



Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
The National Assembly for Wales

Cofnod y Trafodion
The Record of Proceedings

Dydd Mawrth, 16 Mawrth 2010
Tuesday, 16 March 2010

Cynnwys Contents

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
28	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
28	Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement
41	Datganiad am Gymunedau yn Gyntaf Statement on Communities First
59	Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyllido Ysgolion (Cymru) 2010 Approval of the School Funding (Wales) Regulations 2010
69	Cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2010 Approval of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 (Repeal) (Wales) Order 2010
70	Glastir
91	Twristiaeth Tourism
120	Y Gyllideb Atodol The Supplementary Budget
131	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 1.30 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 1.30 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

Y Llywydd: Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog.

The Presiding Officer: Order for questions to the First Minister.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Local Health Board Areas

Q1 Brian Gibbons: Will the First Minister make a statement on how the new LHB areas will link in with spatial plan areas?
OAQ(3)2732(FM)

The First Minister (Carwyn Jones): Officers from the new LHBs will be contributing to the spatial plan work on collaborative projects, such as infrastructure and workforce planning. The objective is to ensure that national health service activities are linked into the wider planning for the region, and that partners' activities contribute to improving health.

Brian Gibbons: I am sure that you will agree that there is an urgent need to promote collaboration within our public bodies to maximise outcomes for citizens through better efficiency, better value for money, and to maximise capacity in delivery. Spatial plan areas were established to allow that to be done on a geographical basis. However, as the local health boards are establishing themselves, would you not agree that they provide an opportunity to be the main platform for future geographical collaboration, unless there are compelling reasons for some other configuration to be put into place?

The First Minister: I do not think that we should be too hung up on geography when it comes to collaboration—there will need to be collaboration within and outside of spatial plan areas. I would expect there to be collaboration across the public sector, whether through the local service boards or via the local health boards or with local authorities. Collaboration is crucial to ensure

Ardaloedd Byrddau Iechyd Lleol

C1 Brian Gibbons: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y bydd yr ardaloedd BILl newydd yn cyd-fynd ag ardaloedd cynlluniau gofodol?
OAQ(3)2732(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Carwyn Jones): Bydd swyddogion o'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd yn cyfrannu at waith y cynlluniau gofodol ar brosiectau cydweithredol, megis cynllunio seilwaith a chynllunio'r gweithlu. Y nod yw sicrhau bod gweithgareddau'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn cyd-fynd â gwaith cynllunio ehangach y rhanbarth, ac y bydd gweithgareddau'r partneriaid yn cyfrannu at wella iechyd.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod angen brys i hyrwyddo cydweithio o fewn ein cyrff cyhoeddus er mwyn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i ddinasyddion drwy well effeithlonrwydd, gwerth gwell am arian, ac er mwyn cynyddu i'r eithaf y capasiti o ran darparu gwasanaeth. Cafodd ardaloedd cynlluniau gofodol eu sefydlu er mwyn sicrhau y gwneir hynny'n ddaeryddol. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y byrddau iechyd lleol wrthi'n sefydlu eu hunain, oni fydddech yn cytuno eu bod yn rhoi cyfle i fod yn brif lwyfan ar gyfer cydweithio daeryddol yn y dyfodol, oni bai fod rhesymau da dros roi rhyw drefniant arall ar waith?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu y dylem ganolbwyntio gormod ar ddaeryddiaeth wrth ystyried cydweithio—bydd angen cydweithio o fewn ardaloedd cynlluniau gofodol a'r tu allan iddynt. Byddwn yn disgwyl y bydd cydweithio'n digwydd ar draws y sector cyhoeddus, pa un ai drwy'r byrddau gwasanaethau lleol neu'r byrddau iechyd lleol neu gydag awdurdodau lleol. Mae

greater efficiency in the public sector and better service delivery for our citizens.

Nick Ramsay: Much as I have a deep and enduring love for the Wales spatial plan—I carry a map of it around with me wherever I go to remind me of the merits of the plan; it is prettily coloured, as you can see—my postbag is not dominated by this issue, but by concerns about the national health service in Wales and certain areas where it is felt that the NHS in Wales has fallen behind the service in England. Only recently we had a debate on dementia services, about which there are serious concerns, and it now appears that many of the new local health boards will go considerably over budget in what are, as Brian Gibbons said, the early days of their lives. Can you give us an assurance that you will listen to what health professionals are telling you, and not get too hung up on data collection tools such as the Wales spatial plan when taking decisions about the health service, and that you will do what you can to ensure that the health service that the people of Wales will have in the future will be considerably better than that your Government has provided them in the past?

The First Minister: I can assure the people of Wales that the health service will continue to improve and will be far better than it was when we inherited it from the Conservative Government.

Janet Ryder: The west Cheshire/north-east Wales sub-regional strategy forecasts around 20,000 new dwellings between 2004 and 2021 for the Flintshire, Denbighshire and Wrexham areas. Can you tell me how the new Betsi Cadwaladar University Local Health Board is working with that plan and making sure that it has the doctors, dentists, nurses and health provision that will be needed to cope with 20,000 new dwellings?

The First Minister: Planning permission would need to be granted for those dwellings,

cydweithio'n hollbwysig er mwyn sicrhau mwy o effeithlonrwydd yn y sector cyhoeddus a darparu gwasanaeth gwell i'n dinasyddion.

Nick Ramsay: Er fy mod yn hoff iawn o gynllun gofodol Cymru—mae gennyf fap ohono yn fy mhoced lle bynnag yr af er mwyn fy atgoffa o rinweddau'r cynllun; mae wedi'i liwio'n ddel, fel y gwelwch—nid y mater hwn sy'n cael mwyaf o sylw yn y llythyrau a gaf, ond pryderon am y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru a rhai meysydd lle y teimlir nad yw'r GIG yng Nghymru yn gwneud cystal â'r gwasanaeth yn Lloegr. Yn ddiweddar cawsom ddadl ar wasanaethau demensia, y mae pryderon difrifol yn eu cylch, a bellach mae'n ymddangos y bydd llawer o'r byrddau iechyd lleol newydd yn mynd dros eu cyllidebau'n sylweddol yn nyddiau cynnar eu bodolaeth, yng ngeiriau Brian Gibbons. A allwch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn gwrando ar yr hyn y mae gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yn ei ddweud wrthy, ac na fyddwch yn canolbwyntio gormod ar ddulliau casglu data megis cynllun gofodol Cymru wrth wneud penderfyniadau ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, ac y byddwch yn gwneud popeth a allwch i sicrhau y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd a gynigir i bobl Cymru yn y dyfodol yn llawer gwell na'r hyn y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i ddarparu iddynt yn y gorffennol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf sicrhau pobl Cymru y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn parhau i wella ac y bydd yn llawer gwell nag a oedd pan wnaethom ei etifeddu gan Lywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr.

Janet Ryder: Mae strategaeth isranbarthol gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gorllewin Swydd Gaer yn rhagweld y codir tua 20,000 o anheddau newydd rhwng 2004 a 2021 yn ardaloedd sir y Flint, sir Ddinbych a Wrecsam. A allwch ddweud wrthyf sut y mae'r bwrdd newydd, Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr, yn gweithio gyda'r cynllun hwnnw ac yn sicrhau bod ganddo'r meddygon, y deintyddion, y nyrsys a'r ddarpariaeth iechyd y bydd eu hangen i ymdopi â 20,000 o anheddau newydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn gyntaf oll, byddai angen cael caniatâd cynllunio ar gyfer yr

first of all. As you know, mention in the spatial plan does not imply an immediate grant of planning permission for any such dwellings. In considering whether planning permission should be given to any dwellings in the future, it is important that there should be services in place for those who might live in those dwellings. There are areas of Wales where there is an identified need for more homes, but we should not assume that the identification of a figure in the spatial plan would necessarily mean that planning permission would be automatically be granted for that number.

Illegal Substances

Q2 Mohammad Asghar: Will the First Minister make a statement on the use of illegal substances in Wales? OAQ(3)2730(FM)

The First Minister: The substance misuse strategy for Wales, ‘Working Together to Reduce Harm’, is supported by more than £52.6 million of funding for 2010-11. Among its key aims are tackling the availability of illegal drugs and protecting individuals and communities.

Mohammad Asghar: I am encouraged by your statement, First Minister. Will you join me in congratulating Gwent Police on its recent work, having seized large quantities of illegal drugs in a series of dawn raids across Newport, and on its ongoing hard work and heavy involvement in operation Rebus, which targets the supply of heroin into Wales? However, such news also raises concerns that considerable amounts of illegal drugs have been and, in some cases, continue to be pushed on our streets. I do not need to highlight how drugs can ruin people’s lives and cause horrendous damage to communities. First Minister, last year, almost 10 per cent of people in Wales admitted to taking some form of illegal drug, and the figure was almost 22 per cent for 16 to 24-year-olds—an increase on previous years. How concerned are you that the trend of drug misuse in Wales, previously heading downwards, reversed last year? What assurances can you give that the Welsh

aneddau hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, nid yw’r hyn y sonnir amdano yn y cynllun gofodol yn awgrymu rhoi caniatâd cynllunio ar unwaith ar gyfer unrhyw anheddau o’r fath. Wrth ystyried a ddylid rhoi caniatâd cynllunio ai peidio ar gyfer unrhyw anheddau yn y dyfodol, mae’n bwysig sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ar waith ar gyfer y bobl hynny a fydd efallai’n byw yn yr anheddau hynny. Ceir ardaloedd yng Nghymru lle y dangoswyd bod angen mwy o dai arnynt, ond ni ddylem gymryd y byddai pennu ffigur yn y cynllun gofodol yn golygu y rhoddid caniatâd cynllunio’n awtomatig ar gyfer y nifer hwnnw o reidrydd.

Sylweddau Anghyfreithlon

C2 Mohammad Asghar: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio sylweddau anghyfreithlon yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2730(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Caiff strategaeth camddefnyddio sylweddau Cymru, ‘Gweithio Gyda’n Gilydd i Leihau Niwed’, gefnogaeth o dros £52.6 miliwn ar gyfer 2010-11. Mae mynd i’r afael â pha mor hawdd yw cael gafael ar gyffuriau anghyfreithlon ac amddiffyn unigolion a chymunedau ymysg un o’i brif nodau.

Mohammad Asghar: Mae eich datganiad yn fy nghalonogi, Brif Weinidog. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch Heddlu Gwent ar ei waith yn ddiweddar, ar ôl atafaelu llawer iawn o gyffuriau anghyfreithlon mewn cyfres o gyrchoedd gyda’r wawr ledled Casnewydd, ac ar ei waith caled parhaus a’i gyfraniad helaeth at ymgyrch Rebus, sy’n targedu’r cyflenwad o heroin a ddaw i Gymru? Fodd bynnag, mae newyddion o’r fath yn codi pryderon bod niferoedd sylweddol o gyffuriau anghyfreithlon wedi cael eu gwthio ar ein strydoedd, a bod hynny’n parhau i ddigwydd mewn rhai achosion. Nid oes angen imi dynnu sylw at sut y gall cyffuriau ddifrodi bywydau pobl ac achosi difrod dychrynlyd mewn cymunedau. Brif Weinidog, y llynedd, cyfaddefodd bron 10 y cant o bobl yng Nghymru eu bod wedi cymryd rhyw fath o gyffur anghyfreithlon, ac yr oedd y ffigur bron yn 22 y cant mewn pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 24 oed—cynnydd o’i gymharu â’r blynyddoedd blaenorol. Pa mor

Assembly Government is doing all that it can to tackle the availability of illegal drugs in this country?

The First Minister: There are two elements to this: the dealers and the users. The users quite often have a medical problem and need to be treated accordingly, which is why we have made money available for substance misuse treatment. However, dealers are criminals—it is as simple as that. Operation Tarian has had a significant impact on the drugs market in Wales. Operation Rebus, which you mentioned, resulted in the seizure of 7 kg of heroin from an area between Birmingham and south-east Wales, and the arrest of 13 people, and operation Atlanta, which concerns the supply of heroin in south-west Wales, has resulted in the seizure of 2.2 kg of heroin. We work closely with the Serious Organised Crime Agency in order to do all that we can to assist in the work of clamping down on those who would push illegal drugs on our young people.

Eleanor Burnham: We all know that substance misuse refers not only to drugs, but to alcohol. In your comprehensive document, ‘Working Together to Reduce Harm’, published in 2008, which you have just referred to, I note that the economic and social cost of alcohol and class-A drug misuse is estimated to be as high as £2 billion each year. What exactly is your Government doing to try to offset the damage that the Labour Party at Westminster did by introducing 24-hour drinking, which many medical professionals suggest increased the cost to the NHS?

The First Minister: You seemed to group alcohol and class-A drugs then, but they are substantially different in their effects. On 24-hour drinking, we have already pledged to help with substance misuse, and we have ring-fenced £17 million for 2010-11 to provide funding for local health boards to

bryderus yr ydych fod y duedd o gamddefnyddio cyffuriau yng Nghymru, a oedd yn gostwng cyn hyn, wedi cynyddu y llynedd? Sut y gallwch sicrhau bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwneud popeth a all i fynd i'r afael â pha mor hawdd yw cael gafael ar gyffuriau anghyfreithlon yn y wlad hon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ceir dwy elfen i hyn: y delwyr a'r defnyddwyr. Yn aml, mae gan y defnyddwyr broblem feddygol ac mae angen eu trin yn unol â hynny, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod arian ar gael ar gyfer triniaeth ar gyfer camddefnyddio sylweddau. Fodd bynnag, mae delwyr yn droseddwyr—mae mor syml â hynny. Mae Ymgyrch Tarian wedi cael effaith sylweddol ar y farchnad gyffuriau yng Nghymru. Mae Ymgyrch Rebus, y soniasoch amdani, wedi arwain at atafaelu 7 kg o heroin o ardal rhwng Birmingham a de-ddwyrain Cymru, ac at arestio 13 o bobl, ac mae ymgyrch Atlanta, sy'n ymwneud â'r cyflenwad heroin yn ne-orllewin Cymru, wedi arwain at atafaelu 2.2 kg o heroin. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r Asiantaeth Troseddau Cyfundrefnol Difrifol er mwyn gwneud popeth a allwn i helpu'r gwaith o fynd i'r afael â'r rhai a fyddai'n gwthio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon ar ein pobl ifanc.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr ydym oll yn gwybod nad yw camddefnyddio sylweddau'n cyfeirio at gyffuriau'n unig, mae'n cyfeirio at alcohol hefyd. Yn eich dogfen gynhwysfawr, ‘Gweithio Gyda'n Gilydd i Leihau Niwed’, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2008, yr ydych newydd gyfeirio ati, sylwaf yr amcangyfrifir bod cost camddefnyddio alcohol a chyffuriau dosbarth A mor uchel â £2 biliwn y flwyddyn. Beth yn union y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud er mwyn ceisio lleihau'r difrod a wnaeth y Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan drwy gyflwyno yfed 24 awr, y mae llawer o weithwyr meddygol proffesiynol yn awgrymu ei fod wedi arwain at fwy o gostau i'r GIG?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddech fel petaech yn rhoi alcohol a chyffuriau dosbarth A yn yr un grŵp, ond mae eu heffeithiau'n wahanol iawn. O ran yfed 24 awr, yr ydym eisoes wedi addo helpu gyda chamddefnyddio sylweddau, ac yr ydym wedi neilltuo £17 miliwn ar gyfer 2010-11 i ddarparu cyllid i

tackle substance misuse. We remain committed to not just dealing with the misuse of illegal drugs, to which the original question referred, but with the effects of alcohol and tobacco.

Personal Spending Commitments

Q3 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne): What assessment has the First Minister made of the impact on the Welsh Assembly Government's budget of the personal spending commitments that he has made? OAQ(3)2750(FM)

The First Minister: During my leadership campaign, I made clear the priorities that would shape my time as First Minister. I have begun the work of building on our successes to date and delivering my vision. That work will take shape over the coming months and years, including informing the budget for 2011-12.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that response, First Minister. Along with the Minister for Health and Social Services, no doubt, I have been scrutinising some of these promises, and many of them make sense. However, I wish to press you on one in particular, which relates to my region, and that is the reopening of the Aberystwyth to Carmarthen railway line, and the practicality of that. It is dear to my own heart, and I wonder whether it is to be progressed, bearing in mind that the Ystwyth Trail follows 15 miles of that line. The trail is a popular route for walkers and cyclists, and is partly funded with European funds.

The First Minister: You are right to point out that it is very much a long-term issue, and I certainly agree with that. However, the commitment refers to looking at the feasibility of it, given that there is no doubt that it is a major project. It would have a major cost, which is clearly uppermost in our minds at the moment. However, work to see whether it can be done can certainly be taken

fyrddau iechyd lleol fynd i'r afael â chamddefnyddio sylweddau. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd nid yn unig i ddelio â chamddefnyddio cyffuriau anghyfreithlon, yr oedd y cwestiwn gwreiddiol yn cyfeirio ato, ond ag effeithiau alcohol a thybaco hefyd.

Ymrwymadau Gwariant Personol

C3 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne): Pa asesiad y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith yr ymrwymadau gwariant personol y mae wedi'u gwneud ar gyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ(3)2750(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ystod fy ymgyrch i fod yn arweinydd fy mhlaidd, nodais yn glir fy mlaenoriaethau ar gyfer fy nghyfnod fel Prif Weinidog. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dechrau ar y gwaith o adeiladu ar ein llwyddiannau hyd yn hyn a chyflawni fy ngweledigaeth. Byddwn yn datblygu'r gwaith hwnnw yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynnyddoedd nesaf, gan gynnwys llywio'r gyllideb ar gyfer 2011-12.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am yr ymateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf fi, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae'n siŵr, wedi bod yn craffu ar rai o'r addewidion hyn, ac mae nifer ohonynt yn synhwyrol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn dymuno pwysu arnoch ynghylch un addewid penodol sydd yn berthnasol i'm rhanbarth, sef ailagor y rheilffordd rhwng Aberystwyth a Chaerfyrddin, a pha mor ymarferol fyddai gwneud hynny. Mae'n agos iawn at fy nghalon, ac yr wyf yn meddwl tybed a fydd y prosiect yn cael ei ddatblygu, ac ystyried bod Llwybr Ystwyth yn dilyn y rheilffordd honno am 15 milltir. Mae'r llwybr yn boblogaidd gyda cherddwyr a beicwyr, a chaiff ei ariannu'n rhannol gan gronfeydd Ewropeaidd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn gwbl gywir wrth dynnu sylw at y ffaith ei fod yn fater hirdymor, ac yr wyf yn bendant yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'r addewid yn cyfeirio at edrych ar ddichonoldeb y prosiect, gan nad oes amheuaeth nad yw'n brosiect mawr. Byddai cost sylweddol gyda'r prosiect, sef yr ystyriaeth uchaf yn ein meddyliau ar hyn o bryd, yn amlwg. Fodd bynnag, gellir yn

forward.

sic fwrw ymlaen â gwaith i weld a ellir ei wneud ai peidio.

1.40 p.m.

David Lloyd: Yn eich maniffesto personol, Brif Weinidog, yr oeddech yn sôn am yr angen i ehangu gwasanaethau meddygon teulu—er enghraifft, i feddygfeydd fod ar agor ar nosweithiau a phenwythnosau. Pa symud a fu yn hynny o beth, a pha asesiad a wnaed o'r arian ychwanegol y byddai ei angen i gyflogi staff ychwanegol i gyflawni'r dyheadau hynny?

David Lloyd: In your personal manifesto, First Minister, you mentioned the need to expand general practitioner services—for example, so that surgeries are open in the evenings and at weekends. What progress has been made on that, and what assessment has been made of the additional funding that would be required in order to employ additional staff to achieve those aspirations?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn edrych i weithio gyda meddygon teulu er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn agor eu meddygfeydd ar adegau sydd yn llawer mwy cyfleus i'r cyhoedd, sy'n talu am y gwasanaeth yn y lle cyntaf. Byddem hefyd eisiau gweithio gyda phob meddygfa yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod llawer mwy o wasanaethau ar gael ar-lein. Byddai hynny'n cynnwys gallu cael presgripsiwn a gwneud apwyntiadau. Mae sawl meddygfa yn cynnig hynny eisoes, ond mae'n bwysig sicrhau ei fod yn cael ei gynnig ar draws Cymru.

The First Minister: We are looking to collaborate with GPs in order to ensure that they open their surgeries at times that are much more convenient for the public, which pays for the service in the first place. We would also want to work with every GP surgery in Wales to ensure that many more services are available online. That would include obtaining a prescription and making appointments. There are several GP surgeries that offer this already, but it is important to ensure that this is offered across Wales.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams): First Minister, never mind your personal spending commitments, it seems increasingly likely that the Government will struggle to meet its current spending commitments, given the squeeze on public expenditure that we can expect in years to come. What steps is your Government taking to prepare the Welsh Assembly Government and other service providers for that shrinkage in expenditure?

Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams): Brif Weinidog, ni waeth am eich ymrwymadau gwariant personol, ymddengys yn fwyfwy tebygol y caiff y Llywodraeth drafferth cyflawni ei hymrwymadau gwariant cyfredol, o ystyried y wasgfa ar wariant cyhoeddus y gallwn ei disgwyl yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf. Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd gan eich Llywodraeth er mwyn paratoi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a darparwyr gwasanaethau eraill ar gyfer y lleihad hwnnw yn y gwariant?

The First Minister: You are quite right to point out that there will be a difficult time ahead in the next financial year and, indeed, for the years beyond that. That is something that I would not want to hide in any way. However, it is important to point out that the budget process has already begun and we are looking to see what areas will need to be cut back in future years. We are also looking to work with the public sector to ensure that it becomes more efficient in the way that it works and looks to make efficiencies. Indeed,

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn gwbl gywir wrth dynnu sylw at y ffaith y bydd cyfnod anodd o'n blaenau yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf ac, yn wir, ar gyfer y blynyddoedd y tu hwnt i hynny. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth na fyddai arnaf eisiau ei gelu o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig imi dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith bod proses y gyllideb eisoes wedi dechrau a'n bod yn ystyried pa feysydd y bydd angen cwtdogi arnynt yn y dyfodol. Yr ydym hefyd yn gobeithio gweithio gyda'r sector cyhoeddus er mwyn

we will have to look at the way in which we work and at our internal expenditure in order to cut back on that. We cannot be seen to be telling others that they must become more efficient if we are not prepared to do the same.

Kirsty Williams: I am pleased to hear that, First Minister. You must have been severely disappointed to read the findings of the Wales Audit Office report this morning, which gives clear examples of how existing policy has failed to take advantage of the opportunities to deliver services in as cost-effective and efficient a manner as possible. For instance, it says that maternity services have no coherent strategic vision, that Communities First lacks a sufficient analysis of resources to deliver the stated objectives, and that the Forestry Commission has failed to align its staff objectives with its corporate objectives. You have an opportunity to raise your game and that of people delivering services on behalf of the people of Wales. Could you outline what steps you have taken to do that since taking office?

The First Minister: We always read with interest what the Auditor General for Wales says, but I refer you back to the fact that we have already held a public services summit. That was not a self-contained event; we expect to see efficiencies as a result of it. We want to see more collaboration across the public sector, particularly in local authorities. If collaboration does not happen voluntarily, we will have to ensure that it occurs in other ways. However, it is certainly not possible for local authorities and others in the public sector to continue in the same way as before; collaboration must happen in order to deliver greater efficiencies and a better service.

Kirsty Williams: But what confidence can

sicrhau bod y sector yn dod yn fwy effeithlon yn y ffordd y mae'n gweithio a'i fod yn ceisio gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Yn wir, bydd yn rhaid inni edrych ar y ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio ac ar ein gwariant mewnol er mwyn cwtdogi ar hynny. Ni allwn ymddangos fel petaem yn dweud wrth eraill bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn fwy effeithlon os nad ydym ni'n barod i wneud yr un fath.

Kirsty Williams: Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn siomedig iawn ar ôl darllen casgliadau adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru y bore yma, sy'n rhoi enghreifftiau clir o sut y mae polisïau sydd eisoes yn bodoli wedi methu manteisio ar y cyfleoedd i ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn modd sydd mor gost-effeithiol ac effeithlon ag sy'n bosibl. Er enghraifft, dywed nad oes gan wasanaethau mamolaeth weledigaeth strategol gydynol, nad yw Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn dadansoddi adnoddau yn ddigonol er mwyn cyflawni'r amcanion sydd wedi cael eu datgan, a bod y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth wedi methu cysoni amcanion ei staff â'i amcanion corfforaethol. Mae gennych gyfle i godi eich safonau chi a safonau pobl sy'n darparu gwasanaethau ar ran pobl Cymru. A allech amlinellu pa gamau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd i wneud hynny ers ichi ymgymryd â'r swydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym bob amser yn darllen yr hyn a ddywed Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru gyda diddordeb, ond yr wyf yn eich cyfeirio'n ôl at y ffaith ein bod eisoes wedi cynnal uwchgynhadledd ynghylch gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid oedd yr uwchgynhadledd yn ddigwyddiad cyflawn ynddo'i hun; yr ydym yn disgwyl gweld arbedion effeithlonrwydd o ganlyniad iddi. Yr ydym am weld mwy o gydweithio ar draws y sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig mewn awdurdodau lleol. Os na fydd cydweithio'n digwydd o wirfodd, bydd yn rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yn digwydd mewn ffyrdd eraill. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr nad yw'n bosibl i awdurdodau lleol nac eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus barhau yn yr un ffordd ag o'r blaen; mae'n rhaid i gydweithio ddigwydd er mwyn gallu sicrhau gwell arbedion effeithlonrwydd a darparu gwell gwasanaeth.

Kirsty Williams: Ond pa mor hyderus y gall

the people of Wales have that your Government can deliver on this agenda? This morning's report contained multiple examples of how your Government has, to date, failed to take advantage of streamlining services and promoting cost-effective services. One of the reasons is that you have not got to grips with public procurement—the Government does not properly monitor its schemes and has failed to take account of the need to look at outcomes rather than input. You have had an opportunity, as a Government, over the last three years to get to grips with this. You say that it is important, but what steps will you take to combat the criticisms contained in this morning's report?

The First Minister: An efficiency and innovation board has been set up, which will be chaired by the Minister for Business and Budget. Its remit will be to look at providing more efficiencies in the public sector. A working group of Ministers has also been set up to carefully examine how we spend our money internally in the Welsh Assembly Government. I believe that those two steps are exceptionally important in identifying and carrying out efficiency savings within the Government.

Priorities

Q4 Alun Cairns: How does the First Minister balance his priorities between the different Welsh Assembly Government departments? OAQ(3)2744(FM)

The First Minister: Cabinet and its committees decide how we invest our efforts and our resources across portfolios, with reference to our shared commitments and ambitions as set out in 'One Wales'.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the First Minister for his response. When I have asked him how he balances priorities in the past, I have always sought to highlight the differences between the benefits that people living in England get as compared with people living in Wales: in Wales, young people are more likely to leave school with

pobl Cymru fod y gall eich Llywodraeth wireddu ei haddewidion ar yr agenda hon? Yr oedd yr adroddiad y bore yma'n cynnwys amryfal enghreifftiau o sut y mae eich Llywodraeth, hyd yn hyn, wedi methu manteisio ar symleiddio gwasanaethau a hyrwyddo gwasanaethau costeffeithiol. Un o'r rhesymau yw nad ydych wedi mynd i'r afael â chaffael cyhoeddus—nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn monitro'i chynlluniau yn iawn ac nid yw wedi ystyried yr angen i edrych ar y canlyniadau yn hytrach na'r mewnbwn. Yr ydych, fel Llywodraeth, wedi cael cyfle dros y tair blynedd diwethaf i fynd i'r afael â hyn. Yr ydych yn dweud bod hyn yn bwysig, ond pa gamau a gymerwch i fynd i'r afael â'r feirniadaeth yn yr adroddiad y bore yma?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae bwrdd effeithlonrwydd ac arloesedd wedi cael ei sefydlu, a'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb fydd y cadeirydd. Cylch gwaith y bwrdd fydd ceisio sicrhau mwy o arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae gweithgor o Weinidogion hefyd wedi cael ei sefydlu i archwilio'n fanwl sut yr ydym yn gwario'n harian yn fewnol yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yr wyf yn credu bod y ddau gam hyn yn eithriadol bwysig o ran canfod a gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd yn y Llywodraeth.

Blaenoriaethau

C4 Alun Cairns: Sut mae'r Prif Weinidog yn cydbwysu ei flaenoriaethau rhwng gwahanol adrannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ(3)2744(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y Cabinet a'i bwyllgorau sy'n penderfynu sut yr ydym yn buddsoddi ein hymdrechion a'n hadnoddau ar draws y portffolios, yn unol â'n hymrwymiaadau a'n dyheadau cyffredin sydd wedi'u hamlinellu yn 'Cymru'n Un'.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ateb. Pan wyf wedi gofyn iddo yn y gorffennol sut y mae'n cydbwysu blaenoriaethau, yr wyf bob amser wedi ceisio tanlinellu'r gwahaniaethau rhwng y manteision y mae pobl sy'n byw yn Lloegr yn eu cael o'u cymharu â phobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru: yng Nghymru, mae pobl ifanc yn

fewer qualifications, people are more likely to be on a waiting list for health services, and people are more likely to be unemployed. Ultimately, this comes down to the wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the UK. The First Minister always comes back to gross disposable household income as the backdrop. However, when we drill down a bit further into the figures, we see that the reality is that the figures have stagnated since 2005 and that gross disposable household income fell, back in 2006-07, the latest year for which figures are available, despite its being a flawed measure that takes account of people's benefits. The more benefits people get, the richer they are, but that is hardly a positive message for the Welsh Assembly Government to be sending when Wales is the poorest part of the United Kingdom. Therefore, does the First Minister accept that, no matter which measure we use, after 10 years of this administration and 13 years of the UK administration, people living in Wales are worse off as a result of the performance of those administrations?

The First Minister: It is said that nature abhors a vacuum, but that is not true on that side of the Chamber. Every time I have been in the Chamber over the past 10 years, I have heard criticisms but not one single constructive, practical proposal from the Conservatives—absolutely nothing. Let us look at the facts: Objective 1 funding was achieved by a Labour Government, while the Conservative Government was too lazy to apply for it; convergence funding was achieved by a Labour Assembly Government, while the Conservatives were critical of it; and 23,000 people are being helped through ProAct and ReAct, schemes brought forward by the One Wales Government and ones that the Conservatives never even thought of. The point is that, on this side of the Chamber, we make sure that we deliver for the people of Wales, while the Conservatives sit on the sidelines and yap.

Jeff Cuthbert: First Minister, I believe that Thursday of this week marks your first 100

fwy tebyg o adael yr ysgol gyda llai o gymwysterau, mae pobl yn fwy tebyg o fod ar restr aros am wasanaethau iechyd, ac mae pobl yn fwy tebyg o fod yn ddi-waith. Yn y pen draw, mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r bwlch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU. Bydd y Prif Weinidog bob amser yn cyfeirio at incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario yn gefndir i hyn. Fodd bynnag, pan fyddwn yn ymchwilio'n ddyfnach i'r ffigurau, gwelwn mai'r gwirionedd yw bod y ffigurau wedi aros yn llonydd ers 2005 a bod incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario wedi lleihau, yn 2006-07, sef y flwyddyn ddiweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei chyfer, er bod y dull hwn o fesur yn wallus am ei fod yn cynnwys budd-daliadau pobl. Po fwyaf o fudd-daliadau a gaiff pobl, po fwyaf cyfoethog a fyddant, ond nid yw honno'n neges gadarnhaol iawn i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei hanfon ac ystyried mai Cymru yw rhan dlotaf y Deyrnas Unedig. Felly, a yw'r Prif Weinidog yn derbyn, ni waeth pa ddull o fesur a ddefnyddiwn, ar ôl 10 mlynedd o dan y weinyddiaeth hon a 13 blynedd o dan weinyddiaeth y DU, fod pobl sy'n byw yng Nghymru ar eu colled o ganlyniad i berfformiad y gweinyddiaethau hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedir ei bod yn gas gan natur le gwag, ond nid yw hynny'n wir ar yr ochr acw i'r Siambr. Bob tro yr wyf wedi bod yn y Siambr dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, yr wyf wedi clywed beirniadu gan y Ceidwadwyr ond nid wyf wedi clywed yr un cynnig adeiladol, ymarferol ganddynt—dim o gwbl. Edrychwn ar y ffeithiau: llwyddodd Llywodraeth Lafur i sicrhau cyllid Amcan 1, tra oedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn rhy ddiog i wneud cais amdano; llwyddodd Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad i sicrhau cyllid cydgyfeirio, tra oedd y Ceidwadwyr yn feirniadol ohono; ac mae 23,000 o bobl yn cael cymorth drwy ProAct a ReAct, sef cynlluniau a ddatblygwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un a rhai nad oedd y Ceidwadwyr wedi meddwl amdanynt, hyd yn oed. Y pwynt yw ein bod, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, yn sicrhau ein bod yn cyflawni dros bobl Cymru, tra mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn eistedd ar y cyrion yn cyfarth.

Jeff Cuthbert: Brif Weinidog, credaf eich bod yn dathlu 100 diwrnod yn eich swydd

days in office, and so I offer you my congratulations, as I am sure does everyone here.

I welcome the £15 million-worth business support package announced last month as part of our economic renewal programme. I am sure that many small businesses will also welcome that. It is important that we follow on from the successful ProAct scheme, which, as you mentioned, saved many individuals and their jobs and stopped many companies from going bust. Do you agree that it is crucial for Labour in Government to concentrate on these important priorities that affect the daily lives of ordinary working people, unlike the Conservatives, whose main priorities seem to be introducing spending cuts as quickly as possible and ensuring our isolation on the fringes of Europe?

The First Minister: It is at times like these that people want those in government, at whatever level, to deliver schemes that will benefit them directly. That is what ProAct does; there are people in Wales who are in work, in jobs and receiving training because of ProAct. The scheme is not available outside Wales. I know that Alun Cairns likes to come here wearing more or less a top hat and a shroud, but the reality is that a tremendous amount is being done in Wales that is not happening elsewhere in the UK. These are schemes that we can be proud of. It is shameful that the Conservatives sit there without putting forward anything positive and have nothing to offer the people of Wales. However, we will stand by the people of Wales and make sure that we continue to deliver schemes such as ProAct and ReAct, because they are useful to many individuals and families who would otherwise have been left on the scrap heap.

Nick Bourne: I want to ask some questions about the health service rather than the economy, First Minister. You pledged that, under your leadership, there would be faster responses to emergencies. You have just talked about delivery and said that you are delivering. The latest set of figures relating to the ambulance service, which were published

ddydd Iau yr wythnos hon, ac felly yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch, fel y mae pawb arall yma, yr wyf yn siŵr.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r pecyn cymorth i fusnes, gwerth £15 miliwn, a gyhoeddwyd y mis diwethaf fel rhan o'n rhaglen i adnewyddu'r economi. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd llawer o fusnesau bach hefyd yn croesawu hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig inni ddilyn y cynllun ProAct llwyddiannus a lwyddodd, fel y soniasoch, i achub nifer o unigolion a'u swyddi ac atal llawer o gwmnïau rhag mynd i'r wal. A gytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ganolbwyntio ar y blaenoriaethau pwysig hyn a fydd yn effeithio ar fywydau bob dydd pobl gyffredin sy'n gweithio, yn wahanol i'r Ceidwadwyr sydd, i bob golwg, yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i gyflwyno toriadau mewn gwariant cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl a sicrhau ein bod wedi ein hynysu ar gyrion Ewrop?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar adegau fel hyn y bydd ar bobl eisiau i'r rhai sydd mewn llywodraeth, ar ba lefel bynnag, gyflwyno cynlluniau a fydd o fudd iddynt yn uniongyrchol. Dyna y mae ProAct yn ei wneud; ceir pobl yng Nghymru sydd mewn gwaith, mewn swyddi ac yn cael hyfforddiant oherwydd ProAct. Nid yw'r cynllun ar gael y tu allan i Gymru. Gwn fod Alun Cairns yn hoff o fod yn broffwyd gwae, ond y gwir amdani yw bod gwaith aruthrol yn cael ei wneud yng Nghymru nad yw'n digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Gallwn fod yn falch o'r cynlluniau hyn. Mae'n gywilyddus bod y Ceidwadwyr yn eistedd acw heb gyflwyno dim byd cadarnhaol a heb ddim byd i'w gynnig i bobl Cymru. Fodd bynnag, safwn ni'n gefn i bobl Cymru a gwneud yn siŵr ein bod yn parhau i gyflwyno cynlluniau megis ProAct a ReAct, oherwydd y maent yn ddefnyddiol i lawer o unigolion a theuluoedd a fyddai wedi cael eu gadael ar y clwt fel arall.

Nick Bourne: Hoffwn ofyn ambell gwestiwn am y gwasanaeth iechyd yn hytrach na'r economi, Brif Weinidog. Addawsoch y ceid ymatebion cyflymach i achosion brys o dan eich arweinyddiaeth. Yr ydych newydd sôn am gyflawni ac wedi dweud eich bod yn cyflawni. Dengys y set ddiweddaraf o ffigurau yng nghyswllt y gwasanaeth

just under a week ago, indicate that, again, the Government has failed to reach its target of responding to 65 per cent of category A emergency calls within eight minutes across Wales. That is very serious and is nowhere near the performance in England. What are you doing about that?

1.50 p.m.

In addition, perhaps you could couple your response with a statement—given that there has not been an official one—in response to the resignation of Alan Murray, the chief executive of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. Will we have an official response to that resignation?

The First Minister: That is ultimately a matter for the trust, but someone is being appointed in the interim. On response times, we know that it has been difficult, and that the weather has not helped, with ambulances being forced to drive at slower speeds to be safe on the roads. Let us see what happens with the March figures, as we are confident that those figures will be robust.

Nick Bourne: We have not had the February figures yet, but it is all part of a trend. If you look at the figures, you will find that January is not an isolated month. However, let us turn to the position with waiting lists. In March 2009, 288 people were waiting for more than 14 weeks for treatment on the in-patient or day-case treatment waiting list. That is rather a good figure, to be honest, but, with the number having gone up month on month, there are now 13,532 people waiting for more than 14 weeks, which represents an increase of 4,598 per cent. In March 2009, there were 150 people waiting for an out-patient appointment, but, with that number also having gone up month on month, the figure stood at 37,602 in January 2010, which is an increase of 24,758 per cent in less than a year. You talk about delivery, but are these numbers not worrying? What are you doing about it, seeing as the figures are going remorselessly upwards and not downwards?

ambiwylans, a gyhoeddwyd ychydig yn llai nag wythnos yn ôl, unwaith eto, fod y Llywodraeth wedi methu cyrraedd ei tharged o ymateb i 65 y cant o alwadau brys categori A cyn pen wyth munud ledled Cymru. Mae hynny'n ddifrifol iawn ac nid yw'n agos at y perfformiad yn Lloegr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch hynny?

Hefyd, efallai y gallech roi datganiad ynghyd â'ch ateb—o ystyried nad oes datganiad swyddogol wedi bod—mewn ymateb i ymddiswyddiad Alan Murray, prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru. A gawn ymateb swyddogol i'r ymddiswyddiad hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth yw hynny yn y pen draw, ond bydd rhywun yn cael ei benodi dros dro. Ynghylch amseroedd ymateb, gwyddom fod y sefyllfa wedi bod yn anodd, ac nad yw'r tywydd wedi helpu hynny, gan fod yn rhaid i ambiwlansys yrru'n arafach er mwyn bod yn ddiogel ar y ffyrdd. Gadewch inni weld beth a ddigwydd gyda ffigurau mis Mawrth, oherwydd yr ydym yn hyderus y bydd y ffigurau hynny'n rhai cadarn.

Nick Bourne: Nid ydym wedi cael ffigurau mis Chwefror eto, ond mae hyn i gyd yn rhan o batrwm. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau, gwelwch nad yw mis Ionawr yn fis unigryw. Fodd bynnag, trown at y sefyllfa ynghylch y rhestrau aros. Ym mis Mawrth 2009, yr oedd 288 o bobl yn aros ers mwy na 14 wythnos am driniaeth ar y rhestr aros i gleifion mewnol neu achosion dydd. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n eithaf da, a bod yn onest, ond, wedi i'r nifer gynyddu o fis i fis, mae 13,532 bellach yn aros ers mwy na 14 wythnos, ac mae hynny'n gynydd o 4,598 y cant. Ym mis Mawrth 2009, yr oedd 150 o bobl yn aros am apwyntiadau cleifion allanol, ond, gan fod y nifer hwnnw hefyd wedi cynyddu o fis i fis, 37,602 oedd y ffigur ym mis Ionawr 2010, sef cynnydd o 24,758 y cant mewn llai na blwyddyn. Yr ydych yn siarad am gyflawni, ond onid yw'r rhifau hyn yn peri pryder ichi? Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch hyn, ac ystyried bod y ffigurau'n cynyddu'n ddi-bendraw yn hytrach na lleihau?

The First Minister: They are not going remorselessly upwards. We have a commitment in 'One Wales' to reduce waiting times to 26 weeks. That has not been missed. At the moment, only 1.5 per cent of people are waiting more than 26 weeks for treatment. Of all the patients treated in January, 93.4 per cent of those admitted to hospital and 98.2 per cent of those not requiring admission were treated within 26 weeks. That is a significant achievement considering the position that we inherited at the end of the 1990s.

Nick Bourne: That is simply not true. At the peak, the figure was well below yours, as you very well know—and I am talking about the last administration before you took over. The figures here are Government figures and they go up remorselessly month on month. I have them in front of me. If these figures are so good, why are you consulting on withdrawing these data so that we will no longer have them to look at? Why is it that you are consulting on withdrawing these? They are the only resource that we have to find out how long people are waiting, and you are consulting on withdrawing them. Why is that?

The First Minister: The data will not be withdrawn. The data will be in place and they will be available for scrutiny by all within the Chamber.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful for that because you are consulting on withdrawing them. Will you therefore state categorically, on the record, that that consultation is a pointless exercise?

The First Minister: You make it sound as though we are looking to remove all data to do with the health service from the public eye.

Nick Bourne: You are.

The First Minister: That is completely incorrect. We are looking to see how the model might be improved statistically, but it will still be possible for those who have a keen eye—maybe not those in the seats

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydynt yn cynyddu'n ddi-ben-draw. Mae gennym ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' i leihau amseroedd aros i 26 wythnos. Nid yw'r targed hwnnw heb ei gyrraedd. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 1.5 y cant o bobl sy'n aros mwy na 26 wythnos am driniaeth. O'r holl gleifion a gafodd driniaeth ym mis Ionawr, cafodd 93.4 y cant o'r rhai a dderbyniwyd i'r ysbyty a 98.2 y cant o'r rhai nad oedd arnynt angen mynd i'r ysbyty eu trin cyn pen 26 wythnos. Mae hynny'n gyflawniad sylweddol ac ystyried y sefyllfa a etifeddwyd gennym ddiwedd yr 1990au.

Nick Bourne: Nid yw hynny'n wir. Ar ei uchaf, yr oedd y ffigur yn is o lawer na'ch ffigur chi, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn—ac yr wyf yn sôn am y weinyddiaeth ddiwethaf cyn i chi gymryd yr awenau. Ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yw'r rhain, ac maent yn cynyddu'n ddi-ben-draw o fis i fis. Maent gennyf o'm blaen. Os yw'r ffigurau hyn cystal, pam yr ydych yn ymgynghori ynghylch tynnu'r data hyn yn ôl gan olygu na fyddwn yn gallu edrych arnynt mwyach? Pam yr ydych yn ymgynghori ynghylch tynnu'r data hyn yn ôl? Dyma'r unig adnodd sydd gennym i wybod am ba hyd y mae pobl yn aros, ac yr ydych yn ymgynghori ynghylch eu tynnu'n ôl. Pam?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fydd y data'n cael eu tynnu'n ôl. Bydd y data ar gael i bawb yn y Siambr eu harchwilio.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am hynny oherwydd yr ydych yn ymgynghori ynghylch eu tynnu'n ôl. A wnewch ddatgan yn bendant, felly, ar goedd, nad oes diben i'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn awgrymu ein bod yn ceisio tynnu'r holl ddata sy'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd o olwg y cyhoedd.

Nick Bourne: Dyna'r ydych yn ei wneud.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n gwbl anghywir. Yr ydym yn ceisio gweld sut y gellid gwella'r model yn ystadegol, ond bydd yn dal yn bosibl i'r rhai sydd â llygaid craff—efallai nid y rhai sy'n eistedd gyferbyn â

opposite—to scrutinise the figures and indeed to compare them, which is important for the people of Wales.

Gareth Jones: Sylwaf, Brif Weinidog, fod gennych gyfrifoldeb trawstoriadol am y dull strategol o gyflwyno gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys perfformiad, cydweithio a chanolbwyntio ar y dinesydd. A allwch ddweud wrthyf i ba raddau yr ydych yn annog creadigrwydd a'r ysbryd o fentergarwch drwy'r holl wahanol adrannau mewn ymdrech i 'dorri'r mowld' a chreu Cymru fwy ffyniannus a llewyrchus?

Y Prif Weinidog: Soniais yn gynharach am y bwrdd y bydd Jane Hutt yn ei gadeirio yn y dyfodol. Un o amcanion y bwrdd yw sicrhau ffyrdd newydd o feddwl ac agwedd fwy mentrus yn y sector cyhoeddus, nid yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn unig, ond hefyd yn y cyrff eraill hynny sy'n rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus. Os bydd gan bobl syniadau da, hoffem sicrhau y cânt eu datblygu at y dyfodol.

Jenny Randerson: First Minister, when you were interviewed on *The Andrew Marr Show*, you said that it is important that we stimulate the private sector in Wales if we are to develop a successful economy. In the past, although other regions have used private money to develop schools and hospitals, for example, that has not happened in Wales. As a result, there has been a slower rate of redevelopment and replacement. In the light of your Government's declared policy to oppose any private sector involvement in that kind of development, how do you plan to cope with the anticipated 40 per cent cut in capital budgets between now and 2013, as pointed to in the report of the Auditor General for Wales, published today?

The First Minister: The difficulty that we have with private finance initiative projects, for example, is that they do not generally represent good value for money for taxpayers. We would not want to enter into any arrangement that delivered a project that might superficially look attractive, but which might have a continuing high-cost element for taxpayers as a part of it. It is right to say that we will face some difficult decisions this

mi—archwilio'r ffigurau ac, yn wir, eu cymharu, ac mae hynny'n bwysig i bobl Cymru.

Gareth Jones: First Minister, I note that you have cross-cutting responsibility for the strategic delivery of public services, including performance, collaboration and citizen-focused services. Can you tell me to what extent you encourage innovation and a spirit of entrepreneurship throughout all Government departments in an attempt to break the mould and create a more successful and prosperous Wales?

The First Minister: Earlier, I mentioned the board that Jane Hutt is to chair in future. One of the board's objectives is to ensure new ways of thinking and a more entrepreneurial attitude in the public sector, not only in the Assembly Government, but also in the other organisations that are a part of the public sector. If people have good ideas, we want to ensure that they can be developed for the future.

Jenny Randerson: Brif Weinidog, pan gawsoch eich cyfweld ar *The Andrew Marr Show*, dywedasoch ei bod yn bwysig inni ysgogi'r sector preifat yng Nghymru os ydym am ddatblygu economi lwyddiannus. Yn y gorffennol, er bod rhanbarthau eraill wedi defnyddio arian preifat i ddatblygu ysgolion ac ysbytai, er enghraifft, nid yw hynny wedi digwydd yng Nghymru. O ganlyniad, cafwyd cyfradd arafach o ran ailddatblygu ac adnewyddu. Yng ngoleuni'r polisi a arddelir gan eich Llywodraeth i wrthwynebu cynnwys y sector preifat o gwbl yn y math hwnnw o ddatblygu, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu ymdopi â'r 40 y cant o doriad a ddisgwyllir mewn cyllidebau cyfalaf erbyn 2013, fel y nodir yn adroddiad Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, a gyhoeddwyd heddiw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr anhawster sydd gennym gyda phrosiectau menter cyllid preifat, er enghraifft, yw nad ydynt, at ei gilydd, yn rhoi gwerth da am arian i drethdalwyr. Ni hoffem ymrwymo i unrhyw drefniant sy'n cyflawni prosiect a fyddai o bosibl yn edrych yn ddeniadol ar yr wyneb, ond a fyddai efallai'n cynnwys elfen barhaus o gost uchel i drethdalwyr yn rhan ohono. Mae'n wir y byddwn yn wynebu rhai

year given the finances for the 2011-12 budget. It is also right to say that we anticipate—although we will not know until October—cuts in the amount of capital funding available to the Assembly Government. We will have to examine the situation to see how we deal with any cuts that may arise.

Dragon International Film Studios

Q5 Bethan Jenkins: Will the First Minister provide an update on the future of the Dragon International Film Studios in Llanilid? OAQ(3)2739(FM)

The First Minister: We are working closely with the appointed administrators to promote the facility. It is hoped that the recent production of the film *Ironclad* will be the catalyst for further productions coming onto the site.

Bethan Jenkins: Thank you for that answer, which forms the basis of the supplementary question that I wanted to ask. We know that it went into administration in 2008. We were promised nearly 2,000 new jobs, but *Ironclad* is the first film to be made at the studios in eight years. What future do you see for the industry in the area to provide jobs for people in the Maesteg and Bridgend areas, to sustain the local economy, and to encourage the development of the arts and new work in that field in Wales?

The First Minister: I am not sure that it has been running for eight years, but you are right that it has been running for some time. The difficulty is that perhaps it was an overambitious project to begin with. There was talk of a theme park and other facilities, such as a rugby academy, a film school and so on. In that format, the scheme ran into some difficulty. However, with *Ironclad* having been filmed there and with a life-size model of Rochester castle built within the grounds—and I have not seen that, but it will be somewhere in the void of the opencast mine—there is now an incentive for others to film there as well. In time, a buyer will be found for the site and it will be a tremendous economic driver, not just for Pencoed and Llanharan, but for the wider area as well.

penderfyniadau anodd eleni o ystyried yr arian ar gyfer cyllideb 2011-2012. Mae'n wir hefyd ein bod yn rhagweld toriadau yn swm y cyllid cyfalaf sydd ar gael i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, er na fyddwn yn gwybod tan fis Hydref. Bydd yn rhaid inni archwilio'r sefyllfa i weld sut y byddwn yn ymdrin ag unrhyw doriadau a fydd efallai'n codi.

Stiwdios Ffilm Rhyngwladol y Ddraig

C5 Bethan Jenkins: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am ddyfodol Stiwdios Ffilm Rhyngwladol y Ddraig yn Llanilid? OAQ(3)2739(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r gweinyddwyr a benodwyd i hyrwyddo'r cyfleuster. Y gobaith yw y bydd y cynhyrchiad yn ddiweddar o'r ffilm *Ironclad* yn gatalydd i ddenu cynhyrchiadau eraill i'r safle.

Bethan Jenkins: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, sy'n sail i'r cwestiwn atodol yr oeddwn am ei ofyn. Gwyddom iddo fynd i ddwylo'r gweinyddwyr yn 2008. Cawsom addewid o bron 2,000 o swyddi newydd, ond *Ironclad* yw'r ffilm gyntaf i gael ei gwneud yn y stiwdio ers wyth mlynedd. Pa fath o ddyfodol sy'n wynebu'r diwydiant yn yr ardal yn eich barn chi o ran darparu swyddi i bobl yn ardaloedd Maesteg a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr, cynnal yr economi leol, ac annog datblygu'r celfyddydau a gwaith newydd yn y maes hwnnw yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'n bodoli ers wyth mlynedd, ond yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud ei fod yn bodoli ers tro. Yr anhawster yw ei fod efallai'n brosiect rhy uchelgeisiol o'r cychwyn. Bu sôn am barc thema a chyfleusterau eraill, megis academi rygbi, ysgol ffilmiau ac yn y blaen. Yn y fformat hwnnw, wynebodd y cynllun rywfaint o drafferthion. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ffilmio *Ironclad* yno ac adeiladu model maint cywir o gastell Rochester ar y safle—ac nid wyf wedi gweld hwnnw, ond bydd rywle yng ngwagle'r pwll agored—ceir ysgogiad yn awr i eraill ffilmio yno hefyd. Yn y dyfodol, canfyddir prynwr ar gyfer y safle a bydd yn symbyliad economaidd enfawr, nid yn unig ar gyfer Pencoed a Llanharan, ond ar gyfer yr ardal ehangach hefyd.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the First Minister for his response, but I was a little startled when he called it ‘an overambitious project’, bearing in mind that the Welsh Assembly Government agreed to put public funds into the scheme. Secondly, it also agreed to go against wider policy and provide a new access road to the M4 motorway, as was requested and then demanded by the project, which wanted to know when that stage would be met. It is therefore a thin excuse to say that it was an overambitious project, particularly when £600,000-worth of public money has been lost at this stage. Is he therefore telling us that he regrets providing financial support for the project, or is he saying that he regrets that it was overambitious? What exactly is he saying about it? What guarantees can he give us that that land will remain employed for the purpose for which it was intended, and that it will not become a residential site in time, when developers can argue that no appropriate use can be found for it?

The First Minister: A film has just been filmed there, so I do not see how they could argue that it is somehow an empty site. Originally, the plan was to have a theme park, a housing development, a rugby academy, a film school and to have golf-related activities. Clearly, those plans did not come to fruition, but there is still a studio there. Even though the studio has gone through some difficulties, it is now attracting new films. I believe that it will attract new films in the future and that it will be a worthwhile investment for the area.

UK Government Departments

Q6 Leanne Wood: What recent discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government departments? OAQ(3)2743(FM)

The First Minister: I meet regularly with UK Government Ministers to discuss a range of matters.

Leanne Wood: First Minister, I have recently held discussions with representatives from the National Probation Service and the

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Prif Weinidog am ei ymateb, ond synnais braidd wrth ei glywed yn galw'r prosiect yn 'brosiect rhy uchelgeisiol', a chofio i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gytuno i roi arian cyhoeddus i'r cynllun. Yn ail, cytunodd hefyd i fynd yn groes i bolisi ehangach a darparu ffordd fynediad newydd i draffordd yr M4, yn ôl yr hyn a oedd yn ofynnol ar gyfer y prosiect ac yna'n angenrheidiol ar ei gyfer, gan holi pryd y byddai'r cam hwnnw o'r gwaith yn cael ei gwblhau. Esgus tila felly yw dweud ei fod yn brosiect rhy uchelgeisiol, yn enwedig a gwerth £600,000 o arian cyhoeddus wedi cael ei golli hyd yma. A yw felly'n dweud wrthym ei bod yn flin ganddo fod cymorth ariannol wedi'i roi i'r prosiect, ynteu a yw'n flin ganddo ei fod yn rhy uchelgeisiol? Beth yn union y mae'n ei ddweud yn ei gylch? I ba raddau y gall ein sicrhau y bydd y tir hwnnw'n parhau i gael ei ddefnyddio at y diben y'i bwriadwyd, ac na fydd yn troi'n safle preswyl yn y dyfodol, pan fydd datblygwyr yn gallu dadlau na ellir canfod defnydd priodol ar ei gyfer?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ffilm newydd gael ei ffilmio yno, felly ni allaf weld sut y gallent ddadlau ei fod rywsut yn safle gwag. Y cynllun gwreiddiol oedd cael parc thema, datblygiad tai, academi rygbi, ysgol ffilmiau a gweithgareddau cysylltiedig â golff. Yn amlwg, ni wireddwyd y cynlluniau hynny, ond ceir stiwdio yno o hyd. Er bod y stiwdio wedi wynebu anawsterau, mae bellach yn denu ffilmiau newydd. Credaf y bydd yn denu ffilmiau newydd yn y dyfodol ac yn fuddsoddiad gwerth chweil i'r ardal.

Adrannau Llywodraeth y DU

C6 Leanne Wood: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gydag adrannau Llywodraeth y DU? OAQ(3)2743(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddaf yn cyfarfod â Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU yn rheolaidd i drafod amryw o faterion.

Leanne Wood: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau yn ddiweddar gyda chynrychiolwyr o'r Gwasanaeth Prawf

National Association of Probation Officers, the probation officers' trade union, in which they raised concerns about the impact of cuts on the probation budget, which could be as much as 20 per cent over three years.

2.00 p.m.

NAPO fears that already overworked staff will be forced to do even more work, and that that could lead to a lower quality of service, potential cuts to programmes for offenders or less supervision, all of which could have an impact in the form of an increase in crime. NAPO claims that up to 2,500 probation officers could be lost in England and Wales. I have been in contact with one probation officer who was previously employed as an assistant. She was encouraged to retrain as a probation officer, and now she has qualified, she has been given notice to quit her job at the end of month, when she would have remained in employment had she not retrained.

The impact of these cuts is, to my mind, threefold. First, there is a potential increase in crime. Secondly, there is the impact on the Welsh economy. Thirdly, there is a loss of skilled, well-qualified people. Clearly, the probation service is not a devolved responsibility, but what representations can you make to the Ministry of Justice and to the Chancellor to try to ensure that these cuts do not have catastrophic consequences on Welsh communities?

The First Minister: You are right to point out that this is not a devolved matter. The total funding for probation has risen by some 70 per cent in the period 1997-2007. The confirmed allocation this year for the national offender management service is £870 million, which is £26 million more than the original indicated budget. I think that those at NOMS believe that the additional money will enable employers to review the position of their services. It does not, therefore, appear on the face of it as if there have been cuts, although, of course, if people have faced individual problems, they would need to raise the matter with their Members of Parliament,

Cenedlaethol a Chymdeithas Genedlaethol y Swyddogion Prawf, undeb llafur y swyddogion prawf. Yn y trafodaethau hynny, codasant bryderon am effaith toriadau yng nghyllideb y gwasanaeth prawf, a allai fod cymaint ag 20 y cant dros dair blynedd.

Pryder NAPO yw y bydd staff sydd eisoes yn cael eu gorweithio yn gorfod gwneud mwy byth o waith, ac y gallai hynny arwain at wasanaeth o safon is, toriadau posibl mewn rhaglenni ar gyfer troseddwr neu lai o oruchwyliaeth. Gallai hyn oll gael effaith drwy arwain at gynnydd mewn troseddu. Yn ôl NAPO, gellid colli hyd at 2,500 o swyddogion prawf yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn cysylltiad ag un swyddog prawf a arferai gael ei chyflogi fel cynorthwydd. Cafodd ei hannog i ailhyfforddi fel swyddog prawf ac erbyn hyn, a hithau wedi cymhwyso, mae wedi cael rhybudd y bydd yn rhaid iddi roi'r gorau i'w swydd ddiwedd y mis. Pe na bai wedi ailhyfforddi, byddai'n dal mewn swydd.

Yn fy nhyb i, bydd tair effaith yn deillio o'r toriadau hyn. Yn gyntaf, mae'n bosibl y bydd cynnydd mewn troseddu. Yn ail, ceir yr effaith ar economi Cymru. Yn drydydd, caiff pobl fedrus a hynod gymwys eu colli. Yn amlwg, nid yw'r gwasanaeth prawf yn gyfrifoldeb datganoledig, ond pa sylwadau y gallwch eu gwneud i'r Weinyddiaeth Gyfiawnder ac i'r Canghellor i geisio sicrhau na fydd y toriadau hyn yn arwain at ganlyniadau trychinebus i gymunedau Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud nad yw hwn yn fater datganoledig. Mae cyfanswm yr arian ar gyfer y gwasanaeth prawf wedi cynyddu tua 70 y cant yn y cyfnod rhwng 1997 a 2007. Mae'r dyraniad sydd wedi'i gadarnhau ar gyfer y gwasanaeth cenedlaethol rheoli troseddwr eleni yn £870 miliwn, sydd £26 miliwn yn fwy na'r gyllideb wreiddiol a bennwyd. Yr wyf yn meddwl bod y rhai yn NOMS yn credu y bydd yr arian ychwanegol yn rhoi cyfle i gyflogwyr edrych ar sefyllfa'u gwasanaethau. Felly, ar yr wyneb, nid yw'n ymddangos bod toriadau wedi bod. Serch hynny, wrth gwrs, os yw pobl wedi wynebu

given that this is not a devolved matter.

Darren Millar: First Minister, can you tell us whether you have made any representations to the UK Treasury regarding the planned termination of the listed places of worship grant scheme at the end of this month? As you will be aware, the scheme allows places of worship to claim all of the VAT incurred by repairs and maintenance costs, and it has delivered in excess of £5 million to Wales since 2001. Given the importance of religious buildings to our national heritage and our tourism industry, and given the fact that they can often be the only community building for many miles in some parts of Wales, what are you doing to lobby the UK Government on this important matter?

The First Minister: I am aware of the issue, but if you would like to write to me with individual examples of where hardship has been caused, I would be pleased to investigate.

Ambulance Service

Q7 Peter Black: Will the First Minister make a statement on reform of the ambulance service? OAQ(3)2729(FM)

The First Minister: It is clear that the ambulance service forms an important part of our response in dealing with emergencies, in particular, as they arise. At the moment, the whole NHS, including the ambulance service, is implementing the NHS reform programme.

Peter Black: In 2009, the Welsh ambulance service took more than 20 minutes to respond to 9,242 category A emergency incidents. These include those suffering emergencies such as heart attacks, when every minute counts. As I am sure that you are aware, the target is that, in an emergency, the response should be within eight minutes. Response time has a significant impact on survival rates.

The ambulance service is still dogged by historic debt, and a recent independent

problem, byddai angen iddynt godi'r mater gyda'u Haelodau Seneddol, gan nad yw hwn yn fater datganoledig.

Darren Millar: Brif Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthym a ydych wedi cyflwyno unrhyw sylwadau i Drysorlys y DU ynghylch y bwriad i ddirwyn y cynllun grant manau addoli rhestredig i ben ddiwedd y mis? Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r cynllun yn caniatáu i fannau addoli hawlio'r holl Dreth ar Werth ar gostau gwaith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw, ac mae wedi darparu dros £5 miliwn i Gymru ers 2001. O gofio pwysigrwydd adeiladau crefyddol i'n treftadaeth genedlaethol ac i'n diwydiant twristiaeth, a chan gofio mai hwy yn aml yw'r unig adeiladau cymunedol am filltiroedd lawer mewn ambell ran o Gymru, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i lobio Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y mater pwysig hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r broblem, ond os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf gydag enghreifftiau unigol sydd wedi arwain at galedi, byddwn yn falch o ymchwilio i'r mater.

Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans

C7 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans? OAQ(3)2729(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n amlwg bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn rhan bwysig o'n hymateb wrth ymdrin ag argyfyngau, yn benodol, pan godant. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r GIG i gyd, gan gynnwys y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, wrthi'n rhoi rhaglen i ddiwygio'r GIG ar waith.

Peter Black: Yn 2009, cymerodd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru fwy nag 20 munud i ymateb i 9,242 o ddigwyddiadau brys categori A. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys pobl sy'n dioddef argyfyngau megis trawiad ar y galon, pan fydd pob munud yn bwysig. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn siŵr, y targed yw ymateb i argyfwng mewn wyth munud. Mae amser ymateb yn cael effaith fawr ar gyfraddau goroesi.

Mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn dal i gael ei boeni gan ddyled hanesyddol, a chanfu

review found that it is underfunded to the tune of £5 million a year. It also stated that delays in offloading patients at accident and emergency departments cost a further £2 million a year. Will you commit to providing this funding and to dealing with delays at accident and emergency departments, or do you believe that waiting over 20 minutes for an ambulance when one is having a heart attack is acceptable?

The First Minister: No, we want to see improvements, of course, in ambulance response times. While the last two months' response times have been disappointing, they compare favourably with those of previous years.

You are right to point out that we want to focus on hospital handovers, to ensure that they happen as quickly as possible and to ensure that there is a money saving. I am sure that this is something that the trust's new chief executive will want to carry forward with vigour.

Alun Davies: First Minister, like me, I am sure that you will welcome the investment that the Welsh Assembly Government is making in the ambulance service. We have seen 31 new emergency ambulances, 28 patient care vehicles, 28 rapid response vehicles, seven district transport vehicles, and seven specialist vehicles, as well as £10 million to install vehicle location systems announced in the past few months. Do you agree that that is a different ambulance service to the one that we would have if we had Nick Clegg's savage cuts or the carelessness of the Conservatives, who would prefer to spend that investment—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before the Liberal Democrats get too excited, the First Minister of Wales has no ministerial responsibility for Nick Clegg.

Alun Davies: I think that the First Minister would also welcome that statement, Presiding Officer. Do you not agree that this is in stark contrast to the cuts proposed by Nick Clegg,

adolygiad annibynnol yn ddiweddar ei fod yn cael ei danariannu tua £5 miliwn y flwyddyn. Yr oedd hefyd yn nodi bod oedi wrth adael cleifion mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn costio £2 filiwn arall y flwyddyn. A ymrwymwch i ddarparu'r arian hwn ac i ddelio â'r oedi mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ynteu a ydych yn credu bod aros dros 20 munud am ambiwlans a chithau'n cael trawiad ar y galon yn dderbyniol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Na, mae arnom eisiau gweld gwelliannau, wrth gwrs, yn amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys. Er bod yr amseroedd ymateb wedi bod yn siomedig yn y ddeufis diwethaf, maent yn well na rhai'r blynyddoedd a fu.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud bod eisiau inni ganolbwyntio ar drosglwyddo cleifion yn yr ysbyty, er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd mor gyflym ag sy'n bosibl ac i sicrhau bod arian yn cael ei arbed. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod hyn yn rhywbeth y bydd prif weithredwr newydd yr ymddiriedolaeth am frw ymlaen yn frwd ag ef.

Alun Davies: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch chi, fel finnau, yn croesawu buddsoddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn y misoedd diwethaf, cafodd 31 o ambiwlansys brys newydd, 28 o gerbydau gofal cleifion, 28 o gerbydau ymateb cyflym, saith o gerbydau cludiant rhanbarthol a saith o gerbydau arbenigol eu cyhoeddi, yn ogystal â £10 miliwn i roi systemau lleoliad cerbydau ar waith. A gytunwch fod hwnnw'n wasanaeth ambiwlans gwahanol i'r un a fyddai'n bodoli petai toriadau llym Nick Clegg wedi'u gwireddu, neu petaem wedi gweld esgeulustod y Ceidwadwyr, y byddai'n well ganddynt wario'r buddsoddiad hwnnw—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol gynhyrfu gormod, nid oes gan Brif Weinidog Cymru gyfrifoldeb gweinidogol dros Nick Clegg.

Alun Davies: Yr wyf yn meddwl y byddai'r Prif Weinidog yn croesawu'r datganiad hwnnw hefyd, Lywydd. Oni chytunwch fod hyn yn dra gwahanol i'r toriadau a gynigir

and also the Conservatives who would prefer to spend that investment on subsidising a few millionaires—if the Leader of the Opposition could be bothered to stay until the end of this question session—or on subsidising Lord Ashcroft?

The First Minister: It is exceptionally important that sufficient funds are provided for the NHS and for ambulance services. Those funds would be put in jeopardy if the party opposite were to achieve power in Westminster.

Andrew R.T. Davies: The resignation of the chief executive of the Welsh ambulance service was announced last week and, regrettably, ambulance response times, through no lack of dedication and expertise on behalf of the ambulance service staff, were lamentably poor for the last reported month. This is combined with the waiting times that the Leader of the Opposition highlighted earlier, and the experience of many patients as they progress through the NHS in Wales. If you couple that with the building programme that is underfunded by hundreds of millions of pounds, especially with regard to health and safety requirements, there is a considerable gap between what is required and what is able to be funded. Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board has indicated that its funding situation is so dire that it will not be able to fulfil its statutory requirements. Will you give a commitment to working with the Minister for Health and Social Services to address these serious concerns about the NHS in Wales, so that the staff can feel motivated to deliver good quality healthcare on a day to day basis, and so that patients can have confidence that you truly have the interests of the Welsh NHS at heart, instead of leaving it to founder the rocks, as I mentioned in my question?

The First Minister: We set up the NHS, and I work closely with my health ministerial colleague—as I do with all my Cabinet colleagues—in order to ensure that our NHS is robust and delivers a good service, which I believe it does. It is all very well to say that there might be a funding problem if one or

gan Nick Clegg, a hefyd gan y Ceidwadwyr, y byddai'n well ganddynt wario'r buddsoddiad hwnnw ar roi cymhorthdal i ambell filiwnydd—petai Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid yn trafferthu aros tan ddiwedd y sesiwn holi hon—neu ar roi cymhorthdal i'r Arglwydd Ashcroft?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig darparu digon o arian i'r GIG ac i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Petai'r blaid gyferbyn yn ennill grym yn San Steffan, byddai'r arian hwnnw mewn perygl.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Cyhoeddwyd ymddiswyddiad prif weithredwr gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf ac, yn anffodus, yr oedd amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys yn druenus o wael yn ystod y mis diwethaf a gofnodwyd, er nad oes a wnelo hynny ddim oll ag ymrwymiad nac arbenigedd staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae hyn ar ben yr amseroedd aros y tynnodd Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid sylw atynt yn gynharach, a phrofiad llawer o gleifion wrth iddynt gael gwasanaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru. Os edrychwch ar hynny ochr yn ochr â'r rhaglen adeiladu sydd wedi'i thanariannu ac felly'n brin o gannoedd o filiynau o bunnau, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt gofynion iechyd a diogelwch, ceir bwch sylweddol rhwng yr hyn sy'n ofynnol a'r hyn y gellir ei ariannu. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg wedi dweud bod ei sefyllfa gyllido mor druenus na fydd yn gallu bodloni ei ofynion statudol. A ymrwymwch i weithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon difrifol hyn ynghylch y GIG yng Nghymru, er mwyn cymell y staff i ddarparu gofal iechyd o safon o ddydd i ddydd, ac er mwyn i gleifion fod yn ffyddiog mai buddiannau GIG Cymru yw eich blaenoriaeth ac na fyddwch yn gadael iddo fynd i'r gwellt fel y soniais yn fy nghwestiwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni a sefydlodd y GIG, ac yr wyf yn gweithio'n agos gyda'm cyd-Weinidog iechyd—fel gyda'm holl gyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet—er mwyn sicrhau bod ein GIG yn gadarn ac yn darparu gwasanaeth o safon, fel y mae'n gwneud yn fy marn i. Hawdd iawn yw dweud bod

more LHBs make that claim, but the reality is that, if there were to be an emergency budget after the election with substantial spending cuts, as put forward by your party, we would not be in a position to fund the NHS. It is all very well to say that health and education policy is devolved, but unless we get the money we cannot provide a good service. [Interruption.] Alun Cairns is shouting that NHS funding should be reserved—apparently he wants to see the health service undeveloped. That might be something that the Conservatives want to put forward. [Interruption.]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Alun Cairns knows full well that I do not take points of order in the middle of questions. Sit down.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Brif Weinidog, cododd Peter Black bwynt digon dilys am yr amser mae'n ei gymryd i ateb galwadau brys. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna'r darlun cyflawn. Mae nifer o barafeddygon wedi bod mewn cysylltiad â mi i fynegi pryderon fod rhai o'r cerbydau maent yn eu defnyddio i ateb galwadau yn anaddas ar gyfer pob math o alwad, a bod y cerbydau hynny yn cael eu defnyddio er mwyn cwrdd â'r targedau amser, yn hytrach nag anghenion y claf. A wnewch sicrhau yn eich trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros iechyd ein bod yn edrych ar y darlun cyflawn, yn hytrach na chwilio am atebion rhwydd i'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n gywir; mae'n bwysig sicrhau ein bod yn edrych mewn ffordd gyfannol ar rai o'r problemau sydd wedi ymddangos dros y misoedd diwethaf a chyn hynny. Mae hynny'n synhwyrol.

Policing

Q8 Christine Chapman: What discussions has the First Minister had regarding policing in Wales? OAQ(3)2746(FM)

The First Minister: The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government has regular discussions on policing, including meetings

problem ariannu o bosibl os bydd un bwrdd iechyd lleol neu ragor yn gwneud yr honiad hwnnw, ond y gwir amdani yw—pe ceid cyllideb frys ar ôl yr etholiad gyda thoriadau sylweddol mewn gwariant, fel y mae eich plaid wedi awgrymu—na fyddem mewn sefyllfa i gyllido'r GIG. Digon hawdd yw dweud bod polisïau iechyd ac addysg wedi'u datganoli, ond oni chawn yr arian ni allwn ddarparu gwasanaeth da. [Torri ar draws.] Mae Alun Cairns yn gweiddi am i gyllid y GIG gael ei gadw'n ôl—yn ôl pob tebyg y mae am weld y gwasanaeth iechyd heb ei ddatganoli. Efallai fod hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd y Ceidwadwyr am ei gyflwyno. [Torri ar draws.]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae Alun Cairns yn gwybod yn iawn nad wyf yn derbyn pwyntiau o drefn yng nghanol y cwestiynau. Eisteddych.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: First Minister, Peter Black raised a perfectly valid point about the time that it takes to respond to emergency calls. However, that is not the full picture. Several paramedics have been in touch with me to express concerns that some of the vehicles that they use to respond to calls are not suited to responding to all calls and are used to meet the time targets, rather than the needs of the patient. Will you ensure in your discussions with the Minister for health that we look at the whole picture, rather than trying to find easy solutions to the problems that face the ambulance service in Wales?

The First Minister: That is right; it is important to ensure that we look holistically at some of the problems that have come to light recently and previously. That is sensible.

Plismona

C8 Christine Chapman: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'u cael ynghylch plismona yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)2746(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn cynnal trafodaethau rheolaidd

with the Association of Chief Police Officers Cymru and with the Home Office Minister, David Hanson.

ynghylch plismona, gan gynnwys cyfarfodydd gyda Chymdeithas Prif Swyddogion Heddlu Cymru a chyda David Hanson, Gweinidog y Swyddfa Gartref.

2.10 p.m.

Christine Chapman: First Minister, while policing is not a devolved matter, the impact of crime on our communities is a major issue for all of us. My constituency case work includes instances of anti-social behaviour, which, while it may not be considered by some to be as serious a crime as others, has a major impact on many people's lives, causing a great deal of misery and anxiety. While working closely with the local police force, I have become concerned by the frequent relocation of police officers to other divisions, which leads to an inconsistency in approach. You will be aware of the recent HM Inspectorate of Constabulary survey, which found that more needs to be done to tackle anti-social behaviour. However, I am pleased that the new chief constable of South Wales Police has highlighted this as his priority. Do you agree that anti-social behaviour needs to be tackled, not tolerated? What assurances can you give that you will raise this with your Westminster colleagues?

Christine Chapman: Brif Weinidog, er nad yw plismona yn fater datganoledig, mae effaith troseddu ar ein cymunedau yn broblem enfawr i bob un ohonom. Mae gwaith achos yn fy etholaeth yn cynnwys achosion o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol sydd, er nad yw'n drosedd mor ddifrifol ag eraill yn nhyb rhai, yn cael effaith enfawr ar fywydau amryw o bobl, gan beri llawer o drallod a phryder. Wrth weithio'n agos gyda'r heddlu lleol, yr wyf wedi dechrau poeni am y ffaith bod swyddogion yr heddlu yn cael eu hadleoli i adrannau eraill yn aml, a hynny'n arwain at ddull anghyson o weithredu. Gwyddoch am arolwg Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi yn ddiweddar, a ganfu fod angen gwneud mwy i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch bod prif gwnstabl newydd Heddlu De Cymru wedi pwysleisio mai dyma fydd ei flaenoriaeth. A ydych yn cytuno bod angen mynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, yn hytrach na'i oddef? Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y byddwch yn codi hyn gyda'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn San Steffan?

The First Minister: Anti-social behaviour has a significant effect on the quality of people's lives. It is also important to ensure that, where community councils have a police officer who attends their meetings, it is the same police officer. I know that community councils often wish to raise issues regarding anti-social behaviour or crime in their areas, but find that they are talking to a different officer every time. There are two ways of approaching anti-social behaviour. There is what I will call the 'judicial way', in which anti-social behaviour orders and the Public Order Act 1986 are used to control it. We also work with young people, although it is not just young people—I have fallen into the trap of suggesting that it is just an issue with young people; it is not, as we know—to ensure that they recognise that their behaviour is anti-social and overcome it themselves.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn cael effaith sylweddol ar ansawdd bywyd pobl. Os oes gan rai cynghorau cymuned blismon sy'n mynychu eu cyfarfodydd, mae hefyd yn bwysig gwneud yn siŵr mai'r un plismon fydd yn bresennol bob tro. Gwn fod cynghorau cymuned yn aml yn dymuno codi materion sy'n ymwneud â throseddu neu ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn eu hardaloedd, ond eu bod yn siarad â phlismon gwahanol bob tro. Ceir dwy ffordd o fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Ceir yr hyn a alwaf yn 'ffordd farnwrol', lle y defnyddir gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a Deddf Trefn Gyhoeddus 1986 i'w reoli. Yr ydym hefyd yn gweithio gyda phobl ifanc, er nad pobl ifanc yn unig—yr wyf wedi llithro i'r fagl drwy awgrymu ei fod yn fater sy'n ymwneud â phobl ifanc yn unig, ond nid yw hynny'n wir, fel y gwyddom—er mwyn

sicrhau eu bod yn sylweddoli eu bod yn ymddwyn mewn ffordd wrthgymdeithasol ac yn goresgyn y mater eu hunain.

Angela Burns: Like Christine, I acknowledge that policing in Wales is not a devolved issue. However, there are a number of strategies in Wales that are different to those used in England to deal with the same matters, such as substance misuse, domestic violence and rape, and big changes are going on in our probation service. Therefore, what representations do you make to ensure that the different and unique ways in which we handle these kinds of issues are reflected in the national policing plan? To date, the national policing plan has never taken any cognisance of any of our strategies in Wales; if they do not know what we are up to, funding will not follow through either. What you are able to do about that?

The First Minister: I will ask my colleague Carl Sargeant to investigate the issue and write to you.

Nerys Evans: The Stern report was published yesterday, looking into rape cases and the treatment of rape victims. It made recommendations on how police, prosecutors and the Government should improve the way that reported rape is handled. It was commissioned by the UK Government, and the report is to the UK Government, but deals with cases across England and Wales. One of the recommendations is that the NHS rather than the police should take responsibility for forensic medical examinations of rape victims. That is a welcome step forward. We know of too many cases in which rape victims have been let down by police doctors and treated as pieces of evidence rather than as human beings. As I mentioned, this is a UK report for the UK Government, but given that it obviously has an impact on devolved services, how will the Welsh Assembly Government respond to this significant report?

The First Minister: You raise an important and sensitive issue. We want to ensure that any changes in the way that rape victims are

Angela Burns: Yr wyf finnau, fel Christine, yn cydnabod nad yw plismona yng Nghymru yn fater datganoledig. Fodd bynnag, ceir amryw o strategaethau yng Nghymru sy'n wahanol i'r rhai a ddefnyddir yn Lloegr i ddelio â'r un materion, megis camddefnyddio sylweddau, trais domestig a threiso, ac mae newidiadau mawr yn mynd rhagddynt yn ein gwasanaeth prawf. Felly, pa sylwadau a wnewch i sicrhau y caiff ein ffyrdd gwahanol ac unigryw o ddelio â'r mathau hyn o faterion eu hadlewyrchu yn y cynllun plismona cenedlaethol? Hyd yma, nid yw'r cynllun plismona cenedlaethol erioed wedi cydnabod dim un o'n strategaethau yng Nghymru; oni wyddant am ein gwaith, ni chawn gyllid ar ei gyfer ychwaith. Beth y gallwch ei wneud ynghylch hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gofynnaf i'm cyd-Weinidog, Carl Sargeant, ymchwilio i'r mater ac ysgrifennu atoch.

Nerys Evans: Cafodd adroddiad Stern ei gyhoeddi ddoe, adroddiad a oedd yn ymchwilio i achosion o dreisio a sut y mae pobl a dreisiwyd yn cael eu trin. Gwnaeth argymhellion ynghylch sut y dylai'r heddlu, erlynwyr a'r Llywodraeth wella'r ffordd y delir ag achosion o dreisio. Llywodraeth y DU a gomisiynodd yr adroddiad, ac adroddiad ar gyfer Llywodraeth y DU ydyw, ond mae'n delio ag achosion ledled Cymru a Lloegr. Un o'r argymhellion yw mai'r GIG yn hytrach na'r heddlu ddylai ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros archwiliadau meddygol ffforensig ar bobl a dreisiwyd. Mae hwnnw'n gam ymlaen a groesewir. Gwyddom am ormod o achosion lle y mae'r sawl a dreisiwyd wedi cael eu siomi gan feddygon yr heddlu a'u trin fel darnau o dystiolaeth yn hytrach nag fel bodau dynol. Fel y soniais, adroddiad y DU ar gyfer Llywodraeth y DU yw hwn, ond gan ei fod yn amlwg yn effeithio ar wasanaethau datganoledig, sut y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymateb i'r adroddiad pwysig hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi mater pwysig a sensitif. Yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd unrhyw newidiadau o ran y modd yr

dealt with are for the better, and we will do all that we can to ensure that those changes are effective.

Education Funding

Q9 Sandy Mewies: Will the First Minister make a statement on education funding in Flintshire? OAQ(3)2748(FM)

The First Minister: Schools in Flintshire are funded by the local authority using locally determined funding formulae that are set on the basis of a national regulatory framework.

Sandy Mewies: You are well aware that the Government is carrying out a review of education in Wales, which I hope will ensure that there is a clear audit trail of money allocated by the Government that goes through the education authorities and into schools. However, on a more general note, what would the consequences for future cash allocations to local authorities be should an authority decide not to spend its full indicative budget allocation in any area, such as education?

The First Minister: You referred to Flintshire as one of the authorities that is in that position and you made reference to the review, which will cover a number of areas. One of the issues that has been raised by all parties in the Chamber is the issue of what is sometimes called ‘the funding fog’. It is essential that the public can see where the money is coming from and where it is going. The review will form part of that process. Ultimately, Flintshire County Council is answerable to its electors; it will have to explain why it wishes to spend less on education than the people of Flintshire want.

Mark Isherwood: In fact, the council leader has said that the council’s choice in this year’s budget was to go down the difficult route of sustaining schools, rather than the route that he said that the Welsh Government wanted the council to take—to close schools with fewer than 93 pupils. Do you not therefore share my concern that the spend per pupil in Flintshire was rock bottom out of the 22 local authorities that were under Labour

ymdrinnir â phobl a dreisiwyd yn newidiadau er gwell, a gwnawn ein gorau glas i sicrhau y bydd y newidiadau hynny’n effeithiol.

Ariannu Addysg

C9 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ariannu addysg yn sir y Fflint? OAQ(3)2748(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr awdurdod lleol sy’n ariannu ysgolion yn sir y Fflint, drwy ddefnyddio fformiwlâu cyllido a bennwyd yn lleol ac sydd wedi’u gosod ar sail fframwaith rheoleiddio cenedlaethol.

Sandy Mewies: Gwyddoch yn iawn fod y Llywodraeth yn cynnal adolygiad o addysg yng Nghymru, a gobeithio y bydd hwnnw’n sicrhau bod trywydd archwilio clir o ran arian a ddyrannwyd gan y Llywodraeth a fydd yn mynd drwy’r awdurdodau addysg ac i’r ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, ar nodyn mwy cyffredinol, petai awdurdod yn penderfynu peidio â gwario ei ddyraniad llawn yn ôl y gyllideb ddangosol mewn unrhyw faes, megis addysg, sut y byddai hynny’n effeithio ar ddyraniadau arian ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yn y dyfodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cyfeiriasoch at sir y Fflint fel un o’r awdurdodau sydd yn y sefyllfa honno, a chyfeiriasoch at yr adolygiad, a fydd yn ymdrin ag amryw o feysydd. Un o’r materion sydd wedi’i godi gan bob plaid yn y Siambr yw’r broblem ynghylch yr hyn sydd weithiau’n cael ei alw’n ‘niwl ariannu’. Mae’n hollbwysig i’r cyhoedd allu gweld o ble y daw’r arian ac i ble y mae’n mynd. Bydd yr adolygiad yn rhan o’r broses honno. Yn y pen draw, mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint yn atebol i’w etholwyr; bydd yn rhaid iddo esbonio pam y mae am wario llai ar addysg nag y mae pobl sir y Fflint yn ei ddymuno.

Mark Isherwood: Y gwir yw bod arweinydd y cyngor wedi dweud bod y cyngor, yn y gyllideb eleni, wedi penderfynu dilyn y llwybr anodd o gynnal ysgolion, yn hytrach na’r llwybr y dywedodd fod Llywodraeth Cymru am i’r cyngor ei ddilyn—cau ysgolion sydd â llai na 93 o ddisgyblion. Felly, onid ydych chi fel finnu’n pryderu mai sir y Fflint oedd ar y gwaelod o ran y gwariant ar gyfer pob disgybl o blith y 22 awdurdod lleol

leadership for many years, and continues to be so because of this Welsh Government's funding formula?

The First Minister: Flintshire spends 3.7 per cent less than its indicator-based assessment, or IBA, on education. According to my figures, it is the third worst authority in Wales for that. That has nothing to do with any education funding cuts, or with keeping schools open; it is down to the fact that Flintshire is not spending the money that it should under the IBA.

Janet Ryder: Do you share my concern that a party that just last week was saying that local authorities should have the right to choose how they spend their money is today criticising this Government for, more or less, telling an authority how to spend its money? Do you agree that other north-east authorities have made the difficult decision to increase their spending on schools to ensure that they benefit? Some of them are still below average as regards what they should be spending on schools, but they have taken that difficult decision to increase their spending on schools, which perhaps Flintshire has not.

The First Minister: Alone of the authorities in the north-east of Wales, Flintshire is spending less than its IBA.

Cardiff and Vale University LHB

Q10 Chris Franks: What assessment has the First Minister made of the performance of Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board? OAQ(3)2734(FM)

The First Minister: The Minister for Health and Social Services monitors performance and regularly meets LHB chairs to drive forward service improvements. Additionally, monthly performance meetings are held between each LHB and senior Assembly Government officials.

a oedd o dan arweinyddiaeth Llafur am flynyddoedd lawer, a'i fod yn parhau ar y gwaelod oherwydd fformiwla gyllido Llywodraeth bresennol Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae sir y Fflint yn gwario 3.7 y cant yn llai na'i asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion ar addysg. Yn ôl fy ffigurau, dyma'r awdurdod gwaethaf ond dau yng Nghymru yn y cyd-destun hwn. Nid oes a wnelo hynny ddim ag unrhyw doriadau mewn cyllid ar gyfer addysg, nac â chadw ysgolion ar agor—y ffaith nad yw sir y Fflint yn gwario'r arian y dylai ei wario o dan yr asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion sydd wrth wraidd hynny.

Janet Ryder: A ydych chi fel finnau'n pryderu bod plaid a oedd yn dweud yr wythnos diwethaf y dylai awdurdodau lleol gael yr hawl i benderfynu sut y maent yn gwario'u harian, heddiw'n beirniadu'r Llywodraeth hon, fwy neu lai, am ddweud wrth awdurdod sut i wario'i arian? A ydych yn cytuno bod awdurdodau eraill yn y gogledd-ddwyrain wedi gwneud y penderfyniad anodd i gynyddu eu gwariant ar ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau y byddant yn elwa? Mae rhai ohonynt yn dal yn is na'r cyfartaledd o ran yr hyn y dylent fod yn ei wario ar ysgolion, ond maent wedi gwneud y penderfyniad anodd hwnnw i gynyddu eu gwariant ar ysgolion, penderfyniad nad yw sir y Fflint wedi'i wneud o bosibl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn wahanol i'r awdurdodau eraill yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, mae sir y Fflint yn gwario llai na'i asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion.

BILL Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro

C10 Chris Franks: Pa asesiad mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i wneud o berfformiad Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro? OAQ(3)2734(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn monitro perfformiad ac yn cyfarfod â chadeiryddion byrddau iechyd lleol yn rheolaidd er mwyn bwrw ymlaen â gwelliannau i'r gwasanaeth. Hefyd, cynhelir cyfarfodydd perfformiad misol rhwng pob BILL ac uwch-swyddogion Llywodraeth y

Cynulliad.

Chris Franks: Work done by the Royal College of Nursing shows that waiting for medicine reviews is among the top three reasons why people have to wait for more than four hours in accident and emergency units. Having nursing practitioners that can independently prescribe is one way to deal with this issue. Cwm Taf Local Health Board has promoted that; how can you encourage Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board to do the same?

The First Minister: It is exceptionally important that LHBs learn best practice from each other. Where it is possible to reduce the time that patients have to wait in accident and emergency departments, and where an LHB has shown how that can be done, then I expect other LHBs to learn from that example.

Jonathan Morgan: Some time ago the local health board in Cardiff submitted a proposal to the Minister for Health and Social Services to revamp mental health services, not only at Whitchurch Hospital, but at Llandough Hospital. The First Minister will know that the health board has since decided to shelve the proposed reform of the Whitchurch Hospital site, although it has spent £6 million demolishing buildings and doing the necessary road and ground works. What concerns me is that, in a letter yesterday, the Minister for health has said that the consultation has brought out concerns that the model proposed is too institutionally based and does not match best-service models, yet this whole issue was subject to an outline business case that was approved by the Minister and was then subject to a full business case, which again was approved by the Minister. What is it with the way that the Assembly Government makes decisions? There is clearly an issue with the robustness of the analysis done by the Assembly Government as to whether the proposals will stand up to scrutiny and deliver the models of care that people expect. This has gone through an extensive consultation process, and yet only now has it been halted; I think there are concerns and issues that you should

Chris Franks: Dengys gwaith a wnaethpwyd gan Goleg Brenhinol y Nyrsys fod aros am adolygiadau meddyginiaeth ymhlith y tri phrif reswm pam mae'n rhaid i bobl aros am fwy na phedair awr mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Mae cael ymarferwyr nyrsio a all ragnodi meddyginiaethau'n annibynnol yn un ffordd o ddelio â'r mater hwn. Mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Cwm Taf wedi hyrwyddo hynny; sut y gallwch annog Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro i wneud yr un fath?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n hynod bwysig i fyrddau iechyd lleol ddysgu arferion gorau gan ei gilydd. Pan fo'n bosibl lleihau'r amser y bydd yn rhaid i gleifion aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, a phan fo BILl wedi dangos sut y gellir gwneud hynny, byddaf yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd lleol eraill ddysgu yn sgîl yr enghraifft honno.

Jonathan Morgan: Dro'n ôl, cyflwynodd y bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghaerdydd gynnig i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ailwampio gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, nid yn unig yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd ond yn Ysbyty Llandoche hefyd. Gŵyr y Gweinidog fod y bwrdd iechyd wedi penderfynu rhoi'r gorau i'r diwygiad arfaethedig ar safle Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd ers hynny, er iddo wario £6 miliwn yn dymchwel adeiladau ac yn gwneud y gwaith ffordd a'r gwaith tir angenrheidiol. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder imi yw bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd wedi dweud mewn llythyr ddoe fod yr ymgynghoriad wedi esgor ar bryderon bod y model a gynigiwyd yn rhy sefydliadol ac nad yw'n cyd-fynd â modelau gwasanaeth gorau. Eto i gyd, bu'r mater hwn yn destun achos busnes amlinellol a gymeradwywyd gan y Gweinidog, a bu wedyn yn destun achos busnes llawn, a chafodd hwnnw hefyd ei gymeradwyo gan y Gweinidog. Beth sy'n bod ar y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud penderfyniadau? Ceir problem yn amlwg ynglŷn â chadernid y dadansoddiad a wnaethpwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran a all y cynigion fodloni archwiliad a darparu'r modelau gofal y mae pobl yn eu disgwyl. Mae'r mater hwn wedi dilyn proses

address, as First Minister, about the way in which the Assembly Government approves such proposals in the first place.

The First Minister: We have to ensure that we have a robust system in place when dealing with the business cases, but, ultimately, there may well be occasions—and legitimately so—when a Minister decides that the proposals that they are considering are not adequate or not fit for the Minister's intended purpose. It is important to have a robust system in place, but it is also important to realise that, at various points during the progression of a particular plan, something may arise that suggests that the plan is not robust enough and decisions will have to be taken. Clearly, you have drawn my attention to that.

2.20 p.m.

Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order

Alun Cairns: My point of order is in relation to a statement that the First Minister made, because I fear that he may have misled the Chamber inadvertently. He suggested that I wished that health matters were reserved, presumably to Westminster. That is not the case. I was merely seeking to reassure Members that, should there be a change in Government, the health budget would be preserved and that there would be no cuts.

The First Minister: I thought that he said that the NHS should be reserved. I have heard what Alun Cairns has said, and I welcome the commitment that his party has made.

The Presiding Officer: Both the First Minister and Alun Cairns will know that that is not a point of order for me, save to say that the Record will show what was said.

ymgyngori helaeth, ac eto, yn awr y mae wedi'i atal. Credaf fod pryderon a phroblemau y dylech, fel Prif Weinidog, roi sylw iddynt, ynghylch y modd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo cynigion o'r fath yn y lle cyntaf.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym system gadarn ar waith wrth ddelio â'r achosion busnes, ond yn y pen draw, efallai y bydd Gweinidog yn penderfynu weithiau—a hynny'n deg—nad yw'r cynigion y mae'n eu hystyried yn ddigonol neu'n addas at y diben a fwriedir gan y Gweinidog. Mae'n bwysig cael system gadarn, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig sylweddoli y gall rhywbeth godi, ar wahanol gamau yn ystod hynt cynllun penodol, sy'n awgrymu nad yw'r cynllun yn ddigon cadarn a bydd yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau. Yn amlwg, yr ydych wedi tynnu fy sylw at hynny.

Alun Cairns: Mae a wnelo fy mhwynt o drefn â datganiad a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog, oherwydd mae arnaf ofn iddo gamarwain y Siambr yn anfwriadol. Awgrymodd fy mod yn dymuno i faterion iechyd gael eu cadw'n ôl, i San Steffan mae'n debyg. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Y cwbl yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i wneud oedd tawelu meddyliau'r Aelodau, pe ceid Llywodraeth newydd, y câi'r gyllideb iechyd ei diogelu ac na wneid toriadau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl iddo ddweud y dylid cadw'r GIG yn ôl. Yr wyf wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun Cairns, ac yr wyf yn croesawu ymrwymiad ei blaid.

Y Llywydd: Gŵyr y Prif Weinidog ac Alun Cairns nad yw hwnnw'n bwynt o drefn i mi, gan y bydd y Cofnod yn dangos yr hyn a ddywedwyd.

Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement

The Minister for Business and Budget Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb

(Jane Hutt): There are two changes to this week's planned Government business. Following this business statement, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government will make a statement on Communities First, and this afternoon's statement by the Deputy Minister for Children on the annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales has been postponed until next Tuesday, 23 March. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the business statement and announcement, which can be found among the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

Jonathan Morgan: I return to the matter that I raised with the First Minister in questions. I ask the Minister to ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to make a statement here as soon as possible about the future plans for mental health services in my constituency, and in particular the services provided at Whitchurch Hospital. As I said to the First Minister, £6 million has already been spent by the health board on starting to revamp the Whitchurch Hospital site to make it ready for the substantial redevelopment that the Assembly Government has committed to. While I know that there is broad agreement in the Chamber on spending these sums of money to revamp mental health services in Cardiff and the Vale—I have also welcomed this as the Assembly Member for Cardiff North—there is a question over the way in which this issue has been dealt with. The health board submitted an outline business case, which was approved. It then submitted a full business case that was also approved by the Assembly Government, and, throughout the entire process, which I and the Member of Parliament for Cardiff North have been involved in, there have been considerable consultations with staff, clinicians, users and their families about the nature of the changes that would be brought about. However, suddenly, the programme, after £6 million has been spent, has been halted.

There are serious questions about how this situation has come about and about why such large sums of money have been spent already if the business case was not robust enough. There are also serious questions about what money is now available to revamp mental

(Jane Hutt): Mae dau newid ym musnes arfaethedig y Llywodraeth yr wythnos hon. Yn dilyn y datganiad busnes hwn, bydd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn gwneud datganiad ar Gymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac mae'r datganiad y prynhawn yma gan y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Blant ar adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru wedi'i ohirio tan ddydd Mawrth nesaf, 23 Mawrth. Mae busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad a chyhoeddiad busnes, a welir ymhlith papurau'r agenda sydd ar gael i'r Aelodau'n electronig.

Jonathan Morgan: Dychwelaf at y mater a godais gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn y cwestiynau. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad yma cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl am y cynlluniau i'r dyfodol ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn fy etholaeth, ac yn enwedig y gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd. Fel y dywedais wrth y Prif Weinidog, mae £6 miliwn wedi'i wario gan y bwrdd iechyd eisoes ar ddechrau ailwampio safle Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd i'w baratoi ar gyfer yr ailddatblygu sylweddol y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo iddo. Er y gwn fod cytundeb cyffredinol yn y Siambr ynghylch gwario'r arian hwn i ailwampio gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro—yr wyf ffinau wedi croesawu hyn fel yr Aelod Cynulliad dros Ogledd Caerdydd—ceir cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r modd y deliwyd â'r mater hwn. Cyflwynodd y bwrdd iechyd achos busnes amlinellol, a gymeradwywyd. Wedyn cyflwynodd achos busnes llawn a gymeradwywyd yn ei dro gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a, thrwy gydol y broses gyfan, yr wyf fi a'r Aelod Seneddol dros Ogledd Caerdydd wedi bod ynghlwm â hi, cafwyd ymgynghori sylweddol gyda'r staff, clinigwyr, defnyddwyr a'u teuluoedd ynghylch natur y newidiadau a wneid. Fodd bynnag, yn sydyn, ar ôl gwario £6 miliwn, mae'r rhaglen wedi'i hatal.

Ceir cwestiynau difrifol ynghylch sut y daeth y sefyllfa hon i fod ac ynghylch pam y gwariwyd symiau mor fawr o arian eisoes os nad oedd yr achos busnes yn ddigon cadarn. Ceir cwestiynau difrifol hefyd ynghylch pa arian sydd ar gael bellach i ailwampio

health services in Cardiff and the Vale over the next three to five years. I urge the Government to ask the health Minister whether she will make a statement, so that we can get clarity as to what has happened and what this means for the reform of these crucial services.

Jane Hutt: As the First Minister has just said in response to your question, this is a matter for the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board. There has been extensive briefing, consultation and engagement with Members of Parliament and Assembly Members about the changing needs with regard to mental health policy, which are being addressed by the Minister.

Chris Franks: I would like to request a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on unscheduled care local delivery plans in my region and the four and eight hour targets in accident and emergency units. I would welcome comment on the stroke services action plan in the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board area. There are three key areas for action: a reduction in the incidence of stroke through strong primary prevention; achieving better outcomes for patients who experience a stroke; and providing a responsive experience for patients, their carers and their families. Could we also have a statement on workforce planning in the NHS, particularly given the news that the Cardiff and Vale LHB is recruiting Irish nurses to fill vacancies in mental health services?

Jane Hutt: It is important to recognise from the recent statistical release that Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board achieved the referral-to-treatment waiting time target in January 2010, with 99.1 per cent of patients waiting less than 26 weeks for treatment, which is well within the 5 per cent tolerance. We should also recognise that issues relating to workforce management and human resource development are key priorities for the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board.

Jenny Randerson: I want to raise two issues

gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghaerdydd a'r Fro dros y tair i bum mlynedd nesaf. Anogaf y Llywodraeth i ofyn i'r Gweinidog iechyd a wnaiff hi ddatganiad, er mwyn inni allu cael eglurder ynghylch yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd a beth y mae hyn yn ei olygu i'r gwaith o ddiwygio'r gwasanaethau hanfodol hyn.

Jane Hutt: Fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog newydd ddweud mewn ymateb i'ch cwestiwn, mater yw hwn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro. Cafwyd briffio, ymgynghori ac ymgysylltu helaeth gydag Aelodau Seneddol ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynghylch yr anghenion, a'r rheini'n newid, ym maes polisi iechyd meddwl, sy'n cael sylw gan y Gweinidog.

Chris Franks: Hoffwn ofyn am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am gynlluniau cyflenwi lleol ar gyfer gofal heb ei drefnu yn fy rhanbarth a'r targedau pedair ac wyth awr mewn unedau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Croesawn sylw ar gynllun gweithredu gwasanaethau strôc yn ardal Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro. Ceir tri maes allweddol ar gyfer gweithredu: lleihau amllder strôc drwy ataliaeth sylfaenol gref; sicrhau canlyniadau gwell i gleifion sy'n dioddef strôc; a darparu profiad ymatebol i gleifion, eu gofalwyr a'u teuluoedd. A gam ddatganiad hefyd ar gynllunio'r gweithlu yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, yn enwedig o ystyried y newydd bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd a'r Fro'n recriwtio nyrsys o Iwerddon i lenwi swyddi gwag ym maes gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod y cyhoeddiad ystadegol diweddar yn dweud i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro lwyddo i gyrraedd y targed ar gyfer yr amser aros rhwng atgyfeirio a thriniaeth ym mis Ionawr 2010, wrth i 99.1 y cant o gleifion aros llai na 26 wythnos am driniaeth, sydd o fewn y goddefiant o 5 y cant, a hynny o gryn dipyn. Dylem gydnabod hefyd fod materion yn ymwneud â rheoli'r gweithlu a datblygu adnoddau dynol yn flaenoriaethau allweddol i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro.

Jenny Randerson: Mae arnaf eisiau codi dau

with you, Minister. I want to start with the issue raised just now by Jonathan Morgan concerning Whitchurch Hospital and plans for its replacement. Whitchurch Hospital serves the whole of Cardiff and beyond. In your reply to Jonathan you said that this is a matter for the local health board. With respect, Minister, the Minister for Health and Social Services issued a letter about it yesterday, making it absolutely clear that it was an issue in which she, quite rightly, was taking a considerable interest. It is simply not acceptable to stand there and say that this is just a little local issue. Thinking back to the days when Sue Essex and I were on Cardiff City Council, I recall discussing the plans then for the replacement of Whitchurch Hospital, which is one of the last former asylums still in use as a mental health facility in the whole of the UK.

It is unacceptable that, after all this money has been spent and all this time has elapsed, the plans are now being put on hold, and we have not been given a timescale for further plans coming forward. The standard of the physical accommodation being offered to people who require inpatient treatment at facilities is woeful, Minister. It is simply not acceptable to say that inpatient facilities will not be needed in future, because they will be, and we all know that. So, Minister, I ask that the Minister for Health and Social Services should, at the very least, issue a written statement answering fully the questions that Jonathan Morgan and I put to you today. Her letter yesterday was extremely brief, and I believe that the public deserves to know more. Indeed, my constituents are already asking me these questions.

The second question that I want to ask you concerns the remit letter to the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales from the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning. It outlines a very different approach to that taken by you as the former Minister for education. It outlines a very much more controlling, centralist approach to funding for universities. It is very centralist in its approach in dictating the percentage of capital spend that must be fully in line with

fater gyda chi, Weinidog. Hoffwn ddechrau gyda'r cwestiwn sydd newydd ei godi gan Jonathan Morgan ynglŷn ag Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd a chynlluniau i gael ysbyty newydd yn ei le. Mae Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd yn gwasanaethu'r cyfan o Gaerdydd a thu hwnt. Yn eich ateb i Jonathan dywedasoeh mai mater i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yw hwn. Gyda pharch, Weinidog, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol lythyr am hyn ddoe, yn datgan yn hollol glir fod hyn yn fater yr oedd ganddi, yn naturiol, ddiddordeb sylweddol ynddo. Nid yw'n dderbyniol ichi sefyll gan ddweud mai dim ond mater bach lleol yw hwn. Wrth feddwl yn ôl at y dyddiau pan oedd Sue Essex a mi ar Gyngor Dinas Caerdydd, cofiaf drafod y cynlluniau bryd hynny ar gyfer cael ysbyty newydd yn lle Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd, sy'n un o'r olaf o'r hen wallgofdai sy'n dal i gael ei ddefnyddio fel cyfleuster iechyd meddwl yn y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan.

Mae'n annerbyniol, ar ôl gwario'r holl arian hwn ac wedi i'r holl amser fynd heibio, fod y cynlluniau bellach yn cael eu gohirio, heb i neb roi amserlen ar gyfer cyflwyno cynlluniau eraill. Mae safon y cyfleusterau o ran y llety a gynigir i bobl y mae arnynt angen triniaeth cleifion mewnol yn druenus, Weinidog. Nid yw'n dderbyniol o gwbl dweud na fydd angen cyfleusterau i gleifion mewnol yn y dyfodol, oherwydd fe fydd, ac yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod hynny. Felly, Weinidog, fy nghais yw y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol o leiaf gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig yn rhoi ateb llawn i'r cwestiynau a roddodd Jonathan Morgan a mi ichi heddiw. Yr oedd ei llythyr ddoe'n eithriadol o fyr, a chredaf fod y cyhoedd yn haeddu gwybod mwy. Yn wir, mae fy etholwyr yn gofyn y cwestiynau hyn imi'n barod.

Mae a wnelo'r ail gwestiwn yr wyf am ei ofyn ichi heddiw â'r llythyr cylch gwaith i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru oddi wrth y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Mae'n amlinellu dull gwahanol iawn i'r un a oedd gennych chi fel y cyn Weinidog addysg. Mae'n amlinellu dull llawer mwy rheolaethol, canoliaethol o gyllido prifysgolion. Mae'n ganoliaethol iawn yn ei agwedd at bennu'r ganran o wariant cyfalaf sy'n gorfod bod yn gwbl unol

Government policies and so on. Of course, it is the Minister's prerogative to change the policy considerably. However, the interesting thing is that, only last week or the week before, he announced a review of university funding. So, it is a bit strange that he has changed the way that university funding is to be spent in Wales at the same time as announcing a review of the way in which universities have been funded in Wales.

2.30 p.m.

Since this is a very different approach, Minister, could you ask the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning to bring forth an oral statement so that we can ask questions? In his own words, he says that he does not expect capital funding to be used to support unnecessary and nugatory competition between higher education providers. One man's competition is, of course, another man's choice. I am sure that many Assembly Members would be interested in having the opportunity to ask the Minister detailed questions on the issue of exactly the implications of this change of direction in higher education funding.

Jane Hutt: On your first point, of course it is important that we look at this very carefully. The Minister has been involved, and has written to Assembly Members about the provision of twenty-first-century excellence in mental health services in our capital city—and also in the Vale of Glamorgan, because it is Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board. I have also been able to raise these issues about provision across the whole of the health board area. We must ensure that mental health services in community, secondary and tertiary settings for in-patients, clinically, are services of twenty-first century excellence. I am assured that this is what is being addressed by the developments announced earlier this week. Those points are also there for the relevant Minister to respond to them.

Your second point is also important. I remember thinking that my remit letter to HEFCW was fairly tough when I issued it last year, when I was the Minister for

â pholisïau'r Llywodraeth ac yn y blaen. Wrth gwrs, mae gan y Gweinidog hawl i newid y polisi'n sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, y peth diddorol yw iddo gyhoeddi adolygiad o gyllid prifysgolion wythnos neu ddwy'n ôl. Felly, mae braidd yn od ei fod wedi newid y modd y mae cyllid prifysgolion i'w wario yng Nghymru ar yr un pryd â chyhoeddi adolygiad o'r modd y mae prifysgolion wedi bod yn cael eu hariannu yng Nghymru.

Gan fod hwn yn ddull gwahanol iawn, Weinidog, a allech ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyflwyno datganiad llafar er mwyn inni allu gofyn cwestiynau? Yn ei eiriau ei hun, dywed nad yw'n disgwyl i gyllid cyfalaf gael ei ddefnyddio i gynnal cystadleuaeth ddiangen a diwerth rhwng darparwyr addysg uwch. Mae'r hyn a wêl rhai fel cystadleuaeth, wrth gwrs, yn ddewis yng ngolwg eraill. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai gan lawer o Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddiddordeb mewn cael y cyfle i ofyn cwestiynau manwl i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn ag union oblygiadau'r newid cyfeiriad hwn o ran cyllido addysg uwch.

Jane Hutt: Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt cyntaf, wrth gwrs mae'n bwysig inni edrych ar hyn yn ofalus iawn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymwneud â hyn, ac wedi ysgrifennu at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynglŷn â darparu rhagoriaeth yr unfed ganrif ar hugain o ran gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn ein prifddinas—a hefyd ym Mro Morgannwg, am mai Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro ydyw. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gallu codi'r materion hyn ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth ar draws y cyfan o ardal y bwrdd iechyd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, mewn sefyllfaoedd cymunedol, eilaidd a thrydyddol i gleifion mewnol, yn wasanaethau o ragoriaeth yr unfed ganrif ar hugain yn glinigol. Fe'm sicreir mai dyna yw diben y datblygiadau a gyhoeddwyd yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Mae'r pwyntiau hynny'n hysbys hefyd i'r Gweinidog perthnasol ymateb iddynt.

Mae eich ail bwynt yn bwysig hefyd. Cofiaf feddwl bod fy llythyr cylch gwaith i Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru yn eithaf caled pan gyhoeddais ef y llynedd, pan oeddwn yn

education. That remit letter is important because it is the means by which we can be clear about how we target our resources and about its responsibility to target our public resources towards front-line delivery in higher education, which is the key driver of the review being undertaken by the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning.

Nerys Evans: I wish to go back to an issue that I raised with the First Minister during questions, namely the Stern report published yesterday. Although it is a UK Government report, it has obligations for devolved responsibilities, notably health and the need to use the national health service to carry out forensic examinations of rape victims. The First Minister said that the Assembly Government will work with these changes, but as these are changes that will have to happen here and made on a Welsh level by the Assembly Government, can we have an oral or written statement on the Assembly Government's response to the Stern report published yesterday?

Jane Hutt: As the First Minister has said, it is quite clear that while welcoming Baroness Stern's report on her review into how rape complaints are handled by public authorities in England and Wales, we, and the relevant Minister in particular, will need to consider very carefully how the report will impact on our provision, delivery and commissioning of services to support victims and to help them pursue complaints, for example. This will be clearly linked to the Minister's work with the violence against women and domestic abuse working group.

Brynle Williams: I am sorry to bring this up once again, Minister, but when can we expect a report from the Minister responsible for the state of the A55? Once again, Easter and the summer season are coming, and the road is fraught with problems. Yesterday, I travelled the length of the A55. There were queues of at least two and a half miles on either side of St Asaph, and at the tunnels on the other side of Conwy, due to bollards and ongoing work.

Weinidog addysg. Mae'r llythyr cylch gwaith hwnnw'n bwysig am mai dyna'r modd y gallwn fod yn glir ynghylch sut yr ydym yn targedu ein hadnoddau ac ynglŷn â'i gyfrifoldeb i dargedu ein hadnoddau cyhoeddus tuag at wasanaethau rheng flaen mewn addysg uwch, sef prif ysgogiad yr adolygiad a wneir gan y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

Nerys Evans: Hoffwn fynd yn ôl at fater a godais gyda'r Prif Weinidog yn ystod y cwestiynau, ynglŷn ag adroddiad Stern a gyhoeddwyd ddoe. Er mai adroddiad i Lywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig ydyw, mae ganddo oblygiadau i gyfrifoldebau datganoledig, sef yn bennaf iechyd a'r angen i ddefnyddio'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol i wneud archwiliadau ffrensig ar ddiodefwyr trais rhywiol. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog y gwnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio gyda'r newidiadau hyn, ond gan mai newidiadau yw'r rhain y bydd yn rhaid iddynt ddigwydd yma a chael eu gwneud ar lefel Cymru gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a gawn ni ddatganiad llafar neu ysgrifenedig ar ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adroddiad Stern a gyhoeddwyd ddoe?

Jane Hutt: Fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, mae'n berffaith amlwg, er ein bod yn croesawu adroddiad y Farwnes Stern ar ei hadolygiad o'r modd y mae awdurdodau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn ymdrin â chwynion am drais rhywiol, y bydd angen i ni, a'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn arbennig, ystyried yn ofalus iawn sut y bydd yr adroddiad yn effeithio ar y modd y byddwn yn darparu, cyflenwi a chomisiynu gwasanaethau i gynnal diodefwyr a'u helpu i fwrw ymlaen â chwynion, er enghraifft. Bydd cysylltiad clir rhwng hyn a gwaith y Gweinidog gyda'r gweithgor ar drais yn erbyn menywod a cham-drin domestig.

Brynle Williams: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf godi hyn unwaith eto, Weinidog, ond pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl adroddiad gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am gyflwr yr A55? Unwaith eto, mae'r Pasg a thymor yr haf yn dod, ac mae'r ffordd yn llawn problemau. Ddoe, teithiais yr A55 ar ei hyd. Yr oedd cynffon o leiaf ddwy filltir a hanner o hyd o boptu i Lanelwy, ac yn y twnneli yr ochr arall i Gonwy, oherwydd bolardiau a gwaith ar y ffordd. Yr wyf yn

I am well aware that the road has to be updated, but it is doing untold damage to tourism and commerce in north Wales. Could the Minister please bring us a statement on when we can expect to see a bollard-free A55?

Jane Hutt: It is vitally important that the work on the A55 is undertaken, as I am sure you will appreciate. We understand that these roadworks will avoid Easter, which is an important point as we consider the forthcoming holiday break. They will start, I understand, on Friday, 26 March and should be completed by lunch time on Wednesday, 31 March. You will know that well-signposted diversion routes are in place. We will keep the public informed by means of road signs, our website, public notices and radio bulletins, and I am sure that that will ameliorate the impact of the work. However, it is important work that has to take place.

Bethan Jenkins: Following a report instigated by the Home Office that found, last week, that the UK Border Agency failed to investigate claims of abuse by its own staff, will the Welsh Government now press for an independent and open inquiry into allegations made against staff at the agency's Cardiff office? According to that report, 29 cases were reviewed, two thirds were not fully investigated and some were not investigated at all. We have cross-party support at the National Assembly for an independent review and I seek a statement from the Government on having that independent review commissioned by the Equality and Human Rights Commission in Wales.

Another issue that I want to bring to your attention is childcare qualifications in Wales. I have received representations on this issue from the University and College Union, which is concerned about claims by education specialists that changes to childcare regulations could not only put children at risk, but create problems for Assembly projects such as Sure Start. May we have a statement on that issue?

ymwybodol iawn bod yn rhaid diweddarau'r ffordd, ond mae'n gwneud niwed difesur i dwristiaeth a masnach yn y gogledd. A allai'r Gweinidog gyflwyno datganiad inni ynghylch pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl gweld A55 ddifolard, os gwelwch yn dda?

Jane Hutt: Mae'n hollbwysig i'r gwaith ar yr A55 gael ei wneud, fel y sylweddolwch, yr wyf yn siŵr. Deallwn y bydd y gwaith ffordd hwn yn osgoi'r Pasg, sydd yn bwynt pwysig wrth inni ystyried y gwyliau sydd ar ein gwarthaf. Bydd yn dechrau, yn ôl a ddeallaf, ddydd Gwener, 26 Mawrth, a dylai fod wedi'i gwblhau erbyn amser cinio ddydd Mercher, 31 Mawrth. Byddwch yn gwybod bod ffyrdd gwyriad ar gael a'u bod wedi'u harwyddo'n dda. Sicrhawn y caiff y cyhoedd wybodaeth am y sefyllfa drwy gyfrwng arwyddion ffyrdd, ein gwefan, hysbysiadau cyhoeddus a bwletinau radio, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff hynny liniaru effaith y gwaith. Fodd bynnag, mae'n waith pwysig y mae'n rhaid iddo digwydd.

Bethan Jenkins: Yn dilyn adroddiad a gychwynwyd gan y Swyddfa Gartref a ganfu, yr wythnos diwethaf, fod Asiantaeth Ffiniau'r Deyrnas Unedig heb ymchwilio i honiadau o gam-drin gan ei staff ei hun, a wnaiff Llywodraeth Cymru'n awr bwysu am ymchwiliad annibynnol ac agored i honiadau a wnaed yn erbyn staff yn swyddfa'r asiantaeth yng Nghaerdydd? Yn ôl yr adroddiad hwnnw, adolygwyd 29 o achosion, nid ymchwiliwyd yn llawn i ddwy ran o dair ohonynt ac nid ymchwiliwyd o gwbl i rai. Mae gennym gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i adolygiad annibynnol a gofynnaf am ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â chomisiynu'r adolygiad annibynnol hwnnw gan y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol yng Nghymru.

Mater arall yr hoffwn ei ddwyn i'ch sylw yw cymwysterau gofal plant yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau am y mater hwn gan yr Undeb Prifysgol a Choleg, sy'n bryderus ynghylch honiadau gan arbenigwyr addysg y gallai newidiadau mewn rheoliadau gofal plant nid yn unig roi plant mewn perygl, ond creu problemau i brosiectau gan y Cynulliad fel Cychwyn Cadarn. A gawn ddatganiad ar hynny?

Jane Hutt: It is important that we recognise reserved matters and that the UK Border Agency has a duty to provide support and accommodation to eligible asylum seekers who would otherwise be destitute. Of course, the Welsh Refugee Council plays an important role in the delivery of advice and support and has a service-level agreement with the UK Border Agency. It is important that we liaise, and that our officials from the inclusion team liaise with the agency, and recognise when there are issues that need to be addressed. That is certainly what they intend to do.

Your point on childcare qualifications is important. I know that these points have been raised before and the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning is dealing with them. I am sure that he will report back as appropriate.

Peter Black: Minister, may I repeat the request that I made last week for a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on the ambulance service? Since last week, figures have come to light following a request under the Freedom of Information Act 2000, that the ambulance service took more than 20 minutes to respond to over 9,200 category A emergency calls in 2009. The ambulance service is going through a hiatus with its chief executive leaving and, of course, there is the issue of the independent review, which identified underfunding to the tune of £5 million and a cost of £2 million due to delays in accident and emergency departments. To the best of my knowledge, the Minister has never come to this Chamber to report on that independent review or to answer questions specifically on it. It seems to me that given the problems faced by the ambulance service, it would be apposite for the Minister to make a statement so that we would be able to ask questions about these issues to try to get to the bottom of why the ambulance service is failing to meet its targets. We would hope to glean an explanation other than the one given by the First Minister, namely that ambulances have to drive a bit slower in bad weather.

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod materion a gedwir yn ôl a bod gan Asiantaeth Ffiniau'r Deyrnas Unedig ddyletswydd i ddarparu cefnogaeth a llety i geiswyr lloches cymwys a fyddai fel arall ar y clwt. Wrth gwrs, mae Cyngor Ffoaduriaid Cymru'n chwarae rhan bwysig o ran darparu cyngor a chefnogaeth ac mae ganddo gytundeb lefel gwasanaeth gyda'r asiantaeth ffiniau. Mae'n bwysig cydweithio, a bod ein swyddogion o'r tîm cynhwysiant yn cysylltu â'r asiantaeth, ac yn cydnabod pan fo materion y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt. Dyna y bwriadant ei wneud, yn sicr.

Mae eich pwynt ynghylch cymwysterau gofal plant yn bwysig. Gwn fod y pwyntiau hyn wedi'u codi o'r blaen a bod y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn delio â hwy. Yr wyf yn siŵr y daw ag adroddiad yn ôl fel y bo'n briodol.

Peter Black: Weinidog, a gaf ailadrodd y cais a wneuthum yr wythnos diwethaf am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans? Ers yr wythnos diwethaf, datgelwyd ffigurau yn sgil cais o dan Ddeddf Rhyddid Gwybodaeth 2000, fod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi cymryd mwy nag 20 munud i ymateb i dros 9,200 o alwadau brys categori A yn 2009. Mae ymadawiad y prif weithredwr yn amharu rhywfaint ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ac, wrth gwrs, ceir mater yr adolygiad annibynnol, a ganfu £5 miliwn o ddiffyg cyllid a chost o £2 filiwn oherwydd oedi mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Hyd y gwn, nid yw'r Gweinidog erioed wedi dod i'r Siambr hon i gyflwyno adroddiad ar yr adolygiad annibynnol hwnnw nac i ateb cwestiynau'n benodol yn ei gylch. Mae'n ymddangos i mi, o ystyried y problemau a wynebir gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y byddai'n briodol i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad er mwyn inni allu gofyn cwestiynau am y materion hyn i geisio canfod pam yn union y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn methu cyrraedd ei dargedau. Gobeithiem gael esboniad gwahanol i'r un a roddwyd gan y Prif Weinidog, sef bod ambiwlansiys yn gorfod gyrru ychydig yn arafach mewn tywydd gwael.

Jane Hutt: It is important, as the First Minister has said, and as I said in responding to questions last week, that we recognise that there has been an upward trend in performance across Wales. That has been achieved despite the fact that the trust was faced with those truly exceptional weather conditions that are beyond our control. The trust recognises that performance would have been better than that achieved if it had not been for the weather. I will say, Peter, that performance has still not reached the standard required and I know that the Minister for health would expect to see improvements in performance levels over the coming months. The trust is clearly aware of our expectations.

Mark Isherwood: May I request two statements on two matters? The first concerns a matter on which there has been some reporting over the last few days, regarding the Barnardo's report, 'Not the end of the story', which found that teenage mothers in England get more support with childcare so that they can return to education than those in Wales. I know that the Welsh Government said that that was untrue, but Barnardo's has said that it is standing by its story, published on Sunday, noting that, in Wales, to a greater extent than in England, teenage mothers resigned themselves to a low-income lifestyle because they faced barriers to getting back into education, and that the funding support available for teenage mothers who want to return to education and training is inadequate and patchy. Rather than reading in the press about a tit for tat between the Government and a very reputable charity, we should hear about this matter in the Assembly.

2.40 p.m.

Secondly, and finally, I request a statement on the current situation, statistics and support with regard to people with HIV/AIDS in Wales. The National Public Health Service for Wales's figures—they relate to 2007, but those are the only ones that I could find—showed the highest ever number of new cases, standing at 192, and that 1,009 Welsh residents were receiving HIV-related care, which is now increasingly long term. Wales

Jane Hutt: Mae'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, ac fel y dywedais innau wrth ymateb i gwestiynau yr wythnos diwethaf, inni gydnabod bod tuedd ar i fyny wedi bod mewn perfformiad ar draws Cymru. Cyflawnwyd hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith i'r ymddiriedolaeth wynebu'r tywydd gwirioneddol eithriadol hwnnw sydd y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn cydnabod y buasai'r perfformiad yn well na'r hyn a gyflawnwyd oni bai am y tywydd. Fe ddywedaf, Peter, nad yw'r perfformiad byth wedi cyrraedd y safon ofynnol a gwn y disgwylia'r Gweinidog iechyd weld gwelliannau mewn lefelau perfformiad yn y misoedd a ddaw. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth yn amlwg yn ymwybodol o'n disgwyliadau.

Mark Isherwood: A gaf ofyn am ddau ddatganiad ar ddau fater? Mae a wnelo'r cyntaf â mater y bu cryn adrodd amdano yn ystod y dyddiau diwethaf, ynglŷn ag adroddiad Barnardo's, 'Not the end of the story', a ganfu fod mamau yn eu harddegau yn Lloegr yn cael mwy o gefnogaeth gyda gofal plant er mwyn gallu dychwelyd i addysg nag a gaiff rhai yng Nghymru. Gwn fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi dweud nad oedd hynny'n wir, ond mae Barnardo's wedi dweud eu bod yn glynu wrth eu stori, a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Sul, gan nodi fod mamau yn eu harddegau yng Nghymru, i raddau mwy nag yn Lloegr, yn bodloni ar fywyd ar incwm isel oherwydd eu bod yn wynebu rhwystrau i fynd yn ôl i addysg, a bod y gefnogaeth ariannol sydd ar gael i famau ifanc y mae arnynt eisiau dychwelyd i addysg a hyfforddiant yn annigonol ac anghyson. Yn hytrach na darllen yn y wasg am ffrae rhwng y Llywodraeth ac elusen uchel ei pharch, dylem glywed am y mater hwn yn y Cynulliad.

Yn ail, ac yn olaf, gofynnaf am ddatganiad am y sefyllfa gyfredol, yr ystadegau a'r gefnogaeth ar gyfer pobl sydd â HIV/AIDS yng Nghymru. Yn ôl ffigurau Gwasanaeth Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cenedlaethol Cymru—ffigurau 2007 ydynt, ond dyna'r unig rai y gallwn ddod o hyd iddynt—cafwyd y nifer uchaf erioed o achosion newydd, sef 192, ac yr oedd 1,009 o drigolion Cymru'n cael gofal cysylltiedig â HIV, sydd erbyn hyn yn

has the only tailored social respite care and support centre in the UK, but, unfortunately, it appears to be fighting a losing battle to convince referring organisations in Wales that HIV/AIDS respite care is a vital resource and one that could be better supported through referrals in Wales.

Jane Hutt: On your point about the Barnardo's report, it is important to say that the claims are not well founded, because we have issued guidance to all schools and local authorities on the need to adopt supportive and flexible approaches for teenage parents, and for teenage mothers in particular, and that that guidance is part of our inclusion and pupil support guidance. It emphasises that on no account should schools exclude pupils for being pregnant, and that schools and local authorities should work together, and with other agencies such as Barnardo's, to support the needs of young mothers. The point that I would make about provision is that we provide good-quality childcare through programmes such as Flying Start, in which we invest around £12 million each year, and we have Genesis Wales 2 to enable all parents, regardless of age and circumstances, to participate in work and education.

I will draw your second point to the attention of the Minister for Health and Social Services. It is important to recognise that we need local services as well as respite care.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Minister, I seek two statements, the first of which relates to what my colleagues Jenny Randerson and Jonathan Morgan have asked for, which I endorse, in relation to Whitchurch Hospital. I note the letter that the Minister for health sent out yesterday, which referred to support for clinicians. The whole point of having a statement at the Assembly would be to explore the level of support that clinicians are afforded in the Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board in relation to this decision. More importantly, the £6 million, as I understand, that has been spent on the site came from the Welsh Assembly Government

fwyfwy hirdymor. Gan Gymru y mae'r unig ganolfan sy'n rhoi cefnogaeth a gofal seibiant cymdeithasol yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond, yn anffodus, mae'n ymddangos ei bod yn colli'r frwydr i ddarbwylllo sefydliadau atgyfeirio yng Nghymru fod gofal seibiant HIV/AIDS yn adnodd hanfodol ac yn un y gellid ei gefnogi'n well drwy atgyfeirio yng Nghymru.

Jane Hutt: Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am adroddiad Barnardo's, mae'n bwysig dweud nad oes fawr o sail i'r honiadau, oherwydd yr ydym wedi rhoi canllawiau i bob ysgol ac awdurdod lleol ar yr angen i ddelio â rhieni yn eu harddegau, a mamau yn eu harddegau'n arbennig, mewn modd cefnogol a hyblyg, ac mae'r canllawiau hynny'n rhan o'n canllawiau ar gynnwys a chynnal disgyblion. Maent yn pwysleisio na ddylai ysgolion ar unrhyw gyfrif wahardd disgyblion am fod yn feichiog, ac y dylai ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda'i gilydd, ac ag asiantaethau eraill fel Barnardo's, i gefnogi anghenion mamau ifanc. Y pwynt yr hoffwn ei wneud ynglŷn â'r ddarpariaeth yw ein bod yn darparu gofal plant o ansawdd da drwy raglenni fel Dechrau'n Deg, yr ydym yn buddsoddi rhyw £12 miliwn bob blwyddyn ynddo, ac mae gennym Genesis Cymru 2 i alluogi pawb sy'n rhieni, beth bynnag fo'u hoed a'u hamgylchiadau, i gyfranogi mewn gwaith ac addysg.

Rhoddaf eich ail bwynt i sylw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod arnom angen gwasanaethau lleol yn ogystal â gofal seibiant.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Weiniog, gofynnaf am ddau ddatganiad, y cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r hyn y mae fy nghyd-Aelodau Jenny Randerson a Jonathan Morgan wedi gofyn amdano, ac yr wyf yn cefnogi hynny, ynglŷn ag Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd. Nodaf y llythyr a anfonodd y Gweinidog iechyd allan ddoe, a gyfeiriai at gefnogaeth i glinigwyr. Diben cael datganiad yn y Cynulliad fyddai ymchwilio i lefel y gefnogaeth a roddir i glinigwyr ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro mewn perthynas â'r penderfyniad hwn. Yn bwysicach, daeth y £6 miliwn, yn ôl a ddeallaf, sydd wedi'i wario ar y safle oddi wrth Lywodraeth Cynulliad

specifically to redevelop it, and so the Welsh Assembly Government has a specific link to the redevelopment of the site because of the money that has gone in to date. Surely, it is a sum of money that cannot be easily discarded. The whole purpose of the Assembly is to scrutinise Ministers on Welsh Assembly Government priorities and resources. I would hope that you would reflect on some of the answers that you have given this afternoon, and impress on the Minister the importance of our having a statement from her, so that we can be assured that the best of intentions are at the heart of this review and that the services can be upgraded to be fit for the twenty-first century. If there are reasonable answers, I am sure that people will be more than prepared to give the LHB the credibility that it deserves in exploring the reconfiguration touched on yesterday.

I also seek a statement from the Minister on the financial troubles that many of the LHBs are suffering at the moment, given their end-of-year positions. Six out of seven of the LHBs have reported, or are likely to report, a financial deficit at the end of the financial year. More importantly, Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board made a statement last week in which it said that it might not be able to fulfil the statutory requirements that are placed on it because of the financial predicament that it faces. Given that a large part of the Vale of Glamorgan is covered by that health board, it has dramatic implications for many of the residents of the Vale of Glamorgan. I hope that you share my concern and that you can arrange for the Minister to make a statement on that. Then, we can see exactly how she, as Minister, and her officials are engaging with the health boards to mitigate their financial troubles. As I said, six out of seven local health boards in Wales face deficits this year.

Jane Hutt: I think that you knocked the nail on the head when you said that we need mental health services that are fit for the twenty-first century. That is precisely why we need this review, which is steered by clinicians who recognise the kinds of services

Cymru yn benodol i'w ailddatblygu, ac felly mae gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gysylltiad penodol ag ailddatblygiad y safle oherwydd yr arian sydd wedi mynd at hynny hyd yma. Mae'n swm o arian na ellir ei ddiystyru'n hawdd, siawns. Holl bwrpas y Cynulliad yw craffu ar Weinidogion ynghylch blaenoriaethau ac adnoddau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gobeithio y byddech yn myfyrio ar rai o'r atebion yr ydych wedi'u rhoi y prynhawn yma, a phwysleisio i'r Gweinidog mor bwysig yw inni gael datganiad ganddi hi, er mwyn inni allu cael sicrwydd bod y bwriadau gorau wrth wraidd yr adolygiad hwn ac y gellir uwchraddio'r gwasanaethau i fod yn addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Os oes atebion rhesymol, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pobl yn fwy na pharod i roi i'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yr hygredded y mae'n ei haeddu wrth archwilio'r ad-drefnu a grybwyllwyd ddoe.

Gofynnaf hefyd am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog ynghylch y trafferthion ariannol y mae llawer o'r byrddau iechyd lleol yn eu dioddef ar hyn o bryd, o weld eu sefyllfaoedd ar ddiwedd blwyddyn. Mae chwech o'r saith bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi adrodd—neu'n debyg o adrodd—fod ganddynt ddiffyg ariannol ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Yn bwysicach, gwnaeth Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg ddatganiad yr wythnos diwethaf gan ddweud efallai na fyddai'n gallu cyflawni'r gofynion statudol sydd wedi'u gosod arno oherwydd yr helynt ariannol y mae ynddo. Gan fod rhan fawr o Fro Morgannwg yn gyfrifoldeb i'r bwrdd iechyd hwnnw, mae goblygiadau dramatig i lawer o drigolion Bro Morgannwg. Gobeithio eich bod chithau'n bryderus ac y gallwch drefnu i'r Gweinidog wneud datganiad ynglŷn â hynny. Wedyn, gallwn weld sut y mae hi, fel Gweinidog, a'i swyddogion yn ymgysylltu â'r byrddau iechyd i liniaru eu trafferthion ariannol. Fel y dywedais, mae chwech o'r saith bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghymru'n wynebu diffygion eleni.

Jane Hutt: Credaf ichi daro'r hoelen ar ei phen pan ddywedasoch fod arnom angen gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl sy'n addas ar gyfer yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Dyna'n union pam y mae angen yr adolygiad hwn, a gaiff ei lywio gan glinigwyr sy'n sylweddoli'r

that are needed to serve Cardiff and the Vale. That point has been made clearly this afternoon.

Your second point goes back to the fact that these are tough times. The Minister for Health and Social Services has made her expectations quite clear to local health boards as regards meeting their financial requirements and expectations.

Paul Davies: I would be grateful if you could arrange for the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport to make a statement on the availability of broadband services throughout Wales. The lack of broadband services affects not only my constituency, but those of many Members here. As Members will be aware, I have been highlighting the not spots in my area for a long time, as I regularly receive representations on that from my constituents.

I know that the Deputy First Minister made an announcement at the beginning of this year that communities will be able to access European funding to enhance their broadband services, following the changes to European Commission guidance on ICT infrastructure. I have also received a letter from the Deputy First Minister confirming that his officials are exploring how these changes can widen the scope to meet the demand for locally driven projects, and stating that further announcements will be made. Will you ask the Deputy First Minister to ensure that he brings forward a statement confirming these details in due course, concentrating particularly on how new technologies such as wireless services can be introduced to assist people, including many of my constituents?

Jane Hutt: You have corresponded with the Deputy First Minister on this issue, and I am sure that you welcome the fact that we are accessing EU funds to tackle broadband access and that Lesley Griffiths, our Deputy Minister for Innovation, Science and Skills, is chairing the digital Wales ministerial group to take these issues forward.

mathau o wasanaethau y mae eu hangen i wasanaethu Caerdydd a'r Fro. Mae'r pwynt hwnnw wedi'i wneud yn glir y prynhawn yma.

Aiff eich ail bwynt yn ôl at y ffaith ei bod yn ddyddiau caled arnom. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi datgan ei disgwyliadau'n hollol glir i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ynghylch cyrraedd eu gofynion a'u disgwyliadau ariannol.

Paul Davies: Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech drefnu i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth wneud datganiad ynghylch y gwasanaethau band eang sydd ar gael ledled Cymru. Mae diffyg gwasanaethau band eang yn effeithio nid yn unig ar fy etholaeth i, ond ar etholaethau llawer o Aelodau yma. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, yr wyf wedi bod yn tynnu sylw at yr ardaloedd digyswllt yn fy ardal ers tro byd, gan fy mod yn cael sylwadau ar hynny'n rheolaidd gan fy etholwyr.

Gwn y gwnaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog gyhoeddiad ddechrau'r flwyddyn y bydd cymunedau'n gallu cael cyllid Ewropeaidd i wella'u gwasanaethau band eang, yn sgîl y newidiadau yng nghanllawiau Comisiwn Ewrop ar seilwaith technoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu. Yr wyf hefyd wedi cael llythyr oddi wrth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn cadarnhau bod ei swyddogion yn archwilio sut y gall y newidiadau hyn ehangu'r posibilïadau i ateb y galw am brosiectau lleol, ac yn datgan y gwneir cyhoeddiadau pellach. A ofynnwch i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog sicrhau y bydd yn cyflwyno datganiad yn cadarnhau'r manylion hyn maes o law, gan ganolbwyntio'n arbennig ar sut y gellir cyflwyno technolegau newydd fel gwasanaethau di-wifr i gynorthwyo pobl, gan gynnwys llawer o'm hetholwyr i?

Jane Hutt: Yr ydych wedi gohebu â'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar y mater hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y croesawch y ffaith ein bod yn cael arian Ewropeaidd i ddelio â mynediad band eang a bod Lesley Griffiths, ein Dirprwy Weinidog dros Wyddoniaeth, Arloesi a Sgiliau, yn cadeirio grŵp gweinidogol Cymru ddigidol i fwrw ymlaen â'r materion hyn.

The Presiding Officer: Finally, to round it all off, I call on Nick Ramsay.

Nick Ramsay: That sounded very final, did it not?

I want to ask the Minister to schedule statements to the Chamber relating to three areas: farming, education and health. On farming, I will not call for a debate on Glastir because I know that we are to have one this afternoon, but serious concerns have been raised with me, as with many Members, I am sure, about the proposed roll-out of that new programme. I am sure that those issues will be raised later, and so I ask that, this afternoon, we do not have a be-all and end-all debate. I want the concerns raised later to be taken on board by the Government and reacted to accordingly, by delivering a scheme that is acceptable to everyone.

Secondly, on education, could we have a statement on what the Assembly Government proposes to do about the issue that we constantly go on about: the funding gap? I know that it has been raised in committees and that some Members will say that the funding gap is not the problem that many of us believe it to be. If that is the case, we need that to be clarified. Over the weekend, I undertook a tour of the schools in my constituency, some of which are within walking distance of schools just across the border. However, in some cases, the schools over the border receive an additional £0.5 million as a result of that differential in the amount given to pupils in England as compared with those in Wales, so I would like to hear about that.

Finally, on health, I have previously raised the subject of vending machines, as have other Members, for people to have access to food during the midnight hour and after. Since I made such comments, I have been contacted by diabetic organisations, which have stressed the need for people suffering from diabetes to have access to chocolate bars and certain types of food, which they need for their condition. Currently, those are not available in hospitals in my constituency and across Wales, so I would like to see this issue dealt with in the Chamber at the earliest

Y Llywydd: Yn olaf, i gau pen y mwdwl, galwaf ar Nick Ramsay.

Nick Ramsay: Yr oedd hynny'n swnio'n derfynol iawn, onid oedd?

Mae arnaf eisiau gofyn i'r Gweinidog drefnu datganiadau i'r Siambr ynglŷn â thri maes: ffermio, addysg ac iechyd. Ynglŷn â ffermio, ni alwaf am ddatl ar Glastir oherwydd gwn ein bod am gael un y prynhawn yma, ond mae pryderon difrifol wedi'u codi gyda mi, fel gyda sawl Aelod, mae'n siŵr, ynglŷn â'r bwriad i gyflwyno'r rhaglen newydd honno. Yr wyf yn siŵr y codir y materion hynny'n ddiweddarach, ac felly gofynnaf, y prynhawn yma, am inni beidio â chael datl i gau'r mater unwaith ac am byth. Mae arnaf eisiau i'r Llywodraeth dderbyn y pryderon a godir yn ddiweddarach a gweithredu arnynt yn briodol, drwy gyflwyno cynllun sy'n dderbyniol gan bawb.

Yn ail, o ran addysg, a gaem ddatganiad ar yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ei wneud am y mater a drafodwn o hyd: y bwlch cyllidol? Gwn fod hyn wedi'i godi mewn pwyllgorau ac y dywed rhai Aelodau nad yw'r bwlch cyllidol yn gymaint o broblem ag y cred llawer ohonom. Os yw hynny'n wir, mae angen egluro hynny. Dros y penwythnos, euthum ar daith o gwmpas yr ysgolion yn fy etholaeth, rhai ohonynt o fewn pellter cerdded i ysgolion dros y ffin. Fodd bynnag, mewn rhai achosion, caiff yr ysgolion dros y ffin £0.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol o ganlyniad i'r gwahaniaeth yn y swm a roddir i ddisgyblion yn Lloegr o'u cymharu â rhai yng Nghymru, felly hoffwn glywed am hynny.

Yn olaf, o ran iechyd, yr wyf wedi codi pwnc peiriannau gwerthu o'r blaen, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill, i bobl allu cael bwyd yn ystod yr oriau mân. Ers imi wneud y sylwadau hynny, cysylltwyd â mi gan gymdeithasau diabetes, sydd wedi pwysleisio'r angen i bobl sydd â'r clefyd hwnnw allu cael bariâu siocled a mathau arbennig o fwyd, y mae arnynt eu hangen at eu cyflwr. Ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'r rheini ar gael mewn ysbytai yn fy etholaeth ac ar draws Cymru, felly hoffwn weld delio â'r mater hwn yn y Siambr cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

opportunity.

2.50 p.m.

Jane Hutt: I am sure that you welcome the fact that Elin Jones, our Minister for Rural Affairs, is leading the debate on Glastir and its implementation this afternoon. I am also sure that you welcome the review initiated by Leighton Andrews, our Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning, of the cost of administering the education system in Wales. That marks the first step in taking forward the First Minister's commitment to refocusing educational investment to ensure that the money reaches the front line.

Jane Hutt: Yr wyf yn siŵr y croesawch y ffaith bod Elin Jones, ein Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig, yn arwain y ddadl ar Glastir a'r modd y'i gweithreidir y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn siŵr hefyd y croesawch yr adolygiad sydd wedi'i gychwyn gan Leighton Andrews, ein Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, o gost gweinyddu'r gyfundrefn addysg yng Nghymru. Dyna'r cam cyntaf i wireddu ymrwymiad y Prif Weinidog i addasu'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg i sicrhau bod yr arian yn cyrraedd y rheng flaen.

On your point about vending machines, if there is an access issue, particularly for people suffering from conditions such as diabetes, I suggest that you raise it with the health board responsible for those vending machines in your constituency.

Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am beiriannau gwerthu, os oes problem cael eitemau, yn enwedig i bobl sydd â chyflyrau megis diabetes, awgrymaf eich bod yn ei chodi gyda'r bwrdd iechyd sy'n gyfrifol am y peiriannau gwerthu hynny yn eich etholaeth.

Datganiad am Gymunedau yn Gyntaf Statement on Communities First

The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant): Over recent months, the Assembly Government's internal audit service, jointly with the Wales Audit Office, has undertaken a detailed investigation into the affairs of the Plas Madoc Communities First partnership in Clwyd South, in the Wrexham county borough. That work is now complete, and I have been briefed on the findings. The report will be published shortly by the Assembly Government and the WAO within the next few days, in line with normal arrangements for publishing reports.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant): Yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, mae gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar y cyd â Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, wedi cynnal ymchwiliad manwl i faterion partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Plas Madog yn Ne Clwyd, ym mwrdeistref sirol Wrecsam. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw bellach wedi'i gwblhau, ac yr wyf wedi cael fy mrieffio am y canfyddiadau. Cyhoeddir yr adroddiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru o fewn y dyddiau nesaf, yn unol â'r trefniadau arferol ar gyfer cyhoeddi adroddiadau.

I am making this statement today, ahead of the report's publication, in view of the public interest and media speculation surrounding the findings. I am particularly concerned to quash mischievous and unfounded speculation that this report signals the end of the Communities First programme, which plays a vital role in supporting our most deprived communities across Wales.

Yr wyf yn gwneud y datganiad hwn heddiw, cyn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad, oherwydd diddordeb y cyhoedd a dyfalu'r cyfryngau ynghylch y canfyddiadau. Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i roi taw ar ddyfalu drygionus a di-sail bod yr adroddiad hwn yn dangos ei bod ar ben ar y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, sy'n chwarae rhan hanfodol i gynnal ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig ledled Cymru.

The audit report makes disturbing reading. It identifies serious and widespread weaknesses in the financial control and governance of the Plas Madoc partnership. It is critical of the failings of the partnership board and of the improper actions of individual members. I want to state quite clearly that I deplore the deliberate actions and the omissions of oversight and stewardship that have led to public funds being diverted from the overall intended purposes of the programme. I am sure that other Members, like me, will wish to condemn the behaviour of those who have put personal gain above the benefit intended for local people in one of the most deprived communities in Wales.

In considering what went wrong, it is necessary to set the failings of Plas Madoc in context. Plas Madoc is one of 157 Communities First partnerships across Wales. Of the total £47 million that was invested in Communities First during 2009-10, around £480,000 has gone to Plas Madoc. The specific audit concerns relate to the financial mismanagement of a small proportion of the funding routed through the Plas Madoc partnership to those funds available for spending at local discretion and internal management purposes. There is no suggestion that the majority of the funding awarded has been used for purposes other than those intended, and a wide range of important services has been delivered to the local community, including support for local children and young people, in particular. In general, these services have been provided to a high standard and are valued by the community. I am anxious to keep those valued services delivered there, and I shall make a further statement on the future of those services when the report is published.

The formal independent audit certification upon which the release of Assembly Government funding rests has been satisfactorily provided for each of the three years during which the Plas Madoc partnership has been a direct grant recipient. In accordance with normal practice, that has triggered ongoing payments of approved grants to the partnership.

Profiad annifyr yw darllen yr adroddiad. Mae'n nodi gwendidau difrifol a chyffredin yn rheolaeth ariannol a threfn lywodraethu partneriaeth Plas Madog. Mae'n feirniadol o ddiffygion bwrdd y bartneriaeth ac o weithredoedd afreolaidd aelodau unigol. Mae arnaf eisiau datgan yn berffaith glir fy mod yn gresynu at y gweithredoedd bwriadol a'r diffyg goruchwylio a stiwardiaeth sydd wedi peri nad yw arian cyhoeddus wedi bod yn cael ei ddefnyddio at y dibenion cyffredinol a fwriadwyd ar gyfer y rhaglen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau eraill, fel fi, yn dymuno condemnio ymddygiad y bobl sydd wedi rhoi elw personol o flaen y budd a fwriedid i bobl leol yn un o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru.

Wrth ystyried beth a aeth o'i le, mae angen gosod diffygion Plas Madog yn eu cyddestun. Mae Plas Madog yn un o 157 partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru. O'r cyfanswm o £47 miliwn a fuddsoddwyd yn Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ystod 2009-10, aeth rhyw £480,000 i Blas Madog. Mae pryderon penodol yr archwiliad yn ymwneud â chamreolaeth ariannol cyfran fach o'r arian a gyfeiriwyd drwy bartneriaeth Plas Madog i'r cronfeydd hynny a fyddai ar gael i'w gwario yn ôl disgresiwn lleol ac at ddibenion rheolaeth fewnol. Nid oes dim awgrym bod y rhan fwyaf o'r cyllid a ddarparwyd wedi'i ddefnyddio at ddibenion gwahanol i'r hyn a fwriadwyd, ac mae ystod eang o wasanaethau pwysig wedi'u darparu i'r gymuned leol gan gynnwys cefnogaeth i blant a phobl ifanc lleol, yn arbennig. Yn gyffredinol, mae'r gwasanaethau hyn sydd wedi'u darparu wedi bod o safon uchel ac fe'u gwerthfawrogir gan y gymuned. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gadw'r gwasanaethau gwerthfawr hynny a ddarperir yno, a gwnaf ddatganiad pellach ar ddyfodol y gwasanaethau hynny pan gyhoeddir yr adroddiad.

Mae'r ardystio ffurfiol drwy archwiliad annibynnol sy'n ofynnol i ryddhau cyllid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi'i ddarparu'n foddhaol ar gyfer pob un o'r tair blynedd y mae partneriaeth Plas Madog wedi cael grant uniongyrchol. Yn unol â'r arfer, mae hynny wedi ysgogi talu grantiau sydd wedi'u cymeradwyo i'r bartneriaeth.

I want to offer my reassurances to all the other partnerships of the Communities First programme. It has been suggested that the failings of the Plas Madoc partnership can be generalised across the wider Communities First programme. Those suggestions are not made on the basis of any evidence of which I am aware. Indeed, I am sure that other partnerships will be very keen to distinguish themselves from the behaviours evident in Plas Madoc. Those genuinely working for the benefit of disadvantaged communities in Wales can be reassured of my support. However, while I wish to see investment in the Communities First programme continue, I will be requiring specific additional assurances from partnerships that their financial management and governance arrangements are robust before committing further substantial funding to them. My department has already begun the process of securing additional assurance by putting in place detailed checks of the financial control and governance in all partnerships.

The action that I am announcing is a proportionate response to the reputational damage to the programme caused by the failings in Plas Madoc. I expect the great majority of Communities First partnerships and their respective grant recipient bodies to be able to satisfy me in this regard, and they will want to do so promptly.

Members will be aware of other reviews and reports relating to Communities First. A review of the robustness of the governance framework for the Communities First programme was initiated last autumn. As a result, I have asked my officials to undertake a programme of detailed and urgent audit inspections of partnerships. I want to be assured that the failings in Plas Madoc cannot be allowed to happen again. Therefore, I will take a close interest in this work and will make a further statement to the Assembly when it is completed.

In addition to the audit of partnerships, we are implementing a further series of actions to strengthen financial control and

Mae arnaf eisiau rhoi sicrwydd i holl bartneriaethau eraill rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Awgrymwyd y gellir dweud bod diffygion partneriaeth Plas Madog yn adlewyrchu diffygion cyffredinol ar draws rhaglen ehangach Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Nid yw'r awgrymiadau hynny wedi'u gwneud ar sail unrhyw dystiolaeth y gwn amdani. Yn wir, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd partneriaethau eraill yn awyddus iawn i ymbellhau oddi wrth y math o ymddygiad a welwyd ym Mhlas Madog. Gallaf sicrhau pobl sy'n gweithio'n wirioneddol er budd cymunedau difreintiedig yng Nghymru fod ganddynt gefnogaeth gennyf. Fodd bynnag, er y dymunaf weld buddsoddiad yn rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn parhau, bydd arnaf eisiau sicrwydd ychwanegol penodol gan bartneriaethau fod eu rheolaeth ariannol a'u trefniadau llywodraethu'n gadarn cyn neilltuo cyllid sylweddol pellach iddynt. Mae fy adran eisoes wedi dechrau'r broses o sicrhau sicrwydd ychwanegol drwy sefydlu mesurau gwirio manwl ar reolaeth ariannol a threfniadau llywodraethu ym mhob partneriaeth.

Mae'r camau yr wyf yn eu cyhoeddi yn ymateb cymesur i'r niwed i enw da'r rhaglen a achoswyd gan y diffygion ym Mhlas Madog. Disgwyliaf y bydd y mwyafrif helaeth o bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r cyrff sy'n cael grantiau yn eu sgîl yn gallu fy modloni yn hyn o beth, ac y bydd arnynt eisiau gwneud hynny'n ddiymdroi.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n ymwybodol o adolygiadau ac adroddiadau eraill ynglŷn â Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Dechreuwyd adolygiad o gadernid fframwaith llywodraethu'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yr hydref diwethaf. O ganlyniad, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion wneud rhaglen o arolygon archwilio manwl a brys ar bartneriaethau. Mae arnaf eisiau bod yn sicr na ellir caniatáu i'r diffygion ym Mhlas Madog ddigwydd eto. Felly, bydd y gwaith hwn o ddiddordeb mawr imi a gwnaf ddatganiad pellach i'r Cynulliad pan fydd wedi'i orffen.

Yn ogystal ag archwilio partneriaethau, yr ydym yn gweithredu cyfres bellach o gamau i gryfhau rheolaeth ariannol a threfniadau

governance arrangements, responding to failings such as those seen at Plas Madoc. Actions are already in hand to test and provide reassurance about arrangements in place across the programme. I am writing to the chairs of Communities First partnership boards, drawing the Plas Madoc report to their attention and reiterating the importance of adherence to the high standards of conduct in public life that I expect. My department will follow that up with formal guidance to ensure that there can be no question but that the importance of adherence to these standards, the Nolan principles, is understood by those involved in delivering and supporting the Communities First programme. I will inform the Assembly when that further audit work on other Communities First partnerships is complete.

Members will also recall that the Public Accounts Committee recently published a report on Communities First, and the Assembly Government will be responding to that shortly. That report dealt not with detailed issues of management and propriety within partnerships, but with the impact of the programme in achieving improved outcomes for people and communities. Let us not forget that, across Wales, Communities First is delivering for local people, providing valuable services such as childcare, youth activity, help into work, and much more to people in our most deprived communities. Many of you will know that well and will value that work in your own areas.

The steps that I am announcing today provide a proportionate response to the failings identified in the Plas Madoc partnership and will secure and strengthen good financial control and governance across the wider Communities First programme. The Assembly Government remains fully committed to ensuring that the most deprived communities in Wales are supported, and is fully committed to improving outcomes for the people who live there. I will not be deflected from that objective by the failings of a few individuals or a partnership that sullies the reputation of others through its deplorable actions.

llywodraethu, gan ymateb i ddiffygion fel y rhai a welwyd ym Mhlas Madog. Mae camau ar waith eisoes i brofi a rhoi sicrwydd ynglŷn â threfniadau sydd yn bodoli ar draws y rhaglen. Yr wyf yn ysgrifennu at gadeiryddion byrddau partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, gan dynnu eu sylw at adroddiad Plas Madog ac ailadrodd pwysigrwydd glynu at y safonau ymddygiad uchel a ddisgwyliaf mewn bywyd cyhoeddus. Bydd fy adran yn dilyn hynny â chanllawiau ffurfiol i sicrhau y bydd pawb sy'n ymwneud â chyflwyno a chefnogi rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn deall pwysigrwydd glynu at y safonau hyn, sef egwyddorion Nolan. Hysbysaf y Cynulliad pan fydd y gwaith archwilio pellach hwnnw ar bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf eraill wedi'i gwblhau.

Bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio hefyd fod y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus wedi cyhoeddi adroddiad yn ddiweddar ar Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymateb i hwnnw cyn bo hir. Yr oedd yr adroddiad hwnnw'n delio nid â chwestiynau manwl yn ymwneud â rheolaeth a phriodoldeb o fewn partneriaethau, ond ag effaith y rhaglen o ran sicrhau canlyniadau gwell i bobl a chymunedau. Nac anghofiwn fod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ar draws Cymru, yn cyflawni pethau i bobl leol, gan ddarparu gwasanaethau gwerthfawr fel gofal plant, gweithgaredd ieuenctid, help i gael gwaith, a llawer mwy i bobl yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig. Bydd llawer ohonoch yn gwybod hynny'n iawn ac yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwaith hwnnw yn eich ardaloedd eich hunain.

Mae'r camau yr wyf yn eu cyhoeddi heddiw'n ymateb cymesur i'r diffygion a ganfuwyd ym mhartneriaeth Plas Madog a byddant yn sicrhau ac yn cryfhau rheolaeth ariannol a threfniadau llywodraethu da ar draws rhaglen ehangach Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau'n gwbl ymroddedig i sicrhau bod y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru'n cael eu cefnogi, ac yn gwbl ymroddedig i wella canlyniadau i'r bobl sy'n byw yno. Ni chaiff diffygion ychydig o unigolion neu bartneriaeth sy'n pardduo enw da eraill drwy ei gweithredoedd gresynus beri imi wyro oddi wrth y nod hwnnw.

Mark Isherwood: Thank you for your statement, Minister. Before I ask my questions, I will start by stating that the Welsh Government's website notes that the Communities First programme exists to tackle deprivation and to improve living conditions and prospects in disadvantaged communities. The issues in Plas Madoc are, in many respects, *sub judice* and so I will not refer to any matters currently under investigation by other bodies. Suffice it to say that the issue under consideration today is the failure of the systems put in place by the Welsh Government to prevent this from happening, which would not have been permitted in the private or third sectors.

Will the Minister join me in commending the whistleblower, who initially suffered severe problems as she was, metaphorically speaking, the messenger who was shot for raising this? Does he agree that we need more rigorous systems in place in future to protect whistleblowers in such circumstances who highlight failings and worse in the systems applied?

Your statement says that the audit report identified serious and widespread weaknesses in financial control and governance within the partnership. Is it not the case, Minister, that this reflects the broader concerns raised in the Wales Audit Office report, namely that the programme had emerged from chaos, was not planned, that there was an absence of basic financial and human resource planning before the programme was launched, and bids were therefore not assessed properly? The review found monitoring to be weak and not built in at all in the early years. There was no evidence that anything was ever done with the feedback. I was told that in a meeting shortly after the report was published last year. Had those systems been operating effectively, this surely could not and would not have occurred.

3.00 p.m.

I agree with you fully that those who are

Mark Isherwood: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Cyn imi ofyn fy nghwestiynau, dechreuaf drwy ddatgan bod gwefan Llywodraeth Cymru'n nodi bod rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn bodoli i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd ac i wella amodau byw a rhagolygon mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Mae'r problemau ym Mhlas Madog, i raddau helaeth, yn *sub judice* ac felly ni chyfeirïaf at unrhyw faterion sydd ar hyn o bryd yn destun ymchwiliad gan gyrff eraill. Digon yw dweud mai'r mater sydd dan sylw heddiw yw methiant systemau a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru i atal hyn rhag digwydd, rhywbeth na fyddid wedi caniatáu iddo ddigwydd yn y sector preifat na'r trydydd sector.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo'r sawl a chwythodd y chwiban, a ddiodeffodd broblemau difrifol ar y dechrau gan mai hi, a siarad yn drosiadol, oedd y negesydd a saethwyd am godi hyn? A yw'n cytuno bod angen cael systemau llymach yn y dyfodol i warchod chwythwyr chwiban mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath sy'n tynnu sylw at ddiffygion, a pethau gwaeth na hynny, yn y systemau a ddefnyddir?

Dywed eich datganiad fod yr adroddiad archwilio wedi nodi gwendidau difrifol a chyffredin mewn rheolaeth ariannol a threfniadau llywodraethu o fewn y bartneriaeth. Onid y gwir yw, Weinidog, fod hyn yn adlewyrchu'r pryderon ehangach a godwyd yn adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, sef bod y rhaglen wedi codi o anhrefn, nad oedd wedi'i chynllunio, na chafwyd cynllunio sylfaenol o ran cyllid ac adnoddau dynol cyn cychwyn y rhaglen, ac felly nad aseswyd ceisiadau'n iawn? Canfu'r adolygiad fod y monitro'n wan ac nad oedd yn rhan annatod o'r drefn o gwbl yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. Nid oedd dim tystiolaeth bod dim wedi'i wneud erioed gyda'r adborth. Dywedwyd hynny wrthyf mewn cyfarfod ychydig wedi cyhoeddi'r adroddiad y llynedd. Pe bai'r systemau hynny wedi bod yn gweithio'n effeithiol, ni allai ac ni fyddai hyn wedi digwydd, siawns.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi y gall y rhai sydd yn

genuinely working for the benefit of disadvantaged communities in Wales can be assured of your support, of my support, and that of my party.

You say that you would expect that a majority of Communities First partnerships and their respective representative bodies would be able to satisfy you in their response, and I hope that you are right, but I note that, at present, the evidence on which to base a judgment is not available. You refer to detailed and urgent audit inspections of partnerships. Will you confirm that those audits will not only look at financial control, but at other identified areas of weakness as well, such as the human resource planning, training and monitoring in place in the partnerships?

I refer you to the Public Accounts Committee report—I will leave it to Jonathan Morgan to raise questions concerning that. You ask us not to forget that Communities First is delivering for local people, but, as I said at the outset, the Welsh Government says that this is about tackling deprivation. Why, then, has the poverty gap widened? Why has social mobility stalled? Why do we have the highest level of unemployment and child poverty in the United Kingdom? Economic inactivity is at record levels and youth unemployment is at its highest level since records began.

Finally, you indicate your hope that this will be an isolated case, and that you are not aware of evidence concerning any other partnerships. I will refer one to you. A volunteer, not from north Wales, but from north Abergavenny, came to see me in Cardiff. He is not suggesting any wrongdoing, necessarily, but he is indicating similar concerns that broadly reflect those at Plas Madoc. He said that the volunteers lacked guidance and training, that the management lacked experience, that the programme is unstructured, and that funds are often spent haphazardly. He wanted to know who exactly audits and co-ordinates the programme. Minister, he met Nick Ramsay, his local Assembly Member, and me in the autumn of last year, so these concerns are

gweithio'n ddiffuant er budd cymunedau difreintiedig yng Nghymru fod yn sicr o'ch cefnogaeth chi, o'm cefnogaeth i, ac o gefnogaeth fy mhlaidd.

Dywedwch y disgwyliech y gallai'r rhan fwyaf o bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r cyrff sy'n cael eu cynrychioli arnynt eich bodloni yn eu hymateb, a gobeithio eich bod yn iawn, ond sylwaf, ar hyn o bryd, nad yw'r dystiolaeth er mwyn seilio barn arni ar gael. Cyfeiriwch at arolygon archwilio manwl a brys ar bartneriaethau. A wnewch gadarnhau y gwnaiff yr archwiliadau hynny edrych nid yn unig ar reolaeth ariannol, ond ar feysydd eraill lle y canfuwyd gwendidau hefyd, megis y cynllunio ar adnoddau dynol, hyfforddiant a monitro a geir yn y partneriaethau?

Fe'ch cyfeiriaf at adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus—gadawaf i Jonathan Morgan godi cwestiynau ynglŷn â hynny. Gofynnwch inni beidio ag anghofio bod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyflawni pethau i bobl leol, ond, fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, dywed Llywodraeth Cymru mai mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd yw diben hyn. Pam, felly, y mae'r bwlch tlodi wedi lledu? Pam mae symudedd cymdeithasol wedi stopio? Pam y mae gennym y lefel uchaf o ddiweithdra a thlodi plant yn y Deyrnas Unedig? Mae mwy o anweithgarwch economaidd nag erioed ac mae diweithdra ymysg yr ifanc ar ei lefel uchaf ers dechrau cadw cofnodion.

Yn olaf, dywedwch eich bod yn gobeithio mai un achos yn unig fydd hwn, ac nad ydych yn ymwybodol o dystiolaeth ynghylch unrhyw bartneriaethau eraill. Fe gyfeiriaf un atoch. Daeth gwirfoddolwr, nid o'r gogledd, ond o ogledd y Fenni, i'm gweld yng Nghaerdydd. Nid yw'n awgrymu bod drwgweithredu wedi bod, o reidrwydd, ond mae'n nodi pryderon tebyg sy'n adlewyrchu'n fras y pryderon ym Mhlas Madog. Dywedodd nad oedd canllawiau na hyfforddiant i'r gwirfoddolwyr, fod y rheolwyr yn ddibrofiad, fod y rhaglen yn ddistrywthur, a bod arian yn cael ei wario'n fympwyol yn aml. Yr oedd arno eisiau gwybod pwy yn union sy'n archwilio ac yn cydgysylltu'r rhaglen. Weinidog, cyfarfu â Nick Ramsay, ei Aelod Cynulliad lleol, a

current and pressing, as they are in other parts of Wales.

Carl Sargeant: As I indicated earlier, there are 157 partnerships. Plas Madoc was identified to us on an evidence basis, and there has been an investigation into that. As you and the Llywydd will understand, I will not be able to comment on the detail of Plas Madoc until the report is formalised, when it will be available to all Assembly Members. However, I have been clear about the actions that I expect to see in how services should be delivered with public money.

I know your position on Communities First, Mark—a glass half empty as opposed to a glass half full. I will not be deflected by that. In fact, I believe that Communities First is delivering some good community services. I do accept, however, that we have to test that regime to ensure that it is delivering. That is why I have put the governance and financial review into all partnerships. I have written to them, and I expect a prompt reply on the initial service check to give us some initial confidence. I have also looked at what I would consider to be the at-risk partnerships where they are direct grant recipient bodies, similar to Plas Madoc, and I have asked my team to ensure that they conduct an immediate investigation and consultation exercise with the partnerships to ensure that I am assured that these issues are not highlighted there.

On the audit report, detailed audit instructions are in place for Communities First programmes, and these are reviewed annually by the Wales Audit Office, and not by the Assembly Government. Some private sector auditors, as in the case of Plas Madoc, have restricted their audit testing to cover the majority of the expenditure, and hence they largely centred on salaries. That is a pretty narrow focus. I have asked for that to be broadened out. I will be reassured that the majority of partnerships are not going down the same road as Plas Madoc. I will shortly have that on an evidence base. I am looking for the majority of the data to be in for the

minnau yn yr hydref y llynedd, felly mae angen rhoi sylw'n ddi-oed yn awr i'r pryderon hyn, fel mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

Carl Sargeant: Fel y nodais yn gynharach, ceir 157 o bartneriaethau. Enwyd Plas Madog inni ar sail tystiolaeth, a chafwyd ymchwiliad i hynny. Fel y deallwch chi a'r Llywydd, ni fyddaf yn gallu rhoi sylwadau ar fanylion Plas Madog nes bydd yr adroddiad wedi'i ffurfioli, pryd y bydd ar gael i bob Aelod Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi bod yn glir ynglŷn â'r camau y disgwyliaf eu gweld o ran y modd y dylid darparu gwasanaethau ag arian cyhoeddus.

Gwn beth yw eich safbwynt am Gymunedau yn Gyntaf, Mark—gwydr hanner gwag yn hytrach na gwydr hanner llawn. Ni chaiff hynny fy mwrw oddi ar fy echel. Yn wir, credaf fod Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn darparu rhai gwasanaethau cymunedol da. Derbyniaf, fodd bynnag, fod yn rhaid inni roi'r drefn honno ar brawf i sicrhau ei bod yn gweithio. Dyna pam yr wyf wedi peri bod yr adolygiad llywodraethu a pherfformiad yn archwilio pob partneriaeth. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atynt, a disgwyliaf ateb diymdroi ar y gwiriad gwasanaethau cyntaf i roi rhyw hyder cychwynnol inni. Yr wyf wedi edrych hefyd ar y partneriaethau lle y gall fod perygl yn fy marn i, sef lle y maent yn gyrff sy'n cael grant uniongyrchol, yn debyg i Blas Madog, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm tîm sicrhau y cynhaliant ymarferiad ymchwilio ac ymgynghori yn ddi-oed gyda'r partneriaethau i sicrhau y caf sicrwydd nad amlygir y problemau hyn yno.

Ynglŷn â'r adroddiad archwilio, mae cyfarwyddiadau archwilio manwl wedi'u gosod i raglenni Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac adolygir y rhain yn flynyddol gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ac nid gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae rhai archwilwyr sector preifat, fel yn achos Plas Madog, wedi cyfyngu eu profion archwilio i ddelio â'r rhan fwyaf o'r gwariant, gan ganolbwyntio i raddau helaeth ar gyflogau felly. Mae hynny'n ffocws eithaf cul. Yr wyf wedi gofyn am ehangu hynny. Caf sicrwydd nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o bartneriaethau'n mynd ar hyd yr un trywydd â Phlas Madog. Yn fuan bydd hynny gennyf ar sail tystiolaeth. Fy nod

end of May, which will give me more confidence in the scheme as a whole.

Brian Gibbons: Thank you for the statement, Minister. It is regrettable that there is need for a statement, but you are to be commended for the open and transparent way in which you are addressing this particular issue. You are absolutely right that there are issues of governance for Communities First partnerships, and it is a key challenge for them to put good governance in place, because it is public money that is being spent. If that money is not being spent effectively, those communities are losing out on the regeneration opportunities that that money is there to help provide. However, we need to be aware that many of our most persistently and severely disadvantaged communities, which are, by definition, part of this bottom-up programme, will have governance capacity issues. If they did not have these governance capacity issues they would not be facing the problems and challenges that they face in the first place. It is important to recognise that all weaknesses in governance arrangements are not down to malign intent, but reflect the capacity weakness that is at the heart of social and economic disadvantage in too many of our communities.

Therefore, do you agree that, as part of the governance review that you are putting in place, it is important that those most disadvantaged communities with the weakest capacity do not find themselves on an outside track for regeneration programmes, and that it is important that they do not find themselves standing still waiting for the governance checks while urgent work needs to be taking place in those communities? That is beginning to happen, particularly when your colleague Leighton Andrews refocused the Communities First programme on an outcome-based approach. I see that difference taking place in my constituency on a day to day basis, where real progress is now being made. It is in the light of that progress that some of the comments in the Public Accounts Committee report, which are important on a historical basis, are quite dated.

yw cael y rhan fwyaf o'r data i mewn erbyn diwedd Mai, a bydd hynny'n rhoi mwy o hyder imi yn y cynllun yn ei gyfanrwydd.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch am y datganiad, Weinidog. Mae'n destun gofid bod angen datganiad, ond yr ydych i'ch cymeradwyo am y modd agored a thryloyw yr ydych yn ymdrin â'r mater arbennig hwn. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle fod problemau llywodraethu gyda phartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac mae'n her allweddol iddynt sefydlu trefn lywodraethu dda, oherwydd arian cyhoeddus sy'n cael ei wario. Os na werir yr arian hwnnw'n effeithiol, mae'r cymunedau hynny ar eu colled o ran y cyfleoedd i adfywio y mae'r arian hwnnw i fod i helpu i'w darparu. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol y bydd problemau ynglŷn â'r gallu i lywodraethu gan lawer o'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, sydd drwy ddiffiniad, yn rhan o'r rhaglen hon, sy'n rhaglen o'r gwaelod i fyny. Pe na bai ganddynt y problemau hyn yn eu gallu i lywodraethu ni fyddent yn wynebu'r problemau a'r heriau y maent yn eu hwynebu yn y lle cyntaf. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod nad bwriad maleisus sy'n gyfrifol am bob gwendid mewn trefniadau llywodraethu, ond maent yn adlewyrchu'r gwendid o ran gallu sydd wrth wraidd amddifadedd cymdeithasol ac economaidd mewn gormod o'n cymunedau.

Felly, a gytunwch ei bod yn bwysig, fel rhan o'r adolygiad llywodraethu yr ydych yn ei drefnu, nad yw'r cymunedau difreintiedig hynny sydd wannaf o ran gallu yn eu canfod eu hunain ar y cyrion ar gyfer rhaglenni adfywio, a'i bod yn bwysig nad ydynt yn eu canfod eu hunain yn sefyll yn eu hunfan yn aros am archwiliadau llywodraethu tra bod angen gwaith brys yn y cymunedau hynny? Mae hynny'n dechrau digwydd, yn enwedig pan newidiodd eich cyd-Weinidog Leighton Andrews bwyslais rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i weithio ar sail canlyniadau. Gwelaf y gwahaniaeth hwnnw'n digwydd yn fy etholaeth o ddydd i ddydd, lle y mae cynnydd gwirioneddol yn digwydd erbyn hyn. Y cynnydd hwnnw sy'n peri bod rhai o'r sylwadau yn y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, sy'n bwysig am resymau hanesyddol, ar ei hôl hi braidd.

Finally, do you agree that, on the basis of what you have said, there may be a need to consolidate governance capacity in a number of Communities First partnerships? We have sent out a message to collaborate in areas such as the outcomes fund, so there may be a need to consolidate the expertise and encourage greater collaboration in relation to governance. Do you also agree that we need to look to well-motivated organisations, such as business in the community or social enterprises that wish to work with their most disadvantaged communities, that may have the necessary capacity and business skills to help underpin the governance arrangements of our most disadvantaged communities, which may be at greatest risk?

Carl Sargeant: Thank you for your comments, Brian. You are right to say that the programme that we are delivering holds a risk, but the risk can be managed by how we deal with the governance of these partnerships. The department has already taken proactive steps to re-examine and strengthen the governance arrangements within partnerships, but would welcome the consolidation or collaborative approach of partnerships in capacity; you are absolutely right about that. We are asking some communities to do that. The difficulty is around the capacity, and not the will to purposely do something that they perhaps should not be doing in the public sector.

3.10 p.m.

As you will know, Brian, many Members across the Chamber can cite examples that Communities First partnerships have started to make progress on delivery in our most deprived communities and it has been a long and difficult transition for some communities from where they were 10 years ago to where they are now. It has been a huge challenge to re-engage broken communities. I am committed to ensuring that we continue to support them, but I also have to be convinced that, where we are spending large amounts of public money, we are providing support for effective governance and that there is financial accountability. I have to be comfortable, as the Minister responsible to the Assembly, that we have the balance right.

Yn olaf, a gytunwch, ar sail yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, y gall fod angen cydgrynhoi'r gallu i lywodraethu mewn nifer o bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf? Yr ydym wedi anfon neges i gydweithio mewn meysydd fel y gronfa canlyniadau, felly efallai fod angen cydgrynhoi'r arbenigedd ac annog mwy o gydweithio mewn perthynas â llywodraethu. A gytunwch hefyd fod angen inni edrych ar gyrff â chymhelliant da, megis busnes yn y gymuned neu fentrau cymdeithasol sy'n dymuno gweithio gyda'u cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, a all fod â'r gallu a'r sgiliau busnes angenrheidiol i helpu i osod sylfaen gadarn i drefniadau llywodraethu ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig, sydd efallai mewn mwyaf o berygl?

Carl Sargeant: Diolch am eich sylwadau, Brian. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod risg ynghlwm wrth y rhaglen yr ydym yn ei chyflwyno, ond gellir rheoli'r risg drwy'r modd y deliwn â threfniadau llywodraethu'r partneriaethau hyn. Mae'r adran eisoes wedi cymryd camau rhagweithiol i ailarchwilio a chryfhau'r trefniadau llywodraethu o fewn partneriaethau, ond byddem yn croesawu cydgrynhoi neu gydweithio gan bartneriaethau o ran gallu; yr ydych yn llygad eich lle ynglŷn â hynny. Yr ydym yn gofyn i rai cymunedau wneud hynny. Y gallu sy'n peri'r anhawster, ac nid yr ewyllys i wneud rhywbeth yn fwriadol na ddylent efallai fod yn ei wneud yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Fel y gwyddoch, Brian, gall llawer o Aelodau ar draws y Siambr roi enghreifftiau lle y mae partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi dechrau gwneud cynnydd o ran cyflawni yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig ac mae wedi bod yn drawsnewid hir ac anodd i rai cymunedau o'r fan lle yr oeddent 10 mlynedd yn ôl i ble y maent yn awr. Mae wedi bod yn her enfawr ailennyn diddordeb cymunedau a oedd wedi datgymalu. Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y parhawn i'w cefnogi, ond rhaid imi fod yn sicr hefyd, lle yr ydym yn gwario symiau mawr o arian cyhoeddus, ein bod yn darparu cefnogaeth i drefniadau llywodraethu effeithiol a bod atebolrwydd ariannol. Rhaid imi fod yn gyfforddus, fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol i'r Cynulliad, fod y

cydbwysedd yn iawn gennym.

Eleanor Burnham: This is a sad state of affairs. It has been a difficult issue for whistleblowers in that they may have been bullied, intimidated, subjected to violence or sacked. There have obviously been discussions and it has been difficult to know how to progress with this issue. I am pleased that you are now taking the bull by the horns. I would like you to be bold enough to say that these kinds of partnerships are all very well in theory, but that, in practice, when this kind of situation arises, we have to ask whether we should not give the money to the local authority, which is directly elected and extremely accountable in all aspects of governance and spending. I do not like to say that, because the theory that underpins these partnerships is laudable.

There has been a sense of evil about this issue, in many respects, to do with the intimidation, the bullying and the violence towards a particular whistleblower of whom Mark and I are aware, and it is very sad. I hope that you will be bold and that you will do your best to ensure that whatever governance is in place for the rest of the Communities First partnerships is truly accountable and much more transparent, so that we do not end up with considerable misspending of resources. You said that £480,000 has gone in 2009-10. Perhaps you would like to tell us what the total spend has been in Plas Madoc and how much of that has been misdirected. I will leave it at that.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister made it clear, as he is entitled to do, that, because of the current position, he was—

Eleanor Burnham: I withdraw the last statement.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful to you.

Carl Sargeant: There are some things that I cannot say regarding Plas Madoc. However, I do not find some of the actions that have been taken there appropriate, so the report will be published in accordance with

Eleanor Burnham: Mae hon yn sefyllfa drist. Mae wedi bod yn fater anodd i rai sy'n chwythu chwiban gan y gallant fod wedi'u bwlio neu eu bygwth, wedi dioddef trais neu wedi cael eu diswyddo. Cafwyd trafodaethau yn amlwg a bu'n anodd gwybod sut i fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod bellach yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Hoffwn ichi fod yn ddigon dewr i ddweud bod y mathau hyn o bartneriaethau'n iawn mewn egwyddor, ond, mewn gwirionedd, pan gyfyd y math hwn o sefyllfa, fod yn rhaid inni ofyn oni ddylem roi'r arian i'r awdurdod lleol, sydd wedi'i ethol yn uniongyrchol ac yn hynod o atebol ym mhob agwedd ar lywodraethu a gwario. Nid wyf yn hoffi dweud hynny, oherwydd y mae'r theori sydd wrth wraidd y partneriaethau hyn yn glodwiw.

Bu ymdeimlad o anfadwaith ynghylch y mater hwn, mewn sawl ystyr, ynglŷn â'r bygwth, y bwlio a'r trais tuag at un chwythwr chwiban arbennig y mae Mark a minnau'n ymwybodol ohono, ac mae'n drist iawn. Gobeithio y byddwch yn ddewr ac y gwnewch eich gorau i sicrhau bod pa drefniadau llywodraethu bynnag sydd gan weddill y partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn wirioneddol atebol ac yn llawer mwy tryloyw, fel na welwn gamwario sylweddol ar adnoddau. Dywedasoch fod £480,000 wedi mynd yn 2009-10. Efallai yr hoffech ddweud wrthym beth oedd cyfanswm y gwariant ym Mhlas Madog a faint o hynny sydd wedi'i gamgyfeirio. Fe'i gadawaf ar hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud yn glir, fel y mae ganddo hawl i wneud, ei fod, oherwydd y sefyllfa gyfredol—

Eleanor Burnham: Tynnaf y gosodiad diwethaf yn ôl.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi.

Carl Sargeant: Mae rhai pethau na allaf eu dweud ynglŷn â Phlas Madog. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl a welaf nid yw rhai o'r pethau a wnaed yno'n briodol, felly cyhoeddir yr adroddiad yn unol â chanllawiau'r Cynulliad ac wedyn

Assembly guidelines and after that I will issue a further statement. What worries me slightly is that—I do not think that it was supposed to come across in your comments—when we generalise, it seems that all Communities First partnerships are involved in this. We are talking about one partnership that is evidenced as being in a difficult situation. I await the findings about the other partnerships' results and how they are delivering to change communities. I am relatively confident that the majority of these organisations will come back with some very good projects and delivery of service. However, I must wait for the evidence on that and I ask Members not to generalise and make accusations that they are all bad, because they clearly are not.

On the grant recipient bodies and local authorities, several partnerships are direct recipient bodies of funding. As part of the governance review, I have asked my department to look at them first to ensure that they are not caught up in a similar scenario to Plas Madoc. I have not seen any evidence that any other partnerships are in that predicament. However, where I discover that kind of inappropriate behaviour, I will stop it.

Janet Ryder: Thank you for your statement, Minister. I would like to echo some of your words and welcome the fact that a lot of good work has happened across Wales as a result of Communities First. Your statement today, unfortunately, deals with an example of where things have, sadly, gone wrong. I echo your words in condemning the behaviour of those who have put personal gain above the benefit intended for local people in one of the most deprived communities in Wales. That is very sad.

As you made clear in your statement, much of what has been brought to light relates to internal governance. Those rules are set by your department, and I welcome the work that you are doing to look at the governance and financial arrangements. You say that you are implementing some of that work now,

byddaf yn cyhoeddi datganiad pellach. Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni fyfryn—nid wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi bwriadu cyfleu hyn yn eich sylwadau—yw pan ydym yn cyffredinoli, ei bod yn ymddangos bod pob partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gysylltiedig â hyn. Sôn yr ydym am un bartneriaeth y cafwyd tystiolaeth ei bod mewn sefyllfa ddyrys. Disgwyliaf am y canfyddiadau am ganlyniadau'r partneriaethau eraill ac o ran yr hyn y maent yn ei gyflawni i newid cymunedau. Yr wyf yn gymharol hyderus y daw'r rhan fwyaf o'r cyrff hyn yn ôl gyda phrosiectau da iawn a'u bod yn cyflwyno gwasanaethau'n dda. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi aros am y dystiolaeth ynghylch hynny a gofynnaf i Aelodau beidio â chyffredinoli a gwneud honiadau eu bod i gyd yn ddrwg, oherwydd y mae'n amlwg nad ydynt.

O ran y cyrff sy'n cael grantiau a'r awdurdodau lleol, mae sawl partneriaeth yn gyrff sy'n cael cyllid yn uniongyrchol. Fel rhan o'm hadolygiad ar drefniadau llywodraethu, yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm hadran edrych arnynt hwy yn gyntaf i sicrhau nad ydynt mewn sefyllfa debyg i Blas Madog. Nid wyf wedi gweld dim tystiolaeth bod unrhyw bartneriaethau eraill yn y twll hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, lle y darganfyddaf y math hwnnw o ymddygiad amhriodol, dof ag ef i ben.

Janet Ryder: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog. Hoffwn adleisio rhai o'ch geiriau a chroesawu'r ffaith bod llawer o waith da wedi digwydd ar draws Cymru o ganlyniad i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae eich datganiad heddiw, yn anffodus, yn delio ag enghraifft lle y mae pethau, ysywaeth, wedi mynd o chwith. Adleisiaf eich geiriau'n condemnio ymddygiad y bobl hynny a roddodd elw personol uwchlaw'r budd a fwriadwyd i bobl leol yn un o'r cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n drist iawn.

Fel y dywedasoeh yn glir yn eich datganiad, mae a wnelo llawer o'r hyn a ddaeth i'r amlwg â threfniadau llywodraethu mewnol. Gosodir y rheolau hynny gan eich adran chi, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'r gwaith yr ydych yn ei wneud i edrych ar y trefniadau llywodraethu ac ariannol. Dywedwch eich

and you have outlined some of it. Could you be clear as to what you are doing, and how you are going to implement the necessary work on governance and financial controls for Communities First bodies? It is regrettable that the work of one particular partnership has led to you having to issue formal guidance to all partnerships on adherence to Nolan principles. When dealing with public funds, accountability and openness have to be the primary concern at every level, including the most local community level.

I have raised the issue of Plas Madoc for several months now—for more than a year, in fact. The issues that were first brought to my attention regarding Plas Madoc were to do with the internal governance of the project. There were concerns from past employees that there was no external appeals procedure and so no way that complaints could be registered about the project management without being routed back to the management committee for determination. There was no way that anyone outside of the Communities First partnership could be made aware of those concerns. This is down to the determination of one individual who kept on and on and, eventually, got the Auditor General for Wales and the Minister to step in and to take these concerns seriously. That person's determination has led to many further serious issues coming to light at Plas Madoc. I appreciate what you have said, and that you will make further statements on those issues. The people of Plas Madoc are concerned that the money that was allocated to them should be used for them; some of the projects have been valued by the local community and should continue. Those people want their voices heard, and would like a say in how that money, if there is any left, is used in their communities. One of the best ways of doing that is through participatory budgeting, and I urge you, when you bring to us that further report on Communities First at Plas Madoc, to use that system in that area as a way of empowering those citizens to bring forward the projects that they want to see on their estate.

bod yn gweithredu rhywfaint o'r gwaith hwnnw'n awr, ac yr ydych wedi amlinellu rhywfaint ohono. A allech fod yn eglur ynghylch yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud, a sut yr ydych yn mynd i weithredu'r gwaith angenrheidiol ar drefniadau llywodraethu a rheolaeth ariannol i gyrrff Cymunedau yn Gyntaf? Mae'n bechod bod gwaith un bartneriaeth arbennig wedi peri ichi orfod cyhoeddi canllawiau ffurfiol i bob partneriaeth ynghylch glynu at egwyddorion Nolan. Wrth ddelio ag arian cyhoeddus, rhaid rhoi atebolrwydd a thryloywder yn flaenaf ar bob lefel, gan gynnwys y lefel fwyaf cymunedol.

Yr wyf wedi codi mater Plas Madog ers misoedd lawer bellach—ers dros flwyddyn, a dweud y gwir. Yr oedd y materion a ddygwyd i'm sylw gyntaf ynghylch Plas Madog yn ymwneud â threfn lywodraethu fewnol y prosiect. Yr oedd pryderon gan gyn weithwyr nad oedd gweithdrefn apelio allanol a dim ffordd i gwynion gael eu cofrestru am reolaeth y prosiect heb gael eu cyfeirio'n ôl at y pwyllgor rheoli i'w penderfynu. Nid oedd dim modd rhoi gwybod i neb y tu allan i'r bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf am y pryderon hynny. Mae hyn wedi dod i'r golwg oherwydd dycnwch un unigolyn a ddaliodd ati'n ddi-baid ac a lwyddodd, yn y diwedd, i gael gan Archwiliwr Cyffredinol Cymru a'r Gweinidog gamu i mewn a chymryd y pryderon hyn o ddifrif. Mae dycnwch y person hwnnw wedi arwain at ddatgelu llawer o faterion difrifol pellach ym Mhlas Madog. Yr wyf yn deall yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, ac y gwnewch ddatganiadau pellach ar y materion hynny. Mae pobl Plas Madog yn bryderus y dylai'r arian a ddyrannwyd iddynt hwy gael ei ddefnyddio er eu mwyn hwy; mae rhai o'r prosiectau wedi cael eu gwerthfawrogi gan y gymuned leol a dylent barhau. Mae ar y bobl hynny eisiau i'w lleisiau gael eu clywed, a hoffent gael llais yn y modd y defnyddir yr arian hwnnw, os oes peth ar ôl, yn eu cymunedau. Un o'r ffyrdd gorau o wneud hynny yw drwy gyllidebu cyfranogol, ac fe'ch anogaf, pan ddewch â'r adroddiad pellach hwnnw inni ar Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ym Mhlas Madog, i ddefnyddio'r system honno yn yr ardal honno fel modd i roi grym i'r dinasyddion hynny i gyflwyno'r prosiectau y mae arnynt eisiau eu

gweld ar eu stad.

3.20 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: Let me start by saying that the board of each of the partnerships is responsible for governance, and the board is made up of members from industry and from the local community. That is working in most places. The fact that there is a failure at Plas Madoc raises issues about the boundaries within which they work, and I, as the Minister responsible, am ensuring that my team is putting measures in place with regard to the audit regime for the governance and the financial management of each partnership. I do not think that it would be right for my officials and me to be managing 157 partnerships. The boards should be empowered to run community development programmes from within the community. I must provide them with the tools to do that, and I have asked my officials to ensure that. I have confidence when I allocate grant funding that that will be passported through the partnership and through the appropriate projects in that community.

Janet, I have asked for some parts of the audit process to be strengthened. The recent governance review recommended that the audit certification instructions should be strengthened to ensure that expenditure in addition to the salary costs should be covered, where possible, by audit testing, to ensure that only eligible costs are incurred. I will be pushing this forward to get reassurance for communities and for me as the Minister responsible. I will come back to the Assembly with the details of the Plas Madoc report when it is published. I expect it to be published in the next week or so. We will issue our actions with regard to future programmes for Communities First on the basis of the details of that.

Jonathan Morgan: As Chair of the Public Accounts Committee, I will start by congratulating the Assembly Government's internal audit service and the Wales Audit Office on the considerable amount of work that they have done in trying to get to the bottom of the failings at Plas Madoc. I understand the sensitive nature of the work that was undertaken, and the detail that had to

Carl Sargeant: Gadewch imi ddechrau drwy ddweud mai bwrdd pob un o'r partneriaethau sy'n gyfrifol am ei llywodraethu, ac mai rhai o fyd diwydiant ac o'r gymuned leol yw aelodau'r bwrdd. Mae hynny'n gweithio yn y rhan fwyaf o leoedd. Mae'r ffaith bod methiant ym Mhlas Madog yn codi cwestiynau am y ffiniau y gweithiant o'u mewn, ac yr wyf fi, fel y Gweinidog cyfrifol, yn sicrhau bod fy nhîm yn rhoi mesurau ar waith ynglŷn â'r drefn ar gyfer archwilio trefn lywodraethu a rheolaeth ariannol pob partneriaeth. Nid wyf yn meddwl y byddai'n iawn i'm swyddogion a mi fod yn rheoli 157 o bartneriaethau. Dylid rhoi grym i'r byrddau redeg rhaglenni datblygu cymunedol oddi mewn i'r gymuned. Rhaid i mi roi'r arfau iddynt wneud hynny, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion sicrhau hynny. Mae gennyf hyder pan ddyrannaf gyllid grant y caiff hynny ei basportio drwy'r bartneriaeth a thrwy'r prosiectau priodol yn y gymuned honno.

Janet, yr wyf wedi gofyn am gryfhau rhai rhannau o'r broses archwilio. Argymhellodd yr adolygiad diweddar o drefniadau llywodraethu y dylid cryfhau'r cyfarwyddiadau ardystio archwiliad i sicrhau y dylai gwariant ychwanegol at gostau cyflogau gael profion archwilio, lle y bo modd, i sicrhau mai dim ond costau cymwys a delir. Byddaf yn gwthio hyn ymlaen i gael sicrwydd i gymunedau ac i mi fel y Gweinidog cyfrifol. Dof yn ôl at y Cynulliad gyda manylion adroddiad Plas Madog pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi. Disgwyliaf iddo gael ei gyhoeddi o fewn rhyw wythnos. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi'r camau a gymerwn ynglŷn â rhaglenni Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i'r dyfodol ar sail manylion hwnnw.

Jonathan Morgan: Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, dechreuaf drwy longyfarch gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru am y gwaith sylweddol y maent wedi'i wneud i geisio mynd at wraidd y diffygion ym Mhlas Madog. Deallaf natur sensitif y gwaith a wnaed, a'r manylion y bu'n rhaid eu hystyried yn y cydweithio

be considered in the joint working between the audit office and the internal audit service. I look forward to the Minister's official response to the Public Accounts Committee report into Communities First and I know that Members will have a chance to be briefed by the Auditor General for Wales about the Plas Madoc report when it is published.

The Minister has already said that he wishes to strengthen financial management and governance and I know that all Public Accounts Committee members support that. You state that you are seeking additional assurances from the partnerships. I must reiterate something that was identified by the auditor general and the Public Accounts Committee, which is the importance of Government setting the framework for financial management and governance to ensure that the framework is sufficiently robust and that the partnerships know exactly what is expected of them. Otherwise, there is a potential for confusion.

The Wales Audit Office and the Public Accounts Committee have been robust in examining Communities First, and I ask for an assurance that you will be equally robust and will take every opportunity afforded to you to ensure that this scheme gets on the right track for the future. When you are spending such large sums of money trying to help the poorest communities in Wales, it is essential that the money is used rigorously in a way that leads to real community development that has a long-lasting sustainable impact and raises those areas out of poverty and provides the infrastructure to help people back to work and into better health. I hope that we can have those assurances this afternoon.

Carl Sargeant: Thank you, Jonathan, for the report that you have presented to the Assembly. I will be responding to that in coming weeks. You made reference to the broader scope of Communities First in making a difference to our communities. This is a delicate programme of change in people's culture and lives. It is a long and challenging process to get these people from where they are to where they need to be. No-one can underestimate the difficulty that the

rhwng y swyddfa archwilio a'r gwasanaeth archwilio mewnol. Edrychaf ymlaen at ymateb swyddogol y Gweinidog i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus ar Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a gwn y caiff Aelodau gyfle i gael eu briffio gan Archwiliwr Cyffredinol Cymru am adroddiad Plas Madog pan gaiff ei gyhoeddi.

Mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi dweud ei fod yn dymuno cryfhau rheolaeth ariannol a threfniadau llywodraethu a gwn fod holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn cefnogi hynny. Dywedwch eich bod yn ceisio mwy o sicrwydd gan y partneriaethau. Rhaid imi ailadrodd rhywbeth a nodwyd gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol a'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus, sef pwysigrwydd bod y Llywodraeth yn gosod y fframwaith ar gyfer rheolaeth ariannol a threfniadau llywodraethu i sicrhau bod y fframwaith yn ddigon cadarn a bod y partneriaethau'n gwybod yn union beth a ddisgwylir ganddynt. Fel arall, gellid cael dryswch.

Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus wedi bod yn gadarn wrth archwilio Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, a gofynnaf am sicrwydd y byddwch chi yr un mor gadarn ac yn achub pob cyfle a gewch i sicrhau bod y cynllun hwn yn mynd ar y trywydd iawn i'r dyfodol. Wrth wario symiau mor fawr o arian i geisio helpu'r cymunedau tlotaf yng Nghymru, mae'n hanfodol defnyddio'r arian yn fanwl gywir mewn modd sy'n arwain at wir ddatblygiad cymunedol a gaiff effaith gynaliadwy arhosol gan godi'r ardaloedd hynny allan o dlodi a darparu'r seilwaith i helpu pobl yn ôl i waith ac i well iechyd. Gobeithio y gallwn gael y sicrwydd hwnnw y prynhawn yma.

Carl Sargeant: Diolch, Jonathan, am yr adroddiad yr ydych wedi'i gyflwyno i'r Cynulliad. Byddaf yn ymateb i hwnnw yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Cyfeiriasoch at rychwant ehangach Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran gwneud gwahaniaeth i'n cymunedau. Rhaglen ofalus o newid yn niwylliant a bywydau pobl yw hon. Mae'n broses hir ac anodd cael y bobl hyn o ble y maent i ble y mae angen iddynt fod. Ni all neb fethu sylweddoli faint o anhawster y mae'r timau

teams on the ground are facing daily. There will be huge challenges, but, as you say, for me to be reassured about the actions of each partnership, I need to have robust guidelines in place to ensure that they can only go up to a certain point that is considered reasonable.

There are aspects of the audit review that need to be strengthened. For example, the terms and conditions that go to the board from the auditors, post review, do not come to the Minister. I have changed that, and have asked for those to come to me so that we are kept up to date on what is going on on the ground. As I said earlier, the Plas Madoc events are most unfortunate. I condemn the practices there, but we will have to await the details. It makes for uncomfortable reading, but that is reality. I have said that I am committed to the Communities First programme in general. I expect that there are many Members who have seen at first hand the great progress and changes made under the Committees First programme. I need to be reassured that we have the basic governance and financial principles in place to ensure that individuals are not allowed to upset the whole programme, which is making a difference to the people of Wales.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, this is the latest bit of bad news that has shaken a programme that was designed with the very best of intentions. Given the sort of criticism that the Communities First programme has received recently from the auditor general and the Assembly's Public Accounts Committee, it is perhaps surprising that Plas Madoc is the only example of such gravity that we have come across so far. The criticism has been to do with the failure of the Assembly Government to monitor the impact of the programme, serious weaknesses in workforce planning, serious weaknesses in financial planning, complex mechanisms for delivery that are difficult to implement; I could go on and on. You will be only too familiar with the litany of criticisms from the auditor general, Minister.

However, when all is said and done, the aims

ar lawr gwlad yn ei wynebu bob dydd. Bydd heriau enfawr, ond, fel y dywedwch, er mwyn i mi gael sicrwydd am weithredoedd pob partneriaeth, mae angen imi gael canllawiau cadarn i sicrhau mai dim ond hyd at ryw bwynt yr ystyrir ei fod yn rhesymol y gallant fynd.

Mae angen cryfhau rhai agweddau ar yr adolygiad archwilio. Er enghraifft, nid yw'r telerau a'r amodau a aiff i'r bwrdd oddi wrth yr archwilwyr yn dod at y Gweinidog. Yr wyf wedi newid hynny, ac wedi gofyn am i'r rheini ddod ataf fi er mwyn inni gael y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae digwyddiadau Plas Madog yn anffodus dros ben. Condemniaf yr arferion yno, ond bydd yn rhaid inni aros am y manylion. Mae'n ddeunydd darllen anghysurus, ond dyna'r realiti. Yr wyf wedi dweud fy mod wedi ymrwymo i raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gyffredinol. Mae'n debyg bod llawer o Aelodau sydd wedi gweld drostynt eu hunain y camau mawr a'r newidiadau sydd wedi'u gwneud o dan raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae angen imi gael sicrwydd bod gennym yr egwyddorion ariannu a llywodraethu sylfaenol i sicrhau na chaniateir i unigolion ddifetha'r rhaglen gyfan, sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth i bobl Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, dyma'r darn diweddaraf o newyddion drwg sydd wedi ysgwyd rhaglen a gynlluniwyd gyda'r bwriadau gorau un. O ystyried y math o feirniadaeth y mae rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi'i chael yn ddiweddar gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol a Phwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad, efallai ei bod yn syndod mai Plas Madog yw'r unig enghraifft sydd mor ddifrifol yr ydym wedi dod ar ei thraws hyd yma. Mae'r feirniadaeth wedi cyfeirio at fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fonitro effaith y rhaglen, gwendidau difrifol o ran cynllunio'r gweithlu, gwendidau difrifol mewn cynllunio ariannol, mecanweithiau cymhleth ar gyfer cyflawni sy'n anodd eu gweithredu; gallwn fynd ymlaen ac ymlaen. Byddwch yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r rhestr o feirniadaethau gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol, Weinidog.

Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, mae nod ac

and objectives of the programme are ones that, cross-party, we subscribe to fully. I have listened carefully to what you have said this afternoon, Minister. I am pleased that, in your last answer, you talked about the importance of engaging individuals locally in programmes, giving them the freedom and ability to get involved. As you review all of this, in light of the problems that have occurred, how are you going to involve local authorities? Often, they are a key part of the jigsaw. The auditor general's report referred to tensions in some areas. In some areas, local authorities have been inspirational partners; in other areas, they have been very distant partners, if at the table at all. It is important that, in the auditor general's report and that of the Public Accounts Committee, the key thing that was pointed out was the need for local authorities to ensure that their local policies took account of the aims and objectives of local Communities First programmes. It will not be fully effective, Minister, if local authorities are not fully involved in your review. What are you doing to ensure that that happens?

Carl Sargeant: Thank you for your comments, Jenny. The Communities First programme is not a one-size-fits-all agenda. We have 157 very different partnerships. As I know from looking at several of the partnerships recently, and, as other Members have told me, there are some very good effective partnerships and there are some that are making a difference but that could perhaps do better.

3.30 p.m.

You mentioned the way in which local authorities can be part of this. I am aware that councillors in most areas are part of the Communities First partnership board, therefore that is where their engagement fits in. As I said earlier, the responsibility for the governance and finance of these partnerships is a matter for the board of each individual member. I do not see Communities First partnerships as an extension of a local authority. The partnerships have autonomy and they make their own decisions locally.

amcanion y rhaglen yn rhai yr ydym ni, yn drawsbleidiol, yn cyd-fynd yn llawn â hwy. Yr wyf wedi gwrando'n ofalus ar yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud y prynhawn yma, Weinidog. Yr wyf yn falch ichi sôn, yn eich ateb diwethaf, am bwysigrwydd cael unigolion yn lleol i ymgysylltu â rhaglenni, gan roi'r rhyddid a'r gallu iddynt ymwneud â hyn. Wrth ichi adolygu hyn i gyd, yng ngoleuni'r problemau sydd wedi digwydd, sut yr ydych yn mynd i gynnwys awdurdodau lleol? Yn aml, maent yn rhan allweddol o'r jig-so. Cyfeiriodd adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol at densiynau mewn rhai ardaloedd. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, bu'r awdurdodau lleol yn bartneriaid ysbrydolgar; mewn ardaloedd eraill, buont yn bartneriaid pell iawn, os buont wrth y bwrdd o gwbl. Mae'n bwysig mai'r peth allweddol a nodwyd yn adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol ac adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus oedd yr angen i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau bod eu polisiau lleol yn ystyried nod ac amcanion rhaglenni lleol Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Ni fydd yn gwbl effeithiol, Weinidog, os na chymer awdurdodau lleol ran lawn yn eich adolygiad. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd?

Carl Sargeant: Diolch am eich sylwadau, Jenny. Nid yw'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn agenda lle y mae'r un peth yn gwneud y tro i bawb. Mae gennym 157 o bartneriaethau gwahanol iawn. Fel y gwn o edrych ar amryw o'r partneriaethau'n ddiweddar, ac fel y mae Aelodau eraill wedi dweud wrthyf, ceir rhai partneriaethau effeithiol da iawn a cheir rhai sy'n gwneud gwahaniaeth ond a allai wneud yn well efallai.

Crybwyllasoch y ffordd y gall awdurdodau lleol fod yn rhan o hyn. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod cynghorwyr yn y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd yn aelodau o fwrdd partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, felly dyna lle y mae eu cyfraniad hwy. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mater i fwrdd pob aelod unigol yw'r cyfrifoldeb am drefn lywodraethu a chyllid y partneriaethau hyn. Ni welaf bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fel estyniad i awdurdod lleol. Mae gan y partneriaethau annibyniaeth a gwnânt eu

However, in the majority of examples, the local authority is the grant recipient body and, therefore, I feel that there is comfort for me as there is a tested regime or funding stream. I do not know whether that may be an option for where the funding is allocated through, as opposed to the decision makers. I do not want Communities First to be an extension of a local authority. It is separate, but I think that there are some links with the collaboration and working arrangements that could be gained from working in partnership with the local authority, particularly around governance procedures.

Darren Millar: I will keep my comments brief because many people have already referred to some of the things that I wanted to say. There are two very good Communities First partnerships operating in my constituency, and they are reaping rewards for the communities that they are based in, namely Cinnel Bay and Colwyn Bay, and are making a real difference to people's lives. I commend them for their work, and they will be pleased to hear today your commitment to Communities First as a scheme that will continue to operate long into the future.

On the situation at Plas Madoc, I think that you may have been slightly premature in bringing forward this statement today because it does not give us the opportunity to ask you about the report that we have not yet seen or read. Can you give us a commitment, Minister, that you will make a further oral statement in Plenary at the soonest opportunity, once you have had an opportunity to formally respond to the report of the auditor general?

You have not mentioned the timescale, but, as for the review that you are undertaking of governance arrangements in Communities First partnerships across Wales, could you tell us how long you expect this process to take? As Jenny Randerson mentioned earlier, this is the most recent of reports that seem to indicate that there are problems, albeit isolated in some Communities First partnerships. The auditor general's report therefore is not necessarily saying anything new. In the light of the fact that there were reports early last year that demonstrated

penderyniadau eu hunain yn lleol. Fodd bynnag, yn y rhan fwyaf o enghreifftiau, yr awdurdod lleol yw'r corff sy'n cael y grant, ac felly, teimlaf fod cysur i mi o ran cael gweithdrefn neu ffrwd ariannu sydd wedi'i phrofi. Ni wn a allai hynny fod yn opsiwn ar gyfer dyrannu'r arian, yn hytrach na'r rhai sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau. Nid oes arnaf eisiau i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fod yn estyniad i awdurdod lleol. Mae ar wahân, ond credaf fod rhai dolenni cyswllt â'r cydweithio a'r trefniadau gweithio a allai ddeillio o weithio mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdod lleol, yn enwedig ynghylch gweithdrefnau llywodraethu.

Darren Millar: Byr fydd fy sylwadau gan fod llawer o bobl eisoes wedi cyfeirio at rai o'r pethau yr oeddwn am eu dweud. Mae dwy bartneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf dda iawn yn gweithredu yn fy etholaeth, ac mae'r cymunedau lle y maent yn gweithio, sef Bae Cinnel a Bae Colwyn, yn elwa yn sgîl hynny, ac mae'r partneriaethau'n gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn i fywydau pobl. Fe'u cymeradwyaf am eu gwaith, a byddant yn falch o glywed heddiw eich ymrwymiad i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf fel cynllun a fydd yn parhau i weithredu ymhell i'r dyfodol.

Ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa ym Mhlas Madog, yr wyf yn meddwl efallai eich bod wedi bod fymryn yn gynamserol yn cyflwyno'r datganiad hwn heddiw oherwydd nid yw'n rhoi'r cyfle inni eich holi am yr adroddiad nad ydym eto wedi'i weld na'i ddarllen. A allwch roi ymrwymiad inni, Weinidog, y gwnewch ddatganiad llafar pellach yn y Cyfarfod Llawn cyn gynted ag y daw cyfle, wedi ichi gael cyfle i ymateb yn ffurfiol i adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol?

Nid ydych wedi sôn am yr amserlen, ond, o ran yr adolygiad yr ydych yn ei wneud o drefniadau llywodraethu mewn partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru, a allech ddweud wrthym am ba hyd y disgwylwch i'r broses bara? Fel y soniodd Jenny Randerson yn gynharach, dyma'r diweddaraf o adroddiadau sydd fel pe baent yn awgrymu bod problemau, er mai enghreifftiau unigol ydynt mewn rhai partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Felly nid yw adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol o reidrwydd yn dweud dim byd newydd. Yng

clearly that there were problems in Communities First partnerships across Wales, what are you doing about that timescale? Can you reassure us that this will be as quick a process as it possibly can be so that we can be confident that taxpayers' money is being spent effectively, and that there is value for money in the system?

On the partnership boards and the make-up of those boards, what guidance are you issuing to Communities First partnerships, how often is their make-up reviewed, and are there certain checks or qualifications required of members of those boards? I accept that they need to be reflective of the communities in which they are based, but we need to make sure that a range of expertise and experience is brought to the table so that the functions of the board can be undertaken in a professional way, and that the capacity can be there when there are officers available to support those processes. Perhaps you can tell us about the timescale and the governance arrangements, and when you expect to make a further oral statement.

Carl Sargeant: I will make a statement when I have received the report. On receipt of the report, I will probably issue a written statement for brevity, and then make further decisions on Communities First according to the evidence that I receive from the partnerships. I will then probably make an oral statement to the Assembly, if permitted by the Presiding Office.

On the timescale, Darren, my team is already undertaking a review. We have written to all 157 partnerships and we are waiting for a response on the generalisation. If there are things that are evident now—things seen via the audit trail—and if those things are replicated elsewhere, that may be an indication that there is something wrong in another partnership. We have asked all 157 partnerships to respond as soon as possible. They have had the letters for over a week—it may be two weeks—and I expect to receive those responses within a month.

ngoleuni'r ffaith bod adroddiadau'n gynnar y llynedd a ddangosai'n glir fod problemau mewn partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ledled Cymru, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch yr amserlen honno? A allwch roi sicrwydd inni y bydd hon yn broses mor gyflym ag y gall fod er mwyn inni allu bod yn hyderus bod arian trethdalwyr yn cael ei wario'n effeithiol, a bod gwerth am arian yn y system?

O ran y byrddau partneriaeth a chyfansoddiad y byrddau hynny, pa ganllawiau yr ydych yn eu rhoi i bartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, pa mor aml yr adolygir eu cyfansoddiad, ac a oes rhai archwiliadau neu gymwysterau'n ofynnol gan aelodau'r byrddau hynny? Derbyniaf fod angen iddynt adlewyrchu'r cymunedau y maent ynddynt, ond mae angen inni wneud yn siŵr bod amrywiaeth o arbenigedd a phrofiad ar gael er mwyn i swyddogaethau'r bwrdd allu cael eu cyflawni mewn ffordd broffesiynol, ac y gall y gallu fod yno pan fydd swyddogion ar gael i gynnal y prosesau hynny. Efallai y gallwch ddweud wrthym am yr amserlen a'r trefniadau llywodraethu, a phryd y disgwyliwch wneud datganiad llafar pellach.

Carl Sargeant: Gwnaf ddatganiad pan fyddaf wedi cael yr adroddiad. Wedi imi gael yr adroddiad, mae'n debyg y cyhoeddaf ddatganiad ysgrifenedig er mwyn bod yn gryno, ac wedyn gwneud penderfyniadau pellach ynghylch Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn ôl y dystiolaeth a gaf gan y partneriaethau. Wedyn mae'n debyg y gwnaf ddatganiad llafar i'r Cynulliad, os caniateir hynny gan y Llywydd.

Ynglŷn â'r amserlen, Darren, mae fy nhîm eisoes yn cynnal adolygiad. Yr ydym wedi ysgrifennu at bob un o'r 157 o bartneriaethau ac yn aros am ymateb ynghylch y sefyllfa'n gyffredinol. Os oes pethau sydd yn amlwg yn awr—pethau a welwyd drwy'r trywydd archwilio—ac os gwelir yr un pethau mewn manau eraill, gallai hynny fod yn arwydd bod rhywbeth o'i le mewn partneriaeth arall. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i bob un o'r 157 o bartneriaethau ymateb cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Maent wedi cael y llythyrau ers dros wythnos—pythefnos, efallai—a disgwyliaf gael yr ymatebion hynny o fewn mis.

On the at-risk partnerships—the ones that I consider to have similar financial models to Plas Madoc—I expect that they will have been assessed fully by the end of May, therefore I will have a response by then. You said that you would like some reassurance, and, as the person who signs off these grants, I certainly want reassurance that the money is being directed to the right areas and is delivering in the right way.

Guidance for boards is constantly reviewed by the Assembly Government, whenever we consider that there should be changes to processes. As I said, I believe that the majority of the partnerships are clear and I am hopeful that the evidence that will come back will indicate that. We know that it is working in some areas, but it is not working everywhere. I would like you to support and encourage people from across the community to join the board. A broad range of membership of a board can offer a lot by way of experience, governance and financial management. Some of our communities would relish benefiting from their experience.

I am committed to Communities First where the partnerships can demonstrate that the public money that we are putting in is going to the right places and I will continue to support them as long as that is proven.

O ran y partneriaethau a allai fod mewn perygl—y rhai yr ystyriaf fod ganddynt fodelau ariannol tebyg i Blas Madog—disgwyliaf y byddant wedi'u hasesu'n llawn erbyn diwedd mis Mai, felly bydd gennyf ymateb erbyn hynny. Dywedasoch yr hoffech gael rhyw sicrwydd, ac, fel y sawl sy'n rhoi sêl bendith ar y grantiau hyn, yn sicr mae arnaf finnau eisiau sicrwydd bod yr arian yn cael ei gyfeirio i'r manau iawn ac yn bwrw'r maen i'r wal yn y ffordd iawn.

Caiff y canllawiau i fyrddau eu hadolygu'n gyson gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, pryd bynnag yr ystyriwn y dylai fod newidiadau mewn prosesau. Fel y dywedais, credaf fod y rhan fwyaf o bartneriaethau'n glir ac yr wyf yn obeithiol y bydd y dystiolaeth a ddaw'n ôl yn dangos hynny. Gwyddom ei fod yn gweithio mewn rhai ardaloedd, ond nid yw'n gweithio ym mhobman. Hoffwn ichi gefnogi ac annog pobl o bob rhan o'r gymuned i ymuno â'r bwrdd. Gall ystod eang o aelodaeth ar fwrdd gynnig llawer o ran profiad, trefn lywodraethu a rheolaeth ariannol. Byddai rhai o'n cymunedau'n falch iawn o elwa o'u profiad.

Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i Cymunedau yn Gyntaf lle y gall y partneriaethau ddangos bod yr arian cyhoeddus yr ydym yn ei roi yn mynd i'r lleoedd iawn ac fe barhaf i'w cefnogi cyn belled â bod hynny wedi'i brofi.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyllido Ysgolion (Cymru) 2010 Approval of the School Funding (Wales) Regulations 2010

The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews): I move that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 24.4:

approves that the draft the School Funding (Wales) Regulations 2010 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2010. (NNDM4438)

I am pleased to present the school funding regulations 2010 for approval. As Members will be aware, the First Minister has made clear the importance that he places on school

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.4:

yn cymeradwyo bod y fersiwn ddrafft o Reoliadau Cyllido Ysgolion (Cymru) 2010 yn cael ei llunio yn unol â'r fersiwn ddrafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2010. (NNDM4438)

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno rheoliadau cyllido ysgolion 2010 i'w cymeradwyo. Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi datgan yn glir mor bwysig yw cyllido

funding. I have commissioned a review of the cost of administering the education system in Wales, which is now well under way. The regulations that we are putting forward today have three advantages: first, they will put in place a requirement for local authorities to give every school a forecast of their budget over three years, which helps to fulfil a 'One Wales' commitment; secondly, they provide new powers for local authorities to tackle wasteful surpluses accrued by schools; and, finally, they simplify the regulatory framework by replacing three separate sets of regulations with one.

On three-year funding, we understand that schools have been asking for it for some time. The ability of schools to plan will obviously be improved by having three-year information. The requirement that we are bringing in will mean that from April 2011, each school will have a budget for the year and a forecast for the next financial year and the one following. Forecasts will be based on the best available information on pupil numbers. We hope that this will mean that governing bodies will be better able to manage their budgets for the medium and longer term because they will have that further information.

In respect of tackling surpluses, we know that there were surpluses across Wales of some £74 million at 31 March 2009 in school budgets. We have to look at why that money accrued. These are large sums that are currently unused in schools across Wales. Over 100 secondary schools in Wales had surpluses in excess of £100,000, and 378 primary schools had surpluses in excess of £50,000. A modest surplus is obviously sensible financial management, but this does not explain the large surpluses that are now a feature of Welsh schools. We are therefore providing, through these regulations, intervention powers for local authorities if they think that schools are holding back money above set limits without good reason. We have given cash limits in the regulations rather than percentages because the percentages would mean very different sums depending on the size of the budget. Smaller schools cannot be expected to have only pennies in reserve—the cost of a teacher is

ysgolion iddo ef. Yr wyf wedi comisiynu adolygiad o gost gweinyddu'r gyfundrefn addysg yng Nghymru, ac mae hwnnw ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd. Mae tair mantais i'r rheoliadau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno heddiw: yn gyntaf, byddant yn sefydlu gofyniad ar i awdurdodau lleol roi i bob ysgol ragolwg o'u cyllideb dros dair blynedd, sydd yn helpu i gyflawni un o ymrwymïadau 'Cymru'n Un'; yn ail, maent yn darparu pwerau newydd i awdurdodau lleol ddelio ag ysgolion sy'n cronni arian dros ben yn wastraffus; ac yn olaf, maent yn symleiddio'r fframwaith rheoleiddio drwy osod un set o reoliadau i gymryd lle tair set wahanol.

O ran cyllido tair blynedd, deallwn fod ysgolion wedi bod yn gofyn am hyn ers tro. Caiff gallu ysgolion i gynllunio ei wella'n amlwg drwy gael gwybodaeth am dair blynedd. Bydd y gofyniad yr ydym yn ei gyflwyno'n golygu y bydd gan bob ysgol, o fis Ebrill 2011, gyllideb am y flwyddyn a rhagolwg ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf a'r un wedi hynny. Seilir y rhagolygon ar y wybodaeth orau a fydd ar gael am niferoedd disgyblion. Gobeithiwn y bydd hyn yn golygu y bydd cyrff llywodraethu'n gallu rheoli eu cyllidebau'n well ar gyfer y tymor canolig a hwy oherwydd bod ganddynt y wybodaeth ychwanegol honno.

O ran mynd i'r afael ag arian dros ben, gwyddom fod rhyw £74 miliwn o arian dros ben ar hyd a lled Cymru ar 31 Mawrth 2009 yng nghyllidebau ysgolion. Rhaid inni edrych ar y rheswm pam y cronodd yr arian hwnnw. Symiau mawr yw'r rhain sydd heb eu defnyddio ar hyn o bryd mewn ysgolion ledled y wlad. Yr oedd gan dros 100 o ysgolion uwchradd yng Nghymru dros £100,000 yr un dros ben, ac yr oedd gan 378 o ysgolion cynradd dros £50,000 dros ben. Mae cadw ychydig wrth gefn yn amlwg yn rheolaeth ariannol gall, ond nid yw hyn yn esbonio'r symiau mawr sydd bellach yn nodwedd ar ysgolion Cymru. Felly, drwy'r rheoliadau hyn, yr ydym yn darparu pwerau ymyrryd i awdurdodau lleol os credant fod ysgolion yn dal arian yn ôl uwchben terfynau penodol heb reswm da. Yr ydym wedi rhoi terfynau ariannol yn y rheoliadau yn hytrach na chanrannau oherwydd y byddai canrannau'n golygu symiau gwahanol iawn yn dibynnu ar faint y gyllideb. Ni ellir

the same, irrespective of a school's size. I expect local authorities to use the new powers wisely. Recovered moneys will be kept in the authority's schools budget and will be recycled for education purposes. If a school has a good reason and a plan to keep money that is above the cash limit, it should be allowed to do so, but such plans must be good and stand up to scrutiny.

3.40 p.m.

I am pleased that the Constitutional Affairs Committee, in its merits report, recognised the value of the changes, the meeting of the long-standing commitment to move to three-year funding for schools and the general revision of the regulations. We recognise the concerns that were expressed by the committee with regard to the level of detail included in the explanatory memorandum for the regulations, and I have written to Janet Ryder, who chairs the committee, and will discuss the issues raised in the merits report with our officials, so that we can be clear about the approach to be taken in the future.

Investment in education is greater than ever, with gross schools expenditure rising to £2.385 billion since 1999, which is an increase of 71 per cent. That is a positive picture. The First Minister has made a commitment to increase funding by 1 per cent more than the changes in the block grant from the 2011-12 financial year. We have to recognise that public spending is entering a difficult period, and, therefore, we cannot tolerate any complacency or slackness in the management of budgets. We need to ensure that budgetary resources from the Assembly are used efficiently.

We are looking at the whole education system through our review. We want to ensure that the education system is efficient, and we want to encourage and drive collaboration throughout the system. We also want to emphasise—and I did so this morning at the launch of the twenty-first century schools programme—that local authorities must address the issue of surplus capacity in schools. The regulations that we

disgwyl i ysgolion llai gadw ceiniogau'n unig wrth gefn—yr un peth yw cost athro, beth bynnag yw maint ysgol. Disgwyliaf i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r pwerau newydd yn ddoeth. Caiff arian a adenillir ei gadw yng nghyllideb ysgolion yr awdurdod a'i ailgylchu at ddibenion addysg. Os oes gan ysgol reswm da a chynllun i gadw arian sydd yn fwy na'r terfyn ariannol, dylid caniatáu iddi wneud hynny, ond rhaid i'r cynlluniau hynny fod yn dda a bodloni gofynion craffu.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol, yn ei adroddiad rhinweddau, wedi cydnabod gwerth y newidiadau, y cam i gyflawni'r hen ymrwymiad i symud at gyllido tair blynedd i ysgolion a'r adolygiad cyffredinol ar y rheoliadau. Yr ydym yn cydnabod y pryderon a fynegwyd gan y pwyllgor ynglŷn â lefel y manylion a gynhwysir ym memorandwm esboniadol y rheoliadau, ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Janet Ryder, sy'n cadeirio'r pwyllgor, a thrafodaf y materion a godir yn yr adroddiad rhinweddau gyda'n swyddogion, er mwyn inni allu bod yn glir ynghylch y modd y dylid gweithredu yn y dyfodol.

Mae mwy o fuddsoddi nag erioed mewn addysg, gyda gwariant crynswth ysgolion yn codi i £2.385 biliwn ers 1999, sy'n gynydd o 71 y cant. Mae hynny'n ddarlun cadarnhaol. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu'r cyllid 1 y cant yn fwy na'r newidiadau yn y grant bloc o'r flwyddyn ariannol 2011-12. Rhaid inni gydnabod ei bod bellach yn gyfnod anodd o ran gwariant cyhoeddus, ac, felly, ni allwn oddef unrhyw hunanfodlonrwydd na llacrwydd wrth reoli cyllidebau. Mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff adnoddau cyllidebol a ddaw gan y Cynulliad eu defnyddio'n effeithlon.

Yr ydym yn edrych ar y gyfundrefn addysg gyfan drwy ein hadolygiad. Mae arnom eisiau sicrhau bod y gyfundrefn addysg yn effeithlon, ac mae arnom eisiau annog a hyrwyddo cydweithrediad yn y gyfundrefn drwyddi draw. Mae arnom eisiau pwysleisio hefyd—a gwneuthum hynny y bore yma yn lansiad y rhaglen ysgolion i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain—fod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ddelio â chwestiwn lleoedd gwag mewn

are putting forward today provide new tools for schools and local authorities, and I commend them to the Assembly.

Paul Davies: I welcome some of the changes that are made in the regulations, especially the move to a system in which authorities will provide schools with a three-year forecast for each allocation that they receive, rather than the single-year forecast that they currently provide.

However, I have some reservations about the regulations that will provide authorities with the ability to take specific action when school surpluses reach certain levels. In the first explanatory memorandum, it was made clear that when surpluses are £50,000 or more in a primary school, or £100,000 or more in a secondary school, authorities will be able to direct schools to spend balances. As you have said, the Chair of the Assembly's Constitutional Affairs Committee wrote to you to express concerns about regulations expressing the limits of school budget surpluses in cash terms, which means that some schools will be able to continue to hold balances of more than 5 per cent, while other schools may be directed to spend balances of less than 5 per cent. It would have been better to draft the regulations so that either 5 per cent or a cash amount applied, depending on which sum is greater.

Having said that, I note that the Minister has responded to the Chair, advising her that:

'This was a drafting error which reflected an earlier version of the regulations.'

Could the Minister clarify why he will not accept the Constitutional Affairs Committee's recommendation that either 5 per cent or a cash amount should apply under the regulations?

Janet Ryder: As Members will be aware, and as you have just been told, the Assembly's Standing Orders require the Constitutional Affairs Committee to consider statutory instruments that are laid before the

ysgolion. Mae'r rheoliadau yr ydym yn eu cyflwyno heddiw'n darparu arfau newydd i ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol, ac fe'u cymeradwyaf i'r Cynulliad.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn croesawu rhai o'r newidiadau a wneir yn y rheoliadau, yn enwedig y symudiad at system lle y bydd awdurdodau'n darparu rhagolwg tair blynedd i ysgolion ar gyfer pob dyraniad a gânt, yn hytrach na'r rhagolwg un flwyddyn a ddarparant ar hyn o bryd.

Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf rai amheuan am y rheoliadau a fydd yn rhoi'r gallu i awdurdodau gymryd camau penodol pan fydd yr arian dros ben mewn ysgol yn cyrraedd lefelau arbennig. Yn y memorandwm esboniadol cyntaf, dywedwyd yn glir pan fydd £50,000 neu fwy dros ben mewn ysgol gynradd, neu £100,000 neu fwy dros ben mewn ysgol uwchradd, y bydd awdurdodau'n gallu cyfarwyddo ysgolion i wario'r gweddill. Fel y dywedasoch, ysgrifennodd Cadeirydd Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol y Cynulliad atoch i fynegi pryderon ynghylch rheoliadau'n datgan terfynau'r arian sydd dros ben yng nghyllidebau ysgolion mewn termau ariannol, sy'n golygu y bydd rhai ysgolion yn gallu parhau i gadw balansau o fwy na 5 y cant, tra gellir cyfarwyddo ysgolion eraill i wario balansau o lai na 5 y cant. Buasai'n well drafftio'r rheoliadau i bennu naill ai 5 y cant neu swm ariannol, yn dibynnu pa swm sydd fwyaf.

Wedi dweud hynny, sylwaf fod y Gweinidog wedi ymateb i'r Cadeirydd, gan ddweud wrthi mai:

Gwall drafftio oedd hyn a adlewyrchai fersiwn gynharach o'r rheoliadau.

A all y Gweinidog egluro pam na wnaiff dderbyn argymhelliad y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol y dylai'r rheoliadau bennu naill ai 5 y cant neu swm ariannol?

Janet Ryder: Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, ac fel yr ydych newydd glywed, mae Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad yn mynnu bod y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol yn ystyried offerynnau statudol a gyflwynir

Assembly and to report on whether special attention should be paid to them for a range of technical and legal reasons. We have produced a report in relation to two specific legal drafting errors in the regulations. While it is unfortunate that regulations brought before the Assembly should contain such errors, I am pleased to note that the Government has agreed to correct them at an appropriate time. As a result, I do not propose to make a further comment on the technical matters, other than to formally draw them to the Assembly's attention.

The committee is also able to report under Standing Order No. 15.3 on what are known as 'merits' of statutory instruments. There are a number of grounds for doing so, such as whether they give rise to issues of public policy that are likely to be of interest to the Assembly. That is why we have produced a report on this occasion, which has been circulated, and I am pleased that some Members have read that report. The purpose of making a merits report is not to question the underlying policy behind the regulations or necessarily to be critical; it is simply to draw Members' attention to matters that they may wish to take into account when reaching a view on a particular statutory instrument. In this case, the regulations implement significant changes. As has been said, they introduce three-year funding arrangements for schools, and they give local authorities the power to direct schools to reduce excess budget balances.

We have reported on three-year funding for schools because it is a significant change, but also because it was a recommendation of the second Assembly's Committee on School Funding in 2006. The matter has also been considered more recently by the Enterprise and Learning Committee. I am glad that the recommendation was accepted in full by the Government at the time, but we also want to point out the delay in implementing what the committee recommended. There has been a significant delay in that regard.

The regulations also propose to give local authorities the power to direct schools to reduce surplus budget balances. As I have

gerbron y Cynulliad ac adrodd a ddylid rhoi sylw arbennig iddynt am amryw o resymau technegol a chyfreithiol. Yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad ynglŷn â dau wall drafftio cyfreithiol penodol yn y rheoliadau. Er ei bod yn anffodus bod rheoliadau a gyflwynir gerbron y Cynulliad yn cynnwys gwallau o'r fath, mae'n dda gennyf nodi bod y Llywodraeth wedi cytuno i'w cywiro ar adeg briodol. O ganlyniad, nid wyf yn bwriadu gwneud sylw pellach ar y materion technegol, ar wahân i dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad yn ffurfiol atynt.

Mae'r pwyllgor yn gallu adrodd hefyd o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 15.3 ar yr hyn a elwir yn 'rhinweddau' offerynnau statudol. Mae nifer o resymau dros wneud hynny, megis a ydynt yn codi cwestiynau'n ymwneud â pholisi cyhoeddus sydd yn debyg o fod o ddiddordeb i'r Cynulliad. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad y tro hwn, sydd wedi'i gylchredeg, ac yr wyf yn falch bod rhai Aelodau wedi darllen yr adroddiad hwnnw. Pwrpas llunio adroddiad rhinweddau yw nid cwestiynu'r polisi sydd wrth wraidd y rheoliadau na bod yn feirniadol o reidrwydd; y pwrpas yw tynnu sylw Aelodau at faterion y gallent ddymuno'u hystyried wrth ffurfio barn ar offeryn statudol arbennig. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'r rheoliadau'n rhoi newidiadau sylweddol ar waith. Fel y dywedwyd, maent yn cyflwyno trefniadau cyllido tair blynedd i ysgolion, ac yn rhoi'r pŵer i awdurdodau lleol gyfarwyddo ysgolion i leihau balansau gormodol mewn cyllidebau.

Yr ydym wedi adrodd ar gyllido tair blynedd i ysgolion am ei fod yn newid sylweddol, ond hefyd am ei fod yn argymhelliad gan y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, sef un o bwyllgorau'r ail Gynulliad, yn 2006. Mae'r mater wedi ei ystyried yn fwy diweddar hefyd gan y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu. Yr wyf yn falch i'r argymhelliad gael ei dderbyn yn llawn gan y Llywodraeth ar y pryd, ond mae arnom eisiau tynnu sylw hefyd at yr oedi cyn rhoi ar waith yr hyn a argymhellodd y pwyllgor. Bu oedi sylweddol yn hynny o beth.

Mae'r rheoliadau hefyd yn cynnig rhoi i awdurdodau lleol y pŵer i gyfarwyddo ysgolion i leihau balansau sydd dros ben

said, it is not our role to criticise the policy underlying the regulations, but we have concerns about the explanatory memorandum that accompanied the regulations. The explanatory memorandum implies that a surplus balance of around 5 per cent of a budget might represent sound financial management, and our concern about that is twofold. First, the regulations express the limits for surpluses in cash terms rather than as a percentage, which means that the limit for some schools will be in excess of 5 per cent while it would be well below that for other schools. That will make it difficult for some schools to manage their budgets. Secondly, the explanatory memorandum does not explain why a cash figure was used, instead of a percentage. Therefore, it is not clear whether the policy behind the regulations has been accurately transposed into the regulation.

That leads me to the explanatory memorandum itself, on which we have made a number of criticisms. I do not intend to go into each of those, but our overall conclusion is that the explanatory memorandum is deficient, lacking sufficient background and detail, and inadequately addressing important policy issues. That is a serious criticism, so I am pleased that the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning has accepted that there were deficiencies in the explanatory memorandum and has laid a revised memorandum, correcting the errors in the original. I am also pleased that he has undertaken to provide fuller explanations in future memoranda. Explanatory memoranda are incredibly important because they are what the majority of people will read, rather than the regulations, and so, if they do not accurately relate to the regulations, that can lead to significant problems.

I finish by making this general point. The Assembly and the Constitutional Affairs Committee rely on accurate, clear and comprehensive explanatory memoranda to carry out their role of effectively scrutinising the considerable amount of subordinate legislation that Ministers make each year. I hope that this case will at least have the benefit of reminding the Government of that

mewn cyllidebau. Fel y dywedais, nid ein rôl ni yw beirniadu'r polisi sydd wrth wraidd y rheoliadau, ond mae gennym bryderon ynglŷn â'r memorandwm esboniadol a ddaeth gyda'r rheoliadau. Mae'r memorandwm esboniadol yn awgrymu y gallai balans dros ben o ryw 5 y cant o gyllideb gael ei gyfrif yn rheolaeth ariannol dda, ac mae ein pryder ynglŷn â hynny'n ddeublyg. Yn gyntaf, mae'r rheoliadau'n datgan y terfynau ar gyfer arian dros ben mewn termau ariannol yn hytrach nag fel canran, sy'n golygu y bydd y terfyn i rai ysgolion yn fwy na 5 y cant tra byddai gryn dipyn yn is na hynny i ysgolion eraill. Bydd hynny'n ei gwneud yn anodd i rai ysgolion reoli eu cyllidebau. Yn ail, nid yw'r memorandwm esboniadol yn esbonio pam y defnyddiwyd ffigur ariannol, yn hytrach na chanran. Felly, nid yw'n eglur a yw'r polisi sydd wrth wraidd y rheoliadau wedi'i drosi'n gywir i'r rheoliad.

Mae hynny'n fy arwain at y memorandwm esboniadol ei hun, yr ydym wedi gwneud nifer o feirniadaethau yn ei gylch. Nid wyf yn bwriadu ymdrin â phob un o'r rhain, ond ein casgliad cyffredinol yw bod y memorandwm esboniadol yn ddiffygiol, heb ddigon o gefndir a manylion, a'i fod yn annigonol o ran delio â materion polisi pwysig. Mae hynny'n feirniadaeth ddifrifol, felly yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi derbyn bod diffygion yn y memorandwm esboniadol ac wedi cyflwyno memorandwm diwygiedig, sy'n cywiro'r gwallau yn y gwreiddiol. Yr wyf yn falch hefyd ei fod wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu esboniadau llawnach mewn memoranda yn y dyfodol. Mae memoranda esboniadol yn anhygoel o bwysig oherwydd dyna y bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ei ddarllen, yn hytrach na'r rheoliadau, ac felly, os nad ydynt yn rhoi darlun cywir o'r rheoliadau, gall hynny arwain at broblemau sylweddol.

Gorffennaf drwy wneud y pwynt cyffredinol hwn. Mae'r Cynulliad a'r Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol yn dibynnu ar femoranda esboniadol cywir, eglur a chynhwysfawr er mwyn cyflawni eu rôl, sef craffu'n effeithiol ar y swm helaeth o is-ddeddfwriaeth a wneir gan Weinidogion bob blwyddyn. Gobeithio y bydd yr achos hwn o leiaf yn fodd i atgoffa'r Llywodraeth am hynny ac i sicrhau y bydd

and ensuring that future memoranda meet the high standard that we have the right to expect.

Michael German: I want to add to the comments of the Chair of the Constitutional Affairs Committee by looking at the policy itself. First, we would never disagree with the concept of the three-year funding, as that is absolutely correct. However, unfortunately, because of the defective drafting here, given the difference between the explanatory memorandum and the regulations, until the Assembly received this letter—dated 12 March, but posted and received later than that—it was unclear whether the policy of clawing back school budgets would relate to a percentage of the overall budget of the school or a fixed sum. As that was not clear, the only place in which one could object to that policy was here in the Chamber, which is unfortunate to say the least. We should have been able to have that discussion in advance, and I see the Minister nodding in agreement. I have great difficulty with that, because, as I am about to explain, we do not want to support the idea of setting a cash limit without a percentage figure being put in place. Therefore, we will have to vote against these regulations.

3.50 p.m.

It would have been far better for that concept to be understood well beforehand but, since we have had only the late explanation, that would have been difficult. The problem is this. If, in legislation, you state a flat-rate figure, such as a £50,000 surplus for primary schools or a £100,000 surplus for secondary schools, you have a one-size-fits-all measurement. For example, the committee received an e-mail from Rhodri Morgan, who said that he had visited a school that had a budget of £9.5 million, and so, in that case, £100,000 would represent just 1 per cent of its budget. A school that has a 1 per cent surplus would be penalised, but it is clear that, for a much smaller school, £100,000 would represent considerably more than that in percentage terms, and so the clawback would not apply to it. Therefore, as it stands, this legislation discriminates against larger schools.

memoranda yn y dyfodol yn cyrraedd y safon uchel y mae gennym hawl i'w disgwyl.

Michael German: Hoffwn ychwanegu at sylwadau Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Materion Cyfansoddiadol drwy edrych ar y polisi ei hun. Yn gyntaf, ni fyddem byth yn anghytuno â'r cysyniad o gyllido tair blynedd, gan fod hynny'n berffaith gywir. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, oherwydd y drafftio diffygiol yn y fan hon, o gofio'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y memorandwm esboniadol a'r rheoliadau, nes cafodd y Cynulliad y llythyr hwn—dyddiedig 12 Mawrth, ond wedi'i bostio ac wedi dod i law yn hwyrach na hynny—yr oedd yn aneglur a fyddai'r polisi o adfachu cyllidebau ysgolion yn cyfeirio at ganran o gyfanswm cyllideb yr ysgol ynteu swm gosodedig. Gan nad oedd hynny'n eglur, yr unig le y gellid gwrthwynebu'r polisi hwnnw oedd yma yn y Siambr, sydd yn anffodus, a dweud y lleiaf. Dylem fod wedi gallu cael y drafodaeth honno ymlaen llaw, a gwelaf y Gweinidog yn nodio i ddangos ei fod yn cytuno. Mae hynny'n peri anhawster mawr imi, oherwydd, fel yr wyf am esbonio'n awr, nid oes arnom eisiau cefnogi'r syniad o osod terfyn ariannol heb sefydlu ffigur canrannol. Felly, bydd yn rhaid inni bleidleisio yn erbyn y rheoliadau hyn.

Buasai'n llawer gwell cael deall y cysyniad hwnnw ymhell o flaen llaw ond, gan mai dim ond yr esboniad hwyr yr ydym wedi'i gael, buasai hynny'n anodd. Dyma'r broblem. Os ydych, mewn deddfwriaeth, yn nodi ffigur cyfradd safonol, megis £50,000 dros ben i ysgolion cynradd neu £100,000 dros ben i ysgolion uwchradd, mae gennych fesur sydd yr un fath i bawb. Er enghraifft, cafodd y pwyllgor e-bost oddi wrth Rhodri Morgan, a ddywedodd ei fod wedi ymweld ag ysgol a chanddi gyllideb o £9.5 miliwn, ac felly, yn yr achos hwn, na fyddai £100,000 yn ddim ond 1 y cant o'i chyllideb. Câi ysgol sydd ag 1 y cant o arian dros ben ei chosbi, ond mae'n amlwg y byddai £100,000, i ysgol lawer llai, yn llawer mwy na hynny o ran canran, ac felly ni fyddai'r adfachu'n digwydd yn ei hachos hi. Felly, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ddeddfwriaeth hon yn gwahaniaethu yn erbyn ysgolion mwy.

I recently visited a brand-new primary school that has more than 600 pupils. The limit for a primary school is £50,000, and the surplus that that school had equated to between 1 and 1.5 per cent of its budget. Therefore, that school would have some leeway equivalent to between 1 and 1.5 per cent of its budget, but a school down the road that might be much smaller and might have a much smaller budget could have a surplus of some 50 per cent. The Minister should have made his intentions clear from the start: to have a fair and level playing field for schools, small and large, in Wales so that the clawback applies equally. That figure could be expressed either in cash or percentage terms, whichever way the Minister wanted to explain it.

That would be a very simple amendment, would it not, to create fairness in the system? However, it has not yet happened in respect of this legislation, and so I regret that we will have to vote against these regulations today, simply because it is not a fair system for the schools of Wales. However, we applaud the policy of having three-year funding. This has caused difficulties for us in the National Assembly in that we could not amend these regulations within the timescale. We did not have that debate and so we were not able to do it. I believe that the only chance we have of changing the regulations is to ask the Minister to take them back and to lay them again with that one paragraph put right and with an explanation of why it is not a fair system to assume that one size fits all. One size does not fit all the schools of Wales, and I appeal to Members to take this opportunity to allow the Minister to come back with something more appropriate. It will not involve a long delay to change that one paragraph.

Jenny Randerson: I want to repeat the main point that Mike German has just made. Minister, to be honest, the only sensible approach is the percentage approach. Your suggested limit was £50,000 for a primary school, but there are primary schools across Wales that have well below 50 pupils and there are some with well over 500 pupils. That £50,000 limit for the very big schools

Yn ddiweddar ymwelais ag ysgol gynradd newydd sbon sydd â mwy na 600 o blant. Y terfyn i ysgol gynradd yw £50,000, ac yr oedd yr arian dros ben a oedd gan yr ysgol honno rhwng 1 ac 1.5 y cant o'i chyllideb. Felly, byddai gan yr ysgol honno rywfaint o le i symud sy'n cyfateb i rhwng 1 ac 1.5 y cant o'i chyllideb, ond gallai ysgol i lawr y ffordd a allai fod yn llawer llai a chanddi gyllideb lawer llai fod â rhyw 50 y cant dros ben. Dylai'r Gweinidog fod wedi datgan ei fwrriad yn glir o'r dechrau: rhoi'r un chwarae teg i ysgolion, bach a mawr, yng Nghymru fel bod yr adfachu'n effeithio ar bawb yn gyfartal. Gellid mynegi'r ffigur hwnnw naill ai mewn termau ariannol neu ganrannol, pa ffordd bynnag y dymunai'r Gweinidog ei esbonio.

Diwygiad syml iawn fyddai hynny, onid e, i greu tegwch yn y system? Fodd bynnag, nid yw wedi digwydd eto yng nghyswllt y ddeddfwriaeth hon, ac felly mae arnaf ofn y bydd yn rhaid i ni bleidleisio yn erbyn y rheoliadau hyn heddiw, oherwydd nad yw'n system deg i ysgolion Cymru. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cymeradwyo'r polisi o gael cyllido tair blynedd. Mae hyn wedi achosi anawsterau i ni yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gan na allem ddiwygio'r rheoliadau hyn o fewn yr amserlen. Ni chawsom y ddadl honno felly nid oeddem yn gallu gwneud hynny. Credaf mai'r unig gyfle sydd gennym i newid y rheoliadau yw gofyn i'r Gweinidog fynd â hwy yn ôl a'u gosod eto gyda'r un paragraff hwnnw wedi'i gywiro a chydag esboniad ynghylch pam nad yw tybio bod yr un peth yn iawn i bawb yn system deg. Nid yw'r un peth yn gwneud y tro i bob ysgol yng Nghymru, ac apeliam ar Aelodau i achub y cyfle hwn i ganiatáu i'r Gweinidog ddod yn ôl gyda rhywbeth mwy priodol. Ni fydd angen oedi mawr i newid yr un paragraff hwnnw.

Jenny Randerson: Hoffwn ailadrodd y prif bwynt y mae Mike German newydd ei wneud. Weinidog, a dweud y gwir, yr unig ddull call yma yw'r dull canrannol. Y terfyn a awgrymwyd gennych oedd £50,000 i ysgol gynradd, ond ceir ysgolion cynradd ledled Cymru sydd â chryn dipyn yn llai na 50 o ddisgyblion a cheir rhai a chanddynt gryn dipyn yn fwy na 500 o ddisgyblion. Mae'r

represents a very small percentage of their budget and allows them no room for manoeuvre. For example, in a school of 500-plus pupils, that amount would not pay for a new reading scheme or a new mathematics scheme. Those are the sorts of things that schools save up for. To take the example of Whitchurch High School Cardiff, which has 2,500 pupils, a £100,000 limit on its surplus would be less than 1 per cent of its budget. That is way out of line with the auditor general's guidelines and recommendations on the amount of surplus and room for manoeuvre that should be allowed in relation to budgets. Those guidelines are provided to local authorities and to the Assembly Government and are applied to schools. Your legislation should therefore be in line with the auditor general's guidelines.

Minister, you referred in your remarks to £74 million-worth of surpluses. Said like that, it sounds like a lot of money. Given that there are so many thousands of schools in Wales, it is a very small amount per school. That is the point here. This legislation is designed to deal with a problem that is very small indeed.

Those of us who are school governors—probably a number of us in the Chamber—will be aware that schools have little room for manoeuvre when it comes to carrying money over from one year's budget to the next. The school of which I am a governor carries money over to be able to buy, for example, a new reading scheme, to afford some new equipment, to undertake a modest programme of refurbishment and redecoration of classrooms, or to provide some playground equipment. I fear that the idea that a vast amount of money is being hoarded by local schools is only a myth. It is not, in practice, a problem, because schools are using their money effectively. Only a tiny handful may require more than they should over a long period of time and are not doing anything useful with the money. You would be better off identifying those schools and dealing with that specific problem, rather than applying a one-size-fits-all approach, which this really is, as it applies to schools whatever their size.

terfyn hwnnw, £50,000, i'r ysgolion mawr iawn yn ganran fach iawn o'u cyllideb ac nid yw'n caniatáu dim lle iddynt droi. Er enghraifft, mewn ysgol a chanddi 500 a mwy o ddisgyblion, ni fyddai'r swm hwnnw'n talu am gynllun darllen newydd neu gynllun mathemateg newydd. Dyna'r mathau o bethau y mae ysgolion yn cynilo ar eu cyfer. A chymryd esiampl Ysgol Uwchradd yr Eglwys Newydd yng Nghaerdydd, sydd â 2,500 o ddisgyblion, byddai terfyn o £100,000 ar ei harian dros ben yn llai nag 1 y cant o'i chyllideb. Mae hynny ymhell o gydymffurfio â chanllawiau ac awgrymiadau'r archwilydd cyffredinol ar faint o arian dros ben a lle i droi y dylid ei ganiatáu mewn perthynas â chyllidebau. Darperir y canllawiau hynny i awdurdodau lleol ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac maent yn berthnasol i ysgolion. Dylai eich deddfwriaeth felly gyd-fynd â chanllawiau'r archwilydd cyffredinol.

Weinidog, cyfeiriasoch yn eich sylwadau at werth £74 miliwn o arian dros ben. O'i ddweud felly, mae'n swnio'n arian mawr. Gan fod cynifer o filoedd o ysgolion yng Nghymru, mae'n swm bach iawn i bob ysgol. Dyna'r pwynt yma. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth wedi'i chynllunio i ddelio â phroblem sydd yn fach iawn iawn.

Bydd y rhai yn ein plith sydd yn llywodraethwyr ysgolion—nifer ohonom yn y Siambr, mae'n debyg—yn ymwybodol mai ychydig o le sydd gan ysgolion i droi pan ddaw'n fater o gario arian drosodd o gyllideb un flwyddyn i'r nesaf. Mae'r ysgol yr wyf fi'n llywodraethwr arni'n cario arian drosodd er mwyn gallu prynu, er enghraifft, cynllun darllen newydd, er mwyn fforddio offer newydd, er mwyn gwneud rhaglen fach o ailwampio ac ailaddurno ystafelloedd dosbarth, neu i ddarparu cyfarpar i'r iard chwarae. Mae arnaf ofn mai chwedl yn unig yw'r syniad bod swm enfawr o arian yn cael ei gronni gan ysgolion lleol. Nid yw'n broblem mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd y mae ysgolion yn defnyddio'u harian yn effeithiol. Dim ond llond llaw sydd efallai'n gofyn am fwy nag a ddylent dros gyfnod maith heb wneud dim byd defnyddiol gyda'r arian. Byddai'n well canfod pa rai yw'r ysgolion hynny a delio â'r broblem benodol honno, yn hytrach nag ymdrin â phawb yn yr un modd,

In times of great economic difficulty and financial stringency, some local authorities could be tempted to apply this approach so rigorously and harshly that they make it impossible for schools to plan and prepare for the future properly.

The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):

Let me get my contrition in first: we should not have made mistakes in the drafting of the explanatory memorandum, but we did. We have learned lessons from this, and I thank the committee for the approach that it has taken and for the lessons that we will apply.

Everyone clearly agrees on the sense of the three-year forecasting aspects of the regulations, so I will not spend much time on that. I was interested to hear a Minister for education today being accused of ‘discriminating’ against larger schools—which was the phrase used by Mike German—because Ministers for education are normally accused in the Chamber of discriminating against smaller schools. Perhaps I am being inconsistent with previous policy.

More seriously, at the end of the day, we have opted for cash rather than a percentage because, ultimately, cash is meaningful. People know what we are talking about when we discuss balances of £50,000 and £100,000. I do not think that we are discriminating against larger schools in a meaningful way, because, in practice, the size of the budgets that they have allows them greater flexibility to plan for the future. You talk of a school the size of Whitchurch high, but we have only a small number of schools of that size in Wales, so I do not think that we are talking about the generality.

The issue for us is that the £74 million carried in school surpluses is a significant sum. I do not think that anyone can honestly say that £74 million is not a lot of money. It is a lot of money. We are clear that we need regulations in place. However, when I

sef yr hyn a wneir yma, gan ei fod yn cyfeirio at ysgolion beth bynnag fo’u maint. Ar adegau o anhawster economaidd a chaethder cyllidol mawr, gallai rhai awdurdodau lleol gael eu tentio i ddefnyddio’r dull hwn mor llym a manwl gywir nes ei gwneud yn amhosibl i ysgolion gynllunio a pharatoi ar gyfer y dyfodol yn iawn.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):

Gadewch imi leisio fy edifeirwch yn gyntaf: ni ddylem fod wedi gwneud camgymeriadau wrth ddrafftio’r memorandwm esboniadol, ond fe wnaethom. Yr ydym wedi dysgu gwersi yn sgîl hyn, a diolch i’r pwyllgor am y dull y mae wedi mynd ati ac am y gwersi a roddwn ar waith.

Mae pawb yn amlwg yn cytuno ar gallineb cynnwys y rhagolygon tair blynedd yn y rheoliadau, felly ni threuliaf lawer o amser ar hynny. Diddorol oedd clywed cyhuddo Gweinidog addysg heddiw o ‘wahaniaethu’ yn erbyn ysgolion mwy—sef yr ymadrodd a ddefnyddiwyd gan Mike German—oherwydd fel arfer cyhuddir Gweinidogion addysg o wahaniaethu yn erbyn ysgolion llai. Efallai fy mod yn anghyson â pholisi blaenorol.

Yn fwy difrifol, yn y pen draw, yr ydym wedi dewis arian yn hytrach na chanran oherwydd, yn y bôn, mae arian yn ystyrllon. Mae pobl yn gwybod am beth yr ydym yn sôn pan drafodwn falansau o £50,000 a £100,000. Nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod yn gwahaniaethu o ddifrif yn erbyn ysgolion mwy, oherwydd, mewn gwirionedd, mae maint y cyllidebau sydd ganddynt yn caniatáu mwy o hyblygrwydd iddynt i gynllunio ar gyfer y dyfodol. Soniwch am ysgol o faint ysgol uwchradd yr Eglwys Newydd, ond dim ond nifer fach o ysgolion o’r maint hwnnw sydd gennym yng Nghymru, felly nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod yn sôn am y sefyllfa’n gyffredinol.

Ein pwynt ni yw bod y £74 miliwn sy’n cael ei gadw yng nghronfeydd wrth gefn ysgolion yn swm sylweddol. Nid wyf yn meddwl y gall neb ddweud yn onest nad yw £74 miliwn yn swm mawr o arian. Mae’n arian mawr. Yr ydym yn glir bod angen inni gael rheoliadau.

introduced this debate, I said that we would expect local authorities to apply the regulations wisely. If a school has a reasonable explanation and a sensible plan for carrying a surplus above the rate set in the regulations, we would expect the local authority to behave in a responsible and sensible way.

I take on board the criticisms that have been made, and I accept what the Chair of the committee said, that these were serious criticisms. I accept that there has been sloppy drafting. We have attempted to remedy that in our response to the Chair of the committee, and I will take the lessons back.

4.00 p.m.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog. Y cwestiwn yw bod cytuno ar y cynnig. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod, felly byddaf yn gohirio'r pleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio; gall hynny fod unrhyw bryd wedi 5 p.m., ac efallai yn nes at 6.15 p.m.

*Gohiriwyd y bleidlais tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Vote deferred until voting time.*

Cymeradwyo'r Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2010

Approval of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 (Repeal) (Wales) Order 2010

The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews): I move that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 24.4:

approves that the draft the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 (Repeal) (Wales) Order 2010 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 11 February 2010. (NNDM4437)

Fodd bynnag, pan gyflwynais y ddatl hon, dywedais y byddem yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r rheoliadau'n ddoeth. Os oes gan ysgol esboniad rhesymol a chynllun call ar gyfer cario arian dros ben sy'n fwy na'r gyfradd a bennir yn y rheoliadau, byddem yn disgwyl i'r awdurdod lleol ymddwyn mewn ffordd gyfrifol a synhwyrol.

Derbyniaf y beirniadaethau sydd wedi'u gwneud, a derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, fod y rhain yn feirniadaethau difrifol. Derbyniaf fod drafftio blêr wedi bod. Yr ydym wedi ceisio unioni hynny yn ein hymateb i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, a rhof sylw i'r gwersi.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister. The question is that the motion be agreed. Is there any opposition? I see that there is, so I will defer voting on this item until voting time; that can be at any time after 5 p.m., and may be closer to 6.15 p.m.

Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews): Cynigias fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.4:

yn cymeradwyo bod y fersiwn ddrafft o'r Gorchymyn Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 (Diddymu) (Cymru) 2010 yn cael ei llunio yn unol â'r fersiwn ddrafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Chwefror 2010. (NNDM4437)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes gennyf siaradwyr ar y pwnc hwn, felly ni fydd gofyn i'r Gweinidog ateb. Y cwestiwn yw bod cytuno ar y cynnig. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Felly, yr wyf yn datgan bod y cynnig hwn wedi'i gytuno yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

The Presiding Officer: I have no speakers on this issue, so there will be no need for the Minister to respond. The question is that the motion be agreed. Is there any objection? I see that there is not. Therefore, I declare that the motion is agreed, in line with Standing Order No. 7.35.

Glastir

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Alun Cairns.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Alun Cairns.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Cynigiaf fod

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): I move that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi'r camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i sicrhau bod Comisiwn Ewrop yn cymeradwyo elfen Cymru gyfan Glastir cyn i'r cynllun gael ei gyflwyno ym mis Ionawr 2012. (NNDM4439)

the National Assembly for Wales notes the progress being made to secure European Commission approval of the all-Wales element of Glastir prior to the introduction of the scheme in January 2012. (NNDM4439)

Fis Mai'r llynedd, wedi ymgynghoriad cynhwysfawr â ffermwyr a charfanau eraill, cyhoeddais gynllun newydd am reoli tir yn gynaliadwy o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig, sef cynllun Glastir, i'w roi ar waith o 2012. Dros y 10 mis diwethaf, mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos ag undebau'r ffermwyr a charfanau allweddol eraill i baratoi pecyn terfynol elfen Cymru gyfan o Glastir. Yn nes ymlaen y mis hwn, bydd ein cynigion terfynol yn cael eu cyflwyno i Gomisiwn Ewrop i'w cymeradwyo'n ffurfiol.

Last May, following extensive consultation with farmers and other interests, I announced a new scheme—the Glastir scheme—for sustainable land management under the rural development plan, which would be implemented by the Welsh Government in 2012. The past 10 months have been a period of intense activity during which my officials have engaged closely with the farmers' unions and other key interests to work towards a final package for the all-Wales element under Glastir. Later on this month, our finalised proposals will be presented to the European Commission for formal approval.

Yn sgîl adolygiad hanner tymor y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin ym mis Tachwedd 2009, penderfynwyd ar newid sylfaenol ym mholisi'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Bellach, mae'r ffocws ar gamau a fydd yn galluogi ffermwyr i ymateb yn fwy uniongyrchol i heriau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd.

As a result of the common agricultural policy mid-term review in November 2009, a decision was taken to fundamentally change the European Union's policy. The focus is now on steps that will enable farmers to respond more directly to the challenges of climate change.

Bydd Glastir ar waith o 2012. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn gwario tua £89 miliwn ar fesurau amaeth-amgylcheddol o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig. Byddwn yn parhau i gynnal y lefel honno o wariant o dan Glastir. Bydd dwy lefel i Glastir. Heddiw, yr wyf yn canolbwyntio ar y lefel gyntaf, sef elfen Cymru gyfan.

Menter i'r fferm gyfan yw'r elfen Cymru gyfan, ac mae wedi'i seilio ar system o bwyntiau. Mae 39 o amodau neu weithgareddau yn yr elfen hon ac, o'r rhain, gall ffermwr ddewis y rhai sy'n fwyaf perthnasol i'w fferm. Bydd £28 yr hectar yn cael ei dalu y tu allan i'r ardal lai ffafriol, gyda £33.60 yr hectar yn cael ei dalu o'i mewn. Yn ychwanegol, bydd taliad o dan god y fferm gyfan.

Gall rhai ffermwyr ymuno â Glastir drwy'r pecynnau rhanbarthol, sy'n gwobrwyo ffermwyr am gynnal y gweithgareddau mwyaf llesol mewn ardal benodol, megis gwarchod bywyd gwylt sydd yn bwysig i'r ardaloedd penodol hynny. Mae'r mudiadau bywyd gwylt wedi bod yn gofyn ers amser am deilwra cynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol yn rhanbarthol.

Mae'n hollbwysig bod cymaint â phosibl o dir comin yn dod o dan Glastir. Mae'r ardaloedd hyn yn ddalfeydd carbon pwysig ac maent yn cynnwys llawer o nodweddion gwerthfawr o ran tirwedd a chynefin. Yn achos tiroedd comin, dim ond un amod fydd, sef uchder y borfa, a bydd taliad blynyddol ychwanegol am gynnwys tir comin mewn contract Glastir.

Sylweddolaf fod rhai yn pryderu am yr angen i sefydlu cymdeithasau pori er mwyn dod â thiroedd comin i mewn i Glastir, a gwnaeth yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig sylw ar hyn yn ei adroddiad diweddar. Comisiwn Ewrop sydd wedi mynnu hyn. Y gofyniad yw i 80 y cant o'r porwyr ar dir comin fod yn rhan o'r gymdeithas bori. Bydd yr elfen tir comin yn Glastir yn cael ei dalu yn uniongyrchol i'r porwyr unigol.

Glastir will be operational from 2012. Current annual spend on agri-environment measures under the rural development plan is some £89 million. That level of spend will be maintained under Glastir. Glastir will comprise a dual-level approach. Today, I am focusing on the first level—the all-Wales element.

The all-Wales element is a whole-farm approach and is points based. There are 39 prescriptions or activities from which a farmer can select actions applicable to his or her farm. A sum of £28 per hectare will be paid outside the less favoured area and £33.60 per hectare will be paid within the LFA. In addition, there will be a payment under the whole-farm code.

Some farmers can join Glastir through the regional packages, which reward farmers for carrying out more beneficial activities in a particular location, such as safeguarding the wildlife that is important for those specific areas. Wildlife organisations have been asking for some time for regional tailoring of agri-environment schemes.

It is vital that we seek to bring as much common land as possible into Glastir. These areas provide vital carbon sinks and have valuable landscape and habitat features. For common land, there will be only one prescription—sward height—and an additional annual payment will be paid for including common land in a Glastir contract.

I know that there are concerns about the need to set up grazing associations in order to bring commons into Glastir, on which the Rural Development Sub-committee commented in its recent report. It is the European Commission that has insisted on this. The requirement is for 80 per cent of active graziers to form the grazing association. The commons element of Glastir can be paid directly to the graziers concerned.

I ymateb i'r pryderon sydd wedi codi ar hyn, yr wyf wedi sefydlu gweithgor tiroedd comin Glastir a fydd yn edrych ar yr holl gymhlethdodau sy'n gysylltiedig â dod â thiroedd comin i mewn i Glastir a dod o hyd i atebion. Yn ychwanegol, bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn talu swyddogion cymorth i helpu porwyr i baratoi ceisiadau i ymuno â'r elfen tir comin yn Glastir.

Fel y dywedais, mae adolygiad hanner tymor y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin wedi dangos bod angen canolbwyntio ar effeithiau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Bydd felly gynllun lleihau carbon amaethyddol o dan Glastir i gynorthwyo ffermwyr sydd am fuddsoddi i foderneiddio er mwyn defnyddio ynni'n fwy effeithlon ar eu ffermydd. Bydd grant cyfalaf o 40 y cant am gyfarpar mewn meysydd megis meicrogynhyrchu trydan, cynhyrchu gwres a defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon. Ar gyfer ffermwyr ifanc, bydd grant o 50 y cant.

Er mwyn hwyluso'r broses o drosi i Glastir, mae pob ffermwr Tir Gofal a Tir Cynnal wedi cael cynnig ymestyn eu cytundebau presennol tan ddiwedd 2013. Hyd yma, mae tua 90 y cant yn Tir Gofal wedi cytuno i gael estyniad. Bydd 3,544 o gytundebau Tir Cynnal yn para tan ddiwedd 2013.

Cynhaliwyd treialon maes ar Glastir yn yr hydref ar 88 o ffermydd o bob math ym mhob cwr o Gymru. Bu tipyn o sôn ymysg ffermwyr—codwyd hyn hefyd yn ystod ymchwiliad yr is-bwyllgor—fod y treialon hyn yn dangos nad oedd Glastir yn ymarferol i rai ffermwyr. O'r treialon hynny, felly, bu inni ddefnyddio sylwadau'r ffermwyr, y rhai negyddol a'r rhai cadarnhaol, i fireinio'r amodau a'r pwyntiau sydd yn perthyn iddynt er mwyn esmwytho mynediad i Glastir ar gyfer mwy o ffermwyr. Dyna bwrpas cynnal treialon, sef darganfod y gwendidau a gwneud y newidiadau, a dyna beth a wnaethom. Wrth i'r cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus ar Glastir fynd yn eu blaen, mae'n bosibl hefyd y byddant yn esgor ar rai mân newidiadau.

Mae rhai wedi galw arnaf i ohirio cyflwyno Glastir, ond nid wyf o'r farn fod angen gwneud hynny. Diffyg gwybodaeth am y cynllun yw beirniadaeth rhai, ac mae hynny

In response to concerns on this issue, I have set up a Glastir commons working group to explore the wide range of complex issues associated with bringing commons into Glastir and to develop solutions to those issues. In addition, the Welsh Government will pay support officers to assist graziers in preparing applications to join the commons element of Glastir.

As I previously mentioned, the CAP mid-term review signalled a need to focus upon the effects of climate change. The agricultural carbon reduction scheme under Glastir will support farmers who wish to invest in modernisation that will result in improved energy efficiency on their farm. There will be a capital grant of 40 per cent for equipment in areas such as electricity microgeneration, heat generation and energy efficiency. For young farmers, there will be a 50 per cent grant.

In order to facilitate the process of changing to Glastir, every Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal farmer has been offered the opportunity to extend their existing agreements through to the end of 2013. To date, some 90 per cent of those in Tir Gofal have agreed to the extension. Some 3,544 Tir Cynnal agreements will run through to 2013.

Trials at farm level for Glastir were held last autumn on 88 farms of all types across Wales. There was considerable talk among farmers—this was also raised during the sub-committee's inquiry—about these trials demonstrating that Glastir was impractical for some farmers. As a result of the trials, therefore, we used farmers' comments—both positive and negative—to fine-tune the prescriptions, and associated points, in such a way to make access into Glastir a smoother process for more farmers. That is the intention behind holding trials: to discover weaknesses and make changes; that is what we did. It is also possible that public meetings on Glastir will also lead to some minor changes.

I have faced calls to delay the introduction of Glastir, but I do not believe that that is necessary. Some complain of a lack of information on the scheme, which is also

hefyd yn gysylltiedig â rhywfaint o ddiffyg dealltwriaeth. Tan fis Tachwedd eleni, pan fydd angen i ffermwyr gyflwyno cais ffurfiol am Glastir, mae gan y Llywodraeth raglen gynhwysfawr o drafod Glastir gyda ffermwyr.

Erbyn hyn, mae'r holl wybodaeth berthnasol am Glastir ar ein gwefan. Mae 34 o ddigwyddiadau hyfforddi a chyfarfodydd cyhoeddus wedi eu cynnal dros fisoedd Chwefror a Mawrth, ac mae dros 2,000 o ffermwyr wedi mynychu'r rhain. Bydd rhagor o gyfarfodydd yn cael eu cynnal rhwng hyn a mis Mai. O fis Mai, mae cynlluniau ar y gweill i gynnig tua 100 o sesiynau hyfforddi arbenigol ar ffermydd. Byddant yn rhoi cyfle i ffermwyr ystyried yn fanwl yr opsiynau ar gyfer ymuno â'r elfen Cymru gyfan. Mae hyn yn rhan ymarferol bwysig o'r broses, oherwydd bydd pecyn ymgeisio ffurfiol yn cael ei anfon ym mis Hydref at y ffermwyr hynny a fydd wedi mynegi diddordeb mewn ymuno â Glastir. Bydd y pecyn yn cynnwys ffurflen ymgeisio gyda gwybodaeth wedi ei rhagargraffu arno, a map o'r fferm.

Daw'r broses i wneud cais i ben ym mis Tachwedd eleni. O hynny tan fis Tachwedd 2011, bydd contractau yn cael eu cynnig i ffermwyr unigol. Byddant yn cael eu gwahodd i gyfarfodydd wyneb yn wyneb i drafod eu cais yn fanwl. Yn sgîl hynny, bydd contract ffurfiol yn cael ei lunio, a dyna pryd y bydd yn rhaid i'r ffermwyr benderfynu a ydynt am ymuno â Glastir neu beidio. Bydd Cyswllt Ffermio yn cynnal cyfres o ddigwyddiadau ledled Cymru yn ddiweddarach eleni i helpu ffermwyr unigol i gynllunio eu busnesau mewn ffordd fwy strategol.

Nod Glastir yw taro'r cydbwysedd rhwng yr angen i gynhyrchu bwyd a'r angen i ddiogelu'r amgylchedd. Yn y dyfodol, bydd rhaid inni gynhyrchu mwy o fwyd o dir Cymru, ond gan wneud hynny gyda llai o allyriadau nwyon tŷ gwydr a llai o effaith amgylcheddol. Mater cwbl wirfoddol yw ymuno â Glastir. Bydd yn rhaid i bob ffermwr ystyried a fyddai ymuno â'r cynllun yn cefnogi eu cynlluniau ar gyfer busnes ei fferm. Er hynny, yr wyf yn ffyddiog y bydd y mwyafrif o ffermwyr Cymru yn gallu ymuno

linked to some lack of understanding. In the run up to November 2010, when farmers will have to submit formal applications for Glastir, the Government has a comprehensive programme for discussing the scheme with farmers.

All relevant information about Glastir is now available on our website. A total of 34 training events and public meetings were held during February and March, attended by more than 2,000 farmers. More events are planned and will be delivered between now and May. From May, plans are being finalised to provide specialist training at farm-level. Farmers will have the opportunity to explore in detail the potential options available to access the all-Wales element. This is a crucial practical step as, from October, farmers who have indicated an interest in joining Glastir will be sent a formal application pack. This will include a pre-populated application form and a dedicated map of the farm.

The application process ends in November. From then until November 2011 contracts will be offered to farmers. They will be invited for a one-to-one meeting to discuss their application in detail. That will lead to the preparation of a formal contract and it will be at that stage that the farmer must decide whether or not to participate in Glastir. Farming Connect will hold a series of events across Wales later this year to help individual farmers adopt a more strategic business planning approach.

Glastir aims to provide a balance between the need to produce food and the need to protect the environment. In the future, we will need to produce more food on Welsh land, but with less greenhouse gas emissions and less environmental impact. Entry into Glastir is purely voluntary. Entry must be based upon an individual farmer's assessment of whether or not entry fits with their business plan for the farm. However, I remain convinced that the vast majority of farmers in Wales will be able to enter Glastir should they choose to do

â Glastir pe baent yn dewis gwneud hynny. so.

Mae elfen uwch i Glastir hefyd, a fydd ar gael ledled Cymru. Mae ein swyddogion wrthi'n trafod y cynigion drafft hyn gyda charfanau perthnasol. Y nod yw cael y pecyn terfynol ar gyfer yr elfen hon sydd wedi'i thargedu yn barod i'w gyhoeddi erbyn diwedd mis Ebrill. Mae'r cynigion ar gyfer yr elfen wedi'i thargedu hefyd yn cynnwys amod i sicrhau cynnydd o ryw 100,000 ha yn arwynebedd y tir sydd o dan goed yng Nghymru dros yr 20 mlynedd nesaf. Dywedodd y grŵp newid yn yr hinsawdd a defnyddio tir, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Gareth Wyn Jones, fod hwn yn darged allweddol. I gychwyn cwrdd â'r targed hwn, bydd opsiwn plannu coed ar gael o hydref 2011 o dan Glastir. Bydd yr opsiwn hwn yn cynnig grant cyfalaf ar gyfer sefydlu coedlannau parhaol ar dir amaethyddol gwael, ynghyd â thaliad blynyddol am hyd at 15 mlynedd ar ôl plannu'r goedlan i dalu am ofalu am y goedlan, ac am incwm a gollwyd.

Yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad ar drywydd cynlluniau echel 2 yn 2008, yr oedd y mudiadau bywyd gwyllt a chadwriaethol eisiau i mi ymgymryd ag opsiwn mwy eithafol na Glastir, a'r undebau amaethyddol eisiau i mi ddewis opsiwn llai eithafol. Er hyn, yr oedd yr undebau amaethyddol yn cydnabod bod angen symud i gyfeiriad Glastir o 2013 ymlaen. Penderfynais ar opsiwn a oedd yn taro cydbwysedd rhwng y ddau eithaf.

4.10 p.m.

Mae'n gwbl ymarferol cyflwyno Glastir o 2012. O ran y diwydiant amaethyddol a phrosesau a chapasiti'r Llywodraeth, mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cwblhau'r gwaith o sefydlu Glastir cyn inni symud i aildrefnu sail y taliad sengl o sail hanesyddol i sail ardal. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd newid sail y taliad sengl, sydd yn gymhorthdal gwerth £290 miliwn eleni i ffermwyr Cymru, o 2013 yn fwy arwyddocaol i'r diwydiant. Felly, mae angen cwblhau Glastir cyn ein bod yn cael ein gorfodi i gychwyn newid y taliad sengl.

Mae'r gwelliant sydd wedi ei gyflwyno

Glastir also includes a higher element, which will be available across Wales. Our officers are currently discussing these draft applications with the relevant parties. The aim is to have the final package for the targeted element ready for publication by the end of April. The targeted element proposals contain a prescription that is aimed at expanding the area of woodland in Wales by 100,000 ha over the next 20 years. The climate change and land use group, chaired by Gareth Wyn Jones, said that this was a key target. To begin the work of achieving this target, a tree planting option will be available from the autumn of 2011 under Glastir. This option will pay a capital grant for the establishment of permanent woodland on lower grade agricultural land, together with annual payments for maintenance and income foregone for up to 15 years after planting.

During the consultation on axis 2 schemes in 2008, wildlife and conservation organisations wanted me to take a more radical approach than that included in Glastir, and farmers' unions wanted me to take a less radical option. Nevertheless, agricultural unions recognised the need to move in the direction of Glastir from 2013. I decided upon an option that struck a balance between the two extremes.

It is practical to introduce Glastir in 2012. On the agriculture industry and Government processes and capacity, it is vital that we complete the work of introducing Glastir before moving forward to a fundamental reorganisation of the single payment, from a historic basis to an area basis. I have no doubt that changing the basis of the single payment—a benefit worth £290 million this year to Welsh farmers—from 2013 will be more significant for the industry. Therefore, Glastir must be finalised before we are forced to embark upon the work of changing the single payment.

The amendment tabled today, amendment 1,

heddiw, gwelliant 1, yn cyfeirio at adroddiad yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig. Cyfeiriais at nifer o'r materion hynny yn fy araith yn barod, ond daw cyfle eto i drafod ymateb ffurfiol y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad yn y Cynulliad.

Brynle Williams: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Alun Cairns. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu wrth y diffyg eglurder ynghylch Glastir ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi sylw ar fyrder i'r pryderon a godwyd yn y llythyr at y Gweinidog gan Gadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig ar 2 Mawrth 2010.

Diolch, Weinidog, am ddwyn y ddadl hon gerbron y Cynulliad. I ddechrau, nid ydym yn gwrthwynebu'r cynllun, ond yr ydym am dynnu sylw at yr amserlen o fynd i mewn iddo.

Farmers are being asked to sign up to the scheme in the coming weeks, despite knowing so little about how it will operate in practice. You will appreciate more than anyone, Minister, as a farmer's daughter, that farming operations take a long time to plan. Two years is a very short time in agricultural or farm planning. It is unreasonable to expect farmers to change all their farming practices in two years, especially without knowing what the criteria are.

The Welsh Conservative amendment, amendment 1, calls on the Assembly Government to address the concerns raised in the letter from the Rural Development Sub-committee following an inquiry into Glastir. This gives a summary of some of the shortcomings and unanswered questions. I will pick out some of the most pertinent. When farmers coming out of Tir Gofal are added to those from the less favoured area and those who have not been able to access other agri-environmental schemes, most of whom are in the dairy industry, we could be looking at 14,000-plus applications. Can the Minister provide a categorical assurance that there will be sufficient manpower and resources to deal with this number of farmers entering into Glastir? Many in the industry

refers to the Rural Development Sub-committee's report. I have already referred to many of those issues, but there will be a further opportunity to discuss the Government's formal response in the Assembly.

Brynle Williams: I move amendment 1 in the name of Alun Cairns. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the lack of clarity on Glastir and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to urgently address the concerns raised in the letter to the Minister from the Chair of the Rural Development Sub-committee on 2 March 2010.

Thank you, Minister, for bringing this debate before the Assembly. First, we do not oppose the scheme, but we want to draw attention to the timetable for entry.

Gofynnir i ffermwyr ymuno â'r cynllun yn yr wythnosau sydd i ddod, er cyn lleied yw eu gwybodaeth am y modd y gwnaiff weithio mewn gwirionedd. Byddwch chi'n sylweddoli'n fwy na neb, Weinidog, a chithau'n ferch fferm, fod gwaith ffermio'n cymryd amser maith i'w gynllunio. Mae dwy flynedd yn amser byr iawn mewn cynllunio fferm neu gynllunio amaethyddol. Mae'n afresymol disgwyl i ffermwyr newid eu holl arferion ffermio mewn dwy flynedd, yn enwedig heb wybod beth yw'r meini prawf.

Mae gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, gwelliant 1, yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi sylw i'r pryderon a godwyd yn y llythyr oddi wrth yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig wedi iddo gynnal ymchwiliad i Glastir. Mae hwn yn crynhoi rhai o'r diffygion a'r cwestiynau sydd heb eu hateb. Dewisaf rai o'r rhai mwyaf perthnasol. Pan ychwanegir ffermwyr sy'n dod allan o Tir Gofal at y rhai o'r ardal lai ffafriol a'r rhai nad ydynt wedi gallu bod yn rhan o gynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol eraill, sydd gan mwyaf yn y diwydiant llaeth, gallem fod yn edrych ar 14,000 a mwy o geisiadau. A all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd pendant y bydd digon o staff ac adnoddau i ddelio â chynifer o ffermwyr yn ymuno â Glastir? Nid yw llawer yn y diwydiant wedi'u darbwyllo y

are not convinced that there will be anywhere near enough project support officers or that the already overstretched divisional offices will be able to cope. Does the Minister also recognise that the requirement for 28 points per hectare over the whole farm will be enormously difficult for most farmers, especially those who have already carried out capital works under Tir Gofal? Does she appreciate that, if there will be such difficulty for farmers joining the entry-level scheme, getting into the higher-tier scheme will cause even more problems?

I would like to highlight a technical problem. One of the possible requirements will be for a 4m wildlife corridor along hedgerows. Several Welsh farms, such as mine, have a lot of small fields of 2, 2.5 or 3 acres, especially around the holding. Adding a 4m corridor means taking virtually half the field away.

The Assembly Government's decision over dual tenancy is another problem. As I am sure that the Minister appreciates, existing tenancy arrangements are rather complex; on top of the usual business considerations over the letting of land, there is the question of whether the single farm payment is retained by the landlord and so on. There will also be tax implications. Therefore, there will potentially be a clash between the three-year farm business tenancy and the five-year minimum Glastir agreement. This is extremely important and will cause serious problems. Some agreements are very lax—little more than a handshake—although I know that we will have to have written agreements, and so what happens if a landlord dies, for example? That would leave the tenant in an awkward position. I urge the Minister and her officials to provide clarification on how Glastir will work with established tenancy arrangements.

The absence of capital grant elements in the entry-level scheme is also worrying. Under Tir Gofal, as we heard when we were in Dolgellau, many farmers' sons and daughters have diversified into a whole range of new businesses—hedge-laying, walling, fencing, and even amenities work. However, if the grant element is not available, and they cannot access the higher tier, then we will

bydd hanner digon o swyddogion cymorth prosiect nac y bydd y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, sydd eisoes o dan bwysau, yn gallu ymdopi. A ydyw'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod hefyd y bydd y gofyniad am 28 pwynt yr hectar dros y fferm gyfan yn aruthrol o anodd i'r rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr, yn enwedig y rhai sydd eisoes wedi gwneud gwaith cyfalaf o dan Tir Gofal? A ydyw hi'n sylweddoli, os bydd cymaint o anhawster i ffermwyr sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun lefel mynediad, y bydd cael mynediad i'r cynllun haen uwch yn achosi mwy fyth o broblemau?

Hoffwn dynnu sylw at broblem dechnegol. Un o'r gofynion posibl fydd am goridor bywyd gwyllt 4m ar hyd gwrychoedd. Mae gan lawer o ffermydd Cymru, fel fy fferm i, lawer o gaeau bach sydd yn rhyw 2, 2.5 neu 3 acer, yn enwedig o gwmpas y daliad. Mae ychwanegu coridor 4m yn golygu tynnu tua hanner y cae i ffwrdd.

Mae penderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch tenantiaeth ddeuol yn broblem arall. Fel y sylweddola'r Gweinidog, mae'n siŵr, mae'r cytundebau tenantiaeth presennol braidd yn gymhleth; ar ben yr ystyriaethau busnes arferol ynghylch gosod tir, ceir y cwestiwn a gedwir y taliad sengl gan y landlord ac yn y blaen. Bydd goblygiadau o ran treth hefyd. Felly, gellid cael gwrthdaro rhwng y denantiaeth busnes fferm tair blynedd a'r cytundeb Glastir dros o leiaf bum mlynedd. Mae hyn yn eithriadol o bwysig a bydd yn achosi problemau difrifol. Mae rhai cytundebau'n llac iawn—fawr mwy nag ysgwyd llaw—er y gwn y bydd yn rhaid inni gael cytundebau ysgrifenedig, ac felly beth sy'n digwydd os yw landlord yn marw, er enghraifft? Byddai hynny'n gadael y tenant mewn lle cas. Anogaf y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion i roi eglurhad ynghylch sut y gwnaiff Glastir weithio gyda threfniadau tenantiaeth sydd wedi'u hen sefydlu.

Mae diffyg elfennau grant cyfalaf yn y cynllun lefel mynediad yn destun pryder hefyd. Dan Tir Gofal, fel y clywsom pan oeddem yn Nolgellau, mae meibion a merched sawl ffermwr wedi arallgyfeirio i lu o fusnesau newydd—plygu perthi, walio, ffensio, a hyd yn oed gwaith mwynderau. Fodd bynnag, os nad yw'r elfen grant ar gael, ac na allant gael yr haen uwch, yna byddwn

lose these young people from the rural community.

The industry has legitimate concerns about Glastir, and I urge you, Minister, to answer these questions and provide clarity as soon as possible. I agree with my fellow committee members that serious consideration needs to be given to postponing this scheme. I know that you do not agree, but I do not believe that it is yet fit for purpose. The farming unions are asking for the same—not for the scheme to be scrapped, but to be postponed until we get a better understanding of it. You have already indicated that that is possibly on the way.

As a final point, I will add that the industry is well aware of its duty to the environment. However, the Assembly Government needs to ensure that it does not lose perspective as to the true purpose of farming. We have seen the effect of adverse weather conditions in other parts of the world, causing droughts and food shortages and, with an expanding global population, we must remember that although Welsh farmers are there to protect the environment, their primary purpose is to produce food to feed the nation.

Kirsty Williams: I thank the Minister for her speech, and for having provided us previously with the opportunity to discuss with her officials some of the details of this scheme. The Minister said that she wanted to concentrate on aspects of the all-Wales scheme. That is of little surprise, as we still do not have the full details about the upper level scheme, so it would be very difficult for her to discuss it this afternoon. That lack of detail about the upper level scheme will greatly influence farmers' decisions about whether to go into the entry-level scheme, which is the gateway into the other schemes.

The lack of information continues to cause great concern across the farming community. That is demonstrated by the fact that 150 farmers from Brecon and Radnorshire turned up at the NFU meeting in the middle of lambing season to try to find out a bit more about what is going on. They would not usually turn up to a meeting at this time of year. The Minister outlined a whole tranche of training exercises, field officers,

yn colli'r bobl ifanc hyn o'r gymuned wledig.

Mae gan y diwydiant bryderon teg ynghylch Glastir, ac fe'ch anogaf, Weinidog, i ateb y cwestiynau hyn a darparu eglurder cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl. Cytunaf â'm cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor fod angen rhoi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i ohirio'r cynllun hwn. Gwn nad ydych yn cytuno, ond nid wyf yn credu ei fod yn addas i'r diben eto. Mae undebau'r ffermwyr yn gofyn am yr un peth—nid am ddiddymu'r cynllun, ond am ei ohirio nes bydd gennym well dealltwriaeth ohono. Yr ydych eisoes wedi awgrymu efallai fod hynny ar y ffordd.

O ran fy mhwynt olaf, ychwanegaf fod y diwydiant yn ymwybodol iawn o'i ddyletswydd at yr amgylchedd. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sicrhau nad yw'n colli persbectif ynglŷn â gwir ddiben ffermio. Yr ydym wedi gweld effaith tywydd gwael mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd, yn achosi sychder a phrinder bwyd, ac wrth i boblogaeth y byd dyfu, rhaid inni gofio, er bod ffermwyr Cymru yno i warchod yr amgylchedd, mai eu prif bwrpas yw cynhyrchu bwyd i fwydo'r wlad.

Kirsty Williams: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei haraith, ac am roi'r cyfle inni'n flaenorol i drafod rhai o fanylion y cynllun hwn gyda'i swyddogion. Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod arni eisiau canolbwyntio ar agweddau ar gynllun Cymru gyfan. Nid yw hynny'n fawr o syndod, gan nad ydym byth wedi cael y manylion llawn am y cynllun lefel uwch, felly byddai'n anodd iawn iddi ei drafod y prynhawn yma. Bydd y diffyg manylion am y cynllun lefel uwch yn dylanwadu'n fawr ar benderfyniadau ffermwyr ynghylch ymuno â'r cynllun lefel mynediad, sef y porth i'r cynlluniau eraill.

Mae'r diffyg gwybodaeth yn parhau i achosi pryder mawr ar draws y gymuned amaethyddol. Dangosir hynny gan y ffaith i 150 o ffermwyr o Frycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ddod i gyfarfod yr NFU yng nghanol y tymor wyna i geisio cael gwybod ychydig mwy am yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Ni fyddent fel rheol yn mynd i gyfarfod yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn. Amlinellodd y Gweinidog res o bethau, sef ymarferiadau hyfforddi, swyddogion maes,

presentations and on-farm demonstrations, but the problem is that all of those will take place after farmers have returned their single application forms, or SAFs. It is via those SAFs, this spring, that farmers will have to express an interest in this scheme. The presentation that we received in Builth Wells made it clear that the tick box on the SAF will be crucial in ensuring farmers are at the forefront for entry to this scheme. I would like the Minister to assure us that if farmers do not tick that box on the SAF this spring they will not be precluded from taking an interest in the scheme further. We have been here before with the organic scheme, when a failure to tick a box on the SAF meant that farmers missed out. The organic scheme was rationed according to who had ticked the box.

The Minister continues to describe the scheme as a simple way for farmers to make a choice about their business, and about farming in a more sustainable way. However, if any of you have looked at the information online, you will have seen how complex this scheme is. Although the Minister says that all the information is available on the website, the frequently asked questions section was only added on 13 March, and they are only available in English, not Welsh. If you look at the online scorecard, you will see the complexities of the numerous prescriptions that are available under the all-Wales entry. That might be fine if you are used to dealing with agri-environment schemes, but if you are new to this business, believe me, those prescriptions are not easy to understand. Without that understanding, it is impossible to progress.

4.20 p.m.

There is also widespread concern that 28 points per hectare is unattainable for many farming businesses. The Minister stated that she was confident that the majority of farmers will be able to get into this scheme. However, my understanding is that the majority of farmers who took part in the pilot scheme could not get 28 points per hectare. Therefore, how can she extrapolate from that

cyflwyniadau ac arddangosiadau ar ffermydd, ond y broblem yw y bydd y rheini i gyd yn digwydd ar ôl i ffermwyr ddychwelyd eu ffurflenni cais sengl. Drwy'r ffurflenni hynny, y gwanwyn hwn, y bydd yn rhaid i ffermwyr fynegi diddordeb yn y cynllun hwn. Dywedwyd yn glir yn y cyflwyniad a gawsom yn Llanfair ym Muallt y bydd y blwch ticio ar ffurflen y cais sengl yn allweddol i sicrhau bod ffermwyr ar y blaen i gael mynediad i'r cynllun. Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog roi sicrwydd inni os na fydd ffermwyr yn ticio'r blwch hwnnw ar y ffurflen y gwanwyn hwn na fydd hynny'n eu hatal rhag ymddiddori ymhellach yn y cynllun. Yr ydym wedi bod yma o'r blaen gyda'r cynllun organig, pryd y golygai methu ticio blwch ar ffurflen y cais sengl fod ffermwyr yn colli'r cyfle. Dognwyd y cynllun organig yn ôl pwy oedd wedi ticio'r blwch.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn dal i ddisgrifio'r cynllun fel ffordd syml i ffermwyr wneud dewis ynglŷn â'u busnes, ac ynglŷn â ffermio mewn ffordd fwy cynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, os ydych wedi edrych ar y wybodaeth ar-lein, byddwch wedi gweld mor gymhleth yw'r cynllun hwn. Er y dywed y Gweinidog fod yr holl wybodaeth ar gael ar y wefan, dim ond ar 13 Mawrth yr ychwanegwyd yr adran cwestiynau cyffredin, a dim ond yn Saesneg y mae ar gael, nid yn Gymraeg. Os edrychwch ar y cerdyn sgorio ar-lein, fe welwch gymhlethodau'r amryfal bresgripsiynau sydd ar gael o dan y mynediad i Gymru gyfan. Efallai fod hynny'n iawn os ydych wedi arfer â delio â chynlluniau amaeth-amgylcheddol, ond os yw'r busnes hwn yn newydd ichi, credwch fi, nid yw'n hawdd deall y presgripsiynau hynny. Heb y ddealltwriaeth honno, nid oes dim modd symud ymlaen.

Ceir pryder cyffredinol hefyd nad yw 28 pwynt yr hectar yn bosibl i lawer o fusnesau ffermio. Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei bod yn hyderus y bydd y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yn gallu bod yn rhan o'r cynllun hwn. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl a ddeallaf, ni lwyddodd y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr a gymerodd ran yn y cynllun peilot i gael 28 pwynt yr hectar. Felly, sut y gall hi gymryd ar sail hynny y

that the majority of farmers will qualify via that 28 points per hectare scheme? There is a real danger that farmers who need to take sustainability issues more seriously will simply walk away and that the opportunity to get the industry as a whole involved in sustainability issues will be missed because of the high levels expected to get into the scheme.

This will be particularly problematic for farmers who have previously been in the Tir Gofal or the organic farm schemes. They will see significant reductions in their income. More important than that, perhaps, is the fate of those farmers who have been in receipt of Tir Mynydd payments. You will know as well as I do, Minister, that often the Tir Mynydd cheque is the difference between a farm making a profit or not making a profit within a financial year. Farmers' ability to stay in the uplands and to do what they need to do will be affected hugely by this scheme.

The entry-level scheme will also be affected by the lack of capital grants. Capital grants were available under Tir Gofal to carry out improvements. However, that is not the case in the entry-level scheme, which will put some people off. More importantly, it will prove hugely devastating to the contracting businesses that have grown as a result of Tir Gofal, which keep in business the sons of farmers who cannot remain at home and be part of the farming business.

I know that the Minister does not want to delay this scheme. I hope that she can guarantee that we will not have a situation in which field officers and staff in field offices in places such as Llandrindod, who do their very best to offer a good deal to farmers, will be overwhelmed and snowed under, should, as the Minister hopes, there be an avalanche of applications for this scheme. It is an awful lot of work for field officers to sit down with individual farmers to go through what is, in effect, a legal contract between the farmer and the Welsh Assembly Government. I know that the Minister does not want to delay the scheme, and I know that environmental lobbyists do not want her to delay the scheme. However, the goals of those environmental lobbyists will not be achieved if farmers do not enter into this scheme. I

bydd y rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr yn gymwys drwy'r cynllun 28 pwynt yr hectar? Ceir gwir berygl y bydd ffermwyr y mae angen iddynt roi mwy o sylw o ddifrif i faterion cynaliadwyedd yn cerdded i ffwrdd ac y collir y cyfle i gael y diwydiant yn ei gyfanrwydd i ymwneud â materion cynaliadwyedd oherwydd y lefelau uchel a ddisgwylir er mwyn cael ymuno â'r cynllun.

Bydd hyn yn broblem arbennig i ffermwyr sydd wedi bod yng nghynlluniau Tir Gofal neu ffermio organig. Bydd gostyngiad sylweddol yn eu hincwm hwy. Pwysicach na hynny, efallai, yw ffawd y ffermwyr hynny sydd wedi bod yn cael taliadau Tir Mynydd. Gwyddoch cystal â mi, Weinidog, mai'r sic Tir Mynydd yn aml yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng bod fferm yn gwneud elw neu'n methu gwneud elw o fewn blwyddyn ariannol. Bydd y cynllun hwn yn effeithio'n ddirfawr ar allu ffermwyr i aros yn yr ucheldir a gwneud yr hyn y mae angen iddynt ei wneud.

Effeithir ar y cynllun lefel mynediad hefyd gan y diffyg grantiau cyfalaf. Yr oedd grantiau cyfalaf ar gael o dan Tir Gofal i wneud gwelliannau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n wir gyda'r cynllun lefel mynediad, a bydd hynny'n peri nad yw'r cynllun yn apelio at rai pobl. Yn bwysicach, bydd yn ddinistriol ofnadwy i'r busnesau contractio sydd wedi tyfu yn sgîl Tir Gofal, sy'n darparu gwaith i feibion ffermydd sy'n methu aros gartref a bod yn rhan o fusnes y fferm.

Gwn nad oes ar y Gweinidog eisiau oedi gyda'r cynllun hwn. Gobeithio y gall hi warantu na chawn sefyllfa lle y bydd swyddogion maes a staff mewn swyddfeydd maes mewn lleoedd fel Llandrindod, sy'n gwneud eu gorau glas i gynnig bargaen dda i ffermwyr, yn cael eu llethu gan y ceisiadau niferus, os ceir llu o geisiadau am y cynllun hwn fel y mae'r Gweinidog yn gobeithio. Mae'n waith aruthrol i swyddogion maes eistedd gyda ffermwyr unigol i fynd drwy'r hyn sydd, mewn gwirionedd, yn gytundeb cyfreithiol rhwng y ffermwr a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Gwn nad oes ar y Gweinidog eisiau oedi gyda'r cynllun, a gwn nad oes ar lobïwyr amgylcheddol eisiau iddi oedi gyda'r cynllun. Fodd bynnag, ni chyflawnir amcanion y lobïwyr amgylcheddol hynny os nad ymuna ffermwyr

urge the Minister to go back to the negotiating table with those involved in the industry to look again at whether those concerns can be alleviated, otherwise, her goals and those of the environmental lobby, as well as our goals, will not be achieved because farmers will simply vote with their feet and not participate.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am gynnal y ddaidl hon ac am gydnabod yr angen am drafodaeth ar y pwnc hwn. Diolchaf iddi nid yn unig am ymateb i rai o'r cwestiynau a godais yn fy llythyr ati yn ei sylwadau agoriadol i'r ddaidl, ond hefyd am yr addewid i ymateb yn llawn i'r llythyr.

Trafodaeth sydd ei angen ar hyn o bryd ar y pwnc hwn. Mae'r Gweinidog mor ymwybodol ag unrhyw un o'r pryder ymysg amaethwyr a'r undebau sy'n eu cynrychioli ynglŷn â'r cynllun newydd hwn. Mae pryder ynghylch mynediad i'r cynllun, fel y cyfeiriasoch, Weinidog. Credaf y bydd y parodrwydd i ymestyn cynlluniau Tir Cynnal a Tir Gofal yn ddefnyddiol er mwyn arwain ffermwyr i mewn i'r sefyllfa newydd a rhoi sicrwydd iddynt. Gwerthfawrogaf yr addewid yr ydych wedi ei roi a'r ffaith eich bod eisoes wedi gwneud rhai newidiadau o ganlyniad i'r cynlluniau peilot a'r sylwadau yr ydych wedi'u derbyn gan amaethwyr. Gwerthfawrogaf eich parodrwydd i edrych ar newidiadau pellach, oherwydd yr ydym oll yn sylweddoli pwysigrwydd sicrhau mynediad i'r cynllun i gynifer â phosibl o ffermwyr—a sylwais eich bod yn hyderus y bydd y mwyafrif o ffermwyr yn cael mynediad i'r cynllun ond mae angen inni fod yn glir ynghylch hynny.

Yr wyf hefyd yn gwerthfawrogi'ch sylwadau ar y pwynt a godwyd gan yr is-bwyllgor ar adnoddau a gallu. Credaf fod y sesiynau hyfforddi a'r cyfarfodydd wyneb yn wyneb yr ydych wedi cyfeirio atynt yn mynd i fod yn hynod bwysig er mwyn galluogi ffermwyr i ddeall goblygiadau'r cynllun newydd. Pe bawn am fod yn feirniadol, efallai y byddwn yn awgrymu y gallai'r cyfarfodydd wyneb yn wyneb a'r sesiynau hyfforddiant fod wedi'u cynnal yn gynharach. Efallai wedyn na fyddem yn ein sefyllfa bresennol.

â'r cynllun hwn. Anogaf y Gweinidog i fynd yn ôl at y bwrdd negodi gyda'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r diwydiant i edrych eto a ellir lleddfu'r pryderon hyn, neu fel arall, ni chyflawnir ei hamcanion hi ac amcanion y lobi amgylcheddol, a'n hamcanion ninnau hefyd, oherwydd gwnaiff ffermwyr bleidleisio â'u traed a dewis peidio â chymryd rhan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I thank the Minister for holding this debate and for acknowledging the need to discuss this subject. I thank her for responding to some of the questions raised in my letter to her in her introductory comments to the debate, as well as for pledging to respond fully to that letter.

What is needed is a debate on this subject. The Minister is as aware as anyone is of the concerns among farmers and the unions that represent farmers regarding this new scheme. There is concern about the accessibility of the scheme, which you referred to, Minister. I believe that the willingness to extend the Tir Cynnal and Tir Gofal schemes will be useful in guiding farmers into the new arrangements and giving them some assurance. I appreciate the promise that you have made and the fact that you have already instigated some changes as a result of the pilot schemes and the responses that you have received from farmers. I appreciate your willingness to consider further amendments, because we all realise the importance of ensuring access to the scheme for as many farmers as possible—and I noted that you are confident that the majority of farmers would be able to gain access to the scheme, but we need to be clear about that.

I also appreciate your comments on the point raised by the sub-committee on resources and capacity. I believe that the training sessions and the face-to-face meetings that you have referred to will be vital in assisting farmers to understand the implications of the new scheme. If I wanted to be critical, I would perhaps suggest that the face-to-face meetings and training sessions could have been held earlier. Perhaps then, we might not be in the situation in which we find ourselves today.

Nid wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi delio'n llwyr, os o gwbl, â'r mater o gael mwy nag un ffermwr yn ffermio'r un tir, hynny yw, pan fydd perchennog tir a thenant. Beth sy'n digwydd yn y sefyllfa honno? Cawsom dystiolaeth y byddai'n anodd iawn i denant gael mynediad i Glastir gan na fyddai'n berchennog ar y tir. Byddwn yn falch pe bai modd ichi ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, gan ei fod yn berthnasol i lawer o ffermwyr yng Nghymru heddiw. Efallai y bydd yn fwy perthnasol yn y dyfodol, gan fod oedran ffermwyr yn codi, ar gyfartaledd. Bydd llawer yn gadael y diwydiant oherwydd eu hoedran, ac efallai na fydd eu merched na'u meibion yn dymuno cymryd drosodd, ond bydd ganddynt dir i'w osod. Bydd pwy bynnag sy'n dod i mewn i'r diwydiant heb gefndir amaethyddol a heb etifeddu ffarm yn ei chael hi'n eithriadol o anodd cael mynediad, ac efallai y bydd yn rhaid symud at system o gytuno bod rhywun yn gweithredu fel rheolwr y tir ac yn ei ffermio yn lle'r perchennog. Gwerthfawrogaf ateb i'r pwynt hwnnw.

Nid wyf yn meddwl eich bod wedi ymdrin yn llawn â'r mater gwaith cyfalaf ychwaith. Derbyniat efallai y bydd yn rhaid imi aros am ymateb llawn, ond pwysaf arnoch am eglurder yma hefyd, gan fod pryder na fydd gwaith cyfalaf yn cael ei gynnwys o fewn Glastir, a gall hynny arwain at sefyllfa anodd i ffermwyr sydd eisiau ehangu eu busnes. Gwerthfawrogaf yn fawr yr hyn a ddywedasoich am gynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy a chynlluniau lleihau carbon ac, yn arbennig, y grantiau helaethach ar gyfer ffermwyr ifanc. Mae'r rheiny i gyd i'w croesawu. Tybiaf y bydd hynny'n cynnwys gwaith cyfalaf, ond ni chredaf ei fod yn mynd i'r afael â phroblem sylfaenol y cynllun. Hefyd, yr ydych wedi delio â mater tir comin y prynhawn yma, ond credaf fod angen trafodaeth bellach am hynny hefyd.

A minnau'n Gadeirydd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, hoffwn weld y drafodaeth yn parhau a hoffwn sicrhau bod yr wybodaeth hon yn nwylo ffermwyr mor fuan â phosibl. Ni fyddaf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant, gan ei fod yn amherthnasol, braidd. Mae'n ddibwrpas, mewn gwirionedd, gan fod y Gweinidog yn ymateb yn llawn bob amser i geisiadau'r Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig.

I do not think that you have fully addressed, if at all, the issue of more than one farmer farming the land, that is, where there is a landowner and a tenant. What happens in that situation? We received evidence that it would be very difficult in that situation for the tenant to access Glastir because he or she would not be the landowner. I would be grateful if you could answer that question, because it is relevant to many farmers in Wales today. I suggest that it may become more relevant in future because the average age of farmers is rising. Many will be leaving the industry because of their age, and their sons or daughters may not want to take over the farm, but they will have land to let. Anyone coming into the industry without a background in agriculture and not having inherited a farm will find it extremely difficult to get access, and perhaps we will have to move to a system where there is an agreement with someone to act as the land manager and to farm instead of the landowner. I would appreciate an answer to that point.

I do not think that you have dealt with the issue of capital works fully either. I accept that I may have to wait for a full response, but I would press you to give us some explanation here, too, because there are concerns that capital works will not be included in Glastir, and that could lead to a difficult situation for farmers who wish to expand their businesses. I greatly appreciate what you said about renewable energy schemes and carbon reduction schemes and, particularly, that there will be more extensive grants for young farmers. Those are all very much to be welcomed. I assume that that will include capital works, but I do not think that it gets to grips with the scheme's fundamental problem. You have also dealt with common land this afternoon, but I think that we need a further discussion on that.

As Chair of the Rural Development Sub-committee, I want to see the debate continuing to ensure that farmers have this information available to them as soon as possible. I will not be supporting the amendment, as it is rather irrelevant. It is pointless, to be honest, because the Minister always responds fully to requests from the Rural Development Sub-committee. In the

Yn y ffaith ei fod yn amherthnasol ac yn ddibwrpas, mae'r gwelliant yn fy atgoffa o'r Ceidwadwyr yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi dechrau ar y ddeialog y prynhawn yma, Weinidog. Mae ffermwyr yng Nghymru a'u cynrychiolwyr yn edrych am drafodaeth agored, ddeallus ac aeddfed am y mater hwn, yn hytrach na phobl yn codi pwyntiau heb wneud llawer o synnwyr.

Paul Davies: I am pleased to be able to take part in the debate this afternoon. I declare an interest as my parents-in-law farm in north Pembrokeshire. There has been considerable confusion about the specifics of the Glastir scheme. That has been a concern for many farmers in my constituency, and I have received a number of letters from constituents expressing concern about the effect that the new Glastir scheme will have on their businesses. Particular concerns revolve around the speed with which these businesses have had to make vital decisions based on the little information presented to farmers regarding the scheme. Glastir clearly represents a fundamental change to agricultural support, and this will have an effect on the way farmers operate their businesses in future. The current schemes, Tir Mynydd, Tir Gofal and Tir Cynnal, are all doing an appropriate job of supporting rural businesses in my constituency and across rural areas in Wales. For example, as has already been said, capital works under Tir Gofal support a range of new rural business, and without a capital works element in Glastir, it could make it more difficult for new rural businesses to develop and survive.

4.30 p.m.

With the implementation of the Glastir scheme on the horizon not having a capital works element, perhaps the Minister can tell us in her response which measures will be put in place to protect these businesses, given that a number of Members have raised this issue here this afternoon.

Concern also exists at the rate at which the scheme has been developed and is being introduced, given that many farmers have

fact that it is irrelevant and pointless, the amendment reminds me of the Conservatives in Wales.

I am pleased that we have started the dialogue this afternoon, Minister. What farmers in Wales and their representatives are looking for is an open, intelligent and mature debate on this issue, rather than people raising points without making much sense.

Paul Davies: Yr wyf yn falch o allu cymryd rhan yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Datganaf fuddiant gan fod fy rhieni yng nghyfraith yn ffermio yng ngogledd sir Benfro. Bu cryn ddryswch ynglŷn â manylion y cynllun Glastir. Mae hynny wedi peri pryder i lawer o ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth, ac yr wyf wedi cael nifer o lythyrau oddi wrth etholwyr yn mynegi pryder am yr effaith a gaiff y cynllun newydd ar eu busnesau. Mae pryderon arbennig yn ymwneud â'r cyflymder y gofynnwyd i'r busnesau hyn wneud penderfyniadau hollbwysig ar sail yr ychydig wybodaeth a gyflwynwyd i ffermwyr ynglŷn â'r cynllun. Mae Glastir yn amlwg yn golygu newid sylfaenol mewn cefnogaeth i amaethyddiaeth, a chaiff hyn effaith ar y ffordd y bydd ffermwyr yn rhedeg eu busnesau yn y dyfodol. Mae'r cynlluniau cyfredol, Tir Mynydd, Tir Gofal a Tir Cynnal, i gyd yn gwneud gwaith priodol o ran cynnal busnesau gwledig yn fy etholaeth ac ar draws cefn gwlad Cymru. Er enghraifft, fel y dywedwyd yn barod, mae gwaith cyfalaf o dan Tir Gofal yn cynnal amrywiaeth o fusnesau gwledig newydd, a heb elfen o waith cyfalaf yn Glastir, gallai ei gwneud yn anos i fusnesau gwledig newydd ddatblygu a goroesi.

Gan fod rhoi cynllun Glastir ar waith ar y gorwel a hynny heb elfen o waith cyfalaf, efallai y gall y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym yn ei hymateb pa fesurau a sefydlir i warchod y busnesau hyn, gan fod nifer o Aelodau wedi codi'r mater hwnnw yma y prynhawn yma.

Ceir pryder hefyd ynghylch cyflymder datblygu a chyflwyno'r cynllun hwn, gan fod llawer o ffermwyr wedi'u gorfodi i wneud

been forced to make business decisions without full knowledge of the scheme. In the light of these concerns, would it be more prudent to continue with the less favoured area support until such time as European policy requires such changes to be introduced, and that, if Glastir is to be introduced, the implementation date should be delayed in order to ensure that the scheme criteria and transition timetable make entry into the scheme practical for the majority of Welsh farmers? Deferring implementation of this scheme has been called for by both farming unions in Wales.

I understand that in order to compensate for the end of the Tir Mynydd scheme, those farming in less favoured areas will be entitled to a 20 per cent uplift in their entry payment, yet 80 per cent of categorised LFA Welsh land will not automatically be eligible, and will only be accessed by farms able to achieve a certain number of points per hectare. For my constituents, and for farmers across Wales, these are growing concerns that affect these people's livelihoods. I welcome the fact that groups have been established to voice these concerns to the Minister, and that farmers' voices are being heard, but that still does not settle the current timetabling issues, which mean that more farmers will feel rushed into an already complex agri-environment scheme. Glastir must be executed properly for all farmers, including common land farmers, as it could spell disaster for many communities if introduced inappropriately.

While I am absolutely committed to organic farming and to environmental stewardship schemes, as are farmers in my constituency, they also need to run viable farm businesses. Although the implementation of Glastir might meet the Assembly's environmental sustainability criteria, it is unclear whether the scheme will deliver economic and social sustainability in rural areas.

The Rural Development Sub-committee has outlined a number of valid considerations over Glastir. For example, the sub-committee has highlighted the difficulties in obtaining

penderyniadau busnes heb wybodaeth lawn am y cynllun. Yng ngoleuni'r pryderon hyn, a fyddai'n ddoethach parhau gyda'r cymorth i ardaloedd llai ffafriol nes bydd polisi Ewrop yn mynnu bod yn rhaid cyflwyno newidiadau o'r fath, ac, os am gyflwyno Glastir, y dylid oedi'r dyddiad gweithredu er mwyn sicrhau bod meini prawf y cynllun â'r amserlen pontio yn golygu bod ymuno â'r cynllun yn ymarferol i'r rhan fwyaf o ffermwyr Cymru? Mae'r ddau undeb ffermio yng Nghymru wedi galw am ohirio gweithredu'r cynllun hwn.

Er mwyn gwneud iawn am ddod â'r cynllun Tir Mynydd i ben, deallaf y bydd gan rai sy'n ffermio mewn ardaloedd llai ffafriol hawl i godiad o 20 y cant yn eu tâl mynediad, eto ni fydd 80 y cant o dir Cymru sydd wedi'i ddosbarthu'n ardaloedd llai ffafriol yn gymwys yn awtomatig, a dim ond ffermydd sy'n gallu cyrraedd nifer penodol o bwyntiau yr hectar a fydd yn gymwys i gael mynediad. I'm hetholwyr i, ac i ffermwyr ar draws Cymru, mae'r rhain yn bryderon cynyddol sy'n effeithio ar fywoliaeth y bobl hyn. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod grwpiau wedi'u sefydlu i leisio'r pryderon hyn i'r Gweinidog, a bod lleisiau ffermwyr i'w clywed, ond nid yw hynny'n datrys y problemau ar hyn o bryd o ran amserlennu, sy'n golygu y bydd mwy o ffermwyr yn teimlo eu bod yn cael eu gyrru i ymuno â chynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol sydd eisoes yn gymhleth. Rhaid gweithredu Glastir yn iawn i bob ffermwr, gan gynnwys ffermwyr tir comin, gan y gallai fod yn drychinebus i sawl cymuned o gael ei gyflwyno mewn modd amhriodol.

Er fy mod yn llwyr gefnogol i ffermio organig ac i gynlluniau stiwardiaeth amgylcheddol, a ffermwyr yn fy etholaeth yr un modd, mae arnynt eisiau rhedeg busnesau fferm hyfyw hefyd. Er bod gweithredu Glastir efallai'n cyflawni meini prawf y Cynulliad o ran cynaliadwyedd amgylcheddol, nid yw'n eglur a wnaiff y cynllun sicrhau cynaliadwyedd economaidd a chymdeithasol mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Mae'r Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig wedi amlinellu nifer o ystyriaethau dilys ynglŷn â Glastir. Er enghraifft, mae'r is-bwyllgor wedi pwysleisio'r anawsterau o ran cael y nifer

the necessary number of points to enter the scheme. Project officer support is also needed for the entry-level scheme because I am told that there is an issue with regard to the capacity to cope with the demand that the Welsh Assembly Government has predicted from the scheme and with some of the difficulties that are likely to arise in relation to common land. It is evident that farmers need more information and support to accommodate these changes and progress to making adequate business decisions.

While some elements of the scheme are pioneering—for example, its approach to climate change and water management is encouraging—other elements seem to be overlooked. It is absolutely crucial that nothing is overlooked. It is obvious from today's debate that Members, farmers and farming unions continue to raise concerns regarding the new scheme. The Assembly Government needs to take these views on board, and possibly consider delaying the Glastir scheme until farmers have a better understanding of its structure, its operational details, and its effect on their businesses. From what I have been told, it is obvious that the timescale to implement the programme is too ambitious, and I therefore urge the Minister to take on board the points made here today. Diolch yn fawr.

Nerys Evans: Hoffwn ddweud wrth ddechrau ei bod hi'n bwysig bod ein Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r sefyllfa hon yn awr. Yn unol â'r enw da y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi ei ennill, dengys nad ydyw, fel Gweinidog, yn fodlon osgoi pynciau anodd fel y pwnc hwn a TB buchol, er enghraifft, sydd yn bynciau enfawr i'n cymunedau amaethyddol. Mae'n siŵr gennyf fod pob Aelod sydd yn cynrychioli ardaloedd gwledig yn deall pa mor anodd y gall unrhyw newidiadau i drefn cymorthdaliadau i ffermwyr fod. Gwn fod y Gweinidog, fel finnau, yn ymwybodol y caiff y newidiadau i'r drefn honno effaith ar arferion gwaith ar lawr gwlad ac ar y ffordd y mae ffermwyr yn rhedeg eu busnesau o ddydd i ddydd. Serch hynny, mae'n rhaid newid, oherwydd lluniwyd y gyfundrefn bresennol ddegawd yn ôl ar gyfer blaenoriaethau gwahanol iawn.

angenrheidiol o bwyntiau i ymuno â'r cynllun. Mae angen cefnogaeth swyddogion prosiect hefyd ar gyfer y cynllun lefel mynediad oherwydd dywedir wrthyf fod problem ynglŷn â'r gallu i ymdopi â'r galw y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei ragweld gan y cynllun a chyda rhai o'r anawsterau sy'n debyg o godi mewn perthynas â thir comin. Mae'n amlwg bod ar ffermwyr angen mwy o wybodaeth a chefnogaeth er mwyn ymdopi â'r newidiadau hyn a symud ymlaen i wneud penderfyniadau busnes boddhaol.

Er bod rhai elfennau o'r cynllun yn arloesol—er enghraifft, mae ei agwedd at y newid yn yr hinsawdd a rheoli dŵr yn galonogol—mae'n ymddangos bod elfennau eraill wedi'u hesgeuluso. Mae'n gwbl hanfodol nad esgeulusir dim. Mae'n amlwg yn ôl y ddadl heddiw fod Aelodau, ffermwyr ac undebau'r amaethwyr yn dal i godi pryderon ynglŷn â'r cynllun newydd. Mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad dderbyn y sylwadau hyn, ac efallai ystyried gohirio'r cynllun Glastir nes bydd gan ffermwyr well dealltwriaeth o'i strwythur, ei fanylion gweithredol, a'i effaith ar eu busnesau. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthyf, mae'n amlwg bod yr amserlen ar gyfer gweithredu'r rhaglen yn rhy uchelgeisiol, ac felly anogaf y Gweinidog i dderbyn y pwyntiau a wnaed yma heddiw. Diolch yn fawr.

Nerys Evans: I would like to say at the outset how important it is that our Minister gets to grips with this situation now. In accordance with the good reputation that the Minister has already gained, she has shown that, as a Minister, she is willing to tackle difficult issues such as this one and bovine TB, for example, which are huge issues for agricultural communities. I am sure that all Members who represent rural areas understand how difficult it is to make any changes to the subsidy system for farmers. I know that the Minister is aware, as am I, that changes to this system will have an impact on work practices at grass-roots level and on the way in which farmers run their businesses on a daily basis. However, change is a must, because the current system was formulated a decade ago to deal with very different priorities.

Mae'r rhain yn newidiadau mawr ac angenrheidiol. Felly, mae'n fwy pwysig nag erioed fod y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth yn gwrandao ar y diwydiant. Yn ôl yr adborth yr wyf wedi ei dderbyn, mae amaethwyr eisoes wedi cael sawl cyfle i gyfrannu at y newidiadau. Yn sicr, un peth sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yw bod grwpiau amgylcheddol am inni symud ymlaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd gyda'r system newydd. Mae unigolion a'r undebau wedi cael cyfleoedd eang i gyfrannu at y broses, a gwn fod eu mewnbwn yn allweddol.

Brynle Williams *a gododd*—

Nerys Evans: Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod y gwaith pwysig sy'n cael ei wneud ar ffermydd ar draws Cymru yn ddyddiol. Y ffermwyr sydd yn y rheng flaen ac sy'n deall goblygiadau'r gyfundrefn ac unrhyw newidiadau i'r gyfundrefn honno. Mae'n naturiol, felly, eu bod yn pryderu. Os caf ategu sylwadau Rhodri Glyn, yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn barod iawn i addasu'r cynlluniau i gyd-fynd â'r sylwadau a'r dystiolaeth sydd wedi eu cyflwyno yn sgîl yr holl ymgynghori.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Brynle, nid wyf yn credu ei bod hi'n mynd i ildio, er dy fod ti'n fachgen mor landeg. [*Chwerthin.*]

Nerys Evans: Hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog am gadarnhad y bydd y broses ymgynghori yn parhau ac y bydd yn ystyried unrhyw sylwadau a ddaw ger ei bron. Wrth gloi, yr wyf am ddweud bod gennyf ffydd fawr y bydd y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth yn mynd i'r afael â'r newidiadau hyn mewn ffordd a fydd nid yn unig yn ystyried yr effaith ar fywydau beunyddiol ein ffermwyr, ond a fydd yn cadw un llygad ar y dyfodol a'r angen i roi trefn ar elfennau cyllidol penodol yn awr er mwyn sicrhau sefydlogrwydd o ran y materion hyn i'r dyfodol.

Andrew R.T. Davies: It is a pleasure to speak in this debate this afternoon, although I do declare an interest as a farmer and a contract holder under the Tir Gofal environmental scheme. I note with some concern that there has not been a contribution to this debate from the largest party in the

These are major and necessary changes. Therefore, it is more important than ever that the Minister and the Government listen to the industry. According to the feedback that I have received, farmers have already had a number of opportunities to feed into the changes. One thing that has certainly become apparent is that environmental groups want to move forward as soon as possible with the new system. Individuals and the unions have had plenty of opportunity to feed into the process, and I know that their input is crucial.

Brynle Williams *rose*—

Nerys Evans: We all acknowledge the important work being undertaken on farms across Wales on a daily basis. It is farmers who are on the front line and who understand the implications of the system and of any changes to that system. It is natural, therefore, that there should be concern. To endorse the comments made by Rhodri Glyn, I acknowledge that the Minister has been very willing to adapt the schemes in line with the comments and evidence submitted as part of the extensive consultation undertaken.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Brynle, I do not think that she is giving way, despite the fact that you are such a handsome gentleman. [*Laughter.*]

Nerys Evans: I would like to ask the Minister for confirmation that the consultation process will continue and that she will consider any comments made. In closing, I would like to say that I have great faith that the Minister and the Government will get to grips with the changes in a way that not only takes account of the impact on the daily lives of farmers, but has an eye on the future and the need to sort out specific funding issues now in order to ensure future stability in this area.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Mae'n bleser siarad yn y ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, er fy mod yn datgan buddiant a minnau'n ffermwr ac yn dal contract o dan gynllun amgylcheddol Tir Gofal. Nodaf gyda pheth pryder na chafwyd cyfraniad at y ddadl hon gan y blaid fwyaf yn y Siambr. Fel ffermwr, mae hynny'n achosi

Chamber. As a farmer, that causes me some concern because, as the Minister highlighted in her opening remarks, this is a considerable remodelling of support for the rural community, in both an environmental and agricultural sense. I think that the Minister mentioned the sum of £100 million in total, which reflects how important this debate is and how important it is that the concerns raised are addressed by the Minister in the Chamber.

Many Members have touched on the challenging timeframe. Many farmers have approached me over the last week or 10 days to say that they are unhappy with the timeframe within which they must indicate whether they wish to enter the scheme. Many are supportive of the strands that are being offered via the scheme, but they would greatly appreciate a greater supply of information. Many of these farmers will be making considerable financial sacrifices by choosing to look at the environmental and conservation aspects of their business rather than sourcing income from the market. Their decisions will be based on the information that the Government and the Minister's officials will give them.

The debate today, as I understand it, is about noting that the Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government are seeking the support of the European Union in addressing the aspiration of the Glastir scheme. I think that that is the motion for debate on today's agenda. We are but at a stage. I hope that European Union officials are listening to this debate and will also raise some of the serious concerns that have been expressed to Members by constituents and people on both sides of the fence—the environmental side and the agricultural side. The timeframe is exceedingly tight and, as the Rural Development Sub-committee has identified, given the concerns expressed by the groups that are mentioned in the opening paragraph of that letter, it is not one voice that is saying that this is an issue, but many voices. I hope that when the Minister responds to the debate this afternoon, she will be able to address the issue of the time constraints.

On the removal of the Tir Mynydd payments that have historically provided financial

cryn bryder i mi oherwydd, fel y pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, mae hyn yn ailfodelu sylweddol ar gymorth i'r gymuned wledig, yn amgylcheddol ac yn amaethyddol. Credaf mai £100 miliwn yn gyfan gwbl oedd y swm a grybwyllwyd gan y Gweinidog, ac mae hynny'n adlewyrchu mor bwysig yw'r ddadl hon ac mor bwysig ydyw i'r pryderon a godir gael eu hateb gan y Gweinidog yn y Siambr.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi crybwyll yr amserlen anodd. Mae llawer o ffermwyr wedi dod ataf yn yr wythnos neu 10 diwrnod diwethaf i ddweud eu bod yn anhapus â'r amserlen a ganiatawyd iddynt nodi a ydynt yn dymuno ymuno â'r cynllun. Mae llawer yn gefnogol i'r elfennau a gynigir drwy'r cynllun, ond byddent yn gwerthfawrogi'n fawr cael mwy o wybodaeth. Bydd llawer o'r ffermwyr hyn yn gwneud cryn aberth ariannol wrth ddewis edrych ar agweddau amgylcheddol eu busnes ac agweddau'n ymwneud â chadwraeth yn hytrach na chael eu hincwm o'r farchnad. Byddant yn seilio'u penderfyniadau ar y wybodaeth a roddir iddynt gan y Llywodraeth a swyddogion y Gweinidog.

Byrdwn y ddadl heddiw, yn ôl a ddeallaf, yw nodi bod y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ceisio cefnogaeth yr Undeb Ewropeaidd i gyflawni dyhead y cynllun Glastir. Credaf mai dyna'r cynnig sydd i'w drafod ar yr agenda heddiw. Ar ganol y broses yr ydym. Gobeithio bod swyddogion yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn gwrandao ar y ddadl hon ac y codant hefyd rai o'r pryderon difrifol sydd wedi'u mynegi i Aelodau gan etholwyr a phobl ar y naill ochr a'r llall i'r ffens—yr ochr amgylcheddol a'r ochr amaethyddol. Mae'r amserlen yn eithriadol o dynn ac, fel y nododd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig, o ystyried y pryderon a fynegir gan y grwpiau a enwir ym mharagraff cyntaf y llythyr hwnnw, nid un llais sydd yn dweud bod hyn yn broblem, ond llawer o leisiau. Gobeithio, pan ymateba'r Gweinidog i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma, y bydd yn gallu delio â mater y cyfyngiadau amser.

O ran dileu'r taliadau Tir Mynydd sydd yn hanesyddol wedi darparu cymorth ariannol i

support for farmers who farm in harsh climates, I would be grateful if the Minister could indicate what sort of modelling and impact work has been undertaken to ascertain the level of support that farmers will need to be able to acquire under Glastir. Many endure severe disadvantage in their everyday farming and have been supported by Tir Mynydd in the past. They need to have confidence that the Government has used appropriate modelling to arrive at the 20 per cent increase in payments that the Minister has included in her top-up for people in the LFA. I have been led to believe that that information has not been forthcoming, and there are serious concerns as to the robustness of the work that the Government has put in to justify the 20 per cent top-up.

4.40 p.m.

Many Members have touched on the impact of the withdrawal of the capital works. As I said in my declaration at the start of my contribution, I have seen many small businesses that have been set up via the Tir Gofal capital works operation, many of which are rural businesses that have relied on the capital element of Tir Gofal to sustain them through many a difficult clime. It is important that farmers and businesses understand how they will be able to access support via the capital works element. This will mean sustaining the many small businesses that rely on that element of Tir Gofal, as currently constructed, to ensure that they have confidence to invest in the future, and in order to safeguard employment in rural areas.

In her opening remarks, the Minister touched on the fact that she hoped to be able to give more information on the higher tier of Glastir at the end of April. I welcome having a date to work to, but it is regrettable on another count, because it is an aspect that farmers need to understand. The base level is the entry to the higher level, and if you have only half of the information to date, it is hard to formulate an opinion as to how the overall scheme will sit in your business. For some businesses, this is critical and can make the difference between their surviving and falling foul of the economic climate.

ffermwyr sy'n ffermio mewn hinsawdd galed, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog nodi pa fath o waith modelu ac effaith sydd wedi'i wneud i ganfod pa lefel o gymorth y bydd ar ffermwyr angen gallu ei gael o dan Glastir. Mae llawer yn dioddef anfantais ddifrifol yn eu ffermio beunyddiol ac maent wedi cael cymorth gan Tir Mynydd yn y gorffennol. Mae angen ennyn hyder ynddynt fod y Llywodraeth wedi defnyddio modelu priodol i bennu'r cynnydd 20 y cant mewn taliadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i gynnwys yn ei swm atodol i bobl yn yr ardal lai ffafriol. Yr wyf wedi cael ar ddeall nad yw'r wybodaeth honno wedi bod ar gael, ac mae pryderon difrifol ynglŷn â chadernid y gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi'i wneud i gyfiawnhau'r 20 y cant atodol.

Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi crybwyll effaith tynnu'r gwaith cyfalaf allan. Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad ar ddechrau fy nghyfraniad, yr wyf wedi gweld llawer o fusnesau bach sydd wedi'u sefydlu drwy raglen gwaith cyfalaf Tir Gofal, llawer ohonynt yn fusnesau gwledig sydd wedi dibynnu ar elfen cyfalaf Tir Gofal i'w cynnal drwy sawl cyfnod anodd. Mae'n bwysig i ffermwyr a busnesau ddeall sut y byddant yn gallu cael cymorth drwy'r elfen gwaith cyfalaf. Bydd hyn yn golygu cynnal y busnesau bach niferus sy'n dibynnu ar yr elfen honno o Tir Gofal, fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, i sicrhau bod ganddynt hyder i fuddsoddi yn y dyfodol, ac er mwyn diogelu cyflogaeth mewn ardaloedd gwledig.

Yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at y ffaith ei bod yn gobeithio gallu rhoi mwy o wybodaeth am haen uwch Glastir ddiwedd Ebrill. Yr wyf yn croesawu cael dyddiad i weithio tuag ato, ond mae'n destun gofid o'r ochr arall, oherwydd y mae'n agwedd y mae angen i ffermwyr ei deall. Y lefel sylfaenol yw'r mynediad i'r lefel uwch, ac os mai dim ond hanner y wybodaeth sydd gennych hyd yma, mae'n anodd barnu sut y gwnaiff y cynllun cyfan weithio yn eich busnes. I rai busnesau, mae hyn yn allweddol a gall wneud y gwahaniaeth rhwng goroesi a mynd i drybini oherwydd yr hinsawdd economaidd.

I appreciate that the clock is against me, Presiding Officer, but I also want to raise a concern about the dual occupancy of land. This is critical because, as the Minister highlighted, we are going into a window of great change in relation to the support payments that farmers and land-based businesses will receive over the next decade, given the reform of the single farm payment. It is critical that people, when making decisions as to whether they will be occupying the land, are in possession of as much information as possible if the regulation is to be enforced in Wales. I understand from the Rural Development Sub-Committee's letter that England and Scotland have chosen not to enforce that regulation, so I implore the Minister to explain why it will be enforced in Wales, because not only has Glastir been reformed, but the single farm payment, through to 2013, will be the subject of major reform as well.

Y Gweinidog dros Faterion Gwledig (Elin Jones): Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu sylwadau, a diolch i Brynle Williams am ei gefnogaeth i egwyddor y cynllun. Serch hynny, yn ei frawddeg gyntaf, ac yn sylwadau Kirsty Williams, rhoddwyd ychydig o gamargraff ynglŷn â'r honiad bod yn rhaid i ffermwyr benderfynu yn yr wythnosau nesaf, cyn cyflwyno'r ffurflenni IACS ym mis Mai, a ydynt am fod yn rhan o Glastir ai peidio. Mae'r ffurflen IACS ar gyfer mis Mai eleni yn gofyn i ffermwyr ddangos eu diddordeb mewn bod yn rhan o Glastir. Byddwn yn annog unrhyw ffarmwr sydd â rhywfaint o ddiddordeb mewn bod yn rhan o Glastir yn 2012 i roi tic yn y bocs hwnnw er mwyn dangos diddordeb. Os na wnewch chi hynny ym mis Mai eleni, ni fydd cyfle tan 2013 i fod yn rhan o Glastir. Serch hynny, drwy roi tic yn y bocs hwnnw, ni fyddwch yn ymrwmo eich hunain i Glastir; bydd proses yn cael ei chynnal yn nes ymlaen yn y flwyddyn, erbyn diwedd mis Tachwedd, pan fydd ffermwyr yn gorfod gwneud cais ffurfiol i fod yn rhan o Glastir. Yna, bydd trafodaethau'n cael eu cynnal yn 2011 gyda swyddogion er mwyn dod i gytundeb ffurfiol gyda'r Llywodraeth ai peidio. Felly, dim ond bryd hynny y bydd angen ymrwymiad penodol gan ffermwyr. Os oes gan ffermwyr ddiddordeb, mae angen iddynt roi tic yn y

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y cloc yn fy erbyn, Lywydd, ond mae arnaf eisiau codi pryder hefyd ynglŷn â deiliadaeth ddeuol ar dir. Mae hyn yn hollbwysig oherwydd, fel y pwysleisiodd y Gweinidog, yr ydym ar fin cyfnod o newid mawr y ran y taliadau cymorth a gaiff ffermwyr a busnesau'r tir dros y degawd nesaf, yn sgîl diwygio'r taliad sengl. Mae'n hollbwysig i bobl, wrth wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch a fyddant yn dal y tir, gael cymaint o wybodaeth ag sy'n bosibl os yw'r rheoliad i gael ei weithredu yng Nghymru. Deallaf yn ôl llythyr yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig fod Lloegr a'r Alban wedi dewis peidio â gorfodi'r rheoliad hwnnw, felly ymbiliaf ar y Gweinidog i esbonio pam y caiff ei orfodi yng Nghymru, oherwydd nid yn unig y mae Glastir wedi'i ddiwygio, ond bydd y taliad sengl, hyd at 2013, yn destun diwygio mawr hefyd.

The Minister for Rural Affairs (Elin Jones): I thank Members for their comments, and I thank Brynle Williams for his support for the principle of the scheme. However, in his first sentence, and in the comments made by Kirsty Williams, there was some misinterpretation regarding the presumption that farmers have to decide in the next few weeks, before submitting the IACS form in May, whether they want to enter Glastir or not. The IACS form for this May requires farmers to express whether they have an interest in entering Glastir. I would encourage any farmer who is even slightly interested in accessing Glastir in 2012 to tick that particular box in order to express an interest. If they do not do that in May of this year, there will not be an opportunity until 2013 to access Glastir. However, having ticked that box, farmers will not be committing themselves to entering Glastir; there will be a process later in the year, by the end of November, through which farmers will have to make a formal application to enter Glastir. Discussions will then be held with officials in 2011 in order to establish a formal agreement with Government or not. Therefore, it is only at that point that farmers will need to make a specific commitment. If farmers have an interest, however, they need to tick that box, without making a

bocs, heb ymrwymiad, ym mis Mai eleni.

Cyfeiriwyd at rai o'r presgripsiynau unigol yn y cynllun ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Dros yr wythnosau nesaf, os oes gan Aelodau sylwadau penodol am Glastir y maent wedi'u clywed gan aelodau'r diwydiant neu gan bobl y maent wedi siarad â hwy ynglŷn â beth y gellid ei newid yn y cynllun er mwyn ei wneud yn fwy ymarferol i ffermwyr, mae croeso iddynt gysylltu â mi.

Cyfeiriodd Brynle Williams at y coridor 4m ar hyd cloddiau, sydd o bosibl yn broblematic yn ymarferol i nifer o ffermwyr. Gwrandewais ar y sylw hwnnw ac fe'i clywais o rai cyfeiriadau eraill, felly byddwn yn rhoi ystyriaeth bellach iddo.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn ac Andrew R.T. Davies at y taliadau deuol. Wrth gyflwyno Glastir, yr wyf wedi gwneud y penderfyniad na fydd dau berson yn cael hawlio dau gynllun gwahanol ar gyfer yr un darn o dir. Mae Llys Archwilwyr Ewrop wedi dweud nad yw hynny'n dderbyniol, felly penderfynais na fyddai hynny'n dderbyniol yng Nghymru bellach, o gyflwyno Glastir. Mae'r un gofyniad ar yr Alban ac ar Loegr, ond mater i'r Gweinidogion yno yw penderfynu cydymffurfio â hwnnw neu beidio. Felly, o ran y cytundebau tenantiaeth, bydd angen i'r tenant a'r landlord drafod pwy fydd yn gwneud yr hawliad a sut y caiff ei adlewyrchu yn y rhent.

Cododd Brynle gwestiwn y byddaf yn ei ystyried, sef beth fyddai'n digwydd pe bai amgylchiadau'r landlord yn newid, er enghraifft, pe bai marwolaeth yn y teulu? Beth fyddai'r sefyllfa yn yr achos hwnnw pe bai'r tenant eisoes wedi ymrwymo i gytundebau pump a 10 mlynedd gyda Glastir? Mae angen inni feddwl ymhellach ynghylch hynny a rhoi arweiniad i ffermwyr.

Bydd manylion yr elfen uwch ar gael erbyn diwedd mis Ebrill, gan eu bod eisoes yn cael eu trafod gan undebau amaethyddol ac eraill. Gan nad oes gofyniad ar ffermwyr i wneud cais ffurfiol tan fis Tachwedd, bydd digon o gyfle iddynt edrych ar y ddwy elfen gyda'i gilydd i benderfynu a ydynt yn dymuno mynd i mewn i Glastir ai peidio.

commitment, in May of this year.

Reference has been made to individual prescriptions within the all-Wales scheme. Over the next few weeks, if Members have received representations about Glastir from the industry or from people that they have talked to about what could be changed within the scheme in order to make it more practical for farmers, they are welcome to contact me.

Brynle Williams referred to the 4m corridor along hedgerows, which is potentially a practical problem for many farmers. I listened to that comment and I have heard it from other quarters, so I will give further consideration to that.

Rhodri Glyn and Andrew R.T. Davies referred to dual payments. In introducing Glastir, I have taken the decision that two people will not be allowed to claim under two different schemes for the same piece of land. The European Court of Auditors has stated that that is not acceptable, and so I decided that it would no longer be acceptable in Wales, when introducing Glastir. The same requirement is in place in Scotland and England, but it is a matter for the Ministers there to decide whether to comply with that. Therefore, on the tenancy agreements, the tenant and the landlord will need to discuss who is to make the claim and how that is to be reflected in the rent.

Brynle raised a question that I will consider, namely, what would happen should the landlord's circumstances change, for example, as a result of a family bereavement? What would be the situation if the tenant had already committed to five and 10-year agreements with Glastir? We need to give this some further thought and provide guidance to farmers.

The details of the higher tier will be available by the end of April, as they are already being discussed by farmers' unions and others. As farmers are not required to make a formal application until November, there will be plenty of opportunity for them to look at both tiers to decide whether they want to enter Glastir.

Bu sawl cyfeiriad at y gwaith grant cyfalaf a'r ffaith nad oes grant cyfalaf penodol yn elfen Cymru gyfan y rhaglen. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na fydd ffermwyr yn gwneud gwaith er mwyn cael y pwyntiau o dan yr elfen Cymru gyfan. Bydd angen contractwyr ac yn y blaen i wneud y gwaith hwnnw ar eu cyfer. Fodd bynnag, o dan y cynllun uwch sydd wedi'i dargedu, bydd rhaglen fawr o blannu coed a chynlluniau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, bydd cynlluniau ar gyfer muriau cerrig ac yn y blaen. Felly, bydd y rhaglen yn un sylweddol, a bydd yn denu contractwyr i wneud y gwaith hwnnw o fewn y cynllun Glastir yn ei ehangder.

Mae'n wir dweud mai gwaith sydd ar droed yw Glastir ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am hynny. Mae'n ddarn mawr o waith ac yn newid cyfeiriad i'r Llywodraeth. Derbyniaf ei fod yn her gorfod newid o sefyllfa o gael o leiaf bedwar cynllun amaeth-amgylcheddol i un yn unig. Mis Mawrth 2010 yw hi yn awr, ac yn 2012 y bydd y cynllun hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno. Mae rhaglen sylweddol o drafod ac o siarad rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r ffermwyr, ac felly bydd y wybodaeth a'r ddealltwriaeth yn cynyddu wrth i'r wythnosau a'r misoedd fynd yn eu blaen. Byddaf yn falch o gynnwys y Cynulliad yn y drafodaeth honno ac i'w 'ypdetio' yn ôl yr angen.

Y Llywydd: Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog—yn enwedig am yr 'ypdetio'. [*Chwerthin.*] Y cwestiwn yw ein bod yn cytuno ar welliant 1. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Mae'n siŵr bod. Oes, gwelaf fod, felly gohiriwn y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Y Llywydd: Mae'n bleser gennyf goesawu'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn ei hôl. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (Rosemary Butler) i'r Gadair am 4.49 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer (Rosemary Butler) took the Chair at 4.49 p.m.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Good afternoon, everyone. What is all this? It is not my birthday. [*Laughter.*]

There were a number of references to the capital grant works and the fact that there is no specific capital grant in the all-Wales element of the programme. However, that does not mean that farmers will not be doing work to score points under the all-Wales element. Contractors and so on will be needed to undertake that work on their behalf. However, under the higher scheme, which is targeted, there will be an extensive tree-planting programme and renewable energy schemes. In some areas, there will be stone-walling schemes and so on. Therefore, the programme will be substantial, and it will attract contractors to carry out that work within the Glastir scheme more widely.

It is true to say that Glastir is a work in progress. I do not apologise for that. It is a major piece of work and represents a change of direction for the Government. I accept that moving from a situation of having at least four agri-environment schemes to having just one will be a challenge. It is now March 2010, and this scheme will be introduced in 2012. There is an extensive programme of discussion and talks between the Government and the farmers, and therefore the information and the understanding will increase as the weeks and months pass. I will be pleased to include the Assembly in that discussion and to update it as required.

The Presiding Officer: I thank the Minister—particularly for the 'ypdetio'. [*Laughter.*] The question is that amendment 1 be agreed to. Are there any objections? I am sure that there are. Yes, I see that there are, so we will defer voting until voting time.

The Presiding Officer: It is a pleasure to welcome the Deputy Presiding Officer back to where she belongs. [*Applause.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Prynawn da, bawb. Beth yw hyn i gyd? Nid yw'n ben-blwydd arnaf. [*Chwerthin.*]

Twristiaeth Tourism

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Alun Cairns.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Alun Cairns.

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones): Cynigiau fod

The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones): I move that

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

the National Assembly for Wales:

yn cydnabod cyfraniad twristiaeth i les economaidd, cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac amgylcheddol Cymru, a'r rhan y mae'n ei chwarae o ran gwella enw da Cymru yn y byd. (NDM4432)

acknowledges the contribution that tourism makes to the economic, social, cultural and environmental wellbeing of Wales, and the role that it plays in enhancing Wales's reputation in the world. (NDM4432)

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a chroeso yn ôl. Heddiw, yr wyf am fachu ar y cyfle i drafod sut y mae twristiaeth yn dod â budd i bob rhan o gymdeithas, a'r rhan y mae yn ei chwarae wrth wella enw da Cymru yn rhyngwladol.

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer, and welcome back. Today I want to take the opportunity to discuss the ways in which tourism provides benefits across society and the role that it plays in enhancing Wales's reputation internationally.

Yn ogystal â'r lles economaidd amlwg, yr wyf am drafod y budd cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac amgylcheddol a ddaw yn sgîl twristiaeth. Maent yn fuddion sy'n gallu gwella ansawdd ein bywydau, cefnogi cyfleusterau a gwasanaethau sydd o les i'r gymuned gyfan, a chynnig ysbrydoliaeth artistig a diwylliannol.

As well as the obvious economic benefits, I want to explore the social, cultural and environmental benefits of tourism. They are benefits that improve our wellbeing and quality of life, support facilities and services that benefit the whole community, and provide artistic and cultural inspiration.

4.50 p.m.

Mae'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn sector allweddol yng Nghymru. Mae'n cyfrannu tua £3.5 biliwn i'r economi ac yn cyflogi rhwng 70,000 a 100,000 o bobl yn ystod y tymor brig. Mae'n cynnig swyddi amrywiol sy'n agored i bawb, yn hen neu'n ifanc, yn ddynion neu'n ferched. Nid yw'r swyddi hyn wedi'u cyfyngu i rannau penodol o Gymru yn yr un modd â swyddi mewn sectorau eraill; yn hytrach, maent wedi'u gwasgaru ym mhob rhan o'r wlad. Yn wahanol i lawer o sectorau eraill, ni allwch adleoli swyddi yn y maes twristiaeth i wledydd eraill sydd â chostau llafur is. Felly, mae gallu'r diwydiant twristiaeth i greu swyddi a chynhyrchu incwm yn golygu ei fod yn gwneud llawer i gynnal ein heconomi yn ystod y dirwasgiad, ac i'w thyfu ar ôl i'r dirwasgiad ddod i ben.

The tourism industry is a key sector for Wales. It contributes around £3.5 billion to the economy and employs between 70,000 and 100,000 people at the peak of the season. It offers a variety of jobs that are accessible to all—to young and old, to men and women. These jobs are not concentrated in certain parts of Wales like the jobs in other sectors; they are spread right across the country. Unlike many other sectors, jobs in tourism cannot be relocated to countries that have lower labour costs. Therefore, the tourism industry's ability to create jobs and income makes it a major contributor in sustaining our economy during recession, and growing it thereafter.

Mae twristiaeth hefyd yn sector allweddol i lawer o'n cymunedau gwledig. Mae ei gallu i greu swyddi yn cadw rhai pobl ifanc yng nghefn gwlad, yn cadw cymunedau gwledig yn hyfyw ac, mewn llawer o ardaloedd, yn rhoi cynhaliaeth i deuluoedd Cymraeg eu hiaith hefyd. Mae datblygiadau cyffrous wedi digwydd, gan gynnwys gwyliau fferm, beicio, cerdded, marchogaeth a physgota, ac mae nifer gynyddol o wyliau bwyd a gwyliau eraill yn cael eu cynnal ym mhob rhan o gefn gwlad.

O ran adfywio, mae twristiaeth yn creu cyfleoedd i adfywio economïau lleol a rhanbarthol, a gwella cyfleusterau a'r amgylchedd. Yng Nghymru, mae gwaith adfywio'n mynd rhagddo'n gyflym, yn arbennig drwy ein rhaglen ardal adfywio strategol, sy'n darparu llawer o brosiectau twristiaeth ledled y wlad. Mae'r rhain yn helpu i drawsnewid ein hen ardaloedd diwydiannol ac i adfywio cymunedau sydd wedi dioddef yn sgîl colli llawer o swyddi.

Gall twristiaeth hefyd chwarae rhan bwysig drwy addysgu ymwelwyr a phobl leol, gan wella'u dealltwriaeth o Gymru. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gwelwyd tuedd gynyddol i atyniadau i ymwelwyr fod yn fwy na phethau i'w gweld yn unig. Yn rhannol, mae hyn yn deillio o'r ffaith bod ymwelwyr erbyn hyn yn fwy chwilfrydig a'u bod am gael mwy allan o'r profiad nag ymweliad yn unig. Mae offer dehongli'n cael ei ddefnyddio fwyfwy i ddod â hanes, diwylliant, y celfyddydau, gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg yn fyw. Mae hynny'n gwneud ymweliadau yn fwy diddorol i fyfyrwyr a disgyblion fel ei gilydd. Yr wyf am inni adrodd ein straeon mewn modd llawer mwy lliwgar a chyffrous, gan ddefnyddio'r dechnoleg ddiweddaraf i'w llawn botensial. Yn ôl yr adroddiadau yr wyf wedi'u cael, mae Casgliad y Bobl yn cynnig posibiliadau cyffrous yn hynny o beth.

O ran iechyd, mae twristiaeth yn gwneud llawer i gyfrannu at fywydau iachach. Mae gan Gymru lawer o leoliadau sy'n ddelfrydol ar gyfer ystod o weithgareddau awyr agored, gan gynnwys cerdded, beicio, beicio mynydd, a chwaraeon dŵr. Mae hyrwyddo'r gweithgareddau hyn a gwella cyfleusterau yn

Tourism is also a key sector for many of our rural communities. Its ability to create jobs keeps young people in the countryside, helps to keep rural communities viable and, in many areas, provides support to Welsh-speaking families. There have been some exciting developments, including farm-based holidays, cycling, walking, horse-riding and fishing, and a growing number of food and other festivals are being held throughout the countryside.

On regeneration, tourism creates opportunities for the regeneration of local and regional economies, and for improving the facilities and the environment. In Wales, regeneration work is moving forward apace, especially through our strategic regeneration area programme, which is delivering many tourism projects across the country. These help to transform our old industrial landscapes and revive communities hit by heavy job losses.

Tourism can also play an important role in educating and informing visitors and locals, thereby improving their understanding of Wales. There has been an increasing trend over the past few years for visitor attractions to be more than just something to look at. That is partly driven by visitors becoming more discerning and looking for more of an experience and understanding than just a visit. Increasingly, interpretative tools are being used at our attractions to bring history, culture, the arts, science and technology alive. That makes visits more interesting for students and pupils alike. I want us to tell our story in a much more colourful and exciting way, using the latest technology to its full potential. According to the reports that I have received, the People's Collection offers exciting opportunities in that regard.

Turning to health, tourism offers many opportunities that contribute to healthier lifestyles. Wales boasts ideal locations for a range of outdoor activities including walking, cycling, mountain biking and water sports. Promoting these activities and making improvements to facilities encourage more

annog mwy o bobl i wneud ymarfer corff. Gall hyn yn ei dro wella iechyd trigolion lleol ac ymwelwyr fel ei gilydd.

people to get active and can help to improve the health of residents and visitors alike.

Yn yr un modd â sectorau eraill, mae gan dwristiaeth ran bwysig i'w chwarae i wneud yn siŵr ein bod yn byw bywydau mwy cynaliadwy. Er bod twristiaeth gynaliadwy yn golygu llawer mwy na diogelu'r amgylchedd yn unig, gall chwarae rhan bwysig wrth ddiogelu ein bywyd gwyllt a'n tirweddau, sef yr hyn y mae ymwelwyr yn aml yn dod yma i'w mwynhau. Gall hefyd ddiogelu ein treftadaeth adeiledig: ein cestyll, ein capeli, ein hetifeddiaeth ddiwydiannol, a safleoedd hanesyddol eraill ledled Cymru. Yn ogystal, gall ymweliadau â chefn gwlad ac atyniadau treftadaeth helpu i godi ymwybyddiaeth o gadwraeth amgylcheddol, gan wneud pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o werth yr atyniadau hyn a pha mor fregus ydynt.

Like other sectors, tourism has an important part to play in ensuring that we live more sustainable lives. Although sustainable tourism is much more than simply protecting the environment, it can play an important part in protecting our wildlife and our landscapes, which tourists often come here to enjoy. It can also protect our built heritage: our castles, chapels, industrial legacy sites, and other historic sites across Wales. Visits to the countryside and our heritage attractions can also help to raise awareness of environmental conservation, and make people more aware of the value and vulnerability of attractions.

Tourism provides a substantial proportion of the money that supports our heritage and culture. Where local culture is the basis for entertaining tourists, it helps to preserve local traditions and handicrafts that might otherwise be lost for ever. Our cultural tourism product gives opportunities for us, the people of Wales, to learn more of Wales's history and culture, and encourages us to conserve and promote it. In turn, this can help to spread knowledge of our unique culture throughout the UK and the rest of the world. This unique culture, including our own language, is a major asset in attracting visitors to Wales. As a visitor destination, we face strong competition from around the world, with a growing number of countries looking to exploit their tourism potential.

Daw cyfran sylweddol o'r arian sy'n cefnogi'n treftadaeth a'n diwylliant yn sgîl twristiaeth. Lle y bydd adloniant i dwristiaid yn cael ei seilio ar ddiwylliant lleol, mae'n gymorth i gadw traddodiadau a chrefftau lleol a gollid am byth fel arall. Mae ein twristiaeth ddiwylliannol yn rhoi cyfleoedd inni, bobl Cymru, ddysgu rhagor am ein hanes a'n diwylliant, ac mae'n ein hannog i'w gadw a'i hybu. Yn ei dro, gall hyn fod o gymorth i ledaenu gwybodaeth am ein diwylliant unigryw i bob cwr o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac i weddill y byd. Mae'r diwylliant unigryw hwn, gan gynnwys ein hiaith ein hunain, yn gaffaeliad mawr o ran denu ymwelwyr i Gymru. Fel cyrchfan i ymwelwyr, yr ydym yn wynebu cystadleuaeth gref o bob cwr o'r byd, gan fod mwy a mwy o wledydd yn ceisio manteisio ar eu potensial ym maes twristiaeth.

Our culture and heritage is on show nowhere more than at St Fagans, our second most visited attraction. I was delighted to hear on St David's Day that the museum has cleared the first hurdle in its bid for an £8.7 million lottery grant. Funding of £450,000 has been awarded to develop proposals for a £21 million-worth all-weather revamp of the museum, to transform it into a year-round, world-class visitor attraction that will act as a gateway to our history and culture for tourists visiting Wales. Therefore, using our culture

Nid oes unman yn well na Sain Ffagan am arddangos ein diwylliant a'n treftadaeth. Dyma'n hatyniad mwyaf poblogaidd ond un. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd o glywed Ddydd Gŵyl Dewi fod yr amgueddfa wedi mynd heibio i'r cam cyntaf yn ei chais am grant gwerth £8.7 miliwn gan y loteri. Mae £450,000 wedi'i ddyfarnu i ddatblygu cynigion gwerth £21 miliwn er mwyn ailwampio'r amgueddfa drwy ddatblygu cyfleusterau pob tywydd a'i throï'n atyniad a fydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd. Bydd yn gallu

and heritage can help to give us an edge in attracting visitors.

This brings me on to the vital role of tourism in enhancing Wales's reputation in the world. The experiences that visitors have in Wales and the impressions that they take away are of paramount importance to building the country's reputation. It is Visit Wales's job, working with the industry and other public and third sector bodies, to help to make those experiences and impressions good ones.

Visit Wales cannot be responsible for ensuring that all our visitor accommodation and attractions are the best in the world, or that everyone in Wales gives visitors a friendly welcome. However, it does have a role to play in getting those things at the forefront of the thinking of all who come into contact with our visitors, whether through its work on quality grading, its work on developing a sense of place, or its advice on tourism developments and regeneration projects.

Therefore, how do we get the good stories and messages about Wales out there? Visit Wales does that primarily through television and online campaigns, direct marketing to those who have visited or have shown an interest in visiting Wales, and by delivering an annual programme of activities for tour operators and the relevant media, such as overseas travel writers. Visit Wales was successful in attracting the Travel Media Association of Canada to Wales last week. It was the first time for its convention to be held outside Canada and was a great success.

Our arts bodies also have an important part to play in selling Wales to the world. At any one time, hundreds of works will be on loan to museums and galleries across the globe. In Washington, during my recent visit to America, I attended the Turner to Cézanne: Masterpieces from the Davies Collection exhibition. The tour has generated record

denu ymwelwyr drwy'r flwyddyn gron a bydd yn borth i'n hanes a'n diwylliant i ymwelwyr sy'n dod i Gymru. Felly, gall defnyddio'n diwylliant a'n treftadaeth fod o gymorth i'n rhoi ar flaen y gad o ran denu ymwelwyr.

Daw hynny â mi at rôl hollbwysig twristiaeth o ran gwella enw da Cymru yn y byd. Mae'r profiadau a gaiff ymwelwyr yng Nghymru a'r argraff a gânt yn hollbwysig er mwyn meithrin enw da'r wlad. Gwaith Croeso Cymru, gan weithio gyda'r diwydiant a chyrrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r trydydd sector, yw cynorthwyo i sicrhau bod y profiadau a'r argraffiadau hynny'n rhai da.

Ni all Croeso Cymru fod yn gyfrifol am sicrhau bod ein holl lety a'n holl atyniadau i ymwelwyr gyda'r gorau yn y byd, na bod pawb yng Nghymru'n rhoi croeso cynnes i ymwelwyr. Serch hynny, mae ganddo rôl i'w chwarae o ran sicrhau bod y pethau hynny ar flaen meddwl pawb sy'n dod i gysylltiad â'n hymwelwyr, boed hynny drwy ei waith ar raddio ansawdd, ei waith yn meithrin naws am le, neu ei gyngor am ddatblygiadau ym maes twristiaeth a phrosiectau adfywio.

Felly, sut y mae sicrhau bod y straeon a'r negeseuon da ynglŷn â Chymru'n cyrraedd y byd mawr? Bydd Croeso Cymru'n gwneud hynny'n bennaf drwy ymgyrchoedd ar y teledu ac ar-lein, drwy anfon gwybodaeth yn uniongyrchol at y rhai sydd wedi ymweld â Chymru neu sydd wedi dangos diddordeb mewn gwneud hynny, a thrwy ddarparu rhaglen weithgareddau flynyddol ar gyfer cwmnïau teithio a'r cyfryngau perthnasol, megis awduron teithio dramor. Llwyddodd Croeso Cymru i ddenu Cymdeithas Cyfryngau Teithio Canada i Gymru yr wythnos diwethaf. Dyna'r tro cyntaf iddi gynnwys ei chynhadledd y tu allan i Ganada a bu'n llwyddiant mawr.

Mae gan ein cyrrff ym maes y celfyddydau ran bwysig i'w chwarae hefyd o ran gwerthu Cymru i'r byd. Ar unrhyw adeg, bydd cannoedd o weithiau wedi'u benthg i amgueddfeydd ac orielau ar hyd ac ar led y byd. Yn Washington, yn ystod fy ymweliad ag America yn ddiweddar, ymwelais ag arddangosfa Turner i Cézanne: Gweithiau'r

audiences and excellent media attention so far. This is another example of how we can use art and culture to generate awareness of Wales and potentially convert that into visits.

Many first-time visitors to Wales come to see the major events that we hold. Wales is increasingly being recognised as one of the best locations in the UK for such events. We have already hosted an Ashes cricket test match, premier rugby and football matches, the UK School Games, Wales Rally GB, and other events and, of course, events do not come much bigger than the Ryder Cup. Over the past 10 years, we have shown what can be done in Wales with vision and by working together, and the Ryder Cup presents us with a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to put Wales on the world stage.

Therefore, we have plenty to be optimistic about in relation to how Wales's reputation in the world is being built. That will, of course, depend on getting things right in all the areas that I have touched on today. I am sure that we will be able to do just that, and I hope that you will all join me in supporting this motion.

Alun Cairns: I move the following amendments in my name. Amendment 1: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the lack of priority shown by the Welsh Assembly Government in marketing Wales and developing the 'tourism product'.

Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that Welsh tourism needs to be promoted much more effectively in the UK and overseas markets.

I am grateful to have the opportunity to debate this motion. Given how the Minister

Meistri o Gasgliad Davies. Mae'r daith wedi denu cynulleidfaoedd mwy nag erioed a sylw rhagorol gan y cyfryngau hyd yn hyn. Mae hyn yn enghraifft arall o sut y gallwn ddefnyddio celf a diwylliant i greu ymwybyddiaeth o Gymru ac o bosibl, i drosi hynny'n ymweliadau.

Bydd llawer o'r rhai sy'n ymweld â Chymru am y tro cyntaf yn dod yma i weld y digwyddiadau mawr a gynhaliwn. Mae Cymru'n cael ei chydabod fwyfwy yn un o'r lleoliadau gorau yn y Deyrnas Unedig i gynnal digwyddiadau fel hyn. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cynnal un o gemau prawf criced cyfres y Llundw, gemau rygbi a phêl droed o'r radd flaenaf, Gemau Ysgolion y Deyrnas Unedig, Rali Cymru GB, a digwyddiadau eraill ac, wrth gwrs, nid oes digwyddiad llawer mwy na Chwpan Ryder. Dros y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi dangos yr hyn y gellir ei wneud yng Nghymru o gael gweledigaeth a thrwy gydweithio, ac mae Cwpan Ryder yn cynnig cyfle unwaith mewn oes inni roi Cymru ar lwyfan y byd.

Felly, mae gennym ddigon i fod yn obeithiol yn ei gylch o ran sut y mae enw da Cymru yn y byd yn cael ei feithrin. Bydd hynny, wrth gwrs, yn dibynnu ar sicrhau bod pethau'n iawn ym mhob un o'r meysydd yr wyf wedi sôn amdanynt heddiw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn gallu gwneud yr union beth hwnnw, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwch i gyd yn ymuno â mi i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

Alun Cairns: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu wrth y diffyg blaenoriaeth a ddangoswyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran marchnata Cymru a datblygu'r 'cynnyrch twristiaeth'.

Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod angen hyrwyddo twristiaeth Cymru'n fwy effeithiol o lawer yn y DU ac mewn marchnadoedd tramor.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar o gael y cyfle i ddadlau ynglŷn â'r cynnig hwn. O ystyried y ffordd y

has introduced the motion, there is little that I can disagree with. He talked about the importance of tourism to the economy, to Wales, to our social and cultural benefit, and to our wellbeing, of how it can be used to market Wales, to change outdated images, and to present Wales as a modern, outward-looking nation.

5.00 p.m.

It is right to recognise the importance of tourism in this way. It is one of the fastest growing sectors of the economy, and it could grow even faster with the appropriate strategies, levels of support, and priority from the Welsh Assembly Government. It currently employs 80,000 people. Tourism has some of the smallest yet most dynamic and nimble businesses. They are fast-moving; they can change and respond to the market quicker than most businesses, simply because they have to, to survive. They can be in fashion one year and out of it the next, and the weather and all the other external factors that are beyond their control can also change so quickly. In spite of those difficulties, they still make up 1.2 per cent of the Welsh economy.

This is an area that could be much greater when we consider the fantastic natural resources that we have, and when we consider the cultures, history and heritage that we can present and sell to the United Kingdom and the rest of the world. It genuinely is unique. We can use the language in an extremely positive way. We can present Wales's industrial heritage and its important role in industry, showing how the economy and the landscape have changed alongside presenting the natural resources that are available.

To make all this fit, to make it work, we need an effective strategy, and not only that—we also need the Welsh Assembly Government to accord it priority and the resources that go with it. That is what my argument comes down to. So, given the way in which the Minister has introduced this debate, it is difficult to disagree with what he said about

mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig, nid oes fawr y gallaf anghytuno ag ef. Soniodd am bwysigrwydd twristiaeth i'r economi, i Gymru, i'n budd cymdeithasol a diwylliannol, ac i'n lles, am sut y gellir ei defnyddio i farchnata Cymru, i newid hen ddelweddau'r oes o'r blaen, ac i gyflwyno Cymru fel cenedl fodern sy'n edrych allan ar y byd.

Mae'n iawn cydnabod pwysigrwydd twristiaeth fel hyn. Mae'n un o'r sectorau sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yn yr economi, a gallai dyfu'n gyflymach byth petai gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y strategaethau priodol a phetai'n rhoi'r lefel briodol o gymorth a blaenoriaeth iddo. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'n cyflogi 80,000 o bobl. Ym maes twristiaeth y gwelir rhai o'r busnesau lleiaf ond eto'r rhai mwyaf dynamig a sionc. Maent yn symud yn gyflym; gallant newid ac ymateb i'r farchnad yn gyflymach na'r rhan fwyaf o fusnesau a hynny oherwydd bod yn rhaid iddynt, er mwyn goroesi. Gallant fod yn y ffasiwn un flwyddyn ac yna ar ei hôl hi'r flwyddyn wedyn, ac mae'r tywydd a'r holl ffactorau allanol eraill sydd y tu hwnt i'w rheolaeth hefyd yn gallu newid mor gyflym. Er gwaethaf yr anawsterau hynny, maent yn dal yn 1.2 y cant o economi Cymru.

Dyma faes a allai fod yn fwy o lawer pan ystyriwn yr adnoddau naturiol anhygoel sydd gennym, a phan ystyriwn y diwylliannau, yr hanes a'r dreftadaeth y gallwn eu cyflwyno a'u gwerthu i'r Deyrnas Unedig ac i weddill y byd. Mae'n wirioneddol unigryw. Gallwn ddefnyddio'r iaith mewn ffordd eithriadol o gadarnhaol. Gallwn gyflwyno treftadaeth ddiwydiannol Cymru a'i rôl bwysig ym myd diwydiant, gan ddangos sut y mae'r economi a'r dirwedd wedi newid ochr yn ochr â chyflwyno'r adnoddau naturiol sydd ar gael.

Er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn i gyd yn cydweddu â'i gilydd, er mwyn gwneud i'r peth weithio, mae angen strategaeth effeithiol arnom, ac nid yn unig hynny—mae angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi blaenoriaeth iddi a'r adnoddau sy'n cyd-fynd â hynny. Dyna hanfod fy nadl. Felly, o gofio sut y mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon,

where he would like to go and the aspirations that we hold, but when you come down to the amount of money being made available, that all seems to be just rhetoric, with very little resource to market Wales or to improve the product, and there is little resource to develop the skills. That is why, sadly, the number of visitors to Wales has, in recent years, dropped back. Yes, we accept that the economy has been different during that time, but that is a fantastic opportunity, because while fewer people wanted to travel overseas, our biggest market, the English market, could have more readily come here if we had been prepared to sell ourselves in a positive and outward-looking way.

The roots of the difficulties go back to the winding up of the Wales Tourist Board, which Labour and Plaid Cymru were prepared to champion at the time. It is a cause of regret in the industry. If you talk to the smallest tourism operator up to the largest multinational, you will find that they feel that, when the Wales Tourist Board existed, there was a direct relationship with decision makers and a direct influence on strategy makers. They feel that it really could make a difference to them in developing their product and in marketing and branding Wales appropriately.

In the days of the Wales Tourist Board, countless awards were won in the marketing and branding of Wales. 'Wales: Two hours and a million miles away' is one that jumps out at me. It showed the fantastic beaches of Gower and Pembrokeshire, highlighted that you could be in a city like London or Birmingham during the day and that, by the evening, you could easily be walking on the fantastic natural resources that we have in Wales. That exemplifies the award-winning contributions that, sadly, we do not see now that Visit Wales is part of the civil service.

There is also a need for a much stronger

mae'n anodd anghytuno â'r hyn a ddywedodd ynglŷn ag i ble yr hoffai fynd a'r dyheadau sydd gennym, ond pan ddaw hi at faint o arian a ddarperir, rhethreg yw'r cyfan i bob golwg a dim mwy na hynny, ac ychydig iawn o adnoddau sydd ar gael i farchnata Cymru neu i wella'r cynnyrch, ac ychydig o adnoddau sydd ar gael i ddatblygu'r sgiliau. Dyna, yn anffodus, pam mae nifer y rhai sy'n ymweld â Chymru wedi gostwng yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Ydym, yr ydym yn derbyn bod yr economi wedi bod yn wahanol yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, ond mae hynny'n gyfle gwyach, oherwydd ar adeg pan oedd llai o bobl am deithio dramor, gallai ein marchnad fwyaf, marchnad Lloegr, fod wedi bod yn fwy awyddus i ddod yma, petaem wedi bod yn barod i'n gwerthu'n hunain mewn ffordd gadarnhaol gan edrych allan ar y byd.

Mae gwreiddiau'r anawsterau'n mynd yn ôl i ddirwyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru i ben, ac yr oedd Llafur a Phlaid Cymru'n barod i ddadlau o blaid hynny ar y pryd. Mae'r diwydiant yn gresynu wrth hynny. Os siaradwch â busnesau twristiaeth, o'r lleiaf un hyd at y cwmni amlwladol mwyaf, gwelwch eu bod yn teimlo, pan oedd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru'n bod, fod ganddynt berthynas uniongyrchol â'r rhai a oedd yn gwneud penderfyniadau a bod ganddynt ddylanwad uniongyrchol ar y rhai a oedd yn llunio strategaethau. Maent yn teimlo y gallai wneud gwahaniaeth go iawn iddynt o ran datblygu eu cynnyrch ac o ran marchnata a brandio Cymru'n briodol.

Yn oes Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, enillwyd gwobrau di-rif am farchnata a brandio Cymru. 'Cymru: dwy awr a miliwn o filltiroedd i ffwrdd' yw'r un sy'n aros yn fy nghof. Yr oedd yn dangos traethau bendigedig Penrhyn Gŵyr a sir Benfro, yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith y gallech fod mewn dinas megis Llundain neu Birmingham yn ystod y dydd ac erbyn gyda'r nos, gallech yn rhwydd fod yn cerdded drwy'r adnoddau naturiol bendigedig sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Mae honno'n enghraifft o'r cyfraniadau arobryn nad ydym yn eu gweld, bellach, yn anffodus, a Chroeso Cymru'n rhan o'r gwasanaeth sifil.

Mae angen hefyd inni ddylanwadu llawer

influence to be brought about on VisitBritain, because one of its prime responsibilities is to market Wales overseas. It is not an exclusive responsibility, but it is one of its prime responsibilities. It is important that it markets Wales positively, so that its prime market is not seen as being Stratford-upon-Avon, London, Bath, Edinburgh and even Belfast. Wales should be seen as an important and integral part of that.

I am conscious of the time, madam Dirprwy Lywydd.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Good.

Alun Cairns: There is a need for an effective marketing strategy. There is a need to support small businesses. The section 4 grant scheme was a fantastic opportunity that businesses and the market understood. There is a need to improve product development, in which section 4 grants offered an important opportunity. We need to exploit our natural, cultural and historical resources.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Can you wind up, please?

Alun Cairns: Transport is equally important to Wales and in Wales.

In closing, the Minister mentioned major sporting events. There is a need to co-ordinate these events, as one department looks after major sporting events but a different department looks after tourism. For goodness' sake, let us them bring them all together and have a coherent strategy with the right type of priority and the funding that goes with it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I am obviously out of practice.

Val Lloyd: I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate. The amendments show that the Tories are determined to talk down the real achievements of the tourism industry in Wales. We have already cited some of them, and I hope to cite a few more, which in the year of the Ryder Cup, show that Welsh tourism industry is going from strength to

mwyr ar VisitBritain, oherwydd un o'i brif gyfrifoldebau yw marchnata Cymru dramor. Nid hynny yw ei unig gyfrifoldeb, ond mae'n un o'i brif gyfrifoldebau. Mae'n bwysig iddo farchnata Cymru'n gadarnhaol, fel nad yw'r brif farchnad yn cael ei gweld yn Stratford-upon-Avon, Llundain, Caerfaddon, Caeredin a hyd yn oed Belffast. Dylid gweld Cymru'n rhan bwysig a hanfodol o hynny.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r amser, fadam Dirprwy Lywydd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Da iawn.

Alun Cairns: Mae angen strategaeth marchnata effeithiol. Mae angen cefnogi busnesau bach. Yr oedd y cynllun grantiau adran 4 yn gyfle gwych yr oedd busnesau a'r farchnad yn ei ddeall. Mae angen gwella datblygu'r cynnyrch, ac yr oedd grantiau adran 4 yn cynnig cyfle pwysig yn hynny o beth. Mae angen inni fanteisio ar ein hadnoddau naturiol, diwylliannol a hanesyddol.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A allwch ddirwyn i ben, os gwelwch yn dda?

Alun Cairns: Mae trafnidiaeth yr un mor bwysig i Gymru ac yng Nghymru.

Wrth gloi, soniodd y Gweinidog am ddigwyddiadau chwaraeon o bwys. Mae angen cydlynu'r digwyddiadau hyn, gan fod un adran yn gofalu am ddigwyddiadau chwaraeon o bwys ond bod adran wahanol yn gofalu am dwristiaeth. Er mwyn dyn, gadewch inni ddod â hwy i gyd at ei gilydd a chael strategaeth gydlynol gan roi'r math iawn o flaenoriaeth iddi a'r cyllid sy'n cydfynd â hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n amlwg nad wyf wedi cael digon o ymarfer.

Val Lloyd: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Dengys y gwelliannau fod y Torïaid yn benderfynol o ladd ar lwyddiannau go iawn y diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi sôn am rai ohonynt eisoes, a gobeithiaf sôn am ychydig yn rhagor, sydd, ym mlwyddyn Cwpan Ryder, yn dangos bod diwydiant twristiaeth

strength. Is this a case of yet another uncosted Tory commitment to increase the tourism budget, while neglecting to clarify where the money would come from?

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to Val Lloyd for giving way so early in her speech. Do you think that it is acceptable that the core budget of tourism for promoting Wales is less than it was 10 years ago? We are saying: 'Do not talk about it as a priority unless you are prepared to stack it up with the resources'.

Val Lloyd: My answer to that would be that you have failed to say by how much you would increase this budget and which existing services or programmes you would cut to pay for it. You also cannot claim that the tourism budget is inadequate in Wales, despite year on year growth, while at the same time committing yourself to a programme of deep cuts at a UK level, which would have a huge impact on the money available to support tourism via the Welsh budget.

I believe that the Welsh Assembly Government is committed to supporting the tourism industry and supporting Wales as a tourism destination. The Visit Wales budget has increased year on year since 2006-07, and stands at over £13 million for 2010-11. European funding has provided a huge boost for marketing activities, and marketing by the Assembly Government generated more than £55 million of additional tourism revenue for Wales, far exceeding the target of £6.5 million.

The latest Wales tourism survey highlighted a number of positive points in how Wales is perceived by visitors. The majority of them went away with a very positive impression, with 70 per cent stating that they would definitely visit Wales again, and 86 per cent saying that they would definitely recommend Wales as a place to visit with family and friends. Figures also point to the successes of Welsh food, and the Welsh landscape attracts the highest level of endorsement from visitors.

Cymru yn mynd o nerth i nerth. Ai enghraifft arall eto yw hyn o'r Torïaid yn ymrwymo i gynyddu'r gyllideb twristiaeth, heb ddweud o ble y deuai'r arian?

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Val Lloyd am ildio mor gynnar yn ei haraith. A ydych yn meddwl ei bod yn dderbyniol bod y gyllideb graidd ar gyfer twristiaeth i hyrwyddo Cymru'n llai nag a oedd 10 mlynedd yn ôl? Yr ydym yn dweud: 'Peidiwch â dweud ei bod yn flaenoriaeth onid ydych yn barod i roi adnoddau'n gefn iddi'.

Val Lloyd: Fy ateb i hynny fyddai nad ydych wedi dweud faint o gynnydd a fyddai gennych yn y gyllideb hon a pha wasanaethau neu raglenni y byddech yn eu torri er mwyn talu amdani. Ni allwch honni ychwaith fod y gyllideb ar gyfer twristiaeth yng Nghymru'n annigonol, er iddi dyfu o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall, a chithau ar yr un pryd yn ymrwymo i raglen o doriadau dwfn ar lefel y Deyrnas Unedig, a gâi effaith enfawr ar yr arian a fyddai ar gael i gefnogi twristiaeth drwy gyllideb Cymru

Credaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i gefnogi'r diwydiant twristiaeth ac i gefnogi Cymru fel cyrchfan i dwristiaid. Mae cyllideb Croeso Cymru wedi cynyddu o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall ers 2006-07, ac erbyn hyn mae'n fwy na £13 miliwn ar gyfer 2010-11. Mae arian Ewropeaidd wedi rhoi hwb enfawr i weithgareddau marchnata, a chrëwyd dros £55 miliwn o refeniw twristiaeth ychwanegol i Gymru drwy gyfrwng marchnata gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ymhell y tu hwnt i'r targed sef £6.5 miliwn.

Yn yr arolwg twristiaeth diweddaraf yng Nghymru, tynnwyd sylw at nifer o bwyntiau cadarnhaol o ran sut yr oedd ymwelwyr yn gweld Cymru. Aeth y mwyafrif ohonynt oddi yma wedi cael argraff gadarnhaol iawn. Dywedodd 70 y cant ohonynt y byddent yn sicr yn ymweld â Chymru eto, ac 86 y cant y byddent yn bendant yn argymhell Cymru yn rhywle i ymweld ag ef gyda'r teulu a ffrindiau. Mae'r ffigurau hefyd yn dangos llwyddiannau bwyd Cymru, a thirwedd Cymru sy'n denu'r ganmoliaeth fwyaf gan ymwelwyr.

In my area, the recent reinstatement of the Swansea to Cork ferry service, with support from the Welsh Assembly Government, will bring a welcome boost to visitor numbers and the economy in Swansea. It is estimated that Irish visitors brought around £65 million to the Welsh economy in 2006, and I hope that such figures will be replicated and exceeded in the future.

In 2010 we also mark the bicentenary of the Hafod copper works in my constituency. People who are familiar with the area will know how much potential the site has to be a major local tourist attraction, celebrating Swansea's thriving industrial past. I am aware that officials from the regeneration department are involved in discussions with the City and County of Swansea to explore possible avenues for regenerating the site. There is huge interest in it at a community level, linking with other projects such as the Swansea community boat. I am also delighted that Swansea University is planning to bring the site back to life through a series of computer animations, exhibitions and activities involving local groups. This project has received funding from the Economic and Social Research Council, and will also lead to an exhibition at the National Waterfront Museum next year.

I highlighted that project as only one of a multitude of exciting developments from all over Wales, which I am sure colleagues will highlight in this debate. It shows that the future of Wales's tourism industry is bright, and, rather than making empty political promises, it is a shame that the Tories cannot recognise its potential and achievements.

Mark Isherwood: Tourism is a vital part of the Welsh economy, but the Welsh economy is going backwards. According to the latest Eurostat figures, west Wales and the Valleys are the only part of the UK to fall below the 75 per cent threshold for qualifying for the highest level of EU aid, despite the billions blown by this Welsh Government.

Yn fy ardal i, bydd ailsefydlu'r gwasanaeth fferi rhwng Abertawe a Corc yn ddiweddar, gyda chymorth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn rhoi hwb i'w groesawu o ran y nifer a fydd yn ymweld ag Abertawe ac i'w heconomi. Amcangyfrifir bod ymwelwyr o Iwerddon wedi dod â rhyw £65 miliwn i economi Cymru yn 2006, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio yr ailadroddir y ffigurau hynny, ac y byddant yn uwch, yn y dyfodol.

Yn 2010 byddwn hefyd yn dathlu dau canmlwyddiant gwaith copr yr Hafod yn fy etholaeth. Bydd pobl sy'n gyfarwydd â'r ardal yn gwybod faint o botensial sydd i'r safle hwnnw fod yn atyniad lleol o bwys i dwristiaid, gan ddathlu gorffennol diwydiannol llewyrchus Abertawe. Gwn fod swyddogion yr adran adfywio'n cymryd rhan mewn trafodaethau gyda Dinas a Sir Abertawe i ystyried posibilïadau ar gyfer adfywio'r safle. Mae diddordeb enfawr yn hyn ar lefel y gymuned, gan ei gysylltu â phrosiectau eraill megis cwch cymuned Abertawe. Yr wyf hefyd wrth fy modd bod Prifysgol Abertawe'n bwriadu adfywio'r safle drwy gyfres o animeiddiadau cyfrifiadurol, arddangosfeydd a gweithgareddau'n cynnwys grwpiau lleol. Mae'r prosiect wedi cael nawdd gan y Cyngor Ymchwil Economaidd a Chymdeithasol, a bydd hefyd yn arwain at arddangosfa yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau y flwyddyn nesaf.

Dim ond un o blith nifer fawr o ddatblygiadau cyffrous ym mhob cwr o Gymru, y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau'n sôn amdanynt yn y ddadl hon yr wyf yn siŵr, yw'r prosiect hwnnw. Mae'n dangos bod dyfodol diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru'n obeithiol, ac, yn hytrach na gwneud addewidion gwleidyddol gwag, mae'n bechod na all y Torïaid gydnabod ei botensial a'i lwyddiannau.

Mark Isherwood: Mae twristiaeth yn rhan hanfodol o economi Cymru, ond mae economi Cymru'n mynd tuag yn ôl. Yn ôl ffigurau diweddaraf Eurostat, gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yw'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig i lithro o dan y trothwy o 75 y cant er mwyn bod yn gymwys i gael cymorth ar y lefel uchaf gan yr Undeb

Ewropeaidd, er gwaethaf y biliynau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u gwastraffu.

5.10 p.m.

Tourism generates £1.8 billion for the north Wales economy yearly and supports up to 37,500 jobs. North Wales accounts for 1 per cent of the UK population, but it accounts for 3 per cent of domestic tourism nights. In 2007, the region attracted around 8 million staying visitors and 17 million day visits. However, in the 2009 Visit Wales summer tourism business survey, the Minister stated that

'the Welsh tourism industry has enjoyed a successful summer period'.

However, as the Wales Tourism Alliance has said, this shows that

'making comments about a successful summer season is a rather unwise practice'.

When the statistics were published, they showed that almost one in four self catering units were empty in August, compared with 93 per cent occupancy in August 2007, and that occupancy in touring caravan and camping parks was only 44 per cent. As the Wales Tourism Alliance said:

'When one is trying to impress on a Minister or two that a considerable number of operators are facing massive rate increases and something needs to be done about it, it is not helpful for them to be under the impression that everyone enjoyed a successful summer and could therefore afford to take a hit on their rates bill'.

As we have heard, the general visitor experience in Wales is positive. However, marketing to overseas markets, especially to potential cultural tourists, is weak. Research commissioned by Visit Wales and the Arts Council of Wales said that Wales was

'definitely not seen as a place for city

Mae twristiaeth yn cynhyrchu £1.8 biliwn i economi'r gogledd bob blwyddyn ac yn cynnal hyd at 37,500 o swyddi. Nid yw poblogaeth y gogledd ond yn 1 y cant o boblogaeth y Deyrnas Unedig, eto i gyd, yno y darperir 3 y cant o nosweithiau aros y diwydiant twristiaeth domestig. Yn 2008, denwyd oddeutu 8 miliwn o ymwelwyr i aros yn yr ardal ac 17 miliwn ar ymweliad undydd. Serch hynny, yn arolwg busnesau twristiaeth yr haf Croeso Cymru 2009, dywedodd y Gweinidog:

'Cafodd diwydiant twristiaeth Cymru haf llwyddiannus.'

Serch hynny, fel y mae Cynghair Twristiaeth Cymru wedi dweud, dengys hyn

fod sôn am dymor haf llwyddiannus yn beth annoeth i'w wneud braidd.

Pan gyhoeddwyd yr ystadegau, yr oeddent yn dangos bod un o bob pedair uned hunanddarpar yn wag ym mis Awst, o'i gymharu â chyfradd o 93 y cant yn llawn ym mis Awst 2007, ac mai dim ond 44 y cant oedd y gyfradd ar gyfer meysydd carafannau a gwersylla. Fel y dywedodd Cynghair Twristiaeth Cymru:

Pan fydd rhywun yn ceisio dwyn perswâd ar ambell Weinidog fod nifer sylweddol o fusnesau'n wynebu cynnydd anferth yn eu hardrethi a bod angen gwneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch, nid yw'n gymorth eu bod o dan yr argraff bod pawb wedi cael haf llwyddiannus ac felly y gallent fforddio cael eu colbio yn eu bil ardrethi.

Fel yr ydym wedi clywed, yn gyffredinol, caiff yr ymwelwyr sy'n dod i Gymru brofiad cadarnhaol. Serch hynny, mae'r marchnata mewn marchnadoedd tramor, yn enwedig ymhlith darpar dwristiaid diwylliannol, yn wan. Dywedodd gwaith ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan Croeso Cymru a Chyngor Celfyddydau Cymru nad oedd Cymru

yn bendant yn cael ei gweld yn rhywle i fynd

breaks’.

The reality is that the level of knowledge of Wales and what it has to offer is poor. This is not surprising, given, as we heard, that the Government’s marketing budget is less now than a decade ago.

The Wales Tourism Alliance drew my attention to Colorado, which in 1993 became the only state in the US to eliminate tourism marketing. As a result, Colorado’s domestic market share plunged 30 per cent within two years, representing a loss of over \$1.4 billion in tourism revenue annually. Over time, the revenue loss increased to well over \$2 billion yearly. It took until 2000 for the industry to convince the legislature to reinstate the tourism budget with a modest \$5 million promotion budget, which was upped to \$19 million in 2006. By 2007, travel to Colorado rebounded to an all-time high, with 28 million visitors spending \$9.8 billion. Why am I talking about Colorado? The Colorado saga provides a cautionary tale for decision makers who, in these difficult economic times, are looking at major cutbacks in all areas. It clearly illustrates that marketing is an essential net generator of revenue and not a cost.

Flintshire Tourism Association has asked me to raise the issue of poor broadband speeds to rural tourism businesses. Guests assume that broadband will be available. Leisure tourism guests make extensive use of the internet while on holiday. Business users expect a high broadband speed, and the lack of it will affect their decision on where to spend the night. This must be addressed by the Welsh Government, working with local authorities and the major telecom providers.

Tourism is worth some £166 million per annum to the Flintshire economy. This sustains jobs and supports the rural economy, small and medium-sized enterprises, and community improvements. However,

am wyliau byr mewn dinas.

Y gwir yw bod gwybodaeth am Gymru a’r hyn sydd ganddi i’w gynnig yn wael. Nid yw hynny’n syndod, o gofio, fel y clywsom, fod cyllideb marchnata’r Llywodraeth yn llai yn awr nag a oedd ddegawd yn ôl.

Tynnodd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru fy sylw at Colorado. Yn 1993, hi oedd yr unig dalaith yn yr Unol Daleithiau a benderfynodd roi’r gorau i farchnata twristiaeth. Yn sgîl hynny, gwelwyd gostyngiad o 30 y cant yng nghyfran Colorado o’r farchnad ddomestig o fewn dwy flynedd, sef colli dros \$1.4 biliwn o ran refeniw twristiaeth bob blwyddyn. O dipyn i beth, cynyddodd y refeniw a gollid i ymhell dros \$2 biliwn bob blwyddyn. Ni lwyddodd y diwydiant i ddarbwylllo’r ddeddfwrfa fod angen ailsefydlu’r gyllideb twristiaeth tan 2000 ac yna, darparwyd swm bach o \$5 miliwn ar gyfer hyrwyddo, gan gynyddu hynny i \$19 miliwn yn 2006. Erbyn 2007, yr oedd mwy o bobl nag erioed yn teithio i Colorado, a 28 miliwn o ymwelwyr yn gwario \$9.8 biliwn. Pam yr wyf yn sôn am Colorado? Mae hanes Colorado’n rhybudd i’r rhai sy’n gwneud penderfyniadau, ac sydd, yn y cyfnod economaidd anodd hwn, yn chwilio am doriadau mawr ym mhob maes. Mae’n dangos yn glir mai cyfrwng hanfodol er mwyn cynhyrchu refeniw net yw marchnata, nid cost.

Mae Cymdeithas Twristiaeth Sir y Fflint wedi gofyn imi godi mater arafwch band eang sy’n broblem i fusnesau twristiaeth gwledig. Bydd ymwelwyr yn tybio y bydd band eang ar gael. Bydd ymwelwyr twristiaeth hamdden yn defnyddio’r rhyngwrwyd yn helaeth tra byddant ar eu gwyliau. Bydd defnyddwyr busnes yn disgwyl cael band eang cyflym, ac oni fydd ar gael, bydd hynny’n effeithio ar eu penderfyniad ynglŷn ag ymhle y byddant yn treulio’r nos. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru fynd i’r afael â hyn, gan weithio gyda’r awdurdodau lleol a’r prif ddarparwyr telegyfathrebu.

Mae twristiaeth yn werth tua £166 miliwn y flwyddyn i economi sir y Fflint. Mae hyn yn cynnal swyddi ac yn cefnogi’r economi wledig, mentrau bach a chanolig a gwelliannau yn y gymuned. Serch hynny,

Flintshire Tourism Association told me yesterday that we need to be working far better together, and that, in north-east Wales, we need to improve the north Wales borderlands brand and image, capitalise on the Pontcysyllte world heritage site and work on our cultural, language and welcoming initiative.

Flintshire pulls more visitors from Chester than from Snowdonia, but finds its ability to advertise reduced, and funding from 2011 will be greatly diminished. Flintshire and north-east Wales are within the reach of 15.5 million potential visitors—a bigger pot than even Cardiff can call upon. It needs to be marketed far more in the midlands and the north-west of England.

Tourism operators also emphasise the need for training for better qualified and informed staff and for improved communication skills focused on customer service. If they are to drive forward the tourism industry in Flintshire, north-east Wales and north Wales as a whole, they will need a Minister who acts on market intelligence and not despite it.

Bethan Jenkins: The National Assembly can acknowledge the contribution that tourism makes to the economic, social, cultural and environmental wellbeing of Wales and the role that it plays in enhancing Wales's reputation in the world—and enhance it does, because last week, the annual conference of the Travel Media Association of Canada was held here. It was the first time that it has been held outside Canada, which is something of a coup for Wales. Two other destinations were short-listed for this prestigious event, but Wales won. The main conference took place over five days last week, but there were also tours before and after the event. It is estimated that this will provide coverage for Wales equivalent to £1.5 million of advertising. Yesterday, British Tourism Week was launched at the Celtic Manor Resort, which will again bring Wales to the forefront in the tourism industry. Beyond that, the Ryder Cup at the Celtic Manor

dywedodd Cymdeithas Twristiaeth Sir y Fflint wrthyf ddoe fod angen inni gydweithio'n well o lawer, a bod angen inni wella brand a delwedd ardaloedd y ffin yn y gogledd-ddwyrain, manteisio ar safle treftadaeth y byd ym Mhontcysyllte a gweithio ar ein cynllun treftadaeth, iaith a chroeso.

Mae sir y Fflint yn denu mwy o ymwelwyr o Gaer nag o Eryri, ond mae'n gweld bod ganddi lai o allu i hysbysebu a bydd y cyllid o 2011 ymlaen yn llai o lawer. Mae sir y Fflint a gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru o fewn cyrraedd 15.5 miliwn o ddarpar ymwelwyr—cronfa fwy nag y gall hyd yn oed Caerdydd fanteisio arni. Mae angen marchnata mwy o lawer arni yng nghanolbarth ac yng gogledd-orllewin Lloegr.

Bu cwmnïau twristiaeth yn pwysleisio hefyd fod angen hyfforddi er mwyn sicrhau bod gan staff well cymwysterau a'u bod yn fwy gwybodus ac yn meddu ar well sgiliau cyfathrebu sy'n canolbwyntio ar roi gwasanaeth i gwsmeriaid. Er mwyn sbarduno'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn sir y Fflint, yn y gogledd-ddwyrain ac yn y gogledd drwyddo draw, bydd arnynt angen Gweinidog sy'n gweithredu ar sail gwybodaeth am y farchnad ac nid er gwaethaf y wybodaeth honno.

Bethan Jenkins: Gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gydnabod y cyfraniad y mae twristiaeth yn ei wneud i les economaidd, cymdeithasol, diwylliannol ac amgylcheddol Cymru a'r rôl y mae'n ei chwarae o ran cryfhau enw da Cymru yn y byd—ac mae'n ei gryfhau, oherwydd yr wythnos diwethaf, cynhaliwyd cynhadledd flynyddol Cymdeithas Cyfryngau Teithio Canada yma. Dyna'r tro cyntaf iddi gael ei chynnal y tu allan i Ganada, sy'n dipyn o fuddugoliaeth i Gymru. Rhoddwyd dwy gyrchfan arall ar y rhestr fer ar gyfer y gynhadledd hon sy'n ddigwyddiad o fri, ond Cymru a enillodd. Cynhaliwyd y brif gynhadledd dros bum niwrnod yr wythnos diwethaf, ond trefnwyd teithiau cyn y digwyddiad ac ar ei ôl hefyd. Amcangyfrifir y bydd hyn yn rhoi sylw i Gymru sy'n cyfateb i werth £1.5 miliwn o hysbysebu. Ddoe, lanswyd Wythnos Twristiaeth Prydain yng Ngwesty'r Celtic Manor, a fydd unwaith eto'n sicrhau bod

Resort will be this year's big sporting event, and one of the biggest, if not the biggest, that we have ever had. We have to ensure that the Ryder Cup gives Wales the kind of lift that it received from the Ashes last year, but on a bigger scale, as it is a much bigger event.

Some of the other steps that the Welsh Government has taken to assist our tourism industry are the Sense of Place programme, which I have spoken about in the Siambr before; Historic Environment, which develops key sites according to their historical significance; the Artes Mundi competition in the National Museum Wales, with 65,000 visitors; Caernarfon Castle, which has 180,000 visitors every year, according to Cadw; and the £17.4 million that was allocated for digital marketing products and sustainable and coastal tourism projects. Where do we go from here? I believe that the way forward is to integrate tourism with culture and sport into a package that we present to the world as a whole. Shock horror: I agree with the Tories in that regard. For example, our sports clubs, which often travel abroad, should become business and tourism ambassadors. I met representatives—*[Interruption.]*

Alun Cairns, if you want to say something, could you stand up? You are heckling continuously.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Excuse me. We will just carry on. If he wishes to stand up, then he will.

Bethan Jenkins: He is heckling me continuously.

Last week I met representatives from Glamorgan County Cricket Club, who said that they would like to explore further the possibility of the Welsh Government linking leading figures in sport in India and China with business, and, subsequently, to develop tourism prospects from such links. Similarly, artists should be able to join our big trade

Cymru'n flaenllaw yn y diwydiant twristiaeth. Ar ben hynny, Cwpan Ryder yng Ngwesty'r Celtic Manor fydd y digwyddiad mawr ym myd chwaraeon eleni, ac un o'r rhai mwyaf, os nad y mwyaf sydd wedi dod yma erioed. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod Cwpan Ryder yn rhoi'r un math o hwb i Gymru ag a gafodd yn sgîl cyfres y Llundw y llynedd, ond ar raddfa fwy, am ei fod yn ddigwyddiad mwy o lawer.

Rhai o'r camau eraill y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'u cymryd i gynorthwyo'n diwydiant twristiaeth yw'r rhaglen Naws am Le, yr wyf wedi sôn amdani yn y Siambr o'r blaen: Amgylchedd Hanesyddol, sy'n datblygu safleoedd allweddol yn ôl eu harwyddocâd hanesyddol; cystadleuaeth Artes Mundi yn Amgueddfa Genedlaethol Cymru, sy'n denu 65,000 o ymwelwyr; Castell Caernarfon, sy'n denu 180,000 o ymwelwyr bob blwyddyn, yn ôl Cadw; a'r £17.4 miliwn a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer cynnyrch marchnata digidol a phrosiectau twristiaeth cynaliadwy ac arfordirol. I ble'r awn o'r fan hon? Credwn mai'r ffordd ymlaen yw integreiddio twristiaeth gyda diwylliant a chwaraeon i greu pecyn i'w gyflwyno i'r byd yn grwn. Peidiwch â dychryn: yr wyf yn cytuno â'r Torïaid yn hynny o beth. Er enghraifft, dylai ein clybiau chwaraeon, sy'n aml yn teithio dramor, ddod yn llysgenhadon busnes a thwristiaeth. Cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Alun Cairns, os ydych am ddweud rhywbeth, a allech sefyll? Yr ydych yn ymyrryd yn ddi-baid.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Esgusodwch fi. Ymlaen â ni. Os yw'n dymuno sefyll, fe wnaiff.

Bethan Jenkins: Mae'n torri ar fy nhraws yn ddi-baid.

Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyfarfûm â chynrychiolwyr Clwb Criced Sir Forgannwg. Dywedasant y byddent yn hoffi archwilio rhagor i'r posibilrwydd y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru greu cysylltiad rhwng arweinwyr ym maes chwaraeon yn India a Tsieina a byd busnes, a thrwy'r cysylltiadau hynny, datblygu'r rhagolygon ym maes twristiaeth.

missions on a regular basis, as we suggested in the report of the Communities and Culture Committee, 'Promoting Welsh Arts and Culture on the World Stage'. We could use that as a way of showing the variety of talent that we have on offer in Wales. Again, that could encourage more tourists to come to Wales, with people viewing and experiencing what we have to offer on a cultural level on trade missions, thus inspiring them to visit Wales. Successful businesses such as the Welsh Whisky Company can be used to stimulate tourism, increasing tours to the distillery and links with other countries. That company tells me that its problem at the moment is that it is not part of the big trade missions, because it is seen as too small and too specialist to take part.

We should be alive to the danger of keeping tourism, business and culture in silos. They can all boost one another, and, when we present Wales to the world, we need to point to the variety and quality that we have to offer. I therefore urge the Welsh Government to take up my ideas and combine the work of the departments for tourism, the arts and business, so that Wales can compete on a world stage. I like to think of the Millennium Stadium as an example; we heard evidence during a recent inquiry into International Business Wales and the economic development unit that, although it was built for rugby and football, there are many other things that it can do: host conferences, trade fairs, and all kinds of gigs and musical concerts. Ultimately, we need to think more broadly and creatively. Going back to Glamorgan County Cricket Club, it would like to host concerts of a different style to those on offer at the Millennium Stadium, thus creating another key tourist opportunity for Wales.

Finally, I have one question. Scotland had its tourism week last week, whereas Wales's coincides with Britain's. Would it not be possible in the future for Wales to have a tourism week separate to that of the UK?

Yn yr un modd, dylai artistiaid allu ymuno â'n teithiau masnach mawr yn rheolaidd, fel yr awgrymwyd gennym yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cymunedau a Diwylliant, 'Hyrwyddo Celfyddydau a Diwylliant Cymru ar Lwyfan y Byd'. Gallem ddefnyddio hynny'n fodd i ddangos yr amrywiaeth o dalent sydd gennym i'w gynnig yng Nghymru. Unwaith eto, gallai hynny annog rhagor o dwristiaid i ddod i Gymru, gan y byddai pobl yn gweld ac yn profi'r hyn sydd gennym i'w gynnig ar lefel ddiwylliannol ar deithiau masnach, gan eu hysbrydoli i ymweld â Chymru. Gellir defnyddio busnesau llwyddiannus, megis y Welsh Whisky Company i ysgogi twristiaeth, gan gynyddu nifer y teithiau i ymweld â'r ddistyllfa a chysylltiadau â gwledydd eraill. Mae'r cwmni hwnnw'n dweud wrthyf mai ei broblem ar hyn o bryd yw nad yw'n rhan o'r teithiau masnach mawr, am ei fod yn cael ei ystyried yn rhy fach ac yn rhy arbenigol i gymryd rhan.

Dylem fod yn effro i'r perygl o gadw twristiaeth, busnes a diwylliant ar wahân. Gall pob un ohonynt roi hwb i'w gilydd, ac, wrth inni gyflwyno Cymru i'r byd, mae angen inni ddangos yr amrywiaeth a'r ansawdd sydd gennym i'w cynnig. Felly, pwysaf ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wrando ar fy syniadau a chyfuno gwaith yr adran twristiaeth, adran y celfyddydau a'r adran busnes, er mwyn i Gymru allu cystadlu ar lwyfan y byd. Byddaf yn hoffi meddwl am Stadiwm y Mileniwm yn enghraifft; clywsom dystiolaeth yn ystod ymchwiliad yn ddiweddar i Fusnes Rhyngwladol Cymru a'r uned datblygu economaidd, er iddi gael ei chodi ar gyfer rygbi a phêl-droed, fod llu o bethau eraill y gall eu gwneud; cynnal cynadleddau, ffeiriau masnach, a phob math o gigiau a chyngherddau cerddorol. Yn y pen draw, mae angen inni feddwl yn fwy eang ac yn fwy creadigol. A dychwelyd at Glwb Criced Sir Forgannwg, byddai'n hoffi cynnal cyngherddau gwahanol i'r rhai a gynigir yn Stadiwm y Mileniwm, gan greu cyfle allweddol arall i Gymru ym maes twristiaeth.

Yn olaf, mae gennyf un cwestiwn. Cafodd yr Alban ei hwythnos twristiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae wythnos Cymru'n cyd-daro ag wythnos Prydain. Oni fyddai modd i Gymru gael wythnos twristiaeth ar wahân i wythnos

y Deyrnas Unedig yn y dyfodol?

David Melding: I agree with a lot of what Bethan has just said, and, indeed, with a lot of the points that have been raised today. The question that we ought to look at is not whether we get a reasonable amount of tourists—we do; there is no question about that—but why we are not one of the leading tourist areas in Europe. We need to raise our vision to achieve that.

On economic development, we need to build upon competitive advantage, and, in the area of tourism, there is no doubt that we have it. I do not think that the Government can sweep away the point about marketing quite as conveniently as it has attempted to do. There are issues on both sides. However, we are not spending as much as we did when we were able to put a lot of European funding into it and we need to take things further. I wonder, when the Minister flew to Washington, whether there was any advertising on the flight about Wales and Welsh tourism. That is the sort of clever marketing that we need.

5.20 p.m.

I would like to mention the specific issue of the castles of Wales. I have talked about these in the past, but I would like to discuss a slightly different dimension. I was just making a note of some of our most famous castles and, in the north, there are Conwy, Caernarfon, Beaumaris and Harlech, and, in the south, Chepstow, Caerphilly and Kidwelly. I made that list, because I am not sure that people realise the extent to which these castles are in the premier league of castles in Europe and, therefore, in the world. Conwy and Chepstow were the leading castles—in an awesome and rather terrible way in some respects, looking at this historically—in military technology. They were the most advanced forms of military power at the time. They were the Trident missile, or whatever the replacement for Trident will be if we replace it, of the day. However, I am not quite sure that we convey that to people in Canada and north America, for example, or other parts of Europe. Nor do we convey that Wales has more castles than

David Melding: Yr wyf yn cytuno â llawer o'r hyn y mae Bethan newydd ei ddweud, ac, yn wir, â llawer o'r pwyntiau sydd wedi'u codi heddiw. Y cwestiwn y dylem edrych arno yw nid a ydym yn denu nifer resymol o dwristiaid—yr ydym; nid oes amheuaeth ynglŷn â hynny—ond pam nad ydym yn un o brif ardaloedd twristiaeth Ewrop. Mae angen inni gryfhau ein gweledigaeth er mwyn sicrhau hynny.

O ran datblygu economaidd, mae angen inni adeiladu ar fantais gystadleuol, ac, ym maes twristiaeth, nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r fantais honno gennym. Ni chredaf y gall y Llywodraeth anwybyddu'r pwynt ynglŷn â marchnata mor rhwydd ag y mae wedi ceisio gwneud. Mae ystyriaethau ar y ddwy ochr. Serch hynny, nid ydym yn gwario cymaint ag a oeddem pan oeddem yn gallu defnyddio llawer o arian Ewrop ar ei gyfer ac mae angen inni fynd â phethau ymhellach. Tybed, pan hedfanodd y Gweinidog i Washington, a oedd unrhyw hysbysebu ar yr awyren ynglŷn â Chymru a thwristiaeth Cymru. Dyna'r math o farchnata clyfar y mae ei angen arnom.

Hoffwn sôn am fater penodol cestyll Cymru. Yr wyf wedi sôn am y rhain yn y gorffennol, ond hoffwn drafod dimensiwn ychydig yn wahanol. Yr oeddwn wrthi'n nodi rhai o'n cestyll mwyaf enwog, ac, yn y gogledd, mae gennym Gonwy, Caernarfon, Biwmares a Harlech, ac, yn y de, Cas-gwent, Caerffili a Chydeweli. Rhestrais y rheini oherwydd nid wyf yn siŵr a yw pobl yn sylweddoli i ba raddau y mae'r cestyll hyn ym mhrif gynghrair cestyll Ewrop, ac o'r herwydd, cestyll y byd. Conwy a Chas-gwent oedd y prif gestyll—a hynny mewn ffordd ddychrynlyd ac erchyll braidd weithiau, ac edrych ar hyn o safbwynt hanesyddol—o safbwynt technoleg filwrol. O safbwynt eu grym milwrol, y rhain oedd y mwyaf datblygedig ar y pryd. Hwy oedd arf Trident eu hoes, neu beth bynnag a ddaw yn lle Trident, os cawn rywbeth yn ei le. Serch hynny, nid wyf yn gwbl sicr a ydym yn cyfleu hynny i bobl yng Nghanada ac yng ngogledd America, er enghraifft, neu i rannau eraill o Ewrop. Nid ydym ychwaith yn cyfleu

anywhere else on earth, with the possible exception—and this is disputed—of Palestine, which also had a rough medieval experience of warfare. Unfortunately, that has continued there. There is extensive encastellation in the Palestine and in Wales. Wales was remarkably difficult to subjugate given its population and resources. I wonder whether we could build on this and extend it to other aspects of medieval culture, which are often not terribly well understood. It is an area where you do not see the tourism product at its most advanced, yet it could connect to things such as the eisteddfod tradition, for instance. There may be a chance to build on some of the events that we see occasionally in Caernarfon or Caerphilly castles, for instance.

It is a matter of celebrating this aspect of our culture, not reducing it to a stereotype, because that, Val, is what talks Wales down. These castles are incredible monuments to the history of Wales. The history is not all good, because it was much about subjugation, although the stewards of the castles were soon the leading Welsh families and, therefore, their role was subverted somewhat, but their initial purpose was to extinguish any sense of political independence. We do not hear London saying, 'Perhaps we shouldn't promote red buses, Buckingham Palace or the Tower of London any more, because it is all stereotypical'. They celebrate those things in London, and they really go for it. That brings in a range of tourists; they are not always the type that will go to galleries, but it will attract many people who will also go to galleries. We need to use our best cards to market Wales.

In conclusion, it seems to me that it is the high end of the tourism sector that we need to chase in Canada and the like. It is splendid news that Canadian travel writers have visited; that is exactly what we should be promoting. I give three cheers for that. I was in Llandudno recently. It is a wonderful resort and an absolute jewel. The promenade is still, from a distance, so perfect. However, if you go up close, you will see that some,

bod gan Gymru fwy o gestyll nag unman arall yn y byd, ac eithrio o bosibl—ac mae hyn yn destun dadl—Palesteina, a gafodd hefyd brofiad digon caled o ryfeloedd yn yr oesoedd canol. Yn anffodus, mae hynny'n dal yn wir yno. Mae cestyll di-rif ym Mhalestina ac yng Nghymru. Yr oedd Cymru'n rhyfeddol o anodd ei goresgyn oherwydd ei phoblogaeth a'i hadnoddau. Tybed a allem adeiladu ar hyn a'i ymestyn i agweddau eraill ar ddiwylliant yr oesoedd canol, agweddau nad yw pobl bob tro'n eu deall yn dda iawn? Mae'n faes lle nad yw'r cynnyrch i dwristiaid ar ei fwyaf datblygedig, eto i gyd, gellid creu cysylltiad â phethau megis traddodiad yr eisteddfod, er enghraifft. Efallai fod cyfle i adeiladu ar sail rhai o'r digwyddiadau a welwn o bryd i'w gilydd yng nghastell Caernarfon neu yng nghastell Caerffili, er enghraifft.

Mater o ddathlu'r agwedd hon ar ein diwylliant ydyw, nid ei lastwreiddio'n stereoteip, oherwydd dyna yw lladd ar Gymru, Val. Mae'r cestyll hyn yn gofobau anhygoel i hanes Cymru. Nid yw'r hanes i gyd yn dda, oherwydd yr oedd a wnelo llawer ohono â'n darostyngiad, er mai stiwardiaid y cestyll oedd prif deuluoedd Cymru ymhen fawr o dro, ac felly cafodd eu rôl ei gwyrddroi i ryw raddau, ond eu pwrpas gwreiddiol oedd lladd unrhyw ymdeimlad o annibyniaeth wleidyddol. Nid ydym yn clywed Llundain yn dweud, 'Efallai na ddylem hyrwyddo bysiau coch, Palas Buckingham na Thŵr Llundain rhagor, oherwydd eu bod i gyd yn stereoteipiau'. Maent yn dathlu'r pethau hynny yn Llundain, ac yn bwrw iddi go iawn. Mae hynny'n denu amrywiaeth o dwristiaid; nid ydynt bob tro'n dwristiaid a fydd yn ymweld ag orielau, ond bydd yn denu llawer o bobl hefyd a fydd yn ymweld ag orielau. Mae angen inni ddefnyddio'n cardiau cryfaf i farchnata Cymru.

I gloi, mae'n ymddangos i mi mai pen uchaf y sector twristiaeth y mae angen inni fynd ar ei ôl yng Nghanaada a manau tebyg. Mae'n newydd ardderchog fod awduron teithio Canada wedi ymweld; dyna'n union yr hyn y dylem fod yn ei hyrwyddo. Rhoddaf dair hwrê i hynny. Yr oeddwn yn Llandudno yn ddiweddar. Mae'n dref ryfeddol ac yn em go iawn. Mae'r promenâd mor berffaith o hyd, o bell. Serch hynny, o glosio, gwelwch fod rhai

although not all, of the hotels are looking a little tired. All the Canadians and Americans who would want to go to north-west Wales, which is one of the most beautiful parts of Europe—it is utterly stunning and perhaps we ought to keep quiet about it if we want to enjoy it in peace and tranquillity, but that would not be of maximum benefit to our economy—would want to stay in exciting boutique hotels. Therefore, that is the sort of investment that we need to be encouraging and marketing. Finally, Wales ought to be as famous as Chesapeake bay for seafood, particularly for shellfish. I will not be satisfied until we get that sort of marketing, so that people do not go to San Sebastian to enjoy wonderful shellfish but come to enjoy it in west Wales.

Christine Chapman: I thank the Minister for the debate today. Over the past few years, there have been significant changes to the way that tourism in Wales has been promoted, and it is important that we return to this subject from time to time. Over the past few years, we have seen a great deal of investment in the traditional tourist areas of Wales. However, I welcome the fact that investment is now going into the non-traditional tourist areas. For example, the former industrial areas, such as the Cynon Valley, my constituency, are being promoted as tourist destinations, and we are ensuring that tourism is sustainable. Tourist locations have also been made accessible to all due to Labour's policy of providing free entry to many of our tourist attractions and museums. All Welsh citizens can enjoy our heritage, and it is no longer the preserve of the few.

Tourism is also about promoting Wales in the world and creating an image of Wales as a good place to visit. Speakers from all parties would agree with those sentiments. A great deal has been done, but there is potential to do more to attract greater numbers of tourists from abroad. I would like to focus on three principal areas. First, if we want to attract tourists, we must ensure that there are quality places for them to stay. To give an example,

o'r gwestai, er nad pob un, yn edrych yn flinedig braidd. Byddai'r holl bobl o Ganada ac America a fyddai am fynd i ogledd-orllewin Cymru, sef un o rannau harddaf Ewrop—mae'n gwbl syfrdanol ac efallai y dylem gadw'n ddistaw amdani os ydym am gael heddwch a llonydd i'w mwynhau, ond ni fyddai hynny o'r budd mwyaf i'n heconomi—am aros mewn gwestai 'boutique' cyffrous. Felly, dyna'r math o fuddsoddi y mae angen inni ei annog a'i farchnata. Yn olaf, dylai Cymru fod yr un mor enwog â Bae Chesapeake am ei bwyd môr, yn enwedig ei physgod cregyn. Ni fyddaf yn fodlon nes inni gael y math hwnnw o farchnata, fel na fydd pobl yn mynd i San Sebastian i fwynhau bwyd môr rhagorol ond eu bod yn dod i'w fwynhau yng ngorllewin Cymru.

Christine Chapman: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am y ddadl heddiw. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae'r ffordd y mae twristiaeth wedi cael ei hyrwyddo yng Nghymru wedi newid yn sylweddol, ac mae'n bwysig inni ddychwelyd at y pwnc hwn o bryd i'w gilydd. Yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld llawer iawn o fuddsoddi yn ardaloedd twristiaeth traddodiadol Cymru. Serch hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod buddsoddi yn awr yn digwydd yn yr ardaloedd nad ydynt yn ardaloedd traddodiadol i dwristiaid. Er enghraifft, mae'r hen ardaloedd diwydiannol, megis Cwm Cynon, fy etholaeth, yn cael eu hyrwyddo'n gyrchfannau i dwristiaid, ac yr ydym yn sicrhau bod twristiaeth yn gynaliadwy. Mae lleoliadau i dwristiaid wedi agor eu drysau i bawb hefyd yn sgîl polisi Llafur o ddarparu mynediad am ddim i lawer o'n hatyniadau i dwristiaid a'n hamgueddfeydd. Gall pob dinesydd yng Nghymru fwynhau ein treftadaeth, ac nid yw wedi'i chyfyngu i'r ychydig rai rhagor.

Mae a wnelo twristiaeth hefyd â hyrwyddo Cymru yn y byd a chreu delwedd o Gymru fel lle da i ymweld â hi. Byddai siaradwyr o bob plaid yn cytuno â'r sylwadau hynny. Mae llawer iawn wedi'i wneud, ond mae lle i wneud rhagor i ddenu mwy o dwristiaid o wledydd tramor. Hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar dri phrif faes. Yn gyntaf, er mwyn denu twristiaid, rhaid inni sicrhau bod mannau o safon ar gael iddynt aros. A rhoi enghraifft

'Rhondda Cynon Taf Tourism Strategy: Reaching Destination Rhondda Cynon Taf 2007-2013' noted the development of suitable accommodation as an important challenge and identified several issues. In my short debate at the beginning of February, I suggested that there might be opportunities for pubs in this regard. We know that pubs are struggling at the moment, and there is potential for some of them to offer good quality accommodation to tourists, so I ask the Minister what more can be done to encourage this and what support can be given to pubs, for example.

On skills, a good tourism industry needs good accommodation, but it also needs highly skilled workers. However, unfortunately, we still have this image of the hospitality industry as being a low-skilled industry that offers nothing more than temporary, badly paid jobs. That is a stereotype that we must challenge; we must change this. A good example is Springboard Wales. I declare an interest, because I am a member of the advisory board. Springboard Wales aims to help unemployed and disadvantaged young people into careers in hospitality and tourism. It also works to improve the image of the sector, allowing skills shortages to be addressed and attracting new talent to work in the sector. I would like to know what other action the Welsh Assembly Government can take to address this.

On the issue of languages, we need to ensure that workers in the sector can communicate fluently with visitors. I know from speaking to CILT, the National Centre for Languages, that it recognises that increased language skills will make Wales more attractive as a tourist destination and more successful in the global economy. So, I ask the Minister to consider what more we can do in Wales to ensure that Wales possesses the language skills to attract the 75 per cent of the world that does not speak English.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad yn fyr ar y mater pwysig hwn. Nid ydym ond yn gallu croesawu geiriau'r Gweinidog a chytuno gyda hwy. Fodd bynnag, mae heriau o'n blaen.

ichi, yn 'Rhondda Cynon Taf Tourism Strategy: Reaching Destination Rhondda Cynon Taf 2007-2013' nodwyd bod datblygu llety addas yn her o bwys a rhestrwyd sawl ystyriaeth. Yn fy nadl fer ddechrau mis Chwefror, awgrymais y gallai fod cyfleoedd i dafarndai yn y cyswllt hwn. Gwyddom fod tafarndai'n cael trafferthion ar hyn o bryd, ac mae lle i rai ohonynt gynnig llety o safon i dwristiaid, felly gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog beth yn rhagor y gellir ei wneud i annog hyn a pha gymorth y gellir ei roi i dafarndai, er enghraifft.

O ran sgiliau, er mwyn cael diwydiant twristiaeth da, mae angen llety da ond mae angen gweithwyr medrus iawn arno hefyd. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, y ddelwedd sydd gennym o hyd o'r diwydiant lletygarwch yw diwydiant isel ei sgiliau nad yw'n cynnig dim mwy na swyddi dros dro ar gyflog isel. Stereoteip y mae'n rhaid inni ei herio yw hwnnw; rhaid inni newid hyn. Enghraifft dda yw Sbardun Cymru Yr wyf am ddatgan buddiant, oherwydd fy mod yn aelod o'r bwrdd cynghori. Nod Sbardun Cymru yw cynorthwyo pobl ifanc ddi-waith a difreintiedig i gael gyrfa ym maes lletygarwch a thwristiaeth. Mae'n gweithio hefyd i wella delwedd y sector, gan gynorthwyo i fynd i'r afael â phrinder sgiliau a denu talent newydd i weithio yn y sector. Hoffwn wybod pa gamau eraill y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â hyn.

O ran ieithoedd, mae angen inni sicrhau bod gweithwyr yn y sector yn gallu cyfathrebu'n rhugl ag ymwelwyr. Gwn o siarad â CILT, y Ganolfan Ieithoedd Genedlaethol, ei bod yn sylweddoli y bydd gwell sgiliau iaith yn gwneud Cymru'n gyrchfan fwy deniadol i dwristiaid ac felly'n fwy llwyddiannus yn yr economi fyd-eang. Felly, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried beth arall y gallwn ei wneud yng Nghymru i sicrhau bod gan Gymru y sgiliau iaith i ddenu'r 75 y cant o'r byd nad yw'n siarad Saesneg.

Eleanor Burnham: I am pleased to be able to contribute briefly on this important matter. We can but welcome the words of the Minister and agree with them. However, we face some challenges.

I have some facts that are quite telling. This is just common sense. In a recent report, our tourism strengths included a unique cultural experience distinct to Wales, the general atmosphere, a feeling of welcome, the friendliness of people, the availability and choice of tourist attractions, and the service received at attractions. That is brilliant; we have got all of that. Those are our strengths, and that is fantastic. Unfortunately, there are weaknesses, and they are very basic weaknesses that most of us would recognise.

5.30 p.m.

The availability of public toilets—I am sorry, I obviously have a thing about loos—is really important because it is a very basic requirement. If you have a bad experience, it puts you off. It is one of the first impressions that you have of an area. These are not my facts; I believe that this is a Government report. However, I wish to discuss tourism weaknesses, which include the availability and cleanliness of public toilets. As a regional Assembly Member for North Wales I visit many public toilets. I commend Holywell public toilets, which I visited last week in the course of my duties. If every public toilet was up to the standard of Holywell, it would be absolutely fabulous. I am talking seriously as a mother, because when you are out with children and you have a desperate need, this is very important. I will not go on.

Value for money at eating establishments is another very basic essential need for tourism. We need to get that right because, at present, it is a weakness. Another weakness, apparently, is the cleanliness of the streets. Again, that puts you off straight away, because if something is dirty you do not want to be associated with it. This is beyond the ken of our wonderful tourism Minister, but I am sure that he is making a note as we speak. It is important that we get this right because it is a matter of the first impression that

Mae gennyf nifer o ffeithiau sy'n eithaf dadlennol. Synnwyr cyffredin yw hyn. Mewn adroddiad yn ddiweddar, rhai o'n cryfderau ym maes twristiaeth oedd profiad diwylliannol unigryw sy'n arbennig i Gymru, yr awyrgylch yn gyffredinol, ymdeimlad o groeso, cyfeillgarwch pobl, yr atyniadau sydd ar gael i dwristiaid, y dewis o atyniadau, a'r gwasanaeth a geir yn yr atyniadau hynny. Mae hynny'n wych; mae hynny i gyd gennym. Dyna'n cryfderau, ac mae hynny'n rhagorol. Yn anffodus, ceir gwendidau, ac maent yn wendidau sylfaenol iawn y byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn gyfarwydd â hwy.

Mae sicrhau bod toiledau cyhoeddus ar gael—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, mae'n amlwg bod tai bach yn beth mawr gennyf—yn bwysig iawn oherwydd ei fod yn ofyniad sylfaenol iawn. Os cewch brofiad gwael, mae'n gadael argraff wael arnoch. Dyna un o'r argraffiadau cyntaf a gewch o ardal. Nid fy ffeithiau i yw'r rhain; credaf mai adroddiad gan y Llywodraeth yw hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am sôn am wendidau ym maes twristiaeth, sy'n cynnwys diffyg toiledau cyhoeddus a diffyg glendid ynddynt. A minnau'n cynrychioli rhanbarth gogledd Cymru yn y Cynulliad, byddaf yn ymweld â llawer o doiledau cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo toiledau cyhoeddus Treffynnon, yr ymwelais â hwy yr wythnos diwethaf yn rhinwedd fy nyletswyddau. Petai pob toiled cyhoeddus cystal â safon rhai Treffynnon, byddai'n wirioneddol wych. Yr wyf yn siarad o ddifrif fel mam, oherwydd pan fyddwch allan gyda'ch plant ac angen toiled arnoch ar frys, mae hyn yn bwysig iawn. Ni ddywedaf ragor.

Mae gwerth am arian mewn bwytai yn rhywbeth sylfaenol iawn arall y mae ei angen ar dwristiaid. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod hynny'n iawn oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, mae'n wendid. Gwendid arall, i bob golwg, yw glendid y strydoedd. Unwaith eto, mae'n creu argraff wael ar unwaith, oherwydd os yw rhywbeth yn fudr, nid ydych am gael eich cysylltu ag ef. Mae hyn y tu hwnt i gyfrifoldeb ein Gweinidog twristiaeth gwych, ond yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gwneud nodyn ohono wrth inni siarad. Mae'n bwysig inni

someone has of an area that they visit.

The other issue is fascinating, which is that the standard of display maps and information boards are not up to scratch. As we were whizzing through on the train yesterday, at Church Stretton or Craven Arms, I noticed a very informative board, which was like a gatekeeper to the area. It was really fantastic because, as I looked through the train window, I saw it and I thought, 'If I have never been to Church Stretton or Craven Arms, I can see what is happening in the area'. That is very important, but it is a weakness at present.

The other weakness according to this report is the facilities at the seaside and the beach. We know that it is not always easy to achieve Blue Flag status. It can be difficult to gain a Blue Flag for certain beaches because it depends on the circumstances. I was told by someone who knows better than me the other day that it is very difficult, apparently, when a beach is at the mouth of a river, because of sewage and all sorts of stuff that we do not really want to think about. We discussed that yesterday, did we not, Ann, in Rhyl?

I suggest that we need to work on those weaknesses because they are the first impression that people have when they go to an area that they have never visited before. Bearing that in mind, we also have some wonderful things that we can speak about in Wales. Apparently, the three most visited tourist attractions are Caernarfon castle at No. 1, which is brilliant. No. 2 is Conwy Castle. I am sorry to tell you, Ann, Rhuddlan castle is not in the top 20, but I am sure that it is there somewhere. The third most visited tourist attraction is the National Trust's Penrhyn castle. If anyone has not been to Penrhyn castle, I suggest that you go because it is absolutely wonderful. Therefore, we have some wonderful attractions, but we need to work on the basics that are not right and put people off an area. Quite frankly, we have a lot to do. Having people from Canada is brilliant, and, no doubt, we have some very hard-working people in the tourism department, but it is a shame that even Esther

sicrhau bod hyn yn iawn oherwydd dyna'r argraff gyntaf a gaiff rhywun o'r ardal y byddant yn ymweld â hi.

Mae'r mater arall yn ddi-ddorol iawn, sef nad yw safon y mapiau arddangos a'r byrddau gwybodaeth yn ddigon da. Wrth inni ruthro heibio ar y trênn ddoe, yn Church Stretton neu yn Craven Arms, sylwais ar fwrdd llawn gwybodaeth, rhyw fath o borth i'r ardal. Yr oedd yn wirioneddol wych, oherwydd, wrth imi edrych drwy ffenestr y trênn, fe'i gwelais a meddwl, 'Os nad wyf erioed wedi bod yn Church Stretton neu yn Craven Arms, gallaf weld beth sy'n digwydd yn yr ardal'. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn, ond mae'n wendid ar hyn o bryd.

Y gwendid arall, yn ôl yr adroddiad hwn, yw cyfleusterau ar lan y môr ac ar y traethau. Gwyddom nad yw bob tro'n rhywdd cael statws Baner Las. Gall fod yn anodd i rai traethau gael statws Baner Las oherwydd ei fod yn dibynnu ar yr amgylchiadau. Dywedodd rhywun sy'n gwybod yn well na fi wrthyf y diwrnod o'r blaen ei bod yn anodd iawn, yn ôl pob sôn, pan fydd traeth wrth aber afon, oherwydd y carthion a phob math o bethau nad ydym am feddwl amdanynt mewn gwirionedd. Buom yn trafod hynny ddoe, oni fuom, Ann, yn y Rhyl?

Awgrymaf fod angen inni weithio ar y gwendidau hynny oherwydd dyna'r argraff gyntaf a gaiff pobl pan fyddant yn ymweld ag ardal nad ydynt wedi ymweld â hi o'r blaen. A chofio hynny, mae gennym hefyd nifer o bethau rhagorol y gallwn sôn amdanynt yng Nghymru. I bob golwg, y tri atyniad i dwristiaid sy'n denu'r nifer fwyaf o ymwelwyr yw Castell Caernarfon, sef Rhif 1, sy'n wych. Rhif 2 yw Castell Conwy. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf ddweud wrthyf, Ann, nad yw castell Rhuddlan ymhlith yr 20 uchaf, ond yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yno yn rhywle. Y trydydd atyniad mwyaf poblogaidd yw Castell y Penrhyn sy'n eiddo i'r Ymddiriedolaeth Genedlaethol. Os oes rhywun yma nad yw wedi ymweld â Chastell y Penrhyn, awgrymaf eich bod yn mynd yno oherwydd y mae'n wirioneddol wych. Felly, mae gennym nifer o atyniadau rhagorol, ond mae angen inni weithio ar y pethau sylfaenol nad ydynt yn iawn ac sy'n creu argraff wael ar bobl. A bod yn gwbl blaen, mae gennym lawer o

Roberts said this morning on Radio Cymru that she regrets the fact that Visit Wales was sucked into the Government because there are walls and, unfortunately, she cannot talk to people. That is regrettable. I have no doubt, as I know some of them, that they are very hard-working people, but there are issues to be addressed as regards advertising and marketing.

Alun Cairns *rose—*

Eleanor Burnham: I think that you have had your say, Alun. Perhaps I will give way in a minute. I am sorry, but time is progressing.

I know that we have advertising, but apparently it is measured according to frequency and share of audience. I wonder whether we are doing it right. I do not know what the terminology is, but we are marketing mostly to people who are within a three-hour journey from Wales. I am sure that it is brilliant, but let us do more; let us attract more people from Canada and beyond, because we have a lot to offer in Wales.

I commend the Minister. I am sure that he is doing his best, but if he could answer the questions about the weaknesses, I would be very grateful. I am sorry that I did not allow you to intervene, Alun.

Trish Law: I very much welcome this debate as I have long since considered that more tourism emphasis should be placed on the south Wales valleys. While job-starved communities in places like Blaenau Gwent continue to mourn the loss of our traditional industries—coal and steel, in particular—the one most advantageous offshoot is that the industrial scars have been erased from our landscape and normal scenic beauty of our hills and valleys has been restored. Nowhere is this more in evidence than in Blaenau Gwent, aptly described by weatherman Derek Brockway as the gateway to the Brecon Beacons. The reopening of the Ebbw valley

waith i'w wneud. Mae'n wych cael pobl yma o Ganada, ac nid oes amheuaeth nad oes gennym nifer o bobl sy'n gweithio'n galed yn yr adran twristiaeth, ond mae'n bechod bod hyd yn oed Esther Roberts wedi dweud y bore yma ar Radio Cymru ei bod yn gresynu bod Croeso Cymru wedi'i lyncu gan y Llywodraeth oherwydd bod waliau ac na all, yn anffodus, siarad â phobl. Mae hynny'n resyn. Nid wyf yn amau, gan fy mod yn adnabod rhai ohonynt, nad ydynt yn bobl sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn, ond ceir problemau y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy o ran hysbysebu a marchnata.

Alun Cairns *a gododd—*

Eleanor Burnham: Credaf eich bod wedi dweud eich dweud, Alun. Efallai yr ildiaf mewn munud. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae'r amser yn mynd heibio.

Gwn ein bod yn hysbysebu, ond, i bob golwg mae'n cael ei fesur yn ôl amllder a chyfran o'r gynulleidfa. Tybed a ydym yn ei wneud yn iawn? Ni wn beth yw'r derminoleg, ond yr ydym yn marchnata gan mwyaf ymhlith pobl sydd o fewn taith deirawr i Gymru. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn wych, ond gadewch inni wneud rhagor; gadewch inni ddenu mwy o bobl o Ganada ac o'r tu hwnt, oherwydd y mae gennym lawer i'w gynnig yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Gweinidog. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei fod yn gwneud ei orau, ond petai'n gallu ateb y cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r gwendidau, byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf na adewais ichi ymyrryd, Alun.

Trish Law: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddadl hon yn fawr gan fy mod wedi meddwl ers tro y dylid rhoi mwy o bwyslais ym maes twristiaeth ar gymoedd y de. Tra bo cymunedau amddifad o swyddi mewn mannau megis Blaenau Gwent yn dal i alaru ar ôl colli'n diwydiannau traddodiadol—glo a dur, yn benodol—yr un sgîl effaith er gwell yw bod y creithiau diwydiannol wedi'u dileu oddi ar ein tirwedd a bod harddwch naturiol golygfeydd ein bryniau a'n cymoedd wedi'i adfer. Nid yw hyn yn fwy amlwg yn unman nag ym Mlaenau Gwent, a ddisgrifiwyd yn briodol gan y dyn tywydd Derek Brockway fel y porth i Fannau Brycheiniog. Wrth

railway just over two years ago has exposed the natural magnificence of the Ebbw Fawr valley, the towering hills and the lush, green valley. I would like to have seen this line called 'the Ebbw valley scenic railway'.

I would also like to see more people from Cardiff taking the 56-minute rail journey to Blaenau Gwent to savour the tourism delights on offer. Yet, sadly and surprisingly, there is no tourist information stand at the main station of Wales's capital city and not a single leaflet to guide would-be tourists to Blaenau Gwent. In this, the year of the Ryder Cup, are we really doing enough to promote the attractions of the West Monmouthshire Golf Club, which is officially the highest golf course in Great Britain, as recognised by the *Guinness Book of Records*? It has some spectacular views overlooking the Brecon Beacons, and yet it is only 20 minutes from Newport's Celtic Manor. The West Monmouthshire Golf Club overlooks the town of Tredegar that, despite having developed only over the past 200 or so years, is steeped in history. One little known piece of history is that Tredegar is home to Lodge No. 1 of the Loyal Order of Moose. The order was founded in Kentucky more than 120 years ago, but the first lodge was established in Tredegar. There are now more than 2,000 lodges worldwide and, over the years, Tredegar has attracted a trickle of American tourists who are members of the moose fraternity. However, I believe that a lot more can be done to bring in the big-spending Americans.

Nearby is Bedwellty House, a grade II listed building that is being restored at a cost of £5.5 million. The main part of the building dates back to the early nineteenth century regency period, and it is being restored and renovated by Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council in partnership with funders that include the Heritage Lottery Fund, the Welsh Assembly Government's Heads of the Valleys programme, the European regional development fund and Cadw. I have no doubt that the restored Bedwellty House and adjacent park will attract many visitors to

ailagor rheilffordd Cwm Ebwy ychydig dros ddwy flynedd yn ôl, agorwyd ffenestr ar odidowgrwydd naturiol Cwm Ebwy Fawr, y brynau uchel a'r cwm glas ffrwythlon. Byddwn wedi hoffi gweld y lein hon yn cael ei galw'n 'rheilffordd godidowgrwydd Cwm Ebwy'.

Hefyd, hoffwn weld rhagor o bobl o Gaerdydd yn manteisio ar y daith 56 munud ar y trêen i Flaenau Gwent i flasur danteithion sydd ar gael i dwristiaid. Eto i gyd, yn anffodus, ac mae hyn yn syndod, nid oes stonidin gwybodaeth i dwristiaid ym mhrif orsaf prifddinas Cymru na dim un daflen i dywys darpar dwristiaid i Flaenau Gwent. A hithau'n flwyddyn Cwpan Ryder, a ydym mewn difrif yn gwneud digon i hyrwyddo atyniadau Clwb Golff Gorllewin Sir Fynwy, sef cwrs golff uchaf Prydain Fawr, a hynny'n swyddogol, fel y'i cydnabyddir gan y *Guinness Book of Records*? Mae'n cynnig golygfeydd ysblennydd dros Fannau Brycheiniog, ac eto, nid yw ond yn 20 munud o daith o'r Celtic Manor yng Nghasnewydd. Mae Clwb Golff Gorllewin Sir Fynwy yn edrych dros dref Tredegar. Er nad yw'r dref ond wedi datblygu dros y 200 mlynedd diwethaf, mae'n gyforiog o hanes. Un hanesyn nad oes llawer yn gwybod amdano yw mai Tredegar yw cartref Cyfrinfa Rhif 1 y Loyal Order of Moose. Sefydlwyd yr urdd honno yn Kentucky dros 120 mlynedd yn ôl, ond sefydlwyd y gyfrinfa gyntaf yn Nhredegar. Erbyn hyn, mae mwy na 2,000 ohonynt drwy'r byd, a thros y blynyddoedd, mae Tredegar wedi denu nifer fach o dwristiaid o America sy'n aelodau o'r frawdoliaeth. Fodd bynnag, credaf y gellir gwneud mwy o lawer i ddenu'r gwarwyr mawr o America.

Gerllaw, mae Tŷ Bedwellte, adeilad rhestredig gradd II sy'n cael ei adfer ar gost o £5.5 miliwn. Mae prif ran yr adeilad yn dyddio yn ôl i gyfnod rhaglafiaeth dechrau'r bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, ac mae'n cael ei adfer a'i adnewyddu gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Blaenau Gwent mewn partneriaeth â noddwyr sy'n cynnwys Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri, rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, cronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop a Cadw. Nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd Tŷ Bedwellte, ar ôl ei adfer, a'r parc cyffiniol yn denu llawer o

Blaenau Gwent, for the project has been selected as one of the key tourism projects for the area by the Heads of the Valleys programme. There is one thing that links Bedwellty House and the unique roundhouse towers in Nantyglo, and that is iron. Bedwellty House was built as an ironmaster's residence in 1818 and the towers were built by an ironmaster a couple of years earlier for fear of an uprising by iron workers, such were the appalling conditions in which they worked. I have high hopes that both the towers and Roundhouse farm itself will one day be restored to their former glory to become another unique tourism selling point in Blaenau Gwent.

Of course, the 2010 National Eisteddfod being held on The Works Ebbw Vale site will be the perfect opportunity to showcase the variety of sights and experiences on offer. Talking of opportunities, perhaps I can take this opportunity of thanking the Minister for the £25,000 he has made available to enable the Eisteddfod to put on a free-entry day on Sunday, 1 August. This will attract more visitors and can only be good for the local economy. Diolch, Alun Ffred. The works site, formerly known as the Corus site, will become a tourist attraction in its own right in due course. The Gwent Record Office, which has one of the largest archives in Wales, is to relocate there, where its priceless collection will form the cornerstone of a unique £12-million visitor centre at the old steelworks' general offices. I know that the Deputy First Minister is keen to extend the Ebbw valley railway line to the works site, which could prove to be a huge tourism boost. I am sure that the Welsh Assembly Government's tourism team, Visit Wales, will be active during the Eisteddfod. In the meantime, I hope it will look more to the Valleys to promote tourism rather than just the usual traditional tourist hotspots—Snowdonia, the Brecon Beacons, the Gower peninsula and the rest. Tourists spend more than £8 million a day on trips to Wales, amounting to around £3 billion a year, and I want to see a bit more of that money coming to Blaenau Gwent.

ymwelwyr i Flaenau Gwent, oherwydd bod y prosiect wedi'i ddewis yn un o'r prosiectau twristiaeth allweddol ar gyfer yr ardal gan raglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Un peth sy'n cysylltu Tŷ Bedwellte a thyllau'r tŷ crwn unigryw yn Nant-y-glo, yw haearn. Codwyd Tŷ Bedwellte'n gartref i un o'r meistri haearn yn 1818 a chodwyd y tyrau gan feistr haearn ychydig flynyddoedd cyn hynny am fod ofn y byddai'r gweithwyr haearn yn gwrthryfela oherwydd bod eu hamgylchiadau gweithio mor erchyll. Yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr y caiff y tyrau a ffermdy'r Tŷ Crwn eu hadfer i'w hen ogoniant ryw ddydd a'u troi'n atyniad unigryw arall i werthu Blaenau Gwent i dwristiaid.

Wrth gwrs, cynhelir Eisteddfod Genedlaethol 2010 ar safle Gweithfeydd Glynebwy a dyna'r cyfle perffaith i arddangos yr amrywiaeth o safleoedd a phrofiadau sydd ar gael. A sôn am gyfleoedd, efallai y caf fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am y £25,000 y mae wedi'i ddarparu i alluogi'r Eisteddfod i wneud dydd Sul, 1 Awst, yn ddiwrnod mynediad am ddim. Bydd hyn yn denu mwy o ymwelwyr ac mae'n sicr o fod er lles yr economi leol. Diolch, Alun Ffred. Daw safle'r gwaith, a elwid gynt yn safle Corus, yn atyniad i dwristiaid ynddo'i hun maes o law. Bydd Swyddfa Cofnodion Gwent, y mae ganddi un o'r archifau mwyaf yng Nghymru, yn symud yno, a bydd ei chasgliad amhrisiadwy'n gonglfaen i ganolfan ymwelwyr unigryw a fydd yn costio £1 miliwn yn swyddfeydd cyffredinol yr hen waith dur. Gwn fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn awyddus i ymestyn rheilffordd Cwm Ebwy at safle'r gwaith, a gallai hynny fod yn hwb aruthrol i dwristiaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd tîm twristiaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, Croeso Cymru, yn gweithio'n galed yn ystod yr Eisteddfod. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd yn edrych mwy at y Cymoedd er mwyn hyrwyddo twristiaeth yn hytrach na dim ond at y mannau traddodiadol sy'n denu twristiaid—Eryri, Bannau Brycheiniog, Penrhyn Gŵyr a'r gweddill. Mae twristiaid yn gwario mwy nag £8 miliwn y diwrnod wrth ymweld â Chymru am y diwrnod, sef tua £3 biliwn y flwyddyn, ac yr wyf am weld ychydig mwy o'r arian hwnnw'n dod i Flaenau Gwent.

Mohammad Asghar: I am grateful for the opportunity to speak once again in the Assembly on the vitally important issue of Welsh tourism. I do not wish to repeat too much of what I said during the debate that we had towards the end of February, but I would like to make a few points to highlight my own thoughts on tourism in Wales.

The Welsh Assembly Government regularly highlights how important tourism is for Wales, and nobody can argue with that. Tourism is capable of having a huge impact on any nation's economic performance. At the moment, here in Wales, an estimated 80,000 people work in tourism on a full-time basis. It is a crucial issue and should be given notable priority by the Welsh Assembly Government. Here in Wales, we have a wealth of amazing and diverse attractions that I am sure all 60 Assembly Members are immensely proud of.

5.40 p.m.

However, to my surprise, north Wales Assembly Members have probably not been to the attractions in south Wales, and vice versa—south Wales Assembly Members have definitely not been to the attractions in north Wales. When you enter Wales over the Severn crossing, one of the biggest structures, and the best part, to be seen is the transporter bridge, and, Deputy Presiding Officer, you are one of its custodians. There are also attractions such as Big Pit: National Coal Museum, Caerphilly castle, Raglan castle, the mountains of the Brecon Beacons, the railways and the Linda Vista gardens in Abergavenny.

Jeff Cuthbert: I can assure you that I have been to just about every tourist attraction in Wales, and certainly to those in north Wales. I look forward to going up to north Wales—*[Interruption.]* I said 'just about'.

Would you encourage people to visit the Big Cheese festival in Caerphilly, which takes place on the last weekend in July in the grounds of Caerphilly castle, which is the second largest castle in Europe? It was held

Mohammad Asghar: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad unwaith eto yn y Cynulliad am y pwnc hollbwysig hwn, sef twristiaeth yng Nghymru. Nid wyf am ailadrodd gormod o'r hyn a ddywedais yn ystod y ddadl a gawsom tua diwedd mis Chwefror, ond hoffwn wneud ychydig o bwyntiau i dynnu sylw at fy syniadau i ynglŷn â thwristiaeth yng Nghymru.

Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn tynnu sylw'n aml at bwysigrwydd twristiaeth i Gymru, ac ni all neb anghydweld â hynny. Gall twristiaeth gael dylanwad enfawr ar berfformiad economaidd unrhyw genedl. Ar hyn o bryd, yma yng Nghymru, amcangyfrifir bod 80,000 o bobl yn gweithio'n llawnamser ym maes twristiaeth. Mae'n fater hollbwysig a dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad roi blaenoriaeth o bwys iddo. Yma yng Nghymru, mae gennym gyfoeth o atyniadau anhygoel ac amrywiol y mae pob un o'r 60 Aelod yma'n aruthrol o falch ohonynt, yr wyf yn siŵr.

Serch hynny, er syndod imi, go brin bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn y gogledd wedi ymweld â'r atyniadau yn y de, a'r gwrthwyneb—yn sicr nid yw Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn y de wedi ymweld â'r atyniadau yn y gogledd. Pan fyddwch yn dod i Gymru dros bont Hafren, un o'r strwythurau mwyaf, a'r rhan orau, sydd i'w gweld yw'r bont gludo, a, Ddirprwy Lywydd, chi yw un o'i cheidwaid. Hefyd, ceir atyniadau megis y Pwll Mawr, Amgueddfa Lofaol Cymru, Castell Caerffili, Castell Rhaglan, Bannau Brycheiniog, y rheilffyrdd a gerddi Linda Vista yn y Fenni.

Jeff Cuthbert: Gallaf eich sicrhau fy mod wedi ymweld â phob atyniad i dwristiaid yng Nghymru fwy neu lai, ac yn sicr â'r rhai yn y gogledd. Byddaf yn edrych ymlaen at fynd i ogledd Cymru—*[Torri ar draws.]* 'Fwy neu lai' a ddywedais i.

A fydddech yn annog pobl i ymweld â'r Wyl Gaws yng Nghaerffili a gynhelir y penwythnos olaf ym mis Gorffennaf ar dir castell Caerffili, sef y castell mwyaf ond un yn Ewrop? Fe'i rhoddwyd dan warchae gan

under siege by Cromwell during the English civil war—unfortunately, it was a Royalist stronghold, but, never mind, you cannot have everything. Will you encourage all people to visit the Big Cheese festival in Caerphilly?

Mohammad Asghar: I am promoting Wales, and not only cheese, as we also have lamb, water and so on.

Wales has immense wealth, Minister, but you have failed to promote Wales throughout the world. I travel around the world, but I have yet to see signs that promote Wales in airports, on ferries or on international trains. There are no signs anywhere, whether in India, China, America and so on, that show that Wales is a part of the world where one can go to enjoy the real beauty of nature. You have failed to ensure that that is the case.

People are put off coming to this part of the world because we do not have quality services. Your budget is only £13 million. I can imagine that certain countries, such as Spain, Portugal and others, depend on tourism. We have the most beautiful, undiscovered part of the world, but we are not promoting it. I am concerned about that. We are all drum beating with regard to the sports that you are bringing to Wales. It was in your manifesto not long ago that you would promote cricket for Wales. What happened to that? You are drum beating only about test cricket, and where is Welsh cricket now? The Ryder Cup is worth £55 billion to the American economy. I will ask you in November how much money Wales has made from the Ryder Cup.

The reason that we are not in the world-class league with regard to tourism is that we do not have proper air strips. There are no air-travel facilities between north and south, south and west, and east and west, and the same is true of train services. The roads are good, but the services on the road are not, which my colleagues have mentioned. Minister, there is huge potential that we should be unleashing in Wales. I do not believe that core spending of £13 million is enough to unleash it, and nor do I believe that

Cromwell yn ystod rhyfel cartref Lloegr—yn anffodus, un o gadarnleoedd y Brenhinwyr ydoedd, ond ni waeth am hynny, ni allwch gael popeth. A wnewch annog pawb i ymweld â'r Wyl Gaws yng Nghaerffili?

Mohammad Asghar: Hyrwyddo Cymru yr wyf fi, ac nid dim ond caws, gan fod gennym gig oen, dŵr ac yn y blaen.

Mae gan Gymru gyfoeth aruthrol, Weinidog, ond yr ydych wedi methu hyrwyddo Cymru drwy'r byd. Byddaf yn teithio o gwmpas y byd, ond nid wyf eto wedi gweld arwyddion sy'n hyrwyddo Cymru mewn meysydd awyr, ar gychod neu ar drenau rhyngwladol. Nid oes arwyddion yn unman, boed yn India, Tsieina, America ac yn y blaen, sy'n dangos bod Cymru'n rhan o'r byd lle y gall rhywun fynd i fwynhau gwir harddwch natur. Yr ydych wedi methu sicrhau hynny.

Mae pobl yn gyndyn o ddod i'r rhan hon o'r byd am nad oes gennym wasanaethau o safon. Nid yw eich cyllideb ond yn £13 miliwn. Gallaf ddychmygu bod rhai gwledydd, megis Sbaen, Portiwgal ac eraill, yn dibynnu ar dwristiaeth. Mae gennym y rhan harddaf o'r byd sydd heb ei darganfod, ond nid ydym yn ei hyrwyddo. Yr wyf yn poeni am hynny. Yr ydym i gyd yn curo'r drymiau ynglŷn â'r chwaraeon yr ydych yn eu denu i Gymru. Yr oedd yn eich manifestio ychydig yn ôl y byddech yn hyrwyddo criced ar gyfer Cymru. Beth a ddigwyddodd i hynny? Curo'r drymiau ynglŷn â gemau prawf criced yn unig yr ydych, ond beth am griced yng Nghymru yn awr? Mae Cwpan Ryder yn werth £55 biliwn i economi America. Gofynnaf ichi ym mis Tachwedd faint o arian y bydd Cymru wedi'i wneud yn sgîl Cwpan Ryder.

Y rheswm pam nad ydym ymhlith cynghair y byd ym maes twristiaeth yw am nad oes gennym leiniau awyr iawn. Nid oes cyfleusterau hedfan rhwng y gogledd a'r de, rhwng y de a'r gorllewin a rhwng y dwyrain a'r gorllewin, ac mae'r un peth yn wir am wasanaethau trenau. Mae'r ffyrdd yn dda, ond nid yw'r gwasanaethau ar y ffyrdd yn dda, ac mae fy nghyd-Aelodau wedi crybwyll hynny. Weinidog, mae potensial aruthrol y dylem fod yn ei ryddhau yng Nghymru. Ni chredaf fod gwariant craidd o £13 miliwn yn

the Welsh Assembly Government's marketing strategy is strong enough to fully achieve Wales's potential.

Bethan Jenkins *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Sorry, but he is out of time. I call on the Minister to reply to the debate.

The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones): I thank everyone who has taken part in the debate, which was generally well tempered, and several constructive remarks were made. I commend Christine Chapman's and Trish Law's remarks about the importance of our industrial heritage. Upgrading accommodation and restaurants is a priority for Visit Wales. With regard to skills, there are centres of excellence in Wales. In my own part of the world, Coleg Llandrillo Cymru, the further education college, is doing excellent work, but you are right to say that we need to give it a higher status in the education and training system.

I enjoyed David Melding's contribution, as usual. Certainly, we have castles that we should be proud of and make the most of—

Ann Jones: I know that Eleanor mentioned it, but could I put on record that Rhuddlan castle, in my constituency, was one of the first built by Edward I, and that the first Parliament was held there, in Parliament House. Would you therefore include Rhuddlan castle in any tourist trail, please?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yes. When I was in America, I told them that we have more than 600 castles. Indeed, you could say that we have castles to burn and, in the past, we frequently did. [*Laughter.*] However, at the time, castles were about subjugation. You are right that they should be marked more clearly, and that is part of Cadw's heritage tourism project, which has started. That project will do some of the work that you were talking about, such as getting events there and installing new technology to promote and present the case in a much more lively fashion. I have no dispute with your

ddigon i'w ryddhau ac ni chredaf ychwaith fod strategaeth marchnata Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ddigon cryf i wireddu potensial Cymru i'r eithaf.

Bethan Jenkins *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae ei amser ar ben. Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones): Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl, a oedd, ar y cyfan, yn ddadl hynaws, a chafwyd sawl sylw adeiladol. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo sylwadau Christine Chapman a Trish Law ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd ein treftadaeth ddiwydiannol. Mae gwella llety a bwytai'n flaenoriaeth i Croeso Cymru. O ran sgiliau, mae gennym ganolfannau rhagoriaeth yng Nghymru. Yn fy rhan i o'r byd, mae Coleg Llandrillo Cymru, y coleg addysg bellach, yn gwneud gwaith rhagorol, ond yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud bod angen inni roi statws uwch iddo yn y system addysg a hyfforddiant.

Mwynheais gyfraniad David Melding, fel y byddaf. Yn sicr, mae gennym gestyll y dylem fod yn falch ohonynt gan fanteisio arnynt i'r eithaf—

Ann Jones: Gwn fod Eleanor wedi sôn amdano, ond a gaf ei roi ar glawr mai castell Rhuddlan, yn fy etholaeth, oedd un o'r rhai cyntaf a godwyd gan Edward I, ac i'r Senedd gyntaf gael ei chynnal yno yn Nhŷ'r Senedd. A fydech felly'n cynnwys castell Rhuddlan ar unrhyw lwybr i dwristiaid, os gwelwch yn dda?

Alun Ffred Jones: Byddwn. Pan oeddwn yn America, dywedais wrthynt fod gennym fwy na 600 o gestyll. A dweud y gwir, gallech ddweud bod gennym gestyll i'w llosgi, ac, yn y gorffennol, dyna y byddem yn ei wneud yn aml. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, ein darostwng oedd pwrpas y cestyll bryd hynny. Yr ydych yn iawn y dylid eu marcio'n fwy clir, ac mae hynny'n rhan o brosiect twristiaeth treftadaeth Cadw, sydd wedi cychwyn. Bydd y prosiect hwnnw'n gwneud rhywfaint o'r gwaith yr oeddech yn sôn amdano, megis cynnal digwyddiadau yno a gosod technoleg newydd i hyrwyddo a

critique.

Andrew R.T. Davies: One of the greatest ways in which we could promote Wales and, indeed, its castles is by having access to North America via Cardiff Airport. Would you support greater route prioritisation and, together with your colleague, the Deputy First Minister, commit to working with Cardiff Airport to establish route priorities, which, sadly, have been neglected to date?

Alun Ffred Jones: Indeed. In fact, I was talking about that this morning with Jo Jones of Visit Wales. Aer Lingus is soon to introduce a new service from America, which will provide through-ticketing from there. That will be a welcome boost, but there is a long way to go before that—

Brynle Williams *rose*—

Alun Ffred Jones: Hold on. I think that I have given way enough for now. However, Andrew, you are quite right to say that it is a weakness at the moment in respect of international trade.

On prioritisation, we heard a lot about the fact that we are not spending enough and so on, but I have to repeat that five tourism projects worth more than £90 million will be coming through over the next four or five years, thanks to European funds, and they will directly address tourism issues, including sustainable tourism, coastal tourism, Cadw heritage tourism, the Communities and Nature project, and digital marketing. Therefore, to say that we are not giving this prominence and priority is simply wrong.

I have to take issue with Alun Cairns on central core funding. He can argue that we should be spending more, but for him to go back to compare it with the Wales Tourist Board's core funding in 1999 is like saying that three apples and three pears make six tangerines. Alun, get a pen and write this down: the core funding was £15.5 million,

chyfleu'r hanes mewn ffordd fwy bywiog o lawer. Nid wyf yn anghytuno â'ch dadansoddiad o gwbl.

Andrew R.T. Davies: Un o'r ffyrdd mwyaf y gallem hyrwyddo Cymru, ac yn wir, ei chestyll, fyddai cael llwybr i Ogledd America drwy Faes Awyr Caerdydd. A fyddech yn cefnogi mwy o flaenoriaethu llwybrau ac, ynghyd â'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, yn ymrwymo i weithio gyda Maes Awyr Caerdydd, i sefydlu blaenoriaethau llwybrau, sydd wedi'u hesgeuluso hyd yn hyn, yn anffodus?

Alun Ffred Jones: Yn sicr. A dweud y gwir, yr oeddwn yn sôn am hynny y bore yma wrth Jo Jones, Croeso Cymru. Bydd Aer Lingus yn cyflwyno gwasanaeth newydd o America cyn bo hir a fydd yn darparu gwasanaeth tocyn drwodd o'r fan honno. Bydd y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n hwb i'w groesawu, ond mae cryn ffordd i fynd cyn hynny—

Brynle Williams *a gododd*—

Alun Ffred Jones: Arhoswch funud. Yr wyf yn meddwl fy mod wedi ildio digon ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, Andrew, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle'n dweud ei fod yn wendid ar hyn o bryd o ran masnach ryngwladol.

O ran blaenoriaethu, clywsom lawer am y ffaith nad ydym yn gwario digon ac yn y blaen, ond rhaid imi ddweud eto y bydd pum prosiect twristiaeth gwerth mwy na £90 miliwn yn cael eu rhoi ar waith dros y pedair neu bum mlynedd nesaf, diolch i gronfeydd Ewrop, a bydd y rhain yn mynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol â materion twristiaeth, gan gynnwys twristiaeth gynaliadwy, twristiaeth y glannau, twristiaeth treftadaeth Cadw, y prosiect Cymunedau a Natur, a marchnata digidol. Felly, mae dweud nad ydym yn rhoi amlygrwydd a blaenoriaeth i hyn yn gwbl anghywir.

Rhaid imi anghytuno ag Alun Cairns ynglŷn ag ariannu craidd canolog. Gall ddadlau y dylem fod yn gwario rhagor, ond mae mynd yn ôl a chymharu hynny ag arian craidd Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn 1999 yr un fath â dweud bod tri afal a thair gellygen yn gwneud chwe thangerîn. Alun, estyn bin ac ysgrifenna hyn ar bapur: yr oedd yr arian

but half of that was staff costs and the old section 4 grants. Those section 4 grants now come within the Department for the Economy and Transport and, already, £5.9 million was allocated last year. The staff costs are now covered by the civil service centrally. Therefore, in fact—

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Alun Ffred Jones: No, I have heard enough, thank you.

Alun Cairns: You cannot name me and then not give way.

Alun Ffred Jones: Listen, Alun. The core funding was therefore £7.8 million, covering all the work of the WTB, compared with £13.6 million this year. I reckon that that is an increase of around 70 per cent. You may argue that it is not enough, but it is certainly an increase and not a decrease. If you cannot understand that, I suggest that something is wrong with you.

Alun Cairns: Give way.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Alun Cairns, he is not taking your intervention. He said ‘no’ to Brynle Williams and he is saying ‘no’ to you. [*Interruption.*] Alun Cairns, sit down.

Alun Ffred Jones: We also heard a great deal about the lack of transport in Wales. Last week in the Chamber, we heard the Tories knocking the fact that we are improving transport links in Wales because they want to spend the money elsewhere. They have to be reasonably consistent about this matter.

I wish to return to the broader issue of marketing Wales abroad. That is not just the work of Visit Wales, but of the whole of the Government. Broadly, I think that we are on the right track. We have proved today that the tourism industry in Wales is valuable not only economically, but also socially.

craidd yn £15.5 miliwn, ond costau staff a'r hen grantiau adran 4 oedd hanner hynny. Mae'r grantiau adran 4 hynny bellach yn dod o dan yr Adran dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, ac eisoes cafodd £5.9 miliwn ei ddyrannu y llynedd. Mae'r gwasanaeth sifil yn ganolog bellach yn talu costau'r staff. Felly, mewn gwirionedd—

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Alun Ffred Jones: Na, yr wyf wedi clywed digon, diolch.

Alun Cairns: Ni allwch fy enwi ac wedyn gwrthod ildio.

Alun Ffred Jones: Gwrandewch, Alun. Yr oedd yr arian craidd felly yn £7.8 miliwn, ar gyfer holl waith Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, o'i gymharu â £13.6 miliwn eleni. Yn ôl fy symiau i, mae hynny'n gynydd o ryw 70 y cant. Gallwch ddadlau nad yw'n ddigon, ond mae'n sicr yn gynydd yn hytrach nag yn ostyngiad. Oni allwch ddeall hynny, awgrymaf fod rhywbeth o'i le arnoch.

Alun Cairns: Ildiwch.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Alun Cairns, nid yw am adael ichi ymyrryd. Dywedodd ‘na’ wrth Brynle Williams ac mae'n dweud ‘na’ wrthy chithau. [*Torri ar draws.*] Alun Cairns, eisteddwch.

Alun Ffred Jones: Clywsom lawer iawn hefyd am y diffyg trafndiaeth yng Nghymru. Yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Siambr, clywsom y Toriaid yn lladd ar y ffaith ein bod yn gwella cysylltiadau trafndiaeth yng Nghymru am eu bod am wario'r arian mewn mannau eraill. Rhaid iddynt fod yn weddol gyson ynglŷn â hyn.

Yr wyf am ddychwelyd at fater ehangach marchnata Cymru dramor. Nid dim ond gwaith Croeso Cymru yw hynny, ond gwaith y Llywodraeth drwyddi draw. Yn gyffredinol, yr wyf yn meddwl ein bod ar y trywydd iawn. Yr ydym wedi profi heddiw fod y diwydiant twristiaeth yng Nghymru'n werthfawr, nid yn unig o safbwynt economaidd, ond hefyd o safbwynt cymdeithasol.

5.50 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree amendment 1. Does any Member object? I see that there is objection. Therefore, I will defer all voting on this item until voting time.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw bod gwelliant 1 yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiad. Felly, gohiriaf yr holl bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Votes deferred until voting time.*

Y Gyllideb Atodol The Supplementary Budget

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): I move that

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly, in accordance with Standing Order No. 27.21, approves the supplementary budget for the financial year 2009-10 laid in the Table Office by the Minister for Business and Budget and e-mailed to Assembly Members on Tuesday, 23 February 2010. (NNDM4424)

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 27.21, yn cymeradwyo'r gyllideb atodol ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2009-10, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno gan y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ddydd Mawrth, 23 Chwefror 2010. (NNDM4424)

This supplementary budget motion proposes a number of changes to the first supplementary budget for 2009-10, approved by the Assembly in October 2009. Supplementary budgets serve to align budgets with the resources available and to reflect in-year changes to plans designed to maximise the delivery of our strategic priorities. The supplementary budget is largely administrative in nature, reflecting budget transfers between portfolios and reprioritisations within portfolios. A number of additional allocations from reserves are also outlined, augmented by end-year flexibility drawn down and capital budgets brought forward.

Mae'r cynnig hwn ynglŷn â'r gyllideb atodol yn cynnig nifer o newidiadau yn y gyllideb atodol gyntaf ar gyfer 2009-10, a gymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad ym mis Hydref 2009. Diben cyllidebau atodol yw cysoni cyllidebau â'r adnoddau sydd ar gael ac adlewyrchu newidiadau mewn cynlluniau yn ystod y flwyddyn gyda'r nod o sicrhau bod ein blaenoriaethau strategol yn cael eu cyflawni hyd yr eithaf. Cyllideb weinyddol ei natur yw'r gyllideb atodol hon yn bennaf. Mae'n adlewyrchu trosglwyddo elfennau o'r gyllideb o'r naill bortffolio i'r llall ac ail-flaenoriaethu o fewn portffolios. Cyfeirir hefyd at nifer o ddyraniadau ychwanegol o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn, ac ychwanegwyd at y rheini drwy ddefnyddio hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn a thrwy ddwyn cyllidebau cyfalaf yn eu blaen.

The total budget allocated to Assembly Government departments rises from £15.19 billion at the previous supplementary budget to £15.76 billion, which is an increase of just under £570 million. A significant proportion of the increase relates to non-cash budgets—£264 million in total—but there is also an allocation of £97 million to reflect the external borrowings of Finance Wales.

Bydd cyfanswm y gyllideb a ddyrannwyd i adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn codi o £15.19 biliwn yn y gyllideb atodol flaenorol i £15.76 biliwn, sy'n gynydd o ychydig o dan £570 miliwn. Mae cyfran sylweddol o'r cynnydd yn berthnasol i gyllidebau nad ydynt yn arian parod—cyfanswm o £264 miliwn—ond ceir hefyd ddyraniad o £97 miliwn i adlewyrchu benthyciadau allanol Cyllid

Cymru.

Other notable elements include: £87 million for the NHS to address non-recurrent pressures and to meet the costs associated with swine flu; a sum of £63.3 million for strategic capital investment fund projects, to help to improve our public transport infrastructure, support the delivery of affordable homes, and tackle climate change; £26.4 million for education and skills, provided to meet budgetary pressures from increased demand for student finance; and support provided under the ReAct initiative.

A total of £14 million has been allocated for EU programme pressures, to cover programme level losses and exchange rate variations. These EU programmes are expected to have created around 46,000 net new jobs and 2,000 new small and medium-sized enterprises, and to have helped around 96,000 unemployed or economically inactive people into work or training.

There is £10 million for the invest-to-save fund. Round 1 of the fund resulted in 25 projects being supported. Thirty-four expressions of interest were submitted for round 2 and a further announcement on successful projects will be made shortly.

An explanatory note and tables accompany the formal supplementary budget motion, and I hope that Assembly Members found them helpful. The changes in additional allocations proposed in the supplementary budget reflect the Assembly Government's continuing commitment to deliver the 'One Wales' agenda and, in doing so, to enable Wales to weather the tough economic conditions effectively.

Finally, I thank the Assembly's Finance Committee for its scrutiny of the second supplementary budget motion for 2009-10 and its subsequent report. I have written to the Chair of the Finance Committee today with further information on the actions outlined in the committee's report.

Elfennau nodedig eraill yw: £87 miliwn i'r GIG i fynd i'r afael â phwysau nad ydynt yn codi'n rheolaidd ac i dalu am y costau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â fflwch moch; swm o £63.3 miliwn ar gyfer prosiectau'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol, er mwyn cynorthwyo i wella'n seilwaith trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, cynorthwyo i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy, a mynd i'r afael â'r newid yn yr hinsawdd; £26.4 miliwn ar gyfer addysg a sgiliau, er mwyn ymateb i'r pwysau ar y gyllideb yn sgil galw cynyddol am gyllid myfyrwyr; a chymorth a ddarperir o dan gynllun ReAct.

Dyrannwyd cyfanswm o £14 miliwn ar gyfer pwysau o dan raglenni'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, i dalu am golledion ar lefel rhaglenni ac amrywiadau yn y gyfradd gyfnewid. Disgwylir y bydd y rhaglenni hyn o dan yr Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi creu tua 46,000 o swyddi newydd net a 2,000 o gwmnïau bach a chanolig newydd, gan gynorthwyo tua 96,000 o bobl ddi-waith neu economaidd anweithgar i gael gwaith neu hyfforddiant.

Ceir £10 miliwn ar gyfer y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed. Canlyniad rownd gyntaf y gronfa oedd bod 25 o brosiectau wedi cael cymorth. Cyflwynwyd 34 o geisiadau'n mynegi diddordeb ar gyfer rownd 2 a rhoddir cyhoeddiad arall ynglŷn â'r prosiectau llwyddiannus cyn bo hir.

Ceir nodyn esboniadol a thablau gyda'r cynnig ffurfiol ar gyfer cyllideb atodol, a gobeithiaf i'r rhain fod o gymorth i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae'r newidiadau yn y dyraniadau ychwanegol a gynigir yn y gyllideb atodol yn dangos ymrwymiad parhaus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wireddu agenda 'Cymru'n Un', ac, wrth wneud hynny, i alluogi Cymru i oroesi'r amgylchiadau economaidd anodd yn effeithiol.

Yn olaf, hoffwn ddiolch i Bwyllgor Cyllid y Cynulliad am graffu ar gynnig yr ail gyllideb atodol ar gyfer 2009-10 a'r adroddiad a'i dilynodd. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid heddiw'n rhoi rhagor o wybodaeth am y camau y cyfeirir atynt yn adroddiad y pwyllgor.

Ann Jones: I speak on behalf of the Finance Committee in the absence of the Chair, Angela Burns. As the Minister has just said, the Finance Committee undertook scrutiny of the supplementary budget, and we met her and her officials on 3 March to that end.

We noted the Government's explanation that the supplementary budget was mainly administrative in nature and that it reflects reprioritisations within portfolios and a number of budgetary transfers between portfolios. The Finance Committee also noted that the supplementary budget includes a transfer of £1.161 million from the Assembly Commission's revenue departmental expenditure limit to its capital DEL. It also includes a small £11,000 adjustment in respect of the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales. Neither of these results in any net increase in expenditure.

The committee's report commented on a number of issues, and I will highlight just a couple of these in this debate. We noted that the largest element of the change is an increase of £351.61 million for health and social services, which includes £27 million in respect of the costs associated with swine flu. The level of swine flu vaccinations required has proven to be lower than that forecast, which has resulted in a significant surplus stock. The Minister for Business and Budget told the Finance Committee that, as well as paying for the costs of vaccine stocks, there was a need to fund an award payment to GPs for administering the vaccination programme. The Finance Committee has previously been concerned about the way in which resources have been provided for the possibility of a flu pandemic. In its report, it commented on the draft budget for 2009-10 and the way in which the provision for that was being made from capital. The Finance Committee will return to that issue.

The Finance Committee also noted that the supplementary budget includes an allocation of £97 million from reserves to reflect the external borrowings of Finance Wales. The Minister for Business and Budget told the Finance Committee that these had been the subject of ongoing discussions between the Government and the Treasury, and that

Ann Jones: Siaradaf ar ran y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn absenoldeb y Cadeirydd, Angela Burns. Fel y mae'r Gweinidog newydd ddweud, bu'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn craffu ar y gyllideb atodol, gan gyfarfod â hi ac a'i swyddogion ar 3 Mawrth at y diben hwnnw.

Nodwyd esboniad y Llywodraeth mai cyllideb o natur weinyddol yn bennaf oedd y gyllideb atodol a'i bod yn adlewyrchu ail-flaenoriaethu o fewn portffolios a nifer o drosglwyddiadau cyllidebol o'r naill bortffolio i'r llall. Nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid hefyd fod y gyllideb atodol yn cynnwys trosglwyddo £1.161 miliwn o derfyn gwariant adrannol refeniw Comisiwn y Cynulliad i'w derfyn gwariant adrannol cyfalaf. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys addasiad bach o £11,000 ar gyfer Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru. Nid yw'r un o'r rhain yn golygu cynnydd net mewn gwariant.

Yr oedd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn sôn am nifer o faterion ac ni thynnaf sylw ond at ddau o'r rhain yn y ddatl hon. Nodwyd mai'r elfen fwyaf o ran y newid yw cynnydd o £351.61 miliwn ar gyfer iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, sy'n cynnwys £27 miliwn ar gyfer y costau cysylltiedig â fflw moch. Ni fu angen cynifer o frechiadau fflw moch ag a broffwydwyd, a hynny'n golygu bod gennym stoc sylweddol dros ben. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod angen talu i feddygon teulu am weinyddu'r rhaglen frechu, yn ogystal â thalu am gostau'r brechlyn. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi bod yn poeni yn y gorffennol am y ffordd y mae adnoddau wedi'u darparu ar gyfer y posibilrwydd y bydd pandemig fflw. Yn ei adroddiad, soniodd am y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2009-10 a'r ffordd yr oedd y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer hynny'n dod o'r arian cyfalaf. Bydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn dychwelyd at y mater hwnnw.

Nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid hefyd fod y gyllideb atodol yn cynnwys dyraniad o £97 miliwn o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn i adlewyrchu benthyciadau allanol Cyllid Cymru. Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod y rhain wedi bod yn destun trafodaethau parhaus rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r Trysorlys a bod

options for the future funding of Finance Wales were being explored. The Finance Committee will ask the Minister to update us on these issues.

In relation to staff costs in the Welsh Government, the Finance Committee noted that, although the increase of £3 million was modest in a budget of £242 million, there was nonetheless a concern that it comes at a time of constraint, and the Finance Committee intends to explore the numbers and the cost of staff in the Welsh Government at a future date.

To conclude, the Finance Committee has noted the changes proposed in the supplementary budget motion and the Government's explanation of the reasons for them, and I am pleased to say that it does not recommend any change to the amounts proposed in the supplementary budget motion.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful to the Minister for presenting the supplementary budget and to the Finance Committee for its scrutiny.

I must admit that there is some concern that the supplementary budget, as presented, according to the case made to the Finance Committee and to the Chamber, is largely for administrative purposes. That is as may be, but, in my book, there are some significant announcements in this statement that should have warranted written or oral statements so that proper and full scrutiny of the individual elements could be given. I will go through some of those in a moment.

On behalf of the Finance Committee, Ann Jones touched on the changes made as a result of swine flu, which saw an increase of £27 million although only 350,000 people were vaccinated. That also included funds for an award payment to general practitioners. There is widespread concern about how much swine flu has cost, what the risks were, and how effective the strategy to deal with it was. If the money is being spent, it needs to be accounted for, and that is fine, but lessons need to be learned about how that money was spent and how effectively it was

dewisiadau ar gyfer ariannu Cyllid Cymru yn y dyfodol yn cael eu hystyried. Bydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y materion hyn.

O ran costau staff yn Llywodraeth Cymru, nododd y Pwyllgor Cyllid, er bod y cynnydd o £3 miliwn yn gymharol fach mewn cyllideb sy'n werth £242 miliwn, ei bod er hynny'n destun pryder bod hyn yn digwydd ar adeg o dynhau, ac mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn bwriadu edrych ar niferoedd a chostau staff Llywodraeth Cymru rywbryd yn y dyfodol.

I gloi, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi nodi'r newidiadau a gynigir yng nghynnig y gyllideb atodol ac esboniad y Llywodraeth am y rhesymau drostynt, ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud nad yw'n argymhell dim newid yn y symiau a gynigir yng nghynnig y gyllideb atodol.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am gyflwyno'r gyllideb atodol ac i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid am ei waith craffu.

Rhaid imi gyfaddef bod rhywfaint o bryder ynglŷn â'r honiad mai at ddibenion gweinyddol yn bennaf y mae'r gyllideb atodol, fel y'i cyflwynir, yn ôl y ddadl a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ac i'r Siambr. Efallai fod hynny'n wir, ond yn fy ngolwg i, mae nifer o gyhoeddiadau o bwys yn y datganiad hwn a ddylasai warantu datganiad ysgrifenedig neu lafar er mwyn inni allu craffu'n briodol ac yn llawn ar yr elfennau unigol. Af drwy rai o'r rheini mewn munud.

Ar ran y Pwyllgor Cyllid, crybwyllodd Ann Jones y newidiadau yn sgîl fflw moch, sef cynnydd o £27 miliwn er na chafodd ond 350,000 o bobl eu brechu. Yr oedd hynny hefyd yn cynnwys arian i dalu i feddygon teulu. Ceir pryder cyffredinol ynghylch cost fflw moch, beth oedd y peryglon, a pha mor effeithiol oedd y strategaeth i ymdrin ag ef. Os yw'r arian yn cael ei wario, mae angen rhoi cyfrif amdano, ac mae hynny'n iawn, ond mae angen dysgu gwersi ynglŷn â sut y gwariwyd yr arian hwnnw a pha mor effeithiol y cafodd ei weinyddu. Dylai fod yn

administered. It should be subjected to appropriate scrutiny, because £27 million is a significant sum.

There is a cut of £5.4 million to the budget line for Flexible Support for Business. That probably reflects the fact that only 20 per cent of the budget has been spent within the first seven months. It is an abject failure on the part of the administration that a flagship scheme is spending so little money. I would have thought that a written or an oral statement would be appropriate to give the details of why that is the case. That would have allowed Assembly Members to question the strategy of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Minister in respect of this so-called 'flagship' scheme, which enterprise agencies, businesses and their representative organisations seem to be complaining about. Flexible Support for Business is a bureaucratic nightmare compared with the former general business advisory service, which we were all so familiar with before the change, which, at times, appeared to be for its own sake.

It would also be helpful to have the Minister's response to other matters, including the £2.5 million of income that comes to the Assembly Government from its lands that have windfarms sited on them. That £2.5 million is going into the reserve, but surely it should really be going to the communities that are affected by the blight of windfarms. That is what happens when the private sector sets up a windfarm: businesses invest in the communities and the people affected by such developments.

Finally, I express my concern and raise an eyebrow at the additional capital funding that is going to the Assembly Government building and estate in north Wales. It is not an insignificant sum and I just wish that we could have had further details on that. A written or oral statement would have been more effective than bringing it all together in a supplementary budget, in the hope of some of the issues getting lost in the detail, thereby avoiding some embarrassment for the administration.

destun craffu priodol oherwydd y mae £27 miliwn yn swm sylweddol.

Torrwyd £5.4 miliwn oddi ar y llinell yn y gyllideb ar gyfer Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes. Mae hynny, mae'n debyg, yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith mai dim ond 20 y cant o'r gyllideb sydd wedi'i wario yn ystod y saith mis cyntaf. Mae'n fethiant llwyr ar ran y weinyddiaeth hon fod cynllun blaenllaw yn gwario cyn lleied o arian. Byddwn wedi tybio y byddai datganiad ysgrifenedig neu lafar yn briodol er mwyn rhoi'r manylion i esbonio hynny. Byddai hynny wedi rhoi cyfle i Aelodau'r Cynulliad gwestiynu strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Gweinidog yng nghyswllt y cynllun hwn a elwir yn gynllun 'blaenllaw', y mae asiantaethau menter, busnesau a'r sefydliadau sy'n eu cynrychioli i bob golwg yn cwyno amdano. Mae Cymorth Hyblyg i Fusnes yn hunllef fiwrocraidaidd o'i gymharu â'r gwasanaeth cyngori cyffredinol i fusnesau a oedd ar gael gynt, ac yr oeddem i gyd mor gyfarwydd ag ef cyn y newid—newid a oedd ar brydiau fel petai'n newid er mwyn newid.

Byddai'n gymorth hefyd cael ymateb y Gweinidog i faterion eraill, gan gynnwys yr incwm gwerth £2.5 miliwn a ddaw i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn sgîl y tir y mae'n berchen arno lle y gosodwyd ffermydd gwynt. Mae'r £2.5 miliwn hwnnw'n mynd i'r arian wrth gefn, ond siawns na ddylai mewn gwirionedd fod yn mynd i'r cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt gan bla ffermydd gwynt. Dyna sy'n digwydd pan fydd y sector preifat yn sefydlu fferm wynt: bydd busnesau'n buddsoddi yn y cymunedau ac yn y bobl y mae datblygiadau o'r fath yn effeithio arnynt.

Yn olaf, yr wyf yn mynegi fy mhryder ac yn synnu wrth weld yr arian cyfalaf ychwanegol sy'n mynd at adeilad ac ystâd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn y gogledd. Nid yw'n swm ansylweddol ac yr wyf yn gresynu na allasem gael rhagor o fanylion am hynny. Byddai datganiad ysgrifenedig neu lafar wedi bod yn fwy effeithiol na dod â'r cyfan at ei gilydd mewn cyllideb atodol, gan obeithio y byddai rhai o'r materion yn mynd ar goll yn y manylion, a thrwy hynny osgoi rhywfaint o embaras i'r weinyddiaeth.

Andrew Davies: I thank the Minister for finance for bringing the supplementary budget before the Finance Committee. The committee generally recognised that, as on previous occasions, it was largely an administrative measure.

6.00 p.m.

I will make two points. I wish to bring to the wider attention of Members that £40 million was set aside for the invest-to-save fund to drive efficiency savings across the public sector. A lack of demand from outside bodies, largely, has meant that only 25 per cent of the fund—£10 million of the £40 million—has been allocated for that purpose. In view of the Wales Audit Office's report that was published this morning about the challenges facing public services in Wales at a time of financial constraint, I find it significant but disappointing that there was little demand for the invest-to-save fund, even when public bodies had requested that such a public pump-priming fund be established. I know that the Minister for Business and Budget feels the same as we did in the Finance Committee that this is disappointing. I still do not think that public services across Wales recognise the challenge facing them if they can, literally, look a gift horse in the mouth. One further education college told me that it did not make an application because it was an interest-free loan as opposed to a grant. If it had been a grant, it would have applied, but it was an interest-free loan, so the college was not interested. That, unfortunately, goes to the heart of the culture of too many public service providers in Wales.

The second point, which was referred to by Ann Jones, is about the committee's request for information on the number of civil servants working for the Welsh Assembly Government. It is disappointing that we and the Minister for Business and Budget have still not been provided with that information. That may reflect the challenges facing the public sector in Wales; even when a committee and a Minister request that information, it is still not forthcoming. I hope that my intervention might help to speed up the process.

Andrew Davies: Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros gyllid am ddod â'r gyllideb atodol gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn cydnabod yn gyffredinol mai mesur gweinyddol oedd hwn i raddau helaeth, fel yn y gorffennol.

Gwnaf ddau bwynt. Dymunaf dynnu sylw ehangach yr Aelodau at y ffaith bod £40 miliwn wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed i sbarduno arbedion effeithlonrwydd ar draws y sector cyhoeddus. Oherwydd diffyg galw gan gyrff allanol yn bennaf, dim ond 25 y cant o'r gronfa—£10 miliwn o'r £40 miliwn—sydd wedi'i ddyrranu at y diben hwnnw. O ystyried adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma ynglŷn â'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru ar adeg o dynhau ariannol, yr wyf yn ei chael yn arwyddocaol ond yn siomedig mai ychydig o alw a oedd am y gronfa buddsoddi i arbed, hyd yn oed pan oedd cyrff cyhoeddus wedi gofyn am sefydlu cronfa ysgogi o'r fath. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb yn teimlo fel ninnau yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod hyn yn siomedig. Nid wyf yn credu eto fod gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ar draws Cymru'n sylweddoli'r her sy'n eu hwynebu, os gallant, yn llythrennol, wrthod rhodd. Dywedodd un coleg addysg bellach wrthyf nad ymgeisiodd amdano am mai benthyciad di-log ydoedd yn hytrach na grant. Petasai'n grant, byddai wedi ymgeisio, ond benthyciad di-log ydoedd, felly nid oedd gan y coleg ddiddordeb. Yn anffodus, mae hynny'n mynd at wraidd diwylliant gormod o ddarparwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Mae a wnelo'r ail bwynt, y cyfeiriodd Ann Jones ato, â chais y pwyllgor am wybodaeth ynglŷn â nifer y gweision sifil sy'n gweithio i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n siomedig nad ydym ni na'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb wedi cael y wybodaeth honno eto. Efallai fod hynny'n adlewyrchu'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu'r sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru; hyd yn oed pan fydd pwyllgor a Gweinidog yn gofyn am y wybodaeth honno, nid yw'n dod o hyd. Gobeithio y bydd fy myriad o ryw gymorth i gyflymu'r broses.

Jenny Randerson: This supplementary budget is different to previous supplementary budgets, in that it is no longer largely administrative—this is no longer about tidying up the edges. That is not to say that some of the things within it are not welcome, and I specifically pick out the additional money for the Open University. The Welsh Liberal Democrats were critical at the time of the budget of the low funding settlement for further education and higher education, and, as a result, we welcome additional money.

However, we have considerable concerns about the procedure by which this budget has come forward, and the lack of ability to give it the type of scrutiny given to the main budget. To give you a little history about the way in which we as a party dealt with the main budget, we were critical of various decisions in it and we came forward with additional proposals—for example, £30 million to reverse the education cuts. The Government was quick to criticise us, saying that it was not reasonable to ask for that additional money. However, the supplementary budget shows that there is enormous flexibility in the Government's finances. We are asked to approve a budget that brings in an additional £569 million from reserves and end of year flexibility. Suddenly, our £30 million—complained about by the Government so strongly a few months ago—pales into insignificance.

We accept that not all of the money in the supplementary budget is readily available in the form of cash. Some changes are technical, non-cash adjustments. However, £106 million has been taken from reserves. It seems that the Government has two rules: one for the opposition parties and one for itself. Two years ago, the Government built up a massive slush fund in the reserves, and when we asked why it had done so, we were told that it was financially prudent to do so and that we were financially irresponsible for questioning it. Now, however, the Government is plundering those reserves, which we questioned and on which we were shot down about two years ago.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r gyllideb atodol hon yn wahanol i gyllidebau atodol blaenorol, oherwydd nid cyllideb weinyddol yn bennaf ydyw bellach—nid mater o dwitio o gwmpas yr ymylon yw hyn rhagor. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad yw rhai o'r pethau sydd ynddi'n bethau i'w croesawu, a chyfeiriaf yn benodol at yr arian ychwanegol i'r Brifysgol Agored. Yr oedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n feirniadol adeg y gyllideb o'r setliad ariannu isel ar gyfer addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, ac, felly, yr ydym yn croesawu arian ychwanegol.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn poeni o ddifrif am weithdrefn cyflwyno'r gyllideb hon, a'r diffyg gallu i graffu arni yn yr un ffordd ag y craffwyd ar y brif gyllideb. A rhoi ychydig o hanes ichi ynglŷn â sut yr aethom ni fel plaid ati i ymdrin â'r brif gyllideb, yr oeddem yn feirniadol o wahanol benderfyniadau ynddi, a chynigiasom gynigion ychwanegol—er enghraifft, £30 miliwn i wrthdroi'r toriadau addysg. Fe'n beirniadwyd yn ddi-oed gan y Llywodraeth, gan ddweud nad oedd yn rhesymol gofyn am yr arian ychwanegol hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, dengys y gyllideb atodol fod hyblygrwydd enfawr yng nghronfeydd ariannol y Llywodraeth. Gofynnir inni gymeradwyo cyllideb sy'n dod â £569 miliwn yn ychwanegol o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn a hyblygrwydd diwedd blwyddyn. Yn sydyn, mae ein £30 miliwn—y bu'r Llywodraeth yn cwyno cymaint amdano ychydig fisoedd yn ôl—yn swm disylw iawn.

Derbyniwn nad yw'r holl arian yn y gyllideb atodol ar gael yn rhwydd ar ffurf arian parod. Mae rhai o'r newidiadau'n dechnegol ac yn addasiadau nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag arian parod. Serch hynny, tynnwyd £106 miliwn o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn. Ymddengys fod gan y Llywodraeth ddwy reol: un i'r gwrthbleidiau ac un iddi hi ei hun. Ddwy flynedd yn ôl, cronnodd y Llywodraeth gronfa gyfleus enfawr yn y cronfeydd wrth gefn, a phan ofynasom iddi pam yr oedd yn gwneud hynny, dywedwyd wrthym fod hynny'n ddoeth i'w wneud o safbwynt ariannol a'n bod yn anghyfrifol o safbwynt ariannol am gwestiynu hynny. Yn awr, serch hynny, mae'r Llywodraeth yn ysbeilio'r cronfeydd wrth gefn hynny, rhywbeth yr oeddem ni'n ei gwestiynu ac yn cael ein

beirniadu'n llym am wneud hynny ddwy flynedd yn ôl.

We will take no lectures in future from the Government on financial prudence, because we believe that this way of dealing with the reserves is not prudent, when we await massive cuts in public spending next year. If any of you doubt that, read the auditor general's report that was issued this morning. The scale of those cuts is massive. One wonders why the reserves are being dipped into at this time, mid-year, when that money should be conserved in order to help to offset the shock that will thunder through the political system next year at every level and in every budget. To the Government, I say that either the reserves at the time of the budget last year were left deliberately large so that they could be used, mid-year, for projects that were largely anticipated or they are being plundered too far because the Government had not anticipated things that it should have anticipated. You can have it one way or you can have it the other, but you cannot have it both ways.

Chris Franks: I will highlight the money in the supplementary budget for education, the economy and the environment. With the money for education, we are investing in our future, and increasing funds for lifelong learning. Revenue funding of over £26 million is being provided to meet the pressures from the downturn. We are investing, as has been mentioned, over £7 million in the Open University; an extra £4.3 million for those facing redundancy, with our ReAct programme; and £14 million for student finance. We are taking a long-term view. By upskilling our workforce, we are putting money in the universally welcomed ReAct programme and reaffirming our commitment to flexible and lifelong learning. Plaid in Government is working hard to lessen the blow of the recession, by improving skills, training and opportunity for the people of Wales.

I welcome the £17 million provided to fund a low-carbon region in the Heads of the

Ni wrandawn ar yr un ddarlith gan y Llywodraeth yn y dyfodol am ddoethineb ariannol, oherwydd credwn nad yw'r ffordd hon o ymdrin â'r cronfeydd wrth gefn yn ddoeth, a ninnau'n rhagweld toriadau enfawr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus y flwyddyn nesaf. Os oes unrhyw un ohonoch yn amau hynny, darllenwch adroddiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol a gyhoeddwyd y bore yma. Mae maint y toriadau hynny'n anferth. Mae rhywun yn pendroni pam mae'r Llywodraeth yn tyrchu i'r cronfeydd wrth gefn yn awr, yng nghanol y flwyddyn, pan ddylid cadw'r arian hwnnw er mwyn ceisio gwrthbwysu'r sioc a fydd yn diasbedain drwy'r drefn wleidyddol y flwyddyn nesaf ar bob lefel ac ym mhob cyllideb. Wrth y Llywodraeth, dywedaf fod y cronfeydd wrth gefn adeg y gyllideb y llynedd naill ai wedi'u gadael yn fwrriadol fawr, er mwyn gallu eu defnyddio yng nghanol y flwyddyn ar gyfer prosiectau a ragwelwyd i raddau helaeth, neu eu bod yn cael eu gordefnyddio oherwydd nad oedd y Llywodraeth wedi rhagweld pethau y dylasai eu rhagweld. Gallwch fod yn bleidiol i'r naill safbwynt neu'r llall, ond ni allwch fod yn bleidiol i'r ddau fel ei gilydd.

Chris Franks: Tynnaf sylw at yr arian sydd yn y gyllideb atodol ar gyfer addysg, yr economi a'r amgylchedd. Gyda'r arian ar gyfer addysg, yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn ein dyfodol, ac yn cynyddu'r arian ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes. Darperir arian refeniw gwerth dros £26 miliwn i ymateb i'r pwysau yn sgîl y dirywiad. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi, fel y crybwyllwyd, dros £7 miliwn yn y Brifysgol Agored; £4.3 yn ychwanegol ar gyfer y rhai sy'n wynebu colli eu gwaith, gyda'n rhaglen ReAct; ac £14 miliwn ar gyfer ariannu myfyrwyr. Yr ydym yn arddel safbwynt hirdymor. Drwy wella sgiliau ein gweithlu, yr ydym yn rhoi arian i'r rhaglen ReAct sy'n cael croeso gan bawb ac yn ailgadarnhau ein hymrwymiad i ddysgu hyblyg a dysgu gydol oes. Mae Plaid Cymru yn y Llywodraeth yn gweithio'n galed i liniaru poen y dirwasgiad, drwy wella sgiliau a hyfforddiant a thrwy roi cyfle i bobl Cymru.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r £17 miliwn a ddarperir i dalu am ranbarth carbon isel ym Mlaenau'r

Valleys, the development of the dualling of the A465 Heads of the Valleys road and investment in railways between north and south, east and west. Over £29 million has been allocated to support the delivery of affordable homes across Wales, to provide an all-Wales low-carbon building programme, to drive down our carbon dioxide emission levels and to reduce the impact of fuel poverty. The money will also support flood and coastal defences. These funds are welcome, but we would be getting a fairer share of public resources if we had a needs-based formula for Wales, as pointed out by the independent Holtham report. We are missing out on £300 million per annum. Can the Minister indicate what recent discussions she has had with her colleagues in London about funding reforms?

Further to that, we need fiscal powers to stimulate sustainable economic growth. We are using our resources to equip our workforce, whereas the Conservatives would slash and burn, as usual; they are the same old Tories. Severe Tory cuts would, once again, cripple Welsh communities, just as they did when they were last in power.

The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt): It is important, Ann, in speaking on behalf of the Finance Committee, that there was a recognition that many of the issues raised with me in scrutiny have been addressed, not only in my response to the Finance Committee report but in front of the committee. It is important that you were able to draw attention to particular matters that were raised at the Finance Committee that can be taken forward.

6.10 p.m.

You raised the issue of preparedness for swine flu and I was glad to be able to draw attention at the committee meeting, as you said, to the importance of recognising that we had to be prepared, not only with our stocks of vaccine, but also regarding general practitioners. Further work can be commissioned on this, which we would be happy to supply to the Finance Committee.

Cymoedd, i ddatblygu deuoli'r A465, ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd ac i fuddsoddi yn y rheilffyrdd rhwng y gogledd a'r de, a'r dwyrain a'r gorllewin. Mae dros £29 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu i gynorthwyo i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy ledled Cymru, i ddarparu rhaglen adeiladu carbon isel Cymru gyfan, i leihau lefelau allyriadau carbon deuocsid ac i leihau effaith tlodi tanwydd. Bydd yr arian hefyd yn cynorthwyo i wella amddiffynfeydd rhag llifogydd ac amddiffynfeydd ar y glannau. Mae'r arian hwn i'w groesawu, ond byddem yn cael cyfran decach o adnoddau cyhoeddus petai gennym fformiwlâ seiliedig ar anghenion ar gyfer Cymru, fel y dywedodd adroddiad annibynnol Holtham. Yr ydym £300 miliwn y flwyddyn ar ein colled. A all y Gweinidog ddweud pa drafodaethau y mae wedi'u cael yn ddiweddar gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion yn Llundain ynglŷn â diwygio'r drefn ariannu?

At hynny, mae angen pwerau ariannol arnom i ysgogi twf economaidd cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn defnyddio'n hadnoddau i arfogi ein gweithlu, lle y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn tocio ac yn llosgi, fel arfer; yr un hen Doriaid ydynt. Byddai toriadau llym gan y Toriaid unwaith eto'n dinistrio cymunedau Cymru, yn union fel y gwnaethant y tro diwethaf yr oeddent wrth y llyw.

Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt): Mae'n bwysig, Ann, wrth siarad ar ran y Pwyllgor Cyllid, fod y pwyllgor wedi cydnabod bod llawer o'r materion a godwyd gyda mi yn ystod y craffu wedi cael sylw, nid yn unig yn fy ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ond gerbron y pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig ichi allu tynnu sylw at faterion penodol a godwyd yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid y gellir bwrw ymlaen â hwy.

Soniasoch am fod yn barod ar gyfer fflw moch ac yr oeddwn yn falch o allu tynnu sylw yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor, fel y dywedasoch, at bwysigrwydd sylweddoli bod yn rhaid inni fod yn barod, nid yn unig o ran bod gennym stoc o'r brechlyn, ond hefyd o ran meddygon teulu. Gellir comisiynu rhagor o waith ar hyn, y byddem yn falch o'i ddarparu ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Fodd

However, I also recognise the points that you made, Alun; supplementary budgets enable us to use our resources to best effect, and that will include reprioritisation. In fact, on the windfarm receipts that you mentioned, these have been used to fund Welsh Assembly Government priorities; Chris made that point in his contribution. I am happy to write about the Assembly Government estate, and delighted that the building at Llandudno Junction is on its way. It will be an excellent building, not just according to BREEAM standards, but also in relocating staff to north Wales.

I also recognise the points that Andrew Davies made. I have to say that I have learned many lessons from him, as a former Minister for finance, about how to be prudent and skilful with the allocation of our resources. I recognise that the invest-to-save fund, which he introduced in 2009, was about supporting public service organisations to transform the way that they work, so that they become more efficient while continuing to provide quality public services. Although we have supported 25 projects, announced in two tranches, making a total investment of £11.3 million, I am glad that we have also had 34 expressions of interest, which are currently under consideration. I will shortly be making an announcement on the next tranche. It is also good to know that, of those 34, a large number come from the NHS, which is rising to the challenge as well as local government and other public sector organisations. I know that the Minister for Health and Social Services will be pleased to hear that.

The point that Andrew made about ensuring that we are clear about our starting levels, cuts and increases is an important one. Some of that information is in the public domain, and it is a case of ensuring that it is fully available for the Finance Committee. I can promise that it will be formally submitted to the Finance Committee next week. I also recognise the impact that the changes and mergers have had on these figures, and I want to ensure that the Finance Committee has

bynag, yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod y pwyntiau a wnaethoch, Alun; mae cyllidebau atodol yn ein galluogi i ddefnyddio'n hadnoddau yn y ffordd orau un, a bydd hynny'n cynnwys ailflaenoriaethu. A dweud y gwir, o ran yr arian gan y ffermydd gwynt a grybwyllwyd gennych, mae'r arian hwnnw wedi'i ddefnyddio i ariannu blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Cyfeiriodd Chris at hynny yn ei gyfraniad. Byddaf yn falch o ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn ag ystâd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd bod yr adeilad yng Nghyffordd Llandudno ar ei ffordd. Bydd yn adeilad rhagorol, nid dim ond o ran safonau BREEAM, ond hefyd o ran symud staff i'r gogledd.

Yr wyf hefyd yn cydnabod y pwyntiau a wnaeth Andrew Davies. Rhaid imi ddweud fy mod wedi dysgu llawer o wersi ganddo, ac yntau'n gyn Weinidog dros gyllid, ynglŷn â sut y mae bod yn ddoeth ac yn fedrus wrth ddyrannu'n hadnoddau. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod a wnelo'r gronfa buddsoddi i arbed a gyflwynwyd ganddo yn 2009 â chynorthwyo sefydliadau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i weddnewid eu ffordd o weithio, er mwyn iddynt ddod yn fwy effeithlon wrth barhau i ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon. Er ein bod wedi cefnogi 25 o brosiectau, a'r rheini wedi'u cyhoeddi mewn dwy gyfran, gyda buddsoddiad sy'n werth cyfanswm o £11.3 miliwn, yr wyf yn falch inni hefyd gael 34 cais yn mynegi diddordeb, sydd wrthi'n cael eu hystyried. Byddaf yn cyhoeddi'r gyfran nesaf cyn bo hir. Mae'n dda gwybod hefyd, o blith y 34 hynny, fod nifer fawr ohonynt gan y GIG, sy'n wynebu'r her yn ogystal â llywodraeth leol a chyrrff eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus. Gwn y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn falch o glywed hynny.

Mae'r pwynt a wnaeth Andrew ynglŷn â sicrhau ein bod yn glir ynglŷn â'n lefelau cychwyn, ein toriadau ac unrhyw gynnydd, yn bwynt pwysig. Mae rhywfaint o'r wybodaeth honno'n gyhoeddus, a mater o sicrhau ei fod ar gael yn llwyr i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ydyw. Gallaf addo y caiff ei chyflwyno'n ffurfiol i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yr wythnos nesaf. Yr wyf yn cydnabod hefyd yr effaith y mae newidiadau ac uno wedi'i chael ar y ffigurau hyn, ac yr wyf am sicrhau bod y

those in full. We have to recognise that that takes us from 2,577 full-time-equivalent members of staff in 1999 up to over 6,000 in the latest figures that I have.

Jenny also made some important points. As I said in response to Chris, we have been skilful and prudent in our reallocation of resources to support education. Jenny mentioned the additional £7.7 million for the Open University, and that was a specific allocation from reserves to fund the operation of the OU in Wales, and that followed the transfer of responsibility back in 2005. It is important, as Chris said, that we have delivered on our objectives; we have responded to the downturn in the economy with counter-cyclical measures, which have benefited student finance and ReAct in the ways that I described. I want to finish by following up Jenny's point that we have, as a result of the challenges that we face, growing pressure on public finances, which will impact on people's lives. The additional funds released by the 2009-10 supplementary budget reflect decisions that we have taken to support further education, skills development and training. They will help us to prepare for the tight fiscal environment in the coming years. We are taking the necessary steps to put Wales on a firm footing to emerge stronger from the economic downturn. That is our responsibility and, clearly, the scrutiny of the Finance Committee, which I am sure that I will enjoy and respond to robustly, is the way to ensure that we are using our finances to good effect. This supplementary budget proposes a number of changes to the first supplementary budget for 2009-10. It was approved by the Assembly in October 2009, and I believe that these changes and additional allocations, as well as being prudent about our reserves, will help us to continue to deliver the 'One Wales' agenda. I commend the motion to the Assembly.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: The proposal is to agree the motion. Are there any objections? I see that there are objections. Therefore, I will defer the vote until voting time.

Pwyllgor Cyllid yn cael y rheini'n llawn. Rhaid inni gydnabod bod hynny'n golygu bod nifer y staff llawnamser wedi cynyddu o 2,577 yn 1999 i dros 6,000 yn y ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennyf.

Gwnaeth Jenny nifer o bwyntiau pwysig hefyd. Fel y dywedais wrth ymateb i Chris, yr ydym wedi bod yn fedrus ac yn ddoeth wrth ailddyrrannu adnoddau i gefnogi addysg. Soniodd Jenny am y £7.7 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer y Brifysgol Agored, ac yr oedd hwnnw'n ddyraniad penodol o'r cronfeydd wrth gefn i dalu am waith y Brifysgol Agored yng Nghymru, a daeth hynny yn sgîl trosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb yn 2005. Mae'n bwysig, fel y dywedodd Chris, ein bod wedi cyflawni'n hamcanion; yr ydym wedi ymateb i'r dirywiad yn yr economi drwy gymryd camau gwrth-gylchol, ac mae'r rheini wedi bod o fudd i gyllid myfyrwyr ac i ReAct yn y ffyrdd a ddisgrifiwyd gennyf. Yr wyf am orffen drwy ddilyn trywydd pwynt Jenny fod gennym, oherwydd yr heriau a wynebwn, bwysau cynyddol ar arian cyhoeddus, a bydd hynny'n effeithio ar fywydau pobl. Mae'r arian ychwanegol a ryddheir drwy gyllideb atodol 2009-10 yn adlewyrchu ein penderfyniadau i gefnogi addysg bellach, datblygu sgiliau a hyfforddiant. Byddant yn gymorth inni baratoi ar gyfer yr amgylchedd ariannol tyn yn y blynyddoedd a ddaw. Yr ydym yn cymryd y camau angenrheidiol i roi troedle cadarn i Gymru er mwyn iddi gamu'n gryfach o'r dirywiad economaidd. Dyna'n cyfrifoldeb, ac, yn amlwg, gwaith craffu'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, y byddaf yr wyf yn siŵr yn ei fwynhau ac yn ymateb iddo'n drwyadl, yw'r ffordd o sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio'n harian yn dda. Mae'r gyllideb atodol hon yn cynnig nifer o newidiadau yn y gyllideb atodol gyntaf ar gyfer 2009-10. Fe'i cymeradwywyd gan y Cynulliad ym mis Hydref 2009, a chredaf y bydd y newidiadau hyn a'r dyraniadau ychwanegol, yn ogystal â bod yn ddoeth ynglŷn â'n cronfeydd wrth gefn, yn gymorth inni barhau i wireddu agenda 'Cymru'n Un'. Cymeradwyaf y cynnig i'r Cynulliad.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Y cynnig yw ein bod yn derbyn y cynnig. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod gwrthwynebiadau. Felly, gohiriaf y bleidlais tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

The Business Committee has agreed that voting time is to take place no earlier than 5 p.m., but, given that it is now after 5 p.m., I propose that we go straight to voting time. Does anyone wish for the bell to be rung? I see that no-one does.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Busnes wedi cytuno na ddylid pleidleisio cyn 5 p.m., ond gan fod 5 p.m. wedi mynd heibio erbyn hyn, cynigïaf ein bod yn symud yn syth i'r cyfnod pleidleisio. A oes unrhyw un yn dymuno imi ganu'r gloch? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y bleidlais tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.
Vote deferred until voting time.*

Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time

Cynnig NDM4438: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.

Motion NDM4438: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

Gwelliant 1 i NDM4439: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.

Amendment 1 to NDM4439: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 30.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4439: O blaid 31, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Motion NDM4439: For 31, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4432: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 1 to NDM4432: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4432: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 31.
Amendment 2 to NDM4432: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 31.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
German, Michael
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris

Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment not agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4432: O blaid 36, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM4432: For 36, Abstain 9, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
German, Michael
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Asghar, Mohammad
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4424: O blaid 31, Ymatal 15, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion NDM4424: For 31, Abstain 15, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Alun
Davies, Andrew
Evans, Nerys
Franks, Chris
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Griffiths, Lesley
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Gareth
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Law, Trish
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Andrew R.T.
Davies, Paul

German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Melding, David
Millar, Darren
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion agreed.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.18 p.m.
The meeting ended at 6.18 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)

Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)