



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 26 Medi 2006  
Tuesday, 26 September 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog  
Questions to the First Minister
- 35 Datganiad Busnes  
Business Statement
- 41 Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar  
Ariannu Ysgolion  
Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Report of the  
Committee on School Funding
- 62 Pwyntiau o Drefn  
Points of Order
- 66 Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25  
Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
- 67 Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau i Ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol  
Powys 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
Approval of the Directions to NHS Trusts and Powys Local Health Board 2006 under  
Standing Order No. 29
- 74 Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Y Bwlch Cyfoeth  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): The Prosperity Gap
- 98 Strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd  
The Heads of the Valleys Strategy
- 109 Cynnig Trefniadol  
Procedural Motion
- 110 Strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd: Parhad  
The Heads of the Valleys Strategy: Continued

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Diwygio Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Public Service Reform**

**Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's record on public service reform? OAQ1844(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** We are delighted that we are the first part of Europe to receive a certificate of competence. It was awarded to us by the European Commission in Warsaw yesterday, and shows that we are a beacon of good administration. However, the Beecham review, which we now want to put into action, shows that we are far from complacent about these matters.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank the First Minister for that response. Does the First Minister want more choice in public services?

**The First Minister:** Yes. We believe in a wider range of choices, for instance, on whether to send your child to nursery school, with the availability of nursery school from the age of three, and on free school breakfasts. There is a wide range of areas in which we believe people will want to exercise greater choice for the benefit of themselves and their families.

**Nick Bourne:** I welcome that. It seems to be a retreat from his earlier statement that greater choice in public services is 'amoral'. Is this a reflection of the fact that Gordon Brown has said that we cannot leave public services as they were, but must build them around the personal aspirations of the individual? I agree with that, and I presume that the First Minister also agrees with that and so perhaps regrets his earlier statement that choice is amoral.

**C1 Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am record Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran diwygio gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ1844(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Yr ydym wrth ein bodd mai ni yw'r rhan gyntaf o Ewrop i dderbyn tystysgrif cymhwysedd. Fe'i cawsom gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn Warsaw ddoe, ac mae'n dangos bod ein gweinyddiaeth yn ddisglair iawn. Fodd bynnag, dengys adolygiad Beecham, yr adolygiad yr ydym yn awr am ei roi ar waith, nad ydym yn hunanfodlon o gwbl yn hyn o beth.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog am yr ateb hwnnw. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn dymuno cael mwy o ddewis mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf. Yr ydym yn credu mewn cael ystod ehangach o ddewisiadau, er enghraifft, ynghylch a ydych am anfon eich plentyn i ysgol feithrin, gydag ysgolion meithrin ar gael i blant pan fyddant yn dair oed, a chynnig brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion. Yn ein tyb ni, mae nifer helaeth o feysydd lle y bydd pobl yn dymuno cael dewis er eu lles eu hunain ac er lles eu teuluoedd.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn croesawu hynny. Ymddengys ei fod yn encilio rhag ei ddatganiad cynharach sy'n dweud bod mwy o ddewis mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn 'ddiegwyddor'. Ai adlewyrchiad yw hyn o'r ffaith bod Gordon Brown wedi dweud na ellid gadael gwasanaethau cyhoeddus fel yr oeddent, ac y dylid eu hadeiladu o amgylch dyheadau'r unigolyn? Yr wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Tybiaf fod y Prif Weinidog hefyd yn cytuno a'i fod, felly, yn edifarhau iddo ddweud bod dewis yn ddiégwyddor yn ei

ddatganiad cynharach.

**The First Minister:** You are confusing choice for the individual with choice between different providers and the introduction of the market mechanism. There is no retreat and no distinction between what I have said now and what I have said previously on this issue.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn drysu rhwng dewis ar gyfer yr unigolyn a dewis rhwng gwahanol ddarparwyr a chyflwyno mecanwaith y farchnad. Nid wyf yn encilio ac nid oes gwahaniaeth rhwng yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud yn awr a'r hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud am y mater hwn o'r blaen.

**Nick Bourne:** I cannot see that there can be any confusion about this. Choice for the individual, by definition, means a choice between two different types of service. The First Minister has previously said that that is amoral. I am glad that he seems to have changed his mind, in saying that it no longer is amoral. That, at least, is progress. Would he also go further and say that we must have a radical shift from the centre to the locality? Again, that is something that Gordon Brown has said, echoing the localism that David Cameron has been championing. Will he also nail his colours to the mast on that one and say that localism is the way forward?

**Nick Bourne:** Ni allaf weld sut y gellir drysu ynghylch hyn. Gellir diffinio dewis i'r unigolyn fel dewis rhwng dau fath gwahanol o wasanaeth. Mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud o'r blaen fod hyn yn ddiogwyddor. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod, i bob golwg, wedi newid ei feddwl wrth ddweud nad yw'n ddiogwyddor mwyach. Mae hynny, o leiaf, yn gam ymlaen. A fyddai hefyd yn mynd gam ymhellach a dweud bod rhaid inni symud o'r canol at y lleol? Unwaith eto, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae Gordon Brown wedi ei ddweud, gan adleisio'r syniad o gymuned leol y mae David Cameron wedi bod yn lladmeredd brwd o'i blaid. A wnaiff ef hefyd ddangos ei liwiau a dweud mai canolbwyntio ar y lleol yw'r ffordd ymlaen?

**The First Minister:** You obviously did not hear what I said, Nick. Perhaps you would do well to read the Record tomorrow of your questions and my answers to you. I clearly said that there is a distinction between a choice between different providers of the same service, and giving people more choice of the services to be provided, as with free school breakfasts, which I take it that you now support, as you are so keen on choice, and as with the choice to go to nursery school at the age of three, at least part time, which we provide in Wales. As far as I know, we do that in advance of anywhere else in the United Kingdom. That is quite different from wishing to extend choice in terms of different providers for the same service; we are talking about more choice between different levels of service that you can opt for.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n amlwg, Nick, na chlywsoch yr hyn a ddywedais. Efallai y dylech ddarllen y Cofnod yfory er mwyn gweld eich cwestiynau a'm hatebion i chi. Dywedais yn glir fod gwahaniaeth rhwng dewis rhwng gwahanol ddarparwyr sy'n darparu'r un math o wasanaeth, a rhoi mwy o ddewis i bobl ynghylch y gwasanaethau y dylid eu darparu. Enghraifft o hyn yw cynnig brechwast am ddim mewn ysgolion—tybiaf eich bod yn cefnogi hyn yn awr, gan eich bod mor hoff o ddewis. Yn yr un modd, mae'r dewis o anfon plant i'r ysgol feithrin, yn rhan-amser o leiaf, pan fyddant yn dair oed, rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei ddarparu yng Nghymru. Hyd y gwn, yr ydym yn gwneud hynny cyn i unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig ei wneud. Mae hynny'n dra gwahanol i ddymuno ymestyn y dewis sydd ar gael o ran gwahanol ddarparwyr sy'n cynnig yr un gwasanaeth; yr ydym yn siarad am fwy o ddewis rhwng lefelau gwahanol o wasanaeth.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Does the First Minister agree that when companies take over services that were

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn cytuno y dylai cwmnïau, pan fyddant yn meddiannu

previously in the public sector they should adopt the higher standards of fairness and openness in their dealings with their workforce? Is the First Minister aware of the deep concerns at RAF Valley at the way in which Babcock Defence Services, which is responsible for aircraft maintenance, treats its workforce? I am told that the company has failed to consult the workforce properly on possible redundancies. Are not workers entitled to a proper explanation of the company's views?

**The First Minister:** We do not get involved in individual industrial relations issues, especially when they are at a very sensitive stage, as I understand this to be. Babcock is seeking 40 voluntary redundancies, I believe, from among the 650-strong workforce, and I do not think that we want to intervene at this stage. However, I understand the strength of feeling that has been manifested in the protest meetings; it is a sticky situation between the unions and the management of Babcock at the moment, but we hope that, after further negotiations, they will come to an agreement.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** These services were previously dealt with in the public sector, and have now been contractorised, with the employment of a number of local people. It is not so much about the detail of what the discussions are as about how these companies treat people when there are redundancies. I am not asking the First Minister to get involved in the actual discussions, as that would be quite wrong; I am asking whether he feels able to ask his officials, or those of the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, to tell this company that it has to be open with its workforce regarding its plans. Surely dialogue is much better than confrontation.

**The First Minister:** I would certainly agree with that last sentiment, as would everyone in the Assembly. However, the contractorisation took place a long time ago. I recall meeting representatives of the trade unions at least 10 years ago, when I was still an opposition spokesperson on Welsh affairs, before the 1997 election, when Brown and Root and Marshall Aerospace Ltd, I think, took over

gwasanaethau a oedd yn y sector cyhoeddus cyn hynny, fabwysiadu safonau uwch o ran bod yn deg ac yn agored wrth ddelio â'u gweithlu? A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol o'r pryderon dwys yn RAF y Fali ynghylch y modd y mae Gwasanaethau Amddiffyn Babcock, sy'n gyfrifol am gynnal a chadw awyrennau, yn trin ei weithlu? Dywedwyd wrthyf nad yw'r cwmni wedi ymgynghori'n iawn â'r gweithlu ynghylch y posibilrwydd y bydd swyddi'n cael eu colli. Onid oes gan weithwyr hawl i gael esboniad priodol ynghylch barn y cwmni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fyddwn yn ymyrryd mewn materion sy'n gysylltiedig â diwydiannau unigol pan fyddant mewn cyfnod sensitif iawn, fel sy'n wir yn yr achos hwn, yn ôl a ddeallaf. Mae Babcock, yr wyf yn credu, yn chwilio am 40 o weithwyr, o blith gweithlu o 650, i golli eu swyddi'n wirfoddol, ac nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod am ymyrryd ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn deall pa mor gryf yw'r teimladau a amlygwyd yn y cyfarfodydd protest; mae'n sefyllfa anodd rhwng yr undebau a rheolwyr Babcock ar hyn o bryd, ond gobeithiwn, ar ôl mwy o negodi, y gallant gytuno.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Arferai'r gwasanaethau hyn gael eu darparu yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac erbyn hyn maent wedi'u rhoi i gontractwr, a chyflogir nifer o bobl leol. Nid yw'n ymwneud cymaint â manylion y trafodaethau, ond yn hytrach sut y bydd y cwmnïau hyn yn trin pobl pan fyddant yn colli eu swyddi. Nid wyf yn gofyn i'r Prif Weinidog ymyrryd yn y trafodaethau eu hunain, ni fyddai hynny'n iawn; gofyn yr wyf a ydyw'n teimlo y gall ofyn i'w swyddogion, neu swyddogion y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, ddweud wrth y cwmni hwn fod angen iddo fod yn agored â'i weithlu ynghylch ei gynlluniau. Onid yw siarad yn llawer gwell na gwrthdaro?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn yn bendant yn cytuno â'r sylw diwethaf hwnnw, fel y byddai pawb yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, rhoddwyd y gwaith i gontractwr gryn dipyn o amser yn ôl. Yr wyf yn cofio cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr yr undebau llafur o leiaf 10 mlynedd yn ôl, pan oeddwn yn llefarydd ar faterion Cymreig, cyn etholiad 1997, pan aeth y contract i Brown and Root a Marshall

the contract. Now you have a new successor contractor in Babcock and a redundancy situation, although those redundancies may prove to be voluntary—I do not know at this stage whether they can get that. I will seek to obtain the latest information via the office of the Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks in north Wales regarding the prospects of an agreement being reached between the unions and management, and either Andrew Davies or I will write to the leader of the opposition.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** One of the services that is much in need of public sector reform is the ambulance service. Chief executives come, chief executives go, and the latest one says that the service needs an additional £140 million. One of his predecessors resigned because he could not make any cuts. Do you agree that, while we have a hardworking and dedicated workforce, we do not have a structure that meets the needs of our ambulance service in Wales? Will you give a commitment today to examine all the options, including relocating our ambulance services instead of having one ambulance trust, so that we can match the boundaries of other blue-light services in Wales?

**The First Minister:** I understand the points that you are making, Mike, and you may have made a submission to that effect to the inquiry, which is ongoing. However, as the inquiry is currently halfway through its proceedings, it would not make sense for me to start issuing judgments on its outcome. I have read what the new chief executive, Alan Murray, has said about his 10-year ambitions for the ambulance service, and I believe that he is presenting his recommendations—not just on expenditure but also on changes to working practices, the involvement of first responders, speeding up responses and ensuring appropriate use of the 999 service—to the board of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust today.

Your particular point about the structure and whether or not the ambulance trust should be broken up is a matter for the inquiry; it is not

Aerospace Ltd, fe dybiaf. Erbyn hyn, Babcock yw'r contractwr newydd, ac eto wynebwn sefyllfa o golli swyddi, er ei bod yn bosibl y gallai hynny ddigwydd yn wirfoddol—ar hyn o bryd nid wyf yn gwybod a allant lwyddo i sicrhau hynny. Ceisiaf gael gafaél ar y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ynghylch y rhagolygon o ran cael cytundeb rhwng yr undebau a'r rheolwyr drwy swyddfa'r Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yn y gogledd, ac fe wnaif fi neu Andrew Davies ysgrifennu at arweinydd yr wrthblaid.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Un gwasanaeth sector cyhoeddus y mae gwir angen ei ddiwygio yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Mae prif weithredwyr yn mynd ac yn dod, ac mae'r un diweddaraf yn dweud bod angen £140 miliwn ychwanegol ar y gwasanaeth. Ymddiswyddodd un o'i ragflaenwyr oherwydd na allai wneud dim toriadau. Er bod gennym weithlu ymroddedig sy'n gweithio'n galed, a ydych yn cytuno nad oes gennym strwythur sy'n diwallu anghenion ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru? A wnewch ymrwymo heddiw i archwilio'r holl opsiynau, gan gynnwys gwneud ein gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn lleol unwaith eto yn hytrach na bod un ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, fel y gallant rannu'r un ffiniau â gwasanaethau brys eraill yng Nghymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn deall eich pwyntiau, Mike, ac efallai eich bod wedi cyflwyno hyn yn yr ymchwiliad sydd ar y gweill. Fodd bynnag, gan fod yr ymchwiliad wedi cyrraedd hanner ffordd ar hyn o bryd, ni fyddai'n gwneud synnwyr i mi ddechrau mynegi fy marn ar y canlyniadau. Yr wyf wedi darllen yr hyn y mae'r prif weithredwr newydd, Alan Murray, wedi ei ddweud am ei ddyheadau 10 mlynedd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a chredaf ei fod yn cyflwyno ei argymhellion—nid ar wariant yn unig ond hefyd ar newidiadau'n ymwneud ag arferion gweithio, defnyddio ymatebwyr cyntaf, ymateb yn gynt a sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth 999 yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n briodol—i fwrdd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru heddiw.

Mater i'r ymchwiliad yw eich pwynt penodol ynghylch y strwythur ac a ddylid gwahanu'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ai peidio; nid fy

for me to issue some big judgment here today.

**Michael German:** I was asking whether you would rule that option out or whether you would say at this stage that you are prepared to keep the door open and consider that option. This may be your first challenge as a result of the Beecham review, which said that we needed to have more joined-up services and joint working in Wales. Given that the other blue-light services operate differently in Wales, with fire services, for instance, being operated at a far more local level, does it make sense to have an all-Wales ambulance trust when you could have a localised ambulance service to match the other blue-light services? Are you prepared to say that this is an option that you are willing to leave open, rather than saying that this will not happen, and that the restructuring of the ambulance service could proceed if that option were available to you?

**The First Minister:** I will have to look at the terms of the inquiry, because I am not sure how far it goes into the structure. However, I think that you have completely misread the whole thrust of the Beecham review. The review concluded that you can frequently reach far more economic ways of working, or big improvements in services, without having to change the structure of public sector bodies or the boundaries within which they work. Simply by giving them an incentive or finding another way of exercising levers without changing the structure, you can get them to co-operate far better. I would guess that that would apply strongly to the three blue-light services.

**Michael German:** If the three blue-light services are to be incentivised to work together—and they are covered in the Beecham review, because they are an important part of public services in Wales—how would you see them working closer together?

2.10 p.m.

In what sort of ways would you like to see things move forwards in a more effective and

lle i yma heddiw yw rhoi rhyw ddyfarniad mawr ar y mater.

**Michael German:** Gofyn yr oeddwn a fyddech yn diystyru'r opsiwn hwnnw ynteu a fyddech yn dweud eich bod, ar hyn o bryd, yn barod i gadw'r drws ar agor ac ystyried yr opsiwn hwnnw. Efallai mai dyma'ch her gyntaf o ganlyniad i adolygiad Beecham, a ddywedodd fod angen inni gael mwy o wasanaethau cydgysylltedig a gwasanaethau sy'n cydweithio yng Nghymru. O gofio bod gwasanaethau brys eraill yn cael eu gweithredu'n wahanol yng Nghymru, gyda'r gwasanaeth tân, er enghraifft, yn cael ei weithredu ar lefel fwy lleol o lawer, a ydyw'n gwneud synnwyr bod ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans Cymru gyfan pan ellid cael gwasanaeth ambiwlans lleol i gyd-fynd â gwasanaethau brys eraill? A ydych yn barod i ddweud bod hyn yn opsiwn yr ydych yn barod i'w gadw ar agor, yn hytrach na dweud na fydd hyn yn digwydd, ac y gellid mynd ati i ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans pe byddai'r opsiwn hwnnw ar gael ichi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd rhaid imi edrych ar delerau'r ymchwiliad, oherwydd nid wyf yn sicr i ba raddau y mae'n canolbwyntio ar strwythur. Fodd bynnag, credaf eich bod wedi camddarllen adolygiad Beecham yn llwyr. Casgliad yr adolygiad oedd nad oes rhaid newid strwythur cyrff cyhoeddus na'u ffiniau er mwyn gweithio mewn ffyrdd llawer mwy economaidd neu wella gwasanaethau'n sylweddol. Drwy wneud rhywbeth mor syml â rhoi cymhelliad iddynt neu ddod o hyd i ffyrdd eraill o roi pethau ar waith, heb newid y strwythur, gallwch wneud iddynt gydweithredu'n llawer gwell. Byddwn yn tybio y gellid yn bendant weithredu hynny yn y tri gwasanaeth brys.

**Michael German:** Os yw'r tri gwasanaeth brys yn mynd i gael eu hysgogi i weithio gyda'i gilydd—ac edrychir arnynt yn adolygiad Beecham gan eu bod yn rhan bwysig o wasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru—sut y byddech yn eu gweld yn gweithio'n agosach â'i gilydd?

Ym mha fath o ffyrdd y byddech yn hoffi gweld pethau'n symud ymlaen mewn modd

efficient manner?

**The First Minister:** It is by having integrated communications systems—similar, or at least compatible, emergency telephone answering systems, radio telephones and so forth. Sometimes, that may involve being under one roof; sometimes, it may involve integrating the control rooms. We will have to see what works best. I understand that, in Carmarthen, the three blue-light services already have their emergency answering systems under one roof, and that proposals have been made for that to happen elsewhere. They are not yet fully integrated, but they are, at least, getting there.

mwy effeithiol ac effeithlon?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Drwy gael systemau cyfathrebu wedi'u hintegreiddio—systemau tebyg neu systemau sydd o leiaf yn gydnaws, systemau ateb galwadau ffôn brys, ffonau radio ac yn y blaen. Weithiau, gallai hynny olygu bod o dan yr un to; dro arall gallai olygu integreiddio'r ystafelloedd rheoli. Bydd angen inni weld beth fydd yn gweithio orau. Deallaf fod systemau ateb galwadau brys y tri gwasanaeth brys dan yr un to yng Nghaerfyrddin, a bod cynigion wedi eu gwneud i hynny ddigwydd mewn mannau eraill. Nid ydynt wedi eu hintegreiddio'n llwyr eto, ond maent, o leiaf, ar ben y ffordd.

### **Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Portffolio Addysg Priorities for the Education Portfolio**

**Q2 Janet Ryder:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for the education portfolio? OAQ1827(FM)

**C2 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y portffolio addysg? OAQ1827(FM)

**The First Minister:** You will be aware of the 12.7 per cent increase in the education budget for this year, exclusive of the revenue support grant. That money has been devoted to the raising achievement and individual standards in education programme, which is aimed at addressing underachievement, to small and rural schools, to addressing inequalities between pay in further education and elsewhere, and to closing the higher education funding gap.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol o'r cynnydd o 12.7 y cant yn y gyllideb addysg eleni, heb gynnwys y grant cynnal refeniw. Mae'r arian hwnnw wedi cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer y rhaglen gwella cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg, sydd â'r nod o fynd i'r afael â thangyflawni, ar gyfer ysgolion bach ac ysgolion gwledig, ar gyfer mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb o ran tâl mewn addysg bellach a mannau eraill, ac ar gyfer cau'r bwlch cyllido ym maes addysg uwch.

**Janet Ryder:** Last night, a number of us had the pleasure of taking part in a discussion panel organised by NIACE Dysgu Cymru, where we answered many questions from its learners' network, made up of people who participate in lifelong learning—that is, the older section of the learning curve. Many of them take part in community education. Questions came from participators and providers. The common theme that ran through all questions was disappointment with your Government's funding of education. They see you putting a lot of money into early years education and taking it out of community education, which is a vital part of community regeneration and learning. How would you help us to answer

**Janet Ryder:** Neithiwr, cafodd nifer ohonom y pleser o gymryd rhan mewn panel trafod a drefnwyd gan NIACE Dysgu Cymru, lle y buom yn ateb llawer o gwestiynau gan ei rwydwaith dysgwyr, a oedd yn cynnwys pobl sy'n cymryd rhan mewn addysg gydol oes—hynny yw, y rhai hŷn o fewn byd addysg. Mae amryw ohonynt yn cymryd rhan mewn addysg gymunedol. Cafwyd cwestiynau gan gyfranogwyr a darparwyr. Y thema gyffredin a oedd wrth wraidd y cwestiynau i gyd oedd siom gyda'r cyllid y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei roi i addysg. Maent yn eich gweld yn rhoi llawer o arian i addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar ac yn ei gymryd oddi ar addysg gymunedol. Sut y byddech yn ein helpu i ateb y cwestiynau hynny? Beth yw eich



those questions? What is your priority for lifelong learning?

**The First Minister:** It is a very high priority. I cannot include 10 priorities in a relatively brief initial answer, but turning schools into community resources, rather than strictly for the academic education of three or seven to 11-year-olds, is one of them. Ensuring that education is seen as a lifelong activity to help people to cope with changes in society or in the economy is another very high priority. Of the four priorities that I did happen to mention, the equalisation of FE pay will have a bearing on the availability of lecturers to do the job, in terms of community education and allied matters, at reasonable remuneration.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Earlier, you referred to the Beecham review. One of the key themes of that review is encouraging collaboration between providers of different services; education is no exception. Do you agree that if the 14-19 pathways, providing a vocational as well as an academic experience for young people, are to be successful, they must involve the active participation and agreement of key education sectors—schools, FE colleges, work-based learning providers and, crucially, employers?

**The First Minister:** Yes, I do. In Nick Bourne's new-found enthusiasm for everything that Gordon Brown said yesterday, he mentioned the parity of esteem between vocational and academic education being a long-held target. We want to try to achieve that. In Wales, we have gone further towards achieving that than most parts of the United Kingdom. Parity of esteem can also apply to achieving—although it is difficult to do it overnight—parity of funding and resourcing courses, regardless of whether they are provided in an FE or a school setting.

**William Graham:** You will know that business leaders continue to express concerns at the significant number of school leavers—

blaenoriaeth ar gyfer dysgu gydol oes?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n flaenoriaeth uchel iawn. Ni allaf gynnwys 10 blaenoriaeth mewn ateb cychwynnol cymharol gryno, ond mae troi ysgolion yn adnoddau cymunedol, yn hytrach na manau i roi addysg academiaidd yn unig i blant rhwng tair neu saith oed ac 11 oed, yn un ohonynt. Blaenoriaeth uchel iawn arall yw sicrhau bod addysg yn cael ei hystyried yn weithgaredd gydol oes sy'n cynorthwyo pobl i ymdopi â newidiadau yn y gymuned neu yn yr economi. O'r pedair blaenoriaeth y bu imi ddigwydd sôn amdanynt, bydd sicrhau cyflogau cyfartal ym maes addysg bellach yn effeithio ar faint o ddarlithwyr a fydd ar gael i wneud y gwaith, o ran addysg yn y gymuned a materion tebyg, am dâl rhesymol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yn gynharach, cyfeiriasoch at adolygiad Beecham. Un o themâu allweddol yr adolygiad hwnnw yw annog cydweithrediad rhwng darparwyr gwahanol wasanaethau; nid yw addysg yn eithriad. A gytunwch os yw llwybrau addysg 14-19 am fynd ati'n llwyddiannus i ddarparu profiad galwedigaethol yn ogystal â phrofiad academiaidd o fyd addysg i bobl ifanc, y dylent gynnwys cyfranogiad gweithredol a chytundeb sectorau allweddol addysg—ysgolion, colegau addysg bellach, darparwyr addysg seiliedig ar waith, ac, yn hanfodol, cyflogwyr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf, yr wyf yn cytuno. Dywedodd Nick Bourne, wrth iddo ddangos ei frwdfrydedd ynghylch popeth yr oedd Gordon Brown yn ei ddweud ddoe, fod cael parch cydradd tuag at addysg alwedigaethol ac addysg academiaidd yn darged ers tro byd. Mae arnom eisiau ceisio cyflawni hynny. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi mynd ymhellach tuag at gyflawni hynny na'r rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gall parch cydradd fod yn berthnasol hefyd—er ei bod yn anodd gwneud hyn dros nos—o ran sicrhau cyllid cydradd a darparu adnoddau ar gyfer cyrsiau, boed y rheini'n cael eu darparu mewn addysg bellach neu mewn ysgol.

**William Graham:** Byddwch yn gwybod bod arweinwyr busnesau'n dal i fynegi pryderon ynghylch y nifer sylweddol o bobl ifanc sy'n

and graduates, for that matter—who lack the skills that are essential for the knowledge economy that you, quite rightly, call for. Would you not concede that your Government must do more to bring that about?

**The First Minister:** Yes, but there are two definitions of this. It is interesting to see the way in which the business community tends to break on this issue. I think that it would agree with the new-found priority that we in Wales, in particular, place on key skills—team working, general communication, information technology and project skills. Those are all skills related to doing things as distinct from merely regurgitating learning. On the other hand, there is another school of thought that says that, if we do that—and we are putting huge emphasis on those key skills—it also wants GCSEs and A-levels. It is quite hard to get the balance right, but we are trying to meet the complaints of the business community on both fronts.

**Peter Black:** It is widely accepted that your Government's aspiration to make all school buildings fit for purpose by 2010 is not achievable. What work are you doing with your Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills and the Welsh Local Government Association to put a more realistic target in place for achieving that aim?

**The First Minister:** It is fair to say that the levers do not all lie in our hands, so you are quite right that we cannot issue a centralised, top-down command, saying, 'This will happen; we will modernise that building and that building', because they do not belong to us but to local government. If local government has the kinds of difficulties in deciding on which schools to modernise that we have seen over the past few months in a few big cities that I could mention, there will be delays in achieving what we would all like to see: modernised school buildings. It is up to local government to take on board the responsibility of carrying the public with it in modernising the school stock in the light of the number of schoolchildren that it has to fit

gadael yr ysgol—a graddedigion hefyd, o ran hynny—nad ydynt yn meddu ar y sgiliau sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer yr economi wybodaeth yr ydych, yn gwbl briodol, yn galw amdani. Oni fydddech yn derbyn bod yn rhaid i'ch Llywodraeth wneud mwy er mwyn gwireddu hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddwn, ond mae dwy ffordd o ddehongli hyn. Mae'n ddiddorol gweld sut y mae'r gymuned fusnes yn edrych ar y mater. Credaf y byddai'n cytuno ar y flaenoriaeth newydd yr ydym ni yng Nghymru, yn arbennig, yn ei rhoi i sgiliau allweddol—gweithio fel rhan o dîm, cyfathrebu cyffredinol, technoleg gwybodaeth a sgiliau prosiect. Mae'r rheini i gyd yn sgiliau sy'n ymwneud â gwneud pethau yn hytrach na dim ond atgynhyrchu'r hyn a ddysgwyd. Ar y llaw arall, mae carfan arall sy'n barnu hyd yn oed os ydym yn gwneud hynny—ac yr ydym ni'n rhoi pwyslais anferth ar sgiliau allweddol—fod arni eisiau TGAU a Lefel A hefyd. Mae'n dra anodd sicrhau'r cydbwysedd cywir, ond yr ydym yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â chwynion y gymuned fusnes o'r ddau du.

**Peter Black:** Derbynnir yn gyffredinol na ellir cyflawni dyhead eich Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yn addas i'r diben erbyn 2010. Pa waith yr ydych yn ei wneud gyda'ch Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau a Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru i osod targed mwy realistig ar gyfer gwireddu'r nod hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n deg dweud nad yn ein dwylo ni y mae'r grym i gyd, felly yr ydych yn llygad eich lle na allwn gyhoeddi gorchymyn canolog, o'r brig i lawr, gan ddweud, 'Mae hyn yn mynd i ddigwydd; yr ydym am foderneiddio'r adeilad hwn a'r adeilad hwnnw', gan nad ydynt yn eiddo i ni, ond i lywodraeth leol. Os oes gan lywodraeth leol y mathau o anawsterau wrth benderfynu pa ysgolion i'w moderneiddio yr ydym wedi'u gweld yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf mewn ambell ddinas fawr y gallwn ei henwi, bydd oedi cyn cyflawni'r hyn yr hoffai pawb ohonom ei weld: moderneiddio adeiladau ysgolion. Mater i lywodraeth leol yw derbyn y cyfrifoldeb dros gael cydsyniad y cyhoedd i foderneiddio'r stoc ysgolion yn ôl nifer y

into those buildings. We will then provide the money to modernise the school stock by 2010. If an authority cannot do it, then it will find that other local authorities will get the capital money that we are making available, and I think that there will be a general feeling in the areas of those local authorities that are falling behind that the electors—and children—there have been let down.

plant ysgol y mae'n rhaid iddi eu cael i mewn i'r adeiladau hynny. Wedyn fe ddarparwn ni'r arian i foderneiddio'r stoc ysgolion erbyn 2010. Os na all awdurdod wneud hynny, yna fe wêl fod awdurdodau lleol eraill yn cael yr arian cyfalaf y byddwn yn ei ddarparu, ac yr wyf yn meddwl y bydd teimlad cyffredinol yn ardaloedd yr awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd ar ei hôl hi fod yr etholwyr—a'r plant—yno wedi cael eu siomi.

### **Y Cynllun Effeithlonrwydd Ynni Cartref The Home Energy Efficiency Scheme**

**Q3 Val Lloyd:** Will the First Minister give an update on the home energy efficiency scheme? OAQ1845(FM)

**C3 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref? OAQ1845(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have the challenging target of trying to increase the coverage of the home energy efficiency scheme to 95,000 homes cumulatively by 2007. We hope that that will be how the £10 million extra that we have available for the scheme—£5 million in this financial year and £5 million for the next—will have an impact, by extending the grant range and also extending it to oil. However, we have yet to bring that legislation before the Assembly.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y nod sydd gennym, a hynny'n gryn her, yw ceisio cynyddu nifer y cartrefi sy'n rhan o'r cynllun i 95,000 i gyd erbyn 2007. Gobeithiwn mai dyna'r effaith a gaiff y £10 miliwn ychwanegol sydd ar gael gennym ar gyfer y cynllun—£5 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon a £5 miliwn yn y flwyddyn nesaf—drwy ymestyn ystod y grant a hefyd ei ymestyn i gynnwys olew. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym wedi dod â'r ddeddfwriaeth honno gerbron y Cynulliad eto.

**Val Lloyd:** I am pleased to note from the latest figures that Swansea has the largest number of homes in Wales to have benefited from HEES—1,029 properties. I also note that the scheme has benefited a total of 400,000 homes. I have organised a number of successful advice surgeries with the Eaga partnership, on which we had good feedback. However, many people in need only just miss out on benefiting from this scheme. Although you have indicated that things are in the pipeline, are there any firmer plans to review the qualifying criteria in order to widen inclusion?

**Val Lloyd:** Mae'n dda gennyf nodi oddi wrth y ffigurau diweddaraf mai yn Abertawe y mae'r nifer fwyaf o gartrefi yng Nghymru sydd wedi elwa o'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd—sef 1,029 o dai. Sylwaf hefyd fod y cynllun wedi bod o fudd i gyfanswm o 400,000 o gartrefi. Yr wyf wedi trefnu nifer o gymorthfeydd cynghori llwyddiannus gyda phartneriaeth Eaga, a chafwyd ymateb da i hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o bobl anghenus yn methu o drwch blewyn â manteisio ar y cynllun hwn. Er eich bod wedi nodi bod pethau ar y gweill, a oes unrhyw gynlluniau mwy pendant i adolygu'r meini prawf ar gyfer bod yn gymwys er mwyn cynnwys rhagor o bobl?

**The First Minister:** As I mentioned last week in the report on the forward work programme through to next April, legislation will be brought before the Assembly to implement more generous conditions for the grant, as well as its extension to oil central heating. However, we try to reach the hard-

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel y soniais yr wythnos diwethaf yn yr adroddiad ar y flaenraglen waith hyd at fis Ebrill nesaf, deuir â deddfwriaeth gerbron y Cynulliad i roi amodau mwy hael mewn grym ar gyfer y grant, yn ogystal â'i estyn i wres canolog olew. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn ceisio

to-heat households as well as those that are difficult to design; we have already picked the low-hanging fruit, and we are now getting to the trickier areas. Nevertheless, we have to try to do that, because the price of oil has gone up. It will come down a little now, but we know that fuel is far more expensive now than it was two or three years ago, and so fuel poverty is bound to be impacted by that.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Diolch yn fawr am yr ateb hwnnw, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf wedi tynnu sylw lawer gwaith at y broblem o gartrefi sydd ddim yn gorwedd ar y pibellau nwy, yn enwedig mewn pentrefi gwledig. Mae'n dda clywed eich bod, o'r diwedd, ar ôl y cynllun peilot, yn bwriadu ymestyn y cynllun i gynnwys bwyleri olew. A fydd hynny'n weithredol yn ystod tymor presennol y Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gobeithiwn y bydd y ddeddfwriaeth ar gael, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fydd y rhaglen wedi'i gweithredu. Byddai'n well pe bawn yn ysgrifennu atoch ar ôl cael cyngor, neu fe ofynnaf i Edwina Hart i wneud hynny, gan roi manylion pellach am y pwynt penodol hwnnw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Almost one in seven Welsh households is now living in fuel poverty, and more older people are dying as a result of bad weather during the winter months than at any other time. In June, I asked you to support research to investigate the reasons for excess winter deaths in Wales, which has been called for by Help the Aged. In response, you stated that,

'you cannot change the British weather'.

2.20 p.m.

In the Minister's response to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee last week, it was stated that the factors responsible for the United Kingdom having a relatively high number of excess winter deaths, compared with many other European countries with a similar climate and living standards, are not well understood. Although the Minister had contributed to research into the English home energy efficiency scheme,

cyrraedd yr aelwydydd anodd eu cynhesu yn ogystal â'r rhai sy'n anodd eu cynllunio; yr ydym wedi hel y ffrwythau ar y canghennau isel yn barod, ac yn awr yr ydym yn cyrraedd y manau anos. Serch hynny, mae'n rhaid inni geisio gwneud hynny, gan fod pris olew wedi codi. Fe ddaw i lawr ychydig yn awr, ond gwyddom fod tanwydd yn llawer drutach yn awr nag a oedd ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl, ac felly mae hynny'n siŵr o effeithio ar dlodi tanwydd.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Thank you for that response, First Minister. I have drawn attention many times to the problem of houses that are not on gas lines, especially in rural villages. I am pleased to hear that you, at long last, intend to extend the scheme to include oil boilers, following the outcome of the pilot scheme. Will that be implemented during the current Assembly term?

**The First Minister:** We hope that the legislation will be in place, but I am not sure whether the programme itself will be implemented. It would be best for me to write to you having sought advice, or I will ask Edwina Hart to do so, and give further details on that particular point.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae bron un o bob saith aelwyd yng Nghymru bellach yn byw mewn tldodi tanwydd, ac mae mwy o bobl hŷn yn marw yn sgîl tywydd garw yn ystod misoedd y gaeaf nag erioed o'r blaen. Ym Mehefin, gofynnais i chi gefnogi ymchwil i'r rhesymau dros y marwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf yng Nghymru, y galwyd amdano gan Help the Aged. Wrth ymateb, dywedasoich,

'ni ellir newid tywydd Prydain'.

Yn ymateb y Gweinidog i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yr wythnos diwethaf, dywedwyd na ddeallir yn iawn y ffactorau sy'n peri bod gan y Deyrnas Unedig nifer gymharol uchel o farwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf, o'i chymharu â llawer o wledydd Ewropeaidd eraill â hinsawdd a safonau byw tebyg. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi cyfrannu at ymchwil i gynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref Lloegr,

we still lack research into the cause of excess winter deaths. Will you support the call for urgent research into this?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that I would accept your original proposition that excess winter deaths are at an all-time high in Britain. I have not seen any data to support that. It certainly will be higher than in recent years simply because the cost of fuel has almost doubled in the last year or so, although I am pleased to see that the oil has come off the top now, which should have some benefit in 2007. The key issue for us is to work out why it is that much colder countries, such as Scandinavia, in particular, as well as parts of Germany, do not have excess winter deaths. I do not know of another country that has comparable weather that would fit in with your proposition, Mark.

**Mick Bates:** First Minister, I have heard you stand there many times and say what great work your Government is doing on sustainable development, particularly in encouraging the installation of renewable energy systems. However, here we have this great scheme, the home energy efficiency scheme, but there is no joined-up thinking in your Government: no-one who applies to HEES can use renewable energy systems to help produce cheap, renewable energy and to reduce carbon dioxide emissions in Wales. When is your Government going to show some joined-up thinking and make HEES a scheme that will promote renewable energy systems, especially in homes that are hard to heat?

**The First Minister:** The answer is: when there is cheap renewable energy available. The problem is that renewable energy, even in its cheapest form, which is on-shore wind, would nevertheless still be 50 per cent more expensive than conventional energy, even though conventional energy has rocketed in price by some 80 per cent to 90 per cent over the last few years. Therefore, I think that you are living in dreamland there. We would all love it to be true that renewable energy was

yr ydym yn dal yn brin o ymchwil i achos y marwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf. A wnewch gefnogi'r alwad am ymchwil ar fyrder i hyn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddwn yn derbyn eich haerriad gwreiddiol bod y marwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf yn uwch nag erioed ym Mhrydain. Nid wyf wedi gweld dim data i gefnogi hynny. Yn sicr bydd yn uwch nag mewn blynyddoedd diweddar, a hynny'n syml am fod cost tanwydd bron wedi dyblu yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, er fy mod yn falch o weld nad yw'r olew mor ddrud erbyn hyn, rhywbeth a ddylai wneud rhyw les yn 2007. Y cwestiwn allweddol i ni yw canfod pam nad oes gan wledydd llawer oerach, fel Llychlyn yn arbennig, yn ogystal â rhannau o'r Almaen, farwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf. Ni wn am wlad arall sydd â thywydd tebyg a fyddai'n cyd-fynd â'ch haerriad, Mark.

**Mick Bates:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf wedi'ch clywed yn sefyll yno lawer gwaith gan ddweud mor wych yw'r gwaith y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, yn enwedig o ran annog gosod systemau ynni adnewyddadwy. Fodd bynnag, dyma ni a'r cynllun gwych hwn, y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, ond nid oes dim meddwl yn gydlynol yn eich Llywodraeth: ni all neb sy'n gwneud cais o dan y cynllun ddefnyddio systemau ynni adnewyddadwy i helpu i gynhyrchu ynni rhad, adnewyddadwy ac i leihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Pa bryd y mae eich Llywodraeth yn mynd i ddangos ychydig o feddwl cydlynol a sicrhau bod y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn gynllun a fydd yn hyrwyddo systemau ynni adnewyddadwy, yn enwedig mewn cartrefi sydd yn anodd eu gwresogi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ateb yw: pan fydd ynni adnewyddadwy rhad ar gael. Y broblem yw y byddai ynni adnewyddadwy, hyd yn oed yn ei ffurf rataf, sef gwynt ar y tir, yn dal i fod 50 y cant yn ddrutach nag ynni confensiynol serch hynny, er bod pris ynni confensiynol wedi codi ryw 80 y cant i 90 y cant yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Felly, yr wyf yn meddwl eich bod yn byw ym mro breuddwydion yn hynny o beth. Byddai pawb ohonom wrth ein boddau petai'n wir bod

as cheap as energy from conventional fuels, but until that day dawns in the Liberal Democrat Valhalla, I am afraid that we have to look to more practical solutions. *[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This is not Welshpool market.

**The First Minister:** No, but it sounds like it.

**The Presiding Officer:** Sorry, I withdraw that remark.

ynni adnewyddadwy cyn rhated ag ynni o danwyddau confensiynol, ond hyd nes y gwawria'r dydd hwnnw yn Nefoedd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, mae arnaf ofn fod yn rhaid inni edrych at atebion mwy ymarferol. *[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid ym marchnad y Trallwng yr ydym.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nage, ond mae'n swnio felly.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, tynnaf y sylw hwnnw'n ôl.

### **Hybu Iechyd Da Promoting Good Health**

**Q4 Carl Sargeant:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote good health among expectant women during pregnancy? OAQ1820(FM)

**The First Minister:** This is a very important issue, because data from the infant feeding survey shows that Wales has the highest rate in the United Kingdom of smoking during pregnancy. Given the impact that that has on the health of the mother and of the unborn child, the NHS smoking cessation service in Wales is addressing this issue as a priority.

**Carl Sargeant:** Thank you, First Minister. Smoking is one issue, but I was disturbed last week to learn from Tommy's, the baby charity, that mums in Wales are more likely to continue drinking alcohol throughout pregnancy than they are elsewhere in the UK. It found that 7.4 per cent of pregnant women in Wales are drinking more than the recommended amount, compared with a UK average of 4.7 per cent.

One in every 100 babies born in the UK is affected by foetal alcohol syndrome, and many people are not aware that the disease is the most common cause of non-genetic mental disability in the Western world. What is the Assembly Government doing, First Minister, to ensure that women are aware of the risks to the unborn child of the

**C4 Carl Sargeant:** Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hybu iechyd da ymhlith menywod yn ystod eu beichiogrwydd? OAQ1820(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hyn yn fater pwysig iawn, gan fod data o'r arolwg ar fwydo babanod yn dangos mai yng Nghymru y mae'r gyfradd uchaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig o ysmegu yn ystod beichiogrwydd. O gofio'r effaith a gaiff hynny ar iechyd y fam a'r baban yn y groth, mae'r gwasanaeth rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu gan y Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i roi sylw i'r mater hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Diolch, Brif Weinidog. Mae ysmegu'n un peth, ond cefais fraw yr wythnos diwethaf o ddysgu oddi wrth Tommy's, yr elusen babanod, fod mamau yng Nghymru'n fwy tebygol o barhau i yfed alcohol drwy gydol eu beichiogrwydd nag yn unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Canfuwyd fod 7.4 y cant o fenywod beichiog yng Nghymru'n yfed mwy na'r cyfanswm a argymhellir, o'u cymharu â chyfartaledd Prydeinig o 4.7 y cant.

Effeithir ar un o bob 100 baban a enir yn y Deyrnas Unedig gan syndrom alcohol y ffetws, ac nid pawb sydd yn gwybod mai'r clefyd hwn yw'r rheswm mwyaf cyffredin dros anabledd meddyliol heb fod yn enetig yn y byd gorllewinol. Beth y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud, Brif Weinidog, i sicrhau bod menywod yn

consumption of alcohol, and how are we helping expectant women to lower their alcohol intake?

**The First Minister:** A new-born baby with congenital problems, low birth-weight and general poor health, does not have the best start in life. We would all like to see, as all parents would, in theory, children having the best possible start in life, which means the state of health that they are in on the day that they arrive in this world.

However, there are dysfunctional aspects to modern life, and smoking and drinking—or heavy drinking—during pregnancy would certainly be among them. Compared with what I said about smoking, I am not sure what the situation is regarding drinking, binge-drinking or heavy drinking during pregnancy. I will consult the Minister for Health and Social Services and ensure that he replies to you on that particular point; I would also be interested in finding out the answer.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, there was a report this morning of an increase in lung cancer among women and, in particular, of the worrying trend of an increase in the number of young female smokers. In the light of Carl Sargeant's question to you, and given this worrying trend, do you propose to provide additional support for smoking cessation services and campaigns particularly targeted at this group?

**The First Minister:** That was the essence of my answer to Carl. The smoking cessation service will have a major increase in its budget; that is partially related to the opportunity for campaigning that we all have on this issue with the ban on smoking in enclosed public places. However, it is also related to trying to give Welsh babies the best possible start in life. There is no question that smoking and drinking—or heavy drinking—during pregnancy can have an impact in terms of congenital diseases and low birth-weight. The question is how we direct that publicity in such a way that it has an impact, and how we reduce the recruitment of young women into smoking. Young women are now

ymwybodol o'r peryglon i'r baban yn y groth wrth yfed alcohol, a sut yr ydym yn helpu menywod beichiog i yfed llai o alcohol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw baban newydd-anedig sydd â phroblemau cynnedigol, pwysau geni isel ac iechyd gwael yn gyffredinol, yn cael y cychwyn gorau i fywyd. Hoffai pawb ohonom, fel yr hoffai pob rhiant, o ran egwyddor, weld rhoi'r cychwyn gorau posibl i blant mewn bywyd, sef y cyflwr iechyd y maent ynddo y diwrnod y deuant i'r byd hwn.

Fodd bynnag, mae agweddau camweithredol i fywyd modern, a byddai ysmegu ac yfed—neu yfed yn drwm—yn ystod beichiogrwydd yn eu plith yn sicr. O'i gymharu â'r hyn a ddywedais am ysmegu, nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r sefyllfa ynghylch yfed, goryfed mewn pyllau neu oryfed yn ystod beichiogrwydd. Ymgynghoraf â'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a sicrhaf y rhydd ateb i chi ar y pwynt penodol hwnnw; byddai gennyf finnau ddiddordeb mewn cael yr ateb hefyd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, yr oedd adroddiad y bore yma am gynnydd yng nghanser yr ysgyfaint ymysg menywod ac, yn enwedig, am y duedd i nifer y merched ifanc sydd yn ysmegu gynyddu, sydd yn destun pryder. Yn sgîl cwestiwn Carl Sargeant ichi, ac yn wyneb y duedd anffodus hon, a yw'n fwriad gennyh ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol i wasanaethau ac ymgyrchoedd rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu a dargedir yn arbennig at y grŵp hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna oedd hanfod fy ateb i Carl. Caiff y gwasanaeth rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu gynnydd mawr yn ei gyllideb; mae hynny'n rhannol gysylltiedig â'r cyfle i ymgyrchu sydd gan bawb ohonom ar y pwnc hwn gyda'r gwaharddiad ar ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus caeedig. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn gysylltiedig â cheisio rhoi'r cychwyn gorau posibl mewn bywyd i fabanod Cymru. Yn ddi-os, gall ysmegu ac yfed—neu yfed yn drwm—yn ystod beichiogrwydd gael effaith o ran afiechydon cynnedigol a phwysau geni isel. Y cwestiwn yw, sut y mae cyfeirio'r cyhoeddusrwydd hwnnw yn y fath fodd fel ei fod yn cael effaith, a sut y mae lleihau nifer y menywod

the key group that cigarette companies are targeting—perhaps they do not even need targeting, because the key group that is keeping smoking going is teenage girls. It is a serious issue, and I hope that the tobacco companies will realise that they need to work with us to ensure that the children of teenage girls who smoke do not come into this world with low birth-weight or other problems.

**Kirsty Williams:** Do you not agree that the best way to promote and protect the health of pregnant women and their unborn children is to have continuity of care with a named midwife throughout the pregnancy? If you agree with that, will you comment on the fact that we have seen a rise in midwifery vacancies over the last year in Wales, which goes against the national trend of a drop in midwifery vacancies?

**The First Minister:** I agree that effective and continuous ante-natal care with a named midwife is an important part of the encouragement and persuasion of the expectant mother to do the right thing by her unborn child. There has been a revolution in obstetric care in hospitals, as we have shifted to midwife-led units in places such as Neath Port Talbot Hospital, Caerphilly District Miners Hospital, and the University Hospital of Wales; that has seen a major improvement in the communication between midwives and expectant mothers. I will have to make inquiries, and get Brian to deal with the issue of midwifery vacancies, because, to me, that is just anecdotal—I have heard it too, but I have not seen the data on it. I will ensure that a proper, full, factual and detailed answer is sent to you on that.

ifanc sydd yn dechrau ysmegu. Menywod ifanc bellach yw'r grŵp allweddol y mae'r cwmnïau sigarennau'n eu targedu—efallai nad oes angen eu targedu hyd yn oed, oherwydd genethod yn eu harddegau yw'r grŵp allweddol sydd yn cadw ysmegu i fynd. Mae'n fater difrifol, a gobeithiaf y gwnaiff y cwmnïau tybaco sylweddoli bod angen iddynt gydweithio â ni i sicrhau na fydd plant genethod yn eu harddegau sy'n ysmegu yn dod i'r byd gyda phwysau geni isel neu broblemau eraill.

**Kirsty Williams:** Oni chytunwch mai'r ffordd orau i hyrwyddo a gwarchod iechyd menywod beichiog a'r babanod yn eu croth yw cael dilyniant gofal gyda bydwraig benodol drwy gydol y beichiogrwydd? Os cytunwch â hynny, a ddywedwch air am y ffaith ein bod wedi gweld cynnydd mewn swyddi gwag ym maes bydwreigiaeth yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf yng Nghymru, sydd yn groes i'r duedd Brydeinig o gwmp yn nifer y swyddi bydwreigiaeth gwag?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf fod gofal effeithiol a pharhaus cyn geni gyda bydwraig benodol yn rhan bwysig o'r broses o annog a pherswadio'r ddarpar fam i wneud y peth iawn i'r baban yn ei chroth. Cafwyd chwyldro mewn gofal obstetrig yn ein hysbytai, wrth inni symud tuag at unedau a arweinir gan fydwragedd mewn lleoedd fel Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Ysbyty Glowyr Cylch Caerffili, ac Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru; mae hynny wedi esgor ar welliant mawr yn y cyfathrebu rhwng bydwragedd a darpar famau. Bydd yn rhaid imi wneud ymholiadau, a chael Brian i ddelio â chwestiwn swyddi bydwreigiaeth gwag, oherwydd, i mi, dim ond stori yw hynny—yr wyf finnow wedi ei chlywed hefyd, ond nid wyf wedi gweld y manylion amdani. Fe sicrhaf yr anfonir ateb priodol, llawn, ffeithiol a manwl atoch am hynny.

#### **Gofal Lliniarol Palliative Care**

**Q5 Brynle Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on palliative care in Wales? OAQ1819(FM)

**The First Minister:** Palliative care services in Wales have improved as a result of the £10

**C5 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ofal lliniarol yng Nghymru? OAQ1819(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol yng Nghymru wedi gwella o



million in additional funding that has been made available since 2003, and the publication in the same year of our strategic direction policy document for palliative care. Some £1.6 million of the £10 million remains unspent during this financial year, including £300,000 to be spent in north Wales.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for that comprehensive statement. However, I am sure that you will agree that independent hospices provide essential palliative care services in Wales, and that their importance will increase as a result of our ageing population. I am concerned that while England has set a target to supply half of the core funding by 2008, Wales has no such target. When will the Welsh Assembly Government demonstrate its commitment to palliative care, and match England's funding target?

**The First Minister:** That is an interesting way of putting the proposition—I believe that it is the other way around. The £10 million that we put into the budget, over and above the previous budget in 2003, which has not been fully taken up yet, although there are many bids for that money, and it will be taken up by 31 March, was a boost to palliative care on a scale quite different from what was available in England. A huge range of new palliative care services have been funded since then, but it was always on the basis that this kind of funding would need to shift into the general commissioning budget of all local health boards by 2007. The timing may be different in England, but the priority given to palliative care is no less in Wales.

2.30 p.m.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I welcome the answers that you have just given to Brynle Williams, but I want to raise an additional matter with you. You may be aware that the Department of Health in England has decided to undertake a specific review of children's palliative services and children's hospice services. It may not be necessary to hold a specific review in Wales, but could you comment on how your Government will be taking forward ensuring that those specialist

ganlyniad i'r £10 miliwn o arian ychwanegol a ddarparwyd ers 2003, a chyhoeddi ein dogfen bolisi ar gyfeiriad strategol gofal lliniarol yn yr un flwyddyn. Mae rhyw £1.6 miliwn o'r £10 miliwn yn dal heb ei wario yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon, gan gynnwys £300,000 i'w wario yn y gogledd.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch am y datganiad cynhwysfawr hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod hosbisau annibynnol yn darparu gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol hanfodol yng Nghymru, ac mai cynyddu a wnaiff eu pwysigrwydd yn sgîl ein poblogaeth fwyfwy oedrannus. Yr wyf yn bryderus tra bod Lloegr wedi gosod targed i gyflenwi hanner y cyllid craidd erbyn 2008, nad oes gan Gymru darged o'r fath. Pa bryd y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddangos ei hymrwymiad i ofal lliniarol, a gosod targed ariannol sydd yn cyfateb i un Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyna ffordd ddiddorol o gyflwyno'r cynnig—credaf mai fel arall y mae hi. Yr oedd y £10 miliwn a roesom yn y gyllideb, a hynny ar ben y gyllideb flaenorol yn 2003, sydd heb ei defnyddio yn gyfan gwbl eto, er bod sawl cais am yr arian hwnnw, a chaiff ei ddefnyddio erbyn 31 Mawrth, yn hwb i ofal lliniarol ar raddfa wahanol iawn i'r hyn a oedd ar gael yn Lloegr. Mae ystod enfawr o wasanaethau gofal lliniarol newydd wedi'i ariannu ers hynny, ond yr oedd hynny bob amser ar y sail y byddai angen i'r math hwn o gyllid symud i gyllideb comisiynu cyffredinol pob bwrdd iechyd lleol erbyn 2007. Efallai fod yr amseru'n wahanol yn Lloegr, ond nid yw'r flaenoriaeth a roddir i ofal lliniarol ronyn yn llai yng Nghymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Croesawaf yr atebion yr ydych newydd eu rhoi i Brynle Williams, ond yr wyf yn dymuno codi mater arall gyda chi. Efallai eich bod yn ymwybodol bod yr Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr wedi penderfynu cynnal adolygiad penodol o wasanaethau lliniarol i blant a gwasanaethau hosbis i blant. Efallai nad oes angen cynnal adolygiad penodol yng Nghymru, ond a allech gynnig sylw ynghylch sut y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn bwrw ymlaen â'r dasg o sicrhau bod y

services are available to all children in Wales? As I am sure that you are aware, there are some very good local services, mainly provided by the voluntary sector, but at the moment the coverage is patchy for those children who have these very special needs.

**The First Minister:** I accept that it is patchy, but that is not necessarily a bad thing, in that a lot of pilot schemes are being run to see if they work and local health bodies will want to learn from one another. Looking at the schemes that have used part of that £10 million, they are located across Wales; the Hope House children's hospice, for one, has certainly received funding. People will be looking at the results of the other experiments and asking whether they want to mainstream them in their local health board commissioning patterns. However, I will take on board your suggestion that we need to have something that may be short of a review—a study, perhaps—of the best outcomes from the £10 million, how it has been spent and what has made a real difference to the people who need it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Do you not agree that one of the big problems with the hospice movement in Wales is that whatever funding is provided via the Assembly Government tends to be short-term funding, such as the £10 million to which you have already referred? I know, through contact with the hospice movement, that not one local health board has committed to providing any further support beyond that £10 million when that money ceases to be there. As a result, hospices in Wales will have to pick up the entire costs of improvements to the service capacity gained through using that £10 million. Will the Government commit to looking at this particular problem? It is no good merely putting money into the system if there is no way of sustaining the improvements beyond the period when the £10 million is available.

**The First Minister:** That is a 'the glass is half empty' rather than 'the glass is half full' sort of definition. The £10 million was extra funding, it is not all spent yet and bids are still coming in, even though there are only a

gwasanaethau arbenigol hynny ar gael i holl blant Cymru? Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn siŵr, mae rhai gwasanaethau lleol da iawn, a ddarperir yn bennaf gan y sector gwirfoddol, ond ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ddarpariaeth yn anghyson ar gyfer y plant hynny sydd â'r anghenion arbennig iawn hyn.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Derbynïaf ei bod yn anghyson, ond nid yw hynny'n beth drwg o reidrwydd, oherwydd y mae llawer o gynlluniau peilot yn cael eu cynnal i weld a ydynt yn gweithio, a bydd cyrff iechyd lleol am ddysgu gan ei gilydd. O edrych ar y cynlluniau sydd wedi defnyddio rhan o'r £10 miliwn hwnnw, maent wedi eu lleoli ledled Cymru; mae hosbis plant Tŷ Gobaith, er enghraifft, yn sicr wedi derbyn cyllid. Bydd pobl yn edrych ar ganlyniadau'r arbrofion eraill ac yn gofyn a ydynt yn dymuno eu prif ffrydio ym mhatrymau comisiynu eu bwrdd iechyd lleol. Fodd bynnag, fe ystyriaf eich awgrym y gallai fod angen inni gynnal rhywbeth a allai fod yn llai nag adolygiad—astudiaeth, efallai—o'r canlyniadau gorau yn sgil y £10 miliwn, sut y mae wedi cael ei wario, a beth sydd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'r bobl sydd ei angen.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Oni fyddech yn cytuno mai un o'r problemau mawr gyda'r mudiad hosbisau yng Nghymru yw bod unrhyw gyllid a ddarperir drwy Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn tueddu i fod yn gyllid tymor byr, megis y £10 miliwn y cyfeiriasoch ato eisoes? Gwn, o gysylltu â'r mudiad hosbisau, nad oes dim un bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi ymrwymo i ddarparu dim cymorth pellach y ar ben y £10 miliwn hwnnw pan na fydd yr arian hwnnw yno mwyach. O ganlyniad, bydd angen i hosbisau yng Nghymru dalu costau llawn y gwelliannau i gapasiti'r gwasanaeth a enillwyd drwy ddefnyddio'r £10 miliwn hwnnw. A fydd y Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo i edrych ar y broblem benodol hon? Nid oes diben rhoi arian i'r system os nad oes modd cynnal y gwelliannau ar ôl y cyfnod pan fo'r £10 miliwn ar gael.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y 'gwydr hanner gwag' yn hytrach na'r 'gwydr hanner llawn' yw'r dull hwnnw o ddiffinio'r sefyllfa. Yr oedd y £10 miliwn yn gyllid ychwanegol, nid yw wedi'i wario i gyd eto ac mae cynigion yn dal

few months left. That £10 million extra funding has produced a huge range of new initiatives. To give you an example of the staffing implications of that £10 million, there were 28 medical staff in palliative care in September 2000, of which 10 were consultants; now there are 45 medical staff in palliative care, of which 16 are consultants. Therefore, there has been a massive improvement. I do not see that as the glass being half empty. With regard to next year, everyone knew that this funding was for three years, so they will have to decide how to mainstream that into normal commissioning.

**Jenny Randerson:** I take issue with you over the picture that you paint. It is a simple matter of fact that the percentage of funding from NHS sources that hospices in England receive is much higher than the percentage that they receive in Wales. Having spoken to representatives of the hospice movement, I know that they would welcome working much more closely with the NHS and working to a closer NHS agenda, in order to be able to acquire more funding. They are fed up to the back teeth with short-term funding initiatives. They need continuity for their patients. Will you talk to your Minister for Health and Social Services about this, and will you, in particular, talk to him about the issue raised with me by Marie Curie Cancer Care, regarding the complexity of trying to deal with 22 LHBs so that it can provide a similar service throughout Wales?

**The First Minister:** I think that it is fair to say that you are confusing—or that you may be confusing—palliative care as a whole with hospice care. Palliative care is a much wider field and is quite difficult to define. Most LHBs would say that you cannot always say that one thing was palliative but that another was not. In their general commissioning, they realise that the voluntary sector provides the extras that the NHS does not provide, or it does things first, which are then adopted by the NHS if they prove to work. The purpose of that £10 million is to allow the palliative care movement, which is usually provided by hospices, to try out a whole range of different things, whether it is hospices at home or

i'n cyrraedd, er mai dim ond ychydig fisoedd sydd ar ôl. Mae'r £10 miliwn hwnnw o gyllid ychwanegol wedi cynhyrchu ystod enfawr o fentrau newydd. A rhoi enghraifft ichi o oblygiadau staffio'r £10 miliwn hwnnw, yr oedd 28 o staff meddygol mewn gofal lliniarol ym mis Medi 2000, ac yr oedd 10 o'r rheini'n ymgynghorwyr; bellach, mae 45 o staff meddygol mewn gofal lliniarol, ac mae 16 ohonynt yn ymgynghorwyr. Felly, bu gwelliant aruthrol. Nid wyf yn barnu mai gwydr hanner gwag yw hynny. O ran y flwyddyn nesaf, yr oedd pawb yn gwybod mai ar gyfer tair blynedd yr oedd yr arian hwn, felly bydd yn rhaid iddynt benderfynu sut i brif ffrydio hynny i'r drefn gomisiynu arferol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf yn anghytuno â'r darlun a gyflwynwch. Mae'n ffaith syml bod canran y nawdd gan ffynonellau GIG a dderbynnir gan hosbisau yn Lloegr yn llawer uwch na'r ganran a dderbynnir ganddynt yng Nghymru. O siarad â chynrychiolwyr y mudiad hosbisau, gwn y byddent yn croesawu gweithio'n llawer agosach gyda'r GIG a gweithio'n unol ag agenda GIG dynnach, er mwyn gallu sicrhau mwy o gyllid. Maent wedi cael llond bol ar fentrau ariannu tymor byr. Mae arnynt angen cysondeb ar gyfer eu cleifion. A wnewch siarad am hyn gyda'ch Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac a wnewch, yn benodol, siarad ag ef am y mater a godwyd gyda mi gan Marie Curie Cancer Care, ynglŷn â chymhlethdod ceisio ymdrin â 22 bwrdd iechyd lleol fel y gallant ddarparu gwasanaeth cyffelyb ledled Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf mai teg fyddai dweud eich bod yn drysu—neu y gallech fod yn cymysgu—rhwng gofal lliniarol cyffredinol a gofal hosbis. Mae gofal lliniarol yn faes llawer ehangach ac yn anodd iawn ei ddiffinio. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf o fyrddau iechyd lleol yn dweud na allwch ddweud bob amser fod un peth yn lliniarol a'r llall heb fod. Wrth gomisiynu'n gyffredinol, maent yn cydnabod bod y sector gwirfoddol yn darparu'r gwasanaethau ychwanegol nas darperir gan y GIG, neu fod y sector gwirfoddol yn dechrau gwneud pethau, a bod y GIG yn eu mabwysiadu os profir eu bod yn gweithio. Diben y £10 miliwn hwnnw yw caniatáu i'r mudiad gofal lliniarol, a ddarperir

residential hospices, so that people can say, 'Okay, I think that this would suit us better than that'. They can then include those things in the general range of care services provided, including palliative care. However, you cannot strictly define where palliative care starts and where it stops.

fel arfer gan hosbisau, roi cynnig ar ystod gyfan o wahanol bethau, boed hynny'n hosbisau yn y cartref neu hosbisau preswyl, fel y gall pobl ddweud, 'O'r gorau, credaf y byddai hyn yn gweddu'n well i ni na hynny'. Yna, gallant gynnwys y pethau hynny yn yr ystod gyffredinol o wasanaethau gofal a ddarperir, sy'n cynnwys gofal lliniarol. Fodd bynnag, ni allwch ddiffinio'n llwyr ym mhle y mae gofal lliniarol yn dechrau a gorffen.

### Ffermydd Gwynt Windfarms

**Q6 Trish Law:** What progress has been made in developing windfarms in the seven strategic search areas as identified in 'Technical Advice Note 8—Planning for Renewable Energy', published by the Welsh Assembly Government in July 2005? OAQ1832(FM)

**C6 Trish Law:** Pa gynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud o ran datblygu ffermydd gwynt yn y saith ardal chwilio strategol a nodwyd yn 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8—Cynllunio ar gyfer Ynni Adnewyddadwy', a gyhoeddwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym mis Gorffennaf 2005? OAQ1832(FM)

**The First Minister:** The TAN 8 document that you referred to identifies seven strategic search areas as being suitable for large-scale onshore windfarm developments in Wales. It is our intention that information on developments will be collected on a quarterly basis from local planning authorities across Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ddogfen TAN 8 y cyfeiriasoch ati'n nodi bod saith ardal chwilio strategol yn addas ar gyfer datblygiadau ffermydd gwynt mawr ar y tir yng Nghymru. Ein bwriad yw casglu gwybodaeth am ddatblygiadau'n chwarterol gan awdurdodau cynllunio lleol ledled Cymru.

**Trish Law:** The seven SSAs are considered in TAN 8 to encompass

**Trish Law:** Yn TAN 8, bernir bod y saith AChS yn cwmpasu

'sufficient suitable land...to deliver the Assembly Government's energy policy aspirations'.

'digon o dir addas... i gyflawni dyheadau polisi ynni Llywodraeth y Cynulliad'.

Is the First Minister aware of concerns in my constituency, Blaenau Gwent, that one windfarm developer may be attempting to establish by stealth an eighth SSA on the mountain known as Mynydd James in Blaina? While the live planning application is for just four turbines, there are local concerns that those four may eventually become 24. Is the First Minister aware that the development of windfarms at prominent locations in Blaenau Gwent flies in the face of the area's tourism potential, as identified in the Welsh Assembly Government's 'Turning Heads—A Strategy for the Heads of the Valleys 2020'?

A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol o bryderon yn fy etholaeth i, Blaenau Gwent, y gallai fod un datblygwr ffermydd gwynt yn ceisio sefydlu wythfed AChS yn gyfrinachol ar Fynydd James yn y Blaenau? Tra bo'r cais cynllunio cyfredol ar gyfer pedwar tyrbîn yn unig, mae rhai pryderon lleol y gallai'r pedwar hynny fod yn 24 yn y pen draw. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod datblygu ffermydd gwynt mewn lleoliadau amlwg ym Mlaenau Gwent yn golygu wffftio at botensial twristiaeth yr ardal, y tynnwyd sylw ato yng nghyhoeddiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, 'Syniadau Blaengar—Strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd 2020'?

**The First Minister:** It is an interesting question, but I am not sure what you mean by referring to an eighth strategic search area being established ‘by stealth’, because I think that you accept, as I did in my answer, that there are seven strategic search areas. I am not sure how you could establish an eighth area by stealth. Would you like to write to Andrew Davies or me, saying what you mean by establishing one ‘by stealth’? As far as I am aware, not one of the seven strategic search areas is in Blaenau Gwent and I think that you are acknowledging that.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae’n gwestiwn diddorol, ond nid wyf yn siŵr beth sydd gennych dan sylw wrth gyfeirio at sefydlu wythfed ardal chwilio strategol ‘yn gyfrinachol’, oherwydd credaf eich bod yn derbyn, fel y gwneuthum i yn fy ateb, mai saith ardal chwilio strategol sydd. Nid wyf yn siŵr sut y gallech sefydlu wythfed ardal yn gyfrinachol. A hoffech ysgrifennu at Andrew Davies neu ataf fi, i egluro beth yr ydych yn ei feddwl wrth sôn am sefydlu un ‘yn gyfrinachol’? Hyd y gwn, nid oes dim un o’r saith ardal chwilio strategol ym Mlaenau Gwent, a chredaf eich bod yn cydnabod hynny.

### Cludiant Cyhoeddus Public Transport

**Q7 Laura Anne Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to encourage people to use public transport? OAQ1821(FM)

**C7 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i annog pobl i ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus? OAQ1821(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have provided more than 530,000 free bus passes to the elderly and disabled. We have new powers to co-ordinate modal shift to under the Transport (Wales) Act 2006. We are investing, big time, in new passenger railway lines, including lines in Blaenau Gwent and Islwyn, and in new rolling stock.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi darparu dros 530,000 o docynnau mantais i deithio ar fysiau i bobl oedrannus ac anabl. Mae gennym bwerau newydd i gydlynw newid modd i ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus dan Ddeddf Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) 2006. Yr ydym yn buddsoddi’n fawr mewn traciau rheilffordd newydd i deithwyr, gan gynnwys traciau ym Mlaenau Gwent ac Islwyn, ac mewn cerbydau trên newydd.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I have been contacted by a couple of constituents from Penhow, near Newport, who have seen their hourly bus service cut from running hourly—obviously—to once every two hours. [*Laughter.*] There is also a three-hour gap in the service in the afternoon. This is clearly a massive inconvenience for elderly people living in the area, as well as students and people who are looking to attend appointments in Newport. This discourages people from using public transport and encourages them to take their cars instead, which will obviously have an environmental impact. Surely, First Minister, if you are to give free bus passes, you should first provide the buses for people to get on. What are you doing to look to improve these local services so that we can improve the environment at the same time?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae cwpl o etholwyr o Ben-how, ger Casnewydd, wedi cysylltu â mi, gan fod eu gwasanaeth bws bob awr wedi’i newid o fod yn wasanaeth bob awr—yn amlwg—i bob dwy awr. [*Chwerthin.*] Hefyd, mae tair awr o doriad yn y gwasanaeth yn y prynhawn. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn anhwylystod enfawr i bobl oedrannus sy’n byw yn yr ardal, yn ogystal â myfyrwyr a phobl sy’n ceisio mynychu apwyntiadau yng Nghasnewydd. Mae hyn yn perswadio pobl i beidio â defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus ac yn eu hannog i ddefnyddio eu ceir yn lle hynny, a bydd hyn yn amlwg yn effeithio ar yr amgylchedd. Nid oes bosibl, Brif Weinidog, os ydych am roi’r tocynnau bws hyn am ddim, na ddylech ddarparu’r bysiau’n gyntaf i bobl gael eu defnyddio. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i geisio gwella’r gwasanaethau lleol hyn fel y gallwn wella’r

**The First Minister:** I agree that hourly bus services should definitely be run every hour, not every three hours, or they should be renamed.

If you look at the pattern of public transport, it is generally going in a sharply upward direction. That is not to say that you will not find any examples of reductions in the frequency of services, but as regards our investment in rail and in buses, it normally leads to increased frequency. In some parts of Wales that I know very well, including some rural parts of west Wales, where I have not seen a bus in 40 or 50 years, there are now buses running regularly. That is also true in parts of the Valleys, such as between Senghenydd and Caerphilly. I am absolutely astonished by the frequency of the bus services there—they run every five or 10 minutes as I think that the Member for Caerphilly would confirm. You seek to disparage the free bus passes, but that scheme provides a backbone of service use among pensioners and those with disabilities and that makes it much more enticing for people to put on bus services that were not there before. They put them on, in part, because they know that elderly people and disabled people will provide guaranteed use and then other people can use them as well.

**Christine Chapman:** One of the ways in which we are encouraging people to use public transport is through the improvements to the rail links between Cynon valley and Cardiff. Passenger travel has increased substantially on this line, which is of course a good thing, but this greater demand has led to overcrowding on peak services. The platform extensions in 2005 mean that four-carriage trains can serve the line, but we rarely see these in the Cynon valley; for example, over a six week period, recently, they were only used 28 per cent of the time on the 7.22 a.m. service. I know that Andrew Davies's department is working with Arriva Trains Wales on a long-term fleet strategy; can you provide an update on progress?

amgylchedd ar yr un pryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cytunaf, yn sicr, y dylai gwasanaethau bws bob awr gyrraedd bob awr, ac nid bob tair awr, neu dylid eu hailenwi.

Os edrychwch ar batrwm cludiant cyhoeddus, yn gyffredinol mae'n gwella'n fawr. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na welwch ddim enghreifftiau o wasanaethau'n rhedeg yn llai aml, ond o ran ein buddsoddiad mewn rheilffyrdd a bysiau, bydd fel arfer yn arwain at wasanaeth yn amlach. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â hwy, gan gynnwys rhai rhannau gwledig yn y gorllewin, lle nad wyf wedi gweld bws ers 40 neu 50 mlynedd, mae bysiau bellach yn rhedeg yn rheolaidd. Mae hynny hefyd yn wir mewn rhannau o'r Cymoedd, megis rhwng Senghenydd a Chaerffili. Mae amllder y gwasanaethau bysiau yno'n fy synnu'n llwyr—maent yn rhedeg bob pump i 10 munud, fel y credaf y gallai Aelod Caerffili gadarnhau. Yr ydych yn ceisio difrio'r tocynnau mantais i deithio ar fysiau am ddim, ond y cynllun hwnnw yw asgwrn cefn y gwasanaeth i bensiywyr a phobl ag anableddau, ac mae hynny'n denu pobl i ddarparu gwasanaethau bysiau nad oeddent yno'n flaenorol. Maent yn eu darparu, yn rhannol, oherwydd eu bod yn gwybod y bydd pobl oedrannus a phobl anabl yn eu defnyddio, ac yna gall pobl eraill eu defnyddio hefyd.

**Christine Chapman:** Un o'r ffyrdd yr ydym yn annog pobl i ddefnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus yw gwella'r cysylltiadau rheilffordd rhwng dyffryn Cynon a Chaerdydd. Mae nifer y teithwyr ar y llinell hon wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, ac mae hynny'n beth da, wrth gwrs, ond mae'r galw ychwanegol hwn wedi arwain at orlenwi ar wasanaethau ar amserau prysur. Golyga'r estyniadau i blatfformau yn 2005 y gall trenau pedwar cerbyd ddefnyddio'r llinell, ond prin y gwelwn y rhain yng nghwm Cynon; er enghraifft, dim ond 28 y cant o'r amser y cawsant eu defnyddio ar y gwasanaeth 7.22 a.m. Gwn fod adran Andrew Davies yn gweithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru ar strategaeth fflyd hirdymor; a allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y cynnydd gyda hyn?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** In general, yes, but on the specific point, I had better get Andrew Davies to write to you. There are major investments going on, and not only on the new Ebbw valley line. I think that we are also spending £18 million on going from an hourly service to a half-hourly service on the Merthyr line to bring it up to the same standard, as, I believe, is the case on the Rhymney valley line. Wherever there is only an hourly service, as in Merthyr's case, we are trying to ensure that it becomes a half-hourly service. Aberdare, Cynon valley and Gwent are first. However, I am not really familiar with the detail of these interim problems, so we will have to look into that. These schemes are frequently expensive, but they are, of course, long-term investments that we will still reap the benefit of in decades to come.

I want to make sure that I did not mislead the Assembly by referring to 20 new trains. They are new to us, but they are refurbished, rather than brand-new rolling stock.

**Janet Davies:** In the Wales transport strategy, your Government has committed an extra £8 billion to transport in general over 15 years—I do not want to panic you that it is over one year; it is over 15 years. It also mentions increased usage of public transport. What degree of flexibility is there in the financial commitments and forecasts if public transport usage increases in line with the needs to ameliorate climate change?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about climate change, but I am glad that you have raised the matter of the £8 billion over 15 years, because I think that the figure that I have is that £4 billion of that will go towards public transport. Therefore, public transport is certainly not being short changed. You will have heard Christine Chapman's remarks that public transport is already increasing rapidly. Where you have a big opportunity to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn gyffredinol, gallaf, ond ar y pwynt penodol hwnnw, byddai'n well i mi ofyn i Andrew Davies ysgrifennu atoch. Mae buddsoddiadau sylweddol yn digwydd, ac nid ar linell newydd Glyn Ebwy'n unig. Credaf ein bod hefyd yn gwario £18 miliwn ar newid gwasanaeth bob awr yn wasanaeth bob hanner awr ar reilffordd Merthyr i beri ei fod o'r un safon ag sy'n bodoli ar reilffordd cwm Rhymni, fe gredaf. Ble bynnag y mae'r gwasanaeth bob awr yn unig, fel yn achos Merthyr, yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd yn troi'n wasanaeth bob hanner awr. Aberdâr, cwm Cynon a Gwent sy'n gyntaf. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â manylion y problemau interim hyn, felly bydd rhaid i ni daro golwg ar hynny. Yn aml, bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn ddrud, ond maent, wrth gwrs, yn fuddsoddiadau hirdymor, a byddwn yn dal i elwa ohonynt ymhen degawdau.

Yr wyf am sicrhau na chamarweiniais y Cynulliad drwy gyfeirio at 20 o drenau newydd. Maent yn newydd i ni, ond rhai wedi'u hailwampio ydynt, nid cerbydau trên hollol newydd.

**Janet Davies:** Yn strategaeth trafniadaeth Cymru, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i roi £8 biliwn ychwanegol i drafniadaeth yn gyffredinol dros 15 mlynedd—nid wyf am beri i chi fynd i banig mai dros flwyddyn y mae hyn; dros 15 mlynedd y mae. Mae hefyd yn crybwyll defnyddio mwy ar gludiant cyhoeddus. Faint o hyblygrwydd sydd yn yr ymrwymadau ariannol a'r rhagolygon pe bai defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus yn cynyddu'n unol â'r anghenion i leddfu effeithiau'r newid yn yr hinsawdd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr am y newid yn yr hinsawdd, ond yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi codi mater y £8 biliwn dros 15 mlynedd, oherwydd credaf mai'r ffigur sydd gennyf yw yr aiff £4 biliwn o hwnnw tuag at gludiant cyhoeddus. Felly, ni fydd cludiant cyhoeddus yn brin o arian o gwbl. Byddwch wedi clywed sylwadau Christine Chapman fod cludiant cyhoeddus eisoes yn cynyddu'n gyflym. Pan fo gennyh gyfle mawr i annog

encourage modal shift—that is, on lines from the former coal-mining Valleys to the city centre of Cardiff—if you can effect such a persuasion, it has big benefits in terms of climate change, because any reduction in car use by modal switch to public transport fits in very much with any kind of sustainable development duty that we have, as well as reducing carbon dioxide emissions.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am sure that you have heard me whinge on many occasions on behalf of long-suffering north Wales train travellers, as I am probably one of the Assembly Members who travels most by train. I met Arriva Trains Wales bosses this morning, because I am still voicing many grave concerns. I am concerned by the fact that they still tell me that they are providing the best possible service with the rolling stock that they have available. First Minister, you have many questions to answer as to why we in Wales appear to have third-hand—sometimes fourth-hand—rolling stock. It does not bode well for the image that we are trying to project, or for our trying to encourage people from outside Wales, including tourists and people who may never have been to Wales before. What can you do to help hurry along improvements in the quality of the rolling stock, which is so abysmal?

**The First Minister:** That is done by buying 20 new ones—in the sense that they are refurbished new rolling stock. Our rail team is currently working with Arriva Trains Wales on set standards for that rolling stock, and ATW itself is undertaking a programme of refurbishment of its own existing stock. However, you should not dismiss the fact that over the next six months, 12 additional 175s and eight trains of another type, refurbished, transferred and modernised from other rail lines, will arrive in Wales. That is 20 additional trains on their way, and I believe that they will contribute to the improvement in standards that we all want to see.

newid modd—hynny yw, ar reilffyrdd o hen feysydd glo'r Cymoedd i ganol dinas Caerdydd—os gallwch achosi tuedd o'r fath, daw â buddion mawr o ran y newid yn yr hinsawdd, oherwydd byddai unrhyw ostyngiad mewn defnyddio ceir drwy newid modd i gludiant cyhoeddus yn cyd-fynd yn dda iawn ag unrhyw fath o ddyletswydd sydd gennym o ran datblygu cynaliadwy, yn ogystal â lleihau gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn aml wedi fy nghlywed yn cwyno ar ran teithwyr trenau dioddefgar y gogledd, gan fy mod, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn un o'r Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n teithio fwyaf ar y trê. Cyfarfûm â phenaethiaid Trenau Arriva Cymru y bore yma, oherwydd fy mod yn dal i leisio llawer o bryderon difrifol. Yr wyf yn pryderu am y ffaith eu bod yn dal i ddweud wrthyf eu bod yn darparu'r gwasanaeth gorau posibl gyda'r cerbydau trê sydd ar gael iddynt. Brif Weinidog, mae gennych lawer o gwestiynau i'w hateb ynglŷn â pham y mae'n ymddangos bod gennym ni yng Nghymru gerbydau trê trydedd law—ac weithiau pedwaredd law. Nid yw'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y ddelwedd yr ydym yn ceisio'i chyfleu, na'n hymdrechion i annog pobl o'r tu allan i Gymru, sy'n cynnwys twristiaid a phobl nad ydynt o bosibl erioed wedi bod yng Nghymru o'r blaen. Beth y gallwch ei wneud i helpu i gyflymu gwelliannau yn ansawdd y cerbydau trê, sydd mor echrydus?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwneir hynny drwy brynu 20 o rai newydd—yn yr ystyr eu bod yn gerbydau trê sydd wedi'u hailwampio o'r newydd. Mae ein tîm rheilffyrdd wrthi'n gweithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru ar safonau penodol ar gyfer y cerbydau trê hynny, ac mae Trenau Arriva Cymru eu hunain yn dilyn rhaglen o ailwampio ar eu cerbydau presennol. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylech ddiystyru'r ffaith y bydd 12 175 ychwanegol ac wyth trê o fath arall, wedi'u hailwampio, eu trosglwyddo a'u moderneiddio o reilffyrdd eraill, yn cyrraedd Cymru yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf. Mae hynny'n 20 trê ychwanegol sydd ar eu ffordd, a chredaf y byddant yn cyfrannu at y gwelliant yn y safonau yr ydym i gyflymu dymuno'i weld.



**Gwasanaethau Iechyd yng Nghwm Cynon**  
**Health Services in Cynon Valley**

**Q8 Christine Chapman:** What are the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for health services in Cynon Valley? OAQ1817(FM)

**The First Minister:** The immediate priority is the development of the new neighbourhood hospital on the, now agreed, Fernhill site in Mountain Ash. I am pleased to confirm that unanimous approval was given to the planning application of that hospital at an August meeting of Rhondda Cynon Taf's planning committee.

**Christine Chapman:** Obviously, everybody was delighted by the news of the new community hospital.

One of the most important aspects of the health service is the provision of primary care, particularly given that 'Designed for Life' advocates a move towards community-based care and a move away from a presumption of admission to hospital. Will you join me in commending the work of the primary care support unit in Rhondda Cynon Taf, and the fact that we now have 22 new salaried GPs and nine salaried nurses working out of the Aberdare centre? This shows that the retirement of a considerable number of GPs at the same time, which was of real concern given the difficulties of recruiting GPs in a deprived area, can be successfully managed. Do you also agree that the establishment of Rhondda Cynon Taf as a teaching local health board, through its partnership with Caerphilly, will help it to recruit and retain staff of the highest quality and make it even more attractive for medical professionals to work there?

**The First Minister:** Yes, and I hesitate to think of anything that I can add to that question by way of an answer. The teaching LHB status is extremely important. *[Interruption.]* People may laugh, but people were worried seven years ago. They said that a whole generation of Asian doctors who arrived in the Valleys in the 1950s would be retiring at the same time, and there were concerns about recruiting and that there

**C8 Christine Chapman:** Beth yw blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghwm Cynon? OAQ1817(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y flaenoriaeth bennaf yw datblygu'r ysbyty cymdogaeth newydd ar y safle y cytunwyd arno bellach, sef Fernhill yn Aberpennar. Mae'n bleser gennyf gadarnhau bod cymeradwyaeth unfrydol i'r cais cynllunio ar gyfer yr ysbyty hwnnw wedi'i roi mewn cyfarfod o'r pwyllgor cynllunio yn Rhondda Cynon Taf ym mis Awst.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn amlwg, yr oedd pawb wrth eu boddau ar ôl clywed y newyddion am yr ysbyty cymuned newydd.

Un o agweddau pwysicaf y gwasanaeth iechyd yw darparu gofal sylfaenol, yn enwedig o ystyried bod 'Cynllun Oes' yn argymhell mwy o ddefnydd o ofal yn y gymuned a llai o ragdybiaeth y bydd pobl yn mynd i ysbyty. A wnewch ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo gwaith yr uned cymorth gofal sylfaenol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, a'r ffaith bod 22 o feddygon teulu cyflogedig newydd a naw nyrs gyflogedig gennym bellach yn gweithio o'r ganolfan yn Aberdâr? Mae hyn yn dangos bod modd ymdopi ag ymddeoliad nifer sylweddol o feddygon teulu yr un pryd, gan fod hynny wedi peri pryder gwirioneddol o gofio'r anawsterau a geir wrth recriwtio meddygon teulu mewn ardal ddifreintiedig. A ydych hefyd yn cytuno y bydd sefydlu Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf fel bwrdd ar gyfer dysgu, drwy ei bartneriaeth â Chaerffili, yn ei helpu i recriwtio a chadw staff o'r radd flaenaf ac yn peri ei fod yn fwy atyniadol byth i weithwyr meddygol proffesiynol fel lle i weithio?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydwyf, ac yr wyf yn ceisio meddwl am rywbeth y gallaf ei ychwanegu at y cwestiwn hwnnw ar ffurf ateb. Mae statws dysgu'r BILl yn bwysig dros ben. *[Torri ar draws.]* Efallai fod pobl yn chwerthin am ben hynny, ond bu hynny'n destun pryder i bobl saith mlynedd yn ôl. Dywedasant y byddai cenhedlaeth gyfan o feddygon Asiaidd a ddaeth i'r Cymoedd yn yr 1950au yn ymddeol yr un pryd, ac yr oedd

would be vacancies for GPs in the Valleys, especially in the upper Valleys, where there had been vacancies for years. We said that one of the answers may be salaried GPs—it is a different model and not the private contractor model any longer—and we have done it. It is very innovative, it is working well in the Cynon Valley—the figures are spectacular, as you mentioned—and it has proved to be a substantial part of the answer. It means that there is no longer any stigma about working in the Valleys, and people realise that they have an incredibly innovative set of health services that fits in with the presumption in favour of the primary care model rather than the acute care model.

**Leanne Wood:** The Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr Tydfil provides a vital service for people in the Cynon Valley, and the Royal Glamorgan Hospital provides a vital service for people in the Pontypridd and Rhondda areas. Given the importance of those services to local people, can you give a guarantee that none of those services currently provided at those hospitals will be removed? Is the answer yes or no?

**The First Minister:** This is the old question about how many Plaid Cymru Assembly Members it takes to change a light bulb—you need one to change it and four to lead the protest group against it. You cannot freeze the health service in aspic any more than you can freeze anything else. To say that I can give a guarantee that there will never be any change in the services provided at any hospital anywhere in Wales for all time is absurd. We all know that there will be change, for the reasons that Christine Chapman gave. We want to see more services provided in a primary care setting—and I thought that that is what you also believe in—but you cannot provide the same service in two locations. If it means a shift to a primary care setting, the service may well cease to be provided in a district general hospital setting. What you are asking for, in terms of a guarantee of no change forever more, is totally absurd, Leanne—please rethink this.

pryderon ynghylch recriwtio ac y byddai swyddi meddygon teulu'n wag yn y Cymoedd, yn enwedig yn y blaenau, lle'r oedd swyddi gwag ers blynyddoedd. Dywedasom mai un o'r atebion posibl oedd cael meddygon teulu cyflogedig—mae'n fodel gwahanol; nid model y contractwr preifat ydyw bellach—a rhoesom hynny ar waith. Mae'n arloesol iawn, mae'n gweithio'n dda yng Nghwm Cynon—mae'r ffigurau'n rhyfeddol, fel y dywedasoch—a chafwyd bod hynny'n ateb i raddau helaeth. Oherwydd hynny, nid oes stigma ynghylch gweithio yn y Cymoedd bellach, ac mae pobl yn sylweddoli bod ganddynt set o wasanaethau iechedd arloesol iawn sydd yn gyson â'r rhagdybiaeth o blaid y model gofal sylfaenol yn hytrach na'r model gofal aciwt.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr Tudful yn darparu gwasanaeth hollbwysig i bobl yng Nghwm Cynon, ac mae Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg yn darparu gwasanaeth hollbwysig i bobl yn ardaloedd Pont-y-pridd a'r Rhondda. O gofio mor bwysig yw'r gwasanaethau hynny i bobl leol, a ydych yn gallu gwarantu na fydd dim un o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd yn yr ysbytai hynny'n cael ei symud? Ai 'ydwylf' ynteu 'nac ydwylf' yw'r ateb?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dyma'r hen gwestiwn am faint o Aelodau Cynulliad Plaid Cymru sydd eu hangen i newid bylbg golau—mae angen un i'w newid a phedwar i arwain y grŵp protest yn ei erbyn. Ni ellir rhewi'r gwasanaeth iechedd am byth, mwy nag y gellir rhewi unrhyw beth arall. Peth hurt yw dweud y gallaf warantu na fydd dim newid byth yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir mewn dim un ysbyty yn unman yng Nghymru. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod y bydd newid, am y rhesymau a nododd Christine Chapman. Yr ydym am weld darparu mwy o wasanaethau ym maes gofal sylfaenol—a thybiais eich bod chithau'n credu yn hynny—ond ni ellir darparu'r un gwasanaeth mewn dau leoliad. Os yw'n golygu troi at faes gofal sylfaenol, mae'n ddigon posibl y rhoddir y gorau i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth mewn ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth. Mae'r hyn yr ydych yn gofyn amdano, o ran gwarant na fydd dim newid byth bythoedd, yn hollol hurt, Leanne—ailystyriwch hyn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**David Melding:** To your Government's credit, you have emphasised the role of local government in delivering better health outcomes, but do you remain frustrated by the lack of joint working between health bodies and local authorities, such as Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council? Do you agree that we need to see a culture change whereby some council employees receive their supervision from managers in the local health board or even in the local NHS trust, and vice versa? We could then see an improvement in healthy living that could lead to improvements that are akin to the great changes in the environment that occurred in the nineteenth century, to such great benefit for public health.

**The First Minister:** We could give a half-hour lecture on that subject between us, David—it is a fascinating subject in terms of the way in which the great public health improvements of the nineteenth century were brought about—but I will not start now. The point that you make about a seamless web that can possibly be obtained between social services in particular, but not just social services, and the health service is extremely important. As regards the reductions in delayed transfers of care, which is the most obviously measurable impact, the figure has almost halved over the past three or four years, but we have much further to go on reducing that figure. It has come down from 1,000 to 550, but we want to reach a much lower figure than that of 550 delayed transfers of care.

**David Melding:** Er clod i'ch Llywodraeth, yr ydych wedi rhoi pwys ar rôl llywodraeth leol wrth sicrhau canlyniadau iechyd gwell, ond a ydych yn teimlo'n rhwystredig o hyd oherwydd y diffyg cydweithio rhwng cyrff iechyd ac awdurdodau lleol, fel Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf? A ydych yn cytuno bod angen inni weld newid yn y diwylliant fel y bydd rhai o weithwyr y cynghorau'n cael eu goruchwylio gan reolwyr y bwrdd iechyd lleol neu hyd yn oed rheolwyr yr ymddiriedolaeth GIG leol, ac fel arall? Gallem weld gwelliant wedyn o ran byw'n iach a allai arwain at welliannau sydd yn debyg i'r newidiadau mawr yn yr amgylchedd a welwyd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, er budd mawr i iechyd cyhoeddus.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallem roi darlith hanner awr ar y pwnc hwnnw gyda'n gilydd, David—mae'r modd y sicrhawyd y gwelliannau mawr i iechyd cyhoeddus yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg yn bwnc diddorol iawn—ond ni ddechreuaf yn awr. Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch ynghylch y cysylltiad di-dor y gellid ei sicrhau rhwng gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn benodol, ond nid gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn unig, a'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn bwysig dros ben. Gyda golwg ar leihau nifer yr achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, sef yr effaith hawsaf ei mesur, mae'r ffigur wedi haneru bron dros y tair neu bedair blynedd diwethaf, ond mae gennym lawer i'w wneud eto i beri bod y ffigur hwnnw'n parhau i ostwng. Mae wedi gostwng o 1,000 i 550, ond yr ydym am gyrraedd ffigur is o lawer na 550 o achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal.

### **Polisiau Datblygu Economaidd Economic Development Policies**

**Q9 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on progress with the Welsh Assembly Government's economic development policies? OAQ1839(FM)

**C9 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd gyda pholisiau datblygu economaidd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ1839(FM)

**The First Minister:** The fundamentals are that there are currently 126,000 more jobs in Wales than there were when we took over our responsibilities in the second quarter of 1999. It is an increase of 10 per cent, but the figure is higher in west Wales and the Valleys,

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y ffeithiau hanfodol yw bod 126,000 yn fwy o swyddi yng Nghymru'n awr nag a oedd pan ymgymerasom â'n cyfrifoldebau yn ail chwarter 1999. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 10 y cant, ond mae'r ffigur yn uwch yng

where it is 12 per cent. The figure is 8 per cent in east Wales, which includes the area that you represent, John, but it is certainly well above the 7 per cent in the UK as a whole.

2.50 p.m.

**John Griffiths:** In recent days, the eyes of the world have been on Ireland because of the Ryder Cup golf tournament. In 2010, that tournament will come to Newport and Wales, and the eyes of the world will be upon us, with all the huge possibilities and opportunities that that will bring. In Newport at present, as I know that you are aware, there is huge development in terms of a new shopping centre, transport infrastructure, housing and industry. All of that is getting under way. It is important that as much of this as possible is in place for 2010 and the Ryder Cup so that we can show our best possible face to the world. Do you agree that it is vital that the Welsh Assembly Government continues to work with Newport City Council, Newport Unlimited and other key partners to help bring this development about in time for that date? Would you also tell the Assembly what lessons you have been able to draw from your recent visit to Ireland for this year's Ryder Cup competition?

**The First Minister:** I think that the key lesson that we have all drawn is that Ian Woosnam was a fantastic captain. He is a stunningly great hero of Welsh sport and he thoroughly outwitted his American opponent with all his team picks. He was absolutely magnificent and we have to find a way of honouring him.

As regards the wider issue of whether the Ryder Cup stimulates more urban regeneration at a faster rate than before, the key elements of infrastructure have to be provided by the time that the Ryder Cup arrives—although nobody was moaning about the fact that Dublin is one great big building site really, with probably 50 to 100 tower cranes spread out all over the city—and the Ryder Cup stimulus is part of that. The same may happen to urban regeneration and the speed with which building projects

ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, sef 12 y cant. Wyth y cant yw'r ffigur yn y dwyrain, sydd yn cynnwys yr ardal yr ydych chi'n ei chynrychioli, John, ond mae'n sicr yn uwch o lawer na'r 7 y cant yn y DU gyfan.

**John Griffiths:** Yn y dyddiau diwethaf, bu llygaid y byd ar Iwerddon am fod cystadleuaeth golff Cwpan Ryder yn cael ei chynnal yno. Yn 2010, daw'r gystadleuaeth honno i Gasnewydd ac i Gymru, a bydd llygaid y byd arnom ni, a cheir posibilïadau a chyfleoedd aruthrol yn sgîl hynny. Yng Nghasnewydd ar hyn o bryd, fel y gwyddoch, ceir datblygu aruthrol ar ffurf canolfan siopa newydd, seilwaith trafndiaeth, tai a diwydiant. Mae hynny oll yn mynd rhagddo. Mae'n bwysig cwblhau cymaint ag y bo modd o hynny erbyn 2010 a chystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder fel y gallwn fod ar ein gorau yng ngolwg y byd. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru barhau i weithio gyda Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd, Newport Unlimited a phartnerïaid allweddol eraill i helpu i gwblhau'r datblygiadau mewn pryd ar gyfer y dyddiad hwnnw? A wnech ddweud wrth y Cynulliad hefyd pa wersi yr ydych wedi gallu eu dysgu oddi wrth eich ymweliad diweddar ag Iwerddon ar gyfer cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder eleni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn credu mai'r brif wers yr ydym oll wedi'i dysgu yw bod Ian Woosnam yn gaptan gwych. Mae'n arwr mawr ym myd chwaraeon Cymru a bu'n gyfrwysach o lawer na'i wrthwynebydd Americanaidd wrth ddewis holl aelodau ei dîm. Bu'n wych dros ben a rhaid inni ddarganfod modd i'w anrhydeddu.

Gyda golwg ar y mater mwy cyffredinol, sef a yw cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder yn ysgogi mwy o adfywio trefol yn gynt nag o'r blaen, rhaid darparu prif elfennau'r seilwaith erbyn dyfodiad cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder—er nad oedd neb yn cwyno am y ffaith bod Dulyn i gyd yn un safle adeiladu drwyddo draw, mewn gwirionedd, a bod rhwng 50 a 100 o graeniau tyrog, mae'n debyg, yma ac acw drwy'r ddinas—ac mae'r ysgogiad oherwydd cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder yn rhan o hynny. Gallai'r un peth ddigwydd o

are undertaken outside of the key elements of infrastructure that we require for the Ryder Cup itself.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn eich ateb gwreiddiol i John Griffiths, bu ichi gyfeirio at y nifer o swyddi sydd wedi'u creu yn ne-orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd. O ystyried bod y swyddi hyn wedi'u creu gydag arian strwythurol o Ewrop, a ydych yn hapus gyda'r nifer o swyddi sydd wedi'u creu? A ydych yn hapus gyda'r cyflogau sy'n cael eu cynnig am y swyddi hynny? Onid yw'n wir bod y cyflogau hynny yn llawer llai na'r cyflogau sy'n bodoli yng nghoridorau'r M4 a'r A55?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf mai chwedl yw honno, ac mae eisiau ei chwalu unwaith eto. Fel y dywedais, bu cynnydd o 7 y cant mewn saith mlynedd yn y Deyrnas Unedig, sy'n dda iawn o'i gymharu â gwledydd mawr eraill Ewrop. Bu cynnydd o 8 y cant yn nwyrain Cymru, 10 y cant yng Nghymru gyfan a 12 y cant yn yr ardal Amcan 1. Felly, efallai y gallwch feddwl bod hynny oherwydd rhyw effaith o du Amcan 1 a'r buddsoddiad sydd wedi mynd i mewn i hynny, er y gallwch weld, os edrychwch arnynt, fod y tystysgrifau sy'n dod i mewn gan y bobl sy'n noddi prosiectau yn honni mai tua 40,000 o swyddi ychwanegol sydd. Efallai y byddai hynny'n egluro pam y bu'r cynnydd gymaint yn uwch yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn ystod y chwech neu saith mlynedd diwethaf.

**Alun Cairns:** We support the comments that you made about Ian Woosnam and the contribution that he made to the fantastic result over the weekend. Coming back to the key question that John Griffiths raised about the infrastructure issues, some of that is going ahead but, in reality, we know that the key infrastructure projects are not working out. We know about the differences between you and Sir Terry Matthews over the link of the A449. We also know about the delay over the M4 motorway since the original proposal was made when Peter Hain was the Welsh Office Minister. We also know that the signals that are going to be broadcast throughout the world will be of gridlock traffic around the Brynglas tunnels because of the delays

ran adfywio trefol a pha mor gyflym yr ymgwymerir â phrosiectau adeiladu heblaw prif elfennau'r seilwaith y mae arnom eu hangen ar gyfer cystadleuaeth Cwpan Ryder ei hun.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** In your original answer to John Griffiths, you referred to the number of jobs that have been created in south-west Wales and the Valleys. Given that these jobs have been created with structural funds money from Europe, are you happy with the number of jobs that have been created? Are you happy with the wages offered for those jobs? Is it not true that those wages are much less than those available along the M4 and A55 corridors?

**The First Minister:** I think that that is a myth, and it needs to be got rid of once again. As I said, there has been an increase of 7 per cent in seven years in the United Kingdom, which is very good compared with other large European countries. There was an increase of 8 per cent in east Wales, of 10 per cent in Wales as a whole, and of 12 per cent in the Objective 1 area. Therefore, you might think that that is because of some effect of Objective 1 and the investment that has gone into that, although you can see, if you look at them, that the certificates that are coming in from the people who sponsor projects suggest that there are around 40,000 additional jobs. Perhaps that would explain why the increase has been so much higher in west Wales and the Valleys during the last six or seven years.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr ydym yn ategu'r sylwadau a wnaethoch am Ian Woosnam a'i gyfraniad at y canlyniad gwych dros y penwythnos. Gan droi'n ôl at y cwestiwn allweddol a gododd John Griffiths am faterion sydd yn ymwneud â seilwaith, mae rhywfaint o hynny'n mynd ymlaen ond, mewn gwirionedd, gwyddom nad yw'r prif brosiectau seilwaith yn llwyddo. Gwyddom am y gwahaniaeth barn rhyngoch chi a Syr Terry Matthews am y ffordd gyswllt â'r A449. Gwyddom hefyd am yr oedi ynghylch traffordd yr M4 ers y cynnig gwreiddiol a wnaed pan oedd Peter Hain yn Weinidog yn y Swyddfa Gymreig. Gwyddom hefyd mai'r lluniau a ddarlledir ledled y byd fydd y rhai o dagfeydd traffig o gwmpas twneli Brynglas

caused by your Government's cutting the budgets. That is the sort of image that will be sent around the world. It would not be the case if you had got your act together and constructed those projects much earlier, and neither would you have had those tensions with Sir Terry Matthews.

**The First Minister:** I was with Sir Terry Matthews over the weekend and he never mentioned any of this to me, so I do not know where you got your claimed knowledge from. Perhaps we should say that they are allegations based on your psychology that a glass is not merely half empty; we do not have a glass at all. You want to rethink your approach. 'Roll on 2010', is what all of us would say. There has been a huge impact on Irish self-confidence. Perhaps, even by 2010, we might detect a tiny bit of self-confidence about the future of Wales in yourself, Alun, although it is a long way away at the moment.

oherwydd yr oedi a achoswyd drwy dorri cyllidebau gan eich Llywodraeth. Dyna'r math o ddelwedd a yrrir o gwmpas y byd. Nid felly y byddai pe byddech wedi cael trefn ar eich pethau ac wedi adeiladu'r prosiectau hynny'n gynharach o lawer, ac ni fuasai tensiynau o'r fath rhyngoch chi a Syr Terry Matthews ychwaith.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bûm gyda Syr Terry Matthews dros y penwythnos ac ni soniodd ddim am hynny wrthyf, felly nid wyf yn gwybod o ble y cawsoch eich gwybodaeth honedig. Efallai y dylem ddweud eu bod yn gyhuddiadau sydd yn seiliedig ar eich meddylfryd, sef nad gwydr sydd yn hanner gwag yn unig sydd gennym; nid oes gennym wydr o gwbl. Dylech ailystyried eich ymagwedd. 'Brysied 2010', yw'r hyn a ddywedem bob un. Rhoddwyd hwb mawr i hunanhyder y Gwyddelod. Efallai, erbyn 2010 hyd yn oed, y gwelwn fymryn bach o hyder yn nyfodol Cymru ynoch chi, Alun, er bod hynny'n bell iawn ar hyn o bryd.

### **Cynyddu'r Isafswm Cyflog Increasing the Minimum Wage**

**Q10 Ann Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the benefits for low-income households in Wales of the increase in the minimum wage to £5.35 per hour in October 2006? OAQ1818(FM)

**The First Minister:** Given the structure of the Welsh economy, the introduction of the national minimum wage and the subsequent increases in levels, including next month's increase, provide a significant benefit to low-income households in Wales. Alongside reforms to the tax and benefits system, with which it is interwoven, the minimum wage has encouraged people back into the labour market and has raised income levels.

**Ann Jones:** As you say, many people have returned to the job market since the introduction of the minimum wage, which dispels the urban myth that was created that the minimum wage would destroy jobs. In fact, the minimum wage has helped to create jobs and to strengthen our economy. Will you, therefore, join me in congratulating our Labour colleagues in Westminster for this?

**C10 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y manteision a ddaw i gartrefi ar incwm isel yng Nghymru yn sgîl cynyddu'r isafswm cyflog i £5.35 yr awr ym mis Hydref 2006? OAQ1818(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Oherwydd strwythur economi Cymru, mae aelwydydd sydd ar incwm isel yng Nghymru'n elwa'n fawr o gyflwyno'r isafswm cyflog a'r lefelau uwch a gyflwynwyd wedyn, gan gynnwys y cynnydd a geir y mis nesaf. Ochr yn ochr â diwygiadau i'r system dreth a budd-daliadau, sydd yn cydblethu ag ef, mae'r isafswm cyflog wedi cymell pobl i ddychwelyd i'r farchnad lafur ac mae wedi codi lefelau incwm.

**Ann Jones:** Fel y dywedwch, mae llawer o bobl wedi dychwelyd i'r farchnad swyddi ers cyflwyno'r isafswm cyflog, ac mae hynny'n gwrthbrofi'r goel a ledaenwyd y byddai'r isafswm cyflog yn dinistrio swyddi. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r isafswm cyflog wedi helpu i greu swyddi a chryfhau ein heconomi. Gan hynny, a wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch ein cyd-aelodau Llafur yn San

Will you also assure me that we will continue to work with them to provide a level of minimum wage that will reflect the cost of living and that we will shortly be able to discuss increasing the amount of minimum wage for those in low-income households?

**The First Minister:** It will be increasing next month from £5.05 to £5.35 an hour; it was £3.60 when it was first introduced seven and a half years ago. However, the essential point is that the minimum wage interacts well with the tax credit system. Those two factors combined are part of, if you like, the Brown revolution—that is not a comment on the current leadership issue—and of the philosophy of trying to recreate a full-employment society and a healthier attitude towards work, even among those who have, at least temporarily, dropped out of the labour market.

**David Melding:** Do you agree that a range of agencies, when dealing with people from households with low incomes, need to consider how they can maximise that income because there is an incredible lack of take-up? This has been a persistent problem over many decades—certain people simply do not know to which benefits they are entitled or they are reluctant to take them because, for some cultural reason, they feel that benefits are a handout rather than a help up the ladder.

**The First Minister:** That is most notorious in terms of council tax benefit; I think that the figures are as high as 50 per cent of people not taking up what they are entitled to. That is usually regarded as a central estimate. That is very sad when you consider that if people are entitled to it, they should be claiming it, but we cannot force them to make a claim. Many benefits are given automatically, but that is not one of them. This issue of stigma in society regarding benefit take-up is serious. We have organised a scheme in health settings for several years whereby health-related benefits are advertised to people sitting in GP surgeries. That has resulted in an improvement in the take-up of health-related benefits.

Steffan ar hynny? A wnewch hefyd fy sicrhau y parhawn i weithio gyda hwy i ddarparu lefel isafswm cyflog a fydd yn adlewyrchu costau byw ac y byddwn cyn hir yn gallu trafod cynyddu'r isafswm cyflog i'r rhai sydd ar aelwydydd sydd ag incwm isel?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bydd yn codi y mis nesaf o £5.05 i £5.35 yr awr; £3.60 ydoedd pan gyflwynwyd ef gyntaf saith mlynedd a hanner yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt hollbwysig yw bod yr isafswm cyflog yn rhyngweithio'n dda â'r system credydau treth. Mae'r ddau ffactor hynny gyda'i gilydd yn rhan o chwyldro Brown, os caf ei roi felly—nid sylw am bwnc cyfredol yr arweinyddiaeth yw hynny—ac athroniaeth yr ymgais i ail-greu cymdeithas o gyflogaeth lawn ac agwedd iachach at waith, hyd yn oed ymysg y rhai sydd wedi gadael y farchnad lafur, dros dro o leiaf.

**David Melding:** A ydych yn cytuno bod angen i amryw o asiantaethau, wrth ddelio â phobl o aelwydydd sydd ag incwm isel, ystyried sut y gallant gynyddu'r incwm hwnnw gan fod diffyg mawr o ran y nifer sydd yn cymryd budd-daliadau? Mae hon wedi bod yn broblem barhaus ers degawdau lawer—mae rhai pobl nad ydynt yn gwybod pa fudd-daliadau y mae ganddynt hawl i'w cael neu maent yn amharod i'w derbyn oherwydd, am ryw reswm diwyllianol, maent yn teimlo mai cardod yw budd-daliadau yn hytrach na help llaw i ddringo'r ysgol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny ar ei waethaf yng nghyd-destun budd-dal y dreth gyngor; yr wyf yn meddwl bod cymaint â 50 y cant nad ydynt yn cymryd yr hyn y mae ganddynt hawl i'w gael. Ystyrir hynny'n amcangyfrif canolig fel arfer. Mae hynny'n drist iawn o ystyried y dylai pobl ei hawlio os oes ganddynt hawl i'w dderbyn, ond ni allwn eu gorfodi i'w hawlio. Rhoddir llawer o fudd-daliadau'n awtomatig, ond nid yw hwnnw'n un ohonynt. Mae mater y stigma mewn cymdeithas mewn cysylltiad â chymryd budd-daliadau'n un difrifol. Yr ydym wedi trefnu cynllun mewn lleoliadau iechyd ers rhai blynyddoedd fel bod budd-daliadau sydd yn ymwneud ag iechyd yn cael eu hysbysebu ymysg pobl ym meddygfeydd meddygon teulu. Mae hynny wedi peri gwelliant o ran y

nifer sydd yn derbyn budd-daliadau sydd yn ymwneud ag iechyd.

**Gwasanaethau Iechyd yn Abertawe  
Health Services in Swansea**

**Q11 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of health services in Swansea? OAQ1837(FM)

**The First Minister:** It is encouraging that, in light of the consultation on reconfiguration proposals for Swansea, the local health board has agreed to the creation of a single site for secondary hospital services in the area. If these proposals are confirmed by the community health council, it would bring substantial new investment, worth millions of pounds, into the hospital service in Swansea, which would support its continuing role as a regional tertiary centre for the whole of mid and west Wales.

**Peter Black:** The situation in Swansea, as many people see it at the moment, is that the trust has currently closed 57 beds and proposes to close wards at Hill House Hospital and Fairwood Hospital. The transfer of adult neurosurgery to Cardiff puts many local people at risk. The proposals on the single-site hospital do not involve a new hospital, but rather involve closing Singleton Hospital and transferring services to Morriston Hospital. Do you think that, in the light of all that, the health service in Swansea is safe in Labour's hands?

**The First Minister:** This is a glass-being-three-quarters-empty situation. You do not seem to want to have £250 million or £350 million, or however much it will cost, invested in a substantial new hospital in Wales, the likes of which we will not have anywhere else in Wales.

3.00 p.m.

It will undoubtedly be the No. 1 hospital in Wales when it is completed, though that is subject to the community health council's agreement. It is a massive project. I am aware of the temporary difficulties that you referred

**C11 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau iechyd yn Abertawe? OAQ1837(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n galonogol, yng ngoleuni'r ymgynghori ynghylch cynigion ar ailgyflunio ar gyfer Abertawe, fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi cytuno i greu un safle ar gyfer gwasanaethau ysbyty eilaidd yn yr ardal. Os bydd y cyngor iechyd cymuned yn cadarnhau'r cynigion hynny, daw â buddsoddiad newydd sylweddol, gwerth miliynau o bunnoedd, i'r gwasanaeth ysbytai yn Abertawe, a fyddai'n ategu ei rôl barhaus fel canolfan drydyddol ranbarthol i'r cyfan o ganolbarth a gorllewin Cymru.

**Peter Black:** Y sefyllfa yn Abertawe, fel y mae llawer yn ei gweld ar hyn o bryd, yw bod yr ymddiriedolaeth bellach wedi cau 57 o welyau a'i bod yn bwriadu cau wardiau yn Ysbyty Hill House ac Ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg. Mae trosglwyddo niwrolawdriniaeth i oedolion i Gaerdydd yn peri bod llawer o bobl leol mewn perygl. Nid yw'r cynigion ar yr ysbyty ar un safle yn cynnwys codi ysbyty newydd ond, yn hytrach, cau Ysbyty Singleton a throsglwyddo gwasanaethau i Ysbyty Treforys. A ydych yn credu, yn sgîl hynny, fod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn Abertawe yn ddiogel yn nwylo Llafur?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hon yn sefyllfa lle y dywedir bod y gwydr yn dri chwarter gwag. Mae'n ymddangos nad ydych am weld buddsoddi £250 miliwn neu £350 miliwn, neu beth bynnag fydd ei gost, mewn ysbyty newydd sylweddol yng Nghymru, ysbyty na fydd gennym ddim byd tebyg iddo yn unman arall yng Nghymru.

Hwn yn sicr fydd yr ysbyty gorau yng Nghymru pan fydd wedi ei gwblhau, er bod hynny'n amodol ar gytundeb y cyngor iechyd cymuned. Mae'n brosiect enfawr. Gwn am yr anawsterau dros dro y cyfeiriasoch atynt



to with a hospital such as Hill House, which I admire very much. I also admire Singleton, because members of my family have spent many weeks—sometimes months—in those different hospitals, so I like them, and have an emotional attachment to them. However, we are not talking about emotional attachments; this is about getting the services that are right for the people of Swansea and right for its tertiary role for the whole of Mid and West Wales, looking forward to 2020 and well beyond. That would fit into the somewhat grudging and curmudgeonly commentary from you, which perhaps you should rethink.

**Val Lloyd:** I do not quite share the total doom and gloom of the previous speaker, First Minister, though not everything is rosy and there are many areas for concern. Part of the savings—some £300,000—will be reinvested, and I am pleased to say that there will be 11 new critical care beds, which are much needed. That will have a knock-on effect on waiting lists and improvements to renal care. Do you agree that, while it is important to ensure that healthcare provision is up to date and effective, it is also crucial that patient care is not compromised?

**The First Minister:** I agree with all of that and I accept entirely what you say. The change is always difficult, and rehabilitation in hospitals such as Hill House is highly regarded by all users and their families—as it was by my brother and me when my late mother spent a long period there. It is sometimes difficult to see the possible advantages of change, but we know that nothing can ever stay the same. We have to rely on the professionalism of the local health board in commissioning and the community health council in acting as a sounding board for views that might be different from those of the health professionals.

**David Lloyd:** Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cefnogi bwriad Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru i gau uned niwrolawdriniaeth Ysbyty Treforys?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf ei fod wedi

gydag ysbyty fel Hill House, yr wyf yn ei edmygu'n fawr iawn. Yr wyf hefyd yn edmygu Singleton, gan fod aelodau o'm teulu wedi treulio nifer o wythnosau—misoedd weithiau—yn y gwahanol ysbytai hyn, felly yr wyf yn eu hoffi, ac mae gennyf ymlyniad emosiynol wrthynt. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn sôn am ymlyniad emosiynol; mae a wnelo hyn â chael y gwasanaethau sy'n briodol i bobl Abertawe ac yn briodol i'w rôl drydyddol ar gyfer pob rhan o Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, gan edrych ymlaen at 2020 ac ymhell ar ôl hynny. Byddai hynny'n ateb y sylwadau braidd yn grintachlyd ac annifyr a glywyd gennyf, sylwadau y dylech o bosibl eu hailystyried.

**Val Lloyd:** Nid wyf yn anobeithio'n llwyr yr un fath â'r siaradwr blaenorol, Brif Weinidog, ond nid yw popeth yn berffaith ychwaith ac mae llawer o feysydd sy'n achosi pryder. Bydd rhywfaint o'r arbedion—tua £300,000—yn cael ei ailfuddsoddi, ac mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud y darperir 11 gwely gofal critigol newydd, y mae angen mawr amdanynt. Bydd hyn yn cael effaith yn ei dro ar restrau aros a gwelliannau i ofal arenol. A ydych yn cytuno, er ei bod yn bwysig sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth gofal iechyd yn gyfoes ac yn effeithiol, ei bod yn bwysig hefyd nad yw gofal cleifion yn cael ei roi yn y fantol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â chi ac yn derbyn y cyfan yr ydych yn ei ddweud. Mae'r newid bob amser yn anodd, ac mae gan bob defnyddiwr a theuluoedd defnyddwyr barch mawr iawn tuag at ofal adsefydlu mewn ysbytai fel Hill House—fel y gall fy mrawd a minnau dystio ar ôl i'm diweddar fam dreulio cyfnod maith yno. Weithiau mae'n anodd gweld manteision posibl newid, ond gwyddom na all dim byd aros yr un fath am byth. Rhaid inni ddibynnu ar broffesiynoldeb y bwrdd iechyd lleol wrth gomisiynu a'r cyngor iechyd cymuned wrth brofi safbwyntiau a allai fod yn wahanol i rai gweithwyr proffesiynol ym maes iechyd.

**David Lloyd:** First Minister, do you support Health Commission Wales's plan to close the neurosurgical unit at Morriston Hospital?

**The First Minister:** I do not think that it has

mynd mor bell â hynny. Os oes cytundeb, bydd yn digwydd; os oes anghytundeb, daw'r apêl gerbron y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Felly, mae'n bwysig iawn nad wyf yn rhoi unrhyw gysgod o ragfarn ar ei benderfyniad ef yn y pen draw, os bydd rhaid iddo wneud penderfyniad lled-farnwrol yn ei swyddogaeth fel y Gweinidog.

**Alun Cairns:** First Minister, the key issue in Swansea at the moment is the transfer of the neurosurgery unit from Morriston Hospital to Cardiff. Many members of the public and Members of the Assembly will recall that some of the constituency Members in and around Swansea also championed the opposition to the transfer of the paediatric neurosurgery unit some four years ago. The decision was delayed until after the election, but the unit was then closed. What guarantees can you give us that, whatever the judgment, it will be open and honest, so that people will be able to vote on the performance of their elected Assembly Members at the next Assembly elections, clear as to where they stand? We notice that, at the moment, many of those Members are championing their opposition to the closure or transfer of the unit in the press. When the vote is held in the Chamber, I hope that they will vote in the same way.

**The First Minister:** Trying to make a party-political issue of safety and patient care is something that I would deprecate. I do not think that a Government anywhere in the world could run a health service if all that it cared about was whether it could grab a few grubby votes from an issue like that. All that you have to concentrate on is what is in the best interests of the patients who need this service. It is a key life-and-death service in Wales, and that is the only issue. That is an issue that Brian Gibbons will have to determine. It is not an easy issue, and making cheap political points out of it brings politicians into contempt.

gone that far. If there is agreement, it will go ahead; if there is disagreement, the matter will come on appeal before the Minister for Health and Social Services. Therefore, it is crucial that I do not cast any shadow of prejudice over his final decision, should he be required to make a quasi-judicial ruling in his capacity as Minister.

**Alun Cairns:** Brif Weinidog, y prif bwnc trafod yn Abertawe ar hyn o bryd yw trosglwyddo'r uned niwrolawdriniaeth o Ysbyty Treforys i Gaerdydd. Bydd sawl aelod o'r cyhoedd ac Aelodau o'r Cynulliad yn cofio bod rhai o'r Aelodau etholaethol yn Abertawe a'r cylch hefyd wedi lleisio eu gwrthwynebiad i drosglwyddo'r uned niwrolawdriniaeth bediatrig tua phedair blynedd yn ôl. Gohiriwyd y penderfyniad tan ar ôl yr etholiad, ond caewyd yr uned wedyn. A allwch ein sicrhau, beth bynnag fydd y penderfyniad, y bydd yn benderfyniad agored a gonest, fel bod pobl yn gallu pleidleisio ar berfformiad eu Haelodau Cynulliad etholedig yn etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad, gan wybod yn iawn beth yw eu barn? Sylwn fod nifer o'r Aelodau hyn, ar hyn o bryd, yn lleisio'u gwrthwynebiad i gau neu drosglwyddo'r uned yn y wasg. Mawr obeithiaf y byddant yn pleidleisio yr un ffordd pan gynhelir y bleidlais yn y Siambr.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ceisio gwneud diogelwch a gofal am gleifion yn destun dadl rhwng pleidiau gwleidyddol yn rhywbeth na fyddwn yn ei gymeradwyo. Nid wyf yn credu y gallai Llywodraeth mewn dim un rhan o'r byd redeg gwasanaeth iechyd pe na bai'n poeni am ddim byd mwy na cheisio ennill ambell bleidlais frwnt drwy fater fel hynny. Y cyfan y mae angen ichi ganolbwyntio arno yw beth sydd er lles y cleifion sydd angen y gwasanaeth hwn. Mae'n wasanaeth pwysig sy'n ymwneud â bywyd a marwolaeth yng Nghymru, a dyna'r unig fater y mae angen ei ddatrys. Mae'n fater y bydd angen i Brian Gibbons benderfynu yn ei gylch. Nid yw'n fater hawdd ei ddatrys, ac mae ei ddefnyddio i ddibenion gwleidyddol pitw yn dwyn gwarth ar wleidyddion.

## Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

*The Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration:*

*the Agricultural Holdings (Units of Production) (Wales) Order 2006; the Clean Neighbourhoods and Environment Act 2005 (Commencement No. 2, Transitional Provisions and Savings) (Wales) Order 2006; the Community Care, Services for Carers and Children's Services (Direct Payments) (Wales) Amendment Regulations 2006; the Pollution Prevention and Control (England and Wales) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Sea Fishing (Enforcement of Community Satellite Monitoring Measures) (Wales) Order 2006; the Housing Renewal Grants (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Housing Renewal Grants (Prescribed Form and Particulars) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and the Fishing Boats (Satellite-tracking Devices) (Wales) Scheme 2006.*

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have no changes to report to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes, ac felly galwaf am sylwadau.

**David Lloyd:** I welcome the business statement, but I have a couple of issues to raise with the Business Minister, on which she will, hopefully, contemplate some movement. Following Ieuan Wyn Jones's earlier question on the potential threat to Ministry of Defence jobs at RAF Valley, the Plaid Cymru group would value regular updates from the Minister for employment, and any other Ministers concerned, on any developments in that regard.

*Mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth i bwyllgor pwnc am ystyriaeth estynedig:*

*Gorchymyn Daliadau Amaethyddol (Unedau Cynhyrchu) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Deddf Cymdogaethau Glân a'r Amgylchedd 2005 (Cychwyn Rhif 2, Darpariaethau Trosiannol ac Arbedion) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Diwygio Gofal Cymunedol, Gwasanaethau ar gyfer Gofalwyr a Gwasanaethau Plant (Taliadau Uniongyrchol) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Atal a Rheoli Llygredd (Cymru a Lloegr) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; Gorchymyn Pysgota Môr (Gorfodi Mesurau Cymunedol ar gyfer Monitro â Lloeren) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Grantiau Adnewyddu Tai (Ffurflenni a Manylion a Ragnodir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; a Chynllun Cychod Pysgota (Dyfeisiau Olrhain Lloerennol) (Cymru) 2006.*

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Nid oes gennyf ddim newidiadau i fusnes yr wythnos hon i adrodd amdanynt. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, a ddylai fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none, and so I call for comments.

**David Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r datganiad busnes, ond mae gennyf un neu ddau o faterion i'w dwyn i sylw'r Trefnydd, gan obeithio y bydd yn ystyried gwneud rhywbeth yn eu cylch. Yn sgîl cwestiwn cynharach Ieuan Wyn Jones ynghylch y bygythiad posibl i swyddi'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yng nghanolfan RAF y Fali, byddai grŵp Plaid Cymru'n gwerthfawrogi adroddiadau rheolaidd gan y Gweinidog dros gyflogaeth, ac unrhyw Weinidogion eraill sy'n gysylltiedig, yn cyflwyno'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am unrhyw ddatblygiadau yn y

cyswllt hwn.

Secondly, I request a debate on the excellent report published by the Electoral Commission last week, 'Wales—Poll Position'. It highlights a number of issues, such as the fact that the people of Wales are obviously warming to the National Assembly for Wales, although they might not yet be totally confident in their knowledge of what Assembly Members actually do—some Assembly Members might also share that view. However, there is a serious point in this report as regards voter engagement. Around 80 per cent of registered 18 to 34-year-olds did not vote in the 2003 elections. After next May, the Assembly will have new powers to promote its powers and responsibility, Assembly elections, and the Assembly system to the public, which, hitherto, was left to the Electoral Commission. In view of that, we request a debate on the Electoral Commission's report, 'Wales—Poll Position'.

My final request is on the tissue directive, as regards the American bone situation with cadaveric bone products from America. I realise that Dr Brian Gibbons has issued a written statement on the recall of certain US tissue products, but this involved three hospitals in Wales and it is an important issue. I shall not go into the details now but, in view of that, we would value the opportunity to question the Minister in detail, and we also request an oral statement at some point.

**Jonathan Morgan:** As you know, we made two requests this morning, the first of which was that we have a statement or debate on how top-up fees and fees generally have altered the number and mix of students in Wales—those who are Welsh based and those who are not. Regardless of the fact that the Minister has reported on this to the committee, I still think that it would be useful for us to examine this issue in the Chamber so that non-committee members can have the chance to ask a few questions.

Yn ail, gofynnaf am ddadl ar yr adroddiad rhagorol a gyhoeddwyd gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol yr wythnos diwethaf, 'Cymru—Ar Flaen y Gad'. Mae'n tynnu sylw at nifer o faterion, megis y ffaith bod pobl Cymru yn amlwg yn closio at Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, er nad ydynt yn teimlo'n gwbl hyderus eto o bosibl eu bod yn gwybod beth yn union y mae Aelodau Cynulliad yn ei wneud—mae'n bosibl bod rhai Aelodau o'r Cynulliad o'r un farn. Fodd bynnag, mae pwynt difrifol yn yr adroddiad hwn gyda golwg ar gysylltu â phleidleiswyr. Yr oedd 80 y cant o'r etholwyr cofrestredig 18 i 34 oed heb fwrw eu pleidlais yn etholiadau 2003. O fis Mai nesaf ymlaen, bydd gan y Cynulliad bwerau newydd i hyrwyddo ei bwerau a'i gyfrifoldeb, etholiadau'r Cynulliad, a system y Cynulliad i'r cyhoedd, gwaith a oedd yn cael ei adael, cyn hyn, i'r Comisiwn Etholiadol. O ganlyniad, gofynnwn am ddadl ar adroddiad y Comisiwn Etholiadol, 'Cymru—Ar Flaen y Gad'.

Mae fy nghais olaf yn ymwneud â'r gyfarwydddeb meinweoedd, yng nghyswllt y sefyllfa gydag esgyrn o America a chynnyrch esgyrn cyrff meirw o America. Sylweddolaf fod Dr Brian Gibbons wedi cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar alw cynnyrch meinweoedd penodol o'r Unol Daleithiau yn ôl, ond yr oedd hyn yn ymwneud â thri ysbyty yng Nghymru ac mae'n fater pwysig. Nid wyf am fynd ar ôl y manylion yn awr ond, oherwydd hynny, byddem yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyfle i ofyn cwestiynau manwl i'r Gweinidog, a gofynnwn hefyd am ddatganiad llafar ar ryw adeg.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Fel y gwyddoch, gwnaethom ddau gais y bore yma. Yr oedd y cais cyntaf yn gofyn am ddatganiad neu ddadl ynglŷn â sut y mae ffioedd atodol a ffioedd yn gyffredinol wedi effeithio ar nifer y myfyrwyr yng Nghymru ac ar y cyfuniad ohonynt—y rhai sy'n dod o Gymru a'r rhai sy'n dod o'r tu allan i Gymru. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi cyflwyno adroddiad ar hyn i'r pwyllgor, yr wyf yn dal i gredu y byddai'n werth inni edrych ar y mater hwn yn y Siambr fel bod y rhai nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor yn cael cyfle i ofyn ychydig o gwestiynau.

We also raised the need for a statement or debate on the ambulance service. I accept that we are in the middle of a review and that we will return to the outcome of that review, but some significant statements have been made. The new chief executive has talked about some of the challenges. He has also referred to the need for an additional £140 million over the next 10 years. Regardless of that ongoing review, the Assembly should not be hampered or restricted in any way in asking questions of the Minister, whether through a statement or a debate, on such a crucial matter for the people of Wales.

Finally, I mentioned to you this morning the possibility of extending the time given to the 'Designed to Deliver' debate on 18 October. It will be an important debate. It is not just about service reconfiguration, but about staffing levels, and the way in which we design primary and secondary care. I think that Members across the Chamber should be given an opportunity to debate these matters, and not just those who sit on the Health and Social Services Committee. If we were to extend that debate, it would give that vital opportunity to Members from all parts of Wales, who do not participate in the health committee.

**Kirsty Williams:** Following a request this morning, I note that the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks is prepared to provide a written statement on St Athan and on how that project will be taken forwards. Perhaps you could tell us when we can expect that written statement from the Minister.

Building on what Jonathan has said, I note the comments on how the Minister for education has been keeping the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee informed regarding higher education. I also understand the need to wait for clearing data to be published next week.

3.10 p.m.

However, rather than looking just at the balance between the types of students

Cyfeiriasom hefyd at yr angen am ddatganiad neu ddadl ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Derbyniaf ein bod ar ganol adolygiad ac y byddwn yn dychwelyd at ganlyniad yr adolygiad hwn, ond mae rhai datganiadau pwysig iawn wedi eu gwneud. Mae'r prif weithredwr newydd wedi siarad am rai o'r heriau. Mae wedi cyfeirio hefyd at yr angen am £140 miliwn yn ychwanegol dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Er bod yr adolygiad hwn ar ei ganol, ni ddylai'r Cynulliad gael ei rwystro na'i atal mewn modd yn y byd rhag gofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog, drwy ddatganiad neu ddadl, ar fater sydd mor bwysig i bobl Cymru.

Yn olaf, soniais wrthyh y bore yma am y posibilrwydd o ymestyn yr amser a neilltuwyd ar gyfer y ddadl ar 'Cynlluniwyd i'w Gyflawni' ar 18 Hydref. Bydd yn ddadl bwysig. Mae'n ymwneud nid yn unig ag ailgyflunio gwasanaethau, ond hefyd â lefelau staffio, a'r ffordd yr ydym yn cynllunio gofal sylfaenol ac eilaidd. Credaf y dylai Aelodau ar draws y Siambr gael cyfle i gymryd rhan mewn dadl ar y materion hyn, yn ogystal â'r rhai sy'n eistedd ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Pe baem yn ymestyn y ddadl honno, byddai'n rhoi cyfle hollbwysig i Aelodau o bob cwr o Gymru, nad ydynt yn rhan o'r pwyllgor iechyd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn dilyn cais y bore yma, nodaf fod y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yn barod i ddarparu datganiad ysgrifenedig ar Sain Tathan ac ar y modd y bydd y prosiect hwnnw'n cael ei roi ar waith. Efallai y gallech ddweud wrthym pa bryd y gallwn ddisgwyl y datganiad ysgrifenedig hwnnw gan y Gweinidog.

Yn sgîl yr hyn a ddywedodd Jonathan, yr wyf yn nodi'r sylwadau ynglŷn â sut y mae'r Gweinidog dros addysg wedi bod yn rhoi gwybodaeth i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ynglŷn ag addysg uwch. Deallaf hefyd fod angen aros hyd nes y bydd data clirio'n cael eu cyhoeddi yr wythnos nesaf.

Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na dim ond edrych ar y cydbwysedd rhwng y mathau o fyfyrwyr

studying at higher education universities in Wales, do you not agree that the Welsh Assembly Government should find time to debate the disparity in funding between higher education institutions in England and Wales as part of a broader debate on higher education?

**Carl Sargeant:** Minister, it will be of no surprise to you to learn that we have many Labour achievements to celebrate in the Chamber, including free swimming, free school breakfasts, free bus passes, more jobs, a better economy—I could go on. However, I do not suppose that you have the time to discuss all of those issues, certainly not in this session. However, I would welcome the time to discuss parts of the Assembly carers' grant. [*Interruption.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am anxious to hear what Carl Sargeant has to say.

**Carl Sargeant:** As the directly elected Member for Alyn and Deeside, I congratulate Flintshire Local Health Board and especially the Admiral nurses in my constituency, who have received funding for families, carers and those with dementia. Last week, it was announced in this grand Chamber that 250,000 visitors have been to this Assembly in south Wales, travelling the length and breadth of Wales and, indeed, the world. I am sure that you would acknowledge the difficulties in travelling here from north Wales, and so will you welcome South Down Primary School in Buckley, who will be visiting the Assembly in the week to see the work that we are engaged in?

Finally, I must bring to your attention that it is not all music and light, Minister. While we had the launch of the transport study last week, a great document with a vision for the future, which I certainly welcome, constituents of Alyn and Deeside, particularly those living on the A494 and the forgotten side of the road campaign group, cannot believe that we are considering building a 13-lane carriageway right through the centre of Alyn and Deeside. This is the biggest carriageway in the whole of the UK—bigger than the M25. Minister, if we are concerned

sy'n astudio mewn prifysgolion addysg uwch yng Nghymru, onid ydych yn cytuno y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ganfod amser i drafod y gwahaniaeth yn y modd y mae sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru a Lloegr yn cael eu hariannu fel rhan o ddadl ehangach ar addysg uwch?

**Carl Sargeant:** Weinidog, ni fydd yn syndod i chi fod gan Lafur lawer o lwyddiannau i'w dathlu yn y Siambr, gan gynnwys nofio am ddim, brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion, tocynnau teithio ar fws am ddim, mwy o swyddi, gwell economi—gallwn fynd ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, mae'n debyg nad oes gennych amser i drafod pob un o'r materion hynny, nid yn y sesiwn hon yn sicr. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn falch o gael amser i drafod rhannau o grant gofalwyr y Cynulliad. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn awyddus i glywed beth sydd gan Carl Sargeant i'w ddweud.

**Carl Sargeant:** Fel yr Aelod a etholwyd yn uniongyrchol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, hoffwn longyfarch Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir y Fflint ac yn enwedig y nyrsys Admiral yn fy etholaeth, sydd wedi cael arian ar gyfer teuluoedd, gofalwyr a phobl sydd â dementia. Yr wythnos diwethaf, cyhoeddwyd yn y Siambr hardd hon fod 250,000 o ymwelwyr wedi ymweld â'r Cynulliad hwn yn y de, gan deithio o bob cwr o Gymru ac o bedwar ban byd. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddech yn cydnabod pa mor anodd yw teithio yma o'r gogledd ac, o ganlyniad, a wnewch groesawu Ysgol Gynradd South Down ym Mwcle, a fydd yn ymweld â'r Cynulliad yn ystod yr wythnos i weld y gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud?

Yn olaf, rhaid imi eich hysbysu, Weinidog, nad yw popeth yn fêl i gyd. A ninnau'n lansio'r astudiaeth drafndiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, dogfen wych sydd â gweledigaeth ar gyfer y dyfodol, yr wyf yn sicr yn ei chroesawu, mae etholwyr Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, yn enwedig y rhai sy'n byw ar yr A494 a grŵp ymgyrchu ochr anghofiedig y ffordd, yn methu â chredu ein bod yn ystyried adeiladu ffordd 13 lôn ar gyfer cerbydau drwy ganol Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Dyma'r lôn gerbydau fwyaf yn y DU—yn fwy na'r M25. Weinidog, os ydym yn poeni

about building a sustainable, healthy and vibrant economy, we have to question whether we need 13 lanes through my constituency of Alyn and Deeside. I would love that debate in this Chamber.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** We probably have the last contribution on the list from Carl Sargeant. I thank all—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Before the Minister continues, I welcome the fact that Carl Sargeant makes appropriate use of these questions to the Business Minister. I hope that, in our future deliberations, we can allow further opportunities for Members to ask questions of the Minister about business that concerns them. I will have no more disparaging comments about Members who use this opportunity in a quite appropriate way.

**Jane Hutt:** Hear, hear. Diolch, Llywydd.

I thank all the opposition parties for supporting the business statement. I think that Dai and Kirsty both raised the issue of having that important update, which Ieuan Wyn Jones alluded to earlier during First Minister's questions, on issues in MOD establishments—RAF Valley in particular. I assure you that my colleague, Andrew Davies, will be issuing a written statement later this week, which will cover these issues and others that affect MOD establishments.

On the Electoral Commission report, warming to the Welsh Assembly Government is what we are looking for, but warming to the National Assembly for Wales is also very positive, is it not? We welcome the opportunity to promote those new powers. We have a lot to do in communicating that message across the Assembly, so we have agreed to that debate. It will take place—perhaps not until early in the new year, but it will take place.

Dai, on the tissue directive, the Minister for

am adeiladu economi gynaliadwy, iach a llewyrchus, rhaid inni ofyn a oes angen 13 lôn drwy fy etholaeth i, sef Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Byddwn wrth fy modd yn cael dadl ar hyn yn y Siambr hon.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'n debyg ein bod yn cael y cyfraniad olaf ar y rhestr gan Carl Sargeant. Hoffwn ddiolch i bob un—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cyn i'r Gweinidog fynd yn ei blaen, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod Carl Sargeant yn gwneud defnydd priodol o'r cwestiynau hyn i'r Trefnydd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, yn ein trafodaethau yn y dyfodol, y gallwn ganiatáu rhagor o gyfleoedd i Aelodau ofyn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog am faterion sy'n peri pryder iddynt hwy. Nid wyf am glywed rhagor o sylwadau amharchus am Aelodau sy'n defnyddio'r cyfle hwn mewn ffordd gwbl briodol.

**Jane Hutt:** Clywch, clywch. Diolch, Lywydd.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bob un o'r gwrthbleidiau am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes. Credaf fod Dai a Kirsty wedi cyfeirio at gael yr adroddiad diweddarau pwysig, mater y cyfeiriodd Ieuan Wyn Jones ato yn gynharach yn ystod y cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, ar faterion yn sefydliadau'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn—RAF y Fali yn fwyaf arbennig. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon, a fydd yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn a materion eraill sy'n effeithio ar sefydliadau'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn.

O ran adroddiad y Comisiwn Etholiadol, cael pobl i glosio tuag at Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw'r hyn yr ydym yn anelu tuag ato, ond mae closio tuag at Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn gadarnhaol iawn hefyd, onid yw? Yr ydym yn croesawu'r cyfle i hyrwyddo'r pwerau newydd hyn. Mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud er mwyn cyfleu'r neges hon ar draws y Cynulliad, felly yr ydym wedi cytuno i gynnal y ddadl honno. Bydd yn cael ei chynnal—yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd efallai, ond bydd yn cael ei chynnal.

Dai, ynglŷn â'r gyfarwydddeb meinweoedd,

Health and Social Services issued a written statement today on the recall of certain US tissue products. It did involve three hospitals in Wales, and the written statement, I am sure, will lead to further updates, response and monitoring from the Minister on this important issue.

Jonathan and Kirsty both drew attention to issues surrounding the numbers of students as a result of the change in the fees position. As you have acknowledged, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has provided information on this to the education committee in her ministerial report, and an update has been promised. As you say, Kirsty, it is important that that post-clearing data on entries is received and published next month. I am sure that there will be robust discussion about funding issues in relation to higher education.

On a statement on the ambulance services, Jonathan—which you also mentioned, Kirsty—I am glad that you accept that we are in the middle of a review; it is appropriate that we follow the cross-party spirit of that review. Its terms of reference include looking at the financial and resource pressures on the trust, so that is very much at the heart of the review. We have asked the Auditor General to undertake the work on our behalf, and I am sure that you would agree that we should not seek to pre-empt the outcome of that work, and that it is right and proper that we allow the Auditor General to conclude the review and report back his findings and recommendations to the Health and Social Services Committee before we discuss the issues further. We also have a debate scheduled on the ambulance service; therefore, we will have the full facts, and the outcome of the review, based on independent, documented evidence, before the Assembly for debate.

Finally, I turn to Carl, and his varied and interesting questions. In terms of the business statement, it is helpful to hear from the sharp end about how, for example, the £3 million in additional, ring-fenced money for the carers

cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ddatganiad ysgrifenedig heddiw ar alw cynnyrch meinweoedd penodol o'r Unol Daleithiau yn ôl. Yr oedd yn ymwneud â thri ysbyty yng Nghymru, a bydd y datganiad ysgrifenedig, yr wyf yn sicr, yn arwain at ragor o adroddiadau diweddar, ymateb a monitro gan y Gweinidog ar y mater pwysig hwn.

Tynnodd Jonathan a Kirsty sylw at faterion yn ymwneud â nifer y myfyrwyr o ganlyniad i'r newid yn y sefyllfa o ran ffioedd. Fel yr ydych wedi cydnabod, mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi darparu gwybodaeth am hyn i'r pwyllgor addysg yn ei hadroddiad gweinidogol, ac addawyd diweddariad. Fel y dywedwch, Kirsty, mae'n bwysig bod y data ôl-glririo hynny am geisiadau yn dod i law ac yn cael eu cyhoeddi y mis nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y ceir trafodaeth gref am faterion cyllido yn ymwneud ag addysg uwch.

O ran datganiad am y gwasanaethau ambiwlans, Jonathan—a grybwyllwyd gennych chithau hefyd, Kirsty—yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn derbyn ein bod ar ganol adolygiad; mae'n briodol inni ddilyn ysbryd trawsbleidiol yr adolygiad hwnnw. Mae ei gylch gorchwyl yn cynnwys edrych ar y pwysau ariannol a'r pwysau o ran adnoddau ar yr ymddiriedolaeth, ac mae hynny'n ganolog i'r adolygiad. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i'r Archwiliwr Cyffredinol ymgymryd â'r gwaith ar ein rhan, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn cytuno na ddylem geisio achub y blaen ar ganlyniad y gwaith hwnnw, ac mae'n briodol inni adael i'r Archwiliwr Cyffredinol gwblhau'r adolygiad ac adrodd ei ganfyddiadau a'i argymhellion yn ôl i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol cyn inni drafod y materion ymhellach. Mae gennym hefyd ddadl wedi ei threfnu am y gwasanaethau ambiwlans; felly, bydd y ffeithiau'n llawn, ynghyd â chanlyniad yr adolygiad, wedi'i seilio ar dystiolaeth annibynnol sydd ar glawr a chadw, gerbron y Cynulliad i'w trafod.

Yn olaf, trof at Carl, a'i gwestiynau amrywiol a diddorol. O ran y datganiad busnes, mae'n fuddiol clywed o lawr gwlad sut, er enghraifft, y mae'r £3 miliwn o arian ychwanegol, wedi'i neilltuo, ar gyfer y grant



grant is supporting the carers of those with Alzheimer's disease. It is important that we hear from the sharp end—and all Members draw issues to our attention—and that we consider ways in which we can express that and share that more fully in the Assembly. We also welcome the fact that north Wales primary schools, such as the one from Buckley, visit us here. The Assembly has an office in north Wales, and many visitors from north Wales come down here, as part of the 250,000 visitors that we have had so far. I am sure that the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks will have heard your point about the roads and transport. It is good that Carl Sargeant can make these points in the Assembly, and I welcome them.

gofalwyr yn cynorthwyo gofalwyr y rhai sydd â chlefyd Alzheimer. Mae'n bwysig inni glywed hyn o lawr gwlad—ac mae'r Aelodau i gyd yn dod â materion i'n sylw—ac inni ystyried ffyrdd o fynegi hynny a'i rannu'n fwy cyflawn yn y Cynulliad. Croesawn hefyd y ffaith bod ysgolion cynradd gogledd Cymru, fel yr un o Fwcle, yn ymweld â ni yma. Mae gan y Cynulliad swyddfa yn y gogledd, ac mae llawer o ymwelwyr o'r gogledd yn dod i lawr yma, fel rhan o'r 250,000 o ymwelwyr yr ydym wedi eu cael hyd yma. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wedi clywed eich pwynt am y ffyrdd a thrafnidiaeth. Mae'n dda bod Carl Sargeant yn gallu gwneud y pwyntiau hyn yn y Cynulliad, a chroesawaf hwy.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Datganiad ar Ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion**

#### **Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's Response to the Report of the Committee on School Funding**

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I thank the Committee on School Funding for its report on this important topic. The committee made 27 recommendations to improve transparency, objectivity and fairness in how education funding is distributed to local authorities in Wales. I am supportive of the aim of the recommendations, and have accepted the majority of them.

The report must be seen in the context of significant new investment in education, training and children's services in Wales in the past six years. Direct investment by the Assembly Government has risen from £760 million in 1999-2000 to over £1.5 billion in 2006-07. We have increased revenue support grant funding to local authorities by more than £1 billion in the same period. Total budgeted local authority gross revenue spending on education this year is at an all-time high of over £2.1 billion.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Diolch i'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion am ei adroddiad ar y pwnc pwysig hwn. Gwnaeth y pwyllgor 27 o argymhellion i wella tryloywder, gwrthrychedd a thegwch yn y ffordd y caiff arian addysg ei ddsbarthu i awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Cefnogaf nod yr argymhellion, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn y mwyafrif ohonynt.

Rhaid edrych ar yr adroddiad yng nghydestun buddsoddiad newydd sylweddol mewn addysg, hyfforddiant a gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf. Mae'r buddsoddiad uniongyrchol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi codi o £760 miliwn yn 1999-2000 i fwy na £1.5 biliwn yn 2006-07. Yr ydym wedi cynyddu arian y grant cynnal refeniw i'r awdurdodau lleol o fwy nag £1 biliwn dros yr un cyfnod. Mae cyfanswm y gwariant refeniw crynswth ar addysg sydd yng nghyllideb yr awdurdodau lleol eleni ar y lefel uchaf erioed, sef dros £2.1 biliwn.

Against that background, I am pleased that the committee's report acknowledges that funding comparisons with England, or other countries, although useful, should not drive education policies in Wales. In future, I hope that we can also develop comparisons with regions and countries whose size and socio-economic circumstances are similar to those of Wales.

I am pleased, too, that the committee acknowledges that local government's role in funding schools is vital in sustaining local democracy. The Assembly Government recognises the advantages of the major part of the local government revenue settlement being non-hypothecated. That is the basis of our partnership agreement with local government. We do not wish to move to a situation where local budget decisions—for education or other services—are determined at the centre. Local authorities know their schools and are best placed to fund them. They are accountable to their electorates for the decisions that they make locally.

We have nonetheless initiated a review of the sparsity and deprivation factors, and their weightings, within the standard spending assessment formula for the distribution of revenue support grant. This underlines our policy commitment to move towards distribution based on a more deliberate identification of future need to spend, and a distribution that can also deliver our social justice objectives for Wales.

3.20 p.m.

The figures that I presented to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee on 5 July show that, at the all-Wales level, total local authority net revenue spend on education in 2006-07 is budgeted at 0.4 per cent above the total education indicator-based assessment within the distribution formula. Across local authorities the position varies: 12 are budgeting to spend above IBA this year and 10 below it. Until we complete our review of the standard spending assessment formula and its outcomes can be used in the local government settlement—this is expected to be for 2008-09—the education

Yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw, yr wyf yn falch bod adroddiad y pwyllgor yn cydnabod na ddylai cymariaethau cyllido â Lloegr, na gwledydd eraill, er eu bod yn fuddiol, bennu beth yw polisiau addysg yng Nghymru. Yn y dyfodol, gobeithiaf y gallwn hefyd ddatblygu cymariaethau â rhanbarthau a gwledydd y mae eu maint a'u hamgylchiadau economaidd-gymdeithasol yn debyg i rai Cymru.

Yr wyf yn falch, hefyd, fod y pwyllgor yn cydnabod bod rôl llywodraeth leol o ran ariannu ysgolion yn hanfodol i gynnal democratiaeth leol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod manteision peidio â neilltuo rhan fawr o setliad refeniw llywodraeth leol. Hynny yw sail ein cytundeb partneriaeth gyda llywodraeth leol. Nid ydym am symud i sefyllfa lle y mae penderfyniadau am gyllidebau lleol—ar gyfer addysg neu wasanaethau eraill—yn cael eu gwneud yn y canol. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn adnabod eu hysgolion a hwy sydd yn y sefyllfa orau i'w hariannu. Maent yn atebol i'w hetholwyr am y penderfyniadau a wnânt yn lleol.

Yr ydym serch hynny wedi sefydlu adolygiad o'r ffactorau teneurwydd poblogaeth ac amddifadedd, a'u pwysoliadau, o fewn fformiwla'r asesiad o wariant safonol ar gyfer dosbarthu'r grant cynnal refeniw. Mae hyn yn tanlinellu ein hymrwymiad polisi i symud tuag at ddsbarthiad a seilir ar ddull mwy pwrpasol o ddynodi'r angen i wario yn y dyfodol, a dosbarthiad a all hefyd wireddu ein hamcanion ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ar gyfer Cymru.

Mae'r ffigurau a gyflwynais i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar 5 Gorffennaf yn dangos, ar lefel Cymru gyfan, fod cyfanswm gwariant refeniw net yr awdurdodau lleol ar addysg yn 2006-07 wedi'i gyllidebu ar 0.4 y cant yn uwch na chyfanswm yr asesiad addysg seiliedig ar ddangosyddion yn y fformiwla ddsbarthu. Mae'r sefyllfa'n amrywio ar draws yr awdurdodau lleol: mae 12 yn cyllidebu i wario mwy na'r asesiad seiliedig ar ddangosyddion eleni a 10 ar wario llai na'r asesiad. Hyd nes inni gwblhau ein hadolygiad o fformiwla'r asesiad o wariant safonol a bod

IBA for each authority will be used as the local target for education spend, as an interim measure. This does not mean fettering authorities' discretion to set education budgets according to local priorities. However, where authorities set a budget that is different from their education IBA, they will be asked to report on the reasons for that to their schools budget forum, their full council and the Assembly Government. This will aid both transparency and local accountability.

I have sympathy with the objective behind the committee's recommendation that the Assembly Government should establish minimum common basic funding requirements for school staffing, accommodation and equipment. However, we should be under no illusion about the difficulty of achieving this. We would need to weigh up, first, how it could be done, what the consequences might be in terms of affecting the budgets of individual schools, and whether, given the extensive work that would be needed, the outcome would be worthwhile. My first priority must be to deliver on the commitments set out in my written response, while keeping this option under review for the future.

The committee's report puts great emphasis on tackling deprivation in Wales. There is a strong link between deprivation and attainment: statistics show that, as levels of eligibility for free school meals increase, attainment levels decrease, and we are committed to tackling deprivation and breaking that link. At a national level, the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme targets substantial additional resources—£16 million this year and the next—at schools with the highest levels of deprivation to improve educational outcomes for pupils who are underachieving. At a local level, following extensive consultation and debate in the Assembly Plenary, we made it a requirement from April 2005 for local authorities to include a deprivation factor in their formula for determining schools' delegated budgets.

modd defnyddio ei ganlyniadau yn y setliad i lywodraeth leol—disgwylir y daw hyn erbyn 2008-09—bydd yr asesiad seiliedig ar ddangosyddion i bob awdurdod yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel targed i'r gwariant ar addysg yn lleol, fel mesur dros dro. Nid yw hyn yn golygu ffrwyno rhyddid yr awdurdodau i osod eu cyllidebau addysg yn unol â'r blaenoriaethau lleol. Fodd bynnag, lle y mae awdurdodau lleol yn gosod cyllideb sy'n wahanol i'w hasesiad seiliedig ar ddangosyddion o ran addysg, gofynnir iddynt adrodd am y rhesymau am hynny i'w fforwm cyllideb ysgolion, eu cyngor llawn a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Bydd hyn yn hybu tryloywder ac atebolrwydd lleol.

Mae gennyf gydymdeimlad â'r amcan y tu ôl i argymhelliad y pwyllgor y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sefydlu lleiafswm y gofynion ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin ar gyfer staffio ysgolion, adeiladau ac offer. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylem dwyllo ein hunain y bydd cyflawni hynny'n beth hawdd. Byddai angen inni bwysu a mesur, yn gyntaf, sut y gellid gwneud hyn, beth fyddai'r canlyniadau posibl o safbwynt effeithio ar gyllidebau ysgolion unigol, ac, o ystyried y gwaith helaeth a fyddai'n ofynnol, a fyddai'r canlyniad yn werth chweil. Fy mlaenoriaeth gyntaf o reidrwydd yw cyflawni'r ymrwymadau a nodais yn fy ateb ysgrifenedig, gan barhau i adolygu'r opsiwn hwn ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn rhoi pwyslais mawr ar fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd yng Nghymru. Mae cysylltiad cryf rhwng amddifadedd a chyrhaeddiad: dengys ystadegau fod lefelau cyrhaeddiad yn gostwng wrth i lefelau hawl i brydau ysgol am ddim gynyddu, ac yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a thorri'r ddolen gyswllt honno. Ar lefel genedlaethol, mae'r rhaglen i godi lefelau cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg yng Nghymru yn targedu adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol—£16 miliwn eleni a'r flwyddyn nesaf—at yr ysgolion sydd â'r lefel uchaf o amddifadedd i wella canlyniadau addysgol disgyblion sy'n tangyflawni. Ar lefel leol, ar ôl ymgynghori'n helaeth a dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, fe'i gwnaethom yn ofyniad o fis Ebrill 2005 i'r awdurdodau lleol gynnwys ffactor amddifadedd yn eu

We have started to review what authorities have done, and will, in light of that, consider whether the requirement needs to be strengthened. I will report on this to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee in November.

Alongside these developments, I am committed to providing greater certainty and stability about schools' future funding through the introduction of three-year budgets at the same time as we introduce three-year local government settlements. We will be developing proposals with local government with a view to consulting on regulations to take effect for the financial year 2008-09.

The committee's report pays considerable attention to the so-called education funding fog in Wales. We have taken steps to improve transparency, including introducing school budget fora and publishing details of the education IBA with the local government settlement for the past three years. We accepted the relevant recommendations of the recent Wales Audit Office report to improve the transparency and clarity of education funding, as did the Welsh Local Government Association. We will be working closely with local government to implement the Welsh Audit Office recommendations and those recommendations of the committee that we have accepted.

The report of the Committee on School Funding highlights many of the important and difficult issues that have long been at the centre of the school funding debate in Wales. I believe that the Assembly Government's response to the committee's report represents an important and extensive programme of work that will move that debate forward positively for the future.

**Janet Ryder:** I thank the Minister for her response to this report. It must have put the Minister in an extremely difficult situation, because, when the report was published, it received great acclaim from professionals and educationists, who regarded it as a major step forward. Therefore, what the Minister

fformiwlâ i bennu cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion. Yr ydym wedi dechrau adolygu'r hyn y mae'r awdurdodau wedi'i wneud a byddwn, yng ngoleuni hynny, yn ystyried a oes angen cryfhau'r gofyniad. Byddaf yn adrodd am hyn i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ym mis Tachwedd.

Ochr yn ochr â'r datblygiadau hyn, yr wyf wedi ymrwmo i ddarparu mwy o sicrwydd a sefydlogrwydd o ran yr arian i ysgolion yn y dyfodol drwy gyflwyno cyllidebau tair blynedd yr un pryd ag yr ydym yn cyflwyno setliadau llywodraeth leol tair blynedd. Byddwn yn datblygu cynigion gyda llywodraeth leol gyda golwg ar ymgynghori ynghylch rheoliadau a ddaw i rym ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol 2008-09.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn rhoi cryn sylw i'r dryswch ynglŷn ag ariannu addysg yng Nghymru. Yr ydym wedi cymryd camau i wella tryloywder, gan gynnwys cyflwyno fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion a chyhoeddi manylion yr asesiad addysg seiliedig ar ddangosyddion gyda'r setliad llywodraeth leol am y tair blynedd diwethaf. Derbyniasom argymhellion perthnasol adroddiad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ddiweddar i wella tryloywder ac eglurder yr arian ar gyfer addysg, fel y gwnaeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda llywodraeth leol i weithredu argymhellion Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru a'r argymhellion hynny o eiddo'r pwyllgor yr ydym wedi eu derbyn.

Mae adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion yn tynnu sylw at lawer o faterion pwysig ac anodd sydd wedi bod yn ganolog yn y ddadl am ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru ers amser maith. Credaf fod ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adroddiad y pwyllgor yn golygu rhaglen bwysig a helaeth o waith a fydd yn symud y ddadl honno ymlaen yn gadarnhaol i'r dyfodol.

**Janet Ryder:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei hymateb i'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n rhaid ei fod wedi rhoi'r Gweinidog mewn sefyllfa hynod o anodd, oherwydd, pan gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad, cafodd ei gymeradwyo'n fawr gan weithwyr proffesiynol ac addysgwyr, a oedd yn barnu ei fod yn gam mawr ymlaen.

has said today, and what was contained in her written response last week, is very disappointing. While the Minister has attempted to show that she will accept many of the recommendations put forward, if you look at the detail—it was not in her statement today, but there was a little detail in last week's written statement—few of the recommendations will come to fruition.

She has talked today about reviewing the funding formula for local government, but what the committee wanted her to do, while she was reviewing that funding formula, was to look at the education element—the element that needs to be funded in any school to provide education—and I cannot see that happening, according to what the Minister has said so far. I hope that it will happen.

I can appreciate that the Minister has made a great deal of the ongoing work. I feel that we might lose some of our recommendations in that ongoing work, because we do not seem to be working to any firm dates or timetables. She certainly made a great deal of the increased spending on education, however, who would not have expected that great increase in education spend when the Government was elected with education as one of its main priorities? That must have been a natural step forward.

The Minister has side-stepped a commitment to even look at a common basic funding requirement for schools, to cover staffing, accommodation and equipment. The Minister has said that she might look at it in the future, but I would like to know when we are going to look at it because, from what I can see, many of the questions raised by the Committee on School Funding will remain. The one concrete thing that we might end up with is a three-year funding formula, which, in itself, will certainly be of great benefit to schools—no-one is saying that that it will not. The Minister said in her statement that

Felly, mae'r hyn y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei ddweud heddiw, a'r hyn a oedd yn ei hateb ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf, yn siomedig iawn. Er bod y Gweinidog wedi ceisio dangos y bydd yn derbyn llawer o'r argymhellion a roddwyd gerbron, os edrychwch ar y manylion—nid oeddent yn ei datganiad heddiw, ond yr oedd rhywfaint o fanylion yn ei datganiad ysgrifenedig yr wythnos diwethaf—prin yw'r argymhellion a fydd yn dwyn ffrwyth.

Mae wedi siarad heddiw am adolygu'r fformiwla ariannu i lywodraeth leol, ond yr hyn yr oedd y pwyllgor am iddi ei wneud, tra oedd yn adolygu'r fformiwla ariannu, oedd edrych ar yr elfen addysg—yr elfen y mae angen ei hariannu mewn unrhyw ysgol i ddarparu addysg—ac ni allaf weld hynny'n digwydd, yn ôl yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei ddweud hyd yma. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn digwydd.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli bod y Gweinidog wedi sôn llawer am y gwaith sydd ar y gweill. Teimlaf y gallai rhai o'n hargymhellion fynd ar goll yn y gwaith hwnnw sydd ar y gweill, oherwydd nid yw'n ymddangos ein bod yn gweithio ar sail dyddiadau nac amserlenni pendant. Mae'n sicr wedi sôn llawer am y cynnydd yn y gwariant ar addysg, fodd bynnag, pwy na fyddai wedi disgwyl y cynnydd mawr hwnnw yn y gwariant ar addysg o ystyried bod y Llywodraeth wedi cael ei hethol gydag addysg yn un o'i phrif flaenoriaethau? Nid oedd hynny ond cam naturiol ymlaen.

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi osgoi ymrwymo i hyd yn oed edrych ar ofyniad ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin i ysgolion, ar gyfer staffio, adeiladau ac offer. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud y gwnaiff hi efallai edrych ar hynny yn y dyfodol, ond fe hoffwn wybod pryd yr ydym yn mynd i edrych arno oherwydd, yn ôl yr hyn a welaf fi, bydd llawer o'r cwestiynau a godwyd gan y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion yn aros. Yr un peth pendant yr ydym yn debygol o'i gael yw fformiwla ariannu dair blynedd a fydd, ynnddi ei hun, yn sicr o fudd mawr i ysgolion—nid oes neb yn dweud na fydd. Yn ei datganiad dywedodd y Gweinidog fod

'the Committee on School Funding highlights 'y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion yn tynnu

many of the important and difficult issues that have long been at the centre of the school funding debate in Wales’,

but, after the response that we have had today, I feel that we will stay where we are, with those same issues right at the heart of the debate. I think that many people will now look to May and a change of Government, for a Government that will pick up those recommendations.

**Jane Davidson:** It is always difficult to respond to the half-hearted endorsement that you give to anything that comes out of the Government, no matter how beneficial it is. The important aspects of this debate are that there are a number of pieces of work that the Assembly Government was already undertaking that will come to fruition within determined timescales, as outlined in the report, and which will contribute to the improvement of the school funding debate.

As Minister, I have personally put a number of measures in place that have contributed to the school funding debate, not least publishing the indicator-based assessments before local authorities set their budgets, and introducing school budget fora so that there can be a proper debate at local authority level prior to the local authorities setting their budgets. That initiative was then taken up by England in the Education Act 2002.

The vast majority of the recommendations in the Committee on School Funding’s report have been accepted by the Government. The Chair of the committee, when he spoke in July, welcomed the fact that the Government was proposing to accept the vast majority of the recommendations. In addition to the work that we have done ourselves in terms of increased transparency, we also commissioned the Wales Audit Office to look objectively at the content of the indicator-based assessment, which effectively operates as a minimum funding requirement. In the published report to the committee, the Wales Audit Office, which is entirely independent of the Assembly Government, found that the factors used to determine the indicator-based assessment in education are suitable. We

sylw at lawer o faterion pwysig ac anodd sydd wedi bod yn ganolog yn y ddadl am ariannu ysgolion yng Nghymru ers amser maith’,

ond, ar ôl yr ymateb yr ydym wedi ei gael heddiw, teimlaf y byddwn yn aros yn ein hunfan, gyda’r un materion hynny yn ganolog i’r ddadl. Credaf y bydd llawer o bobl yn troi eu golygon yn awr at fis Mai a Llywodraeth wahanol, Llywodraeth a fydd yn mynd i’r afael â’r argymhellion hynny.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae bob amser yn anodd ymateb i’r gefnogaeth lugoer a roddwch i unrhyw beth a wneir gan y Llywodraeth, ni waeth pa mor llesol yw. Yr agweddau pwysig ar y ddadl hon yw bod nifer o ddarnau o waith yr oedd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn ymgymryd â hwy a fydd yn dwyn ffrwyth o fewn amserlenni sydd wedi’u pennu, fel yr amlinellwyd yn yr adroddiad, ac a fydd yn cyfrannu at y ddadl am wella’r drefn o ran ariannu ysgolion.

Fel Gweinidog, yr wyf fi’n bersonol wedi sefydlu nifer o fesurau sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl am ariannu ysgolion, yn enwedig cyhoeddi’r asesiadau seiliedig ar ddangosyddion cyn i’r awdurdodau lleol bennu eu cyllidebau, a chyflwyno fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion fel bod modd cael dadl iawn ar lefel yr awdurdod lleol cyn i’r awdurdodau lleol bennu eu cyllidebau. Cafodd hynny ei fabwysiadu wedyn gan Loegr yn Neddf Addysg 2002.

Mae mwyafrif helaeth yr argymhellion yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion wedi cael eu derbyn gan y Llywodraeth. Pan siaradodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, ym mis Gorffennaf, croesawodd y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn bwriadu derbyn y mwyafrif helaeth o’r argymhellion. Yn ychwanegol at y gwaith yr ydym wedi ei wneud ein hunain o safbwynt cynyddu tryloywder, aethom ati hefyd i gomisiynu Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru i edrych yn wrthrychol ar gynnwys yr asesiad seiliedig ar ddangosyddion, sydd i bob pwrpas yn gweithredu fel gofyniad cyllido sylfaenol. Yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan y pwyllgor, canfu Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, sy’n gwbl annibynnol ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fod y ffactorau a ddefnyddiwyd i bennu’r asesiad seiliedig ar

need to work with the evidence base, particularly evidence from independent, objective and experienced analysts, to take this debate forward and I have indicated that I will do that.

**Lynne Neagle:** I thank you for your statement, Minister. On the key recommendations concerning a review of the education aspect of the local government formula, it is a relief that a meaningful review is now under way. I ask that the Assembly Government keeps Assembly Members apprised of that work, perhaps through the relevant committees, in partnership with your colleague, the Finance Minister. As you know, we were promised a review previously, but the results were limited and, as far as I was concerned, unacceptable, and would have benefited from earlier scrutiny by the Assembly. I am still concerned that we should be working towards a minimum common basic funding level for schools. The Minister, in her written statement, refers to the difficulty of achieving this objective. However, as the saying goes, the most difficult thing to do is often the right thing to do.

3.30 p.m.

I also welcome the interim use of the indicator-based assessments as an explicit education spend target for local government. However, I ask for clarification on the language that you use in your statement, where you talk about asking local authorities to report to council, to school budget fora and so on. Can I have clarification that this will be a requirement for all local authorities in Wales?

I also believe that the increased accountability that this will bring is not, on its own, enough. As you have indicated, 10 local authorities are spending below their IBA allocation; in some cases, that underspend is significant indeed. As you are aware, that plays a major part in creating the manifestly unfair situation in which we have a spending gap of around £1,000 per pupil between the highest and the lowest spending

ddangosyddion mewn addysg yn addas. Mae angen inni weithio gyda'r sylfaen dystiolaeth, yn enwedig tystiolaeth gan ddadansoddwyr annibynnol, gwrthrychol a phrofiadol, i symud y ddadl hon ymlaen ac yr wyf wedi dweud y byddaf yn gwneud hynny.

**Lynne Neagle:** Diolchaf ichi am eich datganiad, Weinidog. O ran yr argymhellion allweddol ynglŷn ag adolygu'r agwedd sy'n ymwneud ag addysg yn y fformiwla llywodraeth leol, mae'n rhyddhad gwybod bod adolygiad ystyrion ar y gweill erbyn hyn. Gofynnaf i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi gwybod yn gyson i Aelodau'r Cynulliad am y gwaith hwnnw, drwy'r pwyllgorau perthnasol efallai, mewn partneriaeth â'ch cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid. Fel y gwyddoch, addawyd adolygiad inni cyn hyn, ond cyfyngedig oedd y canlyniadau a, chyn belled ag yr oeddwn i'n bod, yr oeddent yn annerbyniol, a byddent yn well pa bai'r Cynulliad wedi craffu arnynt ynghynt. Yr wyf yn dal i boeni y dylem fod yn gweithio tuag at lefel lleiafswm ariannu sylfaenol cyffredin i ysgolion. Mae'r Gweinidog, yn ei datganiad ysgrifenedig, yn dweud pa mor anodd yw cyflawni'r amcan hwn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywed yr hen air, y peth anoddaf i'w wneud yw'r peth iawn i'w wneud yn aml.

Croesawaf hefyd y defnydd dros dro o'r asesiadau ar sail dangosyddion fel targed gwario penodol i lywodraeth leol ym maes addysg. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf am eglurhad ar yr iaith a ddefnyddiwyd yn eich datganiad, lle y soniwyd am ofyn i awdurdodau lleol adrodd i'r cyngor, i fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion ac yn y blaen. A gaf eglurhad y bydd hyn yn ofyniad ar bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru?

Credaf hefyd nad yw'r cynnydd o ran atebolrwydd a ddaw yn sgîl hyn yn ddigon ynddo'i hun. Fel y dywedasoeh, mae 10 awdurdod lleol yn gwario llai na'u dyraniad seiliedig ar asesiad ar sail dangosyddion; mewn rhai achosion mae'r tanwario hwnnw'n wirioneddol arwyddocaol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae hynny'n chwarae rhan fawr mewn creu'r sefyllfa amlwg o annheg lle y mae gennym fwlch gwariant o ryw £1,000 y

authorities. Minister, in trying to ensure fair funding for children in schools, how, in partnership with the Minister with responsibility for local government, do you intend to work proactively and at an early stage with those local authorities that are spending significantly below their IBA to ensure that they do, in fact, reach their target as quickly as possible?

Finally, on recommendation 12, which deals with local authorities needing to formally prioritise the provision of targeted support to the most deprived schools, you have indicated that you will review this when you report to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee in November. I am a bit puzzled as to how one strengthens a requirement, so, if you find that not all local authorities comply with that requirement, can you give your explicit assurance that you will ensure that all local authorities do so?

**Jane Davidson:** You have been a doughty campaigner in terms of school funding, and I know that you have worked closely with the headteachers in your local authority area.

It is important in terms of ongoing reviews to be clear about their purpose. However, the first review, which is the overarching review being led by my colleague, the Finance Minister, is looking at the broad issues in terms of sparsity and deprivation as elements of local government formula, but then how they apply in terms of the education formula as well. We must remember that this has already been reviewed once, because Pion Economics reviewed this with the Minister back in 2001-02.

The second review, which my officials are undertaking, is of our budget share regulations, which we agreed in 2004, becoming a requirement from 2005. Ann Jones was specifically keen to ensure that this requirement, in terms of a deprivation element within the formula, was firmly adhered to by local authorities. The current

disgybl rhwng yr awdurdodau sy'n gwario fwyaf a'r rhai sy'n gwario leiaf. Weinidog, wrth geisio sicrhau cyllid teg i blant mewn ysgolion, sut yr ydych chi, mewn partneriaeth â'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb am lywodraeth leol, yn bwriadu gweithio'n rhagweithiol ac yn gynnar gyda'r awdurdodau lleol hynny sydd yn gwario swm llai o lawer na'u dyraniad seiliedig ar asesiad ar sail dangosyddion, er mwyn sicrhau y cyrhaeddant eu targed cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Yn olaf, o ran argymhelliad 12, sy'n delio â'r angen i awdurdodau lleol roi blaenoriaeth yn ffurfiol i dargedu cymorth i'r ysgolion mwyaf difreintiedig, yr ydych wedi sôn y byddwch yn adolygu hyn pan adroddwch i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ym mis Tachwedd. Yr wyf yn pendroni braidd ynghylch sut y mae cryfhau gofyniad, felly, os canfyddwch nad yw pob awdurdod lleol yn cydymffurfio â'r gofyniad hwnnw, a allwch roi sicrwydd diamwys y byddwch yn sicrhau bod pob awdurdod lleol yn gwneud hynny?

**Jane Davidson:** Yr ydych wedi bod yn ymgyrchydd di-ildio ynglŷn ag ariannu ysgolion, a gwn eich bod wedi cydweithio'n agos gyda'r prifathrawon yn ardal eich awdurdod lleol.

O ran adolygiadau sydd ar y gweill, mae'n bwysig bod yn glir ynghylch eu pwrpas. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adolygiad cyntaf, sef yr adolygiad cyffredinol a arweinir gan fy nghyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn edrych ar y materion cyffredinol o ran teneurwydd poblogaeth ac amddifadedd fel elfennau o fformiwla llywodraeth leol, ond wedyn ar sut y maent yn berthnasol o ran y fformiwla addysg hefyd. Rhaid cofio bod hyn eisoes wedi'i adolygu unwaith, gan i Pion Economics adolygu hyn gyda'r Gweinidog yn 2001-02.

Mae'r ail adolygiad, y mae fy swyddogion yn ei gynnal, yn ymwneud â'n rheoliadau cyfrannau cyllideb, y cytunasom arnynt yn 2004, ac sy'n dod yn ofynnol o 2005. Yr oedd Ann Jones yn arbennig o awyddus i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn glynu'n gadarn wrth y gofyniad hwn, o ran bod elfen ar gyfer amddifadedd o fewn y fformiwla. Y



requirement is that there should be a deprivation element, but, following discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association, it was agreed that local authorities could look at the percentage that they allocated within that formula. What we are now looking at is the percentage allocation that is in the formula and how local authorities have reviewed that. I can give you an absolute undertaking that that requirement is in the legislation, and we will look to be robust with local authorities in response to that requirement.

I am pleased that you welcome the commitment in terms of looking at IBA issues, on an interim basis while this work is being completed, being an interim local target. The language is 'asking' rather than 'requiring' because you need a legislative base to 'require'. However, it is absolutely clear that, in partnership with the Welsh Local Government Association, the Assembly Government will ask local authorities to report, and I am confident that they will do so. We will bring reports, therefore, to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee in terms of ensuring that that is public here, as well as in the school budget fora and in the local authorities themselves.

Finally, in terms of the minimum core funding, when I looked at these issues before the summer recess, I said that one of the difficulties in some of these areas is that there may be some perverse outcomes, within local authorities as well as beyond local authority boundaries. In principle, I have always been in favour of minimum core funding; when I first became Minister, I worked closely with local authorities and trade unions to see whether or not we could achieve a better mechanism. We remain committed to looking for that holy grail, as it were, but there are ongoing reviews that will give us a better evidence base from which we can look at work to be taken forward on that agenda.

**Mark Isherwood:** I warmly welcomed the Committee on School Funding's report when we debated it on 12 July. However, I regret

gofyniad ar hyn o bryd yw y dylai fod elfen yn ymwneud ag amddifadedd, ond, ar ôl trafod gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, cytunwyd y gallai awdurdodau lleol edrych ar y ganran a gâi ei dyrannu ganddynt o fewn y fformiwla honno. Yr hyn yr ydym yn edrych arno'n awr yw'r dyraniad canrannol sydd yn y fformiwla a sut y mae awdurdodau lleol wedi adolygu hynny. Gallaf roi addewid bendant ichi fod y gofyniad hwnnw yn y ddeddfwriaeth, a byddwn yn ceisio bod yn gadarn gydag awdurdodau lleol wrth ymateb i'r gofyniad hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad ynglŷn ag edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud ag asesu ar sail dangosyddion, ar sail interim tra caiff y gwaith hwn ei gwblhau, sef targed lleol dros dro. 'Gofyn' yw'r gair yn hytrach na 'mynnu', oherwydd y mae angen sylfaen ddeddfwriaethol i 'fynnu'. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwbl glir y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ar y cyd â Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno adroddiad, ac yr wyf yn hyderus y gwnânt hynny. Deun ag adroddiadau, felly, i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n gyhoeddus yma, yn ogystal ag yn y fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion ac yn yr awdurdodau lleol eu hunain.

Yn olaf, o ran yr isafswm ariannu creiddiol, pan edrychais ar y materion hyn cyn gwyliau'r haf, dywedais mai un o'r anawsterau yn rhai o'r meysydd hyn yw y gall fod rhai canlyniadau gwrthun, o fewn awdurdodau lleol yn ogystal â thu hwnt i ffiniau awdurdodau lleol. O ran egwyddor, yr wyf wastad wedi bod o blaid isafswm ariannu creiddiol; pan ddeuthum yn Weinidog gyntaf, cydweithiais yn agos gydag awdurdodau lleol ac undebau llafur i weld a allem sicrhau gwell mecanwaith ai peidio. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo o hyd i chwilio am y greal sanctaidd hwnnw, fel petai, ond mae adolygiadau'n mynd rhagddynt a fydd yn rhoi sylfaen dystiolaeth well inni ar gyfer edrych ar waith i'w gyflawni o ran yr agenda honno.

**Mark Isherwood:** Rhoddais groeso brwd i adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion pan gynaliasom ddadl arno ar 12 Gorffennaf.

that my welcome to this response from the Minister is decidedly lukewarm. As I stated in the debate, people need to be reminded that every Labour Assembly Member voted against the establishment of a committee on school funding when opposition parties defeated them on this issue on 14 June last year, despite the funding fog identified by headteachers' organisations and the postcode lottery that funded pupils on the basis of where they lived, rather than what they needed, and despite the funding deficit identified between English and Welsh schools.

In that debate, I highlighted the unsustainable position in which the worst-funded primary schools in Wales, in Flintshire, received £941 less per pupil than the best-funded primary schools in Wales. The worst-funded secondary schools in Wales, in Denbighshire, received £696 less per pupil than the best-funded secondary schools in Wales. Overall, the worst-funded schools in Flintshire received £754 less to spend on each pupil than the best-funded schools in Wales. Only last week, during a visit to a high school in north-east Wales with an Assembly parliamentary service education officer, I was questioned about this by a concerned senior member of staff. When I made reference to these points, I was thanked by the audience for being an honest politician—those were their words.

I fear that the Minister's response does not rise to the challenge or fully grasp the opportunity presented to her to put things right. The first recommendation of the committee's report called for an investigation into the reasons for the difference in funding between the key stages, particularly for years 6 and 7. However, why does the Minister instead merely refer to information about funding differences that she has already supplied? If that is all the committee wanted, it would not have asked for an investigation.

In the debate on 12 July I stated that recommendation 3 was spot on. As the Wales

Fodd bynnag, mae'n flin gennyf ddweud mai llugoer yn bendant yw fy nghroeso i'r ymateb hwn gan y Gweinidog. Fel y dywedais yn y ddadl, mae angen atgoffa pobl fod pob Aelod Llafur o'r Cynulliad wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn sefydlu pwyllgor ar ariannu ysgolion pan drechwyd hwy gan y gwrthbleidiau ar y pwnc hwn ar 14 Mehefin y llynedd, er gwaethaf y dryswch ynghylch ariannu a nodwyd gan gymdeithasau'r prifathrawon a'r loteri codau post a ariannai ddisgyblion ar sail ble'r oeddent yn byw, yn hytrach na'r hyn yr oedd arnynt ei angen, ac er gwaethaf y bwllch ariannu a welid rhwng ysgolion Lloegr a Chymru.

Yn y ddadl honno, tynnais sylw at y sefyllfa anghynaliadwy lle'r oedd yr ysgolion cynradd a gâi leiaf o arian yng Nghymru, yn sir y Fflint, yn cael £941 yn llai am bob disgybl na'r ysgolion cynradd a gâi'r arian mwyaf yng Nghymru. Yr oedd yr ysgolion uwchradd a gâi leiaf o arian yng Nghymru, yn sir Ddinbych, yn cael £696 yn llai am bob disgybl na'r ysgolion uwchradd a gâi'r arian mwyaf yng Nghymru. O ran y sefyllfa'n gyfan gwbl, yr oedd yr ysgolion a gâi leiaf o arian yn sir y Fflint yn cael £754 yn llai i'w wario ar bob disgybl na'r ysgolion a gâi'r arian mwyaf yng Nghymru. Mor ddiweddar â'r wythnos diwethaf, yn ystod ymweliad ag ysgol uwchradd yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru gyda swyddog addysg o wasanaeth seneddol y Cynulliad, fe'm holwyd ynglŷn â hyn gan uwch-aelod o'r staff a oedd yn bryderus am y mater. Pan gyfeiriais at y pwyntiau hyn, diolchodd y gynulleidfa imi am fod yn wleidydd gonest—dyna'u geiriau.

Mae arnaf ofn nad yw ymateb y Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r her nac yn cydio'n llawn yn y cyfle a gyflwynwyd iddi i gywiro pethau. Galwai argymhelliad cyntaf adroddiad y pwyllgor am ymchwiliad i'r rhesymau am y gwahaniaeth mewn ariannu rhwng y cyfnodau allweddol, yn enwedig i flynyddoedd 6 a 7. Ond pam y mae'r Gweinidog yn hytrach yn cyfeirio'n unig at wybodaeth am wahaniaethau ariannu y mae hi eisoes wedi'i rhoi? Os mai dyna'r cwbl yr oedd ar y pwyllgor ei eisiau, ni fyddai wedi gofyn am ymchwiliad.

Yn y ddadl ar 12 Gorffennaf dywedais fod argymhelliad 3 yn llygad ei le. Fel yr

Audit Office recommended, there should be a review of whether free school meals represent the best indicator for deprivation. The Minister says that she accepts this, but adds that, at the moment, eligibility for free school meals is the only measure that can identify pupils in terms of where they are educated, as opposed to where they live. If this is the case, as I stated on 12 July, why had the London school with the highest number of free school meals in England and Wales, at 83 per cent, achieved 59 per cent of pupils with five A to C passes at GSCE, whereas the Swansea school with the highest number of free school meals in Wales, at just 62 per cent—which is high, but nowhere near as high as 83 per cent—achieved just 14 per cent of pupils with five A to C passes at GSCE? Why was it reported that Rhyl High School received nothing from the Minister's £16 million RAISE grant, which is meant to be targeted at underachievement but which was distributed solely on the basis of free school meals, despite being the eighth worst-performing school in Wales?

I warmly welcomed recommendation 5, which calls for a review of the local government distribution formula so that the education element was based on the current and future costs of education, rather than on historic costs. In the Minister's response, she states that a review has already been put in place, but that it will merely assess whether historic cost continues to be an appropriate proxy for relative need. That is good plain English and Welsh. Why does it seem that the Minister was not listening?

I welcomed recommendation 13 calling on the Assembly Government to publish meaningful comparisons on education spending in Wales, the other nations and regions in the UK and internationally. However, why does the Minister continue only to publish existing comparisons with England—comparisons that failed to highlight the funding gap identified by headteachers—and to investigate the possibility of further comparisons, which she has already dismissed in her response as

argymhellodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, dylid adolygu ai prydau ysgol am ddim yw'r dangosydd amddifadedd gorau. Dywed y Gweinidog ei bod yn derbyn hyn, ond ychwanega mai hawl i gael prydau ysgol am ddim yw'r unig fesur, ar hyn o bryd, a all ganfod disgyblion o ran lle y cânt eu haddysg, yn hytrach na ble y maent yn byw. Os yw hyn yn wir, fel y dywedais ar 12 Gorffennaf, pam yr oedd yr ysgol yn Llundain â'r nifer uchaf o brydau ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru a Lloegr, sef 83 y cant, wedi llwyddo i gael 59 y cant o'r disgyblion i basio pum TGAU gyda graddau A i C, tra bod yr ysgol yn Abertawe â'r nifer uchaf o brydau ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru, sef dim ond 63 y cant—sydd yn uchel, ond nid cyfuwch ag 83 y cant o bellffordd—wedi llwyddo i gael dim ond 14 y cant o'i disgyblion i basio pum TGAU gyda graddau A i C? Pam yr adroddwyd nad oedd Ysgol Uwchradd y Rhyl wedi cael dim byd allan o grant Rhagori'r Gweinidog o £16 miliwn, sydd i fod i gael ei dargedu at dangyflawni ond a ddsbarthwyd ar sail prydau ysgol am ddim yn unig, er mai honno oedd yr ysgol â'r perfformiad gwaethaf ond saith yng Nghymru?

Rhoddais groeso cynnes i argymhelliad 5, sydd yn galw am adolygu fformiwlâ dosbarthu llywodraeth leol fel bod yr elfen yn ymwneud ag addysg yn seiliedig ar gostau addysg yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, yn hytrach nag ar gostau hanesyddol. Yn ymateb y Gweinidog, dywed fod adolygiad eisoes wedi'i sefydlu, ond mai dim ond asesu a yw'r gost hanesyddol yn parhau'n fodd priodol i gynrychioli angen cymharol a wna. Mae hynny mewn Saesneg a Chymraeg clir. Pam y mae'n ymddangos nad oedd y Gweinidog yn gwrando?

Croesewais argymhelliad 13 yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyhoeddi cymariaethau ystyrion ar wariant addysg yng Nghymru, y cenhedloedd a'r rhanbarthau eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac yn rhyngwladol. Fodd bynnag, pam y mae'r Gweinidog yn parhau i gyhoeddi dim ond cymariaethau sydd yn bodoli'n barod gyda Lloegr—cymariaethau a fethodd â dangos y bwch ariannu a amlygwyd gan brifathrawon—ac i ymchwilio i bosibilrwydd cymariaethau pellach, y mae hi eisoes wedi'u

likely to be spurious?

Time will not allow me to comment on all the recommendations, but, suffice to say, the Minister's response represents all that we have come to expect from her. Wrexham's schools budget forum stated that its schools were cut to the bone and that its objective was to push for a greater overall share of the resources for schools in Wales. Flintshire's schools budget forum, the biggest loser in the Welsh postcode lottery in school funding, had wholeheartedly endorsed the committee's recommendations and called for a more principled and coherent mechanism for the allocation of school budgets. We await their response, and that of other school budget fora, with interest.

3.40 p.m.

**Jane Davidson:** At least you remain consistent, Mark. Just before I came to the Chamber, I read what you said in July; you are clearly using the same text for your contribution today, with a few additions.

It is also important to remember that you started from the wrong basis when you asked us why we voted against establishing the Committee on School Funding. We voted against establishing a separate committee to look at school funding when no bid had been made to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee to examine school funding in that setting. Although the opposition thinks that it does its job best by setting up new committees when it has existing committees that can already do the job, we, as a Labour group, believe strongly that we should not set up those new committees.

However, we have always been happy to have discussions around school funding. As I have said, I as Minister, and my colleague, Sue Essex, have undertaken several measures, including asking the Wales Audit Office to comment on the current situation as an objective analysis. So, we are always happy to work with the grain of improving

hwfftio yn ei hymateb fel pethau sydd yn debygol o fod yn annilys?

Nid yw amser yn caniatáu imi gyflwyno sylwadau ar yr argymhellion i gyd, ond digon yw dweud bod ymateb y Gweinidog yn cyfleu popeth yr ydym wedi dod i'w ddisgwyl ganddi. Dywedodd fforwm cyllidebau ysgolion Wrecsam fod ei ysgolion wedi'u torri hyd at yr asgwrn ac mai ei nod oedd pwysu am gyfran gyfartalog fwy o'r adnoddau i ysgolion yng Nghymru. Yr oedd fforwm cyllidebau ysgolion sir y Fflint, y collwr mwyaf yn loteri codau post Cymru ar gyfer ariannu ysgolion, wedi ategu argymhellion y pwyllgor yn frwd ac wedi galw am fecanwaith mwy egwyddorol a chydlynol ar gyfer dyrannu cyllidebau ysgolion. Disgwyliwn am eu hymateb, ynghyd ag ymateb fforymau cyllidebau ysgolion eraill, gyda diddordeb.

**Jane Davidson:** O leiaf yr ydych yn parhau'n gyson, Mark. Cyn dod i'r Siambur heddiw, darllenais yr hyn a ddywedasoch ym mis Gorffennaf; mae'n amlwg eich bod yn defnyddio'r un testun ar gyfer eich cyfraniad heddiw, gydag ambell ychwanegiad.

Mae'n bwysig cofio ichi ddechrau o'r sail anghywir pan ofynasoch inni pam y bu inni bleidleisio yn erbyn sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion. Pleidleisiasom yn erbyn sefydlu pwyllgor ar wahân i edrych ar ariannu ysgolion pan nad oedd dim cais wedi'i wneud i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i edrych ar ariannu ysgolion yn y fan honno. Er bod y gwrthbleidiau'n meddwl eu bod yn gwneud eu gwaith orau drwy sefydlu pwyllgorau newydd pan fo ganddynt bwyllgorau'n barod a all wneud y gwaith, yr ydym ni, y grŵp Llafur, yn credu'n gryf na ddylem sefydlu'r pwyllgorau newydd hynny.

Fodd bynnag, yr ydym bob amser wedi bod yn fodlon cynnal trafodaethau ynghylch ariannu ysgolion. Yr wyf fi fel Gweinidog, a'm cyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, wedi ymgymryd â sawl mesur, gan gynnwys gofyn i Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru gyflwyno sylwadau ar y sefyllfa bresennol ar ffurf dadansoddiad gwrthrychol. Felly, yr ydym

the stability and security of schools and their funding in Wales.

We have changed regulations in terms of the pupil share of school funding to reduce the element allocated to pupil funding, to give schools greater latitude. That was supported in the Assembly and by schools and local authorities.

The Wales Audit Office, for example, told us that it wanted us to examine the issue around free school meals. When questioned in committee, its officials said that they had no alternative proposition to put to us in terms of how we looked at issues around deprivation. The Welsh index of multiple deprivation is a fantastic tool, but free school meals, as you said in your contribution, focuses on where children are educated—in which building and in which school—rather than on where they live. Therefore, it is an attractive indicator in terms of looking at individual pupil attainment. The Assembly, the opposition or otherwise, has never objected to this use of free school meals—it has been published every year in terms of attainment in Wales—before this year, when we sought to put additional funding in.

The RAISE money is focused on issues around disadvantage and attainment. We also need to look at schools that are not performing, perhaps, to their attainment level. The inspection process enables us to do that, as does the partnership between local government and schools. All of us would want to see the standards of all schools raised in Wales.

Where we look forward, in terms of current and future positions and meaningful comparisons with other countries, I have been very happy to bring comparisons to the committee on which you no longer sit. However, the statisticians are saying that it is difficult to provide the analysis in a robust way. You, as a Member, as well as I as a Minister, need to listen to that, because unless they are robust, they are not good, valid statistical comparisons. That is why we have voluntarily entered into the

bob amser yn fodlon cydweithio dros wella sefydlogrwydd a diogelwch ysgolion a'r modd y cânt eu hariannu yng Nghymru.

Yr ydym wedi newid rheoliadau ynglŷn â chyfran y disgyblion o gyllid ysgolion i leihau'r elfen a ddyrennir i ariannu disgyblion, i roi mwy o ryddid i ysgolion. Cefnogwyd hynny yn y Cynulliad a chan ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol.

Dywedodd Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wrthym, er enghraifft, yr hoffai inni archwilio'r cwestiwn ynghylch prydau ysgol am ddim. O'u holi yn y pwyllgor, dywedodd ei swyddogion nad oedd ganddynt ddim cynnig amgen i'w gyflwyno inni o ran sut yr edrychem ar faterion yn ymwneud ag amddifadedd. Mae mynegai amddifadedd lluosog Cymru'n arf gwych, ond mae prydau ysgol am ddim, fel y dywedasoeh yn eich cyfraniad, yn canolbwyntio ar ble y caiff plant eu haddysgu—ym mha adeilad ac ym mha ysgol—yn hytrach nag ar ble y maent yn byw. Felly, mae'n ddangosydd deniadol o ran edrych ar gyrhaeddiad disgyblion unigol. Nid yw'r Cynulliad, yn wrthbleidiau nac fel arall, erioed wedi gwrthwynebu defnyddio prydau ysgol am ddim fel hyn—fe'i cyhoeddwyd bob blwyddyn ynglŷn â chyrhaeddiad yng Nghymru—cyn eleni, pan geisiasom roi arian ychwanegol.

Mae'r arian Rhagori'n canolbwyntio ar faterion ynghylch anfantais a chyrhaeddiad. Mae angen edrych hefyd ar ysgolion nad ydynt yn perfformio, efallai, hyd at eu lefel cyrhaeddiad. Mae'r broses arolygu'n ein galluogi i wneud hynny, fel y gwna'r bartneriaeth rhwng llywodraeth leol ac ysgolion. Byddai pawb ohonom yn awyddus i weld codi safonau pob ysgol yng Nghymru.

Lle'r edrychwn ymlaen, o ran sefyllfaoedd cyfredol a'r dyfodol a chymariaethau ystyrion â gwledydd eraill, yr wyf wedi bod yn fodlon iawn dod â chymariaethau i'r pwyllgor lle nad ydych yn aelod mwyach. Fodd bynnag, dywed yr ystadegwyr ei bod yn anodd darparu'r dadansoddiad mewn ffordd gadarn. Mae angen i chi, fel Aelod, yn ogystal â mi, fel Gweinidog, wrando ar hynny, oherwydd os nad ydynt yn gadarn, nid ydynt yn gymariaethau ystadegol dilys, da. Dyna pam yr ydym o'n gwirfodd wedi

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's programme for international student assessment studies, for example, so that we can benchmark Wales against the rest of the world.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I welcome this statement. The co-operation and evidence of the Minister and the wider education community throughout the review of school funding has culminated in our final report, published before the summer recess. As a former teacher, most importantly I welcome the Minister's broad acceptance of the core recommendations and the work already undertaken to meet these targets. This is a huge step forward, especially in certain areas of north Wales, such as Wrexham and Flintshire.

Given that the committee's recommendations cut across different ministerial portfolios and Government levels and that they require different strategies to implement them, will you ensure that the Assembly is kept up to date with progress on implementing the recommendations collectively?

**Jane Davidson:** You can see that my colleague, Sue Essex, the Finance Minister, is in the Chamber today and I am sure that her officials and mine will look at today's Record of Proceedings in terms of taking the recommendations forward. It is also important to say that, under the Assembly's rules, we will report to committee within the two-month cycle, after today, on how work is being taken forward. The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee, which, in our view, is always the right forum for this discussion, will be the body to look at the detailed recommendations in the report and my future reports as Minister in my normal ministerial role.

**Owen John Thomas:** Er eich bod wedi derbyn llawer o argymhellion adroddiad y pwyllgor, mae eich cefnogaeth i rai ohonynt naill ai'n absennol neu'n wan iawn. Mae'n amlwg bod tipyn o waith i'w wneud o hyd—gan Lywodraeth arall mae'n siŵr. Serch hynny, ar y cyfan, a ydych yn falch eich bod wedi cael eich gorfodi gan Plaid Cymru a'r gwrthbleidiau eraill i ffurfio pwyllgor trawsbleidiol i baratoi adroddiad ar gyllido

ymuno â rhaglen y Sefydliad ar gyfer Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd i astudio asesiadau myfyrwyr yn rhyngwladol, er enghraifft, fel y gallwn feincodi Cymru yn erbyn gweddill y byd.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Croesawaf y datganiad hwn. Mae cydweithrediad a thystiolaeth y Gweinidog a'r gymuned addysg ehangach drwy gydol yr adolygiad o sefyllfa ariannu ysgolion wedi esgor ar ein hadroddiad terfynol, a gyhoeddwyd cyn gwyliau'r haf. Fel cyn-athrawes, yn bwysicaf oll croesawaf y ffaith bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn, at ei gilydd, yr argymhellion craidd a'r gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes i gyrraedd y targedau hyn. Mae hyn yn gam enfawr ymlaen, yn enwedig mewn rhai rhannau o'r gogledd, fel Wrecsam a sir y Fflint.

Gan fod argymhellion y pwyllgor yn torri ar draws gwahanol bortffolios gweinidogol a lefelau Llywodraeth a bod angen gwahanol strategaethau i'w gweithredu, a wnewch sicrhau y caiff y Cynulliad y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd o ran gweithredu'r argymhellion fel cyfanwaith?

**Jane Davidson:** Gallwch weld bod fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, y Gweinidog Cyllid, yn y Siambr heddiw ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd ein swyddogion ni'n dau yn edrych ar Gofnod y Trafodion heddiw o ran gweithredu'r argymhellion. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud, o dan reolau'r Cynulliad, y byddwn, ar ôl heddiw, yn adrodd i'r pwyllgor o fewn y cylch deufis ar sut y mae'r gwaith yn dod yn ei flaen. Y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau sef, yn ein barn ni, y fforwm cywir bob amser ar gyfer y drafodaeth hon, yw'r corff a fydd yn edrych ar yr argymhellion manwl yn yr adroddiad ac ar fy adroddiadau i yn y dyfodol fel Gweinidog yn fy rôl weinidogol arferol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Although you have accepted many of the recommendations in the committee's report, your support for some of them is either entirely lacking or very weak. It is evident that there is still quite a bit of work to be done—by another Government, I am sure. Despite that, on the whole, are you pleased that you have been forced by Plaid Cymru and the other opposition parties to establish a cross-party committee to prepare a

ysgolion?

**Jane Davidson:** Nac ydwyf. Yr oeddwn yn glir iawn ynghylch hyn. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl mai swyddogaeth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ydoedd. Felly, yr oedd yn syndod i mi weld argymhelliad i sefydlu pwyllgor arall pan nad oedd y pwyllgor addysg wedi trafod y pwnc o gwbl.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome your statement today. I have one point on the IBA, the definition and whether it will be left to local authorities to discuss this and to report to the Flintshire forum, particularly in Alyn and Deeside. I am concerned about the outcome of this for the children and, although funding from this Assembly goes to the local authority, I am concerned that it does not transfer into books and educating the children in our schools. I am sure that you are aware that Sandy Mewies and I have made many such representations before this committee was set up. Indeed, Mark Isherwood speaks with warm words about this committee, but he has received many invitations from Flintshire local authority and he is yet to meet the leader to discuss any issues regarding funding in Flintshire, particularly those relating to schools, which I find quite ironic.

**Jane Davidson:** The outcome of the school funding committee report is important. We believe that it could have been achieved through the all-party group of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee, but others believed that it was better to have a separate committee. However, importantly, the same recommendations would have arisen, in a sense, in both settings, so, as an outcome, this is very important.

This issue around IBA as a local target will have to be considered very seriously by local government, and by some areas more than others. We are pleased that some local authorities have set their budgets above IBA, and the number of recommendations in the report that we rejected is tiny. One of those, for example, asked the Assembly Government to report on when the budgets were allocated in local authorities. That is already required in legislation, so we do not

report on school funding?

**Jane Davidson:** No. I was very clear about this. I thought that it was the responsibility of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee. Therefore, I was surprised to see the proposal to establish another committee when the education committee had not discussed the matter at all.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf yn croesawu eich datganiad heddiw. Mae gennyf un pwynt i'w wneud ynghylch yr asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion, sef y diffiniad ac ai'r awdurdodau lleol fydd yn trafod y mater hwn ac yn adrodd i fforwm sir y Fflint, yn enwedig yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy. Yr wyf yn poeni ynghylch ei ganlyniad i'r plant ac, er bod cyllid gan y Cynulliad hwn yn mynd i'r awdurdod lleol, yr wyf yn bryderus nad yw'n cael ei drosi'n llyfrau ac yn addysg i'r plant yn ein hysgolion. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod Sandy Mewies a minnau wedi cyflwyno llawer o sylwadau o'r fath cyn sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn. Yn wir, mae Mark Isherwood yn siarad yn frwd iawn am y pwyllgor hwn, ond mae wedi cael sawl gwahoddiad gan awdurdod lleol sir y Fflint ac nid yw eto wedi cyfarfod â'r arweinydd i drafod unrhyw broblemau ynghylch cyllid yn sir y Fflint, yn enwedig rhai'n ymwneud ag ysgolion, sy'n eithaf eironig yn fy marn i.

**Jane Davidson:** Mae canlyniad yr adroddiad gan y pwyllgor ar gyllido ysgolion yn bwysig. Credwn y gellid bod wedi ei gyflawni drwy grŵp hollbleidiol y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, ond teimlai eraill ei bod yn well cael pwyllgor ar wahân. Er hynny, a hyn sy'n bwysig, byddai'r un argymhellion wedi codi, mewn ffordd, yn y ddau le, felly, fel canlyniad, mae hyn yn bwysig iawn.

Bydd yn rhaid i lywodraeth leol ystyried y mater hwn, sef yr asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion fel targed lleol, yn bur ofalus, a rhai ardaloedd yn fwy na'i gilydd. Yr ydym yn falch y bydd cyllidebau rhai awdurdodau lleol yn uwch na'r asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion, a nifer fach iawn o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a wrthodwyd gennym. Yr oedd un o'r rheini, er enghraifft, yn gofyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad adrodd ynghylch pa bryd yr oedd y cyllidebau'n cael

need that other element. However, local authorities need to be clear with their school budget fora and their local electorate regarding why they make their funding decisions. That transparency will help people to understand more about the levels of funding needed to ensure that we drive our education system forward. The levels that the Assembly Government has provided are unprecedented.

**Peter Black:** The history of setting up this committee is that the opposition followed the example set by the Labour Party when it set up a committee to consider smoking in public places, despite the fact that that could also have been done by the health committee. That is not relevant to the issues before us, and I am sorry that we have had to spend time going over that.

3.50 p.m.

This report—and the reason for it—is about transparency and accountability. Those words have been mentioned a number of times here. There are a number of recommendations that the Minister has not accepted in full, or on which she has passed the buck—there is one such instance in particular of where we do not yet seem to be able to achieve that transparency and accountability. The example that I am thinking about in particular is the way that we, as an Assembly, are able to effectively scrutinise the budgets allocated to local authorities for education. The Minister will be aware that the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee has asked in two subsequent budget rounds whether we can ask questions to the Finance Minister on that element of the education budget that goes directly to schools via local authorities. We have not yet had that opportunity. In her written response to this report, the Minister says that it is not a matter for the Government, but a matter for the Standing Orders of the Assembly. I do not accept that. If the Minister wishes to come to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee, I am more than happy to accommodate her, and we could all then ask

eu dyrannu mewn awdurdodau lleol. Mae hynny eisoes yn ofynnol yn ôl y gyfraith, felly nid oes angen yr elfen arall honno arnom. Fodd bynnag, mae angen i awdurdodau lleol ei gwneud yn glir i'w fforymau cyllideb ysgolion a'u hetholwyr lleol ynghylch pam maent yn gwneud eu penderfyniadau cyllido. Bydd y tryloywder hwnnw'n helpu pobl i ddeall mwy am lefelau'r cyllid sy'n angenrheidiol i sicrhau ein bod yn bwrw ymlaen â'n system addysg. Ni welwyd erioed o'r blaen y lefelau sydd wedi eu darparu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Peter Black:** Yr hyn a ddigwyddodd wrth sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn yw bod y gwrthbleidiau wedi dilyn esiampl y Blaid Lafur pan sefydlodd bwyllgor i ystyried ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, er gwaetha'r ffaith y gallai'r pwyllgor iechyd hefyd fod wedi gwneud hynny. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol i'r materion ger ein bron, ac mae'n flin gennyf ein bod wedi gorfod treulio amser yn trafod hynny.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn—a'r rheswm drosto—yn ymwneud â thryloywder ac atebolrwydd. Soniwyd droeon yn barod am y geiriau hynny. Mae nifer o argymhellion nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi eu derbyn yn llawn, neu lle y mae wedi bwrw'r cyfrifoldeb drostynt i rywun arall—ceir un enghraifft yn enwedig lle nad ydym eto, i bob golwg, yn cyflawni'r tryloywder ac atebolrwydd hwnnw. Yr enghraifft yr wyf yn meddwl amdani'n arbennig yw ein bod ni, fel Cynulliad, yn gallu craffu'n effeithiol ar y cyllidebau sy'n cael eu dyrannu i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer addysg. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau wedi gofyn mewn dwy rownd gyllideb ar ôl ei gilydd a allwn holi'r Gweinidog Cyllid am yr elfen o'r gyllideb addysg sy'n mynd yn syth i ysgolion drwy'r awdurdodau lleol. Ni chawsom y cyfle hwnnw eto. Yn ei hymateb ysgrifenedig i'r adroddiad hwn, dywed y Gweinidog nad mater i'r Llywodraeth ydyw, ond i Reolau Sefydlog y Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny. Os oes ar y Gweinidog eisiau dod i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon iddi ddod, ac yna, gallem i gyd ofyn y cwestiynau y mae



the questions that we would like to ask on that subject. I am sure that the same could happen in terms of the Local Government and Public Services Committee, which is currently addressing this report. I will be going along as the Chair of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee as part of that. Will the Minister reconsider that answer and consider whether she and the Finance Minister could do a joint presentation on these budget issues so that we can have effective scrutiny?

The second issue that I am concerned about, which also relates to the Minister's response, is around capital spending for schools. There does not seem to be an acknowledgement on the Minister's part of what is accepted by virtually everyone else in Wales, namely that this target of getting all schools fit for purpose by 2010 will not be achieved. No-one is saying that you can conjure up the amount of money needed to do that overnight, but we think that there should be some acknowledgement of that and that that target should be revisited so that we can consider what can be achieved and what is a realistic timetable to get those schools fit for purpose. I hope that the Minister will acknowledge that and deal with that as part of her response.

I would like to raise two more issues. The first is on three-year budgets for schools. The Minister, in her response, says that this will come in as part of the three-year budgeting for local authorities in 2008-09. A lot of work is still going on in that regard, but it seems that the Government is making heavy weather of this. Scotland managed three-year budgeting for schools in 2002; England will follow this year. It may be more complex in Wales, but I would like to see more details coming back to the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee on exactly what progress is being made towards this so that we can have a more detailed timetable and a better understanding of the issues that the Government is facing on this aspect. Can the Minister give an undertaking on that?

Finally, I would like to move on to the issue that has exercised all of our minds, namely

arnom eisiau eu gofyn am y pwnc. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gellid trefnu'r un peth gyda'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, sy'n rhoi sylw i'r adroddiad hwn ar hyn o bryd. Byddaf yn mynychu'r Pwyllgor fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau fel rhan o hynny. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ailystyried yr ateb hwnnw ac ystyried a allai hi a'r Gweinidog Cyllid wneud cydgyflwyniad ar y materion cyllideb hyn fel y gallwn graffu'n effeithiol arnynt?

Yr ail fater yr wyf yn bryderus yn ei gylch, ac sydd hefyd yn ymwneud ag ymateb y Gweinidog, yw gwariant cyfalaf i ysgolion. Nid yw'r Gweinidog fel pe bai'n cydnabod yr hyn sy'n cael ei dderbyn gan bron pawb arall yng Nghymru, sef na fydd y targed o gael pob ysgol yn addas i'w diben erbyn 2010 yn cael ei gyrraedd. Nid oes neb yn dweud y gallwch ddod o hyd i'r arian i wneud hynny dros nos, ond teimlwn y dylid cydnabod hynny i raddau ac ailystyried y targed er mwyn gweld beth sy'n bosibl ei gyflawni a beth sy'n amserlen realistig ar gyfer sicrhau bod yr ysgolion hynny'n addas i'w diben. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod hynny ac yn delio â'r mater yn ei hymateb.

Hoffwn godi dau fater arall. Y cyntaf yw'r cyllidebau tair blynedd i ysgolion. Mae'r Gweinidog, yn ei hymateb, yn dweud y bydd hyn yn cael ei gyflwyno fel rhan o'r cyllidebau tair blynedd i awdurdodau lleol yn 2008-09. Mae llawer iawn o waith yn dal i gael ei wneud yn y cyswllt hwnnw, ond ymddengys fod y Llywodraeth yn gwneud môr a mynydd o'r mater. Llwyddodd yr Alban i gyflwyno cyllidebau tair blynedd ar gyfer ysgolion yn 2002; bydd Lloegr yn dilyn eleni. Efallai ei fod yn fwy cymhleth yng Nghymru, ond hoffwn weld mwy o fanylion yn cael eu rhoi i'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ynghylch pa gynnydd yn union sy'n cael ei wneud yn y cyswllt hwn fel y gallwn gael amserlen fwy manwl a dealltwriaeth well o'r problemau y mae'r Llywodraeth yn eu hwynebu. A wnaiff y Gweinidog addo gwneud hynny?

Yn olaf, hoffwn symud ymlaen at y mater sy'n achosi cryn benbleth inni i gyd, sef sut y

how schools should be funded and whether funding should be based on the cost of running them or on past spending patterns. The Minister said earlier that the IBA acts as the minimum spending requirement. The evidence that came to the committee, from the Wales Audit Office, among others, was that it is an indicator of historic spending patterns. We believe that history should be taught in schools, and not used as the basis for funding them. Therefore, can the Minister give us a better indication of what sort of work is involved in trying to achieve funding on the basis of actual costs and a more definite timetable as to how that can be achieved? I am afraid that, otherwise, as has been said by other speakers, that proposal will disappear into the ether and will never be seen again. That is something that I would very much regret.

**Jane Davidson:** First, I maintain my original position, which is my party's position, that this could have been done in our own committee. I do not think that that revisits any other part of the debate. The only reason why this party voted against the establishment of the committee in the first place was not related to not looking at school funding issues, but to the feeling that it was more appropriate to do this in our own committee setting. Therefore, it cannot be compared with the debate on the Committee on Smoking in Public Places, when there was agreement from all parties about the way forward. We are always happy to work on the basis of all-party agreement.

In terms of the issues about what arrangements are made for scrutinising the local government finance budget, among others, they are matters for the Assembly to consider. In terms of capital spending, there are issues around the investment that we put in as Government, and our investment has never been higher. In my response, I say that we will continue to consider whether levels of funding need to be increased to make all schools fit for purpose in future Assembly budget planning rounds, because it remains an absolute commitment for this Government. We have exceeded our manifesto commitment on school capital spend at any rate. The key issue now is whether or not we take a harder line in terms

dylid cyllido ysgolion ac a ddylai'r cyllid fod yn seiliedig ar gost eu rhedeg neu ar batrymau gwariant blaenorol. Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gynharach fod yr asesiad sy'n seiliedig ar ddangosyddion yn gweithredu fel yr lleiafswm o ran y gwariant sy'n ofynnol. Yn ôl y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor, gan Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, ymhlith eraill, mae'n dangos patrymau gwario hanesyddol. Credwn mai dysgu hanes a ddylid yn ein hysgolion, nid ei ddefnyddio'n sail ar gyfer eu cyllido. Felly, a wnaiff y Gweinidog roi syniad gwell inni o'r hyn sydd angen ei wneud wrth geisio sicrhau cyllid ar sail costau gwirioneddol ac amserlen fwy pendant ynghylch sut i wneud hynny? Neu, mae arnaf ofn, fel y dywedodd siaradwyr eraill, bydd y cynnig hwnnw'n mynd i'r gwellt ac yn diflannu am byth. Byddai'n drueni mawr pe bai hynny'n digwydd.

**Jane Davidson:** Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn dal at fy safiad gwreiddiol, sef safiad fy mhlaid, y gellid bod wedi gwneud hyn yn ein pwyllgor ein hunain. Ni theimlaf fod hynny'n aildrafod dim un rhan arall o'r ddadl. Nid oedd a wnelo'r unig reswm y pleidleisiodd y blaid hon yn erbyn sefydlu'r pwyllgor yn y lle cyntaf ddim â pheidio ag edrych ar faterion cyllido ysgolion, ond â theimlo ei bod yn fwy priodol gwneud hyn yn ein pwyllgor ein hunain. Felly, ni ellir ei gymharu â'r drafodaeth am y Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus, pan oedd y pleidiau i gyd yn gytûn ar y ffordd ymlaen. Yr ydym bob amser yn fodlon gweithio ar sail cytundeb rhwng pob plaid.

O ran y materion ynghylch pa drefniadau a wneir i graffu ar gyllideb cyllid llywodraeth leol, ymhlith pethau eraill, materion i'r Cynulliad eu hystyried ydynt. O ran gwariant cyfalaf, codir cwestiynau yng nghyswllt y buddsoddiad yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth yn ei wneud, ac ni fu erioed yn uwch. Yn fy ymateb, dywedaf y byddwn yn parhau i ystyried a oes angen cynyddu'r lefelau cyllid i wneud pob ysgol yn addas i'w diben yn rowndiau cynllunio cyllideb y Cynulliad yn y dyfodol, oherwydd y mae'n parhau'n ymrwymiad pendant gan y Llywodraeth hon. Yr ydym wedi rhagori ar ein hymrwymiad maniffoesto o ran gwario ar gyfalaf ysgolion beth bynnag. Y mater allweddol yn awr yw a ddylem fabwysiadu safiad mwy di-

of non-hypothecated general capital spending, where we expect elements of it to be allocated to schools. I have already alerted local authorities to higher expectations in terms of this commitment. However, it has to be a partnership in terms of delivery.

As I have reported to committee before, we cannot introduce three-year budgets in education until we have the overarching three-year budgets in terms of local government spend. I was delighted to report to Plenary in July that, as a result of a decision the previous day—it was hot news off the press at the time—that we would be able to have three-year budgets for local government from 2008, the education budget would be part of that process. That is something that people should welcome.

I did not say that the IBA was a minimum spending requirement. I made it clear that, in the interim between using the current system and looking to the outcome of the review of future targets based on need rather than on historic assessment, we would use the IBA as a local target in that regard. I know that many Members have welcomed that.

**William Graham:** As Chair of this committee, I wish to say that committee members worked harmoniously together and were able to focus on the real issues of concern and address them across party political boundaries. We reached unanimous agreement on the recommendations that we made to the Minister.

Three issues particularly dominated our discussions: comparisons with England, the alleged postcode lottery, and the funding fog. We highlighted real differences between school funding in different parts of Wales, and we came to the conclusion that part of the reason for this was a historically based funding formula that pays insufficient attention to the needs of schools now and for the future. We had a wealth of evidence, which was exceptionally well-presented.

gyfaddawd ar wariant cyfalaf cyffredinol sydd heb ei glustnodi, lle'r ydym yn disgwyl i elfennau ohono gael ei ddyrannu i ysgolion. Yr wyf eisoes wedi rhoi gwybod i'r awdurdodau lleol y byddwn yn disgwyl mwy ganddynt o ran yr ymrwymiad hwn. Fodd bynnag, o ran darparu, rhaid iddo fod yn bartneriaeth.

Fel y dywedais wrth y pwyllgor o'r blaen, ni allwn gyflwyno cyllidebau addysg tair blynedd hyd nes y bydd gennym gyllidebau tair blynedd cyffredinol ar gyfer gwariant llywodraeth leol. Yr oeddwn yn hynod falch o adrodd i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Gorffennaf, o ganlyniad i benderfyniad y diwrnod cynt—yr oedd yn wybodaeth newydd sbon ar y pryd—y byddem yn gallu cael cyllidebau tair blynedd i lywodraeth leol o 2008 ymlaen ac y byddai'r gyllideb addysg yn rhan o'r broses honno. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth y dylai pobl ei groesawu.

Ni ddywedais fod yr asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion yn lleiafswm o ran y gwariant sy'n ofynnol. Dywedais yn glir y byddem, yn y cyfamser rhwng defnyddio'r system bresennol ac edrych ar ganlyniad adolygu'r drefn bod targedau i'r dyfodol yn seiliedig ar angen yn hytrach nag ar asesiadau hanesyddol, yn defnyddio'r asesiad wedi'i seilio ar ddangosyddion fel targed lleol yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Gwn fod llawer o Aelodau wedi croesawu hynny.

**William Graham:** Fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor hwn, hoffwn ddweud bod aelodau o'r pwyllgor wedi cydweithio'n dda ac wedi gallu canolbwyntio ar y materion a oedd yn wirioneddol bwysig a rhoi sylw iddynt ar draws ffiniau pleidiau gwleidyddol. Cytunwyd yn unfrydol ynghylch yr argymhellion a wnaethom i'r Gweinidog.

Yr oedd tri pheth yn arbennig yn nodweddu ein trafodaethau: y gymhariaeth â Lloegr, y loteri codau post honedig, a'r dryswch o ran ariannu. Tynasom sylw at wahaniaethau gwirioneddol rhwng cyllid ysgolion mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru, a chasglu mai'r rheswm yn rhannol dros hynny oedd fformiwla gyllido sy'n seiliedig ar batrymau hanesyddol ac nad yw'n rhoi digon o sylw i anghenion ysgolion—anghenion presennol ac i'r dyfodol. Cawsom doreth o dystiolaeth, a

gyflwynwyd yn eithriadol dda.

The Minister has acknowledged the continuing review of the criteria to determine local government funding. We acknowledge the slow progress in these considerations. However, we recognise that the Minister should confirm a commitment to making these changes, and that the measure should be employed to ensure that they accurately reflect the needs of schools in Wales. As other Members have suggested, there is a sense of anticipation within the teaching profession in Wales, which needs to be realised.

I ask the Minister to recognise the cross-party nature of, and the unanimous support for, all the recommendations and to review her rejection of recommendation 22. We believe that this proposal will lead to a better understanding of our schools' basic funding needs.

I note from the Minister's written statement that education indicator-based assessments for each local authority will be used as the local target for education spend. During our evidence gathering, all local education authorities preferred that no funding targets be set. Will the Minister clarify her considerations for now setting such a funding target for local education authorities?

The committee spent a considerable amount of time looking at this issue in detail, and it had the benefit of evidence from the Government's own statisticians. Despite this, we were still left with the perception of a complicated and unresponsive system, within which accountability was scattered and unclear. However difficult it was for us to understand, it must be doubly so for teachers, governors and parents, who do not have the time that we have or our resources to clarify the system.

Finally, I thank committee members for the time that they gave and the interest that they took, and I also thank our excellent staff.

**Jane Davidson:** I thank everyone who has contributed to this debate. The contributions have been measured and considered, and they

Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cydnabod yr adolygiad parhaus o'r meini prawf i bennu cyllid llywodraeth leol. Yr ydym yn cydnabod y cynnydd araf deg gyda'r ystyriaethau hyn. Er hynny, yr ydym yn cydnabod y dylai'r Gweinidog gadarnhau ymrwymiad i wneud y newidiadau hyn, ac y dylid defnyddio'r mesur i sicrhau eu bod yn adlewyrchu anghenion ysgolion yng Nghymru yn gywir. Fel yr awgrymodd Aelodau eraill, mae ymdeimlad disgwylgar yn y proffesiwn dysgu yng Nghymru, sydd angen ei ateb.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gydnabod natur drawsbleidiol yr holl argymhellion, a'r gefnogaeth unfrydol iddynt, ac ailystyried ei phenderfyniad i wrthod argymhelliad 22. Teimlwn y bydd y cynnig hwn yn arwain at ddealltwriaeth well o anghenion cyllido sylfaenol ein hysgolion.

Sylwaf oddi wrth ddatganiad ysgrifenedig y Gweinidog y bydd asesiadau wedi'u seilio ar ddangosyddion i bob awdurdod lleol yn cael eu defnyddio'n darged lleol ar gyfer gwariant ar addysg. Wrth gasglu ein tystiolaeth, yr oedd yn well gan bob awdurdod addysg lleol beidio â gweld targedau cyllido'n cael eu gosod. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro ei rhesymau dros osod y targed cyllido hwn ar gyfer awdurdodau addysg lleol?

Treuliodd y pwyllgor gryn amser yn edrych ar y mater hwn yn fanwl, a manteisiodd hefyd ar dystiolaeth gan ystadegwyr y Llywodraeth ei hun. Er hynny, yr oedd y system yn parhau'n un gymhleth nad oedd yn ymateb, yn ein golwg ni, lle'r oedd atebolrwydd yn aneglur ac ar wasgar. Pa mor anodd bynnag ydoedd i ni ei deall, rhaid bod hynny'n waeth fyth i athrawon, llywodraethwyr a rhieni, sydd heb na'r amser na'r adnoddau sydd gennym ni i geisio deall y system.

Yn olaf, diolchaf i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu hamser ac am y diddordeb a ddangoswyd ganddynt, a diolchaf hefyd i'n staff rhagorol.

**Jane Davidson:** Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Mae'r cyfraniadau wedi bod yn bwylllog a meddylgar, a rhoesant

have placed the evidence in front of us to consider.

I fully accept how complicated these issues are. As a Government, we are committed to making it a great deal more responsive than it has been in the past. That is why my colleague, Sue Essex, has given her personal commitment to make the review of the overarching formula more responsive.

4.00 p.m.

Recommendation 22 asks us to dampen year-to-year changes in funding arising from variation in pupil numbers. The Schools Budget Shares (Wales) Regulations 2004 enable authorities to do that from year to year, and they have discretionary factors mitigating the changes from variations in pupil numbers. Therefore, that is already in the current system and that was voted on by the Assembly three years ago. We do not feel that there is any necessity for greater discretion in this context. I went back through the evidence report, but we have not had any evidence to suggest that it would be either appropriate or helpful to limit that discretion. At the moment, that is the only fundamental recommendation that is not about process on which we have said that, in the absence of evidence, we will reject it.

The Assembly can always look at remaking regulations. In future years, were such evidence to arise, it is open to us to see whether we want to make changes to the schools budget shares regulations.

I was happy to make staff from my department available to help you and your committee to carry out this function. I think that we are all, in a sense, more enlightened from the evidence base. However, given that the issue is so complicated, I hope that we all understand that we do not want to see perverse outcomes of changing any aspect of the system, which might have a negative effect on another. That is why we need appropriate lead-in times for changes, and proper reviews to take these considerations into account.

y dystiolaeth ger ein bron inni ei hystyried.

Yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr pa mor gymhleth yw'r materion hyn. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau ei fod yn llawer mwy ymatebol nag y mae wedi bod yn y gorffennol. Dyna pam mae fy nghyd-Weinidog, Sue Essex, wedi gwneud ymrwymiad personol i wneud yr adolygiad ar y fformiwla gyffredinol yn fwy ymatebol.

Mae argymhelliad 22 yn gofyn inni leddfu newidiadau o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall yn y cyllid oherwydd amrywiadau yn nifer y disgyblion. Mae Rheoliadau Cyfrannau Cyllideb Ysgolion (Cymru) 2004 yn galluogi awdurdodau i wneud hynny o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall, ac mae iddynt ffactorau dewisol sy'n lliniaru'r newidiadau sy'n codi yn sgîl yr amrywio yn niferoedd y disgyblion. Felly, mae hynny eisoes yn y system gyfredol a bu i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar hynny dair blynedd yn ôl. Nid ydym o'r farn bod angen rhagor o ddisgresiwn yn hyn o beth. Bûm yn bwrw golwg dros yr adroddiad am y dystiolaeth, ond ni chawsom ddim tystiolaeth a awgrymai y byddai'n briodol nac yn fuddiol cyfyngu'r disgresiwn hwnnw. Ar hyn o bryd, dyna'r unig argymhelliad sylfaenol nad yw'n ymwneud â phroses yr ydym wedi dweud yn ei gylch, onid oes tystiolaeth, y byddwn yn ei wrthod.

Mae modd wastad i'r Cynulliad ail-lunio rheoliadau. Yn y dyfodol, petai tystiolaeth o'r fath yn codi, gallem ystyried a fyddem am wneud newidiadau i'r rheoliadau cyfrannau cyllideb ysgolion.

Yr oeddwn yn falch o gynnig staff o'm hadran i'ch helpu chi a'ch pwyllgor i gyflawni'r swyddogaeth hon. Credaf ein bod oll, ar ryw ystyr, yn fwy goleuedig oherwydd y sylfaen dystiolaeth. Fodd bynnag, gan fod y mater mor gymhleth, gobeithiaf fod pawb yn deall nad ydym am weld canlyniadau gwrthun wrth newid unrhyw agwedd ar y system, a allai gael effaith negyddol ar agwedd arall. Dyna pam mae angen amser priodol i'r newidiadau ddod i rym, ac adolygiadau addas er mwyn cadw'r ystyriaethau hyn mewn golwg.

## Pwyntiau o Drefn Points of Order

**Mark Isherwood:** Point of order. May I seek your guidance on comments made by my colleague, the local Member for Alyn and Deeside, who stated that I had declined invitations to meet the leader of Flintshire County Council? In fact, I have accepted the invitations, and I have also sent him my very best wishes for a speedy recovery, because, as Carl knows, he is very unwell. I expect that he will confirm our meeting when he recovers. I can further confirm that I have had regular meetings with the director of education at Flintshire County Council, as well as with other directors and executive members of that council. Would he withdraw those comments, please?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Nothing said during the statement was regarded as disorderly. I certainly did not notice anything that was disorderly and no-one drew my attention to anything on this presiding desk. However, I appreciate that you have now had an opportunity to put the record straight, from your point of view. There is always more than one view of any series of events. We have heard at least two today, but it does not fall to me to decide between either of them.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pwynt o drefn. A gaf arweiniad ynghylch sylwadau fy nghyd-Aelod, yr Aelod lleol dros Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, a ddywedodd imi wrthod gwahoddiadau i gwrdd ag arweinydd Cyngor Sir y Fflint? Mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf wedi derbyn y gwahoddiadau, ac yr wyf hefyd wedi anfon dymuniadau gorau ato am wellhad buan, gan ei fod, fel y gŵyr Carl, yn sâl iawn. Yr wyf yn disgwyl y bydd yn cadarnhau inni gyfarfod pan fydd wedi gwella. Gallaf gadarnhau hefyd imi gynnal cyfarfodydd rheolaidd gyda chyfarwyddwr addysg Cyngor Sir y Fflint, ynghyd â chyfarwyddwyr eraill ac aelodau gweithredol y Cyngor hwnnw. A wnaiff dynnu'r sylwadau'n ôl, os gwêl yn dda?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oedd dim yn afreolus yn y datganiad. Yn sicr ni sylwais ar ddim byd afreolus ac ni thynnodd neb fy sylw at ddim byd yma ar ddesg y llywydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sylweddoli i chi gael cyfle i unioni pethau, o'ch safbwynt chi. Mae mwy nag un farn bob amser ar bob cyfres o ddigwyddiadau. Clywsom o leiaf ddwy heddiw, ond nid fy lle i yw penderfynu rhwng y naill na'r llall ohonynt.

**Elin Jones:** Codaf bwynt o drefn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34 ar ddeisebau. Mae gennyf llun yma o'r Gweinidog, Brian Gibbons, yn cael deiseb i arbed gwasanaethau yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg oddi wrth yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol. Tynnwyd y llun yn y Siambr hon, a chredaf eu bod yn sefyll yn y fan hon o'm blaen yn y llun. Tynnwyd y llun yn ystod y cyfnod ymgynghori diweddar ar ysbytai yn y gorllewin. Fodd bynnag, mae'r un Gweinidog, Brian Gibbons, wedi gwrthod deiseb gyffelyb oddi wrth olygydd y *Cambrian News* ar ran Ysbyty Bronglais, gan ddweud y byddai hynny yn cyfaddawdu ei swyddogaeth ddiuedd fel Gweinidog.

Lywydd, a yw'n gywir o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34 fod Gweinidog yn gwahaniaethu fel hyn rhwng dau ysbyty—neu, efallai'n fwy cywir, rhwng dwy etholaeth? Onid yw Gweinidogion yn ddarostyngedig i Reol Sefydlog Rhif 34 ac felly yn gorfod derbyn unrhyw ddeiseb heb ddangos unrhyw ffafriaeth wleidyddol?

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Further to this point of order, I have not had any notice of this, but I am aware of the situation. The editor asked me to receive a petition, but I explained to him that at precisely the time at which he—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'She.'] Sorry—she wanted to present the petition, the relevant local health boards were meeting. Therefore, when I received the petition from Tamsin, I pointed out to the editor that I had sent that petition back to the relevant decision-making authority. At the time at which the petition was being offered, the relevant bodies were making the decision, and so I suggested to the editor that, if she was seriously interested in trying to influence the decision, the most appropriate way to send that petition would be to submit it to the local health board. I also indicated to the editor two other dates available to her if she wanted to present that petition to me.

**Elin Jones:** To an official.

**Brian Gibbons:** No, to me. If I was in a position where I had to make a decision on this subsequently, I offered two dates to the

**Elin Jones:** I raise a point of order under Standing Order No. 34 relating to petitions. I have here a picture of the Minister, Brian Gibbons, receiving a petition from the local Assembly Member to safeguard services at Withybush Hospital. The photograph was taken in this Chamber, and in it I think that they are standing in this spot right in front of me. It was taken during the recent consultation period on hospitals in west Wales. However, the same Minister, Brian Gibbons, has refused a similar petition on behalf of Bronglais Hospital from the editor of the *Cambrian News*, saying that it would compromise his impartial role as Minister.

Presiding Officer, under Standing Order No. 34, is it right that the Minister discriminates like this between two hospitals—or, perhaps more correctly, between two constituencies? Are Ministers not subject to Standing Order No. 34 and therefore must receive any petition without displaying any political favouritism?

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, ni chefais rybudd o hyn o gwbl, ond gwn am y sefyllfa. Gofynnodd y golygydd imi dderbyn deiseb, ond esboniais iddo fy mod yr union adeg yr oedd ef—[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Hi.'] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf—yr oedd hi am gyflwyno'r ddeiseb, yr oedd y byrddau iechyd perthnasol yn cwrdd. Felly, pan gefais y ddeiseb gan Tamsin, dywedais wrth y golygydd imi anfon y ddeiseb honno'n ôl i'r awdurdod perthnasol sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau. Ar yr adeg y cyflwynwyd y ddeiseb, yr oedd y cyrff perthnasol yn gwneud y penderfyniad, ac felly awgrymais wrth y golygydd, petai o ddifrif ynglŷn â dylanwadu ar y penderfyniad, mai'r ffordd fwyaf priodol o anfon y ddeiseb honno fyddai ei chyflwyno gerbron y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Crybwyllais ddau ddyddiad arall wrth y golygydd hefyd petai am gyflwyno'r ddeiseb honno i mi.

**Elin Jones:** I swyddog.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nage, i mi. Petawn yn y fath sefyllfa fel bod yn rhaid imi wneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â hyn wedyn, cynigiais

editor if she wanted to avail herself of them. To the best of my knowledge, she has not, as I have had no further feedback.

**Elin Jones:** Further to that point of order, as the decision has still not been taken by the local health boards—in fact, the decision is likely to be that the local health boards will delay the decision on this matter and will set up a planning forum—in the same way as he gave the courtesy of accepting the petition on Withybush, he should now agree to accept the petition on behalf of Bronglais, forwarding it to the relevant local health board and planning forum that is to take this matter further. If he agrees to that, I would be happy to bring this point of order to an end and finish the matter.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You cannot yet, because I have not spoken. [*Laughter.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** Further to this point of order, as I indicated in my previous reply, I forwarded a copy of the petition that I received from Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey to the relevant local health board. When I suggested that I would be doing exactly the same thing with the petition from this editor, she indicated that it had already been sent to the local health board. Therefore, effectively, she was asking me to deliver a second copy of the same petition to the same local health board, which would serve only to duplicate the situation. It would not be a comparable situation to that of Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey's petition, because that had not previously been presented to the local health board; in this instance, I was informed that the petition had already been presented. It seemed to be rather a fruitless exercise for me to send exactly the same petition back down to the local health board.

**Y Llywydd:** Ble ydym i ddechrau? Mae Elin Jones wedi codi pwynt o drefn ynglŷn â deisebau sy'n cael eu cyflwyno. Gall unrhyw aelod o'r cyhoedd gyflwyno deiseb i unrhyw Weinidog neu unrhyw Aelod Cynulliad ar unrhyw adeg mewn unrhyw fan. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr adeilad hwn yn cael ei ddefnyddio i gyflwyno deisebau ar unrhyw adeg.

Gyda llaw, er eich bod wedi codi'r mater yn

ddau ddyddiad i'r golygydd petai am eu derbyn. Hyd y gwn, ni wnaeth hynny, gan nad wyf wedi clywed dim rhagor.

**Elin Jones:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwnnw, gan nad yw'r byrddau iechyd lleol wedi gwneud y penderfyniad eto—yn wir, mae'n debygol y bydd y byrddau iechyd lleol yn gohirio penderfynu ynghylch y mater hwn gan sefydlu fforwm cynllunio—yn yr un modd ag y bu'n ddigon cwrtais i dderbyn deiseb Llwynhelyg, dylai yn awr gytuno i dderbyn deiseb Bronglais, gan ei hanfon ymlaen at y bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r fforwm cynllunio a fydd yn ymdrin ymhellach â'r mater hwn. Os cytuna i wneud hynny, byddwn yn falch o ddiweddu'r pwynt o drefn hwn a therfynu'r mater.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chewch wneud hynny eto, am nad wyf wedi siarad. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, ys dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol, anfonais gopi o'r ddeiseb a gefais gan Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey at y bwrdd iechyd lleol perthnasol. Pan awgrymais y gwnawn yr un peth yn union gyda deiseb y golygydd hwn, dywedodd ei bod eisoes wedi ei hanfon at yr un bwrdd iechyd lleol. Felly, yn y bôn, yr oedd yn gofyn imi anfon ail gopi o'r un ddeiseb at yr un bwrdd iechyd lleol, ac ni fyddai hynny ond yn dyblygu pethau. Ni fyddai'n sefyllfa gyffelyb i eiddo deiseb Tamsin Dunwoody-Kneafsey, gan nad oedd honno wedi ei chyflwyno gerbron y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn flaenorol; yn hyn o beth, cefais wybod bod y ddeiseb eisoes wedi ei chyflwyno. Ymddangosai'n beth di-fudd braidd i mi anfon yr un ddeiseb yn union yn ôl at y bwrdd iechyd lleol.

**The Presiding Officer:** Where do we begin? Elin Jones has raised a point of order relating to the presentation of petitions. Any member of the public may present a petition to any Minister or any Assembly Member at any time and in any place. I am pleased that this building is used as a place in which to present petitions at any given time.

Incidentally, although you have raised this



Saesneg, Weinidog, yr wyf yn ymateb i hyn yn Gymraeg, sy'n groes i'm harfer. Mae hynny oherwydd bod y nodiadau sydd o'm blaen yn Gymraeg, ac maent yn ddigon cymhleth yn Gymraeg. Ni allaf gyfieithu ar y pryd yn fy henaint erbyn hyn. [*Chwerthin.*]

Felly, o ran ein Rheolau Sefydlog, yn ogystal â'r canllawiau ar y weithdrefn ar gyfer deisebau cyhoeddus, yr unig berson sydd â chyfrifoldeb mewn perthynas â deisebau a dderbynnir gan y Cynulliad yw'r Llywydd, ac mae rheidrwydd ar y Llywydd i dderbyn deisebau. Caiff hynny ei weithredu drwy'r Swyddfa Gyflwyno, gan fod y swyddogaeth wedi ei dirprwyo i'r swyddfa honno.

Yr hyn sy'n digwydd wedyn, yn gryno—a gallwch edrych ar y manylion eto—yw bod y deisebau yn cael eu cofnodi, ac mae prif lofnodydd, neu drefnydd, y ddeiseb yn cael gwybod drwy lythyr fod y ddeiseb wedi ei derbyn. Mae'r ddeiseb wedyn yn cael ei chofrestru ac yn cael ei gosod ar ein gwefan, ac mae'r wybodaeth yn dod i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Ar ben hynny, mae'n rhydd i unrhyw Aelod gyflwyno cynnig i drafod cynnwys y ddeiseb, neu gall unrhyw Gadeirydd pwyllgor, neu unrhyw bwyllgor, drwy ganiatâd y Cadeirydd, drafod y ddeiseb. Ymhellach, drwy weithgaredd clerck y ddeiseb, mae modd i'r deisebau hynny gael eu hanfon ymlaen i'r Gweinidog. Felly, mae pob math o ddulliau lle y gellir derbyn deisebau—nid oes dim i rwystro deiseb rhag cael ei derbyn ar unrhyw adeg os yw wedi'i chyflwyno i'r Cynulliad.

4.10 p.m.

Yn wir, yr wyf wedi bod yn dilyn â diddordeb mawr yr hyn y mae'r pwyllgor sy'n edrych ar ein Rheolau Sefydlog yn ei drafod ynglŷn â deisebau at y dyfodol. Yn yr Alban ac yn y Länder yn Awstria—ac mewn lleoedd eraill, mae'n siŵr, ond yr wyf yn digwydd gwybod am y rheini—mae gweithdrefnau ardderchog lle gellir trafod deisebau yn union ar ôl iddynt gael eu cyflwyno, ac mae pwyllgor yn edrych ar sut y dylid bwrw ymlaen â chynnwys y ddeiseb. Carwn ein gweld yn symud i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw. Gobeithio bod pawb yn hapus, gan gynnwys golygydd y *Cambrian News*, sydd yn ddynes bwysig yn fy mywyd, fel ym

matter in English, Minister, I am responding in Welsh, contrary to my usual practice. That is because the notes before me are written in Welsh, and they are complicated enough in Welsh. I am no longer able to translate simultaneously in my old age. [*Laughter.*]

Therefore, in terms of our Standing Order, as well as the guidance on the procedure to be followed for public petitions, the only person who has responsibility in relation to petitions received by the Assembly is the Presiding Officer, and the Presiding Officer is duty bound to receive petitions. That is performed through the Table Office, as that function has been delegated to that office.

This, briefly, is what happens next—and you can look at the detail again. The petitions are signed, and the chief signatory to it, or the petition organiser, is informed by letter that the petition has been received. The petition is then registered and is placed on our website, and the information given to Assembly Members. On top of that, any Member is free to table a motion to debate the contents of the petition, or any committee Chair, or any committee, with the permission of the Chair, may discuss the petition. Furthermore, by means of the actions of the petition clerk, petitions can also be forwarded to the Minister. Therefore, there are many ways in which we can receive petitions, and there is nothing to prevent a petition from being received at any time, if it has been presented to the Assembly.

Indeed, I have been following with great interest the deliberations of our Committee on Standing Orders concerning petitions for the future. In Scotland and in the Austrian Länder—and in other places, I am sure, but I happen to be aware of the situation in those places—there are excellent procedures in place for petitions to be debated as soon as they have been presented, and a committee considers how to take the contents of the petition forward. I would like to see us moving in that direction. I hope that everyone is happy, including the editor of the *Cambrian News*, who is an important woman in my life, as she is in the lives of many of

mywydau llawer ohonoch.

you.

**Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25**  
**Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 September 2006 on the draft the Horses (Zootechnical Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Medi 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Ceffylau (Safonau Söodechnegol) (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. approves that the Horses (Zootechnical Standards) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Ceffylau (Safonau Söodechnegol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 11 July 2006; and*

*a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Gorffennaf 2006; a*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 July 2006. (NDM3208)*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Gorffennaf 2006. (NDM3208)*

*Cynnig (NDM3208): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3208): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael

Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Cyfarwyddiadau i Ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a Bwrdd Iechyd  
 Lleol Powys 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29  
 Approval of the Directions to NHS Trusts and Powys Local Health Board 2006  
 under Standing Order No. 29**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that **Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):*

*considers the principle of the Directions to NHS Trusts and Powys Local Health Board 2006, a draft of which was laid in Table Office on 12 September 2006. (NDM3209)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor y Cyfarwyddiadau i Ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys 2006, y gosodwyd drafft ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Medi 2006. (NDM3209)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly acting under Standing Order No 29.3(ii) and (iii):*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(ii) a (iii):*

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee in relation to the draft Order the Directions to NHS Trusts and Powys Local Health Board 2006 laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 19 September 2006; and

2. approves the Directions to NHS Trusts and Powys Local Health Board 2006 are made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 12 September 2006. (NDM3210)

This subordinate legislation relates to cleaning, hygiene and infection management in our hospitals and health service in Wales. As you will remember, it was first proposed by Val Lloyd under Standing Order No. 31. If we decide to approve this direction today, it will be an historic moment for the Assembly, as it will be the first occasion on which a proposal made under Standing Order No. 31 has made its way to the statute book. The issue has been considered by the Health and Social Services Committee, and we have incorporated some of the recommendations made by Jenny Randerson. I would urge your full support.

**Val Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for his kind and generous words. When I first introduced my proposal—almost exactly a year ago—under that Standing Order No. 31 procedure, my intention was to initiate a dialogue between the public and healthcare providers on issues of concern to service users and their relatives, such as hospital cleanliness and hospital-acquired infections. That is why I put forward the idea of appointing a trust non-executive director as a patients' champion, who would be a source of information and a point of contact between patients, the public, community health councils and healthcare providers. It is my hope that these measures will not only reflect patient needs, but also act as a catalyst, driving forward the ongoing work of infection control teams and cleanliness teams, while integrating patients and the public into the process. By providing patients, relatives, CHCs and the general public with more clarity about hospital-acquired infections and other material, associated matters, and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, y Cyfarwyddiadau i Ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 19 Medi 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Cyfarwyddiadau i Ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG a Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 12 Medi 2006. (NDM3210)

Mae a wnelo'r is-ddeddfwriaeth hon â rheoli glanhau, glanweithdra a heintiau yn ein hysbytai a'n gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Fe gofiwch iddo gael ei gynnig am y tro cyntaf gan Val Lloyd dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31. Os penderfynwn gymeradwyo'r cyfarwyddyd hwn heddiw, bydd yn foment hanesyddol i'r Cynulliad, gan mai hwn fydd y tro cyntaf i gynnig a wnaethpwyd dan reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 fynd ar y llyfr statudau. Ystyriwyd y mater gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac yr ydym wedi ymgorffori rhai o argymhellion Jenny Randerson. Fe'ch anogaf i roi cefnogaeth llwyr.

**Val Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei eiriau caredig a hael. Y tro cyntaf imi gyflwyno fy nghynnig—bron union flwyddyn yn ôl—dan weithdrefn Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31, bwriadwn roi cychwyn ar ddeialog rhwng y cyhoedd a darparwyr gofal iechyd ynghylch materion sy'n peri pryder i ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaeth a'u perthnasau, megis glendid ysbytai a'r heintiau y gellir eu dal mewn ysbytai. Dyna pam y cynigiais y syniad o benodi cyfarwyddwr ymddiriedolaeth anweithredol yn eiriolydd dros y bobl, a fyddai'n ffynhonnell gwybodaeth ac yn bwynt cyswllt rhwng y cleifion, y cyhoedd, y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a darparwyr gofal iechyd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y mesurau hyn nid yn unig yn adlewyrchu anghenion y cleifion, ond y byddant hefyd yn gatalydd, a fydd yn sbarduno gwaith parhaus y timau rheoli heintiau a'r timau glendid, gan integreiddio'r cleifion a'r cyhoedd yn y broses. Drwy roi mwy o eglurder i'r cleifion, y perthnasau, y cynghorau iechyd cymuned a'r cyhoedd yn gyffredinol ynghylch yr

appointing a local advocate as a source of public information, all parties will be able to play their own effective role in minimising the spread of infection, which, of course, will be of benefit to us all.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Plaid Cymru will support these regulations; as the Minister said, we discussed them in committee. However, I wish to take this opportunity to say that, while we fully support Val Lloyd's proposals, I know that she agrees that this will not be enough in itself. While we still have a situation in which so many cleaning contracts are contracted out for profit, and while it remains so difficult for nursing staff to direct cleaners to tidy things up, all the non-executive directors in the world will not solve the problem. This is an important step, but let us not fool ourselves that it will solve the whole problem.

**Glyn Davies:** We, too, welcome the regulations before us today. Strengthening the patient's voice is something that everyone in this Chamber subscribes to, and I congratulate Val Lloyd on the work that she has done to bring forward the concept of having a patients' champion.

Over recent weeks, I have been involved in a lot of discussion about contracts between our local health board and district general hospitals over the border. As I watched those discussions going on and saw how people were addressing each other, I found that patients' voices have been just about at the bottom of the list in terms of how people are addressing the issue. Anything that strengthens the patient's voice, as I think this will, is something that we must welcome.

I agree with the point that Helen Mary makes, in that, as an Assembly, we will want to assess whether this step is effective and whether it goes far enough. We do not want something that turns out to be a token gesture or just replicates part of what the community health council does: there is a longer-term job for us to do to assess its effectiveness. This particular regulation deals with cleanliness.

heintiau y gellir eu dal mewn ysbytai a materion eraill perthnasol cysylltiedig, a phenodi eiriolydd lleol yn ffynhonnell gwybodaeth gyhoeddus, gall pawb sydd â wnelo â hyn chwarae rhan effeithiol wrth atal ymlediad heintiau, a fydd wrth reswm o fudd i ni oll.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Bydd Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn; ys dywedodd y Gweinidog, trafodwyd y rhain gennym yn y pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle i ddweud, er ein bod yn cefnogi cynigion Val Lloyd yn llwyr, ei bod yn gwybod na fydd hyn yn ddigon ynddo'i hun. Tra bo gennym sefyllfa lle y mae llawer o gontractau glanhau wedi eu contractio allan er mwyn elw, a thra bo'n anodd i'r staff nyrsio gyfarwyddo glanhawyr i dacluso pethau, nid oes modd yn y byd i gyfarwyddwyr anweithredol ddatrys y broblem. Mae hwn yn gam pwysig, ond rhaid inni beidio â'n twyllo ein hunain y bydd yn datrys y broblem i gyd.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydym ninnau hefyd yn croesawu'r rheoliadau sydd o'n blaenau heddiw. Mae cryfhau llais y claf yn rhywbeth y mae pawb yn y Siambr hon o'i blaid, ac yr wyf am longyfarch Val Lloyd am y gwaith y mae wedi'i wneud wrth gyflwyno'r cysyniad bod gan y cleifion eiriolydd.

Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf, bûm mewn trafodaethau lu ynglŷn â chontractau rhwng ein bwrdd iechyd lleol a'r ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth dros y ffin. Wrth wyllo'r trafodaethau hynny a gweld sut yr oedd pobl yn annerch ei gilydd, cefais fod lleisiau'r cleifion fwy neu lai ar waelod y rhestr o ran sut y mae pobl yn trafod y mater. Mae rhywbeth sy'n cryfhau llais y claf, fel y credaf y bydd hyn yn gwneud, yn rhywbeth y dylem ei groesawu.

Cytunaf â phwynt Helen Mary, o ran y byddwn ni, fel Cynulliad, am asesu a yw'r cam hwn yn effeithiol ac a yw'n mynd yn ddigon pell. Nid oes arnom eisiau rhywbeth sy'n datblygu'n rhywbeth symbolaidd neu'n rhywbeth nad yw'n gwneud dim ond dyblygu rhan o'r hyn y mae'r cyngor iechyd cymuned yn ei wneud: mae gwaith tymor hwy inni ei wneud i asesu ei effeithiolrwydd. Mae'r

However, this is part of a general commitment to give patients a voice. Another closely related aspect is openness and the requirement for local health boards and trusts to tell people what is going on.

Another part of the discussions that I have been involved with in relation to these contracts, has been about the most appalling way in which patients in Powys have been kept in the dark—and are still completely in the dark—about where they will be able to access orthopaedic services. At the moment, patients in Powys do not know what is going to happen to the structure of the service. There is a huge amount of secrecy involved. Those of us who live in Powys and have taken an interest know very well that a number of community hospitals will be closed, yet the local health board has not made an announcement—it plans to do that tomorrow. We still have not been told officially what it is going to do.

We need a patient-centred NHS in Wales, which is about openness in relation to the challenges that we face, whether that is cleanliness or the need to restructure secondary care to deal with the problems facing the health service in Wales. We hope that these regulations will deliver on a part of that. However, as an Assembly, we need to make certain that it delivers what we hope it will deliver and possibly expand the role of the patients' champion in the future.

**Jenny Randerson:** I would like to thank Val for putting forward this proposal. It is a matter of great regret that this is the first time that a Standing Order No. 31 proposal has made its way through to legislation. We have a lot of work to do to get better systems for legislation proposed by Members and I look forward to the opportunity of a new start next year.

I thank the Minister for taking on board the amendments that I put forward in committee. The original draft related to a lot of information giving and reporting, but it did not include a duty to promote improvement

rheoliad penodol hwn yn delio â glendid. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn rhan o ymrwymiad cyffredinol i roi llais i gleifion. Agwedd arall debyg iawn yw bod yn agored a'r gofyniad i ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol ddweud wrth bobl beth sy'n digwydd.

Mae rhan arall o'r trafodaethau yr wyf wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â hwy o safbwynt y contractau hyn, wedi ymwneud â'r ffordd echrhydus y mae cleifion ym Mhowys heb gael gwybod beth sy'n digwydd—ac nid ydynt wedi cael gwybod dim byth—o safbwynt ymhle y gallant gael gwasanaethau orthopedig. Ar hyn o bryd, ni wŷr cleifion ym Mhowys beth a fydd yn digwydd i strwythur y gwasanaeth. Mae llawer iawn o gyfrinachedd ynghylch y mater. Mae'r rhai ohonom sy'n byw ym Mhowys ac a gymerodd ddiddordeb yn gwybod yn iawn y bydd nifer o ysbytai cymunedol yn cau, er nad yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi gwneud cyhoeddiad—mae'n bwriadu gwneud hynny yfory. Ni chawsom fyth wybod yn swyddogol beth y mae'n bwriadu ei wneud.

Yr hyn sydd arnom ei angen yw GIG yng Nghymru sy'n canolbwyntio ar y claf, gwasanaeth sy'n agored o safbwynt y sialensiau a wynebwn, boed hynny'n lendid neu'r angen i ailstrwythuro gofal eilaidd i ddelio â'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Gobeithiwn y bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn cyflawni rhan o hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel Cynulliad, rhaid inni sicrhau y bydd yn cyflawni'r hyn y gobeithiwn y bydd yn ei gyflawni ac ehangu rôl yr eiriolwr cleifion i'r dyfodol o bosibl.

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn ddiolch i Val am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn. Mae'n resyn mawr mai hwn yw'r tro cyntaf i gynnig dan Reol Sefydlog 31 gyrraedd y cam deddfwriaethu. Mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud i gael gwell systemau ar gyfer deddfwriaeth a gynigia Aelodau ac edrychaf ymlaen at y cyfle i gael cychwyn newydd y flwyddyn nesaf.

Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am dderbyn y gwelliannau a gyflwynais yn y pwyllgor. Yr oedd y drafft gwreiddiol yn ymwneud â llawer o rododi gwybodaeth ac adrodd, ond ni chynhwysai ddyletswydd i hybu gwelliant ac

and awareness. I talked to Val about this and it was quite clear that she had envisaged that as being encompassed by this. What we have to do, through this legislation, is improve the current situation. This is an issue of public and professional knowledge and understanding of MRSA and other infections.

I visited the University Hospital of Wales some time ago and met its executive director of infection management. He made it clear that managing MRSA and other infections is an issue of simple good practice. However, the point was that most people did not understand why certain practices were important. When they did understand, they were much better at carrying out the necessary procedures to control the infection. The promotion of best practice is key to this and I am pleased that the legislation is now reaching the statute book. Whether it will be enough is another matter, and we may well come back to this issue in the future, however, it is an important start.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** It is true that this will be an exercise in improving openness and transparency in the health service in relation to infection control. Members will be aware that specific information in relation to infection control, as it affects individual hospitals, is now available on the website for those who are interested in it. I am surprised that no-one has mentioned that, but it is a big step forward in improving transparency in this regard. Equally, since we proposed this resolution, we have also established lead nurses in our wards and theatres and set up special training courses so that they will go back to the clinical situation, precisely as Jenny Randerson has indicated, and give clear leadership in improving infection control in our hospitals.

4.20 p.m.

To respond to Helen Mary Jones, in relation to the contracting out, to the best of my knowledge, only one or two were contracting out of cleaning services: one in north-west Wales—and I think that Ieuan Wyn would agree that, by and large, that is a good

ymwybyddiaeth. Siaredais gyda Val am hyn ac yr oedd yn gwbl glir ei bod wedi rhagweld y byddai hyn yn cwmpasu hynny. Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud, drwy gyfrwng y ddeddfwriaeth hon, yw gwella'r sefyllfa bresennol. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â gwybodaeth a dealltwriaeth y proffesiwn a'r cyhoedd ynglŷn ag MRSA a heintiau eraill.

Gryn amser yn ôl ymwelais ag Ysbyty Prifysgol Cymru a chyfarfûm â'i gyfarwyddwr gweithredol dros reoli heintiau. Dywedodd yn bendant fod rheoli MRSA a heintiau eraill yn fater o arferion da syml. Fodd bynnag, y pwynt oedd na ddeallai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl pam mae rhai arferion penodol yn bwysig. Pan ddeallent, yr oeddent yn llawer gwell am gyflawni'r gweithdrefnau angenrheidiol i reoli'r haint. Mae hybu'r arferion gorau yn allweddol i hyn ac yr wyf yn falch bod y ddeddfwriaeth yn awr yn cyrraedd y llyfr statudau. Mater arall yw a fydd yn ddigon, ac mae'n wir bosibl y dychwelwn at y mater hwn i'r dyfodol, fodd bynnag, mae'n ddechrau pwysig.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae'n wir y bydd hyn yn ymarferiad mewn gwella tryloywder a bod yn agored yn y gwasanaeth iechyd o safbwynt rheoli heintiau. Bydd yr Aelodau yn ymwybodol bod gwybodaeth benodol am reoli heintiau, o ran sut y mae'n effeithio ar ysbytai unigol, yn awr ar gael ar y wefan i'r rhai sydd â diddordeb ynddi. Mae'n syndod gennyf nad oes neb wedi crybwyll hyn, ond mae'n gam mawr ymlaen i wella tryloywder i'r perwyl hwn. Yn yr un modd, ers inni gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn, yr ydym hefyd wedi sefydlu nyrsys arweiniol yn ein wardiau a'n theatrau ac wedi sefydlu cyrsiau hyfforddiant arbennig fel y byddant yn dychwelyd at y sefyllfa glinigol, yn union fel y dywedodd Jenny Randerson, ac yn rhoi arweiniad clir i wella rheoli heintiau yn ein hysbytai.

O ymateb i Helen Mary Jones, o safbwynt rhoi gwasanaethau allan ar gontract, hyd y gwn, un neu ddau yn unig a oedd yn rhoi'r gwasanaethau glanhau allan ar gontract: un yn y gogledd-orllewin—a chredaf y byddai Ieuan Wyn yn cytuno bod hwnnw, drwyddo

service—and the other in my constituency of Neath Port Talbot. I commend the staff in Neath Port Talbot hospital on the professional and excellent job that they do in cleaning the hospital, even though they are contracted out. I put it on record that, even though there are only a small number of contracted-out staff in Wales, they are providing an excellent service, of which we can be proud.

Again, I thank Val for her excellent work in proposing this resolution. It is not a complete answer, but it is part of the wider jigsaw, and we can be particularly proud, as an Assembly, of the fact that we have been able to move it forward so co-operatively.

draw, yn wasanaeth da—a'r llall yn fy etholaeth i, Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Cymeradwyaf y staff yn ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot am y gwaith proffesiynol ac ardderchog a wnânt o ran glanhau'r ysbyty, er eu bod wedi cael eu rhoi allan ar gontract. Rhoddaf ar ddu a gwyn, er nad oes ond nifer fach o staff y rhoddwyd eu gwasanaethau allan ar gontract yng Nghymru, eu bod yn darparu gwasanaeth ardderchog y gallwn fod yn falch ohono.

Unwaith eto, diolchaf i Val am ei gwaith ardderchog wrth gynnig y cynnig hwn. Nid yw'n ateb cyflawn, ond mae'n rhan o'r jig-so ehangach, a gallwn fod yn arbennig o falch, fel Cynulliad, o'r ffaith ein bod wedi gallu bwrw ymlaen â hyn mewn modd mor gydweithredol.

*Cynnig (NDM3209): O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3209): For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David



Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3210): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3210): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.22 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.22 p.m.*

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)  
 Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Y Bwlch Cyfoeth  
 The Prosperity Gap**

Motion (NDM3207): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3207): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*deplores the prosperity gap which exists between Wales and the regions of the UK and calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise the vital role of Welsh business and Welsh entrepreneurs in developing sustainable growth and development.*

*yn gresynu at y bwlch cyfoeth sy'n bodoli rhwng Cymru a rhanbarthau'r DU ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod rôl hollbwysig busnesau Cymru ac entrepreneuriaid Cymru o ran datblygu twf a datblygiad cynaliadwy.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise the need for, and conduct, an audit of manufacturing businesses in Wales, so that the Welsh Assembly Government can take early action to help mitigate further job losses and assist companies with potential for growth.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod bod angen archwilio busnesau gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, a chynnal archwiliad o'r fath, er mwyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad allu gweithredu'n gynnar i helpu i osgoi colli rhagor o swyddi a chynorthwyo cwmnïau sydd â'r potensial i dyfu.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make more strategic use of the next round of European funding to improving transport and infrastructure for Wales in order to close the prosperity gap.*

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud defnydd mwy strategol o'r rownd nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd i wella trafndiaeth a seilwaith yng Nghymru, er mwyn cau'r bwlch cyfoeth.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.  
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the need to evaluate all of our available assets in order to stimulate the small and medium-sized enterprise sector in all regions of Wales.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before we proceed, I inform Members that I am applying a three-minute limit to speeches made after the amendments have been proposed, as I usually do. I also warn Members that, if the debate on the Heads of the Valleys is to be concluded, we will probably need to extend Plenary. Many Members have indicated a desire to contribute and, unless the situation changes, I will apply a three-minute limit on speakers for that debate also.

I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams and amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*deplores the prosperity gap which exists between Wales and the regions of the UK and calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise the vital role of Welsh business and Welsh entrepreneurs in developing sustainable growth and development. (NDM3207)*

It is clear from comments made by the First Minister and the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, and from those made by their Labour colleagues, that the Labour Party plans to make the economy central to its election campaign. This makes several points in itself, the first being that it highlights how badly other policy areas have gone, such as education standards, the health service, council tax payments and so on. However, it also seeks to perpetuate a claim that the economy in Wales is doing well compared with the rest of the UK and Europe. This is not the case, and the Welsh Conservative Party is more than happy to debate the economic issues in the full

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.  
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod yr angen i werthuso'r holl asedau sydd ar gael gennym, er mwyn ysgogi'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig ym mhob rhanbarth o Gymru.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn inni fwrw ymlaen, hysbysaf yr Aelodau fy mod yn gosod cyfyngiad tri munud ar areithiau ar ôl i'r gwelliannau gael eu cynnig, fel y byddaf yn arfer gwneud. Rhybuddiaf yr Aelodau hefyd, os ydym am gwblhau'r ddadl ar Flaenau'r Cymoedd, ei bod yn debygol y bydd yn rhaid inni ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Mae sawl Aelod wedi mynegi ei ddymuniad i gyfrannu ac, oni bai fod y sefyllfa'n newid, byddaf yn gosod cyfyngiad tri munud ar siaradwyr ar gyfer y ddadl honno hefyd.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams a gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn gresynu at y bwlch cyfoeth sy'n bodoli rhwng Cymru a rhanbarthau'r DU ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod rôl hollbwysig busnesau Cymru ac entrepreneuriaid Cymru o ran datblygu twf a datblygiad cynaliadwy. (NDM3207)*

Mae'n glir oddi wrth sylwadau a gyflwynodd y Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, ac oddi wrth y sylwadau a gyflwynodd eu cyd-Aelodau Llafur, fod y Blaid Lafur yn bwriadu gwneud yr economi yn ganolog i'w hymgyrch etholiadol. Mae hyn yn gwneud sawl pwynt ynddo'i hun, a'r cyntaf yw ei fod yn pwysleisio pa mor wael y mae wedi bod o ran meysydd polisi eraill, megis safonau addysg, y gwasanaeth iechyd, taliadau'r dreth gyngor ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn ceisio cynnal honiad bod yr economi yng Nghymru yn gwneud yn dda o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU ac Ewrop. Nid yw hyn yn wir, ac mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn fwy na

knowledge that, whatever the Ministers claim, after almost eight years of the Welsh economy under the Assembly as an administration, we are now the poorest part of the United Kingdom.

There is no doubt that statistics will be presented by all parties in this debate and, as the opposition, we will rightly highlight those areas that have deteriorated, and the Government will seek to identify maybe one or two points that may well have improved. However, whichever data are quoted, they should not be used in isolation; we need to compare ourselves and our economic performance with other parts of the United Kingdom and Europe. After all, there is no point in claiming that we are more prosperous economically if all other parts have prospered even more. Our relative position is what counts. We are the poorest part of the United Kingdom according to the most authoritative and recognised measure, gross value added, which is the very measure used by Rhodri Morgan when he was the Secretary for Economic Development, and the measure applied by all international organisations when seeking to offer economic aid or assistance. Indeed, this is the measure that the European Commission uses in assessing support for Objective 1 funding, and now cohesion support. Qualifying for this funding for a second time does not concur with the Minister's claims that the economy is doing well. If we are doing so well, why have we qualified, especially considering the admission of some of the former eastern bloc countries into the enlarged Europe? We remember the First Minister, when he was the Secretary for Economic Development, stating on many occasions during the planning of the current round of European funding that it was a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity. It is because the Welsh Assembly Government has done so badly that it has become a second-in-two-Assemblies opportunity for the Welsh Assembly Government.

There is no doubt that the Minister will seek to make an argument based on unemployment data and may even compare Wales favourably with other parts of the United Kingdom. However, when we dig a

pharod i drafod y materion economaidd gan wybod yn iawn, beth bynnag a honna'r Gweinidogion, ar ôl i economi Cymru fod dan y Cynulliad fel gweinyddiaeth ers bron wyth mlynedd, mai nyni yn awr yw'r rhan dlotaf o'r Deyrnas Unedig.

Bydd pob plaid, heb os, yn cyflwyno ystadegau yn y ddadl hon ac, fel yr wrthblaid, byddwn, yn hollol deg, yn tynnu sylw at y meysydd hynny sydd wedi dirwyio, a bydd y Llywodraeth yn ceisio nodi un neu ddau o bwyntiau efallai sydd yn wir wedi gwella. Fodd bynnag, pa ddata bynnag a ddyfynnir, ni ddylid eu defnyddio ar eu pennau eu hunain; rhaid inni ein cymharu ein hunain, a pherfformiad ein heconomi, gyda rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop. Wedi'r cyfan, nid oes dim diben honni ein bod yn fwy ffyniannus yn economaidd os yw pob rhan arall wedi ffynnu mwy fyth. Ein sefyllfa gymharol yw'r hyn sy'n cyfrif. Nyni yw'r rhan dlotaf o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ôl y mesur mwyaf awdurdodol a chydabyddedig, gwerth ychwanegol crynswth, sef yr union fesur a ddefnyddiodd Rhodri Morgan pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, a'r mesur a ddefnyddia pob sefydliad rhyngwladol wrth geisio cynnig cymorth neu gefnogaeth economaidd. Yn wir, hwn yw'r mesur a ddefnyddia'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i asesu cymorth ar gyfer arian Amcan 1, a chymorth cydlyniant yn awr. Nid yw bod yn gymwys ar gyfer y nawdd hwn am yr ail dro yn cyd-fynd â honiadau'r Gweinidog fod yr economi yn gwneud yn dda. Os ydym yn gwneud cystal, paham yr ydym wedi cymhwyso, yn enwedig o ystyried bod rhai o gyn wledydd y bloc dwyreiniol wedi cael eu derbyn i'r Ewrop ehangach? Yr ydym yn cofio'r Prif Weinidog, pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd dros Ddatblygu Economaidd, yn dweud sawl tro wrth gynllunio'r cylch nawdd Ewropeaidd presennol ei fod yn gyfle unwaith mewn oes. Oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud mor wael, mae bellach yn ail gyfle mewn dau Gynulliad i Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Nid oes dim amheuaeth na fydd y Gweinidog yn ceisio cyflwyno dadl yn seiliedig ar ddata diweithdra ac mae'n bosibl y bydd hefyd yn cymharu Cymru yn ffafriol gyda rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, wrth

little deeper there are some worrying trends, and I hope he will acknowledge that. For example, 21,000 net new jobs were created in the Welsh economy over the last 12 months. However, 10,000 of those jobs were created in the public sector. There may be good reasons for creating some of those jobs, as some may be doctors', nurses' or teachers' posts, but, without doubt, those are not the majority. That is hardly a sound foundation upon which to improve economic prosperity in the short to medium term. Having more teachers may help in the very long term, but it does not address the immediate issue that the Assembly Government needs to address, which is the short to medium-term strategy.

Should the Minister seek to put a positive spin on these figures, why is it that the increase in public sector administration in the UK is at half the rate of that in Wales, especially when there is a Labour administration in Westminster? What is good for Westminster should be good for Wales, unless there are specific reasons that the Minister can offer.

We are seeing a trend in terms of the number of manufacturing jobs—they are being replaced by public sector jobs. I do not suggest that that is job for job, but it is worrying that there was a net loss of 8,000 jobs in the Welsh manufacturing sector last year at the same time as 10,000 jobs were created in the public sector.

It needs to be recognised that the construction industry is doing better, but I hope that the Minister will also recognise that there are two concerns in this regard relating to sustainability. One is that there has been a housing boom, which cannot last, and the other is that, over the last few years, the Welsh Assembly Government has embarked on enormous publicly-funded projects. The Assembly Chamber and the Wales Millennium Centre are examples of that. That type of spending cannot be maintained, but it is at the bottom of the boom in the construction sector.

Economic inactivity is a key measure and an

inni durio ychydig yn ddyfnach, ceir rhai tueddiadau sy'n peri pryder, a gobeithiaf y bydd yn cydnabod hynny. Er enghraifft, crëwyd 21,000 o swyddi newydd net yn economi Cymru yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, yn y sector cyhoeddus y crëwyd 10,000 o'r swyddi hynny. Mae'n bosibl bod rhesymau da dros greu rhai o'r swyddi hynny, oherwydd y gallai rhai ohonynt fod yn swyddi meddygon, nyrsys neu athrawon, ond, heb os, nid y rheini yw'r mwyafrif. Prin bod hynny'n sylfaen gadarn ar gyfer gwella ffyniant economaidd yn y tymor byr i'r tymor canolig. Mae'n bosibl y bydd cael rhagor o athrawon yn helpu yn y tymor hir iawn, ond nid yw'n rhoi sylw i'r mater brys y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad roi sylw iddo, sef y strategaeth tymor byr i dymor canolig.

Pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn ceisio creu delwedd gadarnhaol o'r ffigurau hyn, paham felly y mae'r cynnydd mewn gweinyddiaeth sector cyhoeddus yn y DU yn hanner y gyfradd yng Nghymru, yn enwedig gyda gweinyddiaeth Lafur yn San Steffan? Dylai'r hyn sy'n dda i San Steffan fod yn dda i Gymru, oni bai fod rhesymau penodol y gall y Gweinidog eu cynnig.

Yr ydym yn gweld tuedd yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu—cânt eu disodli gan swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus. Nid wyf yn awgrymu bod hynny'n digwydd swydd am swydd, ond mae'n peri pryder fod colled net o 8,000 o swyddi yn sector gweithgynhyrchu Cymru y llynedd ar adeg pan grëwyd 10,000 o swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus.

Rhaid cydnabod bod y diwydiant adeiladu yn gwneud yn well, ond gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn cydnabod bod dau beth yn peri pryder yn y maes hwn o safbwynt cynaliadwyedd. Un yw bod cynnydd aruthrol wedi bod ym maes tai, cynnydd na all barhau, a'r llall yw bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, wedi ymgymryd â phrosiectau anferthol sy'n cael nawdd cyhoeddus. Mae Siambr y Cynulliad a Chanolfan y Mileniwm yn esiamplau o hynny. Ni ellir cynnal y math hwnnw o wariant, ond mae wrth wraidd y cynnydd yn y sector adeiladu.

Mae anweithgarwch economaidd yn fesur

important area of policy for any party or government. It is much the reason why we are the poorest part of the United Kingdom. In September 1999 the inactivity rate was 25.6 per cent of the eligible workforce, which was far too high a figure, as was agreed by all parties. The Economic Development and Transport Committee even conducted a review into this area of policy. The figure now stands at 23.9 per cent. The Minister may claim that that is fair progress and that credit should be given for it. However, as I said at the outset, this needs to be compared with the situation in other nations and regions of the United Kingdom, Europe and beyond. Over the same period, economic inactivity in Scotland fell from 22.9 per cent to 20.8 per cent. In the north-east of England, arguably the region with the economic heritage most similar to Wales, the rate fell from a staggering 27 per cent to 23.7 per cent, a fall of 3.3 percentage points in comparison with a 1.7 point change in Wales. This shows that we are falling further behind the rest of the United Kingdom.

So, what is the way forward? The key economic drivers—the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board—have been wound up. We know that recent staff morale surveys do not paint a rosy picture. There have been some good people recruited; I hope that that will work out, and the Assembly Government should be congratulated on that, although the comments of some senior business leaders over the last few weeks or so have not been altogether positive. The opinion is that some of the new recruits and other senior appointments have become anonymous. I hope that those are isolated examples, rather than a trend.

What worries me most is that, in view of the clear failure of policies, the Minister is determined to pursue the same themes. He has no priority for improving key strategic road programmes. He promoted his transport strategy to the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee just last week but of course there is no additional funding for it.

allweddol ac yn faes polisi pwysig i unrhyw blaid neu lywodraeth. Mae'n rhan fawr o'r rheswm pam mai nyini yw'r rhan dlotaf o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Ym Medi 1999 yr oedd y gyfradd anweithgarwch yn 25.6 y cant o'r gweithlu cymwys. Yr oedd hwn yn ffigur llawer rhy uchel, fel y cytunai pob plaid. Bu i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth hyd yn oed gynnal adolygiad o'r maes polisi hwn. Bellach 23.9 y cant yw'r ffigur. Mae'n bosibl y bydd y Gweinidog yn honni bod hyn yn gynnydd teg ac y dylid rhoi clod am hyn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais ar y dechrau, rhaid cymharu hyn gyda'r sefyllfa yng ngwledydd a rhanbarthau eraill y Deyrnas Unedig, Ewrop a thu hwnt. Yn ystod yr un cyfnod, gostyngodd anweithgarwch economaidd yn yr Alban o 22.9 y cant i 20.8 y cant. Yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, ardal y gellid dadlau bod iddi'r dreftadaeth economaidd debycaf i Gymru, gostyngodd y gyfradd o ffigur aruthrol o 27 y cant i 23.7 y cant, gostyngiad o 3.3. pwynt canran o'i gymharu â newid o 1.7 pwynt yng Nghymru. Dengys hyn ein bod yn mynd ymhellach ar ei hôl hi o'n cymharu â gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Felly, beth yw'r ffordd ymlaen? Cafodd y symbylwyr economaidd allweddol—Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru—eu dirwyn i ben. Gwyddom nad oedd arolygon diweddar o forâl y staff yn darlunio sefyllfa obeithiol. Cafodd rhai pobl dda eu recriwtio; gobeithiaf y bydd hynny'n dwyn ffrwyth, a dylid llongyfarch Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am hynny, er na fu sylwadau rhai o'r uwch arweinwyr busnes dros yr wythnosau diwethaf yn gadarnhaol o bellffordd. Y farn yw bod rhai o'r rhai sydd wedi eu recriwtio o'r newydd ac uwch benodiadau eraill wedi mynd yn ddi-sôn-amdanynt. Gobeithiaf mai esiamplau ar eu pennau eu hunain yw'r rheini, yn hytrach na thueddiad.

Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni fwyaf, yng ngoleuni methiant amlwg polisiâu, yw bod y Gweinidog yn benderfynol o fynd ar drywydd yr un themâu. Nid oes ganddo ddim blaenoriaeth i wella rhaglenni ffyrdd strategol allweddol. Hyrwyddodd ei strategaeth drafnidiaeth gerbron y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau yr wythnos diwethaf, ond wrth gwrs, nid oes cyllid

ychwanegol ar ei chyfer.

4.30 p.m.

He has no support from the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills to deliver improved standards in education and skills, as we have seen the widening gap in GCSE and A-level results between Wales and England. Existing policies such as the knowledge bank for business have been slow to start, to be generous, or have had no tangible benefits, according to many of the members of the scheme. In view of these clear failures, there is a need for new policies, a new direction and a better way.

We need to offer benefits to operate here in Wales. We need to offer a skills advantage and a focus on assisting productivity, because productivity is always the ultimate wealth creator. We need a flexible grant-structure approach rather than the rigid structure of regional selective assistance that is offered at present. We need a business support scheme to be analysed on the evidence that it offers rather than the slashing and burning of the budgets that the Minister did, without any evidence in terms of the success or otherwise of business support.

Questions tabled to establish where those cuts have been taken have been slow in being answered. We all know that areas such as the Rhondda and the Cynon valley have been cut right back—so many of the communities that we will be discussing in the next debate. Those are the sorts of policies that need to be based on evidence rather than on the whim of financial budget planning, which is the basis on which the Minister has conducted it so far.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose the following amendments in my name. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise the need for, and conduct, an audit*

Nid oes ganddo gefnogaeth o du'r Gweinidog Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i gyflwyno gwell safonau mewn addysg a sgiliau, gan ein bod wedi gweld y bwlch yn lledu o ran canlyniadau TGAU a Safon Uwch rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Mae'r polisiau presennol megis y banc gwybodaeth i fusnesau wedi bod yn araf yn cychwyn, a bod yn garedig, neu heb esgor ar ddim manteision amlwg, yn ôl llawer o aelodau'r cynllun. Yn wyneb y methiannau clir hyn, mae angen polisiau newydd, cyfeiriad newydd a gwell ffordd.

Rhaid inni gynnig buddion i gwmnïau weithredu yma yng Nghymru. Rhaid inni gynnig mantais o ran sgiliau a chanolbwyntio ar gynorthwyo cynhyrchiant, oherwydd cynhyrchiant yn y pen draw sydd wastad yn creu cyfoeth. Mae angen inni gael dull o ymdrin â hyn drwy strwythur grantiau hyblyg yn hytrach na strwythur haearnaidd y cymorth rhanbarth dewisol a gynigir ar hyn o bryd. Mae arnom angen cynllun cymorth i fusnesau sy'n cael ei ddadansoddi yn ôl y dystiolaeth y mae'n ei chynnig yn hytrach na darnio a llosgi cyllidebau fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog, heb ddim dystiolaeth o ran llwyddiant neu fethiant cymorth i fusnesau.

Buwyd yn araf iawn yn ateb cwestiynau a gyflwynwyd er mwyn canfod lle y digwyddodd y toriadau hynny. Gwyddom oll fod ardaloedd megis y Rhondda a Chwm Cynon wedi eu torri i'r byw—cynifer o'r cymunedau y byddwn yn eu trafod yn y ddadl nesaf. Dyna'r math o bolisiau a ddylai fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth yn hytrach nag ar fympwy cynllunio cyllidebau ariannol, sef y sail y cynhaliodd y Gweinidog ef arni hyd yma.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod bod angen archwilio busnesau*

*of manufacturing businesses in Wales, so that the Welsh Assembly Government can take early action to help mitigate further job losses and assist companies with potential for growth.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make more strategic use of the next round of European funding to improve transport and infrastructure for Wales in order to close the prosperity gap.*

I thank Alun Cairns for tabling this debate and giving us the opportunity to examine what Alun admitted has been a mixed bag of success by the Welsh Assembly Government.

It is true that some areas—the number of people who are in work and the number of jobs that are available—have improved greatly, and gross value added figures have also gradually improved in Wales. Therefore, we are becoming a more prosperous nation. However, Mr Cairns is right to point out that, compared with other areas of Great Britain, it is clear that we are not making the same progress. We find ourselves, all too often, at the wrong end of league tables for GVA in the UK.

It is not just the fact that we are still bumping along the bottom of the UK figures that is a huge problem for the Welsh Assembly Government, but we also still have grave disparity within Wales in terms of GVA figures. If one looks at the differences between prosperity in parts of south Wales, around the capital, compared with areas in mid Wales or Anglesey, where we see some of the lowest levels of GVA, one can see that we have a gravely diverse situation across Wales, which needs attention. That is not always acknowledged in the way that some of the regional selective assistance and grant-aid packages are put together. If one looks at, for instance, the situation in Powys—and I would, would I not?—one can see that GVA levels there, in an area that receives little support, are much lower than in other areas

*gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, a chynnal archwiliad o'r fath, er mwyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad allu gweithredu'n gynnar i helpu i osgoi colli rhagor o swyddi a chynorthwyo cwmnïau sydd â'r potensial i dyfu.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wneud defnydd mwy strategol o'r rownd nesaf o gyllid Ewropeaidd i wella trafnidiaeth a seilwaith yng Nghymru, er mwyn cau'r bwlch cyfoeth.*

Yr wyf yn diolch i Alun Cairns am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon a rhoi cyfle inni archwilio'r hyn sydd wedi bod, yn ôl cyfaddefiad Alun, yn fagad cymysg o lwyddiannau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mae'n wir bod rhai meysydd—nifer y bobl sydd mewn gwaith a nifer y swyddi sydd ar gael—wedi gwella'n sylweddol, ac mae ffigurau gwerth ychwanegol crynswth hefyd wedi gwella'n raddol yng Nghymru. Felly yr ydym yn dod yn genedl fwy ffyniannus. Fodd bynnag, mae Mr Cairns yn gywir pan ddywed nad ydym, o'n cymharu ag ardaloedd eraill Prydain Fawr, yn gwneud yr un cynnydd. Yn rhy aml o lawer, yr ydym ar begwn anghywir y tablau cynghrair GYC yn y DU.

Nid yn unig y ffaith ein bod yn dal i lusgo ar hyd gwaelodion ffigurau'r DU sydd yn broblem enfawr i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond y ffaith hefyd fod gwahaniaeth enbyd yng Nghymru ei hun o ran ffigurau GYC. Os edrychwch ar y gwahaniaethau rhwng ffyniant mewn rhannau o dde Cymru, o gwmpas y brifddinas, o'i gymharu â rhai ardaloedd yn y canolbarth neu ym Môn, lle y mae rhai o'r lefelau GYC isaf, gallwn weld bod gennym wahaniaethau enbyd leded Cymru, a rhaid rhoi sylw i hyn. Nid yw hyn yn wastad yn cael ei gydnabod yn y dull o lunio rhai o'r pecynnau cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol a chymorth grantiau. Os edrychwch, er enghraifft, ar y sefyllfa ym Mhowys—ac fe fyddwn i'n gwneud hynny, oni fyddwn?—gallwn weld bod lefelau GYC yno, mewn ardal nad yw'n derbyn fawr ddim cymorth,



of Wales, such as Wrexham and Flintshire, that will potentially continue to get support. That is not to say that Wrexham and Flintshire should not get support; I am arguing for a more comprehensive coverage for all parts of Wales. Of course, we anxiously wait to see what the Westminster Government will do with regard to the inclusion of the whole of the east Wales region in further European funding.

However, within that, we have some worrying trends. If we are truly going to improve the prosperity of everybody in Wales and make Wales a richer country, we have to address the ongoing gender pay gap. Women earn 12 per cent less than their male counterparts in full-time work and 31 per cent less in part-time work. If the Welsh Assembly Government is truly interested in tackling child poverty, it has been proven that it will be able to do so by improving the economic lot of women.

On economic inactivity, again we have seen moves in the right direction. There is no point denying that we have seen more of those people who have been economically inactive in the past getting back into the workforce. That is fantastic for them and for their community. However, you have to acknowledge that those people whom we have already succeeded in getting back to work are perhaps the people who had the fewest barriers facing them. They are, perhaps, the people who have been the easiest to help. The remaining economically inactive people are, perhaps, the much more challenging individuals who have many barriers to work, whether health, cultural or childcare. It will be much more difficult to get those people back into work. So, let us not rest on our laurels and think that the figures are going in the right direction. We still have to crack the hard core and we must find some way of identifying those people who truly want to work and participate in the economy of Wales and try to overcome the barriers that they face.

Turning to our amendments, we have seen a huge change in the type of economy that

yn is o lawer nag mewn ardaloedd eraill yng Nghymru, megis Wrecsam a sir y Fflint, a fydd o bosibl yn dal i dderbyn cymorth. Nid dweud yr wyf na ddylai Wrecsam a sir y Fflint gael y cymorth; dadlau yr wyf dros ymdrin yn fwy cynhwysfawr â phob rhan o Gymru. Wrth gwrs, yr ydym yn disgwyl yn eiddgar i weld beth a wnaiff Llywodraeth San Steffan o ran cynnwys rhanbarth dwyrain Cymru yn ei gyfanrwydd yn y cyllid Ewropeaidd pellach.

Fodd bynnag, oddi mewn i hynny, fe welwn rai tueddiadau sydd yn peri pryder. Os ydym yn wir am wella ffyniant pawb yng Nghymru a gwneud Cymru'n wlad gyfoethocach, rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyflogau cyson rhwng y rhywiau. Mae menywod yn ennill 12 y cant yn llai na'u cyfoedion gwryw mewn gwaith llawnamser a 31 y cant yn llai mewn gwaith rhan-amser. Os oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ddiddordeb gwirioneddol mewn mynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, profwyd y gall wneud hynny drwy wella cyflwr economaidd menywod.

O ran anweithgarwch economaidd, eto yr ydym wedi gweld symudiadau i'r cyfeiriad iawn. Nid oes dim diben gwadu nad ydym wedi gweld mwy o'r bobl hynny sydd wedi bod yn economaidd anweithgar yn y gorffennol yn dychwelyd i'r gweithlu. Mae hynny'n wych iddynt hwy a'u cymuned. Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gydnabod mai'r bobl y llwyddasom i'w cael yn ôl i weithio yw, efallai, y bobl oedd yn wynebu'r lleiaf o rwystrau. Efallai mai hwy fu'r bobl hawsaf eu helpu. Dichon mai'r gweddill sydd yn economaidd anweithgar yw'r unigolion llawer mwy anodd eu helpu na hynny a all fod â rhwystrau lawer yn eu hatal rhag gweithio, boed a wnelo'r rhwystrau hynny ag iechyd, diwylliant neu ofal plant. Bydd yn anos o lawer cael y rhain yn ôl i waith. Felly peidiwn â bod yn hunanfodlon a thybio bod y ffigurau'n mynd i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Rhaid i ni dorri drwy'r cnewyllyn caled a rhaid i ni ddarganfod ffordd o weld pwy yw'r bobl hynny sydd o ddifrif am weithio a chymryd rhan yn economi Cymru, a cheisio goresgyn y rhwystrau sy'n eu hwynebu.

O droi at ein gwelliannau, yr ydym wedi gweld newid enfawr yn y math o economi

Wales has and the decimation of our traditional heavy industries by a political party that we will not mention now. So, we have seen—

**David Davies:** Does your amendment, by any chance, refer to the Government that was in office between 1964 and 1970, which closed down far more pits than Mrs Thatcher's Government did more recently?

**Kirsty Williams:** I am talking about the Government that destroyed the Valleys' economy and chucked members of my family out when it effectively closed down most of the steel industry in Wales.

Although we have a changing economy, we are still more reliant on manufacturing than other parts of the UK, which makes up 14.7 per cent of our industry. We have seen a haemorrhaging of manufacturing jobs in Wales, which we must address—

**Alun Cairns:** I take your point about manufacturing, but if you look at the 1980s onwards, the index of manufacturing in Wales was above the UK's average until 2004, when we dropped significantly below the UK average. So, whatever you say about the manufacturing industry, it is having a tougher time now than it ever has.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am saying that we are currently facing a very tough time in manufacturing and that we can ill afford to ignore that, which is my concern. When the First Minister goes on television and announces that there is a false perception in Wales that we have less jobs, he is right; we do not have less jobs, but we are becoming over-reliant on the kind of public sector and service sector jobs that Mr Cairns mentioned earlier to the detriment of concentrating on looking at how we can mitigate job losses in manufacturing.

I appreciate that the Minister cannot stand, Canutlike, in the face of a changing world economy and different drivers, but he does a good impression of an ostrich with its head stuck in the sand when it comes to looking at

sydd gan Gymru a dinistrio ein diwydiannau trwm traddodiadol gan blaid wleidyddol nas crybwyllwn yn awr. Felly, yr ydym wedi gweld—

**David Davies:** A yw eich gwelliant yn digwydd cyfeirio at y Llywodraeth a oedd mewn grym rhwng 1964 a 1970, ac a gaeodd fwy o byllau o lawer nag a wnaeth Llywodraeth Mrs Thatcher yn fwy diweddar?

**Kirsty Williams:** Sôn yr wyf am y Llywodraeth a ddinistriodd economi'r Cymoedd ac a luchiodd aelodau o'm teulu ar y domen pan gaeodd fwy neu lai y cyfan o'r diwydiant dur yng Nghymru.

Er bod gennym economi sy'n newid, yr ydym yn dal i ddibynnu mwy na rhannau eraill o'r DU ar weithgynhyrchu, sydd yn 14.7 y cant o'n diwydiant. Yr ydym wedi gweld llawer iawn o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu'n cael eu colli yng Nghymru, a rhaid i ni ymdrin â hyn—

**Alun Cairns:** Derbyniaf eich pwynt ynghylch gweithgynhyrchu, ond petaech yn edrych ar y cyfnod o'r 1980au ymlaen, yr oedd mynegrif gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn uwch na chyfartaledd y DU tan 2004, pan ddisgynasom yn is o lawer na chyfartaledd y DU. Felly, beth bynnag a ddywedwch am y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu, mae'n cael amser caletach yn awr nag erioed.

**Kirsty Williams:** Dweud yr wyf ein bod ar hyn o bryd yn wynebu amser caled iawn mewn gweithgynhyrchu a phrin y medrwn fforddio anwybyddu hynny; dyna yw fy mhryder. Pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn mynd ar y teledu ac yn cyhoeddi bod canfyddiad ffug yng Nghymru fod gennym lai o swyddi, mae'n iawn; nid oes gennym lai o swyddi, ond yr ydym yn mynd yn orddibynnol ar y math o swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector gwasanaeth a grybwyllodd Mr Cairns yn gynharach, ar draul canolbwyntio ar weld sut y gallwn osgoi colli swyddi mewn gweithgynhyrchu.

Yr wyf yn sylweddoli na all y Gweinidog sefyll, fel Caniwt, yn wyneb newid yn economi'r byd a gwahanol ddylanwadau, ond mae'n dda iawn am ddynwared estrys â'i ben yn sownd yn y tywod pan ddaw'n fater o

what we can do about manufacturing, hence our amendment 1.

Moving on to amendment 2—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You cannot move on to the next amendment; you have run out of time.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod yr angen i werthuso'r holl asedau sydd ar gael gennym, er mwyn ysgogi'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig ym mhob rhanbarth o Gymru.*

Cefnogwn y cynnig hwn—mae'n anodd iawn ei wrthwynebu—a'r gwelliannau. Mae rhan gyntaf y cynnig yn hunanamlwg, ac ymddiheuraf, gan fod llawer o'r hyn y byddaf yn ei ddweud eisoes wedi ei ddweud, ond mae'r ffeithiau yn arwain at yr un dadleuon, yn y bôn. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod gan y Llywodraeth yr hawl i gyfeirio at y ffigurau diweithdra a'r gostyngiad bach yn y nifer sy'n economaidd anweithredol fel llwyddiannau—ni fyddai rhywun yn gwarafun hynny iddi. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, nid yw'r ffigurau GVA, hyd yn hyn, yn dangos ein bod yn cau'r bwlch o fewn yr ardal Amcan 1, er gwaethaf addewidion neu dargedau Rhodri Morgan i godi lefelau GVA neu GDP y pen Cymru i 90 y cant o gyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig. Dyna yw'r marc a osodwyd a dyna sut y dylem feirniadu llwyddiant neu aflwyddiant y Llywodraeth.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn cyfeirio at wneud defnydd llawn o'r holl adnoddau i gryfhau busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Cyfeiriau yn fyr at ddau beth y dylem edrych arnynt. Un ohonynt yw gofalu bod busnesau bach, ym mhob rhan o Gymru, yn cael cyfle teg i wneud cais am y gwaith sy'n deillio, i ddechrau, o wario cyhoeddus ac o'r sector preifat. Soniaf yn arbennig am wariant cyhoeddus—gan y gwasanaeth iechyd, llywodraeth leol a'r Cynulliad ei hun. Gwn fod gwaith wedi ei wneud yn y cyfeiriad hwn, ond mae'n ymddangos i mi fod llawer o hynny'n ymwneud â chynhyrchu papurau di-

weld beth y gallwn ei wneud ynghylch gweithgynhyrchu, a dyna'r rheswm dros ein gwelliant 1.

Gan symud ymlaen at welliant 2—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Ni chewch symud ymlaen at y gwelliant nesaf; mae eich amesr ar ben.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I propose amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the need to evaluate all of our available assets in order to stimulate the small and medium-sized enterprise sector in all regions of Wales.*

We will support this motion—it is difficult to oppose it—and the amendments. The first part of the motion is self-evident, and I apologise, as much of what I will say has already been said, but the facts lead to the same arguments, essentially. I acknowledge that the Government has the right to refer to the unemployment figures and the small reduction in the economically inactive as successes—no-one would begrudge it that. However, unfortunately, the GVA figures to date do not show that we are closing the gap within the Objective 1 area, despite Rhodri Morgan's targets or pledge to raise the level of Welsh GVA or GDP per capita to 90 per cent of the UK average. That was the mark that was set, and that is how we should judge the success or otherwise of the Government.

Amendment 3 refers to making full use of all resources to strengthen small and medium-sized enterprises in all parts of Wales. I will refer briefly to two things that we should look at. One is to ensure that small businesses, in all parts of Wales, have a fair chance to bid for the work emanating, to begin with, from public and private sector expenditure. I am thinking of public expenditure in particular—by the health service, local government and the Assembly itself. I know that work has been done in this regard, but it seems to me that much of that is to do with producing countless papers talking about it, but there is

ri sy'n sôn am y peth, ond ychydig iawn o dystiolaeth sydd i ddangos bod hyn wedi llwyddo hyd yn hyn. Mae ardaloedd o Gymru—ac yr wyf wedi cyfeirio atynt yn ddiweddar—lle nad oes un cwmni yn medru gwneud cais am waith gan y Cynulliad, er enghraifft. Felly, mae gwaith y gellir ei wneud ar hynny.

4.40 p.m.

Dylem hefyd edrych ar brofiad Iwerddon. Mae angen yr hawl arnom i roi goddefiad treth i fusnesau yn ardaloedd Amcan 1. Heb y gallu i amrywio trethi, mae'n anodd iawn denu cwmnïau, neu sbarduno cwmnïau, i sefydlu mewn rhai ardaloedd yn ein hen gymoedd diwydiannol ac mewn rhai ardaloedd cefn gwlad. Mae angen annog twf cwmnïau brodorol. Yr ydym wedi pregethu'r neges hon lawer gwaith dros y blynyddoedd, ond mae'n eithriadol o bwysig. Mae tystiolaeth ddiweddar wedi dangos bod tua dwy ran o dair o'r ffatrioedd neu gwmnïau sydd wedi eu denu i Gymru o'r tu allan wedi dod i ben neu ddiffannu yn ôl i rywle arall, ac nid o fewn cyfnod y Llywodraeth hon yn unig. Mae'n rhaid i ni gael cwmnïau cynhenid, brodorol sydd â'u gwreiddiau yma, fel sail i'n heconomi. Yr oeddwn yn siarad neithiwr â rheolwr-gyfarwyddwr cwmni ym Mangor sydd wedi ei sefydlu ers degawdau. Yr oedd yn cwyno bod llawer o gefnogaeth yn cael ei rhoi i ddenu cwmnïau, ond bod cwmnïau brodorol sydd am foderneiddio a chodi lefelau sgiliau yn ei chael yn anodd cael cefnogaeth.

As Rhodri Morgan said, it is easy to knock, but I would like to be more positive in concluding and refer to two things that have happened in Gwynedd over the past few years, because the motion refers to entrepreneurship and the need to improve entrepreneurship within the workforce. One was the small business scheme that operated in Gwynedd under Objective 1. It proved to be a huge success. The initial investment was only a little over £1 million, and yet the outcomes are quite staggering: over 100 new businesses have been started, with 200 new jobs created. This is a simple and direct way for private businesses to access EU funds; something that the private sector has been complaining about throughout the

little evidence to show that this has been a success to date. There are areas of Wales—and I have referred to them recently—where companies cannot bid for work for the Assembly, for example. Therefore, work could be done on that.

We should also look at the Irish experience. We need the ability to give tax relief to businesses in the Objective 1 area. Without the ability to vary taxes, it is very difficult to attract companies, or to encourage start-ups in some areas of our old industrial valleys and into some rural areas. We need to encourage the growth of indigenous companies. We have preached this message many times over the years, but it is very important. Recent evidence has shown that two thirds of the factories or companies that have been attracted into Wales have ceased to exist or disappeared back to somewhere else, and not just within the time of this Government. We must have indigenous business, which have their roots here, as the basis of our economy. I was talking last night to the managing director of a company in Bangor that has been established for decades. He was complaining that a lot of support is put into attracting companies, but that indigenous companies that want to modernise and increase skills levels find it difficult to get support.

Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Morgan, mae'n hawdd iawn beirniadu, ond carwn fod yn fwy cadarnhaol wrth gloi, a chyfeirio at ddau beth sydd wedi digwydd yng Ngwynedd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, oherwydd bod y cynnig yn cyfeirio at entrepreneuriaeth a'r angen i wella entrepreneuriaeth yn y gweithlu. Un oedd y cynllun busnesau bach oedd yn rhedeg yng Ngwynedd dan Amcan 1. Bu'n llwyddiant ysgubol. Ychydig dros £1 filiwn oedd y buddsoddiad cychwynnol, ac eto mae'r canlyniadau'n rhyfeddol: cychwynnwyd dros 100 o fusnesau newydd, a chreu 200 o swyddi newydd. Mae hyn yn ffordd syml ac uniongyrchol i fusnesau preifat gael arian yr UE; rhywbeth y bu'r sector preifat yn cwyno yn ei gylch drwy

programme. That scheme improved the competitiveness of those businesses in Gwynedd. This should be rolled out throughout the area during the next 6 years of the convergence funds.

The other initiative that was quite successful in—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You have 15 seconds.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I will just refer to it. It is called 'Llwyddo'n Lleol', or 'Getting on in Gwynedd'. I urge the Minister to have a look at the scheme to see whether it can be applied to the rest of Wales over the next six years.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that they have strictly three minutes.

**Mark Isherwood:** Only last month, the chairman of the Federation of Small Businesses in north Wales and Chester went to press to state:

'It is about time that those who control and administer the funding take note that the Welsh economy is necessarily becoming increasingly dependent on small businesses. An investment in these businesses will develop sustainable growth and employment. Furthermore, the money generated from the investment will stay in Wales and be beneficial to the economy of Wales...Offer a grant or a loan to a businessman and he will think of ways to make that money grow and develop his business. Offer the money to a bureaucrat and he will think of ways to spend it...Maybe by investing in those businesses that can actually make use of it, we might at last move away from near the bottom of the list of the European Union's poorest nations.'

A new report was published by Imperial College, London and the independent think-tank Reform in July. This documented a profound economic imbalance between the UK regions, with high welfare dependency and large public sectors in Wales. The report shows that the heavy public-spending increases of this decade have not helped Wales and may have increased dependence

gydol y rhaglen. Mae'r cynllun hwn wedi gwella natur gystadleuol y busnesau hynny yng Ngwynedd. Dylid rhoi hyn ar waith ledled yr ardal yn ystod 6 blynedd nesaf y cyllid cydgyfeirio.

Y fenter arall a fu'n eithaf llwyddiannus o ran—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae gennych 15 eiliad.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Ni wnaf ond cyfeirio ati. 'Llwyddo'n Lleol', neu 'Getting on in Gwynedd' yw ei henw. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i fwrw golwg ar y cynllun i weld a oes modd ei weithredu yng ngweddill Cymru dros y chwe blynedd nesaf.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Carwn atgoffa'r Aelodau mai tri munud a dim mwy sydd ganddynt.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mor ddiweddar â'r mis diwethaf, dywedodd cadeirydd Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yng ngogledd Cymru a Chaer yn y wasg:

Mae'n bryd i'r rhai sy'n rheoli ac yn gweinyddu'r cyllid sylwi bod economi Cymru o raid yn dod i ddibynnu fwyfwy ar fusnesau bach. Bydd buddsoddi yn y busnesau hyn yn datblygu twf cynaliadwy a chyflogaeth. Yn ogystal, bydd yr arian a gynhyrchir gan y buddsoddiad yn aros yng Nghymru ac yn llesol i economi Cymru...Cynigiwch grant neu fenthyciad i ddyn busnes a bydd yn meddwl am ffyrdd o wneud i'r arian hwnnw dyfu a datblygu ei fusnes. Cynigiwch yr arian i fiwrocrat a bydd yn meddwl am ffyrdd o'i wario...Efallai drwy fuddsoddi yn y busnesau hynny a all ei ddefnyddio mewn gwirionedd, y gallwn o'r diwedd symud i ffwrdd o waelodion rhestr cenhedloedd tlotaf yr Undeb Ewropeaidd.'

Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad newydd gan Goleg Imperial, Llundain a'r corff syniadau Reform ym mis Gorffennaf. Cofnododd hwn gryn anghydbwysedd economaidd rhwng rhanbarthau'r DU, gyda dibyniaeth drom ar fudd-daliadau a sectorau cyhoeddus mawr yng Nghymru. Dengys yr adroddiad na fu'r codiadau mawr mewn gwariant cyhoeddus yn y degawd hwn o les i Gymru ac y gall fod

on English taxpayers. The report argues that the coming period of public-spending slowdown gives an opportunity for a new policy direction for Wales, based on private-sector initiative. It says that Wales is, in effect, becoming a client area dependent on state employment and state funding. Public spending as a proportion of the economy is now 54 per cent in Wales compared with just 29 per cent in the south-east of England. As it says, the danger is that a vicious circle of economic inactivity will be created. As more people become dependent on the state for their jobs and incomes, there are fewer opportunities for small businesses to start up or to employ workers. Talented young people and modern industries, which are the lifeblood of future economic progress, will move from Wales, and the urgent need to address this was highlighted in the Confederation of British Industry's 2006 seminar in July. The wolf is not in the next valley; it is at the door. As a CBI senior economist stated, the rapid growth in public spending since 2001 is coming to an end, and there is a tight spending round ahead—in fact, there is zero-based budgeting in many programmes. He also commented that manufacturing, as a percentage of the Welsh workforce, had been fairly steady from 1984 to 1999, but that there have been big falls since then. It is now down to approximately 15 per cent. He also said that Wales has low total enterprise activity compared to other UK nations and regions.

As the Cardiff Business School stated, for much of the 1980s and 1990s, Wales was one of the most successful regions in the European Union in attracting inward investment. Wales received higher inward investment than any other UK nation or region, but, since 1997, it has fallen to eleventh position out of 12 in terms of the number of projects funded from inward investment.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has run out. I call on Nick Bourne.

**Nick Bourne:** This is an important debate, to which I am pleased to be able to contribute.

wedi cynyddu dibyniaeth ar drethdalwyr Lloegr. Dadleua'r adroddiad y gall y cyfnod sydd ar fin gwawrio o arafu mewn gwariant cyhoeddus fod yn gyfle i greu cyfeiriad polisi newydd yng Nghymru, ar sail menter y sector preifat. Dywed fod Cymru, mewn gwirionedd, yn dod yn ardal sy'n gleient, yn dibynnu ar gyflogaeth gan y wladwriaeth a chyllid y wladwriaeth. Mae gwariant cyhoeddus fel cyfran o'r economi bellach yn 54 y cant yng Nghymru o'i gymharu â dim ond 29 y cant yn ne-ddwyrain Lloegr. Fel y dywed, y perygl yw y bydd cylch cythreulig o anweithgarwch economaidd yn cael ei greu. Wrth i fwy o bobl fynd i ddbynnu ar y wladwriaeth am eu swyddi a'u hincwm, mae llai o gyfleoedd i fusnesau bach ddechrau neu gyflogi gweithwyr. Bydd pobl ifanc ddawnus a diwydiannau modern, sy'n hollol hanfodol o ran cynnydd economaidd y dyfodol, yn symud i ffwrdd o Gymru, a thynnwyd sylw at yr angen i fynd i'r afael â hyn ar fyrder yn seminar 2006 Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ym mis Gorffennaf. Nid yn y cwm agosaf y mae'r blaidd; mae wrth y drws. Fel y nododd un o uwch economyddion CDP, mae'r twf cyflym mewn gwario cyhoeddus ers 2001 yn dod i ben, ac mae rownd o wario tyn o'n blaenau—mewn gwirionedd, mae cyllidebu ar sail sero mewn sawl rhaglen. Soniodd hefyd fod gweithgynhyrchu, fel canran o weithlu Cymru, wedi bod yn eithaf cyson o 1984 i 1999, ond bod gostyngiadau mawr wedi bod ers hynny. Mae bellach i lawr i ryw 15 y cant. Dywedodd hefyd fod gan Gymru gyfanswm isel o weithgarwch menter o'i chymharu â gwledydd a rhanbarthau eraill yn y DU.

Fel y nododd Ysgol Fusnes Caerdydd, am ran helaeth o'r 1980au a'r 1990au, yr oedd Cymru'n un o'r rhanbarthau mwyaf llwyddiannus yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd o ran denu mewnfuddsoddiad. Cafodd Cymru fwy o fewnfuddsoddiad na dim un wlad neu ranbarth arall yn y DU, ond, ers 1997, mae wedi syrthio i'r unfed safle ar ddeg allan o 12 o ran nifer y prosiectau a ariennir gan fewnfuddsoddiad.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben. Yr wyf yn galw ar Nick Bourne.

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig, ac yr wyf yn falch o allu cyfrannu ati. Siaradodd

Alun Cairns spoke in a balanced way and set out the main issues that face Wales. I am deeply concerned about a line that the First Minister has taken. I know the First Minister well enough to know that he does not really believe that anyone who knocks the record of his Government is attacking Wales. He cannot possibly believe that. It is the hallmark of a totalitarian regime to suggest that if you start to criticise the Government, you are criticising the country. I wish that he were here to be able to contribute in this debate because it is important. I will never knock Wales, but I will knock the performance of this Government. That is not to say that it has been totally bad on the economy; there have been some successes. In looking at the economic inactivity rates we see that the progress there has been minimal. It has been much more minimal than in any other region of the UK, and it is a deeply disturbing figure. That is one criterion.

A second criterion, as has been correctly stated by Alun Cairns, is that we are the poorest region of the United Kingdom. Thirdly, across the country, there are greater regional disparities now than there were in the 1980s. These are three criteria that should be worrying the Government.

A fourth important issue to address is the current downturn in the economy—not just in Wales, admittedly; we have seen a number of manufacturing job losses in the UK over the last few weeks. We are getting regular statements on job losses and urgent questions on these issues. I have a great concern that that will increase, because we know that the economic position is such that it will; we are no longer in that cycle where everything in the economy is looking rosy—far from it. The gross value added figures are disturbing.

I will raise another issue, which I hope the Minister will address when he speaks. There is a concern, which perhaps Kirsty Williams, among others, has touched upon, about the fact that we are not just looking at growth in

Alun Cairns mewn ffordd gytbwys a nododd y prif broblemau sy'n wynebu Cymru. Yr wyf yn poeni'n fawr am drywydd y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i ddilyn. Yr wyf yn adnabod y Prif Weinidog yn ddigon da i wybod nad yw mewn gwirionedd yn credu bod unrhyw un sy'n lladd ar record ei Lywodraeth yn ymosod ar Gymru. Nid oes dim posibl iddo gredu hynny. Nodwedd ar drefn dotalitaraidd yw awgrymu eich bod yn beirniadu'r wlad os byddwch yn beirniadu'r Llywodraeth. Hoffwn pe bai yma i allu cyfrannu at y ddaedl hon gan ei bod yn bwysig. Ni wnaif byth ladd ar Gymru, ond fe laddaf ar berfformiad y Llywodraeth hon. Nid yw hynny'n gyfystyr â dweud ei bod wedi bod yn hollol wael o ran yr economi; cafwyd rhai llwyddiannau. Wrth astudio'r cyfraddau anweithgarwch economaidd gwelwn mai prin iawn fu'r cynnydd yn hynny o beth. Cafwyd llawer iawn llai o gynnydd nag mewn dim un rhanbarth arall yn y DU, ac mae'n ffigur sy'n peri cryn ofid. Dyna un maen prawf.

Yr ail faen prawf, fel y nodwyd yn gywir gan Alun Cairns, yw mai Cymru yw'r rhanbarth tloaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn drydydd, ledled y wlad, mae mwy o wahaniaethau rhanbarthol heddiw nag a oedd yn yr 1980au. Dyma dri maen prawf a ddylai fod yn peri gofid i'r Llywodraeth.

Y bedwaredd broblem bwysig i fynd i'r afael â hi yw'r dirywiad cyfredol yn yr economi—nid yng Nghymru'n unig, rhaid cyfaddef; yr ydym wedi gweld nifer o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu'n cael eu colli yn y DU yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Yr ydym yn cael datganiadau rheolaidd ynghylch y swyddi sy'n cael eu colli a chwestiynau brys am y problemau hyn. Yr wyf yn poeni'n fawr y bydd hynny'n cynyddu, gan ein bod yn gwybod bod y sefyllfa economaidd am beri i hynny ddigwydd; nid ydym mwyach yn y cylch hwnnw lle y mae popeth yn yr economi i'w weld yn hyfryd—dim o bellffordd. Mae'r ffigurau o ran gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn peri cryn bryder.

Codaf fater arall, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael ag ef pan fydd yn siarad. Mae pryder, y mae Kirsty Williams, ymhlith eraill, wedi ei grybwyll efallai, am y ffaith nad ydym yn edrych ar

the public sector. We welcome some, but not all, job increases in the public sector. We have to be careful; governments cannot pick winners in terms of the economy very often. However, I am concerned about growth in the service sector. Often, the headline will be, 'A large supermarket comes into town'. This was an issue at a meeting that I attended yesterday in Carmarthen. There will be lots of new jobs, but what about all the jobs that will be lost when that supermarket opens? We are not just talking about Carmarthen; there is a similar issue in Cardigan and Lampeter. Therefore, that is something else that I hope the Government is considering. In short, there are many issues of concern, and I hope that the Minister will address these. Criticism of the Government's record is not criticism—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Your time has run out. I call on Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** I also congratulate Alun Cairns on the sheer power, reason and logic that he employed in opening the debate. There has been some discussion about the importance of the economy; that is, in part, the reason why we introduced this debate today. I hope that the economy will be a major part of the debate as we lead up to the next Assembly elections. There is a great deal of concern about public services, health and education, but without a prosperous economy we do not have the funds to pay for any of the services that we want to see.

4.50 p.m.

There are many different interpretations of the various figures that have been mentioned today, but I want to consider the philosophy behind the figures. If you consider the figures, you can come up with anything. I know that the manufacturing industry is losing jobs because it is a changing world, but if we look at the figures between 1970 and the early 1990s, the proportion of manufacturing jobs in mid Wales increased from 8 per cent to about 24 per cent, as a direct result of Government intervention and policy. You can beat the trend through effective Government policy, but the Labour

dwf yn y sector cyhoeddus yn unig. Yr ydym yn croesawu rhai swyddi newydd yn y sector cyhoeddus, ond nid y cyfan ohonynt. Mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ofalus; ni all llywodraethau ddewis enillwyr o ran yr economi yn aml iawn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn poeni am dwf yn y sector gwasanaeth. Yn aml, ceir pennawd megis 'Archfarchnad fawr yn dod i'r dref'. Yr oedd hyn yn destun trafod mewn cyfarfod a fynychais ddoe yng Nghaerfyrddin. Bydd llawer o swyddi newydd, ond beth am yr holl swyddi a gollir pan fydd yr archfarchnad honno'n agor? Nid sôn am Gaerfyrddin yn unig yr ydym; mae problem debyg yn Aberteifi a Llanbedr Pont Steffan. Felly, dyna rywbeth arall y gobeithiaf fod y Llywodraeth yn ei ystyried. Yn fyr, mae llawer o bethau sy'n peri pryder, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhain. Nid yw beirniadu record y Llywodraeth yn feirniadaeth—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae eich amser ar ben. Yr wyf yn galw ar Glyn Davies.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf finnau hefyd yn llongyfarch Alun Cairns ar y pŵer, y rheswm a'r rhesymeg lwyr a ddefnyddiodd wrth agor y ddadl. Bu cryn drafod am bwysigrwydd yr economi; i ryw raddau, dyna'r rheswm y cyflwynasom y ddadl hon heddiw. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr economi yn rhan helaeth o'r ddadl wrth inni nesáu at etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad. Mae llawer iawn o bryder am wasanaethau cyhoeddus, iechyd ac addysg, ond heb economi ffyniannus nid yw'r cyllid gennym i dalu am ddim un o'r gwasanaethau yr hoffem eu gweld.

Mae sawl gwahanol ddehongliad o'r amrywiol ffigurau y soniwyd amdanynt heddiw, ond hoffwn ystyried yr athroniaeth y tu ôl i'r ffigurau. Os ystyriwch y ffigurau, fe allwch honni unrhyw beth. Yr wyf yn gwybod bod y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yn colli swyddi gan fod y byd yn newid, ond os edrychwn ar y ffigurau rhwng 1970 a dechrau'r 1990au, cynyddodd cyfran y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng nghanolbarth Cymru o 8 y cant i ryw 24 y cant, o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i ymyrraeth a pholisi'r Llywodraeth. Gallwch drechu'r duedd drwy bolisi Llywodraeth effeithiol, ond mae gan y



Party here, as it presents itself to the electorate, has a different philosophy to that of the Conservative Party regarding the role that the private sector can play.

Alun Cairns referred to the difference in the proportion of jobs created in the public sector in Wales, compared with the rest of the UK. Some of those are important, but that proportion is far higher than the proportion anywhere else. There is a real concern that the private sector in Wales, and the dynamism associated with the sector, is being squeezed out. That is very relevant in the parts of Wales that are outside the south-east corner.

I have two points to make in this debate, in what will be a short contribution. First, it is crucial that, during the debate that takes place over the next seven months, we focus on how we make Assembly policy relevant to the whole of Wales. If you go to different parts of north, south or mid Wales, you will see disengagement with the Assembly, which we have to address. In terms of the economy, that is definitely an issue. Secondly, on the point that Kirsty Williams raised on how we reach out to those people who are currently unable to work, it is sometimes difficult because they have been unemployed for a long time. However, in terms of childcare, that it is absolutely crucial—

**David Davies:** Will you give way?

**Glyn Davies:** Yes.

**David Davies:** There are many people out there who are unable to work because of childcare or health issues. However, sadly, there is a minority of perfectly able-bodied younger people who are capable of working if they chose to do so. Therefore, we should consider adopting some form of workfare scheme, so that we are not saddled with the spectacle of able-bodied 20-year-olds drinking strong lager in town centres such as Newport on a weekday afternoon.

**Glyn Davies:** There are many sectors of society that we need to target, and we must

Blaid Lafur yma, fel y mae'n cyflwyno'i hun i'r etholwyr, athroniaeth wahanol i athroniaeth y Blaid Geidwadol o ran y rôl y gall y sector preifat ei chwarae.

Cyfeiriodd Alun Cairns at y gwahaniaeth yng nghyfran y swyddi a grëwyd yn y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, o'i chymharu â gweddill y DU. Mae rhai o'r rheini'n bwysig, ond mae'r gyfran honno'n llawer uwch na'r gyfran yn unman arall. Mae gwir bryder bod y sector preifat yng Nghymru, a'r deinamigrwydd sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sector, yn cael ei wasgu allan. Mae hynny'n berthnasol iawn yn y rhannau o Gymru sydd y tu hwnt i gornel y de-ddwyrain.

Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w gwneud yn y ddadl hon, yn rhan o gyfraniad byr. Yn gyntaf, mae'n allweddol, yn ystod y ddadl sy'n digwydd dros y saith mis nesaf, inni ganolbwyntio ar sut y gallwn wneud polisi'r Cynulliad yn berthnasol i Gymru gyfan. Os ewch i wahanol rannau o'r gogledd, y de neu'r canolbarth, fe welwch ymddieithrio oddi wrth y Cynulliad, ac mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hyn. O ran yr economi, mae hynny'n broblem yn sicr. Yn ail, o ran y pwynt a gododd Kirsty Williams am y ffordd yr ydym yn cyrraedd y bobl hynny na allant weithio ar hyn o bryd, mae'n anodd weithiau am eu bod wedi bod yn ddi-waith ers cryn dipyn. Fodd bynnag, o ran gofal plant, mae hynny'n hollol hanfodol—

**David Davies:** A wnewch ildio?

**Glyn Davies:** Gwnaf.

**David Davies:** Mae llawer o bobl na allant weithio oherwydd problemau o ran gofal plant neu iechyd. Yn anffodus, fodd bynnag, ceir lleiafrif o bobl iau nad ydynt yn anabl o gwbl a allai weithio pe byddent yn dewis gwneud hynny. O ganlyniad, dylem ystyried mabwysiadu rhyw fath o gynllun sy'n mynnu bod y rhai sy'n cael budd-daliadau'n gweithio os gallant wneud hynny, fel nad oes rhaid inni weld pobl 20 oed nad ydynt yn anabl yn yfed lager cryf yng nghanol trefi fel Casnewydd yng nghanol y prynhawn yn ystod yr wythnos.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae sawl sector yn y gymdeithas y mae angen inni eu targedu, ac

target them in different ways. I want to concentrate on the importance of childcare. We should make it easy for everyone who wishes to return to work—every young parent—to do so. That is not just for social justice reasons, which are usually the reasons behind debates here; we should also be targeting this for economic development reasons. That is absolutely crucial if we are to take full advantage of all the people in Wales who could contribute to our economy.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** Were it not for the opening phrase, I am sure that we could all have readily supported the motion. I accept wholeheartedly the central role that indigenous business has to play in the future success of the Welsh economy. That is our vision as a Government. However, this motion implies that our businesses have not delivered, which is a curious suggestion from the party that claims to be business friendly. The evidence shows that its attack on Welsh business is as baseless as the rest of its policies, although, of course, it does not have any. I listened with great care to what Alun Cairns, his leader and every other contributor from the Tory benches were saying. I did not hear one policy suggestion; there was some grudging praise for our record, but none of the Tories came forward with a policy proposal this afternoon.

**Alun Cairns:** The Minister said that he listened carefully to our party's contributions—he could hardly listen to anyone from his own party because they did not contribute. The key point is that, had he listened to the last part of what I said, he would have heard me clearly highlighting what was needed, what is being neglected and why you are failing.

**Andrew Davies:** Once again, after being given the opportunity, you have not come forward with any concrete proposals. If you look at the facts, and I will quote them—although the Tories do not like hearing them—the latest figures show a continuing increase in relative GVA per head in Wales.

mae'n rhaid inni eu targedu mewn gwahanol ffyrdd. Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar bwysigrwydd gofal plant. Dylem ei gwneud yn hawdd i bawb sydd am ddechwyn i'r gwaith—pob rhiant ifanc—wneud hynny. Nid yw hynny am resymau'n ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn unig, sef y rhesymau y tu ôl i ddadleuon yma fel arfer; dylem hefyd fod yn targedu hyn am resymau'n ymwneud â datblygu economaidd. Mae hynny'n hollol allweddol er mwyn inni fanteisio'n llawn ar yr holl bobl yng Nghymru a allai gyfrannu at ein heconomi.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Oni bai am yr ymadrodd agoriadol, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem oll fod wedi cefnogi'r cynnig â chroeso. Yr wyf yn derbyn yn gyfan gwbl y rôl ganolog sydd gan fusnesau brodorol i'w chwarae yn llwyddiant economi Cymru yn y dyfodol. Dyna ein gweledigaeth fel Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnig hwn yn awgrymu nad yw ein busnesau wedi cyflawni, sy'n awgrym rhyfedd gan y blaid sy'n honni bod yn gyfaill i fusnesau. Dengys y dystiolaeth fod ei hymosodiad ar fyd busnes Cymru mor ddi-sail â gweddill ei pholisïau, er nad oes ganddi rai wrth reswm. Gwrandewais yn astud ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Alun Cairns, ei arweinydd a phob cyfrannydd arall o'r meinciau Ceidwadol. Ni chlywais ddim un awgrym o ran polisi; cafwyd rhywfaint o glod crintachlyd i'n record, ond ni chyflwynodd dim un o'r Ceidwadwyr gynnig ym maes polisi y prynhawn yma.

**Alun Cairns:** Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei fod wedi gwranddo'n astud ar gyfraniadau ein plaid—prin y gallai wrando ar neb o'i blaid ei hun gan na wnaethant gyfrannu. Y pwynt allweddol yw, pe byddai wedi gwranddo ar ran olaf yr hyn a ddywedais, byddai wedi fy nghlywed yn glir yn tynnu sylw at yr hyn a oedd ei angen, yr hyn sy'n cael ei esgeuluso a pham yr ydych yn methu.

**Andrew Davies:** Unwaith eto, ar ôl cael y cyfle, nid ydych wedi cyflwyno dim cynigion cadarn. Os edrychwch ar y ffeithiau, ac fe ddyfynnaf hwy—er nad yw'r Ceidwadwyr yn hoff o'u clywed—dengys y ffigurau diweddaraf gynnydd cyson mewn gwerth ychwanegol crynswth cymharol y pen yng

The sharp decline in relative GVA per head in the mid 1990s was arrested in 1999. Why was there that decline in GVA? We all know why—as Kirsty Williams rightly said, although she could not bring herself to mention the word ‘Conservatives’, it was because there was a Conservative Government from 1979. In 1979, 7 million people were working in manufacturing in the UK—that is now halved. Some 360,000 jobs—20,000 a year—were lost in Welsh manufacturing between 1979 and 1997 under the Tories. However, the growth in GVA per head in Wales has more than kept pace with the UK average for the last five years; indeed, Wales saw a bigger than average percentage increase of 5 per cent in total GVA in 2004. As I have said, the relative decline in Welsh GVA per head goes back to the early 1990s, long before the creation of the Assembly. I notice that Mark Isherwood and others quote 1984 in their statistics—they do not go back to 1979, and the early, disastrous policies of Geoffrey Howe and the deflationary budget of 1981, which decimated Welsh manufacturing.

As I said, the relative decline in Welsh GVA per head goes back to the early 1990s under the Conservatives. Indeed, since 1999, and Labour coming to power in the UK and in the Assembly, the decline has been arrested, and the gap is beginning to close. If you consider the figures, of the regions and nations of the UK, only London and south-east and east England have GVA per head that is above the UK average. If you take the components of GVA that most directly affect the residents of Wales—namely, the total compensation of employees—Wales has had the biggest increase of all of any part of the UK, that of 5.8 per cent.

If you look at people’s incomes, gross disposable household income per head in west Wales and the Valleys, and east Wales, since 1999, has outstripped the UK average. Also, growth in full-time earnings has exceeded growth in the UK over the last four years. That is hardly economic decline.

Nghymru. Cafodd y gostyngiad sydyn mewn GYC cymharol y pen yng nghanol yr 1990au ei atal yn 1999. Pam y cafwyd y gostyngiad hwnnw mewn GYC? Yr ydym oll yn gwybod pam—fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams yn briodol, er na allai ddarbwylllo ei hun i sôn am y gair ‘Ceidwadwyr’, digwyddodd hynny am fod Llywodraeth Geidwadol o 1979. Yn 1979, yr oedd 7 miliwn o bobl yn gweithio mewn gweithgynhyrchu yn y DU—mae hynny wedi’i haneru bellach. Collwyd rhyw 360,000 o swyddi—2,000 y flwyddyn—yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru rhwng 1979 a 1997 o dan y Ceidwadwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae’r twf mewn GYC y pen yng Nghymru wedi gwneud mwy na dal ati ar yr un raddfa â chyfartaledd y DU yn y pum mlynedd diwethaf; yn wir, cafwyd yng Nghymru gynnydd canrannol mwy na’r cyfartaledd o 5 y cant yng nghyfanswm y GYC yn 2004. Fel y dywedais, mae’r gostyngiad cymharol yn y GYC y pen yng Nghymru yn deillio o ddechrau’r 1990au, ymhell cyn creu’r Cynulliad. Sylwaf fod Mark Isherwood ac eraill yn dyfynnu 1984 yn eu hystadegau—nid ydynt yn mynd yn ôl at 1979, a pholisïau cynnar, trychinebus Geoffrey Howe a chyllideb 1981 a achosodd ddatychwyddiant, y gyllideb a ddifrododd weithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

Fel y dywedais, mae’r gostyngiad cymharol yn y GYC y pen yng Nghymru yn deillio o ddechrau’r 1990au o dan y Ceidwadwyr. Yn wir, ers 1999, a Llafur yn dod i rym yn y DU ac yn y Cynulliad, ataliwyd y gostyngiad, ac mae’r bwlch yn dechrau cau. Os ystyriwch y ffigurau, o’r rhanbarthau a’r gwledydd yn y DU, dim ond Llundain a de-ddwyrain a dwyrain Lloegr sydd â GYC y pen sy’n uwch na chyfartaledd y DU. Os ystyriwch yr elfennau o ran GYC sy’n effeithio’n fwyaf uniongyrchol ar breswylwyr Cymru—sef cyfanswm iawndal cyflogeion—yng Nghymru y bu’r cynnydd mwyaf un o unrhyw ran o’r DU, sef 5.8 y cant.

Os ystyriwch incwm pobl, mae incwm gwario gros aelwydydd y pen yng ngorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd, a dwyrain Cymru, ers 1999, wedi bod yn fwy na chyfartaledd y DU. Hefyd, mae’r twf mewn enillion llawnamser wedi rhagori ar y twf yn y DU yn ystod y pedair blynedd diwethaf. Prin bod hynny’n ddirywiad economaidd.

These numbers show that, since the creation of the Assembly in 1999, the economic decline that we saw under the Conservatives has been arrested, and, indeed, the gap under Labour is beginning to close. The new powers that we are getting under the Government of Wales Act next year will further enhance our capacity to deliver. Our businesses are performing well. In Wales, 70 per cent of businesses registering for VAT in 2001 were still in existence three years later, compared with a survival rate in the UK of 64.2 per cent. This survival rate is 1 percentage point above the UK average.

Wales has also maintained an employment rate well above its historical average, with an additional 126,000 jobs being created since the start of the Assembly in 1999, and with a record number of people in employment in Wales. The accusation that these are public sector jobs is not borne out by the figures; Wales is the only part of the United Kingdom since 1991 where the growth in private sector employment has exceeded that of the public sector. In fact, employment in Wales has increased by 10 per cent since devolution, compared with a 7 per cent increase for the UK as a whole over the same period.

The people of Wales will not need much reminding of what Tory policies did. As Kirsty Williams rightly said, the Tories decimated much of the manufacturing industry and discarded hundreds of thousands of people onto the scrapheap of long-term unemployment. Labour's policies are delivering. The award of a second round of European funding for 2007-13 means that an extra £1.3 billion of grant will be available to help west Wales and the Valleys to complete its economic transformation.

We are giving a much higher priority to knowledge, innovation and growth, and placing more emphasis on people, tackling economic inactivity and improving skill levels—the very point that was made by several speakers earlier. We want to encourage new and innovative approaches to

Dengys y ffigurau hyn fod y dirywiad economaidd a welsom o dan y Ceidwadwyr wedi cael ei atal, ers creu'r Cynulliad yn 1999, ac, yn wir, mae'r bwch yn dechrau cau o dan y Blaid Lafur. Bydd y pwerau newydd a gawn o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru y flwyddyn nesaf yn cryfhau ymhellach ein gallu i gyflawni. Mae ein busnesau'n perfformio'n dda. Yng Nghymru, yr oedd 70 y cant o'r busnesau a gofrestrodd ar gyfer TAW yn 2001 yn dal i fodoli dair blynedd yn ddiweddarach, o'i gymharu â chyfradd goroesi o 64.2 y cant yn y DU. Mae'r gyfradd oroesi hon 1 pwynt canran uwchlaw cyfartaledd y DU.

Mae Cymru hefyd wedi cynnal cyfradd gyflogaeth ymhell uwchlaw ei chyfartaledd hanesyddol, gyda 126,000 o swyddi ychwanegol yn cael eu creu ers dechrau'r Cynulliad yn 1999, a mwy o bobl mewn cyflogaeth yng Nghymru nag erioed o'r blaen. Nid yw'r cyhuddiad mai swyddi sector cyhoeddus yw'r rhain yn cael ei gadarnhau gan y ffigurau; Cymru yw'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig ers 1991 lle y mae'r twf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector preifat wedi rhagori ar dwf mewn cyflogaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mewn gwirionedd, mae cyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu 10 y cant ers datganoli, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o 7 y cant ar gyfer y DU gyfan yn ystod yr un cyfnod.

Ni fydd angen atgoffa pobl Cymru am yr hyn a wnaeth polisiau'r Ceidwadwyr. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams yn briodol, difrododd y Ceidwadwyr lawer o'r diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu a thafu cannoedd o filoedd o bobl i domen sbwriel diweithdra hirdymor. Mae polisiau Llafur yn cyflawni. Mae dyfarnu ail rownd o nawdd Ewropeaidd ar gyfer 2007-13 yn golygu y bydd £1.3 biliwn ychwanegol o grant ar gael i helpu gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd i gwblhau eu gweddnewidiad economaidd.

Yr ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth lawer uwch i wybodaeth, arloesi a thwf, ac yn rhoi mwy o bwyslais ar bobl, mynd i'r afael ag anweithgarwch economaidd a gwella lefelau sgiliau—yr union bwynt a wnaed gan sawl siaradwr yn gynharach. Yr ydym am annog dulliau newydd ac arloesol o gynyddu gallu

increasing business competitiveness and employment. Therefore, the new programmes are not simply more of the same, but more of the best, taking forward existing interventions, with a proven track record of success, as well as seeking innovative new ideas. This week's announcement by the European Commission that, as a Government, we are rated the best in Europe for managing European funds is excellent news for Wales and further demonstrates our efficient and effective use of structural funds.

5.00 p.m.

Instead of making groundless criticisms of our business community, we are determined to build on this success and to deliver for the people of Wales. All this points to a healthy economy in Wales, albeit one that is not without its challenges. However, I believe that the Assembly Government and particularly my new department are well up to the task. I urge you, therefore, to reject this motion.

**Alun Cairns:** It is a pleasure to wind up the debate, especially after so many contributions from the Labour Party given that this is central to its election campaign. It is quite clear that the Minister is desperate for support when he cannot even muster anyone from his own party to support what he is saying. There was a pretty fair balance among the opposition parties in recognising some elements of success but focusing on the failures. It seems that the attitude of the Minister for economic development is that if he does not agree with the figures, he will try to present an argument; if he has no better figures to offer, he will simply deny that they exist.

He particularly picked up on, and denied the existence of, the figures on the creation of public sector jobs in the Welsh economy over the past 12 months. I point him to page 8 of his paper to the last Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee, which included an employment survey from the Office for National Statistics clearly showing that, of the 21,000 new jobs created in the Welsh economy last year, 10,000 were in the public sector—twice the rate of that for the UK

busnesau i gystadlu a chyflogaeth. Felly, nid rhagor o'r un peth yn unig yw'r rhaglenni newydd, ond rhagor o'r gorau, gan ddatblygu'r ymyriadau presennol, gyda record sicr o lwyddiant, yn ogystal â chwilio am syniadau newydd arloesol. Mae'r cyhoeddiad yr wythnos hon gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd sy'n nodi mai ni, fel Llywodraeth, fe fernir, yw'r gorau yn Ewrop am reoli cronfeydd Ewropeaidd yn newyddion ardderchog i Gymru ac yn dangos ymhellach y modd effeithlon ac effeithiol yr ydym yn defnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol.

Yn lle beirniadu ein cymuned fusnes heb sail, yr ydym yn benderfynol o adeiladu ar y llwyddiant hwn, a chyflawni ar ran pobl Cymru. Mae hyn i gyd yn pwyntio at economi iach yng Nghymru, er bod sawl her i'w hwynebu. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac yn enwedig fy adran newydd yn berffaith abl i wneud y gwaith. Fe'ch anogaf, felly, i wrthod y cynnig hwn.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n bleser dirwyn y ddatl i ben, yn enwedig ar ôl cynifer o gyfraniadau gan y Blaid Lafur o gofio bod hyn yn ganolog i'w hymgyrch etholiadol. Mae'n berffaith amlwg bod y Gweinidog yn daer am gefnogaeth pan na all hyd yn oed alw ar neb o'i blaid ei hun i gefnogi'r hyn y mae'n ei ddweud. Yr oedd cydbwysedd eithaf teg ymysg y gwrthbleidiau wrth gydnabod rhai elfennau llwyddiannus ond gan ganolbwyntio ar y methiannau. Mae'n ymddangos mai agwedd y Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd yw os nad ydyw'n cytuno â'r ffigurau, y bydd yn ceisio cyflwyno dadl; os nad oes ganddo ffigurau gwell i'w cynnig, bydd yn gwadu eu bod yn bodoli.

Cododd bwynt yn arbennig ynghylch y ffigurau ar greu swyddi sector cyhoeddus yn economi Cymru dros y 12 mis diwethaf, a gwadodd eu bodolaeth. Fe'i cyfeiriaf at dudalen 8 yn ei bapur i'r Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau diwethaf, a oedd yn cynnwys arolwg cyflogaeth gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Cenedlaethol a ddangosai'n glir, o'r 21,000 o swyddi newydd a grëwyd yn economi Cymru y llynedd, fod 10,000 yn y sector cyhoeddus—cymaint ddwywaith â'r

alone. That demonstrates our worry that, although some public sector jobs provide positive long-term prospects, in the short and medium term, they will not rebuild the private sector.

That is why the thinktank Reform has highlighted that regional economic performance has become increasingly imbalanced. It clearly highlights that the north east of England, Wales and Northern Ireland are in danger of becoming 'Whitehall's last colonies'. That is obviously a result of the past eight years of the Welsh Assembly Government administration's lack of success.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you agree that we should not take lessons from a Government that bequeathed us economic meltdown? The manufacturing company that my father worked for back in 1978—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Members drowned that out, and I did not hear a word of what Mark said. Could you please repeat it? I would like to hear what you said—[*Interruption.*] Order. I have no problems with occasional interruptions, but prolonged sedentary interruptions designed to break up what a person is trying to say are not permissible.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you share my concern that the economic meltdown that was inherited in 1979—it was already in place at that time—destroyed, for instance, hundreds of jobs in the manufacturing company for which my father worked in 1978, which was a year before the Conservatives came to power? Do you share my concern that, according to July's official figures, the number of people of working age not in work in Wales has now reached almost 30 per cent—a rise over the last year, and a rise over the term of the Assembly since 2003?

**Alun Cairns:** I am so glad that you had the opportunity to repeat those figures, because it is obvious from the barracking and the shouting that we heard from the Labour

raddfa ar gyfer y Deyrnas Unedig yn unig. Mae hynny'n amlygu ein pryder, er y bydd rhai swyddi sector cyhoeddus yn rhoi rhagolygon cadarnhaol ar gyfer y tymor hir, na lwyddant yn y tymor byr a chanolig i ailadeiladu'r sector preifat.

Dyna pam y mae'r corff syniadau Reform wedi pwysleisio bod perfformiad economaidd y rhanbarthau wedi mynd yn fwyfwy anghybwys. Mae'n tanlinellu'n glir fod perygl i ogledd-ddwyrain Lloegr, Cymru a gogledd Iwerddon fynd yn 'drefedigaethau olaf Whitehall'. Mae hynny'n amlwg yn ganlyniad yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf o ddiffyg llwyddiant gweinyddiaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn cytuno na ddylem gymryd gwersi oddi wrth Lywodraeth a adawodd fethiant economaidd llwyr inni? Yr oedd y cwmni gweithgynhyrchu a gyflogai fy nhad ym 1978—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Boddwyd hynny gan Aelodau, ac ni chlywais air o'r hyn a ddywedodd Mark. A allech ei ailadrodd, os gwelwch yn dda? Hoffwn glywed yr hyn a ddywedaso—[*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Nid yw ambell ymyriad yn peri trafferth imi, ond nid yw torri ar draws yn barhaus ar eich eistedd gyda'r bwriad o amharu ar yr hyn y mae rhywun yn ceisio'i ddweud yn dderbyniol.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod y methiant economaidd llwyr a etifeddwyd yn 1979—yr oedd yn bod eisoes erbyn hynny—wedi distrywio, er enghraifft, cannoedd o swyddi yn y cwmni gweithgynhyrchu y gweithiai fy nhad iddo yn 1978, flwyddyn cyn i'r Ceidwadwyr ddod i rym? A ydych yn pryderu yr un fath â fi fod nifer y bobl o oedran gweithio nad ydynt mewn gwaith yng Nghymru, yn ôl ffigurau swyddogol mis Gorffennaf, bellach wedi cyrraedd bron 30 y cant—cynnydd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, a chynnydd yn ystod tymor y Cynulliad ers 2003?

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf mor falch ichi gael cyfle i ailadrodd y ffigurau hynny, oherwydd y mae'n amlwg oddi wrth yr hwtio a'r gweiddi a glywsom oddi wrth y grŵp Llafur

group that they did not want to hear it. Well, they were forced to hear it for a second time. It was also interesting to note that, when Mark Isherwood sought to intervene, Leighton Andrews shouted across, 'Well, he would give way, anyway'. I will happily give way to any Labour Members, because they did not even have the courtesy to seek to make an argument during the debate. They prefer to shout down well reasoned arguments, clearly embarrassing their Government and administration.

**Leighton Andrews** *rose—*

**Alun Cairns:** I will give way in a moment. We are the poorest region or nation of the United Kingdom, and that is your eight-year legacy to the next incoming Conservative administration to the Assembly.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** You can quote figures all you like but, unfortunately, many people here, especially those who lived in the south Wales Valleys, remember the reality of Tory rule. We remember 130,000 people being unemployed in Wales as a direct result of your stewardship of the Welsh economy. You were responsible for our qualifying for Objective 1 funding in the first place; you have absolutely nothing to crow about.

**Alun Cairns:** It smacks of absolute desperation when the core theme of the Minister's argument involves going back to 1979—when I was still at primary school. He even had the gall to say that there were 8 million manufacturing jobs in Wales in 1979. Minister, just five months ago, there were 8,000 more manufacturing jobs in Wales. That number of jobs has been lost in the last five months alone. That is your record. I will happily debate 1979, but I want to look forward to the future, and I look forward to a future when you are not sitting on that front bench.

nad oedd arnynt eisiau eu clywed. Wel, cawsant eu gorfodi i'w clywed eilwaith. Yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol nodi, hefyd, pan geisiodd Mark Isherwood ymyrryd, fod Leighton Andrews wedi gweiddi, 'Wel, fe fyddai'n ildio, beth bynnag'. Ildiaf yn llawen i unrhyw Aelodau Llafur, oherwydd nid oedd ganddynt y cwrteisi hyd yn oed i geisio dadlau yn ystod y ddadl. Mae'n well ganddynt floeddio ar draws dadleuon rhesymol, gan beri annifyrrwch amlwg i'w Llywodraeth a'u gweinyddiaeth.

**Leighton Andrews** *a gododd—*

**Alun Cairns:** Ildiaf mewn munud. Ni yw'r rhanbarth neu'r genedl dlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a dyna'r hyn yr ydych yn ei adael wedi wyth mlynedd i'r weinyddiaeth Geidwadol nesaf a ddaw i'r Cynulliad.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Gallwch ddyfynnu hynny a fynnoch o ffigurau ond, yn anffodus, mae llawer o bobl yma, yn enwedig y rhai a oedd yn byw yng nghymoedd y De, yn cofio realiti teyrnasiad y Torïaid. Cofiw'n 130,000 o bobl yn ddi-waith yng Nghymru o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'ch stiwardiaeth chi ar economi Cymru. Chi oedd yn gyfrifol ein bod yn gymwys ar gyfer arian Amcan 1 yn y lle cyntaf; nid oes gennych ddim byd o gwbl i glochdar amdano.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n sawru o anobaith llwyr pan fo thema greiddiol dadl y Gweinidog yn mynd â ni'n ôl i 1979—pan oeddwn i'n dal yn yr ysgol gynradd. Yr oedd ganddo'r wyneb hyd yn oed i ddweud bod 8 miliwn o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru yn 1979. Weinidog, gwta bum mis yn ôl, yr oedd 8,000 yn fwy o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru. Collwyd cymaint â hynny o swyddi yn y pum mis diwethaf yn unig. Dyna'ch record chi. Yr wyf yn fodlon dadlau ynghylch 1979, ond mae arnaf eisiau edrych ymlaen at y dyfodol, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ddyfodol pryd na fyddwch chi'n eistedd ar y fainc flaen.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 1: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda



*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3207 as amended:

Cynnig NDM3207 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*deplores the prosperity gap which exists between Wales and the regions of the UK and calls upon the Welsh Assembly Government to recognise the vital role of Welsh business and Welsh entrepreneurs in developing sustainable growth and development.*

*yn gresynu at y bwlch cyfoeth sy'n bodoli rhwng Cymru a rhanbarthau'r DU ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gydnabod rôl hollbwysig busnesau Cymru ac entrepreneuriaid Cymru o ran datblygu twf a datblygiad cynaliadwy.*

*recognises the need to evaluate all of our available assets in order to stimulate the small and medium-sized enterprise sector in all regions of Wales.*

*yn cydnabod yr angen i werthuso'r holl asedau sydd ar gael gennym, er mwyn ysgogi'r sector busnesau bach a chanolig ym mhob rhanbarth o Gymru.*

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amended motion: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
Motion as amended defeated.*

### **Strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd The Heads of the Valleys Strategy**

Motion (NDM3211): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3211): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *welcomes the publication of 'Turning Heads: A Strategy for the Heads of the Valleys 2020' with its accompanying action plan;*

2. *joins the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks in congratulating all the partner organisations for their endeavour in producing the strategy;*

3. *gives full support to all organisations and people involved in working together to deliver change for those who live, work and play in the Heads of the Valleys.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*ensures that measures to increase prosperity must recognise that the basic requirements for increasing skills and creating an attractive living and working environment in the Heads of the Valleys are incompatible with the development of large-scale destructive and dirty industries.*

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*endorses the need for focusing on increasing prosperity in the areas identified in the strategy, but recognises other Heads of the Valleys areas also need extra assistance.*

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the allocation of additional appropriate resources following the recent inclusion of the Rhondda Fawr within the strategy.*

Amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the importance of putting ICT at*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

1. *yn croesawu cyhoeddi 'Syniadau Blaengar: Strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd 2020', gyda'i gynllun gweithredu ategol;*

2. *yn ymuno â'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wrth longyfarch pob sefydliad partner ar eu hymdrech i gynhyrchu'r strategaeth.*

3. *yn rhoi ei gefnogaeth lwyr i'r holl sefydliadau ac unigolion sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau newid ym mywydau'r bobl sy'n byw, gweithio a chwarae ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn sicrhau bod rhaid i fesurau i gynyddu ffyniant gydnabod bod y gofynion sylfaenol ar gyfer cynyddu sgiliau a chreu amgylchedd byw a gwaith atyniadol ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd yn anghydnaws â datblygiad diwydiannau graddfa fawr sy'n ddinistriol ac yn fudr.*

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cymeradwyo'r angen i ganolbwyntio ar gynyddu ffyniant yn yr ardaloedd a bennir yn y strategaeth, ond yn cydnabod bod ardaloedd eraill ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd hefyd angen rhagor o gymorth.*

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddyrannu adnoddau priodol ychwanegol yn dilyn cynnwys Rhondda Fawr o fewn y strategaeth yn ddiweddar.*

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gosod TGCh wrth*

*the heart of the strategy.*

Amendment 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the crucial importance of involving local people and local partnerships in the delivery of the strategy.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies and amendments 4 and 5 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I regret that I have to do this but, after the amendments have been proposed, I will impose a strict three-minute time limit. Even then, I am not sure whether we can get everyone in.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. *welcomes the publication of 'Turning Heads: A Strategy for the Heads of the Valleys 2020' with its accompanying action plan;*

2. *joins the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks in congratulating all the partner organisations for their endeavour in producing the strategy;*

3. *gives full support to all organisations and people involved in working together to deliver change for those who live, work and play in the Heads of the Valleys. (NDM3211)*

I am delighted to be able to present this strategy for the Heads of the Valleys. This departure represents a tremendous opportunity to develop a new future for a part of Wales that is facing the challenges of economic, social and environmental change. The focus that underpins this strategy is developing a new confidence in the Heads of the Valleys: the confidence to stay and sustain unique communities; to move into the area and enjoy the quality of life that it offers; and the confidence to invest and play

*galon y strategaeth.*

Gwelliant 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd allweddol cynnwys pobl leol a phartneriaethau lleol wrth gyflwyno'r strategaeth.*

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 4 a 5 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf orfod gwneud hyn, ond wedi i'r gwelliannau gael eu cynnig, gosodaf derfyn amser caeth o dri munud. Hyd yn oed wedyn, nid wyf yn siŵr a allwn gael pawb i mewn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *yn croesawu cyhoeddi 'Syniadau Blaengar: Strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd 2020', gyda'i gynllun gweithredu ategol;*

2. *yn ymuno â'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wrth longyfarch pob sefydliad partner ar eu hymdrech i gynhyrchu'r strategaeth;*

3. *yn rhoi ei gefnogaeth lwyr i'r holl sefydliadau ac unigolion sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau newid ym mywydau'r bobl sy'n byw, gweithio a chwarae ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd. (NDM3211)*

Mae'n bleser gennyf allu cyflwyno'r strategaeth hon ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r fenter hon yn cynnig cyfle gwych i ddatblygu dyfodol newydd i ran o Gymru sydd yn wynebu her newid economaidd, cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol. Y canolbwynt sydd yn sail i'r strategaeth hon yw datblygu hyder newydd ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd: yr hyder i aros a chynnal cymunedau unigryw; i symud i mewn i'r ardal a mwynhau'r ansawdd bywyd y mae'n ei gynnig; a'r hyder i fuddsoddi a chwarae

a role in making the Valleys a key part of Wales's capital region.

Our aim is to achieve the reinvention of the Valleys economy, ensuring sustainable development and employment for Valleys communities as part of a high value, dynamic Welsh economy. These communities possess a deep commitment and pride in their identity, culture and heritage, which can act as a bedrock for creating a diverse and sustainable economy for the future. Right across the Valleys, communities are carving out a new future, based on better access to high quality services, better transport, better health and housing, as well as improved skills for all. Communities First action plans and community strategies set out these visions for the future.

5.10 p.m.

The Heads of the Valleys strategy brings these common aspirations together. It provides support in tackling issues that cross administrative boundaries, and it ensures the economies of scale and the collective resource base required to deal with common challenges. It recognises a distinct role and character for every settlement, and it will make a real difference—one that will be felt over time throughout the region. This will be made evident through the reinvention of the Valleys environment. The Valleys are greener and cleaner today than they have been for 200 years, but we intend to go much further. The strategy provides a major impetus for completing the reclamation of contaminated sites and landscapes. Already this year, five major landscape transformation schemes are being implemented, which, between them, will bring back into public use more than 1,000 hectares of land. Keeping the new Valleys environment clean and attractive is already a priority to local partners, and the strategy supports this work by bringing together resources to tackle remaining blights on the landscape.

The strategy also aims to change perceptions. We will do more to promote employment and leisure opportunities to Valleys residents by

rhan mewn gwneud y Cymoedd yn rhan allweddol o uwch ranbarth Cymru.

Ein nod yw llwyddo i ailddyfeisio economi'r Cymoedd, gan sicrhau datblygiad a chyflogaeth gynaliadwy i gymunedau'r Cymoedd fel rhan o economi Gymreig ddynamig, sydd â gwerth uchel. Mae'r cymunedau hyn yn meddu ar ymrwymiad dwfn a balchder yn eu hunaniaeth, eu diwylliant a'u treftadaeth, a all weithredu fel sylfaen i greu economi amrywiol a chynaliadwy i'r dyfodol. Ar draws y Cymoedd benbaladr, mae cymunedau'n creu dyfodol newydd, yn seiliedig ar well mynediad at wasanaethau o ansawdd da, gwell trafndiaeth, gwell iechyd a thai, yn ogystal â gwell sgiliau i bawb. Mae cynlluniau gweithredu a strategaethau cymunedol Cymunedau'n Gyntaf yn amlinellu'r gweledigaethau hyn ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Daw strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd â'r dyheadau cyffredin hyn ynghyd. Mae'n cynnig cefnogaeth i fynd i'r afael â materion sydd yn croesi ffiniau gweinyddol, ac yn sicrhau'r arbedion maint a'r sylfaen adnoddau angenrheidiol i ddelio â heriau cyffredin. Mae'n cydnabod rôl a chymeriad arbennig i bob anheddiad, a bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn—un a deimlir gydag amser drwy'r rhanbarth cyfan. Daw hyn yn amlwg drwy ailddyfeisio amgylchedd y Cymoedd. Mae'r Cymoedd yn wyrddach ac yn lanach heddiw nag y maent wedi bod ers 200 mlynedd, ond bwriadwn fynd yn llawer pellach. Mae'r strategaeth yn darparu hwb mawr ar gyfer cwblhau adfer safleoedd a thirweddau halogedig. Eisoes eleni, mae pum cynllun trawsnewid tirwedd mawr ar waith a fydd, rhyngddynt, yn dod â mwy na 1,000 hectar o dir yn ôl i ddefnydd cyhoeddus. Mae cadw amgylchedd newydd y Cymoedd yn lân ac yn ddeniadol eisoes yn flaenoriaeth i bartneriaid lleol, ac mae'r strategaeth yn cefnogi'r gwaith hwn drwy ddod ag adnoddau ynghyd i fynd i'r afael â phethau sydd yn dal i hagru'r dirwedd.

Mae'r strategaeth hefyd yn ceisio newid y ffordd y gwelir y rhanbarth. Gwnawn fwy i hybu cyflogaeth a chyfleoedd hamdden i

doing this. We shall also act to change the perception of those living outside the Valleys and dispel irrational and outdated misconceptions. The Valleys have a diversity and quality of landscape to rival the best in the UK and Europe, within easy access of urban centres. There have already been early actions, such as a training charter for local people to capitalise on potential growth in the construction sector, and the harnessing of the massive power of the £1 billion annually of public sector spending for improving local business prospects.

**Leanne Wood:** Clearly, what you are saying is that the regeneration of the Valleys is a matter of social, as well as economic, questions. We all know that regeneration means more than just building a road. In his conference speech today, Tony Blair said that, in the 1980s, council house sales were first suggested by Labour people, but were shelved for being too difficult and too divisive. We lost a generation of aspiring working class people on the back of it. Accepting that you cannot work without a house, and that social housing is scarce as a result of the right to buy scheme, do you agree with Blair?

**Andrew Davies:** I certainly agree with the Chancellor of the Exchequer, whose speech I was privileged to hear at the party conference yesterday. He talked about greatly increased investment in the public housing stock, and a key element of the Heads of the Valleys strategy is working with local partners, particularly local authorities, on a massive investment to improve the public sector housing stock in the region.

In June, I welcomed the approval of environmental projects in each of the five local authority areas. This debate provides an opportunity for Members to consider the work that has already been undertaken, and our plans for the future of the Heads of the Valleys.

With regard to the amendments tabled, I reject Jocelyn Davies's amendment 1 on large-scale industries, as there is no precise definition of what might be considered a 'destructive and dirty' industry. However, I

drigolion y Cymoedd drwy wneud hyn. Gweithredwn hefyd i newid syniadau pobl sydd yn byw y tu allan i'r Cymoedd a chwalu camsyniadau afresymegol a hen ffasiwn. Mae gan y Cymoedd amrywiaeth ac ansawdd o ran tirwedd syddystal â'r gorau yn y Deyrnas Unedig ac Ewrop, o fewn cyrraedd hawdd i ganolfannau trefol. Eisoes cafwyd camau gweithredu cynnar, megis siarter hyfforddi i bobl leol elwa o dwf posibl yn y sector adeiladu, a harneisio grym anferth y £1 biliwn blynyddol o wariant sector cyhoeddus ar gyfer gwella rhagolygon busnes lleol.

**Leanne Wood:** Yn amlwg, yr hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud yw bod adfywio'r Cymoedd yn fater o gwestiynau cymdeithasol, yn ogystal ag economaidd. Gwyddom i gyd fod adfywio'n golygu mwy na dim ond adeiladu ffordd. Yn ei araith i'r gynhadledd heddiw, dywedodd Tony Blair mai pobl Lafur a awgrymodd gyntaf y gellid gwerthu tai cyngor, ond bod y cynlluniau wedi eu rhoi heibio am eu bod yn rhy anodd ac yn rhy dueddol o greu rhaniadau. Collwyd cenhedlaeth o bobl dosbarth gweithiol uchelgeisiol yn sgîl hynny. A derbyn na allwch weithio heb dŷ, a bod tai cymdeithasol yn brin o ganlyniad i'r cynllun hawl i brynu, a ydych yn cytuno â Blair?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno â Changhellor y Trysorlys, y cefais y frainc o glywed ei araith yng nghynhadledd y blaidd ddoe. Soniodd am gynnydd mawr yn y buddsoddiad yn y stoc dai cyhoeddus, ac elfen allweddol yn strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yw gweithio gyda phartneriaid lleol, yn enwedig awdurdodau lleol, ar fuddsoddiad enfawr i wella stoc dai'r sector cyhoeddus yn yr ardal.

Ym Mehefin, croesewais y gymeradwyaeth i brosiectau amgylcheddol ym mhob un o'r pum ardal awdurdod lleol. Mae'r ddadl hon yn rhoi cyfle i Aelodau ystyried y gwaith sydd wedi'i gyflawni'n barod, a'n cynlluniau ar gyfer dyfodol Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

O ran y gwelliannau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno, gwrthodaf welliant 1 Jocelyn Davies ynghylch diwydiannau mawr, gan nad oes diffiniad manwl o'r hyn y gellid ei ystyried yn ddiwydiant 'dinistriol a budr'. Fodd

welcome her amendment drawing attention to the spin-off benefits to other areas. I urge you to reject her amendment regarding additional resources, since the £140 million already committed from my budget is only one part of overall investment in the Heads of the Valleys strategy. I have already referred to the £1 billion of public sector funding that goes in to the five local authority areas in that region, as well as the huge potential for levering in a significant amount of private sector investment. Through pump-priming initiatives, we are looking to make better use of the £1 billion annual spend and, as I said, lever in at least £360 million from the private sector investment.

Kirsty Williams rightly recognises the importance that we have attached to information and communications technology and to local engagement. I welcome and support Kirsty's amendment highlighting these important issues.

In presenting the strategy to Members, I want to highlight another unique aspect of its development and implementation. As a form of collaboration between the Assembly and local partners, the Heads of the Valleys strategy sets the bar in the post-Beecham world of public services delivery in Wales. The pooling of expertise and resources is bringing a combined policy-and-delivery approach to strategy implementation. I see the Heads of the Valleys programme as a model for the new post-Beecham world. This is timely, given early planning for strategic implementation of the next round of EU structural funds. I am sure that Members will join me in welcoming the announcement that we are rated the best in Europe by the European Commission. As I said in the earlier debate, this is excellent news for Wales and further demonstrates our efficient and effective use of structural funds.

In conclusion, the 15-year vision and programme set out in the strategy reflects the shared commitment and effort of many stakeholders and partners in the public, private and voluntary sectors, and I commend it highly to the Assembly.

bynag, croesawaf ei gwelliant yn tynnu sylw at y sgîl-fanteision i ardaloedd eraill. Fe'ch anogaf i wrthod ei gwelliant ynglŷn ag adnoddau ychwanegol, gan nad yw'r £140 miliwn sydd eisoes wedi'i neilltuo o'm cyllideb i yn ddim ond un rhan o'r buddsoddiad cyfan yn strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyfeirio at yr £1 biliwn o arian y sector cyhoeddus a aiff i mewn i'r pum ardal awdurdod lleol yn yr ardal honno, ynghyd â'r potensial anferth ar gyfer denu swm sylweddol o fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat. Drwy fentrau arian sefydlu, yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud gwell defnydd o'r £1 biliwn o wariant blynyddol ac, fel y dywedais, denu o leiaf £360 miliwn o fuddsoddiad gan y sector preifat.

Mae Kirsty Williams yn iawn wrth gydnabod y pwys yr ydym wedi ei roi ar dechnoleg gwybodaeth a chyfathrebu ac ar gynnwys pobl lleol. Croesawaf a chefnogaf welliant Kirsty'n tanlinellu'r materion pwysig hyn.

Wrth gyflwyno'r strategaeth i'r Aelodau, hoffwn bwysleisio agwedd unigryw arall ar ei datblygiad a'i gweithrediad. Fel ffurf ar gydweithrediad rhwng y Cynulliad a phartneriaid lleol, mae strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn pennu'r nod ym maes darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru wedi Beecham. Mae cronni arbenigedd ac adnoddau yn golygu dull sy'n cyfuno polisi a chyflawni wrth weithredu strategaeth. I mi mae rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn fodel ar gyfer y byd newydd wedi Beecham. Mae hyn yn amserol, o ystyried y cynllunio cynnar ar gyfer rhoi'r rownd nesaf o arian strwythurol yr UE ar waith yn strategol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yr Aelodau'n ymuno â mi i groesawu'r cyhoeddiad bod y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn barnu mai ni yw'r gorau yn Ewrop. Fel y dywedais yn y ddadl flaenorol, mae hyn yn newyddion rhagorol i Gymru ac mae'n brawf pellach o'n defnydd effeithlon ac effeithiol o'r cronfeydd strwythurol.

I gloi, mae'r weledigaeth a'r rhaglen 15 mlynedd a nodir yn y strategaeth yn adlewyrchu'r ymrwymiad a'r ymdrech a rennir gan lawer o randdeiliaid a phartneriaid yn y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol, ac fe'i cymeradwyaf yn fawr i'r Cynulliad.

**Janet Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*ensures that measures to increase prosperity must recognise that the basic requirements for increasing skills and creating an attractive living and working environment in the Heads of the Valleys are incompatible with the development of large-scale destructive and dirty industries.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*endorses the need for focusing on increasing prosperity in the areas identified in the strategy, but recognises other Heads of the Valleys areas also need extra assistance.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for the allocation of additional appropriate resources following the recent inclusion of the Rhondda Fawr within the strategy.*

This strategy covers the Valleys communities, which grew out of heavy industry, out of coal, iron and steel. We had people living in poor housing, in polluted air and on polluted ground and, for many decades, they were on low wages and in insecure and unsafe employment. They had poor healthcare until they banded together to set up their own local health services. Yet, with all this, they lived in safe, secure and supportive communities. The loss of the heavy industries has left a legacy of poor health and low-wage employment, and employment that disappears with little warning.

However, the worst legacies have been low levels of skills, a deep disillusionment and a loss of self-respect.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I will take advantage of your generosity in giving way to me, Janet, because I may not be able to speak later in the debate as we are short of time. You

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn sicrhau bod rhaid i fesurau i gynyddu ffyniant gydnabod bod y gofynion sylfaenol ar gyfer cynyddu sgiliau a chreu amgylchedd byw a gwaith atyniadol ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd yn anghydnaws â datblygiad diwydiannau graddfa fawr sy'n ddinistriol ac yn fudr.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cymeradwyo'r angen i ganolbwyntio ar gynyddu ffyniant yn yr ardaloedd a bennir yn y strategaeth, ond yn cydnabod bod ardaloedd eraill ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd hefyd angen rhagor o gymorth.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddyrannu adnoddau priodol ychwanegol yn dilyn cynnwys Rhondda Fawr o fewn y strategaeth yn ddiweddar.*

Mae'r strategaeth hon yn cwmpasu cymunedau'r Cymoedd, a dyfodd allan o ddiwydiannau trwm, allan o lo, haearn a dur. Yr oedd pobl yn byw mewn tai gwael, mewn aer halogedig ac ar dir halogedig ac, am ddegawdau lawer, yr oeddent ar gyflogau isel ac mewn swyddi ansicr ac anniogel. Yr oedd y gofal iechyd a gaent yn wael nes iddynt ddod at ei gilydd i sefydlu eu gwasanaethau iechyd lleol eu hunain. Ond, er hyn oll, yr oeddent yn byw mewn cymunedau diogel, sicr a chefnogol. Mae colli'r diwydiannu trwm wedi gadael etifeddiaeth o afiechyd a chyflogaeth ar gyflogau isel, a chyflogaeth sy'n diflannu heb fawr iawn o rybudd.

Fodd bynnag, yr etifeddiaeth waethaf yw'r lefelau sgiliau isel, dadrithiad dwys a cholli hunan-barch.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Yr wyf am fanteisio ar eich caredigrwydd yn ildio imi, Janet, oherwydd efallai na chaf siarad yn ddiweddarach yn y ddadl gan ein bod yn brin o amser. Soniasoch



mentioned low levels of skills, but for some people in the Heads of the Valleys area, the issue is a lack of basic skills. Do you agree that the Assembly should have an ambition to eradicate illiteracy and innumeracy in these communities as a priority?

**Janet Davies:** I agree that that is an absolute priority, because the loss of skills to which I referred gnaws away at what were once strong communities.

The Bevan Foundation report, which influenced the Assembly Government to produce this strategy, has shown the way forward, and Plaid Cymru totally supports the investment of resources into these programmes and strategic goals. Over 255,000 people live in the area, and it is time that they had a better deal. The Assembly Government has a responsibility to enable people to develop new skills and to bring in a variety of employment to restore confidence. We must understand that, if this area becomes prosperous again, the whole of Wales will benefit economically and socially.

I have a great concern about the heads, and the centres, of the Valleys that lie to the west, which I and other Members represent. There must be a commitment to using the lessons learned and to transferring success to these Valleys also, both in terms of business spin-out and skills learning. The Rhondda Fawr was added to the designated area last week, and it is important that finance follows its inclusion.

Work over many years has made the Heads of the Valleys a much more pleasant and safe environment in which to live. When work on the Heads of the Valleys road is complete, there will be a dual carriageway through to the motorway system of the west Midlands and to those markets. However, the Bevan Foundation recognised that improving skills and providing a good road system is not enough. Achieving the goals of this strategy requires people who are determined to make it work, and who have the expertise to do so. In the past, as we all know, there has been considerable private inward investment into the Valleys, attracted by large government grants. New firms have come in but most have, unfortunately, left after a few years. In

am y lefelau sgiliau isel, ond i rai pobl yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, y broblem yw diffyg sgiliau sylfaenol. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai fod gan y Cynulliad uchelgais i ddileu anllhythrenedd ac anrhifogrwydd yn y cymunedau hyn fel blaenoriaeth?

**Janet Davies:** Cytunaf fod hynny'n flaenoriaeth hollol, oherwydd y mae'r colli sgiliau y cyfeiriais ato yn graddol erydu'r hyn a oedd unwaith yn gymunedau cryf.

Mae adroddiad Sefydliad Bevan, a ddylanwadodd ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gynhyrchu'r strategaeth hon, wedi dangos y ffordd ymlaen, ac mae Plaid Cymru yn llwyr gefnogi buddsoddi adnoddau yn y rhaglenni a'r amcanion strategol hyn. Mae dros 255,000 o bobl yn byw yn yr ardal, ac mae'n bryd iddynt gael gwell bargaen. Mae gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb i alluogi pobl i ddatblygu sgiliau newydd a dod ag amrywiaeth o gyflogaeth i mewn i adfer hyder. Rhaid inni ddeall, os daw'r ardal hon yn llewyrchus eto, y bydd Cymru gyfan yn elwa yn economaidd ac yn gymdeithasol.

Yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr am flaenau, ac am ganol, y Cymoedd tua'r gorllewin, yr wyf fi ac Aelodau eraill yn eu cynrychioli. Rhaid cael ymrwymiad i ddefnyddio'r gwersi a ddysgir a throsglwyddo llwyddiant i'r Cymoedd hyn hefyd, o ran sefydlu busnesau o'r newydd a dysgu sgiliau. Ychwanegwyd y Rhondda Fawr at yr ardal ddynodedig yr wythnos diwethaf, ac mae'n bwysig bod cyllid yn dod yn sgîl ei chynnwys.

Mae'r gwaith a wnaed dros flynyddoedd lawer wedi gwneud Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn lle llawer mwy dymunol a diogel i weithio ynddo. Pan fydd y gwaith ar ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd wedi'i gwblhau, bydd ffordd ddeuol drwodd hyd at system gefnffyrdd gorllewin canolbarth Lloegr ac at y marchnadoedd hynny. Fodd bynnag, cydnabu Sefydliad Bevan nad yw gwella sgiliau a darparu system ffyrdd dda yn ddigon. Er mwyn cyflawni amcanion y strategaeth hon rhaid wrth bobl sy'n benderfynol o wneud iddi weithio, ac sydd â'r arbenigedd i wneud hynny. Yn y gorffennol, fel y gŵyr pawb ohonom, cafwyd mewnfuddsoddi preifaf sylweddol i'r Cymoedd, a ddenwyd gan grantiau llywodraeth mawr. Mae cwmnïau

the meantime, indigenous firms have struggled to become established as they have found it difficult to get such grants. I wonder how many jobs would have been established and have remained in the Valleys had indigenous small and medium-sized enterprises received the level of grants and expert help that was given to LG and its will-o'-the-wisp jobs.

The Valleys now have an immensely attractive natural environment. As well as the immediate countryside, they lie next to the Brecon Beacons National Park and they have an important historic built environment, including the world heritage site at Blaenavon, but never forgetting the unique pattern of terraced housing that criss-crosses the Valleys and its lower slopes.

5.20 p.m.

Major investment is planned, but any large-scale project of a dirty and destructive nature, such as opencast coal mining, will destroy the beauty of the area and blunt the cutting edge of advantage established through public investment. It will drive away prospective employers and skilled people, who have a greater choice of where they live, and destroy carefully nurtured self-confidence. We must take care on this. Setting a strategy and failing to follow it through in full raises the spectre of an old-Labour lack of clear thinking, and I worry that heads will turn away.

**Kirsty Williams:** I propose the following amendments in my name. Amendment 4: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the importance of putting ICT at the heart of the strategy.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recognises the crucial importance of involving local people and local partnerships in the delivery of the strategy.*

Undoubtedly, the communities that are the

newydd wedi dod i mewn ond, yn anffodus, gadawodd y rhan fwyaf ar ôl rhai blynyddoedd. Yn y cyfamser, mae cwmnïau cynhenid wedi gorfod brwydro i'w sefydlu eu hunain gan ei bod yn anodd iddynt gael grantiau o'r fath. Ys gwn i faint o swyddi fyddai wedi cael eu sefydlu ac a fyddai wedi aros yn y Cymoedd pe bai cwmnïau bach a chanolig cynhenid wedi cael yr un grantiau a help arbenigol ag a roddwyd i LG a'i swyddi disylwedd?

Erbyn hyn mae gan y Cymoedd amgylchedd naturiol hynod o ddeniadol. Yn ogystal â'r cefn gwlad cyfagos, maent wrth ymyl Parc Cenedlaethol Bannau Brycheiniog ac mae ganddynt amgylchedd adeiledig hanesyddol pwysig, gan gynnwys safle treftadaeth y byd ym Mlaenafon, ond heb anghofio o hyd am y patrwm unigryw o dai teras sy'n britho'r Cymoedd a'u llethrau isaf.

Mae buddsoddi mawr yn cael ei gynllunio, ond bydd unrhyw brosiect ar raddfa fawr o natur fudr a dinistriol, fel cloddio glo brig, yn difetha harddwch yr ardal ac yn tansilio'r fantais o fod yn flaengar a sefydlwyd drwy fuddsoddiad cyhoeddus. Bydd yn gyrru ymaith ddarpar gyflogwyr a phobl fedrus, sydd â mwy o ddewis o ran ble i fyw, ac yn dinistrio hunanhyder sydd wedi cael ei feithrin yn ofalus. Rhaid inni fod yn ofalus yma. Mae pennu strategaeth a methu ei rhoi ar waith yn llawn yn codi bwgan diffyg meddwl clir yr hen Lafur, ac yr wyf yn poeni y bydd pennau'n troi draw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn fy enw i. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gosod TGCh wrth galon y strategaeth.*

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd allweddol cynnwys pobl leol a phartneriaethau lleol wrth gyflwyno'r strategaeth.*

Yn ddiamheuaeth, mae'r cymunedau y mae'r

focus of this document face a number of serious problems that are well worthy of the discussion here today and of the resources that are being placed behind them. There is a declining population and high levels of economic inactivity, which it is worth reminding ourselves of again: only 64 per cent of the working-age population in the Heads of the Valleys work, compared with the Welsh average, and that is simply not good enough. The basis for much of that, I am sure, is the low educational attainment and skills levels of many people who live in the Valleys. They simply do not have the right type of skills—even the most basic numeracy and literacy skills—to help them to participate in the workforce.

We have also heard about the lack of quality jobs and opportunities. Heads of the Valleys residents are less likely to be skilled for professional jobs. It is also a marked point that many of the chief executives, senior directors and managing directors of organisations and companies in the Heads of the Valleys do not choose to live there; they choose to live in neighbouring Monmouthshire or in my constituency. We have to do more to develop the built and physical environment of the Valleys to make it an attractive place for professional people to live in, not just to work in.

Of course, there is also the high incidence of long-term health problems. It is scandalous that life expectancy in Merthyr and Blaenau Gwent should be so considerably lower than that in neighbouring constituencies. I remember being struck by a BBC television programme about a new, young GP working in the Valleys communities, who pointed out that statistic to the family that he was working with. He asked whether they were not angry that their children had a life expectancy of five years less than those in the neighbouring constituency. The family turned around and said that no, they were not angry, and that it was the good luck of the people who lived in Powys. That is wrong, because that family should be angry. That community has the right to be angry that, in modern-day Wales, its children are at such a disadvantage from the very day that they are born.

There is a lack of quality housing and the

ddogfen hon yn canolbwyntio arnynt yn wynebu nifer o broblemau difrifol sy'n sicr yn deilwng o'r drafodaeth yma heddiw ac o'r adnoddau a neilltuwyd iddynt. Mae yma boblogaeth sy'n crebachu a lefelau uchel o anweithgarwch economaidd, y mae'n werth atgoffa ein hunain ohonynt eto: dim ond 64 y cant o'r boblogaeth oedran gweithio ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd sy'n gweithio, o'i gymharu â chyfartaledd Cymru, ac nid yw hynny'n ddigon da. Sylfaen llawer o hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr, yw cyrhaeddiad addysgol isel a lefelau sgiliau llawer o'r bobl sy'n byw yn y Cymoedd. Yn syml, nid oes ganddynt y math iawn o sgiliau—hyd yn oed y sgiliau rhifedd a llythrennedd mwyaf sylfaenol—i'w helpu i gymryd rhan yn y gweithlu.

Yr ydym hefyd wedi clywed am y diffyg swyddi a chyfleoedd o safon. Mae trigolion Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn llai tebygol o fod â'r sgiliau ar gyfer swyddi proffesiynol. Mae hefyd yn bwynt amlwg bod llawer o brif weithredwyr, uwch gyfarwyddwyr a rheolwyr gyfarwyddwyr cyrff a chwmnïau ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd yn dewis peidio â byw yno; maent yn dewis byw yn sir Fynwy gerllaw neu yn fy etholaeth i. Rhaid inni wneud mwy i ddatblygu amgylchedd adeiledig a ffisegol y Cymoedd i'w wneud yn lle deniadol i bobl broffesiynol fyw ynddo, nid dim ond i weithio ynddo.

Wrth gwrs, mae yma hefyd lefel uchel o broblemau iechyd hirdymor. Mae'n warthus bod disgwyliad oes ym Merthyr a Blaenau Gwent gymaint yn is nag mewn etholaethau cyfagos. Cofiaf yr argraff a wnaed arnaf gan raglen deledu gan y BBC am feddyg teulu ifanc, newydd, yn gweithio yng nghymunedau'r Cymoedd, a dynnodd sylw'r teulu yr oedd yn gweithio gydag ef at yr ystadegyn hwnnw. Gofynnodd onid oeddent yn ddig bod disgwyliad oes eu plant hwy bum mlynedd yn llai nag i blant yn yr etholaeth agosaf. Trodd y teulu ato a dweud na, nad oeddent yn ddig, ac mae lwc dda'r bobl a oedd yn byw ym Mhowys oedd hynny. Nid yw hynny'n iawn, oherwydd dylai'r teulu hwn fod yn ddig. Mae gan y gymuned honno hawl i fod yn ddig bod ei phlant, yn y Gymru fodern, o dan y fath anfantais o'r diwrnod y maent yn cael eu geni.

Mae diffyg tai safonol ac nid yw'r canol trefi

poorly equipped town centres do not give people the opportunity to get the things that they need from within those communities rather than having to travel outside them. As Liberal Democrats, we recognise that a designed-for-purpose strategy is desperately needed to ensure that the Valleys do not continue to lose ground compared with other parts of Wales. At the heart of that, we believe that improving transport infrastructure is crucial.

I am concerned that the document gives several options for the delivery of this strategy, and the Government has a preferred option, but I do not know whether you can take that all-or-nothing approach. Yes, we should look at building balanced communities but we should also look at the importance of the Heads of the Valleys road as a way of bringing opportunities in. We also have to recognise that, for some people, their chosen way to develop themselves and their lives is to commute out of the Valleys. We cannot say that there is only one option for people living in the Valleys; I think that we should take a more balanced view across the three delivery options, because they all have a role to play, rather than concentrating on just the one aspect. To do that would be to miss an opportunity that we have before us.

Time is short, so I will conclude by saying that we welcome the opportunities here. We are concerned about a top-down approach rather than a bottom-up one. If this strategy is to succeed, we have to put our words about wanting to encourage local partnerships and working with local people into action. This should not be a strategy that is done to the Heads of the Valleys and the people who live there; we must ensure that it is a strategy that they deliver for themselves. There is already great capacity; people are doing tremendous work. We need to build on that capacity, and ensure that this is not simply something that we do for those people, but rather that we enable them to do it for themselves by giving them the tools to bring those communities out of the serious situations that many of them are in.

gwael yn rhoi'r cyfle i bobl gael y pethau y mae eu hangen arnynt o fewn y cymunedau hynny yn hytrach na gorfod teithio y tu allan iddynt. Fel Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod taer angen am strategaeth wedi'i chynlluno'n bwrpasol i sicrhau nad yw'r Cymoedd yn dal i golli tir o'u cymharu â rhannau eraill o Gymru. Yn ganolog i hynny, credwn fod gwella'r seilwaith trafniadaeth yn dyngedfennol.

Yr wyf yn pryderu bod y ddogfen yn rhoi sawl opsiwn ar gyfer gweithredu'r strategaeth hon, ac mae gan y Llywodraeth opsiwn y mae'n ei ffafrio, ond ni wn a allwch weithredu ar sail y cwbl neu ddim fel hyn. Dylem, fe ddylem edrych ar greu cymunedau cytbwys ond dylem edrych hefyd ar bwysigrwydd ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd fel cyfrwng i ddod â chyfleoedd i mewn. Rhaid inni gydnabod hefyd, o ran rhai pobl, mai'r ffordd y maent hwy wedi'i dewis i ddatblygu eu hunain a'u bywydau yw cymudo allan o'r Cymoedd. Ni allwn ddweud nad oes ond un opsiwn i bobl sy'n byw yn y Cymoedd; credaf y dylem fod yn edrych mewn modd mwy cytbwys ar draws y tri opsiwn gweithredu, oherwydd y mae ganddynt i gyd rôl i'w chwarae, yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar un agwedd yn unig. Byddai gwneud hynny'n golygu colli cyfle sydd gennym.

Mae amser yn fyr, felly yr wyf am gloi drwy ddweud ein bod yn croesawu'r cyfleoedd yma. Yr ydym yn pryderu am ddull gweithredu o'r brig i lawr yn hytrach na dull o'r gwaelod i fyny. Os yw'r strategaeth hon i lwyddo, rhaid inni droi ein geiriau am ein hawydd i annog partneriaethau lleol a gweithio gyda phobl leol yn weithredu. Ni ddylai hon fod yn strategaeth sy'n cael ei chyflawni ar ran Blaenau'r Cymoedd a'r bobl sy'n byw yno; rhaid inni sicrhau ei bod yn strategaeth y maent hwy yn ei rhoi ar waith er eu mwyn eu hunain. Mae cryn allu yno yn barod; mae pobl yn gwneud gwaith gwych. Mae angen inni ddatblygu'r gallu hwnnw, a sicrhau nad rhywbeth yr ydym ni'n ei wneud ar ran y bobl hynny yw hyn, ond yn hytrach ein bod yn eu galluogi hwy i'w wneud drostynt eu hunain drwy roi iddynt yr arfau i ddod â'r cymunedau hynny allan o'r sefyllfaoedd difrifol y mae llawer ohonynt

ynddynt.

### Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I invite the Business Minister to propose an extension to Plenary under Standing Order No. 6.21.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig estyniad i'r Cyfarfod Llawn o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends today's Plenary meeting until 6.15 p.m.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ymestyn Cyfarfod Llawn heddiw tan 6.15 p.m.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** In that case, if Members are succinct, everyone who wishes to do so should be able to speak. Are there 10 Members in support of the motion? I see that there are. I therefore call for a vote.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** O ystyried hynny, os bydd yr Aelodau'n gryno, dylai pawb sy'n dymuno gwneud hynny allu siarad. A oes 10 Aelod yn cefnogi'r cynnig? Gwelaf fod. Galwad am bleidlais felly.

*Cynnig: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.*

*Motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 4.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Melding, David  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd: Parhad** **The Heads of the Valleys Strategy: Continued**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I remind Members that you are allowed three minutes in which to speak, to within a few seconds. I will not cut people off on the second, but I will certainly not allow more than a few seconds over the three minutes.

**Irene James:** I begin by stating my overwhelming support for a programme that aims to redress the economic and social injustices imposed on the Valleys communities over past generations—injustices from which we have yet to recover. Only deep-targeted Government interventions can provide a platform to re-empower and reconstruct impoverished local communities.

The Welsh health survey, again this year, points to the Valleys as the area with the highest levels of ill health. The Welsh indices of multiple deprivation for 2001 and 2005 highlight the concentrated levels of poverty in the Valleys. The strategy itself highlights the effect of these different forces on education, which results in a poverty of aspiration, attainment and opportunity. A proper regional policy basis for targeting investment is vital to the success of regenerating our poorest areas. That is crucial, given the opportunity provided by convergence funding that is now on our doorstep. The Valleys cannot be dependent on growth in Cardiff for economic revival and without a strong sub-regional breakdown within the current convergence consultation, policies with a regional emphasis are key to targeting investment at the most deprived and, consequently, disengaged communities—communities such as Hollybush in Islwyn, which sits on the Heads of the Valleys; it is not a small community, but it still does not have a gas supply, as that can only be provided at an unassailable cost to its residents.

We must ensure that targeted policies to address injustice are not compromised by historic funding disparities. While disparities that discriminate against Valleys

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Atgoffaf yr Aelodau eich bod yn cael tair munud i siarad, o fewn rhai eiliadau. Ni fyddaf yn atal pobl i'r eiliad, ond yn sicr ni fyddaf yn caniatáu mwy nag ychydig eiliadau dros y tair munud.

**Irene James:** Dechreuaf drwy ddatgan fy nghefnogaeth gref i raglen sy'n ceisio unioni'r anghyfiawnderau economaidd a chymdeithasol sydd wedi cael eu gorfodi ar gymunedau'r Cymoedd dros y cenedlaethau a aeth heibio—anghyfiawnderau nad ydym wedi dod drostynt eto. Dim ond ymyriadau gan y Llywodraeth sy'n cael eu targedu'n ddwys a all ddarparu llwyfan i ailrymuso ac ailadeiladu cymunedau lleol tlawd.

Unwaith eto eleni, mae arolwg iechyd Cymru yn cyfeirio at y Cymoedd fel yr ardal sydd â'r lefelau uchaf o afiechyd. Mae mynegeion amddifadedd lluosog Cymru ar gyfer 2001 a 2005 yn tynnu sylw at y lefelau dwys o dlodi yn y Cymoedd. Mae'r strategaeth ei hun yn tynnu sylw at effaith y gwahanol rymoedd hyn ar addysg, sy'n arwain at dlodi o ran dyhead, cyrhaeddiad a chyfleoedd. Mae sylfaen bolisi ranbarthol briodol i dargedu buddsoddi yn hanfodol er mwyn llwyddo i adfywio ein hardaloedd tlotaf. Mae hynny'n dyngedfennol, o ystyried y cyfle a ddarperir gan arian cydgyfeirio sydd ar garreg y drws inni erbyn hyn. Ni all y Cymoedd ddibynnu ar dwf yng Nghaerdydd i'w hadfywio'n economaidd a heb ddadansoddiad is-ranbarthol cryf yn yr ymgynghoriad cyfredol ynghylch cydgyfeirio, mae polisiau sydd â phwyslais rhanbarthol yn allweddol er mwyn targedu buddsoddiad at y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig ac, o ganlyniad, at gymunedau sydd wedi ymddieithrio—cymunedau fel Llwyncelyn yn Islwyn, sydd ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd; nid cymuned fach ydyw, ond nid oes ganddi gyflenwad nwy byth, gan nad oes modd ei ddarparu ond am gost sydd y tu hwnt i gyrraedd ei thrigolion.

Rhaid inni sicrhau nad yw polisiau a dargedir i fynd i'r afael ag anghyfiawnder yn cael eu peryglu gan anghyfartalwch ariannu hanesyddol. Tra bydd anghyfartalwch sy'n

communities prevail, as highlighted, for example, in the evidence collated for the Committee on School Funding report, they will undermine the efforts to regenerate our poorest areas.

Finally, contrary to evocative make-or-break eulogies such as ‘a once-in-a-generation chance to change the area for the better’, this strategy must be the basis for a sustainable direction of principled Government policies aimed at reviving our poorest communities. Eradicating social injustice and equality should never be a matter of a one-off chance, but should be the framework to deliver all Government policy.

5.30 p.m.

**Trish Law:** This motion proposes welcoming the publication of the ‘Turning Heads’ document on the strategy for the heads of the Valleys 2020. I give it a cautious welcome. I am cautious, because too little has been done to regenerate Heads of the Valleys communities, not only during the lifetime of the Assembly, but for a number of years prior to 1999, by successive Governments at Westminster. It is almost 20 years since the then Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Walker, launched the so-called Valleys initiative, which had little impact on the socio-economic landscape of the south Wales Valleys. That is eight Welsh secretaries ago.

The physical landscape of the Valleys may have changed, but far too many Valleys communities still bear the scars of poverty, ill health and underachievement. Nowhere are those hallmarks of deprivation more evident than in Blaenau Gwent. Key statistics for Blaenau Gwent show that, in terms of deprivation, the vast majority of Blaenau Gwent is more deprived than the Wales average. I strongly suspect that there is a link between that and the fact that the population of Blaenau Gwent fell by 5 per cent between 1993 and 2003—it is continuing to fall—while across the rest of Wales, the population rose by 2 per cent. Compared with the rest of

gwahaniaethu yn erbyn cymunedau'r Cymoedd yn parhau, fel sy'n cael ei amlygu, er enghraifft, yn y dystiolaeth a gasglwyd ynghyd ar gyfer adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, bydd yn tanselilio'r ymdrechion i adfywio ein hardaloedd tlotaf.

Yn olaf, yn wahanol i ryw areithiau cyfle olaf sy'n sôn am ‘gyfle unwaith mewn cenhedlaeth i newid yr ardal er gwell’, rhaid i'r strategaeth hon fod yn sail i gyfeiriad cynaliadwy i bolisïau egwyddorol gan y Llywodraeth sydd â'r nod o adfywio ein cymunedau tlotaf. Ni ddylai dileu anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol a chydraddoldeb byth fod yn fater o gyfle unwaith-ac-am-byth, ond dylai fod yn fframwaith er mwyn rhoi holl bolisïau'r Llywodraeth ar waith.

**Trish Law:** Mae'r cynnig hwn yn cynnig y dylid croesawu cyhoeddi'r ddogfen ‘Syniadau Blaengar’ ynghylch y strategaeth ar gyfer blaenau'r Cymoedd 2020. Yr wyf yn rhoi croeso petrusgar iddo. Yr wyf yn betrus, oherwydd nad oes digon wedi cael ei wneud i adfywio cymunedau Blaenau'r Cymoedd, nid yn unig yn ystod oes y Cynulliad, ond dros nifer o flynyddoedd cyn 1999, gan y naill Lywodraeth ar ôl y llall yn San Steffan. Mae bron 20 mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru ar y pryd, Peter Walker, lansio menter y Cymoedd, fel y'i gelwid, na chafodd lawer o effaith ar hinsawdd economaidd-gymdeithasol Cymoedd y de. Mae wyth mlynedd wedi mynd heibio ers hynny.

Efallai fod tirwedd ffisegol y Cymoedd wedi newid, ond mae creithiau tlodi, afiechyd a thangyflawni i'w gweld o hyd mewn llawer gormod o gymunedau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r symbolau hyn o amddifadedd yn fwy amlwg ym Mlaenau Gwent nag yn unman arall. Mae ystadegau allweddol ar gyfer Blaenau Gwent yn dangos, o ran amddifadedd, fod y rhan fwyaf o Flaenau Gwent yn fwy difreintiedig na'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru. Yr wyf yn amau'n gryf bod cysylltiad rhwng hynny a'r ffaith bod poblogaeth Blaenau Gwent wedi gostwng 5 y cant rhwng 1993 a 2003—mae'n parhau i ostwng—tra bod y boblogaeth yng ngweddill Cymru wedi cynyddu 2 y cant. O'i

Wales, people in Blaenau Gwent are, on the whole, less qualified, fewer working-age people are economically active and a higher proportion of these are unemployed. More people or households in Blaenau Gwent claim benefits because they are poor, unemployed or suffer from ill health. On the whole, people there are less healthy.

More recently, this month's labour market statistics show that, in 2005, Blaenau Gwent had the highest unemployment rate in Wales, and those claiming jobseekers allowance accounted for 4.1 per cent of the working-age population, which is almost double the Welsh average. The latest figures for last month reveal that the proportion of claimants went up to 4.4 per cent—by far the highest in Wales.

Turning to this document, I do not share the First Minister's optimism that the £140 million investment by the Assembly Government over 15 years will lever in as much as £360 million from the private sector. I am curious to know where he gets that figure from, unless it just neatly rounds up the overall investment to the tidy sum of £500 million. On the question of investment, I hope that your recent decision to, quite properly, include Treorchy and Treherbert in the Heads of the Valleys programme will be followed by an appropriate funding top-up.

The people of Blaenau Gwent want more and better-paid jobs within the constituency along with better housing, a cleaner and safer environment, and improved health and education services. They want to see steps taken towards establishing a tourism strategy, because, as this document acknowledges, the landscape is stunning in its own right. If the goals set out in this 'Turning Heads' report are ever achieved, I will be the first to say that that was a huge job well done. If they follow their predecessors and are not achieved, investors and others will be turning heads away from Blaenau Gwent and other Heads of the Valleys communities for good.

gymharu â gweddill Cymru, mae gan bobl Blaenau Gwent, at ei gilydd, lai o gymwysterau, mae llai o bobl o oedran gweithio'n economaidd weithgar ac mae cyfran uwch o'r rhain yn ddi-waith. Mae mwy o bobl neu aelwydydd ym Mlaenau Gwent yn hawlio budd-daliadau oherwydd eu bod yn dlawd, yn ddi-waith neu'n dioddef afiechyd. Ar y cyfan, mae'r bobl yno'n llai iach.

Yn fwy diweddar, mae ystadegau marchnad lafur y mis hwn yn dangos bod y gyfradd ddiweithdra uchaf yng Nghymru yn 2005 ym Mlaenau Gwent, a bod y rhai sy'n hawlio lwfans ceiswyr gwaith yn cyfrif am 4.1 y cant o'r boblogaeth oedran gweithio, sydd gymaint ddwywaith bron â'r cyfartaledd yng Nghymru. Mae'r ffigurau diweddarar ar gyfer y mis diwethaf yn dangos bod cyfran yr hawlwyd wedi codi i 4.4 y cant—y ffigur uchaf o lawer yng Nghymru.

Gan droi at y ddogfen hon, nid wyf yn optimistig fel y Prif Weinidog y bydd buddsoddiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o £140 miliwn dros 15 mlynedd yn denu cymaint â £360 miliwn oddi wrth y sector preifat. Hoffwn wybod o ble y mae'n cael y ffigur hwnnw, oni bai ei fod yn talgrynnu cyfanswm y buddsoddiad yn daclus i gael y ffigur o £500 miliwn. Ynglŷn â chwestiwn buddsoddi, gobeithiaf y bydd eich penderfyniad diweddar i gynnwys Treorci a Treherbert, yn hollol iawn, o fewn rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn cael ei ddilyn gan arian ychwanegol priodol.

Mae pobl Blaenau Gwent am gael mwy o swyddi a swyddi sy'n talu'n well yn yr etholaeth ynghyd â thai gwell, amgylchedd glanach a mwy diogel, a gwell gwasanaethau addysg ac iechyd. Maent am weld camau'n cael eu cymryd i sefydlu strategaeth dwristiaeth oherwydd, fel y mae'r ddogfen hon yn cydnabod, mae'r dirwedd yn un drawiadol iawn. Os caiff yr amcanion a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad 'Syniadau Blaengar' eu cyflawni, myfi fydd y cyntaf i gydnabod ei bod yn dasg fawr sydd wedi ei chyflawni'n dda. Os byddant yn dilyn eu rhagflaenwyr ac na chânt eu cyflawni, bydd buddsoddwyr ac eraill yn cefnu ar Flaenau Gwent a chymunedau eraill Blaenau'r Cymoedd am byth.



**Lynne Neagle:** I start by thanking the Minister for his openness and enthusiasm in developing the Heads of the Valleys strategy. The joined-up-thinking visible in this document is testament both to this Assembly Government's commitment to sustainable economic development and to Valleys colleagues who have fought assiduously for a specific, co-ordinated, regional regeneration programme of this kind. I am sure that other Members representing Valleys constituencies join me in support, and in noting that this multi-million pound project shows that really there is only one party that stands up for Torfaen, Blaenau Gwent and for the other communities in the Heads of the Valleys area.

It is fitting that the 'Turning Heads' strategy document was launched in Blaenavon, home of Britain's newest world heritage site—a stunning tourist attraction, which we are still endeavouring to fully exploit. I therefore welcome the specific reference to the world heritage site in this document, and Torfaen council's decision to make use of its first Heads of the Valleys bid to develop the area. I have already seen the money working to good effect, and was pleased to formally open the new gateway project, which is better linking tourist attractions in Blaenavon, such as Big Pit and Pontypool and Blaenavon railway. That initial £180,000 is already working to improve the tourist experience in Torfaen, with new parking facilities, signage, lighting and landscaping.

One of the most startling facts contained within the strategy document is that there are just 225 hotel beds within the Heads of the Valleys region, roughly akin to one decent-sized Cardiff hotel. That underlines the challenge that we face to create a tourist experience worthy of more than just a day trip.

In addition to the physical changes that this strategy will help to develop in the Heads of the Valleys region, an aggressive marketing programme is equally essential. Torfaen

**Lynne Neagle:** Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei frwdfrydedd ac am fod yn agored wrth ddatblygu strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r meddwl yn gydgysylltiedig a welir yn y ddogfen hon yn tystio bod ymrwymiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu economaidd cynaliadwy a bod cyd-Aelodau yn y Cymoedd wedi brwydro'n ddiflino dros raglen adfywio ranbarthol, benodol a chydgysylltiedig fel hon. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Aelodau eraill sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau yn y Cymoedd yn ymuno â mi i gefnogi, ac i ddatgan bod y prosiect hwn sy'n werth miliynau o bunnoedd yn dangos mai dim ond un blaid sy'n gweithio dros Dorfaen, Blaenau Gwent a thros y cymunedau eraill yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Mae'n briodol bod y ddogfen strategaeth 'Syniadau Blaengar' wedi cael ei lansio ym Mlaenafon, cartref safle treftadaeth y byd diweddaraf Prydain—atyniad gwefreiddiol i dwristiaid, un yr ydym wrthi o hyd yn ceisio manteisio i'r eithaf arno. Yr wyf felly'n croesawu'r cyfeiriad penodol at safle treftadaeth y byd yn y ddogfen, a phenderfyniad cyngor Torfaen i ddefnyddio ei gais cyntaf o dan gynllun Blaenau'r Cymoedd i ddatblygu'r ardal. Yr wyf eisoes wedi gweld yr effaith gadarnhaol y mae'r arian yn ei chael, ac yr oeddwn yn falch o gael agor y prosiect porth newydd, sy'n golygu cysylltiad gwell rhwng yr atyniadau i dwristiaid ym Mlaenafon, megis y Pwll Mawr a rheilffordd Pont-y-pŵl a Blaenafon. Mae'r £180,000 yn cael ei ddefnyddio eisoes i wella profiad yr ymwelydd yn Nhorfaen, gyda chyfleusterau parcio newydd, arwyddion, goleuadau a thirlunio.

Un o'r ffeithiau mwyaf brawychus yn nogfen y strategaeth yw mai dim ond 225 o welyau mewn gwestai sydd ar gael yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, tua'r un faint ag un o westai cymharol fawr Caerdydd. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio'r her sy'n ein hwynebu wrth inni greu profiad i'r ymwelydd sy'n teilyngu mwy na thaith diwrnod yn unig.

Yn ogystal â'r newidiadau ffisegol y bydd y strategaeth hon yn helpu i'w datblygu yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, bydd rhaglen farchnata ymwithgar yr un mor hanfodol. Mae

council has indicated to me that if it had just a tiny percentage of the capital spend available for accompanying marketing activity, the impact of the changes that it is making would be felt much deeper. This is not about funding additional public-sector positions; it is about sound economic development and professional project management. I would be interested to hear the Minister's thoughts on this issue.

The Heads of the Valleys strategy is not just about helping partners to work together; it is also about focusing our existing spending and complementing 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' and other economic development strategies. In shaping the new convergence funding programme, the Assembly Government is right to stress the importance of the skills agenda. The strategic approach to this next round of European funding is also welcomed; such an approach will make it much easier for the Assembly Government to shape this programme to complement overall spending in the Valleys.

Infrastructure developments are also vital—the continuing improvement of the Heads of the Valleys road being a case in point. I am encouraged by the strategy that we are looking at today, as it sets out a bold vision of what the Valleys should look like. From landscaping to lighting, the prospect of physical change is exciting and should be welcomed.

In my constituency, Blaenavon, Cwmbran and Pontypool are proud communities—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Lynne Neagle:** Blaenavon, Cwmbran and Pontypool are proud communities in their own right, not domiciles for Cardiff and Newport workforces. These towns deserve our support. This strategy is a vital component to that work. I thank the Minister for bringing it forward.

**Alun Cairns:** Overall, in balance, I support the document. My prime concern is that this

cyngor Tor-faen wedi dweud wrthyf pe na bai ganddo ond cyfran fach o'r gwariant cyfalaf i'w wario ar waith marchnata cysylltiedig, byddai effaith y newidiadau a ddoi yn sgîl y gwaith hwnnw'n fwy pellgyrhaeddol o lawer. Nid mater o ariannu swyddi ychwanegol yn y sector cyhoeddus yw hyn; mae'n golygu datblygu economaidd cadarn a rheoli'r prosiect mewn ffordd broffesiynol. Hoffwn glywed barn y Gweinidog ar y mater.

Mae strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn golygu mwy na helpu partneriaid i weithio gyda'i gilydd; mae'n ymwneud hefyd â chanolbwyntio ar ein gwariant presennol a gweithio gyda 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffyfnu' a strategaethau datblygu economaidd eraill. Wrth lunio rhaglen yr arian cydgyfeirio newydd, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn llygad ei lle wrth roi pwyslais ar bwysigrwydd yr agenda sgiliau. Croesewir hefyd y dull strategol o ymdrin â'r rownd nesaf o arian Ewropeaidd; bydd dull o'r fath yn ei gwneud yn haws i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad lunio'r rhaglen hon i ategu gwariant cyffredinol yn y Cymoedd.

Mae datblygiadau seilwaith yn hanfodol hefyd—mae parhau i wella ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn enghraifft o hyn. Yr wyf yn cael fy nghalonogi gan y strategaeth yr ydym yn edrych arni heddiw, gan ei bod yn amlinellu gweledigaeth feiddgar o ran sut y dylai'r Cymoedd edrych. O dirlunio i oleuadau, mae'r rhagolygon ar gyfer newidiadau ffisegol yn gyffrous a dylid eu croesawu.

Yn fy etholaeth, mae Blaenafon, Cwmbrân a Phont-y-pŵl yn gymunedau balch—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Lynne Neagle:** Mae Blaenafon, Cwmbrân a Phont-y-pŵl yn gymunedau balch ynddynt eu hunain, ac nid fel mannau i bobl sy'n gweithio yng Nghaerdydd a Chasnewydd gysgu ynddynt. Mae'r trefi hyn yn haeddu ein cefnogaeth. Mae'r strategaeth hon yn elfen allweddol o'r gwaith hwnnw. Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei chyflwyno.

**Alun Cairns:** At ei gilydd, yr wyf yn cefnogi'r ddogfen. Fy mhryder mwyaf yw

15-year programme follows another 10-year programme, which followed a previous 10-year programme—‘A Winning Wales’, ‘Wales: A Vibrant Economy’, and now ‘Turning Heads: A Strategy for the Heads of the Valleys 2020’. The longer the term of these targets, the more remote and less relevant they become to the people within those communities. It is the Government’s responsibility to empower those communities in order to raise their own standards and sights, and to share prosperity.

Following on from the previous debate, inactivity is a key issue within the Valleys, as elsewhere in Wales. However, there are particular focal points within the Valleys that need to be addressed in terms of inactivity. The point has already been made that the quality of health within the Valleys is among the worst in Wales. Although there are strong links between these issues, modern technology means that not being able to do one role or task on health grounds does not necessarily mean that you are assigned to the scrap heap; you have the opportunity to play a full role in the workforce in another field.

In overcoming inactivity, childcare and flexible working are issues that need to be addressed. These are long-term strategies needed to overcome cultural issues. Therefore, on the one hand, the long-term strategy is a positive issue, which needs to be sustained. Reference has already been made, by Trish Law, to the Valleys initiative, which did bring about some positive issues but clearly was not long-term enough and fell down as a result. Therefore, if we are to retain that ownership and hope among the communities, there need to be short-term goals. I hope that the Minister will address this issue.

The Minister also needs to accept that, with the trend of jobs going to eastern Europe, the Valleys will be particularly vulnerable due to the nature of employment within those communities. This trend will accelerate with the announcement today of two more countries joining the European Union. Again, I do not feel that the document sufficiently addresses this sort of issue. Therefore, on that

bod y rhaglen 15 mlynedd hon yn dilyn rhaglen 10 mlynedd arall, a oedd yn dilyn rhaglen 10 mlynedd cyn hynny—‘Cymru’n Ennill’, ‘Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu’ ac yn awr ‘Syniadau Blaengar: Strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau’r Cymoedd 2020’. Po hwyaf fo tymor y targedau hyn, po bellaf a lleiaf perthnasol y byddant i’r bobl yn y cymunedau hyn. Y Llywodraeth sy’n gyfrifol am rymuso’r cymunedau hynny er mwyn codi eu safonau a’u golygon eu hunain, ac am rannu ffyniant.

Gan ddilyn y ddadl flaenorol, mae anweithgarwch yn fater hollbwysig yn y Cymoedd, fel mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae pwyntiau allweddol eraill yn y Cymoedd sydd angen sylw o ran anweithgarwch. Dywedwyd eisoes fod ansawdd iechyd yn y Cymoedd ymhlith y gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Er bod cysylltiadau cryf rhwng y materion hyn, mae technoleg fodern yn golygu nad yw’r ffaith na allwch ymgymryd ag un rôl neu dasg am resymau iechyd o reidrwydd yn golygu y cewch eich rhoi ar y domen sbwriel; mae gennych gyfle i chwarae rhan lawn yn y gweithlu mewn maes arall.

Wrth oresgyn anweithgarwch, mae gofal plant ac amodau gwaith hyblyg yn faterion y mae’n rhaid rhoi sylw iddynt. Mae’r rhain yn strategaethau hirdymor sydd eu hangen er mwyn goresgyn materion diwylliannol. Felly, ar y naill law, mae’r strategaeth hirdymor yn rhywbeth cadarnhaol, y mae angen ei gynnal. Cafwyd cyfeiriad eisoes, gan Trish Law, at fenter y Cymoedd, a arweiniodd at rai pethau cadarnhaol ond nad oedd yn ddigon hirdymor yn amlwg a bu’n fethiant o’r herwydd. Felly, os ydym am gadw’r ymdeimlad hwnnw o berchnogaeth a gobaith ymhlith y cymunedau, rhaid cael amcanion tymor byr. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi sylw i hyn.

Dylai’r Gweinidog dderbyn hefyd y bydd y Cymoedd, o gofio’r duedd i symud swyddi i ddwyrain Ewrop, mewn perygl oherwydd natur y swyddi sydd yn y cymunedau hynny. Bydd y duedd hon yn cyflymu yn sgîl y cyhoeddiad heddiw y bydd dwy wlad arall yn ymuno â’r Gymuned Ewropeaidd. Unwaith eto, nid wyf yn teimlo bod y ddogfen hon yn rhoi digon o sylw i faterion fel hyn. Felly, o

point—and bearing in mind the tight timescale—I accept many of the positive intentions within the report. The long-term strategy can have a positive influence, but on the other hand, bearing in mind that it follows two other 10-year strategies, I fear that it will make many Valleys people more disillusioned.

5.40 p.m.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate and to support the motion. I also support amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. This strategy is a vital component, as Lynne said, of the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment and determination to regenerate our Valleys communities. I also welcome the publication of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council's western Valleys strategy, which is a genuine effort to regenerate the county's Valleys. That is to be done through economic development, developing the entrepreneurial spirit, enabling the people whom we serve to reach their full potential, through active citizenship, encouraging local people to become involved in the regeneration of their communities. The western Valleys strategy is led by the Labour council leader, Councillor Derek Vaughan, and the county's chief executive. There are ongoing local consultations to listen to local needs. Major programmes will be progressed in all Valleys areas. Local stakeholders are an important aspect in taking the strategy forward.

We need to remember that there are Valleys to the west of the Heads of the Valleys region. They have their own unique identity and culture. The Heads of the Valleys strategy needs to tie in with the strategy produced by Neath Port Talbot council; in my opinion, it is vital that both strategies tie in together. Will the Minister give a commitment to linking both strategies to form a single, coherent blueprint for the regeneration of the south Wales Valleys? The A465 Heads of the Valleys road provides a vital link to Swansea and the M4 corridor. It is also a link between the Heads of the Valleys and the Neath Port Talbot Valleys. Communities First operates in many Valleys

ran y pwynt hwnnw—a chan gadw'r amserlen dynn mewn cof—yr wyf yn derbyn llawer o'r bwriadau cadarnhaol sydd yn yr adroddiad. Gall y strategaeth hirdymor gael dylanwad cadarnhaol, ond ar y llaw arall, gan gofio ei bod yn dilyn dwy strategaeth 10 mlynedd arall, ofnaf y bydd yn gwneud llawer o bobl y Cymoedd yn fwy dadrithiedig.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gael cyfrannu at y ddatl hon ac i gefnogi'r cynnig. Yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Mae'r strategaeth hon yn elfen allweddol, fel y dywedodd Lynne, o ymrwymiad a phenderfyniad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adfywio cymunedau'r Cymoedd. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu cyhoeddi strategaeth Cymoedd gorllewinol Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sy'n ymdrech wirioneddol i adfywio Cymoedd y sir. Gwneir hyn drwy ddatblygu economaidd, datblygu'r ysbryd o fentergarwch, galluogi'r bobl yr ydym yn eu gwasanaethu i gyrraedd eu llawn botensial, drwy fod yn ddinasyddion gweithgar, gan annog pobl leol i gyfrannu at adfywiad eu cymunedau. Arweinir strategaeth y Cymoedd gorllewinol gan arweinydd Llafur y cyngor, y Cyngorydd Derek Vaughan, a phrif weithredwr y sir. Mae ymgynghoriadau lleol yn cael eu cynnal ar hyn o bryd i wrando ar anghenion y bobl leol. Bydd rhaglenni pwysig yn cael eu datblygu yn holl ardaloedd y Cymoedd. Mae rhanddeiliaid lleol yn elfen bwysig wrth ddatblygu'r strategaeth.

Mae'n bwysig inni gofio bod Cymoedd eraill i'r gorllewin o ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae ganddynt eu hunaniaeth a'u diwylliant unigryw eu hunain. Mae angen i strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd gael ei chysylltu â'r strategaeth a gynhyrchwyd gan gyngor Castell-nedd Port Talbot; yn fy marn i, mae'n hanfodol bod y ddwy strategaeth yn cael eu cysylltu â'i gilydd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymrwymo i gysylltu'r ddwy strategaeth i ffurfio un glasbrint cydlynol ar gyfer adfywio Cymoedd y de? Mae ffordd A465 Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn creu cysylltiad hollbwysig gydag Abertawe a choridor yr M4. Mae'n gysylltiad hefyd rhwng Blaenau'r Cymoedd a Chymoedd Castell-nedd Port Talbot. Mae

areas targeted by the western Valleys strategy.

I congratulate the Minister and the Welsh Assembly Government on producing a long-term, viable economic development strategy, but I would like the Minister's assurance that this is only the story so far, and that it is to be continued.

**Leanne Wood:** Until very recently, the Heads of the Valleys strategy covered the tops of the Gwent Valleys, Rhymney, Merthyr, Aberdare and Rhondda Fach; there it stopped. The top end of the Rhondda Fawr was excluded from the strategy. Plaid welcomed the addition of the upper Rhondda Fawr in the strategy, even though it was a late inclusion. It is a shame that it took the announcement of the closure of the Burberry factory in Treorchy, with the loss of over 300 jobs, for that addition to occur.

Even though the upper Rhondda Fawr is now included in the strategy, I question how much difference it will make. The main focus of the strategy is the Heads of the Valleys road. Does the Minister have plans to upgrade the road between Hirwaun and Treherbert? That is very difficult, considering the topography of the area, but how else can we get businesses to establish at the top of the Rhondda Fawr?

As many people have already suggested, the Valleys suffer from past neglect. When other areas were getting new roads, many Valleys areas lost out. We in Plaid Cymru have been putting the case for many years for a Gelli/Treorchy bypass, so that traffic could reach the upper Rhondda Fawr. Yet, the Government has put a block on funding any new roads, so that appears not to be a solution to this problem. There is no point in developing Fernhill, at the top of the Rhondda Fawr, as an economic development centre, if the infrastructure is not improved to enable people to get there. It is concerning that Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council has earmarked only three main areas for development—Aberdare, Pontypridd and Talbot Green. There are no aspirations for such growth in the Rhondda.

Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn gweithio mewn llawer o ardaloedd sy'n cael eu targedu gan strategaeth y Cymoedd gorllewinol.

Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am gynhyrchu strategaeth datblygu economaidd hirdymor, ymarferol, ond hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog mai dim ond y stori hyd yma yw hyn, ac y bydd yn parhau.

**Leanne Wood:** Tan yn ddiweddar iawn, yr oedd strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn cynnwys pennau Cymoedd Gwent, Rhymni, Merthyr, Aberdâr a'r Rhondda Fach; ac yr oedd yn dod i ben yno. Nid oedd pen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr yn rhan o'r strategaeth. Croesawodd Plaid y penderfyniad i ychwanegu'r Rhondda Fawr uchaf at y strategaeth, er ei bod yn hwyr arni'n cael ei chynnwys. Mae'n drueni bod rhaid cael y cyhoeddiad bod ffatri Burberry yn Nhreorci'n cau gan golli dros 300 o swyddi, cyn bod yr ychwanegiad hwnnw'n digwydd.

Er bod pen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr bellach wedi ei gynnwys yn y strategaeth, yr wyf yn amau faint o wahaniaeth a wnaiff hynny. Mae prif bwyslais y strategaeth ar ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd. A oes gan y Gweinidog gynlluniau i uwchraddio'r ffordd rhwng Hirwaun a Threherbert? Mae hynny'n anodd iawn, o ystyried tirwedd yr ardal, ond pa ffordd arall sydd i gael busnesau i ddod i ben uchaf y Rhondda Fawr?

Fel y mae nifer o bobl wedi awgrymu eisoes, mae'r Cymoedd yn dioddef o ganlyniad i esgeulustod y gorffennol. Pan oedd ardaloedd eraill yn cael ffyrdd newydd, yr oedd llawer o ardaloedd y Cymoedd ar eu colled. Yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru wedi bod yn dadlau ers blynyddoedd dros ffordd osgoi i'r Gelli/Treorci, i alluogi traffig i gyrraedd pen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr. Er hynny, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwrthod ariannu ffyrdd newydd, felly ymddengys na fydd hynny'n ateb y broblem. Nid oes pwrpas datblygu Fernhill, ym mhen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr, fel canolfan datblygu economaidd, os na fydd y seilwaith yn cael ei wella i alluogi pobl i gyrraedd yno. Mae'n peri pryder mai dim ond tair ardal sydd wedi cael eu clustnodi gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf ar gyfer eu datblygu—Aberdâr, Pont-y-

pridd a Thonysguboriau. Nid oes dyhead i weld twf o'r fath yn y Rhondda.

So, Minister, while I welcome the inclusion of the upper Rhondda Fawr in the strategy, I sincerely hope that it will actually mean something. The strategy has been allocated no additional resources since the inclusion of the upper Rhondda Fawr, which means that the upper Rhondda Fawr will get nothing or that other areas will lose out. I would be grateful if the Minister could clarify which it will be.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Thirty-three per cent of the entire population of Wales lives within the greater Valleys area. By joining together under a strategy that unites common interests across authority boundaries, this strategy will enable Valleys authorities to punch above their weight, and not compete against each other. A recent good example of this was the excellent news that the Heads of the Valleys employment consortium successfully bid for funding under the Department for Work and Pensions' city strategy. Without working together, it would have been inconceivable that any individual authority would have succeeded in such a funding bid. The result of the bid will see the roll-out of Blaenau Gwent's job-match scheme across the area. Caerphilly borough will greatly benefit from the 2006-07 funding theme of major environmental projects. The additional funding of £1 million will enable Caerphilly County Borough Council to complete 11 projects, with a financial value of some £3.2 million, which will transform the environment of the upper Rhymney valley, including Bargoed and Aberbargoed in my constituency.

As Chair of the Objective 1 programme monitoring committee, I am hopeful that the programme will add a more strategic approach to the delivery of convergence funding, by facilitating a co-ordinated approach for investments in skills training. However, I would have preferred for the education theme to have been given higher priority. I would have preferred it to have been one of the chosen themes for the next

Felly, Weinidog, er fy mod yn croesawu'r penderfyniad i gynnwys pen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr yn y strategaeth, gobeithiaf o waelod calon y bydd hynny'n golygu rhywbeth ystyrion yn y diwedd. Nid oes adnoddau ychwanegol wedi cael eu neilltuo ers i ben uchaf y Rhondda Fawr gael ei gynnwys, sy'n golygu na fydd pen uchaf y Rhondda Fawr yn derbyn dim neu y bydd ardaloedd eraill ar eu colled. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog egluro ai'r naill ynteu'r llall a fydd yn digwydd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae 33 y cant o holl boblogaeth Cymru'n byw o fewn ardal y Cymoedd. Drwy ddod at ei gilydd o dan strategaeth sy'n uno buddiannau cyffredin ar draws ffiniau awdurdodau lleol, bydd y strategaeth hon yn galluogi awdurdodau'r Cymoedd i wneud cryn enw iddynt eu hunain o ystyried eu maint, yn hytrach na chystadlu yn erbyn ei gilydd. Enghraifft dda o hyn yn ddiweddar oedd y newyddion gwyh am gais llwyddiannus consortiwm cyflogi Blaenau'r Cymoedd am arian o dan strategaeth ddinasoedd yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau. Heb weithio gyda'i gilydd, ni fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl i ddim un awdurdod lwyddo ar ei ben ei hun mewn cais o'r fath am gyllid. O ganlyniad i'r cais, bydd gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar gynllun paru swyddi Blaenau Gwent ar draws yr ardal. Bydd bwrdeistref Caerffili yn elwa yn sylweddol o thema gyllido 2006-07, sef prosiectau amgylcheddol mawr. Bydd y cyllid ychwanegol o £1 miliwn yn galluogi Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i gwblhau 11 prosiect, sydd â gwerth ariannol o ryw £3.2 miliwn, a fydd yn trawsnewid amgylchedd pen cwm Rhymni, gan gynnwys Bargoed ac Aberbargoed yn fy etholaeth i.

Fel Cadeirydd pwyllgor monitro rhaglen Amcan 1, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd y rhaglen yn ychwanegu dull mwy strategol o gyflwyno cyllid cydgyfeirio, drwy hwyluso dull cydgysylltiedig ar gyfer buddsoddi mewn hyfforddiant sgiliau. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n well gennyf petai'r thema addysg wedi cael blaenoriaeth uwch. Byddai'n well gennyf pe bai wedi bod yn un o'r themâu a gâi ei dewis ar gyfer y tair blynedd nesaf, ond

three years, but I understand if there are issues of capacity here; perhaps the Minister can address that. However, as has been pointed out, 35 per cent of adults in my constituency have significant literacy and numeracy problems, and basic skills is a key issue that must be addressed under this theme and other programmes.

Flexible education courses, delivered via institutions such as the Community University of the Valleys and the Workers' Educational Association, are key to increasing basic skills and driving down economic inactivity in the Heads of the Valleys area. Making Merthyr Tydfil a thriving university town by 2020 is a key goal. I also welcome the Liberal Democrats' amendment 5 about involving local people in the planning of education courses in particular.

As mentioned, the Bevan Foundation report underlines the educational challenge that the areas faces. The report also states that issues such as unpaid care work and voluntary work contribute in unmeasured ways to the development of soft and basic skills, and impact on our economy. These activities, if assessed and accredited, would impact on how we raise skills in the Heads of the Valleys area.

I welcome the consultation on the Heads of the Valleys programme, and look forward to taking part in its continued development, as it rolls out in the Caerphilly constituency, and in the area as a whole.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I appreciate this chance to speak on this strategy, as it affects many of the people whom I represent in my region of South Wales East. It is important to note—and this cannot be said enough, and we should not forget it—that this strategy is all-inclusive. It not only takes on transport infrastructure issues, but deals with regeneration as a whole. It would therefore be impossible to touch on every area of this strategy today. However, I re-emphasise the fact that each of these areas, such as social justice, crime, roads, housing, sports

yr wyf yn deall os oes problemau'n ymwneud â chapasiti yma; efallai y gall y Gweinidog ymdrin â hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel y nodwyd, mae gan 35 y cant o oedolion yn f'etholaeth i broblemau sylweddol o ran llythrennedd a rhifedd, ac mae sgiliau sylfaenol yn bwnc allweddol y mae'n rhaid mynd i'r afael ag ef dan y thema hon a rhaglenni eraill.

Mae cyrsiau addysg hyblyg, wedi eu cyflwyno gan sefydliadau megis Prifysgol Gymunedol y Cymoedd a Chymdeithas Addysg y Gweithwyr, yn allweddol i gynyddu sgiliau sylfaenol a lleihau anweithgaredd economaidd yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae gwneud Merthyr Tudful yn dref brifysgol ffyniannus erbyn 2020 yn nod allweddol. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu gwelliant 5 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynghylch cynnwys pobl leol yn y gwaith o gynllunio cyrsiau addysg yn benodol.

Fel y crybwyllwyd, mae adroddiad Sefydliad Bevan yn tanlinellu'r her addysgol y mae'r ardaloedd yn ei hwynebu. Dywed yr adroddiad hefyd fod materion megis gwaith gofal di-dâl a gwaith gwirfoddol yn cyfrannu at ddatblygu sgiliau meddal a sylfaenol, ac yn cael effaith ar ein heconomi. Petai'r gweithgareddau hyn yn cael eu hasesu a'u hachredu, caent effaith ar y modd yr ydym yn codi sgiliau yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Croesawaf yr ymgynghori ynghylch rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gymryd rhan yn ei datblygiad parhaus, wrth i'r gwaith fynd rhagddo yn etholaeth Caerffili, ac yn yr ardal gyfan.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Gwerthfawrogaf y cyfle hwn i siarad am y strategaeth, gan ei bod yn effeithio ar lawer o'r bobl a gynrychiolaf yn fy rhanbarth i, Dwyrain De Cymru. Mae'n bwysig nodi—ac ni ellir pwysleisio gormod ar hyn, ac ni ddylem ei anghofio—fod y strategaeth hon yn hollgynhwysol. Nid yn unig y mae'n delio â materion sy'n ymwneud â seilwaith trafnidiaeth, ond ag adfywio yn ei gyfanrwydd. Byddai'n amhosibl felly ymdrin â phob agwedd ar y strategaeth hon heddiw. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf eto y ffaith bod cyswllt rhwng pob un o'r meysydd hyn,

facilities, education and health, are all interlinked and affect each other. If we do not try to tackle each of them, we will not be able to achieve what is, hopefully, the ultimate goal for all of us of regenerating the Heads of the Valleys area.

There are difficult and complex problems to deal with to achieve these aims, as well as many challenges. I hope that the Assembly will be committed to carrying out this strategy, and to doing so quickly. I want—as do most of the people of Wales—to see some action now, and not just warm words.

A good transport infrastructure is key to a vibrant economy; that is the case for the Heads of the Valleys and South Wales East. As they impact on business competitiveness, transport links are often the lifelines of such an area. Ireland had the right idea when it immediately used its European funding to create a substantial and successful transport infrastructure. It led to Ireland's economic activity being fantastic. I do not understand why it has taken Wales, and more particularly this Labour Welsh Assembly Government, so long to catch on to the fact that a good transport infrastructure has a knock-on effect on every area, in terms of achieving regeneration.

Why are we seeing delays in the timing of achieving this transport infrastructure, Minister, which you have talked about ever since I was elected? I hope that this does not need to be said today, but I ask you to ensure that, as an inclusive project, you include such things as disabled access, and really think about disability rights within your strategy, because that is important if this is to be a strategy for everyone in Wales.

5.50 p.m.

It has been stated that my region of South Wales East is more disproportionately dependent on manufacturing than any other area in the country. Judging by the massive job losses that we have had in Blaenau Gwent, Newport and Tredegar, why,

megis cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, troseddu, ffyrdd, tai, cyfleusterau chwaraeon, addysg ac iechyd, a'u bod yn effeithio ar ei gilydd. Oni cheisiwn fynd i'r afael â phob un ohonynt, ni fydd modd inni lwyddo i gyrraedd yr hyn sydd, gobeithio, yn nod i ni oll yn y pen draw, sef adfywio ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd.

Mae problemau anodd a chymhleth i fynd i'r afael â hwy er mwyn cyrraedd y nod, a llawer her hefyd. Gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn ymrwmo i weithredu'r strategaeth hon ac i wneud hynny'n fuan. Yr wyf fi—fel y rhan fwyaf o bobl Cymru—am weld gweithredu yn awr, nid geiriau teg yn unig.

Mae seilwaith trafndiaeth da yn allweddol i economi fywiog; mae hynny'n wir am Flaenau'r Cymoedd ac am Ddwyrain De Cymru. Gan eu bod yn cael effaith ar allu busnesau i gystadlu, mae cysylltiadau trafndiaeth yn aml yn anadl einioes i ardaloedd o'r fath. Yr oedd gwreiddyn y mater gan Iwerddon pan aeth ati'n syth i ddefnyddio'i chyllid Ewropeaidd i greu seilwaith sylweddol a llwyddiannus. Arweiniodd hyn at weithgaredd economaidd rhyfeddol Iwerddon. Ni allaf ddeall pam y cymerodd gymaint o amser i Gymru, ac i Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru, sylweddoli bod seilwaith trafndiaeth da yn cael ganlyniadol ar bob maes, o ran llwyddo i adfywio.

Pam yr ydym yn gweld oedi gydag amseru'r seilwaith trafndiaeth hwn, Weinidog, yr ydych wedi sôn amdano byth ers i mi gael f'ethol? Gobeithio nad oes angen dweud hyn heddiw, ond yr wyf yn gofyn i chi ofalu eich bod, fel prosiect cynhwysol, yn cynnwys pethau megis mynediad i'r anabl, ac yn meddwl o ddifrif am hawliau anabledd yn eich strategaeth, oherwydd y mae hynny'n bwysig os yw am fod yn strategaeth i bawb yng Nghymru.

Dywedwyd bod fy rhanbarth i, Dwyrain De Cymru, yn dibynnu yn fwy anghymesur ar weithgynhyrchu na dim un ardal arall yn y wlad. A barnu yn ôl nifer enfawr y swyddi a gollwyd ym Mlaenau Gwent, Casnewydd a Thredegar, pam, Weinidog, nad ydych yn



Minister, are you not acting on what you have been preaching? This is too little, too late. We need action now. This may be a pretty document and you may like to look at it, but we want to see action, not words.

**Leighton Andrews:** I start by welcoming the additional investment that this strategy will bring to the Heads of the Valleys area. There is already significant investment coming from the Welsh Assembly Government into the Rhondda in the shape of the Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road, which is an £86 million development and is the largest local-authority-led road scheme anywhere in the UK, and the new community hospital currently being built at Llwynypia, as well as many other Objective 1 projects that have been funded in the Rhondda. It is important to recall that one of the significant positive developments in terms of economic statistics over recent years has been the growth in gross household disposable income in the Valleys area, which is actual money in people's pockets that they have to spend. We should mark that.

I am always interested when Plaid Cymru Members talk about road schemes that they think should be priorities, because when the party had the opportunity to run Rhondda Cynon Taf council, its transport strategy, published in 2000, had two road scheme priorities. The first was the Porth-Rhondda Fach relief road, which is currently being funded by the Welsh Assembly Government, and the other was the Church Village bypass. The Gelli-Treorchy bypass, which many of us would like to see, did not feature among those top two priorities. I also note that there is a degree of ignorance on those benches about the commitments being made by RCT council in the Rhondda—the plans for regeneration in Ferndale, for example. There is ignorance also of the investment that the Welsh Assembly Government has planned for Maerdy's redevelopment. A whole series of initiatives are currently going on.

Mention has been made of the Burberry factory closure. I thank all the Assembly Members who have already signed my statement of opinion supporting the GMB

gweithredu yn ôl eich geiriau? Nid yw hyn yn ddigon, ac mae'n rhy hwyr. Mae arnom angen gweithredu yn awr. Dichon fod hon yn ddogfen ddel a'ch bod yn hoffi edrych arni, ond gweithredoedd, nid geiriau, yr ydym am eu gweld.

**Leighton Andrews:** Dechreuaf drwy groesawu'r buddsoddi ychwanegol a ddaw i ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn sgîl y strategaeth hon. Mae buddsoddiad sylweddol eisoes yn dod gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i'r Rhondda ar ffurf ffordd liniaru Porth-y Rhondda Fach, sydd yn ddatblygiad £86 miliwn; dyma'r cynllun ffordd mwyaf a arweiniwyd gan awdurdod lleol yn unman yn y DU, a'r ysbyty cymuned newydd a godir ar hyn o bryd yn Llwynypia, yn ogystal â llawer o brosiectau Amcan 1 eraill a gyllidwyd yn y Rhondda. Mae'n bwysig cofio mai un o'r datblygiadau cadarnhaol o ran ystadegau economaidd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf fu'r twf yn incwm gwario gros aelwydydd yn ardal y Cymoedd, sef arian go iawn ym mhocedi pobl sydd ar gael iddynt i'w wario. Dylem gofio hynny.

Mae wastad o ddiddordeb i mi pan fydd Aelodau Plaid Cymru yn sôn am gynlluniau ffyrdd a ddylai yn eu barn hwy gael blaenoriaeth, oherwydd pan gafodd y blaid y cyfle i redeg cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, yr oedd dwy flaenoriaeth i'w strategaeth drafnidiaeth a gyhoeddwyd yn 2000. Y gyntaf oedd ffordd liniaru'r Porth-y Rhondda Fach, a gyllidir ar hyn o bryd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'r llall oedd ffordd osgoi Pentre'reglwys. Nid oedd ffordd osgoi'r Gelli-Treorci, y carai llawer ohonom ei gweld, ymysg y ddwy brif flaenoriaeth. Sylwaf hefyd fod peth anwybodaeth ar y meinciau hynny ynghylch yr ymrwymadau a wneir gan gyngor RhCT yn y Rhondda—y cynlluniau adfywio yn Ferndale, er enghraifft. Mae anwybodaeth hefyd am y buddsoddi a gynlluniodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer ailddatblygu Maerdy. Mae cyfres sylweddol o gynlluniau ar y gweill ar hyn o bryd.

Soniwyd am gau ffatri Burberry. Diolchaf i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad sydd eisoes wedi llofnodi fy natganiad barn yn cefnogi'r GMB ac Amicus yn eu hymgyrch i gadw'r ffatri

and Amicus in their campaign to keep that factory open. The unions are currently still waiting to hear from the company on the issue of the 90-day consultation. That campaign goes on.

I am delighted today to be rather warmer about the Heads of the Valleys scheme than I have been in correspondence and discussions with the Minister over the last 18 months. As he knows, I have been pressing for some time for Treorchy and Treherbert to be included within the Heads of the Valleys scheme, and I am delighted that they will now be included—it is Treorchy and Treherbert, of course, not the whole of the Rhondda Fawr, as the Plaid Cymru amendment suggests. I am glad that that money will be available to develop projects from the grass roots up in Treorchy and Treherbert.

Finally, I think that the statement from the European Commission this week, in terms of the next phase of convergence funding, is just as important as this strategy. I hope that we develop the convergence funding alongside this strategy, and that we see a lot of major new projects taking place in the Valleys.

**Michael German:** I start by echoing some of the sentiments expressed by both Trish Law and Irene James, namely that, at this stage, we are not looking for strategies, eulogies, pathos and colour; we are, of course, looking for a strategy that delivers on the ground. That echoes some of the points that have been made over the last 18 months by Leighton Andrews regarding the fact that what we need is action.

The strategy that is laid out before us has some errors in terms of its emphasis. It clearly chooses one of the three options that have been put forward, and I think that it is wrong to leave out some of the things that come out of the other two options. Having the Heads of the Valleys road as a strategic corridor for transportation is important in terms of inward investment. If you drive up to Merthyr Tydfil now, you will see a sign for the Midlands—that is how you go there now, rather than going around through Newport. There is already beginning to be a strategic

honno ar agor. Mae'r undebau ar hyn o bryd yn dal i ddisgwyl clywed gan y cwmni ynghylch yr ymgynghoriad 90 diwrnod. Mae'r ymgyrch yn parhau.

Mae'n bleser gennyf heddiw fod fymryn yn fwy brwd ynghylch cynllun Blaenau'r Cymoedd nag yr wyf wedi bod mewn gohebiaeth a thrafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros y 18 mis diwethaf. Fel y gŵyr, bûm yn pwysu ers peth amser am gynnwys Treorci a Threherbert yng nghynllun Blaenau'r Cymoedd, ac yr wyf wrth fy modd y byddant bellach yn cael eu cynnwys—a Threorci a Threherbert ydynt, wrth gwrs, nid y cyfan o'r Rhondda Fawr, fel yr awgryma gwelliant Plaid Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch y bydd yr arian hwnnw ar gael i ddatblygu prosiectau sy'n tarddu o lawr gwlad yn Nhreorci a Threherbert.

Yn olaf, yn fy marn i mae datganiad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yr wythnos hon, am gyfnod nesaf y cyllid cydgyfeirio, yr un mor bwysig â'r strategaeth hon. Gobeithio y byddwn yn datblygu'r cyllid cydgyfeirio ochr yn ochr â'r strategaeth hon, ac y gwelwn lawer o brosiectau mawr newydd yn digwydd yn y Cymoedd.

**Michael German:** Dechreuaf drwy adleisio rhai o'r teimladau a fynegwyd gan Trish Law ac Irene James, sef nad ydym, ar hyn o bryd, yn chwilio am strategaethau, canu clodydd, pathos a lliw; chwilio yr ydym, wrth gwrs, am strategaeth a fydd yn gwireddu'n dyheadau ar lawr gwlad. Mae hynny'n adleisio rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed dros y 18 mis diwethaf gan Leighton Andrews o ran y ffaith mai'r hyn sydd ei angen arnom yw gweithredu.

Mae rhai gwallau yn y strategaeth sydd o'n blaenau o ran ei phwyslais. Mae'n amlwg yn cymryd un o'r tri dewis a roddwyd gerbron, ac yn fy marn i, mae'n anghywir hepgor rhai o'r pethau sy'n deillio o'r ddau ddewis arall. Mae cael ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd fel coridor strategol ar gyfer trafniadaeth yn bwysig o ran mewnfuddsoddi. Os gyrrwch i fyny i Ferthyr Tudful yn awr, fe welwch arwydd ar gyfer canolbarth Lloegr—dyna sut yr ewch yno yn awr, yn hytrach na mynd o gwmpas drwy Gasnewydd. Mae llwybr cyfeiriol strategol yn dechrau ymddangos

directional route, which was referred to by Gwenda, and I echo her points about making it more joined up in order to use it as a corridor for inward investment and development. To rule it out would mean that you were only relying on the local initiatives that you could provide. I think that it would be a shame if the Minister were to do that. On his third option, it would be a shame if he did not realise the important part played by the southern parts of Wales in attracting people who have skills. If you did an analysis of the people who have recently moved to Cardiff, Newport, Bridgend, Swansea, or nearby, you would see that many of them are from the Valleys and are moving to live closer to their place of work. That is why it is important to recognise that.

I suspect that when we have the Ebbw Vale rail link—as the rail links from Rhymney and Merthyr Tydfil already show—we will see that people want to travel to work and want to work, but that they also want to remain in their homes. The first part of the strategy, about building strong communities, will mean that people who have skills will want to go back and live in those areas, although they may want to work elsewhere. On the higher level skills, the more that those higher level skills generate income for people who will spend it in the Heads of the Valleys area, the more important they are. Therefore, I would encourage the Minister to think across his three approaches because they are all important.

Key to this, of course, is not to overheat the road infrastructure—you already have a huge blockage on the A470 as you come into south Wales in the morning and a jam on the A467 junction with the M4 at Tredegar Park. Both of those jams can hold people up for 20 to 30 minutes, leaving them sitting in their cars playing music. The only way of dealing with that problem—you will not alter the situation in any other way—is to make public transport more effective.

Another issue that I want to raise with the Minister is simply that of balance of employment. I just want to raise the fact that

eisoes, rhywbeth y cyfeiriodd Gwenda ato, ac yr wyf yn adleisio ei phwyntiau hi ynghylch ei wneud yn fwy cydgysylltiedig er mwyn ei ddefnyddio'n goridor ar gyfer mewnfuddsoddi a datblygu. Byddai peidio â'i ystyried yn golygu y byddech yn dibynnu ar y mentrau lleol y gallech eu darparu. Byddai'n drueni, yn fy marn i, petai'r Gweinidog yn gwneud hynny. O ran y trydydd dewis, byddai'n drueni pe na bai'n sylweddoli rhan mor bwysig sydd gan rannau deheuol Cymru o ran denu pobl sydd yn meddu ar sgiliau. Petaech yn dadansoddi'r bobl sydd wedi symud yn ddiweddar i Gaerdydd, Casnewydd, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Abertawe neu'r ardaloedd cyfagos, byddech yn gweld bod llawer ohonynt o'r Cymoedd ac yn symud i fyw yn nes at eu gwaith. Dyna pam mae'n bwysig cydnabod hynny.

Yr wyf yn lled-amau, pan ddaw cyswllt rheilffordd Glynebwy—fel y dengys y cysylltiadau rheilffordd o'r Rhymni a Merthyr Tudful eisoës—y gwelwn y bydd pobl am deithio i'w gwaith ac am weithio, ond y byddant hefyd am aros yn eu cartrefi. Bydd rhan gyntaf y strategaeth, sef adeiladu cymunedau cryfion, yn golygu y bydd y bobl sydd yn meddu ar sgiliau am ddychwelyd i fyw yn yr ardaloedd hynny, er y byddant, efallai, yn dymuno gweithio yn rhywle arall. O ran y sgiliau lefel uwch, po fwyaf y bydd y sgiliau lefel uwch hynny yn cynhyrchu incwm i bobl a fydd yn ei wario yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd, pwysicaf oll fyddant. Felly, byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i bwysio a mesur ei dri dull o ymdrin â hyn gan eu bod oll yn bwysig.

Yr hyn sy'n allweddol o ran hyn, wrth gwrs, yw peidio â llethu seilwaith y ffyrdd—mae gennych dagfa enfawr eisoës ar yr A470 wrth ichi ddod i mewn i dde Cymru yn y bore a thagfa ar gyffordd yr A467 gyda'r M4 yn Nhredegar. Gall y tagfeydd hyn olygu bod pobl yn cael eu dal yn ôl am hyd at 20 i 30 munud, gan eu gadael yn eistedd yn eu ceir yn chwarae cerddoriaeth. Yr unig ffordd i ddelio â'r broblem honno—ni newidiwch y sefyllfa mewn dim un ffordd arall—yw gwneud cludiant cyhoeddus yn fwy effeithiol.

Mater arall yr wyf am ei godi gyda'r Gweinidog yw cydbwysedd cyflogaeth. Y cyfan yr wyf am ei wneud yw codi'r ffaith

there are links further south than those in the area that is being included, and I hope that the Minister will include those as well.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We have extended the session for just long enough for me to call the two deputy Ministers before I call the Minister to wind up.

**Huw Lewis:** Before I offer my own critique of the debate today, I want to say that I shudder when Tories get up in the Chamber and offer advice on the future of the south Wales Valleys. It is rather like listening to homilies from the mugger who robbed you over and over again and who now claims to be some sort of reformed character.

I welcome this debate today, as I welcome the Heads of the Valleys strategy and the action plan that goes with it. I hope that it will be fundamental in unlocking the potential of the people of the Heads of the Valleys. The success and distinctiveness that Wales, as a modern nation, has achieved over the last 200 years has depended, to a huge extent, on the graft and ingenuity of the people of the Valleys, and yet these communities have been given scant reward for their historic achievements. It is therefore with great satisfaction, as Labour's Assembly Member for Merthyr and Rhymney, that I welcome a strategy that is both meaningful in its symbolism and in its reality.

Valleys Forward Labour politicians, members of the Bevan Foundation, who have made an invaluable contribution, and those of us who have argued for a concerted co-ordinated action plan for the Heads of the Valleys for years, recognise the potential in this strategy. There is to be £140 million of targeted funding, which will unlock at least £500 million in total, including private investment. In addition to the hundreds of millions of extra investment, one of the most important aspects of the Heads of the Valleys strategy is the absolute necessity for local government, the NHS and other players to work together. This is easily said, and it is often said, but it has historically been a real problem in the region, and I therefore look to the Minister, alongside the programme director, for genuinely tough and robust

bod cysylltiadau ymhellach i'r de na'r rhai yn yr ardal a gynhwysir, a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cynnwys y rheini hefyd.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr ydym wedi ymestyn y sesiwn yn ddigon hir i mi alw'r ddau ddirprwy Weinidog cyn i mi alw ar y Gweinidog i grynhai.

**Huw Lewis:** Cyn i mi gynnig fy nadansoddiad fy hun ar y ddadl heddiw, carwn ddweud bod cryndod yn mynd drwof pan fydd Torïaid yn codi yn y Siambr i gynnig cyngor ar ddyfodol Cymoedd y de. Mae braidd fel gwrando ar ddoethinebau gan y lleidr sydd wedi dwyn gennyich lawer gwaith ac sydd bellach yn honni ei fod wedi cael rhyw fath o dröedigaeth.

Croesawaf y ddadl hon heddiw, fel y croesawaf strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd a'r cynllun gweithredu sy'n cyd-fynd â hi. Gobeithio y bydd yn sylfaen i ddatgloi potensial pobl Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Mae'r llwyddiant a'r arbenigrwydd a brofodd Cymru, fel cenedl fodern, dros y 200m mlynedd diwethaf, wedi dibynnu i raddau helaeth ar waith caled a dyfeisgarwch pobl y Cymoedd, ac eto, prin fu gwobr y cymunedau hyn am eu llwyddiannau hanesyddol. Mae'n destun boddhad mawr i mi, felly, fel Aelod Cynulliad Llafur dros Ferthyr a Rhymni, goesawu strategaeth sydd yn ystyrion o ran ei symbolaeth a'i realaeth.

Mae gwleidyddion Llafur Valleys Forward, aelodau o Sefydliad Bevan, sydd wedi gwneud cyfraniad amhrisiadwy, a'r rhai ohonom sydd wedi dadlau ers blynyddoedd dros gynllun gweithredu cydgyssylltiedig ar y cyd i Flaenau'r Cymoedd, yn cydnabod potensial y strategaeth hon. Targedir £140 miliwn o gyllid, a fydd yn datgloi cyfanswm o £500 miliwn o leiaf, gan gynnwys buddsoddiad preifat. Yn ychwanegol at y cannoedd o filiynau o fuddsoddi ychwanegol, un o agweddau pwysicaf strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd yw'r rheidrwydd absoliwt ar i lywodraeth leol, y GIG a chyfranogwyr eraill gydweithio. Hawdd dweud hyn, ac mae'n cael ei ddweud yn aml, ond yn hanesyddol, mae wedi bod yn broblem wirioneddol yn yr ardal, a disgwyliaf felly i'r Gweinidog, ynghyd â

leadership in this regard. The fact that the strategy stretches until 2020 will not be lost on those of us who already have one eye on that date as the deadline set by the Government for the eradication of child poverty in Wales. A third of the children living in poverty in Wales reside in the Valleys and they will rely not only on our new poverty-proofing measures and the bending of current programmes to target poverty, but on the success of the strategy that we are discussing today and the implementation of other programmes, such as Flying Start and RAISE—raising attainment and individual standards in education. It is encouraging that, in the key themes of the strategy, there is recognition of the untapped potential in the Heads of the Valleys through more considered exploitation of the natural, historic and built environments, and the accompanying tourism and leisure opportunities. The historic built environment in the Valleys has, sadly, been neglected. This must be addressed in order to resurrect civic pride.

6.00 p.m.

This strategy must have at its core a recognition of the fact that the Valleys' built heritage is as important to local civic pride and to Wales as anything built by Edward I or the Marquis of Bute.

**Christine Chapman:** When I meet constituents, as well as people who live outside the Valleys, and we discuss what they see as the problems in the Valleys, people often say that there is a lack of investment in the surroundings and a run-down appearance. I am pleased by this practical strategy, which is why the first theme—improving the physical look of the environment—is so important.

People also say that there are no jobs, or no jobs worth doing, in the Valleys and that, to get on in life, you have to get out of there. I therefore welcome theme 2 for a vibrant economic landscape that offers new opportunities. That will be crucial to dispelling that myth. If we can attract high quality jobs, we will retain our skilled

chyfarwyddwr y rhaglen, roi arweiniad gwirioneddol gryf a chadarn yn hyn o beth. Bydd y rhai ohonom sydd eisoes wedi sylwi ar y flwyddyn 2020 fel y terfyn amser a osododd y Llywodraeth i ddileu tlodi plant yng Nghymru yn ymwybodol iawn o'r ffaith bod y strategaeth yn ymestyn hyd at y dyddiad hwnnw. Mae traean y plant sy'n byw mewn tlodi yng Nghymru yn byw yn y Cymoedd a byddant yn dibynnu nid yn unig ar ein mesurau newydd yn erbyn tlodi a gwyrō'r rhaglenni presennol i dargedu tlodi, ond hefyd ar lwyddiant y strategaeth yr ydym yn ei thrafod heddiw a gweithredu rhaglenni eraill megis Dechrau'n Deg a Rhagori—codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau unigol mewn addysg. Mae'n galonogol bod themâu allweddol y strategaeth yn cydnabod bod gan Flaenau'r Cymoedd botensial nas gwirededwyd ac y gellid gwneud hynny drwy ddatblygu'r amgylcheddau naturiol, hanesyddol ac adeiledig mewn ffordd fwy gofalus, a'r cyfleoedd ym maes twristiaeth a hamdden a ddeuai yn sgîl hynny. Mae amgylchedd adeiledig hanesyddol y Cymoedd, yn anffodus, wedi ei esgeuluso. Rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn er mwyn adfer balchder y bobl.

Rhaid i'r strategaeth hon gael ei seilio ar gydnabod y ffaith bod treftadaeth adeiledig y Cymoedd llawn cyn bwysiced i falchder pobl y fro ac i Gymru ag unrhyw beth a adeiladwyd gan Edward I neu Ardalydd Bute.

**Christine Chapman:** Pan fyddaf yn cyfarfod ag etholwyr, yn ogystal â phobl sy'n byw y tu allan i'r Cymoedd, a ninnau'n trafod y problemau yn y Cymoedd yn eu barn hwy, dywed pobl yn aml fod diffyg buddsoddi yn yr ardal, a golwg fel petai wedi dirywio. Mae'r strategaeth ymarferol hon yn fy mhlesio, a dyna pam mae'r thema gyntaf—gwella gwedd ffisegol yr amgylchedd—mor bwysig.

Mae pobl yn dweud hefyd nad oes dim swyddi, neu nad oes dim swyddi gwerth eu gwneud, yn y Cymoedd ac er mwyn dod ymlaen yn y byd, fod yn rhaid ichi adael. Croesawaf felly thema 2, sef tirwedd economaidd sy'n ffynnu sy'n cynnig cyfleoedd newydd. Bydd hynny'n hollbwysig wrth chwalu'r myth hwnnw. Os gallwn

workers, and the local economy will further benefit from the increase in spending that that will trigger.

I also particularly welcome theme 5, which is about increasing public confidence in a shared bright future. This strategy will work to its full potential only if aspirations are sufficiently high, including those of people in the community. I agree with Kirsty Williams on this; it is about raising people's expectations and aspirations. We have had low aspirations in the Valleys for far too long, and this must be addressed.

I am also picking up on a growing optimism that we are embarking on something special with this strategy. I commend the extent of the ambition, which is to aim for a complete transformation in terms of health, education, the economy, the physical environment and the tourism and leisure experience. I am particularly keen to support option A, as this is a holistic approach to developing balanced communities. This option is about the potential for people of all ages to experience a good quality of life, which helps to build better, cohesive communities. There are some really good examples in my area: we talked about the new hospital in the Cynon valley, which we are all delighted with; and we have had the funding to help to transform the Phurnacite land, which has been a real blot on the landscape for many years in my constituency. There are some examples there, so I am really pleased that things are now starting to happen as a result of the Welsh Assembly Government's vision.

Finally, I remind the Assembly of what is at stake here. As some have mentioned, including Trish Law, my constituents remember the failed Valleys initiative of the Tories—well, perhaps they do not remember it because it achieved so little. However, I am pleased today that Alun Cairns at least recognised the failure of that initiative. We cannot afford to fail now, and I look forward to the consultation and to making some progress.

**The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies):** I thank Members for their contributions to this

ddenu swyddi o safon uchel, byddwn yn cadw ein gweithwyr medrus, a bydd yr economi leol yn elwa ymhellach o'r cynnydd mewn gwario a sbardunir drwy hynny.

Croesawaf yn benodol thema 5, sef cynyddu hyder y cyhoedd mewn dyfodol disglair y gellir ei rannu. Dim ond os bydd dyheadau'n ddigon uchel, gan gynnwys dyheadau pobl yn y gymuned, y bydd y strategaeth hon yn gweithio hyd at ei photensial llawn. Cytunaf â Kirsty Williams yn hyn o beth; mae'n ymwneud â chodi disgwyliadau a dyheadau pobl. Gwelsom ddyheadau rhy isel yn y Cymoedd ers llawer gormod o amser, a rhaid mynd i'r afael â hyn.

Synhwyraf hefyd optimistiaeth gynyddol ynghylch y ffaith ein bod yn cychwyn rhywbeth arbennig gyda'r strategaeth hon. Yr wyf yn canmol maint yr uchelgais, sef anelu at weddnewidiad llwyr ym maes iechyd, addysg, yr economi, yr amgylchedd ffisegol a'r profiad ym maes twristiaeth a hamdden. Yr wyf yn arbennig o awyddus i gefnogi opsiwn A, gan fod hwn yn ddull holistaidd o ymdrin â datblygu cymunedau cytbwys. Mae'r opsiwn hwn yn ymwneud â photensial pobl o bob oed i brofi bywyd o ansawdd da, sy'n helpu i adeiladu cymunedau gwell a mwy cydlynol. Ceir enghreifftiau gwirioneddol dda o hyn yn fy ardal: cyfeiriasom at yr ysbyty newydd yng Nghwm Cynon, sydd wedi ein plesio'n fawr; ac yr ydym wedi cael y cyllid i helpu i weddnewid tîr Phurnacite, a fu'n graith ar y tirlun ers sawl blwyddyn yn fy etholaeth. Ceir rhai enghreifftiau yno, felly yr wyf yn wirioneddol falch bod pethau'n dechrau digwydd, diolch i weledigaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Yn olaf, carwn atgoffa'r Cynulliad o'r hyn sydd yn y fantol yma. Fel y dywedodd rhai, gan gynnwys Trish Law, mae fy etholwyr yn cofio menter y Cymoedd a fethodd dan y Toriaid—neu'n hytrach, nid ydynt yn ei chofio oherwydd na chyflawnodd fawr ddim. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch heddiw fod Alun Cairns o leiaf wedi cydnabod methiant y fenter honno. Ni allwn fforddio methu yn awr, ac edrychaf ymlaen at yr ymgynghori, ac at wneud peth cynnydd.

**Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies):** Carwn ddiolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i'r

debate, which has been thoughtful and considered. The specific comments about the strategy and action plan will be registered by my officials, as part of the consultation process.

To sum up, I reiterate my vision for the Heads of the Valleys. By 2020, the area will be a culturally rich, dynamic network of vibrant and safe communities, a place where people want to live, work and play with a sustainable high quality of life and a thriving population, and it will also be helping to drive the success of south-east Wales as an internationally recognised capital region.

To achieve that, we will deliver an attractive and well used natural, historic and built environment. We will deliver a vibrant economic landscape that offers new opportunities. We will deliver a well educated, skilled and healthier population. I note Jeff Cuthbert's point about a greater emphasis on education, and I will discuss that with my ministerial colleague. However, as a Government we are putting £40 million into the basic skills programme over three years, which will make substantial inroads into the challenges that have been outlined by many colleagues.

We will deliver an appealing and coherent tourism and leisure experience, and we will deliver public confidence in a shared bright future.

As many Members have pointed out, this is a bold and wide-ranging agenda. It cuts across many of the activities of the Welsh Assembly Government, as well as those of other organisations. However, it is an agenda that our partners across the public, private and voluntary sectors have signed up to. I recognise the considerable challenge that Huw Lewis has thrown down of getting our partners to work collaboratively. I have been gratified in the responses that we have received, not just from the five local authorities involved, but also from the voluntary sector and other public sector bodies that are committed to delivering on this important agenda.

ddadl hon a fu'n ystyrion ac yn ddoeth. Bydd y sylwadau penodol am y strategaeth a'r cynllun gweithredu yn cael eu cofnodi gan fy swyddogion, fel rhan o'r broses ymgynghori.

A chrynhoi, yr wyf yn ailadrodd fy ngweledigaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Erbyn 2020, bydd yr ardal yn rhwydwaith deinamig, cyfoethog ei ddiwylliant o gymunedau hyfyw a diogel, yn ardal lle y bydd pobl am fyw, gweithio a chwarae, gyda safon uchel o fywyd cynaliadwy a phoblogaeth sy'n ffynnu, a bydd hefyd yn helpu i lywio llwyddiant y de-ddwyrain fel uwch ranbarth a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol.

I gyflawni hynny, byddwn yn sicrhau amgylchedd naturiol, hanesyddol ac adeiledig deniadol, a ddefnyddir yn helaeth. Byddwn yn sicrhau tirlun economaidd hyfyw a fydd yn cynnig cyfleoedd newydd. Byddwn yn sicrhau poblogaeth addysgedig, medrus ac iachach. Nodaf bwynt Jeff Cuthbert am fwy o bwyslais ar addysg, a thrafodaf hynny gyda fy nghyd-Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn cyfrannu £40 miliwn at y rhaglen sgiliau sylfaenol dros dair blynedd, a bydd hyn yn cael effaith sylweddol ar y sialensiau a amlinellwyd gan sawl cyd-Aelod.

Byddwn yn sicrhau profiad twristiaeth a hamdden deniadol a chydlynus, a byddwn yn sicrhau hyder y cyhoedd mewn dyfodol disglair i'w rannu.

Fel y mae sawl Aelod wedi nodi, mae hon yn agenda eofn ac eang. Mae'n torri ar draws nifer o weithgareddau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn ogystal â rhai sefydliadau eraill. Fodd bynnag, mae'n agenda y mae ein partneriaid ledled y sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol wedi ymrwmo iddi. Yr wyf yn cydnabod yr her sylweddol y mae Huw Lewis wedi ei gosod o sicrhau bod ein partneriaid yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Fe'm calonogwyd gan yr ymatebion a dderbyniasom, nid yn unig gan y pum awdurdod lleol dan sylw, ond hefyd gan y sector gwirfoddol a chyrff sector cyhoeddus eraill sy'n ymroddedig i gyflawni'r agenda bwysig hon.

The achievements of the programme, and of its partners working collectively, should not be underestimated. While most of the emphasis and discussion has been about the actual strategy, underlying that is an action plan. For the first three years of the action plan, there has already been considerable agreement by the partners on the priorities. For example, for 2006-07, there will be five major landscape-scale environmental improvements, one for each of the five local authorities. For 2007-08, five town centres will be chosen by each of the five local authorities as part of the town-centre renewal programme. For 2008-09, there will be five action programmes featuring and highlighting the potential for tourism in the area.

In front of you today is a document that shows that work is already under way, and we have a clear roadmap to the regeneration of the area in the widest possible sense of the word. 'Turning Heads' represents our determination to help the Heads of the Valleys not only to address the issues that they are currently facing, but also to respond to the challenges of the future and their communities' needs and desires.

The Heads of the Valleys programme is a new way of working. It is a model for best practice in public sector delivery in Wales.

**David Melding:** I do not think that it is a new model for working, but it is another opportunity to implement effective joint working between various agencies. There, your action must be pressing. As Huw Lewis said, we need agencies to work together, to share staff, and to break down traditional management structures, so that we can achieve the wider vision contained in this strategy.

**Andrew Davies:** Much as I hate to disagree with you, David, I do think that it is a new way of working. On this scale, on a sub-regional level, getting five local authorities, the voluntary sector, other public sector bodies and the private sector working together, and having achieved so much progress, not just in terms of drawing up a

Ni ddylid bychanu llwyddiannau'r rhaglen, na llwyddiannau ei phartneriaid yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Er bod y rhan fwyaf o'r pwyslais a'r drafodaeth wedi bod ar y strategaeth ei hun, yn sail i hyn oll y mae cynllun gweithredu. Yn ystod tair blynedd gyntaf y cynllun gweithredu, cafwyd eisoes gytundeb sylweddol ymhlith y partneriaid ynghylch y blaenoriaethau. Er enghraifft, ar gyfer 2006-07, bydd pum gwelliant amgylcheddol sylweddol i'r tirlun, un ym mhob un o'r pum ardal awdurdod lleol. Ar gyfer 2007-08, bydd pob un o'r pum awdurdod lleol yn dewis pum canol tref fel rhan o'r rhaglen adnewyddu canol trefi. Ar gyfer 2008-09, bydd pum rhaglen weithredu a fydd yn amlinellu potensial yr ardal o ran twristiaeth ac yn tynnu sylw at hynny.

O'ch blaen heddiw, ceir dogfen sydd yn dangos bod gwaith eisoes ar droed, a bod gennym fap clir tuag at adfywio'r ardal yn ystyr ehangaf posibl y gair. Mae 'Syniadau Blaengar' yn cyfleu ein penderfyniad i helpu Blaenau'r Cymoedd, nid yn unig i fynd i'r afael â'r materion a wynebant ar hyn o bryd, ond hefyd i ymateb i sialensiau'r dyfodol ac anghenion a dyheadau eu cymunedau.

Mae rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn ffordd newydd o weithio. Mae'n fodel ar gyfer arferion gorau mewn darpariaeth sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** Ni chredaf ei fod yn fodel newydd ar gyfer gweithio, ond mae'n gyfle arall i roi cydweithio effeithiol ar waith rhwng amrywiol asiantaethau. Yn y fan honno, rhaid i'ch camau gweithredu fod yn effeithiol. Fel y dywedodd Huw Lewis, mae gofyn inni gael asiantaethau i weithio gyda'i gilydd, i rannu staff, a chwalu strwythurau rheoli traddodiadol, er mwyn inni allu cyflawni'r weledigaeth ehangach a gynhwysir yn y strategaeth hon.

**Andrew Davies:** Er nad wyf yn hoffi anghytuno â chi, David, credaf fod hon yn ffordd newydd o weithio. Ar y raddfa hon, ar lefel isranbarthol, mae cael pum awdurdod lleol, y sector gwirfoddol, cyrff cyhoeddus eraill, a'r sector preifat i weithio gyda'i gilydd, a chyflawni cymaint o gynnydd, nid dim ond o ran llunio strategaeth ond hefyd o



strategy but also in terms of delivery, is a new way of working. It is certainly a way that I want to see used in other parts of Wales, where appropriate.

The Heads of the Valleys programme seizes on the opportunities presented by major investments in the Valleys, including the major regeneration of the former Ebbw Vale steelworks and the dualling of the Heads of the Valleys road, the A465. It takes full advantage of the opportunities that the area presents, such as strong communities with great community pride and commitment, and the attractive benefits of urban living in a rural environment. It will build momentum and secure engagement in the changes that are occurring, transforming the landscape, the economy and, above all, people's lives.

The people of the Heads of the Valleys have played a central role in the economic and social history of our country. Those communities will now have the chance to be a key part of the success story that is Wales currently, as well as even further into the future.

ran cyflawni, yn ffordd newydd o weithio. Mae'n sicr yn ddull yr hoffwn ei weld yn cael ei ddefnyddio mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru, lle y bo hynny'n briodol.

Mae rhaglen Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn manteisio ar y cyfleoedd a ddaw yn sgîl buddsoddi trwm yn y Cymoedd, gan gynnwys yr adfywio sylweddol yn hen waith dur Glynebwy a throi ffordd Blaenau'r Cymoedd, yr A465, yn ffordd ddeuol. Mae'n manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd a gynigia'r ardal, megis cymunedau cryf lle y ceir ymdeimlad mawr o falchder ac ymrwymiad cymunedol, a manteision deniadol bywyd trefol mewn amgylchedd gwledig. Bydd yn creu momentwm ac yn sicrhau ymrwymiad i'r newidiadau sydd yn digwydd, gan weddnewid y tirlun, yr economi ac, yn anad dim, bywydau pobl.

Mae pobl Blaenau'r Cymoedd wedi chwarae rhan ganolog yn hanes economaidd a chymdeithasol ein gwlad. Bydd gan y cymunedau hynny bellach gyfle i chwarae rhan allweddol yn y llwyddiant sy'n nodwedd ar y Gymru sydd ohoni, yn ogystal ag ymhellach fyth i'r dyfodol.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*

*Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

6.10 p.m.

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 2: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 3: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
German, Michael  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 4: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn

Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM3211 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the publication of 'Turning Heads: A Strategy for the Heads of the Valleys 2020' with its accompanying action plan;*

*2. joins the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks in congratulating all the partner organisations for their endeavour in producing the strategy;*

*3. gives full support to all organisations and people involved in working together to deliver change for those who live, work and play in the Heads of the Valleys;*

*4. endorses the need for focusing on increasing prosperity in the areas identified in the strategy, but recognises other Heads of the Valleys areas also need extra assistance;*

Cynnig NDM3211 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn croesawu cyhoeddi 'Syniadau Blaengar: Strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd 2020', gyda'i gynllun gweithredu ategol;*

*2. yn ymuno â'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau wrth longyfarch pob sefydliad partner ar eu hymdrech i gynhyrchu'r strategaeth;*

*3. yn rhoi ei gefnogaeth lwyr i'r holl sefydliadau ac unigolion sy'n gweithio gyda'i gilydd i sicrhau newid ym mywydau'r bobl sy'n byw, gweithio a chwarae ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd;*

*4. yn cymeradwyo'r angen i ganolbwyntio ar gynyddu ffyniant yn yr ardaloedd a bennir yn y strategaeth, ond yn cydnabod bod ardaloedd eraill ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd hefyd angen rhagor o gymorth;*

5. *recognises the importance of putting ICT at the heart of the strategy; and*      5. *yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd gosod TGCh wrth galon y strategaeth; ac*
6. *recognises the crucial importance of involving local people and local partnerships in the delivery of the strategy.*      6. *yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd allweddol cynnwys pobl leol a phartneriaethau lleol wrth gyflwyno'r strategaeth.*

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 45, Ymatal 6, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 45, Abstain 6, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn

Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â  
 today's proceedings to a close. chylfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 6.11 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 6.11 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)

Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)