



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 29 Mehefin 2010  
Tuesday, 29 June 2010**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Teyrngedau i'r Arglwydd Caerwrangon, Peter Walker  
Tributes to Lord Peter Walker of Worcester
- 10 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 39 Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes  
Business Statement and Announcement
- 52 Pwynt of Drefn  
Point of Order
- 54 Datganiad am y Strategaeth Addysg Uwch 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol'  
Statement on the Higher Education 'For Our Future' Strategy
- 80 Datganiad am y Bwrdd Effeithlonrwydd ac Arloesi  
Statement on the Efficiency and Innovation Board
- 101 Datganiad am y Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion  
Statement on the School Effectiveness Framework

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

### **Teyrngedau i'r Arglwydd Caerwrangon, Peter Walker Tributes to Lord Peter Walker of Worcester**

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn yn y Cynulliad. Cyn imi alw'r cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, yr wyf am alw arweinydd yr wrthblaid i dalu teyrnged i'r diweddar Arglwydd Walker, cyn-Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** It was with great sadness that we heard of the death of Lord Walker. Our thoughts are with his widow and family at this sad time. When I was a student at Cambridge, Peter Walker was the patron of what is now the Tory Reform Group. He was also a Minister in Ted Heath's Government. Indeed, he was the first Secretary of State for the Environment; we now take the importance of that portfolio for granted. He was actively and dynamically promoting the sort of Conservatism that is now back in fashion.

I came into close contact with Peter Walker during the Chesterfield by-election in 1984, which was fought on St David's Day. He was then the Secretary of State for Energy. Chesterfield was part of the Derbyshire coalfield, and there were working mines in the constituency. Peter Walker came up to Chesterfield to speak in my support, and was then, as always, good humoured, bright, dynamic and a total master of his brief. As an extremely capable and adept Minister, he was trusted by Margaret Thatcher in a succession of roles—agriculture, energy and Wales—despite the fact that she and he were from different wings of the party. However, they were from remarkably similar backgrounds, and had a relationship of mutual respect. At the time of his retirement from the Cabinet in 1990, which was very much his own choice, only two politicians had served longer in the Cabinet or the shadow Cabinet during the twentieth century—David Lloyd George and Winston Churchill.

It is as Secretary of State for Wales that Peter

**The Presiding Officer:** Order in the Assembly. Before I call questions to the First Minister, I wish to call the leader of the opposition to pay tribute to the late Lord Walker, former Secretary of State for Wales.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** Gyda thristwch mawr y clywsom am farwolaeth yr Arglwydd Walker. Mae ein meddyliau gyda'i weddw a'i deulu ar yr adeg drist hon. Pan oeddwn yn fyfyrwr yng Nghaergrawnt, Peter Walker oedd noddwr yr hyn a elwir bellach yn Tory Reform Group. Yr oedd hefyd yn Weinidog yn Llywodraeth Ted Heath. Yn wir, ef oedd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol cyntaf dros yr Amgylchedd; erbyn hyn yr ydym yn cymryd pwysigrwydd y portffolio hwnnw'n ganiataol. Bu'n weithgar ac yn ddeinamig wrth hyrwyddo'r math o Geidwadaeth sydd bellach yn ôl mewn ffasiwn.

Deuthum i gysylltiad agos â Peter Walker yn ystod isetholiad Chesterfield ym 1984, a ymladdwyd ar Ddydd Gŵyl Ddewi. Yr oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni ar y pryd. Yr oedd Chesterfield yn rhan o faes glo swydd Derby, ac yr oedd pyllau glo gweithiol yn yr etholaeth. Daeth Peter Walker i fyny i Chesterfield i siarad o'm plaid, ac yr oedd bryd hynny, fel bob amser, yn hynaws, yn glyfar, yn ddeinamig ac yn feistr corn ar ei friff. Yn Weinidog hynod o alluog a medrus, ymddiriedodd Margaret Thatcher ynddo mewn sawl swydd olynol—amaeth, ynni a Chymru—er gwaethaf y ffaith ei bod hi ac yntau o wahanol esgyll o'r blaid. Fodd bynnag, deuent o gefndiroedd hynod o debyg, ac yr oedd ganddynt berthynas o barch y naill tuag at y llall. Ar adeg ei ymddeoliad o'r Cabinet ym 1990, a oedd yn ddewis ganddo ef ei hun, dim ond dau wleidydd a oedd wedi gwasanaethu'n hirach yn y Cabinet neu Gabinet yr wrthblaid yn ystod yr ugeinfed ganrif—David Lloyd George a Winston Churchill.

Fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru y cofir

Walker is probably best remembered. Margaret Thatcher was keen to have a dynamic Minister to handle such a wide-ranging brief. She readily agreed to the only condition that Peter Walker laid down—that he be given a free hand to get on with the job in Wales, without interference by the Prime Minister. Mrs Thatcher honoured that bargain. John Major famously relates that the only time he had difficulties setting a departmental budget as Chief Secretary to the Treasury was with Peter Walker, when Peter Walker said, ‘I am holding out for more money; speak to the Prime Minister—she will back me up’. John Major, believing that there was no way in which she would do so, contacted the Prime Minister, only to find out that Margaret Thatcher backed Peter Walker totally on that.

During this time, he fully supported the regeneration of Cardiff bay, which has transformed Cardiff and has provided a major economic boost to the whole region. We can see the result and benefit from that today. Over the years, Peter Walker came to Wales on many occasions, not least to campaign in general and Assembly elections. He was always supportive, and was always handy with good, sound advice. He was rightly proud of his period of office in Wales, which, as I say, was characterised by a dynamic leadership and a succession of private sector successes that were the envy of other parts of the United Kingdom.

He must have been pleased to see the advent of a Conservative Prime Minister with the sort of centrist right-wing agenda of which he would have been proud. He must also have been massively proud to see his son, Robin, win the seat of Worcester, which he had held for so long himself—although on the basis of different boundaries. He was a successful businessman in his own right, a politician with very sensitive political antennae, an accomplished administrator, a kind and generous man, and a true public servant. He will be massively missed in Wales, in the United Kingdom, and more widely.

**Rhodri Morgan:** On behalf of the

Peter Walker orau, mae'n debyg. Yr oedd Margaret Thatcher yn awyddus i gael Gweinidog deinamig i ddelio â briff mor eang. Cytunodd yn fodlon â'r unig amod a fynnodd Peter Walker—sef y câi rwydd hynt i fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith yng Nghymru, heb ymyrraeth gan y Prif Weinidog. Anrhydeddodd Margaret Thatcher y fargen honno. Mae John Major yn hoffi adrodd mai'r unig dro iddo gael anawsterau wrth bennu cyllideb adrannol fel Prif Ysgrifennydd i'r Trysorlys oedd gyda Peter Walker, pan ddywedodd Peter Walker, ‘Yr wyf yn mynnu mwy o arian; siaradwch â'r Prif Weinidog—fe wnaiff hi fy nghefnogi’. Cysylltodd John Major â'r Prif Weinidog, gan gredu nad oedd siawns y gwnâi hi hynny, dim ond i ganfod bod Margaret Thatcher yn cefnogi Peter Walker 100 y cant ar hynny.

Yn ystod yr adeg hon, yr oedd yn llwyr gefnogol i adfywio bae Caerdydd, sydd wedi trawsnewid Caerdydd ac wedi rhoi hwb economaidd mawr i'r rhanbarth cyfan. Gallwn weld y canlyniad a'r budd a ddaeth o hynny heddiw. Dros y blynyddoedd, daeth Peter Walker i Gymru ar sawl achlysur, nid yn lleiaf i ymgyrchu mewn etholiadau cyffredinol a Chynulliad. Yr oedd bob amser yn gefnogol, a bob amser wrth law gyda chynghor da, cadarn. Yr oedd yn falch, gyda chyfiawnhad, o'i gyfnod yn ei swydd yng Nghymru, a nodweddyd, fel y dywedais, gan arweiniad deinamig a llwyddiant ar ôl llwyddiant yn y sector preifat a oedd yn destun eiddigedd i rannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Mae'n siŵr ei fod yn falch o weld dyfodiad Prif Weinidog Ceidwadol gyda'r math o agenda adain dde canolbleidiol y buasai yntau wedi bod mor falch ohoni. Mae'n rhaid ei fod wedi bod yn aruthrol o falch hefyd o weld ei fab, Robin, yn ennill sedd Caerwrangon, yr oedd yntau wedi ei dal gyhyd ei hun—er ar sail ffiniau gwahanol. Yr oedd yn ŵr busnes llwyddiannus yn ei rinwedd ei hun, yn wleidydd a chanddo deimlyddion gwleidyddol tra sensitif, yn weinyddwr medrus, yn ddyn caredig a hael, ac yn wir wasanaethwr cyhoeddus. Bydd colled aruthrol ar ei ôl yng Nghymru, yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a thu hwnt.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Ar ran grŵp Llafur y

Assembly's Labour group, I wish to add some words and personal reminiscences of my own as we send out, as Nick Bourne, the leader of the opposition has done, our heartfelt sympathies to Peter Walker's widow and his five children, including Robin, his successor, with a few interruptions along the way, as Member of Parliament for Worcester.

I remember Peter Walker well, as he was the incoming Secretary of State for Wales when I was the incoming Labour MP for Cardiff West, back in June 1987. We had many disagreements, but we also had many enjoyable conversations. However, what I remember most about him was the unique way in which he combined the duties of being a family man with a large number of children—five, I seem to recall—and the heavy burdens of Cabinet office over 15 years. I used to have an office in 1 Old Palace Yard, roughly opposite the House of Lords, and at about 6.30 p.m. or 7 p.m. most evenings I would see Peter Walker walking past our office to his house next door. Due to the considerable fortune that he had made in insurance broking, he had managed to acquire a property that was the dream house for any politician—1 Abbey Gardens, I seem to recall—with a very long garden, right at the back of Westminster Abbey. If you think of the London-property Monopoly board, Mayfair and Park Lane were the top properties, but if you were a politician, 1 Abbey Gardens, immediately opposite the House of Lords and at the back of Westminster Abbey, knocked anything in Mayfair or Park Lane into a cocked hat. Peter, uniquely, was able to walk home, have dinner with his wife and whichever of his children were at home, go upstairs to read bedtime stories to his youngest children and then go back to the House of Commons for the wind-up speeches and the votes at 10 p.m. and any other late business.

That reminds me of two things about Peter, the first of which is that he had been an exceptionally successful operator and entrepreneur in the private sector. He had got in early, before property prices in London put houses like 1 Abbey Gardens completely out of the reach of even successful millionaire entrepreneurs, as he was. The second thing

Cynulliad, hoffwn ychwanegu ambell air ac atgof personol wrth i ni, fel Nick Bourne, arweinydd yr wrthblaid, anfon ein cydymdeimlad dwysaf at weddw Peter Walker a'i bump o blant, gan gynnwys Robin, ei olynydd, gydag ychydig o ymyriadau ar y ffordd, fel Aelod Seneddol dros Gaerwrangon.

Yr wyf yn cofio Peter Walker yn dda, gan mai ef oedd yn dod i mewn i swydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru pan etholwyd fi yn AS Llafur dros Orllewin Caerdydd, yn ôl ym Mehefin 1987. Cawsom sawl anghytundeb, ond cawsom sawl sgwrs ddifyr hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn a gofias fwyaf amdano oedd y modd unigryw y cyfunodd ddyletswyddau bod yn ddyn teulu a chanddo nifer fawr o blant—pump, os cofias yn iawn—a beichiau trwm swydd yn y Cabinet dros 15 mlynedd. Yr oedd gennyf swyddfa yn 1 Old Palace Yard, gyferbyn â Thŷ'r Arglwyddi'n fras, ac am oddeutu 6.30 p.m. neu 7 p.m. bron bob nos gwelwn Peter Walker yn cerdded heibio i'n swyddfa i'w dŷ y drws nesaf. O ganlyniad i'r ffortiwn sylweddol yr oedd wedi'i wneud wrth frocera yswiriant, yr oedd wedi llwyddo i brynu eiddo a oedd yn dŷ delfrydol i unrhyw wleidydd—1 Abbey Gardens, os cofias yn iawn—gyda gardd hir iawn, yn union y tu cefn i Abaty San Steffan. Os meddyliwch am fwrdd Monopoli eiddo Llundain, Mayfair a Park Lane oedd y ddau eiddo mwyaf gwerthfawr, ond i wleidydd, yr oedd 1 Abbey Gardens, yn union gyferbyn â Thŷ'r Arglwyddi a'r tu cefn i Abaty San Steffan, ganmil gwell nag unrhyw beth ym Mayfair neu Park Lane. Yn unigryw, gallai Peter gerdded adref, cael swper gyda'i wraig a pharai bynnag o'i blant a fyddai gartref, mynd lan lofft i ddarllen storïau amser gwely i'w blant iau ac wedyn mynd yn ôl i Dŷ'r Cyffredin ar gyfer yr areithiau cloi a'r pleidleisio am 10 p.m. ac unrhyw fusnes hwyr arall.

Mae hynny'n fy atgoffa o ddau beth arall am Peter, sef yn gyntaf y bu'n weithredwr a mentwr eithriadol o lwyddiannus yn y sector preifat. Yr oedd wedi cael ei droed i mewn yn gynnar, cyn i brisiau eiddo yn Llundain roi tai fel 1 Abbey Gardens ymhell y tu hwnt i gyrraedd hyd yn oed filiwnyddion mentrus llwyddiannus fel efe. Yr ail beth y mae'n fy

that it reminds me of is his belief in the power of the state. He was a successful entrepreneur and a great believer in the power of the private sector to regenerate, but he also believed that you could use the power of the state to work with the private sector to do that regeneration.

He made one remark that I remember clearly—a remark that was very notable for him, as a native of Gloucester and a passionate rugby fan—in which he said that he had achieved his dream in his three years as Secretary of State for Wales, which was to see the Welsh economy regenerated and English rugby able to humiliate and hammer Wales regularly every year. That did not go down very well across Wales, but, as a native of Gloucester, perhaps that sums him up in many ways.

If Peter Walker had any regrets in 1990, when he retired after 15 years in the Cabinet, one of them may have been that he did not move, as Michael Heseltine did, to challenge Margaret Thatcher for the leadership in 1990. It was widely rumoured in Westminster that he was supposed to run after Anthony Meyer went as the stalking-horse, but, in the end, it was Michael Heseltine who did that. I never knew whether that rumour was true. He does not say what the truth was in his autobiography, *Staying Power*.

His other regret, which is revealed in *Staying Power*, was that he did not manage to land the Toyota car assembly plant for Wales. He was quite convinced that he had Toyota in the palm of his hand and that the company was going to build what is now the Burnaston car assembly plant in Derbyshire in Wales. At the very last moment, Margaret Thatcher called the chief executive of Toyota in and said, 'You are not putting that plant in Wales; you're putting it in Derbyshire, because we owe more to the Union of Democratic Mineworkers of the east midlands than we owe to the National Union of Mineworkers in south Wales. So, put it in Derbyshire'. The Japanese bosses decided that they had to do what they were told. I think that Peter would have liked to have been able to say that he left the Toyota assembly plant in Wales as his legacy. He could not in the end. Of course, he got the engine plant for north Wales as a

atgoffa ohono yw ei gred yng ngrym y wladwriaeth. Yr oedd yn fentrwr llwyddiannus ac yn gredwr mawr yng ngrym y sector preifat i adfywio, ond credai hefyd y gellid defnyddio grym y wladwriaeth i weithio gyda'r sector preifat i wneud yr adfywio hwnnw.

Gwnaeth un sylw a gofiat yn glir—sylw a oedd yn nodedig iawn iddo ef, fel brodor o Gaerloyw a chefnogwr rygbi angerddol—lle dywedodd ei fod wedi cyflawni ei freuddwyd yn ei dair blynedd fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, sef gweld adfywio economi Cymru a bod rygbi Lloegr yn gallu bychanu a rhoi cweir i Gymru'n rheolaidd bob blwyddyn. Ni chafodd hynny dderbyniad da ar draws Cymru, ond, fel brodor o Gaerloyw, efallai fod hynny'n ei grynhoi mewn sawl ffordd.

Os oedd yn edifar gan Peter Walker am unrhyw beth ym 1990, pan ymddeolodd ar ôl 15 mlynedd yn y Cabinet, efallai mai un peth oedd na fu iddo symud, fel y gwnaeth Michael Heseltine, i herio Margaret Thatcher am yr arweinyddiaeth ym 1990. Yr oedd si ar led yn San Steffan ei fod i fod i redeg wedi i Anthony Meyer fynd fel yr ymgeisydd tramgwydd, ond, yn y diwedd, Michael Heseltine a wnaeth hynny. Ni wn a oedd y si honno'n wir. Nid yw'n dweud beth oedd y gwir yn ei hunangofiant, *Staying Power*.

Ei ofid arall, a ddatgelir yn *Staying Power*, oedd na lwyddodd i gael gwaith cydosod ceir Toyota i Gymru. Yr oedd yn gwbl argyhoeddedig fod Toyota ganddo yng nghledd ei law a bod y cwmni'n mynd i adeiladu'r ffatri gydosod ceir sydd bellach yn Burnaston yn swydd Derby, yng Nghymru. Ar y funud olaf un, galwodd Margaret Thatcher brif weithredwr Toyota i mewn a dweud, 'Chewch chi ddim rhoi'r gwaith hwnnw yng Nghymru; rhaid ichi ei roi yn swydd Derby, oherwydd mae arnom fwy i Undeb Glowyr Democraidd dwyrain canolbarth Lloegr nag sydd arnom i Undeb Cenedlaethol y Glowyr yn ne Cymru. Felly, rhowch y gwaith yn Swydd Derby'. Penderfynodd y penaethiaid o Japan fod yn rhaid iddynt ufuddhau. Yr wyf yn meddwl y buasai Peter wedi hoffi gallu dweud ei fod wedi gadael gwaith cydosod Toyota yng Nghymru fel ei etifeddiaeth. Ni allodd yn y

consolation, but that was only one sixth of the size of the assembly plant. Like all politicians, he will have left office with a few regrets, but also having made a massive contribution to public life in Britain and in Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is my pleasure and privilege to join in these tributes on behalf of Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales. As others have said, our thoughts must be with Peter Walker's family at this time. The fact that a person has lived to a great age and made a huge contribution does not make their loss any less grievous to the family when it comes. I am sure that we will all be thinking of them today.

I was not privileged to know Peter Walker personally, so I am speaking as someone who was working in the public sector in Wales at the time, and who saw the benefits of having a Secretary of State who was prepared to think for himself, to do things differently, and was, in our opinion—and I was a special needs teacher at the time—able to protect Wales from some of the worst excesses of the Thatcher Government, given what it was doing elsewhere, in England.

1.40 p.m.

Reference has already been made to his track record on economic development, but what has not yet been mentioned is the pioneering work in social care in Wales that happened under his leadership and with the resources that he managed to protect for Wales. During his time, a pioneering national mental handicap strategy—as it was then called; we would call it a learning disability strategy today—was developed for Wales, and people who had lived their whole lives in hospital settings came to live full and constructive lives in the community as a result. As I understand it, he was very much involved in the leadership of that strategy. He did not simply allow the professionals to get on with it; he actively promoted the work being done. We were going into our second mental handicap strategy, or learning disability strategy, when England and elsewhere in the

diwedd. Wrth gwrs, fe gafodd y gwaith injans i'r gogledd fel gwobr gysur, ond dim ond chweched ran o faint y gwaith cydosod oedd hwnnw. Fel pob gwleidydd, bydd wedi gadael ei swydd yn edifeiriol am ambell beth, ond hefyd wedi gwneud cyfraniad enfawr i fywyd cyhoeddus ym Mhrydain ac yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Pleser a braint i mi yw ymuno yn y teyrngedau hyn ar ran Plaid Cymru. Fel y dywedodd eraill, rhaid i'n meddyliau fod gyda theulu Peter Walker ar yr adeg hon. Nid yw'r ffaith fod rhywun wedi byw'n hen ac wedi gwneud cyfraniad enfawr yn golygu bod eu colli'n ddim llai poenus i'r teulu pan ddaw'r amser. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn i gyd yn meddwl amdanynt heddiw.

Ni chefais y ffrainc o adnabod Peter Walker yn bersonol, felly yr wyf yn siarad fel un a oedd yn gweithio yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar y pryd, ac a welodd fanteision cael Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a oedd yn barod i feddwl drosto'i hun, i wneud pethau mewn ffordd wahanol, ac a oedd, yn ein barn ni—ac yr oeddwn yn athrawes anghenion arbennig ar y pryd—yn gallu gwarchod Cymru rhag rhai o eithafion gwaethaf Llywodraeth Thatcher, o ystyried beth yr oedd yn ei wneud mewn manau eraill, yn Lloegr.

Cyfeiriwyd eisoes at ei record ym maes datblygu economaidd, ond yr hyn nad yw wedi'i grybwyll eto yw'r gwaith arloesol ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru a ddigwyddodd dan ei arweinyddiaeth a chyda'r adnoddau y llwyddodd i'w gwarchod i Gymru. Yn ystod ei gyfnod, datblygwyd strategaeth genedlaethol arloesol ar gyfer anfantais feddyliol—fel y'i gelwid bryd hynny; strategaeth anabled dysgu fyddai ein henw ni arni heddiw—i Gymru, a chafodd pobl a oedd wedi byw eu bywydau i gyd mewn ysbytai fyw bywydau llawn ac adeiladol yn y gymuned yn sgîl hynny. Hyd y deallaf, yr oedd ganddo ran fawr yn arweiniad y strategaeth honno. Nid gadael i'r bobl broffesiynol fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith a wnaeth; aeth ati i hyrwyddo'r gwaith a wneid. Yr oeddem yn cychwyn ar ein hail strategaeth anfantais feddyliol, neu

UK had not had one at all. Therefore, many people throughout Wales who had learning disabilities were able to live lives that they would not otherwise have been able to live, and that legacy of believing in people's right to live independently and their ability to contribute is certainly one that Peter Walker left us.

He was famous for defending the Welsh budget—unlike some other Secretaries of State for Wales whom we could mention. That clearly demonstrates that it is not necessary to be born and brought up in Wales to be a good friend to Wales. Peter Walker was certainly that, and it is fitting that we in the Assembly pay tribute to him today.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** On behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats at the National Assembly for Wales, I join my colleagues in paying tribute to Peter Walker, Lord Walker of Worcester, and expressing our condolences to his widow, his five children and five grandchildren. Undoubtedly, Lord Walker had a long and distinguished parliamentary career as the MP for Worcester from 1961 to 1992, and I am sure that it was a great source of personal pride and joy for him to learn that his son, Robin, had successfully won that seat in this Parliament.

As Helen Mary Jones has just said, in only three years as Secretary of State for Wales, he proved his commitment to Wales on more than one occasion. Taking the battle to his Cabinet colleagues, he was determined and passionate in defence of his ability to do things here in Wales and in defence of our budget. He was a public servant who worked hard to improve the lives of people here in Wales during his short period as Secretary of State for Wales, but also during his long Cabinet career, given the large number of portfolios that he also held.

As I said, on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I send our sincere condolences to his family at this sad and difficult time.

strategaeth anabledd dysgu, pan oedd Lloegr a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig heb gael un o gwbl. Felly, yr oedd llawer o bobl drwy Gymru gyfan a oedd ag anableddau dysgu'n gallu byw bywydau na fuasent wedi gallu eu byw fel arall, ac mae'r etifeddiaeth honno o gredu yn hawl pobl i fyw'n annibynnol a'u gallu i gyfrannu'n sicr yn un a adawodd Peter Walker inni.

Yr oedd yn enwog am amddiffyn y gyllideb Gymreig—yn wahanol i ambell Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru arall y gallem ei enwi. Mae hynny'n dangos yn glir nad oes raid bod wedi'ch geni a'ch magu yng Nghymru i fod yn gyfaill da i Gymru. Dyna oedd Peter Walker yn sicr, ac mae'n addas ein bod ni yn y Cynulliad yn talu teyrnged iddo heddiw.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ymunaf â'm cyd-Aelodau i dalu teyrnged i Peter Walker, yr Arglwydd Walker o Gaerwrangon, a mynegi ein cydymdeimlad i'w weddw, ei bump o blant a'i bump o wyrion. Heb os, cafodd yr Arglwydd Walker yrfa seneddol hir a chlodwiw fel yr AS dros Gaerwrangon o 1961 i 1992, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod yn destun cryn lawenydd a balchder personol iddo wybod bod ei fab, Robin, wedi llwyddo i ennill y sedd honno yn y Senedd hon.

Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones yn awr, mewn cwta dair blynedd fel Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, profodd ei ymrwymiad i Gymru ar fwy nag un achlysur. Gan fynd â'r frwydr at ei gyd-Weinidogion, yr oedd yn benderfynol ac yn angerddol wrth amddiffyn ei allu i wneud pethau yma yng Nghymru ac wrth amddiffyn ein cyllideb. Yr oedd yn was cyhoeddus a weithiodd yn galed i wella bywydau pobl yma yng Nghymru yn ystod ei gyfnod byr yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ond hefyd yn ystod ei yrfa hir yn y Cabinet, o gofio'r nifer fawr o bortffolios a ddaliodd hefyd.

Fel y dywedais, ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, anfonaf ein cydymdeimlad diffuant at ei deulu yn yr adeg drist a dyrys hon.



**Brian Gibbons:** I, too, want to say a few words about Peter Walker. As I was living and working in a mining community when he was Secretary of State for Energy, I know that Peter Walker had acquired a certain reputation, although he was not very much in the front line in that regard—that was led by the Prime Minister and Sir Ian MacGregor and others. However, after the miners' strike, Peter Walker established the Valleys initiative, and, for a brief moment, it offered those who lived in the Valleys the prospect of hope and regeneration in what was otherwise a dismal and desolate future. One of the first projects to get off the ground when the initiative was announced was in Blaengwynfi, where I was working. We had had kept plans for a health centre in the bottom drawer for quite a few years, and so we were able to open the bottom drawer and produce the proposal. Lo and behold, within six to nine months, we were one of the first projects to receive approval as part of that initiative, and we got a brand-new health centre.

Peter Walker came along to open the health centre, but, in the week before that, the police came to Blaengwynfi just to check what kind of reception he would get, seeing as he was the Secretary of State for Energy, and many miners and former miners were living in the community. The event was held in Gwynfi social club. In fact, the community of Blaengwynfi greatly appreciated getting a long-overdue health centre, and attributed that to his decision. Peter Walker was also extremely charming, and, by the time that he left the club, may have persuaded three or four people to vote Conservative for his efforts. I am pleased to say that that deviation did not persist, but, nonetheless, it was a tribute to his charm when he met the people of Blaengwynfi and to that brief interlude of interventionism, which gave hope to Valleys communities. Unfortunately, it did not last too long, but it is part of his legacy and the plaque is still on display in Gwynfi health centre.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank my colleagues for those warm tributes, and add the following on my own behalf. For most of Peter Walker's period as Secretary of State

**Brian Gibbons:** Hoffwn innau hefyd ddweud ychydig eiriau am Peter Walker. Gan fy mod yn byw ac yn gweithio mewn cymuned lofaol pan oedd ef yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni, gwn i Peter Walker gael rhyw fath o enw, er nad oedd i raddau helaeth yn y rheng flaen yn hynny o beth—arweinid honno gan y Prif Weinidog a Syr Ian MacGregor ac eraill. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl streic y glowyr, sefydlodd Peter Walker fenter y Cymoedd, ac, am ennyd fer, fe gynigiodd ragolygon gobaith ac adfywiad i drigolion y Cymoedd mewn dyfodol a oedd fel arall yn dywyll a llwm. Un o'r prosiectau cyntaf i gychwyn pan gyhoeddwyd y fenter oedd ym Mlaengwynfi, lle'r oeddwn i'n gweithio. Yr oeddem wedi cadw cynlluniau ar gyfer canolfan iechyd yn y drôr gwaelod ers rhai blynnyddoedd, ac felly yr oeddem yn gallu agor y drôr gwaelod a chyflwyno'r cynnig. Ac wele, o fewn chwech i naw mis, nyri oedd un o'r prosiectau cyntaf i gael cymeradwyaeth fel rhan o'r fenter honno, a chawsom ganolfan iechyd newydd sbon.

Daeth Peter Walker draw i agor y ganolfan iechyd, ond, yn yr wythnos cyn hynny, daeth yr heddlu i Flaengwynfi i weld sut groeso a gâi, ac yntau'n Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni, gan fod llawer o lowyr a chyn-lowyr yn byw yn y gymuned. Cynhaliwyd y digwyddiad yng nghlwb cymdeithasol Gwynfi. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oedd cymuned Blaengwynfi'n gwerthfawrogi'n fawr eu bod yn cael canolfan iechyd o'r diwedd, gan briodoli hynny i'w benderfyniad ef. Yr oedd Peter Walker yn hynod o ddymunol hefyd, ac, erbyn iddo adael y clwb, hwyrach ei fod wedi perswadio tri neu bedwar o bobl i bleidleisio dros y Ceidwadwyr am ei ymdrechion. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud na pharodd y gwyrriad hwnnw, ond serch hynny, yr oedd yn deyrnged i'w hynawsedd pan gyfarfu â phobl Blaengwynfi ac i'r ysbaid fer honno o ymyriadaeth, a roddodd obaith i gymunedau'r Cymoedd. Yn anffodus, ni pharodd yn hir iawn, ond y mae'n rhan o'i etifeddiaeth ac mae'r plac yn dal ar y wal yng nghanolfan iechyd Gwynfi.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i'm cyd-Aelodau am y teyrngedau twymgalon hynny, ac ychwanegaf y canlynol ar fy rhan fy hun. Am y rhan fwyaf o gyfnod Peter Walker fel

for Wales we were paired for parliamentary purposes, which meant that we could escape to Wales early every Tuesday morning to do rather different things. I remember, however, one thing that we joined in doing and that was to promote Wales as a European region. That, among the other contributions that have been mentioned, was an aim that he certainly pursued with vigour. His work to develop executive devolution and distinctive policy making in Wales brings us to where we are today. As a result of the growth of executive devolution in his time, we now have democratic devolution, and I know for a fact that he appreciated that as well.

Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yr oeddem wedi'n paru at ddibenion seneddol, a olygai y gallem ddianc i Gymru'n gynnar bob bore Mawrth i wneud pethau tra gwahanol. Cofiaf, fodd bynnag, un peth a wnaethom gyda'n gilydd, sef hyrwyddo Cymru fel rhanbarth Ewropeaidd. Yr oedd hynny, ymysg y cyfraniadau eraill sydd wedi'u crybwyll, yn nod yr anelodd ati'n egniïol, yn sicr. Mae ei waith i ddatblygu datganoli gweithredol a llunio polisi ar wahân yng Nghymru'n dod â ni at lle'r ydym heddiw. O ganlyniad i dwf datganoli gweithredol yn ei gyfnod ef, mae gennym bellach ddatganoli democrataidd, a gwn fel ffaith ei fod yn gwerthfawrogi hynny hefyd.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Raising Productivity Levels**

**Q1 David Melding:** Will the First Minister make a statement on raising productivity levels in the Welsh economy? OAQ(3)2994(FM)

**The First Minister (Carwyn Jones):** First, I would like to add my words of condolence to all those expressed this afternoon.

In answer to your question, David, this issue will be addressed in the economic renewal programme that will be published before the summer recess.

**David Melding:** You must have had sight of my supplementary question, First Minister; I congratulate whoever advises you. You will recall that in the spring the UK competitiveness index, published by the University of Wales Institute of Cardiff, listed Wales as the UK's least competitive region. How will that sort of data help to inform the economic renewal programme? It is only through having a more productive and competitive workforce, with many forming their own businesses and expanding small and medium-sized enterprises, that we will see a step change in national welfare that brings us closer to the UK and, indeed, European, average.

### **Codi Lefelau Cynhyrchiant**

**C1 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am godi lefelau cynhyrchiant yn economi Cymru? OAQ(3)2994(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ychwanegu fy ngeiriau cydymdeimlad innau at yr holl rai a fynegwyd y prynhawn yma.

I ateb eich cwestiwn, David, caiff y mater hwn sylw yn y rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi a gyhoeddir cyn gwyliau'r haf.

**David Melding:** Rhaid eich bod wedi cael cipolwg ar fy nghwestiwn atodol, Brif Weinidog; llongyfarchaf bwy bynnag sy'n eich cynghori. Chwi gofiwch i fynegai cystadleurwydd y Deyrnas Unedig, a gyhoeddwyd gan Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru Caerdydd yn y gwanwyn, nodi mai Cymru oedd rhanbarth lleiaf cystadleuol y Deyrnas Unedig. Sut y gwnaiff y math hwnnw o ddata helpu rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi? Dim ond drwy gael gweithlu mwy cynhyrchiol a chystadleuol, gyda llawer yn ffurfio'u busnesau eu hunain ac yn ehangu busnesau bach a chanolig, y cawn weld newid sylweddol yn lles y genedl a ddaw â ni'n nes at gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig ac, yn wir, Ewrop.

**The First Minister:** You must be careful about what is reflected in the glass behind you in the Chamber, David—if only I could see that far.

The use of data and information is crucial when it comes to planning the approach that we should take as a Government to economic development and renewal in the future, and any such information will form a part of the economic renewal programme when it is published soon.

**Gareth Jones:** Brif Weinidog, a fyddech yn cytuno mai'r bygythiad mwyaf i economi Cymru—waeth beth fydd yn digwydd i lefelau cynhyrchu o ganlyniad i'r polisiau di-hid sy'n cael eu gweithredu gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol a'r Democratiaidd Rhyddfrydol—yw'r cwmp yn niferoedd y gweithlu, yn enwedig yn y sector cyhoeddus? Bydd yn gwaethgu os bydd y glymblaid Tori a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r pleidiau gyferbyn yn dal i ddilyn eu polisiau heb yn gyntaf osod mesurau sylweddol yn eu lle i ddarparu ysgogiad sylweddol i dwf yn y sector preifat.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y broblem, wrth gwrs, yw ein bod yn mynd i weld cwmp yn y nifer o bobl sy'n cael eu cyflogi yn y sector gyhoeddus, ac nid oes swyddi yn y sector breifat i'r bobl hynny symud i mewn iddynt. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig i ni fwrw ymlaen gyda'r rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yng Nghymru er mwyn sicrhau bod mwy o swyddi safon uchel ar gael i'r rheiny fydd yn colli eu swyddi yn y sector gyhoeddus.

**Nick Bourne:** I start by offering the congratulations of the Welsh Conservatives—I am sure that you would wish to join in them, First Minister—to Julia Gillard, the new Prime Minister of Australia, who is a Barry girl by birth, and who is now challenging the First Minister for Welsh Labour's highest office holder, I suspect. That is a clear demonstration that someone from Wales, whatever their gender and background, can, through hard work and determination, reach the very top.

1.50 p.m.

First Minister, I wanted to ask you about

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhaid ichi wyllo beth a adlewyrchir yn y gwydr y tu ôl ichi yn y Siambr, David—o na allwn weld mor bell â hynny.

Mae defnyddio data a gwybodaeth yn allweddol i gynllunio sut y dylem ymagweddu fel Llywodraeth tuag at ddatblygu economaidd ac adnewyddu yn y dyfodol, a bydd unrhyw wybodaeth o'r fath yn ffurfio rhan o raglen adfywio'r economi pan gyhoeddir honno'n fuan.

**Gareth Jones:** First Minister, would you agree that the greatest threat to the Welsh economy—whatever happens to productivity levels as a result of the reckless policies that are being implemented by the Conservative and Liberal Democrat Government—is the fall in the numbers of people in the workforce, particularly in the public sector? That will get worse if the Tory and Liberal Democrat coalition and the parties opposite continue to follow their policies without first of all putting significant measures in place to provide a significant stimulus to growth in the private sector.

**The First Minister:** The problem, of course, is that we will see a reduction in the number of people employed in the public sector, and there are no jobs in the private sector for those people to move into. Therefore, it is crucial that we continue with the economic renewal programme in Wales to ensure that there are more high-quality jobs available to those who will lose their jobs in the public sector.

**Nick Bourne:** Dechreuaf drwy gynnig llongyfarchiadau Ceidwadwyr Cymru—yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech chithau ymuno â hwy, Brif Weinidog—i Julia Gillard, Prif Weinidog newydd Awstralia, sy'n ferch a anwyd yn y Barri, ac sydd yn awr yn herio'r Prif Weinidog i fod yn ddeilydd swydd uchaf Llafur Cymru, mae'n debyg gennyf fi. Dyna ddangos yn glir y gall rhywun o Gymru, beth bynnag fo'i ryw a'i gefndir, drwy waith caled a phenderfyniad, gyrraedd y brig uchaf.

Brif Weinidog, yr oedd arnaf eisiau eich holi

declining productivity, based on the latest available statistics, for the period between 2002 and 2008. Government figures show that productivity in Scotland rose, as it did in England, and dropped marginally—by less than 1 per cent—in Northern Ireland, but showed a massive 5.8 per cent drop, to 84 per cent of the UK average, in Wales. What does the First Minister attribute that to? What is he proposing to do to ensure that productivity takes off again?

**The First Minister:** We should be careful with figures that deal with productivity, as they do not provide the whole picture. For example, it is right to say that productivity might reflect particular features of an industry that are not necessarily a cause for concern—for instance, if, for some reason, businesses are operating in less capital-intensive subsectors, measured productivity could be lower even if wages compare well. It is right to say that the difficulties of the past two years, in particular, have been well documented in the Chamber and outside, but we must ensure that productivity continues to improve so that we become an attractive place to invest—something that we have done before—and an attractive place for people to start up new businesses and grow businesses.

**Nick Bourne:** I appreciate the point that you cannot look at statistics in isolation, with just one year's figures, but these were figures from the period between 2002 and 2008. Therefore, they do not take account of the period to which you refer. I come back to the point that productivity fell by nearly 6 per cent in Wales during that time, when it went up in Scotland and England and fell by less than 1 per cent in Northern Ireland. Why is it that the Welsh economy has not been performing, and what are you doing as a result?

**The First Minister:** I come back to the point that I made before. I know that, during the course of today and in previous sessions, I have referred to the economic renewal programme, but it will, when published, represent a fresh look at the way in which we deliver economic development policy in

am gwmp mewn cynhyrchiant, ar sail yr ystadegau diweddaraf sydd ar gael, am y cyfnod rhwng 2002 a 2008. Mae ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yn dangos bod cynhyrchiant yn yr Alban wedi codi, fel y gwnaeth yn Lloegr, a'i fod wedi cwmpo fymryn—llai nag 1 y cant—yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, ond yn dangos cwmp enfawr o 5.8 y cant, i 84 y cant o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig, yng Nghymru. I beth y mae'r Prif Weinidog yn priodoli hynny? Beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud i sicrhau bod cynhyrchiant yn codi eto?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dylem fod yn ofalus gyda ffigurau sy'n ymdrin â chynhyrchiant, gan nad ydynt yn rhoi'r darlun cyfan. Er enghraifft, mae'n gywir dweud y gall cynhyrchiant adlewyrchu nodweddion penodol diwydiant nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn achos pryder—er enghraifft, os yw busnesau, am ryw reswm, yn gweithio mewn is-sectorau llai cyfalaf-ddwys, gallai'r cynhyrchiant a fesurir fod yn is hyd yn oed os yw cyflogau'n cymharu'n dda. Mae'n gywir dweud fod anawsterau'r ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, yn enwedig, wedi'u dogfennu'n dda yn y Siambr a'r tu allan, ond rhaid inni sicrhau bod cynhyrchiant yn dal i wella fel y deawn yn lle deniadol i fuddsoddi ynddo—rhywbeth yr ydym wedi'i wneud o'r blaen—ac yn lle deniadol i bobl gychwyn busnesau newydd a thyfu busnesau.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn deall na ellir edrych ar ystadegau ar eu pen eu hunain, â ffigurau un flwyddyn yn unig, ond ffigurau oedd y rhain am y cyfnod rhwng 2002 a 2008. Felly, nid ydynt yn rhoi sylw i'r cyfnod yr ydych chi'n cyfeirio ato. Dychwelaf at y pwynt fod cynhyrchiant wedi cwmpo bron 6 y cant yng Nghymru yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, tra cododd yn yr Alban a Lloegr a chwmpo llai nag 1 y cant yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Pam nad yw economi Cymru wedi bod yn perfformio, a beth yr ydych yn ei wneud o ganlyniad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dychwelaf at y pwynt a wneuthum o'r blaen. Gwn, yn ystod heddiw ac mewn sesiynau blaenorol, fy mod wedi cyfeirio at y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd, ond pan gaiff ei chyhoeddi, bydd yn olwg newydd ar y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflawni polisi datblygu economaidd yng Nghymru.

Wales. Looking at the issue of improving productivity and, indeed, wages and skill levels, will be a key part of that.

**Nick Bourne:** I am pleased to hear that, although we have waited over two years since the manufacturing strategy was published in England only to find that we will get our strategy as an annex to the forthcoming economic plan. Given the budget's reference to the £900 million tax break for those parts of the United Kingdom away from London, the east and the south-east—which you and Jane Hutt welcomed—getting a national insurance boost, what are we going to be doing to attract businesses to Wales, given that competitive advantage over the prosperous south-east of England?

**The First Minister:** I very much welcome that part of the budget, as it will be of great help in attracting businesses to Wales and in encouraging business growth in Wales. However, we must be vigilant to ensure that there are more business start-ups in Wales. We have not, traditionally, done that well in terms of new businesses and we have not done at all well in terms of small and medium-sized enterprises wanting to grow into bigger companies. The economic renewal programme recognises those issues and will provide a way forward as to how we might tackle that.

**Nick Bourne:** I find myself in the strange, but not unique, position of agreeing with the First Minister, and I am pleased to hear what he said. However, I will address his concern to west Wales and the Valleys, where we have had a particular problem. Productivity has dropped overall in Wales. I do not think that any of us expected that we could possibly qualify for another round of regional structural funds, if there is to be such a round—I hope that there is—but now it seems at least possible that we could qualify, and it is not just a statistical blip. How does the First Minister feel about that, and what is he doing in relation to that worrying position? Although we want the benefit if it is available, we would much rather that west Wales and the Valleys did not qualify for this assistance.

Bydd edrych ar gwestiwn gwella cynhyrchiant ac, yn wir, gyflogau a lefelau sgiliau, yn rhan allweddol o hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae'n dda gennyf glywed hynny, er ein bod wedi aros dros ddwy flynedd ers cyhoeddi'r strategaeth gweithgynhyrchu yn Lloegr dim ond i ganfod y cawn ni ein strategaeth fel atodiad i'r cynllun economaidd sydd i ddod. Yn wyneb cyfeiriad y gyllideb at y £900 miliwn o leihad treth i'r rhannau hynny o'r Deyrnas Unedig i ffwrdd oddi wrth Lundain, dwyrain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr—a groesawyd gennych chi a Jane Hutt—sy'n cael hwb yswiriant cenedlaethol, beth yr ydym ni'n mynd i'w wneud i ddenu busnesau i Gymru, o gofio'r fantais gystadleuol honno dros dde-ddwyrain cyfoethog Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r rhan honno o'r gyllideb yn fawr, gan y bydd o gymorth mawr i ddenu busnesau i Gymru ac i annog twf busnesau yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn wyliadwrus i sicrhau y cychwynnir mwy o fusnesau yng Nghymru. Nid ydym, yn draddodiadol, wedi gwneud cystal â hynny yn nhermau busnesau newydd ac nid ydym wedi gwneud yn dda o gwbl yn nhermau cael busnesau bach a chanolig i fod eisiau tyfu'n gwmnïau mwy. Mae'r rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd yn cydnabod y materion hynny a bydd yn cynnig ffordd ymlaen o ran sut y gallem fynd i'r afael â hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn fy nghael fy hun yn y sefyllfa ryfedd, ond nid unigryw, o gytuno â'r Prif Weinidog, ac yr wyf yn falch o glywed yr hyn a ddywedodd. Fodd bynnag, cyfeiriaf ei sylw at orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, lle bu gennym broblem arbennig. Mae cynhyrchiant wedi cwmpo'n gyffredinol yng Nghymru. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod neb ohonom wedi disgwyl y gallem fod yn gymwys ar gyfer cylch arall o gronfeydd strwythurol rhanbarthol, os oes cylch o'r fath i fod—a gobeithio bod—ond bellach mae'n ymddangos o leiaf yn bosibl y gallem fod yn gymwys, ac nid dim ond herc ystadegol ydyw. Sut mae'r Prif Weinidog yn teimlo ynglŷn â hynny, a beth y mae'n ei wneud ynghylch y sefyllfa bryderus honno? Er bod arnom eisiau'r budd os ydyw ar gael, byddai'n llawer gwell gennym pe na bai

gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn gymwys ar gyfer y cymorth hwn.

**The First Minister:** I agree with you, Nick—I do not want us to qualify either. It is important that we move ahead of where we were before, although transitional arrangements would be very welcome indeed, to give us a soft landing, as it were, if we no longer qualify for structural funds. We must bear in mind that there have been some severe job blows in west Wales and the Valleys over the past two years, and, inevitably, it will take some time to recover from that. We also have the anomaly, which does not exist in other Objective 1 or convergence funding parts of the UK, that many people who live in west Wales and the Valleys work outside the area—many work in Cardiff, for example. If jobs are created in Cardiff, but the people who do those jobs live in, say, Taff's Well, we have this strange anomaly where the GDP of Taff's Well, and therefore west Wales and the Valleys, drops and the GDP of Cardiff increases, even though people have not physically moved and they still have the same amount of money in their pockets. Nevertheless, I want to make it absolutely clear that the aim of this Government is to ensure that we do not qualify for the top level of structural funding from 2013 onwards.

#### Funding for Police Authorities

**Q2 Chris Franks:** Will the First Minister make a statement regarding Welsh Assembly Government funding for police authorities in South Wales Central? OAQ(3)2993(FM)

**The First Minister:** For 2010-11, South Wales Police will receive £84 million in funding from the Welsh Assembly Government. That represents, combined with Home Office police grant funding, a 2.7 per cent increase in core funding compared with the previous financial year.

**Chris Franks:** Budget cuts by the Conservative-Lib Dem coalition in London will mean fewer police officers. That is the warning from the president of the Association of Chief Police Officers, Hugh

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi, Nick—nid oes arnaf finnau eisiau inni fod yn gymwys ychwaith. Mae'n bwysig inni symud ymlaen o'r fan lle'r oeddem gynt, er y byddai trefniadau pontio'n dderbyniol dros ben, inni gael glanio'n esmwyth, fel petai, os nad ydym mwyach yn gymwys i gael arian strwythurol. Rhaid cofio y cafwyd sawl ergyd galed i swyddi yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, ac, yn anochel, fe gymer gryn amser i ddod dros hynny. Mae gennym yr anghysondeb hefyd, nad yw'n bodoli mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig sy'n cael arian Amcan 1 neu gydgyfeirio, fod llawer o bobl sy'n byw yn y gorllewin a'r Cymoedd yn gweithio'r tu allan i'r ardal—mae llawer yn gweithio yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft. Os creir swyddi yng Nghaerdydd, ond bod y bobl sy'n gwneud y swyddi hynny'n byw yn, dyweder, Ffynnon Taf, mae gennym yr anghysondeb od lle bydd cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Ffynnon Taf, ac felly'r gorllewin a'r Cymoedd, yn cwmpo a chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Caerdydd yn cynyddu, er nad yw pobl wedi symud yn gorfforol a bod ganddynt yr un faint o arian yn eu pocedi o hyd. Serch hynny, mae arnaf eisiau datgan yn gwbl glir mai nod y Llywodraeth hon yw sicrhau na fyddwn yn gymwys am y lefel uchaf o arian strwythurol o 2013 ymlaen.

#### Cyllid i Awdurdodau Heddlu

**C2 Chris Franks:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ(3)2993(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Am 2010-11, bydd Heddlu De Cymru'n cael £84 miliwn o gyllid oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae hynny, ynghyd â chyllid grant heddlu'r Swyddfa Gartref, yn gynydd o 2.7 y cant mewn cyllid craidd o gymharu â'r flwyddyn ariannol flaenorol.

**Chris Franks:** Bydd toriadau cyllideb gan glymblaid y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Llundain yn golygu llai o swyddogion heddlu. Dyna'r rhybudd gan lywydd Cymdeithas y Prif Swyddogion

Orde, today. Do you agree that to claim otherwise would be misleading? The South Wales Police Authority has said that it faces difficult decisions because Ministers in London have cut its funding by £2 million. What talks have you had to help Welsh police forces in the light of the UK budget cuts and do you agree with Hugh Orde that, in order to secure safer communities, Welsh police forces will face many challenges to ensure that key services are protected as much as possible?

**The First Minister:** I can inform you that Carl Sargeant meets regularly with the police authorities. I understand that they met last week and this issue, no doubt, arose then. Inevitably, when there are reductions in funding, there is pressure on a service. However, it is important that everything is done to ensure that there is no cut in the number of police officers on the beat. There is no greater deterrent to crime than to see police officers in a particular area. There is no better way of increasing public confidence in safety than ensuring that people can see police officers, either in cars or on foot, in their communities. A reduction in either visible presence would be regrettable.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** First Minister, one of the things that Welsh Assembly Government Ministers have failed to do for the South Wales Police force is to give special recognition of the capital city status of Cardiff. Many times, when I have received briefings from the police, they have referred to the extra duties that they undertake, which have a great economic impact on the city of Cardiff, such as the economic boost that the Armed Forces Day provided over the weekend. What negotiations or discussions are you taking forward as a Government to engage with the concerns of the police about some of those special responsibilities and the ability of the Welsh Assembly Government to make some allowances to meet the costs of those events, as your counterparts in Scotland have done with regard to the capital city status of Edinburgh?

**The First Minister:** It is not our role to fund

Heddlu, Hugh Orde, heddiw. A ydych yn cytuno mai camarweiniol fyddai honni fel arall? Mae Awdurdod Heddlu'r De wedi dweud ei fod yn wynebu penderfyniadau anodd oherwydd bod Gweinidogion yn Llundain wedi cwtdogi £2 filiwn ar ei gyllid. Pa drafodaethau'r ydych chi wedi'u cael i helpu heddluoedd Cymru yn wyneb toriadau cyllideb y Deyrnas Unedig, ac a ydych yn cytuno â Hugh Orde y bydd heddluoedd Cymru, er mwyn sicrhau cymunedau mwy diogel, yn wynebu sawl her i sicrhau y gwarchodir gwasanaethau allweddol gymaint ag sy'n bosibl?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf ddweud wrthyfch fod Carl Sargeant yn cwrdd yn rheolaidd â'r awdurdodau heddlu. Deallaf iddynt gyfarfod yr wythnos ddiwethaf, ac mae'n siŵr fod y mater hwn wedi codi bryd hynny. Yn anochel, pan geir toriadau ariannol, ceir pwysau ar wasanaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig gwneud popeth i sicrhau na chwtdogir nifer y swyddogion heddlu ar y strydoedd. Nid oes dim byd gwell i atal troseddu na gweld heddweision mewn ardal arbennig. Nid oes dim ffordd well o gynyddu hyder y cyhoedd mewn diogelwch na sicrhau y gall pobl weld swyddogion heddlu, un ai mewn ceir neu ar droed, yn eu cymunedau. Gresyn fyddai torri'r naill bresenoldeb gweladwy na'r llall.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Brif Weinidog, un o'r pethau y mae Gweinidogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi methu ei wneud i Heddlu'r De yw rhoi cydnabyddiaeth arbennig i statws prifddinas Caerdydd. Lawer gwaith, wrth imi gael fy mriaffio gan yr heddlu, maent wedi cyfeirio at y dyletswyddau ychwanegol sydd arnynt, a gaiff effaith economaidd fawr ar ddinas Caerdydd, fel yr hwb economaidd a roddodd Diwrnod y Lluoedd Arfog dros y penwythnos. Pa negodi neu drafod yr ydych yn bwrw ymlaen ag ef fel Llywodraeth i ymgysylltu â phryderon yr heddlu ynghylch rhai o'r cyfrifoldebau arbennig hynny, a gallu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud rhai lwfansau i dalu costau'r digwyddiadau hynny, fel y gwnaeth eich cymheiriaid yn yr Alban yng nghyswllt statws prifddinas Caeredin?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid ein swyddogaeth ni

such events. Policing is not devolved in Wales, but it is in Scotland. I agree that South Wales Police has a special responsibility, particularly with regard to the Millennium Stadium and the policing that surrounds events there, for example, the pressures on the police—with which they dealt exceptionally well—on 5 June, when we had a major event at the Millennium Stadium, a major event at the Cardiff City Stadium and a most unwelcome march by a far-right group. The police coped with that admirably. It is important that recognition is given to South Wales Police. I regret that has not been the case in the past, but I hope that it is the case in the future.

**Christine Chapman:** Following on from what other Members have said, First Minister, Labour was committed to protecting front-line police numbers, as cutting the numbers of police on the beat, as you said, can only lead to a rise in the fear of crime, which can have a devastating effect on people's lives, especially older people and families with young children. Do you agree that this is a Conservative-Liberal Democrat budget cut that will hit the vulnerable hardest, destroying their peace of mind and the deterrence that a police presence provides, causing many people in Wales to become prisoners in their own homes?

**The First Minister:** There are two issues that always remain true. First, the fear of crime is always greater than the actual crime level, but, to some extent, that does not matter, because if people's fear of crime is high, it is almost as bad as if the reality matches that fear. Secondly, long sentences do not necessarily prevent crime, but the fear of being caught does. If people who wish to commit crimes take the view that their chances of being caught are reduced, they will be more tempted to commit crime in the future. That is why it is important that we ensure the continued visibility of police officers in our communities, otherwise crime levels will rise, as they did in the 1980s.

2.00 p.m.

yw ariannu digwyddiadau o'r fath. Nid yw plismona wedi'i ddatganoli yng Nghymru, ond y mae yn yr Alban. Cytunaf fod gan Heddlu'r De gyfrifoldeb arbennig, yn enwedig ynghylch Stadiwm y Mileniwm a'r plismona o amgylch digwyddiadau yno, er enghraifft, y pwysau ar yr heddlu—y deliasant yn eithriadol o dda â nhw—ar 5 Mehefin, pryd yr oedd gennym ddigwyddiad mawr yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm, digwyddiad mawr yn Stadiwm Dinas Caerdydd a gorymdaith dra gwrthun gan grŵp asgell dde. Ymdopodd yr heddlu â hynny'n rhyfeddol. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod Heddlu'r De. Mae'n ofid gennyf nad felly y bu yn y gorffennol, ond gobeithiaf mai felly y bydd yn y dyfodol.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn dilyn oddi ar yr hyn y mae Aelodau eraill wedi'i ddweud, Brif Weinidog, yr oedd Llafur wedi ymrwymo i warchod niferoedd heddlu rheng flaen, gan na all cwtogi niferoedd yr heddlu ar y stryd, fel y dywedasoeh, ddim ond arwain at fwy o ofn trosedd, a all gael effaith ddifäol ar fywydau pobl, yn enwedig pobl hŷn a theuluoedd â phlant ifanc. A ydych yn cytuno mai toriad cyllideb yw hwn gan y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a fydd yn taro'r gwan galetaf, gan chwalu eu tawelwch meddwl a'r ataliad y mae presenoldeb heddlu'n ei ddarparu, gan achosi i lawer o bobl yng Nghymru fynd yn garcharorion yn eu cartrefi eu hunain?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae dau fater sydd bob amser yn wir. Yn gyntaf, mae ofn trosedd bob amser yn fwy na gwir lefel troseddu, ond, i raddau, nid oes ots am hynny, oherwydd os yw ofn pobl o drosedd yn uchel, mae hynny bron cynddrwg â phetai'r realiti'n cyd-fynd â'r ofn hwnnw. Yn ail, nid yw dedfrydau maith o reidrwydd yn atal troseddu, ond y mae ofn cael eich dal. Os bydd pobl sy'n troseddu'n meddwl bod llai o siawns iddynt gael eu dal, cânt eu temtio fwy i droseddu yn y dyfodol. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig sicrhau presenoldeb gweledig parhaus swyddogion heddlu yn ein cymunedau, neu bydd lefelau troseddu'n codi, fel y gwnaethant yn y 1980au.



**Band Eang yng Nghefn Gwlad Cymru**

**C3 Nerys Evans:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth band eang yng nghefn gwlad Cymru? OAQ(3)2978(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae darpariaeth band eang yn fater pwysig i bobl Cymru, yn enwedig i'r rhai sy'n byw yng nghefn gwlad, ac i ni fel Llywodraeth. Yr ydym yn cyflwyno mentrau i fynd i'r afael â manau gwan ar gyfer derbyn band eang, ac yn gweithio gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i sicrhau bod band eang yn cael ei gyflwyno i bob rhan o Gymru.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch am eich ateb, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn rhannu fy siom bod y Llywodraeth newydd yn Llundain wedi cymryd cam yn ôl ar yr ymrwymiad i ymestyn a datblygu band eang dros y Deyrnas Unedig. Fel y gwyddom, os ydym yn gadael y mater hwn i'r farchnad, fel sy'n ganolog i ideoleg y Ceidwadwyr, bydd Cymru yn colli allan, yn enwedig cefn gwlad Cymru.

Mae hynny'n wrthyferbyniad llwyr i bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, o dan arweiniad Ieuan Wyn Jones, sy'n datblygu cynllun i gael gwared ar fannau gwan, ac edrychaf ymlaen at y cyhoeddiad ynghylch arian Ewropeaidd yn yr wythnosau nesaf. Wrth i chi edrych ar fannau gwan, a allwch hefyd gadarnhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn edrych i ddatblygu band eang i'r genhedlaeth nesaf oherwydd bod hynny'n arf pwysig i'r economi dros Gymru gyfan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae dwy sialens i ni yn hyn o beth. Y cyntaf yw sicrhau bod band eang cyflym ar gael dros Gymru gyfan a'r ail yw sicrhau bod band eang symudol ar gael yn rhan helaeth o'r wlad. Mae'n bwysig dros ben fod hyn yn digwydd i'n galluogi i dyfu'r economi yn y dyfodol. Mae'n siom gweld bod y cynlluniau i greu cronfa arian er mwyn sicrhau bod band eang ar gael mewn ardaloedd gwledig wedi'u dileu. Nid wyf yn credu bod cynlluniau go iawn ar gael a fydd yn sicrhau y bydd band eang yn cael ei gyflwyno i bob rhan o Gymru; nid oes arian ar gael ar hyn o bryd. Gwn na fydd y

**Broadband in Rural Wales**

**Q3 Nerys Evans:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of broadband in rural Wales? OAQ(3)2978(FM)

**The First Minister:** The provision of broadband is an important issue for the people of Wales, particularly to those in rural areas, and to us as a Government. We are introducing initiatives to address not spots, and working with the United Kingdom Government to ensure that the roll-out of broadband reaches every part of Wales.

**Nerys Evans:** Thanks for your reply, First Minister. I am sure that you share my disappointment that the new Government in London has taken a step back on the commitment to extend and develop broadband across the United Kingdom. As we know, if we leave this matter to the market—an idea that is central to Conservative ideology—Wales will lose out, especially rural Wales.

That is in sharp contrast to the policy of the Assembly Government, led by Ieuan Wyn Jones, who is developing a plan to get rid of not spots, and I look forward to the announcement on European funding in the coming weeks. As you look at not spots, can you also confirm that the Assembly Government is looking to develop next-generation broadband as it is an important tool for the economy across Wales as a whole?

**The First Minister:** There are two challenges for us in this regard. The first is to ensure that high-speed broadband is available throughout Wales and the second is to ensure that mobile broadband is available across the majority of the country. It is extremely important that this takes place so that we are able to grow the economy in future. It is disappointing that plans to create a fund to ensure that broadband is available in rural areas have been rejected. I do not believe that real schemes that will ensure that broadband is rolled out to all parts of Wales are available; there is no money available at

farchnad yn gallu gwneud hynny yng Nghymru, felly mae'n bwysig bod Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn dweud ar unwaith ym mha ffordd y bydd yn sicrhau'r arian i gyflwyno band eang nid yn unig i gefn gwlad Cymru ond i'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ei chyfanrwydd. I'm meddwl i, nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi gwneud hynny hyd yma.

**William Graham:** First Minister, I have raised with you and your predecessor the fact that a community between Newport and Cardiff, which are two of our largest cities, still cannot receive broadband. Although I welcome the delivering digital inclusion study, it does not seem to take account of the fact that an enterprising way of improving geographical broadband coverage is the use of wireless broadband that is beamed from unused radio frequencies. Will you commission a study into seeing how that could be cost-effective, particularly in rural areas?

**The First Minister:** It is right to say that not all rural areas will be able to receive land-based broadband services. There are other ways of delivering broadband, of which mobile broadband is one, but there are significant areas in Wales where mobile broadband does not exist. That comes back to the problem that we cannot expect the free market to resolve the problem of broadband coverage in Wales. That will happen in bigger urban centres, but it will not happen in some rural areas or in some areas that are close to urban centres but are in themselves rural.

The difficulty that I have with the present plans of the UK Government is that what was clear—in other words, the raising of a levy to pay for broadband across the UK—has now become unclear, because those plans have gone. Even though I read of plans to use the television licence fee as a way of raising money for broadband delivery across the whole of the UK, I am far from convinced that that will raise enough money to do so. We cannot afford to be left behind in Wales and neither can any rural area in the UK. Therefore, it is crucial that the UK Government outlines exactly how it plans to ensure that broadband will reach those parts of the UK that the market will not reach.

present. I know that the market cannot do that in Wales, so it is important that the United Kingdom Government says immediately how it will secure funds to deliver broadband not only to rural Wales, but to the United Kingdom as a whole. To my mind, the Government has not done that as yet.

**William Graham:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf wedi sôn wrthyh chi a'ch rhagflaenydd am y ffaith fod cymuned rhwng Casnewydd a Chaerdydd, dwy o'n dinasoedd mwyaf, yn dal i fethu derbyn band eang. Er fy mod yn croesawu'r astudiaeth sicrhau cynhwysiad digidol, nid yw fel pe bai'n ystyried y ffaith mai un ffordd ddyfeisgar o wella darpariaeth band eang yn ddaeryddol yw defnyddio band eang diwifr a belydrir o amleddau radio segur. A wnewch chi gomisiynu astudiaeth i weld sut y gallai hynny fod yn gost-effeithiol, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n gywir dweud nad pob ardal wledig fydd yn gallu derbyn gwasanaethau band eang ar dir. Y mae ffyrdd eraill o gyflenwi band eang, a band eang symudol yn un ohonynt, ond y mae ardaloedd sylweddol yng Nghymru lle nad oes band eang symudol. Daw hynny'n ôl at y broblem na allwn ddisgwyl i'r farchnad rydd ddatrys problem derbyniad band eang yng Nghymru. Fe wnaiff hynny ddigwydd mewn canolfannau trefol mawr, ond nid mewn rhai ardaloedd gwledig nac mewn rhai ardaloedd sy'n agos at ganolfannau trefol ond sydd yn eu hanfod yn wledig.

Yr anhawster sydd gennyf gyda chynlluniau presennol Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yw bod yr hyn a oedd yn glir—hynny yw, codi lefi i dalu am fand eang ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig—erbyn hyn yn aneglur, gan fod y cynlluniau hynny wedi mynd. Er imi ddarllen am gynlluniau i ddefnyddio ffi'r drwydded deledu fel modd i godi arian ar gyfer darparu band eang dros y Deyrnas Unedig i gyd, nid wyf wedi fy narbwylllo o bell ffordd y gwnaiff hynny godi digon o arian i wneud hynny. Ni allwn fforddio cael ein gadael ar ôl yng Nghymru nac unrhyw ardal wledig arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Felly, mae'n hanfodol i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig amlinellu'n union sut y mae'n bwriadu sicrhau y bydd

band eang yn cyrraedd y rhannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig na chyrraedd gan y farchnad.

**Joyce Watson:** I will take this opportunity to highlight the damage that the Westminster coalition's scrapping of the 50p levy to introduce superfast broadband will have on rural businesses. I am currently dealing with a considerable number of cases across the Mid and West Wales region concerning difficulties with business delivery relating to people who were relying on the Labour Party's proposals to help secure their future. Moreover, the scrapping of the levy and the subsequent lack of provision will do nothing to attract big businesses to rural communities. Do you agree that the scrapping of the levy was a highly damaging blow to rural Wales?

**The First Minister:** It is damaging because nothing practical, to my mind, has been proposed in its place. It is clear that the proposed licence fee scheme will not raise enough money to plug the funding gap that has been identified to support the roll-out of next-generation broadband across the UK. We need to aim high and ensure that we are not looking at a basic broadband service, but superfast broadband across the whole of Wales in the years to come. We, as a Government, are now exploring the matter of next-generation broadband as part of the ongoing delivery of a digital Wales framework.

**Eleanor Burnham:** You have had quite a long time to discuss the issues, but lots of people are still having difficulties. Apparently, BT is a profitable global company, and has had your assistance, yet it has not come up with the goods for many people. I have had a letter from a company—I hope that I am allowed to mention it—called BeyonDSL.net Ltd, which tells me that, for the cost quoted by BT to a single pensioner, it can connect 500 sites anywhere in the country within days. I am not advocating the use of this company, but just repeating what it has told me. The kit cost £299.99. Despite my frivolity, I wondered if you would like to have the details so that you can help a few more of those people in dire straits trying to run businesses with slow broadband or no broadband at all.

**Joyce Watson:** Cymeraf y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at y niwed a wneir i fusnesau gwledig gan fwriad clymblaid San Steffan i ddiddymu'r lefi 50c i gyflwyno band eang cyflym iawn. Yr wyf yn delio ar hyn o bryd â nifer sylweddol o achosion ar draws rhanbarth y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin ynglŷn ag anawsterau cyflawni busnes yng nghyswllt pobl a oedd yn dibynnu ar gynigion y Blaid Lafur i helpu sicrhau eu dyfodol. Ar ben hynny, ni fydd diddymu'r lefi a'r diffyg darpariaeth yn sgîl hynny'n gwneud dim i ddenu busnesau mawr i gymunedau gwledig. A gytunwch fod diddymu'r lefi'n ergyd hynod o niweidiol i'r Gymru wledig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n niweidiol am nad oes dim byd ymarferol, hyd y gwelaf fi, wedi'i gynnig yn ei le. Mae'n amlwg na wnaiff y cynllun ffi trwydded arfaethedig ddim codi digon o arian i lenwi'r bwlch ariannu sydd wedi'i nodi i gynnal cyflwyno band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae angen inni anelu'n uchel a sicrhau nad ydym yn edrych ar wasanaeth band eang sylfaenol, ond band eang tra chyflym ar draws Cymru gyfan yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth, wrthi'n archwilio pwnc band eang y genhedlaeth nesaf fel rhan o gyflawniad parhaus fframwaith Cymru ddigidol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr ydych wedi cael amser go faith i drafod y problemau, ond mae llawer o bobl yn dal i gael trafferthion. Cwmni byd-eang proffidiol yw BT, mae'n debyg, ac mae wedi cael eich cymorth, eto nid yw wedi cyflenwi anghenion llawer o bobl. Cefais lythyr oddi wrth gwmi—gobeithio fy mod yn cael ei enwi—o'r enw BeyonDSL.net Ltd, a ddywed wrthyf, am y gost a ddyfynnir gan BT i un pensynwr, y gall gysylltu 500 safle yn unrhyw le yn y wlad o fewn dyddiau. Nid wyf yn argymhell defnyddio'r cwmni hwn, dim ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedodd wrthyf. Mae'r cyfarpar yn costio £299.99. Er gwaethaf fy ngwamalrwydd, tybed a hoffech gael y manylion fel y gallwch helpu ychydig mwy o'r bobl hynny sydd mewn dyfroedd dyfnion yn ceisio rhedeg busnesau gyda band eang

araf neu heb ddim band eang o gwbl.

**The First Minister:** I do not believe for one moment that that company plans to cover the whole of Wales with broadband. If it is saying that it can do that, I would be interested to find out about that. The problem is that BT, like other telecoms operators, is a private company, and it will only expand into an area where it can make money. It will not provide a service that will lose money; that is not what private companies do. That is why it is so important to ensure that public funding is available from Government—to ensure that where the market cannot make money, the Government provides the service for people. We know full well that broadband access is the twenty-first century equivalent of railway access in the nineteenth century, when, if you could not get a train, you were left behind. We have to ensure that that does not happen in the twenty-first century regarding broadband in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** You will be aware of the recent cuts to service hours in three NatWest branches in Montgomeryshire. Customers are being urged to sign up to online banking, a service often taken for granted, but in many rural areas, as you have just heard, and know yourself, a reliable internet connection is not a reality. Many individuals and businesses cannot get an internet connection at all, and those who can often suffer from an unreliable connection. That in itself poses a threat to accessibility and security. Would you undertake to have discussions with businesses like NatWest about their plans, so that the Welsh Government can target the broadband services needed in rural Wales to help people bank online as these branches close, as well as helping them to access other online services that are not available in rural communities, thus lifting them from being second-class communities with no internet service to ones that equal urban Wales?

**The First Minister:** You are quite right, Mick, to point out the difficulties of broadband coverage in much of rural Wales. However, you then have to ask your

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn credu am un eiliad fod y cwmni hwnnw'n bwriadu darparu band eang i Gymru gyfan. Os yw'n dweud y gall wneud hynny, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn cael gwybod am hynny. Y broblem yw bod BT, fel cwmnïau telathrebu eraill, yn gwmni preifat, ac ni wnaiff ond ehangu i mewn i ardal lle gall wneud arian. Ni wnaiff ddarparu gwasanaeth sy'n colli arian; nid dyna beth a wna cwmnïau preifat. Dyna pam y mae mor bwysig sicrhau bod arian cyhoeddus ar gael oddi wrth y Llywodraeth—i sicrhau lle na all y farchnad wneud arian, bod y Llywodraeth yn darparu'r gwasanaeth i bobl. Gwyddom yn iawn mai mynediad band eang yw'r hyn sy'n cyfateb yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain i fynediad at reilffyrdd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, pryd y caech eich gadael ar ôl os na allech gael trê. Rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw hynny'n digwydd yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yng nghyswllt band eang yng Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r toriadau diweddar yn oriau gwasanaeth tair cangen NatWest yn Sir Drefaldwyn. Caiff cwsmeriaid eu hannog i fancio ar y we, gwasanaeth a gymerir yn ganiataol yn aml, ond mewn llawer o ardaloedd gwledig, fel yr ydych newydd glywed, ac fel y gwyddoch eich hun, nid yw cysylltiad dibynadwy â'r rhyngwyd yn realiti. Mae llawer o unigolion a busnesau'n methu cael cysylltiad rhyngwyd o gwbl, ac mae'r rhai sy'n gallu'n aml yn dioddef o gysylltiad annibynadwy. Mae hynny ynddo'i hun yn fygythiad i hygyrchedd a diogelwch. A ymgymerwch i gynnal trafodaethau gyda busnesau fel NatWest am eu cynlluniau, fel y gall Llywodraeth Cymru dargedu'r gwasanaethau band eang y mae eu hangen yn y Gymru wledig i helpu pobl i fancio ar-lein wrth i'r canghennau hyn gau, yn ogystal â'u helpu i gael mynediad at wasanaethau ar-lein eraill nad ydynt ar gael mewn cymunedau gwledig, i'w codi o fod yn gymunedau ail ddo-barth heb wasanaeth rhyngwyd i rai sy'n gydradd â'r Gymru drefol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, Mick, pan nodwch drafferthion darparu band eang mewn rhan helaeth o'r Gymru wledig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi ofyn wedyn

colleagues at Westminster why they want to scrap the broadband levy. That would have raised money to plug the gap that you have identified. There is no way that NatWest will do it, or a commercial company; the broadband levy would have done it, and so that is a question that you must ask your colleagues at Westminster.

#### **The Leaders of Other Devolved Nations**

**Q4 Alun Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his discussions with the leaders of other devolved nations in the UK? OAQ(3)2979(FM)

**The First Minister:** I have regular discussions on a range of important topics with the leaders of the other devolved administrations.

**Alun Davies:** Thank you very much for that response, First Minister. I am sure that, at the moment, your discussions with the other devolved nations focus on funding and finance issues. We now know that last week's budget was one of the most regressive in history, with the poorest 10 per cent losing over 21 per cent of their household income. We understand now why it was called an 'emergency budget': it will cause an emergency in some of the poorest communities up and down the United Kingdom. Wales will be disproportionately affected by this budget. Will you take advantage of the opportunity next week, when the final report of the Holtham commission is published, to work with the leaders of the other devolved nations to ensure that we all have fair play, and particularly that Wales does not continue to lose out as a result of the policies of the UK Government?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** What was disappointing about the budget was that mention was made of the Calman commission in Scotland and the fossil fuel levy—that was missed, to some extent—which potentially releases several tens of millions of pounds to Scotland. Northern Ireland was mentioned, but Wales was not.

i'ch cyfeillion yn San Steffan pam y maent am ddiddymu'r lefi band eang. Buasai hynny wedi codi arian i gau'r bwlch yr ydych wedi'i nodi. Nid oes dim gobaith y gwnaiff NatWest hyn, na chwmmi masnachol; buasai'r lefi band eang wedi'i wneud, ac felly dyna gwestiwn y mae'n rhaid ichi ei ofyn i'ch cyfeillion yn San Steffan.

#### **Arweinwyr Gwledydd Datganoledig Eraill**

**C4 Alun Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei drafodaethau gydag arweinwyr gwledydd datganoledig eraill y DU? OAQ(3)2979(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn trafod ystod o faterion pwysig yn rheolaidd gydag arweinwyr y gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill.

**Alun Davies:** Diolch yn fawr am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod eich trafodaethau gyda'r gwledydd datganoledig eraill yn canolbwyntio ar faterion ariannu a chyllid ar hyn o bryd. Gwyddom yn awr fod cyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf yn un o'r rhai mwyaf atchweliadol mewn hanes, gyda'r 10 y cant tlotaf yn colli dros 21 y cant o incwm y cartref. Deallwn bellach pam y'i galwyd yn 'gyllideb argyfwng': bydd yn achosi argyfwng yn rhai o'r cymunedau tlotaf ar hyd a lled y Deyrnas Unedig. Effeithir yn anghymesur ar Gymru gan y gyllideb hon. A fanteisiwch chi ar y cyfle'r wythnos nesaf, pan gyhoeddir adroddiad terfynol comisiwn Holtham, i weithio gydag arweinwyr y gwledydd datganoledig eraill i sicrhau y caiff pawb chwarae teg, ac yn enwedig na fydd Cymru'n parhau i fod ar ei cholled o ganlyniad i bolisiau Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr hyn a oedd yn siomedig am y gyllideb oedd y crybwyllwyd comisiwn Calman yn yr Alban a'r lefi ar danwydd ffosil—collwyd hynny, i ryw raddau—a allai ryddhau degau o filiynau o bunnoedd i'r Alban. Soniwyd am Ogledd Iwerddon, ond nid am Gymru.

I was not expecting the UK Government to accept the Holtham commission's proposals at this stage—I understand that these things take time—however, it would have been useful to have heard the Holtham commission mentioned. It would also have been useful for a Barnett floor to have been put in for expenditure. Unfortunately, neither of those things was in the budget. The floor would not have cost anything, which is the most unfortunate thing here.

It is also important that we continue to press the issue of Wales's funding, although it is clear from the coalition agreement that if Wales wishes to receive more money, that is dependent on a 'yes' vote in any future referendum. That is the way that it is phrased in the coalition agreement and that is, perhaps, a matter for another day. We will continue to press for fairer funding for Wales, as encapsulated in the proposals put forward by the Holtham commission.

**Nick Ramsay:** I find myself in the rare position of agreeing with something that Alun Davies said. I also do not want Wales to continue to lose out in terms of the way that it is treated by the Westminster Government, as it has been losing out over the last 10 years of mismanagement at Westminster level. I am pleased that Alun Davies is on board in thinking that.

First Minister, there is now a growing consensus—within this Chamber, and beyond—that the Barnett formula should be replaced with a needs-based assessment, and I am delighted that your Government has come on board in agreeing with that, certainly since 7 May anyway. Like you, I want to see a fairer funding formula for Wales but, as we know, a fairer funding formula for Wales will see another area of the United Kingdom, namely Scotland, lose in the region of £4 billion according to some assessments, so that a fairer funding formula can be arranged for the rest of the UK. In the discussions that you have had with your counterparts in Scotland, have you managed to succeed in gaining their agreement to that fairer funding formula?

**The First Minister:** Scotland's interest is different to ours when it comes to the Barnett

Nid oeddwn yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dderbyn cynigion comisiwn Holtham ar hyn o bryd—yr wyf yn deall bod y pethau hyn yn cymryd amser—ond buasai wedi bod yn fuddiol clywed sôn am gomisiwn Holtham. Buasai wedi bod yn fuddiol hefyd gosod llawr Barnett ar gyfer gwariant. Yn anffodus, nid oedd y naill na'r llall o'r rheiny yn y gyllideb. Ni fuasai'r llawr wedi costio dim, a dyna'r peth mwyaf anffodus yma.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn dal i bwysio ar fater cyllid Cymru, er ei bod yn amlwg o gytundeb y glymblaid os yw Cymru'n dymuno cael mwy o arian, bod hynny'n ddibynnol ar bleidlais 'ie' mewn unrhyw refferendwm a ddaw. Dyna'r ffordd y mae wedi'i eirio yn y cytundeb clymblaid, a mater i ddiwrnod arall yw hynny, efallai. Fe barhawn i bwysio am gyllid tecach i Gymru, fel y'i crynhoir yn y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan gomisiwn Holtham.

**Nick Ramsay:** Fe'm caf fy hun yn y sefyllfa brin o gytuno â rhywbeth a ddywedodd Alun Davies. Nid oes arnaf finnau ychwaith eisiau i Gymru barhau i fod ar ei cholled o ran y ffordd y caiff ei thrin gan Lywodraeth San Steffan, fel y bu ar ei cholled dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf o gamreoli ar lefel San Steffan. Yr wyf yn falch fod Alun Davies o'r un farn yn hynny o beth.

Brif Weinidog, y mae consensws cynyddol erbyn hyn—o fewn y Siambr hon, a'r tu hwnt—y dylai asesiad ar sail anghenion gymryd lle fformiwla Barnett, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd fod eich Llywodraeth wedi dod i gytuno â hynny, yn sicr ers 7 Mai, beth bynnag. Fel chi, mae arnaf finnau eisiau gweld fformiwla ariannu decach i Gymru ond, fel y gwyddom, bydd fformiwla ariannu decach i Gymru'n golygu bod ardal arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig, sef yr Alban, yn colli oddeutu £4 biliwn yn ôl rhai asesiadau, er mwyn trefnu fformiwla ariannu decach i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn y trafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'ch cymheiriaid yn yr Alban, a ydych wedi llwyddo i'w cael i gytuno ar y fformiwla ariannu decach honno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae budd yr Alban yn wahanol i'n budd ni o safbwynt fformiwla

formula. Scotland will fight to keep it; we will not. We do not share every issue of common interest with Scotland. The point is fairness. Scotland is funded well beyond the level at which it should be, given its gross domestic product, for example; Wales is underfunded. Surely, the argument is that we should be looking for a fair funding formula across the whole of the UK.

If you look at the Welsh Labour manifesto, you will see that it contained a commitment to fairer funding. Therefore, the suggestion that this was somehow ignored by the previous Government does not ring true. Bear in mind, as well, that there were a number of debates in this Chamber about the need to reform the Barnett formula, but there was never a body of evidence in place that pointed to what would happen if the formula was reformed. That is why the Holtham commission was set up and that is why that we are now in a position where we can present sound evidence to show that Wales is underfunded to the tune of around £300 million per year. It is a shame that that message has not yet percolated to the bowels of Whitehall.

**David Lloyd:** Gan ddilyn yr un trywydd, fel yr ydych wedi ei ddweud eisoes, mae symud ar yr agenda cyllido yn yr Alban, a gwyddom hefyd fod yr Alban yn cael rhyw £33 biliwn y flwyddyn o dan fformiwla Barnett, a Chymru'n cael rhyw £15.7 biliwn y flwyddyn. Mae hyd yn oed Gogledd Iwerddon ar hyn o bryd yn cael mwy o arian na Chymru, a hynny am wasanaethau cyffredin, heb gyfrif gwasanaethau amddiffyn. Mae bloc Gogledd Iwerddon yn fwy na'n bloc ni ar hyn o bryd. Felly, o'ch trafodaethau ag arweinyddion gwledydd datganoledig eraill am ariannu ein gwledydd, a ydych yn cael y teimlad bod unrhyw siawns o gael symudiad ar agenda Holtham er mwyn cael gwared ar fformiwla Barnett a chael system ariannu deg i Gymru? Cymru sydd ar ei hôl hi ar hyn o bryd gan fod pob gwlad arall yn cael mwy o arian.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi cael yr argraff fod yr Alban eisiau gweld unrhyw newid i fformiwla Barnett. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Alban mewn sefyllfa lle gall fanteisio

Barnett. Bydd yr Alban yn brwydro i'w chadw; nid felly ni. Nid ydym yn rhannu pob pwnc o fudd cyffredin â'r Alban. Tegwch yw'r pwynt. Caiff yr Alban gyllid ymhell y tu hwnt i'r lefel y dylai ei chael, o ystyried ei chynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth, er enghraifft; mae Cymru wedi'i thanariannu. Siawns mai'r ddadl yw y dylem fod yn edrych am fformiwla ariannu deg ar draws gwledydd Prydain i gyd.

Os edrychwch ar fanifesto Llafur Cymru, fe welwch ei fod yn cynnwys ymrwymiad i ariannu tecach. Felly, nid yw'r awgrym yr anwybyddwyd hyn rywsut gan y Llywodraeth flaenorol yn dal dŵr. Cofier, hefyd, y cafwyd sawl dadl yn y Siambur hon am yr angen i ddiwygio fformiwla Barnett, ond nad oedd byth gorff o dystiolaeth ar gael a bwyntiai at beth a fyddai'n digwydd pe diwygid y fformiwla. Dyna pam y sefydlwyd comisiwn Holtham a dyna pam yr ydym yn awr mewn sefyllfa lle gallwn gyflwyno tystiolaeth gadarn i ddangos bod Cymru'n cael tua £300 miliwn y flwyddyn yn rhy ychydig o arian. Mae'n drueni nad yw'r neges honno wedi treiddio eto i berfeddion Whitehall.

**David Lloyd:** On the same point, as you have already said, there is movement on the funding agenda in Scotland, and we also know that Scotland receives around £33 billion per year under the Barnett formula, while Wales receives around £15.7 billion a year. Even Northern Ireland currently receives more money than Wales, and that is for ordinary services, without the inclusion of defence services. Northern Ireland's block grant is more than ours currently. Therefore, from your discussions with the leaders of other devolved nations on funding for our countries, do you get the feeling that there is any hope of movement on the Holtham agenda in order to get rid of the Barnett formula and get a fair funding system for Wales? Wales is lagging behind at the moment because every other country gets more money.

**The First Minister:** I have not had the impression that Scotland wants to see any change to the Barnett formula. At present, Scotland is in a position where it can take

ar argymhellion Calman, fformiwla Barnett a'r arian o'r gronfa y soniais amdani'n gynharach. Byddai unrhyw un o'r Alban yn croesawu hynny. Mae Gogledd Iwerddon yn cael llawer mwy o arian na Chymru, ond mae gan Ogledd Iwerddon hefyd yr hawl i fenthyca arian—hyd at £200 miliwn y flwyddyn. Nid oes gennym ni'r hawl hwnnw. Felly, mae sefyllfa'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon yn llawer gwell na'n sefyllfa ni yng Nghymru. Dyna pam ei bod hi mor bwysig ein bod yn sicrhau ein bod yn cael ein cyllido'n deg yn y dyfodol ac mae'n siom na chafodd hynny ei ystyried eto na'i gydnabod hyd yn oed gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig.

**Rhodri Morgan:** In his discussions with the leaders of Scotland and Northern Ireland, has the First Minister agreed with them to put a case to the Treasury for Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland to benefit from the regional growth fund that was set up, which I understand we are all excluded from? As regards the very welcome and creative move to exempt new companies formed outside the four regions of south-east England from paying national insurance contributions for the first 10 employees, has he agreed with the leaders of Scotland and Northern Ireland and the Treasury any estimates of the expected net increase in the birth rate and growth rate of small companies as a result of that national insurance concession?

**The First Minister:** First, we await further details on how the scheme would work, but, as I said, we welcome it. On the discussions that we have with Scotland and Northern Ireland, particularly regarding any issues that may be of common concern, we will put our argument forcibly to the UK Government and, indeed, to the Treasury. As we are in the situation of having four other administrations in the UK, all run by different parties or combinations of parties, it is important for there to be a mechanism in place to ensure that we can benefit from any new schemes. Unfortunately, the regional growth fund that you identified is targeted only at England, and that has been made clear to us.

advantage of the Calman recommendations, the Barnett formula and money from the fund that I mentioned earlier. Anyone from Scotland would welcome that. Northern Ireland receives a lot more money than Wales, but Northern Ireland also has the right to borrow money—up to £200 million per year. We do not have that right. Therefore, Scotland and Northern Ireland are in a much better position than we are in Wales. That is why it is so important that we ensure that we get fair funding in the future and it is disappointing that that has not yet been considered or even acknowledged by the United Kingdom Government.

**Rhodri Morgan:** Yn ei drafodaethau gydag arweinwyr yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, a ydyw'r Prif Weinidog wedi cytuno â hwy i gyflwyno achos i'r Trysorlys dros i Gymru, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon elwa ar y gronfa dwf rhanbarthol a sefydlwyd, y deallaf ein bod i gyd wedi'n cau allan ohoni? O ran y symudiad tra derbyniol a chreadigol i eithrio cwmnïau newydd a ffurfir y tu allan i bedwar rhanbarth de-ddwyrain Lloegr rhag talu cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol am y 10 gweithiwr cyntaf, a ydyw wedi cytuno ag arweinwyr yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon a'r Trysorlys ar unrhyw amcangyfrifon o'r cynnydd net disgwylidig yng nghyfradd geni a chyfradd twf cwmnïau bach o ganlyniad i'r consesiwn hwnnw ar yswiriant gwladol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn aros am fanylion pellach ynghylch sut y byddai'r cynllun yn gweithio, ond, fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn ei groesawu. O ran y trafodaethau a gawn gyda'r Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, yn enwedig ynghylch unrhyw faterion a all fod o ddiddordeb cyffredin, fe gyflwynwn ein dadl yn nerthol i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac, yn wir, i'r Trysorlys. A ninnau yn y sefyllfa o fod â phedair gweinyddiaeth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig, bob un dan reolaeth gwahanol bleidiau neu gyfuniadau o bleidiau, mae'n bwysig cael peirianwaith i sicrhau y gallwn elwa ar unrhyw gynlluniau newydd. Yn anffodus, mae'r gronfa dwf rhanbarthol a nodwyd gennych wedi'i thargedu ar Loegr yn unig, ac mae hynny wedi'i ddatgan yn glir inni.



## The Economic Situation

**Q5 Jenny Randerson:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the economic situation in Wales? OAQ(3)2982(FM)

**The First Minister:** The policies that we will be putting in place as a result of the economic renewal programme will help us to prepare for the challenges we face in future and to make the most of the opportunities that come our way.

**Jenny Randerson:** First Minister, the economic situation in Wales relies to a considerable extent on having good transport links, and the reliability of those links is an important factor. I am sure that you were as concerned as I was to read reports last week about the cancellation of 18 First Great Western services from Paddington to Wales because the services were being diverted to the Glastonbury festival. In past years, until a couple of years ago, those services were provided by First Great Western renting additional trains from a company that exists to provide additional trains for events. Although the company still exists and provides the same service, it now appears as though First Great Western chooses not to rent those trains. It is clearly saving money on its contract by diverting its rolling stock for use at big events, and Glastonbury is the most recent example, but we had the same problem with the Cheltenham Gold Cup. Have you discussed this issue with UK Ministers at any time? If you have not done so yet, will you undertake to do so? Will you also raise this with the rail regulator, because I believe that there could be an issue relating to the contract that was awarded to First Great Western?

**The First Minister:** I will raise that issue by writing to First Great Western, Jenny. I am aware that there were delays last week, certainly out of Paddington, owing to vandalism to the signal box at Slough, which caused a number of trains to be cancelled. Passengers were disgruntled because they were all forced onto one train, which was

## Y Sefyllfa Economaidd

**C5 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y sefyllfa economaidd yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2982(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd y polisiau y byddwn yn eu sefydlu yn sgîl y rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd yn ein helpu i baratoi ar gyfer yr heriau a wynebwn yn y dyfodol ac i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleon a ddaw i'n rhan.

**Jenny Randerson:** Brif Weinidog, mae'r sefyllfa economaidd yng Nghymru'n dibynnu i raddau helaeth ar gael cysylltiadau trafniadaeth da, ac mae dibynadwyedd y cysylltiadau hynny'n ffactor pwysig. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod mor bryderus ag yr oeddwn i o ddarllen adroddiadau'r wythnos diwethaf am ganslo 18 gwasanaeth First Great Western o Paddington i Gymru oherwydd bod y gwasanaethau'n cael eu harallgyfeirio i ŵyl Glastonbury. Yn y gorffennol, tan flwyddyn neu ddwy'n ôl, darperid y gwasanaethau hynny gan First Great Western drwy rentu trenau ychwanegol oddi wrth gwmni sy'n bodoli i ddarparu trenau ychwanegol ar gyfer digwyddiadau. Er bod y cwmni'n dal i fodoli ac yn darparu'r un gwasanaeth, mae'n ymddangos yn awr fod First Great Western yn dewis peidio â rhentu'r trenau hynny. Mae'n amlwg yn arbed arian ar ei gontract drwy arallgyfeirio ei drenau i'w defnyddio mewn digwyddiadau mawr, a Glastonbury yw'r enghraifft ddiweddaraf, ond cawsom yr un broblem gyda Chwpan Aur Cheltenham. A ydych wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Unedig ar unrhyw bryd? Os nad ydych wedi gwneud hynny eto, a wnewch chi addo gwneud? A wnewch chi godi hyn gyda'r rheoleiddiwr rheilffyrdd, oherwydd credaf y gallai fod cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r contract a ddyfarnwyd i First Great Western?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe godaf y mater hwnnw drwy ysgrifennu at First Great Western, Jenny. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bu oedi yr wythnos diwethaf, yn sicr allan o Paddington, oherwydd fandaliaeth ar y blwch signalau yn Slough, a achosodd i nifer o drenau gael eu canslo. Yr oedd teithwyr yn flin am iddynt i gyd gael eu gorfodi i un trê, a oedd yn llawn

very full. I know that because my wife was on it, and she let me know in straight terms what her feelings were about being stuck on that train. [Laughter.] Nevertheless, that appears to be a delay that was caused by an act of vandalism in Slough, and I am not aware of any trains being diverted. However, I must say that it would be very useful to get early confirmation of the electrification of the south Wales main line. If we are to have proper high-speed train lines in future, they will need to be electrified, and the diesel lines will begin to fall behind as fewer and fewer new trains are ordered. Therefore, if we could get an announcement from the UK Government and an early commitment on the electrification of the line, that would be most welcome.

**Lynne Neagle:** First Minister, last week's emergency budget will have a devastating effect on the Welsh economy. Far from it being a progressive budget, as the Liberal Democrats claim, there is a growing body of evidence that last week's budget will adversely hit the poorest and most vulnerable the hardest. Consider the rise in value-added tax alone, which flies in the face of the 'VAT bombshell' warnings that we had from the Lib Dems prior to the election, and markedly fails the fairness test, which should be the benchmark for any Government that dares to describe itself as 'progressive'.

2.20 p.m.

We know that cuts to public services will also affect the poor disproportionately. Is the First Minister aware of a recent study undertaken for the Trades Union Congress by the economist Howard Reed, which has shown that the poorest 10 per cent of households will see a cut equivalent to more than a fifth of their income, and that, by contrast, the richest will suffer a cut of just 3.6 per cent? What assurances can the First Minister give that Assembly Government contingencies are already in place to protect the most vulnerable in Wales from a budget that hits the poorest in society the hardest and threatens to rip the heart out of our Welsh public services?

iawn. Gwn hynny oherwydd yr oedd fy ngwraig arno, a gadawodd imi wybod mewn geiriau plaen beth oedd ei theimladau hi am fod yn sownd ar y trên hwnnw. [Chwerthin.] Serch hynny, mae'n debyg mai oedi oedd hwnnw a achoswyd gan weithred o fandaliaeth yn Slough, ac nid wyf yn ymwybodol fod unrhyw drenau wedi'u harallgyfeirio. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi ddweud y byddai'n ddefnyddiol iawn cael cadarnhad buan y trydanir prif reilffordd y De. Os ydym am gael rheilffyrdd cyflym go iawn yn y dyfodol, bydd angen eu trydanu, a bydd y leiniau disel yn dechrau colli tir wrth i lai a llai o drenau newydd gael eu harchebu. Felly, pe caem gyhoeddiad gan Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac ymrwymiad cynnar i drydanu'r lein, byddai hynny i'w groesawu'n fawr.

**Lynne Neagle:** Brif Weinidog, caiff cyllideb argyfwng yr wythnos diwethaf effaith ddistrywiol ar economi Cymru. Ymhell o fod yn gyllideb flaengar, fel yr honna'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae corff cynyddol o dystiolaeth y bydd cyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf yn taro galetaf ar y tlotaf a'r mwyaf bregus. Ystyriwch y cynnydd mewn treth ar werth yn unig, sy'n mynd yn gwbl groes i'r rhybuddion 'taranfollt TAW' a gawsom gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol cyn yr etholiad, ac sy'n methu'r prawf tegwch o bell, a ddylai fod yn feincnod i unrhyw Lywodraeth sy'n meiddio'i disgrifio'i hun fel un 'flaengar'.

Gwyddom y bydd toriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn effeithio'n anghymesur ar y tlodion hefyd. A ydyw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol o astudiaeth ddiweddar a wnaed ar ran Cyngres yr Undebau Llafur gan yr economegydd Howard Reed, a ddangosodd y bydd y 10 y cant tlotaf o deuluoedd yn gweld toriad cyfwerth â thros bumed ran o'u hincwm, ac, ar y llaw arall, y bydd y rhai cyfoethocaf yn dioddef toriad o 3.6 y cant yn unig? Pa sicrwydd y gall y Prif Weinidog ei roi fod mesurau argyfwng yn eu lle'n barod i warchod y gwannaf yng Nghymru rhag cyllideb sy'n taro'r tlotaf mewn cymdeithas galetaf ac yn bygwth rhwygo'r galon allan o'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru?

**The First Minister:** The deficiencies in the budget have been well rehearsed, particularly the loss of child tax credits for many people. If you look at any figures, even those published in the Fleet Street papers, you will see that those at the bottom end of the scale have suffered more than those in the middle end of the income scale. That is to be much regretted. We as a Government will do all that we can to protect services for the vulnerable. If a Government cannot provide services for the vulnerable, what is the use of Government? We will do our utmost to protect that despite the difficulties that have been forced upon us by last week's budget.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Research published in April from the Local Data Company has found that Wales's shopping centres have more empty units than those anywhere else in the United Kingdom. With that in mind, can the First Minister outline what role he believes the Welsh Assembly Government is playing in fostering the growth of new businesses in Wales? In addition, does he agree that exempting new Welsh firms from paying £5,000 national insurance contributions for each of the first 10 employees hired will play a leading role in stimulating and encouraging the growth of new businesses in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I do. The plans being put forward on national insurance exemptions are very useful. However, increasing VAT to 20 per cent will not help the retail sector. It will hardly help to stimulate the retail sector in difficult times. It will lead to increased prices, which will inevitably mean that people will buy less, which is bound to affect the sector. That much has been put forward with the agreement of the Conservatives, but with the not quite overwhelming agreement of the Liberal Democrat MPs, as we know. Nevertheless, it is a step that will first depress the retail sector in Wales and elsewhere, and it will mean that those who earn the least will pay the most as a proportion of their income. We strongly disagree with that on this side of the Chamber.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r diffygion yn y gyllideb wedi'u trafod yn helaeth, yn enwedig colli credydau treth plant i lawer o bobl. Edrychwch ar unrhyw ffigurau, hyd yn oed y rhai a gyhoeddir ym mhapurau Stryd y Ffilyd, ac fe welwch fod y rhai ar ben isaf y raddfa wedi dioddef mwy na'r rhai yng nghanol y raddfa incwm. Mae hynny'n destun gofid mawr. Fe wnawn ni fel Llywodraeth bopeth a allwn i warchod gwasanaethau i'r gwan. Os na all Llywodraeth ddarparu gwasanaethau i'r gwan, pa les Llywodraeth? Gwnawn bopeth a allwn i warchod hynny er gwaethaf yr anawsterau sydd wedi'u gorfodi arnom gan gyllideb yr wythnos diwethaf.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd yn Ebrill gan y Local Data Company wedi canfod fod gan ganolfannau siopa Cymru fwy o unedau gwag na rhai yn unrhyw le arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gyda hynny mewn golwg, a all y Prif Weinidog amlinellu pa rôl y cred y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei chwarae i feithrin twf busnesau newydd yng Nghymru? At hynny, a ydyw'n cytuno y bydd eithrio cwmnïau Cymru rhag talu cyfraniadau yswiriant gwladol o £5,000 am bob un o'r 10 gweithiwr cyntaf a gyflogir yn chwarae rhan bwysig i hybu ac annog twf busnesau newydd yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Mae'r cynlluniau a gyflwynir ynghylch eithriadau yswiriant gwladol yn fuddiol iawn. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaiff cynyddu TAW i 20 y cant helpu'r sector manwerthu. Go brin y gwnaiff helpu adfywio'r sector manwerthu mewn cyfnod anodd. Bydd yn arwain at brisiau uwch, a fydd yn golygu'n anochel y bydd pobl yn prynu llai, sydd yn rhwym o effeithio ar y sector. Mae hynny wedi'i gynnig gyda chytundeb y Ceidwadwyr, ond â chefnogaeth lai na llethol ASau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, fel y gwyddom. Serch hynny, mae'n gam a fydd yn gyntaf yn gwasgu'r sector manwerthu yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill, a bydd yn golygu y bydd y rhai sy'n ennill leiaf yn talu fwyaf fel cyfran o'u hincwm. Anghytunwn yn gryf â hynny ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr.

**‘One Wales’**

**Q6 Nick Ramsay:** Will the First Minister make a statement on his ‘One Wales’ commitments? OAQ(3)2977(FM)

**The First Minister:** Yes, we are making good progress in delivering our ‘One Wales’ commitments.

**Nick Ramsay:** Thank you for that statement, First Minister. I wish to ask you specifically about your Government’s commitment to patient involvement in the NHS. ‘One Wales’ states:

‘We will reinstate democratic engagement at the heart of the Welsh health service by putting the voice of patients and the public at the centre of what we do.’

Your Government then proceeded to cut the number of community health councils from 19 to eight, reducing the membership by around 100 members overall. I think that, in Cardiff, we now have less than half the number that independent experts say would be necessary to scrutinise the health service effectively. Would you not agree that your Government’s action in respect of the community health councils represents a failure to listen fully to the people of Wales or their views of what they would like to be done about the NHS? How do you propose to rectify that democratic deficit?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that there is a democratic deficit. It is important that patients have an input into how the NHS is run. It is also important to realise that, when the reform was introduced, the intention was to make all bodies, such as community health councils, stronger and better advocates for patients. I believe that that has been done and has been recognised by the sector.

**Kirsty Williams:** Your ‘One Wales’ programme for government commits itself to allowing children in Wales

‘to develop and grow in a happy, healthy and supportive environment.’

**‘Cymru’n Un’**

**C6 Nick Ramsay:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei ymrwymïadau ‘Cymru’n Un’? OAQ(3)2977(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf, yr ydym yn cymryd camau breision i gyflawni ein hymrwymïadau ‘Cymru’n Un’.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch am y datganiad hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Hoffwn eich holi’n benodol am ymrwymïad eich Llywodraeth i roi llais i gleifion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Dywed ‘Cymru’n Un’:

‘Bydd cynnal cysylltiadau democrataidd yn cael lle canolog unwaith eto yng ngwasanaeth iechyd Cymru...drwy sicrhau bod llais y cleifion a’r cyhoedd yn ganolog i’r hyn a wnawn.’

Aeth eich Llywodraeth ati wedyn i dorri nifer y cynghorau iechyd cymuned o 19 i wyth, gan gwtogi rhyw 100 o aelodau i gyd. Credaf, yng Nghaerdydd, fod gennym bellach lai na hanner y nifer a fyddai’n angenrheidiol, yn ôl arbenigwyr annibynnol, i graffu’n effeithiol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd. Oni chytunech fod gwaith eich Llywodraeth yng nghyswllt y cynghorau iechyd cymuned yn dangos methiant i wrando’n iawn ar bobl Cymru na’u barn ynghylch beth yr hoffent iddo gael ei wneud ynglŷn â’r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu cywiro’r diffyg democrataidd hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn derbyn bod diffyg democrataidd. Mae’n bwysig i gleifion gael mewnbwn i’r modd y rhedir y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae’n bwysig sylweddoli hefyd mai’r bwriad, pan gyflwynwyd y newid, oedd gwneud pob corff, fel cynghorau iechyd cymuned, yn gryfach ac yn well lladmeryddion dros gleifion. Credaf fod hynny wedi’i wneud a bod y sector wedi cydnabod hynny.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae eich rhaglen ‘Cymru’n Un’ ar gyfer llywodraeth yn ymrwymo i ganiatáu i blant yng Nghymru

‘ddatblygu a thyfu mewn amgylchedd hapus, iach a chefnogol.’

Could you outline the steps that you have taken to ensure that for the most vulnerable of children?

**The First Minister:** We have the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010, which will underpin our child poverty commitments. We remain committed to achieving the target of eliminating child poverty by 2020. We also have the foundation phase, which is an excellent way of ensuring that young children get a better education. We all know that the surest way out of poverty is provided by education. If you can provide a good foundation for children at a young age, they will be able to prosper to a greater extent as they get older. That is the surest way of dealing with poverty in Wales. As I said, the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010 is another example of what is being done to satisfy that commitment.

**Kirsty Williams:** First Minister, today we have seen the publication of yet another serious case review. While acknowledging that the staff involved could not have predicted the tragic death of that young girl, the case highlights once again the issue with sharing information between the agencies that had contact with that vulnerable young woman. What is the Government doing to ensure that the ongoing issue of a lack of information sharing among agencies is being addressed?

**The First Minister:** You are right to point out the deficiencies that have been identified. The report states that there are lessons to be learned to improve what is described as 'inter-agency working'. It is essential that the Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Safeguarding Children Board acts swiftly to ensure that the findings and recommendations are implemented. I can assure the Chamber that the Care and Social Services Inspectorate Wales will monitor the progress that the board makes.

**Kirsty Williams:** With all due respect, you are referring to the recommendations of this report only, but I am trying to link it with a number of serious case reviews that have drawn similar conclusions the length and breadth of Wales. The issue is not what an

A allech amlinellu'r camau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i sicrhau hynny i'r plant mwyaf bregus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gennym Fesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010, a fydd yn sylfaen i'n hymrwymadau ar dlodi plant. Yr ydym yn parhau'n ymroddedig i gyrraedd y nod o ddileu tlodi plant erbyn 2020. Mae gennym y cyfnod sylfaen hefyd, sydd yn ffordd ragorol o sicrhau y caiff plant ifanc well addysg. Gwyddom i gyd mai addysg sy'n darparu'r ffordd sicraf allan o dlodi. Os gallwch ddarparu sylfaen dda i blant yn ifanc, byddant yn gallu ffynnu i raddau mwy pan dyfant yn hŷn. Dyna'r ffordd sicraf o ddelio â thlodi yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedais, mae Mesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010 yn enghraifft arall o'r hyn sy'n cael ei wneud i fodloni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Brif Weinidog, heddiw yr ydym wedi gweld cyhoeddi adolygiad achos difrifol arall eto fyth. Tra'n cydnabod na allasai'r staff dan sylw fod wedi rhagweld marwolaeth drasig y ferch ifanc honno, mae'r achos yn amlygu unwaith eto y broblem gyda rhannu gwybodaeth rhwng yr asiantaethau a fu mewn cysylltiad â'r ferch ifanc fregus honno. Beth mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau y rhoddir sylw i'r broblem barhaus fod diffyg rhannu gwybodaeth rhwng asiantaethau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi'r diffygion sydd wedi'u henwi. Dywed yr adroddiad fod gwersi i'w dysgu i wella'r hyn a ddisgrifir fel 'gweithio rhyngasiantaethol'. Mae'n hanfodol fod Bwrdd Diogelu Plant Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn gweithredu ar fyrder i sicrhau y gweithredir ar y canfyddiadau a'r argymhellion. Gallaf sicrhau'r Siambr y bydd Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru'n monitro'r camau a gymerir gan y bwrdd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gyda phob dyledus barch, yr ydych yn cyfeirio at argymhellion yr adroddiad hwn yn unig, ond yr wyf fi'n ceisio'i gysylltu â nifer o adolygiadau achosion difrifol sydd wedi dod i gasgliadau tebyg ar hyd a lled Cymru. Y cwestiwn yw

individual board can learn from the case but what we can all learn to ensure that our most vulnerable children are safeguarded. Six months ago, a number of reports published by charities and Government agencies highlighted inconsistencies in existing practice, information sharing that was variable throughout agencies in Wales, and poor implementation of national guidelines. Your predecessor as First Minister assured me that the Government would take those reports seriously and would act on their findings, and you have had six months in which to do so. Can you now outline what lessons the Government has learned from those reports, and how we can ensure that we will not see further serious case reviews that highlight the same issues?

**The First Minister:** You have talked about one case and have suggested that there is a pattern. It is important to look at this case by itself. There is no sign of a pattern emerging of problematic information sharing throughout Wales. CSSIW has the responsibility of ensuring that these matters are dealt with effectively across Wales. However, there is an underlying issue, and I refer you to what Carl Sargeant, Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, said yesterday, namely that we cannot continue to have a situation whereby 22 bodies are trying to do everything as Wales is too small for that. It is important that we deal with the underlying infrastructural problems in Wales in the next few years to ensure that the system becomes more efficient.

**Kirsty Williams:** With all due respect, First Minister, this is not an isolated case. I refer you to the reports that were published some six months ago by Health Inspectorate Wales, Estyn, the CSSIW, the Wales Audit Office and Barnardo's, the children's charity. They pointed to national problems across the board with the implementation of national guidance, the sharing of information, and inconsistencies in existing practice. You cannot say that this is an isolated case. The case review that has been published today follows on from numerous cases in numerous

and beth y gall bwrdd unigol ei ddysgu oddi wrth yr achos ond beth y gallwn ni i gyd ei ddysgu er mwyn sicrhau y diogelir ein plant mwyaf bregus. Chwe mis yn ôl, cyhoeddwyd nifer o adroddiadau gan elusennau ac asiantaethau Llywodraeth a amlygai anghysonderau yn yr ymarfer bresennol, dulliau rhannu gwybodaeth a oedd yn amrywiol o asiantaeth i asiantaeth yng Nghymru, a diffyg gweithredu yn ôl canllawiau cenedlaethol. Cefais sicrwydd gan eich rhagflaenydd fel Prif Weinidog y cymerai'r Llywodraeth yr adroddiadau hynny o ddifrif ac y gweithredai ar eu canfyddiadau, ac yr ydych wedi cael chwe mis i wneud hynny. A allwch amlinellu'n awr ba wersi y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'u dysgu oddi wrth yr adroddiadau hyn, a sut y gallwn sicrhau na welwn adolygiadau achosion difrifol pellach sy'n amlygu'r un problemau?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi siarad am un achos ac wedi awgrymu bod patrwm. Mae'n bwysig edrych ar yr achos hwn yn unigol. Nid oes argoel fod patrwm yn codi o broblemau gyda rhannu gwybodaeth drwy Gymru gyfan. Gan Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru y mae'r cyfrifoldeb am sicrhau yr ymdrinnir â'r materion hyn yn effeithiol ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, y mae mater gwaelodol, ac fe'ch cyfeiriai at yr hyn a ddywedodd Carl Sargeant, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, ddoe, sef na allwn barhau i gael sefyllfa lle mae 22 o gyrff yn ceisio gwneud popeth, gan fod Cymru'n rhy fach i hynny. Mae'n bwysig inni ddelio â'r problemau seilwaith gwaelodol yng Nghymru yn yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf er mwyn sicrhau y daw'r system yn fwy effeithlon.

**Kirsty Williams:** Gyda phob dyledus barch, Brif Weinidog, nid un achos ar ei ben ei hun yw hwn. Fe'ch cyfeiriai at yr adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd ryw chwe mis yn ôl gan Arolygiaeth Iechyd Cymru, Estyn, Arolygiaeth Gofal a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Cymru, Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a Barnardo's, yr elusen plant. Cyfeiriasant at broblemau cenedlaethol ar draws y bwrdd gyda gweithredu canllawiau cenedlaethol, rhannu gwybodaeth, ac anghysonderau yn yr ymarfer a fodolai. Ni allwch ddweud mai un achos ar ei ben ei hun

local authorities pointing to such failings. If you and your Government are not listening to your own agencies, and, as you have said, if the role of Government is not to protect the most vulnerable, what is Government for? Your own agencies say that there are problems that need to be addressed. I raised the issue six months ago, when your predecessor said that it would be addressed. Could you please outline now what you have done?

**The First Minister:** There are plans to look at having a national safeguarding board, and that will be looked at in September. We need to ensure that standards are adhered to across Wales, and the Deputy Minister for Social Services is keen to ensure that that is the case. As I have said, we are looking at this with a view to taking matters forward in the autumn.

#### The Ambulance Service

**Q7 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the performance of the ambulance service? OAQ(3)2983(FM)

**The First Minister:** I refer you to the statement provided by the Minister for Health and Social Services on 18 June.

**Peter Black:** Thank you for that answer, First Minister. You will know that that statement was issued as a direct response to the report that compared response times for ambulances in Wales with those in England and the rest of the UK, and that, despite the improvements in response times for emergencies in Wales, Wales is still lagging behind England on the time that it takes for an ambulance to get to emergencies, and that performance is unsatisfactory. What progress is being made to correct this, and what sort of timescale and targets are you setting to try to put this right?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** As I said, the answer to

yw hwn. Mae'r adolygiad achos a gyhoeddwyd heddiw'n ddilyniant i sawl achos mewn sawl awdurdod lleol yn pwyntio at ddiffygion o'r fath. Os nad ydych chi a'ch Llywodraeth yn gwrandao ar eich asiantaethau eich hun, ac, fel y dywedoch, os nad rôl y Llywodraeth yw gwarchod y gwannaf, beth yw diben Llywodraeth? Dywed eich asiantaethau eich hun fod problemau sydd angen sylw. Codais y mater chwe mis yn ôl, pryd y dywedodd eich rhagflaenydd y rhoddid sylw iddo. A allech amlinellu'n awr, os gwelwch yn dda, beth yr ydych wedi'i wneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y mae cynlluniau i edrych ar gael bwrdd diogelu cenedlaethol, ac edrychir ar hynny ym mis Medi. Mae angen inni sicrhau y glynir at safonau ar draws Cymru, ac mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn awyddus i sicrhau hynny. Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn edrych ar hyn gyda golwg ar fwrw ymlaen â phethau yn yr hydref.

#### Y Gwasanaeth Ambiwylans

**C7 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am berfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans? OAQ(3)2983(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'ch cyfeiriai at y datganiad a roddwyd gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar 18 Mehefin.

**Peter Black:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Byddwch yn gwybod y cyhoeddwyd y datganiad hwnnw fel ymateb uniongyrchol i'r adroddiad a gymharodd amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau yng Nghymru â rhai yn Lloegr a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, a bod Cymru, er gwaethaf y gwelliannau mewn amserau ymateb i argyfyngau yng Nghymru, yn dal i lusgo'r tu ôl i Loegr ar yr amser a gymer i ambiwlansiau gyrraedd argyfyngau, a bod y perfformiad yn anfodddhaol. Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i gywiro hyn, a pha fath o amserlen a thargedau'r ydych chi'n eu gosod i geisio cywiro hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y dywedais, mae'r ateb

your question lies in the statement that was provided by Edwina Hart on 18 June. To paraphrase the last part of that statement, she expects the trust to implement the report's proposals in full, and to work with the health boards in developing a comprehensive response to unscheduled care, as part of the five-year strategic framework.

**Brian Gibbons:** Do you welcome the fact that, over the last two years, there has been a 12 per cent improvement in ambulance response times in the Neath Port Talbot area, from just under 58 to just over 69 per cent? Not only is this a quantitative improvement, but the quality of service, and how it links in with hospital services, has also dramatically improved over that period of time.

**The First Minister:** I cannot disagree with the doctor's word on this issue. You are right to point out that the service has improved from a difficult level. It is also right to say that we want to ensure that the service gets ever better, which is why the Minister for Health and Social Services produced her statement on 18 June.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I too commend all those in the ambulance trust who have worked tirelessly to improve ambulance response times. However, and following on from the question that you were asked on this issue, hospital transfer times have, sadly, not improved. If you were to consider the transfer times and targets that have been met, many hospitals, particularly in south Wales, are only hitting 54 or 55 per cent of the 15-minute transfer time for going into the accident and emergency department and getting back out on call. In north Wales, it is 63 or 64 per cent. Therefore, across Wales, sadly, this target time is acting as a roadblock to ensuring improvement in the ambulance service and securing what we need: for our ambulances to be back out on call. What action is your Government taking to work with local health boards to improve these handover times at accident and emergency departments, thus reducing a considerable bottleneck, which is causing great stress to the ambulance professionals and to those who direct calls?

i'ch cwestiwn yn y datganiad a roddwyd gan Edwina Hart ar 18 Mehefin. Ac aralleirio rhan olaf y datganiad hwnnw, mae hi'n disgwyl i'r ymddiriedolaeth weithredu cynigion yr adroddiad yn llawn, a gweithio gyda'r byrddau iechyd i ddatblygu ymateb cynhwysfawr i ofal heb ei drefnu, fel rhan o'r fframwaith strategol pum mlynedd.

**Brian Gibbons:** A ydych yn croesawu'r ffaith y cafwyd gwelliant o 12 y cant yn y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf yn amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau yn ardal Castell-nedd Port Talbot, o ychydig dan 58 i ychydig dros 69 y cant? Nid yn unig y mae hyn yn welliant meintiol, ond mae ansawdd y gwasanaeth, a'r modd y mae'n cysylltu â gwasanaethau ysbytai, hefyd wedi gwella'n ddramatig dros y cyfnod hwnnw.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf anghytuno â gair y doctor ar y mater hwn. Yr ydych yn iawn i nodi bod y gwasanaeth wedi gwella o lefel anodd. Mae'n iawn dweud hefyd fod arnom eisiau sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth yn gwella mwy eto, a dyna pam y lluniodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ei datganiad ar 18 Mehefin.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Cymeradwyaf finnau bawb yn yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans sydd wedi gweithio'n ddiflino i wella amserau ymateb ambiwlansiau. Fodd bynnag, ac yn dilyn oddi ar y cwestiwn a ofynnwyd ichi ar y mater hwn, nid yw amserau trosglwyddo i ysbytai, ysywaeth, wedi gwella. Pe ystyriech yr amserau trosglwyddo a'r targedau a gyraeddwyd, mewn llawer o ysbytai, yn enwedig yn y De, dim ond 54 neu 55 y cant o lwyddiant a geir i gyflawni amser trosglwyddo 15 munud ar gyfer mynd i mewn i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys a mynd yn ôl allan ar alwad. Yn y Gogledd, mae'n 63 neu 64 y cant. Felly, ar draws Cymru, ysywaeth, mae'r amser targed hwn yn gweithredu fel rhwystr i sicrhau gwelliant yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a sicrhau'r hyn sydd arnom ei angen: i'n hambiwllansiau fod yn ôl allan ar alwad. Pa gamau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i weithio gyda byrddau iechyd lleol i wella'r amserau trosglwyddo hyn mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, er mwyn lleihau tagfa sylweddol sy'n peri straen mawr i'r gweithwyr ambiwlans ac i'r rhai sy'n



cyfeirio galwadau?

**The First Minister:** I refer you to the third paragraph from the end of the Minister's statement, which deals with handover times. The Minister has made it clear to the chairs of all local health boards that the responsibility for resolving issues affecting patient handover performance lies with them. However, she has also asked them to focus on improving the process with the accident and emergency departments, to ensure that handover times are improved. That message has been sent to the local health board chairs, as detailed in the statement.

**Helen Mary Jones:** You, Brian Gibbons and others are right to congratulate staff for the improvements that have been made, but I am sure that you would agree—and the Minister for health's statement makes it clear—that we are far from having an acceptable level of service in every part of Wales. You will recall that one reason for establishing a national ambulance trust was to try to deliver a consistent service across Wales. If the ambulance trust—and by that I refer to the senior management, not the front-line staff—eventually fails to deliver that consistent service across Wales, will you and your Government consider dismantling the trust and bringing ambulance services back into local health boards? They could then be better co-ordinated with other issues—out-of-hours care, GPs, hospital waiting times and so on. I sense from the Minister's statement that she is pleased with the progress that has been made, but that major concerns are still outstanding, and it may be time to look at a radical solution.

**The First Minister:** That is always in the background; it is something that Government must think about if a situation does not improve over time. However, in the meantime, a management review of the trust board has been completed. It is now in the process of implementing the new structures that the review identified, which should improve the trust's management capacity and leadership at all levels. That must happen; otherwise, other alternatives will have to be

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe'ch cyfeiriau at y trydydd paragraff o'r diwedd yn natganiad y Gweinidog, sy'n cyfeirio at amserau trosglwyddo. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud yn glir wrth gadeiryddion pob bwrdd iechyd lleol mai arnynt hwy y mae'r cyfrifoldeb am ddatrys materion sy'n effeithio ar berfformiad trosglwyddo cleifion. Fodd bynnag, mae hi wedi gofyn hefyd iddynt ganolbwyntio ar wella'r broses gyda'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, i sicrhau gwelliant yn yr amserau trosglwyddo. Mae'r neges honno wedi'i hanfon at gadeiryddion y byrddau iechyd lleol, fel y manylir yn y datganiad.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr ydych chi, Brian Gibbons ac eraill yn iawn i longyfarch staff am y gwelliannau sydd wedi'u gwneud, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech—ac mae datganiad y Gweinidog iechyd yn ei wneud yn glir—ein bod ymhell o gael lefel dderbyniol o wasanaeth ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Fe gofiwch mai un rheswm dros sefydlu ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans genedlaethol oedd i geisio rhoi gwasanaeth cyson ar draws Cymru. Os bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans—a thrwy hynny yr wyf yn cyfeirio at yr uwch reolwyr, nid y staff rheng flaen—yn methu yn y pen draw â darparu'r gwasanaeth cyson hwnnw ledled Cymru, a wnewch chi a'ch Llywodraeth ystyried datgymalu'r ymddiriedolaeth a dod â gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn ôl i fyrddau iechyd lleol? Wedyn gellid eu cyd-drefnu'n well â materion eraill—gofal y tu allan i oriau arferol, meddygon teulu, amserau aros ysbytai ac ati. Synhwyras o ddatganiad y Gweinidog ei bod yn falch â'r camau a gymerwyd, ond bod pryderon mawr yn dal i fodoli, ac efallai ei bod yn bryd edrych ar ateb radicalaidd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny bob amser yn y cefndir; mae'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth feddwl amdano os na fydd sefyllfa'n gwella gydag amser. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, mae adolygiad rheoli o fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth wedi'i gwblhau. Mae bellach wrthi'n gweithredu'r strwythurau newydd a nodwyd gan yr adolygiad, a ddylai wella gallu rheolaethol yr ymddiriedolaeth a'i harweinyddiaeth ar bob lefel. Rhaid i hynny ddigwydd; fel arall, bydd rhaid ymchwilio i

explored.

### Co-operatives

**Q8 Lorraine Barrett:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote the work of co-operatives in Wales? OAQ(3)2984(FM)

**The First Minister:** We provide a mix of funding to the Wales Co-operative Centre to raise awareness of co-operative social enterprises among the general public, and to further support their development. We also promote co-operatives through work outlined in the social enterprise action plan.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Thank you for that response, First Minister, and for the support that your Government gives to co-operatives. We are almost at the end of the first ever Co-operatives Fortnight, and I was delighted to host an event this lunchtime to celebrate the success of co-operatives in Wales, at which Carl Sargeant was a guest speaker. We also launched the co-operative enterprise hub today, to provide advice, training and financial help to set up co-operative enterprises. I ask for your continued support to help develop the success of co-operatives across Wales, particularly in these difficult financial times.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased to be able to give that support. We need to start thinking about social enterprises as ones that can grow. Traditionally in this country, apart from the co-operative movement and farmers' supply co-operatives, co-operatives have been fairly small, yet we know that, across Europe, there are fine examples of very large organisations that are co-operatives. It is important that we help new co-operatives to start, but also that we help those that already exist to expand and provide more services.

**Mark Isherwood:** I, too, welcome the launch of the co-operative enterprise hub in Wales, which offers great potential for

bosibiliadau eraill.

### Mentrau Cydweithredol

**C8 Lorraine Barrett:** Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo gwaith mentrau cydweithredol yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2984(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn darparu cymysgedd o gyllid i Ganolfan Gydweithredol Cymru i godi ymwybyddiaeth o fentrau cymdeithasol cydweithredol ymysg y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol, ac i gefnogi eu datblygiad ymhellach. Byddwn hefyd yn hyrwyddo mentrau cydweithredol drwy waith a amlinellir yn y cynllun gweithredu mentrau cymdeithasol.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog, ac am y gefnogaeth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei rhoi i fentrau cydweithredol. Yr ydym bron ar ddiwedd y Pythefnos Mentrau Cydweithredol cyntaf erioed, ac yr oeddwn wrth fy modd o gynnal digwyddiad amser cinio heddiw i ddatlu llwyddiant mentrau cydweithredol yng Nghymru, lle'r oedd Carl Sargeant yn siaradwr gwadd. Fe wnaethom lansio Cymorth i Fentrau Cydweithredol heddiw, i ddarparu cyngor, hyfforddiant a chymorth ariannol i sefydlu mentrau cydweithredol. Gofynnaf am eich cefnogaeth barhaus i helpu datblygu llwyddiant mentrau cydweithredol ar draws Cymru, yn enwedig yn y dyddiau ariannol dyrys hyn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o allu rhoi'r gefnogaeth honno. Mae angen inni ddechrau meddwl am fentrau cymdeithasol fel rhai a all dyfu. Yn draddodiadol yn y wlad hon, ar wahân i'r mudiad cydweithredol a mentrau cydweithredol cyflenwi ffermwyr, pethau gweddol fach fu mentrau cydweithredol, ond eto gwyddom fod, ar draws Ewrop, enghreifftiau da o gyrff mawr iawn sydd yn gydweithredol. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn helpu mentrau cydweithredol newydd i gychwyn, ond hefyd ein bod yn helpu'r rhai sy'n bodoli eisoes i ehangu a darparu mwy o wasanaethau.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu lansio'r cymorth i fentrau cydweithredol yng Nghymru, sy'n cynnig potensial mawr ar

development in future. The European Federation of Employee Share Ownership highlighted in its report, which was sent to Members, that co-operative business models are back in the spotlight in the UK as people look for more sustainable and effective ways of running a business. The federation cited a clinic in Bath, which is the first of a planned chain of 30 hospitals run as employee partnerships in the style of John Lewis. How do you, as First Minister, respond to proposals for a mutual service delivery model, with the public sector working with social enterprises and independent bodies to maximise outcomes for the people of Wales, and how do you respond to models such as that cited by the European federation?

**The First Minister:** There will be appropriate sectors where that can be done. It is important that there is a level of consistency of service in the public sector that can be maintained, and this Government wishes to maintain that level. There was a time, back in the 1980s, when the co-operative movement lost its way slightly, when co-operatives were not fashionable. It is probably right to say that Co-operative Retail Services Ltd, and all of the arms of the co-operative, were not sure where they fitted in; they pulled out of many mining communities, built large stores then sold them quickly afterwards. However, I think that those days are long gone; it is now clear that the co-operatives—and CRS in particular—have a very clear idea of where they stand in terms of their retail offering. We also see mutual organisations—the community housing organisations and credit unions—plugging a gap left by the conventional private sector, as it were, and I want to ensure that social enterprises continue to provide services in those areas, and continue to grow in future.

**Leanne Wood:** First Minister, I am sure that you are aware that Wales has one of the highest unemployment rates in the UK, mainly for historic reasons. In this difficult financial climate, there is a great need to invest in our communities, particularly in

gyfer datblygu yn y dyfodol. Yn ei adroddiad, a anfonwyd at Aelodau, nododd y Ffederasiwn Ewropeaidd dros Ffediant Gweithwyr ar Gyfranddaliadau fod modelau busnes cydweithredol yn ôl dan y chwyddwydr yn y Deyrnas Unedig wrth i bobl edrych am ffyrdd mwy cynaliadwy ac effeithiol o redeg busnes. Cyfeiriodd y ffederasiwn at glinig yng Nghaerfaddon, y cyntaf o gadwyn o 30 o ysbytai sydd ar y gweill i'w rhedeg fel partneriaethau gweithwyr yn null John Lewis. Sut yr ydych chi, Brif Weinidog, yn ymateb i gynigion ar gyfer model cyflenwi gwasanaethau cydfuddiannol, gyda'r sector cyhoeddus yn gweithio gyda mentrau cymdeithasol a chyrrff annibynnol i gael y canlyniadau gorau i bobl Cymru, a sut yr ydych yn ymateb i fodolau fel hwnnw a grybwyllwyd gan y ffederasiwn Ewropeaidd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fe geir sectorau priodol lle gellir gwneud hynny. Mae'n bwysig cael lefel o gysondeb gwasanaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus y gellir ei chynnal, a dymuniad y Llywodraeth hon yw cynnal y lefel honno. Yr oedd adeg, yn ôl yn y 1980au, pryd y colodd y mudiad cydweithredol ei ffordd braidd, pan nad oedd mentrau cydweithredol yn ffasiynol. Mae'n debyg ei bod yn gywir dweud nad oedd Co-operative Retail Services Ltd, a holl ganghennau'r fenter gydweithredol, yn siŵr ym mhle yr oeddent yn ffitio; ciliasant o sawl cymuned lofaol, codasant siopau mawr a'u gwerthu'n fuan wedyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn meddwl bod y dyddiau hynny wedi hen fynd; mae'n amlwg bellach fod gan y mentrau cydweithredol—a CRS yn arbennig—syniad clir iawn o ble maent yn sefyll o ran eu darpariaeth manwerthu. Gwelwn gyrff cydfuddiannol hefyd—y sefydliadau tai cymunedol ac undebau credyd—yn llenwi bwlch a adawyd gan y sector preifat confensiynol, fel petai, ac mae arnaf eisiau sicrhau bod mentrau cymdeithasol yn parhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y meysydd hynny, ac yn parhau i dyfu yn y dyfodol.

**Leanne Wood:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod gan Gymru un o'r cyfraddau diweithdra uchaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a hynny'n bennaf am resymau hanesyddol. Yn yr hinsawdd ariannol anodd hon, mae angen mawr i fuddsoddi yn ein

non-profit co-operatives or social enterprises; that is a very good way of making that investment. A Welsh co-operative bank could ensure that these small community-based businesses receive the essential funding that they need, reducing problems that they have with cash flow, perhaps, and providing quick access to money so that they can be set up swiftly, helping struggling businesses to prosper. I would be grateful if you would look into the feasibility of setting up a Welsh co-operative bank that could help the Welsh economy, particularly this small, non-profit, co-operative sector, and report back to the Assembly about the practicalities of doing so.

cymunedau, yn enwedig mewn mentrau cydweithredol neu gymdeithasol dielw; mae hynny'n ffordd dda iawn o wneud y buddsoddiad hwnnw. Gallai banc cydweithredol Cymreig sicrhau y caiff y busnesau cymunedol bach hyn y cyllid hanfodol y mae arnynt ei angen, gan leihau problemau sydd ganddynt gyda llif arian, efallai, a darparu mynediad sydyn at arian fel y gellir eu sefydlu'n gyflym, gan helpu busnesau sydd mewn trafferth i ffynnu. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech edrych i mewn i ddichonolrwydd sefydlu banc cydweithredol i Gymru a allai helpu economi Cymru, yn enwedig y sector cydweithredol bach dielw hwn, a dod ag adroddiad yn ôl i'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â chwestiynau ymarferol gwneud hynny.

**The First Minister:** We are looking at a number of models as to how this might be taken forward. The important point is to ensure that any new structure does not cut across what has already been done: for example, the existing Co-operative Bank and credit unions. Any new institution should not take work or business from those that already exist. The difficulty that we face in setting up a bank, in the conventional sense, is that a bank needs about £100 million in reserve, if I remember rightly, before it can get a banking licence, which is a considerable amount of money. However, in the meantime, we want to ensure that credit unions continue to grow across Wales and, if needs be, for some credit unions to merge across Wales and for credit unions to be able to provide their services more widely, particularly through post offices.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn edrych ar nifer o fodelau o ran sut y gellid bwrw ymlaen â hyn. Y pwynt pwysig yw sicrhau nad yw unrhyw strwythur newydd yn torri ar draws rhywbeth sydd eisoes wedi'i wneud: er enghraifft, y Banc Cydweithredol presennol ac undebau credyd. Dylai unrhyw sefydliad newydd beidio cymryd gwaith neu fusnes oddi wrth rai sy'n bodoli eisoes. Yr anhawster a wynebwn wrth sefydlu banc, yn yr ystyr gonfensiynol, yw bod ar fanc angen rhyw £100 miliwn wrth gefn, os cofiaf yn iawn, cyn y gall gael trwydded fancio, sy'n swm sylweddol o arian. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyfamser, mae arnom eisiau sicrhau bod undebau credyd yn parhau i dyfu ledled Cymru ac, os cwyd yr angen, i rai undebau credyd uno ar draws Cymru ac i undebau credyd allu darparu eu gwasanaethau'n fwy eang, yn enwedig drwy swyddfeydd post.

2.40 p.m.

### Tourism

**Q9 Darren Millar:** Will the First Minister make a statement on support for tourism in north Wales? OAQ(3)2991(FM)

**The First Minister:** Latest figures show that UK residents holidaying in north Wales spent £476 million in 2009, which amounts to an increase of almost 10.5 per cent on 2008, despite the weather.

**Darren Millar:** You will know that north

### Twristiaeth

**C9 Darren Millar:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth ar gyfer twristiaeth yn y gogledd? OAQ(3)2991(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf yn dangos i drigolion y DU a dreuliodd eu gwyliau yn y gogledd wario £476 miliwn yn 2009, sy'n gynydd o bron i 10.5 y cant o gymharu â 2008, er gwaetha'r tywydd.

**Darren Millar:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol fod

Wales is blessed with a rich religious heritage that has gone largely unnoticed, unfortunately, by tourists in the region for many years. Given that recent surveys have indicated that there is an increasing spirituality across the UK, do you agree that now would be a good time to look again at the Assembly Government's cultural tourism action plan with a view to promoting Welsh sacred sites, so that places like St Winifred's well in Holywell and St Dyfnog springs in my own constituency can receive a boost in terms of visitor numbers? Of course, that would also provide a boost to the north Wales tourism economy.

**The First Minister:** We are keen to promote any facilities or locations that attract visitors. It is true that we not only have St Winifred's well in Holywell and the location in your own constituency, to which you referred, but also the pilgrim's trail to Bardsey island. There are also many other locations, such as Tintern Abbey and Strata Florida as well as Valle Crucis Abbey, which is not far from Llangollen and which attracts visitors every year. Wales's religious heritage is an important part of its history and, clearly, we would want to encourage people who have an interest in visiting parts of Wales where such religious heritage is exhibited.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware of the importance of the Llangollen steam railway to tourism in that area and of the plans to extend that railway up to Corwen. Those plans are at their final hurdle, but there is a strong possibility that they might now falter. Will you pledge to do all that you can in the Assembly to give that much-needed tourism boost all the support that it needs to ensure that we do all that we can to support the grant bids that are being submitted, because that is vital to unlocking further prosperity in that region?

**The First Minister:** I understand the importance of the final extension out from Carrog to Corwen. The Government has been involved in this project for some considerable time and we are currently considering a proposal that has been put forward by, as I

y Gogledd wedi'i fendithio â threftadaeth grefyddol gyfoethog nad yw prin wedi cael ei gweld, yn anffodus, gan dwristiaid yn y rhanbarth ers blynyddoedd lawer. Gan fod arolygon diweddar wedi dangos bod ysbrydolrwydd ar gynnydd ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig, a ydych yn cytuno y byddai hyn yn amser da i edrych eto ar gynllun gweithredu twristiaeth ddiwylliannol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gyda golwg ar hyrwyddo safleoedd cysegredig Cymru, fel y gall llefydd fel ffynnon Gwenffrewi yn Nhreffynnon a ffynnon Dyfnog yn fy etholaeth i gael hwb o ran niferoedd ymwelwyr? Wrth gwrs, byddai hynny'n rhoi hwb hefyd i economi twristiaeth y Gogledd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn eiddgar i hyrwyddo unrhyw gyfleusterau neu leoliadau sy'n denu ymwelwyr. Mae'n wir fod gennym nid yn unig ffynnon Gwenffrewi yn Nhreffynnon a'r lleoliad yn eich etholaeth chi, y cyfeiriasoch atynt, ond hefyd lwybr y pererinion i ynys Enlli. Mae sawl lleoliad arall hefyd, fel Abaty Tyndyrn ac Ystrad Fflur yn ogystal ag Abaty Glyn y Groes, nid nepell o Langollen, sy'n denu ymwelwyr bob blwyddyn. Mae treftadaeth grefyddol Cymru'n rhan bwysig o'i hanes ac, yn amlwg, byddem yn dymuno annog pobl sydd â diddordeb mewn ymweld â rhannau o Gymru lle mae'r cyfryw dreftadaeth grefyddol i'w gweld.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd rheilffordd stêm Llangollen i dwristiaeth yn yr ardal honno ac o'r cynlluniau i ymestyn y rheilffordd honno i fyny i Gorwen. Mae'r cynlluniau hynny ar y cam olaf, ond mae posibilrwydd cryf y gallent faglu'n awr. A wnewch chi addo gwneud popeth a allwch yn y Cynulliad i roi i'r hwb twristiaeth hollbwysig hwnnw bob cefnogaeth y mae arno ei angen i sicrhau y gwnawn bopeth a allwn i gefnogi'r ceisiadau grant a gyflwynir, oherwydd mae hynny'n allweddol i ddatgloi ffyniant pellach yn y rhanbarth hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn deall pwysigrwydd yr estyniad terfynol allan o Garrog i Gorwen. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymwneud â'r prosiect hwn ers tro byd ac yr ydym ar hyn o bryd yn ystyried cynnig sydd wedi'i gyflwyno gan, yn ôl a ddeallaf, yr

understand it, the railway trust. We are looking to find ways of supporting the initial works during this financial year. We are looking to make a decision shortly.

### Front-line Public Services

**Q10 Nick Bourne:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the quality of front-line public services in Wales? OAQ(3)2986(FM)

**The First Minister:** Public services have improved substantially since the creation of the Assembly Government in all areas.

**Nick Bourne:** We are all clearly committed to excellence in public services and, in these difficult financial times, I wanted to address your concern for something that does not have any cost associated with it, namely the problem with directions that have been given by the Government in relation to vending machines in hospitals. We are now in a position where hospital patients, nurses or visitors—I have had representations on this—are unable to get a cup of tea or coffee with sugar when the shop has closed, because of a ministerial directive. When the shop is open, you can get tea or coffee with as much sugar as you like; you can have chocolate éclairs or whatever, but you cannot get a cup of tea or coffee with sugar when the shop is closed, because of a ministerial directive. Will you look at that, because it seems to be a ludicrous decision? It is particularly a problem for people with diabetes.

**The First Minister:** You also seem to be advocating the removal of sugar from the canteens on that basis to ensure consistency with the vending machines. The policy was introduced to try to reduce people's sugar intake, and I hold up my hand as someone who takes sugar in coffee or tea—a habit that is increasingly being equated with asking to smoke in public. Nevertheless, I understand that the policy is in place to reduce people's sugar intake in hospitals. I will soon, over the course of the next few weeks, join those who do not take sugar in their tea or coffee.

ymddiriedolaeth rheilffordd. Yr ydym yn edrych i ganfod ffyrdd i gefnogi'r gwaith cychwynnol yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Disgwylwn wneud penderfyniad cyn bo hir.

### Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Rheng Flaen

**C10 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ansawdd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus rheng flaen yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2986(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wedi gwella'n sylweddol ers creu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mhob maes.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr ydym i gyd yn amlwg wedi ymrwymo i ragoriaeth mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac, yn y dyddiau ariannol dyrys hyn, yr oedd arnaf eisiau sôn wrthyf am rywbeth nad oes unrhyw gost yn gysylltiedig ag ef, sef y broblem gyda chyfarwyddiadau sydd wedi'u rhoi gan y Llywodraeth mewn perthynas â pheiriannau gwerthu bwyd mewn ysbytai. Yr ydym bellach mewn sefyllfa lle na all cleifion, nyrsys nac ymwelwyr—mae pobl wedi dod ataf i gwyno am hyn—gael cwpanaid o de neu goffi gyda siwgr pan fydd y siop wedi cau, oherwydd cyfarwyddeb weinidogol. Pan fydd y siop ar agor, gallwch gael te neu goffi gyda chymaint o siwgr ag y mynnwch; gallwch gael teisen siocled neu beth bynnag, ond ni allwch gael cwpanaid o de neu goffi gyda siwgr pan fydd y siop wedi cau, oherwydd cyfarwyddeb weinidogol. A wnewch chi edrych ar hynny, oherwydd mae'n ymddangos yn benderfyniad hurt? Mae'n broblem arbennig i bobl â chlefyd siwgr.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych fel pe baech yn dadlau dros ddileu siwgr o'r cantinau ar y sail honno i sicrhau cysondeb â'r peiriannau gwerthu. Cyflwynwyd y polisi i geisio cael pobl i gymryd llai o siwgr, ac yr wyf yn dal fy nwylo i fyny fel un sy'n cymryd siwgr mewn coffi neu de—arferiad sydd fwyfwy'n cael ei drin yr un fath â gofyn am gael ysmegu mewn man cyhoeddus. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn deall mai amcan y polisi yw cael pobl i gymryd llai o siwgr mewn ysbytai. Yn fuan, yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf, byddaf fi'n ymuno â'r rhai nad ydynt yn cymryd siwgr yn eu te na'u coffi.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ddatganiad mentrus ac am ei atebion i'r cwestiynau.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, First Minister, for your ambitious statement and for your answers.

### **Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement**

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** The only change to this afternoon's planned business is the postponement of the Minister for Health and Social Services's updating statement on osteoporosis to a date to be confirmed. Business for the next three weeks is as is set out in the business statement and announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Yr unig newid i fusnes arfaethedig y prynhawn yma yw gohirio datganiad diweddarau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar osteoporosis hyd ddyddiad i'w gadarnhau. Bydd busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i gwelir yn y datganiad a'r cyhoeddiad busnes, sydd i'w gweld ym mhapurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar ffurf electronig.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I seek two statements, Minister. One is from the Minister for Rural Affairs. Last year, when Dairy Farmers of Britain Limited went into liquidation, the Minister used her discretion to bring single farm payments forward to the middle of October. We have had a small amount of rain this morning, but many farmers have approached me over the past few weeks lamenting the fact that the dry weather is putting enormous pressure on winter forage, and there are other considerations. If the Minister was so inclined as to use that discretionary power, it would give farmers a reliable income stream going into the autumn and put them in a far more confident position to negotiate prices. Could the Minister make a statement on her ability to use those powers should the dry weather continue? While we all celebrate the wonderful weather that we are currently enjoying from a tourism perspective, I am sure that many of us will appreciate, when driving in the countryside, the sparsity of fodder available, which will cause a real problem as we enter the winter months.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Ceisiaf ddau ddatganiad, Weinidog. Gan y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig y mae un. Y llynedd, pan ddaeth Dairy Farmers of Britain Limited i ben, defnyddiodd y Gweinidog ei disgresiwn i ddod â'r taliadau sengl ymlaen i ganol mis Hydref. Yr ydym wedi cael diferyn o law'r bore yma, ond mae llawer o ffermwyr wedi dod ataf yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf yn cwyno am y ffaith fod y tywydd sych yn rhoi pwysau aruthrol ar borthiant y gaef, ac y mae ystyriaethau eraill. Pe bai'r Gweinidog yn tueddu at ddefnyddio'r pŵer dewisol hwnnw, byddai'n rhoi ffrwd incwm ddibynadwy i ffermwyr wrth fynd i mewn i'r hydref ac yn eu rhoi mewn safle llawer mwy hyderus i negodi prisiau. A allai'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad am ei gallu i ddefnyddio'r pwerau hynny pe bai'r tywydd sych yn parhau? Er ein bod i gyd yn dathlu'r tywydd bendigedig yr ydym ei fwynhau ar hyn o bryd o safbwynt twristiaeth, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer ohonom yn sylweddoli, wrth yrru yng nghefn gwlad, prinder y porthiant sydd ar gael, a fydd yn achosi problem go iawn wrth inni fynd i fisoedd y gaef.

Secondly, the financial pressures on the NHS are considerable. I have been approached by many constituents who perhaps lack an understanding of the devolution settlement and think that the Westminster Government's commitment to health spending applies here, and they are now seeing considerable cuts in

Yn ail, mae'r pwysau ariannol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn sylweddol. Mae llawer o etholwyr wedi dod ataf sydd efallai heb ddeall y cytundeb datganoli ac sy'n meddwl bod ymrwymiad Llywodraeth San Steffan i wario ar iechyd yn weithredol yma, ac maent yn awr yn gweld toriadau

the health budget in Wales when the NHS budget in England is protected. I would be grateful if the Minister for Health and Social Services could make a statement indicating the Welsh Assembly Government's support for health boards with regard to the financial considerations. Two Assembly committees have taken evidence indicating that considerable cuts are already being made across the NHS budget. We would welcome the opportunity to cross-examine the Minister here, by means of a statement, so that we could put to her the points that many constituents are raising with us.

**Jane Hutt:** The Minister for Rural Affairs, Elin Jones, will be very much aware of the impact of the continuing dry weather on the farming community, although it has changed overnight, west to north. I am sure that she will be aware of your question about the flexibility she has to make single farm payment arrangements.

On your second point, about the NHS, I am sure, Andrew, that you take up your responsibility to educate your constituents about the devolution settlement. You participated in the budget process and supported the 2010-11 budget that we are now implementing with our partners in the NHS in Wales. In preparing for what will be a very tough budget from 2011-12 onwards, we have made it clear that our priorities, which are the key to our allocations, are schools, skills, and the national health service. As the Minister for health has made clear in her many reports to committee, the cost of running the NHS continues to increase year on year, and she plays her part in ensuring that the delivery and improvement of NHS services is at the forefront of our priorities.

**Christine Chapman:** Minister, could we have a statement from the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government on the number of fires in Wales, particularly during this hot weather? We had a useful debate on fire and rescue services in May, but since then there have been a number of disturbing incidents. You will know that Ynysboeth Infant School,

sylweddol yn y gyllideb iechyd yng Nghymru tra bod cyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn Lloegr wedi'i warchod. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad yn nodi cefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fyrddau iechyd o ran yr ystyriaethau ariannol. Mae dau bwyllgor Cynulliad wedi derbyn tystiolaeth yn nodi bod toriadau sylweddol eisoes yn cael eu gwneud ar draws cyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd. Croesawem y cyfle i groesholi'r Gweinidog yma, drwy gyfrwng datganiad, fel y gallem gyflwyno iddi'r pwyntiau y mae llawer o etholwyr yn eu codi gyda ni.

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, Elin Jones, yn ymwybodol iawn o effaith y tywydd sych parhaus ar y gymuned ffermio, er ei fod wedi newid dros nos, o'r gorllewin i'r gogledd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ymwybodol o'ch cwestiwn am yr hyblygrwydd sydd ganddi i wneud trefniadau taliad sengl.

Ar eich ail bwynt, ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, yr wyf yn siŵr, Andrew, eich bod yn ymgymryd â'ch cyfrifoldeb i addysgu eich etholwyr am y cytundeb datganoli. Cymrasoch ran ym mhroses y gyllideb a chefnogi cyllideb 2010-11 yr ydym yn awr yn ei gweithredu gyda'n partneriaid yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Wrth baratoi ar gyfer cyllideb a fydd yn un galed iawn o 2011-12 ymlaen, yr ydym wedi datgan yn glir mai ein blaenoriaethau, sef yr allwedd i'n dyraniadau, yw ysgolion, sgiliau, a'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog iechyd yn eglur yn ei hadroddiadau niferus i'r pwyllgor, mae cost rhedeg y gwasanaeth iechyd yn dal i godi flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ac mae hi'n chwarae ei rhan i sicrhau bod cyflenwi a gwella gwasanaethau'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn flaenllaw yn ein blaenoriaethau.

**Christine Chapman:** Weinidog, a gaem ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol am y nifer o danau yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yn ystod y tywydd poeth hwn? Cawsom ddadl fuddiol ar wasanaethau tân ac achub ym Mai, ond ers hynny bu nifer o ddigwyddiadau ysgytwol. Gwyddoch y



which is in my constituency, was destroyed by fire last Friday. That has been devastating for the children, staff and the community. In addition, there have been a number of forest blazes in my area. I know that this is an experience shared by other Members. We should also focus on the safety of fire crews—there have been 24 attacks on firefighters in south Wales since January. In the most recent, a pellet missed a firefighter's eye by less than an inch as his crew was returning from tackling a blaze in the Cynon valley. I would be grateful for a statement on this issue. It would be useful, given that these men and women risk their lives daily.

2.50 p.m.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Christine, for bringing this matter to the attention of the Assembly. The Minister has heard your contribution. This is an opportunity for us to recognise the devastation that the pupils, staff and community that you represent must feel having seen their beloved school, Ynysboeth Infant School, go up in flames. The first national arson reduction strategy was published in 2007, and involves a multi-agency approach. Recognising the role that police and fire and rescue authorities play in tackling grass fires during the spring and summer as a result of dry weather is key. We have provided £600,000 to the police, fire and rescue authorities since 2007 to address these issues. However, this provides another opportunity—which I know the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government will want to join in—to pay tribute to the police and the fire and rescue authorities at what is a difficult time for them in terms of the dry weather.

**Darren Millar:** Minister, will you bring forward a statement during Government time from the Deputy First Minister and the Minister for Economy and Transport on access to broadband facilities in rural Wales? Questions have been put to the First Minister about this today, but we still have not had a full explanation as to how communities such as those in my constituency that are currently without broadband can access the European

dinistriwyd Ysgol Fabanod Ynysboeth, yn fy etholaeth i, gan dân ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Mae hynny wedi bod yn drychinebus i'r plant, y staff a'r gymuned. Yn ogystal, cafwyd nifer o danau coedwig yn fy ardal. Gwn fod hyn yn brofiad a rennir gan Aelodau eraill. Dylem ganolbwyntio hefyd ar ddiogelwch criwiau tân—cafwyd 24 o ymosodiadau ar ddiffoddwyr tân yn y De ers mis Ionawr. Yn yr un diweddaraf, methodd peled â tharo diffoddwr yn ei lygad o lai na modfedd wrth i'w griw ddychwelyd o ddiffodd tân yng nghwm Cynon. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am ddatganiad ar y mater hwn. Byddai'n fuddiol, o ystyried bod y dynion a'r menywod hyn yn peryglu'u bywydau bob dydd.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch, Christine, am ddod â'r mater hwn i sylw'r Cynulliad. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi clywed eich cyfraniad. Dyma gyfle inni gydnabod y tristwch alaethus y mae'r disgyblion, y staff a'r gymuned a gynrychiolwch yn ei deimlo, mae'n siŵr, wedi gweld eu hannwyl ysgol, Ysgol Fabanod Ynysboeth, yn wenfflam. Cyhoeddwyd y strategaeth genedlaethol gyntaf ar gyfer lleihau tanau bwriadol yn 2007, ac mae'n cynnwys sawl asiantaeth. Mae cydnabod y rôl y mae awdurdodau heddlu a than ac achub yn ei chwarae wrth fynd i'r afael â thanau glaswellt yn ystod y gwanwyn a'r haf yn sgîl tywydd sych yn allweddol. Yr ydym wedi darparu £600,000 i'r awdurdodau heddlu, tân ac achub ers 2007 i ddelio â'r materion hyn. Fodd bynnag, dyma gyfle arall—y gwn y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn awyddus i ymuno ynddo—i dalu teyrnged i'r heddlu a'r awdurdodau tân ac achub ar adeg sy'n anodd iawn iddynt o ran y tywydd sych.

**Darren Millar:** Weinidog, a ddewch chi ymlaen â datganiad yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth ar fynediad at gyfleusterau band eang yn y Gymru wledig? Mae cwestiynau wedi'u gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog am hyn heddiw, ond nid ydym eto wedi cael eglurhad llawn o ran sut y gall cymunedau fel y rhai yn fy etholaeth i sydd heb fand eang ar

funds that the Deputy First Minister said would be available to them in January of this year. I find it regrettable that we are told time and again that this is a priority, yet nothing has come forward on how people can access these funds. I urge you to bring forward a statement as soon as possible. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I always want to hear Darren Millar's questions.

**Jane Hutt:** You had an opportunity to raise these questions last week when the Deputy First Minister and Minister for Economy and Transport answered questions. I will repeat what he said in his response to a question from Mick Bates, which is that he will be making an announcement shortly about extending the ability of people to access funds to deliver broadband to hard-to-reach areas. The new scheme, which is supported by European funding, would be part of the current regional innovative broadband support scheme, which will be part of that announcement.

**Chris Franks:** Minister, could we have a statement from Welsh Ministers regarding the discussions that they have held concerning the electrification of the main line from London to Cardiff and beyond? We saw the lack of robustness of the network system last week, when one incident caused a huge delay in trains coming into Wales. Furthermore, what assessment has the Welsh Government made of the Severn barrage since the UK Government—[*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. A variety of pronunciation is permitted in the Chamber.

**Chris Franks:** It is the local dialect in Dinas Powys, as the former First Minister will be aware. What assessment has the Welsh Government made of the Severn barrage, following the statement from the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change that a major barrage would be unaffordable?

Finally, can we have a response from the Government following the seaside tourism industry report? Towns such as Barry and Penarth do not appear to figure very well in

hyn o bryd gael yr arian Ewropeaidd y dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y byddai ar gael iddynt ym mis Ionawr eleni. Testun gofid i mi yw y dywedir wrthym dro ar ôl tro fod hyn yn flaenoriaeth, ond nad oes dim byd wedi dod ymlaen ynghylch sut y gall pobl gael yr arian hwn. Fe'ch anogaf i ddod â datganiad ymlaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae arnaf eisiau clywed cwestiynau Darren Millar bob amser.

**Jane Hutt:** Cawsoch gyfle i godi'r cwestiynau hyn yr wythnos diwethaf pan oedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn ateb cwestiynau. Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedodd yn ei ateb i gwestiwn gan Mick Bates, sef y bydd yn gwneud cyhoeddiad yn fuan ynglŷn ag ehangu gallu pobl i gael arian i gyflwyno band eang i ardaloedd anodd eu cyrraedd. Byddai'r cynllun newydd, a gefnogir ag arian Ewropeaidd, yn rhan o'r cynllun cefnogi band eang arloesol rhanbarthol presennol, a fydd yn rhan o'r cyhoeddiad hwnnw.

**Chris Franks:** Weinidog, a gaem ddatganiad gan Weinidogion Cymru ynglŷn â'r trafodaethau y maent wedi'u cynnal ynghylch trydanu'r brif lein o Lundain i Gaerdydd a thu hwnt? Gwelsom ddiffyg cadernid y system rhwydwaith yr wythnos diwethaf, pryd yr achosodd un digwyddiad oedi mawr i drenau a ddeuai i Gymru. Ymhellach, pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud o forglawdd Hafren ers i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Caniateir amrywiaeth ynganiad yn y Siambr.

**Chris Franks:** Dyna'r dafodiaith leol yn Ninas Powys, fel y gŵyr y cyn Brif Weinidog. Pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud o forglawdd Hafren, yn dilyn y datganiad gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd na ellid fforddio morglawdd mawr?

Yn olaf, a gawn ni ymateb gan y Llywodraeth yn dilyn yr adroddiad ar y diwydiant twristiaeth glan môr? Nid yw'n ymddangos bod trefi fel y Barri a Phenarth yn

this report, and I am concerned that whereas only 200 people seem to be employed in the tourism industry Barry, the figure is 1,400 in Porthcawl.

**Jane Hutt:** Wales suffered from being absent from the new UK coalition Government's budget last week; there was a not spot in terms of the announcements that we were looking for. I hope that the absence of an announcement about the electrification of the Great Western main line from Swansea to London does not indicate that it will not happen. I am sure that colleagues on the other side of the Chamber and to my left are working hard to ensure—as the Secretary of State for Wales, to be fair, said she would—that we get the electrification of the main line. The outgoing Labour Government in Westminster made a commitment to ensure that the electrification of the line went through to Swansea. Clearly, we need it, in light of all of the delays that we have heard about today—which I was subject to when I went to visit the Chief Secretary to the Treasury. I am talking about when a train comes to a stop and you are told to get off the train. That has to be addressed by updating, modernising and the electrification of the Great Western main line. The Deputy First Minister is raising this issue with the new Secretary of State for Transport and working with the Department for Transport on a programme to electrify the Great Western main line. We are waiting to hear Wales being recognised in the next announcements that will come from the new UK coalition Government.

I turn to your point about the Severn barrage, as I would pronounce it, which is an important one with regard to an update on the current situation. You will know that the current Severn tidal power feasibility study is examining, in detail, different options for exploiting the potential of a barrage. The Cardiff-Weston barrage, commonly known as the Severn barrage, is one of the five options being considered under the study. We await the results of that feasibility study.

I turn now to your points about seaside towns and tourism, particularly in relation to this

edrych yn dda iawn yn yr adroddiad hwn, ac yr wyf yn bryderus mai dim ond 200 o bobl, mae'n debyg, a gyflogir yn y diwydiant twristiaeth yn y Barri, tra mai 1,400 yw'r ffigur ym Mhorthcawl.

**Jane Hutt:** Dioddefodd Cymru o fod yn absennol o gyllideb Llywodraeth glymblaid newydd y Deyrnas Unedig yr wythnos diwethaf; yr oedd yma fan digyswllt yn nhermau'r cyhoeddiadau yr oeddem yn edrych amdanynt. Gobeithio nad yw absenoldeb cyhoeddiad am drydanu prif lein y Great Western o Abertawe i Lundain ddim yn golygu na wnaiff ddigwydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod cyd-Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr ac ar y chwith imi'n gweithio'n galed i sicrhau—fel y dywedodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, er tegwch iddi, y gwnâi hithau—y cawn drydanu'r brif lein. Gwnaeth yr hen Lywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan ymrwymiad i sicrhau bod trydanu'r lein yn mynd drwodd i Abertawe. Yn amlwg, mae arnom ei angen, yn wyneb yr holl oediadau yr ydym wedi clywed amdanynt heddiw—y profais innau hwynt pan euthum i weld Prif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys. Sôn yr wyf am adegau pan ddaw trê'n i stop a dywedir wrthyhych am fynd oddi ar y trê'n. Rhaid datrys hynny drwy ddiweddarau, moderneiddio a thrydanu prif lein y Great Western. Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn codi'r mater hwn gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd dros Drafnidiaeth ac yn gweithio gyda'r Adran Drafnidiaeth ar raglen i drydanu prif lein y Great Western. Yr ydym yn aros i glywed gair am Gymru yn y cyhoeddiadau nesaf a ddaw oddi wrth Lywodraeth glymblaid newydd y Deyrnas Unedig.

Trof at eich pwynt am forglawdd Hafren, fel y byddwn i'n ei ynganu, sy'n un pwysig o ran diweddariad am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf. Byddwch yn gwybod bod yr astudiaeth ddichonoldeb bresennol i bŵer llanw Hafren yn archwilio, yn fanwl, wahanol ddewisiadau ar gyfer manteisio ar botensial morglawdd. Morglawdd Caerdydd-Weston, a adwaenir yn gyffredin fel morglawdd Hafren, yw un o'r pum dewis a ystyrir dan yr astudiaeth. Disgwyliwn am ganlyniadau'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb honno.

Trof yn awr at eich pwynt am drefi glan môr a thwristiaeth, yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun

wonderful weather. Barry island was certainly full to the brim with tourists last weekend. Seaside towns are worth £300 million to the Welsh economy, according to a Sheffield Hallam University report. In terms of investment, five of the seven regeneration areas in Wales are coastal areas. You mentioned Porthcawl, which is not part of a regeneration area. It is important to recognise that local authorities have a role to play with regard to tourism input. One aim of the regeneration action plan in Barry is to link the town centre more closely with the waterfront, supporting transport links and the tourist industry in the town, as well as on the beach and at the seaside.

**Mark Isherwood:** I would like to call for two statements. The first is on rail infrastructure in north-east Wales. I am advised that the grip costings for the double tracking between Saltney and Wrexham are six months late, and that Network Rail has put them back several times this year. I understand that the money from the Welsh Government has been on the table for two years, with no sign of anything happening. Leaked information suggests that the dynamic loop between the bridges has been dropped due to the cost, leaving only the double track between the bridges, which would mean a botched job on the most important strategic single rail track in Wales, with the third largest conurbation in Wales. We therefore need confirmation that the dynamic loop between the bridges is still within the budget, especially after the third-rail electrification of the Bidston-Wrexham was dropped, due—I am told—to a national rail costing scheme that was almost treble what experts said it would cost.

My second request for a statement calls for Members to be updated on the progress of the neurosciences reviews in north Wales and in mid and south Wales. At a meeting of the cross-party group on neurosciences last week, Members learned that the north Wales project group is now progressing well, although it was slow to get started after the recommendations were sent to the Minister for Health and Social Services last autumn. In contrast, the progress of the mid and south Wales group, which started almost

y tywydd bendigedig hwn. Yr oedd ynys y Barri'n sicr dan ei sang â thwristiaid y penwythnos diwethaf. Mae trefi glan môr yn werth £300 miliwn i economi Cymru, yn ôl adroddiad gan Brifysgol Hallam Sheffield. Yn nhermau buddsoddi, ardaloedd arfordirol yw pump o'r saith ardal adfywio yng Nghymru. Cyfeiriasoch at Borthcawl, nad yw'n rhan o ardal adfywio. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod gan awdurdodau lleol rôl i'w chwarae o ran mewnbwn twristiaeth. Un nod gan y cynllun adfywio yn y Barri yw cysylltu canol y dref yn agosach â glan y môr, gan gynnal cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth a'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn y dref, yn ogystal ag ar y traeth ac ar lan y môr.

**Mark Isherwood:** Hoffwn alw am ddau ddatganiad. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â seilwaith rheilffyrdd yn y gogledd-ddwyrain. Dywedir wrthyf fod costiau craff am y tracio dwbl rhwng Saltney a Wrecsam chwe mis yn hwyr, a bod Network Rail wedi'u gohirio sawl gwaith eleni. Deallaf fod yr arian oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cymru wedi bod ar y bwrdd ers dwy flynedd, heb unrhyw arwydd fod dim yn digwydd. Awgryma gwybodaeth a ollyngwyd fod y ddolen ddeinamig rhwng y pontydd wedi'i hepgor oherwydd y gost, gan adael dim ond y trac dwbl rhwng y pontydd, a fyddai'n golygu gwaith carbwl ar y trac rheilffordd sengl strategol pwysicaf yng Nghymru, gyda'r drydedd gyref fwyaf yng Nghymru. Felly mae arnom angen cadarnhad fod y ddolen ddeinamig rhwng y pontydd yn dal o fewn y gyllideb, yn enwedig ar ôl i waith trydanu trydedd reilffordd Bidston-Wrecsam gael ei ollwng, a hynny oherwydd—meddir wrthyf fi—cynllun costio rheilffyrdd cenedlaethol a oedd bron dair gwaith yn fwy na'r hyn yr oedd arbenigwyr wedi dweud y byddai'n ei gostio.

Mae fy ail gais am ddatganiad yn galw am roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau am waith yr adolygiadau niwrowyddorau yn y Gogledd ac yn y Canolbarth a'r De. Mewn cyfarfod o'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar niwrowyddorau yr wythnos diwethaf, hysbyswyd Aelodau fod grŵp prosiect y Gogledd yn bwrw iddi'n dda, er y bu'n araf yn cychwyn ar ôl i'r argymhellion gael eu hanfon at y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr hydref diwethaf. Yn wahanol i hyn, mae gwaith

immediately, has slowed. Meetings of the project team have been postponed repeatedly over the last three months. We therefore call for a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services to update the Senedd on when both these reviews will be completed and when service users can start to see the benefits.

**Jane Hutt:** The important point in response to your first request is that Welsh Assembly Government funding is in place for improvements to the rail infrastructure in north-east Wales. I am sure that you are playing your part as a regional Member, as is the Minister and his officials, to ensure that the partnership delivers in terms of the part played by Network Rail in moving this forward. It is important that you have raised this in the Chamber to reinforce the impact of its responsibility.

Regarding your point about the neurosciences review and delivery in north-east Wales, this is one of the important benefits of all-party groups, and I was able to pop along to one last week to ascertain progress on delivering these issues. I am sure that the Minister for Health and Social Services will update you in due course.

3.00 p.m.

**Leanne Wood:** I would like to raise two matters with you this afternoon. The first involves my concerns about the potential impact of the Westminster budget cuts on public services at a local government level in Wales. I understand that local government makes its own decisions, but two matters have come up in the last week that concern me greatly. One involves the concerns of Professor Hugh Pennington, and what he has said about the danger of cuts to the regulation of food hygiene services. His concern is the prevention of another E. coli outbreak, and none of us can forget the tragic consequences of the outbreak in 2005—an episode that we cannot afford to risk repeating.

grŵp y Canolbarth a'r De, a ddechreuodd bron yn syth bin, wedi arafu. Mae cyfarfodydd y tîm prosiect wedi'u gohirio droeon dros y tri mis diwethaf. Galwn felly am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Senedd ynghylch pa bryd y cwblheir y ddau adolygiad hyn a pha bryd y gall defnyddwyr gwasanaethau ddechrau gweld y buddion.

**Jane Hutt:** Y pwynt pwysig mewn ymateb i'ch cais cyntaf yw bod cyllid ar gael gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwelliannau i'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod chi'n chwarae eich rhan fel Aelod rhanbarthol, fel y mae'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion, i sicrhau bod y bartneriaeth yn bwrw'r maen i'r wal o safbwynt y rhan a chwaraeir gan Network Rail i symud hyn ymlaen. Mae'n bwysig eich bod wedi codi hyn yn y Siambr er mwyn atgyfnerthu effaith ei gyfrifoldeb.

Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am yr adolygiad niwrowyddorau a'i waith yn y Gogledd-ddwyrain, dyma un o fanteision pwysig grwpiau trawsbleidiol, a llwyddais i bicio draw i un yr wythnos diwethaf i ganfod pa gamau oedd yn digwydd i gyflawni'r materion hyn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y rhydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ichi maes o law.

**Leanne Wood:** Hoffwn godi dau fater gyda chi'r prynhawn yma. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â'm pryderon ynghylch effaith bosibl toriadau cyllideb San Steffan ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus ar lefel llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn deall bod llywodraeth leol yn gwneud ei phenderfyniadau ei hun, ond mae dau fater wedi codi yn yr wythnos ddiwethaf sy'n peri pryder mawr imi. Un yw pryderon yr Athro Hugh Pennington, a'r hyn y mae wedi'i ddweud am berygl cwtogi ar reoleiddio gwasanaethau hylendid bwyd. Atal haint E.coli arall yw ei bryder, ac ni all neb ohonom anghofio canlyniadau trasig yr haint yn 2005—digwyddiad na allwn fforddio mentro'i ailadrodd.

There is also a risk that cuts to local government funding could impact upon social services departments. We heard earlier about the publication of a report from Rhondda Cynon Taf's local safeguarding children board following a serious case review into the death of 13-year-old Cherele Ardle. The board found that there was not enough information sharing and communication between the agencies involved in the care of Cherele.

Before this austerity drive, social workers were finding it difficult to prioritise time for communication and information sharing, because they are often fire-fighting with very large and difficult caseloads, and there is not enough time for that proper, inter-agency communication. These problems are bound to be exacerbated by more cuts to local government funding. Therefore a debate on the implications of those cuts to local authority budgets, and specifically these issues that are a matter of life and death, would be most welcome.

I also want to raise with you concerns that I have expressed previously over the management of the Wales Audit Office. It has recently come to my attention that a senior official at the audit office was given a payoff of £107,580, and had his pension payments guaranteed until the day he retires. Two months after leaving the Wales Audit Office, this employee was appointed chief operating officer at the Financial Reporting Council. I am sure that you will agree that that is a decision that deserves detailed scrutiny. I know that previous scrutiny powers proposed for the Wales Audit Office in the past have not materialised because the relevant legislation did not get through the wash-up at the UK Parliament before the general election. However, I ask that this issue is revisited, because we need a robust system in place whereby we, as Assembly Members, can delve into and scrutinise the workings and decisions of the Wales Audit Office just as it scrutinises the activities of other public bodies in Wales. Will you arrange for a statement to be made to this Assembly outlining how the Assembly can scrutinise the scrutinisers?

Y mae perygl hefyd y gallai toriadau yng nghyllid llywodraeth leol effeithio ar adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Clywsom yn gynharach am gyhoeddi adroddiad gan fwrdd diogelu plant lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf yn dilyn adolygiad achos difrifol yn sgîl marwolaeth Cherele Ardle, 13 mlwydd oed. Canfu'r bwrdd nad oedd digon o rannu gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu rhwng yr asiantaethau a oedd yn ymwneud â gofal Cherele.

Cyn y dyddiau darbodus hyn, yr oedd gweithwyr cymdeithasol yn ei chael yn anodd blaenoriaethu amser i gyfathrebu a rhannu gwybodaeth, am eu bod yn aml yn diffodd tanau gyda llwythi achosion mawr a dyrys iawn, ac nid oes digon o amser i gyfathrebu'n iawn rhwng asiantaethau. Mae'r problemau hyn yn siŵr o gael eu gwaethygu gan ragor o doriadau yng nghyllid llywodraeth leol. Felly byddai dadl ar oblygiadau'r toriadau hynny i gyllidebau awdurdodau lleol, ac yn benodol i'r pethau hyn sy'n fater o fyw neu farw, yn dderbyniol iawn.

Mae arnaf eisiau codi gyda chi hefyd bryderon yr wyf wedi'u mynegi o'r blaen ynglŷn â rheolaeth Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Daeth i'm sylw'n ddiweddar y rhoddwyd taliad terfynol o £107,580 i uwch swyddog yn y swyddfa archwilio, a gwarantu ei daliadau pensiwn tan y dydd y bydd yn ymddeol. Ddau fis wedi gadael Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, penodwyd y gweithiwr hwn yn brif swyddog gweithredu yn y Cyngor Adroddiadau Ariannol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod hynny'n benderfyniad sy'n haeddu craffu manwl. Gwn nad yw pwerau craffu blaenorol a gynigiwyd i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn y gorffennol wedi dod i fodolaeth oherwydd nad aeth y ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol drwy'r sesiwn cau pen y mwdwl yn Senedd y Deyrnas Unedig cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am edrych eto ar y mater hwn, oherwydd mae arnom angen cael system gadarn lle gallwn ni, Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ymchwilio a chraffu ar weithredoedd a phenderfyniadau Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn union fel y mae hithau'n craffu ar weithgareddau cyrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru. A wnewch chi drefnu datganiad i'r Cynulliad yn amlinellu sut y gall y Cynulliad graffu ar y craffwyr?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If any statement is to be made about governance in relation to the Wales Audit Office and this Assembly it will be made by me. It is not a matter for the Minister. However, clearly, the Minister has been very helpful in the past in promoting legislation through the UK Parliament for us to achieve our objectives as an Assembly Commission, and I am sure that she will do so again.

**Jane Hutt:** That was the very point that I was going to make in response—this is a matter for the Assembly and the Public Accounts Committee. I am sure that your comments will have been noted. We are certainly seeking a legislative opportunity to follow through on the proposed new scrutiny powers for the audit office, and we are doing so in consultation with Jonathan Morgan, the Chair of the Public Accounts Committee.

On your first point—and perhaps leading to your second point—about how we can protect and safeguard front-line services, it is important that we recognise that the work of environmental health officers is a front-line service, and the investment into and safeguarding of food hygiene and security is critical to implementing the recommendations of the report of Professor Hugh Pennington. We have of course debated that, and, as a Government, we have taken it on board over the past weeks and months. It is important in relation to social services and the fact that the poorest and most vulnerable children and young people in Wales are going to be hit hard by this budget. The priorities of local government—not just those through the revenue support grant but its own priorities—must be clear with regard to putting children's services and social care at the forefront. That is a point that we have been discussing with our colleagues in the Welsh Local Government Association.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for Business and Budget for the statement. I want to raise two items with her for possible statements. The first relates to the banks and

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os oes unrhyw ddatganiad i'w wneud ynghylch llywodraethu mewn perthynas â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a'r Cynulliad hwn fe'i gwneir gennyf fi. Nid mater i'r Gweinidog mohono. Fodd bynnag, yn amlwg, mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn barod iawn ei chymorth yn y gorffennol wrth hyrwyddo deddfwriaeth drwy Senedd y Deyrnas Unedig er mwyn inni allu cyflawni ein hamcanion fel Comisiwn Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hi felly eto.

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna'r union bwynt yr oeddwn yn mynd i'w wneud wrth ymateb—mater i'r Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yw hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddir wedi nodi eich sylwadau. Yr ydym yn bendant yn ceisio cyfle deddfwriaethol i ddilyn drwodd ar y pwerau craffu newydd arfaethedig i'r swyddfa archwilio, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny mewn ymgynghoriad â Jonathan Morgan, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus.

Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt cyntaf—ac yn arwain o bosibl at eich ail bwynt—ynghylch sut y gallwn warchod a diogelu gwasanaethau rheng flaen, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod bod gwaith swyddogion iechyd amgylcheddol yn wasanaeth rheng flaen, ac mae diogelu a buddsoddi mewn hylendid a diogelwch bwyd yn hollbwysig i weithredu argymhellion adroddiad yr Athro Hugh Pennington. Yr ydym wedi trafod hynny, wrth reswm, ac, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi mynd i'r afael ag ef dros yr wythnosau a'r misoedd diwethaf. Mae'n bwysig yng nghyd-destun gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r ffaith fod plant a phobl ifanc mwyaf bregus Cymru'n mynd i gael ergyd galed gan y gyllideb hon. Rhaid i flaenoriaethau llywodraeth leol—nid blaenoriaethau'r grant cynnal refeniw'n unig ond ei blaenoriaethau ei hun—fod yn glir o safbwynt rhoi lle blaenllaw i wasanaethau plant a gofal cymdeithasol. Dyna bwynt yr ydym wedi bod yn ei drafod gyda'n cymheiriaid yng Nghymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb am y datganiad. Hoffwn godi dwy eitem gyda hi a allai alw am ddatganiadau. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â'r

particularly the flow of credit in Wales, which has been raised with me on many occasions by constituents and businesses. This issue is a serious concern and the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, for example, may also wish to come forward with a statement. I will give you a fairly typical example, which is the case of Alun Richards of Tŷ-croes, which is just outside Ammanford, who is a constituent of mine whom I recently visited. He was asked to diversify out of dairy farming and he now runs a successful business park that provides 40 jobs and fantastic commercial opportunities in that part of the Amman valley. However, he is having difficulty in keeping the flow of credit from Lloyds TSB, which, the last time I looked, was largely, if not totally, owned by us, the people. There appears to be an issue with regard to the flow of credit for businesses throughout Wales, which could, perhaps, be facilitated here, Minister.

The second issue relates to the written statement that we have had today from the Minister for Heritage relating to the funding from the Arts Council of Wales. Could we have a debate on the principles that lie behind the statement and the decisions made on the arts council's funding, given that there will be a withdrawal of money from many bodies across Wales, which would want the reassurance of knowing that this had been fully debated in the Assembly. I have looked at the list and there are many excellent bodies on it, such as Wyeside Arts Centre, Theatr Powys, Theatr Harlech and many others that are worthy of support. Therefore, we need to debate the principles that lie behind the decisions that have been made.

**Jane Hutt:** The issue around the flow of credit has not only been at the forefront of the work that we have done to lead Wales out of the recession, particularly our discussions with the banks attending our economic summits, but also follows through to the work of the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport, and will be a key part of the engagement through the economic renewal programme that he will shortly be announcing.

banciau ac yn enwedig llif credyd yng Nghymru, a godwyd gyda mi ar sawl achlysur gan etholwyr a busnesau. Mae'r mater hwn yn bryder difrifol ac efallai y bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, er enghraifft, yn awyddus i ddod ymlaen â datganiad hefyd. Rhoddaf enghraifft weddol nodweddiadol ichi, sef achos Alun Richards o Dŷ-croes, ychydig y tu allan i Rydaman, sy'n etholwr yr euthum i'w weld yn ddiweddar. Gofynnwyd iddo arallgyfeirio allan o ffermio llaeth a bellach mae'n rhedeg parc busnes llwyddiannus sy'n darparu 40 o swyddi a chyfleon masnachol ffantastig yn y rhan honno o gwm Aman. Fodd bynnag, mae'n cael anhawster cynnal llif credyd oddi wrth Lloyds TSB, a oedd, y tro diwethaf i mi edrych, i raddau helaeth, os nad yn gyfan gwbl, yn eiddo i ni, y bobl. Mae'n ymddangos bod problem gyda llif credyd i fusnesau drwy Gymru gyfan, y gellid, efallai, ei hwyluso yma, Weinidog.

Mae a wnelo'r ail fater â'r datganiad ysgrifenedig yr ydym wedi'i gael heddiu gan y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth ynglŷn â'r cyllid oddi wrth Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. A gaem ddadl ar yr egwyddorion sydd y tu ôl i'r datganiad hwnnw a'r penderfyniadau a wnaed ynghylch cyllid cyngor y celfyddydau? Bydd arian yn cael ei dynnu oddi wrth lawer o gyrff ledled Cymru, a hoffent gael y sicrwydd o wybod bod hyn wedi'i drafod yn llawn yn y Cynulliad. Yr wyf wedi edrych ar y rhestr ac mae'n cynnwys sawl corff rhagorol, fel Canolfan Gelfyddydau Glannau Gwy, Theatr Powys, Theatr Harlech a sawl un arall sy'n teilyngu cefnogaeth. Felly, mae angen inni drafod yr egwyddorion sydd y tu ôl i'r penderfyniadau sydd wedi'u gwneud.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r cwestiwn ynghylch llif credyd wedi bod yn flaenllaw yn y gwaith yr ydym wedi'i wneud i arwain Cymru allan o'r dirwasgiad, yn enwedig ein trafodaethau gyda'r banciau a fynychodd ein huwchgynadleddau economaidd. Mae hefyd yn dilyn drwodd i waith y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, a bydd yn rhan allweddol o'r ymgysylltu drwy'r rhaglen adnewyddu economaidd y bydd yn ei chyhoeddi cyn bo hir.



The statement was related to an announcement by the Arts Council of Wales on its investment review. The Minister for Heritage has made a written statement on that this afternoon.

**Alun Davies:** Minister, I would like to ask for a number of statements and debates. I will start by reiterating a point that has just been made by the leader of the opposition. The announcement made by the arts council this morning is significant and far-reaching for a number of communities up and down Wales. Therefore, it is important that we have an opportunity to debate those decisions and also to debate the rationale and the philosophy behind them, because this will have a substantial impact on all of our constituents.

I also want to ask for a further statement or debate on the impact of the digital switchover in Wales. That process has been completed, and, technically, it went well, therefore Digital UK is to be congratulated on how that process was managed. However, we are also aware that the process has led to a number of problems for people in different parts of Wales who are not receiving the service that they expected to receive following the marketing by different companies prior to the switchover. This has caused a great deal of concern among many people and I would appreciate it if the Minister for Heritage could make at least a written statement on this matter in the Assembly.

The third item on which I would like to ask for a statement is policing in Wales. We have already heard today the potential for absolutely horrific cuts in the police service, which will have a significant impact on our community safety responsibilities in Wales. It would be useful for the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government to make a statement on how he believes that these appalling cuts will impact on his responsibilities and on the safety of communities up and down Wales.

3.10 p.m.

Yr oedd y datganiad yn gysylltiedig â chyhoeddiad gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ar ei adolygiad o fuddsoddiad. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth wedi gwneud datganiad ysgrifenedig ynglŷn â hynny'r prynhawn yma.

**Alun Davies:** Weinidog, hoffwn ofyn am nifer o ddatganiadau a dadleuon. Dechreuaf drwy ailadrodd pwynt sydd newydd ei wneud gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid. Mae'r cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan gyngor y celfyddydau'r bore yma'n arwyddocaol a phellgyrhaeddol i nifer o gymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru. Felly, mae'n bwysig inni gael cyfle i drafod y penderfyniadau hynny a hefyd i drafod y rhesymeg a'r egwyddor y tu ôl iddynt, oherwydd caiff hyn effaith sylweddol ar ein hetholwyr i gyd.

Yr wyf yn awyddus hefyd i ofyn am ddatganiad pellach neu ddadl ar effaith y newid i ddigidol yng Nghymru. Mae'r broses honno wedi'i chwblhau, ac, yn dechnegol, fe aeth yn dda, felly rhaid llongyfarch Digital UK ar y modd y rheolwyd y broses honno. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ymwybodol hefyd fod y broses wedi arwain at nifer o broblemau i bobl mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru nad ydynt yn derbyn y gwasanaeth yr oeddent yn disgwyl ei dderbyn yn dilyn y marchnata gan wahanol gwmnïau cyn y newid. Mae hyn wedi achosi cryn bryder ymysg llawer o bobl ac fe werthfawrogwn pe gallai'r Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig, o leiaf, ar y mater hwn i'r Cynulliad.

Y drydedd eitem yr hoffwn ofyn am ddatganiad arni yw plismona yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi clywed eisoes heddiw am y potensial ar gyfer toriadau cwbl erchyll yng ngwasanaeth yr heddlu, a gaiff effaith sylweddol ar ein cyfrifoldebau diogelwch cymunedol yng Nghymru. Byddai'n fuddiol i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol wneud datganiad ynghylch sut y mae'n credu y bydd y toriadau ofnadwy hyn yn effeithio ar ei gyfrifoldebau ac ar ddiogelwch cymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru.

The final statement that I would like to ask for, Minister, concerns the budget statement that you will be making before recess. You have already told us that you will be making a supplementary budget statement in the Chamber. We are aware—and this came up during questions to the First Minister—that the UK Government budget is one of the most regressive budgets that we have seen in modern times. The impact on the poorest 10 per cent will be truly horrific. As part of your budget statement, will you ensure that you are able to describe how this budget will impact upon the Government and the provision of Government services? Due to the disproportionate impact on Wales, and on the poorest 10 per cent in the United Kingdom, we know that there will be an increased demand on the Government for services.

**Jane Hutt:** There were four requests for four statements there. I will briefly answer each of them. I think that I have already answered the point about the arts council review that has just been published. All Members have received a statement from the Minister for Heritage on that.

The point about digital switchover is important. Our officials are represented on the Digital UK stakeholder group to ensure that the switchover has been effective and that issues about analogue coverage are addressed. Addressing issues where there have been difficulties has been a real challenge. I know that it is not a devolved matter. The biggest challenge has been retuning. The call centre has increased its marketing to focus on retuning. That is an issue for the UK Government and others. Therefore, those questions should be directed elsewhere.

Policing is another non-devolved area. Carl Sargeant met the chief constables yesterday. This will all form part of the budget discussions as that time approaches. The budget statement that I will be making at the end of this session will be about how we will meet the challenge of finding the £186 million of cuts that Wales is expected to make, which were announced in May. It will

Mae'r datganiad olaf yr hoffwn ofyn ichi amdano, Weinidog, yn ymwneud â'r datganiad cyllideb y byddwch yn ei wneud cyn y gwyliau. Yr ydych wedi dweud wrthym eisoes y byddwch yn gwneud datganiad cyllideb atodol yn y Siambr. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol—a chododd hyn yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog—fod cyllideb Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn un o'r cyllidebau mwyaf atchweliadol yr ydym wedi'i weld yn y cyfnod modern. Bydd yr effaith ar y 10 y cant tlotaf yn wirioneddol erchyll. Fel rhan o'ch datganiad cyllideb, a wnewch chi sicrhau eich bod yn gallu disgrifio sut y bydd y gyllideb hon yn effeithio ar y Llywodraeth ac ar ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau'r Llywodraeth? Oherwydd yr effaith anghymesur ar Gymru, ac ar y 10 y cant tlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, gwyddom y bydd mwy o alw ar y Llywodraeth am wasanaethau.

**Jane Hutt:** Dyna bedwar cais am bedwar datganiad. Atebaf bob un ohonynt yn fyr. Credaf fy mod eisoes wedi ateb y pwynt ynghylch adolygiad cyngor y celfyddydau sydd newydd ei gyhoeddi. Mae pob Aelod wedi cael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth ynglŷn â hynny.

Mae'r pwynt am y newid i ddigidol yn bwysig. Mae gan ein swyddogion gynrychiolaeth ar fwrdd rhanddeiliaid Digital UK i sicrhau bod y newid wedi bod yn effeithiol ac yr ymdrinnir â phroblemau ynghylch derbyniad analog. Bu'n her go iawn delio â materion lle cafwyd anawsterau. Gwn nad yw'n fater datganoledig. Yr her fwyaf fu aildiwnio. Mae'r ganolfan alwadau wedi cynyddu ei marchnata i ganolbwyntio ar aildiwnio. Mae hynny'n fater i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ac eraill. Felly, dylid cyfeirio'r cwestiynau hynny i rywle arall.

Mae plismona'n faes arall sydd heb ei ddatganoli. Cyfarfu Carl Sargeant â'r prif gwnstabiliaid ddoe. Bydd hyn i gyd yn ffurfio rhan o drafodaethau'r gyllideb wrth i'r adeg honno ddynesu. Bydd y datganiad cyllideb a wnaaf ar ddiwedd y sesiwn hwn yn ymdrin â sut yr wynebwn yr her o ganfod y £186 miliwn o doriadau y disgwylir i Gymru eu gwneud, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mai. Bydd

be about how we are going to find them and what impacts they will have. These are serious and difficult decisions that we have to make, and I will bring that back to the Assembly. It is about how we can protect the most vulnerable and the poorest, and front-line services. I am sure that the Assembly will want to know that I am meeting the Chief Secretary to the Treasury and all the finance Ministers at a quadrilateral meeting on 15 July, and we look forward to receiving further clarification to help us to bring forward our draft budgets when the spending review is announced on October 20.

**Nick Ramsay:** I would like two statements from the Minister. First, as I am sure you are aware, this evening sees the launch of my cross-party group on asbestos, which Members from all parties have agreed to support. This continues to be a serious issue in Wales, and although it is an area for Westminster, primarily, the Assembly Government can have an input into it. Could we have an update on your Government's involvement with the new coalition Government in Westminster about how we can deal with asbestos and the problems of asbestos-related conditions that have seen 300 teachers suffering in Wales?

Secondly, in an answer to an earlier question raised by my colleague, Nick Bourne, the First Minister was rather dismissive of his request for a review of the regulations governing vending machines in Wales. This has been a major concern that has been raised with many Assembly Members. At present, if you go to hospital, you are unable to get sugar in your tea after a certain time. This is ludicrous. The First Minister may well be sweet enough, but many of us are not. People who suffer from diabetes often require sugar. The fact that they will be unable to get those items with sugar in after a certain time seems ludicrous and unhealthy in the extreme. Can we have a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on what she is going to do to address the concerns of patients and people working in the health service in Wales?

**Jane Hutt:** We all welcome the all-party group on asbestos. It requires a cross-

yn ymddiriedolaeth â sut yr ydym yn mynd i'w canfod a pha effeithiau a gânt. Mae'r rhain yn benderfyniadau difrifol ac anodd y mae'n rhaid i ni eu gwneud, ac fe ddof â hynny'n ôl i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n ymddiriedolaeth â sut y gallwn warchod y gwannaf a'r tlotaf, a gwasanaethau rheng flaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ar y Cynulliad eisiau gwybod y byddaf yn cwrdd â Phrif Ysgrifennydd y Trysorlys a phob Gweinidog cyllid mewn cyfarfod pedairochrog ar 15 Gorffennaf, ac edrychwn ymlaen at gael mwy o eglurhad i'n helpu i gyflwyno ein cyllidebau drafft pan gyhoeddir yr adolygiad gwariant ar Hydref 20.

**Nick Ramsay:** Hoffwn ddau ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog. Yn gyntaf, fel y gwyddoch, mae'n siŵr, heno gwelir lansio fy ngrŵp trawsbleidiol ar asbestos, y mae Aelodau o bob plaid wedi cytuno i'w gefnogi. Mae hyn yn parhau'n fater difrifol yng Nghymru, ac er mai maes i San Steffan ydyw'n bennaf, gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gael mewnbwn iddo. A gaem y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ymwneud eich Llywodraeth â'r Llywodraeth glymblaid newydd yn San Steffan ynghylch sut y gallwn ddelio ag asbestos a phroblemau cyflyrau cysylltiedig ag asbestos sydd wedi effeithio ar 300 o athrawon yng Nghymru?

Yn ail, mewn ateb i gwestiwn cynharach a godwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Nick Bourne, yr oedd y Prif Weinidog braidd yn ddibrisiol o'i gais am adolygu'r rheoliadau ynghylch peiriannau gwerthu bwyd yng Nghymru. Mae hyn wedi bod yn bryder mawr sydd wedi'i leisio i lawer o Aelodau Cynulliad. Ar hyn o bryd, os ewch i'r ysbyty, ni allwch gael siwgr yn eich te ar ôl amser arbennig. Mae hyn yn hurt. Efallai'n wir fod y Prif Weinidog yn ddigon melys, ond nid felly lawer ohonom. Mae ar bobl sy'n dioddef o'r clefyd siwgr angen siwgr yn aml. Mae'r ffaith na fyddant yn gallu cael yr eitemau hynny gyda siwgr ynddynt ar ôl amser penodol yn ymddangos yn hurt ac yn eithriadol o afiach. A gawn ni ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch beth y mae hi'n mynd i'w wneud i ateb pryderon cleifion a phobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru?

**Jane Hutt:** Yr ydym i gyd yn croesawu'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar asbestos. Mae'n galw

departmental and cross-Government—Welsh Assembly Government and the UK Government—response. Statements have been made on occasion, and I am sure that that will be taken forward in response to your first meeting.

I will say very little on the vending machines policy, except that, in education, we moved to introduce healthy vending machines in schools. That was a deliberate policy choice with regard to the health of children and young people. Particularly when engaged in choosing what would go in the vending machines, pupils reacted very well to the fact that they were no longer being confronted with machines that were full of pop and crisps and that they had the opportunity to get water, yoghurt and rolls or baguettes. That was a much better option, and that change transformed the health of the children in those schools. That is the important point to make with regard to what is on offer in vending machines in public buildings.

am ymateb trawsadrannol a thraws-Lywodraethol—Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae datganiadau wedi'u gwneud yn achlysurol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cymerir hynny yn ei flaen mewn ymateb i'ch cyfarfod cyntaf.

Ychydig iawn a ddywedaf am y polisi ynghylch peiriannau gwerthu bwyd, ac eithrio dweud, ym maes addysg, inni symud i gyflwyno peiriannau gwerthu iach mewn ysgolion. Yr oedd hynny'n ddewis polisi bwriadol gyda golwg ar iechyd plant a phobl ifanc. Yn enwedig pan gawsant lais mewn dewis beth a âi i mewn i'r peiriannau gwerthu, adweithiodd disgyblion yn dda iawn i'r ffaith nad oeddent mwyach yn dod wyneb yn wyneb â pheiriannau a oedd yn llawn pop a chreision, a bod ganddynt y cyfle i gael dŵr, iogwrt a bagéts neu roliau. Yr oedd hynny'n ddewis llawer gwell, a bu'r newid hwnnw'n fodd i drawsnewid iechyd y plant yn yr ysgolion hynny. Dyna'r pwynt pwysig i'w wneud ynglŷn â beth sydd ar gael mewn peiriannau gwerthu bwyd mewn adeiladau cyhoeddus.

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Jeff Cuthbert:** During the debate on the annual report of the Committee on Standards of Conduct on 23 June, Trish Law referred to a complaint that she had made to the National Assembly for Wales Commissioner for Standards against an unnamed Member. However, she complained that the standards commissioner, with the support of the committee Chair, deemed the complaint to be one of a minor nature that did not require any further action. This was because the Member concerned had apologised and offered to reimburse to any costs involved. By referring to an unnamed Member openly in Plenary, all Members were, potentially, put under a cloud of suspicion in the eyes of the public. I submit that such a reference could bring the whole Assembly into disrepute and that it is most regrettable.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yn ystod y ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad ar 23 Mehefin, cyfeiriodd Trish Law at gŵyn yr oedd hi wedi'i wneud i Gomisiynydd Safonau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn erbyn Aelod dienw. Fodd bynnag, cwynodd fod y comisiynydd safonau, gyda chefnogaeth Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, wedi dyfarnu bod y gŵyn yn un fân ei natur nad oedd yn galw am unrhyw gamau pellach. Y rheswm am hyn oedd bod yr Aelod dan sylw wedi ymddiheuro ac wedi cynnig ad-dalu unrhyw gostau perthnasol. Wrth gyfeirio at Aelod dienw'n agored mewn Cyfarfod Llawn, gellid dweud bod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad wedi'u rhoi dan gwmwl amheuaeth yn llygaid y cyhoedd. Cynigiau y gallai cyfeiriad o'r fath ddwyn anfri ar y Cynulliad cyfan a bod hynny'n destun gofid mawr.

I also submit that the actions and decisions of the commissioner and the committee Chair

Cynigiau hefyd fod gweithredoedd a phenderfyniadau'r comisiynydd a

fully accord with rule 10 of our procedure for dealing with complaints against Assembly Members. I am not aware that Trish Law had objected to our procedures until this incident. I further submit that the contribution made by Trish Law during that debate was not relevant to the report, because no such complaint had been referred by the commissioner to the committee for its consideration.

Furthermore, an article appeared in the *South Wales Argus* on 26 June in which Trish Law clearly suggested that the decisions of the standards commissioner amounted to brushing things under the carpet and a whitewash. I suggest that such public comments could be construed as misrepresenting the decision of the commissioner. So, I will be grateful for your ruling, Llywydd, that the standards commissioner and the committee Chair have acted in accordance with our agreed procedures and rules on this matter.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am grateful to Jeff Cuthbert as the Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct. I have had personal cause this very Assembly session to thank him for the way in which he has undertaken his role in furtherance of the proposed Measure and for the acceptance of the amendments that I proposed as Presiding Officer. I thank him for giving me prior notice, and I thank him for his work as the Chair of the Committee on Standards of Conduct. Therefore, having studied what has been said on this matter and the background, I am able, with authority, to give you the ruling that you ask for and to make it quite clear that the standards commissioner—who, again, has served this Assembly for more than 11 years effectively and discreetly, as is the role of such a commissioner, while at the same time promoting the highest standards—and the Chair of the committee indeed acted fully in accordance with our procedures on this matter.

3.20 p.m.

It might be well that I say some more. The role of the standards commissioner is to investigate complaints against Members in an

Chadeirydd y pwyllgor yn cyd-fynd yn llawn â rheol 10 ein gweithdrefn ar gyfer delio â chwynion yn erbyn Aelodau Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol fod Trish Law wedi gwrthwynebu ein gweithdrefnau tan y digwyddiad hwn. Cynigiau ymhellach nad oedd y cyfraniad a wnaeth Trish Law yn ystod y drafodaeth honno'n berthnasol i'r adroddiad, am nad oedd unrhyw gŵyn o'r fath wedi'i chyfeirio gan y comisiynydd i'r pwyllgor i'w ystyried.

At hynny, ymddangosodd erthygl yn y *South Wales Argus* ar 26 Mehefin lle awgrymodd Trish Law yn glir fod penderfyniadau'r comisiynydd safonau'n gyfystyr ag ysgubo pethau dan y carped a gwyngalchu. Awgrymaf y gellid dehongli bod sylwadau cyhoeddus o'r fath yn camliwio penderfyniad y comisiynydd. Felly, byddaf yn ddiolchgar am eich dyfarniad, Lywydd, fod y comisiynydd safonau a Chadeirydd y pwyllgor wedi gweithredu'n unol â'n gweithdrefnau a'n rheolau cytunedig ynglŷn â'r mater hwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Jeff Cuthbert fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Yr wyf wedi cael achos personol yn yr union sesiwn Cynulliad hwn i ddiolch iddo am y modd y mae wedi ymgymryd â'i rôl yn hyrwyddo'r Mesur arfaethedig ac am dderbyn y gwelliannau a gynigiais i fel Llywydd. Diolchaf iddo am roi rhagrybudd imi, a diolch iddo am ei waith fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Felly, wedi astudio'r hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud am y mater hwn a'r cefndir, yr wyf yn gallu, gydag awdurdod, rhoi ichi'r dyfarniad y gofynnwch amdano a datgan yn gwbl glir fod y comisiynydd safonau—sydd, eto, wedi gwasanaethu'r Cynulliad hwn ers dros 11 mlynedd yn effeithiol ac yn ddoeth, yn unol â swyddogaeth y cyfryw gomisiynydd, gan hyrwyddo'r safonau uchaf ar yr un pryd—a Chadeirydd y pwyllgor yn wir wedi gweithredu'n gwbl unol â'n gweithdrefnau ar y mater hwn.

Efallai y byddai'n beth da imi ddweud mwy. Rôl y comisiynydd safonau yw ymchwilio i gwynion yn erbyn Aelodau mewn modd

impartial and independent manner. It is also his role to work with and alongside Members, particularly in the Committee on Standards of Conduct, to promote a culture in the Assembly where the highest standards of behaviour are the norm. I referred earlier to the new Measure, which is now Welsh law, that lays upon the holder of the office of the commissioner a duty to promote the highest standards in public life in the role of an Assembly Member. As a result, I believe that we have a proud record that will be strengthened further now that we have put the office of commissioner for standards onto a statutory basis.

For the commissioner to undertake his role effectively, the independence of his office and the objectivity and right to investigate complaints, as he sees fit, must be accepted by all Assembly Members. It is out of order, therefore, for any Member in this Chamber to criticise the decisions or actions of the commissioner for standards, or his dealings with the Committee on Standards of Conduct. It is also out of order to refer to the detail of any individual complaint or investigation, as happened last week.

diduedd ac annibynnol. Ei rôl hefyd yw gweithio gydag Aelodau ac ochr yn ochr â hwy, yn enwedig yn y Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, i hyrwyddo diwylliant yn y Cynulliad lle mai'r safonau ymddygiad uchaf yw'r norm. Cyfeiriais yn gynharach at y Mesur newydd, sydd bellach yn gyfraith yng Nghymru, sy'n gosod dyletswydd ar y sawl sy'n dal swydd y comisiynydd i hyrwyddo'r safonau uchaf mewn bywyd cyhoeddus yn swyddogaeth Aelod Cynulliad. O ganlyniad, credaf fod gennym record falch a gaiff ei chryfhau ymhellach a ninnau'n awr wedi gosod swydd y comisiynydd safonau ar sail statudol.

I'r comisiwn gyflawni ei rôl yn effeithiol, rhaid i bob Aelod Cynulliad dderbyn annibyniaeth ei swydd a'r gwrthrychedd a'r hawl i ymchwilio i gwynion, fel y gwêl y bo'n briodol. Mae allan o drefn, felly, i unrhyw Aelod yn y Siambr hon feirniadu penderfyniadau neu weithredoedd y comisiynydd safonau, neu ei ymwneud â'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad. Mae allan o drefn hefyd cyfeirio at fanylion unrhyw gwyn neu ymchwiliad unigol, fel a ddigwyddodd yr wythnos diwethaf.

### **Datganiad am y Strategaeth Addysg Uwch 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol' Statement on the Higher Education 'For Our Future' Strategy**

**The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):** As my predecessor said in our higher education action plan, 'For Our Future', the higher education sector in Wales needs to change and change fast. We intend to build a higher education system in Wales that will be better placed to compete internationally on the basis of excellence, to help drive forward economic renewal, and to deliver social justice.

I sent a clear message to the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales in its remit letter that I wanted to see a step change in the pace of delivery. Today, I am pleased to announce that, in response, HEFCW has acted to deliver that change.

Last week, the Cabinet approved the higher education action plan, developed by HEFCW

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):** Fel y dywedodd fy rhagflaenydd yn ein cynllun gweithredu addysg uwch, 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol', mae angen i'r sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru newid a newid yn gyflym. Bwriadwn adeiladu system addysg uwch yng Nghymru a fydd mewn gwell sefyllfa i gystadlu'n rhyngwladol ar sail rhagoriaeth, er mwyn cynorthwyo i sbarduno adfywio'r economi, a sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Anfonais neges glir at Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn ei lythyr cylch gwaith yn dweud fy mod am weld pethau'n newid yn gyflymach. Heddiw, yr wyf yn falch o gyhoeddi bod y Cyngor Cyllido wedi ymateb drwy weithredu i sicrhau'r newid hwnnw.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cymeradwyodd y Cabinet y cynllun gweithredu addysg uwch, a

and embedded into its corporate strategy for 2010-11 to 2012-13. HEFCW's corporate strategy is being published on its website this afternoon.

Central to this will be a radical change in the structure of higher education. Wales has been dogged for years by many institutions that are too small to cut a mark internationally, too small to withstand and respond to the growing pressure of international competition, and in danger of wasting resources competing with neighbours rather than looking out from Wales to win reputation and research income. Currently, only 36 per cent of institutions in Wales have an annual income that is above the UK median, a situation that has changed little over many years. Additionally, colleagues will recall the findings of the PricewaterhouseCoopers review that only 48 per cent of university spending went on teaching, research and knowledge transfer, and 52 per cent on support services.

Today, I am pleased to report that, in response to my remit letter, HEFCW has determined that, by 2013, 75 per cent of HE institutions in Wales will have an annual income above the UK median, and none will be in the lower quartile. This target does not mean fewer students, but it is likely to mean fewer vice-chancellors. We will have significantly fewer HE institutions in Wales, but they will be larger and stronger. HEFCW will work with HE institutions to achieve this smoothly and rapidly with my full backing and that of the Cabinet.

In line with this approach of consolidation and strengthening, HEFCW will this year devise a new method of funding research from 2011-12, which will support a sharper focus on areas of national priority and critical mass. This will better equip Welsh HEIs to compete for research funds with other HEIs in the UK and beyond and be world leaders in their field. As a result of these changes, I

ddatblygwyd gan y Cyngor Cyllido gan gynnwys ynddo ei strategaeth gorfforaethol ar gyfer 2010-11 i 2012-2013. Cyhoeddir strategaeth gorfforaethol y Cyngor Cyllido ar ei wefan y prynhawn yma.

Elfen ganolog o hyn fydd newid strwythur addysg uwch o'i gwr. Mae Cymru wedi'i llesteirio ers blynyddoedd oherwydd bod ganddi lawer o sefydliadau sy'n rhy fach i greu argraff yn rhyngwladol, yn rhy fach i wrthsefyll pwysau cynyddol cystadleuaeth ryngwladol gynyddol ac ymateb iddynt, ac mae perygl iddynt wastraffu adnoddau'n cystadlu â'u cymdogion yn hytrach nag edrych y tu hwnt i Gymru er mwyn ennill enw da ac incwm ymchwil. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 36 y cant o sefydliadau Cymru sy'n ennill incwm blynyddol uwch na chanolrif y Deyrnas Unedig, ac nid yw'r sefyllfa honno wedi newid fawr ddim ers blynyddoedd lawer. At hynny, bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau'n cofio canfyddiadau adolygiad PricewaterhouseCoopers mai dim ond 48 y cant o arian ein prifysgolion a werid ar ddysgu, ymchwil a throsglwyddo gwybodaeth a bod 52 y cant yn cael ei wario ar wasanaethau cymorth.

Heddiw, yr wyf yn falch o ddweud bod y Cyngor Cyllido, wrth iddo ymateb i'm llythyr cylich gwaith, wedi penderfynu y bydd incwm blynyddol 75 y cant o sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, erbyn 2013, yn uwch na'r cyfanrif yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac na fydd yr un ohonynt yn y chwarter isaf. Nid yw'r targed hwn yn golygu llai o fyfyrwyr, ond mae'n debygol o olygu llai o s-gangellorion. Bydd gennym nifer sylweddol lai o sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru, ond byddant yn fwy o faint ac yn gryfach. Bydd y Cyngor Cyllido yn gweithio gyda sefydliadau addysg uwch i wireddu hyn yn gyflym ac yn hwylus a hynny gyda'm cefnogaeth lawn i a'r Cabinet.

Gan fynd ati i atgyfnerthu a chryfhau fel hyn, bydd y Cyngor Cyllido eleni'n dyfeisio dull newydd o ariannu ymchwil o 2011-12 ymlaen. Bydd hwnnw'n golygu canolbwyntio'n fwy llym ar feysydd sy'n flaenoriaeth genedlaethol ac ar fas critigol. Bydd hyn yn arfogi sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru'n well i gystadlu â sefydliadau addysg uwch eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig a'r tu hwnt

expect to see research income growth equal to, or greater than, elsewhere in the UK. As a further indicator of the international attractiveness of Welsh higher education, I expect to see growth in the number of international students coming to Wales equal to, or greater than, elsewhere in the UK.

These moves are just part of our overall intention to create a national higher education system in Wales by 2013 that has world-class teaching and research, while being inclusive, accessible and responsive to the needs of Wales. As demanded in my remit letter, building on the recommendations of the Assembly's Public Accounts Committee, funding for higher education will change over the coming years so that HE providers will work more strategically and coherently with each other and with further education colleges. This will open up more local access to higher education; encourage greater flexibility in the design, delivery and timing of programmes; sustain progression to higher levels of study from school, work and further education; eliminate unnecessary and wasteful local competition; and secure robust, timely and relevant support for businesses, whether through upskilling the workforce, delivering employable graduates, or assisting research, design and development of innovative products, services and processes.

Over time, I expect to see an increasing proportion of higher education taking place on a part-time and more flexible basis, including modular and work-based routes. I will shortly be announcing action to expand foundation degrees in Wales as part of this aim. From 2011, I also expect to see the first changes to HEFCW's funding methods and criteria to drive the delivery of these objectives.

In line with 'For Our Future', HEFCW has already started to develop and fund regional

am gronfeydd ymchwil ac i arwain y byd yn eu maes. Yn sgil y newidiadau hyn, yr wyf yn rhagweld gweld incwm ymchwil yn tyfu i'r un maint ag y mae mewn mannau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig neu'n fwy hyd yn oed. I ddangos hefyd bod addysg uwch Cymru'n ddeniadol ar y lefel ryngwladol, yr wyf yn disgwyl gweld yr un cynnydd yn nifer y myfyrwyr rhyngwladol sy'n dod i Gymru ag a welir mewn mannau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig, neu fwy o gynnydd na hynny.

Rhan o'n bwriad cyffredinol yn unig yw'r camau hyn i greu system addysg uwch genedlaethol yng Nghymru erbyn 2013 lle bydd yr addysg a'r ymchwil gyda'r gorau yn y byd. Eto i gyd, bydd yn gynhwysol, yn hygyrch ac yn ymateb i anghenion Cymru. Fel y dywedir yn fy llythyr cylch gwaith, gan adeiladu ar argymhellion Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad, bydd gofyn newid y drefn ariannu ar gyfer addysg uwch dros y blynyddoedd nesaf. Bydd hyn yn golygu y bydd darparwyr addysg uwch yn cydweithio'n fwy strategol ac yn fwy cydlynol â'i gilydd ac â cholegau addysg bellach. Bydd hyn yn agor mwy o ddrwsau'n lleol ar addysg uwch; yn annog mwy o hyblygrwydd wrth gynllunio, darparu ac amseru rhaglenni; yn gymorth i bobl gamu ymlaen o'r ysgol, o'r gwaith ac o addysg bellach i lefelau astudio uwch; yn dileu cystadlu diangen a gwastraffus yn lleol; ac yn sicrhau cymorth cadarn, prydlon a pherthnasol i fusnesau, boed drwy wella sgiliau'r gweithlu, drwy ddarparu graddedigion addas i'w cyflogi, neu drwy gynorthwyo i ymchwilio i gynnyrch, gwasanaethau a phrosesau arloesol, eu dylunio a'u datblygu.

Wrth i amser fynd heibio, yr wyf yn disgwyl gweld cyfran gynyddol o addysg uwch yn digwydd ar sail ran amser ac ar sail fwy hyblyg, gan gynnwys llwybrau modiwlwr a llwybrau seiliedig ar waith. Cyn bo hir, ac yn rhan o'r nod hwn, byddaf yn cyhoeddi camau i ehangu ar raddau sylfaen yng Nghymru. O 2011 ymlaen, byddaf hefyd yn disgwyl gweld y newidiadau cyntaf i ddulliau ariannu'r Cyngor Cyllido a'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir ganddo i sbarduno gwireddu'r amcanion hyn.

Yn unol ag 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol', mae'r Cyngor Cyllido eisoes wedi dechrau datblygu



collaborative planning and delivery of higher education in Wales from 2011-12. This approach is crucial to ensure that higher education is responsive to Welsh needs and that it can compete internationally. I can also confirm that I expect the *coleg ffederal* to be operational from 2011-12, and driving forward a target to have 1,000 additional students undertaking higher education through the medium of Welsh by 2013.

We want to revitalise the appeal of higher education to the people of Wales. Our student support arrangements, including the revised arrangements for the national bursary, offer learners the best and fairest support that the Assembly Government has ever made available. To ensure that HE providers are proactive in engaging learners from the most disadvantaged backgrounds, I expect the following milestones to be achieved in the coming years: HE participation in the Heads of the Valleys to grow to match the Welsh average by 2015; and, the proportion of the student HE intake in Wales from Communities First areas to rise to 17.2 per cent of the total student intake by 2013. That should mean a real increase of over 1,500 students from the most disadvantaged communities in Wales

Our agenda is the democratisation of higher education in Wales. That will be supported by the review of higher education governance, to ensure arrangements enable informed and constructive challenge to HE management, while reflecting the market for higher education and the needs of Wales. We face tough economic and financial conditions, which present higher education, and us, with a considerable challenge. However, there is also a unique opportunity to reshape higher education at a pace, in ways that can enable Wales to leap ahead as recovery gathers pace, and in ways that are inclusive, democratic and transformative.

**Paul Davies:** I thank the Minister for his statement. As we have said on numerous

ac ariannu cydweithredu rhanbarthol wrth gynllunio a darparu addysg uwch yng Nghymru o 2011-12 ymlaen. Mae mynd ati fel hyn yn hollbwysig er mwyn sicrhau bod addysg uwch yn ymateb i anghenion Cymru ac er mwyn iddi allu cystadlu'n rhyngwladol. Gallaf gadarnhau hefyd fy mod yn disgwyl i'r coleg ffederal fod ar waith o 2011-12 ymlaen, ac iddo fwrw ymlaen i sicrhau ei fod yn cyrraedd y targed, sef bod 1,000 yn rhagor o fyfyrwyr yn dilyn eu haddysg uwch drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg erbyn 2013.

Yr ydym am ailgynnu apêl addysg uwch i bobl Cymru. Mae ein trefniadau cymorth i fyfyrwyr, gan gynnwys y trefniadau diwygiedig ar gyfer y fwsariaeth genedlaethol, yn cynnig y cymorth gorau a thecaf ddysgwyr y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i ddarparu erioed. Er mwyn sicrhau bod darparwyr addysg uwch yn meithrin cysylltiad rhagweithiol â dysgwyr o'r cefndiroedd mwyaf di-fraint, yr wyf yn disgwyl iddynt gyrraedd y cerrig milltir a ganlyn yn y blynyddoedd nesaf: y nifer sy'n manteisio ar addysg uwch ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd i dyfu i gyfateb â'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru erbyn 2015; a'r gyfran o fyfyrwyr sy'n dechrau ar eu haddysg uwch yng Nghymru sy'n dod o ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i gynyddu i 17.2 y cant o gyfanswm y myfyrwyr a dderbynnir erbyn 2013. Dylai hynny olygu cynnydd go iawn, sef dros 1,500 o fyfyrwyr o gymunedau mwyaf di-fraint Cymru.

Democrateiddio addysg uwch yng Nghymru yw ein hagenda. Yn gefn i hynny, bydd yr adolygiad o lywodraethu addysg uwch. Bydd hwnnw'n sicrhau bod y trefniadau'n galluogi herio rheolwyr addysg uwch mewn ffordd adeiladol a gwybodus, ond eu bod hefyd yn adlewyrchu'r farchnad ar gyfer addysg uwch ac anghenion Cymru. Yr ydym yn wynebu amgylchiadau economaidd ac ariannol llym, sy'n gosod cryn her i addysg uwch, ac i ninnau. Serch hynny, mae cyfle unigryw yma hefyd inni ad-drefnu addysg uwch yn gyflym, mewn ffyrdd sy'n gallu galluogi Cymru i lamu ymlaen wrth i'r adferiad fagu traed, ac mewn ffyrdd sy'n gynhwysol, yn ddemocrataidd ac yn gweddnewid pethau.

**Paul Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad. Yr ydym wedi dweud sawl tro yn

occasions in the Chamber, higher education is essential to securing a thriving Welsh economy. Indeed, as demonstrated by the Enterprise and Learning Committee's report into the importance of the HE sector, for every £1 that is invested in the sector, it contributes £5 to the Welsh economy. A concern among education professionals and others, given the tight financial settlement that we all face, relates, of course, to funding. I was pleased to hear the Minister say in his announcement that HEFCW will set a target so that 75 per cent of higher education institutions in Wales in future will have an annual income that is above the UK median, and none will be in the lower quartile. Following his announcement today, will the Minister reassure us that he will do everything in his power to protect front-line services at a HE level, and that having fewer HE institutions will not result in fewer students and students from disadvantaged backgrounds not being able to access higher education?

The Jones review confirmed that there is significant room for improvement in the funding structure that is currently in place to support our universities and students, and I am pleased that the Minister has said that the structure needs to be changed. Following the recent review into the cost of administering education, can the Minister confirm that the money that was identified as being spent wastefully will now be reinvested directly in the sector, in order to address the funding gap between England and Wales? That is particularly important given that education-related administration in Wales constitutes a substantial proportion of the education budget every year.

3.30 p.m.

I note the Welsh Assembly Government's approach of consolidating and strengthening HEFCW, and supporting the introduction of a new method of funding research from 2011-12, which will support a sharper focus on areas of national priority and critical mass. Could the Minister expand on that and tell us what specifically he means by 'national priority' and 'critical mass'?

y Siambwr fod addysg uwch yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau economi sy'n ffynnu yng Nghymru. Yn wir, fel y dangoswyd yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu am bwysigrwydd y sector addysg uwch, mae pob £1 a fuddsoddir yn y sector yn cyfrannu £5 at economi Cymru. Un o'r pethau y mae gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes addysg ac eraill yn poeni amdano, a chofio'r setliad ariannol tyn yr ydym i gyd yn ei wynebu, wrth gwrs, yw'r ariannu. Yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y Gweinidog yn dweud yn ei ddatganiad y bydd y Cyngor Cyllido'n pennu targed a fydd yn golygu y bydd incwm blynyddol 75 y cant o sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol yn uwch na'r cyfanrif yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac na fydd yr un ohonynt yn y chwarter isaf. Ar ôl ei gyhoeddiad heddiw, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dawelu ein meddwl y gwnaiff bopeth yn ei allu i amddiffyn gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen ar lefel addysg uwch, ac na fydd cael llai o sefydliadau addysg uwch yn golygu llai o fyfyrwyr, a llai o fyfyrwyr o gefndir di-fraint yn gallu manteisio ar addysg uwch?

Yr oedd adolygiad Jones yn cadarnhau bod cryn le i wella'r strwythur ariannu sy'n gefn i'n prifysgolion a'n myfyrwyr ar hyn o bryd, ac yr wyf yn falch i'r Gweinidog ddweud bod angen newid y strwythur. Ar ôl yr adolygiad diweddar o gost gweinyddu addysg, a all y Gweinidog gadarnhau y caiff yr arian a oedd yn cael ei wastraffu, yn ôl yr adroddiad, ei ailfuddsoddi'n uniongyrchol yn awr yn y sector hwn, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyllido rhwng Cymru a Lloegr? Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig ac ystyried bod cyfran sylweddol o'r gyllideb addysg bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru yn cael ei gwario ar weinyddu.

Nodaf mai bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw atgyfnerthu a chryfhau'r Cyngor Cyllido, a chefnogi cyflwyno dull newydd o ariannu ymchwil o 2011-12 ymlaen. Bydd hwnnw'n golygu canolbwyntio'n fwy llym ar feysydd sy'n flaenoriaeth genedlaethol ac ar 'fàs critigol'. A allai'r Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar hyn a dweud wrthym beth yn benodol y mae'n ei olygu wrth sôn am 'flaenoriaeth genedlaethol' a 'màs critigol'?

It is important that we encourage young adults to take up courses from across the spectrum. That includes everything from the sciences and economics, to humanities and languages. Will the Minister outline what strategies the Welsh Assembly Government has put in place to encourage students to study subjects across the spectrum, and what specific measures he will implement to ensure that students are given these opportunities?

Little recognition has been given to how well the creative industries have been developing over recent years. While I appreciate that the Welsh Assembly Government has focused on areas such as the environment, climate change, and the economy, given the difficult economic circumstances, now is the time to be careful not to isolate other subjects from the HE agenda. I agree that, to generate new innovations, we need basic academic research, and that HE research is crucial to our economy, as I mentioned earlier. Phase 2 of the Jones review also considered the contribution of HE institutions to the economy, and argued that a healthy HE sector is crucial to Wales's future.

I recently heard from Bangor University, which seems to be leading the link-up between universities and businesses via the Knowledge Economy Skills Scholarship programme. I understand that the programme will focus on projects reflecting key sectors of the Welsh economy and is designed to provide 400 Masters and PhD placements over the next five years. As a result, Welsh HE institutions need research in a number of growing departments, including the digital and low-carbon economy, health and bioscience, as well as advanced engineering and the manufacturing sectors. I appreciate that today's announcement will, we hope, better equip Welsh higher education institutions with the ability to compete for research funds. Will the Minister outline what specific measures the Welsh Assembly Government will put in place to do that, and to encourage employers to work with higher education providers on research projects and courses?

Mae'n bwysig inni annog oedolion ifanc i ddilyn cyrsiau ar draws y sbectrwm. Mae hynny'n cynnwys popeth o'r gwyddorau ac economeg i ddyniaethau ac ieithoedd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sôn am y strategaethau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'u rhoi ar waith i annog myfyrwyr i astudio pynciau ar draws y sbectrwm a pha gamau penodol y bydd yn eu rhoi ar waith i sicrhau bod myfyrwyr yn cael y cyfleoedd hyn?

Nid oes fawr o sylw wedi'i roi i ba mor dda mae'r diwydiannau creadigol wedi bod yn datblygu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi canolbwyntio ar feysydd megis yr amgylchedd, newid yn yr hinsawdd, a'r economi, a chofio'r amgylchiadau economaidd anodd, nawr yw'r adeg inni ochel rhag cau'r drws ar bynciau eraill yn yr agenda addysg uwch. Cytunaf, er mwyn creu cynlluniau arloesol newydd, fod angen ymchwil academaidd sylfaenol arnom, a bod ymchwil addysg uwch yn hollbwysig i'n heconomi, fel y crybwyllais gynau. Yr oedd Cyfnod 2 adolygiad Jones hefyd yn ystyried cyfraniad sefydliadau addysg uwch i'r economi, ac yn dadlau bod sector addysg uwch iach yn hollbwysig i ddyfodol Cymru.

Clywais yn ddiweddar gan Brifysgol Bangor sydd, i bob golwg, yn arwain y cysylltiad rhwng prifysgolion a byd busnes drwy gyfrwng rhaglen Ysgoloriaethau Sgiliau'r Economi Wybodaeth. Caf ar ddeall y bydd y rhaglen yn canolbwyntio ar brosiectau sy'n adlewyrchu rhai o sectorau allweddol economi Cymru a'r bwriad yw darparu 400 o leoedd gradd Meistr a PhD dros y pum mlynedd nesaf. Yn sgil hynny, mae angen i sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru wneud ymchwil mewn nifer gynyddol o adrannau, gan gynnwys yr economi ddigidol a'r economi rhad-ar-garbon, iechyd a biowyddorau, yn ogystal â pheirianeg uwch a'r sector gweithgynhyrchu. Sylweddolaf y bydd y cyhoeddiad heddiw, gobeithio, yn arfogi sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru yn well â'r gallu i gystadlu am gronfeydd ymchwil. A wnaiff y Gweinidog sôn am y camau penodol y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu rhoi ar waith i wneud hynny, ac i annog cyflogwyr i weithio gyda

darparwyr addysg uwch ar brosiectau ymchwil a chyrsgiau?

Another issue of considerable importance is collaboration between providers, which the Minister outlined today. As the Minister is aware, my constituency is rural, and many of its educational providers are isolated. The Welsh Assembly Government needs to ensure that Wales's geography is also taken into consideration when delivering its education policy. Sometimes, collaboration with other HE providers is not the answer, as, in many cases, it is just not feasible. Given today's statement, which confirms that there will be fewer HE institutions in the future, will the Minister tell us how the Welsh Assembly Government will ensure that students from rural and isolated areas can access HE courses in the future? Perhaps the Minister would also be kind enough to tell us what additional funds will be made available to support this greater collaboration. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will lead on these issues and ensure that appropriate guidance and information regarding educational collaboration is put in place.

Today's statement mentions the *coleg ffederal*, which is making good progress. It is a huge step forward for the higher education sector in our country and for promoting Welsh-language education. I note that the *coleg ffederal* will be operational from 2011-12, and that it is driving forward a target to have 1,000 additional students studying through the medium of Welsh by 2013. To cope with that demand, will the Minister reassure us that sufficient resources will be made available to ensure its success?

I also note from today's statement that the Minister expects to see an increase in the proportion of higher education taking place on a part-time and more flexible basis. Can he tell us how that will be delivered, what additional support the Welsh Assembly Government will be giving to part-time students, and when he intends to make a statement on expanding foundation degrees in Wales?

Finally, I thank the Minister again for this

Un mater arall pwysig iawn yw'r cydweithredu rhwng darparwyr, y soniodd y Gweinidog amdano heddiw. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod mai etholaeth wledig yw fy etholaeth i, a llawer o'i darparwyr addysg mewn ardaloedd pellennig. Mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau bod daearyddiaeth Cymru yn cael ei hystyried hefyd wrth iddi roi ei pholisi addysg ar waith. Weithiau, nid cydweithredu â darparwyr addysg uwch eraill yw'r ateb, oherwydd, yn aml iawn, mae'n gwbl anymarferol. A chofio'r datganiad heddiw, sy'n cadarnhau y bydd llai o sefydliadau addysg uwch yn y dyfodol, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sicrhau bod myfyrwyr o ardaloedd gwledig a phellennig yn gallu manteisio gyrsiau addysg uwch yn y dyfodol? Efallai y byddai'r Gweinidog gystal â dweud wrthym hefyd pa arian ychwanegol a ddarperir i gefnogi'r cydweithredu cryfach hwn. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn arwain yn y meysydd hyn ac yn sicrhau bod canllawiau a gwybodaeth briodol ar gael ynglŷn â chydweithredu ym maes addysg.

Mae'r datganiad heddiw'n sôn am y coleg ffederal, sy'n mynd rhagddo'n dda. Mae'n gam enfawr ymlaen i'r sector addysg uwch yn ein gwlad ac ar gyfer hyrwyddo addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg. Sylwaf y bydd y coleg ffederal ar waith o 2011-12 ymlaen, a'i fod yn bwrw ymlaen i wireddu'r targed, sef 1,000 o fyfyrwyr ychwanegol yn astudio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg erbyn 2013. I ymdopi â'r galw hwnnw, a wnaiff y Gweinidog dawelu ein meddwl y bydd digon o adnoddau ar gael i sicrhau ei lwyddiant?

Nodaf hefyd o'r datganiad heddiw fod y Gweinidog yn disgwyl gweld cynnydd yng nghyfran yr addysg uwch sy'n digwydd ar sail ran amser ac ar sail fwy hyblyg. A all ddweud wrthym sut y gwneir hynny, pa gymorth ychwanegol y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei roi i fyfyrwyr rhan-amser, a pha bryd y mae'n bwriadu rhoi datganiad ynglŷn ag ehangu graddau sylfaen yng Nghymru?

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog

statement. I hope that today's announcement will ensure a prosperous and thriving HE sector in Wales.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank the opposition spokesperson for his constructive response to the statement. We recognise the important contribution that higher education makes to the economy, as we did in our evidence to the Enterprise and Learning Committee's inquiry and our response to its report. He will be aware that I have been pressing the question of funding for the front line through the PricewaterhouseCoopers review, and we are now establishing an operational plan to drive forward its conclusions. It would be premature to talk about funding for the sector in advance of the budget discussions to be held in the Assembly later this year. We look to HEFCW to examine the specific findings of the PWC review and its implications for higher education, and we will be discussing the matter with it.

On the issue that he raised about students, my response is that this is clearly not a statement about numbers of students but about numbers of institutions. I have made very clear commitments, and HEFCW has laid out in its corporate plan the targets that it is setting to ensure that we see more students from disadvantaged backgrounds entering higher education. Those targets are written down.

He mentioned the outcomes of the Jones review of higher education in Wales, and he will be aware that I have appointed Professor Merfyn Jones to act as specialist adviser to the Welsh Assembly Government following his retirement from Bangor University. Professor Jones will be joining us at some stage over the next month or two. Reinvesting resources is the key to the work that we will take forward following the examination of the PWC review.

On the question of a funding gap, I have to reiterate that, following the changes in public expenditure announced in England, I am still not clear on what the funding gap would be going forward, if, indeed, there is one at all. In the past, it has been calculated on a

unwaith eto am y datganiad hwn. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y cyhoeddiad heddiw'n sicrhau sector addysg uwch llewyrchus a ffyniannus yng Nghymru.

**Leighton Andrews:** Hoffwn ddiolch i lefarydd yr wrthblaid am ei ymateb adeiladol i'r datganiad. Yr ydym yn cydnabod cyfraniad pwysig addysg uwch i'r economi, a gwnaethom hynny yn ein tystiolaeth i ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu ac yn ein hymateb i'w adroddiad. Bydd yn gwybod fy mod wedi bod yn pwysleisio mater ariannu'r rheng flaen drwy adolygiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, a'n bod yn awr yn llunio cynllun gweithredol i fwrw ymlaen â'i gasgliadau. Byddai'n rhy fuan sôn am ariannu'r sector cyn gwneud y penderfyniadau ynglŷn â'r gyllideb yn y Cynulliad yn ddiweddarach eleni. Yr ydym yn disgwyl i'r Cyngor Cyllido ystyried canfyddiadau penodol adolygiad PWC a'i oblygiadau ar gyfer addysg uwch, a byddwn yn trafod hynny gydag ef.

O ran y mater a gododd ynglŷn â myfyrwyr, fy ymateb yw nad datganiad am nifer y myfyrwyr yw hwn ond datganiad am nifer y sefydliadau. Yr wyf wedi gwneud ymrwymadau clir iawn ac mae'r Cyngor Cyllido wedi cynnwys yn ei gynllun corfforaethol y targedau y mae'n eu gosod er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gweld mwy o fyfyrwyr o gefndiroedd di-fraint yn mynd i addysg uwch. Mae'r targedau hynny ar glawr.

Crybwyllodd ganlyniadau adolygiad Jones o addysg uwch yng Nghymru, a bydd yn gwybod imi benodi'r Athro Merfyn Jones yn ymgynghorydd arbenigol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar ôl iddo ymddeol o Brifysgol Bangor. Bydd yr Athro Jones yn ymuno â ni rywbryd yn ystod y mis neu ddau nesaf. Ailfuddsoddi adnoddau yw'r allwedd i'r gwaith y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen ag ef ar ôl archwilio adolygiad PWC.

O ran bwlch cyllido, rhaid imi ddweud eto, ar ôl y newidiadau mewn gwariant cyhoeddus a gyhoeddwyd yn Lloegr, nid wyf yn glir o hyd beth fyddai'r bwlch cyllido yn y dyfodol, os, yn wir, a oes bwlch o gwbl. Yn y gorffennol, mae wedi'i gyfrifo ar sail cyfnod sydd wedi

retrospective basis, and we have seen significant changes in public expenditure on higher education in England. I am concerned about the level of spending on back-room services in higher education. I have no reason to believe that the situation in Wales is worse than that in England overall, but I do believe that the higher education sector needs to focus on that.

He also listed key research and development priorities that the Assembly Government—that is, my predecessor and the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport—announced last year, and the development of the UK Commission for Employment and Skills funding for postgraduate scholarships is linked to that. It is important that we identify clear research priorities in Wales that are linked to the needs of our economy, and I think that we have done that. We have also outlined in the remit letter to HEFCW the need to ensure that subjects that could be at risk, including STEM subjects—science, technology, engineering and mathematics—modern foreign languages, and courses through the medium of Welsh, are protected by it in how it funds higher education in Wales. Across the piece in Government, the Deputy First Minister, the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, and I are looking at what support can be developed for research and development and to provide further skills to what the First Minister has termed the ‘anchor companies’ in Wales.

He mentioned the issue of collaboration, particularly in his constituency, and he is right that it is important. I must say that some of the moves recently announced in south-west Wales are ahead of those in other parts of Wales in looking at collaboration between higher education and further education institutions. I find that encouraging, and it is likely that we will see further education institutions continuing to offer entry routes into higher education through part-time study and foundation degrees. I will be making a statement on foundations degrees in due course. It is not a question of finding additional money for mergers or for the

mynd heibio, ac yr ydym wedi gweld newidiadau sylweddol o ran gwariant cyhoeddus ar addysg uwch yn Lloegr. Yr wyf yn poeni am lefel y gwario ar wasanaethau'r ystafell gefn mewn addysg uwch. Nid oes gennyf reswm dros gredu bod y sefyllfa'n waeth yn gyffredinol yng Nghymru nag y mae yn Lloegr, ond yr wyf yn credu bod angen i'r sector addysg uwch ganolbwyntio ar hynny.

Rhestrodd hefyd flaenoriaethau ymchwil a datblygu allweddol a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y llynedd—a hynny gan fy rhagflaenydd a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth. Mae cysylltiad rhwng hynny a datblygu'r arian ar gyfer ysgoloriaethau i raddedigion gan Gomisiwn y Deyrnas Unedig dros Gyflogaeth a Sgiliau. Mae'n bwysig inni nodi blaenoriaethau ymchwil clir yng Nghymru sy'n gysylltiedig ag anghenion ein heconomi, a chredaf inni wneud hynny. Yr ydym hefyd wedi crybwyll yn y llythyr cylch gwaith i'r Cyngor Cyllido bod angen iddo sicrhau ei fod yn gwarchod pynciau a allai fod mewn perygl, gan gynnwys pynciau STEM—gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg a mathemateg—ieithoedd tramor modern, a chysiau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg wrth iddo ariannu addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Drwyddi draw yn y Llywodraeth, mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, a minnau yn ystyried pa gymorth y gellir ei ddatblygu ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu a sut mae darparu rhagor o sgiliau ar gyfer yr hyn y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u galw'n 'gwmnïau angor' yng Nghymru.

Soniodd am gydweithredu, yn enwedig yn ei etholaeth, ac mae'n iawn bod hynny'n bwysig. Rhaid imi ddweud bod rhai o'r camau a gyhoeddwyd yn y de-orllewin yn ddiweddar ar y blaen i'r rheini mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru o ran ystyried cydweithredu rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch a sefydliadau addysg bellach. Mae hynny'n fy nghalonogi, ac mae'n debygol y gwelwn ragor o sefydliadau addysg yn parhau i gynig llwybrau mynediad at addysg uwch drwy astudiaethau rhan-amser a graddau sylfaen. Byddaf yn rhoi datganiad am raddau sylfaen maes o law. Nid mater o ddod o hyd i arian ychwanegol ar gyfer uno neu ad-

reconfiguration of the sector. As the Assembly's Audit Committee, as it was then called—now the Public Accounts Committee—said in its report about a year ago, the funding that has been used by HEFCW for the purpose of reconfiguration has certainly helped some mergers, but some of those may have taken place in any case. What the committee said, what we are seeking to do, and what I outlined in the remit letter was that it was important for the bulk of HEFCW funding to drive our strategic priorities, and that is following the recommendations made by the then Audit Committee. Therefore, we are working entirely in line with that, which is why I asked HEFCW to create a strategic implementation fund, starting with 20 per cent of the budget next year, rising to 80 per cent over coming years. That is so that we are clear that the money that we give is to drive forward the Assembly Government's strategic priorities.

3.40 p.m.

In respect of the *coleg ffederal*, we are now in the position of the board being taken forward under the chairmanship of Geraint Talfan Davies. I think that it is making good progress, and I look to HEFCW to ensure that that is established on time and that it delivers the number of students that we forecast it should have.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog, sy'n amlinellu gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer y sector addysg uwch. Mae straen ar arian cyhoeddus, ac nid oes dwywaith ond y bydd y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu dros y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd i ddod. Mae'n hynod bwysig, felly, fod arian cyhoeddus yn cael ei wario mewn modd effeithlon sy'n adlewyrchu blaenoriaethau a pholisïau Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae'n dda clywed sylwadau ar ddiwedd eich datganiad ynghylch demogreiddio addysg uwch yng Nghymru a chynyddu mynediad i addysg uwch yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn ogystal â chynyddu mynediad i bobl ifanc o gymunedau difreintiedig. Dylai ehangu

drefnu'r sector ydyw. Fel y dywedodd Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad, sef ei enw ar y pryd—y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus erbyn hyn—yn ei adroddiad rhyw flwyddyn yn ôl, mae'r arian sydd wedi'i ddefnyddio gan y Cyngor Cyllido at ddiben ad-drefnu yn sicr wedi bod o gymorth i rai uno, ond efallai y byddai rhai o'r rheini wedi uno beth bynnag. Yr hyn a ddywedodd y pwyllgor, yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud, a'r hyn a grybwyllais yn y llythyr cylch gwaith oedd ei bod yn bwysig defnyddio cyfran helaeth o arian y Cyngor Cyllido i fwrw ymlaen â'n blaenoriaethau strategol, ac mae hynny'n dilyn trywydd argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio fel yr oedd bryd hynny. Felly, yr ydym yn gweithio'n gwbl unol â hynny, a dyna pam y gofynnais i'r Cyngor Cyllido greu cronfa gweithredu strategol, gan ddechrau gydag 20 y cant o'r gyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf, a'i gynyddu i 80 y cant dros y blynyddoedd wedyn. Y rheswm dros hynny yw er mwyn inni fod yn glir mai diben yr arian a ddarparwn yw bwrw ymlaen â blaenoriaethau strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

O ran y coleg ffederal, y sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi yn awr yw bod y bwrdd yn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o dan gadeiryddiaeth Geraint Talfan Davies. Credaf fod y gwaith hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo'n dda, a disgwyliaf i'r Cyngor Cyllido sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei sefydlu mewn pryd a'i fod yn llwyddo i sicrhau nifer y myfyrwyr a nodwyd yn ein rhagolygon.

**Nerys Evans:** Thank you for your statement, Minister, outlining the Welsh Government's vision for the higher education sector. There is a strain on the public finances, and there is no doubt that the situation will get worse over the coming months and years. It is important, therefore, that public money is spent in an efficient manner that reflects the priorities and policies of the Government of Wales. It is good to hear the comments at the end of your statement about the democratisation of higher education in Wales and increasing access to higher education in the Heads of the Valleys area as well as increasing access to young people from disadvantaged communities. Increasing access should be at

mynediad fod wrth galon datblygiadau Llywodraeth Cymru, ac yr wyf yn falch bod hwnnw wedi'i adlewyrchu y prynhawn yma.

Hoffwn ofyn rai cwestiynau penodol. Mae'r datganiad yn un radical iawn, sy'n cynnwys gweledigaeth y Llywodraeth i weld mwy o arian yn mynd i addysgu. Mae'r ffaith eich bod yn sôn am leihau nifer yr is-gangellorion ac nid nifer y myfyrwyr yn awgrymu uno'r prifysgolion fel y crybwyllwyd. Wrth gwrs, mae'r trafodaethau ynghylch uno wedi bod ar yr agenda ers blynnyddoedd bellach. A oes gwaith cychwynnol ar y cynllun hwnnw wedi'i wneud yn y maes ers ichi gymryd y llyw fel Gweinidog? Gwn fod lefel uwch o gydweithio rhwng adrannau gwahanol o fewn sefydliadau gwahanol a rhwng sefydliadau mwy cyffredinol ar hyn o bryd, ond mae uno yn wahanol iawn i gydweithio, ac yn fwy o gam. A oes gennych amserlen ar gyfer y gwaith hwn? Mae hwn yn brosiect hirdymor. A fyddwch yn gosod targed ar gyfer y sector neu amserlen ar gyfer cwblhau'r gwaith hwn?

Mae Cymru yn wlad fach wasgaredig ac mae sefydliadau addysg uwch yn rhan bwysig o gymunedau unigol. Ymhellach at bwyntiau Paul, a allwch eni sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth eisiau gweld parhad daearyddol y sefydliadau unigol hyn a dweud wrthym nad bwriad y Llywodraeth yw canoli addysg uwch mewn nifer is o sefydliadau?

Mae nifer helaeth o'n sefydliadau addysg uwch, os nad pob un, yn cydweithio â cholegau addysg bellach lleol. Gwn, yn fy ardal i, fod Coleg Sir Gâr a Choleg Sir Benfro yn cydweithio'n agos â Choleg Prifysgol y Drindod. A allwch amlinellu sut y gwelwch y berthynas rhwng addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yn parhau o dan y cynlluniau newydd hyn? A oes datblygiadau pellach yn y maes?

Fel y dywedodd Paul, mae cydweithio â busnesau yn hollbwysig ac mae adroddiad diweddar y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn sôn am fasnacheiddio gwaith ein sefydliadau addysg uwch. Bu ichi gyfeirio at sicrhau bod sefydliadau addysg uwch yn cynyddu canran y cyllid sy'n dod i Gymru at ddibenion ymchwil. Sut y mae modd gwneud hwn gan fod denu arian ymchwil yn broses gystadleuol? Drwy weithredu'r amcanion a

the heart of the developments of the Welsh Government, and I am pleased that that has been reflected this afternoon.

I wish to ask some specific questions. The statement is a radical one, which includes the Government's vision of seeing more money going to teaching. The fact that you talk of reducing the number of vice-chancellors and not the number of students suggests the merger of universities, as has been suggested. Of course, merger discussions have been on the agenda for years now. Has any initial work on this scheme been done in the field since you took office as Minister? I know that there is a higher level of collaboration between the different departments in different institutions and between institutions more generally at present, but a merger is very different from collaboration, and is a major step. Do you have a timetable for this work? It is a long-term project. Will you be setting a target for the sector or a timetable for the completion of this work?

Wales is a small and dispersed nation and HE institutions are an important part of individual communities. Further to Paul's points, can you assure us that the Government wants to see the geographical continuation of these individual sites and say that it is not its intention to centralise HE in a smaller number of institutions?

A large number of our higher education institutions, if not all of them, undertakes collaboration with local further education colleges. I know that, in my area, Coleg Sir Gâr and Pembrokeshire College work closely with Trinity University College. Can you outline how you see the relationship between HE and FE continuing under these new schemes? Are there further developments that you want to see in this area?

As Paul said, collaboration with businesses is vital, and the recent report of the Enterprise and Learning Committee talks about the commercialisation of the work of our higher education institutions. You mentioned ensuring that HEIs increase the percentage of finance that comes to Wales for research purposes. How will it be possible to do that, given that attracting research funding is such a competitive process? By putting the



osodwyd y prynhawn yma, ai gobaith y Llywodraeth yw y bydd ein sector addysg uwch yn fwy cystadleuol ac felly'n gallu denu mwy o gyllid ymchwil, neu a fydd yn ceisio trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig i sicrhau 5 y cant o arian ymchwil y Deyrnas Unedig i sefydliadau yng Nghymru, gan ein bod yn cyfrif am 5 y cant o boblogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig?

Gwn fod adrannau rhai prifysgolion yn cael cyllid a bod arian wedi'i glustnodi i adrannau er nad ydynt ar y brig yn eu meysydd gwahanol, felly a yw'n fwriad gennych ddynodi 5 y cant o'r arian ymchwil hwnnw i Gymru neu ai'r nod yw gweithio ar yr amcanion hyn i wella sut y mae ein sefydliadau addysg uwch yn cystadlu ar gyfer yr arian?

I gloi, ni fyddwch yn synnu wrth fy nghlywed yn sôn am y coleg ffederal. Mae'n dda cael clywed bod yr amserlen yn cael ei dilyn. Bûm yn siarad ag aelodau bwrdd cysgodol y cyngor cenedlaethol sy'n hapus gyda'r datblygiadau. Ymhellach at bwynt Paul, a allwch gadarnhau bod y cyllid a bennwyd o hyd ar gael ar gyfer y coleg ffederal ac nad oes newid wedi bod yn y cyllid a ddynodwyd? Mae honno'n elfen bwysig i sicrhau llwyddiant y coleg ffederal.

Diolch am eich datganiad blaengar, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld gweithredu ar yr amcanion a amlinellwyd y prynhawn yma.

**Leighton Andrews:** Thank you for your kind and supportive words, Nerys. I want to stress right at the outset that the money for the *coleg ffederal* is there, and we look to HEFCW to ensure that that remains to be the case, but I think that good progress is being made on the development of that.

You are right to stress the strains on public spending at the present time and the importance of efficient spending. That provides an incentive, I think, for higher education managements to talk to one another, to look for ways of sharing services and to develop deeper ways of working together.

As I have said, our agenda is about the democratisation of higher education, and you

objectives set this afternoon into action, does the Government hope that our HE sector will be more competitive and therefore can attract more research funding, or will it be holding talks with the United Kingdom Government to ensure that 5 per cent of the UK's research funding goes to institutions in Wales, given that we represent 5 per cent of the UK's population?

I know that the departments of some universities are awarded funding and that money is earmarked for departments that are not at the top of their chosen fields, and so is it your intention to earmark 5 per cent of that research funding to Wales, or is it the intention to work on these objectives to improve how our HEIs compete for the funding?

To close, you will not be surprised to hear me talk about the federal college. It is good to hear that the timetable is being adhered to. I was talking to members of the national council's shadow board, who are pleased with the developments. Further to Paul's point, can you confirm that the funding allocated is still available for the federal college and that there has been no change in that? That is an important element if we are to ensure the success of the federal college.

Thank you for your progressive statement, and I look forward to seeing the objectives outlined this afternoon put into action.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch am eich geiriau caredig a chefnogol, Nerys. Yr wyf am bwysleisio o'r cychwyn un bod yr arian ar gael ar gyfer y coleg ffederal, a disgwyliwn i'r Cyngor Cyllido sicrhau mai felly y bydd, ond credaf fod y gwaith datblygu yn y cyswllt hwnnw'n mynd rhagddo'n dda.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n pwysleisio'r straen sydd ar wario cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd a phwysigrwydd gwario'n effeithlon. Mae hynny'n gymhelliant, mi gredaf, i reolwyr addysg uwch siarad â'i gilydd, chwilio am ffyrdd o rannu gwasanaethau a datblygu ffyrdd dyfnach o gydweithio.

Fel yr wyf wedi dweud, mae a wnelo ein hagenda â democateiddio addysg uwch, ac

are right to say that expanding access to higher education is crucial. Very clear targets are being set by HEFCW in this corporate plan. You are right to say that it is a radical plan. In the context that we have outlined, we expect to see further reconfiguration, and we expect to see further mergers. The target set by HEFCW of achieving a higher education sector in Wales in which 75 per cent of institutions will have turnover above the UK median by 2013 is a radical and challenging target. I do not see how it can be met without further mergers in the higher education sector.

I am encouraged by the fact that significant collaboration is going on in a number of areas between academics—cognitive neuroscience is an example that I have mentioned before, and collaboration is also taking place in history, low-carbon technologies and a number of other areas. I welcome that, and I would like to see more of it. I hope that university administrations will rise to the challenge as academics are doing. We have seen leadership from some vice-chancellors in driving this agenda forward. I am encouraged by what is currently going on, for example, in south-west Wales, where active discussions are under way with further education institutions. It should be remembered that several of our further education institutions are significantly larger than many of our higher education institutions.

This is not an agenda for centralisation. It is an agenda for the best use of resources and getting high quality, performing higher education institutions in Wales that more Welsh people, from whatever background, can have access to. That means that we want to see a higher education system that reflects the needs of the whole of Wales. Through the collaboration that we would expect to see between higher education and further education, we believe that that will be delivered.

You raised the same question as Paul about research and collaboration with business. Lesley Griffiths, the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, is carrying

yr ydych yn iawn yn dweud ei bod yn hollbwysig agor y drws at addysg uwch. Mae'r Cyngor Cyllido wrthi'n gosod targedau clir iawn yn y cynllun corfforaethol hwn. Yr ydych yn iawn yn dweud ei fod yn gynllun radical. Yn y cyd-destun yr ydym wedi'i grybwyll, disgwyliwn wëid rhagor o ad-drefnu, a disgwyliwn weld rhagor o uno. Mae'r targed a bennwyd gan y Cyngor Cyllido, sef, sicrhau sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru lle bydd trosiant 75 y cant o'r sefydliadau'n uwch na'r canolrif yn y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn 2013 yn darged radical a heriol. Ni allaf weld sut mae modd cyflawni hynny heb ragor o uno yn y sector addysg uwch.

Mae'r cydweithredu sylweddol sydd ar y gweill mewn nifer o feysydd rhwng academwyr yn codi fy nghalon—mae niwrowyddoniaeth wybyddol yn un enghraifft yr wyf wedi sôn amdani o'r blaen, ac mae cydweithio ar y gweill hefyd ym maes hanes, technolegau rhad-ar-garbon ac mewn nifer o feysydd eraill. Yr wyf yn croesawu hynny, a hoffwn weld rhagor ohono. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd gweinyddiaethau prifysgolion yn derbyn yr her fel y mae academwyr yn ei derbyn. Mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd yn fy nghalonogi, er enghraifft yn y de-orllewin, lle mae trafodaethau brwd ar y gweill â sefydliadau addysg bellach. Dylid cofio bod sawl un o'n sefydliadau addysg bellach yn sylweddol fwy na llawer o'n sefydliadau addysg uwch.

Nid agenda canoli yw hon. Agenda i sicrhau bod adnoddau'n cael eu defnyddio yn y ffordd orau ydyw ac i sicrhau sefydliadau addysg uwch llwyddiannus o safon yng Nghymru y gall mwy o bobl ein gwlad, o ba gefndir bynnag, fanteisio arnynt. Mae hynny'n golygu ein bod am weld system addysg uwch sy'n adlewyrchu anghenion Cymru gyfan. Drwy'r cydweithredu y byddem yn disgwyl ei weld rhwng addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, credwn y gwiredir hynny.

Codasoch chithau'r un cwestiwn a gododd Paul am ymchwil a chydweithredu â byd busnes. Mae Lesley Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a

out a review of research and development, and she has already held discussions in relation to business research and development and research councils in the UK. I met the UK Minister of State for Universities and Science yesterday evening—it was a constructive and businesslike meeting—and I am sure that, in due course, he will also meet Lesley to discuss common issues on the research agenda, which is also part of his portfolio.

We are at a point where radical change is expected of higher education in Wales, and radical change is what will be delivered.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I was relieved when you said that this was not about centralisation, because there is a lot in the statement that could well be about centralisation. You said that

‘Wales has been dogged for years by many institutions that are too small to cut a mark internationally’.

That ignores the fact that we are a small country without any large conurbations. Cardiff, our largest conurbation, is very small indeed by UK city standards. What worries me about your use of the 36 per cent and 75 per cent statistics is that median income is dependent on the size of a university, to a large extent, which means the number of its students. In saying that institutions have to be so large as to be on the same scale as others in the rest of the UK, you are saying, as you have spelled out several times this afternoon, that you want a much smaller number of much larger institutions. That will make them more remote, in some cases, from their potential students. The problem is that that will provide, in many cases, less choice for those students who are not free to leave home to live away at university. Those students will often be single parents, mature students, students from poorer homes and students from some ethnic minority backgrounds. That is the problem—you are not providing choice by amassing universities. What you would call ‘competition’, many would call ‘choice’.

Sgiliau, wrthi'n cynnal adolygiad o ymchwil a datblygu ac mae eisoes wedi cynnal trafodaethau ynglŷn ag ymchwil a datblygu ym maes busnes a chynghorau ymchwil yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Cyfarfûm â Gweinidog Gwladol y Deyrnas Unedig dros Brifysgolion a Gwyddoniaeth neithiwr—yr oedd yn gyfarfod adeiladol a phwrpasol—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn cyfarfod â Lesley hefyd maes o law i drafod materion sy'n ymwneud â'r agenda ymchwil sy'n berthnasol i'r ddau ohonynt, gan fod hynny'n rhan o'i bortffolio yntau.

Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd pwynt lle y disgwylir gweld addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn newid o'i chwyr, a dyna fydd yn digwydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Teimlais ryddhad wrth ichi ddweud nad oedd a wnelo hyn â chanoli oherwydd mae llawer yn y datganiad a allai'n wir fod yn ymwneud â chanoli. Dywedasochoch fod

‘Mae Cymru wedi'i llesteirio ers blynyddoedd oherwydd bod ganddi lawer o sefydliadau sy'n rhy fach i greu argraff yn rhyngwladol’.

Mae hynny'n anwybyddu'r ffaith mai gwlad fechan ydym heb ddim canolfannau poblogaeth mawr. Mae Caerdydd, ein dinas fwyaf, yn fach iawn iawn o'i chymharu â dinasoedd y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni am yr ystadegau 36 y cant a 75 y cant a ddefnyddir gennych yw bod canolrif yr incwm yn dibynnu ar faint prifysgol, i raddau helaeth, sy'n golygu faint o fyfyrwyr sydd ganddi. Wrth ddweud ei bod yn rhaid i sefydliadau fod mor fawr nes eu bod ar yr un raddfa â phrifysgolion eraill yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, yr ydych yn dweud, fel yr ydych wedi datgan yn bendant sawl tro y prynhawn yma, eich bod am weld llai o lawer o sefydliadau a'r rheini'n rhai llawer mwy o faint. Mewn ambell achos, bydd hynny'n eu pellhau oddi wrth eu darpar fyfyrwyr. Y broblem yw y bydd hynny, mewn llawer achos, yn golygu llai o ddewis i'r myfyrwyr hynny nad ydynt yn rhydd i symud oddi cartref i fyw mewn prifysgol. Yn aml iawn, rhieni sengl fydd y myfyrwyr hynny, myfyrwyr aeddfed, myfyrwyr o gartrefi tlotach a myfyrwyr sy'n perthyn i rai lleiafrifoedd ethnig. Dyna'r broblem—drwy

gyfuno prifysgolion, nid ydych yn cynnig dewis. 'Dewis' fyddai llawer yn galw'r hyn y byddech chi'n ei alw'n 'gystadleuaeth'.

3.50 p.m.

I also want to sound a caution about the idea that size always creates success. I am delighted that you are emphasising the importance of international competition and success; I agree entirely on that. However, small universities can also be successful internationally. I hope that you will take this opportunity to congratulate the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff, which is a relatively small university, on being judged second in the world in a survey by the International Student Barometer, which surveys over 0.25 million international students. The success of UWIC in attracting international students is important to the Welsh economy. It has proved, from well over 200 international institutions, that it is second in the world for the second year running. So, size does not always mean success. If you look at the evidence from England, you will see that some of the larger mergers have not been successful. What will you do to ensure that there is an added extra, because mergers and size alone will not create success? I am interested in the additional measures that you will be using.

Minister, some of your predecessors have tried to merge institutions in Wales, and we have made little progress so far. My understanding is that there are legal obstacles in your way in this regard, because of the legal status of universities. Are you planning to attempt to change that legal status in any way? That might involve taking on the Privy Council. It would be interesting to know if there is a way in which you can approach this issue to secure mergers that would be easier than that discovered by your predecessors.

You refer to a new method of research funding, and the sharper focus on critical mass and areas of national priority. I welcome the sharper focus. How will that be done in parallel to the English system of research funding? Do you plan to diverge significantly from that? As you say in your

Yr wyf hefyd am roi gair o rybudd ynglŷn â'r syniad bod maint bob tro'n creu llwyddiant. Yr wyf wrth fy modd eich bod yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd cystadleuaeth a llwyddiant rhyngwladol; cytunaf yn llwyr â hynny. Fodd bynnag, gall prifysgolion bychain lwyddo'n rhyngwladol hefyd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio yr achubwch ar y cyfle hwn i longyfarch Athrofa Prifysgol Cymru, Caerdydd, sy'n brifysgol gymharol fach, ar gael ei dyfarnu'n ail yn y byd mewn arolwg gan y Baromedr Myfyrwyr Rhyngwladol, sy'n holi dros 0.25 miliwn o fyfyrwyr rhyngwladol. Mae llwyddiant UWIC i ddenu myfyrwyr rhyngwladol yn bwysig i economi Cymru. Mae wedi profi, o blith ymhell dros 200 o sefydliadau rhyngwladol, ei bod yn ail yn y byd am yr ail flwyddyn yn olynol. Felly, nid yw maint bob tro'n golygu llwyddiant. Os edrychwch ar y dystiolaeth o Loegr, gwelwch nad yw rhai o'r trefniadau uno mwyaf wedi llwyddo. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau bod elfen ychwanegol ynghlwm wrth hyn, oherwydd ni wnaiff uno a maint greu llwyddiant ar eu pen eu hunain? Byddai'n dda gennyf glywed am y mesurau ychwanegol y byddwch yn eu defnyddio.

Weinidog, mae rhai o'ch rhagflaenwyr wedi ceisio uno sefydliadau yng Nghymru, ac ychydig o gynnydd yr ydym wedi'i wneud hyd yn hyn. Fel y caf ar ddeall, mae rhwystrau cyfreithiol yn eich atal yn y cyswllt hwn, oherwydd statws cyfreithiol prifysgolion. A yw'n fwriad gennych geisio newid y statws cyfreithiol hwnnw mewn unrhyw ffordd? Gallai hynny olygu mynd i'r afael â'r Cyfrin Gyngor. Byddai'n dda cael gwybod a oes ffordd haws ichi fynd ar drywydd y mater hwn i sicrhau uno na'r hyn a ganfu eich rhagflaenwyr.

Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at ddull newydd i ariannu ymchwil a chanolbwyntio'n fwy llym ar fâs critigol a meysydd sy'n flaenoriaeth genedlaethol. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r canolbwyntio llymach. Sut y bwriadwch i hynny gydredeg â'r system ariannu ymchwil yn Lloegr? A ydych yn bwriadu gwyo'n

statement, our universities are not just competing within Wales but across the UK. So, that parallel is important in the context of that competition.

You are correct about the need for more high-level research, but it is important that much of it is done on a worldwide basis. Will your priorities require a preference for collaboration within Wales, or is evidence of collaboration on a worldwide basis valid?

I also draw your attention to what I regard as a real concern about the PricewaterhouseCoopers report, which I read carefully. You mentioned non-teaching costs as a figure of 52 per cent of the total, which sounds awful, but are halls of residence included in those non-teaching costs? If you follow the logic through, Minister, a university that has very few halls of residence will be judged, by definition, to be much more efficient than one that has many halls of residence. I am concerned that such a blunt instrument is being used. The statistics to demonstrate it are there in the report. It is a worrying way in which to do the analysis.

I turn very briefly to the point that you make about expanding foundation degrees, which implies links with further education. I take the opportunity to draw your attention to a point made very effectively by the University and Colleges Union, which says that FE and HE links should not be carried out 'on the cheap'—this should not be higher education on the cheap. For good-quality higher education to be provided in further education institutions, there has to be research time—additional time for lecturers who do the teaching. That is not in their contracts at the moment.

Finally, you referred to the democratisation of higher education in Wales. You say that this does not mean centralisation. I hope that it also means that you will not personally be

sylweddol oddi ar y llwybr hwnnw? Fel y dywedwch yn eich datganiad, nid dim ond o fewn Cymru y mae ein prifysgolion yn cystadlu ond â phob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Felly, mae'r cydredeg hwnnw'n bwysig yng nghyd-destun y gystadleuaeth honno.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n sôn bod angen rhagor o ymchwil lefel uchel, ond mae'n bwysig bod llawer o'r gwaith hwnnw'n cael ei wneud ar lefel fyd-eang. A fydd eich blaenoriaethau'n ffafrio cydweithredu o fewn Cymru, ynteu a fydd tystiolaeth o gydweithredu ar lefel fyd-eang yn ddilys?

Tynnaf eich sylw hefyd at yr hyn sy'n destun pryder go iawn yn adroddiad PricewaterhouseCoopers, a ddarllenais yn ofalus. Dywedasoch fod 52 y cant o'r cyfanswm yn cael ei wario ar gostau nad oes a wnelont ag addysgu. Ar yr olwg gyntaf, mae hynny'n ofnadwy, ond a yw neuaddau preswyl wedi'u cynnwys yn y costau hynny? Os dilynwch y ddadl i'w phen, Weinidog, bydd prifysgol nad oes ganddi ond nifer fach iawn o neuaddau preswyl, yn ôl y diffiniad, yn cael ei hystyried yn fwy effeithlon o lawer na phrifysgol a chanddi lawer o neuaddau preswyl. Yr wyf yn poeni bod arf mor bwl yn cael ei ddefnyddio. Mae'r ystadegau i ddangos hynny yno yn yr adroddiad. Mae'n destun pryder bod y dadansoddi'n cael ei wneud ar y sail honno.

Trof yn gryno iawn at eich pwynt am ehangu graddau sylfaen. Mae hynny'n awgrymu cysylltiadau ag addysg bellach. Achubaf ar y cyfle i dynnu eich sylw at bwynt a wnaeth Undeb y Prifysgolion a'r Colegau'n effeithiol iawn, sef na ddylid creu cysylltiadau rhwng addysg bellach ac addysg uwch 'am y nesaf peth i ddim'—ni ddylai hyn gael ei ystyried yn ffordd rad o ddarparu addysg uwch. Er mwyn darparu addysg uwch o safon mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach, rhaid cael amser ar gyfer ymchwil—amser ychwanegol i ddarlithwyr sy'n gwneud y gwaith addysgu. Nid yw hynny yn eu contractau ar hyn o bryd.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriasoch at ddemocrateiddio addysg uwch yng Nghymru. Yr ydych yn dweud nad yw hyn yn golygu canoli. Yr wyf yn gobeithio ei fod hefyd yn golygu na

appointing the governors of our HE institutions, in your role as Minister, but that it will ensure that the process is transparent and rigorous.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am sorry, but I thought that that was pathetic. It was a load of reactionary, complacent, ignorant tosh. Let us be clear about what this agenda is about: it is about high-performing higher education institutions; it is about increasing access to higher education in Wales; and it is about leadership. That is what we need in higher education. The reality of life has to be that we want institutions in Wales that are not competing with each other, but are competing with the best in the world. That means that we need researchers working together collaboratively beyond institutional boundaries, as many of the best ones already are. Of course, it is true that not every institution in Wales has to be a large HE institution. That is why our figure for being above the median in the UK system is 75 per cent, not 100 per cent. We are allowing for that diversity. I congratulate any higher education institution in Wales that is doing well in attracting students from beyond our boundaries—many of them are, and I am pleased that Wales is a net importer of students.

In the context of how mergers will take place, HEFCW has the remit to deliver funding to higher education institutions. It is saying that 75 per cent of them must be above the median income of higher education institutions in the UK by 2013. They will achieve that target. Higher education management and governing bodies will need to face up to that fact. Therefore, it is not a question of needing extra legal powers to deal with the issue. It is a question of higher education institutions facing up to the new reality and understanding that they will only exist either as part of a larger institution or because they themselves have assumed that size.

fyddwch chi'n bersonol yn penodi llywodraethwyr ein sefydliadau addysg uwch, yn rhinwedd eich swydd fel Gweinidog, ond y bydd yn sicrhau bod y broses yn dryloyw ac yn drwyadl.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod hynny'n bathetig. Llwyth o lol adweithiol, hunanfodlon, anwybodus ydoedd. Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â beth yw hanfod yr agenda hon; mae a wnelo â sefydliadau addysg uwch sy'n gwneud eu gwaith yn dda; mae a wnelo ag agor mwy o ddrysau at addysg uwch yng Nghymru; ac mae a wnelo ag arweiniad. Dyna'r hyn y mae ei angen arnom mewn addysg uwch. Realiti'r sefyllfa yw ein bod am gael sefydliadau yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn cystadlu â'i gilydd, ond sy'n cystadlu â'r gorau yn y byd. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen inni gael ymchwilwyr sy'n cydweithio â'i gilydd y tu hwnt i ffiniau sefydliadau, fel y mae llawer o'r goreuon eisoes. Wrth gwrs, mae'n wir nad oes yn rhaid i bob sefydliad yng Nghymru fod yn sefydliad addysg uwch mawr. Dyna pam y gosodwyd 75 y cant ar gyfer y ganran yr ydym am ei gweld yn rhagori ar ganolrif y Deyrnas Unedig, yn hytrach na 100 y cant. Yr ydym yn caniatáu ar gyfer yr amrywiaeth honno. Llongyfarchaf unrhyw sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru sy'n gwneud yn dda o ran denu myfyrwyr o'r tu hwnt i'n ffiniau—mae llawer ohonynt yn gwneud hynny, ac yr wyf yn falch bod Cymru yn fewnforiwr myfyrwyr net.

Yng nghyd-destun sut y bydd yr uno'n digwydd, cylch gwaith y Cyngor Cyllido yw darparu arian ar gyfer sefydliadau addysg uwch. Mae'n dweud y bydd yn rhaid i 75 y cant ohonynt fod yn denu incwm sy'n uwch na chanolrif sefydliadau addysg uwch y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn 2013. Byddant yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Bydd yn rhaid i reolwyr a chyrrff llywodraethu addysg uwch wynebu'r ffaith honno. Felly, nid mater o orfod cael pwerau cyfreithiol ychwanegol i fynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa yw hi. Mater o sefydliadau addysg uwch yn wynebu'r realiti newydd ac yn deall mai'r unig ffordd y gallant fodoli fydd naill ai fel rhan o sefydliad mwy o faint, neu oherwydd eu bod hwy eu hunain wedi tyfu i'r maint hwnnw.

The issue for me is that this agenda does not merely belong to me, the Cabinet and both coalition parties. It is an agenda that has been endorsed by committees in this Assembly—including the former Audit Committee, which is now the Public Accounts Committee, which has made its own comments in the past on the problems of getting higher education institutions not only to merge, but to accept that there is a higher education sector in Wales that is a distinctive Welsh sector. Read the report issued by the committee last year. We are not setting out to do this for the sake of it. We are setting out to do this to create a better higher education system in Wales.

In respect of PricewaterhouseCoopers, if higher education institutions are running their halls of residents efficiently, they are releasing more resources for the front line, which would help their scores in the PWC report.

4.00 p.m.

Finally, on research, I have already had my first, introductory meeting with the UK Government Minister for higher education, as I said. It took place yesterday and it was a constructive meeting. He will meet, in due course, the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, who is conducting our research review. That is the basis on which we will take forward those discussions, on a grown-up level, Government to Government.

**Andrew Davies:** I not only thank the Minister, but commend him on his statement this afternoon. I speak as an Assembly Member who has two universities in my constituency, which is something that I have in common with Jenny Randerson, but that is where the similarity ends. I was beginning to wonder what I would say, because everything had already been said by Nerys Evans and Paul, but, having heard Jenny speak, I can see that the lobbying has already started. Jenny Randerson paid more attention to the briefing that she had received than to what the Minister said in his statement, because his statement was clearly about the democratisation of higher education, not centralisation, and if Jenny cannot understand

Y peth pwysig i mi yw nad dim ond fi, y Cabinet a dwy blaid y glymblaid biau'r agenda hon. Agenda ydyw sydd wedi'i chadarnhau gan bwyllgorau yn y Cynulliad hwn—gan gynnwys y cyn Bwyllgor Archwilio, y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus erbyn hyn. Mae'r pwyllgor hwnnw wedi sôn ei hun yn y gorffennol am broblemau cael sefydliadau addysg bellach nid yn unig i uno, ond i dderbyn bod gennym sector addysg uwch yng Nghymru sy'n sector unigryw Gymreig. Darllenwch yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan y pwyllgor y llynedd. Nid ceisio gwneud hyn er ei fwyn ei hun yr ydym. Yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud hyn er mwyn creu gwell system addysg uwch yng Nghymru.

O ran PricewaterhouseCoopers, os yw sefydliadau addysg uwch yn cynnal eu neuaddau preswyl yn effeithlon, maent yn rhyddhau rhagor o adnoddau i'r rheng flaen, a fyddai'n rhoi hwb i'w sgôr yn adroddiad PWC.

I gloi, ynglŷn ag ymchwil, yr wyf eisoes wedi cael fy nghyfarfod cychwynnol cyntaf â Gweinidog Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig dros addysg bellach, fel y dywedais. Ddoe oedd hynny ac yr oedd yn gyfarfod adeiladol. Maes o law, bydd yn cyfarfod â'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, sy'n cynnal ein hadolygiad o ymchwil. Dyna fydd y sail wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â'r trafodaethau hynny, ar lefel aeddfed, Lywodraeth wrth Lywodraeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Hoffwn nid yn unig ddiolch i'r Gweinidog, ond ei gymeradwyo am ei ddatganiad y prynhawn yma. Siaradaf a minnau'n Aelod o'r Cynulliad a chanddo ddwy brifysgol yn ei etholaeth. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n gyffredin rhyngof fi a Jenny Randerson, ond dyna ben ar y tebygrwydd. Yr oeddwn yn dechrau meddwl beth y byddwn yn ei ddweud oherwydd yr oedd Nerys Evans a Paul wedi dweud popeth eisoes, ond, ar ôl clywed Jenny'n siarad, gallaf weld bod y lobïo wedi dechrau eisoes. Rhoddodd Jenny Randerson fwy o sylw i'r briff yr oedd wedi'i gael nag i'r hyn a ddywedodd y Gweinidog yn ei ddatganiad, oherwydd yr oedd a wnelo'i ddatganiad yn amlwg â democrateiddio addysg uwch, nid â

the difference 10 or 11 years into devolution that is very worrying. Those of us who fought for devolution in 1997 said, 'This is about the democratisation of civil society'.

If a sector receives considerable public expenditure, whether that sector is higher or further education, there are fundamental issues of accountability. When we took evidence in the Finance Committee from Higher Education Wales and HEFCW—it will be interesting to see whether anyone contradicts me in saying this—I do not think that any member of that committee was reassured by what we were told about the performance of the sector, certainly when it came to joint working. I would characterise that joint working by using a description of the Scottish soccer team in the 1970s, or perhaps of the English soccer team in the latest World Cup—great on paper, but not very good on grass. The Wales Audit Office itself said, with regard to the use of reconfiguration fund, through which tens of millions of pounds have gone into encouraging collaboration, that it was sceptical as to whether that funding had made any difference and that those collaborations or partnerships might have occurred anyway.

Jenny is right in saying that higher education is globally competitive. There is no more competitive sector than higher education, but it has to be said—I speak as a critical friend, and I would bow to no-one in the Chamber, because I have as a good a relationship with higher education institutions, collectively and individually, as any other Member—that the performance of our higher education sector has not been world class, despite what might be said in mission statements and press releases. That is the big challenge. Vice-chancellors have said to me privately that higher education has failed Wales economically. They will not say that publicly, and they will not say that collectively, but they will say it individually.

Your agenda on widening access, Minister, has been Assembly Government policy, as

chanoli, ac oni all Jenny ddeall y gwahaniaeth 10 neu 11 mlynedd ar ôl datganoli, mae hynny'n destun pryder mawr. Dywedodd y rheini ohonom a frwydrodd o blaid datganoli yn 1977, 'Mae a wnelo hyn â democrateiddio'r gymdeithas sifil'.

Os gwerir arian cyhoeddus sylweddol ar sector, boed y sector hwnnw'n addysg uwch ynteu'n addysg bellach, mae sicrhau atebolrwydd yn hollbwysig. Pan gawsom dystiolaeth gan Addysg Uwch Cymru a'r Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid—bydd yn ddi-ddorol gweld a wnaiff unrhyw un fy nghywiro wrth imi ddweud hyn—ni chredaf i'r un aelod o'r pwyllgor deimlo'n dawel ei feddwl o glywed yr hyn a glywsom am berfformiad y sector, yn sicr o ran cydweithio. Byddwn yn diffinio'r cydweithio drwy ddefnyddio disgrifiad o dîm pêl-droed yr Alban yn yr 1970au, neu efallai dîm pêl-droed Lloegr yng Nghwpan y Byd sydd ar y gweill yn awr—gwydych ar bapur, ond nid cystal ar wair. Dywedodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ei hun, wrth sôn am ddefnyddio'r gronfa ad-drefnu, abwydwyd degau o filiynau o bunnoedd drwy honno er mwyn annog cydweithredu, ei bod yn amau a oedd yr arian hwnnw wedi gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth a'i bod yn bosibl y byddai'r cydweithredu neu'r partneriaethau hynny wedi digwydd beth bynnag.

Mae Jenny'n iawn yn dweud bod addysg uwch yn gystadleuol ar lefel fyd-eang. Nid oes yr un sector mwy cystadleuol nag addysg uwch, ond rhaid dweud—a dywedaf hyn fel cyfaill beirniadol, ac ni fyddwn yn plygu i neb yn y Siambr, oherwydd mae fy mhertynas â sefydliadau addysg uwch fel corff, ac fel sefydliadau unigol, gystal â phertynas unrhyw Aelod arall—nad yw perfformiad ein sector addysg uwch wedi bod gyda'r gorau yn y byd, ni waeth beth a ddywedir mewn datganiadau cenhadaeth a datganiadau i'r wasg. Dyna'r her fawr. Mae is-gangellorion wedi dweud wrthyf yn breifat fod addysg uwch wedi gwneud cam â Chymru o safbwynt economaidd. Ni fyddant yn barod i ddweud hynny ar goedd, na'i ddweud ar y cyd, ond maent yn barod i'w ddweud fel unigolion.

Mae eich agenda ar ehangu mynediad, Weinidog, a gwella'r perfformiad yn



has raising performance in general. This is about having citizen-led and student-led further and higher education, not about some market-led nostrum, as was introduced by the Conservative Government, when it introduced the incorporation of the further education sector and we had collaborations between higher and further education that were not student led, but institution led. Therefore, I commend your statement with regard to the greater accountability and more democratisation. I note your comments about having more students and fewer vice-chancellors; I have always said that we should have more for less, or more for fewer, to be grammatically correct. No doubt the Minister for Budget and Business is expecting an efficiency saving there, and perhaps you could offer that up as part of the budget discussions.

On a specific point, as a local Member, I would, like Nerys, very much commend what Swansea Metropolitan University and Trinity Saint David University have started to do with Coleg Ceredigion, Coleg Sir Gâr and Pembrokeshire College. I hope that will be joined by the merged Swansea-Gorseinon college when that merger is completed. HEFCW has required a single regional plan for each region in Wales; I support what has already been achieved and I will do everything that I can to encourage collaboration between higher and further education, because your point about widening access and foundation degrees is crucial. Is there anything that you could say as a Minister, without being prescriptive, about how you would see collaboration happening in the south-west in future?

**Leighton Andrews:** You raise a number of important points, Andrew. One of the first things that I want to say is that I see the role of higher education governance as to provide support and a challenge to higher education managements. That is why we have set up a review of the governance of higher education, which is being chaired by John

gyffredinol, wedi bod yn bolisi gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae a wnelo hyn â chael addysg bellach ac addysg uwch a arweinir gan ddinasyddion a myfyrwyr, ac nid â rhyw raglen amheus a arweinir gan y farchnad, megis honno a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol, pan gyflwynodd ymgorffori'r sector addysg bellach a phan gawsom gydweithredu rhwng addysg uwch ac addysg bellach nad oedd yn cael ei dywys gan fyfyrwyr, ond gan sefydliadau. Felly, cymeradwyaf y cyfeiriad yn eich datganiad at fwy o atebolrwydd a mwy o ddemocrateiddio. Nodaf eich sylw ynglŷn â chael mwy o fyfyrwyr a llai o is-gangellorion; yr wyf wedi dweud erioed y dylem gael mwy am lai, neu nifer fwy am nifer lai a bod yn fanwl gywir. Mae'n siŵr bod y Gweinidog dros y Gyllideb a Busnes yn disgwyl gweld arbediad effeithlonrwydd yn y fan honno, ac efallai y gallech gynnig hynny fel rhan o'r trafodaethau am y gyllideb.

Ar bwynt penodol, a minnau'n Aelod lleol, hoffwn innau ymuno â Nerys i gymeradwyo'n fawr yr hyn y mae Prifysgol Fetropolitan Abertawe a Phrifysgol y Drindod Dewi Sant wedi dechrau ei wneud gyda Choleg Ceredigion, Coleg Sir Gâr a Choleg Sir Benfro. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd coleg unedig Abertawe-Gorseinon yn ymuno â'r broses pan fydd yr uno hwnnw wedi'i gwblhau. Mae'r Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch wedi gofyn am un cynllun rhanbarthol ar gyfer pob rhanbarth yng Nghymru; yr wyf yn cefnogi'r hyn a gyflawnwyd eisoes, a gwnaf bopeth yn fy ngallu i annog cydweithredu rhwng addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, oherwydd mae eich pwynt am ehangu mynediad a graddau sylfaen yn hollbwysig. A oes unrhyw beth y gallech ei ddweud a chithau'n Weinidog, heb fod yn rhy benodol, ynglŷn â sut y gwelech y cydweithredu'n digwydd yn y de-orllewin yn y dyfodol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr ydych yn codi nifer o bwyntiau pwysig, Andrew. Un o'r pethau cyntaf yr hoffwn ddweud yw mai rôl llywodraethu addysg uwch yn fy ngolwg i yw cynnig cymorth a her i reolwyr addysg uwch. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi sefydlu adolygiad o lywodraethu addysg uwch. Fe'i cadeirir gan John McCormick, cyn ysgrifennydd y BBC,

McCormick, who is a former secretary of the BBC, a former controller of BBC Scotland, a member of higher education bodies in Scotland, chair of the Scottish Qualifications Authority and chair of the Electoral Commission in Scotland. He started his working life in the BBC in the field of education, therefore he understands education, and he also understands governance and devolution. The team that we will be assembling to support him in that review will be strong.

You are right to draw attention to what the Wales Audit Office and the Assembly's Audit Committee, now the Public Accounts Committee, have said about the difficulties of trying to create collaboration in the past. However, times are changing. You are also absolutely right to talk of being a critical friend of higher education, because higher education needs critical friends if a world-class higher education system is to be established in Wales.

Access will be achieved through better collaboration between FE and HE, and better progression routes and more part-time courses. It is interesting to note that statistics published in the past few days demonstrate that the Open University is getting a significant number of applicants from a younger age group, whereas it was previously seen as something for mature and returning students. The competition that exists internationally and within the UK is significant and courses are being delivered in a variety of ways, and distance learning is a critical element in that.

You are right to say that this should be student and citizen led. I am not a great fan of the word 'choice' in education overall, because 'choice' is the language of the market. We want a wide range of subjects to be taught in Welsh higher education institutions, but not every higher education institution has always taught every subject. That would not be feasible, but we have seen many higher education institutions in Wales and elsewhere going for subjects that are being well taught and developed at nearby institutions. That may be sensible marketing

cyn reolwr BBC yr Alban, aelod o gyrrff addysg uwch yn yr Alban, cadeirydd Awdurdod Cymwysterau yr Alban a chadeirydd y Comisiwn Etholiadol yn yr Alban. Dechreuodd ar ei yrfa yn y BBC ym maes addysg, felly mae'n deall addysg, ac mae hefyd yn deall llywodraethu a datganoli. Bydd y tîm y byddwn yn ei gynnull i'w gynorthwyo yn yr adolygiad hwnnw'n dîm cryf.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n tynnu sylw at yr hyn y mae Swyddog Archwilio Cymru, y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus erbyn hyn, wedi'i ddweud am anawsterau ceisio creu cydweithredu yn y gorffennol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r oes yn newid. Yr ydych hefyd yn llygad eich lle'n sôn am fod yn gyfaill beirniadol i addysg uwch, oherwydd mae angen cyfeillion beirniadol ar addysg uwch er mwyn sefydlu system addysg uwch yng Nghymru sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd.

Sicrheir mynediad drwy sicrhau gwell cydweithredu rhwng addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, a thrwy ddarparu gwell llwybrau i bobl gamu ymlaen, a mwy o gyrsiau rhan amser. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld bod ystadegau a gyhoeddwyd yn yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf yn dangos bod y Brifysgol Agored yn cael nifer sylweddol o ymgeiswyr o grŵp oedran iau, lle'r oedd yn cael ei gweld gynt yn rhywbeth i fyfyrwyr hŷn a myfyrwyr sy'n dychwelyd i ddyysgu. Mae'r gystadleuaeth yn rhyngwladol ac o fewn y Deyrnas Unedig yn sylweddol ac mae cyrsiau'n cael eu darparu mewn amrywiaeth o ffyrdd. Mae dysgu o bell yn elfen hollbwysig o hynny.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud y dylai hyn gael ei dywys gan fyfyrwyr a chan ddinasyddion. Nid wyf yn bleidiol iawn i'r gair 'dewis' ym maes addysg yn gyffredinol, oherwydd iaith y farchnad yw 'dewis'. Yr ydym am gael amrywiaeth eang o bynciau'n cael eu dysgu yn sefydliadau addysg uwch Cymru, ond nid yw pob sefydliad addysg uwch wedi dysgu pob pwnc erioed. Ni fyddai hynny'n ymarferol, ond yr ydym wedi gweld llawer o sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru ac mewn mannau eraill yn dewis dysgu bynciau sy'n cael eu dysgu a'u

in the sense of attracting an international audience for a particular course, but whether it is adding value to Wales and the Welsh economy is another question altogether.

The collaboration that is starting in the south-west between Swansea Metropolitan University, Trinity University College, Coleg Sir Gâr, Coleg Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire College is a model for regional development. There is also another higher education institution in the south-west that I hope will respond positively to that agenda. I therefore look forward to positive engagement across the whole of Wales as HEFCW develops its regional plans.

**David Melding:** I have no doubt that we have heard this afternoon one of the more significant statements that we will hear in this Assembly. I am not quite sure whether I am in shock or in awe. I think that Jenny was in shock, but perhaps I incline a little more towards awe, as I am prepared to see how this will work out. The strategy does not lack ambition in its scope and in the leadership that you want to give.

As a member for South Wales Central, I want to ask you quite a focused question, which I put to you in good faith. Andrew Davies talked about the fact that we need world-class universities. However, the only university that has achieved that status in recent years is Cardiff University, which got into the top 100 ranking. It was unable to hold that position, and it also slipped a little in the Russell group ranking. However, in general, in terms of a wide scope, and of a researched-based university, Cardiff University seems to be the main player in Wales, and it needs to be an institution that can serve the whole of Wales. That means quite an aggressive development of its research programmes, particularly the PhD programmes that it can offer, because that is a world market. You are competing across the world in that area and links are needed across the major players, such as the United States, India, China and many others.

datblygu'n dda mewn sefydliadau wrth ymyl. Efallai fod hynny'n enghraifft o farchnata synhwyrol o ran denu cynulleidfa ryngwladol at gwrs penodol, ond a yw'n ychwanegu gwerth i Gymru ac i economi Cymru? Mae hynny'n fater arall yn llwyr.

Mae'r cydweithredu sy'n cyniwair yn y de-orllewin rhwng Prifysgol Fetropolitan Abertawe, Coleg Prifysgol y Drindod, Coleg Sir Gâr, Coleg Ceredigion a Choleg Sir Benfro yn esiampl ar gyfer datblygu rhanbarthol. Mae sefydliad addysg uwch arall yn y de-orllewin ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd hwnnw'n ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'r agenda honno. Edrychaf ymlaen felly at ymgysylltu cadarnhaol ledled Cymru wrth i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ddatblygu ei gynlluniau rhanbarthol.

**David Melding:** Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth nad ydym wedi clywed y prynhawn yma un o'r datganiadau mwyaf arwyddocaol a glywn yn y Cynulliad hwn. Nid wyf yn siŵr iawn ai wedi cael braw ynteu mewn parchedig ofn yr wyf. Credaf mai cael braw a wnaeth Jenny, ond efallai fy mod i'n tueddu ychydig mwy at y parchedig ofn, oherwydd yr wyf yn barod i weld sut y bydd hwn yn mynd rhagddo. Nid yw'r strategaeth yn brin o uchelgais o ran ei chwmpas ac o ran yr arweiniad yr ydych am ei gynnig.

A minnau'n aelod dros Ganol De Cymru, yr wyf am ofyn un cwestiwn eithaf penodol ichi, ac fe'i gofynnaf yn ddigon didwyll. Soniodd Andrew Davies am y ffaith bod angen prifysgolion arnom sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd. Fodd bynnag, yr unig brifysgol sydd wedi cyrraedd y statws hwnnw yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf yw Prifysgol Caerdydd, a lwyddodd i gael ei chynnwys ymhlith y 100 uchaf. Ni lwyddodd i gynnal y safle hwnnw, ac fe lithrodd ychydig hefyd o ran ei sgôr yng ngrŵp Russell. Serch hynny, yn gyffredinol, o ran ehangder ei chwmpas, ac o ran ei bod yn brifysgol sy'n seiliedig ar ymchwil, Prifysgol Caerdydd, i bob golwg, yw'r prif chwaraewr yng Nghymru, ac mae angen iddi fod yn sefydliad sy'n gallu gwasanaethu Cymru gyfan. Mae hynny'n golygu datblygu ei rhaglenni ymchwil mewn ffordd eithaf ymosodol, yn enwedig y rhaglenni PhD y gall eu cynnig, oherwydd bod honno'n farchnad fyd-eang. Yr ydych yn

cystadlu drwy'r byd yn y maes hwnnw, ac mae angen cysylltiadau gyda gweddill y prif chwaraewyr, megis yr Unol Daleithiau, India, Tsieina a llawer o rai eraill.

4.10 p.m.

In the formula that you will now be agreeing, will you be prepared to see an institution such as Cardiff become more of a research institution in terms of the programmes that it is delivering? That would mean less emphasis on undergraduate studies and more emphasis on postgraduate studies, particularly PhD studies. Evidently, it is not a choice between one and the other, but an institution such as Cardiff would like to see the emphasis shift a bit more in favour of recruiting postgraduates, many of them from abroad. That is the first question on which some clarity is needed. That is not to minimise the importance of the centres of excellence that we could get all over Wales—we have them dotted about now, in fairness, but they do not have the reach to achieve what Cardiff can achieve in the immediate future or the sort of potential that it has.

My second question is: how does your statement link to the economic renewal programme, which we expect to be announced next week? It is as economic drivers that we will get the maximum value for the investment that we are prepared to make in the higher education sector.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank David Melding for his questions and their tone. I declare an interest as I am an honorary professor at Cardiff University, and I have taught postgraduates there. As you know, I gave the first of my speeches on higher education, which set out some of this agenda, at the end of May at an event organised by the Regeneration Institute at Cardiff University. In that lecture, I paid tribute to much of the work that has been done at Cardiff in developing a specific focus on research institutes and developing their agendas for the future.

I would like to pick David up on one point. I think that research and teaching go well

Yn y fformiwla y byddwch yn cytuno arni yn awr, a fyddwch yn barod i weld sefydliad megis Caerdydd yn dod yn fwy o sefydliad ymchwil o ran y rhaglenni y mae'n eu darparu? Byddai hynny'n golygu llai o bwyslais ar astudiaethau gradd a mwy o bwyslais ar astudiaethau ôl-raddedig, yn enwedig astudiaethau PhD. Mae'n amlwg nad dewis rhwng y naill a'r llall ydyw, ond byddai sefydliad megis Caerdydd yn hoffi gweld y pwyslais yn symud ychydig yn fwy at recriwtio myfyrwyr ôl-raddedig, lawer ohonynt o dramor. Dyna'r cwestiwn cyntaf y mae angen rhywfaint o eglurhad yn ei gylch. Nid yw hynny'n tanbrizio pwysigrwydd y canolfannau rhagoriaeth y gallem eu cael ledled Cymru—mae'r rheini gennym eisoes yma a thraw, a bod yn deg, ond nid oes ganddynt y gallu na'r math o botensial i gyflawni'r hyn y gall Caerdydd ei gyflawni yn y dyfodol agos.

Fy ail gwestiwn yw: beth yw'r cysylltiad rhwng eich datganiad â rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi, y disgwyliwn iddi gael ei chyhoeddi yr wythnos nesaf? Sbardunau economaidd a ddaw â'r gwerth mwyaf inni am y buddsoddiad yr ydym yn barod i'w wneud yn y sector addysg uwch.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch i David Melding am ei gwestiynau ac am eu naws. Yr wyf am ddatgan buddiant oherwydd fy mod yn athro anrhydeddus ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd, ac yr wyf wedi dysgu myfyrwyr ôl-raddedig yno. Fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd a wnelo fy araith gyntaf ag addysg uwch, ac yr oedd honno'n cynnwys rhywfaint o'r agenda hon. Ddiwedd Mai oedd hynny mewn digwyddiad a drefnwyd gan y Sefydliad Adfywio ym Mhrifysgol Caerdydd. Yn y ddarlith honno, rhoddais deyrnged i lawer o'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud yng Nghaerdydd i ddatblygu ffocws penodol ar sefydliadau ymchwil a datblygu eu hagendaû ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Hoffwn anghytuno â David ynglŷn ag un pwynt. Credaf fod ymchwil ac addysgu'n

together, and we need to guard against any suggestion that they do not. That is important. Cardiff's role as an all-Wales institution, an all-UK institution and an international institution is important. We want to see all our HE institutions playing to their strengths. We also want them to be in a position to support our access agenda and, at the same time, to provide a platform for research and development, knowledge transfer spin-outs and so on. There is an exciting future for Cardiff in those roles, some of which Cardiff will lead on itself and some of which it will deliver in collaboration with other HE institutions in Wales, or in the UK or internationally. I cannot focus specifically on individual institutions, as that is ultra vires for a Government Minister and is the responsibility of HEFCW.

Announcements will be made on the economic renewal programme in due course. There have been considerable conversations between my department and the department for Economy and Transport.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thank you, Minister, for your statement, which I warmly support and endorse. I see it in the light of other policy statements that we have already had, such as that on widening access. I deem these to be comparable and compatible. As you know, I am particularly interested in the closer work and collaboration that there could be between higher education and industry.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.13 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.13 p.m.*

As we look to the future and the many challenges that we face, we will no doubt consider the green and high-skilled economy that we need to create here in Wales. I agree with your view that more higher education will be delivered through part-time and bespoke courses organised and requested by industry. A key part of the working relationship between higher education and

cyd-fynd yn dda â'i gilydd, a bod angen inni ochel rhag unrhyw awgrym nad ydynt. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae rôl Caerdydd fel sefydliad i Gymru gyfan, sefydliad i'r Deyrnas Unedig Gyfan a sefydliad rhyngwladol yn bwysig. Yr ydym am weld ein sefydliadau addysg uwch i gyd yn manteisio ar eu cryfderau. Yr ydym hefyd am iddynt fod mewn sefyllfa i gefnogi'n hagenda mynediad ac, ar yr un pryd, i ddarparu llwyfan ar gyfer ymchwil a datblygu, rhaglenni deillio sy'n trosglwyddo gwybodaeth ac ati. Mae dyfodol cyffrous i Gaerdydd yn y swyddogaethau hynny, a bydd Caerdydd ei hun yn arwain y gwaith hwnnw mewn ambell faes ac yn cydweithredu â sefydliadau addysg uwch eraill yng Nghymru, neu yn y Deyrnas Unedig neu'n rhyngwladol mewn meysydd eraill. Ni allaf ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar sefydliadau unigol, gan fod hynny'n ultra vires a minnau'n un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth a chyfrifoldeb Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yw hynny.

Bydd cyhoeddiadau ynglŷn â rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi maes o law. Mae trafodaethau sylweddol wedi bod rhwng fy adran i a'r adran dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad. Yr wyf yn ei gefnogi'n gynnes ac yn ei ategu. Fe'i gwelaf yng ngoleuni datganiadau polisi eraill yr ydym wedi'u cael eisoes, megis hwnnw ynglŷn ag ehangu mynediad. Credaf eu bod yn gyffelyb ac yn gydnaws â'i gilydd. Fel y gwyddoch, mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb penodol yn y posibilrwydd o sicrhau gwaith a chydweithredu mwy clos rhwng addysg uwch a diwydiant.

Wrth inni edrych tua'r dyfodol a'r lluo heriau sy'n ein hwynebu, byddwn yn sicr yn ystyried yr economi werdd hynod fedrus y mae angen inni ei chreu yma yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn cytuno â'ch barn y darperir mwy o addysg uwch drwy gyrsiau rhan-amser a thrwy gyrsiau wedi'u teilwra'n arbennig a drefnir gan ddiwydiant ac ar gais diwydiant. Rhan allweddol o'r berthynas gweithio

industry—particularly high-tech industry—is the area of STEM subjects, namely science, technology, engineering and mathematics. Higher education and industry are jointly responsible for training and up-skilling the workers that the economy of the future will need. STEM subjects will be the very foundation of this knowledge and these skills. Engineers will be in particular demand, as always. ConstructionSkills tells me that STEM subjects are the modern subjects that will change and modernise the world. The Welsh economy is part of this, so any future HE strategy needs to take this into account, and encourage closer working between the sector and industry, with particular reference to STEM. I would be grateful for your confirmation that that will be the case.

**Leighton Andrews:** Absolutely, Jeff. You raise an important focus for us. The links between higher education and the economy and Welsh industry have obviously been explored at length by the Enterprise and Learning Committee in its inquiry. I and my colleague the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills are looking at the support that we need to provide, along with the Deputy First Minister, to anchor companies in Wales and at how our higher and further education systems can support the needs of key companies in Wales.

You referred to the development of the green economy. Obviously, there have been significant developments around the establishment of the Low Carbon Research Institute, and work is going on with Cardiff University and others. In the remit letter to HEFCW, I placed the stress on the importance of protecting science, technology, engineering and mathematics in Wales. You are right to stress the advice that you have had from ConstructionSkills in that regard. These are going to be key areas that will provide the expertise for us in the Welsh economy in future and we will support them.

**Gareth Jones:** Minister, I also welcome the statement. As a committee, we have looked at various issues pertaining to higher education.

rhwng addysg uwch a diwydiant—yn enwedig diwydiant technoleg uchel—yw maes pynciau STEM, sef gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg a mathemateg. Mae addysg uwch a diwydiant yn gydgyfrifol am hyfforddi a gwella sgiliau gweithwyr y bydd eu hangen ar economi'r dyfodol. Pynciau STEM fydd sylfaen yr wybodaeth a'r sgiliau hyn. Bydd galw arbennig am beirianwyr fel sydd bob tro'n wir. Dywed SgiliauAdeiladu wrthyf mai pynciau STEM yw'r pynciau modern a fydd yn newid ac yn moderneiddio'r byd. Mae economi Cymru'n rhan o hyn, felly bydd angen i unrhyw strategaeth addysg bellach yn y dyfodol roi sylw i hyn, ac annog y sector i gydweithio'n fwy clos â byd diwydiant, yn benodol yng nghyswllt STEM. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech gadarnhau mai felly y bydd.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn bendant, Jeff. Yr ydych yn codi pwynt pwysig inni ganolbwyntio arno. Mae'n amlwg bod y cysylltiadau rhwng addysg uwch ac economi a diwydiant Cymru wedi cael sylw manwl gan y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn ei ymchwiliad. Yr wyf fi a'm cyd-Weinidog, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, yn ystyried pa gymorth y mae angen inni ei ddarparu, ochr yn ochr â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, i gwmnïau angor yng Nghymru ac ar sut y gall ein systemau addysg uwch ac addysg bellach yng Nghymru gefnogi anghenion ein cwmnïau allweddol.

Crybwyllwyd gennych ddatblygu'r economi werdd. Mae'n amlwg bod datblygiadau sylweddol wedi bod ym maes sefydlu'r Sefydliad Ymchwil Carbon Isel ac mae gwaith ar y gweill gyda Phrifysgol Caerdydd ac eraill. Yn y llythyr cylch gwaith i'r Cyngor Cyllido, rhoddais y pwyslais ar bwysigrwydd gwarchod gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, peirianeg a mathemateg yng Nghymru. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n pwysleisio'r cyngor yr ydych wedi'i gael gan SgiliauAdeiladu yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Bydd y meysydd hyn yn feysydd allweddol a fydd yn sicrhau'r arbenigedd inni yn economi Cymru yn y dyfodol a byddwn yn eu cefnogi.

**Gareth Jones:** Weinidog, yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r datganiad. Yr ydym ni'r pwyllgor wedi edrych ar faterion amrywiol sy'n

The thrust of what we have heard in your statement this afternoon shows that we are heading in the right direction. I want to express my full support for that delivery. Turning to the important issue as far as I am concerned, I can well understand that we need to pursue reorganisation for the sake of efficiency, but, as you stated, it must be done with a purpose, namely to make Wales competitive globally. To what extent are you confident that you can put in train this arrangement—I believe that Professor Merfyn Jones referred to it as a compact—between higher education, the Government and business? Will you pursue that tripartite arrangement, so that we can see Wales making progress in this respect and becoming competitive? It entails trust and a working relationship between the Government, higher education and business. Jenny mentioned the question of centralisation. We know that it is not centralisation, but we need that agreement at that very high proactive level in Wales. I would like your thoughts on that matter.

**Leighton Andrews:** Thank you, Gareth, for the tone of your remarks and for raising that range of issues. You are quite right that there is a focus to what we are doing; there is a deliberate sense of direction; it is about the economy and, of course, about social justice. I guess that the work that we have been undertaking for the past six months or so since I came into this job has been to get HEFCW into a position where a statement such as it made in its corporate plan today could be made. That was building on the 'For Our Future' document that my colleague, Jane Hutt, as my predecessor, published last autumn. So, taking very practical steps through the remit letter, through the action plan we asked for from HEFCW and through its corporate plan, which now encompasses that, it is about how we are going to implement the agenda in practical ways. So, a great deal of the energy has gone into that side of it.

However, you are right that, in a sense, having now been clear with the sector about

ymwneud ag addysg uwch. Dengys byrdwn yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i glywed yn eich datganiad y prynhawn yma ein bod yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Yr wyf am fynegi fy nghefnogaeth lwyr o blaid cyflawni hynny. A throï at y pwynt pwysig yn fy marn i, gallaf ddeall yn iawn bod angen inni fynd ar drywydd ad-drefnu er mwyn bod yn effeithlon, ond, fel y dywedasoeh, rhaid gwneud hynny a diben mewn golwg, sef gwneud Cymru'n gystadleuol ar lwyfan byd-eang. I ba raddau yr ydych yn ffyddiog y gallwch roi'r trefniant hwn ar waith—credaf fod yr Athro Merfyn Jones wedi'i alw'n gyfamod—rhwng addysg uwch, y Llywodraeth a byd busnes? A wnewch fynd ar drywydd y trefniant tairochrog hwnnw, er mwyn inni weld Cymru'n camu ymlaen yn y cyswllt hwn a dod yn gystadleuol? Mae'n golygu ymddiriedaeth a pherthynas gweithio rhwng y Llywodraeth, addysg uwch a byd busnes. Cyfeiriodd Jenny at fater canoli. Gwyddom nad canoli yw hyn, ond mae angen inni gael y cytundeb hwnnw ar y lefel ragweithiol uchel iawn honno yng Nghymru. Hoffwn glywed eich barn am hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch ichi Gareth am naws eich sylwadau ac am godi'r gyfres hynny o faterion. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle bod ffocws i'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud; mae gennym synnwyr o gyfeiriad pwrpasol; mae a wnelo â'r economi, ac, wrth gwrs, â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Am wn i, mae'r gwaith yr ydym wedi bod yn ei wneud ers rhyw chwe mis, ers imi ymgymryd â'r swydd hon, wedi canolbwyntio ar gael Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru i gyrraedd sefyllfa lle y gall wneud datganiad megis hwnnw sydd yn ei gynllun corfforaethol heddiw. Yr oedd hynny'n adeiladu ar sail y ddogfen 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol' a gyhoeddwyd gan fy rhagflaenydd, Jane Hutt, hydref diwethaf. Felly, gan gymryd camau ymarferol iawn, drwy'r llythyr cylch gwaith, drwy'r cynllun gweithredu y gofynasom i'r Cyngor ei ddarparu, a thrwy ei gynllun corfforaethol, sydd bellach yn cynnwys hwnnw, mae a wnelo hyn â sut yr awn ati i roi'r agenda ar waith ar lefel ymarferol. Felly, mae llawer iawn o'r egni wedi mynd i ochr honno'r gwaith.

Serch hynny, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle mai'r cam nesaf o reidrydd, mewn ffordd, a

what we want, the next stage must be to carry on with an agenda of working through—between Government, higher education and industry—how we now look at the opportunities that exist. That work has already started, in the context of the economic renewal programme and in the context of the work that my colleague Lesley Griffiths, as the Deputy Minister for Science, Innovation and Skills, has been undertaking. However, that must now come more to the forefront.

ninnau bellach wedi dweud yn glir wrth y sector beth yw ein dymuniadau, fydd bwrw ymlaen ag agenda—ar y cyd rhwng y Llywodraeth, addysg uwch a diwydiant—i weld sut mae ymateb yn awr i'r cyfleoedd sydd ar gael. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw ar y gweill eisoes, yng nghyd-destun rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi, ac yng nghyd-destun y gwaith y mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Lesley Griffiths, y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, wedi bod yn ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i hynny gael lle mwy amlwg yn awr.

### **Datganiad am y Bwrdd Effeithlonrwydd ac Arloesi Statement on the Efficiency and Innovation Board**

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** I want to update Assembly Members on progress with the Wales efficiency and innovation programme, following up my previous written statements. The implications of last week's UK budget for Wales, particularly for the poorest and most vulnerable, confirm the imperative of sustaining the public services that so many rely on. The efficiency and innovation programme, which I lead, is at the heart of the unique response that we have been building over the past year to lead public services through the next few years and the financial pressures signalled in the budget.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf am roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am y cynnydd gyda rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi Cymru, yn sgil fy natganiadau ysgrifenedig blaenorol. Mae goblygiadau cyllideb y Deyrnas Unedig yr wythnos diwethaf i Gymru, yn enwedig i'r tlotaf a'r mwyaf agored i niwed, yn cadarnhau ei bod yn hollbwysig inni gynnal y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y mae cynifer yn dibynnu arnynt. Y rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi yr wyf yn ei harwain sydd wrth wraidd yr ymateb unigryw yr ydym wedi bod yn ei ddatblygu dros y flwyddyn diwethaf i dywys gwasanaethau cyhoeddus drwy'r ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf a'r pwysau ariannol y cafwyd arwydd ohonynt yn y gyllideb.

4.20 p.m.

The programme aims to transform operational efficiency, catalyse innovation in the way that public services are designed and delivered, and promote collaboration so that we can continue to deliver better outcomes for the people of Wales. This is about service improvement and cost savings, with the citizen at the heart.

Nod y rhaglen yw gweddnewid effeithlonrwydd gweithredol, sbarduno arloesi yn y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eu cynllunio a'u darparu, a hyrwyddo cydweithredu er mwyn inni barhau i sicrhau gwell canlyniadau i bobl Cymru. Mae a wnelo hyn â gwella gwasanaethau ac arbed costau, gan ganolbwyntio ar y dinesydd.

Our approach is grounded in social partnership, mobilising a common commitment and endeavour across public services and sectors with the public service summits convened by the First Minister, providing the shared leadership and partnership working needed to take us

Seilir ein hagwedd ar bartneriaeth gymdeithasol, tanio ymrwymiad ac ymdrech ar y cyd drwy'r holl wasanaethau a'r sectorau cyhoeddus drwy gyfrwng yr uwchgynadleddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a gynullwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, gan gynnig yr arweiniad ar y cyd a'r gwaith partneriaeth



forward during this challenging time.

Every public service organisation in Wales and every sector, whether it is the third sector, the police, local government or NHS Wales, will have their own plans for the way ahead. Working in silos will not deliver the change required. The only way to make the best of our resources is to work together to address these challenges. The summits and the efficiency and innovation board are proving the places to do so on a number of core issues.

The programme currently has seven work streams, each led by a public service chief executive and drawing on resources and professional expertise from the Assembly Government, public services and elsewhere. I wish to thank all of those who have provided leadership on the programme thus far, and I look forward to working with political and administrative leads from across the full spectrum of public services to take this work forward.

Relentless pressure for public services to adopt or adapt best practice is a strong underlying theme. Each work stream comprises a set of projects designed to adopt collective approaches to driving down costs. On procurement, these include a £200 million target over five years for savings through taking a more radical approach, strengthening our national sourcing strategy and all-Wales contracts, working intelligently with our supply base, and maximising use of our award-winning xchangewales e-procurement system. For example, Value Wales and Welsh Health Supplies have developed a community equipment framework contract, the first of its kind in the UK, which is saving over £1 million a year on the purchase of aids such as hoists, commodes and equipment for disabled people at the same time as improving standards and benefitting Welsh businesses. This is a work stream that is already engaged effectively with the private sector, mirroring the success of the economic summits and the associated economic

y mae eu hangen er mwyn inni allu camu ymlaen yn ystod y cyfnod anodd hwn.

Bydd gan bob sefydliad gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, a phob sector, boed hwnnw'n drydydd sector, yn heddlu, yn llywodraeth leol ynteu'n GIG Cymru, ei gynlluniau ei hun ar gyfer y ffordd ymlaen. Ni lwyddir i sicrhau'r newid angenrheidiol os bydd pawb yn gweithio mewn seilo. Yr unig ffordd o fanteisio i'r eithaf ar ein hadnoddau yw drwy gydweithio i fynd i'r afael â'r heriau hyn. Mae'r uwchgynadledau a'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi'n dangos mai dyna'r lle i wneud hynny o ran nifer o faterion craidd.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae saith ffrwd waith i'r rhaglen a phob un o'r rheini'n cael ei harwain gan brif weithredwr un o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Maent yn manteisio ar adnoddau ac arbenigedd proffesiynol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac adnoddau o fannau eraill. Yr wyf am ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cynnig arweiniad yn y rhaglen hyd yn hyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at weithio gydag arweinwyr gwleidyddol a gweinyddol ar draws holl sbectwm y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith hwn.

Mae'r pwysau di-baid ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus i fabwysiadu neu i addasu'r arferion gorau'n thema sylfaenol gref. Mae pob ffrwd waith yn cynnwys set o brosiectau sydd wedi'u cynllunio i fabwysiadu dulliau ar y cyd i wasgu ar gostau. O ran caffael, mae'r rhain yn cynnwys targed i arbed £200 miliwn dros bum mlynedd drwy arddel ymagwedd fwy radical, cryfhau ein strategaeth cyrchu genedlaethol a chontractau Cymru gyfan, gweithio'n ddeallus gyda'n sylfaen cyflenwi, a manteisio i'r eithaf ar system e-gaffael arobryn cyfnewidcymru. Er enghraifft, mae Gwerth Cymru a Chyflenwadau Iechyd Cymru wedi datblygu contract fframwaith ar gyfer cyfarpar cymunedol, y cyntaf o'i fath yn y Deyrnas Unedig, sy'n arbed dros £1 filiwn y flwyddyn ar brynu cymhorthion megis cyfarpar codi, comodau ac offer i bobl anabl, ac ar yr un pryd mae'n gwella safonau ac o fudd i fusnesau yng Nghymru. Dyma un ffrwd waith sydd eisoes yn ymwneud yn effeithiol â'r sector preifat, yn adlewyrchu llwyddiant yr uwchgynadledau economaidd

renewal programme that will be published shortly.

The asset management work stream will achieve savings through better use of the £10 billion public asset base, including joint use, management, transfer and disposal.

For ICT, we are driving an all-Wales framework for public services based around the public service broadband aggregation programme, which typically can deliver up to 20 per cent savings on existing arrangements, sharing data centres, software licensing and other actions.

Through the transforming the business work stream, we are establishing a project to promote lean and systems thinking approaches across public services to streamline operations. We want to build on excellent examples, including Neath Port Talbot and Blaenau Gwent, which have significantly reduced waste in the operation of housing and council tax benefits and the disability facilities grant. The work stream will also be looking at securing efficiencies in using mobile technology and maximising the use of office space; and looking at imaginative ways of reducing office and meeting costs.

The new models of service delivery work stream is also about redesigning the front line, initially concentrating on three to four tough service delivery issues where there is a track record of pioneering action, which needs to be translated into a pan-Wales change; for example, better co-ordination and integration of all the services that engage with families, promote independent living and neighbourhood services. The reward is better outcomes, less duplication and freeing up resources.

Our leadership work stream is addressing organisational development and leadership skills for tough times. Our workforce

a rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi a gyhoeddir yn fuan sy'n gysylltiedig â'r uwchgynadleddau hynny .

Bydd y ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â rheoli asedau'n sicrhau arbedion drwy ddefnyddio'r sylfaen asedau cyhoeddus sy'n werth £10 miliwn yn well, gan gynnwys cyd-ddefnyddio, cyd-reoli, cyd-drosglwyddo a chyd-waredu.

O ran TGCh, yr ydym yn gwthio ymlaen â fframwaith Cymru gyfan ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a hwnnw'n seiliedig ar raglen cydgasglu band eang y sector cyhoeddus. Fel rheol, bydd hynny'n arbed hyd at 20 y cant ar y trefniadau presennol, drwy rannu canolfannau data, trwyddedu meddalwedd a chamau eraill.

Drwy'r ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â gweddnewid busnes, yr ydym yn sefydlu prosiect i hyrwyddo dulliau main a dulliau meddwl drwy systemau ar draws y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus er mwyn symleiddio ffyrdd o weithio. Yr ydym am adeiladu ar sail enghreifftiau rhagorol, gan gynnwys y rheini yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot a Blaenau Gwent sydd wedi lleihau gwastraff yn sylweddol ym maes gweinyddu budd-daliadau tai a threth gyngor a'r grant cyfleusterau i bobl anabl. Bydd y ffrwd waith hefyd yn ystyried sut y gellir arbed arian wrth ddefnyddio technoleg symudol a manteisio i'r eithaf ar ofod swydddfa; ac yn defnyddio'r dychymyg i geisio gostwng costau swydddfa a chyfarfodydd.

Mae a wnelo'r ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â modelau newydd o ddarparu gwasanaethau ag ail-lunio'r rheng flaen hefyd, gan ganolbwyntio i ddechrau ar dri neu bedwar maes darparu gwasanaethau dyrys lle y llwyddwyd i gymryd camau arloesol. Bydd angen trosi hynny'n newid drwy Gymru gyfan. Un enghraifft o hynny yw cyd-drefnu a chydlynu'n well yr holl wasanaethau sy'n ymwneud â theuluoedd, y rhai sy'n hyrwyddo byw'n annibynnol a gwasanaethau bro. Y wobr fydd gwell canlyniadau, llai o ddyblygu a rhyddhau adnoddau.

Mae ein ffrwd sy'n ymwneud ag arweiniad yn mynd i'r afael â datblygu trefniadaeth a sgiliau arwain ar gyfer cyfnod anodd. Yn ein

development work stream is establishing a career transition system for those leaving or moving to other sectors and, among other things, looking at creating a job pool for public services. The involvement of the trade unions through the workforce partnership council is particularly important. The real experts in redesigning the front line are those who do the work and use the services. Over the summer, the First Minister will be meeting staff and users to hear their ideas. In this and other ways, we will continue to develop the programme and I will publish a programme plan providing further detail.

A regular Public Service Management Wales bulletin is also distributed to public service organisations across Wales, and the June bulletin has just been issued. The second public services summit will be held on Friday, 2 July, bringing public service leaders together to strengthen their commitment to the programme and to move from shared purpose to shared implementation of commitments. The theme of the summit is integrated health and social care using the experiences of the NHS to disseminate best practice across public services, and the Minister for Health and Social Services will be giving the keynote speech. The efficiency and innovation board will meet shortly afterwards.

I want to acknowledge all the other work that is being done to improve efficiency by our public sector workforce, our social partners and by individual organisations. Some of this represents genuine transformational change, and we will see more of it as the recommendations of the strategic review of education and the social services commission emerge over the coming year. There is a real sense of a national imperative and commitment to doing everything possible through efficiency, improvement and innovation in order to secure the future of our public services.

ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â datblygu'r gweithlu, yr ydym yn sefydlu system i gynorthwyo'r rheini sy'n ymadael â sector neu'n symud i sector arall. Bydd yn eu cynorthwyo i groesi pont yn eu gyrfa ac ymhlith pethau eraill, yr ydym yn ystyried creu cronfa swyddi i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae sicrhau cyfraniad yr undebau llafur drwy gyngor partneriaeth y gweithlu'n arbennig o bwysig. Yr arbenigwyr go iawn o ran ail-lunio'r rheng flaen yw'r rheini sy'n gwneud y gwaith ac yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau. Dros yr haf, bydd y Prif Weinidog yn cyfarfod â staff ac â defnyddwyr i glywed eu syniadau. Drwy hyn, ac mewn ffyrdd eraill, byddwn yn parhau i ddatblygu'r rhaglen a byddaf yn cyhoeddi cynllun rhaglen a fydd yn cynnwys rhagor o fanylion.

Hefyd, dosberthir bwletin rheolaidd, Rheoli Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru i sefydliadau'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ledled y wlad, ac mae rhifyn Mehefin newydd ei gyhoeddi. Cynhelir ail uwchgynhadledd y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ddydd Gwener, 2 Gorffennaf, gan ddod â holl arweinwyr y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus at ei gilydd i gryfhau eu hymrwymiad i'r rhaglen ac i symud oddi wrth rannu diben i rannu'r broses o roi ymrwymadau ar waith. Thema'r uwchgynhadledd fydd iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol integredig gan ddefnyddio profiadau'r GIG i ledaenu'r arferion gorau drwy'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, a'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fydd y siaradwr gwadd. Bydd y bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi'n cyfarfod yn fuan wedyn.

Yr wyf am gydnabod yr holl waith arall sy'n cael ei wneud i wella effeithlonrwydd gan ein gweithlu yn y sector cyhoeddus, gan ein partneriaid cymdeithasol a chan sefydliadau unigol. Mae rhywfaint o hyn yn gweddnewid pethau o ddifrif a byddwn yn gweld rhagor ohono wrth i argymhellion yr adolygiad strategol o addysg a'r comisiwn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ymddangos yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae gwir ymdeimlad o reidrwydd cenedlaethol ac ymrwymiad i wneud popeth sy'n bosibl drwy sicrhau effeithlonrwydd, gwelliannau ac arloesi er mwyn diogelu dyfodol ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Nick Ramsay:** I thank the Minister for her statement, and I have some questions based on what you have said this afternoon. I will start by putting a negative spin on your comments, perhaps. You mentioned transforming operational efficiency, which we would all welcome. However, that raises questions about why we have not done that before. We have had 10 years of devolution, and if all the things that you have talked about this afternoon are indeed so effective—and I am sure that many of them will be—it is a shame that we do not look at improving efficiency and efficiency across public services in this way in the good times, so that we do not get ourselves into the mess that we have to get out of now.

That aside, I welcome the move to encourage innovation in the public sector and the way in which you have set up the board and have opened up its membership to many stakeholders from authorities across Wales. However, I ask for clarification with regard to the membership, and whether you feel that consultation should take place more widely, namely with the public at large. I can see that many people are involved in the consultation process, but perhaps we can take that even further, beyond the usual local authorities and public sector employees, to the public at large, in order to see what suggestions the public might have about making efficiency savings at this time.

I agree that we need to move away from the outdated culture of silos, but could you give us some concrete examples of the way in which the board will be able to do that? I noticed that you said that the board and the public service summits have proven that they can do that. Therefore, it would be extremely helpful to have concrete examples of how that has happened.

You mentioned ICT and the way in which the all-Wales framework for public services, which is based on the broadband aggregation programme, is looking at making savings.

**Nick Ramsay:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad, ac mae gennyf nifer o gwestiynau ar sail eich geiriau y prynhawn yma. Dechreuaf drwy roi gwedd negyddol ar eich sylwadau, o bosibl. Crybwyllwyd gennych weddnewid effeithlonrwydd gweithredol, a byddem i gyd yn croesawu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n codi cwestiynau ynglŷn â pham nad ydym wedi gwneud hynny o'r blaen. Yr ydym wedi cael 10 mlynedd o ddatganoli, ac os yw'r holl bethau yr ydych wedi sôn amdanynt y prynhawn yma mor effeithiol â hynny—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer ohonynt—mae'n bechod nad ydym yn ystyried gwella effeithlonrwydd ac effeithiolrwydd drwy'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus fel hyn pan fydd pethau'n dda arnom, er mwyn inni beidio â'n cael ein hunain yn y llanastr y mae'n rhaid inni ddianc rhagddo yn awr.

Wedi dweud hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu'r symudiad at annog arloesi yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r ffordd yr ydych wedi sefydlu'r bwrdd ac agor ei aelodaeth i lawer o randdeiliaid o awdurdodau ledled Cymru. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am gael eglurhad ynglŷn â'r aelodaeth, ac a ydych yn teimlo y dylid ymgynghori'n fwy eang, hynny yw â'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol. Gallaf weld fod llawer o bobl yn ymwneud â'r broses ymgynghori, ond efallai y gallem estyn hynny ymhellach eto, y tu hwnt i'r awdurdodau lleol arferol a gweithwyr y sector cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys y cyhoedd yn gyffredinol, er mwyn gweld pa awgrymiadau sydd ganddynt hwy efallai ynglŷn â gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar hyn o bryd.

Yr wyf yn cytuno bod angen inni symud oddi wrth ddiwylliant seilos. Mae eu dyddiau hwy ar ben, ond a allech roi ychydig o enghreifftiau pendant inni o sut y bydd y bwrdd yn gallu gwneud hynny? Sylwais ichi ddweud bod y bwrdd a'r uwchgynadleddau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus wedi profi eu bod yn gallu gwneud hynny. Felly, byddai'n gymorth mawr cael enghreifftiau pendant o sut mae hynny wedi digwydd.

Crybwyllwyd TGCh gennych a sut mae'r fframwaith Cymru gyfan ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd wedi'i seilio ar y rhaglen cydgasglu band eang, yn

You talked about savings that would 'typically' be of the order of 20 per cent—and I noticed that you used the word 'typically'. I presume that that figure has been gauged from the sort of changes that have been made in the past and the savings that have resulted. Are you confident that those savings can be made at this point? We all know that, whatever the sector or organisation, it is often difficult to make savings in ICT, as you can make savings in one area but inefficiencies pop up somewhere else. Therefore, I would be grateful for your assurance that those savings of 20 per cent can indeed be achieved, as I hope they can be.

You spoke in the statement about the idea of redesigning the front line, and you mentioned three or four tough issues to do with service delivery. You were a little vague on that, in fact, because you did not say what those services delivery issues were, and referred only to the better co-ordination of services—I think that you spoke about that in relation to families. As that was a little vague, it would be helpful for us all if you could give us the detail in relation to those three or four tough service delivery areas.

With regard to workforce development and the creation of a job pool for public services, there is a lot to be said for that. However, the Finance Committee looked at that as part of our investigation into areas of the public sector where savings can be made. Thinking back to some of the evidence sessions, it has been said that the idea of a job pool is fine, but there are questions as to who is in the pool at any one point, how many people are in it, and the length of time that is spent in it. Therefore, the reference to a 'job pool' is far too general. We need to know that the job pool will be scrutinised to make sure that it really is freeing up capacity in the public service and is not being used as an excuse for not wanting to take tough decisions about where to move employees.

gobeithio arbed arian. Dywedasoch y bydd hynny 'fel rheol' yn am arbed oddeutu 20 y cant—a sylwais ichi ddefnyddio'r ymadrodd 'fel rheol'. Tybiaf fod y ffigur hwnnw wedi'i dynnu o'r math o newidiadau sydd wedi'u gwneud yn y gorffennol a'r arbedion sydd wedi deillio o hynny. A ydych yn ffyddiog y gellir arbed yr arian hwnnw yn awr? Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod, pa sector neu sefydliad bynnag sydd dan sylw, ei bod yn aml yn anodd arbed arian ym maes TGCh, oherwydd gallwch arbed arian mewn un maes ond wedyn bydd aneffeithlonrwydd yn codi yn rhywle arall. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar o gael sicrwydd gennych y gellir o ddifrif arbed yr 20 y cant hwnnw, gan obeithio'n wir y gellir gwneud hynny.

Yn eich datganiad, soniwyd am y syniad o ail-lunio'r rheng flaen, gan grybwyll tri neu bedwar mater dyrys sy'n berthnasol i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Yr oeddech yn niwlog braidd ynglŷn â hynny, a dweud y gwir, oherwydd ni ddywedasoch beth oedd y materion hynny, gan gyfeirio'n unig at gydlynw gwasanaethau'n well—credaf ichi sôn am hynny yng nghyswllt teuluoedd. Gan fod hynny'n niwlog braidd, byddai'n gymorth inni i gyd petaech yn gallu rhoi'r manylion inni am y tri neu bedwar maes darparu gwasanaethau hynny sy'n feysydd dyrys.

O ran datblygu'r gweithlu a chreu cronfa swyddi ar gyfer y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, mae llawer i'w ganmol yn hynny. Fodd bynnag, edrychodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar hynny wrth inni ymchwilio i feysydd yn y sector cyhoeddus lle y gellir arbed arian. A meddwl yn ôl at rai o'r sesiynau tystiolaeth, dywedwyd bod y syniad o gael cronfa swyddi'n ddigon teg, ond mae'n rhaid holi pwy fydd yn y gronfa ar unrhyw adeg benodol, faint o bobl sydd ynddi, a faint o amser y bydd rhywun yn ei dreulio ynddi. Felly, mae cyfeirio at 'gronfa swyddi' yn rhy gyffredinol o lawer. Mae angen inni wybod y bydd y gronfa swyddi'n destun craffu er mwyn sicrhau ei bod mewn gwirionedd yn rhyddhau capasiti yn y gwasanaeth cyhoeddus ac nad yw'n cael ei defnyddio'n esgus am fod rhywun yn gyndyn o wneud penderfyniadau anodd ynglŷn ag i ble i symud gweithwyr.

4.30 p.m.

Could we have a timescale for improvement? There are a lot of good ideas in this statement, however, it is pretty thin on timescales. With all of the people who are involved in this process, I am sure that it should not be too difficult to prepare some sort of timescale. You have spoken about the urgency of coming up with these efficiency savings, so I think that a timescale would be something that all sectors would welcome.

I am looking forward to the Minister for Health and Social Services' keynote speech at the second public services summit. I do not think that it is just that there is a sense that there is a need for a national imperative; there is a genuine national imperative—I am sure that you would agree—for all of us, from different parties, from the Government and the Assembly, to ensure that efficiency improvement and innovation are at the heart of what we are trying to do. As you said, our role in securing the future of our public services in Wales cannot be underestimated. My party—the official opposition—will support any effort to make these decisions, and I would very much hope that they are made while we still have the chance to do so. If we do not take these decisions now, when we have the choice to do so, to coin a phrase used by Andrew Davies when he was in your position, at some point down the line, in the not too distant future, the Assembly Government may 'hit a brick wall' in terms of funding public services, and I am sure that that is part of your reasoning for setting up this enterprise and innovation board. It is much better that we take the necessary decisions now, and I welcome your efforts to do so with this board.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for welcoming this, Nick. I will, however, challenge your negative spin. Let us go back to Beecham and 'Making the Connections'—I must say that some of those initiatives were before your time—but there has been a five-year improvement programme, led by the former Minister for Finance and Public Service Delivery, which set a target of achieving

A allem gael amserlen ar gyfer gwella? Mae llawer o syniadau da yn y datganiad hwn, ond mae'n denau braidd o ran amserlenni. Gan fod cynifer o bobl yn ymwneud â'r broses hon, siawns na ddylai fod yn rhy anodd paratoi rhyw fath o amserlen. Yr ydych wedi sôn bod angen gwneud yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd hyn yn ddi-oed, felly credaf y byddai pob sector yn croesawu amserlen.

Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at araith y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn yr ail uwchgynhadledd i'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Credaf ei bod yn llawer mwy nag ymdeimlad o reidrwydd cenedlaethol—mae'n rheidrwydd cenedlaethol go iawn—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno—i bawb ohonom, o wahanol bleidiau, o'r Llywodraeth ac o'r Cynulliad, sicrhau bod gwella effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi wrth wraidd yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i wneud. Fel y dywedasoch, ni ellir tanbrisio'n rôl o ran sicrhau dyfodol ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Bydd fy mhlaid i—yr wrthblaid swyddogol—yn cefnogi unrhyw ymdrech i wneud y penderfyniadau hyn, a byddwn yn gobeithio'n fawr iawn y cânt eu gwneud pan fydd y cyfle i'w gwneud yn dal ar gael inni. Oni wnawn y penderfyniadau hyn yn awr, a'r dewis gennym i'w gwneud, a defnyddio ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd gan Andrew Davies pan oedd yntau yn eich swydd chi, gallai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad 'ddod wyneb yn wynebu â wal frics' o ran ariannu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac yr wyf yn siŵr mai dyna ran o'ch rheswm dros sefydlu'r bwrdd menter ac arloesi hwn. Mae'n well o lawer inni wneud y penderfyniadau angenrheidiol yn awr, a chroesawaf eich ymdrechion i wneud hynny drwy'r bwrdd hwn.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi am groesawu hyn, Nick. Serch hynny, mi heriaf eich dehongliad negyddol. Gadewch inni fynd yn ôl at Beecham a 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'—rhaid imi gyfaddef bod rhai o'r cynlluniau hynny cyn eich cyfnod chi—ond mae rhaglen gwella bum mlynedd wedi bod ar waith, o dan arweiniad y cyn Weinidog dros Gyllid a Chyflenwi Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, a

£600 million of efficiency gains across the public service by 2010. Progress has been excellent and we are on track to deliver, and possibly exceed, the target. That programme has been about efficiency and innovation, and, as I have said more than once in response to questions in this Chamber, Andrew Davies made his statement about better outcomes for tougher times in December. We were working on this agenda way before the credit crunch—the recession—hit us, because we knew that we had to ensure that we got the best value for the Welsh pound. We also reformed our public services to deliver front line provision, particularly for the poorest and most vulnerable, and to make them citizen centred. That ethos has provided a steer for the way forward, which is, of course, so appropriate now that we are facing tough times.

You asked a question about who has been involved and I can tell you that there has been the widest engagement possible in this process. There have been seven work streams as part of that engagement, led by local authority chief executives, the chief executive of a new NHS board and the Welsh Local Government Association. On the question you raised about public services' ICT work stream, if you look at the membership that is engaged in that, you will appreciate that it is important that we engaged a supply reference panel that was established with representatives from the Confederation of British Industry, the Federation of Small Businesses, the Wales Council for Voluntary Action, the Social Enterprise Coalition and key industry sectors, such as construction. All of these parties were involved in our procurement work stream; that is the supplier reference panel.

Our development of the public services' broadband programme is about having an integrated ICT architecture for public services, and improving citizens' access to services is at the heart of that. That approach is already delivering savings; the majority of

osododd darged o sicrhau gwerth £600 miliwn o arbedion effeithlonrwydd drwy'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus erbyn 2010. Mae'r cynnydd wedi bod yn rhagorol. Yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i gyrraedd y targed ac, o bosibl, i ragori arno. Yr oedd a wnelo'r rhaglen honno ag effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi, ac, fel yr wyf wedi dweud fwy nag unwaith wrth ymateb i gwestiynau yn y Siambr hon, gwnaeth Andrew Davies ei ddatganiad am ganlyniadau gwell ar gyfer cyfnod anos ym mis Rhagfyr. Yr oeddem yn gweithio ar yr agenda hon ymhell cyn i'r wasgfa gredyd—y dirwasgiad—ein taro, oherwydd gwyddem ei bod yn rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael y gwerth gorau am bunt Cymru. Diwygiwyd ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus hefyd i ddiogelu'r ddarpariaeth ar y rheng flaen, yn enwedig ar gyfer y tlotaf a'r mwyaf agored i niwed, ac i sicrhau eu bod yn canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd. Dyna'r ethos sy'n ein llywio tua'r dyfodol, ac, wrth gwrs, mae hynny mor briodol yn awr, a ninnau'n wynebu cyfnod anodd.

Gofynnwyd cwestiwn gennych ynglŷn â phwy sydd wedi bod yn ymwneud â hyn a gallaf ddweud wrthyich inni ymgysylltu mor eang ag y bo modd â phobl yn y broses hon. Mae saith ffrwd waith wedi bod yn rhan o'r ymgysylltu hwnnw, o dan arweiniad prif weithredwyr awdurdodau lleol, prif weithredwr un o fyrddau newydd y GIG a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. O ran y cwestiwn a godwyd gennych am y ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â TGCh gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, os edrychwch ar yr aelodau sy'n cyfrannu at hynny, mi sylweddolwch ei bod yn bwysig inni gael panel cyfeirio'n cynnwys cyflenwyr. Fe'i sefydlwyd gyda chynrychiolwyr o Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru, Cynghair y Mentrau Cymdeithasol a sectorau allweddol ym myd diwydiant, megis adeiladu. Yr oedd y rhain i gyd yn ymwneud â'n ffrwd waith caffael; sef panel cyfeirio'r cyflenwyr.

Wrth ddatblygu rhaglen band eang y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, y nod yw sicrhau pensaerniaeth TGCh integredig ar gyfer gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac mae gwella mynediad dinasyddion at wasanaethau wrth wraidd hynny. Mae hynny'n eisoes yn arbed

organisations can expect to save approximately 20 per cent of existing costs, and we are driving those savings further.

We have already given you examples in the Chamber of the issues related to new models of delivery that will appear as we focus on the integration of health and social care. The Gwent Frailty Programme is a pioneering programme that puts the citizen and the frail elderly at the forefront in terms of how services are delivered. I go back to Andrew Davies who mentioned bringing in the Kafka Brigade to address why a multiplicity of agencies and professionals often do not deliver, for example, for the victims of domestic violence. I attended a session led by Newport City Council, an authority controlled by Conservatives, which had invited the Kafka Brigade in and we heard the direct experience of a victim of domestic violence and how all of the agencies had failed her and her family, and how we should face up to that and to the need for service redesign to improve delivery. It is imperative that we take forward these opportunities for new models of delivery, but it has to be a process that extends across the public sector and which engages people across professional and organisational boundaries.

You made an important point about the workforce. We are undertaking some work with the workforce by involving not only the Wales Trades Union Congress, but front-line public service workers. It is crucial to engage in this work stream in terms of the way forward. The career transition system, which you mentioned, gives people the opportunity to be mobile and to move to other sectors by creating that job pull for public services. I will refer to my predecessor in this post and recall his commitment—and that of the previous First Minister, which was taken forward by Carwyn Jones—to a Welsh public service that delivers for Welsh citizens to meet Welsh needs.

On the work stream and workforce

arian; gall mwyafrif y sefydliadau ddisgwyl arbed oddeutu 20 y cant o'u costau presennol ac yr ydym yn ceisio gwthio rhagor ar yr arbedion hynny.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi rhoi enghreifftiau yn y Siambr o'r materion sy'n gysylltiedig â modelau darparu newydd a fydd yn ymddangos wrth inni ganolbwyntio ar integreiddio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Rhaglen arloesol yw Rhaglen Pobl Fregus Gwent sy'n rhoi'r dinesydd a'r henoed bregus flaenaf yn y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau. Dychwelaf at Andrew Davies a grybwyllodd ddod â Brigâd Kafka i mewn i ddatrys pam mae llawer o asiantaethau a gweithwyr proffesiynol yn aml yn methu â darparu gwasanaethau'n iawn, er enghraifft, ar gyfer y rheini sy'n dioddef trais domestig. Bûm mewn sesiwn a lywiwyd gan Gyngor Dinas Casnewydd, awdurdod o dan reolaeth Ceidwadwyr Yr oedd wedi gwahodd Brigâd Kafka i mewn a chlywsom wyneb yn wyneb am brofiad rhywun a oedd wedi dioddef trais domestig, sut yr oedd yr asiantaethau i gyd wedi gwneud cam â hi a'i theulu, a sut y dylem i gyd wynebu hynny a bod angen ail-unio'r gwasanaeth er mwyn gwella'r ddarpariaeth. Mae'n hollbwysig inni fwrw ymlaen â'r cyfleoedd hyn i greu modelau newydd, ond rhaid i'r broses ymestyn ar draws y sector cyhoeddus a rhaid iddi fod yn un sy'n meithrin cysylltiad â phobl ar draws ffiniau proffesiynol a threfniadaethol.

Yr oedd eich pwynt am y gweithlu'n bwynt pwysig. Yr ydym yn gwneud rhywfaint o waith gyda'r gweithlu drwy gynnwys nid yn unig Cyngres Undebau Llafur Cymru, ond hefyd weithwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y rheng flaen. Mae'n hollbwysig ymwneud â'r ffrwd waith hon wrth inni fwrw ymlaen. Mae'r system pontio gyrfa, a grybwyllwyd gennych, yn rhoi cyfle i bobl symud o gwmpas a symud i sectorau eraill drwy greu'r atyniad hwnnw i swyddi'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Cyfeiriaf at fy rhagflaenydd yn y swydd hon gan gofio'i ymrwymiad—ac ymrwymiad y cyn Brif Weinidog—y bwriwyd ymlaen ag ef gan Carwyn Jones—i wasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru sy'n darparu ar gyfer dinasyddion Cymru er mwyn diwallu anghenion Cymru.

O ran y ffrwd waith ar gyfer datblygu'r



development, a number of strands of that work on integrating the workforce are about the career transition support group. There are also the strands on employer of choice, corporate responsibility and human resources professions. It is key that the trade union side is engaged in a positive partnership. The integrating workforce project will encounter many challenges in terms of the prospects that it could bring to bear in negotiating with our public sector workforce. It is an enabling work stream to ensure that the workforce can also feed into the new models of delivery to transform business processes.

The timescales are clear. As I mentioned, we have already set a £200 million target on procurement over five years in terms of savings. However, the timescale and the pace of the board are such that after the board's first meeting we identified that not all authorities had signed up to xchangewales. I think that about 11 or 12 authorities had signed up. I said that, by the time we have our next board meeting within a few weeks, I wanted every authority to be signed up. They would need support, advice and guidance, but by the next meeting, they had all signed up to it.

So, I believe that we are at the forefront in Wales, but it is about building on the momentum of the public services reform agenda of the One Wales Government, which has been in place for over five years. However, it is of course, the imperative of the challenge of tougher times. It is through better outcomes that we can achieve in tougher times. When I go to the quadrilateral meeting in a couple of weeks' time with the Ministers for finance from across the UK, this will be on the agenda and I will share with them what we are achieving and delivering in Wales. However, it cannot only be delivered through the cost savings and efficiencies that we are taking forward; it has to be about innovation, engagement and collaboration.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I remind Members that this is an opportunity to question the Minister and it is not appropriate

gweithlu, mae a wnelo sawl llinyn o'r gwaith hwnnw, sy'n ymwneud ag integreiddio'r gweithlu, â'r grŵp sy'n cynorthwyo pobl i bontio rhwng gyrfaoedd. Ceir hefyd y llinynnau sy'n ymwneud a dewis gyflogwr, cyfrifoldeb corfforaethol a phroffesiynau adnoddau dynol. Mae'n allweddol bod ochr yr undebau llafur yn rhan o bartneriaeth gadarnhaol. Bydd prosiect integreiddio'r gweithlu'n dod ar draws llawer o anawsterau o ran y rhagolygon posibl ar gyfer trafod gyda'n gweithlu yn y sector cyhoeddus. Ffrwd waith sy'n galluogi yw hwn er mwyn sicrhau bod y gweithlu hefyd yn gallu bwydo i'r modelau darparu newydd a gweddnewid prosesau busnes.

Mae'r amserlenni'n glir. Fel y crybwyllais, yr ydym eisoes wedi pennu targed i arbed £200 miliwn wrth gaffael dros bum mlynedd. Serch hynny, mae'r bwrdd yn gweithio yn ôl amserlen ac ar gyflymder sy'n golygu inni sylwi ar ôl ei gyfarfod cyntaf nad oedd pob awdurdod wedi ymuno â chfynewidcymru. Credaf fod tua 11 neu 12 awdurdod wedi ymuno â'r rhaglen. Dywedais, erbyn inni gael cyfarfod nesaf y bwrdd ymhen ychydig wythnosau, fy mod am weld pob awdurdod yn ymuno. Byddai angen cymorth, cyngor a chanllawiau arnynt, ond erbyn y cyfarfod nesaf, yr oeddent i gyd wedi ymuno.

Felly, credaf ein bod ar flaen y gad yng Nghymru, ond rhaid inni adeiladu ar fomentwm agenda diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un, sydd wedi bod ar waith ers dros bum mlynedd yn awr. Serch hynny, wrth gwrs, mae'n gyfnod anos, ac mae hynny'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid inni wynebu'r her. Drwy sicrhau gwell canlyniadau y gallwn wireddu pethau mewn cyfnod anos. Pan af i'r cyfarfod pedair ochrog ymhen ychydig wythnosau gyda'r Gweinidogion dros gyllid o bob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig, bydd hyn ar yr agenda, a byddaf yn rhannu gyda hwy yr hyn yr ydym yn ei gyflawni ac yn ei wireddu yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir gwneud hyn drwy arbed costau ac effeithlonrwydd yn unig; rhaid inni hefyd arloesi, ymgysylltu a chydweithredu.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am atgoffa'r Aelodau mai cyfle i holi'r Gweinidog yw hwn ac nad yw'n briodol

to speak for longer than the Minister has spoken in the first place. Nice, short and concise questions will allow the Minister to give nice, short and concise answers.

**Chris Franks:** The restructuring and modernisation of the Welsh NHS and local councils has saved £230 million, as I think that you indicated earlier. It was always clear that cuts would be made by the previous Government in London, but now they will happen faster, harder and quicker, unfortunately. So, I am pleased that the Welsh Government, in light of the restrictions that were anticipated, created the all-Wales public service efficiency and innovation board, which I think has already agreed to save £200 million by 2013.

4.40 p.m.

This is a welcome step in the right direction. However, Plaid Cymru believes that we should go further to fight the closed-box mentality. What are your views on the creation of a Welsh public service, by which I mean that we need one public service across the Welsh NHS, local authorities, and the civil service? Would you agree that workers need to be properly skilled, so that they can move across the whole range of the public sector in Wales? Further, do you agree that it would be far more radical to protect our hospitals and our schools and our council services if we were able to be more adventurous and stretch the boundaries?

We will continue to be underfunded by the Treasury, and it does not look as though we will have any movement there. However, we must not tolerate poor services because of the crisis created by the City of London and the incompetence of Downing Street. In Wales, we need to reduce our costs, and not through the New Labour and Conservative method of outsourcing or privatisation, but by sharing best practice. How will you address this issue? Inefficient, poorly managed public services are not acceptable.

A future Welsh public service means that

siarad yn hwy nag y mae'r Gweinidog wedi siarad yn y lle cyntaf. Bydd gofyn cwestiynau twt, byr a chryno'n rhoi cyfle i'r Gweinidog hithau roi atebion twt, byr a chryno.

**Chris Franks:** Drwy ad-drefnu a moderneiddio GIG Cymru a chynghorau lleol, arbedwyd £230 miliwn, fel yr awgrymwyd gennych gynnu, mi gredaf. Yr oedd yn glir o'r cychwyn y byddai'r Llywodraeth flaenorol yn Llundain yn gwneud toriadau, ond yn awr, bydd y rheini'n digwydd yn gyflymach, yn galetach ac yn fwy sydyn, yn anffodus. Felly, yr wyf yn falch i Lywodraeth Cymru, yng ngoleuni'r cyfyngiadau a ragwelwyd, greu'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi i wasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru gyfan. Credaf iddo gytuno eisoes i arbed £200 miliwn erbyn 2013.

Mae hwn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad iawn sydd i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, mae Plaid Cymru'n credu y dylem fynd ymhellach i frwydro yn erbyn meddylfryd y blwch caeedig. Beth yw eich barn am greu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? Yr hyn sydd gennyf mewn golwg yw bod angen un gwasanaeth cyhoeddus arnom ar gyfer GIG Cymru, yr awdurdodau lleol a'r gwasanaeth sifil? A fydech yn cytuno bod angen i weithwyr gael y sgiliau iawn, er mwyn iddynt symud ar draws holl ystod y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru? At hynny, a gytunwch y byddai'n fwy radical o lawer amddiffyn ein hysbytai a'n hysgolion a gwasanaethau ein cynghorau pe gallech fod yn fwy anturus ac ymestyn y ffiniau?

Bydd y Trysorlys yn dal i'n tanariannu, ac nid oes argoel bod dim yn mynd i newid yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Serch hynny, rhaid inni beidio â goddef gwasanaethau gwael oherwydd yr argyfwng a grëwyd gan Ddinas Llundain ac anallu Downing Street. Yng Nghymru, mae angen inni leihau ein costau, ac nid drwy ddull Llafur Newydd a'r Ceidwadwyr, sef defnyddio ffynonellau allanol neu breifateiddio, ond drwy rannu'r arferion gorau. Sut yr ewch i'r afael â hyn? Nid yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus aneffeithlon o dan reolaeth wael yn dderbyniol.

Yn y dyfodol, rhaid i wasanaeth cyhoeddus

staff, ideas, and best practice have to be shared across the whole of the public sector. How will you implement this aspiration? In case it seems a little daunting, with the difficult economic clouds gathering, we must not forget that the NHS was created in Wales when we were coming out of a war that crippled the economy and created a huge deficit. The founders of the NHS did not turn and hide; they put forward radical ideas and ensured that their values were put into practice. We need to be radical now, and the leadership has to come from the Welsh Government.

Finally, will you give an assurance that privatisation or part-privatisation of public services such as the Royal Mail, as advocated by the parties opposite, is not the answer? Efficient, well-run public services will always beat outsourcing; poor public services will not.

**Jane Hutt:** I think that you have answered your own questions about our engagement with and support for a motivated and skilled Welsh public service. We know from the work stream that I have mentioned on workforce development that there are issues relating to the different terms and conditions for the public sector workforce across Wales. We already have examples across health and social care of teams that work under one manager. It may be that the terms and conditions of those who work in the health service differ from those of local government employees, but those staff are delivering for the citizen in terms of health and social care, and that is from Flying Start projects right the way through to care for the elderly. We have to ensure that we address the issues in the Welsh public service, which of course we are doing with our social partners. There may prove to be a challenge in terms of how we seek to move the Welsh public service forward and break down any barriers that stand in the way of delivering that goal.

I am reminded of the radical leadership that is

yng Nghymru olygu rhannu staff, syniadau a'r arferion gorau ar draws y sector cyhoeddus i gyd. Sut y gwireddwch y dyhead hwn? Rhag ofn inni gael ein digalonni braidd, a'r cymylau economaidd duon yn hel, rhaid inni beidio ag anghofio mai yng Nghymru y crëwyd y GIG a ninnau ar y pryd newydd fod drwy ryfel a dagodd yr economi a chreu diffyg enfawr. Nid troi a chuddio a wnaeth y rhai a greodd y GIG; yn hytrach cynigiwyd syniadau radical ganddynt gan sicrhau bod eu gwerthoedd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith. Mae angen i ninnau fod yn radical yn awr, a rhaid i'r arweiniad ddod gan Lywodraeth Cymru.

Yn olaf, a wnewch ein sicrhau nad preifateiddio neu led-breifateiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus megis y Post Brenhinol, fel yr argymhellir gan y pleidiau gyferbyn, yw'r ateb? Bydd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon sy'n cael eu rhedeg yn dda'n curo preifateiddio bob tro; ond ni wnaiff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus gwael hynny.

**Jane Hutt:** Credaf ichi ateb eich cwestiynau eich hun ynglŷn â'n hymgysylltu â gwasanaeth cyhoeddus medrus, llawn cymhelliant yng Nghymru. Gwyddom yn sgil y ffrwd waith sy'n ymwneud â datblygu'r gweithlu yr wyf wedi'i chrybwyll fod anawsterau ynghlwm wrth y gwahanol delerau ac amodau sydd gan weithlu'r sector cyhoeddus ledled Cymru. Mae gennym enghreifftiau eisoes ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol o dimau sy'n gweithio o dan un rheolwr. Efallai fod telerau ac amodau'r rheini sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn wahanol i delerau ac amodau gwaith gweithwyr llywodraeth leol, ond mae'r staff hynny'n darparu ar gyfer y dinesydd o ran iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ac mae hynny'n wir am brosiectau sy'n amrywio o Dechrau'n Deg yr holl ffordd drwodd i ofalu am yr henoed. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r problemau yng ngwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymru, ac wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn gwneud hynny gyda'n partneriaid cymdeithasol. Efallai y byddwn yn wynebu anawsterau wrth geisio bwrw ymlaen â'r gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a chwalu unrhyw rwystrau sy'n ein hatal rhag cyrraedd y nod hwnnw.

Caf fy atgoffa am yr arweiniad radical y mae

required, which takes us back to this afternoon's statement on 'For Our Future', on the future of higher education. Now is the time for us to drive this agenda of efficiency and innovation. Not only have we talked about it, we have worked together across the public sector. There are now no excuses, because of the threat, as I said right at the start of the statement, to the poorest and most vulnerable of our citizens. We have to ensure that a Welsh public service is fit for purpose and sustainable, and we have to ensure that the front line is protected.

**Peter Black:** For the sake of clarity, Minister, the previous speaker referred to £200 million being saved by 2013, I think. Can you confirm whether that is the case, or is it just a target, as you said in your statement?

My party leader, Kirsty Williams, has previously referred to the need to have a form of star chamber, as in Canada. Will you look at the structures that you have in place, because although you have seven project boards with some no doubt high-flying people who know what they are doing, what is missing is any outside evidence being taken, any transparency as to how they are operating, or any method by which we can avoid special pleading. The Canadian model was exceptional in the sense that it anonymised the proposed savings, in effect, by getting Ministers to scrutinise each other's projects and departments to avoid special pleading. Can you think of ways in which the elaborate structure that you have set up can be made more accountable, open and transparent in its operation?

Minister, as you know, we have raised the issue of savings in the health service in the past. You will recall that the chief finance officers of local health boards gave evidence to an Assembly committee that £1 billion could be saved, but we do not know whether that particular issue is being examined. Can you confirm whether those claims are being examined by your body? Will you also be looking at how your Government operates? Following the bonfire of the quangos and the Government's no-redundancies policy, there is still a substantial pool of civil servants

ei angen, sy'n ein tywys yn ôl at ddatganiad y prynhawn yma am 'Er Mwyn Ein Dyfodol', ynglŷn â dyfodol addysg uwch. Dyma'r adeg inni fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi hon. Yr ydym wedi gwneud mwy na dim ond sôn amdani, yr ydym wedi cydweithio ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Nid oes esgus bellach, fel y dywedais ar ddechrau un y datganiad, oherwydd y bygythiad i'n dinasyddion tlotaf a mwyaf agored i niwed. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yng Nghymru'n addas i'r diben ac yn gynaliadwy, a rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn gwarchod y rheng flaen.

**Peter Black:** Er mwyn bod yn glir, Weinidog, cyfeiriodd y siaradwr blaenorol at arbed £200 miliwn erbyn 2013, mi gredaf. A allwch gadarnhau hynny, ynteu ai dim ond targed ydyw, fel y dywedasoch chi yn eich datganiad?

Mae arweinydd fy mhlaid, Kirsty Williams, wedi dweud o'r blaen bod angen rhyw fath o siambr seren, tebyg i honno yng Nghanada. A wnewch edrych ar y strwythurau sydd gennych ar waith, oherwydd, er bod gennych saith bwrdd prosiect a nifer o bobl ddisglair a'r rheini, mae'n siŵr, yn gwybod eu gwaith, yr hyn sydd ar goll yw derbyn tystiolaeth o'r tu allan, tryloywder inni weld sut maent yn gweithio neu unrhyw ddull o osgoi pledio arbennig. Yr oedd model Canada yn eithriadol am fod yr arbedion a gynigid yn ddienw, mewn gwirionedd, drwy gael Gweinidogion i graffu ar brosiectau ac adrannau Gweinidogion eraill er mwyn osgoi pledio arbennig. A allwch feddwl am ffyrdd o wneud gwaith y strwythur cymhleth yr ydych wedi'i sefydlu'n fwy atebol, yn fwy agored ac yn fwy tryloyw?

Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi codi mater arbedion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd o'r blaen. Mi gofiwch i brif swyddogion cyllid y byrddau iechyd lleol roi tystiolaeth i un o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad y gellid arbed £1 biliwn, ond ni wyddom a yw'r mater penodol hwnnw'n cael ei ystyried. A allwch gadarnhau a yw eich corff chi'n ystyried yr honiadau hynny? A fyddwch hefyd yn edrych ar sut y mae'ch Llywodraeth yn gweithredu? Ar ôl coelcerth y cwangos a pholisi dim diswyddiadau'r Llywodraeth, mae cronfa sylweddol o weision sifil o hyd mewn rhai

waiting to be redeployed, and there are civil servants in some departments being given jobs that could easily be done—or, indeed, are already being done—elsewhere by other civil servants. I am concerned that its centralised bureaucracy means that the Government is not as lean as it could be. Will you confirm that that is also being looked at in the context of how the Government can deliver its agenda, policy processes and legislation with the leanest possible number of staff?

Joint working is very much the flavour of the day in the Government's thinking, and quite rightly so. However, a number of obstacles still lie in the way of joint working, especially across sectors. You will be aware of the recent articles on the joint working proposed in Powys between local government and the health sector, where there is great reluctance on the part of Powys Council to move forward with this because of the impression that the Assembly Government is not prepared to operate with it on equal terms, particularly on the no-redundancies policy. That means that any savings that arise from that joint working will be expected to be found from the council disproportionately. There is an impression in local government that although councils can work with each other easily—although that does not always work out—when they start working with other sectors under the direct influence of the Assembly Government, particularly health and education, there is no level playing field and it is the councils that are expected to take the pain of driving forward the efficiencies that we all want to see. How is your Government driving forward the joint-working agenda with those two big-spending departments of health and education?

I gave an example of that in the Health, Wellbeing and Local Government Committee last week when the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government was being scrutinised. In my city of Swansea, there is a local council, two universities, an FE college, a local health board and a number of other public sector bodies. However, each has their own back-office systems. Should we not have a single back-office system to deal with all that? Local government should be doing

adrannau'n aros i gael eu hadleoli, ac mae gweision sifil mewn rhai adrannau'n cael gwaith y gellid yn hawdd ei wneud—neu, yn wir, sydd eisoes yn cael ei wneud—mewn mannau eraill gan weision sifil eraill. Yr wyf yn poeni bod ei biwrocratiaeth ganolog yn golygu nad yw'r Llywodraeth mor fain ag y gallai fod. A wnewch gadarnhau bod hynny'n cael ei ystyried hefyd yng nghyd-destun sut y gall y Llywodraeth wireddu ei hagenda, ei phrosesau polisi a'i deddfwriaeth gyda'r nifer leiaf, feinaf o staff

I raddau helaeth iawn, cydweithio yw athroniaeth ddiweddaraf y Llywodraeth, ac mae hynny'n gwbl iawn. Serch hynny, mae nifer o rwystrau'n dal i atal pobl rhag cydweithio, yn enwedig ar draws sectorau. Gwyddoch am yr erthyglau diweddar ynglŷn â'r cynlluniau i gydweithio ym Mhowys rhwng llywodraeth leol a'r sector iechyd. Mae Cyngor Powys yn gyndyn iawn o symud ymlaen â hyn oherwydd bod ganddo'r argraff nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn barod i gydweithredu ag ef ar delerau cydradd, yn enwedig o ran y polisi dim diswyddiadau. Mae hynny'n golygu y disgwylir i gyfran fwy nag sy'n deg o unrhyw arbedion sy'n codi yn sgil y cydweithio hwnnw ddod gan y cyngor. Yr argraff mewn llywodraeth leol yw, er y gall cynghorau gydweithio'n rhwydd—er nad yw hynny bob tro'n llwyddo—pan fyddant yn dechrau gweithio gyda sectorau eraill sydd o dan ddylanwad uniongyrchol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn enwedig ym maes iechyd ac addysg, nad oes cae chwarae gwastad ac y disgwylir i'r cynghorau ysgwyddo'r boen o fwrw ymlaen â'r arbedion yr ydym i gyd am eu gweld. Sut mae eich Llywodraeth yn gyrru'r agenda cydweithio yn ei blaen gyda'r ddwy adran hynny sy'n warwyr mawr, yr adran iechyd a'r adran addysg?

Rhoddais enghraifft o hynny yn y Pwyllgor Iechyd, Lles a Llywodraeth Leol yr wythnos diwethaf, wrth i'r pwyllgor graffu ar waith y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol. Yn fy ninas i, Abertawe, mae cyngor lleol, dwy brifysgol, coleg addysg bellach, bwrdd iechyd lleol a nifer o gyrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, mae gan bob un ei system swyddfa gefn ei hun. Oni ddylem gael un system swyddfa gefn i ymdrin â hynny i gyd? Dylai

more to achieve that, but should the health and education sectors not be pushing that forward, too, to try to ensure that we get those cross-sectoral savings? How are you ensuring that that happens, and how are you achieving that cross-sectoral joint working to achieve those savings?

4.50 p.m.

You also referred to health and social services. I am interested in the good practice that you are looking at elsewhere, particularly over the border in England. I have recently been to Hereford and Sandwell to see what is being done there to improve the delivery of health and social services and to drive out inefficiencies. There is another good example in Torbay. Are your boards going outside Wales's borders to look for those examples and to see what we can learn from what is done in other places?

Minister, there is a huge agenda here. I get the impression from your statement that, although the intent is there, you have so far only scratched the surface, and that the agenda that you are following is not as radical and far-reaching as it could be if you started to break down the barriers that still exist throughout Wales between the various institutions that deliver public services.

**Jane Hutt:** I will focus on just two or three of your points and questions. This is about engaged leadership, is it not? This is a pan-public sector issue, bringing together the people who will drive the change. We can give a steer here, and we have some levers at our disposal. We have the incentives, the carrot and the stick. At the end of the day, however, we will have to drive that change at a local and regional level. Having an engaged leadership across local government, the NHS, the third sector and trade unions is critical to delivery. Engaged leadership is delivering through the work of the operational board that I chair, and it will be taken to the public services summit on Friday, with more than 100 people from across the public sector attending. Look also to the bulletin. Have you

llywodraeth leol fod yn gwneud rhagor i sicrhau hynny, ond oni ddylai'r sector iechyd a'r sector addysg fod yn gwthio hynny yn ei flaen hefyd, er mwyn ceisio gwneud yn siŵr ein bod yn sicrhau'r arbedion traws-sector hyn? Sut yr ydych yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd, a sut yr ydych yn sicrhau'r cydweithio traws-sector hwnnw er mwyn gwireddu'r arbedion hynny?

Cyfeiriasoch hefyd at iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae gennyf ddi-ddordeb yn yr arferion da yr ydych yn edrych arnynt mewn mannau eraill, yn enwedig dros y ffin yn Lloegr. Yr wyf wedi bod yn Henffordd ac yn Sandwell yn ddiweddar i weld beth sy'n cael ei wneud yno i wella'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac i ddileu aneffeithlonrwydd. Ceir enghraifft dda arall yn Torbay. A yw eich byrddau'n mynd y tu allan i ffiniau Cymru i chwilio am yr enghreifftiau hynny ac i weld beth y gallwn ei ddysgu yn sgil yr hyn a wneir mewn mannau eraill?

Weinidog, mae agenda enfawr yn y fan hon. Caf yr argraff o'ch datganiad, er bod y bwriad yno, nad ydych eto ond wedi crafu'r wyneb, ac nad yw'r agenda yr ydych yn ei dilyn mor radical ac mor bellgyrhaeddol ag y gallai fod petaech yn dechrau chwalu'r rhwystrau sy'n dal i fodoli ledled Cymru rhwng y gwahanol sefydliadau sy'n darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Jane Hutt:** Canolbwyntiaf ar ddau neu dri'n unig o'ch pwyntiau a'ch cwestiynau. Mae a wnelo hyn ag arweiniad ymroddedig, onid oes? Mae'n fater sy'n berthnasol i'r sector cyhoeddus i gyd, ac mae'n dwyn ynghyd y bobl a fydd yn sbarduno'r newid. Gallwn lywio'r broses yma, ac mae nifer o bethau y gallwn ei wneud i ysgogi pethau. Mae gennym y cymhellion, y foronen a'r wialen. Yn y pen draw, fodd bynnag, bydd yn dal yn rhaid inni sbarduno'r newid hwnnw ar lefel leol ac ar lefel ranbarthol. Mae sicrhau bod gennym arweiniad ymroddedig ar draws llywodraeth leol, y GIG, y trydydd sector a'r undebau llafur yn hollbwysig er mwyn cyflawni hyn. Mae arweiniad ymroddedig yn cyflawni pethau drwy waith y bwrdd gweithredol yr wyf yn ei gadeirio, a

read the June bulletin yet? I circulated it to Members this morning. There will be one next week as well. Regarding the work streams, I have already told you about the membership of the collaborative procurement work stream, which includes the private sector as well as the social enterprise sector. Every work stream is led by a public service leader, a chief executive.

Given how this feeds into the budget, finding efficiencies and making cost savings are critical. As I work with my fellow Ministers in these tough times, following the challenges set by the UK coalition Government's budget of last week and the May cuts, we have to drive efficiencies to protect and safeguard front-line services. I have mentioned the community equipment framework, which is saving us £1 million a year, and it is the first contract of its kind in the UK. That is taking us forward.

Do not forget what has already been delivered: we have made £500 million-worth of efficiencies. More than £300 million-worth of savings have been realised through reshaping public services. That is about commissioning services jointly. Of course we are looking outwards. Of course our work streams are looking at what can be learned from the rest of the UK and Europe. Indeed, I am sure that this matter will come up during policy scrutiny at Assembly committees. Smarter procurement has already delivered more than £100 million in savings, which includes more than £3 million-worth of savings in the NHS from changes to prescribing medicines. Making better use of staff time has saved a further £230 million in the restructuring and modernisation of the NHS and local government. That is what is to be described and talked about on Monday—sharing best practice. Of course, you are right about streamlining back-office support functions, and that has already delivered £85 million-worth of savings. Today is an

throsoglwyddir hynny i'r uwchgynhadledd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ddydd Gwener, lle bydd mwy na 100 o bobl o bob rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus yn bresennol. Edrychwch hefyd ar y bwletin. A ydych wedi darllen bwletin Mehefin eto? Fe'i dosbarthais i'r Aelodau y bore yma. Bydd un yr wythnos nesaf hefyd. O ran y ffrydiau gwaith, yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn wrthy ch am aelodau'r ffrwd waith ar gyfer caffael cydweithredol, sy'n cynnwys y sector preifat yn ogystal â'r sector mentrau cymdeithasol. Arweinir pob ffrwd waith gan un o arweinwyr y sector cyhoeddus, prif weithredwr.

A chofio sut mae hyn yn bwydo i'r gyllideb, mae canfod arbedion effeithlonrwydd ac arbed costau'n hollbwysig. Gan fy mod yn gweithio gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn y cyfnod anodd hwn, yn dilyn yr heriau a osodwyd yn sgil cyllideb Llywodraeth glymblaid y Deyrnas Unedig yr wythnos diwethaf a'r toriadau ym mis Mai, rhaid inni sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd er mwyn gwarchod a diogelu gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen. Yr wyf wedi sôn am y fframwaith cyfarpar cymunedol, sy'n arbed £1 miliwn y flwyddyn a dyna'r contract cyntaf o'i fath yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hynny'n gam ymlaen.

Peidiwch ag anghofio'r hyn sydd wedi'i gyflawni eisoes: yr ydym wedi gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd gwerth £500 miliwn. Llwyddwyd i arbed gwerth mwy na £300 miliwn drwy ail-lunio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae a wnelo hynny â chomisiynu gwasanaethau ar y cyd. Wrth gwrs ein bod yn edrych y tu hwnt i Gymru. Wrth gwrs bod ein ffrydiau gwaith yn edrych ar yr hyn y gellir ei ddysgu gan weddill y Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop. Yn wir, yr wyf yn siŵr y codir hyn wrth graffu ar bolisiau ym mhwyllgorau'r Cynulliad. Mae caffael doethach eisoes wedi arbed dros £100 miliwn, sy'n cynnwys gwerth mwy na £3 miliwn o arbedion yn y GIG wrth newid y drefn rhagnodi meddyginiaethau. Drwy ddefnyddio amser staff yn well, arbedwyd £230 miliwn arall wrth ailstwythuro a moderneiddio'r GIG a llywodraeth leol. Dyna a ddisgrifir ac a drafodir ddydd Llun—rhannu'r arferion gorau. Wrth gwrs, yr ydych yn iawn yn sôn am symleiddio swyddogaethau cymorth y swyddfa gefn, ac mae hynny eisoes wedi

opportunity for me to share with Members, particularly those in the opposition, what we are doing to engage not just you but our partners in the public sector as we take this to the summit on Friday. We are at the forefront of the joint-working agenda. We have practices that are at the forefront in the UK. This is not just about our public services summit. No-one else in the rest of the UK is taking this kind of approach, and the other Ministers for finance across the UK will want to learn from it.

**Alun Davies:** I thank you, Minister, for your statement this afternoon. It has been welcomed on all sides—or at least most sides—of the Chamber. We also welcome the way in which you have taken forward the process.

If possible, I want to ask you questions on two areas. The first is on the emergency services. We are aware that all three emergency services already work closely together and I know that money has been spent by the Assembly Government on investing in projects to help with closer collaboration in the Dyfed-Powys area. How do you intend to take forward the sharing of resources and much closer working relationships between all the blue-light services to ensure that we have a seamless response to emergency situations, but also a seamless management of those services? Outside the cities of Wales, there is a real need for far closer collaboration and co-operation between the three services.

The second point that I want to make is about structures and services. All too often, particularly when we talk about local government, the debate gets stuck in the mud of structures and we forget that the purpose of the structure is to deliver a service. From my perspective, I want you to focus on the delivery of a service, rather than on the structure that lies behind it, Minister. Peter Black has already referred this afternoon to issues in Powys, and we know that there are further issues in north Wales between

arbed gwerth £85 miliwn. Mae heddiw'n gyfle imi rannu gyda'r Aelodau, yn enwedig â'r rheini yn y gwrthbleidiau, yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud i ymgysylltu nid yn unig â chi, ond hefyd â'n partneriaid yn y sector cyhoeddus wrth inni fynd â hyn gerbron yr uwchgynhadledd ddydd Gwener. Yr ydym ar flaen y gad o ran yr agenda cydweithio. Mae gennym arferion sydd ar flaen y gad yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae a wnelo hyn â mwy na dim ond yr uwchgynhadledd gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid oes neb arall yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn mynd ati fel hyn, a bydd Gweinidogion cyllid eraill o bob rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig am ddysgu yn ei sgil.

**Alun Davies:** Diolch ichi, Weinidog, am eich datganiad y prynhawn yma. Mae wedi'i groesawu ar bob ochr—neu o leiaf ar bron bob ochr—o'r Siambr. Yr ydym yn croesawu hefyd y ffordd yr ydych wedi bwrw ymlaen â'r broses.

Os oes modd, yr wyf am eich holi ynglŷn â dau faes. Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â'r gwasanaethau brys. Yr ydym yn gwybod bod pob un o'r tri gwasanaeth brys eisoes yn cydweithio'n glos a gwn fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwario arian ar fuddsoddi mewn prosiectau i'w cynorthwyo i gydweithredu'n fwy clos yn ardal Dyfed-Powys. Sut y bwriadwch fwrw ymlaen â rhannu adnoddau a chreu perthynas gweithio fwy clos o lawer rhwng pob un o'r gwasanaethau golau glas er mwyn sicrhau bod yr ymateb i argyfyngau'n ymateb cydgysylltiedig, ond hefyd bod y gwasanaethau hynny'n cael eu rheoli mewn ffordd gydgysylltiedig. Y tu allan i ddinasoedd Cymru, mae gwir angen cydweithredu a chydweithio mwy clos o lawer rhwng y tri gwasanaeth.

Mae a wnelo fy ail bwynt â strwythurau a gwasanaethau. Yn rhy aml o lawer, yn enwedig pan fyddwn yn sôn am lywodraeth leol, bydd y ddadl yn cloffi yn llaca'r strwythurau a byddwn yn anghofio mai diben y strwythur yw darparu gwasanaeth. O'm safbwynt i, yr wyf am eich gweld yn canolbwyntio ar ddarparu gwasanaeth, yn hytrach nag ar y strwythur sy'n sail iddo. Weinidog, mae Peter Black eisoes wedi cyfeirio y prynhawn yma at anawsterau ym Mhowys, a gwyddom fod anawsterau eraill



Denbighshire and Conwy, in which joint appointments and joint working have not succeeded in reality. Many of us in the Chamber want to see the Assembly Government being more proactive in ensuring that local authorities and public bodies collaborate in a more meaningful way, to ensure that the structures are in place and that services are delivered so that the citizen can see a difference. When we talk about efficiencies, we do not mean simply chopping down services and attacking the public sector, as the Conservative-Lib Dem Government is doing at the moment; we mean nurturing the public sector and ensuring that we have efficient public services, focusing on the delivery of services, not on the elimination of jobs and support staff.

**Jane Hutt:** Putting the citizen at the forefront of how we design, shape and deliver our public services is the key objective of the efficiency and innovation programme agenda. Emergency services are a good example of where you can look at co-location. There are many examples of fire and rescue services co-locating. I went to a new development in Llandrindod Wells, which will be a new, relocated police station and court service. That will save money through relocation to a redundant estate, and it will also co-locate services for the community. With the emergency services, we look to share not only back-room services, but also front-line delivery, as with the 1000 Lives Campaign that is being taken forward in health. All that is being driven through the co-location workforce stream. We are looking at our assets, at what the public sector owns in Wales, and ensuring that we are making the best use of them. If you put the citizen at the forefront, that will cut through institutional barriers and structures. It has to be about redesigning services and making changes that may require, in the end, some legislation or institutional change, so that also has to be on the agenda.

On the importance of the collaboration

yn y gogledd rhwng sir Ddinbych a Chonwy, lle nad yw cydbenodi a chydweithio wedi llwyddo mewn gwirionedd. Mae llawer ohonom yn y Siambr am weld Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fwy rhagweithiol o ran sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol a chyrff cyhoeddus yn cydweithredu mewn ffordd fwy ystyrion, gan sicrhau bod y strwythurau ar waith a gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu er mwyn i'r dinesydd weld gwahaniaeth. Pan fyddwn yn sôn am arbedion effeithlonrwydd, nid tocio gwasanaethau i'r bôn ac ymosod ar y sector cyhoeddus sydd gennym mewn golwg, sef yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd; yr hyn sydd gennym mewn golwg yw meithrin y sector cyhoeddus a sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau cyhoeddus effeithlon sy'n canolbwyntio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau, nid ar ddileu swyddi a staff cymorth.

**Jane Hutt:** Amcan allweddol agenda'r rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi yw rhoi'r dinesydd flaenaf wrth inni gynllunio, llunio a darparu'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae gwasanaethau argyfwng yn enghraifft dda o faes lle y gallech ystyried cydleoli. Ceir llawer o enghreifftiau o wasanaethau tân ac achub yn cydleoli. Euthum i ddatblygiad newydd yn Llandrindod. Bydd gorsaf yr heddlu a gwasanaeth y llysoedd yn symud i ganolfan newydd yno. Bydd hynny'n arbed arian drwy symud i adeilad segur a bydd hefyd yn cydleoli gwasanaethau ar gyfer y gymuned. O ran y gwasanaethau argyfwng, yr ydym yn gobeithio'u gweld nid yn unig yn rhannu gwasanaethau'r ystafell gefn, ond hefyd ddarpariaeth y rheng flaen, yn yr un modd â'r Ymgyrch 1000 o Fywydau sydd ar y gweill ym maes iechyd. Mae hynny i gyd yn cael ei ddatblygu drwy'r ffordd waith sy'n ymwneud â chydleoli. Yr ydym yn ystyried ein hasedau, yr hyn y mae'r sector cyhoeddus yn berchen arnynt yng Nghymru, ac yn sicrhau ein bod yn eu defnyddio yn y ffordd orau. Os rhowch y dinesydd flaenaf, bydd hynny'n torri drwy rwystrau a strwythurau sefydliadol. Y nod o reidrwydd yw ail-lunio gwasanaethau a newid pethau y gall fod angen rhywfaint o ddeddfwriaeth neu newid sefydliadol i'w gwireddu maes o law, felly, rhaid i hynny hefyd fod ar yr agenda.

O ran pwysigrwydd yr agenda cydweithredu,

agenda, my colleague, Carl Sargeant, was talking about that today in his important contribution about the way forward. He outlined his support for local government and his expectation of collaboration to ensure that we deliver the best services and outcomes for our citizens. That is at the forefront of how we are taking forward the Wales efficiency and innovation programme.

**Andrew Davies:** I take on board the Deputy Presiding Officer's injunction to be brief. I was listening to Radio 4's *The Today Programme* this morning, and the chief constable of an English police force said that that force would very much welcome a strategic approach from the Government on collaboration, as opposed to what seems like each police force being left on its own. I commend your statement and the work that the Government is doing, unlike some of the contributions that I have heard—particularly from Peter Black. For a member of the City and County of Swansea council to criticise Government for its lack of action is rather like a serial offender criticising the criminal justice system.

5.00 p.m.

I have just two questions. First, you mentioned £200 million over five years on procurement, but that is only one area of public service delivery. Are targets being set for other areas within the nine work streams that I believe you have? If so, what are the timescales that are being imposed?

Secondly, in many cases—and here I agree with the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning—we need to focus on delivery. We often know what works at a local service delivery level. How will you incentivise the rolling-out of best practice? It was worrying that the old invest-to-save fund was significantly undersubscribed, which seemed to indicate that local authorities, health bodies and others at that time did not feel pressure or urgency in adopting a more efficient way of delivering front-line services.

yr oedd fy nghyd-Aelod, Carl Sargeant, yn sôn am hynny heddiw yn ei gyfraniad pwysig ynglŷn â'r ffordd ymlaen. Soniodd am ei gefnogaeth i lywodraeth leol a'i fod yn disgwyl gweld cydweithredu er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn darparu'r gwasanaethau a'r canlyniadau gorau i'n dinasyddion. Dyna un o'r ystyriaethau pennaf wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi Cymru.

**Andrew Davies:** Gwrandawaf ar gais y Dirprwy Lywydd ar inni fod yn gryno. Yr oeddwn yn gwrandao ar *The Today Programme* ar Radio 4 y bore yma, a dywedodd prif gwnstabl un o heddluoedd Lloegr y byddent yn croesawu'n fawr ymagwedd strategol gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â chydweithredu, yn hytrach na bod pob heddlu, i bob golwg, yn cael ei adael ar ei ben ei hun. Cymeradwyaf eich datganiad a'r gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud, yn groes i rai o'r cyfraniadau yr wyf wedi'u clywed—yn enwedig gan Peter Black. Mae clywed aelod o gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe yn beirniadu'r Llywodraeth am ddiffyg gweithredu'n debyg braidd i droseddwr mynych yn beirniadu'r system cyfiawnder troseddol.

Dau gwestiwn yn unig sydd gennyf. Yn gyntaf, crybwyllwyd £200 miliwn dros bum mlynedd gennych ym maes caffael, ond dim ond un maes darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yw hwnnw. A oes targedau'n cael eu pennu ar gyfer meysydd y ffrydiau gwaith eraill sydd gennych, naw ohonynt mi gredaf? Os felly, beth yw'r amserlenni sy'n cael eu pennu?

Yn ail, mewn llawer achos—a chytunaf yn hyn o beth â'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol oes—mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar ddarparu'r gwasanaeth. Byddwn yn aml yn gwybod beth sy'n gweithio ar lefel darparu gwasanaethau'n lleol. Pa gymhelliant a roddwch i ledaenu'r arferion gorau? Yr oedd yn destun pryder bod cyn lleied wedi manteisio ar yr hen gronfa buddsoddi i arbed. I bob golwg, yr oedd hynny'n awgrymu nad oedd awdurdodau lleol, cyrff iechyd ac eraill yn teimlo bryd hynny bod brys neu eu bod o dan bwysau i

ddarparu gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen yn fwy effeithlon.

**Jane Hutt:** Targets are important to drive this change. That does not mean service redesign and workforce development across the board; it is about negotiation and looking at the best services at the front line. Targets are not just set for collaborative procurement; I have already mentioned the public sector ICT strategy and other opportunities to get to that 20 per cent and more, and that strategy has already been delivered. As for incentivising the change, the invest-to-save scheme, which you introduced, has now been taken up much more rigorously, and not only by the NHS, which has used invest-to-save funding—I think that it had over £11 million in the last round—to incentivise integration of health and social care, but also for some workforce development change.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae targedau'n bwysig i sbarduno'r newid hwn. Nid yw hynny'n golygu ail-lunio gwasanaethau a datblygu'r gweithlu drwyddi draw; mae a wnelo â thrafod ac edrych ar y gwasanaethau gorau ar y rheng flaen. Nid dim ond ar gyfer caffael cydweithredol y pennir targedau; yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y strategaeth TGCh ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus ac am gyfleoedd eraill i gyrraedd yr 20 y cant hwnnw a rhagor, ac mae'r strategaeth honno wedi'i gwireddu eisoes. O ran cymhelliant i newid, erbyn hyn, mae llawer mwy yn manteisio ar y cynllun buddsoddi i arbed, a gyflwynwyd gennych, ac nid dim ond yn y GIG, sydd wedi defnyddio arian buddsoddi i arbed—credaf iddo gael dros £11 miliwn yn y rownd ddiwethaf—i gymell integreiddio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol, ond hefyd i gyflwyno ambell newid ym maes datblygu'r gweithlu.

Coming back to Nick's point, the brutal reality is that it is a national imperative to secure better outcomes for tougher times. It goes back to your statement in December, Andrew, that if we do not deliver the most efficient and innovative public services in Wales, then given the cuts and the budget that we were faced with last week, we will not be serving the people of Wales, and we will not be contributing to the recovery of the economy. This is about efficiency and innovation in the public sector, but if we do not get this right, it will adversely impact on the private sector as well—and not just in terms of contracts and procurement. We are driving that agenda forward, and that will come through in the economic renewal programme next week, ensuring that we deal with the barriers to procurement, as well as looking at the opportunities for the private sector to grow in partnership and collaboration with the public sector. Without that, we will not be doing justice to the recovery in leading Wales out of the recession.

A dychwelyd at bwynt Nick, y realiti hyll yw ei bod yn rhaid inni fel gwlad sicrhau gwell canlyniadau mewn cyfnod anos. Ac adleisio'ch datganiad ym mis Rhagfyr, Andrew, oni ddarparwn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mwyaf effeithlon ac arloesol yng Nghymru, yna, ac ystyried y toriadau a'r gyllideb y daethom wyneb yn wyneb â hwy yr wythnos diwethaf, ni fyddwn yn gwasanaethu pobl Cymru, ac ni fyddwn yn cyfrannu at adfer yr economi. Mae a wnelo hyn ag effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi yn y sector cyhoeddus, ond oni wnawn hyn yn iawn, caiff effaith niweidiol ar y sector preifat hefyd—ac nid dim ond o ran contractau a chaffael. Yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda honno, a daw hynny drwodd yn rhaglen adnewyddu'r economi yr wythnos nesaf, gan sicrhau ein bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhwystrau rhag caffael, yn ogystal ag edrych ar y cyfleoedd i'r sector preifat dyfu mewn partneriaeth â'r sector cyhoeddus a thrwy gydweithredu ag ef. Heb hynny, ni fyddwn yn gwneud cyfiawnder â'r adferiad wrth arwain Cymru o'r dirwasgiad.

**Brian Gibbons:** I will be brief. This is a welcome statement on public service modernisation within a public service model. I was pleased that there was no talk about privatisation, market testing or Trojan horses

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddaf yn gryno. Mae'r datganiad hwn ynglŷn â moderneiddio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o fewn model gwasanaeth cyhoeddus yn ddatganiad i'w groesawu. Yr oeddwn yn falch nad oedd sôn

that would defragment our public services under the banner of the big society. I was particularly pleased to note your reference to the trade union movement and the importance of workforce engagement in this agenda, because this is crucial. There is a real challenge to the workforce here, and I do not think that the response should necessarily be, 'What we have, we hold', and that is the end of the story. The trade union movement and members of the workforce have a massive creative contribution to make to this modernisation agenda, and, hopefully, the programme that you are outlining will be able to tap into that creative spirit.

This is very much the Assembly Government giving a strong lead. How will you be able to move this forward to more local innovation, as this is mainly about what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing? As Andrew Davies pointed out, some of the big problems are not at Assembly Government level but at a more local level. Therefore, I would be grateful if you could indicate how the Assembly Government will be able to drive this forward at a more local level. Are bodies such as local delivery boards still operational? Can developments such as outcome agreements be useful catalysts for further change?

**Jane Hutt:** Yes, strong leadership is coming from the Welsh Assembly Government to drive the efficiency and innovation programme but, as I said in response to Peter's question, it has to be delivered locally, by local authorities delivering these services in partnership with the NHS and the third sector. We have to look at what can be delivered locally, regionally and nationally. These are the issues that we are all now addressing. We have addressed them in the statement on higher education; we are addressing them in relation to health and social care; we are addressing them in relation to our discussions and debates about collaboration and how it can be achieved across the public sector.

am breifateiddio, am brofi'r farchnad nac am geffylau Caerdroea a fyddai'n darnio'n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o dan faner y gymdeithas fawr. Yr oeddwn yn arbennig o falch o'ch clywed yn sôn am fudiad yr undebau llafur a phwysigrwydd ymgysylltu â'r gweithlu yn yr agenda hon, oherwydd mae hyn yn hollbwysig. Mae her go iawn i'r gweithlu yma, ac ni chredaf y dylid ymateb o reidrwydd drwy ddweud 'Cadwn afael ar yr hyn sydd gennym', ac mai dyna ddiwedd y stori. Mae gan fudiad yr undebau llafur ac aelodau'r gweithlu gyfraniad creadigol enfawr i'w wneud i'r agenda moderneiddio hon, a, gobeithio, bydd y rhaglen yr ydych yn ei disgrifio'n gallu manteisio ar yr ysbryd creadigol hwnnw.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dangos arweiniad cryf yn y cyswllt hwn. Sut y llwyddwch i ddatblygu hyn er mwyn sicrhau arloesi ar lefel fwy lleol, gan fod a wnelo hyn yn bennaf â'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud? Fel y dywedodd Andrew Davies, nid ar lefel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y mae rhai o'r problemau mawr ond ar lefel fwy lleol. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddangos sut y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gallu gyrru hwn yn ei flaen ar lefel fwy lleol. A yw cyrff megis y byrddau cyflawni lleol yn dal ar waith? A all datblygiadau megis cytundebau canlyniadau fod yn sbardun defnyddiol i sicrhau mwy o newid?

**Jane Hutt:** Ydyw, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dangos arweiniad cryf i sbarduno'r rhaglen effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi, ond, fel y dywedais wrth ymateb i gwestiwn Peter, rhaid gwireddu hynny'n lleol, gan awdurdodau lleol sy'n darparu'r gwasanaethau hynny mewn partneriaeth â'r GIG a'r trydydd sector. Rhaid inni ystyried yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni'n lleol, yn rhanbarthol ac yn genedlaethol. Dyma'r pethau yr ydym i gyd yn mynd i'r afael â hwy yn awr. Yr ydym wedi mynd i'r afael â hwy yn y datganiad am addysg uwch; yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â hwy yng nghyswllt iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol; yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â hwy yng nghyswllt ein trafodaethau a'n dadleuon ynglŷn â chydweithredu a sut mae cyflawni hynny ar draws y sector cyhoeddus.

I mentioned the people who can drive that change—the people who work in those services—in my statement. The First Minister leads by chairing a workforce partnership council with all the public sector unions. He is now also going to meet staff and users of front-line services over the coming weeks to engage with them about their experiences and to see the pressures that are on them. We have talked today about the pressures on front-line social workers who are now faced not only with a public sector pay freeze but also additional workload and stress because of the communities and families that they are serving. It is critical that we are seen to be there with the public sector workforce, listening to them and engaging with them. We did this in the economic summits. It was the trade unions, working with business, that helped to create ProAct and asked how people can be kept in work. We got the money from Europe to ensure that we could upskill trainers, even though some of those private sector employers were going into shorter working weeks. It kept them in work. These are the discussions that we must have with our front-line workers. We are having those discussions locally, regionally and nationally through this efficiency and innovation board.

Crybwyllais y bobl sy'n gallu sbarduno'r newid hwnnw—y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaethau hynny—yn fy natganiad. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn arwain drwy gadeirio cyngor partneriaeth y gweithlu gyda holl undebau'r sector cyhoeddus. Mae hefyd yn awr yn mynd i gyfarfod â staff a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'r rheng flaen dros yr wythnosau nesaf i siarad â hwy am eu profiadau ac i ddeall y pwysau sydd arnynt. Yr ydym wedi sôn heddiw am y pwysau sydd ar weithwyr cymdeithasol y rheng flaen. Mae'r rhain yn awr nid yn unig yn wynebu rhewi eu cyflogau yn y sector cyhoeddus ond llwyth gwaith a straen ychwanegol hefyd oherwydd y cymunedau a'r teuluoedd y maent yn eu gwasanaethu. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cael ein gweld yn sefyll gyda gweithlu'r sector cyhoeddus, yn gwrando arnynt ac yn meithrin cysylltiad â hwy. Gwnaethom hyn yn yr uwchgynadleddau economaidd. Yr undebau llafur yn cydweithio gyda byd busnes a fu'n gymorth i greu ProAct ac a ofynnodd sut y gellid cadw pobl mewn gwaith. Cawsom yr arian gan Ewrop i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gwella sgiliau hyfforddwyr, er bod rhai o'r cyflogwyr hynny yn y sector preifat yn dechrau gweithio wythnos waith fyrrach. Llwyddwyd i'w cadw mewn gwaith. Dyma'r trafodaethau y mae'n rhaid inni eu cael gyda'n gweithwyr ar y rheng flaen. Yr ydym yn cynnal y trafodaethau hynny'n lleol, yn rhanbarthol ac yn genedlaethol drwy'r bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesi hwn.

### **Datganiad am y Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion Statement on the School Effectiveness Framework**

**The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):** The Welsh Assembly Government's school effectiveness framework aims to deliver strong and effective school leadership and high-performing schools. It provides the overarching policy to drive improvements in educational standards and provision over the next decade. It has been developed on the basis of international research into what makes schools effective and is based on what the educationalists call 'whole-system reform'. This means all levels of the education system working collaboratively for the common good of all children and young

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):** Nod fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw cynnig arweiniad cryf ac effeithiol mewn ysgolion a sicrhau bod ysgolion yn gwneud yn dda. Mae'n cynnig y polisi cyffredinol i sbarduno gwella safonau a'r ddarpariaeth addysgol dros y degawd nesaf. Fe'i datblygwyd ar sail ymchwil rhyngwladol i'r hyn sy'n gwneud ysgolion yn effeithiol ac fe'i seilir ar yr hyn a elwir gan addysgwyr yn 'ddiwygio system-gyfan'. Mae hyn yn golygu bod y system addysg ar bob lefel yn cydweithredu er lles pob plentyn a pherson ifanc ym mhob ysgol.

people in all schools. The SEF will drive education reform in Wales and all other education policies will be aligned to it.

The overarching aims are achieving better learning outcomes and wellbeing for all children and young people, regardless of their socioeconomic background, and reducing the variation in learning outcomes within and between classrooms, schools and local authorities.

Since taking over this role, I have stressed the need for better implementation and fewer initiatives and the importance of keeping things simple. Therefore, the SEF will focus simply on three inter-related priorities: improved literacy levels, improved numeracy levels and reducing the impact of poverty on educational attainment.

I want to see a culture of high aspirations for all our young people, regardless of social class, family background, gender, ethnicity or language. The Welsh Assembly Government, local authorities and schools are currently working together to decide how these priorities will be taken forward within a wider national framework. Local authorities will determine local and regional delivery in the context of the national policy direction.

5.10 p.m.

The school effectiveness framework puts headteachers and teachers in the driving seat of reform, backed by an effective challenge and leadership role for local authorities. It recognises the central role that teachers play in transforming learner outcomes, through the development of professional learning communities where teachers learn from one another. In due course, we will ensure that our structure for school governance also supports the SEF.

There are six key drivers of change. First, the effective use of data, including Estyn inspection data, to benchmark performance and to signal areas for development and improvement. Estyn's common inspection framework will be aligned with the SEF from

Bydd y Fframwaith yn sbarduno diwygio addysg yng Nghymru a bydd pob polisi addysg arall yn cael ei gysoni â'r fframwaith hwn.

Y nodau cyffredinol yw sicrhau gwell canlyniadau dysgu a gwell lles i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc, ni waeth beth yw ei gefndir cymdeithasol-economaidd, a lleihau'r amrywiadau a welir rhwng canlyniadau dysgu o fewn ystafelloedd dosbarth, ysgolion ac awdurdodau a rhyngddynt.

Ers ysgwyddo'r swydd hon, yr wyf wedi pwysleisio bod angen gwell gweithredu a llai o gynlluniau a phwysigrwydd cadw pethau'n syml. Felly, bydd y Fframwaith yn canolbwyntio'n syml ar dair blaenoriaeth gydgyssylltiedig: gwell lefelau llythrennedd, gwell lefelau rhifedd a lleihau dylanwad tlodi ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol.

Yr wyf am weld diwylliant dyheadau uchelgeisiol i'n holl bobl ifanc, o ba ddosbarth cymdeithasol bynnag, a beth bynnag y bo cefndir eu teulu, eu rhyw, eu hethnigrwydd neu eu hiaith. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion yn cydweithio i benderfynu sut mae bwrw ymlaen â'r blaenoriaethau hyn o fewn fframwaith cenedlaethol ehangach. Bydd awdurdodau lleol yn penderfynu sut y'i gwreiddir yn lleol ac yn rhanbarthol yng nghyd-destun y trywydd polisi cenedlaethol.

Mae'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yn rhoi penaethiaid ac athrawon wrth lyw'r diwygio, ac yn gefn i hynny, rhoddir her effeithiol a rôl arwain i awdurdodau lleol. Mae'n cydnabod rôl ganolog athrawon o ran gweddnewid canlyniadau dysgwyr, drwy ddatblygu cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol, lle bydd athrawon yn dysgu'r naill gan y llall. Maes o law, byddwn yn sicrhau bod ein strwythur ar gyfer llywodraethu ysgolion yn gefn i'r fframwaith hefyd.

Bydd chwe phrif beth yn sbarduno newid. Yn gyntaf, defnyddio data'n effeithiol, gan gynnwys data arolygu Estyn, i feincodi perfformiad ac i ddynodi meysydd y gellid eu datblygu a'u gwella. Caiff fframwaith arolygu cyffredin Estyn ei gysoni â'r

this autumn. Secondly, the strengthening of teaching and learning through a coherent menu of opportunities for continuing professional development. Thirdly, the strengthening of leadership in schools and local authorities through customised and focused leadership development. Fourthly, the establishment of professional learning communities within, between and across schools. Fifthly, the clarification of accountability for schools, governors, local authorities and the Assembly Government. Sixthly, the building of capacity at school, local and national levels.

Work is already under way on piloting the school effectiveness framework, and there will be further workshops next month. I have been impressed by the support given to the framework not only by local authorities, headteachers and teachers, but by pupils who have been involved in the pilot schemes. We have already agreed a national model for school improvement with all 22 local authorities, delivered system leadership training to local authorities, and delivered training on professional learning communities to 850 schools across Wales and 12 local authorities. Training for a further 650 schools and five authorities will take place in the autumn term. Remaining schools and local authorities will receive training by March 2011. Many of the schools that are taking part are concentrating on literacy and numeracy.

Delivering the three priorities of the SEF requires us to draw together a range of work already in place, ensuring that we deliver improved outcomes for children and young people. For example, through the attendance and behaviour action plan, we aim to create a culture of early intervention, effective support and ways to share good practice to promote positive behaviour and attendance in all our schools, so that learners are in classrooms learning and not distracted by poor behaviour. We continue to drive ahead with a statutory reform agenda for additional learning needs. This development programme will result in a new framework to support all those involved in the field of additional learning needs. The reform will deliver an

Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion o'r hydref ymlaen. Yn ail, cryfhau addysgu a dysgu drwy ddewislen o gyfleoedd cydlynol ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus. Yn drydydd, cryfhau arweiniad mewn ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol drwy ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygu arweinwyr a theilwra'r trefniadau ar gyfer hynny. Yn bedwerydd, sefydlu cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol o fewn ysgolion, rhyngddynt ac ar eu traws. Yn bumed, egluro atebolrwydd ysgolion, llywodraethwyr, awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn chweched, meithrin gallu ar lefel yr ysgol, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol.

Mae gwaith ar y gweill eisoes i dreialu'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion a chynhelir rhagor o weithdai fis nesaf. Mae'r gefnogaeth a gafwyd i'r fframwaith, nid yn unig o du awdurdodau lleol, penaethiaid ac athrawon, ond o du disgyblion sydd wedi bod yn ymwneud â'r cynlluniau peilot, wedi creu argraff arnaf. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cytuno ar fodol cenedlaethol ar gyfer gwella ysgolion gyda phob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol, wedi rhoi hyfforddiant arwain system i awdurdodau lleol, ac wedi rhoi hyfforddiant ar gymunedau dysgu proffesiynol i 850 o ysgolion ledled Cymru ac i 12 awdurdod lleol. Rhoddir hyfforddiant i 650 o ysgolion eraill ac i bum awdurdod yn nhymor yr hydref. Bydd gweddill yr ysgolion a'r awdurdodau lleol yn cael hyfforddiant erbyn mis Mawrth 2011. Mae llawer o'r ysgolion sy'n cymryd rhan yn canolbwyntio ar lythrennedd a rhifedd.

Er mwyn gwireddu tair blaenoriaeth y Fframwaith, bydd angen inni dynnu ynghyd wahanol elfennau'r gwaith sydd ar y gweill eisoes, gan sicrhau ein bod yn gwireddu gwell canlyniadau i blant a phobl ifanc. Er enghraifft, drwy'r cynllun gweithredu ar bresenoldeb ac ymddygiad, ein nod fydd creu diwylliant ymyrryd yn gynnar, cymorth effeithiol a dulliau o rannu'r arferion gorau i hyrwyddo ymddygiad cadarnhaol a phresenoldeb yn ein hysgolion i gyd, er mwyn i ddysgwyr ddysgu yn ein hystafelloedd dosbarth yn hytrach na bod eu sylw'n cael ei dynnu oddi ar eu gwaith am fod rhai'n camymddwyn. Yr ydym yn dal i fwrw ymlaen ag agenda diwygio statudol ar gyfer anghenion dysgu ychwanegol. Bydd y

improved learning environment and better outcomes for all children and young people with additional learning needs.

Within our focus on literacy, we are, of course, mindful of the need to ensure literacy in Welsh as a first language as well as in English and to have due regard to the issues that arise in many Welsh-medium and bilingual settings. Ensuring that the emerging professional learning communities take account of the linguistic diversity of Wales is crucial to the development of the school effectiveness framework. They should lead to improvements in the support available for all teachers in Wales. My officials are already working on plans to ensure the creation of effective Welsh-medium professional learning communities.

As I have said publicly, I am currently considering how the use of in-service training days can support the SEF, while also looking to mitigate the impact of disruption to education that bad weather can cause. I will make a written statement on this soon. As Members will be aware, to support system-wide reform further, in January this year, I announced a wide-ranging and strategic review to look at the cost of administering the education system in Wales. PricewaterhouseCoopers carried out phase 1 of the review, and its report was published on 18 May. A project framework is now being developed to provide the leadership and strategic direction needed to drive the changes required and to inject some real momentum into the process.

Working together, my department, the Welsh Local Government Association, local government and schools are beginning to reform the school system. There are many challenges ahead, but it is vital that we take this work forward relentlessly so that we make a significant and sustainable improvement for all children and young people, particularly in relation to literacy, numeracy and reducing the link between poverty and educational attainment.

diwygio'n sicrhau gwell amgylchedd dysgu a gwell canlyniadau i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc a chanddo anghenion dysgu ychwanegol.

Wrth inni ganolbwyntio ar lythrennedd, yr ydym, wrth gwrs, yn cadw mewn cof bod angen sicrhau llythrennedd yn y Gymraeg fel iaith gyntaf yn ogystal ag yn y Saesneg a rhoi sylw dyladwy i'r materion sy'n codi mewn llawer o sefyllfaoedd cyfrwng Cymraeg a dwyieithog. Mae sicrhau bod y cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol sy'n egino'n rhoi sylw i amrywiaeth ieithyddol Cymru yn elfen hollbwysig wrth ddatblygu'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Dylent wella'r cymorth sydd ar gael i holl athrawon Cymru. Mae fy swyddogion eisoes yn gweithio ar gynlluniau i sicrhau bod cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol cyfrwng Cymraeg effeithiol yn cael eu creu.

Fel yr wyf wedi dweud ar goedd, yr wyf wrthi'n ystyried sut mae defnyddio'r diwrnodau hyfforddiant mewn swydd i gefnogi'r Fframwaith, gan geisio, ar yr un pryd, sicrhau cyn lleied o darfu ar addysg ag y bo modd pan fydd y tywydd yn wael. Byddaf yn rhoi datganiad ysgrifenedig am hyn cyn bo hir. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, er mwyn cynorthwyo i ddiwygio'r system drwyddi draw, ym mis Ionawr eleni, cyhoeddais hefyd adolygiad eang a strategol i ystyried cost gweinyddu'r system addysg yng Nghymru. Cwblhawyd cyfnod 1 yr adolygiad gan PricewaterhouseCoopers a chyhoeddwyd ei adroddiad ar 18 Mai. Mae fframwaith prosiect wrthi'n cael ei ddatblygu yn awr i gynnig yr arweiniad a'r trywydd strategol sy'n angenrheidiol er mwyn sbarduno'r newidiadau y mae gofyn amdanynt ac er mwyn a chwistrellu momentwm go iawn i'r broses.

Drwy gydweithio, mae fy adran, Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, llywodraeth leol ac ysgolion yn dechrau diwygio system yr ysgolion. Mae heriau lawer o'n blaenau, ond mae'n hollbwysig inni fwrw ymlaen yn ddiwyro â'r gwaith hwn er mwyn inni wella pethau'n sylweddol ac mewn ffordd gynaliadwy i bob plentyn a pherson ifanc, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt llythrennedd, rhifedd a lleihau'r cysylltiad rhwng tloedi a chyrhaeddiad addysgol.



**Paul Davies:** First, I thank the Minister for his statement on the school effectiveness framework. I welcome some of the points that he has made, and particularly his commitment to keeping things simple. I appreciate that the framework is the Assembly Government's key policy with regard to education reform, and I am sure that we all agree with the underlying principle of achieving better learning outcomes for our children. Given that this framework is a major part of driving improved outcomes for children and young people, how does the Welsh Assembly Government intend to monitor the success of this framework to ensure that we see a real improvement in outcomes?

Central to the school effectiveness framework is the idea of tri-level reform, which relies on effective collaboration between the Welsh Assembly Government, local authorities and schools. Given that collaboration is crucial to the success of the framework, will the Minister outline how the effectiveness of this collaboration has been measured so far, and how will it continue to be measured in order to achieve its success?

This framework also ensures that each level of the tri-level reform has a key part to play in securing the success of the policy. However, some may be concerned that this framework could be construed as inflexible for schools and, as a result, could limit the individual freedom of schools to operate as they think appropriate within the community. It is essential that we avoid too much of a top-down approach and also avoid any additional workload that this framework could bring to headteachers across schools in Wales, whose position is sandwiched in the middle of this tri-level process. I am sure that the Minister would agree that headteachers need to be freed up from administrative work to manage their schools effectively, and this framework must therefore ensure that it does not add to the increasing burdens that teachers face today. In the circumstances, could the Minister expand on what specific training and support there is for headteachers in taking forward this framework and collaboration on a local and national level,

**Paul Davies:** Yn gyntaf, diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad ynglŷn â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Yr wyf yn croesawu rhai o'i bwyntiau, ac yn enwedig ei ymrwymiad i gadw pethau'n syml. Deallaf mai'r fframwaith yw polisi allweddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer diwygio addysg, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno â'r egwyddor sylfaenol, sef, sicrhau gwell canlyniadau dysgu i'n plant. Ac ystyried bod y fframwaith hwn yn rhan bwysig o sbarduno gwell canlyniadau i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc, sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu monitro llwyddiant y fframwaith hwn i sicrhau ein bod yn gweld y canlyniadau'n gwella o ddifrif?

Elfen ganolog o'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion yw'r syniad o ddiwygio ar dair lefel. Mae hynny'n dibynnu ar gydweithredu effeithiol rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion. Ac ystyried bod cydweithredu'n hollbwysig er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant y fframwaith, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud sut mae effeithiolrwydd y cydweithredu hwn wedi cael ei fesur hyd yn hyn, a sut y bydd yn parhau i gael ei fesur er mwyn sicrhau ei lwyddiant?

Mae'r fframwaith hwn hefyd yn sicrhau bod gan bob lefel o'r diwygio tair lefel ran allweddol i'w chwarae wrth sicrhau llwyddiant y polisi. Serch hynny, efallai fod rhai'n poeni y gallai'r fframwaith hwn fod yn fframwaith anhyblyg i ysgolion ac y gallai, yn sgil hynny, gyfyngu ar ryddid ysgolion unigol i weithredu fel sy'n briodol yn eu tyb hwy yn eu cymuned. Mae'n hanfodol inni osgoi gormod o ddylanwad oddi fry a'n bod hefyd yn osgoi unrhyw faich gwaith ychwanegol y gallai'r fframwaith hwn ei roi ar ysgwyddau penaethiaid ysgolion yng Nghymru, a hwythau wedi'u gwasgu yng nghanol brechdan y broses dair lefel hon. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen rhyddhau penaethiaid rhag gorfod gwneud gwaith gweinyddol er mwyn iddynt reoli eu hysgolion yn effeithiol, ac felly, rhaid i'r fframwaith hwn sicrhau nad yw'n ychwanegu at y beichiau cynyddol a wynebir gan athrawon heddiw. O dan yr amgylchiadau, a allai'r Gweinidog ymhelaethu ynglŷn â pha hyfforddiant a

and how will the Welsh Assembly Government ensure that headteachers are not over-burdened?

We all want to see a Wales that has a modern, twenty-first century education system, where schools are given the right flexibility and are able to manage their own affairs. I appreciate that a balance needs to be struck between flexibility and the need to collaborate, and I am sure that we would all agree that education in Wales needs to be run and delivered by educational professionals who understand the needs of our children and young people.

Further to the recent review into the cost of administering education in Wales, will the Minister detail how the framework has been assessed in light of this review, and what outcomes were deduced from it? I note that the pilot phase of the school effectiveness framework has cost around £9.5 million. Given the circumstances, can the Minister detail specifically how this money has been spent and how this has been reviewed, bearing in mind the recent spending review carried out by his department? Consultations with various kinds of educational organisations are essential in implementing any framework. As such, will the Minister outline the discussions that he has had with teaching unions and other educational professionals in the last few months on this?

The school effectiveness framework must also work to meet the needs of schools that are located in isolated communities and those that teach through the medium of Welsh. One of the core themes of the framework is to provide a further vehicle for ensuring that both of our national languages are properly reflected by all of those involved in the schools system. We are all committed to seeing the bar raised in Wales, and we must ensure that that includes all schools throughout the country. Given that, perhaps the Minister would be kind enough to expand on what consultations the Welsh Assembly Government has had with rural schools and

chymorth penodol sydd ar gael i benaethiaid er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r fframwaith hwn a chydweithredu ar lefel leol a chenedlaethol a sut y gwnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau nad oes gormod o faich ar ysgwyddau penaeithiaid?

Yr ydym i gyd am weld Cymru a chanddi system addysg fodern; un sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, a threfniadau digon hyblyg i ysgolion reoli eu materion hwy eu hunain. Sylweddolaf fod angen cadw'r ddysgl yn wastad rhwng hyblygrwydd a'r angen i gydweithio, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod angen i addysg yng Nghymru gael ei rhedeg a'i darparu gan weithwyr addysg proffesiynol sy'n deall anghenion ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

Gan gyfeirio eto at yr adolygiad diweddar o gost gweinyddu addysg yng Nghymru, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud sut mae'r fframwaith wedi'i asesu yng ngoleuni'r adolygiad hwn, a pha ganlyniadau a gasglwyd ohono? Sylwaf fod cyfnod peilot y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi costio oddeutu £9.5 miliwn. Ac ystyried yr amgylchiadau, a all y Gweinidog ddweud yn benodol sut mae'r arian hwn wedi'i wario a sut mae hyn wedi'i adolygu, a chofio'r adolygiad diweddar o wariant a gynhaliwyd gan ei adran? Mae'n hanfodol ymgynghori â gwahanol fathau o sefydliadau addysgol wrth roi unrhyw fframwaith ar waith. Felly, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud pa drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael am hyn gydag undebau'r athrawon a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes addysg yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf?

Rhaid i'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion weithio hefyd i ddiwallu anghenion ysgolion mewn cymunedau pellennig a'r rheini sy'n dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Un o themâu craidd y fframwaith yw darparu ffordd arall o sicrhau bod ein dwy iaith genedlaethol yn cael eu hadlewyrchu'n iawn gan bawb sy'n ymwneud â system yr ysgolion. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymroddedig i weld codi'r bar yng Nghymru, a rhaid inni sicrhau bod hynny'n cynnwys pob ysgol drwy'r wlad. A chofio hynny, efallai y byddai'r Gweinidog gystal ag ymhelaethu ynglŷn ag unrhyw ymgynghori a fu rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac ysgolion gwledig

Welsh-medium schools throughout the pilot phase in order to take forward today's announcement and to ensure that these stakeholders' needs are also met.

As we discussed recently, school reorganisation has become a major concern for many parents in different parts of Wales. Given the Minister's statement on school reorganisation two weeks ago, could he tell us whether today's statement will have a bearing on school reorganisation throughout Wales in the future? I understand that the school effectiveness framework is designed to ensure that all of our schools become effective places of learning. However, a recognition of the needs of different schools in different areas must not only be addressed but met through this agenda.

Finally, I thank the Minister for his statement today. I hope that the announcement will ensure that our schools become effective places of learning and that this framework will improve the education of our children and our young people.

**Leighton Andrews:** I welcome the statements that have been made on behalf of the opposition. It remains my objective to try to keep things simple in the way that we deliver for children and young people throughout the education system. I think that that approach has been welcomed by unions, including the teaching unions, when I have had conversations with them. We have a system in place to monitor success, in the sense that Estyn's common inspection framework will be aligned with the SEF, and many discussions have gone on with Estyn and others about how that will work. Indeed, we discussed this at a meeting with Estyn this morning.

5.20 p.m.

It is important to say that the concept of professional learning communities is at the heart of this. It is a concept that has been widely welcomed by teachers and headteachers. It involves collaboration between families of schools that have access to the data. Families of schools with similar

ac ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg drwy gydol y cyfnod peilot er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â'r cyhoeddiad a gafwyd heddiw ac er mwyn sicrhau bod anghenion y rhanddeiliaid hyn yn cael eu diwallu hefyd.

Fel y trafodwyd gennym yn ddiweddar, mae ad-drefnu ysgolion wedi dod yn destun pryder mawr i lawer o rieni mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru. A chofio datganiad y Gweinidog am ad-drefnu ysgolion bythefnos yn ôl, a allai ddweud wrthym a gaiff y datganiad heddiw effaith ar ad-drefnu ysgolion ledled Cymru yn y dyfodol? Caf ar ddeall fod y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion wedi'i lunio i sicrhau bod pob un o'n hysgolion yn dod yn fannau dysgu effeithiol. Serch hynny, rhaid nid yn unig cydnabod anghenion gwahanol ysgolion mewn gwahanol ardaloedd, rhaid diwallu'r anghenion hynny hefyd drwy'r agenda hon.

I gloi, diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad heddiw. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y cyhoeddiad yn sicrhau bod ein hysgolion yn dod yn fannau dysgu effeithiol ac y bydd y fframwaith hwn yn gwella addysg ein plant a'n pobl ifanc.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r datganiadau a gafwyd ar ran yr wrthblaid. Fy amcan i o hyd yw ceisio cadw pethau'n syml yn y ffordd y byddwn yn cyflawni pethau ar ran plant a phobl ifanc drwy'r system addysg. Credaf fod yr undebau, gan gynnwys undebau'r athrawon, wedi croesawu'r ymagwedd honno wrth imi sgwrsio â hwy. Mae gennym system ar waith i fonitro llwyddiant, yn yr ystyr y bydd fframwaith arolygu cyffredin Estyn yn cael ei gysoni â'r Fframwaith Effeithiolrwydd Ysgolion ac mae llawer o drafodaethau wedi'u cynnal gydag Estyn a chydag eraill ynglŷn â sut y bydd hynny'n gweithio. Yn wir, trafodwyd hyn mewn cyfarfod ag Estyn y bore yma.

Mae'n bwysig dweud mai cysyniad cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol sydd wrth wraidd hyn. Mae'n gysyniad sydd wedi'i groesawu'n eang gan athrawon a phenaethiaid. Mae'n golygu cydweithio rhwng teuluoedd o ysgolion sy'n gallu cael gafael ar y data. Bydd teuluoedd o ysgolion a

characteristics and backgrounds can look at their performance and can spread good practice. The reality is that the good practice is out there. However, it needs to be generalised, and we will be able to do that through the professional learning communities.

Another aspect of measuring performance is the role of governors, which I will be looking at in the context of the LCO that was passed earlier this year, as we may need to make changes to the system of governance to support that. Local authorities will have an important role to play in challenging. They already have that role, and some are doing better at that than others. We need to see a greater emphasis on stronger school improvement services across Wales.

Paul used the phrase 'tri-level reform', and he is right that it is widely used. It happens to be a phrase that I do not like, and I try not to use it. I have said to some of the educationists who piloted it that one problem with it is that it sounds like a technocratic term. What we are trying to deliver through this work is different parts of the education system working together to deliver high-performing schools, and I prefer to talk about things in that way. We have had considerable input from very distinguished academics in the field, such as Professor Alma Harris from the Institute of Education and Professor Michael Fullan, from Ontario, who was here a month or so ago to give a seminar that involved a number of teachers and headteachers from across Wales.

People have had the opportunity to give their input into this, and the schools have been very receptive. Paul is right in saying that we do not want this to be inflexible, and we want communities of professionals to learn together. That has been the exciting feature of this. It has been particularly exciting to see the collaboration between pupils, because in some schools pupils have been part of the piloting of the framework. It has been interesting to see what they have learned, from one school to another. The learner's voice is another form of challenge that is

chanddynt nodweddion a chefnidir tebyg yn gallu edrych ar eu perfformiad a lledaenu arferion da. Y gwir yw bod yr arferion da ar waith eisoes. Serch hynny, mae angen eu rhoi ar waith ym mhobman, a byddwn yn gallu gwneud hynny drwy'r cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol.

Agwedd arall ar fesur perfformiad yw rôl llywodraethwyr, a byddaf yn edrych ar hynny yng nghyd-destun y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol a basiwyd yn gynharach eleni, oherwydd efallai y bydd angen inni newid y system llywodraethu i gefnogi hynny. Bydd gan awdurdodau lleol rôl bwysig o ran herio. Mae'r rôl honno ganddynt eisoes, ac mae rhai'n gwneud hynny'n well nag eraill. Mae angen inni weld rhagor o bwyslais ar wasanaethau gwella ysgolion cryfach ledled Cymru.

Defnyddiodd Paul yr ymadrodd 'diwygio tair lefel', ac mae'n iawn bod yr ymadrodd yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n gyffredin. Mae'n digwydd bod yn ymadrodd nad wyf yn hoff ohono, a byddaf yn gwneud fy ngorau i beidio â'i ddefnyddio. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth rai o'r addysgwyr sydd wedi ei gynnig mai un broblem sydd ynghlwm wrtho yw ei fod yn derm technocratig ei naws. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni drwy'r gwaith hwn yw bod gwahanol rannau'r system addysg yn cydweithio i sicrhau ysgolion sy'n gwneud yn dda, ac mae'n well gennyf fi ei ddisgrifio felly. Yr ydym wedi cael cyfraniad sylweddol gan academwyr o fri yn y maes megis yr Athro Alma Harris o'r Sefydliad Addysg a'r Athro Michael Fullan, o Ontario, a oedd yma fis neu ddau yn ôl i roi seminar a oedd yn cynnwys nifer o athrawon a phenaethiaid o bob cwr o Gymru.

Mae pobl wedi cael y cyfle i gyfrannu at hyn, ac mae'r ysgolion wedi bod yn agored iawn i hynny. Mae Paul yn llygad ei le'n dweud nad ydym am i hyn fod yn anhyblyg, ac yr ydym am i gymunedau o bobl broffesiynol ddysgu gyda'i gilydd. Dyna'r nodwedd sydd wedi bod yn gyffrous yn hyn oll. Mae wedi bod yn arbennig o gyffrous gweld y cydweithio rhwng disgyblion, oherwydd mewn ambell ysgol, mae'r disgyblion wedi bod yn rhan o dreialu'r fframwaith. Mae wedi bod yn ddiddorol gweld yr hyn y maent wedi'i ddysgu, y naill ysgol gan y llall. Ffurf arall ar

important within the system.

In developing the framework, inevitably there has been a cost; there have been costs associated with research, training, and rolling out the framework across Wales. However, we believe that the nature of the framework, given that it relies so very much on professionals taking the lead and sharing experience, is very cost-effective and very much in line with the principles of the review of the cost of administering education that I established. I have had a number of meetings with teaching unions and the unions that represent headteachers over the last six months. Where they have raised issues, we have tried to look at those. Paul is right in saying that there are specific issues in respect of isolated communities, but the concept of developing families of schools will mean that pupils can exchange information interactively. I think that that has been welcomed. We are very clear that the Welsh-medium education strategy has to be properly aligned with the school effectiveness framework and vice versa, and officials have been discussing that internally.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch yn fawr am y datganiad. Yr oedd llawer o wybodaeth bwysig ynddo. Bwriad datblygu'r polisi hwn yw gwella effeithlonrwydd ein hysgolion. Mae hynny'n amlwg, ac mae'n anodd gweld unrhyw un yn anghytuno â hynny. Cytunaf â Paul am yr angen i fod yn hyblyg wrth ddatblygu'r polisi gan fod gwahaniaethau sylfaenol yn ddaeryddol ac yn ieithyddol sy'n effeithio ar ein hysgolion ar draws Cymru.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn gwneud adolygiad ar hyn o bryd o'r rhesymau y tu ôl i'r ganran uchel o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Yr ydym wedi clywed dro ar ôl tro gan dystion mor bwysig yw ymwybyddiaeth gynnar o'r problemau. Felly, mae'n dda gweld bod y polisi hwn yn ceisio sicrhau lefelau uwch o lythrennedd a rhifedd, a bod cynllun gwaith o ran presenoldeb ac ymddygiad yn cael ei ddatblygu er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn gynharach. Byddai'n dda

yr her sy'n elfen bwysig o'r system yw llais y dysgwr.

Mae'n anochel bod cost ynghlwm wrth ddatblygu'r fframwaith; mae costau wedi bod ynghlwm wrth yr ymchwil, yr hyfforddi a lledaenu'r fframwaith ledled Cymru. Serch hynny, credwn fod natur y fframwaith, gan ei fod yn dibynnu gymaint ar arweiniad pobl broffesiynol a'u bod yn rhannu profiadau, yn gost-effethiol iawn ac yn cyd-fynd i raddau helaeth iawn ag egwyddorion yr adolygiad o gost gweinyddu addysg a sefydlwyd gennyf. Yr wyf wedi cael nifer o gyfarfodydd gydag undebau'r athrawon a'r undebau sy'n cynrychioli penaethiaid dros y chwe mis diwethaf. Yr ydym wedi ceisio rhoi sylw i'r materion a godwyd ganddynt. Mae Paul yn iawn yn dweud bod materion penodol i'w hystyried yng nghyswllt cymunedau pellennig, ond bydd datblygu teuluoedd o ysgolion yn golygu y gall disgyblion gyfnewid gwybodaeth yn rhyngweithiol. Credaf fod pobl wedi groesawu hynny. Yr ydym yn glir iawn ei bod yn rhaid cysoni'r strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn iawn â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion a chysoni'r fframwaith â'r strategaeth, ac mae swyddogion wedi bod yn trafod hynny'n fewnol.

**Nerys Evans:** Thank you for the statement. There was a lot of important information in it. The intention of developing this policy is to improve the efficiency of our schools. That is obvious, and it is difficult to see anyone disagreeing with that. I agree with Paul about the need to be flexible in developing the policy as fundamental geographical and linguistic differences affect our schools throughout Wales.

The Enterprise and Learning Committee is currently conducting a review of the reasons for the high percentage of young people not in education, employment or training. We have heard repeatedly from witnesses about the importance of early awareness of the problems. Therefore, it is good to see that this policy seeks to ensure higher levels of literacy and numeracy, and that an action plan on attendance and behaviour is being developed to address these issues earlier. It would be good to hear more details from the

clywed mwy o fanylion gan y Gweinidog am y cynllun peilot hwn.

Elfen ganolog i ddatblygiad y fframwaith yw'r cynllun datblygu sgiliau athrawon. Dywedasoeh yn eich datganiad fod hynny yn un o'ch chwe blaenoriaeth. Yr ydych yn sôn am gryfhau dysgu drwy ystod o gyfleon datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus. Beth yw eich cynlluniau ar gyfer cryfhau hyn? Yr wyf yn deall bod y Llywodraeth wedi bod yn edrych ar ddyfodol CPD yn ddiweddar, felly a oes mwy o fanylion gennych am eich cynlluniau? A ydych yn bwriadu newid y cyllid sydd ar gael ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus? A ydych yn bwriadu cryfhau'r hyfforddiant sydd ar gael drwy fwy o gyrsiau neu drwy ffocysu ar lai o gyrsiau i athrawon?

Un o'r chwe elfen arall yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt yw'r angen i ddefnyddio data'n fwy effeithlon er mwyn amlinellu lleoedd i ddatblygu a gwella. A allwch amlinellu beth yw'r rhwystrdigaethau ar hyn o bryd wrth ddefnyddio'r data sydd ar gael? Os oes problemau ar hyn o bryd, sut y gellid goresgyn y problemau hynny yn eich cynlluniau? Mae sicrhau data cywir, effeithiol ac amserol yn hanfodol i lwyddiant unrhyw bolisi, a byddai'n dda clywed gennych beth yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd.

Yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch o glywed yn eich datganiad fod angen i'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion ddeall gwahaniaethau ieithyddol Cymru a bod angen gwella cefnogaeth i athrawon sy'n dysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Soniasoch fod eich swyddogion yn gweithio ar gynlluniau i greu cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. A allwch ymhelaethu ar hynny? A oes amserlen wedi ei phennu ar gyfer y gwaith hwnnw?

Mae llawer o sylw wedi cael ei roi gan undebau'r athrawon ac yn y wasg i'r dyddiau hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon. Soniasoch y byddwch yn gwneud datganiad am y pwnc cyn hir. Mae anghenion hyfforddiant ein hathrawon yn ehangu, wrth gwrs, ac wrth i Lywodraeth Cymru ddisgwyl mwy oddi wrth ein hathrawon, credaf fod angen edrych eto ar yr amser a benodir ar gyfer hyfforddiant a datblygu proffesiynol.

Minister on this pilot scheme.

A central element to the development of the framework is the scheme to develop teachers' skills. You said in your statement that that is one of your six priorities. You talk about strengthening learning through a range of continuing professional development opportunities. What are your plans for strengthening this? I understand that the Government has been looking at the future of CPD recently; therefore, do you have any more details about your plans? Do you intend to change the funding available for continuing professional development? Do you intend to strengthen the training available by offering more courses or by focusing on fewer courses for teachers?

One of the other six elements that you have talked about is the need to use data more efficiently in order to outline areas for development and improvement. Can you outline the current barriers to using the available data? If there are problems at the moment, how can your plans overcome those problems? Ensuring accurate, effective and timely data is essential to the success of any policy, and it would be good for you to give details on the current situation.

I was also glad to hear in your statement that the school effectiveness framework needs to understand Wales's linguistic differences and that there is a need to improve support for teachers who teach through the medium of Welsh. You mentioned that your officials are working on plans to create professional learning communities through the medium of Welsh. Can you elaborate on that? Has a timetable been set for that work?

Much attention has been paid by the teaching unions and the press to teachers' in-service training days. You mentioned that you will soon be making a statement on the subject. The training needs of our teachers are growing, of course, and as the Welsh Government expects more from our teachers, I think that we need to look again at the time appointed for training and professional development. It would be good to hear your

Byddai'n dda clywed eich sylwadau ar hynny.

I gloi, ar ôl blynyddoedd o ddatblygu ysgolion sylfaen ac academiâu yn Lloegr o dan y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf, yr ydym yn awr yn gweld Llywodraeth Geidwadol a Rhyddfrydol yn mynd gam ymhellach, gan sefydlu ysgolion rhydd yn Lloegr, a byddwn yn gweld cwmnïau masnachol yn addysgu plant yn Lloegr. Yr ydym wedi gweld, o dan y cynllun academiâu ac ysgolion sylfaenol, fod amodau a thâl athrawon wedi gwaethygu, a bod diffygion yn codi yng nghynllun a strwythur hyfforddiant. Mae'r pethau hyn yn groes i bolisi Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr wyf yn croesawu'n fawr y datblygiadau i wella effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn credu'n gryf mai'r wladwriaeth, ac arian cyhoeddus, ddylai darparu addysg i'n plant a'n pobl ifanc, a'n bod am sicrhau gwerth am arian yn y maes hwn ac ymwrthod yn llwyr ag ymyrraeth y farchnad mewn ysgolion, fel sy'n digwydd yn Lloegr. Yr ydym ni, ym Mhlaid Cymru, yn falch iawn o hynny.

**Leighton Andrews:** Nerys has picked up on some important points, and I reiterate what I said in response to the Conservative spokesperson, which is that we retain flexibility. This is a scheme in which professional learning communities provide the opportunity for leadership and the sharing of information between professionals. That provides the guarantee of flexibility and sensitivity that is required. She will be aware that I attended the Enterprise and Learning Committee last week to discuss the issue of young people not in education, employment or training, and my officials have been working on an operational review of our policies regarding young people in those circumstances since March. We need a cross-departmental approach. We need to understand and ensure that our policies are recognising the challenges effectively early on. What we are doing in respect of literacy and numeracy is key to that, and is embedded within the framework. If we can get literacy right, in particular, and if we can do something to raise performance, particularly in respect of boys' attainment compared to that of girls, that will in itself improve attendance and behaviour, on top of the work

comments on that.

Finally, after years of developing foundation schools and academies in England under the last Government, we now see a Conservative and Liberal Government going one step further, by establishing free schools in England, and we will see commercial companies teaching children in England. With the academies and foundation schools, we have seen a worsening of teachers' pay and conditions, and that defects arise in the design and structure of training. These things are contrary to the policy of the Government of Wales. I very much welcome the developments to improve school effectiveness, and I am delighted that the Government of Wales strongly believes that the state and public funds should provide education for our children and young people, and that we want to ensure value for money in this area and totally reject any market interference in schools, as happens in England. We, in Plaid Cymru, are very proud of that.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae Nerys wedi codi sawl pwynt pwysig, a dywedaf eto yr hyn a ddywedais wrth ymateb i lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr, sef ein bod yn bwriadu cadw hyblygrwydd. Cynllun yw hwn lle bydd cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol yn rhoi cyfle i weithwyr proffesiynol gynnig arweiniad a rhannu gwybodaeth. Mae hynny'n gwarantu'r hyblygrwydd a'r sensitifrwydd y mae gofyn eu cael. Bydd yn gwybod imi fynd gerbron y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yr wythnos diwethaf i drafod mater pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant, ac mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio ar adolygiad gweithredol o'n polisiau sy'n ymwneud â phobl yn yr amgylchiadau hynny ers mis Mawrth. Mae angen inni fynd ati ar draws yr adrannau. Mae angen inni ddeall a sicrhau bod ein polisiau yn cydnabod yr heriau'n effeithiol yn fuan yn y broses. Mae'r hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud o ran llythrennedd a rhifedd yn allweddol i hynny, ac mae wedi bwrw gwreiddiau yn y fframwaith. Os gallwn sicrhau bod llythrennedd yn iawn, yn benodol, ac os gallwn wneud rhywbeth i wella perfformiad, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt cyrhaeddiad bechgyn o'i gymharu â

that is already going on in our specific pilot schemes.

I will be bringing forward further proposals on CPD in due course. Our CPD programme must be more focused and aligned with the priorities in our school effectiveness framework. We do not want to have a laissez-faire system of CPD. It has to make a contribution to the overall development of high-performing schools in Wales. Although she did not ask me about it, I will say that we are trying to consider at present what we should do in respect of the General Teaching Council for Wales; you will be aware of developments in England.

5.30 p.m.

The issue of data is important. We are trying to ensure that, within the families of schools and in the professional learning community, there is an opportunity to exchange data on performance so that people can learn from one another and can see what is working in one community as against another. That has been welcomed. The development of Welsh-medium professional learning communities is under way and I think that people are receptive to what we are doing.

On the INSET days question, there are currently five statutory INSET days and two further INSET days that are given by the Assembly Government. I am looking at that in the context of what happened this year in respect of bad weather closures. Some schools in Wales lost up to nine days of teaching time earlier this year. Nine days plus the seven INSET days makes 16 days, which are three working weeks when pupils were not being taught. We need to consider this and I will return with a further statement on it before the end of term.

Finally, you raised the question of teachers' pay and conditions. I had my first meeting yesterday with the Secretary of State for Education in London, Michael Gove, and one

chyrhaeddiad merched, bydd hynny ynddo'i hun yn gwella presenoldeb ac ymddygiad, ar ben y gwaith sydd eisoes ar y gweill yn ein cynlluniau peilot penodol.

Byddaf yn cyflwyno rhagor o gynigion ynglŷn â Datblygiad Proffesiynol Parhaus maes o law. Rhaid i'n rhaglen Datblygiad Proffesiynol Parhaus ganolbwyntio mwy ar y blaenoriaethau sydd yn ein fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion a rhaid ei chysoni â'r fframwaith hwnnw. Nid ydym am gael system lle bydd rhwydd hynt i bawb wneud fel y mynno. Rhaid iddi gyfrannu at ddatblygiad cyffredinol ysgolion sy'n gwneud yn dda yng Nghymru. Er nad ofynnodd imi amdano, hoffwn ddweud ein bod yn ceisio ystyried ar hyn o bryd beth y dylem ei wneud ynglŷn â Chyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru; gwyddoch am y datblygiadau yn Lloegr.

Mae data'n fater pwysig. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau, o fewn y teuluoedd o ysgolion, ac yn y gymuned dysgu proffesiynol, bod cyfle i gyfnewid data am berfformiad er mwyn i bobl ddysgu'r naill gan y llall a gweld beth sy'n gweithio mewn un gymuned o'i gymharu ag mewn cymuned arall. Mae hynny wedi'i groesawu. Mae datblygu cymunedau dysgu proffesiynol cyfrwng Cymraeg ar y gweill a chredaf fod pobl yn agored i dderbyn yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud.

O ran y cwestiwn ynglŷn â diwrnodau HMS, mae pum niwrnod HMS statudol ar hyn o bryd a dau ddiwrnod HMS arall a roddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn edrych ar hynny yng nghyd-destun yr hyn a ddigwyddodd eleni yng nghyswllt cau ysgolion oherwydd y tywydd. Collodd rhai ysgolion yng Nghymru hyd at naw diwrnod o amser addysgu'n gynharach eleni. Mae naw diwrnod a'r saith niwrnod HMS yn golygu 16 diwrnod, sef tair wythnos waith pan nad oedd disgyblion yn cael addysg. Mae angen inni ystyried hyn a dychwelaf i roi datganiad pellach yn ei gylch cyn diwedd y tymor.

Yn olaf, soniasoch am gyflogau ac amodau gwaith athrawon. Cefais fy nghyfarfod cyntaf ddoe gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg yn Llundain, Michael Gove, ac un



of his junior Ministers, Sarah Teather. It was a constructive and business-like meeting at which we went through a range of different issues. Again, that was conducted on a Government basis and I do not intend to go into the detail of that, but I can reassure you that I made it clear that I was not seeking devolution of teachers' pay and conditions.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for your statement, Minister. I welcome the issues that you outline here as being important for the development of our schools. I will ask two or three specific questions. Paul asked earlier about the monitoring of this. Could you say a little more about that? At the back of my mind is the issue that Estyn raised about the monitoring of RAISE funding, which was not good enough. That funding was allowed to go off-point, if you see what I mean—it was used with good intention, but it was not used in the way in which it was intended to be used. We need to avoid good intentions triumphing over strictly targeted action in this particular case.

I welcome your comments about the attendance and behaviour action plan. Nerys raised the Enterprise and Learning Committee's review of young people who are not in employment, education or training. Time and again, we have been told how important it is to intervene early and indeed we are being told that primary school is certainly not too soon and that often, primary schools can point to those children and young people who will find themselves in difficulty in later life. So, when you take the action that you suggest here on attendance and behaviour, could you tell me, with some details, whether you will be concentrating on as low an age group as the early years in primary school, or only on secondary schools?

I wish to make a point for you to note: you referred to English and Welsh-medium literacy, but the Enterprise and Learning Committee, in one of its inquiries, pointed to the problems associated with the teaching of Welsh as a second language. The Estyn

o'i is-Weinidogion, Sarah Teather. Yr oedd yn gyfarfod adeiladol a phwrpasol a thrafodwyd ystod o wahanol faterion. Unwaith eto, cynhaliwyd hynny ar sail Llywodraeth ac nid yw'n fwiad gennyf sôn am fanylion hynny, ond gallaf eich sicrhau imi ei gwneud yn glir nad oeddwn yn ceisio datganoli cyflogau ac amodau gwaith athrawon.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r materion yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt yma am eu bod yn bwysig er mwyn datblygu ein hysgolion. Gofynnaf ddau neu dri chwestiwn penodol. Gofynnodd Paul gynnu am fonitro hyn. A allech ddweud ychydig yn rhagor am hynny? Un peth sydd yng nghefn fy meddwl yw'r mater a godwyd gan Estyn ynglŷn â monitro arian Rhagori, ac nad oedd hynny'n ddigon da. Caniatawyd i'r arian hwnnw fynd ar gyfeiliorn, os deallwch yr hyn sydd gennyf mewn golwg—fe'i defnyddiwyd gyda phob bwriad da, ond ni chafodd ei ddefnyddio at y diben y bwriedid iddo gael ddefnyddio. Mae angen inni osgoi sefyllfa lle bydd bwriadau da yn drech na chamau sydd wedi'u targedu'n ofalus yn yr achos penodol hwn.

Yr wyf yn croesawu eich sylwadau am y cynllun gweithredu ar bresenoldeb ac ymddygiad. Cododd Nerys adolygiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu o bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant. Dro ar ôl tro, yr ydym wedi clywed pa mor bwysig yw ymyrryd yn gynnar ac yn wir, dywedir wrthym nad yw'r ysgol gynradd yn sicr yn rhy gynnar ac y gall ysgolion cynradd, yn aml, adnabod y plant a'r bobl ifanc hynny a fydd yn eu cael eu hunain yn wynebu anhawster yn ddiweddarach yn eu hoes. Felly, pan fyddwch yn cymryd y camau a awgrymwyd yma o ran presenoldeb ac ymddygiad, a allech roi rhywfaint o fanylion imi ynglŷn ag a fyddwch yn canolbwyntio ar grŵp oedran mor ifanc â'r blynyddoedd cynnar yn yr ysgol gynradd, ynteu ar ysgolion uwchradd yn unig?

Yr wyf am wneud pwynt ichi ei nodi: cyfeiriasoch at lythrennedd cyfrwng Cymraeg a Saesneg, ond, yn un o'i ymchwiliadau, cyfeiriodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu at y problemau sy'n gysylltiedig â dysgu'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith. Cyfeiriwyd at hynny

report also picked that up. Although, you might not see it strictly as literacy, I think that it needs to be addressed.

Finally, on INSET days, you will be aware that some of the teaching unions are concerned about the lack of continuing professional development and the impact on training and so on, and I will not repeat what previous Members have said on that. However, I understand why you are trying to mitigate the impact of the bad weather, which is an important issue. Perhaps you can tell us a bit more about whether you are planning to devise new guidelines for schools, for example, on how they respond to bad weather in future so that we do not see the same impact.

I recall that, years ago, in the event that they could not get to the school at which they were employed, teachers were obliged to report to the school nearest their home. Everybody could, of course, walk to a school near their home. In that way, schools tended to remain open more often than they do now. Minister, is a new approach needed to look at this issue, because last winter, children undoubtedly suffered as a result of the number of schools that closed for a significant length of time?

**Leighton Andrews:** Thank you, Jenny, for that response. First, on the monitoring point, the key thing is the alignment of Estyn's common inspection framework with the school effectiveness framework. We have discussed that in detail with Estyn. There have been a number of discussions around the country and workshops where this matter has been addressed. That will give us a good mechanism for monitoring the effectiveness of the school effectiveness framework, school by school. It is also important that the challenge role of local authorities is addressed in Estyn's own work and in the outcome agreements between local authorities and the Assembly Government.

I do not agree with you on Estyn's evaluation of RAISE. I certainly accept that it raised some questions, but overall, I think there were some positive points in the report that Estyn produced on the RAISE initiative.

hefyd yn adroddiad Estyn. Er na fyddech efallai'n ystyried hynny'n llythrennedd mewn gwirionedd, credaf fod angen rhoi sylw iddo.

Yn olaf, o ran diwrnodau HMS, gwyddoch fod rhai o undebau'r athrawon yn poeni am y diffyg datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus a'r effaith ar hyfforddiant ac ati, ac nid ailadroddaf yr hyn y mae Aelodau blaenorol wedi'i ddweud am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn deall pam yr ydych yn ceisio lliniaru effaith y tywydd gwael, sy'n fater pwysig. Efallai y gallwch ddweud ychydig yn rhagor wrthym ynglŷn ag a ydych yn bwriadu dyfeisio canllawiau newydd i ysgolion, canllawiau er enghraifft ynglŷn â sut mae ymateb i dywydd gwael yn y dyfodol fel na welwn yr un peth yn digwydd.

Flynyddoedd yn ôl, os nad oeddent yn gallu cyrraedd yr ysgol lle'r oeddent yn gyflogedig, mi gofiai fod gofyn i athrawon fynd i'r ysgol agosaf at eu cartref. Gallai pawb, wrth gwrs, gerdded i ysgol gerllaw eu cartref. Drwy wneud hynny, tueddai'r ysgolion i aros ar agor yn amlach nag y maent yn awr. Weinidog, a oes angen edrych o'r newydd ar hyn, oherwydd, gaeaf diwethaf, yn sicr dioddefodd plant yn sgil y nifer o ysgolion a fu ar gau am gyfnod sylweddol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch ichi, Jenny, am yr ymateb hwnnw. Yn gyntaf, o ran y monitro, y peth allweddol yw bod fframwaith arolygu cyffredin Estyn yn cael ei gysoni â'r fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion. Yr ydym wedi trafod hynny'n fanwl ag Estyn. Mae nifer o drafodaethau wedi bod o gwmpas y wlad a gweithdai lle y rhoddwyd sylw i hyn. Bydd hynny'n cynnig mecanwaith da inni fonitro effeithiolrwydd y fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, fesul ysgol. Mae'n bwysig hefyd bod Estyn yn rhoi sylw i rôl herio awdurdodau lleol yn ei waith ei hun ac yn y cytundebau canlyniadau rhwng awdurdodau lleol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Nid wyf yn cytuno â chi ynglŷn â gwerthusiad Estyn ar y rhaglen Rhagori. Yr wyf yn sicr yn derbyn iddo godi ambell gwestiwn, ond yn gyffredinol, credaf fod sawl pwynt cadarnhaol yn adroddiad Estyn am y rhaglen Rhagori.

I agree with you about early intervention. That is why I had announced earlier this year a national literacy plan that focuses on the seven to 11 age range, because if our expectation is that the foundation phase will boost confidence and self-esteem—and the feedback that we are getting from all over Wales, from teachers and headteachers, is that it is doing that—it is important that, in the second phase of primary, we do not lose ground on attainment and that key skills such as literacy are developed. We know that a lack of literary skills among a significant proportion of those entering secondary school leads to attendance and behavioural issues subsequently.

I dealt with the issue of Welsh as a second language during the statement on the Welsh-medium education strategy a couple of months ago. I do not intend to go into any more detail on that.

With regard to INSET days and bad weather closures of schools, I appreciate that the teaching unions have issues with the fact that I am looking at the additional two days for in-service training, but I have to say that parents are concerned about the amount of schooling that was lost earlier this year because of bad weather closures. I think that it is only right that I take some time to reflect on this issue at this stage. We are looking at a number of different measures, and I will be issuing a written statement on some of them before the end of term.

The situation that you outlined—it was raised at the time by a number of Assembly Members in January—in which, in the olden days, as it were, teachers used to go to the nearest school happened under a system that largely predated the local management of schools. It is a slightly more complicated system to arrange in the current context of school employment patterns. However, it is one of the things that we have been looking at to see whether we could take it further. Anyway, I intend to respond to the issues concerning INSET and the cold-weather closures of schools by the end of term.

Cytunaf â chi ynglŷn ag ymyrryd yn gynnar. Dyna pam yr oeddwn wedi cyhoeddi'n gynharach eleni gynllun llythrennedd cenedlaethol sy'n canolbwyntio ar yr ystod oedran rhwng saith ac 11, oherwydd os mai'r disgwyl yw y bydd y cyfnod sylfaen yn rhoi hwb i hyder a hunan-gred—a'r adborth yr ydym yn ei gael o bob cwr o Gymru, gan athrawon a phenaethiaid, yw ei fod yn gwneud hynny—mae'n bwysig nad ydym yn colli tir o ran cyrhaeddiad yn ystod ail gyfnod yr ysgol gynradd ac yn bwysig ein bod yn datblygu sgiliau allweddol megis llythrennedd. Gwyddom fod diffyg sgiliau llythrennedd ymhlith cyfran sylweddol o'r rheini sy'n dechrau yn yr ysgol uwchradd yn arwain at broblemau wedyn o ran presenoldeb ac ymddygiad.

Ymdriniais â'r Gymraeg fel ail iaith yn ystod y datganiad am y strategaeth addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Nid wyf yn bwriadu sôn yn fanylach am hynny.

O ran diwrnodau HMS a chau ysgolion oherwydd y tywydd, sylweddolaf fod undebau'r athrawon yn gwrthwynebu'r ffaith fy mod yn ystyried y ddau ddiwrnod ychwanegol hyfforddiant mewn swydd, ond rhaid imi ddweud bod rhieni'n poeni am faint o ysgol a gollwyd yn gynharach eleni oherwydd cau ysgolion yn sgil y tywydd. Credaf nad yw ond yn iawn imi dreulio ychydig o amser yn ystyried y mater hwn yn awr. Yr ydym yn ystyried nifer o wahanol fesurau, a byddaf yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ynghylch rhai ohonynt cyn diwedd y tymor.

Yr oedd y sefyllfa y soniasoch amdani—fe'i codwyd ar y pryd gan nifer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ym mis Ionawr—Ile byddai athrawon, yn yr hen ddyddiau, fel petai, yn mynd i'r ysgol agosaf, yn digwydd i raddau helaeth o dan system a oedd yn rhagflaenu dyddiau rheolaeth leol mewn ysgolion. Mae'n system fwy cymhleth i'w threfnu braidd yng nghyd-destun presennol patrymau cyflogaeth ysgolion. Serch hynny, mae'n un o'r pethau yr ydym wedi bod yn ei ystyried i weld a allem fwrw ymlaen ymhellach â hynny. Beth bynnag, bwriadaf ymateb i'r materion ynglŷn â HMS a chau ysgolion

mewn tywydd oer erbyn diwedd y tymor.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's business to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â busnes heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.39 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.39 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**

**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democrat Rhyddfrydol Annibynnol – Independent Liberal Democrat)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)