy?

The First Minister: First, if the local authorities responsible for school milk contracts are in a position where they have to tender, under European rules they cannot favour local producers in that way. Is there a way around that? Yes, there is.

I have encouraged more suppliers to gear themselves to bid for those contracts. As you and I both know, one of the biggest problems that we have had over the years is that, particularly with big public sector contracts, it was not the case that there was a bias against Welsh producers when it came to the award of those contracts, it was more down to the fact that, at one time, there were almost no Welsh companies that could satisfy the requirements of the contract. That has changed. The procurement initiative that has been in place for the last few years has helped with that. I would certainly encourage all milk producers across Wales to put themselves in a position where they are at least able to bid for those contracts and I am sure that that figure will increase.

Ann Jones: First Minister, a lot has been said about our produce, but do you agree that we should be doing more to tackle the supermarkets and to get the supermarkets on board? Often, you can walk around a supermarket and really have to hunt high and low for produce that is being produced only a few miles down the road. We all talk about food miles and this would be an opportunity for the Assembly to show that we value the work of producers, such as the Snowdonia

Mick Bates: Brif Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o waith Llaeth Cymreig, Highmead Dairies a Milk Link UK yn gwerthu llaeth Cymreig sy'n cael ei gyrchu a'i brosesu'n lleol mewn poteli poly ailgylchadwy. Am hynny, maent wedi cael gwobr Gwir Flas ac rwy'n siŵr y byddem oll yn dymuno eu llongyfarch. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl arolwg prynu bwyd sector cyhoeddus Cymru, dim ond 50 y cant o laeth ysgolion Cymru sy'n cael ei brynu yng Nghymru ac rwy'n credu bod llawer o hwnnw'n cael ei anfon y tu allan i Gymru i'w brosesu. Beth ydych chi'n mynd i'w wneud i sicrhau bod ein plant ysgol yn cael llaeth Cymreig sy'n cael ei brosesu yma, i helpu economi Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn gyntaf, os yw'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gontractau llaeth ysgolion mewn sefyllfa lle mae'n rhaid iddynt dendro, o dan reolau Ewropeaidd ni allant ffafrio cynhyrchwyr lleol yn y modd hwnnw. A oes ffordd o amgylch hynny? Oes.

Rwyf wedi annog mwy o gyflenwyr i baratoi at gynnig am y contractau hynny. Fel y gwyddoch chi ac fel y gwn i, un o'r problemau mwyaf a gawsom dros y blynyddoedd, a hynny'n arbennig o ran contractau sector cyhoeddus mawr, yw nad oedd yn wir bod tueddiad yn erbyn cynhyrchwyr o Gymru pan oedd yn bryd dyfarnu'r contractau hynny; roedd yn ymwneud yn fwy â'r ffaith nad oedd braidd dim cwmni yng Nghymru, ar un adeg, a allai fodloni gofynion y contract. Mae hynny wedi newid. Mae'r fenter gaffael a fu ar waith ers ychydig flynyddoedd bellach wedi helpu gyda hynny. Byddwn yn bendant yn annog pob cynhyrchwr llaeth ledled Cymru i roi ei hun mewn sefyllfa lle gall o leiaf gynnig am y contractau hynny ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y ffigur hwnnw'n cynyddu.

Ann Jones: Brif Weinidog, mae llawer wedi'i ddweud am ein cynnyrch, ond a gytunwch y dylem fod yn gwneud mwy i fynd i'r afael â'r archfarchnadoedd ac i gael ymrwymiad yr archfarchnad a gorfod chwilio ym mhob twll a chornel am gynnnyrch sy'n cael ei gynhyrchu ychydig filltiroedd i lawr y ffordd. Siaradwn oll am filltiroedd bwyd a byddai hwn yn gyfle i'r Cynulliad ddangos ein bod yn gwerthfawrogi

Cheese Company. Vale of Clwyd lamb is also a renowned product, but people do not know where to get it from. We have an awful lot to do to make sure that local produce is available and I believe that the way of achieving that is through the supermarkets.

The First Minister: I agree, Ann, that the supermarkets control most of the food industry. However, things have changed over the years, in that there is now much more awareness and branding of Welsh foods, sometimes within Wales and sometimes outside Wales as well. Different supermarkets have different policies, based on how their customer base reacts to what they do. There is a general principle here that consumers should be as informed as possible about the origin of their food and about what goes into their food, so that they can make informed choices about what they buy. There is no doubt that most Welsh consumers would choose to buy local or Welsh produce, if they were given the opportunity to be informed about that. There are indeed many others outside Wales who see Welsh produce— particularly, but not exclusively, Welsh lamb—as being something that they want to buy. The more labelling the better.

Blaenoriaethau

5. Nick Bourne: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu ei flaenoriaethau ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf. OAQ(3)3081(FM)*

The First Minister: My priorities include delivering the referendum on law-making powers and moving forward with the completion of the 'One Wales' agreement.

Nick Bourne: I thank the First Minister for that response and certainly share his ambition on the first one. I wish to ask specifically about the Communities First programme. The First Minister will recall that the Public Accounts Committee, in February, in a damning document on Welsh Assembly Government policy, said that:

'overall, the Communities First programme

gwaith cynhyrchwyr, fel Cwmni Caws Eryri. Mae cig oen Dyffryn Clwyd hefyd yn gynnyrch clodfawr, ond nid yw pobl yn gwybod o ble i'w gael. Mae gennym gryn dipyn i'w wneud i sicrhau bod cynnyrch lleol ar gael ac rwy'n credu mai trwy'r archfarchnadoedd y mae gwneud hynny.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rwy'n cytuno, Ann, fod yr archfarchnadoedd yn rheoli'r rhan fwyaf o'r diwydiant bwyd. Fodd bynnag, mae pethau wedi newid dros y blynyddoedd, gan fod bellach llawer mwy o frandio ac ymwybyddiaeth am fwydydd o Gymru, weithiau yng Nghymru ac weithiau y tu allan i Gymru hefyd. Mae gan wahanol archfarchnadoedd wahanol bolisiau, yn seiliedig ar y ffordd y mae eu cwsmeriaid yn ymateb i'r hyn a wnânt. Mae egwyddor gyffredinol yma y dylai defnyddwyr gael gwybod cymaint â phosibl am darddiad eu bwyd ac am yr hyn sy'n mynd i mewn i'w bwyd, er mwyn iddynt wneud dewisiadau gwybodus am yr hyn a brynant. Nid oes amheuaeth na fyddai'r rhan fwyaf o ddefnyddwyr Cymru'n dewis prynu cynnyrch lleol neu gynnyrch o Gymru, petaent yn cael y cyfle i gael gwybod am hynny. Yn wir, mae llawer o bobl eraill y tu allan i Gymru sy'n ystyried bod cynnyrch o Gymru- yn enwedig cig oen Cymru, ond nid hwnnw'n unigyn rhywbeth y maent am ei brynu. Mwyaf y labelu, gorau i gyd.

Priorities

5. Nick Bourne: *Will the First Minister outline his priorities for the next six months. OAQ(3)3081(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Ymhlith fy mlaenoriaethau mae cyflenwi'r refferendwm ar bwerau deddfu a symud ymlaen o ran cwblhau cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'.

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw ac rwy'n sicrhau yn rhannu ei uchelgais ar yr un gyntaf. Hoffwn holi'n benodol am raglen Cymunedau'n Gyntaf. Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cofio bod y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus wedi dweud, ym mis Chwefror, mewn dogfen ddamniol am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru:

'ar y cyfan, nid yw rhaglen Cymunedau'n

has not delivered good value for the significant amount of public money spent on it’.

It also talked about the chronic and long-lasting failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to communicate the programme’s objectives. It came up with 12 recommendations and although you damned the report as unbalanced and partial, you did accept all of its recommendations, which included an external assessment of the programme. Will you tell us how that assessment is going, when you intend to publish it and whether we will have a debate on it?

The First Minister: That assessment is being considered by Carl Sargeant, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, and he will report back in due course. Communities First is a very good scheme. There have been examples where it has not worked as we would all have expected, but I have been to many parts of Wales where communities are delighted with Communities First, and Caia Park in Wrexham is a prime example of that. When I went there, the local people—not people involved with the Communities First partnership—were appalled at any suggestion that Communities First might come to an end. They praised the scheme to the hilt and that is true in many communities across Wales. There is a responsibility on Government to ensure that the scheme delivers value for money and that is something that we will always endeavour to do.

Nick Bourne: The problem with the First Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government is that they just cannot take criticism. The Government accepted all 12 recommendations, including an external evaluation, and now the First Minister seems to be rowing backwards on that. The all-party committee found that it did not deliver good value for money.

1.50 p.m.

Moving on, he has undertaken that there will be action on that, and I will take him at his word, but can we expect the same action in

Gyntaf wedi rhoi gwerth da am yr arian cyhoeddus sylweddol a wariwyd arni’.

Roedd hefyd yn sôn am fethiant cronig a maith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfathrebu amcanion y rhaglen. Lluniodd 12 argymhelliad ac er ichi ddamnio’r adroddiad gan ddweud ei fod yn anghybtwys ac yn bleidiol, derbyniasoch ei holl argymhellion, a oedd yn cynnwys asesiad allanol o’r rhaglen. A wnewch chi ddweud wrthym sut mae’r asesiad hwnnw’n mynd rhagddo, pryd rydych chi’n bwriadu ei gyhoeddi ac a fyddwn yn cael dadl amdano?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae’r asesiad hwnnw’n cael ei ystyried gan Carl Sargeant, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, a bydd yn adrodd yn ôl maes o law. Mae Cymunedau’n Gyntaf yn gynllun da iawn. Bu enghreifftiau lle nad yw wedi gweithio fel y byddem oll wedi’i ddisgwyl, ond rwyf wedi bod i lawer rhan o Gymru lle mae cymunedau wrth eu bodd â Chymunedau’n Gyntaf, ac mae Parc Caia yn Wrecsam yn enghraifft wych o hynny. Pan euthum yno, roedd y bobl leol—nid y bobl a oedd yn ymwneud â phartneriaeth Cymunedau’n Gyntaf—yn arswydo at unrhyw awgrym y gallai Cymunedau’n Gyntaf ddod i ben. Buont yn canmol y cynllun i’r cymylau ac mae hynny’n wir mewn llawer o gymunedau ledled Cymru. Mae’r Llywodraeth yn gyfrifol am sicrhau bod y cynllun yn rhoi gwerth am arian ac mae hwnnw’n rhywbeth y byddwn bob amser yn ceisio ei wneud.

Nick Bourne: Y broblem gyda’r Prif Weinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw eu bod yn methu’n lân â derbyn beirniadaeth. Derbyniodd y Llywodraeth y 12 argymhelliad i gyd, gan gynnwys gwerthusiad allanol, ac mae’r Prif Weinidog bellach fel petai’n rhwyfo tuag yn ôl ar hwnnw. Canfu’r pwyllgor hollbleidiol nad oedd yn rhoi gwerth da am arian.

Gan symud ymlaen, mae wedi addo y gweithredir ynghylch hynny, a chymeraf ei air am hynny, ond a allwn ni ddisgwyl yr un

relation to the McKinsey non-report, or the McKinsey framework documents, which still have not been published, and which are still being kept away from Assembly Members and the Welsh public? Will he publish those and will we therefore have the opportunity to scrutinise them in the Assembly so that we can call the Government to account on some of the significant criticisms that we understand are in those framework documents?

The First Minister: As I have said, there is no report. A document was flourished dramatically before the Assembly last week, but, within reason, any suggestions from any source are looked at seriously by the Assembly Government and are given due consideration.

Nick Bourne: I will repeat my question. I did not call it a 'report', because you do not want to, but we know that there are documents. You admitted yourself that a document was brandished here. Will you publish those documents by external consultants about the running of the Welsh health service? That is what the Assembly is for, so that we can call you to account and scrutinise your policy in this arena. You have a record of not wanting to publish reports, as the same is true of other reports. I know that Mark Isherwood has been trying to get the Minister for Health and Social Services to publish a report on substance and alcohol misuse, but that, too, is not being published. Will you undertake to publish these external reports so that we can properly scrutinise your Government and hold you to account on your use of public money—yes or no?

The First Minister: I am investigating this matter following a complaint by the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats. When I have concluded that investigation, I will decide what to do next with any documents that might be made available. Until that investigation is completed and until I can answer the letter that was sent to me by the press, I will make no further comment.

gweithredu mewn perthynas â diffyg adroddiad McKinsey, neu ddogfennau fframwaith McKinsey, sy'n dal heb eu cyhoeddi, ac sy'n dal yn cael eu cadw oddi wrth Aelodau'r Cynulliad a chyhoedd Cymru? A fydd yn cyhoeddi'r rheini ac a fyddwn ni felly'n cael y cyfle i graffu arnynt yn y Cynulliad er mwyn inni ddal y Llywodraeth yn atebol am rai o'r beirniadaethau sylweddol y deallwn eu bod yn y dogfennau fframwaith hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud, nid oes adroddiad. Cafodd dogfen ei chwifio'n ddramatig gerbron y Cynulliad yr wythnos diwethaf, ond, o fewn rheswm, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn edrych o ddifrif ar unrhyw awgrymiadau o unrhyw ffynhonnell ac yn eu hystyried yn briodol.

Nick Bourne: Ailadroddaf fy nghwestiwn. Ni wneuthum ei alw'n 'adroddiad', am nad ydych am wneud hynny, ond yr ydym yn gwybod bod dogfennau. Cyfaddefasoch chi eich hun fod dogfen wedi'i chwifio yma. A wnewch chi gyhoeddi'r dogfennau hynny gan ymgynghorwyr allanol am weithredu gwasanaeth iechyd Cymru? Hwnnw yw diben y Cynulliad, fel y gallwn eich dal yn atebol a chraffu ar eich polisiau yn y maes hwn. Mae gennych hanes o beidio â bod ag eisiau cyhoeddi adroddiadau, ac mae'r un yn wir am adroddiadau eraill. Gwn y bu Mark Isherwood yn ceisio cael y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus i gyhoeddi adroddiad am gamdefnyddio alcohol a sylweddau, ond nid yw hwnnw, ychwaith, yn cael ei gyhoeddi. A wnewch chi addo cyhoeddi'r papurau allanol hyn er mwyn inni graffu'n iawn ar eich Llywodraeth a'ch dal chi'n atebol am y ffordd yr ydych chi'n defnyddio arian cyhoeddus—a wnewch chi neu beidio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rwyf yn ymchwilio i'r mater hwn ar ôl cwyn gan arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru. Pan fyddaf wedi cwblhau'r ymchwiliad hwnnw, byddaf yn penderfynu beth i'w wneud nesaf gydag unrhyw ddogfennau a allai fod ar gael. Nes cwblhau'r ymchwiliad hwnnw a hyd y gallaf ateb y llythyr a anfonwyd ataf gan y wasg, ni fyddaf yn gwneud unrhyw sylw pellach.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I did point out—

Nick Bourne: This is my fourth supplementary question on this point.

The Presiding Officer: I know, and I will call you. I never like to interrupt the leader of the opposition, but I did point out to the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats when this matter was first raised during questions to the First Minister that any complaint that may or may not be in order about the role of any Cabinet Minister is to be made formally by way of communication with the First Minister as guardian of the ministerial code. It is not to be raised here as a point of order or, indeed, a question. That is my difficulty in allowing this line of questioning to continue.

Nick Bourne: With respect, I did not raise the code; the First Minister did. I am asking whether these documents, which I know exist, can be published and whether we can scrutinise them. I simply wanted to ask the First Minister how long it will take him to investigate what really does not need investigating. There are framework documents that we in the Assembly need to scrutinise.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Matters for the ministerial code, which may or may not need to be raised by Members, should be raised with the First Minister in his capacity as keeper of the ministerial code. These are better done by e-mail than by taking up the democratic time of the Assembly, where questions, I believe, should be about matters affecting the people of Wales directly, not about the operation of Government.

Nick Bourne: With respect, I have not raised the code.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I heard you raise a further question about the issue just now. What I am saying is that these matters need to be dealt with through the proper channels. I call the First Minister.

The First Minister: I accept what Nick says, namely that he did not raise the code directly, but I have to consider the context in which

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Roeddwn wedi egluro—

Nick Bourne: Hwn yw fy mhedwerydd cwestiwn atodol am y pwynt hwn.

Y Llywydd: Rwy'n gwybod, a byddaf yn eich galw. Nid wyf byth yn hoffi torri at draws arweinydd yr wrthblaid, ond roeddwn wedi egluro i arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru pan godwyd y mater hwn gyntaf yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog ei bod yn rhaid gwneud unrhyw gŵyn sydd mewn trefn neu beidio am rôl unrhyw Weinidog Cabinet yn ffurfiol drwy gyfathrebu â'r Prif Weinidog fel gwarcheidwad y cod gweinidogol. Ni cheir ei godi yma fel pwynt trefn nac, yn wir, yn gwestiwn. Hwnnw yw fy anhawster wrth ganiatáu i'r cwestiynau hyn barhau.

Nick Bourne: Gyda pharch, ni chodais y cod; y Prif Weinidog a wnaeth hynny. Rwy'n gofyn a all y dogfennau hyn, y gwn eu bod yn bodoli, gael eu cyhoeddi ac a allwn ni graffu arnynt. Roeddwn am ofyn yn syml i'r Prif Weinidog faint o amser y bydd yn ei gymryd iddo ymchwilio i'r hyn nad oes angen ymchwilio iddo o gwbl. Mae dogfennau fframwaith y mae angen inni yn y Cynulliad graffu arnynt.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dylai materion i'r cod gweinidogol, y mae angen eu codi neu beidio gan Aelodau, gael eu codi gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn ei rinwedd ef yn geidwad y cod gweinidogol. Mae'n well gwneud y rhain drwy e-bost na thrwy amser democratig y Cynulliad, lle dylai'r cwestiynau, rwy'n credu, fod am faterion sy'n effeithio ar bobl Cymru'n uniongyrchol, nid am weithredu'r Llywodraeth.

Nick Bourne: Gyda pharch, nid wyf wedi codi'r cod.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Fe'ch clywais yn codi cwestiwn pellach am y peth funud yn ôl. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud yw bod angen ymdrin â'r materion hyn drwy'r sianeli priodol. Galwaf y Prif Weinidog.

Y Prif Weinidog: Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywed Nick, sef nad oedd wedi codi'r cod yn uniongyrchol, ond mae'n rhaid imi

his question was put. However, I can tell him that my investigation will be concluded in the next day or so.

The Presiding Officer: Leader of the opposition, are there any other matters that you wish to raise?

Nick Bourne: No, I am afraid to bring them up.

The Presiding Officer: That is not fair. I would never find anyone out of order who was not disorderly, and certainly not the leader of the opposition.

Nick Bourne: Given that I do not think that there is a question of the code in relation to the report on alcohol and substance misuse, I wonder whether the First Minister would undertake to publish that report and give us the opportunity to discuss it in the Chamber.

The First Minister: I will investigate that issue and I will write to you with an answer.

Christine Chapman: First Minister, keeping people in Wales safe should remain a priority. However, the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats at Westminster are cutting front-line police services and are guilty of opting out of a European directive on human trafficking that is designed to clamp down on the trade in sex slaves. Further to that, they have shelved plans for domestic violence protection orders that force violent men to leave the family home, and they also propose that people accused of rape be allowed to remain anonymous. First Minister, do you agree that the Westminster coalition Government is yet again deserting women as it is under pressure to find immediate big cuts in the £10 billion annual budget of the Home Office? What discussions will you be having with the UK Government on the impact of this on communities throughout Wales?

The First Minister: I am disappointed that the domestic violence orders as proposed have not been implemented yet. I am aware that the Minister for Social Justice and Local

ystyried ym mha gyd-destun y gosodwyd ei gwestiwn. Fodd bynnag, gallaf ddweud wrtho y bydd fy ymchwiliad wedi'i gwblhau yn y diwrnod neu ddau nesaf.

Y Llywydd: Arweinydd yr wrthblaid, a oes unrhyw faterion eraill yr hoffech eu codi?

Nick Bourne: Nac oes, mae ofn arnaf eu codi.

Y Llywydd: Nid yw hynny'n deg. Ni fyddwn byth yn canfod neb allan o drefn heb ei fod yn afreolus, ac nid arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn sicr.

Nick Bourne: O ystyried nad wyf yn credu bod cwestiwn am y cod mewn perthynas â'r adroddiad am gamddefnyddio alcohol a sylweddau, tybed a fyddai'r Prif Weinidog yn addo cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwnnw a rhoi'r cyfle inni ei drafod yn y Siambr.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ymchwiliad i'r mater hwnnw ac ysgrifennaf atoch ag ateb.

Christine Chapman: Brif Weinidog, dylai diogelu pobl yng Nghymru fod yn flaenoriaeth o hyd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn San Steffan yn cwtogi ar wasanaethau heddlu rheng flaen ac wedi dewis peidio â dilyn y gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd ar fasnachu mewn pobl sydd wedi'i chynllunio i roi pen ar y fasnach mewn caethweision rhyw. Yn ogystal â hynny, maent wedi gohirio cynlluniau am orchmynion amddiffyn rhag trais domestig sy'n gorfodi dynion treisgar i adael y cartref teuluol, ac maent hefyd yn cynnig caniatáu i bobl a gyhuddir o drais rhywiol aros yn ddiennw. Brif Weinidog, a ydych chi'n cytuno bod Llywodraeth clymblaid San Steffan unwaith eto yn troi ei chefn ar fenywod am ei bod dan bwysau i ddod o hyd i doriadau mawr ar unwaith yng nghyllideb flynyddol £10 biliwn y Swyddfa Gartref? Pa drafodaethau y byddwch chi'n eu cael â Llywodraeth y DU am effaith hyn ar gymunedau ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rwyf yn siomedig nad yw'r gorchmynion trais domestig fel y'u cynigiwyd wedi'u rhoi ar waith eto. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol

Government has had discussions with the Home Secretary on this issue, and on the issue of rape anonymity. We are committed to tackling violence against women. The launch of 'The Right to be Safe', a six-year integrated strategy for tackling all forms of violence against women, ensures that this is high on the agenda. You may be aware that the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government has recently announced his intention to appoint an anti-human-trafficking co-ordinator to be employed by Gwent Police.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): At your conference in Manchester, you said:

'in short, we do it differently in Wales. We do it our way, and we make no apologies for that.'

Cancer Research UK recently released a report on the implementation of UK cancer strategies, and while the strategies in England and Scotland were well-received, the strategy in Wales was seen as not being a priority here. Worryingly, one of the key recommendations of the report is that:

'a more comprehensive plan should be delivered to ensure consistent delivery, implementation and integration across Wales'.

Will you listen to that advice, or do you plan to continue doing it your own way?

The First Minister: We do things our own way in Wales in order to make things better for our people. We are always willing to listen to advice from cancer charities, but there are good examples of this being taken forward in Wales. Last Thursday, the Minister for Health and Social Services marked the beginning of the construction of the purpose-built Maggie's Cancer Centre at Singleton Hospital in Swansea. That will provide practical advice and support to anyone affected by cancer, and we expect that centre to open in September of next year.

a Llywodraeth Leol wedi trafod â'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref am hyn o beth, ac am fater anhysbysrwydd trais rhywiol. Rydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â thrais yn erbyn menywod. Mae lansio 'Yr Hawl i fod yn Ddiogel', strategaeth integredig chwe blwyddyn i fynd i'r afael â phob math o drais yn erbyn menywod, yn sicrhau bod hwn yn agos at frig yr agenda. Hwyrach y byddwch yn gwybod bod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol wedi cyhoeddi'n ddiweddar ei fwrriad i benodi cydlynnydd atal masnachu mewn pobl i'w gyflogi gan Heddlu Gwent.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Yn eich cynhadledd ym Manceinion, dywedasocho:

'yn fyr, rydyn ni'n ei wneud yn wahanol yng Nghymru. Rydym yn ei wneud yn ein ffordd ni, ac ni ymddiheurwn am hynny.'

Yn ddiweddar, rhyddhaodd Cancer Research UK adroddiad am weithredu strategaethau cancer yn y DU, ac er i'r strategaethau yn Lloegr a'r Alban gael croeso mawr, ystyriwyd nad oedd y strategaeth yng Nghymru'n flaenoriaeth yma. Mae'n peri gofid mai un o argymhellion allweddol yr adroddiad yw:

'y dylid cyflenwi cynllun mwy cynhwysfawr i sicrhau bod cyflenwi, gweithredu ac integreiddio cyson ledled Cymru'.

A wnewch chi wrando ar y cyngor hwnnw, neu a ydych chi'n bwriadu parhau i'w wneud yn eich ffordd eich hun?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydyn ni'n gwneud pethau yn ein ffordd ein hunain yng Nghymru er mwyn gwneud pethau'n well i'n pobl ni. Rydym bob amser yn fodlon gwrandao ar gyngor gan elusennau cancer, ond mae enghreifftiau da o fynd ymlaen â hyn yng Nghymru. Ddydd Iau diwethaf, nododd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod gwaith wedi dechrau i adeiladu Canolfan Ganser Maggie a godir yn bwrrpasol yn Ysbyty Singleton yn Abertawe. Bydd y lle hwnnw'n rhoi cyngor a chymorth ymarferol i unrhyw un y mae cancer yn effeithio arno, a disgwyliwn i'r ganolfan

honno agor ym mis Medi'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Kirsty Williams: The reality is that Wales has higher levels of male cancers than any other part of the UK, and Wales's cancer survival rates are well below that of the European average. By your Government's own admission, the target of 31 days from diagnosis to treatment is met 50 per cent of the time in your best-performing area, and in just 38 per cent of cases in your worst-performing area. That means that Welsh patients diagnosed today with cancer can wait over a month before their treatment begins. You may be satisfied with that, but I am certainly not. The report goes on to say that screening—and as you know, screening can save lives—suffers from recruitment difficulties that fundamentally undermine the security of screening arrangements in Wales, and there are no plans for the Welsh Assembly Government to address that. You say that you need to work on those shortcomings in the screening programme, to pick up more cancers earlier, but you have no plan for exactly how that will be achieved. I will ask you again: what do you intend to do to improve cancer services for patients across Wales?

The First Minister: All these issues are being looked at by cancer networks, and local health boards know that they have a duty to always look to improve services, particularly cancer services. It is difficult to give a judgment on times between diagnosis and treatment; that often depends on the view of the oncologist. There are some cancers that need more urgent treatment than others; I am aware of that even as a lay person. These are all issues that we want to consider. It is right to say that we have a cancer survival rate in Wales that has historically been below that of western Europe. We are ensuring that the situation improves, and it has improved over the past 10 years. What would help us immensely is money from your Government in London to enable us to provide the cancer services that we would like in the future.

Kirsty Williams: Mewn gwirionedd, mae gan Gymru lefelau uwch o ganser ymhlith dynion nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU, ac mae'r cyfraddau goroesi canser yng Nghymru ymhell islaw cyfartaledd Ewrop. Mae eich Llywodraeth chi eich hun wedi cyfaddef bod y targed o 31 diwrnod o'r diagnosis i'r driniaeth yn cael ei gyrraedd 50 y cant o'r amser yn eich ardal sy'n perfformio orau, ac mewn 38 y cant o achosion yn unig yn eich ardal sy'n perfformio waethaf. Mae hynny'n golygu y gall cleifion yng Nghymru sy'n cael diagnosis o ganser heddiw aros dros fis cyn i'w triniaeth ddechrau. Efallai eich bod chi'n fodlon ar hynny, ond nid wyf innau o gwbl. Mae'r adroddiad yn dweud ymhellach fod sgrinio—ac fel y gwyddoch, mae sgrinio'n gallu achub bywydau—yn dioddef o anawsterau recriwtio sy'n tanseilio diogelwch trefniadau sgrinio yng Nghymru, ac nid oes cynlluniau o gwbl i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fynd i'r afael â hynny. Rydych chi'n dweud bod angen ichi weithio ar y diffygion hynny yn y rhaglen sgrinio, i adnabod mwy o ganserau'n gynharach, ond nid oes gennych gynllun ar gyfer sut yn union y bydd hynny'n cael ei wneud. Gofynnaf i chi eto: beth ydych chi'n bwriadu ei wneud i wella gwasanaethau canser i gleifion ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae rhwydweithiau canser yn edrych ar yr holl bethau hyn, ac mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn gwybod bod ganddynt ddyletswydd i geisio gwella gwasanaethau drwy'r amser, yn arbennig gwasanaethau canser. Mae'n anodd barnu'r amseroedd rhwng diagnosis a thriniaeth; mae hwnnw'n aml yn dibynnu ar farn yr oncolegydd. Mae angen triniaeth fwy brys ar rai canserau nag eraill; rwy'n ymwybodol o hynny hyd yn oed yn berson lleyg. Mae'r rhain oll yn bethau y mae arnom eisiau eu hystyried. Mae'n iawn dweud bod gennym gyfradd goroesi canser yng Nghymru a fu'n hanesyddol islaw cyfradd gorllewin Ewrop. Rydym yn sicrhau bod y sefyllfa'n gwella, ac mae wedi gwella dros y 10 mlynedd ddiwethaf. Yr hyn a fyddai'n ein helpu ni'n aruthrol yw arian gan eich Llywodraeth yn Llundain i'n galluogi i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau canser yr hoffem eu cael yn y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: You obviously have not read the report, First Minister, because it is less about resources than strategic leadership, vision and priority. You can stand there and rubbish the targets for cancer treatment times, but they are your own Government's targets, agreed with the professionals in 2005, and five years later, the vast majority of Welsh patients are not beginning their treatment within 31 days—as shown by your Government's own figures, published in May. This is not about doing it your own way; it is about letting Welsh people down. Welsh people deserve cancer services equivalent to those of their neighbours in England and Scotland, and it seems that in your case, First Minister, you are not prepared to do that.

Kirsty Williams: Mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi darllen yr adroddiad, Brif Weinidog, am ei fod yn dweud llai am adnoddau nag arweinyddiaeth strategol, gweledigaeth a blaenoriaeth. Gallwch sefyll yno a diffio'r targedau ar gyfer amseroedd trin canser, ond targedau eich Llywodraeth chi eich hun ydynt, y cytunwyd arnynt â'r gweithwyr proffesiynol yn 2005, a phum mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, nid yw mwyafrif helaeth cleifion Cymru'n dechrau eu triniaeth ymhen 31 diwrnod-fel y dengys ffigurau eich Llywodraeth chi eich hun, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mai. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud â'i wneud yn eich ffordd eich hun; mae'n ymwneud â siomi pobl Cymru. Mae'r Cymry'n haeddu gwasanaethau canser sydd gystal â'r rhai a gaiff eu cymdogion yn Lloegr a'r Alban, ac mae'n debyg, yn eich achos chi, Brif Weinidog, nad ydych chi'n fodlon gwneud hynny.

The First Minister: It is astounding to hear how far the Liberal Democrats have become a subsidiary of the Conservative Party. Kirsty Williams stands there and talks about cancer services and the need for equivalence with England. Let us have the Barnett floor, the implementation of the Holtham commission and the money that we need to provide cancer services in Wales, and then the people of Wales will listen to the Tories and the Lib Dems. Rather than lecturing us on what we need to do, provide us with the resources to do it.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhyfeddol yw clywed cymaint y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol bellach yn is-blaid i'r Blaid Geidwadol. Mae Kirsty Williams yn sefyll yno ac yn siarad am wasanaethau canser a bod angen cywerthedd â Lloegr. Gadewch inni gael llawr Barnett, gweithredu comisiwn Holtham a'r arian sydd ei angen arnom i ddarparu gwasanaethau canser yng Nghymru, ac yna bydd pobl Cymru'n gwranddo ar y Toriaid a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Yn hytrach na phregethu wrthym am yr hyn y mae angen inni ei wneud, rhowch inni'r adnoddau i'w wneud.

2.00 p.m.

Kirsty Williams: You have had four years of record levels of investment in the health service, and that has not translated into record levels of better cancer treatment for people in Wales. You are obsessed with doing it your own way, instead of listening to experts and people working in the field. When will you stop doing it your way, or the Minister for health's way, and get a grip and deliver better cancer services for citizens in Wales?

Kirsty Williams: Rydych wedi cael pedair blynedd o fuddsoddiad mwy nag erioed yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac nid yw hwnnw wedi golygu triniaeth canser well nag erioed i bobl yng Nghymru. Rydych chi wedi gwirioni ar ei wneud yn eich ffordd eich hun, yn lle gwranddo ar arbenigwyr ac ar bobl sy'n gweithio yn y maes. Pryd wnewch chi roi'r gorau i'w wneud yn eich ffordd eich hun, neu ffordd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd, gafael ynddi a darparu gwell gwasanaethau canser i ddinasyddion yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: You have had four months to deliver record cuts. That is a fairly

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydych wedi cael pedwar mis i gyflwyno toriadau mwy nag erioed.

impressive achievement by the Liberal Democrats. It comes down to this: if you want to provide better cancer services, the resources must be there for those services to be provided. The Lib Dems and the Tories in London want to reduce the amount of money available to the people of Wales to spend on the health service and education, and that is what the people of Wales will deliver judgment on next May.

Gareth Jones: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn rhannu fy mhryderon bod y dadleuon o blaid ac yn erbyn gweithredu Rhan 4 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn cael eu camliwio'n fwriadol ac yn anonest gan y gwrth-ddatganolwyr hynny y byddai'n llawer gwell ganddynt droi'r refferendwm yn ddadl ynghylch diddymu'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cymru, ynghyd ag unrhyw beth sy'n ymylu ar ddemocratiaeth Gymreig? Beth y gallwch chi a'ch Gweinidogion ei wneud i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth ymysg y cyhoedd o'r gwir faterion a wynebant cyn iddynt bleidleisio yn y refferendwm?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae dyletswydd ar bawb sy'n mynd i ymgyrchu yn y refferendwm i roi'r gwirionedd i bobl. Clywais rai yn sôn y bydd y refferendwm yn rhoi i'r Cynulliad y pŵer i godi trethi, ond nid yw hynny'n wir. Dywed rhai y bydd mwy o wleidyddion yn y Cynulliad, nad yw'n wirionedd eto, a dywed eraill mai corff elitaidd yw'r corff hwn, er mai corff etholedig ydyw—a gwyddom hynny, wrth gwrs, gydag etholiadau'n dod ym mis Mai.

O ran safbwynt y Llywodraeth, nid oes safbwynt gan y Llywodraeth fel corff, ond, wrth gwrs, mae gan Weinidogion safbwyntiau, ac mae fy safbwynt i yn glir: rhaid i ni gael y pwerau hyn. Rhaid inni eu cael am sawl rheswm: er mwyn ein galluogi i weithio'n fwy effeithiol ac yn rhatach, ac er mwyn gweithio mewn ffordd sy'n fwy democrataidd o ran safbwynt pobl Cymru. Dyna'n sicr fydd y neges o du pawb, bron, yn y Siambr, a dyna'r gwir gwestiwn y dylai pobl Cymru feddwl amdano pan ddaw'r refferendwm.

Brian Gibbons: First Minister, you will be aware that updated research from the Institute for Fiscal Studies and the TUC over the

Mae hwnnw'n gyflawniad gweddol sylweddol gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Dyma'r gwirionedd: os ydych am ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau canser, mae'n rhaid cael yr adnoddau i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Torïaid yn Llundain am leihau'r arian sydd ar gael i bobl Cymru i'w wario ar y gwasanaeth iechyd ac addysg, a hynny y bydd pobl Cymru'n ei feirniadu fis Mai nesaf.

Gareth Jones: Does the First Minister share my concerns that the arguments for and against the implementation of Part 4 of the Government of Wales Act 2006 are being deliberately and dishonestly misrepresented by those anti-devolutionists who would far prefer to see the referendum become an argument about abolishing the Assembly and the Welsh Government, along with anything akin to Welsh democracy? What can you and your Ministers do to raise awareness among the people of the real issues that they will face before voting in the referendum?

The First Minister: Everyone who will campaign in the referendum is duty bound to tell people the truth. I have heard talk that the referendum will give the Assembly tax-raising powers, which is not true. Some say that there will be more politicians in the Assembly, which is also not true, and some others say that this body is an elitist body, although it is an elected body—we all know that, of course, given the elections that are coming in May.

With regard to the Government's stance, the Government as a body does not have a view, but, of course, Ministers do, and my view is clear: we must have these powers. We must have them for several reasons: in order to enable us to work more effectively and cheaply, and in order to work in a way that is more democratic from the point of view of the people of Wales. I am sure that that will be the message from almost everyone in the Chamber, and that is the real question that the people of Wales should think about when the referendum comes.

Brian Gibbons: Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod bod yr ymchwil diweddaraf gan y Sefydliad Astudiaethau Cyllid a'r TUC dros

summer highlighted the regressive and socially unjust nature of the so-called emergency budget last June. Both of those studies showed that families with children are particularly vulnerable to these socially unjust cutbacks. Can you confirm your Government's commitment to giving children here in Wales a flying start to life and to do whatever you can to mitigate the adverse consequences that will damage the life chances of children and the future prospects of Wales?

The First Minister: We know through various studies that have been conducted that the most vulnerable in society are at most risk when it comes to the proposed cuts by the UK Government. We will seek to cushion the vulnerable sections of our community against those cuts. That is what devolution should do. We cannot make promises and we cannot print money, for example, but the priorities of this Government are to ensure that the people of Wales are cushioned against the rapaciousness of what is coming from the UK Government in its present form.

Cwpan Ryder

6. William Graham: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu manteisio i'r eithaf ar y difidend economaidd posibl a fydd yn deillio o'r Cwpan Ryder. OAQ(3)3086(FM)*

The First Minister: The Welsh economy is already benefiting from the Ryder Cup. Many Welsh companies have won contracts linked to the Ryder Cup and golf tourism has doubled since it was announced that the Ryder Cup was coming to Wales. It is important that there is a legacy after the Ryder Cup finishes on Sunday, and we are keen to take that forward. We estimate that the Welsh economy will benefit to the tune of some £73 million, and we intend to ensure that Wales's profile, having been raised by this event, continues to be in the minds of people, particularly in the United States. That will attract more tourists and, in time, more investors, from America and beyond.

William Graham: Thank you, First

yr haf wedi amlygu natur atchweliadol a chymdeithasol anghyfiawn y gyllideb frys fel y'i gelwir fis Mehefin diwethaf. Roedd y ddwy astudiaeth hynny'n dangos bod teuluoedd â phlant yn arbennig o agored i'r toriadau cymdeithasol anghyfiawn hyn. A allwch chi gadarnhau ymrwymiad eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod bywydau plant yma yng Nghymru'n dechrau'n deg ac i wneud beth bynnag y gallwch i liniaru'r canlyniadau andwyol a fydd yn niweidio cyfleoedd bywyd plant a rhagolygon Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydym yn gwybod drwy amryw astudiaethau a gynhaliwyd mai'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas sydd yn y perygl mwyaf o ran y toriadau arfaethedig gan Lywodraeth y DU. Byddwn yn ceisio clustogi'r rhannau agored i niwed o'n cymuned rhag y toriadau hynny. Dyna y dylai datganoli ei wneud. Ni allwn wneud addewidion ac ni allwn argraffu arian, er enghraifft, ond blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth hon yw sicrhau bod pobl Cymru'n cael eu clustogi rhag rheibusrwydd yr hyn sy'n dod o Lywodraeth y DU yn ei ffurf bresennol.

The Ryder Cup

6. William Graham: *Will the First Minister outline how the Welsh Assembly Government plans to maximise the potential economic dividend arising from the Ryder Cup. OAQ(3)3086(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae economi Cymru eisoes yn elwa ar Gwpan Ryder. Mae llawer o gwmnïau yng Nghymru wedi ennill contractau sy'n gysylltiedig â Chwpan Ryder ac mae twristiaeth golff wedi dyblu ers cyhoeddi bod Cwpan Ryder yn dod i Gymru. Mae'n bwysig cael etifeddiaeth ar ôl i Gwpan Ryder ddod i ben ddydd Sul, ac rydym yn awyddus i fynd ymlaen â hynny. Amcangyfrifwn y bydd economi Cymru'n elwa tua £73 miliwn, a bwriadwn sicrhau bod proffil Cymru, wedi'i hybu gan y digwyddiad hwn, yn parhau ym meddyliau pobl, yn arbennig yn yr Unol Daleithiau. Bydd hynny'n denu mwy o dwristiaid ac, ymhen amser, mwy o fuddsoddwyr, o America a'r tu hwnt.

William Graham: Diolch, Brif Weinidog,

Minister, for that answer. Will you join me in welcoming not only the golfers but all those who have come to see such a splendid event in Wales? Will you salute Sir Terry Matthews for his foresight in making such an enormous private investment in the Celtic Manor Resort, and Newport City Council and its partners in making the preparations so timely—I think that the station was completed only on Sunday of this week—and finally, First Minister, will you join me in wishing the European team well in perhaps securing the cup this time?

The First Minister: I find little there with which to disagree. The fact that the Ryder Cup has been delivered with everything ready is a tribute to the work that has gone on among various organisations and individuals, such as the Welsh Assembly Government, the European tour, Newport City Council and Sir Terry Matthews—the Ryder Cup would not be in Wales had he not invested money from his own pocket to build the Celtic Manor in the first place. It is an exciting event. Yesterday, when I welcomed the American team to Wales, I was struck by the number of journalists there from across the world. This is a big showcase event for Wales, and it is an opportunity for us to sell ourselves to the world, to show that Wales is a great place to visit and a great place in which to invest. I am sure that all Members would agree with that.

Bethan Jenkins: I have recently received correspondence from individuals in my region who are concerned about the benefits that the Ryder Cup will bring to the whole of Wales. I know that you mentioned that it should bring £73 million to Wales, but could you expand on how the Welsh Government will measure the return on its investment, and how we will secure legacy funding for the whole of Wales?

The First Minister: As far as the Ryder Cup is concerned, we have been very careful to ensure that the whole of Wales benefits, not just Newport, even though Newport is the host city. I know that golf clubs across Wales, for example, Royal St David's Golf Club in Harlech, the golf club in Nefyn, and so on, have benefited massively, even though

am yr ateb hwnnw. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i groesawu nid yn unig y golffwyr ond y rheini oll sydd wedi dod i weld digwyddiad mor rhagorol yng Nghymru? A wnewch chi gydnabod Syr Terry Matthews am ei graffter wrth wneud buddsoddiad preifat mor anferth yn Celtic Manor Resort, a Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd a'i bartneriaid am wneud y paratoadau mewn digon o bryd—rwy'n credu mai dim ond ddydd Sul yr wythnos hon y cwblhawyd yr orsaf—ac, yn olaf, Brif Weinidog, a wnewch chi ymuno â mi i ddymuno'n dda i dîm Ewrop i gipio'r cwpan y tro hwn efallai?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ychydig iawn yno sydd i anghytuno ag ef. Mae'r ffaith bod Cwpan Ryder wedi'i gyflenwi gyda phopeth yn barod yn deyrnged i'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd ymhlith amryw sefydliadau ac unigolion, fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y daith Ewropeaidd, Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd a Syr Terry Matthews—ni fyddai Cwpan Ryder yng Nghymru heblaw iddo ef fuddsoddi arian o'i boced ei hun i adeiladu Celtic Manor yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n ddigwyddiad cyffrous. Ddoe, pan groesewais dîm America i Gymru, cefais fy nharo gan nifer y newyddiadurwyr yno o bedwar ban byd. Mae hwn yn ddigwyddiad mawr i arddangos Cymru, ac mae'n gyfle inni werthu ein hunain i'r byd, i ddangos bod Cymru'n lle gwych i ymweld ag ef ac yn lle gwych i fuddsoddi ynddo. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddai'r holl Aelodau'n cytuno â hynny.

Bethan Jenkins: Rwyf wedi cael gohebiaeth yn ddiweddar gan unigolion yn fy rhanbarth i sy'n poeni am y buddion y bydd Cwpan Ryder yn eu cyflwyno i Gymru gyfan. Gwn eich bod wedi sôn y dylai ddod â £73 miliwn i Gymru, ond a allech ymhelaethu ar y ffordd y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru'n mesur yr elw ar ei buddsoddiad, a sut byddwn yn sicrhau cyllid etifeddiaeth i Gymru gyfan?

Y Prif Weinidog: O ran Cwpan Ryder, buom yn ofalus iawn i sicrhau bod Cymru gyfan ar ei hennill, nid Casnewydd yn unig, er mai Casnewydd yw'r ddinas sy'n ei gynnal. Gwn fod clybiau golff ledled Cymru, er enghraifft Clwb Golff Brenhinol Dewi Sant yn Harlech, y clwb golff yn Nefyn, ac ati, wedi elwa'n sylweddol, er eu bod cryn dipyn o bellter i

they are some way away from Newport. Our estimate is that there will be £73.1 million boost to the Welsh economy, but a post-event economic impact study will be undertaken to assess the actual impact.

Y Gwasanaethau Argyfwng

7. Chris Franks: *Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch gwasanaethau argyfwng yng Nghanol De Cymru. OAQ(3)3075(FM)*

The First Minister: I have not had direct discussions, but the relevant Cabinet Ministers and their officials are in regular contact with the appropriate services.

Chris Franks: I am sure that you were an avid viewer of the recent Plaid Cymru conference, and particularly the discussions with Paul McKeever, chair of the Police Federation of England and Wales, regarding the creation of a Welsh legal judiciary. What talks have you had regarding more powers for Wales, particularly over our police and courts? Would you comment on the statement by Mr McKeever regarding the impact of the Conservative cuts on the number of police on our streets, and that of chief fire officer for south Wales, Andy Marles, who has warned that 999 response times may increase if the service has to reduce the number of fire engines or fire stations?

The First Minister: I do not think that I can disagree with the views of those who are directly responsible for running those services. As I said last week in the Chamber, having fewer police equals more crime—it is as simple as that. It is an equation that has been in place since police services were first set up, in the early part of the nineteenth century. We continue to look at and examine the evidence for the devolution of criminal justice, but we need to be careful to ensure that if, for example, the police service was devolved at some point in the future, the money would follow. Given the present financial settlement that Wales receives, that is bound to be a concern. Given the context in which we are operating, and that the fire service is devolved but the police service in

ffwrdd o Gasnewydd. Amcangyfrifwn y bydd hwb o £73.1 miliwn i economi Cymru, ond bydd astudiaeth o effaith economaidd yn cael ei chynnal ar ôl y digwyddiad i asesu'r effaith wirioneddol.

The Emergency Services

7. Chris Franks: *What discussions has the First Minister had regarding emergency services in South Wales Central. OAQ(3)3075(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi cael trafodaethau uniongyrchol, ond mae'r Gweinidogion Cabinet perthnasol a'u swyddogion mewn cysylltiad rheolaidd â'r gwasanaethau priodol.

Chris Franks: Rwy'n siŵr y buoch chi'n gwyllo cynhadledd ddiweddar Plaid Cymru'n awchus, ac yn arbennig y trafodaethau â Paul McKeever, cadeirydd Ffederasiwn Heddlu Cymru a Lloegr, ynghylch creu barnwriaeth gyfreithiol i Gymru. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch chi ynghylch mwy o bwerau i Gymru, yn arbennig dros ein heddlu a'n llysoedd? A wnewch chi sôn am y datganiad gan Mr McKeever ynghylch effaith toriadau'r Ceidwadwyr ar nifer swyddogion yr heddlu ar ein strydoedd, ac am ddatganiad y prif swyddog tân i dde Cymru, Andy Marles, sydd wedi rhybuddio y gallai amseroedd ymateb i alwadau 999 gynyddu os bydd rhaid i'r gwasanaeth leihau nifer yr injans tân neu'r gorsafoddd tân?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu y gallaf anghytuno â barn y rheini sy'n uniongyrchol gyfrifol am weithredu'r gwasanaethau hynny. Fel y dywedais yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Siambr, mae cael llai o heddlu'n golygu mwy o drosedd—mae mor syml â hynny. Mae'n hafaliad a sefydlwyd ers sefydlu gwasanaethau'r heddlu gyntaf, tua dechrau'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg. Parhawn i edrych ar y dystiolaeth o blaid datganoli cyfiawnder troseddol, a'i harchwilio, ond mae angen inni ofalu i sicrhau y byddai'r arian yn dilyn pe byddai'r gwasanaeth heddlu'n cael ei ddatganoli rywbryd yn y dyfodol, er enghraifft. O ystyried y setliad ariannol presennol y mae Cymru'n ei gael, mae hynny'n siŵr o beri gofid. O ystyried ym mha gyd-destun yr ydym yn gweithredu, a

terms of operational matters are not, I share your concern that emergency services will be affected very badly by the announcement on 20 October regarding the comprehensive spending review.

2.10 p.m.

Andrew R.T. Davies: First Minister, an emergency service with which many people come into contact is accident and emergency departments. Despite the dedication of all of the staff involved in accident and emergency departments across the South Wales Central region, the waiting times target that your Government has set was missed again last month. At some hospitals, it was missed not by a small amount, but by a country mile. Is that target still relevant today, and is your Government putting in resources to meet it? This is inordinately frustrating for those who present to accident and emergency departments, and it is inordinately troubling for the dedicated staff who work in these departments. Can we be confident that your Government has a handle on this, and that you are dealing with the situation, so that people can be confident of receiving the best accident and emergency care?

The First Minister: Absolutely. The vast majority of patients receive treatment within four hours and are either discharged or admitted. Inevitably, there are times when patients need to wait longer because they may need tests or scans to help staff decide on the best course of treatment. In those circumstances, it is true that patients have to wait longer. However, that means that they get access to the best possible treatment at the time.

Jenny Randerson: I will address the same topic. Regarding your answer, First Minister, if you are saying that the four-hour target is inappropriate, why do you have a 95 per cent target for it? Is it not time that you reassessed this? Also, could you explain to us why the figure for the whole of Wales, in terms of achieving the four-hour target, was 87.3 per

bod y gwasanaeth tân wedi'i ddatganoli ond nid y gwasanaeth heddlu o ran materion gweithredol, rhannaf eich pryder y bydd y cyhoeddiad ar 20 Hydref am yr adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant yn effeithio'n wael iawn ar y gwasanaethau argyfwng.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Brif Weinidog, un gwasanaeth argyfwng y daw llawer o bobl i gysylltiad ag ef yw'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Er gwaethaf ymroddiad yr holl staff sy'n gweithio mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys ledled rhanbarth Canol De Cymru, methwyd unwaith eto fis diwethaf â chyrraedd y targed amseroedd aros y mae eich Llywodraeth chi wedi'i osod. Mewn rhai ysbytai, methwyd â'i gyrraedd nid o fewn trwch blewyn, ond o bell ffordd. A ydy'r targed hwnnw'n dal yn berthnasol heddiw, ac a yw eich Llywodraeth chi'n cyfrannu adnoddau i'w gyrraedd? Mae hyn yn peri rhwystredigaeth ormodol i'r rheini sy'n cyflwyno eu hunain i adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac mae'n peri trafferth ormodol i'r staff ymroddedig sy'n gweithio yn yr adrannau hyn. A allwn fod yn ffyddiog bod gan eich Llywodraeth reolaeth ar hyn, a'ch bod yn ymdrin â'r sefyllfa, fel y gall pobl fod yn ffyddiog o gael y gofal gorau mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys?

Y Prif Weinidog: Heb os nac oni bai. Mae mwyafrif helaeth y cleifion yn cael triniaeth ymhen pedair awr a naill ai'n cael eu rhyddhau neu eu derbyn i'r ysbyty. Yn anochel, mae adegau pan fydd angen i gleifion aros yn hirach am fod angen profion neu sganiau arnynt efallai i helpu staff i benderfynu pa driniaeth sydd orau. Yn yr amgylchiadau hynny, mae'n wir ei bod yn rhaid i gleifion aros yn hirach. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n golygu eu bod yn cael at y driniaeth orau bosibl ar y pryd.

Jenny Randerson: Cyfeiriaf fi at yr un pwnc. Ynghylch eich ateb, Brif Weinidog, os ydych chi'n dweud bod y targed pedair awr yn amhriodol, pam mae gennych darged 95 y cant ar ei gyfer? Onid yw'n bryd ichi ailasesu hwn? Hefyd, a allech chi egluro inni pam oedd y ffigur i Gymru gyfan, o ran cyrraedd y targed pedair awr, yn 87.3 y cant ym mis

cent in August 2010? It was six per cent higher in the previous August. Why is performance against your own target getting worse rather than better?

The First Minister: You have chosen one month out of context there. As far as accident and emergency departments are concerned, you are right to point to our target. The situation is improving. There will be some months when the situation, statistically, may not improve or may get worse, but there may be any number of factors behind that. The important thing is to look at the evidence over the course of a year or over several years. That will show an improvement, particularly since the 1990s and the beginning of the last decade.

Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn Sir Fynwy

8. Nick Ramsay: *Pryd y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cwrdd nesaf â chyd-Weinidogion o'r Cabinet i drafod gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn Sir Fynwy. OAQ(3)3091(FM)*

The First Minister: I meet Cabinet colleagues daily to take forward our programme to improve public services throughout Wales, including Monmouthshire.

Nick Ramsay: Thank you for your answer, First Minister. I am sure that you will agree that, to deliver good public services, you need money. Sadly, in my constituency in Monmouthshire, the local authority has to do its utmost to deliver public services while receiving from the Assembly Government the lowest revenue support grant per head of population of any local authority in Wales. While authorities such as that in Monmouthshire do exceptionally well despite getting a raw deal, do you not agree that it is about time that you discussed with your Minister for Social Justice and Local Government the need to look again at the formula for distributing revenue to local authorities in Wales, and in a way that takes all the factors that those local authorities have to deal with fully into account?

The First Minister: Monmouthshire

Awst 2010? Roedd chwech y cant yn uwch yn y mis Awst blaenorol. Pam mae'r perfformiad mewn perthynas â'ch targed chi eich hun yn gwaethygu yn hytrach na gwella?

Y Prif Weinidog: Rydych wedi dewis un mis allan o gyd-destun yno. O ran adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, mae'n briodol ichi gyfeirio at ein targed. Mae'r sefyllfa'n gwella. Bydd rhai misoedd pan na fydd y sefyllfa'n gwella, yn ystadegol, neu pan fydd yn gwaethygu efallai, ond gall nifer o ffactorau fod yn sail i hynny. Y peth pwysig yw edrych ar y dystiolaeth dros flwyddyn gyfan neu dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Bydd hynny'n dangos gwelliant, yn arbennig ers y 1990au ac ers dechrau'r degawd diwethaf.

Public Services in Monmouthshire

8. Nick Ramsay: *When will the First Minister next be meeting with Cabinet colleagues to discuss public service improvements in Monmouthshire. OAQ(3)3091(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Rwy'n cyfarfod â chyd-Weinidogion o'r Cabinet bod dydd i fynd ymlaen â'n rhaglen i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys Sir Fynwy.

Nick Ramsay: Diolch am eich ateb, Brif Weinidog. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi'n cytuno bod angen arian arnoch er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus da. Yn anffodus, yn fy etholaeth i yn Sir Fynwy, mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdod lleol wneud ei orau glas i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus er ei fod yn cael oddi wrth Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y grant cynnal refeniw isaf y pen o unrhyw awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru. Er bod awdurdodau fel hwnnw yn Sir Fynwy'n gwneud yn eithriadol o dda er eu bod yn cael cam, onid ydych chi'n cytuno ei bod yn hen bryd ichi drafod â'ch Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yr angen i ailedrych ar y fformiwla ar gyfer dosbarthu refeniw i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a hynny mewn ffordd sy'n llwyr ystyried yr holl ffactorau y mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â hwy?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd rhaid i awdurdod Sir

authority will have to take this matter up with the Welsh Local Government Association, which agrees the formula. The formula is not imposed from on high; it has been agreed for many years. Therefore, the local authority in Monmouthshire must take this issue up with the WLGA. However, I entirely agree with your comment that, for services to be provided, money is needed, and that is exactly what we are not going to get in October. Nevertheless, I welcome your honesty, Nick, and I look forward to welcoming you on to these benches as a result of the comments that you have just made.

Trafnidiaeth Gyhoeddus

9. Paul Davies: *A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wella seilwaith trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn y Gorllewin. OAQ(3)3080(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y gorllewin yw gwella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus drwy'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol. Mae hynny'n golygu gwella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd a bysiau, yn ogystal ag ehangu gwasanaeth TrawsCambria.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ateb. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol fy mod i wedi ymgyrchu dros wella'r gwasanaethau trên i Abergwaun dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Mae SWWITCH, sef consortiwm cludiant integredig de-orllewin Cymru, wedi argymhell y dylid gwella'r gwasanaethau i ogledd Sir Benfro. Yn ôl y llythyr diwethaf a dderbyniais gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ym mis Mehefin, mae'r Llywodraeth yn awr yn ystyried y mater. O dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno y byddai gwella gwasanaethau o'r fath o fudd i'r economi lleol? Hefyd, a all y Prif Weinidog ddweud wrthym pryd y bydd ei Lywodraeth yn gwneud penderfyniad ynghylch y mater pwysig hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf am roi'r argraff y bydd hwn yn brosiect a gaiff ei gyllido'n weddol gynnar. Ystyrir sawl prosiect arall ar hyn o bryd ac y mae rhaid inni—heb wneud y pwynt gwleidyddol hwn dro ar ôl tro—aros i weld beth fydd y sefyllfa ar ôl yr adolygiad ar

Fynwy fynd â'r mater hwn at Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, sy'n cytuno ar y fformiwla. Nid yw'r fformiwla'n cael ei osod o uchderau awdurdod; cytunwyd arno ers blynyddoedd lawer. Felly, mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdod lleol yn Sir Fynwy drafod y mater hwn â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, cytunaf yn llwyr â'ch sylw fod angen arian er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau, a dyna'n union nad ydym yn mynd i'w gael ym mis Hydref. Serch hynny, croesawaf eich gonestrwydd, Nick, ac edrychaf ymlaen at eich croesawu chi i'r meinciau hyn o ganlyniad i'r sylwadau yr ydych newydd eu gwneud.

Public Transport

9. Paul Davies: *Will the First Minister make a statement on improving the public transport infrastructure in West Wales. OAQ(3)3080(FM)*

The First Minister: Our priorities for west Wales are to improve public transport through the national transport plan. That means improving rail and bus services, as well as plans to expand the TrawsCambria service.

Paul Davies: I am grateful to the First Minister for his response. I am sure that the First Minister is aware that I have been campaigning for the improvement of train services to Fishguard over the past few years. SWWITCH, the local transport consortium, has recommended that services to north Pembrokeshire should be improved. According to the latest letter that I received from the Deputy First Minister, back in June, the Government is now considering the issue. Under these circumstances, does the First Minister agree that improving such services would benefit the local economy? Also, can the First Minister tell us when his Government will make a decision on this important issue?

The First Minister: I do not want to give the impression that this project will be funded fairly early on. Several other projects are currently being considered and we must—without making this political point repeatedly—wait to see what the situation

20 Hydref.

Deallaf fod rheilffordd yno ac nad yw'n cael ei defnyddio'n aml iawn—tua tair neu bedair gwaith y dydd i Abergwaun. Rhaid hefyd nodi'r ffaith fod y rheilffordd wedi'i gwanhau ers i'r trenau 125 gael eu tynnu o'r gwasanaeth sawl blwyddyn yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wastad yn awyddus i wella'r rheilffordd yng Nghymru gyfan a dros y blynyddoedd y mae rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg a rheilffordd cwm Ebwy wedi agor. Yr ydym yn ystyried cynlluniau eraill, ond nid yw'n bosibl ar hyn o bryd i roi amserlen ichi ar y rheini.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod Llandeilo wedi bod yn disgwyl am gyfnod hir i gael ffordd osgoi a bod yr achos drosto wedi'i ddadlau a'i dderbyn erbyn hyn. Mae ar y rhestr o welliannau a osodwyd gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder y gallai fod gohiriad pellach erbyn hyn oherwydd y toriadau a ddaw o'r glymblaid yn San Steffan?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â Llandeilo a'r problemau a gaiff eu creu o achos traffig yn ystod y dydd. Yr wyf yn rhannu'r pryder ynghylch yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd ar 20 Hydref. Ni wyddom yn union beth fydd graddfa'r toriadau, yn enwedig â chyfalaf, ond gwneuthum y pwynt sawl gwaith i Lywodraeth San Steffan y dylid ystyried cyllido Cymru a sut y caiff ei chyllido yn y tymor hir. Fodd bynnag, deallaf y bydd pobl Llandeilo am weld ffordd osgoi cyn gynted â phosibl, ond bydd yr ateb o ran yr amserlen yn gliriach ar ôl diwedd mis nesaf.

Meini Prawf Fformiwla Barnett

10. Gareth Jones: *Pa bwysau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei roi ar Llywodraeth San Steffan i ailystyried meini prawffformiwla Barnett. OAQ(3)3098(FM)*

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi codi'r pwynt hwn droeon gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ac y mae fy nghyd-Weinidogion yn cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU i bwysleisio'r angen am arian i Gymru ac i bwysleisio diwygio'r

will be after the review on 20 October.

I understand that there is a railway line but that it is not used very often—about three or four times a day to Fishguard. We must also note the fact that the railway has been weakened since the 125 trains were withdrawn from the service several years ago. However, we are always looking to improve the railways in the whole of Wales and the Vale of Glamorgan line and the Ebbw valley railway have opened over the past few years. We are considering other plans, but it is not possible to give you a timetable on those at present.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You will be aware that Llandeilo has been waiting for a long time to have a bypass and the case for it has been argued and accepted. It is on the list of amendments proposed by the Deputy First Minister. Do you share my concern that there could be a further postponement now because of the cuts being made by the coalition in Westminster?

The First Minister: I am very familiar with Llandeilo and the problems that are caused by traffic during the day. I share the concern about what will happen on 20 October. We do not know exactly what the scale of the cuts will be, particularly for capital, but I made the point several times to the Westminster Government that it should consider the funding for Wales and the way in which it is funded in the long term. However, I understand that the people of Llandeilo want to see a bypass as soon as possible, but the answer on the timetable will be clearer after the end of next month.

Barnett Formula Criteria

10. Gareth Jones: *What pressure is the Welsh Assembly Government putting on the UK Government to reconsider the Barnett formula criteria. OAQ(3)3098(FM)*

The First Minister: I have raised this point many times with the Secretary of State, and my ministerial colleagues have regular discussions with UK Government Ministers to press the case for funding for Wales and to press for a reform of the Barnett formula

fformiwla Barnett gan fod gennym y dystiolaeth berthnasol yn awr.

Gareth Jones: Yr wyf yn falch fod bob plaid o'r diwedd wedi derbyn yr hyn y mae Plaid Cymru wedi'i gredu ers amser maith, sef fod fformiwla Barnett yn hynod o annheg a niweidiol i Gymru. Yn aml, yr ydym yn sôn am ystadegau a chyn belled ag y mae tlodi plant yn y cwestiwn, mae anghyfiawnder yn yr holl beth, sy'n deillio o'r diffyg ariannu hwnnw. Pa gamau a gymerwyd hyd yma i fynd i'r afael â hyn ac a yw Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ystyried unrhyw fath o weithredu cyfreithiol i gywiro'r cam?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n anodd gweld pa gamau cyfreithiol y gellir eu cymryd, ond mae camau gwleidyddol. Y pwynt a gefnogir gan sawl plaid yn y Siambr yw y dylai argymhellion comisiwn Holtham gael eu hystyried gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Ni ddeallaf pam mae cwestiwn comisiwn Holtham wedi'i glymu gyda'r refferendwm. Mae'n hwnnw'n wir ynghylch cytundeb y glymblaid. Ni ddeallaf y rhesymeg y tu ôl i hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n wir dweud fod gennym dystiolaeth gref i ddangos nad yw Cymru'n cael ei chyllido mewn ffordd deg.

David Melding: I am sure that we all anticipate a successful referendum result next March—it is certainly what we will all work towards. However, I am surprised that you do not see the bigger picture because the coalition Government in Westminster, of the Conservatives and Liberal Democrats, is the first Westminster Government to agree to review the Barnett formula. The Labour Party that you support, after 13 years in Government, never did it. Indeed, some of us who have been here since 1999 remember Ron Davies raising this issue in the early years and getting squashed flat—if that were possible in terms of Ron Davies—by Rhodri Morgan. You disguised your support for Ron Davies then with great alacrity.

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: The first point to make is that it has been suggested in the Chamber

given that we now have the relevant evidence.

Gareth Jones: I am pleased that all parties have finally accepted what Plaid has long believed, namely that the Barnett formula is extremely unfair and damaging to Wales. Often, we are talking about statistics and as far as child poverty is concerned, there is injustice in the whole thing, which stems from that lack of funding. What steps have been taken so far to get to grips with this and has the Welsh Government considered any kind of legal action to correct the wrong?

The First Minister: It is difficult to see what legal steps could be taken, but political action would be possible. The point that is supported by several parties in the Chamber is that the recommendations of the Holtham commission should be considered by the United Kingdom Government. I do not understand why the Holtham commission question is tied to the referendum. That is true with regard to the coalition agreement. I do not understand the logic behind that. However, it is true to say that we have strong evidence to show that Wales is not being funded fairly.

David Melding: Rwyf yn siŵr ein bod oll yn rhagweld canlyniad refferendwm llwyddiannus ym mis Mawrth nesaf—hwnnw'n sicr y byddwn oll yn gweithio tuag ato. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n synnu nad ydych chi'n gweld y darlun mwy oherwydd y Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan, sef y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yw'r Llywodraeth San Steffan gyntaf i gytuno i adolygu fformiwla Barnett. Ni wnaeth y Blaid Lafur a gefnogwch chi mo hynny erioed, ar ôl 13 mlynedd mewn Llywodraeth. Yn wir, mae rhai ohonom a fu yma er 1999 yn cofio Ron Davies yn codi'r mater hwn yn y blynyddoedd cynnar ac yn cael ei wasgu'n fflat—petai hynny'n bosibl i Ron Davies—gan Rhodri Morgan. Cuddiasoch eich cefnogaeth i Ron Davies â chrym barodrwydd ar y pryd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn gyntaf, oll, awgrymwyd yn y Siambr ers blynyddoedd

for many years by those in different parties that the Barnett formula was not serving Wales as well as it had done. What was missing was the evidence. The Holtham commission provided that evidence. As a result of this Government putting the commission in place, the evidence is now there. I am surprised to hear you say, David, that the Government in London has agreed to review Barnett, as that is not my understanding at all. What it has said—and I shall try to quote as accurately as I can—is that it will look at the financing of Wales depending on the outcome of the referendum. They are not my words, but those of the coalition agreement. That surprises me, because I do not think that the two run together, and I cannot understand the logic of linking the two issues in the minds of the people of Wales.

lauer gan y rheini mewn gwahanol bleidiau nad oedd fformiwla Barnett yn gwasanaethu Cymru cystal ag y bu. Yr hyn a oedd ar goll oedd y dystiolaeth. Darparodd comisiwn Holtham y dystiolaeth honno. Am fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi gosod y comisiwn yn ei le, mae'r dystiolaeth ar gael bellach. Rwy'n synnu o'ch clywed chi'n dweud, David, fod y Llywodraeth yn Llundain wedi cytuno i adolygu Barnett, gan nad felly y'i deallais innau o gwbl. Yr hyn a ddywedodd—a cheisiaf ddyfynnu mor gywir ag y gallaf—yw y bydd yn edrych ar gyllido Cymru gan ddibynnu ar ganlyniad y refferendwm. Nid fy ngeiriau i mo'r rheini, ond geiriau cytundeb y glymblaid. Mae hynny'n fy synnu, achos nid wyf yn credu bod y ddau'n cyd-redeg, ac ni allaf ddeall rhesymeg cysylltu'r ddau beth ym meddyliau pobl Cymru.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the First Minister.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Adolygiad ar y Cyd o Achosion Difrifol Joint Serious Case Review

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi caniatáu cwestiwn brys gan Andrew R.T. Davies i'w ateb gan y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ond cyn imi ei alw i'w ofyn, atgoffaf yr Aelodau fod gwaharddiad Uchel Lys rhag datgelu manylion y personau a effeithiwyd. Nid yw hynny, serch hynny, yn ein hatal rhag trafod y materion difrifol dan sylw.

The Presiding Officer: I have allowed an urgent question by Andrew Davies to be answered by the Deputy Minister for Social Services, but before I invite him to ask it, I remind Members of the High Court injunction against revealing the details of those who have been affected. That does not prevent us, however, from discussing the serious matters at hand.

Andrew R.T. Davies: *A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar yr Adolygiad ar y Cyd o Achosion Difrifol a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Medi sy'n dangos diffygion difrifol gan asiantaethau sy'n gyfrifol am amddiffyn plant. EAQ(3)1682(HSS)*

Andrew R.T. Davies: *Will the Minister make a statement on the Joint Serious Case Review published on the 24th of September which indicates serious failings by agencies responsible for child protection. EAQ(3)1682(HSS)*

The Deputy Minister for Social Services (Gwenda Thomas): I thank you, Helen Mary Jones, and Veronica German for agreeing to attend the in-depth cross-party briefing that I offered to you all on Thursday. This is a tragic case. I have met representatives of the local authorities involved and the police to

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Gwenda Thomas): Diolchaf i chi, Helen Mary Jones, a Veronica German am gytuno i ddod i'r sesiwn wybodaeth drawsbleidiol fanwl a gynigiais i bob un ohonoch ddydd Iau. Mae hwn yn achos trasig. Rwyf wedi cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr

understand the actions that they are taking in respect of the report's recommendations. All recommendations for the Welsh Assembly Government have been referred to the national safeguarding forum for consideration. Assembly Members have received my media statement, which was issued on 24 September.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Deputy Minister, for that answer. Many of the people who have read and have had insight into the report can only be deeply troubled and upset by its contents. I am sure that the 51 recommendations made in the report will find favour with all who have read it. People will deplore the inaction of the 46 different agencies involved in these cases over a period of time. We all understand that certain aspects of this case happened over a considerable time, but other aspects are relatively recent.

Greatly troubling is the ability of authorities to share information and respond when concerns are raised in a legitimate fashion. My questions for you, Deputy Minister, are quite simple. As the report identifies, it is not necessarily more regulation that is required, so much as an understanding of the obligation that people are under if they work in the field of child protection. Are you confident that you, as Deputy Minister, are able to work with the agencies to mitigate any possibility of these events happening again in Wales? That is the critical question. As the report identifies, it is not necessarily more regulation that is needed, but the ability to make the agencies and the regulations work as they have been constructed. The key responsibility falls to you as the Deputy Minister, and to the agencies that work with you, to make them happen for the benefit of children and young people in Wales. Do you have confidence in yourself to do that?

Gwenda Thomas: I consider that a very balanced question, and I thank you for that. I am convinced that what happened to these children is not characteristic of the way in which services to safeguard and protect children operate in Wales today. That is not to say that anyone who has read this report

o'r awdurdodau lleol dan sylw a'r heddlu i ddeall y camau y maent yn eu cymryd o ran argymhellion yr adroddiad. Cyfeiriwyd pob argymhelliad i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru at y fforwm diogelu cenedlaethol i'w ystyried. Mae Aelodau Cynulliad wedi cael fy natganiad i'r cyfryngau, a gyhoeddwyd ar 24 Medi.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch, Ddirprwy Weinidog, am yr ateb hwnnw. Ni all cynnwys yr adroddiad ond poeni a gofidio'n ddwfn llawer o'r bobl sydd wedi ei ddarllen ac wedi cael gwybod amdano. Rwyf yn siŵr y bydd y 51 o argymhellion a wnaethpwyd yn yr adroddiad yn ennill bodd pawb a'i darllenodd. Bydd pobl yn gresynu at segurddod y 46 gwahanol asiantaeth a oedd yn rhan o'r achosion hyn dros gyfnod o amser. Rydym oll yn deall bod rhai agweddau ar yr achos hwn wedi digwydd dros gyfnod sylweddol, ond mae agweddau eraill yn gymharol ddiweddar.

Mae gallu awdurdodau i rannu gwybodaeth ac ymateb pan godir pryderon mewn modd dilys yn peri gofid mawr. Mae fy nghwestiynau i chi, Ddirprwy Weinidog, yn eithaf syml. Fel y mae'r adroddiad yn ei nodi, nid mwy o reoleiddio sy'n ofynnol o reidrwydd, cymaint â deall y rhwymedigaeth sydd ar bobl os ydynt yn gweithio ym maes amddiffyn plant. A ydych chi'n ffyddiog y gallwch chi, fel Dirprwy Weinidog, weithio gyda'r asiantaethau i liniaru unrhyw bosibilrwydd y bydd y pethau hyn yn digwydd eto yng Nghymru? Hwnnw yw'r cwestiwn allweddol. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, nid rhagor o reoleiddio sydd ei angen o reidrwydd, ond y gallu i wneud i'r asiantaethau a'r rheoliadau weithio fel y'u lluniwyd. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb allweddol yn perthyn i chi, y Dirprwy Weinidog, ac i'r asiantaethau sy'n gweithio gyda chi, i wneud iddynt ddigwydd er budd plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. A oes gennych ffydd ynoch chi'ch hun i wneud hynny?

Gwenda Thomas: Ystyriaf fod hwnnw'n gwestiwn cytbwys iawn, a diolchaf i chi am hynny. Rwyf yn argyhoeddedig nad yw'r hyn a ddigwyddodd i'r plant hyn yn nodweddiadol o'r ffordd y mae gwasanaethau i ddiogelu ac amddiffyn plant yn gweithredu yng Nghymru heddiw. Nid yw hynny'n

could fail to be moved. I am greatly saddened to read about the abuse and neglect that these children endured over many years.

I am also convinced that we have brought about improvements in the latter years, and I am convinced that the establishment of the national safeguarding forum, under the independent chairmanship of Phil Hodgson, will see that process through. As you know, membership of that safeguarding forum is at the highest level. I have sent strong messages to all of the relevant authorities. I have met them and police forces to hear what measures are in place to support these children and how they are going to implement the recommendations of the serious case review. I am also writing to the leaders of each local authority in Wales, to the chief executives of NHS Wales and to chief constables to ask them to ensure that they give full consideration to the recommendations.

As I have said previously in the Chamber, I am not happy with the serious case reviews and the length of time that they take. That is why I have already commissioned a review of serious case reviews. That report is imminent and I will share it with you as soon as it is available. I have also asked the safeguarding forum to look at the effectiveness of local safeguarding children boards. I am on the record as saying that I do not believe that having 22 such boards is the best way of safeguarding children. There are excellent examples where local authorities have decided to merge. I have asked for a full review of the workforce and, as Jonathan Morgan has mentioned, a back-to-back review of the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales is being undertaken. Bringing all of that together is the establishment of the commission on social services, which will report in November. I look to that commission, and the subsequent White Paper that I am committed to publishing at the beginning of the year, to prioritise safeguarding, and I know that that will be the case.

Helen Mary Jones: Like all of us in this Chamber, I was disturbed by the contents of

golygu na allai unrhyw un sydd wedi darllen yr adroddiad hwn fethu â chael ei gynhyrfu. Mae'n drist iawn gennyf ddarllen am y gamdriniaeth a'r esgeulustod y dioddefodd y plant hyn dros lawer o flynyddoedd.

Rwyf yn argyhoeddedig hefyd ein bod wedi achosi gwelliannau yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac rwy'n argyhoeddedig y bydd sefydlu'r fforwm diogelu cenedlaethol, o dan gadeiryddiaeth annibynnol Phil Hodgson, yn sicrhau bod y broses honno'n cael ei chwblhau. Fel y gwyddoch, mae aelodaeth y fforwm diogelu hwnnw ar y lefel uchaf. Rwyf wedi anfon negeseuon cryf i'r holl awdurdodau perthnasol. Rwyf wedi cyfarfod â hwy a'r heddluoedd i glywed pa fesurau sydd ar waith i gefnogi'r plant hyn a sut maent yn mynd i weithredu argymhellion yr adolygiad o achos difrifol. Rwyf hefyd yn ysgrifennu at arweinwyr pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, at brif weithredwyr GIG Cymru ac at brif gwnstabiliaid i ofyn iddynt sicrhau eu bod yn ystyried yr argymhellion yn llawn.

Fel y dywedais o'r blaen yn y Siambr, nid wyf yn fodlon ar yr adolygiadau o achos difrifol a'r amser a gymerant. Dyna pam yr wyf eisoes wedi comisiynu adolygiad o adolygiadau achos difrifol. Mae'r adroddiad hwnnw ar ddod a byddaf yn ei rannu â chi cyn gynted ag y bydd ar gael. Rwyf hefyd wedi gofyn i'r fforwm diogelu edrych ar effeithiolrwydd byrddau diogelu plant lleol. Cofnodwyd imi ddweud nad wyf yn credu mai cael 22 o fyrddau felly yw'r ffordd orau o ddiogelu plant. Mae enghreifftiau rhagorol lle mae awdurdodau lleol wedi penderfynu uno. Rwyf wedi gofyn am adolygiad llawn o'r gweithlu ac, fel y soniodd Jonathan Morgan, mae adolygiad cefn-gefn o Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru'n cael ei gynnal. Dod â hynny oll at ei gilydd yw sefydlu'r comisiwn ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, a fydd yn cyhoeddi adroddiad ym mis Tachwedd. Edrychaf at y comisiwn hwnnw, a'r Papur Gwyn dilynol yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i'w gyhoeddi ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn, i roi blaenoriaeth i ddiogelu, a gwn mai dyna fydd yn digwydd.

Helen Mary Jones: Fel pob un ohonom yn y Siambr hon, roedd cynnwys yr adroddiad

this report and the systematic failures that went on for a number of years, as Andrew R.T. Davies and the Deputy Minister have said. I will begin my brief contribution by saying how pleased I am that the Assembly Government did not wait for the publication of the joint review to start its work with the relevant local authorities, the police service and others. It is entirely appropriate that the work began as soon as the criminal case was over last year and I am encouraged by the action that the Deputy Minister has lead. She has taken action very quickly and has attempted, as much as is possible, to ensure that a failure of this magnitude does not occur again.

Deputy Minister, do you agree that at the heart of this failure to protect children was a failure to listen to what the children and young people were saying? I found that to be the most disturbing and upsetting part of the report. This was not a question of young people not speaking out; it was a question of young people speaking out and not being listened to. Will you give me your assurances this afternoon, Deputy Minister, that in responding to this report and to the conclusions of the independent review, the independent commission and the subsequent White Paper on social services, you will ensure that the voice of the child is put right at the heart of any safeguarding and child protection process? If we do not listen to children and young people, then there is a risk that terrible mistakes of this kind will happen again.

Gwenda Thomas: I absolutely agree that we need to listen and to act on what children and young people tell us. That is the key message contained within the serious case review. We also need to ensure that we do everything we can to support front-line staff to make difficult professional decisions, which must be made on a day-by-day basis. I am also grateful to the Children's Commissioner for Wales and I have heard what he has been saying about listening to children. I am grateful to him for becoming a member of the national safeguarding forum, which I am sure will help the forum in its work.

hwn, a'r methiannau systematig a ddigwyddodd am nifer o flynyddoedd, yn fy mhoeni fel y mae Andrew R.T. Davies a'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi'i ddweud. Dechreuaf fy nghyfraniad byr drwy ddweud mor falch yr wyf nad arhosodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r cydadolygiad gael ei gyhoeddi cyn dechrau ei gwaith gyda'r awdurdodau lleol perthnasol, gwasanaeth yr heddlu ac eraill. Mae'n gwbl briodol y bu i'r gwaith ddechrau cyn gynted ag yr oedd yr achos troseddol ar ben y llynedd ac mae'r camau y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi'u harwain yn galonogol. Mae wedi gweithredu'n gyflym iawn ac wedi ymdrechu, cymaint ag sy'n bosibl, i sicrhau na fydd methiant mor sylweddol yn digwydd eto.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, a ydych chi'n cytuno mai methu â gwrando ar yr hyn yr oedd y plant a'r bobl ifanc yn ei ddweud oedd wrth wraidd y methiant hwn i amddiffyn plant? Canfûm mai honno oedd y rhan fwyaf annymunol ac annifyr o'r adroddiad. Nid mater o bobl ifanc yn gwrthod siarad oedd hwn; mater oedd hwn o bobl ifanc yn siarad a neb yn gwrando arnynt. A wnewch chi fy sicrhau'r prynhawn yma, Ddirprwy Weinidog, y byddwch yn sicrhau, wrth ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn ac i gasgliadau'r adolygiad annibynnol, y comisiwn annibynnol a'r Papur Gwyn dilynol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol, bod llais y plentyn yn cael ei osod wrth wraidd unrhyw broses i ddiogelu ac amddiffyn plant? Os na fyddwn ni'n gwrando ar blant a phobl ifanc, mae perygl y bydd camgymeriadau ofnadwy fel hyn yn digwydd eto.

Gwenda Thomas: Cytunaf yn llwyr fod angen inni wrando ar yr hyn a ddywed plant a phobl ifanc wrthym, a gweithredu yn ei gylch. Honno yw'r neges allweddol yn yr adolygiad o achos difrifol. Mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau y gwnawn bopeth y gallwn i gefnogi staff rheng flaen i wneud penderfyniadau proffesiynol anodd, y mae'n rhaid eu gwneud o ddydd i ddydd. Rwyf hefyd yn ddiolchgar i Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru ac rwyf wedi clywed yr hyn y bu'n ei ddweud am wrando ar blant. Rwy'n ddiolchgar iddo am fod yn aelod o'r fforwm diogelu cenedlaethol, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd hynny'n helpu'r fforwm yn ei waith.

Veronica German: Deputy Minister, I would like to thank you for holding a meeting the other day for the relevant spokespeople and for sharing your thoughts with us, which was very useful indeed. This is an issue on which we all agree. There is no disagreement between political parties because this is not a party-political issue.

2.30 p.m.

I concur with Helen Mary that one of the sad aspects of this case, which the serious case review highlights, is the constant lack of child-centred practice. Not only were children not listened to when they were saying what had happened to them, and were almost ignored, but even when they were being spoken to, we are told that they were not spoken to in a structured and effective manner about their life experiences. Therefore, even if they were saying things, they were not probed. When children moved from one local authority area to another, the information was not passed on, or inadequate information was passed on. I know that many practices have been changed, and I know that you are content that your policies and your framework are good and adequate to be able to address those issues. However, are you content that all the organisations that will be dealing with this framework are as robust and as keen as you are to ensure that all those steps will be taken, so that this situation can never arise again?

Gwenda Thomas: You raise the point again about the voice of the child. That point cannot be raised often enough. It is also important that we implement policies in accordance with what children tell us. Sadly, we all know that we live in a world where there are people, such as this evil abuser, who are good at covering their tracks. We can never eliminate such tragedies in the future, but we must do all that we can to reduce the risk. We will never be able to see through walls, or behind closed doors, which is a matter of ongoing concern to us all, I am sure. However, having said that, it is vital that all agencies work together, and we must send out that clear message today. There are good examples, and there is a commitment to

Veronica German: Ddirprwy Weinidog, hoffwn ddiolch i chi am gynnal cyfarfod y diwrnod o'r blaen i'r llefarwyr perthnasol ac am rannu eich meddyliau â ni, a oedd yn ddefnyddiol iawn yn wir. Mae hwn yn fater yr ydym oll yn gytûn arno. Nid oes anghytundeb rhwng pleidiau gwleidyddol gan nad mater o wleidyddiaeth bleidiol mo hwn.

Cytunaf â Helen Mary mai un o'r agweddau trist ar yr achos hwn, sy'n cael ei amlygu gan yr adolygiad o achos difrifol, yw diffyg cyson yr ymarfer sy'n canolbwyntio ar y plentyn. Ni wrandawyd ar y plant pan oeddent yn dweud beth oedd wedi digwydd iddynt, a bron y'u hanwybyddwyd, ond hefyd, hyd yn oed pan oedd rhywun yn siarad â hwy, dywedir wrthym na siaradwyd â hwy mewn modd strwythuredig nac effeithiol am eu profiadau bywyd. Felly, hyd yn oed os oeddent yn dweud pethau, nid oeddent yn cael eu holi'n fanwl. Pan symudai plant o'r naill ardal awdurdod lleol i'r llall, ni fyddai'r wybodaeth yn cael ei throsglwyddo, neu ni fyddai gwybodaeth ddigon da'n cael ei throsglwyddo. Gwn fod llawer o arferion wedi'u newid, a gwn eich bod yn fodlon bod eich polisiau a'ch fframwaith yn dda ac yn ddigonol i allu mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny. Fodd bynnag, a ydych chi'n fodlon bod yr holl sefydliadau a fydd yn ymdrin â'r fframwaith hwn mor gadarn ac mor awyddus â chi i sicrhau y bydd yr holl gamau hynny'n cael eu cymryd, fel na all y sefyllfa hon byth codi eto?

Gwenda Thomas: Rydych yn codi'r pwynt eto am lais y plentyn. Ni ellir codi'r pwynt hwnnw'n ddigon aml. Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni weithredu polisiau yn unol â'r hyn a ddywed plant wrthym. Yn anffodus, rydym oll yn gwybod ein bod yn byw mewn byd lle mae pobl, fel y camdriniwr anfad hwn, yn fedrus yn cuddio eu holion. Ni allwn byth ddileu trasiediau felly yn y dyfodol, ond mae'n rhaid inni wneud popeth y gallwn i leihau'r risg. Ni fyddwn byth yn gallu gweld trwy waliau, na'r tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig, sy'n peri gofid parhaus inni i gyd, rwy'n siŵr. Fodd bynnag, wedi dweud hynny, mae'n hanfodol bod pob asiantaeth yn cydweithio, ac mae'n rhaid inni anfon y neges glir honno heddiw. Mae enghreifftiau da, ac mae

work together. I have had presentations from the police, who have shown me how their systems have improved in later years, as well as from the three authorities that are involved in this case. However, if we do not work together, we will surely fail again.

Brian Gibbons: This is a distressing and upsetting review. It is entirely right that the agencies involved have apologised for their failures to the children who have been affected. Do you agree that the agencies involved have accepted responsibility for their failures, instead of going into denial, engaging in buck passing between organisations, or the scapegoating of front-line workers, which we often see happening after such adverse reports? The organisations have accepted responsibility and have clearly enunciated their commitment to driving improvement. Accepting their personal responsibility for these failures is the important first step that all organisations must go through if they are going to rectify the failures that occurred in these cases.

Could you confirm whether the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales is involved in an active programme of inspecting the relevant organisations as a consequence of the findings of this review? Could you also reassure us that those inspections are showing that improvement has taken place with regard to the failures that were identified by this review in the first place? Finally, I am pleased to hear that you are considering merging the local safeguarding children boards. The necessary skills and expertise are too thin on the ground at a local level, and this is an important step in concentrating expertise to ensure that, when these incidents happen in the future, there will be quality local expertise to provide the necessary supervision.

Gwenda Thomas: Your point about apologies is well made. It is right that all agencies, and I, have offered this apology. I am confident in the commitment of the agencies; we know that they have accepted all the recommendations. I will be looking to the safeguarding forum and I have written to Phil Hodgson, as its independent chair, to ask for its assistance in ensuring the effective

ymrwymiad i gydweithio. Rwyf wedi cael cyflwyniadau gan yr heddlu, sydd wedi dangos imi sut mae eu systemau wedi gwella yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yn ogystal â chan y tri awdurdod sydd ynghlwm wrth yr achos hwn. Fodd bynnag, heb inni gydweithio, byddwn yn siŵr o fethu eto.

Brian Gibbons: Mae hwn yn adolygiad torcalonnus ac annifyr. Mae'n gwbl briodol bod yr asiantaethau dan sylw wedi ymddiheuro am eu methiannau i'r plant yr effeithiwyd arnynt. A ydych chi'n credu bod yr asiantaethau dan sylw wedi derbyn cyfrifoldeb am eu methiannau, yn lle gwadu'r peth, taflu'r baich rhwng sefydliadau, neu wneud bychod dihangol o weithwyr rheng flaen, fel y gwelwn yn digwydd yn aml ar ôl adroddiadau mor andwyol? Mae'r sefydliadau wedi derbyn cyfrifoldeb ac wedi datgan eu hymrwymiad yn glir i ysgogi gwelliant. Derbyn ei gyfrifoldeb personol am y methiannau hyn yw'r cam cyntaf pwysig y mae'n rhaid i bob sefydliad ei gymryd er mwyn iddo wneud iawn am y methiannau a ddigwyddodd yn yr achosion hyn.

A allech chi gadarnhau a yw Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru'n ymwneud â rhaglen weithgar o arolygu'r sefydliadau perthnasol o ganlyniad i ganfyddiadau'r adolygiad hwn? A allech ein sicrhau hefyd fod yr arolygiadau hynny'n dangos bod gwelliant wedi bod o ran y methiannau a nodwyd gan yr adolygiad hwn yn wreiddiol? Yn olaf, mae'n galonogol gennyf glywed eich bod yn ystyried uno'r byrddau diogelu plant lleol. Mae'r sgiliau a'r arbenigedd angenrheidiol yn rhy brin yn lleol, ac mae hwn yn gam pwysig i ganolbwyntio arbenigedd i sicrhau, pan fydd y pethau hyn yn digwydd yn y dyfodol, y bydd arbenigedd lleol o ansawdd ar gael i roi'r oruchwyliaeth angenrheidiol.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae eich pwynt am ymddiheuriadau yn un da. Mae'n iawn bod pob asiantaeth, a minnau, wedi cynnig yr ymddiheuriad hwn. Mae gennyf ffydd yn ymrwymiad yr asiantaethau; rydym yn gwybod eu bod wedi derbyn yr holl argymhellion. Byddaf yn edrych at y fforwm diogelu ac rwyf wedi ysgrifennu at Phil Hodgson, ei gadeirydd annibynnol, i ofyn am

implementation of these recommendations. CSSIW inspected Neath Port Talbot and Caerphilly subsequent to this matter becoming public knowledge. I have read those inspection reports thoroughly, and I know that there have been significant improvements in both authorities, but that there were also some failings. We look to the effective implementation of recommendations to put that right. I have spoken to the directors of both authorities, and I am convinced that they are committed to making those improvements and ensuring that the recommendations of those inspections are seen through.

William Graham: Deputy Minister, I am sure that we are all most grateful that this urgent question was accepted today. I think that it is worth referring briefly to something in the report, specifically the harrowing statement from the children themselves that their voices were not heard, despite many attempts to tell workers about what had happened to them. As previous speakers have said, there must be more attempts to make the procedures more child-centred. More particularly, the report says that there were gaps in communication across agencies, a lack of urgency, and that procedures were not consistently applied or followed. Deputy Minister, you have our assurance that we will work with you to ensure that we express our confidence in you, knowing that you will ensure, as far as possible, that best practice becomes usual practice. We will look to you to support the efforts of all those who deal with children, and particularly those at the front line. As you have said, they are dealing with some particularly violent and manipulative people, who are difficult to identify. I am sure that you will ensure, in a timely manner, that social services and all the agencies that support children in Wales can have confidence in your guidance and that, in future, greater safety can be assured for the children of Wales.

Gwenda Thomas: I am very grateful for those comments, William. Again, you talk about the voice of the child. In this Chamber, we have seen a consensus on the

ei gymorth i sicrhau bod yr argymhellion hyn yn cael eu gweithredu'n effeithiol. Bu AGGCC yn arolygu Castell-nedd Port Talbot a Chaerffili ar ôl i'r mater hwn gael ei gyhoeddi. Rwyf wedi darllen yr adroddiadau arolygu hynny'n drwyadl, a gwn y bu gwelliannau sylweddol yn y ddau awdurdod, ond bod hefyd rhai diffygion. Edrychwn at weithredu argymhellion yn effeithiol i unioni hynny. Rwyf wedi siarad â chyfarwyddwyr y ddau awdurdod, ac rwy'n argyhoeddedig eu bod wedi ymrwymo i wneud y gwelliannau hynny a sicrhau bod argymhellion yr arolygiadau hynny'n cael eu gweithredu.

William Graham: Ddirprwy Weinidog, rwy'n siŵr ein bod oll yn hynod ddiolchgar y cafodd y cwestiwn brys hwn ei dderbyn heddiw. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn werth cyfeirio'n gyflym at rywbeth yn yr adroddiad, yn benodol y datganiad dirdynol gan y plant eu hunain nad oedd eu lleisiau'n cael eu clywed, er gwaethaf llawer ymgais i ddweud wrth weithwyr am yr hyn a oedd wedi digwydd iddynt. Fel y mae siaradwyr blaenorol wedi'i ddweud, mae'n rhaid ymdrechu'n fwy i sicrhau bod y gweithdrefnau'n canolbwyntio'n fwy ar y plentyn. Yn fwy arbennig, dywed yr adroddiad fod bylchau cyfathrebu ar draws asiantaethau, diffyg brys, ac nad oedd gweithdrefnau'n cael eu cymhwyso na'u dilyn yn gyson. Ddirprwy Weinidog, rydym yn eich sicrhau y byddwn yn gweithio gyda chi i sicrhau ein bod yn mynegi ein ffydd ynoch, gan wybod y byddwch yn sicrhau, cymaint â phosibl, y daw arfer gorau'n arfer cyffredin. Byddwn yn edrych atoch chi i gefnogi ymdrechion pawb sy'n ymdrin â phlant, ac yn arbennig y rheini yn y rheng flaen. Fel y dywedaso, maent yn ymdrin â rhai pobl arbennig o dreisgar ac ystrywgar, sy'n anodd eu hadnabod. Rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn sicrhau, mewn pryd, fod gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r holl asiantaethau sy'n cefnogi plant yng Nghymru'n gallu bod â ffydd yn eich arweiniad ac y gellir sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, gwell diogelwch i blant Cymru.

Gwenda Thomas: Rwyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am y sylwadau hynny, William. Eto, rydych yn siarad am lais y plentyn. Yn y Siambr hon, rydym wedi gweld cydsyniad ar ddiogelu

safeguarding of children. It is an issue that must rise above the political divide and, to a great extent, it has here. I am very grateful for your support and that of all other parties. We must show by example that working together means just that to us. The very strong message that you have given this afternoon will be what those children and young people now need to hear. These children are living in our society. They now need to be supported to live the rest of their lives, and I am sure that that is a very sobering thought for us all. I give you my commitment that I am determined to do everything that I can to ensure that safeguarding in Wales is as tight as it possibly can be.

Bethan Jenkins: I would like to reiterate what other people have said about this being quite startling. No child should be treated in this way and I hope that this will not happen again in Wales. I also welcome your commitment to looking into the merger of local safeguarding children boards. We have heard about the variety of agencies involved in this, and perhaps they are spreading their expertise too thinly. What is the timescale for the review of the safeguarding children boards? I would like your commitment to doing that. I would also ask that we keep an eye on the broader issues. As a patron of the British Association of Social Workers, I can say that we often see individuals being targeted, particularly in the red-top press. So, I would like to focus on the development of procedures and processes, rather than looking at how individuals perform or targeting individuals, when we should be looking at the wider picture.

Gwenda Thomas: Diolch i chi, Bethan. I am sure that we would like to be in the position to be able to say that this will never happen again in Wales. We cannot offer that guarantee to any child, but we can say that, to the very best of our ability, we will ensure that there is a commitment to listen to children and to hear what they say.

2.40 p.m.

On the issue of the local safeguarding children boards, the national safeguarding

plant. Mae'n fater y mae'n rhaid iddo godi uwchlaw'r rhaniad gwleidyddol ac, i raddau helaeth, mae wedi gwneud hynny yma. Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn am eich cefnogaeth a chefnogaeth pob plaid arall. Mae'n rhaid inni ddangos drwy esiampl mai hynny'n union yw ystyr cydweithio i ni. Y neges gref iawn a roesoch y prynhawn hwn fydd yr hyn y bydd angen yn awr i'r plant a'r bobl ifanc hynny ei chlywed. Mae'r plant hyn yn byw yn ein cymdeithas ni. Mae angen cymorth arnynt yn awr i fyw gweddill eu bywydau, ac rwy'n siŵr bod hwnnw'n ddigon i sobri pob un ohonom. Rhoddaf fy ymrwymiad ichi fy mod yn benderfynol o wneud popeth y gallaf i sicrhau bod diogelu yng Nghymru mor dynn ag sy'n bosibl.

Bethan Jenkins: Hoffwn ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd eraill sef bod hyn yn eithaf ysgytiol. Ni ddylai'r un plentyn gael ei drin yn y modd hwn a gobeithiaf na fydd hyn yn digwydd eto yng Nghymru. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu eich ymrwymiad i ystyried uno byrddau diogelu plant lleol. Rydym wedi clywed am yr amrywiaeth o asiantaethau sydd ynghlwm wrth hyn, a hwyrach eu bod yn lledu eu harbenigedd yn rhy denau. Beth yw'r amserlen ar gyfer adolygu'r byrddau diogelu plant? Hoffwn eich ymrwymiad i wneud hynny. Hoffwn ofyn hefyd inni gadw llygad ar y materion ehangach. A minnau ymhlith noddwyr Cymdeithas Gweithwyr Cymdeithasol Prydain, gallaf ddweud ein bod yn aml yn gweld unigolion yn cael eu targedu, yn arbennig yn y wasg pen coch. Felly, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygu gweithdrefnau a phrosesau, yn lle edrych ar y ffordd y mae unigolion yn perfformio neu dargedu unigolion, pan ddylem fod yn edrych ar y darlun ehangach.

Gwenda Thomas: Thank you, Bethan. Rwyf yn siŵr yr hoffem fod yn y sefyllfa i allu dweud na fydd hyn byth yn digwydd eto yng Nghymru. Ni allwn gynnig y sicrhad hwnnw i unrhyw blentyn, ond gallwn ddweud y byddwn yn sicrhau, gorau y gallwn, fod ymrwymiad i wrando ar blant ac i glywed yr hyn a ddywedant.

O ran mater y byrddau diogelu plant lleol, mae'r fforwm diogelu cenedlaethol yn edrych

forum is now looking at the issue of effectiveness. I met the safeguarding forum last Friday and I can tell you that this is very high on the agenda. I cannot give you an exact timescale, but I look to report on the effectiveness of this shortly because I want this to be one strand of moving forward from the commissioner's report to the publication of a consultation paper.

I very much hear what you say about front-line staff. I think that I have said before that social services are its workforce and we have to value front-line staff. The vast majority of front-line staff are absolutely committed and, day by day, they are successfully safeguarding tens of hundreds of children in Wales.

Peter Black: I join with other Members in expressing my regret and shock at the circumstances of this case and the dreadful abuse that happened to the children concerned. I know that you will do everything that you can, Deputy Minister, to make sure that the agencies, whose collective efforts have led to this failure, will put right their problems, which led to the many errors that led to this dreadful abuse. However, I am particularly concerned about one aspect of the report with regards to the South Wales Police. The report concludes that the South Wales Police Authority needs to look to see whether it is able to fulfil its legal duty in relation to safeguarding and promoting the welfare of children. There was a whole range of criticisms of the police, including the officers who were not investigating child abuse in the same manner as they would have investigated any other serious allegation of crime. I know that a large part of this is down to communication failure between different agencies, but there have been other serious case reviews where the police forces have let down children and have not delivered on the safeguarding agenda. Although we are not responsible, as an Assembly, for those police forces, it seems that this is a particular problem. Whereas you have levers to make sure that local authorities and health boards get things right, you do not have the same levers in relation to the police and they appear to be a particularly weak link in this chain. Therefore, Deputy Minister, what actions are you taking in relation to the

bellach ar fater effeithiolrwydd. Cyfarfûm â'r fforwm diogelu ddydd Gwener diwethaf a gallaf ddweud wrthyhch fod hwn yn uchel iawn ar yr agenda. Ni allaf roi union amserlen i chi, ond gobeithiaf adrodd am effeithiolrwydd hyn cyn hir oherwydd rwyf am i hyn fod yn un ffrwd o symud ymlaen o adroddiad y comisiynydd i gyhoeddi papur ymgynghori.

Clywaf yn glir iawn yr hyn a ddywedwch am staff rheng flaen. Rwy'n credu imi ddweud o'r blaen mai gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yw ei weithlu a'i bod yn rhaid inni werthfawrogi staff rheng flaen. Mae mwyafrif helaeth y staff rheng flaen yn gwbl ymroddedig ac, y naill ddiwrnod ar ôl y llall, maent yn diogelu degau ar gannoedd o blant yng Nghymru.

Peter Black: Ymunaf ag Aelodau eraill i fynegi fy siom a'm braw at amgylchiadau'r achos hwn a'r gamdriniaeth ofnadwy a ddigwyddodd i'r plant dan sylw. Gwn byddwch chi'n gwneud popeth y gallwch, Ddirprwy Weinidog, i sicrhau y bydd yr asiantaethau, yr arweiniodd eu hymdrechion ar y cyd at y methiant hwn, yn unioni eu problemau, a arweiniodd at y gwallau lawer a ganiataodd y gamdriniaeth ofnadwy hon. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n poeni'n arbennig am un agwedd ar yr adroddiad o ran Heddlu De Cymru. Daw'r adroddiad i'r casgliad fod angen i Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru edrych i weld a yw'n gallu bodloni ei ddyletswydd gyfreithiol mewn perthynas â diogelu plant a hyrwyddo eu lles. Roedd ystod gyfan o feirniadaethau o'r heddlu, gan gynnwys y swyddogion nad oeddent yn ymchwilio i gam-drin plant yn yr un modd ag y byddent wedi ymchwilio i unrhyw honiad difrifol arall o drosedd. Gwn fod diffyg cyfathrebu rhwng gwahanol asiantaethau yn gyfrifol am ran fawr o hyn, ond bu adolygiadau eraill o achos difrifol lle mae'r heddluoedd wedi siomi plant ac wedi methu â chyflenwi'r agenda diogelu. Er nad ydym ni'n gyfrifol, fel Cynulliad, am yr heddluoedd hynny, mae'n debyg bod hon yn broblem arbennig. Er bod gennyhch ddulliau i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol a byrddau iechyd yn gwneud pethau'n iawn, nid oes gennyhch yr un dulliau mewn perthynas â'r heddlu ac maent fel petaent yn ddolen arbennig o wan yn y gadwyn hon. Felly, Ddirprwy Weinidog, pa gamau ydych chi'n eu cymryd mewn perthynas â'r

weaknesses identified in relation to the police in this review and in previous serious case reviews? How will we sort out the issues that they have with taking child abuse seriously, which has been highlighted in this particular instance?

Gwenda Thomas: The senior police officers whom I have met during the course of the last week have shown absolute commitment to the safeguarding agenda. They have expressed remorse and apologised. Having said that, I received presentations from very senior ranking police officers on the systems that they now have in place, and I have confidence in that. I am sure that they realise, as do all of the agencies, that they are a key partner in safeguarding in Wales and they are a committed member of our national safeguarding forum. I hope that you accept my word for that. I am sure that we can arrange to share the steps that have been taken. I give you my word today that, as matters develop on the safeguarding agenda, I will bring them to the Chamber. There will be opportunities in the coming weeks to discuss the wider safeguarding agenda, and I know that Members will want to explore this matter further at that point.

Joyce Watson: First, I am sure that the Chamber is united behind you and your commitment to try to deliver on safeguarding children, and the excellent work that you have put into place. What needs to happen next is to ensure that the work that you have done in preparing policies, documents and structures translates to activity on the ground, because it is on the ground that it failed. We discussed earlier the idea of collaboration and joining together safeguarding children boards. I will be slightly more radical, and I will ask you whether you share my view. When authorities do not voluntarily want to work in collaboration although they clearly need to do so, would you consider some way of making that happen so that the authority has no other option and cannot opt out of merging? We have seen different authorities with different approaches—some with no approaches—to this problem. Lacking the expertise, they pass these children around, in a system that has failed. In my view, which I

gwendidau a nodwyd mewn perthynas â'r heddlu yn yr adolygiad hwn ac mewn adolygiadau blaenorol o achos difrifol? Sut byddwn yn cael trefn ar y problemau sydd ganddynt o ran cymryd cam-drin plant o ddifrif, sydd wedi'u hamlygu yn yr achos arbennig hwn?

Gwenda Thomas: Mae uwch swyddogion yr heddlu y cyfarfûm â hwy yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf wedi dangos ymrwymiad llwyr i'r agenda diogelu. Maent wedi mynegi edifeirwch ac wedi ymddiheuro. Wedi dweud hynny, cefais gyflwyniadau gan swyddogion heddlu uchel iawn eu swydd am y systemau sydd ganddynt yn eu lle erbyn hyn, ac mae gennyf ffydd yn hynny. Rwy'n siŵr eu bod yn sylweddoli, fel pob un o'r asiantaethau, eu bod yn bartneriaid allweddol mewn diogelu yng Nghymru a'u bod yn aelodau ymroddedig o'n fforwm diogelu cenedlaethol. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn derbyn fy ngair am hynny. Rwy'n siŵr y gallwn drefnu rhannu'r camau a gymerwyd. Rhoddaf fy ngair ichi heddiw y byddaf, wrth i faterion ddatblygu ar yr agenda diogelu, yn dod â hwy i'r Siambr. Bydd cyfleoedd yn yr wythnosau i ddod i drafod yr agenda diogelu ehangach, a gwn y bydd Aelodau am archwilio'r mater hwn ymhellach bryd hynny.

Joyce Watson: Yn gyntaf, rwy'n siŵr bod y Siambr yn unedig y tu ôl i chi a'ch ymrwymiad i geisio cyflenwi ar ddiogelu plant, a'r gwaith rhagorol yr ydych wedi'i roi yn ei le. Yr hyn y mae angen iddo ddigwydd nesaf yw sicrhau bod y gwaith a wnaethoch i baratoi polisiau, dogfennau a strwythurau'n troi'n weithgarwch ar lawr gwlad, oherwydd ar lawr gwlad y methodd. Trafodasom yn gynharach y syniad o gydweithio ac uno byrddau diogelu plant. Byddaf ychydig yn fwy radical, a gofynnaf ichi a ydych chi'n rhannu fy marn. Pan nad oes ar awdurdodau eisiau cydweithio o'u gwirfodd er bod angen yn amlwg iddynt wneud hynny, a fyddoch chi'n ystyried rhyw fodd o wneud i hynny ddigwydd fel nad oes gan yr awdurdod ddewis arall ac fel na all ddewis peidio ag uno? Rydym wedi gweld gwahanol awdurdodau a chanddynt wahanol ymagweddau—rhai ohonynt heb ymagweddau—at y broblem hon. Gan nad oes ganddynt yr arbenigedd, maent yn

think will be shared by many here, the time has come to force people to look after children and to join in a united front to achieve that aim. There has been a failure here of mammoth proportions in so many aspects. The children were not listened to and not heard. If you do not listen and do not hear, you cannot act. It seems pretty obvious to me.

When I was a councillor, I remember Alun Michael giving out a list of questions to councillors, which it was their duty to ask, to ensure the welfare of the children in their care. Could we compile another list of pertinent questions for councillors to ask as a result of this review?

Gwenda Thomas: On your first point about effective working and the effective implementation of policies, that is one of the recommendations for the Welsh Assembly Government. We have the protocols, regulations and guidance in place, so it is about how we break down any barriers that still exist and permeate those through to the front-line staff. That is one issue that I have asked the safeguarding forum to look at for me, and to advise on.

You talk about forcing people to work together, and we have taken the first steps to do that within the devolution settlement and the legislative competence of the National Assembly for Wales, as can be seen from the implementation of the integrated family support teams. I have a lot of faith in the work that these teams will do, and there are currently three pioneer areas. In establishing those IFSTs, there was a requirement in statute for health and social services to work together. The requirement for a national implementation board is also set in statute. Far from having to force health and social services to work together, the fact that we were legislating for it was widely welcomed, as it gave the different agencies clarity on what was required of them. I see that as a way forward.

You talked about Alun Michael, and I think

trosglwyddo'r plant hyn o amgylch, mewn system sydd wedi methu. Yn fy marn i, a chredaf y bydd llawer yma'n ei rhannu, mae'n bryd yn awr gorfodi pobl i ofalu am blant ac ymuno gyda'n gilydd i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw. Cafwyd methiant anferthol yma mewn cynifer o agweddau. Ni wrandawyd ar y plant ac ni chlywyd y plant. Os nad ydych chi'n gwrando ac os nad ydych yn clywed, ni allwch weithredu. Mae'n ymddangos yn weddol amlwg imi.

Pan oeddwn i'n gynghorydd, rwy'n cofio Alun Michael yn dosbarthu rhestr o gwestiynau i gynghorwyr, yr oedd yn ddyletswydd arnynt eu gofyn, i sicrhau lles y plant yn eu gofal. A allem lunio rhestr arall o gwestiynau perthnasol i gynghorwyr eu gofyn o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad hwn?

Gwenda Thomas: O ran eich pwynt cyntaf am weithio effeithiol a gweithredu polisïau'n effeithiol, hwnnw yw un o'r argymhellion i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae gennym y protocolau, y rheoliadau a'r cyfarwyddyd yn eu lle, felly mae'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y byddwn yn chwalu unrhyw rwystrau sy'n dal yn bodoli ac yn trosglwyddo'r rheini i'r staff rheng flaen. Un mater yw hwnnw yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r fforwm diogelu edrych arno imi, a chynghori yn ei gylch.

Rydych yn sôn am orfodi pobl i gydweithio, ac rydym wedi cymryd y camau cyntaf i wneud hynny yn y setliad datganoli a chymhwysedd deddfwriaethol Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, fel y gellir ei weld o'r timau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd. Mae gennyf lawer o ffydd yn y gwaith y bydd y timau hyn yn ei wneud, ac ar hyn o bryd mae tri maes arloesi. Wrth sefydlu'r timau integredig cymorth i deuluoedd hynny, roedd yn ofynnol mewn statud i iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol gydweithio. Mae'r gofyniad am fwrdd gweithredu cenedlaethol hefyd wedi'i osod mewn statud. Yn bell o orfod gorfodi iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i gydweithio, croesawyd y ffaith ein bod yn deddfu amdano, am ei fod yn egluro i'r gwahanol asiantaethau yr hyn a oedd yn ofynnol ganddynt. Rwy'n gweld honno fel ffordd ymlaen.

Soniasoch am Alun Michael, ac rwy'n credu

that what you have in mind is a letter issued by him when he was First Minister. It had been issued before by the previous Conservative Secretary of State for Wales, and I have also reissued it two or three times since. That letter is issued to individual elected members of councils, reminding them of their responsibility as corporate parents. I know that that letter has been taken seriously by many councillors throughout Wales. Having said that, it is not a matter for councillors, agencies or front-line staff only; it is a matter for us all. It is the responsibility of us all to speak up if we identify any wrongdoing, in the interests of safeguarding children.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog am ei hatebion cadarn.

2.50 p.m.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): There are no changes to report to this week's planned Government business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

Jonathan Morgan: I request a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on the NHS's ability to meet its cancer waiting time targets of 31 and 62 days. The reason I ask is that I have been informed by a constituent, who has had cause to see her GP about a lump in her breast, that the waiting time in Cardiff is much longer than expected. She was informed by her GP that she could have to wait between four and six weeks to be referred to the breast clinic for a diagnosis. Apart from that, we have discovered that the wait for a diagnosis in Cardiff could well be up to 14 weeks. That causes me an incredible amount of concern, as you can imagine. If that turns out to be the case, it will cause my constituent grave concern, as it would other constituents, and not just mine but those of other Assembly

mai'r hyn sydd gennych mewn cof yw llythyr a gyhoeddwyd ganddo pan oedd yn Brif Weinidog. Fe'i cyhoeddwyd o'r blaen gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Ceidwadol blaenorol i Gymru, ac rwyf fi hefyd wedi'i ailgyhoeddi ddwywaith neu dair ers hynny. Mae'r llythyr hwnnw'n cael ei gyhoeddi i aelodau etholedig unigol o gynghorau, i'w hatgoffa o'u cyfrifoldeb yn rhieni corfforaethol. Gwn fod llawer o gynghorwyr ledled Cymru wedi cymryd y llythyr hwnnw o ddifrif. Wedi dweud hynny, nid mater i gynghorwyr, asiantaethau neu staff rheng flaen yn unig mohono; mae'n fater i bob un ohonom. Cyfrifoldeb pob un ohonom yw siarad os byddwn yn nodi unrhyw gamwedd, er mwyn diogelu plant.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister for her robust answers.

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Nid oes newidiadau i roi gwybod amdanynt ym musnes cynlluniedig y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes am y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y cyhoeddiad datganiad busnes, sydd i'w weld ymhlith y papurau agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau'n electronig.

Jonathan Morgan: Gofynnaf am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am allu'r GIG i fodloni ei dargedau o 31 a 62 diwrnod o ran amseroedd aros i gleifion canser. Y rheswm y gofynnaf yw fy mod wedi cael gwybod gan etholwr, y bu rheswm ganddi weld ei meddyg teulu am lwmp yn ei bron, fod yr amser aros yng Nghaerdydd lawer yn hirach na'r disgwyl. Cafodd wybod gan ei meddyg teulu y gallai fod yn rhaid iddi aros rhwng pedair a chwe wythnos i gael ei chyfeirio at glinig y fron am ddiagnosis. Ar wahân i hynny, rydym wedi darganfod y gallai'r amser aros am ddiagnosis yng Nghaerdydd fod hyd at 14 wythnos yn ddigon posibl. Mae hynny'n peri gofid aruthrol imi, fel y gallwch chi ddychmygu. Os yw hynny'n wir, bydd yn achosi gofid difrifol i'm hetholwr, fel y

Members. I am concerned that the NHS, particularly in Cardiff but perhaps elsewhere too, is struggling to meet these tight timescales. It is right to have tight timescales, because diagnosing what could be cancer needs to be done as quickly as possible. I ask the Government to consider this issue, and I ask the Minister for health whether there is a particular concern that she could bring to the Chamber. It would be wise for the Minister to be open and transparent with Assembly Members so that we can judge whether these targets are being met. However, I am sure that you will agree that a 14-week delay is too long.

Jane Hutt: This matter came up in questions to the First Minister, and he was able to respond on the Minister for Health and Social Services's policies on improving cancer waiting times and draw attention to the announcement that was made last week about the investment in the cancer centre at Singleton Hospital in Swansea. Although it is important to draw this case to our attention, it must also be drawn to the attention of the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board, as I am sure you have done. That is so that we can ensure that any problems are addressed at a local and regional level as well as at a national level.

Christine Chapman: Could we have a statement from the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport on Trinity Mirror's plan to axe the posts of the four editors who run the weekly newspapers in the Valleys? I know that there was considerable reorganisation two years ago and that the company now plans a further restructuring of its management systems so that all papers come under a single editor in chief. In my constituency, we have the *Cynon Valley Leader* and the *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*, which are both much-read, much-loved local institutions. The editors are well known in the community, and local people like that face-to-face contact. I have discussed this with Media Wales and expressed my concerns. However, local people are concerned that these plans could

byddai i etholwyr eraill, ac nid fy etholwyr i yn unig ond etholwyr Aelodau Cynulliad eraill. Poenaf fod y GIG, yn arbennig yng Nghaerdydd ond efallai mewn mannau eraill hefyd, yn ei chael yn anodd bodloni'r amserlenni tynn hyn. Mae'n briodol cael amserlenni tynn, oherwydd mae angen gwneud diagnosis o'r hyn a allai fod yn ganser cyn gynted â phosibl. Gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth ystyried y mater hwn, a gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a oes gofid arbennig y gallai ddod ag ef i'r Siambr. Byddai'n ddoeth i'r Gweinidog fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw gydag Aelodau'r Cynulliad er mwyn inni allu barnu a yw'r targedau hyn yn cael eu cyrraedd. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n cytuno bod oedi am 14 wythnos yn rhy hir.

Jane Hutt: Cododd y mater hwn mewn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, a bu'n gallu ymateb i bolisiau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar wella amseroedd aros i gleifion canser a thynnu sylw at y cyhoeddiad a wnaethpwyd yr wythnos diwethaf am y buddsoddiad yn y ganolfan canser yn Ysbyty Singleton yn Abertawe. Er ei bod yn bwysig tynnu ein sylw at yr achos hwn, mae'n rhaid tynnu sylw Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro ato hefyd, fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaethoch. Mae'n rhaid gwneud hynny er mwyn inni sicrhau bod unrhyw broblemau'n cael sylw ar lefel leol a rhanbarthol yn ogystal â lefel genedlaethol.

Christine Chapman: A allem gael datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth am gynllun Trinity Mirror i ddileu swyddi'r pedwar golygydd sy'n rhedeg y papurau newydd wythnosol yn y Cymoedd? Gwn y bu ad-drefnu sylweddol ddwy flynedd yn ôl a bod y cwmni bellach yn cynllunio ailstrwythuro ei systemau rheoli ymhellach fel bod pob papur yn gyfrifoldeb i un prif olygydd. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae gennym *Cynon Valley Leader* a *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*, sydd ill dau'n sefydliadau lleol a ddarllenir yn helaeth ac sy'n annwyl i lawer. Mae'r golygyddion yn wynebau cyfarwydd yn y gymuned, ac mae pobl leol yn hoffi'r cysylltiad hwnnw wyneb yn wyneb. Rwyf wedi trafod hyn â Chyfyngau Cymru ac wedi mynegi fy mhryderon. Fodd bynnag,

lead to an increased homogenisation of output that will become less relevant to the communities that these papers are meant to serve and inform.

Jane Hutt: It is important that you have taken this opportunity in business questions to draw the matter to our attention. I know that other Members are equally concerned, because although the restructuring of the organisation that is making these decisions is not a matter for the Assembly Government, we recognise the importance of having a successful and thriving newspaper and journalism industry in Wales. I know that Ministers will take any opportunity to meet interested and relevant media organisations, unions and individuals to look at these proposals in further detail and to raise concerns with them.

William Graham: I invite the Minister to schedule a statement on the representations that have been made by the Welsh Assembly Government to the Westminster Government on the level of tolls on the Severn bridges. She will no doubt have noted the comment made last week that the tolls will now be charged for a longer time because the volume of traffic has decreased. I imagine that the Minister will also join me in being grateful that, as of 8 p.m. last night, drivers will be able to pay by credit card, a concession that will last for this week only. How much longer will that last? What representations have been made on the cost of that? Is it worth the while of the operators to do that? Is it welcomed by motorists, and what does your Government think about the tolls continuing for a longer period?

Jane Hutt: We were all pleased when the UK Government confirmed that credit cards would be accepted on the Severn crossing, in time for the Ryder Cup, which you have spoken so well about this afternoon. I assure you that there has been regular dialogue with the bridge operators and the Department for Transport to achieve this outcome. We must look at these issues in light of the recession's impact on Wales, as that has also taken its 'toll' on the Severn crossing. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] The newspapers used that

mae pobl leol yn poeni y gallai'r cynlluniau hyn arwain at homogoneiddio cynnyrch yn gynyddol a fydd yn dod yn llai perthnasol i'r cymunedau y mae'r papurau hyn i fod i'w gwasanaethu a'u hysbysu.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi manteisio ar y cyfle hwn mewn cwestiynau busnes i dynnu ein sylw at y mater. Gwn fod Aelodau eraill yn pryderu cymaint, oherwydd er nad yw ailstrwythuro'r sefydliad sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau hyn yn fater i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, rydym yn cydnabod mor bwysig yw diwydiant llwyddiannus a ffyniannus o bapurau newydd a newyddiaduraeth yng Nghymru. Gwn y bydd Gweinidogion yn cymryd unrhyw gyfle i gyfarfod ag unigolion, undebau a sefydliadau cyfryngau perthnasol sydd â diddordeb, i edrych yn fanylach ar y cynigion hyn ac i godi pryderon gyda nhw.

William Graham: Rwyf yn gwahodd y Gweinidog i drefnu datganiad am y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Lywodraeth San Steffan am lefel y tollau ar bontydd Hafren. Mae'n siŵr y bydd wedi sylwi ar y sylw a wnaethpwyd yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd y tollau'n cael eu codi bellach am amser hirach gan fod maint y traffig wedi gostwng. Dychmygaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymuno â mi hefyd i fod yn ddiolchgar y bydd gyrwyr, ers 8 o'r gloch neithiwr, yn gallu talu drwy gerdyn credyd, consesiwn a fydd yn para'r wythnos hon yn unig. Am faint yn rhagor y bydd hynny'n para? Pa sylwadau sydd wedi'u gwneud am gost hynny? A yw'n werth chweil i'r gweithredwyr wneud hynny? A yw'n cael ei groesawu gan fodurwyr, a beth yw barn eich Llywodraeth am barhau'r tollau am gyfnod hwy?

Jane Hutt: Roeddem oll yn falch pan gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU y byddai cardiau credyd yn cael eu derbyn ar groesfan Hafren, mewn pryd i Gwpan Ryder, y siaradasoch amdano cystal y prynhawn yma. Rwy'n eich sicrhau chi y bu deialog rheolaidd â gweithredwyr y bont a'r Adran Drafnidiaeth i gyflawni'r canlyniad hwn. Mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar y materion hyn yng ngoleuni effaith y dirwasgiad ar Gymru, gan fod hwnnw hefyd wedi gadael ei ôl ar groesfan Hafren. [AELODAU CYNULLIAD:

headline. However, this is a serious matter, and we have to recognise that this is about working to support business and making Wales open for business, through the Deputy First Minister, as Minister for the Economy and Transport.

Bethan Jenkins: During a meeting of the Mid and West Wales Fire Authority on Monday, members were told that the fire authorities in Wales will need to make £11 million-worth of cutbacks. The authority will therefore be looking to amalgamate the stations in Neath Port Talbot and to locate one in Briton Ferry, and I am led to believe that there will also be a closure in Swansea. Could we have a statement from the Minister on the overall risk reduction plan and on the opinions of the Government as part of that process?

Jane Hutt: The fire and rescue authorities have been looking at the risk-reduction planning arrangements and, given the financial challenges that the service faces as a result of the UK Government's forthcoming spending review, difficult decisions will have to be taken. What is important is that the fire and rescue authorities and services have been meeting to consider the risk reduction plan, and it has been stressed that the decisions that they make must take into account the impact on not just the workforce, but also the communities that they serve.

Mark Isherwood: I request a single Government statement on the provision of integrated residential drug and alcohol detoxification and rehabilitation facilities in Wales. Earlier this summer, a Welsh Government-funded report on that subject was given to me by the author of a previous damning report, which was suppressed at that time by Welsh Ministers and which I made public through the media. This time, I have chosen to do so in the Chamber.

This report identifies, among other things, substantial numbers of clients who continue to be referred for residential rehabilitation in England, and that additional money provided by the Welsh Government is being used to fund admissions with providers in England

‘O.’]. Y papurau newydd a ddefnyddiodd y pennawd hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn fater difrifol, ac mae'n rhaid inni gydnabod bod hyn yn ymwneud â gweithio i gefnogi busnes a gwneud Cymru ar agor i fusnes, drwy'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yn Weinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth.

Bethan Jenkins: Yn ystod cyfarfod Awdurdod Tân Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru ddydd Llun, dywedwyd wrth yr aelodau y bydd angen i'r awdurdodau tân yng Nghymru wneud gwerth £11 miliwn o doriadau. Bydd yr awdurdod yn gobeithio felly cyfuno'r gorsafoedd yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot a chael un yn Llansawel, ac rwy'n cael fy arwain i gredu y bydd gorsaf yn cau hefyd yn Abertawe. A allem gael datganiad gan y Gweinidog ar y cynllun cyffredinol i leihau risg ac ar farn y Llywodraeth yn rhan o'r broses honno?

Jane Hutt: Mae'r awdurdodau tân ac achub wedi bod yn edrych ar y trefniadau cynllunio lleihau risg ac, o ystyried yr heriau ariannol sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth o ganlyniad i adolygiad o wariant Llywodraeth y DU sydd ar ddod, bydd rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod yr awdurdodau tân ac achub wedi bod yn cyfarfod i ystyried y cynllun lleihau risg, a phwysleisiwyd ei bod yn rhaid i'r penderfyniadau a wnânt ystyried yr effaith ar y gweithlu, ond hefyd ar y cymunedau a wasanaethant.

Mark Isherwood: Gofynnaf am un datganiad gan y Llywodraeth am ddarparu cyfleusterau integredig preswyl ar gyfer dadwenwyno ac adsefydlu ym maes alcohol a chyffuriau yng Nghymru. Yn gynharach yr haf hwn, cefais adroddiad a ariannwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru am y pwnc hwnnw oddi wrth awdur adroddiad damniol blaenorol, a gafodd ei atal ar y pryd gan Weinidogion Cymru ac a gyhoeddais drwy'r cyfryngau. Y tro hwn, rwyf wedi dewis gwneud hynny yn y Siambr.

Nodir yn yr adroddiad hwn, ymhlith pethau eraill, niferoedd sylweddol o gleientiaid sy'n parhau i gael eu cyfeirio at adsefydlu preswyl yn Lloegr, ac mae'r arian ychwanegol hwnnw a ddarperir gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n cael ei ddefnyddio i ariannu eu derbyn gyda

rather than Wales. It expresses concern about cost comparisons between community and in-patient residential rehabilitation treatments, stating that it does not necessarily help those clients who cannot simply detox safely at home, nor does it take into account the place of in-patient treatment in the treatment and management of those who have complex problems. It says that it is clear that many clients may need in-patient treatment or residential rehabilitation at the appropriate stage of their treatment, so that they can become drug and alcohol free and free from substitute medication. It names three providers: Ty'n Rodyn in north Wales, Rhoserchan in Aberystwyth, and Bryn Awel House in south Wales. All are viewed highly favourably by their clients, most of whom felt that their rehabilitation experiences offered them an opportunity to develop drug and alcohol-free lifestyles for the first time.

Finally, a concern is expressed in this report about a bias by some commissioners and service providers against registered providers. It was not just a concern about treatment practice or clinical effectiveness, but a negative view towards them as businesses motivated by profit, when in fact they are social enterprises. It said that it believed that such attitudes are harmful and unprofessional and that the view that tier 4 services are somehow unprofessional is highly damaging. It found that the exclusion of currently registered providers from lists of appropriate facilities was unacceptable, and said that agencies need to ensure that clients are able to access Bryn Awel, Rhoserchan and Cais services.

3.00 p.m.

Minister, people are literally dying while waiting to get into these facilities at present, and I call for an urgent statement.

Jane Hutt: This is clearly a matter that is partly operational with regard to the way in which we commission, provide and deliver very important services to tackle drug and alcohol misuse. We have a clear

darparwyr yn Lloegr yn lle Cymru. Mae'n mynegi gofid am gymariaethau cost rhwng triniaethau adsefydlu cymunedol a thriniaethau adsefydlu preswyl fel cleifion mewnol, gan nodi nad yw o reidrwydd yn helpu'r cleientiaid hynny na allant ddadwenwyno'n ddiogel gartref, ac nad yw ychwaith yn ystyried lle triniaeth cleifion mewnol o ran trin a rheoli'r rheini sydd â phroblemau cymhleth. Mae'n dweud ei bod yn amlwg y gall fod angen adsefydlu preswyl neu driniaeth claf mewnol ar lawer o gleientiaid yn y cyfnod priodol o'u triniaeth, fel y gallant ddod yn rhydd o gyffuriau ac alcohol ac yn rhydd o feddyginiaeth gyfatebol. Mae'n enwi tri darparwr: Ty'n Rodyn yn y gogledd, Rhoserchan yn Aberystwyth, a Bryn Awel House yn y de. Mae'r rhain oll yn cael eu hystyried yn ffafriol iawn gan eu cleientiaid, a'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn teimlo y bu eu profiadau adsefydlu yn gyfle iddynt ddatblygu ffyrdd o fyw heb gyffuriau ac alcohol am y tro cyntaf.

Yn olaf, mynegir pryder yn yr adroddiad hwn am dueddiad rhai comisiynwyr a darparwyr gwasanaeth yn erbyn darparwyr cofrestredig. Nid pryder am arferion triniaeth nac effeithiolrwydd clinigol oedd hwn yn unig, ond barn negyddol tuag atynt yn fusnesau a gymhellir gan elw, er mai mentrau cymdeithasol ydynt mewn gwirionedd. Roedd yn dweud ei fod yn credu bod agweddau felly'n niweidiol ac yn amhroffesiynol a bod y farn bod gwasanaethau haen 4 rywsut yn amhroffesiynol yn niweidiol iawn. Canfu ei bod yn annerbyniol gwahardd darparwyr sydd wedi'u cofrestru'n gyfredol o restr cyfleusterau priodol, a dywedodd fod angen i asiantaethau sicrhau bod cleientiaid yn gallu cael at wasanaethau Bryn Awel, Rhoserchan a Cais.

Weinidog, mae pobl yn llythrennol yn marw wrth aros i gael i mewn i'r cyfleusterau hyn ar hyn o bryd, a galwaf am ddatganiad brys.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn amlwg yn fater sy'n rhannol weithredol o ran y ffordd yr ydym yn comisiynu, yn darparu ac yn cyflenwi gwasanaethau pwysig iawn i fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio cyffuriau ac alcohol. Mae

understanding from the evidence of best practice in Wales in integrating services. The Minister for Health and Social Services will seek to ensure that the best services—and well-evidenced services—are delivered in this field of policy.

Alun Davies: Minister, our colleague Christine Chapman raised with you earlier the decision taken by Trinity Mirror plc last week to dismiss four editors in the Celtic press. I will not repeat the points made by Christine, although I do concur with them. I ask for a wider statement on the issues affecting our ability to consume news in Wales. The decision by Trinity Mirror plc comes at the same time as wider decisions are being taken on the creation of local monopolies. The new Secretary of State for Culture, Olympics, Media and Sport, Jeremy Hunt, made a statement this morning on the issue of local television; he has already made a statement on the abolition of the news obligation of ITV Wales. Taken together, this is a significant diminution of local, regional and national news in Wales. It is a significant issue for the Assembly and the Government. I recognise that many of the issues regarding the regulation of television news and services provided by various broadcasters are not devolved matters, but the Government here in Cardiff has taken a stance on issues regarding S4C, which we debated last week. It is imperative, in my view, that the Government takes an equally strong stance on plurality in the provision of English-language news and media outlets throughout Wales. I would be grateful, Minister, if the Government could consider these matters and come to the Chamber with a statement.

Jane Hutt: This is an issue that goes back to before the summer recess, to the disappointment that we felt when it was announced that the independently funded news consortium pilot project, which would be important in providing news for Wales, would no longer take place. The Minister for Heritage will meet the Minister shortly—or indeed may already have met him—to

gennym ddealltwriaeth glir o'r dystiolaeth o arfer gorau yng Nghymru wrth integreiddio gwasanaethau. Bydd y Gweinidog dros lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ceisio sicrhau bod y gwasanaethau gorau—a gwasanaethau â thystiolaeth dda—yn cael eu cyflenwi yn y maes polisi hwn.

Alun Davies: Weinidog, cododd ein cydweinidog Christine Chapman gyda chi'n gynharach y penderfyniad a wnaeth Trinity Mirror plc yr wythnos diwethaf i ddiswyddo pedwar golygydd yn y wasg Geltaidd. Ni ailadroddaf y pwyntiau a wnaeth Christine, ond rwyf yn cytuno â hwy. Gofynnaf am ddatganiad ehangach ar y materion sy'n effeithio ar ein gallu i gael newyddion yng Nghymru. Daw'r penderfyniad gan Trinity Mirror plc ar yr un pryd â gwneud penderfyniadau ehangach am greu monopoliau lleol. Cafwyd datganiad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd dros Ddiwylliant, y Gemau Olympaidd, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon, Jeremy Hunt, y bore yma am fater teledu lleol; mae eisoes wedi gwneud datganiad am ddiddymu rhwymedigaeth newyddion ITV Wales. Gyda'i gilydd, mae hyn yn lleihau'r newyddion lleol, rhanbarthol a chenedlaethol yng Nghymru'n sylweddol. Mae'n fater arwyddocaol i'r Cynulliad ac i'r Llywodraeth. Rwyf yn cydnabod nad yw llawer o'r materion ynghylch rheoleiddio gwasanaethau a newyddion teledu a ddarperir gan amryw ddarlledwyr yn faterion datganoledig, ond mae'r Llywodraeth yma yng Nghaerdydd wedi gweithredu ynghylch materion S4C, y dadleuom yn eu cylch yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn fy marn i, mae'n holl bwysig i'r Llywodraeth weithredu'n gyfartal ar luosogrwydd o ran darparu canolfannau cyfryngau a newyddion Saesneg eu hiaith ledled Cymru. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, Weinidog, pe gallai'r Llywodraeth ystyried y materion hyn a dod â datganiad i'r Siambr.

Jane Hutt: Mae hwn yn fater sy'n dyddio'n ôl cyn gwyliau'r haf, i'r siom a deimlasom pan gyhoeddwyd na fyddai'r prosiect pilot consortiwm newyddion wedi'i ariannu'n annibynnol, a fyddai'n bwysig i ddarparu newyddion i Gymru, yn digwydd rhagor. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth yn cwrdd â'r Gweinidog cyn hir—neu'n wir efallai ei fod eisoes wedi cyfarfod ag ef—i

discuss these issues, so that he takes on board our concerns. Of course, there has been news today of another matter involving other owners and organisations, namely the loss as a result of the reorganisation of local newspapers. These are important points, which I am sure that the Minister for Heritage will want to reflect on in respect of wider statements.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, I seek a statement on the issue of the Vale of Glamorgan railway line. There was significant investment by a previous Assembly Government, which has brought about significant benefits. I hosted a meeting on Thursday of last week on the regeneration of Llantwit Major, and one point that was made at the meeting was that, sadly, instead of being a driver for economic activity, the railway line is taking people out of Llantwit Major to commute to Cardiff for their shopping. There could be an opportunity for many businesses in the Vale to benefit from the railway line. Has any work been undertaken to analyse the journeys that are undertaken on that line? Are there initiatives that could be introduced to highlight the advantage of stopping off at the various points along the line through the Vale of Glamorgan? We want economic activity in the Vale of Glamorgan rather than the line being used as a transit route between Bridgend and Cardiff. I hope that we can have a statement from the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport regarding what action has been taken to analyse the journeys that are undertaken on the Vale railway line.

Jane Hutt: It is very heartening to hear you, as the opposition spokesperson for health and social services, welcoming the investment by the former Government—our Government—of £17 million to open up the Vale of Glamorgan line. That investment funded the opening of both Rhoose and Llantwit Major stations. I remember the glorious day when I went with the other Andrew Davies, who was the Labour Minister for transport at that time, to open the station at Llantwit Major. The important point about that investment is that it was secured as a result of support from the UK Labour Government at that time, and the support to open up the line came from the

drafnod y pethau hyn, er mwyn iddo ystyried ein pryderon. Wrth reswm, cafwyd newyddion heddiw o fater arall sy'n ymwneud â pherchenogion a sefydliadau eraill, sef y golled o ganlyniad i ad-drefnu papurau newydd lleol. Mae'r rhain yn bwyntiau pwysig, ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth am fyfyrion ar y rhain o ran datganiadau ehangach.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weinidog, gofynnaf am ddatganiad am fater rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg. Cafwyd buddsoddiad sylweddol gan un o Lywodraethau blaenorol y Cynulliad, sydd wedi cyfrannu budd sylweddol. Cynhaliais gyfarfod ddydd Iau diwethaf am adfywio Llanilltud Fawr, ac un pwynt a wnaethpwyd yn y cyfarfod oedd bod y rheilffordd, yn anffodus, yn hytrach na sbarduno gweithgarwch economaidd, yn mynd â phobl allan o Lanilltud Fawr i gymudo i Gaerdydd i fynd i siopa. Gallai fod cyfle i lawer o fusnesau yn y Fro elwa ar y rheilffordd. A oes unrhyw waith wedi'i wneud i ddadansoddi'r siwrneiau sy'n cael eu gwneud ar y lein honno? A oes mentrau y gellid eu cyflwyno i amlygu mantais aros yn y mannau amrywiol ar hyd y lein drwy Fro Morgannwg? Rydym am gael gweithgarwch economaidd ym Mro Morgannwg yn hytrach na bod y lein yn cael ei defnyddio'n llwybr cludo rhwng Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr a Chaerdydd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn gael datganiad gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ynghylch y camau a gymerwyd i ddadansoddi'r siwrneiau a wneir ar reilffordd y Fro.

Jane Hutt: Calonogol iawn yw eich clywed chi, lefarydd yr wrthblaid dros iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn croesawu'r buddsoddiad gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol—ein Llywodraeth ni—o £17 miliwn i agor lein Bro Morgannwg. Y buddsoddiad hwnnw a ariannodd y gwaith o agor gorsafoedd y Rhws a Llanilltud Fawr. Rwy'n cofio'r diwrnod godidog pan euthum gyda'r Andrew Davies arall, sef Gweinidog Llafur dros drafndiaeth ar y pryd, i agor yr orsaf yn Llanilltud Fawr. Y pwynt pwysig am y buddsoddiad hwnnw yw ei fod wedi'i sicrhau o ganlyniad i gymorth gan Lywodraeth Lafur y DU ar y pryd, a daeth y cymorth i agor y

Welsh Assembly Government. It was not just about economic opportunities; it was about providing opportunities for young people to access colleges and schools, and it was also for commuters.

I hope that you will join me in making representations to Ministers in the new UK Conservative-Lib Dem Government, before the forthcoming spending review, on whether the Government will continue with the investment in electrifying the railway from London to the west that we promised. Let us get that decision. We should also ask the Government to increase investment so that we can have a half-hourly service to Llantwit Major, rather than an hourly service, which I am sure would boost business.

Darren Millar: Minister, you may be aware that a review of emergency general surgery across north Wales has been announced. There is considerable concern about the impact of this review on hospital services in the region, not only among the public but also among clinicians and nursing staff. Could we have an urgent statement on this issue from the Minister for Health and Social Services? It is causing a great deal of alarm in my constituency.

Jane Hutt: You will need to take responsibility, as I am sure you will, Darren, for liaising, working and engaging with the Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board in north Wales. You will need to explore how it is seeking to deliver on the challenges of this budget, including the additional cut imposed on our budget in June. That was a cut, in terms of capital and revenue, in the delivery of services, including the health service. I hope that you will be responsible and constructive on your side of the Chamber in working with the health service and with the Assembly Government to ensure that the health service is supported as it addresses difficult challenges. On Thursday, I am going to north Wales to see how changes are being made, in terms of investing in the provision of community health services to enable people to have shorter stays in hospital, which will save

lein oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Nid cyfleoedd economaidd yn unig a oedd yn bwysig; roedd yn ymwneud â rhoi cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc gael at golegau ac ysgolion, ac roedd hefyd i gymudwyr.

Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ymuno â mi i wneud sylwadau i Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth Geidwadol-Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol newydd y DU, cyn yr adolygiad o wariant sydd ar ddod, ynghylch a fydd y Llywodraeth yn parhau i fuddsoddi mewn trydaneiddio'r rheilffordd o Lundain i'r gorllewin, yn ôl ein haddewid ni. Gadewch inni gael y penderfyniad hwnnw. Dylem ofyn hefyd i'r Llywodraeth fuddsoddi mwy er mwyn inni gael gwasanaeth bob hanner awr i Lanilltud Fawr, yn hytrach na gwasanaeth bob awr; rwy'n siŵr y byddai hynny'n rhoi hwb i fusnes.

Darren Millar: Weinidog, byddwch yn gwybod efallai fod adolygiad o lawdriniaeth gyffredinol frys ledled gogledd Cymru wedi'i gyhoeddi. Mae gofid sylweddol am effaith yr adolygiad hwn ar wasanaethau ysbyty yn y rhanbarth, nid yn unig ymhlith y cyhoedd ond hefyd ymhlith clinigwyr a staff nyrsio. A allem gael datganiad brys am y mater hwn oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol? Mae'n achosi cryn dipyn o ofn yn fy etholaeth i.

Jane Hutt: Bydd angen ichi gymryd cyfrifoldeb, fel y byddwch rwy'n siŵr, Darren, am gysylltu â Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr yng ngogledd Cymru, ac am weithio gyda'r bwrdd hwnnw ac ymgysylltu ag ef. Bydd angen ichi archwilio'r ffordd y mae'n ceisio cyflenwi heriau'r gyllideb hon, gan gynnwys y toriad ychwanegol a osodwyd ar ein cyllideb ym mis Mehefin. Toriad oedd hwnnw, o ran cyfalaf a refeniw, mewn darparu gwasanaethau, gan gynnwys y gwasanaeth iechyd. Gobeithiaf y byddwch chi'n gyfrifol ac yn adeiladol ar eich ochr chi o'r Siambr yn gweithio gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd a chyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn cael ei gefnogi wrth iddo fynd i'r afael â heriau anodd. Ddydd Iau, rwy'n mynd i'r gogledd i weld sut mae newidiadau'n cael eu gwneud, o ran buddsoddi mewn darparu gwasanaethau

money.

iechyd cymunedol er mwyn i bobl aros am lai o amser yn yr ysbyty, a fydd yn arbed arian.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

The Presiding Officer: I have a request for a point of order from Andrew R.T. Davies.

Y Llywydd: Mae gennyf gais am bwynt o drefn gan Andrew R.T. Davies.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Thank you, Presiding Officer. I seek your guidance regarding Ministerial responses to AMs' requests for meetings. I have been endeavouring since 30 June to have a meeting with the Minister for Rural Affairs. I spoke to her office personally yesterday on two occasions, and I still have not managed to arrange a meeting with the Minister. Is this a matter for you or for the First Minister? [*Interruption.*]

Andrew R.T. Davies: Diolch, Lywydd. Gofynnaf am eich arweiniad ynghylch ymatebion Gweinidogion i geisiadau ACau am gyfarfodydd. Bûm yn ymdrechu ers 30 Mehefin i gael cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig. Siaradais â'i swyddfa hi'n bersonol ddoe ar ddau achlysur, ac nid wyf wedi llwyddo o hyd i drefnu cyfarfod â'r Gweinidog. Ai mater i chi neu i'r Prif Weinidog yw hwn? [*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I heard what the Minister said. It is always a pleasure to speak to the Minister, in the canteen or anywhere else. This is not a matter for me, and had I received notice via e-mail, as I usually do, of the possible content of the point of order, I would not have allowed it. However, Andrew R.T. Davies has made his point. I am not in charge of ministerial diaries; I have enough difficulty with my own.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Clywais yr hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog. Mae bob amser yn bleser siarad â'r Gweinidog, yn y ffreutur neu unrhyw le arall. Nid mater i mi yw hwn, a phetawn i wedi cael gwybod drwy e-bost, fel y caf fel arfer, am gynnwys posibl y pwynt o drefn, ni fyddwn wedi'i ganiatáu. Fodd bynnag, mae Andrew R.T. Davies wedi gwneud ei bwynt. Nid wyf yn gyfrifol am ddyddiaduron Gweinidogion; rwy'n cael digon o anhawster â'm dyddiadur fy hun.

Datganiad am y Bwrdd Effeithlonrwydd ac Arloesi Statement on the Efficiency and Innovation Board

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): Further to my oral statement of 29 June, I want to update Assembly Members on progress with the Wales efficiency and innovation programme. The programme, which I lead, involves and supports those who provide our public services to deal with the most challenging financial climate that we have experienced in many years. Its clear remit is to focus on securing better social outcomes for the citizens of Wales.

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Ynglŷn â'm datganiad llafar ar 29 Mehefin, hoffwn roi gwybod am y cynnydd diweddaraf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyda rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi Cymru. Mae'r rhaglen, yr wyf i'n ei harwain, yn cynnwys ac yn cefnogi'r rheini sy'n darparu ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i ymdrin â'r hinsawdd ariannol fwyaf heriol a gawsom ers blynyddoedd lawer. Ei chylch gwaith clir yw canolbwyntio ar sicrhau gwell canlyniadau cymdeithasol i ddinasyddion Cymru.

3.10 p.m.

This is being driven by a comprehensive 'adopt or justify' approach where efficiency gains can be made by the increased take-up

Mae hyn yn cael ei sbarduno gan ymagwedd 'mabwysiadu neu gyfiawnhau' gynhwysfawr lle gellir ennill effeithlonrwydd drwy

and transfer of proven best practice. This will make a significant contribution to the running of public services at this challenging time, assisting all organisations to improve services, reduce costs and secure better value for money.

The efficiency and innovation board met last week and received draft charters from each of the seven work streams. We were updated on the progress being made on a number of initiatives that will yield significant efficiency gains over the short, medium and longer terms.

Under the collaborative procurement and commissioning work stream, a comprehensive review will identify how we can save at least £200 million. Collaborative deals have already realised £8 million this year. Our savings plan will include the efficiencies available from implementing electronic procurement under the xchangewales programme and all local authorities have been targeted with developing a business case for e-trading by mid autumn.

Improving how we carry out public procurement has a major impact for business. We estimate that the private sector spends over £20 million per year submitting pre-qualification documents for Welsh contracts. We are piloting a simplified questionnaire using the supplier qualification information database, which will substantially reduce the cost to business and improve the quality of public tendering. This approach is being successfully adapted for construction, which is the largest spend area. Welsh indigenous businesses have now won 12 of the 20 major capital contracts awarded in the last eight months, with additional community benefits secured.

The board also endorsed the development of a business case for a collaborative career transition programme under the workforce development work stream, which will support interchange and career development opportunities. Partners include Jobcentre Plus and the Careers Service, as well as engagement by the Wales Trades Union Congress and the Equality and Human Rights

ddefnyddio a throsglwyddo'n gynyddol arferion gorau a brofwyd. Bydd hyn yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at redeg gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar yr adeg heriol hon, gan gynorthwyo pob sefydliad i wella gwasanaethau, lleihau costau a sicrhau gwell gwerth am arian.

Cyfarfu'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi'r wythnos diwethaf a chafodd siarteri drafft gan bob un o'r saith ffrwd waith. Cawsom wybod am y cynnydd diweddaraf sy'n cael ei wneud ar nifer o fentrau a fydd yn dwyn enillion effeithlonrwydd sylweddol dros y tymor byr, y tymor canolig a'r tymor hir.

O dan y ffrwd waith comisiynu a chaffael ar y cyd, bydd adolygiad cynhwysfawr yn nodi sut gallwn arbed o leiaf £200 miliwn. Mae cytundebau cydweithredol eisoes wedi sylweddoli £8 miliwn eleni. Bydd ein cynllun arbedion yn cynnwys yr effeithlonrwydd sydd ar gael o weithredu caffael electronig o dan raglen cyfnewidcymru ac mae pob awdurdod lleol wedi'i dargedu gyda datblygu achos busnes ar gyfer e-fasnachu erbyn canol yr hydref.

Mae gwella'r ffordd yr ydym yn caffael yn gyhoeddus yn effeithio'n fawr ar fusnes. Amcangyfrifwn fod y sector preifat yn gwario dros £20 miliwn y flwyddyn yn cyflwyno dogfennau cyn-gymhwyso ar gyfer contractau Cymru. Rydym yn treialu holiadur symlach gan ddefnyddio'r gronfa ddata gwybodaeth cymhwyso cyflenwyr, a fydd yn cwtogi'n sylweddol ar y gost i fusnesau ac yn gwella ansawdd tendro cyhoeddus. Mae'r dull hwn yn cael ei addasu'n llwyddiannus i'r maes adeiladu, sef y maes gwariant mwyaf. Mae busnesau brodorol o Gymru bellach wedi ennill 12 o'r 20 prif contract cyfalaf a ddyfarnwyd yn yr wyth mis diwethaf, gan sicrhau buddion cymunedol ychwanegol.

Bu'r bwrdd hefyd yn cefnogi datblygiad achos busnes ar gyfer rhaglen newid gyrfa ar y cyd o dan y ffrwd waith datblygu gweithlu, a fydd yn cefnogi cyfleoedd datblygu gyrfa a chyfnewid. Mae'r partneriaid yn cynnwys y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith a'r Gwasanaeth Gyrfaoedd, yn ogystal â chysylltiad â Chyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru a'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol.

Commission. The prospects for greater utilisation of shared services are now being taken forward by the transforming the business work stream.

The national asset management work stream has ensured that, to date, 95 per cent of the NHS estate and 75 per cent of the police forces estate have been captured on the electronic property information management system. Nine pilot projects have been selected, representing a range of collaborative property initiatives across Wales, and a review of the crucial protocols that govern land transfers will commence this week.

The information and communications technology work stream is considering a number of priority projects. That includes data centre rationalisation, where, importantly, a moratorium on the establishment of any further data centres has been agreed, pending further analysis. Other projects are an accelerated roll-out of public sector broadband aggregation, establishment of a public sector ICT design and architecture board and the implementation of the public services ICT strategy.

We are developing a unique response in the UK to the challenging financial climate. Others are observing and learning from this approach and in my recent meeting with the Chief Secretary to the Treasury and the other UK finance Ministers, I was able to outline the ambitions and activities of the programme and compare them favourably with progress elsewhere.

The public service workforce is of paramount importance to the programme and this is fully recognised by Cabinet and we are committed to real engagement with our workforce and citizens. The First Minister chairs the Assembly Government workforce partnership council, which has a crucial relationship with the efficiency and innovation programme. Membership comprises the trade unions and our public services, maintaining a strong dialogue with our social partners and supporting Ministers to keep abreast of best practice.

In the same vein, in my last statement, I

Mae'r rhagolygon ar gyfer defnyddio mwy o wasanaethau a rennir yn cael eu datblygu bellach gan y ffrwd waith busnes.

Mae'r ffrwd waith rheoli asedau cenedlaethol wedi sicrhau, hyd yma, fod 95 y cant o ystâd y GIG a 75 y cant o ystâd yr heddluoedd wedi'u cofnodi ar y system electronig i reoli gwybodaeth am eiddo. Mae naw prosiect peilot wedi'u dewis, yn cynrychioli amrywiaeth o fentrau eiddo cydweithredol ledled Cymru, a bydd adolygiad o'r protocolau allweddol sy'n llywodraethu trosglwyddiadau tir yn dechrau'r wythnos hon.

Mae'r ffrwd waith technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu'n ystyried nifer o brosiectau â blaenoriaeth. Mae hynny'n cynnwys rhesymoli canolfannau data, lle cytunwyd, yn bwysig, i ohirio sefydlu unrhyw ganolfannau data pellach, yn disgwyl dadansoddiad pellach. Y prosiectau eraill yw cyflwyno prosiect fesul cam yn gyflym i gydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus, sefydlu bwrdd pensaernïaeth a dylunio TGCh y sector cyhoeddus, a gweithredu strategaeth TGCh y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Rydym yn datblygu ymateb unigryw yn y DU i'r hinsawdd ariannol heriol. Mae eraill yn gwyllo'r dull hwn ac yn dysgu ohono ac, yn fy nghyfarfod diweddar â Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys a Gweinidogion cyllid eraill y DU, roeddwn yn gallu amlinellu uchelgeisiau a gweithgareddau'r rhaglen a'u cymharu'n ffafriol â'r cynnydd mewn manau eraill.

Mae'r gweithlu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn holl bwysig i'r rhaglen ac mae'r Cabinet yn llwyr gydnabod hyn; rydym wedi ymrwmo i ymgysylltu go iawn â'n gweithlu a'n dinasyddion. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cadeirio cyngor partneriaeth gweithlu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sydd â pherthynas allweddol â'r rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi. Mae'r aelodau'n cynnwys yr undebau llafur a'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gan gynnal deialog cryf â'n partneriaid cymdeithasol a chefnogi Gweinidogion i ddilyn arferion gorau.

I'r un perwyl, yn fy natganiad diwethaf,

announced that both the First Minister and I would be meeting staff and users to hear their ideas about redesigning front-line services and to set out the timetable for our response to the spending review. My colleague the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, Carl Sargeant, has also been meeting with local government front-line services in his successful, 'Your Service, Your Say' tour, about which we will hear more in his statement this afternoon.

As a Cabinet, we are making our commitment to front-line services clear by engaging regularly and with purpose with those who deliver them day by day, year by year. On my 'Community Counts' tour, I have met a wide range of front-line staff from a number of organisations. It forms an important part of my pre-budget consultation and engagement with the people who work in and use our public services, hearing their views on opportunities to secure efficiencies and innovations in the delivery of services and on priorities for the challenging budget that lies ahead. I have been impressed by the immense commitment of front-line workers to the communities and individuals they serve—that has been the outstanding feature of the tour so far. Their deep understanding of the challenges that we are dealing with and their ideas for the solutions will be taken on board. They have highlighted on behalf of the people whom they serve their concerns about the impact of the forthcoming UK Government spending review, its impact on our budget, and the importance of protecting preventative services in times of financial constraint. This is also expressed by people who use our services. For example, mental health service users greatly valued the routes to recovery engagement in the Assisting Recovery in the Community centre in Bridgend and in Treharris College through third sector organisations such as Mentro Allan.

I have seen some excellent examples of collaboration, innovation and efficiency. For example, in Llandeilo, I heard about a 10 per cent reduction in operating costs, driven by

cyhoeddais y byddai'r Prif Weinidog a minnau'n cyfarfod â staff a defnyddwyr i glywed eu syniadau am ailgynllunio gwasanaethau rheng flaen ac i nodi'r amserlen ar gyfer ein hymateb i'r adolygiad o wariant. Bu fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, Carl Sargeant, hefyd yn cyfarfod â gwasanaethau rheng flaen llywodraeth leol yn ei daith lwyddiannus 'Eich Gwasanaeth Chi, Eich Llais Chi'; byddwn yn clywed mwy am honno yn ei ddatganiad y prynhawn yma.

Fel Cabinet, rydym yn amlygu ein hymrwymiad i wasanaethau rheng flaen drwy ymgysylltu'n rheolaidd ac yn bwrpasol â'r rheini sy'n eu darparu'r naill ddiwrnod ar ôl y llall, y naill flwyddyn ar ôl y llall. Ar fy nhaith 'Mae'r Gymuned yn Cyfri', rwyf wedi cyfarfod ag ystod eang o aelodau staff rheng flaen o nifer o sefydliadau. Mae'n rhan bwysig o'm gwaith ymgynghori ac ymgysylltu cyn y gyllideb â'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac yn eu defnyddio, gan glywed eu barn am gyfleoedd i sicrhau effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau ac am flaenoriaethau i'r gyllideb heriol sydd o'n blaenau. Gwnaethpwyd argraff dda arnaf gan ymrwymiad aruthrol gweithwyr rheng flaen i'r cymunedau a'r unigolion a wasanaethant-hynny fu nodwedd eithriadol y daith hyd yma. Bydd eu dealltwriaeth ddofn o'r heriau yr ydym yn ymdrin â hwy a'u syniadau am yr atebion yn cael eu hystyried. Maent wedi amlygu ar ran y bobl a wasanaethant eu pryderon am effaith adolygiad o wariant Llywodraeth y DU sydd ar ddod, ei effaith ar ein cyllideb, ac mor bwysig yw amddiffyn gwasanaethau ataliol ar adeg o gyfyngiad ariannol. Mynegir hyn hefyd gan bobl sy'n defnyddio ein gwasanaethau. Er enghraifft, roedd defnyddwyr gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr y gwaith ymgysylltu ar lwybrau at wella yn y ganolfan Cynorthwyo Gwellhad yn y Gymuned ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr ac yng Ngholeg Treharris drwy sefydliadau trydydd sector fel Mentro Allan.

Rwyf wedi gweld enghreifftiau rhagorol o gydweithio, arloesi ac effeithlonrwydd. Er enghraifft, yn Llandeilo, clywais am gwtogi 10 y cant ar gostau gweithredu, a ysgogwyd

Carmarthenshire County Council through collaboration with other local authorities at the customer service centre and care line. We must support projects such as those and our £60 million invest-to-save fund is a key tool that we will continue to utilise to trigger efficiency and innovation.

The Minister for Health and Social Services and I are delighted to announce £9 million in funding for the Gwent frailty programme, which is one of the iconic projects featured at the second public services summit. The project is a partnership comprising the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board, five local authorities, key voluntary sector partners and four Government departments. It is designed to deliver a one-stop shop for assessment and reablement to deliver dignified outcomes for some of the most vulnerable in society. It will also deliver significant efficiencies. It is another great example of what we can achieve with focused, invest-to-save, use of our resources. It is this type of outcome—real improvement and efficiency, delivered through genuine innovation and focused on the citizen—that I have seen on my tour, and I hope to see more of it in the next invest-to-save round.

Finally, I want to mention the other major element of the efficiency and innovation programme, the public services summits. The second summit took place at the start of July, with more than 120 public service leaders attending. It featured integrated working across health and social care as its principal theme and other innovative, cross-agency initiatives. A third public services summit will take place on 25 November, and will highlight the education front-line review of resources and underline the important role of the local service boards in delivering efficiency locally. I will be publishing the full details of the efficiency and innovation programme in November as part of the draft budget consultation.

Nick Ramsay: I thank the Minister for her statement and for this update. It is important that we have transparency in this matter.

gan Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin drwy gydweithio ag awdurdodau lleol eraill yn y llinell ofal a'r ganolfan gwasanaethau cwsmeriaid. Rhaid inni gefnogi prosiectau fel y rheini ac mae ein cronfa buddsoddi-i-arbed o £60 miliwn yn arf allweddol y byddwn yn parhau i'w defnyddio i sbarduno effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a minnau wrth ein bodd i gyhoeddi £9 miliwn o gyllid i raglen eiddilwch Gwent, sef un o'r prosiectau eiconig yn yr ail uwchgynhadledd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Partneriaeth yw'r prosiect sy'n cynnwys Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan, pum awdurdod lleol, partneriaid sector gwirfoddol allweddol a phedair adran Llywodraeth. Fe'i cynlluniwyd i fod yn siop un stop ar gyfer asesu ac ail-alluogi i gyflenwi canlyniadau ag urddas i rai o'r bobl fwyaf agored i niwed mewn cymdeithas. Bydd hefyd yn cyflenwi effeithlonrwydd sylweddol. Mae'n enghraifft wych arall o'r hyn y gallwn ei gyflawni drwy ddefnyddio ein hadnoddau mewn modd pendant, drwy fuddsoddi i arbed. Dyma'r math o ganlyniad-gwir welliant ac effeithlonrwydd, a gyflenwir drwy arloesi go iawn a thrwy ganolbwyntio ar y dinesydd-a welais ar fy nhaith, a gobeithiaf weld mwy ohono yn y cylch nesaf o fuddsoddi i arbed.

Yn olaf, hoffwn sôn am yr elfen bwysig arall o'r rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi, sef yr uwchgynadleddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Cynhaliwyd yr ail uwchgynhadledd ar ddechrau mis Gorffennaf, a mwy na 120 o arweinwyr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yno. Ei phrif thema oedd gwaith integredig ar draws iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a mentrau arloesol, traws-asiantaethol eraill. Bydd trydedd uwchgynhadledd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn digwydd ar 25 Tachwedd, a bydd yn amlygu adolygiad rheng flaen addysg o adnoddau ac yn tanlinellu rhan bwysig y byrddau gwasanaeth lleol mewn cyflenwi effeithlonrwydd yn lleol. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi manylion llawn y rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi ym mis Tachwedd yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad cyllideb drafft.

Nick Ramsay: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad ac am y diweddariad hwn. Mae'n bwysig inni gael tryloywder yn y mater hwn.

I recognise that this is your second oral statement on the efficiency board. On the last point that you mentioned, on the public services summits, I have spoken to several councillors who have very much appreciated being consulted in those summits. So that is positive.

Having said that, Minister, and having looked through your comments in depth, I see that there are some figures, but rather more rhetoric. With regard to the figures that you have given, I have some questions. You mentioned a comprehensive review that you say will save around £200 million, and you go on to say that collaboration deals have already raised £8 million this year. What timescale do you envisage for achieving those savings of £200 million? There is a big gap between the £8 million saved this year and £200 million, and it seems to me that you have glossed over when you anticipate the savings being achieved. I would like some clarification on that.

3.20 p.m.

I welcome the SQuID programme—with a name like SQuID, it is difficult not to welcome some aspects of it. The intention of the programme is to reduce businesses' overall costs, but will that happen? It is all very well having these programmes and ideas at the outset, but I do not see a lot of detail that convinces me that the reduction in costs—I am sure that there will be a certain amount of reduction—will merit the effort that is being put into the programme.

You talk about engaging regularly with those who deliver services 'day by day'—that was the expression that you used. Can you explain what form this engagement has taken and is it literally day-by-day engagement? If so, is it ultimately sustainable? Are we looking at this ultimately being considerably less than a day-by-day engagement? In which case, are the stakeholders involved really going to see the benefits that you state that you would like to see?

Rwy'n cydnabod mai hwn yw eich ail ddatganiad llafar am y bwrdd effeithlonrwydd. Ar y pwynt olaf y soniasoch amdano, am yr uwchgynadleddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, rwyf wedi siarad â nifer o gynghorwyr sydd wedi gwerthfawrogi'n fawr iawn cael eu cynnwys mewn ymgynghoriad yn yr uwchgynadleddau hynny. Felly mae hynny'n gadarnhaol.

Wedi dweud hynny, Weinidog, ac wedi edrych yn fanwl ar eich sylwadau, gwelaf fod rhai ffigurau, ond tipyn mwy o rethreg. O ran y ffigurau yr ydych wedi'u rhoi, mae gennyf rai cwestiynau. Soniasoch am adolygiad cynhwysfawr a fydd, yn eich ôl chi, yn arbed tua £200 miliwn, a dywedwch wedyn fod cytundebau cydweithio eisoes wedi codi £8 miliwn eleni. Pa amserlen a ragwelwch ar gyfer cyflawni'r arbedion hynny o £200 miliwn? Mae bwlch mawr rhwng yr £8 miliwn a arbedwyd eleni a'r £200 miliwn, ac mae'n debyg imi eich bod wedi anwybyddu pryd y rhagwelwch y bydd yr arbedion yn cael eu cyflawni. Hoffwn ychydig o eglurhad am hynny.

Croesawaf raglen SQuID—gydag enw fel SQuID, anodd yw peidio â chroesawu rhai agweddau arni. Bwriad y rhaglen yw lleihau costau cyffredinol busnesau, ond a fydd hynny'n digwydd? Mae'n hawdd iawn cael y rhaglenni a'r syniadau hyn yn y cychwyn, ond ni welaf lawer o fanylion sy'n fy argyhoeddi y bydd y gostyngiad mewn costau—rwy'n siŵr y bydd rhywfaint o ostyngiad—yn deilwng o'r ymdrech sy'n cael ei roi i'r rhaglen.

Rydych yn siarad am ymgysylltu'n rheolaidd â'r rheini sy'n cyflenwi gwasanaethau 'y naill ddiwrnod ar ôl y llall'-dyna'r ymadrodd a ddefnyddiasoch. A allwch egluro ar ba ffurf y digwyddodd yr ymgysylltu hwn ac ai ymgysylltu'r naill ddiwrnod ar ôl y llall ydyw'n llythrennol? Os felly, a yw'n gynaliadwy yn y pen draw? A ydym yn ystyried y bydd hyn, yn y pen draw, yn llawer llai nag ymgysylltu'r naill ddiwrnod ar ôl y llall? Os felly, a ydy'r rhanddeiliaid dan sylw'n wir am weld y buddion y dywedwch yr hoffech eu gweld?

I agree totally with your commitment to front-line workers. There is no question that they work very hard in a difficult environment. I could ask you why they are in that predicament—it is, indeed, because of your colleagues in Westminster and their actions up until five months ago—but I will not go down that route. I will concentrate solely on what you are talking about here.

You talk about your commitment to projects such as the rollout of public sector broadband aggregation—I think that I have those words in the right order—among other things. You say that it will be accelerated. What timescale are you talking about for that? Will it be a rapid acceleration or will it be realised over a longer timescale? You have also spoken about your recent meeting with the chief secretary, which I am pleased that you have had, and you say your experience here compares favourably with progress elsewhere. Is that a two-way process? You have spoken quite highly of your efforts in this regard. Have you learned anything that you think is worth reporting back to us, regarding the ways in which you can improve the process, from your meeting with the chief secretary and from stakeholders? I am sure that you have, because if they have learned from your experience in the Assembly, then there must be some lessons coming the other way.

Jane Hutt: Thank you—that was a constructive and well-balanced set of questions, Nick. It is hard to find anything to be critical about in your questions. I would have loved you to have been at the board meeting last week when Mohammed Mehmet, the chief executive of Denbighshire County Council, gave a really good presentation—I am sure that we can arrange for something similar again—about how they are going to drive this collaborative procurement across all of the authorities in Wales, to deliver this £200 million in savings. They have signed up to £200 million in savings, so I will hold them to that, because this is about the public sector delivering. Local government, working closely with the health service, is, in many

Cytunaf yn llwyr â'ch ymrwymiad i weithwyr rheng flaen. Does dim dwywaith nad ydynt yn gweithio'n galed iawn mewn amgylchedd caled. Gallwn ofyn ichi pam maent yn y sefyllfa anodd honno—mae hynny, yn wir, oherwydd eich cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan a'u camau hyd at bum mis yn ôl—ond ni ddilynaf y trywydd hwnnw. Canolbwyntiaf yn llwyr ar yr hyn y siaradwch amdano yma.

Rydych yn siarad am eich ymrwymiad i brosiectau fel cyflwyno fesul dipyn y prosiect i gydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus—rwy'n credu bod gennyf y geiriau hynny yn y drefn gywir—ymhlith pethau eraill. Dywedwch y bydd yn cael ei gyflymu. Pa amserlen ydych chi'n sôn amdani ar gyfer hynny? Ai cyflymu chwim fydd hwn neu a fydd yn cael ei wireddu dros amserlen hwy? Rydych wedi siarad hefyd am eich cyfarfod diweddar â'r prif ysgrifennydd, ac rwy'n falch o hynny, a dywedwch fod eich profiad yma'n cymharu'n ffafriol â chynnydd mewn mannau eraill. Ai proses ddwyffordd yw honno? Rydych wedi siarad yn eithaf uchel am eich ymdrechion yn hyn o beth. A ydych wedi dysgu unrhyw beth sy'n werth rhoi gwybod inni amdano, yn eich barn chi, ynghylch y ffyrdd y gallwn wella'r broses, o'ch cyfarfod â'r prif ysgrifennydd ac oddi wrth randdeiliaid? Rwy'n siŵr eich bod, oherwydd os ydynt hwy wedi dysgu o'ch profiad yn y Cynulliad, mae'n rhaid bod rhai gwersi'n dod y ffordd arall.

Jane Hutt: Diolch—roedd honno'n set adeiladol a chytbwys o gwestiynau, Nick. Mae'n anodd canfod unrhyw beth i fod yn feiriadol yn ei gylch yn eich cwestiynau. Byddwn wedi bod wrth fy modd petaech chi yn y cyfarfod bwrdd yr wythnos diwethaf pan gafwyd cyflwyniad da iawn gan Mohammed Mehmet, prif weithredwr Cyngor Sir Ddinbych-rwy'n siŵr y gallwn drefnu rhywbeth tebyg eto—am y ffordd y maent am sbarduno'r caffael hwn ar y cyd ar draws yr holl awdurdodau yng Nghymru, er mwyn arbed yr £200 miliwn hwn. Maent wedi cytuno i arbed £200 miliwn, felly byddaf yn eu dal at hynny, oherwydd mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r sector cyhoeddus yn cyflenwi. Mae llywodraeth leol, gan weithio'n agos gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd, ar flaen y gad

respects, at the forefront of the collaborative procurement approach. I have mentioned electronic procurement, in particular, and I am sure that you will raise this. Go back to your local authority and ask whether it has signed up. I am sure that Monmouthshire—although I will have to check—has signed up to the xchangewales programme, which gets rid of all old manuals. With the xchangewales trading programme, all of the ordering can be done online, which leads to increased efficiency, as well as procurement savings. You asked about the £8 million that has already been achieved through the deals that have been done this year. We have not got every authority on board yet, but we are holding authorities to £200 million in savings in the medium term. I urge you all to go to talk to your local authorities about this, because they are making great progress.

Public sector broadband aggregation and the way that we are taking this forward are very important. In fact, it is being led by the Welsh Local Government Association, which is looking to establish an integrated ICT architecture for public services. Public sector broadband aggregation is already delivering savings. The majority of organisations can expect to save approximately 20 per cent of their existing costs. It covers the current ICT strategy for the public sector in Wales. There are procurement gains. I have talked about a moratorium on data centres, and I am sure that there are people in the Chamber who know exactly why that is necessary. We do not need lots of data centres to deliver what we want. We are also looking at issues such as national software licensing, greater collaboration on assets, and the potential to deliver more transformative initiatives. The Wales cloud and Wales applications store will be closely integrated with public sector broadband aggregation and offer a real change to the way that we use ICT in future.

Although I have shared this with my fellow finance Ministers in Scotland and Northern Ireland and with Danny Alexander at quadrilateral meetings, it is interesting that I have not yet had feedback from their efficiency and innovation drives. We are at

mewn llawer ffordd o ran y dull caffael ar y cyd. Rwyf wedi sôn am gaffael electronig, yn arbennig, ac rwy'n siŵr y byddwch yn codi hyn. Ewch yn ôl at eich awdurdod lleol a holi a yw wedi ymrwymo. Rwy'n siŵr bod Sir Fynwy—er bydd rhaid imi sicrhau—wedi cytuno i raglen cyfnewidcymru, sy'n cael gwared ar bob hen ganllaw. Gyda rhaglen fasnachu cyfnewidcymru, gellir gwneud yr holl archebu ar-lein, sy'n arwain at fwy o effeithlonrwydd, yn ogystal ag arbedion caffael. Gofynasoch am yr £8 miliwn a gyflawnwyd eisoes drwy'r cytundebau a wnaethpwyd eleni. Nid ydym wedi cael pob awdurdod i ymrwymo eto, ond rydym yn dal awdurdodau i arbed £200 miliwn yn y tymor canolig. Rwy'n eich annog i gyd i fynd i siarad â'ch awdurdodau lleol am hyn, achos maent yn gwneud cynnydd gwych.

Mae cydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus a'r ffordd yr ydym yn datblygu hyn yn bwysig iawn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'n cael ei arwain gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, sy'n gobeithio sefydlu pensaernïaeth TGCh integredig i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae cydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus eisoes yn cyflawni arbedion. Gall mwyafrif y sefydliadau ddisgwyl arbed tuag 20 y cant o'u costau presennol. Mae'n ymdrin â'r strategaeth TGCh gyfredol i'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae enillion caffael. Rwyf wedi siarad am ohirio canolfannau data, ac rwy'n siŵr bod pobl yn y Siambr sy'n gwybod yn union pam mae angen hynny. Nid oes angen llawer o ganolfannau data arnom i gyflawni'r hyn a ddymunwn. Rydym hefyd yn edrych ar faterion fel trwyddedu meddalwedd genedlaethol, mwy o gydweithio ar asedau, a phosibilrwydd cyflenwi mwy o fentrau trawsffurfiol. Bydd cwmwl Cymru a siop cymwysiadau Cymru'n cael eu hintegreiddio'n agos gyda chydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus a bydd yn newid yn sylweddol y ffordd a ddefnyddiwn TGCh yn y dyfodol.

Er fy mod wedi rhannu hyn â'm cyd-Weinidogion cyllid yn yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon a'i rannu â Danny Alexander mewn cyfarfodydd pedrochrog, mae'n ddiddorol na chefais eto adborth o'u hymdrechion effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi hwythau. Rydym

the forefront of the agenda, and they recognise that. This is pan-public sector. The Westminster Government is looking at it very much from a civil service and UK Government perspective, and not as a pan-public sector exercise. So, I think that we have a great deal to share and offer—perhaps more than we have to gain. However, I am certainly open to that.

Finally, of course, you can never have enough stakeholder engagement. I think that I mentioned the First Minister's tour earlier in the summer, and you will hear more from Carl shortly about what he has learned as a result of his tour. However, when I go to places such as Treharris College in the Merthyr Tydfil and Rhymney constituency, where I went last week, I not only meet those who are delivering adult and community training, which is transforming people's lives, but hear about the 600 or 700 future jobs fund jobs that were created. Many of these people have been through adult and community training. I also met some of the people who have benefited from that, and we and they regret the loss of the future jobs fund. They say that if you do not invest in these services, you will end up with more people with mental health problems in the criminal justice system. Their message to me was that it is a false economy to cut these sorts of services that represent an intervention in people's lives. I have spoken to people who have come out of prison and been homeless and vulnerable who are sorting their lives out because they had adult education and training and job opportunities. Those are the sorts of messages that we get from people on the front line.

Lynne Neagle: Minister, I understand that the innovation and efficiency board is doing very important work in helping to reshape Welsh public services for the challenges that we face in the years ahead. However, I was concerned to discover that the Assembly Government's invest-to-save initiative was supporting, with £1.5 million, an attempt to impose a system of self-rostering at three fire stations in Wales, including at New Inn in my constituency. Firefighters locally and their union representatives were vehemently

ar flaen y gad o ran yr agenda, ac maent yn cydnabod hynny. Mae hyn yn rhychwantu'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae Llywodraeth San Steffan yn ei ystyried i raddau helaeth o safbwynt gwasanaeth sifil a Llywodraeth y DU, nid fel ymarfer sector cyhoeddus cyfan. Felly, rwy'n credu bod gennym gryn dipyn i'w rannu a'i gynnig—efallai mwy nag sydd gennym i'w ennill. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n sicr yn agored i hynny.

Yn olaf, wrth gwrs, ni allwch byth ymgysylltu digon â rhanddeiliaid. Rwy'n credu imi sôn am daith y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach yn yr haf, a byddwch yn clywed mwy gan Carl yn fuan am yr hyn a ddysgodd o ganlyniad i'w daith ef. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddaf yn mynd i leoedd fel Coleg Treharris yn etholaeth Merthyr Tudful a Rhymni, lle'r euthum yr wythnos diwethaf, rwy'n cyfarfod â'r rheini sy'n cyflenwi hyfforddiant oedolion a'r gymuned, sy'n trawsnewid bywydau pobl, ond rwy'n clywed hefyd am y 600 neu 700 o swyddi cronfa swyddi'r dyfodol a grëwyd. Mae llawer o'r bobl hyn wedi cael hyfforddiant oedolion a'r gymuned. Cyfarfûm hefyd â rhai o'r bobl sydd wedi elwa ar hwinnw, ac mae'n ddrwg gennym ni a hwythau golli cronfa swyddi'r dyfodol. Os na fuddsoddwch yn y gwasanaethau hyn, dywedant y bydd mwy o bobl â phroblemau iechyd meddwl yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol yn y pen draw. Eu neges imi oedd mai economi ffug yw torri'r mathau hyn o wasanaethau sy'n ymyriad ym mywydau pobl. Rwyf wedi siarad â phobl sydd wedi dod allan o'r carchar ac wedi bod yn ddigartref ac yn agored i niwed sy'n cael trefn ar eu bywydau am iddynt gael cyfleoedd addysg a hyfforddiant i oedolion a chyfleoedd swydd. Y rheini yw'r mathau o negeseuon a gawn gan bobl ar y rheng flaen.

Lynne Neagle: Weinidog, deallaf fod y bwrdd arloesi ac effeithlonrwydd yn gwneud gwaith pwysig iawn yn helpu i ailffurfio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru i'r heriau a wynebwn yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Fodd bynnag, roeddwn yn poeni o ddarganfod bod menter buddsoddi i arbed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cefnogi, gydag £1.5 miliwn, ymdrech i osod system o hunanrestru dyletswyddau mewn tair gorsaf dân yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys yn New Inn yn fy etholaeth i. Roedd diffoddwyr tân yn lleol a'u

opposed to the plans, which would have seen them become virtual prisoners at the station, working up to 96 hours per week and unable to see their families for days at a time—plans that, as I am sure you know, were unanimously rejected by the fire authority yesterday. What assurances can you offer, Minister, that WAG support for this scheme was an exception and that the Assembly Government is examining project bids carefully to ensure that programmes being supported by the invest-to-save initiative are genuinely innovative and not simply attempts to save money regardless of the impact on services and staff?

Jane Hutt: What is important with regard to any approval of invest-to-save initiatives is that they must be subject to full and proper consultation with those affected and backed by the authority promoting such a scheme. I am glad to say—and I think I have responded directly to you on this point—that I have ensured that that is the case, with my colleague, Carl Sargeant, who is responsible for fire and rescue services.

3.30 p.m.

That must underpin any approval in terms of the invest-to-save fund. However, I am sure that you will be glad to know, Lynne, that your constituency of Torfaen will benefit from today's announcement that £9 million of invest-to-save money will be invested in the Gwent frailty project. I know that you have supported that project, which has been led by Torfaen County Borough Council and the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board. It will demonstrate that we can be innovative, make efficiencies, change the way that we deliver our services, and have collaboration between health, social care and the third sector.

eter Black: I welcome the extra money for the Gwent frailty project. Can the Minister confirm that this £9 million is sufficient to secure the future of that project, and for what period of time will it be secured with that

cynrychiolwyr undeb yn gwrthwynebu'r cynlluniau'n angerddol, a fyddai wedi golygu y byddent cystal â bod yn garcharorion yn yr orsaf, yn gweithio hyd at 96 awr yr wythnos ac yn methu â gweld eu teuluoedd am ddiwrnodau ar y tro—cynlluniau, fel rwyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi'n gwybod, a gafodd eu gwrthod yn unfrydol gan yr awdurdod tân ddoe. Pa sicrhad y gallwch chi ei gynnig, Weinidog, fod cefnogaeth LICC i'r cynllun hwn yn eithriad a bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn archwilio cynigion prosiect yn ofalus i sicrhau bod y rhaglenni a gefnogir gan y fenter buddsoddi i arbed yn wirioneddol arloesol ac nid ymdrechion yn unig i arbed arian heb ystyried yr effaith ar wasanaethau a staff?

Jane Hutt: Yr hyn sy'n bwysig o ran cymeradwyo unrhyw fentrau buddsoddi i arbed yw ei bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn destun ymgynghoriad llawn a phriodol â'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt a chael eu cefnogi gan yr awdurdod sy'n hyrwyddo'r fath gynllun. Rwy'n falch o ddweud—ac rwy'n credu imi ymateb yn uniongyrchol ichi ar y pwynt hwn—fy mod i wedi sicrhau mai hwnnw sy'n digwydd, gyda fy nghydweiniog, Carl Sargeant, sy'n gyfrifol am wasanaethau tân ac achub.

Mae'n rhaid i hynny fod yn sail i unrhyw gymeradwyaeth o ran y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n siŵr y byddwch chi'n falch o wybod, Lynne, y bydd eich etholaeth yn Nhorfaen yn elwa ar gyhoeddiad heddiw y bydd £9 miliwn o arian buddsoddi i arbed yn cael ei fuddsoddi ym mhrosiect eiddilwch Gwent. Rwy'n gwybod eich bod wedi cefnogi'r prosiect hwnnw, a arweiniwyd gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Torfaen a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan. Bydd yn arddangos y gallwn fod yn arloesol, gwneud effeithlonrwydd, newid y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflenwi ein gwasanaethau, a chael cydweithio rhwng iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a'r trydydd sector.

Peter Black: Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol i brosiect eiddilwch Gwent. A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau bod y £9 miliwn hwn yn ddigon i sicrhau dyfodol y prosiect hwnnw, ac am ba gyfnod y bydd y

investment? I also welcome her emphasis on electronic procurement; Swansea Council has led the way on that issue for some years now. It saves money—not quite as much as people estimate it should, perhaps, but I believe that that is true of all information and communication technology systems and issues. I also welcome the Minister's praise for the Assisting Rehabilitation in the Community centre in Bridgend, which is an excellent project and well worth visiting. That is a good example of a worthwhile project.

I have two questions on your statement, Minister. First, are you looking outside Wales for examples of good, innovative projects that will not just save money, but will also deliver better services? A good example of that is the social enterprise that has been established in Sandwell and Torbay in terms of adult social services. Such an initiative could perhaps be presented to local authorities for consideration as well.

Secondly, could you give us an idea of the progress you have made on encouraging collaboration across sectors, not just between local authorities, but between local authorities, higher education, and further education? There are many savings to be made by getting all such organisations that are situated in the same geographical area, for example, to work together in terms of back-office systems and delivering other common services together, rather than duplicating individual services such as human resources, wages, computer systems, and so on.

Jane Hutt: Thank you for your supportive comments on some of the initiatives that I have mentioned, Peter. The Gwent frailty project is an invest-to-save project. We have looked at it carefully with all those who are promoting it. It has been agreed that £9 million will support the programme for a period of three years, with £6 million from the invest-to-save fund, alongside a commitment from the health and social services budget. As the chief executive of the Aneurin Bevan Local Health Board has said, it demonstrates a fundamental shift in the board's systems, and has the potential to

buddsoddiad hwnnw'n ei sicrhau? Croesawaf hefyd ei phwyslais ar gaffael electronig; mae Cyngor Abertawe wedi arwain y ffordd ar y mater hwnnw ers rhai blynyddoedd bellach. Mae'n arbed arian—nid cymaint ag y mae pobl yn amcangyfrif y dylai, efallai, ond credaf fod hynny'n wir am bob mater a system technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Croesawaf hefyd glod y Gweinidog i'r ganolfan Cynorthwyo Gwellhad yn y Gymuned ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n brosiect rhagorol ac yn werth ymweld ag ef. Mae honno'n enghraifft dda o brosiect gwerth chweil.

Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yn gyntaf, a ydych chi'n chwilio'r tu allan i Gymru am enghreifftiau o brosiectau da, arloesol na fyddant ond yn arbed arian, ond a fydd hefyd yn darparu gwell gwasanaethau? Un enghraifft dda o hynny yw'r fenter gymdeithasol a sefydlwyd yn Sandwell a Torbay o ran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol oedolion. Hwyrach y gellid cyflwyno menter felly i awdurdodau lleol ei hystyried hefyd.

Yn ail, a allech roi syniad inni o'r cynnydd a wnaethoch ar annog cydweithio ar draws sectorau, nid rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn unig, ond rhwng awdurdodau lleol, addysg uwch, ac addysg bellach? Mae llawer o arbedion i'w gwneud drwy gael pob sefydliad felly sydd yn yr un ardal ddaearyddol, er enghraifft, i gydweithio o ran systemau cefn swyddfa a chyflenwi gwasanaethau cyffredin eraill gyda'i gilydd, yn hytrach na dyblygu gwahanol wasanaethau fel adnoddau dynol, cyflogau, systemau cyfrifiadurol, ac ati.

Jane Hutt: Diolch am eich sylwadau cefnogol am rai o'r mentrau y soniais amdanynt, Peter. Mae prosiect eiddilwch Gwent yn brosiect buddsoddi i arbed. Rydym wedi edrych arno'n ofalus gyda phawb sy'n ei hyrwyddo. Cytunwyd y bydd £9 miliwn yn cefnogi'r rhaglen am dair blynedd, gyda £6 miliwn o'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed, ynghyd ag ymrwymiad o'r gyllideb iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fel y dywedodd prif weithredwr Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Aneurin Bevan, mae'n arddangos newid sylfaenol yn systemau'r bwrdd, ac mae'n bosibl y gall gyflwyno buddion anferth, gan gynnwys

deliver enormous benefits, including fewer hospital admissions, shorter stays in hospital, which will lead to fewer complications and reduced demand for complex services. Therefore, the board believes that it will deliver efficiency savings of £1.2 million a year. This is also an invest-to-save project.

Thank you also for mentioning the ARC project in Bridgend, which I have visited with Janice Gregory. You could see the importance of that modern facility, in the heart of Bridgend, which serves mental health service users. This demonstrates that we believe in our public services, which includes bricks and mortar. However, more importantly, they told me about focusing on prevention as an important route to invest to save, in terms of the services that they were benefitting from.

Your point on social enterprise is well made. That is at the forefront of thinking in the work stream on new models. Finally, what we are doing, which is unique in terms of the progress that is being made across the UK, is taking this forward as a pan-public sector efficiency and innovation programme. Most of the work streams are either led by local authority chief executives or health service chief executives. However, around the table we have the third sector, Wales TUC, and we also have representation, for example, from the housing organisations and registered social landlords. Also, Nick Bennett from Community Housing Cymru sits on that board. Furthermore, we have the important interface not only with higher and further education, but with non-devolved and Assembly Government-sponsored bodies.

Chris Franks: It was interesting to note that front-line workers have highlighted the importance of protecting universal benefits, wherever possible, and protecting preventive services in times of financial constraint. You have touched on this in answer to other colleagues, but would you agree to bring forward a statement in the Chamber once your community council tour is over, which might highlight some more instances of this

derbyn llai o bobl i'r ysbyty, pobl yn aros am gyfnodau byrrach yn yr ysbyty, gan arwain at lai o gymhlethdodau a llai o alw am wasanaethau cymhleth. Felly, cred y bwrdd y bydd yn cyflwyno arbedion effeithlonrwydd o £1.2 miliwn y flwyddyn. Mae hwn hefyd yn brosiect buddsoddi i arbed.

Diolch hefyd am sôn am brosiect ARC ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yr ymwelais ag ef gyda Janice Gregory. Gallech weld pwysigrwydd y cyfleuster modern hwnnw, yng nghanol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n gwasanaethu defnyddwyr gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl. Mae hyn yn dangos ein bod yn credu yn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, sy'n cynnwys brics a mortar. Fodd bynnag, yn bwysicach na hynny, dywedasant wrthyf am ganolbwyntio ar atal yn llwybr pwysig at fuddsoddi i arbed, o ran y gwasanaethau yr oeddent yn elwa arnynt.

Mae eich pwynt am fenter gymdeithasol yn un da. Mae hwnnw ym mlaen y meddylfryd yn y ffrwd waith am fodolau newydd. Yn olaf, yr hyn a wnawn, sy'n unigryw o ran y cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud ledled y DU, yw mynd â hyn yn ei flaen yn rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi i'r sector cyhoeddus i gyd. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r ffrydiau gwaith naill ai'n cael eu harwain gan brif weithredwyr awdurdod lleol neu brif weithredwyr gwasanaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, o amgylch y bwrdd mae gennym y trydydd sector, TUC Cymru, ac mae gennym hefyd gynrychiolaeth, er enghraifft, o'r cymdeithasau tai a'r landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig. Hefyd, mae Nick Bennett o Gartrefi Cymunedol Cymru yn eistedd ar y bwrdd hwnnw. Hefyd, mae gennym y rhyngwyneb pwysig ag addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, ond hefyd â chyrrff heb eu datganoli a chyrrff a noddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Chris Franks: Roedd yn ddiddorol nodi bod gweithwyr rheng flaen wedi amlygu mor bwysig yw amddiffyn buddion cyffredinol, ble bynnag y mae modd, ac amddiffyn gwasanaethau ataliol mewn adegau o gyfyngiad ariannol. Rydych wedi sôn yn fras am hyn mewn ateb i gyd-Weinidogion eraill, ond a fydddech yn cytuno i gyflwyno datganiad yn y Siambur pan fydd eich taith o gynghorau cymunedol ar ben, a allai amlygu

important matter?

Would you also comment on the report published today by the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which recommends that public bodies should get the basics right for children during this time of financial uncertainty? He specifically highlights the lack of proper toilet facilities for Welsh pupils.

Unlike the recessions of the 1980s and 1990s, we now have a Welsh Government and a National Assembly that can respond to the downturn. I was interested to hear that our response to the challenging financial climate is being looked at and learned from by other UK Ministers for finance. Can you give us more information regarding these meetings, and whether you have discussed a fair funding formula based on the needs of Wales?

Can you also say whether you and the First Minister have had talks with the new Labour leader and leader of the opposition at Westminster, Ed Miliband, who, only a few days ago, said that the current funding formula had 'served us well'? I wonder who the 'us' represents in that little quote.

It is only right that we should acknowledge that, for a considerable number of years, this funding scandal has not been resolved. It is doubly disappointing now that a fair funding formula for Welsh public services and our economy is not a priority for the coalition Government in Westminster, despite the pious words that we have heard in the Chamber for many a year. It clearly shows that the Lib Dems, as Cameron's poodles, and the Conservatives in the Assembly, have no influence with their masters in London. How different it all was just a couple of months ago. Perhaps the Minister could indicate how the efficiency and innovation programme is helping people and services in my region of South Wales Central.

I note your comments regarding collaborative procurement and commissioning work streams. You have set a target of £200

rhai enghreifftiau pellach o'r mater pwysig hwn?

A fydddech chi'n sôn hefyd am yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd heddiw gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru, sy'n argymhell y dylai cyrff cyhoeddus gael y pethau sylfaenol yn gywir i blant yn ystod yr adeg hon o ansicrwydd ariannol? Mae'n amlygu'n benodol y diffyg cyfleusterau toiled priodol i ddisgyblion Cymru.

Yn wahanol i ddirwasgiadau'r 1980au a'r 1990au, mae gennym bellach Lywodraeth Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol sy'n gallu ymateb i'r dirywiad. Roedd yn ddiddorol gennyf glywed bod Gweinidogion cyllid eraill y DU yn astudio ein hymateb i'r hinsawdd ariannol heriol, ac yn dysgu ohono. A allwch roi gwybod rhagor inni am y cyfarfodydd hyn, ac a ydych wedi trafod fformiwla cyllid teg yn seiliedig ar anghenion Cymru?

A allwch ddweud hefyd a ydych chi a'r Prif Weinidog wedi siarad â'r arweinydd Llafur newydd ac arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn San Steffan, Ed Miliband, a ddywedodd, rai diwrnodau'n ôl, fod y fformiwla cyllido cyfredol wedi'n gwasanaethu ni'n dda? Tybed pwy mae'r 'ni' yn ei gynrychioli yn y dyfyniad bach hwnnw.

Mae'n berffaith briodol y dylem gydnabod bod y sgandal cyllid hwn, am nifer sylweddol o flynyddoedd, heb ei ddatrys. Mae ddwywaith mor siomedig erbyn hyn nad yw fformiwla cyllido teg i wasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru a'n heconomi yn flaenoriaeth bellach i'r Llywodraeth glymblaid yn San Steffan, er y geiriau duwiol a glywsom yn y Siambr ers llawer blwyddyn. Mae'n dangos yn glir nad oes gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, sef pwlls Cameron, a'r Ceidwadwyr yn y Cynulliad, ddim dylanwad gyda'u meistri yn Llundain. Mor wahanol oedd y cyfan ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Efallai y gallai'r Gweinidog ddweud sut mae'r rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi'n helpu pobl a gwasanaethau yn fy rhanbarth i, Canol De Cymru.

Sylwaf ar eich sylwadau ynghylch ffrydiau gwaith comisiynu a chaffael ar y cyd. Rydych wedi gosod targed o £200 miliwn, ond a

million, but can you indicate further specific substantial arrangements involving joint working between local authorities, the national health service and the emergency services? Has there been any substantial progress regarding the shared use of back-office staff and services, for example, in the sphere of human resources, payroll and procurement?

Furthermore, can you give an update on the shared use of professional services, such as school improvement and social care? We all have to recognise the financial difficulties facing the public sector. This crisis is partly due to the previous UK Government's mishandling of the economy, resulting in the terrible state of public finances. Efficient, well-run public services will always beat outsourcing. Poor public services will not. Does the Minister agree that public sector workers need to work together more across all levels to provide excellent quality public services? This ultimately means the establishment of a single integrated Welsh public service, involving the civil service, local government, the NHS and all public sector workers in Wales employed in both the devolved and non-devolved sectors of public sector delivery.

3.40 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I will be able to answer one or two of the questions that you have put to me. The desire to protect universal benefits has come over strongly in discussions with front-line staff and people who use the services. There have also been strong concerns about the impact of cuts on non-devolved services, particularly on housing benefit and its impact on vulnerable people in our communities, which front-line public service workers are trying to support. There has been considerable feedback and a great deal of understanding. As you know, I have circulated information about how our budget is made up and what we are responsible for, so that people can see what we can try to protect and what will be more difficult—such as the impact of cuts on housing benefit,

allwch chi nodi trefniadau sylweddol penodol pellach sy'n golygu cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol, y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol a'r gwasanaethau brys? A fu unrhyw gynnydd sylweddol ynghylch rhannu staff a gwasanaethau cefn swyddfa, er enghraifft, ym maes adnoddau dynol, cyflogres a chaffael?

Hefyd, a allwch chi roi gwybod y diweddaraf am rannu gwasanaethau proffesiynol, fel gwella ysgolion a gofal cymdeithasol? Mae'n rhaid inni oll gydnabod yr anawsterau ariannol sy'n wynebu'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae'r argyfwng hwn yn rhannol oherwydd y ffordd y bu i Lywodraeth flaenorol y DU gam-drin yr economi, gan arwain at gyflwr ofnadwy'r cyllid cyhoeddus. Bydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon a reolir yn dda bob amser yn trechu darpariaeth gan gyrff allanol. Ni fydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sâl. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen i weithwyr sector cyhoeddus gydweithio'n fwy ar draws pob lefel i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o ansawdd rhagorol? Mae hyn yn golygu sefydlu, yn y pen draw, un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus integredig i Gymru, gan gynnwys y gwasanaeth sifil, llywodraeth leol, y GIG a phob gweithiwr sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a gyflogir yn sectorau datganoledig a'r sectorau heb eu datganoli o ddarpariaeth sector cyhoeddus.

Jane Hutt: Byddaf yn gallu ateb un neu ddau o'r cwestiynau a gyflwynasoch imi. Mae'r dyhead i amddiffyn buddion cyffredinol wedi'i fynegi'n gryf mewn trafodaethau â staff rheng flaen a phobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau. Bu hefyd pryderon cryf am effaith toriadau ar wasanaethau heb eu datganoli, yn arbennig ar y budd-dal tai a'i effaith ar bobl agored i niwed yn ein cymunedau, y mae gweithwyr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus rheng flaen yn ceisio eu cefnogi. Cafwyd adborth sylweddol a llawer iawn o ddealltwriaeth. Fel y gwyddoch, rwyf wedi cylchredeg gwybodaeth am y ffordd y caiff ein cyllideb ei llunio a'r hyn yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdano, fel bod pobl yn gallu gweld yr hyn y gallwn geisio ei amddiffyn a'r hyn a fydd yn anoddach—fel effaith toriadau ar y

disability living allowance and the effect of the change, for example, to the consumer price index from the retail prices index on the level of benefits. People who work on the front line of service delivery and those who use the services are aware of that. There is recognition that concessionary bus passes have brought independence and improved health and wellbeing to older people, disabled people and their companions or carers, which enables them to participate in training, jobs and education. All of that has come through strongly. I know that Carl will shortly be talking about his findings, but I am happy to come back to Plenary when I have completed my tour of community councils over the next few weeks.

Although this is not a finance-related statement, it is important to say that we are looking at everything. This is about learning in preparation for this difficult budget and about how we can protect and prioritise the way in which we spend our funding, albeit that we are underfunded in Wales. I will certainly make the point clearly to our new leader—who, I am sure, we will shortly be welcoming to Wales—that we are taking full responsibility for equality-impact-assessing our draft budget.

The annual report of the children's commissioner will raise many important issues that affect our budget. The responsibility for the provision of school toilet facilities lies with local authorities, but we are producing best practice guidance to assist school governing bodies, headteachers and local authorities on the provision of adequate school toilet facilities. However, the feedback on the impact of budgeting on children's lives that we are getting on these tours is important.

The delivery of joint working across Wales is substantial. In my visit to Bridgend County Borough Council, I was shown the work that has been done to open new efficient offices, which are set to save £453,000 annually. That is an example of the council taking advantage of the invest-to-save fund in planning and improving its space. It is about bringing all the backroom services of the authority together in order to save money and provide more efficient front-line public service

budd-dal tai, lwfans byw i'r anabl ac effaith y newid, er enghraifft, yn y mynegai prisiau defnyddwyr o'r mynegai prisiau adwerthu ar lefel y buddion. Mae'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y rheng flaen yn darparu gwasanaethau a'r rheini sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau yn ymwybodol o hynny. Cydnabyddir bod cardiau bws rhatach wedi rhoi annibyniaeth a gwell iechyd a lles i bobl hŷn, pobl anabl a'u cymdeithion neu eu gofalwyr, sy'n eu galluogi i gyfranogi mewn hyfforddiant, swyddi ac addysg. Mae hynny oll wedi'i fynegi'n gryf. Gwn y bydd Carl yn siarad yn fuan am ei ganfyddiadau, ond rwy'n fodlon dychwelyd i Gyfarfod Llawn pan fyddaf wedi cwblhau fy nhaith o gynghorau cymunedol dros yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

Er nad datganiad cysylltiedig â chyllid mo hwn, mae'n bwysig dweud ein bod yn edrych ar bopeth. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â dysgu i baratoi ar gyfer y gyllideb anodd hon a'r ffordd y gallwn ddiogelu a blaenoriaethu'r ffordd yr ydym yn gwario ein cyllid, er nad ydym wedi'n cyllido'n ddigonol yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn bendant yn egluro i'n harweinydd newydd—y byddwn, rwy'n siŵr, yn ei groesawu cyn hir i Gymru—ein bod yn cymryd cyfrifoldeb llawn am asesu effaith ein cyllideb ddrafft ar gydraddoldeb.

Bydd adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant yn codi llawer o faterion pwysig sy'n effeithio ar ein cyllideb. Mae'r cyfrifoldeb am ddarparu cyfleusterau toiled ysgolion yn perthyn i awdurdodau lleol, ond rydym yn cynhyrchu canllaw arfer gorau i gynorthwyo cyrff llywodraethu ysgolion, penaethiaid ac awdurdodau lleol am ddarparu cyfleusterau toiled digon da mewn ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adborth yr ydym yn ei gael ar y teithiau hyn am effaith cyllidebu ar fywydau plant yn bwysig.

Mae cydweithio ledled Cymru'n sylweddol. Yn fy ymweliad â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, dangoswyd imi'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd i agor swyddfeydd effeithlon newydd, sydd am arbed £453,000 bob blwyddyn. Mae hynny'n enghraifft o'r cyngor yn manteisio ar y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed i gynllunio a gwella ei le. Mae'n golygu dod ynghyd â holl wasanaethau cefn swyddfa'r awdurdod er mwyn arbed arian a darparu cyswllt mwy effeithlon â rheng flaen

contact. This is not just about local authorities collaborating—the Gwent frailty project is about health and social care collaborating with the third sector.

I have visited Maes Llywelyn in Newcastle Emlyn, where, through the invest-to save fund, we are helping to fund eight convalescent beds in a 12-bed facility. It has resulted in a projected saving of £1.7 million as a result of reducing long-term residential care or hospital admissions. Joint appointments have also been made between health and social care, and we are saying that this is the right way forward and that we are now driving the change that we need in the delivery of our public services.

Brian Gibbons: Thank you for your thoughtful statement, which shows the breadth and depth of the activity that you are undertaking to prepare Wales for the cold blast that will be felt as a result of the ideological comprehensive spending review over the next couple of months. One of the crucial areas in the many different streams that you announced was the workforce stream. We are aware that workforce costs probably constitute 70 to 80 per cent of public service expenditure. No matter how we set about doing it, there is no doubt that the workforce will be at the front line of any of the changes that will take place. It would be fair to say that, with the workforce at the front line of those changes, there will be few winners and, sadly, many more losers as the public services accommodate the new reality in which we will find ourselves. That makes engagement with any change very difficult. In engaging with consultation and communication, members of the workforce will inevitably be aware that we will be talking about their jobs, their salaries and their terms of employment. This will be an extremely difficult process, and I do not think that we can underestimate how difficult and painful it will be.

However, you are right to say that we cannot dodge effective communication and engagement. If they do not take place, there will inevitably be suspicion and rumour,

gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid yw hyn yn ymwneud yn unig ag awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio—mae prosiect eiddilwch Gwent yn ymwneud ag iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn cydweithio â'r trydydd sector.

Rwyf wedi ymweld â Maes Llywelyn yng Nghastell Newydd Emlyn, lle rydym yn helpu, drwy'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed, i ariannu wyth gwely gwella mewn cyfleuster 12-gwely. Rhagamcanir ei fod wedi arwain at arbed £1.7 miliwn o ganlyniad i gwtogi ar y nifer sy'n cael eu derbyn am y tymor hir i ofal preswyl neu ysbytai. Gwnaethpwyd hefyd benodiadau ar y cyd rhwng iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac rydym yn dweud mai hon yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen a'n bod bellach yn ysgogi'r newid sydd ei angen arnom wrth ddarparu ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch am eich datganiad ystyriol, sy'n dangos ehangder a dyfnder y gweithgarwch yr ydych chi'n ei wneud i baratoi Cymru at y storm a deimlir o ganlyniad i'r adolygiad cynhwysfawr ideolegol o wariant dros y ddeufis nesaf. Un o'r meysydd allweddol yn y gwahanol ffrydiau niferus a gyhoeddasoch oedd ffrwd y gweithlu. Rydym yn gwybod bod costau gweithlu yn ôl pob tebyg yn gywerth â 70 i 80 y cant o wariant gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Nid oes gwahaniaeth sut awn ati i'w wneud, does dim dwywaith na fydd y gweithlu yn rheng flaen unrhyw newidiadau a fydd yn digwydd. Byddai'n deg dweud mai ychydig a fydd ar eu hennill, gyda'r gweithlu yn rheng flaen y newidiadau hynny, ac, yn anffodus, bydd llawer mwy ar eu colled wrth i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus dderbyn y realiti newydd sydd gennym. Mae hynny'n ei gwneud yn anodd iawn derbyn unrhyw newid. Wrth fynd ati i ymgynghori a chyfathrebu, bydd aelodau o'r gweithlu'n gwybod yn ymwybodol y byddwn yn siarad am eu swyddi, eu cyflogau a'u telerau cyflogaeth. Bydd hon yn broses anodd iawn, ac nid wyf yn credu y gallwn lawn werthfawrogi mor anodd ac mor boenus y bydd.

Fodd bynnag, rydych yn iawn i ddweud nad allwn osgoi cyfathrebu ac ymgysylltu effeithiol. Os na fyddant yn digwydd, bydd drwgdybiaeth a sion anochel, a fydd yn magu

which will breed even more fear and, consequently, be barriers to change. I can see that in my area of Swansea bay, where, as part of health and social care reform, much tremendous innovation has taken place, led by Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, in terms of integrated services and in creating joint appointments with the national health service. However, there are areas of uncertainty of some 10 to 15 per cent that are creating a lot of disquiet. It is only by effective communication that we can overcome those fears, accepting that there will be bad news for a number of people.

Chris Franks also mentioned this, but I particularly liked your pan-public-service approach or developing an approach based on a single public service in Wales. That is very important. If we can not only work with the civil service, but with local government and the health service to develop a single approach to all public services in Wales, that will be an important innovation.

I do not agree with Chris Franks's remarks on the Barnett formula. We know from Holtham's work that any attempt to renegotiate the Barnett formula when the Assembly was established would have cost Wales money. It is blind dogma from Chris Franks to blame the Assembly Government for not demanding a change to the Barnett formula at an earlier stage. Such a change would have cost Wales. Previous Governments acted in Wales's best interests and did not get themselves impaled on the sort of dogmatic position that Chris seems to be enunciating.

I come to my last point. I know that the Assembly Government has pooled arrangements for people who lose positions in the Assembly Government. Those arrangements have been an easy target for people to attack, but there is some merit in that approach. If jobs are lost in the Assembly Government and there are no pooled arrangements, those people would have to be provided with severance pay, their skills would be lost and new people would have to be recruited and trained. There is a lot of merit in the pooled arrangements that the Assembly Government has in place.

mwy byth o ofn ac, o ganlyniad, bydd rhwystrau rhag newid. Gallaf weld hynny yn fy ardal i o fae Abertawe lle mae, yn rhan o ddiwygio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, llawer o arloesi aruthrol wedi digwydd, wedi'i arwain gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, o ran gwasanaethau integredig ac wrth greu penodiadau ar y cyd â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Fodd bynnag, mae rhannau o ansicrwydd o ryw 10 i 15 y cant sy'n creu llawer o anesmwythyd. Cyfathrebu'n effeithiol yw'r unig ffordd y gallwn oresgyn yr ofnau hynny, gan dderbyn y bydd newyddion drwg i nifer o bobl.

Soniodd Chris Franks hefyd am hyn, ond roeddwn yn hoff yn arbennig o'ch dull sector cyhoeddus cyfan neu ddatblygu dull yn seiliedig ar un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. Os gallwn weithio gyda'r gwasanaeth sifil, ond hefyd gyda llywodraeth leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd, i ddatblygu un dull i bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, bydd hwnnw'n arloesiad pwysig.

Nid wyf yn cytuno â sylwadau Chris Franks am fformiwla Barnett. Gwyddom o waith Holtham y byddai unrhyw ymgais i ail-drafod fformiwla Barnett pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad wedi costio arian i Gymru. Dogma dall sydd gan Chris Franks drwy roi'r bai ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am beidio â mynnu newid yn fformiwla Barnett yn gynharach. Byddai newid felly wedi costio i Gymru. Bu Llywodraethau blaenorol yn gweithredu er budd pennaf Cymru ac nid aethant yn sownd yn y math o sefyllfa ddogmatig y mae Chris fel petai'n ei datgan.

Rwyf wedi cyrraedd fy mhwynt olaf. Gwn fod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad drefniadau cyfun i bobl sy'n colli swyddi yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bu'r trefniadau hynny'n darged hawdd i bobl ymosod arno, ond mae mantais i'r dull hwnnw. Os collir swyddi yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac os nad oes unrhyw drefniadau cyfun, byddai'n rhaid darparu taliad diswyddo i'r bobl hynny, byddai eu sgiliau'n cael eu colli a byddai'n rhaid recriwtio a hyfforddi pobl newydd. Mae llawer i'w ddweud o blaid y trefniadau cyfun sydd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu lle. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd ar goll yw asesiad

However, what is missing is an effective value for money assessment of how those pooled arrangements are working. If there were such an assessment of those pooled arrangements and that showed a positive outcome in terms of value for money, there may be a case for using such pooled arrangements right across the single public service, utilising the pan-public-service approach that you alluded to. There is a case for research or evaluation to provide some evidence-based guidance on taking that approach.

3.50 p.m.

Jane Hutt: Thank you for that thoughtful and well-researched contribution, which results from your experience as an Assembly Member and a Minister, and for your support for the distinctive pan-public-sector approach that we are taking. It is followed through in the work that Carl Sargeant is doing as Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, as well as the work of the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning, and the Minister for Health and Social Services. This is about the Welsh Assembly Government undertaking joined-up working with our public service partners, and the workforce is at the core of that.

I will not repeat what I said in my statement about the way in which we are engaging the Wales TUC, but I will just add to that by saying that the workforce development stream aims to engage, develop and aid transition. It is helping to change the Welsh public service workforce, because that is what it is—a single public service workforce—to not only better support public service delivery, but also to ensure that the workforce itself benefits from the work that we are doing, for example, on the career transition programme, which we are now looking at implementing. You will remember that that includes Jobcentre Plus, and we are also engaging with the Equality and Human Rights Commission. The First Minister, Carwyn Jones, chaired the workforce partnership council only a week ago, where we had all the public sector trade unions around the table with the Equality and Human Rights Commission, to take on board

effeithiol o werth am arian y ffordd y mae'r trefniadau cyfun hynny'n gweithio. Pe byddai asesiad felly o'r trefniadau cyfun hynny a bod hwnnw'n dangos canlyniad cadarnhaol o ran gwerth am arian, gall fod achos o blaid defnyddio trefniadau cyfun felly ar draws y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus sengl i gyd, gan ddefnyddio'r dull gwasanaeth cyhoeddus cyfan a grybwyllwyd gennych. Mae achos o blaid ymchwil neu werthuso i ddarparu ychydig o gyfarwyddyd ar sail tystiolaeth ar ddewis y dull hwnnw.

Jane Hutt: Diolch i chi am y cyfraniad mawr ei ymchwil ac ystyriol hwnnw, sy'n ffrwyth eich profiad yn Aelod Cynulliad ac yn Weinidog, ac am eich cefnogaeth i'r dull sector cyhoeddus cyfan arbennig a ddewiswyd gennym. Mae'n cael ei ddilyn yn y gwaith y mae Carl Sargeant yn ei wneud yn Weinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, yn ogystal â gwaith y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gweithio'n gydgyssylltiedig gyda'n partneriaid gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, ac mae'r gweithlu wrth wraidd hynny.

Ni ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy natganiad am y ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio gyda TUC Cymru, ond ychwanegaf yn gyflym at hynny drwy ddweud mai nod ffrwd datblygu'r gweithlu yw achosi, datblygu a chynorthwyo'r pontio. Mae'n helpu i newid gweithlu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymru, am mai dyna ydyw—un gweithlu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus—i gefnogi'n well y broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond hefyd i sicrhau bod y gweithlu ei hun yn elwa ar y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud, er enghraifft, ar y rhaglen newid gyrfa, yr ydym bellach yn gobeithio ei gweithredu. Byddwch chi'n cofio bod honno'n cynnwys y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, ac rydym hefyd yn ymgysylltu â'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol. Cadeiriodd y Prif Weinidog, Carwyn Jones, y cyngor partneriaeth gweithlu wythnos yn ôl, lle cawsom yr holl undebau llafur sector cyhoeddus o gwmpas y bwrdd gyda'r Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau

their concerns about the changes that they would be engaged in. There will be a special conference of the Wales TUC where we will be addressing these issues.

On the workforce development work stream, we are looking at integrating workforce plans, as well as strands like living corporate social responsibility, and building strategic human resources capacity, which will be important for managing this change in a way that is progressive, socially just and responsible. Where we can, we are looking at issues like varying terms and conditions for the public sector workforce across Wales; that is part of the project on integrating the workforce.

Finally, we are learning from the economic summits and are working with the trade unions and public service employers utilising a social partnership approach. That way, we can take the public sector through the most challenging budget that we have experienced in the Assembly. As I have said repeatedly, not only are we underfunded—and we will be able to debate fair funding in a couple of weeks' time, when we receive the Holtham report—but the £6.6 billion budget in June unnecessarily threatened to destabilise our public services. In Wales, we did things differently by saying that we would not cut our public capital programme, and that we would seek to protect our public services. That has certainly protected jobs, not just in the public services, but in the private sector and the construction industry as well.

Dynol, i ystyried eu pryderon am y newidiadau y byddent yn rhan ohonynt. Bydd cynhadledd arbennig TUC Cymru lle byddwn yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn.

Ar ffrwd waith datblygu'r gweithlu, rydym yn gobeithio integreiddio cynlluniau gweithlu, yn ogystal â ffrydiau fel cyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol corfforaethol byw, a meithrin gallu adnoddau dynol strategol, a fydd yn bwysig i reoli'r newid hwn mewn modd sy'n flaengar, yn gymdeithasol gyfiawn ac yn gyfrifol. Lle gallwn, rydym yn edrych ar faterion fel amrywio telerau ac amodau i'r gweithlu sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru; mae hynny'n rhan o'r prosiect ar integreiddio'r gweithlu.

Yn olaf, rydym yn dysgu oddi wrth yr uwchgynadleddau economaidd ac yn gweithio gyda'r undebau llafur a chyflogwyr gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn defnyddio dull partneriaeth gymdeithasol. Fel hynny, gallwn lywio'r sector cyhoeddus drwy'r gyllideb fwyaf heriol yr ydym wedi'i chael yn y Cynulliad. Fel y dywedais droeon, nid ydym yn cael digon o gyllid—byddwn ni'n gallu dadlau ynghylch cyllid teg ymhen pythefnos, pan gawn adroddiad Holtham—ond hefyd roedd y gyllideb £6.6 biliwn ym mis Mehefin yn bygwth dadsefydlogi ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ddiangen. Yng Nghymru, gwnaethom bethau'n wahanol drwy ddweud na fyddem yn torri ein rhaglen cyfalaf cyhoeddus, ac y byddem yn ceisio amddiffyn ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae hynny'n sicr wedi amddiffyn swyddi, nid yn unig yn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond yn y sector preifat a'r diwydiant adeiladu hefyd.

Datganiad am 'Eich Gwasanaeth Chi, Eich Llais Chi' Statement on 'Your Service, Your Say'

The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant): Before the summer, I set out my vision for the public services. It was a simple message: we must work together for better, more effective services for the citizens of Wales. I also acknowledged that local authority services, from collecting our bins to educating our children, and lighting our streets to paying our benefits, are provided by a workforce of dedicated, proud people who are committed

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant): Cyn yr haf, nodais fy ngweledigaeth i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Roedd yn neges syml: mae'n rhaid inni gydweithio dros wasanaethau gwell, mwy effeithiol i ddinasyddion Cymru. Cydnabûm hefyd fod gwasanaethau awdurdod lleol, o gasglu ein biniau i addysgu ein plant, ac o oleuo ein strydoedd i dalu ein budd-daliadau, yn cael eu darparu gan weithlu o bobl falch,

to delivering services for us all. That is why the theme of my summer tour around Wales, to meet them, was 'Your services, your say'. I wanted to know what front-line workers think about the services that they provide: what is wrong, what is right and how we can do it better. The impact of the UK coalition Government's budget on Wales will not be good for Wales. Therefore, the issue is how we can work together for better, more effective services against such a financial background. That is why, today, I am announcing a review of local government services that will look specifically at how we should be delivering services in Wales that meet the needs of our citizens and meet the financial pressures that we face. I will return to that later.

Our efficiency and innovation programme, which Jane Hutt has just outlined, is a perfect example of how we are shaping and leading change through collaboration. It is only by working with the many organisations across the spectrum of the public service, as well as with our trade unions, that we will be able to respond effectively to the most challenging financial climate in many years. I have seen many examples of innovation and good practice over the past few months, and you have heard about some of the good examples that Jane Hutt has seen. I met lawyers from 16 local authorities who had come together to share expertise and to undertake legal work on specialist areas that they would previously have bought in. It is a simple idea that came from the practitioners themselves, but it developed into an initiative that will improve services and potentially save hundreds of thousands of pounds. It is a stunning success, where senior management encouraged, empowered and supported change. We need to see more of that and when we create something that works, we need to mirror it across Wales. I am frustrated that good practice is often not used as the basis for improving services and making efficiencies elsewhere. Local authorities have to consider whether they need to do something themselves, or whether a service would be better delivered in collaboration with their neighbours, with others at a regional level, or by a single national organisation.

ymroddedig sydd wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu gwasanaethau i bob un ohonom. Dyna pam 'Eich Gwasanaeth Chi, Eich Llais Chi' oedd thema fy nhaith haf o amgylch Cymru, i gyfarfod â hwy. Roeddwn am wybod barn y gweithwyr rheng flaen am y gwasanaethau a ddarparant: beth sy'n anghywir, beth sy'n iawn a sut gallwn wneud yn well. Ni fydd effaith cyllideb Llywodraeth clymblaid y DU ar Gymru yn dda i Gymru. Felly, y mater yw'r ffordd y gallwn gydweithio er mwyn gwasanaethau gwell, mwy effeithiol mewn perthynas â chefnidir ariannol felly. Dyna pam yr wyf i, heddiw, yn cyhoeddi adolygiad o wasanaethau llywodraeth leol a fydd yn edrych yn benodol ar y ffordd y dylem fod yn darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru sy'n bodloni anghenion ein dinasyddion ac sy'n ateb y pwysau ariannol a wynebwn. Dychwelaf i hynny'n nes ymlaen.

Mae ein rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi, y mae Jane Hutt newydd ei hamlinellu, yn enghraifft berffaith o'r ffordd yr ydym yn llywio ac yn arwain newid drwy gydweithio. Dim ond trwy weithio gyda'r sefydliadau lawer ar draws sbectrwm y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a chydag ein hundebau llafur, y byddwn yn gallu ymateb yn effeithiol i'r hinsawdd fwyaf heriol ers blynnyddoedd lawer. Rwyf wedi gweld llawer enghraifft o arloesi ac arfer da dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, ac rydych wedi clywed am rai o'r enghreifftiau da a welodd Jane Hutt. Cyfarfûm â chyfreithwyr o 16 awdurdod lleol a oedd wedi dod ynghyd i rannu arbenigedd ac i wneud gwaith cyfreithiol ar feysydd arbenigol y byddent wedi'i brynu i mewn o'r blaen. Mae'n syniad syml a ddaeth o'r ymarferwyr eu hunain, ond datblygodd yn fenter a fydd yn gwella gwasanaethau ac efallai'n arbed cannoedd ar filoedd o bunnoedd. Mae'n llwyddiant ysgubol, lle bu uwch reolwyr yn annog, yn grymuso ac yn cefnogi newid. Mae angen inni weld mwy o hynny a phan grëwn rywbeth sy'n gweithio, mae angen inni ei adlewyrchu ledled Cymru. Rwy'n anfodlon nad yw arfer da'n cael ei ddefnyddio'n aml yn sail i wella gwasanaethau a chreu effeithlonrwydd mewn mannau eraill. Mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ystyried a oes angen iddynt wneud rhywbeth eu hunain, neu a fyddai'n well i wasanaeth gael ei ddarparu ar y cyd â'u cymdogion, ag eraill ar lefel ranbarthol, neu

gan un sefydliad cenedlaethol.

I have seen the recent report on public services by SOLACE Wales, which suggested an approach to the provision of services through these different models of delivery. SOLACE Wales's work fits very well with some of the messages that I heard during my visits and the discussions that I have had with local government leaders. The challenge is to understand which services fall into which category.

I believe that the public sector workforce has the talent and ambition to meet the challenges of change. I met many people during the course of my tour and was struck by the fact that they shared such a willingness to contribute and a drive to improve. I saw an abundance of evidence of workers putting forward ideas as to how they could make their services better, such as those in citizens advice bureaux, who were changing lives by helping people to claim the benefits to which they were entitled. In Powys, I heard how the library service has diversified to become a community hub by providing a broader range of services to citizens.

Good managers recognise enthusiasm and innovation and encourage creative thinking at all levels of their organisations. My challenge to the rest is to listen to those ideas and, where they will make a difference, put them in place. Management and workers need to engage more constructively through open and transparent communication. I found that where employees were engaged, individually and through their trade unions, innovative ideas had been developed and services were better as a result.

Many of the public sector workers I spoke to expressed concerns about the future and their jobs. The potential impact of the UK Government's comprehensive spending review was a very real concern to them, and I understand that. I welcome the commitment by local authorities to avoid compulsory redundancies wherever they can, but they will not be able to do that without redesigning some of their services. Efficiency and driving down costs do not necessarily mean fewer staff; they can be about cash

Rwyf wedi gweld yr adroddiad diweddar am wasanaethau cyhoeddus gan SOLACE Cymru, a awgrymodd ddull o ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy'r gwahanol fodolau cyflenwi hyn. Mae gwaith SOLACE Cymru'n cyd-fynd yn dda iawn â rhai o'r negeseuon a glywais yn ystod fy ymweliadau a'r trafodaethau a gefais ag arweinwyr llywodraeth leol. Yr her yw deall pa wasanaethau sy'n perthyn i ba gategori.

Credaf fod gan weithlu'r sector cyhoeddus y dalent a'r uchelgais i ateb heriau newid. Cyfarfûm â llawer o bobl yn ystod fy nhaith ac fe'm tarwyd gan y ffaith eu bod yn rhannu cymaint o barodrwydd i gyfrannu a brwdfrydedd i wella. Gwelais lwyth o dystiolaeth o weithwyr yn cyflwyno syniadau am y ffyrdd y gallent wella eu gwasanaethau, fel y rheini mewn canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth, a oedd yn newid bywydau drwy helpu pobl i hawlio'r budd-daliadau yr oedd hawl ganddynt eu cael. Ym Mhowys, clywais am y ffordd y mae'r gwasanaeth llyfrgelloedd wedi arallgyfeirio i fod yn ganolfan gymunedol drwy ddarparu ystod ehangach o wasanaethau i ddinasyddion.

Mae rheolwyr da yn cydnabod brwdfrydedd ac arloesi ac yn annog meddwl creadigol ar bob lefel o'u sefydliadau. Fy her i'r gweddill yw gwrando ar y syniadau hynny ac, os byddant yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, eu rhoi ar waith. Mae angen i reolwyr a gweithwyr gysylltu â'i gilydd mewn modd mwy adeiladol drwy gyfathrebu'n agored ac yn dryloyw. Lle siaradwyd â'r cyflogeion, yn unigol a thrwy eu hundebau llafur, canfûm fod syniadau arloesol wedi'u datblygu a bod gwasanaethau'n well o ganlyniad.

Bu llawer o'r sector cyhoeddus y siaradais â hwy yn mynegi pryderon am y dyfodol ac am eu swyddi. Roedd effaith bosibl adolygiad cynhwysfawr o wariant Llywodraeth y DU yn bryder real iawn iddynt, a deallaf hynny. Croesawaf yr ymroddiad gan awdurdodau lleol i osgoi diswyddiadau gorfodol ble bynnag y gallant, ond ni fyddant yn gallu gwneud hynny heb ailgynllunio rhai o'u gwasanaethau. Nid yw effeithlonrwydd a chwotgi ar gostau yn golygu llai o staff o reidrwydd; gallant olygu arbed arian yn

savings as well as better services. That was demonstrated by the recycling project in Bridgend. That service has been redesigned by the private sector and it was realising some real cash savings, as well as increasing the number of staff employed in the service. That has to be welcomed, but I would like to see that step change and innovation carried through by the public sector. I know that we have the talent to do that, but we need the commitment of public sector leaders to drive this change. I will show the leadership to make it happen, and will provide whatever support I can to those organisations that embrace the agenda for change.

My wish to see more and better collaboration among public services is well known. The power of working together was demonstrated to me on a number of visits, including a visit to the Vale's Women's Aid project. The partnership that had developed between the local authority, the courts service and the police had led to a highly valued and effective multi-agency approach to tackling domestic abuse. Not only were lives saved, but the long-term costs of dealing with the effects of abuse were drastically reduced.

In the Rhondda, the Communities First-led youth project that I visited showed how a strategic approach involving a range of agencies—such as local authorities, NHS trusts and the police—could have a positive impact on outcomes, saving time and resources across the board. I also saw evidence that public bodies working together, often in an informal way, can create a whole that is much more effective than the sum of the parts.

4.00 p.m.

By the same token, I was given a strong message that fragmented services are difficult to access and are a strong disincentive to citizens. People should not be constrained by boundaries in accessing the services that they need, but I found that that was often the case. The sharing of services is happening in some

ogystal â gwella gwasanaethau. Arddangoswyd hynny gan y prosiect ailgylchu ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw wedi'i ailgynllunio gan y sector preifat ac roedd yn sylweddoli rhai arbedion arian real, yn ogystal â chynyddu nifer y staff a gyflogir yn y gwasanaeth. Mae'n rhaid croesawu hynny, ond hoffwn weld y newid sylweddol a'r arloesi hwnnw'n cael ei ddilyn gan y sector cyhoeddus. Gwn fod gennym y dalent i wneud hynny, ond mae angen arnom ymrwymiad arweinwyr sector cyhoeddus i sbarduno'r newid hwn. Dangosaf innau'r arweinyddiaeth i wneud iddo ddigwydd, a byddaf yn rhoi pa gymorth bynnag y gallaf i'r sefydliadau hynny sy'n croesawu'r agenda dros newid.

Mae fy nymuniad i weld mwy o gydweithio a gwell cydweithio ymhlith gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn hysbys iawn. Arddangoswyd grym cydweithio imi ar nifer o ymweliadau, gan gynnwys ymweliad â phrosiect Cymorth i Fenywod y Fro. Roedd y bartneriaeth a ddatblygwyd rhwng yr awdurdod lleol, gwasanaeth y llysoedd a'r heddlu wedi arwain at ddull amlasiantaeth effeithiol a gwerthfawr iawn o fynd i'r afael â cham-drin domestig. Nid yn unig yr achubwyd bywydau, ond cwtogwyd yn aruthrol ar gostau tymor hir ymdrin ag effeithiau camdriniaeth.

Yn y Rhondda, roedd y prosiect ieuentid yr ymwelais ag ef a arweinir gan Gymunedau yn Gyntaf yn dangos y ffordd y gallai dull strategol sy'n cynnwys amryw asiantaethau—fel awdurdodau lleol, ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a'r heddlu—gael effaith gadarnhaol ar ganlyniadau, gan arbed amser ac adnoddau drwyddi draw. Gwelais dystiolaeth hefyd fod cydweithio rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus, a hynny'n aml mewn modd anffurfiol, yn gallu creu rhywbeth cyfan sy'n llawer mwy effeithiol na'r rhannau ar wahân.

Yn yr un modd, cefais neges gref ei bod yn anodd cael at wasanaethau tameidiog a'u bod yn wrthanogol iawn i ddinasyddion. Ni ddylai ffiniau gyfyngu ar bobl wrth gael at y gwasanaethau sydd eu hangen arnynt, ond canfûm mai dyna sy'n digwydd yn aml. Mae gwasanaethau'n cael eu rhannu mewn rhai

areas, but in other areas, progress is slow. The pace needs to quicken if we are to provide improved services to our citizens and meet the huge financial challenges that face us.

While there are certain areas of good practice, not all the conclusions that I have drawn from my various meetings and discussions have been positive. I have seen that there are still many barriers to improvement. In some places, I have heard a good deal of talk about collaboration but have seen much less action. That was reflected by the frustration of workers, who were able to see the opportunities for improvement but were unable to do anything about them.

In some instances, even where there is clear evidence that a collaborative approach would save money and help to improve services, local authorities have failed to change the way in which they do business. In that regard, I was particularly disappointed with Conwy County Borough Council's decision to reject a joint appointment with a neighbouring local authority, although the evidence indicated that as part of a wider service reconfiguration, it would lead to cost savings and service improvements. Local authorities must push this work forward now with more urgency than ever. Those who refuse to consider options for working together are backward looking and are failing their citizens.

I said earlier that I would be commissioning an independent study. That will aim to provide a clearer framework for the delivery of a range of services currently provided by each of the 22 local authorities. My review will be a short, independently chaired study to consider what should be delivered where. The work will be led by the local government centre and will involve representatives from service deliverers, the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives, the Welsh Local Government Association and trade unions. Those involved in that work will report to me around Christmas time.

The terms of reference for the review will be

ardaloedd, ond araf yw'r cynnydd mewn ardaloedd eraill. Mae angen cyflymu pethau os ydym am ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau i'n dinasyddion ac ateb yr heriau ariannol enfawr o'n blaenau.

Er bod rhai meysydd o arfer da, ni fu fy holl gasgliadau o'm cyfarfodydd a'm trafodaethau amrywiol yn rhai cadarnhaol. Rwyf wedi gweld bod llawer yn dal yn rhwystro gwelliant. Mewn rhai mannau, rwyf wedi clywed cryn dipyn o sôn am gydweithio ond wedi gweld llawer llai o weithredu. Adlewyrchwyd hynny gan rwystredigaeth y gweithwyr, a oedd yn gallu gweld y cyfleoedd i wella ond yn methu â gwneud unrhyw beth amdanynt.

Mewn rhai achosion, hyd yn oed pan fydd tystiolaeth glir y byddai dull cydweithio'n arbed arian ac yn helpu i wella gwasanaethau, mae awdurdodau lleol wedi methu â newid y ffordd y maent yn gwneud busnes. Yn hynny o beth, roeddwn i'n arbennig o siomedig â phenderfyniad Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy i wrthod penodiad ar y cyd ag awdurdod lleol cyfagos, er bod y dystiolaeth yn nodi y byddai, yn rhan o ad-drefnu gwasanaeth ehangach, yn arbed costau ac yn gwella gwasanaeth. Mae'n rhaid i awdurdodau lleol wthio'r gwaith hwn yn ei flaen yn awr a hynny ar fwy o frys nag erioed. Mae'r rheini sy'n gwrthod ystyried dewisiadau cydweithio yn edrych tuag yn ôl ac maent yn siomi eu dinasyddion.

Dywedais yn gynharach y byddwn yn comisiynu astudiaeth annibynnol. Bydd honno'n anelu at ddarparu fframwaith cliriach ar gyfer cyflenwi amrywiaeth o wasanaethau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd gan bob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol. Bydd fy adolygiad yn astudiaeth fer, wedi'i chadeirio'n annibynnol i ystyried beth ddylid ei gyflenwi ymhle. Bydd y gwaith yn cael ei arwain gan y ganolfan llywodraeth leol a bydd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o gyflenwyr gwasanaeth, Cymdeithas y Prif Weithredwyr Awdurdod Lleol, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'r undebau llafur. Bydd y rheini sy'n ymwneud â'r gwaith hwnnw'n cyhoeddi adroddiad i mi tuag amser y Nadolig.

Bydd y cylch gorchwyl ar gyfer yr adolygiad

based on two very simple questions: will it reduce costs, and will it improve services? Councillor John Davies, the leader of the WLGA, applies those two tests in assessing the need for change, and he is absolutely right to do so. I do not want change for change's sake, but I want us to have a clear model for local government services in Wales that will meet those principles. I hope that the review will provide us with some of the answers needed to secure the future of services for Welsh citizens and of jobs for Welsh public sector workers. To those workers, we owe a great deal. I wish I had the time to mention each of the projects that I have visited over the last few weeks. Each visit showed me clearly that we should be grateful to the people who deliver those services here in Wales. Whether as workers for local authorities or as volunteers, I thank each and every one of them for their ongoing commitment, energy and drive, and I commend their efforts to you all.

The times ahead will be tough, but I am confident that we can rely on the people who make up our services, and that, between us, we will be able to develop a fair, innovative and efficient solution for the future of public services in Wales.

Darren Millar: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I welcome the review that you have announced today, because we all know that Wales faces a public sector spending squeeze over the next few years. Let us remind ourselves of why we are facing that squeeze, and who is responsible for the shortage of cash in the public sector at the moment. I will tell you who is responsible. *[Interruption.]* You might shout there at the back as a former First Minister, Rhodri Morgan—

The Presiding Officer: Order. No-one shouts in the Chamber, not even former First Ministers.

Darren Millar: The fact of the matter is that

yn seiliedig ar ddau gwestiwn syml iawn: a fydd yn lleihau costau, ac a fydd yn gwella gwasanaethau? Mae'r Cyngorydd John Davies, arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn cymhwysu'r ddau brawf hynny wrth asesu a oes angen newid, ac mae yn llygad ei le i wneud hynny. Nid wyf am gael newid er mwyn newid, ond rwyf am inni gael model clir ar gyfer gwasanaethau llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru a fydd yn bodloni'r egwyddorion hynny. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr adolygiad yn rhoi inni ychydig mwy o'r atebion sydd eu hangen i ddiogelu dyfodol gwasanaethau i ddinasyddion Cymru a swyddi i weithwyr sector cyhoeddus Cymru. I'r gweithwyr hynny, mawr yw ein dyled. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oes gennyf yr amser i sôn am bob un o'r prosiectau yr ymwelais â hwy dros yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Roedd pob ymweliad yn dangos imi'n glir y dylem fod yn ddiolchgar i'r bobl sy'n cyflenwi'r gwasanaethau hynny yma yng Nghymru. P'un a ydynt yn weithwyr i awdurdodau lleol neu'n wirfoddolwyr, diolchaf i bob un ohonynt am eu hymrwymiad, eu hegni a'u brwdfrydedd parhaus, ac rwy'n canmol eu hymdrechion i chi i gyd.

Amser caled sydd o'n blaenau, ond rwy'n ffyddiog y gallwn ddibynnu ar y bobl sy'n rhan o'n gwasanaethau ac y gallwn ddatblygu, rhyngom, ateb teg, arloesol ac effeithlon i ddyfodol gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Darren Millar: Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Croesawaf yr adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd gennych heddiw, am ein bod i gyd yn gwybod bod Cymru'n wynebu gwasgfa mewn gwariant sector cyhoeddus dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Gadewch inni atgoffa ein hunain pam rydym yn wynebu'r wasgfa honno, a phwy sy'n gyfrifol am y diffyg arian yn y sector cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd. Dywedaf wrthych bwy sy'n gyfrifol. *[Torri ar draws.]* Gallwch weiddi yno yn y cefn a chithau'n Brif Weinidog blaenorol, Rhodri Morgan—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid oes neb yn gweiddi yn y Siambr, nid hyd yn oed Prif Weinidogion blaenorol.

Darren Millar: A dweud y gwir, cymynrodd

it is the legacy of the former UK Labour Government that has led to these cuts. Its management of public finances has been disastrous and appalling. We now have a bigger budget deficit than any other country in the European Union bar Ireland. For every £4 of public money spent, £1 is borrowed. That is why we are in this mess, and that is why there needs to be a change in attitude about the delivery of services, not just in local government but across the public sector. That is why the UK coalition Government in London is taking the right approach, managing public finances responsibly. It is because we have to balance the books if we are to be on a stable footing in the future.

Every level of government has to accept its responsibility to deliver public services in a different way in the future. Minister, you are right that we need to replicate good practice in local government and elsewhere where there is collaboration in the delivery of public services, especially when they hit John Davies's two criteria of saving money and delivering services in a better way for the public. However, the public rightly questions why there is not more urgency from local government to bring about change. They ask the question of Assembly Members time and again: why do we need 22 chief executives, 22 directors of finance, 22 directors of education, and all the back-up, support and administration that that requires? They ask why there is no Government action to address those things. We must remember that Welsh council tax payers have paid through the nose for this over the past decade, with council tax more than doubling.

There are some low-hanging fruit to be picked, including human resources, payroll, and health and safety functions, and, as you have already mentioned, legal departments. There is no reason why they should not be merging at a much quicker pace and with more ferocity. They are ripe for rationalisation, and I commend you for taking action to encourage that and to promote that within local government.

Llywodraeth Lafur flaenorol y DU sydd wedi arwain at y toriadau hyn. Mae ei rheolaeth ar gyllid cyhoeddus wedi bod yn drychinebus ac yn ofnadwy. Erbyn hyn, mae ein diffyg cyllideb ni'n fwy nag un unrhyw wlad arall yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd heblaw Iwerddon. Am bob £4 o arian cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei wario, mae £1 yn cael ei benthyg. Dyna pam yr ydym yn y llanast hwn, a dyna pam mae angen newid agwedd am gyflenwi gwasanaethau, nid mewn llywodraeth leol yn unig ond ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Dyna pam mae Llywodraeth clymblaid y DU yn Llundain yn defnyddio'r dull cywir, gan reoli cyllid cyhoeddus yn gyfrifol, oherwydd mae'n rhaid inni fantoli'r cyfrifon er mwyn peidio â baglu yn y dyfodol.

Rhaid i bob lefel o lywodraeth dderbyn ei chyfrifoldeb i gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn gwahanol ffordd yn y dyfodol. Weinidog, rydych chi'n gywir bod angen inni ddyblygu arfer da mewn llywodraeth leol ac mewn mannau eraill lle cydweithir i gyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn enwedig pan fyddant yn bodloni dau faen prawf John Davies sef arbed arian a chyflenwi gwasanaethau mewn gwell ffordd i'r cyhoedd. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyhoedd yn holi'n briodol pam nad oes mwy o frys gan lywodraeth leol i newid. Maent yn gofyn y cwestiwn i Aelodau Cynulliad dro ar ôl tro; pam mae angen 22 o brif weithredwyr arnom, a 22 o gyfarwyddwyr cyllid, a 22 o gyfarwyddwyr addysg, a'r holl gefnogaeth, cymorth a gweinyddiaeth sydd eu hangen ar hynny? Maen nhw'n holi pam nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â'r pethau hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni gofio bod y rhai sy'n talu treth gyngor yng Nghymru wedi talu trwy'r trwyn am hyn dros y degawd diwethaf, a'r dreth gyngor wedi dyblu a rhagor.

Mae ambell ffrwyth isel i'w dynnu, gan gynnwys adrannau adnoddau dynol, cyflogres ac iechyd a diogelwch, ac, fel y soniasoch eisoes, adrannau cyfreithiol. Nid oes rheswm pam na ddylent fod yn uno'n llawer cyflymach ac yn ffyrnicach. Maen nhw'n barod i'w rhesymoli, ac rwy'n eich canmol am weithredu i annog hynny ac i hyrwyddo hynny mewn llywodraeth leol.

Regardless of how people might feel about protecting their service locally for personal gain or interest, where services are delivering and passing those two tests, it is critical that they be driven forward. You must be prepared to take that action, because I hope that you will agree that there is no place for protectionism in the Welsh public sector in respect of service delivery. When I say 'protectionism', I mean protecting little empires that have been built up in different departments in local government offices across this nation, with officers protecting their posts, sometimes unnecessarily and going against the public interest.

I am sure that you would also agree that we need to set aside ideologies about how services can be delivered because, at the end of the day, you are quite right that it is the citizen who matters, not necessarily who delivers a service. It could be delivered by the private sector, for example, and not by local government employees directly. People need to be open minded about service delivery and about whether local government should be a bigger commissioner of services rather than a provider. You cited one good example in Bridgend, but there are many others across Wales. I feel that the private sector is underused because of the ideological problems of some councillors in working with the private sector.

Minister, what was the cost of your tour of Wales? Many of the issues that you raised were already known, and you have been aware of them for some time. I have submitted a written question on this, and I expect an answer today, but I hope that you can furnish us with that information in the Chamber this afternoon. Could you also tell us the estimated cost of this review? I appreciate that you are, in effect, spending to save money, and that is good, but it would be good to have an indication of the costs.

You mentioned the timescale of the review and said that you expect to have a report by Christmas. Can you assure us that you will

Ni waeth sut mae pobl yn teimlo am amddiffyn eu gwasanaeth yn lleol er elw neu fudd personol, lle mae gwasanaethau'n cyflenwi ac yn llwyddo yn y ddau brawf hynny, mae'n allweddol eu sbarduno ymlaen. Mae'n rhaid ichi fod yn barod i gymryd y cam hwnnw, oherwydd gobeithiaf y byddwch yn cytuno nad oes lle i ddiffyndollaeth yn sector cyhoeddus Cymru o ran cyflenwi gwasanaethau. Pan ddywedaf 'diffyndollaeth', rwy'n golygu amddiffyn ymerodraethau bychain a adeiladwyd mewn gwahanol adrannau mewn swyddfeydd llywodraeth leol ledled y genedl hon, gyda swyddogion yn amddiffyn eu swyddi, weithiau'n ddianghenraid ac yn mynd yn erbyn y budd cyhoeddus.

Rwy'n siŵr y byddech chithau hefyd yn cytuno bod angen inni osod o'r neilltu ideolegau am y ffordd y gellir cyflenwi gwasanaethau oherwydd, yn y pen draw, rydych chi'n iawn mai'r dinesydd sy'n bwysig, nid pwy sy'n cyflenwi gwasanaeth o reidrwydd. Gallai gael ei gyflenwi gan y sector preifat, er enghraifft, ac nid gan gyflogaion llywodraeth leol yn uniongyrchol. Mae angen i bobl fod â meddwl agored am gyflenwi gwasanaethau ac wrth ystyried a ddylai llywodraeth leol fod yn fwy o gomisiynydd gwasanaethau na darparwr. Soniasoch am un enghraifft dda ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, ond mae llawer o rai eraill ledled Cymru. Teimlaf nad yw'r sector preifat yn cael ei ddefnyddio digon oherwydd problemau ideolegol rhai cynghorwyr wrth weithio gyda'r sector preifat.

Weinidog, beth oedd cost eich taith o Gymru? Roedd llawer o'r materion a godasoch eisoes yn hysbys, a buoch yn ymwybodol ohonynt ers cryn dipyn. Rwyf wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn ysgrifenedig am hyn, a disgwyliaf ateb heddiw, ond gobeithiaf y gallwch roi'r wybodaeth honno inni yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. A allech chi sôn wrthym hefyd am amcangyfrif o gost yr adolygiad hwn? Gwerthfawrogaf eich bod, i bob pwrpas, yn gwario i arbed arian, ac mae hynny'n beth da, ond byddai'n dda cael syniad o'r costau.

Soniasoch am amserlen yr adolygiad a dywedasoch eich bod yn disgwyl cael adroddiad erbyn y Nadolig. A allwch ein

make a further statement in the Chamber in the new year to update us on your proposed actions as a result of the outcome of that review?

How will the review impact on the ongoing work that the civil servants in your department are already undertaking into whether there needs to be reorganisation in local government? You know very well that many people in local government are speculating about reorganisation. Many are saying that if there is to be reorganisation, let us get on with it. How will this feed into that process? Furthermore, what sanctions will you impose on those local government and other public sector partners who may not wish to engage in the collaboration and joint working agenda at the rate that you and I both know they need to?

I have one further question on the role of town and community councils in service delivery. We have spoken at length about local authorities, but town and community councils often have the capacity to deliver public services at a lower cost through the use of volunteers and local tradespeople who, out of goodwill, want to serve their local community and may be able to offer public services with an in-built efficiency saving. Can you also comment on that?

4.10 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: That was a strange contribution. Sometimes, you were saying that this is brilliant, and other times you were saying that there were some real and big concerns. Let us take your first point about the reasons why. The reason Jane Hutt, the First Minister and I have been travelling the country is because, in October, we expect a series of cuts from the UK Government—that is, your Government, with the help of the Liberal Democrats. Your party has chosen to impose quick and very deep cuts on the people of the UK. These cuts are not based on any assessment of needs; they are ideological cuts that you and your Liberal Democrat colleagues support. You are hitting the poorest in our communities. You are hitting women and children first. Those are

sicrhau y byddwch yn gwneud datganiad pellach yn y Siambwr yn y flwyddyn newydd i roi gwybod y diweddaraf inni am eich camau arfaethedig yn sgil canlyniad yr adolygiad hwnnw?

Sut bydd yr adolygiad yn effeithio ar y gwaith parhaus y mae gweision sifil yn eich adran eisoes yn ei wneud i ganfod a oes angen ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol? Rydych chi'n gwybod yn dda iawn fod llawer o bobl mewn llywodraeth leol yn damcaniaethu am ad-drefnu. Mae llawer yn dweud, os oes ad-drefnu am fod, gadewch inni fwrw ymlaen. Sut bydd hyn yn cyfrannu at y broses honno? Hefyd, pa sancsiynau y byddwch chi'n eu gosod ar y partneriaid llywodraeth leol a sector cyhoeddus eraill hynny nad ydynt efallai'n dymuno bod yn rhan o'r agenda cydweithio i'r graddau y gwyddoch chi ac y gwn i fod angen iddynt?

Mae gennyf un cwestiwn pellach am rôl cynghorau tref a chymuned mewn cyflenwi gwasanaethau. Rydym wedi siarad yn faith am awdurdodau lleol, ond yn aml hefyd mae cynghorau tref a chymuned yn gallu cyflenwi gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn rhatach drwy ddefnyddio gwirfoddolwyr a chrefftwyr lleol sy'n dymuno, drwy ewyllys da, gwasanaethu eu cymuned leol ac a allai gynnig gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gan arbed effeithlonrwydd ar yr un pryd. A allwch chi sôn hefyd am hynny?

Carl Sargeant: Roedd hwnnw'n gyfraniad rhyfedd. Weithiau, roeddech chi'n dweud bod hyn yn wych, a thro arall roeddech chi'n dweud bod rhai pryderon mawr a real. Gadewch inni edrych ar eich pwynt cyntaf am y rhesymau pam. Y rheswm y mae Jane Hutt, y Prif Weinidog a minnau wedi bod yn teithio'r wlad yw ein bod yn disgwyl, ym mis Hydref, gyfres o doriadau gan Lywodraeth y DU—hynny yw, eich Llywodraeth chi, gyda chymorth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae eich plaid wedi dewis gosod toriadau cyflym a dwfn iawn ar bobl y DU. Nid yw'r toriadau hyn yn seiliedig ar unrhyw asesiad o anghenion; maent yn doriadau ideolegol yr ydych chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn eu cefnogi. Rydych chi'n bwrw'r tlotaf yn ein

the things that I do not think are acceptable, and that is the reality of what these cuts are producing.

Let us move on to the issues of collaboration. You mentioned the 22 authorities. Again, that is an interesting concept, and I thank you for bringing it up. However, it was actually the Conservatives who introduced the 22 authorities under John Redwood. I am looking to address the issue of service delivery. The structures that we have in Wales would operate far better if we could discuss collaboration, and carry it out, voluntarily. Based on my experience on my tour of Wales, I accept that we do not have the pace of change needed if these cuts affect Wales. The review will be based on the services that we already have, provided by the 22 authorities. My team and I will be looking at what fits best in a regional operation. There were examples that I can share with you, one of which was to do with trading standards, as there were single bodies across the 22 authorities, and, although they specialised in different areas, they did not always come together. That is just one example of how we create a better working environment across Wales.

I believe that you have submitted a written Assembly question to me on the costs, and I expect you to receive a response to that today. I think that it was pretty good value for money, but you will make your choices on that matter. We travelled the length and breadth of Wales, starting in Barry island and going all the way up to Anglesey. We went from top to bottom, north to south, and east to west. We worked out that it probably cost us around £3.14 for every person we met on the way. I do not think that that is a ridiculous amount of money, actually. It is an investment to save money, by understanding exactly what people who know about service delivery have to tell us. I will furnish you with more details on that, but I can tell you now that the costs were approximately £3.14 per person met on our journey.

cymunedau. Rydych chi'n bwrw menywod a phlant yn gyntaf. Y rheini yw'r pethau sy'n annerbyniol yn fy nhyb i, a dyna'r realiti o ganlyniad i'r toriadau hyn.

Gadewch inni symud ymlaen i faterion cydweithio. Soniasoch am y 22 awdurdod. Eto, mae hwnnw'n gysyniad diddorol, a diolchaf ichi am ei gyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, y Ceidwadwyr mewn gwirionedd a gyflwynodd y 22 awdurdod o dan John Redwood. Rwy'n gobeithio mynd i'r afael â mater cyflenwi gwasanaethau. Byddai'r strwythurau sydd gennym yng Nghymru'n gweithredu'n llawer gwell pe gallem drafod cydweithio, a'i wneud, yn wirfoddol. Yn seiliedig ar fy mhrofiad o'm taith o Gymru, derbyniaf nad oes gennym y cyflymdra newid sydd ei angen os bydd y toriadau hyn yn effeithio ar Gymru. Bydd yr adolygiad yn seiliedig ar y gwasanaethau sydd gennym eisoes, a ddarperir gan y 22 awdurdod. Bydd fy nhîm a minnau'n edrych ar yr hyn sy'n gweithio orau mewn gweithrediad rhanbarthol. Roedd enghreifftiau y gallaf eu rhannu â chi, ac roedd un ohonynt yn ymwneud â safonau masnachu, gan fod cyrff sengl ar draws y 22 awdurdod ac, er eu bod yn arbenigo mewn gwahanol feysydd, nid oeddent bob amser yn dod at ei gilydd. Un enghraifft yn unig yw honno o'r ffordd yr ydym yn creu gwell amgylchedd gwaith ledled Cymru.

Rwy'n credu eich bod wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn Cynulliad ysgrifenedig i mi am y costau, a disgwyliaf ichi gael ymateb i hwnnw heddiw. Credaf ei fod yn werth gweddol dda am arian, ond byddwch chi'n gwneud eich dewisiadau ar y mater hwnnw. Teithiasom ar hyd a lled Cymru, gan ddechrau yn Ynys y Barri a mynd yr holl ffordd i fyny i Ynys Môn. Aethom o'r top i'r gwaelod, o'r gogledd i'r de, ac o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin. Canfuom ei fod wedi costio tua £3.14 y pen inni, yn fwy na thebyg, am bob unigolyn y cyfarfuom ag ef ar y ffordd. Nid wyf yn credu bod hwnnw'n swm aruthrol o arian, a dweud y gwir. Mae'n fuddsoddiad i arbed arian, trwy ddeall yn union yr hyn sydd gan bobl sy'n gwybod am ddarparu gwasanaeth i'w ddweud wrthym. Byddaf yn rhoi rhagor o fanylion ichi am hynny, ond gallaf ddweud wrthy'ch yn awr mai'r gost oedd rhyw £3.14 y pen am bob person y cyfarfuwyd ag ef ar ein siwrnai.

You raised issues to do with the reorganisation element. I think that I have placed my views on reorg clearly on the record. At times of extreme financial pressure in the system, reorg sends the wrong message. My colleagues have gone down the road of telling local authorities that it is not about the structures of democracy but about how we deliver services to citizens. We have examples of where that works really well, with open-minded, progressive politicians, leaders and officers in authorities saying that this is the right thing to do, so let us do it. The people who benefit from it are the citizens, and that is what we should be focusing on. Therefore, reorg is not what I want to do, because I think that we can work better by following a collaborative agenda, but there are some pressures in the system to prevent that. You highlighted some examples that are, politically or professionally, holding back progress, and I do not think that that is acceptable.

We have some issues with the powers that have already been issued to me to do with the direction of improvement. I have been receiving comments from the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee. The other week, we were talking about mergers as a 'tool in the box'. I am more than happy to do some more work around that. We all have to keep an eye on service delivery for the citizen, rather than it always being about how we get there. We have to protect people's jobs—that is fundamental. We can do that through service transformation. If we change the way that we deliver services, we can protect people's jobs and get better services.

David Lloyd: Thank you, Minister, for this statement. I welcome it greatly. You are looking towards a single public service for Wales, on a 'pan-sector' basis as we heard earlier this afternoon, because large elements of your statement are common to the earlier statement made by Jane Hutt. With the impending savage cuts, the only way to keep the public sector viable in Wales is to plan and manage that change into a smaller, leaner

Codasoch faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r elfen ad-drefnu. Rwy'n credu fy mod wedi cyfleu fy marn am ad-drefnu yn glir. Ar adegau o bwysau ariannol eithafol yn y system, mae ad-drefnu'n anfon y neges anghywir. Mae fy nghyd-weinidogion wedi dewis dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol nad yw'n ymwneud â'r strwythurau democratiaeth ond â'r ffordd yr ydym yn darparu gwasanaethau i ddinasyddion. Mae gennym enghreifftiau o hynny'n gweithio'n dda iawn, gyda gwleidyddion, arweinyddion a swyddogion diduedd, blaengar mewn awdurdodau yn dweud mai hwn yw'r peth cywir i'w wneud, felly gadewch inni ei wneud. Y bobl sy'n elwa arno yw'r dinasyddion, ac ar hynny y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio. Felly, nid ad-drefnu sydd arnaf eisiau ei wneud, oherwydd rwy'n credu y gallwn weithio'n well drwy ddilyn agenda o gydweithio, ond mae rhai pwysau yn y system i atal hynny. Rydych wedi amlygu rhai enghreifftiau sydd, yn wleidyddol neu'n broffesiynol, yn rhwystro cynnydd, ac nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n dderbyniol.

Mae gennym rai problemau gyda'r pwerau a roddwyd eisoes imi sy'n ymwneud â chyfeiriad gwelliant. Rwyf wedi bod yn cael sylwadau gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol. Yr wythnos o'r blaen, roeddem yn sôn am uno fel 'offeryn yn y bocs'. Rwy'n fwy na bodlon gwneud rhagor o waith ynghylch hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni oll gadw llygad ar ddarparu gwasanaeth i'r dinesydd, yn hytrach nag ystyried bob amser y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflawni hynny. Mae'n rhaid inni amddiffyn swyddi pobl—mae hynny'n sylfaenol. Gallwn wneud hynny drwy drawsffurfio gwasanaethau. Os newidiwn y ffordd yr ydym yn darparu gwasanaethau, gallwn amddiffyn swyddi pobl a chael gwell gwasanaethau.

David Lloyd: Diolch, Weinidog, am y datganiad hwn. Rwy'n ei groesawu'n fawr. Rydych chi'n edrych tuag at un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i Gymru, ar sail 'sector cyfan' fel y clywsom yn gynharach y prynhawn yma, am fod elfennau mawr o'ch datganiad yn gyffredin i'r datganiad cynharach a wnaethpwyd gan Jane Hutt. A'r toriadau gwyllt ar fin digwydd, yr unig ffordd i gadw'r sector cyhoeddus yn hyfyw yng

and sharper public sector that can really deliver excellent public service. While I applaud much of the detail, some of us would like to go a little further in recognising all public services—not just local government, as you have already mentioned, but the interface with health, higher education and the civil service here in the National Assembly for Wales, all working together to provide a single public service. It should also include non-devolved public services such as the police, the Driver and Vehicle Licensing Agency, the Land Registry and other non-devolved civil service areas. They could all work together for this idea of one public service for Wales on a cross-sectoral basis—or pan-sectoral, as Jane Hutt mentioned earlier.

This vision is something that we would like to see happening anyway, but the main driver is now the black financial climate. Two questions crop up. First of all, we have been talking about collaboration and the Beecham agenda, ‘Making the Connections’, for many years, with greater or lesser success, as you mentioned in your statement, Minister. We are all driving towards greater collaboration, but how do you make sure that it happens? That is a question that comes up from time to time. It must happen now. The days of this just being a good idea are over, and we have to make it happen. We do not like using the word ‘compel’, but encouragement can only get you so far, as we have discovered over the last few years. How are you wrestling with that conundrum, Minister? That was my first point.

Secondly, there is obviously going to be collaboration across geographical boundaries; we all agree that 22 of everything is too much—even the Conservatives agree, despite the fact that they invented 22 of everything in Wales. With collaboration across geographical boundaries, how do we ensure the democratic scrutiny of those services? It is fine to get counties to work together but how do we ensure that scrutiny across geographical boundaries leads to good

Nghymru yw cynllunio a rheoli'r newid hwnnw yn sector cyhoeddus llai o faint, mwy diwastraff a chraffach a all wir ddarparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus rhagorol. Er fy mod i'n canmol llawer o'r manylion, byddai rhai ohonom yn hoffi gwneud ychydig yn rhagor i gydnabod pob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus-nid llywodraeth leol yn unig, fel y soniasoch eisoes, ond y rhyngwyneb gydag iechyd, addysg uwch a'r gwasanaeth sifil yma yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn cydweithio oll i ddarparu un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Dylai hefyd gynnwys gwasanaethau cyhoeddus heb eu datganoli fel yr heddlu, yr Asiantaeth Trwyddedu Gyrwyr a Cherbydau, y Gofrestrfa Tir a meysydd gwasanaeth sifil eraill heb eu datganoli. Gallent oll gydweithio dros y syniad hwn o un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus i Gymru ar sail draws-sector-neu sector cyfan, fel y soniodd Jane Hutt yn gynharach.

Mae'r weledigaeth hon yn rhywbeth yr hoffem ei weld yn digwydd beth bynnag, ond y prif sbardun yw'r hinsawdd ariannol dywyll bellach. Mae dau gwestiwn yn dod i'r amlwg. Yn gyntaf oll, buom yn siarad am gydweithio ag agenda Beecham, ‘Creu'r Cysylltiadau’, am lawer blwyddyn, gyda mwy neu lai o lwyddiant, fel y soniasoch yn eich datganiad, Weinidog. Rydym oll yn pwyso tuag at fwy o gydweithio, ond sut ydych chi'n sicrhau ei fod yn digwydd? Dyna gwestiwn sy'n codi o bryd i'w gilydd. Mae'n rhaid iddo ddigwydd yn awr. Mae wedi canu ar y diwrnodau pan oedd hwn yn syniad da yn unig, ac mae'n rhaid inni wneud iddo ddigwydd. Nid ydym yn hoffi defnyddio'r gair ‘gorfodi’, ond dim ond hyn a hyn o bellter yr ewch chi ag anogaeth, fel yr ydym wedi'i ddarganfod dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf. Sut ydych chi'n mynd i'r afael â'r pos hwnnw, Weinidog? Hwnnw oedd fy mhwynt cyntaf.

Yn ail, mae'n amlwg y bydd cydweithio ar draws ffiniau daearyddol; rydym oll yn cytuno bod 22 o bopeth yn ormod—mae hyd yn oed y Ceidwadwyr yn cytuno, er mai nhw a ddyfeisiodd 22 o bopeth yng Nghymru. Gyda chydweithio ar draws ffiniau daearyddol, sut ydyn ni'n sicrhau craffu democratig ar y gwasanaethau hynny? Mae'n iawn cael siroedd i gydweithio ond sut ydyn ni'n sicrhau bod craffu ar draws ffiniau daearyddol yn arwain at ddarparu gwasanaeth

service delivery? We all know from the conference here last week that good scrutiny aids good governance. With those two questions, I warmly welcome the Minister's direction of travel and his statement this afternoon.

Carl Sargeant: Thank you, Dai. There has been a lot of talk about service transformation and change for many years, with different people and different visions. However, the savage cuts that face Wales post-October are now driving this agenda. We are unsighted of those numbers, but we know that they are not going to be good. That means that the people who will suffer the most and who will be the first to be hit, as I said earlier, are women, children and the poorest in our communities, and we cannot stand by and watch that happen without being prepared to step in and do something about it.

4.20 p.m.

The efficiency and innovation board is looking at the issue that you raised about the single public service, as regards bringing in other parts of the sector: the police, the fire service and health all sit with Jane Hutt on the EIB, which I support. The review that I have announced today is specifically within the family of local government and with regard to how we move that agenda on. It plays a significant part and, I hope, will lead to additional savings for the efficiency and innovation board. The issue of how we develop the argument for collaboration into willing volunteers for collaboration is always difficult. One of the messages that I picked up on during the tour was about communication. When we talk to people on the front line of a service, operating within that structure, we need to discuss their vision with them and ask how they see a different way of delivering the service. I agree with you. I hope that the review results will come back showing that, just because we have 22 authorities, all 22 do not have to do everything and in 22 different ways.

With regard to sanctions, I have the powers to intervene. However, it is not always the best route to tell unwilling partners to do

da? Rydym oll yn gwybod o'r gynhadledd yma'r wythnos diwethaf fod craffu da'n cynorthwyo llywodraethu da. Gyda'r ddau gwestiwn hynny, croesawaf yn gynnes gyfeiriad y Gweinidog a'i ddatganiad y prynhawn yma.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch, Dai. Bu llawer o sôn am newid a thrawsffurfio gwasanaethau ers llawer blwyddyn, gyda gwahanol bobl a gwahanol weledigaethau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r toriadau gwyllt sy'n wynebu Cymru ar ôl mis Hydref bellach yn sbarduno'r agenda hwn. Ni allwn weld y niferoedd hynny, ond gwyddom nad ydynt yn mynd i fod yn dda. Mae hynny'n golygu mai'r bobl a fydd yn dioddef fwyaf a'r cyntaf i ddioddef, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, fydd menywod, plant a'r tlotaf yn ein cymunedau, ac ni allwn sefyll o'r neilltu a gwyltio hynny'n digwydd heb fod yn barod i gamu i'r adwy a gwneud rhywbeth ynghylch y peth.

Mae'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi'n edrych ar y mater a godasoch am un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, o ran dod â rhannau eraill o'r sector i mewn: mae'r heddlu, y gwasanaeth tân ac iechyd i gyd yn eistedd gyda Jane Hutt ar y bwrdd hwnnw, yr wyf i'n ei gefnogi. Mae'r adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd gennyf heddiw'n perthyn yn benodol i'r teulu llywodraeth leol ac ynghylch sut gallwn symud yr agenda hwnnw yn ei flaen. Mae'n chwarae rhan arwyddocaol a gobeithiaf y bydd yn arwain at arbed rhagor i'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi. Mae bob amser yn anodd ystyried sut mae troi'r ddadl o blaid cydweithio yn wirfoddolwyr parod i gydweithio. Un o'r negeseuon a gefais yn ystod y daith oedd cyfathrebu. Pan siaradwn â phobl yn rheng flaen gwasanaeth, sy'n gweithredu yn y strwythur hwnnw, mae angen inni drafod eu gweledigaeth â hwy a holi sut maen nhw'n gweld ffordd wahanol o ddarparu'r gwasanaeth. Cytunaf â chi. Gobeithiaf y bydd canlyniadau'r adolygiad, am fod gennym 22 o awdurdodau, yn dangos nad oes rhaid i bob un o'r 22 wneud popeth a hynny mewn 22 o wahanol ffyrdd.

O ran sancsiynau, mae gennyf y pwerau i ymyrryd. Fodd bynnag, nid y dewis gorau bob amser yw dweud wrth bartneriaid

something. I would prefer that they drive the agenda from within. You mentioned some complications, and picked up on joint scrutiny. If we are asking neighbouring authorities or regions to operate in a different way, as you will be aware, Dai, the Proposed Local Government (Wales) Measure that is being considered by Legislation Committee No. 3 at the moment makes provision for formal joint scrutiny arrangements. There are some formal arrangements for joint scrutiny in some areas already, and those work well. So, if it is perceived to be a problem, we can legislate for joint scrutiny, and I intend to do that through that proposed Measure.

Veronica German: Minister, we welcome a review of the way that local government provides its services. I look at this as an opportunity to stop doing things the way that we have always done them and to look at new ways of delivering services, not necessarily along the collaborative agenda, although I agree that there are many areas where that can work. You say that the theme was 'your service, your say', but in your statement you say that you are talking to public sector workers, so I wonder whether you have considered talking to public service users, following their path through the service. You may be familiar with some of the work done using systems thinking to deliver public services. A great deal of work is being done on improving the way that housing benefit is delivered through local government.

It amazed me to learn that, on average, it can take 100 days for someone to get a decision on their housing benefit. Everybody is working really hard. All the people in the department are working really hard and they are very busy, but sometimes they have lots of targets to meet. Yes, they are meeting those targets, but they have a back office and a front office, and the paper has to be taken from one place to another, and then someone will realise that they do not have one piece of information, so they have to write to the person, but the person does not understand what it is they are supposed to bring in, so a

anfodlon am wneud rhywbeth. Byddai'n well gennyf iddynt hwy sbarduno'r agenda o'r tu mewn. Soniasoch am rai cymhlethodau, a sylwasoch ar graffu ar y cyd. Os ydym yn gofyn i ranbarthau neu awdurdodau cyfagos weithredu mewn ffordd wahanol, fel y byddwch yn gwybod, Dai, mae'r Mesur Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Arfaethedig sy'n cael ei ystyried gan Bwyllgor Deddfwriaethol Rhif 3 ar hyn o bryd yn darparu ar gyfer trefniadau ffurfiol craffu ar y cyd. Mae rhai trefniadau ffurfiol ar gyfer craffu ar y cyd mewn rhai meysydd yn barod, ac mae'r rheini'n gweithio'n dda. Felly, os canfyddir ei fod yn broblem, gallwn ddeddfu ar gyfer craffu ar y cyd, a bwriadaf wneud hynny drwy'r Mesur arfaethedig hwnnw.

Veronica German: Weinidog, croesawn adolygiad o'r ffordd y mae llywodraeth leol yn darparu ei gwasanaethau. Ystyriaf fod hwn yn gyfle i roi'r gorau i wneud pethau yn y ffordd yr ydym wedi'u gwneud erioed ac i edrych ar ffyrdd newydd o ddarparu gwasanaethau, nid o anghenraid ar hyd yr agenda cydweithio, er fy mod i'n cytuno y gall hwnnw weithio mewn llawer o feysydd. Dywedwch mai'r thema oedd 'eich gwasanaeth chi, eich llais chi', ond yn eich datganiad dywedwch eich bod yn siarad â gweithwyr sector cyhoeddus, felly tybed a ydych wedi ystyried siarad â defnyddwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, yn dilyn eu llwybr drwy'r gwasanaeth. Efallai byddwch yn gyfarwydd â rhywfaint o'r gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan ddefnyddio meddwl trwy systemau i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae llawer iawn o waith yn cael ei wneud i wella'r ffordd y mae budd-dal tai'n cael ei ddarparu drwy lywodraeth leol.

Rhyfeddais o ddysgu ei bod yn gallu cymryd 100 o ddiwrnodau, ar gyfartaledd, i rywun gael penderfyniad am ei fudd-dal tai. Mae pawb yn gweithio'n galed iawn. Mae'r holl bobl yn yr adran yn gweithio'n galed iawn ac maent yn brysur iawn, ond weithiau mae ganddynt lawer o dargedau i'w cyrraedd. Ydyn, maen nhw'n cyrraedd y targedau hynny, ond mae ganddynt swyddfa gefn a swyddfa flaen, ac mae'n rhaid mynd â'r papur o'r naill le i'r llall, ac wedyn bydd rhywun yn sylweddoli nad oes ganddo un darn o wybodaeth, felly mae'n rhaid iddo ysgrifennu at yr unigolyn, ond nid yw'r

phone call has to be made and then they have to write another letter and, when the person comes in, they bring the wrong piece of information. This is a common theme throughout these process-led services. Yes, everybody is really busy, but not with the purpose of the service. I am using just one example. In this case, the purpose is to give the right person the right amount of housing benefit as soon as possible, but it is not happening.

That is not about collaboration. It is about managers and people on the front line looking at how they deliver their services together. Managers need to follow the process—perhaps you could do it, as a Minister—and go to watch someone making a claim for the first time, follow the paper trail and see what happens to it. Some improvements have been made, but there is a great deal more that can be done. I hope that you are not going to focus only on collaboration, collaboration, collaboration, when there are many other things that could be done to improve services for the people who need them. Sometimes, we forget that local government is there to provide that service for those people. I am not saying this in a bad way, but local government is not there to provide jobs for people; that is not the purpose of local government. We must remember that and make those services fit for the people who need them. I would value your opinion on whether this is the way forward.

Carl Sargeant: Thank you for your contribution, Veronica. You are right; this does present us with an opportunity to look at what we do. I hope that this review comes back to me with some examples of how we can transform service delivery. Again, why are we doing these things 22 times? The bottom line is securing better, cheaper service delivery. Protecting jobs is crucial to this. If we can save money on the delivery of services via that route, we can also save jobs in that process.

unigolyn yn deall yr hyn mae gofyn iddo ei gyflwyno, felly mae'n rhaid gwneud galwad ffôn ac yna mae'n rhaid iddo ysgrifennu llythyr arall a, phan ddaw'r unigolyn i mewn, mae'n dod â'r darn anghywir o wybodaeth. Mae hon yn thema gyffredin drwy'r holl wasanaethau hyn a arweinir gan broses. Ydyn, mae pawb yn brysur iawn, ond nid gyda diben y gwasanaeth. Rwy'n defnyddio un enghraifft yn unig. Yn yr achos hwn, y diben yw rhoi'r swm cywir o fudd-dal tai i'r person cywir cyn gynted â phosibl, ond nid yw'n digwydd.

Nid yw hynny'n ymwneud â chydweithio. Mae'n ymwneud â rheolwyr a phobl yn y rheng flaen yn ystyried sut mae darparu eu gwasanaethau gyda'i gilydd. Mae angen i reolwyr ddilyn y broses—efallai y gallech chi ei wneud, a chithau'n Weinidog—a mynd i wyllo rhywun yn hawlio am y tro cyntaf, dilyn y trywydd papur a gweld beth sy'n digwydd iddo. Mae rhai gwelliannau wedi'u gwneud, ond mae llawer mwy y gellir ei wneud. Gobeithiaf nad ydych chi'n mynd i ganolbwyntio ar gydweithio, gydweithio, gydweithio yn unig, pan mae llawer o bethau eraill y gellid eu gwneud i wella gwasanaethau i'r bobl y mae eu hangen arnynt. Weithiau, rydym yn anghofio mai diben llywodraeth leol yw darparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw i'r bobl hynny. Nid wyf yn dweud hyn mewn ffordd wael, ond nid yw llywodraeth leol yno i ddarparu swyddi i bobl; nid hwnnw mo diben llywodraeth leol. Mae'n rhaid inni gofio hynny a gwneud y gwasanaethau hynny'n addas i'r bobl y mae eu hangen arnynt. Byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi clywed ai hon yw'r ffordd ymlaen yn eich barn chi.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch am eich cyfraniad, Veronica. Rydych chi'n iawn; mae hyn yn gyfle i edrych ar yr hyn a wnawn. Gobeithiaf y daw'r adolygiad hwn yn ôl imi gyda rhai enghreifftiau o'r ffordd y gallwn drawsnewid darpariaeth gwasanaeth. Eto, pam ydyn ni'n gwneud y pethau hyn 22 o weithiau? Diwedd y gân yw sicrhau bod gwasanaeth gwell, rhatach yn cael ei ddarparu. Mae amddiffyn swyddi'n allweddol i hyn. Os gallwn arbed arian ar ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy'r llwybr hwnnw, gallwn hefyd arbed swyddi yn y broses honno.

Thank you for your comments on what I did on my tour. I met with public service providers and users. Among others, I met with community transport users in Newtown; I went to the Citizens Advice offices in Merthyr Tydfil where I met service users; and I went to Barry, where I met service users of domestic abuse services. I went across Wales. I also met service users at RAF Valley.

I am very aware of the systems thinking. Industry is my background. There are different means of operation between the public sector and the private sector. There are things that we can learn together in the way that we do business.

Your point on housing benefit was interesting, because your Government in Westminster is now considering cutting housing benefit significantly, which will have a dramatic effect on our communities and put more pressure on the service deliverers. For example, Blaenau Gwent transformed its service as it had some issues around the delivery of service. I am not sure whether it was around the 100 days—which you talked about—but Blaenau Gwent turned its service around in terms of service delivery and now it has a very good housing benefit advice service. Therefore, why can we not roll this out across other authorities? If there is good practice in service delivery, why not share that programme? I will be expecting this review to relate to that.

Ann Jones: I have listened to your contribution, Minister, and very quickly read your statement. You did not mention the fire service in your tour of public services. Sometimes, the fire service gets missed as a public service because firefighters wear uniforms. However, it is a public service, and you have a responsibility in that regard, as Minister for fire. Did you manage to talk to any front-line firefighters and control room staff about their fears for public safety? The fire service in north Wales has done a particularly good job on the registration of houses of multiple occupation where,

Diolch am eich sylwadau am yr hyn a wneuthum ar fy nhaith. Cyfarfûm â darparwyr a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Ymhlith eraill, cyfarfûm â defnyddwyr cludiant cymunedol yn y Drenewydd; euthum i'r swyddfeydd Cyngor ar Bopeth ym Merthyr Tudful lle cyfarfûm â defnyddwyr gwasanaeth; ac euthum i'r Barri, lle cyfarfûm â defnyddwyr gwasanaethau cam-drin domestig. Euthum ledled Cymru. Cyfarfûm hefyd â defnyddwyr gwasanaeth yn RAF y Fali.

Rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o feddwl trwy systemau. Diwydiant yw fy nghefndir. Mae gwahanol foddau o weithredu rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Mae pethau y gallwn eu dysgu gyda'n gilydd yn y ffordd yr ydym yn gwneud busnes.

Roedd eich pwynt ar y budd-dal tai yn ddi-ddorol, am fod eich Llywodraeth chi yn San Steffan bellach yn ystyried cwtogi'n sylweddol ar y budd-dal tai, a fydd yn effeithio'n ddramatig ar ein cymunedau ac yn rhoi mwy o bwysau ar y darparwyr gwasanaeth. Er enghraifft, trawsffurfiodd Blaenau Gwent ei gwasanaeth am ei bod yn cael rhai problemau ynghylch darparu gwasanaeth. Nid wyf yn siŵr a oedd oddeutu 100 o ddiwrnodau—y soniasoch chi amdano—ond trawsffurfiodd Blaenau Gwent ei gwasanaeth o ran darparu gwasanaeth ac erbyn hyn mae ganddi wasanaeth da iawn yn cynghori ar fudd-dal tai. Felly, pam nad allwn gyflwyno hyn fesul dipyn ar draws awdurdodau eraill? Os oes arfer da o ran darparu gwasanaeth, pam na ddylid rhannu'r rhaglen honno? Byddaf yn disgwyl i'r adolygiad hwn fod yn berthnasol i hynny.

Ann Jones: Rwyf wedi gwranddo ar eich cyfraniad, Weinidog, ac wedi darllen eich datganiad yn gyflym iawn. Ni soniasoch am y gwasanaeth tân yn eich taith o wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Weithiau, mae'r gwasanaeth tân yn cael ei ddiystyru fel gwasanaeth cyhoeddus am fod diffoddwyr tân yn gwisgo lifrai. Fodd bynnag, gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ydyw, ac mae gennych gyfrifoldeb yn hynny o beth, a chithau'n Weinidog dros dân. A siaradoch chi ag unrhyw ddiffoddwyr tân rheng flaen a staff ystafell reoli am eu hofnau am ddiogelwch cyhoeddus? Mae'r gwasanaeth tân yn y Gogledd wedi gwneud

together with the police, HM Revenue and Customs, and the benefits people, it goes to the landlords with less than scrupulous views and ideas and takes them on, house by house, which has proved to be successful in Rhyl. I wonder whether you heard that on your tour.

I share your disappointment and frustration that Conwy did not complete its collaboration with an adjoining authority. When you do your review, will you take into consideration how damaging it is to go so far down the road of collaboration and then one party or more pulling out at the last minute? How we can manage that in the best interests of all of our people, whom we try to serve?

Finally, will we have an opportunity to look at all stages of the review, so that we can be fully aware of what local authorities are saying and the ways in which we can assist them? You do not hear me saying that I want to assist my local authority very often, but we can assist them to become part and parcel of this, so that we can put up a joint front to make sure that our citizens and constituents can be sheltered in some way from the drastic cuts that we fear in October.

4.30 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: We tried to meet as many organisations as possible during the tour. We met the police, community safety partnerships, the 101 service, the armed forces in north Wales, the voluntary sector, service users and local authorities; we met an abundance of different organisations and people. We came up against a little problem with the fire service, as its protocols do not allow us to meet front-line service personnel unless accompanied by a senior officer of a fire authority.

The reason why we did this tour was to meet those who deliver services at the front line. We met many people but we did not take names—we had a ‘no names, no pack drill—there is no stigma attached to me’ policy, so that they could tell me if they thought that the service was completely wrong and that we

gwaith arbennig o dda ar gofrestru tai amlfeddiannaeth lle mae'n mynd at y landlordiaid â barn a syniadau llai na gofalus, ynghyd â'r heddlu, Cyllid a Thollau EM, a'r bobl budd-daliadau, ac yn mynd i'r afael â hwy, y naill dŷ ar ôl y llall, ac mae hyn wedi llwyddo yn y Rhyl. Tybed a glywsoch chi am hynny ar eich taith.

Rhannaf eich siom a'ch rhwystredigaeth nad oedd Conwy wedi cwblhau ei chydweithio ag awdurdod cyfagos. Pan fyddwch chi'n gwneud eich adolygiad, a wnewch chi ystyried mor niweidiol yw mynd mor bell i lawr y llwybr cydweithio ac yna un ochr neu ragor yn penderfynu peidio ar y funud olaf? Sut gallwn reoli hynny er budd pennaf ein holl bobl, yr ydym yn ceisio eu gwasanaethu?

Yn olaf, a fyddwn yn cael cyfle i edrych ar bob cam o'r adolygiad, er mwyn inni allu bod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r hyn y mae awdurdodau lleol yn ei ddweud a'r ffyrdd y gallwn eu cynorthwyo? Nid ydych chi'n fy nghlywed i'n dweud fy mod am gynorthwyo fy awdurdod lleol yn aml iawn, ond gallwn ei gynorthwyo i fod yn rhan o hyn, er mwyn inni ddod at ein gilydd i sicrhau y gellir cysgodi ein dinasyddion a'n hetholwyr i ryw raddau rhag y toriadau llym a ofnwn ym mis Hydref.

Carl Sargeant: Ceisiasom gyfarfod â chynifer o sefydliadau â phosibl yn ystod y daith. Cyfarfuom â'r heddlu, partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, gwasanaeth 101, y lluoedd arfog yn y Gogledd, y sector gwirfoddol, defnyddwyr gwasanaeth ac awdurdodau lleol; cyfarfuom â llu o wahanol sefydliadau a phobl. Cawsom ychydig o broblem gyda'r gwasanaeth tân, gan nad yw ei brotocolau'n ein caniatáu i gwrdd â phersonél gwasanaeth rheng flaen heblaw bod gennym gwmmi un o uwch swyddogion yr awdurdod tân.

Y rheswm y gwnaethom y daith hon oedd cyfarfod â'r rheini sy'n darparu gwasanaethau yn y rheng flaen. Cyfarfuom â llawer o bobl ond ni chymerasom enwau—roedd gennym bolisi ‘dim enwau, dim pacdril—nid oes stigma ynghlwm wrthyf fi’, fel y gallent ddweud wrthyf petaent yn

were going in the wrong direction. I asked for the staff to be as honest with me as I was with them. Unfortunately, the fire service was not able to accommodate our meeting with front-line staff unless we were accompanied by senior officers, because of the protocols that are in place. I know, Ann, that you have strong connections with the fire service unions, and I would be happy to arrange a meeting with them if that would be a more appropriate route in your opinion.

It comes back to being willing partners for change. I can drive the message about collaboration and how we would like to see provision, but it would be much easier if there were willing partners out there. There are some champions of collaboration across local authorities in Wales, and I thank them for that, but there are also those who do not want to collaborate because of varying degrees of service protectionism. Ultimately, we must remember that the services that local authorities provide are for the citizens of Wales, and that must be paramount in the way in which authorities deliver and look at their services. I am not precious about who does what—what we must be focused upon is the service and the outcome for the citizens. I will continue to drive that.

Brian Gibbons: I welcome your decision to undertake the review, which is long overdue; it is an important development in the delivery of public services. It is time that we grasped this particular nettle, because it is important to ensure that the shape of our public services is right for the functions and services that are delivered.

You are also right that no one set of administrative arrangements will be right for every public service. Depending on the service, the arrangements will change. Some services will be better delivered at a national level in Wales, and some will be better delivered at a regional or local authority level. As Darren Millar indicated, some may even be better delivered at a community council level. So, your review will, hopefully, be a serious attempt to match service to

meddwl bod y gwasanaeth yn gwbl anghywir a'n bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad anghywir. Gofynnais i'r staff fod mor onest â mi ag oeddwn â hwy. Yn anffodus, nid oedd y gwasanaeth tân yn gallu trefnu inni gyfarfod â staff rheng flaen heblaw inni gael cwmni uwch swyddogion, oherwydd y protocolau sydd ar waith. Gwn, Ann, fod gennych gysylltiadau cryf ag undebau'r gwasanaeth tân, a byddwn yn fodlon trefnu cyfarfod â hwy os byddai hwnnw'n llwybr mwy priodol yn eich barn chi.

Y sail i'r cyfan yw bod yn bartneriaid parod i newid. Gallaf hyrwyddo'r neges am gydweithio a sut hoffem weld darpariaeth, ond byddai'n llawer haws petai partneriaid parod i'w cael. Mae rhai'n hyrwyddo cydweithio ar draws awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a diolchaf iddynt am hynny, ond mae rhai hefyd nad oes arnynt eisiau cydweithio oherwydd graddau amrywiol o ddiffyndollaeth gwasanaeth. Yn y pen draw, mae'n rhaid inni gofio bod y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol i ddinasyddion Cymru, ac mae'n rhaid i hynny fod yn holl bwysig yn y ffordd y mae awdurdodau'n darparu eu gwasanaethau ac yn eu hystyried. Nid wyf yn orddethol ynghylch pwy sy'n gwneud beth—yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ganolbwyntio arno yw'r gwasanaeth a'r canlyniad i'r dinasyddion. Byddaf yn parhau i hyrwyddo hynny.

Brian Gibbons: Croesawaf eich penderfyniad i wneud yr adolygiad, gan ei bod yn hen bryd ei wneud; mae'n ddatblygiad pwysig mewn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae'n bryd inni wasgu'r ddanhadlen arbennig hon, gan ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau bod siâp ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn briodol i'r swyddogaethau a'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir.

Rydych chi'n iawn hefyd na fydd dim un set o drefniadau gweinyddol yn iawn i bob gwasanaeth cyhoeddus. Gan ddibynnu ar y gwasanaeth, bydd y trefniadau'n newid. Bydd rhai gwasanaethau wedi'u darparu'n well ar lefel genedlaethol yng Nghymru, a bydd rhai wedi'u darparu'n well ar lefel ranbarthol neu lefel awdurdod lleol. Fel y nododd Darren Millar, efallai bydd rhai hyd yn oed yn well wedi'u darparu ar lefel cyngor cymunedol. Felly, bydd eich adolygiad,

function and form.

I agree that too much time and effort could be spent on trying to reorganise the arrangements that we inherited from Mr John Redwood and his cohorts. Nonetheless, we should send out a strong message that we are in favour of voluntary reorganisation across public services in Wales, particularly where that type of integration is growing organically from practice on the ground. There is no point in preserving organisational structures that have long outlived their usefulness in terms of the services that are being delivered to citizens. Darren Millar is probably right in saying that there are vested interests in preventing change in local government. Hopefully, your review will say to those vested interests that their day is gone and that they can no longer be an insuperable barrier to the type of change that is needed, notwithstanding your statement on wider structural reorganisation in Wales.

The final point that I want to make is to acknowledge the importance of looking at models of care. That is absolutely right. The Minister for finance has already highlighted that developing a pan-public service or single public service approach in Wales has to be the right way forward. I was pleased to see that Plaid Cymru also majored on that in its conference. There is a degree of unity on Government benches on this particular approach. I accept that there are areas in which the private sector has a particular expertise or knowledge to drive change in public services, but I reject totally the argument that the main vehicle for improving public services is privatisation. We have tried that; it is a cul-de-sac. It failed before. It was a race into the gutter as far as the people who were delivering public services were concerned, and as far as quality was concerned. If people are treated with contempt, the services that they deliver will reflect that. There is no doubt that in the 1980s and 1990s there was a taste for outsourcing and it became a dogma of previous Conservative Governments. However, in the private sector itself, many companies are no longer outsourcing, but are bringing services in-house because that

gobeithio, yn ymgais difrifol i baru gwasanaeth â swyddogaeth a ffurf.

Cytunaf y gellid treulio gormod o amser ac ymdrech yn ceisio ad-drefnu'r trefniadau a etifeddasom oddi wrth Mr John Redwood a'i garfannau. Serch hynny, dylem gyfleu neges gref ein bod o blaid ad-drefnu gwirfoddol ledled gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, yn arbennig lle mae'r math hwnnw o integreiddio'n tyfu'n organig o'r arferion ar lawr gwlad. Nid oes diben cadw'r strwythurau trefniadaethol sydd wedi hen beidio â bod yn ddefnyddiol o ran y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu i ddinasyddion. Yn fwy na thebyg, mae Darren Millar yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod diddordebau personol mewn atal newid mewn llywodraeth leol. Gobeithio y bydd eich adolygiad yn dweud wrth y diddordebau personol hynny ei bod wedi canu arnynt ac na allant bellach fod yn rhwystr anorfod rhag y math o newid sydd ei angen, er eich datganiad am ad-drefnu strwythurol ehangach yng Nghymru.

Y pwynt olaf yr hoffwn ei wneud yw cydnabod mor bwysig yw edrych ar fodelau gofal. Mae hynny'n bendant yn wir. Mae'r Gweinidog dros gyllid eisoes wedi amlygu ei bod yn rhaid mai datblygu dull gwasanaeth cyhoeddus cyfan neu un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yw'r ffordd gywir ymlaen. Roeddwn yn falch o weld bod Plaid Cymru hefyd wedi arbenigo yn hynny yn ei chynhadledd. Mae rhywfaint o undod ar feinciau'r Llywodraeth o ran y dull arbennig hwn. Derbyniaf fod rhai meysydd lle mae gan y sector preifat arbenigedd neu wybodaeth arbennig i ysgogi newid mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ond gwrthodaf yn llwyr y ddadl mai'r prif gyfrwng i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw preifateiddio. Rydym wedi rhoi cynnig ar hynny; heol hosan ydyw. Methodd o'r blaen. Roedd yn ras i'r gwter o ran y bobl a oedd yn darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac o ran ansawdd. Os caiff pobl eu trin â dirmyg, bydd y gwasanaethau a ddarparant yn adlewyrchu hynny. Yn bendant, cafwyd blas ar ddarparu gan gyrff allanol yn ystod y 1980au a'r 1990au a daeth yn ddogma gan Lywodraethau Ceidwadol blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, yn y sector preifat ei hun, mae llawer o gwmnïau wedi peidio â darparu gan gyrff allanol, ond yn dod â

makes sense from the point of view of management, co-ordination and so forth. Outsourcing and privatisation are ideas that have been tried and have been shown to fail. Hopefully, we will learn the lessons of history. However, there are new models that need to be looked at, and opportunities such as social enterprise and new examples of the mutualisation of public services, the development of co-operatives and so forth. Those are all things that can be usefully looked at, but on the basis of John Davies's two tests. People often have a knee-jerk reaction if public services are not working. Instead of going to the public services and urging them to change, their knee-jerk reaction is either to privatise or to engage in social enterprise. We must avoid that trap, but we need to look at those opportunities where they make sense according to the tests that you have outlined.

Carl Sargeant: Thank you for your informed contribution, Brian. I am not conducting this review because I want to, but because we must. Local government in Wales does not have the financial capacity to cope with the cuts that we are facing come October, and the money passported from the Westminster Conservative and Liberal Democrat Government is forcing us to review the way that we deliver public services in Wales. The shape of that is unknown at the moment, and part of the review will look at whether that should be national, regional or local. I welcome the earlier comments about town and community councils, because we will all have to look at which services will go where.

I mentioned capacity, which is crucial. I had a recent meeting with the Deputy Minister for Social Services and the Minister for education. The budgets are extremely large, but if they are cut, we are, potentially, facing service failure. As the Minister for local government I cannot stand by and watch local authorities fail—and not because they want to fail, but because they do not have enough capacity in the system.

gwasanaethau'n fewnol gan fod hynny'n synhwyrol o safbwynt rheoli, cydlynw ac yn y blaen. Mae darparu gan gyrff allanol a phreifateiddio yn syniadau a dreialwyd ac yn rhai y dangoswyd eu bod wedi methu. Gobeithio y byddwn yn dysgu gwersi hanes. Fodd bynnag, mae modelau newydd y mae angen edrych arnynt, a chyfleoedd fel menter gymdeithasol ac enghreifftiau newydd o gilyddoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, datblygu cydweithfeydd ac ati. Mae'r rheini oll yn bethau y gellir edrych arnynt yn ddefnyddiol, ond ar sail dau brawf John Davies. Mae pobl yn aml yn ymateb heb feddwl os nad yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gweithio. Yn hytrach na mynd at y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a'u cymell i newid, eu hymateb awtomatig yw naill ai preifateiddio neu ddechrau menter gymdeithasol. Mae'n rhaid inni geisio osgoi'r fagl honno, ond mae angen inni edrych ar y cyfleoedd hynny os ydynt yn synhwyrol yn ôl y profion a amlinellwyd gennych.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch am eich cyfraniad gwybodus, Brian. Nid wyf yn cynnal yr adolygiad hwn am fod arnaf eisiau gwneud hynny, ond am ei bod yn rhaid inni. Nid oes gan lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'r gallu ariannol i ymdopi â'r toriadau sy'n ein hwynebu pan ddaw mis Hydref, ac mae'r arian a drosglwyddwyd o Lywodraeth Geidwadol a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol San Steffan yn ein gorfodi i adolygu'r ffordd y darparwn wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae ffurf hynny'n anhysbys ar hyn o bryd, a bydd rhan o'r adolygiad yn ystyried a ddylai honno fod yn genedlaethol, yn rhanbarthol neu'n lleol. Croesawaf y sylwadau cynharach am gynghorau tref a chymuned, oherwydd bydd yn rhaid inni oll ystyried pa wasanaethau a fydd yn mynd ble.

Soniais am allu, sy'n allweddol. Cefais gyfarfod diweddar â'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Gweinidog dros Addysg. Mae'r cyllidebau hynny'n fawr iawn, ond os cânt eu torri, rydym, efallai, yn wynebu methiant gwasanaeth. A minnau'n Weinidog dros lywodraeth leol, ni allaf sefyll o'r neilltu a gwylio awdurdodau lleol yn methu—ac nid am fod arnynt eisiau methu, ond am nad oes ganddynt ddigon o allu yn y system.

4.40 p.m.

Therefore, I would welcome the voluntary reorganisation of authorities that feel that they cannot manage within the financial settlement, and their looking at different ways of operating. I would welcome that opportunity. However, I will not stand by and allow services to fail across local authorities. That is where we get into the difficult ground of involuntary mergers, where we would have to tell local authorities to do business differently. It is not those authorities that would suffer; it would be the citizens of Wales, and the poorest in our communities, and our women and children, who will be affected first by some of the savage cuts coming from Westminster. I will not stand by and let that happen.

The unity of our Ministers is also important. The Minister for Business and Budget, the Minister for Health and Social Services, and the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning are keen—as is all of the Cabinet—to move in the same direction, and with a sense of urgency. If organisations think that they can pick off a Minister and seek endorsement to go in another direction, they will be disappointed; that will not happen. We have regular meetings on how to take this agenda forward, and we will continue to do so.

I agree with Brian about the public sector versus the private sector. The issue is delivering a great public service, and I think that we can do that if we do things differently. That is the challenge, and my visits to people across the sector suggest that they are up for it. We just need to give them the tools to do the job. Working with my colleague Jane Hutt on this programme, we will be able to do that. I thank you for your contribution, Brian. The review will start as soon as possible and will report back to me around Christmas. If I may, Llywydd, I will then bring back a further report to this Chamber.

The Presiding Officer: Indeed, we look

Felly, byddwn yn croesawu ad-drefnu gwirfoddol yr awdurdodau sy'n teimlo nad allant ymdopi yn y setliad ariannol, a hwythau'n edrych ar wahanol ffyrdd o weithredu. Byddwn yn croesawu'r cyfle hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddaf yn sefyll o'r neilltu ac yn gadael i wasanaethau fethu ar draws awdurdodau lleol. Bryd hynny y byddwn yn camu i dir caled yr uno anwirfoddol, lle byddai'n rhaid inni ddweud wrth awdurdodau lleol am wneud pethau'n wahanol. Nid yr awdurdodau hynny a fyddai'n dioddef; dinasyddion Cymru a fyddai'n dioddef, a'r tlotaf yn ein cymunedau, a'n menywod a'n plant, y bydd rhai o'r toriadau gwyllt sy'n dod o San Steffan yn effeithio arnynt gyntaf. Ni fyddaf yn sefyll o'r neilltu ac yn gadael i hynny ddigwydd.

Mae undod ein Gweinidogion hefyd yn bwysig. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb, y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn awyddus—fel y Cabinet i gyd—i symud yn yr un cyfeiriad, a hynny ar frys. Os yw sefydliadau'n credu y gallant ynysu Gweinidog a chael cefnogaeth i fynd i gyfeiriad arall, byddant yn cael eu siomi; ni fydd hynny'n digwydd. Cawn gyfarfodydd rheolaidd am y ffordd o fynd â'r agenda hwn yn ei flaen, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Cytunaf â Brian am y sector cyhoeddus yn erbyn y sector preifat. Y mater yw darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus gwyb, ac rwy'n credu y gallwn wneud hynny os gwnawn bethau'n wahanol. Dyna yw'r her, ac mae fy ymweliadau â phobl ar draws y sector yn awgrymu eu bod yn barod amdani. Y cyfan sydd angen inni ei wneud yw rhoi'r offer iddynt wneud y gwaith. Gan weithio gyda fy nghyd-weinidog Jane Hutt ar y rhaglen hon, byddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny. Diolchaf ichi am eich cyfraniad, Brian. Bydd yr adolygiad yn dechrau cyn gynted â phosibl a bydd yn cyflwyno adroddiad imi tua'r Nadolig. Os caf fi, Lywydd, byddaf wedyn yn dod ag adroddiad pellach i'r Siambr hon.

Y Llywydd: Yn wir, edrychwn ymlaen ato.

forward to it. Thank you for your statement, Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Minister.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.42 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.42 p.m.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol Datblygu Cynaliadwy The Sustainable Development Annual Report

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Peter Black and amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Nick Ramsay.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rwyf wedi dewis gwelliant 1 yn enw Peter Black a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Nick Ramsay.

Cynnig NDM4538 Jane Hutt

Motion NDM4538 Jane Hutt

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2009-10 fel y nodwyd yn Adroddiad Blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy a osodwyd gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar 21 Medi 2010.

The National Assembly for Wales welcomes the progress made on sustainable development in 2009-10 as set out in the Welsh Assembly Government's Annual Report of the Sustainable Development Scheme, which was laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 21 September 2010.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I move the motion.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau y cynnig.

I am delighted to come before Plenary today to welcome the publication of the annual report of the Welsh Assembly Government's sustainable development scheme for the financial year 2009-10. I am also conscious that, as I will be stepping down at the next Assembly elections, this will be the last time that I will present this annual report to Plenary, so I hope Members will forgive me if I am a little reflective this afternoon.

Mae'n bleser gennyf ddod gerbron Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw i groesawu cyhoeddiad adroddiad blynyddol cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer blwyddyn ariannol 2009-10. Rwyf hefyd yn ymwybodol mai hwn fydd y tro olaf imi gyflwyno'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn i Gyfarfod Llawn, a minnau'n ymddiswyddo yn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad, felly gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n maddau imi am fod ychydig yn fyfyrion y prynhawn yma.

Part of that reflection is on how much cross-party support there has always been, and I am sure will remain, for our legal duty on sustainable development. What really struck me as I was considering presenting this report to Plenary this afternoon was how far we as a Government have come in just one year, and how much of a difference 'One Wales: One Planet' has made. I want to thank Cynnal Cymru in particular; it has contributed a commentary to the report, which is the first time that we have had input from civil society. It states that previous sustainable development schemes were internal, whereas

Yn rhan o'r myfyrio hwnnw, ystyriaif gymaint o gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol sydd wedi bod erioed, ac a fydd yn parhau rwy'n siŵr, i'n dyletswydd gyfreithiol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr hyn a'm tarodd yn arbennig wrth imi ystyried cyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn y prynhawn yma yw mor bell yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth wedi dod ymhenn blwyddyn yn unig, a chymaint o wahaniaeth y mae 'Cymru'n Un: Cenedl Un Blaned' wedi'i wneud. Hoffwn ddiolch i Cynnal Cymru yn arbennig; mae wedi cyfrannu esboniad at yr adroddiad, sef y tro cyntaf inni gael cyfraniad gan gymdeithas

there is, for the first time, now evidence that external stakeholders are using our scheme in their work. We know from those organisations that have signed up to the charter, sought guidance, and participated in Wales's first sustainability week, that sustainability is firmly on the agenda in Wales.

As a Cabinet, when we published our new scheme in May last year, we knew that it was ambitious. However, key to that ambition was our shared, cross-party vision for a sustainable Wales, and how we agreed as a Government that we would act to try to deliver that ambition. That is why we made a commitment to making sustainable development our central organising principle and the overarching, strategic aim of all our policies and programmes across all portfolios. Not that long ago, the Sustainability Committee and the Wales Audit Office took a good, hard look at how the Welsh Assembly Government has been doing on sustainable development and, in particular, at how we have been embedding it in our processes as a central organising principle. Today, as we consider the annual report on progress on sustainable development over the last year—a journey that has not always been easy—I want to pay tribute to my ministerial colleagues for their commitment and dedication to embedding sustainable development in their portfolios. One of the issues that we have been working together to tackle as an Assembly is to gain recognition that sustainable development is about so much more than the green agenda. It is about how the social, economic and environmental factors in life come together and impact on individuals, communities and the places in which people live and work. Yet, I am sure that there will still be outside observers who will be surprised that one of the case studies that we have highlighted in our annual report comes squarely from the field of the economy: 'Economic Renewal: a new direction', which was published in July. I am pleased that the Sustainable Development Commission in Wales, which I also thank for its contribution to the report, welcomes and commends the longer-term approach to the Welsh economy, based on the

sifil. Mae'n dweud bod cynlluniau datblygu cynaliadwy blaenorol yn fewnol, ond bod dystiolaeth bellach, am y tro cyntaf, fod rhanddeiliaid allanol yn defnyddio ein cynllun yn eu gwaith. Rydym yn gwybod o'r sefydliadau hynny sydd wedi ymrwymo i'r siarter, wedi gofyn am arweiniad, ac wedi cyfranogi yn wythnos cynaliadwyedd gyntaf Cymru, fod cynaliadwyedd yn gadarn ar yr agenda yng Nghymru.

Fel Cabinet, pan gyhoeddasom ein cynllun newydd y llynedd ym mis Mai, roeddem yn gwybod ei fod yn uchelgeisiol. Fodd bynnag, yn allweddol i'r uchelgais hwnnw oedd ein gweledigaeth gyffredin, drawsbleidiol am Gymru gynaliadwy, a'n bod yn cytuno fel Llywodraeth y byddem yn gweithredu i geisio cyflawni'r uchelgais hwnnw. Dyna pam yr ymrwymasom i wneud datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor drefnu ganolog inni ac yn nod cyffredinol, strategol i'n holl bolisiau a rhaglenni ar draws pob portffolio. Nid mor bell yn ôl â hynny, bu'r Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru'n edrych yn graff ac yn ofalus ar sut hwyl y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi'i chael ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy ac, yn arbennig, sut buom yn ei ymgorffori yn ein prosesau yn egwyddor drefnu ganolog. Heddiw, wrth inni ystyried yr adroddiad blynyddol am gynnydd datblygu cynaliadwy dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf-siwrnai na fu bob amser yn hawdd-hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'm cyd-weinidogion am eu hymrwymiad a'u hymroddiad i ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy yn eu portffolios. Un o'r materion y buom yn cydweithio i fynd i'r afael â hwy fel Cynulliad yw ennill cydnabyddiaeth fod datblygu cynaliadwy yn ymwneud â llawer mwy na'r agenda gwyrdd. Mae'n ymwneud â'r ffordd y mae'r ffactorau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol mewn bywyd yn dod at ei gilydd ac yn effeithio ar gymunedau a'r lleoedd y mae pobl yn byw ac yn gweithio. Eto, rwy'n siŵr y bydd sylwedyddion allanol o hyd a fydd yn synnu bod un o'r astudiaethau achos a amlygwyd gennym yn ein hadroddiad blynyddol yn dod yn deg o faes yr economi: 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf. Rwy'n falch bod y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, y diolchaf iddo hefyd am ei gyfraniad at yr adroddiad, yn croesawu ac yn

quality of life and economic, social and environmental wellbeing of people and communities in Wales, placing sustainable development as our central organising principle.

Colleagues will have noted from the report that we make no apology for devoting more of the annual report to sustainable resource use than other chapters, because reducing our ecological footprint to our fair earthshare of 1.88 global ha can only be achieved by matching action with ambition. A huge range of work has gone on in 2009-10, which the report demonstrates, including tackling climate change; working towards becoming a zero-waste nation by 2050; a new sustainable housing strategy; work to eradicate fuel poverty; the publication of the national transport plan to help to develop a more inclusive society while tackling climate change; and changes to planning regulations to enable more microgeneration, for example. That is because living within our environmental limits remains central to our approach—it is how we will achieve a one-planet Wales. As we move forward, as Members are aware, we are currently consulting on A Living Wales, the developing natural environment framework, which will have a stronger focus on sustainable land and marine management in Wales, based on an ecosystems services approach. The framework will also address climate change pressures on the environment.

The one thing that stands out from these examples is that they are just examples. This was also picked up by both our commentators within the report. The Sustainable Development Commission stated that we need to move beyond examples of best practice to standard practice, and Cynnal Cymru stated that sustainable development does not always appear to have been embraced throughout the Assembly Government. Therefore, our political vision is taking some time to be fully integrated into this central organising principle across the Assembly Government. However, this is the first year of 'One Wales: One Planet', and even after that brief period of time, we can

canmol yr ymagwedd tymor hwy at economi Cymru, yn seiliedig ar ansawdd bywyd a lles economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol pobl a chymunedau yng Nghymru, gan sefydlu datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor drefnu ganolog i ni.

Bydd fy nghyd-Weinidogion wedi sylwi o'r adroddiad nad ydym yn ymddiheuro am ymroi mwy o'r adroddiad blynyddol i ddefnyddio adnoddau cynaliadwy na phenodau eraill, oherwydd yr unig ffordd o leihau ein hól troed ecolegol i'n cyfran daear deg o 1.88 hectar global yw paru camau gweithredu ag uchelgais. Mae ystod enfawr o waith wedi digwydd yn 2009-10, ac mae'r adroddiad yn dangos hyn, gan gynnwys mynd i'r afael â newid hinsawdd; gweithio tuag at fod yn genedl heb wastraff erbyn 2050; strategaeth tai cynaliadwy newydd; gweithio i ddileu tlodi tanwydd; cyhoeddi'r cynllun trafniadaeth cenedlaethol i helpu i ddatblygu cymdeithas fwy cynhwysol wrth fynd i'r afael â newid hinsawdd; a newidiadau mewn rheoliadau cynllunio i alluogi mwy o ficrogynhyrchu, er enghraifft. Mae hynny gan fod byw y tu mewn i'n cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol yn dal yn ganolog i'n dull-dyna sut byddwn yn cyflawni Cymru un blaned. Wrth inni symud ymlaen, fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, rydym yn ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar Cymru Fyw, y fframwaith datblygu amgylchedd naturiol, a fydd yn canolbwyntio'n gryfach ar reoli morol a thir cynaliadwy yng Nghymru, yn seiliedig ar ddull gwasanaethau ecosystemau. Bydd y fframwaith hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â phwysau newid hinsawdd ar yr amgylchedd.

Yr un peth sy'n sefyll allan o'r enghreifftiau hyn yw mai dim ond enghreifftiau ydynt. Sylwyd ar hyn hefyd gan ein dau sylwebydd yn yr adroddiad. Dywedodd y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy fod angen inni symud y tu hwnt i enghreifftiau o arfer gorau i arfer safonol, a dywedodd Cynnal Cymru nad yw datblygu cynaliadwy fel petai bob amser wedi'i groesawu drwy Lywodraeth gyfan y Cynulliad. Felly, mae ein gweledigaeth wleidyddol yn cymryd peth amser i gael ei chynnwys yn llawn yn yr egwyddor drefnu ganolog ar draws Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, hon yw blwyddyn gyntaf 'Cymru'n Un: Cenedl Un Blaned', a hyd yn oed wedi'r cyfnod bras hwnnw, gallwn

point to Arbed, 'Economic Renewal: a new direction', 'Our Healthy Future', and the natural environment framework as clear major statements about the direction of travel for an Assembly Government that wants sustainable development as its central organising principle. We know that there are many future challenges, and that there is still much to do, but the determination of the Assembly Government, and, I hope, future Assembly Governments post the elections next year, to make Wales a sustainable nation, economically, socially and environmentally, is clear.

I now turn to the first amendment. The north-south air link must be considered as part of our overall approach to transport and connectivity within Wales, set out in the Wales transport strategy and the national transport plan. It is worth pointing out that, for the first time ever, we spend more on sustainable forms of transport than we do on traditional areas, such as roads, and, as well as supporting the air link, we have improved the north-south rail and road links and we are committed to further improving the reliability and speed of journeys between north and south Wales.

I warmly welcome Nick Ramsay's amendment, which refers to the recommendation of the SDC in Wales to include a suite of measurements on the effectiveness of the Welsh Assembly Government against its own performance objectives across the departments. I am happy to accept this amendment, because it gets to the heart of how we can measure effectively the extent to which we are truly embedding sustainable development as our central organising principle. The question in my mind is how we can achieve this.

The Government of Wales Act 2006 mandates a new administration to hold an effectiveness review of the sustainable development scheme immediately following an Assembly election.

4.50 p.m.

gyfeirio at Arbed, 'Adnewyddu'r Economi: cyfeiriad newydd', 'Ein Dyfodol Iach', a'r fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol yn ddatganiadau pwysig clir am gyfeiriad Llywodraeth Cynulliad sydd am gael datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor drefnu ganolog iddi. Rydym yn gwybod bod llawer o heriau yn y dyfodol, a bod llawer i'w wneud o hyd, ond mae natur benderfynol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a, gobeithiaf, Llywodraethau'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol ar ôl yr etholiadau'r flwyddyn nesaf, i wneud Cymru'n genedl gynaliadwy, yn economaidd, yn gymdeithasol ac yn amgylcheddol, yn glir.

Trof yn awr at y gwelliant cyntaf. Mae'n rhaid ystyried y cyswllt awyr rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn rhan o'n hymagwedd gyffredinol at gludiant a chysylltedd yng Nghymru, a nodwyd yn strategaeth trafniadaeth Cymru a'r cynllun trafniadaeth cenedlaethol. Mae'n werth nodi ein bod, am y tro cyntaf erioed, yn gwario mwy ar fathau cynaliadwy o gludiant nag ar feysydd traddodiadol, fel ffyrdd, a'n bod, yn ogystal â chefnogi'r cyswllt awyr, wedi gwella'r cysylltiadau ffordd a rheilffordd rhwng y gogledd a'r de a'n bod wedi ymrwymo i wella ymhellach ar ddibynadwyedd a chyflymder y siwrneiau rhwng gogledd a de Cymru.

Croesawaf yn gynnes welliant Nick Ramsay, sy'n cyfeirio at argymhelliad y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghymru i gynnwys cyfres o fesuriadau am effeithiolrwydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn perthynas â'i hamcanion perfformiad ei hun ar draws yr adrannau. Rwy'n fodlon derbyn y gwelliant hwn, oherwydd mae'n cyrraedd gwraidd y ffordd y gallwn fesur yn effeithiol i ba raddau rydym yn wirioneddol ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor drefnu ganolog inni. Y cwestiwn yn fy meddwl i yw sut gallwn gyflawni hyn.

Mae Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn mandadu gweinyddiaeth newydd i gynnal adolygiad effeithiolrwydd o'r cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy yn syth ar ôl etholiad Cynulliad.

It would seem a sensible part of that effectiveness review to consider how the performance of Government is measured in terms of sustainable development, and which Government objectives should therefore be recorded in a suite of measurements for sustainable development. We will begin this work before the election so that it is in place for the incoming Government to use.

It also occurs to me that consideration will need to be given to which organisation should measure and evaluate the Government's performance in this area, in light of the forthcoming demise of the Sustainable Development Commission in Wales at the end of this financial year. I am sure that all Members would agree that that is an organisation that has served Wales very well. The Welsh Assembly Government and the National Assembly have been justifiably proud of their tradition of transparency and openness when it comes to scrutiny of their performance. It is important that we have measures in place to ensure that this continues.

On Nick's second amendment, to measure sustainable development performance against our 'One Wales' commitments on an annual basis and report back to the Assembly, I ask Nick to consider whether that amendment should be withdrawn. It would not be practical in the immediate term, as the 'One Wales' agreement will expire before the next election. I hope that, since we have accepted your previous amendment, which is about measuring the extent to which sustainable development is driving decisions at the heart of Government and delivering change in terms of outcomes, we will be able to use that amendment to take this agenda forward.

The legal duty that we have relating to sustainable development has always enjoyed cross-party support in the National Assembly. It is important that this cross-party support for sustainable development is maintained and enhanced, and that the work that we report on provides a springboard for new approaches in the next Assembly as we all strive towards our vision of a sustainable Wales.

Byddai fel petai'n rhan synhwyrol o'r adolygiad effeithiolrwydd hwnnw ystyried sut mae perfformiad Llywodraeth yn cael ei fesur o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, a pha amcanion Llywodraeth y dylid eu cofnodi felly mewn cyfres o fesuriadau ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy. Byddwn yn dechrau'r gwaith hwn cyn yr etholiad fel ei fod yn ei le at ddefnydd y Llywodraeth sy'n dod i mewn.

Mae hefyd yn fy nharo y bydd angen ystyried pa sefydliad a ddylai fesur a gwerthuso perfformiad y Llywodraeth yn y maes hwn, yng ngoleuni diwedd y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghymru sydd i ddod ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Rwy'n siŵr y byddai pob Aelod yn cytuno bod hwn yn sefydliad sydd wedi gwasanaethu Cymru'n dda iawn. Bu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn haeddiannol falch o'u traddodiad o dryloywder a didwylledd wrth graffu ar eu perfformiad. Mae'n bwysig inni gael mesurau ar waith i sicrhau bod hyn yn parhau.

Ynglŷn ag ail welliant Nick, i fesur perfformiad datblygu cynaliadwy mewn perthynas â'n hymrwymyiadau 'Cymru'n Un' yn flynyddol ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad, gofynnaf i Nick ystyried a ddylid tynnu'r gwelliant hwnnw yn ôl. Ni fyddai'n ymarferol yn y tymor uniongyrchol, oherwydd bydd cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn dod i ben cyn yr etholiad nesaf. Am ein bod wedi derbyn eich gwelliant blaenorol, sydd yn ymwneud â mesur i ba raddau y mae datblygu cynaliadwy'n sbarduno penderfyniadau wrth wraidd Llywodraeth ac yn cyflenwi newid o ran canlyniadau, gobeithiaf y byddwn yn gallu defnyddio'r gwelliant hwnnw i fynd â'r agenda hwn yn ei flaen.

Mae'r ddyletswydd gyfreithiol sydd gennym mewn perthynas â datblygu cynaliadwy wedi mwynhau cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol erioed yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n bwysig cynnal a chryfhau'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol hon i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a bod y gwaith y rhown wybod amdano yn sbarduno ymagweddau newydd yn y Cynulliad nesaf wrth inni oll anelu at ein gweledigaeth o Gymru gynaliadwy.

Gwelliant 1 Peter Black

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn credu nad yw cymhorthdal Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y cyswllt hedfan rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn cyfateb i ddyheadau Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy'r Llywodraeth.

Kirsty Williams: I move amendment 1.

I begin by thanking the Minister for her opening statement this afternoon. As the Minister said, this will be her last opportunity to introduce such a report. I take this opportunity to pay tribute to the Minister's own personal commitment to this agenda. During her time at the National Assembly, in the various roles that she has held, she has always had sustainability issues at the forefront of her mind. Her personal commitment to driving this through has been second-to-none. Her decision to retire, along with that of Mick Bates, from the National Assembly, means that there will be a real challenge for those of us lucky enough to find ourselves back at the National Assembly next year, to pick up and champion the issues that Jane and Mick have championed during their time here.

Given the cross-party consensus that Jane mentioned, none of us would disagree with the vision outlined in the Government's document, which has been repeated here today in the annual report. It enjoys cross-party support. The goals set by the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government are immensely challenging; they represent a massive step-change for all institutions, organisations and individuals if we are to achieve them.

Before us today, we have a report that demonstrates that we have indeed made great strides in some areas, and that there are things to celebrate. Our success in reducing waste and recycling and our engagement with civic society are things that can be celebrated. However, as the Minister has acknowledged, there are major steps and changes on which

Amendment 1 Peter Black

Add as new point at end of motion:

Believes that the Welsh Assembly Government's subsidy for the north-south airlink does not match the ambitions of the Government's Sustainable Development Scheme.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau welliant 1.

Diolchaf drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad agoriadol y prynhawn yma. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, hwn fydd ei chyfle olaf i gyflwyno adroddiad felly. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i dalu teyrnged i ymrwymiad personol y Gweinidog ei hun i'r agenda hwn. Yn ystod ei hamser yn y Cynulliad, yn y swyddi amrywiol a fu ganddi, bu materion cynaliadwyedd bob amser ym mlaen ei meddwl. Mae ei hymrwymiad personol i hyrwyddo hyn wedi bod heb ei ail. Mae ei phenderfyniad i ymddeol, ynghyd ag ymddeoliad Mick Bates, o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn golygu y bydd tipyn o her i'r rheini ohonom sy'n ddigon ffodus i fod yn ôl yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol y flwyddyn nesaf, i afael yn y materion y mae Jane a Mick wedi'u hyrwyddo yn ystod eu hamser yma, a pharhau i'w hyrwyddo.

O ystyried y cydsyniad trawsbleidiol y soniodd Jane amdano, ni fyddai'r un ohonom yn anghytuno â'r weledigaeth a amlinellwyd yn nogfen y Llywodraeth, a ailadroddwyd yma heddiw yn yr adroddiad blynyddol. Mae'n mwynhau cefnogaeth drawsbleidiol. Mae'r nodau a osodwyd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n heriol dros ben; maent yn newid sylweddol aruthrol i bob sefydliad, cymdeithas ac unigolyn os byddwn yn eu cyflawni.

Ger ein bron heddiw, mae gennym adroddiad sy'n arddangos ein bod yn wir wedi cymryd llamau mawr mewn rhai meysydd, a bod pethau i'w dathlu. Mae ein llwyddiant yn lleihau gwastraff ac yn ailgylchu a'n gwaith ymgysylltu â chymdeithas ddinesig yn bethau y gellir eu dathlu. Fodd bynnag, fel y cydnabu'r Gweinidog, mae camau a

we need to make further progress. This is especially true if we consider the sustainable indicators that the Government published in August alongside this report. If Members are not familiar with them, we have made improvements on 17 of the 44 indicators, but we have seen little or no change on half of them. In fact, in one area, we have clearly gone backwards, while four areas cannot be judged effectively. We therefore need to redouble our efforts, both as a Government and as an institution, to make progress in these areas.

While reading this report, I was particularly struck by the commentary of the SDC. As Jane has said, the demise of the SDC presents us with an opportunity to look at how effective, in the new Assembly, our reporting arrangements can be. There is a useful opportunity to establish whether, given that this is such an important subject, there is a need for an outside body to report to the Assembly as a whole, similar to the way in which the children's commissioner reported to us today about our collective performance with regard to children across our nation. Sustainable development is such an important topic, perhaps we should be doing the same with it and embedding that approach within the work of the Assembly.

The SDC's commentary is telling. The central organising principle that the Minister talked about in the Welsh Assembly Government needs to be further embedded and undoubtedly, as the Minister said, there are examples of good practice, but I think that you would acknowledge that they remain examples of good practice rather than what I am sure that you would like to see, namely standard practice throughout the institution. Often in politics, policy follows the money and the SDC had some critical things to say about financial objectives. When it comes to the financial objectives of spending, the reality is that 'One Wales' trumps sustainable development every time. We need to look at new ways to ensure that the money follows initiatives, which can assist us to reach our goals on sustainable development, hence our amendment today. We think that funding the north-south air link is fundamentally

newidiadau pwysig y mae angen inni wneud cynnydd pellach yn eu cylch. Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir os ystyriwn y dangosyddion cynaliadwy a gyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth ym mis Awst ochr yn ochr â'r adroddiad hwn. Os nad yw Aelodau'n gyfarwydd â hwy, rydym wedi gwneud gwelliannau ar 17 o'r 44 dangosydd, ond prin neu ddim newid a welsom mewn hanner ohonynt. Mewn gwirionedd, mewn un maes, rydym yn amlwg wedi mynd tuag yn ôl, ac mae pedwar maes nad oes modd eu barnu'n effeithiol. Mae angen felly inni ailddyblu ein hymdrechion, yn Llywodraeth ac yn sefydliad, i wneud cynnydd yn y meysydd hyn.

Wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad hwn, cefais fy nharo'n arbennig gan sylwadau'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy. Fel y mae Jane wedi'i ddweud, mae diwedd y Comisiwn yn gyfle inni ystyried mor effeithiol, yn y Cynulliad newydd, y gall ein trefniadau adrodd fod. Gan fod hwn yn bwnc mor bwysig, mae cyfle defnyddiol i ganfod a oes angen corff allanol i adrodd i'r Cynulliad cyfan, yn debyg i'r ffordd yr adroddodd y comisiynydd plant inni heddiw am ein perfformiad ar y cyd o ran plant ledled ein cenedl. Mae datblygu cynaliadwy'n bwnc mor bwysig, hwyrach y dylem fod yn gwneud yr un fath ag ef ac yn cynnwys yr ymagwedd honno yng ngwaith y Cynulliad.

Mae sylwadau'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy'n rymus. Mae angen i'r egwyddor drefnu ganolog y soniodd y Gweinidog amdani yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gael ei hymgorffori ymhellach ac, yn bendant, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae enghreifftiau o arfer da, ond credaf y byddech yn cydnabod eu bod yn dal yn enghreifftiau o arfer da yn hytrach na'r hyn yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech ei weld, sef arfer safonol drwy'r sefydliad cyfan. Yn aml mewn gwleidyddiaeth, mae polisi'n dilyn yr arian ac roedd gan y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy rai pethau allweddol i'w dweud am amcanion ariannol. O ran amcanion ariannol gwariant, y gwir yw bod 'Cymru'n Un' yn trympio datblygu cynaliadwy bob tro. Mae angen inni edrych ar ffyrdd newydd o sicrhau bod yr arian yn dilyn mentrau, sy'n gallu ein cynorthwyo i gyrraedd ein nodau ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, ac felly ein gwelliant

incongruous with what the Government says it wishes to achieve in terms of sustainable development.

Finally, returning to better reporting and scrutiny, I am not saying that it is true in the case of this Minister, but there is a tendency for Government to cherry-pick the areas that it likes to report on—especially where it is doing well—and to gloss over and mask areas where it is not doing so well. We need to get to grips with better, more independent and accurate reporting of our progress in this area. I am glad that the Minister has agreed to accept the Conservative amendment in this regard as it demonstrates that there is a real desire here across the parties to get this right.

Gwelliant 2 Nick Ramsay

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymeradwyo argymhelliad Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru yn Adroddiad Blynyddol 2009-2010 'ddim yn unig yn adrodd ar y cynnydd a wnaed ar y Prif Ddangosyddion Datblygu Cynaliadwy, ond ei fod hefyd yn cynnwys cyfres o fesurau ar effeithiolrwydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ôl ei hamcanion perfformiad ei hun (ar draws Llywodraeth)'.

Ymddangosodd gwelliant 3 ar yr agenda fel a ganlyn:

Gwelliant 3 Nick Ramsay

Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fesur perfformiad Datblygu Cynaliadwy yn glir yn erbyn ymrwymadau Cymru'n Un yn flynyddol ac adrodd yn ôl i'r Cynulliad hwn.

Angela Burns: I move amendment 2 but I will not move amendment 3.

I am pleased to be able to speak on behalf of

heddiw. Credwn fod ariannu'r cyswllt awyr rhwng y gogledd a'r de yn sylfaenol anghyson â'r hyn y dywed y Llywodraeth y mae am ei gyflawni o ran datblygu cynaliadwy.

Yn olaf, gan ddychwelyd i well adrodd a chraffu, nid wyf yn dweud ei bod yn wir yn achos y Gweinidog hwn, ond mae tuedd i Lywodraeth ddewis a dethol y meysydd y mae'n hoff o roi gwybod amdanynt—yn enwedig lle mae'n gwneud yn dda—ac i anwybyddu a chelu meysydd lle nad yw'n gwneud cystal. Mae angen inni fynd ati i roi gwybod yn well, yn fwy annibynnol ac yn gywirach am ein cynnydd yn y maes hwn. Rwy'n falch bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i dderbyn y gwelliant Ceidwadol yn hyn o beth am ei fod yn dangos bod gwir ddyhead ar draws y pleidiau i gael hyn yn iawn.

Amendment 2 Nick Ramsay

Add as new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to endorse the recommendation of the Sustainable Development Commission Wales in the 2009-2010 Annual Report to 'not only report on progress made on the headline Sustainable Development Indicators, but include also a suite of measurements on the effectiveness of the Welsh Assembly Government against its own performance objectives (across Government)'.

Amendment 3 appeared on the agenda as follows:

Amendment 3 Nick Ramsay

Add as new point at end of motion:

Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to clearly measure Sustainable Development performance against the One Wales commitments on an annual basis and report back to this Assembly.

Angela Burns: Cynigiau welliant 2 ond ni fyddaf yn cynnig gwelliant 3.

Rwy'n falch o allu siarad ar ran Ceidwadwyr

the Welsh Conservatives in this important debate. I read this report with great interest and like you, Minister, I welcomed the progress made on sustainable development in 2009-10. However, while we accept that, the report makes it abundantly clear that not enough progress has been made. You state in your foreword to the report that you think that much more needs to be done and I agree.

Wales is not achieving what it could and should, and we are lagging behind other UK administrations in some areas, such as reducing greenhouse gas emissions. We are clearly not living within our current environmental limits and we need to take radical steps to ensure that we make some significant progress to meet all of our ambitious targets and aims.

As has already been alluded to, the Sustainable Development Commission in Wales has produced a number of recommendations in response to the report and I will reinforce one in particular, which is why I am delighted that you have decided to accept our amendment 2, which calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to endorse the recommendations of the SDC and not to report only on progress made on headline sustainable development indicators, but to include a suite of measures on the general effectiveness of the Welsh Assembly Government against its own performance objectives.

As an Assembly, we should be able to see clearly when reading the annual report how the Welsh Assembly Government policies and programmes contribute towards the progress of becoming a sustainable nation. We should be able to see what has changed—what is and is not working and ask why not. That will enable us to see what needs to be reviewed. Therefore, we would endorse this, especially in relation to the urgent review that it calls for on the effectiveness of the current set of reported sustainable development indicators.

We have had this debate here before and you

Cymru yn y ddadl bwysig hon. Darllenais yr adroddiad hwn â chryn ddiddordeb ac fel chithau, Weinidog, croesawaf y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn 2009-10. Fodd bynnag, er ein bod yn derbyn hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn ei gwneud yn glir iawn nad oes digon o gynnydd wedi'i wneud. Rydych chi'n dweud yn eich rhagair i'r adroddiad eich bod yn credu bod angen gwneud llawer mwy ac rwy'n cytuno.

Nid yw Cymru'n cyflawni'r hyn a allai a'r hyn a ddylai, ac rydym y tu ôl i weinyddiaethau eraill y DU mewn rhai meysydd, fel lleihau allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Mae'n amlwg nad ydym yn byw y tu mewn i'n cyfyngiadau amgylcheddol cyfredol ac mae angen inni gymryd camau radical i sicrhau y gwnawn ychydig o gynnydd sylweddol i fodloni ein holl dargedau a nodau uchelgeisiol.

Fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, mae'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghymru wedi cynhyrchu nifer o argymhellion mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad a byddaf yn atgyfnerthu un yn arbennig. Dyna pam rwyf wrth fy modd eich bod wedi penderfynu derbyn ein gwelliant 2, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gefnogi argymhellion y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy ac i roi gwybod am gynnydd o ran prif ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy, ond hefyd cynnwys cyfres o fesurau ar effeithiolrwydd cyffredinol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn perthynas â'i hamcanion perfformiad ei hun.

Fel Cynulliad, dylem fod yn gallu gweld yn glir wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad blynyddol y ffordd y mae polisiau a rhaglenni Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cyfrannu tuag at fod yn genedl gynaliadwy. Dylem fod yn gallu gweld yr hyn sydd wedi newid—yr hyn sy'n gweithio a'r hyn nad yw'n gweithio a gofyn pam nad yw'n gweithio. Bydd hynny'n ein galluogi i weld yr hyn sydd angen ei adolygu. Felly, byddem yn cefnogi hyn, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r adolygiad brys y mae'n galw amdano am effeithiolrwydd y set gyfredol o ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy y rhoddir gwybod amdanynt.

Rydym wedi cael y ddadl hon o'r blaen ac

know that I am uneasy with those indicators, especially as many of them are either not current or not supported by singular data. There needs to be more clarity on them. Perhaps we need to think of different indicators that would be more appropriate as time moves forward. The information needs to be transparent and—Kirsty has already used this term—not ‘cherry-picked’, which was the description used by the Wales Audit Office. For the sake of good scrutiny of the Government, we must change this.

5.00 p.m.

I am glad that you have said that you will support amendment 2. As I have said, we are not going to move amendment 3, but there are two points that I would briefly like to touch on before I conclude. The first concerns biodiversity. Restoration and recovery of biodiversity needs to be recognised as a deliverable outcome under the Welsh Assembly Government commitment to sustainable development. I note your personal commitment, Minister, which I do not doubt, but we need a commitment from the Cabinet, from the First Minister, that a budget will be allocated to achieve this incredibly important target. A budget would clearly define where investment of public funding is being allocated to halt biodiversity decline and enable us to assess the effectiveness of such expenditure to that end. We need an increased commitment and stronger leadership from the Government as a whole. You have been a champion of all things sustainable and environmental in your time here and I do have concerns about where this agenda will go on your departure. Biodiversity is a core part of our wellbeing and our lives, and we cannot survive without it.

In sustaining the environment, a number of Government schemes will assist us. However, taking the example of Glastir, there are still so many uncertainties as to how success will be measured and monitored, and how and when the scheme will be adapted to fit. I know that this issue strays into your colleague, Elin Jones’s portfolio, but this is

rydych yn gwybod fy mod yn anesmwyth gyda’r dangosyddion hynny, yn enwedig am nad yw llawer ohonynt naill ai’n gyfredol neu’n cael eu cefnogi gan ddata hynod. Mae angen cael mwy o eglurder amdanynt. Hwyrach fod angen inni feddwl am wahanol ddangosyddion a fyddai’n fwy priodol wrth i amser fynd heibio. Mae angen i’r wybodaeth fod yn dryloyw ac—mae Kirsty eisoes wedi defnyddio’r term hwn—heb ei ‘dewis a’i dethol’, sef y disgrifiad a ddefnyddiwyd gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Er mwyn craffu’n dda ar y Llywodraeth, mae’n rhaid inni newid hyn.

Rwy’n falch eich bod wedi dweud y byddwch yn cefnogi gwelliant 2. Fel y dywedais, nid ydym yn mynd i gynnig gwelliant 3, ond mae dau bwynt yr hoffwn eu crybwyll yn fras cyn imi orffen. Mae’r cyntaf yn ymwneud â bioamrywiaeth. Mae angen cydnabod bod adfer bioamrywiaeth yn ganlyniad cyraeddadwy o dan ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Sylwaf ar eich ymrwymiad personol, Weinidog, yr wyf yn ffyddiog ohono, ond mae angen arnom ymrwymiad gan y Cabinet, gan y Prif Weinidog, y bydd cyllideb yn cael ei dyrannu i gyflawni’r targed holl bwysig hwn. Byddai cyllideb yn diffinio’n glir ble mae buddsoddiad cyllid cyhoeddus yn cael ei ddyrannu i atal dirywiad bioamrywiaeth ac i’n galluogi i asesu effeithiolrwydd gwariant felly i’r perwyl hwnnw. Mae angen mwy o ymrwymiad ac arweinyddiaeth gryfach gan y Llywodraeth gyfan arnom. Rydych wedi bod yn hyrwyddo popeth cynaliadwy ac amgylcheddol yn eich amser yma ac mae gennyf bryderon am gyfeiriad yr agenda hwn pan fyddwch yn ymadael. Mae bioamrywiaeth yn rhan graidd o’n lles ac o’n bywydau, ac ni allwn fyw hebddi.

O ran cynnal yr amgylchedd, bydd nifer o gynlluniau Llywodraeth yn ein cynorthwyo. Fodd bynnag, gan gymryd enghraifft Glastir, mae cymaint o ansicrwydd yn parhau ynghylch sut bydd llwyddiant yn cael ei fesur a’i fonitro, a sut a phryd y bydd y cynllun yn cael ei addasu i ffitio. Gwn fod y mater hwn yn crwydro i bortffolio eich cyd-weinidog,

an example of where we are looking to use a tool to improve biodiversity and sustainability, but we are still not clear about exactly what it will do or how we will measure it.

The other point that I would briefly like to touch on is that of climate change. We must do more to link climate change and biodiversity, and recognise that they are part of the same objective. I appreciate that you are now undertaking a different approach as part of your ongoing campaign, and I look forward to seeing the outcome of that approach. Wales is calling for policy-led local schemes that are tailored to each unique geographical area, and we need more of a commitment that we will do this. I would like further commitment from you, Minister, that this will be pushed through before the start of next year to ensure that we are all working all the time to make progress. I mentioned earlier the disappointing lack of progress in relation to reducing greenhouse gas emissions. We need to look at why, in 2008, our greenhouse gas emissions rose while England and Scotland achieved significant reductions.

In conclusion, I ask you to revisit the sustainable development indicators, and I would like to pick up on a point that Kirsty made on the Sustainable Development Commission and having an external audit. I think that that is a very important thing. I am not a great fan of quangos and endless non-appointed and non-elected bodies, but I think that having an external auditor, perhaps along the lines of the children's commissioner, would be useful in keeping us all on our toes and ensuring that we are all working for the most sustainable Wales that we can possibly have.

Gareth Jones: Pleser imi ar ran Plaid Cymru yw croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed yn y maes datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2009-10, fel a nodwyd yn yr adroddiad blynyddol. Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn i'n hatgoffa o bwysigrwydd y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo i wneud datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor ganolog a chreiddiol i'w gweithgarwch. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallwn, mae hynny ar draws adrannau a phortffolios.

Elin Jones, ond mae hon yn enghraifft lle rydym yn edrych i ddefnyddio arf i wella bioamrywiaeth a chynaliadwyedd, ond lle nad ydym yn siŵr o hyd beth yn union y bydd yn ei wneud na sut byddwn yn ei fesur.

Y pwynt arall yr hoffwn ei grybwyll yn fras yw'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Mae'n rhaid inni wneud mwy i gysylltu newid hinsawdd a bioamrywiaeth, a chydabod eu bod yn rhan o'r un amcan. Gwerthfawrogaf eich bod bellach yn defnyddio gwahanol dull yn rhan o'ch ymgyrch barhaus, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld canlyniad y dull hwnnw. Mae Cymru'n galw am gynlluniau lleol a arweinir gan bolisi sy'n cael eu teilwra i bob ardal ddaearyddol unigryw, ac mae angen mwy o ymrwymiad arnom y byddwn yn gwneud hyn. Hoffwn ymrwymiad pellach gennych chi, Weinidog, y bydd hwn yn cael ei wthio drwyddo cyn dechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf i sicrhau ein bod i gyd yn gweithio drwy'r amser i wneud cynnydd. Soniais yn gynharach am y diffyg cynnydd siomedig mewn perthynas â lleihau allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr. Mae angen inni ystyried pam, yn 2008, y cynyddodd ein hallyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr er bod Lloegr a'r Alban wedi llwyddo i'w gostwng yn sylweddol.

I gloi, gofynnaf ichi ailystyried y dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy, a hoffwn sôn am bwynt a wnaeth Kirsty am y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy a chael archwiliad allanol. Rwy'n credu bod hwnnw'n beth pwysig iawn. Nid wyf yn un brwd o blaid cwangos a chyrrff diddiwedd heb eu penodi a heb eu hethol, ond rwy'n credu y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael archwilydd allanol, yn debyg i'r comisiynydd plant efallai, i'n cadw i gyd yn frwd ac i sicrhau ein bod oll yn gweithio dros y Gymru fwyaf cynaliadwy sy'n bosibl inni ei chael.

Gareth Jones: On behalf of Plaid Cymru, I am pleased to welcome the progress made in the field of sustainable development in 2009-10, as is noted in the annual report. The Minister is right to remind us of the importance of the fact that the Government is committed to making sustainable development a central, underpinning principle of its activities. From what we understand, that is on a cross-departmental

Arwyddocaol yw'r ffaith bod datblygu cynaliadwy yn gwbl greiddiol i'r rhaglen adfywio'r economi a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Gorffennaf eleni.

Fel nododd y Gweinidog, mae cryn ffordd i fynd, ond diolchaf fod gennym Lywodraeth sydd yn datgan yn glir ac yn groyw yr union ffordd ymlaen. Fel dywedodd y Gweinidog, mae cadw'r cydbwysedd rhwng cynaliadwyedd, dyfodol y blaned a chreu swyddi ac adfywio economi Cymru yn gofyn am arweinyddiaeth ac ymrwymiad diffuant i wir anghenion ein pobl.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud na allaf ganmol y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae'n amlwg eu bod wedi camddeall natur cynlluniau'r Llywodraeth. Dilynir trawsdoriad o gynlluniau. Mae'r gwasanaeth awyr yn un ohonynt, ond nid dyna'r unig un, fel y dylai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wybod. Wedi'r cyfan, yn etholaeth Kirsty ei hun, mae gwelliannau sylweddol yn cael eu gwneud ar hyn o bryd i'r A470. A yw hi a'i phlaid yn meddwl bod y cynlluniau unigol hynny yn diwallu'n dyheadau, ac os nac ydynt, a ydynt yn galw am gael gwared ar y cynlluniau hynny hefyd? A ydyw hwn yn enghraifft arall o safonau dwbl anhygoel y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol? Mae'r safonau dwbl hynny yn chwedlonol bellach, fel mae pawb sy'n talu TAW, pawb sy'n ffafrio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus dros arfau niwclear, a phawb sy'n ymgyrchu yn erbyn y system gyllido annheg, sef fformiwla Barnett, yn gwybod. Er enghraifft, mae'r Cynulliad hwn yn rhoi lwfans i bob un ohonom o tua 40c y filltir i yrru ein ceir. Mae hwnnw yn rhyw fath o gymhorthdal. A ydych chi yn erbyn hwnnw hefyd? Mae'n gwestiwn dilys i'w ofyn.

Nid ydych yn gallu dibynnu ar eiriau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn aml. Wedi'r cyfan, yr ydym yn gwybod eu bod yn gallu newid eu barn yn rhyfeddol o rwydd ar hyd yn oed y cliraf o faterion. Gadewch i ni gofio geiriau un o'r ychydig aelodau o'r blaid honno ar Ynys Môn, sy'n dweud fel a ganlyn:

'As a Welsh Liberal Democrat county councillor for Anglesey County Council, I am appalled to read in the press Executive Members of the party condemning Anglesey Airport in the manner they are portraying—Anglesey's fragile economy needs this vital linkage with South Wales.'

and cross-portfolio basis. It is significant that sustainable development is at the heart of the economic renewal programme, which was published in July of this year.

As the Minister stated, there is a long way to go, but I am thankful that we have a Government that states the way forward clearly and articulately. As the Minister said, striking a balance between sustainability, the future of the planet, job creation and the renewal the Welsh economy requires leadership and a genuine commitment to the real needs of our people.

I am sorry to say that I cannot praise the Liberal Democrats. It is clear that they have misunderstood the Government's plans. It is undertaking a range of schemes. The air service is one of those, but it is not the only one, as the Liberal Democrats should know. After all, in Kirsty's own constituency, significant improvements are currently being made to the A470. Does she believe, and does her party believe, that those individual schemes are meeting our needs? If they do not believe that they are, are they calling for the abolition of those schemes too? Is this another example of the Liberal Democrats' incredible double standards? Those double standards have now passed into mythology, as everyone who pays VAT, everyone who favours public services over nuclear arms, and everyone who is campaigning against the unfair funding system, the Barnett formula, will know. For example, this Assembly provides every one of us with an allowance of about 40p a mile to drive our cars. That is a kind of subsidy. Are you against that too? It is a reasonable question to ask.

You cannot often depend on the words of the Liberal Democrats. After all, we know that they can change their minds incredibly quickly on even the clearest of issues. Let us bear in mind the words of one of the few members of that party on Anglesey, who says:

Mae'n glir bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ymgyrchu i dynnu'r plwg ar ymdrechion y Llywodraeth hon i hybu economi'r gogledd-orllewin. Efallai bydd pobl y gogledd yn cymryd y fath agwedd i ystyriaeth pan ddaw'r cyfle i bleidleisio flwyddyn nesaf.

It is clear that the Liberal Democrats are campaigning to pull the plug on this Government's efforts to promote the economy of north-west Wales. Perhaps the people of north Wales will take that attitude into consideration when they go to the polls next year.

Mark Isherwood: Under the Government of Wales Act 1998, the National Assembly for Wales had a duty to make a scheme stating how it would promote sustainable development in the exercise of its functions. Eight years later, the Government of Wales Act 2006 placed a statutory duty on Welsh Ministers to make a sustainable development scheme. However, in the annual report being debated today, the Minister talks as if 2009-10 was year zero for starting to use sustainable development as the central organising principle. It has been 11 years since devolution and the Labour-led Welsh Government began, and the Minister's claims that Welsh Ministers have been working towards the principles of wellbeing, social justice and resource efficiency since just 2009-10 ring hollow.

Mark Isherwood: O dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, roedd gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ddyletswydd i wneud cynllun yn nodi sut byddai'n hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy wrth arfer ei swyddogaethau. Wyth mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, rhoes Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 ddyletswydd statudol ar Weinidogion Cymru i wneud cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, yn yr adroddiad blynyddol y dadleuir yn ei gylch heddiw, mae'r Gweinidog yn siarad fel petai 2009-10 oedd y flwyddyn wreiddiol ar gyfer dechrau defnyddio datblygu cynaliadwy yn egwyddor drefnu ganolig. Bu'n 11 mlynedd ers datganoli ac ers i Lywodraeth Cymru ddechrau dan arweinyddiaeth Lafur, ac mae honiadau'r Gweinidog y bu Gweinidogion Cymru'n gweithio tuag at egwyddorion lles, cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac effeithlonrwydd adnoddau ers 2009-10 yn unig yn swnio'n wag.

Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. By this definition, the Welsh Government has failed. The Amsterdam treaty states that balanced and sustainable development should be achieved in particular through the strengthening of economic and social cohesion. Wales has gone backwards in comparison. Instead of embracing social and economic entrepreneurs—the front-line experts on strategic planning and delivery in Wales—these Ministers have pursued a dogmatic, top-down, 'we know best' statism that has put back dreams of a sustainable Wales by another generation.

Datblygu cynaliadwy yw datblygu sy'n bodloni anghenion y presennol heb gyfaddawdu gallu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol i fodloni eu hanghenion eu hunain. Yn ôl y diffiniad hwn, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi methu. Mae cytuniad Amsterdam yn nodi y dylid cyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy a chytbwys yn arbennig drwy gryfhau cydlyniant economaidd a chymdeithasol. Mae Cymru wedi mynd tuag yn ôl o'i chymharu. Yn lle croesawu entrepreneuriaid cymdeithasol ac economaidd—yr arbenigwyr rheng flaen ar gynllunio a chyflenwi strategol yng Nghymru—mae'r Gweinidogion hyn wedi mynd ar drywydd gwladoliaeth ddogmatig, o'r top i'r gwaelod, 'ni sy'n gwybod orau' wedi oedi breuddwydion am Gymru gynaliadwy am genhedlaeth arall.

Housing is key to sustainable community regeneration, but since devolution it has been stripped of resources to fund flawed and unsustainable programmes, which could be

Mae tai'n allweddol i adfywio cymunedau cynaliadwy, ond ers datganoli tynnwyd yr adnoddau oddi ar y sector hwn i ariannu rhaglenni diffygiol ac anghynaliadwy, a

compared to building a shiny new wall while digging up its foundations. As a consequence, the Homes for All Cymru report, 'Blueprint for Action', stated that there is a crisis in Wales. It said that there are not enough decent homes at a cost that people can afford to meet demand, and that it is getting worse because demand is increasing and fewer homes are being provided. It said that it is not a new crisis, although the economic downturn made it worse. The current housing system has been failing for a long time, but the consequences are dire for people's health and wellbeing and the stability of communities in Wales. The annual report on sustainable development states that:

'Work to develop a sustainable housing policy has been ongoing during 2009-10'.

I commend the work of the current Deputy Minister for Housing who, unlike her predecessors, has listened. However, thanks to her inheritance, there is an unsustainable funding black hole in relation to affordable housing for rent or purchase, and housing associations are cutting back on their development plans. The Home Builders Federation states that the social and economic implications for every area are huge, and the Council of Mortgage Lenders has expressed uncertainty over Welsh Government capital investment.

5.10 p.m.

In her report, the Minister states that the Welsh Government's vision of a sustainable Wales is one where Wales has 'a resilient and sustainable economy'. However, it is not sustainable that Wales is at the bottom of the UK economic league table despite Welsh Government spending on economic development per head of population being the highest in the UK. The former North Wales Economic Forum chair and former Welsh Development Agency deputy chair said that Wales led the UK out of the last recession but that this is not the case now.

Prior to being scrapped, the Welsh Development Agency had to report twice a

gellid cymharu hyn ag adeiladu wal newydd sgleiniog ond datgloddio ei sylfeini ar yr un pryd. O ganlyniad, roedd adroddiad Cartrefi i Bawb Cymru, 'Blueprint for Action', yn nodi bod argyfwng yng Nghymru. Roedd yn dweud nad oes digon o gartrefi gweddus am bris y gall pobl ei fforddio i fodloni'r galw a bod y sefyllfa'n gwaethgu am fod y galw'n cynyddu a llai o gartrefi'n cael eu darparu. Dywedodd nad argyfwng newydd mohono, ond bod y dirywiad economaidd wedi'i waethgu. Bu'r system dai gyfredol yn methu ers cryn dipyn, ond mae'r canlyniadau'n resynus i iechyd a lles pobl ac i sefydlogrwydd cymunedau yng Nghymru. Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol am ddatblygu cynaliadwy'n dweud bod:

'Gwaith i ddatblygu polisi tai cynaliadwy wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo yn ystod 2009-10'.

Cymeradwyaf waith y Dirprwy Weinidog presennol dros Dai sydd, yn wahanol i'w rhagflaenwyr, wedi gwrandao. Fodd bynnag, gyda diolch i'w hetifeddiaeth, mae twll du cyllid anghynaliadwy mewn perthynas â thair fforddiadwy i'w rhentu neu brynu, ac mae cymdeithasau tai'n torri'n ôl ar eu cynlluniau datblygu. Dywed y Ffederasiwn Adeiladwyr Cartrefi fod y goblygiadau cymdeithasol ac economaidd i bob ardal yn enfawr, ac mae'r Cyngor Benthycwyr Morgeisi wedi mynegi ansicrwydd am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf Llywodraeth Cymru.

Yn ei hadroddiad, dywed y Gweinidog fod gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Cymru o Gymru gynaliadwy yn un lle mae gan Gymru 'economi gadarn a chynaliadwy'. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n gynaliadwy bod Cymru ar waelod tabl cynghrair economaidd y DU er bod Llywodraeth Cymru'n gwario'r mwyaf y pen yn y DU ar ddatblygu economaidd. Dywedodd cyn-gadeirydd Fforwm Economaidd Gogledd Cymru a chyn-ddirprwy gadeirydd Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru fod Cymru wedi arwain y DU allan o'r dirwasgiad diwethaf ond nid yw hynny'n wir bellach.

Cyn rhoi'r gorau iddo, bu'n rhaid i Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru adrodd

year and publicly announce the fundamentals of the economy—how many jobs had been created, how many had been saved, how many had been lost, and how many new companies there were in Wales and in each sub-region. In his previous role, Rhodri Morgan himself was one of the first to jump on those figures. He also said that greater public accountability was one of the reasons for winding up the WDA. However, now, we do not know whether these figures are even being collated, and it cannot be sustainable that they are no longer publicly announced. The business support sector in Wales has now expressed concern that no-one knows what is happening with the Welsh Government's new economic renewal programme.

It is not sustainable that Wales has the highest level of child poverty in the UK and that, even before the recession, half of the previous improvement to that level had already been lost. As the Wales Council for Voluntary Action states, we must move beyond programme and Government dependency and provide a significant step change in community-owned destiny and delivery, delivering in the community-owned dimension, which has seldom been achieved, in creating a better, more sustainable Welsh society.

Mick Bates: I would like to start by agreeing with the Minister's statement in the foreword, where she says,

'If I were to sum up in one sentence this Annual Report, it would be: I am enormously proud of how much has been achieved so far, but so much more needs to be done.'

I congratulate the Minister on that candid statement and her clear vision and leadership on this agenda during the third Assembly. Without her input, there would certainly have been less progress in the area of sustainable development.

Many changes are about to take place, some of which come from Westminster. I will start by looking at the future of independent scrutiny of the Welsh Assembly

ddwywaith y flwyddyn a chyhoeddi nodweddion sylfaenol yr economi-sawll swydd a grëwyd, sawl un a achubwyd, sawl un a gollwyd, a sawl cwmni newydd a oedd yng Nghymru ac ym mhob isranbarth. Yn ei rôl flaenorol, roedd Rhodri Morgan ei hun ymhlith y cyntaf i ymosod ar y ffigurau hynny. Dywedodd hefyd mai mwy o atebolrwydd cyhoeddus oedd un o'r rhesymau am ddirwyn yr Awdurdod i ben. Fodd bynnag, yn awr, nid ydym yn gwybod a yw'r ffigurau hyn yn cael eu casglu hyd yn oed, ac ni all fod yn gynaliadwy nad ydynt yn cael eu cyhoeddi rhagor. Mae'r sector cymorth busnes yng Nghymru bellach wedi mynegi gofid nad oes neb yn gwybod beth sy'n digwydd gyda rhaglen newydd Llywodraeth Cymru i adnewyddu'r economi.

Nid yw'n gynaliadwy bod gan Gymru'r lefel uchaf o dlodi plant yn y DU a, hyd yn oed cyn y dirwasgiad, fod hanner y gwelliant blaenorol i'r lefel honno wedi'i gollu eisoes. Fel y dywed Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, mae'n rhaid inni symud y tu hwnt i ddibynnu ar raglenni a Llywodraeth a darparu newid sylweddol mewn cyflenwi a thynged sy'n eiddo i'r gymuned, gan ddarparu yn y dimensiwn eiddo cymunedol, na'i cyflawnwyd yn aml o gwbl, i greu cymdeithas well, fwy cynaliadwy i Gymru.

Mick Bates: Hoffwn ddechrau drwy gytuno â datganiad y Gweinidog yn y rhagair, lle mae'n dweud,

'Pe byddwn yn crynhoi mewn un frawddeg yr Adroddiad Blynyddol hwn, dywedwn: Rwy'n sylweddol o falch o faint a gyflawnwyd hyd yma, ond mae angen gwneud llawer mwy.'

Rwy'n llongyfarch y Gweinidog am y datganiad didwyll hwnnw ac am ei gweledigaeth a'i harweinyddiaeth glir ar yr agenda hwn yn ystod y trydydd Cynulliad. Heb ei chyfraniad hi, byddai'n bendant wedi bod llai o gynnydd ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy.

Mae llawer o newidiadau ar fin digwydd, a rhai ohonynt yn dod o San Steffan. Dechreuaf drwy edrych ar ddyfodol craffu annibynnol ar waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Ar hyn

Government's work. At the moment, there are plans to combine the Sustainable Development Commission Wales with the Climate Change Commission for Wales and Cynnal Cymru. That is how I understand it, but perhaps the Minister will correct me on that. It may be a great opportunity to ensure that we provide continuity in the work that has been undertaken by those three bodies.

I make a plea that, as much as there needs to be scrutiny, there needs to be delivery of action. I commend those organisations, and in particular Cynnal Cymru, for the way they have focused on delivery. Those of you who are familiar with Cynnal Cymru's work will know that its networking and membership have meant that it has been a tremendous vehicle for communicating good examples throughout Wales. Whatever the successor body or bodies to those three may be, the connection with civic society should be uppermost in mind when the Minister forms the new way forward. I am particularly keen to see that it is in civic society, rather than another Government quango. One of the great developments has been the Minister's engagement with the voluntary sector throughout Wales. Again, that is an amazing plus point that is set out in the report in many of the case studies.

The second point that I wish to make is that the indicators and data used for those indicators are critical. The Minister's encouraging comments in accepting amendment 2, tabled by the Welsh Conservatives, represent a big step forward. As the Minister will remember, I have long proposed that there should be a single indicator that attempts to bring together all of these numbers and 44 indicators. To me, that was always the index of sustainable economic welfare, which has now been adapted to become a measure known as the genuine progress indicator. If people care to look it up, they will see that it is something used extensively in Canada, and particularly in Alberta. That international dimension is something that sustainable development has given Wales. There is recognition throughout the world of the work that has been done in Wales on sustainable development. That can continue by our looking at a single indicator for sustainable development.

o bryd, mae cynlluniau i gyfuno Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru â Chomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd a Cynnal Cymru. Dyna sut ydw i'n ei deall, ond efallai bydd y Gweinidog yn fy nghywiro ar hynny. Hwyrach y bydd yn gyfle gwych i sicrhau ein bod yn darparu parhad yn y gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan y tri chorff hynny.

Rwy'n pledio bod angen gweithredu, cymaint ag y mae angen craffu. Cymeradwyaf y sefydliadau hynny, ac yn arbennig Cynnal Cymru, am y ffordd y maent wedi canolbwyntio ar gyflenwi. Bydd y rheini ohonoch sy'n gyfarwydd â gwaith Cynnal Cymru yn gwybod bod ei rwydweithio a'i aelodaeth wedi golygu y bu'n gyfrwng rhyfeddol i gyfathrebu enghreifftiau da ledled Cymru. Ni waeth pa gorff neu gyrff a fydd yn ei olynu, dylai'r cysylltiad â chymdeithas ddinesig fod ar flaen y cof pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ffurfio'r ffordd newydd ymlaen. Rwy'n arbennig o awyddus i weld ei fod mewn cymdeithas ddinesig, yn hytrach na chwango Llywodraeth arall. Un o'r datblygiadau gwych fu'r Gweinidog yn ymgysylltu â'r sector gwirfoddol ledled Cymru. Eto, mae hwnnw'n fantais ryfeddol sy'n cael ei nodi yn yr adroddiad yn llawer o'r astudiaethau achos.

Yr ail bwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud yw bod y dangosyddion a'r data a ddefnyddir ar gyfer y dangosyddion hynny'n allweddol. Mae sylwadau calonogol y Gweinidog wrth dderbyn gwelliant 2, a gyflwynwyd gan Geidwadwyr Cymru, yn gam mawr ymlaen. Fel y bydd y Gweinidog yn cofio, rwyf wedi hen gynnig y dylai fod un dangosydd sy'n ceisio dod ynghyd â'r holl rifau hyn a 44 o ddangosyddion. I mi, y mynegai lles economaidd cynaliadwy oedd hwnnw erioed, sydd wedi'i addasu bellach i fod yn ddangosydd a elwir y dangosydd cynnydd gwirioneddol. Os oes awydd ar bobl edrych amdano, gwelant ei fod yn rhywbeth a ddefnyddir yn helaeth yng Nghanaada, ac yn Alberta yn arbennig. Mae'r dimensiwn rhyngwladol hwnnw'n rhywbeth y mae datblygu cynaliadwy wedi'i roi i Gymru. Cydnabyddir ledled y byd y gwaith a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Gall hynny barhau os edrychwn ar un dangosydd ar gyfer datblygu

The reporting and accounting of this will depend greatly on how the Cabinet Ministers look on the reporting of sustainable development within their portfolios. I am sure that the Minister has had some frustrating times when her colleagues have not exactly been as 'evangelical' as she in making sure that they take on board and embed sustainable development within their portfolios. When the Sustainability Committee scrutinised each Government department, it recommended in its report that portfolio responsibilities be linked explicitly to sustainable development. In your actions under this report, Minister, it would still be great to link portfolios and sustainable development actions.

Finally, I turn to the planning system. In the next report, questions will need to be answered about the Infrastructure Planning Committee, which has disappeared in name but remains in every other respect. When you sum up, Minister, I wonder whether you will accept the fact that planning plays an extremely important role in the promotion of sustainable development, and that the strategic national policies and the new planning system that the IPC embodied will have an enormous impact on sustainable development issues in Wales. Other than that, I think that most of us recognise, welcome and applaud your efforts, and I hope that the next Assembly Minister will be someone who can carry on your work with equal vigour and enthusiasm.

The Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing (Jane Davidson): I thank all Members for their contributions.

To pick up on Kirsty's point first, yes, a massive step change does need to be undertaken. If we are to futureproof effectively, we must move at a pace and on a scale that we are not close to yet. That is in the context of realising an ambition for sustainability while making sure that we deliver on our climate change and other policy ambitions within a timescale that is set by science, not necessarily by politics. We

cynaliadwy.

Bydd adrodd a chyfrif hyn yn dibynnu'n helaeth ar y ffordd y bydd y Gweinidogion Cabinet yn edrych ar roi gwybod am ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn eu portffolios. Rwy'n siŵr bod y Gweinidog wedi cael rhai amseroedd llesteiriol pan na fu ei chydweinigion yn union mor 'efengylaidd' â hi o ran sicrhau eu bod yn ystyried ac yn ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy yn eu portffolios. Pan graffodd y Pwyllgor Cynaliadwyedd ar bob adran Llywodraeth, argymhellodd yn ei adroddiad y dylai cyfrifoldebau portffolio gael eu cysylltu'n glir â datblygu cynaliadwy. Yn eich camau o dan yr adroddiad hwn, Weinidog, byddai'n dal yn wych cysylltu portffolios â chamau datblygu cynaliadwy.

Yn olaf, trof at y system gynllunio. Yn yr adroddiad nesaf, bydd angen ateb cwestiynau am y Pwyllgor Cynllunio Seilwaith, sydd wedi diflannu mewn enw ond sy'n parhau ym mhob ffordd arall. Pan fyddwch chi'n crynhoi, Weinidog, tybed a fyddwch chi'n derbyn y ffaith bod cynllunio'n chwarae rhan hynod bwysig mewn hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy, ac y bydd y polisiau cenedlaethol strategol a'r system gynllunio newydd yr oedd y Comisiwn Cynllunio Seilwaith yn ei hymgorffori yn effeithio'n aruthrol ar faterion datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Heblaw hynny, rwy'n credu bod y rhan fwyaf ohonom yn cydnabod, yn croesawu ac yn cymeradwyo eich ymdrechion, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog Cynulliad nesaf yn rhywun a all barhau eich gwaith gyda'r un egni a brwdfrydedd.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai (Jane Davidson): Diolchaf i bob Aelod am ei gyfraniad.

I sôn am bwynt Kirsty yn gyntaf, oes, mae angen cael newid sylweddol aruthrol. Os ydym am baratoi'n effeithiol at y dyfodol, mae'n rhaid inni symud ar gyflymder ac ar raddfa nad ydym eto'n agos atynt. Mae hynny yng nghyd-destun gwireddu uchelgais am gynaliadwyedd ond sicrhau ein bod yn cyflenwi ein huchelgeisiau newid hinsawdd a pholisi eraill mewn amserlen sy'n cael ei gosod gan wyddoniaeth, nid o reidrydd gan

have introduced two innovations this year. First, for the first time, we have had a separate debate on the sustainable development indicators as well as on the annual report. I hope that future Assemblies will continue that innovation so that there is an opportunity to look clearly at the indicators as well as looking clearly across the Government. Secondly, we have developed the reporting and scrutiny by having the Wales Audit Office scrutinise the principle and delivery of sustainability across the Assembly Government. That is the first time that that has happened in Government. It is clearly a model that Assembly Members will wish to support for the future.

There are some major challenges ahead for Wales in particular. On greenhouse gas emissions, we have very heavy industry here, and that has been fully accepted by the Climate Change Commission for Wales. Two days after Corus changed its name to Tata, not one of us in the Chamber wanted to see our delivery affected negatively. We do not want steel that is delivered responsibly in the UK, in Wales, and one of the most environmentally friendly industrial sites in the world to go elsewhere. Therefore, there are major challenges ahead in reducing our greenhouse gas emissions, and we have to reflect on our ability to deliver, which is why it is important that we are extremely firm on our ambitions in those areas where we do have overarching responsibilities. We will be launching our climate change strategy in the next week.

There have been some comments today and in previous debates about how reliable the indicators are. It strikes me that, 11 years down the line, we still find ourselves with four of the indicators—waste, including arisings by disposal; bird populations; long-term changes to soil quality; and housing—having insufficient or no comparable data, and so, as part of the effectiveness review, I anticipate that the sustainable development indicators will be looked at. That work can definitely start now.

Angela made a very important point about the links with biodiversity. That is why we

wleidyddiaeth. Rydym wedi cyflwyno dau arloesiad eleni. Yn gyntaf, am y tro cyntaf, rydym wedi cael dadl ar wahân am y dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy yn ogystal â'r adroddiad blynyddol. Gobeithiaf y bydd Cynulliadau'r dyfodol yn parhau'r arloesiad hwnnw fel bod cyfle i edrych yn glir ar y dangosyddion yn ogystal ag edrych yn glir ar draws y Llywodraeth. Yn ail, rydym wedi datblygu'r broses o adrodd a chraffu drwy gael Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru'n craffu ar egwyddor a chyflenwad cynaliadwyedd ar draws Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Dyna'r tro cyntaf i hynny ddigwydd mewn Llywodraeth. Mae'n amlwg yn fodel y bydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dymuno ei gefnogi at y dyfodol.

Mae rhai heriau mawr ar y gorwel i Gymru'n arbennig. O ran allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr, mae gennym ddiwydiant trwm iawn yma, ac mae Comisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd wedi derbyn hynny'n llawn. Ddeuddydd ar ôl i Corus newid ei enw i Tata, nid oedd ar un ohonom yn y Siambr eisiau gweld effaith negyddol ar ein cyflenwi. Nid oes arnom eisiau i ddur sy'n cael ei gyflenwi'n gyfrifol yn y DU, yng Nghymru, ac yn un o'r safleoedd diwydiannol mwyaf ecogyfeillgar yn y byd, fynd i rywle arall. Felly, mae heriau mawr o'n blaenau i leihau allyriadau nwy tŷ gwydr, ac mae'n rhaid inni fyfyrion ynghylch ein gallu i gyflenwi, sef pam mae'n bwysig inni fod yn gadarn dros ben ar ein huchelgeisiau yn y meysydd hynny lle mae gennym gyfrifoldebau cyffredinol. Byddwn yn lansio ein strategaeth ar y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn yr wythnos nesaf.

Cafwyd rhai sylwadau heddiw ac mewn dadleuon blaenorol ynghylch dibynadwyedd y dangosyddion. Mae'n fy nharo ein bod, 11 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, yn dal yn canfod ein hunain â phedwar o'r dangosyddion—gwastraff, gan gynnwys sgil-gynhyrchion drwy daflu; poblogaethau adar; newidiadau tymor hir yn ansawdd pridd; a thai—heb ddigon neu ddim data cymaradwy, ac felly, yn rhan o'r adolygiad o effeithiolrwydd, rhagwelaf yr edrychir ar y dangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy. Gall y gwaith hwnnw ddechrau'n bendant yn awr.

Gwnaeth Angela bwynt pwysig iawn am y cysylltiadau â bioamrywiaeth. Dyna pam

are looking at the delivery of a natural environment framework to bring the importance of biodiversity to centre stage more than when it was considered in the context of habitats and species.

5.20 p.m.

On the proposition by Mick Bates, Kirsty Williams and Angela to look at bringing together the Sustainable Development Commission UK, Cynnal Cymru and the Climate Change Commission for Wales in a way that builds on the strengths of the existing arrangements and makes them better for the future, we are currently actively engaged in that, although I have no proposition to put before you at this time. It is also important for those organisations to be clear about how they see themselves being most effective in future.

Mark, you did not mention the Arbed scheme, which is in the report. It is the largest scheme of its kind in the United Kingdom. It demonstrates unequivocally the links between economic, social justice and environmental outcomes. It tackles fuel poverty, improves people's lives in their own houses, and it operates on an area basis. I am delighted to say that your colleagues at Westminster are very interested in looking at how well it works, even if you are not. Your contribution to the debate shows that you will not look at those areas in which the Assembly Government has explicitly taken forward this agenda. I hope that all Governments of whatever colour will take those considerations together in policy for the future.

Mick talked about the index of sustainable and economic welfare, and it is critical that the Assembly should be able to support indicators against which it can scrutinise future Ministers. We should carry on delivering on our legal duty, supported by all parties and all Members.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there is an objection. I therefore defer all voting until voting time.

rydym yn edrych ar gyflenwi fframwaith amgylchedd naturiol i ddod â phwysigrwydd bioamrywiaeth i ganol y llwyfan yn fwy na phan gafodd ei ystyried yng nghyd-destun cynefinoedd a rhywogaethau.

O ran y cynigiad gan Mick Bates, Kirsty Williams ac Angela i ystyried dod ynghyd â Chomisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy'r DU, Cynnal Cymru a Chomisiwn Cymru ar y Newid yn yr Hinsawdd mewn ffordd sy'n meithrin cryfderau'r trefniadau presennol ymhellach ac yn eu gwella i'r dyfodol, rydym wrthi'n ystyried hynny, er nad oes gennyf gynigiad i'w gyflwyno ichi ar hyn o bryd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig i'r sefydliadau hynny fod yn glir ynghylch y ffordd yr ystyriant y byddant yn fwyaf effeithiol yn y dyfodol.

Mark, ni soniasoch am gynllun Arbed, sydd yn yr adroddiad. Hwn yw'r cynllun mwyaf o'i fath yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n arddangos yn ddiamwys y cysylltiadau rhwng canlyniadau economaidd, cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol. Mae'n mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd, mae'n gwella bywydau pobl yn eu tai eu hunain, ac mae'n gweithredu fesul ardal. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud bod eich cyd-weinidogion yn San Steffan yn awyddus iawn i archwilio pa mor dda y mae'n gweithio, hyd yn oed os nad ydych chi. Dengys eich cyfraniad at y ddatl na fydddech chi'n edrych ar y meysydd hynny lle mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi mynd â'r agenda hwn yn ei flaen yn benodol. Gobeithiaf y bydd pob Llywodraeth o ba liw bynnag yn ystyried y pethau hynny gyda'i gilydd mewn polisi at y dyfodol.

Siaradodd Mick am y mynegai lles cynaliadwy ac economaidd, ac mae'n holl bwysig y dylai'r Cynulliad allu cefnogi dangosyddion y gall eu defnyddio i graffu ar Weinidogion y dyfodol. Dylem barhau i gyflenwi ein dyletswydd gyfreithiol, wedi'n cefnogi gan bob plaid a phob Aelod.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cynigir cytuno i welliant 1. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf fod. Gohiriaf felly'r holl bleidleisio nes y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4538: O blaid 5, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 26.
Amendment 1 to NDM4538: For 5, Abstain 10, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
German, Veronica
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammed
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Burns, Angela
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Ramsay, Nick

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4538: O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 2 to NDM4538: For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Asghar, Mohammed
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burns, Angela
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Alun
 Davies, Andrew R.T.
 Davies, Paul
 German, Veronica
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Griffiths, Lesley
 Hutt, Jane
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Gareth
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Millar, Darren
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Ramsay, Nick
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Watson, Joyce
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion agreed.*

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 3.
 Amendment 3 not moved.*

Cynnig NDM4538 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn croesawu'r cynnydd a wnaed ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy yn 2009-10 fel y nodwyd yn Adroddiad Blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy a osodwyd gerbron Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar 21 Medi 2010.

Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gymeradwyo argymhelliad Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy Cymru yn Adroddiad Blynyddol 2009-2010 'ddim yn unig yn adrodd ar y cynnydd a wnaed ar y Prif

Motion NDM4538 as amended:

The National Assembly for Wales welcomes the progress made on sustainable development in 2009-10 as set out in the Welsh Assembly Government's Annual Report of the Sustainable Development Scheme, which was laid before the National Assembly for Wales on 21 September 2010.

Calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to endorse the recommendation of the Sustainable Development Commission Wales in the 2009-2010 Annual Report to 'not only report on progress made on the headline

Ddangosyddion Datblygu Cynaliadwy, ond ei fod hefyd yn cynnwys cyfres o fesurau ar effeithiolrwydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ôl ei hamcanion perfformiad ei hun (ar draws Llywodraeth)'. Sustainable Development Indicators, but include also a suite of measurements on the effectiveness of the Welsh Assembly Government against its own performance objectives (across Government)'.

*Cynnig NDM4538 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 35, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 3.
Motion NDM4538 as amended: For 35, Abstain 4, Against 3.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Asghar, Mohammed
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Bourne, Nick
Burns, Angela
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Franks, Chris
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Helen Mary
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Ramsay, Nick
Thomas, Gwenda
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Black, Peter
German, Veronica
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4538 fel y'i diwygiwyd.
Motion NDM4538 as amended agreed.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's business to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ar drafodaethau heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.23 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.23 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 German, Veronica (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)