



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 24 Mawrth 2010
Wednesday, 24 March 2010**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro
Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer
- 3 Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad
Questions to the Assembly Commission
- 11 Dadl Cyfnod 1 ar Fesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau)
Stage 1 Debate on the Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration) Measure
- 35 Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Cytundeb ‘Cymru’n Un’
Welsh Conservatives Debate: The ‘One Wales’ Agreement
- 70 Dadl Fer a Ohiriwyd ers 24 Chwefror 2010: Cymru Wledig—yn Chwarae rhan mewn
Chwyldro Ynni Cymunedol?
Short Debate Postponed from 24 February 2010: Rural Wales—Playing a Part in a
Community Energy Revolution?

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn ogystal, cynhwysir cyfieithiad Saesneg o gyfraniadau yn y Gymraeg.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In addition, an English translation of Welsh speeches is included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Trefn yn y Cynulliad.

The Presiding Officer: Order in the Assembly.

Ethol Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro Election of Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer

Y Llywydd: Yn absenoldeb y Dirprwy Lywydd, gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad ethol Dirprwy Lywydd dros dro ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Felly, gwahoddaf enwebiadau.

The Presiding Officer: In the absence of the Deputy Presiding Officer, I ask the Assembly to elect a temporary Deputy Presiding Officer for today's Plenary meeting. Therefore, I invite nominations.

Peter Black: I nominate William Graham.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn enwebu William Graham.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Peter Black. There being no other nominations, I therefore declare that William Graham is elected as temporary Deputy Presiding Officer in relation to today's Plenary.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Peter Black. Gan nad oes enwebiadau eraill, yr wyf yn datgan, felly, bod William Graham wedi'i ethol yn Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro ar gyfer y Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw.

Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad Questions to the Assembly Commission

Access to Members' Offices

Q1 Nick Ramsay: Will the Commissioner make a statement on the protocol governing the Commission's access to Assembly Members' offices? OAQ(3)0041(AC)

The Commissioner for the Assembly and the Citizen (Peter Black): Members' rooms are not normally entered by Assembly staff or contractors unless they have specific permission from the Member or their support staff. Exceptions to this include, for example, cleaning staff, who enter offices every day to carry out their duties and security staff carrying out checks where offices are not locked. If there is a planned programme of maintenance, equipment replacement or significant works that affect many Members, the party groups are contacted and agreement sought. In emergencies, where life or property is at risk for example, Assembly staff or contractors would enter Members' rooms, but reasonable attempts would be made to get agreement or to inform the Member first.

Mynediad i Swyddfeydd Aelodau

C1 Nick Ramsay: A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am y protocol sy'n llywodraethu mynediad y Comisiwn i swyddfeydd Aelodau'r Cynulliad? OAQ(3)0041(AC)

Comisiynydd y Cynulliad a'r Dinesydd (Peter Black): Fel rheol, ni fydd staff y Cynulliad na chontractwyr yn cael mynediad i ystafelloedd yr Aelodau heb ganiatâd penodol gan yr Aelod neu staff cymorth yr Aelod. Mae eithriadau i'r rheol hon yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, staff glanhau, sy'n cael mynediad i'r swyddfeydd bob dydd er mwyn gwneud eu gwaith a staff diogelwch sy'n archwilio swyddfeydd nad ydynt wedi cael eu cloi. Os oes cynllun cynnal a chadw wedi ei drefnu, neu fwriad i adnewyddu offer neu waith sylweddol a fydd yn effeithio ar lawer o Aelodau, cysylltir â grŵp y blaid honno i gael caniatâd mynediad. Mewn achosion brys, pe byddai bywyd neu eiddo mewn perygl, er enghraifft, byddai staff y Cynulliad neu gontractwyr yn mynd i mewn i ystafelloedd Aelodau, ond gwneir pob ymdrech resymol i gael caniatâd yr Aelod

neu i roi gwybod iddo cyn hynny.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro (William Graham) i'r Gadair am 1.32 p.m.
The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer (William Graham) took the Chair at 1.32 p.m.*

Nick Ramsay: I tabled this question in the wake of the recent roll-out of new television equipment to Assembly Members' offices a few weeks ago. It struck me at that time that some Assembly Members had not requested the equipment, and yet it had appeared in some offices. I certainly have one in my office, which I did not request, and which appeared there overnight, a bit like a mushroom popping up in the night. Will you give us an assurance that when new equipment is proposed by the Commission for our offices, the Commission will do what is required to seek the permission of Members to enter our offices to take that action?

Peter Black: I can give you that assurance and I can inform you that that is what happened this time. Permission was sought by Assembly staff. Two e-mails were sent to Assembly Members and their support staff providing details of the replacement programme. The first asked individuals to opt out if they did not want a replacement; the second informed individuals that access would be made to all offices. A message was also placed on the Members' intranet, and the information provided clearly stated that every television would need to be retuned and that that could only be done by accessing the room. Members were advised that if a television, following investigation, appeared to be incompatible or could not be adapted, then it would be replaced, and notice was given to Members of that action.

Alun Cairns: An opt-out system is not an efficient system. That depends on staff being available, and, in some circumstances, staff may well be unavailable for legitimate and good reasons. Can we not have a system whereby expressed consent needs to be given before Assembly staff enter offices to change a piece of equipment, to ensure that that fits in with the priorities and agenda of an

Nick Ramsay: Cyflwynais y cwestiwn hwn yn sgil gosod offer teledu newydd yn ddiweddar yn swyddfeydd Aelodau Cynulliad rai wythnosau'n ôl. Fe'm tarodd bryd hynny nad oedd rhai Aelodau Cynulliad wedi gofyn am yr offer, ac eto yr oeddent wedi ymddangos mewn rhai swyddfeydd. Yn sicr, mae gennyf deledu newydd yn fy swyddfa i nad oeddwn wedi gofyn amdano, ac a ymddangosodd dros nos fel madarchen yn codi'i phen yn ystod y nos. A rowch chi sicrwydd inni y bydd y Comisiwn yn gwneud yr hyn sy'n ofynnol i geisio caniatâd Aelodau i fynd i'n swyddfeydd i gymryd y camau hynny, pan fydd y Comisiwn yn cynnig darparu offer newydd ar gyfer ein swyddfeydd?

Peter Black: Gallaf roi'r sicrwydd hwnnwn ichi, a gallaf ddweud wrthyhch mai dyna a ddigwyddodd y tro hwn. Gofynnodd staff y Cynulliad am ganiatâd. Anfonwyd dwy neges e-bost at Aelodau Cynulliad a'u staff cymorth, yn rhoi manylion y rhaglen i osod offer newydd. Yr oedd y neges gyntaf yn gofyn i unigolion eu heithrio eu hunain os nad oeddent am gael offer newydd; yr oedd yr ail neges yn dweud wrth unigolion y byddid yn mynd i mewn i bob swyddfa. Rhoddwyd neges ar fewnwyd Aelodau hefyd, ac yr oedd y wybodaeth a roddwyd yn dweud yn glir y byddai angen dychwelyd pob teledu, ac mai'r unig ffordd y gellid gwneud hynny fyddai trwy fynd i'r ystafell. Dywedwyd wrth Aelodau y byddai set deledu newydd yn cael ei darparu pe bai'n ymddangos, yn dilyn archwiliad, fod yr un bresennol yn anghydnaws neu na ellid ei addasu, a dywedwyd wrth Aelodau am hynny.

Alun Cairns: Nid yw system lle'r ydych yn eich eithrio'ch hun yn system effeithlon. Mae hynny'n dibynnu ar fod y staff ar gael, ac mewn rhai amgylchiadau mae'n bosibl na fydd staff ar gael am resymau dilys a da. Oni allwn gael system lle mae angen rhoi caniatâd penodol cyn i staff y Cynulliad fynd i mewn i swyddfeydd i newid darn o offer, er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n cyd-fynd â

Assembly Member, as well as the priorities and agenda of the Commission?

Peter Black: We will do all that we possibly can to seek Members' permission, but in this particular instance we had contacted Members with regard to the roll-out. We had a contract that had to be completed within a limited period, and we assumed, given the responses that we had received from your leader's office, for example, that it was understood by your group that if you did not want a television you would let us know. We did our best to contact all staff, and we will continue to do that.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: I call Mohammad Asghar. The electronic system is working. If you would like to make a request to speak, please make it in the usual way in future, Mohammad Asghar.

Mohammad Asghar: I also raise my concerns about this. I was not even offered a television for my office. There was no television in my room, and I had to bring my own television from my office in Newport to my office here in Cardiff bay. Therefore, please ask your officials why I was not even consulted about that.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: I do not think that that is a relevant question.

Peter Black: I would just like to say that consultation did take place. If you are not happy with the outcome then we would be happy to talk to Members individually to try to resolve any issues arising from this.

The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): This is not a reflection on you as Commissioner, Peter, but would it not be better to move to a system whereby it is ensured that Assembly Members are comfortable with expensive equipment being provided to them at a cost to the public purse, particularly in the current climate, rather than having this opt-out system? It would be simple to get Members' consent by signature or by getting staff to sign on their behalf. I certainly did not indicate that my staff were

blaenoriaethau ac agenda'r Aelod Cynulliad dan sylw, yn ogystal â blaenoriaethau ac agenda'r Comisiwn?

Peter Black: Fe wnawn bopeth yn ein gallu i geisio cael caniatâd Aelodau, ond yn yr achos penodol hwn yr oeddem wedi cysylltu ag Aelodau ynghylch gosod yr offer newydd. Yr oedd gennym gontract yr oedd yn rhaid ei gwblhau cyn pen cyfnod cyfyngedig, ac yr oeddem yn cymryd, o ystyried yr ymatebion a gawsom o swyddfa eich arweinydd chi, er enghraifft, fod eich grŵp yn deall bod angen ichi roi gwybod inni os nad oeddech am gael set deledu. Gwnaethom ein gorau i gysylltu â phob aelod o'r staff, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Galwaf ar Mohammad Asghar. Mae'r system electronig yn gweithio. Os hoffech wneud cais i siarad, a wnewch chi hynny yn y modd arferol yn y dyfodol, Mohammad Asghar?

Mohammad Asghar: Yr wyf fi hefyd am fynegi fy mhryderon am hyn. Ni chefais hyd yn oed gynnig set deledu ar gyfer fy swyddfa i. Nid oedd teledu yn fy swyddfa, a bu'n rhaid imi ddod â'm set deledu fy hun o'm swyddfa yng Nghasnewydd i'm swyddfa yma ym mae Caerdydd. Felly, a wnewch chi ofyn i'ch swyddogion pam nad ymgynghorwyd â mi hyd yn oed ynghylch hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Ni chredaf fod hwnnw'n gwestiwn perthnasol.

Peter Black: Hoffwn ddweud ein bod wedi ymgynghori. Os nad ydych yn hapus â'r canlyniad, yna byddem yn ddigon bodlon siarad ag Aelodau'n unigol i geisio datrys unrhyw broblemau sy'n codi yn sgil hyn.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Nid yw hwn yn feirniadaeth arnoch chi fel Comisiynydd, Peter, ond oni fyddai'n well symud i system lle'r ydym yn sicrhau bod Aelodau Cynulliad yn gyfforddus bod offer drud yn cael eu darparu iddynt allan o'r pwrs cyhoeddus, yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni, yn hytrach na chael y system hon lle mae pobl yn eu heithrio eu hunain? Digon syml fyddai cael caniatâd Aelodau trwy gael eu llofnod neu drwy gael staff i lofnodi ar eu rhan. Yn sicr, nid oeddwn wedi dweud bod fy

willing to have items placed in the office without their consent. That is not the case. We need to move to a system whereby Members agree to the provision of expensive equipment and agree to access into their offices. There are two separate issues here, in a sense, but both are serious. Members need to give express consent, rather than there being an opt-out system. I urge you and the entire Commission to look at that point.

Peter Black: We will do all that we can to accommodate Members' wishes, but the Commission had a limited period in which to carry out this roll-out. We contacted all Members twice. I accept that you did not say what you said that I implied that you said, Nick, but your response, as I understand it, was that you did not want a new television and that no group AM should have a new television if the existing ones could be adapted. Perhaps we misunderstood, but we took that to mean that any televisions that could not be adapted could be replaced. Clearly, if we misunderstood, we apologise, but we are trying to roll this out as best we can, within the contractual and expenditure limitations that have been placed upon us as a Commission.

Assembly Affairs

Q2 Alun Cairns: Will the Commissioner make a statement on the role of the Assembly Commission in the day-to-day running of Assembly affairs? OAQ(3)0039(AC)

Peter Black: The Assembly Commission delegates the day-to-day running of Assembly services to the Chief Executive and Clerk of the Assembly. There are some exceptions to this, and some areas where consultation with the Commission is required. Members often ask questions or raise issues about day-to-day matters with Commissioners, and we take those up on their behalf. There is regular communication with Members about the running of services, including briefings about Commission meetings, chief executive's monthly updates, news page items, consultation and direct e-

staff yn barod i gael eitemau wedi'u gosod yn y swyddfa heb eu caniatâd. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Mae angen inni symud i system lle mae Aelodau'n cytuno i gael offer drud, ac yn cytuno i roi mynediad i'w swyddfeydd. Mewn ffordd, mae yma ddau fater gwahanol, ond mae'r ddau'n faterion difrifol. Mae angen i Aelodau roi caniatâd pendant, yn hytrach na defnyddio system lle maent yn eu heithrio eu hunain. Yr wyf yn eich annog chi a'r Comisiwn cyfan i ystyried y mater hwn.

Peter Black: Fe wnawn ni bopeth yn ein gallu i fodloni dymuniadau Aelodau, ond ychydig amser a oedd gan y Comisiwn i osod y offer hyn. Yr oeddem wedi cysylltu â phob Aelod ddwywaith. Derbynïaf nad oeddech wedi dweud yr hyn yr awgrymwyd ichi ei ddweud, Nick, ond eich ymateb, fel y deallaf, oedd nad oeddech am gael set deledu newydd, ac na ddylai'r un grŵp o Aelodau Cynulliad gael set deledu newydd os oedd modd addasu'r hen rai. Hwyrach inni gamddeall, ond yr oeddem wedi cymryd bod hynny'n golygu y gellid rhoi set deledu newydd yn lle unrhyw set na ellid ei haddasu. Yn amlwg, os oeddem wedi camddeall, yr ydym yn ymddiheuro, ond yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud y gwaith hwn cystal ag y gallwn, o fewn y cyfyngiadau contractol a'r cyfyngiadau gwariant sydd wedi'u gosod arnom fel Comisiwn.

Materion y Cynulliad

C2 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am swyddogaeth Comisiwn y Cynulliad yng nghyswllt cynnal materion y Cynulliad o ddydd i ddydd? OAQ(3)0039(AC)

Peter Black: Mae Comisiwn y Cynulliad yn dirprwyo'r cyfrifoldebau o redeg gwasanaethau'r Cynulliad o ddydd i ddydd i'r Prif Weithredwr a Chlerc y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai eithriadau i hyn, a rhai meysydd y mae'n rhaid ymgynghori â'r Comisiwn yn eu cylch. Bydd Aelodau'n aml yn gofyn cwestiynau neu'n codi pryderon am faterion o ddydd i ddydd gyda'r Comisiynwyr, a byddwn yn delio â hwy ar eu rhan. Byddwn yn cyfathrebu'n rheolaidd ag Aelodau ynghylch rhedeg gwasanaethau, gan gynnwys sesiynau briffio am gyfarfodydd y Comisiwn, diweddariadau misol y prif

mails to Members and their staff.

weithredwr, eitemau ar gyfer y dudalen newyddion, ymgynghori ac e-byst uniongyrchol i Aelodau a'u staff.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Commissioner for his response. My supplementary question is on IT services. Despite the best efforts of Commission staff and the contractors, I believe that the central system that is provided is too inflexible to meet the needs of Members. More importantly—particularly in the current financial climate—it is far more expensive than allowing individual Assembly Members to provide IT equipment that can be easily purchased on the high street. For example, a computer purchased through the Assembly Commission will cost well in excess of £1,000. A better computer purchased from a high street shop will cost about £400. That is not an effective use of resources. I appreciate that the answer will be that there are support services provided within that cost. However, those support services are not always needed by individual Assembly Members. Do you not think that it would be right to have a flexible approach, so that Assembly Members can source what would be cheaper, more efficient and, often, better levels of service rather than having a central fixed contract that keeps us in a straitjacket?

Peter Black: I agree that we should have a more flexible approach and that is one reason why the Assembly Commission has implemented the UNO project, which is looking at how we can, effectively, set up our own system, separate from the existing Merlin contract. You will understand that we are currently part of a bigger Government contract, which ties our hands as regards the flexibility that we are able to apply to the systems that we use. The project, which has been given the go-ahead by the Commission, will, hopefully, change that and I am optimistic that, by the end of this calendar year, we will be able to offer Members a great deal more flexibility in the services that we provide.

Expenditure

Q3 Nick Bourne: Will the Commissioner make a statement on the estimated total expenditure for the Assembly Commission

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Comisiynydd am ei ymateb. Mae fy nghwestiwn atodol yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau TG. Er i staff y Comisiwn a'r contractwyr wneud eu gorau glas, credaf fod y system ganolog a ddarperir yn rhy anhyblyg i ddiwallu anghenion Aelodau. Yn bwysicach fyth—yn enwedig yn yr hinsawdd ariannol sydd ohoni—mae'n llawer mwy costus na gadael i Aelodau Cynulliad unigol ddarparu offer TG y gellir eu prynu'n ddigon hawdd ar y stryd fawr. Er enghraifft, bydd cyfrifiadur a brynir trwy Gomisiwn y Cynulliad yn costio ymhell dros £1,000. Bydd cyfrifiadur gwell a brynir o siop ar y stryd fawr yn costio oddeutu £400. Nid yw hynny'n ffordd effeithiol i ddefnyddio adnoddau. Sylweddolaf mai'r ateb fydd i wasanaethau cymorth gael eu darparu fel rhan o'r gost honno. Fodd bynnag, nid oes angen y gwasanaethau cymorth hynny bob amser ar Aelodau Cynulliad unigol. Oni chredwch y byddai'n iawn cael dull hyblyg, fel y gall Aelodau Cynulliad gael gwasanaeth a fyddai'n rhatach, yn fwy effeithlon ac yn well, yn aml, yn hytrach na chael contract canolog penodedig sy'n ein caethiwo?

Peter Black: Cytunaf y dylem gael dull mwy hyblyg, a dyna un rheswm pam mae Comisiwn y Cynulliad wedi rhoi prosiect UNO ar waith, sy'n edrych ar y modd y gallwn sefydlu ein system ein hunain, i bob pwrpas, ar wahân i gontract presennol Merlin. Byddwch yn deall ein bod ar hyn o bryd yn rhan o gontract mwy gyda'r Llywodraeth, sy'n cyfyngu ar ein hyblygrwydd wrth ddefnyddio'r systemau sydd gennym. Bydd y prosiect, sydd wedi cael sêl bendith gan y Comisiwn, yn newid hynny, gobeithio, ac yr wyf yn ffyddiog y byddwn yn gallu cynnig llawer mwy o hyblygrwydd i Aelodau o ran y gwasanaethau a ddarparwn erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn galendr hon.

Gwariant

C3 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am yr amcangyfrif o gyfanswm gwariant Comisiwn y Cynulliad am y

for this financial year? OAQ(3)0040(AC)

flwyddyn ariannol hon? OAQ(3)0040(AC)

1.40 p.m.

Peter Black: The 2009-10 Commission budget is £49.701 million. The Assembly Commission's latest forecast expenditure for this year is £48.807 million, or 98.2 per cent of the budget. This year-end position is an estimated position dependent on several variable factors, which include accounting adjustments, the value of claims submitted for Members' expenses and other variable areas of expenditure, and any slippage on major contracts.

Nick Bourne: I appreciate that response. Congratulations on coming in within budget. In light of the previous question from Alun Cairns, I wish to probe a little further on computer expenditure, which has, I think, been a matter of concern across the Assembly. We appreciate the need to update and improve our systems, but can you give us some indication of the likely additional costs, if there are any, of providing the sort of system that you referred to, because, in the current climate, that would be a matter of concern?

Peter Black: I cannot give you the exact figures at this stage, because we are subject to contractual negotiations, but we are entering into a contract with Siemens to set up our own separate system. The rationale behind that is that, in the long term, it will save us money. At some stage in the next few years, there will be negotiations between the Welsh Assembly Government and Siemens, and it will either renew the IT contract or put it out for tender again. As we form only a small part of that contract, we estimate that that would be very expensive for us. An equipment refresh is due, as a matter of course, which will also cost us a substantial amount of money. The Assembly Commission's judgment is that if we were to go ahead and do all that work at once and set up a separate server, we would be in a much better position in the contract negotiations and would save money overall. That is the rationale behind the changes that we are introducing. We are working closely with Siemens to try to ensure that the costs of carrying out the work are kept as small as

Peter Black: Mae gan y Comisiwn gyllideb o £49.701 miliwn ar gyfer 2009-10. Yr amcangyfrif diweddaraf o gyfanswm gwariant y Comisiwn am y flwyddyn hon yw £48.807 miliwn, neu 98.2 y cant o'r gyllideb. Mae'r amcangyfrif diwedd blwyddyn hwn yn amodol ar lawer ffactor newidiol, gan gynnwys addasiadau cyfrifyddu, gwerth hawliadau Aelodau am dreuliau ac eitemau eraill o wariant newidiol, ac unrhyw lithriant mewn contractau mawr.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi'r ymateb hwnnw. Llongyfarchiadau ichi ar gadw o fewn y gyllideb. O gofio'r cwestiwn blaenorol a ofynnwyd gan Alun Cairns, hoffwn eich holi ychydig yn fanylach am wariant ar gyfrifiaduron, sydd wedi bod yn peri pryder ar draws y Cynulliad yn fy marn i. Sylweddolwn fod angen diweddarau ein systemau a'u gwella, ond a allwch roi rhyw syniad inni o'r costau ychwanegol tebygol, os oes rhai, o ddarparu'r math o system y cyfeirich ati, oherwydd yn yr hinsawdd sydd ohoni, byddai hynny'n destun pryder?

Peter Black: Ni allaf roi'r union ffigurau ichi ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd yr ydym wrthi'n trafod contractau, ond yr ydym yn llunio contract gyda Siemens i sefydlu ein system ein hunain ar wahân. Y rhesymeg y tu ôl i hynny yw y bydd yn arbed arian inni yn y pen draw. Rywbryd yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf, bydd trafodaethau'n cael eu cynnal rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Siemens, a fydd yn arwain naill ai at adnewyddu'r contract TG, neu ei roi allan i dendr unwaith eto. Gan mai rhan fach yn unig o'r contract hwnnw ydym ni, amcangyfrifwn y byddai hynny'n costio'n ddud iawn inni. Mae'n bryd adnewyddu offer yn awr, fel mater o drefn, a fydd hefyd yn costio'n ddud. Barn Comisiwn y Cynulliad yw pe baem yn gwneud yr holl waith hwnnw ar unwaith, ac yn gosod gweinydd ar wahân, byddem mewn sefyllfa lawer gwell wrth drafod contractau, a byddem yn arbed arian at ei gilydd. Dyna'r rhesymeg y tu ôl i'r newidiadau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda Siemens i geisio sicrhau cadw costau

possible, although there is an issue about the cost exceeding the initial estimates.

The Annual Budget

Q4 Darren Millar: Will the Commissioner make a statement on the Assembly Commission's annual budget? OAQ(3)0042(AC)

Peter Black: The Commission's annual budget is approved by the Assembly in accordance with Standing Orders. The 2009-10 budget of £47.751 million was approved in Plenary on 22 October 2008. An additional £1.95 million was approved through the supplementary budget approved on 8 December 2009. That brought the 2009-10 budget to a total of £49.701 million.

Darren Millar: Thank you very much for that answer, Commissioner. You know that public finances are under increasing pressure at the moment and I am sure that you will agree that the Assembly Commission's budget should come under just as much scrutiny as any other budget funded by taxpayers' money. I was concerned to learn recently of the cost of the promotional materials for the reopened Pierhead building. A pack such as the one I have here, which includes beer mats and lapel badges, all with a shelf-life of one day, was sent out to Assembly Members. The beer mats cost around £2,000 and the lapel badges £350. The total cost of the promotional materials was in excess of £12,000. Many people will think that that is unnecessary and lavish spending at a time when people are tightening their belts. We also know that there has been a rebranding exercise by the Commission in relation to stationery and items such as business cards for Assembly Members, all of which, in my opinion and that of Members on this side of the Chamber, has been a totally unnecessary expenditure. Can you describe how decisions to spend these amounts of money are made and can you reassure Assembly Members that no decisions to authorise such expenditure will be made in the future without full consultation with all Assembly Members?

Peter Black: Thank you for that question,

gwneud y gwaith mor isel ag sy'n bosibl, er bod yna broblem o ran a fydd y gost yn fwy na'r amcangyfrifon gwreiddiol.

Y Gyllideb Flynyddol

C4 Darren Millar: A wnaiff y Comisiynydd ddatganiad am gyllideb flynyddol Comisiwn y Cynulliad? OAQ(3)0042(AC)

Peter Black: Caiff cyllideb flynyddol y Comisiwn ei chymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad yn unol â Rheolau Sefydlog. Cymeradwywyd cyllideb 2009-10, sef £47.751 miliwn, yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 22 Hydref 2008. Cymeradwywyd £1.95 miliwn ychwanegol drwy'r gyllideb atodol a gymeradwywyd ar 8 Rhagfyr 2009. Felly, cyfanswm cyllideb y Comisiwn am 2009-10 oedd £49.701 miliwn.

Darren Millar: Diolch yn fawr ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Gomisiynydd. Gwyddoch fod pwysau cynyddol ar gyllid cyhoeddus ar hyn o bryd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch y dylid craffu ar gyllideb Comisiwn y Cynulliad fel ar unrhyw gyllideb a ariennir gan arian trethdalwyr. Yr oeddwn yn pryderu o glywed yn ddiweddar am gost y deunyddiau hyrwyddo ar gyfer adeilad y Pierhead sydd wedi ailagor. Anfonwyd pecyn tebyg i'r un sydd gennyf yma at Aelodau Cynulliad. Mae'n cynnwys matiau cwrw a bathodynau llabed, a oedd yn berthnasol i un diwrnod yn unig. Costiodd y matiau cwrw oddeutu £2,000, a chostiodd y bathodynau llabed £350. Yr oedd cyfanswm cost y deunyddiau hyrwyddo dros £12,000. Bydd llawer o bobl yn meddwl bod hynny'n enghraifft o wario diangen a gwastraffus, ar adeg pan fo pobl yn byw ar lai. Gwyddom hefyd fod y Comisiwn wedi cynnal ymarfer i ailfrandio'i ddeunydd swyddfa ac eitemau megis cardiau busnes i Aelodau Cynulliad, ac mae'r cyfan, yn fy marn i ac ym marn Aelodau ar yr ochr hon o'r Siambr, wedi bod yn enghraifft o wariant hollol ddiangen. A allwch ddisgrifio sut y caiff penderfyniadau i wario'r symiau hyn eu gwneud, ac a allwch roi sicrwydd i Aelodau Cynulliad na fydd dim penderfyniadau'n cael eu gwneud i awdurdodi gwariant o'r fath yn y dyfodol heb ymgynghori'n llawn â phob Aelod Cynulliad?

Peter Black: Diolch ichi am y cwestiwn

Darren. The Assembly Commission takes seriously its public duty to protect its budget and understands fully that if we spend in excess that will take money away from other public services. That is one reason why, when we put the latest budget in front of you, we tried to keep the increase to the bare minimum. I cannot remember the exact percentage, but we came in with a very small increase because we were conscious of that responsibility. The Assembly Commission also has other responsibilities, though, and among them is the duty to market not just the Assembly, but the fledgling Welsh democracy that we are part of, promoting that to the outside world and encouraging people to participate in what we do, to respond to the debates and to the way that we are attempting to pass laws on their behalf in Wales. There is a need, as part of that promotion work, to get our branding and marketing right so that people feel that a coherent package is being presented to them.

Equally, we have a responsibility as landlords to manage this estate properly. The Pierhead is a grade 1 listed building, and we have a responsibility to look after it and to make good use of it. The recent refurbishment of that building is absolutely exceptional. We have created a visitor attraction in the bay that a lot of people will use and which will, in future, be a major asset both to the Assembly and to Cardiff bay. The promotional material that you refer to was part of the launch package for that building, and the brand associated with it, to encourage its greater use within the bay. In both the instances that you referred to, the money—and I have to say, the rebranding exercise was contained within existing budgets—was well spent in promoting and advancing the Assembly, and managing the estate that we are responsible for.

hwnnw, Darren. Mae Comisiwn y Cynulliad yn cymryd ei ddyletswydd gyhoeddus i warchod ei gyllideb o ddifrif, ac mae'n deall yn iawn, os byddwn yn gwario mwy na'r gyllideb, y bydd hynny'n tynnu arian oddi ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill. Dyna un rheswm pam yr oeddem wedi ceisio cael y codiad lleiaf posibl wrth roi'r gyllideb ddiweddaraf ger eich bron. Ni allaf gofio'r union ganran, ond yr oedd yn gynnydd bach iawn, am ein bod yn ymwybodol o'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Er hynny, mae gan Gomisiwn y Cynulliad gyfrifoldebau eraill hefyd, ac ymysg y rheini mae'r ddyletswydd i farchnata nid yn unig y Cynulliad, ond yr egin ddemocratiaeth yr ydym yn rhan ohoni yng Nghymru, hyrwyddo'r ddemocratiaeth honno i weddill y byd, ac annog pobl i gymryd rhan yn yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud, ac ymateb i'r dadleuon a'r modd yr ydym yn ceisio pasio deddfau ar eu rhan yng Nghymru. Fel rhan o'r gwaith hyrwyddo hwnnw, mae angen inni gael ein gwaith brandio a marchnata'n iawn er mwyn i bobl deimlo bod pecyn cydlynol yn cael ei gyflwyno iddynt.

Yn yr un modd, mae gennym gyfrifoldeb fel landlordiaid i reoli'r ystad hon yn iawn. Mae adeilad Pierhead yn adeilad rhestredig gradd 1, ac mae'n gyfrifoldeb arnom i ofalu amdano a'i ddefnyddio'n dda. Mae'r gwaith adnewyddu a wnaed ar yr adeilad hwnnw'n ddiweddar yn gwbl eithriadol. Yr ydym wedi creu atyniad i ymwelwyr yn y bae y bydd llawer o bobl yn ei ddefnyddio, ac a fydd yn gaffaeliad mawr i'r Cynulliad ac i fae Caerdydd yn y dyfodol. Yr oedd y deunydd hyrwyddo y soniech amdano'n rhan o'r pecyn lansio ar gyfer yr adeilad hwnnw, a'r brand sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef, i annog pobl i ddefnyddio'r adeilad yn fwy helaeth yn y bae. Yn y ddwy enghraifft y soniech amdanynt, cafodd yr arian—a rhaid imi ddweud bod yr ymarfer ailfrandio wedi'i wneud o fewn y cyllidebau presennol—ei wario'n dda ar hyrwyddo'r Cynulliad a'i hybu, a rheoli'r ystad yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdani.

Dadl Cyfnod 1 ar Fesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau)
Stage 1 Debate on the Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration)
Measure

Y Llywydd: Cynigiau fod

The Presiding Officer: I move that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 23.24:

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 23.24:

yn cytuno ar egwyddorion cyffredinol Mesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau). (NDM4451)

agrees to the general principles of the Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration) Measure. (NDM4451)

Mae'n dda iawn gennyf gael cyflawni fy nyletswydd i agor y drafodaeth y prynhawn yma ar y cynnig i gymeradwyo egwyddorion cyffredinol Mesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau).

I am pleased to perform my duty in opening the debate this afternoon on a motion to approve the general principles of the proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration Measure).

Dyma'r Mesur Cynulliad cyntaf sydd wedi cael ei gynnig gan y Comisiwn i gael ei drafod yma yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Fel yr Aelod sy'n gyfrifol, yn ôl y Rheolau Sefydlog, yr wyf yn ystyried hyn yn fraint ac yn gyfrifoldeb. Hoffwn ddatgan hefyd fod Comisiwn y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig yn llwyr.

This is the first Assembly Measure proposed by the Commission to be discussed here at Plenary. As the Member in charge, according to our Standing Orders, I consider it an honour and a privilege. I wish to declare that the Measure has the full support of the Assembly Commission.

Gyda'r ddadl hon, down i ddiwedd cyfnod cyntaf y broses graffu. Yn ystod y broses hon, yr wyf fi a'm cynghorwyr wedi ymddangos ddwywaith gerbron Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1, a gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Yn ogystal, mae tystion eraill wedi rhoi eu barn ac mae gwranddo ar dystion eraill wastad yn ddiddorol. Felly, gwn o brofiad uniongyrchol sut y mae'r naill bwyllgor a'r llall wedi bwrw ati i graffu'n fanwl ar y Mesur pwysig hwn. Hoffwn ddweud heddiw, ar sail y profiad hwnnw, a'r profiad sydd gennyf mewn lleoedd eraill, yr wyf yn datgan yn gwbl hyderus bod y gweithdrefnau craffu deddfwriaethol yn y Cynulliad hwn, yr un mor drylwyr, os nad yn fwy trylwyr mewn rhai agweddau, na'r hyn a geir mewn seneddau eraill, yn cynnwys San Steffan. Hoffwn achub ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i aelodau'r ddau bwyllgor, ac i'w Cadeiryddion yn benodol—sef Rosemary Butler ac Angela Burns—am eu cwrteisi a'u dycnwch wrth eu gwaith.

This debate marks the end of the first stage of the scrutiny process. During this process, my advisers and I have appeared twice before Legislation Committee No. 1, and before the Finance Committee. In addition, other witnesses have given their views, and listening to other witnesses is always interesting. Therefore, I know from direct experience how both committees have undertaken detailed scrutiny of this important Measure. I wish to say today that, based on that experience as well as experience gained elsewhere, I confidently declare that the legislative scrutiny procedures in this Assembly are just as rigorous, and in some respects more rigorous, as those undertaken in other Parliaments, including the Palace of Westminster. I should like to take this opportunity to thank the members of both committees, and the Chairs in particular—Rosemary Butler and Angela Burns—for their courtesy and diligence.

Yr hyn sy'n bwysig at bwrpas y ddadl heddiw yw bod adroddiadau'r naill bwyllgor

What is important for the purpose of today's debate is that the reports of both committees

a'r llall i'r Cynulliad yn datgan eu bod yn cefnogi'r egwyddor sylfaenol sy'n sail i'r Mesur arfaethedig, sef cam pwysig ymlaen mewn democratiaeth seneddol yng Nghymru o sefydlu corff statudol annibynnol i oruchwylio'r holl agweddau ar y cymorth ariannol a roddir i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae achos hynod o gryf dros ddadlau y dylai'r penderfyniadau am y materion hyn gael eu gwneud y tu allan i'r byd gwleidyddol o ddydd i ddydd, a'u rhoi yn nwylo corff a gaiff ei weld yn un annibynnol a gwrthrychol a'i unig swydd yw gweithredu er budd y cyhoedd, er budd pobl Cymru. Tra bod y dull hwn yn cael ei ddilyn mewn mannau eraill, megis yn yr Alban, yng Ngogledd Iwerddon yn ddiweddar drwy ddeddfwriaeth, ac, o'r diwedd, mae symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw yn San Steffan, gallwn nodi ein balchder bod y Cynulliad hwn wedi bod ar y blaen yn y broses o ddiwygio'r ffordd o drin taliadau Aelodau.

1.50 p.m.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid a Phwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1 wedi cyfeirio at nifer o astudiaethau pwysig o ran craffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig yn fanwl. Mae'n iawn inni roi sylw i'r rheini wrth benderfynu sut i fwrw ymlaen â'r deddfwriaeth hon, a byddaf yn trafod rhai ohonynt yn gryno wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi dweud y bydd gan y bwrdd, oherwydd ei natur, y rhyddid i benderfynu sut y bydd yn gweithio, gan gynnwys penderfynu pa mor aml y bydd yn cyfarfod. Y mae'n dilyn o hynny bod risg y gallai'r gwir gostau fod yn uwch na'r rhai a geir yn yr amcangyfrifon gofalus yn y memorandwm esboniadol. Derbyniaf fod hyn yn wir, ond yr wyf hefyd o'r farn y bydd modd i gyllideb y Comisiwn ymdopi ag unrhyw gostau a ddaw yn sgil creu'r bwrdd a'i weithredoedd. Yr ydym wedi cael rhybudd cwbl amserol yn y cwestiynau yr ydym newydd wrando arnynt o'r pwysigrwydd o gynnal cyllideb y Comisiwn o fewn perthynas gytbwys gyda chyllideb bloc Cymru a'r gwariant ar wasanaethau uniongyrchol i bobl Cymru. Serch hynny, yr wyf wedi fy mherswadio, ar ôl ystyried yr adroddiadau, gan gynnwys sylwadau'r

to the Assembly state that they support the basic principle of the proposed Measure, which is an important step forward in parliamentary democracy in Wales in establishing an independent body to supervise all of the financial support given to Assembly Members. There is an overwhelming case for taking decisions about these matters out of politics and entrusting them instead to a body which is seen to be independent and objective, acting solely in the public interest and in the interest of the people of Wales. While this approach is now being adopted elsewhere, such as in Scotland, in Northern Ireland recently through legislation, and while at last there is movement in that direction in Westminster, we can take pride in the fact that this Assembly has been in the forefront of reforming Members' remuneration.

The Finance Committee and Legislation Committee No. 1 have identified important studies in relation to detailed scrutiny of the proposed Measure. It is right that we take those into account when deciding how to proceed with this legislation, and I shall discuss some of them briefly when I introduce the proposal.

The Finance Committee has stated that, by its very nature, the board will have freedom to determine its own way of working, including frequency of meetings. It follows that there is a risk that the actual costs could exceed the careful cost estimates in the explanatory memorandum. While I accept that this must be the case, I also believe that whatever costs are associated with the creation and operation of the Board can be accommodated within the Commission's budget. We have received a timely warning from the questions we have just heard of the importance of maintaining a balance between the Commission's budget and the block budget, and the expenditure on direct services for the people of Wales. Nevertheless, I have been persuaded, having considered the reports, including the comments by the Finance Committee and a recommendation by Legislation Committee

Pwyllgor Cyllid ynghyd ag argymhelliad Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1, y gellid cymryd camau ymarferol i leihau'r risg y bydd y costau hyn yn uwch na'r hyn sy'n rhesymol. Bwriadaf gyfeirio at hynny mewn ychydig funudau.

Yn ei adroddiad, mae Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1 yn gwneud nifer o argymhellion adeiladol ynghylch sut y gellid cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig. Mae'n dda gennyf ddweud fy mod yn derbyn yr argymhellion hynny, bron ym mhob achos, oherwydd eu bod yn argymhellion sy'n cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig. Hoffwn ddweud wrth basio ein bod wedi gwrandao'n rhy hir ar Weinidogion sy'n tueddu i wrthod unrhyw argymhellion neu welliannau dim ond oherwydd nad hwy na'u cynghorwyr a feddyliodd amdanynt, neu bod rhyw fath o agwedd meddwl sy'n dweud nad yw'n briodol derbyn gwelliannau neu argymhellion. Hoffwn, felly, ddechrau arfer da drwy ddweud ei bod yn beth gweddus i'r Aelod sy'n trin Mesur gymryd sylw manwl o'r argymhellion a gynigir, ac, os yn bosibl, ymateb iddynt yn adeiladol.

Yr wyf am ymateb yn glir i'r argymhellion canlynol. Y cyntaf yw cynnwys datganiad clir sy'n dweud bod y bwrdd yn annibynnol ar y Cynulliad a'r Comisiwn. Yr ail yw cael trefniadau cryfach o ran cyflwyno adroddiadau a chraffu, fel bod y bwrdd yn atebol i'r Cynulliad, a thrwy hynny i'r cyhoedd, am ei ddefnydd o adnoddau cyhoeddus wrth wneud ei waith. Drwy wneud hyn, byddai'n bosibl rheoli materion, fel pa mor aml y bydd y pwyllgor yn cyfarfod, heb danseilio annibyniaeth y bwrdd. Y trydydd yw bod rheidrwydd ar y bwrdd i weithredu'n agored ac yn dryloyw, ac i gydymffurfio â darpariaethau Deddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000. Agwedd arall yr wyf yn ei chrosawu yw'r pedwerydd argymhelliad ynglŷn ag ehangu'r categorïau o bobl sydd wedi'u hanghymhwyso rhag bod yn aelodau o'r bwrdd er mwyn cynnwys aelodau deddfwrfeydd eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn y rhestr honno. Y pumed argymhelliad yw cynnwys dull o newid y categorïau o bobl sydd wedi'u hanghymhwyso heb fod angen cyflwyno Mesur arall, a'r olaf yw cyhoeddi'r weithdrefn ar gyfer penodi aelodau'r bwrdd.

No. 1, that practical steps can be taken to reduce the risk that these costs will exceed what is reasonable. I intend to refer to that in a few moments.

In its report, Legislation Committee No. 1 makes a number of constructive recommendations as to how the provisions of the proposed Measure can be strengthened. I am pleased to say that I accept those recommendations, in almost every case, because they are recommendations that strengthen the proposed Measure. I should like to say, in passing, that we have listened too long to Ministers who tend to reject any recommendations or amendments just because they were not thought of by them or their advisors, or because of a mindset that says that it is not appropriate to accept amendments or recommendations. Therefore, I wish to initiate good practice by saying that it is appropriate for the Member in charge of a Measure to pay detailed attention to the recommendations put forward, and if possible to respond constructively to them.

I shall respond clearly to the following recommendations. The first is to include a clear statement of the board's independence from the Assembly and the Commission. The second is to strengthen reporting and scrutiny arrangements so that the board is accountable to the Assembly, and through the Assembly to the public, for its use of public resources in undertaking its work. This would make it possible to control matters, such as the frequency of meetings, without undermining the independence of the board. The third is to place an obligation on the board to act in an open and transparent way and to comply with the provisions of the Freedom of Information Act 2000. Another aspect which I welcome is the fourth recommendation on extending the categories of persons disqualified from membership of the board, to include members of other legislatures in other parts of the United Kingdom. The fifth recommendation is to include a way of amending the categories of disqualified persons without the need for a further Measure, and the final recommendation is the publication of the procedure for the appointment of board members. In all these

Ym mhob achos, byddaf yn cyflwyno gwelliannau yng Nghyfnod 2 y Mesur arfaethedig er mwyn rhoi'r argymhellion hyn ar waith, a dyna pam yr wyf yn eu rhestru'n glir y prynhawn yma.

Yn ogystal, lle bydd cysylltiad rhwng gwaith y bwrdd a gwaith y comisiynydd safonau, sydd, ar hyn o bryd, yn y broses o gael ei recriwtio, cytunaf y bydd angen perthynas o gydweithrediad clir rhyngddynt, a pherthynas waith a fydd hefyd yn cynnwys swyddog cyfrifyddu'r Comisiwn.

Mae hon yn berthynas bwysig o ran sicrhau bod y drindod hon yn cyd-drafod ar faterion sy'n peri pryder cyffredinol, a hynny'n gyflym ac yn effeithiol. Nid wyf o'r farn—a chredaf fod hyn yn adlewyrchu'r drafodaeth a gawsom yn y pwyllgorau—bod angen rhoi hynny ar ddu a gwyn yn y deddfwriaeth. Felly, ni allaf dderbyn yn llawn rai o'r argymhellion. Mater o berthynas gref rhwng unigolion proffesiynol yw hynny, o bosibl drwy gyfrwng protocol. Fodd bynnag, credaf y dylai hynny aros hyd nes y bydd y trefniadau ynglŷn â'r bwrdd ac ynglŷn â'r comisiynydd safonau statudol wedi cael amser i setlo.

Trof yn awr at fater diddorol yn ymwneud â'r iaith Saesneg. Yr wyf wedi pendroni tipyn ynglŷn â hyn. Mae gan y Pwyllgor amheuan am y gair 'remuneration' yn y fersiwn Saesneg o enw'r Bwrdd—cawsom drafodaeth am hyn yn y pwyllgor. Nid oedd unrhyw broblemau gyda'r gair 'taliadau' yn y fersiwn Cymraeg. Os cofiwch, gan ein bod yn trin y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg yn gyfartal, nid oes un term sy'n fwy cywir na gwreiddiol na'r llall. Felly, ni sydd i benderfynu wrth ddeddfu beth yw'r cyfystyron priodol, a cheisio diffinio, yn ein dadleuon yn y Cynulliad ac mewn lleoedd eraill, beth yw ystyr y geiriau. Yr wyf wedi astudio sawl geiriadur o Rydychen, ac wedi meddwl llawer ynghylch cyfystyron negyddol y gair 'remuneration'. Mae gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad hawl i gael eu talu neu eu had-dalu am y gwaith a wnânt, cyn belled â bod y tâl hwnnw'n deg. Ni welaf pam y dylem fod yn amddiffynnol o'r ffaith ein bod yn cael ein talu am yr hyn a wnawn, cyhyd â'n bod yn rhoi gwerth am arian. Yn sicr, yr ydym i gyd sydd yma heddiw yn rhoi gwerth

cases I shall be bringing forward amendments during Stage 2 of the proposed Measure in order to give effect to the recommendations in question, which is why I list them clearly this afternoon.

I also agree that, where there is a connection between the work of the board and that of the commissioner for standards, there needs to be a clear working relationship between them, and a working relationship which will also include the Commission's accounting officer.

This is an important relationship to ensure that this trinity discusses issues of common concern in a speedy and efficient manner. I am not of the view—and I believe this reflects the discussion we had in the committees—that that needs to be put in black and white in the legislation. Therefore, I cannot fully accept some of the recommendations. That is a matter of a strong relationship between professional individuals, possibly through protocol. However, I believe that can wait until the arrangements regarding the board and the statutory commissioner for standards have had time to settle down.

I now turn to an interesting issue with regard to the English language. I have been reflecting for some time on this. The committee has reservations about the word 'remuneration' in the English name of the board—we had a discussion on this in the committee. There was no problem with the word 'taliadau' in the Welsh version. You may remember, with regard to the way we operate by treating Welsh and English on the basis of equality, that there is no one term which is more accurate or original than any other. Therefore, when we legislate, it is up to us to decide on the appropriate connotations, and to try to define, through our debates in the Assembly and elsewhere, the meaning of the words. I have studied a number of Oxford dictionaries and have given much thought to the negative connotations of the word 'remuneration'. Assembly Members are entitled to be remunerated for the work that they do, provided that remuneration is fair. I do not see why we should be defensive about the

am arian.

Mae'r term 'remuneration' yn gyson ag iaith cyfansoddiad ysgrifenedig, sef Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, a chredaf mai dyna'r pwynt pwysig. Mae hefyd yn gyffredin mewn nifer o sefyllfaoedd eraill. Mae gan y rhan fwyaf o sefydliadau tebyg bellach yr hyn sy'n cael ei alw'n 'remuneration committee'. Nid yw'r Pwyllgor wedi awgrymu opsiwn arall, ac ni allaf innau feddwl am un ychwaith. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn barod i agor cystadleuaeth am awgrymiadau rhesymol. Mae croeso i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gyflwyno gwelliannau yng Nghyfnod 2 os credant fod ganddynt air Saesneg gwell na 'remuneration'. Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r argymhelliad y dylai'r Mesur ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Bwrdd ymgynghori ag amryw o bartïon penodol cyn gwneud penderfyniadau. Derbyniat ei bod yn arfer da i'r rheini sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau ymgynghori, a dylid annog hynny. Serch hynny, mae angen inni fod yn glir bod gwahaniaeth rhwng ymgynghori a thrafod telerau. Holl bwrpas sefydlu'r bwrdd yw dangos bod y penderfyniadau am daliadau Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cael eu gwneud yn annibynnol ar yr Aelodau. Er fy mod yn derbyn y gallai dyletswydd i ymgynghori fod yn briodol mewn nifer o amgylchiadau, ac er y byddaf yn cyflwyno gwelliant a fydd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Bwrdd ymgynghori pan fydd hynny'n briodol, gan fod hwn yn fwrdd annibynnol statudol, credaf ei bod yn bwysig gadael i'r Bwrdd benderfynu ar hyd a lled y gwaith ymgynghori hwnnw a sut y bydd yn bwrw ati, gan ddibynnu ar yr amgylchiadau dan sylw.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o bryderon y Pwyllgor ynghylch y ffaith y bydd modd i'r Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r Bwrdd gael eu hailbenodi, er mai dim ond unwaith y bydd hynny'n bosibl. Mewn rhai amgylchiadau, yr wyf yn derbyn y gellid tybio nad yw person yn gwbl annibynnol os yw'r person hwnnw'n awyddus i gael ei ailbenodi. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl cnoi cil ar hyn, nid chredaf ei fod yn risg gwirioneddol yn yr achos hwn. O ystyried natur y bwrdd, nid wyf yn credu y bydd y bobl a fydd yn gwasanaethu arno yn debygol

fact that we are paid for what we do, provided that we give value for money. All of us present here today give value for money.

The term 'remuneration' is consistent with the language of our written constitution, namely the Government of Wales Act 2006, and I think that that is the important point. It is also in common use in other situations. Most comparable organisations now have a remuneration committee. The committee has not suggested an alternative option, and I cannot think of one. However, I am willing to open a competition for reasonable suggestions. Assembly Members are welcome to put forward amendments at Stage 2 if they feel they have a better alternative to the word 'remuneration'. I am also aware of a recommendation that the proposed Measure should include a requirement that the board consult various specified parties before making decisions. I accept that consultation by decision-makers is good practice and should be encouraged. However, we need to be clear that there is a difference between consultation and negotiation. The whole purpose of establishing the board is to demonstrate that decisions about the remuneration of Assembly Members are being made independently of those Members. Although I accept that a duty to consult could be appropriate in many circumstances, and although I will be proposing an amendment requiring the board to consult where appropriate, I believe it is important, since it is an independent statutory board, that we allow the board to determine the extent of that consultation and how it is to be conducted in the light of particular circumstances.

I am aware of the committee's concerns about the fact that the chair and members of the board can be reappointed, although that will be possible only once. I accept that, in some circumstances, the fact that an officeholder may be seeking reappointment could be seen to undermine that person's independence. However, on reflection I do not believe this is a real risk in this case. Given the nature of the board, I do not believe the persons serving on the board are likely to be driven by such a degree of

o fod â chymaint o uchelgais nes gellir tybio bod hynny'n amharu ar eu gwrthrychedd. Yn groes i hynny, credaf mai'r peth pwysig yw meithrin a chynnal parhad mewn profiad a meddylfryd wrth i'r Bwrdd wneud ei waith.

ambition that their objectivity will be seen to be compromised. On the contrary, I believe the key issue is the need to build and preserve continuity of experience and culture in the operation of the board.

2.00 p.m.

Os bydd aelod o'r bwrdd yn ymddiswyddo cyn diwedd y tymor o bum mlynedd, dylid deall y bydd y tymor nesaf o bum mlynedd yn dechrau pan benodir y person newydd. Felly, dros amser, bydd aelodaeth dreigl yn datblygu yn naturiol. Gan hynny, nid wyf am gynnig, ar hyn o bryd, ein bod yn diwygio'r rhan yma o'r Mesur arfaethedig sy'n pennu hyd tymhorau aelodau'r bwrdd. Fel yr wyf yn pwysleisio, byddaf yn barod i ystyried unrhyw welliannau eraill a fydd yn ymddangos yng Nghyfnod 2.

It should also be understood that, if a member of the board resigns before the end of the five-year term, the next five-year term will begin when the replacement is appointed. Therefore, over time a rolling membership will develop naturally. Accordingly, I do not propose to amend this part of the proposed Measure, which fixes the terms of board members. As I have emphasised, I will be willing to consider any other amendments that appear at Stage 2.

Hoffwn gloi'r araith agoriadol hon drwy atgoffa Aelodau'r Cynulliad mai egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig sydd o dan sylw gennym heddiw yn y ddatl hon yng Nghyfnod 1. Wrth ymateb i sylwadau'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ac amryw o argymhellion y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth—bron y cyfan ohonynt—fy nod oedd dangos sut y gellir cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig ymhellach yn sgîl yr argymhellion hynny. Os caiff y Mesur arfaethedig ei gymeradwyo heddiw, fel yr wyf yn gobeithio, bydd digon o gyfle yn ein gweithdrefnau effeithiol o graffu yng Nghyfnodau 2 a 3 i gyflwyno rhagor o welliannau cyn i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn gael ei drafod yn ei gyfanrwydd yng Nghyfnodau 3 a 4.

I conclude my opening speech by reminding Assembly Members that it is the general principles of the proposed Measure that are under consideration in today's debate at Stage 1. In responding to the views of the Finance Committee and the various recommendations of the Legislation Committee—almost all of them—my aim has been to demonstrate how the proposed Measure can be strengthened even further in the light of those recommendations. If the proposed Measure is approved this afternoon, as I hope it will be, there will be ample opportunity in our effective scrutiny procedures at Stages 2 and 3 to table more amendments before the proposed Measure is considered in its entirety at Stages 3 and 4.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y gwaith hwn, yn Aelodau ac yn swyddogion. Nid wyf byth yn enwi swyddogion, ond hoffwn enwi un swyddog sydd ar fin ymddeol. Nid wyf wedi dweud wrtho, ond hoffwn ddiolch i Chris Reading yn bersonol am ei lafur diflino i'r Cynulliad hwn, i ddatblygiad y Cynulliad, fel swyddog pwyllgor arbennig, ac am ei lafur cyn hynny yn y Swyddfa Gymreig gynt ac i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymuno ag ef yn crwydro lefelau Gwent ac yn gwylio adar. Mae'n sicr gennyf y caf yr un math o gefnogaeth wrth adnabod yr holl adar ar lefelau Gwent ag yr ydym oll wedi'i chael fel Aelodau Cynulliad. Diolch yn fawr, Chris.

I wish to thank all those who have contributed to this work, both Members and officials. I never name officials, but I wish to name one official who is about to retire. I have not told him, but I wish to thank Chris Reading personally for his tireless work for this Assembly, in the Assembly's development, as an officer of a special committee, and for his work before that in the former Welsh Office and in local government in Wales. I look forward to joining him in roaming the Gwent levels and in bird watching. I am sure I will receive the same kind of support in identifying all the birds on the Gwent levels as we have all received from him as Assembly Members. Thank you

Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i bob Aelod a swyddog sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y broses graffu. Ymlaen â ni, felly, i ddeddfu drwy'r broses hon heddiw.

Nick Ramsay: I am grateful to be called to contribute to this debate on the Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration) Measure on behalf of Legislation Committee No. 1. In undertaking our work, the committee was very conscious that a decision had already been taken by the Assembly Commission to accept the recommendations of the independent review panel to break the link between Assembly Members' salaries and those of Members of Parliament in Westminster, and also to establish a statutory independent review body to make decisions on all aspects of financial support for Assembly Members. However, we agreed from the outset that this decision should not influence our work in any way, and we did not deviate from our standard approach to scrutiny.

I thank all members of the committee for their hard work in scrutinising the proposed Measure, and I also thank the Presiding Officer for the openness with which he responded to the committee when giving evidence. I also thank those who gave evidence to us, which helped to inform our report.

There was broad support in the evidence that we received for the establishment of an independent board, and there were no objections, in principle, to the proposed Measure. The evidence that we received suggests that it is no longer appropriate for elected politicians to be able to set their own levels of pay and other financial support. It was generally felt that the establishment of an independent system—in this case, the board—to determine Assembly Members' pay and other financial support would help in restoring public confidence in elected politicians generally, and would assist in overcoming the negative public perceptions that have come about as a result of recent events in Westminster in relation to the expenses claimed by Members of Parliament.

While we were mindful of these events and of the effect that they have had, we would

very much, Chris. I also thank every Member and official who has taken part in the scrutiny process. Onwards, therefore, to legislate through today's process.

Nick Ramsay: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gael fy ngalw i gyfrannu at y ddafl hon ar Fesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau) ar ran Pwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1. Wrth ymgymryd â'i waith, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn ymwybodol iawn bod Comisiwn y Cynulliad eisoes wedi penderfynu derbyn argymhellion y panel adolygu annibynnol i dorri'r cysylltiad rhwng cyflogau Aelodau Cynulliad a chyflogau Aelodau Seneddol San Steffan, ac i sefydlu corff adolygu annibynnol statudol hefyd i wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch pob agwedd ar gymorth ariannol i Aelodau Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, cytunasom o'r dechrau'n deg na ddylai'r penderfyniad hwnnw ddylanwadu o gwbl ar ein gwaith, ac ni fu gwyro oddi wrth ein dull safonol o graffu.

Diolchaf i bob aelod o'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled wrth graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig, a diolch hefyd i'r Llywydd am ymateb mor agored i'r pwyllgor wrth roi tystiolaeth. Diolchaf hefyd i'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth inni, a fu o gymorth i lywio'n hadroddiad.

Cafwyd cefnogaeth eang yn y dystiolaeth a gawsom o blaid sefydlu bwrdd annibynnol, ac ni chafwyd yr un gwrthwynebiad, i egwyddor y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae'r dystiolaeth a gawsom yn awgrymu nad yw bellach yn briodol i wleidyddion etholedig allu pennu lefel eu cyflog eu hunain a chymorth ariannol arall. Y farn gyffredinol oedd y byddai sefydlu system annibynnol—y bwrdd yn yr achos hwn—i bennu cyflog a chymorth ariannol arall ar gyfer Aelodau Cynulliad yn helpu adfer ffydd y cyhoedd mewn gwleidyddion etholedig yn gyffredinol, ac y byddai'n helpu goresgyn y canfyddiadau cyhoeddus negyddol sydd wedi dod yn amlwg yn sgil digwyddiadau'n ddiweddar yn San Steffan yng nghyswllt y treuliau a hawliwyd gan Aelodau Seneddol.

Er inni gadw'r digwyddiadau hyn a'r effaith a gawsant mewn cof, hoffem nodi'n glir nad

like to make clear that this was not our sole consideration when drawing our conclusions. We believe that significant progress has been made since the inception of the Assembly in gaining the trust of the public. It is important that the Assembly as an institution, and we as Assembly Members, continue to build on this trust. We feel that the proposed Measure and the establishment of an independent board provide an opportunity to do this.

It was clear from the Presiding Officer's evidence to us that he strongly believes that a statutory independent board is the most appropriate mechanism for making decisions on Assembly Members' remuneration. While the committee generally accepts that this is the case, some Members expressed concern that insufficient consideration had been given to the viability of the continued use of existing bodies such as the Review Body on Senior Salaries. However, in view of the evidence that we received, we do agree that there is a need for an independent board and we therefore support the general principles of the proposed Measure.

Notwithstanding this, our report does highlight a number of areas where we think improvements to the legislation can and should be made. The need for the board to operate independently and to be free from the influence of the Assembly and Assembly Members came through very strongly in all the evidence that we received. On that point, we believe that it is important to make clear from the outset that the Assembly Commission will have some involvement in the governance of the board insofar as it is required to formally appoint board members and to provide financial and administrative support to the board. Likewise, the Assembly itself, albeit to a lesser extent, will be involved in the board's governance by virtue of the process provided in the proposed Measure for the termination of membership of the board. We accept that this level of involvement is both reasonable and necessary, and we are content that it will not undermine the key principle that the board will operate independently in the exercise of its functions. However, we believe that there is merit in making explicit the board's independence for the purpose of providing absolute clarity and as a means of enhancing

hynny oedd ein hunig ystyriaeth wrth lunio'n casgliadau. Credwn fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi'i wneud o ran ennill ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd ers i'r Cynulliad gael ei sefydlu. Mae'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad fel sefydliad, a ninnau fel Aelodau Cynulliad, barhau i adeiladu ar yr ymddiriedaeth honno. Teimlwn fod y Mesur arfaethedig a gwaith sefydlu bwrdd annibynnol yn gyfle i wneud hynny.

Yr oedd yn glir yn nhystiolaeth y Llywydd inni ei fod yn credu'n gryf mai bwrdd annibynnol statudol yw'r system fwyaf priodol ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau am daliadau Aelodau Cynulliad. Er bod y pwyllgor yn derbyn yn gyffredinol fod hynny'n wir, yr oedd rhai Aelodau'n pryderu nad oedd dichonoldeb parhau i ddefnyddio cyrff cyfredol, megis y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-swyddogion, wedi'i ystyried yn ddigonol. Fodd bynnag, yng ngoleuni'r dystiolaeth a gawsom, yr ydym yn cytuno bod angen bwrdd annibynnol, ac felly yr ydym yn cefnogi egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig.

Er hynny, mae ein hadroddiad yn tynnu sylw at nifer o feysydd lle credwn y gellir ac y dyldid gwneud gwelliannau i'r ddeddfwriaeth. Yr oedd yr angen i'r bwrdd weithredu'n annibynnol a bod yn rhydd o ddylanwad y Cynulliad ac Aelodau Cynulliad yn amlwg iawn yn yr holl dystiolaeth a gawsom. Ar y pwynt hwnnw, credwn ei bod yn bwysig iawn egluro o'r dechrau'n deg y bydd gan Gomisiwn y Cynulliad ryw gysylltiad â gwaith llywodraethu'r bwrdd, i'r graddau y bydd yn ofynnol iddo benodi aelodau'r bwrdd yn ffurfiol a rhoi cymorth ariannol a gweinyddol i'r bwrdd. Yn yr un modd, bydd y Cynulliad ei hun, er i raddau llai, yn gysylltiedig â gwaith llywodraethu'r bwrdd, yn rhinwedd y broses a ddarperir yn y Mesur arfaethedig ar gyfer dod ag aelodaeth y bwrdd i ben. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod y lefel hon o gysylltiad yn rhesymol ac yn angenrheidiol, ac yr ydym yn fodlon na fydd yn tansilio'r egwyddor allweddol, sef y bydd y bwrdd yn gweithredu'n annibynnol wrth gyflawni ei swyddogaethau. Fodd bynnag, credwn ei bod yn werth nodi'n glir annibyniaeth y bwrdd, er mwyn sicrhau eglurder llwyr ac fel modd i gynyddu ymddiriedaeth y cyhoedd. Felly, yr ydym yn

public trust. So, we recommend that a statement be included in the proposed Measure to make clear that the board is independent of the Assembly in the exercise of its functions.

The committee heard strong evidence to suggest that it would be vital for robust accountability arrangements to be put in place in relation to the governance of the board. While it was apparent from the Presiding Officer's evidence that he envisages that accountability arrangements will be put in place, we remain concerned that insufficient consideration has been given to this issue and how these arrangements will work in practice. So, in the light of this, we recommend that this issue is addressed as a matter of priority. Linked to this and in order to further enhance transparency, we recommend that the proposed Measure places an annual reporting requirement on the board. It was clear from the evidence we received that the board should operate openly and that its work should be publicly accessible at all times. That will be crucial in helping to develop a wider understanding of, and ensuring public confidence in, the board's work. While it may be implicit in the proposed Measure that the board will operate in such a manner, we are not convinced that the legislation as drafted makes adequate provision for it. Indeed, we believe that the proposed Measure should make explicit the intention that the board will operate in an open and transparent manner, and we therefore recommend that a duty is placed on the board in this regard.

The evidence that we received suggested that the most important considerations for the board when making determinations would be the need to ensure levels of remuneration are such that they enable Assembly Members to carry out their roles effectively, central to which is the recruitment and retention of our staff; they do not deter potential candidates from standing for election; they are fair and provide value for money; and that they hold up to public scrutiny. With all of these in mind, we are content that the objectives provided for in the proposed Measure, which the board must seek to achieve when exercising its functions, are both appropriate and reasonable.

argymell y dylid cynnwys datganiad yn y Mesur arfaethedig i egluro bod y bwrdd yn annibynnol ar y Cynulliad wrth gyflawni ei swyddogaethau.

Clywodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth gref i awgrymu y byddai'n hanfodol rhoi trefniadau atebolrwydd cadarn ar waith yng nghyswllt llywodraethu'r bwrdd. Er ei bod yn amlwg o dystiolaeth y Llywydd ei fod yn rhagweld y bydd trefniadau atebolrwydd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith, yr ydym yn dal i bryderu na chafodd y mater hwn, a'r modd y bydd y trefniadau hyn yn gweithio'n ymarferol, eu hystyried yn ddigonol. Felly, yng ngoleuni hynny, yr ydym yn argymell y dylid mynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon fel mater o flaenoriaeth. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, ac er mwyn gwella tryloywder ymhellach, yr ydym yn argymell bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r bwrdd gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol. Yr oedd yn glir o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom y dylai'r bwrdd weithredu'n agored, ac y dylai ei waith fod ar gael i'r cyhoedd bob amser. Bydd hynny'n hollbwysig o ran helpu i ddatblygu dealltwriaeth ehangach o waith y bwrdd, a sicrhau ffydd y cyhoedd ynddo. Er ei bod efallai'n ddealliedig yn y Mesur arfaethedig y bydd y bwrdd yn gweithredu fel hynny, nid ydym wedi ein darbwylllo bod y ddeddfwriaeth fel y'i drafftwyd yn darparu'n ddigonol ar gyfer hynny. Yn wir, credwn y dylai'r Mesur arfaethedig nodi'n glir y bwriedir i'r bwrdd weithredu'n agored ac yn dryloyw, ac felly yr ydym yn argymell bod dyletswydd yn cael ei rhoi ar y bwrdd i'r perwyl hwnnw.

Yr oedd y dystiolaeth a gawsom yn awgrymu mai'r ystyriaethau pwysicaf i'r bwrdd wrth wneud penderfyniadau fyddai'r angen i sicrhau bod lefelau taliadau'n galluogi Aelodau Cynulliad i gyflawni eu rolau'n effeithiol, ac mae recriwtio a chadw ein staff yn ganolog i hynny; nad ydynt yn atal ymgeiswyr posibl rhag sefyll mewn etholiad; eu bod yn deg ac yn rhoi gwerth am yr arian; a'u bod yn dal dŵr yn ystod proses graffu gyhoeddus. Gan gadw'r rhain mewn cof, yr ydym yn fodlon fod yr amcanion y darperir ar eu cyfer yn y Mesur arfaethedig, ac y bydd yn rhaid i'r bwrdd geisio'u gwireddu wrth gyflawni ei swyddogaethau, yn briodol ac yn rhesymol.

We believe that effective consultation by the board will be key in ensuring that these objectives are met. We feel strongly that consultation by the board prior to making determinations is not only desirable, but essential. In view of that, we recommend that the proposed Measure includes a requirement on the board to consult all interested parties before making determinations. We feel that this consultation must extend beyond Assembly Members to include their support staff, relevant trade unions and other parties that are likely to be affected by the board's decisions.

Finally, to reaffirm the committee's position, we recommend that the Assembly agrees the general principles of the proposed Measure. If the proposed Measure should progress beyond today's Stage 1 debate, I hope that the Presiding Officer will accept the recommendations contained in our report and bring forward the necessary amendments at Stage 2.

Angela Burns: I am most grateful for the opportunity to speak in this debate, and the Finance Committee would like to thank the Presiding Officer, as chair of the Assembly Commission, and his officials, for giving evidence to the Finance Committee. I would like to remind Members once again that the Finance Committee does not take a view on the merits of a proposed Measure but we see our role primarily as one of examining the information presented in support of the proposed Measure and of commenting and advising on its financial aspects. Nevertheless, the Finance Committee recognises that the proposed Measure is of major importance to the National Assembly and is designed to ensure that the people of Wales can have confidence in its Members. Therefore, the Finance Committee was keen to ensure that the proposed Measure received the same fair scrutiny that we apply to all proposed Measures.

2.10 p.m.

Overall, the proposed Measure will not involve enormous sums of money. The cost

Credwn y bydd yn allweddol i'r bwrdd ymgynghori'n effeithiol wrth geisio sicrhau gwireddu'r amcanion hyn. Teimlwn yn gryf ei bod nid yn unig yn ddimunol ond hefyd yn hanfodol i'r bwrdd ymgynghori cyn gwneud penderfyniadau. Yng ngoleuni hynny, yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai'r Mesur arfaethedig gynnwys gofyniad i'r bwrdd ymgynghori â phawb sydd a wnelont â'r mater cyn gwneud penderfyniadau. Teimlwn ei bod yn rhaid i'r broses ymgynghori hon ymestyn y tu hwnt i Aelodau Cynulliad, ac y dylid cynnwys eu staff cymorth, undebau llafur perthnasol a phartïon eraill y mae penderfyniadau'r bwrdd yn debygol o effeithio arnynt.

I gloi, i ailgadarnhau safbwynt y pwyllgor, yr ydym yn argymhell y dylai'r Cynulliad gytuno ag egwyddorion cyffredinol y Mesur arfaethedig. Os bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn symud ymlaen y tu hwnt i'r ddadl Cyfnod 1 heddiw, gobeithio y bydd y Llywydd yn derbyn yr argymhellion yn ein hadroddiad ac yn cyflwyno'r gwelliannau angenrheidiol yng Nghyfnod 2.

Angela Burns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon, a hoffai'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ddiolch i'r Llywydd, fel cadeirydd Comisiwn y Cynulliad, a'i swyddogion am roi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid. Hoffwn atgoffa Aelodau unwaith eto nad yw'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ystyried rhinweddau Mesur arfaethedig. Yn hytrach, ystyriwn mai ein rôl yn bennaf yw archwilio'r wybodaeth a gyflwynir i gefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig, a rhoi sylwadau a chynghor ar ei agweddau ariannol. Er hynny, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn cydnabod bod y Mesur arfaethedig o bwys sylweddol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a'i fod wedi'i lunio i sicrhau y gall pobl Cymru fod yn ffyddiog yn ei Aelodau. Felly, yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn awyddus i sicrhau bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn mynd drwy'r un broses graffu deg â'r un a ddilynwn yng nghyswllt pob Mesur arfaethedig.

At ei gilydd, ni fydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn gofyn am symiau enfawr o arian. Taliadau a

of running the review board will be, primarily, the remuneration and associated costs of the chair and members. There would also be some administration costs to support them in their work, and costs associated with advertising for, and recruiting, board members.

The body's workload is likely to be cyclical and greatest every four years in the period before an Assembly election, when a full review of Members' remuneration and allowances will be required. The explanatory memorandum suggests that the board will perhaps need eight meetings prior to an election and perhaps two in intervening years, when the demands on it would be lower. The explanatory memorandum says that the chair would be remunerated at the rate of £237 per day, and the four other board members at a rate of £185 per day. Those were the same rates as were paid to members of the independent review panel, who recommended establishing the board, and they are lower than the rates paid to members of similar bodies in the United Kingdom. The Presiding Officer told the Finance Committee that they were

'the rates for the job in Wales'

and that there was no difficulty in recruiting for similar posts at these levels. The Finance Committee does not disagree with this approach.

The Presiding Officer told the Finance Committee that administrative support for the board would be provided by existing resources in the Assembly Commission. That would be achieved through flexible working, and would not involve any additional cost. The Finance Committee notes with interest that there are sufficient resources available in the staff of the Commission to support the board, but reiterated concerns expressed in our report on the Assembly Commission's draft budget for 2011, and in the previous year, that efficiency savings should not be achieved at the expense of staff workload and morale. We simply ask that that is borne in mind.

The Finance Committee's other main concern

chostau cysylltiedig y cadeirydd a'r aelodau fydd cost cynnal y bwrdd adolygu, yn bennaf. Byddai rhai costau gweinyddu hefyd er mwyn cynorthwyo'r bobl hynny yn eu gwaith, ynghyd â chostau sy'n gysylltiedig â hysbysebu am aelodau i'r bwrdd a'u recriwtio.

Mae'n debygol y bydd llwyth gwaith y corff yn gylchol, ac y bydd ar ei drymaf bob pedair blynedd yn ystod y cyfnod cyn etholiad yn y Cynulliad, pan fydd yn ofynnol cynnal adolygiad llawn o daliadau a lwfansau Aelodau. Mae'r memorandwm esboniadol yn awgrymu y gallai fod angen i'r bwrdd gynnal wyth cyfarfod cyn etholiad, a dau gyfarfod yn ystod y blynyddoedd rhwng etholiadau, pan fyddai'r galwadau arno'n llai. Dywed y memorandwm esboniadol y byddai'r cadeirydd yn cael ei dalu ar gyfradd o £237 y dydd, a phedwar aelod arall y bwrdd yn cael eu talu ar gyfradd o £185 y dydd. Dyna gyfraddau taliadau aelodau'r panel adolygu annibynnol, a argymhellodd sefydlu'r bwrdd, ac maent yn is na'r cyfraddau a delir i aelodau cyrff tebyg yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Dywedodd y Llywydd wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid mai'r rhain oedd

y cyfraddau ar gyfer y gwaith hwn yng Nghymru

ac nad oedd yn anodd o gwbl recriwtio ar gyfer swyddi tebyg ar y lefelau hyn. Nid yw'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn anghytuno â'r dull hwn.

Dywedodd y Llywydd wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid y byddai adnoddau presennol yng Nghomisiwn y Cynulliad yn darparu cymorth gweinyddol i'r bwrdd. Byddai hynny'n cael ei gyflawni drwy weithio'n hyblyg, ac ni fyddai'n golygu dim cost ychwanegol. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn nodi â diddordeb bod adnoddau digonol ar gael yn staff y Comisiwn i roi cymorth i'r bwrdd, ond ailadroddodd bryderon a fynegwyd yn ein hadroddiad ar gyllideb ddrafft Comisiwn y Cynulliad ar gyfer 2011, ac yn ystod y flwyddyn flaenorol, sef na ddylid sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar draul llwyth gwaith a morâl staff. Yn syml iawn, gofynnwn i hynny gael ei gadw mewn cof.

Prif bryder arall y Pwyllgor Cyllid oedd

was about the control of the remuneration board's workload. As the committee recognises that the work of the board will be cyclical, the committee did not see any reason to disagree that the levels of activity at present seemed reasonable. However, the committee was concerned that, while, according to the stringent principle set out in section 2 of the proposed Measure, the board has a specific job to do, there were different ways in which that could be approached. The committee recognises the importance of the board having the freedom to do its work as it sees fit, but it is conscious that this kind of work does have a tendency to expand. The Finance Committee was therefore greatly reassured by the Presiding Officer's indication that he would table an amendment to the proposed Measure that would require the remuneration board to present an annual report to the Assembly Commission. That would enable the Assembly to maintain an overview of the level of resources being consumed by the board, and would enable it to ensure that they were reasonable and proportionate to the task. The Finance Committee asks that the proposed Measure provides for an appropriate mechanism to ensure that the financial aspects of the board's annual report are fully scrutinised. We believe that that is vital in ensuring and improving transparency and accountability.

In conclusion, the Finance Committee noted that there are uncertainties surrounding the costs associated with the proposed Measure, but that the sums involved are not enormous. It supports the proposal to amend the proposed Measure to include a requirement for the board to prepare an annual report, and it would hope that that amendment is accepted. That should ensure that the financial aspects of the report are scrutinised in an open and transparent way. We consider it unlikely that the overall costs associated with the board will be difficult to accommodate in the Assembly Commission's budget, and we see no financial reason to object to the proposed Measure.

On a personal note, I want to add that I, as Chair of the Finance Committee and as an individual, have always received the utmost respect and courtesy from Chris Reading. I concur with the Presiding Officer's

ynghlân â rheoli llwyth gwaith y bwrdd taliadau. Gan fod y pwyllgor yn cydnabod y bydd gwaith y bwrdd yn gylchol, ni welai'r pwyllgor ddim rheswm i anghytuno â'r farn fod y lefelau gweithgarwch ar hyn o bryd yn ymddangos yn rhesymol. Fodd bynnag, er bod gan y bwrdd waith penodol i'w wneud, yn ôl yr egwyddor lem a nodir yn adran 2 yn y Mesur arfaethedig, yr oedd y pwyllgor yn pryderu y gellid mynd i'r afael â'r gwaith hwnnw mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cydnabod ei bod yn bwysig i'r bwrdd gael rhyddid i wneud ei waith fel y gwêl yn dda, ond mae'n ymwybodol bod tuedd i'r math hwn o waith ehangu. Felly, tawelwyd meddwl y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn sylweddol pan ddywedodd y Llywydd y byddai'n cyflwyno gwelliant i'r Mesur arfaethedig a fyddai'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r bwrdd taliadau gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad. Byddai hynny'n galluogi'r Cynulliad i gynnal trosolwg o lefel yr adnoddau a ddefnyddir gan y bwrdd, a byddai'n ei alluogi i sicrhau bod yr adnoddau'n rhesymol ac yn gymesur â'r dasg. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gofyn i'r Mesur arfaethedig ddarparu ar gyfer system briodol i sicrhau craffu'n llawn ar agweddau ariannol adroddiad blynyddol y bwrdd. Credwn fod hynny'n hanfodol o ran sicrhau a gwella tryloywder ac atebolrwydd.

I gloi, nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod ansicrwydd ynghylch y costau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r Mesur arfaethedig, ond nad yw'r symiau hynny'n enfawr. Mae'n cefnogi'r cynnig i wella'r Mesur arfaethedig er mwyn iddo gynnwys gofyniad i'r bwrdd baratoi adroddiad blynyddol, a byddai'n gobeithio y derbynnir y gwelliant hwnnw. Dylai hynny sicrhau craffu ar agweddau ariannol yr adroddiad mewn modd agored a thryloyw. Yn ein barn ni, nid yw'n debygol y byddai'n anodd i gyllideb Comisiwn y Cynulliad ymdopi â'r costau cyffredinol yn gysylltiedig â'r bwrdd, ac ni welwn ddim rheswm ariannol dros wrthwynebu'r Mesur arfaethedig.

Ar nodyn personol, hoffwn ychwanegu fy mod i, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid ac fel unigolyn, bob amser wedi cael fy nhrin â'r parch a'r cwrteisi mwyaf gan Chris Reading. Cytunaf â sylwadau'r Llywydd, a dymunaf

comments, and I wish him all the best, because he has done a sterling job.

Nick Bourne: I will open by saying that I, too, wish Chris Reading all the best for the future. He is far too young to retire—I could not believe that he was intending to retire, but I know that he has a full programme of activities that he is planning for his retirement. It will always be good to see Chris back here in the future.

It is a great pleasure to participate in the debate on this important proposed Measure. I want to speak in general terms rather than the specific and appropriate terms in which Nick Ramsay and Angela Burns have spoken given that they were members of the committees that considered this proposed Measure.

The National Assembly has benefited greatly from being an open and transparent institution. The Scottish Parliament operates in much the same way. I had the opportunity to discuss some of these issues with colleagues in the Scottish Parliament recently.

Our party welcomes the findings of the Roger Jones review, as is right. We have signalled our readiness, willingness and determination to participate in ensuring that the disinfectant of sunlight applies to our proceedings and that we continue to operate in the open way in which we do.

As an Assembly, we have already taken some appropriate actions, and more actions are being taken. As a group, we have looked at this proposed Measure on remuneration in a robust way. I have had the opportunity to discuss it with the Llywydd whose commitment to this process is undoubted and who has provided strong leadership on these issues, which I greatly welcome.

I also welcome the assurance that he has given me on the direction of travel, which is entirely appropriate. It is fair to say that, as a party, we were concerned about the potential cost of setting up a separate body in Wales to consider our remuneration. However, after discussing these matters with the Llywydd—

yn dda iddo, oherwydd mae wedi gwneud gwaith campus.

Nick Bourne: Dechreuaf drwy ddweud fy mod innau am ddymuno'n dda i Chris Reading yn y dyfodol. Mae'n rhy ifanc o lawer i ymddeol—ni allwn gredu ei fod yn bwriadu ymddeol, ond gwn fod ganddo raglen lawn o weithgareddau y mae'n eu cynllunio ar gyfer ei ymddeoliad. Bydd bob amser yn dda gweld Chris yn ôl yma yn y dyfodol.

Mae'n bleser mawr gennyf gymryd rhan yn y ddadl ar y Mesur arfaethedig pwysig hwn. Yr wyf am siarad yn gyffredinol, yn hytrach nag yn benodol ac yn briodol, fel y siaradodd Nick Ramsay ac Angela Burns, o gofio'u bod yn aelodau o'r pwyllgorau a fu'n ystyried y Mesur arfaethedig hwn.

Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi elwa'n fawr o fod yn sefydliad agored a thryloyw. Mae Senedd yr Alban yn gweithredu mewn ffordd debyg iawn. Cefais gyfle i drafod rhai o'r materion hyn gyda chydweithwyr yn Senedd yr Alban yn ddiweddar.

Mae ein plaid yn croesawu darganfyddiadau adolygiad Roger Jones, fel sy'n briodol. Yr ydym wedi nodi ein bod yn barod i gymryd rhan ac yn fodlon, ac yn benderfynol o gymryd rhan i sicrhau bod ein trafodion yn hollol dryloyw a'n bod yn parhau i weithredu yn ein ffordd agored arferol.

Fel Cynulliad, yr ydym eisoes wedi cymryd rhai camau gweithredu priodol, ac mae rhagor o gamau wrthi'n cael eu cymryd. Fel grŵp, yr ydym wedi ystyried yn drylwyr y Mesur arfaethedig hwn ar daliadau. Yr wyf wedi cael cyfle i'w drafod gyda'r Llywydd, sydd â'i ymrwymiad i'r broses hon yn ddiamau. Mae ei arweiniad yn y materion hyn wedi bod yn gryf, ac yr wyf yn croesawu hynny'n fawr.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r sicrwydd a roddodd imi o ran y cyfeiriad yr eir iddo, sy'n gwbl briodol. Mae'n deg dweud ein bod ni, fel plaid, wedi pryderu am gost bosibl sefydlu corff ar wahân yng Nghymru i ystyried ein taliadau. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl trafod y materion hyn gyda'r Llywydd—ac yn

and particularly in light of the fact that the Senior Salaries Review Body has indicated that it does not have the necessary expertise to operate in Wales—I am persuaded that the action that we will take here today is appropriate. I am pleased that this proposed Measure will be passed today because of the support of the Welsh Conservatives and, I do not doubt, the Welsh Liberal Democrat, on a day when it is to be regretted that the Government is not here to signal its clear view of the need for appropriate action.

I want to say a few additional words about our position on lobbying, which I hope can be brought within the scope of the board's remit. Over the last week, we have seen the spectacle of MPs' influence being up for hire. It has been paraded across our television screens and in the media. It is deeply worrying. I feel certain that this type of conduct does not happen in the Welsh Assembly Government. However, I am, as is my party, strongly supportive of a register of lobbyists being maintained in relation to the National Assembly. That should cover not just lobbyists in the narrow political consultancy or PR agency sense, but anyone who lobbies. Public Affairs Cymru, in fairness, is looking at a robust code of conduct, which should apply to all lobbyists in Wales. That view is shared by Positif Politics and other lobbyists in our nation. That should be looked at by the board.

I also believe that we need a strong code of conduct in relation to former Ministers of the Assembly Government taking up employment on ceasing office. I am sure that all Members will welcome that. Robust action will certainly have the strong support of the Welsh Conservatives, just as we strongly support measures to reassure the public and to regulate our own affairs. I welcome the open way in which the Llywydd is proceeding on this vital matter, and I am pleased to offer the strong support of the Welsh Conservatives to this necessary proposed Measure.

Eleanor Burnham: As the Welsh Liberal Democrat member of the committee that considered this proposed Measure, I am

benodol yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fod y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-swyddogion wedi nodi nad oes ganddo'r arbenigedd angenrheidiol i weithredu yng Nghymru—yr wyf wedi fy narbwyllo bod y cam gweithredu a gymerwn yma heddiw yn briodol. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn cael ei basio heddiw oherwydd cefnogaeth y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, a Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yr wyf yn siŵr, ar ddiwrnod pan yw'n drueni nad yw'r Llywodraeth yma i nodi ei barn glir ynghylch yr angen am gamau gweithredu priodol.

Hoffwn ddweud ychydig eiriau ychwanegol am ein safbwynt ar lobïo, a gobeithio y gellir ei gynnwys yn rhychwant cylch gwaith y bwrdd. Yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld yr holl helynt ynghylch talu am ddylanwad Aelodau Seneddol. Yr ydym wedi'i weld ar ein sgriniau teledu ac yn y cyfryngau. Mae'n peri pryder difrifol. Yr wyf yn siŵr nad yw'r math hwn o ymddygiad yn digwydd yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf fi, fel fy mhlaidd, yn gryf dros gynnal cofrestr o lobïwyr yng nghyswllt y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Dylai gynnwys nid yn unig lobïwyr, yn ystyr gul gwasanaeth ymgynghori gwleidyddol neu asiantaeth cysylltiadau cyhoeddus, ond pawb sy'n lobïo. Er tegwch, mae Public Affairs Cymru yn edrych ar god ymddygiad cadarn a ddylai fod yn berthnasol i bob lobïwr yng Nghymru. Mae Positif Politics a lobïwyr eraill yn ein gwlad hefyd o'r farn honno. Dylai'r bwrdd edrych ar hynny.

Credaf hefyd fod arnom angen cod ymddygiad cryf ar gyfer cyn-Weinidogion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n cael gwaith ar ôl gorffen eu swydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod yn croesawu hynny. Bydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn bendant yn gryf o blaid gweithredu'n gadarn, fel yr ydym yn gryf o blaid mesurau i dawelu meddwl y cyhoedd a rheoleiddio ein busnes ein hunain. Croesawaf y modd agored y mae'r Llywydd yn symud yn ei flaen ar y mater hanfodol hwn, ac yr wyf yn falch cynnig cefnogaeth gref y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i'r Mesur arfaethedig angenrheidiol hwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel aelod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o'r pwyllgor a ystyriodd y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, mae'n anrhydedd

honoured to be standing here discussing this important and historical event. I thank the Presiding Officer, the staff, the committee secretariat and in particular Chris Reading, for whom I have some fond memories from the good old days of the Assembly's North Wales Regional Committee. We had some interesting and humorous moments on that committee as well as moments of gravitas. I thank Chris and wish him good luck, and perhaps we will hear more of his pursuits.

As I said, as a member of the Legislation Committee No. 1, I am honoured to hear that, according to opinion polls, Assembly Members are held in high regard when compared with Members of other institutions, regrettably. In many respects, I never believed that we had a problem, and I believe that we continue to build on the trust that has been established, thanks to the Llywydd, in his wisdom, and all parties in the National Assembly. It is regrettable that two of them are not with us today. It is a bizarre situation for us to have this key debate with only two parties present in the Chamber.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats are totally committed to improving and strengthening our robust system. As I said, in comparison, systems in another place have left much to be desired. In my humble opinion, the general populace is looking to us to lead the way and to be in the vanguard of professionalism, openness and transparency.

2.20 p.m.

Consequently, while we should not discourage anyone from standing for election, and while we should be able to provide adequately for our AM support—and we do not, as the media often suggests, put it in our back pockets—no-one should gain inappropriately or unreasonably at other taxpayers' expense. I say 'other' because we are also taxpayers. Therefore, let us continue to enhance our robust system and do our best to ensure that the principles of openness and transparency continue.

I hate to be negative, but the committee had just one regret, namely that the former panel

imi sefyll yma'n trafod y digwyddiad pwysig a hanesyddol hwn. Diolchaf i'r Llywydd, y staff, ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor, a Chris Reading yn enwedig. Mae gennyf atgofion melys amdano ers dyddiau da Pwyllgor Rhanbarth y Gogledd yn y Cynulliad. Cawsom adegau diddorol a digrif ar y pwyllgor hwnnw, yn ogystal ag adegau o ddwyster. Diolchaf i Chris gan ddymuno'n dda iddo, ac efallai y clywn fwy am yr hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud.

Fel y dywedais, fel aelod o Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1, mae'n bleser gennyf glywed bod Aelodau Cynulliad, yn ôl y polau piniwn, yn uchel eu parch o'u cymharu ag Aelodau sefydliadau eraill, yn anffodus. Ar lawer ystyr, ni chredais erioed fod gennym broblem, a chredaf ein bod yn parhau i adeiladu ar yr ymddiriedaeth a sefydlwyd, diolch i'r Llywydd, yn ei ddoethineb, a'r holl bleidiau yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'n drueni nad yw dwy o'r pleidiau hynny gyda ni heddiw. Mae'n rhyfedd ein bod yn cynnal y ddadl allweddol hon a dim ond dwy blaid yn bresennol yn y Siambr.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi ymrwymo'n gyfan gwbl i wella a chryfhau ein system gadarn. Fel y dywedais, o'u cymharu â'n systemau ni, mae systemau mewn man arall yn bur annigonol. Yn fy marn fach i, mae'r boblogaeth gyffredinol yn disgwyl inni arwain y ffordd a bod ar y blaen o ran bod yn broffesiynol, yn agored ac yn dryloyw.

O ganlyniad, er na ddylem annog neb i beidio â sefyll mewn etholiad, ac er y dylem allu darparu'n ddigonol ar gyfer ein cymorth i Aelodau Cynulliad—ac nid ydym, fel yr awgryma'r cyfryngau yn aml, yn rhoi'r cymorth hwnnw yn ein pocedi—ni ddylai neb fod ar ei ennill yn amhriodol neu'n afresymol ar draul trethdalwyr eraill. Dywedaf 'eraill' oherwydd yr ydym ninnau'n drethdalwyr. Felly, gadewch inni barhau i wella ein system gadarn a gwneud ein gorau i sicrhau bod yr egwyddorion o fod yn agored ac yn dryloyw yn parhau.

Mae'n gas gennyf fod yn negyddol, ond yr oedd y pwyllgor yn edifarhau am un peth, sef

chair seemed to have such a negative view of the public sector. He described organisations in the sector as 'wealth destroyers'. I am sorry to be negative, but I wanted to make that known, because I believe that we are not wealth destroyers. In many respects, we are as much wealth creators as the private sector is, and we should not be viewed in such a negative way. I feel quite passionate about that, which is why I am putting it on record.

Apart from that, there was consensus on all matters. We had a robust discussion and some entertaining moments, as well as plenty of gravitas. We also heard evidence from some interesting and eminent specialists and academics. As such, we had an interesting and well-informed debate throughout the proceedings.

In view of the fact that some invitees were not quite so well informed, I suggest that everyone who gets involved with the new board, whatever it is to be called, be properly and appropriately well informed. I heard a former member of another board that has responsibilities relating to us say that we should not get involved in 'social work'. I suggest that anyone involved in any boards to do with Assembly Members be appropriately well informed themselves and do not make judgments without having the proper knowledge about what we get involved in. Therefore, we look to the Presiding Officer, who has a great deal of historical responsibility in this matter, for guidance. I look forward to pursuing this historical issue and to the Stage 2 discussions.

Alun Cairns: It is a pleasure to have the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I thank the Presiding Officer for the way in which he introduced the debate, the committee for the work that it did, and its secretariat, particularly Chris Reading, for the way in which it supported the committee and the independent panel.

I do not apologise one bit for saying that my initial response to this body involved healthy scepticism. I wondered why we needed another body. A body was already in

ei bod yn ymddangos bod gan gyn-gadeirydd y panel farn negyddol iawn am y sector cyhoeddus. Disgrifiodd sefydliadau yn y sector hwnnw fel dinistrwyr cyfoeth. Mae'n flin gennyf fod yn negyddol, ond yr oeddwn am nodi hynny, oherwydd ni chredaf ein bod yn ddinistrwyr cyfoeth. Ar lawer ystyr, yr ydym yn creu'r un faint o gyfoeth â'r sector preifat, ac ni ddylid ein hystyried mewn ffordd mor negyddol. Teimlaf yn eithaf cryf am y mater, a dyna pam yr wyf am gofnodi hynny.

Ar wahân i hynny, cafwyd consensws ar yr holl faterion. Cawsom drafodaeth gadarn a rhai adegau difyr, yn ogystal â digon o ddwystr. Clywsom dystiolaeth hefyd gan rai arbenigwyr ac academyddion diddorol ac amlwg. Felly, cawsom ddadl ddiddorol wedi ei seilio ar lawer o wybodaeth drwy gydol y trafodion.

Yng ngoleuni'r ffaith nad oedd gan rai gwahoddedigion gymaint o wybodaeth, awgrymaf y dylai fod gan bawb a fydd yn ymwneud â'r bwrdd newydd, waeth beth fydd ei enw, wybodaeth gywir a phriodol. Clywais gyn-aelod o fwrdd arall sydd â chyfrifoldebau'n gysylltiedig â ni yn dweud na ddylem ymwneud â 'gwaith cymdeithasol'. Awgrymaf y dylai pawb sy'n ymwneud ag unrhyw fyrddau sy'n gysylltiedig ag Aelodau Cynulliad sicrhau bod ganddynt hwy eu hunain ddigon o wybodaeth briodol, ac na ddylent lunio barn heb y wybodaeth gywir am yr hyn yr ydym ni'n ymwneud ag ef. Felly, dibynnwn ar y Llywydd, sydd â chryn gyfrifoldeb hanesyddol yn y mater hwn, am arweiniad. Edrychaf ymlaen at fynd ar drywydd y mater hanesyddol hwn ac at drafodaethau Cyfnod 2.

Alun Cairns: Mae'n bleser cael y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Diolchaf i'r Llywydd am y modd y cyflwynodd y ddadl, i'r pwyllgor am y gwaith a wnaeth, ac i'r ysgrifenyddiaeth, yn enwedig Chris Reading, am y modd y cynorthwyodd y pwyllgor a'r panel annibynnol.

Nid wyf am ymddiheuro o gwbl am ddweud mai amheuaeth iach oedd fy ymateb cychwynol i'r corff hwn. Yr oeddwn yn dyfalu pam yr oedd arnom angen corff arall.

existence, namely the Senior Salaries Review Body, which did not cost the Assembly a penny and which had undertaken these tasks until that stage. *[Interruption.]* I am getting the message that it did cost something. I stand to be corrected.

The Presiding Officer: I am not used to standing up in the Chamber, but I will for you, Alun. *[Laughter.]* I believe that the cost to us was £8,000, and that was just for publication. Therefore, goodness knows what it would cost if we were to commission it now. I think it also fair to say that it did not perform with its own resources, but used contractors. There is nothing wrong with that; many people use contractors. However, here, we are talking about a different animal. I do not want to anticipate what I hope is coming in your speech, but it is to be a statutory body that has Welsh expertise to deal with the Welsh situation.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Llywydd for his intervention and for correcting my inaccurate statements. I accept what the Presiding Officer has just shared.

Nevertheless, my initial response was one of healthy scepticism regarding the need for another body, whether it would cause duplication, and whether costs would be incurred by running yet another body. In Wales, we sometimes have a habit—dare I say it—of wanting to establish Welsh bodies for the sake of it and sometimes for the sake of being different. However, I think it fair to say that, having accepted the evidence that has been presented to the committee, and having spoken to the Presiding Officer and a number of other Members, the principle of this proposed Measure is extremely important. It is accepted and absolutely necessary. As the detail of the legislation is published, and as scrutiny moves to Stage 2, it is right and fair that we will want to look at it in a positive and constructive way to ensure that it does not become what I initially feared it might. I am confident that there is no sign of that happening at this stage, because the necessity for this legislation was clarified in the scrutiny provided at Stage 1.

Yr oedd corff yn bodoli eisoes, sef y Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-swyddogion, nad oedd yn costio'r un geiniog i'r Cynulliad ac a oedd wedi ymgymryd â'r tasgau hyn tan hynny. *[Torri ar draws.]* Caf ar ddeall iddo gostio rhywbeth. Yr wyf yn fodlon cael fy nghywiro.

Y Llywydd: Nid wyf wedi arfer â sefyll yn y Siambr, ond gwnaf hynny i chi, Alun. *[Chwerthin.]* Credaf mai'r gost inni oedd £8,000, a chost gwaith cyhoeddi'n unig oedd hynny. Felly, dyn a wŷr beth fyddai'r gost pe baem yn ei gomisiynu'n awr. Credaf ei bod yn deg dweud hefyd mai contractwyr a ddefnyddiai'r corff i gyflawni ei waith, nid ei adnoddau ei hun. Nid oes dim o'i le ar hynny; mae llawer o bobl yn defnyddio contractwyr. Fodd bynnag, yma yr ydym yn siarad am rywbeth gwahanol. Nid wyf am ragweld yr hyn sydd i ddod, gobeithio, yn eich araith, ond corff statudol fydd hwn, sy'n cynnwys arbenigedd o Gymru i ymdrin â'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywydd am ei ymyriad ac am gywiro fy natganiadau gwallus. Derbyniaf yr hyn y mae'r Llywydd newydd ei ddweud.

Er hynny, amheuaeth iach oedd fy ymateb cychwynnol am yr angen am corff arall, ynghylch a fyddai'n arwain at ddyblygu gwaith, ac a fyddai costau ynghlwm wrth redeg corff arall eto. Yng Nghymru, mae gennym arfer weithiau—os caf ddweud—o ddymuno sefydlu cyrff Cymreig er mwyn eu sefydlu'n unig, ac weithiau er mwyn bod yn wahanol. Fodd bynnag, credaf ei bod yn deg dweud, ar ôl derbyn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor, ac ar ôl siarad â'r Llywydd a nifer o Aelodau eraill, fod egwyddor y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn eithriadol o bwysig. Fe'i derbynir, ac mae'n gwbl angenrheidiol. Wrth i fanylion y ddeddfwriaeth gael eu cyhoeddi, ac wrth i'r broses graffu symud i Gyfnod 2, mae'n gywir ac yn deg dweud y byddwn am edrych arno mewn modd cadarnhaol ac adeiladol er mwyn sicrhau na fydd yn datblygu fel yr ofnwn yn wreiddiol. Yr wyf yn hyderus nad oes arwydd bod hynny'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd eglurwyd yr angen am y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn ystod y broses graffu a ddarparwyd yng Nghyfnod 1.

It is important that we remain vigilant and aware of the costs at every stage. We need to keep an eye on bureaucracy, which is often necessary for public bodies, because public funds must be accounted for fully and properly. Bureaucracy is therefore often needed, but there are different ways of scrutinising implementation costs effectively.

Having started with a sense of healthy scepticism, which has an important role to play in Assembly scrutiny, I close on a positive note by saying that the new body is necessary, as recommended by the committee and, before that, the independent panel. I am sure that Members of all parties will want to ensure that, as the legislation is finalised, we are absolutely content that it will be delivered in the most efficient way possible, and that it offers the best value for money while serving the needs that the committee and the Presiding Officer have demonstrated to me.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): I thank the Member in charge of the proposed Measure for his statement to the Chamber and for the approach that he has taken to the suggestions put forward by Legislation Committee No. 1 and the Finance Committee. It is a pity that Government Ministers are not here to learn lessons from this approach.

The process of scrutiny in this establishment is genuinely to look to improve legislation and to ensure, through the Finance Committee, that resources are being spent wisely, effectively and efficiently. That is how the suggestions of those committees should be seen, not as attacks, as was the case with previous legislation committees. I am grateful to the Presiding Officer for accepting many of the proposals and for providing the opportunity to continue the debate via Stages 2 and 3 on issues to do with the title in English, for example.

I do not believe that any of us can truly understand the damage that has been done to the reputation of politics and politicians over the past 12 to 18 months. We have been fortunate in many ways that this institution

Mae'n bwysig inni barhau'n wylidwrus ac yn ymwybodol o'r costau yn ystod pob cyfnod. Mae angen inni gadw llygad ar fiwrocratiaeth, sy'n aml yn angenrheidiol ar gyfer cyrff cyhoeddus, oherwydd rhaid rhoi cyfrif yn llawn ac yn briodol am arian cyhoeddus. Mae angen biwrocratiaeth yn aml, felly, ond mae gwahanol ffyrdd i graffu'n effeithiol ar gostau gweithredu.

Wedi cychwyn gydag ymdeimlad o amheuaeth iach, sydd â rôl bwysig ym mhroses graffu'r Cynulliad, yr wyf am orffen ar nodyn cadarnhaol drwy ddweud bod y corff newydd yn angenrheidiol, fel yr argymhellwyd gan y pwyllgor, a'r panel annibynnol cyn hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau o bob plaid am sicrhau, wrth i'r deddfwriaeth gael ei chwblhau, ein bod yn gwbl fodlon y caiff ei gweithredu yn y modd mwyaf effeithlon posibl, ei bod yn cynnig y gwerth gorau am yr arian, ac ar yr un pryd yn diwallu'r anghenion y mae'r pwyllgor a'r Llywydd wedi'u dangos imi.

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Diolch i'r Aelod sydd â gofal am y Mesur arfaethedig am ei ddatganiad i'r Siambr, ac am ei agwedd at yr awgrymiadau a gyflwynwyd gan Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 1 a'r Pwyllgor Cyllid. Mae'n drueni nad yw Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth yma i ddysgu gwersi o'r agwedd hon.

Diben didwyll y broses graffu yn y sefydliad hwn yw ceisio gwella deddfwriaeth a sicrhau, drwy'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, fod adnoddau'n cael eu defnyddio'n ddoeth, yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon. Fel hynny y dylid gweld awgrymiadau'r pwyllgorau hynny, nid fel ymosodiadau, fel a oedd yn wir yn achos pwyllgorau deddfwriaeth blaenorol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywydd am dderbyn nifer o'r cynigion ac am roi'r cyfle i barhau'r ddadl, drwy Gyfnodau 2 a 3, ar faterion yn ymwneud â'r teitl yn Saesneg, er enghraifft.

Ni chredaf y gall yr un ohonom ddeall yn iawn y niwed a wnaed i enw da gwleidyddiaeth a gwleidyddion yn ystod y 12 i'r 18 mis diwethaf. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ffodus mewn llawer ffordd, yn yr ystyr fod

had the forethought and vision to anticipate the difficulties that would arise and to set in train at the earliest of stages a process to look at these issues and respond to them appropriately. I believe that the proposed Measure, following on from the Jones review, does exactly that. I do not believe that we will truly become aware of the damage that has been done until we see what I fear will be record low turnouts in the forthcoming general election, as the public simply walks away from the political process, feeling that it has little worth engaging with.

Like Eleanor Burnham, I am glad that the conduct of Assembly Members has always set us apart from the worst of what we have seen at Westminster. However, we have by no means been perfect, and we must constantly challenge ourselves in this institution to do what we can to ensure that the Welsh public has the greatest possible level of trust in us. It must therefore be right that any decision on how we are paid, our terms and conditions, and the level of expenses that we receive to carry out our duty should not be a matter for us. Being responsible for voting for our own levels of pay has never been the most comfortable of decisions. It does not happen in other walks of life, and it is not appropriate that it should continue to happen in our job.

2.30 p.m.

It is also appropriate to break the link between the level of our wages and those in other institutions. We have a unique role in Wales, and the work that we do is different to that in other institutions. It is only appropriate that we should be considered according to our own merits, and not linked to any other place. I have always believed that the best mechanism for doing that is the establishment of an independent body in Wales, made up of people who understand the issues around the working of this particular institution and who are, therefore, best placed to make judgments on what it is necessary to pay Assembly Members and what it is necessary to allocate to us in additional resources to carry out our role.

gan y sefydliad hwn yr agwedd ragofalus a'r weledigaeth i ragweld yr anawsterau a fyddai'n codi, ac i roi proses ar waith yn gynnar iawn i ystyried y materion hyn ac ymateb iddynt yn briodol. Credaf mai dyna'n union y mae'r Mesur arfaethedig, yn dilyn adolygiad Jones, yn ei wneud. Ni chredaf y byddwn yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r niwed a wnaed nes inni weld yr hyn a ofnaf fydd y niferoedd isaf erioed o bobl yn pleidleisio yn yr etholiad cyffredinol sydd ar ddod, wrth i'r cyhoedd droi cefn ar y broses wleidyddol gan deimlo nad oes fawr ddim gwerth i bobl ymwneud â hi.

Fel Eleanor Burnham, yr wyf yn falch fod ymddygiad Aelodau Cynulliad bob amser wedi ein gosod ar wahân i'r gwaethaf o'r hyn a welsom yn San Steffan. Fodd bynnag, ni fuom yn berffaith o bell ffordd, a rhaid inni ein herio ein hunain yn barhaus yn y sefydliad hwn i wneud popeth posibl i sicrhau bod gan y cyhoedd yng Nghymru y lefel uchaf posibl o ymddiriedaeth ynom. Felly, rhaid ei bod yn iawn na ddylai'r un penderfyniad am y ffordd y cawn ein talu, ein telerau a'n hamodau, a lefel y treuliau a gawn i gyflawni ein dyletswydd, fod yn fater i ni. Ni fu bod yn gyfrifol am bleidleisio dros ein lefelau cyflog ein hunain erioed yn benderfyniad cyfforddus. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd mewn agweddau eraill ar fywyd, ac nid yw'n briodol iddo barhau i ddigwydd yn ein swydd ni.

Mae hefyd yn briodol torri'r cysylltiad rhwng lefel ein cyflogau ni a'r rheini mewn sefydliadau eraill. Mae gennym rôl unigryw yng Nghymru, ac mae'r gwaith a wnawn yn wahanol i waith mewn sefydliadau eraill. Nid yw ond yn briodol y dylem gael ein hystyried yn ôl ein haeddiant, heb gael ein cysylltu â'r un lle arall. Yr wyf wedi credu erioed mai'r dull gorau o wneud hynny yw sefydlu corff annibynnol yng Nghymru, lle bydd pobl sy'n deall y problemau'n â'r modd y mae'r sefydliad penodol hwn yn gweithio, ac sydd, felly, yn y sefyllfa orau i wneud penderfyniadau am yr hyn y mae'n angenrheidiol ei dalu i Aelodau Cynulliad a'i ddyrannu inni fel adnoddau ychwanegol i gyflawni ein rôl.

I accept that we must ensure that the board does not accrue additional responsibilities and that the cost associated with it should not grow. We must ensure that the board operates in the most effective and efficient manner in coming to conclusions. However, more than anything, it must work in a transparent manner, so that members of the public have a total understanding of why the board has reached its decisions at the end of its processes. That must be the benchmark by which this board will be judged: it should be able to explain clearly and concisely to the public why it has reached the decision it has reached.

Therefore, on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats group, we are happy to support this proposed Measure. We look forward to its journey through the National Assembly for Wales, and to seeing the board set up in a timely fashion, to begin its deliberations as soon as possible, so that the task of setting our own pay and conditions is removed from us as quickly as possible. It cannot come soon enough for me, and I am sure for everyone in the Chamber, but most of all, for the people of Wales.

Finally, I pay tribute to the work of Chris Reading at the National Assembly for Wales, who has been an exemplar of what public service is all about. Chris, we appreciate your work very much, and I am sure that your wisdom, tenacity and hard work will be missed in this institution. However, we wish you well in your retirement.

The Presiding Officer: In honour of the kindness that has been shown to me by colleagues, I think that I will stand up. I am not used to trying to address the congregation behind me as well as the Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer. I will try not to turn my back on anyone.

I thank all Members who have taken part in this debate. I tried to set out at the beginning my willingness to accept almost all of what had been said in the reports of the committees, and I will expand a little on that. I welcome the emphasis in Nick Ramsay's

Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw'r bwrdd yn cronni cyfrifoldebau ychwanegol, ac na ddylai'r gost sy'n gysylltiedig ag ef gynyddu. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y bwrdd yn gweithredu yn y modd mwyaf effeithiol ac effeithlon wrth ddod i'w gasgliadau. Fodd bynnag, yn anad dim, rhaid iddo weithio mewn modd tryloyw, er mwyn i'r cyhoedd ddeall yn llwyr pam mae'r bwrdd wedi dod gwneud ei benderfyniadau ar ddiwedd ei brosesau. Rhaid mai dyna'r meincnod a ddefnyddir i farnu'r bwrdd hwn; dylai allu esbonio'n glir ac yn gryno i'r cyhoedd pam mae wedi gwneud y penderfyniad a wnaeth.

Felly, ar ran grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Edrychwn ymlaen at ei daith drwy Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac at weld sefydlu'r bwrdd yn brydlon i ddechrau ar ei drafodaethau cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl, er mwyn i'r dasg o bennu ein cyflog a'n hamodau ein hunain gael ei chymryd oddi arnom cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Gorau po gyntaf y digwydd hynny o'm safbwynt i, ac o safbwynt pawb arall yn y Siambr, yr wyf yn siŵr, ond yn anad dim, gorau po gyntaf y digwydd er mwyn pobl Cymru.

I gloi, hoffwn roi teyrnged i waith Chris Reading yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae wedi bod yn esiampl wych o'r hyn yw gwasanaeth cyhoeddus, ac yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi eich gwaith yn fawr iawn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y sefydliad hwn yn gweld eisiau eich doethineb, eich dycnwch a'ch gwaith caled. Fodd bynnag, dymunwn yn dda ichi yn eich ymddeoliad.

Y Llywydd: O barch i'r caredigrwydd a ddangoswyd imi gan fy nghyd-Aelodau, credaf fy mod am sefyll. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â cheisio annerch y gynulleidfa y tu ôl imi yn ogystal â'r Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro. Ceisiaf beidio â throi fy nghefn ar neb.

Diolch i'r holl Aelodau sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl hon. Ar y dechrau, ceisiais nodi fy mharodrwydd i dderbyn bron popeth a ddywedwyd yn adroddiadau'r pwyllgorau, a hoffwn ymhelaethu ychydig ar hynny. Croesawaf y pwyslais yn araith

erudite constitutional speech on setting out the issues of governance, accountability and transparency, along with the issue of independence. It is the balance between all of these important features that we are looking for in this legislation. It is through this exercise of scrutiny, as most people who have spoken have said, that we can get to a text that we can share, and which will work effectively for its purpose.

On the issue of the annual report, which was raised by Nick and others, the way that I visualise this is that it is an actively updated electronic annual report, which will be part of an active and clearly identified independent website, although it will be hosted by and linked into the Assembly Commission's website. I assume that this is also the way that we will operate in relation to the other important position for which we are currently recruiting, namely the new statutory independent commissioner on standards. There is an inter-relationship between these two.

It is through the means of that active website and the always live annual report, properly monitored and mediated by the relevant Commission staff—I will have something to say about that in a moment—that effective consultation will be assisted. Obviously, we must ensure that the board reaches all the people who would want to be consulted, but it is important that we use the way that we operate as a National Assembly, through electronic means, to ensure that there is always a means of consulting. Perhaps we can say more about how this active website might operate as we take the proposed Measure further. I do not know whether we need to put into legislation these days that an organisation established by statute should have a website, but I am prepared to consider doing so if it is felt that that would make it even clearer how we hope that the body will operate.

Angela Burns hit the nail on the head, if that is the appropriate metaphor, when she talked about the work of the new proposed remuneration board being cyclical in its

gyfansoddiadol, wybodus Nick Ramsay ar osod allan broblemau llywodraethu, atebolrwydd a thryloywder, ynghyd ag annibyniaeth. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei geisio yn y ddeddfwriaeth hon yw cydbwysedd rhwng yr holl nodweddion pwysig hyn. Fel y dywedodd mwyafrif y bobl a siaradodd, drwy'r broses graffu hon y bydd modd inni lunio testun y gallwn ei rannu ac a fydd yn gweithio'n effeithiol at ei ddiben.

O ran yr adroddiad blynyddol, sy'n fater a godwyd gan Nick ac eraill, dychmygaf y bydd yn adroddiad blynyddol electronig a gaiff ei ddiweddarau'n weithredol ac a fydd yn rhan o wefan annibynnol weithredol a glustnodir yn glir, er y bydd yn cael ei lletya gan wefan Comisiwn y Cynulliad a'i chysylltu â hi. Tybiaf mai fel hyn y byddwn hefyd yn gweithredu yng nghyswllt y swydd bwysig arall yr ydym yn recriwtio ar ei chyfer ar hyn o bryd, sef swydd y comisiynydd annibynnol statudol newydd ar safonau. Mae yna berthynas rhwng y ddau beth hyn.

Bydd modd i waith ymgynghori effeithiol gael ei hybu drwy gyfrwng y wefan weithredol honno, a'r adroddiad blynyddol a fydd bob amser yn ddogfen fyw ac a gaiff ei fonitro a'i gyflwyno'n gywir gan staff perthnasol y Comisiwn—bydd gennyf ryw Beth i'w ddweud am hynny yn y man. Yn amlwg, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y bwrdd yn cyrraedd yr holl bobl a fyddai am fod yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori, ond mae'n bwysig inni ddefnyddio'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, drwy dulliau electronig, i sicrhau bod dull ymgynghori ar gael bob amser. Efallai y gallwn ddweud mwy am y modd y gallai'r wefan weithredol hon weithredu wrth inni fynd â'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn ei flaen. Ni wn a oes angen inni nodi mewn deddfwriaeth y dyddiau hyn y dylai corff a sefydlir drwy statud gael gwefan, ond yr wyf yn fodlon ystyried gwneud hynny os credir y byddai'n gwneud hyd yn oed yn gliriach y ffordd y gobeithiwn y bydd y corff yn gweithredu.

Tarodd Angela Burns yr hoelen ar ei phen, os dyna'r trosiad priodol, pan siaradodd am natur gylchol gwaith y bwrdd taliadau arfaethedig newydd wrth iddo weithredu yn

operation during the four-year term of the Assembly. On staffing support—I will deal with this here; it was a point that Angela also made very clearly in the Finance Committee discussions—we have always encouraged, and it has been an ambition of our chief executive in the particularly strong way that she leads this organisation into modernisation and change, that our staff in the National Assembly are excellent at what they do but also excellent at flexible working. Since this is the first meeting of the Chris Reading appreciation society, I might add that he is a very good example of someone who has worked flexibly throughout his career with us. We certainly see it as a career development opportunity for Commission staff to be able to undertake work of this kind in the cyclical pattern that emerges. The flexible working of staff, and the gaining of experience in all aspects of complexity of public sector work, is something that we value in this organisation. That will certainly apply to support for this board, as it has applied already to support for our other independent officers, especially the commissioner for standards.

What supporting the bureau will bring, both to those who are supporting it from within the Commission and to its members, is direct personal satisfaction from knowing that they are deliberately helping to create a positive attitude towards Welsh democracy. There is an ethical principle behind what we are doing this afternoon, and that must always imbue the work of those who will be members of the independent bureau and those who will support it. That is why I do not believe that we will have difficulty in recruiting people to undertake this work, and I am glad that we are agreed that the level of remuneration is the appropriate Welsh rate for the job.

I am very grateful to the leader of the opposition for his support in this, as in many other matters. I was given a very good piece of advice on the job of presiding by my great mentor, Bernard Weatherill, who was, in my view, the best post-war Speaker of the House of Commons—bar the present incumbent, I had better say, but we will see how that pans out. However, Bernard Weatherill warned

ystod tymor pedair blynedd y Cynulliad. O ran cymorth staffio—ymdriniaf â hynny'n awr; yr oedd yn bwynt a wnaeth Angela yn glir iawn hefyd yn nhrefodaethau'r Pwyllgor Cyllid—yr ydym bob amser wedi mynnu, a bu'n un o uchelgeisiau ein prif weithredwr yn y ffordd arbennig o gryf y mae'n arwain y sefydliad hwn i foderneiddio a newid, fod ein staff yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ardderchog yn yr hyn a wnânt, ond hefyd yn ardderchog am weithio'n hyblyg. Gan mai hwn yw cyfarfod cyntaf cymdeithas gwerthfawrogi Chris Reading, hoffwn ychwanegu ei fod yn esiampl dda iawn o rywun sydd wedi gweithio'n hyblyg gydol ei yrfa gyda ni. Yr ydym yn sicr yn ystyried bod ymgymryd â gwaith o'r math hwn, yn y patrwm cylchol a fydd yn dod yn amlwg, yn gyfle i staff y Comisiwn ddatblygu eu gyrfa. Mae staff sy'n gweithio'n hyblyg, ac sy'n meithrin profiad ym mhob agwedd ar gymhlethdod gwaith y sector cyhoeddus, yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei werthfawrogi yn y sefydliad hwn. Yn sicr, bydd hynny'n berthnasol wrth gynorthwyo'r bwrdd hwn, fel y bu eisoes yn berthnasol wrth gynorthwyo'n swyddogion annibynnol eraill, yn enwedig y comisiynydd safonau.

Yr hyn y bydd cynorthwyo'r biwro yn ei olygu, i'r rhai a fydd yn ei gynorthwyo o'r tu mewn i'r Comisiwn ac i'w holl aelodau, yw boddhad personol uniongyrchol o wybod eu bod gan bwyll bach yn helpu i greu agwedd gadarnhaol at ddemocratiaeth yng Nghymru. Mae egwyddor foesegol y tu ôl i'r hyn a wnawn y prynhawn yma, a rhaid i hynny dreiddio bob amser i waith y rhai a fydd yn aelodau o'r biwro annibynnol a'r rhai a fydd yn ei gynorthwyo. Dyna pam na chredaf y bydd yn anodd inni recriwtio pobl i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn, ac yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn cytuno mai lefel y taliadau yw'r gyfradd briodol yng Nghymru ar gyfer y gwaith.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn i arweinydd yr wrthblaid am ei gefnogaeth i'r mater hwn, fel yn achos nifer o faterion eraill. Cefais gyngor da iawn ar swydd y llywydd gan fy mentor ardderchog, Bernard Weatherill, y Siaradwr gorau yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ers y rhyfel, yn fy marn i—ac eithrio'r Siaradwr presennol, gwell imi ddweud, ond cawn weld sut hwyl a gaiff arni. Fodd bynnag, cefais fy rhybuddio

me, when he knew that I was taking this job, never to fall out with the Government and the opposition at the same time. [*Interruption.*]

2.40 p.m.

The leader of the opposition and I have had our moments, mainly in private, but we have a healthy relationship, professionally and personally, for the development of this organisation, and never better than when he stated his concerns and yet was, in our private discussions, and as they say in evangelical Christianity, open to conviction.

However, he brought up a matter today that has concerned me, especially this week, after viewing the absolutely appalling *Dispatches* programme. I have had the highest regard for the programme and its producers over the years and they did a great service to democracy in what they did the other night. I am not revelling at all in what former colleagues at Westminster did, but we need to address what the leader of the opposition mentioned today about lobbying and being able to do something more effective about it here than has happened elsewhere. I am not certain yet whether that should be included in this proposed Measure, but it may well be; I would like to take that away. We strengthened the Measure on the independent commissioner in committee, by placing duties on the commissioner, the accounting officer and so on, and it may be that we can look at bringing a section of this proposed Measure to bear on that issue.

I have had discussions with Public Affairs Cymru about a code of conduct. Over the years, I have believed in self-regulation by the lobbying professions, to call them that. I plead guilty: the only thing that I ever got for asking a parliamentary question was a jar of peanut butter, and I am glad that I never got anything more than that. We need to look at whether, in these times, it might be appropriate to have some form of a code of conduct that is binding. Again, and I have to take advice from—I am sorry, am I due to wind up?

gan Bernard Weatherill, pan glywodd fy mod am gymryd y swydd hon, i beidio â chweryla â'r Llywodraeth a'r wrthblaid ar yr un pryd. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Mae arweinydd yr wrthblaid a minnau wedi ffraeo weithiau, yn breifat yn bennaf, ond mae gennym berthynas dda, ar lefel broffesiynol a phersonol, pan ddaw'n fater o ddatblygu'r sefydliad hwn. Ni fu erioed yn well na phan oedd yn mynegi ei bryderon ond eto, yn ein trafodaethau preifat, yn barod i gael ei argyhoeddi, fel y dywed Cristnogion efengylaidd.

Fodd bynnag, cododd fater heddiw sydd wedi peri pryder imi, yn enwedig yr wythnos hon, ar ôl gweld y rhaglen *Dispatches* a oedd yn hollol erchyll. Bu gennyf barch mawr i'r rhaglen a'i chynhyrchwyr dros y blynyddoedd, a gwnaethant gymwynas fawr â democratiaeth drwy'r hyn a wnaethant y noson o'r blaen. Nid wyf yn ymhyfrydu o gwbl yn yr hyn a wnaeth cyn-gydweithwyr imi yn San Steffan, ond mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â'r hyn y soniodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid amdano heddiw ynghylch lobïo, a gallu gwneud rhywbeth mwy effeithiol yn ei gylch yma nag sydd wedi digwydd mewn manau eraill. Nid wyf yn sicr eto a ddylid cynnwys hynny yn y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, ond mae'n ddigon posibl; hoffwn ystyried hynny. Bu inni gryfhau'r Mesur o ran y comisiynydd annibynnol yn y pwyllgor, drwy osod dyletswyddau ar y comisiynydd, y swyddog cyfrifyddu ac yn y blaen, ac mae'n bosibl y gallwn ystyried dod ag adran o'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn i ddylanwadu ar y mater hwnnw.

Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau gyda Public Affairs Cymru ar god ymddygiad. Dros y blynyddoedd, yr wyf wedi credu y dylai'r proffesiynau lobïo, os gallaf eu galw'n hynny, eu rheoleiddio eu hunain. Plediaf yn euog; yr unig beth a gefais erioed am ofyn cwestiwn seneddol oedd jar o fenyn pysgnau, ac yr wyf yn falch na chefais ddim mwy na hynny. Mae angen inni ystyried a allai fod yn briodol, y dyddiau hyn, cael rhyw fath o god ymddygiad gorfodol. Unwaith eto, a rhaid imi gymryd cyngor gan—mae'n flin gennyf, a yw'n bryd imi ddirwyn i ben?

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Yes, please.

The Presiding Officer: I thought that I would fill the afternoon. [*Laughter.*] I am coming to the end. It is very good stuff, I assure you.

I have received a warning. I thank Eleanor Burnham on behalf of the Liberal Democrats. What I would say is that the issue with this is not that we necessarily had a problem—I agree with her; we probably did not have a problem—but that perception is everything. The perception of the public of what we do is essential. As for Alun Cairns, better a Cairns that repenteth. I am grateful to him and I would say to him that scrutiny and scepticism are cousins. Irony in scepticism has to be part of the approach in this place. I thank him for that. I thank the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats very much for her continued support. Again, I think that our professional and personal relationships go back to the referendum night, about which I will not regale Members today. She referred to the damage elsewhere; I am driven by a wish for this place to be better than what I have experienced elsewhere. I do not apologise for saying that. They have been a shower. We never intend to be a shower, although we live in a wet climate.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the general principles of the Proposed National Assembly for Wales (Remuneration) Measure. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. The motion is therefore agreed, in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35. The financial resolution has been postponed until 20 April 2010.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 2.44 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 2.44 p.m.*

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Trefn. Ydy, os gwelwch yn dda.

Y Llywydd: Credais y byddwn yn llenwi'r prynhawn cyfan. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr wyf yn dirwyn i ben. Mae'n werth ei glywed, credwch fi.

Yr wyf wedi cael rhybudd. Diolch i Eleanor Burnham ar ran y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Hoffwn ddweud mai'r anhawster yng nghyswllt hyn yw nad oedd gennym broblem o reidrwydd—yr wyf yn cytuno â hi; mae'n debyg nad oedd gennym broblem—ond mai canfyddiad pobl sy'n cyfrif. Mae canfyddiad y cyhoedd o'r hyn a wnawn yn hanfodol. O ran Alun Cairns, gwell gennyf y Cairns sy'n edifarhau. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo, a hoffwn ddweud wrtho bod gwaith craffu ac amheuaeth yn gefndryd i'w gilydd. Rhaid i eironi mewn amheuaeth fod yn rhan o'r dull gweithredu yn y lle hwn. Diolch iddo am hynny. Diolch yn fawr i Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru am ei chefnogaeth barhaus. Eto, credaf fod ein perthynas broffesiynol a phersonol yn mynd yn ôl i noson y refferendwm, ond nid wyf am ddifyrru'r Aelodau â hynny heddiw. Cyfeiriodd at y niwed a wnaed mewn man arall; caf fy sbarduno gan fy nymuniad i'r lle hwn fod yn well na'r hyn a brofais mewn man arall. Nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am ddweud hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Y cynnig yw derbyn egwyddorion cyffredinol Mesur Arfaethedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru (Taliadau). A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35. Gohiriwyd y penderfyniad ariannol tan 20 Ebrill 2010.

Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

Cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' The 'One Wales' Agreement

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4 a 5 yn enw Peter Black.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4 and 5 in the name of Peter Black.

Nick Bourne: I move that

Nick Bourne: Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales believes that the 'One Wales' agreement is not delivering for the people of Wales. (NDM4449)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn credu nad yw'r cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru. (NDM4449)

I will open by saying a little about the situation in which we find ourselves today, because we cannot go ahead without mentioning it. I pay tribute to the people who are here today, doing what they are employed to do on behalf of the people of Wales. Just as Government business is vital, opposition business is vital, because it is our opportunity to scrutinise the Government on what it does in the name of our nation. I very much regret that Members from the governing parties are not here today for what I think is an extremely important debate about their governance and also for the short debate. Mick Bates has a short debate later on, and will not get the Government response that he is entitled to. We will be staying for that short debate, which is an important one. I regret that the Government is not here today. That is all the more extraordinary given that, although some Members from governing parties say that they are not working in the interests of solidarity with the union, the union members whom I spoke to when I arrived this morning understood that Assembly Members need to carry on with business here. I do not understand the position of the Government in running away from what it is supposed to be doing here, and I hope that today will be the last day of this nonsense as far as the Government is concerned.

Hoffwn agor y ddadl drwy sôn ychydig am y sefyllfa yr ydym ynnddi heddiw, oherwydd ni allwn symud ymlaen heb sôn amdani. Hoffwn roi teyrnged i'r bobl sydd yma heddiw, yn gwneud yr hyn y cânt eu cyflogi i'w wneud ar ran pobl Cymru. Mae busnes yr wrthblaid yr un mor hanfodol â busnes y Llywodraeth, oherwydd hwn yw ein cyfle i graffu ar yr hyn a wna'r Llywodraeth yn enw ein cenedl. Yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr nad yw Aelodau'r pleidiau llywodraethol yma heddiw ar gyfer dadl eithriadol o bwysig, yn fy marn i, am y modd y maent yn llywodraethu, ac nad ydynt yma ar gyfer y ddadl fer chwaith. Mae gan Mick Bates ddadl fer yn ddiweddarach, ac ni fydd yn cael yr ymateb y mae ganddo hawl i'w gael gan y Llywodraeth. Byddwn ni'n aros ar gyfer y ddadl fer honno, sy'n ddadl bwysig. Yr wyf yn gresynu nad yw'r Llywodraeth yma heddiw. Mae hynny'n fwy rhyfedd fyth oherwydd, er i rai Aelodau o'r pleidiau llywodraethol ddweud nad ydynt yn gweithio heddiw er mwyn dangos cefnogaeth i'r undeb, dywedodd aelodau'r undeb y siaradais â hwy wrth gyrraedd y bore yma eu bod yn deall bod angen i Aelodau Cynulliad fynd ymlaen â gwaith yma. Nid wyf yn deall safbwynt y Llywodraeth wrth droi ei chefn ar yr hyn y mae i fod i'w wneud yma, a gobeithio mai heddiw fydd diwrnod olaf y nonsens hwn o ran y Llywodraeth.

With regard to this important debate today, I am grateful for the opportunity to speak on the Labour/Plaid Cymru Assembly Government's 'One Wales' agreement, and its failure to deliver for the people of Wales.

O ran y ddadl bwysig hon heddiw, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i sôn am gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru y Cynulliad, a'i fethiant i gyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Pan lanswyd y rhaglen

When this programme for Government was launched on 27 June 2007, it stated that:

‘Our ambition is no less than to transform Wales into a self-confident, prosperous, healthy nation and society, which is fair to all.’

No-one could disagree with that as a mission statement; it is a noble ambition, but, so soon after its launch, it has sunk without trace. It has been a programme of such abject failure that no member of the Assembly Government is present and willing to defend it here today. Despite a decade of plenty, the fact is that the Assembly Government has thrown money away on gimmicks and has failed to deliver significant improvements in our economy and our public services. It did not, to use a metaphor that is perhaps overused, fix the roof when the sun was shining.

Let us look first at the Government’s record on the economy, which is clearly the most important issue that we face at the moment. The ‘One Wales’ agreement commits the Assembly Government to a long-term goal of full employment, which is defined as 80 per cent employment. Yet the unemployment rate in Wales today is the highest for 15 years, with 133,000 people, or 9.2 per cent of the workforce, unemployed in Wales. That is a grim testament to Labour and Plaid’s mismanagement of the Welsh economy. Between June 1997, when the Labour Government came to power at Westminster, and November 2009, 68,000 manufacturing jobs were lost in Wales. In more recent times, household names such as Bosch, Hoover and Indesit have disappeared from Wales, yet the First Minister claims that the dire economic figures are ‘not that bad’. The Secretary of State for Wales, when challenged on levels of poverty here, compares them favourably to those of Rwanda. Their complacency is leading Wales into economic ruin.

For Wales to drag itself out of recession, we need to do much more to encourage our small businesses to grow and to thrive. ‘One Wales’ pledges the Assembly Government to

hon ar gyfer Llywodraeth ar 27 Mehefin 2007, yr oedd yn dweud mai:

‘Ein huchelgais fawr yw gwednewid Cymru a’i throi’n genedl a chymdeithas hyderus, ffyniannus, iach sy’n deg â phawb.’

Ni allai neb anghytuno â hynny fel datganiad o genhadaeth; mae’n uchelgais ardderchog, ond yn fuan iawn ar ôl ei lansio, mae wedi diflannu heb adael dim ôl. Bu’n rhaglen mor affwysol o aflwyddiannus fel nad oes yr un aelod o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bresennol ac yn fodlon ei hamddiffyn yma heddiw. Er gwaethaf degawd o ddigonedd, y gwir amdani yw bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwastraffu arian ar gimics, ac wedi methu â chyflawni gwelliannau sylweddol yn ein heconomi a’n gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Gan ddefnyddio trosiad a orddefnyddir efallai, nid atgyweiriodd y to pan oedd yr haul yn gwenu.

Yn gyntaf, gadewch inni ystyried perfformiad y Llywodraeth o ran yr economi, sef y mater pwysicaf, mae’n amlwg, sy’n ein wynebu ar hyn o bryd. Mae cytundeb ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn ymrwymo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i nod hirdymor o sicrhau cyflogaeth lawn, a ddiffinnir fel cyflogaeth ar gyfradd o 80 y cant. Eto i gyd, mae’r gyfradd ddiweithdra yng Nghymru heddiw ar ei huchaf ers 15 mlynedd, gyda 133,000 o bobl, neu 9.2 y cant o’r gweithlu, yn ddi-waith yng Nghymru. Mae’n dystiolaeth enbyd o fethiant y Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru i reoli economi Cymru. Rhwng mis Mehefin 1997, pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth Lafur i rym yn San Steffan, a mis Tachwedd 2009, collwyd 68,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Yn fwy diweddar, mae enwau cyfarwydd megis Bosch, Hoover ac Indesit wedi diflannu o Gymru, ac eto mae’r Prif Weinidog yn honni nad yw’r ffigurau economaidd enbyd ‘yn rhy wael’. Pan gaiff Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ei herio ynghylch lefelau tlodi yma, mae’n eu cymharu’n ffafriol â lefelau tlodi yn Rwanda. Mae eu hunanfodlonrwydd yn arwain Cymru at ddistryw economaidd.

Er mwyn i Gymru ei llusgo’i hun allan o ddirwasgiad, mae angen inni wneud mwy o lawer i annog ein busnesau bach i dyfu a ffynnu. Mae ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn rhwymo

enhance the business rate relief scheme within the context of more effective support for businesses. In Northern Ireland there is a standstill on the rate revaluation; in Scotland, there is a standstill on business rate increases; and in England there is transitional relief. Extended relief has been announced today, in the budget, and yet we are not doing anything with the business rate revaluation in Wales. That is hitting small and medium-sized businesses up and down our country.

Many business communities throughout Wales and in the area that I represent—towns like Narberth, Llandeilo, Aberaeron and Harlech—have suffered massively as a result of the revaluation, and yet, again, and I raised this issue yesterday, the Government does not propose to do anything to help. Above all, it should be postponing this damaging revaluation, just as Northern Ireland has done, or there should at least be some transitional relief, as in England.

‘One Wales’ committed Labour and Plaid Cymru to halving child poverty by 2010, and to eradicating it totally by 2020. The reality is that, despite policies, task groups, implementation plans, Measures and strategies, the percentage of children living in poverty has increased to 32 per cent, and child poverty is now a scar on the lives of more than 180,000 children and young people in Wales. As Save the Children said in a recent report, current Government policy in Wales is clearly not reaching and supporting the children who need help the most.

2.50 p.m.

‘One Wales’ states that Labour and Plaid Cymru are committed to developing and improving Wales’s health service, yet health waiting lists are getting longer, and we know that £1 billion of the health service budget is being spent inappropriately, but the Government is doing little or nothing about that. There are large gaps, as the Sugar review of July 2008 pointed out, in relation to palliative care services. We have reacted to

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wella’r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yng nghyd-destun cymorth mwy effeithiol i fusnesau. Yng Ngogledd Iwerddon, mae’r ymarfer ailbrisiu ardrethi ar stop; yn yr Alban, mae’r broses o gynyddu ardrethi busnes ar stop; ac yn Lloegr, mae yna ryddhad trosiannol. Cyhoeddwyd rhyddhad estynedig heddiw, yn y gyllideb, ac eto nid ydym yn gwneud dim o ran yr ymarfer ailbrisiu ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru. Mae’r ailbrisiu’n taro busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ym mhob cwr o’r wlad.

Mae nifer o gymunedau busnes ledled Cymru ac yn yr ardal yr wyf yn ei chynrychioli—trefi megis Arberth, Llandeilo, Aberaeron a Harlech—wedi dioddef yn enbyd o ganlyniad i’r ymarfer ailbrisiu, ac eto, unwaith yn rhagor, a chodais y mater hwn ddoe, nid yw’r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu gwneud dim i helpu. Yn anad dim, dylai fod yn gohirio’r ymarfer ailbrisiu niweidiol hwn, fel y mae Gogledd Iwerddon wedi gwneud, neu dylai fod gennym o leiaf rywffaint o ryddhad trosiannol, fel sydd yn Lloegr.

Yr oedd ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn ymrwymo’r Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru i haneru tldi plant erbyn 2010, a’i ddileu’n gyfan gwbl erbyn 2020. Er gwaethaf polisiâu, grwpiau gorchwyl, cynlluniau gweithredu, Mesurau a strategaethau, y gwir amdani yw bod canran y plant sy’n byw mewn tldi wedi cynyddu i 32 y cant, a bod tldi plant bellach yn creithio bywydau dros 180,000 o blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd Achub y Plant mewn adroddiad yn ddiweddar, mae’n amlwg nad yw polisi cyfredol y Llywodraeth yng Nghymru yn cyrraedd nac yn cynorthwyo’r plant y mae arnynt angen help fwyaf.

Mae ‘Cymru’n Un’ yn dweud bod y Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru wedi ymrwymo i ddatblygu a gwella gwasanaeth iechyd Cymru, ac eto, mae rhestrau aros ym maes iechyd yn mynd yn hwy, a gwyddom fod £1 biliwn o gyllideb y gwasanaeth iechyd yn cael ei wario’n amhriodol. Ac eto nid yw’r Llywodraeth yn gwneud fawr ddim ynghylch hynny. Mae yna fylchau mawr, fel y dangosodd adolygiad Sugar ym mis

that and have said what we would do, therefore, is it not time that the Government did something about that?

There is a massive funding gap with England with regard to education, and school buildings are not fit for purpose. We met as a group last night with further education colleges, and we find that the Government figures are deeply flawed and do not take account of increased expectations and demand and that these colleges, for some time, have been having settlements lower than inflation and are therefore going backwards.

The Assembly Government promised, as far as is reasonable practicable, to eradicate fuel poverty in vulnerable households by this year, in social housing by 2010, and to eradicate it completely by 2018. The Fuel Poverty Charter Coalition states that the Assembly Government is unlikely to meet its targets, and that it needs a far more radical and comprehensive approach in order to do so.

In relation to what is a cornerstone of the 'One Wales' agreement and central to Plaid Cymru's ambitions, I deeply regret all the dithering in relation to the referendum, which we have voted for unanimously here. I do not understand the First Minister. Failing to send a letter to the Secretary of State for a week is not taking a laid-back approach; it is downright reckless. I cannot understand the leader of Plaid Cymru letting that go without a mention of his party's position. It is time that we had the referendum. We have been dithering for three years on this issue, and it could have been brought forward much earlier. The Richard commission recommended it, and that was the time to act. Given that we have a Government that seems to want this, I cannot believe that, after three years, we are nowhere near a referendum being called. There is a strong feeling, certainly on our side, that Peter Hain is calling the shots, not Carwyn Jones, and certainly not Ieuan Wyn Jones.

Gorffennaf 2008, yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol. Yr ydym wedi ymateb i hynny gan ddweud beth y byddem ni'n ei wneud, felly, onid yw'n bryd i'r Llywodraeth wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch?

Mae bwlch enfawr o ran cyllid rhwng Cymru a Lloegr yng nghyswllt addysg, ac nid yw adeiladau ysgolion yn addas at y diben. Neithiwr, cawsom gyfarfod fel grŵp â cholegau addysg bellach, a gwelwn fod ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yn wallus tu hwnt ac nad ydynt yn ystyried disgwyliadau uwch a galw cynyddol, a'r ffaith bod y colegau hyn ers cryn amser wedi bod yn cael setliadau islaw chwyddiant ac felly'n mynd tuag yn ôl.

Addawodd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, cyn belled â'i bod yn rhesymol ymarferol, ddileu tloedi tanwydd ar aelwydydd sy'n agored i niwed erbyn eleni, ei ddileu mewn tai cymdeithasol erbyn 2010, a'i ddileu'n gyfan gwbl erbyn 2018. Dywed Cynghrair Siarter Tloedi Tanwydd fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn annhebygol o gyrraedd ei thargedau, a bod angen iddi fabwysiadu dull gweithredu mwy radical a chynhwysfawr o lawer i wneud hynny.

Yng nghyswllt un o gonglfeini cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', ac elfen sy'n ganolog i uchelgeisiau Plaid Cymru, gresynaf yn fawr at yr holl din-droi ynghylch y refferendwm yr ydym wedi pleidleisio'n unfrydol drosto yn y fan hon. Nid wyf yn deall y Prif Weinidog. Nid gweithredu wrth ei bwysau ydoedd wrth gymryd wythnos i anfon llythyr at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, ond gweithredu'n hollol ddiotal. Ni allaf ddeall sut y gallai arweinydd Plaid Cymru adael i hynny ddigwydd heb gyfeirio at safbwynt ei blaid. Mae'n bryd inni gael y refferendwm. Yr ydym wedi bod yn tin-droi yn ei gylch ers tair blynedd, a gellid bod wedi'i gyflwyno'n gynharach o lawer. Cafodd ei argymhell gan gomisiwn Richard, a dylid bod wedi gweithredu bryd hynny. O gofio bod gennym Lywodraeth sy'n ymddangos yn awyddus i gael refferendwm, ni allaf gredu, ar ôl tair blynedd, nad ydym yn agos at alw refferendwm. Mae yna deimlad cryf, o'n hochr ni'n bendant, mai Peter Hain sy'n rheoli'r sefyllfa, nid Carwyn Jones, ac nid Ieuan Wyn Jones yn bendant.

'One Wales' is full of worthy aspirations, but, as the saying goes, the road to hell is paved with good intentions. We believe that the Government has clung to out-of-date dogma in relation to the private sector, has not enhanced the position of the voluntary sector properly, and, if we judge it on its performance to date, it has let the nation down badly. Health and education need to be freed up, by putting teachers in charge of schools and doctors in charge of hospitals. More needs to be devolved to local councils and communities, and we need to involve the voluntary sector—the third sector—much more and recognise its importance. It is high time for a change in Wales and we offer that change from these benches. I deplore, once again, that the Government has gone into hiding today when it should be here serving the people of Wales.

Kirsty Williams: I move the following amendments in the name of Peter Black. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that to help ensure that the 'One Wales' agreement delivers for the people of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must urgently investigate the claim that up to a fifth of the NHS budget is not being spent effectively.

Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that to help ensure that the 'One Wales' agreement delivers for the people of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must reverse the 5 per cent 'efficiency gain' recently applied to the further and higher education sectors.

Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that to help ensure that the 'One Wales' agreement delivers for the people of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must re-introduce the tuition fees grant.

Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn llawn dyheadau clodwiw, ond fel y dywed yr hen ddywediad Saesneg, mae'r ffordd i uffern yn frith o fwriadau da. Credwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi glynu wrth ddogma hen ffasiwn yng nghyswllt y sector preifat, nad yw wedi gwella sefyllfa'r sector gwirfoddol yn iawn, ac, o'i barnu ar sail ei pherfformiad hyd yma, ei bod wedi siomi'r genedl yn ddifrifol. Mae angen rhyddhau iechedd ac addysg, drwy adael i athrawon gael y gofal am ysgolion ac i feddygon gael y gofal am ysbytai. Mae angen datganoli mwy o faterion i gymunedau a chynghorau lleol, ac mae angen inni gynnwys y sector gwirfoddol—y trydydd sector—yn fwy helaeth o lawer a chydabod ei bwysigrwydd. Mae'n hen bryd cael newid yng Nghymru, a chaiff y newid hwnnw ei gynnig gennym ni o'r meinciau hyn. Yr wyf, unwaith eto, yn gresynu bod y Llywodraeth wedi mynd i guddio heddiw pan ddylai fod yma'n gwasanaethu pobl Cymru.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Peter Black. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu, er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru, bod raid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru archwilio ar frys yr honiad nad yw hyd at un rhan o bump o gyllideb y GIG yn cael ei gwario'n effeithiol.

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu, er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru, bod raid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wyrddroi'r 'enillion effeithlonrwydd' o 5 y cant a osodwyd yn ddiweddar ar y sectorau addysg bellach ac uwch.

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu, er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru, bod raid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ailgyflwyno'r grant ffioedd dysgu.

Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that to help ensure that the 'One Wales' agreement delivers for the people of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must take urgent action to ensure its child poverty targets are met.

Amendment 5: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the Cardiff-Anglesey air link is not an effective way to improve north-south transport links, and that to help ensure that the 'One Wales' agreement delivers for the people of Wales, the Welsh Assembly Government must scrap the air link.

I will also begin my contribution this afternoon by addressing the situation that we are in today. I acknowledge the right of Public and Commercial Services Union members to withdraw their labour in industrial action, but say to the First Minister and the Deputy First Minister and their parties that they should show support for the PCS not by not attending to business here today, but by appealing to their colleagues in Westminster to get back around the negotiating table with PCS members to sort out the problem. That is the best service that they could offer to the PCS members who are on strike today, and who have genuine concerns about their colleagues and their future, not by taking the action that they have taken today.

Alun Cairns: Does the leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats accept that there is a blatant inconsistency here, in that the Prime Minister is prepared to call industrial action elsewhere deplorable, but the Labour/Plaid administration—although I am focusing on the Labour leadership in the administration—is not prepared to cross a picket line or to do anything that would potentially insult the unions? Is there not a blatant inconsistency there?

Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu, er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru, bod raid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gymryd camau ar frys i sicrhau ei bod yn cyflawni ei thargedau tlodi plant.

Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu nad yw'r cyswllt awyr rhwng Caerdydd ac Ynys Môn yn ffordd effeithiol o wella cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth rhwng y de a'r gogledd, ac er mwyn helpu i sicrhau bod y cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer pobl Cymru, rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gael gwared â'r cysylltiad awyr.

Hoffwn innau ddechrau fy nghyfraniad y prynhawn yma drwy roi sylw i'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi heddiw. Yr wyf yn cydnabod hawl aelodau Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol i beidio â gweithio er mwyn gweithredu'n ddiwydiannol, ond dywedaf wrth y Prif Weinidog a'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'u pleidiau y dylent ddangos cefnogaeth i'r Undeb dan sylw nid drwy beidio â chyflawni busnes yma heddiw, ond drwy erfyn ar eu cydweithwyr yn San Steffan i ddychwelyd at y bwrdd i drafod ag aelodau'r Undeb i ddatrys y broblem. Dyna'r gwasanaeth gorau y gallent ei gynnig i aelodau'r Undeb sydd ar streic heddiw ac sy'n pryderu'n wirioneddol am eu cydweithwyr a'u dyfodol, nid drwy gymryd y camau gweithredu y maent wedi eu cymryd heddiw.

Alun Cairns: A yw arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn derbyn bod anghysondeb amlwg yma, o ran bod y Prif Weinidog yn barod i ddweud bod gweithredu diwydiannol yn resynus ymhob man arall, ond nad yw weinyddiaeth Llafur/Plaid Cymru—er fy mod yn canolbwyntio ar yr arweinyddiaeth Lafur yn y weinyddiaeth—yn barod i groesi llinell biced na gwneud dim a allai dramgwyddo'r undebau? Onid oes anghysondeb amlwg yn hynny?

Kirsty Williams: What I find inconsistent is that Labour and Plaid Cymru Members in Westminster today have gone to the House and are debating, and have crossed the picket lines. We have a responsibility to the people of Wales to conduct our business, and that is what we are trying to do here this afternoon. The interest of the members of that union are not best served by the demonstration here today, but by doing what I have done on behalf of my group, namely contacting the Minister responsible in London and urging her to go back to the negotiating table and to bring this dispute to an end. That is what is best for PCS members, for government, and it is certainly what I believe to be best for the reputation of this Chamber, so that we can get back to normal.

Moving on, I thank the Conservatives for proposing this motion for debate this afternoon. I guess that the situation will mean that today's proceedings will be a lot more amicable and a lot less boisterous than might otherwise have been the case. Indeed, without some of the worst offenders in the barracking ranks on the other side of the Chamber, we might be able to make some progress and shine a light on some very serious problems that face our nation today—some very real problems that cannot be ignored. The leader of the opposition painted a clear picture of the economic situation that this country faces. I was brought into politics by the devastation that was wrought upon our economy several decades ago when members of my family were turfed on to the unemployment lines, and again today the unemployment figures in Wales are truly devastating. Behind each statistic is an individual, and probably a family, struggling to make ends meet.

We also heard about issues to do with child poverty. What is particularly striking about the child poverty figures for Wales is not just how many of our children are living in poverty, but that a significant proportion of those children are living in working households. So, these are not all children whose parents are unemployed; there are children living in households where at least

Kirsty Williams: Yr hyn sy'n anghyson, yn fy marn i, yw bod aelodau'r Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru yn San Steffan wedi croesi'r llinellau piced heddiw ac wedi mynd i'r Tŷ lle maent wrthi'n dadlau. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb tuag at bobl Cymru i gyflawni ein busnes, a dyna'r ydym yn ceisio'i wneud yn y fan hon y prynhawn yma. Nid y gwrthdystiad yn y fan hon heddiw yw'r ffordd orau o sicrhau budd i aelodau'r undeb dan sylw, ond gwneud yr hyn yr wyf fi wedi'i wneud ar ran fy ngrŵp, sef cysylltu â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol yn Llundain, a'i hannog i ddychwelyd at y bwrdd trafod a dod â'r anghydfod hwn i ben. Dyna fyddai orau i aelodau Undeb y Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus a Masnachol, a llywodraeth, a chredaf yn bendant mai dyna fyddai orau i enw da'r Siambr hon, fel y gallwn aildechrau gweithio'n ôl y drefn arferol.

Gan symud ymlaen, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Ceidwadwyr am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn i'w drafod y prynhawn yma. Tybiaf y bydd y sefyllfa'n golygu y bydd trafodion heddiw dipyn yn fwy cyfeillgar a llai swnllyd nag y gallasant fod fel arall. Yn wir, heb rai o'r bobl waethaf am weiddi ar ein traws o'r ochr arall i'r Siambr, efallai y bydd modd inni wneud rhywfaint o gynnydd a rhoi goleuni ar rai o'r problemau difrifol iawn sy'n wynebu ein cenedl heddiw—rhai problemau real iawn na ellir eu hanwybyddu. Peintiodd arweinydd yr wrthblaid ddarlun clir o'r sefyllfa economaidd sy'n wynebu'r wlad hon. Yr hyn a'm denodd at wleidyddiaeth oedd y modd y dinistriwyd ein heconomi'n llwyr lawer degawd yn ôl, pan gollodd aelodau o'm teulu eu gwaith yn ddisymwth, ac unwaith eto heddiw, mae'r ffigurau diweithdra yng Nghymru yn wirioneddol drychinebus. Y tu ôl i bob ystadegyn mae unigolyn, a theulu, fwy na thebyg, sy'n ei chael yn anodd cael deupen llinyn ynghyd.

Clywsom hefyd am broblemau'n ymwneud â thlodi plant. Yr hyn sy'n arbennig o drawiadol am y ffigurau tlodi plant ar gyfer Cymru yw nid yn unig faint o'n plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi, ond y ffaith fod cyfran sylweddol o'r plant hynny'n byw ar aelwydydd lle mae rhywun yn gweithio. Felly, nid yw'r rhain i gyd yn blant sydd â'u rhieni'n ddi-waith; mae plant sy'n byw ar

one of the parents is working, but for wages that are so low that, with living costs so high, they are still in poverty despite the parents' making the effort to work. That is a damning indictment of where we are today. Many of those children are studying in schools that are severely underfunded, particularly compared with schools across the border in England. We have yet to hear from the Government a satisfactory response or explanation of why that should continue to be the case. Simply stating that Welsh children have access to free breakfast in schools does not explain away such a significant funding gap.

If we compare the levels of attainment of Welsh children with those of their English counterparts, we can see that we are not doing well enough. We are at the wrong end of the league tables for many education statistics, and the same is true of our health service. That is not surprising, given the correlation between poverty and ill health. We have higher levels of chronic illness in Wales than many other parts of the UK. This week, we have seen the revelation that there is a recruitment crisis with regard to medics. After a decade of devolution, we are 400 doctors short here in Wales. Many people will have to travel further for services as a result, as local hospitals will be unable to provide the staffing levels to provide services safely. If we look at the ambulance service and the numerous questions that have been raised in the Chamber about the funding and performance for the ambulance service, we can see that, in the field of health, we are far from where we should be. That is why the Welsh Liberal Democrat group has tabled the amendments today.

The first amendment concerns the funding of the health service. I am absolutely amazed that when such a significant figure as Paul Davies comes before the Finance Committee and says:

'All those mistakes, or non-optimal behaviours—that is civil-service-speak if ever I heard it—are poor patient care and are extremely expensive. We believe that there is at least 20 per cent that we are not using

aelwydydd lle mae o leiaf un o'r rhieni'n gweithio, ond am gyflog mor isel fel y byddant yn dal i fyw mewn tloedi, er bod eu rhieni'n gwneud ymdrech i weithio, gan fod costau byw mor uchel. Mae hynny'n gyhuddiad damniol o'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi heddiw. Mae llawer o'r plant hynny'n astudio mewn ysgolion lle mae prinder cyllid difrifol, yn enwedig o'u cymharu ag ysgolion dros y ffin, yn Lloegr. Nid ydym eto wedi clywed y Llywodraeth yn rhoi ymateb neu esboniad boddhaol pam y dylai hynny barhau. Nid yw dweud yn syml bod modd i blant Cymru gael brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion yn esbonio bwch cyllido mor sylweddol.

O gymharu lefelau cyrhaeddiad plant Cymru â lefelau cyrhaeddiad eu cymheiriaid yn Lloegr, gallwn weld nad ydym yn gwneud yn ddigon da. Yr ydym ym mhen gwaelod y tablau perfformiad yng nghyswllt llawer o ystadegau addysg, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am ein gwasanaeth iechyd. Nid yw hynny'n syndod, o gofio'r gydberthynas rhwng tloedi ac afiechyd. Mae gennym lefelau uwch o salwch cronig yng Nghymru na llawer rhan arall yn y DU. Yr wythnos hon, yr ydym wedi gweld bod gennym argyfwng recriwtio meddygon. Ar ôl degawd o ddatganoli, yr ydym 400 o feddygon yn brin yma yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhaid i lawer o bobl deithio ymhellach i gael gwasanaethau o ganlyniad i hynny, oherwydd ni fydd ysbytai lleol yn gallu darparu'r lefelau staffio i ddarparu gwasanaethau'n ddiogel. O edrych ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a'r cwestiynau niferus sydd wedi'u gofyn yn y Siambr am gyllid a pherfformiad y gwasanaeth hwnnw, gallwn weld, ym maes iechyd, ein bod ymhell o'r man lle dylem fod. Dyna pam y mae grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliannau heddiw.

Mae'r gwelliant cyntaf yn ymwneud â chyllido'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu pan ddaw rhywun mor bwysig â Paul Davies gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyllid a dweud:

Mae'r holl gamgymeriadau hynny, neu ymddygiad nad yw gyda'r gorau posibl—ada dyna enghraifft wych, os clywais un erioed, o iaith y gwasanaeth sifil—yn ofal gwael i gleifion ac yn eithriadol o ddud. Credwn nad

appropriately within the total budget.’

I am absolutely amazed that such a senior civil servant in healthcare could come to the National Assembly for Wales and make such a comment without the Government getting worried about it.

3.00 p.m.

We immediately tabled a question for written answer to the Minister asking what action she would take following this revelation, and the single word answer of ‘none’ that came back is truly shocking to me. The health service takes up the largest proportion of our budget than any other service that we fund, and when we are told that such significant portions of that money is not being spent wisely, and that the Government does not choose to do anything about that, it is frankly a failure of the responsibilities that the Welsh Assembly Government has to the good governance of this nation. That is why we have tabled that particular amendment.

Our other amendments focus on issues around education, particularly further and higher education. We believe that those services are absolutely vital if this country is to overcome some of the inherent weaknesses that we have in our economy, which is a relatively low skills base, compared to other nations. If we are to move forward, we have to invest in FE and HE. The new education Minister can spin the figures any way he wants, but in the end, he cannot escape the fact that both HE and FE have been given less money this year than they received last year, yet they will have more students to provide for, which can only result in drops in quality. Individual students, particularly in the HE sector, will be put under significant financial pressure to purchase a lesser service. We expect them to take on significant levels of debt because of the removal of the student finance support that we all worked so hard to achieve here in Wales, and they will pay for a lesser education as the HE sector struggles to maintain a service with the cuts that are being forced upon it by the Government.

ydym yn defnyddio o leiaf 20 y cant o gyfanswm y gyllideb yn briodol.

Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu y gallai gwas sifil, sydd mewn swydd mor uchel ym maes gofal iechyd, ddod i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a gwneud sylw o'r fath heb i'r Llywodraeth bryderu yn ei gylch.

Aethom ati'n syth i gyflwyno cwestiwn i'r Gweinidog ei ateb yn ysgrifenedig, i ofyn pa gamau gweithredu y byddai'n eu cymryd yn dilyn y datgeliad hwn, ac yr wyf yn synnu'n ddychrynlyd at yr ateb un gair a gafwyd, sef 'dim'. Caiff y gwasanaeth iechyd gyfran fwy o'n cyllideb na'r un gwasanaeth arall a gyllidir gennym, a phan ddywedir wrthym na chaiff cymaint o'r arian hwnnw ei wario'n ddoeth, ac nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn dewis gwneud dim byd am y broblem, mae'n dangos methiant, a siarad yn blaen, o ran cyfrifoldebau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i lywodraethu'r wlad hon yn dda. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r gwelliant penodol hwnnw.

Mae ein gwelliannau eraill yn canolbwyntio ar faterion yn ymwneud ag addysg, yn enwedig addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Credwn fod y gwasanaethau hynny'n gwbl hanfodol os yw'r wlad hon am oresgyn rhai o'r gwendidau cynhenid sydd gennym yn ein heconomi, sef sylfaen sgiliau eithaf isel, o'i chymharu â gwledydd eraill. Os ydym am symud ymlaen, rhaid inni fuddsoddi mewn addysg bellach ac addysg uwch. Gall y Gweinidog newydd dros addysg roi pa wedd bynnag a fynno ar y ffigurau, ond yn y pen draw, ni all osgoi'r ffaith bod addysg bellach ac addysg uwch wedi cael llai o arian eleni nag a gawsant y llynedd. Eto i gyd, bydd ganddynt fwy o fyfyrwyr i ddarparu ar eu cyfer, a bydd hynny'n siŵr o arwain at ddirywiad mewn ansawdd. Bydd myfyrwyr unigol, yn enwedig yn y sector addysg uwch, yn cael eu rhoi dan bwysau ariannol sylweddol i brynu gwasanaeth mwy israddol. Disgwyliwn iddynt fynd i ddyled sylweddol yn sgil dileu'r cymorth ariannol i fyfyrwyr y gweithiodd pob un ohonom mor galed i'w sicrhau yma yng Nghymru. Byddant yn talu am addysg fwy israddol wrth i'r sector addysg uwch ei chael yn anodd cynnal

gwasanaeth gyda'r toriadau a orfodir arno gan y Llywodraeth.

I appreciate that time is progressing, and despite the fact that there will not be speakers from the other side, I am sure that the Presiding Officer would like us to finish at a timely hour today. However, we deplore what has happened here today. The Government had an opportunity to come to defend its programme, but it has chosen not to do so for reasons of industrial action. I suspect that it would have had very little to say even if it had been here today. The statistics and the experience of the Welsh public speak for themselves. 'One Wales' is failing them badly and we need to take this opportunity to have a serious rethink about how we run our public services, which will become increasingly more important when we begin to look at the challenges facing our budget in years to come.

Mohammad Asghar: Thank you for the opportunity to speak on this issue today. I welcome this debate greatly. There are processes in place to question and scrutinise the work of the Assembly Government. What better way to do this than to debate the 'One Wales' four-year coalition agreement put in place to guide the governance of Wales. Almost three years have passed since the document was signed by Rhodri Morgan and Ieuan Wyn Jones and the agreement was set out. There were three main objectives which raised peoples' hopes. The objectives were to improve the quality of life for people from all communities; to transform Wales into a self-confident, prosperous and healthy nation; and to deliver a Wales of which all people could be proud. It is regrettable that, in 2010, so many indicators suggest that the 'One Wales' agreement is not delivering for Wales.

On the economy, the 'One Wales' agreement promoted a vision of Wales as a nation boasting a strong and enterprising economy and targeted economic prosperity for the people of Wales. However, as I stand here today, sadly, unemployment is higher in Wales than in any other UK nation. Unemployment in Wales is at a 15-year high today. In 2009, the Welsh unemployment rate among 16 to 19-year-olds was higher than

Sylweddolaf fod amser yn mynd rhagddo, ac er na fydd siaradwyr o'r ochr arall, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Llywydd yn hoffi inni orffen yn brydlon heddiw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn gresynu at yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yma heddiw. Yr oedd gan y Llywodraeth gyfle i ddod i amddiffyn ei rhaglen, ond dewisodd beidio â gwneud hynny oherwydd gweithredu diwydiannol. Tybiaf mai ychydig iawn a fyddai ganddi i'w ddweud hyd yn oed pe bai wedi bod yma heddiw. Mae'r ystadegau a phrofiad y cyhoedd yng Nghymru yn dweud y cyfan. Mae 'Cymru'n Un' wedi eu siomi'n arw, ac mae angen inni fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ailfeddwl o ddifrif am y ffordd yr ydym yn rhedeg ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Bydd hyn yn dod yn fwyfwy pwysig wrth inni ddechrau edrych ar yr heriau a fydd yn wynebu ein cyllideb yn ystod y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod.

Mohammad Asghar: Diolch am y cyfle i siarad ar y mater hwn heddiw. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl hon yn fawr. Mae prosesau ar waith i holi a stilio ynghylch gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chraffu arno. Pa ffordd well sydd i wneud hynny na thrafod cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' y glymblaid pedair blynedd, a roddwyd ar waith i arwain y modd y caiff Cymru ei llywodraethu? Mae bron i dair blynedd ers i'r ddogfen gael ei llofnodi gan Rhodri Morgan a Ieuan Wyn Jones a llunio'r cytundeb. Yr oedd tri phrif amcan a gododd obeithion pobl. Yr amcanion hynny oedd gwella ansawdd bywyd pobl o bob cymuned; gweddnewid Cymru yn genedl hyderus, ffyniannus ac iach; a chreu Cymru y gallai pawb fod yn falch ohoni. Mae'n drueni, yn 2010, fod cynifer o ddangosyddion yn awgrymu nad yw cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn cyflawni ar gyfer Cymru.

O ran yr economi, yr oedd cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn hyrwyddo gweledigaeth o Gymru fel cenedl a chanddi economi gref a mentrus, ac yr oedd yn anelu at ffyniant economaidd ar gyfer pobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, wrth imi sefyll yma heddiw, mae diweithdra, yn anffodus, yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn yr un wlad arall yn y DU. Mae diweithdra yng Nghymru yn uwch heddiw nag a fu ers 15 mlynedd. Yn 2009, yr

any other OECD country.

Our rural economy is struggling and, as a result, many communities in rural areas are becoming less sustainable. Those are very worrying statements and no-one in this Chamber takes pride in them.

The 'One Wales' agreement also aimed to equip the people of Wales with the skills that they need to fulfil their individual potential, yet, in 2010, we have an alarming number of economically inactive people in Wales—around one in four adults of working age. This is not the sort of situation that was pledged in the 'One Wales' agreement.

On businesses, in my region of South Wales East, it is distressing to see the number of shops and offices that are boarded up as businesses continue to go to the wall. This is despite the fact that the 'One Wales' agreement aimed to encourage small and medium-sized businesses to thrive in Wales. Many businesses across Wales face significant and, in some cases, potentially crippling increases in business rates. That really is a worry.

On health, the 'One Wales' agreement aimed to provide a healthy future for all people in Wales and the target was a world-class health service for the nation. Yet, once again, the facts paint a very different picture. As we have mentioned on numerous occasions, estimates have suggested that as much as £1 billion of the health budget in Wales is being misspent year on year. Why is more not being done to investigate this claim? On stroke care, we have heard a leading expert describe the service in Wales as 'scandalously bad'. The list goes on. As has been mentioned, market experts have noted that the provision of dementia services in Wales is the worst in the United Kingdom. This is certainly not a world-class state of affairs. It is, on the contrary, a very worrying state of affairs.

oedd y gyfradd diweithdra yng Nghymru ymysg pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 19 oed yn uwch nag yn yr un wlad arall sy'n perthyn i'r Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd.

Mae ein heconomi wledig mewn trafferthion, ac o ganlyniad mae nifer o gymunedau mewn ardaloedd gwledig yn mynd yn llai cynaliadwy. Mae datganiadau o'r fath yn peri pryder mawr, ac nid oes neb yn y Siambr hon yn ymfalchïo ynnddynt.

Un o nodau eraill cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' oedd sicrhau bod gan bobl Cymru y sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i wireddu eu potensial unigol, ac eto, yn 2010, mae gennym nifer syfrdanol o bobl yng Nghymru sy'n anweithgar yn economaidd—oddeutu un o bob pedwar oedolyn o oed gweithio. Nid dyma'r math o sefyllfa a addawyd yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'.

O ran busnesau, yn fy rhanbarth i, sef Dwyrain De Cymru, mae'n dorcalonnus gweld y siopau a'r swyddfeydd niferus y mae eu ffenestri dan goed wrth i fusnesau fethu. Mae hynny er gwaetha'r ffaith i gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' geisio annog busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint i ffynnu yng Nghymru. Mae llawer o fusnesau ar draws Cymru yn wynebu cynnydd sylweddol mewn ardrethi busnes, a allai fod yn andwyol iawn mewn rhai achosion. Mae hynny'n peri pryder gwirioneddol.

O ran iechyd, nod cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' oedd darparu dyfodol iach i bawb yng Nghymru, a'r targed oedd sicrhau gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf i'r genedl. Eto i gyd, unwaith yn rhagor, mae'r ffeithiau'n paentio darlun gwahanol iawn. Fel yr ydym wedi crybwyll droeon, mae amcangyfrifon wedi awgrymu bod cymaint ag £1 biliwn o'r gyllideb iechyd yng Nghymru yn cael ei gamwario bob blwyddyn. Pam nad oes rhagor yn cael ei wneud i ymchwilio i'r honiad hwn? O ran gofal i bobl sydd wedi cael strôc, clywsom arbenigwr blaenllaw yn galw'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru yn gywilyddus. Mae'r rhestr yn ddi-ddiwedd. Fel y soniwyd eisoes, mae arbenigwyr yn y farchnad wedi nodi mai'r ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau demensia yng Nghymru yw'r ddarpariaeth waethaf yn y

Deyrnas Unedig. Nid yw'r hyn sydd gennym o'r radd flaenaf yn bendant. I'r gwrthwyneb, mae'n peri pryder aruthrol.

On tourism, the 'One Wales' agreement promised to develop tourism, as it is vital for job creation and economic prosperity, yet figures show that the number of tourists who are coming to Wales has declined since the 'One Wales' agreement was signed. The core spend of a little over £13 million is actually lower than it was in 1999. The Government has not delivered on its 'One Wales' pledge.

In conclusion, with such high unemployment, high levels of child poverty, a decline in the number of tourists coming to Wales, a troubled rural economy, and with major organisations like Bosch and Hoover shutting up shop, these are deeply disturbing times for Wales. This is certainly not a great achievement by the people who are not here today. They are supposed to be working for the sake of the people of Wales, but where are they today? They are probably enjoying time off rather than delivering a service for the people of Wales and finding the solutions to the problems that they have created. Labour has failed continuously during the last 13 years to deliver for this nation. It is about time that this nation saw some change. New policies need to be implemented to bring prosperity to this part of the world. I am grateful to you for listening; thank you.

Michael German: One of the funniest things about today and the position in which we find ourselves are the comments made by Plaid and Labour MPs when going in to Parliament, saying that they have to be there today because of the importance of the debate that is taking place about the budget. Therefore, that tells us that this debate about the future of Wales is of less significance to Plaid and Labour AMs. I have to tell the missing Members that this debate is crucial to the people of Wales, and it is crucial for all the reasons in the motion.

O ran twristiaeth, addawodd cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' ddatblygu twristiaeth, gan ei bod yn hanfodol i greu swyddi a ffyniant economaidd. Eto mae'r ffigurau'n dangos bod nifer y twristiaid sy'n dod i Gymru wedi gostwng ers llofnodi cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae'r gwariant craidd, sef ychydig dros £13 miliwn, yn is mewn gwirionedd nag ydoedd yn 1999. Nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi cyflawni ei addewid yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

I gloi, gyda diweithdra mor uchel, lefelau uchel o dlodi plant, gostyngiad yn nifer y twristiaid sy'n dod i Gymru, economi wledig sydd mewn trafferthion, a sefydliadau mawr megis Bosch a Hoover yn cau eu drysau, mae'r amseroedd hyn yn rhai cythryblus tu hwnt i Gymru. Yn sicr, nid yw'r hyn a gyflawnwyd gan y bobl nad ydynt yma heddiw yn orchest fawr. Dylent fod yn gweithio er lles pobl Cymru, ond ymhle y maent heddiw? Maent yn mwynhau amser i ffwrdd o'r gwaith, fwy na thebyg, yn hytrach na darparu gwasanaeth i bobl Cymru a chanfod atebion i'r problemau y maent wedi'u creu. Mae Llafur wedi methu'n gyson â chyflawni ar gyfer y genedl hon dros y 13 mlynedd diwethaf. Mae'n hen bryd i'r genedl hon weld ychydig newid. Mae angen gweithredu polisïau newydd i ddod â ffyniant i'r rhan hon o'r byd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am wrando, diolch.

Michael German: Un o'r pethau mwyaf digrif ynghylch heddiw, a'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi, yw'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Aelodau Seneddol Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur wrth fynd i mewn i Senedd y DU, pan ddywedasant ei bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yno heddiw oherwydd pwysigrwydd y ddadl sy'n digwydd ar y gyllideb. Felly, mae hynny'n dweud wrthym fod y ddadl hon ar ddyfodol Cymru yn llai pwysig i Aelodau Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur yn y Cynulliad. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth yr Aelodau sydd ar goll fod y ddadl hon yn hollbwysig i bobl Cymru, ac mae'n hollbwysig am yr holl resymau sydd yn y cynnig.

3.10 p.m.

One of the biggest criticisms that I have of the Government arises from the fact, which has largely gone unreported, that recent statistics from the European Commission show that Wales's gross domestic product in the Government's first year in office in Wales is less than 75 per cent of the European average. I want us to bear that important figure in mind because it is the tracking figure that gives us the maximum amount of European support—it has given us Objective 1 funding, and now gives us convergence funding. If the situation were repeated—and it is very likely to be repeated for the following year—we will qualify as one of the poorest countries in Europe again, and that is a very sad state of affairs indeed. The one thing that the people of Wales will look to us to do is to make sure that the economy is sound, that jobs are safe and that there is a future for them.

The significance of that is also measured—it is a small example, but it is of great significance to people that I represent—in the response to the issue of the tolls on the Severn bridge. We know that the bridges will revert to public ownership very soon. That is a UK-Government issue, but the effect of those tolls is felt by the economy of south Wales. When asked—the response is on record, and the Petitions Committee received the letter this week—whether he would start to build a case and to get the evidence of the impact of tolls on the economy of south Wales, the Deputy First Minister replied that it was a matter for the UK Government. The economy of Wales is a responsibility of the Government here as well, and it is one that it is shirking by not being present to answer this case today.

A secondary reason why the debate is important is that some of the projects and their funding have not necessarily hit real, front-end demand. I know that some Members are in favour of the air link, but think of the problem that we now face with regard to the Anglesey-to-Cardiff airport air link. No-one will bid for it at the price that the Welsh Assembly Government was prepared to offer, and so what will it do? Will it increase its offer? If so, will that be good value for money for the taxpayer? I doubt it. I

Mae un o'm beirniadaethau pennaf o'r Llywodraeth yn deillio o'r ffaith nad oes fawr ddim sylw wedi'i roi iddi, fod ystadegau diweddar o'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn dangos bod cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth Cymru, ym mlwyddyn gyntaf y Llywodraeth mewn grym yng Nghymru, yn llai na 75 y cant o'r cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf am inni gadw'r ffigur pwysig hwnnw mewn cof, oherwydd dyna'r ffigur olrhain sy'n rhoi'r cymorth Ewropeaidd mwyaf inni—mae wedi rhoi cyllid Amcan 1 inni, ac erbyn hyn mae'n rhoi cyllid cydgyfeirio inni. Pe bai'r sefyllfa'n cael ei hailadrodd—ac mae'n bur debygol y bydd yn cael ei hailadrodd yn ystod y flwyddyn sy'n dilyn—byddwn yn cael ein hystyried yn un o wledydd tlotaf Ewrop unwaith eto, ac mae hynny'n sefyllfa wirioneddol drist. Un peth y bydd pobl Cymru'n disgwyl inni ei wneud yw sicrhau bod yr economi'n gryf, bod swyddi'n ddiogel a bod dyfodol iddynt.

Caiff pwysigrwydd hynny ei fesur hefyd—mae'n enghraifft fach, ond mae'n bwysig iawn i bobl yr wyf fi'n eu cynrychioli—yn yr ymateb i fater y tollau ar bont Hafren. Gwyddom y bydd y pontydd yn dod yn eiddo cyhoeddus yn fuan iawn. Mae hynny'n fater i Lywodraeth y DU, ond mae economi'r de yn teimlo effaith y tollau hyn. Pan ofynnwyd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—mae'r ymateb wedi'i gofnodi, a chafodd y Pwyllgor Deisebau lythyr yr wythnos hon—a fyddai'n dechrau llunio achos a chasglu tystiolaeth am effaith y tollau ar economi'r de, atebodd mai mater i Lywodraeth y DU ydoedd. Mae economi Cymru'n gyfrifoldeb i'r Llywodraeth yma hefyd, ac mae'n gyfrifoldeb y mae'n ei osgoi wrth beidio â bod yn bresennol i ateb yr achos hwn heddiw.

Rheswm eilaidd pam mae'r ddadl hon yn bwysig yw nad yw rhai o'r prosiectau a'u cyllid wedi ymateb o reidrwydd i alw gwirioneddol yn y rheng flaen. Gwn fod rhai Aelodau o blaid yr awyrennau sy'n hedfan rhwng maes awyr Caerdydd ac Ynys Môn, ond ystyriwch y broblem a wynebwn yn awr o ran y cyswllt hwnnw. Ni fydd neb yn cynnig y pris yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn barod i'w gynnig amdano, felly, beth mae'n bwriadu ei wneud? A fydd yn cynnig pris uwch? Os felly, a fydd hynny'n

understand that the Welsh Assembly Government is now even considering leasing a helicopter. I cannot think of a suitable word that rhymes with 'chopper', but if someone can think of one, perhaps they could join the debate and tell me. You have to pay a fortune for a large helicopter that carries a significant number of people. If that will happen, it will become an even more elitist proposal. I see that you have an answer, Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns: I do not have an answer to that, but do you think that the remuneration body might be interested in looking at private jets for Government Ministers? Furthermore, do you think that the Government needs to be careful about who takes the decision in relation to the north-south air link, because of the potential for constituency-related and, might I add, personal interest and benefit with regard to that regular journey, financed through the use of public funds?

Michael German: The only thing with which I disagree is the use of the word 'jets'. I do not think that helicopters are jets, but I concur with everything else that you said.

Darren Millar *rose*—

Michael German: I will give way, as I am waiting for someone to give me an answer.

Darren Millar: Would you agree that, if an air link were to continue, it would be far better to link the city of Liverpool with Cardiff as that would be of great benefit to the majority of people in north Wales in respect of easier access? It is an international airport, which would provide the additional benefit of linking Cardiff with international businesses.

Michael German: There are two serious points in this regard—well, one is less serious, namely that Liverpool ought to be annexed by Wales, as we would then have a great city in the north as well. The much more sensible answer to your intervention is

werth da am yr arian i'r trethdalwr? Mae'n amheus gennyf. Deallaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd yn oed yn ystyried cymryd hofrennydd ar brydles erbyn hyn. Ni allaf feddwl am air addas sy'n odli gyda 'chopper', ond os gall rhywrai feddwl am un, mae croeso iddynt ymuno â'r ddadl a dweud wrthyf. Mae hofrennydd mawr sy'n cario nifer sylweddol o bobl yn costio ffortiwn. Os bydd hynny'n digwydd, bydd yn gynnig sydd hyd yn oed yn fwy elitaidd. Gwelaf fod gennyh ateb, Alun Cairns.

Alun Cairns: Nid oes gennyf ateb i hynny, ond a ydych yn credu y gallai fod gan y corff taliadau ddiddordeb mewn ystyried jetiau preifat i Weinidogion y Llywodraeth? Yn ogystal, a ydych yn credu bod angen i'r Llywodraeth fod yn ofalus pwy sy'n penderfynu'r cyswllt awyr rhwng y gogledd a'r de, oherwydd y posibilrwydd y gallai'r daith reolaidd honno arwain at fudd yn gysylltiedig ag etholaeth, ac os caf ychwanegu, mantais a budd personol, yn cael eu hariannu drwy ddefnyddio arian cyhoeddus?

Michael German: Yr unig beth yr wyf yn anghytuno ag ef yw'r modd y defnyddiwyd y gair 'jetiau'. Ni chredaf fod hofrennyddion yn jetiau, ond cytunaf â phopeth arall a ddywedaso.

Darren Millar *a gododd*—

Michael German: Yr wyf yn fodlon ildio, oherwydd yr wyf yn aros i rywun ateb fy nghwestiwn.

Darren Millar: Pe bai'r cyswllt awyr yn parhau, a fyddech yn cytuno y byddai'n well o lawer cysylltu dinas Lerpwl â Chaerdydd, oherwydd byddai hynny'n fantais fawr i fwyafrif y bobl yn y gogledd o ran hwyluso mynediad? Mae'n faes awyr rhyngwladol, a fyddai'n dod â'r budd ychwanegol o gysylltu Caerdydd â busnesau rhyngwladol.

Michael German: Mae yna ddau bwynt difrifol yn y cyswllt hwn—wel, mae un yn llai difrifol, sef y pwynt y dylid cydio Lerpwl wrth Gymru, oherwydd byddai gennym ddinas ardderchog yn y gogledd wedyn hefyd. Yr ateb llawer mwy synhwyrol i'ch

that we must restrict our use of air travel if we are to ensure that there is a sustainable future for our children and our children's children, and if we are to reduce carbon emissions.

I will now turn to the second of my key criticisms of the Government, which is that it is not able to hit its target on affordable housing. I looked up the words in the 'One Wales' agreement again. It states that the One Wales Government will ensure that,

'The supply of affordable housing in Wales increases by at least 6,500 units.'

To me, that means that 6,500 more affordable homes will be built and delivered by the middle of next year. However, the reality is that the number being taken out of the affordable homes network means that the Government will never achieve that target. That was a way of spinning a solution to the people of Wales that was inaccurate. Being so grossly inaccurate will offend those people looking for a home, those who cannot afford to buy one, those who seek a route towards being able to buy one and those who are in desperate need of a home, but find that there is no provision. Admittedly, there will be an increase, but that will not be according to the numbers that the Government suggested. That housing target will be missed, which I regret. We have been misled by a number of the issues relating to the Welsh Government's programme. It would be wise for us to have the opportunity to speak directly to those Ministers who are responsible in order to hold them to account, and primarily to hold them to account for the damage that is being done to our Welsh economy by them not taking the appropriate action to ensure that people's jobs are safe, that business thrives and that we have a sustainable economy in Wales.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate, albeit in strange circumstances. Many colleagues have talked about the situation in which they find themselves today and I am sure that the public will look at this with a degree of

ymyriad yw ei bod yn rhaid inni gyfyngu'r defnyddio awyrennau os ydym i sicrhau dyfodol cynaliadwy i'n plant a phlant ein plant, ac os ydym i leihau allyriadau carbon.

Trof yn awr at fy ail feirniadaeth allweddol o'r Llywodraeth, sef nad yw'n gallu cyrraedd ei tharged ar gyfer tai fforddiadwy. Chwiliais am y geiriau yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' unwaith eto. Mae'n dweud y bydd Llywodraeth 'Cymru'n Un' yn sicrhau y bydd,

'cynnydd o 6,500 o leiaf yn y cyflenwad o dai fforddiadwy yn ystod y pedair blynedd nesaf.'

I mi, golyga hynny y bydd 6,500 yn rhagor o dai fforddiadwy'n cael eu hadeiladu a'u darparu erbyn canol y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, y realiti yw bod y nifer a dynnir allan o'r rhwydwaith tai fforddiadwy'n golygu na fydd y Llywodraeth byth yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Yr oedd honno'n ffordd o gynnig ateb anghywir i bobl Cymru. Bydd bod mor afresymol o anghywir yn tramgwyddo'r bobl hynny sy'n chwilio am gartref, y sawl na allant fforddio prynu cartref, y sawl sy'n chwilio am ffordd o allu prynu cartref, a'r sawl y mae taer angen cartref arnynt ond sy'n gweld nad oes darpariaeth ar eu cyfer. Rhaid cyfaddef y gwelir cynnydd, ond ni fydd yn unol â'r niferoedd a awgrymodd y Llywodraeth. Bydd y Llywodraeth yn methu â chyrraedd ei tharged ar gyfer tai, ac yr wyf yn gresynu at hynny. Yr ydym wedi ein camarwain gan nifer o'r problemau'n gysylltiedig â rhaglen Llywodraeth Cymru. Byddai'n ddoeth inni gael cyfle i siarad yn uniongyrchol â'r Gweinidogion hynny sy'n gyfrifol er mwyn eu dwyn i gyfrif, yn bennaf am y niwed a wneir i'r economi yng Nghymru am nad ydynt yn cymryd y camau gweithredu priodol i sicrhau bod swyddi pobl yn ddiogel, bod busnes yn ffynnu a bod gennym economi gynaliadwy yng Nghymru.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon, er bod hynny mewn amgylchiadau rhyfedd. Mae nifer o gydweithwyr wedi sôn am y sefyllfa y maent ynddi heddiw, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y cyhoedd yn edrych braidd yn syfrdan arni. Yr

bemusement. What worries me greatly about today's events—and we all subscribe to one's right to strike, if one feels strongly enough about it—is that there is an element of arrogance in the Government not attending Plenary today. Many other legislatures across the UK, because we live in an era of devolution, are managing to function and carry out day-to-day business. It is crucially important that if we are to have robust public services that deliver, the opposition parties' debates and their scrutiny of the Government can be undertaken and that the Government does not withdraw from debating the business of the day.

My concern is that the more I speak to Government backbenchers and Ministers, because of their thumping majority here via the 'One Wales' agreement, the more I think that they have a degree of disdain and that three years of Government allow them to regard the democratic process disdainfully. When people look at the Chamber today and see the empty chairs and that the Government is not prepared to come here to be held to account on the delivery of the 'One Wales' agreement, they will say that that is arrogant and they will, above all, ask the First Minister where is the *chwarae teg* that he talked about when he came into office—where is that sense of fair play and justice for people?

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Andrew R.T. Davies: By all means.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to you for giving way. Do you agree that this situation demonstrates how out of touch the Labour Party and Plaid Cymru are? People want to be governed and need to be led, and this goes to show that they simply do not care because they think that they are greater and more important than ordinary members of the public, which is so wrong.

Andrew R.T. Davies: I could not agree more with my colleague, Alun Cairns, on that

hyn sy'n fy mhoeni'n fawr am y digwyddiadau heddiw—ac yr ydym i gyd yn cefnogi hawl pobl i fynd ar streic, os oes ganddynt deimladau digon cryf am rywbeth—yw'r elfen o haerllugrwydd yn absenoldeb y Llywodraeth o'r Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw. Mae llawer o ddeddfwrfeydd eraill ar draws y DU, gan ein bod yn byw mewn oes o ddatganoli, yn llwyddo i weithredu a chyflawni eu busnes o ddydd i ddydd. Os ydym am gael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus cadarn sy'n gallu cyflawni ar gyfer pobl, mae'n hollbwysig fod modd cynnal dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau a bod modd iddynt graffu ar y Llywodraeth, ac nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn cilio rhag trafod busnes y dydd.

Po fwyaf y siaradaf â Gweinidogion ac aelodau o feinciau cefn y Llywodraeth, oherwydd eu mwyafrif llethol yma trwy gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', mwyaf oll y credaf eu bod braidd yn ddirmygus, a bod tair blynedd o fod mewn Llywodraeth wedi caniatáu iddynt fagu agwedd ddirmygus at y broses ddemocrataidd, ac yr wyf yn pryderu am hynny. Pan fydd pobl yn edrych ar y Siambr heddiw ac yn gweld y seddau gwag, a'r ffaith nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn barod i ddod yma i gael ei dwyn i gyfrif yng nghyswllt cyflawni cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un', byddant yn dweud bod hynny'n haerllug, a byddant yn anad dim yn gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog ble mae'r chwarae teg y soniai amdano pan ddechreuodd ar ei swydd—ble mae'r ymdeimlad hwnnw o chwarae teg a chyfiawnder i bobl?

Alun Cairns: A wnewch chi ildio?

Andrew R.T. Davies: Wrth gwrs.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. A ydych yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa hon yn dangos y graddau y mae'r Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru wedi colli cysylltiad â phobl? Mae pobl am gael eu llywodraethu ac mae angen iddynt gael eu harwain, ac mae hyn yn dangos, yn syml iawn, nad yw pleidiau'r Llywodraeth yn poeni, oherwydd credant eu bod yn uwch ac yn bwysicach na'r cyhoedd cyffredin, sydd mor anghywir.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Ni allwn gytuno mwy â'm cydweithiwr, Alun Cairns, ar y pwynt

point, and that might not be surprising, but what also emphasises the arrogance of this Government is the fact that, if this strike situation continues, it has stated that it will have to look at other avenues to get around the strike. Yet, the First Minister in a press conference yesterday said that not crossing a picket line was ingrained in Labour thinking. That goes to show that if the situation develops, they are prepared to consider condescending to come here as a Government with a thumping majority.

It is a damning indictment of their arrogance—the arrogance that was emphasised last week in three key events in the Chamber. The first was the Glastir debate, which is about radical reform of the support for the rural economy. The First Minister on his platform for leadership talked about reaching across the Loughor to try to embrace all parts of Wales, and yet not one Labour Member spoke in that debate.

3.20 p.m.

In questions last Wednesday to the Minister for Environment, Sustainability and Housing, only one Labour Member asked a supplementary question, and, in questions on rural affairs, only one Labour Member had tabled a question and one supplementary question was taken. That shows the level of engagement—or disengagement—and the arrogance of the Government of Carwyn Jones, and shows little of the *chwarae teg* that we were promised when he took office.

When we consider the developments, or lack of developments, in the health service and the betrayal of the dedication of the staff within that service, one can only despair that, once again, in a debate as important as this, not one Minister has turned up to respond. We have tabled questions and have asked for statement upon statement from the Minister for Budget and Business, but she fails to offer any solution or any insight into the direction that the Government is taking via the NHS in Wales. We were offered the reorganisation as a solution to many of the problems of the

hwnnw, ac efallai nad yw hynny'n syndod. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd hefyd yn pwysleisio haerllugrwydd y Llywodraeth hon yw'r ffaith iddi ddweud, os bydd y sefyllfa hon o streicio'n parhau, y bydd yn rhaid iddi ystyried ffyrdd eraill i ymdopi â'r streic. Eto i gyd, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog mewn cynhadledd i'r wasg ddoe fod peidio â chroesi llinell biced yn rhan annatod o feddylfryd y Blaid Lafur. Dengys hynny, os bydd y sefyllfa'n datblygu, eu bod yn barod i ystyried ymostwng i ddod yma fel Llywodraeth sydd â mwyafrif llethol.

Mae'n gyhuddiad damniol o'u haerllugrwydd—yr haerllugrwydd a bwysleisiwyd yr wythnos diwethaf mewn tri digwyddiad allweddol yn y Siambr. Y digwyddiad cyntaf oedd y ddadl ynghylch Glastir, sy'n ymwneud â diwygio'n radical y cymorth a roddir i'r economi wledig. Wrth frwydro am yr arweinyddiaeth, soniodd y Prif Weinidog am ymestyn ar draws afon Llwchwr i geisio cynnwys pob rhan o Gymru, ac eto, ni siaradodd yr un Aelod Llafur yn y ddadl honno.

Mewn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynaliadwyedd a Thai ddydd Mercher diwethaf, un Aelod Llafur yn unig a ofynnodd gwestiwn atodol, ac yn y cwestiynau ar faterion gwledig un Aelod Llafur yn unig a oedd wedi cyflwyno cwestiwn a chymerwyd un cwestiwn atodol. Dengys hynny lefel yr ymgysylltiad—neu'r ymddieithriad—a haerllugrwydd Llywodraeth Carwyn Jones, ac nid yw'n dangos fawr ddim o'r *chwarae teg* a addawyd inni pan ddaeth i'r swydd.

Pan ystyriwn y datblygiadau, neu'r diffyg datblygiadau, yn y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r modd y bradychwyd ymroddiad y staff yn y gwasanaeth hwnnw, nid oes dim y gallwn ei wneud ond anobeithio ynghylch y ffaith nad oes yr un Gweinidog wedi dod yma i ymateb, unwaith eto, mewn dadl mor bwysig â hon. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno cwestiynau ac wedi gofyn am ddatganiad ar ôl datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb, ond nid yw'n cynnig ateb na goleuni pellach ar y cyfeiriad y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei gymryd o ran y GIG yng Nghymru. Cynigiwyd yr

NHS, when, in fact, we have had to go through that reorganisation because of the debacle that many of the Ministers in office in the early 2000s inflicted upon the NHS in Wales. They are merely rectifying their mistakes.

The target of a 26-week referral time for treatment has been missed. This was a key plank of the 'One Wales' agreement. The number of people waiting longer than the 14-week referral time target has escalated massively, with over 10,000 people now waiting. There has been a 24,000 per cent increase in waiting times since this time last year. Those figures are unbelievable, but they are contained in the Government's statistics. However, not one Government Minister has chosen to respond to the situation in which people find themselves in the Welsh NHS.

In relation to the morale of staff in the NHS, and the training programmes that should be in place so that we can develop a sustainable health service, time and again the Royal College of Nursing, the representatives of the workforce, cry out for support from the One Wales Government but they are given short shrift. Executives are employed in jobs that no longer exist in the NHS, but nurses on temporary contracts are not having their contracts renewed and specialist nurses are unable to access training to develop their careers. Do people pay their taxes to have the health service run in such a way in Wales? I do not think so.

In the constituency of my colleague Nick Ramsay, 43 per cent of emergency ambulance responses are within the agreed eight-minute target. That is not because of those working in the ambulance service but because of the lack of direction, lack of leadership and lack of support that this Government is prepared to offer.

In social care, we have championed a debate on dementia. I can see the Presiding Officer asking me to wind up, but I would like to

ad-drefnu inni fel ateb i lawer o broblemau'r GIG, ond mewn gwirionedd, bu'n rhaid inni fynd drwy'r ad-drefnu hwnnw oherwydd y chwalfa a achosodd llawer o'r Gweinidogion a oedd yn eu swyddi ar ddechrau'r ganrif hon i'r GIG yng Nghymru. Dim ond cywiro eu camgymeriadau y maent.

Ni chyrrhaeddwyd y targed o gyfeirio cleifion am driniaeth cyn pen 26 wythnos. Yr oedd hon yn elfen allweddol yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros mwy na'r targed o 14 wythnos i gael eu cyfeirio am driniaeth wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol, ac erbyn hyn mae dros 10,000 o bobl yn aros. Bu cynnydd o 24,000 y cant mewn amseroedd aros ers yr adeg hon y llynedd. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n anghredadwy, ond maent wedi eu cynnwys yn ystadegau'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, nid oes yr un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth wedi dewis ymateb i'r sefyllfa y mae pobl yn cael eu hunain ynddi yn y GIG yng Nghymru.

O ran morâl y staff yn y GIG, a'r rhaglenni hyfforddiant a ddylai fod ar waith er mwyn inni allu datblygu gwasanaeth iechyd cynaliadwy, dro ar ôl tro, mae'r Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol, cynrychiolwyr y gweithlu, yn galw am gefnogaeth gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un ond ni chânt lawer o drugaredd ganddi. Mae swyddogion gweithredol yn cael eu cyflogi mewn swyddi nad ydynt yn bodoli bellach yn y GIG, ond nid yw contractau nyrsys sydd ar gontractau dros dro yn cael eu hadnewyddu ac ni all nyrsys arbenigol gael mynediad i hyfforddiant i ddatblygu eu gyrfaoedd. A yw pobl yn talu eu trethi er mwyn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gael ei redeg fel hyn yng Nghymru? Nid wyf yn credu eu bod.

Yn etholaeth fy nghydweithiwr, Nick Ramsay, 43 y cant o ymatebion brys gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n cyrraedd y targed o wyth munud y cytunwyd arno. Nid y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans sydd ar fai am hynny ond yn hytrach, y diffyg cyfeiriad, y diffyg arweinyddiaeth a'r diffyg cefnogaeth y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn barod i'w cynnig.

Ym maes gofal cymdeithasol, yr ydym wedi hyrwyddo dadl ar ddemensia. Gallaf weld y Llywydd yn gofyn imi dynnu at y terfyn, ond

execute this part of my speech relating to dementia. The silence from the Government bench is the silence heard by those who have come to the Assembly to seek answers regarding dementia care. When we have asked about that dementia plan, we have been told that we are no nearer to getting it. It is a Government of inaction, of a lack of fair play, and there is no Minister here to respond. Where is your *chwarae teg*, Carwyn Jones?

Darren Millar: I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this important debate this afternoon. We are just over 12 months away from the next Assembly elections, which is an opportune time to look at the record of the One Wales Government. We all remember that the 'One Wales' agreement was announced with great fanfare, and all sorts of promises are contained within it. In fact, there are over 200 bullet points beginning with the phrase 'We will'. I suppose that, at the time, the Government felt that it was worth making a fuss about. However, it did not start so well and, unfortunately, the rhetoric has now worn pretty thin.

The delivery does not measure up to the promises. We do not think that it does, and this is not just our opinion. The evidence strongly indicates that, across the board, the 'One Wales' agreement is failing the people of Wales. I would like to highlight a few specific issues that are a fair representation of the concerns and experiences regularly raised with me by my constituents. I am sure that these will strike a chord across Wales and with the Members who are here today. Take public transport, for example, and bus services specifically. 'One Wales' makes a clear commitment, in that it states:

'We will use new powers for local authorities to plan and support new bus routes to improve links between communities.'

The sounds great, but, in reality, if there is any support for new bus routes, it is at the expense of existing routes, which are cut. For example, the bus service along the A5, which traverses my constituency, linking the honey

hoffwn orffen y rhan hon o'm haraith ar ddemensia. Y distawrwydd o fainc y Llywodraeth yw'r distawrwydd a glywir gan y bobl sydd wedi dod i'r Cynulliad i geisio atebion am ofal demensia. Wrth ofyn am y cynllun demensia hwnnw, dywedwyd wrthym nad ydym gam yn nes at ei gael. Llywodraeth o ddiffyg gweithredu, ac o ddiffyg chwarae teg yw hi, ac nid oes yr un Gweinidog yma i ymateb. Ble mae eich chwarae teg chi, Carwyn Jones?

Darren Millar: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl bwysig hon y prynhawn yma. Ychydig dros 12 mis sydd tan etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad, ac mae'n amser hwylus i edrych ar berfformiad Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Yr ydym i gyd yn cofio bod cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' wedi ei gyhoeddi gyda ffanffer fawr, ac mae pob math o addewidion wedi eu cynnwys ynddo. A dweud y gwir, mae dros 200 o bwyntiau bwled yn dechrau â'r cymal 'Byddwn yn'. Mae'n debyg bod y Llywodraeth yn teimlo'i bod yn werth codi stŵr yn ei gylch ar y pryd. Fodd bynnag, ni ddechreuodd yn dda, ac yn anffodus mae'r rhethreg, erbyn hyn, wedi troi'n hen diwn gron.

Nid yw'r hyn a gyflawnwyd yn cyflawni'r addewidion. Ni chredwn ei fod, ac nid ein barn ni yn unig yw hynny. Mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos yn gryf fod cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yn siomi pobl Cymru yn gyffredinol. Hoffwn dynnu sylw at rai materion penodol sy'n gynrychiolaeth deg o'r pryderon a'r profiadau y bydd fy etholwyr yn eu codi gyda mi yn rheolaidd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y rhain yn taro tant ledled Cymru a chyda'r Aelodau sydd yma heddiw. Cymerwch drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus, er enghraifft, a gwasanaethau bysiau yn arbennig. Mae 'Cymru'n Un' yn gwneud ymrwymiad clir, wrth ddweud:

'Byddwn yn defnyddio pwerau newydd i awdurdodau lleol gynllunio a chefnogi teithiau bysiau newydd i wella cysylltiadau rhwng cymunedau.'

Mae'n swnio'n wych, ond mewn gwirionedd os oes cefnogaeth ar gyfer teithiau bysiau newydd, mae ar draul teithiau presennol, sy'n cael eu torri. Er enghraifft, torrwyd y gwasanaeth bws ar hyd yr A5, sy'n croesi fy

pots of Llangollen and Betws-y-Coed for the tourist trade up to Llandudno via the A470, has been cut, massively damaging the rural community that was so well served by that bus service. I received hundreds of representations from constituents regarding those cuts. That is not the fulfilment of the promise to use new powers to plan and support new bus routes. It is a worrying trend.

Another thing that strikes me when reading through the 'One Wales' agreement is this commitment to support the development of community schools. Now, I have to be honest, never before have so many small schools been under threat of closure as there are at this very moment in time under the One Wales Government. What commitment is that to supporting the development of community schools? We have Plaid in Government here, and yet it is Plaid that is putting forward proposals in Anglesey, Gwynedd, Conwy—where it has a cabinet member—and Denbighshire to close community schools. It is not a consistent picture at all.

Against this backdrop, there is a promise of investment in school buildings. There is a commitment to exceed the sums provided over the previous four years and a strategy to promote the retention of school playing fields. They offer to exceed the sums provided, but in the budget for the next financial year, the school buildings maintenance grant will be cut by a third. School playing fields are under threat in my constituency, in the town of Abergele. It is absolutely barmy, and I greatly hope that the proposed school playing fields Measure that will be brought before us in the not too distant future will make some progress in trying to deal with that issue. This is to be brought forward by a backbencher, and not the Government. The One Wales Government is not fulfilling its commitments.

On other rural services, there was a promise of investment in and refurbishment of our public library network. Yes, some libraries are receiving some investment and being refurbished, such as the one in my

etholaeth, gan gysylltu Llangollen a Betws-y-Coed, sy'n botiau mêl i'r fasnach ymwelwyr, â Llandudno ar hyd yr A470, gan niweidio'n aruthrol y gymuned wledig a oedd yn cael cystal gwasanaeth gan y gwasanaeth bws hwnnw. Cefais gannoedd o gwynion gan etholwyr am y toriadau hynny. Nid yw hynny'n gwireddu'r addewid i ddefnyddio pwerau newydd i gynllunio a chefnogi teithiau bysiau newydd. Mae'n duedd sy'n peri pryder.

Rhywbeth arall sy'n fy nharo wrth ddarllen cytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' yw'r ymrwymiad hwn i gefnogi datblygu ysgolion cymunedol. Yn awr, rhaid imi fod yn onest, ni fu erioed cynifer o ysgolion bach yn wynebu'r bygythiad o gael eu cau ag sy'n wynebu'r bygythiad hwnnw'n awr dan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un. Pa ymrwymiad yw hynny i gefnogi datblygu ysgolion cymunedol? Mae Plaid Cymru'n rhan o'r Llywodraeth yma, ac eto Plaid Cymru sy'n cyflwyno cynigion ar Ynys Môn, yng Ngwynedd, Conwy—lle mae ganddi aelod o'r cabinet—a Sir Ddinbych i gau ysgolion cymunedol. Nid yw'n ddarlun cyson o gwbl.

Yn y cefndir hwn, mae yna addewid i fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgol. Mae ymrwymiad i ddarparu mwy na'r symiau a ddarparwyd dros y pedair blynedd blaenorol a strategaeth i hybu cadw meysydd chwarae ysgolion. Maent yn cynnig rhoi mwy na'r symiau a ddarparwyd, ond yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf bydd y grant cynnal a chadw adeiladau ysgol yn cael ei dorri o draean. Mae meysydd chwarae ysgolion dan fygythiad yn fy etholaeth, yn nhref Abergele. Mae'n gwbl wallgof, a gobeithio'n fawr y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig ynghylch meysydd chwarae ysgolion a gaiff ei gyflwyno ger ein bron yn y dyfodol agos yn gwneud rhywfaint o gynnydd i geisio ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw. Aelod o'r fainc gefn fydd yn ei gyflwyno, nid y Llywodraeth. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un yn cyflawni ei hymrwymadau.

O ran gwasanaethau gwledig eraill, cafwyd addewid i fuddsoddi yn ein rhwydwaith llyfrgelloedd cyhoeddus a'u hailwampio. Oes, mae rhai llyfrgelloedd yn cael rhywfaint o fuddsoddiad ac yn cael eu hailwampio,

constituency in Abergele, but it is at the expense of other libraries being closed, and at the expense of mobile library services being cut in rural parts of my constituency. Again, it is the rural parts of Wales that are losing out most at the hands of the One Wales Government in the delivery of its promises, or what it says it is delivering. Libraries in Colwyn Bay and Abergele have received some investment, but others have been cut.

Towards the end, the agreement refers to businesses and the economy under a heading that says 'Placing Wales in the World', where we find the following sentence:

'When information flows around the globe in nano-seconds...it no longer matters if your desk is in Hirwaen or Honolulu, Snowdonia or Singapore'.

Is that not a wonderful statement? It makes me wonder whether the members of the Labour/Plaid coalition have ever actually visited some of the rural towns and villages in my constituency—places such as Gwytherin, Moelfre, or Gwyddelwern, where there are still homes that cannot get access to broadband, because of this One Wales Government's failure to deliver on its commitment to deal with broadband not spots. That is absolutely outrageous. We have seen failure after failure, and all we hear is Carwyn Jones, when he bothers to turn up to this Chamber, trumpeting that he is delivering on these 'One Wales' commitments. Well, we have a message for you, Carwyn: you are not, and neither is your sidekick in the separatist party, Ieuan Wyn Jones. We need to see delivery against this agreement. There are some noble commitments therein, many of them pinched from our manifesto, and we would commend them to the Assembly, but you have to make progress instead of breaking your promises.

Mark Isherwood: Through thick and thin, representative democracy must keep functioning for all. Today's absence of the parties in Welsh Government starkly illustrates why Wales is in the mess it is. Their immature, irresponsible, and

megis yr un yn fy etholaeth i, yn Abergele, ond mae hyn ar draul cau llyfrgelloedd eraill, ac ar draul gwasanaethau llyfrgelloedd teithiol sy'n cael eu torri mewn rhannau gwledig o'm hetholaeth. Eto, ardaloedd gwledig Cymru sydd fwyaf ar eu colled dan law Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un a'r ffordd y mae'n cyflawni ei haddewidion, neu'r hyn y mae'n dweud y mae'n ei gyflawni. Mae llyfrgelloedd ym Mae Colwyn ac Abergele wedi cael rhywfaint o fuddsoddiad, ond mae rhai eraill wedi cael eu torri.

Tua'r diwedd, mae'r cytundeb yn cyfeirio at fusnesau a'r economi dan bennawd sy'n dweud 'Rhoi Cymru ar Lwyfan y Byd', lle gwelwn y frawddeg ganlynol:

'Mewn oes lle mae gwybodaeth yn teithio o gwmpas y byd mewn nano-eiliadau, nid oes gwahaniaeth a yw eich desg yn Hirwaun neu Honolulu, Singapore neu Splott'.

Onid yw hwnnw'n ddatganiad hyfryd? Mae'n gwneud imi ofyn a yw aelodau clymblaid Llafur/Plaid Cymru erioed wedi ymweld â rhai o'r trefi a'r pentrefi gwledig yn fy etholaeth i—lleoedd megis Gwytherin, Moelfre neu Gwyddelwern, lle mae cartrefi o hyd sy'n methu â cael band eang, oherwydd methiant y Llywodraeth Cymru'n Un hon i gyflawni ei hymrwymiad i ymdrin â manau gwan ar gyfer derbyn band eang. Mae hynny'n hollol warthus. Yr ydym wedi gweld methiant ar ôl methiant, a'r cyfan a glywn yw Carwyn Jones, pan fydd yn trafferthu dod i'r Siambr hon, yn dweud ei fod yn cyflawni'r ymrwymadau hyn yn 'Cymru'n Un'. Wel, mae gennym neges ichi, Carwyn: nid ydych yn eu cyflawni, ac nid yw eich partner yn y blaid ymwahanol, Ieuan Wyn Jones, ychwaith yn eu cyflawni. Mae angen inni weld cyflawni pethau yn erbyn y cytundeb hwn. Mae ynddo ymrwymadau ardderchog, lawer ohonynt wedi eu bachu o'n maniffesto ni, a byddem yn eu cymeradwyo i'r Cynulliad, ond rhaid ichi wneud cynnydd yn hytrach na thorri eich addewidion.

Mark Isherwood: Er gwaethaf popeth, rhaid i ddemocratiaeth gynrychiadol barhau i weithredu i bawb. Mae absenoldeb y pleidiau sy'n rhan o Lywodraeth Cymru heddiw yn dangos yn glir pam mae Cymru yn y fath lanastr. Maent wedi bradychu pobl Cymru yn

ideological impersonation of Government has grossly betrayed the people of Wales and grossly misused the billions in public funds that have been entrusted to them.

ofnadwy gyda'u dynwarediad anaeddfed, anghyfrifol ac ideolegol o Lywodraeth ac wedi camddefnyddio'n ofnadwy y biliynau o bunnoedd o arian cyhoeddus sydd wedi eu hymddiried iddynt.

3.30 p.m.

Opinion polls indicate majority support for the Assembly but that most people in Wales still do not know what the Assembly is responsible for, or that the Welsh Government and the National Assembly for Wales are different. As such, Labour and Plaid Cymru in Government get away with political murder because they are not being blamed for the multiple failings for which they are responsible.

Mae polau piniwn yn dangos cefnogaeth fwyafrifol i'r Cynulliad ond nad yw mwyafrif y bobl yng Nghymru yn gwybod o hyd am beth mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfrifol, na bod Llywodraeth Cymru a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn wahanol. O ganlyniad, mae'r Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru yn y Llywodraeth yn cael gwneud fel y mynnant yn wleidyddol oherwydd nad ydynt yn cael y bai am y methiannau niferus y maent yn gyfrifol amdanynt.

Wales has the lowest prosperity levels of the 12 UK nations or regions, and the gap is widening. Working-age unemployment and record levels of economic inactivity in Wales total 557,000 people: one in three of the population. Youth unemployment is at the highest level since records began.

Cymru sydd â'r lefelau ffyniant isaf o 12 cenedl neu ranbarth y DU, ac mae'r bwlch yn lledu. Mae nifer y bobl sydd o oedran gweithio ac sy'n ddi-waith a'r nifer uchaf erioed o bobl sy'n anweithgar yn economaidd yn dod i gyfanswm o 557,000 o bobl yng Nghymru: un o bob tri o'r boblogaeth. Mae diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc ar y lefel uchaf ers dechrau cadw cofnodion.

Communities First is the Welsh Government's flagship programme to tackle deprivation. However, the Wales Audit Office review of Communities First stated that the programme had emerged from chaos, it was not planned, that there was an absence of basic financial and human resource planning before the programme was launched, and bids were therefore not assessed properly. In the private sector, they would be sacking offences. Almost £0.25 billion of public money later, we should therefore not be surprised at the Wales Audit Office report detailing waste and worse.

Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yw rhaglen flaenllaw Llywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd. Fodd bynnag, nododd adolygiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru o Gymunedau yn Gyntaf fod y rhaglen wedi dod i fodolaeth o anhrefn, nad oedd wedi'i chynllunio, a bod diffyg cynllunio sylfaenol o ran arian ac adnoddau dynol cyn i'r rhaglen gael ei lansio, ac o ganlyniad, ni chafodd cynigion eu hasesu'n iawn. Yn y sector preifat, byddent yn droseddau a fyddai'n arwain at ddiswyddo rhywun. Ar ôl gwario bron i £0.25 biliwn o arian cyhoeddus, ni ddylem synnu, felly, wrth ddarllen adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru sy'n sôn am wastraff a gwaeth.

Wales suffers the highest rate of children living in severe poverty in the UK: 96,000. This has occurred against a backdrop of rising levels of overall child poverty affecting 192,000 children in Wales: one in three. Labour's pledge to halve child poverty in Wales by 2010 is now in tatters, and income inequality has reached the highest level since

Cymru sydd â'r gyfradd uchaf o blant yn byw mewn tlodi difrifol yn y DU: 96,000. Mae hyn wedi digwydd yn erbyn cefndir o lefelau cynyddol o dlodi plant cyffredinol sy'n effeithio ar 192,000 o blant yng Nghymru: un o bob tri. Mae addewid y Blaid Lafur i haneru tlodi plant yng Nghymru erbyn 2010 bellach yn gareiau, ac mae anghydraddoldeb

records began. Nearly a quarter of households in Wales, 320,000, experience fuel poverty. Last winter, excess winter deaths in Wales rose by 74 per cent to 2,500, and are forecast to have risen again this winter.

Homes for Cymru has said that we have a crisis in Wales. This is not a new crisis, although the economic crisis is making it worse. Since devolution, this Welsh Government has cut the number of new affordable homes by two thirds, and housing faces a funding black hole, with capital spending cut by 25 per cent.

The Welsh Conservatives' motion, backed by the Liberal Democrats, calling on the UK Labour Government to stop its post office closure programme in Wales was defeated by Plaid Cymru and Labour Assembly Members—the same ones standing outside purporting to be fighting the UK Government but, in this place, always voting to support it.

Mohammad Asghar: Do you not think that the people on the other side of the Chamber, who are not here, are paid to do the job of serving the nation and solving its problems? However, they are hiding behind the staff of this organisation, and are not solving problems but creating more.

Mark Isherwood: Absolutely. It shows gross political immaturity and huge personal irresponsibility.

In Essex, serving a population of 1.4 million, the Conservative county council has committed to spend up to £1.5 million over three years to support a viable post office network and to reopen post offices closed by Labour's closure programme where there is community support, community need, and suitable premises. If Essex can do it with half the population of Wales, why can Wales not?

We must liberate the true potential of charities and social enterprises in tackling the

incwm wedi cyrraedd y lefel uchaf ers dechrau cadw cofnodion. Mae tlodi tanwydd yn effeithio ar bron i chwarter o aelwydydd Cymru, sef 320,000. Y gaeaf diwethaf, cynyddodd marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf yng Nghymru 74 y cant i 2,500, a rhagwelir y byddant wedi cynyddu eto'r gaeaf hwn.

Mae Cartrefi i Gymru wedi dweud ei bod yn argyfwng arnom yng Nghymru. Nid argyfwng newydd mohono, er bod yr argyfwng economaidd yn ei waethygu. Ers datganoli, mae'r Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru wedi torri nifer y tai fforddiadwy newydd o ddau draean, ac mae tai yn faes sy'n wynebu twll du o ran ariannu, wrth i wariant cyfalaf gael ei dorri 25 y cant.

Cafodd cynnig y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, a gefnogwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, a oedd yn galw ar Lywodraeth Lafur y DU i roi'r gorau i'w rhaglen o gau swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru ei drechu gan Aelodau Cynulliad Plaid Cymru a'r Blaid Lafur—yr un rhai sy'n sefyll y tu allan yn honni eu bod yn brwydro yn erbyn Llywodraeth y DU, ond sydd bob amser yn pleidleisio o blaid ei chefnogi yma.

Mohammad Asghar: Oni chredwch fod y bobl yr ochr arall i'r Siambr, nad ydynt yma, yn cael eu talu i wneud y gwaith o wasanaethu'r genedl a datrys ei phroblemau? Fodd bynnag, maent yn cuddio y tu ôl i staff y sefydliad hwn, ac yn creu mwy o broblemau yn hytrach na'u datrys.

Mark Isherwood: Yn hollol. Mae'n dangos anaeddfedrwydd gwleidyddol ofnadwy ac anghyfrifoldeb personol enfawr.

Yn Essex, mae'r cyngor sir Ceidwadol sy'n gwasanaethu poblogaeth o 1.4 miliwn wedi ymrwymo i wario hyd at £1.5 miliwn dros dair blynedd i gefnogi rhwydwaith hyfyw o swyddfeydd post ac ailagor swyddfeydd post a gaewyd gan raglen gau y Blaid Lafur lle ceir cefnogaeth gan y gymuned, angen yn y gymuned ac eiddo addas. Os gall Essex wneud hyn gyda hanner poblogaeth Cymru, pam na all Cymru?

Rhaid inni ryddhau gwir botensial elusennau a mentrau cymdeithasol i fynd i'r afael â'r

deep-rooted causes of the problems in our society, such as family breakdown, addiction, anti-social behaviour, abuse, and long-term worklessness. Behind the rhetoric, however, this Welsh Government keeps them in chains. The Minister for Health and Social Services, Edwina Hart, is restructuring the 'patient's voice'—our community health councils—and her dismissal of concerns raised by community health councils has left them, in their words, feeling frustrated, disappointed and downright angry.

Approximately 10 per cent of the prison population is made up of ex-service personnel, 2,000 of which are estimated to have post-traumatic stress disorder, and 12 per cent of the homeless population are veterans. When I asked the Minister for health to intervene to safeguard the unique and vital service for our PTSD-wounded veterans at Pathways in Bangor, she replied that the project was not eligible for grant aid, because the services that the project provides can be provided by the NHS. However, as Dr Steven Hughes, regimental medical officer of the second battalion of the parachute regiment in the Falkland Islands in 1982, responded, if conventional mental health services are so comprehensive, there would not be such a high rate of suicide among veterans, such a high prison population, or such large numbers of veterans sleeping rough. Ms Hart subsequently issued a press release claiming that she was rolling out a mental health pilot scheme for veterans, but there has been no statement to the Assembly, no detail, no costings, and no consideration of the needs identified by the veterans and clinicians at Pathways. The Minister should be ashamed of herself. Real change is required. We have changed our party, and Progressive Conservatism can now change Wales in Britain.

Jenny Randerson: I want to start by pointing out that the Presiding Officer is sitting here with a commendably impassive face. I am aware of the fact that he is the only

pethau sy'n achosi'r problemau yn ein cymdeithas, sydd wedi gwreiddio'n ddwfn, megis teuluoedd yn chwalu, dibyniaeth ar sylweddau, ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, camdriniaeth, a diweithdra hirdymor. Fodd bynnag, y tu ôl i'r rhyethreg, mae'r Llywodraeth hon yng Nghymru yn eu cadw mewn cadwynau. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, Edwina Hart, yn ailstrwythuro 'llais y claf'—ein cynghorau iechyd cymuned—ac mae'r ffaith iddi ddiystyru pryderon a godwyd gan gynghorau iechyd cymuned wedi eu gadael, yn eu geiriau hwy, yn teimlo rhwystredigaeth, siom a dicter llwyr.

Mae tua 10 y cant o boblogaeth ein carchardai yn gyn-filwyr, ac amcangyfrifir bod 2,000 ohonynt yn dioddef o anhwylder straen wedi trawma, ac mae 12 y cant o'r boblogaeth ddigartref yn gyn-filwyr. Pan ofynnais i'r Gweinidog dros iechyd ymyrryd i ddiogelu Pathways ym Mangor, sef y gwasanaeth unigryw a hanfodol ar gyfer ein cyn-filwyr sy'n dioddef o anhwylder straen wedi trawma, atebodd nad oedd y prosiect yn gymwys i gael cymorth grant oherwydd bod y GIG yn gallu darparu'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan y prosiect. Fodd bynnag, fel yr ymatebodd Dr Steven Hughes, swyddog meddygol catrodol gydag ail fataliwn catrawd y parasiwtwyr yn Ynysoedd Falkland yn 1982, os yw gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl confensiynol mor gynhwysfawr, ni fyddai cyfradd mor uchel o hunanladdiad ymysg cyn-filwyr, poblogaeth mor uchel o gyn-filwyr mewn carchardai, neu nifer mor fawr o gyn-filwyr yn cysgu ar y stryd. Wedi hynny, cyhoeddodd Ms Hart ddatganiad i'r wasg yn honni ei bod yn cyflwyno cynllun peilot ar iechyd meddwl ar gyfer cyn-filwyr. Fodd bynnag, ni roddwyd datganiad i'r Cynulliad, dim manylion, dim arwydd o'r costau, a dim ystyriaeth o'r anghenion a nodwyd gan y cyn-filwyr a'r clinigwyr yn Pathways. Rhag cywilydd i'r Gweinidog. Mae angen newid gwirioneddol. Yr ydym wedi newid ein plaid, a gall Ceidwadaeth Flaengar newid Cymru ym Mhrydain yn awr.

Jenny Randerson: Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy dynnu sylw at y ffaith fod y Llywydd yn eistedd yma gydag wynepryd hollol ddiuedd, sydd i'w ganmol yn fawr. Gwn

elected Member here from one of the governing parties, although he chairs these meetings in a totally neutral manner. However, I would like to be able to tap into his thoughts as he listens to this debate, because they are probably very like the thoughts of the public who are listening. They are probably mixed, because we give a different view to different sections of the population. It is a great pity and it demeans this institution that we are in this position today.

Other Members have used a lot of statistics about the failure to achieve things, the rising unemployment statistics and so on, but I want to take a slightly different approach. I have just reread 'One Wales', and what is not evident from that is the centralist and socialist nature of many of the decisions that the Government has taken. It is a centralist and socialist direction that it did not take in Rhodri Morgan's period as First Minister of a minority Government or under the Liberal Democrat/Labour partnership Government, obviously—because we would not have let them do it.

I want to pick out a couple of decisions, the first of which is the reorganisation of the health service. Everyone accepted that the various divisions in the health service were too great for it to operate effectively. However, we went from having more health bodies than the rest of the UK to having some of the largest health bodies in Europe, with our seven local health boards. In a country as sparsely populated as Wales, that is not appropriate or locally sensitive enough. I give you the example of the one enormous health body for the whole of north Wales, which is too large to reflect the interests of, and the services required by, that diverse and scattered population.

Another example is the higher education remit letter, which I commend to Members. It is not usual to commend a remit letter as a good read, but it is fascinating because it ties down so greatly the freedom of our

mai ef yw'r unig Aelod etholedig yma o un o'r pleidiau llywodraethol, er ei fod yn cadeirio'r cyfarfodydd hyn mewn modd hollol niwtral. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn allu darllen ei feddwl wrth iddo wrando ar y ddadl hon, oherwydd mae'n siŵr fod yr hyn sydd ar ei feddwl yn debyg iawn i'r hyn sydd ar feddwl y cyhoedd sy'n gwranddo. Mae'n debyg bod meddyliau pobl yn gymysg, oherwydd mae gwahanol rannau o'r boblogaeth yn ein gweld ni mewn ffordd wahanol. Mae'n drueni mawr, ac mae'n diraddio'r sefydliad hwn ein bod yn y sefyllfa hon heddiw.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi defnyddio nifer o ystadegau am y methiant i gyflawni pethau, yr ystadegau diweithdra sydd ar gynnydd, ac yn y blaen, ond yr wyf am gymryd agwedd ychydig yn wahanol. Yr wyf newydd ailddarllen 'Cymru'n Un', a'r hyn nad yw'n amlwg o'r ddogfen honno yw natur ganoliaethol a sosialaidd nifer o'r penderfyniadau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu gwneud. Mae'n gyfeiriad canoliaethol a sosialaidd na chymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth yng nghyfnod Rhodri Morgan fel Prif Weinidog Llywodraeth leiafrifol na dan Lywodraeth bartneriaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol/y Blaid Lafur, yn amlwg—oherwydd ni fyddem wedi gadael iddynt wneud hynny.

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at ddau benderfyniad, a'r cyntaf yw ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Yr oedd pawb yn derbyn bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn rhy dameidiog i allu gweithredu'n effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, aethom o sefyllfa lle'r oedd gennym fwy o gyrff iechyd na gweddill y DU i sefyllfa lle mae gennym rai o'r cyrff iechyd mwyaf yn Ewrop, gyda'n saith bwrdd iechyd lleol. Mewn gwlad sydd mor brin ei phoblogaeth â Chymru, nid yw hynny'n briodol nac yn ddigon sensitif yn lleol. Rhoddaf enghraifft ichi, sef yr un corff iechyd enfawr ar gyfer y gogledd i gyd. Mae'n rhy fawr i adlewyrchu lles y boblogaeth amrywiol a gwasgaredig honno, a'r gwasanaethau y mae arni eu hangen.

Enghraifft arall yw'r llythyr cylch gwaith i sefydliadau addysg uwch, yr wyf yn ei gymeradwyo i Aelodau. Nid yw'n arferol cymeradwyo llythyr cylch gwaith fel rhywbeth sy'n werth ei ddarllen, ond mae'n

universities to spend money. I will give you the example of one fund, which goes from universities having to achieve 25 per cent in line with Government objectives to 80 per cent in line with Government objectives. The letter goes on to say to universities, in essence, 'Here is your money for next year, although it is a great deal less than you had this year—and what is more, you have to do all these things that the Government says you should do'. I understand targeted funding in line with Government objectives, but that goes to the extreme.

ddiddorol iawn oherwydd mae'n cyfyngu cymaint ar ryddid ein prifysgolion i wario arian. Rhoddaf enghraifft ichi o un gronfa, sy'n mynd o ddweud ei bod yn rhaid i brifysgolion weithredu 25 y cant yn unol ag amcanion y Llywodraeth i 80 y cant yn unol ag amcanion y Llywodraeth. Yn y bôn, mae'r llythyr yn mynd yn ei flaen i ddweud wrth brifysgolion, 'Dyma eich arian am y flwyddyn nesaf, er ei fod gryn dipyn yn llai nag a gawsoch eleni—a hefyd, rhaid ichi wneud yr holl bethau hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud y dylech eu gwneud'. Gallaf ddeall targedu arian yn unol ag amcanion y Llywodraeth, ond mae hynny'n mynd i eithafion.

What worries me is that Government does not always know best. The people who run services, whether in local authorities, local hospitals or universities, are normally the people who know how things run most efficiently. If you want to sort out a service and ensure that it improves its efficiency, go to the people at the front line. Far from saying that our universities could not do things better, I am sure that they would fully admit that things could be done more efficiently and effectively. My experience is that bigger is not always better. You still make mistakes if you centralise things and make them big; it is just that your mistakes are bigger and they have major ramifications further down the road.

Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni yw nad y Llywodraeth bob amser sy'n gwybod orau. Fel arfer, y bobl sy'n rhedeg gwasanaethau, boed hynny mewn awdurdodau lleol, ysbytai lleol neu brifysgolion, yw'r bobl sy'n gwybod sut mae pethau'n rhedeg yn fwyaf effeithlon. Os ydych am roi trefn ar wasanaeth a sicrhau ei fod yn gwella'i effeithlonrwydd, ewch at y bobl yn y rheng flaen. Ymhell o ddweud na allai ein prifysgolion wneud pethau'n well, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddent yn cyfaddef yn iawn y gellid gwneud pethau'n fwy effeithlon ac effeithiol. Yn fy mhrofiad i, nid yw mwy bob amser yn golygu gwell. Byddwch yn dal i wneud camgymeriadau os canolwch bethau a'u gwneud yn fawr; ond bydd eich camgymeriadau'n fwy a bydd iddynt ganlyniadau difrifol yn ddiweddarach.

3.40 p.m.

I will finish by recounting a story. I was talking to someone the other day who had serious concerns about a school reorganisation proposal. They said that they thought that the Welsh Assembly Government ought to run the schools, not the council, to which I replied, 'Never wish that', because they were a very effective local campaign voice, which had already made the local council go back to the drawing board once to rethink the plan. I asked them whether they really thought that the Welsh Assembly Government would pay attention to a local little campaign for a local little primary school? No, their voice would not be heard. That is what worries me about the delivery of 'One Wales'.

Dof i ben drwy adrodd stori. Yr oeddwn yn siarad â rhywun y dydd o'r blaen a oedd yn pryderu'n ddifrifol am gynnig i ad-drefnu ysgolion. Dywedodd ei fod yn credu mai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddylai redeg yr ysgolion, nid y cyngor, ac atebais, 'Peidiwch byth â dymuno hynny', oherwydd yr oedd yn llais ymgyrchu effeithiol iawn yn lleol, a oedd eisoes wedi gwneud i'r cyngor lleol fynd yn ôl i'r cychwyn unwaith i ailfeddwl y cynllun. Gofynnais iddo a oedd yn credu mewn gwirionedd y byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhoi sylw i ymgyrch fach leol ar gyfer ysgol gynradd fach leol? Na, ni fyddai ei llais yn cael ei glywed. Dyna sy'n fy mhoeni am ddarparu 'Cymru'n Un'.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for your kind remarks about my position. I am pleased to be carrying out my democratic duty this afternoon. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Hear, hear’.] I thought that you might like that comment. [*Laughter.*]

Jonathan Morgan: I want to start by saying what a tremendous debate this has been this afternoon. In the absence of Labour and Plaid Assembly Members, the standard of debate has been significantly better. Having spent 11 years in this institution and having participated in many opposition debates, whether the motions were tabled by my own party or by the Liberal Democrats, we have become used to the fact that Labour and Plaid Members do not tend to contribute to the debates anyway.

Many people outside the Assembly looking in will do so in horror today, wondering what on earth is going on when two thirds of the elected members of the National Assembly simply fail to turn up for work. We must ask ourselves what that means and what message that sends to the people of Wales ahead of a possible referendum on the future primary law-making powers of this institution. All of us here today argued in favour of a referendum. We argued for the people of Wales to pass judgment not only on whether we should have more powers, but also, in effect, on devolution generally.

If we honestly believe that we face an easy referendum campaign in the months ahead, we are kidding ourselves. We are kidding ourselves because of the actions taken by Labour and Plaid Members not just this week but in a previous week when strike action took place. It will do tremendous damage to the potential confidence throughout Wales in favour of this place having primary law-making powers. Many of my constituents will be shocked—not to find Labour and Plaid Members stood on the picket line arguing the case for those who are concerned at the Government’s reform of the civil service pension and retirement scheme, but to find that they are simply having a duvet

Y Llywydd: Diolch am eich sylwadau caredig am fy sefyllfa. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn cyflawni fy nyletswydd ddemocrataidd y prynhawn yma. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘Clywch, clywch’.] Yr oeddwn wedi tybied y byddech yn hoffi’r sylw hwnnw. [*Chwerthin.*]

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf am ddechrau drwy ddweud i hon fod yn ddadl wych y prynhawn yma. Yn absenoldeb Aelodau Cynulliad y Blaid Lafur a Phlaid Cymru, mae safon y dadlau wedi bod yn sylweddol uwch. Ar ôl treulio 11 mlynedd yn y sefydliad hwn ac ar ôl cymryd rhan yn nifer o ddadleuon yr wrthblaid, yn gynigion a gyflwynwyd gan fy mhlaid fy hun neu gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yr ydym wedi dod i arfer â’r ffaith nad yw Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yn tueddu i gyfrannu at y dadleuon beth bynnag.

Bydd llawer o bobl y tua allan i’r Cynulliad sy’n edrych i mewn yn arswydo wrth wneud hynny heddiw, gan ofyn beth ar y ddaear sy’n digwydd pan fydd dwy ran o dair o aelodau etholedig y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn methu â dod i’r gwaith. Rhaid inni ofyn inni ein hunain beth mae hynny’n ei olygu a pha neges mae hynny’n ei hanfon i bobl Cymru cyn refferendwm posibl ar bwerau deddfu sylfaenol y sefydliad hwn yn y dyfodol. Dadleuodd pob un ohonom sydd yma heddiw o blaid refferendwm. Dadleuwyd o blaid rhoi cyfle i bobl Cymru fynegi barn ar y cwestiwn a ddylem gael mwy o bwerau, a hefyd, mewn gwirionedd, ar ddatganoli yn gyffredinol.

Yr ydym yn ein twyllo’n hunain os ydym yn wir yn credu ein bod yn wynebu ymgyrch refferendwm rwydd yn y misoedd i ddod. Yr ydym yn ein twyllo’n hunain oherwydd y camau gweithredu y mae Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru wedi eu cymryd yr wythnos hon, ac mewn wythnos flaenorol hefyd pan gafwyd streic. Bydd yn gwneud niwed enfawr i’r hyder posibl ledled Cymru o blaid sicrhau bod y lle hwn yn cael pwerau deddfu sylfaenol. Bydd nifer o’r hetholwyr yn synnu—nid o weld Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yn sefyll ar y llinell biced yn dadlau’r achos dros bobl sy’n pryderu am y modd y mae’r Llywodraeth yn diwygio cynllun siwiwn ac ymddeoliad y gwasanaeth sifil,

day, because that is what they will assume. It is quite shocking and it is made even starker given that we have debated the need for the proposed Measure on remuneration today, which will mean that we can legislate to separate Assembly Members from setting their own allowances and pay, ensuring that, in future, we do not face the same problems as Westminster Members. We have taken strong positive action on that, but Labour and Plaid Members were not even here to discuss the issues.

Darren Millar: Given that this is the second time that this has happened to us in the Assembly, do you agree that the individuals concerned should have a day's pay docked from their salaries? At the end of the day, those people who are striking and who are on the picket lines will have their pay docked, so should the same not be applied to these Assembly Members?

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not think that that is within the scope of this debate. I do not believe that the powers exist, even in the all-powerful Assembly Commission, to achieve that.

Jonathan Morgan: Thank you; I must follow the advice of the Presiding Officer. I am sure that members of the Government will have heard what my colleague Darren Millar said and that, no doubt, in the spirit of charity, they will be delighted to donate a day's salary to charitable causes. It is even more striking when we consider that we have not only had the debate on the proposed Measure but are having this debate on the 'One Wales' agreement. Like Jenny Randerson, I sat down earlier and read this document. It is not until you read through it that you realise how little has been achieved in almost three years since the document was signed. The first giggle I had was when I got to the foreword on page 3. It says:

'As a coalition of the two largest parties in the Assembly, we are acutely aware of our shared responsibility to ensure the democratic vitality of the third term and to ensure that dissenting voices and alternative points of

ond o weld eu bod yn cael diwrnod i'r brenin, oherwydd dyna fyddant yn ei feddwl. Mae'n warthus, a'r hyn sy'n gwneud y cyfan yn waeth byth yw'r ffaith ein bod wedi cynnal dadl heddiw ar yr angen am y Mesur arfaethedig ar daliadau, a fydd yn golygu y gallwn ddeddfu i rwystro Aelodau'r Cynulliad rhag gosod eu lwfansau a'u cyflog eu hunain, gan sicrhau na fyddwn yn wynebu'r un problemau yn y dyfodol ag Aelodau San Steffan. Yr ydym wedi cymryd camau gweithredu cryf a chadarnhaol ar hynny, ond nid oedd Aelodau Llafur a Phlaid Cymru yma hyd yn oed i drafod y materion.

Darren Millar: O ystyried mai hwn yw'r eildro i hyn ddigwydd inni yn y Cynulliad, a ydych yn cytuno y dylid tynnu diwrnod o dâl o gyflogau'r unigolion dan sylw? Yn y pen draw, bydd tâl y rheini sy'n streicio ac sydd ar y llinellau piced yn cael ei docio, felly, oni ddylai'r un peth fod yn wir am yr Aelodau Cynulliad hyn?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf yn credu bod hynny o fewn cwrpas y ddadl hon. Ni chredaf fod y pwerau'n bodoli, hyd yn oed yng Nghomisiwn hollbwerus y Cynulliad, i gyflawni hynny.

Jonathan Morgan: Diolch; rhaid imi ddilyn cyngor y Llywydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd aelodau'r Llywodraeth wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedodd fy nghydweithiwr, Darren Millar, ac y byddant, mae'n siŵr, o haelioni calon yn falch iawn cyfrannu cyflog diwrnod at achosion elusennol. Mae hyd yn oed yn fwy trawiadol pan ystyriwn ein bod wedi cael y ddadl am y Mesur arfaethedig a hefyd yn cael y ddadl hon ar gytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Fel Jenny Randerson, eisteddais i lawr yn gynharach a darllenais y ddogfen hon. Ni fyddwch yn sylweddoli tan ichi ddarllen drwyddi cyn lleied sydd wedi'i gyflawni mewn bron i dair blynedd ers llofnodi'r ddogfen. Y peth cyntaf a wnaeth imi chwerrthin wrthyf fy hun oedd cyrraedd y rhagair ar dudalen 3. Mae'n dweud:

'Fel clymblaid o'r ddwy blaid fwyaf yn y Cynulliad, rydym yn llwyr ymwybodol o'n cyfrifoldeb ar y cyd i gynnal democratiaeth hyfyw yn ystod y trydydd tymor hwn, ac i sicrhau bod lleisiau a safbwyntiau gwahanol

view are represented and heard’.

That is except for today, of course, when they do not want to come to work to hear those dissenting voices and alternative viewpoints. However, we must realise where we are after three years of a Labour/Plaid administration, and where we are after almost 13 years of the Labour Party being in Government in the UK and 11 years in Government here in Wales. This is a Government that has spent money more foolishly than an ill-advised lottery winner. I remember the introduction of the lottery, and suddenly there were scores of people winning massive sums of money and going bankrupt within months or years of winning those large sums. It is almost as though those very same people suddenly became Labour MPs and AMs and joined the Government. In one fell swoop, we saw a whole raft of people simply incapable of spending money in an effective way.

I can see the problem: there are those on the political left who think that the most effective thing that you can do with public cash is to do something for nothing—the freebee, gimmick culture: ‘Don’t worry, we’ll give you this for nothing; we’ll provide this for free; this won’t cost you anything; you can have this on us’. There is no such thing: it is taxpayers’ money. This is a party and a Government based on gimmicks, freebies and giveaways. We live in a country where people do not live as long as elsewhere in the UK. The average lifespan in Wales is lower than in the rest of the UK because of some of our health determinants. People living in Wales wait longer for treatment; they wait longer for homes because we are not building as many as we once were; and their children go to schools that are either not being repaired or that are facing closure. This is not a happy place to live, because of the actions and inaction of this coalition administration. It is a Government that has spent money without reforming public services. It is a Government incapable of reform.

We warned time and again that spending taxpayers’ money in this way time and again,

yn cael eu cynrychioli a’u clywed’.

Ar wahân i heddiw, wrth gwrs, pan nad ydynt am ddod i’r gwaith i glywed y lleisiau a’r safbwyntiau gwahanol hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni sylweddoli ble’r ydym ar ôl tair blynedd o weinyddiaeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru, a ble’r ydym ar ôl bron i 13 blynedd o gael y Blaid Lafur mewn Llywodraeth yn y DU ac 11 mlynedd mewn Llywodraeth yma yng Nghymru. Mae hon yn Llywodraeth sydd wedi bod yn fwy ffôl wrth wario arian nag enillwr loteri annoeth. Cofiaf y loteri’n cael ei chyflwyno, ac yn sydyn yr oedd ugeiniau o bobl yn ennill symiau anferthol ac yn troi’n fethdalwyr cyn pen misoedd neu flynyddoedd ar ôl ennill y symiau mawr hynny. Mae bron fel pe bai’r union bobl hynny wedi dod yn ASau ac yn ACau Llafur yn sydyn, ac wedi ymuno â’r Llywodraeth. Ar un tro, gwelsom lond lle o bobl nad oeddent yn gallu gwario arian mewn ffordd effeithiol.

Gallaf weld y broblem: mae yna pobl ar y chwith yn wleidyddol sy’n credu mai’r peth mwyaf effeithiol y gallwch ei wneud ag arian cyhoeddus yw gwneud rhywbeth am ddim—y diwylliant rhoddion a gimigau: ‘Peidiwch â phoeni, fe rown hyn ichi am ddim; fe ddarparwn hyn yn rhad ac am ddim; wnaiff hyn ddim costio ceiniog ichi; fe dalwn ni am hyn’. Nid oes y fath beth yn bodoli: arian trethdalwyr ydyw. Mae hon yn blaid ac yn Llywodraeth sy’n seiliedig ar gimigau a rhoddion. Yr ydym yn byw mewn gwlad lle nad yw pobl yn byw cyhyd ag y maent mewn mannau eraill yn y DU. Ar gyfartaledd, mae hyd oes pobl yng Nghymru yn llai nag yng ngweddill y DU oherwydd rhai o’n penderfynyddion iechyd. Mae pobl sy’n byw yng Nghymru yn aros yn hwy am driniaeth; maent yn aros yn hwy am gartrefi oherwydd nad ydym yn adeiladu cynifer ag yr oeddem ar un adeg; ac mae eu plant yn mynd i ysgolion nad ydynt yn cael eu hatgyweirio neu sy’n wynebu eu cau. Nid yw hwn yn lle hapus i fyw, oherwydd y camau y mae’r weinyddiaeth glymbleidiol hon wedi’u cymryd a’r camau nad yw wedi’u cymryd. Mae’n Llywodraeth sydd wedi gwario arian heb ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Mae’n Llywodraeth nad yw’n gallu diwygio.

Yr ydym wedi rhybuddio dro ar ôl tro na fyddai gwario arian trethdalwyr fel hyn dro ar

without reforming public services or ensuring that we were getting good value for the money spent, would provide nothing sustainable in the long term. Now, as we face financial difficulties and a reduction in our revenue and capital budget, we will see public services struggling to cope because of the foolish way that this Government has behaved. That will be the legacy; that is the basis upon which the people of this country will make a decision in May this year and May next year. Quite frankly, Presiding Officer, I am looking forward to that day coming.

The Presiding Officer: I call Brynle Williams and then finally Angela Burns, unless there is anyone else here. [*Laughter.*]

Brynle Williams: Diolch, Lywydd, am y cyfle i siarad y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn sefyllfa drist ofnadwy. Deuthum yma saith mlynedd yn ôl gyda balchder mawr fy mod wedi dod i sedd Llywodraeth Cymru. Yr ydym wedi troi'r olwyn yn gyfan gwbl. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dianc oddi yma heddiw. Ni all unrhyw un roi gwrs i mi ar brotestio; mae gennyf fwy o gefndir o wneud hynny nag unrhyw un yma. Yr wyf yn parchu'r hawl i brotestio ond mae Aelodau'r Llywodraeth yn sefyll y tu allan i'r Siambr ac yn gwrthod dod i mewn i ddelio â busnes y wlad, a does dim geiriau am hynny.

3.50 p.m.

You have heard the facts—everybody has expressed them well: unemployment is up, child poverty is up, business closures are up, anti-social behaviour is up, ambulance waiting times are up, and rural poverty is up, as my colleague just said. Last week, not even one Member of the Labour Government tried to defend their position. Ten years ago, I went to meet a Minister in London—I believe that it was the Minister for transport and energy—and the Minister asked me, ‘Can you tell me why has this industrial action has taken place?’, and I said, ‘Yes, the Labour Government is not listening to the people’. In 10 years, the Labour Government has not listened at all. It has learnt nothing from that lesson. In fact, its Members are not even here

ôl tro, heb ddiwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus na sicrhau ein bod yn cael gwerth da am yr arian sy'n cael ei wario, yn darparu dim sy'n gynaliadwy yn y tymor hir. Yn awr, wrth inni wynebu anawsterau ariannol a lleihad yn ein cyllideb refeniw a chyfalaf, byddwn yn gweld gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ei chael hi'n anodd ymdopi oherwydd ymddygiad ffôl y Llywodraeth hon. Dyna fydd yr etifeddiaeth; ar sail hynny y bydd pobl y wlad hon yn gwneud penderfyniad ym mis Mai eleni a mis Mai y flwyddyn nesaf. A dweud y gwir, Lywydd, yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y diwrnod hwnnw.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Brynle Williams, ac yna yn olaf Angela Burns, oni bai fod rhywun arall yma. [*Chwerthin.*]

Brynle Williams: Thank you, Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to speak this afternoon. I find this situation extremely sad. I was very proud when I came here seven years ago that I had come to the seat of Welsh Government. However, the tables have turned completely. The Government of Wales has fled from this place today. No-one can give me a lesson on protesting; I have much more of a background in protesting than anyone else in this place. I respect the right to protest, but Members of the Government are standing outside the Chamber and refusing to come in to deal with the business of running the country, and there are no words for that.

Yr ydych wedi clywed y ffeithiau—mae pawb wedi eu mynegi'n dda: mae diweithdra wedi cynyddu, mae tlodi plant wedi cynyddu, mae nifer y busnesau sy'n cau wedi cynyddu, mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol wedi cynyddu, mae amseroedd aros am ambiwlans wedi cynyddu, ac mae tlodi gwledig wedi cynyddu, fel y mae fy nghydweithiwr newydd ei ddweud. Yr wythnos diwethaf, ni cheisiodd yr un Aelod o'r Llywodraeth Lafur amddiffyn ei safbwynt. Ddeng mlynedd yn ôl, euthum i gyfarfod â Gweinidog yn Llundain—credaf mai'r Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth ac ynni ydoedd—a gofynnodd y Gweinidog imi, ‘A allwch ddweud wrthyf pam mae'r gweithredu diwydiannol hwn wedi digwydd?’, a dywedais, ‘Gallaf, nid

today; they are absent, which is where they have been for the last 11 years. They are full of promises and rhetoric, but their attitude is one of 'no can do'.

Angela Burns: I thank everybody who has contributed to the debate today. In fact, there have been so many great contributions, I will not be able to name everyone individually. I will just take a quick gallop through 'One Wales: A progressive agenda for the government of Wales'. Let us just start with 'A Strong and Confident Nation'. It talks of Beecham and citizen-centred local services, but in my two-and-a-half years as an Assembly Member, I would say this to you: 'Not in my constituency'. It talks about the strategic capital investment framework, which is actually a very good idea, but it has been poorly funded and poorly executed. The Government has tinkered around with it at its edges and there is no strategy in SCIF. When we talk about 'A Strong and Confident Nation', one of the things that we need is a good strategy that will take us forward. I tell you that, on this second chapter, it has failed and it has failed dismally.

On the third chapter, 'A Healthy Future', to be honest, I am not sure that I could follow Andrew R.T. Davies's incredibly outstanding performance, where he laid bare the total and utter inadequacies of the health service provision in Wales today. I just want to mention a few things that have touched my heart. The first is the long-awaited dementia plan. We have been waiting for two years and now we are at the stage where there are four task and finish groups. I have never come across anywhere in my entire working life where it has taken so long to make some pretty simple, straightforward decisions. It is a total nonsense.

I will not name the Member who said this—

yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn gwrando ar y bobl'. Mewn 10 mlynedd, nid yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi gwrando o gwbl. Nid yw wedi dysgu dim o'r wers honno. A dweud y gwir, nid yw ei Haelodau yma heddiw hyd yn oed; maent yn absennol, ac maent wedi bod yn absennol am yr 11 mlynedd diwethaf. Maent yn llawn addewidion a rhythreg, ond agwedd 'allwn ni ddim' sydd ganddynt.

Angela Burns: Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl heddiw. A dweud y gwir, cafwyd cynifer o gyfraniadau ardderchog fel na fyddaf yn gallu enwi pawb yn unigol. Af ar garlam drwy 'Cymru'n Un: Rhaglen flaengar ar gyfer llywodraethu Cymru'. Gadewch inni ddechrau gyda'r adran 'Cenedl Gref a Hyderus'. Mae'n sôn am Beecham a gwasanaethau lleol sy'n canolbwyntio ar y dinesydd, ond yn fy nwy flynedd a hanner fel Aelod Cynulliad, byddwn yn dweud hyn wrthyhch: 'Nid yn fy etholaeth i'. Mae'n sôn am y fframwaith buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, sy'n syniad da iawn a dweud y gwir, ond mae wedi'i ariannu'n wael a'i weithredu'n wael. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi chwarae o gwmpas ag ef ar ei ymylon ac nid oes strategaeth yn perthyn i'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol. Pan siaradwn am 'Genedl Gref a Hyderus', un o'r pethau y mae ei angen arnom yw strategaeth dda a fydd yn ein symud yn ein blaen. Yr wyf yn dweud wrthyhch fod y cytundeb wedi methu yng nghyswllt yr ail bennod hon, ac mae wedi methu'n alaethus.

O ran y drydedd bennod, 'Dyfodol Iach', a bod yn onest nid wyf yn siŵr y gallwn ddilyn perfformiad hollol ragorol Andrew R. T. Davies, lle datgelodd ddiffygion llwyr darpariaeth y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru heddiw. Hoffwn sôn am ambell beth sydd wedi cyffwrdd fy nghalon. Y cyntaf yw'r cynllun demensia hirddisgwylidig. Yr ydym wedi bod yn disgwyl ers dwy flynedd, ac yn awr yr ydym wedi cyrraedd pwynt lle mae gennym bedwar grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Yn yr holl flynyddoedd y bŵm yn gweithio, nid wyf erioed wedi dod ar draws unman lle mae wedi cymryd cyhyd i wneud penderfyniadau digon syml a hawdd. Mae'n nonsens llwyr.

Nid enwaf yr Aelod a ddywedodd hyn—yr

the Member belonged to Plaid Cymru, but as that Member is not here to defend himself or herself, it would be unfair to name them—but when Jenny spoke about how she had thought that the delivery of the promises in the ‘One Wales’ agreement had become far more socialist than the words had suggested, I remember one Member leaping to their feet and saying that they thought that it was better for somebody who was desperately sick in north Wales to travel all the way down to Cardiff or Swansea for neurosurgery than going to the Walton Hospital in Liverpool, because it was much better for Welsh patients to spend Welsh money in Welsh hospitals. I cannot even begin to tell you how utterly reprehensible I found that comment. First, where is our humanity? If somebody is sick and needs treatment, they need it as near to their home base as possible and they want their families to come to visit them. They do not want to have to do the journey down to south Wales for brain treatment. Secondly, how daft. The Welsh pound comes from the south-east of England, as does the Scottish pound, the north-east English pound, and the Cornwall pound. The south-east of England is the powerhouse of the United Kingdom. It is the most ridiculous supposition and based on nothing but dogma, and it does not give us a healthy nation.

‘A Healthy Future’ also mentions improving patients’ experience. I say to you again: not in my constituency, not with my postbag, and not for the people who have come to see me because they cannot get treatment. They are having to wait too long. They tell horror stories of little boys falling off fences on farms and waiting for an hour-and-a-half for an ambulance to take them to hospital because they think that they have shattered their arm. They tell stories of old ladies who cannot get post-operative care. I was contacted about one individual yesterday who left hospital a week ago having had a major operation. She is 90 years old, and lives in a home with no internal water. When I spoke to her yesterday, she was just delighted that the neighbours had come round to light her fire for her. She was told by the NHS that she was not a high enough priority to spend a week in a nursing home to help her to recuperate. ‘A Healthy Future’—I do not see it.

oedd yr Aelod yn perthyn i Blaid Cymru, ond gan nad yw'r Aelod hwnnw yma i amddiffyn ei hun, byddai'n annheg ei enwi ef neu hi—ond pan soniodd Jenny am y modd yr oedd yn credu bod cyflawni'r addewidion yn ‘Cymru'n Un’ wedi dod yn fwy sosialaidd o lawer nag yr oedd y geiriau wedi ei awgrymu, cofiaf un Aelod yn neidio ar ei draed ac yn dweud ei fod yn credu ei bod yn well i rywun a oedd yn ddifrifol wael yn y gogledd deithio'r holl ffordd i lawr i Gaerdydd neu Abertawe ar gyfer niwrolawdriniaeth na mynd i Ysbyty Walton yn Lerpwl, gan ei bod yn well o lawer i gleifion o Gymru wario arian Cymru yn ysbytai Cymru. Ni allaf ddechrau dweud wrthy ch mor gwbl resynus oedd y sylw hwnnw yn fy marn i. Yn gyntaf, ble mae ein dyngarwch? Os bydd pobl yn sâl ac angen triniaeth arnynt, mae arnynt eu hangen mor agos ag sy'n bosibl i'w cartref, a byddant am i'w teuluoedd ddod i'w gweld. Nid ydynt am orfod teithio i lawr i'r de i gael triniaeth i'r ymennydd. Yn ail, am wirion. Mae'r bunt Gymreig yn dod o dde-ddwyrain Lloegr, fel punt yr Alban, punt gogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, a phunt Cernyw. De-ddwyrain Lloegr yw pwerdy'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n dybiaeth hollol chwerthinllyd, ac nid yw'n seiliedig ar ddim ond dogma, ac nid yw'n rhoi cenedl iach inni.

Mae ‘Dyfodol Iach’ hefyd yn sôn am wella profiad cleifion. Dywedaf wrthy ch eto: nid yn fy etholaeth i, nid gyda'm bag post i, ac nid ar gyfer y bobl sydd wedi dod i'm gweld oherwydd na allant gael triniaeth. Maent yn gorfod aros yn rhy hir. Maent yn adrodd straeon sy'n codi arswyd am fechgyn bach yn syrthio oddi ar ffensys ar ffermydd ac yn aros awr a hanner am ambiwlans i fynd â hwy i'r ysbyty oherwydd eu bod yn credu eu bod wedi torri eu braich. Maent yn adrodd straeon am hen wragedd sy'n methu cael gofal ôl-driniaethol. Cysylltwyd â mi ddoe am un unigolyn a adawodd yr ysbyty wythnos yn ôl ar ôl cael llawdriniaeth fawr. Mae hi'n 90 oed ac yn byw mewn cartref heb gyflenwad dŵr yn y tŷ. Pan siaradais â hi ddoe, yr oedd wrth ei bodd bod y cymdogion wedi galw i gynnu ei tân. Dywedodd y GIG wrthi nad oedd yn flaenoriaeth ddigon uchel i dreulio wythnos mewn cartref nyrsio i'w helpu i wella. ‘Dyfodol Iach’—ni allaf ei weld.

Turning to the section entitled 'A Prosperous Society', Oscar gave an excellent critique of the tourism issues. In it, the Government talks about stimulating enterprise and business growth, and of a manufacturing forum. Nick Bourne talked very adequately and expressively about the 68,000 lost jobs in manufacturing, and about the high levels of unemployment. In 'A Prosperous Society', the Government talks about the European Investment Bank. When I spoke to it last year, it told me that it had done only two projects in the whole of Wales. Therefore, it is all nonsense. My favourite part of 'A Prosperous Society' is that in which it is said that there will be an enhanced business rate scheme and effective support for businesses. The Welsh Conservatives and the Liberal Democrats have proved time and again over the last few weeks what utter nonsense that is.

On 'Living Communities', I will say two words: Communities First. That sums up our lack of living communities. Let us look at housing and planning. Its promises on housing and planning just did not happen, and my constituency is one of the worst areas in that regard. I want to read a piece of gobbledegook in relation to homelessness, which is on page 18 of 'One Wales: A Progressive Agenda for the Government of Wales':

'We will produce a plan to confront homelessness over a decade, seeking new powers under the Government of Wales Act 2006, where such powers are necessary to the development and implementation of a Welsh strategy'.

I have spent 25 years in business and I will tell you what that is: management speak. Absolutely nothing substantial has happened on that issue.

Turning to 'Learning for Life', I thank the Liberal Democrats for bringing forward their amendment. With regard to education, I will mention tuition fees, and I will not just bash, as the foundation phase is really good. However, although that is good, the rest is pretty awful. We have schools that, as Darren

I droi at yr adran dan y teitl 'Cymdeithas Lewyrchus', rhoddodd Oscar ddadansoddiad gwych o'r materion twristiaeth. Ynnddi mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn am ysgogi mentergarwch a thwf busnesau, ac am fforwm gweithgynhyrchu. Siaradodd Nick Bourne yn ddigon atebol ac yn llawn mynegiant am y 68,000 o swyddi a gollwyd ym maes gweithgynhyrchu, ac am y lefelau uchel o ddiweithdra. Yn yr adran 'Cymdeithas Lewyrchus', mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn am Fanc Buddsoddi Ewrop. Pan siaradais â'r banc y llynedd, dywedodd wrthyf mai dim ond dau brosiect yr oedd wedi'u gwneud yng Nghymru gyfan. Felly, nonsens yw'r cyfan. Fy hoff ran o 'Cymdeithas Lewyrchus' yw'r rhan lle dywedir y bydd cynllun ardrethi busnes gwell a chymorth effeithiol i fusnesau. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol wedi profi dro ar ôl tro yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf mai nonsens llwyr yw hynny.

O ran 'Cymunedau Byw', y cyfan a ddywedaf yw: Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae hynny'n crynhoi ein diffyg cymunedau byw. Beth am inni edrych ar dai a chynllunio? Ni wireddwyd addewidion y cytundeb ar dai a chynllunio, a'm hetholaeth i yw un o'r ardaloedd gwaethaf yn hynny o beth. Hoffwn ddarllen darn o rwdl-mi-ri yn ymwneud â digartrefedd, sydd ar dudalen 18 'Cymru'n Un: Rhaglen Flaengar ar gyfer Llywodraethu Cymru':

'Byddwn yn llunio cynllun i fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd dros ddeng mlynedd, gan geisio pwerau newydd o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, lle bydd pwerau o'r fath yn angenrheidiol i ddatblygu a gweithredu strategaeth Cymru'.

Yr wyf wedi treulio 25 mlynedd mewn busnes a dywedaf wrthyf beth yw hynny: iaith rheolwyr. Nid oes dim sylweddol o gwbl wedi digwydd ar y mater hwnnw.

I droi at yr adran 'Dysgu i Fyw', diolch i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'u gwelliant. O ran addysg, soniaf am ffioedd dysgu, ac nid beirniadu'n unig yr wyf, oherwydd mae'r cyfnod sylfaen yn dda iawn. Fodd bynnag, er bod hynny'n dda mae'r gweddill yn bur ofnadwy. Mae gennym

Millar said, are falling down. The investment grant for maintenance has been cut by over a third, there is closure of community schools, and Jenny very adequately and explicitly talked about the hand-tying that goes on in the higher education remit letter, which boils down to saying, 'Here is your money; you have a lot less, but you have to do a lot more, and we will tell you exactly what are going to do'. That is not about empowering or decentralisation.

Turning to 'A Fair and Just Society', there are 96,000 children in severe poverty. That is the only thing that I will say on it, apart from that, when the Welsh Conservatives tabled a debate on this issue, a Member stood up and tried to blame all of it on the Conservative Government of 30 years ago. Yet, this is the bunch who, on page 28 of the document, say that they will eradicate child poverty. They have gone backward and not forward. It is arrogant to put that statement on paper when you do not even know how you will do it.

Jenny Randerson: You do realise that they passed a law that says that they will eradicate child poverty. They seem to think that that will do the trick.

Angela Burns: It is a case of words, words, words and no action.

The penultimate section of the 'One Wales' agenda is 'A Sustainable Environment'. The Government talks about climate change, rural communities—as if it knew what those were—and sustainable energy production and consumption, where, unless it is a windfarm, it will not receive any backing or support from the Government. It has done one good thing: Elin Jones has been pretty brave in taking bovine TB on the nose to try to sort it out. However, with regard to its commitments in my portfolio of sustainability, it has failed on the carbon-neutrality of public buildings, it failed to work with local authorities to identify and to address the particular needs of deep rural areas, it failed to research and develop renewable technologies, and it has failed to pursue the devolution of building regulations.

ysgolion sy'n dadfeilio, fel y dywedodd Darren Millar. Mae'r grant buddsoddi ar gyfer cynnal a chadw wedi'i dorri fwy na thraean, mae ysgolion cymunedol yn cau, a siaradodd Jenny yn ddigon atebol ac yn eglur iawn am y modd y mae'r llythyr cylch gwaith yn clymu dwylo sefydliadau addysg uwch, gan ddweud yn y bôn, 'Dyma'ch arian; mae llai o lawer gennych, ond rhaid ichi wneud mwy o lawer, a byddwn yn dweud wrthyhych beth yn union yr ydym am ichi ei wneud'. Nid grymuso na datganoli yw hynny.

I droi at yr adran 'Cymdeithas Deg a Chyfiawn', mae 96,000 o blant yn byw mewn tloidi difrifol. Dyna'r cwbl a ddywedaf amdano, ar wahân i'r ffaith fod Aelod wedi sefyll, pan gyflwynodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ddadl am y mater hwn, a cheisio bwrw'r bai am y cyfan ar y Llywodraeth Geidwadol 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Ond eto, dyma'r criw sy'n dweud, ar dudalen 28 yn y ddogfen, y byddant yn dileu tloidi plant. Maent wedi mynd am yn ôl, nid ymlaen. Mae'n haerllug rhoi'r datganiad hwnnw ar bapur pan na wyddoch sut y byddwch yn ei gyflawni, hyd yn oed.

Jenny Randerson: A ydych yn sylweddoli eu bod wedi pasio cyfraith sy'n dweud y byddant yn dileu tloidi plant? Maent fel pe baent yn credu y bydd hynny'n gweithio.

Angela Burns: Dim ond siarad a gawn, a dim gweithredu.

Yr adran olaf ond un yn agenda 'Cymru'n Un' yw 'Amgylchedd Cynaliadwy'. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn sôn am y newid yn yr hinsawdd, cymunedau gwledig—fel pe bai'n gwybod beth yw'r rheini—a chynhyrchu a defnyddio ynni'n gynaliadwy, ac os nad fferm wynt ydyw, ni fydd yn cael dim cymorth na chefnogaeth gan y Llywodraeth. Mae wedi gwneud un peth da: mae Elin Jones wedi bod yn go ddewr wrth fynd i'r afael â TB gwartheg a cheisio datrys y broblem. Fodd bynnag, o ran ymrwymadau'r cytundeb yn fy mhortffolio i, sef cynaliadwyedd, mae wedi methu â sicrhau bod adeiladau cyhoeddus yn garbon niwtral, mae wedi methu â gweithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i adnabod anghenion penodol ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell a mynd i'r afael â hwy, mae wedi methu ag ymchwilio i dechnolegau

It is a case of failure, failure, failure.

adnewyddadwy a'u datblygu, ac mae wedi methu â mynd ar ôl datganoli rheoliadau adeiladu. Methiant, methiant, methiant sydd yma.

4.00 p.m.

Finally, turning to the section entitled 'A Rich and Diverse Culture', this is a portfolio that is singularly underperforming, in my opinion, which is shown by reading what it said that it would do. Again, I will give you one example—because I know that I must wind up—and that is broadband. We have a bunch of people, called International Business Wales, who are running around the world trying to persuade people to come here and to work and live in Wales. It states in the 'One Wales' agreement that that is one of the Government's key objectives for a rich and diverse culture.

Yn olaf, i droi at yr adran dan y teitl 'Diwylliant Cyfoethog ac Amrywiol', mae hwn yn bortffolio sy'n tangyflawni'n rhyfeddol, yn fy marn i, a dangosir hyn drwy ddarllen yr hyn a ddywedodd y byddai'n ei wneud. Eto, rhoddaf un enghraifft ichi—oherwydd gwn fod rhaid imi dynnu at y terfyn—a band eang yw honno. Mae gennym griw o bobl, o'r enw Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru, sy'n rhedeg o amgylch y byd yn ceisio darbwyllo pobl i ddod yma i fyw a gweithio yng Nghymru. Nodir yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' mai dyna yw un o amcanion allweddol y Llywodraeth ar gyfer diwylliant cyfoethog ac amrywiol.

Darren Millar: We have heard about the launch of the 'One Wales' pilot laptop scheme for pupils. Do you not agree that that is a total waste of time if you live in a community that does not have access to broadband and your children cannot get online to do their studies?

Darren Millar: Yr ydym wedi clywed am lansio cynllun peilot 'Cymru'n Un' i ddarparu gliniaduron i ddisgyblion. Oni chytunwch mai gwastraff amser llwyr yw hynny os ydych yn byw mewn cymuned lle na allwch gael band eang a lle na all eich plant fynd ar-lein i astudio?

Angela Burns: Thank you for that, Darren, because that brings me to my final point. On page 38 of the 'One Wales' agreement, the Government states that it is trying to get people to come here and

Angela Burns: Diolch am hynny, Darren, oherwydd daw hynny â mi at fy mhwynt olaf. Ar dudalen 38 yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un' mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud ei bod yn ceisio cael pobl i ddod yma a

'to make Wales a location of choice for people to live, work, study, visit and do business.'

'sichrau bod Cymru'n wlad y mae pobl yn dewis byw, gweithio ac astudio ynddi, ymweld â hi a chynnal gweithgareddau busnes ynddi.'

International Business Wales is running around the world trying to get people to live in Wales, but we do not have broadband. Would you go to live in a place that does not have broadband? I do not think so. Therefore, this document is a great piece of fiction and I suggest that you put it in the place in your house where you like to sit down at leisure and read fiction.

Mae Busnes Rhyngwladol Cymru yn rhedeg o amgylch y byd yn ceisio cael pobl i fyw yng Nghymru, a ninnau heb fand eang. A fydddech chi'n mynd i fyw yn rhywle sydd heb fand eang? Nid wyf yn credu y bydddech. Felly, mae'r ddogfen hon yn ddarn mawr o ffuglen ac awgrymaf eich bod yn ei rhoi yn y lle yn eich tŷ lle'r ydych yn hoffi eistedd i lawr yn hamddenol a darllen ffuglen.

Y Llywydd: Y cwestiwn yw bod cytuno ar y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, mae'r

The Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Are there any objections? I see that there are

cynnig heb ei ddiwygio, y cynnig yn ei ffurf wreiddiol, wedi ei basio.

none. Therefore, the unamended motion, the motion in its original form, is agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro (William Graham) i'r Gadair am 4.01 p.m.
The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer (William Graham) took the Chair at 4.01 p.m.*

Dadl Fer a Ohiriwyd ers 24 Chwefror 2010 Short Debate Postponed from 24 February 2010

Cymru Wledig—yn Chwarae rhan mewn Chwyldro Ynni Cymunedol? Rural Wales—Playing a Part in a Community Energy Revolution?

Mick Bates: It is a shame, but it will be a very short debate, because there is no Minister here to respond. However, I hope that, by the end of this debate, we will have identified an opportunity to create wealth in Wales. That is what this debate is all about. I have received a request from Angela Burns for one minute to contribute to this debate, which, of course, I agree to.

In times of recession, enterprise and innovation become key survival tools for Welsh business. The term 'enterprise', for me, creates a vision of sustainability, of communities working together to become stronger—people working towards a common goal. In this debate, I want to put forward the case for encouraging more of our communities to create an income stream from energy production, whether heat or electricity. Part of my motivation for this is that I have been deeply concerned over the years by the growth in Wales of a public sector economy that rules out enterprise and, in particular, social enterprise, which can provide sustainability and viability to many of our communities.

Some communities already work to produce energy in order to provide benefits. In my constituency, a lovely community called Carno works with the local windfarm developer and has recently installed a wood pellet boiler to reduce energy costs for its community centre. In Llanwddyn, the local community had the first woodchip community heating scheme. It heats a school, which has unfortunately now closed, the community centre and all of the houses

Mick Bates: Yn anffodus, bydd hon yn ddadl fer iawn, am nad oes Gweinidog yma i ymateb. Fodd bynnag, gobeithio, erbyn diwedd y ddadl, y byddwn wedi nodi cyfle i greu cyfoeth yng Nghymru. Dyna yw prif fyrdwn y ddadl hon. Mae Angela Burns wedi gofyn am un funud i gyfrannu at y ddadl, ac yr wyf wrth gwrs yn derbyn ei chais.

Mewn cyfnodau o ddirwasgiad, bydd menter ac arloesedd yn dod yn ddulliau allweddol o oroesi i fyd busnes yng Nghymru. I mi, mae'r term 'menter' yn creu gweledigaeth o gynaliadwyedd, o gymunedau'n cydweithio â'i gilydd er mwyn dod yn gryfach—pobl yn gweithio tuag at nod cyffredin. Yn y ddadl hon, hoffwn gyflwyno'r achos dros annog mwy o'n cymunedau i greu ffrwd incwm o gynhyrchu ynni, boed yn wres neu'n drydan. Yr hyn sydd wedi fy nghymhell yn rhannol yw fy mhryder difrifol dros y blynyddoedd am dwf economi sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, sy'n diystyru menter, a menter gymdeithasol yn enwedig, a all gynnig cynaliadwyedd a hyfywedd i nifer o'n cymunedau.

Mae rhai cymunedau eisoes yn gweithio i gynhyrchu ynni i ddarparu manteision. Yn fy etholaeth i, mae cymuned hyfryd o'r enw Carno wrthi'n gweithio gyda datblygwr y fferm wynt leol, ac mae wedi gosod boeler pelenni coed yn ddiweddar er mwyn lleihau costau ynni yn ei chanolfan gymunedol. Yn Llanwddyn, mabwysiadodd y gymuned leol y cynllun gwresogi cymunedol cyntaf i ddefnyddio naddion pren. Mae'n gwresogi ysgol, sydd wedi cau'n anffodus erbyn hyn,

around it. We also have two schools that have photovoltaic panels on the roof.

However, I would like to see more than just heating for a few schools; I would like to see individuals, communities and every public building have a source of income. I would like to see communities own the means of energy production. There is a familiar bit of philosophy behind that.

Often, enterprise has been stifled by Government policies and red tape. For too long, small-scale renewable energy development has been stifled by the lack of co-ordination between central Government and local government. I will highlight that in a moment, but that is partly because of the planning system and Government encouragement. If you want to see the difference, just put ‘community energy Scotland’ and then ‘community energy Wales’ into Google. You will see a series of Scottish communities in the links that have already developed their own energy production. What an opportunity that is. We are at the dawn of a revolution for communities, because in the Energy Bill at Westminster, feed-in tariffs were introduced, or, as they are also called, clean energy cash-back schemes. These offer new possibilities for individuals, businesses and, in particular, communities, all of which can generate a real income stream. In this recession, we are all aware that less and less support is available to our communities. Currently, much of the criticism of Communities First is that it has never been economically based—there is no real enterprise in it.

Energy generation has been a controversial subject for many years, but the evidence for climate change is there and is growing, as is our desire to produce clean, green energy. Energy production with few or no carbon emissions is good for communities and for our environment, so it is a win-win all round. Feed-in tariffs will stimulate this desire, provided that there is an economic incentive to businesses, individuals, and communities

ynghyd â'r ganolfan gymunedol a'r holl dai o'i hamgylch. Mae gennym ddwy ysgol hefyd sydd â phaneli ffotofoltäig ar eu toeau.

Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld mwy na systemau gwresogi ar gyfer rhai ysgolion yn unig; hoffwn weld unigolion, cymunedau a phob adeilad cyhoeddus yn cael eu ffynhonnell eu hunain o incwm. Hoffwn weld cymunedau'n berchen ar y dulliau cynhyrchu ynni. Mae ychydig athroniaeth gyfarwydd yn gefndir i hynny.

Yn aml bydd menter wedi'i llesteirio gan bolisiau a biwrocratiaeth Llywodraeth. Mae gwaith datblygu ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach wedi'i lesteirio ers gormod o amser gan ddiffyg cydgysylltu rhwng Llywodraeth ganolog a llywodraeth leol. Byddaf yn tynnu sylw at hynny yn y man, ond mae'n rhannol oherwydd y system gynllunio ac anogaeth ar ran y Llywodraeth. Os ydych am weld y gwahaniaeth, rhowch y geiriau ‘community energy Scotland’ ac yna ‘community energy Wales’ yn Google. Yn y dolenni cyswllt, fe welwch gyfres o gymunedau yn yr Alban sydd eisoes wedi datblygu eu dulliau eu hunain o gynhyrchu ynni. Mae'n gyfle gwych. Yr ydym ar drothwy chwyldro i gymunedau, oherwydd yn y Mesur Ynni yn San Steffan cyflwynwyd tariffau bwydo i mewn, neu gynlluniau arian yn ôl am ynni glân, fel y'u gelwir hefyd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnig posibiliadau newydd i unigolion, busnesau, a chymunedau'n enwedig, y gall pob un ohonynt gynhyrchu ffrwd wirioneddol o incwm. Yn y dirwasgiad hwn, yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol bod llai a llai o gymorth ar gael i'n cymunedau. Ar hyn o bryd, mae llawer o'r feirniadaeth o Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ymwneud â'r ffaith nad yw'r rhaglen erioed wedi'i seilio ar faterion economaidd—nid oes menter wirioneddol yn y rhaglen.

Mae cynhyrchu ynni wedi bod yn bwnc llosg ers nifer o flynyddoedd, ond mae'r dystiolaeth am y newid yn yr hinsawdd ar gael ac yn tyfu, fel ein hawydd ni i gynhyrchu ynni gwyrdd a glân. Mae cynhyrchu ynni heb lawer o allyriadau carbon, os o gwbl, yn dda i gymunedau ac i'n hamgylchedd a phawb, felly, ar eu hennill. Bydd tariffau bwydo i mewn yn ysgogi'r awydd hwn, ar yr amod bod cymhellant

to install their own means of energy production. That will help Wales to move towards its 4 TWh target by 2020. It will also help the UK to move towards its target of having 15 per cent of its energy from renewable sources. It is a golden opportunity for us to promote this concept, especially as the UK and Wales are lagging behind, standing twenty-fifth out of 27 European countries when it comes to producing renewable energy. The European average is 14 per cent; we have 5 per cent. In Germany, the feed-in tariff scheme introduced in 1990 has led to a €25 billion market, with 250,000 people employed in the renewable energy sector.

This cash-back scheme, which Ed Miliband announced recently, aims to lead to the production of 2 per cent of our energy from microgeneration by 2020. A more generous tariff for small producers would see more people getting involved. We could have raised it to 6 per cent—by the way, that would be equivalent to two large power stations.

In Wales, feed-in tariffs, combined with community-scale renewable energy grants and feasibility studies, present quite an opportunity for many people. However, as you will have seen in the energy action plan released by the Government recently, only 26 communities in the whole of Wales will benefit from that investment. I want more. In rural areas, you could have communities all over Wales benefiting. Let us aim for 200, not just 26. I want to see landowners and communities owning this energy. There are practical problems, however. Despite the innovative renewable energy production and energy-saving sections of Glastir, it is unclear at the moment, because the Government has not answered my questions, whether farmers who receive a grant under the scheme to install energy generation systems will also be able to receive the feed-in tariff. There is currently considerable doubt as to whether any business or individual in receipt of a grant will also be able to claim the feed-in tariff.

economaidd i fusnesau, unigolion a chymunedau i osod eu dulliau eu hunain o gynhyrchu ynni. Bydd hynny'n helpu Cymru i symud tuag at ei tharged o 4 TWh erbyn 2020. Bydd hefyd yn helpu'r DU i symud tuag at ei tharged o gael 15 y cant o'i hynni o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy. Mae'n gyfle euraidd inni hyrwyddo'r cysyniad hwn, yn enwedig gan fod y DU a Chymru ar ei hôl hi, a'u bod yn y pumed safle ar hugain o blith 27 o wledydd Ewropeaidd o ran cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy. Y cyfartaledd Ewropeaidd yw 14 y cant; mae gennym ni 5 y cant. Yn yr Almaen, mae'r cynllun tariffau bwydo i mewn a gyflwynwyd yn 1990 wedi arwain at farchnad sy'n werth €25 biliwn, gyda 250,000 o bobl yn cael eu cyflogi yn y sector ynni adnewyddadwy.

Mae'r cynllun hwn o gael arian yn ôl a gyhoeddwyd gan Ed Miliband yn ddiweddar yn ceisio arwain at gynhyrchu 2 y cant o'n hynni o ficrogynhyrchu erbyn 2020. Byddai tariff mwy hael ar gyfer cynhyrchwyr bach yn annog mwy o bobl i gymryd rhan. Gallem fod wedi codi'r ganran i 6 y cant—gyda llaw, byddai hynny'n gyfwerth â dwy orsaf bŵer fawr.

Yng Nghymru, mae tariffau bwydo i mewn, o'u cyfuno â grantiau ynni adnewyddadwy cymunedol ac astudiaethau dichonoldeb, yn gyfle gwych i lawer o bobl. Fodd bynnag, byddwch wedi gweld yn y cynllun gweithredu ynni a gyhoeddwyd gan y Llywodraeth yn ddiweddar mai 26 yn unig o gymunedau ledled Cymru a fydd yn elwa o'r buddsoddiad hwnnw. Yr wyf am weld mwy. Mewn ardaloedd gwledig gallai cymunedau ym mhob cwr o Gymru elwa ohono. Dylem anelu at 200, nid dim ond 26. Yr wyf am weld tîrfeddianwyr a chymunedau'n berchen ar yr ynni hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae yna broblemau ymarferol. Er gwaethaf adrannau Glastir ar gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy arloesol ac arbed ynni, nid yw'n glir ar hyn o bryd, am nad yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ateb fy nghwestiynau, a fydd ffermwyr sy'n cael grant i osod systemau cynhyrchu ynni dan y cynllun hwn yn gallu cael y tariff bwydo i mewn hefyd. Mae cryn amheuaeth ar hyn o bryd a fydd busnes neu unigolyn sy'n cael grant hefyd yn gallu hawlio'r tariff bwydo i mewn.

Schools are in a similar position. I am currently working with a school, and we cannot clarify whether, if we install photovoltaics on the roof, the school will be able to claim the money, or whether it will be the local authority, which owns the building, that can claim the feed-in tariff. These are important questions, particularly in a time of recession, when this offers an opportunity for communities, businesses, and schools to earn money.

There is another fly in the ointment for small-scale schemes, namely those under 50 kW. Hydro power is a particular point in case. In mid Wales, we have massive potential in hydro power. It offers an important form of diversification for farmers. The feed-in tariff proposal includes a requirement for all schemes under 50 kW to use equipment that has been accredited under the microgeneration certification scheme and fitted by an accredited installer. However, there are only four accredited hydro technology installers in the whole of UK, none of them in Wales. You can all see the problem here: farmers and landowners can do much of the work themselves as they have suitable equipment and resources, but they will not be accredited, and so they will not be eligible for feed-in tariffs. Also, there is a limited range of accredited equipment. In small hydro schemes, there are many types of turbines, many of which are built to suit specific sites. I urge the Government—I will send a copy of this debate to the Minister—to answer these questions. It is crucial that the accreditation requirement for hydro schemes under 50 kW is either not implemented or radically adjusted, or the large-scale resources offered by local small-scale renewable energy systems will go to waste. So, feed-in tariffs are bittersweet for many people.

4.10 p.m.

Underlying all these new schemes is the problem of the planning process. I was recently contacted by a constituent who has been waiting for months for a pre-

Mae ysgolion mewn sefyllfa debyg. Yr wyf yn gweithio gydag ysgol ar hyn o bryd, ac ni allwn gadarnhau, os byddwn yn gosod paneli ffotofoltäig ar y to, ai'r ysgol a fydd yn gallu hawlio'r arian ynteu'r awdurdod lleol, sy'n berchen ar yr adeilad, a fydd yn gallu hawlio'r tariff bwydo i mewn. Mae'r cwestiynau hyn yn rhai pwysig, yn enwedig mewn cyfnod o ddirwasgiad, a hwn yn gyfle i gymunedau, busnesau ac ysgolion ennill arian.

Mae drwg arall yn y caws i gynlluniau bach, sef cynlluniau dan 50 kW. Mae ynni dŵr yn bwynt perthnasol yn yr achos hwn. Yn y canolbarth mae potensial enfawr i gynhyrchu ynni dŵr. Mae'n ddull pwysig o arallgyfeirio i ffermwyr. Mae'r cynnig ar dariffau bwydo i mewn yn cynnwys gofyniad i bob cynllun dan 50kW ddefnyddio offer sydd wedi'u hachredu dan y cynllun ardstio microgynhyrchu ac wedi'u gosod gan gyfleuster achrededig. Fodd bynnag, dim ond pedwar cyfleuster achrededig ar gyfer gosod technoleg ynni dŵr sydd ar gael yn y DU gyfan, ac nid oes yr un ar gael yng Nghymru. Gallwch i gyd weld y broblem yn y fan hon: gall ffermwyr a thirfeddianwyr wneud llawer o'r gwaith eu hunain oherwydd bod ganddynt offer ac adnoddau addas, ond ni fyddant wedi'u hachredu, ac ni fyddant, felly, yn gymwys ar gyfer y tariffau bwydo i mewn. Yn ogystal, ystod gyfyngedig o offer achrededig sydd ar gael. Mewn cynlluniau ynni dŵr bach mae nifer o wahanol fathau o dyrbinau, nifer ohonynt wedi'u hadeiladu er mwyn gweddu i safleoedd penodol. Anogaf y Llywodraeth—byddaf yn anfon copi o'r ddadl hon at y Gweinidog—i ateb y cwestiynau hyn. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r broses o weithredu'r gofyniad achredu ar gyfer cynlluniau ynni dŵr dan 50kW naill ai gael ei gohirio neu gael ei haddasu'n sylfaenol, neu bydd yr adnoddau mawr a gynigir gan systemau ynni adnewyddadwy bach lleol yn cael eu gwastraffu. Mae tariffau bwydo i mewn yn ddewis chwerwfelys i nifer o bobl, felly.

Mae problem y broses gynllunio yn gefndir i'r holl gynlluniau newydd hyn. Cysylltodd etholwr â mi'n ddiweddar sydd wedi bod yn aros ers misoedd i gwblhau'r broses cyn

application—not the main application—for a small hydro scheme, which involved putting a seven inch pipe into a stream. Has the Minister said to the Environment Agency, ‘Let us make an assessment of these schemes, so that you are not subjecting someone who is developing an under 50 kW scheme, using a small pipe, to a process that you use to assess megaschemes?’

Similarly, the Government has committed in ‘One Wales’, which we have heard so much about today, to reviewing the planning system in technical advice note 8, which sets a limit of 5 MW for community schemes. They cannot be any bigger. Why not? If communities could develop schemes that are bigger than that, let them do so and earn money to benefit that community. If the Government is serious about the transformation of energy in communities, that limit must be removed.

Microgeneration must be made easier to access, as I have said. The challenges to obtaining grants and gaining feed-in tariffs must be removed. Feed-in tariffs cannot be another missed opportunity for the development of small-scale renewable energy, or the creation of energy hubs in rural communities. It must herald a real revolution for businesses, individuals and communities in Wales, particularly in rural Wales.

Taking action would benefit not only rural Wales, but the whole of Wales. There are excellent examples of community initiatives in urban areas, such as the Awel Aman Tawe or the Cwmclydach Community Development Trust in the Clydach vale, which will be installing two micro-hydro turbines and using the benefits to support the local area, supporting the community centre, the day nursery and sports café and giving employment to 20 people. That is the type of project that the Government should be encouraging in its energy plan.

There is still time to make these schemes more ambitious and more practical, and I urge the Government and the Minister to work with the Department of Energy and Climate Change in Westminster to ensure

ymgeisio—nid y prif gais—yng nghyswllt cynllun ynni dŵr bach, a oedd yn golygu gosod pibell saith modfedd mewn nant. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi dweud wrth Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, ‘Gadewch inni asesu'r cynlluniau hyn, fel na fyddwch yn gorfodi rhywun sy'n datblygu cynllun dan 50kW, gan ddefnyddio pibell fach, i ddilyn proses a ddefnyddiwyd i asesu cynlluniau enfawr?’

Yn yr un modd, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo yn ‘Cymru'n Un’, yr ydym wedi clywed cymaint o sôn amdano heddiw, i adolygu'r system gynllunio yn nodyn cyngor technegol 8, sy'n pennu uchafswm o 5 MW ar gyfer cynlluniau cymunedol. Ni allant fod yn fwy na hynny. Pam lai? Os gall cymunedau ddatblygu cynlluniau sy'n fwy na hynny, gadewch iddynt wneud, ac ennill arian a fydd o fantais i'r gymuned honno. Os yw'r Llywodraeth o ddifrif am weddnewid ynni mewn cymunedau, rhaid dileu'r uchafswm hwnnw.

Rhaid sicrhau ei bod yn haws dechrau microgynhyrchu, fel y dywedais. Rhaid dileu'r heriau sy'n ymwneud â chael grantiau a thariffau bwydo i mewn. Ni all y tariffau bwydo i mewn fod yn gyfle arall wedi ei golli i ddatblygu ynni adnewyddadwy ar raddfa fach, neu greu canolfannau ynni mewn cymunedau gwledig. Rhaid iddynt fod yn arwydd o chwyldro gwirioneddol i fusnesau, unigolion a chymunedau yng Nghymru, yn enwedig ardaloedd gwledig Cymru.

Byddai gweithredu o fudd nid yn unig i ardaloedd gwledig Cymru, ond i Gymru ben baladr. Ceir enghreifftiau gwych o fentrau cymunedol mewn ardaloedd trefol, megis Awel Aman Tawe neu Ymddiriedolaeth Datblygu Cymunedol Cwm Clydach yng nghwm Clydach, a fydd yn gosod dau dyrbin bach ynni dŵr ac yn defnyddio'r manteision i gynorthwyo'r ardal leol, cynorthwyo'r ganolfan gymunedol, y feithrinfa ddydd a chaffi chwaraeon, a rhoi gwaith i 20 o bobl. Dyna'r math o brosiect y dylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn ei annog yn ei gynllun ynni.

Mae amser o hyd i wneud y cynlluniau hyn yn fwy uchelgeisiol ac ymarferol, ac anogaf y Llywodraeth a'r Gweinidog i weithio gyda'r Adran Ynni a Newid Hinsawdd yn San Steffan i sicrhau y gellir manteisio i'r eithaf

that full advantage can be taken of this in the way that I have suggested. Only then will Wales benefit from the opportunities that the scheme will bring. We need to develop the skills and capacity to meet the demand so that we can create jobs and see our communities owning the means of energy production, which will benefit them for a minimum of 25 years. We need to harness this so that we can assist the survival of many Welsh communities that can play a part in this energy revolution. Let us put Wales in the lead, and not be in twenty-fifth place in Europe.

Angela Burns: I thank Mick Bates for allowing me time in his important debate. This is about winning hearts and minds, and one of my concerns is that the whole issue of climate change has taken a heck of a battering because of the farce that was the Copenhagen conference, because of the discrediting of a significant number of reports by leading institutions, and because of the vast number of new reports that are slowly beginning to bubble to the surface on the efficiency of wind power and so on. So, people are saying, 'Hang on a minute, guys, one minute you are saying that climate change is really important, but what about all this contrary stuff?' The levels of scepticism are extremely high.

One way of tackling that is to reach people through their pockets. People are trying to save, redeploy or conserve their money, and if we enable communities to profit from feed-in tariffs and club together to mutual benefit, helping themselves as individuals as well as helping their community, that is a way of subtly tackling climate change and helping to move on the debate without the great big thinking fist of this Government and the Government in Westminster always telling people what they should do. It is about winning hearts and minds, and using the carrot rather than the stick.

I appreciate that you raised legitimate concerns about what is happening with Glastir and who gets the money from these feed-in tariffs, because it should go back to local communities. I would like to see

ar hyn fel yr awgrymais. Nes gwneir hynny, ni fydd Cymru'n elwa o'r cyfleoedd a gynigir gan y cynllun. Mae angen inni ddatblygu'r sgiliau a'r capasiti i fodloni'r galw er mwyn inni allu creu swyddi a gweld ein cymunedau'n berchen ar ddulliau cynhyrchu ynni a fyddai o fudd iddynt am leiaf o 25 mlynedd. Mae angen inni fanteisio ar hyn, er mwyn inni allu cynorthwyo nifer o gymunedau yng Nghymru a all fod yn rhan o'r chwyldro ynni hwn i oroesi. Gadewch inni roi Cymru ar y blaen, yn hytrach na'i gadael yn y pumed safle ar hugain yn Ewrop.

Angela Burns: Diolch i Mick Bates am roi amser imi yn y ddadl bwysig hon. Mae a wnelo hyn ag ennill calonnau a meddyliau, ac un peth yr wyf yn pryderu yn ei gylch yw bod holl fater y newid yn yr hinsawdd wedi dioddef yn ddifrifol oherwydd ffars uwchgynhadledd Copenhagen, oherwydd bod nifer sylweddol o adroddiadau gan sefydliadau blaenllaw wedi'u tanseilio, ac oherwydd y nifer mawr o adroddiadau newydd sy'n dechrau ymddangos ar effeithlonrwydd ynni gwynt, ac yn y blaen. Mae pobl yn dweud, felly, 'Arhoswch funud, bois bach, yr ydych yn dweud un funud fod y newid yn yr hinsawdd yn wirioneddol bwysig, ond beth am yr holl ddadleuon sy'n gwrth-ddweud hynny?' Mae yna lawer iawn o amheuaeth.

Un ffordd i fynd i'r afael â hynny yw cyrraedd pobl drwy eu pocedi. Mae pobl yn ceisio cynilo, symud neu gadw'u harian, ac os byddwn yn galluogi cymunedau i elwa o dariffau bwydo i mewn, ac ymuno â'i gilydd er budd pawb, gan eu helpu eu hunain fel unigolion yn ogystal â helpu eu cymunedau, bydd yn ffordd o fynd i'r afael yn gynnil â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Bydd hefyd yn helpu symud y ddadl ymlaen, heb i'r Llywodraeth hon a'r Llywodraeth yn San Steffan bregethu a dweud byth a hefyd wrth bobl beth y dylent ei wneud. Mae a wnelo hyn ag ennill calonnau a meddyliau, a defnyddio abwyd yn hytrach na ffon.

Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi eich bod wedi mynegi pryderon dilys am yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda Glastir, a phwy sy'n cael yr arian o'r tariffau bwydo i mewn, oherwydd dylai'r arian fynd yn ôl i'r cymunedau lleol.

communities that have to have a windfarm in their back yard benefiting from it, instead of all the money being sucked up by Government, because they are the people who will have to put up with it. If we believe in devolution and decentralisation, we must empower communities and give people a reason to fight to mitigate the effects of climate change, even if they do not believe in it yet. If we can win part of that battle by using subtle techniques such as paying them every time that they save money, that will help. I thank you, and I will be most interested to see the Government's response to your debate, if it does respond to it.

Hoffwn weld cymunedau sy'n gorfod cael fferm wynt ar stepen eu drws yn elwa ohono, yn hytrach na gweld yr arian i gyd yn cael ei lyncu gan y Llywodraeth, oherwydd hwy yw'r bobl a fydd yn gorfod goddef y fferm wynt. Os ydym yn credu mewn datganoli, rhaid inni rymuso cymunedau, a rhoi rheswm i bobl ymladd dros liniaru effeithiau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd, hyd yn oed os nad ydynt yn credu ynddo eto. Os gallwn ennill rhan o'r frwydr honno drwy ddefnyddio dulliau cynnil o weithredu, megis eu talu bob tro wrth arbed arian, bydd hynny'n help. Diolch ichi, a bydd gennyf ddiddordeb mawr mewn gweld ymateb y Llywodraeth i'ch dadl, os bydd yn ymateb iddi.

The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:

The second short debate has been postponed to 21 April. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Mae'r ail ddadl fer wedi'i gohirio tan 21 Ebrill. Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.15 p.m.
The meeting ended at 4.15 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)