



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 28 Mehefin 2006
Wednesday, 28 June 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid
Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister
- 19 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau
Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and Skills
- 37 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Gwin) (Cymru) (Diwygio)
2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog 24.27(iv)
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy (Wine) (Wales) (Amendment)
Regulation 2006 under Standing Order 24.27(iv)
- 40 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Tir Gofal (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006
- 47 Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynllun Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
The Local Government Partnership Scheme Annual Report
- 75 Adroddiad Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Bapurau Newydd yng
Nghymru
The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on Newspapers in Wales
- 93 Cynnig Trefniadol
Procedural Motion
- 94 Adroddiad Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Bapurau Newydd yng
Nghymru: Parhad
The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on Newspapers in Wales:
Continued
- 101 Dadl Fer: Dyfodol Amgylcheddol Cymru
Short Debate: The Environmental Future of Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau ar Lywodraeth Leol i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions on Local Government to the Finance Minister

Cydweithredu rhwng Awdurdodau Lleol Co-operation between Local Authorities

Q1 Huw Lewis: Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is promoting co-operation between local authorities in the Valleys? OAQ796(LGP)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): We are supporting joint working in the Valleys through a number of major initiatives. The Heads of the Valleys project recently launched its 15-year 'Turning Heads' strategy, and the 'Making the Connections' improvement fund 2006 is also supporting several innovative Valleys joint projects.

Huw Lewis: The recent multimillion-pound announcement regarding the first major projects under the Heads of the Valleys strategy is, I hope, just a sign of things to come. My colleague, Andrew Davies, is right to point out that the £140 million-worth of extra investment is only one element of the effort required to regenerate Valleys communities. For local authorities to better spend the £2 billion total of public funding already going into Valleys authorities, would you agree that tight, strategic guidance is needed from the Assembly to encourage, even to demand, closer co-operation, particularly on future regeneration work?

Sue Essex: I agree. I think that that is generally accepted now, certainly by local government, which has been strongly behind the regional groups that have been set up in the south east, which I think you were referring to. That sends out the message that there are many areas in which services would be far more efficient and more effectively delivered for the people whom you represent if authorities were to work jointly.

C1 Huw Lewis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hyrwyddo cydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn y Cymoedd? OAQ796(LGP)

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Yr ydym yn cefnogi cydweithio yn y Cymoedd drwy nifer o fentrau mawr ar y cyd. Yn ddiweddar, lansiodd prosiect Blaenau'r Cymoedd ei strategaeth 15 mlynedd, 'Syniadau Blaengar', ac mae cronfa wella 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau' 2006 hefyd yn cefnogi sawl prosiect arloesol ar y cyd yn y Cymoedd.

Huw Lewis: Gobeithiaf fod y cyhoeddiad diweddar i fuddsoddi miliynau o bunnoedd yn y prosiectau mawr cyntaf o dan y strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd yn arwydd o'r hyn sydd i ddod. Mae fy nghyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, yn llygad ei le i nodi mai dim ond un elfen o'r ymdrech sydd ei angen i adfywio cymunedau'r Cymoedd yw'r buddsoddiad ychwanegol hwn gwerth £140 miliwn. Er mwyn i awdurdodau lleol wario'r £2 biliwn o arian cyhoeddus sy'n mynd i awdurdodau'r Cymoedd eisoes yn well, a gytunech fod angen canllawiau strategol tynn gan y Cynulliad i annog, a hyd yn oed fynnu, cydweithredu gwell, yn enwedig ar waith adfywio yn y dyfodol?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf. Credaf fod hynny'n cael ei dderbyn yn gyffredinol bellach, yn sicr gan lywodraeth leol, a fu'n cefnogi'r grwpiau rhanbarthol a grëwyd yn y de-ddwyrain yn frwd, sef yr hyn yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ato, fe gredaf. Mae hynny'n cyfleu'r neges bod llawer o ardaloedd lle y byddai gwasanaethau yn llawer mwy effeithlon ac yn cael eu darparu'n fwy effeithiol i'r bobl yr ydych yn eu cynrychioli pe bai awdurdodau yn cydweithio.

As for where we go, as the Beecham agenda goes on, that idea of common strategic purpose and making sure that that is seen through will be very much at the fore.

Janet Davies: Minister, you will remember as well as I do that, after the devil's brew of reorganisation thought up by John Redwood, it was thought that one of the ameliorating effects would be that local authorities would co-operate, as Huw Lewis asked. While I appreciate that you do not have responsibility for the environment, have you been able to do anything to persuade local authorities to work together to set up new landfill sites?

Sue Essex: Our memories go back a long way, Janet, and one of my big criticisms of that reorganisation was that a proper commission was not set up, and we were not able to take evidence about joint working. In England, there was a commission, but we did not have one in Wales. We could have put those points about joint working to a commission. However, what happened, happened. I take a particular interest in all areas of joint working, and I regularly meet local authorities to try to promote that. Waste, as you know, is an area in which co-operation is absolutely essential, because individual authority boundaries do not always make much sense when it comes to delivering strategic waste facilities. I know that Carwyn Jones, as the relevant Minister, is really pushing those partnership groups to come forward with proposals.

O ran i ba gyfeiriad yr awn ninnau, wrth i agenda Beecham ddatblygu, y syniad hwnnw o ddiben strategol cyffredin a sicrhau y caiff ei wireddu fydd y flaenoriaeth bennaf.

Janet Davies: Weinidog, fe gofiwch cystal â minnau, ar ôl yr ad-drefnu ofnadwy a gyflwynwyd gan John Redwood, fod pobl o'r farn mai un o'r pethau a fyddai'n gwella fyddai y byddai awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithredu, fel y gofynnodd Huw Lewis. Er fy mod yn cydnabod nad ydych yn gyfrifol am yr amgylchedd, a ydych wedi llwyddo i wneud unrhyw beth i ddarbwyllio awdurdodau lleol i gydweithio i greu safleoedd tirlenwi newydd?

Sue Essex: Mae cof hir gennyf, Janet, ac un o'm prif feirniadaethau o'r ad-drefnu hwnnw oedd na chrëwyd comisiwn priodol, ac nad oedd modd inni gymryd tystiolaeth am gydweithio. Yn Lloegr, cafwyd comisiwn, ond nid oedd un gennym yng Nghymru. Gallem fod wedi cyflwyno'r pwyntiau hynny am gydweithio i gomisiwn. Fodd bynnag, digwyddodd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb penodol ym mhob agwedd ar gydweithio, a chyfarfyddaf ag awdurdodau lleol yn rheolaidd i geisio hyrwyddo hynny. Fel y gwyddoch, mae gwastraff yn faes lle y mae cydweithio yn gwbl hanfodol, am nad yw ffiniau awdurdodau unigol yn gwneud llawer o synnwyr bob tro o ran darparu cyfleusterau gwastraff strategol. Gwn fod Carwyn Jones, fel y Gweinidog perthnasol, yn pwyso ar y grwpiau partneriaeth hynny i gyflwyno cynigion.

Gwella Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Public Service Improvement

Q2 John Griffiths: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote public service improvement in local authorities in Wales? OAQ806(LGP)

Q6 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Will the Minister make a statement on how the National Assembly Government's policies have improved public services in South Wales East? OAQ786(LGP)

C2 John Griffiths: Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ806(LGP)

C6 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am sut mae polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn Nwyrain De Cymru? OAQ786(LGP)

Q10 Gwenda Thomas: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote public service improvement in local authorities in Wales? OAQ0832(LGP)

Sue Essex: I will be providing almost £4.5 million to support improvement directly in local government during the 2006-07 financial year. That money will be used to fund capacity building within local authorities, improvement studies and initiatives such as Excellence Wales.

John Griffiths: Sue, there is still considerable variation in the performance of local authorities across Wales, particularly in areas of service delivery. We have already heard, in question 1, about the need for greater co-operation and collaboration. Would you agree that there seems to be an established need for regional co-operation and collaboration, and the sharing of expertise? I know that we should not preempt the findings of the Beecham review, but that seems to be one strong strand of driving progress. Will you also consider further mechanisms for spreading that all-important best practice in local authorities across Wales?

Sue Essex: It is fair to say that, if we looked at the figures, we would all say that performance is patchy. There is no one authority that gets it right or one authority that gets it wrong. Learning from one another is important. I think that the regional collaborations, as well as doing the strategic things that I mentioned to Huw, will enable best practice to come to the fore, which should then be applied consistently across the piece. Excellence Wales, which is an initiative that we support from the Welsh Local Government Association, is aiming to do that. That must come to the fore in 'Making the Connections', because we do not want collaboration to bring quality down; we want it to bring it up.

Michael German: How long does the Minister anticipate that the improvement board, which is currently there to assist Blaenau Gwent County Borough Council, will be in place?

C10 Gwenda Thomas: Beth mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus mewn awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru? OAQ0832(LGP)

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn darparu bron £4.5 miliwn i gefnogi'r gwaith gwella yn uniongyrchol mewn llywodraeth leol yn ystod blwyddyn ariannol 2006-07. Defnyddir yr arian hwnnw i ariannu meithrin gallu o fewn awdurdodau lleol, astudiaethau gwella a mentrau megis Rhagoriaeth Cymru.

John Griffiths: Sue, erys llawer o amrywiaeth ym mherfformiad awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru, yn enwedig o ran darparu gwasanaethau. Clywsom eisoes, yng nghwestiwn 1, am yr angen am gydweithredu gwell. A gytunech yr ymddengys bod angen parhaol am gydweithredu rhanbarthol, a rhannu arbenigedd? Gwn na ddylem achub ar y blaen ar ganfyddiadau adolygiad Beecham, ond ymddengys bod hynny'n faes cryf o ran hyrwyddo cynnydd. A ystyriwch dulliau pellach ar gyfer lledaenu'r arferion gorau hollbwysig hynny mewn awdurdodau lleol ledled Cymru?

Sue Essex: Mae'n deg dweud, pe baem yn edrych ar y ffigurau, y byddem oll yn dweud bod perfformiad yn anghyson. Nid oes unrhyw awdurdod yn llwyddo nac unrhyw awdurdod yn methu. Mae dysgu oddi wrth ein gilydd yn bwysig. Credaf y bydd y cydweithio rhanbarthol, yn ogystal â gwneud y pethau strategol y soniais amdanynt wrth Huw, yn dod ag arferion gorau i'r amlwg, y dylid eu cymhwyso wedyn yn gyson yn gyffredinol. Mae Rhagoriaeth Cymru, sef menter yr ydym yn ei chefnogi gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, yn ceisio gwneud hynny. Rhaid i hynny ddod i'r amlwg yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', am nad ydym am i gydweithio waethygu ansawdd; yr ydym am i gydweithio wella ansawdd.

Michael German: Faint o amser y mae'r Gweinidog yn rhagweld y bydd y bwrdd gwella ar waith, sydd yno ar hyn o bryd i helpu Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Blaenau Gwent?

Sue Essex: It is my understanding that that has virtually come to an end, and it has given its report to say that it has done the work. In fact, I think that everyone will agree that that improvement board, as a model of working, has been useful.

Gwenda Thomas: On the reference to regional working, I welcome the projects that are being supported by the 'Making the Connections' improvement fund. I am particularly pleased to see that a study is being undertaken into the potential of regional, multi-agency, cross-boundary provision of out-of-hours essential services, which will cover Neath, Port Talbot, Swansea and Carmarthenshire. Do you agree that such projects demonstrate the importance of partnership working across Wales and encourage best practice?

Sue Essex: Yes. Those of us who are close to the ground and represent people can see where this mismatch in some of these services occurs. In terms of what we are doing, yes, we want efficiencies in resources, but we also want improvements in services. Many of our services in Wales must be more people focused, and more citizen and client centred. This is one of the projects that would seem to be exciting in that it could provide a way forward to give this linked and integrated service to people. If it works, Gwenda, and is shown to be a good model—picking up on John's point—then it can be mainstreamed and put in place comprehensively across Wales.

David Lloyd: Aeth dros ddwy flynedd heibio ers adolygiad y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus o'r agenda i foderneiddio llywodraeth leol, o ran strwythurau'r cabinet ac ati. Pa gynnydd a fu o ran gweithredu argymhellion y pwyllgor ymysg ein cynghorau sir?

Sue Essex: I have reported back, and the progress was pretty comprehensive across the board. I would point out—and I am sure that you remember this—that we are now carrying out research into the role of what we traditionally call 'backbench members'. Once

Sue Essex: Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae hynny wedi dod i ben fwy neu lai erbyn hyn, ac mae wedi cyflwyno ei adroddiad i ddweud ei fod wedi gwneud y gwaith. A dweud y gwir, credaf y bydd pawb yn cytuno bod y bwrdd gwella hwnnw, fel model o weithio, wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol.

Gwenda Thomas: O ran y cyfeiriad at weithio rhanbarthol, croesawaf y prosiectau a gefnogir gan gronfa wella 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch o weld bod astudiaeth ar waith i weld potensial gwasanaethau hanfodol rhanbarthol, amlasiantaeth, trawsffiniol y tu allan i oriau, a fydd yn cwmpasu Castell-nedd, Port Talbot, Abertawe a sir Gaerfyrddin. A gytunwch fod prosiectau o'r fath yn dangos pwysigrwydd gweithio mewn partneriaeth ledled Cymru ac yn annog arferion gorau?

Sue Essex: Cytunaf. Gall y rhai ohonom sydd ar lawer gwlad ac sy'n cynrychioli pobl weld lle mae'r camgymhariad hwn mewn rhai o'r gwasanaethau hyn. O ran yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud, ydym, yr ydym am sicrhau effeithlonrwyddau o ran adnoddau, ond yr ydym am weld gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau hefyd. Rhaid i lawer o'n gwasanaethau yng Nghymru ganolbwyntio'n well ar bobl, a chanolbwyntio'n well ar ddinasyddion a chleientiaid. Dyma un o'r prosiectau sy'n ymddangos yn gyffrous iawn oherwydd gallai gynnig ffordd ymlaen i roi'r gwasanaeth cysylltiedig ac integredig hwn i bobl. Os bydd yn gweithio, Gwenda, ac os dangosir ei fod yn fodel da—gan ymateb i bwynt John—yna gellir ei brif ffrydio a'i roi ar waith yn gynhwysfawr ledled Cymru.

David Lloyd: It is over two years since the Local Government and Public Services Committee's review of the local government modernisation agenda, in terms of cabinet structures and so on. What progress has been made in implementing the committee's recommendations in our county councils?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf wedi adrodd yn ôl, ac yr oedd y cynnydd yn eithaf cynhwysfawr yn gyffredinol. Hoffwn nodi—ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cofio hyn—ein bod bellach yn cynnal ymchwil i rôl yr hyn a alwn yn draddodiadol yn 'aelodau'r meinciau cefn'.

we have that research and we can discuss that at committee, we can link that in with your findings in the committee report, so that we can put a totally modernised structure in place.

David Lloyd: Pa siroedd felly sy'n parhau i beidio â gweithredu'r argymhelliad i sicrhau bod cadeiryddion pwyllgorau craffu yn dod o'r wrthblaid ac nid o'r un blaid â phlaid y cabinet?

Sue Essex: I know that you are obsessed with this particular issue from the report, which was an extremely good report with many recommendations. *[Interruption.]* Well, it is a familiar theme of yours. In terms of the authorities, I will give you a view on that, because many of them have a range of committees, and I think that we have accepted that, although certain authorities are not following that recommendation to the letter—and it was just a recommendation—they have involved the opposition in all sorts of ways. I will write back to you to give you that view, and that will give a clearer picture than if I were to give you just a one-off answer on that particular recommendation.

2.10 p.m.

David Melding: As we have heard, local government reorganisation in the 1990s was predicated on the assumption that there would be greater partnership and regional working. Given that the Auditor General for Wales has just concluded that ineffective partnership working continues to limit service delivery in Wales, what judgment does that pass on seven years of Labour rule in the Assembly?

Sue Essex: I do not quite understand your question. I do not recall reorganisation being predicated on regional working—as Janet will remember. It seemed to be a quick and dirty way to get local government reorganisation in Wales. If it was predicated in that way, there was no attempt by the Conservative Government of the day to follow that through. Janet was the leader of a local authority at the time, as was I, and what we wanted was more time to ensure that some of the good, constructive working—

Cyn gynted ag y bydd yr ymchwil honno gennym ac y gallwn ei thrafod yn y pwyllgor, gallwn gysylltu hynny â'ch canfyddiadau yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, fel y gallwn roi strwythur cwbl fodern ar waith.

David Lloyd: Therefore, which counties have still not implemented the recommendation to ensure that the chairs of scrutiny committees come from opposition parties rather than the party of the cabinet?

Sue Essex: Gwn fod gennych obsesiwn â'r mater penodol hwn o'r adroddiad, a oedd yn adroddiad da iawn gyda llawer o argymhellion. *[Torri ar draws.]* Wel, mae hon yn thema gyfarwydd gennych. O ran yr awdurdodau, rhoddaf farn ichi ar hynny, gan fod gan lawer ohonynt amrywiaeth o bwyllgorau, a chredaf ein bod wedi derbyn, er nad yw rhai awdurdodau'n dilyn yr argymhelliad hwnnw i'r carn—a dim ond argymhelliad ydoedd—eu bod wedi cynnwys yr wrthblaid mewn llawer ffordd. Ysgrifennaf atoch i fynegi'r farn honno, a bydd hynny'n rhoi darlun cliriach ichi na phe byddwn yn rhoi ateb sydyn ichi am yr argymhelliad penodol hwnnw.

David Melding: Fel y clywsom, roedd y gwaith ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol yn y 1990au yn seiliedig ar y dybiaeth y byddai mwy o weithio mewn partneriaeth a gweithio rhanbarthol. O gofio bod Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru newydd ddod i'r casgliad bod gwaith partneriaeth aneffeithiol yn parhau i gyfyngu darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, beth mae hynny'n ei ddweud am saith mlynedd o Lafur mewn grym yn y Cynulliad?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn deall eich cwestiwn yn iawn. Ni chofiaf fod ad-drefnu'n seiliedig ar weithio rhanbarthol—fel y bydd Janet yn ei gofio. Ymddengys mai ffordd gyflym a brwnt ydoedd o ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Os oedd yn seiliedig ar hynny, ni wnaed unrhyw ymgais gan y Lywodraeth Geidwadol ar y pryd i wireddu hynny. Yr oedd Janet yn arwain awdurdod lleol ar y pryd, fel finnau, a'r hyn yr oeddem am ei gael oedd mwy o amser i sicrhau y gallai rhywfaint o'r gwaith adeiladol da—

sometimes at a regional level, sometimes at an all-Wales level, sometimes at the level of two authorities—could be sustained and carried through within the given timescale. Unfortunately, a lot of that good work was lost. What we are doing now, if we are honest, is trying to rebuild that ethos and that joint working. As I say, there is no point in going back and apportioning blame. This is about trying to bring through some of the good issues around collaboration. Some schemes have followed through, of course, in education and other areas from the period before reorganisation.

David Melding: I regret that you did not have an extra six or 12 months—or whatever you wanted—in 1996 to work up your schemes. However, you have had seven years to get this right. You have put forward various schemes, said how important joint working is, and there have been all sorts of initiatives, but there is still not enough of it. Is this not a lack of leadership from the Assembly and from you, as Minister, to get local government active and innovative in this area? We need more partnership working and more regional working if we are to meet the challenges that face us now.

Sue Essex: You used the word ‘derogatory’ and mentioned six and 12 months for ‘your schemes’; it was all of us in local government. Whatever our politics, we were all asking for the same thing. We were saying, ‘Do not do this reorganisation in this way; give us time and think it through more thoroughly’. If we had had that time, I would not have drawn the local government map as it was drawn at that time; I am sure that it would have been the same for you. We know that what happened was not clever, but there is no point in dwelling on it. What we have done over the last seven years is undertake a whole range of joint-working initiatives. When I was involved in the environment, we supported the transport consortia, and I will give you information about a whole range of good joint-working projects. What we are now saying, under ‘Making the Connections’—and it is we who are saying it—is that the spirit, principles and purpose of joint working need to move up a gear. It is extremely good that the Welsh Local

weithiau’n rhanbarthol, weithiau ar draws Cymru gyfan, weithiau ar draws dau awdurdod lleol—gael ei gynnal a’i wireddu o fewn yr amserlen briodol. Yn anffodus, collwyd llawer o’r gwaith da hwnnw. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yn awr, os ydym yn onest, yw ceisio ailadeiladu’r ethos hwnnw a’r cydweithio hwnnw. Fel y dywedais, nid oes diben troi’n ôl a bwrw bai. Mae a wnelo hyn â cheisio cyflwyno rhai o’r pethau da o ran cydweithredu. Mae rhai cynlluniau wedi eu gweithredu, wrth gwrs, ym maes addysg a meysydd eraill o’r cyfnod cyn ad-drefnu.

David Melding: Gresynaf na chawsoch chwe neu 12 mis ychwanegol—neu faint bynnag yr oeddech am ei gael—yn 1996 i weithredu eich cynlluniau. Fodd bynnag, cawsoch saith mlynedd i sicrhau canlyniad. Yr ydych wedi cynnig cynlluniau amrywiol, yr ydych wedi dweud mor bwysig yw cydweithio, a chafwyd pob math o fentrau, ond nid yw hynny’n ddigon. Onid diffyg arweinyddiaeth yw hyn ar ran y Cynulliad a chithau, fel Gweinidog, i sicrhau bod llywodraeth leol yn weithgar ac yn arloesol yn y maes hwn? Mae angen mwy o weithio mewn partneriaeth a mwy o weithio rhanbarthol os ydym i ateb yr heriau sy’n ein hwynebu’n awr.

Sue Essex: Yr oeddech yn defnyddio’r gair ‘difrio’ ac yn sôn am chwe a 12 mis ar gyfer ‘eich cynlluniau’; yr oeddem i gyd yn rhan o lywodraeth leol. Beth bynnag oedd ein plaid wleidyddol, yr oeddem i gyd yn gofyn am yr un peth. Yr oeddem yn dweud, ‘Peidiwch ag ad-drefnu fel hyn; rhowch amser inni a meddylwch am y peth yn fwy trylwyr’. Pe byddem wedi cael yr amser hwnnw, ni fyddwn wedi llunio’r map llywodraeth leol fel y bryd hynny; yr wyf yn siŵr fod yr un peth yn wir amdanoch chi. Gwyddom nad oedd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn beth doeth iawn, ond nid oes diben sôn am y peth o hyd. Yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei wneud yn ystod y saith mlynedd diwethaf yw ymgymryd ag amrywiaeth eang o fentrau ar y cyd. Pan oeddwn yn gweithio ym maes yr amgylchedd, byddem yn cefnogi’r consortia trafniadaeth, a rhoddaf wybodaeth ichi am amrywiaeth eang o brosiectau da ar y cyd. Yr hyn a ddywedwn yn awr, o dan ‘Creu’r Cysylltiadau’—a ni sy’n dweud hyn—yw bod angen i ysbryd, egwyddorion a diben

Government Association, across the political spectrum, is saying that it is also up for it. It has set up regional groups to that end. We need to work together politically, across the sectors, to make that happen.

The Presiding Officer: I call Jeff Cuthbert.

Jeff Cuthbert: My supplementary is on question 6.

The Presiding Officer: Order. This is question 6.

Jeff Cuthbert: My apologies for not paying attention.

Minister, do you agree that the decision taken recently by Caerphilly County Borough Council to appoint a 14-19 learning pathways organiser shows that the authority is progressive in developing schemes for young people in vocational and academic education?

Sue Essex: The 14-19 learning pathways is one of our top priorities, and I know that you are a great supporter of that initiative, Jeff. I commend any local authority—you mentioned Caerphilly, so I will commend it—that does this. It shows that it intends to focus on this issue, giving it priority.

The Presiding Officer: I call Eleanor Burnham.

Eleanor Burnham: I was going to ask a supplementary to question 2.

The Presiding Officer: Order. These questions have been grouped, as has been indicated, with my royal assent. Therefore, this is question 2, 6 and 10.

Eleanor Burnham: My question is specifically about the condition of school buildings, which we are very concerned about in north Wales, as are people throughout Wales. I understand that you have made a commitment to ensuring that all school buildings are fit for purpose by 2010.

cydweithio gryfhau. Mae'n beth da iawn fod Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, ar draws y sbectrwm gwleidyddol, hefyd yn fodlon gwneud hyn. Mae wedi sefydlu grwpiau rhanbarthol i'r perwyl hwnnw. Bydd angen inni gydweithio'n wleidyddol, ar draws y sectorau, i wireddu hynny.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Jeff Cuthbert.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae fy nghwestiwn atodol yn ymwneud â chwestiwn 6.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cwestiwn 6 yw hwn.

Jeff Cuthbert: Ymddiheuraf am beidio â thalu sylw.

Weinidog, a gytunwch fod y penderfyniad a wnaed yn ddiweddar gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i benodi trefnydd llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn dangos bod yr awdurdod yn flaengar wrth ddatblygu cynlluniau i bobl ifanc mewn addysg alwedigaethol ac academiaidd?

Sue Essex: Mae llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn un o'n prif flaenoriaethau, a gwn eich bod yn cefnogi'r fenter honno'n frwd, Jeff. Cymeradwyaf unrhyw awdurdod lleol—yr oeddech yn sôn am Gaerffili, felly cymeradwyaf yr awdurdod hwnnw—sy'n gwneud hyn. Mae'n dangos ei fod yn bwriadu canolbwyntio ar y mater hwn, gan roi blaenoriaeth iddo.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Eleanor Burnham.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr oeddwm yn mynd i ofyn cwestiwn atodol i gwestiwn 2.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r cwestiynau hyn wedi'u grwpio, fel y dywedwyd, gyda'm cydsyniad brenhinol i. Felly, cwestiwn 2, 6 a 10 yw hwn.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae a wnelo fy nghwestiwn yn benodol â chyflwr adeiladau ysgolion, sy'n peri pryder mawr i bobl yn y gogledd, a hefyd i bobl ledled Cymru. Yr wyf ar ddeall eich bod wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod pob adeilad ysgol yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010. A oes gennyh unrhyw syniad

Do you have any idea of the actual costs involved, and how soon will you be able to put this into effect?

Sue Essex: Our manifesto commitment was to put a higher level of public expenditure into schools, and we will meet that commitment. Importantly, many local authorities will have to raise money themselves, because they are facing a backlog of years of underinvestment in school buildings. We all want to see school buildings in a good condition. Looking at recent figures, it is an encouraging sign that about £200 million—and I am sure that Jane will report on this in the next Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee meeting—is now being invested every year in school buildings programmes, some of which are small, and some large. The timetable is important. Where I think that there has been some slowness—and we have to be honest about this—is around the debates on school reorganisation. You can understand some authorities not rushing to invest in schools if there is a question mark over their future structures. However, overall, I think that a steady stream of money is going into this, and there is a steady recognition on the ground that this is a long-term programme to make sure that we get all schools fit for purpose.

Laura Anne Jones: Minister, in terms of your policies looking to improve public services in south-east Wales, have you factored in the need for additional spending on social services in many of these local authorities?

Sue Essex: I have, and I am pleased to say that in the last few years we have put much more money into social care, and local authorities in south-east Wales, and across Wales, have responded to that. Over the last two years, I have spent a lot of time talking with local authorities about demographic changes. We have to accept that we have an ageing population. People are living longer, and that is good news, but we need to ensure that they can live with dignity and respect, and that requires more money and more attention being given to social services. That needs to happen not just for the elderly, but

o'r costau gwirioneddol a fydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny, a pha mor fuan y byddwch yn gallu rhoi'r cynllun ar waith?

Sue Essex: Ein hymrwymiad maniffesto oedd buddsoddi lefel uwch o wariant cyhoeddus mewn ysgolion, a byddwn yn bodloni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig cofio y bydd yn rhaid i nifer o awdurdodau lleol godi arian eu hunain, gan eu bod yn wynebu ôl-groniad o flynyddoedd o ddiffyg buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Yr ydym i gyd am weld adeiladau ysgolion mewn cyflwr da. Gan edrych ar ffigurau diweddar, mae'n galonogol gweld bod tua £200 miliwn—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Jane yn cyflwyno adroddiad ar hyn yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau—bellach yn cael ei fuddsoddi bob blwyddyn mewn rhaglenni adeiladau ysgolion, rhai ohonynt yn fach, a rhai yn fawr. Mae'r amserlen yn bwysig. Credaf fod rhywfaint o arafwch wedi bod—ac mae'n rhaid inni fod yn onest am hyn—gyda'r dadleuon am ad-drefnu ysgolion. Gallwch ddeall pam nad yw rhai awdurdodau'n awyddus i ruthro i fuddsoddi mewn ysgolion os oes amheuaeth ynghylch eu strwythur yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, ar y cyfan credaf fod llif cyson o arian yn cael ei fuddsoddi, ac mae cydnabyddiaeth gadarn ar lawr gwlad fod hon yn rhaglen hirdymor i sicrhau y bydd pob ysgol yn addas at y diben.

Laura Anne Jones: Weinidog, o ran eich polisiau ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, a ydych wedi ystyried yr angen am wariant ychwanegol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol mewn nifer o'r awdurdodau lleol hyn?

Sue Essex: Do, ac yr wyf yn falch dweud ein bod wedi buddsoddi llawer mwy o arian mewn gofal cymdeithasol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ac mae awdurdodau lleol yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, a ledled Cymru, wedi ymateb i hynny. Yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf, treuliais gryn amser yn trafod newidiadau demograffig gydag awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid inni dderbyn bod gennym boblogaeth sy'n heneiddio. Mae pobl yn byw'n hwy, ac mae hynny'n newyddion da. Ond mae angen inni sicrhau y gallant fyw gydag urddas a pharch, ac mae hynny'n golygu rhoi mwy o arian a mwy o sylw i

for younger adults and children in need. I am pleased that local government has responded.

wasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae angen i hynny ddigwydd nid yn unig i'r henoed, ond i oedolion iau a phlant mewn angen. Yr wyf yn falch fod llywodraeth leol wedi ymateb.

Ad-drefnu'r Heddluoedd Police Restructuring

Q3 Janet Ryder: What recent discussions has the Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding the impact of police restructuring on council tax levels? OAQ815(LGP)

C3 Janet Ryder: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU am effaith ad-drefnu'r heddluoedd ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor? OAQ815(LGP)

Q7 Michael German: What discussions has the Minister had with the Home Office regarding police precept equalisation? OAQ785(LGP)

C7 Michael German: Pa drafodaethau mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref am gydraddoli praesept yr heddlu? OAQ785(LGP)

Q8 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the implications of police restructuring for council tax payers in Wales? OAQ791(LGP)

C8 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am oblygiadau ad-drefnu'r heddluoedd i bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru? OAQ791(LGP)

Sue Essex: The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration met the Westminster Minister for Police and Security on 1 June to discuss police restructuring, including the issue of the impact on council tax. The Minister also issued a written statement referring to the issue on 11 May.

Sue Essex: Cyfarfu'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio â'r Gweinidog dros yr Heddlu a Diogelwch yn San Steffan ar 1 Mehefin i drafod ad-drefnu'r heddlu, gan gynnwys yr effaith ar y dreth gyngor. Cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog hefyd ddatganiad ysgrifenedig yn cyfeirio at y mater ar 11 Mai.

Janet Ryder: Since 1999, the increase received by police authorities from the revenue support grant has been a lowly 37 per cent, compared with a massive increase of 132 per cent in the contribution of the police precept to council tax. Can you explain how that disproportionate burden on council tax payers has evolved? How will you address it, and will you ensure that the cost of restructuring the police is not borne by council tax payers?

Janet Ryder: Er 1999, 37 y cant yn unig o gynydd a gafodd awdurdodau heddlu gan y grant cynnal refeniw, o'i gymharu â chynnydd enfawr o 132 y cant yng nghyfraniad praesept yr heddlu i'r dreth gyngor. A allwch egluro sut y datblygodd y baich anghymesur hwnnw ar bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor? Sut yr ymdrinwch ag ef, ac a fyddwch yn sicrhau nad pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor fydd yn talu cost ad-drefnu'r heddlu?

Sue Essex: We debate the revenue support grant here, and it was voted through last year by all of us. It is just one component of police financing. The arrangements for police financing are quite complicated, and I would like them to be simplified. In some parts of Wales, the police precept is higher than it is in others. That is a matter for the police authorities. North Wales Police Authority has chosen a higher precept, and that is its

Sue Essex: Caiff y ddadl am y grant cynnal refeniw ei chynnal yma, ac fe'i derbyniwyd drwy bleidlais y llynedd gan bob un ohonom. Dim ond un elfen o gyllido'r heddlu ydyw. Mae'r trefniadau ar gyfer cyllido'r heddlu yn eithaf cymhleth, a hoffwn iddynt gael eu symleiddio. Mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru, mae praesept yr heddlu yn uwch nag mewn rhannau eraill. Mater i'r awdurdodau heddlu yw hynny. Mae Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd

decision. In terms of restructuring, both Edwina and I have made it repeatedly clear that the costs of restructuring should not fall upon council tax payers in Wales. I do not think that we could state that more clearly. We have made that clear to our colleagues in Westminster.

Michael German: I wonder whether we could probe that further, Minister. Assuming that the Government gets its way on an all-Wales police force, how many years would it take for the police precept to be equalised across Wales?

2.20 p.m.

Sue Essex: It depends upon the rate of equalisation. That is the mathematics of it. We have raised this matter with Westminster. Should the one police force go ahead, the rate would come down for three police-force areas, and, if we had equalisation, the rate for one would go up. We have made it clear that if there is to be equalisation, we would want that to be phased in over some years, and that is still a matter for discussion. It is hard to say, but I would certainly imagine that it would not happen over less than three years.

Michael German: You answered my question at the end there. I am grateful that you are prepared to consider that it would take three years. Gwent Police Authority has written to me to say that it would take, in its view, five years to equalise the precept across Wales, given the disparity, as you rightly say, between the South Wales Police Authority, which has a precept of £126, and the North Wales Police Authority, which has a precept of £167. Unless you accelerate the process by making the council tax payers of the South Wales Police Authority area suddenly pay more than 5 or 10 per cent extra per year, equalisation will not occur. The alternative route would be to try to curtail police expenditure further by reducing the amount by which they are allowed to increase the precept. Can you tell us whether, in the negotiations that you have been having with the Home Office, this figure has been agreed, and whether there will be a cap on the

Cymru wedi dewis praesept uwch, a'i benderfyniad ef yw hynny. O ran ad-drefnu, yr wyf fi ac Edwina wedi egluro droeon nad pobl sy'n talu treth gyngor yng Nghymru ddylai dalu costau'r ad-drefnu. Ni chredaf y gallem ddweud hynny'n gliriach. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny'n glir i'n cyd-Aelodau yn San Steffan.

Michael German: Tybed a allem eich holi ymhellach am hynny, Weinidog. Gan dybio y caiff y Llywodraeth ei ffordd o ran un heddlu i Gymru gyfan, sawl blwyddyn y byddai'n ei gymryd i gydraddoli praesept yr heddlu ledled Cymru?

Sue Essex: Mae'n dibynnu ar y gyfradd gydraddoli. Dyna yw mathemateg y sefyllfa. Yr ydym wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda San Steffan. Pe bae un heddlu yn cael ei greu, byddai'r gyfradd yn gostwng i dair ardal heddlu, a phe byddem yn cydraddoli, byddai cyfradd un ardal yn codi. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yn glir, os oes cydraddoli i fod, y byddem am i hynny gael ei gyflwyno'n raddol dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd, ac mae hynny'n fater i'w drafod o hyd. Mae'n anodd dweud, ond yn sicr byddwn yn dychmygu na fyddai'n digwydd dros gyfnod o lai na thair blynedd.

Michael German: Yr ydych wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn ar y diwedd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar eich bod yn barod i ystyried y byddai'n cymryd tair blynedd. Ysgrifennodd Awdurdod Heddlu Gwent ataf i ddweud y byddai'n cymryd pum mlynedd, yn ei farn ef, i gydraddoli'r praesept ledled Cymru, o gofio'r anghysondeb, fel y dywedwch yn hollol gywir, rhwng Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru, sydd â phraesept o £126, ac Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, sydd â phraesept o £167. Oni chyflymwch y broses drwy wneud i bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yn ardal Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru yn sydyn dalu mwy na 5 neu 10 y cant yn fwy bob blwyddyn, ni fydd cydraddoli'n digwydd. Y dewis arall fyddai ceisio cwtogi gwariant yr heddlu ymhellach drwy leihau faint y caniateir iddynt gynyddu'r praesept. A allwch ddweud wrthym, yn ystod y negodiadau a gawsoch gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref, a gytunwyd ar y ffigur hwn, ac a

amount of precept charged and on the increases that can be made in any equalisation process? Can you tell us whether three years is a minimum or a maximum for the length of time that this will take?

Sue Essex: You take hold of one thing, and then you start leaping and jumping to a place that you should not arrive at. Let us be clear about the figures. If equalisation took place, there would be a reduction for Dyfed-Powys Police Authority of around £5, for Gwent Police Authority, a reduction of £7, for North Wales Police Authority, a reduction of almost £22, and an increase for South Wales Police Authority of £19. That would be the nature of the change. There is no point in me speculating about this—it would be speculation. You asked how long it would take, and, as I said, it would depend upon what rate of change you wanted to implement. Edwina is leading on those discussions. I said that I could not see equalisation taking less than three years—it could be more, and some people might argue that it could be less. That is my current view, but it is just a view. There is still a lot more discussion to be had, as you well know.

Ann Jones: I have said in this Chamber many times that North Wales Police Authority made the decision to increase the level of precept in north Wales some years ago to provide additional police officers on the beat. I think that it was a brave decision by the North Wales Police Authority to put those police officers on the beat by means of an addition to the precept. We are now seeing the results: the crime figures in north Wales are among the best in England and Wales. In particular, the western division of the North Wales police force has the finest crime reduction figures, and that must be down to the fact that the police precept was set at a much higher level in order to allow for those additional officers. People in north Wales want to keep to that level; they do not want us to have to ring-fence money in order for everyone else to play catch-up. Will you give your assurance that you will bear this in mind when you meet with the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, and with Cabinet colleagues, so that the people of north Wales

fydd terfyn uchaf ar swm y praesept a godir, ac ar godiadau y gellir eu gwneud mewn unrhyw broses gydraddoli? A allwch ddweud wrthym ai isafswm ynteu uchafswm yw'r tair blynedd ar gyfer yr amser y bydd hyn yn ei gymryd?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn cydio mewn un peth, ac yna'n dechrau neidio a llamu i gasgliad na ddylech ei wneud. Gadewch inni egluro'r ffigurau. Pe byddai gydraddoli'n digwydd, byddai gostyngiad o ryw £5 i Awdurdod Heddlu Dyfed-Powys, gostyngiad o £7 i Awdurdod Heddlu Gwent, gostyngiad o bron i £22 i Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, a chynnydd o £19 i Awdurdod Heddlu De Cymru. Dyna fyddai natur y newid. Nid oes diben imi ddyfalu ynglŷn â hyn—dyfalu'n unig fyddai hynny. Yr oeddech yn gofyn faint y byddai'n ei gymryd, ac fel y dywedais, byddai'n dibynnu ar gyfradd y newid y byddech am ei gweithredu. Edwina sy'n arwain y trafodaethau hynny. Dywedais na allwn weld sefyllfa lle y byddai cydraddoli'n cymryd llai na thair blynedd—gallai fod yn fwy, a gallai rhai pobl ddadlau y gallai fod yn llai. Dyna fy marn ar hyn o bryd, ond fy marn i yw hynny. Mae yna lawer o drafod pellach i ddod, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn.

Ann Jones: Dywedais yn y Siambr hon droeon mai er mwyn darparu mwy o swyddogion heddlu ar y stryd y gwnaeth Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru y penderfyniad i gynyddu lefel y praesept yn y gogledd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Credaf fod Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi gwneud penderfyniad dewr i roi mwy o swyddogion heddlu ar y stryd drwy ychwanegu at y praesept. Yr ydym bellach yn gweld y canlyniadau: mae ffigurau troseddau yn y gogledd ymhlith y gorau yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Yn arbennig, mae gan ranbarth gorllewinol heddlu Gogledd Cymru y ffigurau gorau am leihau nifer troseddau, ac mae'n rhaid priodoli hynny i'r ffaith fod praesept yr heddlu wedi ei osod ar lefel lawer uwch er mwyn caniatáu ar gyfer y swyddogion ychwanegol hynny. Mae pobl yn y gogledd am gadw'r lefel honno; nid ydynt am inni orfod neilltuo arian er mwyn i bawb arall geisio dal i fyny. A rowch eich sicrwydd inni y byddwch yn cofio hyn wrth gyfarfod â'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder

will not be disadvantaged, given that that brave decision was taken some years ago?

Sue Essex: That really gets to the heart of the quality and performance levels that we are looking at. This is, primarily, being led by Edwina, and I will ensure that she knows about what has been raised. I know that she understands that people in north Wales feel strongly that you have taken that decision, and that you want those levels of policing and of quality and security.

Nick Bourne: Minister, on the costs of restructuring, which I think everyone accepts will be quite large, I appreciate that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration is leading on this, and I have raised with you before the issue of a joint approach. However, I feel that we must not take our eye off the ball when it comes to the cost. I think that the restructuring will go through, although it will be delayed, but what concerns people in Wales is the projected cost of all of this. Can you give an update on the possibility of a joint approach by all the parties to the Westminster Government to make it aware of the strength of feeling in Wales about there not being additional costs for the council tax payers of Wales, so that it realises that it is an all-Assembly approach?

Sue Essex: Yes, of course, Nick. Edwina Hart gave that commitment, and it is good that we can come together at times across the political spectrum and speak with one clear voice. I have not been close to looking at the costs—Edwina has done that—but whatever emerges from the restructuring, there will obviously be some upfront costs. Ultimately, however, I would hope that the council tax payers of Wales would see some financial benefit, because financial benefits can accrue from amalgamation and collaboration, whatever form that will take. We have been clear that, if there are costs, they should be met by the Home Office, and not here. However, I would also hope that, if restructuring happens, we would see

Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, a chyda'ch cyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet, fel na fydd pobl y gogledd o dan anfantais, o gofio bod y penderfyniad hwnnw wedi ei wneud rai blynyddoedd yn ôl?

Sue Essex: Mae hynny'n wir wrth wraidd y lefelau ansawdd a pherfformiad sy'n cael eu hystyried gennym. Mae'r broses yn cael ei harwain gan Edwina, yn bennaf, a gallaf eich sicrhau y caiff wybod am yr hyn a godwyd. Gwn ei bod yn deall bod pobl y gogledd yn teimlo'n gryf eich bod wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, a'ch bod yn awyddus i gadw'r lefelau plismona hynny a'r lefelau safon a diogelwch.

Nick Bourne: Weinidog, o ran costau ad-drefnu, y mae pawb, mi gredaf, yn derbyn y byddant yn gymharol uchel. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli mai'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio sy'n arwain ar hyn, ac yr wyf wedi codi'r mater o ddull ar y cyd gyda chi o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf na allwn dynnu ein llygaid oddi ar y bêl o ran y gost. Credaf y caiff y cynnig i ad-drefnu ei dderbyn, er y caiff ei ohirio, ond yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i bobl Cymru yw cost arfaethedig y broses. A allwch roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y posibilrwydd y bydd dull ar y cyd rhwng pob plaid i sicrhau bod Llywodraeth San Steffan yn ymwybodol o'r cryfder barn yng Nghymru na ddylai pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru dalu unrhyw gostau ychwanegol, er mwyn iddi sylweddoli mai dyna yw ymagwedd y Cynulliad cyfan?

Sue Essex: Gallaf, wrth gwrs, Nick. Rhoddodd Edwina Hart yr ymrwymiad hwnnw, ac mae'n galonogol gweld y gallwn ddod at ein gilydd ar adegau ar draws y sbectrwm gwleidyddol a siarad ag un llais clir. Ni fûm yn rhan o'r broses o edrych ar y costau—Edwina a wnaeth hynny—ond beth bynnag a ddaw o'r ad-drefnu, bydd rhai costau uniongyrchol yn amlwg. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'r pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru yn gweld rhywfaint o fudd ariannol, oherwydd gall rhai buddiannau ariannol ddeillio o uno a chydweithredu, pa ffurf fydd hynny. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yn glir, os bydd costau, mai'r Swyddfa Gartref ddylai eu talu, ac nid ni. Fodd bynnag,

economies of scale and some financial benefit from that, as well as an increased quality of performance across Wales.

Leanne Wood: I think that we would all agree that, under your Government's plans for the merger of police forces, the council tax will be equalised in terms of the police precept. An option that has already been outlined by the Welsh Local Government Association is that all precepts should be increased to the north Wales level. Taxpayers are fearful that the police merger is being used as a way to increase local taxation. I understand that you have said that you want to put pressure on the UK Government to give guarantees on this, but will you rule out local tax payers paying for this reorganisation?

Sue Essex: I cannot say any more than I have already said. We have said clearly and firmly that the cost of restructuring—and you must separate this from the equalisation of the precept—should not be borne by Welsh council tax payers. Edwina and I feel strongly about that, and I think that that has been accepted. I am not always part of the discussions that Edwina has, but we have made that point strongly, and we feel that it is the responsibility of the Westminster Government to do that. I think that our view has been accepted, but you will have to ask Edwina about her discussions, because that is her area, and not mine.

byddwn yn gobeithio hefyd, os bydd ad-drefnu, y byddem yn gweld arbedion maint a rhywfaint o fudd ariannol o hynny, yn ogystal â gwell ansawdd perfformiad ledled Cymru.

Leanne Wood: Credaf y byddem i gyd yn cytuno, o dan gynlluniau eich Llywodraeth ar gyfer uno heddluoedd, y caiff y dreth gyngor ei chydraddoli o ran praesept yr heddlu. Un dewis a amlinellwyd eisoes gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yw y dylid cynyddu'r holl braeseptau i lefel y gogledd. Mae trethdalwyr yn pryderu bod y cynnig i uno'r heddluoedd yn cael ei ddefnyddio fel ffordd i gynyddu trethiant lleol. Deallaf eich bod wedi dweud eich bod am roi pwysau ar Lywodraeth y DU i roi sicrwydd ar hyn, ond a allwch gadarnhau nad trethdalwyr lleol fydd yn talu am yr ad-drefnu hwn?

Sue Essex: Ni allaf ddweud mwy nag a ddywedais eisoes. Yr ydym wedi dweud yn glir ac yn gadarn na ddylai'r bobl sy'n talu treth gyngor yng Nghymru dalu cost yr ad-drefnu—a rhaid ichi wahanu hyn wrth gydraddoli'r praesept. Mae Edwina a minnau'n teimlo'n gryf am hynny, a chredaf fod hynny wedi'i dderbyn. Nid wyf bob amser yn rhan o'r trafodaethau a gaiff Edwina, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud y pwynt hwnnw'n gadarn, a theimlwn mai cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth San Steffan yw gwneud hynny. Credaf ei bod wedi derbyn ein barn, ond bydd yn rhaid ichi holi Edwina am ei thrafodaethau hi, oherwydd ei maes hi yw hynny, nid fy maes i.

Gwella Cyfranogaeth yn y Broses Ddemocrataidd Improving Participation in the Democratic Process

Q4 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on any plans she is considering that will improve participation in the democratic process? OAQ784(LGP)

Sue Essex: I have set up the elections planning group to facilitate the sharing of information and dissemination of best practice in all areas of electoral administration. A joint campaign with the WLGA will also be undertaken to raise public awareness of the role of members and encourage and prepare new candidates for the

C4 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am unrhyw gynlluniau y mae'n eu hystyried a fydd yn gwella cyfranogaeth yn y broses ddemocrataidd? OAQ784(LGP)

Sue Essex: Yr wyf wedi sefydlu'r grŵp cynllunio etholiadau i hwyluso'r broses o rannu gwybodaeth a lledaenu arfer gorau ym mhob maes mewn gweinyddu etholiadau. Mae yna ymgyrch ar y cyd â CLILC hefyd i wneud y cyhoedd yn fwy ymwybodol o rôl aelodau ac i annog a pharatoi ymgeiswyr newydd ar gyfer etholiadau lleol 2008.

2008 local elections.

Jenny Randerson: Thank you for that answer, Minister—so far, so good. I am sure that you will agree that it is important for us to improve the participation of young people in the democratic process, and to increase their understanding. Allowing voting at age 16 is one solution that has been put forward, which I support, and I would be interested to know what your attitude is to that. However, evidence from around the world shows that allowing voting at age 16 alone does not solve the problem—there also needs to be a strong programme of voter and citizenship education in schools. Do you agree that we are currently failing our young people in this regard? What are you doing as a Labour Assembly Government, in consultation with the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills, to ensure that the curriculum is revised in order to substantially boost this aspect?

Sue Essex: I am glad that you say ‘so far, so good’, because we have made progress in this regard. I am pleased that we have set up the election planning group, which is working extremely well. Every political party has been invited to join and, I am sure, is participating in the group. I have never made a secret of my belief that 16-year-olds should have the vote. I have thought so for a long time, and nothing has dissuaded me over the years. We are working closely with the Electoral Commission, because it has a remit in this area. It is organising a democracy day conference for sixth forms in September; it is important to involve people at that age. The Electoral Commission has also produced

Jenny Randerson: Diolch ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, Weinidog—calonogol hyd yma. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch ei bod yn bwysig inni wella cyfranogiad pobl ifanc yn y broses ddemocrataidd, a gwella’u dealltwriaeth. Mae caniatâu i bobl bleidleisio yn 16 oed yn un ateb a gyflwynwyd, ac yr wyf yn ei gefnogi, a hoffwn wybod eich agwedd chi at hynny. Fodd bynnag, dengys tystiolaeth o wahanol rannau o’r byd nad yw caniatâu i bobl bleidleisio’n 16 oed ar ei ben ei hun yn datrys y broblem—mae angen rhaglen gryfach o addysgu pleidleiswyr a dysgu dinasyddiaeth mewn ysgolion. A gytunwch ein bod yn methu ein pobl ifanc ar hyn o bryd yn hyn? Beth yr ydych chi fel Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad yn ei wneud, drwy ymgynghori â’r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, i sicrhau y caiff y cwricwlwm ei ddiwygio er mwyn rhoi hwb sylweddol i’r agwedd hon?

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn dweud ‘calonogol hyd yma’, gan ein bod wedi gwneud cynnydd yn hyn. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi sefydlu’r grŵp cynllunio etholiadau, sy’n gweithio’n dda iawn. Gwahoddwyd pob plaid wleidyddol i ymuno, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eu bod yn cymryd rhan yn y grŵp. Ni chelais erioed fy nghred y dylai pobl ifanc 16 oed gan yr hawl i bleidleisio. Dyna fy marn ers amser maith, ac nid oes dim wedi newid fy marn dros y blynyddoedd. Yr ydym yn gweithio’n agos gyda’r Comisiwn Etholiadol, gan fod ganddo gyloch gwaith yn y maes hwn. Mae’n trefnu cynhadledd diwrnod democratiaeth i ddisgyblion chweched dosbarth ym mis Medi; mae’n bwysig cynnwys pobl o’r oedran hwnnw. Mae’r Comisiwn Etholiadol hefyd wedi cynhyrchu

2.30 p.m.

a democracy cookbook, as it is called. That is about doing politics with young people. It is aimed at providing information, discussion points and case studies. We are trying to work closely with the Electoral Commission. Jane and I look at all sorts of things in terms

llyfr coginio democratiaeth, fel y’i gelwir. Mae’n ymwneud â thrafod gwleidyddiaeth gyda phobl ifanc. Ei nod yw cyflwyno gwybodaeth, pwyntiau trafod ac astudiaethau achos. Yr ydym yn ceisio gweithio’n agos gyda’r Comisiwn Etholiadol. Mae Jane a

of the way that we can raise that. It is very much part of citizenship education and I guess that it is also part of the Funky Dragon dialogue. I think that we all agree that getting young people interested in politics and voting is important to us.

minnau'n edrych ar bob math o bethau o ran y ffordd y gallwn godi hynny. Mae'n rhan bwysig iawn o addysg dinasyddiaeth, a thbybiaf ei fod hefyd yn rhan o ddeialog y Ddraig Ffyni. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn cytuno bod ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc ym myd gwleidyddiaeth a phleidleisio yn bwysig inni.

Codiadau yn y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax Increases

C5 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am godiadau yn y dreth gyngor er 1997? OAQ0812(LGP)

Q5 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on council tax increases since 1997? OAQ812(LGP)

Sue Essex: The average annual increase in band D council tax between 1997 and 1998 was 7.6 per cent. This year's increase of 4.5 per cent is the second lowest average increase since the introduction of council tax, the lowest increase being 3.8 per cent for 2005-06.

Sue Essex: Cynnydd blynyddol cyfartalog treth gyngor band D rhwng 1997 ac 1998 oedd 7.6 y cant. Y cynnydd o 4.5 y cant eleni yw'r cynnydd isaf ond un ers cyflwyno'r dreth gyngor. Cafwyd y cynnydd isaf o 3.8 y cant yn 2005-06.

David Lloyd: Mae'n wir nodi bod y dreth gyngor ar gyfer band D wedi mwy na dyblu er 1997. Yn ychwanegol, mae ymchwil yn dangos bod yr un rhan o bump mwyaf tlawd o'r boblogaeth yn gwario 4.6 y cant o'u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor tra bo'r un rhan o bump sydd fwyaf cyfoethog yn gwario dim ond 1.6 y cant o'u hincwm ar y dreth gyngor, a hynny wedi i ostyngiadau a budd-daliadau gael eu cyfrif. Felly, a ydych dal i gredu bod y dreth gyngor yn deg?

David Lloyd: It is true to say that, since 1997, band D council tax has more than doubled. In addition, research shows that the poorest one fifth of the population spend 4.6 per cent of their income on council tax, while the richest one fifth of the population spend only 1.6 per cent of their income on council tax, after taking into account discounts and benefits. Therefore, do you still believe council tax is fair?

Sue Essex: On your first point, spending in local government over that time has gone up enormously too so, as council tax is a small contribution, alongside what comes from central Government, you can understand why council tax has gone up over that time. On your question about whether it is fair—and you know this, because you were at the committee meeting with Michael Lyons—if you have a property tax, you have to have that fail-safe element for the people on the lowest incomes: the people who are asset-rich and income-poor. The purpose of council tax benefit was to do that; it is not doing it in any way near the way that I would want to see and that is why, when we had the committee meeting, we strongly pointed out that council tax benefit must be reformed if it is going to have that degree of fairness that

Sue Essex: O ran eich pwynt cyntaf, mae gwariant o fewn llywodraeth leol yn y cyfnod hwnnw hefyd wedi cynyddu'n aruthrol, felly, gan mai cyfraniad bach yw'r dreth gyngor, ynghyd â'r hyn a roddir gan Lywodraeth ganolog, gallwch ddeall pam mae'r dreth gyngor wedi cynyddu dros y cyfnod hwnnw. O ran eich cwestiwn un a yw'n deg—ac fe wyddoch hyn, oherwydd yr oeddech yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor gyda Michael Lyons—os oes gennych dreth eiddo, rhaid i chi gynnig yr elfen ddi-feth honno i'r bobl sydd â'r incwm isaf: y rheini sy'n gyfoethog o ran asedau ac yn dlawd o ran incwm. Dyna oedd diben y budd-dal treth gyngor; nid yw'n gwneud hynny o bell ffordd fel yr hoffwn ei weld a dyna pam, pan gyfarfu'r pwyllgor, y tynnwyd sylw'n gryf gennym fod yn rhaid diwygio'r budd-dal treth gyngor er mwyn

you have alluded to.

sicrhau'r elfen honno o degwch yr ydych wedi cyfeirio ati.

Alun Cairns: Council tax benefit is one way of doing that, but is that not seen to correct the inefficiencies of the way that the increases have taken place in recent years? Dai Lloyd highlighted that 4.5 per cent of the incomes of lower earners is taken in council tax, but more than 20 per cent of the income of some pensioners is taken in council tax payments. Is that fair? Is it not the case that it is not about the council tax benefit system but simply that you are taxing people too much?

Alun Cairns: Mae'r budd-dal treth gyngor yn un ffordd i wneud hynny, ond onid yw hynny'n unioni aneffeithlonrwydd y broses o gyflwyno'r cynnydd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf? Tynnodd Dai Lloyd sylw at y ffaith fod treth gyngor yn cyfrif am 4.5 y cant o incwm yr enillwyr isaf, ond mae taliadau treth gyngor yn cyfrif am fwy nag 20 y cant o incwm rhai pensiynwyr. A yw hynny'n deg? Onid y gwir yw nad mater y system budd-dal treth gyngor yw hyn, ond eich bod yn codi gormod o dreth ar bobl?

Sue Essex: The biggest increase by far in council tax was seen during the Tory years and I make that point whenever you raise this question, Alun, but you come back for more. As a party, you support council tax. I am sure that you will also know that, if you have a property tax, you have to have a scheme that moderates that tax for certain people. I have been arguing strongly for a proper council tax benefit scheme; in fact, I would like the scheme to be overhauled and renamed. I have not heard your voice on that; I have just heard the voice of your party that still consistently talks in support of a property tax.

Sue Essex: Gwelwyd y cynnydd mwyaf o bell ffordd yn y dreth gyngor yn ystod blynyddoedd y Torïaid, a byddaf yn gwneud y pwynt hwnnw pryd bynnag y codwch y cwestiwn hwn, Alun, ond yr ydych yn dod yn ôl am ragor. Fel plaid, yr ydych yn cefnogi'r dtreth gyngor. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch hefyd yn gwybod, os oes gennych dreth eiddo, ei bod yn rhaid cael cynllun sy'n cymedroli'r dreth honno i rai pobl. Yr wyf wedi bod yn dadlau'n gryf o blaid cynllun budd-dal treth gyngor priodol; yn wir, hoffwn weld y cynllun yn cael ei ddiwygio a'i ailenwi. Nid wyf wedi clywed eich barn am hynny; dim ond clywed barn eich plaid yr wyf sy'n cefnogi treth eiddo.

Gostyngiad ar y Dreth Fusnes Wledig Rural Business Rate Relief

Q9 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on rural business rate relief in mid and west Wales? OAQ0803(LGP)

C9 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gostyngiad yn y dreth fusnes wledig yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin? OAQ0803(LGP)

Sue Essex: As I am sure that you know, we have undertaken an extensive consultation into business rate relief in Wales. On 30 March 2006, the Local Government and Public Services Committee discussed the emerging themes resulting from the consultation. I am now considering what changes to rate relief are required.

Sue Essex: Fel yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori'n helaeth am ryddhad ardrethi busnes yng Nghymru. Ar 30 Mawrth 2006, bu'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn trafod y themâu a gododd yn sgîl yr ymgynghori. Yr wyf wrthi bellach yn ystyried pa newidiadau y mae eu hangen mewn rhyddhad ardrethi.

Lisa Francis: The British Hospitality Association was involved in that consultation exercise, as you will be aware. It looked at the future of rate relief for small businesses but it was disappointed that the options that

Lisa Francis: Cymerodd Cymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain ran yn yr ymgynghori hwnnw, fel y gwyddoch. Edrychodd ar ddyfodol rhyddhad ardrethi ar gyfer busnesau bach, ond fe'i siomwyd nad oedd y

your Government proposed did not include transitional relief. Can you confirm whether there will be any further rounds of consultation and whether transitional relief will feature as an option in any such further rounds?

Sue Essex: I think that you are talking about transitional relief as applied to a revaluation exercise. This was outside the revaluation exercise; it was about looking at how rate relief is applied across the board in a sustainable way. However, if you would like to send me a further note on that, Lisa, please do so.

dewisiadau a gynigiwyd gan eich Llywodraeth yn cynnwys rhyddhad trosiannol. A allwch gadarnhau a fydd ymgynghori pellach ac a fydd rhyddhad trosiannol yn un o'r dewisiadau mewn unrhyw ymgynghori felly?

Sue Essex: Credaf eich bod yn sôn am ryddhad trosiannol fel y caiff ei ddefnyddio mewn ymarfer ail-werthuso. Nid oedd hyn yn rhan o'r ymarfer ail-werthuso; yr oedd yn ymwneud ag edrych ar y ffordd y caiff rhyddhad ardrethi ei ddefnyddio'n gyffredinol mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, os hoffech anfon nodyn pellach ataf am hynny, Lisa, mae croeso i chi wneud hynny.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and Skills

Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg Welsh-medium Education

C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y dilyniant mewn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg rhwng ysgolion meithrin, ysgolion cynradd ac ysgolion uwchradd? OAQ0944(ELL)

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yr ydym yn buddsoddi £7 miliwn i hyfforddi 570 o ymarferwyr ychwanegol y blynyddoedd cynnar drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. Yr ydym wedi gofyn i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg weithio gyda ni i ddatblygu rhai mesurau ymarferol er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r mater o ddiffyg parhad ieithyddol rhwng yr ysgol gynradd a'r ysgol uwchradd, sy'n digwydd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Croesawaf y buddsoddiad hwn yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, fel y gwyddoch. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn colli plant sydd mewn addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg wrth iddynt drosglwyddo o ysgolion meithrin i ysgolion cynradd, ac hyd yn oed yn fwy, o ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd. Felly, er eich bod yn buddsoddi yn y blynyddoedd cynnar, os nad ewch i'r afael â'r broblem o ddilyniant a'r trosglwyddiad o'r sector cynradd i'r sector uwchradd, mae

Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the progression in Welsh-medium education between nursery, primary and secondary schools? OAQ0944(ELL)

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): We are investing £7 million to train 570 additional early-years practitioners through the medium of Welsh. We have asked the Welsh Language Board to work with us to develop some practical measures to address the issue of linguistic discontinuity between primary and secondary school, which occurs in some parts of Wales.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I welcome this investment in the early years, as you know. However, we lose children in Welsh-medium education when they transfer from nursery schools to primary schools and, even more so, from primary schools to secondary schools. Therefore, although you are investing in the early years, if you do not tackle the problem of progression and transition from the primary to the secondary sector, there is a danger that that investment

peryl y bydd y buddsoddiad hwnnw'n cael ei wastraffu. Beth a wnewch i sicrhau ar 1 Medi bob blwyddyn nad ydym yn colli 50 y cant o blant o addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg wrth iddynt drosglwyddo o ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd?

Jane Davidson: Yn ôl ein ffigurau ni, mae'r symudiad rhwng ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd yn 22 y cant. Gwn, drwy waith Llais y Lli, fod problem leol mewn pedair ysgol yn sir Gaerfyrddin, Ceredigion a Chonwy. Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r siroedd a chyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg i wella materion yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Neges bwysig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw ein bod yn annog pobl i drosglwyddo o ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd Cymraeg. Cefnogaf yr iaith Gymraeg mewn addysg, ond nid yw'n broblem hawdd i'w datrys gan ei fod yn fater lleol yn hytrach na chenedlaethol.

Alun Cairns: A yw'r Gweinidog yn derbyn bod cyflwr rhai o'r adeiladau yn ein hysgolion uwchradd cyfrwng Cymraeg yn wael iawn a bod hynny'n dylanwadu'n negyddol ar benderfyniadau rhai disgyblion wrth iddynt symud o ysgolion cynradd i ysgolion uwchradd?

Jane Davidson: Ni chytunaf â hynny, ac nid yw rhieni'n dweud hynny wrthyf ychwaith. Mae safon yr addysg yn ein hysgolion yn uchel iawn. Y mater pwysicaf yw sicrhau bod gan rieni hyder digonol i gefnogi plant sydd mewn ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg, yn enwedig pan nad yw aelodau eraill o'r teulu yn siarad Cymraeg. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi rhoi mwy o gefnogaeth i brosiect arbennig i gefnogi rhieni yn y sefyllfa hon.

Ad-drefnu Adnoddau Ysgolion Reorganisation of School Resources

Q2 Jonathan Morgan: What representations has the Minister made to Cardiff County Council regarding the proposed reorganisation of school resources across the city? OAQ0958(ELL)

Jane Davidson: None. The provision of school places in Cardiff is a matter for the local authority.

is wasted. What will you do to ensure that, on 1 September every year, we do not lose 50 per cent of children from Welsh-medium education as they transfer from primary schools to secondary schools?

Jane Davidson: According to our figures, the drift between primary and secondary schools is 22 per cent. I know, through the work of Llais y Lli, that there is a local problem in four schools in Carmarthenshire, Ceredigion and Conwy. We are working with those counties and with the Welsh Language Board to improve matters in those areas. The Assembly Government's important message is that we encourage people to transfer from Welsh-medium primary schools to Welsh-medium secondary schools. I support the Welsh language in education, but it is not an easy problem to resolve as it is a local rather than a national issue.

Alun Cairns: Does the Minister accept that the condition of some of the buildings in our Welsh-medium secondary schools is very poor and that that has a negative influence on the decisions of some pupils as they move from primary to secondary schools?

Jane Davidson: I do not agree with that, nor are parents telling me that. The standard of education in our schools is very high. The most important matter is ensuring that parents have sufficient confidence to support children in Welsh-medium schools, particularly when other members of the family do not speak Welsh. That is why we have given more support to a special project to support parents in this situation.

C2 Jonathan Morgan: Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu rhoi i Gyngor Sir Caerdydd ynghylch y bwriad i ad-drefnu adnoddau ysgolion ar draws y ddinas? OAQ0958(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Nid wyf wedi rhoi dim sylwadau iddo. Mater i'r awdurdod lleol yw darparu lleoedd ysgol yng Nghaerdydd.

Jonathan Morgan: Your department will now be paying close attention to the inspection report that was released this week into Llanedeyrn High School in the city, which sadly has not done well. The report mentions shortcomings in standards that pupil achieve, in the effectiveness of teaching and assessment and in the quality of strategic leadership and management across the school. The inspector has recommended that special measures are required in relation to this school. This is, of course, a sad week for Llanedeyrn High School, where many teachers work extremely hard to provide a standard of education under difficult circumstances.

2.40 p.m.

However, it is clear that action is now required. Can you provide some indication about what work now needs to be done within Cardiff council and, perhaps, in consultation with your department, in order to bring this school up to scratch?

Jane Davidson: It is a very serious matter if schools are deemed to need special measures, because we, as an Assembly Government, working with Estyn, want to ensure that all schools are of a sufficient standard; I am sure that that view would be shared by all Assembly Members. There will now be close co-operation between the local authority and the school in responding to the Estyn timetable to ensure that the school can come out of special measures as quickly as possible, because it takes on board the concerns that have been mentioned. It is also important to say that we have taken Wales-only legislation powers, which we will be bringing to the Assembly shortly, in terms of having regulations on partnerships between local authorities and schools over school improvement to ensure that, as far as possible, schools do not go into special measures because they are adequately supported by their local authority.

Leanne Wood: Minister, one of the biggest criticisms of the recent Liberal Democrat school closure plan was the way in which the consultation exercise was undertaken. In effect, they named the schools that they

Jonathan Morgan: Bydd eich adran bellach yn rhoi sylw manwl i'r adroddiad arolygu a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos hon ar gyfer Ysgol Uwchradd Llanedern yn y ddinas, nad yw wedi gwneud yn dda, yn anffodus. Mae'r adroddiad yn crybwyll diffygion yn y safonau y mae disgyblion yn eu cyrraedd, effeithiolrwydd addysgu ac asesu, ac ansawdd arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth strategol drwy'r ysgol. Mae'r arolygydd wedi argymhell bod angen mesurau arbennig mewn perthynas â'r ysgol hon. Mae hon, wrth gwrs, yn wythnos drist i Ysgol Uwchradd Llanedern, lle y mae nifer o athrawon yn gweithio'n galed iawn i ddarparu addysg o safon o dan amgylchiadau anodd.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg nfd angen gweithredu'n awr. A allwch roi syniad inni pa waith y mae angen i gyngor Caerdydd ei wneud yn awr, a hwyrach drwy ymgynghori â'ch adran, er mwyn sicrhau bod yr ysgol hon yn cyrraedd y safon?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n fater difrifol iawn os tybir bod angen mesurau arbennig ar ysgolion, oherwydd yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, gan weithio gydag Estyn, am sicrhau bod pob ysgol yn cyrraedd safon ddigonol; yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn cytuno â hynny. Bydd cydweithio agos yn awr rhwng yr awdurdod lleol a'r ysgol wrth ymateb i amserlen Estyn, er mwyn sicrhau y gall mesurau arbennig ddod i ben yn yr ysgol cyn gynted â phosibl, am ei bod yn ystyried y pryderon a grybwyllwyd. Mae hefyd yn bwysig dweud ein bod wedi defnyddio pwerau deddfwriaeth Cymru yn unig, a gaiff eu cyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad yn fuan, o ran rheoleiddio partneriaethau rhwng awdurdodau lleol ac ysgolion ar wella ysgolion er mwyn sicrhau, cyn belled â phosibl, na fydd ysgolion yn gorfod cael mesurau arbennig am nad ydynt yn cael cefnogaeth ddigonol gan eu hawdurdod lleol.

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, un o'r ffactorau a feirniadwyd fwyaf yn y cynllun cau ysgolion yn ddiweddar gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol oedd y ffordd y cynhaliwyd yr ymgynghori. I bob diben, enwyd yr ysgolion

wanted to close, thereby inviting mass opposition—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister indicated earlier that she has no responsibility for whatever the Welsh Liberal Democrats may or may not have done in Cardiff.

Leanne Wood: Thank you, Presiding Officer. Plaid-Cymru-controlled Gwynedd Council has been praised by the Welsh Local Government Association—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am very familiar with Gwynedd Council; in fact, I was there last Friday. I do not believe that the Minister has any responsibility for how Gwynedd Council conducts its consultations either.

Leanne Wood: However, it is carrying out an exercise of good practice, for which it has been praised by the WLGA. Would you be prepared to join the WLGA in recognising the sensitive and anti-divisive way in which Gwynedd is carrying out that consultation with regard to what we would all acknowledge is a difficult problem? Will you recommend to the Liberal Democrats in Cardiff that they take some lessons from Gwynedd?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Local authorities are democratic bodies, as are we. They are elected people who are accountable to their electorate. I do not think that we would like it if they started interfering with us; neither should we interfere with them. There is no need for the Minister to answer that question.

Tangyflawni Addysgol Educational Underachievement

Q3 Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister make a statement on how the Welsh Assembly Government is tackling educational underachievement among looked-after children? OAQ0959(ELL)

Jane Davidson: The Welsh Assembly Government has undertaken significant work across ministerial portfolios to improve on this aspect. Most recently, we have provided

yr oeddent am eu cau, a thrwy hynny gwahoddwyd gwrthwynebiad cyffredinol—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn gynharach nad yw'n gyfrifol am beth bynnag y gallai Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru fod wedi'i wneud neu beidio yng Nghaerdydd.

Leanne Wood: Diolch, Lywydd. Mae Cyngor Gwynedd, a reolir gan Blaid Cymru, wedi cael ei ganmol gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â Chyngor Gwynedd; yn wir, yr oeddwn yno ddydd Gwener diwethaf. Ni chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn gyfrifol am y ffordd y mae Cyngor Gwynedd yn cynnal ei ymgynghoriadau ychwaith.

Leanne Wood: Fodd bynnag, mae wrthi'n cynnal ymarfer arfer da, ac mae CLILC wedi ei ganmol am hynny. A fydddech yn barod i ymuno â CLILC i gydnabod y ffordd sensitif a di-ymrannol y mae Gwynedd yn gwneud yr ymgynghori hwnnw ar yr hyn y byddem i gyd yn ei chydnabod fel problem anodd? A wnewch argymhell y dylai'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghaerdydd ddysgu gwersi gan Wynedd?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn gyrrff democrataidd, fel yr ydym ni. Maent yn bobl wedi eu hethol sy'n atebol i'w hetholwyr. Nid wyf yn credu y byddem yn hoffi eu gweld hwy'n dechrau ymyrryd yn ein busnes ni, ac ni ddylem ni ychwaith ymyrryd yn eu busnes hwy. Nid oes angen i'r Gweinidog ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw.

C3 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn mynd i'r afael â thangyflawni addysgol ymysg plant sy'n cael gofal? OAQ0959(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi gwneud llawer o waith ar draws portffolios y Gweinidogion i wella'r agwedd hon. Yn fwyaf diweddar, yr ydym wedi

£1 million in 2006-07 and 2007-08 as part of the raising attainment and individual standards in education programme, and established a stakeholder group to inform a programme of work to promote the educational achievement of looked-after children.

Karen Sinclair: Do you agree that the money distributed to local authorities for 2007-08 aimed specifically to raise the educational attainment of looked-after children will go some way to improving the educational attainment of children in care? At a time when the educational results of children in Wales are rising, it cannot be acceptable that only 35 per cent of children in care achieve two or more GCSEs or their equivalent. Do you agree that this money will kick-start improvements in the educational attainment of looked-after children in north-east Wales and encourage them to move on to further and higher education and training? Can this money be seen as an ongoing, growing commitment by you to these children?

Jane Davidson: It can certainly be seen as an ongoing, growing commitment from the whole of the Assembly Government. It is interesting to note that, in Swansea in 2004, specific action was taken about a cohort of 11 young people sitting GCSEs. They were kept in the same school and were helped with their schoolwork at home, sustainable placements with the same carer were maintained and, as a result, 82 per cent of those children achieved two GCSEs at grades A* to G. It is exactly that kind of practice that is driving the agenda that we are putting in place. I can assure you that the new taskforce that is looking at these issues across the Assembly Government will be continuously reporting to me and to Jane Hutt as the Minister for children in terms of taking this agenda forward in north-east Wales and elsewhere.

William Graham: You will acknowledge that the education of looked-after children is too often linked with that of pupils with special educational needs. Can you confirm the impact that this has upon their underachievement and how this matter can be appropriately addressed?

darparu £1 filiwn yn 2006-07 a 2007-08 fel rhan o'r rhaglen i godi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion, ac wedi sefydlu grŵp rhanddeiliaid i lywio rhaglen waith i hybu cyflawniad addysgol plant sy'n cael gofal.

Karen Sinclair: A gytunwch y bydd yr arian i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2007-08 sy'n anelu'n bennaf at wella cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant sy'n cael gofal yn helpu gwneud hynny i ryw raddau? Ar adeg pan yw canlyniadau addysgol plant yng Nghymru yn gwella, ni all fod yn dderbyniol mai 35 y cant yn unig o blant mewn gofal sy'n ennill dau TGAU neu fwy neu gymwysterau cyfatebol. A gytunwch y bydd yr arian hwn yn hwb i wella cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant mewn gofal yn y gogledd-ddwyrain ac yn eu hannog i symud ymlaen i addysg bellach ac addysg uwch a hyfforddiant? A ellir gweld yr arian hwn fel ymrwymiad parhaus, cynyddol gennych i'r plant hyn?

Jane Davidson: Yn bendant, gellir ei weld fel ymrwymiad parhaus, cynyddol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gyfan. Mae'n ddiddorol sylwi, yn Abertawe yn 2004, fod camau penodol wedi eu cymryd mewn perthynas ag 11 o bobl ifanc a oedd yn sefyll arholiadau TGAU. Fe'u cadwyd yn yr un ysgol a rhoddwyd help iddynt gyda'u gwaith cartref yn eu cartrefi, cawsant ofal gan yr un gofalwr, ac o ganlyniad enillodd 82 y cant o'r plant hynny ddau TGAU gradd A* i G neu fwy. Y math hwnnw o arfer sy'n llywio'r agenda a roddir ar waith gennym. Gallaf eich sicrhau y bydd y tasglu newydd sy'n edrych ar y materion hyn ar draws Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno adroddiadau rheolaidd i mi ac i Jane Hutt, fel y Gweinidog dros blant, ynglŷn â datblygu'r agenda hon yn y gogledd-ddwyrain ac mewn mannau eraill.

William Graham: Fel y gwyddoch, caiff addysg plant sy'n cael gofal ei chysylltu'n rhy aml ag addysg plant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. A allwch gadarnhau'r effaith y mae hyn yn ei chael ar eu tangyflawni, a sut y gellir mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn briodol?

Jane Davidson: The new investment from RAISE, namely the £1 million targeted at looked-after children, will be able to be targeted at individual children in terms of ensuring that they are given the right amount of educational support, whatever their educational needs. In addition, we are giving £1.2 million to the Welsh local government improvement agency to improve leadership capacity and build sustainability within local government in terms of children services in Wales. Therefore, we are taking this forward within a wider agenda.

William Graham: I acknowledge that you are acknowledging that there is a difficulty and that you are trying to ameliorate that. However, surely it is vital that schools, where possible, avoid placing looked-after children in classes or groups with children with special educational needs or poorly behaved children, as that causes so much more problems with discipline in the school and prevents those who want to learn from learning.

Jane Davidson: A key issue that has come out in our investigation into this work and in talking to organisations, such as Voices from Care, is the number of school moves that individual children make. That is why I particularly quoted the Swansea example. Swansea is not the only local authority doing good work in this area, but it found that, by keeping children in the same school and providing the right network of support, however difficult that was for the local authority, it was able to dramatically affect the life chances of those children. When you look at those figures, you will see that 82 per cent of children achieved two GCSE qualifications at grades A to G, in contrast to the 2003-04 figure of 41 per cent, for example, for the whole of Wales. We can see that dramatic effect and we would all want to support a similar agenda in other parts of Wales.

Jane Davidson: Bydd y buddsoddiad newydd gan Rhagori, sef £1 filiwn yn targedu plant sy'n cael gofal, yn gallu targedu plant unigol er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cael y cymorth addysgol cywir y mae arnynt ei angen, waeth beth fo'u hanghenion addysgol. Yn ogystal, yr ydym yn rhoi £1.2 miliwn i asiantaeth gwella llywodraeth leol Cymru i wella arweinyddiaeth a datblygu cynaliadwyedd mewn llywodraeth leol o ran gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru. Felly, yr ydym yn datblygu hyn o fewn agenda ehangach.

William Graham: Yr wyf yn cydnabod eich bod yn derbyn bod anhawster a'ch bod yn ceisio gwella hynny. Fodd bynnag, onid yw'n hanfodol i ysgolion, lle mae'n bosibl, osgoi gosod plant sy'n cael gofal mewn dosbarthiadau neu grwpiau lle mae plant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig neu blant ag ymddygiad gwael, gan fod hynny'n achosi llawer mwy o broblemau disgyblaeth yn yr ysgol ac yn rhwystro'r rheini sydd am ddysgu rhag gwneud hynny?

Jane Davidson: Un o'r prif faterion sydd wedi deillio o'n hymchwiliad i'r gwaith hwn ac o siarad â sefydliadau fel Voices from Care, yw nifer y gweithiau y bydd plant unigol yn symud o ysgol i ysgol. Dyna pam y dyfynnais enghraifft Abertawe yn benodol. Nid Abertawe yw'r unig awdurdod lleol sy'n gwneud gwaith da yn y maes hwn. Ond gwelodd, drwy gadw plant yn yr un ysgol a darparu'r rhwydwaith cymorth cywir, waeth pa mor anodd oedd hynny i'r awdurdod lleol, fod hynny'n gallu effeithio'n ddramatig ar gyfleoedd bywyd y plant hynny. Pan edrychwch ar y ffigurau hynny, fe welwch fod 82 y cant o blant wedi ennill dau gymhwyster TGAU graddau A i G, o'u cymharu â 41 y cant yn 2003-04, er enghraifft, ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Gallwn weld yr effaith ddramatig honno, a byddai pob un ohonom am gefnogi agenda debyg mewn rhannau eraill o Gymru.

Addysg Cyfrwng Cymraeg (Caerdydd) Welsh-medium Education (Cardiff)

Q4 Jenny Randerson: Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of Welsh-medium education in Cardiff?

C4 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu addysg cyfrwng Cymraeg yng Nghaerdydd?

OAQ0926(ELL)

Jane Davidson: There are 10 Welsh-medium primary schools in Cardiff. A further two primary schools provide Welsh-medium and English-medium education. There are two Welsh-medium secondary schools in Cardiff.

Jenny Randerson: Given that your Government is committed to sticking to a maximum of 30 pupils in primary school classes, and that there are declining numbers of pupils in Cardiff, the unassailable logic is that some schools will have to close. However, in Cardiff there is a rising demand for Welsh-medium education, which is a parental choice that I strongly support. Do you agree that it was totally illogical of Plaid Cymru, as a party, to oppose the Cardiff school—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not know why this set of education questions is becoming so party politicised. The Minister has no responsibility for the Plaid Cymru group in Cardiff council, and neither have I.

Jenny Randerson: I will phrase it another way.

The Presiding Officer: I hope that you will.

Jenny Randerson: Do you agree that opposing a plan to utilise English-medium schools, which were well undersubscribed, by converting them to Welsh-medium schools is illogical?

The Presiding Officer: Order. These are all matters for Cardiff council, as the Minister indicated at the beginning of her answer to the previous question. I concur with her view. While I am in this chair, we will not second-guess the debates of local authorities. Members of the council are elected members, just like us. If I can have a question, which does not interfere in Gwynedd or in Cardiff, I will allow it as being in order.

David Melding, would you like to have a go? [*Laughter.*]

David Melding: I hope that I will be of service, Presiding Officer. Cardiff used to

OAQ0926(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae 10 o ysgolion cynradd Cymraeg yng Nghaerdydd. Mae dwy ysgol gynradd arall sy'n darparu addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg a'r Saesneg. Mae dwy ysgol uwchradd Gymraeg yng Nghaerdydd.

Jenny Randerson: O gofio bod eich Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i gadw at uchafswm o 30 o ddisgyblion i bob dosbarth mewn ysgolion cynradd, a bod nifer y disgyblion yng Nghaerdydd yn gostwng, y rhesymeg ddiwrthbrawf yw y bydd yn rhaid i rai ysgolion gau. Fodd bynnag, yng Nghaerdydd, mae galw cynyddol am addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, sy'n ddewis i rieni yr wyf yn ei gefnogi'n gryf. A gytunwch ei bod yn gwbl afresymegol i Blaid Cymru, fel plaid, wrthwynebu—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni wn pam mae'r gyfres hon o gwestiynau addysg yn dechrau mynd i'r afael â gwleidyddiaeth plaid. Nid oes gan y Gweinidog ddim cyfrifoldeb dros grŵp Plaid Cymru yng nghyngor Caerdydd, ac nid oes gennyf finnau ychwaith.

Jenny Randerson: Geiriau y cwestiwn mewn ffordd arall.

Y Llywydd: Gobeithio y gwnewch hynny.

Jenny Randerson: A gytunwch fod gwrthwynebu cynllun i ddefnyddio ysgolion cyfrwng Saesneg, lle nad oedd digon o ddisgyblion, a'u troi'n ysgolion cyfrwng Cymraeg yn afresymegol?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Materion ar gyfer cyngor Caerdydd yw'r rhain, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog ar ddechrau ei hateb i'r cwestiwn blaenorol. Yr wyf yn cytuno â hi. Tra byddaf fi yn y gadair hon, ni fyddwn yn mynd ati i ragweld trafodaethau awdurdodau lleol. Mae aelodau'r cyngor yn aelodau etholedig, fel ninnau. Os caf gwestiwn nad yw'n ymyrryd â Gwynedd na Chaerdydd, fe'i caniatâf fel cwestiwn mewn trefn.

David Melding, hoffech chi roi cynnig arni? [*Chwerthin.*]

David Melding: Gobeithio y gallaf fod o gymorth, Lywydd. Arferai Caerdydd

provide many facilities for children in the vale seeking Welsh-language education. Will you join me in commending the success of the secondary school that opened a few years ago in Barry? It confirms how important it is, even in highly anglicised areas—at least, in formerly anglicised areas—to provide Welsh-language education, which many parents want, whether they speak Welsh or not.

Jane Davidson: The Assembly Government is extremely supportive of the expansion of Welsh-medium education. There are two broad principles, in a sense, that we would want local authorities to look at in terms of issues around schooling in their areas, the first of which is that they must know what the demand is for Welsh-medium education, particularly in the anglicised areas. I am delighted to say that new requirements under the single education plan for local authorities to be active in assessing demand are in place at present. We have strongly encouraged local authorities to have arrangements for surveys in hand. At present, I understand that Cardiff has not taken that approach, and my officials will take that forward with it.

2.50 p.m.

The second point is that there are substantial surplus places in Wales; that is a fact that we cannot get away from. Even in the Welsh-medium sector, in Cardiff, there are 12.3 surplus places in the primary sector, and 17.6 surplus places in the secondary sector, according to Cardiff's own draft plan. However, we need the surveys in place, and we need local authorities to ensure, across the board, that they have schools in the right place for what is, overall, a declining school population.

ddarparu nifer o gyfleusterau i blant yn y fro a oedd yn dymuno cael addysg Gymraeg. A wnewch chi ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo llwyddiant yr ysgol uwchradd a agorwyd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl yn y Barri? Mae'n cadarnhau mor bwysig ydyw, hyd yn oed mewn ardaloedd Seisnig iawn—o leiaf, mewn ardaloedd a arferai fod yn Seisnig—i ddarparu addysg Gymraeg, fel y mae nifer o rieni'n dymuno, p'un a ydynt yn siarad Cymraeg neu beidio.

Jane Davidson: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gefnogol iawn i'r broses o ehangu addysg Gymraeg. Mae yna ddwy egwyddor gyffredinol, ar ryw ystyr, y dymunwn i awdurdodau lleol eu hystyried mewn materion yn gysylltiedig ag ysgolion yn eu hardaloedd. Y cyntaf yw fod yn rhaid iddynt wybod faint o galw sydd am addysg Gymraeg, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd Seisnig. Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud bod gofynion newydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd o dan y cynllun addysg sengl sy'n ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol fynd ati i asesu'r galw. Yr ydym wedi annog awdurdodau lleol yn gryf i sicrhau bod ganddynt drefniadau ar gyfer arolygon. Ar hyn o bryd, deallaf nad yw Caerdydd wedi mabwysiadu'r dull hwnnw, a bydd fy swyddogion yn trafod hynny gyda'r Cyngor.

Yr ail bwynt yw bod nifer sylweddol o leoedd gwag yng Nghymru; mae honno'n ffaith na allwn ei diystyru. Hyd yn oed yn y sector cyfrwng Cymraeg, yng Nghaerdydd mae 12.3 o leoedd gwag yn y sector cynradd, a 17.6 o leoedd gwag yn y sector uwchradd, yn ôl cynllun drafft Caerdydd ei hun. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni sicrhau bod yr arolygon ar waith, ac mae angen i awdurdodau lleol, yn gyffredinol, sicrhau bod eu hysgolion yn y manau cywir ar gyfer poblogaeth ysgol sy'n lleihau'n gyffredinol.

Cynorthwyo Myfyrwyr Assisting Students

C5 Owen John Thomas: Pa gynnydd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud gyda'r penderfyniad a gafwyd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 22 Mehefin 2005 ynghylch cynorthwyo myfyrwyr na allant ddilyn eu dewis gyrsiau

Q5 Owen John Thomas: What progress has the Minister made on the Plenary resolution of 22 June 2005 regarding assisting students who are unable to pursue courses of their choice in Wales? OAQ0925(ELL)

yng Nghymru? OAQ0925(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf wedi comisiynu cyngor gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru ar yr ystod o bynciau nad ydynt ar gael i fyfyrwyr i'w hastudio yng Nghymru. Mae'r sefyllfa gyfreithiol yn cael ei hystyried, ond mae'n amlwg bod rhwystrau sylweddol o ran dod o hyd i ateb cynnar i'r mater hwn.

Owen John Thomas: Ni wn beth ydych yn ei olygu wrth 'cynnar', Weinidog, ond bydd myfyrwyr newydd o Gymru yn dechrau ar gyrsgiau megis gwyddoniaeth filfeddygol o fewn dau neu dri mis. Mae'r methiant i ddatrys y cwestiwn o gymorth cyllidol yn adlewyrchu'n wael ar y Llywodraeth, ac, yn anffodus, ym marn llawer, ar y Cynulliad fel sefydliad cenedlaethol. Gwerthfawrogaf fod gan y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes bortffolio eang, ond mae ganddi hefyd lawer o staff i ymdrin â'r fath faterion. A wnewch addo trefnu bod ymdrech arbennig yn cael ei gwneud i ddatrys y mater hwn cyn dechrau tymor newydd y prifysgolion?

Jane Davidson: No, I will not, because what reflects poorly on the Assembly is making propositions that are then extremely difficult to deliver, and that could land us in legal trouble—this Assembly Government will not do that. If we take veterinary science as an example, some 760 students, including European Union students, study veterinary science in the UK at present. At £1,800 per student, if the fee remission grant were available, that would cost over £1.3 million a year in terms of our having to fund the European Union students, as you have been told in committee before, rather than the £270,000 for 150 Welsh-domiciled students. As a party, you may be happy for us to spend vast amounts of money—over £1 million—on students for whom we have no responsibility and no obligation in terms of Wales, and who have no commitment to Wales and will never come here, but I am not. That is why these issues are extremely difficult, and why we are looking into this hard in terms of delivering on our obligation on the Assembly resolution.

Jane Davidson: I have commissioned advice from the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales on the range of subjects that are not available to students to study in Wales. The legal position is under consideration, but it is clear that there are formidable obstacles to finding an early solution to this issue.

Owen John Thomas: I do not know what you mean by 'early', Minister, but new students from Wales will be starting courses such as veterinary science within two or three months. The failure to solve the question of financial assistance reflects poorly on the Government, and unfortunately, in the eyes of many, on the Assembly as a national body. I appreciate that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills has a vast portfolio, but she also has a great many staff to deal with such issues. Will you promise to arrange a special effort to solve this problem before the start of the new university term?

Jane Davidson: Na wnaf, ni wnaf hynny, oherwydd yr hyn sy'n adlewyrchu'n wael ar y Cynulliad yw gwneud cynigion sydd wedyn yn anodd iawn eu cyflawni, a gallai hynny greu trafferth gyfreithiol inni—ni fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hwn yn gwneud hynny. Os cymerwn filfeddygaeth fel enghraifft, mae tua 760 o fyfyrwyr, gan gynnwys myfyrwyr o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, yn astudio milfeddygaeth yn y DU ar hyn o bryd. Pe bai'r grant talu ffioedd o £1,800 y myfyriwr ar gael, byddai'n costio dros £1.3 miliwn y flwyddyn i ariannu myfyrwyr o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, fel y dywedwyd wrthyh yn y pwyllgor yn flaenorol, yn hytrach na'r £270,000 ar gyfer 150 o fyfyrwyr sy'n huanu o Gymru. Fel plaid, efallai eich bod chi'n fodlon inni wario symiau mawr o arian—dros £1 filiwn—ar fyfyrwyr nad oes gennym unrhyw gyfrifoldeb amdanynt na rhwymedigaeth o dan Cymru, nad oes ganddynt unrhyw ymrwymiad i Gymru ac na fyddant byth yn dod yma, ond nid wyf fi'n fodlon. Dyna pam mae'r materion hyn yn anodd iawn, a dyna pam yr ydym yn ystyried hyn yn ofalus o ran cyflawni'n hymrwymiad i'r cynnig gan y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: The Minister will be aware—in fact, I believe that she has indicated as much—that the resolution that we refer to was tabled in the names of all four party leaders. Therefore, there is an obligation, which reflects the fact that all parties signed up to it. Legal advice was taken at the time, as I am sure the Minister was aware. The legal advice that we were given is that, although there were difficulties, in terms of those courses that were not available in Wales, such as veterinary science and marine engineering, as well as some language courses, I believe, there were ways of getting around this. Therefore, I would urge the Minister to come forward with a written, or oral, statement. There are issues here that the four party leaders recognise, and which, I believe, all Assembly Members recognise, which we need to address, in terms of equity for those Welsh students who are unable to pursue these courses in Wales, and are forced to go elsewhere—to England, Scotland, or wherever.

Jane Davidson: As I indicated in my response, I fully accept our obligation as an Assembly Government to take this forward. However, I am sure that you would agree that we cannot possibly be in a position to take the decision to support 150 Welsh-domiciled students for £270,000, which would then be a cost on the Assembly of £1.3 million a year, because of the issue around the European Union students, which is why my emphatic response to Owen John was in terms of this year. We will continue to look at this issue very carefully.

Peter Black: Because your Government has decided not to introduce top-up fees this year, you are already subsidising English students in universities for the next academic year. You have outlined some very severe problems. This was an all-party agreement, as Nick Bourne said, which was brought forward in that spirit. As a year has now passed since the resolution came before us, and as your department is still finding problems in implementing that resolution, will you not consider convening representatives of the four parties to see whether we can understand those problems between us and find a commonly acceptable

Nick Bourne: Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod—yn wir, yr wyf yn credu ei bod wedi dweud hynny—fod y cynnig y cyfeiriwn ato wedi'i gyflwyno yn enwau arweinwyr y pedair plaid. Felly, mae yna ymrwymiad, sy'n adlewyrchu'r ffaith fod pob plaid wedi'i gefnogi. Ceisiwyd cyngor cyfreithiol ar y pryd, ac yr wyf yn siŵr fod y Gweinidog yn gwybod. Y cyngor cyfreithiol a roddwyd inni, er gwaethaf anawsterau, o ran y cyrsiau hynny nad oeddent ar gael yng Nghymru, fel milfeddygaeth a pheirianeg môr, yn ogystal â rhai cyrsiau iaith, mi gredaf, oedd bod ffyrdd i osgoi hyn. Felly, byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i gyflwyno datganiad ysgrifenedig, neu lafar. Mae yma faterion y mae arweinwyr y pedair plaid yn cydnabod, a phob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn cydnabod, mi gredaf, fod angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwy, o ran tegwch i'r myfyrwyr hynny o Gymru na allant ddilyn y cyrsiau hyn yng Nghymru, ac sy'n cael eu gorfodi i fynd i fannau eraill—i Loegr, yr Alban, neu ble bynnag.

Jane Davidson: Fel y dywedais yn fy ymateb, yr wyf yn derbyn yn llawn ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i weithredu ar y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch na allwn fod mewn sefyllfa i wneud y penderfyniad i gynorthwyo 150 o fyfyrwyr so Gymru am £270,000, a fyddai wedyn yn costio £1.3 miliwn y flwyddyn i'r Cynulliad, oherwydd problem myfyrwyr o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Dyna pam yr oedd fy ymateb pendant i Owen John yn cyfeirio at eleni. Byddwn yn dal i ystyried y mater hwn yn ofalus iawn.

Peter Black: Am fod eich Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu peidio â chyflwyno fffioedd atodol eleni, yr ydych eisoes yn rhoi cymorthdaliadau i fyfyrwyr o Loegr mewn prifysgolion am y flwyddyn academiaidd nesaf. Yr ydych wedi amlinellu rhai problemau difrifol iawn. Cytundeb trawsbleidiol oedd hwn, fel y dywedodd Nick Bourne, a ddygwyd ymlaen yn yr ysbryd hwnnw. Gan fod blwyddyn wedi mynd heibio ers i'r cynnig ddod ger ein bron, a chan fod eich adran yn dal i gael problemau wrth weithredu'r cynnig hwnnw a basiwyd, onid ystyriwch ymgynnull cynrychiolwyr o'r pedair plaid i weld a allwn ddeall y

way forward on this?

Jane Davidson: I am waiting for legal advice in order to explore these issues further. There are some 16 courses that are not available in Wales, but there are some courses that are only available in Wales to students from elsewhere. However, some of those courses would not necessarily bring any community benefit to Wales; it is difficult to see how Australasian studies are of a benefit to Wales in that context. We know that some of the data is flawed—the data indicated that we did not have dentistry courses, when we know that we do. We are looking at those issues, and when we have received the legal advice, if we are not able to move forward with this issue, I am very happy to say that we will convene meetings between parties to discuss how we take this forward.

problemau hynny rhyngom a chael ffordd ymlaen sy'n dderbyniol i bawb ar y mater hwn?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn disgwyl cyngor cyfreithiol er mwyn archwilio'r materion hyn ymhellach. Mae tuag 16 o gyrсияu nad ydynt ar gael yng Nghymru, ond mae yna rai gyrсияu sydd ar gael yng Nghymru'n unig i fyfyrwyr o fannau eraill. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai rhai o'r gyrсияu hynny o reidrwydd yn dod ag unrhyw fuddiant cymunedol i Gymru; mae'n anodd gweld sut y byddai astudiaethau Awstralasiaidd o fudd i Gymru yn y cyddestun hwnnw. Gwn fod rhai o'r data'n ddiffygiol—yr oedd y data'n dangos nad oedd gennym gyrсияu deintyddiaeth, a ninnau'n gwybod bod gennym gyrсияu felly. Yr ydym yn ystyried y materion hynny, a phan fyddwn wedi cael y cyngor cyfreithiol, os na allwn weithredu ar y mater hwn, yr wyf yn fodlon iawn dweud y byddwn yn galw cyfarfodydd rhwng pleidiau i drafod sut y gallwn weithredu ar y mater hwn.

Colegau Amaethyddol Agricultural Colleges

Q6 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on agricultural colleges in Wales? OAQ0957(ELL)

C6 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am golegau amaethyddol yng Nghymru? OAQ0957(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Agricultural courses are provided in several further education colleges across Wales.

Jane Davidson: Caiff gyrсияu amaethyddiaeth eu darparu mewn nifer o golegau addysg bellach ledled Cymru.

Brynle Williams: I have spoken to you about this before, but should the principals of both leading colleges in north Wales decide to agree to support a merger, would you support, in principle, coming to an agreement with the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside to make available capital resources to provide education and training facilities in north Wales equivalent to those offered in England?

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf wedi siarad â chi am hyn o'r blaen, ond pe bai penaethiaid y ddau brif goleg yn y gogledd yn penderfynu cytuno i gefnogi proses uno, a fydddech chi'n cefnogi egwyddor dod i gytundeb gyda'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad i sicrhau bod adnoddau cyfalaf ar gael i ddarparu cyfleusterau addysg a hyfforddiant yn y gogledd i gyfateb i'r rheini a gynnigir yn Lloegr?

Jane Davidson: We need to take this one step at a time. First, we need to look at the independent review that was commissioned by ELWa before it merged with the Assembly Government, to examine the feasibility of a number of possible merger options. No decision to proceed will be taken by us until that review has been concluded.

Jane Davidson: Mae angen inni fynd i'r afael â hwn un cam ar y tro. Yn gyntaf, mae angen inni ystyried yr adolygiad annibynnol a gomisiynwyd gan ELWa cyn iddo uno â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i archwilio ymarferoldeb nifer o ddewisiadau uno posibl. Ni fyddwn yn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniad i fwrw ati nes bydd yr adolygiad hwnnw

There will then need to be a period of public consultation on those areas, and we would then look at whether or not there needed to be additional investment. However, it would not be based on any input figures in comparison to England—it would be based on wanting to know what we needed to deliver in the context of Wales.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Os ydym am weld perthynas well rhwng sefydliadau sy'n cynnig cyrsiau addysgol, gan gynnwys colegau amaethyddol, sut mae modd gwneud hynny pan eich bod wedi penderfynu rhewi cyllideb colegau addysg bellach ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf? Yn hytrach na datblygu gwasanaethau, rhaid iddynt ystyried torri cyrsiau, gwrthod myfyrwyr a chael gwared ar staff. Sut y bydd hynny'n helpu polisi eich Llywodraeth chi?

Jane Davidson: Cefnogwyd polisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gael system genedlaethol i gynllunio a chyllido addysg ac hyfforddiant yng Nghymru gan y pwyllgor o dan gadeiryddiaeth Cynog Dafis. Yr ydym yn creu'r system honno ar hyn o bryd ledled Cymru a ledled y sectorau. Mae pawb wedi cael cyfle i weithio gyda'i gilydd, gydag arian newydd i gefnogi cydweithio yn y system, ac nid i gyllido addysg bellach, ysgolion neu dysgu yn y gweithle yn unig. Yn 2007-08, bydd £32.5 miliwn ychwanegol yn dod i mewn i'r agenda 14 i 19 i annog cydweithio er mwyn sicrhau bod plant yn cael cyfleoedd dysgu.

3.00 p.m.

Pobl Ifanc sy'n Gadael yr Ysgol School Leavers

Q7 Mark Isherwood: What is the Minister doing to encourage school leavers to continue with education or training? OAQ0952(ELL)

Jane Davidson: The 14-19 learning pathways programme offers a unique blend of individually tailored pathways, wider choice and flexibility, consisting of a learning core. This encourages young people to keep their options open.

wedi'i gwblhau. Yna, bydd angen cael ymgynghori cyhoeddus ar y meysydd hynny, ac wedyn byddem yn ystyried a fyddai angen buddsoddiad ychwanegol ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai'n seiliedig ar unrhyw ffigurau mewnbwn o'u cymharu â Lloegr—byddai'n seiliedig ar yr angen i wybod beth y mae angen inni ei ddarparu yng nghyd-destun Cymru.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): If we want to see a better relationship between institutions that offer educational courses, including agricultural colleges, how can that be achieved when you have decided to freeze the budget for further education colleges for the next year? Rather than develop services, they must consider cutting courses, rejecting students and getting rid of staff. How is that going to assist your Government's policy?

Jane Davidson: The Assembly Government policy of a national system to plan and fund education and training in Wales received support from the committee chaired by Cynog Dafis. We are currently creating that system throughout Wales and throughout the sectors. Everyone has had an opportunity to work together, with new funding to support collaboration in the system, and only to fund further education, schools or work-based learning. In 2007-08, an additional £32.5 million will be made available for the 14-19 agenda to encourage collaboration in order to ensure that children are given learning opportunities.

C7 Mark Isherwood: Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i annog pobl ifanc sy'n gadael yr ysgol i barhau mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant? OAQ0952(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae'r rhaglen llwybrau dysgu 14-19 yn cynnig cyfuniad unigryw o lwybrau wedi'u teilwra'n unigol, dewis ehangach a hyblygrwydd, gan gynnwys craidd dysgu. Mae hyn yn annog pobl ifanc i beidio â chyfyngu ar eu dewisiadau.

Mark Isherwood: Can you tell us why the proportion of 16 to 18-year-olds not in education or training in Wales rose from 23 per cent in 1997 to 28 per cent by 2004, which was the last year for which the Members' research service had figures?

Jane Davidson: We have had this debate here on many occasions. If the education system is working perfectly, there is no need for a major review. However, on many occasions, including in the education committee, you have commented that there are too many young people for whom the current education system is not delivering as well as it might be. That is why we are going down the 14-19 agenda route. Part of that is about lifting the proportion of 16-year-olds with a level 2 qualification—the GCSE equivalent—and the proportion with level 3 qualifications at 19 years old. It is about reducing the number of young people who are leaving full-time education with no qualifications, improving the proportion of 16-year-olds who are progressing to further education or learning, whether it is full time or work based, and reducing the number of the NEETs, namely the 16 to 18-year-olds who are not in education, employment or training.

As I have pointed out to you before, we have had a massive reduction of 3 per cent in the number of 19-year-olds who are not in education, employment or training. That is because people are starting to return to learn. We want to get the system right in the first place, which is why we are making the changes that we are making.

Jeff Cuthbert: It is a fact that most adults in my constituency left school or formal education 10 years or more ago, when the Conservative Government was responsible for education policy. It is a sad fact that a third of those adults are without any qualifications to speak of; indeed, they have severe basic problems with literacy and numeracy. Do you agree that, through policies such as the 14-19 learning pathways and RAISE—raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme, we will not abandon, neglect and

Mark Isherwood: A allwch ddweud wrthym pam mae cyfran y bobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant yng Nghymru wedi codi o 23 y cant ym 1997 i 28 y cant erbyn 2004, sef y flwyddyn olaf pan oedd gan wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau ffigurau?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym wedi cael y ddadl hon yma droeon. Os yw'r system addysg yn gweithio'n berffaith, nid oes angen prif adolygiad mawr. Fodd bynnag, ar lawer achlysur, gan gynnwys yn y pwyllgor addysg, yr ydych wedi sôn bod yna ormod o bobl ifanc nad yw'r system addysg bresennol yn diwallu eu hanghenion cystal ag y gallai. Dyna pam yr ydym yn dilyn llwybr yr agenda 14-19 oed. Mae rhan o hynny'n ymwneud â chynyddu cyfran y bobl ifanc 16 oed sydd â chymhwyster lefel 2—sy'n cyfateb i TGAU—a'r gyfran sydd â chymwysterau lefel 3 yn 19 oed. Mae'n ymwneud â lleihau nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n gadael addysg llawn amser heb unrhyw gymwysterau, cynyddu cyfran y bobl ifanc 16 oed sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg bellach neu i ddysgu, boed yn llawn amser neu'n seiliedig ar waith, a lleihau nifer y rhai 16 i 18 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant.

Fel yr wyf wedi dweud wrthyhych o'r blaen, yr ydym wedi sicrhau gostyngiad enfawr o 3 y cant yn nifer y bobl ifanc 19 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant. Mae hynny am fod pobl yn dechrau dychwelyd i ddysgu. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod y system yn gywir yn y lle cyntaf, a dyna pam yr ydym yn gwneud y newidiadau yr ydym yn eu gwneud.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n ffaith fod y rhan fwyaf o oedolion yn fy etholaeth i wedi gadael ysgol neu addysg ffurfiol 10 mlynedd neu fwy yn ôl, pan oedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn gyfrifol am bolisi addysg. Mae'n ffaith drist fod traean yr oedolion hynny heb unrhyw gymwysterau fel y cyfryw; yn wir, mae ganddynt broblemau sylfaenol difrifol gyda llythrennedd a rhifedd. A ydych yn cytuno, drwy bolisiau megis y llwybrau dysgu 14-19 a rhaglen Rhagori—codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion mewn addysg yng Nghymru, na

reject a generation, as former Conservative governments did?

Jane Davidson: We have some absolutely staggering figures on key skills in Wales. They are growing at a far faster rate than in England, and we have a larger share of awards than any other region in the United Kingdom for key skills—16 per cent of all awards were won by our tiny country. For wider key skills, we won 27 per cent of all awards across the United Kingdom. These are really good outcomes. In addition, I have just seen that the Careers Wales pupil destination survey showed an increase in the proportion of year 11 pupils who continued in full-time education or entered work-based training. That proportion was 84 per cent in 2005, and had been at a static 82 per cent for the previous five years, so we really are starting to turn things around.

Janet Ryder: Some young people who do not want to stay in school after turning 16 find valuable courses to follow at colleges such as the Welsh College of Horticulture, in Northop, north Wales. Do you see that a college such as that at Northop has an extremely special role to play—it is acknowledged throughout the horticultural world in the UK, because of the kind of courses that it offers—and needs to be supported by your Government's policies? Therefore, the answer that you gave Ieuan Wyn Jones about the funding that is going into further education needs to be reflected upon, because of the needs of such colleges to deliver your Government's policies.

Jane Davidson: What is potentially very exciting about specialist colleges is the way in which they can provide learning routes into those disciplines, by working very specifically with other schools, colleges and the higher education sector in their areas. The 14-19 agenda will enable new learning pathways to be described and delivered, and I hope that all players, particularly specialist colleges, will look to come into that as quickly as possible, with plans that are as well worked up as possible.

fyddwn yn esgeuluso, yn gwrthod nac yn troi cefn ar genhedlaeth, fel y gwnaeth llywodraethau Ceidwadol blaenorol?

Jane Davidson: Mae gennym rai ffigurau cwbl syfrdanol am sgiliau allweddol yng Nghymru. Maent yn tyfu lawer yn gyflymach nag yn Lloegr, ac mae gennym gyfran fwy o ddyfarniadau nag unrhyw ranbarth arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig mewn sgiliau allweddol—enillwyd 16 y cant o'r holl ddyfarniadau gan ein gwlad fechan ni. Ar gyfer sgiliau allweddol ehangach, ni a enillodd 27 y cant o'r holl ddyfarniadau ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'r rhain yn ganlyniadau gwych. Yn ogystal, yr wyf newydd weld bod arolwg cyrchfan disgyblion Gyrfa Cymru yn dangos cynnydd yng nghyfran y disgyblion blwyddyn 11 a arhosodd mewn addysg llawn amser neu a ddechreuodd mewn hyfforddiant yn seiliedig ar waith. Roedd y gyfran honno yn 84 y cant yn 2005, ac yr oedd wedi sefyll ar 82 y cant am y pum mlynedd blaenorol, felly, yr ydym yn wir yn dechrau newid pethau.

Janet Ryder: Mae rhai pobl ifanc nad ydynt am aros yn yr ysgol ar ôl 16 oed yn dilyn cyrsiau gwerthfawr mewn colegau megis Coleg Garddwriaeth Cymru yn Llaneurgain yn y gogledd. A ydych yn gweld bod gan goleg megis hwnnw yn Llaneurgain rôl arbennig iawn i'w chwarae—caiff ei gydnabod drwy'r byd garddwriaethol yn y DU oherwydd y math o gyrsiau a gynigir ganddo—a bod angen iddo gael ei gefnogi gan bolisiau eich Llywodraeth? Felly, mae angen ystyried yr ateb a roesoch i Ieuan Wyn Jones am y cyllid a neilltuir i addysg bellach, oherwydd anghenion colegau o'r fath i gyflawni polisiau eich Llywodraeth.

Jane Davidson: Yr hyn a all fod yn gyffrous am iawn mewn colegau arbenigol yw'r ffordd y gallant ddarparu llwybrau dysgu i mewn i'r disgyblaethau hynny, drwy weithio'n benodol iawn gydag ysgolion a cholegau eraill a'r sector addysg uwch yn eu hardaloedd. Drwy'r agenda 14-19 bydd llwybrau dysgu newydd yn gallu cael eu disgrifio a'u darparu, a gobeithio y bydd pawb sy'n rhan o hyn, yn arbennig y colegau arbenigol, yn ceisio bod yn rhan o hynny cyn gynted â phosibl, gyda chynlluniau sydd mor drwyadl

â phosibl.

Janet Ryder: Northop is doing exactly what your Government wants it to do; it is working with higher education and developing higher education courses through the FE field. However, it will find it very hard to progress when, in your words, written in a response letter to Ieuan Wyn Jones, we have seen a 3 per cent reduction in the number of FE places since 2003. By your own admission, you have undeniably broken your election promise in 2003 to increase places in FE.

Jane Davidson: Perhaps I could read our election promise to you, since Ieuan Wyn Jones's letter, as usual, included only half of the promise.

'With the help of the Assembly Learning Grant, payable to college as well as university students',

which, of course, is a unique Welsh Labour Assembly Government commitment about supporting further education,

'we will continue to widen access to Further Education, building on the extra 22,000 students since 1999'.

That was in our manifesto for the 2003 elections. If you look at the 1999 figures for FE alone, you will see that there were 224,142 students at that time. If you add 22,000 to that, you get 246,142 students, whereas the figure for 2004—the last year for which we have data—was, in fact, 251,075 students. If we put FE into HE as well, we see that there were 230,152 students in 1999 and if you add 22,000 to that, you get 252,152. Lo and behold! The figure for 2004 was 265,420 students. Yes, there has been movement in that time, but those are the last figures available. We can demonstrate unequivocally that, between 1999 and the latest figures, we have succeeded in adding over and above 22,000 students.

Janet Ryder: Mae Llanelwyr yn gwneud yn union yr hyn y mae eich Llywodraeth am iddo'i wneud; mae'n gweithio gydag addysg uwch ac yn datblygu cyrsiau addysg uwch drwy'r maes addysg bellach. Fodd bynnag, bydd yn ei chael yn anodd iawn gwneud cynnydd pan ydym, yn eich geiriau chi mewn llythyr ymateb i Ieuan Wyn Jones, wedi gweld gostyngiad o 3 y cant yn nifer y lleoedd addysg bellach er 2003. Yn ôl eich cyfaddefiad eich hun, yr ydych yn ddiaw wedi torri eich addewid etholiadol yn 2003 i gynyddu lleoedd mewn addysg bellach.

Jane Davidson: Efallai y gallwn ddarllen ein haddewid etholiadol i chi, gan nad yw llythyr Ieuan Wyn Jones, fel arfer, yn cynnwys dim ond hanner yr addewid.

Gyda chymorth Grant Dysgu'r Cynulliad, a gaiff ei dalu i fyfyrwyr coleg yn ogystal â myfyrwyr prifysgol,

sydd, wrth gwrs, yn ymrwymiad unigryw gan Lywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru ynglŷn â chynorthwyo addysg bellach,

byddwn yn dal i ehangu mynediad i Addysg Bellach, gan adeiladu ar y 22,000 o fyfyrwyr ychwanegol er 1999.

Yr oedd hynny yn ein manifesto ar gyfer etholiadau 2003. Os edrychwch ar y ffigurau ar gyfer addysg bellach yn unig, fe welwch fod 224,142 o fyfyrwyr bryd hynny. Os ychwanegwch 22,000 at hynny, cewch 246,142 o fyfyrwyr, ond y ffigur ar gyfer 2004—y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ddata ar ei chyfer—mewn gwirionedd oedd 251,075 o fyfyrwyr. Os ychwanegwn addysg bellach at addysg uwch hefyd, yr oedd 230,152 o fyfyrwyr yn 1999, ac os ychwanegwch 22,000 at hynny, cewch gyfanswm o 252,152. Wele! Y ffigur ar gyfer 2004 oedd 265,420 o fyfyrwyr. Do, fe fu newid yn yr amser hwnnw, ond dyna'r ffigurau diwethaf sydd ar gael. Gallwn ddangos yn ddiamau ein bod wedi llwyddo i ychwanegu dros 22,000 o fyfyrwyr rhwng 1999 a'r ffigurau diweddaraf.

Hybu Ffyrdd Mwy Iach o Fyw Promoting Healthier Lifestyles

Q8 Lynne Neagle: What action is the Minister taking to promote healthier lifestyles among young people in schools? OAQ0943(ELL)

Jane Davidson: We promote healthy schools, we have introduced our healthy breakfast initiative and free swimming, and, tomorrow, we will launch our food and fitness implementation plan, and 'Appetite for Life', which makes proposals on food in schools. The total funding for the physical education in schools sport initiative is £6.8 million.

Lynne Neagle: I recently saw, at first hand, the fantastic impact that free school breakfasts can have on a school community when I visited Woodlands Junior School in Cwmbran. Seeing a genuine enthusiasm for fruit options among the youngest pupils was particularly encouraging, and shows what an impact this kind of intervention can have. However, despite the efforts of the local authority, there is local concern about the take-up of free breakfast schemes in Torfaen. Will the Minister accept that more direction and support is needed to ensure that all children, particularly those in deprived communities, can access these schemes? Will the Minister also give an update on what steps she is taking to promote and boost free breakfast schemes in places like Torfaen?

Jane Davidson: I am delighted to say that 557 primary schools are now committed to the scheme across Wales, which is over a third of all primary schools in Wales. I am interested to see that the leader of the opposition has just left because, in his local authority area, all schools will have been brought on board by the end of the summer in 2007, and parents now check whether a school has a breakfast club before they register their children—that is the information that the local authority has given us. We have now made sure that information is available in leisure centres and health

C8 Lynne Neagle: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hybu ffyrdd mwy iach o fyw ymhlith pobl ifanc mewn ysgolion? OAQ0943(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym yn hyrwyddo ysgolion iach, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno ein menter brecwast iach a nofio am ddim, ac yfory byddwn yn lansio ein cynllun gweithredu bwyd a ffitrwydd, a 'Blas am Oes', sy'n gwneud cynigion am fwyd mewn ysgolion. Cyfanswm y cyllid ar gyfer y fenter chwaraeon addysg gorfforol mewn ysgolion yw £6.8 miliwn.

Lynne Neagle: Yn ddiweddar cefais brofiad uniongyrchol o'r effaith wych y gall brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion ei chael ar gymuned ysgol pan ymwelais ag Ysgol Iau Woodlands yng Nghwmbrân. Yr oedd gweld brwdfrydedd gwirioneddol am ffrwythau ymhlith y disgyblion iau yn arbennig o galonogol, ac mae'n dangos yr effaith y gall y math hwn o ymyriad ei chael. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf ymdrechion yr awdurdod lleol, mae pryder lleol ynglŷn â'r nifer sy'n manteisio ar y cynlluniau brecwast am ddim yn Nhor-faen. A wnaiff y Gweinidog dderbyn bod angen mwy o gyfeiriad a chymorth er mwyn sicrhau y gall pob plentyn, yn arbennig y rheini mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, fanteisio ar y cynlluniau hyn? A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i hyrwyddo a hybu cynlluniau brecwast am ddim mewn lleoedd fel Tor-faen?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bleser gennyf ddweud bod 557 o ysgolion cynradd bellach wedi ymrwmo i'r cynllun ledled Cymru, sy'n fwy na thraean yr holl ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru. Mae'n ddiddorol fod arweinydd yr wrthblaid newydd adael, oherwydd yn ardal ei awdurdod lleol ef bydd pob ysgol wedi'i chynnwys erbyn diwedd yr haf 2007, ac mae rhieni'n awr am wybod a oes gan ysgol glwb brecwast cyn iddynt gofrestru eu plant—dyna'r wybodaeth a roddwyd inni gan yr awdurdod lleol. Yr ydym yn awr wedi sicrhau bod gwybodaeth ar gael mewn canolfannau hamdden a

centres, so that parents know that this scheme is available. Several people did not give parents or others accurate information. This scheme is free, because it is fully funded by the Assembly Government. We have had a huge increase in the participation rate since we made that information publicly available.

Alun Ffred Jones: Bedair blynedd yn ôl, yn y gynhadledd flynyddol, pasiodd Plaid Cymru gynnis i atal gwerthu creision a diodydd meddal mewn ysgolion. Ar y pryd, cofiaf yr oedd Llafur Newydd yn gwawdio'r cynnis hwn fel un gwirion. A ydych wedi newid eich meddwl bellach, Weinidog, ac a fyddwch chi'n cefnogi'r alwad hon yn y dyfodol i atal gwerthu'r cynnyrch hwn mewn ysgolion?

Jane Davidson: Bydd yn rhaid i chi aros tan yfory am yr adroddiad. Mae Llafur Cymru, wedi cefnogi'r agenda bwyta'n iach yn ein hysgolion. Plaid Cymru sydd ddim yn ei gefnogi, fel gyda brecwastau iach am ddim. Nid ydych yn ei gefnogi o gwbl, er bod ysgolion yn eich ardaloedd a rhieni yn ei gefnogi. A ydych chi, Blaid Cymru, yn cefnogi bwyta'n iach mewn ysgolion?

3.10 p.m.

Mudiadau Ieuenctid Youth Organisations

Q9 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on how she is engaging youth organisations in her education agenda? OAQ0907(ELL)

Jane Davidson: A wide range of representative youth organisations has been involved in the development of 'Extending Entitlement' and 14–19 learning pathways policies. Youth service organisations from the statutory and voluntary sectors will have a key part in shaping the development of the recently announced strategy for the service.

Peter Black: One of the big issues for youth work, particularly in education, is that, when local authorities need to make cuts, youth services are always the first in line. That is because they have no statutory basis, and local authorities have no obligation to

chanolfannau iechyd, er mwyn i rieni wybod bod y cynllun hwn ar gael. Yr oedd nifer o bobl heb roi'r wybodaeth gywir i rieni neu i eraill. Mae'r cynllun hwn am ddim, oherwydd caiff ei ariannu'n llawn gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau cynnydd anferth yn y gyfradd sy'n cyfranogi ers inni ddarparu'r wybodaeth honno i'r cyhoedd.

Alun Ffred Jones: Four years ago, at its annual conference, a motion was carried by Plaid Cymru to prevent the sale of crisps and soft drinks in schools. At the time, I recall New Labour mocking the idea as being ridiculous. Minister, have you now changed your mind on that, and will you support any call in future to prevent the sale of such produce in schools?

Jane Davidson: You will have to wait until tomorrow for the report. Welsh Labour has supported the healthy eating agenda in our schools. It is Plaid Cymru that does not support it, as with free healthy breakfasts. You do not support it at all, although the schools in your areas do, as do parents. Do you, Plaid Cymru, support healthy eating in schools?

C9 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y ffordd y mae'n cynnwys mudiadau ieuenctid yn ei hagenda addysg? OAQ0907(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae ystod eang o sefydliadau ieuenctid cynrychioliadol wedi bod yn rhan o ddatblygu 'Ymestyn Hawliau' a pholisïau llwybrau dysgu 14–19. Bydd gan gyrff gwasanaethau ieuenctid o'r sectorau statudol a gwirfoddol ran allweddol wrth lunio datblygiad y strategaeth ar gyfer y gwasanaeth a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar.

Peter Black: Un o'r materion mawr ar gyfer gwaith ieuenctid, yn arbennig ym maes addysg, yw mai gwasanaethau ieuenctid yw'r rhai cyntaf bob amser i ddioddef pan fydd angen i awdurdodau lleol wneud toriadau. Mae hynny oherwydd nad oes ganddynt sail

provide that service. When the Assembly acquires new powers next year, will the Minister consider supporting moves to give youth services a statutory basis so that local authorities have obligations in terms of what they deliver and how it is delivered?

Jane Davidson: I am rather surprised by your statement, because Wales is the only part of the United Kingdom to have broad youth service delivery underpinned by a statutory framework. We have statutory obligations in terms of young people's partnerships, and they have statutory obligations to deliver youth services in their areas. I am delighted that Alun Michael introduced that under the Learning and Skills Act 2000 during the first Assembly, and we have strongly supported it every since.

Peter Black: I accept that the youth partnerships have a statutory obligation and underpinning, but the provision of services for young people is not a statutory obligation on local authorities in terms of providing educational facilities for youth clubs and so on. I believe that we should be extending statutory provision to encompass that element. Will you consider extending the provision that we already have in Wales to try to ensure that local authorities have that obligation to provide such facilities in communities for young people?

Jane Davidson: It is also important to recognise the contribution of the voluntary sector to youth service provision. It is that partnership between local authorities and the voluntary sector that delivers the best kinds of provision across Wales. We, as an Assembly Government, remain committed to that partnership.

I have already announced to committee that I will develop a youth strategy this year. If there are ways in which we can further secure youth support, I would always be happy to look at them, particularly as I am an ex-youth worker. However, I make absolutely clear that the young people's partnerships are

statudol, ac nid oes rhwymedigaeth ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Pan fydd y Cynulliad yn cael pwerau newydd y flwyddyn nesaf, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ystyried cefnogi symudiadau i roi sail statudol i wasanaethau ieuencid er mwyn gosod rhwymedigaethau ar awdurdodau lleol o ran yr hyn a ddarparant a sut y caiff ei ddarparu?

Jane Davidson: Mae eich datganiad yn fy synnu braidd, oherwydd Cymru yw'r unig ran o'r Deyrnas Unedig sydd â darpariaeth gwasanaethau ieuencid eang a fframwaith statudol yn sail iddi. Mae gennym rwymedigaethau statudol o ran partneriaethau pobl ifanc, ac mae ganddynt hwy rwymedigaethau statudol i ddarparu gwasanaethau ieuencid yn eu hardaloedd. Yr wyf yn falch iawn fod Alun Michael wedi cyflwyno hynny o dan Ddeddf Dysgu a Medrau 2000 yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf, ac yr ydym wedi cefnogi hynny'n gryf ers hynny.

Peter Black: Derbyniaf fod gan y partneriaethau ieuencid rwymedigaeth ar sail statudol, ond nid yw darparu gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc yn rhwymedigaeth statudol ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu cyfleusterau addysgol i glybiau ieuencid, ac ati. Credaf y dylem fod yn estyn darpariaeth statudol i gwmpasu'r elfen honno. A ystyriwch estyn y ddarpariaeth sydd gennym eisoes yng Nghymru i geisio sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol y rhwymedigaeth honno i ddarparu cyfleusterau felly i bobl ifanc mewn cymunedau?

Jane Davidson: Mae hefyd yn bwysig sylweddoli cyfraniad y sector gwirfoddol i ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ieuencid. Y bartneriaeth honno rhwng awdurdodau lleol a'r sector gwirfoddol sy'n rhoi'r mathau gorau o ddarpariaeth ledled Cymru. Yr ydym ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn parhau wedi ymrwymo i'r bartneriaeth honno.

Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud wrth y pwyllgor y byddaf yn datblygu strategaeth ieuencid eleni. Os oes ffyrdd y gallwn sicrhau cymorth pellach i ieuencid, byddwn bob amser yn fwy na pharod i edrych arnynt, yn arbennig gan fy mod yn gyn-weithiwr ieuencid. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiaf fod y partneriaethau pobl

wider than just youth service delivery itself; we have a range of people who we will want to engage in young people's delivery mechanisms to ensure that young people can participate further and influence the outcomes of services that affect their lives.

ifanc yn golygu mwy na darparu gwasanaeth ieuencid yn unig; mae gennym amrywiaeth o bobl y byddwn am eu cynnwys mewn mecanweithiau cyflawni i bobl ifanc i sicrhau y gall pobl ifanc gyfranogi ymhellach a dylanwadu ar ganlyniadau gwasanaethau sy'n effeithio ar eu bywydau.

Cyrsiau Pensaernïaeth Architecture Courses

C10 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyrsgiau pensaernïaeth ym mhreifysgolion Cymru? OAQ0947(ELL)

Q10 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on architecture courses in Welsh universities? OAQ0947(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae modd astudio pensaernïaeth a disgyblaethau cysylltiedig mewn sawl sefydliad addysg uwch yng Nghymru.

Jane Davidson: It is possible to study architecture and associated disciplines in several higher education institutions in Wales.

David Lloyd: Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 10 y cant o fyfyrwyr pensaernïaeth yn unig ysgol bensaernïaeth Cymru, yma yng Nghaerdydd, sy'n dod o Gymru. Beth wnewch chi ynglŷn â hynny?

David Lloyd: At present only 10 per cent of architecture students at the only school of architecture in Wales, here in Cardiff, come from Wales. What will you do about that?

Jane Davidson: Mae'n bwysig bod pobl sydd am fod yn fyfyrwyr pensaernïaeth, fel gydag unrhyw bwnc arall, yn cael mynd i'r brifysgol y maent yn dymuno mynd iddi. Mae'r cwrs yng Nghaerdydd yn dda iawn, fel y gwyddom, gan fod gan yr adran bum seren. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Cynulliad yn falch o hynny.

Jane Davidson: It is important that people who want to become students of architecture, as with any other subject, can attend the university of their choice. The course in Cardiff is highly rated, as we know, as the department has five stars. I am sure the Assembly will be pleased to hear that.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Gwin) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog 24.27(iv) Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy (Wine) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulation 2006 under Standing Order 24.27(iv)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Common Agricultural Policy (Wine) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3140)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Gwin) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3140)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

approves that the Common Agricultural Policy (Wine) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006. (NDM3141)

The purpose of these regulations is to transfer the regulatory functions of the present Wine Standards Board to the Foods Standards Agency from 1 July.

Y Llywydd: Ni allaf ddeall pam nad oes neb yn dymuno siarad am eitem o'r fath, ond, gan nad oes, galwaf am bleidlais.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Gwin) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3141)

Diben y rheoliadau hyn yw trosglwyddo swyddogaethau rheoliadol y Bwrdd Safonau Gwin presennol i'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd o 1 Gorffennaf.

The Presiding Officer: I cannot fathom why no-one would wish to speak on such an item, but, as no one does, I shall call for a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3140): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3140): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3141): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3141): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Tir Gofal (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Tir Gofal (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006. (NDM3142)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 20 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Tir Gofal (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Tir Gofal (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006. (NDM3143)

This is a matter that has been debated on several occasions in this Chamber and in committee. It was last debated in Plenary in June of last year. I welcome the fact that the amendment has been withdrawn. It means that the uncertainty that existed for some Countryside Council for Wales staff has been removed, as far as today is concerned. We have debated this issue many times before, but there are two issues that I would like to emphasise again.

First, the decision was taken to bring Tir Gofal in-house because it was felt that all of the rural development plan schemes should be paid under one umbrella. Not bringing it in-house would have meant that Tir Gofal would have been paid by CCW, while everything else was paid for by the Assembly

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3142)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 20 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tir Gofal (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3143)

Mae hwn yn fater a drafodwyd droeon yn y Siambr hon ac mewn pwyllgor. Fe'i trafodwyd ddiwethaf mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Mehefin y llynedd. Croesawaf y ffaith fod y gwelliant wedi ei dynnu'n ôl. Mae'n golygu bod ychydig o'r ansicrwydd ymhlith staff Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru am gyfnod wedi diflannu, o ran heddiw. Yr ydym wedi trafod y mater hwn droeon o'r blaen, ond mae dau fater yr hoffwn eu pwysleisio eto.

Yn gyntaf, gwnaed y penderfyniad i ddod â Tir Gofal o dan adain y Cynulliad oherwydd teimlid y dylai'r holl gynlluniau datblygu gwledig fod o dan un ymbarél. Byddai peidio â dod â Tir Gofal o dan adain y Cynulliad wedi golygu mai CCGC fyddai'n amdano, a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn talu am bopeth

Government. In order to deliver a proper suite of rural development measures, it is important that they are all dealt with by one organisation.

Secondly, we know that from 1 January this year each region, as defined by the European Commission, will need to have a single paying agency, and that means that that agency has to be the Assembly Government. Bearing that in mind, in our judgment, CCW would not have been able to pay Tir Gofal payments from 1 January onwards, and it is therefore important that full responsibility for payments is transferred properly to the Assembly Government. As far as the recipients of payments are concerned, there will be no detrimental effect from this. We have negotiated with CCW throughout the process and a satisfactory conclusion has been reached in terms of how staff will be dealt with—a small number will move a short distance, while the majority will remain where they currently are.

It is also the case that there was a danger that if, on 1 January, responsibility for paying Tir Gofal had transferred to the Assembly Government—as would have inevitably been the case under the European directive—around 100 staff in CCW would no longer have had a function, which would have created problems in terms of their employment. I place these regulations before the Assembly. As I have said, we have debated the principles of the issue in the past. We are now near to a conclusion, and we will soon be able to deliver a full suite of rural development measures, prior to the adoption of the new rural development plan for 2007 to 2013.

Elin Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau. Byddem wedi gwrthwynebu gwelliant y Ceidwadwyr pe na bai hynny wedi tynnu'n ôl. Fel dywedodd y Gweinidog, fe wnaeth Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad craffu ar y rheoliadau hyn ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Yn y cyfarfod hynny, y prif consÿrn oedd cost cyflwyno'r newidiadau a oedd yn deillio o'r rheoliadau hyn. Daeth yn amlwg y byddai'n costio £2.1 miliwn i weithredu'r newidiadau, gyda £600,000 ohono i'w wario ar godi gwahanfuriau rhwng swyddogion Cyngor

arall. Er mwyn darparu cyfres briodol o fesurau datblygu gwledig, mae'n bwysig i un sefydliad ymdrin â hwy i gyd.

Yn ail, gwyddom o 1 Ionawr eleni y bydd angen i bob rhanbarth, fel y'i diffinnir gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, gael un asiantaeth dalu, ac mae hynny'n golygu mai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fydd yr asiantaeth honno. O gofio hynny, yn ein barn ni, ni fyddai CCGC wedi gallu talu taliadau Tir Gofal o 1 Ionawr ymlaen, ac felly mae'n bwysig trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb llawn dros daliadau yn briodol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. O ran y rhai sy'n cael taliadau, ni fydd dim effaith andwyol arnynt. Yr ydym wedi negodi gyda CCGC drwy gydol y broses, a daethpwyd i gasgliad boddhaol am y ffordd i ddelio â staff—bydd nifer fach yn symud ychydig bellter, a bydd y mwyafrif yn aros lle y maent ar hyn o bryd.

Mae hefyd yn wir fod perygl, pe bai'r cyfrifoldeb dros dalu am Tir Gofal wedi ei drosglwyddo i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ar 1 Ionawr—fel y byddai wedi digwydd yn anochel o dan y gyfarwyddeb Ewropeaidd—na fyddai gan ryw 100 o aelodau staff yn CCGC swyddogaeth, a byddai hynny wedi creu problemau o ran eu cyflogaeth. Gosodaf y rheoliadau hyn gerbron y Cynulliad. Fel y dywedais, yr ydym wedi trafod egwyddorion y mater yn y gorffennol. Yr ydym bron wedi gorffen hyn yn awr, a chyn hir byddwn yn gallu darparu cyfres lawn o fesurau datblygu gwledig, cyn mabwysiadu'r cynllun datblygu gwledig newydd ar gyfer 2007 i 2013.

Elin Jones: Plaid Cymru will support these regulations. We would have opposed the Conservative amendment had it not been withdrawn. As the Minister said, the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee scrutinised these regulations a few months ago. In that meeting, the main concern was the cost of the changes arising from these regulations. It became apparent that it would cost £2.1 million to implement the changes, with £600,000 of that to be spent on building partitions between CCW officials and the officials who would transfer to work

Cefn Gwlad Cymru a swyddogion a fyddai'n trosglwyddo i weithio i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, gyda'r gofal dros Tir Gofal. Yr wyf yn falch o weld yn y dogfennau o'n blaenau fod y Llywodraeth wedi ailfeddwl ar hyn ac wedi cael cyngor pellach, ac nad oes angen y gwariant hwn ar wahanfuriau bellach.

Ni ddylid colli golwg o'r ffaith bydd y gost o drosglwyddo dal yn £1.7 miliwn, gyda'r arian hwnnw'n bennaf yn mynd ar systemau cyfrifiadurol newydd. Nid oes arbedion o'r trosglwyddiad hwn, ac na fydd unrhyw arian ychwanegol yn mynd i ffermwyr i wella'r amgylchedd. Gyda hyn i gyd mewn golwg, a chan ystyried na fydd gwariant ar wahanfuriau, byddai wedi bod yn gwbl diangen, bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau.

3.20 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Members will note that we have withdrawn our amendment, and we will vote in favour of the regulations. Prior to today, we would have voted against the regulations because we did not think that they were the right course for the Assembly Government to take. We have taken this decision on the basis of the Minister's statement to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee this morning, which he repeated in the Chamber this afternoon. It gives me no pleasure to take this decision; I feel that this has been forced upon us by the fact that, after 1 January, there can be only one paying agency in Wales. The Minister put forward two reasons, but I do not accept the first. The idea that there must be one paying agency in Wales to provide a suite of grants seems to me to be disproved by the fact that Tir Gofal has been such a good scheme. It has been lauded across Europe, and it worked well under the previous system—there was no need to change it. We still believe that there was political intent behind the desire to bring the management of Tir Gofal in-house. However, I fully recognise the second reason, which is that there can only be one paying agency from the start of next year. The Minister has told us this, and we must accept it. The danger of continuing with the current arrangements under those circumstances is that there would

for the Assembly Government, with responsibility for Tir Gofal. I am pleased to see in the documents before us that the Government has reconsidered this and has taken further advice, and that this expenditure on partitions is no longer be required.

We should not lose sight of the fact that the cost of transfer will still be £1.7 million, with most of that money being spent on new computer systems. There are no savings from this transfer, and there will be no additional money for farmers to improve the environment. Bearing all of that in mind, and given that there will be no expenditure on partitions, which would have been completely unnecessary, Plaid Cymru will support the regulations.

Glyn Davies: Bydd Aelodau'n sylwi ein bod wedi tynnu ein gwelliant yn ôl, a byddwn yn pleidleisio o blaid y rheoliadau. Cyn heddiw, byddem wedi pleidleisio yn erbyn y rheoliadau, oherwydd nid oeddem yn credu mai dyna oedd y cam cywir i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei gymryd. Gwnaethom y penderfyniad hwn ar sail datganiad y Gweinidog i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad y bore yma, a ailadroddwyd ganddo yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Nid yw gwneud y penderfyniad hwn yn rhoi dim pleser i mi; teimlaf fod hyn wedi ei orfodi arnom gan y ffaith mai un asiantaeth dalu yn unig all fod yng Nghymru ar ôl 1 Ionawr. Rhoddodd y Gweinidog ddau reswm, ond nid wyf yn derbyn y cyntaf. Yn fy marn i, mae'r syniad bod yn rhaid cael un asiantaeth dalu yng Nghymru i ddarparu cyfres o grantiau yn cael ei wrthbrofi gan y ffaith fod Tir Gofal wedi bod yn gynllun mor dda. Fe'i cymeradwywyd ledled Ewrop, ac yr oedd yn gweithio'n dda o dan y system flaenorol—nid oedd angen ei newid. Credwn o hyd fod bwriad gwleidyddol y tu ôl i'r dymuniad i ddod â rheolaeth Tir Gofal o dan adain y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddaf yn llawn yr ail reswm, sef na ellir cael ond un asiantaeth dalu o ddechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud hyn wrthym, a rhaid inni ei dderbyn. Y perygl o barhau'r

have been problems from 1 January, and so we feel that we must change our position and accept that the regulations should go through, and that the management of Tir Gofal should be brought in-house at the National Assembly for Wales.

Michael German: I have two small points. The first is to recognise that whenever there are amalgamations, there will be costs, and there is recognition that there are costs associated with moving staff from one department to another. There will be much more extensive costs if we have to amalgamate our police forces, of course. However, this type of amalgamation always costs, and there is no return on the investment beyond the necessary bringing together of staff.

The second point relates to concern about the remaining functions of the Countryside Council for Wales. The Minister has taken some actions to minimise the impact upon the agri-environment potential of CCW. Can the Minister elaborate on that, so that it is on the record for the Assembly, and so that we know what arrangements he is making to ensure that the expertise of those who are transferring into the Assembly Government is not lost to the general work of CCW? It would be a great shame if its work were to be diminished in any way because of a lack of the specific qualities of the staff who are now being moved from that department and into another. I am sure that the Minister recognises that issue, and it was included as major concern in the regulatory appraisal of the regulations. It is a concern that I think that we should share. Can we be assured that CCW will be able to maintain the full range of its remaining functions, and will not need to call on staff from outside?

Carl Sargeant: We should welcome the regulations, because they are healthy for the agricultural industry in Wales. The underlying reason for the Conservatives withdrawing their amendment is the fact that payments to farmers would have been late otherwise. The Minister should be congratulated on the fact that his payments have been on time. In England, there is a big furore over the fact that payments have been delayed. The Minister should be

trefniadau presennol o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny yw y byddai problemau wedi codi o 1 Ionawr, ac felly teimlwn fod yn rhaid inni newid ein safbwynt a derbyn y rheoliadau, a derbyn y dylai rheolaeth Tir Gofal ddod o dan adain Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Michael German: Mae gennyf ddau bwynt bach. Y cyntaf yw cydnabod, ble bynnag y bydd uno, y bydd costau, a chydabyddir bod costau'n gysylltiedig â symud staff o un adran i adran arall. Bydd costau llawer mwy helaeth os bydd yn rhaid inni uno ein heddluoedd, wrth gwrs. Fodd bynnag, mae'r math hwn o uno bob amser yn costio, ac nid oes unrhyw fudd o fuddsoddi ar wahân i'r broses angenrheidiol o ddod â staff at ei gilydd.

Mae'r ail bwynt yn ymwneud â'r pryder am swyddogaethau Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru sy'n weddill. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cymryd rhai camau i leihau'r effaith ar botensial amaeth-amgylcheddol CCGC. A all y Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar hynny, fel y caiff ei gofnodi ar gyfer y Cynulliad, ac er mwyn inni wybod pa drefniadau y mae'n eu gwneud i sicrhau na chollir arbenigedd y rheini sy'n trosglwyddo i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i waith cyffredinol CCGC? Byddai'n drueni mawr pe bai ei waith yn lleihau mewn unrhyw ffordd oherwydd prinder nodwedion arbennig y staff sydd bellach yn cael eu symud o'r adran honno i adran arall. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod y Gweinidog yn cydnabod y mater hwnnw, ac fe'i cynhwyswyd fel mater o bwys yn yr arfarniad rheoliadol o'r rheoliadau. Mae'n bryder y dylem ei rannu yn fy marn ni. A allwn gael ein sicrhau y bydd CCGC yn gallu cynnal yr ystod lawn o'i swyddogaethau sy'n weddill, ac na fydd yn rhaid iddo alw ar staff o'r tu allan?

Carl Sargeant: Dylem groesawu'r rheoliadau, oherwydd maent yn iach i'r diwydiant amaeth yng Nghymru. Y rheswm sylfaenol pam y tynnodd y Ceidwadwyr eu gwelliant yn ôl yw y byddai taliadau i ffermwyr wedi bod yn hwyr fel arall. Dylid llongyfarch y Gweinidog am fod ei daliadau wedi bod yn brydlon. Yn Lloegr, mae cynnwrf mawr oherwydd bod oedi gyda thaliadau. Dylid llongyfarch y Gweinidog am weinyddu hyn. Mae'r ffaith fod y

congratulated on administering this. The fact that the Conservatives have withdrawn their amendment is a clear admittance by them that it is a good idea to merge staff into the Assembly Government. I am sure that the Conservatives will reconsider their attitude to all mergers in future, and will embrace the mergers of the Welsh Development Agency and the Welsh Tourist Board with the Assembly.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae gennyf fater ieithyddol i'w godi gyda'r Gweinidog. Mae canran uchel o ffermwyr Cymru yn siaradwyr Cymraeg, ac mae'r swyddogion sy'n delio â'r cynllun hwn yn aml yn delio â'r amaethwyr hynny yn eu priod iaith. Mae hynny yn cynnwys defnyddio'r Gymraeg. Yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddeall, mae nifer o'r swyddogion hyn hefyd yn trin a thrafod ac efallai yn cyflwyno ceisiadau drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg i uwch swyddogion.

Gwn am un enghraifft lle mae rhybudd wedi'i roi na fydd hynny'n bosibl yn y dyfodol oherwydd y newid yn y drefn. Yr wyf am sicrhau y bydd swyddogion sydd wedi arfer â gwneud eu gwaith drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn cael parhau i wneud hynny wedi i'r cynllun gael ei dynnu mewn at y Llywodraeth. Fel arall, nid oes ystyr i bolisi iaith y Llywodraeth.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Ar bwynt Elin Jones, £1.7 miliwn fydd y gost dros y dair mlynedd nesaf.

Y rheswm pam daeth cyngor inni ar osod *partitions* oedd diogelwch y system cyfrifadurol mewnwyd diogel y llywodraeth sydd gennym fel Llywodraeth. Mae'r cyngor yn awr wedi symud ymlaen o hynny ond mae'n bwysig bod y rheiny sydd yn symud i system newydd yn sicrhau bod y system honno'n ddiogel.

Mae'n werth pwysleisio y byddai'n rhaid gwneud hyn fodd bynnag, oherwydd dim ond un asiantaeth sydd yn gallu talu ar ôl 1 Ionawr y flwyddyn nesaf. Felly, mewn ffordd, nid oedd modd osgoi'r costau hyn.

In terms of Glyn's points, Tir Gofal is part of a suite of agri-environmental delivery, as is

Ceidwadwyr wedi tynnu eu gwelliant yn ôl yn gyfaddefiad clir ganddynt ei fod yn syniad da dod â staff i mewn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Ceidwadwyr yn ailystyried eu hagwedd at bob achos o uno yn y dyfodol, ac yn croesawu uno Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru â'r Cynulliad.

Alun Ffred Jones: I have a linguistic issue to raise with the Minister. A large proportion of Welsh farmers speak Welsh, and the officials who deal with this scheme often deal with those farmers in their first language. That means using the Welsh language. As I understand it, many of those officials also discuss and perhaps submit applications in Welsh to senior officers.

I know of one instance where a warning has been given that that will not be possible in future because of the change in the system. I want an assurance that those officials who are used to working through the medium of Welsh will still be able to do so once this scheme has been brought into the Government. Otherwise the Government's language policy has no meaning.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): On Elin Jones's point, the cost over the next three years will be £1.7 million.

The reason we were advised to install partitions was the security of the government secure intranet computer system which we have as a Government. The advice has now moved away from that, but it is important for those who are moving to a new system to ensure that that system is secure.

It is worth emphasising that this would have to be done in any case, because we can only have one paying agency after 1 January next year. Therefore, in a sense, these costs are unavoidable.

O ran pwyntiau Glyn, mae Tir Gofal yn rhan o gyfres o fesurau amaeth-amgylcheddol a

Tir Cynnal. It makes perfect sense that they are all delivered in the same way. There will be a third tier scheme in time, which the Assembly Government will deliver, and it is right that all schemes are seen to fit together properly. The officers who are dealing with Tir Gofal at present will not be physically moving, in the main, because, in the discussions that I had with them—and this relates to the point that Mike German made—CCW officials made the point to me that it was important that expertise was retained and asked that, where possible, the staff would physically remain where they were. That has been done, more or less. There are few staff movements. Those who are moving are moving short distances; for example, there is movement between one office in Llandrindod to another. So long distances are not involved. Therefore, I am confident that the expertise will be maintained because the same people will be there delivering day in, day out and they will have regular personal contact with other members of CCW staff.

I thank Carl for his comments on the payments that have been made. It is true to say that if there had been confusion over paying agencies from 1 January, that might have had an impact on not just Tir Gofal payments but on all payments—and not just on those delivered under the rural development plan but also, potentially, those relating to the single farm payment. It is wise that we avoid those difficulties, given that we have seen what happens elsewhere in Europe.

Ar bwynt Alun Ffred Jones, ni ddylai'r system lle mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn cael ei defnyddio gael ei heffeithio gan mai'r un bobl fydd yn derbyn y ceisiadau ac yn delio gyda hwy ac yn siarad gyda'r ffermwyr. Felly, ni welaf unrhyw fath o wanhau ynglŷn â defnydd yr iaith ar ôl y newidiadau hyn.

ddarperir, fel mae Tir Cynnal. Mae'n gwneud synnwyr iddynt gael eu darparu yn yr un ffordd. Bydd cynllun trydedd haen ymhen hir a hwyr, y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei gyflawni, ac mae'n briodol i'r holl gynlluniau gael eu hystyried yn rhai sy'n gweddu i'w gilydd. Ni fydd y swyddogion sy'n ymdrin â Tir Gofal ar hyn o bryd yn symud yn gorfforol, ar y cyfan, oherwydd yn y trafodaethau a gefais gyda hwy—ac mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r pwynt a wnaeth Mike German—dywedodd swyddogion CCGC wrthyf ei bod yn bwysig cadw arbenigedd, a gofynnwyd, lle mae'n bosibl, am gadw staff lle y maent ar hyn o bryd. Gwnaed hynny, fwy neu lai. Symudwyd rhai aelodau o'r staff. Nid yw'r rheini sy'n symud yn symud ymhell; er enghraifft, mae rhai'n symud o un swyddfa yn Llandrindod i un arall. Felly, nid yw'n golygu pellter mawr. Felly, yr wyf yn hyderus y caiff yr arbenigedd ei gadw oherwydd bydd yr un bobl yno yn gweithio bob dydd a bydd ganddynt gysylltiad personol rheolaidd ag aelodau eraill o staff CCGC.

Diolch i Carl am ei sylwadau am y taliadau a wnaed. Mae'n wir dweud, pe bai dryswch wedi codi ynghylch asiantaethau talu o 1 Ionawr, efallai y byddai hynny wedi cael effaith nid yn unig ar daliadau Tir Gofal ond ar yr holl daliadau—nid y rhai a ddarperir o dan y cynllun datblygu gwledig yn unig, ond hefyd, o bosibl, y rhai sy'n ymwneud â'r taliad sengl. Mae'n ddoeth inni osgoi'r anawsterau hynny, o gofio'r hyn a welsom yn digwydd mewn manau eraill yn Ewrop.

On Alun Ffred Jones's point, the system where the Welsh language can be used should not be affected as the same people will be receiving the applications and dealing with them and speaking to the farmers. Therefore, I do not see any weakening in the use of the language following these changes.

*Cynnig (NDM3142): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3142): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3143): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3143): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, David
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynllun Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol The Local Government Partnership Scheme Annual Report

Motion (NDM3144): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3144): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales,

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru,

in accordance with Part II of Schedule 11 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and the National Assembly's Standing Order No. 6.6,

yn unol â Rhan II Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6 y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn

considers the local government partnership scheme annual report for 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 21 June 2006.

ystyried adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 21 Mehefin 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

believes that partnership working has been undermined by the Assembly Government's failure to:

yn credu bod gweithio mewn partneriaeth wedi cael ei danseilio gan fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i:

a) consult with local authorities regarding the distribution of RAISE funding; and

a) ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol parthed dosbarthu cyllid Rhagori; a

b) provide a sufficient level of support to local authorities which, via gearing, has placed great pressure on local government to continually increase council tax to unsustainable levels.

b) darparu lefel ddigonol o gefnogaeth i awdurdodau lleol sydd, drwy gerio, wedi gosod pwysau mawr ar lywodraeth leol i godi'r dreth gyngor yn gyson i lefelau anghynaliadwy.

Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

believes that unsustainable increases in council tax have been inevitable given the gearing ratio inherent in council tax, the responsibilities of local authorities and the scale of the revenue support grant, and further believes that this has weakened partnership working between central Government and local government.

yn credu bod codiadau anghynaliadwy yn y dreth gyngor wedi bod yn anochel oherwydd y gymhareb gerio sydd ymhlyg yn y dreth gyngor, cyfrifoldebau awdurdodau lleol a maint y grant cynnal refeniw, ac yn credu ymhellach fod hyn wedi gwanhau'r broses o weithio mewn partneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth ganolog a llywodraeth leol.

Amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

instructs the Assembly Government to ensure that it fully funds any additional responsibilities it delegates to local authorities in the future.

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau ei bod yn ariannu unrhyw gyfrifoldebau ychwanegol y mae'n eu dirprwyo i awdurdodau lleol yn y dyfodol yn llawn.

Amendment 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets the collaborative problems between the Assembly Government and local authorities in regard to the local regeneration fund and calls for the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks to

yn gresynu at y problemau cydweithio rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol yng nghyswllt y gronfa adfywio leol ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau i adolygu'r ffordd y mae'n

review the way he communicates with local authorities in this respect.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 2, 3, and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

in accordance with Part II of Schedule 11 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and the National Assembly's Standing Order No. 6.6, considers the local government partnership scheme annual report for 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 21 June 2006. (NDM3144)

I am pleased to introduce the debate on the 2005-06 annual report. The report has been developed in partnership with local government and was considered by the partnership council on 15 June and by the Assembly's Local Government and Public Services Committee on 21 June. This report once again reflects the continuing effectiveness of the partnership between the Assembly Government and local government in Wales. The scheme and the partnership council embrace all sectors of local government, including the police, fire and national park authorities, as well as community and town councils.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.30 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.30 p.m.*

Local government has an essential role to play in achieving our shared vision set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'. The continuing challenge is to match local and national priorities and the local authority community strategies with the Assembly Government's strategic agenda. Partnership working is one of the key elements in the Assembly Government's vision for the future of public services in Wales, which was highlighted in the policy document 'Making the Connections'. That document was built around a very strong view that collaboration,

cyfathrebu ag awdurdodau lleol yn y cyswllt hwn.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliannau 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn unol â Rhan II Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6 y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn ystyried adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 21 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3144)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol 2005-06. Datblygwyd yr adroddiad mewn partneriaeth â llywodraeth leol a'i ystyried gan y cyngor partneriaeth ar 15 Mehefin a chan Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus y Cynulliad ar 21 Mehefin. Mae'r adroddiad hwn unwaith eto'n adlewyrchu effeithiolrwydd parhaus y bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Mae'r cynllun a'r cyngor partneriaeth yn ymgorffori pob sector mewn llywodraeth leol, gan gynnwys awdurdodau'r heddlu, awdurdodau tân ac awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol, yn ogystal â chynghorau cymuned a thref.

Mae gan lywodraeth leol rôl hanfodol yn y gwaith o gyflawni ein gweledigaeth gyffredin sydd wedi ei gosod allan yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'. Yr her o hyd yw ceisio cysoni blaenoriaethau lleol a chenedlaethol a strategaethau cymunedol awdurdodau lleol ag agenda strategol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Gweithio mewn partneriaeth yw un o'r elfennau allweddol yng ngweledigaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer dyfodol gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru, fel yr amlinellwyd yn y ddogfen bolisi 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Lluniwyd y ddogfen honno ar

not competition, between service providers was the best way forward. We have continued to work very closely with local government towards this agenda.

I thank the WLGA for the quality of its support in achieving a sea change in collaborative working. We are now seeing some notable developments. For example, through the WLGA, we are seeing the emergence of much stronger joint working at regional level through the new regional partnerships, supported by the newly appointed regional co-ordinators, partly funded by the Assembly Government. That offers a real chance to tackle some of the difficult delivery issues, such as waste management. We were talking about these issues in questions to me earlier this afternoon. We are beginning to see much more collaborative procurement across most sectors, advances in joint commissioning of services in social care and the NHS and work on shared transaction centres.

I was very pleased with the response from public service bodies to the announcement of the 'Making the Connections' improvement fund. Project proposals have identified opportunities for greater collaboration between public service bodies, including local government. They were to provide more effective and more efficient services. I am supporting some 30 projects in this first round of the fund and believe that these projects have the potential to improve public services and stimulate significant change in terms of better ways of working and innovation. We shall repeat this process over the next year.

All this is occurring in advance of the report on local service delivery by Sir Jeremy Beecham, which we expect to be published in mid July. It will clearly influence how we take things forward.

We have made further good progress in the past year in supporting local government to improve its services and how it accounts for

sail barn gref mai cydweithredu, nid cystadlu, rhwng darparwyr gwasanaethau yw'r ffordd ymlaen. Yr ydym wedi parhau i weithio'n agos iawn gyda llywodraeth leol tuag at yr agenda hon.

Yr wyf yn diolch i Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru am ei chefnogaeth gref i sicrhau gweddnewid mewn cydweithredu. Gallwn bellach weld datblygiadau nodedig. Er enghraifft, drwy'r Gymdeithas, gwelwn gydweithio cryfach o lawer ar lefel ranbarthol drwy'r partneriaethau rhanbarthol newydd, a gaiff eu hategu gan y cydlynwyr rhanbarthol sydd newydd eu penodi ac sy'n cael eu hariannu'n rhannol gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n cynnig cyfle gwirioneddol i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r problemau anodd o ran darpariaeth, megis rheoli gwastraff. Yr oeddem yn sôn am y materion hyn mewn cwestiynau imi yn gynharach y prynhawn yma. Yr ydym yn dechrau gweld llawer mwy o waith caffael cydweithredol ar draws y rhan fwyaf o'r sectorau, datblygiadau wrth gyd-gomisiynu gwasanaethau ym maes gofal cymdeithasol a'r GIG, a gwaith ar ganolfannau trafodion cyffredin.

Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o'r ymateb gan gyrff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus pan gyhoeddwyd y gronfa gwella 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae cynigion prosiectau wedi nodi cyfleoedd ar gyfer mwy o gydweithredu rhwng gyrff gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol. Bwriadwyd iddynt ddarparu gwasanaethau mwy effeithiol ac effeithlon. Yr wyf yn cefnogi tua 30 o brosiectau yn ystod y cylch cyntaf hwn o'r gronfa, a chredaf fod gan y prosiectau hyn y potensial i wella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus ac ysgogi newid sylweddol o ran ffyrdd gwell o weithio ac arloesi. Byddwn yn ailadrodd y broses hon yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae hyn i gyd yn digwydd cyn yr adroddiad ar ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol gan Syr Jeremy Beecham y disgwyliwn iddo gael ei gyhoeddi ganol mis Gorffennaf. Bydd yn amlwg yn dylanwadu ar y ffordd y byddwn yn rhoi pethau ar waith.

Yr ydym wedi gwneud cynnydd da pellach yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf i gynorthwyo llywodraeth leol i wella ei gwasanaethau a'r

them. For instance, we have rewarded every local authority for at least adequate progress in delivering its policy agreement targets. The radical reduction in the requirement for local authority plans has reduced bureaucratic burdens and freed up time and resources to meet local needs.

We have reformed and streamlined the Wales programme for improvement, mainstreaming it into local authorities' corporate and business planning processes. Significantly, we have overhauled the local government performance measurement framework, creating a stronger focus on outcomes.

All of these are major developments in our partnership, and our colleagues in England and Wales are following our work with interest. However, much remains to be done. We need to ensure that short-term service improvement supports long-term community and national objectives, we need to do more to strengthen local and national accountability and we need to be clearer about when and how we need to intervene to prevent or rectify service or corporate failure. I will be bringing forward further proposals towards the end of the year.

For public services, the workforce is the most important asset in delivering services. The level of involvement and interest from local government in Public Services Management Wales is evidence of the broad appreciation of the workforce, from senior management to the front line. That is the single most powerful element in achieving successful outcomes. PSMW, as it is abbreviated, aims to support this by addressing development needs both for people and organisations through the highest quality products, services and systems to improve the delivery of services to the people of Wales.

Continuing the partnership theme and the seriousness with which both Assembly Government and local government take the collaborative ethic, the Wales public service workforce forum, which I chair, is a powerful example of how we operate. It is a new

modd y mae'n rhoi cyfrif amdanynt. Er enghraifft, yr ydym wedi gwobrwyo pob awdurdod lleol am wneud cynnydd digonol o leiaf wrth ddarparu ei thargedau cytundeb polisi. Mae'r gostyngiad sylweddol yn y gofyniad am gynlluniau awdurdodau lleol wedi lleihau'r baich biwrocraidd, ac wedi rhyddhau amser ac adnoddau i ddiwallu anghenion lleol.

Yr ydym wedi diwygio a symleiddio rhaglen Cymru ar gyfer gwella, gan ei phrif-frydio mewn prosesau cynllunio corfforaethol a busnes awdurdodau lleol. Yn anad dim, yr ydym wedi gweddnwid y fframwaith i fesur perfformiad llywodraeth leol, gan ganolbwyntio mwy ar ganlyniadau.

Mae'r rhain i gyd yn ddatblygiadau mawr yn ein partneriaeth, ac mae ein cyd-weithwyr yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr yn dilyn ein gwaith gyda diddordeb. Fodd bynnag, mae mwy i'w wneud o hyd. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod gwelliannau byrdymor mewn gwasanaethau yn cynnal amcanion cymunedol a chenedlaethol yn yr hirdymor, mae angen inni gryfhau atebolrwydd lleol a chenedlaethol ac mae angen inni fod yn fwy eglur o ran pryd a sut y mae angen inni ymyrryd i atal neu unioni methiant gwasanaeth neu fethiant corfforaethol. Byddaf yn cyflwyno cynigion eraill tua diwedd y flwyddyn.

O ran gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, y gweithlu yw'r ased pwysicaf wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau. Mae'r ymwneud a'r diddordeb mawr gan lywodraeth leol mewn Rheoli yng Ngwasanaeth Cyhoeddus Cymru yn dystiolaeth o'r gwerthfawrogiad eang o'r gweithlu, o uwch reolwyr i'r rheng flaen. Dyna'r elfen fwyaf pwerus wrth sicrhau canlyniadau llwyddiannus. Nod RhNgCC, fel y caiff ei dalfyrru, yw cefnogi hyn drwy fynd i'r afael ag anghenion datblygu i bobl a sefydliadau drwy gynnyrch, gwasanaethau a systemau o'r safon orau i wella darparu gwasanaethau i bobl Cymru.

I barhau thema partneriaeth a'r pwys a roddir gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol ar gydweithredu, mae fforwm gweithlu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru, a gadeirir gennyf, yn enghraifft rymus o'r modd yr ydym yn gweithredu. Mae'n fforwm newydd,

forum, but one that is already delivering results from management and trade unions, including from local government. It involves working together for a common purpose across an agenda that spans employment practice, equalities and employee engagement.

I should also mention community and town councils in Wales because they represent the grass-roots level of Government and they are well placed to contribute to and deliver these goals.

A good-practice guide commissioned by the Assembly Government last year features many worthwhile examples of how effectively community and town councils are utilising partnership working to produce innovative solutions. The expertise of local councils was further enhanced last year by One Voice Wales with an updated handbook on land use planning which was distributed to all town councils.

The election planning group has been established during the last year, and is proving successful in co-ordinating arrangements for the next Assembly elections—I am sure that you will be pleased to hear that—and, more generally, promoting best practice and new initiatives in the electoral field. It is a good example of how the Assembly Government can make things move without, in this case, having significant legislative powers. We do this by facilitating partnership between the various interested parties. I hope that this electoral group can work with election officers and returning officers to ensure that the local elections in 2008 provide an opportunity for electoral pilot schemes to take place in Wales. This will only be possible if local authorities are happy to operate schemes such as electronic counting, electronic voting, all-postal voting, voting on different days and in places outside traditional polling stations. I am starting to have discussions with local government on that. I am also hopeful that the group will be able to promote high common standards in the administration of the Assembly elections next year. This is, again, something that I am sure that you will all endorse.

ond mae eisoes yn cael canlyniadau gan reolwyr ac undebau llafur, gan gynnwys gan lywodraeth leol. Mae'n golygu gweithio gyda'i gilydd tuag at ddiben cyffredin ar draws agenda sy'n cwmpasu arferion cyflogaeth, cydraddoldeb ac ymgysylltu â chyflogaeth.

Dylwn hefyd sôn am gynghorau cymuned a thref yng Nghymru am mai hwy yw'r Llywodraeth ar lawr gwlad, ac maent mewn sefyllfa dda i gyfrannu at yr amcanion hyn a'u cyflawni.

Mae canllaw arfer da a gomisiynwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad y llynedd yn cynnwys nifer o enghreifftiau buddiol o'r modd y mae cynghorau cymuned a thref yn defnyddio gweithio mewn partneriaeth i lunio atebion arloesol. Rhoddwyd hwb pellach i arbenigedd cynghorau lleol y llynedd gan Un Llais i Gymru, gyda llawlyfr wedi ei ddiweddarau ar gynllunio defnyddio tir a ddsbarthwyd i bob cyngor tref.

Sefydlwyd y grŵp cynllunio etholiadau yn ystod y flwyddyn, ac mae'n llwyddiannus wrth gydlynu trefniadau ar gyfer etholiadau nesaf y Cynulliad—yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn falch o glywed hynny—ac yn fwy cyffredinol mae'n hybu arfer gorau a mentrau newydd ym maes etholiadau. Mae'n enghraifft dda o'r modd y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad newid pethau, heb feddu ar bwerau deddfwriaethol sylweddol yn yr achos hwn. Gwnawn hyn drwy hwyluso partneriaeth rhwng yr amrywiol bartïon sydd â diddordeb. Gobeithio y gall y grŵp etholaethol hwn weithio gyda swyddogion etholiadol a swyddogion canlyniadau i sicrhau y bydd yr etholiadau lleol yn 2008 yn cynnig cyfle ar gyfer cynlluniau peilot etholiadol yng Nghymru. Dim ond os yw awdurdodau lleol yn fodlon gweithredu cynlluniau megis cyfrif electronig, pleidleisio electronig, pleidleisio'n gyfan gwbl drwy'r post, pleidleisio ar ddyddiau gwahanol ac mewn mannau y tu allan i orsafoedd pleidleisio traddodiadol, y bydd hyn yn bosibl. Yr wyf yn dechrau cael trafodaethau gyda llywodraeth leol ar hynny. Yr wyf hefyd yn obeithiol y gall y grŵp hyrwyddo safonau uchel cyffredin wrth weinyddu etholiadau'r Cynulliad y flwyddyn nesaf. Mae hyn, hefyd, yn rhywbeth yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch i gyd

yn ei gymeradwyo.

A research project has been commissioned—which is due to start next month—which will have important ramifications for local government over the next few years. It is on the role and function of elected members, and will look in detail at the experiences of councillors today, particularly those outside the leadership of councils.

Mae prosiect ymchwil wedi ei gomisiynu—a fydd yn dechrau fis nesaf—sydd â goblygiadau pwysig i lywodraeth leol dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Mae'n ymwneud â rôl a swyddogaeth aelodau etholedig, a bydd yn edrych yn fanwl ar brofiadau cynghorwyr heddiw, yn arbennig y rheini y tu allan i arweinyddiaeth cynghorau.

For 2006-07, the Assembly is providing resources for local government through the revenue settlement totalling £3.5 billion, an increase of 5.1 per cent on the previous year. This was a good settlement for local government against a backdrop of tighter public finances. The settlement comprehensively responded to the detailed discussions that took place with local government through the year, particularly through the expenditure sub-group, working together to try to understand the expenditure pressures on local government. I am grateful to all those who took part in that for the good spirit of co-operation within that process. This settlement allowed local authorities to develop their local services and set reasonable budgets which limited the effects on council tax. Most people in local government recognised the fairness of this settlement, which was reflected in the average council tax increase. For 2006-07, the average increase was 4.5 per cent, making it the second lowest increase since the introduction of council tax.

Ar gyfer 2006-07, mae'r Cynulliad yn darparu adnoddau i lywodraeth leol drwy'r setliad refeniw o £3.5 biliwn, sy'n gynydd o 5.1 y cant o'i gymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Yr oedd hwn yn setliad da i lywodraeth leol yn erbyn cefndir o gyllid cyhoeddus mwy tynn. Yr oedd y setliad yn ymateb cynhwysfawr i'r trafodaethau manwl a gafwyd gyda llywodraeth leol yn ystod y flwyddyn, yn arbennig drwy'r is-grŵp gwariant, yn cydweithio i geisio deall y pwysau gwariant sydd ar lywodraeth leol. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i bawb a gymerodd ran yn hynny am y cydweithio da yn y broses honno. Yr oedd y setliad hwn yn galluogi awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu eu gwasanaethau lleol a gosod cyllidebau rhesymol a oedd yn lleddfu effeithiau'r dreth gyngor. Cydnabuwyd tegwch y setliad hwn gan y mwyafrif mewn llywodraeth leol, ac adlewyrchwyd hynny yn y cynnydd cyfartalog yn y dreth gyngor. Ar gyfer 2006-07, y cynnydd oedd 4.5 y cant ar gyfartaledd, sef y cynnydd lleiaf ond un ers cyflwyno'r dreth gyngor.

This year also saw some significant specific grants transferring into the settlement, in particular the capacity grant, the learning disabilities grant and the grant for key stage 2 class sizes. Between them, these grants totalled around £70 million. This was as a result of our commitment to reduce the funding provided through special, specific grants into the RSG.

Cafodd rhai grantiau penodol sylweddol hefyd eu trosglwyddo i'r setliad eleni, yn bennaf y grant adnoddau ymarferol, y grant anableddau dysgu a'r grant ar gyfer maint dosbarthiadau cyfnod allweddol 2. Rhyngddynt, yr oedd cyfanswm y grantiau hyn tua £70 miliwn. Ein hymrwymiad i leihau'r cyllid a ddarperir drwy grantiau arbennig, penodol a'i roi yn y grant cynnal refeniw a arweiniodd at hyn.

I end this introduction by thanking all my colleagues, across the piece—in the Assembly, in local government and in all the other agencies—for making this partnership scheme work so well in Wales.

Gorffennaf y cyflwyniad hwn drwy ddiolch i bawb—yn y Cynulliad, mewn llywodraeth leol ac yn yr holl asiantaethau eraill—am wneud i'r cynllun partneriaeth hwn weithio mor dda yng Nghymru.

David Lloyd: I propose amendment 1 in the

David Lloyd: Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw

name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that partnership working has been undermined by the Assembly Government's failure to:

a) consult with local authorities regarding the distribution of RAISE funding; and

b) provide a sufficient level of support to local authorities which, via gearing, has placed great pressure on local government to continually increase council tax to unsustainable levels.

Y ddadl flynyddol i ystyried adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol yw hon, sy'n olrhain, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog eisoes, yr holl bartneriaethau cydweithio a chydlynu o fewn llywodraeth leol. Mae gan lywodraeth leol agenda eang iawn, fel y gwyddom; llywodraeth leol sy'n delio â materion megis tai, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, trafndiaeth, iechyd yr amgylchedd ac addysg. Mae'r adroddiad sydd ger ein bron yn cloriannu nifer fawr o enghreifftiau clodwiw o gydweithio yn y meysydd hyn rhwng gwahanol adrannau, gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a chyda cyrff eraill fel yr heddlu.

Wedi dweud hynny, nid yw pethau'n fêl i gyd, a dyna yw sail ein gwelliant. Bydd Janet Ryder yn sôn am y diffyg ymgynghori â gyda llywodraeth leol am yr arian Rhagori. Erys her sylweddol i lywodraeth leol ariannu'r holl wasanaethau y disgwylir iddi eu darparu. Caiff unrhyw bartneriaeth ei thanseilio os nad oes digon o arian ar gael.

3.40 p.m.

Daw hyn â ni at faterion y dreth gyngor, sydd hefyd yn ein gwelliant. O leiaf y gall ein siroedd godi eu trethi eu hunain drwy'r dreth gyngor, sy'n bŵer nad yw ar gael i'r Cynulliad. Fel y dywedais, mae'r dreth gyngor wedi mwy na dyblu ers 1997, mae'n cyrraedd lefelau bellach sy'n anghynaliadwy, yn enwedig ar ôl yr ailfandio diweddar, ac mae'n taro rhai o'r pobol fwyaf anghenus waethaf.

Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod gweithio mewn partneriaeth wedi cael ei danseilio gan fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i:

a) ymgynghori ag awdurdodau lleol parthed dosbarthu cyllid Rhagori; a

b) darparu lefel ddigonol o gefnogaeth i awdurdodau lleol sydd, drwy gerio, wedi gosod pwysau mawr ar lywodraeth leol i godi'r dreth gyngor yn gyson i lefelau anghynaliadwy.

This is an annual debate to consider the annual report of the local government partnership scheme, which outlines, as the Minister has already stated, all the collaboration and co-ordination partnerships within local government. Local government has a broad agenda, as we all know; local government deals with matters such as housing, social services, transport, environmental health, and education. The report before us demonstrates many praiseworthy examples of collaboration between departments, with the Assembly Government and with other organisations such as the police.

Having said that, it is not all positive, and that is the basis for our amendment. Janet Ryder will mention the lack of consultation with local government over RAISE funding. A considerable challenge remains for local government in funding all of the services which it is expected to provide. Any partnership is undermined if there is inadequate funding.

That brings us to council tax, which is also included in our amendment. Our counties are, at least, able to raise their own taxes through council tax, which is a power not available to the Assembly. As I have already mentioned, council tax has more than doubled since 1997; it is now approaching unsustainable levels, particularly after the recent rebanding, and it hits the most vulnerable the hardest.

Wrth edrych i'r dyfodol, erys sawl her sylweddol i lywodraeth leol—i ariannu gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, y strategaeth wastraff, fel y crybwyllodd y Gweinidog, tai, a phlant ag anghenion arbennig. Gydag agenda sylweddol sy'n debyg o newid yn sgîl cyhoeddi adolygiad Beecham, ac adolygiad Lyons yn nes ymlaen, heb sôn am agenda 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', a chynllun gofodol Cymru, mae nifer o adolygiadau mawr yn wynebu llywodraeth leol. Bydd llawer o sôn am gydweithio, partneriaethau a chynllunio rhanbarthol. Gwir obeithiaf y bydd hyn oll yn digwydd.

Ond, y brif bartneriaeth bob tro yw'r un rhyngom ni a phobl Cymru. Her Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus o safon a fydd yn gwneud gwir wahaniaeth i bobl Cymru. Ni fydd hynny'n hawdd.

Michael German: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that unsustainable increases in council tax have been inevitable given the gearing ratio inherent in council tax, the responsibilities of local authorities and the scale of the revenue support grant, and further believes that this has weakened partnership working between central and local government.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

instructs the Assembly Government to ensure that it fully funds any additional responsibilities it delegates to local authorities in the future.

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the collaborative problems between the Assembly Government and local authorities in regard to the local regeneration fund and calls for the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks to review the way he communicates with local

Looking to the future, a number of substantial challenges remain for local government—in funding social services, the waste strategy, as the Minister has already mentioned, housing, and children with special needs. With a substantial agenda which is likely to change with the publication of the Beecham review, and later on, the Lyons review, not to mention the 'Making the Connections' agenda, and the Wales spatial plan, there are several major reviews facing local government. There will be a great deal of talk of collaboration, partnerships and regional planning. I very much hope that all of this will happen.

However, the main partnership is always that between us and the people of Wales. The challenge to the Assembly Government is to provide quality public services which make a real difference to the people of Wales. It will not be easy.

Michael German: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod codiadau anghynaliadwy yn y dreth gyngor wedi bod yn anochel oherwydd y gymhareb gerio sydd ymhlyg yn y dreth gyngor, cyfrifoldebau awdurdodau lleol a maint y grant cynnal refeniw, ac yn credu ymhellach fod hyn wedi gwanhau'r broses o weithio mewn partneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth ganolog a llywodraeth leol.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau ei bod yn ariannu unrhyw gyfrifoldebau ychwanegol y mae'n eu dirprwyo i awdurdodau lleol yn y dyfodol yn llawn.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y problemau cydweithio rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac awdurdodau lleol yng nghyswllt y gronfa adfywio leol ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau i adolygu'r ffordd y mae'n cyfathrebu ag awdurdodau lleol yn y cyswllt

authorities in this respect.

It has been a year in which the turf laid out for local government in Wales has been interesting, which will pose a new set of challenges for the future. However, I still think that there are some big fundamental issues, which is why we have these two inquiries taking place, which remain to be answered. I suppose that, at its heart, the first principle that any local government relationship must undertake is how far you allow local government the ability to undertake to do things for itself. When Jeremy Beecham appeared before the committee he tried to paraphrase what Lyons is saying, in that the problem that we now face with the Beecham and Lyons reports is that:

‘Local government would have more freedom to do less.’

He then went on to say that he hoped that local government in Wales and in England would resist that. It is inherent upon us to try to lay out some of our positions on this important issue of whether local government should have more freedom and the role and sets of responsibilities that it has.

I have raised this issue before with the First Minister in questions. I had an interesting reply about how you match the balance of funding, which is at its heart. You cannot give local government more freedom without it having more ability to spend and raise its own money, because if it does not have the income and the wherewithal to do it, it loses those freedoms. The gearing in Wales, with roughly 80 per cent of its money coming from the Assembly and 20 per cent through council tax, business rates and so forth, means that local government has a limited amount of financial freedom. The temptation, which I think that the First Minister expressed, is that the answer might simply be to take out a huge chunk of the present responsibilities of local government—one of those responsibilities, as the First Minister mentioned, is teachers’ salaries. If you took teachers’ salaries out of local government, it would end up without the ability to manage the staffing of its own schools and we would fall towards the French method of local

hwn.

Bu’n flwyddyn lle y gosodwyd maes chwarae diddorol ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, ac a fydd yn creu heriau newydd ar gyfer y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod rhai materion sylfaenol mawr i’w hystyried o hyd, a dyna pam mae’r ddau ymchwiliad hwn yn digwydd sy’n dal aros heb eu hateb. Mae’n debyg mai’r egwyddor gyntaf y dylai unrhyw berthynas â llywodraeth leol ei chynnal, yn ei hanfod, yw i ba raddau y caniatewch i lywodraeth leol wneud pethau drosti hi ei hun. Pan ymddangosodd Jeremy Beecham gerbron y pwyllgor, ceisiodd aralleirio’r hyn yr oedd Lyons yn ei ddweud, yn yr ystyr mai’r broblem sy’n ein hwynebu’n awr gydag adroddiadau Beecham a Lyons yw:

‘Byddai gan lywodraeth leol fwy o ryddid i wneud llai’.

Aeth ymlaen i ddweud ei fod yn gobeithio y byddai llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr yn gwrthsefyll hynny. Mae’n hanfodol inni geisio gosod allan ein barn ar y mater pwysig hwn o ran a ddylai llywodraeth leol gael mwy o ryddid a’r rôl a’r cyfrifoldebau sydd ganddi.

Yr wyf wedi codi hyn eisoes gyda’r Prif Weinidog yn ystod cwestiynau. Cefais ymateb diddorol am y modd yr ydych yn cysoni’r ariannu, sy’n ganolog iddo. Ni allwch roi mwy o ryddid i lywodraeth leol heb roi mwy o allu iddi wario a chodi ei harian ei hun, oherwydd os nad oes ganddi’r incwm a’r gallu i wneud hynny, mae’n colli’r rhyddid hwnnw. Mae’r gerio yng Nghymru, gydag oddeutu 80 y cant o’i harian gan y Cynulliad ac 20 y cant drwy’r dreth gyngor, ardrethi busnes ac ati, yn golygu mai ychydig iawn o ryddid ariannol sydd gan lywodraeth leol. Y demtasiwn y credaf mae’r Prif Weinidog sôn amdani yw mai’r ateb fyddai cymryd rhan fawr o gyfrifoldebau presennol llywodraeth leol oddi arni—un o’r cyfrifoldebau hynny, fel y soniodd y Prif Weinidog, yw cyflogau athrawon. Pe baech yn tynnu cyflogau athrawon oddi ar lywodraeth leol, y canlyniad fyddai na allai reoli staffio yn ei hysgolion ei hun ac y byddem yn symud at y dull o lywodraeth leol ar gyfer ysgolion a geir yn Ffrainc. O dan y

government for schools. Under the French system, local authorities have a responsibility for the buildings, the caretaking and the management and operations of buildings, but responsibility for fundamental internal matters relating to how many staff there should be and how schools should be staffed has been taken from local government.

Therefore, we are facing this specific challenge when we have the result of the Beecham review, in a week or so, and the Lyons review by the end of the year. I hope that the Minister will be able to reassure us today regarding the stitching together of these two reports. On the one side, you have Michael Lyons's report, which has only half of its responsibility towards Wales, which is the part that relates to how you fund local government, but not the part about roles and responsibilities. On the other side, you have Beecham with his roles and responsibilities. I hope that the Minister will be able to resist stitching those two different parts together, when there already appears to be a divide between the two of them on this key aspect of the balance of funding.

Glyn Davies: I am listening to what you say with great interest, Mike. However, I am interested to know what your position is. I am attracted to the idea of taking out a big sum from education in order to give more financial decision making to local government. I see that you have raised this balance of funding issue as an amendment. Assuming that we keep council tax—and I know that you would like to change it to a local income tax—how would you address this balance? What is the Liberal Democrat solution to this issue? We can all see it, but what is your solution to it?

Michael German: The solution is clear, and you have already mentioned it; it is to alter the balance of funding by having a system that allows you to move more directly to people raising their own local tax. That is the answer to the question.

I pass it back to you—you are in a forked position, as a Conservative. It is the same question that those who support the council

system yn Ffrainc, awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am yr adeiladau, y gwaith gofalu a rheoli a gweithredu'r adeiladau. Ond mae llywodraeth leol wedi colli'r cyfrifoldeb dros faterion mewnol sylfaenol sy'n ymwneud â faint o staff y dylid eu cael a'r modd y dylai ysgolion gael eu staffio.

Felly, yr ydym yn wynebu'r her benodol hon pan gawn ganlyniad adolygiad Beecham, ymhen tua wythnos, ac adolygiad Lyons erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi sicrwydd inni heddiw ynglŷn â dwyn ynghyd y ddau adroddiad hwn. Ar y naill law, mae adroddiad Michael Lyons, nad yw ond ei hanner yn ymwneud â Chymru, sef y rhan sy'n ymwneud â'r ffordd yr ydych yn ariannu llywodraeth leol, ond nid y rhan ynglŷn â rolau a chyfrifoldebau. Ar y llaw arall, mae Beecham gyda'i rolau a'i gyfrifoldebau. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu ymatal rhag dwyn ynghyd y ddwy ran wahanol honno, gan fod rhaniad eisoes yn ymddangos rhwng y ddwy ar yr agwedd allweddol hon ar gydbwysedd ariannu.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn gwranddo ar yr hyn a ddywedwch gyda diddordeb mawr, Mike. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn wybod beth yw eich safbwynt chi. Mae'r syniad o dynnu swm mawr oddi ar addysg er mwyn rhoi mwy o gyfle i lywodraeth leol wneud penderfyniadau ariannol yn un sy'n apelio ataf. Gwelaf eich bod wedi codi'r mater cydbwysedd ariannu hwn fel gwelliant. A chymryd y byddwn yn cadw'r dreth gyngor—a gwn yr hoffech ei newid yn dreth incwm leol—sut y byddech yn mynd i'r afael â'r cydbwysedd hwn? Beth yw ateb y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i'r broblem hon? Gallwn i gyd ei gweld, ond beth yw eich ateb chi?

Michael German: Mae'r ateb yn amlwg, ac yr ydych eisoes wedi ei grybwyll; sef newid y cydbwysedd ariannu drwy gael system sy'n fodd ichi symud yn nes at sefyllfa lle mae pobl yn codi eu treth leol eu hunain. Dyna'r ateb i'r cwestiwn.

Gofynnaf yr un cwestiwn i chithau—yr ydych mewn cyfyng-gyngor, fel Ceidwadwr. Dyma'r un cwestiwn y bydd yn rhaid i'r rhai

tax will have to answer. If you support the council tax, you must do one of two things; you must either reduce the amounts of money that come in as the responsibility of local government, or you must allow council tax to increase. You want to do both, which is fair enough—you have given your position; you want to see a slimmed-down local government doing less, but having the freedom to do more. I suspect that that is the position that Jeremy Beecham referred to when he spoke to our committee, which is in the verbatim Record. It is the future, which will be a tough test for the National Assembly and for the Government, whatever it is here. This is the major issue that is facing us, and I believe that the Minister is waiting for these reports to be issued. However, when you clearly see the issue in front of you, it would be useful to have a position statement from the Government as to where it sees itself going. Glyn Davies is right to raise the council tax issue, because it is fundamental. We know what the Conservative position is—he has made it clear to us today.

However, I would like to see local government flourish, as would my party. We would like to see it being more able to raise its own finances and able to do things better for itself, and for it to have that wide range of responsibilities. That includes the ability to manage and have a great deal more local connection with education, which I am sorry that the Conservative Members want to take away.

David Melding: We all look forward to Sir Jeremy Beecham's report in July. The Minister was right to mention that. Apart from these rather obscure discussions about gearing, and the various forms of taxation in which we do or do not believe, it is the improvement of public services that is at the heart of effective and healthy local government. I commend the Minister for at least accepting that—whether the performance meets that expectation is another issue. However, that is what should be central to our discussions today.

An awful lot needs to be done to modernise many of the public services that are the responsibility of local government. In April,

sy'n cefnogi'r dreth gyngor ei ateb. Os ydych yn cefnogi'r dreth gyngor, rhaid ichi wneud un o ddau beth: rhaid ichi naill ai leihau'r symiau arian a ddaw i mewn fel cyfrifoldeb llywodraeth leol, neu rhaid ichi ganiatáu i'r dreth gyngor godi. Yr ydych chi am wneud y ddau, sy'n ddigon teg—yr ydych wedi mynegi'ch barn; yr ydych am weld llywodraeth leol lai o faint yn gwneud llai, ond yn cael y rhyddid i wneud mwy. Credaf mai'r dyna'r safbwynt y cyfeiriodd Jeremy Beecham ato pan anerchodd ein pwyllgor, sydd yn y Cofnod gair am air. Dyna'r dyfodol, a bydd yn gryn brawf ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r Llywodraeth, waeth pwy sydd mewn grym yma. Dyna'r broblem fawr sy'n ei hwynebu, a chredaf fod y Gweinidog yn aros i'r adroddiadau hyn gael eu cyhoeddi. Fodd bynnag, pan welwch y broblem yn glir o flaen eich llygaid, byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael datganiad barn gan y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'i chyfeiriad yn y dyfodol. Mae Glyn Davies yn iawn i godi mater y dreth gyngor, am ei fod yn allweddol. Gwyddom beth yw safbwynt y Ceidwadwyr—mae wedi ei egluro inni heddiw.

Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld llywodraeth leol yn ffynnu, fel y byddai fy mhlaid hefyd. Hoffem weld llywodraeth leol sy'n gallu codi ei chyllid ei hun ac sy'n gallu gwneud pethau'n well drosti'i hun ac yn cael ystod eang o gyfrifoldebau. Mae hynny'n cynnwys y gallu i reoli addysg a chael llawer mwy o gysylltiad lleol â hi, ac yr wyf yn gresynu bod yr Aelodau Ceidwadol am ddileu hynny.

David Melding: Yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at gyhoeddi adroddiad Syr Jeremy Beecham ym mis Gorffennaf. Yr oedd y Gweinidog yn iawn i sôn am hynny. Ar wahân i'r trafodaethau digon astrus hyn ynglŷn â gerio a'r gwahanol fathau o drethiant yr ydym yn credu ynddynt neu ddim yn credu ynddynt, gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus sydd wrth wraidd llywodraeth leol effeithiol ac iach. Canmolaf y Gweinidog am dderbyn hynny o leiaf—mater arall yw a yw'r perfformiad yn ateb y disgwyl. Fodd bynnag, dyna a ddylai fod wrth wraidd ein trafodaethau heddiw.

Mae angen gwneud cryn lawer i foderneiddio nifer o'r gwasanaethau cyhoeddus y mae llywodraeth leol yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Ym

the Auditor General grimly observed that children's services were mainly high risk across the board. That is the situation on children's services in Wales. Had that judgment been made 10 or 20 years ago, I fear that it would have been similar, so I am not making a hostile, partisan point. It is improving services such as children's services that must be at the heart of our discussions.

I believe that the Minister also mentioned the community leadership function. That is the key to the renaissance that we see in local government, which has begun. Probably from the war onwards—in the 1950s, 1960s, 1970s, and 1980s—we have seen a centralisation, in general, in British public life, which is now being reversed. We are going back to the much more mixed model of the late nineteenth century, whereby local government was responsible for some of the major public services, and central Government's role was a much lighter one. This is probably the best way of delivering effective services that are matched to community need, as well as fulfilling basic standards that have to be met and enjoyed by people everywhere. So, we welcome that. It is fair to say that the modernisation of local government, in terms of executive responsibilities that are now quite clarified and often located in a cabinet, is again something that has allowed this community leadership function to be exercised with authority and understanding, with the local population realising that there is a leader of the council who is responsible for these issues, together with colleagues in a cabinet. I would just mischievously suggest that if we ever see an elected mayor in Wales, that might take this concept one stage further.

3.50 p.m.

There is a downside to the modernising agenda, and it is something that needs to be looked at. I do not think it is a crisis situation or anything, but we have not moved as rapidly on the scrutiny role, and most councillors have a scrutiny role as opposed to an executive one. This links in to all sorts of

mis Ebrill soniodd yr Archwilydd Cyffredinol yn ddifrifol iawn fod gwasanaethau plant yn rhai risg uchel ar y cyfan. Dyna'r sefyllfa gyda gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru. Pe bae'r dyfarniad hwnnw wedi ei wneud 10 neu 20 mlynedd yn ôl, ofnaf y byddai wedi bod yn debyg. Felly, nid wyf yn gwneud pwynt gwleidyddol gelyniaethus. Rhaid i wella gwasanaethau megis gwasanaethau plant fod wrth wraidd ein trafodaethau.

Credaf fod y Gweinidog wedi sôn hefyd am y swyddogaeth arweiniad cymunedol. Dyna'r allwedd i'r adfywiad yr ydym am ei weld mewn llywodraeth leol, adfywiad sydd wedi dechrau. Byth ers y rhyfel, mae'n siŵr—yn y 1950au, 1960au, 1970au a'r 1980au—yr ydym wedi gweld canoli, yn gyffredinol, ym mywyd cyhoeddus Prydain, sy'n cael ei ddatwneud bellach. Yr ydym yn dychwelyd at y model llawer mwy cymysg a oedd yn bodoli ar ddiwedd y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg, lle yr oedd llywodraeth leol yn gyfrifol am rai o'r prif wasanaethau cyhoeddus, a rôl Llywodraeth ganolog lawr yn ysgafnach. Mae'n debyg mai dyna'r ffordd orau i ddarparu gwasanaethau effeithiol sy'n cyd-fynd ag anghenion cymunedau, yn ogystal â chyrraedd safonau sylfaenol y mae'n rhaid i bobl ym mhob man eu cyrraedd a'u mwynhau. Felly, croesawn hynny. Mae'n deg dweud bod moderneiddio llywodraeth leol, o ran cyfrifoldebau gweithredol sydd erbyn hyn yn ddigon eglur ac sy'n aml wedi'u rhoi i gabinet, eto yn rhywbeth sydd wedi'i gwneud yn bosibl i'r swyddogaeth arweiniad cymunedol gael ei harfer gydag awdurdod a dealltwriaeth, a'r boblogaeth leol yn sylweddoli bod arweinydd ar y cyngor sy'n gyfrifol am y materion hyn, ynghyd â chyd-aelodau mewn cabinet. Awgrymaf yn gellweirus braidd, os gwelwn faer etholedig fyth yng Nghymru, y bydd hynny'n mynd â'r cysyniad hwn gam ymhellach.

Mae anfantais i'r agenda foderneiddio, ac mae'n rhywbeth y mae angen ei ystyried. Ni chredaf fod argyfwng na dim byd felly, ond nid ydym wedi symud mor gyflym yn y rôl graffu, a rôl graffu sydd gan y rhan fwyaf o gynghorwyr yn hytrach na rôl weithredol. Mae hyn yn gysylltiedig â phob math o

issues about who should chair scrutiny committees—whether it should be exclusively the opposition parties or a mixture. However, certainly the model whereby the party that wins control of the executive also then dominates scrutiny committees is one that I know the Minister very much objects to, but it is still unfortunately the case that they implement that model in one or two authorities.

In driving up standards, we need to improve the quality of the data. The Minister is right to say that we need broader standards. We do not want to be over-regulated, but we have to have a simpler, cleverer approach, which is linked into services being improved. We need to improve the data in some areas, and the data in social services is often quite weak; when you compare it to health data, it is not very robust. That is a slightly technical point, which I am not going to develop, and I know that the Minister and her officials are looking into this.

I also commend the work of One Voice Wales, and we could now perhaps move to a slightly quicker implementation of some of the recommendations in the Aberystwyth study—I would very much welcome that. I also commend the partnership council for Wales; we accept that it has been successful and that it is a good model, and we would certainly continue it if we were in Government. The challenges after 2007 will be quite different with the split between the legislature and the Executive, and I hope that if we have Assembly measures, we will see them published in draft form for consultation, because many of the measures will have a direct effect on local government.

Finally, we will support amendments 3 and 4. Clause b of amendment 1 is impossible to understand because of its very clumsy grammar, but I think that it tries to sink the concept of council tax, so we will abstain on it. We will also abstain on amendment 2, which is primarily a swipe against council tax, although it makes other points that we would agree with.

Ann Jones: As the Minister pointed out, this

faterion ynglŷn â phwy ddylai gadeirio pwyllgorau craffu—ai'r gwrthbleidiau'n unig ynteu cymysgedd. Fodd bynnag, yn sicr mae'r model lle mae'r blaid sy'n rheoli'r weithrediaeth wedyn yn dominyddu'r pwyllgorau craffu hefyd yn un sy'n wrthun i'r Gweinidog, mi wn, ond yn anffodus dyna sy'n digwydd pan gaiff y model hwnnw ei weithredu mewn un neu ddau o awdurdodau.

Wrth inni godi safonau, mae angen inni wella ansawdd y data. Mae'r Gweinidog yn llygad ei le i ddweud bod angen safonau mwy cyffredinol. Nid ydym am gael gormod o reoleiddio, ond rhaid wrth ddulliau gweithredu symlach a mwy clyfar sydd wedi eu cysylltu â gwella gwasanaethau. Mae angen inni wella'r data mewn rhai meysydd, ac mae'r data ym maes gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn aml yn lled gwan; o'u cymharu â'r data ar iechyd, nid ydynt yn gadarn iawn. Mae hynny'n bwynt ychydig yn dechnegol nad wyf am ymhelaethu arno, a gwn fod y Gweinidog a'i swyddogion yn ystyried hyn.

Cymeradwyaf hefyd waith Un Llais i Gymru, a gallem yn awr efallai symud ymlaen at weithredu rhai o'r argymhellion yn astudiaeth Aberystwyth ychydig yn gyflymach—croesawn hynny'n fawr. Cymeradwyaf hefyd gyngor partneriaeth Cymru; derbyniwn iddo fod yn llwyddiannus a'i fod yn fodel da, a byddem yn sicr yn parhau ag ef pe baem mewn grym. Bydd yr heriau ar ôl 2007 yn wahanol iawn gyda gwahanu'r ddeddfwrfa a'r Weithrediaeth, a gobeithio, os bydd y Cynulliad yn llunio mesurau, y byddwn yn gweld eu cyhoeddi ar ffurf ddrafft ar gyfer ymgynghori, oherwydd bydd nifer o'r mesurau'n cael effaith uniongyrchol ar lywodraeth leol.

Yn olaf, cefnogwn welliannau 3 a 4. Mae'n amhosibl deall cymal b yng ngwelliant 1 gan ei fod wedi'i eirio'n wael, ond credaf ei fod yn ceisio gwrthod y cysyniad o dreth gyngor, felly, byddwn yn ymatal arno. Byddwn hefyd yn ymatal ar welliant 2, sydd yn y bôn yn feirniadaeth ar y dreth gyngor, er ei fod yn gwneud pwyntiau eraill y byddem yn cytuno â hwy.

Ann Jones: Fel yr esboniodd y Gweinidog,

partnership council report has been through the partnership council and through the Local Government and Public Services Committee recently, and it now ends up here in the Chamber. We must once again reflect on the continuing effectiveness of the partnership between the Assembly Government and local government in Wales. The partnership scheme, as has been pointed out, embraces all sections of local government, including the police, the fire service and national park authorities, and for the sake of Mair Stephens, town and community councils as well—Mair Stephens has been a champion of town and community councils on the partnership council.

I noticed, when Mike was speaking to the amendments, that the Liberal Democrats' amendment 2 is exactly the same as the one that they tabled last year. You did not go into council tax levels, Mike, but it is worth reminding you that, although we may feel that council tax rises here are high, they still remain lower than the level in England, and, this year, as I said, we have seen some of the smallest increases in council taxes.

Partnerships must be built on relationships, and relationships must be nurtured at times, and, as with any relationship or partnership, there must be give and take. I sometimes believe that we do most of the giving and they do most of the taking, but that is my take on a partnership or a relationship, and if you were to ask my husband that, he would probably say, 'Well, she would say that anyway', and he would give you a different idea of a partnership and a relationship.

On the funding of new responsibilities, we are committed to funding local government adequately, so that it can discharge its responsibilities. This comes out through the revenue support grant, and that is how local government wants it to happen—local government wants it to come through the revenue support grant. The consultative forum on finance—and I was pleased that the Minister mentioned that—is key to this role. Both sides aim to quantify the costs of any new responsibilities and then set about

mae'r adroddiad hwn ar y cyngor partneriaeth wedi bod drwy'r cyngor partneriaeth a thrwy'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus yn ddiweddar, a dyma ef yn cyraedd y Siambr. Rhaid inni unwaith eto ystyried effeithiolrwydd parhaus y bartneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru. Mae'r cynllun partneriaeth, fel y nodwyd, yn cwmpasu pob rhan o lywodraeth leol, gan gynnwys yr heddlu, y gwasanaeth tân ac awdurdodau'r parciau cenedlaethol, ac er mwyn Mair Stephens, y cyngorau tref a chymuned yn ogystal—mae Mair Stephens wedi bod yn cefnogi cyngorau tref a chymuned ar y cyngor partneriaeth.

Sylwais, pan oedd Mike yn trafod y gwelliannau, fod gwelliant 2 gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn union yr un gwelliant ag a gyflwynwyd ganddynt y llynedd. Nid oeddech yn sôn am lefelau'r dreth gyngor, Mike, ond mae'n werth eich atgoffa, er y teimlwn fod y cynnydd yn y dreth gyngor yn uchel, eu bod serch hynny yn is na'r lefel yn Lloegr. Ac eleni, fel y dywedais, cafwyd y cynnydd lleiaf yn y dreth gyngor a welwyd erioed mewn rhai awdurdodau.

Rhaid i bartneriaethau gael eu hadeiladu ar gydberthynas, a rhaid meithrin cydberthynas ar adegau, ac fel gydag unrhyw gydberthynas neu bartneriaeth, rhaid cyfaddawdu. Credaf weithiau mai ni sy'n cyfaddawdu fwyaf a hwy sy'n cyfaddawdu leiaf, ond dyna sut yr wyf fi'n dehongli partneriaeth neu gydberthynas. Pe baech yn gofyn i'm gŵr, mae'n debyg y byddai'n dweud, 'Wel, dyna fyddai hi'n ei ddweud beth bynnag', a byddai'n rhoi syniad gwahanol ichi o bartneriaeth a chydberthynas.

O ran ariannu cyfrifoldebau newydd, yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i ariannu llywodraeth leol yn ddigonol, fel y gall gyflawni ei chyfrifoldebau. Rhoddir yr arian hwn drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw, a dyna sut y mae llywodraeth leol yn dymuno'i gael—mae llywodraeth leol yn dymuno'i gael drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Mae'r fforwm cynghori ar gyllid—ac yr oeddwn yn falch fod y Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio ato—yn allweddol i'r rôl hon. Bydd y naill ochr a'r llall yn ceisio cyfrifo costau unrhyw gyfrifoldebau

reaching an agreement. Where there are new responsibilities, there must be some guesstimates going on, and a good deal of what-if's and maybe's. However, there is also the need to take that back to the consultative forum on finance and to refine it, and to find the formula in the light of experience. I believe that the consultative forum on finance does that effectively.

I realise that there are many pressures on funding for both local government and the Assembly Government, and that we are all under pressure to deliver services more effectively and efficiently. I am pleased to see that local government is on target to exceed the Assembly Government's 1 per cent efficiency target, although I note with some regret that some local authorities passed the 1 per cent efficiency savings directly on to front-line services, which was against the spirit of the agreement of the partnership council. I regret that, and I hope that local authorities will reflect on that in future.

Local authorities are increasingly working together regionally to plan and deliver their services, and I believe that that is the way forward. As the Presiding Officer made clear earlier today, local councillors are elected, as we are, and we are all accountable to voters. They all have their own views at times, and often they can never agree on situations. All the members of the partnership council, however, acknowledge that, if we are to deliver for the people whom we are elected to serve, a partnership approach is the only way forward. We need to remember that, as we move forward and take this on, in accordance with the Government of Wales Bill, in 2007.

Janet Ryder: It is interesting to hear Ann talking about partnership being based on good relationships. In a good relationship, each partner values the other. I think that this relationship has been severely affected by the recent distribution of the RAISE grant. I will quote you something from the opening paragraphs of this partnership agreement. It states:

'The Assembly Government and local government in Wales are committed to

newydd, ac yna ddod i gytundeb. Lle bydd cyfrifoldebau newydd, rhaid bwrw amcan ynglŷn â chostau, a dyfalu gryn dipyn. Fodd bynnag, mae angen hefyd i fynd yn ôl at y fforwm ymgynghori ar gyllid a'i fireinio, a chael fformiwla yng ngoleuni profiad. Credaf fod y fforwm ymgynghori ar gyllid yn gwneud hynny'n effeithiol.

Sylweddolaf fod llawer o bwysau ar gyllid i lywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr ydym i gyd o dan bwysau i ddarparu gwasanaethau'n fwy effeithiol ac effeithlon. Yr wyf yn falch gweld bod llywodraeth leol ar y trywydd iawn i ragori ar darged effeithlonrwydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o 1 y cant, er fy mod yn gresynu braidd fod rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi trosglwyddo'r arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant yn uniongyrchol i'r gwasanaethau rheng flaen, a oedd yn groes i ysbryd cytundeb y cyngor partneriaeth. Gresynaf at hynny, a gobeithio y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried hynny yn y dyfodol.

Mae awdurdodau lleol yn cydweithio'n gynyddol yn rhanbarthol i gynllunio a darparu eu gwasanaethau, a chredaf mai dyna'r ffordd ymlaen. Fel yr eglurodd y Llywydd yn gynharach heddiw, caiff cyngorwyr lleol eu hethol, fel ninnau, ac yr ydym i gyd yn atebol i bleidleiswyr. Maent ganddynt i gyd eu barn, ac yn aml maent yn methu cytuno byth ar bethau. Fodd bynnag, mae pob aelod o'r cyngor partneriaeth yn cydnabod, os ydym am gyflawni dros y bobl sydd wedi ein hethol i'w gwasanaethu, mai gweithio mewn partneriaeth yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen. Mae angen inni gofio hynny, wrth inni symud ymlaen a mynd i'r afael â hyn, yn unol â Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, yn 2007.

Janet Ryder: Mae'n ddiddorol clywed Ann yn sôn bod partneriaethau'n seiliedig ar berthynas dda. Mewn berthynas dda, mae pob partner yn gwerthfawrogi'r llall. Credaf fod y ffordd y dosbarthwyd y grant Rhagori yn ddiweddar wedi gwneud niwed mawr i'r berthynas hon. Dyfynnaf rywbeth ichi o baragraffau agoriadol y cytundeb partneriaeth hwn. Dywed:

'Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru yn ymrwymedig i

working together in partnership, within an atmosphere of mutual trust and respect, recognising the value and legitimacy of the roles both have to play in the governance of Wales’.

It states that both

‘are committed to openness and accountability in decision making and in their relations with each other and the public’.

These are very fine words, taken from the opening paragraphs of this document. It was somewhat surprising, therefore, to read in a letter to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills from the Society of Local Authority Chief Executives in Wales that, while it welcomes the provision of additional resources to drive up school performance, SOLACE Wales wishes to record its deep concern about how this grant has been handled.

The letter goes on to say that the society is concerned by the lack of consultation with representative bodies, such as the Welsh Local Government Association and the Association of Directors of Education in Wales, before an announcement was made. This does not reflect the spirit of partnership with local government, or the partnership approach that the Assembly exhorts councils to follow.

If that is not damning enough, coming from the chief executives’ association in Wales, the WLGA spokesperson for lifelong learning, Councillor John Davies, wrote to the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills on 21 April 2006. He starts his letter by saying that it is with regret and considerable dismay that he writes to her to ask her to reconsider her approach. He goes on to say that the RAISE initiative is an unfortunate departure from the consultative and consensual approach that has characterised her term as Minister.

Those sentiments call into question the sentiments being put forward by the Labour Government in this partnership document, which all parties in the Assembly have signed

gydweithio mewn partneriaeth, o fewn amgylchedd o gyd-ympdiriedaeth a pharch gan gydnabod gwerth a dilysrwydd y rolau sydd ganddynt ill dau i’w chwarae o ran llywodraethu Cymru’.

Dywed fod y ddwy

‘wedi ymrwymo i fod yn agored ac yn atebol wrth wneud penderfyniadau ac yn eu cysylltiadau â’i gilydd ac â’r cyhoedd’.

Dyna ichi eiriau teg, sydd i’w gweld ym mharagraffau agoriadol y ddogfen hon. Yr oeddwn yn synnu braidd, felly, o ddarllen mewn llythyr at y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau gan y Gymdeithas Prif Weithredwyr Awdurdodau Leol yng Nghymru, er ei bod yn croesawu’r adnoddau ychwanegol a ddarparwyd i wella perfformiad ysgolion, fod SOLACE Cymru am gofnodi ei bryder mawr ynglŷn â’r ffordd y deliwyd â’r grant hwn.

Â’r llythyr yn ei flaen i ddweud bod y gymdeithas yn pryderu am y diffyg ymgynghori â chyrrff cynrychioli, megis Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a Chymdeithas y Cyfarwyddwyr Addysg yng Nghymru, cyn i gyhoeddiad gael ei wneud. Nid yw hyn yn adlewyrchu ysbryd y bartneriaeth â llywodraeth leol, na’r gweithio mewn partneriaeth y mae’r Cynulliad yn annog cynghorau i’w arddel.

Fel pe na bai’r feirniadaeth honno’n ddigon damniol, a hynny gan gymdeithas y prif weithredwyr yng Nghymru, ysgrifennodd y Cynghorydd John David, llefarydd CLILC dros ddysgu gydol oes, at y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar 21 Ebrill 2006. Mae’r ei lythyr yn dechrau drwy ddweud ei bod yn edifar mawr ganddo ei fod yn gorfod ysgrifennu ati i ofyn iddi ailystyried sut y mae’n gweithredu. Mae’n mynd yn ei flaen i ddweud bod y fenter Rhagori yn wyriad anffodus oddi wrth ei hymdrech i ymgynghori a dod i gytundeb, fel sydd wedi bod yn nodwedd o’i chyfnod fel Gweinidog.

Mae’r sylwadau hynny’n bwrw amheuaeth ar yr hyn a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y ddogfen bartneriaeth hon ac a gefnogwyd gan bob plaid yn y Cynulliad.

up to. I appreciate that this is not the place to debate the RAISE grant itself, but Plaid Cymru feels that this is the place to debate the Government's handling of this grant and the way in which it clearly contravenes the ethos of the partnership agreement and the idea of working in partnership.

4.00 p.m.

Not only that, but, for the first time, a Minister has totally overridden local accountability and the work of local government, and detailed not only which schools will receive grants, but also how much they will receive. That has never happened in Wales, before this Minister announced the RAISE grant this year.

There is a paragraph in the formal partnership agreement—the concordat between local government and the Assembly Government—which states clearly that no grant should be ended without prior consultation with local government, and when grants are given to local government, there should be an exit strategy. The introduction of the RAISE grant completely ended, without warning, a grant that was being paid to local government. In conjunction with their schools, using their local determination, local government had decided which schools would get what proportion of the funding. That grant was to raise achievement in underperforming schools, but the money was taken away from local government, without warning, by the Government. It has left schools with plans that they can no longer fulfil because some of those schools, which local government had identified in their areas as being in need of support, were not identified by the Minister, from Cardiff, for the whole of Wales. That is not partnership working; that totally overrides partnership working and calls into question the concordat between local government and the Assembly Government.

I have asked the Minister with responsibility for local government previously whether she feels that her partner in the Cabinet has broken the concordat, and I would really like a response to that question today. The whole issue of the RAISE grant has been handled badly—a statement justified by letters from

Deallaf nad dyma'r lle i trafod y grant Rhagori ei hun, ond teimla Plaid Cymru mai dyma'r lle i drafod y ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymdrin â'r grant hwn a'r ffordd y mae'n amlwg yn mynd yn groes i ethos y cytundeb partneriaeth a'r syniad o weithio mewn partneriaeth.

Nid hynny'n unig, ond am y tro cyntaf mae Gweinidog wedi diystyru atebolrwydd lleol a gwaith llywodraeth leol yn llwyr, gan nodi nid yn unig pa ysgolion a fydd yn cael grantiau, ond hefyd faint y byddant yn ei gael. Nid yw hynny erioed wedi digwydd yng Nghymru, cyn i'r Gweinidog hwn gyhoeddi'r grant Rhagori eleni.

Mae paragraff yn y cytundeb partneriaeth ffurfiol—y concordat rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—sy'n dweud yn glir na ddylid dod ag unrhyw grant i ben heb ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol yn gyntaf, a phan roddir grantiau i lywodraeth leol, y dylai fod strategaeth ymadael. Daeth grant a delid i lywodraeth leol i ben yn llwyr, a hynny'n ddirybudd, yn sgîl cyflwyno grant Rhagori. Ar y cyd â'u hysgolion, gan ddefnyddio'u penderfyniad lleol, yr oedd llywodraeth leol wedi penderfynu pa ysgolion fyddai'n cael pa gyfran o'r arian. Bwriad y grant hwnnw oedd codi cyrhaeddiad mewn ysgolion a oedd yn tanberfformio, ond tynnodd y Llywodraeth yr arian yn ôl oddi wrth lywodraeth leol, yn ddirybudd. Mae wedi golygu bod gan ysgolion gynlluniau na allant eu cyflawni mwyach, oherwydd er i lywodraeth leol nodi bod angen cymorth ar rai o'r ysgolion hynny yn eu hardaloedd hwy, ni chawsant eu nodi gan y Gweinidog, o Gaerdydd, ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Nid gweithio mewn partneriaeth yw hynny; mae hynny'n diystyru gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn llwyr ac yn codi amheuaeth ynglŷn â'r concordat rhwng llywodraeth leol a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Yr wyf wedi gofyn gynt i'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am lywodraeth leol a yw'n teimlo bod ei phartner yn y Cabinet wedi torri'r concordat, a hoffwn gael ymateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw heddiw. Deliwyd â phob agwedd ar y grant Rhagori yn wael—datganiad sy'n cael ei gyfiawnhau gan lythyrau gan Gymdeithas

the Association of Local Authority Chief Executives in Wales and the WLGA spokesperson for education. Both letters give a clear indication that they are unhappy. They do not perceive this to be partnership working and I would urge you all, for that reason, to support amendment 1, tabled by Plaid Cymru.

Gwenda Thomas: It is encouraging to see that a partnership-working approach is one of the key principles thematic throughout this report. I support the proposal to introduce a performance management framework for all community strategies in Wales, so that there can be effective delivery of local visions for all our communities. I would add, of course, that children and young people should be at the centre of community planning and should be consulted on community strategies.

When we refer to how we are to enable the effective delivery of public services, I strongly believe that a child's perspective should be considered, and any research conducted into the experiences of service recipients should also include the experiences of children and young people. Alongside this, I welcome the fact that the Welsh Assembly Government is providing financial support to the WLGA, which has set up four regional boards to ensure that collaboration between local authorities is extended. Children's services should definitely benefit from this approach. I take on board the points made by David Melding that we will need to develop a monitoring process to see that this happens.

In the context of service delivery, I am glad to see that One Voice Wales, after receiving funding from the Assembly Government, has ensured that the handbook for community and town councillors is being updated, thus ensuring that they have all the information necessary to meet their requirements. We need to celebrate democracy at the grass-roots level and recognise the voluntary effort of town and community councillors. I would endorse the commissioning of this research to review how non-executive councillors particularly can input into the democratic and scrutiny process effectively while still serving their communities. This research is

y Prif Weithredwyr Awdurdodau Lleol yng Nghymru a llefarydd CLILC dros addysg. Mae'r ddau lythyr yn dangos yn glir nad ydynt yn hapus. Nid ydynt o'r farn fod hyn yn enghraifft o weithio mewn partneriaeth, a byddwn yn eich annog chi oll, am y rheswm hwnnw, i gefnogi gwelliant 1 a gyflwynwyd gan Blaid Cymru.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae'n galonogol gweld bod ymagwedd gweithio mewn partneriaeth yn un o'r egwyddorion allweddol sy'n amlwg drwy'r adroddiad hwn. Cefnogaf y cynnig i gyflwyno fframwaith rheoli perfformiad ar gyfer pob strategaeth gymunedol yng Nghymru, er mwyn gallu cyflawni gweledigaethau lleol ar gyfer pob un o'n cymunedau yn effeithiol. Byddwn yn ychwanegu, wrth gwrs, y dylai plant a phobl ifanc fod yn ganolog i gynllunio cymunedol ac y dylid ymgynghori â hwy am strategaethau cymunedol.

Pan gyfeiriwn at y modd y byddwn yn galluogi'r broses o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn effeithiol, credaf yn gryf y dylid ystyried safbwynt plentyn, ac y dylai unrhyw waith ymchwil ar brofiadau'r sawl sy'n cael gwasanaethau gynnwys profiadau plant a phobl ifanc hefyd. Ynghyd â hynny, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn rhoi cymorth ariannol i CLILC, sydd wedi sefydlu pedwar bwrdd rhanbarthol i sicrhau mwy o gydweithredu rhwng awdurdodau lleol. Dylai gwasanaethau plant yn sicr elwa o'r dull hwn. Derbyniaf y pwyntiau a wnaed gan David Melding y bydd angen inni ddatblygu proses fonitro i sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd.

Yng nghyd-destun darparu gwasanaethau, yr wyf yn falch bod Un Llais i Gymru, ar ôl cael arian gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, wedi sicrhau bod y llawlyfr ar gyfer cynghorwyr cymuned a thref yn cael ei ddiweddarau, gan sicrhau drwy hynny fod ganddynt yr holl wybodaeth y mae arnynt ei hangen i fodloni eu gofynion. Mae angen inni ddatlu democratiaeth ar lawr gwlad a chydabod ymdrech wirfoddol cynghorwyr tref a chymuned. Byddwn yn cefnogi comisiynu'r gwaith ymchwil hwn i adolygu sut y gall cynghorwyr anweithredol, yn arbennig, gyfrannu at y broses ddemocrataidd a'r broses graffu yn effeithiol gan ddal i

imperative for the Welsh Assembly Government, so that any reviews of electoral arrangements can be undertaken with the appropriate knowledge and understanding of the role of councillors and of the need for effective and timely scrutiny. The publication of the Beecham report, of course, will, and should, influence this process, and with your experience and commitment, Minister, we need have no doubt that the direction that will be issued to the Boundary Commission for Wales for its guidance in conducting electoral reviews will be fair and visionary.

Mark Isherwood: In this report, the Assembly Government states that partnership and collaboration are at the heart of the distinctive approach that it has delivered in several areas. In my region of north Wales, a regional partnership board comprising council leaders and chief executives now meets quarterly. In this context, I also endorse Plaid Cymru's comments that the RAISE funding for underachieving in schools has brought the Welsh Assembly Government's partnership approach into question.

This report, as we have heard, refers to Sir Jeremy Beecham's review of local service delivery, and I am advised that Sir Jeremy will no longer propose local government reorganisation in Wales, which I believe was on the agenda at one stage last year. Instead, it is expected that he will either recommend public service boards or, more likely, challenge local authorities to carry out voluntary collaborations. It is anticipated that grants will be conditional upon this, and there is therefore concern that voluntary collaboration may be required even where it is inappropriate and inefficient. We must therefore be sensitive to this issue and ensure that voluntary collaboration is incentivised only when greater efficiency is achieved.

The report is right to recognise the benefits of increased community and town council involvement in local service delivery. However, the drive towards localism at county and community level must be balanced by independent, external checks and

wasanaethu eu cymunedau. Mae'r gwaith ymchwil hwn yn hollbwysig i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, er mwyn gallu gwneud unrhyw adolygiadau o drefniadau etholiadol gyda'r wybodaeth a'r ddealltwriaeth briodol o rôl cynghorwyr a'r angen am broses graffu effeithiol ac amserol. Bydd cyhoeddi adroddiad Beecham, wrth gwrs, yn dylanwadu ar y broses hon, a dylai wneud hynny, a chyda'ch profiad a'ch ymrwymiad chi, Weinidog, gallwn fod yn hollol siŵr y bydd y cyfarwyddyd a roddir i'r Comisiwn Ffiniau i Gymru ar gyfer ei ganllawiau wrth wneud adolygiadau etholiadol yn deg ac yn dangos gweledigaeth.

Mark Isherwood: Yn yr adroddiad hwn, dywed Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod partneriaeth a chydweithredu yn ganolog i'r dull unigryw a ddarparwyd ganddi mewn nifer o ardaloedd. Yn fy rhanbarth i, sef y gogledd, mae bwrdd partneriaeth rhanbarthol sy'n cynnwys arweinwyr cynghorau a phrif weithredwyr bellach yn cwrdd bob chwarter. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, cefnogaf hefyd sylwadau Plaid Cymru fod arian Rhagori ar gyfer tangyflawni mewn ysgolion wedi bwrw amheuaeth ar ddull partneriaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn, fel y clywsom, yn cyfeirio at adolygiad Syr Jeremy Beecham o ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau lleol, a dywedir wrthyf na fydd Syr Jeremy yn cynnig ad-drefnu llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru mwyach, fel yr oedd ar yr agenda ar un adeg y llynedd, mi gredaf. Yn hytrach, disgwylir y bydd naill ai'n argymhell byrddau gwasanaeth cyhoeddus neu, yn fwy tebygol, yn herio awdurdodau lleol i gydweithredu'n wirfoddol. Rhagwelir y bydd grantiau'n amodol ar hyn, ac felly mae pryder y gall y bydd angen cydweithredu gwirfoddol, hyd yn oed lle mae'n amhriodol ac yn aneffeithlon. Rhaid inni felly fod yn ystyriol o'r mater hwn, a sicrhau bod yna gymhelliad i gydweithredu'n wirfoddol dim ond pan fydd mwy o effeithlonrwydd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn iawn i gydnabod manteision cynnwys cynghorau cymuned a thref yn fwy wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau lleol. Fodd bynnag, wrth symud tuag at leoliaeth ar lefel sirol a chymunedol, rhaid wrth wiriadau annibynnol, allanol sy'n

balances that ensure good corporate governance and accountability. The report is also right in emphasising the importance of working in partnership with voluntary and business organisations. However, as I have stated, with evidence, on many occasions in the Assembly, there have been too many instances of voluntary and business organisations telling us that this has been based on an inequality of partnership at national and local government level. The Assembly Government must therefore start to preach less and listen more if we are ever to tackle the deep social and economic problems in Wales today.

Effective partnership between the Assembly and local government will never be achieved if the Assembly Government continues to take a selective position when it comes to involvement in local authority operational matters. Ministers cannot have any credibility if they continue to take credit for local authority achievements, to criticise local authorities not controlled by their own party, and yet refuse to become involved when serious allegations are made against a Labour-controlled council.

The last time that I spoke in depth, in the old Chamber, about Flintshire County Council, the Finance Minister issued a press release accusing me of bringing the Assembly into disrepute. I must repeat that everything that I stated was quoted from legally binding documents, from public records and from council minutes, and some might say that it was her failure to act that brought the Assembly into disrepute.

In a recent question to the Finance Minister in this Chamber, I stated that Flintshire County Council now faces a multimillion pound deficit, redundancies, unrepaired council houses, cuts in services, the suspension of its housing director, the early retirement of its leader, chief executive and county secretary, continuing serious allegations and yet another public interest report. The Minister responded by saying,

'You paint a picture of Flintshire that I do not

sicrhau llywodraethu corfforaethol ac atebolrwydd da. Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn iawn i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd gweithio mewn partneriaeth gyda sefydliadau gwirfoddol a busnes. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, gyda thystiolaeth, ar lawer achlysur yn y Cynulliad, cafwyd gormod o enghreifftiau o sefydliadau gwirfoddol a busnes yn dweud wrthym fod hyn wedi ei seilio ar anghydraddoldeb partneriaeth ar lefel llywodraeth genedlaethol a llywodraeth leol. Rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad felly ddechrau pregethu llai a gwrando mwy os ydym i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau cymdeithasol ac economaidd difrifol yng Nghymru heddiw.

Ni fydd partneriaeth effeithiol byth rhwng y Cynulliad a llywodraeth leol os bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i ddewis a dethol pryd mae am fod yn rhan o faterion gweithredol awdurdodau lleol. Ni fydd gan Weinidogion unrhyw hygredded os byddant yn parhau i gymryd y clod am gyflawniadau awdurdodau lleol, yn beirniadu awdurdodau lleol na reolir gan eu plaid eu hunain, ac eto yn gwrthod cymryd rhan pan wneir honiadau difrifol yn erbyn cyngor a reolir gan Lafur.

Y tro diwethaf imi siarad yn fanwl, yn yr hen Siambr, ynghylch Cyngor Sir y Fflint, cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog Cyllid ddatganiad i'r wasg yn fy nghyhuddo o ddwyn anfri ar y Cynulliad. Rhaid imi ailadrodd bod popeth a ddywedais wedi ei ddyfynnu o ddogfennau cyfreithiol gyfrwymol, o gofnodion cyhoeddus ac o gofnodion y cyngor, ac efallai y byddai rhai pobl yn dweud mai ei methiant hi i weithredu a ddygodd anfri ar y Cynulliad.

Mewn cwestiwn yn ddiweddar i'r Gweinidog Cyllid yn y Siambr hon, dywedais fod Cyngor Sir y Fflint bellach yn wynebu diffyg o filiynau o bunnau, dileu swyddi, tai cyngor heb eu hatgyweirio, torri gwasanaethau, gwahardd ei gyfarwyddwr tai dros dro, ymddeoliad cynnar ei arweinydd, ei brif weithredwr a'i ysgrifennydd sirol, honiadau difrifol parhaus, ac adroddiad budd cyhoeddus eto fyth. Ymatebodd y Gweinidog drwy ddweud,

'Nid yw eich disgrifiad o sir y Fflint yn un

recognise’.

How can the Assembly Government claim to be modernising structures when the Minister refuses to recognise issues that are all a matter of public record? When allegations were initially made against Flintshire’s housing directorate concerning illegal council-house gas-safety certificates and awarding contracts illegally, the messengers were shot. Two Flintshire county councillors and I met a former employee in 2003, and he provided us with the documentary evidence to support these allegations. It is this, and not effective internal mechanisms, that triggered the investigations that exposed the level of mismanagement in this council. As PricewaterhouseCoopers stated, it found that dozens of documents were missing, and so many failings were unearthed that managers and employees could be found guilty of misconduct. The subsequent Roots report showed that the responsibility for major problems in the community and housing directorate goes far beyond the management of that department.

When opposition leaders referred this to the monitoring officer, they were accused of harassment and intimidation. It was only the intervention of councillor Bernie Attridge—perhaps the first Flintshire Labour politician in a generation to put people before party, and for whom I have huge admiration—that finally tipped the scales of justice in the right direction. We will never have effective local government partnership until, as Flintshire’s former internal audit manager stated, the internal audit function is managed, employed and funded from outside the organisation that it audits. Equally, we can no longer justify a situation in which the posts of monitoring officers are seen as discretionary appointments by the executive from the executive.

4.10 p.m.

In the unlikely event that I am ever in government, I go on record and pledge to the Assembly that, if an allegation against a Conservative councillor is made to me, I will pursue it as vigorously as I would against any

sy’n gyfarwydd imi’.

Sut y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad honni ei bod yn moderneiddio strwythurau a’r Gweinidog yn gwrthod cydnabod materion sydd i gyd wedi’u cofnodi’n gyhoeddus? Pan wnaed honiadau yn wreiddiol yn erbyn cyfarwyddiaeth tai sir y Fflint am dystysgrifau diogelwch nwy anghyfreithlon mewn tai cyngor a dyfarnu contractau’n anghyfreithlon, cafodd y rhai a oedd wedi codi’r materion eu beio. Cefais i a dau gynghorydd sir o sir y Fflint gyfarfod â chyn-gyflogai yn 2003, a rhoddodd yntau’r dystiolaeth ddogfennol inni i ategu’r honiadau hyn. Y dystiolaeth honno, nid y dulliau mewnol effeithiol, a sbardunodd yr ymchwiliadau a ddatgelodd raddau’r camreoli yn y cyngor hwn. Fel y dywedodd PricewaterhouseCoopers, gwelwyd bod dwsinau o ddogfennau ar goll, a datgelwyd cynifer o fethiannau fel y gellid cael rheolwyr a chyflogeion yn euog o gamymddwyn. Dangosodd yr adroddiad Roots dilynol fod y cyfrifoldeb am broblemau mawr yn y gyfarwyddiaeth gymuned a thai yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i’r gwaith o reoli’r adran honno.

Pan gyfeiriwyd hyn at y swyddog monitro gan arweinwyr y gwrthbleidiau, fe’u cyhuddwyd o aflonyddu a dychryn. Dim ond ymyriad gan y cynghorydd Bernie Attridge—y gwleidydd Llafur cyntaf yn sir y Fflint mewn cenhedlaeth, hwyrach, i roi pobl cyn plaid, a rhywun yr wyf yn ei edmygu’n fawr—a sicraodd gyfiawnder. Fel y dywedodd cyn-reolwr archwilio mewnol sir y Fflint, ni chawn bartneriaeth effeithiol â llywodraeth leol fyth nes caiff y swyddogaeth archwilio mewnol ei rheoli, ei chyflogi a’i hariannu o’r tu allan i’r sefydliad y mae’n ei archwilio. Yn yr un modd, ni allwn gyfiawnhau sefyllfa mwyach lle yr ystyrir swyddi swyddogion monitro yn benodiadau dewisol gan y weithrediaeth oddi wrth y weithrediaeth.

Mae’n annhebygol o ddigwydd, ond pe byddai fy mhlaid i fyth mewn grym, yr wyf yn cofnodi ac yn addo i’r Cynulliad, os caiff honiad ei wneud imi yn erbyn cynghorydd Ceidwadol, y byddaf yn ymchwilio iddo yr

other councillor. As Albert Einstein stated, the world is dangerous to live in, not because of those who do evil, but because of those who look on and let them do so.

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): There was some light relief at the end there with Mark. I will respond briefly to the points that were made in the six minutes that I think I have. There were some general points and some useful points made. Those of us who have been involved in local government for many years know that it is always changing and always challenging. That is a good thing, because that is how the world is, and we need to push up standards and look for opportunities to take on the challenges and deliver for people.

Mike talked about the Lyons and Beecham reports. We deliberately took the decision to ask Jeremy and his team to come in to do this work because we felt that we needed help. It is such an important initiative. We needed help from some of the best brains around, with lots of experience to help us through. The Beecham report will come out way before the Lyons report. Of course issues of money and structures are important, but I agree with virtually everything that David Melding said. You are thinking too much about the money constraints. David's point was about putting the services first, and that is where the Beecham report starts. What services do we want? The public is really not interested in arcane discussions about who delivers what, and the breakdown of funding. From my experience, I think that most people care about the services, and David and Gwenda were right to mention children's services. We will be—and I want to be—judged primarily on how we deliver for children, because, in some cases, children are the most vulnerable group, whether in education or social care. We must set our sights high for children, so the points that David and Gwenda made were extremely useful.

David also made a very good point about the

un mor drwyadl â phe bai yn erbyn unrhyw gynghorydd arall. Fel y dywedodd Albert Einstein, mae'r byd yn lle peryglus i fyw ynddo, nid oherwydd y bobl sy'n gwneud drwg, ond oherwydd y bobl sy'n gadael iddynt wneud hynny.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Gwnaeth Mark rai sylwadau ysgafn ar y diwedd. Ymatebaf yn gyflym i'r pwyntiau a wnaed yn ystod y chwe munud sydd gennyf, mi dybiaf. Gwnaed rhai pwyntiau cyffredinol a rhai pwyntiau defnyddiol. Fe wŷr y rhai ohonom sydd wedi bod yn rhan o lywodraeth leol ers nifer o flynyddoedd ei bod yn newid yn barhaus ac yn heriol bob amser. Mae hynny'n beth da, oherwydd dyna sut le yw'r byd, ac mae angen inni godi safonau a chwilio am gyfleoedd i ymgymryd â'r heriau a chyflawni i bobl.

Soniodd Mike am adroddiad Lyons ac adroddiad Beecham. Gwnaethom y penderfyniad yn bwrpasol i ofyn i Jeremy a'i dîm ddod i wneud y gwaith hwn oherwydd teimlem fod angen cymorth arnom. Mae'n fenter mor bwysig. Yr oedd angen cymorth arnom gan rai o'r goreuon yn y maes, sydd â llawer o brofiad i'n helpu. Caiff adroddiad Beecham ei gyhoeddi ymhell cyn adroddiad Lyons. Wrth gwrs, mae materion sy'n ymwneud ag arian a strwythurau yn bwysig, ond cytunaf â bron bopeth a ddywedodd David Melding. Yr ydych yn meddwl gormod am y cyfyngiadau ariannol. Yr oedd a wnelo pwynt David â rhoi gwasanaethau'n gyntaf, a dyna fan cychwyn adroddiad Beecham. Pa wasanaethau yr ydym am eu cael? Nid oes gan y cyhoedd ddiddordeb mewn trafodaethau dirgel ynghylch pwy sy'n darparu beth, a dadansoddiad o arian. Yn fy mhrofiad i, credaf mai'r gwasanaethau sy'n bwysig i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl, ac yr oedd David a Gwenda yn gywir i sôn am wasanaethau plant. Cawn ein barnu—ac yr wyf am inni gael ein barnu—yn bennaf am y modd y darparwn wasanaethau ar gyfer plant, oherwydd mewn rhai achosion plant yw'r grŵp mwyaf diamddiffyn, boed ym maes addysg neu ofal cymdeithasol. Rhaid inni anelu'n uchel ar gyfer plant, felly, yr oedd y pwyntiau a wnaed gan David a Gwenda yn hynod ddefnyddiol.

Gwnaeth David bwynt da iawn hefyd ynglŷn

community leadership role that local government can undertake in a local arena. It can raise people's aspirations, it can look at what needs to be done, and use its ability at a local level to champion the improvements and changes that need to take place. I am not sure about an elected mayor. You will have to ask the good folk of Ceredigion about that, as they were the only people who took a vote on it, and they said 'no'. You are also right to say that if we are to improve standards, we must have the correct data. I hope that some of the efforts that we have made through the local government data unit and the performance framework will do that.

Ann made an important concluding point. We must acknowledge that a partnership approach is the only way forward, and the partnership council does work. It will never be perfect, Janet; every partnership has a little peccadillo now and again. Your extreme view of what went on is very interesting, and that is why we reject the amendment that says that the RAISE scheme was not raised, as it were, at either the Local Government and Public Services Committee or the partnership council meeting, which you attended. This report has gone through the committee and the partnership council, and there were no amendments. That reflects the maturity of the discussion that we now have around the partnership council, because its members are not playing games—they are trying to get the improvement that we all want to see.

I reject the other amendments. The local regeneration fund has an advisory forum that already serves that purpose. On the hoary old chestnut of the council tax, yes, council tax has gone up, but we have kept it a fairly low level during the last couple of years through the persuasion force on which I have been working with local government, but the money to local government has increased by 50 per cent, and we must acknowledge that there are increasing standards out there. If there are increasing standards, you will need to see extra spending. We should be pleased that we have increasing standards of performance, aspirations and expectations.

On the last point, about giving money to local

â rôl arweinyddiad cymunedol y gall llywodraeth leol ei chyflawni'n lleol. Gall godi dyheadau pobl, gall edrych ar yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud, a defnyddio ei gallu'n lleol i hyrwyddo'r gwelliannau a'r newidiadau y mae angen eu gweithredu. Nid wyf yn siŵr am faer etholedig. Bydd rhaid ichi holi trigolion Ceredigion ynglŷn â hynny, gan mai hwy'n unig sydd wedi pleidleisio ar hynny, a'u hateb oedd 'na'. Yr ydych yn gywir hefyd i ddweud bod yn rhaid inni gael y data cywir er mwyn gwella safonau. Gobeithio y bydd rhai o'n hymdrechion drwy'r uned data llywodraeth leol a'r fframwaith perfformiad yn gwneud hynny.

Gwnaeth Ann bwynt pwysig i gloi. Rhaid inni gydnabod mai dull partneriaeth yw'r unig ffordd ymlaen, a bod y cyngor partneriaeth yn gweithio. Ni fydd byth yn berffaith, Janet; mae pob partneriaeth yn cael trafferthion o bryd i'w gilydd. Mae eich barn eithafol am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ddiddorol iawn, a dyna pam yr ydym yn gwrthod y gwelliant sy'n dweud na chodwyd y cynllun Rhagori, fel petai, yn y Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus nac yng nghyfarfod y cyngor partneriaeth lle yr oeddech yn bresennol. Mae'r adroddiad hwn wedi ei drafod gan y pwyllgor a'r cyngor partneriaeth, ac nid oedd unrhyw ddiwygiadau. Mae hynny'n adlewyrchu aeddfedrwydd y drafodaeth sydd gennym bellach yn y cyngor partneriaeth, gan fod ei aelodau o ddifrif—maent yn ceisio sicrhau'r gwelliant yr ydym i gyd am ei weld.

Gwrthodaf y gwelliannau eraill. Mae gan y gronfa adfywio lleol fforwm cynghori sydd eisoes yn ateb y diben hwnnw. O ran y dreth gyngor, pwnc a drafodir dro ar ôl tro, ydyw, mae'r dreth gyngor wedi codi, ond yr ydym wedi ei chadw ar lefel gymharol isel yn ystod y ddwy flynedd diwethaf drwy ddwyn perswâd ar lywodraeth leol. Ond mae'r arian i lywodraeth leol wedi cynyddu 50 y cant, a rhaid inni gydnabod bod safonau'n codi. Os yw'r safonau'n codi, bydd angen gwario mwy. Dylem fod yn falch fod safonau perfformiad, dyheadau a disgwyliadau'n cynyddu.

O ran y pwynt olaf, ynglŷn â rhoi arian i

government when there are new commitments and responsibilities, I do not know where you have been. In 2003, I signed an agreement with Sir Harry Jones, the then leader of the Welsh Local Government Association, that we would not, as an Assembly Government, pass on new responsibilities without the appropriate finance. I asked WLGA officials at a public session a few months ago whether we had kept to that agreement. They could have said 'no' or 'yes', and they said 'yes'. We made that agreement and we have kept to it. That is because of our basic belief in partnership.

I am disappointed that we have had these amendments. If you wanted to make these points, I am surprised that you did not make them in committee or in the partnership council. I suggest that you are making them just because this is an arena in which you can play them out.

I thank all those who are involved in making this partnership work—and I do believe that it works. Like all good partnerships, it has to be worked at. There may be the occasional hiccup, but that does not matter because the strength of the partnership will carry it through. I hope that we will all support this report.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 10, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 1: For 10, Abstain 7, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Davies, Janet
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

lywodraeth leol pan fydd ymrwymiadau a chyfrifoldebau newydd, ni wn ble yr ydych wedi bod. Yn 2003, llofnodais gytundeb gyda Syr Harry Jones, arweinydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ar y pryd, na fyddem, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn trosglwyddo cyfrifoldebau newydd heb yr arian priodol. Gofynnais i swyddogion CLILC ychydig fisoedd yn ôl mewn sesiwn gyhoeddus a oeddem wedi cadw at y cytundeb hwnnw. Gallent fod wedi dweud 'naddo' neu 'do', a 'do' oedd eu hateb. Gwnaethom y cytundeb hwnnw a chadwyd ato. Mae hynny oherwydd ein cred sylfaenol mewn partneriaeth.

Yr wyf yn siomedig ein bod wedi cael y gwelliannau hyn. Os oeddech am gyflwyno'r pwyntiau hyn, yr wyf yn synnu na wnaethoch hynny yn y pwyllgor neu yn y cyngor partneriaeth. Awgrymaf eich yn eu cyflwyno dim ond am fod hon yn sefyllfa lle y mae gennych gynulleidfa.

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sy'n gysylltiedig â sicrhau bod y bartneriaeth hon yn gweithio—ac yr wyf yn credu ei bod yn gweithio. Fel pob partneriaeth dda, mae angen gweithio arni. Efallai y bydd mân broblemau, ond nid oes wahaniaeth am hynny oherwydd bydd cryfder y bartneriaeth yn ei chynnal. Gobeithio y bydd pawb yn cefnogi'r adroddiad hwn.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 10, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 2: For 10, Abstain 7, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Davies, Janet
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David

Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 3: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 18, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
Amendment 4: For 18, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3144): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3144): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

in accordance with Part II of Schedule 11 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 and the National Assembly's Standing Order No. 6.6, considers the local government partnership scheme annual report for 2005-06, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 21 June 2006.

yn unol â Rhan II Atodlen 11 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6 y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn ystyried adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun partneriaeth llywodraeth leol ar gyfer 2005-06, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 21 Mehefin 2006.

Cynnig (NDM3144): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM3144): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary

Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Adroddiad Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Bapurau Newydd
 yng Nghymru**
**The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on Newspapers
 in Wales**

Rosemary Butler: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

notes the report produced by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee entitled 'Review of English Language Newspapers in Wales' laid in the Table Office on Tuesday 20 June 2006.(NDM3145)

I thank the committee secretariat for their work in compiling this report and committee members for their enthusiastic deliberations on this topic. We are all indebted to those who came to give evidence to the committee.

Our original remit was to examine the role of the Trinity Mirror plc group in the media market in Wales but, in light of the initial evidence that we received, the committee extended the review to consider some other key issues, albeit briefly, in respect of the wider English-language newspaper industry in Wales. These key issues included the concept of a national newspaper for Wales, the impact of the growth of new technology—in particular, the internet—on advertising revenues, training for prospective journalists, and the placement of

Rosemary Butler: Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn nodi'r adroddiad a luniwyd gan y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon dan y teitl 'Adolygiad o Bapurau Newydd Saesneg yng Nghymru' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ddydd Mawrth 20 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3145)

Hoffwn ddiolch i ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor am eu gwaith yn llunio'r adroddiad hwn ac i aelodau'r pwyllgor am eu hystyriaethau brwdfrydig ar y pwnc hwn. Mae ein dyled yn fawr i'r rhai a ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor.

Ein cylch gwaith gwreiddiol oedd archwilio rôl grŵp Trinity Mirror plc ym marchnad y cyfryngau yng Nghymru. Ond o gofio'r dystiolaeth gychwynol a gafwyd, estynnodd y pwyllgor yr adolygiad i ystyried rhai materion allweddol eraill, er mai ystyriaeth gryno ydoedd, mewn perthynas â'r diwydiant papurau newydd Saesneg ehangach yng Nghymru. Yr oedd y materion allweddol hyn yn cynnwys y syniad o gael papur newydd cenedlaethol i Gymru, effaith twf technoleg newydd—y rhyngwyd yn benodol—ar refeniw hysbysebu, hyfforddiant ar gyfer

advertisements of job opportunities by the Assembly and the Welsh Assembly Government.

We held evidence sessions between January and May and heard from the key newspaper organisations producing newspapers in Wales: the Western Mail and Echo Ltd, Newsquest Media Group, South West Wales Publications Ltd and the north Wales newspapers. The National Union of Journalists and Amicus also gave evidence, as did the Cardiff School of Journalism. We invited the managing director of the Trinity Mirror Group Ltd and the editor of the *Daily Post* to the committee, but both declined on the basis that the representatives from the Western Mail and Echo could speak for the organisation as a whole.

4.20 p.m.

Our initial concern was about the prospect of compulsory redundancies in the Trinity Mirror group in Cardiff. There were fears that those redundancies could amount to 50 jobs, and were part of a pattern of wider redundancies occurring elsewhere in the group in the UK. In evidence to the committee, we were, fortunately, assured that for the immediate future compulsory redundancies in south Wales, at least, had been avoided. However, we record our regret that this was the second round of recent job losses in the Western Mail and Echo. I am delighted to read today that the Trinity Mirror group is to create up to 40 jobs in its finance division in Cardiff.

We also looked at the circumstances surrounding the closure of the Northcliffe Newspaper Group's printing presses in Swansea last October. We were told that this and the subsequent move to printing in Gloucester were based on the high level of investment that would have been needed to upgrade the Swansea presses. The committee was assured that the transfer of the printing of the *Swansea Evening Post* had not affected reporting deadlines. We understood the commercial need behind the decision to close the Swansea presses. However, the loss of skilled printing jobs in Wales and the transfer

darpar newyddiadurwyr, a gosod hysbysebion am gyfleoedd swyddi gan y Cynulliad a chan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Cynhaliwyd sesiynau tystiolaeth gennym rhwng mis Ionawr a mis Mai, a chlywyd gan y sefydliadau papur newydd allweddol sy'n cynhyrchu papurau newydd yng Nghymru: Western Mail and Echo Ltd, Newsquest Media Group, South West Wales Publications Ltd a North Wales Newspapers. Cafwyd tystiolaeth gan Undeb Cenedlaethol y Newyddiadurwyr ac Amicus, yn ogystal ag Ysgol Newyddiaduraeth Caerdydd. Gwahoddwyd cyfarwyddwr rheoli Trinity Mirror Group Ltd a golygydd y *Daily Post* i'r pwyllgor, ond gwrthodwyd y gwahoddiadau hynny ar y sail y gallai cynrychiolwyr y Western Mail and Echo siarad ar ran y sefydliad cyfan.

Ein pryder cychwynnol oedd y bygythiad o ddiswyddiadau gorfodol yng ngrŵp Trinity Mirror yng Nghaerdydd. Yr oedd ofnau y byddai cynifer â 50 o swyddi'n cael eu colli, a'u bod yn rhan o batrwm o ddiswyddiadau ehangach sy'n digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r grŵp yn y DU. Yn ffodus, cawsom ein sicrhau yn y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r pwyllgor fod diswyddiadau gorfodol wedi'u hosgoi yn y de, am y tro o leiaf. Fodd bynnag, cofnodwn ein siom mai hwn oedd yr ail dro i swyddi gael eu colli yn y Western Mail and Echo yn ddiweddar. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o ddarllen heddiw y bydd grŵp Trinity Mirror yn creu hyd at 40 o swyddi yn ei isadran cyllid yng Nghaerdydd.

Edrychwyd hefyd ar amgylchiadau cau gweisg argraffu Northcliffe Newspaper Group yn Abertawe fis Hydref diwethaf. Dywedwyd wrthym fod hyn a'r symudiad wedyn i argraffu yng Nghaerloyw yn seiliedig ar lefel uchel y buddsoddi a fyddai'n angenrheidiol i uwchraddio gweisg Abertawe. Sicrhawyd y pwyllgor nad oedd trosglwyddo'r gwaith o argraffu'r *Swansea Evening Post* wedi effeithio ar derfynau amser newyddiadurwyr. Yr oeddem yn deall yr angen masnachol y tu ôl i'r penderfyniad i gau gweisg Abertawe. Fodd bynnag, mae colli swyddi argraffu medrus yng Nghymru a

of the printing of local Welsh newspapers to England are causes of concern, and the committee found them regrettable.

Set against those losses is the commitment to Wales shown by all the newspaper groups. Both Trinity Mirror and Newsquest have made significant capital investment in Wales. We were told about the commitments to high standards of reporting, to employees, and of services to local advertisers and local communities. Examples of this investment included the substantial sums invested in state-of-the-art printing presses by Trinity Mirror and Newsquest; research into readers' needs which resulted in, for example, the introduction of the compact size *Western Mail* and an improved *South Wales Echo*, which was launched last month; the use of digital technology, including e-editions of the *Western Mail* and, shortly, the *South Wales Echo* and *South Wales Argus*; investment in the internet and the development of the website by newspapers; and investment in people, particularly in the training and development of staff.

One recurrent theme was an often unfavourable comparison with the press in Scotland. We had an interesting debate on the claim by Dr James Thomas from the Cardiff School of Journalism that the absence of a strong, agenda-setting set of newspapers in Wales is often contrasted with the situation in Scotland. In Scotland, 85 per cent of the newspapers produced there are consumed there. In Wales, the situation is the complete reverse, in that over 85 per cent of the daily morning newspapers consumed in Wales are produced in England.

It is apparently cheaper to transport English newspapers into Wales, but more cost-effective for English national titles to print Scottish editions in Scotland. We were told that of the six top-selling newspapers in Britain, only one—*The Daily Telegraph*—does not produce a Scottish edition. That led to some interesting debate, as you can imagine, about the practicalities of establishing a national newspaper in Wales. Some Members felt that that was a very attractive idea in terms of promoting national identity and an awareness of all-Wales issues

throsoglwyddo'r gwaith o argraffu papurau newydd lleol Cymru i Loegr yn destun pryder, ac mae'r pwyllgor yn gofidio am hyn.

Yr hyn sy'n gwrthbwysu'r colledion hyn yw'r ymrwymiad i Gymru a ddangoswyd gan y grwpiau papur newydd i gyd. Mae Trinity Mirror a Newsquest wedi buddsoddi cyfalaf sylweddol yng Nghymru. Dywedwyd wrthym am yr ymrwymadau i safonau uchel o ohebu, i weithwyr, ac am wasanaethau i hysbysebwr lleol a chymunedau lleol. Yr oedd yr enghreifftiau o'r buddsoddiad hwn yn cynnwys y symiau sylweddol a fuddsoddwyd mewn gweisg argraffu o'r radd flaenaf gan Trinity Mirror a Newsquest; ymchwil i anghenion darllenwyr a arweiniodd, er enghraifft, at gyflwyno *Western Mail* llai o faint a *South Wales Echo* gwell, a lanswyd fis diwethaf; defnyddio technoleg ddigidol, gan gynnwys e-rifynnau o'r *Western Mail* ac o'r *South Wales Echo* a *South Wales Argus* cyn hir; buddsoddi yn y rhyngwyd a datblygu'r wefan gan bapurau newydd; a buddsoddi mewn pobl, yn arbennig hyfforddiant a datblygiad staff.

Un thema a welwyd dro ar ôl tro oedd cymhariaeth anffafriol yn aml gyda'r wasg yn yr Alban. Cafwyd trafodaeth ddiddorol ar yr honiad gan Dr James Thomas o Ysgol Newyddiaduraeth Caerdydd fod diffyg cyfres gref o bapurau newydd sy'n mynd ati i ysgogi trafodaeth yng Nghymru yn aml yn cael ei gymharu â'r sefyllfa yn yr Alban. Yn yr Alban, caiff 85 y cant o'r papurau newydd a gynhyrchir yno eu darllen yno. Yng Nghymru, mae'r sefyllfa'n hollol wahanol, gan fod dros 85 y cant o'r papurau newydd boreol dyddiol a ddarllenir yng Nghymru yn cael eu cynhyrchu yn Lloegr.

Yn ôl pob sôn mae'n rhatach cludo papurau newydd o Loegr i Gymru, ond mae'n fwy cost effeithiol i bapurau cenedlaethol Lloegr argraffu rhifynnau ar gyfer yr Alban yn yr Alban. Dywedwyd wrthym mai un yn unig o'r chwe phapur newydd mwyaf poblogaidd ym Mhrydain—*The Daily Telegraph*—nad yw'n cynhyrchu rhifyn ar gyfer yr Alban. Arweiniodd hynny at drafodaeth ddiddorol iawn, fel y gallwch ddechmygu, ynghylch dichonoldeb sefydlu papur newydd cenedlaethol yng Nghymru. Teimlai rhai Aelodau fod hwnnw'n syniad deniadol iawn

and news. However, we heard strong evidence that an all-Wales national newspaper was highly unlikely to be commercially successful. Given the dependence on local advertisers, a newspaper with an all-Wales readership is unlikely to attract sufficient advertising revenue to be sustainable. Such an undertaking would need public funding to sustain it.

We noted that, despite the unfavourable comparisons with the situation in Scotland, there is not, in fact, a true Scottish national newspaper. Of its main newspapers, *The Scotsman* primarily covers Edinburgh and the east coast, *The Herald* covers Glasgow and the west coast, and *The Aberdeen Press and Journal*, the northern areas. On balance, the evidence is that an all-Wales newspaper is unlikely to be commercially successful.

In contrast, there was agreement on the importance of local press and local news. Dr James Thomas said:

‘I agree that the press in Wales is strongest at the local level. Local news is absolutely to the fore of people’s interests when they buy newspapers in Wales.’

Gerry Keighley of Newsquest Wales and Gloucestershire said:

‘Local news is absolutely key to local newspapers’.

Barry Jones from North Wales Newspapers underlined this by saying:

‘It is certainly in our commercial interest to be as local/parochial as we possibly can.’

The impact of the internet is contributing to a rapidly changing and often challenging business environment for the newspaper industry. Despite lower levels of internet access, this is just as much of a challenge in Wales as in the rest of the UK. The internet also poses a threat to traditional newspaper

o ran hyrwyddo hunaniaeth genedlaethol ac ymwybyddiaeth o faterion a newyddion sy’n berthnasol i Gymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, clywyd tystiolaeth gref ei bod yn annhebygol iawn y byddai papur newydd cenedlaethol i Gymru gyfan yn llwyddiant masnachol. O ystyried y ddibyniaeth ar hysbysebwr lleol, mae’n annhebygol y byddai papur newydd gyda darllenwyr o bob cwr o Gymru yn denu refeniw hysbysebu digonol i fod yn gynaliadwy. Byddai angen arian cyhoeddus i gynnal menter o’r fath.

Sylwyd, er gwaethaf y cymariaethau anffafriol â’r sefyllfa yn yr Alban, nad oes papur newydd cenedlaethol go iawn yn yr Alban mewn gwirionedd. O’r prif bapurau newydd yno, mae *The Scotsman* yn cwmpasu Caeredin ac arford y dwyrain yn bennaf, mae *The Herald* yn cwmpasu Glasgow ac arfordir y gorllewin, ac mae *The Aberdeen Press and Journal* yn cwmpasu ardaloedd y gogledd. I grynhoi, awgryma’r dystiolaeth ei bod yn annhebygol y byddai papur newydd i Gymru gyfan yn llwyddo’n fasnachol.

I’r gwrthwyneb, cafwyd cytundeb ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd gwasg leol a newyddion lleol. Dywedodd Dr James Thomas:

Yr wyf yn cytuno mai ar y lefel leol y mae’r wasg yng Nghymru ar ei chryfaf. Newyddion lleol sydd bwysicaf o bell ffordd i bobl pan fyddant yn prynu papurau newydd yng Nghymru.

Dywedodd Gerry Keighley o Newsquest Wales and Gloucestershire:

Mae newyddion lleol yn hollol allweddol i bapurau newydd lleol.

Ategwyd hyn gan Barry Jones o North Wales Newspapers pan ddywedodd:

Mae’n sicr o fudd masnachol inni fod mor lleol/plwyfol ag y gallwn.

Mae effaith y rhyngwrwd yn cyfrannu at amgylchedd busnes sy’n newid yn gyflym, ac sy’n aml yn heriol i’r diwydiant papurau newydd. Er bod llai o ddefnyddio’r rhyngwrwd, mae hyn yn gymaint o her yng Nghymru ag yng ngweddill y DU. Mae’r rhyngwrwd hefyd yn fygythiad i refeniw

advertising revenues, particularly recruitment advertising. The increasing and easy availability of instant news through 24-hour news channels, internet news sites and texting is challenging for all newspapers, and they are now concentrating on providing commentary and discussion on issues rather than just trying to report breaking news.

Journalism is a popular career choice for young people, and newspaper companies are inundated by requests for work experience and trainee opportunities. The newspapers stress that they provide support for trainee journalists to progress along a structured career path. This support includes in-house schemes, postgraduate training, and structured apprenticeships that lead to recognised qualifications. Barry Jones from North Wales Newspapers told us that:

‘The training of journalists has, in fact, never been better.’

Despite this, we felt that more could be done by the Government to ensure strong career paths for young journalists. We therefore recommend that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills review the provision of training courses for journalists in both further and higher education.

The National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government regularly advertise job vacancies in a small number of newspapers. We understand that the current policy on recruitment and advertising is that:

‘more senior positions or those that have proved more difficult to fill are advertised in the press, normally the *Western Mail*, *The Daily Post* and *Golwg*. Occasionally, national newspapers or specialist publications are used for positions requiring particular skills. All positions are advertised with www.Welshjobs.com.’

We recommend that the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government should consider a wider range of

hysbysebu papurau newydd traddodiadol, yn enwedig hysbysebion recriwtio. Mae'r ffaith fod newyddion ar y pryd ar gael yn gynyddol ac yn hwylus drwy sianeli newyddion 24 awr, safleoedd newyddion ar y rhyngwrdd a negeseuon testun yn heriol i bob papur newydd, ac maent bellach yn canolbwyntio ar gyflwyno sylwebaeth a thrafodaeth ar faterion yn hytrach na dim ond ceisio cyfleu newyddion sy'n digwydd.

Mae newyddiaduraeth yn ddewis poblogaidd o yrfa i bobl ifanc, a bydd cwmnïau papurau newydd yn cael niferoedd di-rif o geisiadau am brofiad gwaith a chyfleoedd hyfforddi. Mae'r papurau newydd yn dweud eu bod yn rhoi cymorth i newyddiadurwyr dan hyfforddiant ddatblygu ar hyd llwybr gyrfa strwythuredig. Mae'r cymorth hwn yn cynnwys cynlluniau mewnol, hyfforddiant i raddedigion, a phrentisiaethau strwythuredig sy'n arwain at gymwysterau cydnabyddedig. Dywedodd Barry Jones o North Wales Newspapers:

Ni fu'r sefyllfa o ran hyfforddi newyddiadurwyr erioed crystal.

Er gwaethaf hyn, yr oeddem yn teimlo y gallai'r Llywodraeth wneud mwy i sicrhau llwybrau gyrfa cadarn i newyddiadurwyr ifanc. Felly, argymhellwn y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau adolygu'r ddarpariaeth o gyrfa hyfforddiant addysg bellach ac addysg uwch ar gyfer newyddiadurwyr.

Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn hysbysebu swyddi gwag yn rheolaidd mewn nifer fach o bapurau newydd. Deallwn mai'r polisi presennol ar recriwtio a hysbysebu yw bod:

swyddi uwch neu rai sydd wedi bod yn fwy anodd eu llenwi yn cael eu hysbysebu yn y wasg, yn y *Western Mail*, *The Daily Post* a *Golwg* fel rheol. Weithiau, defnyddir papurau newydd cenedlaethol neu gyhoeddiadau arbenigol ar gyfer swyddi sy'n gofyn am sgiliau penodol. Hysbysebir pob swydd yn www.Welshjobs.com.

Argymhellwn y dylai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ystyried amrywiaeth ehangach o bapurau

newspapers in Wales when making decisions on where to place their recruitment advertisements.

Finally, we looked at the coverage of the Assembly in the press. Many of the newspapers now subscribe to the Press Association for coverage of National Assembly for Wales business, rather than having journalists based here at the Senedd. Market research undertaken by the Western Mail and Echo revealed that readers are most interested in how the business of the National Assembly for Wales affects them directly—for example, decisions on schools, the health service, and the economy—rather than in verbatim reports of the National Assembly's Plenary or committee meetings. There was some discussion about the seemingly low level of public awareness in north Wales about the National Assembly and the role that newspapers can play in promoting National Assembly issues and business. As you would expect, the unanimous answer from the presenters was that the answer lies in our hands as Assembly Members, and that we need to provide exciting and interesting news that is worthy of reporting.

We are making just two recommendations. The first relates to training of journalists, and the other relates to the placement of Government and Assembly advertisements of vacancies. I hope that Members accept this report. The members of the committee found it a very interesting report in which to take part.

David Lloyd: Hoffwn ddechrau, fel rhywun nad yw'n aelod o'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, drwy longyfarch y pwyllgor ar yr adroddiad hwn, a Rosemary Butler am ei chyflwyniad. Un ffaith drawiadol yn yr adroddiad yw bod mwyafrif pobl Cymru yn darllen papur dyddiol nad yw wedi ei gynhyrchu yma yng Nghymru. Dim ond rhyw 15 y cant o bobl Cymru sy'n darllen papurau fel y *Western Mail* a'r *Daily Post*. Mae dros 85 y cant o bobl Cymru yn darllen prif bapurau rhyngwladol Lloegr megis *The Sun*, *Daily Mirror*, *The Guardian*, *The Times* ac yn y blaen, sy'n cael eu cynhyrchu yn Lloegr. Credaf fod angen

newydd yng Nghymru wrth wneud penderfyniadau ble i osod eu hysbysebion recriwtio.

Yn olaf, edrychwyd ar y sylw a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad yn y wasg. Mae nifer o'r papurau newydd bellach yn tanysgrifio i Gymdeithas y Wasg er mwyn cael gwybodaeth am fusnes Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn hytrach na lleoli newyddiadurwyr yma yn y Senedd. Datgelodd ymchwil y farchnad a wnaed gan y Western Mail and Echo mai'r ffordd y mae busnes Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn effeithio arnynt yn uniongyrchol sy'n ennyn diddordeb darllenwyr fwyaf—er enghraifft, penderfyniadau am ysgolion, y gwasanaeth iechyd, a'r economi—yn hytrach nag adroddiadau air am air o Gyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol neu gyfarfodydd pwyllgor. Cafwyd ychydig drafodaeth ar lefel isel ymwybyddiaeth y cyhoedd yn y gogledd, mae'n ymddangos, am y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a'r rôl y gall papurau newydd ei chwarae wrth hyrwyddo materion a busnes y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl, yr ateb unfrydol a gafwyd gan y cyflwynwyr oedd mai yn ein dwylo ni, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, y mae'r ateb i hynny a bod angen inni ddarparu newyddion cyffrous a diddorol sy'n werth eu hadrodd.

Yr ydym yn gwneud dau argymhelliad yn unig. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â hyfforddi newyddiadurwyr, ac mae'r llall yn ymwneud â gosod hysbysebion am swyddi gwag gan y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad. Gobeithio y bydd yr Aelodau'n derbyn yr adroddiad hwn. Yr oedd yn adroddiad diddorol iawn i aelodau'r pwyllgor fod yn rhan ohono.

David Lloyd: I should like to begin, as someone who is not a member of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee, by congratulating the committee on this report, and Rosemary Butler for her presentation. One staggering fact in this report is that the majority of people in Wales read a daily paper which is not produced here in Wales. Only around 15 per cent of Welsh people read papers such as the *Western Mail* and the *Daily Post*. Over 85 per cent of people in Wales read England's main international papers such as *The Sun*, *Daily Mirror*, *The Guardian*, *The Times* and so on, which are produced in England. I believe there is a need

cryfhau gwerthiant cenedlaethol yng Nghymru o'r papurau newydd sydd o leiaf yn ceisio adlewyrchu bywyd yng Nghymru. Mae hefyd angen olrhain sefyllfa'r Alban, ac fe gyfeiriodd Rosemary Butler at hwn eisoes. Credaf fod sefyllfa'r Alban yn llawer mwy iachus; mae dros 85 y cant o bapurau dyddiol yr Alban yn cael eu cynhyrchu a'u gwerthu yn yr Alban, gan adlewyrchu agenda a dyheadau pobl yr Alban mewn ffordd nad yw'r papurau dyddiol sy'n cael eu darllen yng Nghymru yn ei wneud, o bell ffordd; yn bendant, nid ydynt yn adlewyrchu ein dyheadau ni fel Cymry.

4.30 p.m.

Fel y crybwyllir yn yr adroddiad hwn, mae papurau rhanbarthol cryf yng Nghymru. Yn naturiol, fel un sy'n byw yn Abertawe, soniaf am y *South Wales Evening Post*, sydd â'r gwerthiant mwyaf ymhlith papurau dyddiol Cymru. Serch hynny, gresyn gorfod nodi colli swyddi argraffu yn Abertawe y llynedd. Deallaf y rhesymau masnachol am hynny, ond, o gofio'r hanes—bod papurau dyddiol wedi bod yn cael eu hargraffu yn Abertawe ers dros ddwy ganrif—yr wyf yn dal i resynu colli'r swyddi argraffu hynny. Wedi dwy ganrif o argraffu papurau newydd yn Abertawe nid yw hynny'n digwydd mwyach. Argreffir y *South Wales Evening Post* yn Nghaerloyw.

Ni chytunaf ag unrhyw osodiad sy'n dweud bod hon yn sefyllfa ddelfrydol; nid yw'n ddelfrydol o bell ffordd. Mae datganoli wedi digwydd, ac mae'r agenda'n wahanol yma yng Nghymru o'i chymharu â Lloegr. Dylai'r argraffu a'r cynhyrchu, o safbwynt ein papurau dyddiol, adlewyrchu'r ffaith syml honno.

Gyda dyfodiad y Cynulliad, mae angen gwell gwybodaeth am ei benderfyniadau, boed yn ddiddorol neu beidio. Mae rhai ohonom hefyd yn gwrando ar drafodaethau San Steffan ac nid yw'r trafodaethau hynny'n ddiddorol, o bell ffordd, ond cewch fanylion di-ri amdanynt yn *The Guardian* a *The Times*. Ni dderbyniaf y feirniadaeth nad yw eitemau nad ydynt yn ddiddorol yn haeddu sylw mewn papurau newydd.

Mae pobl Cymru yn credu fod pob

to improve the circulation in Wales of those newspapers that at least attempt to reflect life in Wales. We need to duplicate the situation in Scotland, and Rosemary Butler referred to this earlier. I believe the situation in Scotland is far healthier; over 85 per cent of daily newspapers in Scotland are produced and sold in Scotland, reflecting the agenda and aspirations of the Scots in a way that the newspapers read in Wales do not do by far; they certainly do not reflect our aspirations as Welsh people.

As mentioned in this report, there are strong regional newspapers in Wales. Naturally, as one who lives in Swansea, I will mention the *South Wales Evening Post*, which has the highest circulation of Wales's daily newspapers. However, it is regrettable that printing jobs were lost in Swansea last year. I understand the commercial reasons for that, but given the history—daily newspapers have been printed in Swansea for over two centuries—I still regret the loss of those printing jobs. After two centuries of printing newspapers, there are now no printing presses in Swansea. The *South Wales Evening Post* is printed in Gloucester.

I do not agree with any statement which says that this is an ideal situation; it is far from ideal. Devolution has taken place, and the agenda here in Wales is different from that in England. The printing and producing of our daily newspapers should reflect that simple fact.

With the establishment of the Assembly, better information is needed about the decisions that it makes, whether they are interesting or not. Some of us also listen to debates in Westminster, and those debates are far from being interesting, but they are carried in great detail in *The Guardian* and *The Times*. I do not accept the criticism that, because something is not interesting, it should not be carried in newspapers.

The people of Wales believe that all

cyhoeddiad a wneir yn Llundain yn ddilys i Gymru hefyd, gan mai o'r fan honno y daw'r mwyafrif o'u papurau dyddiol. Mae cyfrifoldebau ym meysydd iechyd ac addysg, er enghraifft, wedi'u datganoli yma, felly nid yw penderfyniadau a gyhoeddir yn Llundain, o reidrwydd, yn ddilys yng Nghymru. Ond, mae'n anodd darbwyllo pobl o hynny os mai o bapurau a gynhyrchir yn Lloegr yn unig y maent yn derbyn eu gwybodaeth.

Mae angen sylwebyddion papurau newydd yn y Cynulliad; credaf mai'r *Daily Post* yw'r unig bapur â gohebydd yma ar hyn o bryd. Mae angen fersiynau Cymreig o brif bapurau newydd Lloegr i adlewyrchu bywyd newydd datganoledig Cymru. Ni chredaf ein bod yn gofyn gormod i *The Guardian* neu *The Times* sôn weithiau am Gymru mewn ffordd rhagweithiol a chadarnhaol. Yn sgîl realiti datganoli i Gymru, mae gwir angen hybu gwasanaeth papur dyddiol hyfyw, bywiog a pherthnasol i bobl Cymru.

Leighton Andrews: I was a member of the committee at the time that it decided to have this inquiry but not by the time that the inquiry developed, although I did attend one meeting. I declare an interest in that the Cardiff School of Journalism, Media and Cultural Studies gave evidence, and I am an honorary professor in that school. I am also a member of the National Union of Journalists and of Amicus, which also gave evidence to the inquiry.

I welcome the report, but I state at the outset that I think that the driver, originally, for the inquiry into newspapers in Wales was the position being taken by the Trinity Mirror Group at the end of last year, when it announced a number of redundancies at the Western Mail and Echo Group and plans to merge the editorship of the *Rhondda Leader* and the *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*. I am pleased that, following pressure from people within the Assembly and outside, it rescinded the decision to merge the editorships of the *Rhondda Leader* and the *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*. Ultimately, it moved away from compulsory redundancies to voluntary redundancies.

However, in the course of this report, the

announcements made in London are relevant to Wales, because most daily newspapers emanate from London. The responsibility for health and education matters, for example, has been devolved here, so decisions announced in London are not necessarily relevant to Wales. However, it is difficult to convince people of that if they receive all their information through newspapers produced in England.

We need newspaper journalists in the Assembly; I think the *Daily Post* is the only newspaper which has a journalist based here. We need Welsh editions of the main English newspapers to reflect the new post-devolution reality in Wales. I do not think we are asking too much of *The Guardian* or *The Times* to refer to Wales in a proactive and positive way. Since devolution to Wales is a reality, we need to have a viable, vibrant and relevant daily newspaper service for the people of Wales.

Leighton Andrews: Yr oeddwn i'n aelod o'r pwyllgor pan benderfynodd gynnal yr ymchwiliad hwn, ond nid erbyn i'r ymchwiliad ddatblygu, er imi fod mewn un cyfarfod. Datganaf fuddiant oherwydd bod Ysgol Newyddiaduraeth, Cyfryngau ac Astudiaethau Diwylliannol Caerdydd wedi rhoi tystiolaeth a minnau'n athro anrhydeddus yn yr ysgol honno. Yr wyf hefyd yn aelod o Undeb Cenedlaethol y Newyddiadurwyr ac o Amicus, a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r ymchwiliad hefyd.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad, ond dywedaf o'r cychwyn mai'r hyn a ysgogodd yr ymchwiliad i bapurau newydd yng Nghymru yn wreiddiol, yn fy marn i, oedd safbwynt Trinity Mirror Group ar ddiwedd y llynedd, pan gyhoeddodd nifer o ddiswyddiadau yn y Western Mail and Echo Group a chynlluniau i uno golygyddiaeth *Rhondda Leader* a'r *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*. Yr wyf yn falch, yn dilyn pwysau gan bobl yn y Cynulliad a'r tu allan, ei fod wedi diddymu'r penderfyniad i uno golygyddiaeth *Rhondda Leader* a'r *Pontypridd and Llantrisant Observer*. Yn y pen draw, cynigiodd ddiswyddiadau gwirfoddol yn lle diswyddiadau gorfodol.

Fodd bynnag, yn ystod yr adroddiad hwn

scope has been somewhat widened. It seems that the report that we have today is rather more of a management view of the newspaper industry in Wales than a view that might be taken by journalists or the public.

We welcome investment in printing presses, and the transfer of finance jobs within a newspaper group to Cardiff from elsewhere, but the reality is that there has been a squeeze on journalism and on journalistic jobs in Wales, and we should set down a marker on that. I agree with what Dai Lloyd has just said on the reporting of the National Assembly, and the fact that only one newspaper in Wales, which sees itself as covering Wales on a national basis, has a full-time journalist in the National Assembly.

Therefore, it is worth stating that there are increasing and continuing pressures on journalism in Wales, in those newspapers that see themselves as national newspapers, as well as in local newspapers. A higher degree of advertising is being demanded of local newspapers, for example, compared with the pagination for news reports. You will be told that repeatedly by those engaged in the local media in Wales.

I will focus my remarks on the Trinity Mirror Group, because, whichever way you look at it, in terms of the coverage of Welsh news on a national basis, it has something of a dominant position in the sector. I want to see a competitive news environment in Wales—competition for the BBC and ITV, as well as for Trinity Mirror. I have noticed over the last few months how close the Trinity Mirror Group is becoming to the Conservative Party, for example. I notice that someone called Professor Dylan Jones-Evans has a column in the *Western Mail* and in the *Daily Post*. I notice that the Assembly Member and Member of Parliament for Monmouth now subjects us to a weekly column in the *Wales on Sunday*—I refer of course to Taser Davies.

Alun Cairns: Do you also recall the column that the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks used to have, and the column

ehangwyd y cwmpas i raddau. Ymddengys fod yr adroddiad sydd gennym heddiw yn adlewyrchu safbwynt rheolwyr am y diwydiant papurau newydd yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na safbwynt posibl gan newyddiadurwyr neu'r cyhoedd.

Croesawn fuddsoddiad yn y gweisg argraffu, a'r broses o drosglwyddo swyddi cyllid o fewn grŵp papurau newydd i Gaerdydd o rywle arall, ond y realiti yw bod pwysau wedi bod ar newyddiaduraeth ac ar swyddi newyddiadurool yng Nghymru, a dylem nodi hynny. Cytunaf â'r hyn y mae Dai Lloyd newydd ei ddweud am ohebu ar y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a'r ffaith mai un papur newydd yn unig yng Nghymru, sy'n ystyried ei fod yn cwmpasu Cymru gyfan, sydd â newyddiadurwr llawn amser yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Felly, mae'n werth dweud bod pwysau cynyddol a pharhaus ar newyddiaduraeth yng Nghymru, yn y papurau newydd hynny sy'n ystyried eu hunain yn bapurau cenedlaethol, yn ogystal ag mewn papurau newydd lleol. Mae papurau newydd lleol yn gorfod defnyddio mwy o hysbysebu, er enghraifft, o'u cymharu â'r tudalennu ar gyfer adroddiadau newyddion. Bydd y rheini sy'n gysylltiedig â'r cyfryngau lleol yng Nghymru yn dweud hynny wrthy ch dro ar ôl tro.

Canolbwyntiaf ar Trinity Mirror Group, oherwydd pa bynnag ffordd yr edrychych arno, o ran ymdrin â newyddion Cymru yn genedlaethol mae ei statws yn y sector yn uchel. Yr wyf am weld amgylchedd newyddion cystadleuol yng Nghymru—cystadleuaeth i'r BBC ac ITV, yn ogystal ag i Trinity Mirror. Sylwais dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf ar y berthynas agos sy'n datblygu rhwng Trinity Mirror Group a'r Blaid Geidwadol, er enghraifft. Sylwaf fod gan rywun o'r enw'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans golofn yn y *Western Mail* ac yn y *Daily Post*. Sylwaf fod gan Aelod y Cynulliad a'r Aelod Seneddol dros sir Fynwy golofn wythnosol bellach yn y *Wales on Sunday*—cyfeiriaf wrth gwrs at Taser Davies.

Alun Cairns: A gofiwch hefyd golofn y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, a cholofn Alun Pugh, fel y

that Alun Pugh, as the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, used to have until he put his foot in it as far as the editor was concerned?

Leighton Andrews: An act of censorship was perpetrated on the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport.

There are plenty of economics professors who are not politically aligned in Wales, and there are plenty aligned to other parties, who also have interesting things to say about the economy; one or two of them have even run businesses, unlike Professor Dylan Jones-Evans, to whom I referred earlier.

As we go forward, I would like to see a critical engagement with the media by the National Assembly. That is important for the health of our democracy. It is important that we, in the National Assembly, keep an eye on, not journalistic content, but the employment of journalists, and the environment in which they are allowed to write and report. We want to see a healthy public culture, in which journalism can flourish.

Mark Isherwood: Current economic conditions have been more challenging than usual for newspapers in Wales, as the report notes. A newspaper editor recently told me that this is reflected in a fall in the demand for advertising space, which is hitting newspaper revenues. As this report states, the main reason is the current slowdown in consumer spending, and its effect on traditional advertising. Redundancies and restructuring in the industry must therefore be considered in this wider economic context.

The importance of the newspaper industry in Wales reporting on news in Wales cannot be overemphasised. This report details the challenge faced by journalists when reporting the National Assembly's business fairly and effectively, in a way that is interesting and relevant to their readers. We should not be surprised when market research confirms that newspaper readers are most interested in how National Assembly business affects them

Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, nes iddo roi ei droed ynnddi gyda'r golygydd?

Leighton Andrews: Cyflawnwyd achos o sensoriaeth ar y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon.

Mae digon o athrawon economeg yng Nghymru nad oes ganddynt gysylltiadau gwleidyddol, ac mae digon sy'n gysylltiedig â phleidiau eraill ac sydd hefyd â phethau diddorol i'w dweud am yr economi; mae un neu ddau ohonynt hyd yn oed wedi rhedeg busnesau, yn wahanol i'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans, y cyfeiriais ato'n gynharach.

Wrth inni fynd yn ein blaen, hoffwn weld y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ymgysylltu o ddifrif â'r cyfryngau. Mae hynny'n bwysig i iechyd ein democratiaeth. Mae'n bwysig i ni, yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gadw llygad nid yn unig ar gynnwys newyddiadurrol ond ar gyflogi newyddiadurwyr, a'r amgylchedd y caniateir iddynt ysgrifennu a chyflwyno adroddiadau o'i fewn. Yr ydym am weld diwylliant cyhoeddus iach, lle y gall newyddiaduraeth ffynnu.

Mark Isherwood: Mae'r amodau economaidd cyfredol wedi bod yn fwy heriol na'r arfer i bapurau newydd yng Nghymru, fel y dywedd yr adroddiad. Dywedodd golygydd papur newydd wrthyf yn ddiweddar fod hyn yn cael ei adlewyrchu mewn gostyngiad yn y galw am le hysbysebu, sy'n effeithio ar refeniw papurau newydd. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad hwn, y prif reswm yw'r gostyngiad presennol yng ngwariant defnyddwyr, a'i effaith ar hysbysebu traddodiadol. Dylid ystyried diswyddiadau a'r ailstrwythuro yn y diwydiant felly o fewn y cyd-destun economaidd ehangach hwn.

Ni ellir gorbwysleisio pwysigrwydd y diwydiant papurau newydd yng Nghymru wrth gyflwyno adroddiadau am newyddion yng Nghymru. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn manylu ar yr her a wynebier gan newyddiadurwyr wrth gyflwyno adroddiadau teg ac effeithiol ar fusnes y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, mewn ffordd sy'n ddiddorol ac yn berthnasol i'w darllenwyr. Ni ddylem synnu bod ymchwil i'r farchnad yn

directly, rather than in verbatim reports of National Assembly Plenary or committee meetings. However, UK newspapers reporting on business from the Houses of Parliament have long recognised this. This has not prevented them from reporting news from the Houses of Parliament, but has rather dictated the reader-friendly format in which that news is reported.

4.40 p.m.

Too many people in Wales receive little or no information about Assembly decisions that directly affect them, their families and their communities, and, on too many occasions, we still see decisions taken in Westminster that do not apply in Wales being reported as if devolution had not happened.

This report highlights the low level of detailed public awareness about the National Assembly in north Wales. We must urge newspapers there to take an active role in promoting awareness of National Assembly business as it affects the daily lives of their readers. Perhaps they could start by stamping out the practice, too commonly seen, of referring to the Welsh Assembly Government as the National Assembly for Wales. Public understanding will never be achieved if readers are not even allowed to understand the difference between the Government and the Assembly.

The report is right to recognise that newspapers campaign on behalf of many local issues and that the work of prominent local constituency and regional Members is also often reported. However, direct reporting of Assembly business, in informative, reader-friendly format is also vital if the people of Wales are to become engaged in this institution and if the Assembly Government is to be held democratically accountable. In order to drive this, National Assembly advertising expenditure must be targeted more fairly so that it may better reflect actual

cadarnhau bod gan ddarllenwyr papurau newydd fwy o ddi-ddordeb yn y modd y mae busnes y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn effeithio arnynt hwy'n uniongyrchol, yn hytrach nag mewn adroddiadau gair am air o Gyfarfodydd Llawn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol neu gyfarfodydd pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae papurau newydd y DU sy'n adroddi am fusnes y Senedd wedi cydnabod hyn ers cryn amser. Nid yw hyn wedi eu hatal rhag adrodd o'r Senedd, ond yn hytrach mae wedi ysgogi fformat o gyflwyno newyddion sy'n hawdd i ddarllenwyr ei ddeall.

Mae gormod o bobl yng Nghymru yn cael gwybodaeth brin iawn, os o gwbl, am benderfyniadau'r Cynulliad sy'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol arnynt hwy, eu teuluoedd a'u cymunedau, ac yn rhy aml gwelwn benderfyniadau sy'n cael eu gwneud o hyd yn San Steffan ac nad ydynt yn berthnasol i Gymru yn cael eu hadrodd fel pe bai datganoli heb ddigwydd o gwbl.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn tynnu sylw at lefel isel yr ymwybyddiaeth fanwl o'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ymhlith y cyhoedd yn y gogledd. Rhaid inni annog papurau newydd yno i fynd ati i hybu ymwybyddiaeth o fusnes y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fel y mae'n effeithio ar fywyd bob dydd eu darllenwyr. Hwyrach y gallent ddechrau drwy roi terfyn ar yr arfer, a welir yn rhy aml, o gyfeirio at Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Ni fydd byth yn bosibl sicrhau dealltwriaeth ymhlith y cyhoedd os na chaniateir i ddarllenwyr hyd yn oed ddeall y gwahaniaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad.

Mae'r adroddiad yn iawn i gydnabod bod papurau newydd yn ymgychu ar ran nifer o faterion lleol ac y cyflwynir adroddiadau yn aml ar waith Aelodau etholaethau lleol a rhanbarthol amlwg. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn hanfodol bwysig cyflwyno adroddiadau uniongyrchol ar fusnes y Cynulliad mewn fformat sy'n cyfleu gwybodaeth ac sy'n hawdd i ddarllenwyr ei ddeall, er mwyn sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn ymgysylltu â'r sefydliad hwn ac er mwyn sicrhau bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn atebol yn ddemocrataidd. I ysgogi hyn, rhaid targedu

readership. For example, each week, an estimated 480,000 adults in mid and north Wales read a North Wales Newspapers Group newspaper. However, its main competitor in north Wales receives more than three times this level of Assembly advertising expenditure.

Equally, the importance of reaching target audiences has been emphasised by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. It is vital that we also advertise in the media that is most likely to be read by representative groups. Positive action in that context is not positive discrimination, but rather the promotion of equal access and inclusion for all.

Newspapers have a central role in the democratic process, informing, challenging and reinforcing the views of readers. Let the Assembly do all that it can do to help them achieve this.

John Griffiths: I will speak about one part of the report, namely paragraph 2.7, which Rosemary mentioned in her introduction, regarding the placing of advertisements by the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government in just a small number of newspapers, which was the evidence that was given to the committee. There was a suggestion in the report that a wider range of newspapers be considered. There is also the recommendation that the National Assembly for Wales reviews its job advertisements in that context. I very much agree with that recommendation.

It is also important to look at it a little more widely in terms of other advertisements that the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government place, such as the various notices that we place in newspapers. In addition to advertising the availability of positions, whether they are remunerated or not these advertisements are very informative. Those positions could be with boards, or advertisements for our partner organisations, such as local health boards, local trusts, Assembly sponsored public bodies, non-governmental organisations and

gwariant hysbysebu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn decach er mwyn iddo adlewyrchu'r darllenwyr yn well. Er enghraifft, bob wythnos amcangyfrifir bod 480,000 o oedolion yn y canolbarth a'r gogledd yn darllen un o bapurau newydd North Wales Newspapers Group. Fodd bynnag, mae ei brif gystadleuydd yn y gogledd yn cael dros dair gwaith y lefel honno o wariant hysbysebu gan y Cynulliad.

Yn yr un modd, pwysleisiwyd pwysigrwydd cyraedd cynulleidfaoedd targed gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Mae'n hanfodol inni hefyd hysbysebu yn y cyfrwng sydd fwyaf tebygol o gael ei ddarllen gan grwpiau cynrychioli. Nid gwahaniaethu cadarnhaol yw gweithredu cadarnhaol yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, ond hybu mynediad cyfartal a chynhwysiant i bawb.

Mae gan bapurau newydd rôl ganolog yn y broses ddemocrataidd, wrth lywio, herio ac atgyfnerthu safbwyntiau darllenwyr. Gadewch i'r Cynulliad wneud popeth a all i'w helpu i gyflawni hyn.

John Griffiths: Siaradaf am un rhan o'r adroddiad, sef paragraff 2.7, a grybwyllwyd gan Rosemary yn ei chyflwyniad, gan nodi mai mewn nifer fach yn unig o bapurau newydd yr oedd Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gosod hysbysebion, sef y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor. Cafwyd awgrym yn yr adroddiad y dylid ystyried ystod ehangach o bapurau newydd. Ceir yr argymhelliad hefyd y dylai Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru adolygu ei hysbysebion swyddi yn y cyd-destun hwnnw. Cytunaf yn gryf iawn â'r argymhelliad hwnnw.

Mae'n bwysig hefyd inni ehangu'r ystyriaeth hon rywfaint i gynnwys yr hysbysebion eraill y mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu gosod, fel yr amrywiol hysbysiadau a osodwn mewn papurau newydd. Yn ogystal â hysbysebu swyddi gwag, boed yn waith â thâl neu beidio, mae'r hysbysebion hyn yn cynnwys llawer o wybodaeth. Gallai'r swyddi hyn fod ar fyrddau, neu'n hysbysebion ar gyfer ein sefydliadau partner, fel byrddau iechyd lleol, ymddiriedolaethau lleol, cyrff cyhoeddus a noddur gan y Cynulliad, sefydliadau

so on. In general, it is desirable that, in terms of the influence and the role of the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government, we look at getting these advertisements placed in a wider variety of newspapers.

We all know, as has already been mentioned by a number of contributors to this debate, that people get their news from a wide variety of sources, particularly local, regional newspapers. People obviously have a very keen sense of wanting local news, and they think that that is best provided by their local newspapers. In that context, if we want to reach a wider variety of people, and a better cross-section in terms of social class, for example, it is very important that these advertisements and notices are placed in more newspapers than is currently the case. That is very important in terms of our engagement with the Welsh people. They need to understand the positions that are available. Information is provided about salary and remuneration, but more widely, it details the roles and responsibilities that are involved. This is an important part of people's understanding of the way in which the Assembly and these organisations operate.

Leighton Andrews: You make an important point there. Are you aware that, a couple of years ago, when I conducted some research, I found that only four people from Communities First wards were on the boards of quangos? Advertising is a part of that. Thankfully, we have done away with a lot of those quango boards, but the principle is still the same, in terms of people's access to that information.

John Griffiths: That must be right, and it is an important part of this debate, which we should recognise, and, hopefully, act upon. It is something that is absolutely central to our social justice agenda.

I will conclude by saying that I believe that this aspect of the report is an important part of our new democracy in Wales, and the sort of engagement that we are trying to build with the people of Wales. We need to act on this recommendation in the report if we are to

anllwywodraethol ac ati. Yn gyffredinol mae'n ddymunol, o ran dylanwad a rôl Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, inni geisio gosod yr hysbysebion hyn mewn amrywiaeth ehangach o bapurau newydd.

Gwyddom i gyd, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes gan nifer o gyfranwyr i'r ddadl hon, fod pobl yn cael eu newyddion o amrywiaeth eang o ffynonellau, yn enwedig papurau newydd lleol a rhanbarthol. Mae'n amlwg fod pobl yn awyddus iawn i gael newyddion lleol, a chredant mai eu papurau newydd lleol sy'n darparu hynny orau. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, os ydym am gyrraedd amrywiaeth ehangach o bobl, a thrawstoriad gwell o ran dosbarth cymdeithasol, er enghraifft, mae'n bwysig iawn i'r hysbysebion a'r hysbysiadau hyn gael eu gosod mewn mwy o bapurau newydd nag a wneir ar hyn o bryd. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn wrth inni ymgysylltu â phobl Cymru. Mae angen iddynt ddeall y swyddi sydd ar gael. Rhoddir gwybodaeth am gyflog a thâl, ond yn fwy cyffredinol rhoddir manylion am y rolau a'r cyfrifoldebau cysylltiedig. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o ddealltwriaeth pobl o'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad a'r sefydliadau hyn yn gweithredu.

Leighton Andrews: Yr ydych yn gwneud pwynt pwysig. Wyddoch chi, ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl wrth imi wneud gwaith ymchwil, gwelais mai pedwar person yn unig o wardiau Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a oedd ar fyrddau'r cwangos? Mae hysbysebu yn rhan o hynny. Yn ffodus, yr ydym wedi cael gwared â nifer o'r byrddau hynny, ond mae'r egwyddor yn parhau, o ran gallu pobl i gael y wybodaeth honno.

John Griffiths: Rhaid bod hynny'n iawn, ac mae'n rhan bwysig o'r ddadl hon. Dylem gydnabod hynny, a gweithredu arno, gobeithio. Mae'n rhywbeth sy'n gwbl ganolog i'n agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Gorffennaf drwy ddweud fy mod yn credu bod yr agwedd hon ar yr adroddiad yn rhan bwysig o'n democratiaeth newydd yng Nghymru, a'r math o gyswllt yr ydym yn ceisio'i feithrin â phobl Cymru. Mae angen inni weithredu ar yr argymhelliad hwn yn yr

get wider coverage and reach more people from a wider cross-section of society. It is an important part of this debate and I hope that it is something to which we will return.

Eleanor Burnham: I welcome this review, and thank the Chair, the secretariat and all those who took part in it. I have expressed my disappointment that Sly Bailey from Trinity Mirror was unable to hear our concerns. The fact that we do not have an all-Wales paper is, I believe, a disadvantage for us. I am saddened by the evidence that it is unlikely to be commercially successful. Regrettably, in my region of north Wales, many people continue, as has been alluded to, to be completely unaware of devolution and how our deliberations—however unimportant they might be deemed by certain people—impact on people's lives. We are aware that health, education and transport are particular issues of concern. Quite frankly, a lot of people are thoroughly confused, because they only read UK papers, about exactly what we do. I am sure that it is in our interest and that of democracy for them to know, particularly given the fact that so few people came out to vote last time and that there are only around nine months to go before the next election. It is imperative that we as Assembly Members do our best in this regard.

I was saddened by the quotation that stated that we have to make interesting stories. Some of us do not want to be contrived; we just want the matters that are taking place here to be properly recorded and reported. I see a few people smiling, but that is true. I challenged some north Wales papers on this important issue, which Leighton alluded to previously, namely that local constituency Assembly Members are given the opportunity to have a column in many north Wales papers, while regional Members are not. I have yet to be taken up on my challenge, but I look forward to it happening as soon as possible, so that we can all be represented in terms of how we conduct ourselves and what we do in the Assembly.

I welcome the recommendation about significant investment, because, as our Chair

adroddiad er mwyn bwrw'r rhwyd yn ehangach a chyrraedd mwy o bobl o groestoriad ehangach o gymdeithas. Mae'n rhan bwysig o'r ddadl hon, a gobeithio y gallwn ddychwelyd ati.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adolygiad hwn, a diolch i'r Cadeirydd, yr ysgrifenyddiaeth a phawb a gymerodd ran ynddo. Yr wyf wedi mynegi fy siom nad oedd Sly Bailey o Trinity Mirror yn gallu clywed ein pryderon. Mae'r ffaith nad oes gennym bapur i Gymru gyfan yn anfantais inni, yn fy marn i. Yr wyf yn siomedig fod tystiolaeth yn dweud y byddai'n annhebygol o lwyddo'n fasnachol. Yn anffodus, yn fy rhan i o'r gogledd, mae anwybodaeth o hyd ymhlith nifer o bobl am y ffordd y mae datganoli a'n trafodaethau—waeth pa mor ddibwys ym marn rhai—yn effeithio ar fywydau pobl. Gwyddom mai iechyd, addysg a thrafnidiaeth yw'r prif achosion pryder. A dweud y gwir, mae nifer o bobl wedi'u drysu'n lân ynglŷn â'r hyn a wnawn, am eu bod yn darllen papurau'r DU yn unig. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai o fudd i ni ac i ddemocratiaeth iddynt gael gwybod, yn enwedig o gofio cyn lleied o bobl a bleidleisiodd y tro diwethaf ac mai dim ond rhyw naw mis sydd tan yr etholiad nesaf. Mae'n hollbwysig i ni, fel Aelodau'r Cynulliad, wneud ein gorau yn y cyswllt hwn.

Fe'm siomwyd gan y dyfyniad a oedd yn dweud bod yn rhaid inni gael storïau diddorol. Nid oes gan rai ohonom unrhyw awydd i fod yn artiffisial; yr ydym am i'r materion sy'n digwydd yma gael eu cofnodi a'u cyfleu'n iawn. Gwelaf amryw yn gwenu, ond mae'n wir. Heriais rai o bapurau'r gogledd ar y pwnc pwysig hwn, y soniodd Leighton amdano ynghynt, sef bod gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad sy'n cynrychioli etholaethau lleol gyfle i ysgrifennu colofn yn nifer o bapurau'r gogledd, a'r ffaith nad yw'r cyfle hwn ar gael i Aelodau rhanbarthol. Ni chefais ymateb i'm her hyd yma, ond edrychaf ymlaen at gael ateb cyn gynted â phosibl er mwyn inni i gyd gael ein cynrychioli yn y ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu a'r hyn a wnawn yn y Cynulliad.

Croesawaf yr argymhelliad ynglŷn â buddsoddiad sylweddol, oherwydd dyna oedd

alluded to, that was our initial concern. I also welcome recommendation 4 on the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills' review of the provision of publicly funded training courses for journalists, because, again, our devolved democracy deserves journalism of the best quality. Surely, that is part and parcel of how we achieve that.

Recommendation 5 is about the National Assembly's advertising strategy, and I certainly agree with this, because there have been grave concerns on this issue. For instance, when it comes to advertising jobs based in Llandudno, it makes sense that the people of Llandudno know about it, and not just the people who read the *Western Mail*, which, frankly, is not that relevant to most of us in north Wales. Changing the way in which the National Assembly advertises could and should have far-reaching effects, so that diversification and equality are addressed properly, and so that we have a wider range of people, which is the key for improvement. I know that the issue of extending the number of publications used for Assembly recruitment has been raised by many, Jenny Randerson among them, as a vital step on the road to mainstreaming equality throughout Wales. Using all the local and national newspapers to advertise jobs will see the Assembly making proper use of crucial parts of communities, as alluded to by others, including Leighton Andrews. Never has a change been so needed, if the Assembly is to be seen to be serious about relocating jobs and spreading the benefit of devolution throughout Wales.

4.50 p.m.

Denise Idris Jones: This has been a short but effective review of English-language newspapers in Wales. I echo the comments of colleagues on the committee in thanking the contributors to the review. As the report states, our initial concerns about compulsory redundancies in the industry were not realised, and I welcome the more amicable arrangements that were finally agreed.

On a business-sector level, we heard

ein pryder gwreiddiol, fel y soniodd ein Cadeirydd. Croesawaf argymhelliad 4 ar adolygiad y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau o ddarpariaeth cyrsiau hyfforddi wedi'u hariannu'n gyhoeddus i newyddiadurwyr, oherwydd, unwaith eto, mae ein democratiaeth ddatganoledig yn haeddu newyddiaduraeth o'r radd flaenaf. Onid yw hynny'n rhan o'r modd yr ydym yn cyflawni hynny.

Mae argymhelliad 5 yn ymwneud â strategaeth hysbysebu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ac yr wyf yn bendant yn cytuno â hyn, oherwydd mynegwyd pryderon mawr ynghylch y mater hwn. Er enghraifft, pan gaiff swyddi yn Llandudno eu hysbysebu, mae'n gwneud synnwyr i bobl Llandudno gael gwybod amdanynt, nid darllenwyr y *Western Mail* yn unig, nad yw mor berthnasol â hynny i'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn y gogledd. Gallai newid y modd y mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn hysbysebu gael dylanwad aruthrol, er mwyn mynd i'r afael yn iawn ag amrywiaeth a chydarddoldeb, ac er mwyn inni sicrhau ystod ehangach o bobl, sy'n allweddol i welliant. Gwn fod llawer, Jenny Randerson yn eu plith, wedi codi pwnc cynyddu nifer y cyhoeddiadau a ddefnyddir ar gyfer recriwtio i'r Cynulliad, fel cam allweddol ar y ffordd i briff-ffrydio cydraddoldeb ledled Cymru. Drwy ddefnyddio'r holl bapurau newydd lleol a chenedlaethol i hysbysebu swyddi, bydd y Cynulliad yn gwneud defnydd priodol o rannau hanfodol o gymunedau, fel y crybwyllwyd gan eraill, gan gynnwys Leighton Andrews. Ni fu erioed gymaint o angen am newid os yw'r Cynulliad i gael ei weld o ddifrif ynghylch symud swyddi a lleadaenu budd datganoli ledled Cymru.

Denise Idris Jones: Mae hwn wedi bod yn adolygiad byr ond effeithiol o bapurau newydd Saesneg Cymru. Ategaf sylwadau cyd-Aelodau ar y pwyllgor wrth ddiolch i'r rhai a gyfrannodd at yr adolygiad. Fel y dywed yr adroddiad, ni wireddwyd ein pryderon cychwynnol ynghylch diswyddiadau gorfodol yn y diwydiant, a chroesawaf y trefniadau mwy cyfeillgar y cytunwyd arnynt yn y diwedd.

O ran y sector busnes, clywsom drwy gydol

throughout the review about how the newspaper industry is facing new challenges in the twenty-first century's 24-hour news environment. The internet, dedicated television news channels, and instant access to world events as they unfold around the globe, are changing the role of newspapers. The investment being made to adapt to readers' modern needs is to be commended.

In terms of local news reporting, as the report bears out, the presenters stressed the need to maintain high standards of reporting and the commitment to their employees, local communities, advertisers and services. Although the balance of revenue-generating activity has shifted over time, presenters' paramount concerns were about reporting integrity in local services.

Comparisons with Scotland have proven difficult, given the structural differences between the way in which the industry works and our geography. However, it is worth noting that Scotland, like Wales, does not have a standard national newspaper; it has different publications covering different areas. The commercial case for an all-Wales newspaper, which would require substantial public subsidy, has not been made. However, the variety of newspapers read regionally across Wales has implications for the National Assembly when advertising vacancies, and for others who wish to cast their net as widely as possible across all corners of Wales.

I endorse this report and its findings. I trust that it will prove to be a useful review in forming Government policy, highlighting the crucial role of the local media, and assisting the National Assembly in understanding the structure, demands and challenges of the newspaper industry in Wales.

Alun Cairns: I had not planned to speak in this debate, but when I heard Leighton Andrews's outburst, I felt that I needed to seek to correct some of the points that he made. I should say at the outset that I agreed with the initial thrust of his contribution. I

yr adolygiad am y modd y mae'r diwydiant papurau newydd yn wynebu her newydd oherwydd hinsawdd newyddion 24 awr yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae'r rhyngwyd, sianeli teledu newyddion yn unig, a gallu cael newyddion yn uniongyrchol am ddigwyddiadau byd-eang wrth iddynt ddatblygu yn newid rôl papurau newydd. Rhaid canmol y buddsoddi a wneir i addasu yn ôl anghenion darllenwyr modern.

O ran newyddion lleol, fel y dywed yr adroddiad, pwysleisiodd y cyflwynwyr yr angen am gynnal safonau gohebu a'r ymrwymiad i'w gweithwyr, cymunedau lleol, hysbysebwyrr a gwasanaethau. Er bod newid yn nhueddiadau gweithgareddau cynhyrchu refeniw dros amser, prif bryder y cyflwynwyr oedd cywirdeb gohebu am wasanaethau lleol.

Bu'n anodd llunio cymariaethau â'r Alban oherwydd y gwahaniaethau strwythurol yn y modd y mae'r diwydiant yn gweithio a'n daearyddiaeth. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth sylwi nad oes gan yr Alban, fel Cymru, bapur newydd cenedlaethol safonol; mae ganddi wahanol gyhoeddiadau yn cwmpasu gwahanol ardaloedd. Ni wnaed achos masnachol dros gael papur newydd i Gymru gyfan, rhywbeth a fyddai'n gofyn am gymhorthdal cyhoeddus sylweddol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith fod cynifer o bapurau newydd yn cael eu darllen yn rhanbarthol ledled Cymru yn golygu bod goblygiadau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn hynny wrth hysbysebu swyddi, ac i eraill sydd am fwrw'u rhwyd mor eang â phosibl i bob cwr o Gymru.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn a'i ddarganfyddiadau. Hyderaf y bydd yn adolygiad defnyddiol wrth lunio polisiau'r Llywodraeth, amlygu rôl hanfodol y cyfryngau lleol a chynorthwyo'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wrth ddeall strwythur, gofynion a heriau'r diwydiant papurau newydd yng Nghymru.

Alun Cairns: Nid oedd yn fwrriad gennyf siarad yn y ddadl hon, ond pan glywais sylwadau Leighton Andrews, teimlais fod angen imi geisio cywiro rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth. Dylwn ddweud ar y dechrau imi gytuno â phrif fyrdwn ei gyfraniad. Yr wyf

certainly agreed with his comments about job creation in the finance division—I would obviously welcome those jobs. I welcome the fact that there have not been any compulsory redundancies in the Trinity Mirror Group and that there is to be no merger of the role of the editors in the regional papers, which he highlighted. I certainly welcome that, and I welcome the squeeze on journalism that he mentioned, which is a serious concern that I want to come back to.

Leighton Andrews: Could you clarify what you just said? You said that you ‘welcome the squeeze on journalism’. Are you sure that you meant to say that?

Alun Cairns: I welcome the points that you made about the squeeze on journalism; forgive me if I did not articulate myself correctly.

What Dr Dai Lloyd said about the loss of jobs at the printing press in Swansea is, of course, a matter of concern to me, as a regional Assembly Member. However, if we look at the wider context, I think that publications in south-west Wales have an obligation to invest and to try to retain those jobs in Wales.

From a journalism point of view, I am more relaxed about it. I am more worried about the impact that the squeeze on journalism is having in terms of reporting and the lack of reporters here, for example, from the *South Wales Evening Post*, the *Western Mail* and many other papers. The Assembly, and every politician, needs the scrutiny that those journalists offer. Indeed, it is the political dynamic created by the national papers that puts pressure on governments of all colours, which can quite often lead to a resignation—sometimes when the case warrants a resignation and sometimes when a resignation is not even necessary. That drive for honesty and frankness is a positive pressure on all governments. I regret that we do not have that dynamic. Every paper will play its own role, but one does not feed off the other, as they often do in Westminster, where *The Times* may break a story, *The Daily Telegraph* will follow it up, and *The Guardian* will then take it that much

yn sicr yn cytuno â'i sylwadau ynghylch creu swyddi yn yr adran gyllid—byddwn yn amlwg yn croesawu'r swyddi hynny. Croesawaf y ffaith na fu diswyddiadau gorfodol yn Trinity Mirror Group, ac na chaiff rolau golygyddion yn y papurau rhanbarthol eu cyfuno, sef rhywbeth yr oedd yn tynnu sylw ato. Croesawaf hynny yn sicr, a chroesawaf y pwysau ar newyddiaduraeth a grybwyllwyd ganddo, sy'n bryder mawr yr hoffwn ddychwelyd ato.

Leighton Andrews: A allwch egluro'r hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud? Yr oeddech yn dweud eich bod yn croesawu'r pwysau ar newyddiaduraeth. A ydych yn siŵr eich bod wedi bwriadu dweud hynny?

Alun Cairns: Croesawaf y pwyntiau a wnaethoch ynghylch y pwysau ar newyddiaduraeth; maddeuwch imi os na lwyddais i fynegi fy hun yn iawn.

Wrth gwrs, mae'r hyn a ddywedodd Dr Dai Lloyd ynghylch colli swyddi yn y wasg argraffu yn Abertawe yn bryder imi, fel Aelod Cynulliad rhanbarthol. Fodd bynnag, os edrychwn ar y cyd-destun ehangach, credaf fod gan gyhoeddiadau yn y de-orllewin gyfrifoldeb i fuddsoddi a cheisio cadw'r swyddi hynny yng Nghymru.

O safbwynt newyddiaduraeth, nid yw'n gymaint o achos pryder yn fy marn i. Pryderaf fwy am yr effaith a gaiff y pwysau ar newyddiaduraeth o ran gohebu a phrinder gohebwyd yma, er enghraifft, o'r *South Wales Evening Post*, y *Western Mail* a llawer papur arall. Mae angen i'r Cynulliad a phob gwleidydd ddod o dan chwyddwydr y newyddiadurwyr hynny. Yn wir, yr hyn sy'n rhoi pwysau ar lywodraethau o bob lliw yw'r ddeinamig wleidyddol a grëir gan y papurau cenedlaethol, ac mae'r pwysau hynny'n aml yn gallu arwain at ymddiswyddo—weithiau pan fydd achos dros ymddiswyddo ac weithiau pan na fydd angen ymddiswyddo, hyd yn oed. Mae'r pwysau hynny am onestrwydd a didwylledd yn bwysau cadarnhaol ar bob llywodraeth. Gresynaf nad oes gennym y ddeinamig honno. Bydd pob papur yn chwarae ei ran, fel y gwnânt yn aml yn San Steffan, lle bydd *The Times* efallai yn torri gyda stori a *The Daily Telegraph* yn cyhoeddi stori ddilynol a *The Guardian* yn

further—it is that momentum that is created that really puts pressure on the Government of the day, of whatever colour.

I disagree with Leighton Andrews because, if we have that squeeze on journalism, and we really want to answer it—and margins may well be squeezed; that is why they are using independent experts—that is precisely why people such as Dylan Jones-Evans and many other commentators, including Leighton, will have articles. That is precisely why people like you have articles in the *Western Mail* or the regional press, or why I have articles in the *Glamorgan Gazette*, just as Carwyn Jones does. If your interest is in the quality of journalism and the scrutiny of Government, you should welcome such contributions, otherwise you appear to be quite worried by such close scrutiny.

Leighton Andrews: I think that you need to understand the difference between occasional articles by Members and others, and regular columns by specific columnists.

Alun Cairns *rose*—

Leighton Andrews: Excuse me, but I have not finished.

The problem with what you said—[*Interruption.*] If you want to intervene during my intervention, go ahead. The problem with what you said is that you used the words ‘independent’ and ‘expert’ in the same sentence as ‘Dylan Jones-Evans’.

Alun Cairns: I certainly did not hear the same sorts of concerns about regular columns by Andrew Davies and Alun Pugh. It seems that when the points are uncomfortable to your Government, and when issues are being exposed, you are highly uncomfortable. That is an important point of journalism. I would have expected better from a member of the National Union of Journalists. You really should have the case, the capacity and the resources to rebut those arguments, but you know that what Dylan Jones-Evans writes in the *Daily Post* and the *Western Mail* is extremely uncomfortable, because the truth

mynd â'r stori honno ymhellach fyth—dyna'r momentwm a grëir ac sy'n rhoi pwysau gwirioneddol ar Lywodraeth y dydd, waeth beth fo'i lliw.

Anghytunaf â Leighton Andrews, oherwydd os ni sy'n pwysu ar newyddiaduraeth ac os ydym yn wir am ateb hyn—ac mae'n bosibl bod pwysau arni; dyna pam maent yn defnyddio arbenigwyr annibynnol—dyna'n union pam y bydd erthyglau gan bobl fel Dylan Jones-Evans a sawl sylwebydd arall, gan gynnwys Leighton. Dyna pam mae gan bobl fel chi erthyglau yn y *Western Mail* neu'r wasg ranbarthol, neu pam mae gennyf fi erthyglau yn y *Glamorgan Gazette* yn yr un modd â Carwyn Jones. Os safon newyddiaduraeth a chraffu ar Lywodraeth sydd o ddiddordeb ichi, dylech groesawu cyfraniadau o'r fath, neu fel arall byddwch yn ymddangos fel pe baech yn pryderu ynghylch craffu gofalus o'r fath.

Leighton Andrews: Credaf fod angen ichi ddeall y gwahaniaeth rhwng erthyglau achlysurol gan Aelodau ac eraill, a cholofnau rheolaidd gan golofnwyr penodol.

Alun Cairns *a gododd*—

Leighton Andrews: Esgusodwch fi, ond nid wyf wedi gorffen.

Y broblem gyda'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei ddweud—[*Ymyriad.*] Os ydych am ymyrryd yn ystod fy ymyriad i, mae croeso ichi wneud. Y broblem gyda'r hyn yr oeddech yn ei ddweud yw eich bod wedi defnyddio'r geiriau ‘annibynnol’ ac ‘arbenigwr’ yn yr un frawddeg â ‘Dylan Jones-Evans’.

Alun Cairns: Yn sicr ni chlywais yr un mathau o bryderon ynghylch colofnau rheolaidd gan Andrew Davies ac Alun Pugh. Ymddengys, pan fydd y pwyntiau'n anghyfforddus i'ch Llywodraeth a phan fydd materion yn cael eu datgelu, yr ydych yn anghyfforddus iawn. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig o ran newyddiaduraeth. Byddwn wedi disgwyl gwell gan aelod o Undeb Cenedlaethol y Newyddiadurwyr. Dylai fod gennyf yr achos, y gallu a'r adnoddau i wrthbrofi'r dadleuon hynny, ond gwyddoch fod yr hyn y mae Dylan Jones-Evans yn ei ddweud yn y *Daily Post* a'r *Western Mail* yn

hurts.

Returning to the report and the Scottish dimension, one of my disappointments regarding the report is the fact that the *Scottish Daily Mirror* sold fewer papers than the *Welsh Daily Mirror*, but it was the *Welsh Daily Mirror* that was withdrawn, and not the *Scottish Daily Mirror*. It was said that the reason was falling advertising revenues, but that is clearly not the reason—the competition that exists in Scotland does not exist in Wales, and that led to the withdrawal of the *Welsh Daily Mirror*. The company knew that the people who bought the Welsh edition would happily buy the *Daily Mirror*. We all need to play our part in lobbying papers to ensure that a high standard of journalism is maintained for every Government of every colour. It saddened me that even Welsh broadcasters spent a great deal of time scrutinising and focusing on the English Education Bill, which had no relevance to us other than as a possible long-term consequence later on in terms of the influence of the Prime Minister.

Finally, why do we not use the newspapers to advertise the websites of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Assembly Parliamentary Service? We could include job adverts there, making a positive, dynamic use of IT, rather than spend enormous sums advertising jobs with relatively low salaries; the advertisements are often more expensive than the salaries being offered.

anghyfforddus iawn, oherwydd mae'r gwir yn brifo.

I ddychwelyd at yr adroddiad a dimensiwn yr Alban, un o'r pethau a barodd siom imi ynglŷn â'r adroddiad yw'r ffaith fod y *Scottish Daily Mirror* yn gwerthu llai o bapurau na'r *Welsh Daily Mirror*, ond y *Welsh Daily Mirror* a dynnwyd yn ôl, nid y *Scottish Daily Mirror*. Dywedwyd mai'r rheswm oedd gostyngiad yn y refeniw hysbysebu, ond mae'n amlwg nad dyna oedd y rheswm—nid yw'r gystadleuaeth sydd yn yr Alban yn bodoli yng Nghymru, ac arweiniodd hynny at ddiwedd y *Welsh Daily Mirror*. Gwyddai'r cwmni y byddai'r bobl sy'n prynu'r rhifyn Cymreig yn hapus i brynu'r *Dail Mirror*. Mae angen inni i gyd wneud ein rhan i lobio papurau i sicrhau cael newyddiaduraeth o'r radd flaenaf i bob Llywodraeth o bob lliw. Trist oedd clywed bod darlledwyr yng Nghymru hyd yn oed yn treulio llawer iawn o amser yn craffu ac yn canolbwyntio ar Fesur Addysg Lloegr, nad oedd yn berthnasol inni heblaw am ganlyniadau hirdymor posibl yn ddiweddarach o ran dylanwad y Prif Weinidog.

Yn olaf, pam nad ydym yn defnyddio'r papurau newydd i hysbysebu gwefannau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad? Gallem gynnwys hysbysebion swyddi, gan wneud defnydd deinamig a chadarnhaol o TG yn hytrach na gwario arian aruthrol yn hysbysebu swyddi gyda chyflogau cymharol isel; mae'r hysbysebion yn aml yn ddrutach na'r cyflogau a gynigir.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I understand that the Business Minister is prepared to propose a motion for an extension of half an hour under Standing Order No. 6.21.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Deallaf fod y Trefnydd yn barod i gynnig cynnig am estyniad o hanner awr o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 621.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends the time for this debate by 30 minutes.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ychwanegu hanner awr at yr amser ar gyfer y ddadl hon.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Are there 10 Members in support of this? I see that there are. I therefore call for a vote on the motion.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: A oes 10 Aelod o blaid hyn? Oes. Galwaf felly am bleidlais ar y cynnig.

5.00 p.m.

Cynnig: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 4.

Motion: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 4.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Black, Peter
Davies, Janet
Jones, Ann
Sinclair, Karen

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ar Bapurau Newydd yng Nghymru: Parhad
The Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee's Report on Newspapers in Wales: Continued

Val Lloyd: The uncertain employment climate, which some Members have already mentioned and which prompted the committee's review, is quite regrettable, even though our original concerns about compulsory redundancies were not realised, because the proposed merger of two local Valleys newspapers did not materialise.

Val Lloyd: Mae'r hinsawdd cyflogaeth ansicr y mae rhai Aelodau eisoes wedi sôn amdano ac a symbylodd adolygiad y pwyllgor, yn resynus, er na wireddwyd ein pryderon gwreiddiol ynglŷn â dileu swyddi'n orfodol am na ddigwyddodd yr uniad arfaethedig o'r ddau bapur newydd lleol yn y Cymoedd.

As the Assembly Member for Swansea, I am extremely disappointed by the decision of the

Fel Aelod y Cynulliad dros Abertawe, yr wyf wedi fy siomi'n fawr gan benderfyniad Grŵp

Northcliffe Newspaper Group to close its printing press in the city and move its activity to England. The loss of those skilled printing jobs was a blow for Swansea, and the resultant earlier printing deadline, no matter what the managing director and the chief executive said at the committee, has adversely affected the topicality of the local press, so much so that the *Swansea Evening Post* is now dubbed the 'Swansea morning post' by its Swansea residents.

The evidence that we heard described difficult economic conditions due to, among other things, the decline in advertising revenue, and competition from the internet and television. However, it is important to note that the redundancies were discussed at the end of a period that saw increased circulation for the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo*, and good profit returns. We need to continue to monitor the situation to ensure that the quality and distinctiveness of Welsh news reporting does not suffer from future redundancies and mergers.

According to the presentations made to the committee, the quality of local news is at the centre of every newspaper group's preoccupations. Indeed, local news is most important to readers in Wales, and, as the committee Chair said, we were told that verbatim Assembly coverage did not attract much interest, and what people really wanted to know was how the Assembly's work impacted on their everyday life. The way in which Assembly business is covered in the press is clearly important in informing opinions, and is one strand in bringing the Assembly closer to the people. I recently carried out a survey among young people in my constituency and asked them what the Assembly should do to publicise its work. Many of the respondents said that the Assembly should reach out to various publications in Wales to explain what it does. On the other hand, we hear that some people in Wales are half-hearted about devolution, although I hear that less and less these days. With the Government of Wales Bill nearly on the statute book, perhaps it is now an opportune time to re-examine how the press and the Assembly should engage to ensure that people know what the Assembly does and how it impacts on their lives.

Papur Newydd Northcliffe i gau ei wasg argraffu yn y ddinas a symud ei weithgaredd i Loegr. Yr oedd colli'r swyddi argraffu medrus hynny yn ergyd i Abertawe, ac mae'r terfyn amser argraffu cynharach o ganlyniad, waeth beth a ddywedodd y cyfarwyddwr rheoli a'r prif weithredwr wrth y pwyllgor, wedi cael effaith andwyol ar natur amserol y wasg leol, i'r fath raddau fel y gelwir y *Swansea Evening Post* yn 'Swansea morning post' gan drigolion Abertawe.

Yn y dystiolaeth a glywsom, disgrifiwyd amodau economaidd anodd oherwydd gostyngiad mewn refeniw hysbysebu, ymhlith pethau eraill, a chystadleuaeth gan y rhyngwrwyd a'r teledu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig sylwi bod dileu'r swyddi wedi ei drafod ar gyfnod o gylchrediad uwch i'r *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo*, ac elw da. Mae angen inni barhau i fonitro'r sefyllfa er mwyn sicrhau na fydd safon a nodwedddion penodol newyddiaduriaeth yng Nghymru yn dioddef oherwydd dileu swyddi ac uniadau yn y dyfodol.

Yn ôl y cyflwyniadau a wnaed i'r pwyllgor, safon newyddion lleol sydd wrth wraidd ystyriaethau pob grŵp papur newydd. Yn wir, newyddion lleol sydd bwysicaf i ddarllenwyr yng Nghymru, ac fel y dywedodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, clywsom nad oedd ymdriniaeth air am air o'r Cynulliad yn ennyn llawer o ddiddordeb. Yr hyn yr oedd pobl am ei wybod mewn gwirionedd oedd sut mae gwaith y Cynulliad yn effeithio ar eu bywyd pob dydd. Mae'r modd y caiff busnes y Cynulliad sylw yn y wasg yn amlwg yn bwysig wrth lunio barn, ac mae'n un o'r edau sy'n dod â'r Cynulliad yn nes at y bobl. Yn ddiweddar, cynhaliais arolwg ymhlith pobl ifanc yn fy etholaeth a gofynnais iddynt beth y dylai'r Cynulliad ei wneud i roi cyhoeddusrwydd i'w waith. Dywedodd nifer o'r ymatebwyr y dylai'r Cynulliad geisio cyrraedd amrywiol gyhoeddiadau yng Nghymru i egluro'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud. Ar y llaw arall, clywsom fod rhai pobl yng Nghymru yn llugoer ynglŷn â datganoli, er fy mod yn clywed hynny'n llai ac yn llai erbyn hyn. Gyda Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru bron â bod ar y llyfr statud, efallai ei bod yn adeg gyfleus i ailystyried sut y dylai'r wasg a'r Cynulliad ymgysylltu â'i gilydd i sicrhau bod pobl yn

ymwybod o'r hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn ei wneud a sut y mae'n effeithio ar eu bywydau.

Owen John Thomas: Fel y dywedodd y Cadeirydd, symbylwyd yr adolygiad gan y bygythiad i swyddi yn niwydiant y wasg a hynny ond dwy flynedd ar ôl inni gollu nifer sylweddol o swyddi yn y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo*. Mae'n debyg y bu'r hwb a roddwyd gan adolygiad y pwyllgor i ymgyrch yr undebau, yn erbyn bwriad Grŵp Trinity Mirror i gwtogi ar ei staff, o gymorth mawr, gan beri lleihad yn nifer y swyddi a gollwyd yn y pen draw. Yr oedd hefyd yn dda i ddarllen heddiw y bydd Trinity Mirror yn creu 41 o swyddi newydd yn swyddfeydd y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo*. Bu'n bleser edrych ar lawer o bapurau wythnosol o wahanol rannau o Gymru a sylweddoli eu safon uchel, a gweld nifer uchel y darllenwyr sydd ganddynt.

Datgelodd yr adolygiad yr her dechnegol sy'n wynebu'r wasg o du'r rhyngwyd, y teledu a'r radio. Mae dibyniaeth papurau newydd ar hysbysebu yn cynyddu, ond maent yn hyderus y gallant barhau i argraffu'r gair ysgrifenedig. Fodd bynnag, yr oeddent yn dangos diffyg hyder pan godais y syniad o ddod â'r *Western Mail* a'r *Daily Post* at ei gilydd i ffurfio papur cenedlaethol cryf i Gymru i efelychu'r *Irish Independent*, *The Irish Times*, yr *Irish Examiner*, *The Scotsman* a *The Herald*. Dylai fod yn ddyhead gan bob Aelod Cynulliad i Gymru i gael papur newydd cenedlaethol sy'n cael ei gydnabod felly ym mhob rhan o'r wlad.

Gan dderbyn bod sawl elfen i bapur newydd, megis straeon a hysbysebion lleol, rhanbarthol, cenedlaethol a rhyngwladol, ni fyddai amrywio'r newyddion a hysbysebion ar gyfer y gogledd, y gorllewin a'r de yn broblem nac yn syniad newydd; bu papurau newydd Llundain yn ei wneud eisoes, a thros lawer mwy o'r wlad a thros wlad sydd llawer yn fwy amrywiol ac o fwy o faint na Chymru. Y broblem yw diffyg ewyllys, nid ymhlith newyddiadurwyr ond o ran y perchnogion, Trinity Mirror, sy'n gweld y cynnig fel cymhlethdod yn hytrach na deheuad a fyddai'n ychwanegu at y broses o ddatblygu'r genedl.

Yr wyf yn falch fy mod wedi cynnig bod y

Owen John Thomas: As the committee Chair has said, the review was prompted by the threat of job losses in the press industry only two years after we lost a substantial number of jobs in the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo*. It appears as though the boost which the committee's review gave to the campaign by the unions against the intention by the Trinity Mirror Group to cut back on staff numbers was a great help, ultimately resulting in fewer jobs being lost. It was also good to read today that Trinity Mirror intends to create 41 new jobs in the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo* offices. It has also been a pleasure to read many weekly papers from different parts of Wales, and to realise how high their standard is and the good readership figures they have.

The review revealed the technical challenge facing the press from the internet, television and radio. The dependence of newspapers on advertising revenue is increasing, but they are confident they will continue to print the written word. However, they revealed a lack of confidence when I raised the idea of bringing the *Western Mail* and the *Daily Post* together to form a strong national paper to emulate the *Irish Independent*, *The Irish Times*, the *Irish Examiner*, *The Scotsman* and *The Herald*. It should be a desire by every Assembly Member to have a newspaper which is recognised as such in all parts of the country.

While I acknowledge that a newspaper has many elements to it, such as local, regional, national and international stories and advertising, varying the news stories and advertisements for the north, west and south would not be a problem or a new idea; the London newspapers already do it, and they cover a far wider area which is far more varied in its nature and far bigger than Wales. The problem is a lack of will, not among journalists but on the part of the proprietors, Trinity Mirror, which sees the proposal as a complication rather than an aspiration which would add to the process of developing the nation.

I am pleased to have suggested that the

Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yn cynnal yr adolygiad hwn, gan ei fod wedi achub swyddi a rhoi'r cyfle inni ddechrau ystyried o ddifrif y syniad o greu papur newydd cenedlaethol i Gymru gyfan.

Lisa Francis: I am mindful of the comments that have already been made that devolution in Wales has not been properly reflected in the printing and publishing of newspapers here. However, if the newspaper managers were here, they would say, as they said in their evidence to committee, that that is due to unusually harsh economic challenges and conditions. In fact, they would say that those conditions have been prevalent for the past 20 years or so, and that the industry is having a really tough time.

We were told that, on the whole, consumers are far more cautious about how they spend their money today, and one of the expert reports presented to us showed that newspaper sales had dropped by 40 per cent in 25 years. However, there seems to be a huge assumption out there that the journalistic quality and volume of a newspaper's content is the one and only factor that makes people buy a newspaper. Of course, there are other diverse levers that increase sales. Value for time is apparently a key driver now, because newspapers compete with other media outlets for people's time, and that obviously influences the content of our newspapers. The environment that we live in is constantly and rapidly changing. Gone are the days when there were only two television stations and one radio station. Commercial radio stations, for example, now take a big slice of advertising revenue, and that is not to say that the revenue pot in terms of advertising is any bigger; it just means that it is being shared out more.

We, as consumers of news, are inclined to think that newspapers have a duty and an obligation to observe and provide us with news and should carry on doing so come what may, without realising that, at the end of the day, they are businesses. Like any other business, survival systems are

Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee should conduct this review, because it has saved jobs and given us an opportunity to seriously consider the idea of creating a national newspaper for the whole of Wales.

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf yn cadw mewn cof y sylwadau a wnaed eisoes nad yw datganoli yng Nghymru wedi ei adlewyrchu'n gywir o ran argraffu a chyhoeddi papurau newydd yma. Fodd bynnag, pe bai'r rheolwyr papurau newydd yma, byddent yn dweud, fel y gwnaethant yn eu tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, fod hynny oherwydd yr heriau a'r amodau economaidd anghyffredin o lym. Mewn gwirionedd, byddent yn dweud mai felly y bu ers tua 20 mlynedd, a bod y diwydiant yn cael amser arbennig o anodd.

Clywsom fod defnyddwyr, yn gyffredinol, lawer yn fwy gofalus am y ffordd y maent yn gwario'u harian heddiw, a dangosodd un o'r adroddiadau arbenigol a gyflwynwyd inni fod gwerthiannau papurau newydd wedi gostwng 40 y cant mewn 25 mlynedd. Fodd bynnag, ymddengys fod yna dybiaeth helaeth mai safon newyddiaduriaeth a maint cynnwys papur newydd yw'r unig ffactor sy'n gwneud i bobl brynu papur newydd. Wrth gwrs, mae rhesymau amrywiol eraill sy'n cynyddu gwerthiant. Mae gwerth am amser yn ffactor allweddol erbyn hyn, mae'n debyg, oherwydd bod papurau newydd yn cystadlu â rhannau eraill o'r cyfryngau am amser pobl, ac mae hynny'n dylanwadu'n amlwg ar gynnwys ein papurau newydd. Mae'r amgylchedd yr ydym yn byw ynddo yn newid yn gyson ac yn gyflym. Mae'r dyddiau o gael dim ond dwy orsaf deledu ac un orsaf radio wedi diflannu. Er enghraifft, mae gorsafedd radio masnachol yn cymryd cyfran fawr o'r refeniw hysbysebu yn awr, ac nid dweud y mae hynny fod y pot refeniw o ran hysbysebu yn fwy; mae'n golygu yn hytrach ei fod yn cael ei rannu rhwng mwy o gystadleuwyr.

Yr ydym ni, fel prynwyr newyddion, yn dueddol o feddwl bod ar bapurau newydd ddyletswydd a rhwymedigaeth i arsylwi a rhoi newyddion inni ac y dylent barhau i wneud hynny doed a ddelo, heb sylweddoli mai busnesau ydynt yn y pen draw. Fel unrhyw fusnes arall, rhaid gallu dal i fynd.

necessary. I will be critical of some of the evidence that we received from one expert, because the paper that was presented did not seem to recognise that fact at all. While it talked about the profits that newspaper companies made, it did not mention the investment that they made, and I did not think that that was a particularly balanced approach.

One thing that came out of this review, which is really important, is that local news is absolutely key to local newspapers. We see fashions, people and the balance of features changing, but it became clear to us that if there were a reduction in the number of journalists, that would probably be reflected by a change in local news balance. Therefore, any reduction in the number of journalists due to cost-cutting would be extremely concerning.

We need to encourage more newspapers to espouse a long-term commitment to training. Some of them in Wales do that already and that is why this report has recommended that, in Wales, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills looks closely at the provision of publicly funded training courses for journalists in further and higher education. I welcome that recommendation most of all.

Rosemary Butler: As you can see, this is a subject on which every Member is an expert—some a bit more than others. I agree totally, particularly with Leighton Andrews, about the quality of journalism. It is important that we have high-quality journalists here in Wales, and the training of those journalists is important. However, if they do not have a job to go to when they come out, there is no point in training them. Therefore, we need to encourage permanent, full-time, quality jobs for journalists so that we get excellent coverage of whatever the topic is in Wales and, hopefully, of the Assembly.

5.10 p.m.

I found different people's attitudes to this report interesting, particularly Mark's

Byddaf yn feirniadol o ychydig dystiolaeth a glywsom gan un arbenigwr, oherwydd ymddengys nad oedd y papur a gyflwynwyd yn cydnabod y ffaith honno o gwbl. Er iddo sôn am yr elw a wnaed gan gwmnïau papurau newydd, nid oedd yn sôn am y buddsoddiad a wnaed ganddynt, ac nid oeddwn yn credu bod hynny'n iawn.

Un peth a ddaeth i'r amlwg o'r adolygiad hwn, sy'n arbennig o bwysig, yw fod newyddion lleol yn allweddol i bapurau newydd lleol. Gwelwn ffasiynau, pobl a chydbwysedd erthyglau nodwedd yn newid, ond daeth yn amlwg inni, pe bai gostyngiad yn nifer y newyddiadurwyr, y byddai hynny'n debygol o gael ei adlewyrchu gan newid yng nghydbwysedd y newyddion lleol. Felly, byddai unrhyw ostyngiad yn nifer y newyddiadurwyr oherwydd torri costau o bryder mawr.

Mae angen inni annog mwy o bapurau newydd i wneud ymrwymiad hirdymor i hyfforddi. Mae rhai ohonynt yng Nghymru yn gwneud hynny eisoes, a dyna pam yr argymhellwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau edrych yn fanwl ar ddarparu cyrsiau hyfforddi yng Nghymru i newyddiadurwyr ym meysydd addysg bellach ac addysg uwch a ariennir yn gyhoeddus. Croesawaf yr argymhelliad hwnnw yn fwy na dim.

Rosemary Butler: Fel y gwelwch, mae hwn yn bwnc y mae pob Aelod yn arbenigwr arno—rhai ychydig yn fwy na'i gilydd. Cytunaf yn llwyr, yn enwedig â Leighton Andrews, am safon newyddiaduriaeth. Mae'n bwysig fod gennym newyddiadurwyr o safon yma yng Nghymru, ac mae hyfforddiant y newyddiadurwyr hynny'n bwysig. Fodd bynnag, os nad oes ganddynt swydd i fynd iddi ar ôl gorffen, nid oes diben eu hyfforddi. Felly, mae angen inni annog swyddi parhaol, llawn-amser o safon i newyddiadurwyr, fel y cawn sylw gwych beth bynnag fo'r pwnc yng Nghymru a, gobeithio, i'r Cynulliad.

Yr oedd agweddau gwahanol bobl i'r adroddiad hwn o ddiddordeb imi, yn enwedig

comments—and he has now left the Chamber—about feeling sorry for the newspaper industry because there had been a downturn in advertising. I hope that he continues to sympathise on that front when he attacks the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, claiming that everything is his fault, rather than it being a symptom of the downturn in the economy.

We can say what we like about newspapers and what we want them to do, but we must remember that they are private companies and, as such, are responsible only to their shareholders. We can have aspirations, but it is not a case of winning hearts and minds; it is a case of getting hard cash into the pockets of their shareholders. Where we were able to make recommendations, we have done so. Those were in the area of training, which Lisa Francis just mentioned, and in the other very important area of the placement of advertising. Alun Cairns suggested one solution. That was brought up in committee, but we did not think that it was our role, and we would prefer the Government and the Assembly to do a proper report into where advertisements should be placed.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for Rosemary's response. That is a positive way forward because, throughout the debate, we have heard that advertising revenue has been dropping, but I would be very surprised to learn that the public sector advertising revenue had dropped. Therefore, it seems as though we are not keeping pace with the wider economy. With new media opportunities and as individuals, politicians and for journalism's sake, as well as for the advertising of roles within the Assembly, that is an exciting prospect that we need to embrace.

Rosemary Butler: That was an intervention, was it? It is important that we find out exactly how much public money is spent on advertising in newspapers in Wales, and I think that we would all be staggered by the huge amount that it is.

I reiterate the committee's thanks to the people who gave evidence. They are private companies and there was no need for them to come, but they did. Hopefully, they are

sylwadau Mark—ac mae wedi gadael y Siambr yn awr—am deimlo trueni dros y diwydiant papurau newydd oherwydd gostyngiad mewn hysbysebu. Gobeithio y bydd yn cydymdeimlo am hynny o hyd pan fydd yn ymosod ar y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, gan honni mai ei fai ef yw'r cyfan yn hytrach na'i fod yn symptom o ddirywiad yn yr economi.

Gallwn ddweud yr hyn a fynnwn am bapurau newydd a'r hyn yr hoffem iddynt ei wneud, ond rhaid inni gofio eu bod yn gwmnïau preifat, ac felly maent yn atebol i'w cyfranddalwyr yn unig. Gall fod gennym ddyheadau, ond nid mater o ennill cefnogaeth pobl ydyw; mae'n fater o gael arian sychion i bocedi eu cyfranddalwyr. Yr oeddem yn gallu gwneud argymhellion, a gwnaethom hynny. Yr oedd y rheini ym maes hyfforddiant, y soniodd Lisa Francis amdano, ac yn y maes pwysig iawn arall, sef gosod hysbysebion. Awgrymodd Alun Cairns un ateb. Codwyd hwnnw yn y pwyllgor, ond nid oeddem yn credu mai dyna oedd ein rôl, a byddai'n well gennym pe bai'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad yn paratoi adroddiad go iawn ar ble y dylid gosod hysbysebion.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am ymateb Rosemary. Mae'n ddatblygiad cadarnhaol, oherwydd drwy gydol y ddadl clywsom fod refeniw hysbysebu wedi gostwng. Ond byddwn yn synnu'n fawr o glywed bod refeniw hysbysebu'r sector cyhoeddus wedi gostwng. Felly, ymddengys nad ydym yn cydredeg â'r economi ehangach. Gyda chyfleoedd newydd yn y cyfryngau ac fel unigolion, gwleidyddion ac er mwyn newyddiaduriaeth, yn ogystal ag er mwyn hysbysebu rolau yn y Cynulliad, mae hynny'n gynnig cyffrous y mae angen inni ei fabwysiadu.

Rosemary Butler: Ai ymyriad, oedd hwnnw? Mae'n bwysig inni gael gwybod yn union sut y caiff arian cyhoeddus ei wario ar hysbysebu mewn papurau newydd yng Nghymru, a chredaf y byddem i gyd yn rhyfeddu at y swm enfawr hwnnw.

Ailadroddaf ddiolch y pwyllgor i'r bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth. Cwmnïau preifat ydynt, ac nid oedd yn rhaid iddynt ddod, ond fe ddaethant. Gobeithio eu bod yn cael y neges

getting the message that what we really want is high quality journalism and high quality papers produced here in Wales. It is important that we get high quality jobs and that we try to keep printing in Wales; otherwise, we will end up in a downward spiral.

Owen John Thomas was very keen on having a national newspaper. Sadly, he is leaving us next May, but perhaps he would like to launch a national newspaper. I am sure that we would all buy it. However, he did say that he was a *South Wales Echo* boy at one time. I thank Members for this animated debate. You can imagine the kind of meetings that I had to try to chair when this topic was being debated in committee. I am glad that the Assembly has accepted our report and I look forward to hearing the response of the appropriate Minister.

mai'r hyn yr ydym am ei gael yw newyddiaduriaeth o safon a phapurau o safon wedi'u cynhyrchu yma yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig inni gael swyddi o safon a cheisio cadw argraffu yng Nghymru, neu gwanhau a fydd newyddiaduriaeth.

Yr oedd Owen John Thomas yn awyddus iawn i gael papur newydd cenedlaethol. Yn anffodus, bydd yn ein gadael ni ym mis Mai'r flwyddyn nesaf, ond efallai yr hoffai lansio papur newydd cenedlaethol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai pob un ohonom yn ei brynu. Fodd bynnag, dywedodd ei fod yn un a oedd yn ffafrio *South Wales Echo* ar un adeg. Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am y ddadl frwd hon. Gallwch ddychmygu'r math o gyfarfodydd y bûm yn eu cadeirio wrth i'r pwnc hwn gael ei drafod yn y pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Cynulliad wedi derbyn ein hadroddiad, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymateb y Gweinidog priodol.

*Cynnig (NDM3145): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3145): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Dyfodol Amgylcheddol Cymru The Environmental Future of Wales

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I ask Members who are leaving the Chamber to do so quietly. Denise Idris Jones, if you are going, please go.

Lorraine Barrett: Alun Ffred Jones has asked to speak for a minute as did some other Members, but they have had to leave because we were running late.

If we are serious about sustainable development and tackling climate change, we must encourage behaviour that protects our natural environment so that it exists for future generations to enjoy. Effective action can generate lasting solutions to current environmental problems in Wales and beyond. Our distinctive Welsh environment is arguably our most valuable asset, which, as citizens, we must protect and promote. I welcome the framework outlined in the recent environment strategy, and I realise that a lot of positive change has already been achieved, but the time has come for tough political action.

To ensure that improvements are made, serious consideration of environmental consequences must be built into all decision-making processes in Wales. Something must be done to combat the rate of change. However, many of us think that it is someone else's job. Strong and effective regulation is needed, but it alone cannot change people's attitudes or behaviour. Increasing understanding of environmental issues and the role that individuals can play is key to securing long-term environmental improvements and raising the quality of life

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf i Aelodau sy'n gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n dawel. Denise Idris Jones, os ydych yn gadael, ewch.

Lorraine Barrett: Mae Alun Ffred Jones wedi gofyn am gael siarad am funud, fel y gwnaeth rhai Aelodau eraill, ond bu'n rhaid iddynt adael gan ei bod yn hwyr.

Os ydym o ddifrif am ddatblygiad cynaliadwy a mynd i'r afael â newid yn yr hinsawdd, rhaid inni annog ymddygiad sy'n diogelu ein hamgylchedd naturiol er mwyn iddo fodoli i genedlaethau'r dyfodol ei fwynhau. Gall gweithredu effeithiol greu atebion parhaol i broblemau amgylcheddol cyfredol yng Nghymru a thu hwnt. Yn ddiau, ein hamgylchedd unigryw yng Nghymru yw ein hased mwyaf gwerthfawr, a rhaid inni fel dinasyddion ei ddiogelu a'i hyrwyddo. Croesawaf y fframwaith a amlinellir yn y strategaeth amgylchedd yn ddiweddar, a sylweddolaf fod llawer o newid cadarnhaol eisoes gael ei digwydd, ond mae'r amser wedi dod i weithredu'n wleidyddol gadarn.

Er mwyn sicrhau gwneud gwelliannau, rhaid sicrhau bod ystyriaeth ddifrifol o ganlyniadau amgylcheddol yn rhan o bob proses o wneud penderfyniadau yng Nghymru. Rhaid gwneud rhywbeth i wrthsefyll cyflymdra'r newid. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer ohonom o'r farn mai gwaith rhywun arall yw hynny. Mae angen rheoleiddio cadarn ac effeithiol, ond ni all rheoleiddio ar ei ben ei hun newid agweddau nac ymddygiad pobl. Mae gwella ddealltwriaeth o faterion amgylcheddol a'r rhan y gall unigolion ei chwarae yn allweddol i sicrhau gwelliannau amgylcheddol

for all.

I know that some carbon emissions cannot be avoided, but it is worrying that the 10 warmest years on record have all occurred since the 1990s. By 2080, Wales will be, on average, 1.1 degrees C to 2 degrees C warmer than at present. However, before you rush for your sun cream and head down to the beach, it will also mean that sea levels will rise, submerging many coastal areas and islands. Rainfall will increase dramatically and there will be more frequent storms.

I am sure that everyone here is aware of the campaign to grant fair-trade status to towns and cities, but is everyone aware that a similar campaign is underway to make communities carbon neutral? Carbon-neutral status can be applied to almost anything—companies, events, products or services. The status represents the point at which greenhouse gas emissions have been assessed, reduced where possible, and the remaining non-reducible emissions offset through high-quality renewable energy. Projects such as these can provide the necessary community spirit and energy to make a difference, instilling the importance of preserving our environment into people's minds and making it a part of everyday life.

No discussion of Wales's environment would be complete without a focus on energy production. Although I recognise the need for a mix of renewable energy sources in the UK, currently only 4 per cent of UK power comes from renewable energy sources. Wind power has a role to play not only in generating energy, but in regenerating and building communities. There is no doubt that wind power is a hot political topic these days, and not just in Wales. However, I feel that we should be concentrating on the arguments for, rather than against, its use. There are opportunities for individuals and communities to have a direct stake in renewable energy generation in their local areas by collectively owning a windfarm development. These ventures have proven to operate not only successfully, but profitably. Wind power has to form an essential

hirdymor a gwella ansawdd bywyd i bawb.

Gwn na ellir osgoi rhyddhau rhywfaint o garbon, ond mae'n peri pryder fod y 10 blwyddyn gynhesaf erioed i gyd wedi digwydd ers yr 1990au. Erbyn 2080, bydd Cymru, ar gyfartaledd, 1.1 gradd C i 2 radd C yn gynhesach nag y mae ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, cyn ichi estyn am eich eli haul a mynd i'r traeth, bydd hefyd yn golygu y bydd lefelau'r môr yn codi, gan foddni nifer o ardaloedd arfordirol ac ynysoedd. Bydd llawer mwy o law a stormydd amlach.

Yr wyf yn siŵr fod pawb yma'n gwybod am yr ymgyrch i roi statws masnach deg i drefi a dinasoedd. Ond a yw pawb yn gwybod bod ymgyrch debyg ar droed i sicrhau bod cymunedau'n niwtral o ran carbon? Gellir cymhwyso'r statws niwtral o ran carbon i bron unrhyw beth—cwmnïau, digwyddiadau, cynhyrchion neu wasanaethau. Mae'r statws yn cynrychioli'r pwynt lle y mae gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr wedi'u hasesu, wedi'u gostwng o bosibl, a ble y mae'r gollyngiadau sy'n weddill ac na ellir eu gostwng wedi'u gwrthbwyso drwy ynni adnewyddadwy o safon uchel. Gall prosiectau fel y rhain ddarparu'r ysbryd a'r egni cymunedol angenrheidiol i wneud gwahaniaeth, gan sicrhau bod pobl yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd gwarchod ein hamgylchedd a sicrhau ei fod yn rhan o fywyd pob dydd.

Ni fyddai unrhyw drafodaeth am amgylchedd Cymru yn gyflawn heb ganolbwyntio ar gynhyrchu ynni. Er fy mod yn cydnabod bod angen cael cyfuniad o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy yn y DU, ar hyn o bryd 4 y cant yn unig o bŵer y DU a ddaw o ffynonellau ynni adnewyddadwy. Mae gan bŵer gwynt ran i'w chwarae, nid yn unig wrth gynhyrchu ynni ond hefyd wrth adfywio a datblygu cymunedau. Mae pŵer gwynt yn ddiau yn bwnc gwleidyddol poblogaidd y dyddiau hyn, ac nid yng Nghymru'n unig. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf y dylem fod yn canolbwyntio ar y dadleuon dros ei ddefnyddio, yn hytrach na'r dadleuon yn ei erbyn. Mae cyfleoedd i unigolion a chymunedau chwarae rhan uniongyrchol yn y broses o gynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy yn eu hardaloedd lleol, drwy fod yn berchen ar ddatblygiad fferm wynt ar y cyd. Mae'r

component of the UK's energy jigsaw if we are serious about sustainable development.

Following on from this, with rapid developments being made in microgeneration, including through solar panels, wood-fuelled boilers and wind turbines, homeowners are now able to put their money where their mouths are. Our homes consume 30 per cent of the energy used in Britain. It is a sizeable slice of our shared contribution to greenhouse gas emissions. At another level, property developers must be compelled to incorporate energy-saving devices, and to comply with tougher environmental standards, in all new developments. Older homes should be given energy makeovers. Perhaps that is something for television companies to think about.

The transport sector accounts for over 20 per cent of the UK's total carbon dioxide emissions. In order to get more cars off our roads, I am excited by a new development that I have seen of lightweight suburban railways, which have half the weight and a third of the energy consumption and cost of an equivalent tram. The lightweight railcars can run on branch lines and independent railways and can be a huge asset in beating congestion.

It is easy to point the finger of blame at certain sectors, but, in reality, we all have a part to play. It only by taking an integrated approach that we can deliver real benefits to the environment. Tackling this issue will take a concerted effort across the political spectrum. I know that waste reduction is one of the Assembly Government's priorities, and I am pleased that the Government supported the post of a business waste adviser in Cardiff, so that businesses can receive specialist advice on becoming environmentally friendly. More generally, a transformation in how householders deal with waste is needed across Wales. We must make it easier for people to recycle so that it is part of the domestic routine of every house in Wales. Some local authorities, as we have often heard in the Chamber, are performing

mentrau hyn wedi gweithredu nid yn unig yn llwyddiannus, ond yn broffidiol. Rhaid i bŵer y gwynt fod yn rhan hanfodol o'r darlun ynni yn y DU os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn â datblygu cynaliadwy.

Yn dilyn hyn, gyda datblygiadau cyflym ym maes microgynhyrchu, gan gynnwys drwy baneli solar, bwyleri sy'n defnyddio tanwydd coed a thyrbinau gwynt, gall perchenogion cartrefi bellach roi eu harian ar eu gair. Ein cartrefi sy'n defnyddio 30 y cant o'r ynni a ddefnyddir ym Mhrydain. Mae'n gyfran fawr o'n cyfraniad i ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Ar lefel arall, rhaid gorfodi datblygwyr eiddo i gynnwys dyfeisiau arbed ynni, ac i gydymffurfio â safonau amgylcheddol llymach, ym mhob datblygiad newydd. Dylid adnewyddu cartrefi hŷn o ran eu defnydd o ynni. Efallai fod hynny'n rhywbeth i gwmnïau teledu feddwl amdano.

Mae'r sector trafniadaeth yn cyfrif am fwy nag 20 y cant o gyfanswm gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid y DU. Er mwyn sicrhau bod llai o geir ar ein ffyrdd, mae yna ddatblygiad newydd cyffrous yr wyf wedi'i weld, sef rheilffyrdd maestrefol ysgafn, sy'n pwysu hanner cymaint â thram cyfatebol, sy'n defnyddio traean yr ynni a ddefnyddir gan dram cyfatebol ac sy'n costio traean cymaint â thram cyfatebol. Gall rheilgeir ysgafn redeg ar linellau cangen a rheilffyrdd annibynnol, a gallant fod yn ased enfawr i atal tagfeydd.

Mae'n hawdd rhoi'r bai ar rai sectorau, ond mewn gwirionedd, mae gennym i gyd ran i'w chwarae. Trwy geel dull integredig yn unig y gallwn sicrhau manteision gwirioneddol i'r amgylchedd. Bydd mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn gofyn am ymdrech ar y cyd ar draws y rhychwant gwleidyddol. Gwn fod lleihau gwastraff yn un o flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yr wyf yn falch fod y Llywodraeth wedi cefnogi swydd cynghorydd gwastraff busnes yng Nghaerdydd, fel y gall busnesau gael cyngor arbenigol ar fod yn fwy caredig i'r amgylchedd. Yn fwy cyffredinol, mae angen trawsnewid y ffordd y mae deiliaid cartrefi'n ymdrin â gwastraff ledled Cymru. Rhaid inni ei gwneud yn haws i bobl ailgylchu er mwyn iddo fod yn rhan o drefn pob cartref yng Nghymru. Mae rhai awdurdodau lleol, fel yr

well, with recycling rates of around 30 per cent. However, others are lagging dramatically behind.

I remain disappointed—and I have told the Minister this on several occasions—that we are not considering the autoclave recycling system, which involves cooking the waste, and then using devices to remove the recyclable material and further reduce the remaining organic material, some of which can be used to produce electricity.

5.20 p.m.

Globalisation and telecommunications may be making the world a smaller place, but we can make a huge difference at the local level. I was given a wake-up call recently when I learned that the vast blocks of ice in photographs taken last year of Canadian seal hunting—which is horrific, although licensed in Canada—have disappeared this year, making it difficult for the seals to give birth. Many of the seals are aborting. This is a huge problem, but it is not too huge for individuals to do something about it. We must work together at all levels.

If we want to encourage sustainable development across the globe, we must first set a good example in Wales. We have to find ways of implementing sustainable technology and sustainable values in the modern world. Lifestyles can be balanced and changed to suit without significant disturbance. We are all responsible for our actions and we are all affected as a result of them. As such, as individuals, we have now become environmental managers. Our actions today determine what our children and grandchildren will inherit tomorrow.

We have the opportunity to be innovative in Wales and to make real and lasting improvements to our environment. We must embrace these initiatives. I know that there are many other measures that can be taken, but whatever they may be, we need a sure commitment followed by effective action. We have the opportunity to showcase Wales as a leading environmentally-friendly nation,

ydym wedi clywed yn aml yn y Siambr, yn perfformio'n dda, gyda chyfraddau ailgylchu o tua 30 y cant. Fodd bynnag, mae eraill ar ei hôl hi'n sylweddol.

Yr wyf yn siomedig o hyd—ac yr wyf wedi dweud hyn wrth y Gweinidog droeon—am nad ydym yn ystyried y system ailgylchu awtoclaf, sy'n golygu coginio'r gwastraff ac yna ddefnyddio dyfeisiau i dynnu'r deunydd y gellir ei ailgylchu a lleihau'r deunydd organig sy'n weddill ymhellach, fel y gellir defnyddio rhywfaint ohono i gynhyrchu trydan.

Efallai fod globaleiddio a thelathrebu yn gwneud y byd yn llai, ond gallwn wneud gwahaniaeth enfawr yn lleol. Synnais yn ddiweddar pan ddysgais fod y blociau mawr o iâ mewn lluniau o hela morloi yn Canada a dynnwyd y llynedd—sy'n arswydus, er ei fod wedi'i drwyddedu yn Canada—wedi diflannu eleni, gan ei gwneud yn anodd i forloi roi genedigaeth. Mae nifer o'r morloi yn erthylu. Mae hon yn broblem enfawr, ond nid yw'n rhy fawr i unigolion wneud rhywbeth yn ei chylch. Rhaid inni gydweithio ar bob lefel.

Os ydym am annog datblygu cynaliadwy ledled y byd, rhaid inni osod esiampl dda yng Nghymru yn gyntaf. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffyrdd i weithredu technoleg gynaliadwy a gwerthoedd cynaliadwy yn y byd sydd ohoni. Gellir cydbwysu ffyrdd o fyw a'u newid yn ôl yr angen heb fawr o darfu. Mae pob un ohonom yn gyfrifol am ein camau gweithredu, ac mae canlyniad pob un ohonynt yn effeithio arnom. Yn hyn o beth, fel unigolion, yr ydym erbyn hyn yn rheolwyr amgylcheddol. Mae'r hyn a wnawn heddiw yn effeithio ar yr hyn y bydd ein plant a'n hwyron a'n hwyresau yn ei etifeddu yfory.

Mae gennym y cyfle i fod yn arloesol yng Nghymru a gwneud gwelliannau gwirioneddol a pharhaol i'n hamgylchedd. Rhaid inni groesawu'r mentrau hyn. Gwn fod nifer o fesurau eraill y gellir eu cymryd, ond beth bynnag ydynt, mae angen gwneud ymrwymiad pendant ac wedyn cymryd camau gweithredu effeithiol. Mae gennym y cyfle i ddangos Cymru fel cenedl

setting the pace for changes across the globe. After all, these measures are not just for Wales, but for the benefit of the whole world.

Alun Ffred Jones: Croesawaf y drafodaeth, a chytunaf â phopeth a ddywedodd Lorraine Barrett. Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w gwneud. Soniodd Lorraine am arbed ynni, yn arbennig o fewn ein cartrefi. Yn ddiâu, mae hyn o fewn gallu'r Llywodraeth i wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch o safbwynt adeiladau a godir o'r newydd a hen adeiladau. Mae'n rhaid inni gymryd hyn o ddifrif os ydym am leihau'n dibyniaeth ar ynni.

Yn ail, o safbwynt cynhyrchu ynni, mae dewisiadau anodd o'n blaenau, sy'n cynnwys ynni niwclear, y syniad o forglawdd Môr Hafren, a'r ynni gwynt, fel y bu Lorraine yn sôn. Dylwn gyfeirio at brofiad Anglesey Aluminium Metal Cyf, y mae Môn mor ddibynnol arno, a'r posibilrwydd i gael gorsaf i gynhyrchu trydan drwy ddefnyddio bio-màs. Credaf y dylai'r Llywodraeth a phawb arall ymuno yn yr ymdrech honno, nid yn unig i arbed swyddi ond i gynhyrchu trydan mewn modd mwy cynaliadwy na'r hyn sy'n digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

The Deputy Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Tamsin Dunwoody): I thank Lorraine for the debate today, and Alun Ffred Jones for his contribution. You are absolutely right; our environment in Wales is a key asset and it is completely unique. I am completely biased on that matter. Not only do we have a beautiful environment, but the whole issue underpins our health, economy and our quality of life, which is why we must always be aware of the issues that you have raised.

There is mounting evidence that our actions as individuals and as a society place unfair burdens on our natural systems and their ability to cope. Therefore, we have to look at building a sustainable future for Wales and we need to manage those pressures as we do so.

I was pleased to hear you mention the environment strategy for Wales, which is the framework document that sets out our

ecogyfeillgar flaenllaw, sy'n dangos y ffordd ar gyfer newidiadau yn fyd-eang. Wedi'r cyfan, nid i Gymru'n unig y mae'r mesurau hyn, ond er mwyn y byd yn gyfan.

Alun Ffred Jones: I welcome the debate and I agree with everything that Lorraine Barrett has said. I have two points to make. Lorraine mentioned energy saving, particularly in our homes. There is no doubt that it is within the competence of the Government to do something about this in terms of new and old buildings. We must take this seriously if we are to reduce our dependence on energy.

Secondly, in terms of energy production, there are difficult decisions ahead of us, including nuclear energy, the idea of a Severn barrage, and wind power, as Lorraine mentioned. I should mention the experience of Anglesey Aluminium Metal Ltd, upon which Anglesey is so dependent, and the possibility of having an electricity-producing station using biomass. I think the Government and all of us should join in that effort, not just in order to safeguard jobs, but in order to produce electricity in a more sustainable way.

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Tamsin Dunwoody): Diolch i Lorraine am y ddadl heddiw, ac i Alun Ffred Jones am ei gyfraniad. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle; mae ein hamgylchedd yng Nghymru yn ased allweddol ac mae'n gwbl unigryw. Yr wyf yn credu hynny'n wirioneddol. Nid yn unig y mae gennym amgylchedd hardd, ond mae'r holl fater yn ategu ein hiechyd, ein heconomi a'n hansawdd bywyd, a dyma pam y mae'n rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol drwy'r amser o'r materion a godwyd gennych.

Mae tystiolaeth gynyddol fod ein gweithredoedd fel unigolion ac fel cymdeithas yn gosod beichiau annheg ar ein systemau naturiol a'u gallu i ymdopi. Felly, rhaid inni anelu at ddatblygu dyfodol cynaliadwy i Gymru, ac mae angen inni reoli'r pwysau hynny wrth inni wneud hynny.

Yr wyf yn falch ichi gyfeirio at y strategaeth amgylcheddol ar gyfer Cymru, sef y ddogfen fframwaith sy'n gosod allan ein hymrwymiad

commitment to meet those challenges. It recognises the importance of the environment, not just for its own sake but for the vital services that it provides us. It highlights the challenges that we face and our vision.

However, there is also good news. You will be aware that, recently, 79 per cent of our rivers monitored for chemicals were assessed as of good biological quality. All 80 of our bathing water areas, monitored by the Environment Agency, met European standards, and a record 91 per cent met the more stringent guideline standards. Our own performance indicators demonstrate that, collectively, local government in Wales achieved 19.4 per cent of our recycling targets, which puts it well on target to meet the 25 per cent requirement, and the further 40 per cent requirement for 2010. We also have air quality improvements, but we face further challenges, as you have said. The seven key challenges that we have established, which we have named in the environment strategy, are climate change, as you mention, unsustainable resource use, degraded eco-systems, the loss of biodiversity, the loss of landscape, heritage quality and distinctiveness, poor quality local environments, and environmental hazards. Those are all issues that we need to consider.

However, climate change is possibly one of the greatest challenges that we face, not just in Wales, but across the world. The consequences that you highlight in the increase in temperature are significant. We need to reduce our greenhouse gas emissions, not just here in Wales, as I said, but in the UK. The UK is well on its way to meeting its targets as agreed as part of the Kyoto protocol. The last figures, published in January 2006, show that UK emissions are 14.6 per cent below the base-year levels in 2004. Therefore, we are moving in the right direction. The Assembly is working closely with the UK Government, as well as with other devolved administrations, such as Scotland, to achieve the Kyoto targets.

i ateb yr heriau hynny. Mae'n cydnabod pwysigrwydd yr amgylchedd, nid er ei fwyn ei hun yn unig ond oherwydd y gwasanaethau hollbwysig a ddarpara. Mae'n tynnu sylw at yr heriau a wynebwn a'n gweledigaeth.

Fodd bynnag, mae yna newyddion da hefyd. Fe wyddoch fod 79 y cant o'n hafonydd sy'n cael eu monitro am gemegion wedi eu hasesu o safon biolegol da mewn asesiad yn ddiweddar. Cyrhaeddodd pob un o'r 80 o'n hardaloedd dŵr ymdrochi, a fonitryd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd, safonau Ewropeaidd, a chyrrhaeddodd 91 y cant, sef y ganran uchaf erioed, y safonau canllaw llymach. Mae ein dangosyddion perfformiad ein hunain yn dangos bod llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, ar y cyd, wedi cyrraedd 19.4 y cant o'n targedau ailgylchu, sy'n golygu ei bod ar y trywydd cywir i fodloni'r gofyniad o 25 y cant, a'r gofyniad pellach o 40 y cant ar gyfer 2010. Gwelwyd gwelliannau yn ansawdd yr aer hefyd, ond yr ydym yn wynebu heriau pellach, fel y dywedasoeh. Y saith her allweddol a bennwyd gennym ac a enwyd gennym yn y strategaeth amgylcheddol yw newid yn yr hinsawdd, fel y nodwyd gennych, defnyddio adnoddau'n anghynaliadwy, ecosystemau wedi'u diraddio, colli bioamrywiaeth, colli tirwedd, ansawdd treftadaeth a natur unigryw, amgylcheddau lleol o ansawdd gwael, a pheryglon amgylcheddol. Mae'r rheini i gyd yn faterion y mae angen inni eu hystyried.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl mai newid yn yr hinsawdd yw un o'r heriau mwyaf a wynebwn, nid yng Nghymru'n unig, ond yn fyd-eang. Mae'r canlyniadau yr ydych yn tynnu sylw atynt o ran tymheredd uwch yn sylweddol. Mae angen inni leihau ein gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr, nid yn unig yma yng Nghymru, fel y dywedais, ond yn y DU. Mae'r DU ar y trywydd cywir i gyrraedd y targedau y cytunwyd arnynt fel rhan o brotocol Kyoto. Mae'r ffigurau diwethaf, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Ionawr 2006, yn dangos bod gollyngiadau'r DU 14.6 y cant yn is na lefelau blwyddyn sylfaenol 2004. Felly, yr ydym yn symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'r Cynulliad yn cydweithio'n agos â Llywodraeth y DU, yn ogystal â gweinyddiaethau datganoledig eraill, megis yr Alban, i gyrraedd targedau Kyoto.

As you highlighted, we expect to see impacts in Wales as a result of climate change. For example, it is not just hotter summers and beach visits, but risk of flooding, changing water levels, and increasing temperatures, which not only have an impact on the geographical landscape, but also on the potential for health and biodiversity. That includes disease management, and looking at the changes that our animals and wildlife also face. Furthermore, in terms of people movement around the world, there are potential impacts from climate change and changing temperatures, where vulnerable communities may well move. Therefore, we need to be aware of all these issues. The environment strategy action plan contains several actions aimed at tackling that climate change.

On unsustainable resource use, you mentioned packaging, and you have mentioned plastic carrier bags in the past. We are aware that, if the level of resources that we use in Wales was to be used in the rest of the world, there would have to be three planets to support our current use, because we have a significant level of usage. Therefore, we need to address those through a more sustainable pattern of consumption, as well as waste minimisation, as you say. The environment strategy, the business and environment action plan, and our sustainable development scheme and action plan all address those.

Nearly every local authority across Wales now has some form of kerbside collection. As I stated earlier, most of those are now on board in terms of looking to meet their targets. However, the responsibility for recycling often rests with us as individuals, and we lead by example on that.

The carrier bags issue is interesting. Scotland has a private Member's Bill that is about to go through. Ireland has been an interesting example, and we are awaiting an assessment of the impact of its recent changes in legislation. I realise that plastic carrier bags are an extremely visible form of waste, but they only make up 0.3 per cent of the

Fel yr oeddech yn tynnu sylw, disgwyliwn weld effeithiau yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i newid yn yr hinsawdd. Er enghraifft, nid dim ond hafau poethach ac ymweliadau cynhesach i'r traeth, ond perygl llifogydd, lefelau dŵr yn newid a thymereddau uwch a gaiff effaith nid yn unig ar y dirwedd ddaearyddol, ond hefyd ar y potensial o ran iechyd a bioamrywiaeth. Mae hynny'n cynnwys rheoli clefydau, ac ystyried y newidiadau y mae anifeiliaid a bywyd gwyllt yn eu hwynebu hefyd. Yn ogystal, o gofio bod pobl yn symud o amgylch y byd, mae yna effeithiau posibl yn sgîl newid yn yr hinsawdd a thymereddau sy'n newid, lle y gall cymunedau diamddiffyn symud. Felly, mae angen inni fod yn ymwybodol o'r holl faterion hyn. Mae cynllun gweithredu'r strategaeth amgylcheddol yn cynnwys nifer o gamau gweithredu sydd â'r nod o fynd i'r afael â'r newid hwnnw yn yr hinsawdd.

O ran defnyddio adnoddau'n anghynaliadwy, yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at becynnu, ac yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at fagiau plastig yn y gorffennol. Gwyddom, pe câr adnoddau a ddefnyddiwn yng Nghymru eu defnyddio yng ngweddill y byd, y byddai angen tair planed i gynnal ein defnydd presennol, am ein bod yn defnyddio llawer o adnoddau. Felly, mae angen inni ymdrin â hynny drwy gyfrwng patrwm defnyddio mwy cynaliadwy, yn ogystal â lleihau gwastraff, fel y dywedwch. Mae'r strategaeth amgylcheddol, y cynllun gweithredu busnes a'r amgylchedd, a'n cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy a'n cynllun gweithredu i gyd yn mynd i'r afael â'r rhain.

Mae gan bron pob awdurdod lleol ledled Cymru bellach ryw fath o gasgliad ar ymyl ffordd. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r rhain yn mynd ati i gyrraedd eu targedau. Fodd bynnag, ni fel unigolion yn aml sy'n gyfrifol am ailgylchu, ac yr ydym yn arwain drwy esiampl yn hynny.

Mae mater bagiau plastig yn ddiddorol. Mae gan yr Alban Fesur Aelod Preifat sydd ar fin gael ei basio. Mae Iwerddon wedi bod yn enghraifft ddiddorol, ac yr ydym yn disgwyl am asesiad o effaith ei newidiadau diweddar mewn deddfwriaeth. Sylweddolaf fod bagiau plastig yn fath gweladwy iawn o wastraff, ond dim ond 0.3 y cant o'r ffrwd gwastraff

domestic waste stream, which is small. Therefore, it will be interesting, because, as you say, there was a direct impact when Ireland took that action. We need to have that assessed.

Improving energy efficiency, and promoting renewable energy, are key to us in the Welsh Assembly Government, not only in our 'Energy Saving Wales' action plan, but also, again, in the environment strategy. There is an increasing onshore and offshore wind capacity, as well as a marine energy, biomass and solar power capacity. We are considering all these issues, and encouraging investment in them.

Presently, about 300 MW of wind power are currently installed in Wales. Through technical advice note 8, you will be aware that there are strategic search areas, and that this issue is being considered. Like you, I was impressed with the demonstration that we saw of the wind community renewable energy project. Bro Dyfi Community Renewables Ltd is a good example of that type of community issue. Again, it is a sign of the community that carries forward the success of microgeneration and renewable energy.

It is unfortunate that Alun Ffred Jones has just left the Chamber. He mentioned nuclear industry, as well as the Severn barrage. We have put both those issues on the table with the UK Government, and they will be part of the overall UK review. Our energy route map will not be published until later in the year, but these are certainly issues that are well worth mentioning. As I say, microgeneration is on the table and a consultation exercise on that is going on at present; so, again, it is particularly important.

5.30 p.m.

You touched on transport. We will shortly be publishing our transport strategy for Wales, and that, very specifically, touches on climate change, the reduction of carbon emissions, and looking at the ability we have as a Government to move towards green transport, but again ensuring that the general public are on board with those issues. You

domestig ydynt, sy'n fach. Felly, bydd yn ddiddorol, oherwydd, fel y dywedwch, cafwyd effaith uniongyrchol pan gymerodd Iwerddon y camau hynny. Mae angen inni gael asesiad o hynny.

Mae gwella effeithlonrwydd ynni, a hyrwyddo ynni adnewyddadwy, yn allweddol inni yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, nid yn unig yn ein cynllun gweithredu 'Arbed Ynni Cymru', ond hefyd, unwaith eto, yn y strategaeth amgylcheddol. Mae yna adnoddau gwynt cynyddol ar y tir ac ar y môr, yn ogystal ag ynni'r môr, bio-màs ac adnoddau pŵer yr haul. Yr ydym yn ystyried yr holl faterion hyn, ac yn annog buddsoddi ynddynt.

Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 300 MW o bŵer gwynt sydd wedi ei osod yng Nghymru. Drwy nodyn cyngor technegol 8, fe wyddoch fod yna ardaloedd chwilio strategol, ac y caiff y mater hwn ei ystyried. Fel chi, gwnaed argraff arnaf gan yr arddangosiad a welsom o brosiect ynni adnewyddadwy cymunedol. Mae Bro Ddyfi Community Renewables Ltd yn enghraifft dda o'r math hwnnw o fater cymunedol. Unwaith eto, mae'n arwydd fod y gymuned yn datblygu llwyddiant microgynhyrchu ac ynni adnewyddadwy.

Mae'n anffodus fod Alun Ffred Jones newydd adael y Siambr. Soniodd am y diwydiant niwclear, yn ogystal â morglawdd Hafren. Yr ydym wedi trafod y ddau fater hynny gyda Llywodraeth y DU, a byddant yn rhan o adolygiad cyffredinol y DU. Ni chaiff ein map llwybr ynni ei gyhoeddi tan yn ddiweddarach yn y flwyddyn, ond mae'n sicr ei bod yn werth crybwyll y materion hyn. Fel y dywedais, caiff microgynhyrchu ei drafod, ac mae ymgynghori ar hynny yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd; felly, unwaith eto, mae'n arbennig o bwysig.

Cyfeiriwyd gennych at drafnidiaeth. Byddwn yn cyhoeddi ein strategaeth drafnidiaeth i Gymru cyn hir, ac mae honno'n cyfeirio'n benodol iawn at newid yn yr hinsawdd, gostwng gollyngiadau carbon ac ystyried ein gallu fel Llywodraeth i symud tuag at drafnidiaeth werdd, ond unwaith eto gan sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cefnogi'r materion

touched on light rail suburban railways; we do not have any in Wales at present, but, as a Government, we are always happy to look at those as part of the overall package of reducing carbon emissions. Recently, I was in Strasbourg where there are very good examples of trams and public transport bus services, which are extremely efficient and highly used. So, there are possibilities for moving that forward. Again, on the transport issue, we fund local travel plan co-ordinators in each of our regional transport consortia to ensure that we have local travel plans worked up. These are issues that are constantly on the table.

You touched on construction and the use of the planning system and these are all issues that we as a Government are looking at in detail. I could talk about this for hours, but I will finish now and thank you, in particular, for bringing these issues forward. You have raised a number of important areas, and I welcome the further discussion that we will have on this matter.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

hynny. Cyfeirlech at reilffyrdd maestrefol ysgafn; nid oes gennym rai yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd, ond fel Llywodraeth yr ydym bob amser yn fodlon ystyried y rhain fel rhan o'r pecyn cyffredinol o ostwng gollyngiadau carbon. Bûm yn Strasbourg yn ddiweddar, lle y mae enghreifftiau da iawn o dramiau a gwasanaethau bws trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, sy'n effeithlon iawn ac sy'n cael eu defnyddio'n heleth. Felly, mae posibiladau ar gyfer datblygu hynny. Unwaith eto, o ran trafndiaeth, yr ydym yn ariannu cydgysylltwyr cynlluniau teithio rhanbarthol ym mhob un o'n consortia trafndiaeth rhanbarthol, er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym gynlluniau teithio lleol. Caiff y materion hyn eu trafod drwy'r amser.

Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at adeiladu a defnyddio'r system gynllunio, ac yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth yn ystyried yr holl faterion hyn yn fanwl. Gallwn siarad am hyn am oriau, ond yr wyf am ddod i ben yn awr a diolch ichi, yn arbennig, am godi'r materion hyn. Yr ydych wedi codi nifer o feysydd pwysig, a chroesawaf y drafodaeth bellach a gawn ar y mater hwn.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.31 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.31 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)