



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 20 Medi 2006  
Wednesday, 20 September 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- |     |   |
|-----|---|
| 3   | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol<br>Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services  |
| 25  | Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon<br>Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport   |
| 43  | Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ<br>Questions to the House Committee  |
| 44  | Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Rhag Tân) 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog<br>Delegation of Functions under the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 to the First Minister |
| 47  | Blaenraglen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru<br>The Welsh Assembly Government's Forward Work Programme   |
| 89  | Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio<br>Annual Report of the Audit Committee  |
| 99  | Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio: parhad<br>Annual Report of the Audit Committee: continued   |
| 104 | Dadl Fer: Remploy—Y Ddadl dros Gefnogi<br>Short Debate: Remploy—The Case for Support  |

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Cyflyrau Cyhyrsgerbydol Musculoskeletal Conditions**

**Q1 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on services for people with arthritis and other chronic musculoskeletal conditions in Wales? OAQ0964(HSS)

**C1 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau i bobl sydd ag arthritis a chyflyrau cyhyrsgerbydol cronig eraill yng Nghymru? OAQ0964(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** The service development and commissioning directive for arthritis and chronic musculoskeletal conditions has been circulated as part of a three-month consultation exercise. My officials are currently taking into account the feedback from that consultation with a view to producing a final version for wider dissemination to the health service.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Dosbarthwyd y gyfarwydddeb datblygu a chomisiynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer athritis a chyflyrau cyhyrsgerbydol cronig fel rhan o ymgynghoriad tri mis. Mae fy swyddogion yn ystyried yr adborth o'r ymgynghoriad hwnnw ar hyn o bryd gyda'r nod o gynhyrchu fersiwn terfynol i'w ddsbarthu'n ehangach i'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

**Ann Jones:** I was delighted to see the publication of the consultation document during the summer. You will know that I have been campaigning for better services for those with arthritis, osteoporosis and other musculoskeletal conditions for many years. In July 2002, in answer to a question that I raised, the strategy was initially announced by your predecessor, Jane Hutt. What consideration have you given to including in the final document clearer indications of how the Assembly Government intends to ensure the implementation of the key actions identified? Several of the deadlines in the document are imminent, so what is the health service already doing in order to ensure that, for example, the integrated care pathways are developed by March 2007, as promised in the document?

**Ann Jones:** Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld y ddogfen ymgynghori yn cael ei chyhoeddi yn ystod yr haf. Gwyddoch imi fod yn ymgyrchu am wasanaethau gwell i'r rheini sydd ag arthritis, osteoporosis a chyflyrau cyhyrsgerbydol eraill ers blynnyddoedd. Ym mis Gorffennaf 2002, mewn ateb i gwestiwn a godais, cyhoeddwyd y strategaeth eisoes gan eich rhagflaenydd, Jane Hutt. Pa ystyriaeth a roesoch i gynnwys arwyddion cliriach yn y ddogfen derfynol o ran sut mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu sicrhau bod y camau gweithredu allweddol a nodwyd yn cael eu rhoi ar waith? Mae llawer o'r terfynau amser yn y ddogfen ar droed, felly beth mae'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn ei wneud, er enghraifft, i sicrhau bod y llwybrau gofal integredig yn cael eu datblygu erbyn mis Mawrth 2007, fel yr addawyd yn y ddogfen?

**Brian Gibbons:** The point that you make is that these document are fine, but if they do not see the light of day and make a real difference to the patient experience, they do not really count for much. At the moment, the National Leadership and Innovation Agency for Healthcare, which is the improvement agency for the health service, is

**Brian Gibbons:** Y pwynt yr ydych yn ei wneud yw bod y dogfennau hyn yn iawn, ond os na chânt eu cyhoeddi a gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i brofiad y claf, nid oes llawer o werth iddynt. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Asiantaeth Genedlaethol Arwain ac Arloesi mewn Gofal Iechyd, sef asiantaeth gwella'r gwasanaeth iechyd, wrthi'n datblygu

involved in developing specific care pathways. It is not possible to give a definitive timeframe in terms of when that work will be finished, but, as a way of ensuring that the care pathways are implemented, one thing that we would be considering is whether or not they should be included in, for example, the balanced scorecard as the best method of ensuring a good uptake once the care pathways are fully developed and fit for purpose.

**William Graham:** You will know that the expert patient programme has proved valuable in assisting people living with long-term health conditions, so will you acknowledge the importance of disease-specific courses, such as those run by Arthritis Care in Wales? Will you ensure that alternative and complementary courses for the expert patient programme are properly funded?

**Brian Gibbons:** At the beginning, when I first heard of the expert patient group, I would have agreed that what you described was the correct emphasis for the programme. However, having visited a number of expert patient groups and having listened to participants in the programme, I have been convinced to change to my mind. The opinion of people with practical experience of the programme is that it should be developed more thoroughly on a generic base. This seems to be the main message coming from those with practical experience. It is acknowledged that there is also a need for disease-specific information, along the lines that you suggest, but the balance of opinion at the moment is that we should build on what we have and proceed in this general direction. We could then work more effectively with voluntary sector organisations to develop the more specific disease support that is implicit in the expert patient programme.

I commend the expert patient programme. Some of the most moving moments of my time as Minister have been experienced when speaking to some of these groups and seeing how life changing these expert patient volunteers can be. That is heartening and encouraging. I recommend that all Members avail themselves of any opportunities

llwybrau gofal penodol. Nid yw'n bosibl rhoi amserlen derfynol o ran pryd y caiff y gwaith hwnnw ei gwblhau, ond, fel ffordd o sicrhau y caiff y llwybrau gofal eu rhoi ar waith, un peth y byddem yn ei ystyried yw pa un a ddylid eu cynnwys yn y cerdyn sgorio cytbwys, er enghraifft, fel y dull gorau o sicrhau bod nifer uchel o bobl yn manteisio ar y llwybrau gofal cyn gynted ag y byddant wedi'u datblygu'n llawn ac yn addas at y diben.

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch y bu'r rhaglen cleifion arbenigol yn werthfawr wrth helpu pobl sy'n byw gyda chyflyrau iechyd hirdymor, felly a wnewch chi gydnabod pwysigrwydd cyrsiau sy'n canolbwyntio ar glefydau penodol, fel y rhai a gynhelir gan Gofal Arthritis yng Nghymru? A sicrhewch fod cyrsiau amgen a chyflenwol ar gyfer y rhaglen cleifion arbenigol yn cael eu hariannu'n ddigonol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ar y dechrau, pan glywais gyntaf am y grŵp cleifion arbenigol, byddwn wedi cytuno mai'r hyn a ddisgrifiwyd gennych oedd y pwyslais cywir i'r rhaglen. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl ymweld â nifer o grwpiau cleifion arbenigol ac ar ôl gwrandao ar bobl sy'n cymryd rhan yn y rhaglen, cefais fy narbwylllo i newid fy meddwl. Barn y bobl sydd â phrofiad ymarferol o'r rhaglen yw y dylid ei datblygu'n fwy trylwyr ar sail gyffredinol. Ymddengys mai dyma'r brif neges gan y rhai sydd â phrofiad ymarferol. Cydnabyddir bod angen gwybodaeth sy'n canolbwyntio ar glefydau penodol hefyd, ar hyd y trywydd a awgrymwyd gennych, ond y farn gyffredinol ar hyn o bryd yw y dylem adeiladu ar yr hyn sydd gennym a pharhau yn y cyfeiriad cyffredinol hwn. Yna, gallem weithio'n fwy effeithiol gyda sefydliadau'r sector gwirfoddol i ddatblygu'r cymorth mwy penodol i glefydau sydd ymhlyg yn y rhaglen cleifion arbenigol.

Cymeradwyaf y rhaglen cleifion arbenigol. Cefais rai o'm profiadau mwyaf emosiynol fel Gweinidog wrth siarad â rhai o'r grwpiau hyn a gweld sut y gall y gwirfoddolwyr cleifion arbenigol hyn newid bywydau. Mae hynny'n galonogol iawn. Argymhellaf y dylai pob Aelod fanteisio ar unrhyw gyfle a gânt i weld y gwaith a gyflawnir ganddynt.

presented to them to see the work that they do.

**David Lloyd:** Mae nifer o gleifion yn aros am fisoedd mewn poen i weld arbenigwr rhiwmatoleg, felly beth ydych yn ei wneud i gynyddu nifer y rhiwmatolegyddion yng Nghymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** First, in relation to the number of waits, as you know, Dai, no-one is waiting more than 12 months for an out-patient or an in-patient appointment, and 50 per cent of patients who are referred to specialists in Wales are seen within three months, 80 per cent within six months. Therefore, considerable progress has been made as regards the lengths of time that people must wait for healthcare in Wales.

Moving specifically onto rheumatology, this is clearly a workforce planning issue, in terms of developing the workforce's needs. We are working closely with the service to ensure that the number of graduates is adequate and that the sub-specialist training posts that are available—particularly on the new Modernising Medical Careers programmes—are in appropriate demand for us in Wales. That will mean that demand for some of the more traditional areas for people, maybe some of the surgeries, may actually go down, and we may need to provide better training through Modernising Medical Careers for specialities such as rheumatology.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, you mentioned the waiting times for in-patients and out-patients, but you did not mention waiting times for diagnostic testing. A number of my constituents referred by their GPs for bone scans have been told that they will need to wait for four years before they receive such a scan. This is having a huge impact on the ability of their GPs and specialists to treat their condition. Is a four-year wait for a bone scan common across Wales, and is it acceptable?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would not say that it is common by any manner or means, though I certainly know of some issues in individual

**David Lloyd:** A number of patients wait in pain for months to see a rheumatology specialist, so what are you doing to increase the number of rheumatologists in Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn gyntaf, mewn perthynas â nifer y bobl sy'n aros, fel y gwyddoch, Dai, nid oes neb yn aros am fwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad claf allanol na chlaf mewnol, ac mae 50 y cant o'r cleifion a gaiff eu cyfeirio at arbenigwyr yng Nghymru yn cael apwyntiad o fewn tri mis, ac 80 y cant ohonynt o fewn chwe mis. Felly, gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol o ran hyd yr amser y mae'n rhaid i bobl aros am ofal iechyd yng Nghymru.

Gan symud at rhiwmatoleg yn benodol, mae hyn yn amlwg yn fater o gynllunio'r gweithlu, o ran datblygu anghenion y gweithlu. Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda'r gwasanaeth i sicrhau bod nifer y graddedigion yn ddigonol a bod digon o alw am y swyddi hyfforddi is-arbenigol yng Nghymru—yn enwedig ar y rhaglenni Moderneiddio Gyrfaedd Meddygol newydd. Bydd hynny'n golygu y bydd y galw am rai o'r meysydd mwy traddodiadol i bobl, rhai o'r meddygfeydd o bosibl, yn gostwng, ac efallai y bydd angen inni ddarparu hyfforddiant gwell drwy Foderneiddio Gyrfaedd Meddygol ar gyfer meysydd arbenigol fel rhiwmatoleg.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, bu ichi sôn am yr amseroedd aros i gleifion mewnol a chleifion allanol, ond ni soniasoch am amseroedd aros am brofion diagnostig. Dywedwyd wrth lawer o'm hetholwyr a gyfeiriwyd ar gyfer sganiau esgyrn gan eu meddyg teulu y bydd angen iddynt aros am bedair blynedd cyn y cânt sgan o'r fath. Mae hyn yn cael effaith sylweddol ar allu eu meddygon teulu a'u harbenigwyr i drin eu cyflwr. A yw rhestr aros o bedair blynedd ar gyfer sgan esgyrn yn gyffredin ledled Cymru, ac a yw hyn yn dderbyniol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni fyddwn yn dweud ei fod yn gyffredin o gwbl, er y gwn am broblemau mewn ardaloedd unigol yng Nghymru—yn

areas in Wales—indeed, I have had these highlighted to me in my own constituency workload. In fact, we are making considerable progress through the diagnostic and imaging strategy group, linked to the work that we are doing with the diagnostic waiting times group. You will know of our target that no-one should wait more than 36 weeks for their main diagnostic modalities by the end of this year. If you are monitoring the figures, you will have seen that significant progress has been made in working towards those targets. Hopefully, if that progress is maintained in all the main diagnostic modalities, including bone scans, people will not be waiting more than 36 weeks.

wir, fe'u gwelaf fel rhan o faich gwaith fy etholaeth fy hun. Mewn gwirionedd, yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd sylweddol drwy'r grŵp strategaeth diagnostig a delweddu, sy'n gysylltiedig â'r gwaith yr ydym yn ei wneud gyda'r grŵp amseroedd aros diagnostig. Gwyddoch am ein targed, sef na ddylai unrhyw un aros am fwy na 36 o wythnosau am eu prif faes profion diagnostig erbyn diwedd eleni. Os ydych yn monitro'r ffigurau, byddwch wedi gweld y gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol o ran gweithio tuag at y targedau hynny. Gobeithio, os cynhelir y cynnydd hwnnw ym mhob un o'r prif feysydd diagnostig, yn cynnwys sganiau esgyrn, na fydd pobl yn aros am yn hirach na 36 o wythnosau.

### **Bwyd Afiach Unhealthy Food**

**Q2 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister give details of what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to tackle advertising of unhealthy food to children? OAQ0958(HSS)

**C2 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi manylion yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â hysbysebu bwyd afiach i blant? OAQ0958(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The Welsh Assembly Government responded to the Office of Communications consultation on advertising food and drink to children indicating that we would welcome the extension of restrictions to children up to the age of 16, and that these restrictions should be extended to the 9 p.m. watershed. As you realise, this is not a devolved matter on which we can make a direct adjudication.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ymatebodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ymgynghoriad y Swyddfa Gyfathrebiadau ar hysbysebu bwyd a diod i blant gan nodi y byddem yn croesawu'r cynnig i ymestyn y cyfyngiadau i blant hyd at 16 oed, ac y dylid ymestyn y cyfyngiadau hyn hyd at drothwy 9 p.m. Fel y sylweddolwch, nid yw hwn yn fater datganoledig y gallwn roi beirniadaeth uniongyrchol arno.

**Val Lloyd:** I am sure you know that, in Wales, 22 per cent of 15-year-old boys, and 17 per cent of 15-year-old girls, are classified as obese, so the issue of advertising unhealthy food to children needs to be addressed as a matter of urgency.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch fod 22 y cant o fechgyn 15 oed ac 17 y cant o ferched 15 oed yng Nghymru yn cael eu labelu'n ordew, felly mae angen mynd i'r afael â'r mater o hysbysebu bwyd afiach i blant ar fyrder.

I note that, in England, the Department of Health has established a food and drink advertising and promotion forum to develop a self-regulatory framework on restrictions to children in this area, specifically in the non-broadcast area. Could you tell me whether similar measures will be developed in Wales?

Nodaf fod yr Adran Iechyd yn Lloegr wedi sefydlu fforwm hysbysebu a hyrwyddo bwyd a diod i ddatblygu fframwaith hunanreoleiddiol ar gyfyngiadau i blant yn y maes hwn, yn enwedig yn y maes lle nad yw'r hysbysebion yn cael eu darlledu. A allwch ddweud wrthyf pa un a fydd mesurau tebyg yn cael eu datblygu yng Nghymru?

**Brian Gibbons:** As part of the Welsh

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel rhan o rwydwaith

network of healthy school schemes, we are working to create a situation in which the food that is available to children meets certain nutritional specifications. In particular, food would need to have nutritional value in addition to just pure calorie intake. That is the starting point. Equally, we give guidance to schools in relation to the types of fluids and liquids that should be available. All schools should have chilled water available. There is good practice in some areas, such as Pembrokeshire, where a number of schools have removed vending machines that have advertisements on them. We would like to see that developed further in Wales. Vending machines should be available, but they should contain 'nutritional' food, if you like, rather than junk food, and they should not have the blatant advertising that we often see on them.

2.10 p.m.

**David Melding:** Minister, do you agree that if we had more school nurses, they could promote nutrition and the value of eating well and a good balanced diet? We could also have joined-up government whereby they co-operate with those teaching what used to be called domestic science in my day. People need cooking skills so that they can eat well and glory in good food—I am not suggesting that the little darlings are taught how to dispatch a lobster or what to do with a Jerusalem artichoke, but it is important that they have some basic skills.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not sure that using school nurses would be the best way of implementing that policy, but I am sure that you know that this week we are launching a cooking bus, which will go around schools in Wales. I do not know whether you have had an opportunity to visit the bus, but it is an excellent example of spreading good practice. Children can go on the bus and learn rudimentary cooking skills. The other exciting part of that project is that there is a dedicated session for parents, so that both parents and children will learn new cooking skills and have demonstrated to them how nutritious food can be made appetising.

cynlluniau ysgolion iach Cymru, yr ydym yn gweithio i greu sefyllfa lle mae'r bwyd sydd ar gael i blant yn bodloni anghenion maethol penodol. Yn benodol, byddai'n rhaid bod gan fwyd werth maethol yn ogystal â chaloŕiau. Dyna'r man cychwyn. Yn ogystal, rhoddwn ganllawiau i ysgolion o ran y math o hylifau a ddylai fod ar gael. Dylai pob ysgol ddarparu ddŵr oer. Mae arfer da mewn rhai ardaloedd, fel sir Benfro, lle mae nifer o ysgolion wedi cael gwared ar y peiriannau gwerthu bwyd a diod sy'n dangos hysbysebion. Hoffem weld hynny'n cael ei ddatblygu ymhellach yng Nghymru. Dylai peiriannau gwerthu bwyd a diod fod ar gael o hyd, ond dylent gynnwys bwyd 'maethol', yn hytrach na sothach, ac ni ddylent ddangos yr hysbysebion digywilydd sydd i'w gweld yn aml arnynt.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, a gytunwch y gallai nyrsys ysgol hyrwyddo bwydydd maethol a gwerth bwyta'n iach a deiet cytbwys pe bai mwy ohonynt ar gael? Gallem gael llywodraeth gydlynus hefyd lle maent yn cydweithio â'r rhai sy'n addysgu'r hyn a elwid yn wyddor cartref yn fy nydd. Mae angen i bobl gael sgiliau coginio fel y gallant fwyta'n iach a mwynhau bwyd da—nid wyf yn awgrymu y dylai'r pethau bach annwyl ddysgu sut i ladd cimwch na'r hyn y dylid ei wneud ag artisiog Jeriwsalem, ond mae'n bwysig bod ganddynt rai sgiliau sylfaenol.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ai defnyddio nyrsys ysgol fyddai'r ffordd orau o weithredu'r polisi hwnnw, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch ein bod yn lansio bws coginio yr wythnos hon a fydd yn teithio o amgylch ysgolion yng Nghymru. Ni wn pa un a chawsoch gyfle i ymweld â'r bws, ond mae'n enghraifft wych o ledaenu arfer da. Gall plant fynd ar y bws a dysgu sgiliau coginio sylfaenol. Rhan arall gyffrous o'r prosiect hwnnw yw bod sesiwn benodol i rieni, fel y bydd y rhieni a'r plant yn dysgu sgiliau coginio newydd ac yn gweld sut y gellir gwneud bwyd maethol a blasus.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid**

**Democrat Group (Michael German):** Minister, we have had to wait a long time for the legislative power to ban certain foods from schools. Thankfully, according to the First Minister's forward work programme, which we will discuss later this afternoon, we will debate that matter. That is a starting point. I would like to take you back to Val's question about the regulatory aspect, and how we deal with non-tv and radio commercial advertising. It is possible to advertise Brian's burgers and Turkey Twizzlers and so on, but, as Val pointed out, in England there is a self-regulatory appraisal group. Will you establish what this Government can do to turn around the current situation with regard to the growing obesity rates among our children, and make progress by using the regulatory powers available to us?

**Brian Gibbons:** The main emphasis with regard to reaching children is through the work going on through the healthy schools network and in personal and social education classes. Clearly, with regard to regulatory power over the broadcast media, some of that is not within our gift—I do not think that you are suggesting that it is. However, while food is an important element of the equation in tackling obesity, it is only one element. The other element is activity, and if we are to take a balanced approach to this, we need to concentrate on food, but we also need to invest in promoting activity. I will be doing that along with my colleague, Alun Pugh. It is achieving that balance between dietary intake and activity that is crucial, as well as promoting the knowledge that you suggest that we need instead of misinformation through unhelpful advertising.

**Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Weinidog, bu'n rhaid inni aros am amser hir am y pŵer deddfwriaethol i wahardd rhai bwydydd o ysgolion. Diolch i'r drefn, yn ôl blaenraglen waith y Prif Weinidog, y byddwn yn ei thrafod yn nes ymlaen y prynhawn yma, cawn gyfle i drafod y mater hwnnw. Dyna'r man cychwyn. Hoffwn ddychwelyd at gwestiwn Val am yr agwedd reoleiddiol, a sut yr ydym yn delio â hysbysebion masnachol nad ydynt yn ymddangos ar y radio na'r teledu. Mae'n bosibl hysbysebu byrgyrs Brian a Turkey Twizzlers ac ati ond, fel y nododd Val, yn Lloegr mae grŵp arfarnu hunanreoleiddiol. A wnewch gadarnhau yr hyn y gall y Llywodraeth hon ei wneud i droi'r sefyllfa bresennol ar ei phen o ran y cyfraddau o ordewdra sydd ar gynnydd ymhlith ein plant, a gwneud cynnydd drwy ddefnyddio'r pwerau rheoleiddiol sydd ar gael inni?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gwelir y prif bwyslais o ran cyrraedd plant yn y gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo drwy'r rhwydwaith ysgolion iach ac o fewn dosbarthiadau addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol. Yn amlwg, o ran y pŵer rheoliadol dros y cyfryngau darlledu, nid yw pob agwedd ar hynny o fewn ein pwerau—ni chredaf eich bod yn awgrymu hynny. Fodd bynnag, er bod bwyd yn elfen bwysig o'r hafaliad wrth fynd i'r afael â gordewdra, dim ond un elfen ydyw. Yr elfen arall yw gweithgarwch, ac os ydym am feithrin ymagwedd gytbwys, mae angen inni ganolbwyntio ar fwyd, ond mae angen inni hefyd fuddsoddi mewn hyrwyddo gweithgarwch. Gwnaf hynny gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Alun Pugh. Mae cyflawni'r cydbwysedd hwnnw rhwng bwyd a gweithgarwch yn hanfodol, yn ogystal â hyrwyddo'r wybodaeth yr awgrymwyd sydd ei hangen arnom yn lle gwybodaeth gau drwy hysbysebion da-i-ddim.

### **Cyllido Hosbisau The Funding of Hospices**

**Q3 Brynle Williams:** Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of hospices in Wales? OAQ1008(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** The funding of palliative care to meet patient need is a matter for local health boards working with the cancer

**C3 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido hosbisau yng Nghymru? OAQ1008(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae cyllido gofal lliniarol i ddiwallu anghenion cleifion yn fater i'r byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gweithio gyda'r



networks and with voluntary sector partners, such as hospices. The Assembly Government has made £10 million available non-recurrently in recognition of the valuable role that the hospices play, beginning in 2003.

**Brynle Williams:** Independent hospices play a pivotal role in the provision of palliative care in Wales in close co-operation with the NHS, but they face a serious dilemma with regard to funding. Regrettably, cancer and various other terminal illnesses are on the increase, as we know. These people need help now. What will you and your Government do to help?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am sure that you will be aware that in the last three to four months we have distributed an extra £1.6 million out of that £10 million grant to the palliative care sector. Around eight to 10, perhaps even 15, voluntary sector hospices and palliative care organisations have received grants ranging from £150,000 down to £20,000.

Therefore, in the past few months, we have distributed a considerable amount of money to the voluntary sector to deliver palliative care projects. The long-term message is that all palliative care organisations need to work in close partnership with their local NHS organisations, because there are a number of instances in which that joined-up working is not taking place. That is not to say that those organisations are not doing a valuable job, but, in many instances, that is not linking up with the mainstream commissioning priorities. If that linkage does not take place, some of these palliative care services will have sustainability problems in the short and medium term.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I declare an interest as patron of the Marie Curie hospice in Penarth. You will be aware of the Marie Curie campaign for the choice to die at home instead of in a hospice or hospital. Will you consider what support you can give so that people have the choice to die at home, with the support of Marie Curie nurses, and other healthcare practitioners, as you have mentioned?

**Brian Gibbons:** I am glad that you

rhwydweithiau canser a chyda phartneriaid y sector gwirfoddol, fel hosbisau. Ers 2003 mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi clustnodi £10 miliwn i gydnabod y rôl werthfawr y mae hosbisau'n ei chwarae.

**Brynle Williams:** Mae gan hosbisau annibynnol rôl ganolog yn y gwaith o ddarparu gofal lliniarol yng Nghymru mewn cydweithrediad agos â'r GIG, ond maent mewn cyfyng-gyngor o ran ariannu. Yn anffodus, mae canser ac afiechydon terfynol eraill ar gynnydd, fel y gwyddom. Mae'r bobl hyn angen cymorth yn awr. Beth a wnewch chi a'ch Llywodraeth i helpu?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol ein bod wedi dosbarthu £1.6 miliwn ychwanegol o'r grant £10 miliwn hwnnw yn ystod y tri i bedwar mis diwethaf i'r sector gofal lliniarol. Mae tua wyth i 10, efallai 15, o hosbisau'r sector gwirfoddol a sefydliadau gofal lliniarol wedi cael grantiau yn amrywio o £150,000 i £20,000.

Felly, yn yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi dosbarthu swm sylweddol o arian i'r sector gwirfoddol i ddarparu prosiectau gofal lliniarol. Y neges hirdymor yw bod angen i'r holl sefydliadau gofal lliniarol weithio mewn partneriaeth agos â'u sefydliadau GIG lleol, oherwydd mae nifer o achosion lle nad yw'r gweithio cydgysylltiedig hwnnw'n digwydd. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad yw'r sefydliadau hynny'n gwneud gwaith gwerthfawr, ond mewn llawer achos, nid yw hynny'n cysylltu â'r blaenoriaethau comisiynu prif ffrwd. Os nad yw'r cysylltiad hwnnw'n digwydd, bydd rhai o'r gwasanaethau gofal lliniarol hyn yn cael problemau o ran cynaliadwyedd yn y bydymor a'r tymor canolig.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Datganaf fuddiant fel noddwr hosbis Marie Curie ym Mhenarth. Fe wyddoch am ymgyrch Marie Curie dros yr hawl i farw yn y cartref yn hytrach nag mewn hosbis neu ysbyty. A ystyriwch pa gefnogaeth y gallwch ei rhoi fel bod pobl yn cael dewis marw gartref, gyda chefnogaeth nysys Marie Curie, ac ymarferwyr gofal iechyd eraill, fel y bu ichi grybwyll?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf yn falch eich bod

mentioned the Marie Curie Holme Tower centre in Penarth, because, as part of the allocation that I just mentioned to Brynle, we were pleased to give the centre around £200,000, which I am sure is welcome. On 13 June, we published the Welsh health circular, 'End of Life Care—All Wales Care Pathway for the Last Days of Life', which tries to encapsulate the element of patient choice about where they want to spend the last days of their lives. One of the reasons we published that was following a conversation that I had with Dr Andy Fowell from North West Wales NHS Trust and Baroness Ilorá Finlay from Marie Curie, who have been vigorous in promoting this. We were able to have a meeting with the Baroness and listen to her representations. On the back of that, we issued the circular in June. I know from the meeting that we attended upstairs that that was warmly welcomed by Marie Curie.

wedi crybwyll canolfan Holme Tower Marie Curie ym Mhenarth, oherwydd fel rhan o'r dyraniad y soniais amdano wrth Brynle, roeddem yn falch o allu rhoi tua £200,000 i'r ganolfan, arian a groesewir yn fawr yr wyf yn siŵr. Ar 13 Mehefin, bu inni gyhoeddi cylchlythyr iechyd Cymru, 'Gofal Dyddiau Olaf Bywyd—Llwybr Gofal Cymru Gyfan ar gyfer Dyddiau Olaf Bywyd', sy'n ceisio crynhoi'r elfen o ddewis sydd gan gleifion o ran ble maent am dreulio dyddiau olaf eu bywydau. Un o'r rhesymau y bu inni gyhoeddi'r cylchlythyr hwnnw oedd yn sgîl sgwrs a gefais i â Dr Andy Fowell o Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru a'r Farwnes Ilorá Finlay o elusen Marie Curie, sydd wedi bod yn hybu hyn yn frwd. Cawsom gyfle i gael cyfarfod â'r Farwnes a gwranddo ar ei sylwadau. Ar gefn hynny, bu inni gyhoeddi'r cylchlythyr ym mis Mehefin. Gwn yn sgîl y cyfarfod a gawsom i fyny'r grisiau bod elusen Marie Curie yn falch iawn o weld y cylchlythyr hwnnw.

#### **Llwybr at Wasanaethau Iechyd o'r Radd Flaenaf Access to First-class Health Services**

**Q4 Christine Chapman:** How is the Welsh Assembly Government ensuring that people in Cynon valley have access to first-class health services? OAQ1011(HSS)

**C4 Christine Chapman:** Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n sicrhau y gall pobl yng nghwm Cynon gael llwybr at wasanaethau iechyd o'r radd flaenaf? OAQ1011(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the Assembly's prime aims is to support improvements in patient access to NHS services, and the situation is improving. Rhondda Cynon Taff Local Health Board is responsible for commissioning healthcare services for the residents of the Cynon valley from the Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust and the North Glamorgan NHS Trust.

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o brif amcanion y Cynulliad yw cefnogi gwelliannau o ran llwybrau cleifion at wasanaethau'r GIG, ac mae'r sefyllfa'n gwella. Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf sy'n gyfrifol am gomisiynu gwasanaethau gofal iechyd ar gyfer trigolion cwm Cynon gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Pontypridd a'r Rhondda ac Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Morgannwg.

**Christine Chapman:** All of us were pleased about the recent announcement regarding a new hospital for Cynon valley. That has been positive. However, you may be aware that North Glamorgan and Pontypridd and Rhondda trusts are jointly considering the option of forming one integrated organisation, and that the regional plan for south-east Wales, which was consulted upon earlier this year, also proposes bringing the

**Christine Chapman:** Roedd pob un ohonom yn falch o glywed y datganiad diweddar ynghylch codi ysbyty newydd i gwm Cynon. Yr oedd yn ddatganiad cadarnhaol. Fodd bynnag, efallai eich bod yn gwybod bod ymddiriedolaethau Gogledd Morgannwg a Phontypridd a'r Rhondda yn cyd-ystyried ffurfio un sefydliad integredig, a bod y cynllun rhanbarthol ar gyfer y de-ddwyrain, y bu ymgynghoriad arno yn gynharach eleni,

working arrangements between Prince Charles Hospital and the Royal Glamorgan Hospital closer together. In fact, I have been discussing these issues with the organisations concerned. Are you fully engaged with these discussions, because this is a time of uncertainty for people and it is important that we try to unpack what is happening? Will you give an assurance that Cynon valley will be an equal partner in whatever model is considered best placed to deliver this, and that my constituents will be able to access first-class services that are expertly provided in the best clinical way and as locally as possible?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes, I think that we can say that. The key word that you used was 'merger', because some people are trying to portray the merger as a takeover, and that would be unacceptable. As Huw Lewis has said on a number of occasions, the health profile in Merthyr Tydfil, the Upper Rhymney valley and Cynon valley is among the worst in Wales. It is important that we have a full network of quality services along the lines of those provided at the new hospital in Mountain Ash and the new primary care support unit in Aberdare. Linked to that, it is also important that we also maintain the quality services at a hospital level in Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr Tydfil.

2.20 p.m.

**Leanne Wood:** You have just mentioned Prince Charles Hospital in Merthyr. As you are aware, that hospital provides vital services for people in the Cynon valley. Can you guarantee today that none of the services currently provided at Prince Charles Hospital will be removed? Yes or no?

**Brian Gibbons:** No-one can make such a statement, because one of the big challenges is that if we want to improve the quality of hospital services for Merthyr's population and for those who live further down the Rhondda valley, there has to be considerable change in how those services are configured. Therefore, the challenge or question is not whether or not the status quo will be maintained, rather what sort of change is

hefyd yn cynnig dwyn trefniadau gwaith Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ac Ysbyty Brenhinol Morgannwg yn nes at ei gilydd. Yn wir, bwm yn trafod y materion hyn â'r sefydliadau dan sylw. A ydych yn rhan o'r trafodaethau hyn, oherwydd mae hwn yn gyfnod o ansicrwydd i bobl ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ceisio dadansoddi'r hyn sy'n digwydd? A allwch roi sicrwydd y bydd cwm Cynon yn bartner cyfartal ym mha bynnag fodel a ddewisir i gyflawni hyn, ac y caiff fy etholwyr lwybr at wasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf wedi eu darparu gan arbenigwyr yn defnyddio'r dulliau clinigol gorau a hynny mor lleol â phosibl?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gallwn, yr wyf yn credu y gallwn ddweud hynny. Y gair allweddol y bu ichi ei ddefnyddio oedd 'uno', oherwydd mae rhai pobl yn ceisio portreadu'r uno fel meddiannu, a byddai hynny'n annerbyniol. Fel y dywedodd Huw Lewis ar sawl achlysur, mae'r proffil iechyd ym Merthyr Tudful, ym mhen uchaf cwm Rhymni ac yng nghwm Cynon ymysg y gwaethaf yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym rwydwaith gyflawn o wasanaethau o ansawdd yn debyg i'r rhai a ddarperir yn yr ysbyty newydd yn Aberpennar a'r uned cymorth gofal sylfaenol yn Aberdâr. Yn gysylltiedig â hynny, mae hefyd yn bwysig ein bod yn cynnal y gwasanaethau o ansawdd ar lefel ysbyty yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr Tudful.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr ydych newydd grybwyll Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl ym Merthyr. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r ysbyty hwnnw yn darparu gwasanaethau hanfodol i bobl yng nghwm Cynon. A allwch roi sicrwydd inni heddiw na chaiff unrhyw wasanaethau a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd yn Ysbyty'r Tywysog Siarl eu diddymu? A allwch, ai peidio?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni all neb wneud datganiad o'r fath, oherwydd un o'r heriau mawr os ydym am wella ansawdd y gwasanaethau ysbyty i boblogaeth Merthyr ac i'r rhai sy'n byw yn is i lawr cwm Rhondda, yw bod yn rhaid cael newid sylweddol yn y modd y cyflunnir y gwasanaethau hynny. Felly, yr her neu'r cwestiwn yw nid pa un a fydd y sefyllfa yn aros fel y mae, ond yn hytrach pa fath o newid sydd ei angen i ddarparu

needed to provide better quality services for the people in Merthyr, Pontypridd and the Rhondda. You may want to live in the past, but Welsh Labour wants to deliver improvements with a can-do mentality to give us world-class health services in Wales.

**David Melding:** Some interesting work on mental health services in the northern Valleys has been undertaken by a range of organisations, including those in the voluntary sector, such as developing a tidal model of care. That very much emphasises that patients need to be central and that cognitive therapies need to be made more available than they are today. We know that the incidence of mental health difficulties in the Cynon valley and other areas is higher, so do you think that that ought to be a priority for your Government?

**Brian Gibbons:** It is a priority. Indeed, one of the service and financial framework targets that we set for the health service this year was to improve access to psychology services in a primary care setting. We have set the target for the health service to work towards achieving access to psychology services at a primary care level within six weeks. You are right—this is an important aspect of the service, and it is important that we give it the priority of one of the top two dozen tasks that we expect the health service to deliver in this financial year.

gwasanaethau o ansawdd gwell i bobl ym Merthyr, Pontypridd a'r Rhondda. Efallai eich bod chi am fyw yn y gorffennol, ond mae Llafur Cymru am fod yn gadarnhaol a gwneud gwelliannau i sicrhau gwasanaethau iechyd o'r radd flaenaf inni yng Nghymru.

**David Melding:** Gwnaed peth gwaith diddorol ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng ngogledd y Cymoedd gan ystod o sefydliadau, gan gynnwys y rhai hynny yn y sector gwirfoddol, megis datblygu model llanw ar gyfer gofal. Mae hwnnw'n rhoi pwyslais cryf ar y ffaith bod angen i gleifion fod yn ganolog a bod angen i therapïau gwybyddol fod ar gael yn fwy helaeth nag y maent ar hyn o bryd. Gwyddom fod mynychder anawsterau iechyd meddwl yng nghwm Cynon ac ardaloedd eraill yn uwch, felly a ydych yn credu y dylai hynny fod yn flaenoriaeth i'ch Llywodraeth?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n flaenoriaeth. Yn wir, un o dargedau'r fframwaith gwasanaeth a chyllid y bu inni eu gosod i'r gwasanaeth iechyd eleni oedd gwella llwybr at wasanaethau seicolegol mewn lleoliadau gofal sylfaenol. Yr ydym wedi gosod targed i'r gwasanaeth iechyd weithio tuag at greu llwybr at wasanaethau seicolegol ar lefel gofal sylfaenol o fewn chwe wythnos. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle—mae hon yn agwedd bwysig ar y gwasanaeth, ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn ei gosod yn flaenoriaeth fel un o'r dau ddwsin o dasgau pwysicaf y disgwyliwn i'r gwasanaeth iechyd eu cyflawni yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol hon.

### Gwasanaethau Gofal Canser Cancer Care Services

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau gofal cancer yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0959(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Tackling cancer across Wales remains one of the Welsh Assembly Government's top priorities for the NHS in Wales. Our strategy is to improve services in terms of quality and access through the progressive implementation of our national cancer standards and the advice of organisations such as the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence.

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on cancer care services in South Wales Central? OAQ0959(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae mynd i'r afael â chanser ledled Cymru yn parhau i fod yn un o brif flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y GIG yng Nghymru. Ein strategaeth yw gwella gwasanaethau o ran ansawdd a pha mor hawdd yw cael gafael arnynt drwy weithredu ein safonau cancer cenedlaethol yn gynyddol yn ogystal â cheisio cyngor sefydliadau fel y Sefydliad

Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol.

**Owen John Thomas:** You do not seem to be aware of the community cancer service, which provides transport for cancer sufferers from towns across the Valleys to Cardiff and Pontypridd. That service makes up to 50 round trips a week and more than 800 people have so far benefited from it. That work has already eased the pressure on an already stretched ambulance service. Funding from the Big Lottery Fund will come to an end next week. Unless you find new funding for the service, it will stop. What discussions have you had with the Big Lottery Fund to enable this wonderful and vital service to continue to help cancer sufferers?

**Owen John Thomas:** Ymddengys na wyddoch am y gwasanaeth canser cymunedol, sy'n darparu trafndiaeth i ddiodefwyr canser o drefi ar draws y Cymoedd i Gaerdydd a Phontypridd. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw'n gwneud hyd at 50 o dripiâu dwy ffordd bob wythnos ac mae dros 800 o bobl wedi ei ddefnyddio hyd yma. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw eisoes wedi lliniaru'r pwysau ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, sydd o dan bwysau eisoes. Bydd arian y Gronfa Loteri Fawr yn dod i ben yr wythnos nesaf. Oni allwch ganfod arian newydd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth, daw i ben. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr er mwyn sicrhau y gall y gwasanaeth gwych a hanfodol hwn barhau i helpu diodefwyr canser?

**Brian Gibbons:** I have to say that I have had no discussions with the Big Lottery Fund, because that is not part of my responsibility. It is an independent organisation that responds to applications made to it. It is not my duty, as Minister for health, to interfere in the independent running of that organisation. Having said that, I have been to the organisation in the Cynon valley and in Tonypany, where I spoke with the volunteers and full-time staff working with those organisations. The miners' welfare was also a big factor in supporting the facility in Tonypany. They were certainly receptive to my message along the lines of what I just said to Brynle.

**Brian Gibbons:** Rhaid imi ddweud na chefais unrhyw drafodaethau â'r Gronfa Loteri Fawr, oherwydd nid yw'n rhan o'm cyfrifoldeb. Sefydliad annibynnol ydyw, sy'n ymateb i geisiadau a anfonir ato. Nid fy nyletswydd i, fel Gweinidog iechyd, yw ymyrryd yng ngwaith annibynnol y sefydliad hwnnw. Wedi dweud hynny, ymwelais â'r sefydliad yng nghwm Cynon ac yn Nhonypany, lle siaradais â'r gwirfoddolwyr a'r aelodau staff llawn amser sy'n gweithio gyda'r sefydliadau hynny. Roedd lles y glowyr hefyd yn ffactor pwysig o ran cefnogi'r cyfleuster yn Nhonypany. Yn sicr yr oeddent yn barod i dderbyn fy neges a oedd yn debyg i'r hyn a ddywedais gynnu wrth Brynle.

The main source for commissioning services at a local level is through the local health board, and its engagement must be with the LHB working in partnership with the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. That is the appropriate way in which to do that. My efforts are geared towards working with the health service. As I say, we have no jurisdiction over the Big Lottery Fund and so, clearly, I could not influence it.

Y brif ffynhonnell ar gyfer comisiynu gwasanaethau yn lleol yw drwy'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, a rhaid ymgysylltu â'r BILl gan weithio mewn partneriaeth ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Dyna'r ffordd briodol o wneud hynny. Anelir fy ymdrechion i tuag at weithio gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd. Fel y soniais, nid oes gennym awdurdod dros y Gronfa Loteri Fawr, ac felly, yn amlwg, ni allwn ddylanwadu arni.

**Leighton Andrews:** Minister, I was glad that you were able to visit the community cancer care service with me earlier this year, which

**Leighton Andrews:** Weinidog, yr oeddwn yn falch eich bod wedi gallu ymweld â'r gwasanaeth gofal canser cymunedol gyda mi

is doing a good job of supporting patients with cancer. Many of my constituents are currently actively involved in fundraising initiatives, which I support, to try to keep that cancer care service going. You mentioned that the local health board might be one route, but would you be prepared to support the idea of the local health board and other parts of the health service looking at how to provide further assistance to that centre?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. I think that, actually, we are undertaking a review of the patient transport service at the moment, and not just the emergency ambulance service. The first part of that review is looking at the patient transport service from the point of medical need, such as cancer services, or people who have chronic renal disease who may have to make regular trips to hospital for dialysis and so forth. We are engaging with the review on precisely those issues. Its outcome is not yet complete and is not available, but that preliminary work needs to be done.

Moving on to the wider agenda, I certainly accept that it is providing a valuable service, but it must link in to local priorities on the ground. Indeed, when we were there together, there was recognition among the providers in Tonypanyd that this was the correct direction in which to travel. There were very committed volunteers for fundraising and so forth, but that partnership needed to be built up at a local level, with the local health board, the ambulance trust, and the main hospitals.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Minister, you will be aware that, on 7 June, Health Commission Wales approved a paper that would have led to the provision of brachytherapy services in Velindre Hospital. You will also be aware that patients received letters some weeks later, on 2 August, stating, and I quote,

‘brachytherapy treatment should not be offered as an NHS treatment option to Welsh patients until further notice’.

Can you explain this change in Health

yn gynharach eleni, gwasanaeth sy'n gwneud gwaith da o ran cefnogi cleifion â chanser. Mae llawer o'm hetholwyr yn weithgar iawn ar hyn o bryd mewn mentrau codi arian, gwaith yr wyf yn ei gefnogi, er mwyn ceisio cadw'r gwasanaeth gofal canser hwnnw i fynd. Sonioch fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol yn un llwybr posibl, ond a fydddech yn barod i gefnogi'r syniad o gael y bwrdd iechyd lleol a rhannau eraill o'r gwasanaeth iechyd i edrych ar ddulliau o roi mwy o gymorth i'r ganolfan honno?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwn. Credaf ein bod, fel mae'n digwydd, yn cynnal adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth trafndiaeth i gleifion ar hyn o bryd, ac nid dim ond y gwasanaeth ambiwlans brys. Mae rhan gyntaf yr adolygiad hwnnw yn edrych ar y gwasanaeth trafndiaeth i gleifion o safbwynt angen meddygol, megis gwasanaethau canser, neu bobl â chlefydau arenol cronig y gallai fod angen iddynt wneud tripiâu rheolaidd i'r ysbyty i gael dialysis ac ati. Yr ydym yn ymwneud â'r adolygiad ar yr union faterion hynny. Nid yw ei ganlyniad wedi'i gwblhau eto ac nid yw ar gael, ond mae angen gwneud y gwaith rhagarweiniol hwnnw.

A symud ymlaen i'r agenda ehangach, derbyniaf yn sicr bod y ganolfan yn darparu gwasanaeth gwerthfawr, ond mae'n rhaid iddi gysylltu â blaenoriaethau lleol ar lawr gwlad. Yn wir, pan oeddem yno gyda'n gilydd, yr oedd y darparwyr yn Nhonypanyd yn cydnabod mai'r cyfeiriad hwn yw'r cyfeiriad cywir. Yr oedd gwirfoddolwyr ymrwymedig iawn yn codi arian ac ati, ond yr oedd angen cryfhau'r bartneriaeth honno ar lefel leol, gyda'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, a'r prif ysbytai.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Weinidog, fe wyddoch i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, ar 7 Mehefin, gymeradwyo papur a fyddai wedi arwain at ddarparu gwasanaethau brachytherapi yn Ysbyty Felindre. Fe wyddoch hefyd i gleifion gael llythyrau rai wythnosau yn ddiweddarach, ar 2 Awst, yn datgan,

na ddylid cynnig triniaeth brachytherapi fel dewis ar y GIG i gleifion yng Nghymru hyd nes rhoddir gwybod fel arall.

A allwch esbonio'r newid hwn yn safbwynt

Commission Wales's position, and can you outline today whether the reasons for that related to any clinical question of the viability of the therapy, or whether they were financial?

**Brian Gibbons:** No, I think that the answer is the latter point. A decision has been made in principle that we should be providing low-dose brachytherapy for people suffering from prostate cancer in Wales. Indeed, that is the decision to which you referred, which Health Commission Wales made in principle. It is committed to people who are on waiting lists for that, so those patients will get the treatment if that is what they have been referred for. However, in trying to commission that service, either in England or in Velindre, the cost or tariff of those services was much more expensive than Health Commission Wales had expected when it made that in-principle decision. It has had discussions with Velindre in the last couple of weeks, and both Velindre and Health Commission Wales are working together to try to come up with a sustainable commissioning plan to deliver these services in Wales. The decision in principle is that this service should be available to patients in Wales, as you state. However, it is a case of ensuring that that is built into the commissioning plans for the future, so that the money will be there to allow that to happen.

**Irene James:** Minister, will you join me in paying tribute to the voluntary sector for its cancer care, particularly the cancer care line in my constituency, which provides a unique and valuable service supporting cancer patients and their families in Islwyn? Do you agree that, in addition to a new hospital service and primary care centres across Caerphilly County Borough Council, we must also ensure the vitality of community and voluntary support services, which provide wraparound care for cancer patients across Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. Very often, we do not realise the contribution that the voluntary sector makes to healthcare in Wales and, indeed, the contribution of the partnerships that exist.

Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru, ac a allwch amlinellu heddiw pa un ai cwestiwn clinigol ynghylch hyfywedd y therapi oedd y rheswm am y newid hwnnw, ynteu resymau ariannol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nage, credaf mai eich pwynt diwethaf yw'r ateb. Gwnaed penderfyniad mewn egwyddor y dylem fod yn darparu brachytherapi dos isel i bobl sy'n dioddef o ganser y brostad yng Nghymru. Yn wir, dyna'r penderfyniad y bu ichi gyfeirio ato, y penderfyniad a wnaeth Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru mewn egwyddor. Ymrwymwyd i roi'r driniaeth i bobl sydd ar restrau aros amdani, felly bydd y cleifion hynny yn cael y driniaeth os cawsant eu hatgyfeirio i'w chael. Fodd bynnag, wrth geisio comisiynu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw, yn Lloegr neu yn Felindre, yr oedd cost neu dariff y gwasanaethau hynny yn llawer drutach nag yr oedd Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru wedi ei ddisgwyl pan wnaeth y penderfyniad hwnnw mewn egwyddor. Yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf bu'r Comisiwn yn trafod â Felindre, ac maent ill dau yn cydweithio er mwyn ceisio canfod cynllun comisiynu cynaliadwy i ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hyn yng Nghymru. Y penderfyniad mewn egwyddor yw y dylai'r gwasanaeth hwn fod ar gael i gleifion yng Nghymru, fel y nodwch. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod hyn yn rhan o'r cynlluniau comisiynu ar gyfer y dyfodol, fel bod yr arian yno er mwyn caniatáu i hynny ddigwydd.

**Irene James:** Weinidog, a ymunwch â mi i dalu teyrnged i'r sector gwirfoddol am ei ofal canser, yn arbennig y llinell gofal canser yn fy etholaeth, sy'n darparu gwasanaeth unigryw a gwerthfawr o ran cefnogi cleifion â chanser a'u teuluoedd yn Islwyn? A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni, yn ogystal â chael gwasanaeth ysbyty newydd a chanolfannau gofal sylfaenol ar draws Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili, sicrhau parhad gwasanaethau cymorth cymunedol a gwirfoddol, sy'n darparu gofal cofleidiol i gleifion â chanser ledled Cymru?

**Brian Gibbons.** Cytunaf. Yn aml iawn, nid ydym yn sylweddoli maint cyfraniad y sector gwirfoddol i ofal iechyd yng Nghymru, ac yn wir, gyfraniad y partneriaethau sy'n bodoli eisoes.

2.30 p.m.

The Wales Council for Voluntary Action completed a study a few months ago that showed that the national health service in Wales has contracts with the voluntary sector of around £250 million annually to provide a wide range of services. This is for the direct delivery of services and also for support services along the lines that you suggest.

The voluntary sector is a key partner for us in the health service. We need close working between the voluntary sector and the NHS. It is important that all voluntary sector organisations, as they develop their projects, have discussions with their local health boards and trusts at an early stage so that they do not come to the end of a project and find problems with sustaining the work in the long term. The partnership between the health service and the voluntary sector must be a two-way street.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brynle Williams spoke earlier about the importance of the palliative care provided by hospices in Wales. On average, what proportion of hospices' core funding comes from the Assembly Government?

**Brian Gibbons:** It is not possible to give an answer to that, because many palliative care services are part of mainstream NHS provision. Much palliative care is given in a general practice setting by community nurses. Palliative care for those with end-stage respiratory disease is delivered by chest physicians, and palliative care for those with cardiac disease is delivered by cardiologists. Therefore, it is not possible to disaggregate the figures. For many conditions, palliative care is part of the overall patient pathway. The circular that I mentioned in responding to Lorraine Barrett is an effort by the Welsh Assembly Government to make sure that palliative care is linked more closely into the overall patient journey for all of the major chronic illnesses that we have in Wales. So it is difficult to disaggregate the figures in the way that you asked.

Cwblhaodd Cyngor Gweithredu Gwirfoddol Cymru astudiaeth rai misoedd yn ôl a ddangosodd fod gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru gcontractau gyda'r sector gwirfoddol gwerth tua £250 miliwn y flwyddyn i ddarparu ystod eang o wasanaethau. Mae hyn ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau uniongyrchol ac hefyd ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymorth tebyg i'r rhai a awgrymir gennyh.

Mae'r sector gwirfoddol yn bartner allweddol i ni yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae angen i'r sector gwirfoddol a'r GIG gydweithio'n agos â'i gilydd. Mae'n bwysig bod pob un o sefydliadau'r sector gwirfoddol, wrth iddynt ddatblygu eu prosiectau, yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda'u byrddau iechyd lleol a'u hymddiriedolaethau yn gynnar er mwyn sicrhau na fyddant yn cyrraedd diwedd prosiect ac yn wynebu problemau o ran cynnal y gwaith yn yr hirdymor. Rhaid i'r bartneriaeth rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r sector gwirfoddol fod yn un ddwyffordd.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Soniodd Brynle Williams yn gynharach am bwysigrwydd y gofal lliniarol a ddarperir gan hosbisau yng Nghymru. Ar gyfartaledd, pa gyfran o arian craidd hosbisau a roddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid yw'n bosibl ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw, oherwydd mae llawer o wasanaethau gofal lliniarol yn rhan o ddarpariaeth prif-ffrwd y GIG. Caiff cryn dipyn o ofal lliniarol ei roi mewn practisau cyffredinol gan nyrsys cymunedol. Cyflenwir gofal lliniarol ar gyfer y rheini â chlefyd anadlol cam olaf gan feddygon y frest, a chyflenwir gofal lliniarol ar gyfer y rheini â chlefyd cardiaidd gan gardiolegwyr. Felly, nid yw'n bosibl gwahanu'r ffigurau. Ar gyfer llawer o gyflyrau, mae gofal lliniarol yn rhan o lwybr cyffredinol y claf. Mae'r cylchlythyr y soniais amdano wrth ymateb i Lorraine Barrett yn ymdrech gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod cysylltiad agosach rhwng gofal lliniarol a thaith gyffredinol y claf ar gyfer pob un o'r prif afiechydon cronig yng Nghymru. Felly mae'n anodd gwahanu'r ffigurau yn y ffordd a



ofynnwyd gennych.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Perhaps you do not know what proportion of their core funding hospices receive from you, but, were you to ask them, they could tell you that it is, on average, between 20 and 30 per cent. I understand that the Department of Health has a target that, by 2008, 50 per cent of the core funding of hospices in England will come from the UK Government. Why do we not have such a target in Wales, and why are patients and hospices in Wales being disadvantaged purely because of your policies in the Assembly Government?

**Brian Gibbons:** I do not think that you understand the process. A large amount of palliative and hospice care is delivered by the mainstream national health service in Wales. Your quoting the situation in England does not get us much further, because you have to consider what is happening on the ground in Wales. The answer to your question may become more apparent, as we have asked for a special study to be done to see whether it is possible to disaggregate some of the statistics that you asked for. That is out to tender. However, in terms of giving benchmarked sums of money to hospices, we need to look at the profile of palliative and hospice care in Wales, rather than implement a target from England in a mechanical way.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Efallai na wyddoch ba gyfran o'u harian craidd y mae hosbisau yn ei dderbyn gennych, ond, pe baech yn gofyn iddynt, byddent yn gallu dweud wrthyich mai rhwng 20 a 30 y cant yw'r ganran ar gyfartaledd. Deallaf fod gan yr Adran Iechyd darged, sef y bydd 50 y cant o arian craidd hosbisau yn Lloegr yn cael ei roi gan Lywodraeth y DU erbyn 2008. Pam nad oes gennym darged o'r fath yng Nghymru, a pham bod cleifion a hosbisau yng Nghymru dan anfantais o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'ch polisiau chi yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Brian Gibbons:** Ni chredaf eich bod yn deall y broses. Mae cyfran helaeth o ofal lliniarol a gofal hosbis yn cael ei chyflenwi gan y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol prif-ffrwd yng Nghymru. Nid yw sôn am y sefyllfa yn Lloegr yn helpu, oherwydd rhaid ichi ystyried yr hyn sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad yng Nghymru. Efallai y daw'r ateb i'ch cwestiwn yn fwy amlwg, gan ein bod wedi gofyn am astudiaeth arbennig i weld pa un a yw'n bosibl gwahanu rhai o'r ystadegau y gwnaethoch ofyn amdanynt. Mae'r astudiaeth honno yn destun proses dendro ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, o ran rhoi symiau o arian wedi'u meincnodi i hosbisau, rhaid inni edrych ar broffil gofal lliniarol a gofal hosbis yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na gweithredu targed sy'n berthnasol i Loegr mewn ffordd fecanyddol.

### **Ffonau Symudol mewn Ysbytai Mobile Phones in Hospitals**

**Q6 Lynne Neagle:** Will the Minister make a statement on the use of mobile phones in and around Welsh hospitals? OAQ0975(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** While the Assembly has issued guidance regarding areas where medical devices are likely to be affected by the use of mobile phones and so forth, it is up to individual trusts to develop their own policies in relation to mobile phones and where they can be safely used in and around hospitals.

**Lynne Neagle:** As you know, there is

**C6 Lynne Neagle:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddefnyddio ffonau symudol mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru ac yn eu cyffiniau? OAQ0975(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Er bod y Cynulliad wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau ar ardaloedd lle y mae'n debygol y gallai'r defnydd o ffonau symudol effeithio ar ddyfeisiau meddygol ac yn y blaen, penderfyniad ymddiriedolaethau unigol yw datblygu eu polisiau eu hunain mewn perthynas â ffonau symudol a ble y gellir eu defnyddio'n ddiogel mewn ysbytai ac yn eu cyffiniau.

**Lynne Neagle:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae pryder

growing concern regarding the current system of charging for phone services in hospitals. You will also be aware of recent scientific research that states that mobile phone use is safe in many parts of hospitals. Will you, therefore, in the interests of patients who cannot afford 49p-a-minute phone charges, commit to a review or an audit of the current communication systems in Welsh hospitals? Will you issue new guidance to Welsh health trusts on mobile phone use in hospitals?

**Brian Gibbons:** The guidance that we sent to the NHS pointed out that it is not necessary for any hospital to have a global ban on the use of mobile phones throughout the entire premises. However, there is electromagnetic equipment in hospitals that would be subject to interference from mobile phones. Trusts should look at where within the hospital interference could take place and put in place the necessary signage and warning notices and so on so that people can know the areas of risk and be assured that they can use their phones safely in other parts of the hospital. Equally, I think that it is important that, wherever possible, patients in hospitals should have access to telephone trolleys and conventional landlines because, in many instances, they are much cheaper than mobile phones.

cynyddol ynghylch y system bresennol o godi tâl am wasanaethau ffôn mewn ysbytai. Byddwch hefyd yn ymwybodol o waith ymchwil gwyddonol diweddar sy'n nodi bod y defnydd o ffonau symudol yn ddiogel mewn llawer o fannau mewn ysbytai. A wnewch chi, felly, er budd cleifion na allant fforddio talu'r 49 ceiniog y funud a godir am ddefnyddio'r ffôn, ymrwymo i gynnal adolygiad neu archwiliad o'r systemau cyfathrebu cyfredol mewn ysbytai yng Nghymru? A wnewch chi gyhoeddi canllawiau newydd i ymddiriedolaethau iechyd yng Nghymru ar ddefnyddio ffonau symudol mewn ysbytai?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oedd y canllawiau a anfonwyd gennym i'r GIG yn nodi nad oes angen i unrhyw ysbyty weithredu gwaharddiad cyffredinol ar ddefnyddio ffonau symudol ar draws yr eiddo cyfan. Fodd bynnag, mae offer electromagnetig mewn ysbytai y byddai ffonau symudol yn effeithio ar eu gweithrediad. Dylai ymddiriedolaethau ystyried ble o fewn yr ysbyty y gallai hyn ddigwydd a gosod yr arwyddion a'r rhybuddion angenrheidiol ac ati fel y gall pobl wybod ble mae'r ardaloedd â risg a bod â thawelwch meddwl y gallant ddefnyddio eu ffonau yn ddiogel mewn rhannau eraill o'r ysbyty. Yn ogystal, credaf ei fod yn bwysig, lle bynnag y bo'n bosibl, y dylai cleifion mewn ysbytai allu defnyddio trolïau ffôn a llinellau daear confensiynol oherwydd, yn aml, maent yn llawer rhatach na ffonau symudol.

### Gofal Sylfaenol Primary Care

**Q7 Mark Isherwood:** Will the Minister make a statement on primary care in north Wales? OAQ0955(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Modernisation of primary care services across Wales is driven by the provisions of the new general practitioner contracts and the new contracts for pharmacy and dentistry, as well as the broader roll-out of 'Designed for Life'.

**Mark Isherwood:** Clwyd Community Health Council has rejected plans for the overhaul of hospital and NHS services in

**C7 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ofal sylfaenol yn y Gogledd? OAQ0955(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Caiff y broses o foderneiddio gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol ledled Cymru ei sbarduno gan ddarpariaethau'r contractau meddygon teulu newydd a'r contractau fferylliaeth a deintyddiaeth newydd, yn ogystal â'r broses ehangach o gyflwyno 'Cynllun Oes'.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Clwyd wedi gwrthod cynlluniau i ddiwygio gwasanaethau ysbyty a

north Wales, stating that

‘The public remain sceptical that the transfer of work from secondary care into the primary care setting will be properly resourced and planned, [and] see little evidence of clinical governance and resourcing having been discussed in any great depth’.

The council concludes that, after considering all of the issues, it is unable to support the proposals contained in ‘Designed for North Wales’ as it currently stands. North Wales town councillors met you in Abergele last week and hoped to discuss the matter with you, but they did not have an opportunity to do so—I believe that time pressures were upon you on that occasion. However, both the primary and secondary healthcare plans by local health boards and trusts have been produced, as you know, by instruction from and in accordance with your policies. You are publicly accountable and they are not. What actions do you therefore propose to address these concerns? Please do not deny that accountability because I also speak to local health boards and trusts and I know what sort of guidance they have been given.

**Brian Gibbons:** There are a number of inaccuracies in what you said, Mark. First, the reason why I was not able to discuss service reconfiguration with the town councillors in Abergele was not a matter of time constraints; the predominant reason, as has been said repeatedly to your colleague, Lisa Francis, was that I may have an adjudicatory role in the process, particularly if local agreement cannot be reached on the substantive issues in relation to the reconfiguration of services in all parts of Wales. The reason why I cannot respond directly to the specific question that you asked, any more than I could respond specifically to the questions that some people wanted to ask at Abergele, is that a response could prejudice my position as the ultimate adjudicator. That could leave the whole process, which has been difficult in some parts of Wales, subject to legal challenge and judicial review and that would clearly not be

gwasanaethau'r GIG yn y gogledd, gan nodi

Mae'r cyhoedd yn parhau i amau pa un a fydd yr adnoddau cywir ar gael i drosglwyddo gwaith o leoliadau gofal eilaidd i ofal sylfaenol a pha un a fydd y broses honno yn cael ei chynllunio'n gywir, [ac] nid ydynt yn gweld llawer o dystiolaeth bod llywodraethu clinigol ac adnoddau wedi'u trafod yn fanwl.

Ar ôl ystyried yr holl faterion, daw'r cyngor i'r casgliad na all gefnogi'r cynigion yn 'Cynllun Gogledd Cymru' fel ag y mae. Bu i gynghorwyr tref y gogledd gyfarfod â chi yn Abergele yr wythnos diwethaf ac yr oeddent yn gobeithio trafod y mater gyda chi, ond ni chawsant y cyfle i wneud hynny—credaf mai prin oedd yr amser a oedd gennych ar yr achlysur hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynlluniau gofal iechyd sylfaenol ac eilaidd gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau wedi'u cynhyrchu, fel y gwyddoch, yn dilyn cyfarwyddiadau eich polisïau ac yn unol â hwy. Yr ydych yn atebol i'r cyhoedd ac nid ydynt hwy. Pa gamau a gynigiwch felly i fynd i'r afael â'r pryderon hyn? Peidiwch â gwadu'r atebolrwydd hwnnw gan fy mod innau hefyd yn siarad â byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau ac yn gwybod pa fath o ganllawiau a roddwyd iddynt.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae llawer o'r hyn a ddywedasoch, Mark, yn anghywir. Yn gyntaf, nid cyfyngiadau amser oedd y rheswm pam na fu imi allu trafod ailgyflunio gwasanaethau gyda'r cynghorwyr tref yn Abergele; y prif reswm, fel y dywedwyd lawer gwaith wrth eich cyd-Aelod, Lisa Francis, oedd ei fod yn bosibl y bydd gennyf rôl ddyfarnol yn y broses, yn enwedig os na ellir dod i gytundeb yn lleol ar y materion sylweddol mewn perthynas ag ailgyflunio gwasanaethau ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Y rheswm pam na allaf ymateb yn uniongyrchol i'r cwestiwn penodol a ofynnwyd gennych, ac yn yr un modd na allwn ymateb yn benodol i'r cwestiynau yr oedd rhai pobl yn dymuno eu gofyn yn Abergele, yw y gallai ymateb roi fy statws fel y dyfarnwr terfynol yn y fantol. Gallai hynny olygu y byddai'r broses gyfan, a fu'n anodd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, yn destun her gyfreithiol ac adolygiad barnwrol ac, yn

in anyone's interest.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Minister, do you agree that, with an ageing population, it is important that primary care services in north Wales reflect the changing needs of the local population? What action is being taken to ensure that older people are represented in developing primary care services in north Wales?

**Brian Gibbons:** We certainly need to be grateful to all of those people who have taken an active part in the consultation process on the future of health services in north Wales. I know that you, as the representative of your constituency, are at the forefront of making sure that the hopes and ambitions of local people are adequately represented. We are anxious that that participation should continue. As part of responding to the challenge posed by older people in north Wales, it is encouraging to see that the doctor to patient ratio in many parts of north Wales is among the best in Wales. I think that, by having a lower doctor to patient ratio, more time can be made available to patients and that is particularly important for older patients, who often have a wide range of complex problems.

2.40 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** You have stressed the importance of listening to what patients want and I take you back to what Mark was saying. It is not just Clwyd Community Health Council that has rejected these plans—Conwy Community Health Council has also unanimously rejected these plans. Conwy Community Health Council says that the vision fails lamentably and that it would not be in the best interests of the health service to proceed with the proposals in their present form. Its statement is based on fear that the services that will be taken away will not be redeveloped in the community, and that we will face a situation in primary care that we faced with regard to mental health care some years ago, when care in the community came in and the services that were to replace hospital-based ones were not available in the community. Will you give an absolute promise today that you will not let any changes go ahead until we can see clearly

amlwg, ni fyddai hynny o fudd i unrhyw un.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Weinidog, a gytunwch, gyda phoblogaeth sy'n heneiddio, ei fod yn bwysig bod gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn y gogledd yn adlewyrchu anghenion newidiol y boblogaeth leol? Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn cael eu cynrychioli wrth ddatblygu gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol yn y gogledd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr, mae angen inni fod yn ddiolchgar i'r holl bobl sydd wedi cymryd rhan weithredol yn y broses ymgynghori ar ddyfodol gwasanaethau iechyd yn y gogledd. Gwn eich bod chi, fel cynrychiolydd eich etholaeth, ar flaen y gad o ran sicrhau bod gobeithion ac uchelgeisiau pobl leol yn cael eu cynrychioli'n ddigonol. Yr ydym yn awyddus i'r cyfranogiad hwnnw barhau. Fel rhan o'r broses o ymateb i'r her a berir gan bobl hŷn yn y gogledd, mae'n galonogol gweld bod y gymhareb meddygon i gleifion mewn nifer o rannau o'r gogledd ymhlith y gorau yng Nghymru. Credaf, drwy sicrhau cymhareb meddygon i gleifion is, y gellir sicrhau bod mwy o amser ar gael i gleifion ac mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig ar gyfer cleifion hŷn, y mae ganddynt ystod eang o broblemau cymhleth yn aml.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr ydych wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd gwrando ar ddymuniadau cleifion a hoffwn ddychwelyd at yr hyn a ddywedodd Mark. Nid Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Clwyd yw'r unig gyngor sydd wedi gwrthod y cynlluniau hyn—mae Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Conwy hefyd wedi gwrthod y cynlluniau hyn yn unfrydol. Dywed Cyngor Iechyd Cymuned Conwy fod y weledigaeth yn methu'n druenus ac ni fyddai parhau â'r cynigion presennol er budd y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae ei ddatganiad yn seiliedig ar ofn na fydd y gwasanaethau a gaiff eu diddymu yn cael eu hailddatblygu yn y gymuned, ac y byddwn yn wynebu'r un sefyllfa o ran gofal sylfaenol ag a wynebwyd gennym o ran gofal iechyd meddwl rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, pan gyflwynwyd gofal yn y gymuned ac nid oedd y gwasanaethau y bwriadwyd iddynt ddisodli gwasanaethau ysbyty ar gael yn y gymuned. A wnewch chi addo heddiw na wnewch ganiatáu i unrhyw newidiadau gael eu

how those services will be developed, where they will be developed and from where their budgets will come, so that people can have confidence that the services that they want will be available?

**Brian Gibbons:** That is intrinsic to the whole review of the NHS in north Wales and elsewhere. People must have the assurance that, when we are ready to move forward, the range of services will be in place and the vision outlined in 'Designed for Life' can be realised. I am pleased that there has been such a high level of public engagement in this process, because democratic participation in a consultation process such as this exposes the proposals to strict public scrutiny, as has been the case with those that have come forward in north Wales. That is good, and I know that the health service in north Wales and elsewhere will listen to the outcome of that. In formulating the final set of proposals, they must then take the messages on board, and ensure that the principles that you mentioned underpin them.

**Carl Sargeant:** Before we make changes following the reviews of secondary care provision, we must ensure that primary care provision is correct. For many years, the towns of Buckley and Connah's Quay in my constituency have been promised new primary care facilities by the local health board. A recent newspaper article and an article in *Pulse* stated that 22 out of the 26 surgeries in Flintshire were in need of a significant upgrade. Are you confident that funding is available for Flintshire Local Health Board to do this? When can I expect to tell my constituents in Buckley and Connah's Quay that they will be getting new super-surgeries, as promised by the local health board?

**Brian Gibbons:** I have had an opportunity to look at the *Pulse* article and it is not the most rigorous, scientific piece of work that I have ever read. Nonetheless, there are headline messages there, which include the fact that in some parts of Flintshire, the primary care estate is not as good as it should be. I am aware that the local health board has appointed a third-party developer to work on

gweithredu tan y gallwn weld yn glir sut y caiff y gwasanaethau hynny eu datblygu, ble y cânt eu datblygu ac o ble y daw'r cyllidebau ar eu cyfer, fel y gall pobl deimlo'n hyderus y bydd y gwasanaethau a ddymunant ar gael?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae hynny'n hanfodol i'r adolygiad cyfan o'r GIG yn y gogledd ac mewn mannau eraill. Rhaid i bobl gael y sicrwydd, pan fyddwn yn barod i symud ymlaen, y bydd yr ystod o wasanaethau ar waith ac y gellir gwireddu'r weledigaeth a amlinellwyd yn 'Cynllun Oes'. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod lefel ymgysylltiad y cyhoedd â'r broses hon mor uchel, gan fod cyfranogiad democrataidd mewn proses ymgynghori fel hon yn sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn gallu craffu'n llym ar y cynigion, fel sydd wedi digwydd gyda'r cynigion a gyflwynwyd yn y gogledd. Mae hynny'n dda, a gwn y bydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y gogledd ac mewn mannau eraill yn gwrando ar ganlyniad hynny. Wrth lunio'r set derfynol o gynigion, mae'n rhaid iddynt ystyried y negeseuon, a sicrhau bod yr egwyddorion y gwnaethoch sôn amdanynt yn eu hategu.

**Carl Sargeant:** Cyn inni wneud newidiadau yn dilyn yr adolygiadau o'r ddarpariaeth gofal eilaidd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth gofal sylfaenol yn gywir. Am nifer o flynyddoedd, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi addo cyfleusterau gofal sylfaenol newydd i drefi Bwcle a Chei Connah yn fy etholaeth. Nododd erthygl papur newydd ddiweddar ac erthygl yn *Pulse* bod angen uwchraddio 22 o'r 26 o feddygfeydd yn sir y Fflint yn sylweddol. A ydych yn hyderus bod arian ar gael er mwyn i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol sir y Fflint wneud hyn? Pryd y gallaf ddisgwyl y gallaf hysbysu fy etholwyr ym Mwcle a Chei Connah y byddant yn cael meddygfeydd gwych newydd sbon, fel yr addawyd gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr wyf wedi cael y cyfle i edrych ar yr erthygl yn *Pulse* ac nid dyma'r darn o waith mwyaf trylwyr a gwyddonol yr wyf wedi'i ddarllen erioed. Serch hynny, mae negeseuon amlwg ynddi, sy'n cynnwys y ffaith nad yw'r ystâd gofal sylfaenol mewn rhai rhannau o sir y Fflint cystal ag y dylai fod. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi penodi datblygwyr trydydd

the Buckley project, which you have raised with me previously. The same partnership will be developing three other schemes in the Flintshire area. Therefore, a commitment has been demonstrated by the local health board to addressing the problems with primary care estates in Buckley and in other parts of Flintshire.

There are hurdles to overcome in delivering that project, such as planning permission and so forth. Therefore, delivering these proposals can be a little more protracted than we would like. However, I have received assurances from the local health board that it has already started work on this, and is actively engaged with the necessary partnerships to deliver the improvements for which you are asking.

parti i weithio ar brosiect Bwcle, pwynt yr ydych wedi'i godi gyda mi yn flaenorol. Bydd yr un bartneriaeth yn datblygu tri chynllun arall yn ardal sir y Fflint. Felly, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi dangos ymrwymiad i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau gydag ystadau gofal sylfaenol ym Mwcle ac yn rhannau eraill o sir y Fflint.

Mae rhwystrau i'w goresgyn o ran cyflwyno'r prosiect hwnnw, fel caniatâd cynllunio ac yn y blaen. Felly, gallai cyflwyno'r cynigion fod yn broses ychydig yn hirach nag y byddem yn ei ddyddio. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi cael sicrwydd gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol ei fod wedi dechrau ar y gwaith hwn eisoes, a'i fod yn ymgysylltu â'r partneriaethau angenrheidiol i gyflwyno'r gwelliannau yr ydych yn gofyn amdanynt.

### **Gwasanaeth Ambiwllans The Ambulance Service**

**Q8 Jenny Randerson:** Will the Minister make a statement on the effectiveness of the Welsh ambulance service? OAQ0967(HSS)

**C8 Jenny Randerson:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effeithiolrwydd gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru? OAQ0967(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that it is clear to everyone in the Assembly that much remains to be done to improve the effectiveness of the ambulance trust. The trust is in the process of finalising its modernisation plan to deliver improvements for both staff and management, and, most particularly, for patients in Wales. It hopes to present the final modernisation plan in December of this year.

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf ei fod yn glir i bawb yn y Cynulliad bod llawer i'w wneud i wella effeithiolrwydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Mae'r ymddiriedolaeth wrthi'n cwblhau ei chynllun moderneiddio i gyflwyno gwelliannau ar gyfer staff a rheolwyr, ac, yn fwyaf arbennig, ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru. Mae'n gobeithio cyflwyno ei chynllun moderneiddio terfynol ym mis Rhagfyr eleni.

**Jenny Randerson:** There have been questions about the effectiveness of the all-Wales ambulance structure. As part of this, will you or the inquiry look at the variability in the workload faced by crews in different parts of Wales? I have done some research and discovered that, in the south-east region, which includes Cardiff and the Valleys—rather than what we define as the south-east region—crews make more than 55 urgent and emergency journeys a month per full-time member of staff, but that in north Wales they make 40 such journeys. I am not arguing for fewer ambulance crews in north Wales—I am arguing for more of them in south Wales.

**Jenny Randerson:** Gofynnwyd cwestiynau ynghylch effeithiolrwydd strwythur ambiwlans Cymru gyfan. Fel rhan o hyn, a wnewch chi neu'r ymchwiliad edrych ar amrywioldeb llwyth gwaith criwiau mewn gwahanol rannau o Gymru? Yr wyf wedi gwneud rhywfaint o ymchwil a bu imi ddarganfod, yn y de-ddwyrain, sy'n cynnwys Caerdydd a'r Cymoedd—yn hytrach na'n diffiniad ni o'r de-ddwyrain—fod criwiau yn gwneud mwy na 55 o deithiau ar fyrder a theithiau brys y mis fesul aelod llawn-amser o staff, ond yn y gogledd 40 o deithiau o'r fath a wnânt. Nid wyf yn dadlau o blaid llai o griwiau ambiwlans yn y gogledd—yr wyf yn dadlau o blaid mwy ohonynt yn y de.

**Brian Gibbons:** From my conversations with Alan Murray, the new chief executive of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, I know that he recognises the particular points that you make. He has made a clear commitment to developing and delivering ambulance services in the future on a regional basis. One of his top priorities in modernising the ambulance service will be to put in a much stronger regionally based management and delivery structure, which is implicit in your question.

**Jenny Randerson:** We have heard some words from you over the summer which imply that you might have changed your mind about the need for additional investment in the ambulance service. The crisis blew up because of the resignation of the chief executive, who said that £35 million was needed and that you were asking for a cut. Have you quantified how much additional investment is needed, and how much you have available to put in?

**Brian Gibbons:** We have indicated to the ambulance service that we are receptive to the business plans that it has put forward in relation to its capital requirements. I had an informal meeting with Alan Murray about 10 days ago, at which he told me that the trust is still in the process of working-up its business case for its capital bid. The ambulance service is not yet in a position to make a definitive application to the Assembly for the necessary capital investment. My understanding is that the capital investment, where there are clear priorities in terms of the requirements of the ambulance service, will be staged over as longer period. I said nothing over the summer to indicate that I had changed my recognition that the ambulance service needs significant capital investment to modernise the service that it currently provides.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Reference has been made by the Minister to Alan Murray, who is the third chief executive in almost as many months. He talks about turning around the service, but as has just been referred to, Roger Thayne, one of the previous chief executives, talked

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn dilyn fy sgysiau gydag Alan Murray, prif weithredwr newydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaeth Ambiwlans Cymru, gwn ei fod yn cydnabod y pwyntiau penodol a wneir gennych. Mae wedi gwneud ymrwymiad clir i ddatblygu a darparu gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn y dyfodol ar sail ranbarthol. Un o'i brif flaenoriaethau wrth foderneiddio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans fydd sefydlu strwythur rheoli a darparu rhanbarthol llawer cryfach, sy'n amlwg yn eich cwestiwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr ydym wedi clywed rhywfaint gennych yn ystod yr haf sy'n awgrymu eich bod efallai wedi newid eich meddwl ynghylch yr angen i fuddsoddi mwy o arian yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Bu i'r argyfwng ddigwydd yn sgîl ymddiswyddiad y prif weithredwr, a ddywedodd fod angen £35 miliwn a'ch bod yn gofyn am gwtogiad. A ydych wedi cyfrifo faint o arian ychwanegol sydd ei angen, a faint sydd gennych i'w roi?

**Brian Gibbons:** Rydym wedi dangos i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ein bod yn barod i dderbyn y cynlluniau busnes y mae wedi'u cyflwyno mewn perthynas â'i ofynion cyfalaf. Bu imi gael cyfarfod anffurfiol gydag Alan Murray tua deg diwrnod yn ôl, lle y dywedodd fod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn dal i weithio ar ei hachos busnes ar gyfer ei chynnig cyfalaf. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno cais terfynol i'r Cynulliad eto ar gyfer y buddsoddiad cyfalaf angenrheidiol. O'r hyn a ddeallaf bydd y buddsoddiad cyfalaf, lle ceir blaenoriaethau clir o ran gofynion y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, yn cwmpasu cyfnod hwy. Ni ddywedais unrhyw beth dros yr haf a ddangosodd fy mod wedi newid fy meddwl o ran yr angen sydd gan y gwasanaeth ambiwlans am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf sylweddol i foderneiddio'r gwasanaeth a ddarperir ar hyn o bryd.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at Alan Murray, sef y trydydd prif weithredwr mewn cymaint o fisoedd bron â bod. Sonia am drawsnewid y gwasanaeth, ond fel y cyfeiriwyd ato eisoes, bu i Roger Thayne, un o'r cyn-brif weithredwyr, sôn am argyfwng

of crisis and of the need for massive investment. How can the service be turned around without the massive investment that was identified by Roger Thayne as necessary? Have you given up on the idea of cutting back on expenditure in this regard, and are you now receptive to additional money going in? What sort of sum are you looking for and how will you monitor this turnaround, which we are told will happen before Christmas? For the viability of a system that has had three chief executives in as many months, it is important for the morale of everyone working in the system, as well as for patients throughout Wales, that you get this right.

**Brian Gibbons:** For the sake of accuracy, two of those chief executives were interim chief executives—they were never expected to be long-term appointments. However, the current permanent appointee, Alan Murray, has largely taken the view in his conversations with me that the staffing profile that is available to the NHS in Wales is fairly satisfactory in terms of the personnel and that the numbers are largely in balance. However, the tools needed by those staff to do the job must be modernised and changed. The service is actively working on the capital bid that will go to the Assembly's capital investment board. As I said to Jenny, the ambulance board has not, as yet, finalised the specifics of its capital bid to the Assembly. When it makes its bid, we will, as part of due process, want to scrutinise that bid rather than issue a blank cheque. However, I have conveyed a clear message to the ambulance service that we recognise the need for substantial capital investment. We are committed to working with the ambulance service to give it the tools to deliver the type of service that I think Members want to see.

2.50 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid wyf yn credu y gallwch esbonio'r ffaith bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi cael tri phrif weithredwr mewn tri mis drwy ddweud nad oedd pob un ohonynt yn brif weithredwr amser llawn. Mae ychydig wythnosau yn y swydd braidd

a'r angen am fuddsoddiad enfawr. Sut y gellir trawsnewid y gwasanaeth heb y buddsoddiad enfawr y dywedodd Roger Thayne ei fod yn angenrheidiol? A ydych wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r syniad o gwtogi gwariant yn hyn o beth, ac a ydych bellach yn barod i dderbyn bod angen buddsoddi arian ychwanegol? Pa fath o swm yr ydych yn edrych amdano a sut y gwnewch fonitro'r trawsnewid hwn, a fydd yn digwydd cyn y Nadolig yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedir wrthym? Er dichonoldeb system sydd wedi gweld tri phrif weithredwr mewn cymaint o fisoedd, mae'n bwysig eich bod yn cael hwn yn iawn, er lles morâl pawb sy'n gweithio yn y system, yn ogystal â chleifion ledled Cymru.

**Brian Gibbons:** Er cywirdeb, roedd dau o'r prif weithredwyr hynny yn brif weithredwyr dros dro—ni ddisgwyliwyd iddynt fod yn apwyntiadau hirdymor erioed. Fodd bynnag, mae'r prif weithredwr parhaol presennol, Alan Murray, yn ei sgysiau gyda mi, wedi lleisio'r farn gyffredinol bod y proffil staffio sydd ar gael i'r GIG yng Nghymru yn weddol foddhaol o ran personél a bod y niferoedd yn gytbwys ar y cyfan. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i'r hyn sydd ei angen ar y staff hynny i wneud y gwaith gael ei foderneiddio a'i newid. Mae'r gwasanaeth wrthi'n gweithio ar y cynnig cyfalaf a fydd yn cael ei gyflwyno i fwrdd buddsoddi cyfalaf y Cynulliad. Fel y dywedais wrth Jenny, nid yw'r bwrdd ambiwlans, hyd yma, wedi llunio fersiwn terfynol ei gynnig cyfalaf i'r Cynulliad. Pan fydd yn cyflwyno ei gynnig, byddwn, fel rhan o'r broses ddyladwy, am graffu ar y cynnig hwnnw yn hytrach na rhoi siec wag iddo. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi rhoi neges glir i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ein bod yn cydnabod yr angen am fuddsoddiad cyfalaf sylweddol. Yr ydym yn ymrwymedig i weithio gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans er mwyn ei alluogi i ddarparu'r math o wasanaeth y mae Aelodau am ei weld, yn fy marn i.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not think that you can explain the fact that the ambulance service has had three chief executives in three months by saying that not all of them were full-time chief executives. A few weeks in post is quite a short time even for temporary



yn fyr ar gyfer swyddogion dros dro hyd yn oed. officials.

Wrth reswm, yr ydym yn croesawu Alan Murray, ac yn edmygu ei frwdfrydedd i fynd ati i foderneiddio a diwygio'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ond fe gofiwch, Weinidog, fod y Cynulliad—yr oedd gennych rôl allweddol yn hyn—wedi penderfynu cael ymchwiliad i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y mae Jeremy Colman yn gweithio arno ar hyn o bryd. A wnewch sicrhau bod y prif weithredwr yn bwrw golwg manwl dros gasgliadau ymchwiliad Jeremy Colman cyn gwneud penderfyniadau terfynol? Ni ddylai hyn achosi oedi yn y broses, ond mae'n bwysig bod yr adolygiad hwnnw o'r gwasanaeth yn chwarae rhan lawn mewn unrhyw gynllun moderneiddio, er mwyn sicrhau bod pob gwers o'r gorffennol wedi ei dysgu.

**Brian Gibbons:** From my discussion with Alan Murray, I know that he is aware that the review is under way, and he is keeping a close eye on what transpires from that inquiry as a means of informing the modernisation programme that he and the service want to undertake. However, such are the requirements of the situation, I do not think that we can urge Alan Murray to wait and do nothing until the inquiry reports. A draft modernisation plan has already been submitted to the ambulance trust board, and it has been approved. Alan Murray is going around the ambulance service, along with his colleagues. Their target—on the basis of their discussions with the ambulance service and, obviously, with us in the Assembly Government—is hopefully to be in a position to submit a final modernisation plan by early December. Clearly, as you say, if the Wales Audit Office inquiry is completed on time, and if it throws up information that is pertinent to the modernisation plan, that will have to be taken on board. I know from discussions with Alan Murray that he is open minded about input from all stakeholders in ensuring that we get it right.

We welcome Alan Murray, of course, and admire his enthusiasm for modernising and reforming the ambulance service, but you will recall, Minister, that the Assembly—you had a key role in this—has decided to hold an inquiry into the ambulance service, which Jeremy Colman is working on at the moment. Will you ensure that the chief executive looks in detail at the conclusions of Jeremy Colman's inquiry before making his final decisions? That should not delay the process, but it is important that that service review plays a full part in any modernisation plan in order to ensure that all the lessons of the past are learned.

**Brian Gibbons:** O'm trafodaeth gydag Alan Murray, gwn ei fod yn ymwybodol bod yr adolygiad yn mynd rhagddo, ac mae'n cadw llygad barcud ar yr hyn sy'n deillio o'r ymchwiliad hwnnw fel modd o lywio'r rhaglen foderneiddio y mae ef a'r gwasanaeth am ei chynnal. Fodd bynnag, o ganlyniad i ofynion y sefyllfa, ni chredaf y gallwn annog Alan Murray i aros a gwneud dim nes i'r ymchwiliad gyflwyno ei adroddiad. Mae cynllun moderneiddio drafft eisoes wedi cael ei gyflwyno i fwrdd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, ac fe'i cymeradwywyd. Mae Alan Murray yn mynd o amgylch y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ynghyd â'i gydweithwyr. Eu targed—ar sail eu trafodaethau gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ac, yn amlwg, gyda ni yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—yw gobeithio bod mewn sefyllfa i gyflwyno cynllun moderneiddio terfynol erbyn dechrau mis Rhagfyr. Yn amlwg, fel y dywedwch, os cwblheir ymchwiliad Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru ar amser, ac os rhydd wybodaeth sy'n berthnasol i'r cynllun moderneiddio, bydd yn rhaid ei ystyried. Gwn o'm trafodaethau gydag Alan Murray fod ganddo feddwl agored o ran y mewnbnw a roddir gan bob rhanddeiliad i sicrhau ein bod yn llwyddo.

### **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport**

## **Hyrwyddo Diwylliant Cymru Dramor Promoting Welsh Culture Abroad**

**Q1 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government policies for promoting Welsh culture abroad? OAQ0890(CWS)

**C1 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru dramor? OAQ0890(CWS)

**The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh):** The Welsh Assembly Government takes every opportunity to promote Welsh culture abroad. To name but three examples, we support the Artes Mundi prize, the Llangollen International Music Eisteddfod, and the Venice Biennale.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh):** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn achub ar bob cyfle i hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru dramor. I enwi ond tair enghraifft, cefnogwn wobwr Artes Mundi, Eisteddfod Gerddorol Gydwladol Llangollen, a Biennale Fenis.

**Nick Bourne:** Those are all worthwhile projects.

**Nick Bourne:** Maent oll yn brosiectau gwerth chweil.

Minister, the tragedy on 9/11 was a dreadful event, from which we still reel—it still ripples throughout the world. A commemorative concert was held in London this year, at which our own Ryland Teifi sang; it was immensely worthwhile. There is a British monument in New York, but has there been any Welsh input into that important monument? Have any discussions been held, perhaps with the Welsh community in New York and more widely in the United States, about how we can contribute to that?

Weinidog, yr oedd trasiedi 9/11 yn erchyll ac mae'n dal i effeithio arnom ledled y byd. Cynhaliwyd cyngerdd coffa yn Llundain eleni, lle y bu i Ryland Teifi ganu; roedd yn ddigwyddiad hynod o werth chweil. Mae cofeb Brydeinig i'w gweld yn Efrog Newydd, ond a fu unrhyw gyfraniad gan Gymru at y gofeb bwysig honno? A gynhaliwyd unrhyw drafodaethau, efallai gyda'r gymuned Gymreig yn Efrog Newydd ac yn yr Unol Daleithiau yn ehangach, ynghylch sut y gallwn gyfrannu ati?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to say that that event was, indeed, dreadful. I am not aware of any specifically Welsh input in terms of what is, as you say, a largely British memorial, but I will investigate and write to you.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan ddisgrifiwch y digwyddiad fel un erchyll. Ni wn am unrhyw fewnbwn gan Gymru yn benodol o ran yr hyn sydd, fel y dywedwch, yn gofeb Brydeinig i bob pwrpas, ond ymchwiliat i hynny ac ysgrifennaf atoch.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r celfyddydau perfformio, wrth reswm, yn elfen gref o hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru yn rhyngwladol. Fe wyddoch am Gymdeithas Cymru ar gyfer y Celfyddydau Perfformio, sy'n cynrychioli perfformwyr Cymru. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal â'r gymdeithas, a pha strwythurau sydd ar waith i sicrhau bod y corff hwnnw yn gallu dylanwadu ar eich polisiau perfformio chi? Pa ystyriaeth yr ydych wedi ei rhoi i'r cynllun sydd ar flaen yr agenda ar hyn o bryd, sef y syniad o theatr genedlaethol ffederal cyfrwng Saesneg i gyfateb â'r theatr genedlaethol Gymraeg?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The performing arts, naturally, feature strongly in promoting Welsh culture internationally. You will know of the Wales Association for the Performing Arts, which represents Welsh practitioners. What discussions have you had with the society, and what structures are in place to ensure that that body can influence your performing arts policies? What consideration have you given to the scheme that is at the top of the agenda at the moment, which is the idea of having a national English-language federal theatre to correspond with the national Welsh-language theatre?

**Alun Pugh:** We will be holding discussions with several organisations about their international tourism remits. We support several small-scale international tours but, inevitably, due to budget restrictions, we cannot support every application that the Arts Council of Wales receives. We tend to support tours where a specific cultural memorandum has already been established, such as, for example, activities in Latvia or in Silesia in Poland.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** That was not the question that I asked.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You received your answer. [*Laughter.*]

**Michael German:** You know that the performing arts can be a strong advocate for Wales, particularly when used in conjunction with companies that are seeking to export their wares overseas. What discussions have you had with the British Council, particularly the British Council Wales, on using major companies in Wales to support our overseas investment measures and on supporting companies seeking to invest overseas?

**Alun Pugh:** It is important that we support arts and the cultural agenda for their own sake. They are intrinsically important activities in their own right. However, you are right to say that they can also support other, wider Assembly Government objectives, including that crucial objective of promoting trade. Therefore we have meetings with organisations such as the British Council. I had a meeting with Neil Kinnock a few months ago. We discussed a range of cultural support activities along with the British Council's newer initiatives on international sport.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn cynnal trafodaethau gyda sawl sefydliad ynghylch eu cylchoedd gwaith twristiaeth ryngwladol. Cefnogwn sawl taith ryngwladol fach ond, yn anochel, oherwydd cyfyngiadau cyllidebol, ni allwn gefnogi pob cais a gaiff Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Tueddwn i gefnogi teithiau lle y sefydlwyd memorandwm diwylliannol penodol eisoes, er enghraifft, gweithgareddau yn Latfia neu yn Silesia yng Ngwlad Pwyl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid dyna'r cwestiwn a ofynnais.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cawsoch eich ateb. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Michael German:** Fe wyddoch y gall y celfyddydau perfformio hyrwyddo Cymru yn sylweddol, yn enwedig pan y'u defnyddir ar y cyd â chwmnïau sy'n ceisio allforio eu cynhyrchion dramor. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cael gyda'r Cyngor Prydeinig, yn enwedig Cyngor Prydeinig Cymru, ar ddefnyddio cwmnïau mawr yng Nghymru i gefnogi ein mesurau buddsoddi dramor ac ar gefnogi cwmnïau sy'n awyddus i fuddsoddi dramor?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cefnogi'r celfyddydau a'r agenda ddiwylliannol er eu budd eu hunain. Maent yn weithgareddau hollbwysig ynddynt eu hunain. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud y gallant hefyd gefnogi amcanion ehangach eraill Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys yr amcan hanfodol hwnnw i hybu masnach. Felly cynhaliwn gyfarfodydd gyda sefydliadau megis y Cyngor Prydeinig. Bu imi gynnal cyfarfod gyda Neil Kinnock ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Trafodwyd amrywiaeth o weithgareddau i gefnogi diwylliant gennym ynghyd â mentrau mwy newydd y Cyngor Prydeinig o ran chwaraeon rhyngwladol.

### **Her Iechyd Cymru Health Challenge Wales**

**Q2 Christine Chapman:** What discussions has the Minister had with the Minister for Health and Social Services on the role that sport and physical activity have to play in the

**C2 Christine Chapman:** Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ynghylch rôl chwaraeon a

Health Challenge Wales agenda?  
 OAQ0941(CWS)

gweithgarwch corfforol ar agenda Her Iechyd  
 Cymru? OAQ0941(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I have regular discussions with my colleague, Brian Gibbons, on this important matter. We both know that it is important to improve public health on a number of fronts, such as that of smoking—and the First Minister made a welcome announcement yesterday on that matter—and that there is a crucial interplay between diet and exercise, which has an enormous part to play in improving public health. As you say, it all comes under the heading of Health Challenge Wales.

**Alun Pugh:** Cynhaliaf drafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'm cyd-Aelod, Brian Gibbons, ar y mater pwysig hwn. Gŵyr y ddau ohonom ei bod yn bwysig gwella iechyd y cyhoedd mewn sawl ffordd, megis ysmygu—a bu i'r Prif Weinidog wneud cyhoeddiad a groesawyd gennym ar y mater hwnnw ddoe—a bod cydberthynas hanfodol rhwng deiet ac ymarfer corff, sydd â rhan enfawr i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o wella iechyd y cyhoedd. Fel y dywedwch, mae hyn oll yn dod o dan bennawd Her Iechyd Cymru.

**Christine Chapman:** Sport and physical activity is one of the most important means of establishing a healthier Wales. I was interested to read that the target in 'Climbing Higher' of five sessions of 30 minutes of sport or physical activity per week for adults and five sessions of 60 minutes for children are key features of the fitness aspect of Health Challenge Wales. I know that 'Climbing Higher' states that achieving the target for adults in the next 20 years will require an annual increase in overall adult physical activity levels of at least 1 percentage point per annum. How is this information recorded? What are the practical arrangements for monitoring progress against this target?

**Christine Chapman:** Mae chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol yn un o'r ffyrdd pwysicaf o sicrhau Cymru iachach. Yr oedd diddordeb gennyf ddarllen fod y targed yn 'Dringo'n Uwch' o bum sesiwn chwaraeon neu weithgarwch corfforol 30 munud yr wythnos i oedolion a phum sesiwn 60 munud i blant yn nodweddion allweddol o'r agwedd ffirwydd ar Her Iechyd Cymru. Gwn fod 'Dringo'n Uwch' yn datgan y bydd cyflawni'r targed i oedolion yn ystod yr 20 mlynedd nesaf yn gofyn am gynnydd blynyddol o ran lefelau gweithgarwch corfforol oedolion yn gyffredinol o 1 pwynt canran y flwyddyn o leiaf. Beth yw'r trefniadau ymarferol ar gyfer monitro hynt y broses o gyflawni'r targed hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** Colleagues, including colleagues in the Sports Council for Wales, are responsible for doing regular surveys on the extent of participation in sport and physical exercise. You are right to say that the long-term average that we are trying to achieve is a gain of about 1 per cent a year and, so far—although it is early days yet—in the first few years of the life of the 'Climbing Higher' strategy, we are on target to meet that rise.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae cyd-Aelodau, ynghyd â chydweithwyr yng Nghyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, yn gyfrifol am gynnal arolygon rheolaidd o i ba raddau y cymerir rhan mewn chwaraeon a gweithgareddau ymarfer corff. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud ein bod yn ceisio cyflawni cyfartaledd hirdymor o tua 1 y cant y flwyddyn a, hyd yma—er mai megis dechrau yr ydym—yn ystod blynyddoedd cyntaf strategaeth 'Dringo'n Uwch', yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r cynnydd hwnnw.

**Laura Anne Jones:** With childhood obesity being such a problem in Wales, as the Minister for Health and Social Services rightly acknowledged earlier, I am sure that you will share my concern that Blaenau Gwent was the lowest-scoring region in terms of regularly active primary school children. Those children are at a key age in

**Laura Anne Jones:** Gyda gordewdra ymhlith plant yn gymaint o broblem yng Nghymru, fel y bu i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gydnabod yn gywir yn gynharach, yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn rhannu fy mhryder ynghylch y ffaith mai Blaenau Gwent oedd y rhanbarth â'r sgôr isaf o ran plant ysgol gynradd sy'n

terms of tackling childhood obesity. In your discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services and the Cabinet, is it understood that in order to achieve the targets set out in Health Challenge Wales, preventative policies, such as promoting sport and physical activity at this key age, are essential? How are you looking to bid for more money for your portfolio? What you achieve in your portfolio has a huge impact on our health targets.

**Alun Pugh:** You will know that we plan a major increase in investment in sport and physical activity and the detail of that will be forthcoming in the Finance Minister's budget statement, which we will have in the course of the next few weeks. You are right to say that there are worrying trends in terms of childhood obesity. The overall averages gives us little food for comfort, if I can put it like that, but we know that the figures tend to be worse in the more disadvantaged communities. So, on average, you will see that diet is worse in areas of social disadvantage as are levels of physical activity. That is why Assembly Government programmes, such as that of free swimming which does not discriminate according to levels of income, are so important, and that is why I am trying to move more of the sports match funding into areas of socio-economic deprivation.

3.00 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** Minister, you referred to free swimming. In the First Minister's annual report, one of the few pieces of information that we have is that £10 million has been spent on free swimming for children, young people and the over-60s. However, free swimming for children and young people was introduced by the previous partnership Government. Why have you not provided a figure for the money spent on swimming for older people? Perhaps you can enlighten us now by telling us exactly how much was spent in 2005-06 on free swimming for the over-60s and how much will be spent in the current year?

cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau egnïol yn rheolaidd. Mae'r plant hynny o oedran allweddol o ran trechu gordewdra ymhlith plant. Yn ystod eich trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Cabinet, a ddeallir er mwyn cyflawni'r targedau a nodir yn Her Iechyd Cymru, bod hybu chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol yn ystod yr oedran allweddol hwn, yn hanfodol? Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu gwneud cais am ragor o arian ar gyfer eich portffolio? Mae'r hyn a gyflawnir gennych yn eich portffolio yn cael effaith enfawr ar ein targedau iechyd.

**Alun Pugh:** Fe wyddoch ein bod yn bwriadu cynyddu'r buddsoddiad mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol yn sylweddol a bydd manylion hynny yn cael eu cyflwyno yn natganiad cyllidebol y Gweinidog dros Gyllid, a gawn yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle i ddweud bod tueddiadau pryderus o ran gordewdra ymhlith plant. Nid yw'r cyfartaleddau cyffredinol yn fawr o gysur, ond fe wyddom fod y ffigurau yn tueddu i fod yn waeth mewn cymunedau mwy difreintiedig. Felly, ar gyfartaledd, fe welwch fod deiet yn waeth mewn ardaloedd lle ceir anfantais gymdeithasol fel y mae lefelau o weithgarwch corfforol. Dyna pam y mae rhaglenni Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, megis nofio am ddim nad yw'n gwahaniaethu yn ôl lefelau incwm, mor bwysig, a dyna pam yr wyf yn ceisio symud mwy o gyllideb sportsmatch i ardaloedd o amddifadedd economaidd-gymdeithasol.

**Jenny Randerson:** Weinidog, cyfeiriasoch at nofio am ddim. Yn adroddiad blynyddol y Prif Weinidog, un o'r ychydig ddarnau o wybodaeth sydd gennym yw y gwariwyd £10 miliwn ar nofio am ddim i blant, pobl ifanc a'r rhai dros 60 oed. Fodd bynnag, cyflwynwyd nofio am ddim i blant a phobl ifanc gan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth flaenorol. Pam nad ydych wedi rhoi ffigur ar gyfer yr arian a wariwyd ar nofio i bobl hŷn? Efallai y gallwch ein goleuo yn awr drwy ddweud wrthym faint yn union a wariwyd ar nofio am ddim i'r rhai dros 60 oed yn 2005-06 a faint a gaiff ei wario yn y flwyddyn gyfredol?

**Alun Pugh:** Free swimming has led to a substantial increase in the number of swims, not only for young people, but for older people, and, surprisingly, the number of older people taking up swimming for the first time. I will write to you with regard to the detail of the financial allocations by local authority area for older people, but you are looking at a global investment in swimming of around £25 million for the full term of the Government.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae nofio am ddim wedi arwain at gynnydd sylweddol yn nifer y nofiadau, nid yn unig i bobl ifanc, ond i bobl hŷn, ac, yn syndod, cynnydd yn nifer y bobl hŷn sy'n dechrau nofio am y tro cyntaf. Ysgrifennaf atoch o ran manylion y dyraniadau ariannol fesul ardal awdurdod lleol i bobl hŷn, ond yr ydych yn edrych ar fuddsoddiad cyffredinol mewn nofio sydd oddeutu £25 miliwn ar gyfer tymor cyfan y Llywodraeth.

### **Datblygu'r Celfyddydau Developing the Arts**

**Q3 John Griffiths:** Will the Minister make a statement on progress in developing the arts in Wales? OAQ0884(CWS)

**C3 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd a wnaed o ran datblygu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru? OAQ0884(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Welsh Labour's investment in the arts generally and in performance has led to additional performances and arts activity on the stages of our arts centres. As well as those additional performances and increased activity, there has been a major investment in the estate of the arts, which has been seen in new facilities everywhere from Galeri in the north to the Riverfront theatre closer to your own constituency.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae buddsoddiad Llafur Cymru yn y celfyddydau yn gyffredinol ac mewn perfformiad wedi arwain at berfformiadau ychwanegol a gweithgarwch celfyddydol ar lwyfannau ein canolfannau celfyddydol. Yn ogystal â'r perfformiadau ychwanegol hynny a chynnydd mewn gweithgarwch, cafwyd buddsoddiad sylweddol yn ystad y celfyddydau, a gwelwyd hyn mewn cyfleusterau newydd o'r Galeri yn y gogledd i theatr Glan yr Afon sy'n agosach at eich etholaeth eich hun.

**John Griffiths:** The Riverfront arts centre and the street sculptures in Newport are a great step forward in the area in terms of profiling the arts and increasing interest. Can you say something about one of the greatest challenges facing us in developing the arts in Wales, to which we have referred many times, namely reaching those communities that traditionally have not accessed or engaged with the arts? Do you agree that we need to concentrate yet more resources on reaching those communities and, perhaps more importantly, develop new and imaginative ways of engaging people in those communities if they are to benefit from arts expenditure in Wales?

**John Griffiths:** Mae canolfan gelfyddydol Glan yr Afon a'r cerfluniau stryd yng Nghasnewydd yn gam mawr ymlaen yn yr ardal o ran proffilio'r celfyddydau a chynnyddu diddordeb. A allwch ddweud rhywbeth am un o'r heriau mwyaf sy'n ein hwynebu wrth ddatblygu'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi cyfeirio ati sawl gwaith, sef cyrraedd y cymunedau hynny nad ydynt, yn draddodiadol, wedi manteisio ar y celfyddydau nac ymwneud â hwy? A gytunwch fod yn rhaid inni ganolbwyntio mwy o adnoddau ar gyrraedd y cymunedau hynny ac, yn bwysicach o bosibl, ddatblygu ffyrdd newydd a chreadigol o gael pobl yn y cymunedau hynny i gymryd rhan er mwyn iddynt gael budd o'r gwariant ar y celfyddydau yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** That is a fair point and you can be assured that this will be a strong feature of

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg a rhoddaf sicrwydd ichi y bydd hon yn

my next remit letter to the arts council.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yn anaml iawn mae cenedl fach yn magu arlunydd o statws rhyngwladol fel Kyffin Williams. A gytunwch y byddai datblygu Oriel Môn i fod yn gartref i'w waith yn gyfle gwych i ddenu ymwelwyr o bell ac agos i Gymru a rhoi hwb sylweddol i'r economi ar ddwy ochr afon Menai?

**Alun Pugh:** Kyffin Williams was one of Wales's greatest artists. I have met with Ynys Môn County Council on a number of occasions and we have signalled our support, not just in principle, but in terms of finance, for its project.

**Owen John Thomas:** Pa gynlluniau, felly, sydd gan y Gweinidog i roi cymorth i ddatblygu Oriel Môn fel y gellir cynnal arddangosfa barhaol yno o waith Kyffin Williams?

**Alun Pugh:** As I have already said, we have given our support in principle as well as a financial offer to Ynys Môn council, and I hope that it will be able to take this project forward.

**Lisa Francis:** In terms of funding the arts in Wales, do you agree that the role of the Arts Council of Wales should be to keep working at its reputation as an effective deliverer of funds while improving its effectiveness as a developer and advocate of the arts? Do you think that it is better to keep those two functions together so that client management and quality monitoring can be undertaken on behalf of your Government by the Arts Council of Wales to ensure a level playing field and to avoid duplication in the future?

**Alun Pugh:** I think that it is important that the overall strategy and direction of cultural policy belongs here in this Chamber, with this Government and this democratically elected Assembly. However, you are quite right to say that there is an enormous stock of expertise among the staff and members of the Arts Council of Wales. I value that and look forward to drawing on that expertise for some time to come.

nodwedd gref ar fy llythyr cylch gwaith nesaf i gyngor y celfyddydau.

**Owen John Thomas:** It is rare for a small nation to nurture a world-renowned artist such as Kyffin Williams. Do you agree that developing Oriel Môn to house his art would be an excellent opportunity to entice visitors from both near and far to Wales and to give a substantial boost to the economy on both sides of the Menai?

**Alun Pugh:** Kyffin Williams oedd un o artistiaid gorau Cymru. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â Chyngor Sir Ynys Môn ar sawl achlysur ac yr ydym wedi rhoi ein cefnogaeth, nid dim ond mewn egwyddor, ond o ran cyllid, ar gyfer ei brosiect.

**Owen John Thomas:** What plans, therefore, does the Minister have to give assistance to develop Oriel Môn so that a permanent exhibition of Kyffin Williams's work can be housed there?

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y dywedais eisoes, yr ydym wedi rhoi ein cefnogaeth mewn egwyddor yn ogystal â chynnig ariannol i gyngor Ynys Môn, a gobeithiaf y gall ddatblygu'r prosiect hwn.

**Lisa Francis:** O ran cyllido'r celfyddydau yng Nghymru, a gytunwch mai rôl Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ddylai fod i barhau i weithio ar ei enw da fel darparwr cyllid effeithiol tra'n gwella ei effeithiolrwydd fel datblygwr a hyrwyddwr y celfyddydau? A gredwch ei bod yn well cadw'r ddwy swyddogaeth honno gyda'i gilydd er mwyn i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gynnal gwaith rheoli cleientiaid a monitro ansawdd ar ran eich Llywodraeth er mwyn sicrhau triniaeth gyfartal ac osgoi dyblygu gwaith yn y dyfodol?

**Alun Pugh:** Credaf ei bod yn bwysig bod strategaeth a chyfeiriad cyffredinol polisi diwylliannol yn perthyn yma yn y Siambr hon, gyda'r Llywodraeth hon a'r Cynulliad hwn a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod llawer iawn o arbenigedd ymhlith staff ac aelodau Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Gwerthfawrogaf hynny ac edrychaf ymlaen at fanteisio ar yr arbenigedd hwnnw am beth

amser i ddod.

### **Y Gyllideb ar gyfer Diwylliant The Culture Budget**

**Q4 Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister update us on his policies for the culture budget? OAQ0889(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** My key policies are to increase the level of participation in physical activity, to promote cultural access and excellence for all and to continue our policy and progress on creating a more bilingual society.

**Nick Bourne:** In considering the culture budget, would you pay special attention to the international Punch and Judy festival held at Aberystwyth every year, with great success and on a politically correct basis with contributions from all around the world? It attracts many visitors to what is the gem of Ceredigion and it sorely needs funds from the Assembly Government.

**Alun Pugh:** Decisions regarding small-scale arts projects are probably made at arm's length by the Arts Council of Wales. The Minister does not decide on these matters. That is not the way to do it—[*Laughter.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The Bedwas Working Men's Hall in the Caerphilly basin is an excellent centre for the performing arts. However, unfortunately, although it serves the residents of Bedwas, Trethomas and Machen very well, it is around two miles from Caerphilly town, which, together with the Aber valley, has no centre for the performing arts despite being the fastest growing town in Wales. Will you ask the Arts Council of Wales to consider talking to the various groups involved in the performing arts in Caerphilly to see whether there are ways and means of developing a permanent centre for the performing arts in the town of Caerphilly?

**Alun Pugh:** I am happy to do that. You are right to say that, often, a cultural centre absolutely forms the heart of a town centre.

**C4 Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni am ei bolisiau ar gyfer y gyllideb diwylliant? OAQ0889(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Fy mholisiau allweddol yw cynyddu lefel y cyfranogiad mewn gweithgarwch corfforol, hyrwyddo mynediad diwylliannol a rhagoriaeth i bawb a pharhau â'n polisi a'n cynnydd i greu cymdeithas sy'n fwy dwyieithog.

**Nick Bourne:** Wrth ystyried y gyllideb diwylliant, a fydddech yn rhoi sylw arbennig i wyl ryngwladol Punch a Judy a gynhelir yn Aberystwyth bob blwyddyn, gyda llwyddiant mawr ac ar sail wleidyddol gywir gyda chyfraniadau o bob cwr o'r byd? Mae'n denu llawer o ymwelwyr i un o leoedd harddaf Ceredigion ac mae angen dirfawr arni am arian gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n debyg mai Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru fydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau o ran prosiectau'r celfyddydau ar raddfa fach, ar hyd braich. Nid yw'r Gweinidog yn penderfynu ar y materion hyn. Nid dyna'r ffordd o weithredu—[*Chwerthin.*]

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae Neuadd y Gweithwyr ym Medwas ym masn Caerffili yn ganolfan rhagorol ar gyfer y celfyddydau perfformio. Fodd bynnag, yn anffodus, er ei bod yn gwasanaethu trigolion Bedwas, Tretomas a Machen yn dda iawn, mae tua dwy filltir o dref Caerffili, ac, ynghyd â chwm Aber, nid oes ganddi ganolfan ar gyfer y celfyddydau perfformio er mai hon yw'r dref sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yng Nghymru. A ofynnwch i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru ystyried siarad â'r grwpiau amrywiol sy'n rhan o'r celfyddydau perfformio yng Nghaerffili i weld a oes ffyrdd a dulliau o ddatblygu canolfan barhaol ar gyfer y celfyddydau perfformio yn nhref Caerffili?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn fodlon gwneud hynny. Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod canolfan ddiwylliannol, yn aml, yn ffurfio



When such centres are located at some distance, that causes formidable access problems for some people, particularly the substantial number of people who do not have access to cars late at night.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Diolchaf i'r Prif Weinidog ac i chithau am ddangos cefnogaeth tuag at sefydlu oriel ar gyfer gwaith Kyffin Williams yn Ynys Môn. Bydd hynny'n calonogi'r ymddiriedolwyr a'r cyngor sir yn fawr. Y mae'r Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod angen swm eithaf sylweddol i droi'r freuddwyd hon yn realiti a bod y cynnig a wnaed ar hyn o bryd gan y Llywodraeth drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru yn debygol o syrthio'n fyr o'r hyn sydd ei angen i sicrhau y bydd y prosiect yn digwydd. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi addewid y bydd yn fodlon gweithio gyda'r tîm yn Ynys Môn i sicrhau bod modd i ni gau'r bwlch ariannol hwnnw, oherwydd yn dilyn marwolaeth Kyffin Williams, mae awydd cryf i sicrhau bod y cynllun hwn yn symud yn ei flaen yn fuan?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly want this scheme to proceed. It seems to be entirely fitting that the home of this excellent permanent collection should be on Ynys Môn. You will understand that, ahead of this year's budget discussions, I am not in a position to go any further than I have to date.

**Kirsty Williams:** In your initial answer, you said that one of your priorities was to ensure that people continued to participate in sporting activities. Therefore, would you consider setting up, in conjunction with the Sports Council for Wales, a logistical disadvantage fund for young people who find it difficult to continue their sports training because of where they live? For example, eight-year-old Ben Bateson in my constituency has shown tremendous promise as a young gymnast, winning the Urdd gymnastics competition most recently. His club in Abertillery has closed and his parents will now have to travel for over an hour so that he can continue his training as a gymnast. That is at considerable cost and strain to the family. The sports council is currently uncertain about the future of sports aid, as funding for Olympic sports is transferred back to the UK. What can you do

calon canol tref. Pan gaiff canolfannau o'r fath eu lleoli cryn bellter i ffwrdd, mae hynny'n peri problemau mynediad sylweddol i rai pobl, yn arbennig y nifer sylweddol o bobl nad oes ganddynt gar yn hwyr yn y nos.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I thank the First Minister and you for lending your support to the proposal to set up a gallery to house the work of Kyffin Williams in Anglesey. That will give the trustees and the county council a much-needed boost. The Minister is aware that a fairly hefty sum is required to turn this dream into a reality, and that the offer currently made by the Government, via the Arts Council of Wales, is likely to fall short of the amount that is needed to safeguard this project. Will the Minister give an assurance that he will be willing to work with the team in Anglesey to ensure that there is a way for us to close this financial gap? Following the death of Kyffin Williams, there is a strong desire to see this scheme get the go-ahead as soon as possible.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf yn sicr am i'r cynllun hwn fynd rhagddo. Ymddengys yn gwbl briodol mai yn Ynys Môn y dylid sefydlu cartref y casgliad parhaol rhagorol hwn. Byddwch yn deall, cyn trafodaethau eleni ar y gyllideb, nad wyf mewn sefyllfa i ddweud mwy nag wyf wedi ei ddweud hyd yma.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn eich ateb cychwynnol, dywedasoch mai un o'ch blaenoriaethau oedd sicrhau bod pobl yn parhau i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau chwaraeon. Felly, a ystyriwch sefydlu, ar y cyd â Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, gronfa anfantais logistaidd i bobl ifanc sy'n ei chael yn anodd parhau â'u hyfforddiant chwaraeon oherwydd ble y maent yn byw? Er enghraifft, mae Ben Bateson, wyth oed, yn fy etholaeth wedi dangos addewid arbennig fel gymnastwr ifanc, gan ennill cystadleuaeth gymnasteg yr Urdd yn ddiweddar. Mae ei glwb yn Abertyleri wedi cau ac yn awr bydd yn rhaid i'w rieni deithio am dros awr er mwyn iddo allu parhau â'i hyfforddiant. Mae hynny ar gost a straen sylweddol i'r teulu. Ar hyn o bryd mae'r cyngor chwaraeon yn ansicr o ran dyfodol sports aid, oherwydd caiff cyllid ar gyfer chwaraeon Olympaidd ei drosglwyddo yn ôl i'r DU. Beth y gallwch ei wneud er

to ensure that our young people who have shown great promise have the opportunity to train in first-class facilities wherever they are in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to indicate that this is a particular issue for those elite athletes who are operating at the top of their sport. It is a problem in rural mid Wales, and I must say that it is also a problem across north Wales, particularly for team sports; there is an issue about getting a Welsh team together across such distance. I assure you that part of the substantially increased budget for the Sports Council for Wales will find its way into activities such as coaching and support for travel, but, regrettably, we cannot support every athlete in every part of Wales in every sport.

mwyn sicrhau bod ein pobl ifanc sydd wedi dangos addewid mawr yn cael y cyfle i hyfforddi mewn cyfleusterau o'r radd flaenaf ble bynnag y maent yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir i nodi bod hwn yn fater penodol i'r athletwyr elit hynny sydd ar frig eu chwaraeon. Mae'n broblem yng nghanolbarth gwledig Cymru, a rhaid imi ddweud hefyd ei bod yn broblem ledled y gogledd, yn arbennig ar gyfer chwaraeon tîm; mae problem o ran cael tîm o Gymru at ei gilydd ar draws pellter o'r fath. Rhoddaf sicrwydd i chi y bydd rhan o'r gyllideb a gynyddwyd yn sylweddol ar gyfer Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn cyrraedd gweithgareddau megis hyfforddi a chymorth ar gyfer teithio, ond, yn anffodus, ni allwn roi cymorth i bob athletwr ym mhob rhan o Gymru ym mhob chwaraeon.

3.10 p.m.

### **Cynlluniau Nofio am Ddim Free Swimming Schemes**

**Q5 Val Lloyd:** Will the Minister provide a progress report on the Welsh Assembly Government's free swimming schemes? OAQ0900(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The full impact of the national free swimming pilot initiative will be presented in a final evaluation report in June 2007. However, at present, both schemes—the young people's scheme and the older persons' scheme—continue to have a major and positive impact on swimming participation levels across Wales.

**Val Lloyd:** I look forward to reading about the results of the pilot scheme. I will concentrate on young people here, because encouraging children to take up exercise from quite a young age is crucial if we are to promote a healthy way of life. The opportunity afforded by the free swimming scheme has obviously been a big step in the right direction. In the light of what I perceive from my constituency to be a success, would you consider widening the free swimming scheme to other forms of activity, so as to increase the number of children taking regular exercise?

**C5 Val Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd am gynlluniau nofio am ddim Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAQ0900(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Cyflwynir effaith lawn y cynllun peilot nofio am ddim cenedlaethol mewn adroddiad gwerthuso terfynol ym mis Mehefin 2007. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, mae'r ddau gynllun—cynllun y bobl ifanc a chynllun y bobl hŷn—yn parhau i gael effaith sylweddol a chadarnhaol ar lefelau cyfranogi mewn nofio ledled Cymru.

**Val Lloyd:** Edrychaf ymlaen at ddarllen am ganlyniadau'r cynllun peilot. Canolbwyntiaf ar bobl ifanc yma, gan fod annog plant i ddechrau ymarfer corff o oedran ifanc yn hollbwysig er mwyn inni hyrwyddo ffordd iach o fyw. Yn amlwg, bu'r cyfle a roddwyd gan y cynllun nofio am ddim yn gam mawr i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Yn fy etholaeth i, ymddengys bod hyn wedi bod yn llwyddiant, ac felly a fyddech yn ystyried ehangu'r cynllun nofio am ddim i weithgareddau eraill, er mwyn cynyddu nifer y plant sy'n gwneud ymarfer corff yn rheolaidd?

**Alun Pugh:** A number of people have pointed out potential extensions of the free swimming scheme. Some people talk about dry sports and others about widening the access categories. I would certainly like to have the final evaluation report in before making final decisions on that. However, I can say that, as a Government, we are prioritising ways of getting the Welsh population, in terms of the old and young, to be more active. At the moment, only a minority in Wales takes enough exercise. We want to support the people of Wales to achieve higher levels.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Minister, while I welcome the fact that people can access sport—I am only a mediocre swimmer—you have not told us about the success of the swimming scheme, because surely the success would be about how many people are able to take it up. Many are not able to because of transport difficulties and because free swimming is available for a limited time during the day when many parents cannot take their children swimming. Can you tell us how many more people have learnt to swim? That would surely be the best benefit of any initiative, because if people cannot swim, I cannot quite see how they can make the best use of the swimming scheme.

**Alun Pugh:** That is not the case. I think that you will find that many of the interim reports are in the public domain and have been discussed in the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee in the past.

A mixture of activities are taking place. There are some informal free-splash activities taking place in public pools, but there are also a great number of formal lessons. Therefore, it is important that during school holidays we have a mixture of activities for children. The Welsh Assembly Government, as Rosemary Butler said, is in favour of fun for children and young people, and it is a shame that the Liberal Democrats are not.

**Janice Gregory:** For some of us, the exaggerated indignation of the Liberal Democrats is mind-boggling. Minister, are you aware that the Liberal Democrat-led administration in Bridgend County Borough

**Alun Pugh:** Mae nifer o bobl wedi cyfeirio at ymestyniadau posibl i'r cynllun nofio am ddim. Mae rhai pobl yn sôn am chwaraeon sych ac eraill am ehangu'r categorïau mynediad. Yn sicr, hoffwn dderbyn yr adroddiad gwerthuso terfynol cyn gwneud penderfyniadau terfynol ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth, gallaf ddweud ein bod yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i ffyrdd o gael pobl Cymru, yr hen a'r ifanc, i wneud mwy o ymarfer corff. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond lleiafrif yng Nghymru sy'n gwneud digon o ymarfer corff. Dymunwn gefnogi pobl Cymru i gyflawni lefelau uwch.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Weinidog, er fy mod yn croesawu'r ffaith y gall pobl gael mynediad i chwaraeon—gweddol wyf fel nofiwr—nid ydych wedi dweud wrthym am lwyddiant y cynllun nofio, oherwydd yn sicr y llwyddiant fyddai faint o bobl sy'n gallu manteisio ar y cynllun. Mae llawer yn methu â gwneud oherwydd anawsterau teithio ac oherwydd bod nofio am ddim ar gael am amser cyfyngedig yn ystod y dydd pan nad yw'n bosibl i lawer o rieni fynd â'u plant i nofio. A allwch ddweud wrthym faint yn rhagor o bobl sydd wedi dysgu nofio? Dyna, yn sicr, fyddai budd gorau unrhyw fenter, oherwydd os nad yw pobl yn gallu nofio, ni allaf weld sut y gallent wneud y defnydd gorau o'r cynllun nofio.

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw hynny'n wir. Credaf y byddwch yn canfod bod llawer o'r adroddiadau interim yn eiddo i'r cyhoedd ac wedi'u trafod yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn y gorffennol.

Ceir cymysgedd o weithgareddau. Mae rhai gweithgareddau nofio anffurfiol am ddim yn digwydd mewn pyllau nofio cyhoeddus, ond ceir hefyd nifer fawr o wersi ffurfiol. Felly, yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael cymysgedd o weithgareddau i blant. Fel y dywedodd Rosemary Butler, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o blaid hwyl i blant a phobl ifanc, ac mae'n drueni nad yw'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o blaid hynny.

**Janice Gregory:** I rai ohonom, mae gorymateb y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn syfrdanol. Weinidog, a ydych yn ymwybodol bod y weinyddiaeth a arweinir gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghyngor

Council—one of only two in Wales—removed the offer of free swimming for older people during school holidays?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that every local authority in Wales is meeting the minimum standards set down in our national free swimming scheme, but there is a different pattern of activities across local authorities. I will write to you with the details of who are the best performers and who are perhaps less good.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I understand that there is still a lack of people equipped with the necessary skills to aid those who are visually impaired to access this scheme. How are you looking to address this, particularly, as Val Lloyd said, if you are to extend this scheme?

**Alun Pugh:** We want to make this scheme as available and as comprehensible as possible. If you are aware of any individual difficulties with particular categories of people—perhaps people with disabilities—I would be happy to look at the detail of that and take the details into the final evaluation report, which we will publish in June 2007.

**Karen Sinclair:** Alun, do you agree that the Liberal Democrats' description of the free swimming initiative as a gimmick, and their desire to see the policy scrapped, is out of tune with what the people of Wales want and that it would have a detrimental effect on the lives of those who have benefited from the scheme?

**Alun Pugh:** It is not a gimmick at all but a much-valued scheme, which I want to see continue for many years to come.

Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr—un o ddau yn unig yng Nghymru—wedi dileu'r cynnig o nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn yn ystod gwyliau'r ysgol?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod pob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yn bodloni'r safonau gofynnol a nodwyd yn ein cynllun nofio am ddim cenedlaethol, ond ceir patrwm gwahanol o weithgareddau ar draws awdurdodau lleol. Ysgrifennaf atoch gyda manylion am ba rai sy'n perfformio orau a pha rai, o bosibl, nad ydynt crystal.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Deallaf fod prinder o hyd o ran pobl sy'n meddu ar y sgiliau angenrheidiol i gynorthwyo'r rhai sydd â nam ar eu golwg i fanteisio ar y cynllun hwn. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â hyn, yn enwedig, fel y dywedodd Val Lloyd, os caiff y cynllun hwn ei ymestyn?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym am sicrhau bod y cynllun ar gael i gymaint o bobl â phosibl, a'i fod mor gynhwysfawr â phosibl. Os gwyddoch am unrhyw anawsterau unigol o ran categorïau arbennig o bobl—pobl ag anableddau efallai—byddwn yn fwy na pharod i edrych ar fanylion hynny a chynnwys y manylion yn yr adroddiad gwerthuso terfynol, a gyhoeddir gennym ym mis Mehefin 2007.

**Karen Sinclair:** Alun, a gytunwch fod disgrifiad y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol o'r fenter nofio am ddim fel gimig, a'u dymuniad i weld y polisi'n cael ei ddileu, yn anghydnaws â'r hyn y mae pobl Cymru yn ei ddymuno ac y byddai'n cael effaith andwyol ar fywydau'r rhai sydd wedi cael budd o'r cynllun?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid gimig ydyw o gwbl ond cynllun a werthfawrogir yn fawr, ac un yr wyf am ei weld yn parhau am flynyddoedd lawer i ddod.

### Hyrwyddo Dwyieithrwydd yn y Sector Cyhoeddus Promoting Bilingualism in the Public Sector

**C6 David Lloyd:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd hyrwyddo dwyieithrwydd yn y sector cyhoeddus? OAQ0924(CWS)

**Q6 David Lloyd:** Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of promoting bilingualism in the public sector? OAQ0924(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan y sector cyhoeddus gyfrifoldeb arbennig i hybu'r Gymraeg. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn yr iaith er mwyn creu cymdeithas ddwyieithog yng Nghymru.

**David Lloyd:** In the Welsh Assembly Government consultation document on the convergence programme, there is a line in the section entitled 'Our Vision' that states that bilingual communities will be supported where it is relevant. Does this not directly contradict WAG's 'Iaith Pawb' strategy, which seeks to develop a wholly bilingual Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** It does not. The Assembly Government is fully committed to a wholly bilingual Wales. However, at present, not every community the length and breadth of this nation is yet bilingual.

**Brynle Williams:** How does the Welsh Assembly Government intend to increase the opportunities for speaking Welsh in the workplace and in daily life in areas of north-east Wales, where the language has traditionally been at its weakest?

**Alun Pugh:** We have been working with our language board and many other partners to spread the message that we want to create this bilingual society. There are many programmes to develop Welsh in the workplace, which cover everything from additional training opportunities to many other initiatives.

**Alun Pugh:** The public sector has a particular responsibility to promote the Welsh language. As a Government, we are investing in the language in order to create a bilingual society in Wales.

**David Lloyd:** Yn nogfen ymgynghori Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar y rhaglen gydyfeirio, mae llinell yn yr adran sy'n dwyn y teitl 'Ein Gweledigaeth' sy'n nodi y caiff cymunedau dwyieithog eu cefnogi lle y bydd yn berthnasol. Onid yw hyn yn gwrthddefwedd strategaeth 'Iaith Pawb' Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sy'n ceisio datblygu Cymru hollol ddwyieithog?

**Alun Pugh:** Nac ydyw. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwbl ymrwymedig i Gymru hollol ddwyieithog. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, nid yw pob cymuned ar hyd a lled y wlad yn ddwyieithog.

**Brynle Williams:** Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu cynyddu'r cyfleoedd ar gyfer siarad Cymraeg yn y gweithle ac mewn bywyd bob dydd yn ardaloedd y gogledd-ddwyrain, lle y bu'r iaith ar ei gwannaf yn draddodiadol?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda'n bwrdd iaith a llawer o bartneriaid eraill i ledaenu'r neges ein bod am greu'r gymdeithas ddwyieithog hon. Mae llawer o raglenni i ddatblygu'r Gymraeg yn y gweithle, sy'n cwmpasu popeth o gyfleoedd hyfforddi ychwanegol i lawer o fentrau eraill.

### Teledu Digidol Digital Television

**Q7 Peter Black:** What discussions has the Minister had on the uptake of digital television in Wales by disadvantaged and vulnerable groups? OAQ0908(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** We are working closely with colleagues in the Department for Culture, Media and Sport and Digital UK on switchover in Wales. Wales has the highest take-up of digital television in the UK, with some 83 per cent of households compared with the UK average of 74 per cent. The good news is that the level of take-up does

**C7 Peter Black:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael am nifer y grwpiau dan anfantais ac agored i niwed sy'n manteisio ar deledu digidol yng Nghymru? OAQ0908(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydym yn gweithio'n agos gyda chyd-Weinidogion yn yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon a chydweithwyr yn Digital UK ar y newid i ddigidol yng Nghymru. Cymru sydd â'r nifer uchaf o gartrefi sy'n derbyn teledu digidol yn y DU, sef tua 83 y cant o gartrefi o gymharu â chyfartaledd y DU sef 74 y cant. Y

not appear to vary a great deal between different socioeconomic groups.

**Peter Black:** Do you share my concern that many of the remaining 17 per cent that has not taken up digital television will not be able to afford to switch to digital television when the analogue system is switched off? What assistance is being made available to those disadvantaged groups to ensure that they will continue to be able to access television once analogue is switched off?

**Alun Pugh:** I am not sure whether price is the major barrier. We all remember that when set-top Freeview boxes first came out, they cost £100; I understand that you can now buy one for under £30. Therefore, I do not think that cost is the major barrier. However, getting the message out about re-tuning televisions is a more complicated business, which is why UK Government colleagues are providing special assistance for people aged 75 and over, and those who are severely disabled.

**Leanne Wood:** Does the Minister realise that the Chancellor will rake in between £2 billion and £5 billion as a result of the selling off of the freed-up analogue spectrum after digital switchover in 2012, while Welsh jobs have been lost in the media, and that, by 2008, there will be fewer hours of Welsh content on television? Does the Minister agree that this position is an utter indictment of the regulatory regime of Ofcom, which was established by New Labour at Westminster? When will the Minister receive Wales's £100 million to £250 million slice of the Chancellor's multimillion-pound windfall, and how will he spend it?

**Alun Pugh:** Any windfall that comes from auctioning off the spare spectrum will be invested in public services, and I am sure that you would want to welcome that. As far as Welsh content is concerned, we are seeing an erosion of the amount of it on our screens, which is particularly important as we move towards multichannel television. It is worth re-stating what I said a few months ago, namely that in order to have a properly informed electorate, it is important that all aspects of life in Wales, particularly news

newyddion da yw nad yw'r nifer yn amrywio llawer yn ôl pob tebyg rhwng grwpiau economaidd-gymdeithasol gwahanol.

**Peter Black:** A rannwch fy mhryder na fydd llawer o'r 17 y cant sy'n weddill nad ydynt wedi dewis derbyn teledu digidol yn gallu fforddio newid i deledu digidol pan gaiff y system analog ei diffodd? Pa gymorth sydd ar gael i'r grwpiau difreintiedig hynny er mwyn sicrhau y byddant yn gallu parhau i fanteisio ar deledu pan gaiff y system analog ei diffodd?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ai pris yw'r rhwystr mwyaf. Yr ydym oll yn cofio mai £100 yr un oedd pris y blychau setiau teledu Freeview cyntaf a oedd ar werth; deallaf eich bod yn gallu prynu un yn awr am ychydig o dan £30. Felly, ni chredaf mai cost yw'r prif rwystr. Fodd bynnag, mae trosglwyddo'r neges ynghylch ail-diwnio setiau teledu yn fater mwy cymhleth, a dyna pam y mae cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU yn rhoi cymorth arbennig i bobl 75 oed a throsodd a'r rhai sy'n ddifrifol anabl.

**Leanne Wood:** A yw'r Gweinidog yn sylweddoli y bydd y Canghellor yn casglu rhwng £2 biliwn a £5 biliwn o ganlyniad i werthu'r sbectwm analog a ryddhawyd ar ôl newid i ddigidol yn 2012, tra bod swyddi yng Nghymru yn y cyfryngau wedi cael eu colli ac, erbyn 2008, y bydd llai o gynnwys Cymreig ar y teledu? A yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y sefyllfa hon yn gyhuddiad llwyr o gyfundrefn reoliadol Ofcom, a sefydlwyd gan Lafur Newydd yn San Steffan? Pryd fydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn £100 miliwn Cymru o'r £250 miliwn o elw annisgwyl y Canghellor sy'n werth miliynau o bunnoedd a sut y bydd yn ei wario?

**Alun Pugh:** Bydd unrhyw elw annisgwyl a ddaw o werthu'r sbectwm dros ben yn cael ei fuddsoddi mewn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech am groesawu hynny. O ran cynnwys Cymreig, yr ydym yn gweld llai ohono ar ein sgriniau, sy'n arbennig o bwysig wrth i ni symud tuag at deledu amlsianel. Mae'n werth ailddatgan yr hyn a ddywedais rai misoedd yn ôl, sef, er mwyn cael etholaeth hyddysg briodol, mae'n bwysig bod pob agwedd ar fywyd yng Nghymru, yn arbennig newyddion a materion

and current affairs, are disseminated to all parts of Wales. We are not quite there yet.

cyfoes, yn cael ei lledaenu i bob rhan o Gymru. Nid ydym wedi llwyddo eto.

### Paratoadau ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder Ryder Cup Preparations

**Q8 William Graham:** Will the Minister give an update on the sporting benefits to Wales arising from the Ryder Cup preparations? OAQ0929(CWS)

**C8 William Graham:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y manteision a ddaw i chwaraeon yng Nghymru yn sgîl y paratoadau ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder? OAQ0929(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** As part of our successful 2010 Ryder Cup bid, Golf Development Wales has been established, which aims to increase the number of people playing golf in Wales, especially women and girls. A £2 million legacy fund has been set up to support this work.

**Alun Pugh:** Fel rhan o'n cynnig llwyddiannus ar gyfer Cwpan Ryder 2010, sefydlwyd Golf Development Wales, sy'n anelu at gynyddu nifer y bobl sy'n chwarae golff yng Nghymru, yn enwedig menywod a merched. Sefydlwyd cronfa o £2 filiwn i gefnogi'r gwaith hwn.

3.20 p.m.

**William Graham:** The Ryder Cup presents a unique opportunity to improve the profile of not only golf, but country sports in south-east Wales. Monmouthshire offers some of the best fishing, riding and shooting sites in Britain, and the opportunity to promote such activities must not be missed. How will you take advantage of this unique opportunity?

**William Graham:** Mae Cwpan Ryder yn gyfle unigryw i wella proffil golff yn ogystal â chwaraeon gwledig yn y de-ddwyrain. Mae sir Fynwy yn cynnig rhai o'r safleoedd pysgota, marchogaeth a saethu gorau ym Mhrydain, ac ni ddylid colli'r cyfle i hyrwyddo gweithgareddau o'r fath. Sut y byddwch yn manteisio ar y cyfle unigryw hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly do not intend to create a shooting and fishing fund, but the golf development fund that I was talking about—the £2 million legacy fund—will enable many more people to play golf, especially in terms of turn up and play, pitch and putt and so on. There is nothing yet in the Newport area, but I am pleased to say that courses from Carmarthenshire to Gwynedd will get a slice of that money.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr nid wyf yn bwriadu creu cronfa saethu a physgota, ond bydd y gronfa datblygu golff yr oeddwn yn sôn amdani—y gronfa o £2 filiwn—yn galluogi llawer mwy o bobl i chwarae golff, yn enwedig o ran cyrraedd a chwarae, trawiad taflu a phytiaid ac yn y blaen. Nid oes unrhyw beth yn ardal Casnewydd eto, ond mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud y bydd cyrsiau o sir Gaerfyrddin i Wynedd yn cael rhan o'r arian hwnnw.

### Cyfranogiad Pobl Ifanc Youth Participation

**Q9 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on youth participation in sport and activity across Wales? OAQ0912(CWS)

**C9 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyfranogiad pobl ifanc mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch ledled Cymru? OAQ0912(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Only 24 per cent of our young people regularly and frequently take part in sport and physical activity. We aim to increase that figure substantially to 90 per

**Alun Pugh:** Dim ond 24 y cant o'n pobl ifanc sy'n cymryd rhan yn rheolaidd ac aml mewn chwaraeon a gweithgarwch corfforol. Ein nod yw cynyddu'r ffigur hwnnw yn

cent by 2025, and our new £7.6 million programme, which I will launch officially next month, will be a key vehicle for achieving that target.

**Mick Bates:** I know that you would agree that that percentage needs to be increased, because we have seen figures about the increasing percentage of overweight teenagers and children in Wales. Do you agree that that is, in part, because of the reduction of sport in schools and that this can only be addressed by joined-up Government thinking, requiring greater encouragement and investment in school sport? For example, would you try to get the UK School Games to be held here, in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** We certainly want to take part in the schools Olympics; we have made that clear to colleagues involved with the London 2012 bid. I would take issue with what you said about this being achieved only through school sport. One thing that worries me considerably is the amount of modal shift in getting to school. Young people of our generation tended to walk or cycle to school, but there has been a major shift in that; children are now far more likely to be taken on short journeys to school in cars or on buses. School sport is part of it, but it is not the only answer to this problem.

sylweddol i 90 y cant erbyn 2025, a bydd ein rhaglen newydd £7.6 miliwn, y byddaf yn ei lansio yn swyddogol y mis nesaf, yn gyfrwng allweddol ar gyfer cyflawni'r targed hwnnw.

**Mick Bates:** Gwn y byddech yn cytuno bod angen cynyddu'r ganran honno, oherwydd gwelsom ffigurau ynghylch y ganran gynyddol o blant a phobl ifanc yn eu harddegau sy'n gorbwyso yng Nghymru. A gytunwch fod hynny, yn rhannol, am fod llai o chwaraeon mewn ysgolion a dim ond drwy feddylfryd Llywodraeth cydgysylltiedig y gellir mynd i'r afael â hyn, sy'n galw am fwy o anogaeth a buddsoddiad mewn chwaraeon ysgol? Er enghraifft, a wnewch chi geisio trefnu i Gemau Ysgolion y DU gael eu cynnal yma, yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr yr ydym am gymryd rhan yn y Gemau Olympaidd i ysgolion; gwnaethom hynny'n glir i gyd-aelodau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â chynnig Llundain 2012. Byddwn yn anghytuno â'r hyn a ddywedasoch sef mai dim ond drwy chwaraeon ysgol y gellir cyflawni hyn. Mae un peth yn fy mhoeni yn fawr sef faint o newid sydd wedi bod yn y ffordd y mae plant yn cyrraedd yr ysgol. Yr oedd pobl ifanc o'm cenhedlaeth i yn tueddu i gerdded neu seiclo i'r ysgol, ond mae hynny wedi newid llawer; mae plant yn llawer mwy tebygol yn awr o gael eu cludo ar deithiau byr i'r ysgol yn y car neu ar fws. Mae chwaraeon ysgol yn rhan ohono, ond nid dyna'r unig ateb i'r broblem hon.

### **Cynlluniau i Hyrwyddo Chwaraeon Initiatives to Promote Sport**

**Q10 Janet Ryder:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's initiatives to promote sport? OAQ936(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Our range of initiatives for promoting sport is contained in the 'Climbing Higher—Next Steps' document, which we published earlier this summer. This sets out our framework for action and key areas for investment so that we can achieve our long-term targets to make Wales a healthier nation and a competitive force on the world stage.

**C10 Janet Ryder:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo chwaraeon? OAQ936(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae ein hystod o fentrau ar gyfer hyrwyddo chwaraeon wedi ei chynnwys yn y ddogfen 'Dringo'n Uwch—Camau Nesaf', a gyhoeddwyd gennym yn gynharach yr haf hwn. Mae'n nodi ein fframwaith ar gyfer gweithredu a meysydd allweddol ar gyfer buddsoddi ynddynt fel y gallwn gyflawni ein targedau hirdymor i wneud Cymru yn wlad iachach ac yn rym cystadleuol ar lwyfan y byd.



**Janet Ryder:** I declare an interest as patron of the Wales Rugby League. I understand that you had a meeting this morning with representatives from the rugby league, so you will be aware of some of their concerns. We would like to see rugby league recognised as one of the top sports in Wales, particularly because of the work that it does in encouraging young people to take part in the sport. I am sure that you would like to join me in congratulating the seven young people from Wales who will be playing in the Great Britain conference team in Manchester on 14 October, as it is from that team that the GB amateur rugby league team will be picked to play France. We hope to see some Welsh representation in that team. Would you also join me in congratulating the Celtic Crusaders on having such a fantastic season, finishing off in the play-offs, and now able to contend for a promotion, which would do wonders for rugby league in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** It is fair to say that rugby league is a small sport in terms of the numbers of participants at the moment, but it has certainly shown some healthy growth and I welcome that. You are right to say that I met rugby league officers with Carwyn Jones this morning, and we went through a number of interesting proposals. They are very keen to join us in our mass participation agenda. They also have some interesting proposals for a sporting academy and a headquarters facility in the Cynon valley, and I have asked them to talk to Christine Chapman with regard to that.

**Janet Ryder:** Datganaf fuddiant fel noddwr Cynghrair Rygbi Cymru. Deallaf ichi gael cyfarfod y bore yma gyda chynrychiolwyr o rygbi'r gynghrair, felly byddwch yn ymwybodol o rai o'u pryderon. Hoffem weld rygbi'r gynghrair yn cael ei gydnabod fel un o'r chwaraeon gorau yng Nghymru, yn arbennig oherwydd y gwaith a wna i annog pobl ifanc i gymryd rhan yn y gamp. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffech ymuno â mi i longyfarch y saith o bobl ifanc o Gymru a fydd yn chwarae yn nhîm cynhadledd Prydain Fawr ym Manceinion ar 14 Hydref, oherwydd o'r tîm hwnnw y caiff tîm amatur rygbi'r gynghrair Prydain Fawr ei ddewis i chwarae yn erbyn Ffrainc. Gobeithiwn weld cynrychiolaeth o Gymru yn y tîm hwnnw. A wnewch chi hefyd yn ymuno â mi i longyfarch y Celtic Crusaders ar gael tymor mor wych, gan orffen yn y gemau ail gyfle. Bellach gallant gystadlu am ddyrchafiad, a fyddai'n gwneud byd o les i rygbi'r gynghrair yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n deg dweud bod rygbi'r gynghrair yn gamp fach o ran nifer y cyfranogwyr ar hyn o bryd, ond yn sicr mae wedi dangos rhywfaint o dwf iach a chroesawaf hynny. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud imi gwrdd â swyddogion rygbi'r gynghrair gyda Carwyn Jones y bore yma, a bu inni drafod nifer o gynigion diddorol. Maent yn awyddus iawn i ymuno â ni yn ein hagenda cyfrangaeth dorfol. Mae ganddynt rai cynigion diddorol hefyd ar gyfer academi chwaraeon, a chyfleuster pencadlys yng Nghwm Cynon, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn iddynt drafod hynny â Christine Chapman.

### **Cyfleusterau Priodol ac Ystyriol ar gyfer Pobl Anabl Appropriate and Respectful Facilities for the Disabled**

**Q11 Jonathan Morgan:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government's policy on ensuring that all civic leisure centres across Wales are equipped with appropriate and respectful disabled facilities? OAQ0911(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The provision of public leisure facilities in Wales is the responsibility of local authorities. They are required to ensure that their facilities comply with Part III of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. This

**C11 Jonathan Morgan:** Beth yw polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer sicrhau bod cyfleusterau priodol ac ystyriol ar gyfer pobl anabl ar gael ym mhob canolfan hamdden ddinesig ym mhob cwr o Gymru? OAQ0911(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw darparu cyfleusterau hamdden cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Mae'n ofynnol iddynt sicrhau bod eu cyfleusterau yn cydymffurfio â Rhan III o Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd

requires service providers to make reasonable physical adjustments to their premises to comply with the Act.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Thank you for that response, Minister. There was an incident recently here in Cardiff, at Llanishen Leisure Centre, in the north of the city, where a constituent of mine and his wife had to suffer the humiliation of getting changed in the first aid room, where several members of staff at the centre walked in on them. This was because the lady in question was disabled and there are no disabled changing facilities at the centre. The gentleman's wife was given medical advice to take regular exercise at the centre, because of the nature of its swimming pool. While I agree with you that it is up to local authorities to ensure that they comply with the Act, what support can the Assembly Government give to local authorities so that they can fulfill that particular responsibility?

**Alun Pugh:** I am concerned to hear the details of that incident, but I am aware that Llanishen Leisure Centre requires significant investment in order to comply with Part III of the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. It is, of course, a matter for Cardiff council, and you will know that the revenue support grant and general capital funding are unhypothecated funding to local government. Local government must make its own priorities, but that sounds like an important case to me.

1995. Mae hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i ddarparwyr gwasanaethau wneud addasiadau ffisegol rhesymol i'w safleoedd i gydymffurfio â'r Ddeddf.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. Bu digwyddiad yma yn ddiweddar yng Nghaerdydd, yng Nghanolfan Hamdden Llanisien, i'r gogledd o'r ddinas, lle y bu'n rhaid i un o'm hetholwyr a'i wraig ddioddef y gwarth o orfod newid yn yr ystafell cymorth cyntaf, lle y daeth sawl aelod o staff ar eu traws. Yr oedd hyn oherwydd bod y wraig dan sylw yn anabl ac nid oedd unrhyw gyfleusterau newid i'r anabl yn y ganolfan. Rhoddwyd cyngor meddygol i'r wraig wneud ymarfer corff rheolaidd yn y ganolfan, oherwydd natur ei phwll nofio. Er fy mod yn cytuno â chi mai cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio â'r Ddeddf, pa gymorth y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei roi i awdurdodau lleol fel y gallant gyflawni'r cyfrifoldeb penodol hwnnw?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'n flin gennyf glywed am y digwyddiad hwnnw, ond gwn fod angen cryn fuddsoddiad yng Nghanolfan Hamdden Llanisien er mwyn cydymffurfio â Rhan III o Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995. Wrth gwrs, mater i gyngor Caerdydd ydyw, a gwyddoch fod y grant cynnal refeniw a'r cyllid cyfalaf cyffredinol yn gyllid heb ei neilltuo i lywodraeth leol. Rhaid i lywodraeth leol wneud ei blaenoriaethau ei hunan, ond mae hynny'n ymddangos yn achos pwysig i mi.

### **Coffáu Syr Kyffin Williams Commemorating Sir Kyffin Williams**

**Q12 Ann Jones:** What discussions has the Minister had regarding the suitable commemoration of the late Sir Kyffin Williams in Wales? OAQ0887(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I have had discussions with the leader of the Isle of Anglesey County Council about the council's proposals for the gallery at Oriol Ynys Môn. My officials are in regular contact with the council about the progress of the plans.

**Ann Jones:** Thank you for that, as well as for your answer to Ieuan Wyn Jones's earlier

**C12 Ann Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael ynghylch y ffordd briodol o goffáu'r diweddar Syr Kyffin Williams yng Nghymru? OAQ0887(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Cefais drafodaethau gydag arweinydd Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn ynghylch cynigion y cyngor ar gyfer yr oriel yn Oriol Ynys Môn. Mae fy swyddogion yn cysylltu'n rheolaidd â'r cyngor ynghylch cynnydd y cynlluniau.

**Ann Jones:** Diolch ichi am hynny, a diolch am eich ateb i gwestiwn cynharach Ieuan

question. I emphasise that Sir Kyffin has been recognised across Wales, as you have said, and many people from my constituency want to add their voices to those calling for any commemoration of Sir Kyffin to be in north Wales, closest to his home. I also agree that it should be on Anglesey.

**Alun Pugh:** Many people believe that. Ynys Môn is an entirely appropriate place for this collection, and that is why we have made an offer of substantial financial assistance in order to allow that project to go ahead, which I hope it will.

Wyn Jones. Pwysleisiaf fod Syr Kyffin wedi cael ei gydnabod ledled Cymru, fel y dywedasoch, ac mae llawer o bobl o'm hetholaeth i yn cytuno â'r rhai sydd am i Syr Kyffin gael ei goffâu yn y gogledd, yn agos at ei gartref. Cytunaf hefyd y dylai fod ar Ynys Môn.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae llawer o bobl yn credu hynny. Mae Ynys Môn yn lle hollol briodol ar gyfer y casgliad hwn a dyna pam y gwnaethom gynnig cymorth ariannol sylweddol er mwyn caniatáu i'r prosiect hwnnw fynd yn ei flaen, a bydd gobeithio yn gwneud hynny.

## **Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee**

### **Gwaith Atgyweirio yn y Senedd Repairs to the Senedd**

**Q1 Jonathan Morgan:** How many individual repairs have been undertaken to the Senedd since it was opened to Assembly Members? OAQ0012(HC)

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek):** The Senedd building has not yet been taken over by the House Committee and remains the responsibility of the Welsh Assembly Government. On the defects and repairs for which the contractor has contractual responsibility, I must refer you to the Finance Minister. However, as part of the ongoing routine management of the building, for which the House Committee has exercised responsibility, 32 minor repairs have been undertaken by the Assembly Parliamentary Service since March.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I am grateful to the Deputy Presiding Officer for that response, and I am pleased to hear that the contract includes a period within which any repairs will be undertaken by the contractor and not paid for by the taxpayer. Of course, once that period expires, it will be up to the Assembly to cover the costs of any ongoing repairs beyond that particular date. What preparations are being made at the moment to ensure that we have the appropriate level of finance to ensure that those repairs are covered? We would not want to see repairs

**C1 Jonathan Morgan:** Sawl tasg atgyweirio unigol a wnaed i'r Senedd ers ei hagog i Aelodau'r Cynulliad? OAQ0012(HC)

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):** Nid yw Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi mynd yn gyfrifol eto am adeilad y Senedd a chyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ydyw o hyd. O ran y diffygion a'r atgyweiriadau y mae gan y contractiwr gyfrifoldeb cytundebol drostynt, rhaid imi eich cyfeirio at y Gweinidog Cyllid. Fodd bynnag, fel rhan o reolaeth reolaidd barhaus yr adeilad, y mae Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi bod yn gyfrifol amdano, mae 32 o fân atgyweiriadau wedi eu gwneud gan Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ers mis Mawrth.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Dirprwy Lywydd am yr ymateb hwnnw, ac mae'n bleser gennyf glywed bod y contract yn cynnwys cyfnod lle y caiff unrhyw atgyweiriadau eu gwneud gan y contractiwr ac nid y trethdalwr fydd yn talu amdanynt. Wrth gwrs, pan ddaw'r cyfnod hwnnw i ben, cyfrifoldeb y Cynulliad fydd talu costau unrhyw atgyweiriadau parhaus ar ôl y dyddiad hwnnw. Pa baratoadau sy'n cael eu gwneud ar hyn o bryd i sicrhau bod gennym y lefel briodol o gyllid i sicrhau y telir am yr atgyweiriadau hynny? Ni fyddem am weld

being left, particularly with the large numbers of tourists now visiting Cardiff, many of whom are now happily visiting this Assembly building.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That is one of the reasons why the House Committee has refused to take over responsibility for the new building and has delayed it. I have every hope that the House Committee will be able to take over the Senedd building in the near future, but we want to be sure that we have reasonably accurate estimates of the costs that it will entail—and it will entail costs, because any building needs minor repairs from time to time. I cannot estimate those costs at this stage, but I know that we need to be absolutely clear that they can be contained, and that no unforeseen costs will arise for which we will have to pay as a result of our taking over the responsibility for the building.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Will you join me in welcoming the fact that we have had our two hundred and fifty thousandth visitor today to the Senedd building in the seven months since it opened, and also welcome the fact that the overwhelming reaction of people, despite any snags or repairs that have been taking place, has been very positive?

3.30 p.m.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am happy to welcome the two hundred and fifty thousandth visitor, and I am also happy to confirm to Lorraine that the reaction has been positive and welcoming. We should all be grateful for that, because it is a forum for the nation, and I hope that it will be held in high esteem by the people of Wales, and in even higher esteem as time goes on.

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Rhag Tân) 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 to the First Minister**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

atgyweiriadau yn cael eu hesgeuluso, yn enwedig o gofio'r nifer fawr o dwristiaid sydd bellach yn ymweld â Chaerdydd, y mae llawer ohonynt yn ymweld ag adeilad y Cynulliad hwn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae hynny'n un o'r rhesymau pam fod Pwyllgor y Tŷ wedi gwrthod bod yn gyfrifol am yr adeilad newydd ac wedi ei oedi. Gobeithiaf y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn gallu mynd yn gyfrifol am adeilad y Senedd yn y dyfodol agos, ond yr ydym am sicrhau bod gennym amcangyfrifon rhesymol gywir o'r costau y bydd hynny'n ei olygu—a bydd yn golygu costau, oherwydd mae angen gwneud mân waith atgyweirio mewn unrhyw adeilad o bryd i'w gilydd. Ni allaf amcangyfrif y costau ar hyn o bryd, ond gwn fod angen inni fod yn hollol glir y gellir eu cynnwys, ac na fydd unrhyw gostau annisgwyl yn codi y bydd yn rhaid inni dalu amdanynt pan fyddwn yn gyfrifol am yr adeilad.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A ymunwch â mi i groesawu'r ffaith fod ymwelydd rhif 250,000 wedi ymweld ag adeilad y Senedd heddiw a hynny ddim ond saith mis ers iddo agor ac i groesawu'r ffaith bod pobl, ar y cyfan, wedi ymateb yn gadarnhaol iawn, er gwaethaf unrhyw broblemau neu waith atgyweirio sydd wedi codi?

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny, ac mae'n bleser gennyf hefyd gadarnhau i Lorraine y bu'r ymateb yn gadarnhaol ac yn groesawgar. Dylem oll ddiolch am hynny, gan mai fforwm i'r genedl ydyw, a gobeithiaf y bydd gan bobl Cymru barch mawr tuag ato, ac y bydd y parch hwnnw yn cynyddu gydag amser.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1) (b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998, resolves to delegate the functions of the National Assembly contained in and under the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM3205)*

As you are aware, matters relating to fire and rescue authorities in Wales were conferred on the National Assembly for Wales by the Fire and Rescue Services Act 2004. This transfer of functions Order is consistent with the policy of devolution and it enables the National Assembly for Wales to act across a range of the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005 provisions. Delegation of powers over fire safety to the First Minister will enable those provisions to be administered appropriately to discharge the functions of the Order as intended. However, Members should note that any relevant subordinate legislation in this area can only be made by the agreement of the National Assembly for Wales itself.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for the statement, Minister. We welcome this. However, what is your intention, for example, when you have placed before you the integrated risk management plans, which in some cases would threaten the existence of our retained fire service in Wales? As you are aware, the fire service has a very important role, particularly in rural Wales, where the understanding between local businesses and the fire service has meant that it has provided an excellent service for many years. The integrated risk management plans appear to threaten its existence. Would the Assembly have the power to overturn some of those plans if they were, for example, to threaten the existence of an effective and efficient fire service in rural areas by getting rid of the retained fire service?

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** As you are aware, integrated risk management plans are

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol ag adran 62 (1) (b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn a than Orchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Rhag Tân) 2005, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM3205)*

Fel y byddwch yn ymwybodol, trosglwyddwyd materion o ran yr awdurdodau tân ac achub yng Nghymru i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gan Ddeddf Gwasanaethau Tân ac Achub 2004. Mae'r Gorchymyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau hwn yn gydnaws â pholisi datganoli ac yn galluogi Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i weithredu ar draws amrywiaeth o ddarpariaethau Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoleiddio (Diogelwch Rhag Tân) 2005. Bydd y broses o ddirprwyo pwerau dros ddiogelwch rhag tân i'r Prif Weinidog yn galluogi i'r darpariaethau hynny gael eu gweinyddu'n briodol er mwyn cyflawni swyddogaethau'r Gorchymyn fel y bwriadwyd. Fodd bynnag, dylai Aelodau nodi mai dim ond gyda chytundeb Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ei hun y gellir gwneud unrhyw is-ddeddfwriaeth berthnasol yn y maes hwn.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am y datganiad, Weinidog. Fe'i croesawn. Fodd bynnag, beth yw eich bwriad, er enghraifft, pan ddaw'r cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig ger eich bron, a fyddai, mewn rhai achosion, yn bygwth bodolaeth ein gwasanaeth tân wrth gefn yng Nghymru? Fel y gwyddoch, mae gan y gwasanaeth tân rôl bwysig iawn, yn arbennig yng Nghymru wledig, lle mae'r ddealltwriaeth rhwng busnesau lleol a'r gwasanaeth tân wedi cynnal gwasanaeth ardderchog ers sawl blwyddyn. Ymddengys fod y cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig yn bygwth ei fodolaeth. A fyddai gan y Cynulliad y pŵer i wrthdroi rhai o'r cynlluniau hynny petaent, er enghraifft, yn bygwth bodolaeth gwasanaeth tân effeithiol ac effeithlon mewn ardaloedd gwledig drwy gael gwared ar y gwasanaeth tân wrth gefn?

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r tri awdurdod tân yn

currently out to consultation among the three fire authorities. They are due in for me to have a look at them by 31 October this year. I recognise the representations that I have received from across Wales. I have received many representations in particular concerning the proposals by the fire authorities in respect of Haverfordwest and Pontardawe. I will ensure that the fire authorities' integrated risk management plans take into account the views of the National Assembly for Wales and any regulations that I may have issued, particularly in relation to the time it takes to get to certain incidents.

ymgyngori ar y cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig ar hyn o bryd. Disgwylir iddynt eu cyflwyno ger fy mron erbyn 31 Hydref eleni. Cydnabyddaf y sylwadau a gefais o bob cwr o Gymru. Cefais lawer o sylwadau yn arbennig o ran y cynigion gan yr awdurdodau tân mewn perthynas â Hwlfordd a Phontardawe. Byddaf yn sicrhau bod cynlluniau rheoli risg integredig yr awdurdodau tân yn ystyried safbwyntiau Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ac unrhyw reoliadau y gallwn fod wedi'u cyhoeddi, yn arbennig o ran yr amser a gymer i gyrraedd rhai digwyddiadau penodol.

*Cynnig (NDM3205): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3205): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Blaenraglen Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru The Welsh Assembly Government's Forward Work Programme**

<p>Motion (NDM3206): to propose that</p> <p><i>the National Assembly for Wales notes the Welsh Assembly Government's forward work programme as set out in the Cabinet written statement from the Business Minister, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on Wednesday 13 September.</i></p> <p>Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls for a debate in Government time on WAG's proposals for the Welsh language and the Welsh Language Board in relation to the Government of Wales Act 1998.</i></p> <p>Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls for a debate in Government time on secondary care reviews throughout Wales.</i></p> <p>Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls for a debate in Government time on the ambulance service review.</i></p> <p>Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls for a debate in Government time on Welsh Labour's manifesto commitment of free personal care for the disabled.</i></p> <p>Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:</p> <p><i>calls for a debate in Government time on Welsh Labour's manifesto commitment of free school breakfasts for every child in</i></p>	<p>Cynnig (NDM3206): cynnig bod</p> <p><i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi blaenraglen waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel y'i nodwyd gan y Trefnydd yn natganiad ysgrifenedig y Cabinet, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ddydd Mercher 13 Medi.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar gynigion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran yr iaith Gymraeg a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yng nghyswllt Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr adolygiadau o ofal eilaidd ledled Cymru.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto Llafur Cymru i ddarparu gofal personol rhad ac am ddim i bobl anabl.</i></p> <p>Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:</p> <p><i>yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto Llafur Cymru i ddarparu brechwast ysgol rhad ac am ddim i</i></p>
---	---

Wales.

*bob plentyn yng Nghymru.*

Amendment 6 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 6 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the impact of council tax increases over the past eight years on taxpayers in Wales, especially the vulnerable and those on benefits.*

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar effaith codiadau yn y dreth gyngor dros yr wyth mlynedd diweddaf ar drethdalwyr yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y bobl sy'n agored i niwed a'r rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau.*

Amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the Welsh Assembly Government's budget for communications and media relations.*

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar gyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cyfathrebu a chysylltiadau â'r cyfryngau.*

Amendment 8 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 8 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the withdrawal of Tir Mynydd payments.*

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar ddiddymu taliadau Tir Mynydd.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to ensure the reduction of all primary school class sizes to 25.*

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i sicrhau bod maint pob dosbarth ysgol gynradd yn cael ei ostwng i 25 o blant.*

Amendment 10 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce free homecare for disabled people.*

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl.*

Amendment 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 11 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce a 500m buffer zone for opencast mining sites.*

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno clustogfa 500m ar gyfer safleoedd glo brig.*

Amendment 12 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 12 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce a modern foreign language at key stages 1 and 2.*

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno iaith dramor fodern yng nghyfnod allweddol 1 a 2.*



Amendment 13 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward a draft green jobs strategy for debate in the Chamber.*

Amendment 14 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward, for debate in the Chamber, proposals to re-establish the music development fund.*

Amendment 15 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward, for debate in the Chamber, proposals to re-establish the post office development fund.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, and 8 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendment 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14 and 15 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Cynigial fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn nodi blaenraglen waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel y'i nodwyd gan y Trefnydd yn natganiad ysgrifenedig y Cabinet, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ddydd Mercher 13 Medi. (NDM3206)*

Yr wythnos diwethaf, anfonodd Jane Hutt, y Trefnydd, ddatganiad ysgrifenedig at yr holl Aelodau yn rhestru'r busnes y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bwriadu ei ddod gerbron y Cynulliad yn ystod y cyfnod rhwng yr wythnos hon a'r etholiadau Cynulliad nesaf. Bydd yn gyfnod prysur dros ben, a bydd yn cynnwys gwaith ar y gyllideb a deddfwriaeth, ac, o dro i'w gilydd, rhyw fymryn o ffraeo a gwrthdaro rhyngbleidiol.

Gwelliant 13 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd ddrafft ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr.*

Gwelliant 14 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno, ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr, gynigion i ailsefydlu'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth.*

Gwelliant 15 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno, ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr, gynigion i ailsefydlu cronfa datblygu swyddfa'r post.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 a 8 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14 a 15 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*notes the Welsh Assembly Government's forward work programme as set out in the Cabinet written statement from the Business Minister, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on Wednesday 13 September. (NDM3206)*

Last week, Jane Hutt, the Business Minister, sent a written statement to all Assembly Members listing the business that the Assembly Government intends to bring before the Assembly in the period between this week and the next Assembly elections. It will be an exceptionally busy period, which will include work on the budget and legislation, and, from time to time, some arguments and falling out between the

parties.

However, to contradict that last remark, the request for this statement came from opposition parties and I commend that initiative, coming from the body of the kirk of the Assembly. After all, this is the last six months of work in the old-style Assembly as it was from 1999 to 2003, and through to 2007, prior to the split under the terms of the Government of Wales Act 2006. The initiative from the opposition parties in requesting such a statement, and Jane Hutt's response in providing the statement that is the basis of this afternoon's debate, will bridge us through into the new Assembly post the corporate body split under the provisions of the Government of Wales Act 2006. The enhanced legislative powers that will give us a much wider range of work in the future are not the only way in which we can anticipate additional legislative competence and more powers to legislate and do things, and therefore debate and be scrutinised upon. There are framework powers as well, which we must not forget. Opportunities will arise in England-and-Wales legislation, and we will wish to avail ourselves of them—we do not want to miss any opportunities. There are some interesting examples at the moment.

**David Davies:** Do you not agree that it is vital, given that a lady in my constituency recently waited four hours for an ambulance that had run out of petrol and got lost, that we debate this so-called service? It is little more than a shambulance service—it is the worst service in Wales, and Monmouthshire has the worst results for the ambulance service in Wales. Is it not time that this was discussed as a matter of urgency?

**The First Minister:** I do not know about discussing it this afternoon; there were opportunities to do so earlier when questions about the ambulance trust were put to Brian Gibbons, who responded by referring to his meeting. I am not making any reference to where people were at the time, as I did not notice. However, Members have the opportunity to put questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services in Plenary, including today.

Fodd bynnag, yn groes i'r sylw diwethaf hwnnw, cyflwynwyd y cais am y datganiad hwn gan y gwrthbleidiau a chymeradwyaf eu blaengaredd, gan gorff eglwys y Cynulliad. Wedi'r cyfan, dyma'r chwe mis olaf o weithio yn arddull yr hen Gynulliad fel y bu o 1999 i 2003, ac hyd at 2007, cyn inni rannu o dan delerau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Bydd blaengaredd y gwrthbleidiau wrth wneud cais am ddatganiad o'r fath, ac ymateb Jane Hutt wrth ddarparu'r datganiad sy'n sail i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma, yn gweithredu fel pont i'r Cynulliad newydd yn dilyn y rhaniad corfforaethol o dan ddarpariaethau Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006. Nid y pwerau deddfwriaethol estynedig a fydd yn rhoi amrywiaeth llawer ehangach o waith inni yn y dyfodol yw'r unig ffordd y gallwn ragweld medrusrwydd deddfwriaethol ychwanegol a mwy o bwerau i ddeddfu a gweithredu, ac felly gynnal dadlau a bod yn destun craffu. Mae yna bwerau fframwaith hefyd, ac ni ddylem anghofio hynny. Bydd cyfleoedd yn deillio o ddeddfwriaeth Cymru-a-Lloegr, a byddwn yn awyddus i achub ar y cyfleoedd hynny—nid ydym am golli unrhyw gyfleoedd. Mae yna rai enghreifftiau diddorol ar hyn o bryd.

**David Davies:** Oni chytunwch ei bod yn hanfodol, o gofio y bu i fenyw yn fy etholaeth i aros bedair awr yn ddiweddar am ambiwlans a oedd wedi rhedeg allan o betrol ac wedi colli'r ffordd, inni drafod y gwasanaeth hwn, os gellid ei alw'n wasanaeth? Mae'n gywilyddus—dyma'r gwasanaeth gwaethaf yng Nghymru, a Sir Fynwy sydd â'r canlyniadau gwaethaf o fewn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Onid yw'n bryd inni drafod y mater hwn fel mater o frys?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni wn ai'r prynhawn yma y dylem ei drafod; cafwyd cyfleoedd i wneud hynny yn gynharach pan gyflwynwyd cwestiynau ynghylch yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans i Brian Gibbons, a ymatebodd drwy gyfeirio at ei gyfarfod. Nid wyf yn cyfeirio at leoliad pobl ar y pryd, gan na sylwais. Fodd bynnag, caiff Aelodau gyfle i gyflwyno cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros lechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ystod Cyfarfodydd Llawn, gan gynnwys

heddiw.

I was about to mention the Education and Inspections Bill, which is extremely important, as it includes provisions on school nutrition and transport. It has not yet become an Act of Parliament, but we are anticipating it gladly because of what we will be able to do in terms of making legislation on nutrition and school transport. The NHS Redress Bill is another such Bill, and is self-explanatory.

The main change will come in our gaining powers through the new procedure of Orders in Council, and the Cabinet statement sets out another way in which we gain powers, and though which we will put forward legislation, on which the Assembly will want to scrutinise us. We have just had an example in the Transfer of Functions Order 2006 a few seconds ago, and another is on the way, which is that for the census 2011, which will give us powers of consultation on the census for the first time. That will also come forward through a transfer of functions Order.

This is a packed programme of work, and it does need solid scrutiny by backbenchers and opposition parties, and not shopping-list scrutiny. There is a tendency towards shopping-list scrutiny in the Assembly. If we were to bring in a measure like that in Ireland on taxing plastic shopping bags, I do not know what opposition parties would do to carry all the amendments that they always bring with them as baggage. Scrutiny is not necessarily about producing a long list of amendments: the Lib Dems produce six amendments, Plaid Cymru produce five, and the Conservatives four, and the next time it is the other way around, as though the number of amendments is a form of scrutiny in itself. That is not the case.

This administration takes seriously the trust invested in it by the people of Wales in 2003, and we are determined to deliver on that trust. Aside from one manifesto commitment, we intend to complete the programme on which we were elected. The first commitment in our manifesto was to abolish all prescription charges. We have progressively reduced prescription charges throughout this term of government, and, as set out in our

Yr oeddwn ar fin crybwyll y Mesur Addysg ac Arolygiadau, sy'n arbennig o bwysig, gan ei fod yn cynnwys darpariaethau ar faeth a thrafnidiaeth mewn ysgolion. Nid yw'n Ddeddf Seneddol eto, ond yr ydym yn aros yn eiddgar amdani o gofio'r hyn y byddwn yn gallu ei wneud o ran gwneud deddfwriaeth ar faeth a thrafnidiaeth ysgolion. Mae Mesur Iawndal y GIG yn Fesur arall o'r fath, ac mae'n hunanesboniadol.

Daw'r prif newid yn sgîl y pwerau newydd a roddir inni drwy'r weithdrefn Gorchmynion y Cyngor newydd, ac mae datganiad y Cabinet yn nodi ffordd arall y byddwn yn cael pwerau newydd, ac y byddwn yn ei defnyddio i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth newydd, lle y bydd y Cynulliad yn awyddus i graffu arnom. Yr ydym newydd weld un enghraifft yng Ngorchymyn Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau 2006, a fydd yn rhoi pwerau ymgynghori inni ar y cyfrifiad am y tro cyntaf. Caiff hynny hefyd ei gyflwyno drwy Orchymyn trosglwyddo swyddogaethau.

Mae hon yn rhaglen waith gynhwysfawr, a bydd angen i feincwyr cefn a'r gwrthbleidiau graffu'n ofalus arni, yn hytrach na chynnal proses graffu ar ffurf rhestr siopa. Mae tuedd i graffu ar ffurf rhestr siopa yn y Cynulliad. Pe cyflwynem fesur tebyg i'r mesur yn Iwerddon ar drethu bagiau siopa plastig, ni wn sut y byddai'r gwrthbleidiau yn cario'r holl welliannau y dônt gyda hwy bob tro. Nid oes a wnelo craffu o reidrwydd â chynhyrchu rhestr hir o welliannau: y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cyflwyno chwe gwelliant, Plaid Cymru yn cyflwyno pump, a'r Ceidwadwyr bedwar, a'r tro nesaf, hynny'n cael ei amrywio, fel pe bai nifer y gwelliannau yn fath o graffu ynddo'i hun. Nid dyna fel y mae.

Mae'r weinyddiaeth hon yn cymryd yr ymddiriedaeth a ddangoswyd gan bobl Cymru yn 2003 o ddifrif, ac yr ydym yn benderfynol o ymateb i'r ymddiriedaeth honno. Yn ogystal ag un ymrwymiad yn y maniffesto, yr ydym yn bwriadu cwblhau'r rhaglen y cawsom ein hethol arni. Yr ymrwymiad cyntaf yn ein maniffesto oedd diddymu pob taliad presgripsiwn. Yr ydym wedi lleihau taliadau presgripsiwn yn raddol

programme, we will bring forward legislation to abolish all prescription charges on 1 April 2007, and the budget will include provision for this. From April next year, Wales will be unique in having no prescription charges.

I anticipate that Members, particularly opposition Members, will queue up to remind me that we will not be delivering on our promise to scrap homecare charges for the disabled. I have apologised for this and given a full explanation of why this has now been replaced by a more comprehensive package. The budget will make provision for that alternative package of support and, by April 2007, a new charging framework will be in place for care users, providing more financial support to more people than was envisaged in the original manifesto commitment, and our legislative proposals will provide greater protection for users of social care. When a promise is not fulfilled, it is a matter of great regret, but I believe that we can regain the trust—and we are in the process of regaining the trust—of disabled people by our determination to work with them to develop an alternative support arrangement and invest substantially in that alternative package. Once again, I declare an interest as a part-time carer.

Our manifesto committed us to providing free bus travel for those aged over 60 and disabled people. We have continued this highly successful and popular programme throughout our term of Government. It has been imitated elsewhere in the United Kingdom, but with limitations that we in Wales do not set. We will continue to budget for this programme into the next term of government.

3.40 p.m.

Our manifesto committed us to not introducing top-up fees in Welsh universities. The budget provision is already in place to ensure that that commitment is fulfilled for the full term of the Assembly and we will legislate to uplift the rate of payment for the

drwy gyfnod y llywodraeth hon, ac, fel y nodwyd yn ein rhaglen, byddwn yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i ddiddymu pob taliad presgripsiwn ar 1 Ebrill 2007, a bydd y gyllideb yn cynnwys darpariaeth yn hyn o beth. O fis Ebrill nesaf ymlaen, bydd Cymru yn unigryw gan na fydd ganddi unrhyw daliadau presgripsiwn.

Rhagwelaif y bydd Aelodau, yn arbennig Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, yn fwy na pharod i'm hatgoffa na fyddwn yn cyflawni ein haddewid i ddiddymu taliadau gofal cartref i'r anabl. Yr wyf wedi ymddiheuro am hyn ac wedi rhoi esboniad llawn o'r rhesymau pam ein bod bellach wedi ei disodli gyda phecyn mwy cynhwysfawr. Bydd y gyllideb yn darparu ar gyfer y pecyn cymorth amgen hwnnw ac, erbyn mis Ebrill 2007, bydd fframwaith taliadau newydd ar waith i ddefnyddwyr gofal, a fydd yn darparu mwy o gymorth ariannol i fwy o bobl nag a ragwelwyd yn yr ymrwymiad gwreiddiol yn y maniffesto, a bydd ein cynigion deddfwriaethol yn darparu gwell diogelwch i ddefnyddwyr gofal cymdeithasol. Lle na chaiff addewid ei wireddu, mae'n edifar iawn gennym, ond credaf y gallwn ailennill ymddiriedaeth pobl anabl—ac yr ydym wrthi'n ailennill eu hymddiriedaeth—drwy ein penderfyniad i weithio gyda hwy i ddatblygu trefniant cymorth amgen ac i fuddsoddi'n sylweddol yn y pecyn amgen hwnnw. Unwaith eto, datganaf fuddiant fel gofalwr rhan amser.

Yn ein maniffesto, gwnaed ymrwymiad i ddarparu cynllun teithio am ddim ar fysiau i bobl dros 60 oed a phobl anabl. Parhaodd y rhaglen boblogaidd, hynod lwyddiannus hon drwy gydol ein cyfnod fel Llywodraeth. Fe'i cyflwynwyd mewn ardaloedd eraill yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond gyda chyfyngiadau na cheir mo'u tebyg yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn parhau i gyllidebu ar gyfer y rhaglen hon yn ystod cyfnod nesaf y llywodraeth.

Gwnaed ymrwymiad yn ein maniffesto na fyddem yn cyflwyno ffioedd atodol mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru. Mae'r ddarpariaeth eisoes ar waith yn y gyllideb i sicrhau y cyflawnir yr ymrwymiad hwnnw ar gyfer cyfnod llawn y Cynulliad a byddwn yn

Assembly learning grant, the education maintenance allowance and the teacher training incentive scheme.

Another area that we are up-rating and that will come before the Assembly is the home energy efficiency scheme. It is an under-rated programme that is part of our delivering on our general commitment to sustainable development.

**Glyn Davies:** We are hearing about your programme and a description of your performance in Government; I thought that we were to debate Assembly business for the next six months. I hoped that you might tell us how we can fill in that structure in a way that might engage the population. You are just giving us a series of what you claim to be achievements and your next manifesto; you are not addressing the issue before us at all.

**The First Minister:** What I have been reading out refers, by and large, to matters that will come before the Assembly in the next six months. If you read the Record tomorrow, I think that you will find that your comment is misplaced.

We have already budgeted to meet all of our commitments for capital investment in schools and hospitals but there will be further budget provision in the arguments over this year's budget to ensure that we can carry on with the programme.

People will have seen the Rhondda community hospital rising above the ground, and the Porthmadog hospital becoming a building, although it is not yet open. People in other parts of Wales will want to know when they will see the Blaenau Gwent community hospital and the Holywell community hospital, to which there is now a commitment, and the bigger hospital in the Rhymney valley. Those will all become part of the budget that we will be discussing when it is put before us.

We have delivered on our commitment for a £100 million crime-fighting fund and we will

deddfu i gynyddu cyfradd taliadau grant dysgu'r Cynulliad, y lwfans cynhaliaeth addysg a'r cynllun cymhelliant hyfforddi athrawon.

Maes arall yr ydym yn rhoi blaenoriaeth uwch iddo ac a ddaw ger bron y Cynulliad yw'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Ni chaiff y rhaglen hon, sy'n rhan o'n ymdrech i gyflawni ein hymrwymiad cyffredinol i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, sylw digonol ar hyn o bryd.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr ydym yn clywed am eich rhaglen a disgrifiad o'ch perfformiad fel Llywodraeth; yr oeddwn ar ddeall y byddem yn cynnal dadl ar fusnes y Cynulliad ar gyfer y chwe mis nesaf. Yr oeddwn yn gobeithio y gallech ddweud wrthym sut y gallwn lenwi'r strwythur hwnnw mewn ffordd a fyddai'n ennyn diddordeb y boblogaeth. Yr ydych ond yn rhoi cyfres o'r hyn a elwir yn gyflawniadau gennych a'ch maniffesto nesaf; nid ydych yn ymdrin â'r mater ger ein bron o gwbl.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r hyn a ddarllenais yn cyfeirio, i raddau helaeth, at faterion a ddaw ger bron y Cynulliad yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf. Os darllenwch y Cofnod yfory, fe welwch, credaf, nad oes sail i'ch sylw.

Yr ydym eisoes wedi cyllidebu er mwyn cyflawni pob un o'n hymrwymyiadau o ran buddsoddiad cyfalaf mewn ysgolion ac ysbytai ond bydd darpariaeth bellach yn y gyllideb yn y dadleuon dros gyllideb eleni i sicrhau y gallwn barhau â'r rhaglen.

Bydd pobl wedi gweld ysbyty cymuned y Rhondda yn dechrau codi, ac ysbyty Porthmadog yn dod yn adeilad, er nad yw wedi agor eto. Bydd pobl mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru am wybod pryd y byddant yn gweld ysbyty cymuned Blaenau Gwent ac ysbyty cymuned Treffynnon, yr ymrwymwyd iddo bellach, a'r ysbyty mwy yng nghwm Rhymni. Byddant oll yn dod yn rhan o'r gyllideb y byddwn yn ei thrafod pan gaiff ei chyflwyno ger ein bron.

Yr ydym wedi cyflawni ein hymrwymiad i gronfa ymladd troseddau gwerth £100 miliwn

bring forward legislative proposals to further increase the safety of our communities.

‘Wales: A Better Country’ took the manifesto pledges forward into the context of a strategy for achieving more and better jobs, better health and stronger communities. In the context of better jobs, we will bring forward a statement on the administration’s science policy proposals. However, it would be a bit strange to have two debates on science policy: one to respond to the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee report and one coming from the administration. Therefore, with Christine Gwyther, the Chair of the Enterprise, Innovation and Networks Committee, we need to work on how to have that single science policy discussion and statement.

In addition, the international sustainable development framework to implement Wales’s contribution to millennium development goals will be brought before the Assembly.

Legislation will be brought forward on banning smoking in public places. It is a unique piece of legislation in that it has been brought forward on an all-party, non-party, unwhipped basis across the Assembly. We hope to see its implementation on 2 April. The administration strongly supports this measure. Although it has this unique cross-party character, it is essentially part of a public health, preventative programme.

There will, furthermore, be aspects that—and this is in response to Glyn Davies’s complaint, in a way—will not form part of a legislative or a budget programme but which are bound to be of interest. The new Objective 1 programme, now called convergence, will come to the Assembly in some shape or form because we have to consult the Assembly here, as well as stakeholders outside. We also have to find a method of ensuring that the major initiatives in terms of the roll-out of the innovative early years programme, the Welsh baccalaureate and so forth, are brought forward here, because we are a Government with a purpose, a Government determined to complete our

a byddwn yn cyflwyno cynigion deddfwriaethol i wella diogelwch ein cymunedau ymhellach.

Rhoddodd ‘Cymru: Gwlad Well’ addewidion y manifesto mewn cyd-destun strategaeth i gyflawni mwy o swyddi a swyddi gwell, gwell iechyd a chymunedau cryfach. Yng nghyd-destun swyddi gwell, byddwn yn cyflwyno datganiad am gynigion y weinyddiaeth ar gyfer polisi gwyddoniaeth. Fodd bynnag, byddai braidd yn rhyfedd cynnal dwy ddadl ar bolisi gwyddoniaeth: un i ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ac un gan y weinyddiaeth. Felly, mae angen inni weithio gyda Christine Gwyther, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, i weld sut y gallwn gyflwyno un drafodaeth ac un datganiad ar bolisi gwyddoniaeth.

Yn ogystal, caiff y fframwaith datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol i weithredu cyfraniad Cymru i nodau datblygu’r mileniwm ei gyflwyno ger bron y Cynulliad.

Caiff deddfwriaeth ei chyflwyno ar wahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus. Mae’n ddarn unigryw o ddeddfwriaeth yn yr ystyr iddi gael ei chyflwyno ar sail pob plaid, amhleidiol, di-chwip ar draws y Cynulliad cyfan. Gobeithiwn ei gweithredu ar 2 Ebrill. Mae’r weinyddiaeth yn gadarn o blaid y mesur hwn. Er bod ganddo’r cymeriad trawsbleidiol unigryw hwn, mae’n rhan sylfaenol o raglen ataliol ym maes iechyd y cyhoedd.

At hynny, bydd yna agweddau—ac mae hyn mewn ymateb i gŵyn Glyn Davies, i raddau—na fyddant yn rhan o raglen ddeddfwriaethol neu gyllidebol ond a fydd o ddiddordeb amlwg. Daw’r rhaglen Amcan 1 newydd, a elwir bellach yn gydgyfeirio, ger bron y Cynulliad ar ryw ffurf gan fod yn rhaid inni ymgynghori â’r Cynulliad yn hyn o beth, yn ogystal â rhanddeiliaid allanol. Mae’n rhaid inni hefyd ddod o hyd i ffordd o sicrhau y caiff y mentrau pwysig mewn perthynas â chyflwyno rhaglen arloesol y blynyddoedd cynnar, bagloriaeth Cymru, ac ati, eu cyflwyno ger ein bron, gan fod gennym ddiben fel Llywodraeth, a’n bod yn Llywodraeth sy’n benderfynol o gwblhau ein

programme of making Wales a better country and a Government committed to delivering on the trust that was given to us when we were elected in 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on WAG's proposals for the Welsh language and the Welsh Language Board in relation to the Government of Wales Act 1998.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on secondary care reviews throughout Wales.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the ambulance service review.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on Welsh Labour's manifesto commitment of free personal care for the disabled.*

I propose amendment 5. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on Welsh Labour's manifesto commitment of free school breakfasts for every child in Wales.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the impact of council tax increases over the past eight years on taxpayers in Wales, especially the vulnerable and those on benefits.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the*

rhaglen o wneud Cymru yn wlad well ac yn Llywodraeth sy'n ymrwymedig i ymateb i'r ymddiriedaeth a roddwyd inni pan gawsom ein hethol yn 2003.

**Nick Bourne:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar gynigion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran yr iaith Gymraeg a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yng nghyswllt Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr adolygiadau o ofal eilaidd ledled Cymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans.*

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto Llafur Cymru i ddarparu gofal personol rhad ac am ddim i bobl anabl.*

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar yr ymrwymiad ym maniffesto Llafur Cymru i ddarparu brecwast ysgol rhad ac am ddim i bob plentyn yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar effaith codiadau yn y dreth gyngor dros yr wyth mlynedd diweddf ar drethdalwyr yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y bobl sy'n agored i niwed a'r rhai sy'n derbyn budd-daliadau.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar*

*Welsh Assembly Government's budget for communications and media relations.*

*gyllideb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cyfathrebu a chysylltiadau â'r cyfryngau.*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls for a debate in Government time on the withdrawal of Tir Mynydd payments.*

*yn galw am ddadl yn amser y Llywodraeth ar ddiddymu taliadau Tir Mynydd.*

An awful lot of that contribution seemed to relate, as Glyn Davies has already indicated, to the Labour Party manifesto for the next Assembly election and to an attempt at a justification for what has happened over the last seven to eight years, rather than looking at the forward work programme; I will try to concentrate on that.

Yr oedd a wnelo rhan helaeth o'r cyfraniad hwnnw, fel y nododd Glyn Davies eisoes, â maniffesto'r Plaid Lafur ar gyfer etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad ac ag ymgais i gyfiawnhau'r hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ystod y saith neu wyth mlynedd diwethaf, yn hytrach nag ystyried y blaenraglen waith; ceisiaf ganolbwyntio ar honno.

The First Minister started off in a disarming way by congratulating the opposition parties for ensuring that this debate takes place. I thank him for that. I will try not to be totally disarmed in responding. Naturally, we welcome some of the debates in the forward work programme; it would be unusual if we did not. For example, the debates on road safety and safeguarding vulnerable children are worthwhile and we are glad to see these and some others. There is no doubt that there are many worthwhile issues in the forward work programme. However, with debating time in the Chamber precious, it is regrettable and frustrating that the Government has sought to fill the forward work programme with predominantly non-contentious issues that are likely to result in a predictable consensus. It is things like this that get the Assembly into the disrepute in which it is held by many people. We are seen as too much of a talking shop. There are many issues where we can genuinely engage, where there are differences of opinion and where we can avoid some of the stagnation that I am afraid will result from some of the forward work programme that has been put in front of us.

Dechreuodd y Prif Weinidog mewn ffordd ddengar drwy longyfarch y gwrthbleidiau am sicrhau bod y ddadl hon yn mynd rhagddi. Diolchaf iddo am hynny. Byddaf yn ceisio peidio â chael fy swyno'n llwyr wrth ymateb. Yn naturiol, croesawn rai o'r dadleuon yn y flaenraglen waith; byddai'n anarferol pe na fyddem. Er enghraifft, mae'r dadleuon ar ddiogelwch ar y ffyrdd a diogelu plant diamddiffyn yn werthfawr ac yr ydym yn falch o weld y rhain a rhai eraill. Nid oes amheuaeth bod llawer o faterion gwerthfawr yn y flaenraglen waith. Fodd bynnag, gan fod amser trafod yn y Siambr yn brin, mae'n anffodus ac yn rhwystredig bod y Llywodraeth wedi ceisio llenwi'r flaenraglen waith â materion annadleuol yn bennaf sy'n debygol o arwain at gonsensws rhagweladwy. Pethau fel hyn sy'n rhoi enw drwg i'r Cynulliad, a ategir gan lawer o bobl. Fe'n hystyriar ormod fel siop siarad. Mae llawer o faterion lle y gallwn ymgysylltu'n wirioneddol, lle bo gwahaniaeth barn a lle y gallwn osgoi rhywfaint o'r marweidd-dra a fydd yn deillio, yn fy marn i, o rannau o'r flaenraglen waith a gyflwynwyd ger ein bron.

The First Minister complained about the number of amendments from the opposition parties—I think that only two opposition parties have tabled amendments to this debate, so it is ironic to hear him complain about Plaid Cymru's amendments. There are none for this particular debate. However,

Cwynodd y Prif Weinidog am nifer y gwelliannau gan y gwrthbleidiau—credaf mai dim ond dwy wrthblaid sydd wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r ddadl hon, felly mae'n eironig ei glywed yn cwyno am welliannau Plaid Cymru. Nid oes unrhyw rai ar gyfer y ddadl benodol hon. Fodd bynnag, byddai llai



there would be fewer amendments if the timetable was more acceptable. The amendments are separated because there are different issues and people may feel that they can support some but not others. That is the reason that we have so many amendments. Let us deal with that straight away.

I am afraid that we have a tired Government, which, after about seven years and a string of broken promises—and even the First Minister referred to one of them, but there are many others; waiting lists are, perhaps, predominant among them—is unsurprisingly not going for eight months of intense activity. We have the prospect of seven or eight months of stagnation before the Assembly elections in May next year. From reading the programme, you could be forgiven for wondering if Labour Assembly Members really want to talk about some of the issues that are vitally important: the hospital reconfiguration, on which we are asking for a debate; council tax rises, which have affected so many communities; the withdrawal of Tir Mynydd payments from farmers; the need to debate the Welsh language. I am sure that it will be said that the opposition parties have debates for these issues at their disposal and, of course, we will use those for things that you would rather keep off the agenda, but it would be refreshing, on occasion, if the Assembly Government would grasp the nettle and put some of these issues on the agenda; we would give you credit for that. There are nine committee debates scheduled, which means that the Government can avoid scrutiny on many of these key issues by putting these down for debate rather than some of the things that really matter to people the length and breadth of Wales. We know that they matter to people from going around and speaking to constituents and people up and down Wales.

Since the First Minister mentioned some of the highlights—at least he tried to project them as highlights—of the Labour Party's achievements over eight years, let me remind him that on some of the issues that he touched upon, such as top-up fees, it was the opposition parties which ensured that top-up fees would not affect Welsh students at Welsh universities. That was absolutely

o welliannau pe bai'r amserlen yn fwy derbyniol. Mae'r gwelliannau ar wahân oherwydd bod materion gwahanol a gallai pobl deimlo y gallant gefnogi rhai ond nid rhai eraill. Dyna'r rheswm bod gennym gymaint o welliannau. Gadewch i ni ymdrin â hynny ar unwaith.

Yn anffodus, mae gennym Lywodraeth flinedig, nad ydyw, ar ôl tua saith mlynedd a llu o addewidion nas gwirededwyd—a chyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog hyd yn oed at un ohonynt, ond mae llawer o rai eraill; mae rhestrau aros, efallai, yn amlwg yn eu plith—yn bwriadu gweithredu'n ddwys am wyth mis, ac nid yw hyn yn syndod. Yr ydym yn wynebu'r posibilrwydd o saith neu wyth mis o farweidd-dra cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad fis Mai nesaf. O ddarllen y rhaglen, gellid maddau i chi am feddwl a yw Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad am drafod rhai o'r materion sy'n hollbwysig, mewn gwirionedd: ailgyflunio ysbytai, sef mater yr ydym yn gofyn am i ddadl gael ei chynnal yn ei gylch; cynnydd mewn treth gyngor, sydd wedi effeithio ar gymaint o gymunedau; diddymu taliadau Tir Mynydd i ffermwyr; yr angen i drafod yr iaith Gymraeg. Yr wyf yn siŵr yr honnir bod gan y gwrthbleidiau ddadleuon am y materion hyn at eu defnydd ac, wrth gwrs, byddwn yn defnyddio'r rheini ar gyfer pethau y byddai'n well gennyh beidio â'u cynnwys ar yr agenda, ond byddai'n braf, ar adegau, pe byddai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mentro ac yn cynnwys rhai o'r materion hyn ar yr agenda; byddem yn eich canmol am hynny. Mae naw dadl pwyllgor wedi eu trefnu, sy'n golygu y gall y Llywodraeth osgoi craffu o safbwynt llawer o'r materion allweddol drwy gynnal dadleuon arnynt yn hytrach na rhai o'r pethau sy'n wirioneddol bwysig i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru. Gwyddom eu bod yn bwysig i bobl yn sgîl mynd o amgylch a siarad ag etholwyr a phobl ledled Cymru.

Gan fod y Prif Weinidog wedi sôn am rai o uchafbwyntiau—o leiaf ceisiodd eu cyfleu fel uchafbwyntiau—cyflawniadau'r Blaid Lafur dros wyth mlynedd, gadewch imi ei atgoffa o ran rhai o'r materion y soniodd amdanynt, megis ffioedd atodol, mai'r gwrthbleidiau a sicrhaodd na fyddai ffioedd atodol yn effeithio ar fyfyrwyr o Gymru mewn prifysgolion yng Nghymru. Nid oedd a wnelo

nothing to do with the Government; it had to be dragged kicking and screaming. It was a vote upon which it was defeated, as the Record will demonstrate.

**David Davies:** Does the leader of the Welsh Conservatives agree that the way that this Government is going, it will soon claim credit for the review of the ambulance service, which we only managed to get because one of them could not work out which was the 'yes' button and which was the 'no' button on his computer?

**Nick Bourne:** We have every reason to be grateful to one of their number for that particular review.

**Alun Cairns:** And Jane Hutt.

**Nick Bourne:** And Jane Hutt. It will only be a matter of time before they are all claiming credit for that.

We recall some of the improvements to the budget as a result of action by the opposition parties. We recall the vote on walk-in health centres, which Labour ultimately supported, but which went against what they had said previously. These are things that have become Assembly policy as a result of concerted action by the opposition parties not by the Government. Therefore, let us have a bit more activity in these last few months. It will raise the profile of the Assembly, it will make people more likely to vote, and it will mean that people will see that we are engaging on the issues that matter to people up and down Wales. That would be the prize that we would have if there was a genuinely exciting, dynamic programme for Government. However, I am afraid that that does not exist here.

3.50 p.m.

As we go into the last few months before the Assembly elections, we know that we have tired leaders at Westminster and Cardiff. We do not hear much these days about the dynamic partnership between Blair in London and Morgan in Wales; I wonder why.

hynny ddim â'r Llywodraeth; yr oedd yn rhaid ei gorfodi i gytuno. Aeth hyn i bleidlais lle y cafodd ei threchi, fel y bydd y Cofnod yn ei ddangos.

**David Davies:** A yw arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cytuno, o ystyried y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth hon yn ymddwyn ar hyn o bryd, y bydd yn honni yn fuan mai iddi hi y mae'r diolch am adolygu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans, y bu inni ond llwyddo i'w sicrhau am na allai un ohonynt weithio allan pa un oedd y botwm 'ie' a pha un oedd y botwm 'na' ar ei gyfrifiadur?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae gennym bob rheswm dros fod yn ddiolchgar i un o'u plith am yr adolygiad penodol hwnnw.

**Alun Cairns:** A Jane Hutt.

**Nick Bourne:** A Jane Hutt. Mater o amser fydd hi nes byddant oll yn honni mai iddynt hwy y mae'r diolch am hynny.

Cofiw'n rai o'r gwelliannau i'r gyllideb o ganlyniad i gamau gweithredu gan y gwrthbleidiau. Cofiw'n y bleidlais ar ganolfannau iechyd galw i mewn, a gefnogwyd yn y pen draw gan Lafur, ond a aeth yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedodd yn flaenorol. Mae'r rhain yn bethau sydd wedi dod yn rhan o bolisi'r Cynulliad o ganlyniad i gamau gweithredu cydunol gan y gwrthbleidiau nid gan y Llywodraeth. Felly, gadewch i ni gael ychydig mwy o weithgarwch yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd olaf hyn. Bydd yn codi proffil y Cynulliad, bydd yn gwneud pobl yn fwy tebygol o bleidleisio, a bydd yn golygu y bydd pobl yn gweld ein bod yn ymgysylltu ar y materion sy'n bwysig i bobl ar hyd a lled Cymru. Dyna fyddai'r wob'r y byddem yn ei chael pe bai rhaglen gwirioneddol ddeinamig a chyffrous ar gael gan y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n bodoli yma, yn anffodus.

Wrth inni agosáu at yr ychydig fisoedd olaf cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad, gwyddom fod gennym arweinwyr blinedig yn San Steffan a Chaerdydd. Ni chlywn lawer y dyddiau hyn am y bartneriaeth ddeinamig rhwng Blair yn Llundain a Morgan yng Nghymru; tybed

So, bring on the election that the First Minister was hinting at—he offered sneak previews of the manifesto—but, in the meantime, let us have a more exciting, dynamic timetable for what remains of this Assembly term.

**Michael German:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 9: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to ensure the reduction of all primary school class sizes to 25."*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce free homecare for disabled people.*

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce a 500m buffer zone for opencast mining sites.*

I propose amendment 12. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls for legislation to be brought forward to introduce a modern foreign language at key stages 1 and 2.*

I propose amendment 13. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward a draft green jobs strategy for debate in the Chamber.*

I propose amendment 14. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring forward, for debate in the Chamber, proposals to re-establish the music development fund.*

I propose amendment 15. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Assembly Government to bring*

pam. Felly, croesawaf yr etholiad yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn ei awgrymu—cynigiodd gip ymlaen llaw o'r maniffesto—ond, yn y cyfamser, gadewch inni gael amserlen fwy cyffrous a deinamig ar gyfer yr hyn sy'n weddill o dymor y Cynulliad hwn.

**Michael German:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i sicrhau bod maint pob dosbarth ysgol gynradd yn cael ei ostwng i 25 o blant.*

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno gofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl.*

Cynigiau welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno clustogfa 500m ar gyfer safleoedd glo brig.*

Cynigiau welliant 12. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw am gyflwyno deddfwriaeth i gyflwyno iaith dramor fodern yng nghyfnod allweddol 1 a 2.*

Cynigiau welliant 13. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd ddrafft ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr.*

Cynigiau welliant 14. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno, ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr, gynigion i ailsefydlu'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth.*

Cynigiau welliant 15. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i*

*forward, for debate in the Chamber, proposals to re-establish the post office development fund.*

As you know, First Minister, I respect the fact that you have come forward with this statement. It is important that we called for what will essentially be a Welsh Queen's Speech. You are right to say that this may be a practice that we would want to see transformed into the new Assembly, although not quite in its present form. It would be an annual address at the start of each Assembly year, setting out the Government's programme. We think that this body should set out its stall for the year in terms of what it will do and not just what it can do, to use a phrase that we have heard little of today. When the First Minister responds, could he offer some insight as to the nature of that statement in terms of how it should occur? I do not quite see Rhodri sat here in ermine, giving his views from the throne on someone else's statement. I do not think that it should be quite like that, but there should certainly be a reflection of what is to come and what we have before us in a given year. Therefore, we welcome this first stab at getting that right. I am glad that you have belatedly adopted the idea.

Secondly, you questioned the amendments. Clearly, when you have a statement that is free of many of the issues that concern the people of Wales, it is right that there should be a series of amendments about debates that should take place. That is why my party and the Conservative Party have tabled a series of amendments that we seek to put in place. The amendments issue may have more resonance in this coming term in light of the fact that this programme is, to some extent, legislative-lite. Legislatively, we will not make as much progress as we could. This Assembly has had least practice in making amendments to legislation and that, perhaps, is where it requires the most practice.

We welcome some aspects of your programme. For example, we welcome the further new functions to be delegated to the

*gyflwyno, ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr, gynigion i ailsefydlu cronfa datblygu swyddfa'r post.*

Fel y gwyddoch, Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn parhau'r ffaith i chi gyflwyno'r datganiad hwn. Mae'n bwysig ein bod wedi galw am yr hyn a fydd, yn ei hanfod, yn Araith Gymreig y Frenhines. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth ddweud y gallai hwn fod yn arfer y byddem am ei weld yn cael ei drawsnewid i'r Cynulliad newydd, er nad ar ei ffurf bresennol. Byddai'n anerchiad blynyddol ar ddechrau pob blwyddyn y Cynulliad, yn nodi rhaglen y Llywodraeth. Credwn y dylai'r corff hwn fod yn eglur o ran yr hyn y bydd yn ei wneud yn ystod y flwyddyn ac nid dim ond yr hyn y gall ei wneud, i ddefnyddio ymadrodd na chlywsom lawer ohono heddiw. Pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymateb, a allai gynnig cipolwg ar natur y datganiad hwnnw o ran sut y dylai ddigwydd? Ni allaf weld Rhodri rywsut yn eistedd yma mewn ermin, yn cyflwyno ei safbwyntiau o'r orsedd ar ddatganiad rhywun arall. Ni chredaf y dylai fod felly, ond dylid adlewyrchu'r hyn sydd i ddod yn bendant a'r hyn sydd ger ein bron yn ystod blwyddyn benodol. Felly, croesawn yr ymgais gyntaf hon i sicrhau hynny. Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi mabwysiadu'r syniad er mor hwyr yn y dydd.

Yn ail, bu ichi gwestiynu'r gwelliannau. Yn amlwg, gyda datganiad nad yw'n cynnwys llawer o'r materion sy'n bwysig i bobl Cymru, mae'n briodol cael cyfres o welliannau ynghylch dadleuon a ddylai gael eu cynnal. Dyna pam mae fy mhlaid i a'r Blaid Geidwadol wedi cofnodi cyfres o welliannau y ceisiwn eu rhoi ar waith. Mae'n bosibl y bydd y mater yn ymwneud â gwelliannau yn fwy perthnasol yn ystod y tymor sydd i ddod yng ngoleuni'r ffaith bod y rhaglen hon, i ryw raddau, yn un nad yw'n cynnwys llawer o ddeddfwriaeth. Yn ddeddfwriaethol, ni fyddwn yn gwneud cymaint o gynnydd ag y gallem. Y Cynulliad hwn sydd leiaf profiadol yn y gwaith o wneud gwelliannau i ddeddfwriaeth a dyna lle y mae angen iddo fod ar ei fwyaf profiadol, efallai.

Croesawn rai agweddau ar eich rhaglen. Er enghraifft, croesawn y swyddogaethau newydd pellach i'w dirprwyo i'r Cynulliad,

Assembly, in particular, functions under the Mental Capacity Act 2005, which will hopefully give the Assembly further scope to improve mental health services and to protect and support vulnerable people. We welcome the time scheduled for opposition and backbench Members. It is important that there is sufficient scope to scrutinise the Assembly Government and to hold it accountable.

We also welcome many other legislative proposals. In particular, we welcome those that give effect to the recommendations of the Clywch report for children in educational settings, as well as legislation for tougher nutritional standards for school meals and for banning smoking in public places, although it has taken what seems to be a considerable time since the Assembly first voted to ban smoking for this legislation to come before us. Despite that, I welcome the fact that it will finally happen with all-party agreement before our elections, because banning smoking in public places will make a huge difference in terms of combating ill-health and enabling people to live healthier lives.

However, how much of this legislation before us is a repetition of what has already been introduced in England, with some full stops and commas altered? That is part of the problem encountered today—we are seeing the reflection of a large amount of secondary legislation that has already been introduced elsewhere.

Some things are missing from this programme. That is where we should concentrate our minds today. If this were a response to a Queen's Speech, laying out a programme for Government, then we would respond by saying what was missing from it. My colleague, Kirsty, will discuss these further, but some things need to be included in this programme before the elections.

We have fought, throughout this second Assembly, for a maximum primary school class size of 25 pupils rather than 30, as per the commitment of the previous partnership Government. Smaller class sizes help

yn arbennig, swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Galluedd Meddyliol 2005, a fydd yn rhoi rhagor o gyfle i'r Cynulliad wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl a diogelu a chefnogi pobl ddiameddiffyn, gobeithio. Croesawn yr amser a drefnwyd ar gyfer Aelodau o'r gwrthbleidiau a'r meinciau cefn. Mae'n bwysig bod digon o gyfle i graffu ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'i dwyn i gyfrif.

Croesawn hefyd lawer o gynigion deddfwriaethol eraill. Yn arbennig, croesawn y rhai sy'n gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad Clywch i blant mewn lleoliadau addysgol, yn ogystal â deddfwriaeth ar gyfer safonau maeth llymach o ran prydu ysgol ac ar gyfer gwahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus, er ei bod wedi cymryd cryn amser, yn ôl pob golwg, ers i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio gyntaf i wahardd ysmegu, i'r ddeddfwriaeth hon ddod ger ein bron. Er hynny, croesawaf y ffaith y bydd yn digwydd o'r diwedd gyda chytundeb hollbleidiol cyn ein hetholiadau, oherwydd y bydd gwahardd ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr o ran trechu salwch a galluogi pobl i fyw bywydau iachach.

Fodd bynnag, i ba raddau y mae'r ddeddfwriaeth ger ein bron yn ailadrodd yr hyn a gyflwynwyd eisoes yn Lloegr, gyda rhai atalnodau ac atalnodau llawn wedi'u newid? Mae hynny yn rhan o'r broblem a wynebhir heddiw—yr ydym yn gweld adlewyrchiad o gyfran fawr o is-ddeddfwriaeth a gyflwynwyd eisoes yn Lloegr.

Mae rhai pethau ar goll o'r rhaglen hon. Dyma'r pethau y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio arnynt heddiw. Pe bai hwn yn ymateb i Araith y Frenhines, yn nodi rhaglen ar gyfer y Llywodraeth, yna byddem yn ymateb drwy ddweud beth oedd ar goll ohoni. Bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Kirsty, yn trafod y rhain ymhellach, ond mae angen cynnwys rhai pethau yn y rhaglen hon cyn yr etholiadau.

Yr ydym wedi brwydro, drwy gydol yr ail Gynulliad hwn, am ddsbarthiadau mewn ysgolion cynradd o ddim mwy na 25 o ddisgyblion yn hytrach na 30, yn unol ag ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth

children to learn better by giving teachers more scope for providing individual attention. We would have liked to have debated that and to have been given an opportunity to vote on it, although I recognise that it may be the same as with many proposals, where the Government feels threatened as it might lose.

We want the Assembly Government to bring forward for debate in the Chamber proposals to re-establish the music development fund, which is the money allocated to directly develop music in Wales. This comes on the back of a research project announced today from the McMaster University in Canada, where it has been proven that memory and general intelligence skills, such as literacy and maths, are helped by music learning. The basics of the foundation were set when Alun Michael gave the fund a boost. The fund has now lost its boost and has been downgraded, whereas in England it has been upgraded. Some 60,000 young people from all communities and backgrounds across Wales have accessed music as a result of the fund. I believe that it was a mistake to downgrade the fund. We should have a debate on that matter.

I also believe that we should have a debate on Tir Mynydd. This is a problem for the countryside in Wales. We have a different agricultural and rural structure in Wales. Tir Mynydd is a basic requirement for supporting the Welsh family farm. It will directly hamper the future of our countryside in Wales and it ought to be improved.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You need to wind up.

**Michael German:** I will wind up with this remark, Deputy Presiding Officer. What we have is a programme intended to keep this last period dull. It is far from lighting up the sky, which is what we should have had for this last programme. We have something that is not necessarily going to give the people of Wales the confidence that the National Assembly can do its best.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Thank you, Deputy

flaenorol. Mae dosbarthiadau llai o faint yn helpu plant i ddysgu'n well drwy roi mwy o gyfle i athrawon roi mwy o sylw unigol. Byddem wedi hoffi cynnal dadl ar hynny a chael y cyfle i gynnal pleidlais arno, er y cydnabyddaf y gallai fod yr un mor wir ar gyfer llawer o gynigion, lle y teimla'r Llywodraeth dan fygythiad o golli.

Yr ydym am i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gyflwyno ar gyfer dadl yn y Siambr gynigion i ailsefydlu'r gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth, sef yr arian a ddyrennir i ddatblygu cerddoriaeth yn uniongyrchol yng Nghymru. Daw hyn yn sgil prosiect ymchwil a gyhoeddwyd heddiw o Brifysgol McMaster yn Canada, lle y profwyd bod dysgu cerddoriaeth yn helpu'r cof a sgiliau deallusrwydd cyffredinol, megis llythrennedd a mathemateg. Gosodwyd y sylfaen pan hybodd Alun Michael y gronfa. Mae'r gronfa wedi colli ei hwb erbyn hyn ac mae wedi cael ei hisraddio, tra y cafodd ei huwchraddio yn Lloegr. Mae rhyw 60,000 o bobl ifanc o bob cymuned a chefnidir ledled Cymru wedi profi cerddoriaeth o ganlyniad i'r gronfa. Credaf mai camgymeriad oedd ei hisraddio. Dylem gynnal dadl ar y mater hwnnw.

Credaf hefyd y dylem gynnal dadl ar Tir Mynydd. Mae hyn yn broblem i gefn gwlad Cymru. Mae gennym strwythur amaethyddol a gwledig gwahanol yng Nghymru. Mae Tir Mynydd yn ofyniad sylfaenol ar gyfer cefnogi ffermydd teuluoedd yng Nghymru. Bydd yn rhwystro dyfodol ein cefn gwlad yng Nghymru yn uniongyrchol a dylid gwella hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben.

**Michael German:** Gorffennaf gyda'r sylw hwn, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Yr hyn sydd gennym yw rhaglen sydd â'r nod o gadw'r cyfnod olaf hwn yn ddistaw. Nid yw'n ysgogi cyffro o bell ffordd, sef yr hyn a ddylai fod wedi digwydd ar gyfer y rhaglen olaf hon. Mae gennym rywbeth nad ydyw, o reidrwydd, yn mynd i beri i bobl Cymru deimlo'n hyderus y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wneud ei orau.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd,

Presiding Officer, for giving me the opportunity to contribute to this debate on the Government's plans for the coming months. I am sure that it will be useful for those inside and outside the Assembly to see exactly what their Government intends to do.

I listened carefully to the First Minister's speech, but I do not feel that the programme before us is an exotic diet, although I am a little surprised that the Government is not using the time that it has left to make up for the targets, promises and pledges that it has failed to meet. I can see plenty of time in the programme for Labour to set reduced targets—you can lower expectations and generally keep your heads down before the next manifesto of gimmicks and spin. Please do not forget the very small print this time, because I have no doubt that there will be much of that attached to your most eye-catching initiatives, such as no tuition fees while the opposition can outvote you, and free breakfasts for those lucky enough to attend schools—[*Interruption.*]

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. I deprecate sedentary remarks.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Is the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills making an intervention or not?

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I am pleased to make an intervention. I reaffirm that it was in the Labour Party's manifesto for the last Assembly elections that we would rule out top-up fees for the whole of the period of this Assembly Government. We have delivered on that promise.

**Jocelyn Davies:** I repeat the point about the small print: no tuition fees while the opposition can outvote you; free breakfast for those who are lucky enough to attend schools wanting to provide them; free prescriptions just in time for the next elections; near full employment as long as you do not count everyone who wants to work; and, of course, those elastic health targets and access to an NHS dentist if you are really lucky. If all else fails, of course, you can always blame the Tories. The small print can be important—

am roi'r cyfle imi gyfrannu at y ddatl hon ar gynlluniau'r Llywodraeth ar gyfer y misoedd nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn ddefnyddiol i'r rheini y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Cynulliad weld yn union beth mae eu Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ei wneud.

Gwrandewais yn astud ar araith y Prif Weinidog, ond nid yw'r rhaglen sydd ger ein bron yn gymysgedd egsotig, yn fy marn i, er fy mod yn rhyfeddu ychydig nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn defnyddio'r amser sydd ganddi ar ôl i wneud iawn am y targedau, yr addewidion a'r llwion y mae wedi methu â'u cyflawni. Gallaf weld digon o amser yn y rhaglen i Lafur bennu targedau is—gallwch leihau disgwyliadau a chadw'ch pen i lawr, yn gyffredinol, cyn y maniffesto nesaf o gimigau a sbin. Cofiwch am y print mân iawn y tro hwn, oherwydd credaf y bydd llawer ohono yn gysylltiedig â'ch mentrau mwyaf deniadol, megis dim ffioedd atodol tra y gall pleidlais y gwrthbleidiau eich trechu, a brecwast am ddim ar gyfer y bobl hynny sy'n ddigon lwcus i fynychu ysgolion—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Anghymeradwyaf sylwadau eisteddog.

**Jocelyn Davies:** A yw'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn gwneud ymyrraeth ai peidio?

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Yr wyf yn falch o ymyrryd. Cadarnhaf fod maniffesto'r Blaid Lafur ar gyfer etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad yn sôn am y ffaith y byddem yn diystyru ffioedd atodol ar gyfer cyfnod cyfan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi cyflawni'r addewid honno.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Ailadroddaf y pwynt am y print mân: dim ffioedd atodol tra y gall pleidlais y gwrthbleidiau eich trechu; brecwast am ddim i'r rhai sy'n ddigon lwcus i fynychu ysgolion sy'n awyddus i'w darparu; presgripsiynau am ddim mewn pryd i'r etholiadau nesaf; cyflogaeth lawn, bron iawn, ar yr amod nad ydych yn cyfrif yr holl bobl hynny sy'n awyddus i weithio; ac, wrth gwrs, y targedau iechyd hyblyg hynny a mynediad i ddeintydd y GIG os ydych yn wirioneddol lwcus. A metho popeth arall,

nearly as important, in fact, as the targets and promises themselves. Would we not all like to see a Government debate on that topic?

I am a bit surprised that the First Minister welcomed this debate, because we all know that the Business Minister rejected a request for periodic debates on the forward work programme, even though they used to be a regular feature in the Chamber, without any prompting from us. However, I cannot recall such a debate since the termination of the coalition Government, and I am not sure whether that is because you stopped forward planning, or because the Government took the view that its plans were none of our business. We are only having this debate because you were defeated on the business statement; let us make that clear. However, I am glad that you have come round to the idea that it is quite useful. I think that the Minister will see the benefit of being more open, but I do not think that it will prevent the Government from springing surprises from time to time.

4.00 p.m.

You can see that the Tory amendments relate to debates that they would like to have included in the programme. We all know that Lisa Francis is never short of ideas for debate topics. We would agree with most of them and we will continue to make our requests at the weekly Business Committee meetings as issues become topical, even if most of those requests are almost always initially rejected.

Kirsty Williams's amendments call for legislation on a whole range of topics. I am not sure whether they are all best achieved via legislative measures. The amendment on the 500m buffer zones for opencast sites is an interesting proposition. It is my understanding that the specification for buffer zones is to be decided in a ministerial technical advice note that does not come to this Chamber for approval. We have had two full committee debates on this very topic, in which the Liberal Democrats took no part, even though the Minister was officially

wrth gwrs, gallwch bob amser feio'r Torïaid. Gall y print mân fod yn bwysig—bron mor bwysig, mewn gwirionedd, â'r targedau a'r addewidion eu hunain. Oni fyddem ni oll am weld dadl Llywodraeth ar y pwnc hwnnw?

Yr wyf yn rhyfeddu ychydig at y ffaith bod y Prif Weinidog wedi croesawu'r ddadl hon, oherwydd fe wyddom ni oll i'r Trefnydd wrthod cais am ddadleuon cyfnodol ar y flaenraglen waith, er iddynt arfer fod yn nodwedd reolaidd yn y Siambr, a hynny heb unrhyw anogaeth gennym ni. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gofio dadl o'r fath ers i'r Llywodraeth glymblaid ddod i ben, ac nid wyf yn siŵr a yw hynny oherwydd i chi roi'r gorau i flaengynllunio, neu oherwydd bod y Llywodraeth o'r farn nad oedd a wnelo ei chynlluniau ddim â ni. Yr unig reswm yr ydym yn trafod hyn yw oherwydd fe'ch trechwyd ar y datganiad busnes; gadewch inni wneud hynny'n glir. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn cydweld ei fod yn syniad defnyddiol. Credaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweld budd natur fwy agored ond ni chredaf y bydd yn atal y Llywodraeth rhag ein syfrdanu o bryd i'w gilydd.

Gallwch weld bod gwelliannau'r Torïaid yn ymwneud â dadleuon y byddent wedi hoffi eu cynnwys yn y rhaglen. Gwyddom oll nad yw Lisa Francis byth yn brin o syniadau am bynciau i ddadleuon. Byddem yn cytuno â'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt a byddwn yn parhau i gyflwyno'n ceisiadau yng nghyfarfodydd wythnosol y Pwyllgor Busnes wrth i bynciau ddod i'r amlwg, hyd yn oed os caiff rhan fwyaf y ceisiadau hynny eu gwrthod ar y dechrau fel arfer.

Geilw gwelliannau Kirsty Williams am ddeddfwriaeth ar ystod lawn o bynciau. Nid wyf yn siŵr pa un ai drwy gyfrwng mesurau deddfwriaethol y'u cyflawnir orau. Mae'r gwelliant ar y clustogfeydd o 500m ar gyfer safleoedd glo brig yn gynnig diddorol. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf i, nodyn cyngor technegol gweinidogol sy'n penderfynu ar y fanyleb ar gyfer clustogfeydd ac ni ddaw hwnnw i'r Siambr hon i'w gymeradwyo. Cawsom ddwy ddadl pwyllgor lawn ar y pwnc arbennig hwn ac ni chymerodd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ran ynddynt, er bod y



consulting the committee on its views and updating us on the progress of the public consultation. However, it is better late than never. I look forward to the vote on that particular amendment as we will be able to see which Members are consistent on this issue. All of these would be interesting debates, but I doubt that we will have them.

The First Minister criticises Plaid Cymru for tabling amendments and the Tories criticise us for not tabling amendments. You cannot please everyone, but the fact is that we did not table any amendments because these are the Government's intentions for the next few months and we could have tabled dozens of amendments. Therefore, we decided that we would not table any amendments. We have the option of just voting against the motion.

In recent times, the First Minister has been challenging the whole nation to raise its game, to become more confident and to be more ambitious in all that it does. I hope that he manages to get that message across to the Business Minister soon.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call any further speakers, there is a limit of five minutes. I will not impose a three-minute limit, as I cannot do so. We have six speakers. If they are all going to speak, I appeal for Members to make speeches lasting three or four minutes. If they make five-minute speeches, it will mean that some Members will not be able to get in. I intend to call a vote on this motion by 4.30 p.m. at the latest.

**Glyn Davies:** I welcome the fact of the statement; I see it as a basic structure for the debates that will be held in the Chamber over the next six months. However, in itself, it does not tell us a great deal; it does not answer the questions that I have about what we should be doing over the next six months. It depends on how we fill in that structure and the attitude of the Government in terms of genuinely bringing forward a real debate.

Gweinidog yn ymgynghori'n swyddogol â'r pwyllgor ar ei farn gan gyflwyno gwybodaeth inni ar y datblygiadau diweddaraf yn yr ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus. Fodd bynnag, gwell hwyr na hwyrach. Edrychaf ymlaen at y bleidlais ar y gwelliant arbennig hwnnw fel y gallwn weld pa Aelodau sy'n gyson ar y pwnc hwn. Byddai pob un o'r rhain yn ddadleuon diddorol ond mae'n amheus gennyf a gânt eu cynnal.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn beirniadu Plaid Cymru am gyflwyno gwelliannau ac mae'r Torïaid yn ein beirniadu am beidio â chyflwyno gwelliannau. Ni allwch blesio pawb ond y gwir amdani yw na fu inni gyflwyno gwelliannau oherwydd dyma'r hyn a fwriedir gan y Llywodraeth am yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf a gallem fod wedi cyflwyno dwsinau o welliannau. Felly, penderfynwyd na fyddem yn cyflwyno unrhyw welliannau. Mae'r dewis gennym o bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig.

Yn ddiweddar, mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi bod yn herio'r genedl gyfan i anelu'n uwch, i fod yn fwy hyderus ac i fod yn fwy uchelgeisiol ym mhopeth a wna. Gobeithio y llwydda i gyfleu'r neges honno i'r Trefnydd yn fuan.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar siaradwyr eraill, mae terfyn o bum munud. Ni fyddaf yn gorfodi terfyn o dair munud gan na allaf wneud hynny. Mae gennym chwe siaradwr. Os bydd pob un ohonynt yn siarad, yr wyf yn apelio ar yr Aelodau i areithio am dair neu bedair munud. Os gwnânt areithiau o bum munud, bydd yn golygu na fydd rhai Aelodau yn gallu cymryd rhan. Bwriadaf alw am bleidlais ar y cynnig hwn erbyn 4.30 p.m. ar yr hwyrach.

**Glyn Davies:** Croesawaf ffaith y datganiad; fe'i gwelaf fel fframwaith sylfaenol i'r dadleuon sydd i'w cynnal yn y Siambr dros y chwe mis nesaf. Fodd bynnag, ynddo'i hun, ni ddywed lawer wrthym; nid yw'n ateb y cwestiynau sydd gennyf ynghylch yr hyn y dylem fod yn ei wneud dros y chwe mis nesaf. Dibynna ar y modd y byddwn yn llenwi'r fframwaith hwnnw ac agwedd y Llywodraeth o ran cyflwyno dadleuon go iawn.

I see today's debate somewhat differently to the First Minister, who took my intervention to be a complaint. In this debate, I was rather hoping that we might meet the challenge of tackling the disengagement between Chamber activity and the general public, which we have to meet in the next six months.

There is no doubt that devolution has delivered a lot of positive things in Wales. The one area in which I think it has not delivered is that of engaging the public with what happens in this Chamber. I think that is mainly linked to the fact that a lot of the debate has been on issues on which, generally, we all tend to agree, rather than on those on which we disagree. I think that the Government has set out to try to avoid the latter, and that has been a major mistake. If we deal with issues, albeit important issues, on which we agree, the debate is not dynamic and it does not connect with the public in quite the same way.

I will only make two general points, due to the time constraint. First, I agree with the thrust of Mick's point at the beginning, namely the issue regarding what we debate. It is mainly frustration that has led to the amendments being proposed today because Members feel that tabling amendments is the only way of getting the Government to consider issues that the people of Wales want us to debate in the Chamber. The same thing happens with the business statement every week. I have always believed that it would be far better if the number of changes put forward by opposition parties were much smaller and more concentrated. Due to the Government's tendency to want to talk about issues that people agree are anodyne and do not connect, we find that opposition parties want to prompt you to bring forward the real issues that people wish to debate.

We need some innovation in what we do, and I address this to the Business Minister, in consultation with other people. Why can we not have a three-hour debate in the Chamber about the secondary care situation? We know that that is probably the most difficult issue that the Assembly faces; it is a huge issue and

Gwelaf ddadl heddiw mewn modd ychydig yn wahanol i'r Prif Weinidog a dybiodd mai cwyn oedd fy ymyriad. Yn y ddadl hon, fy ngobaith oedd y gallem wynebu'r her o fynd i'r afael â'r ymddieithrio a geir rhwng gweithgareddau'r Siambr a'r cyhoedd. Rhaid inni ddatrys hynny yn y chwe mis nesaf.

Nid oes amheuaeth bod datganoli wedi esgor ar lawer o bethau cadarnhaol yng Nghymru. Un maes lle nad yw wedi llwyddo yn fy marn i yw cysylltu'r cyhoedd â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Siambr hon. Credaf fod hynny'n bennaf gysylltiedig â'r ffaith bod llawer o'r dadleuon wedi'u cynnal ar faterion yr ydym, yn gyffredinol yn tueddu i gytuno arnynt, yn hytrach na'r rheini yr ydym yn anghytuno arnynt. Credaf fod y Llywodraeth wedi ceisio osgoi'r olaf ac mae hynny wedi bod yn gamgymeriad mawr. Os byddwn yn ymdrin â materion—materion pwysig yn ddi-au—y cytunwn arnynt, nid yw'r ddadl yn un ddeinamig ac nid yw'n cysylltu â'r cyhoedd yn yr un modd.

Gwnaf ddau bwynt cyffredinol yn unig, oherwydd y cyfyngiadau o ran amser. Yn gyntaf, cytunaf â byrdwn pwynt Mick ar y dechrau, sef pynciau ein dadleuon. Yn bennaf, rhwystredigaeth sydd wedi arwain at y gwelliannau a gynigiwyd heddiw oherwydd, ym marn yr Aelodau, cyflwyno gwelliannau yw'r unig ffordd o sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth yn ystyried materion y mae pobl Cymru am inni eu trafod yn y Siambr. Mae'r un peth yn digwydd gyda'r datganiad busnes bob wythnos. Yr wyf wedi credu erioed y byddai'n well o lawer pe byddai nifer y diwygiadau a gyflwynir gan y gwrthbleidiau yn llai ac yn fwy cryno. Oherwydd tuedd y Llywodraeth tuag at drafod materion sydd, ym marn pobl, yn faterion lliniarol, nad ydynt yn cysylltu â'r cyhoedd, gwelwn fod y gwrthbleidiau am eich ysgogi i gyflwyno'r materion gwirioneddol y mae pobl yn dymuno eu trafod.

Mae angen arloesedd arnom yn yr hyn a wnawn, a gofynnaf hyn i'r Trefnydd, mewn ymgynghoriad ag eraill. Pam na allwn gael dadl deirawr yn y Siambr ynghylch y sefyllfa gofal eilaidd? Gwyddom mai hwnnw yw'r pwnc anoddaf, yn ôl pob tebyg, a wynebir gan y Cynulliad; mae'n fater anferth a'r

it is causing the most controversy across Wales. All of us know, in our hearts, that no change is not really an option. We know that thousands of people are dying because we are not allocating the resources exactly as we should, and that is an important issue. If we had a three-hour debate, with Assembly Members being given 10 minutes to make speeches and to develop their points—something somewhat different—I think that we could make a real connection with people. It might be that we should even have an extra Plenary day. I have often thought that this is an area that we have not talked enough about. Going hand in hand with that would be the ability to make proper speeches. Dirprwy Lywydd, you were contemplating today whether we should cut the speeches from five to three minutes—you have often had to do that and I understand why—but that discourages Members from spending time on research to develop five-minute speeches. That is the sort of thing that we should be doing. We should be spending a lot of time on that and then circulate speeches that we are proud of and seek to get them published. However, if a speech is to be cut back at the last minute, that is a huge discouragement for people.

The second point that I want to make concerns the way in which the Chamber engages with the European Union. With Lorraine Barrett, I spent most of last week in the European Union, talking about various issues with some of the commission's directorate general staff. I must say that I was shocked—and this is a self-criticism as much as anything else—about the disconnection with what is happening in Europe. The discussions that we had truly amazed me, and one issue that I think is important for our committees and individual Members is how we can adjust what we do in order to strengthen the European and External Affairs Committee. It is not good enough to pass off everything to a European affairs committee so that issues do not engage quite the same public attention as they would in other committees. I am going to suggest, at the next committee meeting, that we should introduce a video link to the European Commission, perhaps as part of the meeting. I do not know whether Members would support that, but I think that we must find

mater mwyaf dadleuol yng Nghymru. Gwyddom oll, yn ein calonau, nad oes dewis ond newid y sefyllfa. Gwyddom fod miloedd yn marw oherwydd nad ydym yn dyrannu'r adnoddau yn union fel ag y dylem, ac mae hynny'n fater pwysig. Pe caem ddadl deirawr gyda 10 munud i bob Aelod Cynulliad gyflwyno araith a datblygu eu pwyntiau—rhywbeth ychydig yn wahanol—credaf y gallem ymgysylltu'n wirioneddol â phobl. Mae'n bosibl y dylem hyd yn oed gael Cyfarfod Llawn ychwanegol. Yr wyf yn aml wedi credu bod hwn yn faes nad ydym wedi'i drafod ddigon. Law yn llaw â hynny byddai'r gallu i wneud areithiau priodol. Ddirprwy Lywydd, yr oeddech yn ystyried heddiw pa un a ddylem dorri'r areithiau o bum munud i dair munud—yr ydych yn aml wedi gorfod gwneud hynny a deallaf paham—ond oherwydd hynny nid oes cymhelliant i Aelodau dreulio amser ar ymchwil i ddatblygu areithiau pum munud. Dylem fod yn gwneud y math yna o beth. Dylem fod yn treulio llawer o amser ar hynny ac yna dosbarthu'r areithiau yr ydym yn falch ohonynt a cheisio eu hargraffu. Fodd bynnag, nid oes fawr o gymhelliant i bobl os caiff araith ei thorri ar y funud olaf.

Mae'r ail bwynt yr wyf am ei wneud yn ymwneud â'r modd y mae'r Siambr yn cysylltu â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Gyda Lorraine Barrett, treuliais ran fwyaf yr wythnos diwethaf yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd yn trafod amryw bynciau gyda rhai o staff cyfarwyddiaeth gyffredinol y comisiwn. Rhaid imi ddweud imi gael braw—ac mae hyn yn hunanfeirniadaeth gymaint â dim—ynghylch yr anghysylltedd â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Ewrop. Fe'm syfrdanwyd gan y trafodaethau a gawsom ac un mater sy'n bwysig i'n pwyllgorau a'n Haelodau unigol yn fy marn i yw'r modd y gallwn addasu'r hyn a wnawn er mwyn cryfhau'r Pwyllgor Materion Ewropeaidd ac Allanol. Nid yw'n ddigon da i drosglwyddo popeth i bwyllgor materion Ewropeaidd fel na fydd cymaint o sylw'r cyhoedd yn cael ei ddenu i faterion fel y byddai'n wir am bwyllgorau eraill. Yr wyf am awgrymu, yng nghyfarfod nesaf y pwyllgor, y dylem gyflwyno cyswllt fideo â'r Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, efallai fel rhan o'r cyfarfod. Ni wn a fyddai Aelodau yn cefnogi hynny, ond credaf fod yn rhaid inni ddod o

innovative ways in which to make real contact with the European Union to bring forward complicated discussions to a forum that the public can engage with. That is the challenge for us over the next six months. We have all talked about raising our game, as individuals and as regards the civil service. We have to do that, and I think that we should use the next six months to trial ways in which we could do that far better when we come back after the next election.

**Janice Gregory:** Given the time constraints, I will be brief and address my comments to the issue of the post office development fund. On 15 March 2006, the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee received a PODF evaluation report from the Minister. That evaluation made a clear recommendation that no further Assembly Government funding should be made available until the UK Government and Post Office Ltd reach an agreement on the future direction and funding of the post office network. The Minister agreed to keep committee members updated and she reiterated that offer during the debate on the post office in June this year.

Would the Minister agree that to reintroduce the PODF before the UK Government has taken that decision would be premature and financially irresponsible? Some post offices in my constituency benefited from PODF and I was delighted to visit them and to speak to the owners. However, I know that many more will benefit from the Welsh Assembly Government's small business rate relief scheme, which was announced this week. All post offices across Wales that have a rateable value of £9,000 will receive 100 per cent relief and those with a rateable value of between £9,000 and £11,900 will receive 50 per cent relief. This small business rate relief scheme will make a difference to many small businesses in my constituency, but it will make a huge difference to post offices, which are vital community lifelines, especially those in the less prosperous areas of the Ogmores constituency—post offices such as the one that I helped to reopen on Monday morning in the Communities First village of Llangeinor. The new owners, Alan and Susan Jones, will benefit greatly from the rate relief

hyd i ffyrdd arloesol o gysylltu â'r Undeb Ewropeaidd i gyflwyno trafodaethau cymhleth i fforwm y gall y cyhoedd ymgysylltu ag ef. Dyna'r her inni dros y chwe mis nesaf. Yr ydym oll wedi sôn am anelu'n uwch, fel unigolion ac o ran y gwasanaeth sifil. Rhaid inni wneud hynny, a chredaf y dylem ddefnyddio'r chwe mis nesaf i dreialu ffyrdd y gallem wneud hynny'n well o lawer pan ddown yn ôl ar ôl yr etholiad nesaf.

**Janice Gregory:** Oherwydd y cyfyngiadau amser, byddaf yn gryno ac anelu fy sylwadau i gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Ar 15 Mawrth 2006, derbyniodd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio adroddiad gwerthuso cronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post gan y Gweinidog. Daeth argymhelliaid clir o'r gwerthusiad hwnnw na ddylid rhyddhau unrhyw arian pellach gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad hyd nes y bydd Llywodraeth y DU a Swyddfa'r Post Cyf yn cytuno ar ariannu a chyfeiriad rhwydwaith swyddfa'r post yn y dyfodol. Cytunodd y Gweinidog i gyfleu'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i aelodau'r pwyllgor ac ailadroddodd y cynnig hwnnw yn ystod y ddadl ar swyddfa'r post ym mis Mehefin eleni.

A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y byddai ailgyflwyno cronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post cyn i Lywodraeth y DU benderfynu ar hynny yn gynamserol ac yn ariannol anghyfrifol? Cafodd rhai swyddfeydd post yn fy etholaeth fudd o'r gronfa datblygu ac roedd yn bleser gennyf ymweld â hwy a siarad â'r perchnogion. Fodd bynnag, gwn y bydd llawer mwy yn cael budd o gynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes bach Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon. Bydd pob swyddfa'r post ar draws Cymru sydd â gwerth trethadwy o £9,000 yn derbyn rhyddhad o 100 y cant a bydd y rheini â gwerth trethadwy o rhwng £9,000 ac £11,900 yn derbyn rhyddhad o 50 y cant. Bydd y cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi busnes bach hwn yn gwneud gwahaniaeth i lawer o fusnesau bach yn fy etholaeth ond bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth aruthrol i swyddfeydd post, sy'n ddolenni cyswllt cymunedol hanfodol, yn enwedig y rheini yn ardaloedd llai ffyniannus etholaeth Ogwr—swyddfeydd post fel yr un y cynorthwyais i'w hagor fore Llun ym mhentref Cymunedau yn Gyntaf,

scheme, more so perhaps than they would have done under PODF.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Assembly Government reminds me of an athlete limping his way to the finishing tape after a long race. Already lapped by his competitors, the exhausted athlete looks ahead desperately to avoid any hurdles that might trip him up in the final back strait. Would it have been any different if Blaenau Gwent had gone the other way? I doubt it, because this is not a Government that lacks the courage of its convictions; it is just not particularly full of conviction in the first place.

4.10 p.m.

The number of students and pupils learning modern foreign languages is a matter of great concern for anyone who takes an interest in this issue. The Assembly could tackle this problem by introducing a modern foreign language at key stages 1 and 2; this could be done by using section 354 of the Education Act 1996. Increasing the number of people in Wales who are able to speak modern foreign languages can only help Wales's economic prospect in an ever-globalised world. We are losing manufacturing jobs like water through a sieve and we need to give our economy and our young people every opportunity to compete in that globalised economy. Many of our young people are already bilingual, they are able to learn more than one language and we need to give them the opportunity to do so, hence the amendment in our name today.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats remain convinced of the need for Wales to develop a green jobs strategy and for the Assembly Government to work on this and to bring it forward for debate. I believe that 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' fails to give proper prominence to green jobs. A green job strategy is needed in Wales to push forward the sustainable development agenda and to help businesses to embrace this agenda and to seize the opportunity that it provides. There are opportunities in the renewable energy and

Llangeinwyr. Bydd y perchnogion newydd, Alan a Susan Jones, yn cael budd mawr o'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi, a hynny'n fwy nag y byddai'n wir efallai o dan y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn fy atgoffa o athletwr yn hercian ei ffordd i'r llinell derfyn ar ôl ras hir. Ymhell ar ei hôl hi, mae'r athletwr lluddedig yn edrych yn ei flaen gan geisio osgoi unrhyw rwystrau a allai ei faglu yn ystod rhan olaf y ras. A fyddem wedi gweld gwahaniaeth pe byddai canlyniad Blaenau Gwent wedi bod yn wahanol? Yr wyf yn amau hynny, oherwydd nid yw hon yn Llywodraeth nad yw'n barod i sefyll dros ei hegwyddorion; y gwir yw nad oes ganddi fawr o egwyddorion yn y lle cyntaf.

Mae nifer y myfyrwyr a disgyblion sy'n dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yn fater o bryder mawr i unrhyw un sy'n ymddiddori yn y mater hwn. Gallai'r Cynulliad fynd i'r afael â'r broblem hon drwy gyflwyno iaith dramor fodern yng nghyfnodau allweddol 1 a 2; gellid gwneud hyn drwy ddefnyddio adran 354 o Ddeddf Addysg 1996. Gall cynyddu nifer y bobl yng Nghymru a all siarad ieithoedd tramor modern ond helpu rhagolygon economaidd Cymru mewn byd wedi'i globaleiddio. Yr ydym yn colli swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yn ddi-baid ac mae angen inni roi bob cyfle i'n heconomi a'n pobl ifanc i gystadlu yn yr economi honno sydd wedi'i globaleiddio. Mae llawer o'n pobl ifanc eisoes yn ddwyieithog, gallant ddysgu mwy nag un iaith ac mae angen inni roi'r cyfle iddynt wneud hynny, ac felly yr ydym yn cyflwyno'r gwelliant heddiw.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn parhau i fod yn argyhoeddedig o'r angen i Gymru ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd ac i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad weithio ar hyn a'i chyflwyno inni er mwyn cynnal dadl arni. Credaf fod 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' yn methu â thalu'r sylw dyledus i swyddi gwyrdd. Mae angen strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd yng Nghymru i ddatblygu'r agenda datblygu cynaliadwy a helpu busnesau i arddel yr agenda hon a manteisio ar y cyfleoedd a gynigir ganddi. Mae cyfleoedd

recycling sectors. Improved energy efficiency and waste policies can not only develop new industries, but can bring tangible and considerable cost benefits to business in terms of savings.

Turning to the points that Janice just made, we believe that the Assembly Government should bring forward further debate in the Chamber on the proposals to re-establish the post office development fund. If Janice is worried that Labour policies pursued in London will destroy our post office network in Wales, then surely it is as remiss to put money into post offices via rate relief—which I particularly welcome—as it is to develop this fund. After all, business rate relief, while it will benefit post offices not to have to pay it, is small in comparison to the grants that were available under the post office development fund. It assisted 106 post offices to remain open between 2002 and 2004, and provided £4.1 million of support.

Rhodri today spent a great deal of time telling everyone who was willing to listen that Wales is a can-do country. I absolutely agree, First Minister; Wales is a can-do country full of people who want to make it work. Unfortunately for Wales, it is lumbered with a can't-do Government.

**Lisa Francis:** I want to confine my comments in this debate to our amendment 1 on the Welsh language, which, unfortunately, is howlingly omitted from the Business Minister's Cabinet statement. When the Minister responsible for the Welsh language discussed the subject in the Chamber last term, he reiterated his Government's long-term aim of creating a bilingual society in Wales, which, of course, is the aim of all Assembly Members. He spoke then of what would happen when the Government of Wales Bill became law, namely that the Assembly would be able to legislate on the Welsh language within the scope of the Act. He told us that his Government intended to use the additional powers that the Assembly would have under the Government of Wales Act to create the post of the dyfarnydd, and that he intended to merge the Welsh

yn y sectorau ynni adnewyddol ac ailgylchu. Yn ogystal â datblygu diwydiannau newydd, gall polisiau effeithlonrwydd ynni a gwastraff gwell ddod â buddiannau cost diriaethol a sylweddol yn eu sgîl i fusnesau o ran arbedion.

Gan droi at y pwyntiau a wnaed gan Janice, credwn y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad gynnal dadleuon pellach yn y Siambr ar y cynigion i ailsefydlu'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Os yw Janice yn pryderu y bydd polisiau Llafur yn Llundain yn dinistrio ein rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru, onid yw yr un mor esgeulus i roi arian i swyddfeydd post drwy gyfrwng rhyddhad ardrethi—rhywbeth a groesawaf yn fawr—ag ydyw i ddatblygu'r gronfa hon. Wedi'r cyfan, er y bydd o fudd i swyddfeydd post, mae'r rhyddhad ardrethi busnes yn fach o gymharu â'r grantiau a oedd ar gael o dan y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post. Cynorthwyodd 106 o swyddfeydd post i barhau yn agored rhwng 2002 a 2004, gan ddarparu £4.1 miliwn o gymorth.

Treuliodd Rhodri gryn dipyn o amser heddiw yn dweud wrth bawb a oedd yn fodlon gwrandao bod Cymru yn wlad a all gyflawni pethau. Cytunaf yn llwyr, Brif Weinidog; mae Cymru yn wlad a all gyflawni pethau sy'n llawn o bobl sydd am wneud hynny. Yn anffodus i Gymru, mae ganddi Lywodraeth na all gyflawni pethau.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr wyf am gyfyngu fy sylwadau yn y ddadl hon i'n gwelliant 1 ar yr iaith Gymraeg, sydd, yn anffodus, wedi'i hepgor yn llwyr o ddatganiad Cabinet y Trefnydd. Pan drafodwyd y pwnc gan y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am yr iaith Gymraeg yn y Siambr y tymor diwethaf, ailadroddodd nod hirdymor ei Lywodraeth o greu cymdeithas ddwyieithog yng Nghymru, sydd, wrth gwrs, yn nod i bob Aelod Cynulliad. Siaradodd bryd hynny o'r hyn a fyddai'n digwydd pan fyddai Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn ddeddf, sef y byddai'r Cynulliad yn gallu deddfu ar yr iaith Gymraeg o fewn cwmpas y Ddeddf. Dywedodd ei fod yn fwriad gan ei Lywodraeth i ddefnyddio'r pwerau ychwanegol a fyddai gan y Cynulliad o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru i greu swydd dyfarnydd a'i fod yn bwriadu uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg â Llywodraeth y

Language Board with the Assembly Government at the same time. Cynulliad ar yr un pryd.

This was a reasonably clear, unambiguous—though typically short on detail—sort of statement, and an indication of intent, albeit it did not take into account the motion passed by a majority vote in the Assembly last October, when the Welsh Assembly Government was duly instructed to postpone the merger of the Welsh Language Board with the Welsh Assembly Government until the Assembly had approved a motion that satisfactorily dealt with the operation of the regulatory functions of the Welsh Language Board and the powers of monitoring the plans of local education authorities for the promotion of the language. That motion is yet to be passed, but the Government seems hell bent on trying to ride roughshod over the wishes of the Assembly, as evidenced by the Minister for the Welsh language when he published his Cabinet statement very late last term, and by the freedom of information papers that disclosed that numerous work streams had been pushing forward the merger process, despite and in defiance of the majority Assembly vote taken last October, as well as the further investigations undertaken by the auditor general regarding the use of public funds to abolish the Welsh Language Board. The Minister has told us that he intends to grow the Welsh language by investing in it and encouraging parents to choose Welsh-medium education for their children, yet the Welsh language has not been mentioned once in the Business Minister's Cabinet statement on the forward work programme. So much for a bilingual nation.

First Minister, if your Government were truly sincere in its aspirations for the Welsh language, it would surely be desirous of communicating its intelligence on the matter to the Assembly in a current, ongoing and progressive way, and definitely before next May's elections. However, this intelligence is significant by its absence in the Assembly Government's forward work programme, and it is sadly a growing testament to a prevailing arrogant attitude and a lack of commitment to Wales.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I must admit that I had

Yr oedd hwn yn ddatganiad cymharol glir, diamwys—er yn nodweddiadol brin o fanylion—ac yn ddatganiad o fwriad, er nad oedd yn ystyried y cynnig a basiwyd gan bleidlais fwyafrifol yn y Cynulliad fis Hydref y llynedd, pan gyfarwyddwyd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ohirio uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru hyd nes bod y Cynulliad wedi cymeradwyo cynnig a oedd yn ymdrin â gweithrediad swyddogaethau rheoliadol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ynghyd â phwerau monitro cynlluniau awdurdodau addysg lleol ar gyfer hybu'r iaith a hynny mewn modd boddhaol. Nid yw'r cynnig hwnnw wedi'i basio eto ond ymddengys bod y Llywodraeth yn mynnu anwybyddu dymuniadau'r Cynulliad. Mae tystiolaeth o hyn i'w gweld pan gyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros yr Iaith Gymraeg ei ddatganiad Cabinet ddiwedd y tymor diwethaf a chan y papurau rhyddid gwybodaeth a oedd yn datgelu bod nifer o ffrydiau gwaith wedi bod yn gwthio'r broses uno yn ei blaen, er gwaethaf pleidlais fwyafrifol y Cynulliad fis Hydref diwethaf, yn ogystal â'r ymchwiliadau pellach a gynhaliodd yr archwilydd cyffredinol i'r defnydd o arian cyhoeddus i ddi-ddymu Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Soniodd y Gweinidog am ei fwriad i dyfu'r iaith Gymraeg drwy fuddsoddi ynddi ac annog rhieni i ddewis addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg i'w plant, ac eto ni chyfeiriodd datganiad Cabinet y Trefnydd ar y flaenraglen waith unwaith am yr iaith Gymraeg. Sôn am genedl ddwyieithog.

Brif Weinidog, pe bai eich Llywodraeth yn wirioneddol o ddifrif yn ei dyheadau ar gyfer yr iaith Gymraeg, oni fyddai'n dymuno cyfleu ei gwybodaeth am y mater i'r Cynulliad mewn ffordd gyfredol, parhaus a chynyddol, ac yn bendant cyn yr etholiadau fis Mai nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nad yw'r wybodaeth hon yn bodoli ym mlaenraglen waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac, yn anffodus, mae'n dystiolaeth gynyddol o agwedd drahaus gyffredinol a diffyg ymrwymiad i Gymru.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Rhaid imi gyfaddef imi

some difficulty in preparing this speech, because it is so hard to respond to something so thin and unambitious—even for this Government. So many gaps could be highlighted, and other speakers have already done so. I will focus my comments predominantly on health and social care.

I want to begin with a positive. I welcome the several opportunities to discuss children's issues and social services issues. One of the cross-party achievements of the Assembly has been the strength of the amount of time and attention that we have paid to social services, and I welcome that aspect in the forward work programme. We will support retaining those items in the Government's programme for debate.

However, this forward work programme is shockingly thin on health issues. Is this because the Assembly Government does not want to discuss its failures, which have already been touched on by other speakers? On waiting times, I am not very good at mathematics, so I must admit that I have lost count of the number of times that the goalposts have been moved in this regard. The fact is that people are still waiting a shockingly long length of time. The waits for diagnostic tests, for example, are appalling, and Kirsty Williams referred earlier to a person waiting four years for an essential scan. The fact remains that we are spending an awful lot more money on health, but the outcomes for people are still dreadful.

The Minister for education was keen to refer us to Labour's manifesto earlier, so perhaps she will appreciate my referring to it now. On dentistry, in 1999, this Government committed itself to ensuring that all patients in all parts of Wales would have access to NHS dentists. No-one is leaping up from the Government benches to challenge me on that one, interestingly. According to the latest figures, only 47 per cent of patients overall—less than half—are registered with an NHS dentist. In some parts of Wales, the distances that people are expected to travel can amount to more than 100 miles, particularly in the north.

gael cryn anhawster i baratoi'r araith hon, am ei bod mor anodd ymateb i rywbeth mor denau ac anuchelgeisiol—hyd yn oed i'r Llywodraeth hon. Byddai modd tynnu sylw at gymaint o fylchau, ac mae siaradwyr eraill wedi gwneud hynny eisoes. Felly byddaf yn canolbwyntio fy sylwadau yn bennaf ar iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol.

Hoffwn ddechrau'n gadarnhaol. Croesawaf y cyfleoedd niferus i drafod materion sy'n ymwneud â phlant a materion sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Un o gyflawniadau trawsbleidiol y Cynulliad yw'r amser a'r sylw a roddwyd gennym i wasanaethau cymdeithasol, a chroesawaf yr agwedd honno ar y flaenraglen waith. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r bwriad i gadw'r eitemau hynny ar raglen dadleuon y Llywodraeth.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r flaenraglen waith hon yn ddychrynlyd o denau o ran materion iechyd. Ai'r rheswm am hyn yw nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am drafod ei methiannau, y cyfeiriodd siaradwyr eraill atynt eisoes? O ran amseroedd aros, nid yw fy mathemateg yn dda iawn, felly rhaid imi gyfaddef nad wyf yn gallu cyfrif sawl gwaith y mae'r nodau wedi cael eu newid yn hyn o beth. Y gwir yw bod pobl yn dal i aros am amser dychrynlyd o hir. Mae'r amseroedd aros am brofion diagnostig, er enghraifft, yn ofnadwy, a chyfeiriodd Kirsty Williams yn gynharach at berson sydd wedi aros pedair blynedd am sgan hanfodol. Y gwir amdani yw ein bod yn gwario llawer iawn mwy o arian ar iechyd, ond mae'r canlyniadau i bobl yn parhau'n ofnadwy.

Yr oedd y Gweinidog dros addysg yn awyddus i'n cyfeirio at fanifesto Llafur yn gynharach, felly efallai y bydd yn gwerthfawrogi'r ffaith fy mod yn cyfeirio ato yn awr. O ran deintyddiaeth, yn 1999, ymrwymodd y Llywodraeth hon i sicrhau y byddai gan bob claf ym mhob rhan o Gymru gyfle i weld deintyddion y GIG. Mae'n ddi-ddorol gweld nad oes neb yn llamu oddi ar feinciau'r Llywodraeth i herio hynny. Yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf, dim ond 47 y cant o gleifion yn gyffredinol—llai na hanner—sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, gall y pellteroedd y disgwylir i bobl deithio fod



dros 100 milltir, yn arbennig yn y gogledd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Is it not absolutely shocking that the Welsh Assembly Government wrote to Powys Local Health Board, which had dentists whom it could employ in the constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire, to tell it that there no more money was forthcoming to employ more dentists in that county, because it was felt that it already had enough dentists, even though people in many communities must travel considerable distances to access the service?

**Kirsty Williams:** Onid yw'n hollol ddychrynlyd i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ysgrifennu i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Powys, lle yr oedd deintyddion y gallai eu cyflogi yn etholaeth Brycheiniog a sir Faesyfed, i'w hysbysu nad oedd mwy o arian ar gael i gyflogi mwy o ddeintyddion yn y sir honno, am ei bod o'r farn bod digon o ddeintyddion yno eisoes, er bod rhaid i bobl mewn llawer o gymunedau deithio'n eithriadol o bell i gael y gwasanaeth?

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am shocked to hear that, but I cannot say that I am surprised, because one hears similar stories, particularly from the north.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Mae hynny wedi fy nychryn, ond nid wyf wedi fy synnu, am fod storïau tebyg i'w clywed, yn arbennig o'r gogledd.

Some of the figures are as low as the 15.6 per cent of adults in Pembrokeshire registered with an NHS dentist. I do not know how others would describe this, but I would describe it as a failure and a very important broken promise.

Mae rhai o'r ffigurau mor isel â 15.6 y cant o oedolion yn sir Benfro sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG. Ni wn sut y byddai eraill yn disgrifio hyn, ond fy nisgrifiad i ohono fyddai methiant ac addewid bwysig iawn wedi ei thorri.

I cannot make my remarks without referring to the broken promise on healthcare. The First Minister is right—we do not intend to let him forget about it. It remains a shocking betrayal of some of the most vulnerable citizens in our country. I know many citizens, as I am sure do other Members, for whom that promise was a vote-maker in one way or another—it determined how they would vote. If that promise was not affordable and not possible to enforce, it should never have been made.

Ni allaf wneud fy sylwadau heb gyfeirio at yr addewid a dorwyd o ran gofal iechyd. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn iawn—ni fwriadwn adael iddo anghofio hyn. Mae'n parhau i fod yn frad dychrynlyd o rai o ddinasyddion mwyaf diamddiffyn ein gwlad. Gwn am lawer o ddinasyddion, fel y gŵyr Aelodau eraill, mae'n siŵr, lle yr oedd yr addewid honno wedi ennill eu pleidlais mewn un ffordd neu'r llall—llywiodd eu pleidlais. Os nad oedd yr addewid honno yn un fforddiadwy nac yn un yr oedd yn bosibl ei gwireddu, ni ddylid bod wedi ei gwneud.

4.20 p.m.

I was astounded to hear the First Minister yesterday appear to say, in response to a question, that disabled people and disabled people's organisations are now happy and that they agree that his Government's alternative programme is better. Either he meets a different section of disabled people from the ones that I meet, or—

Cefais fy synnu pan glywais y Prif Weinidog ddoe yn datgan yn ôl pob tebyg, mewn ymateb i gwestiwn, fod pobl anabl a sefydliadau pobl anabl bellach yn fodlon a'u bod yn cytuno bod rhaglen amgen ei Lywodraeth yn well. Naill ai mae'n cwrdd â charfan wahanol o bobl anabl i'r rhai y byddaf i'n cwrdd â hwy, neu—

**Brian Gibbons** *rose*—

**Brian Gibbons** *a gododd*—

**Helen Mary Jones:** If the Minister for

**Helen Mary Jones:** Os yw'r Gweinidog dros

Health and Social Services wishes to intervene, I will happily allow the intervention, and refer him to the Record.

**Brian Gibbons:** I think it fair to say that the First Minister said nothing of the sort.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I refer you to the Record, Dr Gibbons. I am perfectly happy to e-mail you the section of the Record that shows that that is what he said. Of course, it is not the same as what he said this afternoon, but we are used to the First Minister's saying one thing on one day and another thing the next. If he thinks that disabled people are happy with this, he is clearly having problems with his grasp on reality. If he finds that discourteous, I am sorry, but it happens to be true. I do not think that disabled people share his perception that the new scheme is better; I certainly do not.

We would have expected this forward work programme to contain a great deal more on health. The Government, as Jocelyn Davies pointed out, has barely six months to keep some of its most important promises. The fact remains—and I repeat myself for the sake of emphasis—that, in fairness, as a nation, we now spend twice as much on health and social care as we did when the Government came to power in 1999, but the outcomes for so many are still so shockingly poor. The people of Wales deserve better—better than this dismal Government and better than this unambitious forward work programme.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** It seems extraordinary to me that we started with quite goodwill from the opposition leaders, and, unfortunately, finished on a rather tarnished note. Like the First Minister, I, too, commend this; in fact, it was Jocelyn who pressed for this statement, and it is a useful innovation. I was disappointed, Jocelyn, that you were more grudging than the leader of the opposition and Mike German, who recognised this as a constructive way forward. It allows the Government to set out its proposals—a business statement for the next eight months

Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dymuno ymyrryd, yr wyf yn fodlon caniatáu'r ymyriad, a'i gyfeirio at y Cofnod.

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf ei bod yn deg dweud na ddywedodd y Prif Weinidog ddim byd o'r fath.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Fe'ch cyfeirïaf at y Cofnod, Dr Gibbons. Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon anfon y rhan o'r Cofnod sy'n dangos yr hyn a ddywedodd atoch dros yr e-bost. Wrth gwrs, mae'n wahanol i'r hyn a ddywedodd y prynhawn yma, ond yr ydym wedi hen arfer â'r Prif Weinidog yn dweud un peth un diwrnod a rhywbeth arall y diwrnod canlynol. Os yw o'r farn bod pobl anabl yn fodlon ar hyn, mae'n amlwg nad yw'n deall y sefyllfa go iawn. Os yw'n meddwl bod hynny'n anghwrtais, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae'n wir. Nid wyf o'r farn bod pobl anabl yn cytuno ag ef bod y cynllun newydd yn well; nid dyna fy marn i, yn bendant.

Byddem wedi disgwyl i'r flaenraglen waith hon gynnwys llawer mwy ym maes iechyd. Fel y soniodd Jocelyn Davies, prin chwech mis sydd gan y Llywodraeth i gadw rhai o'i haddewidion pwysicaf. Y gwir amdani yw—ac ailadroddaf hyn er mwyn ei bwysleisio—ein bod, fel cenedl, a bod yn deg, bellach yn gwario dwywaith gymaint ar iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ag yr oeddem pan ddaeth y Llywodraeth i rym yn 1999, ond mae'r canlyniadau i gymaint o bobl yn parhau mor ddychrynlyd o wael. Mae pobl Cymru yn haeddu gwell—gwell na'r Llywodraeth wael hon a gwell na'r flaenraglen waith anuchelgeisiol hon.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'n rhyfeddod imi ein bod wedi dechrau gydag ewyllys cymharol dda o blith arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau a gorffen, yn anffodus, ar nodyn braidd yn sur. Fel y Prif Weinidog, cymeradwyaf innau hyn; a dweud y gwir, Jocelyn a fynnodd y datganiad hwn, ac mae'n ddyfais ddefnyddiol. Cefais fy siomi, Jocelyn, eich bod yn fwy crintachlyd nag arweinydd yr wrthblaid a Mike German, a gydnabu fod hyn yn ffordd adeiladol ymlaen. Mae'n galluogi'r Llywodraeth i nodi ei chynigion—datganiad busnes am yr wyth mis nesaf o ddadleuon y Cynulliad ac ar gyfer

for Assembly debate and for wider public scrutiny, which is key in terms of the opportunities that we are setting out today.

I was surprised by Nick, leader of the Welsh Conservatives, who is not in the Chamber at the moment, trying to make out that we are somehow ducking difficult issues by including committee reports in our agendas. It is in our Standing Orders that we should debate committee reports, such as the excellent committee report that we debated yesterday on the science policy. Of course time is allocated for committee reports and opposition debates, as well as for Government debates, and we laid it out in the business statement.

The other matter that I must raise as Business Minister and manager is that the opposition has had considerable influence on this programme for the next eight months. In fact, we checked, and saw that we have 25 debates that emanate directly from points and requests made by opposition Members. I expect that my colleagues are thinking, 'She has let too much in', in terms of those opportunities for opposition debates. However, because this is an inclusive, participatory democracy, and because it is my role within our arrangements and political make-up, I have allowed those 25 debates. They include two debates that did not require your amendments. As you know, Lisa, we have scheduled a debate on the ambulance service, and, Glyn, a full debate has been scheduled on 'Designed to Deliver' to deal with the very issues that you raised with regard to the national health service in Wales. You have, therefore, influenced this forward work programme that we are going to debate, in terms of Government debates, time for opposition and important committee reports.

I was curious about the absence of any Plaid Cymru amendments, hoping that that was a sign of backing for our programme. As Jocelyn said, it was right and proper that we should lay out our programme, so that you could say 'yea' or 'nay', challenge and scrutinise. The Welsh Conservatives have

craffu cyhoeddus ehangach, sy'n allweddol o ran y cyfleoedd a nodwn heddiw.

Cefais fy synnu gan Nick, arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, nad yw yn y Siambr ar hyn o bryd, a geisiodd awgrymu ein bod rywfodd yn osgoi materion anodd drwy gynnwys adroddiadau pwyllgorau yn ein hagendaŵ. Mae'n rhan o'n Rheolau Sefydlog y dylem gynnal dadl ar adroddiadau pwyllgorau, megis yr adroddiad pwyllgor ardderchog y cynhaliwyd dadl arno ddoe ar y polisi gwyddoniaeth. Dyrennir amser, wrth gwrs, i adroddiadau pwyllgorau a dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau, yn ogystal â dadleuon y Llywodraeth, fel y nodwyd yn y datganiad busnes.

Y mater arall y mae'n rhaid imi fel Trefnydd a rheolwr busnes ei gyflwyno yw bod y gwrthbleidiau wedi dylanwadu'n sylweddol ar y rhaglen hon am yr wyth mis nesaf. Mewn gwirionedd, yr ydym wedi edrych ar hyn, a gwelwyd bod gennym 25 o ddadleuon sy'n deillio'n uniongyrchol o bwyntiau a cheisiadau a wnaethpwyd gan Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau. Mae'n siŵr bod fy nghyd-Aelodau'n meddwl, 'Mae wedi cynnwys gormod', o ran y cyfleoedd hynny ar gyfer dadleuon y gwrthbleidiau. Fodd bynnag, gan mai democratiaeth gynhwysol, cyfranogol yw hon, a chan mai dyna fy rôl o fewn ein trefniadau a'n hadeiladwaith gwleidyddol, yr wyf wedi caniatáu'r 25 o ddadleuon hynny. Maent yn cynnwys dwy ddadl lle nad oedd angen eich gwelliannau. Fel y gwyddoch, Lisa, yr ydym wedi cynnwys dadl ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans a, Glyn, mae dadl lawn ar 'Cynlluniwyd i'w Gyflawni' wedi ei chynnwys i ymdrin â'r union faterion a godwyd gennych o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru. Yr ydych, felly, wedi dylanwadu ar y flaenraglen waith hon a gaiff ei thrafod gennym, o ran dadleuon y Llywodraeth, amser i'r gwrthbleidiau ac adroddiadau pwysig y pwyllgorau.

Yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu nad oedd gwelliannau wedi eu cynnwys gan Blaid Cymru, yn y gobaith bod hynny'n arwydd o gefnogaeth i'n rhaglen. Fel y dywedodd Jocelyn, yr oedd yn gywir ac yn briodol inni gyflwyno ein rhaglen, er mwyn eich galluogi i gytuno neu anghytuno, herio a chraffu. Mae

given us a whole list of topics for what are presumably their future opposition party debates, so we can prepare for those and be ready for them. I welcome that opportunity.

Turning to Mike German, I thought that what you have done in terms of Kirsty Williams's amendments is constructive. You have given us the Welsh Liberal Democrat policy handbook. It is useful, because it sets out what I am sure we will be ready for, in terms of your manifesto commitments as we take this forward.

I cannot deal with all the amendments. There will be much debate and consultation, and many questions on this. I noticed that Brian Gibbons was on his feet for nearly 50 minutes this afternoon during his questions.

Kirsty, those children who are benefiting from free school breakfasts in those hundreds of primary schools in Wales do not see this as a limping Government; they see this as a Government that is delivering its manifesto commitment on its free breakfast initiative, which is taking us up to 599 primary schools by next spring. Those children do not see this Labour Government as a limping Government; they see us as a Government of change and of social justice.

Finally, Kirsty referred to the important speech that the First Minister made today at the Institute of Welsh Affairs on the theme 'Wales can do it'. The people of Wales will respond to that by signing up to the exciting times and opportunities that we have, thanks to that partnership of a Labour Government in Wales and at Westminster. I remind Members of that record, particularly on the economy and health. There are 126,000 more jobs in Wales today than when the Assembly started. The First Minister made that point yesterday and he made it again today in his speech. Jocelyn, that is the record. This is not nearly-full employment; this is a record. Wales has moved faster than any other part of the UK in terms of that rise, with 126,000 new jobs, and with the growth in private sector jobs outstripping the growth in public sector jobs.

Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi rhoi rhestr gyflawn inni o bynciau o'r hyn, mae'n debyg, yw eu dadleuon fel gwrthblaid yn y dyfodol, fel y gallwn baratoi ar eu cyfer a bod yn barod amdanynt. Croesawaf y cyfle hwnnw.

Gan droi at Mike German, credaf fod yr hyn a wnaethoch o ran gwelliannau Kirsty Williams yn adeiladol. Yr ydych wedi rhoi llawlyfr polisi Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru inni. Mae'n ddefnyddiol, am ei fod yn nodi'r hyn yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwn yn barod amdano, o ran eich ymrwymadau maniffesto wrth inni weithredu ar hyn.

Ni allaf ymdrin â'r holl welliannau. Bydd llawer o drafod ac ymgynghori, a llawer o gwestiynau'n ymwneud â hyn. Sylwais fod Brian Gibbons ar ei draed am bron 50 munud y prynhawn yma yn ystod ei gwestiynau.

Kirsty, nid yw'r plant hynny sy'n cael brechwast ysgol am ddim yn y cannoedd o ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru o'r farn mai Llywodraeth gloff yw hon; maent o'r farn ei bod yn Lywodraeth sy'n cyflawni'r ymrwymiad yn ei maniffesto o ran ei menter brechwast am ddim, a fydd ar gael mewn 599 o ysgolion cynradd erbyn y gwanwyn y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid yw'r plant hynny o'r farn mai Llywodraeth gloff yw'r Llywodraeth Lafur hon; maent o'r farn ein bod yn Lywodraeth sy'n cyflwyno newid a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Yn olaf, cyfeiriodd Kirsty at yr araith bwysig a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog heddiw yn y Sefydliad Materion Cymreig ar y thema 'Wales can do it'. Bydd pobl Cymru yn ymateb i hynny drwy gytuno i fod yn rhan o'r amseroedd a'r cyfleoedd cyffrous sydd gennym, diolch i'r bartneriaeth honno rhwng Llywodraeth Lafur yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan. Hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau o'r record honno, yn arbennig ym maes economi ac iechyd. Mae 126,000 mwy o swyddi yng Nghymru heddiw nag a oedd pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad. Gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog y pwynt hwnnw ddoe a gwnaeth y pwynt hwnnw eto heddiw yn ei araith. Jocelyn, dyna'r record. Nid cyflogaeth bron yn llawn mo hyn; mae hyn yn record. Mae Cymru wedi symud yn gyflymach nag unrhyw ran arall o'r DU o ran y cynnydd hwnnw, gyda 126,000 o swyddi newydd, a chyda nifer y

swyddi yn y sector preifat yn cynyddu'n gyflymach na nifer y swyddi yn y sector cyhoeddus.

On the health front, let us look at the transformation in the Valleys over the past six years.

Ym maes iechyd, gadewch inni edrych ar y trawsnewid yn y Cymoedd dros y chwe blynedd diwethaf.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you give way?

**Mark Isherwood:** A ildiwch?

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. She is about to finish.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Mae ar fin gorffen.

**Jane Hutt:** I do not have time.

**Jane Hutt:** Nid oes amser gennyf.

Nearly 30 salaried GPs and nurses are working in our communities in Rhondda Cynon Taf. Six years ago, the question rightly put to me was, 'What are you going to do about the crisis in the Valleys in the health service?'. There are now 30 salaried GPs and nurses. This model is being rolled out as a result of the pioneering work of Rhondda Cynon Taff Local Health Board.

Mae bron 30 o feddygon teulu a nyrsys cyflogedig yn gweithio yn ein cymunedau yn Rhondda Cynon Taf. Chwe blynedd yn ôl, y cwestiwn hollol deg a ofynnwyd imi oedd, 'Beth ydych yn mynd i'w wneud am yr argyfwng yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y Cymoedd?'. Mae bellach bron 30 o feddygon teulu a nyrsys cyflogedig. Caiff y model hwn ei gyflwyno o ganlyniad i waith arloesol Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf.

By 1 April, we will have free prescriptions in Wales. That is a strong Labour Government manifesto pledge being delivered. Wales can do it with a Labour Government programme that is positive about progress and is pioneering in its policies to improve people's lives. We are proud to endorse that programme.

Erbyn 1 Ebrill, bydd gennym bresgripsiynau am ddim yng Nghymru. Dyna addewid manifffesto gref Llywodraeth Lafur yn cael ei chyflawni. Gall Cymru gyflawni gyda rhaglen Llywodraeth Lafur sy'n gadarnhaol o blaid cynnydd ac sy'n arloesol yn ei pholisïau i wella bywydau pobl. Yr ydym yn falch o gymeradwyo'r rhaglen honno.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 2: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 3: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 4: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 5: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*



*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 17, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 6: For 17, Abstain 10, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 18, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 7: For 18, Abstain 10, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 8: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann

Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 9, Ymatal 17, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 9: For 9, Abstain 17, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, David  
 German, Michael  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 7, Ymatal 21, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 10: For 7, Abstain 21, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
German, Michael  
Law, Trish  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 27, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 11: For 27, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 17, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 29.  
 Amendment 12: For 17, Abstain 10, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice

Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Law, Trish  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 13: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Trish  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne

Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy-Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 14: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 14: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.*  
*Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 15: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.*  
*Amendment 15: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane

Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Trish  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Dirprwy-Lywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Deputy Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3206): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3206): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the Welsh Assembly Government's forward work programme as set out in the Cabinet written statement from the Business Minister, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on Wednesday 13 September.*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi blaenraglen waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel y'i nodwyd gan y Trefnydd yn natganiad ysgrifenedig y Cabinet, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ddydd Mercher 13 Medi.*

*Cynnig (NDM3206): O blaid 29, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 17.*

*Motion (NDM3206): For 29, Abstain 10, Against 17.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty



Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Law, Trish  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio Annual Report of the Audit Committee**

**Janet Davies:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Orders Nos. 6.6(vi) and 12.2(iv) notes the annual report of the Audit Committee for the period 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office on 21 July 2006. (NDM3204)*

The Audit Committee's annual report sets out our work to ensure that the Assembly and other public bodies operate to the highest standards in the management of their financial affairs. To do this, the committee considers the reports of the Auditor General for Wales, takes evidence on these from senior officials, and produces its own reports, which make recommendations for improving the use of public funds. During the past year, the committee has published eight reports and made a total of 43 recommendations for improving the use of public funds. During the past year, these eight reports have covered a diverse range of issues, from energy and water management to protecting NHS staff

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheolau Sefydlog Rhifau 6.6(vi) a 12.2(iv) yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio ar gyfer y cyfnod 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 21 Gorffennaf 2006. (NDM3204)*

Mae adroddiad blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn nodi ein gwaith i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yn gweithredu yn unol a'r safonau uchaf wrth reoli eu materion ariannol. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae'r pwyllgor yn ystyried adroddiadau Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, yn cymryd tystiolaeth am y rhain gan uwch swyddogion ac yn cynhyrchu ei adroddiadau ei hun, sy'n gwneud argymhellion ar gyfer gwella'r defnydd o arian cyhoeddus. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'r pwyllgor wedi cyhoeddi wyth adroddiad a gwnaeth gyfanswm o 43 o argymhellion ar gyfer gwella'r defnydd o arian cyhoeddus. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, mae'r wyth

from violence and aggression, and to the National Botanic Garden of Wales.

Before I consider some of the main themes that have emerged from our work, I take this opportunity to draw your attention to the fact that our report on NHS waiting times, published at the end of the previous reporting year, subsequently featured as an example in a report by the Centre for Public Scrutiny entitled 'Successful Scrutiny'. This report pointed to the potential for scrutiny bodies, such as the Audit Committee, to affect the delivery of public services by providing constructive advice and concluded that the committee's work:

'Played a key role in securing a sea-change in the Welsh Assembly Government's approach to, and focus on, improving waiting times for patients in Wales'.

Those are the words of the Centre for Public Scrutiny, not ours.

Turning to our work in the last year, I will pick out four main themes. The first of these concerns sound employment practices. We are all only too aware of how crucial people are to effective service delivery; this applies in the public sector at least as much as it does in the private sector. Being a good employer is not about complying with legislation for the sake of it. It means a proactive approach to the management of an organisation's key assets so that staff are healthy, trained and motivated to come to work. The cost of failure to achieve these goals can be considerable. In the areas that we focused on, the NHS and the further education sector, the absence of staff can have a direct impact on the service provided.

We recognise that this can be a difficult and sensitive area. While employers have every right to do what they can to encourage staff to come to work, they must guard against the real risk of forcing staff to come in when they

adroddiad hyn wedi cwmpasu amrywiaeth eang o faterion, o reoli ynni a dŵr i ddiogelu staff y GIG rhag trais ac ymosodiad, ac i Ardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru.

Cyn imi ystyried rhai o'r prif themâu a ddeilliodd o'n gwaith, hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu eich sylw at y ffaith i'n hadroddiad ar amseroedd aros y GIG, a gyhoeddwyd ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn adrodd ddiwethaf, gael ei ddefnyddio ar ôl hynny fel enghraifft mewn adroddiad gan y Ganolfan Craffu Cyhoeddus o'r enw 'Successful Scrutiny'. Cyfeiriodd yr adroddiad hwn at y potensial i gyrff craffu, megis y Pwyllgor Archwilio, effeithio ar y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a ddarperir drwy roi cyngor adeiladol a daeth i'r casgliad bod gwaith y pwyllgor:

Wedi chwarae rhan allweddol wrth sicrhau newid mawr yn ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru tuag at wella amseroedd aros i gleifion yng Nghymru, a chanolbwyntio arnynt.

Dyna eiriau'r Ganolfan Craffu Cyhoeddus, nid ein geiriau ni.

Gan droi at ein gwaith yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, byddaf yn dewis pedair prif thema. Mae'r thema gyntaf yn ymwneud ag arferion cyflogaeth cadarn. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn o bwysigrwydd pobl i ddarparu gwasanaeth yn effeithiol; mae hyn yn berthnasol i'r sector cyhoeddus o leiaf gymaint ag ydyw i'r sector preifat. Nid yw bod yn gyflogwr da yn ymwneud â chydymffurfio â deddfwriaeth er ei mwyn ei hun. Mae'n golygu ymagwedd ragweithiol tuag at reoli asedau allweddol sefydliad fel bod y staff yn iach, wedi'u hyfforddi ac wedi'u cymell i ddod i'r gwaith. Gall y gost o fethu â chyflawni'r nodau hyn fod yn sylweddol. Yn y meysydd y bu inni ganolbwyntio arnynt, y GIG a'r sector addysg bellach, gall absenoldeb staff gael effaith uniongyrchol ar y gwasanaeth a ddarperir.

Cydnabyddwn y gall hyn fod yn faes anodd a sensitif. Er bod gan gyflogwyr yr hawl i wneud yr hyn a allant i annog staff i ddod i'r gwaith, rhaid iddynt wylio rhag y gwir berygl o orfodi staff i ddod i'r gwaith pan nad ydynt

are not physically or mentally fit to do so. Not only is this morally wrong, it is often counter-productive in the longer term. These judgments can be fine ones, particularly in relation to the growing incidence of stress-related illnesses. We are sensitive to these concerns. Our recommendations were, therefore, aimed at the practical, straightforward steps that organisations should put in place, such as ensuring that relevant staff are trained in such matters and that sensible data are maintained on the key measures.

The theme of risk management is, naturally, close to the heart of this committee. It is easy to caricature the activities of any organisation with the word 'audit' in its title as being over-concerned with eliminating risk and, where things have not gone to plan, over-eager to criticise with the benefit of hindsight without any thought for how things might be handled better next time.

However, that is not our aim. We recognise that running public services involves risk, and that attempting new things—as Governments must do to keep pace with public expectations and changing technologies—increases those risks. Progress cannot be made without taking risks. On the other hand, public bodies should not lose sight of the fact that it is not their money but the public's money that they are spending. The aim should therefore be not to eliminate risk, which is impossible, but to minimise it by taking decisions on a well-informed, well-considered basis. In three of our reports this year on different subjects—grants to a local enterprise agency, Antur Dwyrdd-Llŷn, the award of a new contract by Cardiff Local Health Board, and the National Botanic Garden of Wales—we found scope for improvement. Taking the last of these as an example, it is not our place to comment on whether or not the National Botanic Garden of Wales should have received public funding, but it is very much within our powers to point, as we did, to the deficiencies in the assessments of the garden's early business plans by the agencies concerned and to make recommendations designed to improve matters in the future, such as the greater use of sensitivity analysis.

yn iach yn gorfforol neu'n feddyliol i wneud hynny. Mae hyn nid yn unig yn foisol anghywir, mae'n aml yn wrthgynhyrchol yn y tymor hir. Gall y penderfyniadau hyn fod yn anodd, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â'r nifer gynyddol o achosion o salwch sy'n ymwneud â straen. Yr ydym yn ystyriol o'r pryderon hyn. Felly, yr oedd ein hargymhellion wedi'u hanelu at y camau syml ymarferol y dylai sefydliadau eu rhoi ar waith, megis sicrhau y caiff staff perthnasol eu hyfforddi mewn materion o'r fath ac y caiff data synhwyrol eu cadw ar y mesurau allweddol.

Yn naturiol, mae thema rheoli risg yn agos at galon y pwyllgor hwn. Mae'n hawdd gorlunio gweithgareddau unrhyw sefydliad sydd â'r gair 'archwilio' yn ei deitl fel un sy'n orbryderus am ddileu risg ac yn orawyddus i feirniadu gydag ôl-ddoethineb pan nad aeth pethau fel y'u cynlluniwyd, heb ystyried sut y gellid ymdrin â phethau'n well y tro nesaf.

Fodd bynnag, nid dyna ein nod. Cydnabyddwn fod rheoli gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn cynnwys risg, a bod ceisio gwneud pethau newydd—fel y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraethau ei wneud i fodloni disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd a thechnolegau newydd—yn cynyddu'r risgiau hynny. Ni ellir gwneud cynnydd heb risg. Ar y llaw arall, ni ddylai cyrff cyhoeddus anwybyddu'r ffaith nad eu harian hwy y maent yn ei wario, ond arian y cyhoedd. Felly, ni ddylid pennu'r nod o ddileu risg, sy'n amhosibl, ond ei leihau drwy wneud penderfyniadau gwybodus ac ystyriol. Mewn tri o'n hadroddiadau eleni ar wahanol bynciau—grantiau i asiantaeth fenter leol, Antur Dwyrdd Llŷn, rhoi contract newydd gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd, a Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru—yr oedd lle i wella. Gan gymryd yr olaf o'r rhain fel enghraifft, nid ein lle ni yw dweud pa un a ddylai Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru fod wedi cael arian cyhoeddus ai peidio, ond mae o fewn ein pwerau i nodi, fel y gwnaethom, y diffygion yn asesiadau cynlluniau busnes cynnar yr ardd gan yr asiantaethau dan sylw a gwneud argymhellion a gynlluniwyd i wella materion yn y dyfodol, megis defnydd mwy o ddadansoddiad o sensitifrwydd.

As it is such fertile ground for audit examination, we have continued this year to examine the quality of procurement. The Government's policy paper, 'Making the Connections', set a target of £120 million in procurement-related savings for the Welsh public sector as a whole, which is a challenging target. Our finding that what is now known as Value Wales reported savings of £6 million in 2004, with further savings of £25 million deliverable in 2005, is welcome, but it also suggests that there is some way to go. We have made recommendations to the Government on increasing the levels of expertise in the area, and we have also emphasised the importance of procurement policies that reflect sustainable development principles, such as whole-life costing.

Finally, I will mention the theme of collaboration, which is another topic that figures in 'Making the Connections'. It is no more than common sense that institutions, some of which may be relatively small but which are still rightly expected to have high standards of management and governance, should share knowledge and resources. We found some good examples of this within sectors, such as between Cardiff University and the Royal Welsh College of Music and Drama, and across sectors, such as between Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust and the local police force. However, there must be scope for much more.

When I addressed the Assembly in a similar capacity last year, I alluded to some shortcomings in the quality of the Government's responses to the committee's recommendations. I am pleased to report that this has not been an issue with the Government responses in this past year. However, with a view to ensuring that our recommendations contribute to real improvements in the way in which services are managed, I continue to believe that it has been a positive development for the committee to secure update reports and memoranda from the auditor general and, where appropriate, for us to take further evidence from officials. There were three examples of this in the months leading up to the summer recess, on Merlin, the successor to Osiris, on national health service waiting

Gan ei fod yn faes mor ffrwythlon i'w archwilio, yr ydym wedi parhau i archwilio ansawdd caffael eleni. Pennodd papur polisi'r Llywodraeth, 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', darged o £120 miliwn mewn arbedion yn gysylltiedig â chaffael ar gyfer sector cyhoeddus Cymru yn gyffredinol, sy'n darged heriol. Croesewir ein canfyddiad i'r hyn a elwir yn Werth Cymru nodi arbedion o £6 miliwn yn 2004, gydag arbedion pellach o £25 miliwn yn bosibl yn 2005, ond awgryma hefyd fod cryn dipyn i'w wneud o hyd. Yr ydym wedi cyflwyno argymhellion i'r Llywodraeth ar gynyddu lefelau'r arbenigedd yn y maes, ac yr ydym hefyd wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd polisiau caffael sy'n adlewyrchu egwyddorion datblygu cynaliadwy, megis costau bywyd cyfan.

I gloi, byddaf yn sôn am thema cydweithio, sy'n bwnc arall sy'n amlwg yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Nid yw'n fwy na synnwyr cyffredin bod sefydliadau, y gall rhai ohonynt fod yn gymharol fach ond y disgwylir yn gywir iddynt fod â safonau rheoli a llywodraethu uchel, rannu gwybodaeth ac adnoddau. Gwelsom rai enghreifftiau da o hyn o fewn y sectorau, megis rhwng Prifysgol Caerdydd a Choleg Brenhinol Cerdd a Drama Cymru, ac ar draws sectorau, megis rhwng Ymddiriedolaethau GIG Conwy a Sir Ddinbych a'r heddlu lleol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid bod lle am lawer mwy o gydweithio.

Pan anerchais y Cynulliad mewn rhinwedd tebyg y llynedd, crybwyllais rai diffygion yn ansawdd ymatebion y Llywodraeth i argymhellion y pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn falch o nodi na fu hyn yn wir am ymatebion y Llywodraeth yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r bwriad o sicrhau bod ein hargymhellion yn cyfrannu at welliannau gwirioneddol yn y modd y rheolir gwasanaethau, parhaf i gredu ei fod yn ddatblygiad cadarnhaol i'r pwyllgor sicrhau adroddiadau diweddar a memoranda gan yr archwilydd cyffredinol a, lle y bo'n briodol, inni gymryd tystiolaeth bellach gan swyddogion. Yr oedd tair enghraifft o hyn yn y misoedd cyn toriad yr haf, ar Merlin, olynnydd Osiris, ar amseroedd aros y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol, ac ar reoli ystadau a chaffael yn y sector addysg bellach.

times, and on estates management and procurement in the further education sector. All have led, or will lead, to further reports and recommendations by the Audit Committee. I shall be liaising with the auditor general to ensure that we are able to consider more follow up of reports of this nature in the coming Assembly terms.

I will finish with some words of thanks. First, I thank my fellow committee members for their hard work and disciplined approach. I very much appreciate that, despite our looking at some potentially divisive material, the committee has maintained its positive cross-party way of working. The non-partisan operation of the committee is one of its great strengths.

I have gone on record before in paying tribute to the effectiveness of the close working relationship that we enjoy with the Auditor General for Wales, Jeremy Colman, and his staff in the Wales Audit Office. I reiterate that today. To be able to draw on this body of professionalism and integrity makes a huge difference to the committee's ability to fulfil its vital function. It is also good to report that the expected dividend from the creation of the Wales Audit Office, with its ability to penetrate across the entire Welsh public sector, is becoming increasingly evident. A number of the auditor general's reports that we have considered in the past year have benefited from providing the full local picture as well as the national one.

Finally, I thank again the senior officials and other witnesses who have appeared before us to provide evidence. Although I recognise that it can be gruelling for them, our witnesses invariably provide helpful comments and constructive evidence, even when being held to account for problems that have occurred. I am very grateful for the co-operative spirit with which they do this.

Looking to the future, it is testament to the work of the Audit Committee since devolution that, when the Assembly Government's executive functions are formally split from the activities of the National Assembly after next May's

Mae pob un wedi arwain at adroddiadau pellach ac argymhellion gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio, neu byddant yn arwain atynt. Byddaf yn cysylltu â'r archwilydd cyffredinol i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu ystyried rhagor o adroddiadau dilynol o'r math yn nhymhorau'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol.

Byddaf yn cloi gyda rhai geiriau o ddiolch. Yn gyntaf, diolchaf i'm cyd-aelodau pwyllgor am eu gwaith caled a'u hymagwedd ddisgybledig. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn, er gwaethaf inni edrych ar ddeunydd â allai beri rhwyg, fod y pwyllgor wedi parhau â'i ddull trawsbleidiol cadarnhaol o weithio. Gweithredu'n amhleidiol yw un o gryfderau mawr y pwyllgor.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi talu teyrnged i effeithiolrwydd y gydberthynas waith agos sydd gennym ag Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru, Jeremy Colman, a'i staff yn Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru. Ailadroddaf hynny heddiw. Mae'r gallu i fanteisio ar eu holl broffesiynoldeb a chywirdeb yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr i allu'r pwyllgor i gyflawni ei swyddogaeth hanfodol. Mae hefyd yn dda nodi bod y budd disgwylidig yn sgîl creu Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru, gyda'i allu i dreiddio i'r sector cyhoeddus cyfan yng Nghymru, yn dod yn fwyfwy amlwg. Mae nifer o adroddiadau'r archwilydd cyffredinol a ystyriwyd gennym yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf wedi elwa ar roi'r darlun llawn yn lleol yn ogystal ag yn genedlaethol.

Yn olaf, diolc unwaith eto i'r uwch swyddogion a'r tystion eraill a ymddangosodd ger ein bron i roi tystiolaeth. Er y cydnabyddaf y gall fod yn anodd iddynt, mae ein tystion bob amser yn rhoi sylwadau defnyddiol a thystiolaeth adeiladol, hyd yn oed pan gânt eu dwyn i gyfrif am broblemau sydd wedi digwydd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn am eu hysbryd cydweithredol wrth ymgymryd â hyn.

Gan edrych i'r dyfodol, mae'n dyst i waith y Comisiwn Archwilio ers datganoli, pan gaiff swyddogaethau gweithredol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eu gwahanu'n ffurfiol oddi wrth weithgareddau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ôl etholiadau mis Mai nesaf, y bydd

elections, legislation specifically protects the Audit Committee as currently constituted. I will not be here to present this report in the future, as I am looking forward to retiring when I stand down next May, but I give all my good wishes to the Chair of the next committee, and to the next committee as a whole.

**Jenny Randerson:** I preface my remarks by referring to what I regard as the tremendous importance of this committee. It has given us hard-hitting but measured reports, which reveal the level of development of some Assembly committees, and the kind of development that we will all have to achieve next May under the new system.

I will address one particular part of the committee's work this year, which relates to the out-of-hours service, and the report on that service in Cardiff. More than £50,000 was paid by Cardiff Local Health Board because it had underestimated the costs and the risks associated with the contract for out-of-hours services through a new commercial company. The committee found that there were serious deficiencies in the checks carried out by the local health board. The report refers to wider issues to be learned on out-of-hours provision, and I will use this opportunity to draw attention to the fact that the out-of-hours problem is not confined to Cardiff.

Whether we represent north or south, east or west Wales, we have had complaints about the out-of-hours service, and whether we live in north or south, east or west Wales, we have paid additional money for that service. In fact, Cardiff has had to provide less additional money than many other local health boards. I will give you some examples. Between 2004 and 2006, Ceredigion paid £700,000 in additional money, Gwynedd paid £1,134,000, Pembrokeshire paid £721,000, Powys paid over £1 million, Rhondda Cynon Taf paid £703,000, Torfaen paid £127,000, and Wrexham paid £470,000. Those are staggering and astonishing figures, and I wonder whether the committee might like to look again at this issue next year to consider how the cost, throughout Wales, of providing out-of-hours services has been so badly estimated. Only Swansea, the Vale of

deddfwriaeth yn diogelu'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn benodol yn ôl y cyfansoddiad cyfredol. Ni fyddaf yma i gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn yn y dyfodol, gan fy mod yn edrych ymlaen at ymddeol fis Mai nesaf, ond dymunaf yn dda i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor nesaf, ac i'r pwyllgor nesaf yn ei gyfarwydd.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cyn gwneud fy sylwadau cyfeiriau at bwysigrwydd aruthrol y pwyllgor hwn yn fy marn i. Mae wedi rhoi adroddiadau beirniadol ond pwylllog i ni, sy'n datgelu lefel datblygiad rhai o bwyllgorau'r Cynulliad, a'r math o ddatblygiad y bydd yn rhaid inni oll ei gyflawni fis Mai nesaf o dan y system newydd.

Ymdriniaf ag un rhan benodol o waith y pwyllgor eleni, sy'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, a'r adroddiad ar y gwasanaeth hwnnw yng Nghaerdydd. Talwyd dros £50,000 gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerdydd am ei fod wedi tanamcangyfrif y costau a'r risgiau a oedd yn gysylltiedig â'r contract ar gyfer gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau drwy gwmni masnachol newydd. Canfu'r cwmni fod diffygion difrifol yn y gwiriadau a wnaed gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol. Cyfeiria'r adroddiad at faterion ehangach i'w dysgu ar ddarpariaeth y tu allan i oriau, a defnyddiaf y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at y ffaith nad yw'r broblem y tu allan i oriau wedi'i chyfyngu i Gaerdydd.

Pa un a ydym yn cynrychioli'r gogledd neu'r de, y dwyrain neu'r gorllewin, yr ydym wedi cael cwynion am y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, a pha un a ydym yn byw yn y gogledd neu'r de, y dwyrain neu'r gorllewin, yr ydym wedi talu arian ychwanegol am y gwasanaeth hwnnw. Yn wir, bu'n rhaid i Gaerdydd ddarparu llai o arian ychwanegol na llawer o fyrdau iechyd lleol eraill. Rhoddaf rai enghreifftiau ichi. Rhwng 2004 a 2006, talodd Ceredigion £700,000 o arian ychwanegol, talodd Gwynedd £1,134,000, talodd sir Benfro £721,000, talodd Powys dros £1 filiwn, talodd Rhondda Cynon Taf £703,000, talodd Tor-faen £127,000, a thalodd Wrecsam £470,000. Mae'r rheini'n ffigurau trawiadol a syfrdanol, a thybed a fyddai'r pwyllgor yn dymuno rhoi sylw eto i'r mater hwn y flwyddyn nesaf i ystyried pam y cafodd y gost, ledled Cymru, o

Glamorgan, Neath Port Talbot, Anglesey, Flintshire and Carmarthenshire have not had to pay additional money in either of the two years. Therefore, Cardiff's £58,000 pales into insignificance.

Therefore, the issue with regard to out-of-hours services is such a Wales-wide issue that, although the Cardiff report was important and significant, it needs to be looked at in a much bigger way and in an all-Wales way. I am speaking today solely as a Cardiff representative and as a health spokesperson, so I will confine my remarks to that.

4.50 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. The Welsh Conservative Party supports the motion and the contents of the report. It is important to recognise the role of the Wales Audit Office during the year, such a short time after it was created, and its staff, who helped to present the reports in order for the committee to undertake its official duties. Similarly, the work of the clerk, the deputy clerk and the committee staff should also be recognised.

I want to focus on the auditor general and recognise the changes that he has brought to the style of reporting and to the assistance and support that are provided to the committee. I think that that has taken the committee on to the second stage of its development, following the excellent work of his predecessor, Sir John Bourn. There is no doubt that the work that the committee does, under the chairmanship of Janet Davies, provides tangible evidence and benefits regarding the advantages of devolution: it can be clearly demonstrated that every penny spent at the Wales Audit Office provides a return of seven times that amount of savings to the public purse. That can then go on to include not only financial savings, but also improvements in policy development, which are received, by and large, in a positive way by the Welsh Assembly Government. The report highlights one example in relation to

ddarparu gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau ei hamcangyfrif mor wael. Yr unig rai na fu'n rhaid iddynt dalu arian ychwanegol yn y naill flwyddyn neu'r llall oedd Abertawe, Bro Morgannwg, Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Ynys Môn, sir y Fflint a sir Gaerfyrddin. Felly, nid yw'r £58,000 a dalwyd gan Gaerdydd mor arwyddocaol â hynny.

Er bod adroddiad Caerdydd yn bwysig ac yn arwyddocaol, mae'r mater o ran gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau yn bwysig ledled Cymru, felly mae angen ei ystyried ar raddfa lawer fwy ac yng nghyd-destun Cymru gyfan. Yr wyf yn siarad heddiw yn benodol fel cynrychiolydd Caerdydd ac fel siaradwr iechyd, felly cyfyngaf fy sylwadau i hynny.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon. Mae Plaid Geidwadol Cymru yn cefnogi'r cynnig a chynnwys yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod rôl Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ystod y flwyddyn, cyn lleied o amser ar ôl iddi gael ei chreu, a'i staff, a helpodd i gyflwyno'r adroddiadau er mwyn i'r pwyllgor allu ymgymryd â'i ddyletswyddau swyddogol. Yn yr un modd, dylid cydnabod gwaith y cler, y dirprwy glerc a staff y pwyllgor hefyd.

Yr wyf am ganolbwyntio ar yr archwilydd cyffredinol a chydabod y newidiadau a wnaeth i'r dull o gyflwyno adroddiadau a'r cymorth a'r gefnogaeth a roddir i'r pwyllgor. Credaf i hynny fynd â'r pwyllgor i ail gam ei ddatblygiad, yn dilyn gwaith ardderchog ei ragflaenydd, Syr John Bourn. Nid oes amheuaeth bod gwaith y pwyllgor, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Janet Davies, yn darparu tystiolaeth a buddiannau pendant o ran manteision datganoli: gellir dangos yn glir bod pob ceiniog a gaiff ei gwario yn Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn rhoi elw saith gwaith drosodd mewn arbedion i bwrs y wlad. Nid dim ond arbedion ariannol a fydd yn deillio o hynny, ond hefyd welliannau o ran datblygu polisiau, a gaiff eu derbyn, ar y cyfan, mewn ffordd gadarnhaol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Mae'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio at un enghraifft mewn perthynas ag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd Cymru ac ymateb Llywodraeth

the Environment Agency Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government's reaction, but that matter was clarified quickly. I think that the Audit Committee and the Assembly Government should receive recognition for the way in which that was received.

In terms of the public policy changes that have taken place in recent times, particularly with the wind up of the quangos and their merger with the Welsh Assembly Government, this will be an enormously challenging time for the committee and the Wales Audit Office in terms of analysing whether the Welsh Assembly Government's analysis of the cost benefits are realised. Of course, that will be in the future, so the report will be conducted with the benefit of hindsight, but it will also provide guidance to any future Government on the way in which it should undertake its duties and go about major reorganisation and merger projects.

There is no doubt that the work that is conducted by the committee is undertaken, accepted and intended on a non party-political basis. I cannot recall one vote being taken at the committee. The work has always been done on a consensual basis, and even when there have been difficulties for some individuals, a form of words has been found that can receive the support of all committee members. That underlines the integrity and strength of the committee.

In closing, I recognise the role played by Janet Davies as Chairman of the Audit Committee. She had a difficult task in the first Assembly in terms of forming the committee, setting the culture and setting the working agenda for the Audit Committee. That was done in an exemplary fashion, demonstrated by the non-voting record of the committee. For a short period, the chair was handed over to the former Assembly Member, Dafydd Wigley, but it was not long before Janet Davies took the reins again and took the committee forward to its second stage of development. I regret that Janet will not be the Chairman after the next Assembly election, but I look forward, with every committee member, to working closely with her between now and then and to continuing the work of the Audit Committee in ensuring that there are better public services for all in

Cynulliad Cymru, ond cafodd hynny ei ddatrys yn gyflym. Credaf y dylai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad cael cydnabyddiaeth am y ffordd y derbyniwyd hynny.

O ran y newidiadau a fu mewn polisiau cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar, yn enwedig o ran diddymu'r cwangos a'u huno â Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, bydd hyn yn amser heriol iawn i'r pwyllgor a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru o ran dadansoddi pa un a gaiff dadansoddiad cost a budd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wireddu. Wrth gwrs, yn y dyfodol y bydd hynny, felly cynhelir yr adroddiad gan arddel ôl-ddoethineb, ond bydd hefyd yn rhoi canllaw i unrhyw Lywodraeth yn y dyfodol ar y ffordd y dylai ymgymryd â'i dyletswyddau a mynd ati i ad-drefnu ac uno prosiectau ar raddfa fawr.

Nid oes amheuaeth y caiff y gwaith a wneir gan y pwyllgor ei gyflawni, ei dderbyn a'i fwriadu ar sail amhleidiol. Ni allaf gofio un bleidlais yn cael ei chymryd yn y pwyllgor. Gwnaed y gwaith bob amser ar sail gydsyniol, a hyd yn oed pan fu anawsterau i rai unigolion, llwyddwyd i eirio rhywbeth a allai gael cefnogaeth holl aelodau'r pwyllgor. Mae hynny'n pwysleisio cywirdeb a chryfder y pwyllgor.

I gloi, cydnabyddaf y rôl a chwaraewyd gan Janet Davies fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Yr oedd ganddi dasg anodd yn y Cynulliad cyntaf o ran ffurfio'r pwyllgor, pennu'r diwylliant a phennu'r agenda waith ar gyfer y Pwyllgor Archwilio. Gwnaed hynny mewn modd rhagorol, a ddangoswyd gan record ddibleidlais y pwyllgor. Am gyfnod byr, trosglwyddwyd y gadeiryddiaeth i gyn Aelod y Cynulliad, Dafydd Wigley, ond nid oedd yn hir cyn i Janet Davies afael yn yr awenau eto ac arwain y pwyllgor i ail gam ei ddatblygiad. Trueni na fydd Janet yn Gadeirydd ar ôl etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad, ond edrychaf ymlaen, ynghyd â phob un o aelodau'r pwyllgor, i weithio'n agos gyda hi rhwng nawr a phryd hynny ac i barhau â gwaith y Pwyllgor Archwilio i sicrhau bod gwell gwasanaethau cyhoeddus i bawb yng Nghymru.



Wales.

**Mick Bates:** It has been a great pleasure to serve under the Chair; as she has pointed out, this is her last report to the Assembly. The way in which the committee has operated, as Alun has said, has been exemplary. The fact that there has been consensus has been due, in large part, to how the Chair has handled the committee. On behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I offer her our thanks for the way in which the committee has been run. Before I move on to detailed matters, I will also add that the auditor general, Jeremy Colman, and his staff provide us with excellent briefings. The function of the whole committee is well integrated. Information is given to us, there is an opportunity to discuss it, and that is an excellent way of operating a committee.

What is so brilliant about receiving this report today, at a time when we are discussing the development of the Assembly for the next session when we will have the power to scrutinise legislation, is that here we have a committee that scrutinises public spending. We hope that that scrutiny leads to an improvement in the quality of the services received by the people of Wales. We share the view that legislation has to undergo the same scrutiny. We hope that that too will improve the lives of the people of Wales.

The scrutiny work of this committee has led to real savings. In fact, the savings mentioned in the report amount to just over £115 million of public money. That, in itself, is evidence that we can measure the outcomes of scrutiny by Assembly Members through the Audit Committee. There is scope for a further £35 million to be saved. Receiving value for money through good management is what we need to maintain throughout all public service providers.

As the Chair mentioned, there have been four major themes to our scrutiny during this Assembly. I will highlight three particular areas where the committee has done good work and where there is tremendous work to do. Many of our recommendations, which are generally accepted by the Government, refer to the way that data is collected. We read, for

**Mick Bates:** Bu'n bleser mawr gwasanaethu o dan ei Chadeiryddiaeth; fel y nododd, dyma yw ei hadroddiad olaf i'r Cynulliad. Bu'r ffordd y gweithredodd y pwyllgor, fel y dywedodd Alun, yn rhagorol. Cafwyd consensws, i raddau helaeth, oherwydd y modd yr ymdriniodd y Cadeirydd â'r pwyllgor. Ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, diolchaf iddi am y ffordd y cafodd y pwyllgor ei redeg. Cyn imi symud ymlaen at faterion manwl, dywedaf hefyd fod yr archwilydd cyffredinol, Jeremy Colman, a'i staff yn rhoi adroddiadau briffio ardderchog inni. Mae swyddogaeth y pwyllgor cyfan wedi'i chyfannu'n dda. Rhoddir gwybodaeth inni, ceir cyfle i'w thrafod, ac mae hynny'n ffordd ardderchog o weithredu pwyllgor.

Yr hyn sydd mor wych ynglŷn â derbyn yr adroddiad hwn heddiw, ar adeg pan ydym yn trafod datblygiad y Cynulliad ar gyfer y sesiwn nesaf pan fydd gennym y pŵer i graffu ar ddeddfwriaeth, yw bod gennym bwyllgor yn awr sy'n craffu ar wariant cyhoeddus. Gobeithiwn y bydd y craffu'n arwain at welliant yn ansawdd y gwasanaethau a dderbynnir gan bobl Cymru. Rhannwn y farn fod angen craffu hefyd ar ddeddfwriaeth. Gobeithiwn y bydd hynny hefyd yn gwella bywydau pobl Cymru.

Mae gwaith craffu'r pwyllgor hwn wedi arwain at arbedion gwirioneddol. Yn wir, mae cyfanswm yr arbedion y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad ychydig dros £115 miliwn o wariant cyhoeddus. Mae hynny, ynddo'i hun, yn dystiolaeth y gallwn fesur canlyniadau craffu gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad drwy'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Mae cyfle i arbed £35 miliwn pellach. Sicrhau gwerth am arian drwy ddulliau rheoli da yw'r hyn y mae angen inni ei gynnal drwy'r holl ddarparwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus.

Fel y crybwyllodd y Cadeirydd, bu pedair thema bwysig i'n gwaith craffu yn ystod y Cynulliad hwn. Cyfeiriaf at dri maes penodol lle y mae'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith da a lle y mae gwaith aruthrol i'w wneud. Mae llawer o'n hargymhellion, a dderbynnir yn gyffredinol gan y Llywodraeth, yn cyfeirio at y ffordd y cesglir data. Darllenwn, er

example, about waiting times, or sickness times in further education, and that there is sometimes not enough investment in detail in terms of the way that data is collected. As someone who represents a constituency right on the border between Wales and England, that position is often aggravated by different systems and by the way in which the whole of the NHS in England is moving towards one system while in Wales we do not seem to be able to obtain that data in a satisfactory way, sometimes even to find out our true waiting times.

The example of waiting times leads me to my second issue, namely the recognition of the good work of this committee. That recognition came in May 2005, when the report on NHS waiting times in Wales was published and the Centre for Public Scrutiny, in its report entitled 'Successful Scrutiny', used this as an example. I draw attention to one sentence from the report, which concluded that the Audit Committee's report,

'played a key role in securing a sea-change in the Welsh Assembly Government's approach to, and focus on, improving waiting times for patients in Wales'.

That is the first step in more improvement for patients waiting in Wales.

Finally, I move on to where there are to be new inquiries and new audits, particularly on flood risk management. Many Members understand the difficulties that have arisen in Wales with some Government planning issues, particularly in relation to technical advice note 15. We need to ensure that there is full scrutiny of the planning undertaken by the Government and the outcomes. All in all, this committee's work is an example of what we want to achieve in the future in terms of the scrutiny of legislation. I hope that the committee builds on the work that has been done by this Chair and this committee.

enghraifft, am amseroedd aros, neu amseroedd salwch mewn addysg bellach, ac weithiau na roddir digon o sylw i'r ffordd y caiff data ei gasglu. Fel rhywun sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth sydd ar y ffin rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, caiff y sefyllfa honno ei gwaethygu'n aml gan systemau gwahanol a chan y ffordd y mae'r GIG cyfan yn Lloegr yn symud tuag at un system tra ymddengys na allwn gasglu'r data hwnnw mewn ffordd foddhaol yng Nghymru, weithiau hyd yn oed er mwyn canfod ein hamseroedd aros gwirioneddol.

Mae'r enghraifft o ran amseroedd aros yn fy arwain at fy ail fater, sef cydnabod gwaith da y pwyllgor hwn. Cafwyd y gydnabyddiaeth honno ym mis Mai 2005, pan gyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad ar amseroedd aros y GIG yng Nghymru a bu i'r Ganolfan Craffu Cyhoeddus ddefnyddio hyn fel enghraifft yn ei hadroddiad, 'Successful Scrutiny'. Cyfeiriaf at un frawddeg o'r adroddiad, a nododd fod adroddiad y Pwyllgor Archwilio,

wedi chwarae rôl allweddol i sicrhau newid sylweddol yn ymagwedd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru tuag at wella amseroedd aros i gleifion yng Nghymru ac yn ei ffocws ar hynny.

Dyna'r cam cyntaf mewn rhagor o welliant i gleifion sydd ar restr aros yng Nghymru.

Yn olaf, af ymlaen i sôn am yr ymchwiliadau a'r archwiliadau newydd a gaiff eu cynnal, yn arbennig o ran rheoli perygl llifogydd. Mae llawer o Aelodau yn deall yr anawsterau sydd wedi codi yng Nghymru ynglŷn â rhai o faterion cynllunio'r Llywodraeth, yn enwedig o ran nodyn cyngor technegol 15. Mae angen inni sicrhau y creffir yn llawn ar y gwaith cynllunio a wneir gan y Llywodraeth a'r canlyniadau. Ar y cyfan, mae gwaith y pwyllgor yn enghraifft o'r hyn yr ydym am ei gyflawni yn y dyfodol o ran craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyllgor yn adeiladu ar y gwaith a wnaed gan y Cadeirydd hwn a'r pwyllgor hwn.

### **Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before we **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn inni gyrraedd

get to the 5 p.m. deadline, I invite the Business Minister, under Standing Order No. 6.21, to propose a 20-minute extension to the session.

terfyn amser 5 p.m, gwahoddaf y Trefnydd, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, i gynnig 20 munud o estyniad i'r sesiwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, under Standing Order No. 6.21 extends the session by 20 minutes.*

*y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ychwanegu 20 munud at hyd y cyfarfod.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I do not think that that is an abuse of Assembly procedures. Are there 10 Members who support this? I see that there are.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Ni chredaf fod hynny'n mynd yn groes i weithdrefnau'r Cynulliad. A oes 10 Aelod sy'n cefnogi hyn? Gwelaf fod.

*Cynnig trefniadol: O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 5.  
Procedural motion: For 30, Abstain 0, Against 5.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

Black, Peter  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Lewis, Huw  
Neagle, Lynne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol y Pwyllgor Archwilio: parhad Annual Report of the Audit Committee: continued**

**Mark Isherwood:** I also start by **Mark Isherwood:** Dechreuaf innau hefyd

commending both the Auditor General for Wales and his team and the Audit Committee Chair and her team for their dedication, support, advice and sheer hard work throughout this year, as before. This report highlights the vital role played by the committee and the Wales Audit Office in scrutinising the Welsh public sector and the Assembly Government and holding them to public account. As we saw with the initial failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to address the issues in the committee report on the regulation of waste management, as highlighted in this report.

5.00 p.m.

As the report states,

‘To provide solutions for a problem, an organisation first needs to understand the scale of it.’

Our reports on protecting NHS staff from violence and aggression and on sickness absence in further education institutions found that the poor quality of data hindered an organisation’s ability to deal with the problems that it faced. They also highlighted the need for the right training to be available at the right time, and the concern that stress is becoming an increasingly large contributor to absence from work, while noting that employers have a legal duty to protect their staff.

When taking evidence on violence against NHS staff, I asked the chief executive of Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust whether he felt appropriately incentivised to record incidents of violence against staff accurately. In his response, he stated that although he did not think that this was an area that lent itself to targeted performance, he agreed that the leaders of NHS trusts should ensure that this was sufficiently high up on their performance management agenda. As the report states, the committee recommended the development of sickness absence reporting systems that record work-related violence as a reason for absence.

The key role of the police in working with

drwy gymeradwyo Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru a'i dîm a Chadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio a'i thîm am eu hymrwymiad, eu cefnogaeth, eu cyngor a'u gwaith caled drwy gydol y flwyddyn, fel o'r blaen. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn amlygu'r rôl hanfodol a chwaraeir gan y pwyllgor a Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru wrth graffu ar y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'u gwneud yn atebol i'r cyhoedd. Fel y gwelwch gyda methiant cychwynnol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i fynd i'r afael â'r materion yn adroddiad y pwyllgor ar reoleiddio'r gwaith o reoli gwastraff, fel yr amlygwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn.

Fel y noda'r adroddiad,

Er mwyn datrys problem, mae angen i sefydliad ddeall maint y broblem i ddechrau.’

Canfu ein hadroddiadau ar ddiogelu staff y GIG rhag trais ac ymosodiad ac ar absenoldeb oherwydd salwch mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach fod ansawdd gwael data yn atal gallu sefydliad i ddelio â'r problemau a wynebair ganddo. Hefyd amlygwyd yr angen i ddarparu'r hyfforddiant cywir ar yr adeg gywir, a'r pryder bod straen yn cyfrannu fwy fwy at absenoldebau o'r gwaith, tra'n nodi bod gan gyflogwyr ddyletswydd gyfreithiol i ddiogelu eu staff.

Wrth gymryd tystiolaeth ar drais yn erbyn staff y GIG, gofynnais i brif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych pa un a oedd yn teimlo'n ddigon cryf i sicrhau bod achosion o drais yn erbyn staff yn cael eu cofnodi'n gywir. Yn ei ymateb, nododd er nad oedd yn teimlo bod hwn yn faes oedd yn addas ar gyfer perfformiad wedi'i dargedu, cytunodd y dylai arweinwyr ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG sicrhau bod y mater yn ddigon uchel ar eu agenda rheoli perfformiad. Fel y noda'r adroddiad, argymhellodd y pwyllgor y dylid datblygu systemau cofnodi absenoldebau oherwydd salwch sy'n cofnodi trais sy'n gysylltiedig â gwaith fel rheswm dros absenoldeb.

Amlygwyd rôl allweddol yr heddlu yn

NHS trusts to protect staff was highlighted, and it is a matter of concern that four NHS trusts reported that police response to violent incidents was unsatisfactory. However, good practice was exhibited by Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust, where a police officer spent 50 per cent of his time in the hospital.

The report on energy and waste management identified the value of collaborative working to enable institutions to share knowledge and resources, and I note that the joint working between the North East Wales Institute for Higher Education and Wrexham County Borough Council was identified as a model of good practice.

During the evidence session on the finances of NHS Wales, I noted that NHS bodies will need to achieve efficiency savings or cuts because new pay contracts for consultants, GPs, NHS staff, pharmacists and dentists had absorbed health funding increases. I asked how this would take account of different current levels of efficiency across NHS bodies. I also asked to what extent resources had been taken away from front-line services by the large number of plans and initiatives launched by the Welsh Assembly Government. In this context, I note that the Audit Committee was told in May that NHS Cymru did not know whether any job losses could be expected, and that managing deficits, new pressures and provision for loan repayment will add to what was diplomatically described as the financial challenge for NHS Wales. No doubt we will revisit this issue in the future.

Other reports have noted deficiencies in risk management and the need for more work on public procurement. As we have heard, the committee's main scrutiny work is focused on sound employment practices, procuring effectively, collaborating with others and managing risks, where the assessment and management of risks lies at the core of the audit function. Risks must be identified, assessed and managed, and full transparency and accountability in the public sector must be ensured among officers and elected

gweithio gydag ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG er mwyn diogelu staff, ac mae'n peri pryder bod pedwar o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG wedi nodi bod ymateb yr heddlu i achosion o drais yn anfodddhaol. Fodd bynnag, gwelwyd arfer da gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Siroedd Conwy a Dinbych, lle treuliodd un swyddog yr heddlu 50 y cant o'i amser yn yr ysbyty.

Nododd yr adroddiad ar reoli ynni a gwastraff werth cydweithio i alluogi sefydliadau i rannu gwybodaeth ac adnoddau, a nodaf i'r cydweithio rhwng Athrofa Addysg Uwch Gogledd Ddwyrain Cymru a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam gael ei ddefnyddio fel enghraifft o arfer da.

Yn ystod y sesiwn dystiolaeth ar gyllid y GIG yng Nghymru, nodais y bydd angen i gyrff y GIG gyflawni arbedion effeithlonrwydd neu doriadau oherwydd bod y cynnydd mewn arian iechyd wedi mynd ar gontractau cyflog newydd i ymgynghorwyr, meddygon teulu, staff y GIG, fferyllwyr a deintyddion. Gofynnais sut y byddai hyn yn ystyried lefelau effeithlonrwydd presennol gwahanol ar draws cyrff y GIG. Gofynnais hefyd i ba raddau y cymerwyd adnoddau oddi ar wasanaethau llinell flaen oherwydd y nifer fawr o gynlluniau a mentrau a lansiwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Yn y cyddestun hwn, nodaf y dywedwyd wrth y Pwyllgor Archwilio ym mis Mai nad oedd y GIG yng Nghymru yn gwybod pa un a ddylid disgwyl unrhyw achosion o golli swyddi, ac y bydd diffyg o ran rheoli, pwysau newydd a darpariaeth ar gyfer ad-dalu benthyciadau yn ychwanegu at yr hyn a ddisgrifiwyd yn ddiplomyddol fel yr her ariannol i'r GIG yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn sicr o ailystyried y mater hwn yn y dyfodol.

Mae adroddiadau eraill wedi nodi diffygion yn y broses o reoli risgiau a'r angen am fwy o waith ar gaffael cyhoeddus. Fel y clywyd, mae prif waith craffu'r pwyllgor yn canolbwyntio ar arferion cyflogaeth cadarn, caffael yn effeithiol, cydweithio ag eraill a rheoli risgiau, ac mae'r gwaith o asesu a rheoli risgiau yn ganolog i'r broses o archwilio. Rhaid nodi risgiau, eu hasesu a'u rheoli, a rhaid sicrhau tryloywder ac atebolrwydd llawn yn y sector cyhoeddus ymysg swyddogion ac aelodau etholedig ar

members at every level. Secrecy and bad practice must be rooted out and good practice must be identified and shared. Therefore, the work of the Audit Committee will become ever more important as the Assembly moves forward to gaining ever greater powers.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** The Audit Committee plays an essential role in scrutinising the way in which public sector bodies in Wales maintain high standards of financial accountability and value for money. Alun summed it up by saying that the Audit Committee has a role to play in ensuring that we have better public services in Wales. On behalf of my colleagues in the Assembly Government, we are grateful to Janet Davies. I wish to pay tribute to Janet in her role as Chair of the Audit Committee, as other Members have done. I know that her fellow committee members also play an important role, but we must acknowledge the contribution that Janet has made and we wish her well in the future in terms of her retirement. I also echo Janet's comments about thanking those who have supported her, and the fact that she has delivered this non-partisan operation. Again, that is due to leadership on her behalf. It is the committee's great strength.

The Assembly Government welcomes the constructive advice and recommendations included in the committee's reports throughout the year. Jenny referred to them as hard-hitting but measured reports. We share the committee's objective of working to continually improve standards in the stewardship of public money in Wales. Therefore, we take pride in the fact that the Auditor General for Wales has expressed the view that, for at least the past five years, the standard of financial management and probity in central Government and the NHS sectors is high, and Members have taken the opportunity to draw attention to other matters that might have been, and might further be, considered by the Audit Committee in relation to the NHS and other services. However, in seeking to build on this achievement, the committee and the Government alike continue to give careful consideration to the recommendations. We in the Government will table responses to

bob lefel. Rhaid dileu cyfrinachedd ac arfer gwael a rhaid nodi a rhannu arfer da. Felly, bydd gwaith y Pwyllgor Archwilio mor bwysig ag erioed wrth i'r Cynulliad symud ymlaen i ennill mwy a mwy o bwerau.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae'r Pwyllgor Archwilio yn chwarae rhan hanfodol yn y gwaith o graffu ar y ffordd y mae cyrff y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru yn cynnal safonau uchel o atebolrwydd ariannol a gwerth am arian. Crynhowyd hyn gan Alan drwy ddweud bod gan y Pwyllgor Archwilio ran i'w chwarae yn y gwaith o sicrhau bod gennym wasanaethau cyhoeddus gwell yng Nghymru. Ar ran fy nghyd-Aelodau yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, hoffwn ddiolch i Janet Davies. Hoffwn ddiolch i Janet am ei gwaith fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill. Gwn fod ei chyd-aelodau yn y pwyllgor hefyd yn chwarae rhan bwysig, ond rhaid inni gydnabod y cyfraniad a wnaeth Janet a hoffem ddymuno'n dda iddi yn y dyfodol ar ôl iddi ymddeol. Hoffwn hefyd ategu sylwadau Janet ynghylch diolch i'r rhai a'i chefnogodd, a'r ffaith iddi sicrhau'r ymagwedd amhleidiol hon. Unwaith eto, mae hynny o ganlyniad i'w harweiniad. Dyma brif gryfder y pwyllgor.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu'r cyngor a'r argymhellion adeiladol a gafodd eu cynnwys yn adroddiadau'r pwyllgor drwy gydol y flwyddyn. Cyfeiriodd Jenny atynt fel adroddiadau beirniadol ond pwylllog. Rhannwn amcan y pwyllgor o weithio i barhau i wella safonau yn stiwardiaeth arian cyhoeddus yng Nghymru. Felly, ymfalchïwn yn y ffaith i Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru fynegi y bu safon rheolaeth ac uniondeb ariannol mewn Llywodraeth ganolog a sectorau'r GIG yn uchel dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf o leiaf, a bod Aelodau wedi cymryd y cyfle i dynnu sylw at faterion eraill y gallai'r Pwyllgor Archwilio fod wedi eu hystyried mewn perthynas â'r GIG a gwasanaethau eraill, ac a allai gael eu hystyried eto. Fodd bynnag, wrth geisio adeiladu ar y cyflawniad hwn, mae'r pwyllgor a'r Llywodraeth yn parhau i roi ystyriaeth fanwl i'r argymhellion. Yn y Llywodraeth byddwn yn cyflwyno ymatebion i adroddiadau sy'n glir ac yn benodol, a

reports that are clear and focused, and we will be diligent in monitoring progress on the implementation of its recommendations.

**Janet Davies:** I thank everybody for their contributions, and particularly for their exceedingly kind words. The only issue that I need to take out of the debate is that raised by Jenny Randerson about the out-of-hours contracts, which concern me greatly—we accept this, Jenny. I will discuss this matter with the Auditor General when I meet him next week to see which is the best way to take it forward. Thank you for bringing that to my attention.

byddwn yn monitro'r cynnydd a wneir wrth weithredu'r argymhellion yn fanwl.

**Janet Davies:** Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau, ac yn enwedig am eu geiriau caredig iawn. Yr unig fater y mae angen imi ei godi o'r ddadl hon yw'r mater a godwyd gan Jenny Randerson ynghylch y contractau allan o oriau, sy'n peri pryder mawr imi—derbyniwn hyn, Jenny. Byddaf yn trafod y mater hwn gyda'r Archwilydd Cyffredinol pan fyddaf yn cwrdd ag ef yr wythnos nesaf i weld beth yw'r ffordd orau o ddelio â hyn. Diolch am dynnu fy sylw at hynny.

*Cynnig (NDM3204): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3204): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Remploy—Y Ddadl dros Gefnogi Remploy—The Case for Support**

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch i'r Aelodau hynny sydd wedi aros ar gyfer y ddadl fer hon. Mae pwnc y ddadl yn ymwneud â llawer o etholaethau. Mae ffatri Remploy ym Mrynaman, yn fy etholaeth, ac mae ffatrïoedd hefyd yn Abertyleri, Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, Crymlyn yng Nghasnewydd, Merthyr Tudful—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Jenny, it is not permitted for Members to stand in the Chamber during proceedings. Sorry about that.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae ffatrïoedd yng Nghastell-nedd, yn y Porth ac yn Nhrefforest yn y Rhondda, yn ogystal ag yn Abertawe, Ystalyfera ac Ystradgynlais. Mae'r ffatrïoedd hyn yn cynnig gwasanaeth arbennig o bwysig. Pan gefais fy ethol gyntaf i'r Cynulliad yn 1999, un o'r pethau cyntaf a wneuthum oedd mynd i'r ffatri ym Mrynaman, a oedd, bryd hynny, dan fygythiad. O siarad â'r bobl yno, sylweddolais fod y bobl a gyflogid yn y ffatri yn cael ystyr i'w bywydau yn sgil y gwaith yr oeddynt yn ei wneud, sef paratoi dodrefn i safon dda iawn—dodrefn arbennig at ddefnydd swyddfeydd ac ysgolion oeddynt. Wedi dychwelyd i'r gymuned ym Mrynaman, a siarad â rhieni, yn aml, a pherthnasau'r bobl hynny, sylweddolais fod y gymuned gyfan yn dibynnu ar y ffatri yno. Bryd hynny, yr oedd sôn am gyfuno rhai o'r ffatrïoedd, a sôn hefyd am y posibilrwydd y byddai'r gweithwyr yn teithio i ffatri gyfagos os oeddynt am barhau i gael eu cyflogi gan Remploy. Wrth gwrs, o ystyried anghenion arbennig y bobl hynny, byddai teithio yn y modd hwnnw yn gwbl anymarferol. Eto i gyd, yr oedd y bygythiad yn aros, fel y bygythiad i nifer o ffatrïoedd eraill, a gwn fod Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad wedi bod yn brwydro i gadw ffatrïoedd yn eu hetholaethau hwy am yr union reswm hwnnw, sef bod y gyflogaeth a gynigir yn y ffatrïoedd hyn yn

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I thank the Members who have stayed for this short debate. The subject of the debate involves many constituencies. There is a Remploy factory in Brynaman, in my constituency, and there are also factories in Abertillery, Bridgend, Crumlin in Newport, Merthyr Tydfil—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Jenny, ni chaniateir i Aelodau sefyll yn y Siambr yn ystod trafodion. Ymddiheuriadau am hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** There are factories in Neath, Porth and in Treforest in the Rhondda, as well as in Swansea, Ystalyfera and Ystradgynlais. These factories provide a vital service. When I was first elected to the Assembly in 1999, one of the first things that I did was go to the factory in Brynaman, which was at risk at the time. Having spoken to the staff there, I realised that the people employed at the factory had found meaning in their lives as a result of working there, which was manufacturing furniture to a very high standard—it was furniture made specially for offices and schools. Upon my return to the community in Brynaman to talk with the parents, often, and relatives of those people, I realised that the entire community depended on that factory. At the time, there was talk of integrating some of the factories, and also of the possibility of workers travelling to a factory nearby if they wanted to continue to be employed by Remploy. Of course, given the special needs of those people, travelling in such a manner would be totally impractical. However, the threat remained, as did the threat to many other factories, and I know that other Assembly Members have been fighting to keep factories in their constituencies open for precisely the same reason, namely that the employment offered in these factories is unique and special. I am pleased to say that I



unigryw ac yn arbennig. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y bu imi lwyddo, fel y gwnaeth Aelodau eraill, i sicrhau bod y ffatrioedd yn aros ar agor ar y pryd. Fodd bynnag, saith mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, yr ydym yn ôl yn yr un sefyllfa, ac mae bygythiad o'r newydd.

5.10 p.m.

Pan ofynnwyd cwestiwn i brif weithredwr Remploy ynglŷn â pha ffatrioedd sydd dan fygythiad, nid oedd yn gallu rhoi ateb, yn ôl y senario sydd wedi'i gynnig—ac mae sawl senario wedi'i gynnig ynglŷn â dyfodol Remploy yn ddiweddar, yn amrywio o gadw'r ffatrioedd fel ag y maent i hyd yn oed gau'r ffatrioedd i gyd a chanolbwyntio yn unig ar arallgyfeirio pobl i swyddi eraill y tu allan i'r ffatrioedd. Fodd bynnag, mae senario yn y canol sy'n sôn am leihau nifer y safleoedd, ac mae sôn am 37 o ffatrioedd yn cau drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig. Fodd bynnag, pan ofynnwyd y cwestiwn i'r prif weithredwr, dywedodd nad oedd yn gallu dweud wrthym ba ffatrioedd oedd o dan fygythiad, ac felly mae'n rhaid inni dderbyn bod y ffatrioedd yr ydym ni'n eu cynrychioli ymysg y rhai hynny sydd o dan fygythiad.

Nid oes problem gennyf gyda'r gwaith y mae Remploy Interwork, a sefydlwyd yn 1988, yn ei gyflawni. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, 2005-06, llwyddodd i leoli 4,300 o bobl mewn swyddi y tu allan i'r ffatrioedd a'u cael i weithio i gwmnïau fel BT ac Asda a nifer o gwmnïau eraill. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw i'w glodfori. Yr ydym i gyd am weld Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 2005 yn cael ei gweithredu, fel bod pobl sydd ag anghenion arbennig yn cael chwarae teg a chyfle cyfartal a bod eu gobeithion o ran derbyn swyddi yn cael eu hyrwyddo. Mae Remploy Interwork yn gobeithio, erbyn 2010, y gall gyfeirio 20,000 o bobl y flwyddyn i swyddi mewn cyflogaeth gyffredinol. Yr ydym yn sicr yn gobeithio y bydd yn gallu gwireddu'r nod hwnnw.

Er mwyn cyflawni hynny, mae wedi dod i gytundeb gyda'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith ac mae'r cytundeb hwnnw yn dwyn ffrwyth. Mae ymgais i gynyddu sgiliau pobl ac i gynnig hyfforddiant iddynt ac mae rhaglenni recriwtio ar gael. Mae hynny i gyd i'w ganmol. Mae wedi sefydlu canolfannau

succeeded, as did other Members, to ensure that the factories remained open at the time. However, seven years later, we are back to square one, and we face a new threat.

When the chief executive of Remploy was asked which factories were faced with closure, he was not able to answer, according to the scenario that has been put—and many scenarios have been suggested recently for the future of Remploy, ranging from keeping these factories as they are to closing all factories and concentrating efforts only on referring people to other jobs outside the factories. However, there is a middle-ground scenario that involves reducing the number of sites, and there is also talk of closing 37 factories throughout the United Kingdom. However, when the question was put to the chief executive, he said that he could not tell us which factories were faced with closure, and so we must accept that those factories that we represent are among those that are under threat.

I do not have a problem with the work that Remploy Interwork, established in 1988, has achieved. In the last financial year, 2005-06, it managed to find placements for 4,300 people in jobs outside the factories, and in the employ of companies such as BT and Asda, as well as many others. That work is to be commended. We all want to see the Disability Discrimination Act 2005 working to ensure that people with special needs get fair play and are given equal opportunities, and that their aspirations for getting jobs are given a boost. Remploy Interwork hopes to be able to find posts in general employment for 20,000 people each year, by 2010. We certainly hope that it will be able to turn that aim into reality.

In order to achieve that, it has come to an agreement with the Jobcentre, which is reaping rewards. There is an attempt to improve people's skills and to offer them training. There are also recruitment programmes on offer. That is all to be applauded. It has set up centres in many cities

mewn nifer o ddinasoedd yn y Deyrnas Unedig: un ym Mirmingham, un ym Mhlymouth ac un yn Leeds. Nid oes un yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd ac yr wyf yn mawr obeithio y bydd un yng Nghymru cyn bo hir ac y byddwn yn gweld hyn yn cynyddu a'r nod hwn yn cael ei gyrraedd drwy'r Deyrnas Unedig, yn ogystal â chynnydd cyfatebol yng Nghymru.

Mae'n rhaid inni gofio pam y sefydlwyd Remploy yn y lle cyntaf. Daeth i fodolaeth yn dilyn yr adolygiad anabledd cyflogaeth a Deddf Pobl Anabl (Cyflogaeth) 1944, o dan y Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros lafur ar y pryd, sef Ernest Bevin. Fe'i ffurfiwyd yn Ebrill 1945 ac agorodd y ffatri gyntaf yn 1946. Bryd hynny, yr oedd y ffatri yn cynhyrchu dodrefn a ffidilau—nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r cysylltiad, ac ni allaf feddwl am unrhyw ffatri Remploy sy'n cynhyrchu ffidilau ar hyn o bryd, ond mae dodrefn yn cael eu cynhyrchu ym Mrynaman ac mewn mannau eraill. Y bwriad ar y pryd, yn sicr yn y blynyddoedd cynnar wedi'r ail ryfel byd, oedd cynnig rhyw fath o gyfle i bobl oedd wedi bod yn y lluoedd arfog, ac wedi dioddef o ganlyniad i hynny, gael gwaith. Fodd bynnag, ehangodd y ddarpariaeth ac mae'r ffatrioedd hynny, byth er hynny, wedi bod yn cyflawni gwaith eithriadol o bwysig.

Credaf fod cyfrifoldeb arnom. Cofiaf un o'r pethau cyntaf a wnes fel Aelod o'r Cynulliad. Yr oeddwn yn ymhyfrydu ynddo ar y pryd oherwydd bu imi ddechrau ymwneud â gwleidyddiaeth, fel pawb yn y Siambr, credaf—o ba blaid bynnag—er mwyn sicrhau bod darpariaeth ar gyfer pawb yng Nghymru, yn ôl eu hanghenion. Yr ydym yn arbennig yn teimlo cyfrifoldeb dros gynorthwyo'r bobl hynny sydd ag anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru. Yr wyf yn dod i hynny o safbwynt athrawiaeth Gristnogol; daw eraill ato oherwydd athroniaeth wleidyddol neu ymwybyddiaeth o ddinasyddiaeth ac ymdeimlad dyngarol. Gobeithiaf fod y cymhelliad hwnnw yn rhywbeth y gallwn ei rannu.

Yng nghyd-destun y ffatrioedd hyn, mae cyfrifoldeb arbennig arnom i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Rhaid inni gofio o ba le y daeth yr alwad am newid. Daeth oherwydd bod y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros

in the UK: one in Birmingham, one in Plymouth, and one in Leeds. There is not one in Wales at present, but I hope very much that there will be soon, and that we will see this gathering momentum with the target reached throughout the UK, as well as seeing a corresponding increase in Wales.

We must remember why Remploy was set up in the first place. It came to being following the employment disability review and the Disabled Persons (Employment) Act 1944, under the Minister of Labour at the time, Ernest Bevin. It was formed in April 1945 and the first factory was opened in 1946. At that time, the factory was manufacturing furniture and violins—I am not sure what the connection is, and I cannot think of a single Remploy factory that still produces violins, but furniture is manufactured at Brynamman and on other sites. The aim at the time, certainly in the early years following the second world war, was to provide some kind of opportunity to find work for people who had been in the armed forces and who had suffered as a result. However, provision was extended and, ever since, those factories have been doing work that is extremely important.

I believe that we have a responsibility. I remember one of the first things that I did as an Assembly Member. I revelled in it at the time, because I was just starting to get involved in politics, like everyone in the Chamber, I think—from whatever party—to ensure that there was provision for everyone in Wales according to their needs. In particular, we feel a responsibility to help those with special needs in Wales. I approach that from the perspective of Christian philosophy; others will approach it from a political philosophy or an awareness of citizenship and a humanitarian perspective. I hope that we can all share in that.

In the context of these factories, we have a particular responsibility to ensure that that happens. We must remember from where the call for change came. It came about because the Minister with responsibility for disability

faterion anabledd yn San Steffan, Anne McGuire, wedi ymateb i adroddiad gan swyddfa'r archwilydd yn Llundain a alwodd, yng nghyd-destun Remploy, am gael sicrhau mwy o werth am arian a mwy o bwyslais ar gyfeirio pobl tuag at gyflogaeth ym maes cyflogaeth gyffredinol yn hytrach nag mewn ffatrioedd arbennig. Pe bawn yn ymdrin â chwmni masnachol, credwn y byddai'r casgliadau hynny yn ddigon teg. Ceir marchnad, a rhaid i unrhyw gwmni ymateb i'r farchnad. Fodd bynnag, yn y cyd-destun hwn, ni chredaf ein bod yn sôn am gwmni masnachol arferol. Yr ydym yn sôn am gwmni a ffurfiwyd gyda chefnogaeth Llywodraeth San Steffan i gyflawni pwrpas a bwriad arbennig, ac mae'r anghenion hynny yn parhau. Ni fydd pawb yn gallu cymryd y cyfleoedd y mae Remploy Interwork yn eu cynnig iddynt.

Y rheswm dros y ddadl hon—

**Leanne Wood:** Will you take an intervention?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I do not think that you are allowed to intervene at this stage. However, I am quite happy to offer you a minute at the end, Leanne. I have already promised a minute each to Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams and Leighton Andrews. You are welcome to have a minute as well, and I will make sure that I finish in time for you all to have your minute.

Sefydlwyd y cwmni hwn am resymau arbennig, ac mae'r anghenion hynny yn parhau hyd heddiw. Galwaf ar Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru i ymateb i'r sialens o gefnogi'r ffatrioedd hyn. Yr wyf yn tybio mai chi sy'n ymateb i'r ddadl hwn, Weinidog. Mae hynny'n briodol iawn gan fod nifer o'r ffatrioedd hyn, gan gynnwys ffatri Brynman, yn cynhyrchu dodrefn ar gyfer ysgolion. Byddai'n braf iawn pe bai Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau bod y dodrefn hynny yn cael eu gwerthu i'n hysgolion. Yn fwy na hynny, o ran addysg gydol oes, byddwn yn dadlau y byddai'n dda pe bai ysgolion lleol yn creu cysylltiad â ffatrioedd Remploy fel eu bod yn gallu gweld y gwaith a gyflawnir yno a'r cynigion o ran gobaith am swyddi ac ystyr i fywyd sy'n cael eu sicrhau i'r bobl sydd yno.

issues in Westminster, Anne McGuire, responded to a report by the auditor's office in London that called, in the context of Remploy, for greater value for money and a greater emphasis on directing people into general employment rather than into specialist factories. Were we dealing with a commercial company, I think that those conclusions would be fair enough. There is a market, and companies must respond to the market. However, in this case, I do not believe that we are talking about an ordinary commercial company. We are talking about a company that was formed with the support of the Westminster Government in order to achieve a particular aim, and the need for that continues. Not everyone can take up the opportunities that Remploy Interwork offers them.

The reason for holding this debate—

**Leanne Wood:** A dderbyniwch ymyriad?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Ni chredaf y caniateir ichi ymyrryd ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn eithaf bodlon cynnig munud ichi ar y diwedd, Leanne. Yr wyf wedi addo munud yr un eisoes i Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams a Leighton Andrews. Mae croeso i chi gael munud hefyd, a byddaf yn sicrhau fy mod yn dod i ben mewn pryd i bob un ohonoch gael munud yr un.

This company was established for particular reasons, and the need for that continues today. I call on the National Assembly for Wales to respond to the challenge of supporting these factories. I assume that you will be responding to this debate, Minister. It is appropriate that you should, as many of these factories, including that at Brynman, make school furniture. It would be good if the Welsh Assembly Government could ensure that that furniture is sold to our schools. In addition, in terms of lifelong learning, I would argue that it would be good if local schools were to establish a link with Remploy factories so that they could go and see the work done there and the opportunities they offer in terms of job prospects and a meaningful life.

Felly, gobeithiaf y gall pawb sydd yma y prynhawn yma gefnogi'r cais syml hwn. Gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog wneud hynny a dadlau gyda'i chyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet er mwyn sicrhau bod y cynnig a'r cyfle hwnnw ar gael, a bod y ffatrioedd hyn yn parhau i fod ar agor.

Cynigiad funud bob un i Leanne Wood, Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams a Leighton Andrews yn y pedair munud union sy'n weddill.

**Leanne Wood:** Rhodri Glyn Thomas outlined the Westminster Government's approach to this company and the reasons for this current review. As most people know, very few reviews result in the rolling out of successful projects; they usually result in some kind of cutbacks to services. In my intervention, I was going to ask Rhodri Glyn what the Welsh Assembly Government can do should the review conclude that factories need to close. For example, procurement in the public sector could be one good way of ensuring stability and security for the company and its workforce. I would like to hear what the Minister has to say about that.

**Nick Bourne:** I thank Rhodri Glyn for bringing this issue to the Assembly. It is a timely and important issue. Like everyone here, I have visited many Remploy factories throughout my region. I have visited the Brynamman Remploy in Rhodri Glyn's constituency. It is vital that we have an input into this review. Under successive Governments—and this all started under a national Government during the war—there has been support for Remploy. I very much agree with what Rhodri Glyn has said about the social importance of this; it is not just a question of economics—far from it. We need to make sure that this continues in the way that it has continued so successfully. It does fantastic work.

5.20 p.m.

I agree with what has been said about jobs in the community, but we must underpin their

Therefore, I hope that everyone here this afternoon will support this simple request. I hope that the Minister will be able to do that and persuade her Cabinet colleagues to ensure that these factories remain open, so that the opportunities they offer continue to be available.

I offer a minute each to Leanne Wood, Nick Bourne, Kirsty Williams and Leighton Andrews from the four minutes remaining.

**Leanne Wood:** Amlinellodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas ymagwedd Llywodraeth San Steffan tuag at y cwmni hwn a'r rhesymau dros yr adolygiad presennol hwn. Fel y gŵyr y rhan fwyaf o bobl, ychydig iawn o adolygiadau sy'n arwain at gyflwyno prosiectau llwyddiannus; fel arfer maent yn arwain at ryw fath o doriadau mewn gwasanaethau. Yn fy ymyriad, yr oeddwn yn mynd i ofyn i Rhodri Glyn beth y gallai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei wneud pe bai'r adolygiad yn dod i'r casgliad bod angen i ffatrioedd gau. Er enghraifft, gallai caffael yn y sector cyhoeddus fod yn un ffordd o sicrhau sefydlogrwydd a sicrwydd i'r cwmni a'i weithlu. Hoffwn glywed yr hyn sydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud ynghylch hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolchaf i Rhodri Glyn am ddod â'r mater hwn gerbron y Cynulliad. Mae'n fater amserol a phwysig. Fel pawb yma, yr wyf wedi ymweld â sawl ffatri Remploy ledled fy rhanbarth. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â ffatri Remploy ym Mrynaman yn etholaeth Rhodri Glyn. Mae'n hollbwysig ein bod yn cyfrannu i'r adolygiad hwn. O dan Lywodraethau dilynol—a dechreuodd hyn oll o dan Lywodraeth genedlaethol yn ystod y rhyfel—cafwyd cefnogaeth i Remploy. Cytunaf i raddau helaeth â'r hyn y mae Rhodri Glyn wedi'i ddweud ynghylch y pwysigrwydd cymdeithasol sy'n gysylltiedig â hyn; nid oes a wnelo ag economeg yn unig—o bell ffordd. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod hyn yn parhau yn y ffordd mae wedi parhau a hynny mor llwyddiannus. Gwna waith ardderchog.

Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedwyd ynghylch swyddi yn y gymuned, ond rhaid inni ategu

future by some guarantee of input from this Government to the Westminster Government so that we can ensure that they continue for the future. They have been going for 63 years; they need to be going for another 63 and beyond. I commend Rhodri Glyn for bringing this forward.

**Kirsty Williams:** I also thank Rhodri Glyn for making such a powerful case on behalf of the employees of Remploy's factories in Wales. Ystradgynlais and Brynamman may look close on the map but, as those of us who represent those areas know, they might as well be a million miles away from each other for the people who work in those factories. While it is right that Remploy takes every opportunity to support people in looking to join the regular labour market, with job opportunities, and the right kind of support in building confidence and self-esteem, we must acknowledge that, for some of the people employed in those factories, being there is about the most that they can manage. The fear that many of them feel about their prospects is criminal, and we must do all that we can to secure their future.

**Leighton Andrews:** I also thank Rhodri Glyn for bringing this issue to our attention. I have visited the Remploy factory in Dinas, in my constituency, on a number of occasions and one of the important developments there relates to how the work undertaken has been moved up the value chain, if you like, so they are now looking at the disposal of computer equipment, data management and asset tracking—work that represents a business with a long-term future. I was pleased with the responses that I had from the Assembly Government and Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council when I approached them about the possibility of that factory being incorporated into future public procurement bids and tenders in that area. Working with the Member of Parliament for the Rhondda, Chris Bryant, we have made representations in support of the union campaign to keep the Remploy factories open, and I know that the Member of Parliament has also made contact with the Westminster Government about this issue.

**The Minister for Education, Lifelong**

eu dyfodol gan ryw sicrwydd o gyfraniad gan y Llywodraeth hon i Lywodraeth San Steffan fel y gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn parhau yn y dyfodol. Maent wedi bodoli ers 63 mlynedd; mae angen iddynt barhau am 63 mlynedd arall a thu hwnt. Cymeradwyaf Rhodri Glyn am ddod â'r mater hwn ger ein bron.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolchaf innau hefyd i Rhodri Glyn am gyflwyno dadl mor bwerus ar ran cyflogeion ffatrioedd Remploy yng Nghymru. Efallai fod Ystradgynlais a Brynaman yn edrych yn agos ar y map ond, fel y gŵyr y rhai ohonom sy'n cynrychioli'r ardaloedd hynny, cystal iddynt fod filiwn o filltiroedd i ffwrdd oddi wrth ei gilydd i'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y ffatrioedd hynny. Er ei bod yn gywir bod Remploy yn manteisio ar bob cyfle i helpu pobl i ymuno â'r farchnad lafur reolaidd, drwy roi cyfleoedd gwaith, a'r math cywir o gymorth i feithrin hyder a hunan-dyb, rhaid inni gydnabod, i rai o'r bobl a gyflogir yn y ffatrioedd hynny, mai'r ffaith eu bod yna yw'r mwyaf y gallant ei wneud. Mae'r ofn y mae llawer ohonynt yn ei deimlo ynghylch eu rhagolygon yn ofnadwy, a rhaid inni wneud popeth a allwn i ddiogelu eu dyfodol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolchaf innau hefyd i Rhodri Glyn am ddwyn y mater hwn i'n sylw. Yr wyf wedi ymweld â ffatri Remploy yn Ninas, yn fy etholaeth, sawl gwaith ac mae a wnelo un o'r datblygiadau pwysig yno â sut y mae'r gwaith a gyflawnir wedi dringo'r gadwyn werth, os mynnwch, felly maent bellach yn ystyried gwaredu offer cyfrifiadurol, rheoli data ac olrhain asedau—gwaith sy'n golygu busnes â dyfodol hirdymor. Yr oeddwn yn fodlon ar yr ymatebion a gefais gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf pan gysylltais â hwy ynghylch y posibilrwydd o gynnwys y ffatri honno mewn cynigion a thendrau caffael cyhoeddus yn yr ardal honno yn y dyfodol. Gan gydweithio a'r Aelod Seneddol dros y Rhondda, Chris Bryant, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno sylwadau i gefnogi ymgyrch yr undeb i gadw ffatrioedd Remploy ar agor, a gwn fod yr Aelod Seneddol hefyd wedi cysylltu â Llywodraeth San Steffan ynghylch y mater hwn.

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol**

**Learning and Skills (Jane Davidson):** I join in the chorus of thanks to Rhodri Glyn Thomas for bringing this debate before us today. Not only am I personally a strong supporter of Remploy and the Treforest factory in my constituency, which I have visited on many occasions, but this Government is also a strong supporter of Remploy, and fully recognises its vital role in providing employment support for disabled people throughout Wales.

There is a current understandable uncertainty among the employees, staff and management at Remploy about the possible outcomes of the review process that the company is undergoing. I have received a small number of letters from Assembly Members to that effect, and I have also encountered such views on the doorsteps of Pontypridd when undertaking doorstep surgeries. I currently have a personal debt to Remploy as AM for Pontypridd and as Minister for education, because when, sadly, a school in my constituency burned down some weeks ago, Remploy provided the furniture to furnish the replacement school in Graig-y-Wion, enabling pupils to continue with their schooling. Remploy has been working closely with this Assembly Government and other public bodies in Wales.

I assure Members that this Assembly Government continues to liaise closely with the Department for Work and Pensions and Remploy on the progress of the review. I have met Bob Warner, its chief executive, and I have corresponded with Guy Phillips, the company secretary with responsibility for Wales. I have also corresponded with the DWP Minister for disabled people, Anne McGuire. We are pressing the DWP to ensure that Remploy continues to play an active and vital role in Wales, supporting those people with complex needs who face the greatest barriers to work.

Our approach to build on the active involvement with Remploy, which has developed over recent years, is to link our policy agenda in Wales with the provision offered by the company and other key organisations, such as Jobcentre Plus. Members will know that Remploy is a key

**Oes a Sgiliau (Jane Davidson):** Ymunaf â'r bobl eraill sydd wedi diolch i Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ddod â'r ddadl hon ger ein bron heddiw. Nid yn unig yr wyf yn gefnogwr brwd o Remploy a'r ffatri yn Nhrefforest yn fy etholaeth, yr wyf wedi ymweld â hi sawl gwaith, ond mae'r Llywodraeth hon hefyd yn gefnogwr brwd o Remploy, ac yn cydnabod yn llawn ei rôl hollbwysig wrth roi cymorth cyflogaeth i bobl anabl ledled Cymru.

Mae ansicrwydd ar hyn o bryd ymhlith cyflogeion, staff a rheolwyr Remploy, a hynny'n ddealladwy, ynghylch canlyniadau posibl y broses adolygu a gynhelir yn y cwmni. Yr wyf wedi cael nifer fach o lythyrau gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad i'r perwyl hwnnw, ac yr wyf hefyd wedi clywed barn o'r fath ar garreg drws cartrefi ym Mhontypridd wrth imi gynnal cymorthfeydd carreg drws. Ar hyn o bryd, yr wyf yn ddyledus yn bersonol i Remploy fel AC dros Bontypridd ac fel Gweinidog dros addysg, oherwydd, pan losgodd ysgol yn fy etholaeth rai wythnosau yn ôl, darparodd Remploy y dodrefn ar gyfer yr ysgol newydd yng Ngrraig-y-Wion, gan alluogi'r disgyblion i barhau â'u haddysg. Bu Remploy yn cydweithio'n agos â'r Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon a chyrrff cyhoeddus eraill yng Nghymru.

Sicrhaf Aelodau fod y Llywodraeth Cynulliad hon yn parhau i gydweithio'n agos â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a Remploy o ran yr adolygiad. Yr wyf wedi cyfarfod â Bob Warner, ei brif weithredwr, ac yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Guy Phillips, ysgrifennydd y cwmni sy'n gyfrifol am Gymru. Yr wyf hefyd wedi ysgrifennu at Weinidog yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau dros bobl anabl, Anne McGuire. Yr ydym yn pwysu ar yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i sicrhau bod Remploy yn parhau i chwarae rhan allweddol yng Nghymru, gan gefnogi'r bobl hynny ag anghenion cymhleth sy'n wynebu'r rhwystrau mwyaf i weithio.

Yr ydym yn meithrin y cyfranogiad brwd gyda Remploy, sydd wedi datblygu yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, drwy gysylltu ein hagenda bolisi yng Nghymru â'r ddarpariaeth a gynigir gan y cwmni a sefydliadau allweddol eraill, megis y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith. Gŵyr Aelodau fod Remploy yn un o

deliverer of the New Deal for Disabled People. Rhodri Glyn Thomas talked about the UK figures for the Interwork programme, but the Welsh figures are very good. In 2005-06, Remploy in Wales helped 657 disabled people into jobs, 507 of whom, or 77 per cent, were able to sustain employment without the continuing support of Remploy. Therefore, we know that the Interwork agenda has worked very effectively.

We also know that most of those were incapacity benefit claimants returning to work, so it was very much targeting those whom the Assembly Government also supports through its own Want 2 Work programme, working closely with the UK Government and the Jobcentre. We have a unique European social fund-funded project called Healthy Minds at Work, which is a Welsh project that is about to go national across the UK for Remploy because of the success of the project in Wales.

The Assembly Government has supported Remploy with funding for a number of capital investment projects, including establishing the modernised factory in Abertillery, which I was privileged to open in October 2004. That had a regional selective assistance grant of £87,000. A total of £437,500 was further provided via RSA to assist the further development of that site, as well as at Wrexham, Brynamman and Ystradgynlais—and I have also visited the Brynamman and Ystradgynlais sites.

We have also strongly supported Remploy's commitment to providing lifelong learning opportunities for its employees, including the learning centres that offer access to a wide variety of courses. I am delighted to have been asked on a number of occasions to work with Remploy staff on rewarding them for the learning undertaken in the factory and with other partners. I will shortly be visiting the site in Neath to present the company with a basic skills Employer Pledge award.

I want to emphasise that we wish to see this intensive review of Remploy building on the investment by the 11 factories in Wales, and

ddarparwyr allweddol y Fargen Newydd ar gyfer Pobl Anabl. Soniodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas am ffigurau'r DU ar gyfer y rhaglen Interwork, ond mae ffigurau Cymru yn dda iawn. Yn 2005-06, helpodd Remploy yng Nghymru 657 o bobl anabl i gael swydd, yr oedd 507 ohonynt, neu 77 y cant, yn gallu parhau mewn gwaith heb gefnogaeth barhaus Remploy. Felly, gwyddom fod agenda Interwork wedi gweithio'n effeithiol iawn.

Gwyddom hefyd fod y mwyafrif o'r rhain yn hawlwyd budd-dal analluogrwydd a oedd yn dychwelyd i'r gwaith, felly targedwyd y rhai y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn eu cefnogi hefyd drwy ei rhaglen ei hun, Yn Awyddus i Weithio, gan gydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU a'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith. Mae gennym brosiect unigryw a ariennir gan gronfa gymdeithasol Ewrop o'r enw Meddwl Iach yn y Gwaith, sef prosiect yng Nghymru sydd ar fin cael ei gyflwyno ledled y DU i Remploy oherwydd llwyddiant y prosiect yng Nghymru.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi arian i Remploy am nifer o brosiectau buddsoddi cyfalaf, gan gynnwys sefydlu'r ffatri fodern yn Abertyleri, y cefais y fraint o'i hagog ym mis Hydref 2004. Cafodd y ffatri honno grant cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol o £87,000. Rhoddwyd cyfanswm o £437,500 arall drwy gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol i helpu i ddatblygu'r safle hwnnw ymhellach, yn ogystal ag yn Wrecsam, Brynaman ac Ystradgynlais—ac yr wyf hefyd wedi ymweld â safleoedd Brynaman ac Ystradgynlais.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cefnogi'n frwd ymrwymiad Remploy i roi cyfleoedd dysgu gydol oes i'w gyflogeion, gan gynnwys y canolfannau dysgu sy'n cynnig y cyfle i ddilyn amrywiaeth eang o gyrsiau. Yr wyf yn falch bod Remploy wedi gofyn imi weithio gyda'i staff sawl gwaith i'w gwobrwo am y dysgu a wnaed yn y ffatri a chyda phartneriaid eraill. Byddaf yn ymweld â'r safle yng Nghastell-nedd cyn hir i roi gwobr Addewid y Cyflogwr ym maes sgiliau allweddol i'r cwmni.

Yr wyf am bwysleisio ein bod am i'r adolygiad dwys hwn o Remploy adeiladu ar y buddsoddiad a wnaed gan yr 11 o ffatrioedd

we have made this clear to the Department for Work and Pensions. It is important to emphasise the purpose of the review and set it in the context of the wider programmes of reform that are being developed to provide greater support to those people who are at greatest disadvantage in the labour market. As Rhodri Glyn Thomas outlined in his opening remarks, the review had the dual objective of examining how support provided by Remploy can be developed to help to increase the number of disabled people moving into mainstream employment; that is, like the Interwork initiative. Remploy knows that it has been a successful element of its work, which it would like to support rather than the segregated employment opportunities that there were previously, and which continue. We also need to look at where it is appropriate for that kind of employment to remain, and look at issues around value for money.

Following Janet Davies's eloquent intervention on the role of the Assembly's Audit Committee and working with the audit office, I say to Rhodri Glyn Thomas that there is an obligation on the public sector to provide value for money. Remploy is a non-departmental public body; it works as a commercial arm but its status is an NDPB. Therefore, we all need to look at National Audit Office reports and consider how we take that agenda forwards.

The Department for Work and Pensions has made a number of points—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Jane Davidson:** I will just finish this point and then I will be happy to take an intervention. The Department for Work and Pensions has emphasised to me two things, which are important in this context. There is no intention for Remploy to cease to operate. It fully recognises the role that Remploy has played in providing support for disabled people for some 60 years. It has also made clear that Remploy's disabled employees must be protected from any compulsory redundancy. It has already given that categorical insurance.

yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym wedi egluro hyn i'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio diben yr adolygiad a'i roi yng nghyd-destun y rhaglenni diwygio ehangach a ddatblygir i roi mwy o gymorth i'r bobl hynny sydd o dan yr anfantais fwyaf yn y farchnad lafur. Fel yr amlinellodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas yn ei sylwadau agoriadol, yr oedd gan yr adolygiad yr amcan deul o archwilio sut y gellir datblygu'r cymorth a roddir gan Remploy i helpu i gynyddu nifer y bobl anabl sy'n cael cyflogaeth brif ffrwd; hynny yw, megis menter Interwork. Gŵyr Remploy fod hyn wedi bod yn elfen lwyddiannus o'i waith, a hoffai gefnogi hynny yn hytrach na'r cyfleoedd cyflogaeth ar wahân blaenorol, a fydd yn parhau. Mae angen inni ystyried hefyd lle y mae'n briodol i'r math hwnnw o gyflogaeth barhau, ac ystyried y materion o ran gwerth am arian.

Yn dilyn ymyriad huawdl Janet Davies ar rôl Pwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad a gweithio gyda'r swyddfa archwilio, dywedaf wrth Rhodri Glyn Thomas bod rhwymedigaeth ar y sector cyhoeddus i ddarparu gwerth am arian. Mae Remploy yn gorff cyhoeddus anadrannol; mae'n gweithio fel braich fasnachol ond corff cyhoeddus anadrannol ydyw. Felly, mae angen i bob un ohonom edrych ar adroddiadau'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol ac ystyried sut i ddatblygu'r agenda honno.

Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi gwneud nifer o bwyntiau—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Jane Davidson:** Gorffennaf y pwynt hwn ac wedyn byddaf yn fodlon derbyn ymyriad. Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau wedi pwysleisio dau beth imi, sy'n bwysig yn y cyd-destun hwn. Nid oes bwriad y bydd Remploy yn rhoi'r gorau i weithredu. Mae'n cydnabod yn llawn y rhan y mae Remploy wedi'i chwarae i roi cymorth i bobl anabl am ryw 60 mlynedd. Mae hefyd wedi egluro bod yn rhaid diogelu cyflogeion anabl Remploy rhag unrhyw ddiswyddiadau gorfodol. Mae wedi rhoi'r sicrwydd pendant hwnnw eisoes.



The report produced in July was by independent consultants, PricewaterhouseCoopers, with the existence of the chief executive of disability matters. That set out, as you outlined, a number of options for the future structure of the company, including potential closures of sites. However, no decisions have been taken on that modernisation strategy. The company is in the process of consulting with employees and trade unions. The chief executive is on his way to Blackpool this afternoon to meet with trade unions to discuss that, and there is Welsh trade union representation at that meeting.

The strategy will then need to be fully assessed by the new chair of Remploy, who is not due to take up post until the end of the year. The Minister at the Department for Work and Pensions, Anne McGuire, has also given the assurance that no decisions will be taken by her on any outcomes for Remploy until the new chair is fully behind the proposals. Therefore, the proposals that go to the Department for Work and Pensions will be utterly supported by the Remploy board and new chair.

5.30 p.m.

There is a provisional timetable that comes in with proposals for the early part of next year. However, the Department for Work and Pensions has also confirmed a five-year funding envelope of £111 million a year to enable the company to plan its future business operations.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** My point was not so much that Remploy is within the public sector but that it is a special case because it offers a service to people who have special needs. In that sense, value for money should not be seen in purely commercial terms. It should be seen in terms of the benefit that those factories offer and the service that they offer not only to those who are employed there but to their families and relatives and to the communities that they serve. That was the case that I was trying to make for looking at Remploy as a special case.

Lluniwyd yr adroddiad a gynhyrchwyd ym mis Gorffennaf gan ymgynghorwyr annibynnol, Pricewaterhouse Coopers, gyda bodolaeth prif weithredwr ym maes materion anabledd. Nododd yr adroddiad hwnnw, fel yr amlinellwyd gennych, nifer o opsiynau o ran strwythur y cwmni yn y dyfodol, gan gynnwys cau safleoedd o bosibl. Fodd bynnag, ni wnaed dim penderfyniadau ar y strategaeth foderneiddio honno. Mae'r cwmni wrthi'n ymgynghori â chyflogeion ac undebau llafur. Mae'r prif weithredwr ar ei ffordd i Blackpool y prynhawn yma i gyfarfod ag undebau llafur i drafod hynny, ac mae cynrychiolwyr undebau llafur Cymru yn y cyfarfod hwnnw.

Bydd angen wedyn i'r strategaeth gael ei hasesu'n llawn gan gadeirydd newydd Remploy, na fwriedir iddo ddechrau yn ei swydd tan ddiwedd y flwyddyn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, Anne McGuire, hefyd wedi rhoi'r sicrwydd na fydd yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar unrhyw ganlyniadau i Remploy hyd nes bod y cadeirydd newydd yn cefnogi'r cynigion yn llawn. Felly, caiff y cynigion a gyflwynir i'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau eu cefnogi'n llwyr gan fwrdd a chadeirydd newydd Remploy.

Mae amserlen dros dro a gaiff ei chyflwyno gyda'r cynigion ar gyfer rhan gyntaf y flwyddyn nesaf. Fodd bynnag, mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau hefyd wedi cadarnhau amlen ariannu gwerth £111 miliwn y flwyddyn dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd i alluogi'r cwmni i gynllunio ei weithrediadau busnes ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Nid oedd a wnelo fy mhwynt mewn gwirionedd â'r ffaith bod Remploy yn rhan o'r sector cyhoeddus ond yn hytrach, â'r ffaith ei fod yn achos arbennig gan ei fod yn cynnig gwasanaeth i bobl ag anghenion arbennig. Yn yr ystyr hwnnw, mae gwerth am arian yn fwy na gwerth masnachol yn unig. Mae'n cynnwys y budd a gynigir gan y ffatrioedd hynny a'r gwasanaeth a gynigir ganddynt nid yn unig i'r rheini a gaiff eu cyflogi ganddynt ond i'w teuluoedd a'u perthnasau ac i'r cymunedau a wasanaethir ganddynt. Dyna oedd yr achos yr oeddwn yn

ceisio ei gyflwyno dros ystyried Remploy fel achos arbennig.

**Jane Davidson:** This Government would absolutely support that. In many senses, it is exactly the same sort of argument that, earlier down in the education and support system, we would look at those children who can be educated in the main stream with support being able to do that, those who can be educated in the main stream without support being able to do that, and those children who need to be given extra support being educated in the special school sector. I apply the same kind of philosophy, as does this Government, in that context.

**Jane Davidson:** Byddai'r Llywodraeth hon yn cefnogi hynny'n llwyr. Mewn sawl ystyr, dyma'r union fath o ddadl, yn gynharach yn y system addysg a chymorth, lle y byddai'r plant hynny a all gael eu haddysgu yn y brif ffrwd gyda chymorth yn gallu gwneud hynny, y rheini a all gael eu haddysgu yn y brif ffrwd heb gymorth yn gallu gwneud hynny, a'r plant hynny y mae angen rhoi cymorth ychwanegol iddynt yn cael eu haddysgu yn y sector ysgolion arbennig. Cymhwysaf yr un math o athroniaeth, fel y gwna'r Llywodraeth hon, yn y cyd-destun hwnnw.

We will continue to be actively involved as the strategy develops. I think that there will be a hiatus, and I am concerned that that will lead to additional concerns among our employees in Wales, and I have made those representations already, because it is a five-year modernisation strategy—it is a five-year funding envelope—and until the new chair is in place, there will be no propositions to the UK Government. We all want to see, coming out of this process, a confident company that remains true to its original values of ensuring that disabled people who want to work can find employment both within the employment it offers and elsewhere, and which also adapts to the changes in demands of the economy of the twenty-first century, and to the new obligations under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995, which mean that other organisations are now required to make more opportunities available. In that way, we really can see that equality agenda bear fruit. The Assembly Government will continue to maintain a major interest in this issue. Although it remains a non-devolved issue—I am here acting as link Minister today—I am always happy to make representations on behalf of our Welsh factories.

Byddwn yn parhau i gymryd rhan weithgar yn y broses wrth i'r strategaeth ddatblygu. Credaf y bydd yna fwch, ac yr wyf yn pryderu y bydd hynny'n arwain at bryderon ychwanegol ymysg ein cyflogion yng Nghymru, ac yr wyf wedi cyflwyno'r sylwadau hynny eisoes, gan mai strategaeth foderneiddio pum mlynedd ydyw—amlen ariannu dros gyfnod o bum mlynedd—ac hyd nes y caiff y cadeirydd newydd ei benodi, ni chyflwynir unrhyw gynigion i Lywodraeth y DU. Ar ddiwedd y broses hon, yr ydym oll am weld cwmni hyderus sy'n parhau'n driv i'w werthoedd gwreiddiol sef sicrhau y gall pobl anabl sydd am weithio ddod o hyd i swyddi o fewn y swyddi a gynigir ganddo ac mewn mannau eraill, ac sydd hefyd yn addasu i newidiadau o ran gofynion economi'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, ac i rwymedigaethau newydd Deddf Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd 1995, sy'n golygu ei bod bellach yn ofynnol i sefydliadau eraill gyflwyno mwy o gyfleoedd. Drwy hynny, gallwn yn wirioneddol weld yr agenda gydraddoldeb yn dwyn ffrwyth. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i ddangos diddordeb brwd yn y mater hwn. Er nad yw'n fater datganoledig o hyd—yr wyf yn gweithredu fel Gweinidog cyswllt heddiw—yr wyf bob amser yn fwy na pharod i wneud sylwadau ar ran ein ffatrioedd yng Nghymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.32 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.32 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Trish (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)