



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 20 Mehefin 2006  
Tuesday, 20 June 2006**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

3	Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister
34	Datganiad Busnes Business Statement
39	Datganiad ar Gronfeydd Ymddiriedolaeth Plant Statement on Child Trust Funds
52	Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25
53	Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006
63	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
63	Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru): Darpariaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru): The Provision of Ambulance Services
90	Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order
90	Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol The Social Justice Annual Report

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Cynnal a Chadw Cefnffyrdd Trunk Road Maintenance**

**Q1 Brynle Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for trunk road maintenance in north Wales? OAQ1673(FM)

**C1 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cynnal a chadw cefnffyrdd yng ngogledd Cymru? OAQ1673(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** The priority is to maintain the trunk road network in a safe, sustainable manner, taking into account social, economic and environmental demands and obligations.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Y flaenoriaeth yw cynnal y rhwydwaith cefnffyrdd mewn modd diogel, cynaliadwy, gan ystyried gofynion a rhwymedigaethau cymdeithasol, economaidd ac amgylcheddol.

**Brynle Williams:** I think that you can anticipate what I am going to ask. Given that the Welsh Assembly Government had considerable opportunities to begin negotiations on the reopening of the old A5 route during the 14 months in which risk assessment took place, do you not agree that you now have an obligation to compensate businesses for the loss of trade caused by the disruption, which has left some takings down at least 80 per cent over the bank holiday weekend?

**Brynle Williams:** Yr wyf yn meddwl y gallwch ragweld yr hyn yr wyf yn mynd i'w ofyn. Gan fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi cael cyfleoedd sylweddol i ddechrau trafodaethau ynghylch ailagor yr hen A5 yn ystod y 14 mis y buwyd wrthi'n asesu risg, oni chytunwch ei bod erbyn hyn yn ddyletswydd arnoch ddiogolledu busnesau am y busnes a gollwyd ganddynt yn sgîl cau'r ffordd, sydd wedi peri i rai ohonynt wynebu gostyngiad o 80 y cant o leiaf yn eu derbyniadau dros benwythnos gŵyl y banc?

**The First Minister:** You are constructing an argument on behalf of constituents who would like to receive compensation; I then have to construct an argument as to why compensation should not be paid, but we should not get into that argument today. We are acting in good faith in opening the old A5 route, albeit that it has a 7.5 tonne weight limit, and is single track, controlled by traffic lights. We have already let a contract to Jones Brothers of Ruthin, a highly esteemed local contractor, which knows the area. It will be getting on with the job of rendering safe the closed new section of the A5, around Dinmael and Tŷ-nant. We have acted in good faith throughout.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn creu dadl ar ran etholwyr a hoffai gael iawndal; rhaid i minnau felly greu dadl ynghylch pam na ddylid talu iawndal, ond ni ddylem fynd ati i gynnal y ddadl honno heddiw. Yr ydym yn gweithredu'n ddidwyll wrth agor hen ffordd yr A5, er bod cyfyngiad pwysau 7.5 tonnau ar honno, a'i bod yn ffordd un lôn, dan reolaeth goleuadau traffig. Yr ydym eisoes wedi gosod contract i'r Brodyr Jones o Ruthun, contractwr lleol uchel ei barch, sydd yn adnabod yr ardal. Bydd yn bwrw ati gyda'r gwaith o sicrhau diogelwch y rhan newydd sydd wedi cau o'r A5, ger Dinmael a Th-nant. Yr ydym wedi gweithredu'n ddidwyll drwy hyn i gyd.

**Carl Sargeant:** The A55 and A494 trunk roads, which run through my constituency of

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae angen uwchraddio cefnffyrdd yr A55 a'r A494, sy'n mynd drwy

Alyn and Deeside, need upgrading, and there is a programme to be exhibited to the public in July. Local residents are concerned about many things, including noise levels. The Minister, Andrew Davies, has suggested that new road surfaces will reduce noise, but we need to benchmark the current noise levels so that they can be compared with future noise levels. Will you ensure that, during the July exhibition, figures relating to noise, traffic flows and accident rates will be available to my constituents?

**The First Minister:** I am sure that we can do that. Parts of the M4 and the Ely link road run through residential areas of my constituency, so this strikes a sensitive spot for anyone who represents Cardiff West. A benchmark for a reasonable level of noise from nearby trunk roads and motorways is extremely important. People expect to be able to enjoy the occasional barbecue in the garden, and to have the grandchildren around to play in the garden, without the level of road noise being excessive. However, what is excessive? I will look at the issue of the benchmark for what is an excessive level of road noise, and either I or Andrew Davies will write to you.

**Janet Ryder:** To take you back to the problems on the A5, many people are grateful that the old A5 route is now open, but many businesses have seen a dramatic loss in tourist trade, in particular, and are concerned about the effect on the whole area. Given the publicity about the road closure, businesses are concerned that many people still may not visit the area, and want a guarantee from you that you will put a package in place to readvertise and relaunch the area, and to bring tourists back in. This closure affects a wide area along the A5 and businesses want a guarantee of a rescue package, and that we will see more advertising to support the tourist attractions and local communities. Businesses also want to know who their one point of contact is while the repair work is going on. Will you name an officer so that businesses can contact that person and get information and their questions answered straight away?

f'etholaeth i, sef Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, a chaiff rhaglen ei harddangos i'r cyhoedd ym mis Gorffennaf. Mae trigolion lleol yn pryderu am sawl peth, gan gynnwys lefelau sŵn. Mae'r Gweinidog, Andrew Davies, wedi awgrymu y bydd arwynebau ffyrdd newydd yn lleihau'r sŵn, ond mae angen inni feincnodi'r lefelau sŵn cyfredol fel y gellir eu cymharu â lefelau sŵn y dyfodol. A wnewch sicrhau y bydd ffigurau ynglŷn â'r sŵn, llif y traffig a chyfraddau damweiniau ar gael i'm hetholwyr yn ystod yr arddangosfa yng Ngorffennaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn wneud hynny. Mae rhannau o'r M4 a ffordd gyswllt Trelái'n mynd drwy ardaloedd preswyl yn f'etholaeth i, felly mae hyn yn taro tant i unrhyw un sydd yn cynrychioli Gorllewin Caerdydd. Mae meincnod ar gyfer lefel sŵn resymol oddi wrth gefnffyrdd a thraffyrdd cyfagos yn hynod o bwysig. Mae pobl yn disgwyl gallu mwynhau ambell farbeciw yn yr ardd, a gweld yr wyrion yn dod draw i chwarae yn yr ardd, heb i lefel sŵn y ffordd fod yn ormodol. Ond beth yw gormodol? Fe edrychaf ar gwestiwn pennu meincnod ar gyfer yr hyn sydd yn lefel ormodol o sŵn oddi wrth y ffordd, a chewch lythyr naill oddi wrthyf fi neu oddi wrth Andrew Davies.

**Janet Ryder:** O fynd â chi'n ôl at y problemau ar yr A5, mae llawer o bobl yn ddiolchgar bod hen ffordd yr A5 bellach wedi'i hagor, ond mae llawer o fusnesau wedi colli llawer iawn o fusnes o ran twristiaid, yn enwedig, ac yn bryderus am yr effaith ar yr ardal gyfan. O gofio'r cyhoeddusrwydd ynglŷn â chau'r ffordd, mae busnesau'n pryderu y bydd llawer o bobl yn dal i gadw draw oddi wrth yr ardal, ac mae arnynt eisiau cael sicrwydd gennych y byddwch yn trefnu pecyn i ailhysbysebu ac ail-lansio'r ardal, ac i ddod â'r twristiaid yn eu holau. Mae'r cau hwn yn effeithio ar ardal eang ar hyd yr A5 ac mae ar fusnesau eisiau cael sicrwydd y bydd pecyn achub, ac y gwelir mwy o hysbysebu i gynorthwyo'r atyniadau i ymwelwyr a'r cymunedau lleol. Mae ar fusnesau eisiau cael gwybod hefyd pwy yw'r unigolyn sy'n bwynt cyswllt tra bo'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo. A wnewch enwi swyddog fel y gall busnesau gysylltu â'r unigolyn hwnnw a chael gwybodaeth ac

atebion i'w cwestiynau yn syth?

**The First Minister:** I will certainly look at the issue of having one point of contact, along with Andrew Davies. That suggestion may prove useful. There could be claims for compensation, which could involve people trying to claim against us, or us trying to claim against the people who put in the rock bolts that sheared. Those are all matters that need to be dealt with at a legal level. It has happened, and we now have six months of the difficulties of single-lane working, with a weight limit of 7.5 tonnes. Perhaps the most urgent issue that we need to look at in trying to restore the tourism viability is whether coaches can be allowed on the road, despite the fact that they may weigh more than 7.5 tonnes, although heavy goods vehicles will certainly have to use alternative routes. If we can see how to minimise the damage to the tourism trade in the areas served by the A5 through central north Wales, I will get back to you on that.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am delighted that you will be learning lessons from this debacle, because it has a huge impact, as we have heard from other Members. I am also concerned about listening to local people, not only as regards the A5, but also in Ewloe, as mentioned by Carl. I get the impression that if you and your officials had listened properly to local people, there would not have been this mess on the A5, for instance. Will you reassure us that you will listen to local people in Ewloe? I also went to the exhibition with Carl. With the new regime, it is very difficult for us to talk to people other than Ministers. Reassure us, First Minister, that you will be listening to local people and giving them what they want, not just what officials think that they want.

**The First Minister:** You mentioned that there was a mess, but that question was a bit of a mess, really, given that you were trying to weave together matters relating to the A55 and the A494, which is a section of road not yet open, with what has happened on the A5, which you say I described as a 'debacle', but I did not. What I said was that these things

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn sicr fe edrychaf ar gwestiwn cael un pwynt cyswllt, ynghyd ag Andrew Davies. Gall yr awgrym hwnnw fod yn ddefnyddiol. Gellid cael hawliadau am iawndal, un ai wrth i bobl geisio hawlio yn ein herbyn ni, neu wrth i ni geisio hawlio yn erbyn y bobl a osododd y bolltau yn y graig a dorrodd. Materion y mae angen delio â hwy ar lefel gyfreithiol yw'r rheini i gyd. Mae wedi digwydd, ac yn awr mae gennym chwe mis o anawsterau wrth weithio mewn un lôn, gyda chyfyngiad pwysau o 7.5 tunnell. Efallai mai'r mater sydd â mwyaf o frys yn ei gylch y mae angen inni edrych arno wrth geisio adfer y sefyllfa o ran ymwelwyr yw a ellir caniatáu coetsys ar y ffordd, er gwaethaf y ffaith y gallant bwyso mwy na 7.5 tunnell, er y bydd yn rhaid i gerbydau nwyddau trwm, yn sicr, ddefnyddio ffyrdd eraill. Os gallwn weld sut i sicrhau'r niwed lleiaf posibl i'r fasnach ymwelwyr yn yr ardaloedd a wasanaethir gan yr A5 drwy ganol gogledd Cymru, deuaif yn ôl atoch ynglŷn â hynny.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn falch dros ben eich bod am ddysgu gwersi o'r traed moch sydd wedi digwydd yma, oherwydd y mae'n cael effaith enfawr, fel y clywsom gan Aelodau eraill. Yr wyf yn pryderu hefyd ynghylch gwrando ar bobl leol, nid yn unig ynglŷn â'r A5, ond hefyd yn Ewlo, fel y soniodd Carl. Caf yr argraff pe baech chi a'ch swyddogion wedi gwrando'n iawn ar y bobl leol, na fyddai'r llanast hwn ar yr A5, er enghraifft, wedi digwydd. A rowch sicrwydd inni y gwrandewch ar y bobl leol yn Ewlo? Euthum innau i'r arddangosfa gyda Carl. Gyda'r drefn newydd, mae'n anodd iawn inni siarad â phobl heblaw Gweinidogion. Rhowch sicrwydd inni, Brif Weinidog, y byddwch yn gwrando ar bobl leol ac yn rhoi iddynt yr hyn y mae arnynt ei eisiau, nid yr hyn sydd arnynt ei eisiau ym mam swyddogion.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr oeddech yn sôn bod llanast, ond yr oedd y cwestiwn hwnnw'n dipyn o lanast, yn y bôn, o feddwl eich bod yn ceisio cysylltu materion yn ymwneud â'r A55 a'r A494, sy'n ddarn ffordd nad yw wedi'i agor eto, â'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd ar yr A5, y dywedwch fy mod wedi'i ddisgrifio fel 'traed moch', ond ni wneuthum.

happen. The bolts sheared, creating a 1 in 63 chance of loss of life from an accident, and so we had to take urgent action, which may be followed by legal action. Likewise, there may be others who wish to sue for compensation. They may sue us or they may sue the original contractors—I do not know. However, those are all matters for lawyers to deal with in the courts, and are not for me to comment on here. As I said, these things happen from time to time, and so the question then is whether you should deal with them promptly. We have dealt with this promptly, and we have let the contract promptly. We have managed to get the landowners all on board with, shall we say, reasonable payments for compensation to reopen the old A5, while also recognising that, with the weight limit, it means big diversions for HGVs. We may be able to do something for coaches, which is what we are looking at now, to minimise the impact on tourism. We have acted as promptly as possible, under the circumstances.

Yr hyn a ddywedais yw bod y pethau hyn yn digwydd. Torrodd y bolltau, gan greu siawns 1 mewn 63 o golli bywyd yn sgîl damwain, ac felly bu raid inni weithredu ar fyrder, ac efallai y bydd camau cyfreithiol yn dilyn hynny. Yn yr un modd, gall fod eraill a fydd yn dymuno mynd â ni i'r llys i gael iawndal. Gallant ddwyn achos yn ein herbyn ni neu yn erbyn y contractwyr gwreiddiol—ni wn. Fodd bynnag, materion yw'r rheini i gyd i gyfreithwyr ymdrin â hwy yn y llysoedd, ac nid i mi gyflwyno sylwadau arnynt yma. Fel y dywedais, bydd y pethau hyn yn digwydd o bryd i'w gilydd, ac felly y cwestiwn wedyn yw a ddylech ddelio â hwy'n ddi-oed. Yr ydym wedi delio â hyn yn ddi-oed, ac wedi gosod y contract yn ddi-oed. Yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gael cytundeb yr holl berchenogion tir gyda thaliadau digolledu y byddem ni'n eu galw'n rhesymol er mwyn ailagor yr hen A5, gan gydnabod hefyd fod y cyfyngiad pwysau'n golygu gwyradau mawr i lorïau trymion. Efallai y gallwn wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â choetsys, sef yr hyn yr ydym yn edrych arno'n awr, i sicrhau'r effaith leiaf posibl ar dwristiaeth. Yr ydym wedi gweithredu mor ddi-oed ag y gallem, yn yr amgylchiadau.

### **Blaenoriaethau ar gyfer y Gwasanaethau Iechyd Priorities for the Health Services**

**C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Beth yw blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer y gwasanaethau iechyd dros y 12 mis nesaf? OAQ1685(FM)

**Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What are the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for the health services over the next 12 months? OAQ1685(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein blaenoriaethau yn cynnwys cwtogi ymhellach ar amseroedd aros am driniaeth ysbyty, gwasgu i lawr ar anghydraddoldeb iechyd, a bwrw ymlaen gyda'r gwaith o gynllunio patrwm ein gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol.

**The First Minister:** Our priorities include further reducing waiting times for hospital treatment, cutting down on health inequalities, and forging ahead with the work of planning the future shape of our health services in Wales.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** It is nice to see that you have turned up on time this afternoon, although many of your colleagues seem to be following your example and leaving it a bit late.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'n dda gweld eich bod wedi cyrraedd yn brydlon y prynhawn yma, er bod llawer o'ch cyd-Aelodau i'w gweld yn dilyn eich esiampl ac yn ei gadael braidd yn hwyr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It is normal for supplementary questions to relate to the question on the agenda.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n arferol i gwestiynau atodol fod yn berthnasol i'r cwestiwn ar yr agenda.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Indeed. Thank you, Presiding Officer. We were talking about priorities in the health service, First Minister. I am surprised that you did not refer specifically to the primary sector when you talked about your priorities. You should be telling us what you are going to do about the primary sector in Wales and community health services, rather than 'Designed for Life', which deals with acute services.

**The First Minister:** Whatever I had listed as our priorities—within the 50-word limit that I am allowed in my response—you would inevitably have said, 'You did not mention this, that or the other'. I mentioned three things. I cannot mention six things, or my answer would be far too long. We have put a huge emphasis on primary care; the health inequalities that I mentioned will include action mostly through the primary care services. You may be unaware of that fact, but I think that your question is misplaced. You must recognise that what we have done in bringing down long waiting lists has been a massive achievement. Perhaps you did not expect us to be able to do it, but we have done it. We have shot your fox and destroyed your next election manifesto—I apologise, but not to the people of Wales; I think that they will be extremely pleased. However, there is still a long way left to go. To get waiting times for out-patients and in-patients down from 12 months to eight months by 1 April 2007 will be a massive further step forward, but that is what we aim to do. However, that is not our only priority, and I mentioned the others in my original answer.

**Leighton Andrews:** One priority is the investment in new hospitals and other buildings. Will you welcome the work that is under way to build the new Llwynypia hospital, as well as the investment in primary care facilities, such as the new health centre at Ynyshir, the planned health centres at Ynyswen and Tonypany and, in due course, the new doctors' surgery at Porth? These are all being planned by Rhondda Cynon Taf Local Health Board as we speak. It is great investment in primary healthcare services for the people of the Rhondda. Do you agree that

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yn wir. Diolch, Lywydd. Yr oeddem yn sôn am flaenoriaethau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, Brif Weinidog. Yr wyf yn synnu na wnaethoch gyfeirio'n benodol at y sector sylfaenol wrth sôn am eich blaenoriaethau. Dylech ddweud wrthym beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud ynghylch y sector sylfaenol yng Nghymru a gwasanaethau iechyd cymunedol, yn hytrach na 'Chynllun Oes', sy'n ymwneud â gwasanaethau aciwt.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Beth bynnag y byddwn wedi'i restru fel ein blaenoriaethau—o fewn y cyfyngiad o 50 gair a ganiateir imi yn fy ateb—byddech yn siŵr o fod wedi dweud, 'Ni soniasoch am y peth a'r peth'. Soniais am dri pheth. Ni allaf enwi chwe pheth, neu byddai fy ateb yn llawer rhy hir. Yr ydym wedi rhoi pwyslais enfawr ar ofal sylfaenol; bydd yr anghydraddoldebau iechyd a grybwyllais yn cynnwys gweithredu'n bennaf drwy'r gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol. Efallai nad yw'r ffaith honno'n hysbys i chi, ond credaf fod eich cwestiwn yn ddi-alw-amdano. Rhaid ichi gydnabod bod yr hyn yr ydym wedi'i wneud wrth leihau rhestrau aros hir wedi bod yn gamp aruthrol. Efallai nad oeddech yn disgwyl inni allu cyflawni hynny, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud. Yr ydym wedi saethu'ch cadno a difetha'ch manifffesto ar gyfer yr etholiad nesaf—ymddiheuraf, ond nid i bobl Cymru; credaf y byddant hwy wrth eu boddau. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer iawn waith i'w wneud o hyd. Bydd cael amserau aros i gleifion allanol a chleifion mewnol i lawr o 12 mis i wyth mis erbyn 1 Ebrill 2007 yn gam enfawr ymlaen eto, ond dyna yw ein nod. Fodd bynnag, nid hynny yw ein hunig flaenoriaeth, a soniais am y lleill yn fy ateb gwreiddiol.

**Leighton Andrews:** Un flaenoriaeth yw'r buddsoddiad mewn ysbytai newydd ac adeiladau eraill. A wneuch groesawu'r gwaith sydd ar droed i godi ysbyty newydd Llwynypia, yn ogystal â'r buddsoddiad mewn cyfleusterau gofal sylfaenol, megis y ganolfan iechyd newydd yn Ynys-hir, y canolfannau iechyd sydd yn yr arfaeth yn Ynys-wen a Thonypany a, maes o law, y feddygfa newydd yn y Porth? Mae'r rhain i gyd ar y gweill gan Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf y funud hon. Mae'n fuddsoddiad mawr mewn gwasanaethau gofal

other local health boards should be following the example of RCT local health board and accessing the capital budgets that are available?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We are trebling the funding for the capital programme from £100 million to £300 million by next year, which enables a considerable increase in primary healthcare centres as well as in hospital construction. People often know about the new Ystrad Mynach hospital or the new Rhondda and Ebbw Vale community hospitals, but they are not so familiar with the smaller, but significant, developments of new primary care centres. Those are particularly significant in the Valleys because the Valleys were not blessed with the previous wave of health centre construction because, frequently, you had GPs working single-handedly in big Victorian houses and they often lived over the premises. Therefore, that degree of group practice and full professionalisation of primary healthcare centres is happening 20 years later in the Valleys than in other places. I am really pleased to see that happening in the Rhondda.

**Jenny Randerson:** I also welcome capital development. You will be aware that in the Cardiff and Vale area we have an extremely welcome capital development in the form of the new orthopaedic centre at Llandough Hospital. Do you agree, however, that it is a crying shame, if not a scandal, that the money is not available to open those facilities, and that, as a result, your prized waiting-list reductions are now under threat?

**The First Minister:** That is a fairly oppositionist line to take, Jenny. I do not think that the situation is as bad as that. We believed that we had an agreement on its funding, but that agreement crumbled under close examination. However, the out-patient side is fully operational. Anyone who remembers the out-patient orthopaedic facilities located in portakabins, which were not even very up to date, at Llandough

iechyd sylfaenol i bobl y Rhondda. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai byrddau iechyd lleol eraill ddilyn esiampl bwrdd iechyd lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf a defnyddio'r cyllidebau cyfalaf sydd ar gael?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn treblu'r cyllid ar gyfer y rhaglen gyfalaf o £100 miliwn i £300 miliwn erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, sydd yn galluogi cynnydd sylweddol mewn canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn ogystal ag mewn adeiladu ysbytai. Mae pobl yn gwybod yn aml am ysbyty newydd Ystrad Mynach neu ysbytai cymuned newydd y Rhondda a Glynebwy, ond nid ydynt mor gyfarwydd â datblygiadau llai, ond arwyddocaol, y canolfannau gofal sylfaenol. Mae'r rhain yn arbennig o arwyddocaol yn y Cymoedd gan nad elwodd y Cymoedd o'r don flaenorol o adeiladu canolfannau iechyd oherwydd, yn aml, ceid meddygon teulu'n gweithio fel unigolion mewn tai Fictorianaid mawr, gan fyw uwchben y feddygfa'n aml. Felly, mae practisiau grŵp a gwneud canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn rhai hollol broffesiynol i'r fath raddau yn digwydd 20 mlynedd yn ddiweddarach yn y Cymoedd nag mewn mannau eraill. Yr wyf yn wirioneddol falch o weld hynny'n digwydd yn y Rhondda.

**Jenny Randerson:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu datblygiad cyfalaf. Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod gennym ddatblygiad cyfalaf sydd i'w groesawu'n fawr yn ardal Caerdydd a'r Fro, sef y ganolfan orthopedig newydd yn Ysbyty Llandochoau. A gytunwch, fodd bynnag, ei bod yn drueni mawr, os nad yn warth o beth, nad yw'r arian ar gael i agor y cyfleusterau hynny, a bod lleihau'r rhestrau aros, rhywbeth sydd yn bwysig iawn yn eich golwg, bellach dan fygythiad o ganlyniad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n agwedd eithaf nodweddiadol o'r gwrthbleidiau, Jenny. Nid wyf yn meddwl bod y sefyllfa cynddrwg â hynny. Yr oeddem yn credu bod gennym gytundeb ar y modd y câi ei ariannu, ond chwalodd y cytundeb hwnnw wrth graffu'n fanwl arno. Fodd bynnag, mae'r rhan sy'n ymwneud â chleifion allanol yn gwbl weithredol. Bydd unrhyw un sydd yn cofio'r cyfleusterau orthopedig i gleifion



Hospital will welcome the fact that the out-patient facilities are now world class. We have not yet been able to phase in the remainder of it, namely the surgery part of it, but we are continuing with our negotiations, which need to be concluded pretty soon, with Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust on the additional costs. When people realise how big the Cardiff and Vale orthopaedic centre development is and what a massive impact it will have, they will realise that getting the figures right is perhaps more important than looking for the daily headlines.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Dywedodd Roger Thyne, cyn brif weithredwr y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, fod angen buddsoddiad o £35 miliwn mewn gwasanaeth lle mae'r cynllun 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' wedi cael ei dangyllido i'r graddau bod y gwasanaeth yn beryglus a bron â chwalu. Defnyddiodd y geiriau 'danger of collapse'. A ydych yn cytuno â Roger Thyne?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydwyf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Efallai na chytunwch ag ef, Brif Weinidog, ond gwnaeth sawl honiad yn ei adroddiad, a gyflwynodd i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Mae'n honni bod hyd at 500 o bobl yn marw yn ddiangen bob blwyddyn oherwydd diffygion yn y gwasanaeth. A ydych yn sylweddoli bod angen adfer ffydd y cyhoedd yn y gwasanaeth hwn? Sut y byddwch chi'n gwneud hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Prif weithredwr dros dro oedd Roger Thyne, ac ail brif weithredwr dros dro sydd gennym yn awr, sef Anton van Dellen, a ddaeth i mewn gyda Roger Thyne o wasanaeth ambiwlans swydd Stafford. Mae Anton van Dellen yn edrych ar y sefyllfa o'r newydd. Maent yn disgwyl penodi prif weithredwr parhaol erbyn mis Awst. Yn ystod y ddau fis pan oedd yn gallu gweld beth oedd y sefyllfa, bu iddo ddod ar draws llawer o broblemau, ac yr ydym yn gyfarwydd iawn â rhai ohonynt. Yr ydym yn disgwyl gwelliant mawr yn safon gweinyddiaeth Ymddiriedolaeth GIG

allanol mewn portacabins, nad oeddent hyd yn oed yn rhai modern iawn, yn Ysbyty Llandochau yn croesawu'r ffaith bod y cyfleusterau i gleifion allanol erbyn hyn o'r radd flaenaf. Nid ydym wedi gallu cyflwyno gweddill y ddarpariaeth eto, sef y rhan yn ymwneud â llawdriniaethau, ond yr ydym yn parhau i negodi, gyda'r nod o orffen cyn bo hir, gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro ynglŷn â'r costau ychwanegol. Pan sylweddola pobl mor fawr yw datblygiad canolfan orthopedig Caerdydd a'r Fro a chymaint o effaith a gaiff, sylweddolant fod sicrhau bod y ffigurau'n iawn efallai'n bwysicach nag edrych am y penawdau dyddiol.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Roger Thyne, the former chief executive of the ambulance service, has said that investment of £35 million is needed in a service where the 'Agenda for Change' has been underfunded to such an extent that the service is dangerous and close to collapse. He used the words 'danger of collapse'. Do you agree with Roger Thyne?

**The First Minister:** No.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Perhaps you do not agree with him, First Minister, but he made several claims in his report, which he presented to the Minister for Health and Social Services. He claims that as many as 500 people die unnecessarily every year because of deficiencies in the service. Do you realise that we need to restore public confidence in this service? How will you do that?

**The First Minister:** Roger Thyne was an interim chief executive, and we now have a second interim chief executive, namely Anton van Dellen, who came in with Roger Thyne from Staffordshire ambulance service. Anton van Dellen is looking at the situation anew. They expect to appoint a permanent chief executive by August. During the two months when he could see what the situation was, he picked up on a number of problems, and we are very aware of some of them. We expect to see great improvement in the quality of the administration of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust and that the

Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru ac y bydd y prif weithredwr dros dro a'r prif weithredwr newydd yn gweithio gyda'r bwrdd a'r undebau sy'n cynrychioli staff yr ymddiriedolaeth i wella'r gwasanaeth.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What I find strange is that, although your answer to the first question was 'no', in your answer to the second question, you almost acknowledge that what Roger Thayne was saying was a real issue, because you highlighted some of the concerns that he has highlighted in his report. However, he does not mince his words. He has said some damning things about the service in his report. He refers to the lack of investment and the need for greater management control.

It is fairly clear to me that the Minister for Health and Social Services' response so far has been extremely complacent. It is high time that this Government stopped giving these lame excuses and did something to restore public confidence. Do you not think that it is now time for a full public inquiry, so that we can understand what evidence exists for making decisions and so that the Minister for Health and Social Services can assure us that he is in charge of the service?

**The First Minister:** That is a laughable proposition. One thing that a public inquiry would not do is restore public confidence in the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. It would be used to knock the ambulance trust. What are needed are practical steps to improve the service. The service is nothing like as bad as you imply. Ninety-seven per cent of category-A calls, which are immediately life-threatening emergencies, are met within the set time—81 per cent of all emergency calls and 97 per cent of immediately life-threatening calls are met within the set time. From what you have said, people would be led to believe that no-one sees an ambulance from one winter to the next, and that you could be lying on the road dying and no ambulance would come to pick you up. That is absurd; 97 per cent of immediately life-threatening calls are answered within the specified time. I do not

interim chief executive and the new chief executive will work with the board and the unions that represent the staff of the trust to improve the service.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr hyn yr wyf fi'n ei gael yn od yw, er mai 'nac ydwyf' oedd eich ateb i'r cwestiwn cyntaf, yn eich ateb i'r ail gwestiwn yr ydych bron â chydnabod bod yr hyn yr oedd Roger Thayne yn ei ddweud yn broblem wirioneddol, oherwydd cyfeiriasoch at rai o'r pryderon y mae ef wedi cyfeirio atynt yn ei adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siarad heb flewyn ar ei dafod. Mae wedi dweud pethau damniol am y gwasanaeth yn ei adroddiad. Cyfeiria at y diffyg buddsoddiad a bod angen mwy o reolaeth gan reolwyr.

Mae'n eithaf clir i mi fod ymateb y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol hyd yma wedi bod yn hynod hunanfodlon. Mae'n hen bryd i'r Llywodraeth hon roi'r gorau i wneud yr esgusion tila hyn a gwneud rhywbeth i adfer ffydd y cyhoedd. Onid ydych yn credu ei bod yn bryd cael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn, fel y gallwn weld pa dystiolaeth sydd o blaid gwneud penderfyniadau ac fel y gall y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ein sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth o dan ei reolaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n gynnig chwerthinllyd. Un peth na fyddai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn ei wneud yw adfer ffydd y cyhoedd yn Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Cymru. Byddai'n cael ei ddefnyddio i feirniadu'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans. Yr hyn sydd ei angen yw camau ymarferol i wella'r gwasanaeth. Nid yw'r gwasanaeth hanner cynddrwg â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei awgrymu. Mae 97 y cant o alwadau categori A, sef achosion brys lle y mae bygythiad ar unwaith i fywyd, yn cael eu hateb o fewn yr amser sy'n ofynnol—mae 81 y cant o bob galwad frys a 97 y cant o alwadau lle y mae bygythiad ar unwaith i fywyd yn cael eu hateb o fewn yr amser sy'n ofynnol. Yn ôl yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, gallai pobl yn hawdd gredu nad oes neb yn gweld ambiwlans o'r naill aeaf i'r llall, ac y gallech fod yn gorwedd yn y ffordd yn marw heb fod

know what purpose you envisage for an inquiry, but I am sure that it is not to restore confidence in the service, despite what you say.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** You were dismissive of what Roger Thayne said, but have you looked at his report more closely than to simply reject it out of hand? He said that there was poor equipment, poor management and delays, and that that could be costing up to 500 lives per year. You said that you did not agree with that, but have you examined the evidence? What is the basis for his disagreement?

**The First Minister:** Mr Thayne was not there long enough to have established a clear picture in his mind. He was appointed on an interim basis and he left after two months, as he did not enjoy the commuting from Staffordshire and wanted to spend more time with his family. That is my understanding. The person who came with him from Staffordshire, Anton van Dellen, has now taken over. I am pleased to say that a permanent chief executive will be in place by August, we hope. The longer that you are in charge, and the more permanent the arrangements, the easier it is for you to get a grip on what is really wrong. We know that there have been some major problems with ambulance procurement. Everybody would like to know how on earth the ambulances that have not worked as well as they should have worked were ordered. That is being looked at as a specific exercise in terms of something going wrong in procurement. We have looked at the improving figures, but there is a long way to go and further improvements to be made. However, we do not accept some of the more bloodcurdling, shroud-waving comments that Mr Thayne has made.

**Nick Bourne:** It seems that you are keen to go through interim chief executives until you get to one who sings the same tune as you sing. The Minister for Health and Social

ambiwylans yn dod i'ch nôl o gwbl. Mae hynny'n hurt bost; mae 97 y cant o alwadau lle y mae bygythiad ar unwaith i fywyd yn cael eu hateb o fewn yr amser sy'n ofynnol. Ni wn beth fyddai pwrpas ymchwiliad yn eich barn chi, ond yr wyf yn siŵr nad er mwyn adfer ffydd y cyhoedd yn y gwasanaeth, er gwaetha'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddweud.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yr oeddech yn wfftio'r hyn a ddywedodd Roger Thayne, ond a ydych wedi edrych yn ddigon manwl ar ei adroddiad yn hytrach na'i ddiystyru'n syth? Dywedodd fod y cyfarpar yn wael, y rheolaeth yn wael a bod oedi, a allai fod yn costio hyd at 500 o fywydau bob blwyddyn. Yr ydych wedi dweud nad oeddech yn cytuno â hynny, ond a ydych wedi edrych ar y dystiolaeth? Ar ba sail y mae'n anghytuno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oedd Mr Thayne yno'n ddigon hir i fod wedi cael darlun clir yn ei feddwl. Fe'i penodwyd dros dro a gadawodd ar ôl deufis, oherwydd nad oedd yn mwynhau cymudo o swydd Stafford a'i fod am dreulio mwy o amser gyda'i deulu. Dyna'r hyn a ddeallaf fi. Mae hwnnw a ddaeth gydag ef o swydd Stafford, Anton van Dellen, bellach wedi cymryd drosodd. Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y bydd prif weithredwr parhaol wrth ei waith erbyn mis Awst, gobeithio. Po hwyaf y bydd rhywun wrth y llyw, a pho fwyaf parhaol yw'r trefniadau, hawsaf yn y byd ydyw ichi ddeall beth sydd o'i le mewn gwirionedd. Gwyddom fod rhai problemau sylweddol wedi bod o ran caffael ambiwlansys. Byddai pawb yn dymuno gwybod sut yn y byd yr archebwyd yr ambiwlansys sydd heb weithio cystal ag y dylent fod wedi gwneud. Mae hynny'n cael ei ystyried yn benodol ar hyn o bryd o ran bod rhywbeth yn mynd o'i le gyda chaffael. Yr ydym wedi edrych ar y ffigurau, sy'n gwella, ond mae llawer iawn o waith i'w wneud, a gwelliannau pellach i'w gwneud. Fodd bynnag, nid ydym yn derbyn rhai o'r sylwadau mwyaf brawychus ac erchyll a wnaed gan Mr Thayne.

**Nick Bourne:** Ymddengys eich bod yn awyddus i gael prif weithredwyr dros dro hyd nes y byddwch yn cael un sy'n canu'r un diwn â chi. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a

Services has accepted that lives have been lost because of ambulance delays, poor equipment and so on, and you said, in a rather unfortunate answer, that a public inquiry would not restore public confidence. That seemed to prejudge the outcome of any public inquiry that may be ordered.

To take you on to some of our concerns, 40 to 45 per cent of people are not seen within the eight minute target time—those are Government figures. Are you happy with those figures? What is being done in terms of raising the performance? There are concerns here, but you seemed a little complacent in some of your earlier answer.

**The First Minister:** Let us be clear on what I said: I said that the public inquiry put forward by the leader of the opposition was not intended to restore confidence; it was intended to allow critics of the ambulance service to create an oppositionist whirl of media sentiment around this issue. In that way, those who have not already done so would lose confidence. That would be to move away from the figures that demonstrate that 97 per cent of immediately life-threatening calls and 81 per cent of all emergency calls are met within the set time.

There is a big job ahead, and there is no question that the ambulance trust needs to improve performance. There is no issue about trying to find and appoint a chief executive who agrees with us; that is an absurd smear. It is the best person for the job who will be appointed. We have had one interim chief executive, and we now have another, who will hold the fort until a permanent chief executive is appointed. However, I wish that you would withdraw the absurd smear that we are looking for some sort of 'yes-man' or 'yes-woman'. There is no evidence for that. If you wish to be taken seriously, you need to withdraw that remark.

2.20 p.m.

Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi derbyn bod bywydau wedi eu colli oherwydd oedi gydag ambiwlansys, cyfarpar gwael ac yn y blaen, ac yr ydych wedi dweud, mewn ateb braidd yn anffodus, na fyddai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn adfer ffydd y cyhoedd. Yr oedd hynny fel pe bai'n rhagfarnu canlyniad unrhyw ymchwiliad cyhoeddus y gellid gorchymyn ei gynnal.

A sôn am rai o'n pryderon, mae 40 i 45 y cant o bobl nad ydynt yn cael eu gweld o fewn yr amser targed o wyth munud—ffigurau'r Llywodraeth yw'r rheini. A ydych yn fodlon ar y ffigurau hynny? Beth sy'n cael ei wneud i wella'r perfformiad? Mae pryderon gyda'r mater hwn, ond yr oeddech yn ymddangos braidd yn hunanfodlon gyda pheth o'ch ateb blaenorol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedais: dywedais nad pwrpas yr ymchwiliad cyhoeddus a gynigiwyd gan arweinydd yr wrthblaid oedd adfer ffydd; ei bwrpas oedd rhoi cyfle i feirniaid y gwasanaeth ambiwlans greu corwynt gwrthbleidiol o deimladau yn y cyfryngau ynghylch y mater hwn. Wrth wneud hynny, byddai'r rhai nad ydynt eisoes wedi colli ffydd yn gwneud hynny. Byddai hynny'n golygu colli golwg ar y ffigurau sy'n dangos bod 97 y cant o alwadau lle y mae bygythiad ar unwaith i fywyd a 81 y cant o'r holl alwadau brys yn cael eu hateb o fewn yr amser sy'n ofynnol.

Mae llawer iawn i'w wneud, ac nid oes amheuaeth nad oes angen i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans wella'i pherfformiad. Nid oes a wnelo â cheisio dod o hyd i brif weithredwr sy'n cytuno â ni a'i benodi; mae hynny'n sarhad hurt. Yr unigolyn gorau ar gyfer y swydd fydd yn cael ei benodi. Yr ydym wedi cael un prif weithredwr dros dro, ac yn awr mae gennym un arall, i sefyll yn y bwlch hyd nes y penodir prif weithredwr parhaol. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn hoffi ichi dynnu'n ôl eich awgrym sarhaus hurt ein bod yn chwilio am ryw fath o gynffonwr. Nid oes dim tystiolaeth bod hynny'n digwydd. Os dymunwch inni eich cymryd o ddifrif, dylech dynnu eich geiriau'n ôl.

**Nick Bourne:** Before the First Minister disappears into the quicksand of his own argument, he was the person who said that a public inquiry would not restore public confidence. You were quite clear on that, First Minister, so whatever you said more recently had a different slant to what you first said. Let me be clear about this. It is absolutely true, and the Minister for Health and Social Services has said so, that there is out-of-date equipment and poor management, and that there are delays that are contributing to deaths. We could argue about the precise number, but this is why Roger Thayne—who was appointed by your Government as a result of one phone call, as I understand it—resigned in the way that he did. He said that £35 million was needed for capital equipment to restore capital deficits in the ambulance service, and that a further £10 million was needed every year for running costs. These are not just comments that he has made about the poor service; they have also been made by the unions. Therefore, I find it extraordinary that you say that an independent public inquiry—and I am happy for it to be independent—could not restore public confidence. Of course it would; it would restore public confidence in terms of its findings, and then we would know about the problem that we have to address. The First Minister's response is characterised by typical complacency; he is blaming the opposition for trying to address issues that he is unwilling and unable to address himself.

**The First Minister:** You have forgotten your skill of asking questions, Nick. There is no question there at all; it is only a rant and an attempt to make assertions. I rebut entirely your attempt to rearrange my words. What I said to Ieuan Wyn Jones was, 'What is the purpose of the suggestion of having a public inquiry?'. He says that the purpose is to restore public confidence, but I disagree with that. The purpose is for opposition parties, which want this to be some sort of a way of vote grubbing in the run-up to the Assembly elections, to have lots of media stories about scandals in the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS trust. That is what it is for, and that is what I rebut. It would not help one bit to improve ambulance services for the people of Wales. The service is doing well, but it needs

**Nick Bourne:** Cyn i'r Prif Weinidog ddiflannu i gors ei ddadl ei hun, ef ei hun a ddywedodd na fyddai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn adfer ffyrdd y cyhoedd. Yr oeddech yn gwbl glir ynghylch hynny, Brif Weinidog, felly yr oedd gogwydd gwahanol i'r hyn a ddywedasoch yn ddiweddarach o'i gymharu â'r hyn a ddywedasoch yn gyntaf. Gadewch imi fod yn glir ynghylch hyn. Mae'n berffaith wir, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, fod y cyfarpar yn wael a'r rheolaeth yn wael, a bod oedi yn cyfrannu at farwolaethau. Gallem ddadlau am yr union nifer, ond dyna pam y penderfynodd Roger Thayne—a benodwyd gan eich Llywodraeth o ganlyniad i un alwad ffôn, yn ôl a ddeallaf—ymddiswyddo fel y gwnaeth. Dywedodd fod angen £35 miliwn ar gyfer cyfarpar cyfalaf i adfer diffygion cyfalaf yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, a £10 miliwn ar ben hynny yn flynyddol ar gyfer costau rhedeg. Nid sylwadau a wnaed ganddo ef yn unig yw'r rhain am y gwasanaeth gwael; mae'r undebau hefyd wedi dweud hyn. Felly, mae'n anhygoel i mi eich bod yn dweud na allai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus annibynnol—ac yr wyf yn hapus iddo fod yn annibynnol—adfer ffydd y cyhoedd. Byddai wrth gwrs; byddai'n adfer ffydd y cyhoedd o ran ei ddarganfyddiadau, ac yna byddem yn gwybod am y broblem y byddai'n rhaid inni geisio'i datrys. Mae hunanfodlonrwydd nodweddiadol yn ymateb y Prif Weinidog; mae'n beio'r gwrthbleidiau am geisio mynd i'r afael â materion y mae'n anfodlon neu'n methu â mynd i'r afael â hwy ei hun.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych wedi anghofio eich sgil o ofyn cwestiynau, Nick. Nid cwestiwn oedd gennych o gwbl; dim ond brygowthan ac ymgais i wneud haeriadau. Yr wyf yn ymwrthod yn llwyr â'ch ymgais i ail-drefnu fy ngeiriau. Yr hyn a ddywedais wrth Ieuan Wyn Jones oedd, 'Beth yw pwrpas awgrymu bod ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn cael ei gynnal?' Mae'n dweud mai'r pwrpas yw adfer ffydd y cyhoedd, ond anghytunaf â hynny. Y pwrpas yw rhoi cyfle i'r gwrthbleidiau, sydd am ddefnyddio hyn i chwilota am bleidleisiau cyn etholiadau'r Cynulliad, gael digon o straeon yn y cyfryngau am sgandalau yn ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Dyna ei bwrpas, ac yr wyf yn ymwrthod â hynny. Ni fyddai'n helpu dim i wella

to do a lot better, and there are specific issues about procurement, which are being looked at properly. I am pleased with what you said about the unions, because in meetings with the management and the unions we have found that they are very much on board in trying to participate in exercises to improve the service.

gwasanaethau ambiwlans i bobl Cymru. Mae'r gwasanaeth yn gwneud yn dda, ond mae angen iddo wneud yn llawer gwell, ac mae problemau penodol ynghylch caffael, sy'n derbyn sylw priodol. Yr wyf yn falch o'r hyn a ddywedsoch am yr undebau, oherwydd mewn cyfarfodydd gyda'r rheolwyr a'r undebau, cawsom eu bod yn ymdrechu o ddifrif i gyfranogi mewn ymarferion i wella'r gwasanaeth.

### **Adfywio Cymoedd De Cymru Regenerating the South Wales Valleys**

**Q3 Irene James:** Will the First Minister make a statement about regenerating the south Wales Valleys? OAQ1682(FM)

**C3 Irene James:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am adfywio Cymoedd de Cymru? OAQ1682(FM)

**The First Minister:** That is a very timely question. On Thursday 16 June, Andrew Davies, the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, launched the Heads of the Valleys strategy, which describes an investment programme of a £140 million of special funding in the area over the next 15 years as part of our wider and continuing regeneration activity across the Valleys.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n gwestiwn amserol iawn. Ddydd Iau 16 Mehefin, lansiodd Andrew Davies, y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, strategaeth ar gyfer Blaenau'r Cymoedd, sy'n disgrifio rhaglen fuddsoddi sy'n werth £140 miliwn o gyllid arbennig yn yr ardal dros y 15 mlynedd nesaf fel rhan o'n gweithgareddau adfywio ehangach a pharhaus ar draws y Cymoedd.

**Irene James:** Do you agree that, after decades of decline, it is only a Labour Assembly Government that is committed to deliver prosperity for our Valleys communities? [*Interruption.*] Would you also agree that, with the combination of the Heads of the Valleys strategy—

**Irene James:** A ydych yn cytuno, ar ôl degawdau o ddirywiad, mai dim ond Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad sydd â'r ymrwymiad i sicrhau ffyniant i gymunedau'r Cymoedd? [*Torri ar draws.*] A fydddech hefyd yn cytuno, yn sgîl y cyfuniad, strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I would like to hear supplementary questions.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Hoffwn glywed cwestiynau atodol.

**Irene James:** Do you also agree that, with the combination of the Heads of the Valleys strategy, the spatial plan and 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy', we now have a key strategic policy base for sustained investment of our new European money to deliver more strategic projects with visible targeted benefits for our most deprived areas?

**Irene James:** A ydych hefyd yn cytuno, yn sgîl y cyfuniad, strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd, y cynllun gofodol a 'Chymru: Economi yn Ffynnu', fod gennym bellach sylfaen polisi strategol allweddol fel bod ein cyllid Ewropeaidd newydd yn cael ei fuddsoddi'n barhaol i ddarparu prosiectau mwy strategol gyda manteision amlwg, a'r rheini wedi eu targedu, yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig?

**The First Minister:** Thank you for asking that question, Irene, despite attempts from the opposition to shout you down. People only want to shout you down because they do not

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Diolch am ofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw, Irene, er gwaetha'r ymdrechion gan y gwrthbleidiau i weiddi ar eich traws. Dim ond am nad ydynt am i bobl

want the people of Blaenau Gwent and other Valleys areas to hear the truth. However, they will hear the truth. A total of £140 million from the Assembly Government is intended to lever in £360 million from the private sector, which gives a total of £500 million. That has to be based on trying to use the rugged mountain scenery of the Valleys as an attraction, and not what it is seen as at the moment, which is some sort of disincentive to private housing investment and industrial investment. This also links to improving transport, including road transport through the duelling of the A465 Heads of the Valleys road, and the new railway from Cardiff, via Newport, to Ebbw Vale.

**Laura Anne Jones:** First Minister, what long-term strategies do you have in place to ensure that companies set up in the Valleys stay there and do not leave for other European Union countries, as we have seen in Ebbw Vale?

**The First Minister:** We have seen one example in Ebbw Vale, but we have also seen a counter example in terms of the Danish company Nørhaven, which has bought the Creative Print and Design Group. The company moved into a new factory, which we helped to pay for, and that will safeguard 60 jobs and create a further 70 jobs. We have also seen the extraordinary success of General Dynamics UK Ltd, which employs 1,200 people in Oakdale in software design. This is the first time that that kind of white-collar professional employment in software engineering has been based in the Valleys. This also combines with the fact that we are investing in the new Heads of the Valleys office in Merthyr Tydfil, which I believe will have 500 civil servants working in it before long. Having all those pieces in place means that you now have a much wider variety of jobs, in manufacturing, the service industries, and the public and private sectors. General Dynamics has been able to blaze a trail in Oakdale, and many others will follow, not just in manufacturing, but also in service employment.

Blaenau Gwent ac ardaloedd eraill y Cymoedd glywed y gwir y mae pobl yn gweiddi ar eich traws. Fodd bynnag, cânt glywed y gwir. Bydd cyfanswm o £140 miliwn yn cael ei roi gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddenu £360 miliwn gan y sector preifat, gan roi cyfanswm o £500 miliwn. Rhaid seilio hynny ar geisio defnyddio golygfeydd mynyddoedd ysgithrog y Cymoedd i'w denu, ac nid yr hyn a welir ar hyn o bryd, sef rhyw fath o anghymhelliaid i fuddsoddiad tai preifat a buddsoddi diwydiannol. Mae hyn yn cysylltu hefyd â gwella trafndiaeth, gan gynnwys trafndiaeth ffyrdd drwy greu ffordd ddeuol ar hyd yr A465 ym Mlaenau'r Cymoedd, a'r rheilffordd newydd o Gaerdydd, drwy Gasnewydd, i Lynebwly.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Brif Weinidog, pa strategaethau hirdymor sydd gennych ar waith i sicrhau bod cwmnïau sy'n ymsefydlu yn y Cymoedd yn aros yno ac nad ydynt yn mynd oddi yno i wledydd eraill yn yr Undeb Ewropeaidd, fel yr ydym wedi gweld yng Nglynebwly?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi gweld un enghraifft yng Nglynebwly, ond hefyd wedi gweld enghraifft i'r gwrthwyneb gyda Nørhaven, y cwmni o Ddenmarc, sydd wedi prynu'r Creative Print and Design Group. Symudodd y cwmni i ffatri newydd, a rhoesom gyllid i'w helpu i dalu amdani, a bydd hynny'n diogelu 60 o swyddi ac yn creu 70 o rai newydd. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gweld llwyddiant anhygoel cwmni General Dynamics UK Ltd, sy'n cyflogi 1,200 o bobl yn Oakdale mewn dylunio meddalwedd. Dyma'r tro cyntaf i'r math hwnnw o gyflogaeth broffesiynol coler wen mewn peirianeg meddalwedd gael ei leoli yn y Cymoedd. Yn ogystal â hyn, yr ydym yn buddsoddi yn swyddfa newydd Blaenau'r Cymoedd ym Merthyr Tudful, lle y bydd 500 o weision sifil yn gweithio cyn bo hir, yr wyf yn credu. Oherwydd bod yr holl elfennau hyn ar waith, mae'n golygu bod gennych bellach lawer mwy o amrywiaeth o ran swyddi, mewn gweithgynhyrchu, yn y diwydiannau gwasanaethu, ac yn y sectorau cyhoeddus a phreifat. Mae General Dynamics wedi gallu torri cwys newydd yn Oakdale, a bydd sawl un arall yn dilyn, nid yn unig mewn gweithgynhyrchu, ond hefyd mewn swyddi

gwasanaethu.

### **Y Diwydiant Dur The Steel Industry**

**Q4 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the importance of the steel industry in Wales? OAQ1667(FM)

**C4 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bwysigrwydd y diwydiant dur yng Nghymru? OAQ1667(FM)

**The First Minister:** Despite rocketing energy prices, the steel industry continues to be a vital component of the Welsh economy, with 8,000 people directly employed by the industry and multi-million pound investment programmes going on at Corus, Celsa and Alphasteel Ltd.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Er bod prisiau ynni'n codi i'r entrychion, mae'r diwydiant dur yn parhau'n rhan hanfodol o economi Cymru, drwy gyflogi 8,000 o bobl yn uniongyrchol, a rhaglenni buddsoddi gwerth miliynau lawer yn digwydd yn Corus, Celsa ac Alphasteel Ltd.

**John Griffiths:** I look forward to your visit to the Cogent Power Ltd orb works in Newport East in July, so that you will hear, at first hand, about some of the current issues in the steel industry. From my visits to the orb works, and Llanwern and Alphasteel, it is clear that one of the most pressing issues at the moment is the rapidly escalating energy prices. Can you assure me, Rhodri, that you will continue to work closely with the industry in Wales and with our UK Government colleagues to address these important issues on the price of energy?

**John Griffiths:** Edrychaf ymlaen at eich ymweliad â gwaith pelenni Cogent Power Ltd yn Nwyrain Casnewydd ym mis Gorffennaf, fel y gallwch glywed o lygad y ffynnon am rai o broblemau presennol y diwydiant dur. Yn sgîl fy ymweliadau â'r gwaith pelenni, ac â Llan-wern ac Alphasteel, mae'n glir mai un o'r problemau mwyaf dybryd ar hyn o bryd yw bod prisiau ynni'n codi i'r entrychion. A allwch fy sicrhau, Rhodri, y byddwch yn parhau i weithio'n agos â'r diwydiant yng Nghymru a chyda'n cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU i geisio datrys y problemau pwysig hyn ynghylch prisiau ynni?

**The First Minister:** I will. It is the key bugbear of the industry at the moment. Even though they are making major investments to improve efficiency in Port Talbot, Shotton, Newport and Cardiff and so on, the different owners of the different steel companies in Wales all say that every gain that they have made in efficiency savings, with new plants and investment, has been wiped out by the rocketing energy prices. What they mean by that is that the prices have gone up in the gross fashion, but they have also gone up far more in the UK because of the way that the liberalised energy market applies to the UK. That market does not yet apply in other countries because they have not yet applied the liberalised energy market rule that is supposed to apply across the EU.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf. Dyna gasbeth mwyaf y diwydiant ar hyn o bryd. Er eu bod yn buddsoddi'n helaeth i wella effeithlonrwydd ym Mhort Talbot, Shotton, Casnewydd a Chaerdydd ac yn y blaen, mae gwahanol berchenogion y gwahanol gwmmniau dur yng Nghymru i gyd yn dweud bod pob cynnydd y maent wedi'i wneud drwy arbedion effeithlonrwydd, o ran buddsoddiad a ffatrioedd newydd, wedi diflannu o ganlyniad i'r codiadau anferth ym mhrisiau ynni. Yr hyn a olygir ganddynt wrth ddweud hynny yw bod prisiau wedi codi'n gyffredinol, ond eu bod wedi codi llawer mwy yn y DU oherwydd y modd y mae'r farchnad ynni ddigyfyngiadau yn effeithio ar y DU. Nid yw'r farchnad honno'n effeithio ar wledydd eraill eto oherwydd nid ydynt eto wedi gweithredu rheol y farchnad ynni ddigyfyngiadau sydd i fod i gael ei dilyn ar draws y DU.



**William Graham:** Can you explain to the people of Blaenau Gwent why, at a time when the demand for steel is at its highest, you have managed in your Government to close the plants in Llanwern and the plant in Ebbw Vale? Could you explain that?

**The First Minister:** I can explain that you got your facts wrong, in the sense that it is true that the tinsplate plant in Ebbw Vale closed some three years ago, but Capparo Steel Products Ltd remains open, therefore there is still a steel industry in Blaenau Gwent. Furthermore, the steel plant did not close at Llanwern. It will come as a great shock to the people working in the finishing end at Llanwern that you, William Graham, as one of the people representing the region that includes Llanwern, think that the whole works has gone. In fact, it has not. I think that there are some 1,500 people still working at Llanwern who will have a great shock when they read what you said in the *South Wales Argus* tomorrow.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I fynd yn ôl at gwestiwn atodol John Griffiths a oedd yn cyfeirio at gost uchel trydan i'r diwydiant, mae hynny hefyd yn wir yn achos Alwminiwm Môn, sy'n defnyddio mwy o drydan, o bosibl, nag unrhyw ddiwydiant arall yng Nghymru. Pa gefnogaeth a gredwch y gallwch ei rhoi i'r cwmni hwnnw, wrth iddo edrych am ffyrdd eraill o sicrhau cyflenwad trydan digonol yn wyneb y tebygolrwydd y bydd atomfa yr Wylfa yn cau yn y dyfodol agos?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr unig wahaniaeth yw, pan ydych yn sôn am y diwydiant dur, yr ydych yn sôn am ynni yn gyffredinol, sef nwy a thrydan, ond pan ydych yn siarad am Alwminiwm Môn, pris y trydan yw'r peth allweddol, ynghyd â'r trefniadau o ran sut y darperir y trydan, o ran y llinellau i mewn i'r ffatri neu'r *smelter*. Yr ydym wedi cynnal cyfarfodydd yn gyson gyda'r cwmni, gan gynnwys un, wythnos i ddydd Gwener, gyda chyfarwyddwyr y ffatri a'r cwmni, oherwydd daeth cyfarwyddwr draw o Seland Newydd er mwyn chwarae rhan yn y cyfarfod. Mae'r cyfarfodydd yn parhau er mwyn ceisio dod o hyd i'r ateb. Nid yw'n hawdd a bydd yn rhaid i ni gael rhywbeth yn barod cyn i'r Wylfa gau yn 2010. Golyga'r amseriad ein bod yn gweithredu ar frys.

**William Graham:** A allwch esbonio i bobl Blaenau Gwent pam yr ydych wedi llwyddo yn ystod eich Llywodraeth i gau'r ffatrioedd yn Llan-wern a'r ffatri yng Nglynebwy, a hynny ar adeg pan fo'r galw am ddur ar ei uchaf? A allwch esbonio hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gallaf esbonio bod eich ffeithiau yn anghywir, o ran ei bod yn wir bod y ffatri tunplat yng Nglynebwy wedi cau tua thair blynedd yn ôl, ond bod Capparo Steel Products Ltd yn parhau ar agor, felly mae diwydiant dur o hyd ym Mlaenau Gwent. Heblaw hynny, ni chaeodd y gwaith dur yn Llan-wern. Bydd yn peri cryn sioc i'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn yr adran gorffen yn Llan-wern eich bod chi, William Graham, fel un o'r bobl sy'n cynrychioli'r ardal sy'n cynnwys Llan-wern, yn meddwl bod y gwaith cyfan wedi mynd. Nid ydyw, mewn gwirionedd. Credaf fod tua 1,500 o bobl yn dal i weithio yn Llan-wern a fydd yn cael sioc fawr o ddarllen yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud yn y *South Wales Argus* yfory.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** To go back to John Griffiths's supplementary question that referred to the industry's high electricity costs, that is also true in the case of Anglesey Aluminium, which uses more electricity, possibly, than any other industry in Wales. What support do you think that you can give to that company as it looks for other ways of securing a sufficient electricity supply in the face of the likelihood that Wylfa nuclear power station will close in the near future?

**The First Minister:** The only distinction is that, when you are talking about the steel industry, you are talking about energy in general, namely gas and electricity, but when you are talking about Anglesey Aluminium, the key issue is the price of electricity, along with the arrangements as to the way in which electricity is provided, in terms of lines into the factory or the smelter. We have held regular meetings with the company, including one a week ago last Friday with the directors of the factory and the company, because a director came over from New Zealand to participate in the meeting. The meetings are continuing in order to try to resolve this issue. It is not easy and we will have to have something in place before Wylfa closes in 2010. The timing means that we are working

urgently on this.

### **Hyrwyddo Ymwybyddiaeth o Gyffuriau The Promotion of Drug Awareness**

**Q5 Mark Isherwood:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the promotion of drug awareness among children and young people in Wales? OAQ1670(FM)

**The First Minister:** I am sure that you will have been delighted that we allocated an additional £300,000 to the previously announced budget, when we received additional money from Gordon Brown out of the consequentials. A large part of that will be used to develop a pilot programme to deal with raising awareness of the dangers of drugs—if you want to call that ‘drug awareness’, I suppose that that is okay, but I would rather call it the ‘dangers of drugs’—among disengaged pupils. That comes on top of our ‘Tackling Substance Misuse in Wales: A Partnership Approach’ strategy.

**C5 Mark Isherwood:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau ymysg plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru? OAQ1670(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod wrth eich bodd pan glywsoch ein bod wedi dyrannu £300,000 yn ychwanegol i'r gyllideb a gyhoeddwyd yn flaenorol, pan gawsom arian ychwanegol gan Gordon Brown allan o'r ddarpariaeth ganlyniadol. Bydd cyfran helaeth o hynny'n cael ei defnyddio i ddatblygu rhaglen beilot i godi ymwybyddiaeth o beryglon cyffuriau—os ydych am ei alw'n 'ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau', mae'n debyg bod hynny'n iawn, ond byddai'n well gennyf ei alw'n 'peryglon cyffuriau'—ymhlith disgyblion sydd wedi ymddieithrio. Mae hynny'n ychwanegol at ein strategaeth 'Delio â Chamdefnyddio Sylweddau yng Nghymru: Y Dull Partneriaeth'

2.30 p.m.

**Mark Isherwood:** In the context of the proposed pilot programme, last year, CAIS Ltd, the voluntary sector drug and alcohol agency, briefed me on its Don't Touch—Tell! drugs education programme for primary schools, which has the support of all six directors of education in north Wales. Perhaps well over 25,000 primary school pupils in north Wales have benefited from this successful programme. Tomorrow, there will be a presentation by CAIS in the Assembly in the hope that the campaign may be rolled out across Wales. Can they be assured of your support?

**The First Minister:** Absolutely. I can be clear on that, provided we do not breach the principle that what you are trying to do is make drugs appear boringly dangerous and not excitingly dangerous to children. Many drug awareness messages have been misplaced in the past, in the 1980s and the 1990s, by making drugs seem interesting while trying to warn children off them. You have to make sure that they are boringly

**Mark Isherwood:** Yng nghyd-destun y rhaglen beilot arfaethedig, y llynedd, bu i CAIS Cyf, asiantaeth cyffuriau ac alcohol y sector gwirfoddol, roi gwybodaeth i mi am ei rhaglen addysg cyffuriau i ysgolion cynradd, Paid Cyffwrdd—Dwed!, sydd wedi derbyn cefnogaeth pob un o chwe chyfarwyddwr addysg gogledd Cymru. Efallai fod dros 25,000 o ddisgyblion ysgolion cynradd yn y gogledd wedi cael budd o'r rhaglen lwyddiannus hon. Yfory, bydd CAIS yn rhoi cyflwyniad yn y Cynulliad yn y gobaith y gellir ymestyn y rhaglen ledled Cymru. A ellir eu sicrhau eich bod yn cefnogi hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn bendant. Gallaf fod yn glir ynghylch hynny, ar yr amod nad ydym yn tramgwyddo'r egwyddor mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ceisio'i wneud yw gwneud i gyffuriau ymddangos yn ddiflas o beryglus yn hytrach nag yn gyffrous o beryglus. Bu llawer o negeseuon ynghylch ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau'n gyfeiliornus yn y gorffennol, yn yr 1980au a'r 1990au, drwy wneud i gyffuriau ymddangos yn ddi-ddorol wrth

dangerous, and that you do not attach some sort of excitement to them, which will make people wish to experiment with them who had not heard of them before you tried out the new drug awareness programme—nothing could be worse than that. Trying to ensure that that is the principle on which you base your drug awareness-raising work in schools is vital.

**Leighton Andrews:** In fact, several successful substance misuse awareness programmes are in operation. Formerly in the Rhondda, we had the drug abuse resistance education scheme, and we now have the scheme that has taken over from that: the substance awareness for everyone project, which is supported by Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council and by South Wales Police. Will you join me in congratulating all those young people who graduated from that project this year, and in thanking headteachers and teachers working with the police and the local authority for all the work put in to make that scheme work on the ground?

**The First Minister:** I will, indeed. I commend everybody who is working in this field. We need feedback as well, because some of these programmes will work really well, while others will have a middling effect, and others will, inevitably, fail, as is always the case. However, we wish to support everybody who is working in this field, and we want to see best practice spread from the schemes that really work. The substance misuse action fund, which covers the funding of all of these programmes, has risen massively from £3 million in 2002-03 to a projected £20 million in 2008-09. That is a 600 per cent increase, and it shows just how seriously we take this issue.

**Leanne Wood:** I offer you congratulations, first of all, on your clear display of anti-deference to the monarch last week. I thoroughly approve.

geisio rhybuddio plant rhagddynt. Rhaid ichi sicrhau eu bod yn ddiflas o beryglus, ac nad ydych yn gwneud iddynt ymddangos yn gyffrous o gwbl, gan y bydd hynny'n peri i bobl fod yn awyddus i arbrofi â hwy, pobl nad oeddent wedi clywed amdanynt cyn i chi roi cynnig ar y rhaglen newydd ar ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau—ni allai dim byd fod yn waeth na hynny. Mae'n hanfodol ceisio sicrhau mai hynny yw'r egwyddor y seilir eich gwaith wrth godi ymwybyddiaeth o gyffuriau mewn ysgolion arni.

**Leighton Andrews:** Mewn gwirionedd, mae sawl rhaglen lwyddiannus ar ymwybyddiaeth o gamddefnyddio sylweddau ar waith. Yn y Rhondda gynt, yr oedd gennym gynllun addysg gwrthsefyll camddefnyddio cyffuriau, a bellach mae gennym gynllun sydd wedi olynu hwnnw: y prosiect ymwybyddiaeth o sylweddau i bawb, a gefnogir gan Gyngor Sir Rhondda Cynon Taf a Heddlu De Cymru. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch yr holl bobl ifanc hynny a gymerodd ran yn y prosiect hwnnw eleni, ac i ddiolch i brifathrawon ac athrawon sy'n cydweithio â'r heddlu a'r awdurdod lleol am yr holl waith a wnaed i sicrhau bod y cynllun yn llwyddiannus ar lawr gwlad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf yn wir. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo pawb sy'n gweithio yn y maes hwn. Mae angen adborth arnom hefyd, oherwydd bydd rhai o'r rhaglenni hyn yn gweithio'n dda iawn, tra bydd effaith eraill yn ganolog, ac eraill, yn anochel, yn methu, fel sy'n digwydd bob amser. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dymuno cefnogi pawb sy'n gweithio yn y maes hwn, ac yr ydym am weld yr arferion gorau'n ymledu o'r cynlluniau sy'n gweithio'n iawn. Mae'r gronfa weithredu ar gamddefnyddio sylweddau, sy'n cyllido'r holl raglenni hyn, wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol iawn o £3 miliwn yn 2002-03 i £20 miliwn, yn ôl yr hyn a ragwelir, yn 2008-09. Mae hynny'n gynnydd o 600 y cant, ac mae'n dangos yn union gymaint o ddifrif yr ydym ynghylch y mater hwn.

**Leanne Wood:** Yr wyf yn eich llongyfarch, yn gyntaf, ar ddangos yn glir iawn eich diffyg parch tuag at y frenhines yr wythnos diwethaf. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo hynny'n fawr.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. This question is not about the monarchy; it is about serious matters.

**Leanne Wood:** Thank you, Presiding Officer.

First Minister, as you just said, your Government recently announced an extra £300 million—sorry, it was £300,000—for a pilot project in substance misuse prevention, but the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is due to conduct a review of substance misuse prevention programmes soon. Do you think that the allocation of these extra funds for this specific programme is a bit premature?

**The First Minister:** No, it is a pilot programme. What we are doing is a lot of trying to reach out to the difficult-to-reach children, the disengaged pupils. That is a pilot programme, so you can do that while you are conducting the review, which is really based on trying to ensure that what we do works, and discovering whether we are spreading best practice quickly from the successful projects to the less successful ones, or to those areas that have no projects. I do not think that there is any contradiction. Although the figure of £300 million that you gave was a bit too high, I am glad that the extra £300,000 that came in late last March will be put to a good purpose.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid cwestiwn am y frenhiniaeth yw hwn; mae'n gwestiwn am faterion difrifol.

**Leanne Wood:** Diolch ichi, Lywydd.

Brif Weinidog, fel yr ydych newydd ddweud, yn ddiweddar bu i'ch Llywodraeth gyhoeddi £300 miliwn ychwanegol—mae'n ddrwg gennyf, £300,000 ydoedd—ar gyfer prosiect peilot ar atal camddefnyddio sylweddau, ond mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar fin cynnal adolygiad o raglenni atal camddefnyddio sylweddau cyn bo hir. Onid ydych yn teimlo ei bod braidd yn gynamserol i ddyrannu'r cyllid ychwanegol hwn i'r rhaglen benodol hon ar hyn o bryd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nac ydwyf, rhaglen beilot ydyw. Yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yw ceisio'n gorau glas gyrraedd at blant sy'n anodd eu cyrraedd, disgyblion sydd wedi ymddieithrio. Rhaglen beilot ydyw, felly gallwch wneud hynny tra ydych yn cynnal yr adolygiad, sy'n seiliedig mewn gwirionedd ar geisio sicrhau bod yr hyn a wneir gennym yn llwyddo, a chanfod a ydym yn lledaenu arferion gorau'n gyflym o'r prosiectau llwyddiannus i'r rhai llai llwyddiannus, neu i'r ardaloedd hynny lle nad oes prosiectau. Ni chredaf fod dim anghysondeb. Er bod y ffigur a roesoch, £300 miliwn, braidd yn uchel, yr wyf yn falch y bydd y £300,000 a dderbyniwyd ddiwedd mis Mawrth diwethaf yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n effeithiol.

### **Nifer y Gofalwyr Maeth yng Nghymru The Number of Foster Carers in Wales**

**Q6 Sandy Mewies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the number of foster carers in Wales? OAQ1681(FM)

**The First Minister:** The latest figures that we have, for the end of March 2005, show that 1,891 are on local authority registers, but that does not include foster carers employed by independent fostering agencies.

**Sandy Mewies:** Flintshire children's services family placement team has put out a call for potential new foster carers to come forward. The team is working hard to improve services

**C6 Sandy Mewies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am nifer y gofalwyr maeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1681(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennym, ar gyfer diwedd Mawrth 2005, yn dangos bod 1,891 ar gofrestrau awdurdodau lleol, ond nid yw hynny'n cynnwys gofalwyr maeth a gyflogir gan asiantaethau maethu annibynnol.

**Sandy Mewies:** Mae tîm lleoliadau teuluol gwasanaethau plant sir y Fflint wedi galw am ddarpar ofalwyr maeth newydd i'w cynnig eu hunain. Mae'r tîm yn gweithio'n galed i

for looked-after children, and its members have taken into account the need to ensure that foster carers feel that they are supported and reassured, as they work to provide stable homes for the children in their care. Flintshire foster carers have set up a support group and a support line, so that foster carers can contact other carers in their area to discuss problems or to have a chat when they need to. Do you agree with me that, as part of caring and working to improve services for looked-after children, we must also ensure that those who care are looked after too?

**The First Minister:** That is a fundamental principle, because, these days, the purpose of fostering is frequently to close down a permanent residential children's home and to have people looked after in a family. However difficult the child, if you are able to find foster carers who are brave enough, well trained enough and well remunerated enough who are willing to do it instead, the outcomes are far better. My wife, Julie, set up the first such scheme in Wales 20 years ago, and I have lived through this quite considerably. The amount of support needed by the families that are willing to take on this work is quite considerable, but it is at the outer end of fostering. These are difficult children; nevertheless, they get a much better chance in life than if they were to stay in children's homes.

**David Lloyd:** I adeiladu ar gwestiwn Sandy Mewies, a allwch olrhain y cynnydd a wnaed wrth ddatblygu llinell gymorth 24 awr ledled Cymru ar gyfer gofalwyr maeth a'u teuluoedd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd, ond felly yr oedd yn gweithio yng ngorllewin Morgannwg 20 mlynedd yn ôl, pan oedd fy ngwraig yn gwneud y gwaith hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, mae angen y gwasanaeth hwnnw, oherwydd y mae plant anodd a gafodd drawma yn eu bywydau cynnar gartref, ac weithiau yn y cartref preswyl hefyd, yn gallu rhedeg i ffwrdd am 2 a.m., a gallant wneud niwed iddynt eu hunain hefyd. Felly, mae angen rhyw fath o linell gymorth sy'n rhedeg o'r

wella gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac mae ei aelodau wedi rhoi sylw i'r angen i ofalwyr maeth deimlo eu bod yn cael eu cefnogi a'u calonogi, wrth iddynt weithio i ddarparu cartrefi sefydlog i blant sydd dan eu gofal. Mae gofalwyr maeth sir y Fflint wedi sefydlu grŵp cymorth a llinell gymorth, fel y gall gofalwyr maeth gysylltu â gofalwyr eraill yn eu hardal i drafod problemau neu i gael sgwrs pan fo angen arnynt. A ydych yn â mi, fel rhan o ofalu a gweithio i wella gwasanaethau i blant sy'n derbyn gofal, fod yn rhaid inni sicrhau hefyd y gofelir am y rhai sy'n gwneud y gwaith gofalu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n egwyddor sylfaenol, oherwydd y dyddiau hyn, diben maethu'n aml iawn yw er mwyn cau cartref preswyl parhaol i blant a sicrhau bod pobl yn cael gofal mewn teulu. Pa mor anodd bynnag yw'r plentyn, os oes modd i chi ddarganfod gofalwyr maeth digon dewr, sydd wedi derbyn digon o hyfforddiant ac yn cael digon o arian, sy'n fodlon gwneud y gwaith yn lle cartref preswyl, mae'r canlyniadau'n well o lawer. Fy ngwraig, Julie, a sefydlodd y cynllun cyntaf o'i fath yng Nghymru 20 mlynedd yn ôl, ac yr wyf wedi byw drwy hyn i raddau helaeth. Mae angen cryn dipyn o gymorth ar y teuluoedd sy'n fodlon ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwn, ond rhywbeth sydd ar gwr y maes ydyw o ran maethu. Mae'r rhain yn blant anodd; fodd bynnag, maent yn cael gwell cyfle mewn bywyd na phe baent yn aros mewn cartrefi plant.

**David Lloyd:** To build on Sandy Mewies's question, what progress has been made in developing a 24-hour helpline across Wales for foster carers and their families?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure how the current situation stands, but that is how it worked in west Glamorgan 20 years ago, when my wife was doing that work. However, that service is needed, because difficult children, who have experienced trauma in their early lives at home, and sometimes at the care home where they lived as well, can run away at 2 a.m., and they can also harm themselves on occasion. So, there needs to be some kind of helpline that connects the family directly to the police, to

teulu i'r heddlu, i'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, yr asiantaethau arbenigol, ac yn y blaen. Mae sefydlu'r rhwydwaith hwnnw a sicrhau ei fod yn gweithio drwy'r amser yn bwysig dros ben er mwyn ei lwyddiant.

**David Melding:** I commend your obvious interest in this matter. Recruiting and retaining foster carers is essential for the best outcome for looked-after children, as you clearly realise. Would you join me in commending the work that has been undertaken in the region that we represent, South Wales Central, led by Rhondda Cynon Taf County Borough Council? Will you take a regional approach to the recruitment of foster carers, so that you can get that sub-advertising done, and also have a base where there are specialist foster carers? A lot of placements break down because the high levels of skills required for particular types of placements are not present, but there is clearly much scope here for regional working with local authorities.

**The First Minister:** The work would originally have been carried out at county level, so that is almost the equivalent of regional level. To be honest, the old county boundaries that existed for the 22 years from 1974 to 1996 were not always terribly meaningful. You would not say that a child in Swansea should not be fostered by a family in Llanelli, because it was in Dyfed, as was; you want to disregard the boundaries and look for the right placement. The key thing is that there is an element of training, but it is mostly about looking for courage, attitude and tender loving care. Skill is imparted through training, but it is mostly about giving people the confidence that they have something to offer the child. It is also important to ensure that people do not think that it is not for the likes of them because they do not have a university degree, or because they are not a doctor or a bank manager. We must ensure that we trawl through all parts of society, because, as long as you have the courage, you can do it, and, as long as you have the back-up, you can do it for years on end and get a lot out of it, given what you can offer the children.

social services, the specialist agencies involved, and so on. The establishment of that network and ensuring that it works at all times is extremely important if it is to succeed.

**David Melding:** Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'ch diddordeb amlwg yn y mater hwn. Mae recriwtio a chadw gofalwyr maeth yn hanfodol er mwyn cael y canlyniad gorau i blant sy'n derbyn gofal, fel yr ydych yn sylweddoli'n amlwg. A fydddech yn ymuno â mi i gymeradwyo'r gwaith a wnaed yn y rhanbarth a gynrychiolir gennym, Canol De Cymru, dan arweiniad Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Rhondda Cynon Taf? A wnewch ymdrin â recriwtio gofalwr maeth yn rhanbarthol, fel y gallwch sicrhau bod yr is-hysbysebu hwnnw'n digwydd, a bod canolfan lle y ceir gofalwyr maeth arbenigol? Mae llawer o leoliadau'n methu oherwydd nad yw'r lefel uchel o sgiliau sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer mathau penodol o leoliadau ar gael, ond mae'n amlwg bod cryn gyfle yn hyn o beth i weithio'n rhanbarthol gydag awdurdodau lleol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddai'r gwaith wedi cael ei wneud yn wreiddiol ar lefel sirol, felly mae hynny'n cyfateb bron i'r lefel ranbarthol. A bod yn onest, nid oedd ffiniau'r hen siroedd a fu mewn bodolaeth am 22 mlynedd rhwng 1974 ac 1996 yn ystyrllon iawn bob amser. Ni fydddech yn dweud na ddylai plentyn yn Abertawe gael ei faethu gan deulu yn Llanelli, am mai yn Nyfed yr oedd y fan honno gynt; mae eisiau ichi anwybyddu'r ffiniau ac edrych am y lleoliad iawn. Y pwynt allweddol yw bod elfen o hyfforddi, ond mae'n ymwneud yn bennaf â chwilio am ddewrder, agwedd bendant a gofal tyner. Enillir sgiliau drwy hyfforddiant, ond mae'n ymwneud yn bennaf â rhoi hyder i bobl fod ganddynt rywbeth i'w gynnig i'r plentyn. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau hefyd nad yw pobl yn meddwl nad yw'n rhywbeth i bobl fel hwy am nad oes ganddynt radd prifysgol, neu am nad ydynt yn feddyg neu'n rheolwr banc. Rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cribinio drwy bob rhan o gymdeithas, oherwydd, cyn belled â bod gennych ddewrder, gallwch ei wneud, a chyn belled â bod gennych gefnogaeth, gallwch ei wneud am flynyddoedd lawer, a chael llawer o fudd ohono, o gofio'r hyn y

gallwch ei gynnig i'r plant.

### Gwasanaethau Ambiwylans Ambulance Services

**Q7 Lisa Francis:** Would the First Minister make a statement on ambulance services in Wales? OAQ1679(FM)

**C7 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru? OAQ1679(FM)

**The First Minister:** The latest statistics show that, for the quarter ending 31 March 2006, more than eight out of 10 responses to all emergency calls in Wales arrived within the target times, rising to 97 per cent in relation to category A, immediately life-threatening, calls.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r ystadegau diweddaraf yn dangos, ar gyfer y chwarter yn diweddu 31 Mawrth 2006, fod mwy nag wyth allan o 10 ymateb i alwadau brys yng Nghymru wedi cyrraedd o fewn yr amseroedd targed, gan godi i 97 y cant mewn perthynas â chategori A, galwadau i sefyllfaedd sy'n peryglu bywyd ar unwaith.

**Lisa Francis:** Following last week's reports, referring to the figure of 500 patients in Wales who are dying each year because of failures in the Welsh ambulance service, the Minister for Health and Social Services said that the figures were cause for concern. Why is your Government so reluctant to hold a public inquiry into the service, which is reputedly in need of a £35 million cash injection to make it safe and to restore public confidence in it? The Minister for Health and Social Services said last week that it was an embarrassing and difficult situation, and that things were not looking good. If Mr Thayne, a man with a reputation for troubleshooting and turning difficult situations around, does not feel prepared to offer a commitment of two to three years to such a project and to the challenges that lie ahead, why has your Government decided that a public inquiry into this service is so unnecessary?

**Lisa Francis:** Yn dilyn yr adroddiadau yr wythnos diwethaf, yn cyfeirio at ffigur o 500 o gleifion yng Nghymru sy'n marw bob blwyddyn oherwydd methiannau'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol fod y ffigurau'n peri pryder. Pam y mae eich Llywodraeth mor amharod i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r gwasanaeth, sydd, yn ôl y sôn, angen £35 miliwn o arian i'w wneud yn ddiogel ac i adfer hyder y cyhoedd ynddo? Dywedodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf ei bod yn sefyllfa anodd sy'n codi cywilydd, ac nad oedd pethau'n edrych yn dda o gwbl. Os nad yw Mr Thayne, dyn sydd ag enw am ddatrys problemau a gweddnewid sefyllfaedd anodd, yn teimlo'n barod i gynnig ymrwymiad am ddwy neu dair blynedd i brosiect o'r fath a'r sialensiau sydd i ddod, paham mae eich Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu bod ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r gwasanaeth hwn mor ddiangen?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** It is because we do not think that it would compare at all, in terms of improved services, with simply taking the practical steps that are needed. Those steps are to solve the question of why the vehicles were ordered and whether they can be made fit for purpose now, and to solve the problem of having a permanent chief executive, and we are getting on with that. Does it make it easier to appoint a permanent chief executive with a public inquiry going on? I do not think

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y rheswm yw oherwydd nad ydym yn credu y byddai'n cymharu o gwbl, o ran gwella gwasanaethau, â chymryd y camau ymarferol sydd eu hangen, yn syml iawn. Y camau hynny yw datrys y cwestiwn pam yr archebwyd y cerbydau, ac a oes modd eu gwneud yn addas i'w diben yn awr, a datrys y broblem o gael prif weithredwr parhaol, ac yr ydym yn bwrw ymlaen â hynny. A yw'n ei gwneud yn haws penodi prif weithredwr parhaol pan fo ymchwiliad

so, and I do not think that that is what opposition parties have in mind. They want to keep this story running in the papers for as long as possible, thinking that it might help them in next year's elections. If we thought anything other and that this was a constructive move, we would look at it seriously, but we can see the purpose of this standing out a mile, and I think that everybody in the ambulance service can see it too.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is not often that I am disappointed in you, First Minister, because my expectations are quite low, but I really am disappointed by what you have just said. The whole purpose of having a public inquiry would be to take this matter out of the party-political arena. If we want to keep it party political, we can give your Minister hell in committee fortnight after fortnight. You should be ashamed of yourself for that but, more importantly, you should be ashamed of yourself for accusing Roger Thayne of flag waving.

In private correspondence from him to me, which thanks me for calling for a public inquiry, Roger Thayne says that the current state of the ambulance service cannot be allowed to continue unless the effect on lives is ignored. He does not consider that the current management of the trust appreciates the seriousness of the position or that it has the capability to lead the improvements required. I ask you to apologise to Roger Thayne for what you have said today about flag waving. You may not agree with all his statistics, but his concern is genuine. He goes on to say that he has resigned at considerable cost to himself. Apologise for what you have said.

**The First Minister:** I do not know why he resigned, to be honest. The official line that we have been given is that he did not wish to continue commuting from Staffordshire to Mold, and that he wished to spend more time with his family. Everybody will draw their own conclusions about that. I take it at face value, so I have nothing to apologise for. I believe him; you may not.

cyhoeddus yn mynd rhagddo? Nid wyf yn credu, ac ni chredaf mai hynny sydd gan y gwrthbleidiau dan sylw. Maent am gadw'r stori hon i rygnu ymlaen yn y papurau newydd cyhyd â phosibl, gan feddwl y gallai fod o gymorth iddynt yn etholiadau'r flwyddyn nesaf. Pe credem fod hyn yn unrhyw beth arall, a bod hyn yn gam adeiladol, byddem yn edrych o ddifrif arno, ond gallwn weld yn blaen beth yw diben hyn, a chredaf fod pawb yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn ei weld hefyd.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Nid yn aml y byddaf yn cael fy siomi gennyh, Brif Weinidog, oherwydd y mae fy nisgwyliadau'n eithaf isel, ond yr wyf wedi fy siomi'n fawr gan yr hyn yr ydych newydd ei ddweud. Holl bwrpas cynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus fyddai mynd â'r mater hwn o faes y pleidiau gwleidyddol. Os ydym am ei gadw fel mater gwleidyddol i'r pleidiau, gallwn chwarae'r diawl â'ch Gweinidog yn y pwyllgor bob pythefnos yn ddi-ben-draw. Dylai fod arnoch gywilydd o hynny, ond yn bwysicach, dylai fod cywilydd arnoch am gyhuddo Roger Thayne o chwifio baneri.

Mewn gohebiaeth breifat ataf, sy'n diolch imi am alw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, dywed Roger Thayne na ellir caniatáu i gyflwr presennol y gwasanaeth ambiwlans barhau, onid anwybyddir yr effaith ar fywydau. Nid yw o'r farn bod rheolwyr presennol yr ymddiriedolaeth yn sylweddoli difrifoldeb y sefyllfa na chwaith fod ganddynt y gallu i arwain y gwelliannau angenrheidiol. Gofynnaf ichi ymddiheuro i Roger Thayne am yr hyn a ddywedasoch heddiw ynghylch chwifio baneri. Efallai nad ydych yn cytuno â'i holl ystadegau, ond mae ei bryder yn un gwirioneddol. Aiff ymlaen i ddweud ei fod wedi ymddiswyddo ar gost sylweddol iddo'i hun. Ymddiheurwch am yr hyn a ddywedasoch.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn gwybod pam y bu iddo ymddiswyddo, a bod yn onest. Yr hyn a ddywedwyd wrthym yn swyddogol yw nad oedd yn dymuno parhau i gymudo o swydd Stafford i'r Wyddgrug, a'i fod yn dymuno treulio mwy o amser gyda'i deulu. Bydd pawb yn dod i'w casgliadau eu hunain ynghylch hynny. Fe'i cymeraf fel y mae, felly nid oes gennyf ddim byd i ymddiheuro



amdano. Yr wyf yn ei gredu; efallai nad ydych chi.

As regards his figure of 500 patients, I do not know where that figure was plucked from, and I have not seen any evidence to support it. As regards his view of management after he left, it is up to him to make that comment stick, if you like. It is a damning comment about the people that he found working there. Mr Van Dellen is happy to continue, even though he came with Mr Thayne. We hope to appoint a permanent chief executive soon and we think that it is far better to do that in an atmosphere where you can get on with the job of improving the service rather than be producing briefings for public inquiries, which is an immense diversion of management time. However, we have to look at what went wrong in the purchase of the Renault conversion vehicles, and that is being done through the district audit service. There is no problem about wanting to get to the truth on that.

In terms of trying to encourage the management and the trade unions, as Brian has been doing, we have found no problems with trying to get them fully engaged in a co-operative exercise to improve the service.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** What Mr Thayne actually said was that he resigned because he could not stay as he felt ashamed and did not want to be held accountable for a service that was failing so badly. I will ask you a question for which there is a clear 'yes' or 'no' answer, and we will see how we get on with it. Mr Thayne said,

'despite the poor clinical performance and the poor response performance in my report, it was decided that what was more important was this financial deficit and therefore we should devise a financial recovery plan'.

Is there truth in that statement, First Minister?

**The First Minister:** Without having been present and seeing the correspondence, I cannot answer 'yes' or 'no' to a question of

Ynghylch ei ffigur o 500 o gleifion, nid wyf yn gwybod o ble y cafwyd y ffigur hwnnw, ac nid wyf wedi gweld dim tystiolaeth i'w gefnogi. O ran ei farn am reolwyr wedi iddo adael, mater iddo ef yw profi'r sylw hwnnw, os mynnwch. Mae'n sylw damniol am y bobl a oedd yn gweithio yno. Mae Mr Van Dellen yn fodlon dal ati, er iddo ddod gyda Mr Thayne. Gobeithiwn benodi prif weithredwr parhaol cyn bo hir, a chredwn mai gwell o lawer yw gwneud hynny mewn awyrgylch lle y gallwch fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o wella'r gwasanaeth yn hytrach na chynhyrchu briffiau ar gyfer ymchwiliadau cyhoeddus, sy'n cymryd llawer iawn o amser rheolwyr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn a aeth o'i le wrth brynu'r cerbydau Renault wedi'u haddasu, ac mae hynny'n cael ei wneud drwy'r gwasanaeth archwilio dosbarth. Nid oes dim problem ynghylch bod arnom eisiau cael y gwir am hynny.

O ran ceisio annog y rheolwyr a'r undebau llafur, fel y mae Brian wedi bod yn gwneud, nid ydym wedi cael dim problemau wrth geisio cael ganddynt gyfrannu'n llawn i ymarferiad cydweithredol i wella'r gwasanaeth.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Yr hyn a ddywedodd Mr Thayne mewn gwirionedd oedd ei fod wedi ymddiswyddo am na allai aros oherwydd bod arno gywilydd ac nad oedd am gael ei ddal yn gyfrifol am wasanaeth a oedd yn methu mor ofnadwy. Fe ofynnaf gwestiwn ichi, sy'n gofyn am ateb clir 'oes' neu 'nac oes', a chawn weld sut hwyl a gawn arni. Dywedodd Mr Thayne,

er gwaethaf y perfformiad clinigol gwael a'r perfformiad gwael o ran ymateb yn fy adroddiad, penderfynwyd bod y diffyg ariannol hwn yn bwysicach ac felly y dylem lunio cynllun adfer ariannol.

A oes gwirionedd yn y datganiad hwnnw, Brif Weinidog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Heb imi fod yn bresennol a gweld yr ohebiaeth, ni allaf ateb 'oes' neu 'nac oes' i gwestiwn mor gymhleth. Yr hyn

that complexity. What is important is that we recognise that he is no longer part of the sports. He has decided to leave. Whatever the reasons are, it is Mr Van Dellen who is now the interim chief executive, and a permanent chief executive will be appointed in August. He has no management responsibility now. He has decided that he does not want to be involved. He was not the full chief executive; he was the interim chief executive, and he decided that he wished to cease to be the interim chief executive. That is up to him, but he is not responsible now. Therefore, the questions have to be directed to Mr Van Dellen, and not to Mr Thayne.

**Michael German:** I am trying to address the question to you, First Minister, since this is a statement by Mr Thayne, whose views are relevant to the future of our ambulance service in Wales and which have caused great alarm and concern, not just in the Chamber but around Wales. They will certainly strike a chord with the ambulance crews that I have talked to. It was a simple and straightforward question, not a convoluted or complicated one: was Roger Thayne asked to come up with a financial recovery plan rather than the clinical performance recovery plan that he wanted to do?

**The First Minister:** I have not seen the correspondence, but I ask you to cease obsessing about the comments of a person who is no longer interim chief executive and was only in the position for two months. You may find great political capital in referring backwards, but we are trying to go forwards. We have another interim chief executive who has carried on and taken on the duties of Mr Thayne. He came with Mr Thayne from Staffordshire and has now taken on his duties. It is Mr Van Dellen's views that are important now, unless all you are interested in is trawling through the papers and seeing whether you can create another headline. That does not help the servants or employees of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust. Furthermore, you referred to ambulance crews; we have found a very good level of co-operation between management and unions in trying to move the ambulance trust service forward.

sy'n bwysig yw ein bod yn cydnabod nad yw ef mwyach yn rhan o'r sefyllfa. Mae wedi penderfynu gadael. Beth bynnag fo'r rhesymau, Mr Van Dellen yw'r prif weithredwr dros dro ar hyn o bryd, a phenodir prif weithredwr parhaol ym mis Awst. Nid oes ganddo ef ddim cyfrifoldeb rheolaethol yn awr. Mae wedi penderfynu nad yw am fod yn gysylltiedig. Nid y prif weithredwr parhaol ydoedd, ond prif weithredwr dros dro, a phenderfynodd ei fod am roi'r gorau i fod yn brif weithredwr dros dro. Mater iddo ef yw hynny, ond nid ef sy'n gyfrifol bellach. Felly, rhaid cyfeirio'r cwestiynau at Mr Van Dellen, ac nid at Mr Thayne.

**Michael German:** Yr wyf yn ceisio cyfeirio'r cwestiwn atoch chi, Brif Weinidog, gan mai datganiad gan Mr Thayne yw hwn, a bod ei farn yn berthnasol i ddyfodol ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru ac wedi achosi cryn ddychryn a phryder, nid yn y Siambr yn unig, ond ledled Cymru. Bydd yn sicr yn taro tant gyda'r criwiau ambiwlans yr wyf wedi siarad â hwy. Cwestiwn syml ydoedd, ac nid un astrus na chymhleth: a ofynnwyd i Roger Thayne ddyfeisio cynllun adfer ariannol yn hytrach na'r cynllun adfer perfformiad clinigol yr oedd yn dymuno ei wneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf wedi gweld yr ohebiaeth, ond gofynnaf ichi roi'r gorau i'ch obsesiwn ynghylch sylwadau rhywun nad yw bellach yn brif weithredwr dros dro ac na fu yn y swydd honno ond am ddau fis. Efallai eich bod yn cael mantais wleidyddol fawr wrth gyfeirio'n ôl, ond yr ydym ni'n ceisio mynd ymlaen. Mae gennym brif weithredwr dros dro arall sydd wedi dal ati ac wedi ymgymryd â dyletswyddau Mr Thayne. Daeth gyda Mr Thayne o swydd Stafford ac mae bellach wedi ymgymryd â'i ddyletswyddau. Barn Mr Van Dellen sydd yn bwysig yn awr, oni bai mai'ch unig ddiddordeb yw pori yn y papurau a gweld a allwch greu pennawd arall. Nid yw hynny o gymorth i weision neu weithwyr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru. Yn ogystal â hynny, cyfeiriasoch at griwiau ambiwlans; cawsom fod cydweithredu da iawn rhwng y rheolwyr a'r undebau wrth geisio symud gwasanaeth yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn ei flaen.

**Michael German:** The question is this: did your Government instruct the previous acting chief executive to conduct a financial recovery plan rather than the patient recovery plan that he asked for? That is a relevant question, because if that is the case and you made such a request, as he has said, then clearly you are asking the same of the new chief executive, unless you have changed your position and said, 'Right, he's gone and we told him to do one thing, but we will change it for the next chief executive'. It is a clear matter of public interest as to whether or not we expect the new chief executive, for the future of our ambulance service, to come up with a patient recovery plan or, as the previous chief executive said, to come up with a recovery plan that only deals with the financial deficit.

**The First Minister:** I am glad that we have now moved on from Mr Thayne's views to those of Mr Van Dellen, because Mr Van Dellen's views are far more important. As far as I am aware, these things are not necessarily a question of 'either or'. Everyone accepts that much of the work carried out by ambulance crews in Wales is not directed with 100 per cent efficiency, and that it is not the last word in how we deliver emergency care. Can paramedics, for example, treat more patients at home or do they always have to take them to accident and emergency? We must consider those issues and the new management is keen to look at them. That approach may be cheaper and much better for the patient, and that would involve both a patient recovery and a financial recovery plan. So, your suggestion that it is a matter of 'either or' is false.

**Michael German:** Y cwestiwn yw hyn: a roddodd eich Llywodraeth gyfarwyddyd i'r prif weithredwr dros dro blaenorol i wneud cynllun adfer ariannol yn hytrach na'r cynllun adfer cleifion y gofynnodd amdano? Mae'r cwestiwn hwnnw'n un perthnasol oherwydd, os felly y bu ac os gwnaethoch gais o'r fath, fel y dywedodd, yna mae'n amlwg eich bod yn gofyn am yr un peth gan y prif weithredwr newydd, oni bai eich bod wedi newid eich safbwynt ac wedi dweud, 'O'r gorau, mae wedi mynd a rhoesom gyfarwyddyd iddo wneud un peth, ond newidiwn hynny ar gyfer y prif weithredwr nesaf'. Mae'n amlwg yn fater sydd o ddiddordeb cyhoeddus a ydym yn disgwyl i'r prif weithredwr newydd ddyfeisio cynllun adfer ar gyfer cleifion er mwyn dyfodol ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans neu, fel y dywedodd y prif weithredwr blaenorol, ddyfeisio cynllun adfer nad yw ond yn ymwneud â'r diffyg ariannol.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi symud ymlaen yn awr oddi wrth farn Mr Thayne at farn Mr Van Dellen, gan fod barn Mr Van Dellen yn bwysicach o lawer. Hyd y gwn, nid yw'r pethau hyn yn fater o ddewis rhwng y naill beth neu'r llall. Mae pawb yn derbyn nad yw llawer o'r gwaith a wneir gan griwiau ambiwlans yng Nghymru yn cael ei gyfarwyddo'n gwbl effeithlon, ac nad yw'n berffaith o ran y modd yr ydym yn darparu gofal brys. A fyddai modd, er enghraifft, i bameddygon drin mwy o gleifion gartref neu a oes raid iddynt fynd â hwy i uned damweiniau ac achosion brys bob tro? Rhaid inni ystyried y materion hynny ac mae'r rheolwyr newydd yn awyddus i edrych arnynt. Gallai dull gweithredu o'r fath fod yn rhatach ac yn well o lawer i'r claf, a byddai hynny'n ymwneud â chynllun adfer cleifion a chynllun adfer ariannol. Felly, mae eich awgrym bod hyn yn fater o ddewis rhwng y naill beth neu'r llall yn anghywir.

### **Gostwng Amseroedd aros y GIG NHS Waiting Time Reductions**

**Q8 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on NHS waiting-time reductions? OAQ1674(FM)

**C8 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ostwng amseroedd aros y GIG? OAQ1674(FM)

**The First Minister:** We have achieved a

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi cyflawni

great deal over the past two years, but we have a much further distance to go. No-one is waiting more than 12 months for in-patient/day-case treatment and 78 per cent of patients are waiting less than six months. Out-patient waits of over 12 months have fallen from 13,700 to 30, with 80 per cent of patients waiting less than six months.

**Peter Black:** Given the deficits in several trusts and the measures being taken to deal with those, specifically in Swansea in part of the area which I represent, where Fairwood hospital and ward 1 at Hill House is being closed, possibly leading to further bedblocking, do you believe that any progress that you have made will continue? How are you liaising with those trusts, which are making cuts in services that could lead to further bed-blocking and further waiting-time increases, to try to prevent that from happening?

**The First Minister:** Having had one of my close relatives in Hill House for some considerable time, I understand your point about the risk of additional bedblocking, but, on the other hand, I think that by the way we have financially structured the second offer scheme, that money is relatively isolated from the rest of the health service budgets that the local health boards have to commission and that the trusts have to spend. It is clear that the success that we have achieved so far in reaching the interim stage of a 12-month wait, which is to be replaced by an eight-month wait on 31 March 2007, has not been achieved at the cost of making those who have waited a short time wait longer, because the percentage of those waiting six months or less is far higher than it used to be.

**Owen John Thomas:** In the NHS Wales Barometer 2006, managers are sceptical about achieving several of the targets set out by the Assembly Government in its 'Designed for Life' health plan and many trusts are struggling to reduce financial deficits and, consequently, wards are being closed and some trusts have imposed a freeze on recruitment. When the opinions of health

llawer iawn dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, ond mae gennym lawer eto i'w wneud. Nid oes neb yn aros yn hwy na 12 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol neu achos dydd ac mae 78 y cant o gleifion yn aros llai na chwe mis. Mae nifer y cleifion allanol sy'n aros am fwy na 12 mis wedi gostwng o 13,700 i 30, ac mae 80 y cant o gleifion yn aros llai na chwe mis.

**Peter Black:** O ystyried y diffygion mewn sawl ymddiriedolaeth a'r camau a gymerir i ddelio â hynny, yn enwedig yn Abertawe mewn rhan o'r ardal yr wyf yn ei chynrychioli, lle y mae ysbyty Mynydd Llwynteg a ward 1 yn ysbyty Hill House yn cael eu cau, gan arwain o bosibl at ragor o flocio gwelyau, a ydych yn credu y bydd unrhyw gynnydd a wnaethoch yn parhau? Sut yr ydych yn cysylltu â'r ymddiriedolaethau hynny, sydd yn torri gwasanaethau mewn modd a allai arwain at ragor o flocio gwelyau a chynnydd pellach mewn amseroedd aros, i geisio sicrhau na fydd hynny'n digwydd?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gan fod un o'm perthnasau agos wedi bod yn ysbyty Hill House am gryn amser, yr wyf yn deall y pwynt a wnaethoch am y perygl o ragor o flocio gwelyau, ond, ar y llaw arall, yr wyf yn credu, oherwydd y trefniadau ariannol yr ydym wedi eu gwneud ar gyfer cynllun yr ail gynnydd, fod yr arian wedi'i gadw ar wahân i ryw raddau oddi wrth weddill cyllidebau'r gwasanaeth iechyd sydd gan y byrddau iechyd lleol ar gyfer comisiynu ac sydd gan yr ymddiriedolaethau i'w gwario. Mae'n amlwg nad yw'r llwyddiant a gawsom hyd yn hyn o ran cyrraedd y cam interim o aros am 12 mis, a ddisodlir gan aros am wyth mis ar 31 Mawrth 2007, wedi'i sicrhau ar draul peri i'r rhai sydd wedi bod yn aros am gyfnod byr aros yn hwy, gan fod canran y rhai sydd yn aros am chwe mis neu lai'n uwch o lawer nag yr arferai fod.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yn yr NHS Wales Barometer 2006, mae rheolwyr yn amheus ynghylch y gallu i gyrraedd nifer o'r targedau sydd wedi'u nodi gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei chynllun iechyd 'Cynllun Oes' ac mae llawer o ymddiriedolaethau'n ei chael yn anodd lleihau diffygion ariannol ac, o ganlyniad, mae wardiau'n cael eu cau ac mae rhai ymddiriedolaethau wedi rhewi eu

professionals contrast so greatly with Government rhetoric, is it not time for you to start listening and to admit that your Government has got it wrong?

2.50 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I am sorry to have to tell you again, Owen John Thomas, that the figures that I published are the actual figures, and that there are improvements on a massive scale. Almost no-one is waiting more than 12 months, apart from those 30 people waiting for out-patient consultations in English trusts. That has been achieved. That is a huge achievement for the Welsh NHS, and we have to pat it on the back for that. However, there is a long way to go. It is a tough challenge to get waits down from 12 months to eight months, let alone when we start including the diagnostic and therapy waits, where some of the waiting lists are very long and very large.

**Jonathan Morgan:** First Minister, the Government has set a target for access times for 2009. In doing so, you have provided money to the NHS trusts to help them to meet that target. Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust believes that it is £12.9 million short of what it needs to implement its local delivery plans in order to meet the target that your Government has set. Do you accept that there is a huge disparity in Wales between what your Government is willing to offer the trusts to help them to meet these obligations and what is required by them to do the job properly? Do you accept that, unless Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust gets the money that it needs to do the job, not only will it miss the target for 2009, but there will be great slippage in meeting the existing 12-month target?

**The First Minister:** It is not uncommon to have this kind of argument at this stage of the year, Jonathan. We eventually negotiate and meet somewhere in the middle—especially when a body is commissioning a new service—between what it says is the cost of

proses recriwtio. Gan fod barn gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol mor wahanol i rethreg y Llywodraeth, onid yw'n bryd ichi ddechrau gwranddo a chyfaddef bod eich Llywodraeth wedi methu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf orfod dweud wrthy ch eto, Owen John Thomas, mai'r ffigurau a gyhoeddais yw'r ffigurau gwirioneddol, a bod gwelliannau aruthrol wedi bod. Nid oes neb bron yn aros yn hwy na 12 mis, heblaw'r 30 hynny sydd yn aros am ymgynghoriadau fel cleifion allanol mewn ymddiriedolaethau yn Lloegr. Mae hynny wedi cael ei gyflawni. Mae hynny'n gamp aruthrol ar ran GIG Cymru, a rhaid inni ei longyfarch ar hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer i'w wneud eto. Her anodd yw gostwng hyd arosiadau o 12 mis i wyth mis, heb sôn am yr adeg pan fyddwn yn dechrau cynnwys yr arosiadau am ddiagnosis a therapïau, lle y mae rhai o'r rhestrau aros yn hir iawn ac yn fawr iawn.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Brif Weinidog, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi gosod targed ar gyfer amseroedd mynediad erbyn 2009. Wrth wneud hynny, yr ydych wedi darparu arian i'r ymddiriedolaethau GIG i'w helpu i gyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn credu ei bod £12.9 miliwn yn brin o'r hyn y mae arni ei hangen i weithredu ei chynlluniau cyflawni lleol er mwyn cyrraedd y targed y mae eich Llywodraeth wedi'i osod. A ydych yn derbyn bod bwlch mawr yng Nghymru rhwng yr hyn y mae eich Llywodraeth yn barod i'w gynnig i'r ymddiriedolaethau i'w helpu i gyflawni'r ymrwymadau hynny a'r hyn y mae arnynt ei angen i wneud y gwaith yn iawn? A ydych yn derbyn, os na chaiff Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yr arian y mae arni ei angen i wneud y gwaith, y bydd yn methu â chyrraedd y targed ar gyfer 2009, ac y bydd llithriant mawr hefyd wrth gyrraedd y targed presennol o 12 mis?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yw'n anarferol cael dadl o'r math hwn ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, Jonathan. Yn y diwedd, byddwn yn negodi ac yn cwrdd rywle yn y canol—yn enwedig os yw corff yn comisiynu gwasanaeth newydd—rhwng cost rhedeg y

running that new service and what we think that it can be done for. We are gradually inching towards each other at this stage in terms of the Cardiff and Vale orthopaedic centre development, as I explained earlier, and I hope that we will achieve success before too long, with a bit of give on both sides.

gwasanaeth newydd hwnnw yn ôl y corff a'r hyn sydd ei angen yn ein barn ni. Yr ydym yn nesáu'n raddol at ein gilydd ar hyn o bryd mewn cysylltiad â datblygiad canolfan orthopedig Caerdydd a'r Fro, fel yr esboniais yn gynharach, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio y llwyddwn cyn hir, gydag ychydig o gyfaddawdu ar y ddwy ochr.

### **Gwella'r Economi Wledig Improving the Rural Economy**

**Q9 Mick Bates:** What steps is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to improve the rural economy? OAQ1676(FM)

**C9 Mick Bates:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i wella'r economi wledig? OAQ1676(FM)

**The First Minister:** Over the year to September 2005—these are the latest figures that we have—there were 439,000 people in employment in the nine rural local authorities of Wales, which is a 7 per cent increase since 2001, compared with a 2.5 per cent increase in the UK as a whole.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dros y flwyddyn hyd at Fedi 2005—y rhain yw'r ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennym—yr oedd 439,000 o bobl mewn gwaith yn naw awdurdod lleol gwledig Cymru, sef cynnydd o 7 y cant ers 2001, o'i gymharu â chynnydd o 2.5 y cant yn y DU gyfan.

**Mick Bates:** Like most people, we welcome those figures. However, last week in the Chamber, your Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside, commenting on farming, said:

**Mick Bates:** Fel y rhan fwyaf o bobl, yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffigurau hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr wythnos diwethaf yn y Siambr, dywedodd eich Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, wrth sôn am ffermio:

'we are talking about an industry that is about as close to socialism as you can get, in many ways, because it is an economy that is subsidised, and needs state aid in order to survive.... The farmers of Wales should be grateful that there is a socialist aspect to farming policy.'

'yr ydym yn siarad am ddiwydiant sydd cyn agosed at sosialaeth ag y gallwch fod, mewn llawer ffordd, oherwydd y mae'n economi sy'n cael cymhorthdal, ac sydd angen cymorth gwladol i oroesi... Dylai ffermwyr Cymru fod yn ddiolchgar fod agwedd sosialaidd i bolisi ffermio.'

If this really is the case, First Minister, and your Government believes that there is a socialist aspect to farming, why are you threatening the very existence of Welsh hill-farmers by cutting or even scrapping the vital Tir Mynydd payments?

Os mai felly y mae mewn gwirionedd, Brif Weinidog, ac os yw eich Llywodraeth yn credu bod agwedd sosialaidd ynglŷn â ffermio, pam yr ydych yn bygwth bodolaeth ffermwyr mynydd Cymru drwy gwtogi neu hyd yn oed cael gwared ar y taliadau Tir Mynydd hollbwysig?

**The First Minister:** I will not comment on the philosophical aspect, because I am not sure that it is of real interest to anyone, although it is interesting knock-about stuff across the floor. However, as we have made a major shift, as has the rest of Europe, from production subsidies to environmental subsidies and single payments, there have

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chyflwynaf sylwadau am yr agwedd athronyddol, gan nad wyf yn sicr a yw hynny o wir ddiddordeb i neb, er ei fod yn bwnc digon difyr mewn ymrafael geiriol rhwng y ddwy ochr. Fodd bynnag, gan ein bod wedi gwneud newid mawr, fel y mae gweddill Ewrop wedi gwneud, gan droi oddi wrth gymorthdaliadau ar gyfer cynhyrchu at

been some big changes for people to get used to. It is important that we realise that we have to diversify the economy, and there is no point in trying to pretend that we could ever go back to production subsidies. The single payment scheme, with a strong environmental and access-related component and assistance for diversification to tourism and forestry and other new industries on farm, is the right way forward.

**Elin Jones:** Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno bod y diwydiant defaid yn bwysig iawn yng nghefn gwlad. Mae defaid yn crwydro—mae hi yn eu natur i wneud hynny. A gredwch y dylid rhoi dirwy sefydlog ar bob un ddafad yng Nghymru sy'n crwydro? Dyna mae'r Blaid Lafur yn ei ddweud mewn taflenni ym Mlaenau Gwent ar hyn o bryd. Ai dyma fyddwch yn ei ddweud wrth etholwyr y canolbarth a'r gorllewin y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fedraf fod yn siŵr am y maniffesto, oherwydd ni fyddaf yn ei ysgrifennu mewn ffordd sydd yn siwtio Plaid Cymru. Clywais yr un cwyn gan bobl Tredegar neithiwr. Nid wyf yn siŵr fy mod yn gallu ailadrodd y frawddeg gyfan yn y ffordd a roddwyd i fi gan bensiynwyr sy'n byw ar un o ystadau cyngor Tredegar, ond yr oeddent yn cwyno ynglŷn â defaid yn dod i lawr i'r ystâd ac yn gadael eu marc ar lawntiau'r tai. Mae'n broblem ond ni welaf beth yn union yw'r ateb heddiw. Nid wyf yn barod i ysgrifennu ein maniffesto tan ychydig fisoedd cyn yr etholiad.

**Glyn Davies:** Probably the most important development to improve the rural economy of mid Wales is the proposed A458 road improvement between Welshpool and the English border. Over the last two years, we have heard your Minister for transport make statements about which of the preferred routes that the road will take. However, we now discover that he has not secured any agreement from the Highways Agency in England to fund the £5 million of the scheme that is to take place in England. Can you give us some idea of when this cross-border issue will even be discussed by your Minister; and

gymorthdaliadau amgylcheddol a thaliadau sengl, cafwyd rhai newidiadau mawr y bydd yn rhaid i bobl ddod i arfer â hwy. Mae'n bwysig inni sylweddoli bod rhaid inni arallgyfeirio'r economi, ac nid oes diben cymryd arnom y gallem fynd yn ôl rywbryd at gymorthdaliadau ar gyfer cynhyrchu. Cynllun y taliad sengl, gydag elfen gref yn ymwneud â'r amgylchedd a mynediad a chymorth ar gyfer arallgyfeirio i feysydd twristiaeth a choedwigaeth a diwydiannau newydd eraill ar ffermydd, yw'r llwybr y dylid ei ddilyn.

**Elin Jones:** First Minister, I am sure that you agree that the sheep industry is very important in rural Wales. Sheep stray—it is in their nature to do so. Do you believe that fixed penalty fines should be given to each sheep in Wales that strays? That is what the Labour Party is saying in leaflets in Blaenau Gwent at the moment. Is this what you will say to constituents in mid and west Wales next year?

**The First Minister:** I cannot be sure about the manifesto, because I will not be writing it in a way that suits Plaid Cymru. I heard the same complaint from people in Tredegar last night. I am not sure that I can repeat the entire sentence in the way that it was given to me by pensioners living on one of Tredegar's council estates, but they were complaining about sheep coming down onto the estate and leaving their calling card on the front lawns. It is a problem but I do not know exactly what the answer is today. I am not willing to write our manifesto until a few months before the election.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae'n debyg mai'r datblygiad pwysicaf i wella economi wledig y canolbarth yw'r gwelliant arfaethedig i ffordd yr A458 rhwng y Trallwng a'r ffin â Lloegr. Dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, clywsom eich Gweinidog dros drafnidiaeth yn gwneud datganiadau ynghylch pa un o'r llwybrau sy'n cael eu ffafrio ar gyfer y ffordd honno a ddewisir. Fodd bynnag, cawsom wybod bellach nad yw wedi sicrhau cytundeb gan yr Asiantaeth Briffyrdd yn Lloegr i ariannu'r £5 miliwn ar gyfer y cynllun sydd i'w roi ar waith yn Lloegr. A allwch roi rhyw syniad i ni ynghylch pa bryd y caiff y mater

do you agree that we are entitled to an apology for being so misinformed by your Minister over the last two years?

**The First Minister:** That is a little harsh. Our co-operation with the authorities over the border has been good, especially in the Flintshire and Cheshire area. I see no reason why, after any initial hiccups, as has been the case in Flintshire and Cheshire, we cannot come to an agreement on cross-border routes around the A458 from Welshpool towards Telford, Shrewsbury and so forth. I will ask Andrew Davies to address the particular issues, but I think that your language is somewhat over the top.

trawsffiniol hwn ei drafod hyd yn oed gan eich Gweinidog; ac a ydych yn cytuno ein bod yn haeddu ymddiheuriad am gael ein camarwain i'r fath raddau gan eich Gweinidog dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny braidd yn gas. Bu'r cydweithredu rhyngom a'r awdurdodau y tu draw i'r ffin yn dda, yn enwedig yn ardal sir y Fflint a swydd Gaer. Ni welaf ddim rheswm, ar ôl mân drafferthion ar y dechrau, fel sydd wedi digwydd yn sir y Fflint a swydd Gaer, pam na allwn ddod i gytundeb ar lwybrau trawsffiniol o gwmpas yr A458 o'r Trallwng tua Telford, Amwythig ac yn y blaen. Gofynnaf i Andrew Davies roi sylw i'r materion penodol, ond yr wyf yn credu bod eich geiriau'n mynd dros ben llestri braidd.

### Lefelau GYC GVA Levels

**Q10 Janet Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on GVA levels in Wales?  
OAQ1656(FM)

**C10 Janet Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lefelau GYC yng Nghymru?  
OAQ1656(FM)

**The First Minister:** Gross value added in Wales in 2004, the last year for which we have full figures, was £39.2 billion, up from some £29 billion, as I remember, when the Conservatives were last in charge. My statisticians tell me that, almost for a certainty—we will not have the actual figures for a couple of months—in 2005 we will have surpassed the £40 billion level for the first time.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yng Nghymru yn 2004, sef y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ffigurau llawn ar ei chyfer, oedd £39.2 biliwn, ac yr oedd wedi codi o tua £29 biliwn, os wyf yn cofio'n iawn, pan fu'r Ceidwadwyr mewn grym ddiwethaf. Mae fy ystadegwyr yn dweud wrthyf eu bod yn sicr bron—ni chawn yr union ffigurau am fis neu ddau—y byddwn yn 2005 wedi codi'n uwch na £40 biliwn am y tro cyntaf.

**Janet Davies:** Yes, but, compared to 1999, the gross value added levels are at the same percentage. In the meantime, I understand from one of your Government publications that we have had 100,000 new jobs. As they do not seem to have had a significant effect on GVA, what are you doing to assess the reasons for this?

**Janet Davies:** Ie, ond o'u cymharu â 1999, yr un ganran sydd i lefelau'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn deall o ddarllen un o gyhoeddiadau eich Llywodraeth ein bod wedi cael 100,000 o swyddi newydd. Gan nad yw'n ymddangos eu bod wedi cael effaith sylweddol ar GYC, pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i asesu'r rhesymau dros hyn?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that you have got your figures right. If you think that in 1999 the gross value added was also £39 billion, as it was in 2004, you are sadly mistaken. The figure, as I seem to remember, although I do not have it here, would have been around £33 billion. It is important that

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a yw'r ffigurau'n iawn gennych. Os credwch mai £39 biliwn oedd y gwerth ychwanegol crynswth yn 1999 hefyd, fel yr oedd yn 2004, yr ydych yn camgymryd. Y ffigur, yn ôl y cof sydd gennyf, er nad yw gennyf yma, oedd tua £33 biliwn. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod y



we recognise the major increases that have occurred. I hope that we will have confirmation of my statisticians' broad estimate that we will have burst through the £40 billion barrier in the last full year, 2005.

**Alun Cairns:** It is easy for you to talk in absolute numbers, but are not the relative numbers the ones that are of real importance to the people of Wales? We want to know how well we are doing in comparison to England, Scotland, Northern Ireland and the regions within those countries. That is what we are worried about. Is it not the reality that we are now the poorest nation within the United Kingdom? Your Minister for economic development now seems to be moving to comparisons of gross domestic household income when, in reality, the internationally recognised measure of wealth is GVA. Will you confirm that what you are really trying to do is to raise the relative position of GVA in Wales, and that you have absolutely failed up until now?

**The First Minister:** That is an absolutely dreadful failure to understand facts and economic realities. If you like GVA relative per head figures—and I can hear you saying so, in your usual sonorous way, from a sedentary position—that is fine. In the Tory years, GVA per head, relatively speaking, was falling for a long time. When the Assembly came into power, it stopped falling for the first time for a long time. It now appears to have started to rise up the other side. After years of Tory decline, we stabilised it; it has not fallen while we have been in power and it seems to be coming up the other side now. When you then say—and this is the ultimate cheek in what you are saying—that Wales is the poorest region, why are you questioning the use of gross domestic household income figures? If you want to look at the poorest region, it is gross domestic household income that you look at. GDHI is doing extremely well; it is at the highest level now relatively since 1996. Therefore, if you want to talk about the poorest region, it is GDHI not GVA that you are talking about.

cynnydd mawr sydd wedi bod. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y cawn gadarnhad o amcangyfrif bras fy ystadegwyr y byddwn wedi mynd dros £40 biliwn am y tro cyntaf yn y flwyddyn lawn ddiwethaf, 2005.

**Alun Cairns:** Mae'n hawdd ichi ddefnyddio rhifau absoliwt, ond onid y rhifau cymharol yw'r rhai sydd o wir bwys i bobl Cymru? Yr ydym am gael gwybod pa mor dda yr ydym yn gwneud mewn cymhariaeth â Lloegr, yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon a'r rhanbarthau yn y gwledydd hynny. Am hynny yr ydym yn pryderu. Onid y gwir yw mai ni bellach yw'r wlad dlotaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig? Mae'n ymddangos yn awr fod eich Gweinidog dros ddatblygu economaidd yn troi at gymariaethau o incwm mewnwladol crynswth aelwydydd, er mai'r ffon fesur ar gyfoeth a gydnabyddir yn rhyngwladol yw GYC. A wnewch gadarnhau mai'r hyn yr ydych yn ceisio'i wneud mewn gwirionedd yw codi lefel gymharol GYC yng Nghymru, a'ch bod wedi methu'n llwyr hyd yma?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n dangos eich bod yn methu'n lân â deall ffeithiau a gwirioneddau economaidd. Os ydych yn hoffi ffigurau cymharol GYC y pen—a gallaf eich clywed yn dweud hynny, yn eich ffordd soniarus arferol, ar eich eistedd—mae hynny'n burion. Ym mlynnyddoedd y Torïaid, bu GYC y pen, a siarad yn gymharol, yn gostwng am gyfnod hir. Pan ddaeth y Cynulliad i rym, peidiodd â gostwng am y tro cyntaf ers amser maith. Mae'n ymddangos ei fod bellach yn dechrau codi. Wedi blynyddoedd o ddirywiad dan y Torïaid, bu inni ei sefydlogi; nid yw wedi gostwng tra ydym wedi bod mewn grym ac mae'n ymddangos ei fod yn codi erbyn hyn. Pan ddywedwch wedyn—a dyma'r peth mwyaf digywilydd yn yr hyn a ddywedwch—mai Cymru yw'r rhanbarth tlotaf, pam yr ydych yn cwestiynu defnyddio ffigurau incwm mewnwladol crynswth aelwydydd? Os ydych am weld pa un yw'r rhanbarth tlotaf, ar incwm mewnwladol crynswth aelwydydd y byddwch yn edrych. Mae incwm mewnwladol crynswth aelwydydd yn gwneud yn dda iawn; mae ar y lefel uchaf yn awr, yn gymharol, ers 1996. Felly, os mai am y rhanbarth tlotaf yr ydych am sôn, rhaid cyfeirio at incwm mewnwladol crynswth aelwydydd yn hytrach na GYC.

3.00 p.m.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have no changes to report to this week's business. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which should be available to Members on the agenda. Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Road Traffic (Permitted Parking Area and Special Parking Area) (County Borough of Conwy) Order 2006, the Standards Committees (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, and the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Elin Jones:** Derbyniaf fod rhestr hir o geisiadau wedi eu gwneud am ddatganiadau a dadleuon i chi y bore yma, Drefnydd, ond mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt wedi eu gwrthod, ac yr ydym yn anhapus â hynny, ar y cyfan. Er hynny, croesawaf y ffaith y bydd datganiad ysgrifenedig ar lendid dŵr y môr, yn enwedig o gofio bod un o draethau Aberystwyth wedi bod ar gau unwaith eto dros y penwythnos oherwydd problem gyda seilwaith carthffosiaeth yr ardal honno.

Mae dau fater penodol yr ydym am i chi eu hailstyried. Yn gyntaf, yr ydych wedi dweud y byddwch yn barod i wneud datganiad ysgrifenedig yn unig ar fwriad yr

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Nid oes gennyf newidiadau i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, a ddylai fod ar gael i'r Aelodau ar yr agenda. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, mae'r Dirprwy Lywydd wedi penderfynu nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Gorchymyn Traffig Ffyrdd (Ardal Barcio a Ganiateir ac Ardal Barcio Arbennig) (Bwrdeistref Sirol Conwy) 2006, Rheoliadau Pwyllgorau Safonau (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, a Rheoliadau Grantiau a Benthyciadau Dysgu y Cynulliad (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, so I ask that the Minister formally propose the business statement.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Elin Jones:** I accept that a long list of applications for statements and debates was made to you this morning, Business Minister, but most of them have been rejected, and we are dissatisfied with that, on the whole. However, I welcome the fact that there will be a written statement on the cleanliness of sea water, bearing in mind that one of Aberystwyth's beaches was once again closed over the weekend because of a problem once again with sewerage infrastructure in that area.

There are two specific matters that we would like you to reconsider. First, you have said that you will only provide a written statement on the Department of Trade and Industry's

Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i ystyried gosod trwyddedau chwilio am olew a nwy ym mae Ceredigion. Mae hwn yn fater pellgyrhaeddol, sy'n bwysig i'r Cynulliad ac o ran cadwraeth amgylcheddol y darn hwnnw o'r wlad, sy'n cael ei gydnabod yn rhyngwladol. Mae'n fater mor bwysig fel y dylai fod gennym hawl yn y Siambr i gwestiynu'r Gweinidog ar rôl y Cynulliad yn y penderfyniad ar drwyddedu. Yr wyf yn anhapus mai datganiad ysgrifenedig yn unig sydd ar y mater hwnnw.

Yn ail, yr ydych wedi gwrthod caniatáu datganiad ar ddyfodol y Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd. Derbyniaf ein bod wedi cael trafodaeth ddigon defnyddiol ar ddyfodol IGER yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yr wythnos diwethaf, ond mae'r sefydliad hwn yn unigryw ac yn bwysig yng Nghymru, ac mae'r chwe mis nesaf yn dyngedfennol o ran ei ddyfodol. Mae'n fater o ddigon o bwys i haeddu trafodaeth lawn yn y Siambr.

**Lisa Francis:** We too are disappointed that only a written statement will be offered on the DTI's position and its invitation for applications for licences to explore for oil and gas in Cardigan bay. It would be useful to know this Government's response, and its involvement insofar as the environment, and particularly tourism, are concerned in the important areas of Cardiganshire and Pembrokeshire.

We ask for an oral statement—an update—on the A5 closure. We are happy that you have agreed, Minister, to update us on this before the end of the term, but this situation is ongoing. There is the issue of compensation to businesses. Some local businesses have reported that they have lost up to 80 per cent of their income. There is also the question of further problems that could beset the road, with the Welsh Assembly Government planning to build a new bridge at Pont Melin Rug. A regular oral statement should have been offered to us on that issue.

We are disappointed that you feel that you

intention to consider licensing oil and gas exploration in Cardigan bay. This is a far-reaching matter, which is important for the Assembly and for the environmental conservation of that part of the country, which is internationally acknowledged. It is such an important issue that we should have the right in the Chamber to question the Minister on the Assembly's role in the decision on licensing. I am unhappy that we are only to have a written statement on that matter.

Secondly, you have refused to allow a statement on the future of the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research. I accept that we had a useful enough discussion on the future of IGER in last week's Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee meeting, but this institution is unique and important to Wales, and the next six months will be critical in terms of its future. It is important enough a matter to deserve a full debate in the Chamber.

**Lisa Francis:** Yr ydym ninnau hefyd yn siomedig mai dim ond datganiad ysgrifenedig fydd yn cael ei gynnig am safbwynt yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r gwahoddiad y mae wedi ei estyn i geisiadau am drwyddedau i chwilio am olew a nwy ym mae Ceredigion. Byddai'n dda cael gwybod beth yw ymateb y Llywodraeth hon, a'r hyn y mae'n ei wneud o safbwynt yr amgylchedd, a thwristiaeth yn arbennig, yn ardaloedd pwysig sir Aberteifi a sir Benfro.

Gofynnwn am ddatganiad llafar—y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf—am gau'r A5. Yr ydym yn falch eich bod wedi cytuno, Weinidog, i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am hyn cyn diwedd y tymor, ond mae'r sefyllfa hon yn bod yn awr. Digolledu busnesau yw un mater sydd dan sylw. Mae rhai busnesau lleol wedi dweud eu bod wedi colli hyd at 80 y cant o'u hincwm. Cwestiwn arall hefyd yw'r problemau pellach a allai amharu ar y ffordd, gyda Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n bwriadu codi pont newydd ym Mhont Melin Rug. Dylai adroddiad llafar arferol fod wedi cael ei gynnig inni ar y mater hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn siomedig eich bod yn teimlo na

cannot come forward with an oral statement on the workings and structure of the new Department for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks, particularly following reports of confusion and lack of decision making, and even estrangement, which business people feel about how this has developed, particularly in north Wales. You must be aware of those complaints of the increasing levels of bureaucracy, and lack of industry consultation, which is said to be dwindling to negligible levels. It is not good enough to say that the information is available on the intranet—businesspeople need to know about this now.

**Peter Black:** In opposing the business statement, I will focus on two issues that deserve more attention than has been offered by the Business Minister. We have referred before to the future of IGER. It is imperative that we have some progress on that. The Minister can update the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee on this issue, but this is a very important issue and there are things that the Assembly Government itself can do, particularly in terms of links with higher education, to try to secure the future of this particular facility. That is why we need a statement in the Chamber, so that we can question the Minister on that and raise those issues with him.

In terms of the oil and gas exploration in Cardigan bay, we are facing another situation where an energy matter will be decided outside of Wales in Westminster—a matter that will have environmental consequences for Wales, and a decision for which the Assembly will have very little, if any, say. My party believes that we should have a debate or a statement on that, so that we can question the Minister, put pressure on the Westminster Government and have an Assembly view on this particular matter before it is too late. For that reason, I hope that we can vote down this business statement and that an amended business statement, with those two issues taken on board, can be brought forward.

**Carl Sargeant:** I would be grateful, Minister, for the opportunity to debate safety at sea. The coastguard was called out to an

allwch gyflwyno datganiad llafar am beirianwaith a strwythur yr adran newydd, Adran Menter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau, yn enwedig yn sgîl adroddiadau ynghylch dryswch a diffyg penderfynu, a hyd yn oed ymddieithrio, sef sut y mae pobl fusnes yn teimlo ynghylch sut y mae hyn wedi datblygu, yn enwedig yn y gogledd. Mae'n rhaid eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r cwynion hynny am lefelau cynyddol o fiwrocratiaeth, a diffyg ymgynghori â diwydiant, y dywedir ei fod yn lleihau nes nad oes fawr ddim yn digwydd. Nid yw'n ddigon da dweud bod y wybodaeth ar gael ar y fewnwyd—mae angen i bobl fusnes wybod am hyn yn awr.

**Peter Black:** Wrth wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes, canolbwyntiaf ar ddau fater sy'n haeddu mwy o sylw nag a gynigiwyd gan y Trefnydd. Yr ydym wedi cyfeirio o'r blaen at ddyfodol IGER. Mae'n hanfodol bod rhywbeth yn digwydd ynglŷn â hynny. Gall y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ar y mater hwn, ond mae'n fater pwysig iawn ac mae pethau y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei hun eu gwneud, yn enwedig o safbwynt cysylltiadau ag addysg uwch, i geisio diogelu dyfodol y cyfleuster neilltuol hwn. Dyna pam y mae angen inni gael datganiad yn y Siambr, fel y gallwn holi'r Gweinidog am hynny a chodi'r materion hynny gyda ef.

O ran chwilio am olew a nwy ym mae Ceredigion, yr ydym yn wynebu sefyllfa arall lle y penderfynir ar fater yn ymwneud ag ynni y tu allan i Gymru yn San Steffan—mater a fydd yn golygu canlyniadau amgylcheddol i Gymru, a phenderfyniad na chaiff y Cynulliad fawr o lais ynddo, os caiff unrhyw lais o gwbl. Cred fy mhlaid i y dylem gael dadl neu ddatganiad ar hynny, fel y gallwn holi'r Gweinidog, rhoi pwysau ar Lywodraeth San Steffan a chael barn y Cynulliad ar y mater neilltuol hwn cyn ei bod yn rhy hwyr. Am y rheswm hwnnw, gobeithiaf y gallwn drechu'r datganiad busnes hwn ac y gellir cyflwyno datganiad busnes diwygiedig, sy'n cynnwys y ddau fater hynny.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, Weinidog, am y cyfle i drafod diogelwch ar y môr. Galwyd gwyliwr y glannau allan i

incident at Prestatyn yesterday involving seasonal sailors and swimmers. There is obviously an influx of tourists to the area and we should be issuing safety-at-sea guidance, particularly in north Wales coastal areas.

I would also welcome the opportunity to debate primary healthcare centres in Flintshire. Buckley and Connah's Quay deserve services that are fit for purpose for the twenty-first century and shared cross-border facilities between England and Wales.

Finally, will you consider a debate on the honours list that was announced last weekend? I am sure that everyone in the Chamber, including the regional Member for north Wales, would welcome and celebrate the OBE issued by the Queen to Alex Aldridge. Those people who have been quite vindictive and who have participated in destroying his character may like to apologise in public. Alex Aldridge deserves the OBE that was announced by the Queen last weekend.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I am disappointed that you are not supporting today's business statement. We only have four weeks left of this term and I do not know how we would cram in all these requests. We would have to lose some business, so this is about us taking responsibility together to have a robust business statement that takes on board your views and your requests, as I have done. We have not rejected all the requests, Elin. The written statement on the cleanliness of sea water is important. Peter also brought up the issue of IGER. The committee is an important place for providing updates on IGER and clearly, that is something on which you have had a rigorous debate and discussion, as Elin said. It is a very important institution and we will ensure that you get those updates. As far as the Department of Trade and Industry is concerned, and the issue of licences in Cardigan bay, you have drawn it to our attention and that is important. Our response in a written statement is appropriate at this stage, and we can see how much further we need to take that issue in the future.

ddigwyddiad ym Mhrestatyn ddoe yn ymwneud â hwylwyr a nofwyr tymhorol. Yn amlwg, mae twristiaid yn heidio i'r ardal a dylem fod yn cyhoeddi canllawiau diogelwch ar y môr, yn enwedig yn ardaloedd arfordirol gogledd Cymru.

Byddwn hefyd yn croesawu'r cyfle i drafod canolfannau gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn sir y Fflint. Mae Bwcle a Chei Connah yn haeddu gwasanaethau sy'n addas i'w diben yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain a chyfleusterau trawsffiniol a rennir rhwng Cymru a Lloegr.

Yn olaf, a wnewch ystyried cynnal dadl am y rhestr anrhydeddau a gyhoeddwyd y penwythnos diwethaf? Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd pawb yn y Siambr, gan gynnwys yr Aelod rhanbarthol dros ogledd Cymru, yn croesawu ac yn dathlu'r OBE a roddwyd gan y Frenhines i Alex Aldridge. Efallai y bydd y bobl hynny sydd wedi bod yn bur ddialgar ac sydd wedi mynd ati i danseilio ei gymeriad yn barod i ymddiheuro yn gyhoeddus. Mae Alex Aldridge yn haeddu'r OBE a gyhoeddwyd gan y Frenhines y penwythnos diwethaf.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Yr wyf yn siomedig nad ydych yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes heddiw. Dim ond pedair wythnos o'r tymor hwn sydd gennym ar ôl ac ni wn sut y byddem yn gallu cynnwys yr holl geisiadau hynny. Byddai'n rhaid inni golli peth busnes, felly mae gofyn inni gymryd cyfrifoldeb gyda'n gilydd i gael datganiad busnes cryf sy'n adlewyrchu eich barn a'ch ceisiadau, fel yr wyf wedi gwneud. Nid ydym wedi gwrthod pob cais, Elin. Mae'r datganiad ysgrifenedig am lendid dŵr y môr yn bwysig. Cododd Peter fater IGER hefyd. Mae'r pwyllgor yn lle pwysig i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am IGER ac yn amlwg, mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydych wedi cael dadl a thrafodaeth drwyadl amdano, fel y dywedodd Elin. Mae'n sefydliad pwysig iawn a byddwn yn sicrhau eich bod yn cael yr adroddiadau diweddar hynny. Cyn belled ag y mae'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant yn y cwestiwn, a mater y trwyddedau ym mae Ceredigion, yr ydych wedi ei ddwyn i'n sylw ac mae hynny'n bwysig. Mae ein hymateb mewn datganiad ysgrifenedig yn briodol ar hyn o bryd, a chawn weld faint ymhellach y mae angen inni fynd o ran y mater hwnnw yn y

dyfodol.

I am sure that Lisa was here when the First Minister was questioned about the A5 closure. He dealt with that matter extensively. As he said, issues were dealt with promptly and the Assembly Government acted in good faith throughout. It is good that there was an opportunity for people to question the First Minister and the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks. On your point about the enterprise, innovation and networks service, we now have a streamlined service for business and tourism in Wales, which is outward-looking and customer-faced. That is the most important thing in terms of the new department.

Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Lisa yma pan holwyd y Prif Weinidog ynghylch cau'r A5. Deliodd â'r mater yn helaeth. Fel y dywedodd, aethpwyd i'r afael â'r problemau yn ddiymdroi ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gweithredu'n ddidwyll drwyddi draw. Mae'n dda bod cyfle wedi bod i bobl holi'r Prif Weinidog a'r Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau. O ran eich pwynt am y gwasanaeth menter, arloesi a rhwydweithiau, erbyn hyn mae gennym wasanaeth wedi'i ailwampio i fusnes a thwristiaeth yng Nghymru, sy'n edrych tuag allan ac yn canolbwyntio ar y cwsmer. Hynny yw'r peth pwysicaf o ran yr adran newydd.

3.10 p.m.

I thank Carl for supporting the business statement, and I take the opportunity of praising the lifeguards in our waters around Wales. They save lives and many young people are involved in this as volunteers. This is also an issue for which we must take responsibility in terms of safety at sea. You took the opportunity, Carl, to focus on important developments in primary healthcare in your constituency. Also, let us congratulate Alex Aldridge OBE for his contribution to public service and local government in Wales.

Diolchaf i Carl am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes, ac achubaf ar y cyfle i ganmol yr achubwyr bywydau yn ein dyfroedd o gwmpas Cymru. Maent yn achub bywydau ac mae llawer o bobl ifanc yn ymwneud â hyn fel gwirfoddolwyr. Mae hwn hefyd yn fater y mae'n rhaid inni ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb amdano o ran diogelwch ar y môr. Bu ichi fanteisio ar y cyfle, Carl, i ganolbwyntio ar ddatblygiadau pwysig mewn gofal iechyd sylfaenol yn eich etholaeth. Hefyd, gadewch inni longyfarch Alex Aldridge OBE ar ei gyfraniad i wasanaeth cyhoeddus a llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John

Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Datganiad ar Gronfeydd Ymddiriedolaeth Plant Statement on Child Trust Funds**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Last September, the Assembly debated the Welsh Assembly Government's feasibility study report on Christine Chapman's Standing Order No. 31 proposal to require local authorities to provide an annual contribution to the child trust funds of children looked after by them. As Minister for children, I was pleased to inform the Assembly that, while the proposal would not be pursued via the Standing Order No. 31 legislative route, we would be taking forward a scheme to reimburse local authorities for providing, as part of their corporate parenting responsibilities, an annual contribution to the child trust funds of looked-after children in their care. The scheme is unique to Wales, and I am pleased that the Assembly is leading the way in encouraging savings and investment for this vulnerable group.

The modern welfare state has concentrated on providing an income for those who, because of age, illness, unemployment and so on, are unable to secure one for themselves. Llywydd, I recognise that there is a lot of—  
 [Interruption.]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I do not understand what all this discussion is about. The Business Minister is making a statement to which we should listen.

**Jane Hutt:** The recent Joseph Rowntree report on social exclusion in Wales concluded that child poverty has fallen further and faster in Wales than in any other part of the United Kingdom. The Assembly

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Fis Medi diwethaf, cynhaliodd y Cynulliad ddadl ar adroddiad astudiaeth ddichonoldeb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gynnig Christine Chapman o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31 i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol roi cyfraniad blynyddol i gronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant y plant hynny sy'n derbyn gofal ganddynt. Fel y Gweinidog dros blant, yr oeddwn yn falch o hysbysu'r Cynulliad, er na fyddem yn dilyn y cynnig ar hyd llwybr deddfwriaethol Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 31, y byddem yn bwrw ymlaen â chynllun i ad-dalu'r awdurdodau lleol am roi cyfraniad blynyddol i gronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant y plant hynny sy'n derbyn gofal ganddynt, fel rhan o'u cyfrifoldebau rhianta corfforaethol. Mae'r cynllun yn unigryw i Gymru, ac yr wyf yn falch bod y Cynulliad yn arwain y ffordd wrth annog cynilion a buddsoddi ar gyfer y grŵp hwn sy'n agored i niwed.

Mae'r wladwriaeth les fodern wedi canolbwyntio ar ddarparu incwm i'r rhai nad ydynt, oherwydd oed, salwech, diweithdra ac yn y blaen, yn gallu sicrhau incwm iddynt eu hunain. Lywydd, yr wyf yn cydnabod bod llawer o—  
 [Torri ar draws.]

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid wyf yn deall beth yw'r holl drafod hyn. Mae'r Trefnydd yn gwneud datganiad y dylem wrando arno.

**Jane Hutt:** Daeth adroddiad Sefydlaidd Joseph Rowntree yn ddiweddar am allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru i'r casgliad bod tloidi ymysg plant wedi lleihau ymhellach ac yn gyflymach yng Nghymru nag mewn dim

Government's child poverty action plan, being taken forward by Huw Lewis, will build on these foundations in a series of practical ways. However, while having enough money to meet everyday needs is vitally important, there is another component to poverty and inequality at the start of the twenty-first century. Access to assets, in the form of savings, property or occupational pensions has become a standard part of the lives of two-thirds or more of Welsh citizens. For the remaining third, however, these advantages are few and far between. Research shows us that having access to even a modest level of savings at the age of 18 makes a real difference to the sort of decisions that young people make about their futures and encourages a sense of investment in their lives. That is why this scheme is so important. It ensures asset accumulation for those looked-after children who are likely to spend considerable periods of their childhood in care, who are reliant on the local authorities, and who are least likely to be able to build up savings in another way.

This statement is intended to update Members on the outcome of the second consultation—which was held between February and April 2006—with local authorities on the criteria for the Assembly Government's looked-after children child trust fund scheme. This follows an earlier consultation with local authorities last August on the merits of introducing such a scheme and the practicalities of its implementation. Responses to both consultations have been positive and when we discussed the feasibility report in Plenary in September, Members were keen to ensure that only those children who were likely to remain in care for long periods, with no plans to return home to their birth parents, would benefit from these contributions. Under the original criteria, some 650 children would have benefited. This would have included children spending short periods in care and those placed with their birth parents. Clearly, this was inappropriate and not the intention of the original motion.

un rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Bydd cynllun gweithredu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar dlodi ymysg plant, dan ofal Huw Lewis, yn adeiladu ar y seiliau hyn mewn cyfres o ffyrdd ymarferol. Fodd bynnag, er bod cael digon o arian i dalu am angenion bob dydd yn hanfodol bwysig, mae elfen arall ynglŷn â thlodi ac anghyfartaledd yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae mynediad at asedau, ar ffurf cynilion, eiddo, neu bensiynau galwedigaethol wedi dod yn rhan arferol o fywydau dwy ran o dair neu ragor o ddinasyddion Cymru. I'r traean sy'n weddill, fodd bynnag, prin iawn yw'r manteision hyn. Mae ymchwil yn dangos inni fod hyd yn oed lefel eithaf isel o gynilion gan bobl ifanc yn 18 oed yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol i'r math o benderfyniadau y maent yn eu gwneud am eu dyfodol ac yn annog ymdeimlad o fuddsoddi yn eu bywydau. Dyna pam mae'r cynllun hwn mor bwysig. Mae'n sicrhau bod asedau'n cronni i'r plant hynny sy'n derbyn gofal sy'n debygol o dreulio cyfnod sylweddol o'u plentyndod mewn gofal, sy'n ddibynnol ar yr awdurdodau lleol, ac sydd leiaf tebygol o allu hel cynilion mewn ffordd arall.

Diben y datganiad hwn yw rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am ganlyniad yr ail ymgynghoriad—a gynhaliwyd rhwng mis Chwefror a mis Ebrill 2006—gydag awdurdodau lleol am y meini prawf ar gyfer cynllun cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i blant sy'n derbyn gofal. Mae hyn yn dilyn ymgynghoriad cynharach gyda'r awdurdodau lleol fis Awst y llynedd am ragoriaethau cyflwyno cynllun o'r fath a'r ystyriaethau ymarferol o ran ei weithredu. Mae'r ymatebion i'r ddau ymgynghoriad wedi bod yn gadarnhaol a phan drafodasom yr adroddiad dichonoldeb mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ym mis Medi, yr oedd yr Aelodau'n awyddus i sicrhau mai dim ond y plant hynny a oedd yn debygol o aros mewn gofal am gyfnodau hir, heb ddim cynlluniau i ddychwelyd adref at eu rhieni biolegol, fyddai'n elwa o'r cyfraniadau hyn. O dan y meini prawf gwreiddiol, byddai rhyw 650 o blant wedi elwa. Byddai hyn yn cynnwys plant a fyddai'n treulio cyfnodau byr mewn gofal a'r rhai a gâi eu lleoli gyda'u rhieni biolegol. Yn amlwg, yr oedd hyn yn amhriodol ac nid hyn oedd bwriad y cynnig gwreiddiol.



We believe that the scheme to be implemented from September 2006 is the most equitable in meeting the aims of the motion. Some 460 children, those most in need, will benefit. To be eligible for the scheme, and an annual £50 top-up, a child must have been continuously looked after by a Welsh local authority under section 31, or accommodated under section 20, of the Children Act 1989, for a period of six months in the period leading up to 1 September every year, starting in 2006. Statutory requirements in the care planning and review arrangements for looked-after children require local authorities, within four months of a child entering care, to have a plan for permanency. This may include the following: a plan to return home; a plan to be placed with extended family or friends; a plan to be placed in long-term care with a foster carer or in children's homes; and/or a plan for adoption.

Evidence shows that many children who remain in care beyond the four-month stage are likely to spend considerable periods of their childhood in the care system. Under the above criteria, we estimate that around 460 children—which is around 10 per cent of the looked-after children population—will be eligible from the start of the scheme in September 2006. Each subsequent year, an additional 200 children, on average, will benefit from the CTF contribution. Local authorities welcome the scheme, and preparations are in hand to identify eligible children and to make the first contributions from September onwards. In August, the Assembly will issue statutory guidance under section 7 of the Local Authority Social Services Act 1970 on the detailed arrangements of the scheme. Local authorities will be required to submit an annual schedule of all children who have benefited from a CTF contribution, and we consider these arrangements to be sufficiently robust to encourage local authorities to participate in the scheme.

I also intend to write to elected Members to remind them of their responsibilities as corporate parents for looked-after children in their care, and to encourage their support and scrutiny of the scheme within their local

Credwn mai'r cynllun sydd i gael ei roi ar waith o fis Medi 2006 yw'r un tecaf wrth gyflawni amcanion y cynnig. Bydd rhyw 460 o blant, y rhai y mae mwyaf o angen arnynt, yn elwa. I fod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun, ynghyd ag ychwanegiad blynyddol o £50, rhaid i blentyn fod wedi bod dan ofal parhaus awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru dan adran 31, neu fod wedi ei gartrefu dan adran 20, Deddf Plant 1989, am gyfnod o chwe mis yn ystod y cyfnod hyd at 1 Medi bob blwyddyn, gan ddechrau yn 2006. Mae'r gofynion statudol yn y trefniadau adolygu a chynllunio gofal i blant sy'n derbyn gofal yn mynnu bod gan awdurdodau lleol, o fewn pedwar mis ar ôl i'r plentyn fynd i ofal, gynllun parhad. Mae'n bosibl y bydd hwn yn cynnwys y canlynol: cynllun i ddychwelyd adref; cynllun i gael ei leoli gyda theulu estynedig neu gyfeillion; cynllun i gael ei leoli mewn gofal hirdymor gyda gofalwr maeth neu mewn cartrefi plant; a/neu gynllun mabwysiadu.

Dengys tystiolaeth fod llawer o'r plant sy'n dal mewn gofal wedi'r cyfnod pedwar mis yn debygol o dreulio cyfnodau sylweddol o'u plentyndod yn y system ofal. Dan y meini prawf uchod, amcangyfrifwn y bydd tua 460 o blant—sef tua 10 y cant o boblogaeth y plant sy'n derbyn gofal—yn gymwys o ddechrau'r cynllun ym Medi 2006. Bob blwyddyn wedi hynny, bydd 200 o blant yn ychwanegol, ar gyfartaledd, yn elwa o'r cyfraniad i'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn croesawu'r cynllun, ac mae paratodau ar y gweill i ddynodi plant cymwys a gwneud y cyfraniadau cyntaf o fis Medi ymlaen. Yn Awst, bydd y Cynulliad yn cyflwyno canllawiau statudol dan adran 7 Deddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Awdurdodau Lleol 1970 ar drefniadau manwl y cynllun. Bydd gofyn i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno atodlen flynyddol o'r plant sydd wedi elwa o gyfraniad i gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, a chredwn fod y trefniadau hyn yn ddigon cadarn i annog awdurdodau lleol i gyfranogi yn y cynllun.

Bwriadaf hefyd ysgrifennu at Aelodau etholedig i'w hatgoffa o'u cyfrifoldebau fel rhieni corfforaethol dros y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd yn eu gofal, a'u hannog i gefnogi'r cynllun o fewn eu hardaloedd lleol

areas. Resources to fund the scheme have been built into the health and social care budget for 2006-07 and future years, and the intention, in due course, is to use powers under the Government of Wales Bill to require local authorities to make annual contributions. Until such time, the administrative arrangements will continue and local authorities will be encouraged to make annual contributions and to be reimbursed for doing so. In order to assist Assembly Members and others to assess the success of the scheme, arrangements will be made to ensure that the annual publication of social services statistics includes the numbers of looked-after children who have benefited from contributions to their CTF accounts. I would also like to thank Christine Chapman for initiating the development of such a worthy scheme to benefit some of the most vulnerable children in Wales.

**Christine Chapman:** I warmly welcome the Minister's statement. We know that the CTF scheme that was set up by a Labour Government in Westminster is a very ambitious way of challenging inequality by supporting saving and asset building for every child, rather than just for those who can afford it. The additional contributions to funds is something on which children in care could miss out, and I am very pleased to see the Labour Government here in Wales intervening and putting in funding so that this will not be the case.

Minister, as you said, we want to ensure that this will be safeguarded for the future, and I am very keen to find out how we will monitor the take-up of this scheme. Therefore, will you give a commitment that the scheme will continue until the Assembly is able to legislate, so that the scheme is compulsory for local authorities? Do you agree that the requirement for local authorities to check with Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs that a CTF is opened for the children whom they look after is also a very positive way forward?

**Jane Hutt:** I think that the key for us in

a chraffu arno. Cynhwyswyd adnoddau i ariannu'r cynllun yn y gyllideb iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ar gyfer 2006-07 ac ar gyfer blynyddoedd i'r dyfodol, a'r bwriad, maes o law, yw defnyddio pwerau dan Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru i fynnu bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud cyfraniadau blynyddol. Nes y bydd hynny'n digwydd, bydd y trefniadau gweinyddol yn parhau ac anogir awdurdodau lleol i wneud cyfraniadau blynyddol a chael eu had-dalu am wneud hynny. Er mwyn cynorthwyo Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac eraill i asesu llwyddiant y cynllun, gwneir trefniadau i sicrhau bod ystadegau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gyhoeddir yn flynyddol yn cynnwys niferoedd y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd wedi elwa o gyfraniadau i'w cyfrifon cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant. Hoffwn hefyd ddiolch i Christine Chapman am symbylu datblygiad cynllun mor glodwiw er budd rhai o'r plant mwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru.

**Christine Chapman:** Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog yn gynnes. Gwyddom fod cynllun y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan yn ffordd uchelgeisiol iawn o herio anghydraddoldebau drwy roi cymorth i gynilo a chronni asedau i bob plentyn, yn hytrach na dim ond i'r rhai a all ei fforddio. Mae'r cyfraniadau ychwanegol at yr arian yn rhywbeth y gallai plant mewn gofal fethu ag elwa ohonynt, ac yr wyf yn falch o weld y Llywodraeth Lafur yma yng Nghymru yn ymyrryd ac yn cyfrannu cyllid fel na fydd hyn yn digwydd.

Weinidog, fel y dywedasoeh, yr ydym am sicrhau y bydd hyn yn cael ei ddiogelu ar gyfer y dyfodol, ac yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i ganfod sut y byddwn yn monitro faint a fydd yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun hwn. O'r herwydd, a wnewch addo y bydd y cynllun yn parhau nes y bydd y Cynulliad yn gallu deddfu, fel bod y cynllun yn orfodol i awdurdodau lleol? A ydych yn cytuno mai cam cadarnhaol iawn ymlaen hefyd yw ei bod yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol gael gwybod gan Gyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi a oes cyfrif cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant wedi cael ei agor i'r plant y maent yn gofalu amdanynt?

**Jane Hutt:** Credaf mai'r allwedd i ni yn y

Government is how we can most effectively intervene to improve the outcomes for our most vulnerable children, and looked-after children are a part of that population. Monitoring the scheme will be crucial, but the fact that we have made the funding available through the revenue support grant, and made it available in the health and social care budget for this year and for ensuing years, and the fact that we have undertaken two periods of consultation—one on the principle and the second on the practicalities and the criteria—means that local authorities are fully on board and embracing the opportunity in terms of their responsibilities as corporate parents. Also, in terms of monitoring, we will have the information included in the social services statistics schedule to show how many children have benefited from this top-up under the CTF arrangements.

3.20 p.m.

It is a reimbursement scheme, and it is unique to the United Kingdom in terms of Wales taking this forward. Statutory guidance will be issued in August under section 7 of the Local Authority Social Services Act 1970, and detailed arrangements for the scheme will be identified. As the Minister with responsibility for children, I will write to all local authorities and meet with the lead members who will be responsible, under the Children Act 1989, for children in their communities. I believe that all those elements will ensure that we can monitor and scrutinise this carefully, and then, hopefully, we will get the powers that we seek as we move forward with the Government of Wales Bill.

**David Lloyd:** I thank the Minister for her statement. We have debated child trust funds a few times before. I also commend Christine Chapman on her work in bringing this forward originally. As the Minister said, we are detailing a scheme to reimburse local authorities, which, as part of their corporate parenting responsibilities, must provide an annual contribution to the child trust funds of looked-after children in their care. An annual contribution to a child trust fund of anything up to £1,200 is possible. Therefore, when we

Llywodraeth yw sut y gallwn ymyrryd yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol i wella'r canlyniadau i'n plant mwyaf agored i niwed, ac mae plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn rhan o'r boblogaeth honno. Bydd monitro'r cynllun yn hollbwysig, ond mae'r ffaith ein bod wedi rhyddhau'r arian drwy'r grant cymorth refeniw, ac wedi ei ryddhau drwy'r gyllideb iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ar gyfer y flwyddyn hon ac ar gyfer blynyddoedd dilynol, a'r ffaith ein bod wedi cynnal dau gyfnod o ymgynghoriad—un ar yr egwyddor a'r ail ar yr ochr ymarferol a'r meini prawf—yn golygu bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn gwbl gefnogol ac yn achub ar y cyfle o safbwynt eu cyfrifoldebau fel rhieni corfforaethol. Hefyd, o ran monitro, bydd y wybodaeth yn cael ei chynnwys yn atodlen ystadegau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i ddangos faint o blant sydd wedi elwa o'r ychwanegiad hwn dan drefniadau'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant.

Cynllun ad-daliad ydyw, ac mae'n unigryw i'r Deyrnas Unedig o ran bod Cymru'n bwrw ymlaen â hyn. Cyflwynir canllawiau statudol yn Awst dan adran 7 Deddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Awdurdodau Lleol 1970, a dynodir trefniadau manwl ar gyfer y cynllun. Fel y Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant, ysgrifennaf at yr holl awdurdodau lleol a chyfarfod â'r aelodau arweiniol a fydd yn gyfrifol, dan Ddeddf Plant 1989, am blant yn eu cymunedau. Credaf y bydd yr holl elfennau hynny'n sicrhau y gallwn fonitro a chraffu ar hyn yn ofalus, ac yna, gobeithio, cawn y pwerau yr ydym yn gofyn amdanynt wrth inni symud ymlaen gyda Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru.

**David Lloyd:** Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad. Yr ydym wedi trafod cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant o'r blaen. Yr wyf finnau'n cymeradwyo Christine Chapman am ei gwaith yn cyflwyno hyn yn wreiddiol. Fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, yr ydym yn manylu ar gynllun i ad-dalu awdurdodau lleol, awdurdodau lleol y mae'n rhaid iddynt, fel rhan o'u cyfrifoldebau rhianta corfforaethol, roi cyfraniad blynyddol i gronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant y plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd yn eu gofal. Mae cyfraniad

are talking about an annual contribution of £50 per looked-after child, I think that everybody would agree that we are talking about a moderate contribution.

Will the Minister clarify what guidance she is giving to local authorities as regards the type of accounts that can be set up for that money, in terms of high-risk and low-risk accounts? As I understand it, there is a variety of provision. I also wish to probe a little deeper into the eligibility criteria. We are all aware that the needs of looked-after children vary enormously; looked-after children spend varying amounts of time in different sorts of care, in different counties, on occasions, so it is sometimes an immense challenge to provide any sort of national provision for them. In the written copy of the statement that has been provided, the Minister says that

‘to be eligible for the scheme (an annual £50 top-up), a child must have been continuously looked after by a Welsh local authority...for a period of six months in the period up to 1 September each year’.

Minister, what happens when children spend lesser amounts of time in care, but, accumulatively, the time adds up to more than six months? They may be in and out of care and therefore may receive lesser contributions compared with children who are in care continuously for that qualifying time. Some children are in and out of care, and although, over a period of time, they are in care for the same amount of time, they have had different amounts of dollops of care, rather than a continuous six-month qualifying period. I ask the Minister to clarify how she intends to assess such cases.

My final question is on the final paragraph of the written copy of the statement, which states:

‘Resources to fund the scheme have been built into the Health and Social Care budget’.

Can you clarify exactly what those resources are? How much money are we talking about?

blynyddol o unrhyw swm hyd at £1,200 yn bosibl. O’r herwydd, pan soniwn am gyfraniad blynyddol o £50 i bob plentyn sy’n derbyn gofal, credaf y byddai pawb yn cytuno ein bod yn sôn am gyfraniad canolig.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro pa arweiniad y mae’n ei roi i awdurdodau lleol o safbwynt y math o gyfrifon y gellir eu sefydlu ar gyfer yr arian hwnnw, o ran cyfrifon risg uchel a risg isel? Yn ôl a ddeallaf, ceir darpariaeth amrywiol. Hoffwn hefyd roi rhagor o sylw i’r meini prawf o ran cymhwysedd. Yr ydym oll yn ymwybodol bod anghenion plant sy’n derbyn gofal yn amrywio’n aruthrol; mae plant sy’n derbyn gofal yn treulio amrywiol gyfnodau mewn gwahanol fathau o ofal, mewn gwahanol siroedd, ar adegau, felly weithiau mae’n her aruthrol cyflwyno unrhyw fath o ddarpariaeth genedlaethol iddynt. Yn y copi ysgrifenedig o’r datganiad a ddarparwyd, dywed y Gweinidog

er mwyn bod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun (ychwanegiad blynyddol o £50), rhaid i blentyn fod wedi bod dan ofal parhaus awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru...am gyfnod o chwe mis yn ystod y cyfnod hyd at 1 Medi bob blwyddyn.

Weinidog, beth sy’n digwydd pan fydd plant yn treulio llai o amser mewn gofal, ond bod yr amser, gyda’i gilydd, yn fwy na chwe mis? Mae’n bosibl y byddant i mewn ac allan o’r system ofal ac y byddant, o’r herwydd, yn cael llai o gyfraniadau o’u cymharu â phlant sydd mewn gofal yn barhaol yn ystod y cyfnod cymhwyso hwnnw. Mae rhai plant i mewn ac allan o’r system ofal, ac er eu bod, dros gyfnod o amser, mewn gofal am yr un faint o amser, maent wedi cael cyfnodau gwahanol o ofal tameidiog, yn hytrach na chyfnod cymhwyso di-dor o chwe mis. Gofynnaf i’r Gweinidog egluro sut y mae’n bwriadu asesu achosion o’r fath.

Mae fy nghwestiwn olaf yn ymwneud â pharagraff olaf copi ysgrifenedig y datganiad, sy’n dweud:

Cynhwyswyd adnoddau i ariannu’r cynllun yn y gyllideb Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol.

A allwch egluro beth yn union yw’r adnoddau hynny? Am faint o arian yr ydym

I ask this so that when we, as opposition members, scrutinise this scheme over the coming years, we will know exactly how many pounds, shillings and pence we are looking for. Of course, that is also what the local authorities are looking for because this is a fully reimbursed scheme. Clarification on the exact costs would be useful. However, at the end of the day, as we progress in gaining further powers in the Assembly, we will be able to legislate for child trust funds for our own children, here in Wales.

**Jane Hutt:** Thank you, Dai, I think that you have asked important questions about the implementation of the child trust fund and how we are going to use it and build on it, in terms of this reimbursement to local authorities for looked-after children.

On your question about the kinds of accounts that will be set up, I will just go over the way in which the scheme operates. Quite apart from our forthcoming involvement, you know that Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs is responsible for the policy and administration of the child trust fund accounts, and, for the majority of children, it is their parents who set up those accounts. All looked-after children born after 1 September 2002 who were looked after by the local authority on 6 April should have a child trust fund set up with a minimum payment of £500. I am not sure of the exact arrangements in terms of the types of accounts that you mentioned, but I will have to get back to you in writing and share that with the rest of the Members.

It is important to recognise that, for low-income families and looked-after children, there will be an extra payment for children aged seven, and that provides another £500. Therefore, there are means, and the Treasury is taking steps to build up that account. Clearly, the sum of £50 is a minimum; it is a starting point. You talk about what that equates to, and we have estimated that 460 children, at this point, in terms of eligibility, are eligible to receive £50 as a starting point, and that is in the Minister for Health and Social Services' health and social care budget. You will also have the opportunity to

yn sôn? Yr wyf yn gofyn hyn er mwyn i ni, aelodau'r wrthblaid, wrth graffu ar y cynllun hwn dros y blynyddoedd nesaf, wybod yn union faint o arian yr ydym yn chwilio amdano. Wrth gwrs, am hynny y mae'r awdurdodau lleol yn chwilio hefyd oherwydd bod hwn yn gynllun a ad-delir yn llwyr. Byddai eglurhad ynghylch yr union gostau yn ddefnyddiol. Fodd bynnag, yn y pen draw, wrth inni gamu ymlaen i ennill pwerau pellach yn y Cynulliad, byddwn yn gallu deddfu ar gyfer cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant i'n plant ein hunain, yma yng Nghymru.

**Jane Hutt:** Diolch ichi, Dai, credaf eich bod wedi gofyn cwestiynau pwysig ynghylch gweithredu'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant a sut yr ydym yn mynd i'w defnyddio ac adeiladu arni, o safbwynt yr ad-daliad hwn i awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Ynghylch eich cwestiwn am y mathau o gyfrifon a sefydlir, ymdriniaf â'r ffordd y mae'r cynllun yn gweithio. Yn gwbl ar wahân i'r ffordd y byddwn yn ymwneud â hyn maes o law, gwyddoch fod Cyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi yn gyfrifol am bolisi a gweinyddu cyfrifon y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, ac, i'r rhan fwyaf o'r plant, eu rhieni sy'n sefydlu'r cyfrifon hynny. Dylai fod cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, gydag isafswm o daliad o £500, yn cael ei sefydlu ar gyfer pob plentyn sy'n derbyn gofal a aned ar ôl 1 Medi 2002 a oedd dan ofal yr awdurdod lleol ar 6 Ebrill. Nid wyf yn sicr o'r union drefniadau o safbwynt y mathau o gyfrifon y soniasoch amdanynt, ond bydd yn rhaid imi ddychwelyd atoch yn ysgrifenedig a rhannu hynny gyda gweddill yr Aelodau.

Mae'n bwysig cydnabod y bydd taliad ychwanegol ar gael i blant saith oed, ar gyfer teuluoedd incwm isel a phlant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac mae'r taliad hwnnw'n rhoi £500 arall. O'r herwydd, mae moddion ar gael, ac mae'r Trysorlys yn cymryd camau i gynyddu'r cyfrif hwnnw. Yn amlwg, lleiafswm yw'r £50; man cychwyn ydyw. Yr ydych yn sôn am yr hyn y mae hynny'n cyfateb iddo, ac yr ydym wedi amcangyfrif bod 460 o blant, ar hyn o bryd, o safbwynt cymhwysedd, yn gymwys i gael £50 fel man cychwyn, ac mae hynny yng nghyllideb iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol y Gweinidog

scrutinise and question your local authorities and, indeed, through the Minister and me, the schedule of social services statistics to see whether those children have been registered and whether they, and the local authorities, are now eligible to receive that reimbursement grant.

There is an issue of understanding eligibility, because, clearly, this is the outcome of extensive consultation with local authorities on the merits and practicalities of how they should take this forward. It was felt, as I said in my statement, that this is about how we can look at the issues relating to permanency and recognising that this is important. I think that it was felt that the period of six calendar months is an indication—the permanency starts to appear after the review following the four-month period. I appreciate your point about children who may go in and out of care; I think that we will find that, if that is the situation, a plan for permanency would emerge as a duty and responsibility, and I would hope, then, that that would enable the child to meet the criteria in terms of the six-month review. I will certainly go back and look at whether this can be accumulative, but I know that that was the view as a result of extensive consultation, in terms of the practicalities of administering this equitably and reaching the most vulnerable children.

**Mark Isherwood:** Conservatives in Westminster supported the principle of the child trust fund and worked with the UK Government to improve it, rather than oppose it for the sake of opposition. We welcomed the UK Government's decision to accept most of the changes proposed by the Conservatives at the Bill's Second Reading. Welsh Conservatives also supported the proposal to require Welsh local authorities to provide an annual contribution to the child trust funds of children who are looked after by them. We therefore welcome this statement as confirmation that local authorities will be reimbursed for the apparently low costs incurred.

dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Cewch gyfle hefyd i holi eich awdurdodau lleol a chraffu arnynt ac, yn wir, drwy'r Gweinidog a minnau, atodlen ystadegau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i weld a yw'r plant hynny wedi eu cofrestru, ac a ydynt hwy, a'r awdurdodau lleol, yn awr yn gymwys i gael y grant ad-daliad hwnnw.

Mae cwestiwn yn codi ynghylch deall cymhwysedd, oherwydd, yn amlwg, mae hyn yn ffrwyth ymgynghori helaeth gydag awdurdodau lleol ynghylch rhinweddau ac agweddau ymarferol sut y dylent fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Teimlid, fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad, fod hyn yn ymwneud â sut y gallwn edrych ar faterion sy'n ymwneud â pharhad a chydabod bod hyn yn bwysig. Teimlid yn fy marn i fod y cyfnod o chwe mis calendr yn rhoi rhyw syniad—mae'r parhad yn dechrau ymddangos ar ôl yr adolygiad wedi'r cyfnod pedwar mis. Yr wyf yn deall eich pwynt ynghylch plant sydd o bosibl yn mynd i mewn ac allan o'r system ofal; credaf y byddwn yn canfod, os mai hynny fydd y sefyllfa, y byddai cynllun parhad yn deillio o hynny fel dyletswydd a chyfrifoldeb, a byddwn yn gobeithio, wedyn, y byddai hynny'n galluogi'r plentyn i fodloni'r meini prawf o ran yr adolygiad wedi chwe mis. Byddaf yn bendant yn dychwelyd ac yn edrych a all hyn fod yn gronnol, ond gwn mai hynny oedd y safbwynt o ganlyniad i ymgynghori'n eang, o ran yr agweddau ymarferol ynglŷn â gweinyddu hyn yn deg a chyrraedd y plant mwyaf agored i niwed.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cefnogodd y Ceidwadwyr yn San Steffan egwyddor y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant gan weithio gyda Llywodraeth y DU i'w gwella, yn hytrach na'i gwrthwynebu er mwyn gwrthwynebu. Yr oeddem yn croesawu penderfyniad Llywodraeth y DU i dderbyn y rhan fwyaf o'r newidiadau a gynigiwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr yn Ail Ddarlleniad y Mesur. Cefnogodd Ceidwadwyr Cymru hefyd y cynnig i fynnu bod awdurdodau lleol Cymru yn rhoi cyfraniad blynyddol i gronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant y plant sy'n derbyn gofal ganddynt. O'r herwydd, croesawn y datganiad hwn fel cadarnhad y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn cael eu had-dalu am y costau sydd, i bob golwg, yn isel.

What measures will the Minister pursue should any local authorities fail to participate in this non-legislative scheme? Also, will she tell us whether the upward trend in the number of looked-after children has been included in the figures that she given us, and what administrative costs, if any, will be incurred by local authorities in managing this scheme?

Since the child trust fund was launched, a third of parents in the wider community who have been issued with vouchers have failed to use them to open any form of savings account, and that is despite the fact that the Government automatically invests the vouchers on a child's behalf when the 12-month deadline for parents to use them has expired. What figures, if any, does the Minister have for take-up across Wales, and what action will the Welsh Assembly Government take, acting alone or with the UK Government, to promote the better take-up of the vouchers and their investment?

3.30 p.m.

What target has been set for the proportion of accounts that the Assembly Government would like to see opened by parents? What discussions have been held with the child trust fund providers, investors, banks, building societies, and so on concerning the promotion of the scheme to current and potential customers, whether parents or local authorities? What discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government held with the UK Government concerning the potential for greater flexibility within a child trust fund, so that it can be more responsive to people's needs throughout their lives?

Finally, prior to becoming Conservative Party leader, David Cameron secured a promise from UK Government Ministers that child trust funds could be used to provide extra help for parents with disabled children. What action has been taken to promote this in Wales and beyond, and what progress has been made in Wales on that key matter?

Pa gamau a ddilynir gan y Gweinidog os digwydd i unrhyw awdurdodau lleol fethu â chyfranogi yn y cynllun anneddfwriaethol hwn? Hefyd, a gafodd y cynnydd yn nifer y plant sy'n derbyn gofal ei gynnwys yn y ffigurau a roddodd inni, a pha gostau gweinyddol, os oes rhai, a fydd gan awdurdodau lleol wrth reoli'r cynllun hwn?

Ers lansio'r gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, mae traean y rhieni yn y gymuned ehangach a gafodd dalebau heb eu defnyddio i agor unrhyw fath o gyfrif cynilo, ac mae hyn er gwaethaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn buddsoddi'r talebau yn awtomatig ar ran y plentyn pan ddaw'r cyfnod 12 mis i'r rhieni eu defnyddio i ben. Pa ffigurau, os oes rhai, sydd gan y Gweinidog ar gyfer y cyfranogwyr ar draws Cymru, a pha gamau y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd, gan weithredu ar ei phen ei hun neu gyda Llywodraeth y DU, i hybu gwell cyfranogaeth o ran y cynllun talebau a buddsoddi'r talebau?

Pa darged sydd wedi ei bennu ar gyfer y gyfran o gyfrifon yr hoffai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei gweld yn cael eu hagog gan rieni? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cynnal gyda darparwyr y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, buddsoddwyr, banciau, cymdeithasau adeiladu ac yn y blaen ynglŷn â hyrwyddo'r cynllun i gwsmeriaid cyfredol a phosibl, boed y rheini'n rhieni neu'n awdurdodau lleol? Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â'r potensial i gael mwy o hyblygrwydd o fewn cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, er mwyn iddi allu bod yn fwy ymatebol i anghenion pobl drwy gydol eu hoes?

Yn olaf, cyn iddo ddod yn arweinydd y Blaid Geidwadol, llwyddodd David Cameron i sicrhau addewid gan Weinidogion Llywodraeth Prydain y gellid defnyddio cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant i roi cymorth ychwanegol i rieni sydd â phlant anabl. Pa gamau a gymerwyd i hyrwyddo hyn yng Nghymru a'r tu hwnt, a pha gynnydd a wnaethpwyd yng Nghymru ar y mater

allweddol hwnnw?

**Jane Hutt:** It was a Labour Chancellor who pioneered the child trust fund scheme in an inclusive way, as you described. It is a pioneering scheme in addressing the deficit in opportunities that so many looked-after children suffer. We are responsible for them, as corporate parents, particularly when they reach the crucial age of 18 when they can take advantage of further or higher education, and opportunities for transition into adulthood. On the numbers that we are discussing, we identified that the first eligible cohort would be about 10 per cent of the population of looked-after children in Wales. We hope that that trend will fall. We know that we have to address those measures in a far wider policy perspective, and we are doing that. Indeed, we are putting £1 million into the education of looked-after children, and we must see the child trust fund as only one part of a whole, in terms of the important work also carried out by Children First.

Local authorities, in delivering their statutory duties and responsibilities to looked-after children, not just their corporate parenting responsibilities, will want to ensure that looked-after children are not disadvantaged when leaving care, and that they have some element of financial security of their own to assist them in the transition to adulthood. Therefore, local authorities will welcome the new arrangement. It is important that it is a simple scheme; its administration is the most straightforward that we could seek, and it operates in a practical and transparent way. The Welsh Local Government Association and local authorities have been fully on board in how we have developed the scheme.

You asked wider questions about issues with the take-up of child trust funds. If you were to look at UK Government figures, you would see that, since last year, approximately 2.5 million vouchers have been sent out. Savings accounts must then be opened for children, but the UK Government automatically sets up default accounts for children on their first birthday if their parents

**Jane Hutt:** Canghellor y Blaid Lafur oedd yn gyfrifol am ddatblygu cynllun y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant mewn ffordd gynhwysol, fel y disgrifiwyd gennych. Mae'n gynllun arloesol gan ei fod yn rhoi sylw i'r diffyg cyfleoedd sydd ar gael i gynifer o blant sy'n derbyn gofal. Yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt, fel rhieni corfforaethol, yn enwedig pan fyddant yn cyrraedd yr oed allweddol, 18, a hwythau'n gallu manteisio ar addysg bellach neu uwch, a chyfleoedd i ddatblygu'n oedolion. O ran y niferoedd yr ydym yn eu trafod, gwelwyd y byddai'r garfan gymwys gyntaf yn cyfrif am tua 10 y cant o boblogaeth y plant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru. Gobeithiwn y bydd y duedd honno'n gostwng. Gwyddom fod rhaid inni roi sylw i'r mesurau hynny o safbwynt polisi llawer ehangach, ac yr ydym yn gwneud hynny. Yn wir, yr ydym yn neilltuo £1 miliwn i addysg plant sy'n derbyn gofal, a rhaid inni edrych ar y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant fel un rhan yn unig o'r cyfan, o ran y gwaith pwysig a wneir gan Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf hefyd.

Bydd yr awdurdodau lleol, wrth gyflawni eu dyletswyddau a'u cyfrifoldebau statudol tuag at blant sy'n derbyn gofal, ac nid eu cyfrifoldebau rhianta corfforaethol yn unig, am sicrhau nad yw plant sy'n derbyn gofal o dan anfantais pan fyddant yn gadael gofal, a bod ganddynt ryw gymaint o sicrwydd ariannol eu hunain i'w cynorthwyo wrth iddynt ddatblygu'n oedolion. Felly, bydd awdurdodau lleol yn croesawu'r trefniant newydd. Mae'n bwysig iddo fod yn gynllun syml; mae'n cael ei weinyddu yn y ffordd fwyaf syml posibl, ac mae'n gweithio mewn ffordd ymarferol a thryloyw. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru a'r awdurdodau lleol wedi bod yn gwbl gefnogol i'r ffordd yr ydym wedi datblygu'r cynllun.

Gofynasoch gwestiynau mwy cyffredinol ynglŷn â materion yn ymwneud â'r niferoedd sy'n manteisio ar gronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant. Pe baech yn edrych ar ffigurau Llywodraeth y DU, byddech yn gweld, ers y llynedd, fod tua 2.5 miliwn o dalebau wedi eu dosbarthu. Yna rhaid agor cyfrifon cynilo i blant, ond mae Llywodraeth y DU yn sefydlu cyfrifon fel mater o drefn yn awtomatig i



have failed to do so. That is an important point as regards the Treasury's engagement in this.

We talked about accounts earlier on, and another development in Wales is the link with the credit unions. The UK Government passed legislation in the spring of last year enabling credit unions to provide a child trust fund savings product. That was identified as an opportunity for families who do not have bank accounts and who are not used to setting up accounts. With the support of the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, we are supporting two pilot schemes with credit unions. One scheme is with Loans and Savings Abertawe Credit Union in Swansea and the other with Dragon Savers in Treorchy, which enable and support families in those communities to invest in the local credit union.

It is important that we look at the wider issues of the child trust fund with our colleagues in the UK Government, and you mentioned issues relating to disabled children and more opportunities. We must ensure that the new scheme in Wales is successful, and that every Assembly Member can engage with it, in contact with their local authority and by scrutiny in committee. It will be identified in a schedule to social services statistics, and it is a real opportunity that we must build on in our child poverty action plan.

**Jenny Randerson:** Thank you for your statement. When this matter was first raised, the concern of the Welsh Liberal Democrats was that it could be taking money away from other worthy—indeed, obligatory—social services schemes in Wales and we were concerned that there would be additional pressure on social services budgets, which we all know are already hard-pressed. I am, therefore, pleased to see that you intend to reimburse local authorities and I welcome the details that you have given us about that. I would like your reassurance that we will have permanent and clearly identified funding for local authorities, and that local authorities having to identify those who have benefited

blant pan fyddant yn flwydd oed os nad yw eu rhieni wedi gwneud hynny. Mae hyn yn bwynt pwysig o ran cysylltiad y Trysorlys â hyn.

Soniasom am gyfrifon yn gynharach, a datblygiad arall yng Nghymru yw'r cysylltiad gydag undebau credyd. Pasiwyd deddfwriaeth gan Lywodraeth y DU yn ystod y gwanwyn y llynedd yn galluogi undebau credyd i ddarparu cyfleusterau cynilo cronfeydd ymddiriedolaeth plant. Gwelid bod hynny'n gyfle i deuluoedd heb gyfrifon banc ac sy'n anghyfarwydd ag agor cyfrifon. Gyda chefnogaeth y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, yr ydym yn cefnogi dau gynllun peilot gydag undebau credyd. Mae un cynllun gydag Undeb Credyd Loans and Savings Abertawe yn Abertawe ac mae'r llall gyda Dragon Savers yn Nhreorci, sy'n galluogi ac yn cefnogi teuluoedd yn y cymunedau hynny i fuddsoddi yn yr undeb credyd lleol.

Mae'n bwysig inni edrych ar y cwestiynau ehangach ynghylch y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn Llywodraeth y DU, a soniasoch am faterion yn ymwneud â phlant anabl a mwy o gyfleoedd. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cynllun newydd yng Nghymru'n llwyddiannus, a bod pob Aelod o'r Cynulliad yn gallu ymwneud ag ef, mewn cysylltiad â'u hawdurdod lleol a thrwy graffu arno yn y pwyllgor. Bydd yn cael ei nodi mewn atodlen i ystadegau'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac mae'n gyfle pwysig y mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu arno yn ein cynllun gweithredu ar dlodi plant.

**Jenny Randerson:** Diolch i chi am eich datganiad. Pan godwyd y mater hwn gyntaf, pryder Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru oedd y gallai fod yn mynd ag arian oddi ar gynlluniau clodwiw eraill gan y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol—rhai ohonynt yn rhai gorfodol, yn wir—yng Nghymru ac yr oeddem yn bryderus y byddai'n rhoi pwysau ychwanegol ar gyllidebau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol sydd, fel y gwyddom, eisoes yn ei chael yn anodd. Yr wyf, felly, yn falch o weld eich bod yn bwriadu digolledu awdurdodau lleol a chroesawaf y manylion yr ydych wedi eu rhoi inni ynglŷn â hynny. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gennych y bydd gennym gyllid parhaol a phenodol i

from the fund in a schedule will be a permanent feature of the process so that we do not have the situation that we have had with so many other new initiatives, namely that, over time, it becomes totally lost within the rest of the budget and is regarded as yet another pressure and used as an alternative outlet perhaps for funding that would otherwise go to other aspects of the budget.

It is not a massive amount of money: it is £23,000, roughly, if your figures are correct, Minister. However, it is a significant amount of money in some terms, and it is worth looking at the details of how it will work from the point of view of the local authorities affected.

I ask for your explanation of some of the figures. You mentioned that, originally, some 650 children would have benefited but that that would have included children spending short periods in care and those placed with their birth parents. You then go on to say that the new figure is 460, which is approximately 10 per cent of those in care. You then say,

‘Each year an additional 200 children on average will benefit from the...contribution’.

Could you explain how you reached that figure of 200 and whether you are including in it new people who did not receive it the previous year and so on? One would like reassurance that these figures are accurate. I look forward to further detail when you get to the point of looking at powers under the Government of Wales Bill, to see how you could use those additional powers to require local authorities to make annual contributions. That issue of the power to give directions to local authorities has been raised in several different guises recently—for example, in relation to school meals, and it is now raised in this respect. Therefore, one would welcome the Minister giving us some guidance on when she is planning to seek these powers.

**Jane Hutt:** We remember the Liberal

awdurdodau lleol, ac y bydd yn nodwedd barhaol ar y broses fod awdurdodau lleol yn gorfod nodi'r rhai sydd wedi elwa o'r gronfa mewn atodlen fel na fyddwn yn y sefyllfa yr ydym wedi bod ynddi o'r blaen yn achos cynifer o fentrau newydd eraill, sef eu bod, dros amser, yn cael eu colli'n llwyr o fewn gweddill y gyllideb a'u bod yn cael eu hystyried yn bwysau ychwanegol ac yn cael eu defnyddio o bosibl fel ffynhonnell arall ar gyfer arian a fyddai fel arall yn cael ei wario ar agweddau eraill ar y gyllideb.

Nid yw'n swm enfawr: tua £23,000, os yw eich ffigurau'n gywir, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, mae'n swm sylweddol o arian mewn rhai ffyrdd, ac mae'n werth edrych ar y manylion o ran sut y bydd yn gweithio o safbwynt yr awdurdodau lleol yr effeithir arnynt.

Gofynnaf am esboniad gennych ar rai o'r ffigurau. Soniasoch, yn wreiddiol, y byddai tua 650 o blant wedi elwa ond y byddai hynny'n cynnwys plant sy'n treulio cyfnodau byr mewn gofal a rhai sy'n cael eu lleoli gyda'u rhieni biolegol. Yr ydych wedyn yn dweud mai 460 yw'r ffigur newydd, sydd tua 10 y cant o'r rhai sydd mewn gofal. Yna yr ydych yn dweud,

Bob blwyddyn bydd 200 o blant ychwanegol, ar gyfartaledd, yn elwa o'r...cyfraniad.

A allwch esbonio sut y cawsoch y ffigur hwnnw, 200, ac a ydych yn cynnwys pobl newydd ynddo nas cawsant yn y flwyddyn flaenorol ac yn y blaen? Hoffwn gael sicrwydd bod y ffigurau hyn yn gywir. Edrychaf ymlaen at gael rhagor o fanylion pan fyddwch yn mynd ati i edrych ar bwerau o dan Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru, i weld sut y gallech ddefnyddio'r pwerau ychwanegol hynny i'w gwneud yn orfodol i awdurdodau lleol wneud cyfraniadau blynyddol. Mae mater y pŵer i roi cyfarwyddiadau i awdurdodau lleol wedi ei godi mewn sawl maes yn ddiweddar—er enghraifft, o ran cinio ysgol, ac yn awr mae'n cael ei godi yn y cyd-destun hwn. Felly, byddwn yn croesawu rhyw arweiniad gan y Gweinidog ynglŷn â pha bryd y mae'n bwriadu ceisio cael y pwerau hyn.

**Jane Hutt:** Cofiw'n wrthwynebiad y

Democrats' opposition to the child trust fund scheme, and I think that you abstained on the vote in the debate that we had in terms of the feasibility study. However, I welcome the positive contribution that you have made today because, as an Assembly, we should be proud of our opportunities to take forward and build on a scheme from a Labour Government in Westminster to reach out to the most vulnerable children, for whom we are responsible.

You asked some important questions, such as ensuring that this schedule of statistics identifies the number of children who will benefit. I said in my statement that local authorities will be required to submit an annual schedule of all children who have benefited from a CTF contribution. 'Required' is an important word in this context, as we would like to require local authorities to have the scheme, but we are requiring them to submit an annual schedule. We can do that under section 7 of the Local Authority Social Services Act 1970. Therefore, I think that it will provide a very robust opportunity for scrutiny, to identify which local authorities sign up and commit to this new scheme.

3.40 p.m.

Your questions on the numbers are important. That does go back to the criteria and the fact that we have consulted extensively to come to the figure of 460 children for this year. This is being implemented from September 2006.

On Dai Lloyd's question, this is about ensuring that we are taking it from the six-month point, when there is the most clarity about the likely permanency of arrangements for children in care. The estimate of the 200, on average, relates to the full year, but I will come back to Jenny on that, if I am not right.

On taking the opportunities offered by the Government of Wales Bill forward, there are many things that the Assembly Chamber is looking forward to doing in terms of what will be included in political-party manifestos.

Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gynllun y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant, a chredaf ichi ymatal yn y bleidlais yn y ddadl a gafwyd ar yr astudiaeth ddichonoldeb. Fodd bynnag, croesawaf y cyfraniad positif yr ydych wedi ei wneud heddiw oherwydd, fel Cynulliad, dylem ymfalchïo yn ein cyfleoedd i fwrw ymlaen â chynllun gan Lywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan ac adeiladu arno i gyrraedd at y plant mwyaf agored i niwed, yr ydym yn gyfrifol amdanynt.

Yr ydych wedi gofyn rhai cwestiynau pwysig, megis sicrhau bod yr atodlen ystadegau hon yn nodi nifer y plant a fydd yn elwa. Dywedais yn fy natganiad y bydd yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol gyflwyno atodlen flynyddol o bob plentyn sydd wedi elwa o gyfraniad cronfa ymddiriedolaeth plant. Mae 'gofynnol' yn air pwysig yn y cyd-destun hwn, gan y byddem yn hoffi ei gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol weithredu'r cynllun, ond yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol iddynt gyflwyno atodlen flynyddol. Gallwn wneud hynny o dan adran 7 Deddf Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Awdurdodau Lleol 1970. Felly, credaf y bydd yn gyfle da i graffu, i ganfod pa awdurdodau lleol sy'n ymuno â'r cynllun newydd hwn ac yn ymrwymo i'w gyflwyno.

Mae eich cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r niferoedd yn bwysig. Mae hynny'n mynd yn ôl at y meini prawf a'r ffaith ein bod wedi ymgynghori'n eang i gael y ffigur o 460 o blant ar gyfer eleni. Bydd hyn yn cael ei weithredu o fis Medi 2006 ymlaen.

Ynglŷn â chwestiwn Dai Lloyd, mae hyn yn ymwneud â sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio chwe mis yn sail, pan fo pethau ar eu mwyaf eglur ynglŷn â pha mor barhaol y mae'r trefniadau'n debygol o fod ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Mae'r amcangyfrif o 200, ar gyfartaledd, yn cyfeirio at y flwyddyn gyfan, ond dof yn ôl at Jenny ynglŷn â hynny, os nad wyf yn gywir.

O ran manteisio ar y cyfleoedd sy'n dod yn sgîl Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, mae llawer o bethau y mae Siambr y Cynulliad yn edrych ymlaen at eu gwneud o ran yr hyn a gaiff ei gynnwys ym maniffestos y pleidiau

However, as a Government, we want to take this forward and use our powers to require local authorities to make annual contributions under the new legislative arrangements.

gwleidyddol. Fodd bynnag, fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym am fwrw ymlaen â hyn a defnyddio ein pwerau i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i awdurdodau lleol wneud cyfraniadau blynyddol o dan y trefniadau deddfwriaethol newydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Carl Sargeant wishes to raise a point of order.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae Carl Sargeant yn dymuno codi pwynt o drefn.

**Carl Sargeant:** As I intend to mention the name of a Member who is currently absent from the Chamber, is it appropriate to raise it now?

**Carl Sargeant:** Gan fy mod yn bwriadu enwi Aelod sy'n absennol o'r Siambr ar hyn o bryd, a yw'n briodol ei godi yn awr?

**The Presiding Officer:** No, the convention would be to inform the Member, so you do not wish to raise it at this stage.

**Y Llywydd:** Nac ydyw, y confensiwn fyddai hysbysu'r Aelod, felly nid ydych yn dymuno'i godi ar hyn o bryd.

**Carl Sargeant:** No.

**Carl Sargeant:** Nac ydwyf.

### **Cymeradwyo Deddfwriaeth o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25 Approval of Legislation under Standing Order No. 24.25**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006 on the draft the Plant Health (Wales) Order 2006; and*

*1) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006 ynglŷn â'r Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iechyd Planhigion (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2) approves that the Plant Health (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with*

*2) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Iechyd Planhigion (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006;*

*a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 May 2006; and*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Mai 2006; ac*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006. (NDM3095)*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3095)*

*Cynnig (NDM3095): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3095): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006,  
a Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006  
Approval of the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations  
2006, and the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

Motion (NDM3096): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3096): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point:

*believes that the composition of the residential property tribunal should represent public-private sector balance.*

Motion (NDM3097): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

*2. approves that the draft the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006; and*

*b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006; and*

*c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 May 2006.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM3096 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006. (NDM3096).*

I propose that

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006.*

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

*yn credu y dylid sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat yng nghyfansoddiad y tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl.*

Cynnig (NDM3097): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006; a*

*b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006; ac*

*c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Mai 2006.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 to NDM3096 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006. (NDM3096).*

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *approves that the draft the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006; and*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006; a*

b) *the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006; and*

b) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006; ac*

c) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 May 2006. (NDM3097)*

c) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Mai 2006. (NDM3097)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 23 May 2006. (NDM3098)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor y rheoliadau, Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006. (NDM3098)*

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 6 June 2006 in relation to the draft the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and*

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 6 Mehefin 2006 ynglŷn â'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006; a*

2. *approves that the draft the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006; and*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006; a*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 31 May 2006. (NDM3099)*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 31 Mai 2006. (NDM3099)*

I will not speak now, but will exercise my right to reply, Presiding Officer.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 1 to NDM3096 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add as a new point:

*believes that the composition of the residential property tribunal should represent public-private sector balance.*

Although it has not been possible to propose an amendment to the Order before us today, as the enabling legislation has been passed and the regulations have been laid, the Welsh representative on the National Federation of Registered Landlords has asked me to propose an amendment to the principle of these regulations, asking the Assembly to state its belief that the composition of the residential property tribunal should represent public-private sector balance. Landlords are conscious that precedent indicates inevitable, if unintentional, bias when purely public sector bodies adjudicate on disputes involving public and private sector bodies. Equally, it will apply in reverse, if exclusively private sector tribunal membership is asked to adjudicate.

The Housing Act 2004 set a dangerous precedent perhaps in requiring or empowering the state to interfere with an individual's property. The Human Rights Act 1998 has made it necessary for a system of appeals against decisions, by referral to an independent tribunal. We will, therefore, support these regulations because without them, the public would have no mechanism for challenging local authority decisions. It is proposed that the tribunals will consist of three members: a professionally qualified chair, who is usually legally qualified; an expert, who is usually a building surveyor or management consultant; and a lay member with relevant practical experience. Within these parameters, there is apparently no restriction, unless the Minister can confirm otherwise, to prevent the tribunal from comprising exclusively public or private sector members. It is not anticipated that there will be any cost to the measure

Nid wyf am siarad yn awr, ond byddaf yn arfer fy hawl i ateb, Lywydd.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiau welliant 1 i NDM3096 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

*yn credu y dylid sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat yng nghyfansoddiad y tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl.*

Er nad yw wedi bod yn bosibl cynnig gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn sydd gerbron heddiw, gan fod y ddeddfwriaeth alluogi wedi ei phasio a bod y rheoliadau wedi eu cyflwyno, mae cynrychiolydd Cymru ar Ffederasiwn Cenedlaethol y Landlordiaid Cofrestredig wedi gofyn imi gynnig gwelliant i egwyddor y rheoliadau hyn, sy'n gofyn i'r Cynulliad ddatgan ei fod yn credu y dylid sicrhau cydbwysedd rhwng y sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat yng nghyfansoddiad y tribiwnlys eiddo preswyl. Mae landlordiaid yn ymwybodol bod cynsail yn dangos gogwydd anochel, os anfwriadol, pan fydd cyrff o'r sector cyhoeddus yn unig yn dyfarnu ar anghydfodau sy'n cynnwys cyrff o'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat. Yn yr un modd, bydd yn gweithio y ffordd arall, os bydd gofyn i dribiwnlys sy'n cynnwys aelodau o'r sector preifat yn unig ddyfarnu.

Gosododd Deddf Tai 2004 gynsail peryglus o bosibl drwy fynnu bod y wladwriaeth yn ymyrryd ag eiddo unigolion neu'n ei galluogi i wneud hynny. Mae Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 wedi ei gwneud yn angenrheidiol cael system apelio yn erbyn penderfyniadau, drwy gyfeirio at dribiwnlys annibynnol. Byddwn, felly, yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn oherwydd hebddynt, ni fyddai gan y cyhoedd gyfrwng i herio penderfyniadau awdurdodau lleol. Cynigir y bydd y tribiwnlysoedd yn cynnwys tri aelod: cadeirydd sydd â chymwysterau proffesiynol, sydd fel arfer â chymwysterau cyfreithiol; arbenigwr, sydd fel arfer yn syrfëwr adeiladau neu ymgynghorydd rheoli; ac aelod lleig sydd â phrofiad ymarferol perthnasol. O fewn y paramedrau hyn, ymddengys nad oes dim cyfyngiad, oni bai fod y Gweinidog yn gallu cadarnhau i'r gwrthwyneb, sy'n rhwystru'r tribiwnlys rhag cynnwys aelodau o'r sector cyhoeddus neu'r sector preifat yn unig. Ni ragwelir y bydd



proposed in this amendment, but any costs incurred should be no different to those already incurred in appointing a tribunal, as is already proposed in these regulations. However, as stated, were any residential property tribunals to comprise only either public or private sector members, a conflict of interest or subjective bias could arise, giving undue advantage to other public or private sector applicants or appellants.

My party has been supportive of greater protection for vulnerable people living in houses of multiple occupation that do not meet acceptable health and safety standards, but we are concerned that regulations should not be excessively burdensome for responsible landlords, because that could restrict the availability of affordable rented accommodation and increase the cost of housing for those on low incomes. In this context, I highlight the judicial review in Belfast High Court which resulted in victory for the Landlords Association of Northern Ireland, and which ordered that the entire set of regulations relating to the registration of houses in multiple occupation with control provisions be re-written. Although this ruling is not binding in courts in England and Wales, this is a persuasive authority to which a court may be referred. I conclude by urging the Welsh Assembly Government to give consideration to this judicial review when asking the Assembly to vote on further commencement Orders to implement the licensing regime under the Housing Act 2004 in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats are generally in favour of the regulations, and see no reason why the amendment should not also be carried. We have one question for the Minister. We note that the fees have been altered. Can the Minister tell us where the fees go, what they are used for, and what percentage of the total cost of an appeal they account for?

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** With regard to Mick Bates's question, I will have to get further details in order to respond to you about the percentage that you mentioned; I

cost ynghlwm â'r mesur a gynigir yn y gwelliant hwn, ond ni ddylai costau sy'n codi fod yn wahanol i'r rhai sy'n codi eisoes wrth benodi tribiwnlys, fel sy'n cael ei gynnis eisoes yn y rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedwyd, pe bai unrhyw dribiwnlysoedd eiddo preswyl yn cynnwys aelodau o'r sector cyhoeddus neu'r sector preifat yn unig, gallai gwrthdaro buddiannau neu ogwydd goddrychol godi, gan roi mantais annheg i ymgeiswyr neu apelwyr eraill o'r sector cyhoeddus neu breifat.

Mae fy mhlaid wedi cefnogi mesurau gwell i ddiogelu pobl agored i niwed sy'n byw mewn cartrefi amlfeddiannaeth nad ydynt yn bodloni safonau derbyniol o ran iechyd a diogelwch, ond yr ydym yn bryderus na ddylai rheoliadau fod yn ormod o faich i landlordiaid cyfrifol, oherwydd gallai hynny gyfyngu ar y llety sydd ar gael am rent fforddiadwy a chynyddu cost tai i bobl ar incwm isel. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, tynnaf sylw at yr adolygiad barnwrol yn Uchel Lys Belfast a arweiniodd at fuddugoliaeth i Gymdeithas Landlordiaid Gogledd Iwerddon, ac a orchynnodd ailysgrifennu'r holl reoliadau ynglŷn â chofrestru tai amlfeddiannaeth gyda darpariaethau rheoli. Er nad yw'r dyfarniad hwn yn rhwymo llysoedd Cymru a Lloegr, mae hwn yn awdurdod argyhoeddiadol y gellir cyfeirio llys ato. I gloi, anogaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ystyried yr adolygiad barnwrol hwn pan ofynna i'r Cynulliad bleidleisio ar Orchmynion cychwyn pellach i roi'r drefn drwyddedu mewn grym dan Ddeddf Tai 2004 yng Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n gyffredinol o blaid y rheoliadau, ac ni welwn ddim rheswm pam na ddylid derbyn y gwelliant hefyd. Mae gennym un cwestiwn i'r Gweinidog. Sylwn fod y ffioedd wedi'u newid. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym i ble'r aiff y ffioedd, i beth y'u defnyddir, ac am ba ganran o gyfanswm cost apêl y maent yn cyfrif?

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Ynglŷn â chwestiwn Mick Bates, bydd rhaid imi gael manylion pellach er mwyn ymateb i chi ynghylch y ganran y soniasoch amdani; fe

will deal with that in writing. On the case of the amendment, section 229 of the Housing Act 2004 provides for any jurisdiction conferred on a residential property tribunal to be exercised by the rent assessment committee, constituted in accordance with Schedule 10 of the Rent Act 1977. Schedule 10 provides for the panels of persons to be appointed to act as a rent assessment committee. There are three panels. Chairs are normally solicitors and are appointed by the Department for Constitutional Affairs. Those on professional panels are usually chartered surveyors, and those on lay panels are people with no specific qualifications, but with a general interest in housing, and these people are appointed by the National Assembly for Wales. Appointments to all three panels are made on the basis of fair and open competition, following press advertisements for applicants with the appropriate qualifications. I believe that that is the best way to take matters forward, and I believe that the amendment tabled by the Welsh Conservatives is unnecessary, and I ask the Assembly to support the regulations unamended.

ddeliaf â hynny yn ysgrifenedig. Ynglŷn â'r gwelliant, mae adran 229 Deddf Tai 2004 yn darparu bod unrhyw awdurdodaeth a roddir i dribiwnlys eiddo preswyl yn cael ei harfer gan y pwyllgor asesu rhenti, a gyfansoddir yn unol ag Atodlen 10 Deddf Rhenti 1977. Mae Atodlen 10 yn darparu ar gyfer penodi'r paneli o bobl i weithredu fel pwyllgor asesu rhenti. Ceir tri phanel. Bydd y cadeiryddion fel rheol yn gyfreithwyr ac fe'u penodir gan yr Adran Materion Cyfansoddiadol. Syrfewyr siartredig fydd aelodau paneli proffesiynol fel rheol, a bydd aelodau paneli lleyg yn bobl heb ddim cymwysterau penodol, ond sydd â diddordeb cyffredinol mewn tai, a phenodir y bobl hyn gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Penodir i'r tri phanel ar sail cystadleuaeth deg ac agored, ar ôl hysbysebu yn y wasg am ymgeiswyr â'r cymwysterau priodol. Credaf mai hynny yw'r ffordd orau i fynd ati, a chredaf fod y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd gan Geidwadwyr Cymru yn ddiangen, a gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gefnogi'r rheoliadau heb y gwelliant.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 36.  
Amendment 1: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 36.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3096): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3096): cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 May 2006.*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Mai 2006.*

*Cynnig (NDM3096): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Motion (NDM3096): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3097): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM3097): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3098): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3098): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3099): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM3099): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Carl Sargeant:** Last week, during the ‘Wales: A Vibrant Economy’ debate, Eleanor Burnham used what I would term inappropriate language in this Chamber. Those who know me know that it was language that I would certainly not use. The Liberal Democrats obviously feel that is appropriate language to use in Cardiff and in Westminster. Last week, Roger Williams was asked to withdraw the same term that was in our Record, published last week. This is the second time that I have asked Eleanor Burnham to be given some guidance on the language that she uses. Last time, I recall, she called my constituents in Flintshire ‘dregs’, which I think was also inappropriate. Under Standing Order No. 7.2, I ask for some guidance and I would ask you, Presiding Officer, to clarify the Member’s comments and perhaps ask her to withdraw the remark that she made last week.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, yn ystod y ddadl ar ‘Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu’, defnyddiodd Eleanor Burnham yr hyn y byddwn i’n ei alw’n iaith amhriodol yn y Siambr hon. Bydd y sawl sydd yn f’adnabod yn gwybod mai iaith ydoedd na fyddwn i’n ei defnyddio, yn sicr. Mae’r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn amlwg yn teimlo ei bod yn iaith briodol i’w defnyddio yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gofynnwyd i Roger Williams dynnu’n ôl yr un term ag a welwyd yn ein Cofnod, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Dyma’r ail waith imi ofyn am roi peth arweiniad i Eleanor Burnham ynghylch yr iaith a ddefnyddia. Y tro diwethaf, cofiaf iddi alw fy etholwyr yn sir y Fflint yn ‘wehilion’, a oedd hefyd yn amhriodol yn fy marn i. Dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 7.2, gofynnaf am arweiniad a gofynnaf i chi, Lywydd, egluro sylwadau’r Aelod ac efallai gofyn iddi dynnu’r sylw a wnaeth yr wythnos diwethaf yn ôl.

3.50 p.m.

**The Presiding Officer:** If anything disorderly was said last week, I did not hear it either here in the Chamber, or on my television set downstairs. Attention would have been drawn to it either by a Member of the Assembly or by colleagues on the presiding bench. Westminster has its rules and we have ours; it is the same with parliaments everywhere. I will read the Record and if I find anything of interest, I will inform you.

**Y Llywydd:** Os dywedwyd unrhyw beth amharchus yr wythnos diwethaf, ni chlywais hynny nac yma yn y Siambr, nac ar fy set deledu i lawr y grisiau. Byddai naill ai Aelod o’r Cynulliad neu gydweithwyr ar y fainc lywyddu wedi tynnu sylw ato. Mae gan San Steffan ei rheolau ac mae gennym ninnau ein rhai ni; mae yr un fath gyda seneddau ym mhob man. Fe ddarllenaf y Cofnod ac os canfyddaf unrhyw beth o ddiddordeb, rhoddaf wybod ichi.

### **Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid Cymru) Minority Party Debate (Plaid Cymru)**

#### **Darpariaeth Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans The Provision of Ambulance Services**

Motion (NDM3100): to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

Cynnig (NDM3100): cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| <p>1. acting in accordance with its powers under section 1 of the Inquiries Act 2005, causes an inquiry to be held into the provision of ambulance services in Wales;</p> <p>2. recommends that the terms of reference for the inquiry should be:</p> <p>a) to look at the effectiveness of performance standards, staffing issues, financial and resource pressures together with any other related matters considered relevant; and</p> <p>b) to consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly.</p> <p>3. The cost of the inquiry shall be borne by the Welsh Assembly Government.</p> | <p>1. gan weithredu'n unol â'i bwerau dan Adran 1 Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, yn peri i ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal i ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru;</p> <p>2. yn argymhell y dylai cylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad fod fel a ganlyn:</p> <p>a) edrych ar effeithiolrwydd safonau perfformiad, materion staffio, pwysau o ran arian ac adnoddau, ynghyd ag unrhyw faterion perthnasol eraill yr ystyrir eu bod yn berthnasol; a</p> <p>b) ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny.</p> <p>3. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ysgwyddo cost yr ymchwiliad.</p> |
|--|---|

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Cynnwys pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:

*calls for a panel, comprising the Assembly Minister for Health and Social Services, and one Member each from the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party, the Welsh Conservative Party and Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, to be convened for the purpose of recommending the name of a suitable person to chair the inquiry. The panel shall lay a report before the Assembly accordingly.*

*yn galw am gynnull panel, yn cynnwys Gweinidog y Cynulliad dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac un Aelod yr un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a Phlaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, at ddiben argymhell enw person cymwys i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad. Bydd y panel yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad yn unol â hynny.*

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Oherwydd y cyfyngiad amser ar gyfer y ddadl hon, bydd y cyfyngiadau arferol yn weithredol, sef 15 munud ar ran y rhai yn agor ac yn cloi'r ddadl, wyth munud ar ran y Llywodraeth, pum munud i'r rhai sy'n cynnig gwelliannau, a thri munud i bawb arall.

Due to the time constraints for this debate, the usual limits will apply, that is, 15 minutes for those opening and closing the debate, eight minutes for the Government, five minutes for those proposing amendments and three minutes for everyone else.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cynigiaf fod

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I propose that

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

1. gan weithredu'n unol â'i bwerau dan Adran 1 Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, yn peri i ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal i ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru;

1. acting in accordance with its powers under section 1 of the Inquiries Act 2005, causes an inquiry to be held into the provision of ambulance services in Wales;

2. yn argymhell y dylai cylch gorchwyl yr

2. recommends that the terms of reference for



*ymchwiliad fod fel a ganlyn:*

*a) edrych ar effeithiolrwydd safonau perfformiad, materion staffio, pwysau o ran arian ac adnoddau, ynghyd ag unrhyw faterion perthnasol eraill yr ystyrir eu bod yn berthnasol; a*

*b) ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny.*

*3. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ysgwyddo cost yr ymchwiliad. (NDM3100)*

Yn y cynnig hwn, galwn am ymchwiliad o dan adran 1 Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005 i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym yn nodi'r hyn y credwn y dylai fod yn gylch gorchwyl i'r ymchwiliad hwnnw. Bydd Plaid yn cefnogi gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams, sy'n galw, pe bai'r cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn, am i banel gael ei sefydlu i ystyried person addas i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad. Mae hynny'n dilyn yr un patrwm ag a sefydlwyd gydag ymchwiliad i E.coli.

Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig yn wyneb y cyhoeddusrwydd diweddar ynglŷn â'r argyfwng sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddweud bod pawb yn gwerthfawrogi cyfraniad y gweithwyr ambiwlans. Gwnânt waith cwbl amhrisiadwy. Gwyddom am eu gwaith fel gwasanaeth brys, a'u gwaith pwysig o gludo cleifion i'r ysbyty. Gwyddom hefyd fod lefel uchel o ymrwymiad, a werthfawrogi gan y cyhoedd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r ffordd y caiff gweithwyr ambiwlans Ynys Môn eu hystyried gan y cyhoedd. Mae'r cyhoedd yn derbyn bod gwaith pwysig iawn yn cael ei wneud ganddynt, sy'n cael ei werthfawrogi.

Serch hynny, mae problemau o safbwynt y gwasanaeth. Credaf fod pawb yn ymwybodol o hynny, a hynny ers tro. Gŵyr y Llywodraeth ei hun am rai o'r pryderon sydd wedi bod yn y gwasanaeth ers oddeutu dwy flynedd.

Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol, fel Aelod etholedig ym Môn, o rai o'r problemau sy'n wynebu'r gwasanaeth ar yr ynys. Cyfeiriais yr wythnos diwethaf at ddigwyddiad yng

*the inquiry should be:*

*a) to look at the effectiveness of performance standards, staffing issues, financial and resource pressures together with any other related matters considered relevant; and*

*b) to consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly.*

*3. The cost of the inquiry shall be borne by the Welsh Assembly Government. (NDM3100)*

In this motion, we call for an inquiry under section 1 of the Inquiries Act 2005 into the ambulance service in Wales. We have set out what we believe should be the remit of that inquiry. Plaid will support amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams, which calls, if this motion is carried, for a panel to be established to consider a suitable person to chair the inquiry. That follows the pattern that was established with the inquiry into E.coli.

This is an important debate in the light of the recent publicity surrounding the crisis facing the ambulance service. First, I would like to say that we all value the contribution of ambulance workers. They do work of immeasurable value. We know of their work as an emergency service, and their important work in transporting patients to hospital. We also know that there is a high level of commitment, which is appreciated by the public. I am aware of how ambulance workers in Anglesey are perceived by the public. The public accepts that extremely important work is done by them, which is appreciated.

However, there are problems with the service. I think that we are all aware of that, and have been aware of that for some time. The Government itself knows of some of the concerns that have existed within the service for about two years.

I am also aware, as an elected Member in Anglesey, of some of the problems facing the ambulance service on the island. I referred last week to an incident in Holyhead. For

Nghaergybi. Am dair noson yn olynol—nos Iau, nos Wener a nos Sadwrn—nid oedd unrhyw ambiwlans ar gael. O ystyried bod Caergybi yn orsaf 24 awr, mae pryder mawr yn yr ardal oherwydd hynny.

Cyfeiriais hefyd at y ffaith fod gorsafoedd eraill lle, yn anffodus, nad oes ond un parameddyg ar ddyletswydd un ai yn ystod y dydd neu dros nos. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth sydd o bryder i'r bobl sy'n gorfod gweithio ar eu pennau eu hunain. Yn aml, os digwydd rhywbeth, mae angen o leiaf ddau weithiwr yn bresennol.

Gwyddom hefyd fod pwysau ar y gwasanaeth oherwydd y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Gwyddom fod Galw Iechyd yn aml yn cyfeirio pobl at y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn hytrach na bod meddyg yn mynd allan i weld y cleifion. Dywed llawer o bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth bod mynd â rhywun i ysbyty o dan yr amgylchiadau hyn yn aml yn gwbl ddiangen ac yn creu problemau wedyn yn yr ysbyty.

Hefyd, yn ddiweddar, yr ydym wedi cael adroddiad Roger Thayne, sy'n dangos nifer o wendidau yn y gwasanaeth. Cyfeiriai yn fyr fel yr oedd y Prif Weinidog wedi cael y neges hon.

Yn gyntaf, mae diffyg buddsoddiad. Mae'r geiriau y mae Roger Thayne yn eu defnyddio yn galed. Mae'n dweud bod diffyg buddsoddiad i'r graddau bod y gwasanaeth yn beryglus, a'i fod bron â chwalu—'in danger of collapse' yw'r geiriau y mae'n eu defnyddio. Dywed hefyd fod hyd at 500 o fywydau o bosibl yn cael eu colli yn ddianghenraid oherwydd diffygion yn y system, ac mae hynny yn fater cwbl ddifrifol.

Gwyddom hefyd fod nifer o'r cerbydau a ddefnyddir a'r offer yn hen. Gwyddom fod rhai aelodau o'r staff yn prynu eu hoffer eu hunain oherwydd nad ydynt yn fodlon gweithio â'r offer a ddarperir iddynt. Yr ydym wedi clywed bod Roger Thayne yn dweud bod angen buddsoddiad cyfalaf o £35 miliwn i wneud iawn am y diffygion yn y gwasanaeth.

In his report, Roger Thayne makes it clear that the service requires a substantial sum of

three consecutive nights—Thursday, Friday and Saturday—there was no ambulance available. Bearing in mind that Holyhead is a 24-hour ambulance station, there is great concern in the area as a result.

I also referred to the fact that there are other ambulance stations where, unfortunately, there is only one paramedic on duty either during the day or during the night. That is a cause of concern for those people who have to work alone. Often, if something happens, at least two paramedics need to be present.

We also know that there is pressure on the service due to the out-of-hours service. We know that NHS Direct often refers people to the ambulance service rather than sending out a doctor to see them. Many people working in the service say that taking someone to hospital in those circumstances is often quite unnecessary and then creates problems in the hospital.

Also, recently, we have received Roger Thayne's report, which highlights many deficiencies in the service. I will refer briefly to how the First Minister received this message.

First, there is a lack of investment. The words that Roger Thayne uses are harsh. He says that there is a lack of investment to such an extent that the service is dangerous—'in danger of collapse' are the words that he uses. He also states that perhaps up to 500 lives are lost unnecessarily because of deficiencies in the system, and that is an extremely serious matter.

We also know that several of the vehicles used are old, as is the equipment. We know that some staff members buy their own equipment because they are unwilling to work with the equipment provided to them. We have heard that Roger Thayne says that capital investment of £35 million is required to put right the problems in the service.

Yn ei adroddiad, mae Roger Thayne yn ei gwneud yn glir fod ar y gwasanaeth angen

capital investment, £35 million, to

swm sylweddol o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf, sef £35 miliwn, er mwyn

‘tackle the current failings, to take on NHS Direct, realise its vision’—

mynd i’r afael â’r diffygion cyfredol, mynd i’r afael â Galw Iechyd, gwireddu ei weledigaeth—

that is, that of the ambulance service—

hynny yw, gweledigaeth y gwasanaeth ambiwlans—

‘and contribute fully to the “Designed for Life” strategy.’

a chyfrannu’n llawn at strategaeth “Cynllun Oes”.

As the Minister knows, because this report has been presented to him, the request for £35 million is fully costed, and there are at least seven or eight items—the Minister for Health and Social Services is shaking his head, so I will read them out to him. Roger Thayne refers to three control centre replacements at £10 million, a vehicle-tracking and satellite navigation system at £1 million, a computer-aided despatch system at £2 million, a computer-aided despatch system at £1.5 million, and so on. These are costed proposals that have been put to the Minister; I will be pleased to see what he does when he responds to that.

Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, gan fod yr adroddiad hwn wedi’i gyflwyno iddo, mae’r cais am £35 miliwn wedi’i gostio’n llawn, ac mae o leiaf saith neu wyth eitem—mae’r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ysgwyd ei ben, felly fe’u darllenaf yn uchel iddo. Mae Roger Thayne yn cyfeirio at dair canolfan reoli newydd am £10 miliwn, system tracio cerbydau a llywio lloeren am £1 filiwn, system anfon â chymorth cyfrifiadur am £2 filiwn, system anfon â chymorth cyfrifiadur am £1.5 miliwn, ac yn y blaen. Cynigion wedi’u costio yw’r rhain, sydd wedi’u cyflwyno i’r Gweinidog; byddaf yn falch o weld beth a wna pan ymateba i hynny.

In his report, Roger Thayne goes on to say that only £8 million has been earmarked. He says that

Yn ei adroddiad, aiff Roger Thayne ymlaen i ddweud mai dim ond £8 miliwn sydd wedi’i glustnodi. Dywed

‘The Welsh ambulance service does not and cannot in the near future provide a safe, responsive, reliable and clinically sound service to the public of Wales.’

nad yw gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru yn darparu gwasanaeth diogel, ymatebol, dibynadwy a chlinigol gadarn i bobl Cymru, ac na all wneud hynny yn y dyfodol agos.

We must take that kind of statement seriously. That is a statement from someone who has been an acting chief executive, and was appointed by this Government to that role. However, the Government’s response so far, Minister, has been extremely complacent, and it does not give us a sense that the Government recognises the urgency of making a proper response to this. That is why an inquiry is vital.

Rhaid inni gymryd y math hwnnw o ddatganiad o ddifrif. Mae hynny’n ddatganiad gan rywun sydd wedi bod yn brif weithredwr dros dro, ac a benodwyd gan y Llywodraeth hon i’r swydd honno. Fodd bynnag, mae ymateb y Llywodraeth hyd yn hyn, Weinidog, wedi bod yn hynod o hunanfodlon, ac nid yw’n peri inni deimlo bod y Llywodraeth yn sylweddoli’r angen brys i ymateb yn briodol i hyn. Dyna pam y mae’n rhaid wrth ymchwiliad.

Why is this inquiry needed? First, we must restore public confidence in the system. The facts are in dispute, so we must clarify them. If the facts are before us, in public, we can

Pam y mae angen yr ymchwiliad hwn? Yn gyntaf, rhaid inni adfer hyder y cyhoedd yn y system. Mae dadl ynglŷn â’r ffeithiau, felly rhaid inni eu cyflwyno’n glir. Os yw’r

judge whether or not the Government's response is satisfactory. In view of the public concern, I do not believe that any inquiry that the Government wants to make should be done behind closed doors. As Helen Mary said in her response to Rhodri Morgan, if you have an inquiry with an independent chair, the issue is taken out of the political process. Roger Thayne himself, in his report to the Government, calls for a public inquiry.

I look forward to the contributions to this debate. I hope that the Government now understands the seriousness of the situation, and will respond positively to our request.

**Jenny Randerson:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add as new point 3 and renumber accordingly:

*calls for a panel, comprising the Assembly Minister for Health and Social Services, and one Member each from the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party, the Welsh Conservative Party and Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, to be convened for the purpose of recommending the name of a suitable person to chair the inquiry. The panel shall lay a report before the Assembly accordingly.*

What a pity it is that the First Minister could not spare time from his busy schedule to be here for this debate. His replies to questions this afternoon showed that he needs to come up to speed on this issue. He seems to be living in a parallel universe to the rest of us, Roger Thayne included.

We welcome this motion, and support an inquiry. We have suggested a mechanism in our amendment that would put this beyond the political process, and which was the sort of mechanism that was involved in the E.coli inquiry. The inquiry should be in response to the concerns of not just Roger Thayne and politicians, but those who work in the service. I went out with the ambulance service last year and the people who work in the service listed exactly the same problems to me as the ones that Roger Thayne has raised. Other health professionals, such as Andrew Deardon of the British Medical

ffeithiau ger ein bron, yn gyhoeddus, gallwn farnu a yw ymateb y Llywodraeth yn foddhaol ai peidio. Yn wyneb y pryder cyhoeddus, ni chredaf y dylai dim un ymchwiliad y dymuna'r Llywodraeth ei gynnal ddigwydd y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig. Fel y dywedodd Helen Mary yn ei hymateb i Rhodri Morgan, os cewch ymchwiliad gyda chadeirydd annibynnol, eir â'r mater allan o'r broses wleidyddol. Mae Roger Thayne ei hun, yn ei adroddiad i'r Llywodraeth, yn galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus.

Yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y cyfraniadau at y ddafl hon. Gobeithio bod y Llywodraeth erbyn hyn yn deall difrifoldeb y sefyllfa, ac y gwnaiff ymateb yn gadarnhaol i'n cais.

**Jenny Randerson:** Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Cynnwys pwynt 3 newydd ac ailrifo'r pwyntiau sy'n dilyn:

*yn galw am gynnull panel, yn cynnwys Gweinidog y Cynulliad dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac un Aelod yr un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a Phlaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, at ddiben argymhell enw person cymwys i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad. Bydd y panel yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad yn unol â hynny.*

Dyna drueni na allai'r Prif Weinidog neilltuo amser o'i amserlen brysur i fod yma ar gyfer y ddafl hon. Dangosodd ei atebion i gwestiynau y prynhawn yma fod angen iddo addysgu ei hun am y mater hwn. Mae fel petai'n byw mewn bydysawd gwahanol i'r gweddill ohonom, gan gynnwys Roger Thayne.

Croesawn y cynnig hwn, a chefnogwn ymchwiliad. Yr ydym wedi awgrymu mecanwaith yn ein gwelliant a fyddai'n gosod hyn y tu allan i'r broses wleidyddol, sef y math o fecanwaith a gafwyd yn yr ymchwiliad i E.coli. Dylai'r ymchwiliad fod yn ymateb i bryderon nid yn unig Roger Thayne a gwleidyddion, ond y bobl sydd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth. Euthum allan gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans y llynedd a rhestrodd y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth yr un problemau yn union wrthyf â'r rhai a godwyd gan Roger Thayne. Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill ym maes

Association, are expressing the same concern.

4.00 p.m.

However, the key thing here is the re-establishment of public confidence. We need to get to the bottom of whether the service is adequately financed, whether Roger Thayne is right in saying that it needs £35 million, and whether the Minister is right in saying that it needs to save £11 million. Which of those two points of view is right? Or is it somewhere in between? We need to look at whether the targets are effective and whether staffing levels are appropriate, and so on.

The First Minister is profoundly wrong in his response to having a public inquiry. A public inquiry would objectively investigate issues of deep concern, such as how on earth ambulances that were not fit for purpose were purchased. Even the First Minister expressed concern about that. You only have to look at the performance of the ambulance service to see the problem. It is a deteriorating service. The percentage of category A and B emergency calls answered on target dropped from a high of 94.5 per cent in June 2000 to 81.5 per cent at the end of March 2006. The all-Wales target for category-A calls receiving a response within eight minutes was originally set at 75 per cent; that target could not be reached, so the Government moved the goalposts down to 65 per cent. It is now down to 60 per cent. If the targets are not reached, the Government's answer is to reduce them.

An ambulance, as a first responder, should arrive at the scene within 14 minutes in urban areas, 18 minutes in rural areas and 21 minutes in sparsely populated areas. The target for those times is 95 per cent, but only five unitary authority areas achieved that target. I could go on and on. This is a catalogue of shame and it cannot go on like this. If it were a social services department or a school, the ambulance trust would be in special measures by now. It has taken the resignation of Roger Thayne to shake the issue up and to raise public awareness. Yet the First Minister is still in denial, telling us,

iechyd, fel Andrew Deardon o Gymdeithas Feddygol Prydain, yn mynegi'r un pryder.

Fodd bynnag, y peth pwysig yma yw adfer hyder y cyhoedd. Mae angen inni ddarganfod a yw'r gwasanaeth yn cael ei ariannu'n ddigonol, a yw Roger Thayne yn iawn wrth ddweud bod arno angen £35 miliwn, ac a yw'r Gweinidog yn iawn wrth ddweud bod angen iddo arbed £11 miliwn. Pa un o'r ddau safbwynt hyn sy'n iawn? Neu a yw'r ateb cywir rywle rhwng y ddau? Mae angen inni edrych a yw'r targedau'n effeithiol ac a yw lefelau staffio'n briodol, ac yn y blaen.

Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn hollol anghywir yn ei ymateb i gael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Byddai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus yn ymchwilio'n wrthrychol i faterion sy'n peri pryder mawr, megis sut ar y ddaear y prynwyd ambiwlansys nad oeddent yn addas i'w diben. Mae hyd yn oed y Prif Weinidog wedi mynegi pryder ynglŷn â hynny. Nid oes rhaid ichi ond edrych ar berfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i weld y broblem. Mae'n wasanaeth sy'n dirywio. Gostyngodd canran y galwadau brys categori A a B a atebid yn unol â'r targed o ganran uchel o 94.5 y cant ym Mehefin 2000 i 81.5 y cant erbyn diwedd Mawrth 2006. Y targed gwreiddiol ar gyfer Cymru gyfan oedd ymateb i 75 y cant o'r galwadau categori A cyn pen wyth munud; ni ellid cyrraedd y targed hwnnw, felly newidiodd y Llywodraeth y targed i 65 y cant. Erbyn hyn mae i lawr i 60 y cant. Os nad yw'r targedau'n cael eu cyflawni, ateb y Llywodraeth yw eu gostwng.

Dylai ambiwlans, fel ymatebydd cyntaf, gyrraedd y safle cyn pen 14 munud mewn ardaloedd trefol, 18 munud mewn ardaloedd gwledig a 21 munud mewn ardaloedd sydd â phoblogaeth wasgaredig. Mae'r targed ar gyfer yr amseroedd hyn yn 95 y cant, ond dim ond pum awdurdod unedol a gyrrhaeddodd y targed hwn. Gallwn fynd ymlaen ac ymlaen. Mae'r rhestr yn gywilyddus ac ni allwn adael i'r sefyllfa barhau. Pe bai'n adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol neu'n ysgol, byddai'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yn destun mesurau arbennig erbyn hyn. Mae

extraordinarily, that Roger Thayne simply wanted to spend more time with his family. If so, what about the report he produced, at the request of the ambulance trust last year—the so-called confidential one, which is more or less public property and should, at the earliest opportunity, be officially released to us all?

The First Minister said that we should cease obsessing about the past, but what was the point of Roger Thayne's first report if it was not to look at the issues and the problems so that we can move forward? That report so impressed Ann Lloyd, the head of the NHS in Wales, as she said in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting last week, that, on the basis of it, she invited him to become the trust's interim chief executive. That report cannot be dismissed and it should become public property.

If the Government succeeds in blocking the call for a public inquiry today, I urge the Minister, in order to restore some vestiges of public confidence, to ensure that that report is available to all and understood by all so that we can move forward on the basis of a full understanding. However, despite the Government's rhetoric, I fear that we will not have Government approval for this.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf fi hefyd yn cefnogi'r alwad am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Wrth wneud hynny, pwysleisiaf nad yw hynny'n adlewyrchiad ar y gwaith gwyb sy'n cael ei gyflawni gan barafeddygon. Yr wyf wedi gorfod galw ambiwlans yng Ngheredigion ddwywaith yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ac, ar y ddau achlysur, mae gwasanaeth y parameddygon wedi bod yn broffesiynol a gofalus tu hwnt. Fodd bynnag, rhaid imi gydnabod, fel yr Aelod Cynulliad lleol, bod yr amodau gwaith a'r adeiladau a'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Ngheredigion yn ddiffygiol dros ben.

ymddiswyddiad Roger Thayne wedi rhoi proc i'r sefyllfa a'i dwyn i sylw'r cyhoedd. Ac eto, mae'r Prif Weinidog yn dal i wadu bod dim byd o'i le, ac yn dweud wrthym, yn rhyfedd iawn, mai am dreulio mwy o amser gyda'i deulu yr oedd Roger Thayne. Os hynny, beth am yr adroddiad a luniodd, ar gais yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans y llynedd—yr un a elwir yn gyfrinachol, ond sydd fwy neu lai yn eiddo cyhoeddus ac a ddylai gael ei ryddhau'n swyddogol i bob un ohonom cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog y dylem roi'r gorau i'n hobsesiwn ynglŷn â'r gorffennol, ond beth oedd pwrpas adroddiad cyntaf Roger Thayne ar wahân i edrych ar y materion a'r problemau er mwyn inni allu symud ymlaen? Creodd yr adroddiad hwn gymaint o argraff ar Ann Lloyd, pennaeth y GIG yng Nghymru, fel y dywedodd yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yr wythnos diwethaf, nes iddi ei wahodd, ar sail yr adroddiad, i fod yn brif weithredwr interim i'r ymddiriedolaeth. Ni ellir diystyru'r adroddiad hwn a dylai'r cyhoedd gael ei weld.

Os bydd y Llywodraeth yn llwyddo i rwystro'r alwad am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus heddiw, yr wyf yn pwysu ar y Gweinidog, er mwyn adennill rhywfaint o hyder y cyhoedd, i sicrhau bod yr adroddiad hwn ar gael i bawb a bod pawb yn ei ddeall er mwyn inni allu symud ymlaen ar sail dealltwriaeth lawn. Fodd bynnag, er gwaethaf rhethreg y Llywodraeth, mae arnaf ofn na fydd yn cymeradwyo hyn.

**Elin Jones:** I also support the call for a public inquiry into the ambulance service. In doing so, I emphasise that that is not a reflection on the excellent work undertaken by the paramedics. I have had to call out ambulances in Ceredigion twice during the past year, and, on both occasions, the service from the paramedics has been professional and very careful. However, I must acknowledge, as the local Assembly Member, that the working conditions and the buildings and resources available to the ambulance service in Ceredigion are greatly deficient.

Mae dau bwynt penodol yr wyf am gyfeirio atynt y prynhawn yma. Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am gyfeirio at y newidiadau sy'n cael eu hargymell ar gyfer ysbytai aciwt y gorllewin. Mae'r newidiadau hynny, ar eu ffurf bresennol, yn llwyr ddibynnol ar wasanaeth ambiwlans digonol i drosglwyddo cleifion o Fronglais a Llwynhelyg i ysbyty Glangwili, ac efallai ymhellach i Dreforys hefyd. Yr hyn a ddywedir gan awdurdodau iechyd yng Ngheredigion yw y bydd Bronglais yn ysbyty i sefydlogi cleifion ac i'w trosglwyddo. Canolir gwasanaethau yng Nglangwili ac Abertawe.

Yr amcangyfrif presennol o'r amser a gymerir i drosglwyddo cleifion mewn ambiwlans o ward ym Mronglais i ward yng Nglangwili yw tair awr—mewn ambiwlans gyda doctor, bydwraig neu nyrs, a dau barafeddyg. Bydd yr adnoddau ychwanegol y bydd eu hangen ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans i wneud hyn sawl gwaith y dydd, o bosibl, yn sylweddol ac yn ychwanegol at yr adnoddau sydd eu hangen ar gyfer y galwadau presennol ar y gwasanaeth ambiwlans.

Cymhlethdod ychwanegol pan fo angen gwely mewn ysbyty fel Treforys neu Langwili ar glaf o Fronglais—claf gyda phroblemau calon, er enghraifft—yw bod yr amser sydd ei angen i alw ambiwlans, ac i sicrhau bod y claf a'r ambiwlans yn barod, yn gallu golygu bod y gwely yn Nhreforys wedi'i gymryd gan rywun arall. Mae'r claf yn dal ym Mronglais heb wely ar ei gyfer yn Nhreforys. Nid oes gennyf ffydd bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, ar ei ffurf bresennol a chyda'r adnoddau presennol, yn ddigon cryf i ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb ychwanegol o drosglwyddo nifer sylweddol o gleifion. Dyna'r sefyllfa a fyddai'n codi pe bai'r argymhellion ar newidiadau i'r ysbytai aciwt yn y gorllewin yn cael eu gweithredu.

Yr oeddwn eisiau gwneud pwynt arall, ond gan fod yr amser mor brin, ni wnaaf ei godi.

**Y Llywydd:** Pe bai pawb yr un peth â thi, byddai bywyd lawer yn haws.

**Tamsin Dunwoody:** First, I echo Ieuan Wyn Jones's praise of the paramedic service. Like Elin, I have had occasion to call paramedics

I will refer to two specific points this afternoon. First, I will refer to the proposed changes for acute hospitals in west Wales. Those changes, in their present form, are totally dependent on an ambulance service that is capable of transferring patients from Bronglais and Llwynhelyg to Glangwili hospital, and even further on to Morrision. Health authorities in Ceredigion are saying that Bronglais will be a hospital where patients are stabilised and from where they are then transferred. Services will be centralised in Glangwili and Swansea.

The current estimate for the time it would take to transfer patients in an ambulance from a ward in Bronglais to a ward in Glangwili is three hours—in an ambulance with a doctor, midwife or a nurse, and two paramedics. The additional resources required by the ambulance service so that it can carry this out several times a day, possibly, will be considerable, and will be in addition to the resources that are needed to meet the present demands on the ambulance service.

A further complication when beds are required in hospitals such as Morrision or Glangwili by patients from Bronglais—patients with heart problems, for example—is that the time that it takes to call out an ambulance, and to prepare both the patient and the ambulance, can mean that the bed in Morrision has been taken by someone else. The patient is stuck in Bronglais with no bed available in Morrision. I have no faith that the ambulance service, in its present form and with current resources, is strong enough to take on the additional responsibility of transferring a significant number of patients. That is the situation that would arise if the recommended changes to west Wales's acute hospitals were to be implemented.

I wanted to make another point, but as time is so short, I will not raise it.

**The Presiding Officer:** If everyone was like you, life would be much easier.

**Tamsin Dunwoody:** Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ategu canmoliaeth Ieuan Wyn Jones i'r gwasanaeth parameddygol. Yr wyf finau, fel

in an extremely rural area and know the issues that they face. The people who work as paramedics are not just ordinary men and women—they are extremely special people, who deal with incidents on a daily basis that many of us could not possibly deal with in such a professional and calm way. Like other emergency responders, such as firefighters and the police service, they are the people who arrive at the scene of road-traffic accidents and major incidents, or who may just be dealing with the happy drunk who has fallen over on a Saturday night. They are remarkable people for whom I have enormous praise and admiration.

I speak for them today, because many of the comments that have been made so far about the overall public confidence in the ambulance service have been detrimental and can be seen to be such by paramedics themselves. Frankly, when push comes to shove, the public has confidence in our paramedics and that is absolutely right and proper.

My concerns, which I take up with, and express to, the Minister, are about the appropriateness, sometimes, of paramedic call-outs. Are paramedics always called to appropriate incidents or are there other measures that could be used at those times, particularly first responders? There is an enormous role there for these highly trained and qualified people who can rapidly get to the scene of an incident, an accident or whatever to make a proper assessment. Having lived with an ambulanceman who worked in the ambulance service for over 15 years, I can quite safely say that all paramedics want to be as highly trained as possible, because their *raison d'être* is to save lives. If we can ensure that they receive the best training possible, I know that they would all welcome that.

The reality is that, in a rural area, you will not have ambulance stations in every village. That will never happen, it never has happened and it is pie-in-the-sky thinking to

Elin, wedi gorfod galw'r parameddygon mewn ardal wledig iawn a gwn am y problemau sy'n eu hwynebu. Dynion a merched cyffredin yw'r bobl hyn sy'n gweithio fel parameddygon—ond maent hefyd yn bobl arbennig iawn, sy'n delio â digwyddiadau o ddydd i ddydd na fyddai llawer ohonom byth yn gallu delio â hwy mewn ffordd mor broffesiynol a digynnwrf. Fel gweithwyr eraill sy'n ymateb i argyfyngau, megis diffoddwyr tân a'r heddlu, hwy yw'r rhai cyntaf i gyrraedd safle trychinebau a damweiniau ffordd, a'r rhai sydd hefyd yn gorfod delio â'r meddwyn gwirion sydd wedi cael codwm ar nos Sadwrn. Maent yn bobl arbennig iawn ac maent i'w canmol a'u hedmygu'n fawr.

Yr wyf yn siarad ar eu rhan heddiw, gan fod llawer o'r sylwadau sydd wedi eu gwneud hyd yn hyn ynglŷn â hyder cyffredinol y cyhoedd yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi bod yn andwyol, a gellir eu gweld fel rhai andwyol gan y parameddygon eu hunain. Mewn gwirionedd, pan ddaw hi i'r pen, mae gan y cyhoedd hyder yn ein parameddygon ac mae hynny'n gwbl briodol.

Mae'r pryderon hyn, yr wyf yn eu codi gyda'r Gweinidog, ac yn eu mynegi wrtho, yn ymwneud â pha mor briodol, ambell waith, yw galw parameddygon. A yw parameddygon yn cael eu galw i ddigwyddiadau priodol bob amser ynteu a oes mesurau eraill y gellid eu defnyddio ar yr adegau hynny, yn enwedig ymatebwyr cyntaf? Mae rôl aruthrol yn hynny o beth i'r bobl hyn sydd â chymwysterau da, ac sydd wedi cael llawer o hyfforddiant, ac a allai gyrraedd safle digwyddiad, damwain neu beth bynnag y bo, yn gyflym i wneud asesiad priodol. Fel un sy'n byw gyda dyn ambiwlans a dreuliodd dros 15 mlynedd yn gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans, gwn fod pob parameddyg am gael cymaint ag sy'n bosibl o hyfforddiant, oherwydd y maent yn gwbl ymroddedig i achub bywydau. Os gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn derbyn yr hyfforddiant gorau posibl, gwn y byddent i gyd yn ddiolchgar.

Y realiti, mewn ardal wledig, yw na fydd gennyh orsafoedd ambiwlans ym mhob pentref. Ni fydd hynny'n digwydd fyth, nid yw erioed wedi digwydd a breuddwyd



think that it could. However, we deserve a rapid response of the calibre required to convey people safely to the most appropriate form of care for the condition from which they are suffering.

4.10 p.m.

I do not think that I have ever named anyone in the Chamber, but I am going to name a paramedic today, a guy called Steve Roberts, based at Bridgend, who is a sub-divisional paramedic officer with whom I spent an instructive afternoon. Steve and his team demonstrate the ethos of Nye Bevan's establishment of healthcare—it is not just responsive, it is proactive. Steve has trained local retailers to use defibrillators and that has to be praised.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn uno i ganmol gwaith nid yn unig y parameddygon, ond pawb sy'n rhan o wasanaeth iechyd Cymru. Maent yn cyflawni gwaith eithriadol o bwysig, fel mae Aelodau eraill wedi dweud y prynhawn yma.

Nid sôn am waith y parameddygon a'r bobl eraill sy'n rhan o'r gwasanaeth yr ydym yn y fan hon, ond am strwythurau'r gwasanaeth ei hun a'r ffaith bod y diffygion yn y strwythurau hynny yn tanseilio ymdrechion y bobl hyn i gyflawni eu gwaith fel y byddent yn dymuno ei wneud. Os oes unrhyw un yn amau hynny, dylent siarad â pharafeddygon ac aelodau eraill o'r gwasanaeth iechyd ledled Cymru i weld mai'r bobl hynny, yn fwy na neb, sydd am weld ymchwiliad er mwyn iddynt gael cyfle i nodi'r gwendidau ac i bawb gael gweld y pwysau sydd arnynt o ran cyflawni'r gwasanaeth.

Os oedd unrhyw un yn amau'r angen am ymchwiliad, ar ôl clywed ymateb y Prif Weinidog i gwestiynau'r prynhawn yma, dylent fod yn gwbl glir ynglŷn â hynny. Dywedodd y Prif Weinidog fod sylwadau Roger Thayne yn amherthnasol am nad yw bellach yn y swydd, ac y dylid anwybyddu'r hyn a oedd yn ei adroddiad. Yn sicr, nid oes neb arall yng Nghymru yn credu hynny. Mae'n deg nodi nad Roger Thayne yn unig sydd wedi dweud y pethau hynny: datganodd cyn-gadeirydd awdurdod ambiwlans Cymru,

gwrach yw meddwl y gallai hynny ddigwydd. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn haeddu ymateb buan o'r safon angenrheidiol er mwyn cludo pobl yn ddiogel i gael y math priodol o ofal ar gyfer y cyflwr y maent yn dioddef ganddo.

Nid wyf yn meddwl fy mod erioed wedi enwi neb yn y Siambr, ond yr wyf am enwi un parameddyg heddiw, sef dyn o'r enw Steve Roberts, swyddog parameddygol is-ranbarthol o Ben-y-bont ar Ogwr y treuliais brynhawn addysgiadol yn ei gwmmi. Mae Steve a'i dîm yn dilyn ethos y gofal iechyd a sefydlwyd gan Nye Bevan—mae'n ymatebol, ac mae hefyd yn rhagweithiol. Mae Steve wedi hyfforddi siopwyr lleol i ddefnyddio diffibrilwyr a rhaid canmol hynny.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am sure that all Assembly Members would unite to praise the work of not only the paramedics, but everyone who is part of the Welsh health service. They undertake extraordinarily important work, as other Members have said this afternoon.

We are not talking about the work undertaken by the paramedics and the other people who are part of the health service, but about the structures of the service itself and the fact that the weaknesses in those structures undermine people's efforts to achieve what they want to achieve. If anyone doubts that, they should talk to paramedics and other members of the health service across Wales to see that it is those people, more than anyone else, who want an inquiry so that they have an opportunity to note the weaknesses and so that everyone sees the pressure that is on them in terms of providing the service.

If anyone doubted the need for an inquiry, after hearing the First Minister's response to questions this afternoon, they should be clear as to why it is necessary. The First Minister said that Roger Thayne's comments were irrelevant because he is no longer in post, and that we should ignore what was in his report. I am sure that no-one else in Wales believes that. It is fair to note that Roger Thayne is not the only one to have said those things: the former chair of Wales's ambulance trust, Roy Norris, said soon after the publication of

Roy Norris, yn fuan ar ôl cyhoeddi adroddiad Roger Thayne, ei fod yn cytuno yn llwyr â'r gwendidau yr oedd wedi eu gweld yn y gwasanaeth.

Weinidog, cofiaf eich ymateb yn y pwyllgor, eich cydnabyddiaeth bod gwendidau yn y gwasanaeth a'ch cyfaddefiad bod angen buddsoddi yn y gwasanaeth. Gobeithiaf y byddwch yn ymbellhau o sylwadau'r Prif Weinidog ac yn cydnabod bod achos teilwng yn y fan hon. Dylem uno gyda'n gilydd nid yn unig i gydnabod a chanmol gwaith y parameddygon a'r bobl eraill sy'n rhan o'r gwasanaeth, ond i sicrhau eu bod yn cael pob cefnogaeth er mwyn cyflawni'r gwasanaeth angenrheidiol hwn. Dylem ni, fel gwleidyddion, uno i sicrhau bod y cyllid a'r strwythurau yn eu lle i sicrhau ein bod yn cynnig y gwasanaeth sydd ei angen, nid yn unig ar y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth, ond ar y bobl sy'n dibynnu ar y gwasanaeth.

Ategaf yr hyn a ddywedodd Elin Jones. Pan gaewyd uned mân anafiadau Llanymddyfri, ni chryfhawyd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans. Nid oedd pobl yn gallu cael gwasanaeth yn Llanymddyfri, ond nid oedd modd eu cludo yn hwylus i ysbyty Glangwili. Weinidog, gobeithiaf y derbyniwch ein cais am ymchwiliad.

**Jonathan Morgan:** We are supporting the motion and the call for a public inquiry. It is quite telling that, once again, it has been left to the opposition to lead a debate on a matter of public importance and to put forward a constructive solution to many of the problems that the ambulance service faces. We know that we cannot rely on the Assembly Government to get to grips with this issue.

We know that the Minister is a busy man: he spends one day a week sorting out waiting-list problems—I think that it is a Thursday, if he is still doing it—and he spends a great deal of time trying to sort out the deficits in the NHS, without much success. Frankly, we know that the Minister is running out of days in the week to get things done. If you were to examine this motion in a certain light, you would see that we are trying to be helpful; we are trying to take the workload off you,

Roger Thayne's report that he agreed completely with the weaknesses that he identified in the service.

Minister, I remember your response in committee, your recognition that there are weaknesses in the service and your admission that the service needs investment. I hope that you will distance yourself from the First Minister's comments and recognise that we have a worthy case. We should unite not only to acknowledge and praise the work of paramedics and the other people who are part of the health service, but to ensure that they receive all the support that they need to provide this essential service. As politicians, we should unite to ensure that the funding and the structures are in place to ensure that we offer the service required not only by the people who work in the service, but by the people who rely on it.

I endorse what Elin Jones said. When the Llanymddyfri minor injuries unit was closed, the ambulance service was not strengthened. People could not access the service in Llanymddyfri, but there was no convenient way of transporting them to Glangwili hospital. Minister, I hope that you will accept our request for an inquiry.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r cynnig a'r alwad am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Mae'n arwyddocaol iawn mai'r gwrthbleidiau, unwaith eto, sy'n gorfod arwain dadl ar fater o bwys cyhoeddus a chynnig ateb adeiladol i lawer o'r problemau y mae'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn eu hwynebu. Gwyddom na allwn ddibynnu ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn.

Gwyddom fod y Gweinidog yn ddyn prysur: mae'n treulio un diwrnod bob wythnos yn datrys problemau rhestrau aros—tybiaf mai dydd Iau yw hwnnw, os yw'n dal wrthi—ac mae'n treulio llawer iawn o amser yn ceisio datrys y diffygion yn y GIG, heb lawer o lwyddiant. Mewn gwirionedd, gwyddom nad oes gan y Gweinidog ddigon o ddiwrnodau yn ei wythnos i wneud popeth. Pe baech yn edrych ar y cynnig hwn o ogwydd penodol, byddech yn gweld ein bod yn ceisio helpu; yr

Minister, and give the work to a full public inquiry that could give some real consideration to where the ambulance service needs to go from here. You admitted, in committee last week, that the loss of Roger Thayne was an embarrassment; it is an embarrassment because we have lost an experienced and capable individual, a man with a proven track record in terms of delivering results for ambulance services.

You admitted, and I think that it was very frank of you to do so, that it was an embarrassment to Wales that our ambulance service and the way in which it was being run, resourced and managed was so bad that we lost an individual of his experience and track record.

The most telling aspect of what he told us is that, in his estimate, we were possibly losing 500 people a year because the ambulance service was not able to reach those people facing a life-threatening situation. Again, to your credit, Minister, you did not dismiss that figure; you said that it could be an extrapolation based on other figures. I do not know whether those are hard figures or purely an extrapolation—either way, the underperformance of the ambulance service in Wales is, simply, killing people; we are not able to get ambulances to people in life-threatening situations who might otherwise be saved if those ambulances had got to them. It is scandalous that, in the twenty-first century, we are not able to match the performance of ambulance services elsewhere in the UK, to the extent that lives are being lost here in Wales. That should be a wake-up call for the Assembly Government, and that, in itself, should be justification for a public inquiry.

A public inquiry should look at a wide range of issues. It should look at the management of the NHS trusts and whether an all-Wales trust is appropriate. It should look at resourcing, equipment and the numbers and skills of staff. Above all, we need to ensure that we have an ambulance service that is fit for purpose—it is not at the moment, and a

ydym yn ceisio ysgafnhau eich baich, Weinidog, a rhoi'r gwaith i ymchwiliad cyhoeddus llawn a allai ystyried o ddifrif i ba gyfeiriad y mae angen i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans fynd o'r fan hon. Cyfaddefasoch, yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, fod colli Roger Thayne yn peri annifyrrwch; mae'n peri annifyrrwch oherwydd ein bod wedi colli unigolyn profiadol a thalentog, dyn sydd wedi profi yn y gorffennol y gall sicrhau canlyniadau i wasanaethau ambiwlans.

Cyfaddefasoch, a chredaf eich bod yn onest iawn wrth wneud hynny, ei bod yn peri annifyrrwch i Gymru fod ein gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'r ffordd yr oedd yn cael ei redeg, yn cael adnoddau ac yn cael ei reoli mor wael nes peri inni golli unigolyn o'i brofiad a'i statws ef.

Yr elfen fwyaf dadlennol o'r hyn a ddywedodd wrthym oedd ein bod, yn ôl ei amcangyfrif ef, o bosibl yn colli 500 o bobl y flwyddyn am nad oedd y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn gallu cyrraedd y bobl hynny a wynebai sefyllfa lle'r oedd eu bywyd yn y fantol. Unwaith yn rhagor, Weinidog, er clod i chi, ni wnaethoch ddiystyru'r ffigur hwnnw; dywedasoch y gallai fod yn allosodiad a oedd yn seiliedig ar ffigurau eraill. Ni wn a yw'r rheini'n ffigurau caled neu'n ddim ond allosodiad—y naill ffordd neu'r llall, mae tanberfformiad y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yng Nghymru, yn syml, yn lladd pobl; nid ydym yn gallu cael ambiwlansys at bobl sydd â'u bywyd yn y fantol y gellid eu hachub fel arall, pe bai'r ambiwlansys hynny wedi eu cyrraedd. Mae'n gywilyddus, yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, ein bod yn methu â chyrraedd safon perfformiad gwasanaethau ambiwlans mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU, i'r fath raddau nes bod bywydau'n cael eu colli yma yng Nghymru. Dylai hynny fod yn rhybudd croch i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, a dylai hynny, ynddo'i hun, gyfiawnhau ymchwiliad cyhoeddus.

Dylai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ystyried ystod eang o faterion. Dylai edrych ar reolaeth ymddiriedolaethau GIG ac a yw ymddiriedolaeth Cymru gyfan yn briodol. Dylai edrych ar adnoddau, offer, niferoedd staff a'u sgiliau. Yn anad dim, mae gofyn inni sicrhau bod gennym wasanaeth ambiwlans sy'n addas i'w ddiben—nid ydyw

public inquiry could start to provide the answers.

**David Lloyd:** Roger Thayne, in his report, says that the poor state of the ambulance service means that 500 lives are needlessly lost in Wales every year. He goes on to say that the Welsh ambulance service does not, and cannot in the near future, provide a safe, responsive, reliable and clinically sound service to the public of Wales. Failure to take note of the situation, as reported, could lead to the continued loss of life and a risk of a total collapse of the service. It is those sorts of words that bring us to the position whereby Plaid is calling for a public inquiry today. Five hundred lives are needlessly lost, potentially, every year. We are talking about an ambulance service that is under immense pressure, and, yes, it is staffed by exceptional people who are doing exceptional work, but they need more tools to do the job properly. In the Swansea area, we have had recent problems with all 999 calls not necessarily being answered.

Plaid is calling for a public inquiry because this issue of ambulance response times is nothing new. The Government patently denied today, through Rhodri Morgan, that there is much of a problem at all, but I remember sitting in Health and Social Services Committee meetings in 2000 and 2001 at which we heard evidence of missed target response times. The target response for category-A calls was for 75 per cent to be answered within eight minutes in all areas—that target was missed then. Despite the target being revised downward successively to 65 per cent of category-A calls being answered in eight minutes by March 2005, and then down to 60 per cent, all those targets continued to be missed on an all-Wales basis.

The importance of ambulance response times, as Elin Jones alluded to, is highlighted in the document 'Designed to Deliver'. With some district general hospitals facing potential closure, care is being moved around, patients are being transported—or

ar hyn o bryd, a gallai ymchwiliad cyhoeddus ddechrau cynnig yr atebion.

**David Lloyd:** Dywed Roger Thayne, yn ei adroddiad, fod cyflwr gwael y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn golygu bod 500 o fywydau'n cael eu colli'n ofer yng Nghymru bob blwyddyn. A yn ei flaen i ddweud nad yw gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru'n darparu gwasanaeth diogel, ymatebol, dibynadwy a chlinigol gadarn i'r cyhoedd yng Nghymru, ac na all wneud hynny yn y dyfodol agos. Gallai methu â chymryd sylw o'r sefyllfa honno, fel y dywedwyd, arwain at barhau i golli bywydau a'r perygl y gallai'r gwasanaeth ddymchwel yn llwyr. Dyna'r math o eiriau a arweiniodd at sefyllfa lle y mae Plaid yn galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus heddiw. Gallai fod pum cant o fywydau'n cael eu colli'n ofer bob blwyddyn. Yr ydym yn trafod gwasanaeth ambiwlans sydd dan bwysau aruthrol. Ydyw, mae'n cael ei gynnal gan staff eithriadol sy'n cyflawni gwaith eithriadol, ond mae angen rhagor o adnoddau arnynt i wneud y gwaith yn iawn. Yn ardal Abertawe, cawsom broblemau yn ddiweddar lle nad oedd pob galwad 999, o reidrwydd, yn cael ei hateb.

Mae Plaid yn galw am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus am nad yw'r mater hwn, amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys, yn rhywbeth newydd. Gwadodd y Llywodraeth yn blaen heddiw, drwy Rhodri Morgan, nad yw hi'n fawr o broblem, ond cofiaf eistedd yng nghyfarfodydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn 2000 a 2001 lle y clywsom dystiolaeth nad oedd targedau amseroedd ymateb yn cael eu cyrraedd. Yr ymateb targed ar gyfer galwadau categori A oedd bod 75% yn cael eu hateb o fewn wyth munud ym mhob ardal—nid oedd y targed hwnnw'n cael ei gyflawni bryd hynny. Er i'r targed gael ei ostwng fesul cam i ateb 65 y cant o alwadau categori A mewn wyth munud erbyn Mawrth 2005, ac yna i lawr i 60 y cant, yr oeddid yn dal i fethu â chyrraedd y targedau hynny drwy Gymru gyfan.

Tynnir sylw at bwysigrwydd amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys, fel y nodwyd gan Elin Jones, yn y ddogfen 'Designed to Deliver'. Wrth i rai ysbytai dosbarth cyffredinol wynebu'r bygythiad y gallent gael eu cau, mae gofal yn cael ei symud o gwmpas, mae

should be—within set times from hospital to hospital, and ‘Designed to Deliver’ is predicated on the ambulance service producing excellent response times. Without that, some people in some parts of Wales really will have no health service at all. Frankly, the time for dallying is over; lives are at risk, and a public inquiry is long overdue.

**Nick Bourne:** As indicated by Jonathan Morgan, the Minister, in fairness, has indicated that he takes this matter perhaps more seriously than the First Minister does. It may well be that, because he is running out of days, as was indicated, and is spending time on the waiting lists and on the deficit, he has left this to the First Minister—this is too important an issue to leave to the First Minister. In the most extraordinary display of complacency and arrogance that I have seen from him for some time—and that really is saying something—we heard that the reason for Roger Thayne’s departure was that, first of all, he wanted to spend time in Staffordshire. I heard him being interviewed, and that was not the reason that he gave or that was reported.

16.20 p.m.

Then, even more extraordinary, we were told that he was only a temporary appointment; he was not—it was an interim appointment. We were also told that, now that he has gone, the reason why he left is not relevant, which is the most extraordinary argument that I have heard in this Chamber. Yes, the people who work in the service are first class, but when we say that they need more money to operate the system and that they need a better management system to operate the system, we are not attacking them; we are attacking the system and the Assembly Government’s failure to grapple with what is clearly a problem. There is no doubt that those people do excellent work. There are first-class paramedics in the service, as Tamsin Dunwoody said, many of whom use their own satellite navigation systems, maps and mobile phones at work, which they should not be required to do in twenty-first century

cleifion yn cael eu cludo—neu dylent gael eu cludo—o fewn amseroedd dynodedig o ysbyty i ysbyty, ac mae ‘Designed to Deliver’ wedi ei seilio ar y dybiaeth bod y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn cynhyrchu amseroedd ymateb ardderchog. Heb hynny, y gwir yw na fydd gan rai pobl mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru wasanaeth iechyd o gwbl. A dweud yn blwmp ac yn blaen, daeth yn bryd rhoi’r gorau i din-droi; mae bywydau mewn perygl, ac mae’n hen bryd cael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus.

**Nick Bourne:** Fel y dywedodd Jonathan Morgan, mae’r Gweinidog, a bod yn deg, wedi dangos ei fod yn rhoi mwy o bwys ar y mater hwn nag y mae’r Prif Weinidog, o bosibl. Gall hyn fod oherwydd nad oes ganddo ddigon o ddiwrnodau, fel y nodwyd, a’i fod yn treulio amser ar y rhestrau aros ac ar y diffyg, a’i fod wedi gadael y mater hwn i’r Prif Weinidog—mae hwn yn fater rhy bwysig i’w adael i’r Prif Weinidog. Dyma’r ymddygiad mwyaf hunanfodlon a thrahaus i mi ei weld ganddo ers tro—ac mae hynny’n ddweud mawr—clywsom mai’r rheswm dros ymadawiad Roger Thayne oedd, i ddechrau, ei fod am dreulio amser yn swydd Stafford. Clywais y cyfweliad ag ef, ac nid hynny oedd y rheswm a roddodd na’r un a welwyd mewn adroddiadau.

Ac yna, yn fwy anhygoel byth, dywedwyd wrthym mai dim ond penodiad dros dro ydoedd; nid dyna ydoedd—penodiad interim ydoedd. Dywedwyd wrthym hefyd, gan ei fod bellach wedi gadael, nad yw’r rheswm pam y gadawodd yn berthnasol, a dyna’r ddadl fwyaf rhyfeddol i mi ei chlywed yn y Siambr hon. Yn wir, mae’r bobl sy’n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth yn rhagorol, ond pan ddywedwn fod angen rhagor o arian arnynt i weithredu’r system a bod angen gwell system reoli arnynt i weithredu’r system, nid ymosod arnynt hwy a wnawn; ymosod ar y system yr ydym ac ar fethiant Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i’r afael â rhywbeth sy’n amlwg yn broblem. Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw’r bobl hynny’n cyflawni gwaith ardderchog. Ceir parameddygon ardderchog yn y gwasanaeth, fel y dywedodd Tamsin Dunwoody, a llawer ohonynt yn defnyddio eu systemau llywio

Wales—it is not satisfactory. We must listen to what Roger Thayne said when he was in charge of running the system. He was not a politician; he examined the system and he knew what the defects in the system were. He said that we need a cash injection of £35 million to bring up the system to what is required, and that we need an additional £10 million every year to run it. We would do well to listen to that.

As has been said, the ‘Designed to Deliver’ document, in terms of west Wales, will make the problem even more serious, because people will have to travel even further in ambulances to get the treatment that they need. I accept, as has been said, that ambulances are sometimes called out inappropriately; there is no doubt about that. Tamsin Dunwoody is right about that, but that is another issue for another time, and it is not what we are currently looking at. I fail to understand, as the First Minister suggested in another of these flights of fancy, why setting up an independent public inquiry would undermine public confidence. Is it the case that we undermine public confidence every time that we set up an independent public inquiry? It would be chaired by someone who is not partisan or political, and the inquiry would look at the evidence in the cold light of day and tell us what we need to do. Therefore, it is entirely right that the motion is before us, and we will support it and the amendments. I urge other Members to do the same.

**Kirsty Williams:** My constituents did not need Roger Thayne’s report to tell them how dire their ambulance service is in Brecon and Radnorshire, because Powys is consistently the worst-performing local authority area in terms of ambulance response times. The patient who lay on the street in Llandrindod Wells after being hit by a vehicle, until the police, in despair, took him to hospital, did not need Roger Thayne’s report. The male and female members of the ambulance crew in Llandrindod Wells who must share the

lloeren, eu mapiau a’u ffonau symudol hwy eu hunain wrth eu gwaith, rhywbeth na ddylai fod gofyn iddynt ei wneud yng Nghymru’r unfed ganrif ar hugain—nid yw’n foddhaol. Rhaid inni wrando ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Roger Thayne pan oedd yn gyfrifol am redeg y system. Nid gwleidydd ydoedd; archwiliodd y system a gwyddai beth oedd diffygion y system. Dywedodd fod angen chwistrelliad ariannol o £35 miliwn arnom i wella’r system nes ei bod yn cyrraedd yr hyn sy’n ofynnol, a bod angen £10 miliwn ychwanegol bob blwyddyn i’w rhedeg. Byddai’n ddoeth inni wrando ar hynny.

Fel y dywedwyd, bydd y ddogfen ‘Designed to Deliver’, o ran y gorllewin, yn gwneud y broblem yn un fwy difrifol fyth, gan y bydd rhaid i bobl deithio ymhellach fyth mewn ambiwlansys i gael y driniaeth sydd ei hangen arnynt. Derbyniaf, fel y dywedwyd, fod ambiwlansys weithiau’n cael eu galw allan ar gam; nid oes dim amheuaeth ynghylch hynny. Mae Tamsin Dunwoody yn llygad ei lle ynghylch hynny, ond mae hwnnw’n fater arall ar gyfer rhyw dro arall, ac nid hynny sydd dan sylw gennym ar hyn o bryd. Ni allaf ddeall, fel yr awgrymodd y Prif Weinidog, â’i ben yn y cymylau eto, pam y byddai sefydlu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus annibynnol yn tanseilio hyder y cyhoedd. A ydym yn tanseilio hyder y cyhoedd bob tro y byddwn yn sefydlu ymchwiliad cyhoeddus annibynnol? Byddai dan gadeiryddiaeth rhywun nad yw’n bleidiol nac yn wleidyddol, a byddai’r ymchwiliad yn edrych ar y dystiolaeth mewn gwaed oer, ac yn dweud wrthym beth y mae angen i ni ei wneud. O’r herwydd, mae’n gwbl briodol bod y cynnig ger ein bron, ac fe’i cefnogwn ynghyd â’r gwelliannau. Anogaf Aelodau eraill i wneud yr un modd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Nid oedd angen adroddiad Roger Thayne ar fy etholwyr i ddweud wrthynt mor ddifrifol yw eu gwasanaeth ambiwlans ym Mrycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed, gan mai Powys, yn gyson, yw’r ardal awdurdod lleol sy’n perfformio waethaf o ran amseroedd ymateb ambiwlansys. Nid oedd angen adroddiad Roger Thayne ar y claf a orweddai ar y stryd yn Llandrindod ar ôl cael ei daro gan gerbyd hyd nes i’r heddlu, yn eu hanobaith, fynd ag ef i’r ysbyty. Nid oedd angen yr adroddiad ar y dynion a’r menywod

same toilet, and who did not have a shower in which to wash after a dirty job, did not need the report. Members of the Builth Wells ambulance crew do not need a report to tell them that they must defrost their ambulance in winter before they can respond to a call because it is not garaged overnight. The ambulance crew at Ystradgynlais that regularly responds to calls 55 miles away in Gladesbury or Newbridge-on-Wye did not need Roger Thayne's report to tell it how dire things are. That is the equivalent of a Llanelli ambulance responding to a call in Cardiff. Would Rhodri Morgan regard that as an adequate service for his constituents? I think not, and it is not adequate for mine. In a rural area, it often takes longer to get to places, but it is not an excuse. In Pembrokeshire and Ceredigion, which are also rural areas, the ambulance crews respond much quicker.

The First Minister cannot dismiss the credentials of Roger Thayne either. Last year, I held talks with the then chief executive of Health Commission Wales, Stuart Fletcher, to express my concerns about the amount of money that was being spent on ambulances in my constituency. I asked him where I could go in England to see a top-performing ambulance organisation. Stuart Fletcher, who is now the chair of the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust, told me that I should go to Staffordshire to see what Roger Thayne had done there. Therefore, do not let the First Minister undermine the efforts of this man, who is acknowledged throughout England and Wales as having provided the very best ambulance services in England.

We need a public inquiry because I have little confidence that the ambulance trust, as its structure currently stands, is open, honest and accountable for its actions. I recall going to a trust meeting of the organisation, and, at the end of the meeting, when there was a discussion about the location of the next meeting, the then chief executive publicly said that it should hold a meeting at a location that I could not get to. I attended the meeting because I had such concerns about the service that was being delivered to my

sy'n rhan o griw ambiwlans Llandrindod sy'n gorfod rhannu'r un toiled, ac sydd heb gawod ar gyfer ymolchi ar ôl tasg fudr. Nid oes angen adroddiad ar griw ambiwlans Llanfair-ym-Muallt i ddweud wrthynt fod rhaid iddynt ddadrewi eu hambiwllans yn y gaeaf cyn gallu ymateb i alwad, am nad yw'n cael ei gadw mewn garej dros nos. Nid oedd angen adroddiad Roger Thayne ar y criw ambiwlans yn Ystradgynlais sy'n ymateb yn rheolaidd i alwadau 55 milltir i ffwrdd yn Gladesbury neu Newbridge-on-Wye i ddweud wrthynt mor ddiffrifol yw'r sefyllfa. Mae hynny yr un fath â phe bai ambiwlans yn Llanelli'n ymateb i alwad yng Nghaerdydd. A fyddai Rhodri Morgan yn barnu bod hynny'n wasanaeth digonol i'w etholwyr? Go brin, ac nid yw'n ddigonol i'm rhai i. Mewn ardal wledig, mae'n aml yn cymryd mwy o amser i fynd i leoedd, ond nid yw hynny'n esgus. Yn sir Benfro ac yng Ngheredigion, sydd hefyd yn ardaloedd gwledig, mae'r criwiau ambiwlans yn ymateb yn llawer cynt.

Ni chaiff y Prif Weinidog ddilorni cymwysterau Roger Thayne ychwaith. Y llynedd, cynhaliais drafodaethau gyda phrif weithredwr Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru ar y pryd, Stuart Fletcher, i fynegi fy mhryderon am yr arian a oedd yn cael ei wario ar ambiwlansys yn fy etholaeth. Gofynnais iddo i ble y gallwn fynd yn Lloegr i weld sefydliad ambiwlans a oedd yn perfformio'n effeithiol. Dywedodd Stuart Fletcher, sydd bellach yn gadeirydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru, wrthyf y dylwn fynd i swydd Stafford, i weld yr hyn a gyflawnwyd gan Roger Thayne yno. Felly peidiwch â gadael i'r Prif Weinidog danseilio ymdrechion y gŵr hwn, a gydnabyddir ledled Cymru a Lloegr fel rhywun a ddarparodd y gwasanaethau ambiwlans gorau un yn Lloegr.

Mae angen inni gael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, gan nad oes gennyf fawr o ffydd bod yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, fel y mae ei strwythur ar hyn o bryd, yn agored, yn onest ac yn atebol am ei gweithredoedd. Cofiaf fynd i gyfarfod o ymddiriedolaeth y sefydliad ac, ar ddiwedd y cyfarfod, pan gafwyd trafodaeth am leoliad y cyfarfod nesaf, dywedodd y prif weithredwr ar y pryd ar goedd y dylai gynnal cyfarfod mewn lleoliad na allwn i fynd iddo. Euthum i'r cyfarfod gan fod gennyf gymaint o bryderon am y

constituents.

During the seven years that I have been an Assembly Member, I have twice spent days with ambulance crews out and about in Swansea and in my constituency. Last year, when I asked whether I could go back to visit the same crew, all of a sudden, I was not allowed to go—it was an issue of health and safety; I could no longer be allowed to go anywhere near a working ambulance crew. We need to have an open inquiry to get to the bottom of this. In my constituency, we now have an air ambulance—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am going to have to ask you to finish.

**Kirsty Williams:** We rattled tins to raise money for that; at this rate, we will also be rattling tins for our vehicles on the road.

**Brian Gibbons:** I was almost reaching for my handkerchief on seeing the face of compassionate conservatism and hearing Jonathan Morgan and Nick Bourne express such interest in my welfare. It is a welcome move from chameleon conservatism, which we have been quite used to over recent months.

It is interesting that all of the parties are calling for this inquiry. Just a couple of months ago, they were in the vanguard of the criticism of any proposal by the Assembly Government to set up a task and finish group or working party to forward the implementation of Government policy. It would be fair to say that, over the last few months, the opposition parties have been almost tripping over themselves trying to take out the franchise and calling for committees, inquiries and a sundry range of different bodies to be established to look into a range of things. Some inquiries, such as that on the E.coli outbreak, are of proven value and will add benefit, but it is hard to see what the justification of this motion and debate is, and we have had nothing from any of the contributions in this debate so far that has made a substantial case.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch ildio?

gwasanaeth a ddarperid ar gyfer fy etholwyr.

Yn ystod y saith mlynedd yr wyf wedi bod yn Aelod Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi treulio diwrnodau ddwywaith gyda chriwiau ambiwlans wrth eu gwaith yn ardal Abertawe ac yn fy etholaeth. Y llynedd, pan ofynnais a gawn ddychwelyd i ymweld â'r un criw, yn sydyn, ni chaniateid imi fynd—yr oedd yn fater iechyd a diogelwch; nid oedd modd bellach imi gael mynd ar gyfyl criw ambiwlans wrth eu gwaith. Mae angen inni gael ymchwiliad agored i fynd at wraidd hyn. Yn fy etholaeth i yn awr, mae gennym ambiwlans aer—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'n rhaid imi ofyn ichi derfynu.

**Kirsty Williams:** Buom yn ratlo tuniau i godi arian ar gyfer hynny; oni fydd pethau'n newid, bydd rhaid inni ratlo tuniau i godi arian ar gyfer ein cerbydau ar y ffordd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr oeddwn bron ag estyn fy hances wrth weld ceidwadaeth drugarog a chlywed Jonathan Morgan a Nick Bourne yn dangos cymaint o ddiddordeb yn fy lles. Mae'n ddatblygiad yr ydym yn ei groesawu, o'i gymharu â'r geidwadaeth symudliw y daethom i arfer â hi dros y misoedd diwethaf.

Mae'n ddiddorol bod yr holl bleidiau'n galw am yr ymchwiliad hwn. Ychydig fisoedd yn ôl, yr oeddent yn uchel eu cloch yn beirmiadu unrhyw gynnig gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sefydlu grŵp tasg a gorffen neu weithgor i lywio gweithredu polisi'r Llywodraeth. Byddai'n deg dweud bod y gwrthbleidiau, yn ystod y misoedd diwethaf, wedi bod yn baglu dros ei gilydd bron i geisio gweithredu'r etholfraint a galw am sefydlu pwyllgorau, ymchwiliadau ac ystod amrywiol o wahanol gyrff i ymchwilio i amrywiaeth o bethau. Mae rhai ymchwiliadau, megis yr un ar yr achosion E.coli, yn profi eu gwerth a byddant yn ychwanegu budd, ond mae'n anodd gweld cyfiawnhad dros y cynnig hwn a'r ddadl hon, ac nid ydym wedi clywed dim gan ddim un o'r cyfraniadau yn y ddadl hon hyd yma sydd wedi cyflwyno achos sylweddol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you give way?



**Brian Gibbons:** Let me finish.

At a time when the ambulance trust has a new acting chief executive and when it is ready to present a new modernisation agenda to the ambulance board and take a modernisation approach, which is endorsed by the ambulance staff, opposition parties are revisiting the past. It is a waste of time, a waste of money and a waste of enthusiasm and it carries an unknown price tag—and for what? Will we learn anything that is not known already or is being looked at?

We know that the ambulance board received a report from Roger Thayne last year, benchmarking its report, and I am pleased to say that that report will be put into the public domain, with the consent of the ambulance board trust, so people will know the result of that audit. We know that the district audit office is completing an investigation of procurement exercise. That is an independent audit done by a body of great integrity. Are we going to duplicate that? I have already said in the public domain that Healthcare Inspectorate Wales will look into the allegation that in excess of 500 deaths are taking place every year in Wales. It is duplication. Is somebody saying that Healthcare Inspectorate Wales is not an independent body and is incapable of doing its job? If it is independent and capable, why are we going down this route of duplication?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnewch ildio?

**Brian Gibbons:** I will take an intervention at the end.

This allegation, however, is serious and it is surprising to me, in view of what subsequently happened, that Roger Thayne did not raise this issue with me when I met him after his appointment as interim chief executive.

We will know the results when Healthcare Inspectorate Wales reports, but, as I said in committee, as far as anybody can make sense

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadewch imi orffen.

Mewn cyfnod pan fo gan yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans brif weithredwr dros dro newydd a phan yw'n barod i gyflwyno agenda foderneiddio newydd i'r bwrdd ambiwlans a mabwysiadu dull o weithredu sy'n moderneiddio, a hynny wedi ei gymeradwyo gan staff yr ambiwlansys, mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n camu'n ôl i'r gorffennol. Gwastraff ar amser ydyw, gwastraff ar arian a gwastraff ar frwdfrydedd, a phwy a w'yr beth fydd y gost—ac i beth? A ddysgwn unrhyw beth nas gwyddys neu nad yw'n cael ei ystyried yn barod?

Gwyddom i'r bwrdd ambiwlans gael adroddiad gan Roger Thayne y llynedd, yn meincnodi ei adroddiad, ac yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y daw'r adroddiad hwnnw'n wybodaeth gyhoeddus, gyda chaniatâd ymddiriedolaeth y bwrdd ambiwlans, felly caiff pobl wybod canlyniad yr archwiliad hwnnw. Gwyddom fod y swyddfa archwilio dosbarth yn cwblhau ymchwiliad i'r hyn sy'n digwydd ym maes caffael. Mae hwnnw'n archwiliad annibynnol a gyflawnir gan gorff arbennig o onest. A ydym am ddyblygu hynny? Yr wyf eisoes wedi datgan, yn gyhoeddus, y bydd Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru yn ymchwilio i'r haerriad bod dros 500 o farwolaethau'n digwydd bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru. Mae hynny'n ddyblygu. A oes rhywun yn dweud nad yw Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru yn gorff annibynnol, ac yn un na all wneud ei waith? Os ydyw'n annibynnol ac yn abl, pam yr ydym yn mynd ati i ddyblygu?

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Brian Gibbons:** Derbyniaf ymyriad ar y diwedd.

Mae'r haerriad hwn, fodd bynnag, yn ddifrifol ac mae'n syndod i mi, yn wyneb yr hyn a ddigwyddodd wedyn, na chododd Roger Thayne y mater hwn gyda mi pan gyfarfûm ag ef ar ôl iddo gael ei benodi'n brif weithredwr interim.

Cawn wybod y canlyniadau pan gyflwyno Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru ei adroddiad, ond fel y dywedais yn y pwyllgor,

of this accusation, it is based on an extrapolation from Staffordshire to Wales. However, several people have looked at how that comparison could be made, and the basis of making any such direct comparisons are highly problematic to say the least, and if we are to make such comparisons in a rigorous and scientific way, the difference would be much less than the estimate that Roger Thayne is giving. We are having an independent look at this through Healthcare Inspectorate Wales; why do we need to duplicate that?

On the ambulance trust, with this new chief executive, it is about to embark on a process of modernisation. What are the implications of this inquiry? Do we expect the ambulance trust to stop its modernisation programme while this inquiry sits for an indeterminate time to duplicate what is going on elsewhere? If this inquiry ever came up with something new and useful, which I seriously doubt, would we ask the ambulance service to abandon its programme of modernisation? We have heard the Wales Audit Office criticise the Assembly Government from time to time for trying to micromanage the national health service; here we have an example of the whole Assembly wanting to micromanage an individual organisation.

4.30 p.m.

Clearly, that does not make any sense. We, as an Assembly Government, have already put processes in place to ensure that there is proper clinical and financial governance in the ambulance service that will be subject to scrutiny. We have agreed to work with the ambulance service and its staff to deliver the modernisation agenda. We are on the verge of publishing, 'Delivering Emergency Care Services', which will be going out for consultation in the next few weeks. That will provide the very foundation of a completely new way of providing unscheduled care in Wales. We have an Assembly Government and an ambulance trust looking forward, working to see what we can contribute to this new and exciting agenda, so let us reject this backward-looking motion. Let us look to the future and build a better ambulance service, delivering better unscheduled services.

hyd y gall unrhyw un wneud synnwyr o'r cyhuddiad hwn, mae'n seiliedig ar allosodiad o swydd Stafford i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, mae amryw o bobl wedi edrych ar sut y gellid gwneud y gymhariaeth honno, ac mae'r sail dros wneud unrhyw gymariaethau uniongyrchol yn llawn problemau, a dweud y lleiaf, ac os ydym am wneud cymariaethau o'r fath mewn ffordd drylwyr a gwyddonol, byddai'r gwahaniaeth yn llawer llai na'r amcangyfrif y mae Roger Thayne yn ei roi. Yr ydym yn cael golwg annibynnol ar hyn drwy Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru; pam mae angen inni ddyblygu hynny?

O ran yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, gyda'r prif weithredwr newydd hwn, mae ar fin dechrau proses o foderneiddio. Beth yw goblygiadau'r ymchwiliad hwn? A ydym yn disgwyl i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans rewi ei rhaglen foderneiddio tra bo'r ymchwiliad hwn yn eistedd am gyfnod amhenodol i ddyblygu rhywbeth sy'n digwydd yn rhywle arall? Pe bai'r ymchwiliad hwn yn canfod rhywbeth newydd a defnyddiol, ac yr wyf yn amau hynny'n fawr, a fyddem yn gofyn i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans gefnu ar ei raglen foderneiddio? Clywsom Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru'n beirniadu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o bryd i'w gilydd am geisio microeoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol; yma mae gennym enghraifft o'r Cynulliad cyfan eisiau microeoli corf unigol.

Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n gwneud synnwyr. Yr ydym ni, Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, eisoes wedi rhoi prosesau ar waith i sicrhau bod trefn glinigol a chyllidol briodol yn y gwasanaeth ambiwlans ac y bydd craffu ar y drefn honno. Yr ydym wedi cytuno i weithio gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans a'i staff i gyflawni'r agenda foderneiddio. Yr ydym ar fin cyhoeddi 'Delivering Emergency Care Services', y bydd ymgynghori yn ei gylch yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf. Bydd hwnnw'n sylfaen i ddull hollol newydd o ddarparu gofal heb ei drefnu yng Nghymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ill dau'n edrych ymlaen, gan weithio i weld beth y gallwn ei gyfrannu at yr agenda newydd a chyffrous hon, felly gadewch inni wrthod y cynnig hwn sy'n edrych yn ôl. Gadewch inni edrych i'r dyfodol a chreu gwasanaeth ambiwlans

gwell, a fydd yn darparu gwell gwasanaethau sydd heb eu trefnu.

Between 750 and 780 paramedics have already been trained in advanced skills of resuscitation and thrombolysis with over 150 patients benefiting, and bilateral agreements are in place between local health boards and ambulance trusts to improve local performance. I am sure that Kirsty knows that discussions are already taking place across Powys on the role of community paramedics. Amazingly, she did not think that that was worth commenting on in her contribution. New care pathways are being developed to improve the skills base of our ambulance staff, to allow them to respond more flexibly to the emergency call-outs. That is crucial because, as Nick Bourne said, many calls are inappropriate. Possibly up to 90 per cent of the 999 calls made to the ambulance service are not of 999 category status. Consequently, we need our ambulance services to work more flexibly to be able to respond, as opposed to working rigidly, as currently. Proposals are coming forward to redesign handover and turnaround times with regard to ambulances in our hospitals. I have given a clear indication in committee that we are willing to engage constructively with the ambulance service in a dialogue over the capital programme that has been outlined.

In conclusion, there is a clear programme for modernising the ambulance service in Wales. We, as an Assembly Government, want to move forwards; we will not move backwards.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Your response in committee was far more measured than your response this afternoon to the comments of not only Roger Thayne, but also the former chair of the ambulance trust, Roy Norris, who confirmed the fears and said that he shared Mr Thayne's concerns. Are you telling us that a chief executive of an emergency service, interim or not, resigning because he does not feel that he wants to preside over a service that is endangering lives is not a serious matter, or a matter that needs an inquiry to look into it?

Mae rhwng 750 a 780 o barameddygon eisoes wedi eu hyfforddi mewn sgiliau uwch o ran dadebru a thrombolysis ac mae dros 150 o gleifion wedi elwa, ac mae cytundebau dwyochrog ar waith rhwng y byrddau iechyd lleol a'r ymddiriedolaethau ambiwlans i wella'r perfformiad yn lleol. Yr wyf yn siŵr bod Kirsty'n gwybod bod trafodaethau eisoes ar waith ledled Powys ynghylch rôl y parameddygon cymunedol. Yn rhyfedd ddigon, ni chredai ei bod yn werth cynnig sylwadau ynghylch hynny yn ei chyfraniad. Mae llwybrau gofal newydd wrthi'n cael eu datblygu i wella sylfaen sgiliau staff yr ambiwlansys, fel y gallant ymateb yn fwy hyblyg i alwadau brys. Mae hyn yn hanfodol oherwydd, ys dywedodd Nick Bourne, mae llawer o alwadau amhriodol. Efallai nad yw hyd at 90 y cant o'r galwadau 999 a wneir i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans o statws categori 999. O ganlyniad, mae angen i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans weithio mewn modd mwy hyblyg er mwyn gallu ymateb, yn hytrach na gweithio'n haearnaidd, fel y gwna ar hyn o bryd. Mae cynigion wrthi'n cael eu cyflwyno i ail-lunio amseroedd trosglwyddo cleifion a chwblhau teithiau ambiwlansys yn ein hysbytai. Dangosais yn glir yn y pwyllgor ein bod yn fodlon cynnal deialog adeiladol gyda'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans ynghylch y rhaglen gyfalaf sydd wedi ei hamlinellu.

I gloi, mae rhaglen glir ar gyfer moderneiddio gwasanaeth ambiwlans Cymru. Yr ydym ninnau, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, am symud ymlaen; nid ydym am symud tuag yn ôl.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr oedd yr ymateb a roesoch yn y pwyllgor yn llawer mwy pwylllog na'r ymateb a roesoch y prynhawn yma nid yn unig i sylwadau Roger Thayne, ond hefyd i gyn-gadeirydd yr ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans, Roy Norris, a gadarnhaodd y pryderon ac a ddywedodd fod yr un pryderon ag sydd gan Mr Thayne ganddo yntau. Ai dweud yr ydych nad yw ymddiswyddiad prif weithredwr gwasanaeth brys, boed honno'n swydd interim ai peidio, am nad yw'n teimlo ei fod am fod yn rheolwr ar wasanaeth sy'n peryglu bywydau'n fater difrifol, nac yn fater y mae angen i ymchwiliad edrych arno?

**Brian Gibbons:** No, I do not think that anyone would deny that this is a serious matter, but if it is serious, we need to move ahead with the modernisation agenda and not waste an indeterminate amount of time and money going down the route of holding a public inquiry, which will duplicate what is already being done and will not tell us anything new. A range of other independent bodies is currently looking at this. As the First Minister said, yours is a recipe for standing still or looking backwards; we want to go forwards with the workforce.

**Helen Mary Jones:** It is very interesting to note the different tone in the Minister's response here in the Chamber compared with his response in committee last week, and I will return to that point.

I begin by making the case for an inquiry. I stress that we have not asked for this lightly; we realise that there are cost and time implications. I very much regret that the Minister and the First Minister have suggested that this is about party politics; it is not. It is a deliberate attempt to remove this issue from a party-political agenda. We can and will scrutinise the Minister fortnightly in committee, and weekly in the Chamber, but we, the opposition party, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, do not want our ambulance service to become a political football. The Minister and First Minister are making it such this afternoon.

We need a public inquiry to restore confidence; people are fearful. Kirsty Williams was right to say that many of us did not need Roger Thayne to tell us that there were problems. Last year, I saw three ambulances standing outside the hospital in Llanelli. One held a very sick patient who had been there for an hour. None of those ambulances could respond to emergency calls, and none of those patients was getting treatment. People are really concerned, and if the Minister and Government do not know that, it shows just how out of touch they are.

**Brian Gibbons:** Na, ni chredaf y byddai neb yn gwadu nad yw hwn yn fater difrifol, ond os yw'n ddifrifol, mae angen inni fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda foderneiddio yn hytrach na gwastraffu cyfnod amhenodol o amser a swm amhenodol o arian wrth fynd ati i gynnal ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, a fyddai'n dyblygu'r hyn sydd eisoes yn digwydd ac na fyddai'n datgelu dim byd newydd inni. Mae amryw o gyrff annibynnol eraill wrthi'n ystyried hyn ar hyn o bryd. Ys dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, mae'r hyn a gynigiwch yn golygu sefyll yn yr unfan neu edrych tuag yn ôl; yr ydym ninnau am symud ymlaen gyda'r gweithlu.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Diddorol iawn yw nodi'r tinc gwahanol sydd i ymateb y Gweinidog yma heddiw yn y Siambr o'i gymharu â'r ymateb a roes yn y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, ac yr wyf am ddychwelyd at y pwynt hwnnw.

Dechreuaf gan bledio'r achos dros gynnal ymchwiliad. Pwysleisiaf nad ar chwarae bach yr ydym wedi gofyn am hyn; sylweddolwn fod goblygiadau o ran cost ac amser. Yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr fod y Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog wedi awgrymu mai mater o wleidyddiaeth pleidiau yw hyn; nid felly y mae. Ymgais fwriadol ydyw i ddwyn y mater hwn oddi ar agenda gwleidyddiaeth pleidiau. Gallwn graffu ar y Gweinidog bob pythefnos yn y pwyllgor, a bob wythnos yn y Siambr, a gwnawn hynny, ond nid ydym ni, yr wrthblaid, Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, am i'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans fynd yn bêl-droed wleidyddol. Dyna y mae'r Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog yn ei wneud y prynhawn yma.

Mae angen inni gael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i ailennyn hyder; mae ofn ar bobl. Yr oedd Kirsty Williams yn llygad ei lle pan ddywedodd nad oedd angen i Roger Thayne ddweud wrth lawer ohonom fod problemau. Y llynedd, gwelais dri ambiwlans yn sefyll y tu allan i'r ysbyty yn Llanelli. Yn un ohonynt yr oedd claf sâl iawn a oedd wedi bod yno ers awr. Ni allai'r un o'r ambiwlansys hynny ymateb i alwadau brys, ac nid oedd yr un o'r cleifion hynny'n cael triniaeth. Mae pobl yn bryderus iawn, ac onid yw'r Gweinidog a'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod hynny, mae

hynny'n dangos cyn lleied a wyddant am yr hyn sy'n digwydd.

We need a public inquiry to establish the facts. There are some differences. Roger Thayne makes some quite shocking statements in his report; those need to be tested. Most of all, we need to agree a way ahead. We need to get this out of the party-political arena and develop a national consensus. An inquiry could be short, and it could be focused. The Minister is right to say that much of the information is already there and needs only to be put in the public domain to be scrutinised, so why can we not do this in public?

Mae angen inni gael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus i benderfynu beth yw'r ffeithiau. Mae rhai gwahaniaethau. Mae Roger Thayne yn gwneud rhai datganiadau syfrdanol yn ei adroddiad; mae angen profi'r rheini. Yn bennaf oll, mae angen inni gytuno ynghylch ffordd ymlaen. Mae angen inni ddwyn y mater hwn o arena gwleidyddiaeth pleidiau a datblygu consensws cenedlaethol. Gallai'r ymchwiliad fod yn un byr, a gallai ganolbwyntio ar faterion penodol. Mae'r Gweinidog yn iawn wrth ddweud bod llawer o'r wybodaeth ar gael eisoes ac mai mater o'i gwneud yn gyhoeddus ydyw er mwyn craffu arni, felly pam na allwn wneud hynny yng ngŵydd y cyhoedd?

The internal investigations that the Minister talks about are simply not good enough; we need that public reassurance. I have to ask, Presiding Officer, why the Minister seems to be so afraid of this. I am concerned that the Minister may feel that he has something to hide. I am afraid that he is picking up some nasty habits from the rest of his Cabinet colleagues, because he is showing a marked, depressing desire to avoid scrutiny.

Nid yw'r ymchwiliadau mewnol y mae'r Gweinidog yn sôn amdanynt yn ddigon da; mae angen inni gael y sicrwydd cyhoeddus hwnnw. Mae'n rhaid imi ofyn, Lywydd, pam y mae ar y Gweinidog gymaint o ofn hyn. Yr wyf yn bryderus efallai nad yw'r Gweinidog yn datgelu'r cyfan. Mae arnaf ofn ei fod yn dysgu arferion drwg gan weddill ei gyd-Aelodau yn y Cabinet, oherwydd ei fod yn dangos awydd amlwg, sy'n peri i rywun ddigalonni, i osgoi craffu arnoch.

**Brian Gibbons:** As I said, the audit report from Roger Thayne, the report from the district audit office, and the Healthcare Inspectorate Wales report will all be in the public domain. There is no cover up, as you suggested; this is open government.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fel y dywedais, bydd adroddiad archwilio Roger Thayne, adroddiad swyddfa'r archwilydd dosbarth, ac adroddiad Arolygiaeth Gofal Iechyd Cymru i gyd yn adroddiadau cyhoeddus. Nid oes dim byd wedi ei gelu, fel yr awgrymasoch; llywodraethu agored yw hyn.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I did not use the words 'cover up', Minister, and if I had, I am sure that the Presiding Officer would have called me up. I just asked why you were so keen to avoid scrutiny, which you clearly are.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Ni ddefnyddiais y gair 'celu', Weinidog, a phetaswn, yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r Llywydd wedi dweud y drefn. Gofyn a wneuthum pam yr oeddech mor awyddus i osgoi craffu arnoch, fel y mae'n amlwg eich bod.

In the short time available to me, I will not respond to all of the individual comments, but I am grateful to all of those who took part in the debate. Ieuan Wyn Jones clearly set out the case for the inquiry, and we are grateful to Jenny Randerson and Kirsty Williams for their support, and to Jenny Randerson for her helpful amendment.

Yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf, nid wyf am ateb pob un o'r sylwadau unigol, ond yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r rhai a gymerodd ran yn y ddatl. Cyflwynodd Ieuan Wyn Jones yr achos dros yr ymchwiliad yn glir, ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar i Jenny Randerson a Kirsty Williams am eu cefnogaeth ac i Jenny Randerson am ei gwelliant defnyddiol.

The points that Elin Jones and Dai Lloyd raised about the importance of the ambulance services for any planned broader changes to hospital services must be addressed before those planned changes to hospital services in Mid and West Wales are attempted. I would like us all to echo the praise that Tamsin Dunwoody gave to the ambulance staff. Most of us here will have had an occasion in our lives when we have been very glad to see them. However, it is wrong of her to imply that this debate is in any way a criticism of those staff. It is, as Rhodri Glyn Thomas has said, the reverse. The problem is not the quality of the staff, but that they do not have the resources to do their job or the support that they need.

I am grateful, again, for the support of Jonathan Morgan and Nick Bourne, both of whom were right to say that we cannot leave this to the Assembly Government alone, and were right to stress the seriousness of the issue and the risk to life.

We could probably have done without the Minister's initial flippancy in his response. It is not typical of him; it is more typical of the First Minister, and perhaps he should not pick up his bad ways. We are increasingly, as opposition parties, calling for efficient and innovative methods of scrutiny because of the continuing failures of this Government to deliver. That is why we ask for inquiries and committees and so on. In case the Minister has failed to notice, we are the opposition; it is our job to scrutinise him. If that makes him uncomfortable, I am sorry, but that is what we are paid to do.

This is not about the past, but about the future. The report that was given to me by Roger Thayne, presented to the trust on 16 May, was jointly authored by the now interim/acting/whatever-it-is chief executive. So, we are not addressing issues that are in the past; we are addressing issues that are here in the present. There is a clear difference of view here, because Roger Thayne has said categorically and written to me that he raised all of these issues in his report with the

Mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw i bwyntiau Elin Jones a Dai Lloyd ynghylch pwysigrwydd y gwasanaethau ambiwlans o ran unrhyw newidiadau ehangach arfaethedig cyn rhoi cynnig ar y newidiadau arfaethedig hynny i wasanaethau'r ysbytai yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Hoffwn inni oll ategu'r ganmoliaeth a roes Tamsin Dunwoody i staff yr ambiwlansys. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonom sydd yma heddiw wedi gweld adegau yn ein bywyd pan oeddem yn falch iawn o'u gweld. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n iawn iddi awgrymu bod y ddadl hon rywfodd yn feirniadaeth ar y staff hynny. I'r gwrthwyneb, ys dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas. Nid safon y staff yw'r broblem, ond y ffaith nad oes ganddynt adnoddau digonol i wneud eu gwaith na'r gefnogaeth angenrheidiol.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar, unwaith yn rhagor, am gefnogaeth Jonathan Morgan a Nick Bourne, yr oeddent yn iawn ill dau wrth ddweud na allwn adael hyn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn unig, ac yn iawn wrth bwysleisio difrifoldeb y mater a'r perygl i fywyd.

Mae'n debyg y byddai'n well pe baem heb gael yr ysmaldod ar y dechrau gan y Gweinidog yn ei ymateb. Nid yw'n nodweddiadol ohono; mae'n fwy nodweddiadol o'r Prif Weinidog, ac efallai na ddylai fagu ei arferion drwg. Yr ydym ni'r gwrthbleidiau'n galw fwyfwy am ddulliau craffu effeithlon ac arloesol oherwydd bod y Llywodraeth hon yn barhaus yn methu â chyflawni. Dyna pam yr ydym yn gofyn am ymchwiliadau a phwyllgorau ac yn y blaen. Rhag ofn nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi sylwi, ni yw'r wrthblaid; ein gwaith yw craffu arno. Os yw hynny'n peri iddo fod yn anghyfforddus, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond am wneud hynny yr ydym yn cael ein talu.

Nid mater sy'n ymwneud â'r gorffennol yw hwn, ond yn hytrach y dyfodol. Cafodd yr adroddiad a roddwyd imi gan Roger Thayne, ac a gyflwynwyd i'r ymddiriedolaeth ar 16 Mai, ei ysgrifennu ar y cyd gan y sawl sydd erbyn hyn yn brif weithredwr interim/dros dro/beth bynnag y bo. Felly, nid rhoi sylw i faterion y gorffennol yr ydym; rhoi sylw i faterion y presennol a wnawn. Mae gwahaniaeth barn eglur i'w weld yma, gan fod Roger Thayne wedi dweud yn bendant

Minister in a meeting on 2 May. I was not present at that meeting, but this is an example of precisely why we need a public inquiry. There are too many discussions going on behind closed doors.

In the Thayne report, we have a picture of excellent, committed front-line staff struggling with inadequate equipment, poor management, and a lack of strategic planning. This has to be deeply worrying to us all, because we are all potential users of those services, as are all of our constituents. Surely every citizen in Wales should have the right to know that this basic emergency service will be there when it is needed. We cannot be sure where the figure of 500 deaths comes from; that needs to be scrutinised in more detail. However, if there is one death in Wales because the ambulance service cannot get there on time, then I, as shadow health Minister am not satisfied with that. If the Minister is, he should be ashamed of himself.

This report reflects the experience of constituents, and I was moved by some of the situations described by Kirsty Williams. Unfortunately, they are not that rare, though, on the whole, the service on the front line is very good. The Minister's complacency is worrying. He did not quite take the dismissive approach that the First Minister did when we attempted to scrutinise him, but it is very different from the approach that he took in committee, which was far more constructive.

4.40 p.m.

To conclude, Presiding Officer, we have a desperate need to pull all of these reports, studies and inquiries together, and get all of these issues out into the open. When we called for a public inquiry, we did not know that Roger Thayne's report to the ambulance trust had asked for the same thing. These issues have to be brought out into the public eye. Nothing less will restore public confidence and enable us to develop the national consensus that we so desperately

iddo godi'r holl faterion sydd yn ei adroddiad gyda'r Gweinidog mewn cyfarfod ar 2 Mai ac mae wedi ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud hynny. Nid oeddwn yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, ond dyma enghraifft sy'n dangos yn union pam y mae angen inni gael ymchwiliad cyhoeddus. Mae gormod o drafod y tu ôl i ddrysau caeedig.

Yn adroddiad Thayne, cawn ddarlun o staff gwych ac ymroddedig y rheng flaen yn ymlafnio gyda chyfarpar annigonol, rheoli gwael a diffyg cynllunio strategol. Dylai hyn fod yn peri pryder i ni oll, gan fod posibilrwydd y byddwn ni i gyd yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny, a'n hetholwyr hefyd. Siawns na ddylai fod hawl gan bob dinesydd yng Nghymru i gael gwybod y bydd y gwasanaeth brys sylfaenol hwn ar gael pan fo ei angen. Ni allwn fod yn sicr o ble y daeth ffigur o 500 o farwolaethau; mae angen craffu ar hwnnw'n fwy manwl. Fodd bynnag, os oes un farwolaeth yng Nghymru am na all y gwasanaeth ambiwlans gyrraedd mewn pryd, yna nid wyf fi, fel Gweinidog iechyd yr wrthblaid yn fodlon ar hynny. Os yw'r Gweinidog yn fodlon, dylai fod arno gywilydd.

Mae'r adroddiad yn adlewyrchu profiadau'r etholwyr, ac fe'm cynhyrfwyd gan rai o'r sefyllfaoedd a ddisgrifiwyd gan Kirsty Williams. Yn anffodus, nid ydynt mor brin â hynny, er bod gwasanaeth y rheng flaen, ar y cyfan, yn dda iawn. Mae hunanfodlonrwydd y Gweinidog yn peri pryder imi. Nid aeth ati i wfftio yr un fath â'r Prif Weinidog pan geisiasom graffu arno ef, ond mae ei agwedd yn wahanol iawn i'w agwedd yn y pwyllgor, a oedd yn llawer mwy adeiladol.

I gloi, Lywydd, mae gwir angen inni ddwyn yr holl adroddiadau, astudiaethau ac ymchwiliadau hyn ynghyd, a dwyn yr holl faterion hyn i olau dydd. Pan alwasom am ymchwiliad cyhoeddus, ni wyddem fod adroddiad Roger Thayne i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans wedi gofyn am yr un peth. Mae'n rhaid dwyn y materion hyn i sylw'r cyhoedd. Ni wnaiff dim byd arall ailennyn hyder y cyhoedd a'n galluogi i ddatblygu'r consensws cenedlaethol y mae ei angen

need.

arnom yn ddirfawr.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *rose*—

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas** *a gododd*—

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will take an intervention.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Derbyniaf ymyriad.

**The Presiding Officer:** I do not think so. You do not have that much time left.

**Y Llywydd:** Go brin. Nid oes gennych fawr ddim amser ar ôl.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I will be guided by the Presiding Officer, of course.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Dilynaf arweiniad y Llywydd, wrth gwrs.

**The Presiding Officer:** That is an old trick to keep the floor.

**Y Llywydd:** Mae hynny'n hen dric i gadw'r llawr.

**Helen Mary Jones:** If the Minister refuses the call for an inquiry, we will have to scrutinise him through the party-political fora, which is precisely what we were attempting to avoid by tabling this motion.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Os bydd y Gweinidog yn gwrthod yr alwad am ymchwiliad, bydd rhaid inni graffu arno drwy'r fforymau gwleidyddol pleidiol, sef yr union beth yr oeddem yn ceisio'i osgoi drwy gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn.

I commend this motion and the amendment to the Assembly. I particularly urge those Labour Members who I know have individual constituents coming to them regularly with issues and problems to vote in this case with their consciences and in their constituents' interests, and not according to the whip.

Cymeradwyaf y cynnig hwn a'r gwelliant i'r Cynulliad. Anogaf yn arbennig yr Aelodau Llafur hynny y gwn fod etholwyr unigol yn mynd atynt yn rheolaidd gyda materion a phroblemau i bleidleisio y tro hwn yn ôl eu cydwybod ac er lles eu hetholwyr, ac nid yn ôl y chwip.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Mewies, Sandy



Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion (NDM3100) as amended: to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3100) fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. acting in accordance with its powers under section 1 of the Inquiries Act 2005, causes an inquiry to be held into the provision of ambulance services in Wales;*

*1. gan weithredu'n unol â'i bwerau dan Adran 1 Deddf Ymchwiliadau 2005, yn peri i ymchwiliad gael ei gynnal i ddarpariaeth gwasanaethau ambiwlans yng Nghymru;*

*2. recommends that the terms of reference for the inquiry should be:*

*2. yn argymhell y dylai cylch gorchwyl yr ymchwiliad fod fel a ganlyn:*

*a) to look at the effectiveness of performance standards, staffing issues, financial and resource pressures together with any other related matters considered relevant; and*

*a) edrych ar effeithiolrwydd safonau perfformiad, materion staffio, pwysau o ran arian ac adnoddau, ynghyd ag unrhyw faterion perthnasol eraill yr ystyrir eu bod yn berthnasol; a*

*b) to consider the implications for the future and make recommendations accordingly;*

*b) ystyried y goblygiadau ar gyfer y dyfodol a gwneud argymhellion yn unol â hynny;*

*3. calls for a panel, comprising the Assembly Minister for Health and Social Services, and one Member each from the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party, the Welsh Conservative Party and Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, to be convened for the purpose of recommending the name of a suitable person to chair the inquiry. The panel shall lay a report before the Assembly accordingly.*

*3. yn galw am gynnull panel, yn cynnwys Gweinidog y Cynulliad dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, ac un Aelod yr un o Blaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a Phlaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, at ddiben argymhell enw person cymwys i gadeirio'r ymchwiliad. Bydd y panel yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad yn unol â hynny.*

*4. The cost of the inquiry shall be borne by the Welsh Assembly Government.*

*4. Bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ysgwyddo cost yr ymchwiliad.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 26.  
Amended motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 26.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff

Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Brian Gibbons:** Point of order. I voted the wrong way for the amendment. [*Laughter.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** Pwynt o drefn. Pleidleisiais yn anghywir ar y gwelliant. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Michael German:** I think that it was the right way.

**Michael German:** Credaf i chi bleidleisio'n iawn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I welcome the Minister's honesty at all times, but I am afraid that there is nothing that I can do about it.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Byddaf wastad yn croesawu gonestrwydd y Gweinidog, ond mae arnaf ofn nad oes dim y gallaf ei wneud yn ei gylch.

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol The Social Justice Annual Report**

Motion (NDM3101): to propose that  
*the National Assembly for Wales:*

Cynnig (NDM3101): cynnig bod  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*notes the Welsh Assembly Government's social justice report 2006, as presented to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on 8 June 2006.*

*yn nodi adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol 2006 Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y'i cyflwynwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 8 Mehefin 2006.*

Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the increasing unemployment and high economic inactivity in Wales.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd mewn diweithdra a lefel uchel anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru.*

- Amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes with concern rising homelessness, the growing housing crisis in Wales and the failure to recognise that adequate supply of affordable housing is at the heart of community regeneration.*
- Gwelliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd yn nifer y digartref, yr argyfwng cynyddol ym maes tai yng Nghymru a'r methiant i gydnabod bod cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy wrth wraidd adfywio cymunedol.*
- Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes with concern increasing poverty in households where someone is in work.*
- Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi gyda phryder fod tlodi ar gynydd mewn aelwydydd lle mae rhywun yn gweithio.*
- Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes with concern that the bulk of improvement in school performance since the mid 1990s took place before 2000 and that Wales does worse than any English region at GCSE level.*
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi gyda phryder fod y rhan fwyaf o'r gwelliant ym mherfformiad ysgolion ers canol yr 1990au wedi digwydd cyn 2000 a bod Cymru'n perfformio'n waeth nag unrhyw un o ranbarthau Lloegr ar lefel TGAU.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- regrets the recent significant increase in the number of households in Wales experiencing fuel poverty.*
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn gresynu at y cynnydd sylweddol yn ddiweddar yn nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu tlodi tanwydd.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to introduce a comprehensive energy efficiency scheme aimed at reducing energy consumption.*
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cynhwysfawr gyda'r nod o leihau faint o ynni a ddefnyddir.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- condemns the refusal of the Welsh Assembly Government to release statistics to demonstrate whether the Communities First programme is achieving its aims.*
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn condemnio'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwrthod rhyddhau ystadegau i ddangos a yw'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyflawni ei hamcanion.*
- Amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- Gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y

cynnig:

*regrets the persistent high levels of in-work poverty in Wales.*

*yn gresynu at y lefelau cyson uchel o dlodi mewn gwaith yng Nghymru.*

Amendment 9 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 9 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to honour its commitments in the national service framework for mental health in Wales.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i anrhydeddu'r ymrwymadau a wnaeth yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru.*

Amendment 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*welcomes the fact that this is the last social justice report of the Assembly term and looks forward to future independent assessments of the Assembly Government's social justice record.*

*yn croesawu'r ffaith mai dyma adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol olaf tymor y Cynulliad ac yn edrych ymlaen at gael asesiadau annibynnol yn y dyfodol o record Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.*

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 and 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Lisa Francis, a gwelliannau 5, 6, 7, 8, 9 a 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*notes the Welsh Assembly Government's social justice report 2006, as presented to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on 8 June 2006. (NDM3101)*

*yn nodi adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol 2006 Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y'i cyflwynwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 8 Mehefin 2006. (NDM3101)*

I am pleased to present to the National Assembly the 2006 annual report on social justice, which provides a comprehensive round-up of Assembly Government activity, and details the development and implementation of a wide range of policies and programmes aimed specifically at tackling poverty and exclusion. As you know, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, 'Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion in Wales', provided a good evidence base in respect of the key problems

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol adroddiad blynyddol 2006 ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, sy'n crynhoi gweithgareddau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac yn manylu ynglŷn â datblygu gweithredu polisïau a rhaglenni amrywiol sydd â'r nod penodol o fynd i'r afael â thlodi ac allgáu cymdeithasol. Fel y gwyddoch, rhoes adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, 'Monitro Tlodi ac Allgáu Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru', sylfaen dda o dystiolaeth ar gyfer y problemau allweddol y dylid mynd i'r afael

to be tackled. The 2006 report uses that evidence as a focus for outlining the Assembly Government's action.

Having taken on board the comments made on the 2005 report by Assembly Members in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and in Plenary regarding measuring progress, the 2006 report outlines robust and quantifiable indicators to track progress year on year and indicators introduced in 2005 to be updated. It introduces cross-Government pictures of existing targets for the Assembly's main policies and programmes contributing to tackling social inclusion. It makes reference to the Assembly Government's commitment to develop new milestones and targets to monitor progress in eradicating child poverty by 2020.

This report was endorsed by the Cabinet, and I know that all Ministers share the objective of achieving social justice for communities across Wales. The report was also considered by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on 8 June. I welcome the contribution that the committee made to discussions, hopefully, on future reports in respect of social justice.

One of the key areas in the report, which I would like to tackle, is developing strong and safe communities. Fundamental to this is the issue of child poverty. As we know, the Deputy Minister is leading on this, using a phased approach to take forward the implementation of proposals to achieve the aim of eradicating child poverty by 2020. Major policy areas have been identified, and the intention is to develop medium-term milestones for 2010, and long-term targets for 2020, so that progress in eradicating child poverty can be measured over time.

In the context of potential new powers under the forthcoming Government of Wales Act, the intention is to consider developing a new Measure, post 2007, to combat child poverty. Over the next 12 months, the Deputy Minister will seek views from a variety of

â hwy. Mae adroddiad 2006 yn defnyddio'r dystiolaeth honno'n ffocws ar gyfer amlinellu'r hyn y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud.

Wedi derbyn y sylwadau a wnaethpwyd ynghylch adroddiad 2005 gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ac yn y Cyfarfod Llawn parthed mesur cynnydd, mae adroddiad 2006 yn amlinellu dangosyddion cadarn a mesuradwy i olrhain y cynnydd o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall a dangosyddion a gyflwynwyd yn 2005 i'w diweddarau. Mae'n cyflwyno darluniau traws-Lywodraethol o'r targedau presennol o ran y prif bolisiau a'r rhaglenni sydd gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer cyfrannu at fynd i'r afael â chynhwysiant cymdeithasol. Mae'n cyfeirio at ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cerrig milltir a thargedau newydd i fonitro cynnydd wrth ddiddymu tlodi plant erbyn 2020.

Cymeradwywyd yr adroddiad hwn gan y Cabinet, a gwn fod pob Gweinidog yn rhannu'r nod o sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ar gyfer cymunedau ar hyd a lled Cymru. Cafodd yr adroddiad ei ystyried hefyd gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 8 Mehefin. Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfraniad a wnaeth y pwyllgor i'r trafodaethau ar adroddiadau'r dyfodol, gobeithio, parthed cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Un o feysydd allweddol yr adroddiad, yr hoffwn fynd i'r afael ag ef, yw datblygu cymunedau cryf a diogel. Mae mater tlodi plant yn greiddiol i hyn. Fel y gwyddom, mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn arwain ar hyn, gan roi'r cynigion ar waith yn raddol er mwyn cyrraedd y nod o ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Mae meysydd polisi pwysig wedi'u nodi, a'r bwriad yw datblygu cerrig milltir tymor canolig ar gyfer 2010, a thargedau hirdymor ar gyfer 2020, fel y gellir mesur y cynnydd wrth ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant dros amser.

Yng nghyd-destun pwerau newydd y gallem eu cael o dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru sydd ar ddod, y bwriad yw ystyried datblygu Mesur newydd, ar ôl 2007, i ymladd yn erbyn tlodi ymhlith plant. Dros y 12 mis nesaf, bydd y Dirprwy Weinidog yn gofyn am farn

organisations across Wales on what this should entail.

Investment in children in their early years is particularly important. The Assembly Government's budgets provide increased investment in children, and several programmes are aimed at combating child poverty, such as Cymorth and Communities First. Cymorth uses partnership working and targeted investment in disadvantaged areas to make a positive impact. More than 900 projects across Wales are supported by this funding, and we only need to look at the figures—funding has increased from £11.5 million to £55 million in 2006-07—to see that that is a substantial financial commitment. We also have the Flying Start programme, as well as Communities First.

amryw o gyrff ledled Cymru ynghylch yr hyn y dylai ei gynnwys.

Mae buddsoddi mewn plant yn eu blynyddoedd cynnar yn arbennig o bwysig. Mae cyllidebau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu ar gyfer mwy o fuddsoddi mewn plant, a cheir sawl rhaglen sydd â'r amcan o ymladd yn erbyn tlodi ymhlith plant, fel Cymorth a Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae Cymorth yn defnyddio gweithio mewn partneriaeth a buddsoddi wedi'i dargedu mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig i gael effaith gadarnhaol. Mae mwy na 900 o brosiectau ledled Cymru'n cael cymorth drwy'r cyllid hwn, ac nid oes rhaid inni ond edrych ar y ffigurau—mae'r cyllid wedi codi o £11.5 miliwn i £55 miliwn yn 2006-07—i weld bod hynny'n ymrwymiad ariannol sylweddol. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae gennym raglen Dechrau'n Deg, yn ogystal â Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.46 p.m.  
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.46 p.m.*

Central to the Assembly Government's social justice agenda is the drive to build safer communities in which individuals do not live in fear of crime and anti-social behaviour—communities that are vibrant and attract investment, and in which individuals can realise their potential. Communities across Wales are becoming safer—the chances of being a victim of crime are the lowest for 20 years. Much credit for this must not go to us in Government, but to the community safety partnerships, which are committed to building safer, stronger communities. From 2003 to 2008, the Assembly Government has made over £16.5 million available to community safety partnerships to tackle youth offending and provide diversionary projects. The work that we do on youth work, particularly, in those areas is of mega importance to communities.

Mae lle canolog yn agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol i'r ymgyrch i greu cymunedau mwy diogel lle nad yw unigolion yn byw gan ofni troseddu ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol—cymunedau sydd yn fywiog ac yn denu buddsoddiad, a lle y gall unigolion wireddu eu potensial. Mae cymunedau ledled Cymru'n dod yn fwy diogel—mae'r tebygolrwydd o ddioddef oherwydd troseddu ar ei isaf ers 20 mlynedd. Nid i ni yn y Llywodraeth y mae llawer o'r clod am hynny, ond i'r partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol, sydd wedi ymrwymo i greu cymunedau cryfach a mwy diogel. Rhwng 2003 a 2008, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi darparu mwy na £16.5 miliwn i bartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol i ddelio â throseddu gan bobl ifanc a darparu prosiectau i'w difyrru. Mae'r gwaith a wnawn ar waith ieuencid, yn benodol, yn y meysydd hynny'n bwysig dros ben i gymunedau.

Poor-quality housing, and the profoundly negative impact that this has on people's physical health, safety and wellbeing, is an issue. We must improve Welsh housing stock, and we must consider many issues around that.

Mae tai o ansawdd gwael, a'r effaith dra negyddol a gaiff hynny ar iechyd corfforol, diogelwch a lles pobl, yn fater o bwys. Rhaid inni wella stoc dai Cymru, a rhaid inni ystyried llawer o faterion sydd yn gysylltiedig â hynny.

Homelessness represents the most extreme form of social exclusion. The revised national homelessness strategy, launched last November, is supported by a large increase in budget over the last eight years, bringing it up to £6.3 million. In addition, £16 million has been made available to local authorities through the housing revenue account subsidy to support the provision of private sector leased properties. We are also creating a progressive service framework through legislation, such as in restricting the use of bed-and-breakfast accommodation to house homeless families. We are seeing an improvement in homelessness in Wales resulting from our commitment and action. The latest figures for October to December 2005 show a 35 per cent decrease in homelessness on the previous year. The numbers of households in bed-and-breakfast accommodation is 22 per cent lower than in the previous 12 months.

There are issues about helping more people to get into jobs. We have worked closely with the Department for Work and Pensions on Pathways to Work. Other issues are covered in my report, such as guaranteeing free travel for the elderly and disabled people, which continues to be successful. Local authorities have issued more than 500,000 free bus passes. This scheme has helped turn around the long-term decline in the number of bus passengers making journeys in Wales.

On the improving health and wellbeing agenda in this regard, there is our work on prescription charges, and we have looked at the inequalities in health fund, which is supporting 62 projects. There are also local health alliances established in each local authority area, and we provide support for them.

However, sometimes the key to all these issues is creating better jobs and skills. When we look at education, we can see that we now have the foundation phase, the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales programme, and we have also had the further roll-out of education maintenance allowances in Wales.

Digartrefedd yw'r math mwyaf eithafol o allgáu cymdeithasol. Mae'r strategaeth genedlaethol ddiwygiedig ar ddigartrefedd, a lanswyd fis Tachwedd diwethaf, yn cael ei chefnogi gan gynnydd mawr yn y gyllideb dros yr wyth mlynedd diwethaf, ac mae wedi codi i £6.3 miliwn. Yn ogystal â hynny, darparwyd £16 miliwn i awdurdodau lleol drwy gymorthdal y cyfrif refeniw tai i hyrwyddo darparu tai sector preifat ar les. Yr ydym hefyd yn creu fframwaith gwasanaeth blaengar drwy ddeddfwriaeth, gan gyfyngu, er enghraifft, ar y defnydd o lety gwely a brecwast i gartrefu teuluoedd digartref. Yr ydym yn gweld gwelliant o ran digartrefedd yng Nghymru o ganlyniad i'n hymrwymiad a'r camau a gymerasom. Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer y cyfnod rhwng mis Hydref a mis Rhagfyr 2005 yn dangos bod digartrefedd wedi gostwng 35 y cant o'i gymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Mae nifer y teuluoedd mewn llety gwely a brecwast 22 y cant yn is nag yn y 12 mis blaenorol.

Mae rhai materion sydd yn ymwneud â helpu mwy o bobl i gael swyddi. Yr ydym wedi cydweithio'n agos â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ar Llwybrau at Waith. Ymdrinnir â materion eraill yn fy adroddiad, fel gwarantu teithio am ddim i'r henoed a phobl anabl, sydd yn dal i lwyddo. Mae awdurdodau lleol wedi dosbarthu mwy na 500,000 o docynnau bws am ddim. Mae'r cynllun hwn wedi helpu i wrthdroi'r dirywiad hirdymor yn nifer y rhai sydd yn mynd ar deithiau mewn bysiau yng Nghymru.

Ynghylch yr agenda ar wella iechyd a lles mewn cysylltiad â hyn, tynnir sylw at ein gwaith ar daliadau presgripsiwn, ac yr ydym wedi edrych ar y gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sydd yn rhoi cymorth i 62 o brosiectau. Mae cynghreiriau iechyd lleol wedi'u sefydlu hefyd yn ardal pob awdurdod lleol, ac yr ydym yn darparu cymorth iddynt.

Fodd bynnag, yr allwedd weithiau i'r holl faterion hyn yw creu gwell swyddi a gwella sgiliau. Gyda golwg ar addysg, gwelwn fod y cyfnod sylfaen gennym bellach, y rhaglen codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru, ac yr ydym hefyd wedi gweld cyflwyno rhagor o lwfansau cynhaliath addysg yng Nghymru.

The report demonstrates the Assembly Government's ongoing commitment to social justice for all, through all its programmes, including Communities First in my own portfolio, but across all programmes in portfolios. For those living in Wales's most deprived communities our policies and programmes offer hope, helping people to overcome disadvantage and allowing them to play a fuller part in society. However, continuing to make progress means working across the different levels of government in Wales, and with voluntary and private sector partners. Not least, it means working with the people living in the most deprived communities.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos ymrwymiad parhaus Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol i bawb, drwy ei holl raglenni, gan gynnwys Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn fy mhortffolio fy hun, ac yn yr holl raglenni mewn portffolios eraill. I'r rhai sydd yn byw yng nghymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig Cymru, mae ein polisiau a'n rhaglenni'n cynnig gobaith, gan helpu pobl i oresgyn anfanteision a chaniatáu iddynt chwarae rhan lawnach mewn cymdeithas. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn parhau i wneud cynnydd, rhaid gweithio ar draws gwahanol lefelau llywodraeth yng Nghymru, a chyda phartneriaid yn y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector preifat. Yn anad dim, mae'n golygu gweithio gyda'r rhai sydd yn byw yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig.

4.50 p.m.

I commend the report and the motion to you, and I look forward to the discussion. We had an exceptionally good discussion on this report in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. I very much hope that Members agree that this report is an improvement on last year's—we hope to make further improvements in future.

Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad a'r cynnig i chi, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at y drafodaeth. Cawsom drafodaeth eithriadol o dda ar yr adroddiad hwn yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Yr wyf yn mawr obeithio bod yr Aelodau'n cytuno bod yr adroddiad hwn yn well nag un y llynedd—yr ydym yn gobeithio gwneud gwelliannau pellach yn y dyfodol.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** We should get in everyone who wishes to speak. However, in order that we not overrun the 5.30 p.m. cut-off too much, I appeal for succinct speeches where possible.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Dylai fod yn bosibl inni gynnwys pawb sydd yn dymuno siarad. Fodd bynnag, fel na fyddwn yn gorffen yn rhy hwyr ar ôl y terfyn amser am 5.30 p.m., gofynnaf am wneud areithiau cryno, os oes modd.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiau welliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern the increasing unemployment and high economic inactivity in Wales.*

*yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd mewn diweithdra a lefel uchel anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru.*

I propose amendment 2 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiau welliant 2 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*notes with concern rising homelessness, the growing housing crisis in Wales and the failure to recognise that adequate supply of affordable housing is at the heart of*

*yn nodi gyda phryder y cynnydd yn nifer y digartref, yr argyfwng cynyddol ym maes tai yng Nghymru a'r methiant i gydnabod bod cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy wrth*



*community regeneration.*

I propose amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern increasing poverty in households where someone is in work.*

Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern that the bulk of improvement in school performance since the mid 1990s took place before 2000 and that Wales does worse than any English region at GCSE level.*

Action speaks louder than words, hence amendments 1 to 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Labour often claims that only the state can guarantee fairness. Its centralised top-down approach means well, but fails badly. We must find different solutions to the deep-rooted causes of poverty in Wales and we must start trusting people and sharing responsibility. We must also remove the limits on what the voluntary sector, social enterprises and community groups can do—they can succeed where the state has failed. During the 1980s and early 1990s, Wales, with 5 per cent of the UK's population, obtained 22 per cent of inward investment, but, despite this inheritance, economic inactivity among people of working age in Wales has been increasing for over a year and is now higher than it was at the start of the second Assembly. In reality, there is now no-one in employment in almost one in five Welsh working-aged households and one in six Welsh children are being brought up in households in which no-one has a job. In fact, if Welsh economic inactivity was at the UK level, 100,000 more people in Wales would be in employment. The unemployment rate in Wales has risen over the last year, and the employment rate still stands at 3 per cent below the UK average. All this is despite a big increase in public spending, with almost 60 per cent of the Welsh economy now in the public sector. Even worse, new unemployment tends to be in low-skilled jobs, and Oxfam's statement that the proportion of those living in income poverty

*wraidd adfywio cymunedol.*

Cynigiau welliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder fod tlodi ar gynydd mewn aelwydydd lle mae rhywun yn gweithio.*

Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder fod y rhan fwyaf o'r gwelliant ym mherfformiad ysgolion ers canol yr 1990au wedi digwydd cyn 2000 a bod Cymru'n perfformio'n waeth nag unrhyw un o ranbarthau Lloegr ar lefel TGAU.*

Mae gweithredoedd yn bwysicach na geiriau, a dyna'r rheswm dros welliannau 1 i 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Mae Llafur yn honni'n aml mai dim ond y wladwriaeth a all warantu tegwch. Mae ei dull gweithredu canoledig, o'r brig i lawr, yn dda ei amcan, ond mae'n methu'n druenus. Rhaid inni ganfod atebion gwahanol i achosion sylfaenol tlodi yng Nghymru a rhaid inni ddechrau ymddiried mewn pobl a rhannu cyfrifoldeb. Rhaid inni hefyd godi'r cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn y caiff y sector gwirfoddol, mentrau cymdeithasol a grwpiau cymunedol ei wneud—gallant lwyddo lle y mae'r wladwriaeth wedi methu. Yn ystod yr 1980au a dechrau'r 1990au, sicrhodd Cymru, gyda 5 y cant o boblogaeth y DU, 22 y cant o'r mewnfuddsoddiadau, ond, er gwaethaf yr hyn a etifeddwyd, mae anweithgarwch economaidd ymysg pobl o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru wedi bod ar gynydd ers mwy na blwyddyn ac mae bellach yn uwch nag a oedd ar ddechrau'r ail Gynulliad. Mewn gwirionedd, nid oes neb mewn gwaith yn un o bob pump bron o'r aelwydydd o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru ac mae un o bob chwech o blant Cymru'n cael eu magu ar aelwydydd lle nad oes gan neb swydd. Mewn gwirionedd, pe byddai anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghymru ar lefel y DU, byddai 100,000 yn fwy o bobl yng Nghymru mewn gwaith. Mae'r gyfradd diweithdra yng Nghymru wedi codi dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ac mae'r gyfradd cyflogaeth yn dal i fod 3 y cant yn is na chyfartaledd y DU. Mae hynny oll er gwaethaf cynnydd mawr mewn gwariant

in households with at least one person in work has risen from 30 per cent in the mid 1990s to over 37 per cent now is, therefore, perhaps not surprising.

**Huw Lewis:** I thank you for your opening paragraphs, because they sum up the Tory philosophy in this regard almost perfectly. What you describe, as far as the Welsh Conservatives are concerned, is the ‘not me, Guv’ approach when it comes to the role of the state on issues connected with social justice and poverty—the attitude is, let us hand it over to charities and the voluntary sector. Your leader in Westminster, David Cameron, has committed the Conservative Party to honouring the commitment to eradicate child poverty by 2020. The Welsh Conservatives have not said a word. What is your commitment on child poverty by 2020?

**Mark Isherwood:** I think you will find that David Cameron made a UK commitment, to which we are fully committed.

**Huw Lewis:** Will you write that down?

**Mark Isherwood:** I stand by the national leader’s statement fully. Had he said something that I disagreed with, I would have said so publicly, which I most certainly did not. In terms of history, in 1997, the UK had the best job creation record in Europe, and unemployment had fallen faster in Wales than in any other UK nation or region. The most competitive regions in the UK are those least dependent on the public sector, and there is therefore an urgent need for Wales to stimulate the private sector. Cardiff University states that good housing should be at the heart of community regeneration, and the Chartered Institute of Housing Cymru states that an adequate supply of affordable housing is key to creating sustainable

cyhoeddus, ac mae bron 60 y cant o economi Cymru yn y sector cyhoeddus erbyn hyn. Yn waeth byth, mae diweithdra newydd yn tueddu i fod ym maes swyddi sgiliau isel ac, felly, nid yw datganiad Oxfam i’r perwyl bod cyfran y rhai sydd yn byw mewn tlodi o ran incwm mewn aelwydydd lle y mae o leiaf un unigolyn mewn gwaith wedi codi o 30 y cant yng nghanol yr 1990au i fwy na 37 y cant yn awr yn peri syndod, o bosibl.

**Huw Lewis:** Diolchaf i chi am eich paragraffau agoriadol, gan eu bod yn crynhoi athroniaeth y Torïaid yn hyn o beth yn berffaith bron. Yr hyn a ddisgrifiwch, o ran Ceidwadwyr Cymru, yw’r ymagwedd ‘peidiwch â disgwyl i mi wneud dim’ mewn cysylltiad â rôl y wladwriaeth mewn materion sydd yn ymwneud â chyfiawnder cymdeithasol a thlodi—yr agwedd yw, gadewch inni drosglwyddo hyn i elusennau a’r sector gwirfoddol. Mae eich arweinydd yn San Steffan, David Cameron, wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau bod y Blaid Geidwadol yn cyflawni’r ymrwymiad i ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020. Nid yw Ceidwadwyr Cymru wedi dweud yr un gair. Beth yw eich ymrwymiad chi o ran tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020?

**Mark Isherwood:** Yr wyf yn credu y cewch fod David Cameron wedi gwneud ymrwymiad ar gyfer y DU, yr ydym ni wedi llwyr ymrwymo iddo.

**Huw Lewis:** A wnewch roi hynny ar ddu a gwyn?

**Mark Isherwood:** Llwyf gefnogaf ddatganiad yr arweinydd cenedlaethol. Pe byddai wedi dweud rhywbeth yr oeddwn yn anghytuno ag ef, byddwn wedi dweud hynny ar goedd, ac ni wneuthum hynny’n sicr. Gyda golwg ar hanes, yn 1997, gan y DU yr oedd y record orau o ran creu swyddi yn Ewrop, ac yr oedd diweithdra wedi gostwng yn gyflymach yng Nghymru nag mewn dim un wlad neu ranbarth arall yn y DU. Y rhanbarthau mwyaf cystadleuol yn y DU yw’r rhai sydd leiaf dibynnol ar y sector cyhoeddus, ac felly mae taer angen i Gymru roi hwb i’r sector preifat. Dywed Prifysgol Caerdydd y dylai tai da fod wrth wraidd adfywio cymunedol, a dywed Sefydliad Tai Siartredig Cymru fod cyflenwad digonol o

communities. Despite rising waiting lists for houses, homelessness and house prices, the Labour Welsh Assembly Government has massively cut funding for social and affordable housing. As I have said before, funding for the Welsh social housing grant programme was nearly £174 million in 1996-97, but in the last full financial year it totalled just £96.4 million—that is a 45 per cent cut. Even with planned budget increases through to 2007-08, the social housing grant will still be less in absolute terms, and massively less in real terms, than it was 10 years ago. Without urgent action to tackle the Welsh housing crisis, Labour's multi-million pound investment in community regeneration is like pouring water into a bucket full of holes rather than going out and buying a new bucket.

The number of households needing accommodation in Wales is forecast to increase by 12 per cent over the next 10 years. Under Labour, however, the number of new social housing dwellings built in Wales has been cut by three quarters. In the first six years of devolution, housing associations and councils built 4,436 new dwellings. This contrasts with the 17,395 built in Wales during the last six years of Conservative Government. In Wales today, an estimated 225,000 people are living in unfit accommodation. Homelessness in Wales has more than doubled since devolution. Shelter Cymru estimates that at least 50,000 people now experience homelessness in Wales each year. Housing waiting lists across Wales rose by 50 per cent last year alone, and are projected to exceed 100,000.

Wales has the worst housing conditions in the United Kingdom. Bad housing is making our children ill, robbing them of a decent education and damaging their future. To tackle this crisis, we must look beyond the public sector and unlock the potential in both voluntary and private sectors in public and private partnership—turning it into a reality, Huw, and not simply ensuring a soundbite.

dai fforddiadwy'n hollbwysig ar gyfer creu cymunedau cynaliadwy. Er bod rhestrau aros am dai, digartrefedd a phrisiau tai ar gynydd, mae Llywodraeth y Blaid Lafur yn y Cynulliad wedi cwtdogi'n enbyd ar y cyllid ar gyfer tai cymdeithasol a fforddiadwy. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud o'r blaen, yr oedd y cyllid ar gyfer rhaglen grant tai cymdeithasol Cymru yn £174 miliwn bron yn 1996-97, ond yn y flwyddyn ariannol lawn ddiwethaf dim ond £96.4 miliwn oedd y cyfanswm—mae hynny'n doriad o 45 y cant. Hyd yn oed ar ôl y cynnydd arfaethedig yn y gyllideb hyd at 2007-08, bydd y grant tai cymdeithasol yn dal i fod yn llai o ran ei werth absoliwt, ac yn llai o lawer o ran ei wir werth, nag a oedd 10 mlynedd yn ôl. Os na chymerir camau ar frys i ddelio â'r argyfwng tai yng Nghymru, bydd buddsoddiad Llafur o filiynau lawer o bunnoedd mewn adfywio cymunedol yn debyg i arllwys dŵr i bwced a'i llond o dyllau yn hytrach na mynd allan i brynu pwced newydd.

Rhagwelir y bydd nifer yr aelwydydd sydd arnynt angen llety yng Nghymru yn codi 12 y cant dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Dan Lafur, fodd bynnag, mae nifer y tai cymdeithasol newydd a godir yng Nghymru wedi'i dorri o dri chwarter. Yn chwe blynedd cyntaf datganoli, cododd cymdeithasau tai a chynghorau 4,436 o anheddau newydd. Mae hynny'n cyferbynnu â'r 17,395 a godwyd yng Nghymru yn ystod chwe blynedd olaf y Llywodraeth Geidwadol. Yng Nghymru heddiw, amcangyfrifir bod 225,000 o bobl yn byw mewn tai anaddas. Mae digartrefedd yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu mwy na dwywaith ers datganoli. Mae Shelter Cymru yn amcangyfrif bod o leiaf 50,000 o bobl yn profi digartrefedd bob blwyddyn yng Nghymru erbyn hyn. Cododd rhestrau aros am dai drwy Gymru 50 y cant y llynedd yn unig, a rhagwelir y byddant yn fwy na 100,000.

Gan Gymru y mae'r amodau gwaethaf o ran tai yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae tai gwael yn achosi salwch ymhlith ein plant, yn eu hamddifadu o addysg dderbyniol ac yn gwneud drwg i'w dyfodol. Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r argyfwng hwn, rhaid inni edrych y tu hwnt i'r sector cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol potensial y sector gwirfoddol a'r sector preifat mewn partneriaeth gyhoeddus a

phreifat—gan droi hynny'n ffaith, Huw, yn hytrach nag ennill sylw'n unig.

Despite Labour's manifesto promises, one in seven Welsh households are now living in fuel poverty and the number of excess winter deaths last winter was the highest it has been in five years. Despite big increases in the education budget, the Rowntree report monitoring poverty and social exclusion in Wales states that the bulk of the improvement in school performance since the mid-1990s took place before 2000. Since then, it says that there has been little further progress, and Wales is worse than any of the English regions, due to the 7.5 per cent of 16-year-olds in Wales who gain no GCSEs at all. The proportion of young people aged 16 to 18 who are not in education or training in Wales rose from 23 per cent in 1997 to 28 per cent in 2004. All this is happening as Welsh further education colleges have suffered three years of core budget cuts.

Er gwaethaf yr addewidion ym maniffesto Llafur, mae un o bob saith o aelwydydd Cymru bellach yn profi tloedi tanwydd ac yr oedd nifer y marwolaethau ychwanegol y gaeaf diwethaf ar ei uchaf ers pum mlynedd. Er gwaethaf y cynnydd mawr yn y gyllideb addysg, mae adroddiad Rowntree ar fonitro tloedi ac allgáu cymdeithasol yng Nghymru'n nodi bod y rhan fwyaf o'r gwelliant ym mherfformiad ysgolion ers canol yr 1990au wedi digwydd cyn 2000. Ers hynny, dywed na fu fawr o gynnydd pellach, ac mae Cymru'n waeth na dim un o ranbarthau Lloegr, oherwydd y 7.5 y cant o rai 16 mlwydd oed yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn cael dim un TGAU. Cododd cyfran y bobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed nad ydynt mewn addysg neu hyfforddiant yng Nghymru o 23 y cant yn 1997 i 28 y cant yn 2004. Mae hyn oll yn digwydd wrth i golegau addysg bellach yng Nghymru ddiodeff tair blynedd o doriadau yn eu cyllidebau craidd.

Meanwhile, without measurable targets for Communities First, the Assembly Government is in breach of both its duty to spend public money efficiently and transparently, and its duty to deliver sustainable community development. No wonder Communities First is subject to allegations of political control, and, if the Minister challenges that, I hope that she will accept my request for a meeting with the leader of the opposition of one of the north Wales councils. We should not be surprised that income-support claims are produced faster in areas that are not covered by Communities First. The Assembly Government may mean well, but it continues to fail, because it fails to listen. Or is it that it has dumped the Blairite Third Way and rejected Fabianism in favour of the discredited Marxist dialectic? I am sure that Huw will understand what I mean by that.

Yn y cyfamser, gan nad oes targedau mesuradwy ar gyfer Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn torri ei dyletswydd i wario arian cyhoeddus yn effeithlon ac yn dryloyw, a'i dyletswydd i sicrhau datblygu cymunedol cynaliadwy. Nid oes ryfedd bod honiadau ynghylch rheolaeth wleidyddol ar Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, ac, os gwnaiff y Gweinidog herio hynny, yr wyf yn gobeithio y gwnaiff dderbyn fy nghais am gyfarfod gydag arweinydd yr wrthblaid yn un o gynghorau'r gogledd. Ni ddylem synnu bod hawliadau am gymhorthdal incwm yn cael eu cynhyrchu'n gyflymach mewn ardaloedd sydd heb eu cynnwys dan Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Efallai fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn dda ei hamcan, ond mae'n dal i fethu, am ei bod yn methu â gwranddo. Ynteu ai'r rheswm yw ei bod wedi rhoi'r gorau i'r Drydedd Ffordd Blairidd ac wedi gwrthod Ffabiaeth gan fabwysiadu'r dilechdid Marcsaidd anhygred yn ei lle? Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Huw'n deall beth yr wyf yn ei olygu wrth hynny.

**Leanne Wood:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 5: add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Leanne Wood:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 5: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*regrets the recent significant increase in the number of households in Wales experiencing fuel poverty.*

I propose amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to introduce a comprehensive energy efficiency scheme aimed at reducing energy consumption.*

I propose amendment 7. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the refusal of the Welsh Assembly Government to release statistics to demonstrate whether the Communities First programme is achieving its aims.*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets the persistent high levels of in-work poverty in Wales.*

I propose amendment 9. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*notes with concern the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to honour its commitments in the national service framework for mental health in Wales.*

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*welcomes the fact that this is the last social justice report of the Assembly term and looks forward to future independent assessments of the Assembly Government's social justice record.*

That was a rather amusing end to Mark's contribution.

Plaid Cymru welcomes the fact that this is the last social justice report in this form, and, as we say in amendment 10, we look forward to more independent assessments of the Government's social justice record in future

*yn gresynu at y cynnydd sylweddol yn ddiweddar yn nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu tlodi tanwydd.*

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyflwyno cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cynhwysfawr gyda'r nod o leihau faint o ynni a ddefnyddir.*

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gwrthod rhyddhau ystadegau i ddangos a yw'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn cyflawni ei hamcanion.*

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu at y lefelau cyson uchel o dlodi mewn gwaith yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 9. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn nodi gyda phryder fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i anrhydeddu'r ymrwymadau a wnaeth yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru.*

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn croesawu'r ffaith mai dyma adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol olaf tymor y Cynulliad ac yn edrych ymlaen at gael asesiadau annibynnol yn y dyfodol o record Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.*

Yr oedd hwnnw'n ddiweddglo eithaf difyr i gyfraniad Mark.

Mae Plaid Cymru yn croesawu'r ffaith mai hwn yw'r adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol olaf ar y ffurf hon, ac, fel y dywedwn yng ngwelliant 10, yr ydym yn edrych ymlaen at gael asesiadau mwy

years—whoever might form that Government. It is clear from this report that the Labour Assembly Government has buried its head in the sand with regard to the ongoing problems affecting the lives of many people living in our communities in Wales. Plaid Cymru's amendments to this motion aim to address the gaps.

This report clearly demonstrates that there is a substantial rise in the numbers of people living in fuel poverty, yet the Government has a target of taking Wales's most vulnerable citizens out of fuel poverty by 2010. That is a manifesto commitment that will not be kept unless some radical action is taken. The Welsh Assembly Government is failing to address the substantial numbers of people who are in work and living in poverty. We now know that the jobs created by the Objective 1 programme in west Wales and the Valleys have mainly been low-paid and low-skilled jobs. According to research by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, 65 per cent of working households in poverty in Wales are low-paid households.

Although there has been some progress on child poverty figures, one in four children in Wales still live in a low-income household. This proportion is higher than that for pensioners and working-age adults. If those children are in lone-parent households, they are more likely to be living in deep poverty. This poverty can only be dealt with by reforming the benefits system, as has been said before. However, there seems to be little movement on that front.

Time and again, the Government makes much of the rise in employment figures, yet this report shows that, between 2005 and 2006, the overall level of employment has reduced. It has reduced for three specific groups: ethnic minorities, the over 50s and the disabled. This is a worrying trend, as I am sure Members would agree. I would like to know from the Minister what is being done to

annibynnol o record y Llywodraeth ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn y dyfodol—ni waeth pwy a fydd yn ffurfio'r Llywodraeth honno. Mae'n amlwg oddi wrth yr adroddiad hwn fod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad wedi cuddio ei phen yn y tywod mewn cysylltiad â'r problemau parhaus sydd yn effeithio ar fywydau llawer o bobl sydd yn byw yn ein cymunedau yng Nghymru. Mae gwelliannau Plaid Cymru i'r cynnig hwn yn ceisio rhoi sylw i'r diffygion.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn dangos yn glir fod nifer y bobl sydd yn byw mewn tlodi tanwydd wedi cynyddu'n sylweddol, ac eto mae gan y Llywodraeth darged ar gyfer codi'r dinasyddion sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yng Nghymru o dlodi tanwydd erbyn 2010. Ni chyflawnir yr ymrwymiad maniffesto hwnnw oni chymerir rhai camau radical. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n methu â rhoi sylw i'r nifer sylweddol o bobl sydd mewn gwaith ac yn byw mewn tlodi. Gwyddom bellach fod y rhan fwyaf o'r swyddi a grëwyd gan y rhaglen Amcan 1 yng ngorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn rhai â chyflog isel a sgiliau isel. Yn ôl ymchwil gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, mae 65 y cant o'r aelwydydd sydd yn gweithio sydd mewn tlodi yng Nghymru'n aelwydydd sydd â chyflogau isel.

Er bod rhywfaint o gynnydd wedi bod o ran ffigurau tlodi ymhlith plant, mae un o bob pedwar o'r plant yng Nghymru'n dal i fyw mewn aelwyd sydd ag incwm isel. Mae'r gyfran hon yn fwy na'r gyfran ar gyfer pensïynwyr ac oedolion o oedran gweithio. Os yw'r plant hynny mewn aelwydydd unig riant, maent yn fwy tebygol o fod yn byw mewn tlodi mawr. Yr unig fodd i ddelio â thlodi o'r fath yw diwygio'r system budd-daliadau, fel y dywedwyd o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'n ymddangos bod fawr yn digwydd yn y maes hwnnw.

Dro ar ôl tro, mae'r Llywodraeth yn gwneud môr a mynydd o'r cynnydd yn y ffigurau o ran cyflogaeth, ac eto mae'r adroddiad hwn yn dangos bod lefel cyflogaeth yn gyffredinol rhwng 2005 a 2006 wedi gostwng. Mae wedi gostwng yn achos tri grŵp penodol: lleiafrifoedd ethnig, rhai dros 50 oed a'r anabl. Mae'r duedd hon yn peri pryder, fel y byddai'r Aelodau'n cytuno, yr wyf yn siŵr.

prevent this trend, because if we see higher unemployment levels among traditionally under-represented groups, this is bound to have an impact on poverty levels. How can we all work to ensure that unemployment levels among these groups do not rise even further?

5.00 p.m.

**Huw Lewis:** You must agree, Leanne, that there have been massive falls in absolute poverty, particularly among families with children. Much of that has been built on the back of the sound economy that Labour has delivered. Therein lies Plaid Cymru's difficulty: where do your priorities lie? If Plaid Cymru had to choose between separation from the rest of the United Kingdom by 2020 or the eradication of child poverty by 2020, which would you choose?

**Leanne Wood:** I believe that the only way of eradicating poverty in this country is through independence.

Plaid Cymru's amendment 7 aims to force the Government to measure outcomes for the Communities First programme. There are 137 community partnerships benefiting from a total of £131 million, but there are no measurable targets set for the Communities First programme, so we have no idea whether or not it is meeting its aims. It aims to reduce poverty and to increase employment, yet there are no figures to show income levels or employment changes for these 137 partnership areas. If it is reducing poverty, that is great, and those partnerships will be able to justify their continued existence after the end of the current 10-year programme. However, at the moment, they have no idea whether they are successful and taxpayers have no idea whether they are getting value for money. If these figures and this information are available, I would argue that they should have been presented as part of this report. If they are not available, the Welsh Assembly Government has a duty to obtain that information in order to be accountable for spending those public funds.

Carwn gael gwybod gan y Gweinidog pa gamau a gymerir i atal y duedd hon, oherwydd os gwelwn lefelau diweithdra uwch ymysg grwpiau sydd wedi'u tangynrychioli yn y gorffennol, mae hynny'n sicr o effeithio ar lefelau tlodi. Sut y gallwn oll ymdrechu i sicrhau nad yw lefelau diweithdra ymysg y grwpiau hyn yn codi ymhellach fyth?

**Huw Lewis:** Rhaid ichi gytuno, Leanne, fod gostyngiad enfawr wedi bod mewn tlodi absoliwt, yn enwedig ymysg teuluoedd sydd â phlant. Mae llawer o hynny wedi digwydd yn sgîl yr economi gref y mae Llafur wedi ei sicrhau. A dyna yw'r anhawster i Blaid Cymru: ble mae eich blaenoriaethau? Pe bai'n rhaid i Blaid Cymru ddewis rhwng gwahanu oddi wrth weddill y Deyrnas Unedig erbyn 2020 a dileu tlodi ymysg plant erbyn 2020, pa un y byddech yn ei ddewis?

**Leanne Wood:** Credaf mai'r unig ffordd o ddileu tlodi yn y wlad hon yw drwy annibyniaeth.

Nod gwelliant 7 gan Blaid Cymru yw gorfodi'r Llywodraeth i fesur canlyniadau'r rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Mae 137 o bartneriaethau cymunedol yn elwa o gyfanswm o £131 miliwn, ond nid oes targedau mesuradwy wedi cael eu gosod i raglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, felly nid oes gennym ddim syniad a yw'n cyflawni ei hamcanion ai peidio. Ei nod yw lleihau tlodi a chynyddu cyflogaeth, ond nid oes ffigurau i ddangos lefelau incwm na newidiadau cyflogaeth yn y 137 o ardaloedd partneriaeth hyn. Os yw'n lleihau tlodi, mae hynny'n wych, a bydd y partneriaethau hynny'n gallu cyfiawnhau eu parhad ar ôl diwedd y rhaglen 10 mlynedd bresennol. Fodd bynnag, ar hyn o bryd, nid oes ganddynt ddim syniad a ydynt yn llwyddiannus ac nid oes gan drethdalwyr ddim syniad a ydynt yn cael gwerth am arian. Os yw'r ffigurau hyn a'r wybodaeth hon ar gael, byddwn yn dadlau y dylent fod wedi cael eu cyflwyno fel rhan o'r adroddiad hwn. Os nad ydynt ar gael, mae'n ddyletswydd ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru sicrhau'r wybodaeth honno er mwyn bod yn atebol am wario'r arian cyhoeddus hwnnw.

The final point that I want to make is in relation to housing and homelessness. Housing is a major social justice issue, as the Minister has said. With house prices rocketing in communities all over Wales, buying a home is an unreachable dream for many young people today. Now is the time to ensure a steady supply of homes for rent in the social housing sector. Labour's manifesto in 2005 promised to suspend the right-to-buy scheme in areas of housing pressure, yet this has not been done. At the end of 2005, there were 2,700 right-to-buy applications and, in that same year, local authorities built no houses and registered social landlords built 100 houses. If we are selling 2,700 houses and only building 100 new houses, it does not take a genius to work out that we are fast approaching a crisis, if we are not already in a housing crisis. Local authorities cannot perform miracles; they cannot build homes without money. Minister, if your Government is serious about promoting social justice, this housing crisis cannot be ignored any longer.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am never surprised that the regional Member, who was not elected by the electorate in Alyn and Deeside, takes every opportunity to hurl a tirade of accusations at the Labour Government in the Assembly—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Carl, I am in the chair and we are all equal here; we have all been elected. I would be grateful if you would deal with the subject that we are discussing, the social justice report, not the method of election.

**Carl Sargeant:** I am not sure where some Members get their statistics from. Unemployment in Communities First areas has not risen because of the Communities First programme. The programme was established by the Welsh Assembly Government to target areas suffering from economic inactivity, deriving from the 1980s, and to tackle the social problems that often go hand in hand with economic inactivity. The majority of Communities First partnerships are located in areas that suffered massive job losses under the previous

Mae a wnelo'r pwynt olaf yr wyf am ei wneud â thai a digartrefedd. Mae tai'n fater o bwys o ran cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog. Wrth i brisiau tai gynyddu'n aruthrol mewn cymunedau ym mhob rhan o Gymru, mae prynu tŷ yn freuddwyd sydd y tu hwnt i'w cyrraedd i lawer o bobl ifanc heddiw. Bellach mae'n bryd sicrhau cyflenwad cyson o dai ar rent yn y sector tai cymdeithasol. Addawodd maniffesto Llafur yn 2005 atal y cynllun hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle y mae pwysau ar dai, ond nid yw hyn wedi cael ei wneud. Ar ddiwedd 2005, yr oedd 2,700 o geisiadau hawl i brynu ac, yn y flwyddyn honno, ni chododd yr awdurdodau lleol ddim tai a chododd landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig 100 o dai. Os ydym yn gwerthu 2,700 o dai gan adeiladu dim ond 100, nid oes angen athrylith i weld ein bod yn prysur nesáu at argyfwng, os nad ydym eisoes mewn argyfwng tai. Ni all yr awdurdodau lleol wneud gwyर्थiau; ni allant godi tai heb arian. Weinidog, os yw eich Llywodraeth o ddifrif ynghylch hyrwyddo cyfiawnder cymdeithasol, ni ellir parhau i anwybyddu'r argyfwng tai hwn.

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid fyddaf byth yn synnu pan fydd yr Aelod rhanbarthol, na chafodd ei ethol gan yr etholaeth yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy, yn achub ar bob cyfle i hyrddio llif o gyhuddiadau at y Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Carl, fi sydd yn y gadair ac yr ydym i gyd yn gydradd yma; yr ydym i gyd wedi cael ein hethol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn delio â'r mater yr ydym yn ei drafod, yr adroddiad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol, nid y dull o ethol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o ble y caiff rhai Aelodau eu hystadegau. Nid yw diweithdra mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi codi oherwydd y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Sefydlwyd y rhaglen gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i dargedu ardaloedd a oedd yn dioddef gan anweithgarwch economaidd, yn deillio o'r 1980au, ac i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau cymdeithasol sydd yn aml yn mynd law yn llaw ag anweithgarwch economaidd. Mae mwyafrif y partneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi eu lleoli mewn ardaloedd a



Conservative Government; Shotton, in my constituency, is no exception. It took a long time for those communities to decline and it will certainly take a long time for the damage to be rectified through investment by the Labour Party.

**Mark Isherwood:** As a regional Member elected under a system used by approximately 40 legislatures across the world—the only other legislature that shared your views on democracy was the Ukraine before the orange revolution—how did unemployment in 1980 differ from unemployment in 1997 in your constituency? My understanding is that the figures produced by the Assembly Government suggest that there had been something of a change in the intervening 17 years.

**Carl Sargeant:** I remember when you were taking redundancy cheques off steel workers in the Cheshire Building Society in your previous employment, and now, having lost elections in Alyn and Deeside and Delyn, you come here as a regional Member, not elected by the first-past-the-post system. You actually lost.

The fact is that the Communities First programme has been operating in Higher Shotton for many years, and I have seen the huge difference that it has made in numerous people's lives. Furthermore, I am saddened by Mr Isherwood's lack of faith in the people and the Communities First programme in Shotton, Flintshire and the whole of Wales. I do not believe that the Welsh Assembly Government is creating a new class of decommissioned people, as has been suggested; I believe that we inherited them from the previous Tory Government. Poverty is not winning in Wales. We are the Government that is offering hope to some of Wales's poorest communities, in particular Higher Shotton and Holywell.

Mark Isherwood said earlier that he stands by his leader's policies. I am pleased that he made that declaration as he is obviously opposed to working tax credits, child tax credits, the minimum wage and two weeks' paid paternity leave. I am glad that he made

gollodd swyddi ar raddfa enfawr o dan y Llywodraeth Geidwadol flaenorol; nid yw Shotton, yn fy etholaeth i, yn eithriad. Bu'r cymunedau hynny'n dirywio am amser maith ac yn sicr bydd angen amser maith i'r difrod gael ei unioni drwy fuddsoddi gan y Blaid Lafur.

**Mark Isherwood:** Fel Aelod rhanbarthol a etholwyd dan system a ddefnyddir gan ryw 40 o ddeddfwrfeydd ar draws y byd—yr unig ddeddfwrfa arall a oedd o'r un farn â chi am ddemocratiaeth oedd Ukrain cyn y chwyldro oren—sut yr oedd diweithdra yn 1980 yn wahanol i ddiweithdra yn 1997 yn eich etholaeth chi? Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae'r ffigurau a gynhyrchwyd gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awgrymu bod rhywfaint o newid wedi bod yn ystod y 17 flynedd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Cofiaf yr adeg pan oeddech yn cymryd sieciau dileu swyddi gan weithwyr dur yng Nghymdeithas Adeiladu Cheshire yn eich gwaith blaenorol, ac yn awr, ar ôl colli etholiadau yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy a Delyn, yr ydych yn dod yma fel Aelod rhanbarthol, na chawsoch eich ethol gan system y cyntaf i'r felin. Colli a wnaethoch mewn gwirionedd.

Y ffaith yw bod y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi bod yn gweithredu yn Shotton Uchaf ers blynnyddoedd lawer, ac yr wyf wedi gweld y gwahaniaeth enfawr y mae wedi ei wneud ym mywydau llawer o bobl. Caf fy nhristâu gan ddiffyg ffydd Mr Isherwood yn y bobl ac yn y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Shotton, sir y Fflint a Chymru gyfan. Ni chredaf fod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n creu dosbarth newydd o bobl sydd wedi cael eu digomisiynu, fel yr awgrymwyd. Credaf inni eu hetifeddu gan y Llywodraeth Doriaidd flaenorol. Nid yw tloidi'n ennill yng Nghymru. Ni yw'r Llywodraeth sy'n cynnig gobaith i rai o gymunedau tlotaf Cymru, yn arbennig Shotton Uchaf a Threffynnon.

Dywedodd Mark Isherwood yn gynharach ei fod yn cefnogi polisïau ei arweinydd. Yr wyf yn falch iddo wneud y datganiad hwnnw gan ei fod yn amlwg yn gwrthwynebu credydau treth gwaith, yr isafswm cyflog a dwy wythnos o absenoldeb tadolaeth â thâl. Yr

that statement today.

wyf yn falch iddo wneud y datganiad hwnnw heddiw.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Before I call the next speaker, I inform Members that the temperature is 25 degrees Celsius in the Chamber, which exceeds the maximum temperature recommended in the World Health Organisation's advice, although there is no statutory maximum. I am not recommending it, but if anybody wants to move a dilatory motion, then I will, of course, consider the circumstances.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Cyn imi alw'r siaradwr nesaf, hysbysaf yr Aelodau fod y tymheredd yn 25 gradd Celsius yn y Siambr, sy'n uwch na'r tymheredd uchaf a argymhellir yng nghyngor Sefydliad Iechyd y Byd, er nad oes uchafswm statudol. Nid wyf yn argymhell hynny, ond os oes unrhyw un am wneud cynnig i ohirio, yna byddaf, wrth gwrs, yn ystyried yr amgylchiadau.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Cyfeiriaf at y gwelliannau yn enw Jocelyn Davies, ac yn benodol at welliant 5, sy'n sôn am nifer y cartrefi sy'n dioddef o dlodi tanwydd. Yng ngwelliant 6, yr ydym yn galw am gynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni, a fyddai'n gostwng lefelau'r ynni a defnyddir yn ein tai. Pe baem yn gallu gweithredu ar y ddau welliant hynny, ac yn sicr ar welliant 6, gallem weld dau beth yn digwydd: byddai llai o bobl yn dioddef o dlodi tanwydd yn eu cartrefi, a byddai cyfraniad sylweddol yn cael ei wneud o ran y sefyllfa bresennol o wastraffu ynni.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I refer to the amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and specifically to amendment 5, which refers to the number of homes suffering fuel poverty. In amendment 6, we call for a fuel efficiency scheme, that would reduce the amount of fuel used in our homes. Were we to take action on those two amendments, and amendment 6 in particular, we could see two consequences: fewer people would suffer from fuel poverty in their homes, and a significant contribution would be made in terms of the current situation with regard to energy waste.

Cawsom drafodaeth ar y pynciau hyn yn ddiweddar. Heriais y Prif Weinidog ar y pwnc, ac mae rhyw fath o ddealltwriaeth rhyngom fod y sefyllfa'n waeth yng Nghymru am sawl rheswm—mae mwy o dlodi yn Nghymru ac mae llawer o'n tai yn hen, gyda llawer yn dyddio o ddechrau'r ganrif ddiwethaf. Hefyd, mae llai o bobl yn byw mewn fflatiau yng Nghymru. Felly, mae angen edrych ar y mater yn hynod o ofalus. Pwynt arall i'w wneud yw bod nifer y bobl sy'n dioddef o dlodi ynni wedi codi oherwydd bod prisiau tanwydd wedi codi'n sylweddol yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

We had a debate on these issues recently. I challenged the First Minister on the subject, and we have reached some sort of understanding that the situation in Wales is worse for several reasons—there is more poverty in Wales and many of our houses are old, with many dating back to the beginning of the last century. Also, fewer people live in flats in Wales. Therefore, careful consideration needs to be given to this issue. Another point to be made is that the number of people who suffer from fuel poverty has risen due to significant increases in fuel prices over the past year.

Ni chlywais y Gweinidog yn cyfeirio at y gwelliannau, ond hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn ymroi i ailedrych ar y cynllun hwn. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'r cynllun yn dod o dan adran y Gweinidog, ond gall hi siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth. Hoffwn weld y Llywodraeth yn cymryd y cynllun o ddifrif. Drwy fuddsoddi'n sylweddol mewn effeithlonrwydd ynni, byddech yn helpu pobl—yn enwedig yr henoed, sydd yn aml yn byw mewn tai drafftio—i gynhesu eu tai; byddai hynny'n helpu gyda'r amgylchedd

I did not hear the Minister referring to the amendments, but I would like to see the Government giving a commitment to revisit this scheme. I am not sure whether the scheme comes under the Minister's department, but she can speak on the Government's behalf. I would like to see the Government taking this scheme seriously. By making a significant investment in fuel efficiency, you would be helping people—especially the elderly, who often live in draughty houses—to heat their homes; that

drwy arwain at lai o ddefnydd o ynni.

would help with the environment by reducing energy use.

Yn olaf, gallech dorri'n sylweddol ar y defnydd o ynni. Gallai tai Cymru fod yn dai mwyaf effeithiol Ewrop o ran ynni pe baem yn torri 10 y cant ar y defnydd o ynni dros 10 mlynedd. Byddai hynny'n werth chweil o safbwynt y Llywodraeth. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn derbyn y gwelliannau hyn yn yr ysbryd y'u cyflwynwyd.

Finally, you could significantly cut energy use. We could see Welsh houses becoming the most energy efficient in Europe by reducing energy use by 10 per cent over 10 years. That would be worthwhile from the Government's perspective. I hope that the Minister will accept these amendments in the spirit in which they were proposed.

5.10 p.m.

**Janice Gregory:** It is with pleasure that I welcome the report. I am pleased that the Minister has taken up the suggestions made when we discussed the 2005 report, and included more information on outputs and progress. I also welcome the fact that she has continued her commitment to ensure that the cross-cutting nature of the Welsh Assembly Government's commitment to social justice is reflected in the report.

**Janice Gregory:** Mae'n bleser gennyf groesawu'r adroddiad hwn. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn yr awgrymiadau a wnaethpwyd pan drafodasom adroddiad 2005, ac wedi cynnwys rhagor o wybodaeth am gynhyrchion a chynnydd. Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith ei bod wedi parhau â'i hymrwymiad i sicrhau bod natur drawsbynciol ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn cael ei hadlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad.

When the 2006 report was considered by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee at its meeting on 8 June, the Minister acknowledged the difficulties that she and her officials had encountered in collating meaningful information from many other departments to produce a picture of the issues surrounding the social justice agenda. Despite these difficulties, the Minister has produced a report packed with information indicating the cross-cutting nature of her portfolio. It enables the reader to see the wide range of work being successfully undertaken in the social justice arena in Wales.

Pan oedd adroddiad 2006 yn cael ei ystyried gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn ei gyfarfod ar 8 Mehefin, cydnabu'r Gweinidog yr anawsterau yr oedd hi a'i swyddogion wedi eu cael wrth gasglu gwybodaeth ystyrllon oddi wrth lawer o adrannau eraill er mwyn llunio darlun o'r materion sy'n berthnasol i'r agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Er gwaethaf yr anawsterau hyn, mae'r Gweinidog wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad llawn gwybodaeth sy'n dangos natur drawsbynciol ei phortffolio. Mae'n galluogi'r darlennydd i weld yr ystod eang o waith sy'n cael ei wneud yn llwyddiannus ym maes cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee welcomed the report and several ways in which the report could be improved were discussed. However, in contrast to previous years, these referred to improvements in specific areas, such as Communities First, transport and housing. The committee welcomed the overall improvement in the report, and was pleased that its comments from previous years had been incorporated. As always, the Minister agreed to take the points raised by committee

Croesawodd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yr adroddiad a thrafodwyd sawl ffordd bosibl o wella'r adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, yn wahanol i'r blynyddoedd blaenorol, cyfeiriai'r rhain at welliannau mewn meysydd penodol, fel Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, trafnidiaeth a thai. Croesawai'r pwyllgor y gwelliant cyffredinol yn yr adroddiad, ac yr oedd yn falch bod ei sylwadau mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol wedi cael eu cynnwys. Fel bob amser, cytunodd y Gweinidog i ystyried y pwyntiau a godwyd

on board. She said that she would return to the committee with further information about progress in evaluating and monitoring Communities First projects.

The Minister also undertook to provide more information in subsequent reports on transport, affordable housing, housing standards and climate change. In the same way as was encompassed in the committee's comments on last year's report, the Minister gave an undertaking to examine how these issues may be taken forward in the manner suggested.

I believe that this type of commitment from the Minister is appreciated by all Assembly Members, and, as Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I know that it is also appreciated by members of the committee. I am proud that consensus is reached as a rule, rather than as an exception, in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. I pay tribute to my fellow committee members for their part in allowing this to happen.

At the committee meeting on 8 June, Mick Bates reminded the committee that the report not only highlights the progress made so far, but also the challenges that still exist to defeat poverty. The report gives a good basis to work on these challenges, and I look forward to reading about further progress in future years.

**Mick Bates:** Right on cue from the Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee; thank you. As a newcomer to the committee, I thank the Chair for her remarks. There is genuine consensus about the need to defeat poverty, and I set my remarks against that background.

I wish to discuss two major items in terms of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's report. One issue, that I have mentioned many times, is the collection of data so that the Assembly Government has the information on which to formulate policies to reflect need. The second issue is the difficulty in defeating poverty, because, in so many cases, we need to change

gan y pwyllgor. Dywedodd y byddai'n dod yn ôl i'r pwyllgor gyda gwybodaeth bellach am y cynnydd o ran gwerthuso a monitro prosiectau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf.

Ymrwymodd y Gweinidog hefyd i ddarparu mwy o wybodaeth mewn adroddiadau dilynol am drafnidiaeth, tai fforddiadwy, safonau tai a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd. Yn yr un ffordd ag a gynhwyswyd yn sylwadau'r pwyllgor am adroddiad y llynedd, ymrwymodd y Gweinidog i archwilio sut y gellir bwrw ymlaen â'r materion hyn yn y modd a awgrymwyd.

Credaf fod y math hwn o ymrwymiad gan y Gweinidog yn cael ei werthfawrogi gan holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad, ac, fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, gwn ei fod yn cael ei werthfawrogi hefyd gan aelodau'r pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn falch ein bod yn cytuno ynghylch consensws fel rheol, ac nad eithriad yw hynny, yn y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Talaf deyrnged i'm cyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor am eu rhan wrth ganiatáu i hyn ddigwydd.

Yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor ar 8 Mehefin, atgoffodd Mick Bates y pwyllgor fod yr adroddiad nid yn unig yn pwysleisio'r cynnydd a wnaed hyd yma, ond hefyd y sialensiau sy'n dal i fodoli er mwyn trechu tloidi. Rhydd yr adroddiad sylfaen dda i weithio ar y sialensiau hyn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ddarllen am gynnydd pellach yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

**Mick Bates:** Ar y gair, gan Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio; diolch ichi. Fel newydd-ddyfodiad i'r pwyllgor, diolchaf i'r Cadeirydd am ei sylwadau. Mae consensws gwirioneddol am yr angen i drechu tloidi, ac yn erbyn y cefndir hwnnw y gwnaf fy sylwadau.

Yr wyf am drafod dwy eitem o bwys o safbwynt adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Un mater, yr wyf wedi ei grybwyll lawer gwaith, yw casglu data fel bod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad wybodaeth sy'n sail i lunio polisiau sy'n adlewyrchu'r angen. Yr ail fater yw'r anhawster wrth drechu tloidi, oherwydd, mewn cynifer o achosion, mae angen inni

behaviour. We all recognise that we meet cultural difficulties, and changing behaviour and culture is sometimes an immense challenge. Also, we have, for so long, accepted lower housing standards. I will support some of the amendments in this regard, as they reflect the need, for example, to remove fuel poverty.

This challenge has been well-known for many years. We already have data that reflects our housing stock: 30 per cent of the stock is pre-war, with no cavity wall insulation. We need to collect robust data—in the case of housing, we already have it—and we also need to act upon it. In its wisdom in the last election manifesto, Labour made a manifesto commitment to reduce fuel poverty and to ensure that older people were removed from this life-threatening issue in their homes. Some figures clearly demonstrate that you are not achieving that.

Again, we need to use the data to formulate policy, and, in committee, I often make the point that, through the home energy efficiency scheme, there is a massive opportunity to ensure that we help not only those people who are in fuel poverty, but our local economy by using renewable fuels. That is a way forward. I am certain that if you looked for data, you would see that we can use the eradication of fuel poverty to generate local business and green jobs. In mentioning data, I refer to the way in which you work with other Ministers. I refer here to the way that we in the Assembly have failed to resolve the affordable housing crisis, which affects so many young people.

I know that you will agree that possibly the first legislative step that you should take is to suspend the right to buy. The second would be to have in your budget a line that says that it is the Government's intention to encourage homebuy through local authorities. We would then be able to scrutinise things a little better and see the balance between local authorities having the ability to build and own their own houses—which they used to have—and, thereby, allocating them and

newid ymddygiad. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod ein bod yn dod wyneb yn wyneb ag anawsterau diwylliannol, a bod newid ymddygiad a diwylliant weithiau'n her enfawr. Hefyd, yr ydym, ers amser maith, wedi derbyn safonau tai is. Cefnogaf rai o'r gwelliannau yn y cyswllt hwn, gan eu bod yn adlewyrchu'r angen, er enghraifft, i ddileu tlodi tanwydd.

Mae'r her hon wedi bod yn hysbys ers blynyddoedd lawer. Mae gennym eisoes ddata sy'n adlewyrchu ein stoc dai: mae 30 y cant yn dyddio o'r cyfnod cyn y rhyfel, heb insiwleiddio waliau ceudod. Mae angen inni gasglu data trylwyr—yn achos tai, mae gennym ddata eisoes—ac mae angen inni weithredu arno hefyd. Yn ei doethineb ym maniffesto'r etholiad diwethaf, gwnaeth Llafur ymrwymiad i leihau tlodi tanwydd ac i sicrhau bod pobl hŷn yn cael eu gwarchod rhag y sefyllfa hon sy'n fygythiad i fywyd yn eu cartrefi. Mae rhai ffigurau'n dangos yn glir nad ydych yn cyflawni hynny.

Eto, mae angen inni ddefnyddio'r data i lunio polisi, ac, yn y pwyllgor, yr wyf yn aml yn gwneud y pwynt bod cyfle enfawr, drwy'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, i sicrhau ein bod yn helpu nid yn unig y bobl hynny sy'n dioddef gan dlodi tanwydd, ond ein heconomi leol drwy ddefnyddio tanwyddau adnewyddadwy. Mae hynny'n ffordd ymlaen. Yr wyf yn sicr pe baech yn chwilio am ddata, y byddech yn gweld y gallwn ddefnyddio dileu tlodi tanwydd i gynhyrchu busnes lleol a swyddi gwyrdd. Wrth sôn am ddata, cyfeiraf at y ffordd yr ydych yn gweithio gyda Gweinidogion eraill. Cyfeiraf yma at y modd yr ydym ni yn y Cynulliad wedi methu â datrys yr argyfwng tai fforddiadwy, sy'n effeithio ar gynifer o bobl ifanc.

Gwn y byddwch yn cytuno mai'r cam deddfwriaethol cyntaf y dylech efallai ei gymryd yw atal yr hawl i brynu. Yr ail fyddai cynnwys llinell yn eich cyllideb yn nodi mai bwriad y Llywodraeth ydyw i annog cymorth prynu drwy awdurdodau lleol. Wedyn, byddem yn gallu craffu ar bethau ychydig yn well a gweld y cydbwysedd rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn gallu codi eu tai eu hunain a bod yn berchen arnynt—fel yr oeddent yn arfer gwneud—a, thrwy hynny,

building new properties as they see fit, and providing them with the tools necessary to do that. The homebuy shared equity scheme is an excellent way of reducing the affordable housing crisis. It seems to me that we have planning tools, Minister. Perhaps, in your response, you could refer to the way in which the Cabinet operates, because it seems to me, under rural exemptions and section 106 agreements, that it is possible to use land that is outside of the unitary-development-plan-prescribed area and which has such a high value, and to look for land that is owned by the Government so that we can reduce the price of land because, all too often, it is the price of land that makes houses unaffordable for young people.

The age balance of our communities, although not referred to directly in the report, is a fundamental issue for social justice and regeneration because, without truly age-balanced communities, none of the issues about poverty eradication and making more people economically active will mean anything because we will have communities full of retired people. That is the big challenge.

I was pleased that the Chair of the committee raised my point that there are many positive issues in the report. However, there are massive challenges, and I will refer in my final remarks to three of them.

One issue is community transport. Issuing free bus passes is a great success but, in a constituency such as Montgomeryshire, there are rural areas without any public transport, so these people cannot use their free bus passes. Would it be possible to revisit the issue of community transport and see whether it would be possible to allow voluntary organisations, such as Dial-a-Ride, to accept free bus passes, which would achieve that ultimate aim?

**Huw Lewis:** Thank you for your worthy points. I am worried that you will end your speech without giving a commitment to consensus, which is how you began. You want consensus between the parties in terms of poverty. What are the Welsh Liberal Democrats going to say about child poverty?

yn eu dyrannu ac yn adeiladu tai newydd fel y gwelid bod angen, a rhoi'r arfau angenrheidiol iddynt i wneud hynny. Mae'r cynllun rhannu ecwiti drwy gymorth prynu yn ffordd wych o leihau'r argyfwng tai fforddiadwy. Ymddengys i mi fod yr arfau cynllunio gennym, Weinidog. Efallai, yn eich ymateb, y gallech gyfeirio at sut y mae'r Cabinet yn gweithredu, oherwydd ymddengys i mi, o dan eithriadau gwledig a chytundebau adran 106, ei bod yn bosibl defnyddio tir sydd y tu allan i'r ardal sydd wedi'i phennu yn y cynllun datblygu unedol, sy'n werth cymaint, a chwilio am dir sy'n eiddo i'r Llywodraeth fel y gallwn ostwng pris tir oherwydd, yn rhy aml o lawer, pris tir sy'n golygu na all pobl ifanc fforddio tai.

Mae cydbwysedd oed ein cymunedau, er nad yw'r adroddiad yn cyfeirio ato'n uniongyrchol, yn fater sylfaenol i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio oherwydd, heb gymunedau sy'n wirioneddol gytbwys o ran oed, ni fydd yr holl faterion ynghylch dileu tlodi a gwneud pobl yn economaidd weithgar yn golygu dim oherwydd bydd ein cymunedau yn llawn pobl wedi ymddeol. Dyna'r her fawr.

Yr oeddwn yn falch bod Cadeirydd y pwyllgor wedi codi fy mhwynt bod nifer o bethau cadarnhaol yn yr adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae ynddo sialensau enfawr, a chyfeiriaf at dair ohonynt yn fy sylwadau terfynol.

Trafnidiaeth gymunedol yw un pwynt. Mae'r tocynnau bws am ddim yn llwyddiant ysgubol ond, mewn etholaeth fel sir Drefaldwyn, mae rhai ardaloedd gwledig heb ddim trafndiaeth gyhoeddus, felly ni all y bobl hyn ddefnyddio'u tocynnau bws am ddim. A fyddai'n bosibl edrych eto ar drafndiaeth gymunedol i weld a ellid gadael i fudiadau gwirfoddol, fel Galw'r Gyrrwr, dderbyn tocynnau bws am ddim, a thrwy hynny, gyflawni'r nod hwnnw yn y pen draw?

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch am eich pwyntiau clodwiw. Yr wyf yn poeni y byddwch yn gorffen eich araith heb roi ymrwymiad i gonsensws, fel y soniasoch ar y dechrau. Mae angen ichi gael consensws rhwng y pleidiau ar dlodi. Beth y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn mynd i'w ddweud am

The Tories have agreed to honour Labour's pledge to eradicate child poverty by 2020, and Plaid Cymru has said that it would rather wave a flag; what do the Welsh Liberal Democrats say?

**Mick Bates:** That is an excellent intervention. Our commitment at this point in time does not have a date attached to it; it is a reasonable commitment that says that we want to eradicate child poverty. I admire your target of 2020 and assure you that I will do everything that I can in my party to ensure that we produce a target. At this moment, we do not have a date. You are brave to do that. The eradication of poverty is a battle that I have fought all my life, and I share your conviction, and your report on overindebtedness, Deputy Minister, shows your commitment.

I will finish with the issue of mental health—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. You may have a sentence; you may not raise an issue.

**Mick Bates:** I will finish there.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am much obliged, Mick.

**Laura Anne Jones:** This report is an improvement on last year's, but practical solutions need to be put in place now. The statistics show that there has been little improvement in achieving social justice in Wales.

In line with my party's amendment 1, I note with concern increasing unemployment and high economic inactivity in Wales. While I appreciate that the Assembly's social justice agenda is committed to helping people to break out of the poverty trap, the failing economic policies of this Labour Government are costing Wales the jobs and investment required to achieve that. More than 1,600 jobs have been lost in Wales since Labour scrapped the WDA in April. My constituents have been affected by job losses at Printpack Ltd in Cwmbran, Bristol Bending Services Ltd in Ebbw Vale and at Continental Teves. That is a loss of 500 jobs

dlodi plant? Mae'r Torïaid wedi cytuno i wireddu addewid Llafur i ddileu tlodi plant erbyn 2020, ac mae Plaid Cymru wedi dweud y byddai'n well ganddynt chwifio baner; beth y mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n ei ddweud?

**Mick Bates:** Mae hynny'n ymyriad gwych. Nid oes gennym ddyddiad ar hyn o bryd ynglŷn â'n hymrwymiad; mae'n ymrwymiad rhesymol sy'n dweud bod arnom eisiau dileu tlodi plant. Edmygaf eich targed, sef 2020, a gallaf eich sicrhau y gwnaf bopeth a allaf yn fy mhlaid i wneud yn siŵr ein bod yn cynhyrchu targed. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes gennym ddyddiad. Yr ydych yn ddewr yn gwneud hynny. Mae dileu tlodi yn frwydr yr wyf wedi bod yn ei hymladd gydol fy oes, a rhannaf eich argyhoeddiad, ac mae eich adroddiad ar orddyled, Ddirprwy Weinidog, yn dangos eich ymrwymiad.

Gorffennaf gyda mater iechyd meddwl—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Cewch ddweud brawddeg; ni chewch godi mater.

**Mick Bates:** Gorffennaf ar hynny.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iawn, Mick.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn well na'r un a gafwyd y llynedd, ond rhaid cael atebion ymarferol yn awr. Dengys yr ystadegau mai ychydig o welliant a welsom o ran sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Yn unol â gwelliant 1 fy mhlaid, nodaf gyda phryder y diweithdra cynyddol a'r anweithgarwch economaidd uchel yng Nghymru. Er fy mod yn sylweddoli bod agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol y Cynulliad yn ymrwymo i helpu pobl i ddod yn rhydd o fagl tlodi, mae methiant polisïau economaidd y Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn golygu nad yw Cymru'n cael y swyddi a'r buddsoddi sydd eu hangen i gyflawni hynny. Collwyd mwy na 1,600 o swyddi yng Nghymru ers i Lafur gael gwared â'r awdurdod datblygu ym mis Ebrill. Effeithwyd ar fy etholwyr gan golli swyddi yn Printpack Ltd yng Nghwmbrân, Bristol Bending Services Ltd yng Nglynebwy

at three local firms in a little over a month.

ac yn Continental Teves. Collwyd 500 o swyddi mewn tri chwmni lleol mewn ychydig dros fis.

5.20 p.m.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am grateful to Laura Anne for giving way. Perhaps the most damning feature of unemployment is youth unemployment because of the damage that it does to people's long-term ability to get jobs and to their self-esteem. In Blaenau Gwent, at the height of the Conservative years, youth unemployment stood at 1,200; now it is down to below 200 as a result of our measures. Does that not put things into perspective?

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Laura Anne am ildio. Efallai mai nodwedd fwyaf damniol diweithdra yw diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc oherwydd y niwed a wneir i allu hirdymor pobl i ddod o hyd i waith ac i'w hunan-barch. Ym Mlaenau Gwent, yn anterth blynyddoedd y Ceidwadwyr, yr oedd 1,200 o bobl ifanc yn ddi-waith; erbyn hyn mae llai na 200 o ganlyniad i'n mesurau ni. Onid yw hynny'n rhoi pethau mewn persbectif?

**Laura Anne Jones:** I am sure that you will agree that there is a lack of skilled workers in Blaenau Gwent and that there is a dire need to encourage workers to gain more skills. Labour's ridiculous target to get more young people into university has meant that they are moving out of Blaenau Gwent, which is probably why your figures reflect the fact that things are improving—those young people are not there anymore.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod prinder gweithwyr medrus ym Mlaenau Gwent a bod taer angen annog gweithwyr i ennill rhagor o sgiliau. Mae targed gwirion bost Llafur i gael mwy o bobl ifanc i fynd i brifysgol wedi golygu eu bod yn symud allan o Flaenau Gwent, a dyna mae'n debyg pam mae eich ffigurau'n adlewyrchu'r ffaith bod pethau'n gwella—nid yw'r bobl ifanc hynny yno mwyach.

The European figures have revealed that the Valleys regions that form part of my South Wales East constituency are still some of the poorest in Europe. Indeed, it is stated in the report that economic inactivity affects the low-skilled in particular and is concentrated in the south Wales Valleys and other urban areas. I welcome the fact that the Government is willing to recognise that. However, when it comes to Communities First, as has already been suggested, it concerns the Conservative Party that there is no way to measure the progress or failure of your policies. It will benefit us all when we have comparable statistics.

Dangosodd y ffigurau Ewropeaidd fod ardaloedd y Cymoedd sy'n ffurfio rhan o fy etholaeth yn Nwyrain De Cymru ymhlith y rhai tlotaf yn Ewrop o hyd. Yn wir, dywedir yn yr adroddiad fod anweithgarwch economaidd yn effeithio'n arbennig ar rai sydd â sgiliau isel a bod hynny i'w weld yn bennaf yng Nghymoedd de Cymru ac ardaloedd trefol eraill. Croesawaf y ffaith bod y Llywodraeth yn barod i gydnabod hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, fel yr awgrymwyd eisoes, un o bryderon y Blaid Geidwadol yw nad oes dim modd mesur cynnydd na methiant eich polisïau. Bydd o fudd inni i gyd pan fydd gennym ystadegau cymharol.

South Wales East is a varied constituency affected by a wealth of different problems, but what is still evident is the inequality of access to services, which I have mentioned many times in committee. That is a major problem and concern for us all, including many people in South Wales East.

Mae Dwyrain De Cymru'n etholaeth amrywiol yr effeithir arni gan doreth o wahanol broblemau, ond yr hyn sy'n amlwg o hyd yw'r diffyg cydraddoldeb o ran mynediad at wasanaethau, fel y soniais droeon yn y pwyllgor. Mae hynny'n broblem fawr ac yn bryder inni i gyd, gan gynnwys llawer o bobl yn Nwyrain De Cymru.

**Huw Lewis:** Thank you for giving way,

**Huw Lewis:** Diolch am ildio, Laura Anne; yr



Laura Anne; you are very generous. You make these points, but what is your prescription, because your colleague, Mark Isherwood, has already signalled your policy, which is a retreat of the state from these issues and a handover to the voluntary sector and to charities? So what is the Tories' prescription? Flag days? Raffles? What is it?

**Laura Anne Jones:** It is very important to involve people who know what they are talking about. It is also important that it is not just people stuck in an office in a Government building somewhere that make policy decisions. It is important to involve the community at all levels when trying to regenerate areas, particularly areas of such dire need.

Last month, I expressed concern at figures from the latest Halifax Welsh rural housing index, which show Monmouthshire to be the most expensive rural area in Wales. According to research in 2005, average house prices reached a staggering £201,000. That report also revealed that Monmouthshire is the rural district with the fewest first-time buyers, who represent a mere 21 per cent of the local housing market. That is a real dilemma that is facing young people and first-time buyers in Monmouthshire, with Chepstow and Abergavenny ranked as two of the least affordable towns in Wales.

My party's amendment 2 recognises that there is a growing housing crisis in Wales. This Assembly Government has failed to recognise that an adequate supply of affordable housing is at the heart of community regeneration. It is not fair that average house prices in rural areas now stand at six times the average salary, or that a first-time buyer in Wales has to save for four years just to afford a deposit. It is now time for this Government to make clear exactly how it intends to tackle these problems. I welcome the aims of this report, but I am disappointed that the Government has failed to recognise some of the key causes that are still leading to social injustice in Wales.

ydych yn garedig iawn. Yr ydych yn gwneud y pwyntiau hyn, ond beth yw eich ateb i hyn, oherwydd y mae eich cyd-Aelod, Mark Isherwood, eisoes wedi dweud beth yw eich polisi, sef y byddai'r wladwriaeth yn camu'n ôl o'r materion hyn ac yn trosglwyddo'r awenau i'r sector gwirfoddol a'r elusennau? Felly beth yw ateb y Torïaid? Diwrnod baneri? Raffl? Beth ydyw?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'n bwysig iawn cynnwys pobl sy'n gwybod am beth y maent yn sôn. Mae hefyd yn bwysig nad dim ond pobl mewn swyddfa yn un o adeiladau'r Llywodraeth sy'n gwneud penderfyniadau polisi. Mae'n bwysig cynnwys y gymuned gyfan wrth geisio adfywio ardaloedd, yn enwedig ardaloedd lle y mae angen dybryd o'r fath.

Fis diwethaf, lleisiais bryder ynghylch ffigurau'r mynegai tai gwledig diweddaraf gan yr Halifax yng Nghymru, sy'n dangos mai sir Fynwy yw'r ardal wledig ddrutaf yng Nghymru. Yn ôl ymchwil yn 2005, mae prisiau tai ar gyfartaledd bellach yn £201,000, sy'n ysgytwol. Dangosodd yr adroddiad hwnnw hefyd mai sir Fynwy yw'r ardal wledig sydd â lleiaf o brynwyr tro cyntaf, sef dim ond 21 y cant o'r farchnad dai leol. Mae hynny'n achosi penbleth fawr i bobl ifanc a phrynwyr tro cyntaf yn sir Fynwy, a Chas-gwent a'r Fenni yw'r ddwy dref leiaf fforddiadwy yng Nghymru.

Mae gwelliant 2 fy mhlaid yn cydnabod bod yr argyfwng tai'n gwaethygu fwyfwy yng Nghymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi methu â chydabod bod sicrhau cyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy wrth wraidd adfywio cymunedol. Nid yw'n deg bod prisiau tai ar gyfartaledd mewn ardaloedd gwledig bellach gymaint chwe gwaith â'r cyflog cyfartalog, na bod yn rhaid i brynwr tro cyntaf yng Nghymru gynilo am bedair blynedd er mwyn gallu fforddio talu blaendal. Mae'n bryd bellach i'r Llywodraeth hon ddweud yn glir sut y mae'n bwriadu mynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn. Yr wyf yn croesawu amcanion yr adroddiad hwn, ond yn siomedig bod y Llywodraeth wedi methu â chydabod rhai o'r prif bethau sy'n dal i arwain at anghyfiawnder cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** We must recognise that there has been a steady fall in the proportion of people of all ages living in low-income households and that we have brought poverty rates in Wales down to the Great Britain average. We need to do better, but we have reached that point. Unemployment has also fallen to UK levels or below. Furthermore, there has been a sizeable fall in the level of child poverty, with the rate in Wales now the same as the average for the UK as a whole. People in Wales have lower levels of worry about crime as compared with the average for England and Wales, and our education achievements are second to none in Wales. That is the background to some of the key points in the report.

First, on amendment 1, we must see the issue of unemployment and economic inactivity rates in the context of the general trend over the last few years, which shows the significant progress that we have made in Wales as a nation. The social justice report includes details of the range of actions being taken to raise activity levels. Therefore, I ask you to oppose that particular amendment.

Amendment 2 is about homelessness. The latest homelessness statistics indicate a fall of 35 per cent in the number of households accepted as homeless over the previous 12 months. As a Government, we have increased the social housing grant budget, but community regeneration is about more than those issues; it is about a range of issues. You only have to look at some of the other issues within the housing agenda, such as area-renewal programmes, which are successfully initiated with the local authorities.

I will support amendment 3 on poverty, because the Joseph Rowntree Foundation report, 'Monitoring Poverty and Social Exclusion in Wales', highlighted the fact that households in which someone is in work are a rising share of those living in poverty. As part of the new ideas fund, I have agreed to fund the Bevan Foundation to identify the underlying nature and characteristics of in-

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Rhaid inni gydnabod bod nifer y bobl o bob oed sy'n byw mewn cartrefi ar incwm isel wedi gostwng yn gyson a'n bod wedi lleihau cyfraddau tlodi yng Nghymru i lefel gyfartalog y DU. Mae angen inni wneud yn well, ond yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y pwynt hwnnw. Mae diweithdra hefyd wedi gostwng i lefelau'r DU neu'n is. Yn ogystal, yr ydym wedi gweld lleihad sylweddol yn lefel tlodi plant, gyda'r gyfradd yng Nghymru bellach yr un fath â'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Mae pobl yng Nghymru yn poeni llai am droseddu o'i gymharu â'r cyfartaledd ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr, ac mae ein llwyddiant addysgol yn ddihafal yng Nghymru. Dyna'r cefndir i rai o'r prif bwyntiau yn yr adroddiad.

Yn gyntaf, o ran gwelliant 1, rhaid inni roi cyfraddau diweithdra ac anweithgarwch economaidd yng nghyd-destun y duedd gyffredinol dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, sy'n dangos y cynnydd helaeth a wnaethom yng Nghymru fel gwlad. Mae'r adroddiad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn cynnwys manylion yr holl gamau a gymerir i wella lefelau gweithgarwch. Felly, gofynnaf ichi beidio â chefnogi'r gwelliant arbennig hwnnw.

Digartrefedd yw pwnc gwelliant 2. Dengys yr ystadegau digartrefedd diweddaraf fod nifer y teuluoedd y derbyniwyd eu bod yn ddigartref wedi gostwng 35 y cant dros y 12 mis blaenorol. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r gyllideb grantiau tai cymdeithasol, ond mae adfywio cymunedol yn fwy na'r materion hynny; mae'n ymwneud ag ystod o bethau. Nid oes rhaid ichi ond edrych ar rai o'r materion eraill ar yr agenda dai, fel rhaglenni adnewyddu ardaloedd, sy'n cael eu cyflwyno'n llwyddiannus gyda'r awdurdodau lleol.

Cefnogaf welliant 3 ar dlodi, oherwydd y mae adroddiad Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree, 'Monitro Tlodi ac Allgáu Cymdeithasol yng Nghymru', wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod cartrefi lle y mae rhywun yn gweithio yn gyfran gynyddol o'r rhai sy'n byw mewn tlodi. Fel rhan o'r gronfa syniadau newydd, yr wyf wedi cytuno i gyllido Sefydliad Bevan er mwyn gweld beth yw natur a nodweddion

work poverty, and the findings from this study will contribute to the mapping of in-work poverty across Wales. So, I am pleased to support that amendment as it reflects the work that I am already undertaking.

Turning to the amendment on education, we accept that we are behind England at GCSE level, particularly in terms of our most disadvantaged children. Why do you think that we have the raising attainment and individual standards in education programme here? Otherwise, these results continue to improve in Wales year on year. Therefore, the picture is not the negative one that you paint. We also have to recognise that, as an Assembly, we are on top of the issues in terms of primary education as a result of the policies of the Assembly Government. So, I certainly do not support that amendment.

On amendment 5, which relates to the number of households experiencing fuel poverty, our strategy as a Government is aimed at addressing fuel poverty. The recent price increases have certainly added to the number of people experiencing fuel poverty. As a Government, we are trying to work with the agencies and others to ensure that we can maximise the benefits and use our ability to influence income and fuel costs. The Government is limited in its ability to do this, but we try to do what we can. So, I am happy to support that amendment.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**Edwina Hart:** Ieuan also spoke about the spirit of amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. I understand exactly what Ieuan said in his contribution, but I believe that the amendment is unnecessary as energy efficiency is a key strand of Welsh Assembly Government policy, and we are looking at all of the issues that we need to look at at the moment. If you recall, last year we published the energy route map, which also reiterates the important role that energy efficiency plays in the Assembly Government's long-term vision to provide secure, diverse and affordable energy while meeting the environmental commitments, which are also important in this discussion.

sylyfaenol tlodi mewn gwaith, a bydd canfyddiadau'r astudiaeth hon yn cyfrannu at fapio tlodi mewn gwaith ledled Cymru. Felly, yr wyf yn falch o gefnogi'r gwelliant gan ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r gwaith yr wyf eisoes yn ei wneud.

Gan droi at y gwelliant ar addysg, derbyniwn ein bod y tu ôl i Loegr ar lefel TGAU, yn enwedig o ran ein plant mwyaf difreintiedig. Pam, yn eich barn chi, y mae'r rhaglen codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion gennym yma? Fel arall, mae'r canlyniadau hyn yn parhau i wella o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yng Nghymru. Felly, nid yw'r darlun yn un mor negyddol ag yr ydych chi'n dweud. Rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod, fel Cynulliad, ein bod ar y brig o ran addysg gynradd o ganlyniad i bolisïau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Felly, nid wyf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn yn sicr.

O ran gwelliant 5, sy'n ymwneud â nifer y cartrefi sy'n dioddef gan dlodi tanwydd, nod ein strategaeth fel Llywodraeth yw mynd i'r afael â thlodi tanwydd. Mae'r codiadau diweddar mewn prisiau yn sicr wedi cynyddu'r nifer sy'n profi tlodi tanwydd. Fel Llywodraeth, yr ydym yn ceisio gweithio gyda'r asiantaethau ac eraill i sicrhau ein bod yn gallu manteisio hynny a allwn ar fuddaliadau a defnyddio ein gallu i ddylanwadu ar incwm a chostau tanwydd. Mae gallu'r Llywodraeth i wneud hyn yn gyfyngedig, ond ceisiwn wneud hynny a allwn. Felly, yr wyf yn fodlon cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Edwina Hart:** Siaradodd Ieuan hefyd am ysbryd gwelliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Yr wyf yn deall yn union beth a ddywedodd Ieuan yn ei gyfraniad, ond credaf fod y gwelliant yn ddiangen oherwydd bod arbed ynni yn un o brif elfennau polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac yr ydym yn edrych ar yr holl faterion y mae angen inni edrych arnynt ar y funud. Os cofiwch, y llynedd cyhoeddusom fap llwybr ynni, sydd hefyd yn pwysleisio'r rôl bwysig y mae arbed ynni yn ei chwarae yng ngweledigaeth hirdymor Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddarparu ynni sicr, amrywiol a fforddiadwy gan gyflawni'r ymrwymadau amgylcheddol, sydd hefyd yn bwysig yn y drafodaeth hon.

**Mark Isherwood** *rose*—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. Minister, are you giving way?

**Edwina Hart:** I had not noticed that Mark was on his feet. I will not give way.

The social justice report details the action being taken by the Welsh Assembly Government in full.

I think that amendment 7 is a tad disingenuous, as is what Leanne said on this. As she knows, we had quite a long discussion about how we should get data and what we should do at the last meeting of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. I am preparing a detailed report for the committee meeting on 6 July, which will contain a structure for baseline reports on statistics. So, work is going forward on this, and I would, therefore, ask you to oppose the amendment.

I will also support Jocelyn's amendment on the persistent high levels of in-work poverty in Wales, as it reflects the comments that I made earlier.

**Leanne Wood:** Plaid Cymru wants to eradicate child poverty, and all poverty, in fact. Do you agree that the cause of socialism is being held back by Wales's control from London?

**Edwina Hart:** No. When you look at the record of the Westminster Government—and you only heard Jane Hutt speaking earlier today about what the Chancellor did with regard to the trust fund for children—you will see that the agenda that emerges is positive, and I hope that we complement it and perhaps improve upon it here in some of the things that we do as a Government.

On the issue raised in amendment 9, I think that significant progress has been made against the national service framework that was issued in 2002. It was revised in 2005, and there is an action plan, so we will be opposing that amendment.

**Mark Isherwood** *a gododd*—

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Weinidog, a ydych yn ildio?

**Edwina Hart:** Nid oeddwn wedi sylwi bod Mark ar ei draed. Nid ildiaf.

Mae'r adroddiad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn manylu ar y camau a gymerir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Credaf fod gwelliant 7 braidd yn ffuantus, a hefyd yr hyn a ddywedodd Leanne ar hyn. Fel y gŵyr hithau, cawsom drafodaeth eithaf hir ynghylch sut y dylem gasglu data a beth y dylem ei wneud yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Yr wyf wrthi'n paratoi adroddiad manwl ar gyfer cyfarfod y pwyllgor ar 6 Gorffennaf, a fydd yn cynnwys strwythur ar gyfer adroddiadau sylfaenol ar ystadegau. Felly, mae'r gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar hyn, a gofynnaf, felly, ichi wrthwynebu'r gwelliant.

Cefnogaf hefyd welliant Jocelyn ar y lefelau cyson uchel o dlodi mewn gwaith yng Nghymru, gan ei fod yn adlewyrchu'r sylwadau a wneuthum yn gynharach.

**Leanne Wood:** Mae ar Blaid Cymru eisiau dileu tlodi plant, a phob tlodi a dweud y gwir. A ydych yn cytuno bod y ffaith bod Cymru'n cael ei rheoli o Lundain yn llesteirio achos sosialaeth?

**Edwina Hart:** Nac ydwyf. Pan edrychwch ar record Llywodraeth San Steffan—a chlywsoch Jane Hutt yn siarad yn gynharach heddiw am yr hyn a wnaeth y Canghellor yng nghyswllt y gronfa ymddiriedolaeth i blant—mae rhywun yn gweld bod yr agenda yn un gadarnhaol, a gobeithio ein bod yn ei hategu ac efallai'n ei gwella yma gyda rhai o'r pethau yr ydym yn eu gwneud fel Llywodraeth.

O ran y mater a godir yng ngwelliant 9, credaf fod cynnydd sylweddol wedi'i wneud yn erbyn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol a gyflwynwyd yn 2002. Cafodd ei ddiwygio yn 2005, ac mae cynllun gweithredu erbyn hyn, felly ni fyddwn yn

We will support amendment 10 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, as long as it is not in the context of auditors scrambling over figures, and that it is about having a good look at it in terms of taking the agenda forward.

If I have time, Deputy Presiding Officer, I would like to comment briefly on a number of issues. I think that it is important that we recognise the issues around housing. I continue to lobby on the issue of the right to buy, because I feel strongly that it inhibits us in dealing with some of the issues.

5.30 p.m.

In terms of the housing agenda, we have some good policies in place. Carwyn and I have looked at the planning issues—the very issues that Mick Bates raised with me—and at what we can do to encourage development in certain areas, particularly affordable housing. We will take that agenda forward particularly strongly.

When we look at other issues on the agenda, we see that the point that Mick made about demographics and how that will impact in the long term was actually quite important. If you look at the issue of demographics, the issue of sustainability, and moving closer towards energy efficiency and how we are going to live, you will see that it is quite key in the future if we are to look at the social justice agenda.

I thank Carl Sargeant for his comments on what is an excellent Communities First programme in Shotton. Other comments made by Members in the debate were quite positive. Laura Anne alluded to her concerns about the inequality of access to services, which we generally understand, not just in the context of the social justice report but in the context of all things. If you are in a rural area and you cannot get transport, what do you do? It also relates to the level of services, in my own portfolio, in drug and substance misuse and so forth. We will have to tackle that if we are to make social justice a reality in the Welsh context.

cefnogi'r gwelliant hwnnw.

Byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 10 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, cyn belled nad ydyw yng nghyd-destun archwilwyr yn ymgiprys ynghylch ffigurau, ac mai ei bwrpas yw edrych yn iawn arno o ran bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda.

Os bydd gennyf amser, Ddirprwy Lywydd, hoffwn wneud sylw byr ar nifer o faterion. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig inni gydnabod y materion ynghylch tai. Yr wyf yn parhau i lobio ynglŷn â'r hawl i brynu, oherwydd teimlaf yn gryf ei fod yn ein rhwystro rhag delio â rhai o'r problemau.

O ran yr agenda ym maes tai, mae gennym rai polisiau da ar waith, Mae Carwyn a minnau wedi edrych ar y materion cynllunio—yr union faterion y mae Mick Bates wedi eu codi gyda mi—ac ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud i annog datblygu mewn ardaloedd penodol, yn enwedig tai fforddiadwy. Byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â'r agenda honno mewn ffordd arbennig o gryf.

Wrth edrych ar faterion eraill ar yr agenda, gwelwn fod y pwynt a wnaethpwyd gan Mick ynglŷn â demograffeg a pha effaith a gaiff yn y tymor hir yn un eithaf pwysig a dweud y gwir. Os edrychwch ar fater demograffeg, mater cynaliadwyedd, a symud yn nes at effeithlonrwydd ynni a sut yr ydym am fyw, gwelwch ei fod yn allweddol yn y dyfodol os ydym am edrych ar agenda cyfiawnder cymdeithasol.

Diolchaf i Carl Sargeant am ei sylwadau ar y rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yn Shotton, sy'n rhaglen wych. Yr oedd sylwadau eraill a wnaethpwyd gan Aelodau yn y ddadl yn bur gadarnhaol. Cyfeiriodd Laura Anne at ei phryderon ynglŷn â mynediad anghyfartal at wasanaethau, rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei ddeall ar y cyfan, nid yn unig yng nghyd-destun yr adroddiad ar gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ond yng nghyd-destun popeth. Os ydych yn byw mewn ardal wledig ac yn methu â chael cludiant, beth y gallwch ei wneud? Mae'n ymwneud hefyd â lefel gwasanaethau, yn fy mhortffolio i, o ran camddefnyddio cyffuriau a sylweddau ac yn y blaen. Bydd rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny os ydym am weld

cyfiawnder cymdeithasol yn cael ei wireddu yng nghyd-destun Cymru.

I thank all Members for their contributions to this debate. I will certainly look at the Record to see what further work can be undertaken. I hope that Members will support this report. Not everything will be agreed across the parties in it, but I think that it is a snapshot of what is happening in Government at this time. I hope that we can do more work on the report in future years.

I was also quite interested in Mark Isherwood's comments on Marx. Did the Queen not say something about Marx when she made her eightieth birthday speech? I did not think that he was trying to raise any political points with me—I am not quite sure whether he understands the merits of socialism to raise them with me.

Diolchaf i'r holl Aelodau am eu cyfraniadau i'r ddadl hon. Byddaf yn sicr o edrych ar y Cofnod i weld pa waith pellach y gellir ei wneud. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau'n cefnogi'r adroddiad hwn. Ni fydd pob plaid yn cytuno â phopeth sydd ynddo, ond credaf ei fod yn rhoi cipolwg ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y Llywodraeth ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithiaf y gallwn wneud mwy o waith ar yr adroddiad yn y blynyddoedd i ddod.

Yr oedd sylwadau Mark Isherwood ar Marx yn ddiddorol hefyd. Oni ddywedodd y Frenhines rywbeth am Marx yn ei haraith wrth ddathlu ei phen-blwydd yn bedwar ugain? Nid oeddwn yn credu ei fod yn ceisio codi pwyntiau gwleidyddol gyda mi—nid wyf yn hollol siŵr a yw'n deall rhinweddau sosialaeth i'w codi gyda mi.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 11, Ymatal 13, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 4: For 11, Abstain 13, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Williams, Brynle

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Famsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine



Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bates, Mick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Davies, Janet  
German, Michael  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 5: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David

Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 6: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 7: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
 Amendment 8: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 9: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 10: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Hart, Edwina  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3101) as amended: to propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*1. notes the Welsh Assembly Government's social justice report 2006, as presented to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee on 8 June 2006;*

*2. notes with concern increasing poverty in households where someone is in work;*

*3. regrets the recent significant increase in the number of households in Wales experiencing fuel poverty; and*

*4. regrets the persistent high levels of in-work poverty in Wales.*

Cynnig (NDM3101) fel y'i diwygiwyd: cynnig bod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn nodi adroddiad cyfiawnder cymdeithasol 2006 Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, fel y'i cyflwynwyd gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ar 8 Mehefin 2006;*

*2. yn nodi gyda phryder fod tlodi ar gynydd mewn aelwydydd lle mae rhywun yn gweithio;*

*3. yn gresynu at y cynnydd sylweddol yn ddiweddar yn nifer yr aelwydydd yng Nghymru sy'n wynebu tlodi tanwydd; ac*

*4. yn gresynu at y lefelau cyson uchel o dlodi mewn gwaith yng Nghymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Amended motion: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.*

*The meeting ended at 5.35 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau**  
**Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur – Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)