



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 21 Mehefin 2006
Wednesday, 21 June 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 20 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport
- 36 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth
Drosiannol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional
Provision) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006
- 38 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllun Pensiwn Dynion Tân (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Firefighters' Pension (Wales) Scheme (Amendment) Order 2006
- 42 Yr Adroddiad Blynyddol ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy
The Annual Report on the Sustainable Development Scheme
- 73 Dadl Fer: Archfarchnadoedd—Bendith neu Felltith?
Short Debate: Supermarkets—Jolly Green Giants or Incredible Hulks?
- 85 Dadl Fer: Trefnu ar gyfer Trychineb—Ad-drefnu Ysbytai yn y Canolbarth a'r
Gorllewin
Short Debate: Designed for Disaster—Hospital Reconfiguration in Mid and West
Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

**Gwasanaethau'r GIG
NHS Services**

Q1 Catherine Thomas: Will the Minister make a statement on the provision of NHS services in mid and west Wales? OAQ0939(HSS)

C1 Catherine Thomas: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau'r GIG a ddarperir yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0939(HSS)

Q10 Helen Mary Jones: What recent discussions has the Minister had with local health boards regarding the provision of NHS services in mid and west Wales? OAQ0905(HSS)

C10 Helen Mary Jones: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol ynglŷn â darparu gwasanaethau'r GIG yn y canolbarth a gorllewin Cymru? OAQ0905(HSS)

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): It would be inappropriate for me to comment on the details of 'Designed for Life' with regard to mid and west Wales, but any change must be measured against the ambition of delivering sustainable, safe, world-class health and social care by 2015 for all residents.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Byddai'n amhriodol imi roi sylwadau ar fanylion 'Cynllun Oes' mewn perthynas â'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin, ond rhaid mesur unrhyw newid yn erbyn yr uchelgais o ddarparu gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol cynaliadwy, diogel o'r radd flaenaf i bob preswlydd erbyn 2015.

Catherine Thomas: While I appreciate that you are not able to comment on the substance of the acute services review, I want to ask a question on the process of consultation. Do you share my concern and that of my constituents and Llanelli rural and town councillors that requests for a second public meeting, following one that was held about a month ago, to discuss the review have been denied? While health managers have agreed to organise a health panel-style meeting, they will not agree to the more traditional public meeting, which many of my constituents find to be a more accessible and inclusive way of holding discussions. Can you suggest a way forward to secure the meeting that my constituents deserve in order to discuss issues that could potentially have serious impacts on our hospital in Llanelli?

Catherine Thomas: Er fy mod yn gwerthfawrogi na allwch roi sylwadau ar sylwedd yr adolygiad o wasanaethau aciwt, hoffwn ofyn cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r broses ymgynghori. A ydych chi, fel finnau a'm hetholwyr a chynghorwyr cymunedau gwledig a threfol Llanelli, yn pryderu am fod ceisiadau i gynnal ail gyfarfod cyhoeddus, yn dilyn yr un a gynhaliwyd tua mis yn ôl, i drafod yr adolygiad wedi'u gwrthod? Er bod rheolwyr iechyd wedi cytuno i drefnu cyfarfod iechyd ar ffurf panel, ni wnânt gytuno ar y cyfarfod cyhoeddus mwy traddodiadol sydd, ym marn nifer o'm hetholwyr, yn ffordd fwy cyfleus a chynhwysol i gynnal trafodaethau. A allwch awgrymu ffordd ymlaen i sicrhau cynnal y cyfarfod y mae fy etholwyr yn ei haeddu, er mwyn trafod materion a allai o bosibl gael effeithiau difrifol ar ein hysbyty yn Llanelli?

Brian Gibbons: I know that you are involved in the local situation and that, in working with the committee for the

Brian Gibbons: Gwn eich bod yn ymwneud â'r sefyllfa leol, ac thrwy weithio gyda'r pwyllgor i wella gwasanaethau ysbyty yn

improvement of hospital services in Llanelli, you have been involved in the consultation process. The consultation process in mid and west Wales has been considerable, and I understand that literally thousands of people have turned up to consultation meetings, and I am grateful to those members of the public who have taken the time to do that. There is, as you say, a round-table consultation taking place today. However, it is important that people do have confidence in the process, as well as having confidence in the outcome of any consultation process. I will, therefore, having heard your remarks, go to the project board team and see whether there is any way of accommodating your request. Clearly, because I am not personally or ministerially responsible for the consultation process, I cannot give any guarantee, but I can certainly convey the strength of view that you expressed.

Helen Mary Jones: In your response to Catherine Thomas, you said that you are not ministerially responsible for this process. Technically, that is correct. However, when I have asked you about these matters before, you have asked me to speak to the local health boards. I have now done so, and they have made it clear to me that the agenda and the timetable for this process is driven entirely by demands from your officials—I cannot say whether it is driven by demands from you—and not from the local health boards themselves. Do you acknowledge that, in communities across mid and west Wales—we cite Llanelli and would also cite Withybush—the population feels that it is being railroaded? Will you review the timetable for this review, with the LHBs, so that proper consultation can not only be done, but can be seen to be done?

Brian Gibbons: As I said to Catherine, it is important that the public has confidence in the process as well as the outcome, and a key element of that is that they feel that they have been properly engaged in the process. You will be aware that I have extended the period of consultation by another month to give

Llanelli, yr ydych wedi bod yn ymwneud â'r broses ymgynghori. Bu ymgynghori sylweddol yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, a deallaf fod miloedd o bobl wedi mynychu'r cyfarfodydd ymgynghori, ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r aelodau hynny o'r cyhoedd sydd wedi rhoi o'm hamser i wneud hynny. Fel yr oeddech yn dweud, mae ymgynghori ford gron yn cael ei gynnal heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig i bobl fod yn hyderus yn y broses, yn ogystal â chael hyder yng nghanlyniad unrhyw broses ymgynghori. Felly, ar ôl clywed eich sylwadau, byddaf yn cysylltu â thîm bwrdd y prosiect i weld a oes unrhyw ffordd y gellir ateb eich cais. Yn amlwg, gan nad wyf yn gyfrifol yn bersonol nac fel gweinidog am y broses ymgynghori, i allaf roi unrhyw warant, ond yn sicr gallaf gyfleu cryfder y farn a fynegwyd gennych.

Helen Mary Jones: Yn eich ymateb i Catherine Thomas, yr oeddech yn dweud nad ydych yn gyfrifol am y broses hon yn rhinwedd eich swydd fel gweinidog. Mae hynny'n dechnegol gywir. Fodd bynnag, pan wyf wedi eich holi ynglŷn â'r materion hyn yn y gorffennol, yr ydych wedi gofyn imi siarad â'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr wyf wedi gwneud hynny'n awr, ac maent wedi pwysleisio bod agenda ac amserlen y broses hon yn cael eu llywio'n gyfan gwbl gan alwadau eich swyddogion—ni allaf ddweud a ydynt yn cael eu llywio gan eich galwadau chi—ac nid gan y byrddau iechyd lleol eu hunain. A ydych yn cydnabod, mewn cymunedau ledled y canolbarth a'r gorllewin—gan gynnwys Llanelli a Llwynhelyg hefyd—fod y boblogaeth yn teimlo bod y broses yn cael ei gorfodi'n rhy gyflym? A wnewch chi adolygu'r amserlen ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwn gyda'r Byrddau Iechyd Lleol, fel y gellir sicrhau nid yn unig bod proses ymgynghori gywir yn cael ei chynnal, ond y gellir gweld ei bod yn cael ei chynnal?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y dywedais wrth Catherine, mae'n bwysig i'r cyhoedd fod yn hyderus yn y broses yn ogystal â'r canlyniad, a rhan allweddol o hynny yw eu bod yn teimlo'u bod wedi'u cynnwys yn llawn yn y broses. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori am fis arall er

people the opportunity to make their voices heard. Equally, I have offered a number of groups the opportunity to have access to my officials to allow them to explore particular areas of development that they felt that they might not reasonably be able to develop within their own resources. We have tried to facilitate consultation to the maximum extent. As I told Catherine, the fact that thousands of people turned up to the consultation meetings shows that there is interest, and that people are voting with their feet by turning up at those meetings. However, I do hear the message that has been given and, while I cannot make any adjudication on it, I must take that on board as part of any consideration of the final outcome.

Helen Mary Jones: It is interesting that you can extend the timescale of a process over which you have no ministerial responsibility, Minister, but I will leave that to one side for a moment. Would you agree that part of the reason for the public reaction to this process is because people are being asked to accept what they perceive to be cuts when there is no parallel package for the reprovisioning of services in the community? Do you agree that it might be wise to freeze this process until local health boards can come up with a costed, clear plan of those services that they will reprovide in the community, so that we can give people some good news if they have to accept some changes to their hospital services?

Brian Gibbons: As I said to Catherine, I am not in a position to order the project board to extend the consultation period; all that I can do is make a request. Some lobbying groups came to the Assembly three or four weeks ago, and clearly conveyed the message to me that they felt that the consultation period was not long enough, so I took that away and conveyed that sentiment to the project team, as I have agreed to do for Catherine Thomas. It listened to my feedback, and it agreed to extend the consultation period. If it had said, 'Sorry, the time is up and that is it', I would have had to live with it, just like everyone else. However, it is committed to the process.

mwyn rhoi'r cyfle i bobl fynegi eu barn. Yn ogystal, yr wyf wedi cynnig y cyfle i nifer o grwpiau ddefnyddio fy swyddogion i'w galluogi i archwilio meysydd datblygu penodol y maent yn teimlo na allant efallain eu datblygu'n rhesymol o fewn eu hadnoddau eu hunain. Yr ydym wedi gwneud ein gorau i hwyluso'r ymgynghori. Fel y dywedais wrth Catherine, mae'r ffaith fod miloedd o bobl wedi mynychu'r cyfarfodydd ymgynghori yn dangos bod diddordeb, a bod pobl yn pleidleisio â'u traed drwy fynychu'r cyfarfodydd hynny. Fodd bynnag, clywaf y neges sydd wedi'i chyfleu, ac er na allaf roi unrhyw ddyfarniad arni, rhaid imi ei hystyried fel rhan o'r broses o unrhyw broses ystyried y canlyniad terfynol.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n ddiddorol eich bod, Weinidog, yn gallu ymestyn amserlen proses nad oes gennych unrhyw gyfrifoldeb drosti fel gweinidog, ond gosodaf hynny o'r neilltu am funud. A gytunwch mai rhan o'r rheswm dros ymateb y cyhoedd i'r broses hon yw bod gofyn i bobl dderbyn yr hyn a hystyriant yn doriadau pan nad oes unrhyw becyn cyfatebol ar gyfer ailddarparu gwasanaethau yn y gymuned? A gytunwch y gallai fod yn ddoeth gohirio'r broses hon nes gall byrddau iechyd lleol lunio cynllun clir wedi'i gostio o'r gwasanaethau hynny y byddant yn eu hailddarparu yn y gymuned, fel y gallwn roi rhywfaint o newyddion da i bobl os yw'n rhaid iddynt dderbyn rhai newidiadau yn eu gwasanaethau ysbyty?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y dywedais wrth Catherine, nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i orchymyn bwrdd y prosiect i ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori; yr unig beth y gallaf ei wneud yw gwneud cais. Ymwelodd rhai grwpiau lobio â'r Cynulliad dair neu bedair wythnos yn ôl, a chyflewyd y neges glir imi eu bod yn teimlo nad oedd y cyfnod ymgynghori yn ddigon hir. Felly, nodais eu sylwadau a'u cyfleu i dîm y prosiect, fel yr wyf wedi cytuno i'w wneud ar gyfer Catherine Thomas. Gwrandawodd y tîm ar fy ymateb, a chytunodd i ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori. Pe bai wedi dweud, 'Mae'n flin gennym, mae'r amser wedi dod i ben a dyna ben', byddwn wedi gorfod derbyn hynny, fel pawb arall. Fodd bynnag, mae wedi ymrwymo i'r broses.

One of the pressing issues in relation to your point is that a considerable amount of work is under way in communities as we speak—I am sure that we will have time to go into that in greater depth later this evening. Equally, there is an imperative that we cannot ignore: the European working times directive. It will have to be complied with by 2009; otherwise, we will be in breach of the EU requirements. There are some musts that we have to work to deliver within the timeframe, and the European working times directive places some constraints on the timeframe in which we are trying to engage with this process, some of which are not entirely within our control. Given that situation, there is a certain urgency for the hospital centre to address its reconfiguration problems with a view to its being fit for purpose when the working times directive comes into force in 2009. We cannot get away from that.

Lisa Francis: When the First Minister visited Aberystwyth recently, he gave an assurance to protestors fighting proposals to downgrade Bronglais General Hospital's services that he would provide them with expert help, which would allow local people to bring forward various options. In the light of the First Minister's pledge, what subsequent discussions have you had with Ceredigion Local Health Board to bring these changes about?

Brian Gibbons: The only people with whom I have had direct consultation, along the lines that you suggest, are those from the deputation that came here from Pembrokeshire, and not from Aberystwyth. Therefore, it was in consultation with the people who I understood were representing lobbyists from Pembrokeshire. I explained to them that I would ask local health board officials to make themselves available to provide whatever information they felt was necessary for them to work up alternative options. I have not written to Ceredigion Local Health Board, but I have written to the Save Withybush Action Team group in Pembrokeshire to formally confirm what I had told them verbally when we met informally in the Assembly. As part of yesterday's debate, which perhaps I should

Un o'r materion pwysig mewn perthynas â'ch pwynt yw bod llawer iawn o waith yn mynd rhagddo mewn cymunedau ar hyn o bryd—yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd amser yn caniatáu inni drafod hynny'n fanylach yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma. Yn ogystal, mae yna fater hollbwysig na allwn ei anwybyddu: sef cyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewrop. Bydd yn rhaid cydymffurfio â'r gyfarwyddeb erbyn 2009, neu byddwn yn torri gofynion yr UE. Mae rhai pethau y mae'n rhaid inni weithio tuag at eu cyflawni o fewn y terfyn amser, ac mae cyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewrop yn gosod rhai cyfyngiadau ar y terfyn amser sydd gennym i geisio ymgysylltu â'r broses hon, gan gynnwys rhai nad ydynt yn llwyr o dan ein rheolaeth. O ystyried y sefyllfa honno, mae angen i'r ganolfan ysbyty fynd i'r afael â'i phroblemau ail-gyflunio ar frys, gyda'r bwriad o fod yn addas at y diben pan ddaw'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith i rym yn 2009. Ni allwn anwybyddu hynny.

Lisa Francis: Pan ymwelodd y Prif Weinidog ag Aberystwyth yn ddiweddar, rhoddodd sicrwydd i brotestwyr sy'n brwydro yn erbyn cynigion i israddio gwasanaethau Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bron-glais y byddai'n darparu help arbenigol iddynt, a fyddai'n galluogi pobl leol i gyflwyno amrywiol ddewisiadau. Yn sgîl addewid y Prif Weinidog, pa drafodaethau dilynol yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Ceredigion i gyflwyno'r newidiadau hyn?

Brian Gibbons: Yr unig bobl yr wyf wedi ymgynghori'n uniongyrchol â hwy, ar hyd y llinellau a awgrymwch yw'r rheini ddirprwyaeth a ddaeth yma o sir Benfro, ac nid o Aberystwyth. Felly, ymgynghorais â'r bobl y deallais eu bod yn cynrychioli lobiwyr o sir Benfro. Esboniais wrthynt y byddwn yn gofyn i swyddogion y bwrdd iechyd lleol sicrhau eu bod ar gael i ddarparu pa wybodaeth bynnag y credent y byddai ei hangen i lunio dewisiadau amgen. Nid wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Ceredigion, ond yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at grŵp Tîm Gweithredu Achub Llwynhelyg yn sir Benfro i gadarnhau'n ffurfiol yr hyn a ddywedais wrthynt ar lafar pan fu inni gyfarfod yn anffurfiol yn y Cynulliad. Fel rhan o'r ddadl a gynhaliwyd ddoe, na ddylwn sôn amdani efallai, clywsom ychydig

not really return to, we heard some slight misinformation. It was said by David Lloyd—and Elin Jones, to an extent—that there were proposals to decimate hospital services in Bronglais. That is not the case. The key challenge in Bronglais is to have resilient local general hospital services in place. As part of that, we need to put changes in place to ensure that hospital provision in Bronglais is able to continue in line with the requirements of the working times directive standards and clinical governance arrangements. Even though I cannot prejudge the outcome of the consultation, as I said in my previous answer, any outcome must be based on the criterion of delivering quality services in a sustainable way. That will be my sole criterion if I am asked to evaluate the outcome if there is no local agreement.

2.10 p.m.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): One of the key services delivered in mid and west Wales is the ambulance service. We are increasingly hearing reports that ambulance stations are being left without cover for days on end, and that staff in other stations are being asked to work on their own, making it difficult for them to provide a full and comprehensive service. I accept that it is quite challenging to deliver a comprehensive ambulance service in such a vast, rural area, but will you give us two assurances? First, will you examine cases where no cover is available or where only one member of staff is on duty, and, secondly, will you respond to the claim made by Roger Thayne that, in view of the geography of Wales, it might be impossible for a single Welsh ambulance service to deliver a full service?

Brian Gibbons: There were two or three questions there. First, if we look at what has happened in Staffordshire, which, by many parameters, has a good performing ambulance service, some notable factors exist that may not operate in Wales. The first is the use made of single-staffed vehicles: the number of single-staffed vehicles used in Staffordshire is much higher. This was something that Roger Thayne saw as a

wybodaeth anghywir. Dywedodd David Lloyd—ac Elin Jones, i ryw raddau—fod cynigion i gael gwared ar wasanaethau ysbyty ym Mron-glais. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Yr her allweddol o ran Bron-glais yw sicrhau bod gwasanaethau ysbyty cyffredinol lleol cadarn ar waith. Fel rhan o hynny, mae angen inni roi newidiadau ar waith i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth yn ysbyty Bron-glais yn gallu parhau'n unol â gofynion safonau a threfniadau llywodraethu clinigol y gyfarwydddeb ar oriau gwaith. Er na allaf ragfarnu canlyniad y broses ymgynghori, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb blaenorol, rhaid i unrhyw ganlyniad fod yn seiliedig ar y maen prawf o ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Dyna fydd fy unig faen prawf os gofynnir imi werthuso'r canlyniad os na cheir cytundeb lleol.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Un o'r gwasanaethau allweddol a ddarperir yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yw'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Clywn adroddiadau'n gynyddol fod gorsafoddd ambiwlans yn cael eu gadael heb staff am ddiwrnodau bwy gilydd, a bod gofyn i staff mewn gorsafoddd eraill weithio ar eu pen eu hunain, sy'n ei gwneud yn anodd iddynt ddarparu gwasanaeth llawn a chynhwysfawr. Derbynïaf fod darparu gwasanaeth ambiwlans cynhwysfawr mewn ardal wledig mor eang yn dipyn o her, ond a wnewch chi roi sicrwydd inni ar ddau gyfrif? Yn gyntaf, a wnewch chi archwilio achosion lle nad oes staff ar gael o gwbl, neu lle nad oes ond un aelod staff sydd ar ddyletswydd? Ac yn ail, a wnewch chi ymateb i'r honiad a wnaed gan Roger Thayne sef, o ystyried daearyddiaeth Cymru, y gallai fod yn amhosibl i un gwasanaeth ambiwlans ddarparu gwasanaeth llawn yng Nghymru?

Brian Gibbons: Yr oedd dau neu dri chwestiwn yn hynny. Yn gyntaf, os edrychwn ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn Swydd Stafford sydd, yn ôl sawl paramedr, â gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n perfformio'n dda, mae yno rai ffactorau nodedig nad ydynt efallai yn gweithredu yng Nghymru. Y cyntaf yw'r defnydd a wneir o gerbydau ag un aelod o'r staff: mae nifer y cerbydau ag un aelod o'r staff ynddynt lawer yn uwch yn Swydd

weakness in the Welsh ambulance service. One of the recommendations, or suggestions, that he made is that we need to move to more single-staffed rapid-response vehicles.

Equally, he pointed out that one of the reasons why the ambulance service in Wales was struggling to achieve efficiency was that its estate was out of date and was much too substantial. He pointed out that any comparison between the estate in Wales and that in Staffordshire did not compare very well. He was making the point that, if we are to have effective deployment of ambulance services, it would not be correct to station them in individual stations, as you suggest. They need to be dynamically deployed across Wales, in line with where demand is forthcoming. That is why a great priority has been placed on immediate investment in satellite navigation equipment for the ambulance service in Wales, as well as vehicle location technology to deliver a more effective and dynamic deployment, rather than have ambulances waiting in stations.

The point that you made in relation to regional delivery of ambulance services is in line with emerging thinking in the developing emergency care services project. In responding to emergency services in the DECS project, we are taking the view that emergency and unscheduled care should be provided on a regional basis. That is in line with what Roger Thayne is saying, namely that a central, single command-and-control model is not appropriate in Wales. This is very much the conclusion that we are coming to in delivering emergency care services; hopefully, the conclusions will go out for consultation within the next few weeks.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): Some two weeks ago, I visited the West Wales General Hospital at Glangwili, Carmarthen, and I have since written to you specifically about the dialysis service there. You will be aware of grave concerns about the condition of facilities where people are dialysing. That is no

Stafford. Yr oedd hyn yn rhywbeth a ystyriwyd gan Roger Thayne yn wendid yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru. Un o'r argymhellion, neu'r awgrymiadau, a wnaeth yw bod angen inni symud tuag at ddefnyddio mwy o gerbydau ymateb cyflym ag un aelod o'r staff ynddynt.

Yn ogystal, eglurodd mai un o'r rhesymau pam mae'r bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru yn ei chael hi'n anodd bod yn effeithlon oedd bod ei ystâd wedi mynd yn hen ac yn rhy sylweddol o lawer. Eglurodd nad oedd cymharu'r ystâd yng Nghymru a'r ystâd yn Swydd Stafford yn gymhariaeth dda iawn. Y pwynt yr oedd yn ei wneud oedd hyn: os ydym i gael defnyddio gwasanaethau ambiwlans effeithiol, ni fyddai'n gywir eu lleoli mewn gorsafoedd unigol, fel yr awgrymwch. Mae angen eu defnyddio mewn ffordd ddeinamig ledled Cymru, yn unol â'r galw. Dyna pam y rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth fawr i fuddsoddiad uniongyrchol mewn offer tywys drwy loeren ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, yn ogystal â thechnoleg lleoli cerbydau er mwyn eu defnyddio mewn ffordd fwy effeithiol a deinamig, yn hytrach na bod cerbydau ambiwlans yn aros mewn gorsafoedd.

Mae'r pwynt a wnaethoch ynglŷn â darparu gwasanaethau ambiwlans rhanbarthol yn unol â syniadau sy'n datblygu yn y prosiect datblygu gwasanaethau gofal mewn argyfwng. Wrth ymateb i wasanaethau brys yn y prosiect DECS, yr ydym yn ystyried y dylid darparu gofal mewn argyfwng a gofal heb ei drefnu ar sail ranbarthol. Mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r hyn y mae Roger Thayne yn ei ddweud, sef nad yw un model gorchymyn a rheoli canolog yn briodol yng Nghymru. Dyna'r casgliad yr ydym yn dod iddo o ran darparu gwasanaethau gofal mewn argyfwng; gobeithio y caiff y casgliadau eu cyhoeddi i ymgynghori o fewn yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Tua phythefnos yn ôl, ymwelais ag Ysbyty Cyffredinol Gorllewin Cymru yng Nglangwili, Caerfyrddin, ac ers hynny yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch yn benodol ynglŷn â'r gwasanaeth dialysis yno. Fel y gwyddoch, mae pryderon mawr ynglŷn â chyflwr y cyfleusterau yn y manau lle caiff pobl

criticism of the people offering the service or of the hospital, generally—it is an excellent hospital—but the portakabin in which people are dialysing was originally designed to cater for 37 patients; there are now 80 patients using it every week. There is no privacy, there are often people in distress, and there is only one disabled toilet. I am told that there is nowhere else in the hospital that they can use, but it is becoming an extremely serious situation. Has the Minister had discussions with the trust, and can he update us on his attitude towards what I think is an unacceptable situation for those patients?

Brian Gibbons: I had discussions with the trust when I visited Glangwili hospital a number of months ago, and I have had separate discussions and exchanged correspondence with the Welsh Kidney Patients' Association on the same matter. The situation is that we expect that facility to be open possibly by June 2007. The opening was put back somewhat because the original plan was to provide a stand-alone renal dialysis unit, but, as part of that project was developing, it was recognised that there was also an opportunity there to put in an additional cardiac unit to provide enhanced services at Glangwili hospital. Both of those facilities were going to be provided within the same block. Consequently, because the cardiac unit would have to be built at the same time as the dialysis facility, it was felt that it would not be appropriate to move the dialysis facility in until the work was completed on the cardiac unit. Hopefully, by June 2007, as I said, Carmarthenshire will have an up-to-date modern new renal dialysis facility, and, linked to that, a new modern cardiac unit as well.

driniaeth dialysis. Nid yw hynny'n feirniadaeth ar y bobl sy'n cynnig y gwasanaeth nac ar yr ysbyty, yn gyffredinol—mae'n ysbyty ardderchog—ond cynlluniwyd y caban lle mae pobl yn cael triniaeth dialysis yn wreiddiol i drin 37 o gleifion; bellach mae 80 o gleifion yn ei ddefnyddio bob wythnos. Nid oes preifatrwydd, yn aml mae yno bobl mewn trallod, ac un tŷ bach i'r anabl yn unig sydd ar gael. Dywedwyd wrthyf nad oes unman arall yn yr ysbyty y gallant ei ddefnyddio, ond mae'n mynd yn broblem ddirifol iawn. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi cael trafodaethau gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth, ac a all roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am ei agwedd at yr hyn a gredaf fi sy'n sefyllfa annerbyniol i'r cleifion hynny?

Brian Gibbons: Cefais drafodaeth gyda'r ymddiriedolaeth pan ymwelais ag ysbyty Glangwili rai misoedd yn ôl, a chefais drafodaethau ar wahân gyhebais â hi ar yr un mater. Y sefyllfa yw ein bod yn disgwyl y bydd y cyfleuster hwnnw ar agor erbyn mis Mehefin 2007 o bosibl. Gohiriwyd yr agoriad ryw ychydig oherwydd mai'r cynllun gwreiddiol oedd darparu uned dialysis arenol annibynnol. Ond gan fod rhan o'r prosiect hwnnw yn datblygu, cydnabuwyd bod cyfle hefyd i gynnwys uned gardiaidd ychwanegol i ddarparu gwell gwasanaethau yn ysbyty Glangwili. Bwriadwyd cynnwys y ddau wasanaeth hynny yn yr un bloc. O ganlyniad, oherwydd y byddai'n rhaid adeiladu'r uned gardiaidd ar yr un pryd â'r cyfleuster dialysis, teimlwyd na fyddai'n briodol symud y cyfleuster dialysis nes byddai'r gwaith ar yr uned gardiaidd wedi ei orffen. Fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd gan sir Gaerfyrddin gyfleuster dialysis arenol newydd modern erbyn mis Mehefin 2007, ac yn gysylltiedig ag ef uned gardiaidd fodern newydd hefyd.

Ad-drefnu Ysbytai The Reorganisation of Hospitals

Q2 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister make a statement on the reorganisation of hospitals in north Wales? OAQ0899(HSS)

C2 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ad-drefnu ysbytai yn y gogledd? OAQ0899(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: The north Wales health community is currently leading a consultation

Brian Gibbons: Mae cymuned iechyd y gogledd yn arwain ymgynghoriad ar hyn o

exercise, which was initially due to end at the end of June. It would be inappropriate, therefore, for me to comment on the detail of that consultation process. I have already mentioned the situation in Mid and West Wales, and I was asked to see whether the period of this consultation could be extended. When I spoke to the project team, it said that it was willing to allow the consultation period to continue for another month.

Eleanor Burnham: I am obliged to you for that answer, as that is good news for us all. However, proposals put forward by the north Wales secondary care review have met with massive public opposition, as you may or may not know, particularly in terms of the relocation and closure of hospitals because of distances and inadequate transport in north Wales. When the consultation concludes—and I am pleased that it will carry on for another month—and the health board refers the decision to you, and in light of the lack of public support for these proposals across north Wales, will you seek to impose one of the five current proposals on an unwilling public, or will you seek a more acceptable solution for our long-suffering north-Wales constituents?

Brian Gibbons: As I said before, whatever settlement comes out of north Wales will be judged on the same criteria by which I would have to judge the situation in Mid and West Wales. I am not automatically involved in adjudication if there is local agreement, but, in the event of local disagreement, I would be involved. The challenges for north Wales in many respects are no different from those in Mid and West Wales in ensuring that patients have safe, secure, high-quality health and social care services in hospitals and in the community. A key element of that will be compliance, or the ability to comply, with the working times directive in 2009. Therefore, as far as I am concerned, it would be preferable if there were local agreement in north Wales on the basis of what is the best way forward. However, if that agreement is not there, particularly from the local community health councils, I will have to look at the evidence and come to a decision.

Ann Jones: I welcome your commitment

bryd y bwriadwyd yn wreiddiol iddo ddod i ben ddiwedd mis Mehefin. Felly, byddai'n amhriodol imi roi sylwadau ar fanylion yr ymgynghori hwnnw. Yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y sefyllfa yn y canolbarth ac yn y gorllewin, a gofynnwyd imi weld a ellid ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori. Pan siaradais â thîm y prosiect, dywedwyd ei fod yn fodlon ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori am fis arall.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am yr ateb hwnnw, gan fod hynny'n newyddion da i bawb. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cyhoedd wedi dangos gwrthwynebiad chwyrn i'r cynigion a gyflwynwyd gan yr adolygiad gofal eilaidd yn y gogledd, fel y gwyddoch, hwyrach, yn enwedig o ran symud a chau ysbytai oherwydd pellteroedd teithio a chludiant annigonol yn y gogledd. Pan fydd yr ymgynghori'n dod i ben—ac yr wyf yn falch y bydd yn parhau am fis arall—a phan fydd y bwrdd iechyd yn cyfeirio'r penderfyniad atoch, ac yng ngoleuni'r ffaith nad oes cefnogaeth gyhoeddus i'r cynigion hyn ledled y gogledd, a fyddwch yn ceisio gorfodi un o'r pum cynnig presennol ar y cyhoedd anfodlon, neu a fyddwch yn ceisio cael ateb mwy derbyniol ar gyfer ein hetholwyr amyneddgar yn y gogledd?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y dywedais eisoes, caiff pa setliad bynnag a ddaw o'r gogledd ei farnu yn ôl yr un meini prawf ag y byddai'n rhaid imi farnu'r sefyllfa yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Ni fyddaf yn ymwneud yn awtomatig â'r broses ddyfarnu os oes cytundeb lleol, ond os byddai anghytuno, byddwn yn rhan o'r broses honno. Nid yw'r heriau ar gyfer y gogledd yn wahanol i'r rheini yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin ar lawer ystyr, o ran sicrhau bod cleifion yn cawel gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol diogel o safon. Elfen allweddol yn hynny fydd cydymffurfio, neu'r gallu i gydymffurfio â'r gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith yn 2009. Felly, o'm rhan i, byddai'n well pe bai cytundeb lleol yn y gogledd am y ffordd orau ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, os na ellir cytuno ar hynny, yn enwedig ymhlith y cynghorau iechyd cymuned lleol, bydd yn rhaid imi edrych ar y dystiolaeth a gwneud penderfyniad.

Ann Jones: Yr wyf yn croesawu'ch

that the consultation period will be extended by a month. However, I am concerned by the way in which the consultation process has been carried out so far. In this extra month that you have given for this consultation, will you ensure that we get out into those communities that are most affected, and will you instruct your officials, or the community health council, which many people in north Wales do not have much regard for when it comes to consultation processes, following the issue in Prestatyn with Chatsworth House, to ensure that the consultation is meaningful and that as many people as possible are reached and can put forward their views as they feel appropriate?

2.20 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: Clearly, there are constraints on what I can order people to do if it is to be a legitimate, independent consultation process that is not subject to political manipulation. One of the challenges for us all is to ensure that the solutions that we put in place are sustainable, can deliver quality services, and are not seen as a quick political fix. One way in which we can assure north Wales residents, as well as those in Mid and West Wales, that this is not going to be a quick political fix is by the consultation process being truly independent of us as politicians, and being driven very much by those involved in healthcare delivery in north Wales, both clinicians and managers. It is important that the public has confidence in the process and the outcome and, as I said to Catherine Thomas, I have heard what you said and I will be pleased to convey your sentiments to the team leading the consultation process. Equally, I have to put in the caveat that I cannot order the team to do anything, for the reasons that I have already outlined.

The Presiding Officer: Question 3, OAQ0902(HSS), has been withdrawn.

ymrwymiad i ymestyn y cyfnod ymgynghori am fis. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu ynghylch y ffordd y gweithredwyd yr ymgynghori hyd yn hyn. Yn ystod y mis ychwanegol hwn yr ydych wedi'i bennu ar gyfer yr ymgynghori hwn, a sicrhewch y byddwn yn ymweld â'r cymunedau hynny yr effeithir arnynt fwyaf, ac a rowch gyfarwyddyd i'ch swyddogion, neu'r cyngor iechyd cymuned, nad oes gan lawer o bobl yn y gogledd lawer o barch ato wrth drafod yr ymgynghori, yn dilyn y broblem ym Mhrestatyn gyda Tŷ Chatsworth, i sicrhau bod yr ymgynghori'n ystyrlon ac yn cyrraedd cynifer o bobl â phosibl, a'u bod yn gallu cyflwyno'u sylwadau fel y teimlant yn briodol?

Brian Gibbons: Yn amlwg, mae cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn y gallaf orchymyn pobl i'w wneud er mwyn i hyn fod yn ymgynghori annibynnol, dilys nad yw gwleidyddion yn dylanwadu arno. Un o'r heriau i bob un ohonom yw sicrhau bod yr atebion a rown ar waith yn gynaliadwy, y gallant ddarparu gwasanaethau o safon, ac na chânt eu hystyried yn atebion gwleidyddol cyflym. Un ffordd y gallwn roi sicrwydd i drigolion y gogledd, yn ogystal â thrigolion yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, nad ateb gwleidyddol cyflym fydd hwn yw drwy sicrhau bod yr ymgynghori'n wirioneddol annibynnol arnom fel gwleidyddion, ac y caiff ei lywio'n bennaf gan y rheini sy'n ymwneud â darparu gofal iechyd yn y gogledd, yn glinigwyr ac yn rheolwyr. Mae'n bwysig i'r cyhoedd fod yn hyderus am y broses a'r canlyniad, ac fel y dywedais wrth Catherine Thomas, yr wyf wedi clywed yr hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddweud, a byddaf yn falch cyfleu eich teimladau i'r tîm sy'n arwain yr ymgynghori. Yn yr un modd, rhaid imi nodi'r cafeat na allaf orchymyn y tîm i wneud unrhyw beth, am y rhesymau a amlinellais eisoes.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 3, OAQ0902(HSS) yn ôl.

Triniaeth Osteoporosis Osteoporosis Treatment

Q4 Lorraine Barrett: Will the Minister **C4 Lorraine Barrett:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog

make a statement on the provision of treatment for osteoporosis in Wales? OAQ0925(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: We are currently consulting on an all-Wales arthritis and musculoskeletal strategy, which will help to ensure the provision of high-quality, integrated services for people with arthritis and chronic musculoskeletal disorders, including osteoporosis. The national service framework for older people in Wales also addresses the risks associated with osteoporosis.

Lorraine Barrett: With over 1,000 deaths occurring every year in Wales due to osteoporosis, and the cost of hip fractures alone being £84 million, what can you do to ensure that nurses and general practitioners who have a specific interest in osteoporosis are given the necessary support?

Brian Gibbons: That is why the commissioning framework, which we have launched for consultation, is so important. It should be a robust mechanism by which proper commissioning should take place. If that is done, the services should be available. We also need to link in to our waiting times targets. We acknowledge in our imaging and scanning strategy that we need to have more diagnostic facilities, such as DEXA scanners, available. I went to the opening of a new DEXA scanner facility in Bridgend last year, and I understand that a new DEXA scanner is in the process of being commissioned in north Wales, for Llandudno Hospital.

Jenny Randerson: I am interested in what you say about DEXA scanners, because the National Osteoporosis Society estimates that the commissioning of DEXA scans to cover those at risk of osteoporosis currently averages only one third of the required number of scans in Wales. It points out that this is not just an issue of the number of scanners, but also of the availability of staff time. What is being done to address that problem?

Brian Gibbons: Workforce planning should address that. I know that in north Wales, in particular, the issue is not with providing the

ddatganiad am y driniaeth a ddarperir ar gyfer osteoporosis yng Nghymru? OAQ0925(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Ar hyn o bryd yr ydym yn ymgynghori ar strategaeth Cymru gyfan ar arthritis ac anhwylderau cyhyrsgerbydol, a fydd yn helpu sicrhau darparu gwasanaethau integredig o safon i bobl sydd ag arthritis ac anhwylderau cyhyrsgerbydol cronig, gan gynnwys osteoporosis. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hŷn yng Nghymru hefyd yn mynd i'r afael â'r risgiau sy'n gysylltiedig ag osteoporosis.

Lorraine Barrett: Gan fod dros 1,000 o farwolaethau bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru oherwydd osteoporosis, a'r gost o doriadau clun yn £84 miliwn, beth gallwch ei wneud i sicrhau bod nyrsys ac ymarferwyr cyffredinol sydd â diddordeb penodol mewn osteoporosis yn cael y gefnogaeth angenrheidiol?

Brian Gibbons: Dyna pam mae'r fframwaith comisiynu, a lanswyd ar gyfer ymgynghori, mor bwysig. Dylai fod yn fecanwaith cadarn ar gyfer comisiynu priodol. Os gwneir hynny, dylai'r gwasanaethau fod ar gael. Mae angen inni gysylltu hyn hefyd â'n targedau amseroedd aros. Cydnabyddwn yn ein strategaeth ar ddelweddu a sganio fod angen inni sicrhau bod mwy o gyfleusterau diagnostig, fel sganwyr DEXA, ar gael. Euthum i agoriad cyfleuster sganiwr DEXA newydd ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr y llynedd, a deallaf fod sganiwr DEXA newydd yn cael ei gomisiynu yn y gogledd, ar gyfer Ysbyty Llandudno.

Jenny Randerson: Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn yr hyn a ddywedwch am sganwyr DEXA, gan fod y Gymdeithas Osteoporosis Genedlaethol yn amcangyfrif bod y sganiau DEXA a gomisiynir ar gyfer pobl sydd mewn perygl o gael osteoporosis yn cyfrif am un rhan o dair yn unig o'r sganiau y mae eu hangen yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n dangos nad oes a wnelo hyn â nifer y sganwyr yn unig, ond hefyd â chael staff ar gael. Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem honno?

Brian Gibbons: Dylai gwaith cynllunio gweithlu fynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn y gogledd, yn benodol, gwn nad darparu'r

scanner, but, as you said, with securing staff to operate the scanner. That is why, as part of the wider waiting times strategy, we need to ensure that staff are available to operate the machinery, as well as investing in the machinery to ensure that the equipment available—scanners, in this instance—helps to deliver our waiting times targets, which will be based on clinical need as determined by clinicians in the field.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, you referred earlier to the national service framework for older people. One of the first recommended actions in that NSF is that local health boards should appoint a lead person on osteoporosis. How many LHBs have done that?

Brian Gibbons: I do not have that information to hand, Jenny, so I will write to you to let you know the specific details. It is important to emphasise that, in our general approach to tackling and responding to established osteoporosis, it is equally important that we promote health and wellbeing at a much earlier stage in people's lives, preventing it from becoming a problem that we need to respond to. I think that it is important that, while we need to have the trained staff, the lead officers and the equipment, it is even more important that we put in the health and wellbeing strategies at an earlier stage, through exercise, activity and so on, to prevent osteoporosis from becoming a risk. Clearly, as people begin to live longer, the risk of osteoporosis will increase, simply because of the longevity of the population.

Diddymu Tâl Presgripsiwn The Abolition of Prescription Charges

Q5 Irene James: Will the Minister make a statement on the abolition of prescription charges in Wales? OAQ0945(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Prescription charges in Wales have halved from £6 to £3 during the lifetime of this Government, and we have pledged to abolish them completely by 2007. This makes it easier for patients on modest incomes to have all their medication

sganiwr yw'r broblem, ond, fel yr oeddech yn ei ddweud, mater yw o sicrhau bod staff ar gael i weithio'r sganiwr. Dyna pam, fel rhan o'r strategaeth amseroedd aros ehangach, mae angen inni sicrhau bod staff ar gael i weithredu'r peiriannau, yn ogystal â buddsoddi yn y peiriannau i sicrhau bod yr offer sydd ar gael—sganwyr, yn yr achos hwn—yn helpu cyrraedd ein targedau amseroedd aros, a fydd yn seiliedig ar angen clinigol fel y caiff ei bennu gan glinigwyr yn y maes.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, yr oeddech yn cyfeirio'n gynharach at y fframwaith gwasanaethau cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Un o'r camau gweithredu cyntaf a argymhellir yn y fframwaith hwnnw yw y dylai byrddau iechyd lleol benodi person i arwain ym maes osteoporosis. Sawl BILl sydd wedi gwneud hynny?

Brian Gibbons: Nid yw'r wybodaeth honno gennyf wrth law, Jenny, felly byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch i roi'r union fanylion ichi. Mae'n bwysig pwysleisio, yn ein dull cyffredinol o fynd i'r afael ag osteoporosis sydd wedi datblygu ac ymateb iddo, ei bod hi lawn mor bwysig inni hyrwyddo iechyd a lles yn gynharach ym mywydau pobl, i'w atal rhag dod yn broblem y mae angen inni ymateb iddi. Er bod angen inni gael y staff wedi eu hyfforddi, y swyddogion arwain a'r offer, credaf ei bod yn bwysicach fyth inni roi'r strategaethau iechyd a lles ar waith yn gynharach, drwy ymarfer corff, gweithgarwch, ac ati, er mwyn atal osteoporosis rhag dod yn risg. Yn amlwg, wrth i bobl ddechrau byw'n hwy, bydd risg osteoporosis yn cynyddu, yn syml am fod pobl yn byw'n hŷn.

dispensed, instead of choosing which ones to take on the basis of their affordability.

Irene James: The abolition of prescription charges is a welcome Labour commitment in my constituency, where limiting, long-term health problems are prevalent. However, other charges are incurred through ill health that people feel are unfair costs, such as car parking charges at hospitals throughout the duration of their treatment, which can add up and affect the most vulnerable. What action is being taken to further identify and address overburdening costs incurred by NHS patients?

Brian Gibbons: On the second point, parking charges are obviously an issue for individual hospital trusts. Last year, I received a petition and the results of a consultation document, and it raised a number of these issues. I circulated that to trusts around Wales so that they were fully informed of the difficulty that charges were placing on service users. Ultimately, this is a matter for the trusts to decide, and it would not be appropriate for me at this stage to tell trusts how they should order their finances, not least because of the financial pressures that they may be under at the current time.

feddyginiaeth, yn hytrach na dewis y rhai i'w cymryd yn ôl eu gallu i'w fforddio.

Irene James: Mae diddymu taliadau presgripsiwn yn ymrwymiad Llafur sy'n cael ei groesawu yn fy etholaeth i, lle mae problemau iechyd hirdymor cyfyngol yn gyffredin. Fodd bynnag, mae yna daliadau eraill oherwydd afiechyd y mae pobl yn teimlo'u bod yn gostau annheg, fel taliadau parcio ceir mewn ysbytai pan fyddant yn cael triniaeth, a all fod yn gostus a chael effaith ar y rhai mwyaf diamddiffyn. Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i nodi ymhellach y costau beichus a dynnir gan gleifion y GIG ac i fynd i'r afael â hwy?

Brian Gibbons: O ran yr ail bwynt, mae taliadau parcio'n amlwg yn fater i ymddiriedolaethau ysbytai unigol ei benderfynu. Y llynedd, cefais ddeiseb a chanlyniadau ymgynghori, a chodwyd nifer o'r materion hyn. Dosbarthais hynny i ymddiriedolaethau ledled Cymru er mwyn iddynt fod yn hollol ymwybodol o'r anhawster yr oedd taliadau'n ei beri i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau. Yn y pen draw, penderfyniad yr ymddiriedolaethau yw hyn, ac ni fyddai'n briodol ar hyn o bryd imi ddweud wrth ymddiriedolaethau sut i drefnu eu cyllid, yn bennaf oherwydd y pwysau ariannol a all fod arnynt ar hyn o bryd.

Gordewdra Obesity

C6 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau gordewdra yng Nghymru? OAQ0903(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: In relation to obesity services, the Assembly Government is engaged in a wide range of food and fitness initiatives, from free school breakfast to free swimming for older people, in an effort to tackle the challenges of obesity.

David Lloyd: Gyda gordewdra ar gynydd, pa gynlluniau sydd gyda chi i sefydlu gwasanaeth llawdriniaeth gordewdra?

Brian Gibbons: I think that the National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence's guidelines—which were initially produced in

Q6 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on obesity services in Wales? OAQ0903(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau gordewdra, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd rhan mewn amrywiaeth eang o fentrau bwyd a ffirwydd, o frecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion i nofio am ddim i bobl hŷn, i geisio mynd i'r afael â heriau gordewdra.

David Lloyd: With the increase in obesity, what plans do you have to establish a surgical service for obesity?

Brian Gibbons: Credaf fod canllawiau'r Sefydliad Cenedlaethol dros Iechyd a Rhagoriaeth Glinigol—a gynhyrchwyd yn

2000-02, and are now being updated with a view to being published in February 2007—outline a clear clinical pathway for the management of obesity. The pathway ranges from prevention at an early stage to intensive dietary regimes and drug and pharmaceutical treatment. Surgery is noted as the ultimate treatment for those with no other option, who suffer from morbid obesity, with an indicative body mass index of 50.

2.30 p.m.

Nyrsys Adsefydlu'r Galon Cardiac Rehabilitation Nurses

Q7 Brynle Williams: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of cardiac rehabilitation nurses in Wales? OAQ0897(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: I recognise the importance of cardiac rehabilitation nurses and the contribution that they make. However, the provision of specialist nursing posts, including cardiac rehabilitation nurses, is a matter for individual NHS trusts to determine, on the basis of the needs identified in their local workload plans and clinical need.

Brynle Williams: I declare a personal interest in this issue. I recently discovered at first hand the excellent services provided by the cardiac rehabilitation nurses, whose work in offering counselling, and diet and medicinal advice, is enormously respected and well-intended for the patient. However, given the service's reliance on Lottery funding, which is renewed every three years, does the Minister agree that these essential services deserve the stability of permanent funding under the Minister's portfolio?

Brian Gibbons: Thank you, Brynle. We are all pleased to see you back and looking in good fettle. When the original national service framework on ischemic heart disease was published, the section on cardiac rehabilitation was an area that was probably under-developed. In the revised national service framework, that section has been rewritten to deal with issues such as arrhythmias

wreiddiol yn 2000-02 ac sydd yn awr yn cael eu diweddarau gyda'r nod o'u cyhoeddi ym mis Chwefror 2007—yn amlinellu llwybr clinigol clir i reoli gordewdra. Mae'r llwybr yn amrywio o atal gordewdra'n gynnar i batrymau deiet dwys a thriniaeth cyffuriau a fferylliaeth. Nodir llawdriniaeth fel y driniaeth olaf i'r rheini nad oes ganddynt ddewis arall ac sy'n dioddef gan ordewdra morbid, gyda mynegai más corff dangosol o 50.

C7 Brynle Williams: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyllido nyrsys adsefydlu'r galon yng Nghymru? OAQ0897(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd nyrsys adsefydlu'r galon a'r cyfraniad a wnânt. Fodd bynnag, mater i ymddiriedolaethau unigol y GIG ei benderfynu yw darparu swyddi nyrsio arbenigol, gan gynnwys nyrsys adsefydlu'r galon, ar sail yr anghenion a nodir yn eu cynlluniau llwyth gwaith lleol ac angen clinigol.

Brynle Williams: Hoffwn ddatgan ddi-ddordeb personol yn y mater hwn. Cefais brofiad yn ddiweddar o'r gwasanaethau ardderchog a ddarperir gan nyrsys adsefydlu'r galon. Mae eu gwaith yn cynnig gwasanaeth cwnsela a chyngor ar ddiet a meddyginiaeth, ac mae'n cael ei barchu'n fawr ac yn diwallu anghenion y claf. Fodd bynnag, o gofio am ddibyniaeth y gwasanaeth ar arian Loteri, a adnewyddir bob tair blynedd, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod y gwasanaethau hanfodol hyn yn haeddu sefydlogrwydd cyllid parhaol o dan bortffolio'r Gweinidog?

Brian Gibbons: Diolch, Brynle. Yr ydym i gyd yn falch o'ch gweld yn ôl ac yn edrych mor dda. Pan gyhoeddwyd y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol gwreiddiol ar isgemia'r galon, mae'n debyg nad oedd yr adran ar adsefydlu'r galon yn faes a oedd wedi'i ddatblygu'n digonol. Yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol diwygiedig, mae'r adran honno wedi'i hailysgrifennu i ymdrin â

and so forth, but it is recognised that further editing is needed in relation to rehabilitation nursing. However, there are a fair number of rehabilitation nurses working in north Wales, and a number of inequalities in health projects are also based on work that is going on in community rehabilitation across Wales. A document is out for consultation on exercise referral, which is about developing good practice in Wales, and that should also be an important adjunct to cardiac rehabilitation, in promoting appropriate physical exercise.

materion megis *arrythmia*, ac ati, ond cydnabyddir bod angen ei olygu ymhellach o ran nyrsys adsefydlu. Fodd bynnag, mae cryn nifer o nyrsys adsefydlu yn gweithio yn y gogledd, ac mae nifer o brosiectau anghydraddoldebau iechyd hefyd yn seiliedig ar waith sy'n mynd rhagddo ym maes adsefydlu cymunedol ledled Cymru. Mae ymgynghori'n digwydd ar ddogfen ar atgyfeirio cleifion i wneud ymarfer corff, sy'n ymwneud â datblygu arfer da yng Nghymru, a dylai hefyd fod yn ategiad pysig i adsefydlu'r galon wrth hybu ymarfer corff priodol.

Bwydo ar y Fron Breast-feeding

Q8 Janice Gregory: Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government initiatives to promote breast-feeding in Wales? OAQ0923(HSS)

C8 Janice Gregory: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo bwydo ar y fron yng Nghymru? OAQ0923(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Thank you, Janice; I know that you are very interested in this subject. The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to improving the numbers of mothers in Wales who initiate breast-feeding, as well as to extending the time that they breast-feed their babies. We have appointed a breast-feeding co-ordinator to support the promotion of breast-feeding and the breast-feeding strategy, 'Investing in a Better Start: Promoting Breastfeeding in Wales'.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch, Janice; gwn fod gennych ddi-ddordeb mawr yn y pwnc hwn. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i gynyddu nifer y mamau yng Nghymru sy'n dechrau bwydo ar y fron, yn ogystal ag ymestyn yr amser pan fyddant yn bwydo'u babanod ar y fron. Yr ydym wedi penodi cydgysylltydd bwydo ar y fron i gefnogi hyrwyddo bwydo ar y fron a'r strategaeth bwydo ar y fron, 'Buddsoddi mewn Gwell Cychwyn: Hybu Bwydo ar y Fron yng Nghymru'.

Janice Gregory: You will be aware that low breast-feeding rates are often linked with deprivation and poverty. Recent statistics show that the lowest incidences of breast-feeding are found among mothers from routine and manual occupations, and those with the lowest educational levels. Another challenge is that many new mothers leave hospital quite quickly after giving birth, sometimes within hours, before there has been an opportunity to establish a breast-feeding pattern. Therefore, does the Minister agree that more work needs to be done in hospitals and in aftercare to ensure that mothers, particularly those from less advantaged backgrounds, are encouraged to breast-feed, and that once they begin breast-feeding that they are supported to continue?

Janice Gregory: Fe wyddoch fod cyfraddau isel o fwydo ar y fron yn aml yn gysylltiedig ag amddifadedd a thlodi. Dengys ystadegau'n ddiweddar fod y nifer isaf o achosion o fwydo ar y fron ymhlith mamau o alwedigaethau arferol a galwedigaethau llaw, a'r rheini sydd â'r lefelau addysgol isaf. Her arall yw bod nifer o famau newydd yn gadael yr ysbyty'n fuan ar ôl rhoi genedigaeth, ymhen ychydig oriau weithiau, cyn cael cyfle i sefydlu patrwm bwydo ar y fron. Felly, a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno bod angen gwneud mwy o waith mewn ysbytai ac ym maes ôl-ofal i sicrhau bod mamau, yn enwedig y rheini o gefndiroedd llai breintiedig, yn cael eu hannog i fwydo ar y fron, ac ar ôl iddynt ddechrau gwneud hynny eu bod yn cael eu cefnogi i barhau?

Brian Gibbons: You are right; there is a stark social gradient in breast-feeding, and if we are committed to giving our children the best start in life, breast-feeding must be part of that overall strategy. It not only helps psychologically, but many physical illnesses benefit from it. It is even possible that osteoporosis in mothers may be reduced by breast-feeding, which links to an earlier question. We are working with the United Nations Children's Fund UK's baby-friendly initiative in hospitals across Wales, and, already, seven hospitals are compliant with best practice. You will be pleased to know that the Princess of Wales Hospital in Bridgend is one such hospital. I am equally pleased that another such hospital is the Neath Port Talbot Hospital, in my constituency. There are six more maternity units working towards compliance with the UNICEF standards, so, hopefully, we will see approximately 60 per cent to 70 per cent of new babies in Wales born into units that are able to deliver best practice, as outlined in the baby-friendly initiative. In terms of sustaining breast-feeding, the current strategy of promoting breast-feeding in public places, which we launched a few weeks ago, to try to get rid of some of the stigma associated with that, makes an important contribution. The fact that mothers cannot breast-feed in particular places, such as cafés and other public amenities, without the risk of being stigmatised is a big problem. The breast-feeding welcome scheme, which is to be promoted across Wales, will, hopefully, contribute towards not only making breast-feeding the normal option, but positively facilitating its practice in public places.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle; mae graddiant cymdeithasol amlwg o ran bwydo ar y fron, ac os yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i roi'r dechrau gorau mewn bywyd i'n plant, rhaid i fwydo ar y fron fod yn rhan o'r strategaeth gyffredinol honno. Nid yn unig y mae'n helpu'n seicolegol, ond mae o fudd gyda llawer math o salwch corfforol. Mae hyd yn oed yn bosibl y gallai osteoporosis mewn mamau fod yn llai drwy fwydo ar y fron, sy'n cysylltu â chwestiwn cynharach. Yr ydym yn cydweithio â menter sy'n garedig i fabanod yn y DU gan Gronfa Blant y Cenhedloedd Unedig mewn ysbytai ledled Cymru, ac eisoes mae saith ysbyty yn cydymffurfio ag arfer gorau. Byddwch yn falch clywed bod Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr yn un o'r ysbytai hynny. Yr wyf yr un mor falch fod Ysbyty Castell-nedd Port Talbot, sydd yn fy etholaeth i, yn un arall. Mae chwe uned famolaeth arall yn gweithio tuag at gydymffurfio â safonau UNICEF. Felly, y gobaith yw y gwelwn tua 60 y cant i 70 y cant o fabanod newydd yng Nghymru yn cael eu geni mewn unedau sy'n gallu sicrhau arfer gorau, fel yr amlinellir yn y fenter sy'n garedig i fabanod. O ran cynnal bwydo ar y fron, mae'r strategaeth bresennol o hybu bwydo ar y fron mewn mannau cyhoeddus, a lansiwyd gennym ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, i geisio dileu rhywfaint o'r stigma sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny, yn gyfraniad pwysig. Mae'r ffaith na all mamau fwydo ar y fron mewn mannau penodol, megis caffis ac amwynderau cyhoeddus eraill, heb wynebu risg cael eu stigmatiddio yn broblem fawr. Gobeithio y bydd y cynllun i groesawu bwydo ar y fron, a gaiff ei hybu ledled Cymru, nid yn unig yn cyfrannu at wneud bwydo ar y fron yn ddewis normal, ond yn ei hwyluso'n gadarnhaol mewn mannau cyhoeddus.

Gwasanaethau Gofal yn y Gymuned Community Care Services

Q9 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on community care services in South Wales West? OAQ0911(HSS)

C9 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau gofal yn y gymuned yng Ngorllewin De Cymru? OAQ0911(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: The legal responsibility for assessing and commissioning social care services rests with local authorities. The

Brian Gibbons: Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfreithiol gyfrifol am asesu a chomisiynu gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol.

Assembly Government's responsibility is to provide the policy framework, guidance, regulation, national minimum standards and inspection regime to support such services. Planning the provision and delivery of NHS care within a community setting is the responsibility of local health boards.

Peter Black: You will, of course, be aware that the current proposals by the Swansea Local Health Board to close Fairwood hospital and ward 1 of Hill House are based on the supposition that those services will be picked up by additional community care services. However, no additional money seems to be being made available by the local health board for that. In fact, the services that they are relying upon are still in the pilot stage. If these proposals go ahead, and, as a result, additional costs are placed on the local authority social services department, do you think that the Assembly should give the City and County of Swansea Council additional money to pick up the additional costs that it will have to meet as a result of the LHB not consulting or involving it in this process?

Brian Gibbons: Clearly, this issue may not achieve local resolution and I could ultimately have an adjudicative role in this matter, so I cannot present a definitive view on how this is developing. However, it should be recognised that we have supplied an extra £45 million this year to allow adult social care services to be improved, and we know that spending on adult social services has increased by some 40 to 60 per cent in total over recent years.

We need to move away from the mentality that it is not possible to effect change without putting money into the system. Often, inefficient and old-fashioned services are not only not good enough for patients, but the more expensive option. Often by modernising the service, you give patients a better service from the point of view of meeting their needs and free up resources to allow the delivery of better quality services for older people. I do not think that the initial instinct in following any modernisation agenda should be to come to the Assembly,

Cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw darparu'r fframwaith polisi, canllawiau, rheoliadau, safonau cenedlaethol gofynnol a chyfundrefn arolygu i gefnogi gwasanaethau felly. Byrddau iechyd lleol sy'n gyfrifol am gynllunio darparu a chyflwyno gofal y GIG mewn cymunedau.

Peter Black: Fe fyddwch, wrth gwrs, yn gwybod bod cynigion presennol Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Abertawe i gau ysbty Fairwood a ward 1 yn Hill House yn seiliedig ar y dybiaeth y bydd y gwasanaethau hynny'n cael eu darparu gan wasanaethau gofal cymunedol ychwanegol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymddangos bod unrhyw arian ychwanegol yn cael ei ddarparu gan y bwrdd iechyd lleol ar gyfer hynny. Yn wir, mae'r gwasanaethau y mae'n dibynnu arnynt yn dal i gael eu treialu. Os gweithredir y cynigion hyn, ac os bydd adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yr awdurdod lleol o ganlyniad yn tynnu costau ychwanegol, a ydych yn credu y dylai'r Cynulliad roi arian ychwanegol i Gyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i dalu'r costau ychwanegol a fydd ganddo am fod y BILL wedi methu ymgynghori neu ei gynnwys yn y broses hon?

Brian Gibbons: Yn amlwg, mae'n bosibl na chaiff y mater hwn ei ddatrys yn lleol, ac yn y pen draw gallai fod angen imi fod yn ddyfarnwr. Felly ni allaf roi barn bendant am y ffordd y mae hyn yn datblygu. Fodd bynnag, dylid cydnabod ein bod wedi darparu £45 miliwn ychwanegol eleni i wella gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol i oedolion, a gwyddom fod yr arian a gaiff ei wario ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion wedi cynyddu tua 40 i 60 y cant dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Mae angen i ni roi'r gorau i feddwl nad yw'n bosibl sicrhau newid heb fuddsoddi arian yn y system. Yn aml, mae gwasanaethau aneffeithlon a hen ffasiwn nid yn unig heb fod yn ddigon da i gleifion, ond hefyd hwy yw'r dewis drutaf. Drwy foderneiddio'r gwasanaeth, caiff cleifion yn aml well gwasanaeth o ran diwallu eu hanghenion a sicrhau bod adnoddau ar gael i ddarparu gwasanaethau o well safon i bobl hŷn. Ni chredaf mai gofyn i'r Cynulliad, nac i neb arall, ble mae'r arian ychwanegol ddylai fod yn reddf gychwynol wrth ddilyn unrhyw

or anyone else, to see where the extra money is. The first challenge is whether we can redesign services that are more in line with clients' or service users' needs, and then, if extra money can be made available, the issue is how we can plough that back into the frontline.

The Presiding Officer: Question 10 was grouped with question 1.

agenda foderneiddio. Yr her gyntaf yw a allwn ailgynllunio gwasanaethau sy'n fwy unol ag anghenion cleientiaid neu ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau, ac wedyn, os gellir darparu mwy o arian, y mater yw sut y gellir ei fuddsoddi yn ôl yn y rheng flaen.

Y Llywydd: Cafodd cwestiwn 10 ei osod gyda chwestiwn 1.

Canser y Coluddyn Bowel Cancer

Q11 Glyn Davies: What action is the minister taking to promote early diagnosis of bowel cancer in Wales? OAQ0884(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: I know that you have a personal interest in this subject. Screening is an important way of detecting bowel cancer at an early stage, which is why I have asked Health Commission Wales, working with the NHS and the cancer services co-ordinating group, to develop formal proposals for the phased introduction of a national bowel cancer screening programme for people aged between 50 and 74 in Wales.

Glyn Davies: I am pleased to hear that, Minister. Last week, I was also pleased that you ratified a drug that will extend the lives of those suffering from acute-stage bowel cancer. However, you and I know that those diagnosed at an early stage can make a complete recovery from the disease. Can you give me a timescale for when the screening test will be introduced in Wales? There has been a lot of publicity on this in England, and we had anticipated that this would already be up and running. Approving an early screening test to diagnose people at an early stage will save a huge number of lives.

2.40 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: Just for the record, the drug that I recently ratified is for the treatment of very advanced bowel cancer, rather than treatment of the early stage of the disease. The reason why England may seem to have a lead on us in this area is that the initial pilot work undertaken to validate the screening process was undertaken, and Wales was not

C11 Glyn Davies: Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo diagnosis cynnar o ganser y coluddyn yng Nghymru? OAQ0884(HSS)

Brian Gibbons: Gwn fod gennych ddi-ddordeb personol yn y pwnc hwn. Mae sgrinio'n ffordd bwysig i ddarganfod canser y coluddyn yn gynnar, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru, gan weithio gyda'r GIG a'r grŵp cydgysylltu gwasanaethau canser, ddatblygu cynigion ffurfiol ar gyfer cyflwyno fesul cam raglen genedlaethol i sgrinio canser y coluddyn ar gyfer pobl rhwng 50 a 74 oed yng Nghymru.

Glyn Davies: Yr wyf yn falch clywed hynny, Weinidog. Yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddwn hefyd yn falch eich clywed yn cadarnhau cyffur a fydd yn ymestyn bywydau pobl sydd â chanser aciwt y coluddyn. Fodd bynnag, gwyddom ein dau y gall darganfod y clefyd yn gynnar olygu gwella'n llwyr. A allwch roi amserlen imi ar gyfer cyflwyno'r prawf sgrinio yng Nghymru? Rhoddwyd llawer o gyhoeddusrwydd i hyn yn Lloegr, ac yr oeddem wedi disgwyl y byddai ar waith eisoes. Bydd cymeradwyo prawf sgrinio cynnar i roi diagnosis i bobl yn gynnar yn achub nifer enfawr o fywydau.

Brian Gibbons: Er gwybodaeth, diben y cyffur a gadarnhawyd gennyf yn ddiweddar yw trin canser y coluddyn sydd wedi datblygu, yn hytrach na thrin y clefyd yn gynnar. Y rheswm pam mae'n ymddangos bod Lloegr efallai ar y blaen yw nad oedd Cymru'n un o'r ardaloedd sgrinio pan wnaed y gwaith peilot cychwynol i ddilysu'r broses

one of the screening locations. So, to the extent that the pilot schemes are still operating in England, it has a lead. This year, we have put aside approximately £500,000 to undertake the necessary training for endoscopists, who will be a key part of the screening process. Hopefully, we will be able to initiate the screening programme in the following year. The screening programme that we are proposing in Wales, in terms of its age spectrum, is far more ambitious than what is being proposed in England. Our screening age group is 50 to 74-year-olds, whereas the English proposals concentrate on people aged in their 60s.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for all of those detailed answers.

sgrinio. Felly, i'r graddau bod y cynlluniau peilot ar waith yn Lloegr o hyd, mae ar y blaen. Eleni, yr ydym wedi clustnodi tua £500,000 i ddarparu'r hyfforddiant angenrheidiol i endosgopwyr, a fydd yn rhan allweddol o'r broses sgrinio. Gobeithio y gallwn gychwyn y rhaglen sgrinio y flwyddyn ganlynol. Mae'r rhaglen sgrinio yr ydym yn ei chynnig yng Nghymru, o ran oedran, lawer yn fwy uchelgeisiol nag a gynigir yn Lloegr. Ein grŵp oedran sgrinio yw 50 i 74 oed, ond mae'r cynigion yn Lloegr yn canolbwyntio ar bobl yn eu 60au.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog, am yr holl atebion manwl hynny.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport

Adeiladau Hanesyddol Historical Buildings

Q1 Catherine Thomas: What is being done to safeguard historical buildings in Wales? OAQ0870(CWS)

C1 Catherine Thomas: Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i ddiogelu adeiladau hanesyddol yng Nghymru? OAQ0870(CWS)

The Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport (Alun Pugh): The Welsh Assembly Government, through grant programmes and through the use of our statutory powers and our policy initiatives protects, promotes and presents the historic environment of Wales. We do this with the support of our public-sector partners and organisations such as the Heritage Lottery Fund and voluntary organisations.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon (Alun Pugh): Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, drwy raglenni grant a defnyddio'n pwerau statudol a'n mentrau polisi, yn diogelu, yn hyrwyddo ac yn cyflwyno amgylchedd hanesyddol Cymru. Gwnawn hyn gyda chymorth ein partneriaid yn y sector cyhoeddus a sefydliadau megis Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri a sefydliadau gwirfoddol.

Catherine Thomas: Cwrt Farm in Pembrey in my constituency is the largest surviving pre-Renaissance manor house in Carmarthenshire. Although it is currently derelict and in a state of disrepair, the structure remains and has been shown to be viable for restoration. As you know, Minister, Llanelli has a rich cultural heritage, with many sites of historical interest. May I extend an invitation to you to visit Cwrt Farm and meet the friends of Cwrt Farm, which is a group that has been formed to promote the restoration of what could be, once again, a very impressive building in my constituency?

Catherine Thomas: Fferm y Cwrt ym Mhen-bre yn fy etholaeth i yw'r maenordy mwyaf yn sir Gaerfyrddin sydd wdi goroesi o'r cyfnod cyn y Dadeni. Er ei fod yn adfail ar hyn o bryd a bod angen ei atgyweirio, mae'r adeiledd yn dal ar ei draed a dangoswyd y gellid ei adfer. Fel y gwyddoch, Weinidog, mae gan Lanelli dreftadaeth ddiwylliannol gyfoethog, gyda nifer o safleoedd o ddiddordeb hanesyddol. Hoffwn eich gwahodd i ymweld â Fferm y Cwrt a chwrrd â chyfeillion Fferm y Cwrt, grŵp a sefydlwyd i hyrwyddo'r broses o adfer adeilad a allai, unwaith eto, fod yn adeilad

mawreddog yn fy etholaeth.

Alun Pugh: Thank you. I know all about Llanelli House; it is a very fine structure. I know very little about Cwrt Farm, but I would be happy to see whether we can synchronise our diaries and organise a site visit.

Alun Pugh: Diolch. Gwn am Dŷ Llanelli; mae'n adeiledd ysblennydd. Ychydig iawn a wn am Fferm y Cwrt, ond byddem yn fwy na pharod i weld a allwn gydamseru ein dyddiaduron a threfnu ymweliad â'r safle.

Peter Black: There are buildings that are slightly less historic. A number of buildings of historic value are still in use and are in private ownership or are owned by local authorities. Whereas the more historic buildings can access grants through Cadw, those buildings cannot always access the amount of money needed to bring them up to the standard for use. What are you doing to look at ways of ensuring that the historic environment that we have at present, including more recent buildings, such as, for example, Swansea Guildhall, is being preserved? What resources can be made available to help local authorities and other owners to carry out the necessary repairs to keep those buildings in good repair?

Peter Black: Mae yna adeiladau sydd ychydig yn llai hanesyddol. Mae nifer o adeiladau o werth hanesyddol yn cael eu defnyddio o hyd, a naill ai'n eiddo preifat neu ym meddiant awdurdodau lleol. Tra gall yr adeiladau mwy hanesyddol gael grantiau drwy Cadw, ni all yr adeiladau hynny bob amser gael yr arian angenrheidiol i sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd safon lle y gellir eu defnyddio. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i edrych ar ffyrdd i sicrhau bod yr amgylchedd hanesyddol sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, gan gynnwys adeiladau mwy diweddar, megis Neuadd y Ddinas Abertawe, er enghraifft, yn cael eu diogelu? Pa adnoddau a all gael eu darparu i helpu awdurdodau lleol a pherchnogion eraill i wneud y gwaith atgyweirio angenrheidiol i sicrhau bod yr adeiladau hynny'n cael eu cadw mewn cyflwr da?

Alun Pugh: We have a strong statutory framework that covers listing, but we could not possibly cover all repairs to all listed buildings from tax sums alone. The whole issue of the historic environment will be reviewed in a joint paper by the DCMS and the Welsh Assembly Government, which will lead to legislation in due course. So, there will be a major consultation on this and, no doubt, you will want to have an input into that consultation.

Alun Pugh: Mae gennym fframwaith statudol cryf sy'n cwmpasu rhestru, ond ni allem dalu am yr holl waith atgyweirio y mae ei wneud ar bob adeilad rhestredig drwy drethi yn unig. Caiff yr amgylchedd hanesyddol ei adolygu mewn papur ar y cyd gan yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a fydd yn arwain at ddeddfwriaeth maes o law. Felly, bydd ymgynghori helaeth ar hyn, ac yn sicr byddwch am gyfrannu at yr ymgynghori hwnnw.

Hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg (Gwynedd) Promoting the Welsh Language (Gwynedd)

C2 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg yng Ngwynedd? OAQ0876 (CWS)

Q2 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to promote the Welsh language in Gwynedd? OAQ0876(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n galed drwy ein bwrdd iaith a'n partneriaid i hybu'r Gymraeg ym mhob rhan

Alun Pugh: The Assembly Government is working hard through our language board and other partners to promote the Welsh

o Gymru, gan gynnwys Gwynedd, wrth gwrs. Yr ydym yn gwneud hyn drwy nifer o gynlluniau cyffrous, fel Twf a pheccynau symud i Gymru.

Alun Ffred Jones: Un o'r canolfannau hynny sy'n hyrwyddo dysgu Cymraeg fel ail iaith yw canolfan iaith Nant Gwrtheyrn, sy'n ganolfan iaith genedlaethol—deallaf eich bod wedi bod yno ar gyrsiau. Hyd y gwelaf i, nid oes sôn am gyrsiau preswyl yn yr adolygiad o ddysgu Cymraeg i oedolion. A ydych yn gweld lle i'r ganolfan hwn yn y dyfodol, ac a wnewch drafod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ynglŷn â'r diffyg hwn yn y ddarpariaeth i'r dyfodol er mwyn sicrhau dyfodol canolfan sydd wedi gwneud gwaith da iawn?

Alun Pugh: Byddwn yn hapus iawn i drafod hynny gyda Jane Davidson, y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau. Credaf fod Nant Gwrtheyrn yn gwneud cyfraniad pwysig yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: What support will you give to help small businesses in north-east Wales improve bilingual services to customers and to increase the opportunities for Welsh learners and fluent speakers to use the language outside the classrooms?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A wnei di newid hynny i 'ogledd-orllewin Cymru', Brynle, er mwyn bod mewn trefn?

Brynle Williams: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Fe ddywedaf 'ogledd Cymru', felly.

Y Llywydd: Yn arbennig Gwynedd.

Alun Pugh: The private sector has an important contribution to make in moving towards a bilingual Wales. I am not in favour of having major new legislation in respect of the private sector, but support and encouragement for the private sector, for large and small organisations, will form an important part of the Welsh Language Board's private-sector strategy. There will be an announcement on this shortly.

language in every part of Wales, including of course in Gwynedd. We are doing this through many exciting initiatives, such as Twf, and moving to Wales welcome packs.

Alun Ffred Jones: One of the centres promoting the teaching of Welsh as a second language is Nant Gwrtheyrn language centre, which is a national language centre—I understand you have attended courses there. As far as I can see, there is no mention of residential courses in the review of teaching of Welsh to adults. Do you see a place for this centre in the future, and will you discuss with the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills this deficiency in future provision in order to safeguard the future of a centre which has done very good work?

Alun Pugh: I should be happy to discuss that with Jane Davidson, the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills. I believe Nant Gwrtheyrn makes an important contribution in Wales.

Brynle Williams: Pa gymorth a rowch i helpu busnesau bach yng ngogledd-ddwyrain Cymru i wella gwasanaethau dwyieithog i gwsmeriaid, a chynyddu'r cyfleoedd i bobl sy'n dysgu Cymraeg a siaradwyr rhugl ddefnyddio'r iaith y tu allan i'r ystafelloedd dosbarth?

The Presiding Officer: Order. Will you change that to 'north-west Wales', Brynle, so that you are in order?

Brynle Williams: I apologise. I will then say 'north Wales'.

The Presiding Officer: Particularly Gwynedd.

Alun Pugh: Mae gan y sector preifat gyfraniad pwysig i'w wneud i symud tuag at Gymru ddwyieithog. Nid wyf o blaid cael deddfwriaeth newydd sylweddol ar gyfer y sector preifat, ond bydd cefnogaeth ac anogaeth i'r sector preifat, i sefydliadau mawr a bach, yn rhan bwysig o strategaeth Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ar gyfer y sector preifat. Gwneir datganiad am hynny'n fuan.

Cefnogi'r Gymraeg ymysg Pobl Ifanc

Supporting the Welsh Language among Young People

Q3 Sandy Mewies: What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to promote and support the Welsh language among young people? OAQ0868(CWS)

Alun Pugh: The Welsh Assembly Government is acutely aware of the fact that young people are the key to the future of the Welsh language and we are working hard to maximise the opportunities for young people to use the language in everyday and social situations.

Sandy Mewies: You recall that representatives from Ysgol Maes Garmon in my Delyn constituency came to the Assembly to present the Urdd message of peace and goodwill to Assembly Members and members of the public, and it was well received. The young people presented a meaningful and well-thought-out message through the medium of Welsh and also incorporated song and dance to convey their meaning. I went to the Urdd eisteddfod held in north Wales this year and was delighted to see so many children and young people—and older people—celebrating the Welsh language, as Welsh-speakers and learners, in the sunshine. Do you agree that by encouraging children from all backgrounds to participate and to use Welsh in fun, engaging and inclusive ways we will better promote the use of the language throughout Wales?

Alun Pugh: I do. As you say, fun is an important part of presenting that positively to young people. It was very good to see representatives from Ysgol Maes Garmon here on 17 May. I know that that school, and many other schools in your constituency, made an important contribution to the successful Urdd eisteddfod in Rhuthun a couple of weeks ago.

Lisa Francis: The Twf project, now in its sixth year, the wonderful work done by the Urdd, which we have just heard about, young farmers' clubs and the Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin are all excellent examples of how the Welsh Language Board has created opportunities for young people to use Welsh in a wholly natural and fun way. In future, how does your Government intend to achieve

C3 Sandy Mewies: Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo a chefnogi'r Gymraeg ymysg pobl ifanc? OAQ0868(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ymwybodol iawn mai pobl ifanc yw'r allwedd i ddyfodol yr iaith Gymraeg, ac yr ydym yn gweithio'n galed i roi cynifer â phosibl o gyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddefnyddio'r iaith mewn sefyllfaoedd bob dydd a sefyllfaoedd cymdeithasol.

Sandy Mewies: Fe gofiwch i gynrychiolwyr o Ysgol Maes Garmon yn fy etholaeth i yn Nelyn ddod i'r Cynulliad i gyflwyno neges heddwch ac ewyllys da yr Urdd i Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac i'r cyhoedd, ac fe gawsant groeso da. Cyflwynodd y bobl ifanc neges ystyrlon wedi ei llunio'n dda drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, a defnyddiwyd canu a dawnsio hefyd i gyfleu eu hystyr. Euthum i eisteddfod yr Urdd a gynhaliwyd yn y gogledd eleni, ac yr oeddwn wrth fy modd yn gweld cynifer o blant a phobl ifanc—a phobl hŷn—yn dathlu'r iaith Gymraeg, fel siaradwyr Cymraeg a dysgwyr, yn yr haul. A ydych yn cytuno y byddwn yn hybu defnyddio'r iaith yn well ledled Cymru drwy annog plant o bob cefndir i gymryd rhan ac i ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg mewn ffyrdd sy'n gynhwysol, yn atyniadol ac yn hwyl?

Alun Pugh: Ydwyf. Fel y dywedwch, mae hwyl yn rhan bwysig o gyflwyno hynny'n gadarnhaol i bobl ifanc. Yr oedd yn braf iawn gweld cynrychiolwyr o Ysgol Maes Garmon yma ar 17 Mai. Gwn fod yr ysgol honno, a llawer un arall yn eich etholaeth, wedi gwneud cyfraniad pwysig i eisteddfod lwyddiannus yr Urdd yn Rhuthun rai wythnosau'n ôl.

Lisa Francis: Mae cynllun Twf, sydd yn ei chweched flwyddyn bellach, y gwaith gwych y mae'r Urdd yn ei wneud fel yr ydym newydd glywed, clybiau ffermwyr ifanc a'r Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin i gyd yn enghreifftiau ardderchog o'r modd y mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi creu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddefnyddio'r Gymraeg mewn ffordd hollol naturiol a hwyliog. Yn y

the softer side of the work that the Board currently undertakes, such as promoting education, increasing the use of Welsh among young people, promoting pop music and activities among young farmers? What research have you undertaken to ensure that your Government is able to undertake all of that work effectively?

Alun Pugh: A great deal of research shows that what you call the softer side is important. The business of creating opportunities for people to use the Welsh language in a social situation is important. That is why the Assembly Government has invested an extra £28 million in the 'Iaith Pawb' process. I look forward to receiving your support in the budgetary process later this year.

Lisa Francis: Returning to my initial question, what consultation have you carried out with the Welsh Language Board's partners in respect of research about how your Government will fulfil the role of supporting and promoting the Welsh language among young people? Also, what documentary evidence can you provide as to how your Government intends to pursue this?

Alun Pugh: The overall policy is set out in 'Iaith Pawb'. We will have an important debate on the 'Iaith Pawb' process here in a few weeks' time. Detailed conversations with the Welsh Language Board over matters such as this take place all the time—the most recent was held this morning.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gwn eich bod yn ymwybodol fod consensws yn dechrau datblygu o safbwynt deddfu pellach ar yr iaith. Byddai hynny'n hwb i'r defnydd o'r Gymraeg gan bobl ifanc. Mae'r consensws hwnnw bellach i'w weld mewn nifer fawr o fudiadau iaith ac ymhlith nifer o'r gwrthbleidiau yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n ymddangos felly mai'r unig blaid wleidyddol yng Nghymru sy'n gwrthod y syniad o ddeddfu pellach ar yr iaith yw eich plaid chi. Hoffwn gael eich barn ar y ffaith bod y consensws hwn yn dechrau amlygu ei hun o gwmpas y syniad o hawliau ieithyddol a

dyfodol, sut mae eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu cyflawni ochr feddalach y gwaith y mae'r Bwrdd yn ei wneud ar hyn o bryd, megis hybu addysg, cynyddu defnyddio'r Gymraeg ymysg pobl ifanc, hybu cerddoriaeth pop a gweithgareddau ymysg ffermwyr ifanc? Pa ymchwil sydd wedi ei wneud gennych i sicrhau y gall eich Llywodraeth ymgymryd â'r holl waith hwnnw'n effeithiol?

Alun Pugh: Mae llawer o waith ymchwil yn dangos bod yr hyn a alwch yn ochr feddalach yn bwysig. Mae'r gwaith o greu cyfleoedd i bobl ddefnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg mewn sefyllfa gymdeithasol yn bwysig. Dyna pam y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi £28 miliwn yn ychwanegol yn y broses 'Iaith Pawb'. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael eich cefnogaeth yn y broses gyllidebol yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Lisa Francis: I ddychwelyd at fy nghwestiwn gwreiddiol, pa ymgyngori a fu rhyngoch a phartneriaid Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg o ran ymchwilio i'r modd y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn cyflawni'r rôl o gefnogi a hybu'r iaith Gymraeg ymysg pobl ifanc? Hefyd, pa dystiolaeth ddogfennol y gallwch ei darparu am y ffordd y mae eich Llywodraeth yn bwriadu mynd i'r afael â hyn?

Alun Pugh: Mae'r polisi cyffredinol wedi ei osod allan yn 'Iaith Pawb'. Cawn drafodaeth bwysig ar broses 'Iaith Pawb' yma ymhen ychydig wythnosau. Bydd sgysiau manwl gyda Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ynghylch materion fel hyn yn digwydd drwy'r amser—cafwyd y sgwrs ddiweddaraf y bore yma.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I know you are aware that consensus is emerging in terms of further legislation on the language. That would promote the use of the Welsh language by young people. That consensus now includes a number of language organisations and a number of the opposition parties in the Assembly. It appears that the only political party in Wales which rejects the idea of further legislation on language is your own party. I should like to hear your opinion on the fact that this consensus is beginning to emerge around the idea of linguistic rights, which would add to the responsibility of

fyddai'n ychwanegu at gyfrifoldeb cyrff cyhoeddus i baratoi cynlluniau iaith. A allwch egluro yn union pam yr ydych yn erbyn y datblygiad hwnnw o hawliau ieithyddol?

2.50 p.m.

Alun Pugh: I believe that there is consensus in the Assembly about growing the number of Welsh speakers; we all agree that we want to see the number, and the proportion, of Welsh speakers in the population grow. However, there are legitimate political differences between our political parties on the best way to achieve that. Many Plaid Cymru Members want to see the Welsh language rights issue, and the whole issue of Welsh-language schemes, extended into the private sector. That is not the Welsh Assembly Government's view, and I do not believe that it is the Conservative Party's view either. There is consensus on taking the Welsh language forward, but there is not consensus on the means. I do not believe that a Quebec-style rights agenda, for example, is the best way forward.

public bodies to prepare language schemes. Can you explain exactly why you oppose that development of language rights?

Alun Pugh: Credaf fod consensws yn y Cynulliad ynghylch cynyddu nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg; yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno ein bod am weld nifer, a chyfran, y siaradwyr Cymraeg yn y boblogaeth yn tyfu. Fodd bynnag, mae gwahaniaethau gwleidyddol dilyn rhwng ein pleidiau gwleidyddol o ran y ffordd orau i gyflawni hynny. Mae nifer o Aelodau Plaid Cymru am weld mater hawliau'r iaith Gymraeg, a holl fater cynlluniau iaith Gymraeg, yn ymestyn i'r sector preifat. Nid dyna farn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac ni chredaf mai dyna farn y Blaid Geidwadol ychwaith. Mae yna gonsensws ar weithredu ar yr iaith Gymraeg, ond nid oes consensws ar y dulliau. Nid wyf yn credu mai agenda hawliau fel sydd yn Cwbec, er enghraifft, yw'r ffordd orau ymlaen.

Digwyddiadau Diwylliannol Cultural Events

Q4 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister outline Welsh Assembly Government initiatives to ensure that cultural events in Wales reach out to a wide range of people? OAQ0833(CWS)

Alun Pugh: We do this by providing support to all sorts of different types of events, and to all different parts of Wales. That includes everything from the national eisteddfod, which will be held in Swansea this year, to the Mostyn gallery—a different cultural event, situated in Llandudno, on the north Wales coast.

Val Lloyd: I was particularly impressed by the programme of the Festival of Muslim Cultures. I welcome the fact that many events have taken place, or will take place, in Swansea, ranging from traditional music to Pakistani print-work. The festival is an excellent opportunity to discover different cultures, and will no doubt contribute to raising their profile on the UK artistic scene.

C4 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu cynlluniau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod digwyddiadau diwylliannol yng Nghymru yn estyn allan i ystod eang o bobl? OAQ0833(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Gwnawn hyn drwy ddarparu cefnogaeth i bob math o wahanol ddigwyddiadau, ac i bob rhan o Gymru. Mae hynny'n cynnwys popeth o'r eisteddfod genedlaethol, a gynhelir yn Abertawe eleni, i oriel Mostyn—digwyddiad diwylliannol gwahanol, yn Llandudno, ar arfordir y gogledd.

Val Lloyd: Gwnaeth rhaglen yr Ŵyl Diwylliannau Moslemaidd argraff arbennig arnaf. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ffaith bod nifer o ddigwyddiadau wedi eu cynnal, neu i gael eu cynnal, yn Abertawe, yn amrywio o gerddoriaeth draddodiadol i waith print Pacistanaid. Mae'r ŵyl yn gyfle ardderchog i ddysgu am wahanol ddiwylliannau, a bydd yn sicr yn cyfrannu at godi eu proffil ar

What steps has the Welsh Assembly Government taken to publicise this festival, in particular, and encourage attendance and involvement by people from all communities?

Alun Pugh: You are right to remind us that, although Wales is a small nation, we have many faiths and cultures. The question of marketing the arts is important, which is why the Assembly Government, through the Arts Council of Wales, provides substantial support for marketing arts events, big and small.

Owen John Thomas: Mae Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn adeilad hardd, sy'n denu miloedd ar filoedd o bobl o wahanol gefndiroedd. Mae'n ddigon hawdd i bobl y Cymoedd ddod i Gaerdydd i ymweld â'r ganolfan, ond wrth ddychwelyd gyda'r nos, gallant deithio o orsaf y bae, ond ni allant fynd heibio i orsaf Heol y Frenhines; nid oes trenau i alluogi'r mwyafrif ohonynt i fynd i ben y cwm. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn eu cynnal â'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau i sicrhau bod Trenau Arriva Cymru yn gwella ei wasanaeth, er mwyn dod â digwyddiadau diwylliannol o fewn cyrraedd amrediad ehangach o bobl, yn arbennig y rhai yn y Cymoedd?

Alun Pugh: People attend the wide-range of events that take place in the WMC via many means. Many use private cars, and it is interesting and encouraging to see the growth in coach traffic, which provides transport not just for the Valleys but for many other parts of Wales too. You are right that some parts of the rail network are not accessible very late at night, but it depends on which valley you are talking about. Andrew has many discussions with Arriva about matters such as timetabling patterns, which we are addressing as a Government.

Owen John Thomas: Mae'n amlwg nad ydych wedi meddwl yn ddryys am hynny, ac ni allaf gymryd eich bod o ddifrif, felly, am ehangu'r amrediad o bobl a all fynychu digwyddiadau diwylliannol yng Nghymru.

Will you give me a cast-iron promise that,

lwyfan celfyddydol y DU. Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cymryd i hyrwyddo'r ŵyl hon, yn arbennig, ac i annog pobl o bob cymuned i ymweld â hi ac i gymryd rhan?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle yn ein hatgoffa bod yng Nghymru lawer ffydd a diwylliant, er mai cenedl fach ydym. Mae cwestiwn marchnata'r celfyddydau yn bwysig, a dyna pam mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, yn darparu cymorth sylweddol ar gyfer marchnata digwyddiadau celfyddydol, yn fawr a bach.

Owen John Thomas: The Wales Millennium Centre is a beautiful building, which attracts thousands of people from different backgrounds. It is easy enough for people from the Valleys to come to Cardiff to visit the centre, but when they return home in the evening, they can travel from the bay station but cannot go further than Queen Street station; there are no trains to take most of them back up to the top of the valley. What discussions are you having with the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks to ensure that Arriva Trains Wales improves its service, to bring cultural events within the reach of a wider range of people, especially people in the Valleys?

Alun Pugh: Bydd pobl yn mynychu'r ystod eang o ddigwyddiadau yn y Ganolfan drwy lawer dull. Mae nifer yn defnyddio ceir preifat, ac mae'n ddiddorol ac yn galonogol gweld cynnydd mewn traffig bysiau, sy'n darparu cludiant nid yn unig i'r Cymoedd ond i lawer rhan arall o Gymru hefyd. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud nad yw pob rhan o'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd ar gael yn hwyr iawn yn y nos, ond mae'n dibynnu am ba gwm yr ydych yn sôn. Bydd Andrew yn cael llawer o drafodaethau gydag Arriva ynghylch materion fel patrymau amserlennu, rhywbeth yr ydym yn ymdrin ag ef fel Llywodraeth.

Owen John Thomas: It is evident that you have not thought about that in great detail, and I cannot accept, therefore, that you are serious about increasing the variety of people who can access cultural events in Wales.

A rowch addewid cadarn imi y bydd yn

when the Ebbw Vale to Cardiff line is reopened, it will be possible for the people of Blaenau Gwent to visit the WMC in Cardiff, by travelling to and from the city by train? On reflection, should I perhaps put this question to the leader of Plaid Cymru, as it seems unlikely that your party will be in power when the line opens?

The Presiding Officer: Order. No Member of any group may ask the leader of his or her group a question that is directed to a Minister, and I do not deal in hypotheticals.

Alun Pugh: No, but it is fair to point out that it is not a hypothetical point; it is actually a Labour Government that has delivered that railway line to that community. My range of responsibilities as Minister for culture is very wide, but it does not include setting the train timetable from Ebbw Vale to Cardiff.

Mick Bates: Street markets, such as those held in many towns in Montgomeryshire, provide an excellent opportunity to reach a wide range of people. Previously, you have pledged your support for street markets. What action have you taken to co-ordinate cultural events, such as local singing or dancing groups, artists or storytellers, with street markets?

Alun Pugh: These events, by their nature, tend to be fairly small scale. They do not lend themselves readily to central planning; it is very much a bottom-up approach, but, as you know, substantial lottery support is available on a project basis to support street festivals. Street festivals and street markets have a very good track record of attracting people from all different social strata in Wales, which we would want to see continue.

Nick Bourne: The arts outside Cardiff initiative has provided valuable funds for theatres across Wales, including some £2 million a year for the Torch Theatre in Milford Haven and Theatr Brycheiniog in my area. That is important. I know that it is your intention to carry that on to 2007. Is it your policy that it should continue thereafter? I have been asked that question by the

bosibl i bobl Blaenau Gwent ymweld â'r Ganolfan yng Nghaerdydd drwy deithio i'r ddinas ac yn ôl ar y trênn pan ailagorir y llinell o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd? Wedi meddwl, ai i arweinydd Plaid Cymru y dylwn ofyn y cwestiwn hwn, efallai, gan ei bod yn edrych yn annhebygol y bydd eich plaid chi'n dal mewn grym pan fydd y llinell yn agor?

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Ni chaiff Aelod o unrhyw grŵp ofyn cwestiwn wedi ei gyfeirio at Weinidog i arweinydd ei grŵp, ac ni fyddaf fi'n ymdrin â damcaniaethau.

Alun Pugh: Nac ydych, ond mae'n ddigon teg sylwi nad pwynt damcaniaethol mohono; Llywodraeth Lafur sydd wedi darparu'r llinell reilffordd honno i'r gymuned honno. Mae fy amrywiol gyfrifoldebau fel Gweinidog yn eang iawn, ond nid yw'n cynnwys pennu amserlen y trênn o Lynebwy i Gaerdydd.

Mick Bates: Mae marchnadoedd stryd, fel y rhai a gynhelir mewn llawer tref yn sir Drefaldwyn, yn gyfle gwych i gyrraedd ystod eang o bobl. Yn y gorffennol, gwaethoch addewid i gefnogi marchnadoedd stryd. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd i gydgyssylltu digwyddiadau diwylliannol, megis grwpiau canu neu ddawnsio lleol, artistiaid neu adroddwyr straeon, â marchnadoedd stryd?

Alun Pugh: Mae'r digwyddiadau hyn, yn eu hanfod, yn tueddu i fod yn rhai bach. Nid yw cynllunio canolog yn gweddu iddynt yn dda iawn; o'r gwaelod i fyny y maent yn gweithio i raddau helaeth. Ond fel y gwyddoch, mae cymorth sylweddol ar gael i gefnogi gwyliau stryd fesul prosiect. Mae gan wyliau stryd a marchnadoedd stryd hanes da o ddenu pobl o'r holl wahanol haenau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, rhywbeth y byddem am ei weld yn parhau.

Nick Bourne: Mae menter y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd wedi rhoi arian gwerthfawr i theatrau ledled Cymru, gan gynnwys rhyw £2 filiwn y flwyddyn ar gyfer Theatr y Torch yn Aberdaugleddau a Theatr Brycheiniog yn fy ardal i. Mae hynny'n bwysig. Gwn mai eich bwriad yw parhau i wneud hynny tan 2007. A yw'n bolisi gennych y dylai barhau wedi hynny?

directors of both theatres and I do not know the answer.

Alun Pugh: It is certainly our intention to continue with a vigorous programme of financial support for the Arts Outside Cardiff. The sum of £2 million is currently in the baseline and we would like to see that continue. Future budget rounds are a matter for the Assembly as a whole, but the Assembly Government is not going to propose a major cut in the Arts Outside Cardiff budget.

Gofynnwyd hynny imi gan gyfarwyddwyr y ddwy theatr, ac ni wn beth yw'r ateb.

Alun Pugh: Yn sicr, mae'n fwriad gennym barhau rhaglen egniol o gymorth ariannol i'r celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd. Mae'r swm o £2 filiwn yn y llinell sylfaenol ar hyn o bryd, a byddem am weld hynny'n parhau. Mater i'r Cynulliad cyfan yw cylchoedd cyllideb y dyfodol, ond nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn mynd i gynnig gostyngiad mawr yng nghyllideb y celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd.

Datblygiad Opera The Development of Opera

Q5 David Melding: What measures are in place to support the development of opera in South Wales Central? OAQ0848(CWS)

Alun Pugh: The development of opera in Wales, including South Wales Central, is supported through a range of activities, from the internationally recognised Welsh National Opera to local operatic groups.

David Melding: Will the Minister join me in congratulating the Wales Millennium Centre for holding a whole *Ring Cycle* in November? I understand that the whole cycle sold out in a morning, which shows you what a wonderful initiative this is. I have signed up to that myself, so I declare an interest. Do you also agree that after the full rigours of a *Ring Cycle*, one might need to be soothed with a little more Mozart in future seasons?

Alun Pugh: It is certainly true to say that the Kirov Opera had a very rapid sell-out, which shows that there is a substantial international market for top-quality cultural events. I am very pleased to see the Wales Millennium Centre fulfilling its early promise as a stage for some of the best performing arts anywhere in the world.

C5 David Melding: Pa gamau sydd ar waith i gefnogi datblygiad opera yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0848(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Cefnogir datblygiad opera yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys Canol De Cymru, drwy amrywiaeth o weithgareddau, o Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol, i grwpiau operatig lleol.

David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru am gynnal y *Ring Cycle* yn gyfan ym mis Tachwedd? Deallaf fod y gyfres gyfan wedi ei gwerthu'n llwyr mewn un bore, sy'n dangos ichi pa mor arbennig yw menter fel hon. Yr wyf wedi penderfynu mynd fy hun, felly yr wyf yn datgan buddiant. A gytunwch hefyd y bydd anom angen ychydig mwy o dawelwch Mozart yn y dyfodol ar ôl holl rym y *Ring Cycle*?

Alun Pugh: Mae'n sicr yn wir fod Kirov Opera wedi gwerthu'n gyflym iawn, sy'n dangos bod marchnad ryngwladol sylweddol ar gyfer digwyddiadau diwylliannol o fri. Mae'n bleser gennyf weld Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru yn cyflawni ei haddewid cynnar fel llwyfan ar gyfer rhai o'r celfyddydau perfformio gorau mewn unrhyw ran o'r byd.

Symud i'r System Ddigidol The Digital Switchover

Q6 Janet Davies: What recent discussions has the Minister had with the UK Government regarding the cost of digital

C6 Janet Davies: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael yn ddiweddar gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch y gost o symud

switchover in Wales? OAQ0818(CWS)

Alun Pugh: I have made representations to the UK Government about the costs to viewers of television services, including switching to digital, in my responses to the review of the BBC's charter. That response, as are all others, is available on the Assembly Government's website.

Janet Davies: You will appreciate that there will be a considerable cost, particularly for people on benefits, students and retired people. Therefore, I ask you to ensure that you are pressing the case very hard to ensure that people have some extra payments or some means of recompense for the additional costs that they will have to commit.

Alun Pugh: You say that there is a considerable cost; there is a cost of buying a Freeview box, which I believe you can get now for under £50, with no subscription cost. I would argue that it is not a considerable cost, but it is fair to say that some categories of people, such as those who are aged 75 or over, or those who are severely disabled, will qualify for the support scheme that is being set up by the BBC and the UK Government.

Eleanor Burnham: The take-up of digital is going exceptionally well, or so we are told. However, there will still be some problems when the switchover happens in 2009. The recent trial in Bolton, with which I am sure you are very familiar, found that the elderly and disabled needed much more help with setting up the equipment than was originally envisaged.

3.00 p.m.

What discussion have you had with Digital UK to put in place the necessary systems for the elderly, the disabled and the vulnerable in Wales?

Alun Pugh: You are right to say that there has been a substantial take-up of digital television in Wales—over 80 per cent of households already have access to digital television, which compares with an UK average of some 72 per cent. However, you are right; for some people, switching over is

i'r system ddigidol yng Nghymru?
OAQ0818(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Yr wyf wedi cyflwyno sylwadau i Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch costau gwasanaethau teledu i wylwyr, gan gynnwys y newid i'r digidol, yn fy ymatebion i'r adolygiad o siarter y BBC. Mae'r ymateb hwnnw, fel y lleill i gyd, ar gael ar wefan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Janet Davies: Byddwch yn deall y bydd cost sylweddol, yn enwedig i bobl ar fudd-daliadau, myfyrwyr a phobl sydd wedi ymddeol. Felly, gofynnaf i chi sicrhau eich bod yn gwneud pob ymdrech i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael taliadau ychwanegol neu ryw fath o iawndal am y costau ychwanegol y bydd yn rhaid iddynt eu talu.

Alun Pugh: Dywedwch fod cost sylweddol; mae yna gost prynu blwch Freeview, y gallwch ei gael am lai na £50 erbyn hyn, mi gredaf, heb gost tanysgrifio. Byddwn i'n dadlau nad yw'n gost sylweddol, ond mae'n deg dweud y bydd rhai categorïau o bobl, megis pobl 75 oed neu hŷn, neu'r rheini sydd ag anabledd difrifol, yn gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun cymorth y mae'r BBC a Llywodraeth y DU yn ei sefydlu.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'r nifer sy'n gwyllo teledu digidol yn cynyddu'n eithriadol o gyflym, neu dyna'r sôn. Fodd bynnag, bydd rhai problemau o hyd pan ddigwydd y newid yn 2009. Darganfu'r treial yn Bolton yn ddiweddar, ac yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn gyfarwydd iawn ag ef, fod angen llawer mwy o gymorth ar yr henoed a phobl anabl i osod cyfarpar nag a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol.

Pa drafodaeth yr ydych wedi ei chael gyda Digital UK i roi ar waith y systemau y mae eu hangen ar yr henoed, pobl anabl a phobl ddiamddiffyn yng Nghymru?

Alun Pugh: Mae'n wir dweud bod nifer fawr wedi dewis cael teledu digidol yng Nghymru—mae dros 80 y cant o aelwydydd eisoes yn gallu cael teledu digidol, o'u cymharu â chyfartaledd o tua 72% ar gyfer y DU. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn iawn; i rai pobl, nid mater o arian yn unig yw newid i'r

not simply a question of financing, but of the technical business of how you switch over from analogue to digital. That will clearly be an important part of the meeting that I will be having with Digital UK, which is responsible for these matters. That meeting is scheduled to take place on 4 July.

Eleanor Burnham: The Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport, Tessa Jowell, announced that £400 million was to be administered by the BBC to assist the elderly and the vulnerable with the cost of the switchover. I am certainly one of the people, although I am not elderly and vulnerable, who will need just as much help, because I find it difficult to cope with these sorts of things. Wales has a high proportion of disabled people, as we have just suggested. What discussions have you had with the BBC to ensure that Wales gets its fair share of that fund, and how much do you expect that to be?

Alun Pugh: We certainly expect Wales to get its fair share of the fund, but, as I said, Wales is already substantially ahead of the UK in terms of our digital take-up, as 80 per cent of Welsh households have already satisfactorily adopted digital television, and, therefore, most people can clearly cope with this switchover. However, I accept that some people will have difficulties with the technology.

digidol, ond y mater technegol o newid o analog i ddigidol. Bydd hynny'n amlwg yn rhan bwysig o'r cyfarfod y byddaf yn ei gael gyda Digital UK, sy'n gyfrifol am y materion hyn. Cynhelir y cyfarfod hwnnw ar 4 Gorffennaf.

Eleanor Burnham: Cyhoeddodd Tessa Jowell, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddiwylliant, i gael ei weinyddu gan y BBC i helpu'r henoed a phobl ddiamddiffyn gyda'r gost o newid i'r digidol. Er nad wyf fi'n hen nac yn ddiamddiffyn, yr wyf yn sicr yn un o'r bobl hynny y bydd arnom angen llawn cymaint o gymorth, oherwydd yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd ymdopi â phethau felly. Mae cyfran fawr o bobl anabl yng Nghymru, fel yr ydym newydd ei awgrymu. Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cael gyda'r BBC i sicrhau bod Cymru'n cael ei chyfran deg o'r arian hwnnw, a faint o arian y disgwylwch i Gymru ei gael?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydym yn sicr yn disgwyl i Gymru gael ei chyfran deg o'r arian. Ond fel y dywedais, mae Cymru eisoes ar y blaen o'i chymharu â'r DU o ran newid i'r digidol, gan fod 80 y cant o aelwydydd yng Nghymru eisoes wedi newid i deledu digidol a hynny'n foddhaol. Felly, mae'n amlwg bod y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn gallu ymdopi â'r newid hwn. Fodd bynnag, derbynïaf y bydd rhai pobl yn cael anhawster gyda'r dechnoleg.

Cymunedau dan Anfantis Deprived Communities

Q7 Irene James: Will the Minister make a statement about the impact of measures to promote culture, sport and the languages of Wales in deprived communities?
OAQ0853(CWS)

Alun Pugh: I expect all our funding bodies to deliver on the Government's social justice agenda. I am sure that you will be pleased that, for example, the Blackwood Miners Institute has received £50,000 from the Arts Outside Cardiff fund and that the Welsh Language Board is supporting an adviser in Islwyn. In addition, I am sure that your constituency will get a slice of the Sports Council for Wales's £125,000 regeneration challenge.

C7 Irene James: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith y camau i hyrwyddo diwylliant, chwaraeon ac ieithoedd Cymru mewn cymunedau dan anfantis?
OAQ0853(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Disgwyliaf i'n holl gyrff cyllido gyflawni agenda'r Llywodraeth ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Byddwch yn falch clywed, mae'n siŵr, fod Sefydliad y Glowyr yn y Coed Duon, er enghraifft, wedi cael £50,000 gan gronfa'r Celfyddydau y tu allan i Gaerdydd a bod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn cynnal cynghorydd yn Islwyn. Yn ogystal, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd eich etholaeth yn cael cyfran o her adfywio Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, sy'n werth £125,000..

Irene James: Thank you for that response, Minister. Do you agree that culture, sport and learning languages are vital elements of economic regeneration, in addition to serving their own purposes and justifiably existing for their own sake? What further action is being taken to improve the impact of Government policy in deprived communities and to address an historic inequality in provision for our most deprived communities?

Alun Pugh: That is an important point, and, in the past, if you look at participation rates in cultural events and sporting events, it is fair to say that the most deprived parts of Wales have not had their fair share. Any Minister who is concerned with social justice would want to right that. It will be a continuing feature of both our policy and of our remit letters to Assembly sponsored public bodies. I want every strata of Welsh society, particularly the deprived parts of Wales, to benefit fully from its share of Government funding.

Irene James: Diolch ichi am yr ymateb hwnnw, Weinidog. A gytunwch fod diwylliant, chwaraeon a dysgu ieithoedd yn elfennau hollbwysig mewn adfywio economaidd, yn ogystal â bod yn nodau cwbl ddilys ynddynt eu hunain? Pa gamau eraill a gymerir i gynyddu effaith polisi'r Llywodraeth mewn cymunedau difreintiedig, ac i fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldeb hanesyddol mewn darpariaeth i'n cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig?

Alun Pugh: Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig, ac yn y gorffennol, os edrychwch ar y cyfraddau sy'n cymryd rhan mewn digwyddiadau diwylliannol a chwaraeon, mae'n deg dweud nad yw'r rhannau mwyaf difreintiedig o Gymru wedi cael eu cyfran deg. Byddai unrhyw Weinidog sy'n poeni am gyfiawnder cymdeithasol am unioni hynny. Bydd hynny'n nodwedd barhaus yn ein polisi a'n llythyrau cylch gorchwyl at gyrff a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Yr wyf am i bob rhan o gymdeithas yng Nghymru, yn enwedig y rhannau difreintiedig o Gymru, elwa'n llawn o'u cyfran o arian y Llywodraeth.

Cerddoriaeth Pobl Ifanc Youth Music

Q8 Eleanor Burnham: For generations, Wales has been a pioneering nation in the field of youth music. However, as 32 of Wales's most respected—[*Interruption.*] I am sorry. Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government support for youth music in Wales? OAQ0846(CWS)

The Presiding Officer: Order. You may have anticipated what might be good practice in the future as it would save us some time.

Alun Pugh: Now, now, Llywydd. The Welsh Assembly Government, through the Arts Council of Wales, provides support for many forms of youth music, including projects run by youth clubs, youth organisations and schools. Particular initiatives include support for youth music projects, visits by professional musicians to schools, and the funding of our national youth ensembles.

C8 Eleanor Burnham: Ers cenedlaethau, mae Cymru wedi bod yn genedl arloesol ym maes cerddoriaeth pobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae 32 o—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gerddoriaeth pobl ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ0846(CWS)

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hwyrach eich bod wedi rhag-weld yr hyn a allai fod yn arfer da yn y dyfodol, gan y byddai'n arbed amser inni.

Alun Pugh: Nawr, nawr, Lywydd. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, drwy Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru, yn cefnogi llawer math o gerddoriaeth ieuenctid, gan gynnwys prosiectau a redir gan glybiau ieuenctid, sefydliadau ieuenctid ac ysgolion. Mae mentrau penodol yn cynnwys cefnogaeth i brosiectau cerddoriaeth ieuenctid, ymweliadau gan gerddorion proffesiynol mewn ysgolion, ac ariannu ein cerddorfeydd ieuenctid cenedlaethol.

Eleanor Burnham: As I was saying earlier, for generations, Wales has been seen as a pioneering nation in the field of youth music. However, as 32 of our most respected musicians made clear to a letter to Rhodri in March, this heritage and our future as a musical nation are under threat. *[Interruption.]* I am speaking of Rhodri Morgan, our First Minister. They are under threat, because of a chronic lack of national funding and direction. Do you agree that it is time for your Welsh Assembly Government to consult with music providers and practitioners across the country to provide a clear vision for youth music, and the funding necessary to resource it?

Alun Pugh: You have some sort of difficulty regarding the story behind the music development fund. As you know, the fund is one of some £17 million run over a six-year period—it was extend well beyond its original three-year life span. It was never the intention to provide ongoing music services indefinitely. These services remain the responsibility of the 22 local education authorities in Wales, and the money is in their budgets.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ers cenedlaethau, mae Cymru wedi cael ei hystyried yn genedl arloesol ym maes cerddoriaeth ieuencid. Fodd bynnag, fel y gwnaed yn glir gan 32 o'n cerddorion mwyaf blaenllaw mewn llythyr at Rhodri ym mis Mawrth, mae'r dreftadaeth hon a'n dyfodol fel cenedl gerddorol yn y fantol. *[Torri ar draws.]* Yr wyf yn sôn am Rhodri Morgan, ein Prif Weinidog. Maent yn y fantol, oherwydd prinder dybryd o gyllid ac arweiniad cenedlaethol. A gytunwch ei bod yn bryd i'ch Llywodraeth ymgynghori â darparwyr ac ymarferwyr cerdd ledled y wlad, er mwyn rhoi gweledigaeth glir ar gyfer cerddoriaeth ieuencid, a'r cyllid angenrheidiol i'w gwireddu?

Alun Pugh: Mae gennych ryw fath o broblem gyda hanes y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth. Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r gronfa'n rhan o tua £17 miliwn o gyllid a roddir am gyfnod o chwe blynedd—fe'i hestynnwyd ymhell y tu hwnt i'w chyfnod gwreiddiol o dair blynedd. Ni fwriadwyd erioed ddarparu gwasanaethau cerdd am gyfnod amhenodol. Cyfrifoldeb y 22 o awdurdodau addysg lleol yng Nghymru o hyd yw'r gwasanaethau hyn, ac mae'r arian yn eu cyllidebau.

Meysydd Chwarae Playing Fields

Q9 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Will the Minister state why the Welsh Assembly Government does not keep a record of the number of playing fields in Wales? OAQ0851(CWS)

Alun Pugh: There are approximately 2,000 playing fields in Wales on local authority records. They vary from large multi-pitch formal sporting grounds to more informal recreational areas and kick-about pitches.

Michael German: I am sure that the Minister is aware of the concern regarding the loss of playing fields in Wales. It was only yesterday that we heard concern from Newport City Council regarding its playing fields. In England, the Department for

C9 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ynghylch pam nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cadw cofnod o nifer y meysydd chwarae yng Nghymru? OAQ0851(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Mae tua 2,000 o feysydd chwarae yng Nghymru yn ôl cofnodion awdurdodau lleol. Maent yn amrywio o gyfleusterau mawr, ffurfiol gyda nifer o feysydd chwarae i fannau hamdden a chaeau mwy anffurfiol.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r pryder ynglŷn â cholli meysydd chwarae yng Nghymru. Ddoe ddiwethaf y clywsom am bryder Cyngor Dinas Casnewydd am ei feysydd chwarae. Yn Lloegr, mae'n bolisi gan yr

Culture, Media and Sport now has a policy of not only counting every playing field, but of assessing all the planning applications for playing fields. They are counting them in order to have a national baseline on which they can judge the number of playing fields that are available. Will you now instruct your department to start counting accurately the number of planning applications for playing fields, and also the numbers and size of existing playing fields in Wales, so that we also have an accurate national baseline?

Alun Pugh: Wales is very different to England in that we do not have the acute pressures on land development and land values are not so high. You cannot compare major areas of Wales with, for example, London and south-east England. A more important question is, 'Is there sufficient space in Wales to allow for the development of our ambitious "Climbing Higher" agenda?'. The answer to that is clearly 'yes'. However, a number of key documents in the planning process, as well as 'Technical Advice Note 16: Sport and Recreation', are being revised. You will have the opportunity to deal with that, in terms of the consultation, later this summer.

Laura Anne Jones: Minister, playing fields are still being sold off, and the planning laws are not as tight as they are in England. We are behind here in Wales. Will you provide financial support to local authorities in order to protect and secure the future of playing fields throughout Wales, and to ensure that facilities are available, which is surely the central aim of your 'Climbing Higher' agenda?

Alun Pugh: I contest that we are somehow behind England; as I said, the situation is not comparable. We do not have the development pressures that they have in London and the south-east of England, for example, so we are not behind. However, I expect local authorities to have proper concern and regard for playing fields in terms of their planning developments, and, of course, our Sports Council for Wales is a statutory consultee on planning applications that affect playing fields and aims to protect them in line with our general planning policy, set out in

Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon erbyn hyn nid yn unig i gyfrif pob maes chwarae, ond i asesu pob cais cynllunio ar gyfer meysydd chwarae. Maent yn eu cyfrifo er mwyn cael llinell sylfaen genedlaethol i allu barnu faint o feysydd chwarae sydd ar gael. A fyddwch chi'n awr yn cyfarwyddo'ch adran i ddechrau cyfrif yn fanwl gywir faint o geisiadau cynllunio a wneir ar gyfer meysydd chwarae, a hefyd niferoedd a maint y meysydd chwarae sydd gennym yng Nghymru, fel y gallwn ni hefyd bennu llinell sylfaen genedlaethol gywir?

Alun Pugh: Mae Cymru'n wahanol iawn i Lloegr yn yr ystyr nad oes pwysau mawr o ran datblygu tir ac nad yw gwerthoedd tir mor uchel. Ni allwch gymharu rhannau helaeth o Gymru â Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, er enghraifft. Cwestiwn pwysicach na hynny yw, 'A oes digon o le yng Nghymru i ddatblygu ein hagenda uchelgeisiol, "Dringo'n Uwch"?'. Yr ateb i hynny, yn amlwg, yw 'oes'. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o ddogfennau allweddol yn y broses gynllunio, yn ogystal â 'Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 16: Chwaraeon a Hamdden', yn cael eu diwygio. Cewch gyfle i ymdrin â hynny, o ran yr ymgynghori, yn ddiweddarach yn yr haf eleni.

Laura Anne Jones: Weinidog, mae meysydd chwarae'n dal i gael eu gwerthu, ac nid yw'r rheolau cynllunio mor dynn ag ydynt yn Lloegr. Yr ydym ar ei hôl hi yma yng Nghymru. A roddwch gymorth ariannol i awdurdodau lleol er mwyn diogelu dyfodol meysydd chwarae ledled Cymru, ac i sicrhau bod cyfleusterau ar gael, sef nod canolog eich agenda 'Dringo'n Uwch', mae'n siŵr?

Alun Pugh: Nid wyf yn derbyn ein bod rywsut ar ei hôl hi ryw ffordd neu'i gilydd o'n cymharu â Lloegr; fel y dywedais, ni ellir cymharu'r sefyllfa. Nid ydym yn wynebu'r pwysau i ddatblygu sydd yn Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr, er enghraifft, felly nid ydym ar ei hôl hi. Fodd bynnag, disgwyliaf i awdurdodau lleol roi sylw priodol i feysydd chwarae yn eu datblygiadau cynllunio, ac wrth gwrs, ymgynghorir yn statudol â Chyngor Chwaraeon Cymrustatudol am geisiadau cynllunio sy'n effeithio ar feysydd chwarae, a'i nod yw eu diogelu'n unol â'n

'Planning Policy Wales', published in 2002.

Janet Ryder: I have raised with you before the issue that children under the age of eight are calculated as needing less space on a school playing field than those over the age of eight when it comes to team sports. Two of your Cabinet colleagues—Jane Hutt, who is responsible for children, and Jane Davidson, who is responsible for education—have given a commitment to review that. Are you working with them, Minister, and is that now being reviewed?

Alun Pugh: You raised the question of school-age pupils, and the Sports Council for Wales, which is our expert on this matter, has advised us that the sale of school land is not a significant issue in Wales. Jane Davidson has made it very clear that, by 2012, all schools in Wales should be in good physical condition, so that they can deliver the national curriculum in appropriate surroundings, and, obviously, the question of playgrounds and playing fields is part of that agenda.

John Marek: Does the Minister understand that, as with the last question, when he did not actually proffer the advice that his Government had cut music funding to local authorities, his expectations in terms of getting local authorities to preserve playing fields will also be to no avail? Does he not realise that in Flintshire, which has a Labour authority, Carl Sargeant, who is one of the local Members, is objecting to the council selling playing fields. Wrexham County Borough Council, when it was under the incompetent rule of Labour, did not even tell the Sports Council for Wales that it was selling playing fields. The Minister must come down to the real world. Why is he protecting incompetent Labour councils in the way that he is doing now?

Alun Pugh: That is an absurd allegation, Mr Marek. As I said, there is not a systematic problem in Wales in the way that there is development pressure in London and the south east. We have the sports council as a

polisi cynllunio cyffredinol, sydd wedi ei osod allan ym 'Mholisi Cynllunio Cymru' a gyhoeddwyd yn 2002.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf wedi codi'r mater hwn gyda chi o'r blaen, sef cyfrif bod angen llai o le i blant o dan wyth oed ar gae chwarae ysgol nag i blant dros wyth oed o ran chwaraeon timau. Mae dau o'ch cyd-Weinidogion yn y Cabinet—Jane Hutt, sy'n gyfrifol am blant, a Jane Davidson, sy'n gyfrifol am addysg—wedi ymrwymo i adolygu hynny. A ydych yn gweithio gyda hwy, Weinidog, ac a yw hynny'n cael ei adolygu bellach?

Alun Pugh: Yr ydych wedi codi cwestiwn oedran disgyblion ysgol, ac mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru, sef ein harbenigwr ar y mater hwn, wedi dweud wrthym nad yw gwerthu tir ysgol yn broblem fawr yng Nghymru. Mae Jane Davidson wedi'i gwneud yn glir iawn y dylai pob ysgol, erbyn 2012, fod mewn cyflwr da, fel y gallant ddarparu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol mewn amgylchiadau priodol, ac mae iardiau ysgol a meysydd chwarae yn amlwg yn rhan o'r agenda honno.

John Marek: A yw'r Gweinidog yn deall, fel gyda'r cwestiwn diwethaf, pan na ddywedodd mewn gwirionedd fod ei Lywodraeth wedi cwtdogi'r arian i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer cerddoriaeth, na fydd ei ddisgwyliadau o ran cael awdurdodau lleol i gadw meysydd chwarae yn tycio ychwaith? Onid yw'n sylweddoli yn sir y Fflint, sydd ag awdurdod Llafur, fod Carl Sargeant, sy'n un o'r Aelodau lleol, yn gwrthwynebu penderfyniad gan y cyngor i werthu meysydd chwarae. Ni wnaeth Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Wrecsam, pan oedd o dan reolaeth ddiffygiol Llafur, ddweud wrth Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru hyd yn oed ei fod yn gwerthu meysydd chwarae. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog ddechrau byw yn y byd go iawn. Pam y mae'n amddiffyn cyngor Llafur diffygiol fel y mae yn awr?

Alun Pugh: Mae hwnnw'n honiad hurt, Mr Marek. Fel y dywedais, nid oes problem systematig yng Nghymru fel y mae pwysau i ddatblygu yn Llundain a de-ddwyrain Lloegr. Ymgynghorir yn statudol â'r cyngor

statutory consultee, and the whole issue of playgrounds, including informal playgrounds as well as the more formal playing fields, is very much a part of our agenda of improving schools by 2010.

chwaraeon, ac mae meysydd chwarae, gan gynnwys mannau chwarae anffurfiol yn ogystal â meysydd chwarae mwy ffurfiol, yn sicr yn rhan o'n hagenda i wella ysgolion erbyn 2010.

Chwaraeon i Bobl Anabl Sport for People with Disabilities

Q10 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government support for sport for people with disabilities in Wales? OAQ0838(CWS)

C10 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i chwaraeon ar gyfer pobl anabl yng Nghymru? OAQ0838(CWS)

Alun Pugh: Through the Sports Council for Wales and the Federation of Disability Sport Wales, we have provided over £1.8 million in funding over the past two years to support disability sport in Wales at all levels, from grass roots to elite and Paralympic level.

Alun Pugh: Drwy Gyngor Chwaraeon Cymru a Ffederasiwn Chwaraeon Anabledd Cymru, yr ydym wedi darparu dros £1.8 miliwn o gyllid dros y ddwy flynedd diwethaf i gefnogi chwaraeon ar gyfer pobl anabl yng Nghymru ar bob lefel, o weithgareddau ar lawr gwlad i athletwyr elitaidd a Pharalympaidd.

Ann Jones: I will concentrate on the grass-roots level. I know that, as a keen cyclist, you will be keen to see everyone being able to participate in that sport. Will you join me in congratulating On Track, in my constituency, which has adapted bikes to allow those with a disability to participate in cycling events, alongside someone who is able to do the pedalling and provide the power? When you have Chris Ruane as your driver, you have to be fully strapped in, as I was last Saturday when we tested these bicycles. [*Laughter.*] On a more serious note, the people who can now use these bicycles are delighted and the fact that those bicycles can be hired out for a session means that people can now enjoy the delights of travelling through the countryside on a bicycle. Will you ensure that we can protect schemes such as that run by On Track, in my constituency, and that we are able to promote cycling and other sports for those people at grass-roots level?

Ann Jones: Canolbwyntiaf ar weithgareddau ar lawr gwlad. Gwn y byddwch chi, fel seiclwr brwd, yn awyddus i weld pawb yn gallu cymryd rhan yn y gamp honno. A ymunwch â mi i longyfarch On Track yn fy etholaeth i, sydd wedi addasu beiciau i'w gwneud yn bosibl i bobl ag anabledd gymryd rhan mewn digwyddiadau seiclo, ochr yn ochr â rhywun sy'n gallu pedalu ar eu rhan? Pan fydd Chris Ruane yn yrrwr ichi, rhaid ichi icrhau bod eich gwregys yn dynn amdanoch, fel y gwneuthum i ddydd Sadwrn diwethaf pan roesom brawf ar y beiciau hyn. [*Chwerthin.*] Ar nodyn mwy difrifol, mae'r bobl sydd erbyn hyn yn gallu defnyddio'r beiciau hyn wrth eu bodd, ac mae'r ffaith y gellir hurio'r beiciau hynny am sesiwn yn golygu bod pobl bellach yn gallu mwynhau'r pleser o deithio drwy gefn gwlad ar gefn beic. A wnewch chi sicrhau y gallwn ddiogelu cynlluniau fel yr un a redir gan On Track yn fy etholaeth i, a'n bod yn gallu hybu seiclo a chwaraeon eraill i'r bobl hynny ar lawr gwlad?

Alun Pugh: I would be happy to do that. It is amazing what you can do now with adaptations-to-bicycles technology. That opens up a variety of participation opportunities in everything from grass-roots events to elite competitions. On the north Wales coast there are some superb bicycle

Alun Pugh: Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i wneud hynny. Mae'n syndod beth y gallwch ei wneud erbyn hyn gyda thechnoleg addasu beiciau. Mae hynny'n esgor ar nifer o gyfleoedd i gymryd rhan ym mhob math o bethau, o ddiwyddiadau i'r cyhoedd i gystadlaethau elitaidd. Ar arfordir y gogledd

and footpath tracks. It is great to see athletes with a variety of disabilities racing it out at national facilities such as the Wales National Velodrome in Newport.

mae yna rai llwybrau gwych i feicwyr a cherddwyr. Mae'n braf gweld athletwyr gyda gwahanol anabledau yn cystadlu mewn cyfleusterau cenedlaethol megis Felodrom Cenedlaethol Cymru yng Nghasnewydd.

Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Tŷ Questions to the House Committee

Y Llywydd: Ni chyflwynwyd unrhyw gwestiynau i gynrychiolydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ.

The Presiding Officer: No questions were tabled for the representative of the House Committee.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 Approval of the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provision) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provision) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006. (NDM3102)

yn ystyried egwyddor y Gorchymyn, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3102)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 13 June 2006 in relation to the draft Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provision) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 13 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft Higher Education Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2 and Transitional Provision) (Wales) (Amendment) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg Uwch 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2 a Darpariaeth Drosiannol) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006. (NDM3103)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3103)

Y Llywydd: Nid oes neb yn dymuno siarad **The Presiding Officer:** There are no
am y cynnig hwn, felly awn yn syth i speakers on this motion, therefore we will
bleidlais. move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM3102): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3102): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cynnig (NDM3103): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3103): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cynllun Pensiwn Dynion Tân (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006
Approval of the Firefighters' Pension (Wales) Scheme (Amendment) Order 2006

The Minister for Social Justice and Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder
Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I propose that Cymdeithasol ac Adfwyio (Edwina Hart):
Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

considers the principle of the Firefighters' Pension (Wales) Scheme (Amendment) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2006. (NDM3104)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 13 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Firefighters' Pension (Wales) Scheme (Amendment) Order 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Firefighters' Pension (Wales) Scheme (Amendment) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 16 May 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 13 June 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 May 2006. (NDM3105)

Leanne Wood: Minister, I would be grateful if you could indicate whether you would be prepared to schedule a full debate on the future of our fire services in Wales, in the context of the current consultation. Plaid Cymru is concerned that proposals to reduce the number of full-time firefighters and to replace them with retained firefighters will have an impact on communities. I would like to know what assessment has been made of that. There is a concern that an increase in reliance on retained firefighters could increase response times. Therefore, I would be grateful if the Minister would agree to a full debate, so that we can look at all these issues.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): These questions have been raised in the context of

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynllun Pensiwn Dynion Tân (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3104)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 13 Mehefin 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynllun Pensiwn Dynion Tân (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Cynllun Pensiwn Dynion Tân (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 16 Mai 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 13 Mehefin 2006; ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Mai 2006. (NDM3105)

Leanne Wood: Weinidog, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallech ddweud a fydddech yn barod i drefnu dadl lawn ar ddyfodol ein gwasanaethau tân yng Nghymru, yng nghydestun yr ymgynghori sy'n mynd rhagddo. Mae Plaid Cymru yn pryderu y bydd y cynigion i ostwng nifer y diffoddwyr tân llawn amser a defnyddio diffoddwyr tân wrth gefn yn eu lle yn cael effaith ar gymunedau. Hoffwn wybod sut y mae hynny wedi cael ei asesu. Mae pryder y gallai dibyniaeth gynyddol ar ddiffoddwyr wrth gefn arwain at amseroedd ymateb hwy. Felly, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog yn cytuno i gynnal dadl lawn, fel y gallwn edrych ar yr holl faterion hyn.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Codwyd y cwestiynau hyn yng nghydestun

the debate, and I am mindful that the three fire and rescue authorities have gone out to consultation on their various plans and documents. There are some other issues that we need to discuss, and I would be more than happy to schedule a debate on the fire service in the autumn, if that would be helpful, after the consultations have been undertaken with local people and constituent bodies on the future of the fire service across Wales. Some of these are operational matters for the fire and rescue authorities, but as the fire service has been a successfully devolved function, it would be useful to have an excellent debate on what I think is a first-class service in Wales that we need to support. We particularly need to support the firefighters, and there are many issues around fire on which I would welcome a debate.

y ddadl, ac yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y tri awdurdod tân ac achub wrthi'n ymgynghori ar eu gwahanol gynlluniau a'u dogfennau. Cyfyd rhai materion eraill y mae angen inni eu trafod, a byddwn yn fwy na pharod i drefnu dadl ar y gwasanaeth tân yn yr hydref, pe bai hynny'n ddefnyddiol, ar ôl cynnal yr ymgynghori â phobl leol a chyrrff cyfansoddol ar ddyfodol y gwasanaeth tân ledled Cymru. Mae rhai o'r rhain yn faterion gweithredol i'r awdurdodau tân ac achub, ond oherwydd bod y gwasanaeth tân yn swyddogaeth a ddatganolwyd yn llwyddiannus, byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael dadl dda ar yr hyn sydd, yn fy marn i, yn wasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf yng Nghymru ac angen inni ei gefnogi. Yn arbennig, mae angen inni gefnogi'r diffoddwyr tân, ac mae nifer o faterion sy'n ymwneud â tân y byddwn yn croesawu dadl arnynt.

*Cynnig (NDM3104): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3104): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM3105): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM3105): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Yr Adroddiad Blynyddol ar y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy The Annual Report on the Sustainable Development Scheme

Motion (NDM3106): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	Cynnig (NDM3106): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru</i>
<i>notes the sustainable development annual report 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 14 June 2006.</i>	<i>yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol datblygu cynaliadwy 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 14 Mehefin 2006.</i>
Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion: <i>regrets the increase in the amount of waste not recycled or composted per person in Wales.</i>	Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn gresynu at y cynnydd mewn gwastraff y pen yng Nghymru nad yw'n cael ei ailgylchu na'i gompostio.</i>
Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. At the end of the motion: <i>instructs the Assembly Government to develop a green jobs strategy in order to do more to assist and promote green businesses and industries.</i>	Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd er mwyn gwneud rhagor i gynorthwyo a hyrwyddo busnesau a diwydiannau gwyrdd.</i>
Amendment 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion: <i>calls on the Assembly Government to publish an annual indicator in the sustainable development report that clearly measures economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions.</i>	Gwelliant 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyhoeddi dangosydd blynyddol yn yr adroddiad datblygu cynaliadwy sy'n mesur yn glir y twf economaidd o'i gymharu â'r carbon deuocsid a ryddheir.</i>
Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion: <i>regrets the increases in carbon dioxide emissions in Wales, and calls on the Welsh</i>	Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: <i>yn gresynu at y cynnydd o ran y carbon deuocsid a ryddheir yng Nghymru ac yn galw</i>

Assembly Government to redraft planning guidance to increase the diversity of renewable energy supply.

ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ailddrafftio canllawiau cynllunio i gynyddu amrywiaeth y cyflenwad ynni adnewyddadwy.

Amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

condemns the Assembly Government's continued failure to clearly demonstrate in the sustainable development scheme annual reports how Wales is achieving a more sustainable way of living.

yn condemnio methiant parhaus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddangos yn glir yn yr adroddiadau blynyddol ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy sut y mae Cymru'n llwyddo i fyw mewn ffordd fwy cynaliadwy.

Amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

notes the failure to link the sustainable development scheme annual report to the First Minister's annual reports, as stated in the sustainable development action plan 2004 to 2007.

yn nodi'r methiant i gysylltu adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy gydag adroddiadau blynyddol y Prif Weinidog fel ag a nodir yng nghynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy 2004 i 2007.

Amendment 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

notes that the continued lack of powers over building regulations limits Wales's sustainable development aims and calls for the devolution of these powers.

yn nodi bod amcanion datblygu cynaliadwy Cymru'n cael eu llesteirio am nad oes ganddi bwerau o hyd dros reoliadau adeiladu ac yn galw am ddatganoli'r pwerau hyn.

Amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Expresses concern at the rise in carbon dioxide emissions from Welsh sources and calls on WAG to develop year-on-year targets for reductions in carbon emissions.

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y cynnydd yn y carbon deuocsid a ryddheir o ffynonellau yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu targedau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ar gyfer gostwng y carbon a ryddheir.

Amendment 9 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

notes the fact that this is the final sustainable development scheme annual report of the Assembly term and looks forward to future independent assessments of the Assembly Government's record in achieving its sustainable development aims.

yn nodi'r ffaith mai dyma adroddiad blynyddol olaf tymor y Cynulliad ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ac yn edrych ymlaen at gael asesïadau annibynnol yn y dyfodol o record Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran cyflawni ei hamcanion datblygu cynaliadwy.

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1, 2, and 3 in the name of Kirsty Williams, amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 5, 6, 7, 8 a 9 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

notes the sustainable development annual report 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 14 June 2006. (NDM3106)

yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol datblygu cynaliadwy 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 14 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3106)

I am pleased to introduce the Assembly Government's seventh sustainable development annual report. The report covers the work that we did on sustainable development during the past financial year of 2005-06. The past year was the first full year of implementing the sustainable development action plan commitments, and Members will recall unanimously accepting the action plan in Plenary in November 2004. It contains just fewer than 100 commitments designed to produce a step change in our delivery of sustainable development.

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r seithfed adroddiad blynyddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r adroddiad yn sôn am y gwaith a wnaed gennym ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, sef 2005-06. Y flwyddyn ddiwethaf oedd blwyddyn lawn gyntaf gweithredu ymrwymadau'r cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, a bydd Aelodau'n cofio derbyn y cynllun gweithredu yn unfrydol yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Tachwedd 2004. Mae'n cynnwys bron 100 o ymrwymadau gyda'r nod o gynhyrchu newid sylweddol yn y ffordd yr ydym yn cyflawni datblygu cynaliadwy.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.16 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.16 p.m.*

The report describes the progress that we have made in putting the action plan into effect, and the other sustainable development-related activities that we have undertaken. It highlights the progress with our top 10 sustainable development action commitments, the progress of the Wales spatial plan, and the development of the Welsh international sustainable development framework. It also highlights work on indicators on embedding sustainable development in key policies such as the environment strategy, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', and education for sustainable development and global citizenship. It highlights our policy-making processes and our work with local government in managing our estate.

Mae'r adroddiad yn disgrifio'r cynnydd a wnaed gennym o ran rhoi'r cynllun gweithredu ar waith, a'r gweithgareddau eraill sy'n gysylltiedig â datblygu cynaliadwy a gynhaliwyd gennym. Mae'n tynnu sylw at y cynnydd gyda'n 10 prif ymrwymiad gweithredu ym maes datblygu cynaliadwy, cynnydd cynllun gofodol Cymru, a datblygu fframwaith datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol Cymru. Yn ogystal, mae'n tynnu sylw at waith ar ddangosyddion o ran ymgorffori datblygu cynaliadwy mewn polisïau allweddol megis y strategaeth amgylcheddol, 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', ac addysg datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang. Mae'n tynnu sylw at ein prosesau gwneud polisi a'n gwaith gyda llywodraeth leol ar reoli ein hystad.

The report shows that a significant amount of progress was made. By the end of May, 83 out of 94 commitments had either been completed or were ongoing, which is a figure of 88 per cent. A few actions have taken longer than anticipated to get under way, but all the actions should be complete by 2007.

There are a few areas to which I would draw the Assembly's attention. On the environment strategy, Members will know that it was published on 17 May and it highlights the challenges that we face as a nation. It sets out our vision for what we want to achieve by 2026 and how we intend to get there. Climate change is a central theme of the strategy. The past year has seen a significant change in attitudes to climate change from one of questioning the veracity of the science to accepting the need for urgent action. We will prepare a climate change adaptation action plan to take this forward.

There is also the new building, which we are in now, and of which we can all be proud in terms of its sustainability credentials. The location strategy will also deliver three new buildings in Merthyr Tydfil, Aberystwyth and Llandudno Junction that will attain the Building Research Establishment environmental assessment method 'excellent' standard. Part of the team involved in that is also working with the Carbon Trust to reduce the carbon footprint of each building. The team developing the Aberystwyth building is working with Ceredigion County Council to procure a biomass fuel supplier for the council office, schools and Assembly properties.

We continue to be active in the development of Wales's international sustainable development framework, which will significantly enhance our ability to help to deliver the United Nations' millennium development goals. It will complement UK Government actions and add value to the already excellent, but largely unsung, activity going on in Wales by the voluntary sector and some individuals. It is anticipated that the framework will be launched soon.

Dengys yr adroddiad fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi ei wneud. Erbyn diwedd Mai, roedd 83 o'r 94 o ymrwymadau naill ai wedi'u cyflawni neu'n cael eu gweithredu, sy'n ffigur o 88 y cant. Mae rhai camau wedi cymryd yn hwy na'r disgwyl i'w rhoi ar waith, ond dylid cwblhau'r holl gamau gweithredu erbyn 2007.

Mae rhai meysydd yr hoffwn dynnu sylw'r Cynulliad atynt. O ran y strategaeth amgylcheddol, bydd yr Aelodau'n gwybod iddi gael ei chyhoeddi ar 17 Mai ac mae'n tynnu sylw at yr heriau a wynebwn fel cenedl. Mae'n gosod allan ein gweledigaeth ar gyfer yr hyn y dymunwn ei gyflawni erbyn 2026 a sut y bwriadwn gyrraedd y nod. Mae newid yn yr hinsawdd yn thema ganolog yn y strategaeth. Yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, bu newid sylweddol mewn agweddau at newid yn yr hinsawdd, o amau cywirdeb y wyddoniaeth i dderbyn yr angen am gamau gweithredu brys. Byddwn yn paratoi cynllun gweithredu addasu ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd er mwyn gweithredu hyn.

Yn ogystal, rhaid sôn hefyd am yr adeilad newydd lle yr ydym yn awr. Gallwn oll ymfalchio ynddo am ei rinweddau cynaliadwyedd. Yn ogystal, o dan y strategaeth leoli caiff tri adeilad newydd eu codi ym Merthyr Tudful, Aberystwyth a Chyffordd Llandudno a fydd yn cyrraedd safon 'rhagorol' dull asesu amgylcheddol y Sefydliad Ymchwil Adeiladu. Mae rhan o'r tîm sy'n ymwneud â hynny hefyd yn gweithio gyda'r Ymddiriedolaeth Garbon i leihau ôl-troed carbon pob adeilad. Mae'r tîm sy'n datblygu'r adeilad yn Aberystwyth yn gweithio gyda Chyngor Sir Ceredigion i gael cyflenwr tanwydd bio-màs ar gyfer swyddfa'r cyngor, ysgolion ac adeiladau'r Cynulliad.

Yr ydym yn parhau i ddatblygu fframwaith datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol Cymru, a fydd yn gwella'n sylweddol ein gallu i helpu cyflawni nodau datblygu'r Cenhedloedd Unedig ar gyfer y mileniwm. Bydd yn ategu camau gweithredu'r DU ac yn ychwanegu gwerth atn y gweithgarwch sydd eisoes yn rhagorol, ond prin ei glod, sy'n cael ei wneud yng Nghymru gan y sector gwirfoddol a rhai unigolion. Rhagwelir y caiff y fframwaith ei lansio'n fuan.

The Wales spatial plan was adopted in November 2004, and is making real progress in terms of delivering sustainable development on the ground. Therefore, there has been progress over the course of the last year, but there is no room for complacency.

3.20 p.m.

The size of the challenge remains large, and the path is likely to get more difficult and rocky as we start to get to grips with issues, such as sustainable consumption and sustainable production. Two reports in recent weeks have reinforced this. In May, the round table on sustainable consumption, jointly hosted by the National Consumer Council and the Sustainable Development Commission, made recommendations to the UK Government on how to create consumer choices that stay within environmental limits. Just two weeks ago, the Expert Panel on Resources Management for Wales published a consultation document on potential high-level strategic actions for taking resource management forward, with particular emphasis on the business sector. Following consultation in July and August, it will be refining proposals for my consideration.

What is encouraging about these reports is how diverse sectors of our society are working together to tackle what are very difficult issues. Members will have seen a copy by now of the report, 'Sustainable Development in Wales: From Pioneer to Delivery' published by the UK Sustainable Development Commission. We invited the commission to contribute its views to our annual sustainable development reporting process.

There has been significant progress, for example, the inclusion of social and environmental criteria in the justification for the reopening of the Ebbw Vale railway line, the inclusion of key stakeholders in the drafting of the environment strategy, and the partnership model that has been put together in developing a waste management strategy between the Assembly, local government, social businesses and so forth. There is also

Mabwysiadwyd Cynllun Gofodol Cymru ym mis Tachwedd 2004, ac mae'n gwneud cynnydd gwirioneddol wrth sicrhau datblygu cynaliadwy ar lawr gwlad. Felly, bu cynnydd yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ond nid oes lle i fod yn hunanfodlon.

Mae'n parhau'n her fawr, ac mae'n debygol y bydd y llwybr yn mynd yn fwy anodd a heriol wrth inni ddechrau mynd i'r afael â materion megis defnyddio cynaliadwy a chynhyrchu cynaliadwy. Atgyfnerthwyd hyn gan ddau adroddiad yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf. Ym mis Mai, cyflwynodd y fordron ar ddefnydd cynaliadwy, a gynhaliwyd ar y cyd gan y Cyngor Defnyddwyr Cenedlaethol a'r Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy, argymhellion i Lywodraeth y DU ar y ffordd i greu dewisiadau i ddefnyddwyr sy'n dal o fewn terfynau amgylcheddol. Bythefnos yn unig yn ôl, cyhoeddodd y Panel Arbenigol ar Reoli Adnoddau yng Nghymru ddogfen ymgynghori ar gamau gweithredu strategol lefel uchel posibl ar gyfer datblygu rheoli adnoddau, gyda phwyslais arbennig ar y sector busnes. Ar ôl ymgynghori ym mis Gorffennaf a mis Awst, bydd yn mireinio cynigion er mwyn imi eu hystyried.

Yr hyn sy'n galonogol am yr adroddiadau hyn yw'r ffordd y mae rhannau amrywiol o'n cymdeithas yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd i fynd i'r afael â materion anodd iawn. Erbyn hyn, bydd Aelodau wedi gweld copi o'r adroddiad 'Datblygu Cynaliadwy yng Nghymru: O Arloesi i Gyflawni' a gyhoeddwyd gan Gomisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy y DU. Gwahoddwyd y comisiwn i gyfrannu ei farn at ein proses o gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy.

Cafwyd cynnydd sylweddol, er enghraifft, cynnwys meini prawf cymdeithasol ac amgylcheddol yn y cyfiawnhad dros ailagor rheilffordd Glynebwy, cynnwys rhanddeiliaid allweddol yn y gwaith o lunio fersiwn drafft y strategaeth amgylcheddol, a'r model partneriaeth a luniwyd wrth ddatblygu strategaeth rheoli gwastraff rhwng y Cynulliad, llywodraeth leol, busnesau cymdeithasol ac ati. Yn ogystal mae yna'r

the emerging international sustainable development framework and the strategy for education for sustainable development and global citizenship.

I welcome the Sustainable Development Commission's report; it is a helpful contribution to the ongoing development of our work. We have never been under any illusion other than that we know that this is a difficult and long-term agenda. We have had to rethink how things are done and challenge pre-conceived ideas about the right way forwards. The commission's recommendations are constructive and I will consider them carefully. There will be a revised sustainable development action plan later this year, which will take into account the commission's findings.

Turning to the amendments, we oppose amendment 1. We believe that the reason for the increase in the amount of residual municipal waste sent to landfill is because there has been more accurate data capture and an accurate estimate, probably for the first time, of the amount of waste produced in Wales. However, Members should also note that the recycling rate has increased, certainly over the past five years.

On amendment 2 and the green jobs strategy, that is already being done by means of the environmental goods and services programme. 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' makes it clear that the Assembly Government already engages with a range of sectors, including energy and environmental-related sectors, which are of critical importance to the development of a sustainable economy.

On amendment 3, we want to see a fall in total carbon dioxide emissions as a result of greater resource efficiency, and not just a fall in the ratio of carbon dioxide to gross value added.

On amendment 4, TAN 8 already exists and it deals with renewable energy.

There has already been progress on the subject of amendment 5. The scheme itself contains information on what progress has

fframwaith datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol arfaethedig a'r strategaeth ar gyfer addysg datblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang.

Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy; mae'n gyfraniad defnyddiol i ddatblygiad parhaus ein gwaith. Nid ydym erioed wedi'n twyllo'n hunain nad yw hon yn agenda anodd a hirdymor. Bu'n rhaid inni ailfeddwl sut y gwneir pethau, a herio syniadau blaenorol am y ffordd gywir ymlaen. Mae argymhellion y comisiwn yn adeiladol a byddaf hyn eu hystyried yn ofalus. Cynhyrchir cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy wedi ei ddiwygio yn ddiweddarach eleni, a bydd hwnnw'n ystyried darganfyddiadau'r comisiwn.

I droi at y gwelliannau, yr ydym yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 1. Credwn mai'r rheswm dros y cynnydd mewn gwastraff trefol gweddilliol a anfonir i'w dirlenwi yw bod proses gywirach o ddal data erbyn hyn, ac amcangyfrif cywir, hwyrach am y tro cyntaf, o faint o wastraff a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, dylai Aelodau hefyd sylwi ar y cynnydd yn y gyfradd ailgylchu, yn sicr dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

O ran gwelliant 2 a'r strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd, mae hynny'n cael ei wneud eisoes drwy'r rhaglen nwyddau a gwasanaethau amgylcheddol. Mae 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' yn pwysleisio bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn ymgysylltu ag amrywiaeth o sectorau, gan gynnwys ynni a sectorau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r amgylchedd, sydd o bwys hanfodol i ddatblygu economi gynaliadwy.

O ran gwelliant 3, dymunwn weld lleihad yng nghyfanswm y gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid o ganlyniad i well effeithlonrwydd adnoddau, nid dim ond lleihad yn y gymhareb carbon deuocsid a gwerth gros ychwanegol.

O ran gwelliant 4, mae TAN 8 yn bodoli eisoes ac mae'n ymdrin ag ynni adnewyddadwy.

Cafwyd cynnydd eisoes ar bwnc gwelliant 5. Mae'r cynllun ei hun yn cynnwys gwybodaeth am y cynnydd a wnaed eisoes, a

already been made, and the action plan will outline what remains to be done.

We will accept amendment 6, because it is correct in stating that there is an omission, which will need to be put right. However, fortunately, that is a matter of process rather than a fundamental one, but it is important to realise that it has been overlooked and needs to be dealt with.

On amendment 7, there are no plans to devolve, or to seek the devolution of, building regulations at this time, but the planning system can do a great deal more to deliver sustainable development and construction. We are moving forward with that over the course of the next months and years, particularly building on the good work that has already been done on that by the Design Commission for Wales.

On amendment 8, I refer Members to the fact that the climate change action adaptation plan is to be produced, and the question of reducing greenhouse gas emissions is already contained in the environment strategy for Wales action plan.

On amendment 10, our sustainable development duty, as a corporate body, requires an independent effectiveness report every four years, after each election. In fact, that has come a little early this year, because the UK Sustainable Development Commission has contributed to this year's annual report. Therefore, there is external monitoring and peer review of the work that we do, so both the Assembly and the general public can be assured that the work that we are doing is effective. I put before the Assembly this year's report on the sustainable development scheme.

Mick Bates: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the increase in the amount of waste not recycled or composted per person in Wales.

I propose amendment 2. At the end of the

bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn amlinellu'r hyn sydd eto i'w wneud.

Byddwn yn derbyn gwelliant 6, gan ei fod yn gywir wrth ddweud bod yna wall y bydd angen ei unioni. Fodd bynnag, yn ffodus mater o broses yw hwnnw yn hytrach na mater sylfaenol, ond mae'n bwysig sylweddoli iddo gael ei anwybyddu a bod angen mynd i'r afael ag ef.

O ran gwelliant 7, nid oes unrhyw gynlluniau i ddatganoli, nac i geisio datganoli, rheoliadau adeiladu ar hyn o bryd, ond gall y system gynllunio wneud llawer mwy i sicrhau datblygu ac adeiladu cynaliadwy. Byddwn yn datblygu hynny dros y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd nesaf, gan adeiladu'n arbennig ar y gwaith da a wnaed ar hynny eisoes gan Gomisiwn Dylunio Cymru.

O ran gwelliant 8, cyfeiriai Aelodau at y ffaith fod cynllun gweithredu addasu ar gyfer newid yn yr hinsawdd i gael ei gynhyrchu, ac mae cwestiwn lleihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr wedi'i gynnwys eisoes yng nghynllun gweithredu strategaeth amgylcheddol Cymru.

O ran gwelliant 10, mae ein dyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy, fel corff corfforaethol, yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol cael adroddiad annibynnol ar effeithiolrwydd bob pedair blynedd, ar ôl pob etholiad. Mewn gwirionedd, daeth hynny braidd yn gynnar eleni, oherwydd bod Comisiwn Datblygu Cynaliadwy y DU wedi cyfrannu at adroddiad blynyddol eleni. Felly, mae yna fonitro allanol ac adolygiad cymheiriaid o'r gwaith a wnawn, fel y gellir sicrhau'r Cynulliad a'r cyhoedd fod y gwaith a wnawn yn effeithiol. Cyflwynaf adroddiad eleni ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy gerbron y Cynulliad.

Mick Bates: Cynigiai y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y cynnydd mewn gwastraff y pen yng Nghymru nad yw'n cael ei ailgylchu na'i gompostio.

Cynigiai welliant 2. Ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

motion:

instructs the Assembly Government to develop a green jobs strategy in order to do more to assist and promote green businesses and industries.

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Assembly Government to publish an annual indicator in the sustainable development report that clearly measures economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions.

Thank you for many of the things that you said in your address today. However, as I go through the rationale, I hope that some of the Members from the Labour Party sitting behind you will change their minds about amendments 1, 2 and 3, given that your arguments, in my view, are not based on rational debate, and that, furthermore, you do not have the figures to suggest that you need to reject them.

I accept that it is no easy option to change behaviour. In many ways, we are about something different here. The sustainable development duty that we have in section 121 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 gives Wales a great opportunity to lead the world. In many ways, the rhetoric emanating from the Minister has reflected a genuine consensual desire here to achieve many of the points in the sustainable development action plan as well as a number of the points that are in the new environment strategy, because the two are closely related.

Our amendment 1 regrets the increase in the amount of waste that is not recycled or composted per person in Wales. The Minister says that it is just a question of data. Where have you been all of these years, Minister? Get the data right. The figures show clearly that the amount of waste going to landfill per person in Wales has gone up. How can you reject the amendment? We are helping you, with this amendment, to improve things in Wales. So, let us have a little honesty in your rationale, which is so weak. If it is so weak, why do you not admit that you failed to

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd er mwyn gwneud rhagor i gynorthwyo a hyrwyddo busnesau a diwydiannau gwyrdd.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyhoeddi dangosydd blynyddol yn yr adroddiad datblygu cynaliadwy sy'n mesur yn glir y twf economaidd o'i gymharu â'r carbon deuocsid a ryddheir.

Diolch ichi am nifer o'r pethau a ddywedwyd yn eich anerchiad heddiw. Fodd bynnag, wrth imi fynd drwy'r rhesymeg, gobeithio y bydd rhai o Aelodau'r Blaid Lafur sy'n eistedd y tu ôl ichi yn newid eu meddyliau am welliannau 1, 2 a 3, o gofio nad yw eich dadleuon, yn fy marn i, yn seiliedig ar ddadl resymegol, ac at hynny nad yw'r ffigurau gennych i awgrymu bod angen ichi eu gwrthod.

Derbyniaf nad yw'n ddewis hawdd newid ymddygiad. Mewn llawer ffordd, yr ydym yn sôn am rywbeth gwahanol yma. Mae'r ddyletswydd datblygu cynaliadwy sydd gennym yn adran 121 o Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 yn gyfle gwych i Gymru arwain y byd. Mewn llawer ffordd, mae rhethreg y Gweinidog wedi adlewyrchu dymuniad cydsyniol gwirioneddol yma i gyflawni llawer o'r pwyntiau yn y cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy, yn ogystal â nifer o'r pwyntiau sydd yn y strategaeth amgylcheddol newydd, oherwydd mae perthynas agos rhwng y ddau.

Mae ein gwelliant 1 yn gresynu at y cynnydd yn y gwastraff y pen nad yw'n cael ei ailgylchu na'i gompostio yng Nghymru. Dywed y Gweinidog mai cwestiwn o ddata yn unig yw hyn. Ble yr ydych chi wedi bod dros y blynyddoedd, Weinidog? Sicrhewch fod y data'n gywir. Dengys y ffigurau'n glir fod cynnydd yn y gwastraff y pen sy'n mynd i'w dirlenwi yng Nghymru. Sut y gallwch wrthod y gwelliant? Yr ydym yn eich helpu, gyda'r gwelliant hwn, i wella pethau yng Nghymru. Felly, beth am gael ychydig onestrwydd yn eich sail resymol, sydd mor

collect the data in a robust manner before?
That is what you are telling us.

Our amendment 2 instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to develop a green jobs strategy in order to do more to assist and promote green businesses and initiatives. This is not the first time that many of my colleagues in the Welsh Conservatives and Plaid Cymru and I have called for this. While you have sat there talking in depth to Andrew Davies, the Minister responsible for green jobs, the Labour Party in the Scotland Executive, in partnership with the Liberal Democrats, has gone ahead and has produced a green jobs strategy. So, yet again, we are doing it; we are getting the data, and we are getting rid of landfill in Wales. Great rhetoric, but where is the delivery? It just does not wash, Minister.

Amendment 3 calls on the Assembly Government to publish an annual indicator in the sustainable development report that clearly measures economic growth against carbon dioxide emissions. We have argued the case before across the floor, and you have rejected my arguments on the grounds, I assume, that everything is already being done, and that we are already reducing carbon emissions. That is not true. What about the Scottish Executive? I do not think that Scotland has any greater opportunities than Wales to achieve sustainable development, but it has done it; it uses that indicator. The problem is that, at the moment, you can get away with all of these little things, like increasing the amount of landfill, increasing the amount not recycled from individuals, and avoiding creating green jobs so that we create economic wealth in this country on the back of sustainable development. You can avoid it, because you do not have a single indicator to measure this. That is how you are avoiding good scrutiny.

Where is the scrutiny in Wales? It obviously comes from this Chamber, and from the many organisations that look to you and to us

wan. Os ydyw mor wan, pam nad ydych yn cyfaddef ichi fethu â chasglu'r data mewn ffordd gadarn cyn hyn? Dyna yr ydych yn ei ddweud wrthym.

Mae ein gwelliant 2 yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd er mwyn gwneud mwy i gynorthwyo a hyrwyddo busnesau a mentrau gwyrdd. Nid dyma'r tro cyntaf i nifer o'm cyd-aelodau yng ngrŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru a Phlaid Cymru a minnau alw am hyn. Tra yr ydych chi wedi bod yn eistedd yna'n siarad yn ddifrifol ag Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am swyddi gwyrdd, mae'r Blaid Lafur yng Ngweithrediaeth yr Alban, mewn partneriaeth â'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi bwrw ati i gynhyrchu strategaeth swyddi gwyrdd. Felly, unwaith eto, yr ydym yn gwneud yr un peth; yr ydym yn casglu'r data, ac yr ydym yn cael gwared ar wastraff wedi'i dirlenwi yng Nghymru. Rhethreg wych, ond beth am gyflawni? Nid yw'n dal dŵr, Weinidog.

Mae gwelliant 3 yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyhoeddi dangosydd blynyddol yn yr adroddiad ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy sy'n mesur twf economaidd yn glir yn erbyn gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid. Yr ydym wedi dadlau'r achos ar draws y llawr cyn hyn, ac yr ydych wedi gwrthod fy nadleuon ar y sail, mi gymeraf, fod popeth eisoes yn cael ei wneud a'n bod eisoes yn lleihau gollyngiadau carbon. Nid yw hynny'n wir. Beth am Weithrediaeth yr Alban? Ni chredaf fod yr Alban yn cael mwy o gyfleoedd na Chymru i ddarparu datblygu cynaliadwy, ond mae wedi llwyddo; mae'n defnyddio'r dangosydd hwnnw. Y broblem ar hyn o bryd yw y gallwch wneud fel y mynnoch o ran yr holl bethau bach hyn, fel cynyddu faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei dirlenwi, cynyddu'r hyn nad yw'n cael ei ailgylchu gan unigolion, ac osgoi creu swyddi gwyrdd er mwyn inni greu cyfoeth economaidd yn y wlad hon ar sail datblygu cynaliadwy. Gallwch osgoi hyn, oherwydd nid oes gennych yr un dangosydd i fesur hyn. Dyna sut yr ydych yn osgoi proses graffu dda.

Ble mae'r craffu yng Nghymru? Yn amlwg, mae'n dod o'r Siambr hon, ac o'r sefydliadau niferus sy'n troi atoch chi a ninnau yma am

here for leadership on issues of sustainable development. We also have Cynnal Cymru, the sustainable development forum for Wales, which is an excellent organisation, established as a critical friend to allow all of the people involved in sustainable development to come together to advise you. In your closing remarks, we should hear more about how to use it.

3.30 p.m.

Finally, we have some measures to which you did not refer in your opening remarks about the sustainable development annual report. In closing, I will draw your attention to one such measure and I hope that you will refer to it in summing up. Wales currently has an ecological footprint of 5.2, much of which is made up from waste per person, which we know that you have increased, as Minister. What action will you take during the remainder of your office—before the head boy becomes headmaster, as I assume will happen—and what efforts will you make to reduce Wales's share of the footprint from this high level of 5.2 to the world average of 1.8?

Brynle Williams: I propose amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the increases in carbon dioxide emissions in Wales, and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to redraft planning guidance to increase the diversity of renewable energy supply.

The Welsh Conservatives will support all of the amendments apart from amendment 7, on which we will abstain.

Sustainable development policy is not working in Wales because the Welsh Assembly Government has its priorities wrong. While England, Scotland and Northern Ireland have all reduced their carbon dioxide emissions since 1990, Wales has seen an increase, albeit a small one. England, which is responsible for over three quarters of the UK's carbon dioxide emissions, has reduced emissions by 6.9 per cent. In comparison, Wales, which contributes just 7.4 per cent to the UK

arweinyddiaeth ar faterion datblygu cynaliadwy. Yn ogystal, mae gennym Cynnal Cymru, sef fforwm datblygu cynaliadwy Cymru, sy'n sefydliad rhagorol, wedi ei sefydlu fel cyfaill beirniadol i alluogi pawb sy'n cymryd rhan mewn datblygu cynaliadwy i ddod ynghyd i'ch cynghori. Yn eich sylwadau i gloi, dylem glywed mwy am y ffordd i'w ddefnyddio.

Yn olaf, mae gennym rai mesurau nas cyfeiriasoch atynt yn eich sylwadau agoriadol ynghylch adroddiad blynyddol datblygu cynaliadwy. Wrth gloi, hoffwn dynnu eich sylw at un mesur o'r fath gan obeithio y byddwch yn cyfeirio ato wrth grynhoi. Ar hyn o bryd mae ôl troed ecolegol o 5.2 gan Gymru a gwastraff y pen yw'r rhan fwyaf ohono y gwyddom ichi ei gynyddu fel Gweinidog. Pa gamau y byddwch yn eu cymryd yn ystod gweddill eich cyfnod fel Gweinidog—cyn i'r prif swyddog fynd yn bennaeth, fel y tybiaf y bydd yn digwydd— a pha ymdrechion a wnewch i leihau cyfran Cymru o'r ôl troed mawr hwn o 5.2 i 1.8 sef y cyfartaledd byd eang?

Brynle Williams: Cynigiau welliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y cynnydd o ran y carbon deuocsid a ryddheir yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ailddrafftio canllawiau cynllunio i gynyddu amrywiaeth y cyflenwad ynni adnewyddadwy.

Bydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi pob gwelliant ar wahân i welliant 7, pan fyddwn yn atal ein pleidlais.

Nid yw'r polisi datblygu cynaliadwy yn gweithio yng Nghymru gan fod blaenoriaethau anghywir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Er bod Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon i gyd wedi lleihau eu gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid ers 1990, gwelwyd cynnydd, er yn fach, yng Nghymru. Mae Lloegr, sy'n gyfrifol am dros dri chwarter gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid y DU, wedi lleihau gollyngiadau 6.9 y cant. Mewn cymhariaeth, gwelwyd cynnydd o 0.2 y cant yn y gollyngiadau o Gymru, sy'n

emissions total, has seen its emissions rise by 0.2 per cent. Sustainable development is not being given the priority that it deserves.

As the Minister stated, electricity generation is the biggest source of carbon dioxide emissions in Wales. I will use my time today to focus on this. While carbon dioxide emissions from electricity generation in England have fallen by over 20 per cent since 1990, it is of great concern to me that emissions from electricity generation in Wales have risen by 22 per cent. The Minister has argued that Wales produces energy for consumption beyond its borders and that it does not consume all that its industry manufactures, which I agree with, but that is the same in England and Scotland, where carbon emissions have been decreasing over the same period. As important as energy production is how efficiently that energy is used, and not enough is being done to reduce consumption.

It is significant that while the amount of renewable energy being produced in Wales increased by a third between 2003 and 2004, it added just 0.37 per cent to the total. Demand is spiralling upwards and growth in renewable energy is not keeping pace.

Renewable energy production could be making a substantial contribution, but, at present, the rise in consumption must be met in the main by traditional—and regrettably—carbon-emitting power stations. It is, perhaps, unfortunate that energy efficiency will never be as visible as a Severn barrage or the huge windfarms dominating our countryside. However, efficiency, together with diverse renewable energy sources, must be taken on board if Wales is to reverse its rising carbon emissions.

The Welsh Assembly Government should be doing everything that it can to help households, particularly those with low incomes, to move away from unsustainable electricity use in space heating and lighting, and to improve the take-up of simple measures such as installing cavity wall insulation and using energy-saving light bulbs. I agree with the Minister that there are many other such measures that we could use.

cyfrannu dim ond 7.4 y cant o gyfanswm gollyngiadau'r DU. Nid yw datblygu cynaliadwy yn cael y flaenoriaeth y mae'n ei haeddu.

Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, cynhyrchu trydan yw'r ffynhonnell fwyaf o ollyngiadau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru. Byddaf yn defnyddio fy amser heddiw i ganolbwyntio ar hyn. Er bod gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid o gynhyrchu trydan yn Lloegr wedi gostwng dros 20 y cant er 1990, mae'n bryder mawr i mi fod gollyngiadau o gynhyrchu trydan yng Nghymru wedi codi 22 y cant. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dadlau bod Cymru'n cynhyrchu ynni ar gyfer ei ddefnyddio y tu allan i Gymru, ac nad yw'n defnyddio'r cyfan y mae ein diwydiant yn ei gynhyrchu. Yr wyf yn cytuno â hynny. Ond, mae'r un peth yn wir yn Lloegr a'r Alban, ac mae gollyngiadau carbon wedi bod yn lleihau yno dros yr un cyfnod. Mae defnyddio'n effeithlon lawn mor bwysig â chynhyrchu ynni, ac ni wneir digon i leihau faint a ddefnyddir.

Er i gyfanswm yr ynni adnewyddadwy a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru gynyddu un rhan o dair rhwng 2003 a 2004, mae'n arwyddocaol mai 0.37 y cant yn unig a ychwanegodd at y cyfanswm. Mae'r galw'n cynyddu'n aruthrol, ond nid oes twf cyfatebol mewn ynni adnewyddadwy.

Gallai cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy wneud cyfraniad sylweddol. Ond ar hyn o bryd, yn anffodus, rhaid diwallu'r cynnydd yn y defnydd yn bennaf gan orsafoedd pŵer traddodiadol sy'n cynhyrchu carbon. Mae'n anffodus, efallai, na fydd defnyddio ynni'n effeithlon byth mor weladwy ag argae ar draws afon Hafren neu'r ffermydd gwynt enfawr sy'n britho'n hardaloedd gwledig. Fodd bynnag, rhaid mynd ati i fabwysiadu egwyddor effeithlonrwydd er mwyn i Gymru leihau ei gollyngiadau carbon cynyddol.

Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wneud popeth posibl i helpu teuluoedd, yn enwedig y rheini sydd ag incwm isel, i symud oddi wrth ddefnyddio trydan anghynaliadwy i wresogi a goleuo, a chynyddu'r niferoedd sy'n defnyddio dulliau syml, fel inswleiddio waliau a defnyddio bylbiau golau sy'n arbed ynni. Cytunaf â'r Gweinidog fod nifer o gamau eraill o'r fath y gallem eu defnyddio.

If renewable energy production is to start making a real contribution, the Welsh Assembly Government needs to redraft planning guidance to support a far wider group of technologies. Currently, technical advice note 8 overwhelmingly supports large, onshore windfarms as the main way of reaching Wales's renewable energy targets for 2010.

I can see the attraction of having one policy responsible for meeting the renewable energy targets. However, I do not believe that this will be effective. Guidance should promote joined-up thinking, and address efficiency at the same time as production. Local authorities should be supported in developing decentralised energy production, following the best practices of towns such as Woking, which has reduced its carbon dioxide emissions by as much as 77 per cent since 1990; that is quite a reduction.

There needs to be a realisation of the fundamental differences between public buildings and businesses signing paperwork to get green energy from the national grid, and, for example, having a wood-fuel combined heat and power generator on site, providing efficient electricity and space heating without the inefficiencies of the old-fashioned grid. The Welsh Assembly Government should embrace biomass, and at least give our farmers the same level of support, in kick-starting the industry, as is available in England—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You need to wind up now, Brynle.

Brynle Williams: Minister, I hope that you will take heed of what has been said in the Chamber this afternoon, and that you will support these amendments.

Elin Jones: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 5: Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn condemnio methiant parhaus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddangos yn glir yn yr adroddiadau blynyddol ar y cynllun datblygu

Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ailddrafftio canllawiau cynllunio i gefnogi grŵp ehangach o lawer o dechnolegau, er mwyn sicrhau y gall cynhyrchu ynni adnewyddadwy ddechrau gwneud cyfraniad gwirioneddol. Ar hyn o bryd, mae nodyn cyngor technegol 8 yn cefnogi ffermydd gwynt mawr ar y tir fel y prif ddull i gyrraedd targedau ynni adnewyddadwy Cymru ar gyfer 2010.

Gallaf ddeall apêl cael un polisi yn gyfrifol am gyflawni targedau ynni adnewyddadwy. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf y bydd hynny'n effeithiol. Dylai canllawiau hyrwyddo meddylfryd cydgyssylltiedig, a mynd i'r afael ag effeithlonrwydd ar yr un pryd â chynhyrchu. Dylid cefnogi awdurdodau lleol i ddatblygu cynhyrchu ynni i ffwrdd o'r canol, gan ddilyn arferion gorau trefi fel Woking, sydd wedi lleihau ei gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid gymaint â 77 y cant er 1990; mae hynny'n gryn ostyngiad.

Mae angen sylweddoli'r gwahaniaethau sylfaenol rhwng adeiladau cyhoeddus a busnesau yn llofnodi gwaith papur i gael ynni gwyrdd o'r grid cenedlaethol, a chael generadur ar y safle, er enghraifft, sy'n llosgi coed ac yn cynhyrchu gwres a phŵer, gan ddarparu trydan effeithlon a gwres heb aneffeithlonrwydd y grid hen ffasiwn. Dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru arddel egwyddor bio-màs, gan roi'r un lefel o gefnogaeth i'n ffermwyr, o leiaf, wrth roi hwb cychwynnol i'r diwydiant, fel sydd ar gael yn Lloegr—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben, yn awr, Brynle.

Brynle Williams: Weinidog, gobeithio y byddwch yn ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma ac y byddwch yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn.

Elin Jones: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

condemns the Assembly Government's continued failure to clearly demonstrate in the sustainable development scheme annual

cynaliadwy sut y mae Cymru'n llwyddo i fyw mewn ffordd fwy cynaliadwy. *reports how Wales is achieving a more sustainable way of living.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

yn nodi'r methiant i gysylltu adroddiad blynyddol y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy gydag adroddiadau blynyddol y Prif Weinidog fel ag a nodir yng nghynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy 2004 i 2007. *notes the failure to link the sustainable development scheme annual report to the First Minister's annual reports as stated in sustainable development action plan 2004 to 2007.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

yn nodi bod amcanion datblygu cynaliadwy Cymru'n cael eu llesteirio am nad oes ganddi bwerau o hyd dros reoliadau adeiladu ac yn galw am ddatganoli'r pwerau hyn. *notes that the continued lack of powers over building regulations limits Wales's sustainable development aims and calls for the devolution of these powers.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y cynnydd yn y carbon deuocsid a ryddheir o ffynonellau yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu targedau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn ar gyfer gostwng y carbon a ryddheir. *expresses concern at the rise in carbon dioxide emissions from Welsh sources and calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to develop year on year targets for reductions in carbon emissions.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig: I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

yn nodi'r ffaith mai dyma adroddiad blynyddol olaf tymor y Cynulliad ar y cynllun datblygu cynaliadwy ac yn edrych ymlaen at gael asesiadau annibynnol yn y dyfodol o record Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran cyflawni ei hamcanion datblygu cynaliadwy. *notes the fact that this is the final sustainable development scheme annual report of the Assembly term and looks forward to future independent assessments of the Assembly Government's record in achieving its sustainable development aims.*

Gwerthfawrogaf fod y Gweinidog yn cefnogi gwelliant 6, ac yn derbyn y bu camgymeriad yn y broses hon. Fodd bynnag, mae'n gwrthod y gwelliannau sydd â sylwedd iddynt o ran y pwnc sydd o dan sylw, sy'n anffodus. I appreciate the Minister's support for amendment 6, and that he accepts there has been a mistake in this process. However, he rejects the amendments of substance in this subject, which is unfortunate.

Nid yw'r ddogfen yr ydym yn ei thrafod y prynhawn yma ar gael yn y Gymraeg—mae'n debyg nad oedd yn flaenoriaeth i'w chyfieithu. Felly, fel rhywun sy'n gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg yn y Cynulliad, mae'n fy ngosod o dan rywffaint o anfantais, yn ogystal ag unrhyw un arall sy'n gweithio drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. The document which we are discussing this afternoon is not available in Welsh—it seems it was not a priority for translation. As someone who works through the medium of Welsh in the Assembly, that puts me at somewhat of a disadvantage, as it would anyone else who works through the medium of Welsh.

Ar y cynllun gweithredu, mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud bod nifer o'r pwyntiau gweithredu yn y cynllun hwn wedi eu cyrraedd, neu yn agos i'w cyrraedd, ac yr wyf yn cydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, os felly, mae'n amser yn awr i edrych ar gynnig pwyntiau gweithredu mwy heriol i'r Llywodraeth a fydd yn delio â'r ffaith ddamniol a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar, sef bod y cynnydd mewn rhyddhau carbon deuocsid yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn unrhyw fan arall yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol, a hynny er mai ni yw'r unig Lywodraeth yn y Deyrnas Gyfunol sydd â rôl statudol i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy.

Mae cynladwyedd ac effeithlonrwydd ynni yn ganolog i'r pwnc hwn; mae'r cynllun gweithredu ei hunan yn cydnabod hynny. Mae dau set o ddefnyddwyr ynni y gall unrhyw Lywodraeth effeithio arnynt yn uniongyrchol. Y set gyntaf yw adeiladau sydd yn y sector cyhoeddus, a'r ail set yw adeiladau newydd. Noda'r cynllun gweithredu bod angen trosglwyddo cytundebau trydan adeiladau'r Llywodraeth i gyflenwyr gwyrdd, ac mae hynny wedi ei wneud yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion. Fodd bynnag, a yw hyn yn ddigon uchelgeisiol? Ni chredaf ei fod.

Mae eisiau edrych hefyd ar effeithlonrwydd ynni yr adeiladau sydd yn y sector cyhoeddus—ysbytai, ysgolion, canolfannau hamdden, ac yn y blaen. Mae ysbytai, yn enwedig, yn gwastraffu llawer o ynni, ac yn ddefnyddwyr mawr o ynni. Mae eisiau rhaglen ddatblygu ynni cynaliadwy—ynni'r haul ac ynni gwynt—i adeiladau cyhoeddus; gellid cael tyrbîn gwynt, efallai, ar gyfer pob ysgol yng Nghymru, neu baneli solar ar doeau ysgolion.

Ar gyfer cynlluniau mwy, fel y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes, mae eisiau edrych ar systemau gwres a phŵer cyfunedig. Mae Cyngor Sir Ceredigion, er enghraifft, newydd lansio ei gynllun ar gyfer swyddfeydd y cyngor yn Aberaeron, yn ogystal â'r cartref hen bobl lleol. Buaswn yn gobeithio y gallasai Llywodraeth flaengar ddatblygu'r model hwnnw ar gyfer adeiladau cyhoeddus drwy Gymru.

As for the action plan, the Minister has said that many of the action points in this plan have been achieved, or are close to being achieved, and I acknowledge that. However, if that is the case, it is now time to look at proposing more challenging action points for the Government to deal with the damning fact published recently, which is that the increase in carbon dioxide emissions is higher in Wales than anywhere else in the United Kingdom, despite the fact that we are the only Government in the United Kingdom that has a statutory role to promote sustainable development.

Energy sustainability and efficiency is central to this subject; the action plan itself acknowledges that. There are two sets of energy users that any Government can directly influence. The first set is buildings in the public sector, and the second is new buildings. The action plan states that we need to transfer electricity contracts for Government buildings to green providers, which has been done in most cases. However, is that ambitious enough? I do not believe it is.

We also need to look at energy efficiency in buildings in the public sector—hospitals, schools, leisure centres, and so on. Hospitals, in particular, waste a great deal of energy, and are major consumers of energy. We need a sustainable energy development programme—solar and wind energy—for public buildings; we could have a wind turbine for every school in Wales, perhaps, or solar panels on the roofs of schools.

For larger projects, as already referred to, we need to look at combined heat and power systems. Ceredigion County Council, for example, has just launched its scheme for the council's offices in Aberaeron, as well as the local home for the elderly. I would hope that a progressive Government could develop that model for public buildings throughout Wales.

3.40 p.m.

I fod yn gynaliadwy, rhaid inni fod yn hunan-gynaliadwy o ran yr ynni yr ydym yn ei ddefnyddio yn ein sector cyhoeddus, nid o ran yr amgylchedd yn unig, ond o ran diogelwch y ffynonellau ynni hynny fel yr awn yn fwy dibynnol ar ffynonellau ynni sydd yn bell i ffwrdd, megis nwy o Rwsia ac olew o'r dwyrain canol.

O ran adeiladau newydd, mae dylanwad y Cynulliad yn gyfyngedig i adeiladau'r Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad ac hefyd i dai cymdeithasol, ac mae pwynt gweithredu penodol ar dai cymdeithasol yn yr adroddiad hwn. Dyma'r unig adeiladau newydd y gall y Llywodraeth chwarae unrhyw rôl yn hybu ynni cynaliadwy ynddynt oherwydd nid yw'r rheoliadau adeiladu wedi cael eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Felly, mae'r hyn a all y Cynulliad a'r Llywodraeth ei wneud o ran hybu cynaliadwyedd ynni o fewn adeiladau newydd yn gyfyngedig.

Byddwn yn gobeithio byddai pob plaid yn cytuno bod dadl gref dros ddatganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladu i Gymru, ac yr wyf yn siomedig bod y Llywodraeth a'r Blaid Doriáidd yn dweud nad ydynt yn cefnogi datganoli'r rheoliadau adeiladu i Gymru. Mae'n ddigon clir—mae adeilad naill ai yng Nghymru neu yn Lloegr, ac felly mae rheoliadau adeiladu naill ai'n berthnasol yng Nghymru neu yn Lloegr. Mae'n fater a allai gael ei ddatganoli'n glir, ond mae diffyg ewyllys gwleidyddol yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma.

Cyfeiriaf at un mater arall. Rhaid inni gael gweld y dangosyddion cynaliadwyedd cyn gynted â phosibl fel ein bod ni'n gallu craffu ar y Llywodraeth hwn yn fwy effeithiol ar ei waith.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Your time is up.

Gwenda Thomas: I welcome the opportunity to comment on one of the Assembly's cross-cutting duties. Equality of opportunity and the promotion of sustainable development are both statutory duties of the Assembly and, as such, are central to the way in which the Assembly exercises its

To be sustainable, we need to be self-sufficient in relation to the energy we use in our public sector, not only in terms of the environment, but in terms of the security of those sources of energy, as we become more and more dependent upon energy sources from far afield, such as gas from Russia and oil from the middle east.

In terms of new buildings, the Assembly's influence is limited to Government and Assembly buildings and to social housing, and there is a specific action point on social housing in this report. These are the only new buildings in which the Government can play any role in promoting sustainable energy, because the building regulations have not been devolved to the Assembly. Therefore, what the Government and the Assembly can do in terms of promoting sustainable energy in new buildings is limited.

I would hope that all parties would agree that there is a strong argument for devolving the building regulations to Wales, and I am disappointed that the Government and the Tory Party have said that they do not support devolving the building regulations to Wales. It is perfectly clear—a building is either in Wales or in England, and so building regulations are either relevant in Wales or in England. It is a matter that could be clearly devolved, but there is a lack of political will in the Chamber this afternoon.

I will refer to one other matter. We must have sustainability indicators as soon as possible, so that we can scrutinise this Government on its work more effectively.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'ch amser wedi dod i ben.

Gwenda Thomas: Croesawaf y cyfle i roi sylwadau ar un o ddyletswyddau trawsbynciol y Cynulliad. Mae cyfle cyfartal a hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy yn ddyletswyddau statudol i'r Cynulliad, ac felly maent yn ganolog i'r modd y mae'r Cynulliad yn cyflawni ei swyddogaethau.

functions. The report shows real progress in moving towards the target set in the sustainable development action plan, and I am pleased to see that the majority of the objectives have been achieved or are in the process of being achieved. Two of the targets that still need more work to achieve the commitment are to do with education in relation to global citizenship. The Committee on Equality of Opportunity discussed how sustainable development can be promoted as part of the equality agenda when it considered the draft sustainable development action plan in May 2004. We acknowledge the difficulty of weaving as large an issue as sustainable development into the everyday work of the Assembly. We suggested that the approach taken by the mainstreaming equality review report to the development of an equality strategy could help address some of the issues raised in taking forward the sustainable development action plan. I hope that the committee's suggested approach has proved to be useful in the development of the action plan.

I am pleased to see that the committee's concerns about engaging the private sector in sustainable practices have been addressed, with the setting up of training and information services for the public, private and voluntary sectors. I am sure that this is one sector in which great strides forward can be achieved. In terms of other issues raised by the committee when we considered the draft plan, there are still some that do not appear to have been fully addressed. Although the headline indicators have been revised and extended, there is still concern as to how much they adequately measure equality. I welcome the advances made in sustainable procurement in the public sector, especially in food procurement. These will help not only to encourage local businesses and producers, but also to improve the freshness and quality of the food available in schools and hospitals. The committee recognised the importance of sustainable procurement and emphasised the need for procurement that is not only sustainable, but ethical, and I would hope that the action plan will reflect this in the future.

Finally, last week, we heard in the press that

Dengys yr adroddiad hwn gynnydd gwirioneddol o ran symud at y targed a bennwyd yn y cynllun gweithredu ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Yr wyf yn falch gweld bod fwyafrif yr amcanion wedi eu cyflawni neu yn y broses o gael eu cyflawni. Mae dau o'r targedau y mae angen gwaith pellach arnynt i gyflawni'r ymrwymiad yn ymwneud ag addysg yng nghyd-destun dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang. Trafodwyd y ffordd y gellir hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy fel rhan o'r agenda cydraddoldeb yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal pan ystyriwyd y cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy drafft ym Mai 2004. Cydnabyddwn mor anodd yw plethu pwnc mor fawr â datblygu cynaliadwy i waith bob dydd y Cynulliad. Awgrymwn y gallai'r ymagwedd a gymerwyd gan yr adroddiad ar adolygu prif-ffrydio cydraddoldeb at ddatblygu strategaeth cydraddoldeb helpu mynd i'r afael â rhai o'r materion a godwyd wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy. Gobeithio bod yr ymagwedd a awgrymwyd gan y pwyllgor wedi bod yn ddefnyddiol wrth ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu.

Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod pryderon y pwyllgor ynglŷn ag annog y sector preifat i fabwysiadu arferion cynaliadwy wedi'u datrys drwy sefydlu gwasanaethau hyfforddiant a gwybodaeth i'r sectorau cyhoeddus, preifat a gwirfoddol. Diau y gellir gwneud camau breision yn y sector hwn. O ran y materion eraill a godwyd gan y pwyllgor wrth ystyried y cynllun drafft, ymddengys nad aethpwyd i'r afael yn llawn eto â rhai ohonynt. Er bod y dangosyddion pennawd wedi'u hadolygu a'u hymestyn, mae pryder o hyd am y graddau y maent yn mesur cydraddoldeb yn ddigonol. Croesawaf y cynnydd a wnaed ym maes caffael cynaliadwy yn y sector cyhoeddus, yn enwedig ym maes caffael bwyd. Yn ogystal ag annog busnesau a chynhyrchwyr lleol, byddant hefyd yn gwella ffresni ac ansawdd y bwyd sydd ar gael mewn ysgolion ac ysbytai. Mae'r pwyllgor yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd caffael cynaliadwy, a phwysleisiwyd yr angen am fesurau caffael sy'n foesebol yn ogystal ag yn gynaliadwy, a gobeithio y bydd y cynllun gweithredu yn adlewyrchu hyn yn y dyfodol.

Yn olaf, clywsom yn y wasg yr wythnos

black and minority ethnic communities in London felt marginalised in the sustainable development debate as their cultural and religious views on the environment are often seen as different to the accepted views of some organisations involved in promoting sustainability. I hope that you will agree that sustainability and equality of opportunity are not mutually exclusive, and that we should strive to ensure that the two themes are fully integrated in Assembly policies.

Glyn Davies: There has always been an air of what I think is justified self-congratulation about the National Assembly whenever we talk about sustainable development, because of the duty placed upon the Assembly by the Government of Wales Act 1998. All parties have been supportive of this principle—this was the gist of Mick Bates’s opening remarks—and the Welsh Assembly Government has received justified praise for its commitment to sustainable development. However, we have now reached a stage where mere words and a commitment to raising an awareness of the importance of sustainable development is no longer enough.

I have not yet read the Cardiff University report, ‘Aiming Higher’, but from the initial comments from other people who have read it, there is clearly much more work to do in terms of moving from the pioneering work that we have done here, in comparison with other Governments, to actions and policies that will make a real difference and deliver results. It seems that there is also much more work to do in terms of developing relationships with other UK parliaments, local government and the European Union, which any parliament that does pioneering work must do if it is to spread that work outwards.

It would be easy in a debate such as this to criticise the Assembly Government on aspects of the action plan, and there are aspects that I would like to criticise, as I am sure that, if we were in Government, there would be aspects that other people would want to criticise. However, I will use my time today to put forward a proposal that I believe

diwethaf fod cymunedau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn Llundain yn teimlo wedi eu gwthio i’r cyrion yn y ddadl ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy, oherwydd ystyrir bod eu safbwyntiau diwylliannol a chrefyddol ar yr amgylchedd yn aml yn wahanol i farn gyffredin rhai o’r sefydliadau sy’n ymwneud â hyrwyddo cynaliadwyedd. Gobeithio y byddwch yn cytuno nad yw cynaliadwyedd a chyfle cyfartal yn groes i’w gilydd, a dylem ymdrechu i sicrhau y caiff y ddwy thema eu hintegreiddio’n llawn ym mholisiau’r Cynulliad.

Glyn Davies: Mae yna ymdeimlad erioed o hunan-longyfarch y gellir ei gyfiawnhau, yn fy marn i, ynghylch y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol pryd bynnag y soniwn am ddatblygu cynaliadwy, oherwydd y ddyletswydd a roddir ar y Cynulliad gan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae’r holl bleidiau wedi bod yn gefnogol i’r egwyddor hon—dyna oedd sylwedd sylwadau agoriadol Mick Bates—ac mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ei chanmol am ei hymrwymiad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, a hynny’n gyfiawn. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn awr wedi cyrraedd sefyllfa lle nad yw geiriau ac ymrwymiad i gynyddu ymwybyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd datblygu cynaliadwy yn ddigon mwyach.

Nid wyf eto wedi darllen adroddiad Prifysgol Caerdydd, ‘Anelu’n Uwch’, ond o’r sylwadau cychwynnol gan bobl eraill sydd wedi ei ddarllen, mae’n amlwg fod llawer mwy o waith i’w wneud i symud o’r gwaith arloesol a wnaethom yma, o’n cymharu â Llywodraethau eraill, i weithredoedd a pholisiau a fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol ac yn dwyn ffrwyth. Ymddengys fod llawer mwy o waith i’w wneud hefyd i ddatblygu perthynas â seneddau eraill y DU, llywodraeth leol a’r Undeb Ewropeaidd. Rhaid i unrhyw senedd sy’n gwneud gwaith arloesol wneud hynny os yw am ledaenu’r gwaith tuag allan.

Byddai’n hawdd mewn dadl megis hon i feirniadu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am agweddau ar y cynllun gweithredu, ac mae yna agweddau yr hoffwn eu beirniadu, gan fy mod yn siŵr, pe baem mewn grym, y byddai agweddau yr hoffai pobl eraill eu beirniadu. Fodd bynnag, defnyddiaf fy amser heddiw i gyflwyno cynnig a gredaf allai wneud

could make a real difference. Last month, I represented the National Assembly at a Commonwealth Parliamentary Association seminar in the West Indies, where the impact of climate change is an issue of increasing concern—in particular, the increasing incidence and ferocity of hurricanes. My question was about the contribution that my personal journey to the West Indies had made to climate change and the damage that it had caused. Over the last year, I have travelled to Budapest, Edinburgh, Northern Ireland and Brussels and twice to Dublin on official National Assembly business—I should, perhaps, be the one to sign the copy of *Gulliver's Travels*.

Other Members are making similar journeys, and this does not take our private holiday arrangements into account. Another UK representative at the West Indies seminar was Michael Howard, a fellow Welshman and a former leader of the Conservative Party. Similar concerns about the impact of our journeys on climate change were on Michael Howard's mind as well, so much so that, this week, he adopted a personal policy that I too intend to adopt, and hope that other AMs will copy. I will find out the carbon cost of my journey, which was probably around 2 tonnes of carbon dioxide, and pay a sum to climatecare that is sufficient to plant enough trees—probably about five or six trees—to compensate for the damage that I caused to the climate as a result of my journey. It will probably cost me about £30. This is, in effect, a voluntary hypothecated tax on air travel, and I would not want it to be anything except voluntary.

I would like to see the carbon cost of every journey made by Assembly Members and officials calculated and for that information to be made available to them before they travel, so that they can compensate for the damage caused by their journey, if that is what they want to do. While the voluntary principle must remain, I would like to see manifesto commitments from all parties to introduce legislation ensuring that the carbon cost of every flight made from Wales, whether for business or private reasons, be made available to the person making that journey, so that they can make climate compensation payments if they so wish.

gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol. Y mis diwethaf, cynrychiolais y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol mewn seminar gan Gymdeithas Seneddol y Gymanwlad yn India'r Gorllewin, lle mae effaith newid yn yr hinsawdd yn fater o bryder cynyddol—yn arbennig y cynnydd mewn corwyntoedd a'u ffyrnigrwydd. Fy nghwestiwn oedd cyfraniad fy nhaith bersonol i India'r Gorllewin at newid yn yr hinsawdd a'r difrod a achosodd. Dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, yr wyf wedi teithio i Budapest, Caeredin, Gogledd Iwerddon a Brwsel a dwywaith i Ddilyn ar fusnes swyddogol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol—fi, efallai, ddylai lofnodi'r copi o *Gulliver's Travels*.

Mae Aelodau eraill yn gwneud teithiau tebyg, ac nid yw hynny'n cynnwys trefniadau ein gwyliau preifat. Cynrychiolydd arall o'r DU yn y seminar yn India'r Gorllewin oedd Michael Howard, cyd-Gymro a chyn-arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol. Yr oedd gan Michael Howard hefyd bryderon am effaith ein teithiau, yn gymaint felly nes iddo, yr wythnos hon, fabwysiadu polisi personol y bwriadaf fi ei fabwysiadu hefyd, a gobeithio y bydd ACau eraill yn ei efelychu. Byddaf yn cyfrifo cost carbon fy nhaith, a oedd tua 2 dunnell o garbon deuocsid, mae'n sicr, ac yn talu swm i climatecare sy'n ddigon i blannu digon o goed—pump neu chwech o goed fwy na thebyg—i wneud iawn am y difrod yr wyf wedi'i achosi i'r hinsawdd o ganlyniad i'm taith. Mae hynny'n debygol o gostio tua £30 imi. Mae hyn, mewn gwirionedd, yn dreth wirfoddol wedi'i neilltuo ar deithio awyr, ac ni fyddwn am iddo fod yn ddim ond gwirfoddol.

Hoffwn weld cost carbon pob taith a wneir gan Aelodau a swyddogion y Cynulliad yn cael ei chyfrifo, ac i'r wybodaeth honno fod ar gael iddynt cyn teithio fel y gallant wneud iawn am y difrod a achosir gan eu taith, os dyna a ddymunant. Tra dylai'r egwyddor wirfoddol barhau, hoffwn weld ymrwymadau manifesto gan bob plaid i gyflwyno deddfwriaeth sy'n sicrhau bod cost carbon pob taith awyr a wneir o Gymru, boed at ddibenion busnes neu breifat, ar gael i'r sawl sy'n gwneud y daith, fel y gallant wneud taliadau i ddigolledu'r hinsawdd, os dymunant.

Another proposal—and I do not want to be so precise about this—is that we need to introduce encouragement, and even force, so that developers ensure that some of the power that developments need comes from renewable sources. There are different ways of doing this, and I do not feel able to be precise—a certain proportion could be required for every property. I would prefer to see larger properties, whether business properties or private developments, required to be powered by a slightly higher proportion of renewable sources.

3.50 p.m.

We must move to a stage where we have legislation that will move this agenda forward, into the area that is much less popular. The Minister pointed out in his opening remarks that moving forward from where we are now will mean taking decisions that are not so popular. I have said in the Chamber before now that, on some decisions, we would be prepared to come to an agreement, because unpopular decisions are difficult to take in a democratic institution. That would be the general way forward.

I am disappointed that I did not get to all the areas on which I wanted to criticise the Government, but I can see that the clock has ticked on. Therefore, I will have to leave my contribution at a point which means that it has been only positive.

Val Lloyd: The drive towards sustainable development is representative of levels of international co-operation, for it is essential that countries work together to achieve this aim on a global level. As Agenda 21, the blueprint for sustainable development in this century, sets out, no country can achieve its potential on its own. The common global goal, set out in Agenda 21, allows nations such as Wales to develop and maintain links with countries in Europe and beyond.

The work undertaken in Wales, even though it has its detractors, has been used world wide

Cynnig arall—ac nid wyf am fod mor fanwl gywir ynglŷn â hwn—yw bod angen inni ddarparu anogaeth, a hyd yn oed gorfodaeth, er mwyn i ddatblygwyr sicrhau bod rhywfaint o'r pŵer y mae ei angen ar ddatblygiadau yn dod o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy. Mae gwahanol ffyrdd i wneud hyn, ac ni credaf y gallaf fod yn fanwl gywir—gellid mynnu cyfran benodol am bob eiddo. Byddai'n well gennyf weld gofyniad bod adeiliadau mwy o faint, boed yn eiddo busnes neu'n ddatblygiadau preifat, yn cael eu hynni o gyfran ychydig yn uwch o ffynonellau adnewyddadwy.

Rhaid inni symud at sefyllfa lle mae gennym ddeddfwriaeth a fydd yn symud yr agenda hon ymlaen, i'r maes sydd lawer yn llai poblogaidd. Tynnodd y Gweinidog sylw at ei sylwadau agoriadol y bydd symud ymlaen o ble yr ydym yn awr yn golygu gwneud penderfyniadau nad ydynt mor boblogaidd. Yr wyf wedi dweud yn y Siambr cyn hyn y byddem, ar rai penderfyniadau, yn barod i ddod i gytundeb, gan fod penderfyniadau amhoblogaidd yn anodd eu gwneud mewn sefydliad democrataidd. Dyna fyddai'r ffordd ymlaen yn gyffredinol.

Yr wyf wedi fy siomi na lwyddais i godi'r holl feysydd yr oeddwn am feirniadu'r Llywodraeth amdanynt, ond gwelaf fod y cloc wedi mynd yn ei flaen. Felly, bydd yn rhaid imi adael fy nghyfraniad ar bwynt sy'n golygu iddo fod yn gadarnhaol yn unig.

Val Lloyd: Mae'r ymgyrch tuag at ddatblygu cynaliadwy yn dangos lefelau o gydweithredu rhyngwladol, oherwydd ei bod yn hanfodol i wledydd gydweithio i gyflawni'r nod hwn ar lefel fyd-eang. Fel y mae Agenda 21, y glasbrint ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yn y ganrif hon, yn ei osod allan, ni all unrhyw wlad gyflawni ei photensial ar ei phen ei hun. Mae'r nod byd-eang cyffredin, sydd wedi ei osod allan yn Agenda 21, yn fodd i wledydd megis Cymru ddatblygu a chynnal cysylltiadau â gwledydd yn Ewrop a thu hwnt.

Mae'r gwaith a wnaed yng Nghymru, er bod rhai wedi'i feirniadu, wedi ei ddefnyddio ar

as an example of good practice in joined-up partnership working across policy areas and involving stakeholders in the process. The Assembly has embraced its commitment to improve people's quality of life, to promote equality and to tackle disadvantage. People in communities are at the heart of the Government's drive towards higher levels of sustainable development. The annual report for 2006 shows that a growing proportion of the commitments outlined in the action plan for 2004-07 have been completed and I am sure that we are all pleased to see that progress.

It has already been mentioned, and we would agree, that the Chamber is a symbol of the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development. Notwithstanding some hiccups with the temperature control yesterday, it is a huge success; our new building has sustainable development at the heart of its design, which has been recognised all over the world. It achieved the well-deserved sustainability award at the Royal Institute of Chartered Surveyors' sustainability awards 2006. High environmental standards are repeated through the Assembly estate including, as indicated by the Minister, the three new buildings delivered under the location strategy. Another highlight, this year, is the launch of the environment strategy for Wales and the concomitant action plan; identifying climate change is a priority and it sets out commitments to reduce greenhouse-gas emissions.

I welcome the progress achieved by the sustainable development indicators working group in identifying a full set of indicators that reflect cultural, social, economic and environmental issues. This will allow more accurate monitoring of how we are doing on each of our commitments. These are welcome developments; however, efforts need to continue to ensure a more sustainable way of life for everyone. Not only do we need even more green energy, less waste and more recycling, we also need to involve all sections of society in bringing this agenda forward. Indeed, as Glyn pointed out—he has now left the Chamber—we need to look to ourselves to see that we, too, are effective across all aspects of our lives.

draws y byd fel enghraifft o arfer da mewn gwaith partneriaeth cydgyssylltiedig ar draws meysydd polisi a chynnwys rhanddeiliaid yn y broses. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi llwyr ymrwmo i wella safon byw pobl, hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb a mynd i'r afael ag anfantais. Pobl yn y cymunedau sydd wrth wraidd ymgyrch y Llywodraeth at fwy o ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol am 2006 yn dangos bod cyfran gynyddol o'r ymrwymadau a amlinellwyd yng nghynllun gweithredu 2004-07 wedi eu cwblhau, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn falch gweld y cynnydd hwnnw.

Soniwyd eisoes, a byddem yn cytuno, fod y Siambr yn symbol o ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy. Er gwaethaf rhai problemau wrth reoli'r tymheredd ddoe, mae'n llwyddiant ysgubol; mae datblygu cynaliadwy wrth wraidd cynllun ein hadeilad newydd, rhywbeth a gydnabuwyd yn fyd-eang. Enillodd wobwr haeddiannol am gynaliadwyedd yng ngwobrau cynaliadwyedd Sefydliad Brenhinol y Syrffewyr Siartredig yn 2006. Mae'r un safonau amgylcheddol uchel i'w gweld yn holl ystad y Cynulliad, gan gynnwys, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, y tri adeilad newydd a ddarparwyd o dan y strategaeth leoli. Uchafbwynt arall eleni yw lansio strategaeth yr amgylchedd i Gymru a'r cynllun gweithredu cysylltiedig; mae nodi newid yn yr hinsawdd yn flaenoriaeth, ac mae'n gosod allan ymrwymadau i leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr.

Croesawaf y cynnydd a wnaed gan y gweithgor ar ddangosyddion datblygu cynaliadwy wrth nodi set gyfan o ddangosyddion sy'n adlewyrchu materion diwylliannol, cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol. Bydd hyn yn fodd i fonitro'n fwy cywir ein cynnydd gyda phob un o'n hymrwymadau. Maent yn ddatblygiadau i'w croesawu; fodd bynnag, mae angen i ymdrechion barhau i sicrhau ffordd o fyw mwy cynaliadwy i bawb. Mae angen nid yn unig mwy o ynni gwyrdd, llai o wastraff a mwy o ailgylchu, ond mae hefyd angen cynnwys pob rhan o gymdeithas er mwyn datblygu'r agenda hon. Yn wir, fel yr eglurodd Glyn—mae wedi gadael y Siambr erbyn hyn—mae angen inni edrych arnom ni ein hunain i sicrhau ein bod ni hefyd yn

effeithiol ym mhob agwedd ar ein bywydau.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn derbyn bod yn rhaid i ni greu meddylfryd clir a chryf yng Nghymru o blaid datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae angen newid diwylliant os ydym am gael y math o effaith y cyfeiriodd Mick Bates ato, a lleihau ein hól troed ecolegol, sy'n llawer rhy fawr ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch fod gan addysg ran bwysig i'w chwarae yn y broses hon a bod addysgu plant a phobl ifanc i feddwl yn y termau hyn yn eithriadol o bwysig. Weinidog, a wnewch ymuno â mi i fynegi pryder bod yr Adran dros Ddatblygu Rhyngwladol yn San Steffan wedi penderfynu dod â chyllid y tair canolfan addysg datblygu cynaliadwy yng Nghymru i ben? Y canolfannau hynny yw'r Ganolfan Addysg Byd ym Mangor, Global Connections yn Noc Penfro a Chanolfan Addysg Amgylchedd a Datblygu Powys yn Llanidloes. Mae'r canolfannau hynny yn cyfrannu cyrsiau ar ddatblygu cynaliadwy a dinasyddiaeth fyd-eang.

A yw'r Adran dros Ddatblygu Rhyngwladol yn San Steffan yn sylweddoli fod gan y Cynulliad gyfrifoldeb statudol i hyrwyddo datblygu cynaliadwy? A yw'r adran yn sylweddoli ei fod yn un o flaenoriaethau eich Llywodraeth? Os ydyw, pa drafodaethau a gawsoch chi neu'r Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau gyda'r adran ynghylch cyllido'r canolfannau a'r cyrsiau pwysig hyn? Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau y bydd y canolfannau hyn yn cael digon o gyllid ac yn sicrhau bod y cyrsiau yn parhau?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I thank Members for their contributions; some interesting ideas were raised. To deal with Mick Bates's points, I welcome his attempts to be inclusive and helpful in terms of promoting amendment 1, but all that it does is to note a possible problem and not provide the solution. I have answered that point. It is important to realise that he is not correct in saying that I am responsible for the generation of waste in Wales, and the increase in it. There is no doubt that much work remains to be done in terms of waste minimisation, but it cannot be done at a Welsh national level. I suggest that it cannot

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I am sure you accept that we must create a clear and strong mindset in Wales in favour of sustainable development. We need a culture change if we are to have the kind of impact that Mick Bates referred to, and succeed in reducing our ecological footprint, which is far too large in Wales at present. I am sure you would agree that education has an important role to play in this process, and that educating children and young people to think in these terms is extremely important. Minister, will you join me in expressing concern at the fact that the Department for International Development in Westminster has decided to terminate the funding of the three sustainable development education centres in Wales? Those centres are the World Education Centre in Bangor, Global Connections in Pembroke Dock and the Powys Environment and Development Education Centre in Llanidloes. Those centres contribute courses on sustainable development and global citizenship.

Does the Department for International Development at Westminster realise that the Assembly has a statutory responsibility to promote sustainable development? Does the department realise that it is priority for your Government? If so, what discussions have you or the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills had with the department on fund these important centres and courses? How will you ensure that the centres receive sufficient funding to ensure that the courses continue?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Diolch i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau; codwyd rhai syniadau diddorol. I ymdrin â phwyntiau Mick Bates, croesawaf ei ymdrechion i fod yn gynhwysol ac yn gefnogol o ran hyrwyddo gwelliant 1. Ond y cyfan y mae hynny'n ei wneud yw nodi problem bosibl, nid darparu'r ateb. Yr wyf wedi ateb y pwynt hwnnw. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli nad yw'n gywir dweud fy mod yn gyfrifol am faes cynhyrchu gwastraff yng Nghymru, a'r cynnydd yn y gwastraff hwnnw. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes llawer o waith i'w wneud eto o ran lleihau gwastraff, ond ni ellir ei wneud ar lefel genedlaethol

be done either at a UK level; at the very minimum, it must be done at EU level, because, for example, the vast majority of packaging that finds its way into Wales comes from outside Wales. We can deal with the waste that arises in Wales, but it is more difficult to deal with the situation where there is excess packaging as a result of what happens elsewhere. That is despite the fact that there are packaging regulations in place in the UK, and that prosecutions take place under that legislation.

We all understand the need to reduce carbon emissions, and the idea put forward by Glyn Davies was interesting. I would support his suggestion that Assembly Members should at least be aware of the carbon cost, if I can put it that way, of their journeys when they travel by plane. It is matter for them as to what they do about it, but it would be an important educational tool for every Assembly Member, as legislators, to be fully informed of the true environmental cost of air travel. That cost is sometimes unavoidable, but at least Assembly Members would be aware of that cost.

On Brynle Williams's comments, I felt that there was a fundamental flaw in his argument. I draw his attention to the words of his party leader, Nick Bourne, on the front page of the *Western Mail*, when Technical Advice Note 8 was first produced. He said that he would oppose each and every wind-farm application in Wales. You cannot, on the one hand, say that there is a need to reduce carbon emissions and, on the other, say that we should not consider the form of energy production with possibly the lowest amount of carbon emissions. Carbon dioxide emissions are created as a result of the manufacture of wind turbines, but they do not create carbon dioxide emissions during the course of their operation. It is not possible to argue that we need more renewable energy while saying that one of the most important forms of creating renewable energy should be disregarded completely; it is a flaw in the argument.

I also dispute the fact that other technologies are not mentioned in TAN 8, because it was

yng Nghymru. Awgrymaf na ellir ei wneud ychwaith ar lefel y DU; rhaid ei wneud ar lefel yr UE, o leiaf, oherwydd mae'r mwyafrif helaeth o ddefnydd pacio, er enghraifft, sy'n dod i Gymru yn dod o'r tu allan i Gymru. Gallwn fynd i'r afael â gwastraff sy'n codi yng Nghymru, ond mae'n anos ymdrin â'r sefyllfa lle mae gormodedd o ddefnydd pacio yn ganlyniad i'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn mannau eraill, a hynny er bod rheoliadau pecynnu mewn grym yn y DU a bod pobl yn cael eu herlyn o dan y ddeddfwriaeth honno.

Yr ydym i gyd yn deall yr angen am leihau gollyngiadau carbon, ac yr oedd y syniad a gynigiwyd gan Glyn Davies yn ddi-ddorol. Byddwn yn cefnogi ei awgrym y dylai Aelodau'r Cynulliad o leiaf fod yn ymwybodol o'r gost carbon, os caf ei disgrifio felly, pan fyddant yn teithio mewn awyren. Mater iddynt hwy yw beth a wnânt ynghylch hynny. Ond byddai'n declyn addysgol pwysig i bob Aelod Cynulliad, fel deddfwyr, i wybod faint yw cost amgylcheddol wirioneddol teithiau awyr. Ni ellir osgoi'r gost honno ar brydiau, ond o leiaf byddai Aelodau Cynulliad yn ymwybodol o'r gost honno.

O ran sylwadau Brynle Williams, teimlaf fod diffyg sylfaenol yn ei ddadl. Tynnaf ei sylw at eiriau arweinydd ei blaid, Nick Bourne, ar dudalen flaen y *Western Mail*, pan gynhyrchwyd Nodyn Cyngor Technegol 8 gyntaf. Dywedodd y byddai'n gwrthwynebu pob cais am fferm wynt yng Nghymru yn ddiwahân. Ni allwch, ar y naill llaw, ddweud bod angen lleihau gollyngiadau carbon, ac ar y llaw arall ddweud na ddylem ystyried y math o gynhyrchu ynni sydd hwyrach â'r gollyngiadau carbon isaf. Caiff gollyngiadau carbon eu creu drwy weithgynhyrchu tyrbinau gwynt, ond nid ydynt yn cynhyrchu gollyngiadau carbon deuocsid wrth eu gweithredu. Nid yw'n bosibl dadlau fod angen mwy o ynni adnewyddadwy arnom a dweud y dylid anwybyddu'n gyfan gwbl un o'r mathau pwysicaf o greu ynni adnewyddadwy; mae'n ddiffyg yn y ddadl.

Ni dderbyniaf ychwaith na sonnir am dechnolegau eraill yn TAN 8, gan ei fod yn

all-encompassing—

Glyn Davies *rose*—

Carwyn Jones: I will give way in a moment. It was all-encompassing, and it includes reference to other technologies. It also includes a realistic appraisal of the fact that, if we are to reach targets that we have set by 2010, it is inevitable, given the present state of technology, that wind power will play a major part.

Glyn Davies: I note your comment on onshore wind-farms, but do you agree that their development should be a matter for local planning authorities, and that the principle of strategic search areas within TAN 8 is the part that makes it unacceptable? In our view, as a party, it should be withdrawn and redrafted because of that anti-democratic principle.

Carwyn Jones: To take that to its logical conclusion, all planning policy in Wales is anti-democratic, because it clearly sets out policy in relation to out of town shopping centres, for example, and all manner of development. Local authorities cannot take decisions in a vacuum.

4.00 p.m.

Even though they are still the decision-makers under TAN 8, they must bear in mind that they must follow national planning policy guidance. It is a matter for them to apply that guidance as they see fit, in accordance with the need to follow planning policy and in accordance with the law.

The difficulty with biomass is that it is highly questionable whether providing a grant system for biomass in Wales would be of any help to farmers, given that it is questionable whether there is a market for it. All the assessments that I have seen have referred to the fact that other parts of the UK are more suited to growing biomass and are in a better position to gain from economies of scale in terms of supplying it to power stations; that is not necessarily the case in Wales.

hollgynhwysol—

Glyn Davies *a gododd*—

Carwyn Jones: Byddaf yn ildio maes o law. Yr oedd yn hollgynhwysol, ac mae'n cynnwys cyfeiriad at dechnolegau eraill. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys arfarniad realistig o'r ffaith, os ydym am gyrraedd targedau a osodwyd gennym erbyn 2010, ei bod yn anochel, o ystyried cyflwr presennol technoleg, y bydd ynni'r gwynt yn chwarae rhan flaenllaw.

Glyn Davies: Nodaf eich sylwadau ar ffermydd gwynt ar y tir, ond a gytnwch y dylai eu datblygiad fod yn fater i awdurdodau cynllunio lleol, ac mai'r egwyddor ardaloedd chwilio strategol yn TAN 8 yw'r rhan sy'n ei wneud yn annerbyniol? Yn ein barn ni, fel plaid, dylid ei dynnu'n ôl a'i ailddrafftio oherwydd yr egwyddor annemocrataidd honno.

Carwyn Jones: I fynd â hynny i'w derfyn rhesymegol, mae polisi cynllunio yng Nghymru i gyd yn annemocrataidd, gan ei fod yn gosod allan yn glir y polisi ar ganolfannau siopa ar gyrion trefi, er enghraifft, a phob math o ddatblygiadau. Ni all awdurdodau lleol wneud penderfyniadau mewn gwactod.

Er mai hwy sy'n gwneud y penderfyniadau o hyd o dan TAN 8, rhaid iddynt gofio bod yn rhaid iddynt ddilyn canllawiau polisi cynllunio cenedlaethol. Maent yn gyfrifol am gymhwyso'r canllawiau hynny fel y gwelant yn dda, yn unol â'r angen i ddilyn polisi cynllunio ac yn unol â'r gyfraith.

Y broblem o ran bio-màs yw ei bod yn amheus iawn a fyddai darparu system grantiau ar gyfer bio-màs yng Nghymru yn helpu ffermwyr o gwbl, o gofio ei bod yn amheus iawn a oes marchnad ar ei gyfer. Mae pob un o'r asesiadau yr wyf wedi'u gweld wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith bod rhannau eraill o'r DU yn fwy addas ar gyfer tyfu bio-màs, ac mewn sefyllfa well i sicrhau arbedion maint wrth ei gyflenwi i orsafoedd pŵer; nid yw hynny'n wir o reidrwydd yng Nghymru.

Brynle Williams: On that point, the report notes that growing biomass would keep communities together and that the product could be utilised close to the point of service. Perhaps we should look at smaller combined heat and power plants. That would socially encompass everything, but perhaps I am not using the right word there.

Carwyn Jones: Why is a subsidy needed in order for that to happen? I do not want to look at providing a subsidy to farmers to produce something for which there is no market. That is self-evidently not sensible.

Ar bwynt Elin Jones, yn fy marn i, gall system gynllunio gyflawni llawer iawn o adeiladu cynaliadwy. Yn gyntaf, yr oeddwn am sicrhau ein bod ni, fel Llywodraeth a Chynulliad, yn darparu enghreifftiau da dros Gymru o'r hyn y gellir ei wneud o ran adeiladu cynaliadwy. Yr ydym yn gweld hynny yn yr adeilad hwn, ac mewn adeiladau ledled Cymru.

Ni chredaf y byddai'n gall pregethu i bawb arall pe na fyddem yn sicrhau ein bod yn adeiladu mewn ffordd gynaliadwy. Wedi dweud hynny, ers agoriad yr adeilad hwn, yr ydym wedi dangos ei bod yn bosibl adeiladu'n gynaliadwy. Mae'n rhaid edrych yn awr ar y sefyllfa a gofyn y cwestiwn: a ddylai pob tŷ yng Nghymru yn y sector breifat neu gyhoeddus gael ei adeiladu mewn ffordd gynaliadwy? Hoffwn edrych ar hyn dros y misoedd nesaf i weld beth gall y system gynllunio ei wneud er mwyn cyflawni'r amcan hwnnw. Dyna'r cwestiwn mawr yn y dyfodol, a bydd rhaid i ni edrych arno'n fanwl.

Mae'r dangosyddion ar y ffordd. Mae'n wir nad ydynt wedi cyrraedd yn gyflym ond gwelais ddrafft o'r dangosyddion a gobeithiaf y byddant gennym cyn toriad yr haf.

On Gwenda's points, it is worth emphasising that, particularly when it came to the environment strategy, the Black Environment Network was involved. With the assistance of Jane Hutt, I have looked at the production of access statements so that when new buildings are built, there is a clear commitment by the

Brynle Williams: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, noda'r adroddiad y byddai tyfu bio-màs yn cadw cymunedau gyda'i gilydd, ac y gellid defnyddio'r cynnyrch yn agos at y pwynt gwasanaeth. Efallai y dylem ystyried gweithfeydd gwres a phŵer cyfunol llai o faint. Byddai hynny'n cwmpasu popeth yn gymdeithasol, ond efallai nad wyf yn defnyddio'r gair cywir yno.

Carwyn Jones: Pam mae angen cymhorthdal er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd? Nid wyf am ystyried rhoi cymhorthdal i ffermwyr er mwyn cynhyrchu rhywbeth nad oes marchnad ar ei gyfer. Mae'n hollol amlwg nad yw hynny'n synhwyrol.

On Elin Jones's point, in my opinion the planning system can deliver a great deal of sustainable building. First, I wanted to ensure that we, as a Government and an Assembly, provided good examples across Wales of what can be done in terms of sustainable building. We see that in this building, and we see it in buildings throughout Wales.

I do not believe it would be wise to preach to everyone else unless we ourselves ensure that we build in a sustainable manner. Having said that, since the opening of this building we have shown that it is possible to build sustainably. We must now look at the situation and ask the question: should every house in Wales, in the private or public sector, be built in a sustainable manner? I should like to look at that over the next few months to see what the planning system can do to deliver that objective. That is a huge question for the future, and we will have to look at it in detail.

On the indicators, they are on the way. It is true they have not arrived swiftly, but I have seen the draft of the indicators and I hope we shall have them before the summer recess.

O ran pwyntiau Gwenda, mae'n werth pwysleisio bod y Rhwydwaith Amgylchedd Pobl Dduon wedi cymryd rhan, yn enwedig yn y strategaeth amgylcheddol. Gyda chymorth Jane Hutt, yr wyf wedi ystyried cynhyrchu datganiadau hygyrchedd er mwyn cael ymrwymiad clir gan yr adeiladwyr, pan

builders to make them as accessible as possible to people who would previously have had difficulty accessing them. We have adopted the social model for many years when it comes to disability in Wales, and it is important that access statements form a part of that.

We should also bear in mind the successes that we have had with sustainable food procurement. There was a time when people thought that it would not be possible for Welsh suppliers to supply large public sector organisations, and we know now that that is not the case following the assistance that we have given. I have already mentioned the idea that Glyn put forward.

Ar bwynt Rhodri Glyn, mae gennym system o eco-ysgolion yng Nghymru sy'n llwyddiannus o ran addysgu plant ynghylch datblygu cynaliadwy a sut i fyw mewn harmoni gyda'r amgylchedd. Felly, mae gennym o leiaf system sy'n addysgu plant a fydd o fantais i ni gyd yn y dyfodol.

godir adeiladau newydd, i'w gwneud mor hygrych â phosibl i bobl a fyddai wedi cael anhawster i'w defnyddio o'r blaen. Yr ydym wedi mabwysiadu model cymdeithasol ers llawer blwyddyn o ran anabledd yng Nghymru, ac mae'n bwysig fod datganiadau hygrychedd yn rhan o hynny.

Dylem gofio hefyd y llwyddiannau a gawsom o ran caffael bwyd cynaliadwy. Yr oedd yna adeg pan gredai pobl na fyddai'n bosibl i gyflenwyr yng Nghymru gyflenwi sefydliadau mawr yn y sector cyhoeddus. Gwyddom bellach nad yw hynny'n wir ar ôl y cymorth yr ydym wedi'i roi. Yr ydym eisoes wedi crybwyll y syniad a gyflwynodd Glyn.

On Rhodri Glyn's point, we have a system of eco-schools in Wales which is successful in terms of educating children about sustainable development and how to live in harmony with the environment. Therefore, we at least have a system of educating children which will benefit everyone in the future.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 3: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise

Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 14, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 4: For 14, Abstain 9, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
 The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 5: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 6: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Francis, Lisa

German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 14, Ymatal 8, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 7: For 14, Abstain 8, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet
 German, Michael
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lloyd, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val

Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Cairns, Alun
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 8: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 9: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Amended motion (NDM3106): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. notes the sustainable development annual report 2006, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 14 June 2006; and

2. notes the failure to link the sustainable development scheme annual report to the First Minister's annual reports as stated in sustainable development action plan 2004 to 2007.

Cynnig (NDM3106) fel y'i diwygiwyd:
cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol datblygu cynaliadwy 2006, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 14 Mehefin 2006; ac

2. yn nodi'r methiant i gysylltu Adroddiad Blynyddol y Cynllun Datblygu Cynaliadwy gydag adroddiadau blynyddol y Prif Weinidog fel ag a nodir yng nghynllun gweithredu datblygu cynaliadwy 2004 i 2007.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
 Amended motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Archfarchnadoedd—Bendith neu Felltith? Supermarkets—Jolly Green Giants or Incredible Hulks?

Mick Bates: As many of you can see, I will use PowerPoint to illustrate my debate. I am pleased that we have this facility and, as I am not the greatest when it comes to information technology, I hope that it works. I was going to ask Brian to change the slides for me, but we all know that he has a tendency to press

Mick Bates: Fel y mae nifer ohonoch y gweld, byddaf yn defnyddio PowerPoint i ategu fy nadl. Yr wyf yn falch fod gennym y cyfleuster hwn, a chan nad wyf yn gwbl gyfforddus yn defnyddio technoleg gwybodaeth, gobeithio y bydd yn gweithio. Yr oeddwn yn mynd i ofyn i Brian newid y

the wrong button. Presentations will not be appropriate for many debates. However, I wish to embrace the communications used by so many of the people whom we serve. I could not resist the opportunity to use the magnificent IT facilities that we have. Before I start, I would like to thank the IT department for all of its help in making this happen. I apologise beforehand that I could not get a bilingual presentation together, but, next time, I will do so. If these images and words can change attitudes and behaviour, this debate will be worthwhile. I have given permission for Brynle Williams, Alun Ffred Jones and Lorraine Barrett to speak.

sleidiau imi, ond gwyddom i gyd fod ganddo duedd i bwysu'r botwm anghywir. Ni fydd cyflwyniadau'n briodol i nifer o ddadleuon. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn fanteisio ar y dulliau cyfathrebu a ddefnyddir gan gynifer o'r bobl a wasanaethwn. Rhaid imi achub ar y cyfle i ddefnyddio'r cyfleusterau TG gwych sydd gennym. Cyn imi ddechrau, hoffwn ddiolch i'r adran TG am ei holl gymorth i wneud hyn. Ymddiheuraf ymlaen llaw na allwn baratoi cyflwyniad dwyieithog, ond gwnaf hynny y tro nesaf. Os gall y lluniau a'r geiriau hyn newid agweddau ac ymddygiad, bydd y ddadl hon yn werthfawr. Yr wyf wedi rhoi caniatâd i Brynle Williams, Alun Ffred Jones a Lorraine Barrett siarad.

4.10 p.m.

Fifty years ago, they were unheard of. Today, they are found all over the country with over 7,000 outlets in the UK. Since the first one was opened in Lincolnshire in the late 1950s, supermarkets have grown to dominate the country's grocery market and have recently expanded into the clothing and entertainment sectors. We have to stand back and admire their commercial success. In 2004, UK retail sales totalled £246 billion—that is more than the total economies of 13 of the countries currently playing in the World Cup. It is fair to say that they are a major force in our country but, like all forces, they can be for good or evil.

Hanner can mlynedd yn ôl, nid oeddent yn bodoli. Heddiw, maent i'w cael ledled y wlad mewn mwy na 7,000 o safleoedd yn y DU. Ers i'r un gyntaf agor yn swydd Lincoln ddiwedd y 1950au, mae i archfarchnadoedd bellach le blaenllaw ym marchnad fwydydd y wlad, ac maent wedi ymestyn i'r sectorau dillad ac adloniant yn ddiweddar. Rhaid inni edmygu eu llwyddiant masnachol. Yn 2004, cyfanswm gwerthiannau manwerthu'r DU oedd £246 biliwn—sef mwy na chyfanswm economïau'r 13 o wledydd sy'n cystadlu yng Nghwpan y Byd ar hyn o bryd. Mae'n deg dweud bod iddynt ran rymus yn ein gwlad, ond fel pob grym, gallant fod er da neu er drwg.

In this debate I will look at how these incredible hulks can become green giants, by putting the environment, economy and local community at the heart of their operations. I am pleased that, today, I am supported by WWF Cymru, the Women's Institute Cymru and Oxfam Cymru.

Yn y ddadl hon, byddaf yn ystyried sut y gall melltith droi'n fendith, drwy roi'r amgylchedd, yr economi a'r gymuned leol wrth wraidd eu gweithrediadau. Yr wyf yn falch o gael cefnogaeth WWF Cymru, Sefydliad y Merched Cymru ac Oxfam Cymru heddiw.

For those who do not know, the Incredible Hulk is a raging creature with enormous strength, much like me. [*Laughter.*] Just as he caused destruction and carnage wherever he went, so can supermarkets be seen to cause destruction wherever they go. On the other hand, the Green Giant is a symbol for greenness and goodness. Although just as big, if not bigger than, the Incredible Hulk, he leaves no damage in his wake. Therefore, the vision is clear; we want to change

I'r rheini ohonoch na wyddoch, mae'r Incredible Hulk yn greadur gwyllt cryf iawn, yn debyg iawn i mi. [*Chwerthin.*] Yn yr un modd ag yr achosodd ddinistr a lladdfa ble bynnag yr âi, gellir gweld bod archfarchnadoedd hefyd yn achosi dinistr ble bynnag yr ânt. Ar y llaw arall, mae'r Green Giant yn symbol o wyrddni a daioni. Er ei fod mor fawr, os nad yn fwy na'r Incredible Hulk, nid yw'n gadael unrhyw ddifrod ar ei ôl. Felly, mae'r weledigaeth yn glir; yr ydym

supermarkets from incredible hulks to green giants, by encouraging them to see issues of recycling, local food and fair trade as a market advantage. I want to encourage them to compete with one another by establishing which one sells the most local food, which one is recycling the most waste and which one sells the most fair-trade products, but how do I achieve this?

So far, all efforts to turn supermarkets into green giants have failed. Many have tried. The Office of Fair Trading has produced a number of reports and, in May 2006, suggested that the power of the supermarket may have an adverse effect on consumers. Subsequently, the Competition Commission is carrying out a review of the adverse effects of supermarkets and their impact on the grocery market. That is not to mention the work of many lobby groups such as Friends of the Earth and Action Aid. We have all continually called for the supermarkets to clean up their act by selling more locally sourced food and fair-trade products and limiting the amount of packaging on their products. After all these reports and criticisms, why has there been no real action?

First, we have to understand that these supermarkets are pretty big and they are incredibly successful. They hold nearly 75 per cent of the UK grocery market, they sell 27 per cent of all compact discs and DVDs, and they sell 19 per cent of all the clothing and footwear in the whole of the UK. This year, the country's largest supermarket chain, Tesco, announced record profits of £2.25 billion. It takes £1 out of every £8 spent by British consumers.

We also have to understand another basic truth: people actually like supermarkets. Whenever I go to a supermarket, it is full. It is quite a popular way of shopping. Why is that so? First, look at how they have knocked down food prices, as you will see from the graphic display. If you look at children's clothing you will see that, according to the average supermarket price, the unit is £2.68, which is less than half the market average of £5.55. This means that even those people living on limited budgets can now have

am newid archfarchnadoedd o fod yn *incredible hulks* i fod yn *green giants*, drwy eu hannog i weld materion ailgylchu, bwyd lleol a masnach deg yn fantais yn y farchnad. Yr wyf am eu hannog i gystadlu â'i gilydd drwy sefydlu p'un sy'n gwerthu fwyaf o fwyd lleol, p'un sy'n ailgylchu fwyaf o wastraff a ph'un sy'n gwerthu fwyaf o gynhyrchion masnach deg. Ond sut y gallaf fi wneud hyn?

Hyd yn hyn, mae pob ymdrech i droi archfarchnadoedd yn fendith wedi methu. Mae nifer wedi rhoi cynnig arni. Mae'r Swyddfa Masnachu Teg wedi cynhyrchu nifer o adroddiadau, ac ym mis Mai 2006 awgrymodd y gallai pŵer yr archfarchnad gael effaith andwyol ar ddefnyddwyr. O ganlyniad, mae'r Comisiwn Cystadleuaeth yn cynnal adolygiad o effeithiau andwyol archfarchnadoedd a'u heffaith ar y farchnad fwydydd, heb sôn am nifer o grwpiau lobïo megis Cyfeillion y Ddaear ac Action Aid. Yr ydym i gyd wedi bod yn galw'n barhaus ar yr archfarchnadoedd i fod yn fwy gwyrd drwy werthu mwy o fwydydd lleol a chynhyrchion masnach deg a chyfyngu ar y pecynnau ar eu cynhyrchion. Ar ôl yr holl adroddiadau a'r beirniadaethau hyn, pam nad oes camau gwirioneddol wedi'u cymryd?

Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni ddeall bod yr archfarchnadoedd hyn yn fawr ac yn hynod o lwyddiannus. Mae ganddynt bron 75 y cant o farchnad fwydydd y DU, maent yn gwerthu 27 y cant o'r holl gryno ddisgiau a'r DVDs, ac yn gwerthu 19 y cant o'r holl ddillad a'r esgidiau yn y DU gyfan. Eleni, cyhoeddodd Tesco, cadwyn archfarchnadoedd fwyaf y wlad, yr elw mwyaf erioed o £2.25 biliwn. Mae'n cymryd £1 o bob £8 a werir gan ddefnyddwyr Prydain.

Rhaid inni ddeall ffaith sylfaenol arall hefyd: mae pobl yn hoffi archfarchnadoedd. Pryd bynnag yr af i archfarchnad, mae'n llawn. Mae'n ffordd ddigon poblogaidd o siopa. Pam felly? Yn gyntaf, edrychwch ar y ffordd y maent wedi gostwng prisiau bwyd, fel y gwelwch o'r graff. Os edrychwch ar ddillad plant, fe welwch, yn ôl cyfartaledd y pris yn yr archfarchnad, mai cost yr uned yw £2.68, sy'n llai na hanner cyfartaledd y farchnad o £5.55. Golyga hyn y gall hyd yn oed y bobl hynny sy'n byw ar gyllidebau cyfyngedig

access to better-quality goods. However, there is a price to pay, and it is usually the producer and the environment that suffer. Secondly, the way in which we work, live and socialise means that people now have less time. Finding everything under one roof is easier and more convenient than going to lots of small shops.

Supermarkets have thrived on change; they have built bigger stores and are planning to build more to meet consumer demands. Furthermore, supermarkets are major employers in their communities, so, there is a strong case for their existence. Therefore, what is the problem?

Supermarkets have a major effect on the environment. Earlier this week, I went shopping—and you will see a list on the screen, which you can read later. I bought raspberries, which are in season in the UK, but these had travelled 964 miles from Spain. I bought cherries, which are also in season here, but these had travelled 1,000 miles from Italy. I bought lamb from New Zealand, which had travelled nearly 12,000 miles to be on our supermarket shelves, despite the fact that we, in Wales, have the best lamb.

All in all, I bought 13 items, which had generated 70,696g of carbon emissions—the same amount of energy that it takes to power your personal computer for 42 days. Friends of the Earth has suggested that the average supermarket produces as much carbon dioxide as 60 greengrocers. The average person travels 890 miles a year to shop at supermarkets—that is a lot more than travelling to the local greengrocer—not to mention the wasteful packaging that is used to make products look pretty. With landfill set to rise in Wales by 2010, we will soon be drowning in our own waste. Let us not forget that the packaging that we buy in the supermarket costs the average household £470 a year.

There is also the issue of fair trade. For many years, supermarkets have been accused of exploiting local and third-world producers. We are aware of the poor wages and working

bellach gael nwyddau o ansawdd gwell. Fodd bynnag, mae pris i'w dalu, ac fel arfer y cynhyrchydd a'r amgylchedd sy'n dioddef. Yn ail, mae'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithio, byw a chymdeithasu yn golygu bod gan bobl lai o amser bellach. Mae cael popeth o dan yr un to yn haws ac yn fwy cyfleus na mynd i nifer o siopau bach.

Mae archfarchnadoedd wedi ffynnu ar newid; maent wedi adeiladu siopau mwy ac yn bwriadu adeiladu rhagor i fodloni gofynion defnyddwyr. Yn ogystal, mae archfarchnadoedd yn gyflogwyr mawr yn eu cymunedau, ac felly mae dadl gref dros eu bodolaeth. Felly, beth yw'r broblem?

Mae archfarchnadoedd yn cael effaith fawr ar yr amgylchedd. Yn gynharach yr wythnos hon, euthum i siopa—ac fe welwch restr ar y sgrîn. Gallwch ei darllen yn ddiweddarach. Prynais fafon, sydd yn eu tymor yn y DU, ond yr oedd y rhain wedi teithio 964 o filltiroedd o Sbaen. Prynais geirios, sydd hefyd yn eu tymor yma, ond yr oedd y rhain wedi teithio 1,000 o filltiroedd o'r Eidal. Prynais gig oen o Seland Newydd, a oedd wedi teithio bron 12,000 o filltiroedd i fod ar silffoedd ein harchfarchnadoedd, er bod gennym ni, yng Nghymru, y cig oen gorau.

At ei gilydd, prynais 13 o eitemau, a oedd wedi cynhyrchu 70,696g o allyriadau carbon—yr un faint o ynni ag y mae'n ei gymryd i yrru eich cyfrifiadur personol am 42 o ddiwrnodau. Mae Cyfeillion y Ddaear wedi awgrymu bod yr archfarchnad gyffredin yn cynhyrchu'r un faint o garbon deuocsid â 60 o siopau llyisiau bach. Mae'r person cyffredin yn teithio 890 o filltiroedd y flwyddyn i siopa mewn archfarchnadoedd—mae hynny'n llawer mwy na theithio i'r siop llyisiau leol—heb sôn am y pecynnu gwastraffus a ddefnyddir i wneud i gynhyrchion edrych yn ddeniadol. Gan fod disgwyl i dirlenwi gynyddu yng Nghymru erbyn 2010, byddwn yn boddi yn ein gwastraff ein hunain yn fuan. A chofiw'n fod y pecynnu a brynwn yn yr archfarchnad yn costio £470 y flwyddyn i'r cartref cyffredin.

Mae masnach deg yn fater i'w drafod hefyd. Ers llawer blwyddyn, mae archfarchnadoedd wedi eu cyhuddo o gamfanteisio ar gynhyrchwyr lleol a'r trydydd byd. Fe

conditions of Costa Rican banana growers, but what about our local industries? What about Welsh dairy farmers? Some sell their milk, but cannot even meet the costs of production. It is time that we encouraged more fair trade in our supermarkets; let us make Wales the first fair-trade country in the world. Something needs to be done.

The social commentator, Alain de Botton, famously described supermarkets as the new cathedrals. Whether that statement is true or not is a debate for another day. One thing is clear: supermarkets need to perform to the highest standards. For many years, 'free trade' has been their mantra; let us make 'fair trade' their new mantra.

We already have the tools to build this new faith in fair trade. It means cutting down on waste. Just this week, the Women's Institute launched a campaign encouraging supermarkets to cut down on their waste. It also means buying more locally sourced produce. Wales has some of the best fresh produce in the world, so why is it that, when I went shopping, there was a New Zealand leg of lamb on the shelf? As the *Farmers Weekly* campaign says, local food is miles better. As the World Wildlife Fund Cymru says, Wales's footprint can be reduced if we buy a quarter of our food locally. It is immoral that food producers, wherever they are in the world, are paid unfair prices for products that they work hard to produce.

These are not just my views, but the views of the vast majority of the public. Oxfam Cymru also notes, by the way, that we now have 1,300 fair-trade products available for sale. Therefore, as part of this, we need to wipe out the international poverty created by many of our products. In Wales, we need to wipe out child poverty and, to make that happen, we must also promote fair trade.

How can this be achieved? Allow me to make a few suggestions to the supermarkets. First, take greater steps to promote locally sourced food. For example, advances in

wyddom am gyflogau ac amodau gweithio gwael tyfwyr bananas yn Costa Rica, ond beth am ein diwydiannau lleol ni? Beth am ffermwyr llaeth Cymru? Mae rhai'n gwerthu eu llaeth, ond ni allant dalu'r costau cynhyrchu hyd yn oed. Mae'n bryd inni annog mwy o fasnach deg yn ein harchfarchnadoedd. Gadewch inni sicrhau mai Cymru fydd y wlad masnach deg gyntaf yn y byd. Mae angen gwneud rhywbeth.

Disgrifiodd y sylwebydd cymdeithasol, Alain de Botton, yr archfarchnadoedd fel yr eglwysi cadeiriol newydd. Dadl ar gyfer y dyfodol yw'r cwestiwn a yw'r datganiad hwnnw'n wir ai peidio. Mae un peth yn amlwg: mae angen i archfarchnadoedd berfformio yn unol â'r safonau uchaf. Ers blynyddoedd, 'masnach rydd' fu eu mantra; gadewch inni sicrhau mai 'masnach deg' fydd eu mantra newydd.

Mae gennym eisoes y dulliau i ddatblygu'r gred newydd hon mewn masnach deg. Mae'n golygu cynhyrchu llai o wastraff. lansiodd Sefydliad y Merched ymgyrch i annog archfarchnadoedd i greu llai o wastraff. Mae hefyd yn golygu prynu cynhyrchion mwy lleol. Mae rhai o'r cynhyrchion ffres gorau yn y byd yng Nghymru, felly, pam yr oedd darn o gig oen o Seland Newydd ar y silff pan euthum i siopa? Fel y dywed ymgyrch y *Farmers Weekly*, mae bwyd lleol lawer yn well. Fel y dywed Cronfa Bywyd Gwyllt y Byd Cymru, gellir lleihau ôl-troed Cymru os prynwn chwarter ein bwyd yn lleol. Mae'n anfoesol fod pobl yn talu prisiau annheg i gynhyrchwyr bwyd, ble bynnag y maent yn y byd, am gynhyrchion y maent yn gweithio'n galed i'w cynhyrchu.

Nid fy marn i yn unig yw hyn, ond barn y mwyafrif helaeth o'r cyhoedd. Dywed Oxfam Cymru hefyd, gyda llaw, fod 1,300 o gynhyrchion masnach deg ar werth bellach. Felly, fel rhan o hyn, rhaid inni ddileu'r tlodi rhyngwladol a grëir gan lawer o'n cynhyrchion. Yng Nghymru, mae angen inni ddileu tlodi plant, ac i wneud rhaid inni hefyd hyrwyddo masnach deg.

Sut y gellir cyflawni hyn? Gadewch imi wneud ambell awgrym i'r archfarchnadoedd. Yn gyntaf, dylech gymryd mwy o gamau i hyrwyddo bwyd lleol. Er enghraifft, mae

technology have made it possible to indicate on the till receipt the percentage of items bought that were locally sourced. Just imagine. When you go to the supermarket check-out, you see on your receipt how much you have spent and helped the local economy. It is possible.

Secondly, let us promote recycling. It is still the exception that supermarkets provide bring sites on their premises. Why can this not be the norm across Wales? Recently, the chair of Wal-Mart, which owns ASDA, said that the company has made a commitment to the idea of zero waste. We need to provide the pressure to make that happen.

Thirdly, let us establish and promote new lines of produce that pay a fair price. One of those new lines should be Welsh milk. We should have a new brand called 'Just Milk', which pays a fair price to Welsh dairy farmers. Establishing something like 'Just Milk' would be the first step in helping our Welsh dairy industry to thrive again.

My challenge today is not just for the supermarkets; it is also a challenge for us, for the Government, and all political parties, as well as environmental lobbies who are interested in promoting local food, recycling and fair trade.

4.20 p.m.

The supermarkets are driven by the market and, as the consumer demands more, so the supermarkets meet those demands. I want to work with the supermarkets to achieve this goal. Earlier today, I wrote to each of the major supermarkets inviting them to a green supermarket summit in Wales. I invite the Minister to join me in this. Together, we can explore the possibility of changing supermarkets from incredible hulks into green giants. I want the supermarkets to publish figures that show who sells the most local food, who recycles the most waste, and who sells the most fair-trade products. I invite the Minister and all parties to join me in that summit. I have a three-point agenda, which will be sent out to all Members. I hope

datblygiadau ym maes technoleg wedi golygu ei bod yn bosibl i'r dderbynneb nodi canran yr eitemau a brynwyd ac a oedd yn rhai lleol. Dychmygwch hyn. Pan ewch i dalu am eich eitemau yn yr archfarchnad, fe welwch ar eich derbynneb faint yr ydych wedi'i wario ac wedi helpu'r economi lleol. Mae'n bosibl.

Yn ail, gadewch inni hyrwyddo ailgylchu. Mae archfarchnadoedd sy'n darparu safleoedd dod â gwastraff ar eu safle yn dal yn eithriadau. Pam na all hyn fod yn arfer cyffredin ledled Cymru? Yn ddiweddar, dywedodd cadeirydd Wal-Mart, sy'n berchen ar ASDA, fod y cwmni wedi ymrwymo i'r syniad o ddim gwastraff. Mae angen inni roi'r pwysau arnynt i sicrhau hynny.

Yn drydydd, gadewch inni sefydlu a hyrwyddo llinellau cynnyrch newydd sy'n talu pris teg. Dylai llaeth Cymru fod ymysg y llinellau newydd hynny. Dylem gael brand newydd o'r enw 'Llaeth Teg', sy'n talu pris teg i ffermwyr llaeth Cymru. Sefydlu rhywbeth fel 'Llaeth Teg' fyddai'r cam cyntaf i helpu ein diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru i ffynnu eto.

Nid yw fy her heddiw wedi ei chyfyngu i'r archfarchnadoedd; mae hefyd yn her i ni, i'r Llywodraeth, ac i'r holl bleidiau gwleidyddol, yn ogystal ag i lobïau amgylcheddol sydd â diddordeb mewn hyrwyddo bwyd lleol, ailgylchu a masnach deg.

Caiff yr archfarchnadoedd eu hysgogi gan y farchnad, ac wrth i'r defnyddiwr fynnu rhagor, mae'r archfarchnadoedd yn bodloni'r gofynion hynny. Yr wyf am weithio gyda'r archfarchnadoedd i gyrraedd y nod hwn. Yn gynharach heddiw, ysgrifennais at bob un o'r archfarchnadoedd mawr yn eu gwahodd i uwchgynhadledd archfarchnad werdd yng Nghymru. Gwahoddaf y Gweinidog i ymuno â mi yn yr uwchgynhadledd. Gyda'n gilydd, gallwn archwilio'r posibilrwydd o newid archfarchnadoedd o fod yn *incredible hulks* i fod yn *green giants*. Yr wyf am i'r archfarchnadoedd gyhoeddi ffigurau sy'n dangos pwy sy'n gwerthu fwyaf o fwyd lleol, pwy sy'n ailgylchu fwyaf o wastraff a phwy sy'n gwerthu fwyaf o gynhyrchion masnach

that, together, we can scale the heights to make Wales a greener and more prosperous place, where the incredible hulks become the green giants of the modern age.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Three Members have caught my eye, so you have less than a minute each.

Brynle Williams: I thank Mick for the opportunity to contribute to his debate. I would ask how serious we are about this. We have discussed sustainable development, the ecological footprint and so on this afternoon. I take on board what Mick said. It is ridiculous that we are chopping down the lungs of the world in South America to produce grain and meat that is transported halfway around the world simply to fill a niche for cheap food without any thought of the consequences to the world. We have the ideal opportunity here in Wales and in the UK to support local produce and agriculture, and we need to do that. Why do we need carrots of a certain length and so on—do they taste any differently? Thousands of tonnes of British produce, which could be delivered on our shelves, will be dumped and stock-fed. The supermarkets have a responsibility. They cannot just take; they must give something back to this country.

Alun Ffred Jones: Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon.

Supermarkets are in danger of being seen as undermining the confidence of the farming community. I wonder whether this is how they want to be seen, and what they want to be accused of. However, there is an opportunity for the supermarkets to bring stability to the abattoir chain, for example, by going into partnership with private companies or co-operatives to bring confidence back to the market, and to use their financial clout to ensure that payments are honoured and that the system is sustainable both socially and environmentally.

Lorraine Barrett: As Mick said, the

deg. Gwahoddaf y Gweinidog a'r pleidiau i gyd i ymuno â mi yn yr uwchgyhadledd honno. Mae gennyf agenda ag iddi dri phwynt, a chaiff ei hanfon at bob Aelod. Gyda'n gilydd, gobeithio y gallwn fod yn arloesol i sicrhau y bydd Cymru yn lle mwy gwyrdd a ffyniannus, lle y bydd yr *incredible hulks* yn troi'n *green giants* yr oes fodern.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae tri Aelod wedi dal fy llygad, felly mae gennych lai na munud yr un.

Brynle Williams: Diolch i Mick am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Gofynnaf pa mor ddifrifol ydym ynglŷn â hyn. Yr ydym wedi trafod datblygu cynaliadwy, yr ôl-troed ecolegol ac ati y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick. Mae'n hurt ein bod yn dinistrio coedwigoedd yn Ne America i gynhyrchu grawn a chig a gludir hanner ffordd o amgylch y byd, a'r cyfan er mwyn darparu bwyd rhad heb feddwl o gwbl am y canlyniadau i'r byd. Mae gennym y cyfle delfrydol yma yng Nghymru ac yn y DU i gefnogi cynnyrch ac amaethyddiaeth leol, ac mae angen inni wneud hynny. Pam mae arnom angen moron o hyd penodol, ac ati—a ydynt yn blasu'n wahanol? Caiff miliynau o dunelli o gynnyrch Prydeinig, y gellid ei osod ar ein silffoedd ei dympio a'i fwydo i anifeiliaid. Mae gan yr archfarchnadoedd gyfrifoldeb. Ni allant gymryd yn unig; rhaid iddynt roi rhywbeth yn ôl i'r wlad hon.

Alun Ffred Jones: Thank you for the opportunity to contribute to this debate.

Mae perygl yr ystyrir bod archfarchnadoedd yn tanseilio hyder y gymuned ffermio. Tybed ai dyma sut maent am i bobl eu hystyried, ac ai dyma'r hyn y maent am gael eu cyhuddo ohono. Fodd bynnag, mae cyfle i'r archfarchnadoedd ddod â sefydlogrwydd i'r gadwyn lladd-dai, er enghraifft, drwy lunio partneriaeth gyda chwmnïau preifat neu gwmnïau cydweithredol i ddod â hyder yn ôl i'r farchnad, a defnyddio'u grym ariannol i sicrhau bod taliadau'n cael eu hanrhydeddu a bod y system yn gynaliadwy yn gymdeithasol ac yn amgylcheddol.

Lorraine Barrett: Fel y dywedodd Mick,

National Federation of Women's Institutes launched its packaging day of action yesterday, calling on supermarkets to improve their environmental policies on packaging and food waste. Across the nation, unnecessary and unwanted packaging was returned to the supermarkets from which they were purchased. That is great, because we, as taxpayers, are paying our councils to collect the supermarkets' packaging. We can make a stand—and Elin suggested in committee once that we could, for example, buy a microwave, take it out of its packaging in the shop and tell the supermarket to get rid of it. Power to the elbow of the WI. I congratulate it on taking this initiative, and I hope that we give it our full support.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I call the Minister to respond.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I am not sure whether 'respond' is the right word on this occasion, Dirprwy Lywydd, because I agreed with much of what Mick said. It was a superb presentation and one that, through the use of MS PowerPoint, conveyed much more than simple words could do.

I have a confession to make, Dirprwy Lywydd, in that I was once a Tesco employee. From 1984 to 1985, when I was at school, I worked in Tesco Bridgend as a provisions vehicle co-ordination assistant—or 'trolley pusher' as it is known to most people. [*Laughter.*] I worked on a Saturday between 8 a.m. and 2 p.m.. It was a reasonably well paid job, and it was a closed shop in those days, as a member of the Union of Shop, Distributive and Allied Workers. One thing that struck me was the phrase that was often used at that time: 'Pile it high, sell it cheap'. The philosophy of Tesco particularly, until quite recently, was that people should be able to buy the same food in every Tesco store in the UK. There was no emphasis on regional food; in fact, it was actually discouraged for a long time. That has changed. Sainsbury's has a better record and Waitrose, a better record still. However, all of this came about because of consumer

lansiodd Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol Sefydliadau'r Merched ei ddiwrnod gweithredu ar becynnu ddoe, gan alw ar archfarchnadoedd i wella'u polisiau amgylcheddol ar becynnu a gwastraff bwyd. Ar draws y wlad, dychwelwyd pecynnu diangen i'r archfarchnadoedd lle cawsant eu prynu. Mae hynny'n beth da, oherwydd yr ydym ni, fel trethdalwyr, yn talu i'n cynghorau am gasglu pecynnu'r archfarchnadoedd. Gallwn wneud safiad—ac awgrymodd Elin yn y pwyllgor unwaith y gallem ni, er enghraifft, brynu ffwrn feicrodon, ei thynnu allan o'i pheccyn yn y siop a gofyn i'r archfarchnad waredu'r pecyn hwnnw. Da iawn, Sefydliad y Merched. Hoffwn ei longyfarch am ymgymryd â'r fenter hon, a gobeithio y byddwn yn ei chefnogi'n llwyr.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Galwaf ar y Gweinidog i ymateb.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Nid wyf yn siŵr ai 'ymateb' yw'r gair cywir ar yr achlysur hwn, Ddirprwy Lywydd, oherwydd yr oeddwn yn cytuno â'r rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedodd Mick. Yr oedd yn gyflwyniad gwyb a oedd yn cyfleu, drwy ddefnyddio MS PowerPoint, lawer mwy nag y gallai geiriau syml ei wneud.

Yr wyf yn cyfaddef, Ddirprwy Lywydd, fy mod ar un adeg yn gweithio i Tesco. O 1984 i 1985, pan oeddwn yn yr ysgol, gweithiais yn Tesco ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr fel cynorthwy-ydd cydgysylltu cerbydau nwyddau—neu 'gwthiwr troliau' fel y bydd y rhan fwyaf o bobl yn ei alw. [*Chwerthin.*] Gweithiwn ar ddydd Sadwrn rhwng 8 a.m. a 2 p.m.. Yr oedd y swydd yn talu'n rhesymol, ac yr oedd yn siop gaeedig bryd hynny, fel aelod o'r Undeb Gweithwyr Siopau, Dosbarthu a Gwaith Perthynol. Un peth a'm tarodd oedd y frawddeg a ddefnyddid yn aml bryd hynny: 'Llenwch y silffoedd, gwerthwch yn rhad'. Athroniaeth Tesco yn arbennig, tan yn eithaf diweddar, oedd y dylai pobl allu prynu'r un bwyd ym mhob siop Tesco yn y DU. Nid oedd pwyslais o gwbl ar fwyd rhanbarthol; mewn gwirionedd, rhwystrwyd hynny am gyfnod hir. Mae hynny wedi newid. Mae gan Sainsbury's record well, ac mae gan Waitrose record well

demand, and sometimes we forget that.

Mick was realistic enough to understand that supermarkets are popular. They offer people choice, flexibility and low prices. I have often wondered—and this has worried me at times—whether, in some parts of urban Britain, farming could disappear and no-one would notice, as long as the supermarket shelves were piled high with food. That has troubled me, such is people's love of supermarkets.

The question for us all is whether supermarkets can co-exist with a thriving producer sector in the UK. I am far from convinced that that is the case, at the moment. I have spoken to companies and to producers that are clearly very weak when it comes to negotiating with large supermarkets. Historically, that is a structural failure of British farming, to be frank. In other countries of Europe, large organisations negotiate directly with the supermarkets; in Britain, instead of farmers moving up the food industry chain and taking control of the abattoirs, supermarkets have tended to come down, forcing farmers back to the farm gate. That remains a fundamental problem in farming generally in Britain, though not exclusively—there are some good examples of different practices, particularly in Wales.

I liked the comparison that Mick made between the Incredible Hulk and the Jolly Green Giant, though I note that I am looking at the moment at the photograph of the Jolly Green Giant presiding over a bio-diversity-free environment. It is not one that we would seek to encourage in Wales, perhaps. It is very green, but none of it is natural; it has all been seeded with grass and there is the odd tree here and there, but not much by the way of bio-diversity. Perhaps it is not the best example in the modern world of what we are trying to do.

However, Mick makes a serious point, asking what supermarkets can do to make themselves more friendly to suppliers. The

fyth. Fodd bynnag, digwyddodd hyn oll oherwydd galw gan ddefnyddwyr, a byddwn yn anghofio hynny weithiau.

Yr oedd Mick yn ddigon realistig i ddeall bod archfarchnadoedd yn boblogaidd. Maent yn cynnig dewis, hyblygrwydd a phrisiau isel i bobl. Yr wyf wedi meddwl yn aml—ac mae hyn wedi peri gofid imi ar brydiau—a allai ffermio ddiflannu mewn rhai rhannau o Brydain drefol heb i neb sylwi, cyhyd â bod silffoedd yr archfarchnad yn llawn bwyd. Mae hynny wedi peri gofid imi, cymaint yw hoffter pobl o archfarchnadoedd.

Y cwestiwn inni bob un yw a all archfarchnadoedd fodoli ar y cyd â sector cynhyrchu ffyniannus yn y DU. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o bell ffordd fod hynny'n wir, ar hyn o bryd. Yr wyf wedi siarad â chwmnïau ac â chynhyrchwyr sy'n amlwg mewn sefyllfa wan iawn wrth negodi ag archfarchnadoedd mawr. Yn hanesyddol, mae hynny'n fethiant strwythurol ym maes ffermio ym Mhrydain, a bod yn onest. Mewn gwledydd eraill yn Ewrop, mae sefydliadau mawr yn negodi'n uniongyrchol â'r archfarchnadoedd; ym Mhrydain, yn lle bod ffermwyr yn symud i fyny'r gadwyn diwydiant bwyd ac yn cymryd rheolaeth dros y lladd-dai, mae archfarchnadoedd wedi tueddu i ddod i lawr, gan wthio ffermwyr yn ôl i'r fferm. Erys hynny yn broblem sylfaenol ym maes ffermio'n gyffredinol ym Mhrydain, er nad ym mhobman—mae rhai enghreifftiau da o arferion gwahanol, yn arbennig yng Nghymru.

Yr oeddwn yn hoff o'r gymhariaeth a wnaeth Mick rhwng yr Incredible Hulk a'r Jolly Green Giant, er fy mod yn sylwi ar hyn o bryd fy mod yn edrych ar y llun o'r Jolly Green Giant yn llywyddu dros amgylchedd heb fioamrywiaeth. Nid yw'n un y byddem yn ceisio'i annog yng Nghymru, efallai. Mae'n wyrdd iawn, ond nid yw'n naturiol o gwbl; mae'r cyfan yn borfa, ac mae ambell goeden ar wasgar, ond nid oes llawer o fioamrywiaeth. Efallai nad hon yw'r enghraifft orau yn yr oes fodern o'r hyn yr ydym yn ceisio'i gyflawni.

Fodd bynnag, mae Mick yn gwneud pwynt difrifol, ac yn gofyn beth y gall archfarchnadoedd ei wneud i sicrhau eu bod

fundamental answer to that question lies in consumer behaviour. Supermarkets are the creation of consumers—they do not exist of themselves. If they cannot sell anything, they will collapse. The fact is that consumers like choice. They like going to the supermarket and being offered broad beans and new potatoes all year round, whereas 30 years ago, people accepted that they ate with the season. Some education has to be done, and has started already, to encourage people to eat what is good at the right time of year. It is difficult to prise people away from brightly coloured packages and all that is in them, and the way that they are advertised, and to prise people away from buying fruit and vegetables that are out of season, which leads to an increase in food miles.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you not think that you, as a Government, here and in Westminster, have a strong role to play in controlling the monopolistic tendencies that have been allowed to develop in supermarkets, so much so that they have been allowed to overcome every other form of control? Farmers obviously cannot compete. Do you not think that you have some role to play?

Carwyn Jones: The word that you are looking for is ‘oligopoly’, not ‘monopoly’. In terms of the role that can be played, the findings of the Office of Fair Trading investigation will be interesting. However, to suggest that this is somehow the fault of a political party is preposterous, as supermarkets have been going for many years. I noted what Mick said about free trade. I have just finished reading a history of the Liberal Party—I like to know the background of those who stand against me—and I have learned that the one thing that led to the decline of the Liberal Party more than anything was its dogmatic adherence to free trade. That changed in the aftermath of the second world war, and I was glad to hear Mick emphasise that fair trade is the wave of the future.

I think that it was the co-operative

yn fwy ystyriol o gyflenwyr. Mae'r ateb sylfaenol i'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n ymwneud ag ymddygiad defnyddwyr. Defnyddwyr a greodd archfarchnadoedd—nid ydynt yn bodoli ohonynt eu hunain. Os na allant werthu dim, byddant yn mynd i'r wal. Y ffaith amdani yw bod defnyddwyr yn hoffi dewis. Maent yn hoffi mynd i'r archfarchnad ac yn hoff o'r ffaith bod ffa llydan a thatws newydd yn cael eu cynnig drwy gydol y flwyddyn, lle yr oedd pobl 30 mlynedd yn ôl yn derbyn eu bod yn bwyta yn ôl y tymor. Mae angen ychydig addysgu i annog pobl i fwyta'r hyn sy'n dda ar yr adeg gywir o'r flwyddyn, ac mae hynny wedi dechrau eisoes. Mae'n anodd rhwystro pobl rhag cael eu denu gan becynnau lliwgar a'r hyn sydd ynddynt, a'r modd y cânt eu hysbysebu, a rhwystro pobl rhag cael eu denu i brynu ffrwythau a llysiau nad ydynt yn eu tymor, sy'n arwain at gynnydd mewn milltiroedd bwyd.

Eleanor Burnham: Oni chredwch fod gennych chi, fel Llywodraeth, yma ac yn San Steffan, ran gref i'w chwarae wrth reoli'r tueddiadau monopolyddol sydd wedi cael cyfle i ddatblygu mewn archfarchnadoedd, i'r graddau lle maent wedi gallu trechu pob math arall o reolaeth? Mae'n amlwg na all ffermwyr gystadlu. Oni chredwch fod gennych chi ryw ran?

Carwyn Jones: Y gair yr ydych yn chwilio amdano yw ‘oligopoli’, nid ‘monopoli’. O ran yr hyn y gellir ei wneud, bydd darganfyddiadau ymchwiliad y Swyddfa Masnachu Teg yn ddiddorol. Fodd bynnag, mae awgrymu bod hyn, rywsut, yn fai ar blaid wleidyddol yn afresymol, gan fod archfarchnadoedd yn bodoli ers blyneddod mawr. Nodais yr hyn a ddywedodd Mick ynghylch masnach rydd. Yr wyf newydd orffen darllen hanes y Blaid Ryddfrydol—yr wyf yn hoffi gwybod bth yw cefndir fy ngwrthwynebwy—ac yr wyf wedi dysgu mai ei hymlyniad pendant wrth fasnach deg oedd un o'r pethau a arweiniodd at ddirywiad y Blaid Ryddfrydol yn anad dim. Newidiodd hynny ar ôl diwedd yr ail ryfel byd, ac yr oeddwn yn falch clywed Mick yn pwysleisio mai masnach deg yw'r dyfodol.

Credaf mai'r mudiad cydweithredol, yn

movement, particularly the Co-operative stores, that began the move towards fair-trade products, along with other organisations that sold particular products. Increasingly, we see fair-trade products appearing in many supermarkets, including the mainstream supermarkets. Why? It is because consumers are demanding it. If, as consumers, we decided that we wanted to buy fair-trade products that did not cost the earth in terms of food miles—although there is inevitably a conflict between food miles and fair trade, as fair-trade products come from far away—and if we continued to promote fair-trade products and to encourage people to buy them and continued to make people aware of what fair trade means, we would change things and ensure that supermarkets take notice of fair trade as a concept. Ultimately, it is in the consumers' hands. If that is what consumers demand, that is what the supermarkets will provide.

4.30 p.m.

It has been apparent to me for some time, as I said earlier, that it is exceptionally difficult, if not impossible, for a small individual supplier to get an equitable price when selling to a large organisation such as a supermarket. There are two choices, in my view: you either get rid of the supermarket, which you cannot do because people find them to be convenient, and they are popular, or you try to reorganise the supply chain to ensure that people have a fairer crack of the whip when it comes to negotiating contracts.

Brynle Williams: I know that it is rather unconventional for me to come in like this. I agree with you, Minister, and we have had this discussion before, about fair trade and so on, but we are fast approaching a situation in this country where the milk industry is in the hands of about half a dozen companies. We are talking about fair trade, and I am all for fair trade, but we are selling milk at way below the cost of production—the figures are there to substantiate that—simply because the supermarkets want to take control of the milk industry, which is contracting at an alarming rate. I think that, for certain products, we should ensure fair trade right across the

arbennig y siopau Cydweithredol, a ddechreuodd y newid i gynhyrchion masnach deg, ynghyd â sefydliadau eraill a oedd yn gwerthu cynhyrchion penodol. Gwelwn fwy a mwy o gynhyrchion masnach deg yn ymddangos mewn nifer o archfarchnadoedd, gan gynnwys yr archfarchnadoedd prif ffrwd. Pam? Y rheswm yw bod defnyddwyr yn gofyn am hynny. Pe baem ni, fel defnyddwyr, yn penderfynu ein bod am brynu cynhyrchion masnach deg nad oeddent yn costio ffortiwn o ran milltiroedd bwyd—er bod gwrthdaro rhwng milltiroedd bwyd a masnach deg, yn anochel, gan fod cynhyrchion masnach deg yn dod o bell—a phe baem yn dal i hyrwyddo cynhyrchion masnach deg ac annog pobl i'w prynu a pharhau i wneud pobl yn ymwybodol o'r hyn y mae masnach deg yn ei olygu, byddem yn newid pethau ac yn sicrhau bod archfarchnadoedd yn rhoi sylw i fasnach deg fel cysyniad. Yn y pen draw, y defnyddwyr sydd â'r grym. Os dyna mae defnyddwyr yn ei fynnu, dyna y bydd archfarchnadoedd yn ei ddarparu.

Mae'n amlwg i mi ers cryn amser, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, ei bod yn eithriadol anodd, os nad yn amhosibl, i un cyflenwr bach gael pris teg wrth werthu i sefydliad mawr fel archfarchnad. Mae dau ddewis, yn fy marn i: naill ai cael gwared â'r archfarchnad, sy'n amhosibl am fod pobl yn eu hystyried yn gyfleus, ac maent yn boblogaidd, neu geisio ad-drefnu'r gadwyn gyflenwi i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael mwy o chwarae teg pan fyddant yn negodi contractau.

Brynle Williams: Gwn ei bod braidd yn anarferol imi ymyrryd fel hyn. Cytunaf â chi, Weinidog, ac yr ydym wedi cael y drafodaeth hon yn y gorffennol, am fasnach deg ac ati. Ond yr ydym ar fin cyrraedd sefyllfa yn y wlad hon lle y mae'r diwydiant llaeth yn nwylo tua hanner dwsin o gwmnïau. Yr ydym yn trafod masnach deg, ac yr wyf yn gefnogol iawn i fasnach deg, ond yr ydym yn gwerthu llaeth ymhell islaw cost cynhyrchu—mae'r ffigurau ar gael i ategu hynny—yn syml am fod yr archfarchnadoedd am reoli'r diwydiant llaeth, sy'n cywasgu'n frawychus o gyflym. Credaf, o ran cynnyrch penodol, y dylem sicrhau masnach deg ar

world, and not just for our friends in developing nations. We should not be protectionist, but we have to look at achieving a fair price for the producers in this country as well.

Carwyn Jones: Some farmers are selling at below the cost of production, but others are not. I was at a conference on Friday at which a Flintshire dairy farmer said to me that he was making money as a dairy farmer—some are and some are not—however, no-one would pretend that it is an enormous amount of money, given the historic price of milk in Wales and the rest of the UK. We often go back to the debate on Milk Marque when it comes to milk, and I think that, in time, we have come to regret the decision on Milk Marque—not that it was our decision. It is important to realise that co-operatives have a strong role to play when it comes to marketing particular products and we have good examples of that in Wales already: the Dolaucothi estate has done well in marketing its product to one supermarket and it has been successful. We need more and more farmers to start doing that. The expectation that an individual, in some way, in the future, will be able to sell to a large organisation and get an equitable price is just not going to be fulfilled. This means that, increasingly, we will see fewer farms, regardless of anything that government does. We have had that debate many times in the Chamber and it is a debate that we could have in the future as well.

I do not think that there is much else that I can add to the points that Mick has made. This boils down, at the end of the day, to what consumers demand. If consumers can be galvanised to go down a certain path in sufficient numbers, supermarkets will respond to that. We have seen it happen with fair trade and the introduction of more and more regional food, including Welsh food in supermarkets in Wales and Welsh lamb across all Waitrose supermarkets. If you create the demand for something, the supermarkets will supply it. It is in our hands, as consumers, and it is for us, as politicians, to make sure that that message gets across to as many people as possible.

draws y byd, nid dim ond ar gyfer ein cyfeillion mewn gwledydd sy'n datblygu. Ni ddylem fod yn ddiffyndollwyr, ond rhaid inni edrych ar sicrhau masnach deg i gynhyrchwyr y wlad hon hefyd.

Carwyn Jones: Mae rhai ffermwyr yn gwerthu am lai na chost cynhyrchu, ond nid pawb. Yr oeddwn mewn cynhadledd ddydd Gwener lle dywedodd ffermwr llaeth o sir y Fflint wrthyf ei fod yn ennill arian fel ffermwr llaeth—mae hyn yn wir am rai, ond nid eraill. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddai neb yn dadlau ei fod yn arian mawr, o gofio pris hanesyddol llaeth yng Nghymru a gweddill y DU. Byddwn yn aml yn dychwelyd at y ddadl am Milk Marque wrth drafod llaeth, a chredaf ein bod, erbyn hyn, wedi dechrau difaru'r penderfyniad ar Milk Marque—er nad ein penderfyniad ni ydoedd. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod gan gwmnïau cydweithredol ran gref i'w chwarae o ran marchnata cynnyrch penodol, ac mae gennym enghreifftiau da o hynny yng Nghymru eisoes: mae ystâd Dolaucothi wedi llwyddo i farchnata ei chynnyrch i un archfarchnad. Mae angen i fwy a mwy o ffermwyr ddechrau gwneud hynny. Nid yw disgwyl y bydd unigolyn, mewn rhyw fodd, yn y dyfodol yn gallu gwerthu i sefydliad mawr a chael pris teg yn mynd i ddigwydd. Golyga hyn y byddwn, yn gynyddol, yn gweld llai o ffermydd, waeth beth a wnaiff y llywodraeth. Yr ydym wedi cael y drafodaeth honno lawer gwaith yn y Siambr, ac mae'n drafodaeth y gallem ei chael yn y dyfodol hefyd.

Ni chredaf fod dim byd arall y gallaf ei ychwanegu at y pwyntiau a wnaeth Mick. Mae a wnelo hyn, yn y pen draw, â'r galw gan ddefnyddwyr. Os gellir ysgogi nifer digonol o ddefnyddwyr i ddilyn llwybr arbennig, bydd archfarchnadoedd yn ymateb i hynny. Gwelsom hyn yn digwydd gyda masnach deg a'r broses o ddarparu mwy a mwy o fwyd rhanbarthol, gan gynnwys bwyd o Gymru mewn archfarchnadoedd yng Nghymru a chig oen Cymreig ym mhob un o archfarchnadoedd Waitrose. Os byddwch yn creu'r galw am rywbeth, bydd yr archfarchnadoedd yn ei ddarparu. Mae yn ein dwylo ni, fel defnyddwyr, a'n cyfrifoldeb ni, fel gwleidyddion, yw sicrhau y caiff y neges honno ei chyfleu i gynifer â phosibl o bobl.

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Trefnu ar gyfer Trychineb—Ad-drefnu Ysbytai yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin Designed for Disaster—Hospital Reconfiguration in Mid and West Wales

Helen Mary Jones: I have agreed to give one minute each to Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Elin Jones, Dai Lloyd, Lisa Francis and Mick Bates. I realise that that only leaves 10 minutes for me and I apologise to those who requested time that I was not able to give, but I hope that those Members will have an opportunity to speak when the Minister responds to the debate. That level of interest from Assembly Members shows how important this issue is for those of us who live in these communities.

I have titled my speech 'Designed for Disaster', because that is how it feels when you are on the receiving end of these proposed changes. It has been a profoundly unhappy process for many of the communities affected, and it is a profound concern for all of us who live in those communities and need to receive those services. We have to be clear that no-one is saying that there should never be any change: expectations of the health service have changed, the conditions in which the health service operates have changed and the service needs to respond. However, are these the right changes, at the right time? I think not.

I want to challenge some of the bases on which the proposals are predicated, and I begin with a much-quoted figure from the Royal College of Surgeons report, 'Delivering High-quality Surgical Services for the Future'. 'Designed to Deliver' repeatedly refers to the need for a critical mass of a population of 300,000 as a minimum for the provision of safe services. However, if one reads the document carefully, the Royal College of Surgeons clearly asserts that there are some circumstances in which hospitals providing services in rural areas for populations of around 150,000 will need to be maintained as autonomous hospitals because of travel distance issues, and the Royal College of Surgeons asks government at all levels to pay particular attention to that. This matter that

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf wedi cytuno i roi munud yr un i Rhodri Glyn Thomas, Elin Jones, Dai Lloyd, Lisa Francis a Mick Bates. Sylweddolaf mai dim ond 10 munud sydd ar ôl i mi, ac ymddiheuraf i'r rheini sydd wedi gofyn am amser, na allwn ei roi. Ond gobeithio y caiff yr Aelodau hynny gyfle i siarad pan fydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i'r ddadl. Mae lefel fel hynny o ddi-ddordeb gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn dangos mor bwysig yw'r mater hwn i'r rheini ohonom sy'n byw yn y cymunedau hyn.

Y pennawd a roddais i'm haraith yw 'Trefnu ar gyfer Trychineb', gan mai dyna'r teimlad a gewch pan gaiff y newidiadau arfaethedig hyn eu hargymell ar eich cyfer. Bu'n broses drist iawn i nifer o'r cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt, ac mae'n destun pryder mawr i bob un ohonom sy'n byw yn y cymunedau hynny ac sydd ag angen y gwasanaethau hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn glir nad oes neb yn dweud na ddylid byth cael newid byth: mae disgwyliadau'r gwasanaeth iechyd wedi newid, mae amodau gwaith y gwasanaeth iechyd wedi newid, ac mae angen i'r gwasanaeth ymateb. Fodd bynnag, ai dyma'r newidiadau cywir, ar yr adeg gywir? Nid wyf yn creddu hynny.

Yr wyf am herio rhai o'r seiliau y gosodwyd y cynigion arnynt, a dechreuaf gyda ffigur a ddyfynnir yn aml o adroddiad Coleg Brenhinol y Llawfeddygon, sef 'Delivering High-quality surgical Services for the Future'. Cyfeiria 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi' droeon at yr angen am fâs critigol o boblogaeth o 300,000 fel yr isafswm ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau diogel. Fodd bynnag, wrth ddarllen y ddogfen yn ofalus, mae Coleg Brenhinol y Llawfeddygon yn haeru'n glir bod rhai amgylchiadau lle mae angen cynnal ysbytai sy'n darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd gwledig ar gyfer poblogaethau o tua 150,000 fel ysbytai ymreolaethol oherwydd ystyriaethau pellter teithio, ac mae Coleg Brenhinol y Llawfeddygon yn galw ar y llywodraeth ar bob lefel i roi sylw arbennig i hynny. Ni chodwyd y mater hwn yn y

has not been raised in the discussions around 'Designed for Deliver', which takes no account of it. It must do so now.

The Minister referred earlier to the working times directive. To my sure and certain knowledge, the service has known for 10 years that it has to respond to this directive. I accept that the directive may be a reason to make changes, but I do not accept that it is a reason to rush or to put changes to hospitals before the provision of services in the community. Frankly, if hospital providers have not got their act together on the directive, that is not the fault of the communities that they serve. We should not be bounced on that basis.

I want to refer to geography. 'Designed to Deliver' reads as if it has been written by someone who has never been west of Swansea or north of Neath. The distances on maps may be one thing, but those of us who live in that area or travel through it know that travel times are quite another. The proposed transfers for many services are just too far, and I refer the Minister to yesterday's debate about ambulance services. While our ambulance services remain so fragile, people across mid and west Wales will not accept the travel distances proposed in 'Designed to Deliver'.

Some communities in this debate have raised their voices louder than others; the issues around Withybush Hospital are well-rehearsed and I congratulate the campaigners on their hard work and success in mobilising their communities. However, I want to refer to another set of issues that have been touched upon in the Chamber, but which are perhaps not as well-rehearsed as the issues around Withybush Hospital. Those are the issues around Prince Philip Hospital in Llanelli. Llanelli has the highest concentration of population in the former county of Dyfed, but despite the best or worst efforts of the Minister's colleague in economic development, it still has much heavy industry, and thus great potential for accidents. It has very high levels of deprivation and long-term illness, and the

trafodaethau sy'n ymwneud â 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi', nad yw'n ei ystyried o gwbl. Rhaid iddo wneud hynny'n awr.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog yn gynharach at y gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith. Gwn yn sicr ac yn bendant fod y gwasanaeth yn ymwybodol ers 10 mlynedd fod angen iddo ymateb i'r gyfarwydddeb hon. Derbyniaf y gallai'r gyfarwydddeb fod yn rheswm dros wneud newidiadau, ond ni dderbyniaf ei bod yn rheswm dros ruthro na gwneud newidiadau mewn ysbytai cyn darparu gwasanaethau yn y gymuned. A dweud y gwir, os nad yw darparwyr ysbytai wedi dod i drefn o ran y gyfarwydddeb, nid bai'r cymunedau a wasanaethir ganddynt yw hynny. Ni ddylem gael ein gwthio ar y sail honno.

Hoffwn gyfeirio at ddaearyddiaeth. Mae 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi' yn darllen fel pe bai wedi ei ysgrifennu gan rywun nad yw erioed wedi teithio i'r gorllewin o Abertawe neu i'r gogledd o Gastell-nedd. Un peth yw'r pellteroedd ar fapiau, ond gŵyr y rhai ohonom sy'n byw yn yr ardal honno neu sy'n teithio drwyddi fod amseroedd teithio yn rhywbeth arall. Mae'r trosglwyddo arfaethedig i nifer o wasanaethau yn rhy bell, a chyfeiriaf y Gweinidog at y ddatl ddoe ar wasanaethau ambiwlans. Tra bydd ein gwasanaethau ambiwlans yn dal mor fregus, ni fydd pobl ar draws y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn derbyn y pellteroedd teithio a gynigir yn 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'.

Mae rhai cymunedau yn y ddatl hon wedi codi eu lleisiau'n uwch nag eraill; mae'r problemau ynghylch Ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn hen, a hoffwn longyfarch yr ymgyrchwyr am eu gwaith caled a'u llwyddiant yn ysgogi eu cymunedau. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gyfeirio at gyfres arall o faterion y soniwyd amdanynt yn fras yn y Siambr, ond nad ydynt wedi eu trafod gymaint â'r problemau'n ymwneud ag Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Y materion hynny yw'r rheini sy'n ymwneud ag Ysbyty'r Tywysog Philip yn Llanelli. Yn Llanelli y mae'r dwysedd uchaf o'r boblogaeth yn hen sir Dyfed, ond er ymdrechion gorau neu waethaf cyd-aelod y Gweinidog ym maes datblygu economaidd, mae llawer o ddiwydiant trwm yno o hyd, ac felly mae potensial damweiniau yn uchel. Mae yno lefelau uchel iawn o amddifadedd a salwch hirdymor, a'r

medical needs that go along with that. So, there are strong arguments for maintaining full hospital services in Llanelli.

Having said that, there could be some positives in the proposals for services in Llanelli in 'Designed to Deliver'. For example, many people would welcome the proposal for midwife-led maternity services. There is an opportunity there to perhaps develop centres of excellence, and I am aware that the Minister has visited the breast care centre; more could be done to develop that. However, the people of Llanelli have experienced cut after cut and a constant downgrading of hospital services. The Minister will be aware of the current debate over the provision of emergency surgery. We have reached a situation where people do not trust the health decision makers, whether the trust or the local health board. The impartiality of the community health council is even being questioned. I am not saying that the concerns are wholly justified, although I share them to an extent, but it reflects how people feel, and if the Minister has any doubt about that I would refer him to our excellent local paper, the *Llanelli Star*, whose pages are regularly filled with coverage of health crises, and, more importantly perhaps, with letters referring to it.

I would submit that this is a matter for the Minister. He appoints the members of the local health boards, and before he starts to shake his head, I have taken time to consult the regulations, so I know what I am talking about. He may consult with others before he makes the appointments, but it is he who makes them. He appoints the non-executive directors of the trust boards, he sets the policy framework to which the LHBs must deliver, and his officials, quite rightly, monitor the local health boards. The health community in mid and west Wales has drafted 'Designed for Disaster' to his specification and timetable. The Minister sets the decision-making procedures and guidelines, and if he needs to change them to intervene in the current process, I urge him to do so.

anghenion meddygol sy'n gysylltiedig â hynny. Felly, mae dadleuon cryf dros gynnal gwasanaethau ysbyty llawn yn Llanelli.

Wedi dweud hynny, gallai fod rhai agweddau cadarnhaol ar y cynigion dros gael gwasanaethau yn Llanelli yn 'Cynllunio i Gyflenwi'. Er enghraifft, byddai nifer o bobl yn croesawu'r cynnig am wasanaethau Mae cyfle yno efallai i ddatblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth, a gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi ymweld â'r ganolfan gofal y fron; gellid gwneud mwy i ddatblygu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae pobl Llanelli wedi cael un toriad ar ôl y llall ac israddio parhaus mewn gwasanaethau ysbyty. Fe fydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r ddatl bresennol am ddarparu llawdriniaeth frys. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd sefyllfa lle nad oes gan bobl ffydd yn y rheini sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau ym maes iechyd, boed yr ymddiriedolaeth neu'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Mae amheuaeth hyd yn oed am agwedd ddiuedd y cyngor iechyd cymuned. Nid wyf yn awgrymu y gellir cyfiawnhau'r pryderon yn llwyr, er fy mod yn eu rhannu i raddau. Ond maent yn adlewyrchu teimladau pobl, ac os oes gan y Gweinidog unrhyw amheuaeth am hynny, byddwn yn ei gyfeirio at ein papur lleol ardderchog, y *Llanelli Star*. Bydd ei dudalennau'n aml yn trafod argyfyngau iechyd, ac mae'n cynnwys, yn bwysicaf oll efallai, lythyrau sy'n cyfeirio atynt.

Byddwn yn cynnig mai mater i'r Gweinidog yw hyn. Ef sy'n penodi aelodau'r byrddau iechyd lleol, a chyn iddo ddechrau ysgwyd ei ben, yr wyf wedi treulio amser yn ymgynghori â'r rheoliadau, felly gwn beth yr wyf yn ei ddweud. Hwyrach ei fod yn ymgynghori ag eraill cyn gwneud y penodiadau, ond ef sy'n eu gwneud. Ef sy'n penodi cyfarwyddwyr anweithredol byrddau ymddiriedolaethau, ef sy'n pennu'r fframwaith polisi y mae angen i'r BILlau ei ddarparu, a'i swyddogion ef, a hynny'n briodol, sy'n monitro'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'r gymuned iechyd yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin wedi llunio fersiwn drafft o 'Trefnu ar gyfer Trychineb' yn ôl ei fanyleb a'i amserlen ef. Y Gweinidog sy'n pennu'r gweithdrefnau a'r canllawiau ar gyfer gwneud penderfyniadau, ac os oes angen iddo eu newid i ymyrryd yn y broses bresennol, anogaf ef i wneud hynny.

I ask the Minister to give serious consideration to putting the process on hold and reviewing it. I urge him to work with the local health boards to develop proper, costed, consistent and fully-funded plans for re-providing services in the community.

4.40 p.m.

If we want people to accept that there will need to be changes in their hospital services, they have to hear the good news, and see what they will get instead. I accept that we will not be able to fully provide those services in the community before the money is taken out of the acute sector, and we all think that that is the right thing to do, but, at the very least, communities should be able to see the plans—they should know what will happen.

It is very basic public relations, but if you want to bring people with you through a process of change, you start with the good news and then give them the news that may be less acceptable. ‘Designed to Deliver’ does exactly the opposite—it talks about reducing services that communities are used to getting, and does not tell them anything about what they will get instead.

I urge the Minister to work with local health boards. I am talking about proper, consistent and fully costed plans across the whole region, because I am sure that the Minister would acknowledge that development is patchy.

Next, I urge the Minister to insist, and take whatever action he can and must take, on much more effective co-operation between health and social services. That is vital, not only to deal with delayed transfers of care, but to deal with the effective provision of services in the community. Until that problem is unblocked, whatever we do to reconfigure our hospital services, we will not be able, in the long term, to properly deal with waiting lists and times because we will still have delayed transfers of care.

I would then urge the Minister—when those

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ystyried o ddifrif y posibilrwydd o ohirio'r broses a'i hadolygu. Apeliaf arno i weithio gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol i ddatblygu cynlluniau priodol, cyson, wedi'u costio a'u hariannu'n llawn ar gyfer ail-ddarparu gwasanaethau yn y gymuned.

Os ydym am i bobl dderbyn y bydd angen newidiadau yn y gwasanaethau yn eu hysbytai, rhaid iddynt glywed y newyddion da, a gweld beth a gânt yn eu lle. Derbyniaf na allwn ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny yn y gymuned yn llawn cyn tynnu'r arian allan o'r sector aciwt, ac yr ydym i gyd yn credu mai dyna'r peth iawn i'w wneud, ond dylai cymunedau allu gweld y cynlluniau, o leiaf—dylent gael gwybod beth fydd yn digwydd.

Mater o gysylltiadau cyhoeddus sylfaenol iawn ydyw, ond er mwyn cael pobl i'ch cefnogi drwy broses o newid, dylech ddechrau gyda'r newyddion da ac yna gyflwyno'r newyddion a all fod yn llai derbyniol. Mae ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’ yn gwneud yn gwbl groes i hynny—mae'n sôn am leihau gwasanaethau y mae cymunedau wedi arfer eu cael, ac nid yw'n sôn dim wrthynt am yr hyn a gânt yn eu lle.

Anogaf y Gweinidog i weithio gyda byrddau iechyd lleol. Yr hyn a olygaf yw cynlluniau priodol, cyson, wedi'u costio'n llawn ar gyfer y rhanbarth cyfan, oherwydd yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Gweinidog yn cydnabod bod y gwaith datblygu'n anghyflawn.

Yna, anogaf y Gweinidog i fynnu, a chymryd pa gamau bynnag y mae eu hangen, i gydweithio lawer yn fwy effeithiol rhwng y maes iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Mae hynny'n hollbwysig, nid yn unig i fynd i'r afael ag oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, ond i fynd i'r afael â darparu gwasanaethau yn y gymuned yn effeithiol. Nes caiff y broblem honno ei datrys, waeth beth a wnawn i ailgyflunio ein gwasanaethau ysbty, ni allwn, yn y pen draw, fynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros ac amseroedd aros yn briodol am na fyddwn wedi datrys yr oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal.

Yna, byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog—pan

things are done, and not before—to work with communities across the region to develop hospital services that truly meet local needs and are truly fit for the twenty-first century. No-one is saying that the status quo should continue forever or that it is acceptable, but communities will not accept change if all that they can see is cuts and centralisation. Whatever the intention of ‘Designed to Deliver’, that is how it feels if you are one of those people who lives in a community served by those hospitals. If the Minister and the health community do not take the communities with them, then ‘Designed to Deliver’ will end up destined for the dustbin. Minister, this is your responsibility—I urge you to act now before it is too late.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ate gaf yr hyn y dywedodd Helen Mary Jones am yr angen i chi egluro'n glir iawn i'r cymunedau yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin sut y byddwch yn datblygu darpariaeth gwasanaeth iechyd yn y gymuned a beth y byddwch yn ei wneud yn y sector gofal sylfaenol oherwydd, heb esboniad, ni allwch ddisgwyl bobl i gytuno i newidiadau yn y sectorau eilaidd ac aciwt.

Elin Jones: Gwrandewais ar yr ateb a rhoddodd y Gweinidog i gwestiwn gan Lisa Francis, pan ddywedodd ei fod wedi rhoi cyfarwyddid i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Benfro i roi cefnogaeth i'r grŵp sy'n ymgyrchu dros Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Mae grŵp ymgyrchu hefyd yn bodoli i warchod Ysbyty Bronglais. Cyn-gyfarwyddwr meddygol Bronglais sy'n cadeirio'r grŵp hwnnw. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn datgan y prynhawn yma bod yr un cynnig ar gael yn Sir Benfro bydd hefyd ar gael yng Ngheredigion er mae'n rhaid dweud bod y cynngor iechyd cymunedol yng Ngheredigion eisoes wedi datgan gwrthwynebiad i ‘Designed to Deliver’ ac wedi cyflwyno opsiwn arall ar gyfer Ngheredigion sy'n gwrthod ‘Designed to Deliver’ yn llwyr.

David Lloyd: Any reorganisation of the district general hospitals in mid and west Wales must be predicated on two factors, as we have heard from Helen Mary and Rhodri Glyn. First, we must have the development of

fydd y pethau hynny wedi eu gwneud, ac nid cyn hynny—i weithio gyda chymunedau ar draws y rhanbarth i ddatblygu gwasanaethau ysbyty sy'n wirioneddol yn diwallu anghenion lleol ac sydd yn wir yn addas ar gyfer yr unfed-ganrif-ar-hugain. Nid oes neb yn dweud y dylai'r sefyllfa bresennol barhau am byth na'i bod yn dderbyniol, ond ni fydd cymunedau'n derbyn newid os y cyfan sy'n eu hwynebu yw toriadau a chanoli. Beth bynnag yw bwriad ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’, dyna sut mae'n teimlo os ydych yn un o'r bobl hynny sy'n byw mewn cymuned sy'n cael ei gwasanaethu gan yr ysbytai hynny. Os na fydd y Gweinidog a'r gymuned iechyd yn cydweithio â'r cymunedau, yna tynged ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’ fydd y bin sbwriel. Weinidog, eich cyfrifoldeb chi yw hyn—fe'ch anogaf i weithredu yn awr cyn iddi fynd yn rhy hwyr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I endorse what Helen Mary Jones has said on the need for you to explain clearly to the communities in mid and west Wales how you will develop health service provision in the community, and what you will do in the primary care sector because, without an explanation, you cannot expect people to agree to changes in the secondary and acute sectors.

Elin Jones: I listened to the Minister's response to Lisa Francis's question this afternoon, when he said that he had directed Pembrokeshire Local Health Board to support the group which is campaigning for Withybush Hospital. There is also a group campaigning to protect Bronglais Hospital, chaired by the former director of medical services at Bronglais. I hope the Minister will say this afternoon that the proposal available in Pembrokeshire will also be available in Ceredigion, although it has to be said that the community health council in Ceredigion has already stated its opposition on ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’ and has presented another option for Ceredigion, which rejects ‘Cynllunio i Gyflenwi’ outright.

David Lloyd: Rhaid i unrhyw waith addrefnu ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin gael ei briodoli i ddau factor, fel y clywsom gan Helen Mary a Rhodri Glyn. Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni ddatblygu

more community health services and social services before any district general hospital organisation. Secondly, we need an ambulance service that is fully up-to-speed and able to respond—again, before any secondary care reorganisation.

Lisa Francis: Minister, you said earlier that your sole aim in this consultation process was to ensure that quality services are delivered sustainably. It is of paramount importance that they are delivered safely. Helen Mary has explained how mid and west Wales is compromised in many respects by its very geography. I am concerned that this document is fundamentally flawed from the outset. There is scant research in it and you need to look into that. It is not good enough for mid and west Wales and for the people of that region. It is almost an insult to expect them to respond to such a document. Please take it back and look at it again.

Mick Bates: Thank you, Helen Mary, for raising this incredibly important issue in your short debate. I thought your title, 'Designed for Disaster', was very apt, because the feeling of the people in the north of my constituency of Montgomeryshire is just that. As an example, this document says that maternity consultant beds will be removed from Bronglais hospital. The people of the Machynlleth area use Bronglais hospital. I want to ask the Minister what risk assessment he has undertaken with regard to closing those beds in terms of putting a mother who is about to give birth in an ambulance and sending her on a 75-mile journey? Obviously, I have never given birth, but can you imagine the anxiety of the people who have received a perfectly adequate service and who are now told that it will disappear? Minister, I think that you owe us some clear answers so that we can have some stability and remove a lot of the anxiety that currently exists about services that are about to disappear to distant places.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): As Derek

mwy o wasanaethau iechyd cymunedol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol cyn trefnu unrhyw ysbyty cyffredinol dosbarth. Yn ail, mae arnom angen gwasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n gweithio'n llawn ac sydd â'r gallu i ymateb—eto, cyn ystyried unrhyw ad-drefnu gofal eilaidd.

Lisa Francis: Weinidog, yr oeddech yn dweud yn gynharach mai eich unig nod yn y broses ymgynghori hon oedd sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau o safon eu darparu'n gynaliadwy. Mae'n hynod bwysig iddynt gael eu darparu'n ddiogel. Mae Helen Mary wedi egluro sut y mae'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn cael eu peryglu mewn llawer ffordd oherwydd eu daearyddiaeth. Pryderaf fod y ddogfen hon yn sylfaenol wallus o'r cychwyn. Ychydig iawn o waith ymchwil sydd ynnddi, a rhaid ichi ymchwilio i hynny. Nid yw'n ddigon da i'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin a phobl y rhanbarth hwnnw. Mae bron â bod yn sarhaus disgwyl iddynt ymateb i'r fath ddogfen. Cymerwch hi yn ôl ac edrychwch arni eto, os gwelwch yn dda.

Mick Bates: Diolch i chi, Helen Mary, am godi'r mater pwysig iawn hwn yn eich dadl fer. Yr oeddwn yn meddwl bod eich pennawd, 'Trefnu ar gyfer Trychineb', yn addas iawn, oherwydd dyna yw teimlad y bobl yng ngogledd fy etholaeth i yn sir Drefaldwyn. Er enghraifft, dywed y ddogfen hon y bydd gwelyau mamolaeth lle y mae meddygon ymgynghorol ar gael yn cael eu symud o ysbyty Bron-glais. Mae pobl yn ardal Machynlleth yn defnyddio ysbyty Bron-glais. Yr wyf am ofyn i'r Gweinidog pa asesiad risg sydd wedi ei wneud mewn cysylltiad â chau'r gwelyau hynny o ran rhoi mam sydd ar fin rhoi genedigaeth mewn ambiwlans a'i hanfon ar daith 75 milltir? Yn amlwg, nid wyf i erioed wedi rhoi genedigaeth, ond a allwch ddychmygu gofid y bobl sydd wedi cael gwasanaeth cwbl ddigonol ac sy'n cael y newyddion yn awr y bydd yn diflannu? Weinidog, credaf ein bod yn haeddu cael atebion clir gennych fel y gallwn gael ychydig sefydlogrwydd a chael gwared ar lawer o'r gofid sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd am wasanaethau sydd ar fin diflannu i fannau pell.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Fel y

Wanless told us, no change is not an option, so to do nothing is to create a situation for the health service in Wales in which it would be destined for disaster. One of Wanless's core messages is that the health structures that we have in place are out of date, unsuitable and unsustainable. The twenty-first century poses different health problems that need different health solutions. Expertise is too thinly spread and we need to redesign services. If we wish to continue with the generalist-based service that we have inherited from the early 1960s, then we need to be clear in telling people what we are offering them. However, it is simply not possible to deliver modern, specialised healthcare based on a model that is nearly a half-a-century old. If people want to have the best-quality service, we need service redesign and service reconfiguration.

It could be argued that we should proceed more gently. Indeed, we have had this argument today. However, there is another unavoidable driver of change, which we cannot ignore and which will not go away, and which will be with us within three years, namely compliance with the working times directive, which is not optional. Responding to the pressures of the working times directive is not new, as Helen Mary said—it has been going on for many years. By September 2005, the directive had resulted—at the 58-hours level—in, more or less, 95 per cent compliance in Wales. So, considerable work has been going on to achieve compliance with it. However, by 2009, compliance based on present work patterns will be only 29 per cent.

The best estimate is that compliance with the August 2009 limit of 48 hours in Ceredigion, Pembrokeshire and Carmarthenshire, at the present rate of progress, is unachievable. Some trusts in mid and west Wales already have high vacancy rates and a level of dependency on agency and locum working that is among the highest in Wales. This is a very expensive and unsustainable way of working, which will only get worse if the changes are not put in place. In fact, other parts of Wales face similar problems, but that is of no comfort, because it means that there

dywedodd Derek Wanless wrthym, nid yw peidio â newid yn ddewis, felly, mae gwneud dim yn creu sefyllfa i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru a allai fod yn drychinebus. Un o brif negeseuon Wanless yw bod y strwythurau iechyd sydd gennym ar waith yn hen, yn anaddas ac yn anghynaliadwy. Mae'r unfed ganrif ar hugain yn creu problemau iechyd gwahanol sy'n gofyn am atebion iechyd gwahanol. Nid oes digon o arbenigedd, ac mae angen inni ailgynllunio gwasanaethau. Er mwyn inni allu parhau'r gwasanaeth cyffredinol a etifeddwyd gennym o'r 1960au cynnar, rhaid inni fod yn glir wrth ddweud wrth bobl beth yr ydym yn ei gynni iddynt. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n bosibl darparu gofal iechyd arbenigol, modern yn seiliedig ar fodel sydd bron yn hanner cant oed. Os yw pobl am gael y gwasanaeth o'r safon orau, mae angen inni ailgynllunio ac ailgyflunio gwasanaethau.

Gellid dadlau y dylem fynd ymlaen gan bwyll. Yn wir, yr ydym wedi cael y ddadl hon heddiw. Fodd bynnag, mae yna ffactor arall na ellir ei osgoi sy'n llywio newid, na allwn ei anwybyddu ac na fydd yn diflannu, ac a fydd ar waith ymhen tair blynedd, sef cydymffurfio â'r gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith. Nid oes dewis ynglŷn â hynny. Nid yw ymateb i bwysau'r gyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith yn rhywbeth newydd, fel y dywedodd Helen Mary—mae'n digwydd ers blyneddodded. Erbyn mis Medi 2005, yr oedd y gyfarwydddeb wedi arwain—ar y lefel 58 awr—at 95 y cant o gydymffurfio, fwy neu lai, yng Nghymru. Felly, mae gwaith sylweddol wedi ei wneud i sicrhau cydymffurfio. Fodd bynnag, erbyn 2009, 29 y cant fydd y cydymffurfio, ar sail patrymau gwaith presennol.

Yn ôl yr amcangyfrif gorau, ni fydd yn bosibl cydymffurfio â therfyn mis Awst 2009 o 48 awr yng Ngheredigion, sir Benfro a sir Gaerfyrddin, yn ôl y cynnydd presennol. Mae gan rai ymddiriedolaethau yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin gyfraddau uchel o swyddi gwag eisoes, ac mae lefel eu dibyniaeth ar weithwyr asiantaeth a locwm ymhlith yr uchaf yng Nghymru. Mae hon yn ffordd gostus ac anghynaliadwy iawn o weithio, ac ni fydd ond yn gwaethygu os na roddir y newidiadau ar waith. Yn wir, mae rhannau eraill o Gymru yn wynebu problemau tebyg.

is no latitude for making special cases or arguing that there are special exemptions. If the whole of Wales faces this problem, then the whole of Wales must work together to resolve it.

This cannot be the basis upon which we want to deliver world-class services for mid and west Wales. The National Assembly has accepted the need for change and recognises that we need a long and sustained programme of delivering the challenge outlined in the Wanless report. It welcomed 'Designed for Life' as the mechanism to deliver these ambitions. So, when the health service suggests that radical change is needed, our response cannot be one of rejection, or even acceptance in theory without it being followed by a practical set of proposals for action. If we do not come up with a set of practical proposals to these problems within a reasonable timeframe, time will run out and we will find ourselves out of compliance with the working times directive. It is not enough to say that this is some barmy, off-the-wall EU directive, because failure to comply will result in illegal activity.

4.50 p.m.

The directive is not about creating problems; it is about creating decent, safe working conditions for staff in the NHS, reducing risks for patients that follow from healthcare staff working unacceptably long and stressful hours. If there is failure to comply with the working times directive, organisations and hospitals out of compliance will not be able to attract staff, because of adverse working conditions. They will almost certainly not achieve training accreditation. The local service will suffer, and, consequently, patients will also suffer. So, there is a timeframe within which we must get this right, and there is simply not the luxury of many years in which to gently and sedately work towards delivering this—2009 is around the corner.

There is a legitimate point in saying that people are reluctant to move towards the

Ond nid yw hynny o ddim cysur, oherwydd mae'n golygu nad oes rhyddid i wneud achosion arbennig neu ddadlau bod yna eithriadau arbennig. Os yw Cymru gyfan yn wynebu'r broblem hon, yna rhaid i Gymru gyfan gydweithio i'w datrys.

Ni all hyn fod yn sylfaen ar gyfer darparu gwasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf i'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol wedi derbyn yr angen am newid, ac mae'n cydnabod bod angen rhaglen hir a chyson arnom i ymateb i'r her a amlinellwyd yn adroddiad Wanless. Yr oedd yn croesawu 'Cynllun Oes' fel y mecanwaith ar gyfer cyflawni'r uchelgeisiau hyn. Felly, pan fydd y gwasanaeth iechyd yn awgrymu bod angen newid radical, ni allwn ei wrthod, na hyd yn oed ei dderbyn mewn egwyddor heb iddo gael ei ddilyn gan gyfres ymarferol o gynigion ar gyfer gweithredu. Os na luniwn gyfres o gynigion ymarferol i'r problemau hyn o fewn amserlen resymol, aiff amser yn drech na ni, a'r byddwn hyn methu cydymffurfio â'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith. Nid yw'n ddigon dweud bod hon yn gyfarwyddeb gan yr UE sy'n wirion ac yn anarferol, oherwydd bydd methu cydymffurfio yn arwain at weithredu anghyfreithlon.

Nid creu problemau yw diben y gyfarwyddeb; mae'n ymwneud â chreu amodau gwaith priodol a diogel i staff yn y GIG, gan leihau risgiau i gleifion am fod staff gofal iechyd yn gweithio oriau sy'n annerbyniol o hir a llafurus. Os bydd methiant i gydymffurfio â'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith, ni fydd sefydliadau nac ysbytai nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio yn gallu denu staff, oherwydd amodau gwaith andwyol. Mae bron yn sicr na fyddant yn cael achrediad hyfforddiant. Bydd y gwasanaeth lleol yn dioddef, ac o ganlyniad bydd cleifion hefyd yn dioddef. Felly, mae yna amserlen y mae'n rhaid inni gyflawni hyn o'i mewn, ac nid oes gennym yr hyblygrwydd i allu treulio blynyddoedd lawer yn gweithio gan bwyll ac yn ddigyffro tuag at gyflawni hyn—mae 2009 ar ddod.

Mae'n deg dweud bod pobl yn amharod i symud ymlaen i'r dyfodol os na allant weld

future if they cannot see the shape of things to come. However, that does not acknowledge the change that is going on. It is not a case of change not happening; the problem is that we do not have a clear, visible, bricks-and-mortar exemplar of what the future is. Nevertheless, change is taking place. The new GP contract has been a major factor in shifting services into the community. A sum of £54 million has been spent on developing enhanced services in the new general medical services contract. This has resulted in a wide range of services that were not previously provided being offered in the community by GPs.

Equally, we have the new Tenby hospital, which I am due to open on Monday. It offers a new model of care, bringing together a wide range of health, social care, minor injury and minor surgery activity. The new Pembroke Dock hospital, which is due to open in October, will have the same flexibility and range of services. Earlier this month, agreement was given to the development of the Port Talbot primary care resource centre—a new and exciting development, which will include primary care, community services, the voluntary sector and the local authority in a single modern, new and innovative environment. Similar work is taking place in Britton Ferry.

In Ceredigion, real, imaginative work is already under way to align unscheduled primary care with the way that accident and emergency services are delivered. We know that proposals are being worked on to develop a new network of provision based on projects being proposed in places such as Tregaron, Aberaeron and Cardigan.

It is too early to anticipate the full potential of these proposals, but the statement of purpose and the direction of travel in a real, concrete way are being outlined.

Christine Gwyther: It is good to know that you are listening to the people of mid and west Wales. I have been to nearly 30 consultation meetings over the last few months, in a pre-consultation and now full

beth sydd o'u blaenau. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n cydnabod y newid sy'n digwydd. Y gwir yw bod newid yn digwydd, ond nid oes gennym enghraifft glir, weladwy a chadarn o'r dyfodol. Serch hynny, mae newid ar waith. Mae contract newydd y meddygon teulu wedi bod yn ffactor pwysig wrth symud gwasanaethau i'r gymuned. Gwariwyd £54 miliwn ar ddatblygu gwell gwasanaethau yn y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol newydd. Mae hyn wedi arwain at greu ystod eang o wasanaethau na ddarperid gynt gan feddygon teulu yn y gymuned.

Yn yr un modd, mae ysbyty newydd yn Ninbych-y-pysgod y byddaf yn ei agor ddydd Llun. Mae'n cynnig patrwm gofal newydd, gan ddwyn ynghyd amrywiaeth eang o ofal cymdeithasol, a chyfleusterau ar gyfer mân anafiadau a mân lawdriniaethau. Bydd gan yr ysbyty newydd yn Noc Penfro, a fydd yn agor ym mis Hydref, yr un hyblygrwydd ac amrywiaeth gwasanaethau. Yn gynharach y mis hwn, cafwyd cytundeb i ddatblygu canolfan adnoddau gofal sylfaenol Port Talbot—datblygiad newydd a chyffrous, a fydd yn cynnwys gofal sylfaenol, gwasanaethau cymunedol, y sector gwirfoddol a'r awdurdod lleol mewn un amgylchedd modern, newydd ac arloesol. Mae gwaith tebyg yn mynd rhagddo yn Llansawel.

Yng Ngheredigion, mae gwaith gwirioneddol, creadigol eisoes yn mynd ymlaen i alinio gofal sylfaenol heb ei drefnu â'r ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Gwyddom fod cynigion yn cael eu trafod i ddatblygu rhwydwaith newydd o ddarpariaeth yn seiliedig ar gynnig prosiectau mewn lleoedd fel Tregaron, Aberaeron ac Aberteifi.

Mae'n rhy gynnar rhag-weld potensial llawn y cynigion hyn, ond amlinellir y datganiad o ddiben a'r cyfeiriad teithio mewn ffordd real a chadarn.

Christine Gwyther: Mae'n dda gwybod eich bod yn gwranddo ar bobl y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn tua 30 o gyfarfodydd ymgynghorol dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, mewn cyfnod cyn

consultation period. I have been disappointed that not a single opposition AM has attended any of those meetings. I am, frankly, surprised that they feel able to talk with such authority on a subject about which they should have learned a lot more.

My constituents have been telling me consistently over the last three months that they want to see more development in primary care. I was pleased to hear you talking about the hospitals in Tenby and Pembroke Dock, which will be providing that primary care. I want to see that primary care—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is an intervention; it is not a speech.

Christine Gwyther: Could you give an assurance that those sorts of primary care centres will be spread across the region before we talk about a full-blown re-organisation of our secondary care services?

Brian Gibbons: The problem is whether or not the service can maintain resilience after 2009 if we do not make major changes. If we are not able to deliver compliance with the European working times directive a lot of the basic services that Members take for granted will be in serious jeopardy. It is an unavoidable 'must deliver' for us in the health service.

Rhodri Glyn made reference to working with social care. I am pleased to see the good progress being made in Pembrokeshire; Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust had one of the highest proportions of hospital beds occupied by delayed transfers of care six months ago, but significant progress has been made to improve that situation. Equally, in Carmarthenshire, a bad situation exists in relation to delayed transfer of care, but I am sure that Rhodri Glyn and other people from Carmarthenshire will be aware of the new sense of purpose and partnership that is emerging.

Therefore, there are clear, tangible signs of putting the new future in place if people want to go out to see them.

ymgyngori ac mewn cyfnod ymgyngori llawn yn awr. Fe'm siomwyd nad oes yr un o AC y gwrthbleidiau wedi mynychu un o'r cyfarfodydd hynny. Yr wyf yn synnu, a dweud y gwir, eu bod yn teimlo y gallant siarad gyda chymaint o awdurdod ar bwnc y dylent fod wedi dysgu llawer mwy amdano.

Mae fy etholwyr wedi bod yn dweud wrthyf yn gyson dros y tri mis diwethaf eu bod am weld mwy o ddatblygu mewn gofal sylfaenol. Yr oeddwn yn falch eich clywed yn siarad am yr ysbytai yn Ninbych-y-pysgod ac yn Noc Penfro, a fydd yn darparu'r gofal sylfaenol hwnnw. Yr wyf am weld y gofal sylfaenol hwnnw—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ymyriad yw hwn; nid araith.

Christine Gwyther: Allwch chi roi sicrwydd y bydd y mathau hynny o ganolfannau gofal sylfaenol yn cael eu darparu ar draws y rhanbarth cyn inni siarad am ad-drefnu ein gwasanaethau gofal eilaidd ar raddfa fawr?

Brian Gibbons: Y broblem yw a all y gwasanaeth barhau'n gadarn ar ôl 2009 os na wnawn newidiadau mawr. Os na allwn sicrhau cydymffurfio â'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd, bydd nifer o'r gwasanaethau sylfaenol y mae Aelodau yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol mewn perygl difrifol. Mae'n rhywbeth anochel y mae'n rhaid inni ei gyflawni yn y gwasanaeth iechyd.

Cyfeiriodd Rhodri Glyn at weithio gyda gofal cymdeithasol. Yr wyf yn falch gweld y cynnydd da sy'n cael ei wneud yn sir Benfro; chwe m is yn ôl yr oedd gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen un o'r cyfrannau uchaf o welyau ysbyty'n cael eu defnyddio gan gleifion a oedd yn wynebu oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, ond gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol i wella'r sefyllfa honno. Yn yr un modd, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae yna sefyllfa wael o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Rhodri Glyn a phobl eraill o sir Gaerfyrddin yn ymwybodol o'r ymdeimlad newydd o bwrpas a phartneriaeth sy'n dod yn amlwg.

Felly, mae yna arwyddion clir a chadarn o osod y dyfodol newydd ar waith os yw pobl am fynd allan i'w gweld.

Tamsin Dunwoody: I was glad to hear you say that Pembrokeshire is showing signs of moving towards the new changes. However, Wanless emphasised that the National Assembly should be looking at not only moving forward and moving things back to community level, but investing in the community level, and developing those services, at the same time as looking at the potential of pooling resources and estates, and looking at the merger and the management of social services, as well as healthcare. I am glad to say that Pembrokeshire is working towards an option 3. I reiterate Chris Gwyther's point that no opposition AM attended any of the consultation meetings that I attended. The people's voice is clear—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is another speech—you are meant to intervene on the Minister.

Tamsin Dunwoody: Thank you for reminding me, Deputy Presiding Officer. Minister, could you say a few words about moving forward on the social services interface?

Brian Gibbons: There are some constraints because of my adjudication role in this. I would not want to create a situation in which it would seem that I have prejudged any referral to me, if that is necessary; I clearly have not done that. However, it is important that there is public engagement with the process of change. As I said earlier today, if there is not professional confidence in the resilience of the care system, and if there is not public confidence in the capacity of that service to deliver for local people, then our capacity to be able to deliver the changes will be severely compromised.

Catherine Thomas: I am glad that you have touched on the importance of engagement. You know that I have fundamental concerns about the acute services review and how it will affect my constituents in Llanelli, especially the proposal to take away emergency surgery. However, to carry on from what I asked you earlier, I would appreciate it if you can bring influence to

Tamsin Dunwoody: Yr oeddwn yn falch eich clywed yn dweud bod sir Benfro yn dangos arwyddion o symud tuag at y newidiadau newydd. Fodd bynnag, pwysleisiodd Wanless y dylai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol fod yn ystyried nid yn unig symud ymlaen a symud pethau yn ôl i'r gymuned, ond buddsoddi yn y gymuned, a datblygu'r gwasanaethau hynny ynghyd ag edrych ar y posibilrwydd o gyfuno adnoddau ac ystadau, ac edrych ar y broses o uno a rheoli gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yn ogystal â gofal iechyd. Yr wyf yn falch dweud bod sir Benfro yn gweithio tuag at ddewis 3. Ategaf bwynt Chris Gwyther na fu'r un o ACau y gwrthbleidiau yn unrhyw un o'r cyfarfodydd ymgynghori a fynychais. Mae llais y bobl yn glir—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae hyn yn araith arall—disgwylir ichi ymyrryd pan fydd y Gweinidog yn siarad.

Tamsin Dunwoody: Diolch am fy atgoffa, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Weiniog, allech chi ddweud ychydig eiriau ynglŷn â symud ymlaen i gydgyssylltu'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol?

Brian Gibbons: Mae ychydig gyfyngiadau o ganlyniad i'm rôl ddyfarnu yn hyn. Ni fyddwn am greu sefyllfa lle y byddai'n ymddangos fy mod wedi rhagfarnu unrhyw atgyfeiriad ataf, os bydd hynny'n angenrheidiol; mae'n amlwg nad wyf wedi gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig inni ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd wrth sicrhau newid. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach heddiw, os na fydd hyder proffesiynol yng nghadernid y system gofal, ac os na fydd hyder y cyhoedd yng ngallu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw i ddarparu ar gyfer bobl leol, yna caiff ein gallu i gyflwyno'r newidiadau ei beryglu'n ddifrifol.

Catherine Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi crybwyll pwysigrwydd ymgysylltu. Gwyddoch fod gennyf bryderon sylfaenol ynglŷn â'r adolygiad o wasanaethau aciwt a sut y bydd yn effeithio ar fy etholwyr yn Llanelli, yn enwedig y cynnig i gael gwared ar lawdriniaeth frys. Fodd bynnag, i barhau gyda'r hyn a ofynnais ichi yn gynharach, byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi pe gallech

bear on those making decisions in my constituency regarding organising a second public meeting, so that people can feel that they are fully engaged. It is pretty rich of opposition Members, and especially Helen Mary Jones, to talk about the importance of engagement when they have not attended any meetings in mid and—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. This is another speech. What has been said has been perfectly in order, but Members must be a little cleverer at getting in with interventions on the Minister, rather than trying to make speeches.

Brian Gibbons: I have dealt with some of Catherine's points. It is a disappointment to me, in some ways, that these requests are being made, because I am aware that over 7,000 people have turned up at consultation exercises in mid and west Wales. We owe a great debt of gratitude to people who have given up of their free time and have made considerable investment in trying to work up alternative proposals.

I am pleased to take away what Elin Jones said about local work action groups needing the type of information that is necessary to work up other practical and realistic options; this is the whole purpose of the consultation. As a Government, we are not putting the consultation out under a three-line whip. We expect our public representatives to engage fully with this debate, as public representatives. If they are not confident that the proposals that are coming forward are sufficiently resilient, I would suggest that they have a public duty to speak up on behalf of their constituents, and need to be there at those meetings to hear what the public is saying. If Members did not do that, I believe that they would be failing as representatives in the National Assembly for Wales.

Lisa Francis: Will you give way, Minister?

Brian Gibbons: Yes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

ddyfanwadu ar y rheini sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau yn fy etholaeth i o ran trefnu ail gyfarfod cyhoeddus, fel y gall pobl deimlo eu bod yn cael eu cynnwys yn llawn. Mae'n chwerrthinllyd i Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, ac yn enwedig Helen Mary Jones, sôn am bwysigrwydd ymgysylltu pan nad ydynt wedi mynychu un o'r cyfarfodydd yn y canolbarth a—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae hyn yn araith arall. Mae'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn hollol mewn trefn, ond rhaid i Aelodau fod ychydig yn fwy clyfar wrth ymyrryd pan fydd y Gweinidog yn siarad, yn hytrach na cheisio gwneud areithiau.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf wedi delio â rhai o bwyntiau Catherine. Mae'n fy siomi, mewn rhai ffyrdd, fod y ceisiadau hyn yn cael eu gwneud, oherwydd gwn fod dros 7,000 o bobl wedi mynychu ymarferion ymgynghori yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Dylem fod yn ddiolchgar iawn i'r bobl hynny sydd wedi rhoi o'u hamser ac wedi gwneud buddsoddiad sylweddol i geisio llunio cynigion amgen.

Yr wyf yn falch derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Elin Jones fod ar grwpiau gweithredu lleol angen y wybodaeth sy'n angenrheidiol i lunio dewisiadau ymarferol a realistig eraill; dyna yw holl ddiben yr ymgynghori. Fel Llywodraeth, nid ydym yn cyflwyno'r ymgynghori o dan chwip tair llinell. Disgwyliwn i'n cynrychiolwyr cyhoeddus ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r ddadl hon, fel cynrychiolwyr cyhoeddus. Os nad ydynt yn hyderus fod y cynigion a gyflwynir yn ddigon cadarn, awgrymaf fod ganddynt ddyletswydd gyhoeddus i siarad ar ran eu hetholwyr, a bod angen iddynt fod yn bresennol yn y cyfarfodydd hynny i glywed yr hyn sydd gan y cyhoedd i'w ddweud. Pe na byddai Aelodau'n gwneud hynny, credaf y byddent yn methu yn eu rôl fel cynrychiolwyr yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.

Lisa Francis: A wnewch chi ildio, Weinidog?

Brian Gibbons: Gwnaf.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Cyn ichi

Before you decide to give way, Minister, your contribution must not take more than 15 minutes.

Lisa Francis: I am grateful to you for taking an intervention, Minister, as you are busy with them this afternoon. You talk about the importance of public confidence. Do you, as a doctor, not feel that the 'Designed to Deliver' document, in its proposals for consultant obstetrics alone, is fundamentally flawed?

5.00 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: I will let Helen Mary come in.

Helen Mary Jones: For the record—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. There cannot be an intervention on an intervention.

Brian Gibbons: I am letting her intervene on my speech. I give way to Helen Mary.

Helen Mary Jones: For the record, it is true that I have not been able to attend any of the meetings in Pembrokeshire, although other members of Plaid Cymru, including county councillors, have done so. Catherine Thomas is very well aware that I have attended meetings in Llanelli. I am disappointed that she should try to imply otherwise.

Brian Gibbons: In conclusion, this is an important issue. I hope that it will be possible to reach local agreement on these issues, because the necessity of change is unanswerable. Maintaining the status quo is a recipe for disaster, and would lead to a total falling apart of the health service in Wales. Hopefully, the debate will continue—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

benderfynu ildio, Weinidog, ni ddylai eich cyfraniad gymryd mwy na 15 munud.

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am gymryd ymyriad, Weinidog, ganeich bod yn cael llawer y prynhawn yma. Yr ydych yn sôn am bwysigrwydd hyder y cyhoedd. Onid ydych chi, fel meddyg, yn teimlo bod diffygion sylfaenol yn y ddogfen 'Cynllun Oes', yn ei chynigion ar gyfer obstetreg ymgynghorol yn unig?

Brian Gibbons: Gadawaf i Helen Mary gyfrannu.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn gofnodi—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni allwn gael ymyriad yn ystod ymyriad.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn gadael iddi ymyrryd yn ystod fy araith. Ildiaf i Helen Mary.

Helen Mary Jones: Hoffwn gofnodi ei bod yn wir nad wyf wedi gallu mynychu unrhyw un o'r cyfarfodydd yn sir Benfro, er bod aelodau eraill o Blaid Cymru, gan gynnwys cynghorwyr sir, wedi gwneud hynny. Mae Catherine Thomas yn gwybod yn iawn fy mod wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd yn Llanelli. Yr wyf yn siomedig ei bod yn ceisio awgrymu'n wahanol.

Brian Gibbons: I gloi, mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Gobeithio y bydd yn bosibl dod i gytundeb lleol ar y materion hyn, oherwydd mae'r angen am newid yn ddiymwad. Mae cynnal y sefyllfa bresennol yn ffordd sicr i gael llanast, a byddai'n arwain at chwalu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn gyfan gwbl. Gobeithio y bydd y ddadl yn parhau—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.01 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.01 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)