



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru**  
**The National Assembly for Wales**

**Cofnod y Trafodion**  
**The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 10 Mawrth 2010**  
**Wednesday, 10 March 2010**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning
21	Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement
36	Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am Fesur Arfaethedig y Gymraeg Legislative Statement on the Proposed Welsh Language Measure
60	Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Cynnydd yn y Dreth Gyngor ac mewn Ardrethi Busnes Welsh Conservatives Debate: Increases in the Council Tax and Business Rates
85	Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion
86	Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar Ariannu Seilwaith Ffyrdd The Finance Committee's Report on Funding Road Infrastructure
116	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
117	Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Cau Ysgolion Welsh Conservatives Debate: School Closures
148	Cyfnod Pleidleisio Voting Time
156	Neges gan Ei Mawrhydi Y Frenhines, Pennaeth y Gymanwlad A Message from Her Majesty The Queen, Head of the Commonwealth

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches is included.

*Ailymgynullodd y Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly reconvened at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer (Dafydd Elis-Thomas) in the Chair.*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn ar gyfer cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.  
**The Presiding Officer:** Order for questions to the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning**

#### **Education Provision**

**Q1 The Leader of the Opposition (Nick Bourne):** Will the Minister make a statement on education provision in mid Wales? OAQ(3)1273(CEL)

**The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):** Education provision across mid Wales at all levels continues to receive significant funding and support from my department and from local authorities.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful to the Minister for that response. You will be aware that, last week, the issue of special educational needs funding was raised on numerous occasions across the Chamber with various Ministers. I am concerned about the proposal brought forward by the Assembly Government that seems to indicate that funding will only be at a level of 69 per cent next year, having been at 95 per cent this year, whereas previously, 100 per cent has ultimately been paid in relation to this issue. It will mean a shortfall in Powys of some £0.5 million—just over, in fact—and a shortfall across Wales of £8.5 million. I have spoken to specialist schools in my area and Ysgol Penmaes, for example, is hit in Brecon, as is Ysgol Cedewain in Newtown. This is an issue across Wales, and impacts upon the most vulnerable children and the most vulnerable part of our community. I hope that the Minister is able to give some reassurance that the Government will fund this at 100 per cent and nothing less.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am aware of the concerns that have been raised across Wales and the Chamber in respect of funding for special educational needs post 16. The reality is that we have invested significantly in post-

#### **Darpariaeth Addysg**

**C1 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth addysg yn y canolbarth? OAQ(3)1273(CEL)

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):** Mae darpariaeth addysg ar bob lefel ar draws y canolbarth yn parhau i gael cyllid a chymorth sylweddol gan fy adran a chan awdurdodau lleol.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am yr ymateb hwnnw. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod cwestiwn ariannu anghenion addysgol arbennig wedi ei godi droeon yr wythnos diwethaf ar draws y Siambr gydag amrywiol Weinidogion. Yr wyf yn bryderus am y cynnig a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd fel petai'n nodi mai 69 y cant yn unig fydd lefel yr ariannu y flwyddyn nesaf, ar ôl bod yn 95 y cant eleni, lle'r arferid ariannu'r mater hwn 100 y cant. Bydd yn golygu diffyg ym Mhowys o ryw £0.5 miliwn—ychydig dros hynny, a dweud y gwir—a diffyg ar draws Cymru o £8.5 miliwn. Yr wyf wedi siarad ag ysgolion arbenigol yn fy ardal ac mae Ysgol Pen-maes, er enghraifft, yn dioddef yn Aberhonddu, a hefyd Ysgol Cedewain yn y Drenewydd. Mae hyn yn broblem ar draws Cymru, ac yn effeithio ar y plant mwyaf bregus a'r rhan fwyaf bregus o'n cymuned. Gobeithio y gall y Gweinidog roi rhyw sicrwydd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ariannu hyn 100 y cant a dim llai.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon sydd wedi'u lleisio ar draws Cymru a'r Siambr ynglŷn ag ariannu anghenion addysgol arbennig ôl-16. Y gwirionedd yw ein bod wedi buddsoddi'n

16 SEN, and budgets have grown significantly in recent years. However, I am concerned about the current situation and have asked officials to look at what we may be able to do. We will be looking at that over the next week or two, to see whether we can do any more.

**Nerys Evans:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol o gynlluniau i ad-drefnu ysgolion ym Mhowys. Un peth sydd wedi bod yn syfrdanol yn y broses yw'r diffyg ymgynghori â thrigolion y sir a'i haelodau etholedig. Yn anffodus, nid yw Powys yn eithriad yn hynny o beth. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r broses o ad-drefnu ysgolion yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Ychydig wythnosau yn ôl, cytunodd bwrdd gweithredol y cyngor sir ar argymhellion ad-drefnu ysgolion yn ardal Dinefwr. Pan ddaeth cofnodion gerbron y cyngor llawn ddydd Gwener, nid oedd modd i aelodau etholedig y sir drafod y mater yn fanwl na chynnig gwelliannau. Y cyfan y gallent ei wneud oedd cymeradwyo cofnodion y bwrdd gweithredol. Mae hwn yn fater o bwys enfawr i drigolion yr ardal, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â darpariaeth addysg Gymraeg. Oni ddylai pob cyngor sicrhau cyfle teg i aelodau etholedig drafod cynlluniau pellgyrhaeddol mewn perthynas ag ad-drefnu ysgolion?

**Leighton Andrews:** Llywydd, I think that the Member has made a case, but as she is well aware, I am unable to comment on specific proposals that may come to me at some stage for determination.

**Paul Davies:** Last year, just 57 per cent of students in Wales gained five or more A\* to C grades at GCSE; that compares to 70 per cent in England. If that is not bad enough, the gap has more than doubled in the last two years. Will the Minister tell us what specific measures he is putting in place to close this gap?

**Leighton Andrews:** The issue for us must inevitably be one of seeking to place an emphasis in our educational work on standards rather than structures. That is a message that I have been sending out very

sylweddol mewn anghenion addysgol arbennig ôl-16, a bod cyllidebau wedi tyfu'n sylweddol yn y blynyddoedd diweddar. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn bryderus am y sefyllfa gyfredol ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i swyddogion weld beth y gallem ei wneud. Byddwn yn edrych ar hynny dros yr wythnos neu ddwy nesaf, i weld a allwn wneud mwy.

**Nerys Evans:** I am sure you are aware of plans to reorganise schools in Powys. One astonishing aspect of the process is the lack of consultation with residents in the county and its elected members. Unfortunately, Powys is no exception in that regard. I am sure you are also aware of the schools reorganisation process in Carmarthenshire. A few weeks ago the executive board of the county council agreed recommendations for reorganising schools in the Dinefwr area. When the minutes were presented to the full council on Friday, elected members were not given the opportunity to discuss the matter in detail or to propose amendments. All they could do was approve the minutes of the executive board. This is a matter of great importance to the residents of the area, particularly in relation to Welsh-medium education. Should all councils not give elected members a fair opportunity to discuss far-reaching plans in relation to schools reorganisation?

**Leighton Andrews:** Lywydd, credaf fod yr Aelod wedi cyflwyno achos, ond fel y gŵyr hi'n iawn, ni allaf roi sylw ar gynigion penodol a all ddod ataf ar ryw adeg i'w penderfynu.

**Paul Davies:** Y llynedd, 57 y cant yn unig o fyfyrwyr yng Nghymru a gafodd bump neu ragor o raddau TGAU A\* i C; mae hynny'n cymharu â 70 y cant yn Lloegr. Pe na bai hynny'n ddigon drwg, mae'r bwllch wedi mwy na dyblu yn y ddwy flynedd diwethaf. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa gamau penodol y mae'n eu sefydlu i gau'r bwllch hwn?

**Leighton Andrews:** Y cwestiwn i ni o reidrwydd fydd ceisio rhoi pwyslais yn ein gwaith addysgol ar safonau yn hytrach nag ar strwythurau. Mae honno'n neges yr wyf wedi bod yn ei rhoi'n glir iawn. Weithiau, mater o

clearly. Sometimes, this is an issue of leadership in schools. Our school effectiveness framework, which kicks in this autumn, will provide the wherewithal and the opportunities for standards to be tackled at a local level. We need to look at variations in performance between schools, and at variations in performance within the classroom. I am well aware that there is a large body of committed headteachers out there who are determined to raise school performance levels. I saw a very interesting presentation at a school in Newport just last week by a new headteacher with ambitious plans to raise standards. This is crucial, and it is something on which I will want to see action taken.

**Paul Davies:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. Many of our young people progress to further education to continue their educational pathway, and a well-trained, highly skilled population is fundamental to the wellbeing of the economy now and in the future. The level of funding to this sector directly affects the number of courses that further education establishments of all types can offer, and a broad variety of courses help to provide a well-balanced workforce for the future. Will the Minister tell us the rationale behind the Welsh Assembly Government's decision to require this sector to find 5 per cent efficiency savings, when all other government sectors are required to find only 1.6 per cent?

**Leighton Andrews:** I am surprised that the Member does not understand the difference between the 1.6 per cent and the 5 per cent. As I explained before the Finance Committee quite recently, the 1.6 per cent relates to the saving overall that we would expect across the budget, while the 5 per cent is what we would expect particular providers to find within the training that they provide. We have had extensive discussions on this with the Finance Committee within the last few weeks. I met ColegauCymru this morning and it is fair to say that it was positive about the settlement that it had received this year. We have given a settlement that, in terms of recurrent funding, is, if I remember the figures exactly, a 5.85 per cent increase. We have done well by the further education

arweiniad mewn ysgolion yw hyn. Bydd ein fframwaith effeithiolrwydd ysgolion, a fydd yn dechrau yn yr hydref, yn rhoi'r gallu a'r cyfleoedd i fynd i'r afael â safonau ar lefel leol. Mae angen inni edrych ar amrywiadau mewn perfformiad rhwng ysgolion, ac ar amrywiadau mewn perfformiad yn yr ystafell dosbarth. Gwn yn iawn fod yna gorff mawr o brifathrawon ymroddedig sy'n benderfynol o godi lefelau perfformiad ysgolion. Gwelais gyflwyniad diddorol iawn mewn ysgol yng Nghasnewydd yr wythnos diwethaf gan bennaeth newydd a oedd â chynlluniau uchelgeisiol i godi safonau. Mae hyn yn allweddol, ac mae'n rhywbeth y byddaf eisiau gweld gweithredu arno.

**Paul Davies:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Aiff llawer o'n pobl ifanc ymlaen i addysg bellach i barhau eu llwybr addysgol, ac mae poblogaeth grefftus iawn, wedi'i hyfforddi'n dda, yn hanfodol i les yr economi yn awr ac yn y dyfodol. Mae lefel ariannu'r sector hwn yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar nifer y cyrsiau y gall sefydliadau addysg bellach o bob math eu cynnig, ac mae cael amrywiaeth eang o gyrsiau'n helpu darparu gweithlu cytbwys ar gyfer y dyfodol. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym beth yw'r rhesymeg y tu ôl i benderfyniad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ofyn i'r sector hwn sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 5 y cant, tra mai 1.6 y cant yn unig y gofynnir i bob sector llywodraeth arall ei sicrhau?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn synnu nad yw'r Aelod yn deall y gwahaniaeth rhwng yr 1.6 y cant a'r 5 y cant. Fel yr eglurais gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn weddol ddiweddar, mae'r 1.6 y cant yn cyfeirio at yr arbediad cyfan a ddisgwyliem ar draws y gyllideb, ond y 5 y cant yw'r hyn y disgwyliem i ddarparwyr penodol ei sicrhau o fewn yr hyfforddiant a ddarparant. Yr ydym wedi cael trafodaethau helaeth am hyn gyda'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn yr ychydig wythnosau diwethaf. Cwrddais â ColegauCymru y bore yma, ac mae'n deg dweud ei fod yn gadarnhaol am y setliad a gawsai eleni. Yr ydym wedi rhoi setliad sydd, o ran ariannu rheolaidd, os cofiaf y ffigurau'n iawn, yn gynnydd o 5.85 y cant. Yr ydym wedi rhoi chwarae teg i'r sector addysg bellach.

sector.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats (Kirsty Williams):** I wish to return to the subject of post-16 special educational needs provision. In your answer, you pointed to the increases in funding to the sector, and there have been increases in funding, but that has been offset by an increase in inflation and in the cost of delivery of education, and by a significant additional number of pupils to be provided for. I welcome your commitment to look again at the funding arrangements for next year. That is in stark contrast to the responses by the First Minister and Minister for Business and Budget, so it is very welcome indeed. When you look again to see what additional resources can be put into this field, will you take into consideration issues around special educational needs statements? Those are legal documents, which accompany those children and enshrine their right to appropriate levels of education after the age of 16, and need to be taken into consideration when planning so that the resources are available to meet the educational needs statements.

**Leighton Andrews:** On the question of statements, as you are probably aware, as we discussed this in the Enterprise and Learning Committee recently, we have pilot projects under way on the standard of statements and assessment. In respect of funding, we have to ask whether the funding that we are currently allocating, both for post-16 provision through local authorities and through the FE sector, is delivering in the best interests of learners and of the institutions. There are questions in my mind at the moment, because we have put significant additional resources in year on year, and if you look at the figures you can see that. It is true that numbers have grown, but we also need to look at the impact of that money. Are we delivering as effectively as we could? Are we delivering provision for students who would want to stay in Wales but may have to take out of county or, indeed, out of country placements? We have to look at whether that money is properly organised and is delivering in the way that we would want it to.

**Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Kirsty Williams):** Hoffwn ddechwyn at bwnc darpariaeth anghenion addysgol arbennig ôl-16. Yn eich ateb, cyfeirich at y codiadau yn y cyllid i'r sector, a bu codiadau yn y cyllid, ond yn erbyn hynny cafwyd cynnydd mewn chwyddiant ac yng nghost darparu addysg, a nifer ychwanegol sylweddol o ddisgyblion i ddarparu ar eu cyfer. Croesawaf eich ymrwymiad i edrych eto ar y trefniadau ariannu ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny'n hollol wahanol i'r ymatebion gan y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb, felly, fe'i croesewir yn wir. Pan edrychwch eto i weld pa adnoddau ychwanegol y gellir eu rhoi yn y maes hwn, a roddwch ystyriaeth i broblemau ynghylch datganiadau anghenion addysgol arbennig? Dogfennau cyfreithiol yw'r rhain, sy'n mynd gyda'r plant hynny ac yn cadw eu hawl i gael lefelau priodol o addysg ar ôl 16 oed, ac mae angen eu hystyried wrth gynllunio er mwyn i'r adnoddau fod ar gael i ateb y datganiadau anghenion addysgol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ar gwestiwn datganiadau, fel y gwyddoch, mae'n debyg, gan inni drafod hyn yn y Pwyllgor Menter a Dysgu yn ddiweddar, mae gennym brosiectau peilot ar droed ar safon datganiadau ac asesu. Ar fater ariannu, rhaid inni ofyn a yw'r cyllid yr ydym yn ei ddyrannu ar hyn o bryd, ar gyfer darpariaeth ôl-16 trwy awdurdodau lleol a thrwy'r sector addysg bellach, yn cyflawni er lles gorau dysgwyr a'r sefydliadau. Mae cwestiynau yn fy meddwl ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd yr ydym wedi darparu adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ac os edrychwch ar y ffigurau gallwch weld hynny. Mae'n wir bod niferoedd wedi codi, ond mae angen inni edrych ar effaith yr arian hwnnw hefyd. A ydym yn darparu mor effeithiol ag y gallem? A ydym yn sicrhau darpariaeth i fyfyrwyr a fyddai'n dymuno aros yng Nghymru ond sydd efallai'n gorfod derbyn lleoedd y tu allan i'w sir neu, yn wir, y tu allan i'r wlad? Rhaid inni edrych a yw'r arian hwnnw wedi'i drefnu'n iawn ac yn darparu yn y modd a ddymunem.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, you will be aware of the two special schools that provide services for my constituents, Ysgol Penmaes, and Ysgol Cedewain in Newtown. Those schools have scored very highly in inspections in recent years, and the inspectors pointed to the good value for money of placements at those schools. Powys has developed its services in those schools precisely to stop Powys children from having to be educated out of county or out of country. We have developed those services to keep our children within their community, and that work is undermined if you are unable to find the additional resources that you now say that you will look to provide.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ddwy ysgol arbennig sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i'm hetholwyr i, Ysgol Pen-maes, ac Ysgol Cedewain yn y Drenewydd. Mae'r ysgolion hynny wedi sgorio'n uchel iawn mewn arolygon yn y blynyddoedd diweddar, a chyfeiriodd yr arolygwyr at y gwerth da am arian o leoliadau yn yr ysgolion hynny. Mae Powys wedi datblygu ei gwasanaethau yn yr ysgolion hynny'n unswydd er mwyn arbed plant Powys rhag gorfod cael eu haddysgu y tu allan i'r sir neu allan o'r wlad. Yr ydym wedi datblygu'r gwasanaethau hynny i gadw ein plant o fewn eu cymuned, a thanseilir y gwaith hwnnw os na allwch ddod o hyd i'r adnoddau ychwanegol y dywedwch yn awr y byddwch yn ceisio'u darparu.

**Leighton Andrews:** We can always learn from good practice, and that will be part of the discussion that we need to have. It is clear that there are probably issues on the supply side in terms of the educational provision that is around, both in Wales and outside it, and we need to look at how the costs of that are rising. I do not think that this is something that can be fixed quickly. It is something that we have to have a proper look at. As I say, on the general issue, I am looking to see what we can do in terms of additional funding.

**Leighton Andrews:** Gallwn bob amser ddysgu gan ymarfer da, a bydd hynny'n rhan o'r drafodaeth y mae angen inni ei chael. Mae'n amlwg fod problemau'n debygol ar yr ochr gyflenwi o ran y ddarpariaeth addysgol sydd ar gael, yng Nghymru a'r tu allan, ac mae angen inni edrych ar y modd y mae costau hynny'n codi. Ni chredaf ei fod yn rhywbeth y gellir ei ddatrys yn gyflym. Mae'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni gael golwg iawn arno. Fel y dywedais, ar y cwestiwn cyffredinol, yr wyf yn edrych i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud o ran cyllid ychwanegol.

### Childhood Literacy

**Q2 Christine Chapman:** Will the Minister provide an update on improving childhood literacy in Wales? OAQ(3)1248(CEL)

2.10 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Raising literacy levels in Wales is one of my key objectives. As we emerge from recession, it is more important than ever that we ensure good standards in basic skills. I have made clear my intention to focus on children's literacy.

**Christine Chapman:** Last week, I was pleased to host a launch event here for the StartRight! young enterprise company from Pontypridd High School in my constituency.

### Llythrennedd Plant

**C2 Christine Chapman:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am wella llythrennedd plant yng Nghymru? OAQ(3)1248(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Codi lefelau llythrennedd yng Nghymru yw un o fy mhrif amcanion. Wrth inni ddod allan o'r dirwasgiad, mae'n bwysicach nag erioed sicrhau safonau da mewn sgiliau sylfaenol. Yr wyf wedi datgan yn glir fy mwriad i ganolbwyntio ar lythrennedd plant.

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn yn falch cynnal digwyddiad lansio yma i'r cwmni menter ifanc StartRight! o Ysgol Uwchradd Pontypridd yn fy etholaeth.

The company has produced a series of books to promote healthy eating among children, but which also encourage literacy. As that example shows, we need to use creativity and flexibility to capture the attention of our children and young people when promoting childhood literacy. Can the Minister assure me that the Welsh Assembly Government will continue to be as creative as it has been in support of the Read a Million Words in Wales campaign? In addition, all levels of Government can and should work together on the promotion of literacy to produce the best results. I welcome Rhondda Cynon Taf council's announcement of £60,000 to create a first-class library facility for young people in Aberdare, and the recent Science Fiction/Science Fact sessions organised by RCT libraries. Can the Minister assure me that he will continue to work with other stakeholders to give every child the best possible start in life so that they can go on to reach their potential?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yes, indeed, and I lend my support to StartRight! and the other initiatives that you mentioned. There are many good examples of initiatives being developed by some very passionate and committed individuals, such as Rob Jones in the Rhondda, who is working on the Only Boys Allowed reading scheme, although many other organisations are also involved. Only two weeks ago, I was at Cardiff City Stadium supporting the Learning Through Sport initiative. We really have to capture the imagination of young people to engage them in ways that are accessible to them and interesting. That is what underpins some of the schemes that you are talking about.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, in 2008, the Portuguese Government launched a programme that consisted of a partnership between the state, Intel, Portuguese mobile communications providers and Microsoft, to give a subsidised laptop to every primary school child between grades 1 and 4. The key difference between your scheme and that scheme, as well as what has happened in countries such as Uruguay, is that your scheme is a universal freebie, or at least it purports to be. Other countries have targeted the use of their resources at those

Mae'r cwmni wedi cynhyrchu cyfres o lyfrau i hyrwyddo bwyta'n iach ymhlith plant, ond sydd hefyd yn hybu llythrennedd. Fel y dengys yr enghraifft honno, mae angen inni fod yn greadigol ac yn hyblyg i ddal sylw ein plant a'n pobl ifanc wrth hyrwyddo llythrennedd plant. A all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd imi y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dal mor greadigol ag y bu wrth gefnogi'r ymgyrch Darllenwch Filiwn o Eiriau yng Nghymru? At hynny, gall pob lefel o Lywodraeth gydweithio ar hyrwyddo llythrennedd, a dylent wneud hynny, er mwyn cael y canlyniadau gorau. Croesawaf gyhoeddiad cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf am £60,000 i greu cyfleuster llyfrgell o'r radd flaenaf i bobl ifanc yn Aberdâr, a'r sesiynau Ffuglen Wyddonol/Ffaith Wyddonol a drefnwyd yn ddiweddar gan lyfrgelloedd Rhondda Cynon Taf. A all y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd imi y bydd yn parhau i weithio gyda rhanddeiliaid eraill i roi i bob plentyn y dechrau gorau posibl mewn bywyd, fel y gall fynd ymlaen i gyflawni ei botensial?

**Leighton Andrews:** Gallaf, yn wir, a rhoddaf fy nghefnogaeth i StartRight! a'r mentrau eraill y soniech amdanynt. Y mae llawer o enghreifftiau da o fentrau'n cael eu datblygu gan unigolion angerddol ac ymroddgar dros ben, fel Rob Jones yn Rhondda sy'n gweithio ar y cynllun darllen *Only Boys Allowed*, er bod nifer o gyrff eraill yn ymwneud â hyn hefyd. Gwta bythefnos yn ôl yr oeddwn yn Stadiwm Dinas Caerdydd yn cefnogi'r fenter Dysgu Drwy Chwaraeon. Rhaid inni gydio yn nychymyg pobl ifanc i ymgysylltu â hwy mewn ffyrdd sy'n hwylus iddynt ac yn ddiddorol. Dyna sydd wrth wraidd rhai o'r cynlluniau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, yn 2008 lansiodd Llywodraeth Portiwgal raglen a oedd yn cynnwys partneriaeth rhwng y wladwriaeth, Intel, darparwyr cyfathrebu symudol Portiwgal a Microsoft, i noddi rhoi gliniadur am ddim i bob plentyn ysgol rhwng graddau 1 a 4. Y gwahaniaeth allweddol rhwng eich cynllun chi a'r cynllun hwnnw, yn ogystal â'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn gwledydd fel Uruguay, yw mai rhywbeth am ddim i bawb yw eich cynllun chi, neu o leiaf dyna y mae'n ei honni. Mae gwledydd eraill wedi targedu defnyddio'u hadnoddau at y



communities in which literacy has been a main problem or that are particularly poor. Those computer projects have tried to raise standards not only in literacy, but also in a variety of subjects such as numeracy and basic Portuguese, English and computer skills. If you are to pursue the free laptop policy in Wales, will you do it in a more targeted way, or are you still committed to giving a free laptop to all?

**Leighton Andrews:** Our commitment in 'One Wales' is to pilot the use of laptops, and I will be saying more about that over the next couple of weeks. We are looking for the pilot scheme to take place in areas of disadvantage. I welcome what you said about other schemes, and I am very pleased that, tomorrow, I will be returning to my first school to assist in an initiative that has the involvement of Apple Computer Inc. Several partnerships are going on in Wales. I have seen excellent schemes, such as that in Torfaen, in which Microsoft is involved, and many different ones, which are to be encouraged.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, I know that you will agree with me that introducing formal learning at too early a stage is counterproductive to early childhood literacy. The approach taken through the foundation phase—of encouraging communication skills and confidence before moving to formal literacy training—is likely to deliver the most effective approach to promoting young people's literacy in the long term. Will you take the opportunity this afternoon to confirm this Government's ongoing commitment to the foundation phase? Knowing that we are going into difficult financial times, I am sure that you would agree that that is one area of education that we must protect at all costs, because it is the one most likely to give the poorest children a step up, giving them access to opportunities that are available to better-off children through the home and through paid childcare places.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thank you very much for your resounding endorsement of the foundation phase. As we approach financial discussions in the Assembly over the next

cymunedau hynny lle mae llythrennedd wedi bod yn brif broblem neu sy'n arbennig o dlawd. Mae'r prosiectau cyfrifiadur hynny wedi ceisio codi safonau nid mewn llythrennedd yn unig, ond hefyd mewn amrywiaeth o bynciau megis rhifedd a Phorthiwgaleg sylfaenol, Saesneg a sgiliau cyfrifiadurol. Os ydych am ddilyn polisi gliniaduron am ddim yng Nghymru, a wnewch chi hynny mewn modd mwy targedol, ynteu a ydych yn dal wedi ymrwymo i roi gliniadur am ddim i bawb?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ein hymrwymiad yn 'Cymru'n Un' yw cadell peilot ar ddefnyddio gliniaduron, a byddaf yn dweud mwy am hynny yn yr wythnos neu ddwy nesaf. Ein bwriad yw i'r cynllun peilot ddigwydd mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedech am gynlluniau eraill, ac yr wyf yn falch iawn y byddaf, yfory, yn dychwelyd i'm hysgol gyntaf i gynorthwyo mewn menter y mae cwmni Cyfrifiaduron Apple yn ymwneud â hi. Mae llawer partneriaeth ar waith yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wedi gweld cynlluniau rhagorol, fel yr un yn Nhorfaen y mae Microsoft yn cyfrannu ato, a nifer o rai gwahanol, sydd i'w hannog.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, gwn y cytunwch â mi fod cyflwyno dysgu ffurfiol yn rhy gynnar yn wrthgynhyrchiol i llythrennedd plentyndod cynnar. Y dull a ddilynir drwy'r cyfnod sylfaen—sef annog sgiliau cyfathrebu a hyder cyn symud at hyfforddiant llythrennedd ffurfiol—sy'n debygol o sicrhau'r ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i hybu llythrennedd pobl ifanc yn y tymor hir. A gymerwch chi'r cyfle y prynhawn yma i gadarnhau ymrwymiad parhaus y Llywodraeth hon i'r cyfnod sylfaen? Gan wybod ein bod yn mynd i gyfnod ariannol anodd, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunech mai dyna un maes addysg y mae'n rhaid inni ei warchod ar bob cyfrif, oherwydd hwnnw yw'r mwyaf tebygol o roi hwb ymlaen i'r plant tlotaf, gan ddarparu cyfleon iddynt sydd ar gael i blant o deuluoedd cyfoethocach drwy'r cartref a thrwy ofal plant y telir amdano.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch yn fawr am eich cefnogaeth gref i'r cyfnod sylfaen. Wrth inni nesáu at drafodaethau ariannol yn y Cynulliad dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf,

few months, I urge you to keep that resounding support well to the forefront. We are committed to that programme, which is receiving recognition across Wales. People in the primary sector are very enthusiastic about it wherever you go, and there is no question that it is receiving accolades from across the border.

### School Closures

**Q3 Jonathan Morgan:** Will the Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's policies for school closures? OAQ(3)1263(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** I refer the Member to the written statement that I issued in January.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Thank you, Minister, for that response. I want to raise a specific issue in relation to the way in which the schools reorganisation programme is being taken forward as it affects Whitchurch in my constituency. Although I know that the Minister will be unable to comment on specific proposals being consulted upon, it is the nature of the consultation that concerns me today. The Minister will be aware that between October and December last year, Cardiff Council consulted on three options. In February of this year, Cardiff Council issued a fourth option for consultation, with a consultation period of some three and a half weeks. I understand from reading the Assembly Government's guidance on school closures, which was issued in time for the start of the new calendar year, that any proposal that went to statutory notice would have to be consulted on for a period of two months. While Cardiff Council has not moved to the point of statutory notice as yet, issuing a fourth option in February for a consultation period of only three and a half weeks is a dreadful way to consult the people of Whitchurch, because it does not give sufficient time for headteachers, governors, and parents within the wider community to respond to the considerable detail of the new proposal. In addition, no information was provided by the council to back up the reason for considering a fourth option. Can the Minister outline what the guidance says about the way in which consultation should

fe'ch anogaf i gadw'r gefnogaeth gref honno ar flaen eich meddwl. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i'r rhaglen honno, sy'n cael ei chydabod ledled Cymru. Mae pobl yn y sector cynradd yn frwd iawn drosto ble bynnag yr ewch, ac nid oes dim dwywaith nad yw'n cael ei ganmol o'r tu draw i'r ffin.

### Cau Ysgolion

**C3 Jonathan Morgan:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cau ysgolion? OAQ(3)1263(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Cyfeiriaf yr Aelod at y datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyhoeddais yn Ionawr.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ymateb hwnnw. Mae arnaf eisiau codi cwestiwn penodol am y modd y gweithredir y rhaglen ad-drefnu ysgolion fel y mae'n effeithio ar yr Eglwys Newydd yn fy etholaeth. Er y gwn na fydd y Gweinidog yn gallu gwneud sylw am gynigion penodol sy'n destun ymgynghori, natur yr ymgynghoriad sy'n fy mhoeni heddiw. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol fod Cyngor Caerdydd wedi ymgynghori ar dri dewis rhwng mis Hydref a Rhagfyr y llynedd. Yn Chwefror eleni, cyhoeddodd Cyngor Caerdydd bedwerydd dewis ar gyfer ymgynghori, gyda chyfnod ymgynghori o ryw dair wythnos a hanner. Deallaf, o ddarllen canllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gau ysgolion, a gyhoeddwyd mewn pryd ar gyfer dechrau'r flwyddyn galendr newydd, y byddai'n rhaid ymgynghori am gyfnod o ddau fis ar unrhyw gynnig a fyddai'n golygu hysbysiad statudol. Er nad yw Cyngor Caerdydd wedi symud mor bell â chyhoeddi hysbysiad statudol hyd yma, mae cyhoeddi pedwerydd dewis yn Chwefror am gyfnod ymgynghori o dair wythnos a hanner yn unig yn ffordd ofnadwy o ymgynghori â phobl yr Eglwys Newydd, gan nad yw'n rhoi digon o amser i bennaethiaid, llywodraethwyr a rhieni o fewn y gymuned ehangach ymateb i fanylion sylweddol y cynnig newydd. Yn ogystal, ni ddarparwyd dim gwybodaeth gan y cyngor i gefnogi'r rheswm dros ystyried pedwerydd dewis. A all y Gweinidog amlinellu beth y mae'r canllawiau'n ei ddweud am y modd y

take place before a statutory notice is issued?

dylai ymgynghori ddigwydd cyn cyhoeddi hysbysiad statudol?

**Leighton Andrews:** Llywydd, I am again, I am afraid, not going to comment on the specifics of the case. The Member has set out his views on the process that is being followed. We have a debate scheduled for later today in which we can perhaps talk about some of the general issues involved, therefore I would rather not be drawn in a context where a Member has made comments on specific proposals.

**Leighton Andrews:** Lywydd, unwaith eto, mae arnaf ofn, nid wyf yn mynd i wneud sylw am fanylion yr achos. Mae'r Aelod wedi cyflwyno'i farn am y broses a ddilynir. Mae gennym ddadl wedi'i threfnu'n ddiweddarach heddiw lle gallwn siarad efallai am rai o'r materion cyffredinol perthnasol. Felly, byddai'n well gennyf beidio â dweud dim mewn cyd-destun lle mae Aelod wedi gwneud sylwadau am gynigion penodol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Minister, I believe that you are perfectly entitled to say what you have just said, and I maintain that that is the orderly thing for us to be doing here. Local government is a properly constituted democratic authority that has delegated powers within its area. Of course, there are issues where Ministers are involved in guidance and setting procedures. However, Ministers should not comment on decisions taken by local authorities within those contexts, because those are the decisions of the authorities. That is the fine line that we have to deal with in these matters.

**Y Llywydd:** Weinidog, credaf fod gennych berffaith hawl i ddweud yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud, a maentumiaf mai dyna'r peth trefnus inni ei wneud yma. Mae llywodraeth leol yn awdurdod democrataidd sydd wedi'i gyfansoddi'n briodol a chanddo bwerau dirprwyedig yn ei ardal. Wrth gwrs, y mae materion lle bydd Gweinidogion yn ymwneud â rhoi arweiniad a phennu gweithdrefnau. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylai Gweinidogion wneud sylwadau ar benderfyniadau a wneir gan awdurdodau lleol o fewn y cyd-destunau hynny, gan mai penderfyniadau'r awdurdodau yw'r rheiny. Dyna'r llinell fain y mae'n rhaid inni ddelio â hi yn y materion hyn.

**Chris Franks:** Minister, when will you be able to make a decision regarding the reorganisation of Cardiff schools? I appreciate that we will not discuss the actual decision, but pupils, parents and teachers will remain in limbo until a decision is made, and there is a great deal of frustration across the city. Weekly, the Government tells local authorities that they must become more efficient and must address surplus places and a whole range of issues, yet Government delays are causing huge problems.

**Chris Franks:** Weinidog, pa bryd y byddwch yn gallu gwneud penderfyniad ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu ysgolion Caerdydd? Sylwedolaf na fyddwn yn trafod y penderfyniad ei hun, ond bydd disgyblion, rhieni ac athrawon yn dal mewn limbo nes gwneir penderfyniad, ac mae llawer iawn o rwystredigaeth ar draws y ddinas. Bob wythnos bydd y Llywodraeth yn dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol ei bod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn fwy effeithlon a delio â llefydd gwag a llu o faterion, eto mae oedi gan y Llywodraeth yn achosi problemau enfawr.

**Leighton Andrews:** Llywydd, I will make decisions when the papers are put in front of me. Sometimes, of course, I may have further questions to ask.

**Leighton Andrews:** Lywydd, fe wnaif benderfyniadau pan roddir y papurau ger fy mron. Weithiau, wrth gwrs, gall fod gennyf gwestiynau pellach i'w gofyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Again, I have to agree with the Minister.

**Y Llywydd:** Eto, rhaid imi gytuno â'r Gweinidog.

**Jenny Randerson:** Let us see if I can get

**Jenny Randerson:** Gadewch inni weld a

something from you, Minister. Last week, the First Minister said in response to my question about education that what is mainly wrong with education is the fact that local authorities are not getting on with the process of reorganisation. I have asked you some written questions about the delay in ministerial decision making, and among the helpful comments that you made in your answers was the reference to the fact that you have a target date of 26 weeks for a decision, while the average time taken has been 32 weeks. Can you give me some general information on why there have been delays beyond the target date?

2.20 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yes, that is fairly straightforward. In some cases the proposals can be complex and they will involve the redistribution of numbers between several schools if a particular organisation proposal was pursued, while, in others, there may be a high volume of objections. It is fair to say that there are occasions when local authorities submit information to us that is incomplete, which leaves us with two choices: we either go back to them and ask for more information, which extends the process again, or we reject the proposals, in which case they would have to start the entire process again. So, there are a number of reasons that come together, and I think that that gives you a fair summary.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for that, Minister; it was very helpful. I echo the comments of Chris Franks, because there is a great deal of tension across Wales in communities where there are proposals for school reorganisation. It is bad for staff morale, and for parents and children in the area, to have to wait a long time. Of course, the proposals that come out of the statutory consultation period come after a long, informal consultation period, when certain possibilities have been widely discussed and informally consulted on by local authorities. That uncertainty goes on for years in many cases. Can you explain, therefore, why one set of proposals has been waiting on your desk for 49 weeks, and another that you recently decided on took 47 weeks? Were they proposals where, as you suggest, you

allaf fi gael rhywbeth gennych, Weinidog. Yr wythnos diwethaf dywedodd y Prif Weinidog mewn ateb i'm cwestiwn am addysg mai'r hyn sydd o'i le yn bennaf ar addysg yw'r ffaith nad yw awdurdodau lleol yn bwrw ati â'r broses ad-drefnu. Yr wyf wedi gofyn cwestiynau ysgrifenedig ichi am yr oedi wrth wneud penderfyniadau gweinidogol, ac ymhlith y sylwadau buddiol a wnaethoch yn eich atebion yr oedd y cyfeiriad at y ffaith fod gennych ddyddiad targed o 26 wythnos ar gyfer penderfyniad, ond y cymerwyd 32 wythnos ar gyfartaledd. A allwch roi rhywfaint o wybodaeth gyffredinol imi pam y bu oedi yn hwy na'r dyddiad targed?

**Leighton Andrews:** Gallaf, mae hynny'n weddol syml. Mewn rhai achosion gall y cynigion fod yn gymhleth a byddant yn golygu ailddosbarthu niferoedd rhwng nifer o ysgolion os dilynir cynnig trefniant penodol. Mewn achosion eraill gall fod nifer fawr o wrthwynebiadau. Mae'n deg dweud bod adegau pan fydd awdurdodau lleol yn cyflwyno gwybodaeth anghyflawn inni, sy'n rhoi dau ddewis inni: naill ai i fynd yn ôl atynt i ofyn am fwy o wybodaeth, sy'n ymestyn y broses eto, ynteu i wrthod y cynigion, ac wedyn byddai'n rhaid iddynt ddechrau'r holl broses eto. Felly, mae nifer o resymau sy'n dod at ei gilydd, a chredaf fod hynny'n rhoi crynodeb teg ichi.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch am hynny, Weinidog; yr oedd o gymorth mawr. Adleisiaf sylwadau Chris Franks, oherwydd mae llawer iawn o densiwn ar draws Cymru mewn cymunedau lle mae cynigion ar gyfer ad-drefnu ysgolion. Mae'n ddrwg i forâl staff, ac i rieni a phlant yn yr ardal, orfod aros amser maith. Wrth gwrs, bydd y cynigion a ddaw o'r cyfnod ymgynghori statudol yn dod wedi cyfnod ymgynghori anffurfiol hirfaith, pryd y bydd posibilïadau penodol wedi'u trafod yn eang ac wedi bod yn destun ymgynghori anffurfiol gan awdurdodau lleol. Aiff yr ansicrwydd hwnnw ymlaen am flynyddoedd mewn llawer achos. A allwch egluro, felly, pam mae un set o gynigion wedi bod ar eich desg ers 49 wythnos, ac un arall y gwnaethoch benderfyniad arno'n ddiweddar wedi cymryd 47 wythnos? A oeddent yn

had to go back to local authorities and ask for further information, which is why the decision took so much longer? Do you not think that it would be a good idea to revise your target date as you are unable to meet it and because members of the public think they will get an answer much more quickly than they evidently are?

**Leighton Andrews:** The 26-week target date starts with a notice of the publication of the proposals by the local authority, followed by a two-month consultation period. The authority then has a month to get the proposals to us and we would try to get a decision within three months of receiving those papers. I have been quite open about the fact that we are not meeting the deadlines. I would agree with Members that there is a series of problems that we need to look at more broadly. Indeed, I convened a new policy board in my department after taking over as Minister, and the first detailed discussion that we had on an item of policy related to school closures, as we could see some of the problems that were before us.

Again, I am not going to comment on individual proposals. However, I will say that, in one of the cases that you cited, we had to go back to the local authority to get additional information, as I mentioned in my previous answer. I do not think that the current situation is acceptable. We are looking at what we can do internally and we will no doubt discuss that further later this afternoon. I assure you that no proposal sits on my desk for a number of weeks. I try to clear proposals as they come to me. Of course, as I said earlier, I may feel that I have to ask officials for further information on occasion before I am prepared to sign off or reject a proposal, so it is not straightforward.

#### **Autism Training for Teachers**

**Q4 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on in-service autism training for teachers? OAQ(3)1268(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Our bilingual e-learning course on special educational needs,

gynigion lle bu'n raid ichi fynd yn ôl at awdurdodau lleol, fel yr awgrymwch, a gofyn am wybodaeth bellach, ac ai dyna pam y cymerodd y penderfyniad gymaint yn fwy o amser? Oni chredwch y byddai'n syniad da adolygu eich dyddiad targed gan nad ydych yn gallu ei gyrraedd ac am fod y cyhoedd yn meddwl y cânt ateb lawer ynghynt nag a gânt mewn gwirionedd?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r dyddiad targed o 26 wythnos yn dechrau gyda hysbysiad yn cyhoeddi'r cynigion gan yr awdurdod lleol, wedyn ceir cyfnod ymgynghori o ddau fis. Wedyn mae gan yr awdurdod fis i gyflwyno'r cynigion i ni, a byddem yn ceisio cael penderfyniad ymhen tri mis ar ôl cael y papurau hynny. Yr wyf wedi bod yn eithaf agored am y ffaith nad ydym yn cyrraedd y targedau. Cytunaf ag Aelodau bod cyfres o broblemau y mae angen inni edrych arnynt yn ehangach. Yn wir, sefydlais fwrdd polisi newydd yn fy adran ar ôl cymryd y llyw fel Gweinidog, a'r drafodaeth fanwl gyntaf a gawsom ar eitem polisi oedd un yn ymwneud â chau ysgolion, gan y gallem weld rhai o'r problemau a oedd o'n blaenau.

Eto, nid wyf yn am wneud sylw am gynigion unigol. Fodd bynnag, dywedaf ein bod, yn un o'r achosion a grybwyllwyd gennych, wedi gorfod mynd yn ôl at yr awdurdod lleol i gael gwybodaeth ychwanegol, fel y soniais yn fy ateb blaenorol. Ni chredaf fod y sefyllfa gyfredol yn dderbyniol. Yr ydym yn edrych i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud yn fewnol, ac mae'n siŵr y trafodwn hynny ymhellach yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Fe'ch sicrhaf na fydd yr un cynnig yn eistedd ar fy nesg am wythnosau lawer. Ceisiaf glirio cynigion wrth iddynt gyrraedd. Wrth gwrs, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, efallai y teimlaf ei bod yn rhaid imi ofyn i swyddogion am wybodaeth bellach weithiau cyn bod yn barod i lofnodi neu wrthod cynnig, felly, nid yw'n syml.

#### **Hyfforddiant i Athrawon ar Awtistiaeth**

**C4 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyfforddiant mewn swydd i athrawon ym maes awtistiaeth? OAQ(3)1268(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae ein cwrs e-ddysgu dwyieithog ar anghenion addysgol arbennig,

launched in 2008, contains a module on autism. Materials for newly qualified teachers are under development on a wide range of additional learning needs, including autism, and further courses will follow as part of the wider review of continuing professional development.

**Janet Ryder:** Thank you for that answer, Minister. On Friday I had the pleasure of speaking at the launch of Gwynedd's strategic plan on the autism spectrum. One of the other guest speakers at that conference was Dr Glenys Jones, who is a research professor in the Autism Centre for Education and Research in the University of Birmingham. I fully appreciate that we need to have the structures and support material for our staff that are relevant to Welsh schools, but the autism centre at the University of Birmingham is producing some innovative work for teacher training, including units that can be used in the classroom by teachers and cascaded down to every class teacher. Will you look at some of that work, Minister, and, if you feel it is applicable to Wales, consider how we can introduce some of that work into our curriculum once it is fully translated?

**Leighton Andrews:** If it is relevant to our curriculum, we will be happy to look at it. There is a range of courses available already via statutory or third sector organisations across Wales to enable teachers to develop expertise in autism. For example, Autism Cymru has trained between 400 and 500 schools to date, with more on the agenda next term.

**Alun Cairns:** I want to ask the Minister about special educational needs in general, and specifically about autism. Do you recognise that, in this funding squeeze on local authorities, for good and bad reasons—I do not want to make a particular point about that—funding for special educational needs can be squeezed also? Some local authorities have taken action to mainstream all of their special educational needs pupils, irrespective of need. Do you recognise that that is a dangerous step to take for those children and

a lansiwyd yn 2008, yn cynnwys modiwl ar awtistiaeth. Mae deunyddiau ar gyfer athrawon sydd newydd gymhwyso yn cael eu paratoi ar hyn o bryd ar ystod eang o anghenion dysgu ychwanegol, gan gynnwys awtistiaeth, a bydd cyrsiau pellach yn dilyn fel rhan o'r adolygiad ehangach o ddatblygiad proffesiynol parhaus.

**Janet Ryder:** Diolch am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Ddydd Gwener cefais y pleser o siarad wrth lansio cynllun strategol Gwynedd ar y sbectrwm awtistiaeth. Un o'r siaradwyr gwadd eraill yn y gynhadledd honno oedd Dr Glenys Jones, sy'n athro ymchwil yng Nghanolfan Addysg ac Ymchwil Awtistiaeth ym Mhrifysgol Birmingham. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli'n iawn fod angen inni gael y strwythurau a'r deunydd cymorth i'n staff sy'n berthnasol i ysgolion Cymru. Ond mae'r ganolfan awtistiaeth ym Mhrifysgol Birmingham yn cynhyrchu gwaith arloesol ar gyfer hyfforddi athrawon, gan gynnwys unedau y gellir eu defnyddio yn yr ystafell ddosbarth gan athrawon a'u rhaeadru i lawr i bob athro neu athrawes ddosbarth. A wnewch chi edrych ar ryw faint o'r gwaith hwnnw, Weinidog, ac, os teimlwch ei fod yn berthnasol i Gymru, a wnewch chi ystyried sut y gallwn gyflwyno rhyw faint o'r gwaith hwnnw yn ein cwricwlwm pan fydd wedi'i gyfieithu'n llawn?

**Leighton Andrews:** Os yw'n berthnasol i'n cwricwlwm, byddwn yn hapus edrych arno. Mae amrediad o gyrsiau ar gael eisoes drwy gyrff statudol neu gyrff y trydydd sector ar draws Cymru i alluogi athrawon i ddatblygu arbenigedd mewn awtistiaeth. Er enghraifft, mae Awtistiaeth Cymru wedi hyfforddi rhwng 400 a 500 o ysgolion hyd yma, ac mae mwy ar yr agenda yn y tymor nesaf.

**Alun Cairns:** Hoffwn holi'r Gweinidog am anghenion addysgol arbennig yn gyffredinol, ac yn benodol am awtistiaeth. A ydych yn cydnabod, yn y wasgfa ariannol hon ar awdurdodau lleol, am resymau da a drwg—nid oes arnaf eisiau gwneud pwynt arbennig am hynny—y gall cyllid ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig hefyd fod dan bwysau? Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi gweithredu i brif-ffrydio'u holl ddisgyblion anghenion addysgol arbennig, beth bynnag fo'u hangen. A ydych yn cydnabod ei fod yn gam peryglus

that their needs must be at the forefront, irrespective of whether they need to be in a maintained, independent, special or mainstream school, whichever is appropriate? What action can you take on a strategic level, across all local authorities in Wales, to ensure that when spending is tight, funding for children with special educational needs is not squeezed as it could be, if some press reports are to be believed?

**Leighton Andrews:** I agree that the starting point has to be the needs of the individual learner, as you describe it. One of the things that we can do—this goes back to an answer I gave earlier—is look at the way in which the funding is currently distributed. We need to consider whether authorities are following best practice that is available and whether the proposals that they have adopted are genuinely relevant to the individual needs of specific learners. I am not satisfied at the moment, particularly about post-16 provision, as I mentioned earlier, that we have the funding regime that is appropriate across both maintained schools and FE, or for other funding that we need to make available for placements that are out of county or beyond. There is quite a lot there for us to look at in that respect. Your question was directed more at pre-16 provision, and I accept the points that you make.

### Sex Education in Schools

**Q5 Eleanor Burnham:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Government's plans to increase the provision of sex education in schools? OAQ(3)1291(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Maintained schools are required to have a policy with regard to the provision of sex education. There are no plans to alter the current position with provision being a matter for each school working within statutory requirements and taking note of guidance issued by the Welsh Assembly Government.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Thank you, Minister, for that reply. However, in view of the sad fact that most youngsters need some sort of help due to the fact that the teenage pregnancy

i'w gymryd i'r plant hynny, a'i bod yn rhaid rhoi eu hanghenion yn flaenaf, ni waeth a oes angen iddynt fod mewn ysgol a gynhelir, un annibynnol, un arbennig ynteu un brif ffrwd, pa un bynnag sy'n briodol? Beth y gallwch ei wneud ar lefel strategol, ar draws holl awdurdodau lleol Cymru, i sicrhau, pan fydd gwariant yn dynn, na chaiff cyllid ar gyfer plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ei wasgu, fel a all ddigwydd os yw rhai adroddiadau yn y wasg i'w credu?

**Leighton Andrews:** Cytunaf mai anghenion y dysgwyr unigol, fel y'i disgrifiwch, a ddylai fod yn fan cychwyn. Un o'r pethau y gallwn eu gwneud—mae hyn yn mynd yn ôl at ateb a roddais yn gynharach—yw edrych ar y modd y dosberthir yr arian ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen inni ystyried a yw awdurdodau'n dilyn yr arfer gorau sydd ar gael, ac a yw'r cynigion y maent wedi'u mabwysiadu yn wirioneddol berthnasol i anghenion unigol dysgwyr penodol. Nid wyf yn fodlon ar hyn o bryd, yn enwedig ynghylch darpariaeth ôl-16, fel y soniais ynghynt, fod gennym drefn ariannu sy'n briodol ar draws ysgolion a gynhelir ac addysg bellach, nac am gyllid arall y mae angen inni ei ddarparu ar gyfer lleoliadau y tu allan i'r sir neu'r tu hwnt. Mae cryn dipyn yno inni edrych arno yn hynny o beth. Yr oedd eich cwestiwn wedi'i gyfeirio'n fwy at ddarpariaeth ôl-16, a derbyniaf y pwyntiau a wnewch.

### Addysg Rhyw Mewn Ysgolion

**C5 Eleanor Burnham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cymru i gynyddu darpariaeth addysg rhyw mewn ysgolion? OAQ(3)1291(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'n ofynnol i ysgolion a gynhelir gael polisi ynglŷn â darparu addysg rhyw. Nid oes dim bwriad i newid y sefyllfa bresennol, hynny yw, bod pob ysgol yn darparu addysg rhyw o fewn y gofynion statudol gan ystyried canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Diolch, Weinidog, am yr ateb hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yn wyneb y ffaith drist fod ar y rhan fwyaf o bobl ifanc angen rhyw fath o gymorth gan fod cyfradd

rate in Britain is much higher than it is elsewhere in Europe, do you not believe that we need to learn from other cultures that seem to do this better? We know from significant evidence that sexually transmitted diseases can impact heavily on young people's life chances, both male and female. Some of us have seen this situation at first hand. For example, when I was working with schools and excluded young people across north-east Wales, before I came here, many of those young people were pregnant at an alarmingly young age, and many in certain schools had had several abortions, and so on. Instead of taking a somewhat complacent view on this difficult situation, I believe that you need to take this seriously. We need to look at relationships and qualitative issues, and not just give out free condoms. It is a complex issue that desperately needs your attention.

**Leighton Andrews:** I do not think that anyone is complacent about it. Sex education is a statutory requirement in the school curriculum in Wales, and all schools must have a separate written statement of their policy with regard to the provision of sex education. As part of the basic curriculum, secondary schools are required to include sex education for all registered pupils, and primary schools must have a sex education policy, although currently, in the case of primary schools, whether they provide sex education is at the discretion of the school. I do not think that we have been at all complacent about that.

2.30 p.m.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Can you assure me that pupils in some faith schools will not be disadvantaged by receiving sex and relationship education that is not as accurate and balanced as that received in non-faith schools?

**Leighton Andrews:** We want to see balanced education on personal relationship matters provided in all schools in Wales, and that is the policy of the Government. However, some of the issues that have grown up around this subject over the past fortnight

beichiogrwydd yn yr ardegau ym Mhrydain lawer yn uwch nag mewn rhannau eraill o Ewrop, oni chredwch fod angen inni ddysgu oddi wrth ddiwylliannau eraill sydd i'w gweld yn gwneud hyn yn well? Gwyddom o dystiolaeth sylweddol y gall clefydau a drosglwyddir yn rhywiol fod yn ergyd drom i gyfleoedd pobl ifanc mewn bywyd, yn ddynion a merched. Mae rhai ohonom wedi gweld y sefyllfa hon â'n llygaid ein hunain. Er enghraifft, pan oeddwn i'n gweithio gydag ysgolion a chyda phobl ifanc a oedd wedi'u gwahardd ar draws y Gogledd-ddwyrain, cyn dod yma, yr oedd nifer o'r bobl ifanc hynny'n feichiog yn ddychrynlyd o ifanc, a llawer un mewn ambell ysgol wedi cael mwy nag un erthylad, ac ati. Yn lle bod braidd yn hunanfodlon am y sefyllfa anodd hon, credaf fod angen ichi gymryd hyn o ddfrif. Mae angen inni edrych ar faterion perthynas ac ansawdd, nid yn unig ar ddsbarthu condomau am ddim. Mae'n fater dyrys y mae dirfawr angen ichi roi sylw iddo.

**Leighton Andrews:** Ni chredaf fod neb yn hunanfodlon yn ei gylch. Mae addysg rhyw yn ofyniad statudol yn y cwricwlwm ysgol yng Nghymru, a rhaid i bob ysgol gael ei datganiad ysgrifenedig ei hun am ei pholisi ar ddarparu addysg rhyw. Fel rhan o'r cwricwlwm sylfaenol, mae'n ofynnol i ysgolion uwchradd gynnwys addysg rhyw ar gyfer pob disgybl cofrestredig, a rhaid i ysgolion cynradd gael polisi ar addysg rhyw, er mai mater i'r ysgol yw a ydynt am ddarparu addysg rhyw ar hyn o bryd, yn achos ysgolion cynradd. Ni chredaf ein bod wedi bod yn hunanfodlon o gwbl ynglŷn â hynny.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A allwch roi sicrwydd imi na roddir disgyblion mewn rhai ysgolion ffydd dan anfantais drwy gael addysg rhyw a pherthynas nad yw mor gywir a chytbwys â'r addysg a geir mewn ysgolion nad ydynt yn ysgolion ffydd?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae arnom eisiau gweld darparu addysg gytbwys ar faterion perthynas bersonol ym mhob ysgol yng Nghymru, a dyna yw polisi'r Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae rhai o'r materion sydd wedi datblygu o gylch y pwnc hwn yn y pythefnos diwethaf



have been largely in relation to discussions on proposals that are relevant to England rather than to Wales.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** As someone who agrees fully that sex education is an important part of the curriculum given how it can help people, especially when we hear of some of the terrible events that befall people, I am fully supportive of the current sex education curriculum taught in our schools. However, I also have sympathy with, and understanding for, many of the concerns that people raise over the position in which they find themselves as a result of the curriculum, especially if they are members of certain ethnic or religious groups. Do you endorse the idea that there should be a tolerance and understanding of people's reservations about some parts of the curriculum, and that schools should try to accommodate these concerns so that children and parents can go along with the curriculum without feeling that they have an undue burden placed on them?

**Leighton Andrews:** The delivery of the curriculum is delegated to schools in partnership with the local authority. Schools will continue to decide where the emphasis should be placed, and parents have the right to withdraw their children from those lessons.

**David Lloyd:** Minister, further to your comprehensive replies thus far, would you agree that sex education needs to be directed in particular at boys and young men, emphasising that it is cool to respect a woman's choice not to have sex?

**Leighton Andrews:** Yes, indeed. You make a very important point, Dai. I am encouraged to see that specific programmes on matters of sexual health are being developed—in informal learning settings as well as in schools—and that those are being followed by boys as well as girls. I have seen a number of these courses being run in Penrhys and in other parts of my constituency.

#### The Frank Buttle Trust

**Q6 David Melding:** Will the Minister make a statement on how many higher education

wedi ymwneud yn bennaf â thrafodaethau ar gynigion sy'n berthnasol i Loegr yn hytrach nag i Gymru.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Fel un sy'n cytuno'n llwyr fod addysg rhyw yn rhan bwysig o'r cwricwlwm, o gofio sut y gall helpu pobl, yn enwedig pan glywn am rai o'r pethau ofnadwy sy'n digwydd i bobl, yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogol i'r cwricwlwm presennol ar addysg rhyw a ddysgir yn ein hysgolion. Fodd bynnag, mae yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo hefyd, ac yn deall nifer o'r pryderon y bydd pob yn eu codi am eu sefyllfa o ganlyniad i'r cwricwlwm, yn enwedig os ydynt yn aelodau o grwpiau ethnig neu grefyddol penodol. A ydych yn cefnogi'r syniad y dylai fod goddefgarwch a dealltwriaeth o amheuon pobl am rai rhannau o'r cwricwlwm, ac y dylai ysgolion geisio darparu ar gyfer y pryderon hyn fel y gall plant a rhieni gydfynd â'r cwricwlwm heb deimlo bod baich gormodol wedi'i osod arnynt?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae cyflwyniad y cwricwlwm wedi'i ddirprwyo i ysgolion mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdod lleol. Bydd ysgolion yn dal i benderfynu ymhle y dylid gosod y pwyslais, ac mae gan rieni yr hawl i dynnu eu plant allan o'r gwersi hynny.

**David Lloyd:** Weinidog, yn dilyn eich atebion cynhwysfawr hyd yma, a gytunech fod angen cyfeirio addysg rhyw yn enwedig at fechgyn a dynion ifanc, gan bwysleisio'i bod yn cŵl i barchu dewis merch i beidio â chael rhyw?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ydwyf, yn wir. Mae gennyfych bwynt pwysig iawn, Dai. Mae'n galonogol gweld bod rhaglenni penodol ar faterion iechyd rhyw yn cael eu datblygu—mewn sefyllfaoedd dysgu anffurfiol yn ogystal ag mewn ysgolion—ac y dilynir y rheiny gan fechgyn yn ogystal â genethod. Yr wyf wedi gweld nifer o'r cyrsiau hyn ar waith ym Mhen-rhys ac mewn rhannau eraill o'm hetholaeth.

#### Ymddiriedolaeth Frank Buttle

**C6 David Melding:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch sawl sefydliad addysg

institutions in Wales have passed the Frank Buttle Trust quality mark for care leavers? OAQ(3)1254(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** All Welsh higher education institutions have been awarded the trust's quality mark, which is an excellent achievement. We are committed to improving the educational experience and aspirations of children in care and those leaving care, including opening up opportunities for progression to higher education in partnership with the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales and the Frank Buttle Trust.

**David Melding:** I am sure you will join me in congratulating the Welsh higher education sector on achieving that milestone way in advance of its achievement in England or the rest of the United Kingdom. It is unalloyed good news. However, it is only a part of the challenge, as you hinted in your reply. We must now ensure that we identify this area as a key one to measure the success of policies relating to care leavers, because giving care leavers an excellent education is probably the biggest thing that we can do to ensure that they have happy and productive lives. That must start at the earliest stages, in primary schools, and must continue throughout the education process. At the moment, fewer than 4 per cent of care leavers go on to higher education, unfortunately.

**Leighton Andrews:** The points that you have raised are important. We have the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales grant for looked-after children, which is focused on additional study support, on training for education practitioners, and on the publication of relevant materials. There is already some evidence that RAISE is having a beneficial effect. For instance, it has certainly had an effect on the number of looked-after children achieving GCSEs. I also commend the work that has been undertaken by the Reaching Wider partnerships across Wales in providing support and guidance for care leavers considering higher education. A number of very good initiatives are under way.

uwch yng Nghymru sydd wedi cyrraedd marc ansawdd Ymddiriedolaeth Frank Buttle ar gyfer pobl sy'n gadael gofal? OAQ(3)1254(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae pob sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru wedi cael marc ansawdd yr ymddiriedolaeth, sydd yn gamp ragorol. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wella profiad addysgol a dyheadau plant mewn gofal a rhai sy'n gadael gofal, gan gynnwys agor cyfleon i symud ymlaen i addysg uwch mewn partneriaeth â Chyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ac Ymddiriedolaeth Frank Buttle.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn siŵr yr ymunwch â mi i longyfarch sector addysg uwch Cymru ar gyrraedd y garreg filltir honno ymhell o flaen y sector yn Lloegr a gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n newyddion da digymysg. Fodd bynnag, dim ond rhan o'r her yw hyn, fel yr awgrymwyd yn eich ateb. Rhaid inni sicrhau'n awr ein bod yn nodi'r maes hwn fel un allweddol i fesur llwyddiant polisïau'n ymwneud â rhai sy'n gadael gofal, oherwydd mae'n debyg mai rhoi addysg ragorol i rai sy'n gadael gofal yw'r peth mwyaf y gallwn ei wneud i sicrhau y cânt fywydau hapus a chynhyrchiol. Rhaid i hynny ddechrau yn y cyfnodau cynharaf, yn yr ysgolion cynradd, a rhaid iddo barhau drwy'r broses addysg. Ar hyn o bryd, aiff llai na 4 y cant o rai sy'n gadael gofal ymlaen i addysg uwch, yn anffodus.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae'r pwyntiau yr ydych wedi'u codi'n bwysig. Mae gennym y grant codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru ar gyfer plant sy'n cael gofal. Mae hwnnw'n canolbwyntio ar gefnogaeth astudio ychwanegol, ar hyfforddiant i ymarferwyr addysg, ac ar gyhoeddi deunyddiau perthnasol. Eisoed mae ychydig dystiolaeth fod Rhagori yn cael effaith fuddiol. Er enghraifft, mae wedi cael effaith yn bendant ar nifer y plant sy'n cael gofal ac sy'n llwyddo mewn TGAU. Cymeradwyaf hefyd y gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud gan y partneriaethau Ymgysylltu Ehangach ledled Cymru i roi cefnogaeth ac arweiniad i rai sy'n gadael gofal ac sy'n ystyried addysg uwch. Mae nifer o fentrau da iawn ar droed.

**Addysg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin**

**C7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am addysg yn sir Gaerfyrddin? OAQ(3)1267(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae awdurdod lleol sir Gaerfyrddin wrthi'n datblygu amgylcheddau dysgu i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain sy'n ennyn diddordeb ac yn ysbrydoli dysgwyr, athrawon a'r gymuned ehangach.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Weinidog, hoffwn eich cyfeirio at addysg uwchradd, a'r ad-drefnu sydd ar y gweill ar gyfer cwm Gwendraeth a dyffryn Tywi. A wyddoch am unrhyw asesiad a wnaed o'r dymuniad i gael addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yn nyffryn Tywi, ac a wnewch chi drafod â'r awdurdod addysg yr angen i sicrhau y caiff trigolion dyffryn Tywi y cyfle i gael addysg gyflawn Gymraeg yn y sector uwchradd?

**Leighton Andrews:** I will not be drawn into commenting on proposals that are being developed by local authorities and may, at some stage, come to me for determination. I remind the Member that I published a written statement on the transformation agenda and the Welsh language earlier this year.

**Cymorth**

**Q8 Brian Gibbons:** Will the Minister make a statement on the future of Cymorth? OAQ(3)1259(CEL)

**The Deputy Minister for Children (Huw Lewis):** Cymorth is a key part of our support to children, young people and families, and the programme will continue to fund projects to tackle disadvantage.

**Brian Gibbons:** You will be aware of the recent evaluation of Cymorth, which demonstrated that much excellent and innovative practice is taking place across Wales to improve the life chances of our most vulnerable children. However, the report did not provide a universal endorsement of the programme. What will you do in response to the evaluation to make sure that Cymorth resources are targeted fully

**Education in Carmarthenshire**

**Q7 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on education in Carmarthenshire? OAQ(3)1267(CEL)

**Leighton Andrews:** Carmarthenshire local authority is working to develop twenty-first century learning environments that engage and inspire learners, teachers and the wider community.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Minister, I wish to refer you to secondary education, and to the reorganisation that is on the cards for the Gwendraeth and Towy valleys. Do you know of any assessment carried out of the demand for Welsh-medium education in the Towy valley, and will you discuss with the education authority the need to ensure that the residents of the Towy valley are given the opportunity to have a full Welsh-medium education in the secondary sector?

**Leighton Andrews:** Ni ddywedaf ddim am gynigion sy'n cael eu datblygu gan awdurdodau lleol ac a allai, ar ryw adeg, ddod ataf fi i'w penderfynu. Atgoffaf yr Aelod imi gyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar yr agenda trawsnewid a'r iaith Gymraeg yn gynharach eleni.

**Cymorth**

**C8 Brian Gibbons:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol Cymorth? OAQ(3)1259(CEL)

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Blant (Huw Lewis):** Mae Cymorth yn rhan allweddol o'n cefnogaeth i blant, pobl ifanc a theuluoedd, a bydd y rhaglen yn parhau i ariannu prosiectau i fynd i'r afael ag anfantais.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r gwerthusiad diweddar o Cymorth, a ddangosai fod llawer o waith rhagorol ac arloesol yn digwydd ledled Cymru i wella cyfleoedd bywyd ein plant mwyaf bregus. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd yr adroddiad yn cefnogi'r rhaglen drwyddi draw. Beth a wnewch chi i ymateb i'r gwerthusiad i sicrhau targedu adnoddau Cymorth yn llawn ac yn fwyaf effeithiol at anghenion ein plant

and most effectively at the needs of our most vulnerable children? mwyaf bregus?

**Huw Lewis:** You are quite right to say that the interim evaluation of Cymorth is, overall, an encouraging document to read. However, I will be joining my officials to look at ways to make the programme—and programmes like it—stronger, more strategic, more accountable and more focused, particularly on children in the worst levels of deprivation.

**Mark Isherwood:** Wales has the highest rate of children living in severe poverty, with the number standing at 96,000, against a backdrop of rising levels of overall child poverty, with the figure in Wales standing at 192,000. As you indicated, Cymorth is the Welsh Government's fund targeting support for children and young people in disadvantaged families. How do you respond, therefore, to evidence from the Joseph Rowntree Foundation that identifies real concerns about our ability to address child poverty if we rely on Cymorth and Flying Start programmes? Research indicates that more children are living in poverty outside the areas designated as disadvantaged than inside them.

**Huw Lewis:** Mark, you really need to take a wider view and catch up on developments. The Welsh Assembly Government's child poverty policies, as well as the programmes that we have operating in communities to eradicate child poverty and ameliorate its effects go much further and wider than Cymorth and Flying Start. On 10 February, we received Royal Approval for the Children and Families (Wales) Measure 2010, which, in effect, draws the entire Welsh public sector into the battle to eradicate child poverty. That new Welsh law will have far-reaching effects for every local authority, for the NHS, for all those public bodies out there that receive funding from the Welsh Assembly Government and, indeed, for WAG itself. We are going to go through what is, in effect, a revolution in attitudes and programmes aimed at this group of children.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I have received

**Huw Lewis:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud bod y gwerthusiad interim o Cymorth, ar y cyfan, yn ddogfen galonogol i'w darllen. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn ymuno â'm swyddogion i edrych ar ffyrdd i wneud y rhaglen—a rhaglenni tebyg iddi—yn gryfach, yn fwy strategol, yn fwy atebol ac yn canolbwyntio'n well, yn enwedig i blant yn y lefelau amddifadedd gwaethaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Gan Gymru y mae'r gyfradd uchaf o blant sy'n byw mewn tlodi difrifol, 96,000 ohonynt, mewn cefndir o lefelau cynyddol o dlodi plant yn gyffredinol. Mae'r ffigur yng Nghymru yn 192,000. Fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, Cymorth yw cronfa Llywodraeth Cymru sy'n targedu cefnogaeth i blant a phobl ifanc mewn teuluoedd difreintiedig. Sut yr ydych yn ymateb, felly, i dystiolaeth gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree sy'n nodi gwir bryderon am ein gallu i ddatrys tlodi plant os dibynnwn ar raglenni Cymorth a Dechrau'n Deg? Mae ymchwil yn dangos bod mwy o blant yn byw mewn tlodi y tu allan i'r ardaloedd sydd wedi'u dynodi'n ddifreintiedig nag o'u mewn.

**Huw Lewis:** Mark, mae gwir angen ichi gymryd golwg ehangach a dysgu am y datblygiadau diweddaraf. Mae polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar dlodi plant, ynghyd â'r rhaglenni sydd gennym ar waith mewn cymunedau i ddileu tlodi plant a lliniaru ei effeithiau, yn mynd lawer ymhellach ac yn lletach na Cymorth a Dechrau'n Deg. Ar 10 Chwefror cawsom Gymeradwyaeth Frenhinol i'r Mesur Plant a Theuluoedd (Cymru) 2010, sydd, mewn gwirionedd, yn tynnu holl sector cyhoeddus Cymru i mewn i'r frwydr i ddileu tlodi plant. Caiff y ddeddf newydd Gymreig honno effeithiau pellgyrhaeddol i bob awdurdod lleol, i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, i'r holl gyrrff cyhoeddus hynny sy'n cael cyllid gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac, yn wir, i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun. Byddwn yn mynd drwy'r hyn sydd, i bob pwrpas, yn chwyldro mewn agweddau a rhaglenni wedi'u hanelu at y grŵp hwn o blant.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau

representations from Action for Children stating that when projects are set up for review, the review process is quite long. The organisation also hears about new projects and new financing at the beginning of the following year, which it says creates a lot of uncertainty regarding when it will receive the next tranche of funding. It wonders whether it could have any interaction with you, as Deputy Minister, which might relieve some of these uncertainties and provide clarity for staff and service users regarding which projects are to go ahead following the review process.

**Huw Lewis:** Of course, Bethan. I am always very happy to meet with any groups that are out there delivering in partnership with us, looking for ways to improve the life chances of this group of children. I take on board what you are saying and, as I said previously, I am interested in making all our programmes much more strategic as we enter the second decade of our commitment to eradicate child poverty by 2020.

2.40 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr i'r Gweinidog a'r Dirprwy Weinidog.

gan Gweithredu dros Blant sy'n dweud, pan drefnir prosiectau i gael eu hadolygu, fod y broses adolygu'n eithaf maith. Clyw'r corff hwnnw hefyd am brosiectau newydd a chyllid newydd ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn ganlynol, sydd, meddai, yn creu llawer o ansicrwydd pryd y caiff y gyfran nesaf o gyllid. Mae'n holi tybed a allai gael unrhyw ryngweithiad â chi, fel Dirprwy Weinidog, a allai liniaru rhywfaint o'r ansicrwydd hwn a darparu eglurder i staff a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau am y prosiectau sydd i fynd ymlaen yn dilyn y broses adolygu.

**Huw Lewis:** Wrth gwrs, Bethan. Yr wyf bob amser yn hapus iawn i gwrdd ag unrhyw grwpiau sydd allan yn y maes yn gweithredu mewn partneriaeth gyda ni, gan edrych am ffyrdd i wella cyfleoedd bywyd y grŵp hwn o blant. Derbyniaf yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud ac, fel y dywedais ynghynt, mae gennyf ddiddordeb mewn gwneud ein rhaglenni i gyd yn llawer mwy strategol wrth inni gychwyn ar ail ddegawd ein hymrwymiad i ddileu tlodi plant erbyn 2020.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Minister and the Deputy Minister.

### **Datganiad a Chyhoeddiad Busnes Business Statement and Announcement**

**The Minister for Business and Budget (Jane Hutt):** Business for the next three weeks is as set out on the business statement and announcement, which can be found in the agenda papers that are available to Members electronically.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the Minister for business for that statement, and I ask her for two statements on the following two issues, or perhaps a debate on the first one. The first request relates to caravans and mobile homes, and, as it does not have a particularly party political dimension, a Government debate or statement might be appropriate. I have written to the Minister for planning about Aberystwyth Holiday Village specifically, but it is more about a generality. Working with councillor Aled Davies, who is a Plaid Cymru councillor in Ceredigion, I have come

**Y Gweinidog dros Fusnes a'r Gyllideb (Jane Hutt):** Mae busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i amlinellir yn y datganiad a'r cyhoeddiad busnes sydd ymysg y papurau agenda sydd ar gael i Aelodau yn electronig.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog dros fusnes am y datganiad hwnnw, a gofynnaf iddi am ddau ddatganiad ar y ddau fater canlynol, neu ddadl efallai ar yr un cyntaf. Mae'r cais cyntaf yn ymwneud â charafannau a chartrefi symudol, a chan nad oes elfen bleidiol benodol iddo, mae'n bosibl y byddai datganiad neu ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth yn briodol. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog dros gynllunio ynghylch Pentref Gwyliau Aberystwyth yn benodol, ond mae hyn yn fwy cyffredinol. Drwy weithio gyda'r cynghorydd Aled Davies, sy'n gynghorydd

across difficulties in relation to planning permission being granted for a number of permanent homes but then of homes in excess of that number being sold. That often creates problems with insurance not being valid, possibly for the whole site, but certainly for the individuals living in those homes. It is an issue of mis-selling, and some of these caravan parks are still mis-selling in breach of planning regulations. There is an issue of potential homelessness. These are serious issues that tend to affect the older and most vulnerable in our community, because they are the people who are attracted to go to live near relations and so on. In relation to Aberystwyth Holiday Village, which I have been looking at with Aled Davies, I wonder whether we could have a general statement about some of those issues.

The second issue relates to the Hywel Dda NHS Trust but perhaps more widely. I ask that the Minister for Health and Social Services make a statement about some of the debts that trusts have. Hywel Dda NHS Trust has the largest debt in Wales, with some £12 million. People in the area that I represent are concerned that services should not be compromised by the debt that has been run up, and that a good health service should be provided in our area. I seek reassurance from the Minister and ask whether she can make a statement on the generality of some of those debts, as we go forward.

**Jane Hutt:** I sympathise with the concerns that have been expressed to you in your involvement with the caravan and mobile homes issue. I am handling similar issues in my constituency. We had a very good debate across the Chamber, with cross-party evidence of real difficulties. I will draw the matter to the attention of the Deputy Minister for Housing and Regeneration, and perhaps ask for an update on the action that she said that she would take. You also raise issues that relate to planning, and so perhaps we as an Assembly Government need to look at this in the round. I am grateful that you have brought this to my attention this afternoon.

Plaid Cymru yng Ngheredigion, yr wyf wedi dod ar draws anawsterau lle mae caniatâd cynllunio'n cael ei roi ar gyfer nifer penodol o gartrefi parhaol, ond wedyn caiff mwy na'r nifer hwnnw eu gwerthu. Mae hynny'n aml yn creu problemau gan nad yw'r yswiriant yn ddilys, o bosibl ar gyfer y safle cyfan, ond yn sicr mae hynny'n wir i'r unigolion sy'n byw yn y cartrefi hynny. Mater o gamwerthu yw hyn, ac mae rhai o'r parciau carafannau hyn yn camwerthu o hyd yn groes i reoliadau cynllunio. Mae digartrefedd posibl hefyd yn fater. Mae'r rhain yn faterion difrifol sy'n dueddol o effeithio ar y bobl hynaf a'r mwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymuned, oherwydd hwy sy'n cael eu denu i fyw gerllaw perthnasau, ac ati. O ran Pentref Gwyliau Aberystwyth, sef y mater yr wyf fi ac Aled Davies wedi bod yn rhoi sylw iddo, ys gwn i a allem gael datganiad cyffredinol am rai o'r materion hynny.

Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel Dda ond efallai yn fwy eang. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wneud datganiad am rai o'r dyledion sydd gan yr ymddiriedolaethau. Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel Dda sydd â'r ddyled fwyaf yng Nghymru, oddeutu £12 miliwn. Mae pobl yn yr ardal a gynrychiolaf yn poeni na ddylai'r ddyled sydd wedi cronni gael effaith andwyol ar y gwasanaethau, ac y dylid darparu gwasanaeth iechyd da yn ein hardal. Ceisiaf sicrhad gan y Gweinidog, a gofynnaf iddi wneud datganiad cyffredinol am rai o'r dyledion hynny, wrth inni symud ymlaen.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn cydymdeimlo â'r pryderon a fynegwyd wrthyh wrth ddelio â mater carafannau a chartrefi symudol. Yr wyf yn delio â materion tebyg yn fy etholaeth i. Cawsom ddadl dda iawn ar draws y Siambr, gyda thystiolaeth drawsbleidiol am yr anawsterau gwirioneddol. Tynnaf sylw'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai ac Adfywio at y mater, a gofyn efallai am y newyddion diweddaraf am y camau y dywedodd y byddai'n eu cymryd. Yr oeddech hefyd yn codi materion yn ymwneud â chynllunio, a hwyrach fod angen inni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad edrych ar hyn yn ei gyfanrwydd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am dynnu fy sylw at hyn y prynhawn yma.

The issues surrounding the Hywel Dda NHS Trust and its finances are matters with which the Minister for Health and Social Services is fully engaged. It is her role to ensure that the chief executives deliver on their financial planning assumptions. Her expectations have been made very clear to them.

**Chris Franks:** I welcome the news that the pilot project to support those who have served in the armed forces and have experienced mental health difficulties is to be extended. Could we have a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services on that announcement? My parliamentary colleagues at Westminster have shown that there is still a long way to go, particularly on the integration of services for veterans provided by the Ministry of Defence and the voluntary sector. Will the Welsh Government discuss with Ministers in London the important issue of support for those who have served in the armed forces? We should also consider those in the territorial army who serve as doctors and nurses in conflict zones.

Furthermore, following the fiasco concerning the threatened closure of Bryneithin home for the elderly and mentally infirm, could we have a debate regarding the protection of our most vulnerable residents who are threatened with eviction from their much-loved home?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. That is a matter for the Vale of Glamorgan Council, is it not? I have told you that before.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Chris. On your point about the important announcement that Edwina Hart was able to make on Monday, that the pilot project for the veterans' mental health service will be extended across Wales, I know that it was widely welcomed. The project has been trialled in Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board and Cwm Taf Local Health Board. It is an important new all-Wales service that will be fully funded by the Assembly Government with investment of £485,000 per year. I would also say, in relation to the armed forces, that all war veterans in Wales are entitled to priority NHS

Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r materion yn ymwneud ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Hywel Dda a'i sefyllfa ariannol. Ei swyddogaeth yw sicrhau bod y prif weithredwyr yn cyflawni yn ôl eu tybiaethau cynllunio ariannol. Eglurwyd wrthynt yn glir iawn beth oedd ei disgwyliadau.

**Chris Franks:** Croesawaf y newyddion fod y prosiect peilot i gefnogi pobl sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn y lluoedd arfog ac wedi cael anawsterau iechyd meddwl am gael ei ehangu. A allwn gael datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y cyhoeddiad hwnnw? Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau seneddol yn San Steffan wedi dangos bod llawer o waith i'w wneud o hyd, yn enwedig o ran integreiddio'r gwasanaethau ar gyfer cyn-filwyr a ddarperir gan y Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn a chan y sector gwirfoddol. A wnaiff Llywodraeth y Cynulliad drafod gyda Gweinidogion yn Llundain y mater pwysig hwn o gefnogi pobl sydd wedi gwasanaethu yn y lluoedd arfog? Dylem hefyd gofio'r rheini yn y fyddin diriogaethol sy'n gwasanaethu fel meddygon a nyrsys ar faes y gad.

At hynny, yn dilyn y ffiasgo ynghylch y bygythiad i gau cartref Bryneithin i'r henoed a phobl eiddil eu meddwl, a allem gael dadl ar warchod ein preswylwyr sydd fwyaf agored i niwed ac sydd dan fygythiad o gael eu troi allan o'u cartref hannwyl?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mater i Gyngor Bro Morgannwg yw hynny, onid e? Yr wyf wedi dweud hynny wrthoch o'r blaen.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch, Chris. O ran eich pwynt am y cyhoeddiad pwysig a wnaeth Edwina Hart ddydd Llun, sef bod y prosiect peilot ar gyfer gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl cyn-filwyr am gael ei ymestyn ledled Cymru, gwn ei fod wedi cael croeso cynnes. Mae'r prosiect wedi ei dreialu ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Cwm Taf. Mae'n wasanaeth Cymru gyfan pwysig newydd a gaiff ei gyllido gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda buddsoddiad o £485,000 y flwyddyn. Byddwn hefyd yn dweud, wrth sôn am y lluoedd arfog, bod hawl gan yr holl gyn-filwyr yng Nghymru gael blaenoriaeth ar

treatment for a health condition related to their military service.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Funding for the Wales Women's National Coalition has been removed. In view of the fact that funding has been removed from such an august body that does an enormous amount of very good work, can we have a statement on the issue please? We need to have some questions answered on the need to withdraw funding from such an important body.

**Jane Hutt:** I am sure, Eleanor, that you were here this morning when the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government was answering questions.

**Eleanor Burnham:** No, I was not.

**Jane Hutt:** I know that the Minister dealt with this issue very fully this morning when answering questions on the project.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** I was hoping that we would be able to secure a statement today on the statutory training provided in the national health service. Last week, the inadequate cleanliness of the wards at Llandough Hospital was highlighted by Health Inspectorate Wales. One of the failings that the inspectorate found was that many of the staff had not, sadly, undertaken their statutory training in respect of hygiene and cleanliness on the wards. This is of great concern, given the consequences of not understanding the need for cleanliness and control in our health service and the consequences for patients when *Clostridium difficile* and other conditions arise on the wards. I was hoping that the Minister would be able to come forward with a statement to Plenary on how she is now addressing the statutory training of our healthcare professionals so that we can have the best trained workforce possible in our health service.

I would like the Minister to make a written statement available to Members and to provide an oral address to Plenary on today's announcement that the chief executive of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust will

gyfer triniaeth GIG am gyflwr iechyd sy'n gysylltiedig â'u gwasanaeth milwrol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae cyllid ar gyfer Clymblaid Genedlaethol Menywod Cymru wedi'i ddileu. O gofio bod corff mor barchus â hwnnw sy'n gwneud cymaint o waith da iawn wedi colli ei gyllid, a gawn ni ddatganiad ar y mater, os gwelwch yn dda? Mae angen inni gael atebion i rai cwestiynau am yr angen i dynnu cyllid oddi ar gorff mor bwysig.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn siŵr, Eleanor, eich bod yn bresennol y bore yma pan oedd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn ateb cwestiynau.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Nac oeddwn, nid oeddwn yma.

**Jane Hutt:** Gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi delio â'r mater hwn yn llawn iawn y bore yma wrth ateb cwestiynau am y prosiect.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y gallem gael datganiad heddiw am yr hyfforddiant statudol a ddarperir yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Yr wythnos diwethaf tynnodd Arolygiaeth Iechyd Cymru sylw at y ffaith nad oedd wardiau yn Ysbyty Llandochau yn ddigon glân. Un o'r ffaelecteddau a ddarganfuwyd gan yr arolygiaeth oedd fod nifer o'r staff, yn anffodus, heb gael eu hyfforddiant statudol mewn hylendid a glendid ar y wardiau. Mae hynny'n peri cryn bryder, o gofio'r canlyniadau o beidio â deall yr angen am lendid a rheolaeth yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd, yn ogystal â'r canlyniadau i gleifion pan fydd *Clostridium difficile* a chyflyrau eraill yn ymddangos ar y wardiau. Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog yn gallu cyflwyno datganiad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn am y modd y mae'n rhoi sylw'n awr i hyfforddiant statudol ar gyfer ein gweithwyr gofal iechyd proffesiynol, fel y gallwn gael gweithlu wedi'i hyfforddi i'r graddau gorau posibl yn ein gwasanaeth iechyd.

Hoffwn i'r Gweinidog ddarparu datganiad ysgrifenedig i Aelodau a rhoi annerchiad ar lafar i'r Cyfarfod Llawn am y cyhoeddiad heddiw y bydd prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau



be stepping down. Considering the timeframe that has been indicated, this piece of news has come from nowhere and it will cause great concern to many Members in the Chamber, given what has happened historically when chief executives have left the ambulance trust. We are all aware of the challenges that the ambulance trust faces and for it to find itself without a chief executive is a matter of great concern. I would hope that you will be able to secure a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services so that, next week, we will be able to scrutinise her response in Plenary to discern how she will now take this issue forward. Above all, we may be able to glean an understanding as to how a situation has arisen that has resulted in the chief executive feeling that he has to leave at relatively short notice, within a two-week period.

I am sure that you would join me in asking the Assembly to note that this Friday will be the sixtieth anniversary of the tragic air accident in Sigginstone in the Vale of Glamorgan. Sadly, that village, at the time, faced the task of dealing with 75 deaths and had the dubious honour of witnessing the largest airborne accident involving civilians in the world at that time. Although progress has been made at many airfields, including St Athan and Cardiff airport, which are located in the Vale of Glamorgan, it is essential that we ensure that our emergency services are prepared. Above all, people must feel that they have the support of the Assembly Government when ensuring that these types of events are not forgotten and that, above all, we remember these situations so that we can prevent such a tragedy from occurring again.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you for bringing two key priority areas for the Government to the Assembly this afternoon, to me as the Minister responsible for Assembly business. Of course, the highest standards of hygiene and cleanliness are at the forefront of the Minister for Health and Social Services' priorities for the Welsh NHS. When there are lessons to be learnt and if there is any diminution in terms of standards, we have to look at the reasons for that. I know that that

Ambiwlans Cymru yn rhoi'r gorau i'w swydd. O gofio'r amserlen sydd wedi'i phennu, mae'r newyddion hwn yn annisgwyl iawn a bydd yn peri pryder i lawer o Aelodau yn y Siambr o gofio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol pan fydd prif weithredwyr wedi gadael yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, ac mae bod heb brif weithredwr yn peri pryder aruthrol. Byddwn yn gobeithio y gallwch sicrhau bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn cyflwyno datganiad, fel y gallwn graffu ar ei hymateb yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos nesaf i weld sut y bydd yn symud ymlaen â'r mater hwn. Yn anad dim, mae'n bosibl y gallwn gael dealltwriaeth sut y cododd sefyllfa sydd wedi golygu bod y prif weithredwr yn teimlo'i bod yn rhaid iddo adael ar fyr rybudd, hynny yw, ymhen pythefnos.

Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn ymuno â mi i ofyn i'r Cynulliad nodi trigain mlynedd, y dydd Gwener hwn, ers y ddamwain awyren drasig yn Nhresigin ym Mro Morgannwg. Bryd hynny, yn drist iawn, gorfu'r pentref hwnnw wynebu'r dasg o ddelio â 75 o farwolaethau yn ogystal â chael ei gysylltu â'r ddamwain awyren deithwyr fwyaf yn y byd ar y pryd. Er bod cynnydd wedi'i wneud mewn nifer o feysydd awyr, gan gynnwys maes awyr Sain Tathan a Chaerdydd, sydd ym Mro Morgannwg, mae'n hanfodol inni fod yn sicrhau bod ein gwasanaethau brys yn barod. Yn anad dim, rhaid i bobl deimlo bod ganddynt gefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wrth sicrhau nad yw'r mathau hyn o ddigwyddiadau'n mynd yn angof, ac yn anad dim ein bod yn cofio'r sefyllfaoedd hynny fel y gallwn atal trasiedi o'r fath rhag digwydd eto.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch yn fawr am godi dau faes blaenoriaeth sy'n allweddol i'r Llywodraeth y prynhawn yma a'u dwyn i sylw'r Cynulliad ac i'm sylw fel y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am Fusnes y Cynulliad. Wrth gwrs, mae'r safonau hylendid a glendid uchaf ar frig rhestr blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar gyfer GIG Cymru. Pan fydd gwersi i'w dysgu, ac os bydd safonau'n gostwng, rhaid inni edrych ar y rhesymau dros hynny. Gwn y

will be taken on board by the relevant body—Cardiff and Vale University Local Health Board in this instance—in terms of statutory training.

2.50 p.m.

The matter of the chief executive of the ambulance trust is a matter for the ambulance trust and its board. It is most important to us that the performance of the Welsh ambulance trust has improved considerably, with increased stability, over the last few months. We would not expect there to be a change in terms of its ability to meet those service performance targets and standards for Wales. We see that the performance of the Welsh ambulance trust against the eight-minute target has been sustained over the last few months, particularly—let us recognise—during the difficult few weeks after Christmas when we experienced bad weather. I am sure that everyone in the Chamber would want to congratulate those in the emergency services who were on the front-line during that time. Our role is to ensure that the Welsh ambulance trust continues to improve, with increased stability, which is what I believe that it is doing.

**Peter Black:** Minister, if anything underlines the need for a statement on the ambulance service, it is your interpretation of the performance statistics of the ambulance trust, which worsened during the last two months for which figures are available, although I understand that the figures for February may show an improvement again. I underline Andrew R.T. Davies's request for a statement on the ambulance service. Obviously the loss of the chief executive is a matter of great regret, but there are a number of issues that his successor will need to address, including the efficiency review of the ambulance trust, the fact that the ambulance trust is failing to meet its targets in a number of key areas of Wales—notably, rural Wales and south-east Wales—and the impact on its performance of issues around accident and emergency departments and the shortage of acute beds. It is apposite that the Minister should come to us with a statement on the ambulance trust in the light of the standing down of the chief executive so that she can answer questions on

caiff hynny ei dderbyn gan y corff perthnasol—Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Caerdydd a'r Fro yn yr enghraifft hon—mewn cysylltiad â hyfforddiant statudol.

Mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans a'i bwrdd yw mater prif weithredwr yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Yr hyn sydd bwysicaf i ni yw bod perfformiad ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru wedi gwella'n sylweddol, a hynny'n fwy sefydlog, dros y misoedd diwethaf. Ni fyddem yn disgwyl gweld newid o ran ei gallu i gyrraedd y safonau a'r targedau perfformiad gwasanaeth hynny yng Nghymru. Gwelwn fod perfformiad ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru yn erbyn y targed o wyth munud wedi'i gynnal dros y misoedd diwethaf, yn enwedig yn ystod yr wythnosau anodd hynny ar ôl y Nadolig adeg y tywydd garw—a gadewch inni gydnabod hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pawb yn y Siambr yn dymuno llongyfarch y rheini yn y gwasanaethau brys a oedd yn y rheng flaen yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw. Ein swyddogaeth ni yw sicrhau bod ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru yn parhau i wella, a hynny'n fwy sefydlog, sef yr hyn y credaf y mae'n ei wneud.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, os oes unrhyw beth yn tanlinellu'r angen am ddatganiad am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, yna eich dehongliad o ystadegau perfformiad yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yw hynny. Maent wedi gwaethygu yn ystod y ddau fis diwethaf pan oedd ffigurau ar gael ar eu cyfer, er fy mod yn deall y gallai'r ffigurau am fis Chwefror ddangos gwelliant unwaith eto. Ategfaf gais Andrew R.T. Davies i gael datganiad am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn amlwg, mae colli prif weithredwr yn peri cryn siom, ond mae yna nifer o faterion y byddyn rhaid i'w olynydd roi sylw iddynt, gan gynnwys adolygiad o effeithlonrwydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, y ffaith bod yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn methu â chyrraedd ei dargedau mewn nifer o ardaloedd allweddol yng Nghymru—yn benodol, Cymru wledig a'r de ddwyrain—a'r effaith ar ei pherfformiad gan faterion yn ymwneud ag adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a phrinder gwelyau aciwt. Mae'n arbennig o berthnasol fod y

the way forward for that trust, and so that we can ask questions on it.

Secondly, Minister, is it possible to have a written statement on the Government's dealings with the UK Government over the draft LCO on housing? It seems to me that until the general election is called, the fate of that LCO lies very much in the hands of the Government. If it is able to get a date for debates in the House of Commons and the House of Lords, and if it were to be approved, we would be able to implement it. If it ends up in the wash-up, clearly its fate is far murkier. Minister, since you failed to answer me on that point during questions to the First Minister, it is important that we have some clarity as to exactly what the Government is doing to try to get a debate on that draft LCO as a matter of urgency.

**Jane Hutt:** I do not think that there is anything more to add on the ambulance trust. It is important that the ambulance trust, its management and the trust board responsible for it continue to deliver and improve. However, we must remember the difficulties that the service faced during the early weeks of this year due to the bad weather. It is also important to remember that, in October 2009, the Minister announced £4.96 million additional funding for the Welsh ambulance service for replacement vehicles. I was very pleased to hear that in the south-east region, for example, 16 newly trained paramedics and 18 additional technicians are now in post. Those are important factors that will help to improve and sustain the ambulance trust as it now seeks to appoint a new chief executive.

I think that your point about the progress of the draft LCO on sustainable housing is important. I will be looking to ensure that that draft LCO can be secured. That will be happening in another place, but I will be

Gweinidog yn rhoi datganiad inni am y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, yn sgil penderfyniad y prif weithredwr i roi'r gorau i'w swydd, fel y gall ateb cwestiynau am y ffordd ymlaen i'r ymddiriedolaeth, ac fel y gallwn ni ofyn cwestiynau am hynny.

Yn ail, Weinidog, a yw'n bosibl cael datganiad ysgrifenedig am drafodaethau'r Llywodraeth gyda Llywodraeth y DU am y Gorchymyn Cymhwysedd Deddfwriaethol drafft ynghylch tai? Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod tynged yr LCO yn nwylo'r Llywodraeth i bob pwrpas nes caiff etholiad cyffredinol ei alw. Petai'n gallu cael dyddiad ar gyfer dadleuon yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin ac yn Nhŷ'r Arglwyddi, a phetai'n cael ei gymeradwyo, gallem ei roi ar waith. Os caiff ei roi o'r neilltu, yn amlwg bydd ei dynged lawer yn fwy ansicr. Weinidog, gan na wnaethoch fy ateb ar y pwynt hwnnw yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, mae'n bwysig inni gael rhywfaint o eglurder ynghylch beth yn union mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i geisio cael dadl ar yr LCO drafft hwnnw fel mater o frys.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid wyf yn credu bod llawer mwy i'w ddweud am yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Mae'n bwysig i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, ei rheolwyr a bwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth sy'n gyfrifol amdani barhau i gyflawni a gwella. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gofio'r anawsterau a oedd yn wynebu'r gwasanaeth yn ystod yr wythnosau cyntaf eleni yn sgil y tywydd gwael. Mae'n bwysig cofio hefyd fod y Gweinidog, ym mis Hydref 2009, wedi cyhoeddi £4.96 miliwn o gyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i brynu cerbydau newydd. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn clywed yn rhanbarth y de ddwyrain, er enghraifft, fod 16 o barafeddygon sydd newydd orffen eu hyfforddiant a 18 o dechnegwyr ychwanegol bellach wedi dechrau yn eu swyddi. Mae'r rheini'n ffactorau pwysig a fydd yn helpu gwella a chynnal yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans wrth iddi fynd ati'n awr i geisio penodi prif weithredwr newydd.

Credaf fod eich pwynt am gynnydd yr LCO drafft ynghylch tai cynaliadwy yn bwysig. Byddaf yn ceisio sicrhau bod yr LCO drafft hwnnw'n cael ei gyflawni. Bydd hynny'n digwydd mewn man arall, ond byddaf yn

raising this issue with my colleagues in the UK Government. I go back to the point that I made this morning: would it not have been so much better if the whole Chamber, including the Welsh Conservatives, had backed that draft LCO when they had the opportunity? If everyone had backed it, that would have ensured that there was a clear indication of the will of the National Assembly for Wales and that we wish to support people who are homeless, housing associations in order to make sure that they are not at risk, and that we support a change in allocations policy and the single tenancy. All those things will make a difference to people's lives in Wales.

**Mark Isherwood:** The Welsh Government had the opportunity to make that a wholly consensual Order; however, I will move on.

I reinforce the call for a statement on funding for the Wales Women's National Coalition. In the Minister's earlier response, she referred to a response by her colleague Carl Sargeant, but it is my understanding that we did not reach that question on the agenda today because Carl was giving such full and efficient answers to the earlier questions. As you will be aware, the coalition was informed that it would not receive core funding, which caused it grave concern as it gives the message that the Welsh Government no longer values or requires an independent advocacy body for women's equality. It contrasted that with the equivalent bodies in England and Scotland, which do receive Government funding, and asked whether its work was not seen as necessary or sufficiently valuable for the Welsh Government to find additional funding for it urgently. I urge the Minister to reconsider that and to ask colleagues to provide a statement.

My second and final point is to call for a statement on the Minister for health's press release regarding veterans' mental health services across Wales. It is the second time in this session that the Minister has made major announcements to the press rather than to the National Assembly for Wales, and that she has then put a copy of the release on the Welsh Government's website. That causes

codi'r mater gyda'm cyd-Weinidogion yn Llywodraeth y DU. Dychwelaf at y pwynt a wneuthum y bore yma: oni fyddai'n well o lawer petai'r Siambr gyfan, gan gynnwys Ceidwadwyr Cymru, wedi cefnogi'r LCO drafft hwnnw pan gawsant y cyfle? Petai pawb wedi'i gefnogi, byddai hynny wedi sicrhau arwydd clir o ddyhead Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a'n dymuniad i gefnogi pobl ddigartref, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydynt mewn perygl, a'n bod yn cefnogi newid y polisi dyrannu a'r denantiaeth sengl. Bydd pob un o'r pethau hyn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i fywyd pobl yng Nghymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cafodd Llywodraeth Cymru gyfle i'w wneud yn Orchymyn hollol gydsyniol; fodd bynnag, symudaf ymlaen.

Ategef yr alwad am ddatganiad ynghylch cyllido Clymblaid Genedlaethol Menywod Cymru. Yn ymateb y Gweinidog yn gynharach, cyfeiriodd at ymateb ei chyd-Weinidog Carl Sargeant, ond deallaf na chyrrhaeddwyd y cwestiwn hwnnw ar yr agenda heddiw gan fod Carl yn rhoi atebion mor llawn ac effeithiol i'r cwestiynau blaenorol. Fel y gwyddoch, hysbyswyd y glymblaid na fyddai'n cael cyllid craidd, gan beri pryder aruthrol iddi oherwydd mae'n cyfleu'r neges nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwerthfawrogi corff eirioli annibynnol dros gyfle cyfartal i fenywod, nac yn credu bod arni angen corff o'r fath mwyach. Cymharodd y Glymblaid hynny â sefyllfa'r cyrff cyfatebol yn Lloegr a'r Alban, sy'n cael cyllid gan y Llywodraeth, a gofynnodd a oedd ei gwaith yn cael ei ystyried yn ddigon gwerthfawr neu angenrheidiol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddod o hyd i gyllid ychwanegol ar ei chyfer ar fyrder. Anogaf y Gweinidog i ailystyried hynny ac i ofyn i gyd-Weinidogion ddarparu datganiad.

Fy ail bwynt, a'm pwynt olaf, yw gofyn am ddatganiad ynghylch datganiad i'r wasg gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl i gyn-filwyr ledled Cymru. Dyma'r eildro yn y sesiwn hon i'r Gweinidog wneud cyhoeddiadau pwysig i'r wasg yn hytrach nag i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, ac wedyn wedi rhoi copi o'r datganiad ar wefan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae

grave constitutional concerns, but, more broadly, it raises questions, regrettably, as to the sincerity of the statement. Some senior clinicians have contacted me to say that this is 'dirty politics'. In north Wales, a leading campaigner for veterans, who is himself a veteran, told me that this makes him wonder whether Ministers are really taking this issue seriously. He said that, if provision is available, he would love to know where. Would it have accepted veterans on stringent bail conditions and adopted the responsibility for their 24-hour supervision, as well as treating their condition while awaiting trial, as third sector bodies are currently trying to do?

Has the pilot scheme been appraised? We do not know. Has the roll-out of the scheme been costed? We do not know. We do not know which clinicians will be used, what relevant expertise they have, where the scheme will be located, or how the money will be allocated. The Minister says that she is bringing together the Ministry of Defence, the Welsh Government and staff from the NHS, but what about the experts in the third, voluntary and independent sectors who are already working in this area, without whom you cannot possibly begin to deliver on this programme?

Finally, what of the residential respite and therapy needs of those with complex post traumatic stress disorder, as evidence indicates that, for those people, the sort of model that is being rolled out in Cardiff risks simply unlocking nightmares for them to live with until their next therapy session, while they live in the community with all the risks of abuse and suicide that goes with that?

**Jane Hutt:** I will pick up on your last point first. It is disappointing that you cannot welcome the fact that the veterans' mental health service has been extended across Wales. It is an extension of a pilot project. I am sure that you will have read the statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services, in which she said that this will be a

hynny'n peri pryderon cyfansoddiadol difrifol, ond yn fwy cyffredinol mae'n codi cwestiynau, yn anffodus, ynghylch didwylledd y datganiad. Mae rhai uwch-glinigwyr wedi cysylltu â mi i ddweud bod hyn yn 'wleidyddiaeth fudr'. Yn y gogledd mae ymgyrchydd amlwg dros gyn-filwyr, sy'n gyn-filwr ei hun, wedi dweud wrthyf fod hyn yn gwneud iddo feddwl a yw Gweinidogion yn wir yn cymryd y mater hwn o ddifrif. Dywedodd, os yw'r ddarpariaeth ar gael, y byddai wrth ei fodd yn gwybod ble. Gofynnodd a fyddai wedi derbyn cyn-filwyr ag amodau mechnïaeth caeth, ac a fyddai wedi ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros eu goruchwyllo 24 awr y dydd, yn ogystal â chynnig triniaeth am eu cyflwr tra oeddent yn aros am dreial, fel y mae cyrff y trydydd sector yn ceisio'i wneud ar hyn o bryd?

A yw'r cynllun peilot wedi ei werthuso? Ni wyddom. A gyfrifwyd y gost o roi'r cynllun ar waith? Ni wyddom. Ni wyddom pa glinigwyr a fydd yn cael eu defnyddio, pa arbenigedd perthnasol sydd ganddynt, ble fydd y cynllun yn cael ei leoli, na sut y caiff yr arian ei ddyrannu. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud ei bod yn dod â'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn, Llywodraeth Cymru a staff o'r GIG at ei gilydd, ond beth am yr arbenigwyr yn y trydydd sector, y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector annibynnol sydd eisoes yn gweithio yn y maes hwn? Hebddynt nid oes posibilrwydd o gwbl ichi ddechrau cyflawni'r rhaglen hon?

Yn olaf, beth am anghenion therapi a seibiant preswyl pobl sydd ag anhwylder straen wedi trawma cymhleth, oherwydd mae tystiolaeth yn nodi, ar gyfer y bobl hynny, fod perygl yn y math o fodel sy'n cael ei gyflwyno yng Nghaerdydd y gallai eu hatgoffa o'r hunllefau ac y byddant yn gorfod dygymod â hynny nes iddynt gael eu sesiwn therapi nesaf, tra byddant yn byw yn y gymuned a'r holl risgiau a ddaw yn sgil hynny o gamddefnyddio a hunanladdiad?

**Jane Hutt:** Dechreuaf drwy ddelio â'ch pwynt olaf. Mae'n drueni na allwch groesawu'r ffaith fod y gwasanaeth iechyd meddwl i gyn-filwyr wedi ei ymestyn ledled Cymru. Mae'n estyniad o brosiect peilot. Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wedi darllen y datganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, lle dywedodd y

new all-Wales service, and which says that veterans and carers will have a comprehensive assessment, that they will be involved in the development of a management plan for their health and care needs, and that they will be given information on other services and support to which they are entitled.

The other point that she has made is that she requires health boards and NHS trusts to designate an armed forces and veterans' champion to drive forward improvements. Surely, that is what veterans and their families want to hear and want to know are our priorities.

A number of grant schemes to advance equality are being dealt with by the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government, and a great many organisations are benefiting from that. These are times when grant conditions and applications have to be considered carefully and we are aware of the work of the Wales Women's National Coalition. As the Minister said in questions to him this morning, these issues are considered very carefully in terms of our current tight budgetary framework.

3.00 p.m.

**Nick Ramsay:** I wish to raise two issues. The first, raised earlier by Peter Black, is on ambulance response times, which remain a serious concern for my constituents in Monmouthshire and in the south-east Wales area in general. I would also be grateful for a statement from the Minister on what she plans to do to try to improve response times, particularly in rural areas, where, understandably, there have been issues about important calls not being responded to in time. I would be grateful for a debate on that.

Secondly, you will know that I have raised, with the First Minister and with you, my concerns about the digital switchover in Wales and the issues that constituents have raised with me about the effectiveness of equipment with which they have been

byddai hwn yn wasanaeth newydd i Gymru gyfan ac sy'n dweud y bydd cyn-filwyr a gofalwyr yn cael asesiad cynhwysfawr, y byddant yn rhan o'r broses o lunio cynllun rheoli ar gyfer eu hanghenion iechyd a gofal, ac y byddant yn cael gwybodaeth am gymorth a gwasanaethau eraill y mae hawl ganddynt i'w cael.

Y pwynt arall y mae wedi'i wneud yw ei bod yn gofyn i fyrddau iechyd ac ymddiriedolaethau GIG ddynodi hyrwyddwr ar gyfer y lluoedd arfog a chyn-filwyr er mwyn gyrru gwelliannau ymlaen. Yn sicr, dyna y mae cyn-filwyr a'u teuluoedd am ei glywed ac wybod eu bod yn flaenoriaethau inni.

Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn delio â nifer o gynlluniau grant i ddatblygu cydraddoldeb, ac mae llawer iawn o fudiadau'n elwa o hynny. Mae hwn yn gyfnod lle mae'n rhaid ystyried amodau a cheisiadau grant yn ofalus, ac yr ydym yn ymwybodol o waith Clymblaid Genedlaethol Menywod Cymru. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn ystod cwestiynau iddo y bore yma, mae'r rhain yn faterion sy'n cael eu hystyried yn ofalus iawn o safbwynt ein fframwaith cyllidebol caeth presennol.

**Nick Ramsay:** Hoffwn godi dau fater. Mae'r cyntaf, a godwyd yn gynharach gan Peter Black, yn ymwneud ag amseroedd ymateb cerbydau ambiwlans, sy'n dal yn bryder difrifol i'm hetholwyr yn sir Fynwy ac yn ardal y de ddwyrain yn gyffredinol. Byddwn hefyd yn ddiolchgar am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog am yr hyn y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud i geisio gwella amseroedd ymateb, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, lle mae problemau wedi bod, yn ddealladwy, am na fu ymateb prydlon i alwadau pwysig. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am gael dadl ar hynny.

Yn ail, byddwch yn gwybod imi godi fy mhryderon gyda'r Prif Weinidog a gyda chithau am y newid i'r digidol yng Nghymru a'r materion y mae etholwyr wedi'u codi gyda mi am effeithiolrwydd yr offer sydd wedi'i ddarparu iddynt. A allem gael

supplied. Could we have a statement on your liaison with Westminster on this? I realise that this is not necessarily a devolved issue, but it is of concern to many of my constituents, particularly those who are aged over 80, who are targeted by the digital switchover campaign. It would be appropriate for us to have that discussion.

**Jane Hutt:** The Minister for Health and Social Services responds regularly during questions and at other times to questions on the ambulance service's performance and she is robust with the Welsh Ambulance Service NHS Trust with regard to AMs' expectations on improvement and on sustaining delivery. However, I want to recognise how difficult it was to meet demand during the severe weather conditions after Christmas. I also welcome the fact that there was a great deal of partnership working at that time—which might have included your constituency, Nick—with the Red Cross, local mountain rescue teams, St John Ambulance and community first responders. I am proud to be president of Barry First Responders, which does a tremendous job in my constituency. I am sure that you would also want to congratulate those organisations that helped during that time.

You raised an important point about digital switchover. On the role that we play, we have been working closely with Digital Outreach Ltd to ensure that it has a strong team of people to lead at community level. That is the key point. There is a switchover help scheme and it has been heavily promoted in Wales. It has looked in particular at older and disabled viewers and the assistance that we need to give them. Officials in Welsh Assembly Government departments such as the tourism, health and education departments have also assisted key stakeholders in Wales, along with Digital UK, to ensure that those people in our communities are ready to switch to digital television.

**Alun Cairns:** You will be well aware that ambulance services have been a subject of interest in the Chamber for some time. There have not only been committee investigations, but an investigation by the auditor general, as well as a high turnover of chief executives

datganiad am eich trafodaethau gyda San Steffan am hyn? Sylweddolaf nad yw hwn o reidrwydd yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, ond mae'n peri pryder i lawer o'm hetholwyr, yn enwedig y rheini dros 80 oed, a dargedwyd gan yr ymgyrch newid i'r digidol. Byddai'n briodol inni gael y drafodaeth honno.

**Jane Hutt:** Bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ymateb yn rheolaidd yn ystod y sesiwn gwestiynau ac ar adegau eraill i gwestiynau am berfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ac mae hi'n gadarn gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG y Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans o ran disgwyliadau Aelodau Cynulliad mewn cysylltiad â gwella a chynnal y ddarpariaeth. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gydnabod mor anodd oedd ateb y galw yn ystod y tywydd gwael ar ôl y Nadolig. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith bod llawer o weithio mewn partneriaeth yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw—o bosibl yn eich etholaeth chi, Nick—gyda'r Groes Goch, timau achub mynydd lleol, Ambiwllans Sant Ioan ac ymatebwyr cyntaf yn y gymuned. Yr wyf yn falch o fod yn llywydd Ymatebwyr Cyntaf y Bari, sy'n gwneud gwaith rhagorol yn fy etholaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech hefyd longyfarch y mudiadau hynny a fu'n helpu yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw.

Codwyd pwynt pwysig gennych am y newid i'r digidol. O ran ein rôl, yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio'n agos gyda Digital Outreach Ltd i sicrhau bod ganddo dîm cadarn o bobl i arwain ar lefel gymunedol. Dyna'r pwynt allweddol. Mae yna gynllun cymorth newid i'r digidol sydd wedi ei hyrwyddo'n frwd yng Nghymru. Mae wedi canolbwyntio'n benodol ar wylwyr hŷn ac anabl ac ar y cymorth y mae angen inni ei roi iddynt. Mae swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn adrannau megis twristiaeth, iechyd ac addysg hefyd wedi cynorthwyo rhanddeiliaid allweddol yng Nghymru, ar y cyd â Digital UK, i sicrhau bod y bobl hynny yn ein cymunedau yn barod i newid i deledu digidol.

**Alun Cairns:** Byddwch yn gwybod yn iawn fod gwasanaethau ambiwlans wedi bod yn bwnc trafod yn y Siambr ers cryn amser. Nid yn unig yr ydym wedi cael ymchwiliadau gan bwyllgorau, ond hefyd cafwyd ymchwiliad gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol, heb sôn am

over recent years. On each of those occasions in the past, the Minister has shown the courtesy of at least making a statement to demonstrate some kind of leadership and support to the staff and to explain the reasons behind the departure of the chief executives. Do you not think that that is the courteous thing to do? It is not only about being courteous, because we can ignore manners at a time like this; we need to know what sort of leadership the Welsh Assembly Government is offering to an all-Wales body that has been the subject of discussion in the Chamber for good and bad reasons for some considerable time. Do you agree that there should be an oral statement in the Chamber, not a written statement at 4 p.m. or 5 p.m. on a Friday afternoon before a Wales rugby match on Saturday.

**Jane Hutt:** The whole of your weekend may be taken up with preparing for the Wales-Ireland rugby match, but other people do business on Friday evening and Saturday and hold surgeries and so on. I am certain that the ambulance service will be hard at work over this weekend. We must put this to rest. This is not a matter for me to respond to in the Chamber. This is a matter of human resources and is the responsibility of the Welsh Ambulance Service NHS Trust board, which has a chair and non-executive directors. Of course, the Minister for Health and Social Services ensures that the delivery, performance and sustainability of the ambulance trust is at the forefront of her considerations.

**Paul Davies:** I would be grateful if the Minister could ask the Minister for Health and Social Services to bring forward a statement on the provision of orthodontic services. Representations are made to me regularly by parents about the lack of orthodontic services for children in west Wales. I have dealt with cases where children have been unable to access treatment for a number of years. As the Minister is aware, there can be long-term effects if children are not treated at the appropriate time. In the circumstances, I would be grateful if the Minister for Health and Social Services could

drosiant uchel y prif weithredwyr dros y blynyddoedd diweddar. Ar bob un o'r adegau hyn yn y gorffennol, mae'r Gweinidog o leiaf wedi dangos cwrteisi drwy wneud datganiad i ddangos rhyw fath o arweiniad a chefnogaeth i'r staff ac i egluro'r rhesymau pam mae'r prif weithredwyr wedi gadael. Onid ydych yn credu mai dyna'r peth cwrtais i'w wneud? Nid mater o fod yn gwrtais yn unig yw hyn, oherwydd gallwn anwybyddu moesgarwch ar adeg fel hon; ond mae angen inni wybod pa fath o arweiniad y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei gynnig i gorff Cymru gyfan sydd wedi bod yn destun trafod yn y Siambr am resymau da a drwg ers cryn amser. Oni chytunwch y dylid cael datganiad llafar yn y Siambr, ac nid datganiad ysgrifenedig am 4 p.m. neu 5 p.m. ar brynhawn dydd Gwener cyn gêm rygbi Cymru ar y dydd Sadwrn.

**Jane Hutt:** Efallai eich bod chi'n treulio'ch penwythnos cyfan yn paratoi ar gyfer y gêm rygbi rhwng Cymru a'r Iwerddon, ond mae pobl eraill yn gweithio ar nos Wener a dydd Sadwrn ac yn cynnal cymorthfeydd, ac ati. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn gweithio'n galed dros y penwythnos hwn. Rhaid inni glymu pen y mwdwl y drafodaeth hon. Nid yw'n fater i mi ymateb iddo yn y Siambr. Mater yw hwn o adnoddau dynol, a bwrdd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans Cymru, sydd â chadeirydd a chyfarwyddwyr anweithredol, sy'n gyfrifol amdano. Wrth gwrs, mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn sicrhau bod darpariaeth, perfformiad a chynaliadwyedd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ar frig rhestr ei hystyriaethau.

**Paul Davies:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyflwyno datganiad am ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau orthodonteg. Byddaf yn cael sylwadau'n rheolaidd gan rieni am ddiffyg gwasanaethau orthodonteg i blant yn y gorllewin. Yr wyf wedi delio ag achosion lle nad yw plant wedi gallu cael triniaeth am flynyddoedd. Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, gall plant ddioddef effeithiau tymor hir os na chânt eu trin ar yr adeg briodol. Dan yr amgylchiadau, byddwn yn ddiolchgar petai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau



bring forward a statement telling us what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to address this issue in general and, in particular, on the lack of provision in areas such as mine.

**Jane Hutt:** I am sure that the Minister for Health and Social Services would be happy to receive any correspondence to identify any issues in respect of orthodontic services.

**Angela Burns:** I have two questions for you today. First, I make no apology for being the third person to ask you to ask the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government to make a statement on the lack of funding for the Wales Women's National Coalition. The Assembly has prided itself on its transparency and its gender equality. That is enshrined in our principles and our methodology, and yet we will be the only country in the United Kingdom without a Government-sponsored equality champion. International representation on behalf of the women of Wales will, effectively, be lost. That includes our representation on bodies such as the UK Joint Committee on Women, the European Women's Lobby and the Committee on the Status of Women. Many of the smaller bodies that rely on the WWNC for support will lose their funding and their status, and will close down. I can give you evidence to support that, so I would be grateful if you would ask the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government to bring forward a statement on this matter, as I would not like to see this retrograde step.

The second point that I would like to bring to your attention relates to the news that we have all heard about the possibility that the refinery in Pembroke will be sold. If the bid is successful, that is to be welcomed. However, I am concerned that yet another major employer in Wales is looking to streamline its operations here. We have already lost 900 jobs at Bosch, we have lost Anglesey Aluminium, Air Products, and Indesit, and that is to name but a few. Will you ask your colleague, the Minister for the Economy and Transport, to bring forward a statement on what the Government can do to

Cymdeithasol yn gallu gwneud datganiad i ddweud wrthym beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i roi sylw i'r mater hwn yn gyffredinol, ac yn benodol am y diffyg darpariaeth mewn ardaloedd fel fy etholaeth i.

**Jane Hutt:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn fodlon derbyn unrhyw ohebiaeth sy'n tynnu sylw at unrhyw faterion yn ymwneud â gwasanaethau orthodonteg.

**Angela Burns:** Mae gennyf ddau gwestiwn ichi heddiw. Yn gyntaf, nid wyf yn ymddiheuro am fod y trydydd person i ofyn ichi ofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol wneud datganiad ar y diffyg cyllid i Glymblaid Genedlaethol Menywod Cymru. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi ymfalchïo yn ei dryloywder a'i gydraddoldeb rhyw. Mae hynny wrth wraidd ein hegwyddorion a'n methodoleg, ac eto ni fydd yr unig wlad yn y Deyrnas Unedig heb hyrwyddwr cydraddoldeb a noddir gan y Llywodraeth. I bob pwrpas, bydd menywod Cymru yn colli eu cynrychiolaeth ryngwladol. Mae hynny'n cynnwys ein cynrychiolaeth ar gyff megis Cyd-bwyllgor Menywod y DU, Lobi Ewropeaidd y Menywod a'r Pwyllgor ar Statws Menywod. Bydd nifer o'r cyrff llai sy'n dibynnu ar y Glymblaid am gymorth yn colli eu cyllid a'u statws, a byddant yn cau. Gallaf gyflwyno tystiolaeth ichi i gefnogi hynny, felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar petaech yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol wneud datganiad ar y mater hwn, oherwydd nid wyf am weld y cam hwn yn ôl.

Mae'r ail bwynt yr hoffwn ei ddwyn i'ch sylw yn ymwneud â'r newyddion sy'n hysbys i bawb am y posibilrwydd y caiff y burfa yn Benfro ei gwerthu. Os bydd y cynnig yn llwyddiannus, mae hynny i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn poeni bod cyflogwr mawr arall eto yng Nghymru yn ystyried ailwampio'i weithgareddau yma. Yr ydym eisoes wedi colli 900 o swyddi yn Bosch, yr ydym wedi colli Alwminiwm Môn, Air Products ac Indesit, i enw rhai'n unig. A wnewch chi ofyn i'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, wneud datganiad am yr hyn y gall y

encourage such companies to stay, what it can do when companies indicate that they may not be able to carry on, and how we can intervene to provide help in certain areas? For example, I know, from talking to Chevron, that transportation and the transport infrastructure is an issue that irks all of the energy companies in west Wales. I also ask that you suggest to your colleague that we might have a debate on what the National Assembly for Wales could do, on a united, cross-party basis, to head off at the pass these decisions by large companies to close down or relocate because they no longer find the environment here favourable, as we need every single job that we can possibly save.

**Jane Hutt:** The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government is aware of the concerns. There are always issues and concerns around funding allocations and decisions. The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government is taking this into account, and I will ask him to write to all those Members who raised this issue this afternoon.

3.10 p.m.

On your point about Chevron, as one example of the difficulties faced by businesses and multinationals, as well as our workforces, and the uncertainty in your constituency, I appreciate the point that you made, and you know that I have said this morning that the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport and his officials are already closely in touch with Chevron. The company is not moving out. This is a European decision, which is not just affecting Wales, as all its refineries are up for sale. We hope that the operations here can be sustained, because, as the manager said, they are efficient, they deliver and, as far as we are concerned, it is the best place for them to be located. Clearly, the economic renewal programme that is being driven forward by the Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport is addressing these issues.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Minister, I have two

Llywodraeth ei wneud i annog cwmnïau o'r fath i aros, beth y gall ei wneud pan fydd cwmnïau'n gwneud synau sy'n awgrymu nad ydynt yn gallu parhau, a sut y gallwn ymyrryd i ddarparu cymorth mewn ardaloedd penodol? Er enghraifft, wrth siarad â Chevron, gwn fod cludiant a'r seilwaith cludiant yn fater sy'n dân ar groen yr holl gwmnïau ynni yn y gorllewin. Gofynnaf ichi hefyd awgrymu wrth eich cyd-Weinidog y gallem gael dadl ar yr hyn y gallai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ei wneud, ar sail unedig, drawsbleidiol, i ddarbwylllo cwmnïau mawr i beidio â phenderfynu cau neu symud am nad ydynt yn ystyried bod yr amgylchedd yma yn ffafriol mwyach, oherwydd mae angen inni achub pob un swydd bosibl.

**Jane Hutt:** Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon. Mae yna broblemau a phryderon bob amser mewn cysylltiad â phenderfyniadau a dyraniadau cyllid. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol yn ystyried hyn, a gofynnaf iddo ysgrifennu at yr holl Aelodau hynny sydd wedi codi'r mater hwn y prynhawn yma.

O ran eich pwynt am Chevron, fel un enghraifft o'r anawsterau sy'n wynebu busnesau a chwmnïau rhyngwladol, yn ogystal â'n gweithluoedd, a'r ansicrwydd yn eich etholaeth chi, yr wyf yn gwerthfawri'r pwynt a wnaethoch, a gwyddoch fy mod wedi dweud y bore yma fod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth a'i swyddogion eisoes mewn cysylltiad agos â Chevron. Nid yw'r cwmni'n symud allan. Penderfyniad Ewropeaidd yw hwn, sy'n effeithio nid yn unig ar Gymru, gan fod ei holl burfeydd ar werth. Gobeithio y gellir parhau'r gwaith yma, oherwydd fel y dywedodd y rheolwr, maent yn effeithlon, maent yn cyflawni, a chyn belled ag yr ydym ni yn y cwestiwn, dyma'r lleoliad gorau iddynt. Yn amlwg, mae'r rhaglen adfywio economaidd sy'n cael ei gyrru gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yn rhoi sylw i'r materion hyn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Weinidog, mae gennyf

particular requests for statements in Plenary. The first is to the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning, about the implementation of the foundation phase. Concerns have been expressed, and not just to me, but to other Members, too, about the way in which local authorities are able to implement the foundation phase, and there are concerns about the funding, particularly when it comes to a decision over whether teaching assistants at level 2 or 3 will be funded wholly by local authorities or partly by schools. Those concerns have been raised by schools in my constituency, and I think that we ought to have a statement from the Government so that we can explore whether there have been any unacceptable variations in the way in which the foundation phase is being delivered.

The second request is to support colleagues who believe strongly that the Minister for health should make a statement here about where the ambulance service in Wales now goes. We are now in a deeply embarrassing position, having lost another chief executive. It really is a disastrous position for the organisation to be in. I can only guess at what the job advertisement may look like—'Yet another chief executive required. Job-specific criteria: to be able to manage and handle the mood swings of the health Minister. Term of office: uncertain'. We are in a most dreadful situation here, Minister. We have lost another chief executive; one whom I believe was more than capable of doing his job. I believe strongly that if the organisation is to have any future in providing the service to the people of Wales that we need, the Minister for health ought to come here as a matter of urgency so that we can discuss these issues.

**Jane Hutt:** Had you been in the Chamber when a question was asked about the foundation phase earlier, you would have heard ringing endorsement and backing from the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning for our foundation phase. It has been a priority for the One Wales Government, and we have funded it.

We also have an operational group, with all of the partners involved, including local authorities and teaching unions, in the

ddau gais penodol am ddatganiadau yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae'r un cyntaf i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ynghylch gweithredu'r cyfnod sylfaen. Mae pryderon wedi'u mynegi, ac nid yn unig i mi, ond i Aelodau eraill hefyd, am y ffordd y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gallu rhoi'r cyfnod sylfaen ar waith. Mae yna bryderon hefyd am gyllido, yn enwedig pan fydd angen penderfynu a fydd cynorthwywyr addysgu lefel 2 neu 3 yn cael eu cyllido'n llwyr gan awdurdodau lleol ynteu'n rhannol gan ysgolion. Mae ysgolion yn fy etholaeth i wedi mynegi'r pryderon hynny, a chredaf y dylem gael datganiad gan y Llywodraeth fel y gallwn archwilio i weld a oes unrhyw amrywiadau annerbyniol ar waith yn y ffordd y caiff y cyfnod sylfaen ei gyflwyno.

Mae'r ail gais yn cefnogi fy nghyd-Aelodau sy'n credu'n gryf y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd wneud datganiad yma ynghylch y ffordd ymlaen yn awr i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa chwithig iawn yn awr, ar ôl colli prif weithredwr arall. Mae'n sefyllfa drychinebus i'r sefydliad fod ynddi. Ni allaf ond dychmygu beth fydd geiriad yr hysbyseb swydd—'Yr ydym unwaith eto yn chwilio am brif weithredwr arall. Meini prawf penodol i'r swydd: gallu rheoli ac ymdopi â thymor y Gweinidog dros iechyd. Cyfnod y swydd: ansicr'. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa sobor iawn, Weinidog. Yr ydym wedi colli prif weithredwr arall; un a oedd yn fy marn i yn fwy nag abl i wneud ei waith. Credaf yn gryf, os yw'r sefydliad am gael unrhyw ddyfodol o ran darparu'r gwasanaeth y mae ei angen arnom i bobl Cymru, y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd ddod yma fel mater o frys fel y gallwn drafod y materion hyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Petaech yn y Siambr pan ofynnwyd cwestiwn am y cyfnod sylfaen yn gynharach, byddech wedi clywed y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn canmol ein cyfnod sylfaen i'r cymylau ac yn datgan ei gefnogaeth iddo. Mae wedi bod yn flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth Cymru'n Un, ac yr ydym wedi'i gyllido.

Mae gennym hefyd grŵp gweithredol, gyda'r holl bartneriaid, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol ac undebau athrawon, yn cyfrannu at ei

implementation, and I am sure that that is addressing those issues.

I deeply object, Llywydd, to the statement that Jonathan Morgan made as far as the Minister for Health and Social Services is concerned, and I am sure that he would wish to withdraw it.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you, Minister.

weithredu, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod y grŵp hwnnw'n rhoi sylw i'r materion hynny.

Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'n gryf, Lywydd, y datganiad a wnaeth Jonathan Morgan am y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n dymuno ei dynnu'n ôl.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch yn fawr, Weinidog.

### **Datganiad Deddfwriaethol am Fesur Arfaethedig y Gymraeg Legislative Statement on the Proposed Welsh Language Measure**

**Y Gweinidog dros Dreftadaeth (Alun Ffred Jones):** Mae'n rhoi cryn bleser i mi fedru hysbysu'r Aelodau i Fesur Arfaethedig y Gymraeg (Cymru) gael ei osod ar 4 Mawrth 2010. Mae dau ddegawd wedi mynd heibio ers cyflwyno deddfwriaeth yn unswydd i ganolbwyntio ar y Gymraeg, a dyma'r tro cyntaf i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad allu gwneud hynny. Ers 1993 mae sefyllfa'r iaith wedi gwella mewn sawl ffordd bwysig, ond mae'r her sy'n wynebu'r Gymraeg hefyd wedi cynyddu. Mae nifer y cymunedau lle mai'r Gymraeg yw iaith y mwyafrif wedi gostwng yn syfrdanol. A minnau'n un gafodd ei fagu mewn rhai o'r cymunedau hynny, mae'n werth cofio nad oedd yr un arwydd cyhoeddus, swyddogol yn Gymraeg nag yn ddwyieithog y pryd hynny, a fawr ddim o ffurflenni Cymraeg neu ddwyieithog i'w cael. Os ydym am ddiogelu dyfodol yr iaith, mae angen yr offer priodol arnom ar gyfer y gwaith. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn darparu rhai o'r pwerau sydd eu hangen arnom os am sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn parhau i ffynnu yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain.

Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig ynghylch y Gymraeg yn creu fframwaith deddfwriaethol newydd i hyrwyddo'r iaith ym mhob agwedd ar fywyd yng Nghymru. Bydd yn elwa ar y profiad a gaed dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf er mwyn diweddarau a chryfhau'r ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â defnyddio'r Gymraeg wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau allweddol ar gyfer pobl Cymru.

Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn gwneud darpariaethau mewn pedwar maes allweddol. Yn unol ag ymrwymadau 'Cymru'n Un',

**The Minister for Heritage (Alun Ffred Jones):** I am very pleased to be able to inform Members that the proposed Welsh Language (Wales) Measure was laid on 4 March 2010. Two decades have passed since legislation was introduced that focused solely on the Welsh language, and this is the first time that the Welsh Assembly Government has been able to do that. Since 1993, the position of the language has improved in a number of important respects, but the challenges facing the Welsh language have also increased. The number of communities where Welsh is the majority language has declined markedly. I was brought up in some of those communities, and it is worth remembering that there was not one official public sign in Welsh or Welsh and English at that time, and hardly any Welsh language or bilingual forms available. If we are to safeguard the future of the language, we need appropriate tools for the job. The proposed Measure provides us with some of the tools we need to ensure that the Welsh language can continue to prosper into the twenty-first century.

The proposed Welsh language Measure sets out a new legislative framework for the promotion of the language in all aspects of life in Wales. It draws on the experience gained over the past two decades in order to modernise and strengthen the legislation governing the use of Welsh in the delivery of key services for the people of Wales.

The proposed Measure will make provision in four key areas. In line with our 'One Wales' commitment, the proposed Measure

bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn cynnwys darpariaethau i gadarnhau statws swyddogol y Gymraeg. Y bwriad yw rhoi arwydd clir ynglŷn â'r statws y mae'r iaith yn ei fwynhau ac y bydd yn ei fwynhau yng Nghymru.

Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hefyd yn sefydlu swydd comisiynydd y Gymraeg. Bydd gan y comisiynydd swyddogaethau a phwerau eang i hybu a hwyluso defnyddio'r iaith ac i hybu cydraddoldeb rhwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg. Bydd y comisiynydd yn cael cymorth gan banel cynghori a chanddo rôl strategol, ond na fydd yn ymwneud â materion o ddydd i ddydd. Ar ôl penodi'r comisiynydd, bydd ef neu hi'n cymryd cyfrifoldeb dros y gwaith a wneir ar hyn o bryd gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hefyd yn rhoi'r hyblygrwydd i drosglwyddo rhai o swyddogaethau'r bwrdd i Weinidogion Cymru, pe baem yn ystyried mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud.

Yn drydydd, bydd darpariaeth yn y Mesur arfaethedig a fydd yn golygu, dros gyfnod o amser, bod cynlluniau iaith yn cael eu disodli gan safonau ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Ein bwriad yw y bydd y safonau yn symleiddio'r broses o osod dyletswyddau ar gyrrff, gan gyflwyno mwy o gysondeb o fewn ac ar draws sectorau. Byddant hefyd yn ychwanegu at y gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd, ac yn helpu i egluro i siaradwyr Cymraeg lefel y gwasanaeth y gallant ei ddisgwyl. Bydd y safonau, i bob perwyl, yn creu hawliau i siaradwyr Cymraeg yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Bydd gan y comisiynydd hefyd bwerau gorfodi mwy grymus na'r rhai sydd gan fwrdd yr iaith ar hyn o bryd. Gellir apelio yn erbyn penderfyniadau a wneir gan y comisiynydd yn gysylltiedig â gosod neu orfodi safonau gerbron tribiwnlys newydd ar gyfer y Gymraeg. Er bydd gan y comisiynydd bwerau cryfach, bydd y Mesur arfaethedig hefyd yn galluogi iddo ef neu iddi hi ddelio â chwynion drwy gydweithrediad a chytundeb ar bob cyfle posibl.

Yn olaf, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn rhoi'r pŵer i'r comisiynydd ymchwilio i gwynion gan siaradwyr Cymraeg sy'n credu bod rhywun wedi ymyrryd â'u rhyddid i

contains provisions intended to confirm the official status of the Welsh language. This is intended to provide a clear signal as to the status that the language enjoys and will enjoy in Wales.

The proposed Measure will establish the office of Welsh language commissioner. The commissioner will have wide ranging functions and powers to promote and facilitate the use of the language and to promote equality between the Welsh and English languages. The commissioner will be assisted by an advisory panel that will have a strategic role, but which will not be involved in day-to-day issues. Once the commissioner has been appointed, he or she will take on responsibility for the work currently undertaken by the Welsh Language Board. The proposed Measure will also provide flexibility to allow some of the board's functions to be transferred to Welsh Ministers, should we deem it appropriate for that to happen.

Thirdly, the proposed Measure will provide that, over time, Welsh language schemes will be replaced by Welsh language standards. Our intention is that standards should streamline the process of placing duties on organisations, while introducing greater consistency within and across sectors. They will also build on the level of Welsh language services provided at the moment and help clarify for Welsh speakers the level of services that they can expect to receive. Standards will, in effect, create rights for Welsh speakers with regards to the provision of services. The commissioner will also have more powerful enforcement powers than those of the language board at present. It will be possible to appeal to a new Welsh language tribunal against decisions made by the commissioner in respect of imposing or enforcing standards. While the commissioner will have stronger powers, the proposed Measure will give him or her the ability to secure compliance with the new Welsh language standards through engagement and agreement whenever possible.

Finally, the proposed Measure gives the commissioner the power to investigate complaints from Welsh speakers who believe that their freedom to use Welsh with one

ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg gyda'i gilydd. Mae hefyd yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r comisiynydd gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol i Weinidogion Cymru ar effeithiolrwydd y gyfraith o ran diogelu'r rhyddid hwnnw.

Mae'r 20 mlynedd diwethaf wedi dangos yn glir iawn manteision cael fframwaith deddfwriaethol sy'n sylfaen i gefnogaeth y Llywodraeth tuag at yr iaith. Maent hefyd wedi dangos pwysigrwydd cael eiriolwr cryf dros yr iaith sy'n annibynnol ar unrhyw Lywodraeth. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y comisiynydd yn gwneud hynny. Wrth nodi hynny, hoffwn dalu teyrnged i fwrdd yr iaith am y modd y mae wedi defnyddio'r pwerau hynny a oedd ar gael iddo yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, a dangos dyfeisgarwch wrth wneud hynny.

Gwn fod cryn ddiddordeb yn gyffredinol yn y Mesur arfaethedig, ac felly mae'n fwriad gennyf gynnal nifer o gyfarfodydd cyhoeddus drwy Gymru yn ystod y ddau neu dri mis nesaf i egluro wrth y cyhoedd ein hargymhellion, ac i sicrhau gwell dealltwriaeth o'r Mesur arfaethedig. Yr wyf yn awyddus i gyfarfod â chynifer o bobl ag y gallaf yn y cyfarfodydd hynny, ac i glywed eu sylwadau.

3.20 p.m.

Bydd polisiau'r Llywodraeth hon ar gyfer y Gymraeg yn ymestyn ymhellach o lawer na'r ddeddfwriaeth ei hun, ac mae'r gwaith o ddatblygu strategaeth newydd ar gyfer y Gymraeg yn mynd rhagddo, a bwriedir ei chyhoeddi ar gyfer ymgynghoriad yn ddiweddarach eleni. Mae'r darpariaethau a gynhwysir yn y Mesur arfaethedig yn gosod sylfeini hanfodol i'r polisiau ehangach hynny. Maent yn rhoi neges glir ynglŷn â'n hymrwymiad yn y maes hwn. Mae'r rhain yn gynigion pwyllog a synhwyrol wedi'u llunio i sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn parhau i ffynnu. Cymeradwyaf y Mesur arfaethedig ichi ac edrychaf ymlaen at weld cyfraniadau cadarnhaol yn cael eu gwneud drwy broses graffu'r Cynulliad.

**Paul Davies:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad hwn heddiw. Fel y gŵyr, bu i ni, fel yr wrthblaid swyddogol, gefnogi trosglwyddo pwerau dros yr iaith Gymraeg

another has been interrupted. It also requires the commissioner to report annually to the Welsh Ministers on the adequacy and effectiveness of the law in protecting that freedom.

The past 20 years have shown very clearly the advantages of having a legal framework that underpins the Government's support for the language. They have also demonstrated the importance of having a strong advocate for the language, independent of Government. I am confident that the commissioner will do that. In saying that, I wish to pay tribute to the language board for the way it has used the powers available to it over those years, and for being innovative in their use.

I know there is a great deal of general interest in the proposed Measure, and it is my intention, therefore, to hold a number of public meetings around Wales over the next two to three months to explain our proposals to the public, and to ensure a better understanding of the proposed Measure. I am keen to meet as many people as possible in those meetings, and to hear their views.

This Government's policies for the Welsh language will extend far wider than legislation alone, and work is in hand to develop a new Welsh language strategy, to be published for consultation later this year. The provisions set out in the proposed Measure provide crucial foundations that will underpin those wider policies. They represent a clear signal of our commitment in this area. These are measured and sensible proposals designed to ensure that the Welsh language continues to thrive. I commend this proposed Measure to you and I look forward to constructive contributions by means of the Assembly's scrutiny process.

**Paul Davies:** I thank the Minister for this statement today. As he knows, we, as the official opposition, supported the transfer of powers over the language to the Assembly,

i'r Cynulliad oherwydd ei bod yn gwneud synnwyr llwyr inni ddeddfu arni yn y sefydliad hwn. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y Mesur arfaethedig wedi ei gyhoeddi, er yn ddiweddarach nag yr oeddem i gyd yn ei ddisgwyl. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn synnu bod y cyhoeddiad wedi ei oedi, o ystyried bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn 136 o dudalennau.

Fel y gŵyr yr Aelodau, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yr wyf wedi bod yn ymgyrchu dros sefydlu statws swyddogol i'r Gymraeg a chomisiynydd iaith. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn symud i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Gan droi yn gyntaf at y comisiynydd, sylwaf y bydd y comisiynydd, y panel cynghori a'r tribiwnlys yn cael eu penodi gan y Prif Weinidog a Gweinidogion. Deallaf y bydd y tribiwnlys hwn yn gwneud penderfyniadau a dyfarniadau ar resymoldeb a bydd y comisiynydd hefyd yn adrodd ar achosion a fydd yn arwain at achosion llys. O dan erthygl 6 y Confensiwn Ewropeaidd ar Hawliau Dynol, rhaid i benderfyniadau ar hawliau a chyfrifoldebau gael eu gwneud gan gyrff annibynnol. Gan fod y comisiynydd yn cael ei apwyntio'n uniongyrchol gan y Prif Weinidog, a yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon y bydd y swydd hon yn wirioneddol annibynnol?

A all y Gweinidog hefyd gadarnhau y bydd amodau penodol yn gysylltiedig â swydd o'r fath? Mae perygl y bydd y penodiad ac, yn wir, benodiadau'r panel cynghori a'r tribiwnlys yn cael eu gweld fel rhai gwleidyddol ac yn rhy agos at wleidyddion. Nid wyf yn awgrymu am funud y bydd y Gweinidog hwn yn gwneud penodiadau gwleidyddol, ond nid yw hynny'n rhwystro Gweinidogion yn y dyfodol rhag gwneud hynny. Gellir gwneud cyhuddiadau bod gormod o bŵer gan wleidyddion yn y strwythurau newydd hyn. A all y Gweinidog esbonio pa fath o fesurau a fydd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith i osgoi rhoi gormod o bŵer i Weinidogion Cymru?

Sylwaf fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn datgan na fydd y ddeddfwriaeth yn effeithio ar siaradwyr Saesneg. A oes rheswm pam na fydd y comisiynydd newydd hwn yn gyfrifol am Saesneg yn ogystal â'r Gymraeg? Sut y bydd y comisiynydd newydd yn amddiffyn

since it is wholly sensible for this institution to legislate for the language. I welcome the fact that the proposed Measure has been published, albeit later than expected. However, I am not surprised at the delay, given that the proposed Measure is 136 pages long.

As Members know, I have been campaigning over the past few years for official status for the language and for a language commissioner. I am pleased that this proposed Measure is moving in the right direction. Turning first to the commissioner, I note that the commissioner, the advisory panel and the tribunal will be appointed by the First Minister and Ministers. I understand that the tribunal will make decisions and resolutions on what is reasonable and that the commissioner will also report on cases that lead to court cases. Under article 6 of the European Convention on Human Rights, decisions on rights and responsibilities must be made by independent organisations. Given that the commissioner is appointed directly by the First Minister, is the Minister satisfied that this office will be truly independent?

Can the Minister also confirm that specific conditions will be attached to this type of post? There is a danger that the appointment, and, indeed, appointments to the advisory panel and to the tribunal, will be seen as political appointments that are too close to politicians. I am not suggesting for a moment that this Minister will make political appointments, but that does not prevent future Ministers from doing so. Politicians can be accused of having too much power in these new structures. Can the Minister explain what kind of measures will be implemented to avoid giving Welsh Ministers too much power?

I note that the proposed Measure states that the legislation will not impact upon English speakers. Is there any reason why the new commissioner will not be responsible for the English language as well as the Welsh language? How will the new commissioner

hawliau siaradwyr Saesneg yng Nghymru? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol inni amddiffyn hawliau siaradwyr Cymraeg a Saesneg yng Nghymru.

defend the rights of English speakers in Wales? I am sure the Minister would agree that it is crucial that we defend the rights of both Welsh speakers and English speakers in Wales.

Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn cadarnhau y bydd safonau yn cael eu cyflwyno ac y bydd cynlluniau iaith yn cael eu gwaredu. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym faint o safonau a fydd yn bodoli a pha amodau a fydd yn cael eu cynnwys yn y safonau hyn?

The proposed Measure confirms that standards will be introduced and language schemes will be disposed of. Can the Minister tell us how many standards will exist and what conditions will be included in those standards?

Mae rhai yn poeni y bydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn diflannu o ganlyniad i'r Mesur arfaethedig. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y bwrdd wedi bod yn allweddol ac wedi chwarae rhan bwysig dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran hybu'r iaith Gymraeg. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y bydd y strwythur newydd yn gweithio? A fydd staff presennol y bwrdd iaith yn cael eu trosglwyddo'n gyfan gwbl i weithio dan y comisiynydd newydd ynteu a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu na fydd angen cymaint o staff neu, efallai, y bydd angen rhagor?

Some people are concerned that the Welsh Language Board will disappear as a result of the proposed Measure. I am sure the Minister will agree that the board has been key and that it has played an important part over the past years in promoting the Welsh language. Can the Minister tell us how the new structure will work? Will the board's current staff members all transfer to work under the new commissioner, or does the Minister believe that fewer, or perhaps more, staff will be needed?

Deallaf o'r datganiad y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cynnal cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus i adael i bobl leisio eu barn ar y Mesur arfaethedig. Mae rhai mudiadau'n poeni nad ymgynghorwyd â hwy ynglŷn â'r Mesur arfaethedig hyd yma. O gofio y bydd y Llywodraeth yn cynnal y cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus hyn, a fydd yn barod i addasu'r Mesur arfaethedig ar ôl gwrando ar farn unigolion, mudiadau a sefydliadau?

I understand from the statement that the Government will hold public meetings to allow people to air their views on the proposed Measure. Some organisations are concerned that they have not been consulted to date on the proposed Measure. Given that the Government will hold these public meetings, will it be prepared to amend the proposed Measure after listening to the views of individuals, organisations and institutions?

Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn rhoi dyletswyddau ar gwmnïau fel cwmnïau carthffosiaeth, fel yr wyf yn deall. Mae cwmnïau carthffosiaeth bach yn bodoli, gydag unigolion, hyd yn oed, yn mynd o amgylch yn clirio carthffosydd. A all y Gweinidog gadarnhau na fydd cwmnïau bach o'r fath yn dod o dan yr amodau hyn? Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod gorfodi cwmnïau neu fusnesau bach i ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn drychinebus o ran yr ymgyrch i ehangu'r iaith ac i greu Cymru gwbl ddwyieithog.

The proposed Measure places a duty on companies such as sewerage companies, as I understand it. There are very small companies of that sort in operation, with individuals even offering a sewerage clearing service. Can the Minister confirm that small companies of that nature will not be included in proposed Measure? I am sure the Minister would agree that compelling small companies or businesses to provide services through the medium of Welsh would be disastrous in terms of the campaign to expand the use of the language and to create a truly bilingual Wales.

Yr wyf wedi clywed y Gweinidog yn dweud

I have heard the Minister say in the past that



yn y gorffennol na fydd deddfwriaeth ynddi'i hun yn hybu'r Gymraeg yn ein cymunedau. A all y Gweinidog, felly, ddweud wrthym beth fydd effaith ymarferol rhoi statws i'r Gymraeg o ran sicrhau bod y Gymraeg yn iaith fyw yn ein cymunedau? Deallaf y bydd rhaid i Bwyllgor Deddfwriaeth Rhif 2 adrodd yn ôl cyn 2 Gorffennaf. O ystyried pwysigrwydd y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, a yw'r Gweinidog yn credu bod hyn yn ddigon o amser i graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig? Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad ac edrychaf ymlaen at graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig yn ystod y misoedd nesaf.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch, Paul, am y rhestr faith honno o gwestiynau. O ran y comisiynydd iaith a'i annibyniaeth, yr ydym yn barod i wrando ar unrhyw awgrymiadau synhwyrol, os bydd hynny'n ffordd o wneud y penodiad yn fwy derbyniol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r broses wedi'i hamlinellu eisoes yn y Mesur arfaethedig, ac mae'n dilyn yr un patrwm ag a ddilynwyd wrth benodi'r holl gomisiynwyr eraill a benodwyd yng Nghymru. Ni chlywais neb yn dweud bod y rheini'n benodiadau gwleidyddol ac nad ydynt yn annibynnol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl inni edrych ar y prosesau hynny.

Cyfeiriasoch at hawliau siaradwyr yr iaith Saesneg. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn dweud yn glir nad yw'n effeithio ar statws y Saesneg yng Nghymru. Credaf fod hynny'n ateb eich pwyt yn gyflawn.

Cyfeiriasoch at fwrdd yr iaith, fel y gwneuthum innau yn fy araith, gan ganmol y gwaith a'r cynnydd a wnaed ganddo. O ran ei staff, nid Mesur arfaethedig er mwyn arbed arian yw hwn, felly mae disgwyl y bydd llawer iawn o staff y bwrdd, os nad y mwyafrif ohonynt, yn trosglwyddo i swyddfa'r comisiynydd iaith. Mae manylion hynny i'w trafod ac mae pwyllgor wedi'i sefydlu ar y cyd er mwyn gofalu bod y broses honno mor drefnus â phosibl, gan achosi cyn lleied o drafferthion a phoendod â phosibl i'r staff presennol.

O ran y cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus, eto, pe byddech wedi gwrando ar yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy sylwadau, cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus fydd y rhain i esbonio'r Mesur

this legislation in itself will not promote the language in our communities. Can the Minister tell us, therefore, what practical impact he believes giving the Welsh language official status will have in ensuring that the language is alive in our communities? I understand that Legislation Committee No. 2 will have to report back before 2 July. Given the importance of this proposed Measure, does the Minister believe this will give adequate time for scrutiny of the proposed Measure? I thank the Minister for his statement and I look forward to scrutinising the proposed Measure over the coming months.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Paul, for that long list of questions. On the language commissioner and his or her independence, we are prepared to listen to any sensible suggestions, if that makes the appointment more acceptable. However, the process has already been outlined in the proposed Measure, and it follows the same pattern as that followed when appointing all of the other commissioners in Wales. I have never heard anyone say that those were political appointments and that they were not independent. However, it is possible for us to look at those processes.

You referred to the rights of English speakers. The proposed Measure clearly states that it does not affect the status of the English language in Wales. I believe that that answers your point fully.

You referred to the Welsh Language Board, as I did in my speech, praising its work and the progress it has made. In terms of its staff, this is not a money-saving proposed Measure, therefore it is expected that many, if not the majority, of the board's staff will transfer to the language commissioner's office. Those details are yet to be discussed, and a committee has been established to ensure that that process is as orderly as possible and causes minimum disruption and difficulty to the present staff.

With regard to the public meetings, again, had you listened to what I said in my comments, these will be public meetings to explain the proposed Measure to people, not

arfaethedig i bobl, nid cyfle i ymgynghori. Bydd unrhyw welliannau i'r Mesur arfaethedig yn dod o'r prosesau a ddilynir o fewn y Cynulliad; dyna sy'n briodol a dyna fydd yn digwydd. Nid oes angen codi bwganod ynghylch cwmnïau carthffosiaeth bach—ni fyddant yn dod o fewn y rheoliadau oherwydd nid dyna yw bwriad y Mesur arfaethedig.

Yr oeddech yn holi ynghylch sut y bydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn hyrwyddo a hybu'r Gymraeg. Y gobaith yw y bydd mwy o wasanaethau ar gael ac y bydd pobl yn fwy ymwybodol o'r safonau hynny ac o ba wasanaethau a fydd ar gael. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n arwain at fwy o ddefnydd o'r iaith ond brwydr i'w hennill eto yw hynny o ran y defnydd o wasanaethau. Nid y Mesur arfaethedig fydd yn sicrhau mwy o ddefnydd, ond bydd yn sicrhau bod pawb yn fwy eglur ynglŷn â safon a natur y gwasanaethau a fydd ar gael iddynt yn ddwyieithog.

Credaf fy mod wedi ateb y rhan fwyaf o'ch cwestiynau. Ynghylch yr amser i drin a thrafod y Mesur arfaethedig, yr ydym yn barod i fod yn hyblyg ond, ar y llaw arall, oherwydd yr oedi hyd yma, mater i ni yn y Cynulliad bellach yw sicrhau bod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cael ei drin a'i drafod yn drylwyr a'n bod yn bwrw ymlaen i wneud hynny er mwyn dod â'r Mesur arfaethedig i fwcl cyn gynted â phosibl.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn gam hanesyddol ymlaen ac, am y tro cyntaf, mae'n creu cyfundrefn sy'n rhoi hawliau i bobl Cymru dderbyn gwasanaethau Cymraeg, mae'n cadarnhau statws swyddogol y Gymraeg ac yn creu comisiynydd cryf i amddiffyn yr iaith. Credaf fod hyn yn ddechrau proses graffu hir, a chroesawaf y ffaith bod ein Gweinidogion wedi gwneud ymrwymiad i wrando'n ofalus ar y syniadau a gyflwynir gan eraill yn ystod y broses hon, wrth inni gyrraedd ein hamcanion.

3.30 p.m.

Os oes materion sydd angen eu gwella neu eu cryfhau yn y Mesur arfaethedig, a wnaiff y Gweinidog roi sicrwydd y byddai'n barod i wrando ar syniadau ac ar newidiadau a

an opportunity for consultation. Any amendments to the proposed Measure will stem from the processes followed in the Assembly; that is what is appropriate and that is what will happen. There is no need for scaremongering regarding small sewerage companies—they will not fall within the regulations as that is not the intention of the proposed Measure.

You asked how the proposed Measure will promote and facilitate the language. It is hoped that more services will be available and that people will be more aware of those standards and which services are available. It is hoped that this will lead to wider use of the language, but that battle is yet to be won in terms of the use of services. This proposed Measure will not guarantee wider use of the language, but it will ensure that everyone will be clearer about the standard and nature of the services that will be available to them bilingually.

I believe I have answered most of your questions. Regarding the time available to discuss the proposed Measure, we are prepared to be flexible, but on the other hand, because of the delay so far, it is now a matter for us in the Assembly to ensure that the proposed Measure is discussed in detail and that we proceed with that in order to bring about this proposed Measure as soon as possible.

**Bethan Jenkins:** This proposed Measure is a historic step forward, and for the first time it creates a system that gives the people of Wales the right to receive services through the medium of Welsh, confirms the official status of the language and creates a strong commissioner to safeguard the language. I believe this is the start of a long scrutiny process, and I welcome the fact that Ministers have made a commitment to listen carefully to ideas put forward by others during this process, as we realise our objectives.

If there are issues within the proposed Measure that need to be improved or made more robust, will the Minister assure us that he will listen to ideas and to proposed

awgrymir? Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn creu, am y tro cyntaf, eiriolwr cryf dros y Gymraeg; pencampwr a fydd yn gallu ymchwilio, ac adrodd ar, unrhyw fater sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith. Mae'n creu trefn newydd sy'n gosod dyletswydd ar gyrff i ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, gan gynnwys cwnïau ffôn, cwmnïau teithio, awdurdodau lleol, cwmnïau ynni, ac yn y blaen. Bydd hyn oll yn sicrhau bod y Gymraeg i'w gweld ac yn gallu cael ei defnyddio yn ein bywydau pob dydd.

Byddwn, wrth gwrs, wedi bod yn falch o weld rhai o'r cwmnïau mawr rhyngwladol eraill yn cael eu cynnwys, ond nid oedd y Gorchymyn terfynol yn caniatáu hynny. Serch hynny, yr ydym heddiw gam yn nes at weld gwefannau Cymraeg, biliau Cymraeg, a gwasanaethau i gwsmeriaid drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cael eu darparu gan ystod eang o gyrff am y tro cyntaf. Wedi dweud hynny, hoffwn wybod a fydd sgôp i gynnwys cwmnïau rhyngwladol mewn Mesurau yn y dyfodol. Nid wyf yn dadlau na ddylem ni graffu ar y broses yma yn y Cynulliad, ond mae natur democratiaeth a'r strwythur deddfwriaethol yng Nghymru yn golygu y byddwn ni nawr yn esgor ar ymgynhoriad trylwyr gyda phobl Cymru. Ni allwn ni addo mwy neu lai na hynny, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno. Yr ydym yn barod i wrando ac yn barod i sicrhau dyfodol cryf i'r iaith.

Mae'n bwysig nodi ar y cychwyn, wrth ymateb i'r rheini sy'n dweud nad yw'r Mesur arfaethedig yn mynd yn ddigon pell, y bydd Plaid Cymru, yn sgîl y Mesur arfaethedig hwn, wedi llwyddo i sicrhau datblygiad mwyaf blaengar a phellgyrhaeddol yr iaith Gymraeg ers sefydlu'r corff hwn. Gadewch inni atgoffa ein hunain am yr hyn a addawyd gan bleidiau eraill. Yng Ngorchymyn arfaethedig y Toriaid yn 2008, yr oedd sôn am gomisiynydd â statws, ond nid oedd sôn o gwbl am gynyddu darpariaeth gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Bwriad y Llywodraeth flaenorol oedd creu swydd dyfarnydd yn unig.

Crëwyd Plaid Cymru fel grŵp pwyso ieithyddol, ac yr ydym yn awr yn blaid flaengar sy'n rhan o Lywodraeth sy'n creu deddfwriaeth. Heb yr ymgyrchu a'r lobio

amendments? The proposed Measure makes provision, for the first time, for a strong advocate for the Welsh language, a champion who will be able to inquire into and report on any matters relating to the Welsh language. It creates a new system that places a duty on service providers to offer services through the medium of Welsh, including telephone companies, travel companies, local authorities, energy companies, and so on. This will ensure that the Welsh language is heard and can be used in our daily lives.

Of course, we would have been happy to see some of the large multinational companies included, but the final Order did not allow for that. However, today we are a step closer to seeing Welsh websites, Welsh bills and customer services available through the medium of Welsh provided by a wide range of bodies for the first time. Having said that, I should like to know whether there would be scope in future Measures to include multinational companies. I am not arguing that we should not scrutinise the process here in the Assembly, but the nature of democracy and the legislative framework in Wales mean that we will now begin a long, thorough consultation with the people of Wales. We cannot promise more or less than that, as I am sure the Minister would agree. We are prepared to listen and prepared to ensure a robust future for the language.

It is important to note at the outset, in response to those who say that the proposed Measure does not go far enough, that Plaid Cymru, as a result of the proposed Measure, will have ensured the most innovative and far-reaching development for the Welsh language since the establishment of this Assembly. Let us remind ourselves of what other parties were pledging. In the proposed Order in 2008 by the Conservatives, they mentioned a commissioner with status, but there was no mention of an increase in the provision of Welsh-language services. The sole intention of the previous Government was to create the role of *dyfarnydd*.

Plaid Cymru was created as a Welsh language pressure group, and now we are an innovative political party and part of Government, making legislation. Without

cynnar, a heb yr ymgyrchu a lobiö cyfredol a'r bobl yn y blaid, ni fyddai hwn wedi dod yn realiti. Mae'n rhaid ategu bod Plaid Cymru yn rhannu uchelgais a chymhelliad ymgyrchwyr iaith o ran creu a chynllunio deddfwriaeth ar yr iaith. Felly, wrth edrych at y dyfodol, edrychaf ymlaen at y drafodaeth a fydd yn digwydd dros y misoedd nesaf am sut i hyrwyddo'r iaith yn y dyfodol a phwy ddylai gael y cyfrifoldeb pwysig hwnnw

Yr wyf yn hynod falch fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cynnwys cymal sy'n dweud y bydd yn rhaid i Weinidogion Cymru roi sylw priodol i argymhellion y comisiynydd iaith. Rhaid croesawu'r ffaith y bydd er neu hi yn gallu ymchwilio i unrhyw fater yn ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r consym am y ffaith y caiff y comisiynydd ei benodi gan y Prif Weinidog, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes. Felly, hoffwn ofyn i'r Gweinidog a fyddai'n fodlon ystyried y mater hwn a sut y gellir ymateb i'r gofidion. A fyddai modd ystyried rôl i'r Cynulliad wrth gadarnhau'r apwyntiad? Hoffwn ofyn hefyd a fyddai modd i'r Gweinidog ystyried cynnig a wnaed gan fudiadau iaith i wneud yr hawl i siarad Cymraeg yn gefn i'r drefn newydd. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r darpariaeth a fyddai'n caniatáu i'r comisiynydd ymchwilio i unrhyw achos o ymyrraeth yn rhyddid yr unigolyn i siarad Cymraeg. Serch hynny, yr wyf hefyd yn falch fod y Mesur arfaethedig yn cydnabod yr angen i adolygu'r sefyllfa'n rheolaidd er mwyn addasu'r ddeddfwriaeth yn y dyfodol pe bai angen.

Wrth edrych ar y pleidiau eraill eto, a ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, mai siomedig yw darllen ar wefan *Golwg* fod Paul Davies wedi dweud dros y penwythnos y byddai'r Mesur arfaethedig yn arwain at apartheid ieithyddol. Mae hyn yn tanseilio'r consensws eang sydd wedi datblygu yng Nghymru ynghylch datblygiad yr iaith, ac mae'r iaith a ddefnyddiodd yntau yn ymfflamychol ac yn gwbl ddiangen. Efallai nad yw Paul Davies yn deall cynnwys y Mesur arfaethedig, neu efallai ei fod yn ceisio bod yn negatif ac yn ceisio creu rhaniadau am resymau cwbl wleidyddol a sinigaidd. Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn ynglŷn â hynny.

that early campaigning and lobbying, without our continuing campaigning and lobbying and the people in the party, this would not have become a reality. We must say that Plaid Cymru shares the ambition and motivation of language campaigners in terms of creating and planning Welsh language legislation. Therefore, looking to the future, I look forward to the discussion which will happen over the coming months on how to promote the language in the future and who should bear that important responsibility.

I am very pleased that the proposed Measure includes a clause for Welsh Ministers to give appropriate attention to the Welsh language commissioner's recommendations. We must welcome the fact that he or she will be able to inquire into any issues relating to the Welsh language. I am aware of the concern about the fact that the commissioner will be appointed by the First Minister, as has already been mentioned. Therefore, I wish to ask the Minister whether he would be willing to consider this issue and how we can respond to those concerns. Could we consider giving the Assembly a role in confirming the appointment? I also wish to ask whether the Minister could consider a proposal by Welsh language organisations to make the right to speak Welsh a core part of this. I welcome the provision to allow the commissioner to look into anything that restricts people's ability to use the Welsh language. However, I am pleased that the proposed Measure acknowledges the need to review this position regularly so that the legislation can be adapted in future according to need.

Looking at the other parties again, do you agree with me, Minister, that it is very disappointing to read on the *Golwg* website that Paul Davies, over the weekend, said that this proposed Measure would lead to linguistic apartheid. This undermines the broad consensus which has developed in Wales on the development of the language. The language he used is inflammatory and entirely unnecessary. Perhaps Paul Davies does not understand the content of the proposed Measure, or perhaps he is trying to be negative and to create divisions for entirely political and cynical reasons. I am very disappointed at that.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Bethan, yr ydym yn disgwyl cwestiynau am y datganiad; araith yw hon. Hoffwn i gael cwestiwn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yr oedd hwnnw'n gwestiwn i'r Gweinidog o ran a ydyw'n cytuno bod yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn peri siom.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes gan y Gweinidog gyfrifoldeb am Paul Davies [*Chwerthin.*] Felly, cyfle i ofyn cwestiynau am y Mesur arfaethedig sydd ger ein bron yw hwn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Gan ein bod ni'n ceisio creu consensws, credaf ei bod hi'n bwysig inni glywed barn y Gweinidog.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf i'n ceisio gofalu ein bod ni'n cael datganiad cywir a phriodol. Nid wyf i'n ceisio creu dim byd. Gawn ni gwestiynau plis? Gallwn symud ymlaen wedyn.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn fy nghwestiynau i i gyd. Diolch yn fawr am wrando.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch, Bethan, am eich cefnogaeth gadarnhaol, ac am y cwestiynau. Yr oeddech yn gofyn yn benodol ynglŷn â'r broses o benodi'r comisiynydd. Yr wyf yn ategu eto ein bod yn barod i wrando ar sylwadau neu syniadau ynglŷn â hynny, a byddem y dymuno cael consensws a chydweid. Os oes angen addasu'r Mesur arfaethedig i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw, byddwn yn barod i wrando ar syniadau. Yr oeddech yn iawn i bwysleisio y bydd y comisiynydd yn eiriolwr ar ran y Gymraeg. Mae geiriau'r Mesur arfaethedig yn ategu hynny drosodd a throsodd o ran gwaith a dyletswyddau'r comisiynydd: hybu, hwyluso, annog arferion gorau, a rhoi cyngor a chymorth, gan gynnwys cymorth ariannol, i unrhyw berson. Bydd cylch gwaith a dyletswyddau'r comisiynydd yn eang iawn, fel y dylent fod. Yr oeddech yn sôn am ychwanegu categorïau newydd, felly rhaid i ni bwysleisio bod y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yn adlewyrchu'r cytundeb a wnaed drwy'r Gorchymyn ynglŷn â hyd a lled y pwerau sydd wedi dod i ni. Ni fydd addasu ar hynny; mater arall fydd hynny

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Bethan, these are to be questions on the statement; this is becoming a speech. Perhaps we could have a question.

**Bethan Jenkins:** That was a question to the Minister as to whether he agrees that this was very disappointing.

**The Presiding Officer:** The Minister has no responsibility for Paul Davies. [*Laughter.*] Therefore, this is an opportunity to ask questions about the proposed Measure before us today.

**Bethan Jenkins:** Since we are trying to create a consensus, I believe it is important for us to hear the Minister's views.

**The Presiding Officer:** I am trying to ensure that we get an appropriate statement. I am not trying to create anything. Could we have some questions, please? Then we can move on.

**Bethan Jenkins:** I have asked all of my questions. Thank you for listening.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you, Bethan, for your positive support, and for the questions. You asked specifically about the process of appointing the commissioner. I reiterate the point that we are prepared to listen to comments or suggestions in that regard, and we would wish to seek consensus and agreement. If we need to amend the proposed Measure in that direction, we will be prepared to listen to suggestions. You were right to emphasise that the commissioner will be an advocate for the Welsh language. The wording of the proposed Measure supports that position time and again in terms of the commissioner's work and duties: to promote, facilitate, encourage best practice, and provide advice and support, including financial support, to any person. The commissioner's remit and duties will be very broad, as they should be. You mentioned adding new categories, therefore, we must emphasise that the proposed Measure reflects the agreement reached through the LCO on the length and breadth of the powers which we have received. That will not be amended;

i Lywodraethau'r dyfodol, os byddant yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

O ran hyrwyddo'r iaith, nid yw'r Mesur arfaethedig yn dweud yn union lle y bydd y cyfrifoldebau hynny yn gorwedd. Mae hwnnw'n fater ar gyfer trafodaeth, a chredaf ei bod yn iawn fod pawb yn cael dweud ei ddweud ynglŷn â hynny. Yr unig beth y mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn ei ddweud yw y gallai'r cyfrifoldebau orwedd gyda'r comisiynydd a'i staff, neu yn rhywle arall.

O safbwynt y consensws a'r cytundeb, yr wyf yn weddol ffyddiog bod cytundeb ar draws y pleidiau o safbwynt symud ymlaen ac adeiladu ar Ddeddf 1993. Nid oeddwn yn hoff o'r dyfyniad gan Mr Davies ynglŷn ag apartheid ieithyddol, gan nad yw hynny yn helpu. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedodd y Llywydd, nid oes gennyf gyfrifoldeb dros Mr Davies.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ceisïaf fy ngorau i ofyn cwestiynau yn unig. Mae heddiw yn ddiwrnod hanesyddol. Yr oeddem yn lwcus i gael Jenny Randerson fel Gweinidog mewn Llywodraeth flaenorol, oherwydd gweithiodd yn galed ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ym maes pwysig yr iaith. Credaf fod y Gweinidog presennol wedi cael trafferth yn symud y mater pwysig hwn drwy gwstard San Steffan. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith ei fod wedi dychwelyd erbyn hyn, er fy mod yn gresynu ei fod wedi cymryd cyhyd. A fu'r cyfnod hwn yn *learning curve*? A ydych yn credu y cawn ni lai o drafferth wrth i ni symud y materion hyn drwy San Steffan?

Yn ddiweddar, bûm mewn seminar diddorol dan arweiniad Gwion Lewis. Yr oedd yn traddodi'n fanwl ar faterion sydd y tu hwnt i'm dealltwriaeth i efallai, ond, o'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, mae pryderon. Sut ydych yn ymateb i gyhuddiad Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg na wnaethoch eich gwaith yn ddigon da? Mae'r gymdeithas yn cwyno eich bod chi wedi camarwain y cyhoedd. Dyna'r cwestiwn rhesymol cyntaf i chi.

Mae'r cwestiwn nesaf yn ymwneud â'r pryder ynghylch colli Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Mae gan fwrdd yr iaith enw da ar draws y byd am fod yn gadarn ac am wneud

that will be another matter for future Governments, should they choose to do so.

In terms of promoting the language, the proposed Measure does not say exactly where those responsibilities will lie. That is a matter for discussion, and I believe it is right that everyone has an opportunity to have their say. All this proposed Measure says is that the responsibility could lie with the commissioner and his or her staff, or elsewhere.

Regarding the consensus and agreement, I am fairly confident that there is agreement across the parties in terms of moving forward and building on the 1993 Act. I did not like Mr Davies' quote about linguistic apartheid, because that does not help. However, as the Presiding Officer said, I have no responsibility for Mr Davies.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I shall do my best to ask questions only. Today is a historic day. We were fortunate to have Jenny Randerson as Minister in a previous Government, since she worked hard on behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats in the important sphere of the Welsh language. I believe the present Minister has encountered difficulties in trying to progress this important matter through the political custard at Westminster. I welcome the fact that it has now come back to us, although I regret that it has taken so long. Has this period been a learning curve? Do you believe we will face fewer difficulties as we progress these matters through Westminster?

I recently attended an interesting seminar held by Gwion Lewis. He spoke in great detail on issues that are perhaps beyond my comprehension, but from what I understood there are concerns. How do you respond to the accusation made by the Welsh Language Society that you have not done your work effectively enough? The society has complained that you have misled the public. That is my first rational question to you.

My next question relates to the concern regarding the loss of the Welsh Language Board. The board has worked to the highest standards and acted robustly, and as a result it

gwaith o safon. Sut ydych yn gobeithio y bydd y bwrdd yn datblygu? A fydd yn cael ei sugno i mewn i'r Llywodraeth, fel y digwyddodd i'r WDA gynt? Os na fydd, sut bartneriaeth fydd gyda'r comisiynydd newydd, rôl a fydd yn annibynnol? Yr ydych yn trafod rôl y comisiynydd fel eiriolwr. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y bydd hynny'n annibynnol o'ch adran chi.

is held in high regard worldwide. How do you hope to see the board developing? Will it be subsumed into the Government, as happened the WDA previously? If not, what kind of partnership will there be with the new commissioner, whose role is to be independent? You refered to the commissioner's role as an advocate. I am not sure how that will be independent of your department.

3.40 p.m.

Pam nad ydych wedi seilio'r materion pwysig hyn ar hawliau dynol? Onid ydych yn cydfynd â ni'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac eraill mai hawliau dynol yw'r pethau pwysicaf y dylem eu trafod ynghylch yr iaith, yn hytrach na gosod gofynion ar gyrff? Hwyrach y gallech ddweud wrthym sut y mae natur a maint y cyrff hyn wedi newid. Hyd y deallaf, dim ond cyrff sy'n cael grant o bron £0.5 miliwn gan y Llywodraeth fydd yn cael y gofynion hyn wedi'u gosod arnynt. Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen, fel y mae gweddill y blaid, at wella'r sefyllfa.

Why have you not based these important issues on human rights? Do you not concur with us Liberal Democrats and others that the most important issues we should be discussing regarding the language are human rights, rather than making requirements of organisations? Perhaps you could tell us how the nature and size of these organisations have changed. As I understand it, the requirements are made only of those bodies that receive a grant of almost £0.5 million from the Government. I look forward, as does the rest of the party, to seeing an improvement in the situation.

Beth fydd yn digwydd i'r llysoedd yn sgil y Mesur arfaethedig? Hyd y deallaf, ni fydd llysoedd yn datblygu'n ddwyieithog. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Llywydd yn rhygnu arnaf ynghylch y mater hwn mewn eiliad. Gyda hynny, croesawn y ffaith ein bod yn symud ymlaen. Er bod y cynnydd yn araf, hwyrach ei fod yn well na dim. Mae gennym bryderon, ond gobeithiwn y gallwn drafod y materion pwysig hyn yn ystod y drafodaeth am y Mesur arfaethedig.

What will happen to the courts as a result of this proposed Measure? As I understand it, the courts will not be developing bilingually. I am sure the Presiding Officer will berate me for this in a moment. With that, we welcome the fact that we are making progress. Although progress is slow, perhaps it is better than nothing. We have concerns, but we hope to be able to discuss these important matters during the discussion on the proposed Measure.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Fel mater o drefn, nid yw'r cyfrifoldeb am y llysoedd eto wedi'i ddatganoli.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. On a point of order, the responsibility for the courts has not yet been devolved.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gan nad yw'r llysoedd wedi'u datganoli, nid ydynt yn berthnasol i'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Nid Mesur arfaethedig sy'n well na dim byd mohono; mae wedi'i deilwra'n arbennig i ddatblygu Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993, i ehangu ar ei darpariaethau, ac i adeiladu ar brofiadau Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw o Gymreigio gwasanaethau mewn llawer cyfeiriad ym mywyd cyhoeddus Cymru. Nid oes angen ymddiheuro am y

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Given that the courts are not devolved, they are not relevant to this proposed Measure. This proposed Measure is not better than nothing; it has been tailored specifically to develop the Welsh Language Act 1993, to expand its provisions, and to build on the experiences of the Welsh Language Board during that period of pushing for bilingual services in many aspects of public life in Wales. There is no need to apologise for this proposed Measure.

Mesur arfaethedig hwn.

Yr ydych yn anghywir wrth gyfeirio at gyrff sy'n derbyn dros £0.5 miliwn; £400,000 yw'r ffigur sydd yn y Mesur arfaethedig, ac mae'n cyfeirio at un yn unig o'r categorïau. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r gyrff sy'n cael eu henwi yn cyflwyno gwasanaethau i'r cyhoedd, a dyna'r maen prawf gwaelodol.

You are wrong to refer to organisations that receive more than £0.5 million; the figure in the proposed Measure is £400,000, and that refers to only one of the categories. The majority of the bodies named provide a service to the public, and that is the basic criterion.

Ni allaf wneud unrhyw sylw am brosesau San Steffan. O ran y ddadl am hawliau dynol, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn wedi cael ei lunio fel ei fod yn cael effaith uniongyrchol ar gyrff sy'n cyflwyno gwasanaeth i'r cyhoedd. Mae angen eglurder ar hynny, yn hytrach na gadael i'r llysoedd benderfynu beth sy'n rhesymol a synhwyrol ei gyflwyno.

I cannot comment on the procedures at Westminster. On the argument about human rights, this proposed Measure has been drafted in such a way as to have direct effect on organisations that offer a service to the public. We need to be clear about that, rather than leave it to the courts to decide what is reasonable and sensible to introduce.

Wrth i'r comisiynydd fynd fesul categori, ac edrych ar draws ystod o wasanaethau, bydd yn dweud pa safonau a ddisgwylir gan y gyrff. Os nad ydynt yn cyflwyno'r gwasanaethau hynny'n briodol, yn y Gymraeg neu'n ddwyieithog, mae ganddo bwerau, sy'n elfen newydd, i sicrhau eu bod yn newid eu ffyrdd. Mae'r elfen hon o orfodaeth yn gam pwysig ymlaen, ac yn rhoi dannedd i'r ci gwarchod nad ydynt gan fwrdd yr iaith ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, fel ym mhrofiad gwledydd eraill, gobeithiaf mai drwy drafod y byddwn yn dod â'r rhan fwyaf o'r anghydfodau a fydd yn codi i ben. Er hyn, mae gan y comisiynydd rym go iawn, ac yr wyf yn mawr hyderu y bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i wasanaethau Cymraeg a dwyieithog yng Nghymru.

As the commissioner moves from category to category, taking an overview of the range of services, he or she will state the standards expected of the organisations. If they do not provide those services appropriately, in Welsh or bilingually, he has the power, which is a new element, to ensure that they change their ways. This element of enforcement is an important step forward and gives the watchdog some teeth, which the language board does not have currently. However, as in the experience of other countries, I hope we can resolve most disputes that arise by discussion. However, the commissioner has real power, and I hope very much that he or she will make a difference to Welsh-language and bilingual services in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Gweinidog yn fawr iawn am lwyddo i ddod â'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ger ein bron y prynhawn hwn. Nid gwaith bach o gwbl fu hynny. Bu'n gyfnod hir iawn, ac mae'r Gweinidog wedi gweithio'n ddiflino er mwyn sicrhau hynny. Dros gyfnod hir, mae'n anodd cadw rheolaeth dynn ar y broses, ac mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn hir iawn—136 o dudalennau. Gofynnaf dri chwestiwn penodol i'r Gweinidog, ac yr wyf yn croesawu ei agwedd iach at y drafodaeth a fydd yn digwydd yn sgîl ei ddatganiad: mae'n croesawu unrhyw gyfraniadau a fyddai'n cryfhau'r Mesur arfaethedig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I congratulate the Minister very much on succeeding to bring this proposed Measure before us this afternoon. That was no mean feat. It has been a very long process, and the Minister has worked tirelessly to ensure that. Over a long period, it is difficult to keep a tight rein on the process, and this proposed Measure is a very lengthy one, at 136 pages long. I will ask the Minister three specific questions, and I very much welcome the healthy attitude that he has taken towards the discussion which will take place following his statement: he welcomes any contributions that would strengthen the proposed Measure.

Weinidog, yr ydych wedi sôn am gadarnhau

Minister, you have talked about confirming



statws y Gymraeg. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod rhai cwestiynau wedi codi ynghylch hynny. A oes modd cael cyfeiriad penodol clir yn y Mesur arfaethedig am statws y Gymraeg yng Nghymru?

Mae'r cwestiwn o hawliau wedi codi hefyd. Derbyniaf yn llwyr y ddadl yr ydych wedi'i chyflwyno ger ein bron, sef mai bwriad y Mesur arfaethedig hwn yw gosod cyfrifoldeb ar gyrff i ddarparu gwasanaethau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Er hynny, defnyddiwyd y gair 'eiriolwr' gennych yng nghyd-destun y comisiynydd, ac mae'r gair hwnnw yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Cyfrifoldeb eiriolwr yw diogelu hawliau unigolion. A oes unrhyw ffordd o ddiogelu'r elfen o hawliau siaradwyr Cymraeg yn swydd ddisgrifiad y comisiynydd?

Hoffwn hefyd ategu'r cwestiynau sydd wedi codi am annibyniaeth swydd y comisiynydd. Nid wyf yn poeni am y broses benodi gymaint ag annibyniaeth y broses adrodd yn ôl. Mae'n bosibl y gall sefyllfa godi pan fydd yn rhaid i'r comisiynydd weithredu ar ran unigolyn neu gorff sydd o'r farn nad yw Llywodraeth Cymru hyd yn oed wedi darparu gwasanaeth cymwys yn y Gymraeg. Weinidog, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith eich bod yn mynd allan i drafod y system newydd o safonau yr ydych yn gosod yn eu lle. Nid wyf yn credu bod yr un ohonom yn gwbl glir am hynny ar hyn y bryd, a mawr obeithiaf y bydd y drafodaeth hon yn ein galluogi i weld hynny'n gliriach. Deallaf yn llwyr yr hyn a ddywedasoich am bwysigrwydd y safonau hyn.

Mae fy nghwestiwn olaf yn ymwneud â gwahanu'r broses o hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg, sef rôl a gyflawnwyd yn draddodiadol ac yn rhagorol iawn gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ers ei sefydlu yn gorff statudol â chanddo gyfrifoldebau statudol, a'r broses o reoleiddio a fydd yn nwylo'r comisiynydd. Yr wyf o'r farn—a gwn nad ydych eto wedi penderfynu'n derfynol ar y mater hwn—y dylid ystyried gwahanu'r cyfrifoldebau hynny, a sicrhau bod y rôl hyrwyddo yn rhan o gyfrifoldeb ehangach Llywodraeth Cymru i gyflawni'r hyn y mae wedi addo ei wneud, sef creu Cymru sy'n wirioneddol ddwyieithog. Gyda hynny o gwestiynau, croesawaf y Mesur arfaethedig

the status of the Welsh language. You will be aware that some questions have arisen about that. Is it possible to have a clear and specific reference in the proposed Measure to the status of the language in Wales?

The question of rights has also arisen. I accept entirely the argument that you make, which is that the intention of this proposed Measure is to place a responsibility on bodies to provide services through the medium of Welsh. However, you used the word 'advocate' in reference to the commissioner, and that word is in the proposed Measure. An advocate's responsibility is to protect the rights of individuals. Is there any way of protecting the element of Welsh-speakers rights in the commissioner's job description?

I also support the questions raised about the independence of the commissioner's role. I am not concerned about the appointment process so much as the independence of the process of reporting back. A situation could arise where the commissioner has to act on behalf of an individual or body which believes that even the Welsh Government has not provided an adequate service in Welsh. Minister, I welcome the fact that you will be going out to discuss the new system of standards that will be implemented. I do not believe any of us are entirely clear about that at present, and I hope very much that this discussion will allow us to see that more clearly. I understand entirely what you said about the importance of these standards.

My last question relates to separating the process of promoting the language, which is a role that has been traditionally and excellently undertaken by the Welsh Language Board since its inception as a statutory body with statutory responsibilities, and the regulation process which will be in the hands of the commissioner. I am of the opinion—and I know that you have not yet finally decided on this matter—that consideration should be given to splitting those responsibilities, and to ensure that the promotion role should be part of the broader responsibilities of the Welsh Government to fulfil what it has promised to do, which is to create a truly bilingual Wales. With those

yn fawr, a hoffwn eich llongyfarch, Weinidog, am ei ddwyn ger ein bron heddiw.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch am y sylwadau hynny. Dechreuodd y gwaith hwn yn ystod eich amser chi fel Gweinidog. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn hir a chymhleth—wel, mae'n hir ond mae'n dod yn symlach wrth i'r misoedd fynd heibio. Mae dau ddatganiad yn bodoli ynghylch statws swyddogol y Gymraeg. Nid wyf am osgoi'r cwestiwn drwy ddweud wrth gwrs y byddwn yn gwrando ar unrhyw argymhellion a fyddai'n gwella'r Mesur arfaethedig neu'n ei wneud yn fwy eglur, ond mae hwn yn ddatganiad clir am ddarpariaeth bellach o ran statws swyddogol y Gymraeg yng Nghymru. Os dywedwn fod gan iaith statws swyddogol, rhaid gofyn ym mha ffordd yr adlewyrchir y statws hwn. Gwyddom am yr hen ddadl: nid oes gan y Saesneg statws swyddogol ysgrifenedig oherwydd dyna natur cyfansoddiad Prydain. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn cael statws drwy'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn ychwanegu at y ddarpariaeth a gynigir drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, ac felly at statws yr iaith. Efallai ein bod mewn perygl o geisio dyfalu sawl angel sy'n gallu sefyll ar ben pin yn y cyd-destun hwn, ac ni fyddwn yn cyrraedd pen draw'r mater drwy fynd ymhellach. Er hynny, drwy gynnwys y datganiad hwnnw am statws swyddogol yr iaith yn y Mesur arfaethedig, gellir ei ddefnyddio yn y dyfodol pe bai achos llys perthnasol yn codi, gan ei fod yn ddatganiad clir o'r hyn a gredwn ac o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru o safbwynt y Gymraeg.

O ran hawliau, gofynasoch a fydd gan y comisiynydd bwerau i ddiogelu hawliau unigolion. Bydd, mewn dwy ffordd cwbl ymarferol. Mae cyfeiriad penodol at y rhyddid i siarad Cymraeg, ac os bydd unrhyw un yn teimlo bod y rhyddid hwnnw wedi'i gyfyngu, bydd gan y comisiynydd yr hawl i ymchwilio i'r achos. Mae gan y comisiynydd hawl hefyd i ddwyn achos ar ran unigolyn a gweithredu ar ran yr unigolyn yn gwbl ymarferol. Felly, yn yr ystyr honno, bydd y comisiynydd yn cefnogi hawliau unigolion mewn modd ymarferol.

questions, I very much welcome the proposed Measure, and congratulate you, Minister, on laying it before us here today.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for those comments. This work began during your time as Minister. The proposed Measure is lengthy and complex—well, it is lengthy but it becomes simpler as the months go by. Two statements exist about the official status of Welsh. I have no wish to evade the question by saying that of course we will listen to any recommendations that would improve the proposed Measure or make it clearer, but this is a clear statement about making further provision for the official status of Welsh in Wales. If we say that a language has official status, we have to ask in what way is this status reflected. We know the old argument: English has no written official status, because that is the nature of the British constitution. However, you get status through what you do. The proposed Measure adds to what is provided through the medium of Welsh, and therefore it adds to the status of the language. Perhaps we are in danger of trying to guess how many angels can fit on a pinhead in this respect, and we will not get to the end of the matter by pursuing it any further. Nevertheless, by including that statement on the official status of the language in the proposed Measure, it could be used in future if a relevant court case arose, because it is a clear statement of what we believe and of what is happening in Wales in relation to the Welsh language.

You asked, in respect of rights, whether the commissioner will have powers to protect the rights of individuals. There is specific reference to the freedom to speak Welsh, and if anyone should feel that that freedom is being restricted, the commissioner will have the right to enquire into the case. The commissioner will also have the right to bring a case on behalf of the individual in a practical way. Therefore, in that respect the commissioner will support the rights of individuals in a practical way.

3.50 p.m.

Soniasoch wedyn am annibyniaeth y comisiynydd a'r ffaith ei fod, mewn rhyw ffordd, hefyd yn plismona'r Llywodraeth. Mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn datgan,

'rhaid i Weinidogion Cymru roi sylw dyladwy i'r argymhelliad, y sylw neu i'r cyngor'.

Hynny yw, oddi wrth y comisiynydd. Dywedwyd wrthyf, mewn termau cyfreithiol, fod 'sylw dyladwy' yn eiriau cryf iawn mewn cydberthynas unrhyw gorff allanol a Llywodraeth. Felly, yn yr ystyr honno, mae pwerau'r comisiynydd yn gryfach na phwerau comisiynwyr eraill yng Nghymru.

Ni theimlaf fod angen imi wneud sylw am y ddadl ynghylch hyrwyddo a rheoleiddio, oherwydd dyna'r union drafodaeth sy'n mynd rhagddo. Ymhle y dylai'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw orffwys?

**Mark Isherwood:** In the debate last November, speaking as Chair of the legislation committee that scrutinised the draft legislative competence Order on the Welsh language, I stated that the committee agreed with the principle of it but expressed disappointment that, instead of allowing the Assembly competence over a broad area relating uniquely to the Welsh nation, the Governments had, in most places, narrowed it.

We recommended that organisations be subject to duties in any future Measures according to the nature of the services that they provide to the public, their size, and their legal status, rather than an arbitrary monetary threshold. Instead, the Minister has raised the financial limit to £400,000. Is that not still a fairly arbitrary figure?

I welcomed the fact that the proposed Measure should not capture those in receipt of one-off payments, which was a concern raised in evidence. We recommended that all large financial institutions providing services to the public should fall within the scope of matter 20.1 to ensure a level playing field

You then mentioned the independence of the commissioner, and the fact that the commissioner will, in some way, be policing the Government. The proposed Measure states,

'the Welsh Ministers...must have due regard to the recommendation, representation or advice'.

That is, from the commissioner. I was told, in legal terms, that 'due regard' are strong words to describe the relationship between any external body and Government. Therefore, in that respect the commissioner's powers are greater than the powers of other commissioners in Wales.

I do not believe I need to comment on the discussion about promotion or regulation, because that is the very discussion which is already under way. Where should that responsibility lie?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yn y ddadl fis Tachwedd diwethaf, pan oeddwn yn siarad fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth a fu'n craffu ar y Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol drafft ynghylch yr iaith Gymraeg, dywedais fod y pwyllgor yn cytuno ag egwyddor y Gorchymyn ond yn mynegi siom bod y Llywodraethau, at ei gilydd, wedi cyfyngu cymhwysedd y Cynulliad yn hytrach na rhoi cymhwysedd iddo dros faes eang sy'n unigryw i Gymru.

Gwnaethom argymhelliad y dylai sefydliadau fod yn gaeth i ddyletswyddau mewn unrhyw Fesurau a ddeuai yn y dyfodol, yn ôl natur y gwasanaethau a ddarparant i'r cyhoedd, eu maint a'u statws cyfreithiol, yn hytrach na throthwy ariannol mympwyol. Yn lle hynny, mae'r Gweinidog wedi codi'r terfyn ariannol i £400,000. Onid yw hwnnw o hyd yn ffigur cymharol fymmpwyol?

Croesewais y ffaith na ddylai'r Mesur arfaethedig fod yn berthnasol i'r rheini sy'n cael taliadau unwaith yn unig, a oedd yn bryder a fynegwyd mewn tystiolaeth. Bu inni argymhell y dylai mater 20.1 fod yn berthnasol i bob sefydliad ariannol mawr sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i'r cyhoedd, er mwyn sicrhau

between all companies within the sector. The provisions in this proposed Measure include only those financial institutions 'engaged in central banking', such as the Bank of England. However, will banks that have been bailed out by the UK Government be caught by the financial threshold, and does that result in a level playing field for banks and financial institutions?

Our main cause for concern was the qualification of the legislative competence of the Assembly, whereby the Assembly may not impose duties on persons unless they can challenge those duties on the grounds of reasonableness and proportionality. No previous legislative competence Order has proposed that kind of qualification. That seemed to mean that an Assembly Measure under matter 20.1 will never, in effect, be capable of imposing an absolute duty, which has potentially far-reaching implications. Does it therefore mean that any decision that the Assembly takes could be subject to challenge? On that basis, will the proposed Measure enable the Government to achieve its policy objective of addressing the shortcomings of the Welsh Language Act 1993? That qualification of the Assembly's legislative competence will govern the issue of whether a duty should apply at all. This provision is novel and unprecedented in the development of Schedule 5 to the Government of Wales Act 2006.

Mae'r ddarpariaeth hon yn un newydd a digynsail yn natblygiad pwerau'r Cynulliad.

It appears to set an uncomfortable and worrying constitutional precedent: the Assembly is granting powers only on the condition that a future Measure include certain specified provisions.

In its evidence to our committee, BT Cymru noted that its bilingual policy had been praised by the Welsh Government and the Welsh Language Board, but added that it had been pressing the Welsh Government to concentrate activity not on legislation but on practical programmes that would encourage more use of the language. The Association of Train Operating Companies told us that its Welsh language service had not been used as

chwarae teg rhwng yr holl gwmnïau yn y sector. Dim ond y sefydliadau ariannol 'sy'n ymgymryd â bancio canolog', megis Banc Lloegr, sydd wedi'u cynnwys yn narpariaethau'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn. Fodd bynnag, a fydd y trothwy ariannol yn dal y banciau sydd wedi cael cymorth gan Lywodraeth y DU, ac a yw hynny'n golygu chwarae teg i fanciau a sefydliadau ariannol?

Yr hyn yr oeddem yn pryderu fwyaf yn ei gylch oedd y cyfyngiad ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad, sy'n golygu na all y Cynulliad osod dyletswyddau ar bersonau onid oes modd iddynt herio'r dyletswyddau hynny ar sail rhesymoldeb a chymesuredd. Nid oes cyfyngiad o'r fath wedi'i gynnig gan yr un Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol blaenorol. Yr oedd fel pe bai'n golygu, i bob pwrpas, na fydd Mesur gan y Cynulliad dan fater 20.1 byth yn gallu gosod dyletswydd ddiamod, a gallai goblygiadau hynny fod yn bellgyrhaeddol. A yw'n golygu, felly, y gallai unrhyw benderfyniad y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wneud gael ei herio? Os felly, a fydd y Mesur arfaethedig yn galluogi'r Llywodraeth i gyflawni amcan ei pholisi, sef mynd i'r afael â diffygion Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993? Bydd y cyfyngiad hwnnw ar gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol y Cynulliad yn rheoli a ddylai dyletswydd fod yn berthnasol o gwbl. Mae'r ddarpariaeth hon yn un newydd a digynsail yn natblygiad Atodlen 5 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006.

This is a new and unprecedented provision in the development of the Assembly's powers.

Ymddengys ei fod yn gosod cynsail cyfansoddiadol annymunol sy'n peri gofid: mae'r Cynulliad yn rhoi pwerau ar un amod, sef bod Mesur a gyflwynir yn y dyfodol yn cynnwys rhai darpariaethau penodol.

Yn ei dystiolaeth i'n pwyllgor, dywedodd BT Cymru fod Llywodraeth Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi canmol ei bolisi ar ddwyieithrwydd, ond ychwanegodd ei fod wedi bod yn pwyso ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ganolbwyntio gweithgarwch ar raglenni ymarferol a fyddai'n annog mwy o bobl i ddefnyddio'r iaith, yn hytrach nag ar ddeddfwriaeth. Dywedodd y Gymdeithas Cwmnïau Gweithredu Trenau wrthym nad

widely as it would have liked, adding its need for a business case when making decisions on future provision for services.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. We are not doing very well with our questions today, for some reason. I am referring not only to you but to everyone. I would like to hear a few questions.

**Mark Isherwood:** Does the Minister therefore agree that we must address the concerns of such organisations when taking forward the proposed Measure on the basis of co-operation and consensus building, as was the conclusion of the legislation committee report, in accordance with the approach adopted by our friends and colleagues in Catalonia?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Credaf ichi sôn am dri mater yn benodol. Dywedasoeh gryn dipyn am y trothwy o £400,000. Gadewch inni fod yn glir bod y rhan fwyaf o'r Mesur arfaethedig yn delio â gwahanol categorïau o gyrff, cwmnïau neu sectorau. Nid ydym yn enwi na chorff na chwmmi yn y Mesur arfaethedig. Yr ydym yn ymdrin â chyrrff fesul categori a hynny dim ond pan fydd y cyrrff hynny'n cyflwyno gwasanaeth i'r cyhoedd. Dyna'r meini prawf. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym hefyd yn awyddus i gynnwys cyrrff sy'n derbyn arian yn uniongyrchol o'r pwr cyhoeddus ac o ran y cyrrff hynny y mae'r £400,000 yn berthnasol. Nid oes llawer o gyrff yn syrthio i'r categori hwnnw. Codi tipyn o ysgyfarnog, mewn gwirionedd, yw mynd ar drywydd y pwynt hwnnw.

O safbwynt y ffaith bod y Gorchymyn yn dweud bod yn rhaid cael modd o herio unrhyw benderfyniad neu ddyletswydd ar y sail nad yw'n synhwyrrol na chymesur, y gwir amdani yw bod yn rhaid i bob darn o ddeddfwriaeth fod yn synhwyrrol a chymesur. Gellir herio unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth mewn llys ar y sail ei bod yn afresymol. Felly, nid ydym yn credu bod cynnwys y cymal hwnnw yn y Gorchymyn yn gwanhau'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn nac yn atal y Cynulliad rhag deddfu'n briodol yn y maes.

Yn drydydd, o ran y sylwadau gan BT y

oedd ei gwasanaeth Cymraeg wedi ei ddefnyddio i'r graddau y byddai wedi dymuno, gan ychwanegu bod arni angen achos busnes wrth wneud penderfyniadau ar ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Am ryw reswm, nid ydym yn cael llawer o hwyl gyda'r cwestiynau heddiw. Nid atoch chi yn unig yr wyf yn cyfeirio ond at bawb. Hoffwn glywed ychydig gwestiynau.

**Mark Isherwood:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno, felly, ei bod yn rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â phryderon sefydliadau o'r fath wrth symud y Mesur arfaethedig yn ei flaen ar sail cydweithredu ac adeiladu consensws? Dyna gasgliad adroddiad y pwyllgor deddfwriaeth, yn unol â'r dull gweithredu a fabwysiadwyd gan ein cyfeillion a'n cydweithwyr yng Nghatalonia?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I believe you mentioned three issues specifically. You talked much about the £400,000 threshold. Let us be clear that most of the proposed Measure deals with different categories of bodies, companies or sectors. We do not name a body or a company in the proposed Measure. We deal with bodies by category and only if those bodies provide a service to the public. Those are the criteria. Of course, we are also keen to include bodies that receive direct funding from the public purse, and the £400,000 is relevant to those bodies. Not many bodies fall within that category. In reality, pursuing that point is a bit of a red herring.

As for the fact that the Order states that there should be a way of challenging any decision or duty on the basis that it is not reasonable or proportionate, the truth is that all pieces of legislation have to be reasonable and proportionate. Any legislation can be challenged in court on the basis that it is not proportionate. Therefore, we do not believe that including that clause in the Order weakens this proposed Measure or stops the Assembly from legislating appropriately in the field.

Thirdly, as to the comments by BT which

gwnaethoch eu dyfynnu, yn sicr yr ydym mewn deialog gyson gyda'r byd busnes a diwydiant. Wrth osod dyletswyddau, rhaid i'r comisiynydd hefyd ddangos ei fod wedi trafod yn drylwyr gyda'r sectorau a'r cwmnïau cyn gosod y safonau. Y gobaith yw y bydd safonau cyson ar draws sector, er enghraifft, y sector ynni neu'r sector telathrebu, fel bod yn rhaid i bob cwmni gyflawni'r un lefel o wasanaeth. Byddai hynny'n briodol ac yn deg.

Yr ydych yn hollol iawn, wrth gwrs, mai'r her ar ôl hynny fydd sicrhau bod mwy a mwy o Gymry Cymraeg yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau Cymraeg. Mae honno'n her fawr, ac yr wyf yn derbyn hynny ar ran y Llywodraeth, ond mae hefyd yn her y bydd yn rhaid inni ei hystyried yn ofalus er mwyn sicrhau bod cynnydd yn y defnydd a wneir o wasanaethau Cymraeg.

**Jenny Randerson:** I will do my best to think of a couple of questions, Presiding Officer.

It is important to remember that we have had nothing less than a social revolution in attitudes to the language in the past 20 years. Minister, I very much regret the considerable delay to which you referred earlier in getting this proposed Measure before us. I always took the view that the very first thing the Assembly should be dealing with would be an LCO on the language, because I could not for one minute see why the UK Parliament would wish to interfere with our right to deal with issues relating to the Welsh language, but there you go.

It is now time to move on. I emphasise, Minister, that you should not cast the Welsh Language Board aside thoughtlessly, because it is an amazing success story throughout the world. Welsh is virtually the only minority language in the world that is growing not declining, and that is in large part down to the expert work of the Welsh Language Board over the years.

I agree with you, Minister, that it is time for 'Iaith Pawb' to have a successor. It has lasted well as a strategy, but it was written in other

you quoted, we are certainly having a dialogue with the world of business and industry. In placing duties, the commissioner also has to show that he or she has had thorough discussions with sectors and companies before setting standards. The hope is that there will be consistent standards across individual sectors, for example, the energy sector or the telecommunications sector, so that each company must provide the same level of service. That would be appropriate and fair.

You are quite right, of course, that the challenge after that will be to ensure that more and more Welsh speakers use Welsh services. That is a huge challenge, and one that I accept on behalf of the Government, but it is also a challenge that we will have to consider carefully in order to ensure that there is an increase in the use of Welsh-language services.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gwnaf fy ngorau i feddwl am gwestiwn neu ddau, Lywydd.

Mae'n bwysig cofio inni weld dim byd llai na chwyldro cymdeithasol mewn agweddau at yr iaith dros yr 20 mlynedd diwethaf. Weinidog, yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr at yr oedi sylweddol yr oeddech yn sôn amdano'n gynharach wrth ddod â'r Mesur arfaethedig hwn ger ein bron. Yr oeddwn bob amser o'r farn mai'r peth cyntaf y dylai'r Cynulliad ymdrin ag ef oedd Gorchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol ynghylch yr iaith, oherwydd ni allwn weld am eiliad pam y byddai Senedd y DU yn dymuno ymyrryd â'n hawl i ymdrin â materion yn ymwneud â'r Gymraeg, ond dyna ni.

Mae'n bryd symud ymlaen erbyn hyn. Yr wyf yn pwysleisio, Weinidog, na ddylech ddileu Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn ddifeddwl, oherwydd mae wedi bod yn llwyddiant ryfeddol ledled y byd. Y Gymraeg yw'r unig iaith leiafrifol yn y byd, bron â bod, sydd ar gynnydd yn hytrach nag ar drai, ac mae hynny i raddau helaeth yn ganlyniad i waith arbenigol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar hyd y blynyddoedd.

Cytunaf â chi, Weinidog, ei bod yn bryd cael olynnydd i 'Iaith Pawb'. Mae wedi para'n dda fel strategaeth, ond cafodd ei hysgrifennu

times when we did not have legislative competence over the language, and so it is important that we move on. It has lasted well, I think, because it was regarded as pretty radical at the time. It had room to grow, but people's attitudes to the language have grown at the same time.

4.00 p.m.

I do want to put some questions to you, Minister, and offer some words of warning. The Welsh language used to be fiercely divisive, largely along party political lines. That has been entirely overcome, and, as a result, has strengthened the language considerably. Do you share my concern that an acrimonious debate is already opening up? Your colleague behind you was hard and critical in her attitude towards Paul Davies—I am not defending Paul Davies in this—and your answer to Eleanor Burnham was also pretty sharp. It is not a time for Plaid Cymru triumphalism on this issue, and I applaud Rhodri Glyn Thomas for his earlier comments. It is important that we keep the language, and not party politics, at the forefront. When I was a Minister, I vowed to overcome the party political approach, and I hope that you will agree that we would be taking a step backwards if we were to go back to the days when the Welsh language was something that Plaid Cymru always said 'yes' to, and the Labour Party automatically said 'no' to. The language will not grow in that type of political climate.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Let us have some questions.

**Jenny Randerson:** I am asking questions.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not think so. [*Interruption.*] Order. I would like to—

**Jenny Randerson:** I have asked two questions, Presiding Officer.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. With the exception of the distinguished speaker on behalf of the opposition, Paul Davies, who

mewn cyfnod arall, pan nad oedd gennym gymhwysedd deddfwriaethol dros yr iaith, ac mae'n bwysig inni symud ymlaen. Credaf ei bod wedi para'n dda oherwydd ei bod yn cael ei hystyried yn strategaeth ddigon radical ar y pryd. Yr oedd ganddi le i dyfu, ond mae agweddau pobl at yr iaith wedi tyfu ar yr un pryd.

Hoffwn ofyn ambell gwestiwn ichi, Weinidog, a chynnig ambell air o rybudd. Arferai'r Gymraeg fod yn fater a achosai rwyg mawr, ar hyd llinellau gwleidyddiaeth plaid i raddau helaeth. Goresgynnwyd hynny'n llwyr, a chryfhawyd yr iaith yn sylweddol o ganlyniad. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod dadl chwerw eisoes yn dechrau? Yr oedd eich cydweithiwr sydd y tu ôl ichi yn ddiostur ac yn feirniadol iawn yn ei hagwedd at Paul Davies—nid wyf yn amddiffyn Paul Davies yn hyn—ac yr oedd eich ateb chi i Eleanor Burnham yn ddigon swta hefyd. Nid yw'n adeg i Blaid Cymru ymorchestu ynghylch y mater, a chymeradwyaf Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ei sylwadau'n gynharach. Mae'n bwysig mai'r iaith, ac nid gwleidyddiaeth plaid, sy'n cael y sylw pennaf. Pan oeddwn i'n Weinidog, gwneuthum adduned i gefnu ar y dull gweithredu yn seiliedig ar wleidyddiaeth plaid, a gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno y byddai'n gam yn ôl pe baem yn dychwelyd i'r dyddiau pan oedd yr iaith Gymraeg yn rhywbeth yr oedd Plaid Cymru bob amser yn dweud 'ie' wrtho, a'r Blaid Lafur yn dweud 'na' yn syth. Ni fydd yr iaith yn tyfu mewn hinsawdd wleidyddol felly.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Gadewch inni gael ychydig gwestiynau.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn gofyn cwestiynau.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n amheus gennyf. [*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Hoffwn—

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn dau gwestiwn, Lywydd.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ar wahân i'r siaradwr neilltuol ar ran yr wrthblaid, Paul Davies, a ofynnodd nifer o gwestiynau, areithiau fu'r

asked a lot of questions, most responses to this statement have been speeches.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have asked two questions.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You have taken rather a long time to do so.

**Jenny Randerson:** I have got another one. I am sorry, but I was judging the length of my speech by the length of time given to other contributors.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It should not be a speech; this is the whole point. This is a legislative statement and questions are the order of the day. I keep having to say this; what is the problem this afternoon? It is not mine.

**Jenny Randerson:** I urge the Minister to take into account the need for the commissioner and the advisory panel, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas said, to be appointed independently and to be answerable to the Assembly as a whole. Do you agree that the key thing is to keep the language and its implementation out of the bear pit—as it is occasionally—of party politics? Do you agree that the language should be held as an independent issue at arm's length from party politics and from Government? Do you agree with the earlier comments made by Rhodri Glyn Thomas in this regard, and will you take that seriously into consideration?

Finally, your statement also refers to the transfer of some powers to Welsh Ministers. In the light of my earlier comments, what type of powers are you thinking of? I am concerned, once again, that you could be bringing the language too close to the party politics associated with Government, and the type of criticism that is inevitably associated with Government action, whatever its colour. What type of powers are you thinking of transferring from those currently held by the Welsh Language Board to the commissioner and the Government?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yr wyf yn cytuno y bu chwyldro mewn agweddau ar yr iaith Gymraeg, a gallaf eich sicrhau na fyddwn yn

rhan fwyaf o'r ymatebion i'r datganiad hwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf wedi gofyn dau gwestiwn.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr ydych wedi cymryd cryn amser i wneud hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae gennyf gwestiwn arall. Mae'n flin gennyf, ond yr oeddwn yn mesur hyd fy araith yn ôl yr amser a roddwyd i gyfranwyr eraill.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni ddylai fod yn araith; dyna'r holl bwynt. Datganiad deddfwriaethol yw hwn a chwestiynau yw trefn y dydd. Yr wyf yn gorfod ailadrodd hynny o hyd; beth yw'r broblem y prynhawn yma? Nid fy mhroblem i ydyw.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn annog y Gweinidog i ystyried yr angen i'r comisiynydd a'r panel cyngori, fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gael eu penodi'n annibynnol a bod yn atebol i'r Cynulliad cyfan. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r allwedd yw cadw'r iaith, a'r camau gweithredu sy'n gysylltiedig â hi, allan o wleidyddiaeth plaid, sy'n gallu bod yn dipyn o bydew ar adegau? A ydych yn cytuno y dylai'r iaith fod yn fater annibynnol a gedwir hyd braich oddi wrth wleidyddiaeth plaid a Llywodraeth? A ydych yn cytuno â'r sylwadau a wnaed yn gynharach gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas ar y mater hwn, ac a wnewch chi roi ystyriaeth ddifrifol i hynny?

Yn olaf, mae eich datganiad yn cyfeirio hefyd at drosglwyddo rhai pwerau i Weinidogion Cymru. O gofio fy sylwadau'n gynharach, pa fath o bwerau sydd gennych mewn golwg? Yr wyf yn pryderu, unwaith eto, y gallech fod yn dod â'r iaith yn rhy agos at y wleidyddiaeth plaid sy'n gysylltiedig â Llywodraeth, a'r math o feirniadaeth sy'n cael ei chysylltu'n anochel â chamau gweithredu Llywodraeth, o ba liw bynnag y bo. Pa fath o bwerau yr ydych yn ystyried eu trosglwyddo o Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i'r comisiynydd a'r Llywodraeth?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I agree that there has been a revolution in terms of attitudes towards the language, and I can assure you



colli unrhyw arbenigedd a ddatblygwyd gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg dros y blynyddoedd. Yr wyf innau hefyd yn talu teyrnged i 'Iaith Pawb' fel y strategaeth gyntaf.

O ran eich cwestiynau, yr oeddech yn dweud ei bod yn bwysig cadw'r gefnogaeth drawsbleidiol, a byddwn yn ategu hynny. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw nodyn o *triumphalism* yn fy sylwadau, ac nid wyf yn bwriadu cynnwys nodyn o'r fath yn y dyfodol chwaith. Mae cael cefnogaeth eang Cymry Cymraeg a'r di-Gymraeg yn hollbwysig o safbwynt sicrhau dyfodol ffyniannus i'r Gymraeg.

O ran penodi'r comisiynydd, yr wyf wedi dweud, a dywedaf eto, fy mod yn barod i wrando ar unrhyw awgrymiadau ynglŷn â hynny. Yr un broses sy'n cael ei hamlinellu yma ag a ddefnyddir ar gyfer comisiynwyr eraill yng Nghymru, ac nid wyf yn ymwybodol o feirniadaeth lem o'r broses honno o safbwynt ei hannibyniaeth. Os oes beirniadaeth, gadewch inni wrando ar yr argymhellion.

Hoffwn ddweud un peth ynglŷn â pheidio â gwneud y broses yn un wleidyddol a'r awgrym mai dim ond os yw pawb yn gytŷn y bydd popeth yn iawn. Os nad oes ymrwymiad gwleidyddol i gefnogi'r Gymraeg, neu unrhyw fater arall, nid oes dim yn digwydd. Mae perygl, os yw pawb yn dawel ac yn cytuno â'i gilydd, na fydd dim yn symud ymlaen. Felly, er ein bod yn nodi bod cael consensws yn wych o beth, nid oes dim o'i le mewn cael trafodaeth fywiog am y pwnc hwn, fel pob pwnc arall, nac mewn anghydweld o dro i dro. Ni ddylem ddyrchafu consensws i fod uwchlaw popeth arall, hyd yn oed yn y maes arbennig hwn. Rhaid gwerthfawrogi'r chwyldro a'r newid mewn agweddau a gafwyd dros y degawdau diwethaf, a chytunaf fod hynny wedi bod yn fuddiol iawn.

O ran cymryd pwerau oddi wrth Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg, mae'r Mesur arfaethedig yn egluro yn fanwl pa bwerau a fydd yn trosglwyddo i'r comisiynydd, ac yn ei gwneud yn glir bod y rhan fwyaf o'r pwerau hynny, a'r pwerau ychwanegol, yn cael eu trosglwyddo i'r comisiynydd o Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Yr ydym yn sôn yn benodol am y gallu i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg a'r lle

that we will not lose any of the expertise developed by the Welsh Language Board over the years. I also pay tribute to 'Iaith Pawb' as the first strategy.

To turn to your questions, you said it was important to maintain cross-party support, and I would endorse that. I do not believe there was any note of triumphalism in my comments, and I do not intend to include such a note in future. It is vital that we have the broad support of Welsh-speakers and non-Welsh-speakers alike in order to ensure a successful future for the language.

In terms of the appointment of a commissioner, I have said—and I repeat—that I am prepared to listen to any suggestions made. The process being outlined here is the same as that used for other commissioners in Wales, and I am not aware of strong criticism of the independence of that process. If there is criticism, let us listen to the recommendations.

I should like to say one thing about not turning this into a political process and the suggestion that this will not work unless we have unanimity. Unless there is political commitment to support the language, or any other issue, nothing will happen. There is a danger, if everyone is quiet and in agreement, that there will be no progress. Therefore, even though we note that consensus is excellent, there is nothing wrong with having a lively debate on this issue, as with all other issues, or with having disagreements from time to time. We should not put consensus on a pedestal, above all else, even in this field. We must appreciate the revolution and change in attitudes which has been seen over the past decades and which I agree have been very beneficial.

On taking powers away from the Welsh Language Board, the proposed Measure explains in detail which powers will be transferred to the commissioner, and it makes it clear that most of those powers, and additional powers, are transferred to the commissioner from the Welsh Language Board. We are talking specifically about the ability to promote the language and the best

gorau i hynny orwedd. Nid yw hynny yn y Mesur arfaethedig, er ei fod yn caniatáu i'r comisiynydd wneud hynny, os mai dyna yw'r dewis yn y pen draw.

**Darren Millar:** I want to ask some questions specifically as a member of the committee that looked at the Welsh language legislative competence Order. Before I do so, I want to say how supportive this party will always be of any Measures to protect, promote and to advance the Welsh language and its use in Wales. I subscribe fully to the points made by my colleague, Paul Davies.

It is worth noting that there were over 150 responses to the consultation on the Welsh language LCO, over 70 of which came from individuals. Many of those individuals expressed concerns, based on information that they had, about the fact that the role of the commissioner could extend to the protection of the rights of English speakers, as well as of those of Welsh speakers. You were questioned in the committee on that subject, and you seemed to be prepared to look at the role of the commissioner and whether the rights of English speakers in some parts of north-west Wales, for example, could also be protected by the commissioner, who could act as a channel for complaints, where complaints might arise. Minister, could you signal to us whether, if evidence comes forward in that regard through scrutiny of the proposed Measure, you are prepared to look at that again to see whether that is necessary?

My second question relates to the public meetings. I welcome the fact that you have suggested that public meetings will be held across Wales, but it is important that they are not just a charm offensive on this subject, and that there is an opportunity for individuals, organisations and businesses who come to those public fora to make a contribution to the shaping of the legislation as it goes forward. I fully support Bethan Jenkins in that respect, who I believe made similar points.

My third question relates to the costs of the proposed Measure. You have indicated that

place for that to be. That is not in the proposed Measure, although it does allow the commissioner to do so, if that is the choice ultimately.

**Darren Millar:** Yr wyf am ofyn rhai cwestiynau'n benodol fel aelod o'r pwyllgor a fu'n edrych ar Orchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yr iaith Gymraeg. Cyn gwneud hynny, yr wyf am ddweud mor gefnogol y bydd y blaid hon bob amser i unrhyw Fesurau i ddiogelu, hyrwyddo a datblygu'r iaith Gymraeg a'r modd y caiff ei defnyddio yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan fy nghydweithiwr, Paul Davies.

Mae'n werth nodi bod dros 150 o ymatebion wedi'u cyflwyno i'r ymgynghoriad ar Orchymyn cymhwysedd deddfwriaethol yr iaith Gymraeg, a dros 70 ohonynt oddi wrth unigolion. Dywedodd nifer o'r unigolion hynny eu bod yn pryderu, ar sail y wybodaeth a oedd ganddynt, y gallai rôl y comisiynydd gynnwys amddiffyn hawliau siaradwyr Saesneg yn ogystal â hawliau siaradwyr Cymraeg. Cawsoch eich holi ynghylch hynny yn y pwyllgor, ac ymddangosai eich bod yn barod i edrych ar rôl y comisiynydd ac ystyried a allai hawliau siaradwyr Saesneg, mewn rhai ardaloedd o'r gogledd-orllewin, er enghraifft, gael eu hamddiffyn hefyd gan y comisiynydd, ac y gallai fod yn sianel ar gyfer cwynion, lle gallai cwynion godi. Weinidog, a allech ddweud wrthym a fydech, pe bai tystiolaeth yn cael ei chyflwyno i'r perwyl hwnnw wrth graffu ar y Mesur arfaethedig, yn barod i edrych ar hynny eto i weld a oes angen y fath beth?

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â'r cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus. Croesawaf y ffaith ichi awgrymu y bydd cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus yn cael eu cynnal ledled Cymru, ond mae'n bwysig i'r rhain fod yn fwy nag ymgyrch i ennill cymeradwyaeth pobl, a'u bod yn gyfle i unigolion, sefydliadau a busnesau sy'n dod i'r fforymau cyhoeddus hyn gyfrannu at lunio'r ddeddfwriaeth wrth iddi symud yn ei blaen. Yr wyf yn cefnogi Bethan Jenkins yn llawn yn hynny o beth, a chredaf iddi wneud pwyntiau tebyg.

Mae fy nhrydydd cwestiwn yn ymwneud â chostau'r Mesur arfaethedig. Yr ydych wedi

you will use the £13.8 million that is available to support the Welsh Language Board to move forward with the implementation of the role of the commissioner. However, you have made no reference whatsoever to the support that might be available to those organisations that want to go further than they have done before to promote the Welsh language.

4.10 p.m.

As a committee member, I was interested to hear the evidence that was given by the Catalan Government on support that it has made available to organisations and businesses and to third sector organisations to help them to adapt and to be creative in terms of the use of the Catalan language. I think that it has a current annual budget of around €36 million. I recognise that we cannot make lavish promises on the cash that might be available to promote the Welsh language in Wales among organisations and businesses, but will you consider that point as you shape the regulations? Will there be adequate resources in order to make Wales a truly bilingual nation?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Croesawaf ddatganiad Darren Millar, fel yr wyf yn croesawu cyfraniad bron pawb a siaradodd heddiw. Yr oedd Darren Millar yn gofyn am bwerau'r comisiynydd mewn perthynas â'r Saesneg. Dywed y Mesur arfaethedig yn glir nad yw'n effeithio ar statws y Saesneg yng Nghymru, ond ei fod yn edrych i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ochr yn ochr â'r Saesneg. Mesur arfaethedig yw hwn yn benodol i hyrwyddo'r defnydd o'r iaith a'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael yn y Gymraeg, oherwydd, fel iaith leiafrifol hyd yn oed yng Nghymru, mae angen Mesur arfaethedig o'r fath i gyflawni'r amcanion hynny.

Mae'r cyfarfodydd cyhoeddus—dyna'r tro cyntaf imi gael fy nghyhuddo o gynnal 'charm offensive', ond derbyniaf y sylw—yn fater o gyflwyno gwybodaeth a derbyn cwestiynau, fel y byddai rhywun yn ei ddisgwyl. Fodd bynnag, o ran cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r Mesur arfaethedig, bydd gofyn iddynt gael eu sianelu drwy'r pwyllgorau priodol yn y Cynulliad, lle bydd

nodi y byddwch yn defnyddio'r £13.8 miliwn sydd ar gael i gefnogi Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i symud ymlaen â'r gwaith o weithredu rôl y comisiynydd. Fodd bynnag, nid ydych wedi cyfeirio o gwbl at y gefnogaeth a allai fod ar gael i'r sefydliadau hynny sydd am wneud mwy nag a wnaethant o'r blaen i hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg.

Fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, yr oedd gennyf ddiddordeb clywed y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd gan Lywodraeth Catalonia am y gefnogaeth y mae wedi'i darparu i sefydliadau a busnesau a sefydliadau'r trydydd sector i'w helpu i addasu a bod yn greadigol wrth ddefnyddio Catalaneg. Credaf fod ganddi gyllideb flynyddol gyfredol o oddeutu €36 miliwn. Yr wyf yn cydnabod na allwn wneud addewidion hael ynghylch yr arian a all fod ar gael i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ymhllith sefydliadau a busnesau yng Nghymru, ond a wnewch chi ystyried y pwynt hwnnw wrth lunio'r rheoliadau? A fydd digon o adnoddau ar gael i wneud Cymru'n wlad gwbl ddwyieithog?

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I welcome Darren Millar's statement, as I welcome what has been said by nearly all of the contributors today. Darren Millar asked about the commissioner's powers in relation to the English language. The proposed Measure says clearly that it does not impact upon the status of the English language in Wales, but seeks to promote the Welsh language alongside English. This is a proposed Measure aimed specifically at promoting the language and the services available through the medium of Welsh, because as a minority language, even in Wales, we need such a proposed Measure to achieve those objectives.

The public meetings—that was the first time that I have been accused of carrying out a charm offensive, but I accept the point—are an opportunity to present information and take questions, as one would expect. However, any amendments to the proposed Measure would have to be channelled through the Assembly's relevant committees, where Members will lobby for any changes.

Aelodau yn lobïo am unrhyw newidiadau.

O ran y costau, nid oes dim yn y Mesur arfaethedig sy'n ychwanegu at gostau'n uniongyrchol. Fel y gwyddom, mae darparu gwasanaeth yn cael ei ystyried fel rhan o weithgarwch unrhyw gorff neu gwmni ym mha bynnag iaith y maent yn gwneud hynny. Mae llawer o'r cwmnïau rhyngwladol hyn, gan gynnwys llawer o gwmnïau yng Nghymru, wedi hen arfer â chyflwyno gwasanaeth yn ddwyieithog. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch o glywed y sylw y bydd y Torïaid yn ystyried rhoi €36 miliwn tuag at hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg. Byddai hynny'n dderbyniol iawn.

As for the costs, nothing in the proposed Measure adds directly to costs. As we know, providing a service is seen as part and parcel of the activity of organisations and companies, whatever the language. Many of these multinational companies, including many in Wales, are used to providing bilingual services. However, I was pleased to hear that the Tories are thinking of providing €36 million for the promotion of the Welsh language. That would be very welcome.

Yn sicr, mae angen adnoddau i gyflawni nod uchelgeisiol o'r fath, ond nid yn unig drwy waith y comisiynydd y mae cyrraedd y nod hwnnw. Felly, gobeithiwn y bydd y gefnogaeth i'r Gymraeg yn cael ei phrifffrdio o fewn adrannau eraill.

We certainly need resources to achieve this ambitious aim, but that will not be done through the work of the commissioner alone. Therefore, we hope that support for the Welsh language is mainstreamed in other departments.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ddatganiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** I thank the Minister for his statement.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro (Peter Black) i'r Gadair am 4.13 p.m.  
The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer (Peter Black) took the Chair at 4.13 p.m.*

### **Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate**

#### **Cynnydd yn y Dreth Gyngor ac mewn Ardrethi Busnes Increases in the Council Tax and Business Rates**

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Presiding Officer has selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendment 2 in my name.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Mae'r Llywydd wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliant 2 yn fy enw i.

**Darren Millar:** I move that

**Darren Millar:** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. notes with concern the burden placed on Welsh households and businesses respectively by above-inflation increases in the council tax and business rates;*

*1. yn nodi â phryder y baich a roddwyd ar gartrefi a busnesau yng Nghymru yn sgîl y cynnydd sy'n uwch na chwyddiant yn y dreth gyngor ac mewn ardrethi busnes;*

*2. raises concern over the impact of the business rates revaluation on many businesses in Wales. (NDM4434)*

*2. yn mynegi pryder am effaith yr ailbriso ardrethi busnes ar lawer o fusnesau yng Nghymru. (NDM4434)*

I am grateful for the opportunity to open this debate this afternoon for the Welsh Conservatives. Most here would agree that the increased burden placed on Welsh households and businesses by the above-inflation increases in council tax and business rates is a matter of great concern. Given that we are still emerging from one of the most severe recessions in living memory and one from which all of the evidence would suggest that, compared with the rest of the UK, Wales will emerge from even more slowly, that concern is certainly justified.

For the people of Wales, this means that, as a result of the unfair financial pressure placed on local authorities by the Labour/Plaid Cymru Welsh Assembly Government, their pockets are being hit pretty hard. Let us start by looking at council tax rises this year, which are directly affected by the poor settlements that are dished out year on year by this Government. I know that the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government has claimed that the latest settlement is fair and realistic, but others, including me, and probably most of the people who have seen their council tax payments double over the past 10 years, would beg to differ.

In contrast to the Minister's claim to realism and a rather rosy assessment of all things financial, John Davies, the leader of the Welsh Local Government Association, is probably more realistic by correctly describing the recent settlement as the lowest increase in Assembly Government support since devolution.

Unfortunately, that is not fair. The average 3.6 per cent council tax increase in Wales is more than twice the projected increase for England, which is just 1.6 per cent. We must not forget that the 3.6 per cent figure masks the huge variations between local authorities in Wales. Council tax in Conwy and Anglesey, for example, will rise by 4.7 per cent and 4.5 per cent respectively.

The Labour/Plaid Government's policy of lower settlements and higher council tax not

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i agor y ddafl hon y prynhawn yma ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yma yn cytuno bod y baich cynyddol sydd ar gartrefi a busnesau yng Nghymru yn sgil y cynnydd sy'n uwch na chwyddiant yn y dreth gyngor ac mewn ardrethi busnes yn destun pryder mawr. Yn sicr, mae'r pryder hwnnw'n ddigon teg, o ystyried ein bod yn dal i ddod allan o ddirwasgiad sydd gyda'r mwyaf difrifol o fewn cof, a dirwasgiad y mae'r holl dystiolaeth yn awgrymu y bydd Cymru'n dod allan ohono'n arafach fyth o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU.

I bobl Cymru, mae hynny'n golygu, o ganlyniad i'r pwysau ariannol annheg a sydd ar awdurdodau lleol gan y Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru yn y Cynulliad, bod eu pocedi'n cael eu taro'n go galed. Gadewch inni ddechrau drwy edrych ar y codiadau yn y dreth gyngor eleni, yr effeithir yn uniongyrchol arnynt gan y setliadau gwael a ddosberthir gan y Llywodraeth hon flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Gwn fod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol wedi honni bod y setliad diweddaraf yn deg ac yn realistig, ond byddai pobl eraill, fel fi, a phawb arall mae'n siŵr sydd wedi gweld eu taliadau treth gyngor yn dyblu yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf, yn anghytuno.

Yn wahanol i honiad y Gweinidog fod y setliad yn realistig, a'i asesiad digon gobeithiol o bethau ariannol, mae'n debyg bod John Davies, arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn fwy realistig pan ddisgrifiodd y setliad diweddar, yn ddigon cywir, fel y cynnydd isaf yng nghefnogaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ers datganoli.

Yn anffodus, nid yw hynny'n deg. Ar gyfartaledd mae'r dreth gyngor wedi codi 3.6 y cant yng Nghymru, sy'n fwy na dwywaith y cynnydd a ragwelir ar gyfer Lloegr o 1.6 y cant yn unig. Rhaid inni gofio bod y ffigur o 3.6 y cant yn cuddio'r amrywiadau sylweddol rhwng awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Er enghraifft, bydd y dreth gyngor yng Nghonwy yn codi 4.7 y cant, ac yn Ynys Môn bydd yn codi 4.5 y cant.

Nid yn unig y mae polisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru o setliadau is a threth

only hurts people's ability to get by day to day, but will have a drastic effect on the future provision of services by local authorities.

**Gareth Jones:** Are you including the police precept in that increase? Do you have any comment to make about the increase in that percentage over the last five to seven years?

**Darren Millar:** I am not including the police precept increase; these are the increases in the council tax precept.

As I have said before, Welsh Assembly Government policy will inevitably mean that councils will be forced to make cuts to front-line services, putting schools, libraries, leisure centres and weekly bin collections—where they still exist—at risk. Most councils are already bracing themselves for the huge financial challenges that lie ahead.

We have heard in north Wales, for example, that Anglesey will need to make savings of around £10 million over the next three years, while, in the south, Cardiff has announced the need to make savings of £14 million. These are not savings. Let us be honest about it: they are cuts.

**Janet Ryder:** I take it from what you are saying that you will now give us a pledge that, should there be a change in Government, there will be absolutely no cuts to public services at all by any Tory Government.

**Darren Millar:** If you would bother to listen to me before intervening, you might be able to get an answer, might you not, Janet?

The £10 million in savings needed in Anglesey and the £14 million needed in Cardiff are probably extremes, but the need to save money, that is, to cut costs, will no doubt become the norm if the Welsh Assembly Government continues to wear its rose-tinted spectacles. We believe that fair and realistic support must be given to local authorities and council tax payers. Therefore,

gyngor uwch yn niweidio gallu pobl i ymdopi o ddydd i ddydd, ond bydd hefyd yn effeithio'n sylweddol ar y gwasanaethau a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol yn y dyfodol.

**Gareth Jones:** A ydych yn cynnwys praesept yr heddlu yn y cynnydd hwnnw? A oes gennych unrhyw sylw ynghylch y cynnydd yn y ganran honno yn ystod y pum i saith mlynedd diwethaf?

**Darren Millar:** Nid wyf yn cynnwys y cynnydd ym mhraesept yr heddlu; y codiadau ym mhraesept y dreth gyngor yw'r rhain.

Fel yr wyf wedi'i ddweud o'r blaen, mae'n anochel y bydd polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn golygu y caiff cynghorau eu gorfodi i wneud toriadau mewn gwasanaethau rheng flaen, gan beryglu ysgolion, llyfrgelloedd, canolfannau hamdden a chasgliadau sbwriel wythnosol—lle maent yn dal i fodoli. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o gynghorau eisoes yn ymbaratoi ar gyfer yr heriau ariannol sylweddol sydd o'u blaen.

Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi clywed yn y gogledd y bydd angen i Ynys Môn wneud arbedion gwerth tua £10 miliwn yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf, ac yn y de mae Caerdydd wedi cyhoeddi y bydd angen gwneud arbedion gwerth £14 miliwn. Nid arbedion mo'r rhain. Gadewch inni fod yn onest: toriadau ydynt.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn tybio o'r hyn a ddywedwch y byddwch yn rhoi addewid inni yn awr, os bydd newid mewn Llywodraeth, na fydd yr un Llywodraeth Doriadau yn gwneud dim toriadau mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

**Darren Millar:** Pe baech yn trafferthu gwrandao arnaf cyn ymyrryd, hwyrach y gallech gael ateb, Janet.

Mae'n debyg mai eithafion yw'r arbedion gwerth £10 miliwn y mae eu hangen yn Ynys Môn a'r arbedion gwerth £14 miliwn y mae eu hangen yng Nghaerdydd, ond mae'n ddiaw y bydd yr angen i arbed arian, hynny yw, torri costau, yn dod yn beth arferol os bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i edrych yn obeithiol ar bopeth. Credwn fod yn rhaid rhoi cefnogaeth deg a realistig i awdurdodau

what can be done? Here is your answer, Janet.

First, there needs to be targeted support for the most vulnerable. It is worrying to read that, although one in three households in Wales are eligible for council tax benefit, according to the Assembly Government's own report, £100 million in council tax benefit goes unclaimed every year in Wales. I know that there are all sorts of different reasons as to why some people claim and why others do not, but, on the whole, the support that is readily available is simply not getting through. That is why one of our policies would be to give every pensioner household across the board a 30 per cent council tax discount. There would be no complicated forms to fill in or embarrassing interviews with council officers. It would be simple, straightforward and easy to understand: there would be a 30 per cent council tax discount for every single pensioner household.

You may respond that that is fair enough, but how on earth will we pay for it? Well, the second thing that we see as key is a need to reduce the use of hypothecated grants drastically. No doubt you will argue, Minister, in your response, that, in the 2010-11 settlement, you made some steps towards reducing hypothecation, and I understand that, but you did not go anywhere near far enough. Around a tenth of the £600 million currently hypothecated in grants to local authorities is swallowed up in administrative costs. By cutting the use of hypothecated grants—those ring-fenced grants that you make available year in, year out, which we have been telling you to stop messing about with for years—you could save around £60 million. That is money that could go towards supporting a council tax discount for pensioner households and to help other households that are struggling with their council tax bills, as well as to help to protect front-line services.

Another area that needs urgent review is local government pensions. Throughout Wales, band D council tax payers are seeing £273 of their annual bill go towards the massive

lleol a phobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor. Felly, beth y gellir ei wneud? Dyma'ch ateb, Janet.

Yn gyntaf, mae angen cael cymorth wedi'i dargedu ar gyfer y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed. Mae'n destun pryder darllen, er bod un cartref o bob tri yng Nghymru yn gymwys i gael budd-dal treth gyngor, yn ôl adroddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun, mae £100 miliwn o fudd-daliadau treth gyngor heb ei hawlio bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru. Gwn fod pob math o resymau pam mae rhai pobl yn ei hawlio ac nid eraill ond ar y cyfan nid yw'r cymorth parod sydd ar gael yn cyrraedd y bobl y mae arnynt ei angen. Dyna pam y byddai un o'n polisiau ni'n golygu rhoi gostyngiad o 30 y cant yn y dreth gyngor i bob aelwyd lle mae pensiynwyr. Ni fyddai ffurflenni cymhleth i'w llenwi na chyfweliadau annifyr â swyddogion cyngor. Byddai'n syml ac yn hawdd ei ddeall: byddai gostyngiad o 30 y cant yn y dreth gyngor i bob aelwyd lle mae pensiynwr.

Gallech ymateb drwy ddweud bod hynny'n ddigon teg, ond sut ar y ddaear y byddwn yn talu amdano? Wel, yr ail beth a gredwn sy'n allweddol yw'r angen i leihau'n sylweddol yr arfer o ddefnyddio grantiau wedi'u neilltuo. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn dadlau yn eich ymateb, Weinidog, ichi gymryd rhai camau tuag at leihau grantiau wedi'u neilltuo yn setliad 2010-11, a deallaf hynny, ond nid oedd yr hyn a wnaethoch yn agos at fod yn ddigon. Mae tua degfed ran o'r £600 miliwn sy'n cael ei neilltuo ar hyn o bryd mewn grantiau i awdurdodau lleol yn cael ei lyncu mewn costau gweinyddol. Drwy ddefnyddio llai o grantiau wedi'u neilltuo—y grantiau hynny a ddarparwch flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn a ninnau wedi bod yn dweud wrthy ch ers blynyddoedd am beidio â photsian â hwy—gallech arbed tua £60 miliwn. Mae hwnnw'n arian a allai fynd at gefnogi gostyngiad yn y dreth gyngor i aelwydydd lle mae pensiynwyr ac at helpu cartrefi eraill sy'n ei chael yn anodd talu eu biliau treth gyngor, yn ogystal â helpu diogelu gwasanaethau rheng flaen.

Maes arall y mae taer angen ei adolygu yw pensiynau llywodraeth leol. Ledled Cymru, mae pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor ym mand D yn gweld £273 o'u bil blynyddol yn mynd i'r

pensions black hole facing local government. That is unsustainable. We believe that that needs to be tackled. Obviously, there needs to be discussion about that, but we are not hearing the Assembly Government saying anything about it at all at present. That bill excludes contributions made by council tax payers to the pensions of teachers, police officers and firefighters. Those index-linked, gold-plated pensions enjoyed by some of the senior council staff—many of whom are on salaries of more than £100,000 per year and some of whom are paid more than the First Minister—are no longer affordable.

twll du enfawr sy'n wynebu llywodraeth leol o safbwynt pensiynau. Nid yw hynny'n gynaliadwy. Credwn fod angen mynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn amlwg, mae angen trafod hynny, ond nid ydym yn clywed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dweud dim amdano ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'r bil hwnnw'n cynnwys cyfraniadau a wneir gan bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor i bensiynau athrawon, swyddogion heddlu a diffoddwyr tân. Nid yw'r pensiynau bras, mynegrifol hynny y mae rhai o uwchswyddogion y cynghorau'n eu cael—lawer ohonynt yn cael cyflog o fwy na £100,000 y flwyddyn a rhai ohonynt yn cael mwy o gyflog na'r Prif Weinidog—yn fforddiadwy mwyach.

4.20 p.m.

There are a number of other measures that, with better support from the Assembly Government, could be taken effectively at a more local level. We need to improve council tax collection rates, for example. Your own figures, Minister, suggest that local councils are owed more than £78 million in unpaid council tax and that around 4 per cent of the total council tax levied in 2008-09 has not been collected. That is not good enough. Low settlements and high council taxes have become the hallmark, unfortunately, of this Labour/Plaid administration, just as they were of the Labour administration previously.

Mae nifer o gamau eraill y gellid eu cymryd yn effeithiol ar lefel fwy lleol, o gael cefnogaeth well gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae angen inni wella cyfraddau casglu'r dreth gyngor, er enghraifft. Mae eich ffigurau chi eich hun, Weinidog, yn awgrymu bod dros £78 miliwn yn ddyledus i gynghorau lleol mewn treth gyngor heb ei thalu, a bod tua 4 y cant o'r dreth gyngor a godwyd yn 2008-09 heb ei chasglu. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Yn anffodus, mae setliadau isel a threth gyngor uchel wedi dod yn nodwedd o'r weinyddiaeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru hon, yn union fel yr oeddent yn nodwedd o'r weinyddiaeth Lafur gynt.

The second part of our motion is about business rates and the crippling increases that some businesses face as a result of the recent business rate revaluation exercise. In one way, the business rate situation is a similar story to that of council tax—rates are going up while realistic support from Government for business is going down, with cuts in the budget for the economic development department. What is more, those hardest hit will probably be businesses in the rural communities that already face huge challenges, as they have done over many years under Labour rule. The tourism industry is facing a significant whammy as well. Rural Wales will suffer above-inflation rises in business rates that will exacerbate the loss of local services such as post offices, village shops, and schools.

Mae ail ran ein cynnig yn ymwneud ag ardrethi busnes a'r cynnydd niweidiol sy'n wynebu rhai busnesau o ganlyniad i'r ymarfer ailbrizio ardrethi busnes yn diweddar. Mewn ffordd, mae'r sefyllfa o ran ardrethi busnes yn debyg i'r sefyllfa o ran y dreth gyngor—mae ardrethi'n codi a chefnogaeth realistig gan y Llywodraeth i fusnesau yn gostwng, gyda thoriadau yn y gyllideb ar gyfer yr adran datblygu economaidd. Yn ogystal, mae'n debyg mai'r busnesau yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf fydd y rheini mewn cymunedau gwledig sydd eisoes yn wynebu heriau sylweddol, ac sydd wedi wynebu heriau sylweddol ers blynnyddoedd o dan lywodraeth Lafur. Mae'r diwydiant twristiaeth yn wynebu ergyd sylweddol hefyd. Bydd Cymru wledig yn dioddef codiadau uwch na chwyddiant mewn ardrethi busnes, a fydd yn gwaethygu'r broblem o



golli gwasanaethau lleol megis swyddfeydd post, siopau pentref, ac ysgolion.

Tourism-related businesses, including piers, amusement arcades, heritage railways, caravan sites, holiday homes, hotels, and tourist attractions all face big rates rises from April 2010. For an area such as north Wales, where I come from, Minister, that will be absolutely devastating to the tourism industry, which is already lagging behind that in other parts of the United Kingdom, as we discussed in this Chamber just a few weeks ago. That is not to mention the problems that the rate rises will cause for petrol stations, which are difficult to come across, frankly, in some parts of rural Wales.

Mae busnesau sy'n gysylltiedig â thwristiaeth, gan gynnwys pierau, arcedau difyrwch, rheilffyrdd treftadaeth, safleoedd carafannau, cartrefi gwyliau, gwestai ac atyniadau i dwristiaid i gyd yn wynebu codiad sylweddol mewn ardrethi busnes o fis Ebrill 2010. I ardal fel y gogledd, yr ardal yr wyf fi'n dod ohoni, Weinidog, bydd hynny'n gwbl ddiistriol i'r diwydiant twristiaeth, sydd eisoes yn llusgo ar ôl y diwydiant twristiaeth mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, fel y trafodwyd yn y Siambr ychydig wythnosau'n unig yn ôl. Mae hynny heb sôn am y problemau y bydd y cynnydd mewn ardrethi yn eu hachosi i orsafoedd petrol sydd, a siarad yn blaen, yn bethau digon prin mewn rhai ardaloedd o Gymru wledig.

Like many Members, I represent a constituency that includes a large rural area, and we rely on tourism as a primary economic generator. It is the bread and butter of our economy, as it is in some parts of west Wales. Not only will local businesses face the difficulties of trying to tackle the economic recession this year, additionally, they will find that, in extreme cases, their rates will increase 100 per cent. That is a big worry for many businesses, and the Government needs to do more to assist them. That is why we have been calling for the revaluation exercise to be postponed. To do so would not cost any money, because the situation is supposed to be cost-neutral in terms of the rates that will be collected. We need you to postpone that exercise, just as is being done in Northern Ireland. It will not cost you a bean, and that is one practical thing that you can do to help. You are showing a lack of urgency, however, that we find astonishing, and we want you to stand up in this Chamber to tell us what you will do to help these businesses that face huge rate rises.

Fel nifer o Aelodau, yr wyf yn cynrychioli etholaeth sy'n cynnwys ardal wledig fawr, ac yr ydym yn dibynnu ar dwristiaeth fel prif symbylydd economaidd. Dyna yw bara ymenyn ein heconomi, fel mewn rhai ardaloedd o'r gorllewin. Nid yn unig bydd busnesau lleol yn wynebu'r anawsterau o geisio mynd i'r afael â'r dirwasgiad economaidd eleni, ond yn ogystal, byddant yn cael gwybod, mewn achosion eithafol, y bydd eu hardrethi'n cynyddu 100 y cant. Mae hynny'n ofid mawr i lawer o fusnesau, ac mae angen i'r Llywodraeth wneud mwy i'w helpu. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod yn galw am ohirio'r ymarfer ailbriso. Ni fyddai gwneud hynny'n costio dim, oherwydd mae'r sefyllfa i fod yn niwtral o ran cost yn nhermau'r ardrethi a gesglir. Mae angen ichi ohirio'r ymarfer hwnnw, fel y gwneir yng Ngogledd Iwerddon. Ni fydd yn costio'r un geiniog ichi, ac mae hynny'n un peth ymarferol y gallwch ei wneud i helpu. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn dangos difrawder sy'n ein syfrdanu, ac yr ydym am ichi sefyll yn y Siambr hon a dweud wrthym beth y byddwch yn ei wneud i helpu'r busnesau hyn sy'n wynebu cynnydd anferth yn eu hardrethi.

We also want you to extend rate relief, of course, which we have been talking about and talking up for a long time now. It is one of the best tools at your disposal, and you should be using it much more. We propose rate relief of 100 per cent for all businesses

Wrth reswm, yr ydym hefyd am ichi ymestyn y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi yr ydym wedi bod yn siarad amdano ac yn ei frolio ers tro bellach. Mae'n un o'r arfau gorau sydd gennych, a dylech fod yn ei ddefnyddio'n amlach o lawer. Yr ydym yn cynnig rhoi

with a rateable value of up to £10,000, and 20 per cent rate relief for businesses with a rateable value of between £10,000 and £15,000. Minister, if you give us a response today, tell us what you are going to do to support those businesses. They are the backbone of the Welsh economy and they represent the way out of recession. We have to support them if we are ever going to get off our knees. I look forward to your response.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt. Delete all and replace with:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. notes that the resources made available to local authorities by the Welsh Assembly Government has enabled Wales to have lower council tax levels than the rest of the UK;*

*2. notes that over 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will have a reduction in their rates bills as a result of the revaluation and in addition the majority of businesses in Wales will receive rates relief.*

In 2010-11, local government will receive over £4 billion through the settlement to fund key services. That represents a 2.1 per cent, or £81 million increase on what authorities received last year, taking into account transfers. The additional resources demonstrate our commitment to support local government through the challenging economic times and the tough fiscal environment in which they find themselves. It also secures a minimum of 1 per cent for all authorities so that every authority can be assured of an increase in resources next year. That is far higher than the 1.3 per cent increase that would have resulted if the £216 million efficiency savings that the Assembly Government has had to find as a consequence of block grant funding had been applied to local government on a pro rata basis.

Interestingly, as a Manchester lad now living in Wales—we welcome you—Darren Millar wants to compare England with Wales. Council tax levels are set by local authorities,

rhyddhad ardrethi o 100 y cant i bob busnes sydd â gwerth ardrethol hyd at £10,000 a rhyddhad ardrethi o 20 y cant i fusnesau sydd â gwerth ardrethol rhwng £10,000 a £15,000. Weinidog, os rhowch ateb inni heddiw, dywedwch wrthym beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i gefnogi'r busnesau hynny. Hwyl yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru a hwy fydd ein ffordd allan o'r dirwasgiad. Rhaid inni eu cefnogi os ydym am godi ar ein traed byth. Edrychaf ymlaen at eich ymateb.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Cynigiaf welliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt. Dileu popeth a rhoi yn ei le:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn nodi bod yr adnoddau a ddarparwyd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi golygu bod lefelau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn is nag yng ngweddill y DU;*

*2. yn nodi y bydd dros 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru yn gweld gostyngiad yn eu biliau ardrethi o ganlyniad i'r ailbrisio ac y bydd y mwyafrif o fusnesau yng Nghymru hefyd yn derbyn rhyddhad ardrethi.*

Yn 2010-11 bydd llywodraeth leol yn cael dros £4 biliwn drwy'r setliad i ariannu gwasanaethau allweddol. Mae hynny'n 2.1 y cant, neu'n £81 miliwn yn fwy na'r hyn a gafodd awdurdodau y llynedd, o ystyried trosglwyddiadau. Mae'r adnoddau ychwanegol yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i gefnogi llywodraeth leol drwy'r cyfnod economaidd heriol a'r amgylchedd ariannol anodd y maent ynnddo. Mae hefyd yn sicrhau isafswm o 1 y cant i bob awdurdod fel y gall pob awdurdod fod yn siŵr o gael cynnydd yn eu hadnoddau'r flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hynny'n uwch o lawer na'r cynnydd o 1.3 y cant a fyddai wedi digwydd pe bai'r £216 miliwn o arbedion effeithlonrwydd yr oedd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddod o hyd iddynt am fod cyllid grant bloc wedi ei gymhwyso i lywodraeth leol ar sail pro rata.

Yn ddiddorol, ag yntau'n llanc o Fanceinion sydd bellach yn byw yng Nghymru—fe'ch croesawn—mae Darren Millar am gymharu Lloegr â Chymru. Caiff lefelau'r dreth

as you well understand, Darren, and council tax levels in Wales this year remain the lowest in Britain. Average band D council tax in Wales is £1,086. In England it is £1,414 and in Scotland it is £1,149. That has not happened by chance, Darren—it has happened because the Welsh Assembly Government has provided sufficient funds to enable local authorities to keep council tax levels lower.

**Darren Millar:** The fact is that the rate of increase in Wales is more than twice the rate of increase in England in the next financial year. Do you accept that? If you find that acceptable, for how long will you allow that rate of increase to continue?

**Carl Sargeant:** Darren, you do not understand. Average band D council tax in Wales is £1,086, and it is £1,414 in England. That is a difference of nearly £400 between England and Wales. It is not a percentage—those are the actual figures. The final figures for council tax in Wales for 2010-11 are not yet available, Darren, but, even in these challenging financial times, the indications are that a number of local authorities will increase council tax by less than the rate of inflation. Those are the facts and there are clearly inaccuracies in point 1 of the motion.

Local authorities are responsible for setting council tax, as I said, and they are responsible to their local electorate for their levels of council tax and the standards of service that they provide. The Assembly Government recognises the importance of adequately financing local authorities, and the relatively generous settlement grant demonstrates this.

However, resources are finite and local authorities, like the Assembly Government and the rest of the public sector, must seek to use their resources effectively and efficiently, and to continually review their methods of working and the use of their resources to obtain the best value for money.

Most businesses in Wales have benefited

gyngor eu gosod gan awdurdodau lleol, fel y deallwch yn iawn, Darren, ac mae lefelau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru eleni yn dal yr isaf ym Mhrydain. Ar gyfartaledd mae'r dreth gyngor ar eiddo band D yng Nghymru yn £1,086. Yn Lloegr, mae'n £1,414 ac yn yr Alban mae'n £1,149. Nid ar hap y digwyddodd hynny, Darren—digwyddodd oherwydd bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi sicrhau digon o gyllid i alluogi awdurdodau lleol i gadw lefelau treth gyngor yn is.

**Darren Millar:** Y gwir yw fod cyfradd y cynnydd yng Nghymru yn fwy na dwywaith cyfradd y cynnydd yn Lloegr yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf. A ydych yn derbyn hynny? Os credwch fod hynny'n dderbyniol, am ba hyd y byddwch yn caniatáu i'r cynnydd barhau ar y gyfradd honno?

**Carl Sargeant:** Darren, nid ydych yn deall. Ar gyfartaledd mae'r dreth gyngor ar eiddo band D yng Nghymru yn £1,086 ac yn £1,414 yn Lloegr. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth o bron i £400 rhwng Lloegr a Chymru. Nid canran ydyw—dyna'r union ffigurau. Nid yw'r ffigurau terfynol ar gyfer y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru ar gyfer 2010-11 ar gael eto, Darren, ond hyd yn oed yn yr amserau heriol hyn o safbwynt ariannol, yr arwydd yw y bydd nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn cynyddu'r dreth gyngor ar gyfradd sy'n llai na chwyddiant. Dyna'r ffeithiau, ac mae'n amlwg fod gwallau ym mhwynt 1 yn y cynnig.

Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am bennu treth gyngor, fel y dywedais, ac maent yn atebol i'w hetholwyr lleol am lefel y dreth gyngor a safonau'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ganddynt. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd ariannu awdurdodau lleol yn ddigonol, ac mae'r grant setliad cymharol hael yn dangos hynny.

Fodd bynnag, mae pen draw ar yr adnoddau sydd ar gael, a rhaid i awdurdodau lleol, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a gweddill y sector cyhoeddus, geisio defnyddio'u hadnoddau'n effeithiol ac yn effeithlon, ac adolygu'n barhaus eu dulliau o weithio a'u ffordd o ddefnyddio adnoddau er mwyn cael y gwerth gorau am yr arian.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o fusnesau yng Nghymru

from revaluation. Only the Tories could make political capital out of a situation where 60 per cent of businesses in Wales are winners, because over 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will pay less on 1 April 2010 as a consequence of revaluation and the raising of the threshold for the small business rate relief scheme. Over half of businesses in Wales—over 50,000 businesses—fall within relief thresholds that could entitle them to a 50 per cent or 25 per cent reduction in rates.

While most businesses will pay less, I accept that some will see their rates rise. These tend to be businesses that have performed relatively better since the last revaluation, and consequently may see a rise in their rates bill. I am aware that in the tourism sector, rateable values for the self-catering sector have risen by 55 per cent, which is significantly more than average. However, that must be seen in a realistic context. Even after revaluation, their overall rateable values remain comparatively low. Around 85 per cent of those businesses will pay rates of under £10 per week. The majority of self-catering premises fall within a threshold that qualifies them for 50 per cent relief, and over 96 per cent fall within a threshold that could qualify them for 50 per cent or 25 per cent relief.

Small guesthouses have benefited from the revaluation. Their average rates bill will fall as a consequence of the revaluation, and over 93 per cent will also qualify for 25 per cent or 50 per cent rate relief.

I am aware that the rates of some clusters of business in the tourism sector have increased by significantly more than average. However, in general, that simply reflects the rental value of the properties, some of which are significant. For example, a property of which I am aware in mid Wales will have a rateable value of around £5,100 after revaluation. However, after the application of 25 per cent rate relief, the owner of the property will pay rates of around £30 per week. The website of the property shows that it is booked for a significant part of the year, and the advertised

wedi elwa o'r ymarfer ailbrisió. Dim ond y Toriaid a allai geisio sicrhau mantais wleidyddol iddynt eu hunain o sefyllfa lle mae 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru ar eu hennill, oherwydd bydd dros 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru'n talu llai ar 1 Ebrill 2010 o ganlyniad i'r ymarfer ailbrisió a chodi trothwy'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach. Mae dros hanner y busnesau yng Nghymru—dros 50,000 o fusnesau—yn dod dan drothwyon rhyddhad a allai olygu eu bod yn gymwys i gael gostyngiad o 50 y cant neu 25 y cant yn eu hardrethi.

Er y bydd y rhan fwyaf o fusnesau'n talu llai, derbyniaf y bydd rhai'n gweld eu hardrethi'n cynyddu. Mae'r rhain yn tueddu i fod yn fusnesau sydd wedi perfformio'n gymharol well ers yr ymarfer ailbrisió diwethaf, ac felly gallant weld cynnydd yn eu bil ardrethi. Gwn fod gwerthoedd ardrethol ar gyfer y sector hunanddarpar yn y sector twristiaeth wedi cynyddu 55 y cant, sy'n fwy o lawer na'r cyfartaledd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ystyried hyn mewn cyd-destun realistig. Hyd yn oed ar ôl yr ymarfer ailbrisió, mae eu gwerthoedd ardrethol cyffredinol yn dal yn gymharol isel. Bydd tua 85 y cant o'r busnesau hynny'n talu ardrethi o lai na £10 yr wythnos. Daw'r rhan fwyaf o eiddo hunanddarpar dan drothwy sy'n eu gwneud yn gymwys i gael rhyddhad o 50 y cant, a daw 96 y cant dan drothwy a allai eu gwneud yn gymwys i gael rhyddhad o 50 y cant neu 25 y cant.

Mae gwestai bach wedi elwa o'r ymarfer ailbrisió. Bydd eu bil ardrethi ar gyfartaledd yn gostwng o ganlyniad i'r ymarfer ailbrisió, a bydd dros 93 y cant hefyd yn gymwys i gael rhyddhad ardrethi o 25 y cant neu 50 y cant.

Gwn fod ardrethi rhai clystyrau o fusnesau yn y sector twristiaeth wedi cynyddu'n fwy o lawer na'r cyfartaledd. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol mae hynny'n adlewyrchu gwerth rhent yr eiddo, ac mae rhai ohonynt yn sylweddol. Er enghraifft, bydd gan eiddo y gwn i amdano yn y canolbarth werth ardrethol o tua £5,100 ar ôl yr ymarfer ailbrisió. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl tynnu 25 y cant ar gyfer rhyddhad ardrethi, bydd perchennog yr eiddo yn talu ardrethi o ryw £30 yr wythnos. Mae gwefan yr eiddo'n dangos ei fod yn llawn am ran sylweddol o'r flwyddyn,

letting price is between £800 and £1,900 a week.

The increase in the thresholds for the small business rate relief scheme means that businesses that fell within the relief thresholds before revaluation will continue to do so. If their valuation has increased in line with, and in some cases by significantly more, than the national average, they will continue to remain eligible for relief.

4.30 p.m.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Your time is up.

**Carl Sargeant:** I do not think that my time is up yet. What exactly are the Tories proposing today? First of all, they are calling for a transition scheme based on the English model. That scheme is self-financing and would take away money from the businesses that have suffered the most during the recession to cap increases for businesses that have been more successful. It is typical of Tory values to propose this: increasing the tax on the poor to reduce the tax on the rich.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Can you wind up, please, Minister?

**Carl Sargeant:** The effect of that would be to take around £120 million from businesses that have decreased in order to cap those that have increased. Presumably, the Tories want us to spend more money on reducing business rates but this is yet another Tory spending commitment that they have no idea how they will pay for.

**Jenny Randerson:** I move amendment 2 in the name of Peter Black. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that the business rate revaluation has had an adverse effect on small businesses in particular.*

In the customary manner, I want to thank the

a'r pris a hysbysebwr ar gyfer rhentu'r eiddo yw rhwng £800 a £1,900 yr wythnos.

Mae'r cynnydd yn y trothwyon ar gyfer y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach yn golygu y bydd busnesau a oedd dan y trothwyon rhyddhad ardrethi cyn yr ymarfer ailbriso yn parhau felly. Os bydd eu prisiad wedi cynyddu yn unol â'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol, ac mewn rhai achosion yn sylweddol uwch na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol, byddant yn dal yn gymwys i gael rhyddhad ardrethi.

**Andrew R.T. Davies:** Mae eich amser ar ben.

**Carl Sargeant:** Ni chredaf fod fy amser ar ben eto. Beth yn union y mae'r Torïaid yn ei gynnig heddiw? Yn gyntaf, maent yn galw am gynllun trosiannol yn seiliedig ar fodel Lloegr. Mae'r cynllun hwnnw'n hunangyllidol a byddai'n cymryd arian oddi ar y busnesau sydd wedi dioddef fwyaf yn ystod y dirwasgiad er mwyn gallu gosod terfyn uchaf ar y cynnydd i fusnesau sydd wedi bod yn fwy llwyddiannus. Mae'n nodweddiadol o werthoedd y Torïaid i gynnig hyn: cynyddu'r dreth ar y tlawd er mwyn lleihau'r dreth ar y cyfoethog.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Trefn. A wnewch chi dynnu at y terfyn os gwelwch yn dda, Weinidog?

**Carl Sargeant:** Effaith hynny fyddai cymryd tua £120 miliwn oddi ar fusnesau sydd wedi lleihau er mwyn rhoi terfyn uchaf ar y rhai sydd wedi cynyddu. Yr wyf yn cymryd bod y Torïaid am inni wario mwy o arian ar leihau ardrethi busnes ond mae hwn yn ymrwymiad gwario arall gan y Torïaid nad oes ganddynt syniad sut y byddant yn talu amdano.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Peter Black. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi bod y broses ailbriso ardrethi busnes wedi cael effaith andwyol ar fusnesau bach yn benodol.*

Yn unol â'r arfer, hoffwn ddiolch i'r grŵp

Conservative group for bringing forward this motion. I like talking about the council tax, because, after all, the Conservatives introduced it, and they did so to cover the problems caused by the poll tax. One of the interesting things is that my constituents still call it 'the poll tax', and they know exactly who introduced the poll tax. You can talk about 30 per cent discounts all that you want; you will not be able to defray the political damage that the council tax does to you, as a party, every single year.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats, as you all well know, are strongly opposed to the council tax. We believe that a much fairer system would be based on the ability to pay, as opposed to the size of the house or the fashionable status of the road in which you happen to live. You may offer a 30 per cent discount as an attempt to persuade pensioners that you are not all that bad, but it is the pensioners who are suffering most harshly from council tax and the problems that it brings. Pensioners ask me, 'Why should I sell my home just because the council tax has risen on it? I don't want to move from my home. Why should I sell my home, because I happen to live in a road where property values have become much higher?'

I would also tell the Conservatives to look at the record on the ground. Despite the fact that the Welsh Liberal Democrats do not approve of council tax, we are extremely good at managing it. In the Welsh Liberal Democrat-run councils throughout Wales, we have managed, over the last four years, to deliver increases that are well below the average increase for Wales. Councils under which political control, fellow Assembly Members, produce the highest increases in council tax in Wales? It is those that are under the Conservatives, where it is more expensive to live—

**Darren Millar and Gareth Jones** *rose*—

**Jenny Randerson:** I happily give way to Gareth Jones.

Ceidwadol am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Yr wyf yn hoffi siarad am y dreth gyngor, oherwydd wedi'r cyfan y Ceidwadwyr a'i cyflwynodd, a gwnaethant hynny i guddio'r problemau a achoswyd gan dreth y pen. Un o'r pethau diddorol yw bod fy etholwyr yn dal i'w galw'n 'dreth y pen', a gwyddant yn union pwy a gyflwynodd dreth y pen. Gallwch siarad faint a fynnoch am ostyngiadau o 30 y cant, ond ni allwch wneud iawn am y niwed gwleidyddol y mae'r dreth gyngor yn ei wneud i chi, fel plaid, bob blwyddyn.

Fel y gwyddoch i gyd yn iawn, mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r dreth gyngor yn chwyrn. Credwn y byddai system yn seiliedig ar y gallu i dalu, yn hytrach na maint y tŷ neu statws ffasiynol yr heol yr ydych yn digwydd byw ynddi, yn decach o lawer. Gallwch gynnig gostyngiad o 30 y cant fel ymgais i ddwyn perswâd ar bensiynwyr nad ydych yn ddrwg i gyd, ond pensiynwyr sy'n ddioddef fwyaf oherwydd y dreth gyngor a'r problemau a ddaw yn ei sgil. Bydd pensiynwyr yn gofyn imi, 'Pam ddylwn i werthu fy nghartref dim ond oherwydd bod y dreth gyngor arno wedi codi? Nid wyf am symud o'm cartref. Pam ddylwn i werthu fy nghartref, oherwydd fy mod i'n digwydd byw ar heol lle mae gwerth eiddo wedi codi'n fawr?'

Byddwn hefyd yn dweud wrth y Ceidwadwyr am edrych ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad. Er gwaetha'r ffaith nad yw Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cymeradwyo'r dreth gyngor, yr ydym yn eithriadol o dda yn ei rheoli. Yn y cynghorau a reolir gan Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru ledled Cymru, yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gadw'r cynnydd ymhell islaw'r cynnydd cyfartalog i Gymru. Cynghorau o dan reolaeth pa blaid wleidyddol sy'n cyflwyno'r cynnydd uchaf yn y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, gyd-Aelodau? Y rheini a reolir gan y Ceidwadwyr, lle mae'n ddrutach byw—

**Darren Millar a Gareth Jones** *a gododd*—

**Jenny Randerson:** Ildiaf i Gareth Jones gyda phleser.

**Gareth Jones:** Thank you for taking my intervention. While we are reminding ourselves of these important issues, can you also remind us that, when we refer to business rates, that the tax was introduced by the Conservatives back in 1990?

**Jenny Randerson:** I was going to turn to business rates, Gareth. I am only getting going on this issue. If you live in Conservative-controlled Monmouth, you pay £20 a year more for the privilege than if you live in Welsh Liberal Democrat-controlled Newport, Cardiff or Swansea.

**Nick Ramsay** *rose*—

**Jenny Randerson:** No, I will not give way again, because the Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer will not give me any extra time at the end.

The Welsh Liberal Democrat-controlled councils have consistently, for the last four years, delivered the lowest increases in council tax. It is not just that we do not agree with them, but when we are in charge of a council, we can deliver efficiently.

I want to move on to business rates, which Gareth has happily reminded us were also introduced by the Conservatives. As I see it, despite the Minister's efforts to deal with them, the major problem is that the proportion of the turnover or the takings of the small and medium-sized enterprises that is taken in business rates is still much higher than the proportion that comes from large businesses.

That has become an acute problem on our high streets. I want to draw your attention to the permeation of our high streets by Tesco, Sainsbury's and so on, which are opening small shops that compete with the small businesses, the privately run grocery shops and supermarkets, for example the Spar and Nisa shops. They are taking advantage of being part of a big business, with the cover of a large multimillion pound turnover, and are competing directly on our high streets with the small shops. That, Minister, despite your efforts with business rates, means that we continue to have a serious problem. I

**Gareth Jones:** Diolch am dderbyn fy myriad. A ninnau'n ein atgoffa'n hunain o'r materion pwysig hyn, a allwch ein hatgoffa hefyd, pan gyfeiriwn at ardrethi busnes, fod y dreth wedi'i chyflwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr yn ôl yn 1990?

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr oeddwn am droi at ardrethi busnes, Gareth. Megis dechrau ar y mater yr wyf. Os ydych yn byw yn Sir Fynwy, a reolir gan y Ceidwadwyr, yr ydych yn talu £20 yn fwy bob blwyddyn am y fraint honno na phobl sy'n byw yng Nghasnewydd, Caerdydd neu Abertawe, a reolir gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru.

**Nick Ramsay** *a gododd*—

**Jenny Randerson:** Na, ni wnaif ildio eto, oherwydd ni fydd y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro yn rhoi amser ychwanegol i mi ar y diwedd.

Mae cynghorau a reolir gan Ddemocratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru wedi cyflwyno'r cynnydd isaf yn y dreth gyngor yn gyson ers y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Nid ydym yn cytuno â'r dreth, ond pan fyddwn yn rheoli cyngor, gallwn gyflawni'n effeithlon.

Hoffwn symud ymlaen at ardrethi busnes, y mae Gareth wedi ein hatgoffa iddynt hefyd gael eu cyflwyno gan y Ceidwadwyr. Hyd y gwelaf i, er gwaethaf ymdrechion y Gweinidog i ymdrin â hwy, y broblem fwyaf yw bod cyfran y trosiant neu'r arian a gymerir gan fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint a delir mewn ardrethi busnes yn parhau'n llawer uwch na'r gyfran a ddaw o fusnesau mawr.

Mae hynny wedi dod yn broblem ddifrifol ar y stryd fawr. Hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at y modd y mae Tesco, Sainsbury's ac yn y blaen yn treiddio i'n stryd fawr, ac yn agor siopau bach sy'n cystadlu â busnesau bach, y siopau groser a'r archfarchnadoedd preifat, fel siopau Spar a Nisa. Maent yn manteisio o fod yn rhan o fusnes mawr, gyda throsiant o filiynau o bunnoedd yn gefn iddynt, ac yn cystadlu'n uniongyrchol â'n siopau bach ar y stryd fawr. Golyga hynny, Weinidog, er gwaethaf eich ymdrechion gydag ardrethi busnes, fod gennym broblem ddifrifol o hyd. Weinidog, argymhellaf ichi gadw'ch llygad

recommend, Minister, that you keep your eyes on Scotland and England, where there are still more generous schemes that aim to help to alleviate the impact of business rates on small businesses.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Thank you for the opportunity to speak on this special issue today. There can be no doubt that this is a hugely important issue; we are talking about a financial burden placed on many Welsh households and an economic strain placed on many businesses in Wales. This comes at a time when many families and business holders across the nation have been hit so badly by the recession. Mr Gordon Brown has said, over the past 24 hours, that we are not out of the woods yet.

Over the past decade, council tax has more than doubled under Labour. Council tax band D in 1997-98 was £495 in Wales, and now, in 2009-10, it is nearly £1,090, which is more than double. There can be no argument that this has placed notable strain on many Welsh households and I will focus on the impact that that has had on pensioners in Wales. The 2009 statistics show that we have more young people over the age of 65 in Wales than any other part of the United Kingdom. This large community of pensioners in Wales have been among the hardest hit by Labour's council tax hike since 1997 and many are being put under unnecessary pressure. I fully support the Conservative policy that will give all pensioners in the country a 30 per cent discount on council tax, which would amount to nearly £350 in council tax relief per household. That would help to make a real difference to their lives and, I am sure, would help them to live through periods of cold weather. Such a Conservative commitment is realistic and can be done by reducing the use of ring-fenced grants to local authorities.

**Janet Ryder:** Will you take an intervention?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Yes, I will in a minute. That could free up an estimated £60 million by cutting out the administration associated

ar yr Alban a Lloegr, lle mae cynlluniau mwy hael eto ar gael sy'n ceisio helpu lleddfu effaith ardrethi busnes ar fusnesau llai.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Diolch am y cyfle i siarad ar y mater arbennig hwn heddiw. Nid oes dwywaith nad yw'r mater yn un eithriadol o bwysig; yr ydym yn sôn am faich ariannol ar nifer o gartrefi yng Nghymru a straen economaidd ar nifer o fusnesau yng Nghymru. Daw hyn ar adeg pan fo nifer o deuluoedd a busnesau ledled y wlad wedi cael eu taro cynddrwg gan y dirwasgiad. Mae Mr Gordon Brown wedi dweud, yn ystod y 24 awr ddiwethaf, nad ydym ar dir diogel eto.

Yn ystod y degawd diwethaf mae'r dreth gyngor wedi mwy na dyblu dan y blaid Lafur. Yng Nghymru yr oedd treth gyngor band D yn £495 yn 1997-98, ac yn awr, yn 2009-10, mae bron yn £1,090, sy'n fwy na dwywaith. Ni ellir dadlau nad yw hyn wedi rhoi straen sylweddol ar nifer o gartrefi yng Nghymru, a byddaf yn canolbwyntio ar yr effaith y mae hynny wedi'i chael ar bensynwyr yng Nghymru. Dengys ystadegau 2009 fod gennym fwy o bobl dros 65 oed yng Nghymru nag mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r gymuned fawr hon o bensynwyr yng Nghymru wedi bod ymhlith y rhai yr effeithiwyd arnynt fwyaf gan gynnydd Llafur yn y dreth gyngor er 1997, ac mae llawer yn cael eu rhoi dan bwysau diangen. Yr wyf yn cefnogi polisi'r Ceidwadwyr yn llwyr. Bydd yn rhoi gostyngiad o 30 y cant yn y dreth gyngor i'r holl bensynwyr yn y wlad, a fyddai'n golygu rhyddhad o oddeutu £350 yn y dreth gyngor i bob cartref. Byddai hynny'n helpu gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'w bywyd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n eu helpu i fyw drwy gyfnodau o dywydd oer. Mae ymrwymiad o'r fath gan y Ceidwadwyr yn realistig a gellir ei gyflawni drwy roi llai o grantiau wedi'u neilltuo i awdurdodau lleol.

**Janet Ryder:** A wnewch chi dderbyn mymriad?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Gwnaf, yn y funud. Gallai hynny ryddhau tua £60 miliwn drwy ddileu'r gwaith gweinyddol sy'n gysylltiedig



with these grants.

**Janet Ryder:** One of those ring-fenced grants is to provide support for autistic children. Are you seriously suggesting that that grant gets cut?

**Mohammad Asghar:** The funds of most of the local authorities run by you are mismanaged. *[Interruption.]* I have more things to say that I want you to listen to.

I also want to place emphasis on the issue of business rates. Many businesses across South Wales East are struggling. If you ask Trish Law, she will tell you that she comes from the poorest part of the United Kingdom, which is Blaenau Gwent. There are abandoned premises all across Newport, and many businesses have closed down as the recession bites.

4.40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** The source for your statistic of administration costs of £65 million—

**Mohammad Asghar:** It was £60 million.

**Brian Gibbons:** The figure of £60 million for administration costs for special grants derives from your colleague beside you in his press release of probably 12 months ago. That particular press release was absolutely without foundation and a total misreading of the statistics.

**Mohammad Asghar:** It is information from the WLGA, as you should know, Doctor Gibbons. The Welsh Assembly Government should be doing all that it can not only to reassure businesses in this uncertain economic climate, but to foster the growth of new businesses. This is crucial as we look to tackle the problem of unemployment across Wales. Business rates are in the top three forms of expenditure for small businesses. There can be no doubt that, for many, they are a huge financial strain. We should be doing all we can to alleviate that pressure. More rate relief is affordable in Wales. It should be a business support measure and

â'r grantiau hyn.

**Janet Ryder:** Diben un o'r grantiau hynny a neilltuir yw rhoi cymorth i blant awtistig. A ydych yn wir yn awgrymu y dylid dileu'r grant hwnnw?

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae arian y rhan fwyaf o'r awdurdodau lleol a reolir gennych chi yn cael ei gamreoli. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae gennyf fwy o bethau i'w dweud yr hoffwn ichi wrando arnynt.

Yr wyf hefyd bwysleisio ardrethi busnes. Mae'n galed ar lawer o fusnesau ledled Dwyrain De Cymru. Os gofynnwch i Trish Law, gall ddweud wrthyhych ei bod yn dod o'r ardal dlotaf ym Mhrydain Fawr, sef Blaenau Gwent. Mae yno eiddo gwag ar draws Casnewydd, ac mae nifer o fusnesau wedi cau wrth i'r dirwasgiad frathu.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae ffynhonnell eich ystadegau o gostau gweinyddol gwerth £65 miliwn—

**Mohammad Asghar:** £60 miliwn oedd y ffigur.

**Brian Gibbons:** Daw'r ffigur o £60 miliwn ar gyfer costau gweinyddol grantiau arbennig oddi wrth eich cyd-Aelod sy'n eistedd wrth eich ochr yn ei ddatganiad i'r wasg tua 12 mis yn ôl. Yr oedd y datganiad hwnnw i'r wasg yn gwbl ddi-sail ac yn gamddarlleniad llwyr o'r ystadegau.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Mae'n wybodaeth a ddarparwyd gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, fel y dylech wybod, Doctor Gibbons. Dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn gwneud popeth o fewn ei gallu nid yn unig i dawelu ofnau busnesau yn yr hinsawdd economaidd ansicr hon, ond i feithrin busnesau newydd. Mae hyn yn hanfodol wrth inni geisio mynd i'r afael â phroblem diweithdra ledled Cymru. Mae ardrethi busnes ymhlith y tri pheth y mae busnesau bach yn gwario fwyaf arnynt. Nid oes dwywaith nad ydynt yn rhoi straen ariannol sylweddol ar nifer ohonynt. Dylem fod yn gwneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i leddfu'r

rate relief should be given the highest priority in the business support budget. As things stand, not all rate relief is automatic. Statistics that show how many businesses are taking up the rate relief available to them are currently unavailable. That is another issue that you should be looking into very seriously, Minister. We must do all that we can to fully publicise which businesses are eligible for such relief to ensure a fair deal. We must ensure that the system of business rate relief in Wales is accessible and competitive. I want to see a Wales where business has every opportunity to flourish. We must ensure that Wales as a business environment does not fall behind again in future. I hope that it will not.

**David Lloyd:** May I say what a pleasure it is to follow Mohammad Asghar in a debate? It is also a pleasure to restate Plaid's position on council tax and business rates. We do not like either. The big picture underpinning this debate is tight Government finances. We are all aware of the global financial meltdown and the £178 billion black hole, which, potentially, means Wales losing £2.8 billion over the next four years from the Assembly budget.

**Nick Bourne:** I am very grateful to Dai Lloyd for giving way on that point. I welcome what he just said; that is certainly the case. How does he square that with Plaid Cymru's commitment to spend £20 billion per annum on pensions?

**David Lloyd:** We shall come to that now because I am developing the debate. *[Laughter.]* I am always pleased that the leader of the opposition allows people to develop their arguments. So, we have a global financial meltdown. On top of the fact that we are losing all of this money to the financial crisis, the Holtham commission and other commissions last year revealed how Wales has been grossly short-changed for the past generation and will continue to be short-changed by £300 million a year.

**Brian Gibbons:** Gerry Holtham has done an excellent job. He has certainly highlighted

pwysau hynny. Mae mwy o ryddhad ardrethi yn fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Dylai fod yn fesur i gynorthwyo busnes, a dylid rhoi'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i ryddhad ardrethi yn y gyllideb cymorth busnes. Fel y mae pethau, nid yw'r holl ryddhad ardrethi yn awtomatig. Dengys ystadegau faint o fusnesau sy'n manteisio ar y rhyddhad ardrethi sydd ar gael iddynt ar hyn o bryd. Mae honno'n broblem arall y dylech fod yn ei hystyried o ddifrif, Weinidog. Rhaid inni wneud popeth o fewn ein gallu i gyhoeddi'n llawn pa fusnesau sy'n gymwys i gael rhyddhad o'r fath er mwyn sicrhau chwarae teg. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y system rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru yn hygyrch ac yn gystadleuol. Yr wyf am weld Cymru lle mae gan fusnesau bob cyfle i ffynnu. Rhaid inni sicrhau na fydd Cymru fel amgylchedd busnes ar ei hôl hi eto yn y dyfodol. Gobeithio na fydd.

**David Lloyd:** A gaf fi ddweud cymaint o bleser yw cael dilyn Mohammad Asghar mewn dadl? Mae hefyd yn bleser ailddatgan safbwynt Plaid Cymru ar y dreth gyngor ac ardrethi busnes. Nid ydym yn hoffi'r naill na'r llall. Y darlun mawr sy'n sail i'r ddadl hon yw cyllid tyn y Llywodraeth. Gwyddom i gyd am y chwalfa ariannol fyd-eang a'r twll du gwerth £178 biliwn, a allai olygu y bydd Cymru'n colli £2.8 biliwn o gyllideb y Cynulliad dros y pedair blynedd nesaf.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn i Dai Lloyd am ildio ar y pwnt hwnnw. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywedodd yn awr; dyna sut mae pethau, yn sicr. Sut mae'n cysoni hynny ag ymrwymiad Plaid Cymru i wario £20 biliwn y flwyddyn ar bensiynau?

**David Lloyd:** Deuwn at hynny'n awr oherwydd yr wyf yn datblygu'r ddadl. *[Chwerthin.]* Yr wyf bob amser yn falch bod arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn caniatáu i bobl ddatblygu eu dadleuon. Felly, mae gennym chwalfa ariannol fyd-eang. Yn ogystal â'r ffaith ein bod yn colli'r holl arian hwn i'r argyfwng ariannol, datgelodd comisiwn Holtham a chomisiynau eraill y llynedd fod Cymru wedi cael cam sylweddol dros y genhedlaeth ddiwethaf, ac y bydd yn parhau i gael cam o tua £300 miliwn y flwyddyn.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae Gerry Holtham wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol. Mae'n sicr wedi

the fact that we need to look at the Barnett formula going forward. I do not think that there is anything in the Holtham report to suggest that Wales has been short-changed in the past. Indeed, my reading of the report was that Barnett has served us quite well, thank you very much.

**David Lloyd:** The Holtham report says that we lose £300 million a year and that we will lose £8.5 billion between now and 2020. Do not forget the global big picture, which is that there are £43 billion of unpaid taxes that need to be claimed back by the UK Government. That will interest our Conservative colleagues opposite. How much of that belongs to various non-doms? Anyway, to cut to the chase with regard to council finances being very tight, at least our local authorities can raise their own taxes by means of the council tax, a power that is denied to the Assembly. At least councils have tax-raising powers. Obviously, council tax is inadequate. As we have heard from Jenny Randerson, it is a property-based tax and, as we have rehearsed well over the years, another Conservative idea that has been pronounced to be largely inadequate. Here we go again—

**Darren Millar:** Shall we talk about your ideas? The Plaid Cymru 2007 manifesto said that you would look to cut business rates by up to a half. However, this year, your own Deputy First Minister said he was not currently persuaded that extending rate relief was the best use of the limited resources in the Assembly Government. Where do you stand on this? What are your ideas? You do not appear to be presenting any alternatives here.

**David Lloyd:** If you stopped interrupting all the time you might get to hear something. The arguments as regards council tax have been well rehearsed. There are total inadequacies in that it is a property-based tax; revaluation and rebanding exposed ever more problems with it. Plaid Cymru policy remains to replace council tax with a local income tax; taxation based on the ability to pay. We feel that property-based taxes are unfair. That sort of rationale also underpins Plaid Cymru

tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod angen inni edrych ar fformiwla Barnett wrth symud ymlaen. Ni chredaf fod dim yn adroddiad Holtham i awgrymu bod Cymru wedi cael cam yn y gorffennol. Yn wir, yn ôl fy nealltwriaeth i o'r adroddiad, mae Barnett wedi bod yn eithaf da inni, diolch yn fawr iawn.

**David Lloyd:** Dywed adroddiad Holtham ein bod yn colli £300 miliwn y flwyddyn ac y byddwn yn colli £8.5 biliwn rhwng yn awr a 2020. Peidiwch ag anghofio am y darlun bydeang, sef bod £43 biliwn o drethi heb eu talu y mae angen i Lywodraeth y DU eu hawlio'n ôl. Bydd hynny o ddiddordeb i'n cyd-Aelodau Ceidwadol gyferbyn. Faint o hynny sy'n perthyn i amrywiol bobl nad ydynt yn talu trethi yn y wlad hon? Beth bynnag, i fynd at wraidd y mater o ran bod arian cynghorau yn dynn iawn, o leiaf gall ein hawdurdodau lleol godi eu trethi eu hunain drwy'r dreth gyngor, pŵer nad yw wedi ei roi i'r Cynulliad. O leiaf mae gan gynghorau bwerau i godi trethi. Yn amlwg, mae'r dreth gyngor yn annigonol. Fel y clywsom gan Jenny Randerson, treth sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo ydyw, ac fel y nodwyd droeon dros y blynyddoedd, dyma syniad arall gan y Ceidwadwyr sy'n amlwg yn gwbl annigonol. Dyma ni eto—

**Darren Millar:** Beth am siarad am eich syniadau chi? Dywedodd manifestio Plaid Cymru yn 2007 y byddech yn ceisio torri ardrethi busnes hyd at 50 y cant. Fodd bynnag, eleni dywedodd eich Dirprwy Brif Weinidog nad oedd wedi'i ddarbwyllo ar hyn o bryd mai ymestyn y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi oedd y ffordd orau i ddefnyddio adnoddau cyfyngedig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Beth yw eich barn ar hyn? Beth yw eich syniadau? Nid yw'n ymddangos eich bod yn cyflwyno dim syniadau amgen yma.

**David Lloyd:** Pe baech yn rhoi'r gorau i dorri ar draws drwy'r amser hwyrach y caech glywed rhywbeth. Mae'r dadleuon am y dreth gyngor wedi'u hailadrodd droeon. Mae yna ddiffygion llwyr yn yr ystyr ei bod yn dreth sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo; amlygodd yr ymarfer ailbriso ac ailfandio mwy o broblemau fyth â'r dreth. Polisi Plaid Cymru o hyd yw cyflwyno treth incwm leol yn lle'r dreth gyngor; sy'n seiliedig ar allu i dalu. Credwn fod trethi sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo yn annheg.

policy on business rates as they represent the same phenomenon; the present property-based system is unfair in much the same way as council tax is unfair. It takes no account of the ability of the business to pay tax. This has also been exposed now, through a rebanding project, if you like, with business rates, bringing that inequity to the fore as well. Business rates need to be remodelled and based on a company's profits and not on the size of the factory that it owns. Obviously, at present, we lack the powers to do anything about council tax and business rates. In the meantime, I am content to support the Government amendment.

**Nick Ramsay:** If I was confused earlier with the extra Plenary session, I am now beginning to think that I am still in a dream and that I will wake up in a minute. While I was listening to Jenny Randerson and Janet Ryder, I heard Jenny talking about the poll tax and I wondered how far back in history some parties here will go—we will be talking about the window tax next. Then we had Janet Ryder accusing the Welsh Conservatives of bringing in a universal benefit in terms of our assistance for pensioners. Okay, hands up, I admit that we are guilty.

In the last 10 years, council tax has doubled and that is what this debate is about. Carl Sargeant quoted figures on the rate of tax itself at the different levels at the moment. However, the key point, which he did not address, was that doubling of the tax and the fact that the rate has increased so much more in Wales than it has in England. If you follow that into the future, it will get far worse here, when we would like to have, as my party has made clear, a revision of the Barnett formula so that Wales gets more money and so that we can put more money into public services. I do not want to incur the temporary Deputy Presiding Officer's wrath by going on about council issues, so I will simply say that you cannot isolate this question of council tax from the revenue support grant. They are closely linked. You cannot have a council tax debate on the one hand, whether that be a local income tax or a property-based tax, and, on the other, take that apart from the revenue

Mae'r math hwnnw o resymeg yn sail i bolisi Plaid Cymru ar ardrethi busnes hefyd am eu bod yn cyflwyno'r un ffenomen; mae'r system bresennol sy'n seiliedig ar eiddo yn annheg fel y mae'r dreth gyngor yn annheg. Nid yw'n ystyried gallu'r busnes i dalu trethi o gwbl. Mae hynny hefyd wedi'i amlygu'n awr, drwy brosiect ailfandio, os hoffech, gydag ardrethi busnes, gan ddod â'r annhegwch hwnnw i'r amlwg hefyd. Mae angen ail-lunio ardrethi busnes a'u pennu ar sail elw cwmni, nid ar faint y ffatri y mae'n berchen arni. Yn amlwg, ar hyn o bryd nid oes gennym y pwerau i wneud dim ynghylch y dreth gyngor ac ardrethi busnes. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi gwelliant y Llywodraeth.

**Nick Ramsay:** Os oeddwn wedi drysu yn gynharach gyda'r Cyfarfod Llawn ychwanegol, yr wyf bellach yn dechrau credu fy mod mewn breuddwyd o hyd ac y byddaf yn deffro yn y funud. Wrth wrando ar Jenny Randerson a Janet Ryder, clywais Jenny yn siarad am dreth y pen a meddyliais tybed pa mor bell yn ôl mewn hanes yr aiff rhai pleidiau yma—byddwn yn siarad am y dreth ffenestri nesaf. Yna cawsom Janet Ryder yn cyhuddo'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig o gyflwyno budd-dal cyffredinol o ran rhoi cymorth i bensynwyr. Iawn, dwylo i fyny, yr wyf yn cyfaddef ein bod yn euog.

Yn ystod y 10 mlynedd diwethaf mae'r dreth gyngor wedi dyblu, a dyna yw testun y ddadl hon. Dyfynnodd Carl Sargeant ffigurau am gyfradd y dreth ei hun ar y gwahanol lefelau ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt allweddol nad oedd wedi mynd i'r afael ag ef oedd dyblu'r dreth a'r ffaith bod y gyfradd wedi cynyddu gymaint yn fwy yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Os dilynwch hynny i'r dyfodol, bydd yn mynd lawer yn waeth yma, ac, fel y mae fy mhlaid wedi ei nodi'n glir, hoffem gael adolygiad o fformiwla Barnett er mwyn i Gymru gael mwy o arian ac fel y gallwn roi mwy o arian i wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nid wyf am ddigio'r Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro drwy fynd ymlaen am faterion sy'n ymwneud â chynghorau, felly, y cyfan a ddywedaf yw na allwch wahanu'r cwestiwn am y dreth gyngor oddi wrth y grant cymorth refeniw. Maent wedi'u cysylltu'n agos. Ni allwch gael dadl am y dreth gyngor ar y naill law, boed hynny am

support grant.

**Janet Ryder:** One of the reasons why the autism grant is ring-fenced is because when it was going into the revenue support grant not having been ring-fenced, not one council was using it to provide autism services for children. Now that it is ring-fenced, we are seeing those services being developed. Your party is now talking about taking that ring fence away. Will you be getting rid of every ring-fenced grant, and, if not, which ring-fenced grants will you get rid of? Which other section in society will have to suffer?

**Nick Ramsay:** Which—I nearly said ‘withering’ then. Plaid Cymru is one of the key parties of the devolution process of 10 years ago. We believe in devolution, but we also believe in devolution to local authorities. Local authorities must be allowed to make those decisions. The problems that local authorities face at the moment is that they simply do not have enough basic money from here, so they are facing questions about their grants.

4.50 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** The logic behind Janet’s argument is that the budget would be ring-fenced for the services that we want to provide. If one local authority dares to take away the budget for supporting autistic or vulnerable people, or for tackling child poverty—whatever the essential area is—it would get everything that it deserves when the time comes for local authority elections; that is the nature of democracy. I remember Plaid Cymru standing on a platform that supported the further devolution of powers to local authorities, and debating that issue with Sue Essex, so there has certainly been a big turnaround.

**Nick Ramsay:** I agree with your comments, Alun. It is interesting that if one looks back at some of the things that Plaid Cymru has said, it looks as though we have entered a parallel universe. Back in 2007, Dafydd Wigley said

dreth incwm leol neu dreth sy’n seiliedig ar eiddo, ac, ar y llaw arall, ei chymryd ar wahân i’r grant cymorth refeniw.

**Janet Ryder:** Un o’r rhesymau dros neilltuo’r grant awtistiaeth yw hyn: pan oedd yn cael ei gynnwys yn y grant cymorth refeniw heb ei neilltuo, nid oedd yr un cyngor yn ei ddefnyddio i ddarparu gwasanaethau awtistiaeth i blant. Yn awr gan ei fod yn cael ei neilltuo, gwelwn y gwasanaethau hynny’n cael eu datblygu. Mae eich plaid bellach yn siarad am ddileu’r sicrwydd hwnnw. A fyddwch yn dileu pob grant sydd wedi’i neilltuo, ac os na fyddwch, pa grantiau wedi’u neilltuo y byddwch yn eu dileu? Pa ran arall o gymdeithas fydd yn gorfod dioddef?

**Nick Ramsay:** Pa—bu bron i mi ddweud ‘parablu’ am eiliad. Mae Plaid Cymru yn un o bleidiau allweddol y broses ddatganoli a gafwyd 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Credwn mewn datganoli, ond credwn hefyd mewn datganoli i awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid caniatáu i awdurdodau lleol wneud y penderfyniadau hynny. Y problemau sy’n wynebu awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd yw nad ydynt yn cael digon o arian sylfaenol o’r fan hon, felly, maent yn wynebu cwestiynau ynghylch eu grantiau.

**Alun Cairns:** Y rhesymeg y tu ôl i ddadl Janet yw y byddai’r gyllideb yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer y gwasanaethau yr ydym am eu darparu. Os bydd un awdurdod lleol yn meiddio dileu’r gyllideb ar gyfer rhoi cymorth i bobl awtistig neu bobl sy’n agored i niwed, neu i fynd i’r afael â thlodi plant—beth bynnag yw’r maes hanfodol—byddai’n cael popeth y mae’n ei haeddu pan ddaw’n adeg etholiadau’r awdurdod lleol; dyna natur democratiaeth. Cofiaf Plaid Cymru’n sefyll ar lwyfan a oedd yn cefnogi datganoli rhagor o bwerau i awdurdodau lleol, ac yn dadlau’r mater hwnnw gyda Sue Essex, felly, mae newid sylweddol yn sicr wedi bod.

**Nick Ramsay:** Cytunaf â’ch sylwadau, Alun. Mae’n ddiddorol, o edrych yn ôl ar rai o’r pethau y mae Plaid Cymru wedi’u dweud, ei bod yn ymddangos fel pe baem wedi camu i fydsawd cyfochrog. Yn ôl yn 2007,

that people may well ask how on earth they can pay for business rate cuts, as they cannot be afforded within WAG's budget. He might not have been here when he said that, but it is my understanding that he is still in your party.

This is a crucial debate. It is an issue that the Liberal Democrats and we, the Conservatives, come back to often because it affects the most vulnerable people in our society. There are people who, when the council tax bill hits their doormat, will be asking what is being done on their behalf. In some respects, assistance has been given that council tax payers like, but, in the overwhelming majority of cases, they are not getting the support that they deserve.

Jenny Randerson mentioned the high rate of increase in the council tax in my constituency of Monmouthshire. I hope that she will join me in calling on the Government to give the local authority in Monmouthshire a far greater share of the cake because it is currently bottom of the pile in terms of the funding that it receives.

**Angela Burns:** Minister, I have a couple of questions on business rates. However, before I start on those, I have to go back to the comments made by Janet Ryder, because there is an old saying that 'power corrupts, and absolute power corrupts absolutely'. My concern is that we fight to have devolution of powers—we want to be devolved from the United Kingdom—yet we do not want to pass on that devolution down the line. Suddenly, we seem to think that the devolved powers should be kept here, and that local authorities do not have the wherewithal or the capabilities to do what they need to in some of their areas. Some local authorities may make an absolute hash of their responsibilities—no doubt about it—but that is what democracy and devolution are about, and what the empowerment of people is about. We talk about that fact that people are totally disillusioned with politics, that they do not buy what any of us is saying much and that they do not think that politicians as a whole are doing a wonderful job. We have to re-engage the public, and surely the way to re-engage the ordinary person living out there

dywedodd Dafydd Wigley y gall pobl yn hawdd ofyn sut ar y ddaear y gallant dalu am doriadau mewn ardrethi busnes, gan na ellir eu fforddio o fewn cyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Efallai nad oedd yma pan ddywedodd hynny, ond yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae'n dal i fod yn eich plaid.

Mae hon yn ddadl hanfodol. Mae'n fater y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a ninnau, y Ceidwadwyr, yn dychwelyd ato'n aml oherwydd ei fod yn effeithio ar y bobl fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas. Mae yna bobl a fydd gofyn beth sy'n cael ei wneud ar eu rhan, pan ddaw bil y dreth gyngor drwy'r post. I ryw raddau, rhoddwyd cymorth y mae pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor yn ei hoffi, ond yn y mwyafrif llethol o achosion, nid ydynt yn cael y cymorth y maent yn ei haeddu.

Soniodd Jenny Randerson am y cynnydd mawr yn y dreth gyngor yn fy etholaeth i, sef Sir Fynwy. Gobeithio y bydd yn ymuno â mi i alw ar y Llywodraeth i roi cyfran lawer tecach o gyllid i'r awdurdod lleol yn Sir Fynwy, oherwydd ar hyn o bryd mae ar waelod y pentwr o ran y cyllid a gaiff.

**Angela Burns:** Weinidog, mae gennyf gwestiwn neu ddau am ardrethi busnes. Fodd bynnag, cyn imi ddechrau arnynt, rhaid imi dychwelyd at y sylwadau a wnaed gan Janet Ryder, oherwydd mae yna hen ddywediad sy'n dweud bod 'grym yn llygru, a grym llwyr a lwyr lygra'. Fy mhryder yw ein bod yn brwydro i ddatganoli pwerau—yr ydym am gael ein datganoli oddi wrth y Deyrnas Unedig—ond eto nid ydym am ddatganoli'r pwerau hynny ymhellach. Yn sydyn, ymddengys ein bod yn meddwl y dylid cadw'r pwerau wedi'u datganoli yma, ac nad oes gan awdurdodau lleol y modd na'r gallu i wneud yr hyn y mae angen iddynt ei wneud yn rhai o'u hardaloedd. Gall rhai awdurdodau lleol wneud annibendod llwyr o'u cyfrifoldebau—nid oes dwywaith am hynny—ond dyna yw hafod democratiaeth a datganoli, a dyna yw hanfod grymuso pobl. Siaradwn am y ffaith fod pobl wedi'u dadrithio'n llwyr â gwleidyddiaeth, nad ydynt yn credu dim y mae'r un ohonom yn ei ddweud ac nad ydynt yn credu bod gwleidyddion ar y cyfan yn gwneud gwaith gwych. Rhaid inni ailymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd,

is to tell them that they have a say through the various layers of government. I agree that we do not want to have endless layers of bureaucracy, but we have to be brave enough to give power away.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am grateful to you for giving way. As I often say, I do not dwell on the past. [*Laughter.*] However, I take on board what you say about devolving powers, so do you regret the actions of the Conservative Government during the 1980s and early 1990s when it cynically took away powers from local authorities and created the quango state, because it could not control matters through elected representatives? Do you resent that now?

**Angela Burns:** I have heard talk of 'New Labour', which I understood was a new beast that came out of old Labour; it was a sign that Labour was moving on, was moving with the times and moving with democracy. The Conservatives have done exactly the same, except that we have not been trying to pull the wool over people's eyes by running around saying that we are 'New Conservatives'; we are just the Conservatives, but we have had the maturity to move on with the debate as times have changed. I am running out of time, so I will ask the Minister about business rates.

I am glad that the Deputy First Minister is in the Chamber, because I believe that the responsibility for business rates needs to sit in his department. The reason for this belief is that within the business rate infrastructure we have a lever that we can use to help to stoke the economy. We are having all of these economic summits throughout Wales to look at ways of bringing us through this economic crisis, and they are to be welcomed. However, these are hard times, and we need the economy of Wales to be strong, to grow and to be well supported so that all of these businesses throughout Wales, irrespective of their size, know that we are behind them. We need to use them so that we can develop as a nation.

ac mae'n siŵr mai'r ffordd o ailymgysylltu â'r dyn cyffredin yw dweud wrtho fod ganddo lais yn amrywiol haenau llywodraeth. Cytunaf nad ydym am gael haenau diddiwedd o fiwrocratiaeth, ond rhaid inni fod yn ddigon dewr i ildio pŵer.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Fel y dywedaf yn aml, nid wyf yn un i aros yn y gorffennol. [*Chwerthin.*] Fodd bynnag, derbynaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am ddatganoli pwerau, felly a ydych yn edifar am weithredoedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au pan aeth ati'n sinigaidd i gymryd pwerau oddi ar awdurdodau lleol a chreu gwladwriaeth o gwangos, am na allai reoli materion drwy gynrychiolwyr etholedig? A yw hynny'n eich digio yn awr?

**Angela Burns:** Yr wyf wedi clywed sôn am 'Lafur Newydd', ac yr oeddwn ar ddeall mai creadur newydd ydoedd a ddaeth allan o'r hen Lafur; yr oedd yn arwydd bod y Blaid Lafur yn symud ymlaen, ei bod yn symud gyda'r oes ac yn symud gyda democratiaeth. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr wedi gwneud yr un peth yn union, ond nid ydym wedi bod yn ceisio taflu llwch i lygaid pobl drwy redeg o gwmpas yn dweud mai'r 'Ceidwadwyr Newydd' ydym; Ceidwadwyr ydym a dyna'i gyd, ond yr ydym wedi bod yn ddigon aeddfed i symud ymlaen gyda'r ddadl wrth i bethau newid. Yr wyf yn brin o amser, felly holaf y Gweinidog am ardrethi busnes.

Yr wyf yn falch bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn y Siambr, oherwydd credaf mai ei adran ef ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am ardrethi busnes. Credaf hynny am fod y seilwaith ardrethi busnes yn cynnig arf inni y gallwn ei ddefnyddio i helpu cynnal yr economi. Yr ydym yn cael yr holl uwchgynadleddau economaidd hyn ledled Cymru i edrych ar ffyrdd o'n harwain allan o'r argyfwng economaidd hwn, ac mae'r rheini i'w croesawu. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn byw mewn cyfnod anodd, ac mae angen inni sicrhau bod economi Cymru'n gryf, yn tyfu ac yn cael pob cymorth fel y bydd yr holl fusnesau hyn ledled Cymru, waeth beth fo'u maint, yn gwybod ein bod yn eu cefnogi. Mae angen inni eu defnyddio fel y gallwn ddatblygu fel gwlad.

Ninety-seven per cent of all businesses in Wales are SMEs. One of the most useful levers in helping to promote SMEs is business rates. My plea is not to do with the fact that 60 per cent are going to be better off—60 per cent may well be better off, and that is great. However, I am worried about the ones that have had an increase of more than 100 per cent; the ones that have had an increase of more than 200 per cent; the ones that have had an increase of more than 300 per cent; and I am worried about the poor guy who has a business in Tenby and who has had an increase of 430 per cent in his business rates this year. When you think that some of these businesses are relatively large SMEs, you are talking about many thousands of pounds. One of the businesses that has had an increase of more than 100 per cent has seen its rates go up from £11,000 a year to £26,000 a year. That is an enormous amount of extra money to find every single month: it is essentially one staff wage each month.

I accept that funds are tight and that you do not have limitless budget. What I do not accept, however, is the lack of information that would enable us to come forward with ideas to help resolve this situation. I have had many a debate here with the Deputy First Minister. One of the things that I have said to him from time to time is that if I could stand here and make a useful contribution and put forward some ideas, I would. Therefore, I wrote to his office and to the Members' research service to try to find out how many businesses in Wales have seen a business rate increase of more than 100 per cent. I know that these businesses are in pockets around Wales. I could not get the information. First, the Government came back and said it did not have the information. Then, MRS said that the information might exist but that it did not have access to the database and that we would have to get it from the Valuation Office. I went to the Valuation Office, which said that the Welsh Assembly Government had all of the information, cut, sliced, diced and packaged in every which way.

Mae 97 y cant o holl fusnesau Cymru yn fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Ardrethi busnes yw un o'r ffyrdd mwyaf defnyddiol i helpu hybu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Nid yw fy mhle yn ymwneud â'r ffaith y bydd 60 y cant yn well eu byd—mae'n bosibl iawn y bydd 60 y cant yn well eu byd, ac mae hynny'n wych. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn poeni am y rhai sydd wedi cael cynnydd o fwy na 100 y cant; y rhai sydd wedi cael cynnydd o fwy na 200 y cant; y rhai sydd wedi cael cynnydd o fwy na 300 y cant; ac yr wyf yn poeni am y truan sydd â busnes yn Ninbych-y-pysgod sydd wedi gweld cynnydd o 430 y cant yn ei ardrethi busnes eleni. Pan ystyriwch fod rhai o'r busnesau hyn yn fusnesau bach a chanolig cymharol fawr, yr ydych yn sôn am filoedd lawer o bunnoedd. Mae un o'r busnesau sydd wedi cael cynnydd o fwy na 100 y cant wedi gweld ei ardrethi'n codi o £11,000 y flwyddyn i £26,000 y flwyddyn. Mae hwnnw'n swm ychwanegol mawr iawn i ddod o hyd iddo bob mis: yn y hanfod mae'n gyfystyr â chyflog un aelod staff bob mis.

Derbyniad fod arian yn dynn ac nad oes gennych gyllideb ddiderfyn. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn nad wyf yn ei dderbyn yw'r diffyg gwybodaeth a fyddai'n ein galluogi i gyflwyno syniadau i helpu datrys y sefyllfa hon. Yr wyf wedi cynnal sawl dadl yma gyda'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Un o'r pethau yr wyf wedi'i ddweud wrtho o bryd i'w gilydd yw pe gallwn sefyll yma a gwneud cyfraniad defnyddiol a chynnig syniadau, byddwn yn gwneud hynny. Felly, ysgrifennais at ei swyddfa ac at wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau er mwyn ceisio cael gwybod faint o fusnesau yng Nghymru sydd wedi gweld cynnydd o fwy na 100 y cant yn eu hardrethi busnes. Gwn fod y busnesau hyn mewn pocedi o amgylch Cymru. Nid oedd modd imi gael y wybodaeth. Yn gyntaf, daeth y Llywodraeth yn ôl a dweud nad oedd y wybodaeth ganddi. Yna, dywedodd Gwasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau ei bod yn bosibl bod y wybodaeth yn bodoli ond nad oedd ganddo fynediad i'r gronfa ddata ac y byddai'n rhaid inni ofyn amdani gan y Swyddfa Brisio. Euthum at y Swyddfa Brisio, a ddywedodd fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cael y wybodaeth i gyd, a hynny ym mhob ffurf bosibl.



If I could have that information and could see how many of those businesses in the remaining 40 per cent—located in pockets like Aberaeron, Llandeilo and Narberth—have seen increases of more than 100 per cent, 200 per cent or 300 per cent in their business rates, I would make every effort to try to find a way of leveraging some help towards those businesses. The reason why I believe this should lie with the Department of Economy and Transport is that we have underutilised business support funds. Some of those funds could be used to help these businesses. I ask you, Minister, to come down to Narberth—I have written to ask you this, but you may not have seen the letter due to your absence—and I will walk you down a street where I can show you 20 shops that will have ‘for sale’ notices on them in April. That is a terrible situation for us to be in.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Local Government (Carl Sargeant):** I welcome the opportunity to respond to some of the points that have been raised today. Darren Millar started with the issue that the Conservatives are telling us that we should target funding in relation to taxes. Then, all of a sudden, the Conservatives argue the case for a universal policy on business rate relief. They want one thing one minute and another thing the next. That does not surprise me in the slightest. Oscar talked about council tax levels, which is a very important issue. You are absolutely right to raise it, Oscar; you will understand that Newport City Council sets the council tax for the Newport area, and Newport has a Conservative council.

I will refer to some other related points. The fact of the matter is that I do not believe that the Tories know what they want at all on business rates. As usual, they are on the wrong side of the argument. They complain about something that will benefit more than 60 per cent of businesses in Wales. It is clear that they do not understand the system or even the powers of the Assembly. They start by calling on us to delay the revaluation, which the Assembly does not have the powers to do. Then, they propose a transition scheme, which will take from the poor to give to the rich, or spend money on business

Pe gallwn gael y wybodaeth honno a gweld faint o'r busnesau hynny yn y 40 y cant sy'n weddill—mewn pocedi fel Aberaeron, Llandeilo ac Arberth—sydd wedi gweld cynnydd o fwy na 100 y cant, 200 y cant neu 300 y cant yn eu hardrethi busnes, fe wnawn bob ymdrech i geisio dod o hyd i ffordd i sicrhau bod y busnesau hynny'n cael rhywfaint o gymorth. Y rheswm pam y credaf y dylai hwn fod yn gyfrifoldeb i Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth yw nad ydym wedi defnyddio cronfeydd cymorth busnes i'r eithaf. Gellid defnyddio rhai o'r cronfeydd hynny i helpu'r busnesau hyn. Weinidog, gofynnaf ichi ddod i lawr i Arberth—yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch i ofyn ichi wneud hynny, ond hwyrach nad ydych wedi gweld y llythyr oherwydd eich absenoldeb—ac fe'ch arweiniaf i lawr stryd lle gallaf ddangos 20 o siopau ichi a fydd ag arwyddion 'ar werth' arnynt ym mis Ebrill. Mae honno'n sefyllfa ofnadwy inni fod ynddi.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol (Carl Sargeant):** Croesawaf y cyfle i ymateb i rai o'r pwyntiau a godwyd heddiw. Dechreuodd Darren Millar gyda mater y Ceidwadwyr yn dweud wrthym y dylem dargedu cyllid o ran trethi. Yna, yn sydyn, mae'r Ceidwadwyr yn dadlau o blaid polisi cyffredinol ar ryddhad ardrethi busnes. Maent am gael un peth un funud, a rhywbeth arall y funud nesaf. Nid yw hynny'n fy synnu o gwbl. Siaradodd Oscar am lefelau'r dreth gyngor, sy'n fater pwysig iawn. Yr ydych yn hollol iawn i'w godi, Oscar; byddwch yn deall mai Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd sy'n pennu'r dreth gyngor ar gyfer ardal Casnewydd, a Chyngor Ceidwadol sydd yng Nghasnewydd.

Cyfeiriaf at rai o'r pwyntiau cysylltiedig eraill. Y ffaith amdani yw nad wyf yn credu bod y Toriaid yn gwybod beth maent am ei gael o gwbl o ran ardrethi busnes. Fel arfer, maent ar ochr anghywir y ddadl. Maent yn cwyno am rywbeth a fydd o fudd i fwy na 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru. Mae'n glir nad ydynt yn deall y system na hyd yn oed pwerau'r Cynulliad. Maent yn dechrau drwy alw arnom i oedi'r ymarfer ailbrisiu, sy'n rhywbeth nad oes gan y Cynulliad y pwerau i'w wneud. Yna, maent yn cynnig cynllun trosiannol, a fydd yn cymryd oddi ar y tlawd ac yn rhoi i'r cyfoethog, neu wario arian ar

rates without giving any indication of where or whom it will come from. Even the FSB in Wales, which represents the views of small businesses, does not want a transitional scheme.

5.00 p.m.

**Darren Millar:** You keep talking about the rate relief that is already available for businesses in Wales, but how many of those businesses eligible for relief actually receive that relief? As I understand it, you do not even know the figures. How can you demonstrate that your relief packages are working, when all the economic indicators are telling you that they are not, and that things are getting worse in Wales compared with the rest of the United Kingdom?

**Carl Sargeant:** More than 60 per cent of businesses in Wales can apply for business rate relief. I know what you are thinking now, but I certainly do not want to take that support away from all those businesses in Wales. Unlike you, I think that it is a bad thing to do and it would go against the support that we are giving businesses.

Jenny Randerson raised council tax policies. The policy in Scotland is under review, so that is under consideration yet again. I have explained to you that there is a transitional rate relief scheme under the model in England, which the FSB does not want, but the Tories do. I would have thought that they would at least have distanced themselves from that.

I am not at all surprised about the Liberal Democrats' policies on tax. Recently, when the top-rate tax policy was put to Nick Clegg, he said that, after dropping it, it did not really do as much as they had initially thought, but that is a recurrent problem with the Liberal Democrats.

**Mohammad Asghar:** I am a regional Assembly Member for South Wales East, which covers Merthyr, Blaenau Gwent,

ardrethi busnes heb awgrymu o ble y daw'r arian hwnnw na chan bwy. Nid yw hyd yn oed y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng Nghymru, sy'n cynrychioli barn busnesau bach, am gael cynllun trosiannol.

**Darren Millar:** Yr ydych yn siarad o hyd am y rhyddhad ardrethi sydd ar gael eisoes i fusnesau yng Nghymru, ond faint o'r busnesau hynny sy'n gymwys i gael rhyddhad ardrethi sy'n cael y rhyddhad hwnnw mewn gwirionedd? Yn ôl a ddeallaf, nid ydych hyd yn oed yn gwybod beth yw'r ffigurau. Sut gallwch ddangos bod eich pecynnau rhyddhad yn llwyddiannus a'r holl ddangosyddion economaidd yn dangos nad ydynt yn llwyddiannus, a bod pethau'n gwaethygu yng Nghymru o'n cymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig?

**Carl Sargeant:** Gall dros 60 y cant o fusnesau Cymru wneud cais am ryddhad ardrethi busnes. Gwn beth yr ydych yn ei feddwl yn awr, ond yn sicr nid wyf am gymryd y cymorth hwnnw oddi ar yr holl fusnesau hynny yng Nghymru. Yn wahanol i chi, credaf y byddai hynny'n beth gwael i'w wneud ac y byddai'n mynd yn groes i'r cymorth yr ydym yn ei roi i fusnesau.

Soniodd Jenny Randerson am bolisiâu'r dreth gyngor. Mae'r polisi yn yr Alban yn cael ei adolygu, felly mae hynny'n cael ei ystyried unwaith eto. Yr wyf wedi esbonio wrthyhch bod cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi trosiannol ar gael o dan y model yn Lloegr, nad yw'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach am ei gael, ond mae'r Torïaid am ei gael. Byddwn wedi meddwl y byddent o leiaf yn ymbellhau oddi wrth hynny.

Nid yw polisiâu'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ar dreth yn fy synnu o gwbl. Yn ddiweddar, pan holwyd Nick Clegg am y polisi treth cyfradd uchaf, dywedodd, ar ôl ei dileu, nad oedd yn gwneud cymaint ag yr oeddent wedi'i dybio i ddechrau, ond mae hynny'n broblem reolaidd gyda'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol.

**Mohammad Asghar:** Yr wyf yn Aelod Cynulliad rhanbarthol dros Ddwyrain De Cymru, sy'n cwmpasu Merthyr, Blaenau

Torfaen, and Islwyn, not only Newport. In most of those areas, more than 25 or 30 per cent of the shops are empty.

**Carl Sargeant:** It is surprising how policies change in a few short weeks, is it not, Oscar? [*Laughter.*] As with many of their policies, the Tories' policy on business rates is all over the place. This motion is evidence of that. Again, their rhetoric fails to relate to reality, and so I urge Members to support the Government's amendment 1 today.

**David Melding:** I hope that my colleagues will forgive me if, before responding to the debate, I first respond to the main arguments, if they can be called such, of our opponents. I also welcome the Minister back, because we were all concerned about the accident that he suffered. This is one of his first ministerial contributions in a debate in the Chamber, and we wish him well. However, I think that he made a slightly complacent start. We all expected a bit more robustness from him. His predecessor, Brian Gibbons, was notoriously cold on the business sector. At times, it was as though the sector was not there. Indeed, he once made an intervention claiming that the Holtham report pointed out that the Barnett formula is neutral or even good for Wales. That is a very strange reading of the Holtham report. Then again, he did not show a wonderful grasp of the finances of local government and business rates when he was Minister. As I have referred to him, I will give way to him.

**Brian Gibbons:** Just for the record, in contradistinction to what Dai said, what I said was that, in the past, the Barnett formula has served Wales well but, looking to the future, there is obviously a need for change.

**David Melding:** I remember someone once telling me that, when a joke does not go well, it is pointless trying to explain it afterwards. You are on record, and I will leave it to people to judge.

The Minister then made the terrible calumny

Gwent, Tor-faen, ac Islwyn, nid Casnewydd yn unig. Yn y rhan fwyaf o'r ardaloedd hynny, mae dros 25 neu 30 y cant o'r siopau'n wag.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'n syndod sut y bydd polisïau'n newid mewn cwta wythnos neu ddwy, onid yw, Oscar? [*Chwerthin.*] Fel gyda llawer o'u polisïau, mae polisi'r Torïaid ar ardrethi busnes yn draed moch. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn dystiolaeth o hynny. Unwaith eto, nid yw eu rhethreg yn gysylltiedig â realiti, felly, anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi gwelliant 1 gan y Llywodraeth heddiw.

**David Melding:** Gobeithio y bydd fy nghyd-Aelodau'n maddau imi am ymateb yn gyntaf i brif ddadleuon ein gwrthwynebwyr, os gellir eu galw'n ddadleuon, cyn ymateb i'r ddadl. Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu'r Gweinidog yn ôl, oherwydd yr oeddem i gyd yn pryderu am y ddamwain a gafodd. Dyma un o'i gyfraniadau cyntaf fel gweinidog yn y Siambr, a dymunwn yn dda iddo. Fodd bynnag, credaf iddo ddechrau braidd yn hunanfodlon. Yr oeddem i gyd yn disgwyl ychydig mwy o gadernid ganddo. Yr oedd gan ei ragflaenydd, Brian Gibbons, enw drwg am anwybyddu'r sector busnes. Ar brydiau yr oedd fel pe na bai'r sector yn bodoli. Yn wir, un tro gwnaeth ymyriad gan honni bod adroddiad Holtham yn nodi bod fformiwla Barnett yn niwtral neu hyd yn oed yn dda i Gymru. Mae hynny'n ffordd ryfedd iawn o ddehongli adroddiad Holtham. Wedi dweud hynny, ni ddangosodd fod ganddo ddealltwriaeth wych o faterion ariannol llywodraeth leol ac ardrethi busnes pan oedd yn Weinidog. Gan fy mod wedi cyfeirio ato, ildiaf iddo.

**Brian Gibbons:** Er mwyn i bawb gael gwybod, yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedodd Dai, yr hyn a ddywedais oedd bod fformiwla Barnett wedi gwasanaethu Cymru'n dda yn y gorffennol, ond o edrych i'r dyfodol mae'n amlwg bod angen newid.

**David Melding:** Cofiaf i rywun ddweud wrthyf rywbyrd, pan na fydd jôc yn cael ei derbyn yn dda, nid oes diben ceisio'i hesbonio wedyn. Cofnodwyd yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennyh, a gadawaf i bobl faru.

Yna baglodd y Gweinidog yn ofnadwy drwy

that Manchester is not in north Wales. I do not know what spatial map he is looking at but, on ours, there are pockets of Welshness all over the world. Lloyd George must be spinning in his grave. If he keeps up with that kind of lack of vision, I will get that wonderful former resident of Derby, Dafydd Wigley, onto him to sort him out.

**Janet Ryder:** Will you take an intervention?

**David Melding:** No, I want to get through this. On business rates, Minister, you made the complacent remark that 60 per cent are winners, but you know that, overall, your reforms are cost-neutral. There are no winners overall, if you look at Welsh businesses as a whole. Our reforms would bring real help of at least £50 million to Welsh businesses. That is the priority that we have. It was the priority of Plaid Cymru, of course, before it joined the Government. We say to its Members that they were right at that time and it is a pity that they did not hold on to that principle and deliver it when in office.

On what Jenny said, what we did on the poll tax is ancient history. She spoke passionately against the poll tax because it imposed a tax per head of the population on everyone over 18 years of age. Was that not wicked? What is her solution? She does not like the council tax either. She would tax everyone over the age of 18 with a local income tax. I have to say that I do not quite understand the vast difference in principle between those two systems.

**Jenny Randerson:** May I explain it to you?

**David Melding:** No, I fear that the time for explanations has come and gone. She was sounder on business rates and pointed out the more generous model in Scotland. That is what we ought to be comparing our policies to, and identifying best practice elsewhere.

Dai made a contribution that focused on the difficult financial position that we are in and then referred to the Barnett formula. We, on

ddweud nad yw Manceinion yng ngogledd Cymru. Ni wn pa fap gofodol y mae'n edrych arno, ond ar ein map ni mae yna bocedi o Gymreictod ledled y byd. Rhaid bod Lloyd George yn troi yn ei fedd. Os bydd yn parhau â diffyg gweledigaeth felly, gofynnaf i Dafydd Wigley, y dyn gwych hwnnw a fu'n byw yn Derby, roi trefn arno.

**Janet Ryder:** A wnewch chi dderbyn myriad?

**David Melding:** Na wna, yr wyf am gyrraedd y diwedd. O ran ardrethi busnes, Weinidog, gwnaethoch y sylw hunanfodlon fod 60 y cant ar eu hennill, ond gwyddoch, yn gyffredinol, fod eich diwygiadau yn niwtral o ran cost. At ei gilydd, nid oes neb yn ennill os edrychwch ar fusnesau Cymru'n gyffredinol. Byddai ein diwygiadau ni'n rhoi cymorth gwirioneddol gwerth o leiaf £50 miliwn i fusnesau Cymru. Dyna'r flaenoriaeth sydd gennym. Dyna oedd blaenoriaeth Plaid Cymru, wrth gwrs, cyn iddi ymuno â'r Llywodraeth. Dywedwn wrth ei Haelodau eu bod yn iawn bryd hynny a'i bod yn drueni iddynt fethu â dal gafael ar yr egwyddor honno a'i gwireddu wedi iddynt ddod i rym.

O ran yr hyn a ddywedodd Jenny, mae'r hyn a wnaethom o ran treth y pen yn hen hanes. Siaradodd yn angerddol yn erbyn treth y pen am ei bod yn codi treth ar bawb dros 18 oed. Onid oedd hynny'n ofnadwy? Beth yw ei hateb? Nid yw'n hoffi'r dreth gyngor ychwaith. Byddai hi'n codi treth ar bawb sydd dros 18 oed gyda threth incwm leol. Rhaid imi ddweud nad wyf yn deall yn iawn y gwahaniaeth sylweddol yn egwyddor y ddwy system hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** A gaf fi ei esbonio ichi?

**David Melding:** Na chewch, ofnaf fod yr amser i gynnig esboniadau wedi hen fynd. Yr oedd yn fwy siŵr o'i phethau ar ardrethi busnes a thynnodd sylw at y model mwy hael yn yr Alban. Dyna y dylem fod yn cymharu ein polisiâu ag ef, a nodi arfer gorau mewn manau eraill.

Gwnaeth Dai gyfraniad a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar y sefyllfa ariannol anodd yr ydym ynddi, ac yna cyfeiriodd at fformiwla

this side of the Chamber, accept that Barnett does not seem to deliver to Wales what it deserves. We have looked at a needs-based formula and that has to be addressed. However, there are no simple solutions to this. I must say to Plaid Cymru, as the nationalist party in Wales, that if they really think that this is essential, as our leader said on the weekend, they ought to get Ieuan to don a kilt and go up to try to convince the Scottish Government and their colleagues in the Scottish National Party that they should give up the £2 billion that Holtham identifies as what they get currently over and above their need. Dai Lloyd, why do you not don a kilt also and take a bag of dirks with you because you are going to need some protection when Alex Salmond tells you what he thinks and gives you the interpretation of nationalist opinion in Scotland? It is for the unionist parties that really believe in Great Britain to sort out Barnett. We are not going to take any lectures from the likes of you, Dai. This is just not your area.

We then had second helpings of Carl. Carl came back, but I am afraid that he did not make any more sense than the first time around. However, we wish him better in the future. I urge Assembly Members to support this motion.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Are there any objections? I see that there are. Therefore, the votes will be deferred until voting time.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have been notified by Helen Mary Jones that she wishes to move a procedural motion in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.26 to postpone the short debate tabled in her name.

Barnett. Yr ydym ni, ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, yn derbyn nad yw'n ymddangos bod Barnett wedi darparu'r hyn y mae Cymru'n ei haeddu. Yr ydym wedi edrych ar fformiwla'n seiliedig ar anghenion, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes atebion hawdd i hyn. Rhaid imi ddweud wrth Blaid Cymru, fel plaid genedlaethol Cymru, os yw'n wir yn credu bod hyn yn hanfodol, fel y dywedodd ein harweinydd dros y penwythnos, dylent ddwyn perswâd ar Ieuan i wisgo cilt a mynd i'r Alban i geisio darbwyllo Llywodraeth yr Alban a'u cydweithwyr ym Mhlaid Genedlaethol yr Alban y dylent ildio'r £2 biliwn y mae Holtham yn ei nodi fel y swm a gânt ar hyn o bryd yn fwy nag y mae arnynt ei angen. Dai Lloyd, pam na wnewch chithau wisgo cilt a mynd â bag o ddagerau gyda chi, oherwydd bydd angen rhywbeth i'ch amddiffyn pan fydd Alex Salmond yn dweud ei farn wrthych ac yn rhoi dehongliad o farn cenedlaetholwyr yr Alban ichi? Cyfrifoldeb y pleidiau unoliaethol sy'n credu o ddifrif mewn Prydain Fawr yw rhoi trefn ar Barnett. Nid ydym am wrando ar yr un bregeth gan bobl fel chi, Dai. Nid dyma'ch maes chi o gwbl.

Yna cawsom gyfraniad arall gan Carl. Dychwelodd Carl, ond mae arnaf ofn nad oedd ganddo ddim mwy o synnwyr yr eildro nag a oedd ganddo'r tro cyntaf. Fodd bynnag, dymunwn yn well iddo yn y dyfodol. Anogaf Aelodau'r Cynulliad i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, gohiriwn y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Mae Helen Mary Jones wedi rhoi gwybod imi ei bod yn dymuno cyflwyno cynnig trefniadol, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.26, i ohirio'r ddadl fer a gyflwynwyd yn ei henw hi.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I move that

*the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 7.26, agrees to postpone the short debate.*

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is that the motion be agreed. Are there any objections? I see that there are not. In accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35, the motion is therefore agreed.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

### **Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar Ariannu Seilwaith Ffyrdd The Finance Committee's Report on Funding Road Infrastructure**

**Angela Burns:** I move that

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the report of the Finance Committee on its inquiry into funding road infrastructure, which was laid in the Table Office on 8 January 2010. (NDM4433)*

I am pleased to open the debate today on the Finance Committee's inquiry into the funding of the road infrastructure in Wales. We live in a world in which communication is vital for nearly every aspect of life. The economy, wealth creation and jobs all depend on being able to move goods and people to where they are needed. Public services, such as health and education, depend on transport for patients, students and staff. Similarly, leisure, sport and holidays require people to move around. Our stewardship of the environment depends on communication being efficient and sustainable.

In its inquiry into the funding of the Welsh trunk roads network, the Finance Committee examined how this vital part of Wales's communication network is planned and developed. I start by thanking the very many witnesses who presented evidence to us in writing and orally, the clerking team and the Members' research service who supported the committee in this major investigation. I also thank the Deputy First Minister and the committee members for giving of their time,

**Helen Mary Jones:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, o dan Reol Sefydlog rhif 7.26, yn cytuno gohirio'r ddadl fer.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Y cynnig yw bod y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn. A oes gwrthwynebiad? Gwelaf nad oes. Yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

**Angela Burns:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar ei ymchwiliad i ariannu seilwaith ffyrdd, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Ionawr 2010. (NDM4433)*

Yr wyf yn falch cael agor y ddadl heddiw ar ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Cyllid i waith ariannu'r seilwaith ffyrdd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn byw mewn byd lle mae cyfathrebu'n hanfodol ar gyfer bron pob agwedd ar fywyd. Mae'r economi, creu cyfoeth, a swyddi i gyd yn dibynnu ar y gallu i symud nwyddau a phobl i'r manau lle mae eu hangen. Mae gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, megis iechyd ac addysg, yn dibynnu ar gludiant i gleifion, myfyrwyr a staff. Yn un modd mae gweithgareddau hamdden, chwaraeon a gwyliau yn mynnu bod pobl yn symud o gwmpas. Mae'r modd yr ydym yn stiwardio'r amgylchedd yn dibynnu ar waith cyfathrebu effeithlon a chynaliadwy.

Yn ei ymchwiliad i waith ariannu'r rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd yng Nghymru, bu'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn archwilio sut caiff y rhan hanfodol hon o rwydwaith cyfathrebu Cymru ei chynllunio a'i datblygu. Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r tystion niferus iawn a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth inni'n ysgrifenedig ac ar lafar, a diolch i'r tîm clericio ac i wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau a gefnogodd y pwyllgor yn ystod yr ymchwiliad pwysig hwn. Diolch hefyd i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog

because this was a long and detailed inquiry.

The Finance Committee was prompted to launch this inquiry because of concerns put to it about the impact of changes made in the reprioritisation of the Welsh Assembly Government's trunk road forward programme 2008. As we explored these issues, we identified a number of broader concerns about the trunk road forward programme, particularly its co-ordination with other Government policies. The Finance Committee started from the viewpoint that the Welsh road system should be a strategic resource that should be developed and maintained to support and serve a wide range of economic and social activities.

5.10 p.m.

The trunk road system should be a key element of that, and the trunk road forward programme should be the way in which the resource is managed. It should be based on a strategic view of Wales's road transport needs. However, the Finance Committee found it difficult to avoid the conclusion that that is not happening and that the trunk road forward programme appears to be being developed without regard to the needs of all stakeholders, almost as though it were an end in itself.

Our inquiry focused to a large extent on the latest reprioritisation of the roads programme, in 2008, and the concerns put to us that it had involved a change in priority from strengthening east-west links to a focus on north-south links. That is significant because, as many witnesses told us, east-west links are critical to regenerating Wales and our economy, and because economic and community planning and development was being done locally on that basis.

We spent a considerable amount of time examining the three trunk road forward programmes: those in 2002, 2004 and 2008. We were surprised to find that, while the trunk road forward programme is presented as four main corridors in Wales, it is in

ac aelodau'r pwyllgor am roi o'u hamser, oherwydd bu'n ymchwiliad hir a manwl.

Ysgogwyd y Pwyllgor Cyllid i lansio'r ymchwiliad hwn oherwydd pryderon a fynegwyd wrtho am effaith y newidiadau a wnaed wrth ailflaenoriaethu blaenraglen cefnffyrdd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru 2008. Wrth inni archwilio'r materion hyn, canfuom nifer o bryderon ehangach am y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd, yn enwedig y modd y caiff ei chydgysylltu â pholisïau eraill y Llywodraeth. Dechreuodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid o'r safbwynt y dylai system ffyrdd Cymru fod yn adnodd strategol y dylid ei ddatblygu a'i gynnal i gefnogi a gwasanaethu ystod eang o weithgareddau economaidd a chymdeithasol.

Dylai'r system gefnffyrdd fod yn elfen allweddol yn hynny, a dylid rheoli'r adnodd drwy'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd. Dylid ei seilio ar olwg strategol ar anghenion Cymru o ran trafnidiaeth ffyrdd. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei chael yn anodd osgoi dod i'r casgliad nad yw hynny'n digwydd, a bod y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd fel pe bai'n cael ei datblygu heb ystyried anghenion yr holl randdeiliaid, bron fel pe bai'r flaenraglen yn nod ynddi ei hun.

Canolbwyntiodd ein hymchwiliad i raddau helaeth ar y gwaith diweddaraf ar ailflaenoriaethu'r rhaglen ffyrdd yn 2008, a'r pryderon a fynegwyd wrthym fod y gwaith hwnnw wedi golygu newid blaenoriaeth, o gryfhau cysylltiadau dwyrain-gorllewin i ganolbwyntio ar gysylltiadau gogledd-de. Mae hynny'n bwysig oherwydd bod cysylltiadau dwyrain-gorllewin, fel y dywedodd nifer o dystion wrthym, yn hanfodol i adfywio Cymru a'n heconomi, ac oherwydd bod gwaith cynllunio a datblygu economaidd a chymunedol yn cael ei gyflawni'n lleol ar y sail honno.

Treuliwyd cryn amser yn archwilio'r tair blaenraglen cefnffyrdd: blaenraglenni 2002, 2004 a 2008. Er y caiff y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd ei chyflwyno ar ffurf pedwar prif goridor yng Nghymru, cawsom ein synnu o weld mai'r hyn ydyw, mewn gwirionedd, yw

reality a series of about 50 individual road schemes whose level of priority moves backward and forward in the light of policy decisions, funding constraints or project developments.

The Finance Committee noted that, while the trunk road forward programme was launched in 2002, it has had to be reviewed and revised twice in six years. In that period, there have been 32 changes to the phasing of schemes, two schemes have been added and two have been removed. While we accept that road schemes, like any long-term investment, can encounter difficulties that may delay progress, that level of adjustment has led us to conclude that it is clearly not being managed as a strategic programme. We discovered that many of the changes were due to delays and difficulties in delivering particular road schemes. We were told that that was due to a range of factors, such as a lack of funding and poor estimating. We learned of terms used to explain these failings, such as 'construction industry inflation' and 'optimism bias', but also of changes to the way in which projects are assessed.

We examined the charge that the Government had discreetly changed its policy and was now placing more emphasis on links between north and south Wales at the expense of the key economic links from east to west. However, while the Finance Committee could see signs of such a change in emphasis, there was so much poor management and uncertainty in the programme that it was difficult to come to a clear view on that.

It was plainly obvious that the roads programme is being managed in an old-fashioned way, whereby cost overruns and delays are accepted as part of the process. That is an approach to construction that has long been left behind by modern business practices and management methods. The Finance Committee was surprised to find that this approach still existed in the Department for the Economy and Transport and considered that the Government should adopt more modern business practices, which

cyfres o ryw 50 o gynlluniau ffyrdd unigol, a'u lefel o ran blaenoriaeth yn amrywio yng ngoleuni penderfyniadau polisi, cyfyngiadau ariannu neu ddatblygiadau prosiectau.

Er i'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd gael ei lansio yn 2002, sylwodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid iddi orfod cael ei hadolygu a'i diwygio ddwywaith mewn chwe mlynedd. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, bu 32 o newidiadau mewn gwaith cyflwyno cynlluniau, cafodd dau gynllun eu hychwanegu a chafodd dau eu dileu. Er ein bod yn derbyn y gall cynlluniau ffyrdd, fel pob buddsoddiad hirdymor, ddod ar draws anawsterau a all olygu oedi o ran cynnydd, mae lefel yr addasu a fu wedi dod â ni i'r casgliad ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'r flaenraglen yn cael ei rheoli fel rhaglen strategol. Gwelsom fod nifer o'r newidiadau wedi digwydd oherwydd oedi, ac anawsterau wrth gyflawni cynlluniau ffyrdd penodol. Dywedwyd wrthym fod hynny wedi digwydd oherwydd amrywiol ffactorau, megis diffyg arian ac amcangyfrifo gwael. Clywsom am dermau a ddefnyddir i egluro'r diffygion hyn, megis 'chwyddiant yn y diwydiant adeiladu' a 'tuedd optimistiaeth', a chlywsom hefyd am newidiadau yn y modd y caiff prosiectau eu hasesu.

Buom yn archwilio'r cyhuddiad bod y Llywodraeth wedi newid ei pholisi heb yn wybod inni, a'i bod yn awr yn rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar gysylltiadau rhwng y gogledd a'r de ar draul y cysylltiadau economaidd allweddol o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin. Fodd bynnag, er y gallai'r Pwyllgor Cyllid weld arwyddion o newid o'r fath mewn pwyslais, yr oedd cymaint o reolaeth wael ac ansicrwydd yn y rhaglen fel ei bod yn anodd llunio barn glir am hynny.

Yr oedd yn gwbl amlwg fod y rhaglen ffyrdd yn cael ei rheoli mewn ffordd hen ffasiwn, lle derbynnir bod gorwario ac oedi yn rhan o'r broses. Mae'r dull hwnnw o adeiladu wedi'i adael ar ôl ers tro gan arferion busnes a dulliau rheoli modern. Synnai'r Pwyllgor Cyllid o weld bod y dull hwn yn dal i fodoli yn Adran yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth, a chredai y dylai'r Llywodraeth fabwysiadu arferion busnes mwy modern, a fyddai'n helpu dileu a rheoli llawer o risgiau prosiectau, gan gynnwys amcangyfrifo



would help to eliminate and manage many of the project risks, including poor estimating, bad planning and late delivery.

The Finance Committee found an impressively contrasting picture when it spoke to the National Roads Authority of Ireland, which had developed ways to build roads on time and on budget. The key seemed to be good professional skills. The Irish had accepted the need to ensure that the roads programme in Ireland was based on a strategic plan that delivered the economic imperatives. They depoliticised the process as far as possible and created an independent authority that had the business skills and industry-specific knowledge to prepare reliable cost estimates for their projects. They had developed good and standardised contracts for these and then managed them well. The process was supported by a five-year rolling investment programme. While the Finance Committee accepts that that is longer than the normal financial horizon in the UK, it finds it difficult to see why, within an annual Welsh budget of some £16 billion, it is not possible to develop a mechanism that would enable commitments to be made for a five-year period in relation to an annual investment programme of around £80 million to £90 million.

The Finance Committee also found it difficult to see how the trunk road forward programme had been co-ordinated with developments and priorities elsewhere in Government and throughout Wales. The programme seems to be determined to a great extent by the Government's transport department. There was no process evident by which the regeneration element of the Deputy First Minister's department fed into the development of roads, other than by being copied in on papers and having the opportunity to comment on them.

The committee was particularly surprised that there was not a stage in the process at which Ministers discussed the needs and requirements of other Assembly Government departments that need roads to meet their objectives. The Finance Committee was concerned to learn that the programme was not debated at Cabinet level to ensure

gwael, cynllunio gwael a chwblhau'n hwyr.

Gwelodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid ddarlun a oedd yn drawiadol o wrthgyferbyniol pan siaradodd ag Awdurdod Ffyrdd Cenedlaethol Iwerddon, a oedd wedi datblygu dulliau o adeiladu ffyrdd yn brydlon heb orwario. Ymddangosai mai sgiliau proffesiynol da oedd yr allwedd. Yr oedd y Gwyddelod wedi derbyn bod angen sicrhau bod y rhaglen ffyrdd yn Iwerddon yn seiliedig ar gynllun strategol a oedd yn sicrhau'r hanfodion economaidd. Yr oeddent wedi dadwleidyddoli'r broses gymaint ag a oedd yn bosibl, ac wedi creu awdurdod annibynnol a oedd â'r sgiliau busnes a'r wybodaeth sy'n benodol i'r diwydiant i baratoi amcangyfrifon dibynadwy o gost ar gyfer eu prosiectau. Yr oeddent wedi datblygu contractau da wedi'u safoni ar gyfer y rhain, ac yn eu rheoli'n dda wedyn. Yr oedd rhaglen fuddsoddi dreigl o bum mlynedd yn cefnogi'r broses. Er bod y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn derbyn bod hynny'n hwy na'r terfyn ariannol arferol yn y DU, mae'n ei chael yn anodd gweld pam nad yw'n bosibl datblygu system a fyddai'n ein galluogi i ymrwymo am gyfnod o bum mlynedd i raglen fuddsoddi flynyddol sy'n werth rhyw £80 miliwn i £90 miliwn, mewn cyllideb flynyddol o ryw £16 biliwn i Gymru.

Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid hefyd yn ei chael yn anodd gweld sut yr oedd y flenraglen cefnffyrdd wedi'i chydgyssylltu â datblygiadau a blaenoriaethau mewn rhannau eraill o'r Llywodraeth a ledled Cymru. Ymddengys fod y rhaglen yn cael ei phennu i raddau helaeth gan adran drafndiaeth y Llywodraeth. Nid oedd proses i'w gweld lle'r oedd yr elfen adfywio yn adran y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn bwydo i mewn i waith datblygu ffyrdd, heblaw drwy ei chynnwys wrth ddsbarthu papurau a chael cyfle i wneud sylwadau arnynt.

Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn synnu'n arbennig nad oedd cam yn y broses pan fyddai'r Gweinidogion yn trafod anghenion a gofynion adrannau eraill Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y mae angen ffyrdd arnynt i gyflawni eu hamcanion. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn pryderu o glywed na chafodd y rhaglen ei thrafod ar lefel y Cabinet er mwyn

cohesion with other major investment programmes.

The Finance Committee took evidence from a range of external organisations about the way in which they were involved in the development of the trunk road forward programme, and was encouraged by their general enthusiasm to work with the Government to ensure that developments locally were co-ordinated with the strategic programme.

However, what they all said was that it was a one-way process: while the Government was willing to be involved with the activities of local authorities and other bodies, it had never consulted them on the trunk road forward programme. This struck the committee as a strange way to do things. If the trunk road forward programme is intended to support and serve people and activities, surely the Government needs to know the plans and priorities of the people and organisations that will use the road network. Everyone could accept that, ultimately, the Government has to make decisions on the overall programme—sometimes difficult ones—but surely the way to get wide support for these is to ensure that everyone has their say before the decisions are made.

The fact that most witnesses expressed concern about the priorities indicated by the plan, and concerns that it failed to address Wales's economic needs, would seem to underline the point. I draw particular attention to the widespread concern about the Government's decision to abandon the new M4 project, which was described to us by the Confederation of British Industry Wales as,

'by head and shoulders the most key route and scheme for the economy'.

The committee's conclusions and recommendations in one sense are very simple: the trunk road forward programme should be seen as, and managed as, a strategic programme and one that underpins a wide range of the Government's policies and

sicrhau cydlyniant â rhaglenni buddsoddi eraill o bwys.

Casglodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid dystiolaeth gan ystod o sefydliadau allanol am y modd yr oeddent yn ymwneud â datblygu'r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd, a chafodd ei galonogi gan eu brwdfrydedd cyffredinol i weithio gyda'r Llywodraeth er mwyn sicrhau bod datblygiadau lleol yn cael eu cydgysylltu â'r rhaglen strategol.

Fodd bynnag, yr hyn a ddywedodd pawb oedd mai proses unffordd ydoedd: er bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i ymwneud â gweithgareddau awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff eraill, nid oedd erioed wedi ymgynghori â hwy ynghylch y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd. I'r pwyllgor, yr oedd y ffordd hon o wneud pethau'n ymddangos yn rhyfedd. Os bwriad y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd yw cefnogi a gwasanaethu pobl a gweithgareddau, siawns nad oes angen i'r Llywodraeth wybod beth yw cynlluniau a blaenoriaethau'r bobl a'r sefydliadau a fydd yn defnyddio'r rhwydwaith ffyrdd. Gallai pawb dderbyn ei bod yn rhaid i'r Llywodraeth, yn y pen draw, wneud penderfyniadau ynghylch y rhaglen gyffredinol—penderfyniadau anodd weithiau—ond siawns nad y ffordd o gael cefnogaeth eang i'r rhain yw sicrhau bod pawb yn cael dweud eu dweud cyn y gwneir y penderfyniadau.

Ymddangosai fod y pwynt yn cael ei ategu gan y ffaith fod mwyafrif y tystion wedi mynegi pryder am y blaenoriaethau a nodwyd gan y cynllun, a mynegi pryder ei fod yn methu â rhoi sylw i anghenion economaidd Cymru. Hoffwn dynnu sylw'n benodol at y pryder eang am benderfyniad y Llywodraeth i droi ei chefn ar brosiect newydd yr M4, a ddisgrifiwyd wrthym gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain yng Nghymru fel

'y ffordd fwyaf allweddol o lawer a'r cynllun mwyaf allweddol o ran yr economi'.

Ar un olwg, mae casgliadau ac argymhellion y pwyllgor yn syml iawn: dylid ystyried y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd fel rhaglen strategol ac yn un sy'n sail i ystod eang o bolisiau a rhaglenni'r Llywodraeth, a dylid ei rheoli felly.

programmes.

The Government should come to a firm view on the programme's strategic objectives in the light of the needs of all stakeholders, both within and outside the Government. It should be open about the process and its thinking, and should seek and listen to the views of those involved with, and affected by, the programme. The plan should clearly set out how road investment dovetails with other investment and development proposals. The Government should then agree the plan, publish it and commit to it. I cannot emphasise enough the necessary requirement to commit, because our evidence showed without fail that the revisions and constant realignments are causing delays, confusion, lost opportunities and funding problems.

Delivery should be managed by a dedicated unit established for this purpose and skilled in the use of modern business practices, which will ensure delivery of projects to time and budget. The Finance Committee does not have a view on whether this should be inside the Government or an external body, but the Government should ensure that such a unit has the necessary tools to do its job. That includes establishing a financial regime appropriate for an investment programme covering a number of years. The Government should then resist the temptation to micromanage the programme or change priorities, other than in exceptional circumstances.

The Finance Committee is also being realistic. Members recognised that the last thing that anyone wants is yet another revision. So we have asked the Government to refocus the existing programme to eliminate the many problems caused by poor estimation, delays, uncertainty over funding and endless revisions. In particular, the committee asked the Government to address the widespread concerns about the focus of the 2008 reprioritisation from organisations within Wales.

I will conclude by turning my attention to the Deputy First Minister's response to our report. The main thrust of his response is that

Dylai'r Llywodraeth ffurfio barn gadarn am amcanion strategol y rhaglen yng ngoleuni anghenion yr holl randdeiliaid, yn y Llywodraeth a'r tu allan iddi. Dylai fod yn agored ynglŷn â'r broses a'i meddylfryd, dylai ofyn am farn y rheini sy'n ymwneud â'r rhaglen a'r rheini y mae'r rhaglen yn effeithio arnynt, a dylai wrando ar y farn honno. Dylai'r cynllun egluro sut mae buddsoddi mewn ffyrdd yn cyd-fynd â chynigion eraill o ran buddsoddi a datblygu. Yna, dylai'r Llywodraeth gytuno'r cynllun, ei gyhoeddi ac ymrwymo iddo. Ni allaf bwysleisio ddigon yr angen hollbwysig i ymrwymo, oherwydd dangosodd ein tystiolaeth yn ddi-ffael fod yr adolygu a'r ad-drefnu cyson yn peri oedi, dryswch, colli cyfleoedd a phroblemau ariannu.

Dylai'r gwaith cwblhau gael ei reoli gan uned bwrpasol wedi ei sefydlu at y diben hwnnw ac sy'n hyddysg mewn defnyddio arferion busnes modern, a fydd yn sicrhau cwblhau prosiectau'n brydlon heb orwario. Nid oes gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid farn ar y cwestiwn a ddylai'r uned fod yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth ynteu'n gorff allanol, ond dylai'r Llywodraeth sicrhau bod gan uned o'r fath yr adnoddau angenrheidiol i wneud ei gwaith. Mae hynny'n cynnwys sefydlu trefn ariannol briodol ar gyfer rhaglen fuddsoddi sy'n ymestyn dros nifer o flynyddoedd. Yna, dylai'r Llywodraeth wrthsefyll y demtasiwn i ficoreoli'r rhaglen neu newid blaenoriaethau, heblaw mewn amgylchiadau eithriadol.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid hefyd yn realistig. Cydnabu'r Aelodau mai'r peth olaf y mae ar neb ei eisiau yw adolygiad arall eto. Felly, yr ydym wedi gofyn i'r Llywodraeth ailbennu ffocws y rhaglen bresennol er mwyn dileu'r problemau niferus a achosir gan amcangyfrifo gwael, oedi, ansicrwydd ynghylch ariannu ac adolygiadau diddiwedd. Yn benodol, gofynnodd y pwyllgor i'r Llywodraeth fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon eang gan sefydliadau yng Nghymru am ffocws yr ailflaenoriaethu yn 2008.

Hoffwn gloi drwy droi fy sylw at ymateb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i'n hadroddiad. Prif fyrdwn ei ymateb yw bod,

the,

‘Assembly Government believes that it has already addressed the issues raised by the Finance Committee in its report. The measures set out above will ensure that our transport programme is managed efficiently and effectively and that we can develop a modern and sustainable transport network.’

The measures that the Government sets out are indeed of great interest. I am heartened to note the Government’s commitment to putting transport on to a carbon reduction pathway, in order to help meet the challenge of climate change. I also note the Government’s realisation that moving to a low-carbon transport infrastructure will require a balanced, joined-up approach that takes full account of the linkages between different policy areas—one of the Finance Committee’s key recommendations. I also note the Government’s acceptance that it is essential to maximise the benefit from every single transport intervention that is made.

Indeed the Deputy First Minister’s response informs the Finance Committee that many of the recommendations that we made are already in place. The Deputy First Minister talks of cohesion between transport and regeneration, better liaison with local government and a better framework for transport planning—all recommendations made by the Finance Committee.

However, what the Deputy First Minister does not address in his response to the report are the funding issues, the acceptance of long-term strategic objectives rather than short-term political fixes and consideration of a dedicated unit for delivery. Instead, he promises yet another transport reorganisation, this time in the guise of producing a national transport plan, because the Government is now moving away from the concept of separate trunk road and rail programmes.

This new transport programme is to replace the 2008 update of the trunk road forward programme, which reinforces everything that the committee said about not constantly

‘Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn credu ei bod eisoes wedi rhoi sylw i’r materion a godir gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei adroddiad. Bydd y mesurau a nodir uchod yn sicrhau y bydd ein rhaglen drafnidiaeth yn cael ei rheoli’n effeithlon ac yn effeithiol ac y gallwn ddatblygu rhwydwaith trafnidiaeth modern a chynaliadwy.’

Mae’r mesurau y mae’r Llywodraeth yn eu gosod allan yn ddi-ddorol iawn yn wir. Fe’m calonogir o weld ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i roi trafnidiaeth ar lwybr i leihau carbon, er mwyn helpu ymateb i her y newid yn yr hinsawdd. Sylwaf hefyd fod y Llywodraeth wedi sylweddoli y bydd symud at seilwaith trafnidiaeth carbon isel yn gofyn am dull gweithredu cytbwys a chydgyssylltiedig, sy’n ystyried yn llawn y cysylltiadau rhwng gwahanol feysydd polisi—sef un o argymhellion allweddol y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Sylwaf hefyd fod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn ei bod yn hanfodol sicrhau cymaint â phosibl o fudd o bob ymyriad a wneir o safbwynt trafnidiaeth.

Yn wir, mae ymateb y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn dweud wrth y Pwyllgor Cyllid fod nifer o’r argymhellion a wnaethom eisoes ar waith. Mae’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn sôn am gydlyniant rhwng trafnidiaeth ac adfywio, cyswllt gwell â llywodraeth leol, a fframwaith gwell ar gyfer cynllunio trafnidiaeth—y mae pob un ohonynt yn argymhellion a wnaed gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid.

Fodd bynnag, yr hyn nad yw’r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn mynd i’r afael ag ef yn ei ymateb i’r adroddiad yw’r materion ariannu, derbyn amcanion strategol hirdymor yn hytrach nag atebion gwleidyddol byrdymor, ac ystyried uned bwrpasol ar gyfer cwblhau. Yn hytrach, mae’n addo ad-drefnu trafnidiaeth eto, y tro hwn ar ffurf cynhyrchu cynllun trafnidiaeth cenedlaethol, gan fod y Llywodraeth yn awr yn symud oddi wrth y cysyniad o raglenni ar wahân ar gyfer cefnffyrdd a rheilffyrdd.

Bydd y rhaglen drafnidiaeth newydd hon yn disodli’r gwaith o ddiweddarau’r flaenraglen cefnffyrdd yn 2008, sy’n ategu popeth a ddywedodd y pwyllgor am beidio ag addasu’r

altering\_the road programmes and making strategic commitments.

rhaglenni ffyrdd byth a hefyd, ac am wneud ymrwymadau strategol.

5.20 p.m.

Finally, if the changes that the Deputy First Minister talks about have happened on the ground and have bedded in, that is to be wholeheartedly welcomed. However, I remind you that the Finance Committee took evidence last year and the report was published in January this year, so the comment that the Government believes that it has already addressed the concerns of the committee is surprising. You would have expected some witness, somewhere, to have mentioned all of this, but no-one did, not even the Government.

Yn olaf, os yw'r newidiadau y mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn sôn amdanynt wedi digwydd ar lawr gwlad ac wedi ymsefydlu, dylid croesawu hynny'n galonnog. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn eich atgoffa fod y Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi casglu tystiolaeth y llynedd a bod yr adroddiad wedi ei gyhoeddi ym mis Ionawr eleni. Felly, mae'r hyn a ddywedodd y Llywodraeth ei bod yn credu ei bod eisoes wedi rhoi sylw i bryderon y pwyllgor yn ein synnu. Byddech wedi disgwyl i ryw dyst rywle grybwyll hynny i gyd, ond ni wnaeth neb, ddim hyd yn oed y Llywodraeth.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I will confine my remarks at this stage of the debate to addressing some of the points that Angela has made, although I find it difficult to respond to some of them. I am astounded at the lack of recognition by the Finance Committee about how finance in the Assembly works.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Cyfyngaf fy sylwadau yn ystod y cam hwn yn y ddadl i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r pwyntiau y mae Angela wedi eu gwneud, er fy mod yn ei chael yn anodd ymateb i rai ohonynt. Fe'm syfrdanwyd gan ddiffyg cydnabyddiaeth y Pwyllgor Cyllid o'r modd y mae cyllid yn y Cynulliad yn y gweithio.

I will mention one of the points that she raised. The following is a recommendation by the Finance Committee of the National Assembly for Wales:

Hoffwn sôn am un o'r pwyntiau a godwyd ganddi. Mae'r canlynol yn argymhelliad gan Bwyllgor Cyllid Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

'The Finance Committee finds it difficult to see that within an annual Welsh budget of some £16bn it is not possible to develop a mechanism that would enable commitments to be made for a five year period in relation to an annual investment programme of around £80m - £90m'.

'Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ei chael yn anodd gweld nad yw'n bosibl, o fewn cyllideb flynyddol o tua £16bn i Gymru, ddatblygu dull a fydd yn galluogi ymrwymadau i gael eu gwneud am gyfnod o bum mlynedd mewn cysylltiad â rhaglen fuddsoddi flynyddol o tua £80m - £90m'.

The first point is that the Assembly Government does not have a £16 billion budget. Why could the Finance Committee not find out the precise budget of the Welsh Assembly Government?

Y pwynt cyntaf yw nad oes gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyllideb o £16 biliwn. Pam na allai'r Pwyllgor Cyllid ddarganfod beth yw union gyllideb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

Secondly, my budget for roads is a capital budget. Of the £16 billion, £14.5 billion is revenue and £1.5 billion is capital. That is a fundamental error in the report. The committee does not understand how the budget of the Assembly works.

Yn ail, cyllideb gyfalaf yw fy nghyllideb ar gyfer ffyrdd. O'r £16 biliwn, refeniw yw £14.5 biliwn a chyfalaf yw £1.5 biliwn. Mae'r gwall hwnnw'n un sylfaenol yn yr adroddiad. Nid yw'r pwyllgor yn deall sut mae cyllideb y Cynulliad yn y gweithio.

The third mistake appears in the same paragraph. It says that it would enable commitments to be made for a five-year period. The Assembly budget covers a three-year period. All of the comprehensive spending review announcements made by all previous Governments in Westminster are on a three-year cycle. How is it possible for the Government to put down a five-year programme against a three-year budget? It may well be that we could agree that this should be a five-year budget, but the current position is that it is not. Therefore, in one paragraph, I have counted three basic errors by the Finance Committee.

I will explain another. Paragraph 40 in your report asks why

'the Minister and officials rely on phrases in the small print such as "Subject to completion of statutory consent procedures and the availability of finance" as a justification for not meeting targets'.

What is Angela suggesting? Is she suggesting that I should ignore statutory procedures? Is that the policy that Angela is now proposing? If she looked at all of the road programmes proposed by the former Welsh Office run by Conservative Secretaries of State, she would see that, after 10 years of the Assembly, every single road project has to have statutory consent before it can proceed.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**The Deputy First Minister:** No, I will not give way.

The second point is that every single project depends on finance. How can you possibly commit to a road programme unless you say that it is subject to the provision of finance?

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**The Deputy First Minister:** No, I will not give way.

**Alun Cairns:** May I raise a point of order?

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:**

Mae'r trydydd camgymeriad yn ymddangos yn yr un paragraff. Dywed y byddai'n galluogi ymrwymadau am gyfnod o bum mlynedd. Mae cyllideb y Cynulliad yn ymestyn dros gyfnod o dair blynedd. Mae'r holl gyhoeddiadau a wnaed gan bob Llywodraeth flaenorol yn San Steffan ar adolygiadau cynhwysfawr o wariant wedi'u seilio ar gylch tair blynedd. Sut mae'n bosibl i'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno rhaglen bum mlynedd ar sail cyllideb tair blynedd? Efallai y gallem gytuno y dylai fod yn gyllideb pum mlynedd, ond nid felly y mae ar hyn o bryd. Felly, mewn un paragraff, yr wyf wedi cyfrif tri gwall sylfaenol gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid.

Egluraf un arall. Mae paragraff 40 yn eich adroddiad yn gofyn pam mae'r

'Gweinidog a'r swyddogion yn dibynnu ar ymadroddion fel "Subject to completion of statutory consent procedures and the availability of finance" yn y print mân i gyfiawnhau peidio â chwrdd â thargedau'.

Beth mae Angela yn ei awgrymu? A yw'n awgrymu y dylwn anwybyddu gweithdrefnau statudol? Ai dyna'r polisi y mae Angela yn ei gynnig yn awr? Pe bai'n edrych ar yr holl raglenni ffyrdd a gynigiwyd gan yr hen Swyddfa Gymreig a gâi ei rhedeg gan Ysgrifenyddion Gwladol Ceidwadol, byddai'n gweld ei bod yn rhaid i bob prosiect unigol ym maes ffyrdd, ar ôl 10 mlynedd o fodolaeth y Cynulliad, gael caniatâd statudol cyn y gellir bwrw ymlaen ag ef.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Na, nid wyf am ildio.

Yr ail bwynt yw bod pob prosiect yn dibynnu ar gyllid. Sut ar y ddaear y gallwch ymrwymo i raglen ffyrdd oni ddywedwch ei bod yn amodol ar ddarparu cyllid?

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Na wna, nid wyf am ildio.

**Alun Cairns:** A gaf fi godi pwynt o drefn?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Trefn. Nid

Order. The Member is not giving way and I will not take a point of order on this. Please sit down and let the Member finish.

**The Deputy First Minister:** I have listened to a catalogue of things raised by the Finance Committee and I am dealing with them. [*Interruption.*]

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Please stop heckling from a sedentary position.

**The Deputy First Minister:** Let me make my final points in this part of my contribution. The first is this: I would have expected the Finance Committee to have looked at the Government's policy to decide whether it was following its own policy, and to decide whether the finance allocated to that policy could be delivered. It did not, however, mention in its report what the Government's policy was. In 'One Wales', which is an agreement between two of the parties in this Chamber, we agreed that there should be a contribution to the cost of north-south road links. That is Government policy. There is no scrutiny of that policy in this committee report whatsoever. It criticises that policy, but is that the role of the Finance Committee? The role of the Finance Committee is to scrutinise the Government's delivery of its policy.

My second point is this: I made it clear that it was the Government's priority to improve north-south links and to improve the Heads of the Valleys road across east-west links. Why, therefore, is the Finance Committee not dealing with that? In fact, it could not find the silver bullet that it was looking for. So what did it do? It has ended up with generalisations in its conclusions, which, frankly, have no place, in my view, in the committee's report.

Before I finish this part, I would also say that it fails to recognise this Government's statutory duty to comply with the provisions of the Transport (Wales) Act 2006. What does that transport Act tell us? It tells us that I have a responsibility to produce a Wales transport strategy and a national transport plan. In her response today, Angela Burns ridicules the Government for producing the

yw'r Aelod am ildio, ac ni chymeraf bwynt o drefn ar hynny. Eisteddwch a gadewch i'r Aelod orffen.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi gwranddo ar restr o bethau y mae'r Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi eu codi, ac yr wyf yn ymdrin â hwy. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Trefn. Rhowch y gorau i heclo ar eich eistedd.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Gadewch imi wneud fy mhwyntiau terfynol yn y rhan hon o'm cyfraniad. Y cyntaf yw hwn: byddwn yn disgwyl i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid fod wedi edrych ar bolisi'r Llywodraeth i benderfynu a oedd y Llywodraeth yn dilyn ei pholisi ei hun, a phenderfynu a ellid darparu'r cyllid a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y polisi hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yn ei adroddiad ni soniodd y pwyllgor beth oedd polisi'r Llywodraeth. Yn 'Cymru'n Un', sef cytundeb rhwng dwy o'r pleidiau yn y Siambr hon, cytunwyd y dylem gyfrannu at gost cysylltiadau ffyrdd gogledd-de. Mae hynny'n bolisi gan y Llywodraeth. Ni chreffir o gwbl ar y polisi hwnnw yn adroddiad y pwyllgor. Mae'n beirniadu'r polisi hwnnw, ond ai dyna yw rôl y Pwyllgor Cyllid? Rôl y Pwyllgor Cyllid yw craffu ar y modd y mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwireddu ei pholisi.

Fy ail bwynt yw hyn: eglurais mai blaenoriaeth y Llywodraeth oedd gwella cysylltiadau gogledd-de a gwella ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd ar draws cysylltiadau dwyrain-gorllewin. Pam, felly, nad yw'r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn ymdrin â hynny? Mewn gwirionedd, ni allai ddod o hyd i'r ateb rhwydd yr oedd yn chwilio amdano. Felly, beth wnaeth y Pwyllgor? Mae ei gasgliadau'n llawn cyffredinoli, nad oes iddo le, a bod yn onest, yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, yn fy marn i.

Cyn imi orffen y rhan hon, byddwn hefyd yn dweud ei fod yn methu â chydabod dyletswydd statudol y Llywodraeth hon i gydymffurfio â darpariaethau Deddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006. Beth mae'r Ddeddf trafndiaeth honno'n ei ddweud wrthym? Dywed wrthym fod cyfrifoldeb arnaf i gynhyrchu strategaeth drafndiaeth i Gymru a chynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol.

national transport plan. The reality is that we have a statutory requirement to deliver that plan. What the committee failed to recognise is that I am complying with a statutory duty that has been placed on me by Parliament.

What we have here, unfortunately, are general statements by a Finance Committee that fails to scrutinise this Government properly.

**Nick Ramsay:** I will do an unusual thing by starting my contribution with something said by Alun Davies, a former member of the Finance Committee. When we were drafting this report, he said that, at the end of the day, this is about roads. We have been building roads for quite a long time—I am paraphrasing slightly—and we will be building them for a long time in the future.

When considering this subject in Finance Committee, it sometimes seemed, from some of the witnesses that we listened to, that we were talking about sending the first Welshman to the moon to collect some stones and getting him back here. I wonder why it has to be so complicated. I listened with interest to what the Deputy First Minister said, much of which was about the status of the Finance Committee and how it works. You cannot talk about finance for a road programme as if it was separate from the other issues involved in the roads and the cost issues. We should be clear that these two aspects are interlinked, and if the Deputy First Minister believes that this report contains recommendations that stray into an area that the committee should not be considering, I would disagree with him. I think that this is an excellent report, and it is not only a product of Angela Burns's chairing; every member of that committee worked hard to produce it, including Labour members, Liberal Democrat members and Plaid Cymru members. What came out was genuine horror and shock at the lack of clarity in the running of the transport budget.

Looking at some of the recommendations,

Yn ei hymateb heddiw, mae Angela Burns yn gwawdio'r Llywodraeth am gynhyrchu'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol. Y gwir amdani yw bod gofyniad statudol arnom i ddarparu'r cynllun hwnnw. Yr hyn y methodd y pwyllgor â'i gydnabod yw fy mod yn cydymffurfio â dyletswydd statudol a roddwyd arnaf gan Senedd y DU.

Yr hyn sydd gennym yma, yn anffodus, yw datganiadau cyffredinol gan Bwyllgor Cyllid sy'n methu â chraffu'n iawn ar y Llywodraeth hon.

**Nick Ramsay:** Yr wyf am gymryd cam anarferol drwy ddechrau fy nghyfraniad â rhywbeth a ddywedodd Alun Davies, cyn-aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid. Pan oeddem yn drafftio'r adroddiad hwn, dywedodd mai'r hyn sydd dan sylw, yn y bôn, yw ffyrdd. Yr ydym wedi bod yn adeiladu ffyrdd ers amser go faith—yr wyf yn aralleirio rhywfaint—a byddwn yn eu hadeiladu am amser maith i ddod.

Wrth ystyried y pwnc hwn yn y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ymddangosai weithiau, o gyfraniadau rhai o'r tystion y buom yn gwrando arnynt, ein bod yn sôn am anfon y Cymro cyntaf i'r lleuad i gasglu cerrig, a'i gael yn ôl yma. Tybed pam mae'n rhaid i'r mater fod mor gymhleth? Gwrandewais â diddordeb ar yr hyn a ddywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac yr oedd llawer ohono'n ymwneud â statws y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r modd y mae'n gweithio. Ni allwch sôn am gyllid ar gyfer rhaglen ffyrdd fel pe bai ar wahân i'r materion eraill sy'n ymwneud â ffyrdd a'r materion cost. Dylem ddeall bod y ddwy agwedd yn gysylltiedig, ac os yw'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn credu bod yr adroddiad yn cynnwys argymhellion sy'n crwydro i faes na ddylai'r pwyllgor ei ystyried, byddwn yn anghytuno ag ef. Credaf fod hwn yn adroddiad ardderchog, ac nid cynnyrch gwaith cadeirio Angela Burns yn unig ydyw; gweithiodd pob aelod o'r pwyllgor yn galed i'w gynhyrchu, gan gynnwys aelodau'r Plaid Llafur, aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ac aelodau Plaid Cymru. Yr hyn a ddeilliodd ohono oedd gwir ddychryn a sioc am y diffyg eglurder yn y modd y caiff y gyllideb trafndiaeth ei rhedeg.

I edrych ar rai o'r argymhellion, mynnodd



many witnesses asserted that the consultation with the Assembly Government was too often a one-way process. That is a terrible indictment, and it came from many witnesses. Consultation should be a two-way thing. If you are not overseeing a proper two-way consultation process, how on earth can you hope to address some of the problems that were raised?

5.30 p.m.

The big issue that the Finance Committee came up with was the lack of an overall strategic planning framework for the roads programme. Many witnesses mentioned slippage, which was a word that came up time and again. Many of us were not aware of what was meant by 'slippage' to begin with, but, by the end of the inquiry, it became clear that 'slippage' was being used to mask many flaws in the way that the roads programme was being run. I do not think that they should have been masked in that way.

My vocabulary increased markedly during the committee's inquiry. The words 'optimum bias' came up, which is the percentage that must be added to a road budget line because engineers automatically underestimate the cost, not to mention inflation. Where else does that happen? 'Over-programming' was another word used; it means that the Government expects some programmes to be delayed, and so takes the opportunity to bring forward other schemes to fill the gap. Angela Burns mentioned 'construction index inflation' at the start of the debate. A lot of smoke and mirrors were used during the committee's sessions, and we worked hard to come to these conclusions and recommendations.

**Alun Cairns:** I could not agree with you more about the smoke and mirrors. When you work your way through the smoke and mirrors, you come across some horrific examples, such as the access road to the airport, where £2 million was spent on a programme that had already been consulted on, was then cancelled, and then revived for further consultation only for the Government to say that there were insufficient funds and that it could not go ahead with it. This

nifer o dystion fod yr ymgynghori â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn rhy aml yn broses unffordd. Mae hynny'n gyhuddiad ofnadwy, ac fe'i clywyd gan nifer o dystion. Dylai ymgynghori fod yn broses ddwyffordd. Os na fyddwch yn goruchwyllo proses ymgynghori ddwyffordd briodol, sut ar y ddaear y gallwch obeithio mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau a godwyd?

Y broblem fawr y tynnodd y Pwyllgor Cyllid sylw ati oedd diffyg fframwaith cynllunio strategol cyffredinol ar gyfer y rhaglen ffyrdd. Soniodd llawer o dystion am lithriant, sy'n air a ddaeth i'r amlwg dro ar ôl tro. Nid oedd llawer ohonom yn ymwybodol o ystyr 'llithriant' ar y dechrau, ond erbyn diwedd yr ymchwiliad daeth yn amlwg bod 'llithriant' yn cael ei ddefnyddio i guddio nifer o ddiffygion yn y modd yr oedd y rhaglen ffyrdd yn cael ei rhedeg. Ni chredaf y dylent fod wedi'u cuddio fel hynny.

Cynyddodd fy ngeirfa'n sylweddol yn ystod ymchwiliad y pwyllgor. Daeth y geiriau 'tuedd optimistaeth' yn amlwg, sef y ganran y mae'n rhaid ei hychwanegu at linell cyllideb ar gyfer ffordd, gan fod peirianwyr yn awtomatig yn rhoi amcangyfrif rhy isel o gost, heb sôn am chwyddiant. Ymhle arall mae hynny'n digwydd? Yr oedd 'gorraglennu' yn air arall a ddefnyddid; mae'n golygu bod y Llywodraeth yn disgwyl i rai rhaglenni gael eu gohirio, ac felly'n manteisio ar y cyfle i gyflwyno cynlluniau eraill i lenwi'r bwlch. Soniodd Angela Burns am 'chwyddiant mynegai adeiladu' ar ddechrau'r ddadl. Ceisiwyd celu pethau a'n camarwain yn ystod sesiynau'r pwyllgor, a buom yn gweithio'n galed i ddod i'r casgliadau a'r argymhellion hyn.

**Alun Cairns:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â chi am y celu a'r camarwain. O dreiddio drwy'r celu a'r camarwain, fe welwch rai enghreifftiau dychrynlyd, megis y ffordd at y maes awyr, lle gwariwyd £2 filiwn ar raglen yr ymgynghorwyd eisoes yn ei chylch ac a gafodd ei chanslo wedyn, a'i hatgyfodi wedyn i ymgynghori ymhellach yn ei chylch er mwyn i'r Llywodraeth ddweud nad oedd digon o arian ar gael ac na allai fwrw ymlaen â hi. Gwastraffodd y Gweinidog hwn £2

Minister wasted £2 million on a road that went to nowhere and is going nowhere. That is how incompetent his department is.

**Nick Ramsay:** We also heard similar concerns regarding the new M4.

**Chris Franks:** Will you give way?

**Nick Ramsay:** Sorry, but I do not think that I have time, Chris; maybe next time. A political decision was made to cancel the M4 project, and I do not disagree with the Government's right to take that decision. However, when it came to the justification for it, at one point it was based on economic grounds, and then the environmental issues were thrown in, but there was no coherent explanation for the cancellation of that project. The same applies to the scheme that Alun mentioned. As I said, I am pleased that hard work went into this report and I am glad that I was part of the process. If the report makes Assembly Members think seriously about the role of the Finance Committee and the way in which the Minister's department works, then so much the better.

**Christine Chapman:** I am pleased that the Finance Committee has given us the opportunity to discuss this important issue. The report mentions the dualling of the A465 Heads of the Valleys road, and there is a huge amount of frustration and disappointment at the length of time that this project is taking, given the real economic benefits involved in its completion. Such frustrations were mentioned in the evidence that officers from Rhondda Cynon Taff County Borough Council gave to the Finance Committee last year.

However, I wish to focus attention on an even more vital aspect of the debate. The report notes the impact of good road infrastructure on the lives of Welsh citizens, and we need investment in our road infrastructure to make those lives not just better but safer. Information that I have recently received from South Wales Police—I await a response from Gwent Police—shows that the figures highlight this. The figures show that between 2000 and 2009 there were nearly 900 accidents on just one

filiwn ar ffordd nad oedd ac nad yw'n mynd i unman. Dyna mor anghymwys yw ei adran.

**Nick Ramsay:** Clywsom bryderon tebyg hefyd am yr M4 newydd.

**Chris Franks:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Nick Ramsay:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond nid wyf yn credu bod gennyf amser, Chris; y tro nesaf, efallai. Gwnaed penderfyniad gwleidyddol i ganslo prosiect yr M4, ac nid wyf yn anghytuno â hawl y Llywodraeth i wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaeth yn fater o'i gyfiawnhau, yr oedd yn seiliedig ar faterion economaidd ar un adeg, ac yna ychwanegwyd y materion amgylcheddol, ond ni chafwyd yr un eglurhad cydlynol dros ganslo'r prosiect. Mae'r un peth yn wir am y cynllun y soniodd Alun amdano. Fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn falch bod yr adroddiad hwn wedi'i seilio ar waith caled, ac yr wyf yn falch imi fod yn rhan o'r broses. Os yw'r adroddiad yn gwneud i Aelodau Cynulliad feddwl o ddirif am rôl y Pwyllgor Cyllid a'r modd y mae adran y Gweinidog yn gweithio, gorau oll.

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf yn falch fod y Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi rhoi'r cyfle inni drafod y mater pwysig hwn. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am ddeuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, sef yr A465, ac mae rhwystredigaeth a siomedigaeth enfawr am yr amser y mae'r prosiect yn ei gymryd, o gofio'r manteision economaidd gwirioneddol sy'n gysylltiedig â'i gwblhau. Soniwyd am rwystredigaeth o'r fath yn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynodd swyddogion o Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid y llynedd.

Fodd bynnag, hoffwn ganolbwyntio ar agwedd fwy hanfodol fyth ar y ddadl. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi effaith seilwaith ffyrdd da ar fywydau dinasyddion Cymru, ac mae angen inni fuddsoddi yn ein seilwaith ffyrdd nid yn unig i wella bywydau dinasyddion Cymru ond i'w gwneud yn fwy diogel hefyd. Mae gwybodaeth a gefais yn ddiweddar gan Heddlu De Cymru—yr wyf yn dal i ddisgwyl ymateb gan Heddlu Gwent—yn dangos bod y ffigurau'n amlygu hynny. Dengys y ffigurau fod bron i 900 o ddamweiniau wedi digwydd

stretch of the A465, between Dowlais Top and Hirwaun. Of these, 21 were fatal collisions, meaning that there were 21 incidents in which a life was lost—and sometimes more than one life was lost. A further 32 incidents were classed as serious collisions and over 250 others resulted in injury.

All that is on just one stretch of road, on which work will not be started until some unspecified time in the future and on which a disproportionate number of lives are being lost. I would be keen to know what the response is to this report on the grounds of safety. I know that the Automobile Association states that dual carriageways are safer, and dualling was one response adopted by the UK Department for Transport to increase road user safety. Similarly, the Campaign for Safe Road Design calls for a more intelligent, responsive attitude towards roadside design to help to prevent accidents. We need to concern ourselves not just with developing our existing road infrastructure, but with ensuring that that infrastructure is as safe as possible. I know that we have had lots of discussions and debates here about slippage, but I ask today that the Deputy First Minister starts to take a fresh look at this, given the appalling statistics that we are seeing on this stretch of road.

**Kirsty Williams:** I thank the Chair and the committee staff for their work in putting together this report and I also thank the witnesses who took the time and trouble to come to the committee to give evidence and to submit views in writing, and those organisations outside Wales that took the time and trouble to co-operate with the review. Quite often, in the discussions that resulted in the report, I thought, just like today, that there was a lot more heat than light.

The decision to reprioritise the trunk road programme in 2008 always took centre stage in those discussions. I was bemused by the shock and surprise expressed by some Members and some witnesses that reprioritisation seemed to move north-south routes further up in the priorities, while east-

ar un rhan yn unig o'r A465, rhwng Dowlais Top a Hirwaun, rhwng 2000 a 2009. O blith y rhain yr oedd 21 yn wrthdrawiadau angheuol, sy'n golygu bod 21 o ddigwyddiadau lle collwyd bywyd—a lle collwyd mwy nag un bywyd weithiau. Ystyriwyd bod 32 o ddigwyddiadau eraill yn wrthdrawiadau difrifol, ac arweiniodd dros 250 o rai eraill at anaf.

Mae'r rhain i gyd wedi digwydd ar un rhan yn unig o'r ffordd, lle na fydd gwaith yn dechrau tan ryw adeg amhenodol yn y dyfodol, ac y mae nifer anghymesur o fywydau'n cael eu colli arni. Byddwn yn awyddus i wybod beth yw'r ymateb i'r adroddiad hwn ar sail diogelwch. Gwn fod Cymdeithas Foduro yr AA yn dweud bod ffyrdd deuol yn fwy diogel, ac yr oedd deuoli yn un ymateb a fabwysiadwyd gan Adran Drafnidiaeth y DU i hybu diogelwch defnyddwyr ffyrdd. Yn yr un modd, mae'r Ymgyrch o blaid Dylunio Ffyrdd Diogel yn galw am agwedd fwy deallusol ac ymatebol at ddylunio ymylon ffyrdd er mwyn helpu i atal damweiniau. Mae angen inni ymwneud nid yn unig â datblygu ein seilwaith ffyrdd presennol, ond sicrhau hefyd bod y seilwaith hwnnw mor ddiogel ag sy'n bosibl. Gwn inni gael nifer o drafodaethau a dadleuon yma am lithriant, ond gofynnaf heddiw i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ddechrau edrych o'r newydd ar y mater, o ystyried yr ystategau brawychus am y rhan hon o'r ffordd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch i'r Cadeirydd a staff y pwyllgor am eu gwaith wrth lunio'r adroddiad hwn. Diolch hefyd i'r tystion a roddodd amser ac ymdrechu i ddod i'r pwyllgor i roi tystiolaeth a chyflwyno safbwyntiau'n ysgrifenedig, a'r sefydliadau o'r tu allan i Gymru a roddodd o'u hamser a gwneud i gydweithredu â'r adolygiad. Yn aml iawn, yn ystod y trafodaethau a arweiniodd at yr adroddiad yr oeddwn yn credu, fel heddiw, bod llawer mwy o dân na goleuni.

Yr oedd y penderfyniad i ailflaenoriaethu'r rhaglen gefnffyrdd yn 2008 bob amser yn ganolbwynt i'r trafodaethau hynny. Fe'm dryswyd gan y sioc a'r syndod a fynegodd rhai Aelodau a rhai tystion fod yr ailflaenoriaethu fel pe bai wedi symud y llwybrau gogledd-de i fyny'r rhestr

west programmes seemed to slip down the list of priorities. As the Deputy First Minister rightly stated, we really should not be shocked and surprised about that, because that was the stated aim of the Government and that is what the members of Government parties signed up to. Therefore, we should not be surprised to see, when looking again at the trunk road programme, that priorities changed in that way, because that was the Government's stated intention. You can argue over whether those were the right priorities and whether the Government was correct in identifying those roads as being strategically more important for the economic and social development of Wales, but you should hardly be shocked and surprised, because that was the Government's stated intention.

I can well understand the frustration of Members who had wanted to see the Heads of the Valleys road project move forward more quickly. The Deputy First Minister used the term 'silver bullet', but I think that what he meant to say was 'the smoking gun'. There was a feeling that this report would throw up the smoking gun that would pin the failure to bring this project forward on this particular Minister for transport. However, the Heads of the Valleys project perfectly encapsulates the problems that all trunk road programmes have had, in that they have not been managed optimally. It is not that the Deputy First Minister does not want to do anything about the Heads of the Valleys road, it is just that, in managing the programme, he, like previous Ministers for transport, has faced changes in the budget and poor planning. There was no smoking gun to be found. This particular road has been subject to the problems that we have seen. That is why I am disappointed by the Government's response this afternoon.

The Deputy First Minister can rip the Finance Committee apart and he can try to be personal in his attacks on Angela, but the issue is that when we compare how we manage our trunk road programme with how it is managed by in Ireland there is a significant difference. I would not advocate, as has been done in Ireland, setting up a

flaenoriaethau, a bod y rhaglenni dwyrain-gorllewin fel pe baent wedi llithro i lawr. Fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn gywir ddigon, ni ddylem fynegi sioc a syndod am hynny mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd dyna oedd nod penodol y Llywodraeth, a dyna yr ymrwymodd aelodau pleidiau'r Llywodraeth iddo. Felly, ni ddylem synnu o weld, wrth edrych eto ar y rhaglen cefnffyrdd, fod blaenoriaethau wedi newid yn y fath fodd, oherwydd dyna oedd bwriad penodol y Llywodraeth. Gallwch ddadlau ai'r rheini oedd y blaenoriaethau cywir, ac a oedd y Llywodraeth yn iawn i nodi bod y ffyrdd hynny'n bwysicach yn strategol ar gyfer datblygiad economaidd a chymdeithasol Cymru, ond ni ddylech fynegi sioc na syndod, oherwydd dyna oedd bwriad penodol y Llywodraeth.

Gallaf ddeall rhwystredigaeth yr Aelodau a oedd am weld prosiect ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn symud ymlaen yn gyflymach. Soniodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog am 'ateb rhwydd', ond credaf mai'r hyn yr oedd yn bwriadu ei ddweud oedd 'tystiolaeth bendant'. Teimlid y byddai'r adroddiad yn dadlennu tystiolaeth bendant a fyddai'n dangos mai'r Gweinidog hwn dros drafnidiaeth sy'n gyfrifol am fethu â gwireddu'r prosiect. Fodd bynnag, mae prosiect Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn crynhoi'n berffaith y problemau y mae'r holl raglenni cefnffyrdd wedi'u cael, sef nad ydynt wedi cael eu rheoli yn y ffordd orau posibl. Nid yw hynny oherwydd diffyg awydd ar ran y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog i wneud rhywbeth am ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ond wrth reoli'r rhaglen mae ef, fel y Gweinidogion blaenorol dros drafnidiaeth, wedi wynebu newidiadau yn y gyllideb a gwaith cynllunio gwael. Nid oedd tystiolaeth bendant i'w gweld. Mae'r ffordd benodol hon wedi wynebu'r problemau a welsom. Dyna pam yr wyf yn siomedig gan ymateb y Llywodraeth y prynhawn yma.

Gall y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ladd ar y Pwyllgor Cyllid, a gall geisio bod yn bersonol yn ei ymosodiadau ar Angela, ond y broblem yw bod gwahaniaeth sylweddol i'w weld wrth gymharu'r modd yr ydym ni'n rheoli ein rhaglen cefnffyrdd â'r modd y caiff y rhaglen cefnffyrdd ei rheoli yn Iwerddon. Ni fyddwn o blaid sefydlu corff allanol ar

separate external body to do the work, but we are naive if we turn around and say that we cannot learn any lessons from anyone else, and we are naive and misguided if we refuse to learn any lessons from anyone else on how we can do this better.

5.40 p.m.

The Government, in its response to the committee's report, acknowledges that the way that this has been done before needs to be considered. The Government states that it has created new structures and new policy frameworks, and has reorganised the department, and that the management of this programme will be done better in future. I welcome that, but I agree with Angela that if this work had been going on, then it is surprising that the Deputy First Minister or his officials did not mention it in evidence to the committee.

We need to consider the role of the Cabinet in these decisions. The Deputy First Minister was quite clear that, in making these decisions, he did not take them back to the Cabinet. This is pretty significant policy and the kind of policy that I, perhaps naively, would expect to be discussed in the Cabinet. If the Cabinet is not discussing policies and decisions of this nature, what is it discussing?

**Alun Davies:** We were all quite surprised that the issue of reprioritisation had not been taken to the Cabinet. At the same time, we were also surprised that no stakeholder or witness who gave evidence to the committee stated that they had, at any time, been consulted by the Government on this reprioritisation.

**Kirsty Williams:** That is correct. There was no consultation within or outside the Government. However, I would expect a Government, in deciding on such important strategic infrastructure projects for the nation, to discuss that sort of thing internally and externally.

We should not be surprised about the

wahân i wneud y gwaith, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn Iwerddon, ond byddem yn naïf pe baem yn troi ac yn dweud na allwn ddysgu gwersi gan neb arall, a byddem yn naïf ac yn annoeth pe baem yn gwrthod dysgu gwersi gan neb arall am y modd i wneud hyn yn well.

Yn ei hymateb i adroddiad y pwyllgor, mae'r Llywodraeth yn cydnabod bod angen ystyried y modd y gwnaed hyn o'r blaen. Mae'r Llywodraeth yn dweud ei bod wedi creu strwythurau newydd a fframweithiau polisi newydd, a'i bod wedi aildrefnu'r adran, ac y bydd y rhaglen hon yn cael ei rheoli'n well yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn croesawu hynny, ond yr wyf yn cytuno ag Angela pan ddywedodd ei bod yn rhyfedd, os oedd y gwaith hwn wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo, na soniodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog neu ei swyddogion amdano mewn tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor.

Mae angen inni ystyried rôl y Cabinet yn y penderfyniadau hyn. Dywedodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn eithaf clir nad oedd yn mynd â'r penderfyniadau hyn yn ôl at y Cabinet wrth eu gwneud. Mae hwn yn bolisi lled sylweddol a'r math o bolisi y byddwn i, yn naïf efallai, yn disgwyl iddo gael ei drafod yn y Cabinet. Os nad yw'r Cabinet yn trafod polisiau a phenderfyniadau o'r math hwn, beth y mae'n ei drafod?

**Alun Davies:** Yr oeddem i gyd yn synnu braidd nad oedd y mater ailflaenoriaethu wedi'i gyflwyno i'r Cabinet. Ar yr un pryd, yr oeddem hefyd yn synnu na ddywedodd yr un rhanddeiliad, na'r un tyst a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, fod y Llywodraeth wedi ymgynghori rywbryd â hwy ynghylch yr ailflaenoriaethu hwnnw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae hynny'n gywir. Ni ddigwyddodd dim ymgynghori o fewn y Llywodraeth na'r tu allan iddi. Fodd bynnag, wrth benderfynu prosiectau mor bwysig yng nghyswllt seilwaith strategol ar gyfer y genedl, byddwn yn disgwyl i Lywodraeth drafod y math hwnnw o beth yn fewnol ac yn allanol.

Ni ddylem synnu at yr ailflaenoriaethu;

reprioritisation; the Government's intention to do that was clearly stated. However, if we are going to be spending this amount of money on these important infrastructure projects in future, they should be discussed in the way that many of us think that they should have been. None of us should be surprised about the reprioritisation; it was clearly the Government's intention to do that and it is simply carrying out its own policy. However, in doing so, I suggest that it could manage the policy better internally.

**Chris Franks:** It is worth reminding ourselves that this report considers just a part of the transport system in Wales. It should be noted that Ieuan Wyn Jones has invested heavily in rail and bus services, not simply in roads. Since 2007, substantial road upgrades have been made by the Minister. He has ensured the stability of the whole road building programme, given the funding that he has secured, which includes a multi-million pound investment for the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road, with completion timetabled for 2020. Members who do not sit on the Finance Committee will note that the Heads of the Valleys road has figured greatly in these discussions. My Conservative friends make great play of that, except in places such as the Vale of Glamorgan, where they say it is terrible to spend all this money on the Heads of the Valleys.

The route is vital and the work shows our commitment to the Valleys. The timetable for the work on the A465, the Heads of the Valleys road, is on course to be completed by 2020. There has been no slippage since 2007, when Plaid went into coalition Government, despite the bizarre statements made by some Members. There has been no slippage, despite the comments to the contrary.

**Christine Chapman:** Chris, do you agree that the figures that I cited today, referring to more than 21 incidents in which lives were lost over quite a short space of time, are unacceptable? Would you support a special investigation by the Welsh Assembly Government into why these accidents are happening?

cafodd bwriad y Llywodraeth i wneud hynny ei nodi'n glir. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am wario'r swm dan sylw yn y dyfodol ar y prosiectau seilwaith pwysig hyn, dylid eu trafod yn y modd y cred nifer ohonom y dylent fod wedi'u trafod. Ni ddylai'r un ohonom fynegi syndod am yr ailflaenoriaethu; yr oedd yn glir mai dyna oedd bwriad y Llywodraeth, ac mae'n bwrw ymlaen yn syml iawn â'i pholisi ei hun. Fodd bynnag, wrth wneud hynny, awgrymaf y gallai reoli'r polisi'n well yn fewnol.

**Chris Franks:** Mae'n werth ein hatgoffa ein hunain mai rhan yn unig o'r system drafnidiaeth yng Nghymru y mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ei hystyried. Dylid nodi bod Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi buddsoddi'n helaeth mewn gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd a bysiau, nid mewn ffyrdd yn unig. Er 2007, mae'r Gweinidog wedi uwchraddio ffyrdd yn sylweddol. Mae wedi sicrhau sefydlogrwydd y rhaglen adeiladu ffyrdd yn ei chyfarwydd, o gofio'r arian y mae wedi'i sicrhau, sy'n cynnwys buddsoddiad gwerth llawer miliwn o bunnoedd i ddeuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, gyda'r bwriad o gwblhau'r gwaith erbyn 2020. Bydd yr Aelodau nad ydynt ar y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn sylwi bod ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd wedi cael lle amlwg yn y trafodaethau hyn. Mae fy ffrindiau Ceidwadol yn gwneud môr a mynydd o hynny, heblaw mewn lleoedd megis Bro Morgannwg, gan ddweud ei bod yn ofnadwy fod yr holl arian hwn yn cael ei wario ar Flaenau'r Cymoedd.

Mae'r ffordd yn hanfodol, ac mae'r gwaith yn dangos ein hymrwymiad i'r Cymoedd. Mae'r gwaith ar yr A465, sef ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ar y trywydd iawn i gael ei gwblhau erbyn 2020. Ni fu llithriant er 2007, pan aeth Plaid i mewn i Lywodraeth glymblaid, er gwaetha'r datganiadau rhyfedd a wnaed gan rai Aelodau. Ni fu llithriant, er gwaetha'r sylwadau i'r gwrthwyneb.

**Christine Chapman:** Chris, a ydych yn cytuno bod y ffigurau a ddyfynnais heddiw, yn cyfeirio at dros 21 o ddigwyddiadau lle collwyd bywydau dros gyfnod gweddol fyr, yn annerbyniol? A fydddech yn cefnogi ymchwiliad arbennig gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r rhesymau pam mae'r damweiniau hyn yn digwydd?

**Chris Franks:** I agree that those figures are awful. The incidents often involve young motorists. It is devastating. However, Ieuan Wyn Jones has secured the funding to complete the work by the target date of 2020. No other Minister has done that. There were some unfunded schemes, and he has found the necessary money. In fact, he has secured additional moneys from Europe, which will be of great benefit to our scheme. In response to talk of how dysfunctional this department and this Minister are, it is worth noting that the £100 million M4 widening scheme around Cardiff was completed on time and on budget. Some opposition Members and some non-opposition Members are quite mute about that. The report is unrepresentative of the views of everyone on the committee, and it was not signed off by all committee members.

**Alun Cairns:** Will you give way?

**Chris Franks:** No. Perhaps I would give way to Mr Asghar, who was an important member of the committee who disappeared like a parrot in the jungle.

**Angela Burns:** Will you give way to me?

**Chris Franks:** No, you are not good enough compared to Mr Asghar, I am afraid. [*Laughter.*] In terms of his expertise I mean. The Finance Committee was dysfunctional, and it is unfortunate that it descended into petty point-scoring, which got in the way of robust scrutiny. It would be much fairer to say that Ieuan Wyn Jones has tackled the poor management and uncertainty in his 2008 reprioritisation. This will deliver a better trunk road network across Wales. We now have a programme that is more robust and more achievable than has ever been the case in the past.

Although the Welsh Government is committed to improving north-south links, it is not to be done at the expense of east-west links, including the Heads of the Valleys road. The Minister for transport is delivering and delivering on target—something that no other Minister has managed to achieve.

**Chris Franks:** Cytunaf fod y ffigurau hynny'n ofnadwy. Mae'r digwyddiadau'n aml yn ymwneud â modurwyr ifanc. Mae'n dorcalonnus. Fodd bynnag, mae Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi sicrhau'r arian i gwblhau'r gwaith erbyn y dyddiad targed, sef 2020. Nid oes yr un Gweinidog arall wedi gwneud hynny. Yr oedd rhai cynlluniau heb gyllid, ac mae wedi dod o hyd i'r arian angenrheidiol. Mewn gwirionedd, mae wedi sicrhau arian ychwanegol o Ewrop, a fydd yn fuddiol iawn i'n cynllun. Wrth ymateb i'r sôn mor gamweithredol yw'r adran hon a'r Gweinidog, mae'n werth nodi bod y cynllun £100 miliwn i ledu'r M4 o amgylch Caerdydd wedi ei gwblhau'n brydlon heb orwario. Mae rhai o Aelodau'r wrthblaid a rhai Aelodau nad ydynt yn perthyn i'r wrthblaid yn ddigon tawel ynghylch hynny. Nid yw'r adroddiad yn cynrychioli barn pawb ar y pwyllgor, ac ni chafodd ei gymeradwyo gan bob aelod o'r pwyllgor.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Chris Franks:** Na wnaf. Hwyrach y byddwn yn fodlon ildio i Mr Asghar, a oedd yn aelod pwysig o'r pwyllgor ac a ddiflannodd fel parot yn y jyngl.

**Angela Burns:** A wnewch chi ildio i mi?

**Chris Franks:** Na wnaf, mae arnaf ofn nad ydych yn ddigon da o'ch cymharu â Mr Asghar. [*Chwerthin.*] O ran ei arbenigedd yr oeddwn yn ei olygu. Yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gamweithredol, ac mae'n anffodus iddo ymostwng i sgorio pwyntiau dibwys a oedd yn rhwystro gwaith craffu trylwyr. Byddai'n decach o lawer dweud bod Ieuan Wyn Jones wedi mynd i'r afael â'r rheolaeth wael a'r ansicrwydd wrth ailflaenoriaethu yn 2008. Bydd y gwaith hwnnw'n darparu rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd gwell ledled Cymru. Mae gennym raglen yn awr sy'n fwy cadarn a chyraeddadwy nag erioed o'r blaen.

Er bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymrwymo i wella cysylltiadau gogledd-de, ni ddylid gwneud hynny ar draul cysylltiadau dwyrain-gorllewin, gan gynnwys ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth yn cyflawni, ac yn cyflawni'n unol â'r targedau—rhywbeth nad oes yr un

Slippage in the past was the direct result of funding issues, and Plaid is campaigning for fairer funding for Wales so that we can get the money that we deserve based on need rather than a head count. In conclusion, the Deputy First Minister has shown his competence. He has kept to the timetable for completing the Heads of the Valleys road. Essentially, he has also secured funding. Regrettably, the dysfunctional nature of the committee at the time meant that there was a party-political slant to this report, which was not signed off by all Members.

**William Graham:** I want to concentrate my remarks on the Heads of the Valleys road and the aborted M4 relief road. Both projects have the capacity to bring tremendous social and economic opportunities to South Wales East, but both have been mired in controversy. The Finance Committee's report emphasises just how high a priority previous administrations considered the M4 relief road to be, until its complete abandonment last July. I believe that this issue will have to be revisited; transport and business leaders are almost unanimous in voicing the need for the scheme. As the report states,

'In the view of the CBI, the new M4 around Newport was, by head and shoulders, the most key route of the scheme for the Welsh economy.'

It is hard to see another scheme that is of such economic importance, and the previous Welsh Assembly Government appears to have agreed, giving the Magor to Castleton relief road a greater priority in 2004 by moving it from being on hold to phase 2.

**Gareth Jones:** Could you remind us how much this road would have cost the people of Wales? We are talking about a national framework, but how much would it have cost? I believe that the Finance Committee knows its statistics, so can it tell us what that sum would have been, so that we can make

Gweinidog arall wedi llwyddo i'w wneud. Yn y gorffennol, yr oedd llithriant yn ganlyniad uniongyrchol materion yn ymwneud ag ariannu, ac mae Plaid yn ymgyrchu dros gyllid tecach i Gymru er mwyn inni allu cael yr arian yr ydym yn ei haeddu'n seiliedig ar angen yn hytrach na maint y boblogaeth. I gloi, mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi dangos ei gymhwysedd. Mae wedi cadw at yr amserlen ar gyfer cwblhau ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Yn bwysicaf oll, mae hefyd wedi sicrhau arian. Yn anffodus, yr oedd natur gamweithredol y pwyllgor ar y pryd yn golygu bod gwleidyddiaeth plaid yn amlwg yn yr adroddiad hwn, na chafodd ei gymeradwyo gan bob Aelod.

**William Graham:** Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio fy sylwadau ar ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a ffordd liniaru'r M4 a aeth i'r gwellt. Mae gan y ddau brosiect y gallu i ddod â chyfleoedd cymdeithasol ac economaidd enfawr i Ddwyrain De Cymru, ond mae'r ddau wedi boddi mewn dadlau. Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn pwysleisio mor bwysig yr oedd ffordd liniaru'r M4 ym marn gweinyddiaethau blaenorol, nes rhoddwyd y gorau i'r cynllun yn llwyr fis Gorffennaf diwethaf. Credaf y bydd yn rhaid ailedrych ar y mater hwn; mae arweinwyr ym maes cludiant a byd busnes yn unfrydol bron yn lleisio'r angen am y cynllun. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad,

'Ym marn y CBI, y ffordd M4 newydd o amgylch Casnewydd oedd y ffordd fwyaf allweddol o lawer a'r cynllun mwyaf allweddol o ran yr economi.'

Mae'n anodd gweld cynllun arall sydd â'r un pwysigrwydd economaidd, ac yr oedd Llywodraeth flaenorol y Cynulliad fel pe bai'n cytuno, wrth iddi roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i gynllun ffordd liniaru Magwyr i Gas-bach yn 2004, drwy ei symud o gael ei ohirio a'i roi yng ngham 2.

**Gareth Jones:** A allech ein hatgoffa faint y byddai'r ffordd honno wedi'i gostio i bobl Cymru? Yr ydym yn sôn am fframwaith cenedlaethol, ond faint y byddai wedi'i gostio? Credaf fod y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn gwybod yr ystadegau, felly, a all ddweud wrthym beth fuasai'r swm hwnnw, er mwyn



comparisons?

**William Graham:** The approximate cost was in the region of £800 million. Compare that to the cost of £1 million an hour when the road is blocked, let alone the economic benefit it would bring to south-east Wales and the reassurance it would give manufacturers that they could get their raw materials in and their manufactured goods out.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to William Graham for giving way. Does he recognise that when the Deputy First Minister stood in this Chamber to announce that road the decision was made on safety grounds, because of the deaths that had happened on that stretch of motorway? That was the rationale on which the road was originally commissioned. It is in the BBC reports of the time and it is in the Record of Proceedings, but the road was cancelled on financial ground.

5.50 p.m.

**William Graham:** There is also the alternative of a private finance initiative, particularly with regard to the fact that the tolls on the Severn bridge come to an end in 2016 and there have already been schemes that will make that economically viable.

No matter how hard the Government tries to prioritise the north-south transport links in Wales, statistics bear out that it is the east-west corridor that is of significantly greater economic value. It is no surprise therefore to read, in point 72 of the report, that:

‘The Finance Committee is therefore disappointed that the decision to abandon this project seems to have been based solely on the road’s affordability and without reference to the wider roads programme or the economic impact of the scheme.’

There is a clear need for a greater strategic approach to the traffic flow problems in the Newport area that have held back the local population’s economic and social development for far too long. Along with the many thousands of people who are regularly

inni allu cymharu?

**William Graham:** Tuag £800 miliwn oedd y gost yn fras. Dylech gymharu hynny â’r gost o £1 filiwn yr awr pan fydd y ffordd wedi’i thagu, heb sôn am y budd economaidd y byddai’n ei gynnig i’r de-ddwyrain, a’r sicrwydd y byddai’n ei roi i weithgynhyrchwyr y gallent gael eu deunyddiau crai i mewn a chael y nwyddau a gynhyrchant allan.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i William Graham am ildio. Pan safodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn y Siambr hon i gyhoeddi’r ffordd honno, a yw William Graham yn cydnabod y gwnaed y penderfyniad ar sail diogelwch, oherwydd y marwolaethau a oedd wedi digwydd ar y rhan honno o’r draffordd? Dyna pam y comisiynwyd y ffordd yn wreiddiol. Fe’i gwelir yn adroddiadau’r BBC ar y pryd ac yng Nghofnod y Trafodion, ond canslwyd y ffordd am resymau ariannol.

**William Graham:** Mae yna ddewis gwahanol hefyd, sef menter cyllid preifat, yn enwedig o ystyried bod y tollau ar bont Hafren yn dod i ben yn 2016, a gwelwyd cynlluniau eisoes a fydd yn golygu bod hynny’n hyfyw yn economaidd.

Waeth pa mor galed y ceisia’r Llywodraeth flaenoriaethu cysylltiadau trafndiaeth gogledd-de yng Nghymru, mae ystadegau’n cadarnhau bod y coridor dwyrain-gorllewin lawer yn fwy gwerthfawr o safbwynt economaidd. Felly, nid yw’n syndod darllen y canlynol, ym mhwynt 72 yn yr adroddiad:

‘Felly, mae’r Pwyllgor Cyllid yn siomedig ei bod yn ymddangos i’r penderfyniad i roi’r gorau i’r prosiect hwn gael ei wneud ar ddim ond fforddiadwyedd y ffordd a heb gyfeirio o gwbl at y rhaglen ffyrdd ehangach nag effaith economaidd y cynllun.’

Mae angen amlwg am agwedd fwy strategol at y problemau llif traffig yn ardal Casnewydd, sydd wedi atal datblygiad economaidd a chymdeithasol y boblogaeth leol am amser rhy hir o lawer. Ynghyd â’r miloedd lawer o bobl sy’n cael eu dal mewn

delayed on this route, this summer I look forward to the publication of the plans for the new road connecting the Newport southern distributor road to the M4 motorway via the former Corus site. The Minister replied to a recent written question I posed on this issue, indicating that construction is scheduled to commence on this route early next year at a cost of £20 million. I urge the Minister to make this route an absolute priority in the forthcoming national transport plan.

The Welsh Conservatives warmly welcomed the Assembly Government's confirmation yesterday that the next stage of the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road between Brynmawr and Tredegar will start in 2012 and that a contractor was awarded today for £116 million. This remains a vital project, which has been overshadowed by the argument over which the transport Minister should take responsibility for the slippage in the scheme. There have unquestionably been serious inconsistencies in successive Assembly Government explanations of the delay. Putting aside the arguments and local disappointment that the scheme is not being completed earlier, it is encouraging that the Minister has signalled a completion date of 2020 and we must then press the Government for a greater realisation of the strategic aims contained in the documents, 'Heads—We Win' and 'Turning Heads'. For this to happen, the Assembly Government must take heed of the report's comment that there is a need for greater co-ordination in the Heads of the Valleys programme between the Minister for the Economy and Transport and the Deputy Minister for Housing and Regeneration, as well as a need to involve key stakeholders, such as local government and business, to a greater degree.

When I questioned the previous First Minister last summer on the fact that work on the first section to be dualled on the A465 had cost three times the initial estimate, he put this down to optimism bias on the part of engineers and other professionals. As the Finance Committee report states, at point 39, this is a particular cause for concern and I am interested in learning of the measures that the

tagfeydd yn rheolaidd ar y ffordd honno, edrychaf ymlaen yr haf hwn at weld y cynlluniau ar gyfer y ffordd newydd yn cael eu cyhoeddi, a fydd yn cysylltu ffordd ddisbarthu ddeheuol Casnewydd â thraffordd yr M4 drwy hen safle Corus. Atebodd y Gweinidog gwestiwn ysgrifenedig a ofynnais yn ddiweddar am y mater hwn, gan ddweud bod disgwyl i'r gwaith adeiladu ddechrau ar y ffordd hon yn gynnar y flwyddyn nesaf, ar gost o £20 miliwn. Anogaf y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod y ffordd hon yn flaenoriaeth wirioneddol yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol sydd ar ddod.

Rhoddodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig groeso cynnes i gadarnhad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ddoe y bydd y cam nesaf yn y gwaith o ddeuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd rhwng Bryn-mawr a Thredegar yn dechrau yn 2012, a bod contract wedi ei ddyfarnu heddiw am £116 miliwn. Mae hwn yn parhau'n brosiect hanfodol, sydd wedi'i daflu i'r cysgod gan y ddadl ynghylch y ffaith y dylai'r Gweinidog dros drafndiaeth gymryd cyfrifoldeb am y llithriant yn y cynllun. Heb os, bu anghysondebau difrifol yn y naill esboniad ar ôl y llall gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad am yr oedi. Gan roi o'r neilltu y dadleuon a'r siomedigaeth yn lleol nad yw'r cynllun i gael ei gwblhau'n gynharach, mae'n galonogol bod y Gweinidog wedi rhoi arwydd mai 2020 fydd y dyddiad cwblhau. Yna, rhaid inni bwysu ar y Llywodraeth i wireddu mwy o'r nodau strategol sydd yn y dogfennau 'Blaenau'r Cymoedd ar y Blaen' a 'Syniadau Blaengar'. Er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd, rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried y sylw yn yr adroddiad fod angen mwy o gydgyssylltu yn rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd rhwng y Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafndiaeth a'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Dai ac Adfywio, a bod angen cynnwys rhanddeiliaid allweddol, megis byd busnes a llywodraeth leol, i raddau helaethach.

Pan holais y Prif Weinidog blaenorol yr haf diwethaf ynghylch y ffaith bod gwaith ar y rhan gyntaf a oedd i'w deuoli ar yr A465 wedi costio deirgwaith cymaint â'r amcangyfrif cychwynnol, dywedodd mai tuedd optimistaeth ar ran y peirianwyr a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill oedd yn gyfrifol am hynny. Fel y dywed adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid, ym mhwynt 39, mae hwn yn

transport Minister has put in place to ensure that the final sections are delivered on time and on budget. To go so far over budget is a major cause for concern, given the damage that it has done in setting back the overall dualling programme, not to mention the negative public perception of such perceived overspending.

The Welsh Conservatives look forward to seeing meaningful action being taken to alleviate the long-term traffic congestion problems on the M4 in the Newport area, a firm resolve to complete the work on the A465 with greater partnership between Assembly Government departments and local businesses, and a more integrated transport system that recognises the importance of east-west transport links and unlocks the economic potential of the Gwent valleys.

**Alun Davies:** I also put on record my thanks to the committee, the staff of the committee, and also the Chair of the committee in guiding and steering the committee through what was, at times, a very fraught inquiry. I reject the Deputy First Minister's criticisms of the report. It was a report that was adopted and supported by the committee as a whole. One of the issues that we had to face, as a committee, was that we were receiving and taking, at times, very consistent evidence, and at other times some very inconsistent evidence. We heard from a wide range of witnesses on this inquiry. They were in unanimous in their views. They had not been consulted by the Government or by the office of the Deputy First Minister. They had very clear views on what should be done in terms of the strategic trunk road programme, and the unanimous view of a wide range of stakeholders was entirely contrary to the programme of the Government.

We had inconsistent evidence from the Deputy First Minister. When we talk about a road programme that was inherited—I will use the Deputy First Minister's terms—I take, as my starting point, the 14 September 2006. On that date, the then Minister,

achos pryder arbennig, a byddai hoffwn glywed am y mesurau y mae'r Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth wedi eu rhoi ar waith i sicrhau cwblhau'r rhannau olaf yn brydlon a heb orwario. Mae'r ffaith bod cymaint o orwario wedi digwydd yn achos pryder mawr, o ystyried y niwed y mae wedi'i wneud o ran arafu'r rhaglen ddeuoli gyffredinol, heb sôn am ganfyddiad negyddol y cyhoedd ynghylch gorwario ymddangosiadol o'r fath.

Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn edrych ymlaen at weld cymryd camau gweithredu ystyrion i liniaru'r problemau hirdymor o ran tagfeydd traffig ar yr M4 yn ardal Casnewydd. Maent hefyd yn edrych ymlaen at weld agwedd benderfynol at gwblhau'r gwaith ar yr A465, gyda mwy o bartneriaeth rhwng adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a busnesau lleol. Ac y maent yn edrych ymlaen at system drafnidiaeth fwy integredig sy'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd cysylltiadau trafnidiaeth dwyrain-gorllewin ac yn datglo potensial economaidd cymoedd Gwent.

**Alun Davies:** Hoffwn i hefyd gofnodi fy niolch i'r pwyllgor, staff y pwyllgor, a Chadeirydd y pwyllgor hefyd am arwain a llywio'r pwyllgor drwy ymchwiliad a oedd, weithiau, yn llawn trafferthion. Gwrthodaf feirniadaeth y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog o'r adroddiad. Yr oedd yn adroddiad a gafodd ei fabwysiadu a'i gefnogi gan y pwyllgor cyfan. Un o'r problemau yr oedd yn rhaid inni eu hwynebu, fel pwyllgor, oedd ein bod yn cael ac yn casglu tystiolaeth a oedd weithiau'n gyson iawn ac yn anghyson iawn bryd arall. Clywsom gan ystod eang o dystion yn yr ymchwiliad hwn. Yr oeddent yn unfrydol eu barn. Nid oedd y Llywodraeth na swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi ymgynghori â hwy. Yr oedd ganddynt farn glir iawn am yr hyn y dylid ei wneud o safbwynt y rhaglen cefnffyrdd strategol, ac yr oedd barn unfrydol ystod eang o randdeiliaid yn gwbl groes i raglen y Llywodraeth.

Cawsom dystiolaeth anghyson gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Pan fyddwn yn sôn am raglen ffyrdd wedi ei hetifeddu—defnyddiaf eiriau'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog—cymeraf 14 Medi 2006 fel fy man cychwyn. Ar y dyddiad hwnnw, gwnaeth Andrew Davies, y

Andrew Davies, made a clear statement:

‘In line with the ‘Heads We Win’ strategic framework for the Heads of the Valleys, it would be the Assembly Government’s intention to complete the remaining sections by 2015.’

That statement was repeated by the Minister, Brian Gibbons, in Plenary and was repeated—ironically enough—by the Deputy First Minister when he took over the role. When he replied to short debate that I tabled in November, he redefined what the inherited programme was. He defined it as this:

‘When I first spoke to my officials in the transport department, I asked them what road schemes we had in the programme, where we were on their implementation, and when we were likely to start and finish those road schemes. The officials gave me a timetable for the Heads of the Valleys road that had a completion date of 2020.’

That date had not been reported to the Assembly at all. However, what the Deputy First Minister had done, in April 2008 and November 2007, was tell the Chamber that there had been no slippage in the programme for the Heads of the Valleys road. There is a clear question to answer. Deputy First Minister, this is not playing politics, this is scrutiny. At what point did you have that discussion with your transport officials? Had you had that discussion before you made a statement to the Assembly that there had been no slippage? You made statements six months after you had taken office and nearly a year after you had taken office. At what point did you know that slippage had taken place?

In terms of what we are seeing with the road programme, Kirsty is wrong to say that we voted for the programme that is being delivered. We voted for a different programme. What we have seen since the Government has taken office is a deprioritisation of the Heads of the Valleys dualling project. During the last Government, between 2003 and 2008, the average annual expenditure on this scheme was £21.7

Gweinidog ar y pryd, ddatganiad clir:

‘Yn unol â’r fframwaith strategol ‘Blaenau’r Cymoedd ar y Blaen’ ar gyfer Blaenau’r Cymoedd, bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fyddai cwblhau’r rhannau sy’n weddill erbyn 2015.’

Ailadroddodd y Gweinidog, Brian Gibbons, y datganiad hwnnw yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, a chafodd ei ailadrodd—yn eironig ddigon—gan y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog pan gymerodd yntau’r awenau. Pan ymatebodd i’r ddadl fer a gyflwynais i ym mis Tachwedd, ailddiffiniodd y rhaglen a etifeddiwyd. Fe’i diffiniodd fel hyn:

‘Pan siaradais gyntaf â’r swyddogion yn yr adran drafnidiaeth, gofynnais iddynt pa gynlluniau ffordd a oedd gennym yn y rhaglen, ble’r oeddem arni o ran eu gweithredu, a phryd yr oeddem yn debygol o ddechrau a gorffen y cynlluniau ffordd hynny. Rhoddodd y swyddogion amserlen imi ar gyfer ffordd Blaenau’r Cymoedd gyda dyddiad cwblhau o 2020.’

Nid oedd y Cynulliad wedi cael gwybod am y dyddiad hwnnw o gwbl. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr oedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi’i wneud, ym mis Ebrill 2008 a mis Tachwedd 2007, oedd dweud wrth y Siambr na fu llithriant yn y rhaglen ar gyfer ffordd Blaenau’r Cymoedd. Mae cwestiwn clir i’w ateb. Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, nid chwarae gwleidyddiaeth yw hyn, ond craffu. Pryd y cawsoch y drafodaeth honno gyda’ch swyddogion trafnidiaeth? A oeddech wedi cael y drafodaeth honno cyn ichi ddweud wrth y Cynulliad na fu llithriant? Gwnaethoch ddatganiadau chwe mis ar ôl cychwyn ar eich swydd, a bron i flwyddyn ar ôl cychwyn ar eich swydd. Pryd yr oeddech yn gwybod bod llithriant wedi digwydd?

O ran yr hyn yr ydym yn ei weld gyda’r rhaglen ffyrdd, mae Kirsty yn anghywir wrth ddweud inni bleidleisio dros y rhaglen sy’n cael ei chyflawni. Bwriasom ein pleidlais dros raglen wahanol. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi’i weld ers i’r Llywodraeth ddod i rym yw dadflaenoriaethu prosiect deuoli ffordd Blaenau’r Cymoedd. Yn ystod y Llywodraeth ddiwethaf, rhwng 2003 a 2008, yr oedd cyfartaledd y gwariant blyneddol ar y cynllun

million. The average annual expenditure by this Government on the Heads of the Valleys scheme, up to next year, is £8.87 million. Money talks. It is clear that the previous Government regarded the Heads of the Valleys scheme as a priority and spent money on it. It is clear that this Government does not regard the Heads of the Valleys dualling project as a priority and has not spent its money on it. Where has that money gone? The concern of the committee was that the 2008 reprioritisation had effectively changed the policy of the Government and that it had been done without consultation or debate, without a discussion at Cabinet and without consultation with any stakeholder.

In the coming financial year, the amount of money spent on north-south links is £61.5 million and the amount of money spent on east-west links is £19.5 million. That reverses Government policy. It reverses the historic trend of policy, going back to 2002-03. Every year, we have seen money invested in the key economic links of Wales, except next year, when we will see a complete reversal of that policy. This is not what the ministerial advisory group advised the Deputy First Minister to do. It is not what was in the 'One Wales' agreement. It was not consulted on or reported on. It was done by slight of hand, in private, and in a way that would avoid scrutiny and debate. That is the conclusion of the report by the Finance Committee. That is scrutiny, Deputy First Minister, and you are yet to respond to that charge.

**David Melding:** I will start by saying that I think that the Deputy First Minister has set a most unfortunate tone for this debate. To completely rubbish a report in that manner is to undermine the legislative and scrutiny functions of the Assembly. I thought that Chris Franks delivered an even less gallant speech. Silently poisoning the well has never been regarded as being a particularly courageous thing to do. I have to tell you, Mr Franks, that you are either dilatory in committee in not raising your objections or you are being disingenuous now. A shameful performance, I have to say. I will give way, if

hwn yn £21.7 miliwn. Cyfartaledd gwariant blynyddol y Llywodraeth hon ar gynllun Blaenau'r Cymoedd, hyd y flwyddyn nesaf, yw £8.87 miliwn. Arian sy'n cyfrif. Mae'n amlwg bod y Llywodraeth flaenorol yn ystyried cynllun Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn flaenoriaeth, a gwariodd arian arno. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r Llywodraeth hon yn ystyried prosiect deuoli ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn flaenoriaeth, ac nid yw wedi gwario ei harian arno. I ble mae'r arian hwnnw wedi mynd? Pryder y pwyllgor oedd bod y gwaith ailflaenoriaethu yn 2008 i bob pwrpas wedi newid polisi'r Llywodraeth, a bod hynny wedi'i wneud heb ymgynghori na dadl, heb drafod yn y Cabinet a heb ymgynghori â'r un rhanddeiliad.

Yn y flwyddyn ariannol sydd i ddod, bydd £61.5 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar gysylltiadau gogledd-de, a bydd £19.5 miliwn yn cael ei wario ar gysylltiadau dwyrain-gorllewin. Mae hynny'n gwrthdroi polisi'r Llywodraeth. Mae'n gwrthdroi tuedd hanesyddol polisi, gan fynd yn ôl i 2002-03. Bob blwyddyn, yr ydym wedi gweld arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi yng nghysylltiadau economaidd allweddol Cymru, ar wahân i'r flwyddyn nesaf pan fyddwn yn gweld gwrthdroi'r polisi hwnnw'n llwyr. Nid dyna oedd cyngor grŵp cynghori'r gweinidog i'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Nid dyna oedd yng nghytundeb 'Cymru'n Un'. Nid ymgynghorwyd yn ei gylch ac nid adroddwyd yn ei gylch. Fe'i gwnaed yn gyfrwys, yn breifat, ac mewn modd a fyddai'n osgoi gwaith craffu a dadlau. Dyna gasgliad yr adroddiad gan y Pwyllgor Cyllid. Craffu yw hynny, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, ac nid ydych eto wedi ymateb i'r cyhuddiad hwnnw.

**David Melding:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddweud fy mod yn credu bod y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi gosod tôn anffodus iawn ar gyfer y ddadl hon. Mae lladd yn llwyr ar adroddiad, fel y gwnaeth, yn tansilio swyddogaethau deddfwriaethol a swyddogaethau craffu'r Cynulliad. Credaf fod Chris Franks wedi traddodi araith a oedd yn llai cwrtais fyth. Nid ystyriwyd erioed fod gwenwyno'r ffynnon yn ddistaw bach yn weithred arbennig o ddewr. Rhaid imi ddweud wrthy, Mr Franks, naill ai yr ydych yn llusgo eich traed yn y pwyllgor, wrth beidio â mynegi eich gwrthwynebiadau,

you would like me to because I think that you deserved that criticism.

**Chris Franks:** I have had extensive discussions with the committee Chair to express my dissatisfaction with this report. I do not know how long those discussions may have lasted—it may have been an hour or two hours. We went through a huge range of issues and hardly any of them were addressed. In the end, I could not sign up to the report, and nor did Mr Asghar, as I understand. I am not sure whether Mr Davies signed up to it—if he did, it was at the very last minute. [*Interruption.*] You did; okay.

6.00 p.m.

**David Melding:** I regret that you do not understand the procedures of the Assembly or the protocols that apply. If you disagree with a report, you have to vote against it in committee, and you require the committee to take a vote. If it is so fundamentally flawed, that is what you do. You should be congratulated on being able to discuss a huge range, as you put it, of objections in just one hour. We have at least proven that you were dilatory in your performance.

The Deputy First Minister created a huge diversion in saying that the committee's report was not credible because it did not understand that the Welsh Assembly Government did not have a £16 billion budget, but that it had a £14.5 billion revenue budget and a £1.5 billion capital budget. Those combine to make about £16 billion. That appears to be a distinction without a difference, and it comes from a man who has just promised a £20 billion increase in pensions in the United Kingdom, which is to be funded year in year out by the £20 billion saved on Trident. How many of us realised that the replacement of Trident would cost £20 billion each year for the next 20 or 30 years? There is a profound misunderstanding of the difference between revenue and capital, but he presumed to dismiss the report in a wild, hyperbolic fashion.

ynteu yr ydych yn bod yn annidwyll yn awr. Perfformiad gwarthus, rhaid imi ddweud. Ildiaf, os hoffech imi ildio, oherwydd credaf eich bod yn haeddu'r feirniadaeth honno.

**Chris Franks:** Yr wyf wedi cael trafodaethau helaeth gyda Chadeirydd y pwyllgor i fynegi fy anffodlonrwydd â'r adroddiad hwn. Ni wn am ba hyd y parodd y trafodaethau hynny—gallent fod yn awr neu'n ddwy awr o hyd. Aethom drwy ystod enfawr o faterion, ac ni roddwyd sylw bron i'r un ohonynt. Yn y diwedd, ni allwn gymeradwyo'r adroddiad, ac ni wnaeth Mr Asghar ychwaith, fel y deallaf. Nid wyf yn siŵr a gafodd ei gymeradwyo gan Mr Davies—os gwnaeth, ar y funud olaf y digwyddodd hynny. [*Torri ar draws.*] Gwnaethoch; iawn.

**David Melding:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad ydych yn deall gweithdrefnau'r Cynulliad neu'r protocolau sy'n berthnasol. Os ydych yn anghytuno ag adroddiad, rhaid ichi bleidleisio yn ei erbyn yn y pwyllgor, a mynnu bod y pwyllgor yn pleidleisio. Os oes cymaint o wallau sylfaenol ynddo, dyna y dylech ei wneud. Dylid eich llongyfarch ar allu trafod ystod enfawr, fel y dywedaso, o wrthwynebiadau mewn awr yn unig. O leiaf yr ydym wedi profi ichi lusgo eich traed.

Creodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wyriad enfawr pan ddywedodd nad oedd adroddiad y pwyllgor yn gredadwy am nad oedd yn deall nad oedd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyllideb o £16 biliwn, ond bod ganddi, yn hytrach, gyllideb refeniw o £14.5 biliwn a chyllideb gyfalaf o £1.5 biliwn. Mae'r rheini'n cyfuno i roi cyfanswm o ryw £16 biliwn. Ymddengys ei fod yn wahaniaeth diwahaniaeth, ac fe'i nodir gan ddyn sydd newydd addo cynnydd o £20 biliwn mewn pensïynau yn y Deyrnas Unedig, sydd i'w ariannu'r naill flwyddyn ar ôl y llall gan yr £20 biliwn a arbedir ar Trident. Faint ohonom oedd yn sylweddoli y byddai disodli Trident yn costio £20 biliwn bob blwyddyn am yr 20 neu'r 30 mlynedd nesaf? Mae camddealltwriaeth enbyd o'r gwahaniaeth rhwng refeniw a chyfalaf, ond mentrodd ddiystyru'r adroddiad yn wyllt gan orddweud.

In his written response, the Deputy First Minister was much more cautious. He adopted that old trick of the Government's of saying, 'Yes, that is a point, but we are disappointed that you did not recognise that we have already made those changes.' That is what he said about the connection to wider objectives regarding regeneration and having an integrated approach to transport—not just with regard to roads, but the whole area of transport—and also about strengthening the management of the transport programme.

I will quote the written response, which, under the heading 'An improved focus on delivery', says:

'We have changed the organisational structure of the Assembly Government to sharpen our focus on delivery, as well as ensuring that we have staff with the right transport planning, civil engineering, procurement, project management and programme management skills.'

What a relief that he has the people in his department who can perform the basic skills required to carry out transport planning and delivery. Yet, he pretends to be angry, dismisses a report and insults the work of a cross-party committee of the Assembly.

In the short time that remains, I want to talk about issues on which we agree. The A470 does need to be improved. In fact, I went up to Llandudno and back at the weekend and could see some of the improvements. As a party, we do not have a problem with that, but they do have to be balanced against other strategic issues. The A470 is being improved for strategic reasons as well as reasons of national unity and because of social concerns. They do impinge on transport; you cannot just look at it in a utilitarian, economic way, and we accept that. However, the A465 is the strategic route that is most in need of being developed at the moment, and it is crucial to the regeneration of the Valleys. Members who represent the Valleys areas have a right to be frustrated at the rate of progress over the years, and not just recently; I would concede that. We need a modern road infrastructure for the Welsh economy. We

Yn ei ymateb ysgrifenedig, yr oedd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog yn fwy gofalus o lawer. Mabwysiadodd hen dric y Llywodraeth o ddweud, 'Ydi, mae'n bwynt, ond yr ydym yn siomedig nad oeddech yn cydnabod ein bod eisoes wedi gwneud y newidiadau hynny.' Dyna a ddywedodd am y cysylltiad ag amcanion ehangach ynghylch adfywio a chael modd integredig o ymdrin â thrafnidiaeth—nid yn unig o ran ffyrdd, ond o ran holl faes trafndiaeth—a dyna a ddywedodd hefyd ynglŷn â chryfhau rheoli'r rhaglen drafnidiaeth.

Dyfynnaf yr ymateb ysgrifenedig, sy'n dweud dan y pennawd sy'n sôn am well ffocws ar gyflawni:

Yr ydym wedi newid strwythur trefniadaethol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i wella ein ffocws ar gyflawni, yn ogystal â sicrhau bod gennym staff sydd â'r sgiliau iawn mewn peirianeg sifil, cynllunio trafndiaeth, caffael, rheoli prosiectau a rheoli rhaglenni.

Diolch byth bod ganddo'r bobl yn ei adran sydd â'r sgiliau sylfaenol gofynnol i gynllunio a darparu trafndiaeth. Eto i gyd, mae'n ffugio bod yn flin, yn diystyru adroddiad ac yn sarhau gwaith un o bwyllgorau trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad.

Yn yr amser byr sydd ar ôl, yr wyf am siarad am faterion yr ydym yn cytuno arnynt. Mae angen gwella'r A470. Mewn gwirionedd, euthum i fyny i Landudno ac yn ôl dros y penwythnos, a gallwn weld rhai o'r gwelliannau. Fel plaid, nid oes gennym broblem gyda hynny, ond rhaid eu cloriannu yn erbyn materion strategol eraill. Mae'r A470 yn cael ei gwella am resymau strategol yn ogystal â rhesymau'n ymwneud ag undod cenedlaethol ac oherwydd pryderon cymdeithasol. Mae'r materion hynny'n effeithio ar drafnidiaeth; ni allwch edrych ar y mater mewn modd iwtilitaraidd, economaidd yn unig, ac yr ydym yn derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr A465 yw'r llwybr strategol y mae angen ei ddatblygu fwyaf ar hyn o bryd, ac mae'n hanfodol i adfywio'r Cymoedd. Mae gan yr Aelodau sy'n cynrychioli ardaloedd y Cymoedd hawl i deimlo rhwystredigaeth am gyflymder

require a whole range of responses to modern transport development, and roads and their construction are essential and will be for many years to come.

**The Deputy First Minister and Minister for the Economy and Transport (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I am afraid that Alun Davies has let the cat out of the bag. What was interesting about Alun's contribution was that he was not speaking to the recommendations of the report. Let me tell him what the report recommends. He is a member of the committee, and he signed it off. So, just to remind you, Alun, this is what it says:

'While the Finance Committee could see that there were signs of a change in emphasis from east-west to north-south there was so much poor management and uncertainty within the programme that it was very difficult to come to a clear view.'

Your view today is entirely different. What you said today, which you repeated—*[Interruption.]* No, I have listened to your speech; now you have to listen to mine. Let me make this point clear to you, Alun: you had a short debate, and your arguments were totally demolished. You are saying today that this Assembly Government has allowed slippage to happen with regard to the Heads of the Valleys road. This inquiry was set up to determine that. That was the smoking gun that Kirsty Williams mentioned; it was what this committee was supposed to find out. The reality is that it has failed to find it out because there is no conclusion in this report that this Government has caused the slippage of the Heads of the Valleys road. That is the truth of the matter.

**Alun Davies** *rose—*

**The Deputy First Minister:** I am not giving way, Alun. I will repeat the point again: this Government has not caused any slippage whatsoever in the work on the Heads of the

cynnydd ar hyd y blynyddoedd, ac nid yn ddiweddar yn unig; byddwn yn fodlon cyfaddef hynny. Mae arnom angen seilwaith ffyrdd modern ar gyfer economi Cymru. Mae arnom angen ystod lawn o ymatebion i ddatblygu trafndiaeth fodern, ac mae ffyrdd a'r gwaith o'u hadeiladu yn hanfodol, a byddant yn hanfodol am flynyddoedd i ddod.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros yr Economi a Thrafnidiaeth (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Mae arnaf ofn fod Alun Davies wedi gollwng y gath o'r cwd. Yr hyn a oedd yn ddiddorol am gyfraniad Alun oedd nad oedd yn siarad am argymhellion yr adroddiad. Gadewch imi ddweud wrtho beth mae'r adroddiad yn ei argymhell. Mae'n aelod o'r pwyllgor, a chymeradwyodd yr adroddiad. Felly, i'ch atgoffa, Alun, dyma a ddywed:

'Er y gallai'r Pwyllgor Cyllid weld arwyddion o newid pwyslais o ran dwyrain-gorllewin a gogledd-de, roedd cymaint o ddiffyg rheolaeth ac ansicrwydd o fewn y rhaglen fel ei bod yn anodd dod i benderfyniad clir.'

Mae eich barn heddiw yn gwbl wahanol. Yr hyn a ddywedasoch heddiw, ac a ailadroddwyd gennych—*[Torri ar draws.]* Na, yr wyf wedi gwrandao ar eich araith chi; rhaid i chi wrando ar fy araith i'n awr. Gadewch imi wneud y pwynt hwn yn glir ichi, Alun: cawsoch ddadl fer, a chwalwyd eich dadleuon yn llwyr. Yr ydych yn dweud heddiw bod y Llywodraeth hon yn y Cynulliad wedi caniatáu i lithriant ddigwydd yng nghyswllt ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Sefydlwyd yr ymchwiliad hwn i benderfynu hynny. Dyna oedd y dystiolaeth bendant y soniodd Kirsty Williams amdani; dyna oedd y pwyllgor hwn i fod i'w ddarganfod. Y gwir amdani yw ei fod wedi methu â'i ddarganfod, oherwydd nid oes yr un casgliad yn yr adroddiad hwn fod y Llywodraeth hon wedi achosi'r llithriant yng nghyswllt ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Dyna'r gwir amdani.

**Alun Davies** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Nid wyf am ildio, Alun. Ailadroddaf y pwynt eto: nid yw'r Llywodraeth hon wedi achosi llithriant o gwbl yng nghyswllt y gwaith ar ffordd



Valleys road.

The committee heard evidence from me, which was that our priority was to improve north-south links, but that I also regarded it as an equal priority to deliver the Heads of the Valleys programme. The previous Government published two documents, which I think William mentioned earlier. These documents were entitled 'Turning Heads' and 'Heads We Win'. Both documents state that the Heads of the Valleys road should be completed by 2020. When I went to speak to my officials, after I was given the post of Minister, and asked them, 'Is that deliverable by 2020?' They said 'yes'. I then asked how it could be funded, and I spent time listening and talking to my officials. I concluded that it could be funded, provided we could secure more funding than we had in our core budget. I therefore secured extra funding from the strategic capital investment fund and from European programmes. I have now made it clear that I am committed to the delivery of the Heads of the Valleys programme.

I also thank William for something that I heard from him, though not from Alun. He congratulated the Government on making the announcement on the new section of the Heads of the Valleys road, which I announced yesterday. I would have expected Alun to congratulate me on that, but he did not take the opportunity to do so. *[Interruption.]*

**Alun Davies** *rose—*

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Alun, please sit down. The Deputy First Minister is about to wind up because we are out of time.

**The Deputy First Minister:** What we have decided to do is carry on this programme. We are committed to delivering the programme, and we have set the contract for its next stage. We are therefore delivering on it.

The other point that has been made is that there has been a lack of consultation. Two

Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Clywodd y pwyllgor dystiolaeth gennyf, sef mai ein blaenoriaeth oedd gwella cysylltiadau gogledd-de, ond fy mod hefyd yn ystyried bod cyflawni rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn flaenoriaeth gyfartal. Cyhoeddodd y Llywodraeth flaenorol ddwy ddogfen, a chredaf i William eu crybwyll yn gynharach. Teitlau'r dogfennau hynny oedd 'Syniadau Blaengar' a 'Blaenau'r Cymoedd ar y Blaen'. Mae'r ddwy ddogfen yn dweud y dylai ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd gael ei chwblhau erbyn 2020. Pan euthum i siarad â'm swyddogion, ar ôl dod i swydd Gweinidog, a gofyn iddynt 'A yw'n bosibl cwblhau hynny erbyn 2020?', 'ydy' oedd eu hateb. Yna, gofynnais sut y gellid ei hariannu, a threuliais amser yn gwranddo ar fy swyddogion ac yn siarad â hwy. Deuthum i'r casgliad y gellid ei hariannu, cyn belled â'n bod yn gallu sicrhau mwy o arian nag a oedd gennym yn ein cyllideb graidd. Felly, sicrhais arian ychwanegol o'r gronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf strategol ac o raglenni Ewropeaidd. Yr wyf yn awr wedi gwneud yn glir fy mod wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Diolch i William hefyd am rywbeth a glywais ganddo ef, ond nid gan Alun. Llongyfarchodd y Llywodraeth ar y cyhoeddiad am ran newydd ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, a wneuthum ddoe. Byddwn wedi disgwyl i Alun fy llongyfarch ar y cyhoeddiad, ond ni fanteisiodd ar y cyfle i wneud hynny. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Alun Davies** *a gododd—*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Trefn. Alun, eisteddwch. Mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog ar fin gorffen oherwydd mae ein hamser ar ben.

**Y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog:** Yr hyn yr ydym wedi penderfynu ei wneud yw parhau'r rhaglen hon. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i gyflawni'r rhaglen, ac yr ydym wedi gosod y contract ar gyfer ei cham nesaf. Felly, yr ydym wrthi'n ei chyflawni.

Y pwynt arall sydd wedi'i wneud yw'r diffyg ymgynghori a fu. Dwy ddogfen sy'n

documents that are crucial to this but that the committee has ignored for some reason are the Wales transport strategy and the national transport plan. Both documents have gone to Cabinet, both documents have been endorsed, and both documents include all of the programmes that have been set out in the trunk road forward programme. All of the programmes that have been set out in the trunk road forward programme have gone into the national transport plan, which has been endorsed by the Cabinet, and if the committee had bothered to look at the Cabinet minutes, it would have found that. It is clear. It is the truth of the matter. Not only has there been consultation, there has been a 12-week consultation period, and there has also been extensive consultation with local government. The programme is aligned with local government priorities because each authority in Wales is a member of one of the regional transport consortia, which feed into the priorities that we have for the strategy. This is what I am saying: they set out to embarrass the Minister. They wanted to find the smoking gun. They failed to find it, and, unfortunately, they embarrassed themselves.

**Angela Burns:** Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer, I have never been in this situation before so I am going to rely upon you to tell me when you think that I should not be saying certain things that I am about to say. Given that the Minister dislikes this report so much, he has spent his time here today, with his party's support—not the support of the Government, of which he is a part—trying to trash the Finance Committee, the members of the Finance Committee and the Chair of the Finance Committee.

6.10 p.m.

I salute Labour Ministers. I salute them because, time and again, when committees have produced reports that have been critical and have raised serious issues, they have taken them, absorbed them, set forward their responses, and they have accepted that the committees have worked in the best interest. I object most strongly to being accused in this Chamber of deliberately trying to embarrass

hollbwysig o ran hynny, ond sydd wedi eu hanwybyddu gan y pwyllgor am ryw reswm, yw strategaeth drafnidiaeth Cymru a'r cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol. Mae'r ddwy ddogfen wedi bod gerbron y Cabinet, mae'r ddwy ddogfen wedi'u cymeradwyo, ac mae'r ddwy ddogfen yn cynnwys yr holl raglenni sydd wedi'u gosod allan yn y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd. Mae'r holl raglenni sydd wedi'u gosod allan yn y flaenraglen cefnffyrdd wedi'u cynnwys yn y cynllun trafndiaeth cenedlaethol, sydd wedi'i gymeradwyo gan y Cabinet, a phe bai'r pwyllgor wedi trafferthu edrych ar gofnodion y Cabinet, byddai wedi gweld hynny. Mae'n glir. Dyna'r gwir amdani. Nid hyn unig bu ymgynghori, bu cyfnod ymgynghori o 12 wythnos, ac ymgynghorwyd yn helaeth hefyd â llywodraeth leol. Mae'r rhaglen yn cydreddeg â blaenoriaethau llywodraeth leol, oherwydd mae pob awdurdod yng Nghymru yn aelod o un o'r consortia trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, sy'n cyfrannu at y blaenoriaethau sydd gennym ar gyfer y strategaeth. Dyma'r wyf yn ei ddweud: eu bwriad oedd codi cywilydd ar y Gweinidog. Yr oeddent am ddod o hyd i dystiolaeth bendant. Ni ddaethant o hyd iddi, ac yn anffodus maent wedi codi cywilydd arnynt eu hunain.

**Angela Burns:** Ddirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro, nid wyf wedi bod yn y sefyllfa hon erioed o'r blaen, felly, byddaf yn dibynnu arnoch i ddweud wrthyf os credwch na ddylwn fod yn dweud rhai o'r pethau yr wyf ar fin eu dweud. O ystyried bod y Gweinidog yn casáu'r adroddiad gymaint, mae wedi treulio ei amser yma heddiw, gyda chefnogaeth ei blaid—nid cefnogaeth y Llywodraeth y mae'n rhan ohoni—yn ceisio lladd ar y Pwyllgor Cyllid, aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyllid a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyllid.

Yr wyf yn canmol Gweinidogion y Blaid Lafur. Yr wyf yn eu canmol am eu bod, dro ar ôl tro, pan fydd pwyllgorau wedi cynhyrchu adroddiadau sydd wedi bod yn feiriadol ac wedi codi materion difrifol, maent wedi eu cymryd, wedi eu derbyn, wedi cyflwyno'u hymatebion ac wedi derbyn bod y pwyllgorau wedi gweithio er budd pawb. Yr wyf yn gwrthwynebu'n gryf iawn gael fy

the Deputy First Minister. This was an inquiry into how the funding of the road infrastructure in Wales brings economic benefit and good value for money for the Welsh pound. This report is an absolute indictment of the transport department. I would have thought that the Minister would have taken this report and thought, 'Great; I now have ammunition with which to go back to my civil servants to improve the return for the Welsh pound'. Instead, the Deputy First Minister has taken some examples from the report, which he has judiciously used in speaking to us today. I could go through them but I know that I only have three minutes to speak, and I also want to deal with the subject of Chris Franks.

The Deputy First Minister says that the Finance Committee was surprised by the use of the words,

“Subject to completion of statutory consent procedures and the availability of finance” as a justification for not meeting targets.’

If you read the whole thing, you will see that what it actually says is that when you are out to meet a target, you actually build in that kind of thing so that you have it there. You do not use it as an excuse on a routine basis.

Chris, I was not going to bring this up, but you have absolutely led this Assembly astray. You came to see me and my clerking team with around 26 or 28 points. There is so much evidence to the Finance Committee on the slipshod way that the trunk road programme is run that we actually provided every single committee member with a bound copy of the evidence. Do you recall it? It is that thick. I will happily bring it here and show it to people. I sat with you and the clerking team, and with Members' research service staff, who do not make mistakes about the numbers in here, and we went through all of those points. To your chagrin, you could not find any of them stacking up because, within that evidence, we answered every single point. Instead, you did a disappearing act because you knew that you would have to come here today and defend

ngyhuddo yn y Siambr hon o geisio codi cywilydd yn fwriadol ar y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Ymchwiliad oedd hwn i'r modd y mae gwaith ariannu'r seilwaith ffyrdd yng Nghymru yn dod â budd economaidd a gwerth da am yr arian i'r bunt Gymreig. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn feirniadaeth lwyr o'r adran drafnidiaeth. Byddwn yn meddwl y byddai'r Gweinidog wedi cymryd yr adroddiad ac wedi meddwl, 'Gwych; mae gennyf arfogaeth yn awr y gallaf fynd â hi'n ôl at fy ngweision sifil i wella'r hyn a gawn am y bunt Gymreig'. Yn hytrach, mae'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog wedi cymryd rhai enghreifftiau o'r adroddiad ac wedi eu defnyddio'n ddoeth iawn wrth siarad â ni heddiw. Gallwn fynd drwyddynt, ond gwn mai tair munud yn unig sydd gennyf i siarad, ac yr wyf am ymdrin â Chris Franks hefyd.

Dywed y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fod y Pwyllgor Cyllid wedi synnu o weld y geiriau hyn yn cael eu defnyddio,

“Subject to completion of statutory consent procedures and the availability of finance”...i gyfiawnhau peidio â chwrdd â thargedau.’

O ddarllen y cyfan, fe welwch mai'r hyn a ddywed mewn gwirionedd yw y byddwch, wrth geisio cyrraedd targed, yn ymgorffori'r math hwnnw o beth fel ei fod gennych. Ni fyddwch yn ei ddefnyddio'n rheolaidd fel esgus.

Chris, nid oeddwn am grybwyll hyn, ond yr ydych wedi camarwain y Cynulliad hwn yn llwyr. Daethoch i'm gweld i a'm tîm clericio gyda rhyw 26 neu 28 o bwyntiau. Cyflwynwyd cymaint o dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Cyllid am y modd esgeulus y caiff y rhaglen cefnffyrdd ei rhedeg nes inni ddarparu copi wedi'i rwymo o'r dystiolaeth i bob aelod o'r pwyllgor. A ydych yn ei gofio? Mae mor drwchus â hynny. Yr wyf yn fodlon dod ag ef yma a'i ddangos i bobl. Eisteddais gyda chi a'r tîm clericio, a chyda staff gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau nad ydynt yn gwneud camgymeriadau am y rhifau sydd yma, ac aethom drwy'r holl bwyntiau. Er mawr siom ichi, ni allech weld bod yr un ohonynt yn dal dŵr, oherwydd yn y dystiolaeth honno atebwyd pob un pwynt. Diflanasoch wedyn, oherwydd gwyddech y byddai'n rhaid ichi ddod yma heddiw ac

the Deputy First Minister. I did not want this to be politically nasty and personal, but it was you, Deputy First Minister, started this. You have impugned my reputation and the committee. You should take this report back to your civil servants and say, 'Wales needs to be better served. How can we do better?'

amddiffyn y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog. Nid oeddwn am i'r ddadl fod yn wleidyddol gas ac yn bersonol, ond chi, Ddirprwy Brif Weinidog, a ddechreuodd hyn. Yr ydych wedi lladd ar fy enw da i a'r pwyllgor. Dylech fynd â'r adroddiad hwn yn ôl at eich gweision sifil a dweud, 'Mae angen inni wasanaethu Cymru yn well. Sut y gallwn wneud yn well?'

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** The proposal is to note the Finance Committee's report. Does any Member object? I see that there are no objections. Therefore, the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order No. 7.35.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Y cynnig yw ein bod yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad. Felly, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 7.35, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion agreed.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Alun Davies:** Point of order. During the last debate on the Finance Committee report on the trunk road programme, the Deputy First Minister, in replying to the debate, used my name on a number of occasions. I believe that he abused the procedures and the Standing Orders of the Assembly in not allowing me an opportunity to reply to the points that he was making. I tried to intervene on a number of occasions but he refused to allow an intervention despite using my name repeatedly during his speech. I believe that that is a very real abuse of the privileges that we have in this Chamber, and I would like a ruling on the matter.

**Alun Davies:** Pwynt o drefn. Yn ystod y ddadl ddiwethaf ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ar y rhaglen cefnffyrdd, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy Brif Weinidog fy enw droeon wrth ymateb i'r ddadl. Credaf iddo gamddefnyddio gweithdrefnau a Rheolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad trwy beidio â rhoi cyfle imi ymateb i'r pwyntiau yr oedd yn eu gwneud. Ceisiais ymyrryd droeon, ond gwrthododd dderbyn ymyriad er iddo ddefnyddio fy enw droeon yn ei araith. Credaf fod hynny'n gamddefnyddio gwirioneddol ar y breintiau sydd gennym yn y Siambr hon, a hoffwn ddyfarniad ar y mater.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** Thank you for that point of order, Alun. I think that you are aware, as all of us are, that not only have we just had a very robust debate in which very strong views were put on either side, but that it is up to the individual Member to take an intervention or not. Therefore, that is not really a matter for me.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Diolch ichi am y pwynt hwnnw o drefn, Alun. Credaf eich bod yn ymwybodol, fel pob un ohonom, ein bod nid yn unig newydd gael dadl rymus iawn, lle cyflwynwyd safbwyntiau cryf iawn gan y naill ochr a'r llall, ond mai'r Aelod unigol sydd i benderfynu a yw am dderbyn ymyriad ai peidio. Felly, nid yw hynny'n fater i mi mewn gwirionedd.

## Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig Welsh Conservatives Debate

### Cau Ysgolion School Closures

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** The Presiding Officer has selected amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt and amendments 2 and 3 in my name.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Mae'r Llywydd wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt a gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn fy enw i.

**Paul Davies:** I move that

**Paul Davies:** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that before a school is closed full consideration is given to:*

1. *yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod ystyriaeth lawn yn cael ei rhoi i'r canlynol cyn cau ysgol:*

(a) *its standard of education;*

(a) *safon yr addysg;*

(b) *the importance of that school in the community;*

(b) *pwysigrwydd yr ysgol honno yn y gymuned;*

(c) *any new future residential planning applications which could secure its future viability; and*

(c)  *unrhyw geisiadau cynllunio preswyl newydd yn y dyfodol a allai sicrhau ei hyfywedd i'r dyfodol; a*

2. *believes that a proper and robust consultation process must be put in place at an early stage of a proposed school closure. (NDM4435)*

2. *yn credu y dylid rhoi proses ymgynghori briodol a chadarn ar waith yn gynnar pan fydd bwriad i gau ysgol. (NDM4435)*

It gives me great pleasure to propose the motion tabled in the name of Alun Cairns on behalf of the Welsh Conservatives. We have tabled this debate because concerns around school reorganisation are raised with me as the education spokesperson for the Welsh Conservatives, and with other Members, on a regular basis. Parents across Wales are becoming increasingly concerned about the way that school reorganisations are being handled. I know that we were told by the previous First Minister last year that 170 schools across Wales need to close in order to tackle surplus school places. I accept that there are thousands of surplus places in schools across Wales, and I am not arguing that all schools must remain open. The subject of school closures is an extremely sensitive issue, and I know that it concerns every Member.

Pleser o'r mwyaf yw cael dwyn gerbron y cynnig a gyflwynwyd yn enw Alun Cairns ar ran y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r ddadl hon oherwydd caiff pryderon ynghylch ad-drefnu ysgolion eu codi gyda mi fel llefarydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ar addysg, a chydag Aelodau eraill, yn rheolaidd. Mae rhieni ledled Cymru yn pryderu mwyfwy am y modd yr ymdrinnir ag ad-drefnu ysgolion. Gwn fod y cyn-Brif Weinidog wedi dweud wrthym y llynedd fod angen cau 170 o ysgolion ledled Cymru er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion. Derbyniaf fod miloedd o leoedd gwag mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru, ac nid wyf yn dadlau ei bod yn rhaid cadw pob ysgol ar agor. Mae cau ysgolion yn fater sensitif iawn, a gwn ei fod yn peri pryder i bob Aelod.

In most cases, schools not only provide education for our children, but are true community centres. For example, where a village does not have a hall, the school is used for social activities. Schools are at the heart of our communities, particularly in rural areas. They are a valuable community resource, especially where public services, such as post offices and libraries, have been removed. Closing a small rural school, particularly in a Welsh-speaking area, is like ripping the heart out of that community. Therefore, it is crucial that any decisions to close schools be taken on the basis of not only education, but their impact on the culture and language of the communities. That is why robust community impact assessments must be undertaken in all cases in which schools are earmarked for closure. The Welsh Assembly Government has issued guidance to local authorities stating that they will need to consider

‘the impact that proposals may have on local families and the local community, through the preparation of a community impact assessment’.

However, that is not statutory. After all, it is only guidance. It goes on to say that it

‘sets out the policy context and general principles, policies and issues which have a bearing on reviewing the provision of school places’.

Some of the schools earmarked for closure across Wales provide high-quality education, which is borne out by Estyn reports. Take some of the schools in Powys for example. These are some of the best performing schools in the country, yet many are faced with potential closure. Closing good schools must surely be avoided at every opportunity. No school that is able to deliver the national curriculum should be forced to close without the agreement of parents, teachers and governors. Where a school is earmarked for closure, it is essential that robust consultation processes be put in place and that education authorities listen to the voice of the communities that they serve.

Yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, nid yn unig y mae ysgolion yn darparu addysg i'n plant, ond maent yn ganolfannau cymunedol go iawn. Er enghraifft, os nad oes neuadd mewn pentref, cynhelir gweithgareddau cymdeithasol yn yr ysgol. Ysgolion yw calon ein cymunedau, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig. Maent yn adnodd cymunedol gwerthfawr, yn enwedig os yw gwasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill megis swyddfeydd post a llyfrgelloedd wedi'u cau. Mae cau ysgol fach wledig, yn enwedig mewn ardal Cymraeg ei hiaith, fel rhwygo'r galon allan o'r gymuned honno. Felly, mae'n hollbwysig i unrhyw benderfyniadau i gau ysgolion gael eu gwneud ar sail yr effaith y bydd hynny'n ei chael ar ddiwylliant ac iaith y cymunedau, yn ogystal ag ar sail addysg. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid cael asesiadau cadarn o'r effaith ar y gymuned ym mhob achos lle clustnodir ysgolion i'w cau. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi canllawiau i awdurdodau lleol yn dweud y bydd angen iddynt ystyried

‘sut y gallai'r cynnig effeithio ar deuluoedd lleol a'r gymuned leol, drwy gynnal asesiad o'r effaith ar y gymuned’.

Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n statudol. Wedi'r cyfan, dim ond canllawiau ydynt. Mae'r ddogfen yn mynd rhagddi i ddweud ei bod

‘yn amlinellu'r cyd-destun polisi a'r egwyddorion cyffredinol, y polisiau a'r materion ar gyfer adolygu darpariaeth lleoedd ysgolion’.

Mae rhai o'r ysgolion sydd wedi'u clustnodi i'w cau ledled Cymru yn darparu addysg o safon uchel, a chadarnhawyd hynny gan adroddiadau Estyn. Ystyriwch rai o'r ysgolion ym Mhowys, er enghraifft. Mae'r rhain ymysg yr ysgolion sy'n perfformio orau yn y wlad, ac eto i gyd mae nifer ohonynt yn wynebu posibilrwydd eu cau. Nid oes bosibl na ddylid osgoi cau ysgolion da ar bob cyfle. Ni ddylid gorfodi unrhyw ysgol sy'n gallu cyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol i gau heb gydsyniad y rhieni, yr athrawon a'r llywodraethwyr. Os clustnodir ysgol i'w chau, mae'n hollbwysig rhoi prosesau ymgynghori cadarn ar waith, a bod yr awdurdodau addysg yn gwrandao ar lais y

cymunedau y maent yn eu gwasanaethu.

A good education opens the door to life opportunities. Not only does a good school teach children reading, writing and arithmetic, but it inspires young people to learn, to follow their interests, and to become responsible adults. I accept that school rolls must be considered in funding each school, but the most important factor is the effect of the closure on the wider community. Closing a school can mean that children have to travel to access their education. That has an environmental impact, as parents and education authorities run more vehicles.

Before closing a school, consideration must be given to planning applications in the area. Time after time, I am told that schools are earmarked for closure with no regard for planned housing developments, which could improve their viability. Closing a school can also have a huge impact on a community's local economy. For example, pupils attending secondary schools can double the size of a town's population, in many cases. Many pupils use the town's facilities before and after school, and during lunch times, boosting the economy. Those pupils will bring their parents with them, when calling for or dropping off their children at school, and parents will also use the town's amenities. There would therefore be a significant economic impact on communities in which schools are to close. That is why we must look at all the alternatives before a school is finally closed.

School buildings can be used to house libraries, re-establish post offices, host community meetings, concerts and other community purposes. Most school buildings are redundant after 3.30 p.m. Monday to Friday, and are closed for the weekends and the holidays. We must look at innovative ways of making schools more viable if a particular school is seen to be unviable by the authorities. For example, in some cases, some schools have spare rooms that could be leased or rented to local businesses, thereby making that school more viable. All these options should be considered before closing the doors of a school for the last time.

Mae addysg dda yn agor drysau i gyfleoedd mewn bywyd. Mae ysgol dda yn gwneud mwy nag addysgu sgiliau darllen, ysgrifennu a rhifo i blant: mae'n ysbrydoli pobl ifanc i ddysgu, dilyn eu diddordebau a dod yn oedolion cyfrifol. Derbyniaf ei bod yn rhaid ystyried nifer y disgyblion ar y gofrestr wrth ariannu pob ysgol, ond y ffactor pwysicaf yw'r effaith y bydd cau'r ysgol yn ei chael ar y gymuned ehangach. Gall cau ysgol olygu bod plant yn gorfod teithio i gael eu haddysg. Caiff hynny effaith ar yr amgylchedd, wrth i rieni ac awdurdodau addysg ddefnyddio mwy o gerbydau.

Cyn cau ysgol, rhaid ystyried ceisiadau cynllunio yn yr ardal. Dro ar ôl tro, caf wybod bod ysgolion yn cael eu clustnodi i'w cau heb roi dim ystyriaeth i ddatblygiadau tai arfaethedig, a allai wella eu hyfywedd. Gall cau ysgol gael effaith aruthrol ar economi leol cymuned hefyd. Er enghraifft, gall disgyblion sy'n mynychu ysgolion uwchradd ddyblu maint poblogaeth tref mewn nifer o achosion. Mae llawer o ddisgyblion yn defnyddio cyfleusterau'r dref cyn ac ar ôl ysgol ac yn ystod amser cinio, sy'n rhoi hwb i'r economi. Bydd y disgyblion hynny'n dod â'u rhieni gyda hwy, pan fyddant yn mynd â'u plant i'r ysgol neu'n eu casglu oddi yno, a bydd y rhieni hefyd yn defnyddio cyfleusterau'r dref. Felly, bydd cau'r ysgol yn cael effaith economaidd sylweddol ar y cymunedau dan sylw. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid inni ystyried y dewisiadau eraill cyn cau ysgol yn derfynol.

Gellir rhoi llyfrgelloedd mewn adeiladau ysgolion, a defnyddio'r adeiladau i ailsefydlu swyddfeydd post, cynnal cyfarfodydd cymunedol a chyngherddau, a'u defnyddio at ddibenion cymunedol eraill. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o adeiladau ysgolion yn wag ar ôl 3.30pm rhwng dydd Llun a dydd Gwener, ac ar gau dros y penwythnos ac yn ystod y gwyliau. Rhaid inni ystyried ffyrdd arloesol i wneud ysgolion yn fwy hyfyw os yw'r awdurdodau'n ystyried bod cynnal ysgol benodol yn anymarferol. Er enghraifft, mewn rhai achosion mae gan rai ysgolion ystafelloedd gwag y gellid eu rhentu neu eu gosod i fusnesau lleol, a thrwy hynny wneud yr ysgol yn fwy hyfyw. Dylid ystyried pob un

o'r dewisiadau hyn cyn cau drysau ysgol am y tro olaf.

I also believe that federation can be an important element in avoiding the closure of some of our schools. By working in federation, there is mutual support for the teaching staff, and individual expertise can be developed across a number of schools, spreading the bureaucratic burden. The federation of schools can allow for the employment of certain staff who can perform all the administrative functions of a number of schools across the area, thereby making individual schools more viable.

Credaf hefyd y gall ffedereiddio fod yn elfen bwysig wrth geisio osgoi cau rhai o'n hysgolion. Trwy ffedereiddio gall staff addysgu gynnig cymorth i'w gilydd, a gellir datblygu arbenigedd unigol ar draws nifer o ysgolion, gan rannu'r baich o ran biwrocratiaeth. Gall ffedereiddio ysgolion olygu bod modd cyflogi aelodau staff penodol sy'n gallu cyflawni holl swyddogaethau gweinyddol nifer o ysgolion ar draws yr ardal, a thrwy hynny wneud ysgolion unigol yn fwy hyfyw.

6.20 p.m.

I believe that community partnerships should be formed when a local education authority announces its intention to close a school. Such partnerships could include community councils, local businesses, in addition to parent and teacher groups. It is crucial that the entire community be given the right to consult, given that a school closure can impact on a community for many years to come. That is what local democracy means—everyone participating so that the entire community supports the decisions that affect it.

Credaf y dylid llunio partneriaethau â'r gymuned pan fydd awdurdod lleol yn cyhoeddi ei fwriad i gau ysgol. Gallai partneriaethau o'r fath gynnwys cyngorau cymuned, busnesau lleol yn ogystal â grwpiau rhieni ac athrawon. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r gymuned gyfan gael yr hawl i ymgynghori, o gofio y gall cau ysgol gael effaith ar gymuned am flynyddoedd i ddod. Dyna y mae democratiaeth leol yn ei olygu—pawb yn cymryd rhan er mwyn i'r gymuned gyfan gefnogi'r penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arni.

We have seen difficulties in some parts of the country because the local authority has failed to take on board the views of the community. I am pleased that the Minister last week acknowledged that the school reorganisation process is inadequate. Perhaps he could tell us in his response what he now intends to do about it. The Liberal Democrats' amendments 2 and 3 seek to highlight that issue, and, for that reason, we will be supporting them. Councils must consider carefully the impact that any decision to close a school will have on a community, particularly in Welsh-speaking areas. It is not merely a matter of closing a school, as a far more serious issue is allied to this, namely the effect on culture and the wider population.

Yr ydym wedi gweld anawsterau mewn rhai rhannau o'r wlad am fod yr awdurdod lleol wedi methu ag ystyried barn y gymuned. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi cydnabod yr wythnos diwethaf bod y broses ad-drefnu ysgolion yn annigonol. Efallai y gallai ddweud wrthym yn ei ymateb beth mae'n bwriadu ei wneud ynghylch hyn. Mae gwelliannau 2 a 3 a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ceisio tynnu sylw at y broblem honno ac, oherwydd hynny, byddwn yn eu cefnogi. Rhaid i gyngorau ystyried yn ofalus yr effaith a gaiff unrhyw benderfyniad i gau ysgol ar gymuned, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd Cymraeg eu hiaith. Nid mater o gau ysgol yn unig mohono, gan fod mater llawer mwy difrifol yn hyn, sef yr effaith a gaiff ar ddiwylliant ac ar y boblogaeth ehangach.

There is evidence to suggest that a community is weakened when a school closes. In some areas, there is always a

Mae tystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod cau ysgol yn gwanhau cymuned. Mewn rhai ardaloedd, mae perygl bob amser y bydd y swyddfa bost



danger that the post office and local shop will close because of the economic impact that closing a school will have. Before a school in any community closes, each and every sensible option must be looked into.

The message that we must convey today should be absolutely clear: schools are not just places in which our children are taught; they play an important role in our communities. We have a responsibility to ensure that we protect those communities. I urge Members to support our motion.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** I now call on the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning to move formally amendment 1.

**The Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning (Leighton Andrews):** I move amendment 1 in the name of Jane Hutt. In point 1, delete all before 'given' and replace with

*notes that the Welsh Assembly Government ensures that before a school is closed, full consideration has been*

In point 2, replace 'believes' with 'recognises'.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have five minutes in which to speak.

**Leighton Andrews:** I thought that you just said 'to move formally'. Sorry.

I will start by saying that everyone recognises that school closures are difficult for parents, pupils, teachers and local communities. I do not think that there is any disagreement about that among us in the Chamber. I suspect that we will all have had the experience of seeing school reorganisation proposals in our own constituencies and will all have been on the receiving end of representations. In many cases, we may have joined in by objecting to proposals that have come forward, and it is entirely appropriate for us to do so in supporting the concerns of groups in our constituencies.

a'r siop leol yn cau oherwydd yr effaith economaidd a gaiff cau ysgol. Rhaid ystyried pob un dewis synhwyrol posibl cyn cau ysgol mewn unrhyw gymuned.

Dylai'r neges y mae'n rhaid inni ei chyfleu heddiw fod yn hollol glir: nid manau lle mae ein plant yn cael eu haddysgu yn unig mo ysgolion; mae iddynt rôl bwysig yn ein cymunedau. Mae'n gyfrifoldeb arnom i sicrhau ein bod yn gwarchod y cymunedau hynny. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi ein cynnig.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Galwaf yn awr ar y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gynnig gwelliant 1 yn ffurfiol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Leighton Andrews):** Cynigiai welliant 1 yn enw Jane Hutt. Ym mhwynt 1, dileu popeth cyn 'i'r canlynol' a rhoi yn ei le:

*yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn sicrhau bod ystyriaeth lawn wedi'i rhoi*

Ym mhwynt 2, dileu 'yn credu' a rhoi 'yn cydnabod' yn ei le.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:** Mae gennych bum munud i siarad.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr oeddwn yn meddwl ichi ddweud 'i gynnig yn ffurfiol' yn unig. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf.

Dechreuaf trwy ddweud bod pawb yn cydnabod bod cau ysgolion yn anodd i rieni, disgyblion, athrawon a chymunedau lleol. Ni chredaf fod neb yn y Siambr yn anghytuno â hynny. Tybiaf y byddwn bob un wedi cael y profiad o weld cynigion i ad-drefnu ysgolion yn ein hetholaethau ein hunain, a bydd sylwadau wedi'u cyflwyno i bob un ohonom. Mewn llawer achos, efallai ein bod wedi ymuno â'r ddadl trwy wrthwynebu cynigion sydd wedi'u cyflwyno, ac mae'n hollol briodol inni wneud hynny wrth gefnogi pryderon gan grwpiau yn ein hetholaethau.

These are sensitive issues, and the two points in our amendment reflect the fact that, in our published guidance, we have tried to address the issues that are raised in the motion today. The latest guidance on school organisation is our circular 021/2009, which affects proposals published from 1 January 2010. The circular sets out what local authorities and other promoters need to consider when bringing forward a proposal. It also sets out the considerations that Ministers will apply when they are required to determine statutory proposals. Consultation should begin before any statutory proposals are published by local authorities. That is in the guidance that we have published in the past, which also states that adequate time should be allowed and sufficient information provided for those being consulted, so that they can take a considered view of the issues. That is published before the statutory proposals come forward.

Point 1(a) of the motion refers to the standard of education, and says that that needs to be considered. That is the main emphasis of the circular that we have introduced on school closures. It stresses that, at all times, the effect of a proposal on educational standards will be the prime consideration. Those promoting reorganisation need to consider whether the school provides education of a good standard compared with alternative schools, as evidenced by Estyn and other measures of performance. We, as the Welsh Ministers, take into account whether the proposals are likely to maintain or improve the standard of education provision in the area, including the standard of provision for pupils who have special needs. The Welsh Ministers will not normally be prepared to approve the closure of a popular and effective school unless evidence is presented that the alternative school proposed would offer an education of at least equivalent quality and diversity at a lower total cost than had the school remained open.

Point 1(b) of the motion relates to the importance of the school in the community. That is referred to in our guidance, which gives the emphasis to community impact

Mae'r materion hyn yn rhai sensitif, ac mae'r ddau bwynt yn ein gwelliant yn adlewyrchu'r ffaith ein bod wedi ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r problemau a gaiff eu codi yn y cynnig heddiw yn y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd gennym. Y canllawiau diweddaraf inni eu cyhoeddi ar drefniadaeth ysgolion yw cylchlythyr 021/2009, sy'n effeithio ar gynigion a gyhoeddwyd ar ôl 1 Ionawr 2010. Mae'r cylchlythyr yn gosod allan yr hyn y mae angen i awdurdodau lleol a hyrwyddwyr eraill ei ystyried wrth gyflwyno cynnig. Yn ogystal, mae'n gosod allan y pethau y bydd Gweinidogion yn eu hystyried pan fydd gofyn iddynt benderfynu ar gynigion statudol. Dylid dechrau'r broses ymgynghori cyn cyhoeddi unrhyw gynigion statudol gan awdurdodau lleol. Mae hynny yn y canllawiau yr ydym wedi'u cyhoeddi yn y gorffennol, sydd hefyd yn dweud y dylid caniatáu digon o amser a darparu digon o wybodaeth i'r sawl yr ymgynghorir â hwy, fel y gallant lunio barn ystyriol am y materion. Caiff hynny ei gyhoeddi cyn i gynigion statudol ddod gerbron.

Mae Pwynt 1(a) yn y cynnig yn cyfeirio at safon yr addysg, ac yn dweud bod angen ystyried hynny. Dyna yw prif bwyslais y cylchlythyr yr ydym wedi'i gyflwyno ynghylch cau ysgolion. Mae'n pwysleisio mai'r brif ystyriaeth bob amser fydd effaith cynnig ar safonau addysgol. Mae angen i'r sawl sy'n hyrwyddo ad-drefnu ysgolion ystyried a yw'r ysgol yn darparu addysg o safon dda o'i chymharu ag ysgolion eraill, ar sail tystiolaeth Estyn a ffyrdd eraill o fesur perfformiad. Yr ydym ni, fel Gweinidogion Cymru, yn ystyried a yw cynigion yn debygol o gynnal neu wella safon yr addysg a ddarperir yn yr ardal, gan gynnwys safon y ddarpariaeth i ddisgyblion ag anghenion arbennig. Fel rheol, ni fydd Gweinidogion Cymru'n barod i gymeradwyo cau ysgol boblogaidd ac effeithiol oni chyflwynir tystiolaeth sy'n dangos y byddai'r ysgol arall arfaethedig yn cynnig addysg sydd o leiaf cystal o ran ansawdd ac amrywiaeth, ac yn costio llai na phe bai'r ysgol wedi aros ar agor.

Mae pwynt 1(b) yn y cynnig yn ymwneud â phwysigrwydd yr ysgol yn y gymuned. Cyfeirir at hynny yn ein canllawiau, sy'n rhoi pwyslais ar ddatganiadau effaith gymunedol.

statements. In fact, I think that there is probably a greater emphasis now on the community aspect in the new circular because of that specific reference to the development of community impact assessments. So far, we have strengthened that guidance in the new circular. We have not yet had any proposals come forward under that—inevitably so, because it took effect from 1 January only—but we will want to see how the community impact assessments develop as a part of that.

Point 1(c) of the motion calls on the Welsh Ministers and those who propose a reorganisation to take account of the impact of future residential planning applications. Our circular emphasises that proposals have to be developed in the light of sound forecasting. They need to take account of population projections, and of forecasts for inward and outward migration and birth rates. They also need to take account of local plans for economic or housing development. There is evidence to show that local authorities are doing that. For example, there is a formula for estimating how many pupils might be generated from a particular housing development. It is therefore up to local authorities to work through those processes, which exist and are there in our guidance.

I certainly agree that consultation needs to be proper and robust. It should also clearly occur in the run-up to the proposal of a decision rather than after decisions have been made. The timing of consultations is up to the local authority involved in the process, but we have stressed, through our guidance, what we expect to see, so that people have enough time and information to form a considered view. We want people to have the opportunity to make their views known, and we want a clear method for doing so, through meetings or in writing. Local authorities now provide opportunities to do that electronically, as well, of course.

Therefore, there are processes and we think that they are appropriate. However, as I said

Mewn gwirionedd, credaf fod mwy o bwyslais, mae'n debyg, ar yr agwedd gymunedol yn awr yn y cylchlythyr newydd oherwydd y cyfeiriad penodol hwnnw at ddatblygu asesiadau effaith gymunedol. Hyd yma, yr ydym wedi cryfhau'r arweiniad hwnnw yn y cylchlythyr newydd. Nid oes dim cynigion yn gysylltiedig â hynny wedi dod ger ein bron hyd yn hyn—ond mae hynny'n anochel, oherwydd dim ond ar 1 Ionawr y daeth i rym—ond byddwn am weld sut y bydd yr asesiadau effaith gymunedol yn datblygu fel rhan o hynny.

Mae pwynt 1(c) yn y cynnig yn galw ar Weinidogion Cymru a'r sawl sy'n cynnig ad-drefnu i ystyried yr effaith ceisiadau cynllunio preswyl yn y dyfodol. Mae ein cylchlythyr yn pwysleisio'i bod yn rhaid datblygu cynigion ar sail rhagolygon cadarn. Mae angen i gynigion ystyried amcanestyniadau poblogaeth a'r rhagolygon ar gyfer patrymau mewnfudo ac allfudo, a chyfraddau genedigaethau. Mae angen hefyd iddynt ystyried cynlluniau lleol ar gyfer datblygu economaidd neu ddatblygiadau tai. Mae yna dystiolaeth sy'n dangos bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud hynny. Er enghraifft, ceir fformiwla ar gyfer amcangyfrif faint o ddisgyblion a allai ddod o ddatblygiad tai penodol. Felly, cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw gweithio trwy'r prosesau hynny, sy'n bodoli ac sydd yno yn ein canllawiau.

Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno bod angen i waith ymgynghori fod yn briodol ac yn gadarn. Wrth reswm, dylai hefyd ddigwydd yn y cyfnod cyn cynnig penderfyniad, yn hytrach nag ar ôl i benderfyniadau gael eu gwneud. Yr awdurdod lleol dan sylw sy'n gyfrifol am benderfynu pryd y cynhelir yr ymgynghoriad, ond yr ydym wedi pwysleisio, trwy ein canllawiau, yr hyn yr ydym yn disgwyl ei weld, fel y bydd pobl yn cael digon o amser a gwybodaeth i lunio barn ystyriol. Yr ydym am i bobl gael y cyfle i leisio'u barn, ac yr ydym am gael dull clir o wneud hynny, trwy gyfrwng cyfarfodydd neu'n ysgrifenedig. Wrth gwrs, erbyn hyn mae awdurdodau lleol yn cynnig cyfleoedd i wneud hynny'n electronig yn ogystal.

Felly, mae prosesau ar gael, a chredwn eu bod yn briodol. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais

at the outset, there is no question that the processes themselves may take longer than we would like, particularly when we have a bunching of school organisation proposals, as we have at the present time. I acknowledged that last week, and my officials and I are looking at it and will be considering it over the next few months. We need to see our way through the current batch of proposals before we get into further suggestions for change, but it is important to us. At the end of the day, we want a sustainable schooling system in Wales. That means that local authorities have to engage, as Paul Davies said in introducing the motion, with the issue of surplus places, and we expect them to take action to address that. We are putting in the funding to support the necessary changes.

**Kirsty Williams:** I move the following amendments in the name of Peter Black. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes that it has taken an average of 32 weeks for the Welsh Assembly Government to make a decision on the last 10 school reorganisation proposals, and, in one case, has taken 47 weeks.*

Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that delays in decisions taken by the Welsh Assembly Government can cause huge uncertainty for students, families and teachers and makes the necessary process of reorganising schools even more difficult for those involved.*

I begin by echoing the Minister's opening comments, recognising how difficult school closure and school reorganisation is for many communities and those directly involved in the proposals. As it is such a difficult and controversial issue, it is vital that the discussions that lead to proposals to reorganise or close schools be done properly. Not only that, but they must be seen by the community and stakeholders to have been done properly.

ar y dechrau, mae'n ddiamau y gallai'r prosesau eu hunain fod yn cymryd mwy o amser nag y byddem yn ei ddymuno, yn enwedig pan fydd gennym swp o gynigion ynghylch trefniadaeth ysgolion, fel sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd. Cydnabûm hynny yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae fy swyddogion a minnau'n edrych ar y mater a byddwn yn ei ystyried dros yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf. Mae angen inni weithio trwy'r llwyth presennol o gynigion cyn inni ystyried awgrymiadau pellach ar gyfer newid, ond mae hynny'n bwysig inni. Yn y pen draw, yr ydym am gael system addysg gynaliadwy yng Nghymru. Golyga hynny ei bod yn rhaid i awdurdodau lleol fynd i'r afael â phroblem lleoedd gwag, fel y dywedodd Paul Davies wrth gyflwyno'r cynnig, a disgwyliwn iddynt gymryd camau i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Yr ydym yn darparu'r cyllid i gefnogi'r newidiadau angenrheidiol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Peter Black. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi ei bod ar gyfartaledd wedi cymryd 32 wythnos i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru benderfynu ar y 10 cynnig diwethaf i ad-drefnu ysgolion, ac, mewn un achos, iddi gymryd 47 wythnos.*

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu bod oedi cyn cael penderfyniadau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gallu achosi llawer o ansicrwydd i fyfyrwyr, i deuluoedd ac i athrawon, a bod hynny'n gwneud proses angenrheidiol ad-drefnu ysgolion hyd yn oed yn anos i'r rheini dan sylw.*

Dechreuaf trwy adleisio sylwadau agoriadol y Gweinidog, a chydabod mor anodd yw cau ysgol ac ad-drefnu ysgolion i nifer o gymunedau a'r sawl sy'n ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r cynigion. Gan ei fod yn fater mor anodd a dadleuol, mae'n hollbwysig i'r trafodaethau sy'n arwain at gynigion i ad-drefnu neu gau ysgolion gael eu cynnal yn iawn. At hynny, rhaid i'r gymuned a'r rhanddeiliaid allu gweld bod y trafodaethau wedi eu cynnal yn iawn.

Quite rightly, standards in education should be at the forefront of any decision about a school's future. Nobody here, I am sure, would advocate keeping a failing school open just for the sake of having that institution within the community. However, time and again in my own constituency, I have seen schools that Estyn has judged to be perfectly adequate and, often, better than adequate subjected to closure. I echo Paul's comments about looking at the ramifications for the wider community when a closure takes place. That is particularly relevant for me considering current proposals in my county. If some of those proposals were to go ahead, Welsh schoolchildren who are currently entitled to follow a Welsh curriculum, to study the Welsh language to GCSE level, and to study the Welsh baccalaureate post 16, the council will have a legal responsibility to bus them only to the nearest school. If that school is over the border, suddenly those citizens of Wales no longer have the right to study in their own country, to study their country's national curriculum and to study their country's language. These issues about what the alternatives are must be carefully looked at in all aspects.

6.30 p.m.

These changes can go well if they are handled properly. We have seen a mass reorganisation of primary schools in the Ystradgynlais area and those discussions are ongoing, but by working closely with the community, by listening to people's concerns and by ensuring that the Government changes its policy when those concerns have been brought to its attention, as the previous Minister for education did, you can move communities to accept change. When it is done properly, it can work and it can effect a real change in communities.

However, more often than not, these proposals are met with strong and vigorous resistance. That is why, when they come to the Minister for final determination, that process must also be handled in a timely and proper fashion. The Government has stated again and again that councils cannot duck the issue of surplus places. Indeed, in answers to questions last week, the First Minister held

Mae'n hollol iawn i safonau addysg gael lle blaenllaw wrth benderfynu dyfodol ysgol. Yr wyf yn siŵr na fyddai neb yma'n dadlau dros gadw ysgol sy'n methu ar agor dim ond er mwyn cael y sefydliad hwnnw yn y gymuned. Fodd bynnag, dro ar ôl tro yn fy etholaeth i yr wyf wedi gweld ysgolion y mae Estyn wedi barnu eu bod yn hollol ddigonol, ac yn well na digonol yn aml, yn cael eu cau. Yr wyf yn adleisio sylwadau Paul ynghylch ystyried y goblygiadau i'r gymuned ehangach pan fydd ysgol yn cael ei chau. Mae hynny'n arbennig o berthnasol i mi o ystyried cynigion presennol yn fy sir. Pe bai rhai o'r cynigion hyn yn cael eu derbyn yn achos plant ysgol o Gymru sydd â hawl ar hyn o bryd i ddilyn cwricwlwm Cymru, astudio'r iaith Gymraeg i lefel TGAU, ac astudio bagloriaeth Cymru ôl-16, bydd cyfrifoldeb cyfreithiol ar y cyngor i drefnu bod bws ar gael i gludo'r plant i'r ysgol agosaf yn unig. Os yw'r ysgol agosaf honno dros y ffin, yn sydyn iawn nid oes gan y plant hynny, sy'n ddinasyddion o Gymru, yr hawl i astudio yn eu gwlad eu hunain, yr hawl i astudio cwricwlwm cenedlaethol eu gwlad, na'r hawl i astudio iaith eu gwlad. Rhaid ystyried yn ofalus bob agwedd ar y dewisiadau eraill sydd ar gael.

Gall y newidiadau hyn lwyddo os ymdrinnir â hwy yn briodol. Yr ydym wedi gweld ad-drefnu ysgolion cynradd ar raddfa fawr yn ardal Ystradgynlais, ac mae'r trafodaethau hynny'n parhau, ond trwy weithio'n agos gyda'r gymuned, gwranddo ar bryderon pobl a sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn newid ei pholisi ar ôl cael gwybod am y pryderon hynny, fel y gwnaeth y cyn-Weinidog dros addysg, gallwch gael cymunedau i dderbyn newid. Pan gaiff ei wneud yn iawn, gall weithio a gall achosi newid gwirioneddol mewn cymunedau.

Fodd bynnag, bydd gwrthwynebiad cryf a grymus i'r cynigion hyn yn amlach na pheidio. Dyna pam mae'n rhaid ymdrin â'r broses mewn modd amserol a phriodol pan ddaw'r cynigion gerbron y Gweinidog i wneud penderfyniad terfynol yn eu cylch. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud dro ar ôl tro na all cynghorau osgoi problem lleoedd gwag. Yn wir, yn ei atebion i gwestiynau yr

up the issue of surplus places as the primary reason why Welsh schools were not doing as well as they should be and said that councils needed to get on with the job. However, we have found that, when councils get on with the job and go through what is a painful process for communities, which is often damaging for elected individuals, it can take an awfully long time for that decision to be finally taken by the Minister. In answer to questions laid by my colleague Jenny Randerson, the Minister's figures suggest that, for the last 10 decisions on which the Minister for education was asked to make a judgment, the average time for making those decisions was some 32 weeks and the longest time was 47 weeks. That is almost a year for a decision to be made or for the processes to be—

**Leighton Andrews:** Can we be clear about the process? The answer that I gave was the number of weeks from the point at which the proposal was published. It is not as though it waited around in our department for 47 weeks. That is the time that the process took from the beginning. I think that I am right in saying that, in the example that you gave of 47 weeks, we had to go back to the local authority to get further information.

**Kirsty Williams:** I accept that, in the process, the objectors have an opportunity to write to the Minister and the council has the opportunity to respond to those questions that are raised in the objections to the Minister. That process has to be thorough and it has to allow people's views to be heard, but the decision must also be made in a timely fashion. The Minister has targets by when he wishes those decisions to be made and, in many cases, the decision is taking longer than the target time. That causes huge problems. It causes huge anxiety for the teachers and the children in those individual institutions and for those children's parents. It also causes huge problems for parents who are looking to plan for the future educational needs of their children. It also puts huge pressure on those politicians at the local level who are making these tough decisions. Government Ministers expect schools to close and expect local authorities to tackle this problem, but they have to play their part by ensuring that they handle their decision correctly and in a timely

wythnos diwethaf, nododd y Prif Weinidog mai problem lleoedd gwag oedd y prif reswm pam nad oedd ysgolion yng Nghymru'n gwneud cystal ag y dylent, a dywedodd fod angen i gynghorau fwrw ati. Fodd bynnag, pan fydd cynghorau'n bwrw ati ac yn mynd trwy broses sy'n boenus i gymunedau, ac yn aml yn niweidiol i unigolion etholedig, yr ydym wedi gweld y gall gymryd amser hir iawn i'r Gweinidog benderfynu'n derfynol. Wrth ateb cwestiynau a ofynnwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Jenny Randerson, yr oedd ffigurau'r Gweinidog yn awgrymu ei bod, ar gyfartaledd, wedi cymryd oddeutu 32 wythnos i'r Gweinidog dros addysg benderfynu'r 10 cynnig diwethaf, a'r amser hiraf oedd 47 wythnos. Mae hynny bron yn flwyddyn i wneud penderfyniad neu i'r prosesau gael eu—

**Leighton Andrews:** A allwn fod yn glir ynghylch y broses? Yr ateb a roddais oedd nifer yr wythnosau ers cyhoeddi'r cynnig. Nid oedd y mater wedi aros heb gael sylw yn ein hadran am 47 wythnos. Dyna faint o amser a gymerodd y broses o'r dechrau. Credaf fy mod yn iawn i ddweud ein bod wedi gorfod mynd yn ôl at yr awdurdod lleol i gael rhagor o wybodaeth yn achos yr enghraifft o 47 wythnos a roesoeh.

**Kirsty Williams:** Derbynaf ei bod yn rhan o'r broses i'r gwrthwynebwyr gael cyfle i ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog, ac i'r cyngor gael cyfle i ymateb i'r cwestiynau hynny a gaiff eu codi yn y gwrthwynebiadau i'r Gweinidog. Rhaid i'r broses honno fod yn drwyadl, a rhaid iddi ganiatáu i farn pobl gael ei chlywed, ond rhaid gwneud y penderfyniad mewn modd amserol hefyd. Mae gan y Gweinidog dargedau sy'n dweud erbyn pryd y mae'n dymuno penderfynu cynigion, ac mewn llawer achos mae'r penderfyniad yn cymryd yn hwy na'r targed a bennwyd. Mae hynny'n peri problemau enfawr. Mae'n peri pryder mawr i'r athrawon a'r plant yn y sefydliadau unigol hynny, ac i rieni'r plant hynny. Mae hefyd yn peri problemau enfawr i rieni sy'n ceisio cynllunio ar gyfer anghenion addysgol eu plant yn y dyfodol. Mae hefyd yn rhoi pwysau enfawr ar y gwleidyddion hynny ar lefel leol sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau anodd hyn. Mae Gweinidogion y Llywodraeth yn disgwyl i ysgolion gau, ac yn disgwyl i awdurdodau

fashion. I hope that the Minister will take some steps to ensure that he reaches his targets.

**Nick Bourne:** This is an important debate and, in fairness, the Minister has approached it sensitively. There is an issue, and I do not think that anyone here would suggest that schools should never close. I well remember when Trap school in Carmarthenshire was closed; it had seven pupils, which would clearly not satisfy Estyn in delivering the core curriculum. In such instances one has to be totally realistic. Therefore, I do not think that anyone is saying that schools should be preserved in aspic and that we should keep schools open, regardless of the number of pupils. That said, I do not think that there have been many instances, if any at all, where a Minister has turned down a proposal—there may have been one or two, but the balance has very much been to uphold the decision made by the local authority by a considerable margin.

Schools must modernise and change; I accept that. It is a question, to a large extent, of how this is organised. Having reached the point where we say that, yes, on occasion, school must change and reorganise, the issue is why they should be reorganised and how we should handle that. They should not be reorganised for budgetary reasons; that should not be the prime motivator. The prime motivator must be that the kids at the school get a decent education. I know of many schools in Wales, as Kirsty does, that have closed for financial reasons, even though they have been delivering a first-class education and have excellent Estyn reports, and even though they are a treasured part of the local community and the parents, governors and pupils are all happy. If that is going to be the criteria, we should be honest about it, but no-one has ever said that that is to be the criteria. I would certainly disassociate myself from any such approach.

**Gareth Jones:** I am pleased to hear the Conservative Party talking about organisation

lleol fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon, ond rhaid iddynt hwythau wneud eu rhan trwy sicrhau eu bod yn ymdrin â'u penderfyniad yn briodol ac yn amserol. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd rhai camau i sicrhau ei fod yn cyrraedd ei dargedau.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig, ac i fod yn deg mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymdrin â hi'n sensitif. Mae yma broblem, ac ni chredaf y byddai neb yma'n awgrymu na ddylid cau ysgolion byth. Cofiaf yn iawn pan gaewyd ysgol Trap yn Sir Gaerfyrddin; yr oedd saith disgybl yn yr ysgol, ac mae'n amlwg na fyddai hynny'n bodloni Estyn o ran darparu'r cwricwlwm craidd. Mewn achosion o'r fath, rhaid inni fod yn hollol realistig. Felly, nid wyf yn credu bod neb yn dweud y dylid cadw ysgolion fel y maent wedi bod erioed ac y dylem gadw ysgolion ar agor, ni waeth faint o ddisgyblion sydd ganddynt. Wedi dweud hynny, nid wyf yn credu bod llawer o achosion wedi bod, os o gwbl, lle mae Gweinidog wedi gwrthod cynnig—hwyrach fod un neu ddau achos wedi bod, ond y duedd yn sicr o gryn dipyn fu cadarnhau penderfyniad yr awdurdod lleol.

Rhaid i ysgolion foderneiddio a newid; yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. I raddau helaeth, cwestiwn ydyw sut y caiff hynny ei drefnu. Gan inni gyrraedd y pwynt lle'r ydym yn derbyn ei bod yn rhaid i ysgolion newid ac ad-drefnu weithiau, y cwestiwn yw pam y dylid eu had-drefnu a sut y dylem ymdrin â hynny. Ni ddylid eu had-drefnu am resymau cyllidebol; nid dyna'r prif beth a ddylai fod yn ysgogi newid. Y prif beth a ddylai fod yn ysgogi newid yw sicrhau bod plant yr ysgol yn cael addysg foddhaol. Gwn am nifer o ysgolion yng Nghymru, fel y gŵyr Kirsty, sydd wedi cau am resymau ariannol, er iddynt fod yn darparu addysg o'r radd flaenaf ac wedi cael adroddiadau gwych gan Estyn, ac er eu bod yn rhan o'r gymuned leol sy'n cael ei thrysori a'r holl rieni, y llywodraethwyr a'r disgyblion yn hapus. Os dyna fydd y meini prawf, dylem fod yn onest ynghylch hynny, ond nid oes neb erioed wedi dweud mai dyna fydd y meini prawf. Byddwn yn sicr yn datgysylltu fy hun o unrhyw drefniant o'r fath.

**Gareth Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch clywed y Blaid Geidwadol yn sôn am drefniadaeth ac

and community and educational needs. However, it seems to me that we should be funding those partnerships and processes. Unfortunately, your party introduced pupil funding, and that is the heart of the problem. That is the issue, because all schools are funded according to the number of pupils. The fewer pupils, the more exposed and vulnerable the school. It is your party that introduced an alien system into Wales that is leading to these school closures. What do you intend to do about the funding system?

**Nick Bourne:** I am coming to that issue. You are, after all, in the Government and, as this is a devolved legislature, you have the ability to change that. I do not think that that is much of a defence, Gareth. I thought that yours was going to be a more telling intervention, if you do not mind be saying so. You have the ability to change all of that, and I hope that you do change it. *[Interruption.]* Please allow me to carry on.

There are important considerations here and, as I said, they should not be governed by budgetary considerations alone; it should primarily be governed by the education of the children. That is vital. Powys has been mentioned, and I welcome Kirsty Williams's comments, but it must be said that the Liberal Democrats and the independents in Powys were the people who brought those proposals forward. I accept that they have since withdrawn them—

**Kirsty Williams:** My understanding is that, at the last discussion that Powys County Council had on this issue, Councillor Michael Hodges from Llandrindod Wells, who, I understand, is the joint leader of your group on that council, supported the Liberal Democrat and independent amendment in that debate, and voted with that group, as did other members of the Conservative council group.

**Nick Bourne:** The point remains, because I do not think that you have countermanded it, that the original plans were brought forward by the Liberal Democrats and the

anghenion cymunedol ac addysgol. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys imi y dylem fod yn ariannu'r partneriaethau a'r prosesau hynny. Yn anffodus, cyflwynodd eich plaid chi system o ariannu disgyblion, a dyna sydd wrth wraidd y broblem. Dyna'r broblem, oherwydd caiff pob ysgol ei hariannu yn ôl nifer y disgyblion ar y gofrestr. Po leiaf yw nifer y disgyblion, y mwyaf agored i niwed yw'r ysgol a'r mwyaf yw'r perygl iddi. Eich plaid chi a gyflwynodd system estron yng Nghymru sy'n arwain at yr achosion hyn o gau ysgolion. Beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud am y system ariannu?

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn dod at y mater hwnnw. Yr ydych chi, wedi'r cyfan, yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth, a chan fod hon yn ddeddfwrfa sydd wedi'i datganoli, mae gennych y gallu i newid hynny. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n fawr o amddiffyniad, Gareth. Credais y byddai eich ymyriad chi'n fwy effeithiol, os caf ddweud hynny. Gallwch newid hynny i gyd, a gobeithio y byddwch yn ei newid. *[Torri ar draws.]* A gaf fi barhau, os gwelwch yn dda.

Mae yma ystyriaethau pwysig, ac fel y dywedais, ni ddylent gael eu rheoli gan ystyriaethau cyllidebol yn unig; addysg y plant a ddylai fod yn ddylanwad pennaf. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig. Crybwyllwyd Powys, ac yr wyf yn croesawu sylwadau Kirsty Williams, ond rhaid dweud mai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r aelodau annibynnol ym Mhowys a ddaeth â'r cynigion hyn gerbron. Derbyniaf eu bod wedi tynnu'r cynigion hynny'n ôl ers hynny—

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn ôl a ddeallaf, yn ystod y drafodaeth ddiwethaf a gafodd Cyngor Sir Powys ar y mater hwn, yr oedd y Cyngorydd Michael Hodges o Landrindod, sy'n gyd-arweinydd eich grŵp ar y cyngor hwnnw, fel y deallaf, wedi cefnogi gwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r aelodau annibynnol yn y ddadl honno, ac wedi pleidleisio gyda'r grŵp hwnnw, fel y gwnaeth aelodau eraill o grŵp y Ceidwadwyr ar y cyngor.

**Nick Bourne:** Erys y ffaith, oherwydd nid wyf yn credu eich bod wedi'i ddiddymu, bod y cynlluniau gwreiddiol wedi'u cyflwyno gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r aelodau



independents. I will stand shoulder to shoulder with you if you disagree with those proposals. It is also important that we put on record that, of the 13 schools that exist at secondary level in Powys, seven were threatened with closure in those proposals. The proposals have since been withdrawn, which is good news. What is crucial in this debate, Minister, is that, as soon as those proposals are made, a planning blight is created on that school and the community. It demotivates the teachers and pupils and has a devastating effect on the local community. The Minister has been fair enough to acknowledge that in the past, and if there is anything that can be done to solve this dire problem, it needs to be done. My primary message is that it cannot be done for budgetary reasons, but it should be done for educational reasons.

We need to look at community purposes, as Paul Davies rightly said. We need to build in something on rurality. There is something on community, but, with rurality, there are issues of the larger distances travelled between schools, and the use of transport against the green agenda, which we are also plugging. Mention has not been made so far of the Welsh language, which is a massive concern. I have visited many schools in my area that have closed where Welsh was the prime language, for instance in Henllan Amgoed, Carmarthenshire, and many are under threat in Gwynedd. That is another consideration that needs to be built in. Above all, a school closure is devastating for education, it is unsettling and unfair to school children and their parents, and it rips out the hearts of communities. For instance, the closure of Llanidloes High School, which I have visited—I also know that Gareth has an interest in it, because his son teaches history there—would devastate that community. We must get a balance, but, above all, we must look at the way in which we handle this issue to avoid the great uncertainties in this area.

6.40 p.m.

**Nerys Evans:** Diolch am y cyfle i siarad. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Ceidwadwyr wedi gosod

annibynnol. Safaf ochr yn ochr â chi os ydych yn anghytuno â'r cynigion hynny. Mae'n bwysig hefyd ein bod yn cofnodi'r ffaith bod y cynigion hynny'n cynnwys bygythiad i gau saith o'r 13 ysgol uwchradd sy'n bodoli ym Mhowys. Mae'r cynigion hynny wedi'u tynnu'n ôl ers hynny, sy'n newyddion da. Yr hyn sy'n hollbwysig yn y ddadl hon, Weinidog, yw bod malltod cynllunio yn taro'r ysgol a'r gymuned gynted ag y caiff y cynigion hynny eu cyflwyno. Mae athrawon a disgyblion yn colli eu cymhelliant a'r effaith ar y gymuned leol yn ddinistriol. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn ddigon teg i gydnabod hynny yn y gorffennol, ac os gellir gwneud unrhyw beth i ddatrys y broblem ddifrifol hon, mae angen gwneud hynny. Fy mhrif neges yw na ellir gwneud newidiadau am resymau cyllidebol, ond y dylid eu gwneud am resymau addysgol.

Yr oedd Paul Davies yn llygad ei le wrth ddweud bod angen inni ystyried dibenion cymunedol. Mae angen inni gynnwys cyfeiriad at natur wledig rhai ardaloedd. Ceir cyfeiriad at gymuned, ond mae natur wledig rhai ardaloedd yn arwain at broblemau eraill megis mwy o bellter teithio rhwng ysgolion, a defnyddio trafndiaeth yn groes i'r agenda werdd, yr ydym hefyd yn ei hyrwyddo. Nid oes neb wedi sôn dim hyd yn hyn am yr iaith Gymraeg, sy'n bryder enfawr. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â nifer o ysgolion yn fy ardal sydd wedi cau lle oedd y Gymraeg oedd y brif iaith, er enghraifft, yn Henllan Amgoed, Sir Gaerfyrddin, ac mae nifer o ysgolion dan fygythiad yng Ngwynedd. Mae honno'n ystyriaeth arall y mae angen ei chynnwys. Yn anad dim, mae cau ysgol yn ddinistriol i addysg, mae'n gythryblus i blant a'u rhieni ac yn annheg â hwy, ac mae'n rhwygo'r galon allan o gymunedau. Er enghraifft, byddai cau Ysgol Uwchradd Llanidloes, yr wyf wedi ymweld â hi—a gwn hefyd fod gan Gareth ddiddordeb yn yr ysgol, gan fod ei fab yn athro hanes yno—yn dinistrio'r gymuned. Rhaid inni gael cydbwysedd, ond yn anad dim rhaid inni ystyried y ffordd yr ydym yn ymdrin â'r mater hwn er mwyn osgoi'r ansicrwydd mawr sydd yn y maes hwn.

**Nerys Evans:** Thank you for the opportunity to speak. I am pleased that the Conservatives

y cynnig hwn i edrych ar y broses o ad-drefnu a chau ysgolion. Yn sgîl yr agenda weddnewid, sy'n effeithio ar addysg uwch ac addysg bellach, ac wrth i awdurdodau lleol ymdrin â lleoedd gwag ysgolion cynradd, dyma fater pwysig iawn. Hoffwn sôn am ychydig egwyddorion ac enghreifftiau penodol.

Mae'r cynnig yn gosod y camau y dylai awdurdodau lleol eu cymryd wrth gau ysgolion. Hefyd, wrth gwrs, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes, mae'n rhaid inni ystyried nad ar chwarae bach y mae cau ysgol yn y lle cyntaf, yn enwedig yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Mae ystyriaethau arbennig iawn i'w cymryd yn ein cymunedau gwledig. Mae angen dirfawr inni edrych ar ein hysgolion fel asedau cymunedol ac fel adnoddau i'n cymunedau. Dylai'r awdurdodau lleol geisio defnyddio'r adeiladau i ddarparu gwasanaethau eraill ac i wneud yr adeilad yn hwb cymunedol—yn ffocws i'r gymuned—fel modd i gynnal cymunedau gwledig yn hyfyw. Felly, y dewis olaf un fydd cau ysgol yn ein cymunedau gwledig.

Yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes y prynhawn yma, soniais am y broses o geisio cau ysgolion ym Mhowys a sir Gaerfyrddin. Hoffwn ymhelaethu ar y pwnc hwnnw. Mae'n fater anodd gan fod y pwerau a'r broses wedi'u datganoli. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gynharach, bydd penderfyniadau terfynol i'w gwneud os daw anghytundeb i'w ddesg ef. Serch hynny, mae'n bwysig inni amlinellu'r pryderon am y broses ymgynghori sydd yn bodoli mewn dwy o'r siroedd yr wyf yn eu cynrychioli.

Ym Mhowys—fel y soniodd Nick eisoes—mae cryn bryder ymhlith staff, disgyblion a thrigolion y sir ynglŷn â'r broses o ad-drefnu neu gyflwyno cynlluniau ar gyfer ad-drefnu, sydd yn cynnwys cau nifer fawr o ysgolion. Daeth i'r amlwg bod pedwar opsiwn yn cael eu trafod, a'r argymhellion yn radical ac yn bellgyrhaeddol. Nid yw'r broses wedi cael mewnbwn oddi wrth aelodau etholedig y sir. Mae gan gynghorwyr rôl bwysig iawn yn y maes hwn, ac mae democratiaeth leol yn hollbwysig. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod awdurdod lleol Powys bellach wedi

tabled this motion to look at the process of reorganising and closing schools. As a result of the transformation agenda, which affects further and higher education, and as local authorities deal with surplus places in primary schools, this is a very important issue. I should like to mention some principles and some specific examples.

The motion sets out the steps which local authorities should follow in closing schools. Also, of course, as has already been mentioned, we must consider that closing a school in the first place should not be undertaken lightly, especially in our rural communities. There are some very specific considerations that should be taken into account in rural communities. We need to give serious consideration to our schools as community assets and as community resources. Local authorities should try to use the buildings for other services and to make them community hubs—a focus for the community—as a way of keeping rural communities viable. Therefore, closing schools in our rural communities should be the last resort.

During this afternoon's questions to the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning I mentioned the process of trying to close schools in Powys and Carmarthenshire. I would like to expand on that. This is a difficult issue, because the powers and processes have been devolved. As the Minister said earlier, final decisions will have to be made if any disagreements reach his desk. However, it is important that we outline the concerns that have been raised about the consultation process in two of the counties that I represent.

In Powys—as Nick has already mentioned—staff, pupils and residents in the county have expressed considerable concern at the process of reorganising or proposing plans for reorganisation, which includes closing a large number of schools. It became clear that four options were being discussed, and that the proposals were radical and far-reaching. There has been no input to the process from the county's elected members. Councillors have a very important role to play in this matter, and local democracy is vital. I am pleased to see that Powys local authority has

ailldechrau'r broses.

Yn ystod y cwestiynau, soniais hefyd am Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin. Yr wyf i a Rhodri Glyn Thomas wedi codi ein pryderon sawl gwaith yn y Siambr ynglŷn â'r broses yno. Mae'r broses yn un hynod o sensitif, fel y mae pob llefarydd wedi'i nodi. Mae ad-drefnu ysgolion uwchradd, o ran yr agenda weddnewid yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yn golygu cyfuno ysgolion. Mae yna bryderon mawr ynglŷn â'r safleoedd, y cyfrwng iaith, yr amserlen, a'r goblygiadau teithio i bobl ifanc. Mae'r achosion hyn oll yn rhai sensitif, felly mae'n hollbwysig bod yr ymgynghoriad yn un pwrpasol ac eang sy'n cynnwys cymaint o bobl ag y bo'n bosibl.

Cafwyd sawl diffyg mawr yn y broses ymgynghori yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Er enghraifft, un o'r cynigion yw uno Ysgol Pantycelyn, sydd yn Llanymddyfri, ag Ysgol Tre-gib, sydd yn Llandeilo, a chynnig ysgol newydd rhwng y ddwy dref. Yr oedd trigolion Llanymddyfri yn anfodlon iawn gyda'r cynnig i ddechrau, ond fe'u darbwyllwyd am nifer o resymau gwahanol. Un o'r rhesymau pennaf yw y bydd yr ysgol newydd yn cael ei hadeiladu mewn lleoliad rhwng y ddwy dref. Wrth i'r cyngor ddatblygu a chymradwyo'r cynlluniau, mae wedi cymeradwyo ysgol newydd i'r de o Llandeilo. Nid oedd hynny'n opsiwn wrth i'r cyngor gynnal ei ymgynghoriad. Rhagdybiwyd mai safle rhwng y ddwy dref a ddefnyddid ac felly mae teimlad cryf nad yw'r ymgynghoriad wedi bod yn deg a bod elfen o dwyll yn bodoli—dyna'r gair mae pobl leol yn ei ddefnyddio ynglŷn â'r ymgynghoriad.

Fel y dywedais, mae'r rhain yn faterion sensitif iawn. Mae'n fater sensitif o ran natur ieithyddol yr addysg yn y drefn newydd. Mae'n bwysig eto bod yr ymgynghoriad yn un ystyrlon, eang a chywir.

Ar ôl y broses o ymgynghori a gynhaliwyd gan Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, a oedd yn gamarweiniol—nid yn unig o ran cynlluniau daearyddol ond hefyd o ran diffyg gwybodaeth gywir ac esboniad digonol ar y categorïau gwahanol o safbwynt darpariaeth

restarted the process.

During questions, I referred to Carmarthenshire County Council. Rhodri Glyn Thomas and I on a number of occasions have raised our concerns in the Chamber about the process in that area. The process is extremely sensitive, as every speaker has mentioned. The reorganisation of secondary schools, in the context of the transformation agenda in Carmarthenshire, does mean merging schools. There are grave concerns about the sites, the medium of teaching, the timetable and the travel implications for young people. All of these cases are sensitive ones, therefore, it is crucially important that the consultation is purposeful and wide-ranging and that it includes as many people as possible.

There were many of huge deficiencies in the consultation process in Carmarthenshire. For example, one of the proposals is to merge Ysgol Pantycelyn in Llandovery with Ysgol Tre-gib in Llandeilo, and to open a new school between the two towns. The people of Llandovery were very dissatisfied with the proposal at the outset, but they were convinced for a number of different reasons. One of the main reasons was that the new school will be built at a location between the two towns. As the council has developed and approved the plans, it has approved a new school to be located to the south of Llandeilo. This was not an option as the council went out to consultation. There was a presumption that the site would be between the two towns, therefore, there is a strong feeling that the consultation has not been fair and that there has been an element of misleading—that is the word being used by local people in relation to the consultation.

As I said, these are very sensitive issues. It is a sensitive issue in terms of the linguistic nature of the education under the new regime. Again, it is important to have meaningful, broad and proper consultation.

Following the consultation process undertaken by Carmarthenshire County Council, which was misleading—not only in relation to the geographical plans but also in terms of a lack of accurate information and an adequate explanation of the different

ieithyddol addysg—mae'r bwrdd gweithredol yn sir Gaerfyrddin wedi cymeradwyo cynllun i fynd o bump ysgol uwchradd i dair ysgol. Mae'n gynllun eithaf radical, gyda goblygiadau pellgyrhaeddol. Mae'r bwrdd gweithredol wedi penderfynu ar leoliadau daearyddol a chyfrwng ieithyddol yr ysgolion newydd, ond ni all y cyngor llawn gynnal trafodaeth ar y cynlluniau hyn, na chynnig gwelliannau ychwaith. Yr unig drafodaeth y bu i'r bwrdd gweithredol ei chaniatáu ddydd Gwener diwethaf oedd nodi cofnodion y bwrdd gweithredol. Nid oedd modd trafod y materion hyn yn eang hyd yn oed. Dengys hyn ddiffyg enfawr mewn democratiaeth leol. Mae cau ysgolion yn fater sensitif, ac mae'n bwysicach fyth bod y broses a osodwyd yn cael ei dilyn. Felly, gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn edrych ar yr elfennau a osodwyd allan.

**Mark Isherwood:** Although the issue of surplus school places is important as local authorities face increased pressure on their budgets, the Welsh language pressure group Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg was right to call for the argument about school closures to be widened beyond statutory education to the value of schools in communities. Section 79 of the Government of Wales Act 2006 states that:

'Welsh Ministers must make a scheme...setting out how they propose...to promote sustainable development.'

Sustainable development means development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. In reality, however, the sometimes unsustainable nature of Labour/Plaid Cymru Welsh Government policy was summarised in a recent Wales Rural Observatory report case study:

'Our school closed in December.... There was a campaign to keep it open, but it closed.... The closure of the school has had effect on the village hall where school functions were held.... There are no buses anymore. It can be difficult for elderly people to get about.'

categories of the medium in which education is provided—Carmarthenshire council's executive board has approved a plan to reduce the number of secondary schools from five to three. It is quite a radical plan, with far-reaching implications. The executive board has decided the geographic location and the medium of the new schools, but the full council cannot have a discussion on those plans nor can it propose amendments to them. The only discussion allowed by the executive board last Friday was to note the minutes of the executive board. These matters could not even be discussed in general. This demonstrates a huge deficiency in local democracy. School closure is a sensitive issue, and it is even more important that the process set out be followed. Therefore, I hope the Minister will look at the elements set out.

**Mark Isherwood:** Er bod y mater hwn ynghylch lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion yn bwysig wrth i awdurdodau lleol wynebu pwysau cynyddol ar eu cyllidebau, yr oedd y grŵp ymgyrchu dros yr iaith Gymraeg, Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, yn iawn i alw am ehangu'r ddadl ar gau ysgolion y tu hwnt i addysg statudol er mwyn iddi gynnwys gwerth ysgolion mewn cymunedau. Mae Adran 79 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006 yn dweud fel hyn:

Rhaid i Weinidogion Cymru greu cynllun sy'n egluro sut y maent yn bwriadu hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy.

Mae datblygu cynaliadwy'n golygu datblygiad sy'n diwallu anghenion y presennol heb beryglu gallu cenedlaethau'r dyfodol i ddiwallu eu hanghenion eu hunain. Mewn gwirionedd, fodd bynnag, crynhowyd polisi'r Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru hon yng Nghymru, sy'n gallu bod yn anghynaliadwy weithiau, mewn adroddiad ar astudiaeth achos yn ddiweddar gan Arsyllfa Wledig Cymru:

Caeodd ein hysgol ym mis Rhagfyr. Bu ymgyrch i'w chadw ar agor, ond caeodd... Mae cau'r ysgol wedi cael effaith ar neuadd y pentref lle cynhaliwyd gweithgareddau'r ysgol...Nid oes dim bysiau bellach. Mae'n gallu bod yn anodd i bobl hŷn deithio o le i le.

Gwynedd Council was forced back to the drawing board after protests against school closures became a council election issue. A fortnight ago, Gwynedd was forced to extend a consultation after complaints that villagers were not properly consulted on proposals to shut five primary schools in the Tywyn area. Powys campaigners stated that Welsh Government guidance lacked breadth and clarity, resulting in councils and the Welsh Government blaming each other for community school closures. Once again, the Welsh Government practises the politics of the coward and bully, planning school closures but refusing to admit and debate it publicly, openly and honestly.

As headteachers and school governors in Flintshire told me, the Welsh Government's modernising education agenda is driven more by resource implications than improvements in educational delivery, thereby putting at risk whole-school communities, school infrastructures and community resources. Only last week, I visited a small rural school, following its excellent Estyn report. It has fewer than 60 pupils. The staff are confident about the future and deserve to be so. They should not have to fear the future. They also highlighted the need for council planners and planning committees to consider the sustainability of local schools when determining residential planning applications.

The Association of Communities in Wales with Small Schools told me that it wanted a voice, that the current situation was 'not equitable' and that

'the main issues and concerns are focused around the lack of citizen engagement.'

As the Campaign for the Protection of Rural Wales has stated, the report by the Institute of Welsh Affairs on small school closures appears to ignore all the existing evidence that favours small schools for their educational merits, including the support given by Plaid Cymru's separatist friends in

Gorfodwyd Cyngor Gwynedd i ailfeddwl, ar ôl i brotestiadau yn erbyn cau ysgolion ddod yn fater a oedd yn gysylltiedig ag etholiad y cyngor. Bythefnos yn ôl, gorfodwyd Gwynedd i ymestyn ymgynghoriad, ar ôl cael cwynion na fu ymgynghori priodol â phentrefwyr ar y cynigion i gau pum ysgol gynradd yn ardal Tywyn. Dywedodd ymgyrchwyr ym Mhowys fod diffyg ehangder ac eglurdeb yng nghanllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, a olygodd fod cynghorau a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn beio'i gilydd am gau ysgolion cymunedol. Unwaith eto, mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n arfer gwleidyddiaeth y cachgi a'r bwli, gan gynllunio i gau ysgolion ond yn gwrthod cyfaddef hynny a'i drafod yn gyhoeddus, yn agored ac yn onest.

Fel y dywedodd penaethiaid a llywodraethwyr ysgol yn Sir y Fflint wrthyf, mae goblygiadau o ran adnoddau yn dylanwadu mwy ar agenda moderneiddio addysg Llywodraeth y Cynulliad na gwelliannau mewn darpariaeth addysgol, gan beryglu cymunedau ysgol gyfan, yn ogystal â seilwaith ysgolion ac adnoddau cymunedol, felly. Mor ddiweddar â'r wythnos diwethaf, ymwelais ag ysgol wledig fach ar ôl iddi gael adroddiad ardderchog gan Estyn. Mae llai na 60 o ddisgyblion yn yr ysgol. Mae'r staff yn hyderus am y dyfodol, ac maent yn haeddu bod yn hyderus. Ni ddylai fod yn rhaid iddynt ofni'r dyfodol. Tynnodd y staff sylw hefyd at yr angen i gynllunwyr y cyngor a phwyllgorau cynllunio ystyried cynaliadwyedd ysgolion lleol wrth benderfynu ceisiadau cynllunio preswyl.

Dywedodd Cymdeithas y Cymunedau ag Ysgolion Bach yng Nghymru wrthyf ei bod am gael llais, ac nad oedd y sefyllfa bresennol yn deg, a

bod y prif broblemau a'r pryderon yn ymwneud â diffyg ymgysylltu â dinasyddion.

Fel y mae Ymgyrch Diogelu Cymru Wledig wedi ei ddweud, ymddengys fod yr adroddiad gan y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig ar gau ysgolion bach yn anwybyddu'r holl dystiolaeth bresennol sy'n ffafrio ysgolion bach am eu rhinweddau addysgol, gan gynnwys y gefnogaeth a gafwyd gan

the Scottish National Party and the presumption against closure applying to small schools in England.

When I referred in the Chamber to the letter issued by the UK Government to local authorities in England stating that, by law, small rural schools should not be closing, Carwyn Jones responded by stating that this related to schools with 75 children. However, the UK Department for Children, Schools and Families advises that it does not have a definition of a small school and that this is a matter for local education authorities. The report by the Institute of Welsh Affairs fails to acknowledge Ofsted conclusions in England regarding the quality of teaching in small schools, as well as the Countryside Commission's report to the UK Parliament in 2005, which highlights the reality that

'schools with under 100 pupils...get the best results'.

This Labour/Plaid Cymru Welsh Government must not ignore concern about the general erosion of community life and of rural services that provide the social glue that binds communities together. In response to the deep rural localities report, the Campaign for the Protection of Rural Wales said:

'the Welsh Government needs to recognise the depth of the problem'.

The campaign added that it expected support for the

'provision of services in deep rural areas—such as education.'

Throughout Wales, rural and otherwise, local government and the Welsh Government must look at this issue in the round and see how school buildings and assets could be used for the benefit of communities as well as for schools, replacing the problem of excess capacity with sustainable and cost efficient use of resources. As the Minister indicated, to achieve this, no school closure should be considered without a community impact

ymwahanwyr Plaid Genedlaethol yr Alban, sy'n gyfeillion i Blaid Cymru, a'r rhagdybiaeth yn erbyn cau sy'n berthnasol i ysgolion bach yn Lloegr.

Pan gyfeiriais yn y Siambr at y llythyr a anfonwyd gan Lywodraeth y DU at awdurdodau lleol yn Lloegr, yn dweud na ddylai ysgolion bach gwledig fod yn cau yn ôl y gyfraith, ymatebodd Carwyn Jones trwy ddweud bod hynny'n berthnasol i ysgolion o 75 o blant. Fodd bynnag, mae Adran Plant, Ysgolion a Theuluoedd y DU yn dweud nad oes ganddi ddiffiniad o ysgol fach, ac mae mater i awdurdodau addysg lleol yw hynny. Mae adroddiad y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig yn methu â chydabod casgliadau Ofsted yn Lloegr ar ansawdd yr addysgu mewn ysgolion bach, yn ogystal ag adroddiad y Comisiwn Cefn Gwlad i Senedd y DU yn 2005, sy'n tynnu sylw at wirionedd y sefyllfa, sef bod

ysgolion sydd â llai na 100 o blant...yn cael y canlyniadau gorau.

Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth Lafur/Plaid Cymru hon yng Nghymru beidio ag anwybyddu pryder ynghylch erydu bywyd cymunedol yn gyffredinol, ac erydu gwasanaethau gwledig sy'n darparu'r glud cymdeithasol i glymu cymunedau ynghyd. Mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad ar ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell, dywedodd yr Ymgyrch Diogelu Cymru Wledig:

mae angen i Lywodraeth Cymru sylweddoli mor ddwfn yw'r broblem.

Ychwanegodd yr ymgyrch ei bod yn disgwyl cael cefnogaeth ar gyfer

darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig anghysbell—megis addysg.

Trwy Gymru gyfan, yn wledig ac fel arall, rhaid i lywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth Cymru ystyried pob agwedd ar y mater hwn a gweld sut y gellir defnyddio adeiladau ac asedau ysgolion er budd cymunedau yn ogystal ag ar gyfer ysgolion, gyda ffyrdd cynaliadwy a chost-effeithlon o ddefnyddio adnoddau'n cymryd lle problem lleoedd gwag. Fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i nodi, er mwyn cyflawni hyn ni ddylid ystyried cau'r un

assessment having first addressed its impact on community cohesion.

6.50 p.m.

**Alun Davies:** Had I been proposing an amendment to the motion, I would have said that we should delete all after point 1(a). I do not believe that we can justify any school remaining open or any school reorganisation on the basis of anything other than educational grounds. You simply cannot say to a community or to parents, 'I'm sorry, we do not think that the school provides a particularly good education, but we are going to keep it open because the local choir likes to practise in the hall'. You must be very clear-sighted on this. If I were to make an appeal to the Government this afternoon—I assume that the Minister will be replying to the debate—I would say, 'Please ensure that the debate on the future of schools in Wales is of a higher standard and is better informed'. One reason why this debate is so difficult is that, too often, parents and communities feel that they are being railroaded into a closure that they do not understand and that has not been explained to them, where they have not been involved in the discussion or where the discussion has been poorly informed and, frankly, sometimes misled.

All too often, people fear what will happen in the future. Paul Davies introduced the debate. He will know Crymych better than I do, but he will know that there is not a parent in that community who would like to go back to the old system before Ysgol y Frenni was established. The education provided by Ysgol y Frenni is of a far better quality than that provided by a number of schools previously. It is disingenuous to say that we should support an educational experience for children that is not comparable with that provided anywhere else in Wales or in the United Kingdom.

The Rural Development Sub-committee conducted an investigation into this matter two years ago, and Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Mike German and Lorraine Barrett, who all took part in that inquiry, are all here today. The worst part of that inquiry was when we

ysgol heb asesiad effaith gymunedol i asesu'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar gydlyniant cymunedol.

**Alun Davies:** Pe bawn wedi bod yn cynnig gwelliant i'r cynnig, byddwn wedi dweud y dylem ddileu popeth ar ôl pwynt 1(a). Ni chredaf y gallwn gyfiawnhau cadw unrhyw ysgol ar agor neu ad-drefnu unrhyw ysgolion ar unrhyw sail heblaw sail addysgol. Yn syml iawn, ni allwch ddweud wrth gymuned neu rieni, 'Mae'n flin gennyf, ond nid ydym yn credu bod yr ysgol yn darparu addysg arbennig o dda, ond yr ydym yn mynd i'w chadw ar agor oherwydd bod y côr lleol yn hoffi ymarfer yn y neuadd'. Rhaid ichi fod yn graff iawn ynghylch hyn. Pe bawn yn apelio ar y Llywodraeth y prynhawn yma—yr wyf yn cymryd y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r ddadl—byddwn yn dweud, 'A wnewch chi sicrhau bod y ddadl ar ddyfodol ysgolion yng Nghymru yn fwy deallus ac o safon uwch'. Un rheswm pam mae'r ddadl hon mor anodd yw fod rhieni a chymunedau'n teimlo, yn rhy aml, eu bod yn cael eu gwthio i gau ysgol heb ddeall y rhesymau a heb gael esboniad, lle nad ydynt wedi bod yn rhan o'r drafodaeth neu lle nad yw'r drafodaeth wedi bod yn ddigon deallus, a lle maent, a siarad yn blaen, wedi cael eu camarwain weithiau.

Yn rhy aml, mae pobl yn ofni beth fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol. Cyflwynodd Paul Davies y ddadl. Bydd ef yn fwy cyfarwydd â Chrymych na mi, ond bydd yn gwybod nad oes yr un rhiant yn y gymuned honno a fyddai'n dymuno dychwelyd i'r hen system cyn sefydlu Ysgol y Frenni. Mae'r addysg a ddarperir gan Ysgol y Frenni o safon lawer uwch na'r addysg a ddarperir gan nifer o ysgolion cyn hynny. Mae'n ffuantus dweud y dylem gefnogi profiad addysgol i blant nad yw'n cymharu â'r profiad addysgol a ddarperir mewn unrhyw le arall yng Nghymru neu'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Cynhaliodd yr Is-bwyllgor Datblygu Gwledig ymchwiliad i'r mater hwn ddwy flynedd yn ôl, ac mae Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Mike German a Lorraine Barrett, a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad hwnnw, i gyd yn bresennol yma heddiw. Y rhan waethaf o'r ymchwiliad

sought evidence on the impact on a community of a school's closure. We heard many of the speeches that have been made here this afternoon, but we did not have any facts or information; we had a very insubstantial debate. If this Government is to achieve anything, I hope that in future we will be able to have a better debate that seeks to involve people on the basis of the facts as we know them.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In order to get a complete picture of the situation, do you agree that we need to gain the views of people after schools have been joined to form an area school to find out their views after their children have been educated in the area school? It is natural for people to try to defend a small rural school in their community, but, quite often, when they have had an opportunity to see their children educated in an area school, they are very happy about the benefits of that education.

**Alun Davies.** Absolutely. That is why I referred to Ysgol y Frenni earlier. It is a very good example of where that has happened, and there are, of course, many other examples. I disagree with the points made by Kirsty Williams, because, too often, the debate on school closures is misinformed and ill informed. Minister, one thing that we and the Government need to do is to emphasise the amount of money that is being invested in schools in Wales. The statistics produced by the Office for National Statistics two months ago demonstrated that the Welsh Assembly Government spends £830 per capita on schools, compared with a spend of £814 per capita in England, outside London. That demonstrates very real investment in education and in providing a world-class educational experience for children and young people. Too often, I hear people saying that this is the result of cuts and that closures are happening because Cardiff has told them that this must happen.

**Darren Millar:** You are spouting these figures, which are meaningless, because the actual spending per head, per pupil—this is a fact that you cannot dispute—is £527 less in Wales than in England. It is not about the

hwnnw oedd pan geisiwyd cael tystiolaeth am effaith cau ysgol ar y gymuned. Clywsom nifer o'r areithiau a gafwyd yma'r prynhawn yma, ond ni chawsom ddim ffeithiau na gwybodaeth; cawsom ddadl ddisylwedd iawn. Os yw'r Llywodraeth hon i gyflawni unrhyw beth, gobeithio y gallwn gael gwell dadl yn y dyfodol sy'n ceisio cynnwys pobl ar sail y ffeithiau sy'n hysbys inni.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Er mwyn cael darlun cyflawn o'r sefyllfa, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni gael barn pobl ar ôl i ysgolion gael eu huno i ffurfio ysgol ardal, i ddarganfod eu safbwyntiau ar ôl i'w plant gael eu haddysgu yn yr ysgol ardal? Mae'n naturiol i bobl geisio amddiffyn ysgol fach wledig yn eu cymuned, ond yn aml iawn, pan fyddant wedi cael cyfle i weld eu plant yn cael eu haddysg mewn ysgol ardal, maent yn hapus iawn am fanteision yr addysg honno.

**Alun Davies:** Yn sicr. Dyna pam y cyfeiriais at Ysgol y Frenni yn gynharach. Mae'n enghraifft dda iawn o fan lle mae hynny wedi digwydd, ac wrth gwrs mae yna nifer o enghreifftiau eraill. Anghytunaf â'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Kirsty Williams, oherwydd yn rhy aml mae'r ddadl ynghylch cau ysgolion yn anwybodus neu'n seiliedig ar wybodaeth anghywir. Weinidog, un peth y mae angen i ni a'r Llywodraeth ei wneud yw pwysleisio faint o arian sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yr ystadegau a gynhyrchwyd gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol ddeufis yn ôl yn dangos bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwario £830 y pen ar ysgolion, o'i gymharu ag £814 y pen yn Lloegr, y tu allan i Lundain. Mae hynny'n dangos buddsoddiad go iawn mewn addysg ac mewn darparu profiad addysgol o'r radd flaenaf i blant a phobl ifanc. Yn rhy aml clywaf bobl yn dweud mai toriadau sydd i gyfrif am hyn, a bod cau ysgolion yn digwydd oherwydd bod Caerdydd wedi dweud wrthynt ei bod yn rhaid i hynny ddigwydd.

**Darren Millar:** Yr ydych yn gweiddi'r ffigurau hyn, nad ydynt yn golygu dim, oherwydd bod y swm gwirioneddol y pen am bob disgybl—mae hon yn ffaith na allwch ddadlau â hi—£527 yn llai yng Nghymru nag



level of investment. That is why we are lagging behind in educational attainment, and that is why we have bigger problems in investment in our crumbling schools. You have to accept that fact and have to stop bandying about nonsense about the amount per head.

**Alun Davies:** Therefore, when I quote statistics, I am babbling and spouting, but when you quote statistics, you are informing the debate. That is typical of you, Darren, and that is exactly the sort of misleading debate to which I was referring earlier. The reality is that the Minister has addressed that issue in his announcement in January. By the way, the real figure is £316, so you need to be careful about the statistics that you are bandying about.

Minister, please ensure that local education authorities have a clear duty to proactively seek the involvement of the community and the views of parents, and to ensure that all members of the community are consulted, informed, and feel a part of that decision and not as though they are being railroaded by poor politicians, and, frankly, by poor local representatives, as happens all too often. They then have an ill-informed debate and feel that reorganisation has been foisted upon them, and feel bitter and sad as a result. That, Darren, is the reality of what happens too often in Wales today. As a representative in the Assembly, you should be leading the debate, not debasing it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I do not doubt the difficulty for local authorities in trying to reorganise school places. Many local authorities struggle with this enormous task. Many of them—that is my experience in Cardiff—lack capacity in terms of the sheer number of officials that are required to undertake a task of this magnitude. Cardiff Council has been trying for years to reorganise school places across the city, and many proposals have been extremely controversial. In my constituency, we lost Cefn Onn Primary School, which served a difficult and challenging estate in the heart of

yn Lloegr. Nid oes a wnelo hyn â lefel y buddsoddiad. Dyna pam yr ydym ar ei hôl hi o ran cyrhaeddiad addysgol, a dyna pam mae gennym broblemau mwy difrifol o ran buddsoddi yn ein hysgolion sy'n adfeilio. Rhaid ichi dderbyn y ffaith honno, a rhaid ichi roi'r gorau i siarad dwli am y swm y pen.

**Alun Davies:** Felly, pan fyddaf fi'n dyfynnu ystadegau, yr wyf yn parablu ac yn gweiddi, ond pan fyddwch chi'n dyfynnu ystadegau, yr ydych yn cyfrannu gwybodaeth i'r ddadl. Mae hynny'n nodweddiadol ohonoch chi, Darren, a dyna'r union fath o ddadl gamarweiniol yr oeddwn yn cyfeirio ati'n gynharach. Y gwir yw bod y Gweinidog eisoes wedi mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw yn ei gyhoeddiad ym mis Ionawr. Gyda llaw, y ffigur go iawn yw £316, felly, mae angen ichi fod yn ofalus am yr ystadegau yr ydych yn eu taflu ar hyd y lle.

Weinidog, a wnewch chi sicrhau bod dyletswydd glir ar awdurdodau addysg lleol i fynd ati'n rhagweithiol i gynnwys y gymuned a cheisio barn rhieni, ac i sicrhau ymgynghori â phob aelod o'r gymuned a rhannu gwybodaeth iddynt, fel y gallant deimlo'n rhan o'r penderfyniad hwnnw, yn hytrach na themlo'u bod yn cael eu gwthio gan wleidyddion gwan, a chan gynrychiolwyr lleol gwan, i fod yn blaen, fel sy'n digwydd yn rhy aml o lawer. Wedyn byddant yn cael dadl anwybodus ac yn teimlo bod yr ad-drefnu wedi ei wthio arnynt, ac yn teimlo'n chwerw ac yn drist o ganlyniad i hynny. Dyna'r gwirionedd am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn rhy aml yng Nghymru heddiw, Darren. Fel cynrychiolydd yn y Cynulliad, dylech fod yn arwain y ddadl, nid ei diraddio.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Nid wyf yn amau mor anodd ydyw i awdurdodau lleol geisio ad-drefnu lleoedd mewn ysgolion. Mae nifer o awdurdodau lleol yn ymgodymu â'r dasg anferth hon. O'm profiad i yng Nghaerdydd—nid oes gan lawer o awdurdodau lleol y capasiti o ran nifer y swyddogion y mae eu hangen i ymgymryd â thasg o'r maint hwn. Mae Cyngor Caerdydd wedi bod yn ceisio ad-drefnu lleoedd mewn ysgolion ar draws y ddinas ers blynnyddoedd, ac mae nifer o gynigion wedi bod yn ddadleuol iawn. Yn fy etholaeth i, yr ydym wedi colli Ysgol Gynradd Cefn Onn, a fu'n

Llanishen. That was despite the fact that it was the only local facility. The result is that children will now be scattered to other, neighbouring schools, and many will have to cross busy roads and attend schools that their friends are not attending as they have had to go elsewhere. That was a difficult decision and a difficult campaign.

In Whitchurch, the council wants to reduce the size of a successful and popular high school, and it wants to close two English-medium primary schools and replace them with one new school. It also wishes to expand the capacity of the Welsh-medium primary school sector. That is to be commended, because, for more than a decade in Cardiff, the local authority has failed to increase the supply of school places in the Welsh-medium sector to meet the demand from parents. The council's handling of the proposals for Whitchurch has been disastrous. Only a council run by Liberal Democrat and Plaid Cymru councillors could launch an incredible attack on some of the most successful schools in the capital city.

In October last year it consulted on three options. In that consultation it relied on projections that had been supplied to the Assembly Government on the number of pupils. I am sure that many of you would argue that that would seem fair. However, those figures were submitted to the Assembly Government in 2008, and the council failed to point out that the most recent figures to be submitted to the Welsh Assembly Government, in 2009, were, surprisingly, somewhat healthier than the previous set of figures. I am not surprised that it relied on data that were more suited to backing up its argument.

Despite the fact that the council's own figures show strong demand for two English-medium primary schools in Whitchurch, it still wants to cut provision from schools that are regarded by Estyn as not just succeeding, but providing a high standard of education, and that are popular with pupils and parents

gwasanaethu ystad anodd a heriol yng nghanol Llanisien, a hynny er gwaethaf y ffaith mai dyna oedd yr unig gyfleuster lleol a oedd ar gael. Y canlyniad yw y bydd plant yn awr yn cael eu gwasgaru i ysgolion eraill cyfagos, a bydd nifer ohonynt yn gorfod croesi ffyrdd prysur a mynd i ysgolion nad yw eu ffrindiau'n mynd iddynt am eu bod wedi gorfod mynd i ysgol arall. Yr oedd hwnnw'n benderfyniad anodd ac yn ymgyrch anodd.

Yn yr Eglwys Newydd, mae'r cyngor am leihau maint ysgol uwchradd lwyddiannus a phoblogaidd, a chau dwy ysgol gynradd cyfrwng Saesneg a chael un ysgol newydd yn eu lle. Mae hefyd yn dymuno cynyddu capasiti'r sector ysgolion cynradd Cymraeg. Mae hynny i'w gymeradwyo, oherwydd ers dros ddegawd yng Nghaerdydd mae'r awdurdod lleol wedi methu â chynyddu nifer y lleoedd ysgol yn y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg i fodloni'r galw gan rieni. Mae'r modd y mae'r cyngor wedi ymdrin â'r cynigion ar gyfer yr Eglwys Newydd wedi bod yn drychinebus. Dim ond cyngor sy'n cael ei redeg gan gynghorwyr y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a Phlaid Cymru a allai ymosod mewn modd mor ofnadwy ar rai o'r ysgolion mwyaf llwyddiannus yn y brifddinas.

Ym mis Hydref y llynedd, ymgynghorodd y cyngor ar dri dewis. Yn yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw, yr oedd yn dibynnu ar amcanestyniadau a roddwyd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch nifer y disgyblion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai nifer ohonoch yn dadlau bod hynny'n ymddangos yn deg. Fodd bynnag, cyflwynwyd y ffigurau hynny i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2008, a methodd y cyngor â thynnu sylw at y ffaith bod y ffigurau diweddaraf a gyflwynwyd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn 2009, yn rhyfedd iawn, rywfaint yn well na'r set flaenorol o ffigurau. Nid wyf yn synnu ei fod wedi dibynnu ar ddata a oedd yn cefnogi ei ddadl yn well.

Er gwaethaf y ffaith fod ffigurau'r cyngor ei hun yn dangos bod galw mawr am ddwy ysgol gynradd cyfrwng Saesneg yn yr Eglwys Newydd, mae'n dal yn awyddus i leihau'r ddarpariaeth mewn ysgolion sy'n cael eu hystyried gan Estyn yn ysgolion sydd nid yn unig yn llwyddo ond sydd hefyd yn darparu

alike. Its plans for the high school, namely to reduce it from being 12-form entry to 10-form entry, have been designed without any analysis of what that will mean for the provision of education at the school, and the decision has not been taken in accordance with the Assembly Government's own guidance, which states that changes need to show how improvements will be gained as a result. In proposing the closure of primary schools and reducing the size of the high school, the council has failed to take into account how successful these schools are and their importance to the local community.

addysg o safon uchel ac yn boblogaidd gyda'r disgyblion a'r rhieni fel ei gilydd. Mae cynlluniau'r cyngor ar gyfer yr ysgol uwchradd, sef lleihau nifer y dosbarthiadau ym mlwyddyn 7 o 12 i 10, wedi'u cynllunio heb ddadansoddi dim ar yr effaith a gaiff hynny ar ddarparu addysg yn yr ysgol, ac ni chymerwyd y penderfyniad yn unol â chanllawiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun, sy'n dweud bod angen i newidiadau ddangos sut y byddant yn arwain at welliannau. Wrth gynnig cau ysgolion cynradd a lleihau maint yr ysgol uwchradd, mae'r cyngor wedi methu ag ystyried mor llwyddiannus yw'r ysgolion hynny, ac mor bwysig ydynt i'r gymuned leol.

7.00 p.m.

In respect of the second point of our motion, I believe strongly that we need to ensure that there is a proper and more robust consultation process. As the first three options have been a disaster, Cardiff Council has now come up with a fourth option. As I said to the Minister earlier, that fourth option is only to give a month for consultation. That is not done to the point of statutory notice in the sense of the Assembly guidance, which states two months. So, given that it is not a statutory notice, I am sure that the Government can get away with merely offering one month. However, that is only one month to consult an entire community, including schools, governors, parents and elected representatives. It is a fourth option with no accompanying information to back up why this scheme was being redesigned in the way that it was. That is a disastrous way to reorganise schools in that area of Cardiff. It is vital that the guidance from the Assembly Government is robust enough to ensure that proper consultation takes place—not just at the point of statutory notice, but when it is publicly considering options.

O ran yr ail bwynt yn ein cynnig, credaf yn gryf fod angen inni sicrhau bod proses ymgynghori briodol a mwy cadarn. Gan fod y tri dewis cyntaf wedi bod yn drychinebus, mae Cyngor Caerdydd wedi meddwl am bedwerydd dewis erbyn hyn. Fel y dywedais wrth y Gweinidog yn gynharach, y pedwerydd dewis hwnnw yw caniatáu mis yn unig ar gyfer ymgynghori. Nid yw hynny'n cael ei wneud i'r pwynt lle rhoddir hysbysiad statudol dan ganllawiau'r Cynulliad, sy'n dweud dau fis. Felly, o gofio nad yw'n hysbysiad statudol, yr wyf yn siŵr y gall y Llywodraeth gynnig un mis yn unig, heb gael cerydd. Fodd bynnag, mae hynny'n golygu un mis i ymgynghori â chymuned gyfan, gan gynnwys ysgolion, llywodraethwyr, rhieni a chynrychiolwyr etholedig. Mae'n bedwerydd dewis heb ddim gwybodaeth gysylltiedig i egluro pam y cafodd y cynllun hwn ei ailgynllunio fel y cafodd. Mae honno'n ffordd drychinebus i ad-drefnu ysgolion yn yr ardal honno o Gaerdydd. Mae'n hollbwysig i'r canllawiau a geir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn ddigon cadarn i sicrhau bod ymgynghori priodol yn digwydd—nid wrth gyrraedd y cam lle rhoddir hysbysiad statudol yn unig, ond wrth ystyried y dewisiadau'n gyhoeddus.

The Minister asked earlier for our ideas. That is my first idea for revising the guidance. My second idea is to ensure that local authorities start to tackle the reasons for a school being less popular than another school. You cannot make unpopular schools popular just by

Gofynnodd y Gweinidog am ein syniadau yn gynharach. Dyna fy syniad cyntaf ar gyfer adolygu'r canllawiau. Fy ail syniad yw sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â'r rhesymau pam mae un ysgol yn llai poblogaidd nag ysgol arall. Ni

reducing the size of popular schools and forcing parents to send their children to those less popular schools. That is where Cardiff County Council is going dreadfully wrong and that is what we need to do to ensure that all schools' standards are raised.

**Trish Law:** I support the Liberal Democrat amendments 2 and 3 for I have a school in my constituency whose pupils, parents and staff are at their wits' end over the length of time it has taken to reach a ministerial decision on the school's future. The formal statutory notice to close Nantyglo Comprehensive School was issued on 9 July 2009—that is 35 weeks ago. We are 14 months down the line from when the closure plan went out to consultation. I wrote to you, Minister, shortly after your appointment with an appeal for an early decision in order to end the uncertainty once and for all, as pupils, parents and staff were undergoing a most unsettling and anxious time. I received a response from you where you stated, and I quote,

'I currently expect to be able to issue a decision within the next six weeks.'

That was more than 8 weeks ago, and I have since sent you two urgent e-mails on this issue and I am still waiting for a response. You will also have received a letter from a member of staff at Nantyglo school who wrote, and again I quote,

'The uncertainty that this indecision is causing is becoming unbearable for staff and their families, pupils, parents and the wider community.'

The author of that letter also made the point that staff and pupils had worked hard to maintain a stable teaching and learning environment during the last academic year and consequently achieved some of the best ever results at GCSE and A-level in the summer of 2009. I am told that Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council and the school need to know by Easter the school's fate in order for the necessary redeployment

allwch wneud ysgolion amhoblogaidd yn boblogaidd trwy leihau maint yr ysgolion poblogaidd a gorfodi rhieni i anfon eu plant i'r ysgolion llai poblogaidd hynny. Dyna lle mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn gwneud camgymeriad mawr, a dyna y mae angen inni ei wneud i sicrhau bod safonau pob ysgol yn codi.

**Trish Law:** Yr wyf yn cefnogi gwelliannau 2 a 3 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, gan fod gennyf ysgol yn fy etholaeth lle mae'r disgyblion, y rhieni ar staff wedi cyrraedd pen eu tennyn oherwydd yr amser y mae'r Gweinidogion wedi'i gymryd i benderfynu dyfodol yr ysgol. Cyhoeddwyd yr hysbysiad statudol ffurfiol i gau Ysgol Gyfun Nant-y-glo ar 9 Gorffennaf 2009—35 wythnos yn ôl. Mae 14 mis wedi mynd heibio ers cyhoeddi'r cynllun cau er mwyn ymgynghori. Ysgrifennais atoch, Weinidog, yn fuan ar ôl ichi gael eich penodi yn gofyn am gael penderfyniad buan er mwyn rhoi diwedd ar yr ansicrwydd unwaith ac am byth, gan fod y disgyblion, y rhieni a'r staff yn mynd trwy adeg gythryblus a phryderus iawn. Cefais ymateb gennyf, ac yr oeddech yn dweud fel hyn:

Ar hyn o bryd yr wyf yn disgwyl bod mewn sefyllfa i roi penderfyniad yn ystod y chwe wythnos nesaf.

Yr oedd hynny dros 8 wythnos yn ôl, ac ers hynny yr wyf wedi anfon dwy neges e-bost frys atoch am y mater hwn, ac yr wyf yn dal i aros am ymateb. Byddwch hefyd wedi cael llythyr gan aelod o staff yn ysgol Nant-y-glo, a ysgrifennodd y canlynol:

Mae'r ansicrwydd a achosir gan y diffyg penderfyniad hwn yn mynd yn annioddefol i'r staff a'u teuluoedd, y disgyblion, y rhieni a'r gymuned ehangach.

Yn ogystal, tynnodd awdur y llythyr hwnnw sylw at y pwynt bod y staff a'r disgyblion wedi gweithio'n galed i gynnal amgylchedd dysgu ac addysgu sefydlog yn ystod y flwyddyn academaidd ddiwethaf, ac o ganlyniad llwyddwyd i gael rhai o'r canlyniadau TGAU a Safon Uwch gorau erioed yn yr haf 2009. Dywedwyd wrthyf bod angen i Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent a'r ysgol gael gwybod erbyn

of staff to be fulfilled in time for the start of the autumn term, and Easter is perilously close—just three weeks away in fact. I would implore you, for the good of all concerned, to end this uncertainty and to speed up the decision process, which, as you admitted in answer to earlier questions, is not acceptable.

**William Graham:** The Welsh Conservatives continue to favour retaining viable local schools rather than Labour-imposed titan schools. It must be the Assembly Government's aim to strengthen the bond between our schools and their local communities rather than to weaken them. There is an urgent need to rebuild the once natural bond that existed between people across Wales, of duty and responsibility, which is currently being replaced with the synthetic bonds of state regulation and bureaucracy.

The arguments for building on the foundation provided by our schools in south-east Wales are compelling. We should look to improve their standards rather than rip up the existing framework and introduce large, unaccountable schools. Clearly, there are pressing issues demanding the Minister's attention in south-east Wales, such as the region having the highest levels of absenteeism in Wales, the need to attract more high-calibre young graduates into teaching science and maths in the region and the fact that if you are schooled in Blaenau Gwent, you will have just a 45 per cent likelihood of gaining five or more good grades. That is significantly below the Wales and UK average, but there is a strong case for improving our existing schools framework rather than shifting to providing education in large central institutions that necessitate the closure of local smaller schools. Where closure is put forward, a proper and robust consultation process with those affected must be conducted.

Currently, Merthyr Tydfil County Borough Council wants to close sixth forms at Cyfarthfa High School, Pen-y-Dre High School, Afon Taf High School and Bishop Hedley Roman Catholic High School in

gwyliau'r Pasg beth fydd tynged yr ysgol, er mwyn gallu symud staff mewn pryd ar gyfer dechrau tymor yr hydref, ac mae gwyliau'r Pasg yn hynod o agos—dim ond tair wythnos sydd i fynd mewn gwirionedd. Ymbiliaf arnoch, er lles pawb sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sefyllfa, i roi diwedd ar yr ansicrwydd hwn a chyflymu'r broses o wneud penderfyniadau, sy'n annerbyniol, fel yr oeddech yn cyfaddef yn eich ateb i gwestiynau blaenorol.

**William Graham:** Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn dal o blaid cadw ysgolion lleol hyfyw yn hytrach nag ysgolion anferth sy'n cael eu gwthio gan y Blaid Lafur. Rhaid mai nod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw cryfhau'r cysylltiad rhwng ein hysgolion a'u cymunedau lleol, yn hytrach na'u gwanhau. Mae angen mynd ati ar frys i ailadeiladu'r cysylltiad naturiol a arferai fodoli rhwng pobl ar draws Cymru, o ran dyletswydd a chyfrifoldeb, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn cael ei ddisodli gan gysylltiadau artiffisial a grëir gan reolaeth y wladwriaeth a biwrocratiaeth.

Mae'r dadleuon dros adeiladu ar y seiliau a ddarperir gan ein hysgolion yn y de-ddwyrain yn gryf. Dylem fod yn ceisio gwella'u safonau yn hytrach na thynnu'r fframwaith presennol yn gareiau a chyflwyno ysgolion mawr, anatebol. Mae'n amlwg bod problemau difrifol yn y de-ddwyrain sy'n mynnu sylw'r Gweinidog, megis y ffaith bod gan y rhanbarth y lefelau uchaf o absenoldeb yng Nghymru, yr angen i ddenu graddedigion ifanc o safon i fod yn athrawon gwyddoniaeth a mathemateg yn y rhanbarth, a'r ffaith bod y tebygolrwydd o gael pump neu ragor o raddau da yn ddim ond 45 y cant i'r rheini sy'n cael eu haddysg ym Mlaenau Gwent. Mae hynny'n is o lawer na'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru a'r DU, ond mae achos cryf dros wella'r fframwaith ysgolion sydd gennym yn hytrach na newid i ddarparu addysg mewn sefydliadau mawr canolog sy'n golygu ei bod yn rhaid cau ysgolion llai. Os gwneir cynnig i gau ysgol, rhaid cael proses ymgynghori briodol a chadarn gyda'r sawl y byddai hynny'n effeithio arnynt.

Ar hyn o bryd mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Merthyr Tudful am gau'r chweched dosbarth yn Ysgol Uwchradd Cyfarthfa, Ysgol Uwchradd Pen-y-Dre, Ysgol Uwchradd Afon Taf ac Ysgol Uwchradd Gatholig yr Esgob

favour of a new £33 million tertiary college.

Local Members will know that there has been considerable opposition to the plan, particularly from Roman Catholic Church leaders campaigning to retain post-16 education at Bishop Hedley Roman Catholic High School in Merthyr Tydfil. Indeed, the Archbishop of Cardiff warned that the longstanding partnership between the Welsh Government and the Catholic Church could be seriously damaged if plans to close the sixth form are approved.

If these plans are approved, there would be no alternative Catholic provision across the Heads of the Valleys. Since the Education Act 1944, the Catholic Church has worked successfully in partnership with national and local government to ensure the provision of Catholic education throughout England and Wales. This raises wider issues of serious concern to the teachers, pupils and parents at Wales's faith schools. We must ensure that, where viable, parents have a right to have their children educated in accordance with the teaching of their chosen faith, rather than have the school closed to make way for any unified tertiary college.

With the Minister for Children, Education and Lifelong Learning having stated his express support for faith schools in response to my oral question in plenary on 3 February, it is clear that the Assembly Government acknowledges that the unique role that faith schools play in Welsh Communities could not be replaced by a central college. Similarly, the Minister will understand the concerns surrounding any merger between the College Ystrad Mynach and Coleg Gwent. Although currently described as a strategic alliance, any future merger or closures must be allowed to occur only after extensive and meaningful consultations.

The excellent facilities at Newport High School, which opened last November at a cost of £28 million, demonstrate what can be achieved where there is strong local support for a closure and opening of a replacement facility. The school demonstrates how modern facilities and a customised learning

Hedley, er mwyn sefydlu coleg trydyddol newydd a fyddai'n costio £33 miliwn.

Bydd yr Aelodau Lleol yn gwybod bod gwrthwynebiad sylweddol i'r cynllun, yn enwedig gan arweinwyr yr Eglwys Gatholig sy'n ymgyrchu i gadw addysg ôl-16 yn Ysgol Uwchradd Gatholig yr Esgob Hedley ym Merthyr Tudful. Yn wir, rhybuddiodd Archesgob Caerdydd y gallai cymeradwyo'r cynlluniau i gau'r chweched dosbarth wneud niwed difrifol i'r bartneriaeth hirsefydlog honno rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Eglwys Gatholig.

Os caiff y cynlluniau hyn eu cymeradwyo, ni fyddai dim darpariaeth Gatholig arall ar gael ar draws Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Ers cyflwyno Deddf Addysg 1944, mae'r Eglwys Gatholig wedi gweithio'n llwyddiannus mewn partneriaeth â'r llywodraeth genedlaethol a llywodraeth leol i sicrhau y ceir darpariaeth addysg Gatholig trwy Gymru a Lloegr gyfan. Mae hyn yn codi problemau ehangach sy'n peri pryder difrifol i athrawon, disgyblion a rhieni ysgolion ffydd Cymru. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod gan rieni yr hawl i gael addysg i'w plant yn unol â'u dewis o ffydd, lle mae hynny'n bosibl, yn hytrach na chau'r ysgol i wneud lle i unrhyw goleg trydyddol unedig.

Gan fod y Gweinidog dros Blant, Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi datgan ei gefnogaeth glir i ysgolion ffydd mewn ymateb i'm cwestiwn llafar yn y cyfarfod llawn ar 3 Chwefror, mae'n amlwg fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod na allai coleg canolog ddisodli'r rôl unigryw sydd gan ysgolion ffydd mewn cymunedau yng Nghymru. Yn yr un modd, bydd y Gweinidog yn deall y pryderon ynghylch unrhyw uno rhwng Coleg Ystrad Mynach a Choleg Gwent. Er y caiff ei ddisgrifio fel cynghrair strategol ar hyn o bryd, ni ddylid caniatáu i unrhyw achosion o gyfuno neu gau ddigwydd yn y dyfodol heb fod ymgynghoriadau helaeth ac ystyrlon wedi'u cynnal.

Mae'r cyfleusterau gwych yn Ysgol Uwchradd Casnewydd, a agorodd fis Tachwedd diwethaf gan gostio £28 miliwn, yn dangos yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni os bydd cefnogaeth gref yn lleol i gau ysgol ac agor cyfleuster arall yn ei lle. Mae'r ysgol yn dangos sut y gall cyfleusterau modern ac

environment can provide a major boost to pupils' performance in examinations. The same design team who worked on the Newport High School project are now engaged in the replacement Hartridge High School scheme. With construction planned to start in July 2010, this is clearly an encouraging time for pupils and educators in Newport and demonstrates what is possible from traditional secondary schools that have strong support from their local community. The pioneering vocational training facility established by Blaenau Gwent County Council at the Tafarnaubach industrial estate in Tredegar provides a good example of a centre that can be set up to supplement existing learning arrangements with no need for closures.

There is unquestionably a need to replace the many school buildings that the previous First Minister described in May 2006 as being 'trash built in the 1960s'. Improving our schools system is the most important thing that we can do to make opportunity more equal and to address our declining social mobility. Wales is slipping down the world league tables in mathematics and English, and violence in the classroom is a serious problem. Truancy is, regrettably, at record levels, having risen by more than a third despite the Assembly Government spending millions to combat it. Standards are falling and there is a growing gap between those of least and most ability. We cannot go on like this.

The reason that we have fallen behind is that schools are controlled by politicians and bureaucrats with the wrong ideas. They have undermined the power of teachers to keep order and devalued the curriculum and exam system. The Welsh Conservatives aspire to provide safe classrooms, talented and specialist teachers, access to the best curriculum and exams, and smaller schools run by teachers who know their children's names. To make real progress, we need to implement the kind of reforms that have worked so well in countries like Canada, Sweden and elsewhere, based on increased

amgylchedd dysgu wedi'i addasu roi hwb sylweddol i berfformiad disgyblion mewn arholiadau. Mae'r un tîm cynllunio a fu'n gweithio ar brosiect Ysgol Uwchradd Casnewydd erbyn hyn yn gweithio ar gynllun adeilad newydd Ysgol Gyfun Hartridge. Gan fod disgwyl i'r gwaith adeiladu ddechrau ym mis Gorffennaf 2010, mae'n amlwg bod hwn yn amser gobeithiol i ddisgyblion ac addysgwyr yng Nghasnewydd, ac mae'n dangos yr hyn y gellir ei wneud gydag ysgolion uwchradd traddodiadol sy'n cael cefnogaeth gref gan eu cymuned leol. Mae'r cyfleuster hyfforddiant galwedigaethol arloesol a sefydlwyd gan Gyngor Sir Blaenau Gwent ar ystad ddiwydiannol Tafarnau-bach yn Nhredeg ar yn enghraifft dda o ganolfan y gellir ei sefydlu i ategu trefniadau dysgu presennol, heb fod angen cau ysgolion.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes angen codi adeiladau newydd yn lle'r adeiladau ysgolion niferus a ddisgrifiwyd gan y Prif Weinidog blaenorol ym mis Mai 2006 fel rhai diwerth wedi eu hadeiladu yn yr 1960au. Gwella ein system ysgolion yw'r peth pwysicaf y gallwn ei wneud i ddarparu cyfle mwy cyfartal ac i fynd i'r afael â'r ffaith bod mudoedd cymdeithasol yn lleihau. Mae Cymru'n llithro i lawr tablau perfformiad y byd mewn mathemateg a Saesneg, ac mae trais yn yr ystafell ddosbarth yn broblem ddifrifol. Yn anffodus, mae chwarae triwant wedi cyrraedd y lefelau uchaf erioed, wedi i'r lefelau godi dros draean ers i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wario miliynau yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Mae safonau'n gostwng, ac mae'r bwlch rhwng y disgyblion lleiaf galluog a'r disgyblion mwyaf galluog yn tyfu. Ni allwn barhau fel hyn.

Y rheswm pam yr ydym wedi colli tir yw fod ysgolion yn cael eu rheoli gan wleidyddion a biwrocratiaid sydd â'r syniadau anghywir. Maent wedi tanseilio grym athrawon i gadw trefn, ac wedi dibrisio'r cwricwlwm a'r system arholiadau. Nod y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yw darparu ystafelloedd dosbarth diogel, athrawon dawnus ac arbenigol, mynediad i'r cwricwlwm a'r arholiadau gorau, ac ysgolion llai o faint yn cael eu rhedeg gan athrawon sy'n adnabod y plant wedi eu henwau. Er mwyn gwneud cynnydd go iawn, mae angen inni weithredu'r math o ddiwygiadau sydd wedi gweithio cystal

choice and accountability, rigorous standards and greater prestige for the teaching profession. By making these changes, we will improve standards for all pupils and close the attainment gap.

**Leighton Andrews:** I like this new system where Ministers get two speeches during an opposition debate. The tone of this debate has been constructive and participative, and people have been engaged in quite a difficult and sensitive issue, as Paul Davies said right at the outset.

Inevitably, I will not comment on individual school organisation proposals that Members have spoken about today. In my opening remarks, I referred to the specifics of the motion and how existing guidance—the existing circular—deals with the points in the motion. However, others have raised matters such as the Welsh language. Pages 13, 18, 21, 23, 25, 27, 28 and 34 of the circular all refer to issues connected to the Welsh language and Welsh-medium provision—and that was just a quick glance. Rurality was also raised, and paragraph 1.20 on page 11 deals with rurality, and transport issues are dealt with in 1.21 and 1.22 on page 12.

The community use of school premises, which has been widely raised, is dealt with on page 17 of the circular. In the last year, the Assembly Government has put in place the new community asset transfer programme which I was pleased to launch last autumn with the Big Lottery Fund, and which enables communities to take over assets which may no longer be needed in the public sector. That aspect is now being dealt with by my colleague, the Minister for Social Justice and Local Government.

7.10 p.m.

William Graham referred to two schools in Newport, which I had the privilege to visit last week, one of which was Newport High

mewn gwledydd megis Canada, Sweden a manau eraill, yn seiliedig ar ragor o ddewis ac atebolrwydd, safonau llym a mwy o fri i'r proffesiwn addysgu. O wneud y newidiadau hyn, byddwn yn gwella'r safonau ar gyfer pob disgybl, ac yn cau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn hoffi'r system newydd hon lle mae'r Gweinidogion yn cael siarad ddwywaith yn ystod dadl yr wrthblaid. Mae tŷn y ddadl hon wedi bod yn adeiladol ac yn gyfranogol, ac mae pobl wedi ymdrin â mater digon anodd a sensitif, fel y dywedodd Paul Davies ar y dechrau.

Mae'n anochel na fyddaf yn gwneud sylw ar y cynigion unigol ynghylch trefniadaeth ysgolion y mae'r Aelodau wedi sŷn amdanynt heddiw Yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, cyfeiriais at faterion penodol yn y cynnig, a sut y mae'r canllawiau presennol—y cylchlythyr cyfredol—yn ymdrin â'r pwyntiau yn y cynnig. Fodd bynnag, mae Aelodau eraill wedi sŷn am faterion megis yr iaith Gymraeg. Mae tudalennau 13, 18, 21, 23, 25, 27, 28 a 34 y cylchlythyr i gyd yn cyfeirio at faterion yn gysylltiedig â'r iaith Gymraeg a darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg—a dim ond cipolwg cyflym arno oedd hynny. Codwyd y pwynt ynghylch natur wledig rhai ardaloedd hefyd, ac mae paragraff 1.20 ar dudalen 11 yn ymdrin â hynny, ac ymdrinnir â materion cludiant ym mharagraff 1.21 ac 1.22 ar dudalen 12.

Ar dudalen 17 y cylchlythyr, ymdrinnir â'r modd y mae'r gymuned yn defnyddio adeiladau ysgol, sy'n bwynt a godwyd yn aml. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi sefydlu'r rhaglen newydd ar gyfer trosglwyddo asedau cymunedol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ac yr oeddwn yn falch ei lansio yn yr hydref gyda'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr. Mae'r rhaglen yn galluogi cymunedau i gymryd asedau na fydd eu hangen bellach efallai yn y sector cyhoeddus. Erbyn hyn, fy nghydweithiwr, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol a Llywodraeth Leol, sy'n ymdrin â'r agwedd honno.

Cyfeiriodd William Graham at ddwy ysgol yng Nghasnewydd y cefais y fraint o ymweld â hwy yr wythnos diwethaf, ac Ysgol



School with its terrific new building—the facilities are tremendous, and the staff also have some interesting and valuable insights into the curriculum. I also visited Hartridge High School and had a presentation from the new headteacher, whom I know from his previous role at Ferndale Community School in my constituency. He presented his plans for raising attainment levels in that school. The debate that we ought to be having more often in the Assembly Chamber is about the importance of school leadership, because that is what changes standards and raises attainment levels. That is a debate that we need to have.

After the current batch of proposals awaiting determination, we will look, as a Government, at all the issues around school closures. It is true that I have been caught out on one or two occasions this year when I have expressed a hope that a determination will be made within a given timescale, only to find that we have not been able to do that. As I said before, it is because of the bunching of the number of proposals that we currently have. Some of the proposals have also attracted extraordinary numbers of objections which must be evaluated. It is also the case that some of the proposals are quite complex in that there are inter-relationships between a number of different schools in the proposals by local authorities. So, we are conscious of the issues that face us, we are moving on that, and we will be looking in more detail at what we can do to improve the process after we have determined the current batch of proposals that have come to Ministers for determination.

**Darren Millar:** This has been a good non-partisan debate for the best part, and there has been a great deal of consensus. We had the usual dirty bomb lobbed across the Chamber from Alun Davies, which was toxic in the extreme, but apart from that it has been pretty sensible. Paul Davies opened the debate excellently in talking about the community value of schools, and the fact that school buildings are a community asset and not just an educational establishment. However, we

Uwchradd Casnewydd oedd un ohonynt, gyda'i hadeilad newydd bendigedig—mae'r cyfleusterau'n wych, ac mae gan y staff hefyd ddealltwriaeth ddiddorol a gwerthfawr o'r cwricwlwm. Ymwelais ag Ysgol Gyfun Hartridge hefyd, a chefais gyflwyniad gan y pennaeth newydd. Yr wyf yn ei adnabod o'i swydd flaenorol yn Ysgol Gymunedol Glynrhedynog yn fy etholaeth. Cyflwynodd ei gynlluniau ar gyfer codi lefelau cyrhaeddiad yn yr ysgol honno. Y ddadl y dylem fod yn ei chael yn amlach yn Siambr y Cynulliad yw'r ddadl ynghylch pwysigrwydd arweinyddiaeth mewn ysgolion, oherwydd dyna sy'n newid safonau ac yn codi lefelau cyrhaeddiad. Mae honno'n ddadl y mae angen inni ei chael.

Ar ôl ymdrin â'r swp presennol o gynigion sy'n disgwyl eu penderfynu, byddwn fel Llywodraeth yn ystyried yr holl broblemau sy'n gysylltiedig â chau ysgolion. Mae'n wir fy mod wedi cael fy nal ar fy mai unwaith neu ddwy eleni wrth fynegi gobaith y byddai penderfyniad yn cael ei wneud cyn pen amserlen benodol, a chael wedyn nad ydym wedi llwyddo i wneud hynny. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae hynny oherwydd y swp o gynigion sydd wedi crynhoi ar hyn o bryd. At hynny, cafwyd nifer anghyffredin o wrthwynebiadau i rai o'r cynigion, a rhaid gwerthuso'r rheini. Mae hefyd yn wir fod rhai o'r cynigion yn eithaf cymhleth, gan fod cydberthynas rhwng nifer o wahanol ysgolion yn y cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan awdurdodau lleol. Felly, yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r problemau sy'n ein hwynebu, yr ydym yn gwneud rhywbeth am hynny, a byddwn yn edrych yn fanylach ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i wella'r broses ar ôl inni benderfynu'r swp presennol o gynigion sydd wedi dod gerbron y Gweinidogion i'w penderfynu.

**Darren Millar:** Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl dda ac amhleidiol gan mwyaf, a chafwyd cryn dipyn o gonsensws. Gwelsom Alun Davies yn taflu'r bom budr arferol ar draws y Siambr, a oedd yn wenwynig tu hwnt, ond heblaw am hynny bu'n ddadl ddigon synhwyrol. Agorodd Paul Davies y ddadl yn ardderchog drwy sôn am werth cymunedol ysgolion, a'r ffaith fod adeiladau ysgolion yn adnodd i'r gymuned ac nid yn sefydliad addysgol yn unig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni

must not lose sight of the fact that schools are there to educate, which is their fundamental function.

Kirsty Williams talked about the situation in her constituency, as did many Assembly Members, including Jonathan Morgan. We are all aware of schools that we felt should not have faced closure, and where we felt that there were flaws in the consultation process. While we accept that the Government's revised guidance is an improvement on the previous guidance, you must keep these things under review, Minister. I was pleased that you said that you would review the situation after considering the current batch of school closures, and it is important that you do so.

Nick Bourne talked about the impact of a school closure on the wider community. The impact of a potential school closure on a community, even if it ends up staying open, can be devastating. It impacts on the educational attainment of the children, the morale of the teaching staff and the school's future role, because it immediately triggers a panic in the local community and people tend to take their children elsewhere. That is why it is important that we truncate this decision-making process when these matters come to you as Minister, so that you can make a decision quickly and so that the uncertainty is not prolonged unnecessarily.

Nerys Evans referred to the adequacy or inadequacy of the consultation process within her region. She quite rightly placed an emphasis on the Welsh language because the situation is different in different areas, and the language has to be taken into consideration. Kirsty mentioned a situation where a school had closed and the nearest school was over the border in England, where there was no opportunity for pupils to be taught through the medium of Welsh. So, it is important that there is a proper assessment of the impact on the local community in terms of the language.

Mark Isherwood raised the issue of wider sustainability in a community, and the fact that if a school closes you are often

beidio â cholli golwg ar y ffaith fod ysgolion yno i addysgu, a dyna yw eu prif swyddogaeth.

Siaradodd Kirsty Williams am y sefyllfa yn ei hetholaeth, fel y gwnaeth nifer o Aelodau Cynulliad, gan gynnwys Jonathan Morgan. Mae pob un ohonom yn ymwybodol iawn o ysgolion na ddylent fod wedi wynebu eu cau yn ein barn ni, ac achosion lle'r oeddem yn teimlo bod diffygion yn y broses ymgynghori. Er ein bod yn derbyn bod canllawiau diwygiedig y Llywodraeth yn welliant ar y canllawiau blaenorol, rhaid ichi barhau i adolygu'r pethau hyn, Weinidog. Yr oeddwn yn falch eich bod wedi dweud y byddech yn adolygu'r sefyllfa ar ôl ystyried y swp presennol o gynigion i gau ysgolion, ac mae'n bwysig ichi wneud hynny.

Siaradodd Nick Bourne am yr effaith a gaiff cau ysgol ar y gymuned ehangach. Gall posibilrwydd cau ysgol gael effaith ddinistriol ar gymuned, hyd yn oed os yw'r ysgol yn dal ar agor yn y pen draw. Mae'n effeithio ar gyraeddiad addysgol y plant, ar forâl y staff addysgu ac ar rôl yr ysgol yn y dyfodol, oherwydd mae'n gwneud i bobl fynd i banig yn y gymuned leol, a bydd pobl yn tueddu i fynd â'u plant rywle arall. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig inni gwtogi'r amser y mae'r broses gwneud penderfyniadau hon yn ei gymryd pan ddaw'r materion hyn ger eich bron fel Gweinidog, fel y gallwch wneud penderfyniad yn gyflym, ac fel na fydd yr ansicrwydd yn para mwy nag sydd raid.

Soniodd Nerys Evans mor ddigonol neu annigonol yw'r broses ymgynghori yn ei rhanbarth hi. Yr oedd yn iawn i bwysleisio mater yr iaith Gymraeg, oherwydd mae'r sefyllfa'n wahanol mewn gwahanol ardaloedd, a rhaid ystyried yr iaith. Soniodd Kirsty am sefyllfa lle'r oedd ysgol wedi cau, a'r ysgol agosaf dros y ffin yn Lloegr, lle nad oedd cyfle i ddisgyblion gael eu haddysgu trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Felly, mae'n bwysig gwneud asesiad priodol o'r effaith ar y gymuned leol o ran yr iaith.

Soniodd Mark Isherwood am gynaliadwyedd ehangach mewn cymuned, a'r ffaith bod cau ysgol yn aml yn arwain yn syth at leihau nifer

immediately taking away custom from the local shop and the local post office, and other community services, such as bus transport, immediately lose custom. Minister, there was not enough emphasis on such issues in the circular that you issued in January. We would like to see a bit more of that when you seek to review it—[*Interruption.*] Yes, we have looked at it, Minister. It might astonish you, but we have. He also mentioned the support for the campaign for the protection of rural Wales on those issues.

Jon Morgan made a very important point about the quality of the consultation process and the need for total transparency in that process, rather than the simple *fait accompli* that is very often presented when a school modernisation programme is kicked off. It is important, Minister, that where different options are set out by local authorities, they are backed up with robust arguments for and against, showing the pitfalls, shortcomings and potential benefits. Quite rightly, some Members have said that, very often, parents who resisted school modernisation support it with hindsight, because of the benefits that it has brought. It is important that those messages are communicated to those communities in such situations. Pembrokeshire is a good example of such a situation.

William, you raised the issue of faith schools and the need to recognise their importance when looking at school modernisation programmes. Of course, controlled schools generally fall outside any modernisation programme, but in the case of voluntary controlled schools—and many primary schools exist on a voluntary controlled basis—there is no consideration of the faith issue when a modernisation programme is brought forward. You must take into account the differences in the catchment areas for faith schools compared with general community schools.

This has been a quality debate. We look forward to the further review of the guidance you are issuing, Minister. We are here to support you in ensuring that there are robust ways to look at these issues, generally

y cwsmeriaid sydd gan y siop leol a'r swyddfa bost leol, ac at gollu cwsmeriaid yn syth i wasanaethau cymunedol eraill megis trafnidiaeth bysiau. Weinidog, ni chafwyd digon o bwyslais ar faterion o'r fath yn y cylchlythyr a gyhoeddwyd gennych ym mis Ionawr. Hoffem weld ychydig mwy o hynny pan fyddwch yn ceisio ei adolygu—[*Torri ar draws.*] Ydym, yr ydym wedi edrych arno, Weinidog. Efallai y bydd hynny'n eich synnu, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Soniodd hefyd am y gefnogaeth i'r ymgyrch diogelu Cymru wledig ar y materion hynny.

Gwnaeth Jon Morgan bwynt pwysig iawn ynghylch ansawdd y broses ymgynghori a'r angen i sicrhau bod y broses honno'n gwbl dryloyw, yn hytrach na'r *fait accompli* syml a gaiff ei gyflwyno'n aml iawn pan ddechreuir rhoi rhaglen o foderneiddio ysgolion ar waith. Mae'n bwysig, Weinidog, pan gaiff gwahanol ddewisiadau eu cyflwyno gan awdurdodau lleol, eu bod yn cael eu cefnogi gan ddadleuon cadarn o'u plaid ac yn eu herbyn, gan ddangos y peryglon, y diffygion a'r manteision posibl. Mae rhai Aelodau wedi dweud, yn ddigon cywir, fod rhieni sydd wedi gwrthsefyll moderneiddio ysgolion yn aml yn cefnogi'r syniad wrth edrych yn ôl, oherwydd y manteision y mae wedi'u sicrhau. Mae'n bwysig i'r negeseuon hynny gael eu cyfleu i'r cymunedau hynny sydd mewn sefyllfaoedd o'r fath. Mae Sir Benfro yn enghraifft dda o sefyllfa o'r fath.

William, yr oeddech yn sôn am ysgolion ffydd, a'r ffaith bod angen cydnabod eu pwysigrwydd wrth ystyried rhaglenni moderneiddio ysgolion. Wrth gwrs, gan amlaf, nid yw rhaglenni moderneiddio'n berthnasol i ysgolion a reolir, ond yn achos ysgolion gwirfoddol a reolir—ac mae llawer o ysgolion cynradd yn rhai gwirfoddol a reolir—ni roddir dim ystyriaeth i ffydd pan gaiff rhaglen foderneiddio ei chyflwyno. Rhaid ichi ystyried y gwahaniaethau yn nalgylchoedd ysgolion ffydd o'u cymharu â dalgylchoedd ysgolion cymunedol cyffredin.

Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl o safon. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld y canllawiau yr ydych yn eu cyhoeddi yn cael eu hadolygu ymhellach, Weinidog. Yr ydym yma i'ch cefnogi wrth sicrhau bod gennym ffyrdd

accepting that there is an issue with school rolls and financing. However, the fundamental issue that we must consider is the education of our children in this nation. We have got to close the attainment gaps. We have to ensure that the necessary investment is made in schools to ensure that people get the education they need in a quality school environment.

cadarn i ystyried y materion hyn, gan dderbyn yn gyffredinol fod problem o ran niferoedd disgyblion ac ariannu. Fodd bynnag, y mater sylfaenol y mae'n rhaid inni ei ystyried yw addysg ein plant yn y wlad hon. Rhaid inni gau'r bylchau cyrhaeddiad. Rhaid inni sicrhau y gwneir y buddsoddiad angenrheidiol mewn ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl yn cael yr addysg y mae arnynt ei hangen mewn amgylchedd ysgol o ansawdd.

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer:**

The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Are there any objections? I see that there are. In that case, I will defer votes on this item until voting time. As it is past 5 p.m., I propose to move straight to the votes. Does any Member wish the bell to be rung? I see that no-one does.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro:**

Y cynnig yw ein bod yn cytuno'r cynnig heb welliant. A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? Gwelaf fod. Felly, caiff yr holl bleidleisio ar yr eitem hon ei ohirio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio. Gan ei bod wedi troi 5p.m., cynigïaf ein bod yn symud yn syth at y cyfnod pleidleisio. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn dymuno bod y gloch yn cael ei chanu? Gwelaf nad oes.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisiau tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.  
Votes deferred until voting time.*

**Cyfnod Pleidleisio  
Voting Time**

*Cynnig NDM4434: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Motion NDM4434: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4434: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4434: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4434: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4434: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Kirsty

Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4434 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

Motion NDM4434 as amended: that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn nodi bod yr adnoddau a ddarparwyd ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi golygu bod lefelau'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn is nag yng ngweddill y DU;*

*1. notes that the resources made available to local authorities by the Welsh Assembly Government has enabled Wales to have lower council tax levels than the rest of the UK;*

*2. yn nodi y bydd dros 60 y cant o fusnesau yng Nghymru yn gweld gostyngiad yn eu biliau ardrethi o ganlyniad i'r ailbrisio ac y bydd y mwyafrif o fusnesau yng Nghymru hefyd yn derbyn rhyddhad ardrethi.*

*2. notes that over 60 per cent of businesses in Wales will have a reduction in their rates bills as a result of the revaluation and in addition the majority of businesses in Wales will receive rates relief.*

*Cynnig NDM4434 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 30, Ymatal 4, Yn erbyn 11.  
Motion NDM4434 as amended: For 30, Abstain 4, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick

Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4434 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM4434 as amended agreed.*

*Cynnig NDM4435: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 30.  
Motion NDM4435: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 30.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
Motion not agreed.*

7.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1 i NDM4435: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 11.  
Amendment 1 to NDM4435: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment agreed.*

*Gwelliant 2 i NDM4435: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Amendment 2 to NDM4435: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane



Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment not agreed.*

*Gwelliant 3 i NDM4435: O blaid 16, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Amendment 3 to NDM4435: For 16, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Asghar, Mohammad  
 Bates, Mick  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew R.T.  
 Davies, Paul  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Millar, Darren  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ramsay, Nick  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Alun  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Evans, Nerys  
 Franks, Chris  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Griffiths, Lesley  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Gareth  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Watson, Joyce

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment not agreed.*

Cynnig NDM4435 fel y'i diwygiwyd: bod

Motion NDM4435 as amended: that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. yn nodi bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn sicrhau bod ystyriaeth lawn wedi'i rhoi i'r canlynol cyn cau ysgol:*

*(a) safon yr addysg;*

*(b) pwysigrwydd yr ysgol honno yn y gymuned;*

*(c) unrhyw geisiadau cynllunio preswyl newydd yn y dyfodol a allai sicrhau ei hyfywedd i'r dyfodol; a*

*2. yn cydnabod y dylid rhoi proses ymgynghori briodol a chadarn ar waith yn gynnar pan fydd bwriad i gau ysgol.*

*1. notes that the Welsh Assembly Government ensures that before a school is closed, full consideration has been given to:*

*(a) its standard of education;*

*(b) the importance of that school in the community;*

*(c) any new future residential planning applications which could secure its future viability; and*

*2. recognises that a proper and robust consultation process must be put in place at an early stage of a proposed school closure.*

*Cynnig NDM4435 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 34, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 11.*

*Motion NDM4435 as amended: For 34, Abstain 0, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Alun  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Evans, Nerys  
Franks, Chris  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Griffiths, Lesley  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Gareth  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Watson, Joyce  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Andrew R.T.  
Davies, Paul  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Melding, David  
Millar, Darren  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ramsay, Nick

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM4435 fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion NDM4435 as amended agreed.*

**The Temporary Deputy Presiding Officer: Y Dirprwy Lywydd Dros Dro: Gan fod y**

The short debate has been postponed, ddadl fer wedi'i gohirio, cyhoeddaf fod y therefore I declare the Plenary meeting Cyfarfod Llawn ar ben. closed.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 7.21 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 7.21 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Asghar, Mohammad (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Burns, Angela (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew R.T. (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Paul (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Evans, Nerys (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Franks, Chris (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, Lesley (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jenkins, Bethan (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Gareth (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Millar, Darren (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Ramsay, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Watson, Joyce (Llafur – Labour)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymreig – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)

## **Neges gan Ei Mawrhydi Y Frenhines, Pennaeth y Gymanwlad** **A Message from Her Majesty The Queen, Head of the Commonwealth**

**Her Majesty The Queen:** Today's societies are constantly seeking ways to improve their quality of life, and science and technology play a vital part in that search.

Experimentation, research and innovation mean that more opportunities for improving people's lives exist today than ever before. Take long distance communication, where the obstacles of time and geography have been dramatically reduced: people can now use mobile phones to be in instant contact virtually anywhere in the world, be it with a medical centre in the Himalayan mountains in Asia, a Pacific island school, a research facility at the South Pole, or even the international space station, beyond this planet altogether.

Advances in modern telecommunications are also having a marked economic effect on people from developing nations in the Commonwealth, helping to transform small to medium-sized businesses. The internet is playing an important part in helping to nurture these fledgling markets but, as yet, it still remains an unaffordable option for too many of our Commonwealth citizens.

Progress in the fields of healthcare, manufacturing, and education have, for the most part, helped improve people's lives throughout the world. In the health sector, the Commonwealth has shown how collaborative schemes can successfully assist member states to fight pandemics and diseases.

In making these advances the Commonwealth recognises that the best forms of innovation are those that unite, and help build resilient partnerships and better societies as a whole.

**Ei Mawrhydi Y Frenhines:** Mae cymdeithasau'r dwthwn hwn bob amser yn chwilio am ffyrdd i wella ansawdd eu bywyd, ac mae gwyddoniaeth a thechnoleg yn rhan hanfodol yn hynny.

Mae arbrofi, ymchwilio ac arloesi'n golygu bod mwy o gyfleoedd ar gael heddiw nag erioed o'r blaen i wella bywydau pobl. Meddylwch am gyfathrebu dros bellter mawr, lle mae rhwystrau amser a daearyddiaeth wedi'u lleihau'n sylweddol: erbyn hyn gall pobl ddefnyddio ffonau symudol i gysylltu'n syth â phobl bron ym mhob cwr o'r byd, boed mewn canolfan feddygol ym mynyddoedd Himalaia yn Asia, ysgol ar un o ynysoedd y Môr Tawel, cyfleuster ymchwil ym Mhegwn y De, neu'r orsaf ofod ryngwladol hyd yn oed, sydd y tu hwnt i'r blaned hon yn gyfan gwbl.

Yn ogystal, mae datblygiadau ym maes telathrebu modern yn cael effaith economaidd sylweddol ar bobl o wledydd datblygol y Gymanwlad, gan helpu gweddnewid busnesau bach i ganolig eu maint. Mae'r rhyngryd yn bwysig o safbwynt helpu meithrin yr egin-farchnadoedd hyn, ond hyd yma mae'n dal yn rhy ddrud i ormod o'n dinasyddion yn y Gymanwlad.

Ar y cyfan, mae cynnydd ym maes gofal iechyd, gweithgynhyrchu ac addysg wedi helpu gwella bywydau pobl ledled y byd. Yn y sector iechyd, mae'r Gymanwlad wedi dangos sut gall cynlluniau cydweithredol lwyddo i gynorthwyo aelod-wladwriaethau i ymladd afiechydon a chlefydau pandemig.

Wrth wneud cynnydd o'r fath, mae'r Gymanwlad yn cydnabod mai'r mathau gorau o arloesi yw'r mathau sy'n uno, ac sy'n helpu creu partneriaethau gwydn a chymdeithasau gwell yn gyffredinol.

This is particularly important for the more than half of the Commonwealth citizens who are under 25 years of age. It is vital that their potential to build on the exceptional scientific expertise that exists in member states is also fully supported through education and social development. The Commonwealth understands this, and should continue to aid and encourage our young people to participate in the exciting new opportunities that lie ahead, in the knowledge that progress is something which must be sustained and shared by all.

**Elizabeth R**  
**8 March 2010**

[www.thecommonwealth.org](http://www.thecommonwealth.org)

Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig i'r dinasyddion hynny sydd dan 25 oed, sef dros hanner poblogaeth y Gymanwlad. Mae'n hanfodol i'w potensial i adeiladu ar arbenigedd gwyddonol eithriadol aelod-wladwriaethau gael ei gefnogi'n llawn hefyd trwy addysg a datblygiad cymdeithasol. Mae'r Gymanwlad yn deall hynny, a dylai barhau i gynorthwyo ac annog ein pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y cyfleoedd newydd cyffrous sydd o'n blaenau, gan wybod bod cynnydd yn rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i bawb ei gynnal a'i rannu.

**Elizabeth R**  
**8 Mawrth 2010**

[www.thecommonwealth.org](http://www.thecommonwealth.org)