



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 23 Mai 2006
Tuesday, 23 May 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

- 3 Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog
Questions to the First Minister
- 33 Cwestiwn Brys: Gwasanaethau Deintyddol yng Ngogledd Cymru
Urgent Question: Dental Services in North Wales
- 38 Cwestiwn Brys: Cefnffordd yr A5
Urgent Question: The A5 Trunk Road
- 45 Datganiad Busnes
Business Statement
- 52 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Treuliau Teithio a Pheidio â Chodi Tâl) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006
- 58 Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006
- 77 Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Cyfarwyddiadau Diogelwch Gwladol a Chynrychiolwyr Penodedig) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig, Ardaloedd Cadwraeth a Sylweddau Peryglus) (Diwygiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, a'r Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Diwygiadau Amrywiol ac Addasiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv)
Approval of the Planning (National Security Directions and Appointed Representatives) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Planning (Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Hazardous Substances) (Amendments Relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the Town and Country Planning (Miscellaneous Amendments and Modifications relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Order 2006, under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv)
- 84 Rhan 2 o Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig
The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's Part 2 Policy Review of Special Educational Needs

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Cyllideb Rhagori The RAISE Budget

Q1 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on the raising attainment and individual standards in education in Wales budget? OAQ1589(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): The RAISE budget has been distributed using a formula based on schools with 20 per cent and above of pupils entitled to free school meals. That method provides the best available proxy for social disadvantage and its impact on educational underachievement. If anyone knows of a better way of targeting, please tell us.

Janet Ryder: I am sure that you are aware that many of your own backbenchers are unhappy with the formula chosen to distribute the RAISE money. Ann Jones asked you in Plenary on 9 May what you could offer those children who had lost out due to the inaccuracy of the free-school-meals data. Carl Sargeant said in the *Flintshire Evening Leader* on 20 April that the proportion of school dinners at a school was not an accurate method of judging whether its pupil base was disadvantaged. Would you agree with them, First Minister?

The First Minister: I notice that you did not accept my invitation, Janet, to tell me whether you had a better method. Trying to imply that you know of a better method is one thing, but it is the responsibility of the opposition to tell us if it thinks that there is a better method. Our experts tell us that, roughly, that level of 20 per cent and above of pupil entitlement to free school meals is the proper cut-off point and the best proxy for social disadvantage. If you know of a better method, write to me telling me about it; if not, I do not know what use your contribution is.

Jeff Cuthbert: First Minister, I am sure that,

C1 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllideb Rhagori, sef cynllun codi cyrhaeddiad a safonau addysgol unigolion yng Nghymru? OAQ1589(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Defnyddiwyd fformiwla sy'n seiliedig ar ysgolion sydd ag 20 y cant neu fwy o'u disgyblion â hawl i dderbyn prydau ysgol am ddim i ddsbarthu cyllideb Rhagori. Mae'r dull hwnnw'n cynnig y procsi gorau posibl sydd ar gael ar gyfer anfantais gymdeithasol ac effaith hynny ar dangyflawni addysgol. Os oes unrhyw un yn gwybod am ffordd well o dargedu, rhowch wybod inni.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod llawer o'ch meincwyr cefn yn anhapus â'r fformiwla a ddewiswyd i ddsbarthu arian Rhagori. Gofynnodd Ann Jones ichi yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 9 Mai beth y gallech ei gynnig i'r plant hynny a oedd wedi bod ar eu colled o ganlyniad i'r data gwallus am brydau ysgol am ddim. Dywedodd Carl Sargeant yn y *Flintshire Evening Leader* ar 20 Ebrill nad oedd cyfran y rhai sy'n cael cinio ysgol mewn ysgol yn ddull manwl o farnu a oedd sylfaen ei disgyblion yn wynebu anfantais. A fydddech yn cytuno â hwy, Brif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sylwaf na dderbyniasoch fy ngwahoddiad, Janet, i ddweud wrthyf a oedd gennych ddull gwell. Un peth yw ceisio awgrymu eich bod yn gwybod am ddull gwell, ond cyfrifoldeb yr wrthblaid yw dweud wrthym a yw'n credu bod dull gwell ar gael. Dywed ein harbenigwyr wrthym, yn fras, mai'r lefel honno o 20 y cant a mwy o ddisgyblion sydd â hawl i gael cinio ysgol am ddim yw'r terfyn priodol a'r procsi gorau ar gyfer anfantais gymdeithasol. Os gwyddoch am ddull gwell, ysgrifennwch ataf i roi gwybod imi amdano; os na wyddoch am un gwell, ni wn beth yw diben eich cyfraniad.

Jeff Cuthbert: Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn

like me, you are amazed by the way in which opposition members can ask the same question time and again. It is noted time and again, and you get the same answer time and again. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am very interested in hearing the rest of the supplementary question.

Jeff Cuthbert: I know that it is embarrassing for opposition members, but do you agree, First Minister, that the real value of this RAISE budget is in ensuring that once again we do not have a wasted generation leaving schools with no qualifications, or next to none? In my constituency, 35 per cent of adults who left school more than 10 years ago—and we all know who was in charge of our education system at that time—have no qualifications. Do you agree that that is the real value of this budget?

The First Minister: It is targeting underattainment. No school gets less money because of RAISE; the schools that get it are all getting additional money targeted directly at the schools for the specific purpose of reducing underattainment. The method used is that which most experts believe to be the best proxy for the likely risk of underattainment, and so that is why we have targeted it in this way. We believe that the schools that are receiving this money are enthusiastic about the new IT equipment or learning coaches that they will get, or the other ways in which they will target underattainment. It behoves the opposition to try to come up with some better ideas, or to accept that targeting underattainment in this way is a valuable contribution to make to improving the one area of weakness in the Welsh education system.

Peter Black: While you are targeting children in deprived areas in this way, is it not the case that, at the same time, schools are underfunded, so children are having to work in larger class sizes without the resources that they need? Is that not defeating the purpose of your grant? Could you tell us exactly what the view of local government is on this, and why you did not consult with local government before allocating this

siŵr eich bod chi, fel minnau, yn rhyfeddu at y ffordd y mae aelodau'r wrthblaid yn gallu gofyn yr un cwestiwn dro ar ôl tro. Fe'i nodir dro ar ôl tro, ac yr ydych yn cael yr un ateb dro ar ôl tro. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn awyddus iawn i glywed gweddill y cwestiwn atodol.

Jeff Cuthbert: Gwn ei fod yn peri annifyrrwch i aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, ond a ydych yn cytuno, Brif Weinidog, mai gwir werth cyllideb Rhagori yw sicrhau nad oes gennym unwaith eto genhedlaeth wedi'i gwastraffu sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb ddim cymwysterau, neu fawr ddim? Yn fy etholaeth, mae 35 y cant o'r oedolion a adawodd yr ysgol dros 10 mlynedd yn ôl—a gwyddom oll pwy oedd yn gyfrifol am ein system addysg bryd hynny—heb ddim cymwysterau. A ydych yn cytuno mai dyna yw gwir werth y gyllideb hon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n targedu tangyflawni. Nid oes yr un ysgol yn derbyn llai o arian oherwydd Rhagori; mae'r holl ysgolion sy'n ei gael yn cael arian ychwanegol sydd wedi ei dargedu'n uniongyrchol i'r perwyl penodol o leihau tangyflawni. Y dull a ddefnyddir yw'r procsi gorau ym marn y rhan fwyaf o arbenigwyr ar gyfer y perygl tebygol o dangyflawni, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi ei dargedu fel hyn. Yr ydym yn credu bod yr ysgolion sy'n cael yr arian hwn yn frwd ynghylch yr offer TG neu'r anogwyr dysgu a gânt, neu'r ffyrdd eraill y byddant yn eu defnyddio i dargedu tangyflawni. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar y gwrthbleidiau gynnig rhai syniadau gwell, neu dderbyn bod targedu tangyflawni fel hyn yn gyfraniad gwerthfawr tuag at wella'r un maes sy'n wendid yn system addysg Cymru.

Peter Black: Wrth ichi dargedu plant mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig fel hyn, onid yw'n wir, ar yr un pryd, nad yw ysgolion yn cael digon o arian, a bod plant yn gorfod gweithio mewn dosbarthiadau mwy heb yr adnoddau sydd eu hangen arnynt? Onid yw hynny'n mynd yn groes i bwrpas eich grant? A allwch ddweud wrthym beth yn union yw barn llywodraeth leol am hyn, a pham na wnaethoch ymgynghori â llywodraeth leol

money?

The First Minister: ‘No time’ is the very simple reason. We wanted to make the announcement quickly because the additional money from Gordon Brown’s budget came through around the end of the financial year. We thought, ‘Right, what will we do with it? Let’s use it to expand the programme that we have already started, to target underattainment in this way’. We were then able to raise that from £2 million to some £16 million and get it directly to schools and to the front line. I am sure that directors of education and people working in County Hall would much rather that they got the money. ’Twas ever thus: human beings are human beings. They would much rather they got their hands on the money, but we told them ‘no’, and that it would go straight to the schools. We think that that is the right way to do it. We think that the RAISE money will make a real difference at the front line in schools with the highest proportion of children at risk of underattainment.

Mark Isherwood: I suggest that the best measure might be actual attainment levels at primary school and age 11, and at GCSE. Charles Dickens wrote of two children, Ignorance and Want, and stated that Ignorance was worse,

‘for on his brow I see that written which is Doom’.

A headteacher in Merthyr, one of the most deprived areas, but with the best attendance rates, told me that it made him angry when links were automatically made between deprivation and poor achievement. He said that in his school, they talk about opportunity, and never disadvantage.

How can you justify the allocation of this RAISE budget to schools in a manner that penalises underachieving schools in counties such as Wrexham, and educational needs in schools from Flintshire and across north Wales, while further rewarding schools that may not be underachieving, or which are underachieving despite better funding, in areas that already receive the most funding

cyn dyrannu’r arian?

Y Prif Weinidog: ‘Dim amser’ yw’r rheswm syml. Yr oeddem am wneud y cyhoeddiad yn gyflym oherwydd bod yr arian ychwanegol o gyllideb Gordon Brown wedi dod tua diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol. Yr oeddem yn meddwl, ‘Iawn, beth a wnawn gyda’r arian? Gadewch inni ei ddefnyddio i ehangu’r rhaglen sydd eisoes ar waith gennym, i dargedu tangyflawni fel hyn’. Yr oeddem felly’n gallu cynyddu hynny o £2 miliwn i tua £16 miliwn a sicrhau ei fod yn mynd yn uniongyrchol i ysgolion ac i’r rheng flaen. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai’n llawer gwell gan gyfarwyddwyr addysg a’r bobl sy’n gweithio yn Neuadd y Sir iddynt hwy gael yr arian. Felly y bu pethau erioed: pobl yw pobl. Byddai’n llawer gwell ganddynt gael gafael ar yr arian, ond dywedasom ‘na’ wrthynt, ac y byddai’n mynd yn uniongyrchol i’r ysgolion. Yr ydym yn credu mai dyna’r ffordd orau o wneud hyn. Yr ydym yn credu y bydd arian Rhagori yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol yn y rheng flaen yn yr ysgolion sydd â’r gyfran uchaf o blant sydd mewn perygl o dangyflawni.

Mark Isherwood: Awgrymaf mai’r mesur gorau efallai fyddai’r lefelau cyrhaeddiad gwirioneddol yn yr ysgol gynradd yn 11 oed, ac adeg TGAU. Ysgrifennodd Charles Dickens am ddau blentyn, Ignorance a Want, a dywedodd mai Ignorance oedd waethaf,

‘cans ar ei dalcen gwelaf Dranc’.

Dywedodd pennaeth ym Merthyr, un o’r ardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, ond sydd â’r cyfraddau presenoldeb gorau, wrthyf ei fod yn gwylltio pan gysylltir amddifadedd yn awtomatig â chyflawni isel. Yn ei ysgol ef, meddai, am gyfle y byddant yn sôn, ac nid am anfantais byth.

Sut y gallwch gyfiawnhau dyrannu cyllideb Rhagori i ysgolion mewn modd sy’n cosbi ysgolion sy’n tangyflawni mewn siroedd fel Wrecsam, ac anghenion addysgol mewn ysgolion o sir y Fflint a ledled y Gogledd, gan wobrwyo ymhellach ysgolion nad ydynt o reidrwydd yn tangyflawni, neu sy’n tangyflawni er eu bod yn cael mwy o arian, mewn ardaloedd sydd eisoes yn cael mwyaf o

from your Government?

The First Minister: That is one of the most complicated propositions that I have heard—even from you, Mark. There are two alternatives here. You either target underachieving schools, that is, failing schools, or you target schools with the biggest problem in terms of the risk of underattainment because of the amount of social disadvantage. We believe that it is far better to do the second. If you do the first, you stigmatise those schools as failing schools and you are compensating them for their failures. We believe that it is better to take those schools with the highest risk factors for underattainment, regardless of the qualities of leadership and so on, and target them, giving them the money to help with learning coaches, information technology equipment or whatever it is that they think will help to reduce the number of children leaving school without educational qualifications.

arian gan eich Llywodraeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna un o'r gosodiadau mwyaf cymhleth imi eu clywed—hyd yn oed gennych chi, Mark. Mae dau ddewis posibl yma. Yr ydych un ai'n targedu ysgolion sy'n tangyflawni, hynny yw, ysgolion sy'n methu, neu'n targedu ysgolion sydd â'r broblem fwyaf o ran y perygl o dangyflawni oherwydd lefel yr anfantais gymdeithasol. Yr ydym yn credu ei bod yn llawer gwell gwneud yr ail. Os gwnewch y cyntaf, yr ydych yn pardduo'r ysgolion hynny fel ysgolion sy'n methu ac yr ydych yn talu iawndal iddynt am eu methiannau. Yr ydym yn credu ei bod yn llawer gwell cymryd yr ysgolion hynny gyda'r ffactorau risg uchaf ar gyfer tangyflawni, beth bynnag fo ansawdd yr arweiniad ac yn y blaen, ac yn eu targedu, gan roi arian iddynt i helpu gydag anogwyr dysgu, offer technoleg gwybodaeth neu beth bynnag a fyddai'n gymorth iddynt yn eu barn hwy i ostwng nifer y plant sy'n gadael yr ysgol heb gymwysterau addysgol.

Adfywio Economaidd yng Nghasnewydd Economic Regeneration in Newport

Q2 John Griffiths: Will the First Minister make a statement on economic regeneration in Newport? OAQ1564(FM)

The First Minister: As I saw from my visit to both banks of the River Usk in Newport city centre last Friday, unique opportunities are now emerging in Newport, with a probably best-in-a-generation set of plans, involving hundreds of millions of pounds of expenditure, and getting the balance right between developing the centre of Newport and the motorway junction peripheries, and between manufacturing and office developments.

John Griffiths: That is very true. There is a tremendous amount of development happening and about to happen in Newport with the urban regeneration company, and the Welsh Assembly Government and Newport City Council working closely together. Unfortunately, there is still far too much economic inactivity in Newport and the surrounding area. It has been clearly shown

C2 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am adfywio economaidd yng Nghasnewydd? OAQ1564(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y gwelais yn ystod fy ymweliad â'r ddwy ochr i afon Wysg yng nghanol dinas Casnewydd ddydd Gwener diwethaf, mae cyfleoedd unigryw yn dod i'r amlwg yn awr yng Nghasnewydd, gyda'r cynlluniau gorau ers cenhedlaeth mae'n debyg, sy'n golygu cannoedd o filiynau o bunnoedd o wariant, ac sy'n cadw'r cydbwysedd cywir rhwng datblygu canol Casnewydd a chyrion cyffyrdd y traffyrdd, a rhwng gweithgynhyrchu a datblygu swyddfeydd.

John Griffiths: Mae hynny'n berffaith wir. Mae llawer iawn o waith datblygu'n digwydd ac ar fin digwydd yng Nghasnewydd gyda'r cwmni adfywio trefol, a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Chyngor Dinas Casnewydd yn cydweithio'n agos. Yn anffodus, mae llawer iawn o anweithgarwch economaidd yng Nghasnewydd a'r ardal gyfagos o hyd. Dangoswyd yn eglur fod

that Newport is very important to the wider sub-regional economy. Given that, and all the development that is about to take place, and the fact that the Ryder Cup will be coming to Newport in 2010, would you agree that this is a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to get those economically inactive people in our most deprived communities into work and back into the economy? If so, what strategic approach will the Welsh Assembly Government encourage to make sure that those opportunities are maximised?

The First Minister: If you consider the 460 jobs in the new radiator manufacturing plant, the 1,300 jobs coming to the Office for National Statistics and Her Majesty's Prison Service's shared service centre, the jobs that will be coming to Debenhams and the city centre shopping redevelopment, costing £200 million, and the other developments in the city centre, you will see that there are big opportunities for inner-city communities such as Pill, Bainswell and Maindee, as well as for the outlying council estates such as Ringland and Bettws, to participate by getting the right training opportunities to get into construction, retail, manufacturing and the civil service jobs coming to Newport.

Laura Anne Jones: There have been widespread concerns recently about the cuts in budgets for enterprise agencies such as Newport and Gwent Enterprise and Venture Wales. Providers in South Wales East will see their funding, used to aid start-ups, almost halved. If we are serious about economic regeneration in Newport, should we not be supporting these agencies rather than cutting their funding?

The First Minister: I do not think that anyone is cutting their funding, but it is not guaranteed for all time. These bodies provide a service, and they compete to continue to provide that service. You mentioned being serious—that is why I mentioned the £140 million development by Barlo-Quinn, involving 460 new jobs in manufacturing, and the 1,300 plus jobs in the civil service, in ONS and Her Majesty's Prison Service.

Casnewydd yn bwysig iawn i'r economi isranbarthol ehangach. O gofio hynny, a'r holl ddatblygu sy'n mynd i ddigwydd, a'r ffaith bod Cwpan Ryder yn dod i Gasnewydd yn 2010, a fyddech yn cytuno bod hwn yn gyfle unwaith mewn oes i gael y bobl hynny sy'n anweithgar yn economaidd yn ein cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yn ôl i weithio ac yn ôl i'r economi? Os felly, pa ddull strategol y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei annog i sicrhau bod modd manteisio i'r eithaf ar y cyfleoedd hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os edrychwch ar y 460 o swyddi yn y ffatri cynhyrchu rheiddiaduron newydd, y 1,300 o swyddi sy'n dod i'r ganolfan wasanaethau sy'n cael ei rhannu gan y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol a Gwasanaeth Carchardai Ei Mawrhydi, y swyddi a fydd yn dod i Debenhams ac ailddatblygu siopau canol y ddinas, sy'n costio £200 miliwn, a'r datblygiadau eraill yng nghanol y ddinas, gwelwch fod cyfleoedd mawr i gymunedau canol y ddinas fel Pill, Bainswell a Maindee, yn ogystal ag i'r ystadau cyngor ar y cyrion fel Ringland a Bettws, i gyfranogi drwy fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyfforddi priodol i sicrhau swyddi yn y diwydiannau adeiladu, adwethu, gweithgynhyrchu a'r gwasanaeth sifil sy'n dod i Gasnewydd.

Laura Anne Jones: Mynegwyd pryderon mawr yn ddiweddar ynghylch y toriadau yng nghyllidebau asiantaethau menter fel Menter Casnewydd a Gwent a Menter Cymru. Bydd darparwyr yn Nwyrain De Cymru yn gweld eu harian, a ddefnyddir i gynorthwyo busnesau sy'n dechrau, yn cael ei haneru bron. Os ydym o ddifrif ynglŷn ag adfywio economaidd yng Nghasnewydd, oni ddylem fod yn cefnogi'r asiantaethau hyn yn hytrach na chwtdogi eu harian?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu bod neb yn cwtdogi eu harian, ond ni ellir ei warantu am byth. Mae'r cyrff hyn yn darparu gwasanaeth, ac maent yn cystadlu i barhau i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Soniasoch am fod o ddifrif—dyma pam y soniais am y datblygiad gwerth £140 miliwn gan Barlo-Quinn, sy'n golygu 460 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu newydd, a'r 1,300 a mwy o swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil, yn y Swyddfa Ystadegau Gwladol a Gwasanaeth Carchardai Ei Mawrhydi.

2.10 p.m.

I forgot to mention the 300 jobs coming as a result of Macquarie Bank's acquiring the Wales and West gas distribution network. That is being serious, with real jobs in the private and public sectors. It is bringing manufacturing and office jobs on top of the new Debenhams store and the other retail developments, which will enormously strengthen Newport's retail offer in the city centre.

Anghofiais sôn am y 300 o swyddi sy'n dod am fod Macquarie Bank wedi prynu rhwydwaith dosbarthu nwy Cymru a Gorllewin Lloegr. Dyna beth yw bod o ddifrif, gyda swyddi go iawn yn y sectorau preifat a chyhoeddus. Mae'n dod â swyddi gweithgynhyrchu a swyddi mewn swyddfeydd yn ychwanegol at y siop Debenhams newydd a'r datblygiadau adwerthu eraill, a fydd yn hwb enfawr i wasanaethau adwerthu Casnewydd yng nghanol y ddinas.

Thrombosis Gwythiennau Dwfn Deep-vein Thrombosis

Q3 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister make a statement on deep-vein thrombosis treatment in the NHS? OAQ1577(FM)

C3 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am driniaeth thrombosis gwythiennau dwfn yn y GIG? OAQ1577(FM)

The First Minister: We accept that venous thromboembolism is a common and potentially serious condition, often following deep-vein thrombosis. The Welsh Assembly Government recognises the need to raise public and professional awareness of this condition and its prevention. We are currently considering commissioning a national audit on its prevention, diagnosis and treatment.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn derbyn bod thrombo-emboledd gwythiennol yn gyflwr cyffredin ac yn un a all fod yn ddifrifol, sy'n aml yn dilyn thrombosis gwythiennau dwfn. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n cydnabod yr angen i godi ymwybyddiaeth o'r cyflwr hwn ymhlith y cyhoedd a'r proffesiwn meddygol a sut i'w atal. Yr ydym yn ystyried comisiynu archwiliad cenedlaethol ar hyn o bryd ynghylch sut i'w atal, gwneud diagnosis a'i drin.

Jenny Randerson: As you point out, thrombosis is a leading cause of death in the UK, affecting one in 1,000 people. The risk is particularly high among hospital patients, as a result of their immobility. Yet, no risk analysis is done on admission to hospital and no routine medication is given, even though it is inexpensive and cost-effective, particularly for the most at-risk groups. Thromboprophylaxis can reduce cases of thrombosis by up to 70 per cent in high-risk groups. Caroline Flint, Minister of State for Public Health, has announced that the Healthcare Commission in England will be taking up this issue. I am pleased to hear that you are considering doing something about it, but will you give your commitment this afternoon to take much firmer action and more prompt action, so that Wales does not

Jenny Randerson: Fel y dywedaso, mae thrombosis yn un o brif achosion marwolaeth yn y DU, sy'n effeithio ar un o bob 1,000 o bobl. Mae'r perygl yn arbennig o fawr ymhlith cleifion mewn ysbytai, oherwydd nad ydynt yn gallu symud. Er hynny, nid oes dadansoddiad risg yn cael ei wneud pan dderbynnir cleifion i'r ysbyty ac ni roddir dim meddyginiaeth arferol iddynt, er bod hynny'n rhad a chosteffeithiol, yn enwedig i'r grwpiau sy'n wynebu'r perygl mwyaf. Gall thromboprophylaxis leihau nifer yr achosion o thrombosis gymaint â 70 y cant mewn grwpiau sydd mewn perygl mawr. Mae Caroline Flint, y Gweinidog Gwladol dros Iechyd Cyhoeddus, wedi cyhoeddi y bydd y Comisiwn Gofal Iechyd yn Lloegr yn edrych ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed eich bod yn ystyried gwneud

lag behind England, as is usual?

The First Minister: That was a nasty little twist in the tail, Jenny. The Chief Medical Officer for England's expert panel reports on this issue this summer; we do not need to duplicate its work to avoid your throwing nasty little remarks, such as that which you made at the end of what was otherwise quite a sensible question. It is difficult to strike the right balance between giving advice on heparin and aspirin and the other drugs that can reduce the risks, and on lifestyle changes in relation to high-risk factors, such as excessive smoking or having a family history of diabetes, and so on. We are certainly actively engaged in trying to raise awareness. This is a major killer: it appears to affect more people than breast cancer, in terms of fatalities. It has been hidden away and has not received the proper emphasis, although my understanding is that the data demonstrate that the number of deaths in Wales over the last five or six years has come down steadily, from about 500 deaths a year to 400 deaths a year. That is still far too high, but is nevertheless an improving picture.

David Melding: I welcome the initiative to raise awareness of this problem among patients, potential sufferers and the medical profession. Far too many people wait too long for treatment, and I am sure that we have all received postbags full of letters about cases where people have been waiting in accident-and-emergency departments for quite a long time before a problem is diagnosed, or are sent home where the condition worsens. There are some basic diagnostic methods that need to be advanced as soon as possible.

The First Minister: I agree with that in the sense that if you have the risk factors, such as diabetes, old age—unfortunately—or a family history of strokes and so on, there are various things that you can do to try to reduce the risk. Then, when you become a very

rhywbeth yn ei gylch, ond a wnewch roi ymrwymiad y prynhawn yma i weithredu'n llawer mwy pendant a chyflym, fel na fydd Cymru ar ei hôl hi o'i chymharu â Lloegr, fel sy'n arfer digwydd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd hynny'n dro cas yn y gynffon, Jenny. Bydd panel arbenigwyr Prif Swyddog Meddygol Lloegr yn cyhoeddi ei adroddiad ar y pwnc yn ystod yr haf; nid oes angen inni ailadrodd ei waith er mwyn osgoi eich sylwadau bach cas chi, fel yr un a gafwyd gennych ar ddiwedd yr hyn a oedd fel arall yn gwestiwn digon synhwyrol. Mae'n anodd cael y cydbwysedd iawn rhwng rhoi cyngor ar heparin ac aspirin a chyffuriau eraill a all leihau'r peryglon, ac ar newidiadau i ffordd o fyw o ran ffactorau sy'n creu perygl mawr, megis ysmegu gormod neu fod diabetes yn y teulu, ac yn y blaen. Yr ydym yn sicr wrthi'n ceisio codi ymwybyddiaeth. Mae hwn yn gyflwr sy'n lladd llawer: ymddengys ei fod yn effeithio ar fwy o bobl na chanser y fron, o ran y niferoedd sy'n marw o ganlyniad iddo. Mae heb gael fawr o sylw ac ni roddwyd digon o bwyslais arno, er bod y data, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, yn dangos bod nifer y marwolaethau yng Nghymru wedi gostwng yn raddol dros y pum neu chwe blynedd diwethaf, o tua 500 marwolaeth y flwyddyn i tua 400 marwolaeth y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n llawer rhy uchel o hyd, ond er hynny mae'r sefyllfa'n gwella.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cynllun i godi ymwybyddiaeth o'r broblem hon ymhlith cleifion, dioddefwyr posibl a'r proffesiwn meddygol. Mae llawer gormod o bobl yn gorfod aros yn rhy hir am driniaeth, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd wedi derbyn llawer o lythyrau am achosion lle y mae pobl wedi bod yn aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys am gryn amser cyn bod diagnosis yn cael ei wneud, neu eu bod yn cael eu hanfon adref lle y mae'r broblem yn gwaethygu. Mae rhai dulliau sylfaenol o wneud diagnosis y mae angen eu hyrwyddo cyn gynted â phosibl.

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf â hynny yn yr ystyr os yw'r ffactorau risg yn hysbys, megis diabetes, henaint—yn anffodus—neu fod rhai o'r teulu wedi cael strôc ac yn y blaen, mae amryw o bethau y gellir eu gwneud i geisio lleihau'r perygl. Yna, pan fyddwch yn

likely victim, at high risk, blood-thinning treatments such as warfarin, heparin and aspirin can be of great value. As I said, there has been a big improvement in the fatalities picture related to this disease, but we would all agree that it has never had the proper amount of attention, publicity and priority. We are determined to give it that now.

debygol iawn o ddioddef, mewn perygl mawr, gall triniaethau i deneuo'r gwaed megis warfarin, heparin ac aspirin fod yn werthfawr iawn. Fel y dywedais, bu gwelliant mawr o ran y niferoedd sy'n marw o ganlyniad i'r cyflwr, ond byddem i gyd yn cytuno nad yw erioed wedi cael sylw, cyhoeddusrwydd a blaenoriaeth ddigonol. Yr ydym yn benderfynol y caiff hynny o hyn ymlaen.

Gwasanaethau Meddygon Teulu y Tu Allan i Oriau Arferol Out-of-hours General Practitioner Services

Q4 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Will the First Minister make a statement on the provision of out-of-hours GP services in Wales? OAQ1573(FM)

C4 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau arferol yng Nghymru? OAQ1573(FM)

The First Minister: Out-of-hours services in Wales have been commissioned by local health boards for more than 20 months. We expect LHBs to continue to monitor the services for their effectiveness and efficiency, and make improvements accordingly.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol yng Nghymru wedi cael eu comisiynu gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ers dros 20 mis. Yr ydym yn disgwyl y bydd BILlau yn parhau i fonitro'r gwasanaethau o ran eu heffeithiolrwydd a'u heffeithlonrwydd, a chyflwyno gwelliannau ar sail hynny.

Michael German: Just fewer than 100,000 people contacted the out-of-hours service in Gwent last year—100,000 people who stand to be affected by plans to shut half of the centres providing that service. We discussed that issue two weeks ago. When I wrote to you on this matter, you said that you would look into the problems faced by about 43,000 people in Gwent who travel to these centres annually. For many people, travel times will be doubled or even trebled. Have you considered the impact of more people needing home visits and the extra costs to the health service of these proposals?

Michael German: Cysylltodd ychydig llai na 100,000 o bobl â'r gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau arferol yng Ngwent y llynedd—100,000 o bobl y gallai'r cynlluniau i gau hanner y canolfannau sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn effeithio arnynt. Trafodwyd y mater hwnnw bythefnos yn ôl. Pan ysgrifennais atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, dywedasoch y byddech yn ymchwilio i'r problemau y mae tua 43,000 o bobl yng Ngwent sy'n teithio i'r canolfannau hyn yn flynyddol yn eu hwynebu. Yn achos llawer o bobl, bydd eu hamser teithio'n dyblu neu'n treblu hyd yn oed. A ydych wedi ystyried pa effaith a gaiff y ffaith y bydd ar fwy o bobl angen ymweliadau cartref a'r costau ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn sgîl y cynigion hyn?

The First Minister: It is not a case of whether I have looked at that but whether the LHB will be looking at it. Some of your points may have some validity, but the picture may not be as you describe it. Many patients choose to travel the longer distance

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid a wyf fi wedi edrych ar hynny yw'r cwestiwn ond a fydd y BILl yn edrych arno. Mae'n bosibl bod rhywfaint o ddilysrwydd yn perthyn i rai o'ch pwyntiau, ond mae'n bosibl nad yw'r darlun fel yr ydych yn ei ddisgrifio. Mae llawer o gleifion

to the bigger out-of-hours centres. We understand that that emerged from the LHBs' review after the first year. They said that a significant number travelled on to other centres and that patients who went to smaller centres at their local hospitals then transferred to the larger centres because the facilities in the smaller centres were not what they required. There is also the question of the efficient use of the 100 or so doctors who are engaged in providing the out-of-hours service. It is up to the LHBs; they are reviewing it, and their consultation will finish on 31 July.

Leighton Andrews: Are you aware that, since April, the Rhondda Cynon Taff Local Health Board has been commissioning in co-operation with the Pontypridd and Rhondda NHS Trust, and that, therefore, we have an NHS-delivered, out-of-hours GP service in RCT? That has led to an expansion in the number of doctors operating in the service and to the likelihood of reduced costs overall because of the advance commissioning of doctors' time. Do you welcome that step, and will you offer your congratulations to RCT local health board for the steps that it has taken?

The First Minister: I do not know the details of the situation that you are describing. However, I seem to remember that Primecare first provided the out-of-hours service in the Pontypridd and Rhondda trust area when it ceased to be commissioned by GPs in September 2004. I guess that there has been a change in the contracting arrangements after a certain period and that the LHB and trust have gone over to providing it from within. Let us hope that that is a step forwards in terms of the services provided. The big advantage will be that the doctors will probably know the patients far better than was the case with Primecare staff. It is up to them to make the decision, with a view to providing a better service to patients and making better use of doctors.

David Lloyd: A ydych chi'n hollol ffyddiog

yn dewis teithio'r pellter hwy i'r canolfannau y tu allan i oriau sy'n fwy. Deallwn fod hyn wedi dod i'r amlwg yn dilyn adolygiad y BILlau ar ôl y flwyddyn gyntaf. Dywedasant fod nifer sylweddol yn teithio i ganolfannau eraill a bod cleifion a oedd yn mynd i ganolfannau bach yn eu hysbytai lleol yn symud wedyn i'r canolfannau mawr gan nad oedd y cyfleusterau yn y canolfannau bach yn addas i'w hanghenion. Mater arall yw gwneud defnydd effeithlon o'r meddygon, tua 100 ohonynt, sy'n ymwneud â darparu'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Y BILlau fydd yn penderfynu; maent yn adolygu hyn, a bydd eu hymgyngoriad yn dod i ben ar 31 Gorffennaf.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn ymwybodol bod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf, ers mis Ebrill, wedi bod yn comisiynu ar y cyd ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Pontypridd a'r Rhondda, a bod gennym, felly, wasanaeth meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau sy'n cael ei ddarparu gan y GIG yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? Mae hyn wedi arwain at gynnydd yn nifer y meddygon sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth ac at y tebygolrwydd y bydd costau is yn gyffredinol gan fod amser meddygon yn cael ei gomisiynu ymlaen llaw. A ydych yn croesawu'r cam hwn, ac a wnewch longyfarch bwrdd iechyd lleol Rhondda Cynon Taf am gymryd y camau hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â manylion y sefyllfa yr ydych yn ei disgrifio. Fodd bynnag, tybiaf fy mod yn cofio bod Primecare wedi dechrau darparu'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yn ardal ymddiriedolaeth Pontypridd a'r Rhondda pan beidiodd â chael ei gomisiynu gan feddygon teulu ym Medi 2004. Mae'n debyg bod newid wedi bod yn y trefniadau contractio ar ôl rhyw gyfnod a bod y BILl a'r ymddiriedolaeth wedi dechrau ei ddarparu o'r tu mewn. Gadewch inni obeithio bod hyn yn gam ymlaen o ran y gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu. Y brif fantais yw y bydd y meddygon mae'n debyg yn adnabod y cleifion yn llawer gwell nag yr oedd staff Primecare yn eu hadnabod. Eu cyfrifoldeb hwy yw gwneud y penderfyniad, er mwyn darparu gwell gwasanaeth i gleifion a gwneud gwell defnydd o feddygon.

David Lloyd: Are you confident that

bod digon o arian wedi'i glustnodi yng Nghymru gogyfer â'r gwasanaeth meddyg teulu y tu allan i oriau gwaith arferol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ceisio cofio'r ffigur; yr wyf yn meddwl taw £28 miliwn oedd hwnnw. Os wyf yn anghywir, ysgrifennaf atoch gyda'r ffigur cywir—mae'n ddrwg gennyf; yr wyf newydd weld mai hwnnw oedd y ffigur yn 2002-03. Byddaf fi, neu Brian Gibbons, yn ysgrifennu atoch gyda'r manylion am faint sydd wedi'i glustnodi, gan ddangos y patrwm dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf ac ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf.

Jonathan Morgan: One of the consequences of patients not being able to access primary care, particularly out-of-hours services, is self-referral to the nearest accident-and-emergency department. This was the consequence of the clumsy transition from the old system to the new out-of-hours service in many parts of Wales. Do you accept the fact that some accident-and-emergency departments in Wales have suffered as a consequence of that? Do you also accept that the introduction of walk-in centres, perhaps co-located with accident-and-emergency departments, may help to alleviate some of the pressures?

The First Minister: I do not think that anyone has ever claimed that the services offered by walk-in centres substitute for those provided by accident-and-emergency departments or the out-of-hours system. It appears that walk-in centres service a demand that is not currently met at all. In other words, they provide services that are additional to, and not instead of, those provided by accident-and-emergency departments and out-of-hours providers.

The introduction of the out-of-hours service went quite badly in certain areas. You will be familiar with what occurred in the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust area during the difficult first autumn and winter. We believe that it has settled down now. However, it certainly creates an overspill into the inappropriate use of accident-and-emergency departments and the paramedic emergency service, with

sufficient funding has been allocated in Wales for the out-of-hours general practitioner service?

The First Minister: I am trying to recall the figure; I think that it was £28 million. If I am wrong, I will write to you with the correct figure—I apologise; I have just noticed that that was the figure for 2002-03. Brian Gibbons or I will write to you with the details as regards how much has been allocated and to reflect the pattern over the past five years, as well as for next year.

Jonathan Morgan: Un o'r pethau sy'n digwydd pan fo cleifion yn methu â chael gofal sylfaenol, yn enwedig gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau, yw eu bod yn mynd i'r adran damweiniau ac achosion brys agosaf. Dyma a ddigwyddodd o ganlyniad i'r trosglwyddo trwsogl o'r hen system i drefn newydd y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau mewn sawl rhan o Gymru. A ydych yn derbyn y ffaith bod rhai adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yng Nghymru wedi dioddef o ganlyniad i hynny? A ydych hefyd yn derbyn y gallai cyflwyno canolfannau galw i mewn, yn yr un lle ag adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys efallai, helpu i leddfu rhywfaint ar y pwysau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu bod neb erioed wedi honni bod y gwasanaethau a gynigir gan ganolfannau galw i mewn yn cymryd lle'r rhai a ddarperir gan adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys na'r system y tu allan i oriau. Ymddengys fod canolfannau galw i mewn yn ateb galw nad yw'n cael ei ddiwallu o gwbl ar hyn o bryd. Mewn geiriau eraill, maent yn darparu gwasanaethau sy'n ychwanegol at y rhai a ddarperir gan adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a ddarparwyr y tu allan i oriau, ac nid gwasanaethau yn lle'r rhai hynny.

Cafwyd problemau mawr wrth gyflwyno'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau mewn rhai ardaloedd. Gwyddoch am yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn ardal Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro yn ystod cyfnod anodd yr hydref a'r gaeaf cyntaf. Credwn fod pethau'n well erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n sicr yn peri bod adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a gwasanaeth argyfwng y parafeddygon

people calling 999. We also saw the backing up of ambulances that were unable to go back out to respond to calls. I do not think that this winter was anything like as bad as the first, although it was not entirely free of problems.

yn cael eu defnyddio'n amhriodol, wrth i bobl alw 999. Gwelsom hefyd broblemau gydag ambiwlansys a oedd yn methu â mynd yn ôl allan i ymateb i alwadau. Credaf fod y gaeaf hwn wedi bod yn well na'r un cyntaf, er na fu heb ei broblemau.

Gwasanaethau Swyddfeydd Post Post Office Services

Q5 Eleanor Burnham: What representations has the Welsh Assembly Government made to the UK Government regarding increasing post office services in Wales? OAQ1570(FM)

C5 Eleanor Burnham: Pa sylwadau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cyflwyno i Lywodraeth y DU ynghylch cynyddu gwasanaethau swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru? OAQ1570(FM)

Q9 Catherine Thomas: What discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government had with the UK Government on providing support to sub-post offices in Wales? OAQ1583(FM)

C9 Catherine Thomas: Pa drafodaethau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â darparu cefnogaeth i is-swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru? OAQ1583(FM)

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: These matters are non-devolved responsibilities, although we take a strong interest in the pattern of post offices, because they are linked with many other public services and are the backbone of the communities, or the shopping centres serving those communities. Increasing the range of post office services by providing foreign exchange or internet facilities is a key to ensuring the future of the network after the loss of benefit payments. In relation to sub-post offices, there are pilot schemes in Wales that aim to provide services in areas that cannot support the traditional type of post office or sub-post office.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r cyfrifoldeb am y materion hyn wedi ei ddatganoli, er bod gennym ddiddordeb mawr ym mhattrwm swyddfeydd post, gan eu bod yn gysylltiedig â llawer o wasanaethau cyhoeddus eraill a chan eu bod yn asgwrn cefn i'r cymunedau, neu'r canolfannau siopa sy'n gwasanaethu'r cymunedau hynny. Mae cynyddu amrediad y gwasanaethau mewn swyddfeydd post drwy ddarparu cyfleusterau cyfnewid arian tramor neu gyfleusterau rhyngwyd yn ddull allweddol o sicrhau dyfodol y rhwydwaith ar ôl colli budd-daliadau. O ran is-swyddfeydd post, mae cynlluniau peilot yng Nghymru sy'n ceisio darparu gwasanaethau mewn ardaloedd na allant gynnal y math traddodiadol o swyddfa bost neu is-swyddfa bost.

Eleanor Burnham: First Minister, a fortnight ago you said in response to a question about the post office development fund that you cannot run the scheme at the moment, because we will not know in which post offices it would be right to encourage investment until the wider review by the Department of Trade and Industry and the Treasury is completed. We hope that this will emerge from the inter-departmental undergrowth in Whitehall before too long. Is the National Assembly, First Minister, not

Eleanor Burnham: Brif Weinidog, bythefnos yn ôl dywedasoeh wrth ateb cwestiwn ynglŷn â'r gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post na allwch gynnal y cynllun ar hyn o bryd, gan na fyddwn yn gwybod ym mha swyddfeydd post y byddai'n iawn annog buddsoddiad hyd nes y bydd yr adolygiad ehangach gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Trysorlys wedi ei gwblhau. Yr ydym yn gobeithio y daw hyn yn hysbys o'r isfyd rhyngadrannol yn Whitehall cyn bo hir. A yw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, Brif Weinidog,

capable of determining for itself which post offices deserve investment on the basis of need alone, without having to wait for Whitehall to pull the issue out of the long grass? Will you consider, First Minister, reinstating the post office development fund now, before it is too late?

The First Minister: I do not think that that would be good value for money. We need to know which post offices are likely to survive any shrinkage in the size of the network, which has already been spoken about. There is a large loss-making component in the network, and although we can differentiate between a marginally loss-making post office or sub-post office, and one that might be able to make money by drawing in more customers through better security and facilities, and so forth, I do not think that we can agree to reopen the post office development fund, successful as it was, until we know the pattern. I do not think that it will be too long before the picture from Whitehall is a bit clearer.

Catherine Thomas: First Minister, I regularly meet staff from sub-post offices in my constituency, and I am extremely concerned at the alarming rate at which those sub-post offices are losing key services, such as the post office card account and television licence payments. Most recently, it was announced in Carmarthenshire that post offices will no longer be able to take payment for, or administer, council tax. First Minister, do you share my concern that no-one seems to be monitoring the overall, combined impact of the loss of these key services? Do you agree with me, First Minister, that this needs to be addressed urgently, as many post offices, which have benefited greatly from the support this Assembly Government has given, may be forced to close?

The First Minister: They have suffered three losses of business. I was not aware of that third one, to be honest—I was aware of two, but you have now added a third. Those losses, on their own, may only constitute 2 or 5 per cent of the total business. However, if you add the three together, then it is a big loss for an individual business, which a sub-

yn analluog i benderfynu drosto'i hun pa swyddfeydd post sy'n haeddu buddsoddiad ar sail angen yn unig, heb orfod aros i Whitehall ddyfarnu ynghylch y mater? Brif Weinidog, a wnewch ystyried adfer y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post yn awr, cyn ei bod yn rhy hwyr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu y byddai hynny'n werth da am arian. Mae angen inni gael gwybod pa swyddfeydd post sy'n debygol o oroesi unrhyw leihad ym maint y rhwydwaith, y soniwyd amdano'n barod. Mae rhan fawr o'r rhwydwaith sy'n gwneud colled, ac er ein bod yn gallu gwahaniaethu rhwng swyddfa bost neu is-swyddfa bost sy'n gwneud ychydig o golled, ac un a allai wneud arian drwy ddenu rhagor o gwsmeriaid o ganlyniad i well diogelwch a gwell cyfleusterau, ac yn y blaen, nid wyf yn credu y gallwn gytuno i ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, er ei bod yn llwyddiannus, hyd nes y byddwn yn gwybod beth yw'r patrwm. Nid wyf yn credu y bydd angen aros llawer mwy nes y bydd y darlun ychydig yn gliriach o Whitehall.

Catherine Thomas: Brif Weinidog, byddaf yn cyfarfod â staff o is-swyddfeydd post yn fy etholaeth yn aml, ac yr wyf yn bryderus iawn bod yr is-swyddfeydd hyn yn colli mwy a mwy o wasanaethau allweddol, megis cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post a thaliadau trwydded deledu. Yn ddiweddar, cyhoeddwyd yn sir Gaerfyrddin na fydd swyddfeydd post mwyach yn gallu derbyn taliadau'r dreth gyngor na gweinyddu'r dreth honno. Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder nad oes neb i'w weld yn monitro effaith gyfunol, gyffredinol colli'r gwasanaethau allweddol hyn? A ydych yn cytuno â mi, Brif Weinidog, fod angen rhoi sylw i hyn ar fyrder, gan y bydd llawer o swyddfeydd post, sydd wedi elwa'n fawr o'r cymorth a roddwyd gan Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn cael eu gorfodi i gau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Maent wedi colli tri busnes. Nid oeddwn yn ymwybodol o'r trydydd, a bod yn onest—gwyddwn am ddau, ond yr ydych wedi ychwanegu trydydd yn awr. Efallai nad yw'r colledion hyn, ar eu pennau eu hunain, fawr mwy na 2 neu 5 y cant o'u busnes cyfan. Fodd bynnag, os ydych yn dod â'r tri at ei gilydd, yna mae'n

post office is. The post office card account is one such loss and the loss of the television licence payment contract is another, and you also mentioned the loss of housing benefits payments.

The Post Office has been telling us continuously that, as a business, it needs more products. It very much regrets that it does not now have the Girobank to provide it with a basis upon which to diversify and overcome the loss of the benefits business, which was the biggest blow of all. The Post Office announced record profits the other day and is doing well as an overall business. However, that does not mean that there is not a major problem in the potential shrinkage of the post office network. That would have a major impact on the pattern of the delivery of public and private services, in the way in which you have illustrated, in large areas of Wales.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Mae'n braf gweld pobl fel Catherine Thomas yn brwydro i gadw swyddfeydd post ar agor yn eu hetholaethau, Brif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn ei ystyried yn rhyfedd bod Aelodau Cynulliad Llafur ac Aelodau Seneddol Llafur yn brwydro i gadw swyddfeydd post ar agor, pan fydd y penderfyniad terfynol a fydd yn arwain at eu cau yn cael ei wneud gan Weinidog Llafur yn Llundain?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y broblem yw, os yw rhannau helaeth o'r rhwydwaith yn colli arian, a hwnnw'n arian mawr, beth sydd i'w wneud? Yr hyn sy'n cael ei drafod yw ymgais i ailwampio'r rhwydwaith, fel bod y rhwydwaith yn medru bod yn gynaliadwy. Wrth ystyried ei bod yn costio 1c i dalu budd-daliadau ac ati yn uniongyrchol i mewn i gyfrif banc, tra ei bod yn costio £1 i wneud y taliad i'r cwsmer mewn swyddfa bost, mae hynny'n ddadl go gryf o blaid taliadau electronig, gan y byddai'n arbed 99 y cant o'r costau presennol. Wrth gwrs byddwn yn brwydro i gadw cymaint o'r rhwydwaith ag sy'n bosibl. Mae'n rhan o asgwrn cefn gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a phreifat mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr oedd hynny'n ateb cymhleth i gwestiwn syml. Gweinidog Llafur

gollod fawr i fusnes unigol, fel is-swyddfa bost. Colli cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yw un gollod ac un arall yw colli'r contract taliadau trwydded deledu, a chyfeiriasoch hefyd at golli taliadau budd-daliadau tai.

Mae Swyddfa'r Post wedi bod yn dweud wrthym yn gyson fod arni, fel busnes, angen rhagor o gynhyrchion. Mae'n gresynu'n fawr nad yw'r Girobank ganddi bellach i gynnig sail ar gyfer arallgyfeirio a goresgyn colli'r busnes budd-daliadau, sef yr ergyd fwyaf o'r cyfan. Cyhoeddodd Swyddfa'r Post ei helw mwyaf erioed y diwrnod o'r blaen ac mae'n gwneud yn dda fel busnes yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes problem fawr yn sgîl y lleihad posibl ym maint rhwydwaith swyddfa'r post. Byddai hynny'n cael effaith fawr ar batrwm darparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a phreifat, fel yr ydych wedi dangos, mewn rhannau helaeth o Gymru.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): It is good to see people such as Catherine Thomas fighting to keep post offices open in their constituencies, First Minister. However, do you not consider it strange that Labour Assembly Members and Labour Members of Parliament are fighting to keep post offices open when the final decision that would lead to their closure is being made by a Labour Minister in London?

The First Minister: The problem is, if large areas of the network are losing money, and a great deal of it, what is to be done? What is being discussed is an attempt to revamp the network, so that it can be sustainable. When you consider that it costs 1p to pay benefits and so on directly into a bank account, while it costs £1 to pay the customer in a post office, that is a strong argument in favour of electronic payments, as it would save on 99 per cent of the present costs. Of course we will fight to keep as much of the network as possible. It is a part of the backbone of public and private services in many parts of Wales.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That was a complicated answer to a simple question. A Labour

yn Llundain sydd â'r cyfrifoldeb am benderfynu ar ddyfodol swyddfeydd post. Y cwestiwn yw: a wnewch roi pwysau ar y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i gadw'r cerdyn tan ar ôl 2010? A ydych yn ymwybodol bod miloedd o bensiynwyr yng Nghymru wedi cael addewid gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn 2003 y byddant yn medru parhau i ddefnyddio'r cerdyn? Fodd bynnag, yn y ddau neu dri mis diwethaf, yr ydym wedi clywed bod y cerdyn yn darfod ar ôl 2010. Un ffordd o gadw swyddfeydd post ar agor yw cadw'r cerdyn ar ôl 2010. A ydych yn fodlon brwydro i sicrhau hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn brwydro. Nid yw'r mater wedi ei gau i lawr gyda'r penderfyniad hwn. Mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn parhau i drafod gyda Swyddfa'r Post ynglŷn â beth fydd yn digwydd ar ôl 2010. Byddwn yn parhau i wasgu a brwydro dros ddefnyddio adnoddau Swyddfa'r Post er mwyn cadw cymaint o'r rhwydwaith ar agor ag sy'n bosibl, ac i gael modd effeithiol sydd ar gael i gymaint o bobl Cymru ag sy'n bosibl heb iddynt orfod teithio gormod. Mae hi'n fwy o broblem yng Nghymru nag yw hi yn rhanbarthau Lloegr.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I do not understand why you have made your response so complicated, First Minister, because the issue is quite simple. If the card comes to an end in 2010, the vast majority of sub-post offices in Wales will close. The reason why I say that is because such a high proportion of their income is derived from the card account. Once that business goes to the banks, the post offices will close. They have made it perfectly clear that whatever new arrangements are in place, unless those arrangements enable pensioners and benefit holders to access their money at the post office, you can say 'goodbye' to most of the network. That is clear. What I want to hear from you, First Minister—without the waffle—is whether you support our post offices.

The First Minister: I have already said—and I will say it again, because you are obviously trying to do a lot of posturing this afternoon—that we have campaigned.

Minister in London has the responsibility for deciding on the future of post offices. The question is: will you bring pressure to bear on the Government in London to keep the card until after 2010? Are you aware that thousands of pensioners in Wales were promised by the Labour Government in 2003 that they will be able to continue to use the card? However, in the last two or three months, we have heard that the card will no longer be in use after 2010. One way to keep post offices open is to keep the card after 2010. Are you willing to fight to ensure that?

The First Minister: We are fighting. The issue has not been closed down by this decision. The Department for Work and Pensions is still in discussion with the Post Office with regard to what will happen after 2010. We will continue to apply pressure and fight for the use of the resources of the Post Office in order to keep as much of the network open as is possible, and to have an effective solution that is available to as many people in Wales as possible without them having to travel too far. It is more of a problem in Wales than it is in the English regions.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Nid wyf yn deall pam yr ydych wedi gwneud eich ateb mor gymhleth, Brif Weinidog, oherwydd y mae'r cwestiwn yn syml iawn. Os yw'r cerdyn yn dod i ben yn 2010, bydd y mwyafrif helaeth o is-swyddfeydd post Cymru'n cau. Y rheswm pam yr wyf yn dweud hyn yw oherwydd bod cyfran mor uchel o'u hincwm yn dod o'r cyfrif cerdyn. Pan fydd y busnes hwnnw'n mynd i'r banciau, bydd y swyddfeydd post yn cau. Maent wedi nodi'n gwbl glir, beth bynnag yw'r trefniadau newydd, oni bai fod y trefniadau hynny'n galluogi pensiynwyr a deiliaid budd-daliadau i gael eu harian yn swyddfa'r post, gallwch ddweud 'ffarwél' wrth y rhan fwyaf o'r rhwydwaith. Mae hyn yn glir. Yr hyn y mae arnaf eisiau ei glywed gennych chi, Brif Weinidog—heb y malu awyr—yw a ydych yn cefnogi ein swyddfeydd post.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi dweud yn barod—a dywedaf eto, oherwydd yr ydych yn amlwg yn ceisio ymhonni llawer y prynhawn yma—ein bod wedi ymgyrchu.

Edwina Hart wrote a few months ago to the Department of Trade and Industry and the Department for Work and Pensions on this issue. The loss of the card account from 2010 means that alternative arrangements have to be made. The issue is whether those alternative arrangements will also involve the Post Office. We understand that what is being talked about at the moment is that, at no additional cost to the customer, some 25 banks will introduce a facility to allow people to draw out their benefit money from the local post office with no loss of income for the postmaster. There are still three or four years for the details of that to be worked out, and we want to do what everyone in Wales wants to do and make sure that this contributes to the retention of the maximum percentage of today's post office and sub-post office network throughout Wales.

Christine Chapman: We know that there is an agenda to explore other services and products that post offices could offer. However, I met sub-postmasters and sub-postmistresses in the Cynon Valley a few weeks ago, and many of them were sceptical about the process of diversifying and its effect. For example, there were questions as to whether it is appropriate for post offices to be encouraged to market loans in poorer communities when it may not be in people's interests to take them out. How is the Welsh Assembly Government factoring considerations relating to deprivation into its discussions with the UK Government on post offices?

The First Minister: I am sure that it will be conscious of the fact that the Girobank, which it regrets was sold before it could be developed as a network, was a bank for the un-banked. Therefore, it was more likely to have a high proportion of deprived customers than the National Westminster Bank or Barclays Bank, or the other high street clearing banks. I am sure that it has always been conscious of that. However, it no longer has the Girobank, so it needs some form of banking facility, otherwise there is far less reason to go into the post office now that post offices have lost the main benefit payments on which it depended, in deprived areas, for 80 per cent of their income. That is the problem.

Ysgrifennodd Edwina Hart at yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ynglŷn â'r mater hwn ychydig fisoedd yn ôl. Mae colli'r cyfrif cerdyn o 2010 ymlaen yn golygu bod rhaid gwneud trefniadau eraill. Y cwestiwn yw a fydd y trefniadau eraill hynny hefyd yn cynnwys Swyddfa'r Post. Deallwn mai'r hyn sy'n cael ei drafod ar hyn o bryd yw y bydd tua 25 o fanciau, heb gost ychwanegol i'r cwsmer, yn cyflwyno cyfleuster i ganiatáu i bobl godi eu budd-daliadau o'r swyddfa bost leol heb i'r postfeistr golli incwm. Mae tair neu bedair blynedd arall eto i drafod y manylion, ac yr ydym am wneud yr hyn y mae pawb yng Nghymru am ei wneud a gwneud yn siŵr bod hyn yn cyfrannu tuag at gadw'r ganran fwyaf posibl o'r rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post ac is-swyddfeydd post a geir heddiw drwy Gymru gyfan.

Christine Chapman: Gwyddom fod agenda ar gyfer edrych ar wasanaethau a chynhyrchion eraill y gallai swyddfeydd post eu cynnig. Fodd bynnag, cyfarfûm ag is-bostfeistri yng Nghwm Cynon ychydig wythnosau'n ôl, ac yr oedd llawer ohonynt yn amheus iawn o'r broses arallgyfeirio a'i heffaith. Er enghraifft, yr oedd amheuaeth a yw'n briodol annog swyddfeydd post i hybu benthyciadau mewn cymunedau tlawd pan nad yw o fudd o bosibl i bobl gymryd benthyciad. Sut y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cynnwys ystyriaethau sy'n ymwneud ag amddifadedd yn ei thrafodaethau â Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch swyddfeydd post?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd yn ymwybodol o'r ffaith bod y Girobank, y mae'n gresynu ei fod wedi ei werthu cyn y gellid ei ddatblygu fel rhwydwaith, yn fanc ar gyfer pobl heb fanc. Felly, yr oedd yn fwy tebygol o fod â chyfran uchel o gwsmeriaid difreintiedig na Banc National Westminster neu Fanc Barclays, neu fanciau clirio eraill y stryd fawr. Yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod wedi bod yn ymwybodol o hyn erioed. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r Girobank ganddi mwyach, felly mae arni angen rhyw fath o gyfleuster bancio, neu fel arall mae llawer llai o reswm dros fynd i swyddfa'r post gan fod swyddfeydd post erbyn hyn wedi colli'r prif fudd-daliadau yr oeddent yn dibynnu arnynt, mewn ardaloedd difreintiedig, am 80 y cant o'u hincwm.

Dyna'r broblem.

2.30 p.m.

However, you have to have an ethical method of dealing with the particular problems created by serving a deprived community and trying to engage in financial dealings with a financially deprived community, while remembering that if you do not provide a bank via the post office it is possible that the alternative will be far worse in terms of loan sharks.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): The First Minister will be aware that over 300 sub-post offices have closed since Labour came to power here in 1999. With the exception of last year when, admittedly, it dipped, it has been an accelerating trend with more than one closure a week—coming up to three per fortnight. Catherine Thomas quite rightly outlined the problem, created by the Labour Government. What are you specifically doing to persuade the Westminster Government to ensure that the post office account can carry on after 2010? As has been said time and again, this is the key problem, but I have not heard what you are doing about it.

The First Minister: As I said, we are pressing the Government to adopt a policy that enables us to reopen our post office development fund, by eliminating the risk of us funding post offices that will shortly close. Since our fund is a capital investment fund to modernise premises, it would make no sense unless we had some idea of which post offices had a good chance of surviving.

Secondly comes the question of what happens to the post office card account in 2010. What are the alternatives? Will they contribute a revenue for postmasters? Although we have not yet seen the details, the current strategy is that banks will provide equivalent facilities in post offices for people to draw out benefit payments paid into their bank accounts. If they live a long way from the bank, money paid into their bank account will prove inconvenient for them. The same

Fodd bynnag, rhaid ichi gael dull egwyddorol o ddelio â'r problemau penodol sy'n cael eu creu gan wasanaethu cymuned ddifreintiedig a cheisio cynnal trafodion ariannol gyda chymuned sy'n ddifreintiedig yn ariannol, gan gofio os nad ydych yn darparu banc drwy gyfrwng swyddfa'r post ei bod yn bosibl y bydd y dewis arall yn llawer gwaeth o ran usurwyr.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Bydd y Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol bod dros 300 o is-swyydfeydd post wedi cau ers i Lafur ddod i rym yma yn 1999. Ac eithrio'r llynedd, pan gafwyd rhywfaint o ostyngiad, mae'n rhaid cyfaddef, bu tuedd gynyddol iddynt gau gyda mwy nag un yn cau bob wythnos—tair bron bob pythefnos. Amlinellodd Catherine Thomas yn hollol gywir y broblem a achoswyd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn benodol i berswadio Llywodraeth San Steffan i sicrhau y gall cyfrif swyddfa'r post barhau ar ôl 2010? Fel y dywedwyd dro ar ôl tro, hyn yw'r broblem allweddol, ond nid wyf wedi clywed beth yr ydych yn ei wneud yn ei chylch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn pwyso ar y Llywodraeth i fabwysiadu polisi a fydd yn ein galluogi i ailagor ein cronfa datblygu swyydfeydd post, drwy ddileu'r perygl y byddwn yn ariannu swyydfeydd post a fydd yn cau cyn bo hir. Gan mai cronfa buddsoddi cyfalaf i foderneiddio adeiladau yw ein cronfa, ni fyddai'n gwneud dim synnwyr heb i ni fod â rhyw syniad pa swyydfeydd post oedd â siawns dda o oroesi.

Yn ail daw'r cwestiwn beth a fydd yn digwydd i gyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yn 2010. Beth yw'r dewisiadau eraill? A fyddant hwy'n cyfrannu refeniw i bostfeistri? Er nad ydym eto wedi gweld y manylion, y strategaeth bresennol yw y bydd banciau'n darparu cyfleusterau cyfatebol mewn swyydfeydd post i bobl godi budd-daliadau a dalwyd i mewn i'w cyfrifon banc. Os ydynt yn byw ymhell o'r banc, bydd arian a delir i'w cyfrif banc yn anghyfleus iddynt. Bydd yr

amount of revenue will go to the postmistress, sub-postmaster, sub-postmistress, or the post office, as under the cardholder system. However, it will be provided under the auspices of any one out of 25 banks. That is the strategy. Provided that it maintains the income to the post office or sub-post office, it should not lead to an erosion of the viability of the post office network, which is under huge pressure.

Denise Idris Jones: According to independently compiled figures, postal delivery records were broken in all seven postcodes across Wales this year. I believe that the LL postcode, in my constituency, was top of the list. Will you join me in congratulating postal workers, who have delivered a record quality of service this year? Would you agree that maintaining access to post-office services is an important element of sustaining individual communities throughout Wales?

The First Minister: I am glad that you have mentioned the fact that we have Royal Mail as well as Post Office counters to deal with when we consider the post office. The turnaround in the Post Office's financial fortunes over the last few years has been quite extraordinary, pointing in the right direction. The Post Office, having survived a difficult financial crisis and the opening up of the delivery market to other post offices and private companies, foreign post offices and so forth, is doing extremely well at present, which is a huge tribute to improved industrial relations and a remarkable productivity effort by all the employees. They deserve our congratulations.

Michael German: From the replies that you have given to colleagues today, this almost feels like a Neroesque situation. The problem is being explained to you by colleagues around from all parties, and yet you say, 'We will wait to see what the Government will do'. The writing is on the wall, First Minister. Last year alone, 102 rural post office branches closed in England and 25 closed in Wales, which means a 2.9 per cent reduction in post offices in Wales and a 1.8 per cent reduction in England. The rate of closures in Wales was almost double the rate in England. At the same time, we have seen what you

un faint o refeniw yn mynd i'r bostfeistres, yr is-bostfeistr, yr is-bostfeistres, neu'r swyddfa bost, ag sy'n mynd dan y system deiliaid cerdyn. Fodd bynnag, fe'i darperir dan nawdd unrhyw un o 25 o fanciau. Dyna'r strategaeth. Ar yr amod ei bod yn cynnal yr incwm i'r swyddfa bost neu'r is-swyddfa bost, ni ddylai arwain at erydu ymarferoldeb rhwydwaith y swyddfeydd post, sydd dan bwysau enfawr.

Denise Idris Jones: Yn ôl ffigurau a gasglwyd yn annibynnol, torrwyd y record o ran danfon llythyrau ym mhob un o'r 7 ardal cod post ledled Cymru eleni. Credaf fod cod post LL, yn fy etholaeth i, ar frig y rhestr. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y gweithwyr post sydd wedi rhoi gwasanaeth o'r ansawdd gorau erioed eleni? A fydddech yn cytuno bod cynnal mynediad at wasanaethau swyddfa'r post yn elfen bwysig yn y gwaith o gynnal cymunedau unigol ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch ichi grybwyll y ffaith bod gennym y Post Brenhinol yn ogystal â chownteri Swyddfa'r Post i ymdrin â hwy wrth ystyried swyddfa'r post. Bu'r gweddnewidiad yn ffawd ariannol Swyddfa'r Post dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf yn rhyfeddol iawn, gan symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Mae Swyddfa'r Post, ar ôl goroesi argyfwng ariannol anodd ac agor y farchnad ddanfôn i swyddfeydd post eraill a chwmnïau preifat, swyddfeydd post tramor ac yn y blaen, yn gwneud yn dda iawn ar hyn o bryd, sy'n deyrnged anferth i gysylltiadau diwydiannol gwell ac ymdrech enfawr o ran cynhyrchedd gan bob gweithiwr. Maent yn haeddu ein llongyfarchion.

Michael German: Yn ôl yr atebion a roddwyd gennych i gyd-Aelodau heddiw, mae hyn yn teimlo bron fel sefyllfa'r Ymherodr Nero gynt. Mae cyd-Aelodau o'ch cwmpas o bob plaid yn esbonio'r broblem ichi, ac eto dyma chithau'n dweud 'Fe arhoswn i weld beth a wnaiff y Llywodraeth'. Mae'r ysgrifen ar y mur, Brif Weinidog. Y llynedd yn unig, caeodd 102 o swyddfeydd post gwledig yn Lloegr a chaeodd 25 yng Nghymru, sy'n golygu gostyngiad o 2.9 y cant mewn swyddfeydd post yng Nghymru a gostyngiad o 1.8 y cant yn Lloegr. Yr oedd y gyfradd o ran cau yng Nghymru gymaint

have called dysfunctional Government in London. Many Ministers have been talking about it in London. The future of the post-office network seems to me to be a prime example of that: on the one side you have a Government department that wants to run the benefit system cheaply and puts at risk the survival of much of the post-office network and another Government department that wants the post office to be a source of funding, turning over a profit and run like a supermarket. There is also a new Government department—John Prescott found himself with nothing else to do, so they passed it on to someone else—aimed at promoting and safeguarding opportunities in communities; that job is much harder if the post-office network is decimated.

You have told us, both today and last week, that we will wait and see. What have you done to persuade your colleagues in London and in the Labour Party that this inter-departmental rivalry is not serving the best interests of the communities of Wales, and is not serving the best interests of our post-office network?

The First Minister: Now and again, you should consider, when you let loose a stream of invective of that nature, whether you have anything constructive to offer. Are you saying that, if someone offers to carry out a public service for 1p instead of £1, you would say, ‘Always go for the pound—go for the more expensive method of doing it’, or do you believe that that is not a problem? If you believe that you should simply ignore a saving of 99 per cent in a transaction cost for a Government department, tell us. We will then know that the Liberal Democrats go for the most expensive method of delivering public services. That is just nonsense, and utterly irresponsible.

If you say that you believe that the post-office network, heavily loss-making as it is—and it is especially heavily loss-making in Wales because of the dispersed pattern of our population—should not be savagely cut back today, or tomorrow, into the minimum

ddwywaith bron â'r gyfradd yn Lloegr. Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym wedi gweld yr hyn a alwyd gennych yn Llywodraeth gamweithredol yn Llundain. Mae llawer o Weinidogion wedi bod yn siarad am y peth yn Llundain. Ymddengys i mi fod dyfodol y rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post yn enghraifft amlwg o hynny: ar y naill law mae gennych adran o'r Llywodraeth sydd am redeg y system buddaliadau'n rhad ac yn peryglu parhad llawer o rwydwaith swyddfa'r post, ac adran arall o'r Llywodraeth sydd am i swyddfa'r post fod yn ffynhonnell cyllid, gan greu elw a gweithredu fel archfarchnad. Ceir hefyd adran newydd o'r Llywodraeth—canfu John Prescott ei hun heb ddim byd arall i'w wneud, felly fe'i trosglwyddwyd i rywun arall—sydd â'r nod o hyrwyddo a diogelu cyfleoedd mewn cymunedau; bydd y swydd honno'n llawer anoddach os dinistrir rhwydwaith y swyddfeydd post.

Yr ydych wedi dweud wrthym heddiw a'r wythnos diwethaf y byddwn yn aros i gael gweld. Beth yr ydych wedi'i wneud i berswadio'ch cyd-aelodau yn Llundain ac yn y Blaid Lafur nad yw'r gystadleuaeth ryngadrannol hon er budd cymunedau Cymru, nac ychwaith er budd ein rhwydwaith o swyddfeydd post?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bob hyn a hyn, dylech ystyried, pan fyddwch yn gwneud araith ymosodol o'r fath, a oes gennych unrhyw beth adeiladol i'w gynnig. A ydych yn dweud, os bydd rhywun yn cynnig darparu gwasanaeth cyhoeddus am geiniog yn hytrach nag am bunt, y byddech yn dweud ‘Y bunt piau hi bob amser—y dull drutaf o'i wneud piau hi’, neu a ydych yn credu nad yw hynny'n broblem? Os ydych yn credu y dylech anwybyddu arbediad o 99 y cant ar gostau trafodion i adran o'r Llywodraeth, dywedwch wrthym. Byddwn wedyn yn gwybod bod y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn dewis y dull drutaf o ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Nonsens yw hynny, a chwbl anghyfrifol.

Os ydych yn credu na ddylai rhwydwaith y swyddfeydd post, sy'n gwneud colledion mawr—ac mae'n gwneud colledion arbennig o fawr yng Nghymru oherwydd patrwm gwasgaredig ein poblogaeth—gael ei docio'n llym heddiw, neu yfory, i isafswm o

number of branches, namely those that make a profit, we would agree with you; that is not the right way to do this. If you say that the Post Office must turn itself around, go back to Denise Idris Jones's question—the Post Office has turned itself around remarkably well. It is a tribute to a functional—not dysfunctional—Government that we now have a viable Post Office, as a company, even though its market has been opened up on the delivery side. However, there is this problem of what we do in Wales about the fact that we have the highest percentage of loss-making post offices because of our dispersed population. We are making a plea to the Government to manage this in such a way so that Wales can cope, including rural Wales and deprived urban communities. That is the right way forward.

Michael German: Let us address this 1p/£1 issue that you raise. We know the facts—for every £1 billion that is contributed by this card system, which is what it costs, there is a £3 billion contribution to local economies. In other words, there is a direct payback to the local economy. That is the issue in Wales. When you are losing more post offices than they are in the rest of the United Kingdom, at a rate faster than in England, Scotland and Northern Ireland, we are losing money into local economies. Therefore, the 1p/£1 argument is about how much you are losing to local economies, which you would gain from putting money into those local economies.

You say that some Government departments are taking action in certain directions, and some in other directions. What we want to hear from you today, First Minister, is what you believe is right for the communities of Wales, and what you believe is the right policy. At present, you are saying that you do not believe that retaining the post office card account is the right way of retaining the post-office network. Could you clarify that that is your view?

The First Minister: It is not my view—it is whether there are any ways forward after 2010. Just occasionally, as I said, despite

ganhennau, sef y rhai sy'n gwneud elw, byddem yn cytuno â chi; nid dyma'r ffordd iawn o wneud hyn. Os ydych yn dweud bod yn rhaid i Swyddfa'r Post weddnewid ei hun, ewch yn ôl at gwestiwn Denise Idris Jones—mae Swyddfa'r Post wedi gweddnewid ei hun yn hynod o dda. Mae'n deyrnged i Lywodraeth weithredol—nid camweithredol—fod gennym bellach Swyddfa'r Post hyfyw, fel cwmni, er bod ei marchnad wedi'i hagor o ran danfon. Fodd bynnag, mae'n broblem beth i'w wneud yng Nghymru ynghylch y ffaith bod gennym y ganran uchaf o swyddfeydd post sy'n gwneud colled, oherwydd ein poblogaeth wasgaredig. Yr ydym yn apelio ar y Llywodraeth i reoli hyn mewn ffordd a fydd yn galluogi Cymru i ymdopi, gan gynnwys y Gymru wledig a chymunedau trefol difreintiedig. Dyna'r ffordd gywir ymlaen.

Michael German: Gadewch inni roi sylw i'r cwestiwn hwn ynghylch ceiniog/punt a godwyd gennych. Yr ydym yn gwybod y ffeithiau—am bob £1 biliwn a gyfrennir gan y system cardiau hon, sef yr hyn y mae'n ei gostio, ceir cyfraniad o £3 biliwn i economïau lleol. Mewn geiriau eraill, ceir taliad yn ôl yn uniongyrchol i'r economi lleol. Dyna'r hyn sydd dan sylw yng Nghymru. Pan ydych yn colli mwy o swyddfeydd post nag y maent yng ngweddill y Deyrnas Unedig, ar gyfradd gyflymach nag yn Lloegr, yr Alban a Gogledd Iwerddon, yr ydym yn colli arian i'r economïau lleol. Felly, mae'r ddadl ceiniog/punt yn ymwneud â faint yr ydych yn ei golli i economïau lleol, y byddech yn ei ennill pe rhoddech arian yn yr economïau lleol hynny.

Dywedwch fod rhai adrannau o'r Llywodraeth yn cymryd camau mewn rhai cyfeiriadau, a rhai mewn cyfeiriadau eraill. Yr hyn yr ydym am ei glywed gennych heddiw, Brif Weinidog, yw beth, yn eich barn chi, sy'n briodol i gymunedau Cymru a beth yw'r polisi cywir. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydych yn dweud nad ydych yn credu mai cadw cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yw'r ffordd iawn o gadw'r rhwydwaith swyddfeydd post. A allwch egluro mai hynny yw eich barn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid hynny yw fy marn—fy marn i yw a oes ffyrdd ymlaen ar ôl 2010. Yn achlysurol iawn, fel y dywedais, er

invitations from me, you are singularly unwilling to indicate to us whether you have any constructive contribution to make to this debate. As I have said, after 2010, it is an open discussion at present, in which we are participating—because we want to reopen the post office development fund—as to what happens, when the post office card account is withdrawn, to people's ability to draw down benefits if they live a considerable distance from a bank. It does not mean that, somehow or other, people cannot get benefits from the bank. The function will be taken over by banks, operating in post offices, but with no loss of revenue to the Post Office. If that turns out to be true, that has no impact on the viability of those post offices, despite the implications in your question, which means that you probably do not understand what is being proposed. We must try to tighten that up; we may then be able to reopen the post office development fund.

Michael German: A survey shows that two thirds of postmasters across Wales believe that this proposal, as it is going forward, will result in the closure of post offices—we know that that is the case. You have just said that you would like to reopen the post office development fund, which, as you know, was a partnership-Government fund, which we put in place as a result of the problems that the post office was facing then. You say that we need to know for certain which post offices are closing and which will remain open, but you then tell us that we will not know until 2010, when the post office card account is withdrawn, which post offices will close. Therefore, how will you be able to judge which post offices will be open, and which ones are threatened with closure, when all the time you are saying to us that we will not know for certain until 2010?

The First Minister: I did not say that we have to know for certain. You are misquoting me to try to pretend that you have a question to put to me, when you do not have a question. All you are doing is waffling and trying to grandstand for the benefit of the odd vote here and there from the occasional postmaster. You do not have anything

gwaethaf gwahoddiadau gennyf fi, yr ydych yn anfodlon iawn i nodi a oes gennych unrhyw gyfraniad adeiladol i'w wneud i'r ddadl hon. Fel y dywedais, ar ôl 2010, mae'n drafodaeth agored ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn cymryd rhan ynddi—oherwydd ein bod am ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post—ynglŷn â beth fydd yn digwydd i allu pobl i gael eu budd-daliadau os ydynt yn byw ymhell o fanc, pan gaiff cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post ei ddileu. Nid yw'n golygu na fydd modd i bobl, rywsut neu'i gilydd, gael budd-daliadau o'r banc. Bydd y swyddogaeth yn cael ei chymryd drosodd gan fanciau, yn gweithredu mewn swyddfeydd post, ond heb i Swyddfa'r Post golli dim refeniw. Os ceir bod hynny'n wir, ni fydd yn cael dim effaith ar hyfywedd swyddfeydd post hynny, er gwaethaf yr hyn oedd ymhlyg yn eich cwestiwn, sy'n golygu nad ydych mae'n debyg yn deall beth sy'n cael ei gynnig. Rhaid inni geisio cryfhau hynny; efallai y bydd modd inni wedyn ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post.

Michael German: Dengys arolwg fod dwy ran o dair o bostfeistri ledled Cymru'n credu y bydd y cynnig hwn, fel y mae'n mynd rhagddo, yn golygu cau swyddfeydd post—gwyddom mai dyna'r sefyllfa. Yr ydych newydd ddweud y byddech yn hoffi ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, a oedd, fel y gwyddoch, yn gronfa Llywodraeth y bartneriaeth, a sefydlwyd gennym o ganlyniad i broblemau a wynebai swyddfa'r post ar y pryd. Dywedwch fod angen inni wybod i sicrwydd pa swyddfeydd post sydd i gau a pha rai a fydd yn parhau'n agored, ond dywedwch wrthym wedyn na fyddwn yn gwybod hyd 2010, pan fydd cyfrif cerdyn swyddfa'r post yn cael ei ddileu, pa swyddfeydd post a fydd yn cau. Felly, sut y bydd modd ichi farnu pa swyddfeydd post a fydd yn agored, a pha rai y bygythir eu cau, pan ydych yn dweud drwy'r amser na fyddwn yn gwybod i sicrwydd hyd 2010?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ddywedais fod yn rhaid inni wybod i sicrwydd. Yr ydych yn fy nghamddyfynnu i geisio cymryd arnoch fod gennych gwestiwn imi, pan nad oes gennych gwestiwn o gwbl. Y cwbl a wnewch yw malu awyr a cheisio ymddwyn yn orchestol er mwyn cael ambell bleidlais hwnt ac yma gan ambell bostfeistr. Nid oes gennych ddim byd

constructive to offer in this area.

adeiladol i'w gynnig yn y maes hwn.

2.40 p.m.

All I have said is that we are anxious to reopen the post office development fund, but I said that you have to have some idea about the structure of the actual network. You may want to rearrange the words because you think that that gives you a better opening, but that only shows that you do not have anything constructive to say. When you do, I will be pleased to engage in discussion with you.

Y cwbl a ddywedais yw ein bod yn awyddus i ailagor y gronfa datblygu swyddfeydd post, ond dywedais fod yn rhaid ichi gael rhyw syniad ynghylch strwythur y rhwydwaith ei hun. Efallai y byddwch am ad-drefnu'r geiriau am eich bod yn credu bod hynny'n rhoi gwell cyfle ichi, ond nid yw hynny'n gwneud dim ond dangos nad oes gennych ddim byd adeiladol i'w ddweud. Pan fydd gennych rywbeth adeiladol i'w ddweud, byddaf yn falch o gael trafodaeth â chi.

Pŵer Niwclear Nuclear Power

Q6 Mick Bates: What negotiations has the First Minister held with the UK Government regarding the future of nuclear power in Wales? OAQ1571(FM)

C6 Mick Bates: Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynglŷn â dyfodol pŵer niwclear yng Nghymru? OAQ1571(FM)

The First Minister: I have discussed with UK Government Ministers the review of options for a possible extension of the operational life of Wylfa power station. Beyond that, we have said that we see no need, in the context of the UK Government's energy review, for new nuclear generation in Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf wedi trafod gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU yr adolygiad o opsiynau ar gyfer y posibilrwydd o ymestyn bywyd gweithredol gorsaf bŵer yr Wylfa. Wedi hynny, yr ydym wedi dweud na welwn ddim angen, yng nghyd-destun adolygiad ynni Llywodraeth y DU, am gynhyrchu ynni niwclear o'r newydd yng Nghymru.

Mick Bates: This is an issue of great importance to many industries in Wales, not least to Anglesey Aluminium Metal Ltd. You mentioned that Wylfa power station comes to the end of its life in 2010. As I understand it, there is no hope that Wylfa will continue beyond that date because of fuel issues. If that is the case, your Government is sending out false hope to Anglesey Aluminium that Wylfa would be an option for it for a continuous local and cheap supply of fuel beyond 2010. Your Government is negligent in not looking at an alternative plan for Anglesey Aluminium—which is a tremendous employer and of great importance to the economy, as you are well aware—stating how the Government will proceed to provide it with a local, continuous and economic supply of electricity. When will your Government produce such a plan?

Mick Bates: Mae hwn yn fater o bwys mawr i lawer o ddiwydiannau yng Nghymru, yn arbennig Cwmni Alwminiwm Môn Cyf. Bu ichi grybwyll bod gorsaf bŵer yr Wylfa yn dod i derfyn ei hoes yn 2010. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, nid oes dim gobaith y bydd yr Wylfa'n parhau wedi'r dyddiad hwnnw oherwydd materion yn ymwneud â thanwydd. Os dyna'r gwir, mae eich Llywodraeth yn rhoi gobaith ffug i Alwminiwm Môn y byddai'r Wylfa'n opsiwn iddo ar gyfer cyflenwad parhaus o danwydd lleol a rhad wedi 2010. Mae eich Llywodraeth yn esgeulus drwy beidio ag edrych ar gynllun amgen ar gyfer Alwminiwm Môn—sy'n gyflogwr mawr iawn ac yn hynod bwysig i'r economi, fel y gwyddoch yn dda—gan ddatgan sut y bydd y Llywodraeth yn mynd ati i ddarparu cyflenwad economaidd o drydan yn barhaus ac yn lleol ar ei gyfer. Pa bryd y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn creu

cynllun o'r fath?

The First Minister: You are going down the same road as Mike German, your group leader, in trying to rearrange my words to convey what you hoped I had said. I have certainly not raised false hopes in Anglesey. We have said that getting an extension is a slim hope. The Nuclear Decommissioning Authority—which is an independent body, and not part of the Government—gave evidence to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee last week where it appeared to shut the door at least on an extension until 2012. Clearly there are big problems about the supply of fuel ingots and the Oslo Paris Commission agreement on Sellafield and the Irish Sea and so forth, but it does not completely close the door on the option that we had been discussing with the Department for Trade and Industry and the NDA in terms of a four-year extension.

However, I am holding no more than a slim hope. For you to imply that we are raising hopes and to do exactly the same thing by implying that you have some alternative plan up your sleeve, through which you are going to supply alternative power at a rate that would be attractive to Anglesey Aluminium, the biter is bit there very much, Mick if you read the record of what you said. It is a difficult area because you either have to have grid electricity, a new generating station or an extension of the licence to operate Wylfa. The only purpose of trying to get an extension to operate Wylfa is that it gives Anglesey Aluminium and electricity generators a little more elbow room to come up with an alternative generating plan in Anglesey that can do the job for Anglesey Aluminium at a reasonable price.

Alun Ffred Jones: I barhau ar yr un trywydd, yr ydych newydd ddweud mai gobaith bach sy'n bodoli a bod y newyddion a ddaeth allan yr wythnos diwethaf yn awgrymu ei bod yn annhebygol iawn y bydd oes Wylfa yn cael ei hymestyn. Pa bwysau ychwanegol yr ydych wedi bod yn ei roi ar y Llywodraeth yn Llundain i geisio sicrhau'r ymestyniad hwnnw am y rhesymau yr ydych wedi eu nodi'n barod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn dilyn yr un trywydd â Mike German, arweinydd eich grŵp, drwy geisio rhoi trefn wahanol ar fy ngeiriau er mwyn cyfleu'r hyn yr oeddech yn gobeithio fy mod wedi'i ddweud. Yn sicr nid wyf wedi codi gobeithion ffug ym Môn. Yr ydym wedi dweud mai ychydig iawn o obaith sydd i gael estyniad. Rhoddodd yr Awdurdod Dadgomisiynu Niwclear—sy'n gorff annibynnol, ac nid yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth—dystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yr wythnos diwethaf lle'r oedd yn ymddangos ei fod yn cau'r drws o leiaf ar estyniad hyd 2012. Mae'n amlwg bod problemau mawr ynghylch cyflenwi ingotiau tanwydd, a chytundeb Comisiwn Oslo Paris ar Sellafield a Môr Iwerddon ac yn y blaen, ond nid yw'n cau'r drws yn gyfan gwbl ar yr opsiwn yr oeddem wedi bod yn ei drafod gyda'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant a'r Awdurdod Dadgomisiynu Niwclear o ran estyniad am bedair blynedd.

Fodd bynnag, dim ond gobaith bach iawn sydd gennyf. Wrth i chi awgrymu ein bod yn codi gobeithion, a gwneud yr un peth yn union drwy awgrymu bod gennych ryw gynllun arall mewn golwg, fel y gallwch gyflenwi pŵer arall ar gyfradd a fyddai'n ddeniadol i Alwminiwm Môn, mae'r sawl sy'n brathu'n cael brathiad ei hun yn wir, Mick, os darllenwch y cofnod ynghylch yr hyn a ddywedasoch. Mae'n faes anodd, oherwydd un ai mae'n rhaid i chi gael trydan o'r grid, gorsaf gynhyrchu newydd neu estyniad ar y drwydded i weithredu yn yr Wylfa. Unig bwrpas ceisio cael estyniad i weithredu yn yr Wylfa yw ei fod yn rhoi ychydig mwy o amser i Alwminiwm Môn a chynhyrchwyr trydan greu cynllun cynhyrchu arall ym Môn a all ateb y diben i Alwminiwm Môn am gost resymol.

Alun Ffred Jones: To follow along the same lines, you have just said that there is only a slim hope and that the news that came out last week suggested that it is very unlikely that there will be any extension to the life of Wylfa. What additional pressure have you been putting on the Government in London to try to secure that extension for the reasons that you have already noted?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna pam yr ydym wedi bod yn parhau gyda'n trafodaethau yn dilyn tystiolaeth yr NDA i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig yr wythnos diwethaf, a roddodd yr argraff o leiaf fod y drws wedi ei gau a'i gloi. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn yr ydym yn chwilio amdano yw ychydig o amser anadlu i Alwminiwm Môn, ac unrhyw un sydd â syniad ynglŷn â sut i gynhyrchu trydan a fydd yn effeithlon o ran pris a safon i'r cwmni ar ôl 2014. Yr ydym yn chwilio am ychydig o amser anadlu er mwyn gwneud trefniadau eraill.

David Davies: Do you agree that Anglesey Aluminium will never be powered by a windfarm or by another source of alternative energy? Do you, therefore, also agree that it would be completely and utterly ludicrous for either you as a Government, or opposition parties that are serious about tackling global warming, to rule out the only proven technology that can deliver electricity in large quantities without delivering greenhouse gases?

The First Minister: You are probably right about Anglesey Aluminium not being capable of being serviced by a complex of windfarms, although the reason is not so much to do with price as consistency of supply, because of the way that smelters operate. However, on the question of Wales as a whole, there would appear to be sufficient proposals in hand to generate electricity by a diversity of sources other than nuclear, and without creating an unsuitable—in engineering terms—dependency by large companies like Anglesey Aluminium on wind. Therefore, we do not think that Wales needs more nuclear power stations.

The First Minister: That is why we have continued with our discussions following the evidence given by the NDA to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee last week, which gave the impression at least that the door had been closed and locked. However, what we are looking for is more breathing time for Anglesey Aluminium, and anyone who may have some proposal as to how to produce electricity that will be efficient in terms of price and quality for the company after 2014. We are looking for a little bit of breathing space to make alternative arrangements.

David Davies: A ydych yn cytuno na fydd Aliwminiwm Môn byth yn cael ei bŵer gan fferm wynt neu ryw ffynhonnell arall o ynni amgen? A ydych, felly, yn cytuno hefyd y byddai'n gwbl chwerthinllyd i chi fel Llywodraeth, neu wrthbleidiau sydd o ddifrif ynghylch mynd i'r afael â'r cynhesu bydeang, ddiystyru'r unig dechnoleg sydd wedi ei phrofi a all gyflenwi llawer iawn o drydan heb gynhyrchu nwyon tŷ gwydr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'n tebyg eich bod yn iawn na allai Aliwminiwm Môn gael ei wasanaethu gan glwstwr o ffermydd gwynt, er bod a wnelo'r rheswm fwy â chysondeb y cyflenwad na'r pris, oherwydd y ffordd y mae ffwrneisi'n gweithio. Fodd bynnag, o safbwynt Cymru gyfan, mae'n ymddangos bod digon o gynigion ar y gweill i gynhyrchu trydan drwy amryw o ffynonellau ar wahân i niwclear, a heb greu dibyniaeth anaddas—mewn termau peirianyddol—ar wynt i gwmnïau mawr fel Aliwminiwm Môn. Felly, ni chredwn fod angen rhagor o atomfeydd ar Gymru.

Cynnyrch Gwastraff Waste Products

Q7 William Graham: Will the First Minister outline the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to promote the disposal of waste products in Wales by incineration? OAQ1572(FM)

The First Minister: We do not support the incineration of waste unless it is combined with energy recovery.

C7 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i hyrwyddo'r broses o waredu cynnyrch gwastraff yng Nghymru drwy ei losgi? OAQ1572(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid ydym yn cefnogi llosgi gwastraff oni bai fod hynny'n cael ei gyfuno ag adfer ynni.

William Graham: I remind you of a document called 'Wise about Waste', in which you, as First Minister, stressed the need for full local consultation on future proposals for waste disposal. Can you explain why there has been no local consultation with regard to proposals for a waste disposal site on the former St Ives site in Caerphilly or the Shanks-Rechem site in Torfaen?

The First Minister: I think that you mean St Ives, not St Ivel; it is the printing company, not the dairy company. However, perhaps I misheard you, William, because my hearing is not as good as it used to be. The important thing is that the obligation to consult would fall on the local authority that is making the proposal. I am aware of the deep unhappiness in the business and residential communities about that proposal from Caerphilly County Borough Council. If it came down to it, I do not know how it would demonstrate that it had consulted; I have certainly seen a consultation leaflet on the new recycling facility and, in fact, I have a copy here, but I am not sure if it would pass muster for the reason that you give. I am not aware of a controversy, although there may well be one as regards the proposal in Torfaen.

Jeff Cuthbert: Understandably, local residents in Ystrad Mynach, Llanbradach and Maesycwmer in my constituency have concerns about ideas that have been put forward that a waste incineration plant might, at some future point, be installed at the St Ives site—you are right about the name. I would share those concerns, but I know of no such plans at this point. Will you undertake to contact Caerphilly County Borough Council to see whether there are any plans, or not, as the case may be?

The First Minister: I can confirm that, as far as we are aware, there is no proposal to site an incinerator at the St Ives plant. Incineration would take place a long way away from the plant, and, I understand, outside Wales. What would take place there would be the preparation of refuse-derived fuel, which would then be incinerated well off site and well away from the Maesycwmer

William Graham: Fe'ch atgoffaf o ddogfen o'r enw 'Yn Gall gyda Gwastraff', lle'r ydych chi, fel y Prif Weinidog, yn pwysleisio'r angen am ymgynghori llawn yn lleol ynghylch cynigion gwaredu gwastraff ar gyfer y dyfodol. A allwch esbonio pam na fu ymgynghori'n lleol ynghylch y cynigion i sefydlu safle gwaredu gwastraff ar hen safle St Ives yng Nghaerffili neu ar safle Shanks-Rechem yn Nhor-faen?

Y Prif Weinidog: Credaf mai St Ives, nid St Ivel, sydd gennych dan sylw; y cwmni argraffu, nid y cwmni cynnyrch llaeth. Fodd bynnag, efallai imi eich camglywed, William, oherwydd nid yw fy nghlyw cystal ag yr arferai fod. Y peth pwysig yw mai'r awdurdod lleol sy'n gwneud y cynnig fyddai'n gorfod ymgynghori. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r anfodlonrwydd mawr yn y cymunedau busnes a phreswyl ynghylch y cynnig hwnnw gan Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili. Ni wn sut y byddai'n dangos ei fod wedi ymgynghori, pe bai gofyn iddo wneud hynny; yr wyf yn sicr wedi gweld taflen ymgynghori am y cyfleuster ailgylchu newydd ac, yn wir, mae gennyf gopi yma, ond nid wyf yn siŵr a fyddai'n ddigon da am y rheswm a roddwch chi. Nid wyf yn ymwybodol bod hyn yn fater dadleuol, er y gallai fod o ran y cynnig yn Nhor-faen.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n hollol ddealladwy bod gan drigolion lleol yn Ystrad Mynach, Llanbradach a Maesycwmer yn fy etholaeth bryderon ynghylch syniadau sydd wedi cael eu cyflwyno y gallai gwaith llosgi gwastraff, ryw dro yn y dyfodol, gael ei godi ar safle St Ives—yr ydych yn iawn ynghylch yr enw. Byddwn yn rhannu'r pryderon hynny, ond ni wn am gynlluniau o'r fath ar hyn o bryd. A wnewch ymrwymo i gysylltu â Chyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili i weld a oes unrhyw gynlluniau ai peidio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf gadarnhau, hyd y gwyddom, nad oes cynnig i leoli llosgydd ar safle St Ives. Byddai'r llosgi'n digwydd ymhell o'r safle ac, yn ôl a ddeallaf, y tu allan i Gymru. Yr hyn a fyddai'n digwydd yno fyddai paratoi tanwydd sy'n deillio o wastraff, a fyddai wedyn yn cael ei losgi ymhell o'r safle ac ymhell o ardal Maesycwmer.

area.

Jocelyn Davies: I certainly would not want to live near an incinerator, and I doubt that you would either, First Minister. However, the residents of Llanbradach certainly have the impression that an incinerator is planned for this site. Therefore, would you say that the consultation that you mentioned earlier must have been seriously flawed if it gave the wrong impression to the residents?

The First Minister: You have given the wrong impression by saying that this is in Llanbradach, because I understand that it is in Ystrad Mynach. However, it is clear from the proposals that the incinerator is not on this site. What will take place there is a recovery of some recyclable materials, but there will be no incinerator there. The incineration of the refuse-derived fuel that comes through the recycling facility would take place outside Wales.

Jocelyn Davies: Ni fyddwn i yn sicr am fyw'n agos at losgydd, ac mae'n amheus gennyf a fydddech chithau ychwaith, Brif Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, mae trigolion Llanbradach yn sicr wedi cael yr argraff bod llosgydd yn cael ei gynllunio ar gyfer y safle hwn. Felly, a fydddech yn dweud bod yn rhaid bod yr ymgynghoriad y cyfeiriasoch ato'n gynharach yn ddifrifol o ddiffygiol os rhoddodd yr argraff anghywir i'r trigolion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi rhoi'r argraff anghywir drwy ddweud bod hyn yn Llanbradach, oherwydd deallaf mai yn Ystrad Mynach y mae. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg yn ôl y cynigion nad yw'r llosgydd ar y safle hwn. Yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd fydd adfer rhai defnyddiau ailgylchadwy, ond ni fydd llosgydd yno. Byddai'r tanwydd sy'n deillio o sbwriel a ddaw o'r cyfleuster ailgylchu yn cael ei losgi y tu allan i Gymru.

Cludiant Ysgol School Transport

Q8 Janet Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on the implementation of Welsh Assembly Government policies for school transport? OAQ1587(FM)

The First Minister: Local education authorities are responsible for providing free home-to-school transport for children of compulsory school age who live beyond the statutory walking distances of two miles for children under eight and three miles for those aged over eight. Funding of, or arrangements for, post-16 transport provision are matters for individual authorities to consider in the light of their local priorities.

2.50 p.m.

Janet Davies: You will be aware of the tragic death of Jasmine Allen, who was killed on her way to school, in a minibus driven by an uninsured and unlicensed driver. Schoolchildren should not be put in a position where their safety is put at risk in transport that has been provided by the local education authority. Will you lobby the appropriate UK Government Ministers to

C8 Janet Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am weithredu polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer cludiant ysgol? OAQ1587(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr awdurdodau addysg lleol sy'n gyfrifol am ddarparu cludiant rhwng y cartref a'r ysgol i blant o oedran ysgol gorfodol sy'n byw y tu hwnt i'r pellteroedd cerdded statudol o ddwy filltir i blant dan wyth a thair milltir i'r rhai dros wyth. Materion i'r awdurdodau unigol i'w hystyried, yn unol â'r blaenoriaethau lleol, yw'r cyllid, neu'r trefniadau, i ddarparu cludiant ôl-16.

Janet Davies: Byddwch yn gwybod am farwolaeth drasig Jasmine Allen, a gafodd ei lladd ar ei ffordd i'r ysgol, mewn bws mini a oedd yn cael ei yrru gan yrrwr heb yswiriant na thrwydded. Ni ddylai plant ysgol gael eu rhoi mewn sefyllfa lle y mae eu diogelwch yn cael ei beryglu mewn cludiant a ddarperir gan yr awdurdod addysg lleol. A wnewch lobio'r Gweinidogion priodol yn Llywodraeth y DU

create a separate and more serious offence of driving school transport unlicensed and uninsured for journeys to and from school and on school trips?

The First Minister: I am grateful for the opportunity, as I am sure are all parties in the Assembly, to express our sympathies with Jasmine's family following her tragic death and to express our horror at the fact that it emerged during that trial, which concluded recently, that the driver had been both unlicensed and uninsured. I do not think that any of us found it possible to imagine that school transport could be provided by drivers who were both unlicensed and uninsured. Normally, you would say, 'Yes, this is a loophole that needs to be closed', however, even under the current system, it should not have been possible in normal circumstances for anyone to hire someone who was unlicensed and uninsured to drive a school bus. It is just not credible, and it was totally mind-boggling when that fact emerged during the trial. This is one of the issues that I believe should emerge from the Education and Inspections Bill; it should transfer powers to us, providing that it receives Royal Assent, to legislate in the area of school transport.

Glyn Davies: I would like to ask a question on a different aspect of school transport issues. Whenever a small school is closed, it has a negative effect on school transport. Indeed, in relation to carbon emissions, records tell us that your Government's record is the poorest in the United Kingdom. When you are discussing policy about the future structure of education in Wales, does your Minister, and do you, take due account of the impact that that will have on school transport and on your responsibilities for climate change?

The First Minister: I do not think that it is stated quite in those terms, but it is certainly implicit in the policy. I do not think that it involves the local authority having to make an estimate of what additional tonnage of carbon dioxide—if it would reach a tonnage—that would be involved in the additional school transport and private transport to take kids to more distant schools if school X is closed. There is a general duty

i greu trosedd ar wahân, a mwy difrifol, o yrru cerbyd i gludo plant i'r ysgol yn ddirwydded a heb yswiriant ar siwrneiau i'r ysgol ac oddi yno ac ar dripiâu ysgol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle, fel pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yr wyf yn siŵr, i fynegi ein cydymdeimlad â theulu Jasmine wedi ei marwolaeth drasig ac i fynegi ein harswyd ynglŷn â'r ffaith a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn ystod y treial, a ddaeth i ben yn ddiweddar, fod y gyrrwr yn ddirwydded a heb yswiriant. Ni credaf fod neb ohonom wedi gallu dychmygu y byddai'n bosibl i gludiant i'r ysgol gael ei ddarparu gan yrwyr a oedd yn ddirwydded a heb yswiriant. Yn naturiol, byddwch yn dweud, 'Ydyw, mae hwn yn fwllch y mae angen ei gau', fodd bynnag, hyd yn oed o dan y system gyfredol, ni ddylai fod wedi bod yn bosibl o dan amgylchiadau arferol i neb gyflogi rhywun a oedd yn ddirwydded a heb yswiriant i yrru bws ysgol. Mae'n anodd credu hynny, ac yr oeddem yn gwbl syfrdan pan ddaeth y ffaith honno i'r amlwg yn ystod y treial. Dyma un o'r materion yn fy marn i a ddylai ddeillio o'r Mesur Addysg ac Arolygiadau; dylai drosglwyddo'r pwerau i ni, cyhyd â'i fod yn cael Cydsyniad Brenhinol, i ddeddfu ym maes cludiant i ysgolion.

Glyn Davies: Hoffwn ofyn cwestiwn am agwedd wahanol yn ymwneud â chludiant i'r ysgol. Pa bryd bynnag y caiff ysgol fach ei chau, mae'n cael effaith negyddol ar gludiant i'r ysgol. Yn wir, o safbwynt gollyngiadau carbon, yn ôl y cofnodion, record eich Llywodraeth chi yw'r un waethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Pan fyddwch yn trafod polisi ynghylch strwythur addysg yng Nghymru i'r dyfodol, a yw eich Gweinidog, ac a ydych chi, yn ystyried yr effaith a gaiff hynny ar gludiant i ysgolion ac ar eich cyfrifoldeb o ran y newid yn yr hinsawdd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf ei fod yn cael ei ddatgan yn y termau hynny yn union, ond yn sicr mae ymhlyg yn y polisi. Ni chredaf ei fod yn golygu bod yr awdurdod lleol yn gorfod amcangyfrif faint o dunelli ychwanegol o garbon deuocsid—pe bai'n gymaint â thunelli—a fyddai'n cael ei gynhyrchu oherwydd y cludiant ychwanegol i ysgolion a'r cludiant preifat i gludo plant i ysgolion sydd ymhellach pe câi ysgol X ei

on local authorities to consider what the reasonable journey time is for the age of the children in question. If the nearest school to the one proposed for closure is 10 miles or more away, that is a factor; however, if it is only 0.5 miles away, it is not a factor. A large number of proposals that local authorities consider will fall in that range between 0.5 miles and 10 miles as regards additional school transport. However, this will apply more in terms of the stress that it will cause to the children, rather than its effect on carbon dioxide emissions, but it comes to the same thing.

chau. Mae dyletswydd gyffredinol ar awdurdodau lleol i ystyried beth sy'n amser teithio rhesymol i blant o'r oedran dan sylw. Os yw'r ysgol agosaf at yr un y cynigir ei chau 10 milltir neu fwy oddi wrthi, mae hynny'n ffactor; fodd bynnag, os nad yw ond 0.5 milltir oddi wrthi, nid yw'n ffactor. Bydd llawer iawn o gynigion y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn eu hystyried yn perthyn i'r ystod honno rhwng 0.5 milltir a 10 milltir o ran cludiant ychwanegol i'r ysgol. Fodd bynnag, bydd hyn yn fwy perthnasol o ran y straen y bydd yn ei achosi i'r plant, yn hytrach na'r effaith ar ollyngiadau carbon deuocsid, ond yr un ydyw yn ei hanfod.

Ad-drefnu Gwasanaethau Iechyd The Reconfiguration of Health Services

C10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa drafodaethau diweddar a fu rhwng Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a byrddau iechyd lleol ynghylch cynigion ar gyfer ad-drefnu gwasanaethau iechyd? OAQ1561(FM)

Q10 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What recent discussions has the Welsh Assembly Government had with local health boards regarding proposals for the reconfiguration of health services? OAQ1561(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Brian Gibbons sydd yn gyfrifol am iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru ac ni fyddai'n briodol iddo ef wneud sylwadau am y cynigion ar gyfer ad-drefnu ar hyn o bryd, gan ei bod yn bosibl y gofynnir iddo ddyfarnu ar rai o'r materion hyn yn y man. Felly, y byrddau iechyd a'r ymddiriedolaethau iechyd, ac nid ni, sy'n creu'r cynlluniau hyn. Wrth gwrs, efallai y dânt ger ein bron ni, fel Llywodraeth, a gerbron Brian, fel y Gweinidog, cyn hir.

The First Minister: Brian Gibbons is responsible for health and social services in Wales and it would not be appropriate for him to comment on the reorganisation plans at the moment, as it is possible that he will be called on to adjudicate on some of these matters soon. Therefore, it is the health boards and the health trusts, and not us, who draw up these plans. Of course, they may be brought before us, as a Government, and before Brian, as the Minister, soon.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gan mai Brian Gibbons sy'n dyfarnu, nid yw hynny yn eich atal chi rhag mynegi barn, er eich bod, gan amlaf, yn ceisio osgoi mynegi barn ar y rhan fwyaf o bynciau. Wrth sôn am wasanaethau iechyd, yr ydych yn hoff o'n hatgoffa bod 90 y cant o gleifion yn derbyn gwasanaethau iechyd yn y sector sylfaenol. Onid ydych felly yn meddwl y byddai'n fwy buddiol pe baech wedi edrych ar drawsnewid y sector sylfaenol yn gyntaf, cyn mynd ati i ad-drefnu'r gwasanaethau yn yr ysbytai? Heb i ni wybod beth fyddwch yn ei fuddsoddi mewn gofal yn y gymuned, drwy feddygon teulu a gwasanaethau wedi eu harwain gan nyrsys, sut fyddwn yn gwybod beth fydd effaith hynny o ran yr ad-drefnu yn yr

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: As it is Brian Gibbons who is to adjudge, that does not prevent you from expressing an opinion, although you mostly try to avoid expressing an opinion on the majority of subjects. When you talk about health services, you are keen to remind us that 90 per cent of patients access health services in the primary sector. Do you not therefore think that it would have been more beneficial if you had looked at transforming the primary sector first, before reconfiguring hospital services? Unless we know what you are going to invest in community care, through general practitioners and nurse-led services, how will we know what its effect will be in terms of the reconfiguration of hospital services?

ysbytai?

Y Prif Weinidog: Sylwais ar eich ymosodiad personol ar y dechrau, Rhodri Glyn, ond dim ond dangos gwacter eich cyfraniadau o ran polisi a wnaeth hynny, mae arnaf ofn. Mae Brian a minnau yn gorfod rhannu'r swyddogaeth o ymateb yn yr ystyr lled-farnwrol i unrhyw gais sy'n dod gerbron ynglŷn â chau ysbytai. Felly, yr ydych yn anghywir ac yn bersonol yn ddieisiau.

O ran y cydbwysedd rhwng yr ochr sylfaenol ac ochr yr ysbytai, mae'n fater o beth sydd tu ôl i'r gwendid yn y model yr ydym wedi byw gydag ef—model *Holby City*, neu 'Llanholby City' gan ein bod yn siarad am Gymru—sef yr ysbyty lleol cyffredinol, gan fod mwy o waith traddodiadol yr ysbytai hynny yn symud i'r sector sylfaenol, sef y meddyg teulu a'r nyrs gymunedol, ac yn mynd i'r ysbytai mawr mewn trefi mawr ac ati. Felly, os ydych yn colli 10 y cant ar un ochr, a 10 y cant o'r ochr arall, mae'n golygu eich bod yn gorfod ailystyried gwerth y fath ysbyty ar sail model *Holby City*.

Leighton Andrews: Do you agree that what is important in the current discussion on reconfiguration is that the fullest possible consultation takes place and that local people, health service unions and others are all involved and take the opportunity to ensure that their representations are heard?

The First Minister: Equality of consultation is what it is all about, because any change is difficult to manage not only because it involves the technicalities of getting the decision right technically, but because you have to carry the potential patients and their families, and possible visitors and friends with them, when they are considering whether this is the health service pattern that they want. I think that we all accept the principle that we would like to be treated as closely to home as possible. Everyone, right across the Assembly, signed up to the Wanless conclusion that the present pattern is not sustainable. However, when individual change comes along, it can be unpopular, and then, when it is explained, sometimes, it becomes popular simply because of the

The First Minister: I noticed your personal attack at the start, Rhodri Glyn, but that served only to highlight the emptiness of your contributions in terms of policy, I am afraid. Brian and I have to share the duty of responding in the quasi-judicial sense to any application brought forward with regard to the closure of hospitals. You are therefore wrong and unnecessarily personal.

With regard to the balance between the primary side and the hospital side, it is a matter of what lies behind the weakness in the model that we have lived with—the *Holby City* model, or 'Llanholby City', since we are talking about Wales—that is, the district general hospital, given that more of the traditional work of such hospitals is moving to the primary sector, which means the general practitioner and the community nurse, and to the larger urban hospitals and so on. Therefore, if you lose 10 per cent from one side, and 10 per cent from the other, it means that you have to re-evaluate the *Holby City*-style hospital model.

Leighton Andrews: A ydych yn cytuno mai'r hyn sy'n bwysig yn y drafodaeth ar hyn o bryd ynghylch ad-drefnu yw bod yr ymgynghori llawnaf posibl yn digwydd a bod pobl leol, undebau'r gwasanaeth iechyd ac eraill i gyd yn cael eu cynnwys a'u bod yn achub ar y cyfle i sicrhau bod eu sylwadau yn cael eu clwyed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cydraddoldeb o ran ymgynghori yw hanfod hyn, oherwydd y mae'n anodd rheoli unrhyw newid nid yn unig am ei fod yn cynnwys yr elfennau technegol o wneud y penderfyniad iawn yn dechnegol, ond am fod yn rhaid ichi gael cydsyniad y cleifion posibl a'u teuluoedd, a'u hymwelwyr a'u ffrindiau posibl gyda hwy, wrth iddynt ystyried ai dyma'r patrwm y maent am ei gael o ran y gwasanaeth iechyd. Credaf ein bod i gyd yn derbyn yr egwyddor yr hoffem gael ein trin cyn agosed at ein cartref ag sydd bosibl. Derbyniodd pawb, ar draws y Cynulliad cyfan, gasgliad Wanless nad yw'r patrwm presennol yn gynaliadwy. Fodd bynnag, pan ddaw newid unigol gerbron, gall fod yn amhoblogaidd, ac yna, ar ôl iddo gael ei esbonio, weithiau, mae'n dod

quality of the explanation that means that people are carried with you. We must ask how much we need to spend to modernise district general hospitals, how much on community hospitals such as the new one in the Rhondda, how much on primary care services, and how much on the super-special or critical care centres.

Nick Bourne: Can the First Minister assure me that there are no plans to downgrade Withybush hospital?

The First Minister: I have not seen any plans, because I have not seen what the reconfiguration group, led by the chair of Pembrokeshire Local Health Board, will propose. We are aware of options that have been brought forward, but as to what will emerge when it finally comes before the Minister and the department to be discussed by us, it is too early to say.

Nick Bourne: Is the First Minister aware of, and would he like to comment on, a question asked in another place by Stephen Crabb to Nick Ainger, who replied that he had had discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services in November 2005, and that he could confirm that there were no plans whatsoever to downgrade Withybush hospital?

The First Minister: I do not know what the review group will come up with. We do know, however, that you and other opposition parties have signed up to Wanless, which says, 'We know that we cannot go on with the present pattern'. That pattern is not viable for the middle of the twenty-first century because it was developed in the middle of the twentieth century, and that was based on district general hospitals such as Withybush, Glangwili and so on. Then, as I explained earlier, the issue is that of the pressure arising from everyone's desire to be treated as close to home as possible. The technology now permits that far more than it did 30 to 40 years ago. Likewise, we need super-special hospitals to deal with the issues of great complexity, and we hope that we will need such treatment rarely in our lives, but nevertheless, when we need it, we really do need it.

yn boblogaidd am fod ansawdd yr esboniad yn golygu bod pobl yn rhoi cefnogaeth ichi. Rhaid inni ofyn faint y mae angen ei wario i foderneiddio'r ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth, faint ar ysbytai cymuned fel yr un newydd yn y Rhondda, faint ar wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, a faint ar y canolfannau uwch-arbenigol neu ofal critigol.

Nick Bourne: A all y Prif Weinidog fy sicrhau nad oes cynlluniau i israddio ysbyty Llwynhelyg?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf wedi gweld dim cynlluniau, oherwydd nid wyf wedi gweld yr hyn y bydd y grŵp ailgyflunio, dan arweiniad cadeirydd Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Sir Benfro, yn ei gynnig. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r opsiynau a gyflwynwyd, ond o ran yr hyn a gynigir pan fydd yn dod gerbron y Gweinidog a'r adran yn y pen draw i gael ei drafod gennym, mae'n rhy gynnar i ddweud.

Nick Bourne: A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn ymwybodol o gwestiwn a ofynnwyd mewn man arall gan Stephen Crabb i Nick Ainger, a atebodd ei fod wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ym mis Tachwedd 2005, ac y gallai gadarnhau nad oedd dim cynlluniau o gwbl i israddio ysbyty Llwynhelyg, ac a hoffai gynnig sylwadau ar y cwestiwn hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn beth fydd cynigion y grŵp adolygu. Yr ydym yn gwybod, fodd bynnag, eich bod chi a'r gwrthbleidiau eraill wedi cefnogi Wanless, sy'n dweud, 'Gwyddom na allwn barhau â'r patrwm presennol'. Nid yw'r patrwm hwnnw yn ddichonadwy ar gyfer canol yr unfed ganrif ar hugain oherwydd cafodd ei ddatblygu yng nghanol yr ugeinfed ganrif, ac yr oedd wedi'i seilio ar ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth fel Llwynhelyg, Glangwili ac yn y blaen. Felly, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, y cwestiwn o bwys yw'r pwysau sy'n deillio o ddymuniad pawb i gael ei drin cyn agosed â phosibl at ei gartref. Mae'r dechnoleg yn caniatáu hynny i raddau llawer mwy yn awr nag yr oedd yn gwneud 30 i 40 o flynyddoedd yn ôl. Yn yr un modd, mae angen ysbytai uwch-arbenigol arnom i ddelio â materion eithriadol o gymhleth, a gobeithiwn mai anaml yn ystod ein bywyd y bydd angen triniaeth felly

arnom, ond serch hynny, pan fydd ei hangen arnom, mae arnom ei hangen yn wirioneddol.

To adapt to a change of pattern and simultaneously pretend that you can give guarantees that nothing ever changes does not make sense.

Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr ymaddasu i newid yn y patrwm ac esgus ar yr un pryd y gallwch roi sicrwydd na fydd dim byth yn newid.

Nick Bourne: I am putting to you something that was apparently said by your Minister, which is that there are no plans to downgrade Witherby hospital. Can you confirm that that is the case?

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ailadrodd wrthyh rywbeth a gafodd ei ddweud, fe ymddengys, gan eich Gweinidog, sef nad oes cynlluniau i israddio ysbyty Llwynhelyg. A allwch gadarnhau bod hynny'n wir?

The First Minister: I am not aware of what Nick Ainger said in answer to Stephen Crabb. I do not know whether you are referring to private consultations or to what was in Hansard in the form of questions and answers in the House of Commons. All that I can say is that the Pembrokeshire LHB chair is leading the exercise, which has drawn enormous crowds because of fears about 'downgrading' and so on. However, I know of no possibility for giving any details, because they are still at the stage of discussing options, and we have seen nothing from that.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn a ddywedodd Nick Ainger mewn ateb i Stephen Crabb. Ni wn a ydych yn cyfeirio at ymgynghoriadau preifat neu at yr hyn a oedd yn Hansard ar ffurf cwestiynau ac atebion yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin. Y cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud yw bod cadeirydd BILl Sir Benfro yn arwain yr ymarferiad, sydd wedi denu tyrfaeoddd enfawr oherwydd bod pryderu ynghylch 'israddio' ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, ni wn am ddim posibilrwydd i roi manylion, am eu bod yn dal i fod wrthi'n trafod yr opsiynau, ac nid ydym wedi gweld dim o'r drafodaeth honno.

3.00 p.m.

Catherine Thomas: I attended a very productive public meeting last night to discuss the acute services review and its impact on the Llanelli constituency. Picking up on Leighton Andrews's comments in relation to the importance of consultation, it became clear at last night's meeting that the public wanted to have another meeting, but there was some reluctance from those who organised the meeting. Do you agree that, if people want a meeting, they should have an opportunity to have it and to be as well informed as possible?

Catherine Thomas: Bûm mewn cyfarfod cyhoeddus buddiol dros ben neithiwr i drafod yr adolygiad o'r gwasanaethau aciwt a'i effaith ar etholaeth Llanelli. Gan ddilyn sylwadau Leighton Andrews ynglŷn â phwysigrwydd ymgynghori, daeth yn amlwg yn y cyfarfod neithiwr fod y cyhoedd am gael cyfarfod arall, ond yr oedd y rhai a oedd yn trefnu'r cyfarfod yn dangos peth amharodrwydd. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai pobl sydd am gael cyfarfod gael un ac y dylent gael cymaint o wybodaeth ag sy'n bosibl?

The First Minister: That follows clearly from what I said earlier, in that the big job when you have reorganisation or the reconfiguration of services is to carry the public with you. Usually, it means quite a long drawn-out process, and carrying the public with you is as important as getting the details right, in order to get them to understand how you are responding to the different technology, case mix and strategies

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n dilyn yn glir yr hyn a ddywedais yn gynharach. Y gwaith mwyaf wrth ad-drefnu neu ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yw sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn eich cefnogi. Fel arfer, mae'n golygu proses hir a llafurus ac mae cael cydsyniad y cyhoedd yr un mor bwysig â sicrhau bod y manylion yn gywir, er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn deall sut yr ydych yn ymateb i'r dechnoleg, y cymysgedd achosion a'r

for dealing with the different kinds of medical problems. If you say to people, as I do, that no change is not an option, people want to know what kind of change you are talking about and why. Therefore, you must explain the reasons in detail and at length, sometimes over more than one meeting.

strategaethau gwahanol ar gyfer delio â gwahanol fathau o broblemau meddygol. Os dywedwch wrth bobl, fel yr wyf fi'n gwneud, nad yw peidio â newid dim yn opsiwn, bydd pobl am wybod pa fath o newid yr ydych yn sôn amdano a pham. Felly, mae'n rhaid ichi esbonio'r rhesymau'n fanwl ac yn helaeth, weithiau mewn mwy nag un cyfarfod.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Gwasanaethau Deintyddol yng Ngogledd Cymru Dental Services in North Wales

Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ariannu gwasanaethau deintyddol yng ngogledd Cymru? EAQ0872(HSS)

Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the funding of dental services in north Wales? EAQ0872(HSS)

The Presiding Officer: Order. I heard Huw Lewis say that this was not an urgent question. That is out of order. Please withdraw your remarks.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Clywais Huw Lewis yn dweud nad yw hyn yn gwestiwn brys. Nid yw hynny'n dderbyniol. A fydddechystal â thynnu eich sylwadau'n ôl?

Huw Lewis: It was not on the record. I have nothing to withdraw. I have made no comment on the record.

Huw Lewis: Nid chafodd ei gofnodi. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w dynnu'n ôl. Nid wyf wedi gwneud yr un sylw sydd wedi'i gofnodi.

The Presiding Officer: I heard you make a comment quite audibly. This is a Chamber with good acoustics. If you made the statement, which I heard, namely that it is not an urgent question, I ask you to withdraw it or to withdraw yourself.

Y Llywydd: Fe'ch clywais yn eithaf clir yn gwneud sylw. Mae'r acwsteg yn dda yn y Siambr hon. Os gwnaethoch y sylw, ac fe'ch clywais yn gwneud hynny, sef nad yw'r cwestiwn yn un brys, gofynnaf ichi ei dynnu'n ôl neu adael yr ystafell.

Huw Lewis: I have made no comment on the record. I have nothing to withdraw. I have made no point of order.

Huw Lewis: Nid wyf wedi gwneud yr un sylw a gofnodwyd. Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w dynnu'n ôl. Nid wyf wedi gwneud pwynt o drefn.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I ask you to withdraw a comment that I heard distinctly.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf ichi dynnu'n ôl sylw a glywais yn glir.

Huw Lewis: I have nothing to withdraw from the record.

Huw Lewis: Nid oes gennyf ddim i'w dynnu'n ôl o'r cofnod.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I ask you to withdraw a comment that was audible and therefore would have been heard on the record.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Gofynnaf ichi dynnu'n ôl sylw a oedd yn glywadwy ac a fyddai felly wedi cael ei glywed ar y cofnod.

Huw Lewis: I think that we have both heard each other.

Huw Lewis: Credaf ein bod ni'n dau wedi clywed ein gilydd.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I have asked you to withdraw that comment. You know the rules of order here. If you choose to impugn the integrity of the Chair in the decision of urgent questions, two of which I made this morning, such a statement must be withdrawn; otherwise, this place can never be orderly. Do you now withdraw that statement?

Huw Lewis: I will withdraw it, Chair.

The Presiding Officer: I am grateful.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): There has been no recent allocation to North West Wales NHS Trust or local health boards in relation to the dental contract. A sum of £17.5 million was made available to implement the new dental contract, and it is entirely a matter for local health boards to decide how to use this money.

Alun Ffred Jones: As you know from the comments in the *Daily Post* and other parts of the press, a number of health boards in north Wales are in serious trouble because of a mix-up in the contracts for the new dental services, which the Government proposed. It seems to be another fine mess that you have got yourself into, Minister. Your answer will be cold comfort to, for example, the mother who e-mailed me this morning to say that she cannot find an NHS or private dentist anywhere in the county of Gwynedd. However, my specific question is in reference to the new dental services proposed in north Wales in four different LHB areas. They state that, because of a mix-up in the contracts, they will be out of pocket to the tune of some £2 million or £3 million. Will you give a guarantee that the Welsh Assembly Government will fully fund these new dental services in full to ensure that the local health boards do not have to bear the costs and put other services at risk?

Brian Gibbons: Alun Ffred's comments are untrue. The rules for allocation under the new personal dental services schemes were made explicitly clear to all local health boards.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf wedi gofyn ichi dynnu'r sylw hwnnw'n ôl. Yr ydych yn gwybod beth yw'r rheolau yma. Os dewiswch amau didwylledd y Cadeirydd pan fydd yn penderfynu ynghylch cwestiynau brys, ac yr wyf wedi gwneud dau benderfyniad o'r fath y bore yma, mae'n rhaid tynnu sylw o'r fath yn ôl. Fel arall, ni fydd trefn yn y lle hwn fyth. A ydych yn tynnu'r sylw hwnnw'n ôl yn awr?

Huw Lewis: Tynnaf y sylw'n ôl, Gadeirydd.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid oes arian wedi'i ddyrannu'n ddiweddar i Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru nac i'r byrddau iechyd lleol o ran y contract deintyddol. Yr oedd swm o £17.5 miliwn ar gael i roi contract deintyddol newydd ar waith, a'r byrddau iechyd lleol biau penderfynu sut i ddefnyddio'r arian hwn.

Alun Ffred Jones: Fel y gwyddoch oddi wrth y sylwadau yn y *Daily Post* a rhannau eraill o'r wasg, mae nifer o fyrddau iechyd yn y gogledd mewn trafferthion difrifol oherwydd y dryswch gyda'r contractau ar gyfer y gwasanaethau deintyddol newydd a gynigiodd y Llywodraeth. Ymddengys eich bod wedi'ch cael eich hun mewn picil unwaith eto, Weinidog. Ni fydd eich ateb yn fawr o gysur i'r fam, er enghraifft, a anfonodd e-bost ataf y bore yma i ddweud na all ddod o hyd i ddeintydd y GIG na deintydd preifat yn unlle yn sir Gwynedd. Fodd bynnag, mae fy nghwestiwn yn cyfeirio'n benodol at y gwasanaethau deintyddol newydd arfaethedig yn y gogledd mewn pedair ardal BILl wahanol. Oherwydd y dryswch gyda'r contractau, maent yn dweud y byddant yn brin o ryw £2 filiwn neu £3 miliwn. A wnewch roi sicrwydd y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ariannu'r gwasanaethau deintyddol newydd hyn yn llawn er mwyn sicrhau na fydd yn rhaid i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ysgwyddo'r costau a rhoi gwasanaethau eraill mewn perygl?

Brian Gibbons: Nid yw sylwadau Alun Ffred yn wir. Fe'i gwnaed yn hollol glir i bob bwrdd iechyd lleol beth yw'r rheolau ar gyfer dyrannu cyllid dan y cynlluniau

Many local health boards across Wales effectively delivered the scheme; some did not. This is a matter of many weeks' standing.

Y Llywydd: Galwaf ar Gwenda Thomas.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae fy nghwestiwn i wedi'i ateb.

Mark Isherwood: We heard at the North Wales Regional Committee meeting that was held, I think, last November, and which took evidence on dentistry that, at that stage, of 101 registered dental practices in north Wales, only three were still taking NHS patients. We learned over Christmas that that would reduce to one. Since then, we have heard many announcements from you about alternative provision through private dental providers, factory units on estates and goodness knows what else. The proof of the pudding is in the eating, and you cannot keep dictating policy from the centre and then abdicating responsibility when problems affecting patients at the front line result. I will give an example of what Alun Ffred said. We know that Conwy Local Health Board has entered into a contract with Oasis Dental Care Ltd to provide a new, eight-dentist NHS practice in Colwyn Bay. The contractual obligations that it has entered into cannot now be withdrawn from. However, because of a minor matter that should have a solution in front of it, you have withdrawn the funding needed to achieve that, which, I understand, leaves a £1 million gap in funding, which will have to come from other LHB resources and, therefore, other LHB services. Will you take responsibility for that and work with the local health boards and the providers to ensure that this service can be delivered without constantly having these problems being published in the press, terrifying the life out of the public, which is so desperate for solutions for the good of all?

Brian Gibbons: As you said, this is an issue relating back to the introduction of the new contract, some six to seven weeks ago. Nothing new or urgent has appeared in

gwasanaethau deintyddol newydd. Llwyddodd llawer o fyrddau iechyd lleol ledled Cymru i weithredu'r cynllun yn effeithiol; ni lwyddodd eraill. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n mynd yn ôl wythnosau.

The Presiding Officer: I call Gwenda Thomas.

Gwenda Thomas: My question has been answered.

Mark Isherwood: Yng nghyfarfod Pwyllgor Rhanbarth Gogledd Cymru a gynhaliwyd, yr wyf yn meddwl, ym mis Tachwedd y llynedd, ac a dderbyniodd dystiolaeth am ddeintyddiaeth, clywsom mai dim ond tri phractis deintyddol cofrestredig o blith 101 yn y gogledd, ar y pryd, a oedd yn dal i dderbyn cleifion y GIG. Clywsom dros y Nadolig y byddai hynny'n gostwng i un. Ers hynny, yr ydym wedi clywed llawer o gyhoeddiadau gennych ynghylch darpariaeth arall drwy ddarparwyr deintyddol preifat, unedau ffatri ar ystadau a dyn a wŷr beth arall. Wrth ei flas y mae profi pwddin, ac ni allwch ddal ati i bennu polisiau o'r canol ac yna gwrthod bod yn gyfrifol pan fydd problemau yn effeithio ar gleifion yn y rheng flaen. Rhoddaf enghraifft o'r hyn yr oedd Alun Ffred yn ei ddweud. Gwyddom fod Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Conwy wedi arwyddo contract ag Oasis Dental Care Ltd i ddarparu practis GIG newydd sydd ag wyth deintydd ym Mae Colwyn. Nid oes modd iddo dynnu'n ôl yn awr o'r rhwymedigaethau cytundebol. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd mater bach y dylai fod ateb ar ei gyfer, yr ydych wedi tynnu'n ôl yr arian sydd ei angen ar gyfer gwireddu hynny, sydd, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, yn gadael bwlch o £1 miliwn. Bydd yn rhaid i'r arian hwn ddod o adnoddau eraill y BILL ac felly, gwasanaethau eraill y BILL. A wnewch ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb dros hynny a gweithio gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol a'r darparwyr er mwyn sicrhau bod modd darparu'r gwasanaeth hwn heb gael y problemau hyn yn y wasg drwy'r amser, sy'n dychryn y cyhoedd, sy'n disgwyl mor eiddgar am atebion er lles pawb?

Brian Gibbons: Fel y dywedasoeh, mae hyn yn fater sy'n mynd yn ôl at gyflwyno'r contract newydd, ryw chwech i saith wythnos yn ôl. Nid oes dim byd newydd na dim y mae

relation to this matter, which my officials have been dealing with, with the local health boards.

Jenny Randerson: You may think that there is nothing new here, but it is quite obvious from the quotations from the chief executives of local health boards and so on that they regard the situation not only as one of great concern but also as a surprise. You may shake your head, Minister, but it is obvious that they were not counting on this financially, and it will have an impact on other services. Have you had discussions with the local health boards involved about the impact on other services of the LHBs concerned, and where they are going to draw the money from in order to fund these services?

Where do you think this places you in relation to the promise that the First Minister made the week before last that every area would have enough NHS dentists for everyone who wanted one by the end of this financial year? This kind of deterrent effect, which is discouraging the development of new dental surgeries, will have an impact on the ambitions and enthusiasm of local health boards to establish new services. Given that north Wales and the western part of north Wales are among the areas with the lowest numbers of NHS dentists per 1,000 population, how do you think they will overcome this hurdle and achieve your ambition, which I assume you share with the First Minister and think is achievable?

Brian Gibbons: In response to the introduction to your question, which is explicit, I repeat that that relates to matters and negotiations that took place around the introduction of the new contract for dentists, which was six to eight weeks ago. The guidance that went out to local health boards went out many months before that. Therefore, I repeat my statement that nothing in the questions that I have heard so far relates to a new or urgent matter.

On the second part of your question, once the situation relating to the number of people registered with dentists in Wales is clear, I intend to release some central funds targeted

brys yn ei gylch wedi codi sy'n ymwneud â'r mater hwn, y mae fy swyddogion wedi bod yn delio ag ef, gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol.

Jenny Randerson: Efallai eich bod yn meddwl nad oes dim byd newydd yma, ond mae'n gwbl amlwg yn ôl y dyfyniadau gan brif weithredwyr y byrddau iechyd lleol ac yn y blaen eu bod yn barnu bod y sefyllfa'n un sy'n peri pryder mawr ond hefyd yn un sy'n peri syndod iddynt. Efallai eich bod yn ysgwyd eich pen, Weinidog, ond mae'n amlwg nad oeddent yn disgwyl hyn yn ariannol, ac y bydd yn effeithio ar wasanaethau eraill. A ydych wedi cynnal trafodaethau gyda'r byrddau iechyd lleol dan sylw am yr effaith ar wasanaethau eraill y BILLau, ac o ble y cânt yr arian er mwyn ariannu'r gwasanaethau hyn?

Yn eich barn chi, pa effaith a gaiff hyn ar eich sefyllfa o ran yr addewid a wnaeth y Prif Weinidog yr wythnos cyn yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai gan bob ardal ddigon o ddeintyddion y GIG ar gyfer pawb a oedd am gael un erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon? Bydd y math hwn o effaith ataliol, sy'n atal deintyddfeydd newydd rhag datblygu, yn effeithio ar uchelgeisiau a brwdfrydedd y byrddau iechyd lleol i sefydlu gwasanaethau newydd. O gofio bod y gogledd a rhan orllewinol y gogledd ymysg yr ardaloedd sydd â'r nifer leiaf o ddeintyddion y GIG am bob 1,000 o'r boblogaeth, sut, yn eich barn chi, y byddant yn goresgyn y rhwystr hwn ac yn gwireddu'ch uchelgais, yr wyf yn tybio eich bod yn ei rannu â'r Prif Weinidog ac yn credu bod modd ei wireddu?

Brian Gibbons: Wrth ymateb i'r rhagymdrodd i'ch cwestiwn, sy'n amlwg, dywedaf eto fod hyn yn ymwneud â materion a thrafodaethau a gafwyd pan gyflwynwyd y contract newydd i ddeintyddion, tua chwech i wyth wythnos yn ôl. Cafodd y canllawiau, a anfonwyd at fyrddau iechyd lleol, eu hanfon fisoedd cyn hynny. Felly, dywedaf eto nad oes dim yn y cwestiynau yr wyf wedi'i glywed hyd yn hyn yn ymwneud â mater newydd na mater brys.

Ynghylch ail ran eich cwestiwn, pan fydd y sefyllfa o ran nifer y bobl sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintyddion yng Nghymru yn glir, bwriadaf ryddhau arian canolog wedi'i

particularly at those local health boards with the lowest levels of registration. Again, this is not new news; the First Minister has mentioned it on a number of occasions recently during First Minister's questions.

3.10 p.m.

Carl Sargeant: The dentistry debate is upsetting to opposition members because they do not like a good-news story. However, there are some issues in north Wales, which I understand are down to the local health boards and the operating company. Will you ensure that your officials talk to LHBs about how they made such a mess of this wonderful news story about delivering dentists for the people of Wales, particularly those in north Wales?

Brian Gibbons: The guidance for these new contracts has been available to local health boards for many months. Therefore, there is nothing new in this. As I said, in relation to those communities in north and west Wales where registration levels are relatively low, as the First Minister has indicated on a number of occasions in recent weeks, we intend to make further announcements on that. However, there has been nothing of new or immediate interest for me to respond to in the questions that I have heard so far.

Ann Jones: Will you give me some assurance that, should dentists continue to seek to go down the private-practice route, local health boards will be assisted to ensure that salaried dentists will be put in their place? The new dental contract has been a good issue, and the PDS scheme is now working in our favour. However, I am frightened that dentists will continue to seek private practices as they are more lucrative. I want assurances from you that LHBs will be assisted in ensuring that salaried dentists can be put in their place.

Brian Gibbons: You will be aware that, in Denbighshire, well over 11,000 new places have been assured under the PDS scheme. That has been an outstanding success,

dargedu'n benodol at y byrddau iechyd lleol hynny lle y mae nifer y bobl sydd wedi cofrestru ar ei hisaf. Eto, nid yw hyn yn newydd; mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi sôn am hyn droeon yn ddiweddar yn ystod cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog.

Carl Sargeant: Mae'r ddadl am ddeintyddiaeth yn corddi aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau am nad ydynt yn hoffi clywed newyddion da. Fodd bynnag, mae rhywfaint o faterion yn codi yn y gogledd y mae'r byrddau iechyd lleol a'r cwmni gweithredol yn gyfrifol amdanynt, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf. A wnewch sicrhau bod eich swyddogion yn siarad â'r BILlau ynghylch sut y gwnaethant y fath lanast o'r newyddion bendigedig am ddarparu deintyddion i bobl Cymru, yn enwedig yn y gogledd?

Brian Gibbons: Mae'r canllawiau ar gyfer y contractau newydd hyn wedi bod ar gael i'r byrddau iechyd lleol ers misoedd. Felly, nid oes dim byd newydd yn hyn o beth. Fel y dywedais, o ran y cymunedau hynny yn y gogledd a'r gorllewin lle y mae lefelau cofrestru'n gymharol isel, fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi dweud sawl tro yn yr wythnosau diwethaf, yr ydym yn bwriadu cyhoeddi mwy am hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oes dim byd newydd na dim sy'n peri bod brys i mi ymateb iddo yn y cwestiynau yr wyf wedi'u clywed hyd yn hyn.

Ann Jones: A wnewch roi sicrwydd, pe bai deintyddion yn parhau i droi eu practisiau'n rhai preifat, y caiff byrddau iechyd lleol gymorth i sicrhau y darperir deintyddion cyflogedig yn eu lle? Mae'r contract deintyddol newydd wedi bod yn beth da, ac mae'r cynllun gwasanaethau deintyddol personol yn gweithio o'n plaid erbyn hyn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu y bydd deintyddion yn parhau i geisio cael practisiau preifat gan eu bod yn fwy proffidiol. Yr wyf am gael sicrwydd gennych y caiff y BILlau gymorth i sicrhau y gellir darparu deintyddion cyflogedig yn eu lle.

Brian Gibbons: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod dros 11,000 o leoedd newydd yn sir Ddinbych wedi'u sicrhau dan y cynllun gwasanaethau deintyddol personol. Mae

because the bids were received in time in line with the rules and regulations that were made explicitly clear to the local health boards that wanted to process this particular scheme. However, I do not think that we are prescriptive in how local health boards wish to provide access for their local populations. They can go to independent contractors under the family dental scheme if that is the most appropriate option, and they can deal with corporate bodies in the private sector. If they wish, they can use the salaried NHS community dental service scheme as a mechanism to provide general dental services. All local health boards should be sufficiently flexible and creative to use all those means to ensure that good access to dental care is available in their areas.

hynny wedi bod yn llwyddiant anhygoel, oherwydd derbyniwyd y ceisiadau mewn pryd yn unol â'r rheolau a'r rheoliadau a wnaed yn gwbl glir i'r byrddau iechyd lleol a oedd am brosesu'r cynllun penodol hwn. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn credu ein bod yn rhoi argymhellion pendant o ran sut y mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn dymuno darparu mynediad i'w poblogaethau lleol. Gallant fynd at gontractwyr annibynnol dan y cynllun deintyddol teuluol os mai dyna yw'r dewis mwyaf priodol, a gallant ddelio â chyrrff corfforaethol yn y sector preifat. Os ydynt yn dymuno, gallant ddefnyddio cynllun gwasanaeth deintyddol cymunedol cyflogedig y GIG yn fecanwaith i ddarparu gwasanaethau deintyddol cyffredinol. Dylai pob bwrdd iechyd lleol fod yn ddigon hyblyg a chreadigol i ddefnyddio'r holl ddulliau hynny i sicrhau bod gofal deintyddol ar gael yn rhwydd yn eu hardaloedd.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for answering that urgent question of public importance.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog, am ateb y cwestiwn brys hwnnw sydd o bwys cyhoeddus.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Cefnffordd yr A5 The A5 Trunk Road

Karen Sinclair: Will the Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks make a statement on the actions being taken to minimise the economic impact of the emergency closure of the A5 trunk road between Tŷ-nant and Dinmael? EAQ0827(EIN)

Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau ddatganiad am y camau sy'n cael eu cymryd i leihau'r effaith economaidd a achosir gan gau cefnffordd yr A5 ar frys rhwng Tŷ-nant a Dinmael? EAQ0827(EIN)

The Minister for Enterprise, Innovation and Networks (Andrew Davies): As Members will know, I issued a written statement yesterday and have made a commitment to keeping all of you, and others, regularly updated on this situation. I have been advised by my officials that there is a significant risk of a dangerous rock fall at this location on the A5. I have to take the advice seriously as the consequences of ignoring it and not taking appropriate action could be potentially life-threatening. I have subsequently asked my officials to give top priority to examining a range of options for dealing with this situation to minimise the

Y Gweinidog dros Fenter, Arloesi a Rhwydweithiau (Andrew Davies): Fel y gwŷr yr Aelodau, cyhoeddais ddatganiad ysgrifenedig ddoe ac yr wyf wedi addo rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i chi i gyd, ac eraill, ynghylch y sefyllfa hon. Mae fy swyddogion wedi rhoi gwybod i mi fod perygl sylweddol y bydd creigiau'n cwmpo yn y man hwn ar yr A5. Mae'n rhaid i mi gymryd y cyngor o ddifrif gan y gallai ei anwybyddu a pheidio â chymryd y camau priodol beryglu bywydau. Yr wyf, felly, wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion roi'r flaenoriaeth uchaf i chwilio am nifer o opsiynau ar gyfer delio â'r sefyllfa hon er mwyn tarfu cyn lleied ag y bo modd ar y bobl

disruption to local people and businesses, as well as other road users. Given the urgency of this matter, my officials have also embarked on an extensive communication exercise to inform those affected by this decision of the latest position as fully as possible.

Karen Sinclair: The tourism trade along the A5 corridor has already been adversely affected this spring by the dreadful weather that we have had. As you can imagine, the news of the closure of the A5 at Tŷ-nant and Dinmael has sent shockwaves through the business community, which fears that an already fragile economy is being threatened. The original plan to redirect traffic along the A483 and A55 would have a significant detrimental impact on trade. While accepting that safety has to be our prime consideration, can the Minister assure me that any necessary diversions are kept to a minimum to ensure that tourist traffic remains on the A5? As you know, I have forwarded a number of suggestions for diversions to your officials, and I seek your assurance that no A5 closure signage will be put on the A483 and that diversions will be routed along roads near to the closures, thereby ensuring that the A5 corridor remains open and businesses in Llangollen, Corwen and beyond are protected.

Andrew Davies: I am grateful for the information that we have received from you and from many of your constituents. Many Members have corresponded with me about this. I have received many alternatives for diversionary routes, and my officials are looking at these. The head of tourism and marketing, Jonathan Jones, has drawn up a communication plan, which is now being implemented and is addressed specifically to trying to mitigate the impact on tourism operators and other local businesses.

One of the reasons why the decision was to close the road at the end of this week rather than last week was that we needed to put diversionary signs in place and to plan and inform people as much as possible. My officials have acted very responsibly. We will be looking at a range of options, which will include reopening the old A5. My officials

a'r busnesau lleol, yn ogystal â defnyddwyr eraill y ffordd. O gofio bod y mater hwn yn un brys, mae fy swyddogion wedi dechrau ar y gwaith o gyfathrebu'n eang hefyd er mwyn rhoi cymaint o wybodaeth ag sy'n bosibl am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf i'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt gan y penderfyniad hwn.

Karen Sinclair: Mae'r tywydd ofnadwy yr ydym wedi'i gael eisoes wedi cael effaith andwyol ar y fasnach dwristiaeth ar hyd yr A5 y gwanwyn hwn. Fel y gallwch ddyfalu, mae'r newyddion ynghylch cau'r A5 yn Nhŷ-nant a Dinmael wedi brawychu pobl fusnes, sydd yn ofni bod hyn yn fygythiad i economi sydd eisoes yn fregus. Byddai'r bwriad gwreiddiol i ailgyfeirio'r traffig ar hyd yr A483 a'r A55 wedi amharu'n ddifrifol ar fasnach. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod rhaid i ddiogelwch fod yn brif ystyriaeth, a all y Gweinidog fy sicrhau y ceir cyn lleied ag sy'n bosibl o ddargyfeiriadau er mwyn gofalu bod traffig ymwelwyr yn aros ar yr A5? Fel y gwyrddoch, yr wyf wedi anfon nifer o awgrymiadau ar gyfer dargyfeiriadau at eich swyddogion, ac yr wyf yn gofyn am sicrwydd gennych na fydd dim arwyddion ynghylch cau'r A5 yn cael eu gosod ar yr A483 ac y bydd y dargyfeiriadau'n dilyn ffyrdd ger y rhannau sydd wedi'u cau, fel y sicrheir bod coridor yr A5 yn aros ar agor a bod busnesau yn Llangollen, Corwen a'r tu hwnt wedi'u diogelu.

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y wybodaeth yr ydym wedi'i chael gennych chi a chan lawer o'ch etholwyr. Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi gohebu â mi ynghylch hyn. Yr wyf wedi cael llawer o awgrymiadau ar gyfer llwybrau eraill i ddargyfeiriadau, ac mae fy swyddogion yn eu hystyried. Mae pennaeth twristiaeth a marchnata, Jonathan Jones, wedi paratoi cynllun cyfathrebu, sydd yn cael ei roi ar waith yn awr ac sydd â'r diben penodol o leddfu'r effaith ar weithredwyr busnesau ymwelwyr a busnesau lleol eraill.

Un o'r rhesymau dros benderfynu cau'r ffordd ddiwedd yr wythnos hon yn hytrach na'r wythnos diwethaf oedd bod angen inni osod arwyddion dargyfeirio a chynllunio a hysbysu pobl i'r graddau mwyaf posibl. Mae fy swyddogion wedi ymddwyn yn gyfrifol iawn. Byddwn yn ystyried nifer o ddewisiadau, a fydd yn cynnwys ailagor yr

are looking seriously at that proposition in order to deal with the disruption to local traffic. We are also looking at how to divert the longer distance traffic along alternative routes.

Alun Pugh: Given the engineering assessment—[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Did I hear someone say that a Minister should not question a Minister?

Alun Cairns: I withdraw the remark.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you. This has happened on a number of occasions. Ministers are also constituency Assembly Members. I would not mind asking an oral question on this. I have already e-mailed the Minister twice this morning on this matter. We are all involved, and it is only fair that Ministers should also be able to represent their constituents.

Alun Pugh: Thank you, Llywydd. I am conscious that this affects your constituents in communities such as Betws-y-Coed as much as it affects my constituents in communities such as Cerrigydrudion and Pentrefoelas. Given the bleak engineering assessment, Andrew, I am sure that no responsible Government could allow the road to remain open. However, I ask you to do everything in your power to get the road reopened as soon as possible and to ensure that an appropriate set of diversions, and not a single diversion, is put in place to cover the specific needs of local traffic, long-distance heavy goods vehicles—which is a quite separate issue—and tourist vehicles, so that people can access local businesses. Passing trade makes the difference between those businesses staying open or having to close.

Andrew Davies: I am mindful of the impact that this will have. This was not a decision that was made lightly, but I was advised by my transport officials that there is a significant threat of a serious rock-fall that could be life-threatening, and I have to take

hen A5. Mae fy swyddogion yn ystyried yr awgrym hwnnw o ddifrif er mwyn delio â'r amharu ar draffig lleol. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried sut i ddargyfeirio'r traffig sydd yn teithio'n bellach ar hyd llwybrau eraill.

Alun Pugh: O ystyried yr asesiad gan beirianwyr—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. A glywais rywun yn dweud na ddylai Gweinidog ofyn cwestiwn i Weinidog?

Alun Cairns: Tynnaf y sylw'n ôl.

Y Llywydd: Diolch ichi. Mae hyn wedi digwydd ar nifer o achlysuron. Mae Gweinidogion yn Aelodau Cynulliad dros etholaethau hefyd. Byddwn i'n hoffi gofyn cwestiwn llafar am hyn. Yr wyf eisoes wedi anfon dau e-bost at y Gweinidog y bore yma ynghylch y mater hwn. Yr ydym i gyd yn gysylltiedig â hyn, ac nid yw ond yn deg i Weinidogion gael cynrychioli eu hetholwyr hefyd.

Alun Pugh: Diolch ichi, Lywydd. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod hyn yn effeithio ar eich etholwyr mewn cymunedau fel Betws-y-coed yn gymaint ag y mae'n effeithio ar fy etholwyr i mewn cymunedau fel Cerrigydrudion a Phentrefoelas. O ystyried yr asesiad digalon gan beirianwyr, Andrew, yr wyf yn sicr na fyddai'r un Llywodraeth gyfrifol yn gallu caniatáu i'r ffordd aros yn agored. Er hynny, gofynnaf ichi wneud popeth yn eich gallu i beri i'r ffordd gael ei hailagor cyn gynted ag y bo modd ac i sicrhau y bydd set briodol o ddargyfeiriadau, ac nid un dargyfeiriad yn unig, yn cael ei rhoi ar waith er mwyn darparu ar gyfer anghenion penodol traffig lleol, cerbydau nwyddau trwm sydd yn teithio'n bell—sydd yn fater cwbl wahanol—a cherbydau ymwelwyr, fel y gall pobl fynd at fusnesau lleol. Masnach y cwsmeriaid sydd yn mynd heibio sydd yn gwneud y gwahaniaeth rhwng aros yn agored a gorfod cau yn achos y busnesau hynny.

Andrew Davies: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r effaith a gaiff hyn. Nid ar chwarae bach y gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad hwn, ond fe'm hysbyswyd gan fy swyddogion trafndiaeth fod bygythiad sylweddol o gwmp a allai beryglu bywyd, a rhaid imi gymryd hynny o

that seriously. Public safety has to be the overwhelming priority for me as a Minister, and for the Government. As I said, we are looking at a range of options in order to minimise the impact on local businesses. As the Presiding Officer said, he and others have been in communication with me, and I have responded. We are looking at a wide range of options and at ways to reduce, as far as possible, any economic impact on local business.

Janet Ryder: Local residents tell me that traffic lights have been operating in that area for over a year. You have been carrying out tests in that area for over a year. They want to know why things have moved so suddenly, and why they had no prior warning. What were you doing, and why was it only last weekend that you started to look at alternative routes? If you knew that this was a possibility, those constituents want to know why it was not prepared for, because many of them feel that their livelihoods will disappear.

3.20 p.m.

Andrew Davies: It is precisely because of the monitoring that has been undertaken that the risk assessment has revealed that there is now a significant risk. As I said, the situation has been monitored. The possibility of a rock-fall at that site has been identified and that is why there has been a reduction to single lane traffic and traffic lights have been installed. However, the results of the latest risk assessment, which were communicated to me by my officials late last week, show that there is a very serious threat of a rock-fall. It would be, in their terms, without warning and could be catastrophic. Given that advice, I have to take that seriously.

This only came to light last week. If officials had had information previously about a serious risk, we would have taken action at that time. However, the monitoring undertaken previously had not revealed a risk of this magnitude. As I said, as a responsible Minister, I have to take seriously the advice that I get from my engineers and transport

ddifrif. Rhaid i ddiogelwch y cyhoedd fod yn flaenoriaeth bennaf i mi fel Gweinidog, ac i'r Llywodraeth. Fel y dywedais, yr ydym yn ystyried nifer o ddewisiadau er mwyn lleihau'r effaith ar fusnesau lleol. Fel y dywedodd y Llywydd, mae ef ac eraill wedi gohebu â mi, ac yr wyf wedi ymateb. Yr ydym yn ystyried amrywiaeth fawr o ddewisiadau a dulliau o leihau, hyd y gellir, unrhyw effaith economaidd ar fusnesau lleol.

Janet Ryder: Mae preswylwyr lleol yn dweud wrthyf fod goleuadau traffig wedi bod ar waith yn yr ardal honno ers mwy na blwyddyn. Yr ydych wedi bod yn cynnal profion yn yr ardal honno ers mwy na blwyddyn. Maent am gael gwybod pam y mae pethau wedi digwydd mor sydyn, a pham na chawsant rybudd ymlaen llaw. Beth yr oeddech yn ei wneud, a pham na ddechreuasoch ystyried llwybrau eraill tan y penwythnos diwethaf? Os gwyddech y gallai hyn ddigwydd, mae'r etholwyr hynny am gael gwybod pam na pharatowyd ar gyfer hynny, gan fod llawer ohonynt yn teimlo y bydd eu bywoliaeth yn diflannu.

Andrew Davies: Y gwaith monitro a wnaethpwyd yw'r union beth sydd wedi peri i'r asesiad risg ddangos bod perygl sylweddol erbyn hyn. Fel y dywedais, mae'r sefyllfa wedi'i monitro. Canfuwyd y posibilrwydd o gwmp yn y fan honno a dyna pam y mae'r traffig wedi'i gyfyngu i un lôn ac y mae goleuadau traffig wedi'u gosod. Fodd bynnag, mae canlyniadau'r asesiad risg diweddaraf, a roddwyd i mi gan fy swyddogion ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf, yn dangos bod bygythiad difrifol iawn o gwmp. Byddai'n ddirybudd, yn ôl yr hyn a ddywedasant, a gallai fod yn drychinebus. O gofio'r cyngor hwnnw, rhaid imi gymryd hynny o ddifrif.

Ni ddaeth hyn i'r golwg tan yr wythnos diwethaf. Pe buasai gwybodaeth gan fy swyddogion cyn hynny am berygl difrifol, byddem wedi cymryd camau bryd hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd y gwaith monitro a wnaethpwyd o'r blaen wedi dangos perygl mor fawr. Fel y dywedais, fel Gweinidog cyfrifol, rhaid imi gymryd o ddifrif y cyngor

officials. That is why the decision was made.

There is also a risk in diverting traffic, which is why there has been a week's notice of the need for closure and diversion. My transport officials say that there is also a risk inherent in diverting traffic in itself. In their judgment, it takes a week in order to do this safely and to not impose an unacceptable risk in terms of installing or introducing diversionary signs and measures before local people and businesses have that information.

Brynle Williams: Where have we been for the last 12 months and more? This road was only opened some five or six years ago and now we have a major problem of rock-slide. Like the other Members who have spoken, I have had constituents complain to me about the severe problems for their businesses. The diverted traffic, as you well know, will have to go up through Bala, around Fron-goch to come around the top, or down through Rhuthin. That is 30 to 40 miles out of their way. It is badly damaging the tourist industry. I hope, Minister, that you will consider opening a section of the old A5.

Mick Bates: It has been said.

Brynle Williams: Yes, it has been, but I am saying it again. It needs to be opened. Once again, it appears that the Assembly Government does not give a damn about what happens in north Wales. This problem is over 12 months in the making.

Andrew Davies: That shows the difference between the responsibility of Government and the irresponsibility of the opposition.

To say that, as a Minister, I should blithely ignore the serious advice of my engineers and transport officials and put the public at risk, is grossly irresponsible. Those who are listening to this question here on or on television will note the points made by Brynle Williams.

Eleanor Burnham: As Brynle has just

a gaf gan fy mheirianwyr a'm swyddogion trafniadaeth. Dyna pam y gwnaethpwyd y penderfyniad.

Mae perygl hefyd wrth ddargyfeirio traffig, a dyna pam y rhoddwyd wythnos o rybudd bod angen cau'r ffordd a dargyfeirio traffig. Mae fy swyddogion trafniadaeth yn dweud bod perygl ynglŷn â dargyfeirio traffig hefyd. Yn eu barn hwy, mae'n cymryd wythnos i wneud hynny'n ddiogel a pheidio â pheri risg annerbyniol o ran gosod neu gyflwyno arwyddion a mesurau dargyfeirio cyn i bobl a busnesau lleol gael y wybodaeth honno.

Brynle Williams: Beth y buom yn ei wneud ers 12 mis a mwy? Nid oes ond rhyw bump neu chwe blynedd ers pan agorwyd y ffordd hon a bellach mae gennym broblem ddifrifol ar ffurf cwmp. Fel yr Aelodau eraill sydd wedi siarad, mae etholwyr wedi cwyno wrthyf am y problemau difrifol y mae eu busnesau'n eu hwynebu. Fel y gwyddoch, bydd y traffig sydd wedi'i ddargyfeirio'n gorfod mynd i fyny drwy'r Bala, o gwmpas y Fron-goch i ddod o amgylch y pen uchaf, neu i lawr drwy Ruthun. Mae hynny'n mynd â hwy rhwng 30 a 40 milltir o'u ffordd. Mae'n gwneud niwed mawr i'r diwydiant ymwelwyr. Yr wyf yn gobeithio, Weinidog, y byddwch yn ystyried agor rhan o'r hen A5.

Mick Bates: Dywedwyd hynny.

Brynle Williams: Do, dywedwyd hynny, ond yr wyf yn ei ddweud eto. Rhaid ei hagar. Unwaith eto, mae'n ymddangos nad yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn poeni dim am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd yn y gogledd. Mae'r broblem hon yn corddi ers mwy na 12 mis.

Andrew Davies: Mae hynny'n dangos y gwahaniaeth rhwng agwedd gyfrifol y Llywodraeth ac anghyfrifoldeb y gwrthbleidiau.

Mae dweud y dylwn i, fel Gweinidog, ddiystyru cyngor difrif fy mheirianwyr a'm swyddogion trafniadaeth, heb boeni dim, a rhoi'r cyhoedd mewn perygl, yn dra anghyfrifol. Bydd y rhai sydd yn gwrando ar y cwestiwn hwn yma neu ar y teledu'n nodi'r pwyntau a wnaeth Brynle Williams.

Eleanor Burnham: Fel y mae Brynle

mentioned, this problem has been in the making for some time. I understand that your officials did not take any notice of local people when they suggested that you should have made sure that the alternative, old road was kept viable. My understanding now is that it will take some time to acquire the land to do this. That is quite unacceptable. I was there on Sunday and there were people, particularly those in the cafe, who were concerned, because they have taken some time to build up their business. You may or may not know—because you have been in business yourself—but you cannot expect them to throw away a business just because you and your officials have been so dilatory about taking action, particularly over the last 12 months. I do not accept that you or your officials have done exactly what should have been done.

Andrew Davies: I could almost repeat, word for word, my response to Brynle Williams. I am not sure whether that should be dignified with a response.

The overwhelming priority for us as a Government is the safety of users—*[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. What is wrong with people today? This is a serious transportation issue for many of us. The Minister is responding, so please can we hear what he has to say. If there are any genuine points of order, I may call you later.

Andrew Davies: The overwhelming priority for me as a Minister is the safety of the public. If I were to say, 'I will ignore that advice; we will keep that road open, because there is a risk to some local businesses', and there was a catastrophic rock-fall and a loss of life or serious injury, then Members would be seeking my blood for being irresponsible and keeping the road open when I had clear advice otherwise. I said in response to an earlier question from Janet Ryder that there have been questions about the stability of this rock face, which is why the full risk assessment has been undertaken. The advice that I have had is that it now—*[Interruption.]*

newydd ddweud, mae'r broblem hon yn corddi ers cryn amser. Yr wyf yn deall na chymerodd eich swyddogion ddim sylw o bobl leol pan awgrymasant y dylech fod wedi sicrhau bod yr hen ffordd wedi'i chadw fel y gellid ei defnyddio fel dewis arall. Yr wyf yn deall yn awr y bydd yn cymryd peth amser i gaffael y tir i wneud hyn. Mae hynny'n gwbl annerbiniol. Bûm yno ddydd Sul ac yr oedd rhai, yn enwedig y rhai yn y caffî, a oedd yn bryderus, am eu bod wedi cymryd cryn amser i ddatblygu eu busnes. Efallai y gwyddoch—gan eich bod wedi bod mewn busnes eich hun—na ellir disgwyl iddynt roi'r gorau i fusnes dim ond am eich bod chi a'ch swyddogion wedi bod mor araf yn gweithredu, yn enwedig dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Nid wyf yn derbyn eich bod chi na'ch swyddogion wedi gwneud yn union fel y dylid bod wedi gwneud.

Andrew Davies: Bron na allwn ailadrodd, air am air, fy ateb i Brynle Williams. Nid wyf yn sicr a yw hynny'n haeddu ateb.

Y flaenoriaeth bennaf i ni fel Llywodraeth yw diogelwch y defnyddwyr—*[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Beth sydd o'i le ar bobl heddiw? Mae hyn yn fater difrifol yn ymwneud â thrafnidiaeth yng ngolwg llawer ohonom. Mae'r Gweinidog wrthi'n ateb, felly a gawn glywed yr hyn sydd ganddo i'w ddweud, os gwelwch yn dda? Os oes pwyntiau o drefn sy'n ddilys, efallai y galwaf arnoch yn ddiweddarach.

Andrew Davies: Y flaenoriaeth bennaf i mi fel Gweinidog yw diogelwch y cyhoedd. Pe byddwn yn dweud, 'Anwybyddaf y cyngor hwnnw; cadwn y ffordd honno'n agored, am fod perygl i rai busnesau lleol', a phe byddai cwmp trychinebus a rhai'n colli eu bywyd neu'n cael eu hanafu'n difrifol, byddai Aelodau am fy ngwaed am fod yn anghyfrifol a chadw'r ffordd yn agored a minnau wedi cael cyngor pendant i wneud fel arall. Dywedais mewn ymateb i gwestiwn cynharach gan Janet Ryder fod amheuaeth wedi bod ynghylch sefydlogrwydd wyneb y graig yn y fan honno, a dyna pam y gwnaethpwyd yr asesiad risg llawn. Y cyngor a gefais yw ei bod bellach—*[Torri ar draws.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. If any further Members want to be called on this urgent question, could they so indicate? This is not about heckling. I do not understand what the issue is. This is not helpful to the scrutiny of Ministers, or to the real concerns of the public on this issue.

Andrew Davies: I would have been in dereliction of my duty had I ignored that advice. I am fully aware of the potential threats to local businesses, which is why I have asked the relevant officials in my department to communicate with local businesses, whether in tourism or in any other sector, to try to reduce or mitigate the effect of this decision. I have also asked my officials to consider a range of options to deal with traffic flow at that level, which may include—and it is not straightforward—reopening the old A5.

I will give you some figures. I have been informed that the risk assessment shows that there is a 1 in 3,866 chance, over one year, of a rock-fall leading to a fatality. The Health and Safety Executive considers that a probability of less than 1,000,000 represents an acceptable level of risk. Between 1 in 1,000,000 and 1 in 100,000 is acceptable with mitigation measures in place. A probability greater than 1 in 100,000 is an unacceptable risk. My officials tell me that there is a high risk of a catastrophic rock-fall that would pose a serious threat to the safety, if not the life, of the users of that road. As a responsible Minister, I cannot ignore that risk. I have asked my officials to consider ways of reducing the impact on local businesses, and to seek to reopen that road as soon as is humanly possible.

Karen Sinclair: Point of order. I will make this clear for some of the regional Members who have obviously not been involved in the protracted correspondence that I have been involved in with regard to this road. Back in February and March—as I am sure you will know, Presiding Officer, and you will support what I am saying—it was assumed that the work could be done using traffic lights. It is now clear that this is dangerous.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os oes unrhyw Aelodau eraill sydd yn dymuno cael eu galw ar gyfer y cwestiwn brys hwn, a allent ddangos hynny? Nid oes a wnelo hyn â heclo. Nid wyf yn deall beth sydd dan sylw. Nid yw hyn o gymorth wrth holi Gweinidogion, nac wrth ystyried pryderon gwirioneddol y cyhoedd ynghylch y mater hwn.

Andrew Davies: Byddwn wedi esgeuluso fy nyletswydd pe byddwn wedi diystyru'r cyngor hwnnw. Yr wyf yn llwyr ymwybodol o'r bygythion posibl i fusnesau lleol, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r swyddogion perthnasol yn fy adran gysylltu â busnesau lleol, boed hwy yn y sector twristiaeth neu unrhyw sector arall, i geisio lleihau neu leddfu effaith y penderfyniad hwn. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion ystyried nifer o ddewisiadau i ddelio â'r llif traffig ar y lefel honno, a allai gynnwys—ac nid yw'n fater syml—ailagor yr hen A5.

Rhoddaf rai ffigurau i chi. Fe'm hysbyswyd bod yr asesiad risg yn dangos bod siawns o 1 mewn 3,866, dros flwyddyn, y byddai cwmp yn achosi marwolaeth rhywun. Mae'r Awdurdod Gweithredol Iechyd a Diogelwch o'r farn bod tebygolrwydd o lai na 1,000,000 yn lefel risg dderbyniol. Mae tebygolrwydd rhwng 1 mewn 1,000,000 ac 1 mewn 100,000 yn dderbyniol os yw mesurau lliniarol ar waith. Mae tebygolrwydd o fwy nag 1 mewn 100,000 yn risg annerbyniol. Mae fy swyddogion yn dweud wrthyf fod risg uchel o gael cwmp trychinebus a fyddai'n fygythiad difrifol i ddiogelwch, os nad bywyd, defnyddwyr y ffordd honno. Fel Gweinidog cyfrifol, ni allaf ddiystyru'r risg honno. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'm swyddogion ystyried dulliau o leihau'r effaith ar fusnesau lleol, ac cheisio ailagor y ffordd honno cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Karen Sinclair: Pwynt o drefn. Egluraf hyn er mwyn rhai o'r Aelodau rhanbarthol nad ydynt mae'n amlwg wedi bod yn ymwneud â'r ohebiaeth yr wyf fi wedi bod yn ymwneud â hi dros gyfnod hir mewn cysylltiad â'r ffordd hon. Ym mis Chwefror a mis Mawrth—fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf yn siŵr, Lywydd, ac fe wnewch ategu'r hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud—cymerwyd y byddai modd gwneud y gwaith gan ddefnyddio goleuadau

For these regional Members to make cheap points about something that is extremely dangerous—and we are all cognisant of the economic impact—is unacceptable. Work has been ongoing, and it is only because of the situation's urgency that this has happened.

Nick Bourne: I raise a point of order.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I am taking a point of order from Karen Sinclair. My response to Karen Sinclair is that that is not a matter for me. However, I do not accept that this is an abuse of the point of order tradition in this place, because I have allowed Members, especially constituency Members, who have a particular concern, to use the point of order convention to make points that are not, in fact, points of order. I believe that the leader of the Welsh Conservatives, who seems to be getting rather excited about this, has taken advantage of this convention in the past.

3.30 p.m.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): There is one change to report to this week's business. Tomorrow, Eleanor Burnham's short debate, 'Engaging the youth of today: Votes at 16?', which was deferred from 29 March, will replace Mick Bates's short debate, which has been deferred until 21 June. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which will be available to Members on the Chamberweb. Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Food Hygiene (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2006, the Sheep and Goats Transmissible Spongiform Encephalopathies (TSE) Compensation (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Bovine Spongiform Encephalopathy (BSE) Compensation

traffig. Mae'n amlwg bellach fod hyn yn beryglus. Mae'n annerbyniol bod yr Aelodau rhanbarthol hyn yn gwneud pwyntiau iselwael ynghylch rhywbeth sydd yn dra pheryglus—ac yr ydym oll yn gwybod am yr effaith economaidd. Mae'r gwaith wedi bod yn mynd rhagddo, a dim ond oherwydd y brys sydd ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa y mae hyn wedi digwydd.

Nick Bourne: Codaf bwynt o drefn.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn cymryd pwynt o drefn gan Karen Sinclair. Fy ymateb i Karen Sinclair yw nad yw hynny'n fater i mi. Er hynny, nid wyf yn derbyn bod hyn yn gamddefnydd o draddodiad y pwynt o drefn yn y lle hwn, gan fy mod wedi caniatáu i Aelodau, ac Aelodau dros etholaethau'n enwedig, sydd â phryder penodol, gael defnyddio confensiwn y pwynt o drefn i wneud pwyntiau nad ydynt, mewn gwirionedd, yn bwyntiau o drefn. Yr wyf yn credu bod arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, sydd i bob golwg yn cyffroi braidd ynghylch hyn, wedi manteisio ar y confensiwn hwn yn y gorffennol.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae un newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon i adrodd amdano. Yfory, bydd dadl fer Eleanor Burnham, 'Ennyn diddordeb pobl ifanc heddiw: Pleidleisio yn 16?', a ohiriwyd o 29 Mawrth, yn disodli dadl fer Mick Bates, dadl a ohiriwyd hyd at 21 Mehefin. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i gwelir yn y datganiad drafft; a fydd ar gael i'r Aelodau ar we'r Siambr. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd na fydd yn rhaid cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Hylendid Bwyd (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2006, Rheoliadau Iawndal Enseffalopathi Sbyngffurf Trosglwyddadwy (TSE) Defaid a Geifr (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Iawndal Enseffalopathi Sbyngffurf Buchol (BSE) (Cymru) 2006, Gorchymyn Iechyd Planhigion (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau

(Wales) Regulations 2006, the Plant Health (Wales) Order 2006, the Housing Health and Safety Rating System (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Housing (Interim Management Orders) (Prescribed Circumstances) (Wales) Order 2006, the Residential Property Tribunal Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2006 and the Residential Property Tribunal (Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn hynod o siomedig nad yw'r Gweinidog wedi cynnwys, yn unol â'n cais, ddatganiad ar y ffigurau Eurostat a ryddhawyd yr wythnos diwethaf. Yn groes i'r hyn yr oedd y Llywodraeth yn ei awgrymu, mae'r ffigurau yn dangos gostyngiad rhwng 2002 a 2003. Pe baent yn dangos cynnydd, byddai'r Gweinidog wedi bod yn fwy na bodlon gwneud datganiad; ond, gan fod y ffigurau fel arall, ymddengys ei fod yn anfodlon gwneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am gael datganiad, a dadl o bosibl, ar hynny gan ei fod yn fater mor bwysig o ran Amcan 1.

Yn ail, yr oeddem wedi gobeithio cael rhyw fath o ddatganiad ar y drafodaeth ynglŷn ag uno'r heddluoedd a chost hynny, yn enwedig gan fod Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, bellach yn dweud bod angen i'r Swyddfa Gartref ysgwyddo'r costau. Yr oeddem yn gobeithio y byddai'r Llywodraeth yn gweld y pwynt o gael datganiad pellach ar hynny. Hefyd, mae 60 o swyddi wedi'u colli yn Printpac Cyf yng Nghwmbrân—unwaith eto yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu—a byddem wedi gobeithio gweld y Gweinidog yn awyddus i wneud datganiad ar hynny.

There are two other matters on which we wanted to see debates tabled. The first issue is Wales's rising carbon emissions; figures in Wales are rising whereas they are falling in

System Graddio Iechyd a Diogelwch Tai (Cymru) 2006, Gorchymyn Tai (Gorchymynion Rheoli Interim) (Amgylchiadau Rhagnodedig) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Cymru) 2006 a Rheoliadau Tribiwnlys Eiddo Preswyl (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2006.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, so I ask that the Minister formally propose the business statement

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am extremely disappointed that the Minister has failed to include, in accordance with our request, a statement on the Eurostat figures that were released last week. Contrary to what the Government suggested, the figures demonstrate a reduction between 2002 and 2003. If they had shown an increase, the Minister would have been more than happy to make a statement; but, as the figures are otherwise, it appears that he is unwilling to do so. However, we want a statement, and possibly a debate, on that issue as it is such an important issue in terms of Objective 1.

Secondly, we had hoped to have some sort of statement on the discussions on the police merger and its cost, particularly as the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, is now saying that the Home Office should foot the bill. We had hoped that the Government would see the point of a further statement on that. In addition, 60 jobs have been lost in Printpac Ltd in Cwmbrân—again in the manufacturing industry—and we would have hoped that the Minister would be keen to make a statement on that.

Mae dau fater arall yr hoffem weld dadleuon yn cael eu cyflwyno arnynt. Y mater cyntaf yw gollyngiadau carbon cynyddol Cymru; mae'r ffigurau yng Nghymru yn cynyddu tra

the rest of the UK. In view of the Assembly's commitment to sustainable development, that is an issue that should be the subject of an early statement. Finally, I understand that a request was also made this morning for a statement on police checks and the fact that a number of people in Wales have been wrongly identified as having criminal convictions by the Criminal Records Bureau. That is an issue of public concern, on which we should have a proper debate or statement.

Lisa Francis: I duly note the e-mail that I received earlier, which said that the issue that we raised with you in committee should be raised under the business statement. It is to do with your response, and that of the First Minister, to the organisation of Assembly business following recent press reports. I ask for your response on that.

We also asked for an oral statement on the situation following the industrial dispute at universities. This has now become a very urgent issue; 20 per cent of students will apparently be given grades in lieu of sitting examinations, which has serious implications for their prospects of job offers and so on. You said that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills will make a statement on 6 June, but we do not know what kind of statement. Why can the Minister not update us now following her meetings with vice-chancellors? Surely, there should be an opportunity for that to happen.

We also asked for an oral statement on the appalling situation of a Llanelli woman who had been unable to receive a double lung transplant at Harefield hospital because the Welsh Ambulance Services NHS Trust had encountered delays, including one because of a fuel stop. You say that that is a matter for the ambulance trust, but when the service received the call for that transportation, both local ambulances were dealing with emergencies. That is a matter that concerns all the people of Wales at the moment, and should be addressed.

We are grateful for the written statement that

bôn yn gostwng yng ngweddill y DU. O ystyried ymrwymiad y Cynulliad i ddatblygu cynaliadwy, mae hwn yn fater a ddylai fod yn destun datganiad yn fuan. Yn olaf, deallaf fod cais wedi'i gyflwyno y bore yma yn ogystal am ddatganiad am archwiliadau'r heddlu a'r ffaith bod y Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol wedi camfarnu bod gan nifer o bobl yng Nghymru euogfarnau troseddol. Mae hwn yn fater o bryder cyhoeddus, a dylem gael datganiad neu ddatl iawn yn ei gylich.

Lisa Francis: Nodaf yn briodol yr e-bost a gefais yn gynharach ac a ddywedai y dylai'r mater a godasom gyda chi yn y pwyllgor gael ei godi dan y datganiad busnes. Mae'n ymwneud â'ch ymateb, ac ymateb y Prif Weinidog, i drefniant busnes y Cynulliad yn dilyn yr adroddiadau yn y wasg yn ddiweddar. Gofynnaf am eich ymateb ynghylch hynny.

Gofynasom hefyd am ddatganiad llafar am y sefyllfa yn sgîl yr anghydfod diwydiannol mewn prifysgolion. Mae hyn bellach yn fater y mae cryn frys ynglŷn ag ef; mae'n ymddangos y rhoddir graddau i 20 y cant o fyfyrwyr yn hytrach na'u bod yn sefyll arholiadau, ac mae gan hyn oblygiadau difrifol ar gyfer eu rhagolygon o ran cael cynnig swyddi ac yn y blaen. Dywedasoch y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yn gwneud datganiad ar 6 Mehefin, ond ni wyddom pa fath o ddatganiad. Pam na all y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni yn awr wedi ei chyfarfodydd gyda'r is-gangellorion? Siawns na ddylai fod cyfle i hynny ddigwydd.

Bu inni hefyd ofyn am ddatganiad llafar am sefyllfa echrydus menyw o Lanelli a oedd wedi methu â chael trawsblaniad ysgyfaint dwbl yn ysbyty Harefield oherwydd bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gwasanaethau Ambiwllans Cymru wedi wynebu oedi, gan gynnwys un oherwydd eu bod wedi aros i gael tanwydd. Dywedwch mai mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans yw hwn, ond pan gafodd y gwasanaeth yr alwad ar gyfer y cludo hwn, yr oedd y ddau ambiwlans lleol yn delio â galwadau brys. Mae hwn yn fater sy'n peri pryder i holl bobl Cymru ar hyn o bryd, a dylid rhoi sylw iddo.

Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar am y datganiad

you are offering on safety at the liquefied natural gas terminal; that is an important issue. To reiterate the comments of the leader of the opposition, we too think that you should make an oral statement regarding Peter Hain's comments on the police merger and the fact that the Home Office should pay for it.

I find it extraordinary that the Government is coming back to say that it cannot offer a statement on the Eurostat figures because they are not Government-produced figures. I think that you should reconsider that issue. We will be opposing the statement.

Peter Black: It occurred to me that perhaps we should ask Peter Hain to come here and make a statement, so that we could question him about his comments. That may be possible under Standing Orders; I am not sure if that is the case, although I know that he can come to the Chamber whenever he wishes.

I welcome, Business Minister, the fact that you are offering a statement on nutritional standards at the end of June, once the Minister has completed her work on that. I also welcome the fact that the Minister will, hopefully, produce an oral statement on 5 June on the crisis in our universities as a result of industrial action and its impact on students' exams. That is very important. I repeat—and this is one of the reasons why we will not support the business statement today—our request for a debate on the no named day motion tabled by Mike German on the music development fund, which is an important issue that needs to be discussed.

The issues raised by the other two opposition parties are also very important. I was astonished by the e-mail sent out today, according to which, apparently, the issue of the lady in Llanelli is a matter for the ambulance trust and not for the Government, while the Eurostat figures are not a matter for the Assembly Government because the Eurostat figures have not been produced by the Assembly Government. It seems to me that a great deal of people are passing on responsibilities here. Clearly, both issues are matters on which the Assembly Government

ysgrifenedig yr ydych yn ei gynnig am ddiogelwch yn y safle nwy naturiol hylifedig; mae hwn yn fater pwysig. Ac ailadrodd sylwadau arweinydd yr wrthblaid, yr ydym ninnau hefyd yn credu y dylech wneud datganiad llafar am sylwadau Peter Hain am uno'r heddluoedd a'r ffaith y dylai'r Swyddfa Gartref dalu am hynny.

Credaf ei bod yn hynod bod y Llywodraeth yn dod yn ôl i ddweud na all gynnig datganiad am y ffigurau Eurostat oherwydd nad ydynt yn ffigurau a gynhyrchwyd gan y Llywodraeth. Credaf y dylech ystyried y mater hwn. Byddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad.

Peter Black: Mae'n fy nharo y dylem efallai ofyn i Peter Hain ddod yma i wneud datganiad, fel y gallem ei holi am ei sylwadau. Gall hynny fod yn bosibl dan y Rheolau Sefydlog; nid wyf yn sicr ai felly y mae, er y gwn y caiff ddod i'r Siambr pryd bynnag y mae'n dymuno.

Croesawaf, Drefnydd, y ffaith eich bod yn cynnig datganiad am safonau maeth ddiwedd Mehefin, wedi i'r Gweinidog gwblhau ei gwaith ar hynny. Croesawaf hefyd y ffaith y bydd y Gweinidog, gobeithio, yn cyflwyno datganiad llafar ar 5 Mehefin am yr argyfwng yn ein prifysgolion o ganlyniad i weithredu diwydiannol a'i effaith ar arholiadau myfyrwyr. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. Yr wyf yn ailadrodd—ac mae hyn yn un o'r rhesymau pam na chefnogwn y datganiad busnes heddiw—ein cais am ddadl am y cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod a gyflwynwyd gan Mike German ynghylch y gronfa datblygu cerddoriaeth. Mae hwn yn fater pwysig y mae'n rhaid ei drafod.

Mae'r materion a gododd y ddwy wrthblaid arall hefyd yn bwysig iawn. Yr oeddwn yn synnu'n fawr at yr e-bost a anfonwyd heddiw, oherwydd ei fod yn dweud, yn ôl pob golwg, mai mater i'r ymddiriedolaeth ambiwlans ac nid i'r Llywodraeth yw mater y fenyw yn Llanelli, tra nad yw'r ffigurau Eurostat yn fater i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad oherwydd na chynhyrchwyd y ffigurau Eurostat gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod llawer iawn o bobl yn trosglwyddo cyfrifoldebau yn hyn o beth. Mae'r ddau fater, yn amlwg, yn faterion y

should answer, because there are Ministers who are accountable for those areas. I hope, therefore, Minister, that you take account of those requests and accede to them.

The Presiding Officer: Order. Before I call Carl Sargeant and the Minister to respond, the practice, under the Government of Wales Act 1998 and our Standing Orders, is for the Secretary of State to appear here in relation to the Government's legislative programme, known as the Queen's speech. Although I am sure that we would all appreciate his presence, if he were invited, to be ably scrutinised by the Chair of our Social Justice and Regeneration Committee.

Carl Sargeant: I would welcome time in the Chamber for a debate on the transport infrastructure of Wales, particularly north Wales, and the modifications that are taking place on the A55 and A494 in my constituency. Residents of Old Aston Hill and Aston Mead are extremely concerned about a consultation that is taking place with them. I know that you, Minister, are keen to ensure that there is full consultation. I would welcome time for that debate.

In addition, Minister, we had a debate on the manufacturing industry only last week, but I feel that it is important to recognise the success of the aerospace industry in Wales. Last week, the success of the made-in-Wales approach was seen when the A380 flew over Wales and the UK. The workforce of Broughton should be congratulated on that.

Finally, Minister, I know that we have talked many times in the Chamber about the success of manifesto commitments, such as free bus travel and free swimming—we know that, when the Conservatives come to power, they will slash them straight away—but the fact is that we should be grateful that we are doing so well. Our successes are endorsed by John Marek and the Forward Wales website, where the question of whether things have got better under Labour is posed; over 85 per cent of respondents say 'yes'.

dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ateb arnynt, oherwydd bod Gweinidogion sy'n atebol am y meysydd hyn. Gobeithiaf, felly, Weinidog, y rhoddwch ystyriaeth i'r ceisiadau hynny ac y byddwch yn cydsynio â hwy.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Cyn imi alw Carl Sargeant a'r Gweinidog i ymateb, y drefn dan Ddeddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 a'n Rheolau Sefydlog, yw bod yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn ymddangos yma mewn perthynas â rhaglen ddeddfwriaethol y Llywodraeth a elwir yn araith y Frenhines. Er hynny, yr wyf yn sicr y byddem oll yn gwerthfawrogi ei bresenoldeb, petai'n cael ei wahodd, iddo gael ei holi'n fanwl yn ddeheuig gan Gadeirydd ein Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

Carl Sargeant: Byddwn yn croesawu amser yn y Siambr i gynnal dadl ar seilwaith trafniadaeth Cymru, yn enwedig yn y gogledd, a'r addasiadau sy'n mynd rhagddynt ar ffordd yr A55 a'r A494 yn fy etholaeth. Mae trigolion Old Aston Hill ac Aston Mead yn bryderus eithriadol am ymgynghoriad sy'n mynd rhagddo gyda hwy. Gwn eich bod chi, Weinidog, yn awyddus i sicrhau bod ymgynghori llawn yn digwydd. Byddwn yn croesawu amser ar gyfer y ddadl honno.

Yn ogystal, Weinidog, cawsom ddadl am y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu yr wythnos diwethaf, ond teimlaf ei bod yn bwysig cydnabod llwyddiant y diwydiant awyrfod yng Nghymru. Yr wythnos diwethaf, gwelwyd llwyddiant y dull gwnaed yng Nghymru pan hedfanodd yr A380 dros Gymru a'r DU. Dylid llongyfarch y gweithlu ym Mrychdyn am hynny.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, gwn ein bod wedi siarad droeon yn y Siambr am lwyddiant ymrwymadau'r manifesto, megis teithio am ddim ar y bysiau a nofio am ddim—gwyddom, pan ddaw'r Ceidwadwyr i rym, y byddant yn cael gwared â'r rhain ar unwaith—ond y gwir amdani yw y dylem fod yn ddiolchgar ein bod yn gwneud cystal. Caiff ein llwyddiannau eu hategu gan John Marek a chan wefan Ymlaen Cymru, lle y gofynnir y cwestiwn a yw pethau wedi gwella dan y blaid Lafur; mae dros 85 y cant o'r ymatebwyr yn dweud 'ydynt'.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): It is always good to finish a business statement on a cheery note of support from Carl Sargeant.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae bob amser yn braf diweddu datganiad busnes ar nodyn hwyliog o gefnogaeth oddi wrth Carl Sargeant.

3.40 p.m.

I counted 14 requests this morning from party business managers. Some requests did concern operational matters for other Governments, for the NHS and for other bodies. I think that you will get tired of me repeating the things that I said last week, so I do not intend to repeat myself on issues if there is nothing more to say. However, I will respond to the new points that have been brought up today.

Cyfrifais 14 o geisiadau y bore yma oddi wrth reolwyr busnes y pleidiau. Yr oedd rhai ceisiadau yn ymwneud â materion gweithredol i Lywodraethau eraill, i'r GIG ac i gyrff eraill. Credaf y byddwch yn blino arnaf yn ailadrodd y pethau a ddywedais yr wythnos diwethaf, felly ni fwriadaf fy ailadrodd fy hun am faterion os nad oes dim rhagor i'w ddweud. Ymatebaf, fodd bynnag, i'r pwyntiau newydd a godwyd heddiw.

Lisa, I found what you said extraordinary. You made one of your more puzzling requests this morning. You wanted an opportunity for the First Minister to make a statement on how we organise Assembly business. The decisions are for me, the Business Minister, to make and you question me on them, every week, during the business statement. Any discussions or comments on how the Assembly should operate post 2007, when we have our new Government of Wales Act and we take it forward, should be aimed at our new standing orders committee, in which I know, Lisa, you are looking forward to playing a full part.

Lisa, teimlwn fod yr hyn a ddywedasoch yn hynod. Yr oedd eich cais y bore yma yn un o'r rhai rhyfeddaf gennych. Yr oeddech am gael cyfle i'r Prif Weinidog wneud datganiad ynghylch sut yr ydym yn trefnu busnes y Cynulliad. Mater i mi, y Trefnydd, yw gwneud y penderfyniadau ac yr ydych yn fy nghwestiynu yn eu cylch, bob wythnos, yn ystod y datganiad busnes. Dylai unrhyw drafodaethau neu sylwadau ynghylch sut y dylai'r Cynulliad weithredu ar ôl 2007, pan fydd gennym ein Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru newydd a phan fyddwn yn ei rhoi ar waith, gael eu hanelu at ein pwyllgor rheolau sefydlog newydd, pwyllgor y gwn, Lisa, eich bod yn edrych ymlaen at chwarae rhan lawn ynddo.

Ieuan, Lisa and Peter, you all raised issues around the Eurostat figures. Those figures give a three-year moving average, which is rising. If Tony Blair had not done the deal before Christmas, we would not have had that extra money that will now be going into your communities. If we had not done the deal on the budget, you would not have that. You should look at the good news. For example, unemployment is down by 30 per cent, claimant count is down by more than 40 per cent, and the figures for gross value added and gross disposable household income per head have all grown faster in Wales than the UK average. Are you interested in those statistics? Why do you not bring those figures to my attention as issues for debate and matters for the business statement? I hope that you will join us in

Ieuan, Lisa a Peter, bu ichi oll godi materion ynghylch y ffigurau Eurostat. Mae'r ffigurau hynny'n rhoi ffigur cyfartalog dros gyfnod o dair blynedd, ffigur sy'n codi. Pe bai Tony Blair heb daro'r fargen cyn y Nadolig, ni fyddem wedi cael yr arian ychwanegol a fydd yn awr yn mynd i'ch cymunedau. Pe na baem wedi taro'r fargen ynghylch y gyllideb, ni fyddai hynny gennych. Dylech edrych ar y newyddion da. Er enghraifft, mae diweithdra i lawr 30 y cant, mae nifer yr hawlwyd i lawr dros 40 y cant, ac mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer gwerth ychwanegol crynswth ac incwm aelwydydd crynswth i'w wario y pen oll wedi tyfu'n gynt yng Nghymru na'r ffigur cyfartalog ar gyfer y DU. A oes gennych ddi-ddordeb yn yr ystadegau hynny? Pam na wnewch ddwyn fy sylw at y ffigurau hynny fel materion i'w trafod a materion ar gyfer y

celebrating those successes.

On police mergers, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has not had any discussions with Peter Hain on the issue. She has issued a statement; she is dealing with this matter with the UK Government and you have been updated on the situation week after week. I will not repeat myself on that issue. You have had written statements on carbon emissions. That was promised, as was a statement on Printpac Ltd. It is regrettable that there have been difficulties with the CRB checks, but that is not a matter for the Welsh Assembly Government.

I also welcome the fact, as I hope that you will, that the Welsh Rugby Union is launching its child protection campaign tomorrow. It is taking the matter seriously and I am glad, as the Minister with responsibility for children, that I will be there at the launch because that will be key for community rugby in Wales.

There is a point on the issues around exams. Jane Davidson has had a useful meeting which has resulted in her feeling that the time to make a statement on the matter will be 6 June. She is due to meet union representatives and the dates for those meetings are being finalised. That will be the time to make a statement, after those meetings, but she had a constructive meeting yesterday with the representatives of Higher Education Wales. That is an update and it was important that I, as Business Minister, brought that to you as part of the business statement.

In terms of the way forward, Carl, you offer us so many opportunities for items that could be included in the business statement. We will, of course, be consulting further on the transport plan. We were all delighted to see the Airbus A380 lift off and fly over Broughton. In terms of manufacturing, the First Minister was at the Ford factory to press the button on the new S16 Ford engine. That development will bring an extra 250 jobs to the area, to Ford, which is developing as we

datganiad busnes? Gobeithiaf yr ymunwch â ni i ddathlu'r llwyddiannau hynny.

O ran uno'r heddluoedd, ni chafodd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ddim trafodaethau gyda Peter Hain am y mater. Mae hi wedi rhyddhau datganiad; mae hi'n delio â'r mater gyda Llywodraeth y DU ac fe'ch hysbyswyd am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf wythnos ar ôl wythnos. Nid ailadroddaf fy hun ynghylch y mater hwnnw. Cawsoch ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig am ollyngiadau carbon. Addawyd hynny, yn ogystal â datganiad am Printpac Ltd. Mae'n resyn bod anawsterau wedi bod gydag archwiliadau'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol, ond nid yw hynny'n fater i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Croesawaf hefyd, fel y gwnewch chithau gobeithio, y ffaith bod Undeb Rygbi Cymru yn lansio ei ymgyrch amddiffyn plant yfory. Mae'n cymryd y mater o ddifrif ac yr wyf yn falch, fel y Gweinidog gyda'r cyfrifoldeb dros blant, y byddaf yno yn y lansiad oherwydd y bydd hynny'n allweddol i rygbi cymunedol yng Nghymru.

Mae pwynt ynghylch y problemau'n ymwneud ag arholiadau. Cafodd Jane Davidson gyfarfod defnyddiol sydd wedi peri iddi deimlo mai 6 Mehefin fydd yr amser i wneud datganiad am y mater. Bydd yn cwrdd â chynrychiolwyr yr undebau ac mae'r dyddiadau pendant ar gyfer y cyfarfodydd hynny'n cael eu trefnu. Dyna'r adeg i wneud datganiad, ar ôl y cyfarfodydd hynny, ond cafodd gyfarfod adeiladol ddoe gyda chynrychiolwyr Addysg Uwch Cymru. Adroddiad ar y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf yw hynny ac yr oedd yn bwysig fy mod i, fel Trefnydd, yn rhoi hynny ichi fel rhan o'r datganiad busnes.

O ran y ffordd ymlaen, Carl, cynigiwch inni gynifer o gyfleoedd ar gyfer eitemau y gellid eu cynnwys yn y datganiad busnes. Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn ymgynghori ymhellach ynghylch y cynllun trafndiaeth. Yr oeddem oll wrth ein bodd o weld Bws Awyr A380 yn codi ac yn hedfan dros Frychdyn. O safbwynt gweithgynhyrchu, yr oedd y Prif Weinidog yn ffatri Ford i bwyso'r botwm ar y peiriant Ford S16 newydd. Bydd y datblygiad hwnnw'n dod â 250 o swyddi ychwanegol i'r

speak. That is what we have to look at in terms of our record on manufacturing in Wales.

ardal, i Ford, cwmni sy'n datblygu y funud hon. Dyna'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni edrych arno o safbwynt ein record ym maes gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru.

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.

Motion defeated.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Treuliau Teithio a Pheidio â Chodi Tâl) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3049)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006 in relation to the draft the National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (Travelling Expenses and Remission of Charges) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3050)

These regulations update the capital limits in calculating the entitlement to payment of travel expenses and remission of charges in the use of NHS services by people on a low income. Many amendments were tabled to the original regulations, and, following the report of the Legislation Committee, I intend to consolidate these regulations during the coming year in time for next year's uprating exercise. This will be a complex exercise, as the regulations, with their various amendments, run to over 100 pages and involve many links to non-devolved legislative matters.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn oherwydd ychydig iawn o bobl a gaiff eu heffeithio gan y newidiadau hyn.

Manteisiaf ar y cyfle i godi dau bwnc cysylltiedig. Nid ydynt wedi eu cynnwys yn

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Treuliau Teithio a Pheidio â Chodi Tâl) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3049)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Treuliau Teithio a Pheidio â Chodi Tâl) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Treuliau Teithio a Pheidio â Chodi Tâl) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3050)

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn diweddarau'r terfynau cyfalaf wrth weithio allan hawl pobl ar incwm isel i'w treuliau teithio gael eu talu a pheidio â chodi tâl am ddefnyddio gwasanaethau'r GIG. Cyflwynwyd llawer o welliannau i'r rheoliadau gwreiddiol, ac yn dilyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau, bwriadaf gadarnhau'r rheoliadau hyn yn ystod y flwyddyn sydd i ddod mewn pryd ar gyfer yr uwchraddio y flwyddyn nesaf. Bydd hyn yn waith cymhleth, gan fod y rheoliadau, gyda'u hamrywiol welliannau, dros 100 o dudalennau a bod ynddynt lawer o gysylltiadau â materion deddfwriaethol nas datganolwyd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: We will support these regulations as very few people will be affected by the changes.

I take this opportunity to raise two related subjects. They are not included in the

y rheoliadau, ond maent yn gysylltiedig o ran y costau y mae cleifion yn gorfod eu hwynebu. Yr wyf yn siŵr, Weinidog, eich bod chi, fel minnau, yn gwybod bod llawer o gleifion yn gorfod ymweld yn gyson ag ysbytai; pobl sy'n dioddef o ganser neu sydd angen gwasanaeth dialysis, er enghraifft. Oherwydd eu hymweliadau cyson, rhaid i'r rhain wynebu costau teithio a chostau parcio pan fyddant wedi cyrraedd yr ysbyty. A wnewch chi ymrwmo i edrych ar y costau hyn, i weld sut y gellir cynorthwyo'r bobl hyn sydd, yn aml, ar incwm isel o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i'w salwch?

Mae achos diweddar yn Llys Cyfiawnder Ewrop, sef Watts yn erbyn ymddiriedolaeth gofal sylfaenol Bedford a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Iechyd, yn golygu y gall pobl gael triniaeth ar y cyfandir os na chânt y driniaeth honno yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Gyda'r rhestrau aros mor hir yng Nghymru, golyga hynny y bydd—cewch ysgwyd eich pen, Weinidog, ond mae'n dilyn y bydd llawer o Gymru yn chwilio am driniaeth ar y cyfandir. A fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynorthwyo'r bobl hynny gyda'u costau gan y byddant yn cael eu gorfodi i chwilio am driniaeth ar y cyfandir?

Jenny Randerson: I echo Rhodri Glyn Thomas's concerns about the cost of travel for many patients. The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the regulations, and I take this opportunity to welcome the fact that capital limits will be higher in Wales than they are in England. I particularly welcome the fact that the capital limit has increased from £14,500 to £16,000. However, the problem is that, actually, these regulations are narrow; it is estimated that they will only affect about 150 people in Wales. Nevertheless, local health boards, once again, have an additional cost to absorb, and I believe that this particular cost will come from their drugs budget, which I find unusual. We would have welcomed an even higher capital limit.

As Rhodri Glyn Thomas said, there is a great deal of concern about the cost of travel for patients, and it is a complex issue. It is sad, but true, that many NHS trusts rely on the income from parking fees to boost funds to treat patients. The situation is complex

regulations, but they are connected in terms of the costs that patients have to carry. I am sure, Minister, that you, like me, know that many patients have to visit hospitals regularly; cancer or dialysis patients, for example. Because these people have to visit so regularly, they have to face travel costs and, once they have reached the hospital, parking costs. Will you make a commitment to look at these costs, to see how these people, who are often on a low income as a direct result of their illness, can be assisted?

The recent case in the European Court of Justice of Watts versus Bedford Primary Care Trust and the Secretary of State for Health means that people can have treatment on the continent if they cannot receive it in the United Kingdom. With Welsh waiting lists being so long, that means that there will be—you can shake your head, Minister, but it follows that many people from Wales will seek treatment on the continent. Will the Government of Wales assist those people with their costs since they will be forced to look for treatment on the continent?

Jenny Randerson: Ategaf bryderon Rhodri Glyn Thomas am gost teithio i lawer o gleifion. Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau, a chymeraf y cyfle hwn i groesawu'r ffaith y bydd y terfynau cyfalaf yn uwch yng Nghymru nag y maent yn Lloegr. Croesawaf yn arbennig y ffaith bod y terfyn cyfalaf wedi codi o £14,500 i £16,000. Fodd bynnag, y broblem yw bod y rheoliadau hyn mewn gwirionedd yn gyfyng; amcangyfrifir mai dim ond ar ryw 150 o bobl yng Nghymru y byddant yn effeithio. Er hynny, mae gan y byrddau iechyd lleol, eto fyth, gost ychwanegol i'w hysgwyddo, a chredaf y daw'r gost arbennig hon o'u cyllideb gyffuriau, sydd yn anarferol iawn yn fy marn i. Byddem wedi croesawu terfyn cyfalaf uwch fyth.

Fel y dywedodd Rhodri Glyn Thomas, mae cryn bryder am gost teithio i gleifion, ac mae'n fater cymhleth. Y caswir yw bod llawer o ymddiriedolaethau GIG yn dibynnu ar incwm o ffioedd parcio i ychwanegu at eu cyllid i drin cleifion. Mae'r sefyllfa'n

throughout Wales; there are places where deterring parking is necessary to prevent the hospital becoming a free car park for the whole town and so on. However, you have an opportunity to look at the issue of a uniform travel scheme for those on a low income. The financial impact on cancer patients, for example, who must visit regularly over a long period of time for out-patient treatment, is yet another burden that they must bear, and it is of real concern for them and their families. In some circumstances, it can hinder their ability to recover. I urge the Minister to devise a new scheme for Wales that is more generous.

3.50 p.m.

Another key issue is awareness of the scheme. Why have only 150 people in Wales been estimated to come under its umbrella? Very often, awareness of the scheme relies on clinicians and nurses having the time, incentive or awareness to discuss the availability of the scheme with patients. I have come across several constituents who would probably have been eligible for the scheme but were not made aware of it. I urge the Minister to ensure that the scheme is widely publicised and that it is not left to individual doctors or nurses to refer to it when they see patients.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): It would be fair to say that we have gone down a few cul-de-sacs with regard to this debate. However, in terms of the issues that are immediately relevant, and on Jenny's last point, only 150 people are affected because that is the number of people where the calculation of capital charges relates to their travel expenses. It is not a reflection of the number of people who avail of assistance with travel expenses; that number is many multiples higher. This is a very small sub-group, and it is only because calculating capital charges is such a small part of the overall scheme that the number in Wales is so small.

gymhleth ledled Cymru; fe gewch fannau lle y mae'n angenrheidiol atal parcio rhag i'r ysbyty ddod yn faes parcio am ddim i'r dref gyfan, ac yn y blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae gennych gyfle i edrych ar bwnc cynllun teithio unffurf i'r sawl sydd ar incwm isel. Mae'r effaith ariannol ar gleifion canser, er enghraifft, sydd yn gorfod ymweld yn rheolaidd dros gyfnod maith o amser i gael triniaeth fel cleifion allanol, yn faich arall eto iddynt ei ysgwyddo, ac mae'n bryder gwirioneddol iddynt hwy a'u teuluoedd. Dan rai amgylchiadau, gall lesteirio eu gallu i wella. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i ddyfeisio cynllun newydd a mwy hael ar gyfer Cymru.

Pwnc allweddol arall yw ymwybyddiaeth o'r cynllun. Pam mai dim ond 150 o bobl yng Nghymru sydd, yn ôl yr amcangyfrif, wedi eu cynnwys ynddo? Yn aml iawn, mae ymwybyddiaeth o'r cynllun yn dibynnu ar faint o amser, cymhelliad neu ymwybyddiaeth sydd gan weithwyr clinigol a nyrsys i drafod gyda chleifion i ba raddau y mae'r cynllun ar gael. Yr wyf wedi dod ar draws llawer o etholwyr a fyddai, mae'n debyg, wedi bod yn gymwys ar gyfer y cynllun ond a oedd heb fod yn ymwybodol ohono. Anogaf y Gweinidog i sicrhau bod y cynllun yn cael cyhoeddusrwydd eang, ac na wneir ond gadael i feddygon neu nyrsys unigol gyfeirio ato pan fyddant yn gweld cleifion.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Byddai'n deg dweud inni fynd ar hyd ambell ffordd bengoll gyda'r ddadl hon. Fodd bynnag, o ran y pynciau sy'n uniongyrchol berthnasol, ac ynghylch pwynt diwethaf Jenny, dim ond ar 150 o bobl yr effeithir am mai dyna nifer y bobl lle y mae a wnelo cyfrifo taliadau cyfalaf â'u treuliau teithio. Nid yw'n adlewyrchu nifer y bobl sydd yn manteisio ar gymorth gyda threuliau teithio; mae'r nifer hwnnw'n fwy o lawer iawn. Is-grŵp bach iawn yw hwn, a dim ond oherwydd bod cyfrifo taliadau cyfalaf yn rhan mor fach o'r cynllun yn gyffredinol y mae'r nifer yng Nghymru mor fach.

I understand the concerns about car parking and, at some stage, one would like to see progress made on this issue. We have had enough debates in recent weeks in the Assembly to highlight that the NHS in Wales is under considerable pressure from a financial point of view. In addressing this concern, which is a legitimate area for representations, we must look at it in the overall context of the priorities that we face in the national health service. The points are well made, but now is probably not the most optimum time to seek progress on it, although we understand the sentiments behind the concern.

To clarify Rhodri Glyn's point about the Watts case—in case it grows a pair of legs and starts running—going abroad for treatment in Europe was not dependent on treatment not being available in the United Kingdom. The point of the Watts case was that treatment was available in the United Kingdom, and, therefore, you can only seek treatment abroad if the treatment is available in the United Kingdom. It is a vital qualification in the implications of the Watts case. The issue to which the Watts case gave rise was access to treatment—if the access to treatment available in the United Kingdom is not deemed to be reasonable on the basis of clinical assessment of the patient, the patient will be in a position to seek the opportunity to go abroad. However, the first step must be that the treatment is available in the United Kingdom, and it is important to clear up that point.

Otherwise, I am pleased that we have had qualified positive comments about the regulations, and I urge you to support them.

Deallaf y pryderon ynghylch parcio ceir, ac fe garai rhywun rywbyrd weld symud ymlaen yn hyn o beth. Cawsom ddigon o ddadleuon yn ystod yr wythnosau diwethaf yn y Cynulliad i bwysleisio'r ffaith bod y GIG yng Nghymru dan gryn bwysau o safbwynt ariannol. Wrth ymdrin â'r pryder hwn, sydd yn faes dilys i wneud sylwadau arno, rhaid inni edrych arno yng nghyd-destun cyffredinol y blaenoriaethau a wynebwn yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol. Mae'r pwyntiau'n rhai da, ond mae'n debyg nad yn awr yw'r amser gorau i geisio cael cynnydd ar y mater, er ein bod yn deall y teimladau y tu ôl i'r pryder.

Er mwyn bod yn glir ynghylch pwynt Rhodri Glyn ynglŷn ag achos Watts—rhag ofn i hynny gael ei chwyddo—nid oedd mynd dramor am driniaeth yn Ewrop yn dibynnu ar fetu â chael triniaeth yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Y pwynt yn achos Watts oedd bod triniaeth ar gael yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac felly, ni allwch geisio cael triniaeth dramor oni bai fod y driniaeth ar gael yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae hyn yn amod hollbwysig yn oblygiadau achos Watts. Y cwestiwn a enynnwyd gan achos Watts oedd cael mynediad at driniaeth—os nad ydys yn barnu bod y mynediad at driniaeth sydd ar gael yn y Deyrnas Unedig yn rhesymol ar sail asesiad clinigol o'r claf, bydd y claf yn gallu chwilio am gyfle i fynd dramor. Fodd bynnag, y cam cyntaf hanfodol yw bod y driniaeth ar gael yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ac mae'n bwysig bod yn glir ar y pwynt hwnnw.

Fel arall, yr wyf yn falch ein bod wedi cael sylwadau cadarnhaol amodol am y rheoliadau, ac yr wyf yn eich annog i'w cefnogi.

*Cynnig (NDM3049): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3049): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3050): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3050): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice

Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006

Motion (NDM3051): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3051): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006.

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
 Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
 Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

believes that the proposed valuation table based on age-related average prices alone will not provide fair compensation, especially for pedigree animals, as it will only serve to overvalue animals of poorer condition and quality and undervalue animals of higher condition and quality;

yn credu na fydd y tabl prisio arfaethedig sy'n seiliedig ar brisiau cyfartalog yn ôl oedran yn unig yn cynnig iawndal teg, yn enwedig am anifeiliaid pedigri, gan y bydd yn gorbriso anifeiliaid o gyflwr ac ansawdd is, ac yn tanbriso anifeiliaid o gyflwr ac ansawdd gwell;

believes that an appeal system should be available to resolve disputed valuations;

yn credu y dylid cyflwyno system apelio i ddatrys prisiadau dadleuol;

expects the Minister to bring forward revised compensation measures by 30 June 2006.

yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog gyflwyno mesurau iawndal wedi'u diwygio erbyn 30 Mehefin 2006.

Motion (NDM3052): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3052): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006 in relation to the draft the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006;

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006; and

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006; ac

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3052)

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3052)

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 to NDM3051 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM3051 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that:

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3051)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3051)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006 in relation to the draft the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006; a

2. *approves that the draft the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:*

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006;

b) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006; and

c) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006. (NDM3052)

It is clear that cattle compensation policy requires an overhaul. Our aim is to increase transparency and fairness while enhancing controls that will protect the taxpayer from excessive payments. We also want to remove inconsistencies that are built through the case-by-case approach of the compensation policy by producing a system where compensation is determined by the value of the animal and not the disease that is contracted. Our longer-term objective is to rationalise compensation for all notifiable cattle diseases but, in this first stage, the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006 will introduce a new table-based cattle compensation system in Wales for bovine tuberculosis, brucellosis and enzootic bovine leucosis. Separate legislation is proposed to introduce the system dealing with bovine spongiform encephalopathy.

I recognise that, for many of our farmers, bovine TB is the most significant and worrying health issue that they have to face with regard to their animals. Therefore, the decision to introduce new compensation arrangements for owners of cattle affected by bovine TB and the three other notifiable diseases was not taken lightly.

Bovine TB compensation is currently determined through individual valuations. However, there is a substantial body of evidence that suggests that using individual valuations results in widespread overcompensation, and that constitutes a

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006;

b) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006; ac

c) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006. (NDM3052)

Mae'n glir bod angen ailwampio ein polisi iawndal gwartheg. Ein nod yw cynyddu tryloywder a thegwch gan wella camau rheoli a fydd yn gwarchod y trethdalwr rhag taliadau gormodol. Yr ydym hefyd am ddileu anghysonderau sy'n deillio o ddull y polisi iawndal o ymdrin â hyn fesul achos drwy gynhyrchu system lle y pennir iawndal yn ôl gwerth yr anifail yn hytrach na'r clefyd sydd arno. Ein nod yn y tymor hir yw rhesymoli'r iawndal am bob clefyd gwartheg hysbysadwy, ond yn y cam cyntaf hwn, bydd Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006 yn cyflwyno system iawndal gwartheg newydd sy'n seiliedig ar dabl yng Nghymru ar gyfer twbercwlosis buchol, brwselosis a lewcosis buchol ensöotig. Bwriedir cael deddfwriaeth ar wahân i gyflwyno'r system sy'n delio ag enseffalopathi sbyngffurf buchol.

Yr wyf yn cydnabod mai TB mewn gwartheg, i lawer o'n ffermwyr, yw'r broblem iechyd fwyaf arwyddocaol, ac sy'n peri mwyaf o bryder, y mae'n rhaid iddynt ei hwynebu o ran eu hanifeiliaid. Felly, nid ar chwarae bach y cymerwyd y penderfyniad i gyflwyno trefniadau iawndal newydd i berchenogion gwartheg yr effeithir arnynt gan TB buchol a'r tri chlefyd hysbysadwy arall.

Pennir iawndal am TB mewn gwartheg ar hyn o bryd drwy brisiadau unigol. Fodd bynnag, mae corff sylweddol o dystiolaeth sy'n awgrymu bod defnyddio prisiadau unigol yn arwain at orddigolledu ar raddfa helaeth, ac mae hynny'n gamddefnydd clir ac

clear and unacceptable misuse of taxpayers' money. Those are not my words. I should inform the Assembly that the evidence for overcompensation stems largely from a report on TB compensation, issued by the National Audit Office Wales, which concluded that compensation was between 50 and 100 per cent higher than underlying market prices. In other words, many farmers are having twice as much as they should in compensation. No rational Member could possibly support the situation as it is. Two reviews carried out by the internal audit service of the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, and separate studies carried out by two universities, suggest that, in 20 to 35 per cent of cases, there is a net benefit to farmers financially if there is a TB breakdown on their farm. That calls into question the incentive that there is for farmers to do something themselves about biosecurity if the present compensation system remains.

I would be failing in my responsibility to taxpayers and farmers if I did not deal robustly with the independently verified evidence of overcompensation and ensure that there is every incentive to farmers to introduce good biosecurity measures. It might be helpful to summarise how the new arrangements will work. Compensation will be determined using table valuations based on average sales prices for 47 predetermined cattle categories, which were drawn up in consultation with the industry and which are already in place in England. To support the system, sales data will be continuously collected by an independent service provider from a large number and wide range of sources across Great Britain, including sources such as store markets, prime markets, rearing calf sales, breeding sales and dispersal sales. All of this is being done to ensure that the compensation paid for the table system reflects a fair value in terms of market price.

It is also worth remembering that the compensation that would be paid would be based on the value of a healthy animal, not of a diseased animal, which is what the payment

annerbyniol o arian y trethdalwyr. Nid fi biau'r geiriau hynny. Dylwn hysbysu'r Cynulliad fod y dystiolaeth ynghylch iawndal gormodol yn deillio'n bennaf o adroddiad ar iawndal TB, a gyhoeddwyd gan Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru, a ddaeth i'r casgliad bod yr iawndal rhwng 50 a 100 y cant yn uwch na phrisiau gwaelodol y farchnad. Mewn geiriau eraill, mae llawer o ffermwyr yn cael cymaint ddwywaith ag y dylent ei gael o iawndal. Nid oes dim dichon i'r un Aelod rhesymol gefnogi'r sefyllfa fel y mae. Mae dau adolygiad a gynhaliwyd gan wasanaeth archwilio mewnol Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, ac astudiaethau ar wahân a wnaed gan ddwy brifysgol, yn awgrymu, mewn 20 i 35 y cant o achosion, fod mantais ariannol net i ffermwyr os digwydd TB ar eu fferm. Mae hynny'n bwrw amheuaeth ar y cymhelliad sydd i ffermwyr wneud rhywbeth eu hunain ynghylch bioddiogelwch os erys y system iawndal bresennol.

Byddwn yn ddiffygiol o ran fy nghyfrifoldeb tuag at drethdalwyr a ffermwyr pe na bawn yn delio'n gadarn â'r dystiolaeth a ddilyswyd yn annibynnol ynghylch gorddigolledu ac yn sicrhau bod pob cymhelliad i ffermwyr gyflwyno camau bioddiogelwch da. Gall fod o gymorth crynhoi sut y bydd y trefniadau newydd yn gweithio. Pennir iawndal gan ddefnyddio prisiau tabl sy'n seiliedig ar brisiau gwerthiant cyfartalog ar gyfer 47 o gategoriâu gwartheg sydd eisoes wedi eu pennu, a luniwyd drwy ymgynghori â'r diwydiant ac sydd eisoes yn bodoli yn Lloegr. I gefnogi'r system, cesglir data gwerthiannau yn barhaus gan ddarparwr gwasanaeth annibynnol o nifer fawr ac ystod eang o ffynonellau ledled Prydain Fawr, gan gynnwys ffynonellau megis marchnadoedd stôr, marchnadoedd da tew, arwerthiannau lloi magu, arwerthiannau bridio ac arwerthiannau buchesi. Mae hyn oll yn cael ei wneud i sicrhau bod yr iawndal a delir am y system dabl yn adlewyrchu gwerth teg o ran pris y farchnad.

Y mae'n werth cofio hefyd y byddai'r iawndal a delid yn seiliedig ar werth anifail iach, nid anifail claf, sef yr hyn y telir amdano. Felly, nid yw'r ddadl sy'n awgrymu

is being made for. Therefore, the argument that suggests that there is some kind of possible undercompensation is not true because we know that these animals are diseased animals and have a lower market value in any event. Therefore, from that point of view, there is certainly no undercompensation.

The views of stakeholders have been sought at all stages in drawing up the scheme. There has been an increase in the number of categories from 29 to 47 to take into account the concerns that have been raised.

4.00 p.m.

I am also aware of the concerns raised in relation to the perceived undercompensation of high-value pedigree cattle. Such cattle account for some 50 per cent of the compensation payments made under the old system, and so cannot be excluded from the table valuation system. However, separate tables are being introduced under this legislation for pedigree and commercial cattle, based on separately collected market prices.

The National Audit Office Wales has identified a difficulty that leads to taxpayers' money being used for overcompensation. I do not believe that that situation can be justified under any circumstances. Many millions of pounds have been paid in overcompensation, and that will continue to happen in the future if the Order is unsuccessful.

On the amendment tabled by the opposition parties, I have listened carefully to the arguments that have been put forward in committee and in meetings that I have had with various representatives of opposition parties, but I cannot accept any system that still has independent valuations, because that does not get rid of the underlying problem of overcompensation. Whatever we have considered, we have not been able to get around this particular problem. As long as individual valuation is involved, taxpayers will be paying too much money to people who should not be getting overcompensation. That cannot do farming much good in the

bod rhyw fath o danddigolledu o bosibl yn wir, oherwydd ein bod yn gwybod mai anifeiliaid claf yw'r rhain a bod eu gwerth ar y farchnad yn is beth bynnag. Felly, o'r safbwynt hwnnw, yn sicr nid oes tanddigolledu.

Gofynnwyd am farn rhanddeiliaid ym mhob cam wrth lunio'r cynllun. Cododd nifer y categorïau o 29 i 47 er mwyn ystyried y pryderon a godwyd.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol hefyd o'r pryderon a fynegwyd ynglŷn â'r tanddigolledu tybiedig am wartheg pedigri gwerthfawr. Mae gwartheg o'r fath yn cyfrif am tua 50 y cant o'r taliadau iawndal a wnaed o dan yr hen system, ac felly ni ellir eu heithrio o'r system tablau prisio. Fodd bynnag, mae tablau ar wahân yn cael eu cyflwyno o dan y ddeddfwriaeth hon ar gyfer gwartheg pedigri a masnachol, sy'n seiliedig ar brisiau'r farchnad a gasglwyd ar wahân.

Mae Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru wedi canfod anhawster sy'n golygu bod arian y trethdalwyr yn cael ei ddefnyddio i orddigolledu. Nid wyf yn credu bod modd cyfiawnhau'r sefyllfa honno mewn unrhyw amgylchiadau. Mae miliynau lawer o bunnoedd wedi cael eu talu i orddigolledu, a bydd hynny'n parhau i ddiwydd yn y dyfodol os na fydd y Gorchymyn yn llwyddiannus.

O ran y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd gan y gwrthbleidiau, yr wyf wedi gwrando'n astud ar y dadleuon a roddwyd gerbron yn y pwyllgor ac mewn cyfarfodydd yr wyf wedi eu cynnal gyda gwahanol gynrychiolwyr o'r gwrthbleidiau, ond ni allaf dderbyn dim un system sy'n cadw prisio annibynnol, oherwydd nid yw hynny'n dileu'r broblem sylfaenol o orddigolledu. Beth bynnag yr ydym wedi ei ystyried, nid ydym wedi llwyddo i oresgyn y broblem arbennig hon. Cyn belled â bod prisio unigol yn parhau, bydd trethdalwyr yn talu gormod o arian i bobl na ddylent fod yn cael eu gorddigolledu. Ni all hynny wneud fawr o les i ffermio yn y

longer term, because the taxpayer will resent paying that money.

The second point made in the amendment is that there should be an appeals system. Again, I cannot for the life of me see how such a system could work. There cannot possibly be a tribunal that sits after a valuation and after an animal has been slaughtered to second-guess what an independent valuer has done. In addition, introducing yet another valuation into the system would introduce delay, which would mean difficulties with animal welfare and, potentially, as regards the spread of disease in the future.

I believe that this system is fair to affected cattle owners and to the taxpayer. We have to deal with the issue of overcompensation. We have considered many ways in which to try to deal with it, but if independent valuation remains in the system, taxpayers will continue to pay more than they should. On that basis, I move the motion.

Elin Jones: Cynigiad welliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis a Peter Black. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu na fydd y tabl prisio arfaethedig sy'n seiliedig ar brisiau cyfartalog yn ôl oedran yn unig yn cynnig iawndal teg, yn enwedig am anifeiliaid pedigri, gan y bydd yn gorbrisio anifeiliaid o gyflwr ac ansawdd is, ac yn tanbrisio anifeiliaid o gyflwr ac ansawdd gwell;

yn credu y dylid cyflwyno system apelio i ddatrys prisiadau dadleuol;

yn disgwyl i'r Gweinidog gyflwyno mesurau iawndal wedi'u diwygio erbyn 30 Mehefin 2006.

Yn ôl y Gweinidog, mae'r Gorchymyn hwn yn cael ei gyflwyno fel ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad archwiliad y Cynulliad yn 2004, fel pe bai'r Gweinidog a'i swyddogion wedi eistedd i lawr i ddyfeisio'r Gorchymyn i gwrdd â phryderon Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru. Fodd bynnag, nid dyna sydd o'n blaenau. 'Cut and paste' o'r Gorchymyn a gyflwynwyd yn Lloegr yn

tymor hir, gan y bydd trethdalwyr yn anfodlon talu'r arian hwnnw.

Yr ail bwynt a wneir yn y gwelliant yw y dylid cael system apelio. Unwaith eto, ni allaf yn fy myw weld sut y gallai system o'r fath weithio. Ni ellir cael tribiwnlys sy'n cwrdd ar ôl i brisio ddigwydd ac ar ôl i anifail gael ei ladd i sgil-feirmiadu'r hyn y mae prisiwr annibynnol wedi ei wneud. Hefyd, byddai cyflwyno prisiad arall i'r system yn arwain at oedi, a byddai hynny'n golygu anawsterau o ran lles anifeiliaid ac, o bosibl, o ran lledaenu clefydau yn y dyfodol.

Credaf fod y system hon yn deg i berchnogion gwartheg ac i'r trethdalwr. Rhaid inni ddelio â phroblem gorddigolledu. Yr ydym wedi ystyried sawl ffordd i geisio delio â hynny, ond os bydd prisiu annibynnol yn parhau yn y system, bydd trethdalwyr yn parhau i dalu mwy nag a ddylent. Ar sail hynny, cymeradwyaf y cynnig.

Elin Jones: I propose amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Lisa Francis and Peter Black. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the proposed valuation table based on age-related average prices alone will not provide fair compensation, especially for pedigree animals, as it will serve only to overvalue animals of poorer condition and quality and undervalue animals of higher condition and quality;

believes that an appeals system should be available to resolve disputed valuations;

expects the Minister to bring forward revised compensation measures by 30 June 2006.

According to the Minister, this Order is presented to us as the Government's response to the Assembly's audit report in 2004, as though the Minister and his officials had sat down around the table to draw up the Order to allay the fears of the Auditor General for Wales. However, that is not the case. This legislation is actually just a cut and paste of the Order that has just been introduced in

ddiweddar yw'r ddeddfwriaeth hon mewn gwirionedd. England.

Yr oedd nifer o argymhellion yn yr adroddiad archwilio yn cyfeirio at yr angen i dynhau'r broses o werthuso anifeiliaid a monitro hynny. Mae Plaid Cymru yn cytuno â hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid oedd argymhelliad gan yr archwilydd y dylid cyflwyno system o bris cyfartalog. Penderfyniad gwleidyddol gan y Llywodraeth yw sail y Gorchymyn hwn.

The audit report contained a number of recommendations that referred to the need to firm up the process of valuing animals and monitoring that process. Plaid Cymru agrees with that. However, the auditor did not recommend that an average price system be introduced. Therefore, this Order is the result of a political decision by the Government.

Mae sawl problem gyda'r drefn a gynigir gan y Gweinidog. Fodd bynnag, y broblem bennaf yw bod y drefn, yn ei hanfod, yn annheg. Drwy gynnig pris cyfartalog ar gyfer pob buwch, bydd perchnogion y da gorau yn cael eu tanddiggolledu, tra bydd perchnogion y da o'r ansawdd gwaethaf yn cael eu gorddiggolledu. A yw'n ddefnydd doeth o arian cyhoeddus i greu system a fydd yn caniatáu i berchnogion yr anifeiliaid o'r ansawdd gwaethaf gael y fargen iawndal orau? Er bod gwerth yr anifeiliaid yn is na'r pris cyfartalog, bydd y perchnogion yn cael y pris cyfartalog yn awtomatig.

There are several problems with the system as proposed by the Minister. However, the main problem is that the system is fundamentally unfair. By offering an average price for all cattle, the owners of the finest cattle will be undercompensated, while the owners of the poorest cattle will be overcompensated. Is it a good use of public funds to create a system that allows the owners of the poorest cattle to get the best deal as regards compensation? Although the value of the animals is lower than the average, the owners will automatically receive the average price.

Mae gwendidau eraill yn y drefn a gynigir heddiw. Dim ond un categori sydd ar gyfer da sydd wedi bwrw llo. Felly, mae'r un pris yn cael ei gynnig am fuwch sydd wedi bwrw llo unwaith ag a gynigir am fuwch sydd wedi bwrw llo wyth gwaith, er ei bod yn amlwg bod eu gwerth yn gwbl wahanol. Peth bach fyddai i'r Gweinidog gynyddu nifer y categorïau o wartheg sydd wedi bwrw llo, ond nid yw wedi gwneud hynny.

There are other shortcomings in the system being proposed today. There is only one category for cattle that have calved. Therefore, the same price is offered for a cow that has calved once as for a cow that has calved eight times, although their value is clearly different. It would be a small step for the Minister to increase the number of categories for cattle that have calved, but he has not done so.

Ni all y drefn hon ddelio â'r gwahaniaethau yng ngwerth gwartheg pedigri. Mae gan y cymdeithasau pedigri, yn enwedig y rhai sydd yn y sector llaeth, gofnodion manwl am anifeiliaid unigol, ac felly mae sail dystiolaeth gref i bob gwerthusiad. Mae'n drasiedi i unrhyw ffermwr pan wêl ei wartheg yn cael eu cymryd o'r ffarm o dan fygythiad achos o TB. Fodd bynnag, mae colli pencampwr pedigri, sydd wedi ei fagu'n ofalus, yn golled oes o waith. Os na fydd gwerth y digolledu yn adlewyrchu gwir werth marchnad yr anifail, mae posibilrwydd o anghydweld difrifol ar ambell fferm yn y dyfodol. Mae'n bwysig cofio bod gwartheg yn cael eu cymryd yn orfodol oherwydd TB er bod y prawf am TB ymhell o fod 100 y

This system cannot deal with the differences in the value of pedigree cattle. The pedigree associations, particularly those in the dairy sector, keep detailed records of individual animals, and therefore there is a strong evidence base for each and every valuation. It is a tragedy for any farmer to see his cattle being taken from the farm under the risk of a TB outbreak. However, losing a pedigree champion, after careful rearing, means the loss of a lifetime's work. If the value of the compensation does not properly reflect the animal's true market value, there is a serious possibility of conflict on some farms in future. We should bear in mind that livestock can be forcibly removed from farms because of TB, although the test for TB is far from

cant yn gywir.

Nid yw ffermwyr eisiau cwyno am y gyfundrefn o dalu iawndal am TB; mae ffermwyr eisiau cael gwared ar TB. Os yw'r Gweinidog o ddifrif o ran lleihau maint yr arian sy'n cael ei dalu fel iawndal, rhaid iddo leihau nifer yr anifeiliaid sy'n dioddef o TB yn gyntaf, gan fod y clefyd yn rhemp mewn ambell ran o'r wlad.

Rhyw ddeufis yn ôl ym Mhwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, cyflwynwyd y pryderon hyn i'r Gweinidog, a phasiwyd pleidlais yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog ailedrych ar y Gorchymyn a chyflwyno system digolledu a oedd yn adlewyrchiad gwell o werth anifeiliaid. Bu i rai ohonom gyfarfod â swyddogion y Gweinidog i drafod sut y gellid gwella'r system. Bu inni ysgrifennu at y Gweinidog, a defnyddiwyd pob cyfle democrataidd yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gyflwyno'n pryderon a gofyn am ddiwygiadau. Er hyn oll, mae'r Gweinidog wedi ein hanwybyddu ac wedi mynnu cadw at ei *cut-and-paste job* o Orchymyn Lloegr.

Pe bai'r Gweinidog am wneud *cut and paste* o unrhyw system, byddai'n well pe bai wedi dewis y gyfundrefn yn Iwerddon lle mae mwy o gategoriâu oedran a phum categori graddio ansawdd. Byddai tabl felly yn dderbyniol, ynghyd â threfniadau penodol i werthuso pedigri, a'r cyfan yn cael ei weithredu gan werthuswyr cyflogedig i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel yr awgrymodd adroddiad yr archwilydd yn 2003.

Heddiw, mae'r Gweinidog eisiau cyflwyno system o ddigolledu lle bydd canran o ffermwyr yn cael eu tanddigolledu am eu gwartheg a ffermwyr eraill yn cael pris gwell na'u haeddiant am eu stoc. Nid yw hynny'n iawn. Nid yw'n welliant i'r system bresennol, ac ni fydd Plaid Cymru yn ei chefnogi. Galwn ar y Gweinidog i ailddrafftio'r Gorchymyn i ymateb i'n pryderon ac i greu system decach yng Nghymru na'r hyn sydd ar waith yn Lloegr. Efallai wedyn y byddwn yn cefnogi'r Gweinidog.

Brynle Williams: Diolch, Lywydd, am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddatl hon.

100 per cent accurate.

Farmers do not want to complain about the compensation system for TB; they want to eradicate TB once and for all. If the Minister is serious about reducing the amounts paid in compensation, then he must first reduce the number of animals affected by TB, as the disease is currently out of control in some parts of the country.

Some two months ago in the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee, we expressed these concerns to the Minister and a vote was passed asking the Minister to review the Order and to introduce a system of compensation that would better reflect the true value of livestock. Some of us met the Minister's officials to discuss how the system could be improved. We wrote to the Minister, and availed ourselves of every democratic opportunity available in the National Assembly to express our concerns and to call for amendments. In spite of all of that, the Minister has ignored us and has insisted on sticking to his *cut-and-paste job* of the English Order.

If the Minister had wanted to do a *cut-and-paste job* of any system, it would have been better had he chosen the Irish system where there are more age categories and five categories for grading quality. Such a table would be acceptable, along with specific arrangements for valuing pedigree animals, with it all being carried out by valuers employed by the Assembly Government, as the auditor's report suggested back in 2003.

Today, the Minister wants to introduce a system of compensation that means that a percentage of farmers will be undercompensated for their cattle while other farmers get a price they do not deserve for their stock. That is not right, and it is not an improvement on the current system. Therefore, Plaid Cymru will not support it. We call on the Minister to redraft the Order to respond to our concerns, and to create a fairer system in Wales than that which currently operates in England. Perhaps then we will support the Minister.

Brynle Williams: Thank you, Presiding Officer, for the opportunity to contribute to

this debate.

I welcome the opportunity to speak on this issue, as it has serious implications for agriculture in Wales. Like you, Minister, I believe that the taxpayer has to be protected; that goes without saying. However, I also believe that this tabular valuation is the wrong way to go about it. You are not attacking the problem correctly, as is clear from the opposition parties' amendment. The tabular system is geared towards overvaluing poor-quality animals, but it is also undervaluing the higher quality animals. There will be massive variation in each of the 47 categories, yet you fail to address that. As Elin has said, we have been over to Ireland to look at the tabular valuations there, and it is a system that appears to be working.

You do not take into consideration the number of times that an animal has calved, as my colleague, Elin Jones, has, once again, said. A first-calf heifer is worth considerably more than a ninth-calf cow. You do not seem to be aware of this. The system ignores these very things that separate the poorest quality animal from the best. An animal at the lower end of a category could fetch £300 or £400, while a second-calf heifer in full profit could be worth £2,000 or more. How will you address that issue, Minister?

Picking average values is grossly unfair, as it will reward the poorer quality animals while penalising farmers who have put considerable effort and expense into improving the quality of their herds. If the same logic were applied to motor cars, a Ford Fiesta and a BMW would be valued at the same price simply because of their year of manufacture. Given the unfairness of this system, it is only right that farmers should be able to appeal against decisions that will affect and destroy their livelihoods.

4.10 p.m.

You have said several times, on record, that farmers are fortunate to be getting compensation, all because TB-infected

Croesawaf y cyfle i siarad ar y mater hwn, gan fod iddo oblygiadau difrifol i amaethyddiaeth yng Nghymru. Fel chithau, Weinidog, credaf fod rhaid amddiffyn y trethdalwr; afraid dweud hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni chredaf mai'r tablau prisio yw'r ffordd orau o ddelio â'r mater. Nid ydych yn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem mewn ffordd effeithiol, fel sy'n cael ei amlygu yng ngwelliant y gwrthbleidiau. Mae'r system tablau'n un sy'n gorbrisio anifeiliaid o ansawdd gwael, ond mae hefyd yn tanbrisio anifeiliaid o ansawdd gwell. Bydd amrywiad enfawr ym mhob un o'r 47 categori, ond nid ydych yn rhoi sylw i hynny. Fel y dywedodd Elin, yr ydym wedi bod yn Iwerddon i edrych ar y prisio ar sail tablau yno, ac mae'n ymddangos bod y system honno'n gweithio yno.

Nid ydych yn ystyried sawl gwaith y mae anifail wedi bwrw llo, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Elin Jones, eto. Mae heffer sydd wedi bwrw un llo yn werth llawer mwy nag un sydd wedi bwrw naw llo. Nid yw'n ymddangos eich bod yn ymwybodol o hyn. Mae'r system yn anwybyddu'r union bethau hyn sy'n gwahaniaethu rhwng yr anifeiliaid gorau a'r rhai salaf. Gallai anifail ar begwn isaf categori fod yn werth £300 neu £400, tra gallai heffer sydd wedi bwrw dau lo sy'n dwyn elw llawn fod yn werth £2,000 neu fwy. Sut yr ydych yn bwriadu datrys yr amryfusedd hwnnw, Weinidog?

Mae dewis prisiau cyfartalog yn gwbl annheg, gan y bydd yn gwobrwyo anifeiliaid o ansawdd is ac yn cosbi ffermwyr sydd wedi ymdrechu'n ddygn ac wedi gwario arian sylweddol i wella ansawdd eu buchesi. Pe baem yn defnyddio'r un ddadl yn achos ceir, byddai gwerth Ford Fiesta a BMW yr un faint oherwydd eu bod wedi eu cynhyrchu yn yr un flwyddyn. Oherwydd bod y system hon yn un annheg, rhaid rhoi cyfle i ffermwyr apelio yn erbyn penderfyniadau a fydd yn effeithio ar eu bywoliaeth ac yn ei dinistrio.

Mae wedi'i gofnodi lawer gwaith eich bod wedi dweud bod ffermwyr yn ffodus eu bod yn derbyn iawndal, oherwydd bod anifeiliaid

animals are, effectively, worthless. I most certainly object to that argument, as I have said to you personally. It ignores the responsibility that the Assembly Government must take for its unwillingness to tackle the spread of the disease, which was all but eradicated in the late 1970s and early 1980s. Effective TB control has to be attacked holistically.

The Minister's current policy of ignoring wildlife infection while culling infected cattle is doing nothing to halt the spread of TB. Incidences of bovine TB are continuing to increase at a rate of over 18 per cent per year while in Ireland, where livestock and wildlife infections are treated simultaneously, it has reduced from some 18,000 cases per year to just six.

The Minister expects this new system to reduce compensation by 35 per cent, yet, given that he is willing to accept a system that will routinely overvalue and undervalue stock, the priority is clearly not on fair compensation but simply on reducing costs, which means that TB will just continue to spread.

The Assembly Government is unwilling to tackle bovine TB in wildlife simply because it does not want to make an unpopular decision, irrespective of how necessary it might be. The disease has far more serious implications for the agricultural industry than foot-and-mouth disease ever had, which you are well aware of, Minister. However, if you want to reduce the burden on taxpayers, I urge you to grasp the nettle and deal with TB in cattle and wildlife populations, and stop adding to the hardships that many farmers are facing with the cost of pre-movement testing and other restrictions.

Mick Bates: I express the Welsh Liberal Democrats' support for the amendment of which we are a part today, and also our recognition that the control of TB is a massive issue. All the research that has taken place over the years has been done in the

sydd wedi eu heintio â TB yn ddiwerth, i bob pwrpas. Yr wyf yn sicr yn anghytuno'n llwyr â'r ddadl honno, fel y dywedais wrthyh yn bersonol. Mae'n anwybyddu'r cyfrifoldeb y mae'n rhaid i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ei ysgwyddo am ei hamharodrwydd i fynd i'r afael â lledaeniad y clefyd, a oedd wedi ei ddileu fwy neu lai erbyn diwedd yr 1970au a dechrau'r 1980au. Mae rheoli TB yn effeithiol yn rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid ei wneud mewn dull cyfannol.

Nid yw polisi presennol y Gweinidog o anwybyddu'r haint mewn bywyd gwyllt gan ladd gwartheg wedi eu heintio yn gwneud dim i atal lledaeniad TB. Mae achosion o TB mewn gwartheg yn parhau i gynyddu dros 18 y cant y flwyddyn ond yn Iwerddon, lle y mae'r haint mewn da byw a'r haint mewn bywyd gwyllt yn cael eu trin ar yr un pryd, mae wedi gostwng o tua 18,000 achos y flwyddyn i ddim ond chwech.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn disgwyl i'r system newydd hon arwain at ostyngiad o 35 y cant yn yr iawndal, ond eto, o gofio ei fod yn barod i dderbyn system a fydd yn gorbriso ac yn tanbriso stoc fel mater o drefn, mae'n amlwg nad iawndal teg yw'r flaenoriaeth ond yn hytrach lleihau'r costau, sy'n golygu y bydd TB yn parhau i ledaenu.

Nid yw Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn barod i fynd i'r afael â TB buchol mewn bywyd gwyllt am nad yw'n barod i wneud penderfyniad amhoblogaidd, ni waeth pa mor angenrheidiol yw penderfyniad o'r fath. Mae goblygiadau'r clefyd yn llawer mwy difrifol i'r diwydiant amaeth nag y bu goblygiadau clwy'r traed a'r genau erioed, rhywbeth yr ydych yn ymwybodol iawn ohono, Weinidog. Fodd bynnag, os ydych am ysgafnhau'r baich ar drethdalwyr, pwysaf arnoch i wynebu'r broblem a mynd i'r afael â TB mewn gwartheg a bywyd gwyllt, a rhoi'r gorau i ychwanegu at y caledi y mae llawer o ffermwyr yn ei wynebu yn sgîl costau profi cyn symud a chyfyngiadau eraill.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn datgan cefnogaeth Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru i'r gwelliant yr ydym yn rhan ohono heddiw, a hefyd ein cydnabyddiaeth bod rheoli TB yn fater eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'r holl ymchwil a wnaethpwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf

spirit of partnership with all the Governments that have existed, to try to resolve what is an extremely dangerous issue to the survival of the cattle industry throughout Wales and in parts of England.

I listened with great care to what the Minister had to say on this legislation. He argued strongly that he is reducing compensation in the name of the taxpayer. He even sets a figure in his regulatory appraisal: the minimum reduction in expenditure will be 35 per cent. What about the equivalent reduction in the incidence of the disease, Minister?

Why is the expenditure so high? Why has your budget increased to £8 million in Wales? Why were 1,317 cattle slaughtered in Wales only six years ago, when, last year, that figure had risen to 6,639? It is because you have failed to control a disease that is your responsibility to control. The fact of the matter is that, behind this legislation—which, as Elin quite rightly says, is a cut-and-paste job as per England—is the dead hand of the Treasury. It is because of the failure of the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs in England and the failure of your reign here, as Minister, that the disease has increased so much and that the Treasury is now pulling the strings and saying, ‘Reduce expenditure’. Is that not the real reason why you are introducing this tabular valuation system today?

Other Members have made reference to the fairness and justice in this system. Throughout the consultation responses on this, the industry and we recognised that this system was unfair. As has already been pointed out, when you take an average price, you overcompensate the owner of the poorest animal and you undercompensate the owner of the animal in good condition. What is so frustrating to many people is that there is a system that works by recognising the condition of the animal: the system in Ireland. Why do you refuse to implement a system that would be fairer?

wedi ei gynnal mewn ysbryd o bartneriaeth gyda'r holl Lywodraethau sydd wedi bodoli, er mwyn ceisio datrys yr hyn sy'n fater peryglus dros ben o ran gallu'r diwydiant gwartheg i oroesi ledled Cymru ac mewn rhannau o Loegr.

Gwrandewais yn astud iawn ar yr hyn a oedd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am y ddeddfwriaeth hon. Bu'n dadlau'n gryf ei fod yn gostwng yr iawndal yn enw'r trethdalwr. Mae hyd yn oed yn pennu ffigur yn ei arfarniad rheoliadol: bydd isafswm y gostyngiad mewn gwariant yn 35 y cant. Beth am y gostyngiad cyfatebol yn nifer yr achosion o'r clefyd, Weinidog?

Pam mae'r gwariant mor uchel? Pam mae eich cyllideb wedi codi i £8 miliwn yng Nghymru? Pam y lladdwyd 1,317 o wartheg yng Nghymru mor ddiweddar â chwe blynedd yn ôl, tra bo'r ffigur hwnnw wedi codi i 6,639 erbyn y llynedd? Ai oherwydd eich bod wedi methu â rheoli clefyd yr ydych yn gyfrifol am ei reoli? Y gwir amdani yw mai'r hyn sydd wrth wraidd y ddeddfwriaeth hon—sydd, fel y dywedodd Elin yn gwbl gywir, yn *cut-and-paste job* o'r hyn a geir yn Lloegr—yw llaw drom y Trysorlys. Mae'n arwydd o fethiant yr Adran dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig yn Lloegr a methiant eich teyrnasiad chi yma, fel Gweinidog, fod y clefyd wedi cynyddu i'r fath raddau a bod y Trysorlys yn awr yn cau'r pwrs ac yn dweud, ‘Gwariwch lai’. Onid hynny yw'r gwir reswm pam yr ydych yn cyflwyno'r system hon o brisio ar sail tablau heddiw?

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi cyfeirio at y tegwch a'r cyfiawnder yn y system hon. Yn yr ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad ynghylch hyn drwyddynt draw, mae'r diwydiant a ninnau wedi cydnabod bod y system hon yn annheg. Fel y dywedwyd eisoes, pan fyddwch yn cymryd pris cyfartalog, yr ydych yn gorddigolledu perchennog yr anifail yn y cyflwr gwaethaf ac yn tanddigolledu perchennog yr anifail sydd mewn cyflwr da. Yr hyn sy'n rhwystredig i gynifer o bobl yw bod system ar gael sy'n gweithio drwy gydnabod cyflwr yr anifail: y system a ddefnyddir yn Iwerddon. Pam yr ydych yn gwrthod gweithredu system a fyddai'n decach?

You talk about the rejection of an appeal system. One part of the United Kingdom has controlled TB well, and that is Scotland. Scotland retains a valuation that is based on an independent valuation of the individual animal. Not only that, everyone else recommends that there should be an appeal system. Consider the case of pedigree producers, of which there are many in Wales. Do not mistake some of what was identified in the National Audit Office report as overcompensation; it was compensation for the quality animals that are produced in Wales. The pedigree industry in Wales is large. From the many visits that you have undertaken, you will recognise the value and the importance of those animals to the industry. Why will you not recognise that by saying that we will have valuation of pedigree animals, based, very often, on receipts and documentation that the individual producer possesses? It is grossly unfair to introduce an average compensation figure for many of our quality producers, who will lose substantial amounts of money.

Think of the message that you are sending to the industry today. The Treasury has already forced the implementation of pre-movement testing, which, as you know, was abandoned in Ireland. You have refused to bring forth evidence to say why pre-movement testing is good. You have no control mechanism to assure the industry, to which you are now saying, 'We will reduce expenditure by 35 per cent to whatever'. Why do you not do some good, and say, 'I will also commit to reducing the incidence of TB in Wales by 35 per cent'? Instead, under your watch, the disease is increasing annually by 18 per cent. That is unacceptable. That is why I urge Labour Assembly Members to look at the justice of the issue, and vote for our amendment, and ensure fairness for the farmers of Wales.

Lorraine Barrett: Here we go again—unhappy farmers. The taxpayers of Wales will be interested to know that, today, opposition members, including the independent Member for Wrexham, I believe, will be voting for farmers to continue to receive more than their fair share of

Fe soniwch am wrthod system apêl. Mae un rhan o'r Deyrnas Unedig wedi rheoli TB yn dda, sef yr Alban. Mae'r Alban yn cadw prisiad sydd yn seiliedig ar brisiad annibynnol ar yr anifail unigol. Heblaw hynny, mae pawb arall yn argymhell y dylid cael system apêl. Ystyriwch achos cynhyrchwyr pedigri, ac mae llawer o'r rhain yng Nghymru. Peidiwch â chamgymryd rhywfaint o'r hyn a nodwyd yn adroddiad y Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol fel gorddigolledu; iawndal ydoedd am yr anifeiliaid o safon a gynhyrchir yng Nghymru. Mae'r diwydiant pedigri yng Nghymru yn un mawr. Ar sail eich ymweliadau niferus, byddwch yn cydnabod gwerth a phwysigrwydd yr anifeiliaid hyn i'r diwydiant. Pam na wnewch gydnabod hynny drwy ddweud y bydd gennym brisiad anifeiliaid pedigri, yn seiliedig, yn aml iawn, ar dderbynebau a dogfennaeth sydd ym meddiant y cynhyrchwr unigol? Mae'n hynod annheg cyflwyno ffigur iawndal cyfartalog i lawer o'n cynhyrchwyr o safon, a fydd yn colli symiau sylweddol o arian.

Meddyliwch am y neges yr ydych yn ei hanfon at y diwydiant heddiw. Mae'r Trysorlys eisoes wedi gorfodi gweithredu profi cyn symud, y rhoddwyd y gorau iddo, fel y gwyddoch, yn Iwerddon. Yr ydych wedi gwrthod cyflwyno tystiolaeth i ddweud pam mae profi cyn symud yn beth da. Nid oes gennych ddim mecanwaith rheoli i dawelu meddwl y diwydiant, yr ydych yn awr yn dweud wrtho, 'Gostyngwn y gwariant o 35 y cant i beth bynnag y bo'. Pam na wnewch rywfaint o les, a dweud, 'Ymrwymaf hefyd i leihau nifer yr achosion o TB yng Nghymru o 35 y cant'? Yn hytrach na hynny, dan eich gofalaeth chi, mae'r clefyd yn cynyddu 18 y cant y flwyddyn. Mae hynny'n annerbyniol. Dyna paham yr wyf yn annog Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad i edrych ar gyfiawnder y pwnc, a phleidleisio dros y gwelliant, a sicrhau tegwch i ffermwyr Cymru.

Lorraine Barrett: Dyma ni eto—ffermwyr anhapus. Bydd gan drethdalwyr Cymru ddiddordeb mewn cael gwybod y bydd aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau heddiw, gan gynnwys, fe gredaf, yr Aelod annibynnol dros Wrecsam, yn pleidleisio o blaid bod ffermwyr yn parhau i dderbyn mwy na'u

compensation. The amendment attempts to circumvent a new system with an appeals process in order to give farmers a second chance to get compensation to which they are possibly not entitled. If the criteria of the category of the animal are adhered to, there should be no need for an appeal. I could see the system coming to gridlock.

Given farmers' concerns, separate tables were introduced for pedigree and commercial cattle, based on separately collected market prices. We need a system that is fair to farmers and to taxpayers. I am sure that taxpayers will be interested to see how many opposition members, including farmers, will be pressing their voting buttons to continue those overpayments, and to delay this new process. It is a sensible process that the Minister is planning to bring in.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): Out they all come when we deal with farming. We have a system here that, according to the National Audit Office Wales, overcompensates farmers by between 50 and 100 per cent. To suggest that that system should continue is to hold that view in contempt. To suggest that, somehow, taxpayers should continue to fund a system that is so grossly unfair to them is to hold them in contempt.

I would have taken the opposition parties' objections more seriously had they tabled amendments to the Order, but they have not done so. Instead, they have tried to hide by criticising the Order, but they have not taken the responsibility of amending the Order themselves. If you wanted new categories added, you could have amended the Order.

Janet Davies: I believe that you are aware that the Audit Committee's recommendations were not along the lines of what you propose today. It is not acceptable to say that that is what the Audit Committee said.

cyfran deg o iawndal. Ymgais yw'r gwelliant i osgoi system newydd gyda phroses apelio er mwyn rhoi ail gyfle i ffermwyr gael iawndal nad oes ganddynt hawl i'w gael o bosibl. Os cedwir at feini prawf categori'r anifail, ni ddylai fod angen apêl. Gallwn weld y system yn tagu'n llwyr.

O gadw mewn cof bryderon ffermwyr, cyflwynwyd tablau ar wahân ar gyfer gwartheg pedigri a masnachol, yn seiliedig ar brisiau'r farchnad a gesglir ar wahân. Mae arnom angen system sydd yn deg i ffermwyr a threthdalwyr. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd gan y trethdalwyr ddiddordeb mewn gweld faint o aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau, gan gynnwys ffermwyr, a fydd yn pwysu eu botymau i barhau â'r gordaliadau hynny, ac i ohirio'r broses newydd hon. Mae'r broses y mae'r Gweinidog yn bwriadu ei chyflwyno yn un synhwyrol.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Dyma hwy i gyd yn dod i'r golwg pan fyddwn yn trafod ffermio. Mae gennym system yma sydd, yn ôl Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol Cymru, yn gorddigolledu ffermwyr o rhwng 50 a 100 y cant. Mae awgrymu y dylai'r system honno barhau yn bwrw anfri ar y farn honno. Mae awgrymu y dylai trethdalwyr, rywsut, barhau i gyllido system sydd mor hynod annheg yn bwrw anfri arnynt hwythau.

Byddwn wedi cymryd gwrthwynebiadau'r gwrthbleidiau yn fwy o ddifrif petaent wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r Gorchymyn, ond ni wnaethant hynny. Yn hytrach, maent wedi ceisio cuddio drwy feirniadu'r Gorchymyn, ond nid ydynt wedi ymgymryd â'r cyfrifoldeb o wella'r Gorchymyn eu hunain. Petaech am i gategorïau newydd gael eu hychwanegu, gallech fod wedi cynnig gwelliannau i'r Gorchymyn.

Janet Davies: Credaf eich bod yn ymwybodol nad oedd argymhellion y Pwyllgor Archwilio yn cyd-fynd â'r hyn a gynigwch heddiw. Nid yw'n dderbyniol dweud mai dyna a ddywedodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio.

Carwyn Jones: The Audit Committee said that, as long as an independent valuation is involved, there will be overcompensation—that is a simple, logical deduction to make. The question, quite simply, is this: do we stick with a system that the audit office has stated that, because of independent valuations, rips off the taxpayer—and I use that phrase deliberately—and which does farmers no good? At the end of the day, it makes farmers look as if they are receiving money to which they are not entitled. Therefore, it does not do farmers any good in terms of public perception.

4.20 p.m.

Mick Bates: Let us look at the rationale of your argument here. If you want to save the taxpayers money, reduce the incidence of the disease. Stop using an argument that does not hold water, and reduce the disease. Why do you not tell us what target you will set for reducing bovine TB in Wales?

Carwyn Jones: There it is, that is the argument: forget about overcompensation, forget the taxpayers and kill a few badgers instead. That is what it is all about: if we kill a few badgers, everything is sorted, but do not worry about what is happening to the taxpayer. That is what this argument is all about. The argument about what do about TB is an important one, and for those who have been on another planet for the past year, you should know that the TB action group is taking steps to deal with the situation. One of those steps is to look at the testing of road-killed badgers. That is now over, because enough badgers have been collected. I am not willing to prevaricate for many months when I know that enough badgers have been collected to ensure that we can have a statistically significant result. On the one hand, TB is an important issue, but that does not justify overcompensation to farmers and that, ultimately, is what so many speakers have said today: forget about overcompensation, it does not matter about the taxpayer, we need to kill a few badgers, and everything will be sorted out. It is not as easy as that and that is why the TB action group exists. It is all very well to hide behind

Carwyn Jones: Dywedodd y Pwyllgor Archwilio, cyhyd ag y bydd prisiad annibynnol, y bydd gorddigolledu—mae hynny'n gasgliad syml a rhesymegol. Y cwestiwn, yn syml iawn, yw hyn: a ydym yn cadw at system y mae'r Swyddfa Archwilio wedi dweud ei bod, oherwydd prisiadau annibynnol, yn twyllo'r trethdalwr—a defnyddiaf yr ymadrodd yn fwriadol—ac nad yw'n gwneud dim lles i ffermwyr? Yn y pen draw, mae'n gwneud i ffermwyr edrych fel petaent yn derbyn arian nad oes ganddynt hawl iddo. Felly, nid yw'n gwneud dim lles i ffermwyr o ran y ffordd y mae'r cyhoedd yn eu gweld.

Mick Bates: Gadewch inni edrych ar resymeg eich dadl yma. Os ydych am arbed arian i'r trethdalwyr, ceisiwch lleihau'r clefyd. Rhowch y gorau i ddefnyddio dadl nad yw'n dal dŵr, a lleihau'r clefyd. Pam na ddywedwch wrthym pa darged a osodwch ar gyfer lleihau TB mewn gwartheg yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: Dyna chi, dyna'r ddadl: anghofiwch am orddigolledu, anghofiwch y trethdalwyr, a lladdwch ychydig o foch daear yn lle hynny. Dyna beth yw craidd hyn: os lladdwch ambell fochyn daear, bydd popeth yn iawn, ond peidiwch â phryderu am beth sy'n digwydd i'r trethdalwr. Dyna hanfod y ddadl. Mae'r ddadl ynghylch beth i'w wneud ynghylch TB yn un bwysig, ac i'r rhai ohonoch a fu ar blaned arall yn ystod y flwyddyn a aeth heibio, fe ddylech wybod fod y grŵp gweithredu ar TB yn cymryd camau i ddelio â'r sefyllfa. Un o'r camau hynny yw ystyried profion ar foch daear sy'n cael eu lladd ar y ffyrdd. Mae hynny ar ben erbyn hyn, gan fod digon o foch daear wedi cael eu casglu. Nid wyf yn fodlon osgoi ateb am fisoedd lawer a minnau'n gwybod bod digon o foch daear wedi eu casglu i sicrhau y gallwn gael canlyniad sydd yn ystadegol arwyddocaol. Ar y naill law, mae TB yn bwnc pwysig, ond nid yw hynny'n cyfiawnhau gorddigolledu ffermwyr, ac yn y pen draw dyna y mae llawer o'r siaradwyr heddiw wedi'i ddweud: anghofiwch y gorddigolledu, dim ots am y trethdalwr, rhaid inni ladd ychydig o foch daear, a bydd popeth wedi ei ddatrys. Nid yw mor hawdd â hynny,

stating that you believe this and that in amendments. If you really felt that the categories were not sufficient, then you should have taken the responsibility to amend the Order, as is your democratic prerogative. Have you done that? No.

Brynle Williams: I am very disappointed to hear what you are saying. Before I came here, you were not very satisfied with the valuation on reactors and so on pre-2002, and I believe that your office instigated the present system of valuation. I am not very intelligent, but with regard to tabular valuation, I can see that if you are trying to save money for the taxpayer by overvaluing second-rate stock and grossly undervaluing quality stock, you are doing no-one any justice. Whether you say that it is irrelevant or not, we must return to the fact that you are not tackling the issue of TB. The disease is spreading at an alarming rate, and it is now travelling down the north Wales coast. We did not have any incidents 18 months ago, and we now have closed parishes. You seem to be doing nothing about it.

Carwyn Jones: What incentive is there for farmers to do anything themselves in terms of biosecurity if they are being overcompensated for animals? There is absolutely no doubt that farmers bear a responsibility for TB. We know that cattle-to-cattle spread is a significant factor. Mick Bates talks about how well the disease is being controlled in Scotland—there has been pre-movement testing in Scotland for nearly two years. Is that a coincidence—

Brynle Williams *rose*—

Carwyn Jones: You have had one chance, Brynle; I cannot let you in again. If the opposition parties were serious about wanting to change the Order, they would have tabled amendments to the Order. Those amendments would have been considered one by one and I would have had an open mind on them. The opposition parties have done no such thing. It is far easier to scrawl three little

a dyna pam mae'r grŵp gweithredu ar TB yn bod. Digon hawdd dweud eich bod yn credu hyn a'r llall mewn gwelliannau a chuddio y to ôl i hynny. Petaech o ddifrif yn teimlo nad oedd y categorïau'n ddigonol, yna dylech fod wedi cymryd y cyfrifoldeb i gynnig gwelliannau i'r Gorchymyn, fel y mae gennych hawl ddemocrataidd i wneud. A wnaethoch hynny? Naddo.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn siomedig iawn clywed yr hyn a ddywedwch. Cyn imi ddod yma, nid oeddech yn fodlon iawn â'r prisiaid ar anifeiliaid adweithiol ac yn y blaen cyn 2002, a chredaf mai eich swyddfa chi a roddodd y system brisio bresennol ar waith. Nid wyf yn ddeallus iawn, ond o ran y prisio ar sail tabl, gallaf weld nad ydych yn trin neb yn gyfiawn os ydych yn ceisio arbed arian i'r trethdalwr drwy orbrisio stoc eilradd a thanbrisio stoc o safon yn ddirfawr. Ni waeth a ydych yn dweud ei fod yn amherthnasol ai peidio, rhaid inni ddychwelyd at y ffaith nad ydych yn mynd i'r afael â phroblem TB. Mae'r clefyd yn lledaenu ar raddfa ddychrynlyd, ac mae yn awr yn teithio i lawr ar hyd arfordir gogledd Cymru. Nid oedd gennym ddim achosion o'r clefyd 18 mis yn ôl, ac erbyn hyn mae gennym blwyfi caeedig. Nid ydych fel petaech yn gwneud dim ynghylch y peth.

Carwyn Jones: Pa gymhelliad sydd i ffermwyr wneud dim eu hunain o ran bioddiogelwch os ydynt yn cael eu gorddigolledu am anifeiliaid? Nid oes gronyn o amheuaeth nad oes gan ffermwyr gyfrifoldeb am TB. Gwyddom fod lledaenu o wartheg i wartheg yn ffactor arwyddocaol. Mae Mick Bates yn dweud mor dda y mae'r clefyd yn cael ei reoli yn yr Alban—mae profi cyn symud yn yr Alban ers dwy flynedd bron. Ai cyd-ddigwyddiad yw hynny—

Brynle Williams *a gododd*—

Carwyn Jones: Fe gawsoch un cyfle, Brynle; ni allaf adael ichi ymyrryd eto. Petai'r gwrthbleidiau o ddifrif o ran eu bod am newid y Gorchymyn, byddent wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau i'r Gorchymyn. Byddai'r gwelliannau hynny wedi eu hystyried fesul un a byddwn innau wedi bod â meddwl agored amdanynt. Ni wnaeth y gwrthbleidiau hynny o gwbl. Mae'n haws o

lines on the back of a fag packet than take the responsibility and do the work to amend the Order. When will we have a situation in the Chamber where opposition parties take some responsibility and, instead of making criticisms, amend an Order and tell us what they actually believe in? It is far easier to squawk and shout on the sidelines. It is farmers, ultimately, who are suffering because of this debate. We know that the system is grossly unfair to the taxpayer because it pays money to people who should not get that money. Individual farmers tell me this; I forget the number of times that farmers have come to me and said, 'People are receiving more than their fair share in compensation for their animals'. Those farmers who are not dairy farmers also deserve some protection.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You have referred to the fact that farmers' stock is being overvalued. Is not the recommendation that you referred to that you should work more closely with the valuers to ensure that the money paid to farmers better represents the true cost? Is not that the recommendation?

Carwyn Jones: How on earth do you do that? Also, if you really believe that, why did you not amend the Order? But no, it is far too difficult to amend the Order and put your cards on the table for the people of Wales, so that they know exactly what your position is.

Elin Jones: Will you give way?

Carwyn Jones: I have taken enough interventions. [*Interruption.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dim rhagor o weiddi, os gwelwch yn dda. Beth yw diben yr holl weiddi hyn? Yr wyf eisiau clywed y Gweinidog yn ateb y ddadl.

Carwyn Jones: The reason why we will have the same system as England has is because I believe that it is a good system. I fully believe in ensuring that we have policies and systems that are appropriate for

lawer sgriblan tair llinell fer ar gefn pecyn sigarennau nag ysgwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb a gwneud y gwaith i gynnig gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn. Pryd y cawn sefyllfa yn y Siambr lle y mae'r gwrthbleidiau'n cymryd peth cyfrifoldeb ac, yn hytrach na beirniadu, yn cynnig gwelliannau i Orchymyn ac yn dweud wrthym beth y maent yn ei gredu mewn gwirionedd? Mae gryn dipyn yn haws gwichian a gweiddi ar y cyrion. Ffermwyr, yn y pen draw, sydd yn dioddef oherwydd y ddadl hon. Gwyddom fod y system yn eithriadol annheg i'r trethdalwr am ei bod yn talu arian i bobl na ddylent fod yn cael yr arian hwnnw. Mae ffermwyr unigol yn dweud hyn wrthyf; ni allaf gofio faint o weithiau y daeth ffermwyr ataf a dweud, 'Mae pobl yn derbyn mwy na'u cyfran deg o iawndal am eu hanifeiliaid'. Mae'r ffermwyr hynny nad ydynt yn ffermwyr llaeth hefyd yn haeddu peth gwarchodaeth.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith bod stoc ffermwyr yn cael eu gorbrisio. Onid yr argymhelliad y cyfeiriasoch ato yw y dylech weithio'n agosach gyda'r priswyr i sicrhau bod yr arian a delir i ffermwyr yn cynrychioli'r gost wirioneddol yn well? Onid hynny yw'r argymhelliad?

Carwyn Jones: Sut ar y ddaear y mae gwneud hynny? Hefyd, os ydych yn credu hynny mewn gwirionedd, pam na wnaethoch gynnig gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn? Ond na, mae'n llawer rhy anodd cynnig gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn a dangos eich ochr i bobl Cymru, fel eu bod yn gwybod beth yn union yw eich safbwynt.

Elin Jones: A wnewch ildio?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf wedi derbyn digon o ymyriadau. [*Ymyriad.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. No more shouting, please. What is the point of all this shouting? I want to hear the Minister's response to the debate.

Carwyn Jones: Y rheswm pam y bydd yr un system â Lloegr gennym yw am fy mod yn credu ei bod yn system dda. Yr wyf yn credu'n llwyr mewn sicrhau bod gennym bolisiau a systemau sy'n briodol i Gymru, a,

Wales, and, where there is a sensible reason for doing so, they will be different. In these circumstances, I believe that the table of valuations is correct. No system is perfect, of course: some animals will be overvalued and some will be undervalued, but what do you do, for example, in a situation where animals are in a poor condition because they had bovine TB? How do you value them? Are farmers to be undercompensated because of that? No-one seems to have thought of that point.

This is the Government's view on compensation. Regardless of what happens today, I cannot adopt a system that perpetuates a situation in which taxpayers pay more than they should in compensation to an industry. I cannot possibly accept that. Nor can I accept that, somehow, farmers should continue to be overcompensated because of some alleged inaction in dealing with TB. Those are two different arguments, and it is exceptionally dangerous to put them together. Many millions of pounds are coming out of my budget for this, and from somewhere in the farming budget. Perhaps the opposition parties would like to consider that, and ask themselves, 'If dairy farmers are going to continue to be overcompensated, which other farmers will pay?'

lle y bo rheswm synhwyrol dros wneud hynny, byddant yn wahanol. Dan yr amgylchiadau hyn, credaf fod y tabl prisiadau'n gywir. Nid oes yr un system yn berffaith, wrth gwrs: bydd rhai anifeiliaid yn cael eu gorbriso a rhai eraill yn cael eu tanbriso, ond beth a wnewch, er enghraifft, mewn sefyllfa lle y mae anifeiliaid mewn cyflwr gwael oherwydd iddynt gael TB buchol? Sut yr ydych yn eu prasio? A yw ffermwyr i gael eu taddigolledu oherwydd hynny? Nid oes neb fel petai wedi meddwl am y pwynt hwnnw.

Dyma farn y Llywodraeth am iawndal. Ni waeth beth fydd yn digwydd heddiw, ni allaf fabwysiadu system sydd yn cynnal sefyllfa lle y mae trethdalwyr yn talu mwy nag a ddylent mewn iawndal i ddiwydiant. Nid oes modd yn y byd i mi dderbyn hynny. Ni allaf dderbyn chwaith y dylai ffermwyr, rywsut, barhau i gael eu gorddigolledu oherwydd rhyw ddiffyg honedig o ran gweithredu i fynd i'r afael â TB. Mae'r rheini'n ddwy ddadl wahanol, ac mae'n beryglus dros ben eu rhoi ynghyd. Mae miliynau lawer o bunnoedd yn dod allan o'm cyllideb ar gyfer hyn, ac o rywle yn y gyllideb ffermio. Efallai y carai'r gwrthbleidiau ystyried hynny a holi eu hunain, 'Os parheir i orddigolledu ffermwyr llaeth, pa ffermwyr eraill a fydd yn talu?'

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Marek, John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy

Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM3051): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM3051): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the Cattle Compensation (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 May 2006.

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Iawndal Gwartheg (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Mai 2006.

*Cynnig (NDM3051): O blaid 28, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 27.
Motion (NDM3051): For 28, Abstain 1, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Marek, John

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3052): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Motion (NDM3052): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Gan fod nifer y pleidleisiau yn gyfartal, defnyddiodd y Llywydd ei bleidlais fwrw yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 1.12(ii).

As there was an equality of votes, the Presiding Officer used his casting vote in accordance with Standing Order No. 1.12(ii).

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion defeated.*

4.30 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Cyfarwyddiadau Diogelwch Gwladol a Chynrychiolwyr Penodedig) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig, Ardaloedd Cadwraeth a Sylweddau Peryglus) (Diwygiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, a'r Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Diwygiadau Amrywiol ac Addasiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27(iv)

Approval of the Planning (National Security Directions and Appointed Representatives) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Planning (Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Hazardous Substances) (Amendments Relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the Town and Country Planning (Miscellaneous Amendments and Modifications relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Order 2006, under Standing Order No. 24.27(iv)

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y tair eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next three items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Planning (National Security Directions and Appointed Representatives) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3053)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Cyfarwyddiadau Diogelwch Gwladol a Chynrychiolwyr Penodedig) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3053)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

approves that the Planning (National Security Directions and Appointed Representatives) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3054)

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Cyfarwyddiadau Diogelwch Gwladol a Chynrychiolwyr Penodedig) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3054)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Planning (Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Hazardous Substances) (Amendments Relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly

yn ystyried egwyddor y Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig, Ardaloedd Cadwraeth a Sylweddau Peryglus) (Diwygiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at

Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3055)

Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3055)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

approves that the Planning (Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Hazardous Substances) (Amendments Relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3056)

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig, Ardaloedd Cadwraeth a Sylweddau Peryglus) (Diwygiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3056)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Town and Country Planning (Miscellaneous Amendments and Modifications relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3057)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Diwygiadau Amrywiol ac Addasiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3057)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

approves that the Town and Country Planning (Miscellaneous Amendments and Modifications relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 16 May 2006. (NDM3058)

yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Diwygiadau Amrywiol ac Addasiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 16 Mai 2006. (NDM3058)

These three items of legislation are largely technical in nature. The first is the Planning (National Security Directions and Appointed Representatives) (Wales) Regulations 2006. It sets out the procedure to be followed by the Assembly when considering giving a national security direction. The second piece of legislation, the Planning (Listed Buildings, Conservation Areas and Hazardous Substances) (Amendments Relating to Crown Land) (Wales) Regulations 2006, makes provision for urgent applications for works to buildings on Crown land, which are listed or are in conservation areas, and provisions relating to hazardous substances consent. The

Eitemau technegol yw'r tair eitem hyn o ddeddfwriaeth gan mwyaf. Y gyntaf yw Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Cyfarwyddiadau Diogelwch Gwladol a Chynrychiolwyr Penodedig) (Cymru) 2006. Mae'n gosod y drefn y dylai'r Cynulliad ei dilyn wrth ystyried rhoddi cyfarwyddyd sy'n ymwneud â diogelwch cenedlaethol. Mae'r ail ddeddfwriaeth, Rheoliadau Cynllunio (Adeiladau Rhestredig, Ardaloedd Cadwraeth a Sylweddau Peryglus) (Diwygiadau sy'n ymwneud â Thir y Goron) (Cymru), yn gwneud darpariaethau ar gyfer ceisiadau brys am waith i adeiladau ar Dir y Goron, sydd wedi eu rhestru neu sydd mewn ardaloedd

final piece of legislation, to do with town and country planning, makes amendments and modifications to the use classes Order and to the permitted development Order, to include some developments peculiar to the Crown, including the treatment of residential institutions, Crown railways, dockyards and developments for national security or national defence.

cadwraeth, a darpariaethau sy'n ymwneud â chaniatâd parthed sylweddau peryglus. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth olaf, sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio gwlad a thref, yn gwneud diwygiadau ac addasiadau i'r Gorchymyn dosbarthau defnydd ac i'r Gorchymyn datblygiadau a ganiateir, i gynnwys rhai datblygiadau sy'n neilltuol i'r Goron, gan gynnwys trin sefydliadau preswyl, rheilffyrdd y Goron, dociau a datblygiadau ar gyfer diogelwch gwladol neu amddiffyn gwladol.

Y Llywydd: Nid oes unrhyw un am siarad ar yr eitemau cynllunio diddorol hyn, felly symudwn ymlaen at y pleidleisiau.

The Presiding Officer: No-one wishes to speak on these interesting planning matters, so we will move to the votes.

*Cynnig (NDM3053): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3053): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen

Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3054): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3054): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3055): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3055): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM3056): O blaid 43, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM3056): For 43, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3057): O blaid 40, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3057): For 40, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM3058): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM3058): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Rhan 2 o Adolygiad Polisi'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar
Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig
The Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's Part 2 Policy Review
of Special Educational Needs**

Peter Black: I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 6.6(v), notes the report of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee entitled, 'Policy Review of Special Educational Needs—Part 2: Statutory Assessment Framework (Statementing)', which was laid in the Table Office on 15 May 2006. (NDM3059)

I am pleased to present the report on the second part of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's review of special educational needs. The review is in three parts. The first part covered early identification and intervention and was published in November 2004. The third part, which we are just about to embark upon, will focus on transition from secondary to higher and further education and to work. We hope to complete this part of the review by early next year.

This part of the review concentrates on the statutory framework for assessing children's special educational needs, more widely known as statementing. Statements of educational needs were introduced by the Education Act 1981. They were a considerable step forward. Earlier legislation had done away with the awful concept of uneducable children, who were offered little or no support to meet their educational needs. Statements provided a statutory basis for assessing a child's needs. They placed statutory duties on local authorities to support those needs. Statements would be based on a detailed, multi-disciplinary assessment, and

Peter Black: Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6(v), yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, sef 'Adolygiad Polisi o Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig—Rhan 2: Fframwaith Asesu Statudol (Datganiadau)', a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Mai 2006. (NDM3059)

Yr wyf yn falch o gyflwyno'r adroddiad ynghylch ail ran adolygiad y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ar anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae tair rhan i'r adolygiad. Yr oedd y rhan gyntaf yn ymwneud â nodi ac ymyrryd yn gynnar ac fe'i cyhoeddwyd ym mis Tachwedd 2004. Bydd y drydedd rhan, yr ydym ar fin dechrau arni yn awr, yn canolbwyntio ar bontio o addysg uwchradd i addysg uwch ac addysg bellach ac i waith. Gobeithiwn gwblhau'r rhan hon o'r adolygiad erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn nesaf.

Mae'r rhan hon o'r adolygiad yn canolbwyntio ar y fframwaith statudol ar gyfer asesu anghenion addysgol arbennig plant, sy'n fwy cyfarwydd fel gwneud datganiadau. Cyflwynwyd datganiadau o anghenion addysgol gan Ddeddf Addysg 1981. Yr oeddent yn gam mawr ymlaen. Yr oedd deddfwriaeth flaenorol wedi diddymu'r cysyniad ofnadwy hwnnw bod rhai plant na ellid eu haddysgu, na chynigid fawr ddim cymorth neu ddim cymorth o gwbl i ateb eu hanghenion addysgol. Cynigiai datganiadau sail statudol ar gyfer asesu anghenion plentyn. Yr oeddent yn rhoi dyletswyddau statudol i'r awdurdodau lleol gefnogi'r

they would set out the help and support that a child needed to get the most out of the education system. Local authorities would be under a statutory duty to provide this support.

So what were the problems? The number of pupils who receive statements is much higher than originally envisaged. This alone might not be a problem, but, unfortunately, the process of getting a statement is costly, complex and bureaucratic. It often creates barriers between parents, teachers and other professionals. Professional time and resources are taken up in a lengthy, and often divisive, assessment process—time and resources that would be better spent meeting the needs of pupils.

Our report makes 28 recommendations. It also restates a number of recommendations from our first report. These recommendations are wide-ranging, but several are central to the approach we are advocating. First, we recommend that statementing be limited to those children with the most severe and complex needs. Statements may need to be retained as a safety net in some cases, but they should be gradually replaced for most children. What should replace them? A number of approaches were suggested, ranging from relatively minor changes through to more radical options. The committee was most attracted to an approach based on a new statutory requirement for a continuously assessed record of need for all children—a so-called ‘passport’ approach. This would provide the statutory underpinning that many parents are concerned about, and it would also be an inclusive, whole-school improvement approach to additional needs. We believe that this would be less likely to stigmatise individual pupils, and, it would be less likely to create divisions between parents and professionals.

anghenion hynny. Byddai datganiadau'n cael eu seilio ar asesiad manwl, amlddisgyblaethol, a byddent yn nodi'r help a'r cymorth yr oedd eu hangen ar blentyn i gael y budd mwyaf o'r system addysg. Byddai'n ddyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau lleol gynnig y cymorth hwn.

Felly beth oedd y problemau? Mae llawer mwy o blant yn cael datganiadau na'r hyn a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol. Efallai na fyddai hyn yn broblem ynddo'i hun, ond, yn anffodus, mae'r broses o lunio datganiad yn gostus, yn gymhleth ac yn fiwrocraidd. Yn aml mae'n codi rhwystrau rhwng rhieni, athrawon a gweithwyr proffesiynol eraill. Caiff amser ac adnoddau proffesiynol eu llyncu mewn proses asesu hirfaith sy'n aml yn peri rhwygiadau—byddai'n well defnyddio'r amser a'r adnoddau hynny i ateb anghenion y disgyblion.

Mae 28 o argymhellion yn ein hadroddiad. Yn ogystal mae'n ailddatgan nifer o argymhellion a wnaethpwyd yn ein hadroddiad cyntaf. Mae'r argymhellion hyn yn eang, ond mae amryw ohonynt yn ganolog i'r dull yr ydym yn ei bledio. Yn gyntaf, yr ydym yn argymhell y dylid cyfyngu datganiadau i'r plant hynny sydd â'r anghenion mwyaf difrifol a chymhleth. Efallai y bydd angen cadw datganiadau fel rhwyd ddiogelwch mewn rhai achosion, ond dylid eu diddymu yn achos y rhan fwyaf o blant a gosod rhywbeth arall yn eu lle'n raddol. Beth a ddylai gymryd eu lle? Awgrymwyd nifer o ddulliau, gan amrywio o newidiadau cymharol fach i ddewisiadau mwy radical. Yr oedd y pwyllgor o blaid dull sy'n seiliedig ar reidrwydd statudol newydd i gadw cofnod anghenion a gaiff ei asesu'n barhaus ar gyfer pob plentyn—dull ‘pasport’ fel y'i gelwir. Byddai hyn yn cynnig y sylfaen statudol y mae llawer o rieni'n ei deisyf, a byddai hefyd yn ddull cynhwysol o wella ar gyfer yr ysgol gyfan wrth ymdrin ag anghenion ychwanegol. Credwn y byddai hyn yn llai tebygol o waradwyddo disgyblion unigol, a byddai'n llai tebygol o greu rhaniadau rhwng rhieni a gweithwyr proffesiynol.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.37 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.37 p.m.*

Our consultation exercise and the evidence from witnesses showed a picture of general dissatisfaction with the statementing process, but we also heard that many parents value the legal certainty that statements can provide. This may be simply a case of better the devil you know, but we on the committee are keen to carry parents with us. Therefore, we underpinned our recommendations for change with a recommendation that the Assembly Government should consult widely with parents and other stakeholders. This is so that any changes will be built on consensus and will have parents' full confidence.

There are other key recommendations in the report, which I will mention briefly. We believe that gathering schools together into clusters could play a greater part in supporting special-unit provision within mainstream education. Special units within clusters should be developed as centres of excellence for SEN teaching, and the Assembly Government should consider providing SEN funding to school clusters.

Statements will be with us for some time yet: fundamental changes will not happen overnight. In the meantime, much can be done to make the process less demanding and traumatic for parents and children. These steps include: appointing key workers to support parents and ensure a more genuinely multi-disciplinary approach, holding assessments at single venues, such as children's centres, the greater use of the disagreement resolution service, and thinking more carefully about how we can support children themselves. Statementing as a process is often focused more on the needs of parents and professionals than on children.

We have made a number of recommendations in respect of Welsh-language issues. Children and parents whose first language is Welsh, or children who receive their education through the medium of Welsh, may experience particular problems with statementing. Underpinning our recommendations on Welsh-language provision is the committee's belief that all testing during the statementing process should be available in a child's first language of choice. Similar issues arise in relation to

Yn ôl yr ymgynghori a wnaethom a thystiolaeth y tystion, mae anfodlonrwydd cyffredinol ynghylch y broses gwneud datganiadau, ond clywsom hefyd fod llawer o rieni'n falch o'r sicrwydd cyfreithiol y gall datganiadau ei roi. Efallai mai gwell y drwg a wyddys na'r drwg na wyddys yw hyn, ond yr ydym ni ar y pwyllgor yn awyddus i ennyn cefnogaeth y rhieni. Felly, ynghyd ag argymhellion ar gyfer newid gwnaethom argymhelliad y dylai'r Cynulliad ymgynghori'n helaeth gyda rhieni a rhanddeiliaid eraill. O wneud hynny, caiff y newidiadau eu gwneud ar sail consensws a bydd gan y rhieni hyder llwyr ynddynt.

Mae argymhellion allweddol eraill yn yr adroddiad, ac yr wyf am grybwyll y rheini'n fyr. Credwn y gallai dod ag ysgolion ynghyd mewn clystyrau chwarae mwy o ran wrth gynorthwyo darpariaeth yr unedau arbennig mewn addysg brif ffrwd. Dylid datblygu unedau arbennig mewn clystyrau fel canolfannau rhagoriaeth ar gyfer dysgu AAA, a dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ystyried darparu cyllid AAA i glystyrau o ysgolion.

Bydd datganiadau'n parhau am beth amser eto: ni wneir newidiadau sylfaenol dros nos. Yn y cyfamser, mae modd gwneud llawer i wneud y broses yn llai anodd a dirdynol i rieni a phlant. Ymhlith y camau hyn y mae: penodi gweithwyr allweddol i gefnogi rhieni a sicrhau y bydd dull gwirioneddol amlddisgyblaethol ar waith, cynnal asesiadau mewn lleoliadau unigol, megis canolfannau plant, gwneud rhagor o ddefnydd ar y gwasanaeth datrys anghytundeb, a meddwl yn fwy gofalus ynglŷn â sut y gallwn gefnogi plant ein hunain. Yn aml mae datganiadau fel proses yn canolbwyntio mwy ar anghenion rhieni a gweithwyr proffesiynol na'r plant.

Yr ydym wedi gwneud nifer o argymhellion ynghylch materion sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg. Gall plant a rhieni y mae'r iaith Gymraeg yn iaith gyntaf iddynt, neu blant sy'n cael eu haddysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, wynebu problemau neilltuol gyda datganiadau. Yn sylfaen i'n hargymhellion parthed darpariaeth yn yr iaith Gymraeg y mae cred y pwyllgor y dylai pob un o'r profion a wneir yn ystod proses y datganiad fod ar gael yn newis iaith y plentyn. Mae ystyriaethau eraill yn codi gyda phlant o

children from other linguistic backgrounds, which also need to be addressed.

gefndiroedd ieithyddol eraill, ac mae angen rhoi sylw i'r rheini hefyd.

4.40 p.m.

Looked-after children find it particularly hard to access the statementing process and receive the help that they need. This is a wider problem than statementing and SEN, but it needs to be addressed. We ask that the Assembly Government and the Children's Commissioner for Wales consider what can be done for this group of children.

Mae plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn ei chael yn hynod anodd cael mynediad at y broses gwneud datganiadau a chael yr help y mae ei angen arnynt. Mae hyn yn broblem ehangach na datganiadau ac AAA, ond mae angen rhoi sylw iddi. Gofynnwn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a Chomisiynydd Plant Cymru ystyried beth y gellid ei wneud dros y grŵp hwn o blant.

Many of our key recommendations will not be possible until the Assembly has full legal competence for special needs education issues. The Assembly does not have full legal competence in this area at present, despite the fact that education is otherwise an almost wholly devolved matter. We strongly recommend that the Assembly Government seeks the necessary powers to allow the Assembly to change the current arrangements for the better and, hopefully, to implement the report's recommendations.

Ni fydd llawer o'n hargymhellion allweddol yn bosibl nes bydd gan y Cynulliad gymhwysedd cyfreithiol llawn dros faterion ym maes addysg sy'n ymwneud ag anghenion arbennig. Nid oes gan y Cynulliad gymhwysedd cyfreithiol llawn yn y maes hwn ar hyn o bryd, er bod addysg yn faes sydd wedi ei ddatganoli bron yn llwyr. Argymhellwn yn gryf y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad geisio cael y pwerau angenrheidiol i ganiatáu i'r Cynulliad newid y trefniadau presennol er gwell, gan obeithio gweld gweithredu argymhellion yr adroddiad.

It is not possible in the time that we have today to cover all aspects of the report in detail. I will try to respond at the end to any questions on matters that I have not been able to cover or have only touched upon. I hope that the report will be read widely and that it starts a debate on changing the statutory assessment system for special educational needs. I hope that it will act as a catalyst for moving to a new statutory system that has inclusion and the needs of children at its core. I hope that it accelerates the process of moving away from a system that, whatever its merits, has become driven by process and bureaucracy and that divides parents and children from teachers and professionals. Above all, I hope that it allows Wales, once again, to lead the way for the whole of the UK in this process. I look forward to hearing the Assembly Government's response to the report in due course.

Nid oes amser inni fynd drwy'r adroddiad yn ei holl agweddau heddiw. Ceisiaf ymateb ar y diwedd i unrhyw gwestiynau ynghylch unrhyw faterion nad wyf wedi gallu sôn amdanynt neu rai na wneuthum ond eu crybwyll. Gobeithiaf y bydd darllen eang ar yr adroddiad ac y bydd yn hwb i drafodaeth ynghylch newid y system asesu statudol ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn ysgogiad i symud ymlaen at system statudol newydd y bydd cynhwysiant ac anghenion y plant yn greiddiol iddi. Gobeithiaf y bydd yn hwb i'r broses o gefnu ar system sydd, beth bynnag fo'i rhagoriaethau, wedi mynd yn un sy'n cael ei symbylu gan broses a biwrocratiaeth ac sy'n rhannu rhieni a phlant oddi wrth athrawon a gweithwyr proffesiynol. Yn anad dim, gobeithiaf y bydd yn fodd i Gymru, unwaith yn rhagor, arwain y ffordd ar gyfer y Deyrnas Gyfunol gyfan yn y broses hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed ymateb Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r adroddiad maes o law.

I thank everyone involved in producing this report. In particular, I thank the members of

Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a fu ynglŷn â chynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Yn arbennig

the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee and David Melding, who, when chair of the Health and Social Services Committee, attended many of our meetings and contributed significantly to our deliberations. I also thank those who presented evidence, those who responded to the consultation, and members of the reference group. I thank the staff and pupils at the schools that we visited, the committee secretariat and researchers, and the Minister's officials who have been particularly helpful to the committee in drawing up the recommendations. I commend the report to the Assembly and to the Minister.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: About 10 speakers have indicated that they wish to speak, so we will run over if everyone takes up their time. However, I notice that one or two Members are not present. I will call Members who are not members of the committee first, so that we can hear their comments.

Catherine Thomas: I am very glad of the opportunity to speak in this debate, not as a member of the committee, but as someone who has an interest in special educational needs. I hosted a conference last week in my constituency attended by parents and carers of children with special needs. I was delighted that the Minister for Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills was there, as well as the Minister with responsibility for children.

Most of my comments echo the concerns raised by parents and carers at that conference. While most would overwhelmingly agree that the process of producing a statement of special educational needs is often a drawn-out and complex matter, and would understand and share the concerns raised in part 2 of the review, they have real concerns about the possible cessation of statements for all children with special needs, apart from those deemed as having severe and complex needs, as laid out in recommendation 4.

felly, hoffwn ddiolch i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau ac i David Melding, a ddaeth i lawer o'n cyfarfodydd pan oedd yn Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, a chyfrannu'n helaeth at ein trafodaethau. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'r rhai a gyflwynodd dystiolaeth, y rhai a ymatebodd i'r ymgynghori, ac aelodau'r grŵp cyfeirio. Hoffwn ddiolch i staff a disgyblion yr ysgolion y bu inni ymweld â hwy, ysgrifenyddiaeth y pwyllgor a'r ymchwilyr, a swyddogion y Gweinidog a fu'n gymorth mawr i'r pwyllgor o ran llunio'r argymhellion. Cymeradwyaf yr adroddiad i'r Cynulliad a'r Gweinidog.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae tua 10 o siaradwyr wedi dangos eu bod yn dymuno siarad, felly byddwn yn mynd dros yr amser os bydd pawb yn defnyddio'r amser sydd ganddynt. Fodd bynnag, sylwaf nad yw un neu ddau o'r Aelodau'n bresennol. Galwaf ar yr Aelodau hynny nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor yn gyntaf, fel y cawn glywed eu sylwadau hwy.

Catherine Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch iawn o'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon, nid fel aelod o'r pwyllgor, ond fel rhywun sydd â diddordeb mewn anghenion addysgol arbennig. Llywyddais gynhadledd yr wythnos diwethaf yn fy etholaeth lle'r oedd rhieni a gofawyr plant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig yn bresennol. Yr oeddwn wrth fy modd bod y Gweinidog dros Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau yno, ynghyd â'r Gweinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros blant.

Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'm sylwadau'n adlewyrchu'r pryderon a godwyd gan rieni a gofawyr yn y gynhadledd honno. Er y byddai'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yn cytuno'n llwyr bod y broses o lunio datganiad anghenion addysgol arbennig yn aml yn fater hirfaith a chymhleth, gan ddeall a rhannu'r pryderon a godwyd yn rhan 2 yr adolygiad, mae ganddynt bryderon gwirioneddol ynghylch y posibilrwydd y caiff datganiadau eu diddymu ar gyfer pob plentyn sydd ag anghenion arbennig, ac eithrio'r rhai y bernir bod ganddynt anghenion difrifol a chymhleth, fel y nodir yn argymhelliad 4.

The parents' concerns are that, even if the current statementing procedure is cumbersome and expensive, it still gives the parent a legal document safeguarding the education of their children. It became evident last week in Llanelli that, if such a cessation should take place, parents were concerned about the assurances that they will be given to ensure that their child's needs are met, and what legal recourse they will have if their child's needs are not met. Many parents commented that, even if the current system is long-winded, it does provide some form of a legally binding document. One parent pointed out that it was well and good to remove the awful stigma of statementing, but what guarantee would parents whose children were not deemed to have severe and complex needs have that their children's needs would be met? What assurance can we have that, should statementing be withdrawn in most cases, some other legal form of guarantee will be created to ensure that the child's needs are met?

I support the statement in the Chair's introduction to the report with regard to the committee's wanting to see more multi-agency working between health, education and social services staff. As we all know, there is a significant gap in the provision of speech and language therapy and, without fail, every parent at the conference last week spoke of this as an area of real concern. It cannot be overstated that the majority of children with special educational needs will require some form of speech and language therapy.

In my constituency, the problem is exacerbated as there are currently no speech and language therapists providing a service through the medium of Welsh. One of my constituents has a 10-year-old daughter with Down's syndrome. This little girl has a reading age of nine-years-old. Her cognitive development is at a similar level and she has achieved many other real successes. Where this child fails is that her speech and language is not commensurate with her other developments. Why is that the case? She certainly has the ability but has received no consistent speech and language input. Her parents are sufficiently concerned to be considering paying for private speech and

Mae'r rhieni'n pryderu, er bod gweithdrefn bresennol y datganiadau'n anhyllaw ac yn ddrud, ei bod er hynny'n rhoi dogfen gyfreithiol i'r rhieni sy'n diogelu addysg eu plant. Daeth yn amlwg yr wythnos diwethaf yn Llanelli, petai diddymiad o'r fath yn digwydd, fod rhieni'n bryderus ynglŷn â'r sicrwydd a gânt i sicrhau y diwellir anghenion eu plant, a'r hawliau cyfreithiol a fydd ganddynt oni ddiwellir anghenion eu plentyn. Dywedodd nifer o rieni, er bod y broses bresennol yn hirwyntog, ei bod yn cynnig rhyw fath o ddogfen sydd â grym cyfreithiol. Dywedodd un rhiant ei bod yn iawn diddymu gwaradwydd ofnadwy datganiadau, ond pa sicrwydd a roddir i rieni na fernir bod gan eu plant anghenion difrifol a chymhleth y diwellir anghenion eu plant? Pa sicrwydd sydd gennym, pe byddid yn dileu datganiadau yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion, y bydd rhyw fath arall o warant gyfreithiol yn cael ei chreu i sicrhau bod anghenion y plentyn yn cael eu diwallu?

Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r datganiad yn rhagymadrodd y Cadeirydd i'r adroddiad o ran awydd y pwyllgor i weld rhagor o weithio rhyngasiantaethol rhwng staff iechyd, addysg a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Fel y gŵyr pawb ohonom, mae bwlch sylweddol yn y ddarpariaeth therapi lleferydd ac iaith ac, yn ddiethriad, siaradodd pob rhiant yn y gynhadledd yr wythnos diwethaf am hyn fel maes sy'n peri pryder gwirioneddol. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio y bydd ar y rhan fwyaf o blant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig angen rhyw fath o therapi lleferydd ac iaith.

Yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r broblem yn cael ei dwysáu am nad oes therapyddion lleferydd ac iaith yn darparu gwasanaeth drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ar hyn o bryd. Mae gan un o'm hetholwyr ferch 10 oed sydd â syndrom Down arni. Mae gan y ferch fach hon oedran darllen naw oed. Mae ei datblygiad gwybyddol ar lefel debyg ac mae wedi cael llawer o lwyddiannau eraill sy'n rhai gwirioneddol. Y gwendid o ran y plentyn hwn yw nad yw ei lleferydd a'i hiaith yn gymesur â'i datblygiad fel arall. Pam hynny? Yn sicr mae'r gallu ganddi ond nid yw wedi cael mewnbwn cyson o ran lleferydd ac iaith. Mae ei rheini'n ddigon pryderus i ystyried talu am therapi lleferydd ac iaith yn breifat.

language therapy. This pattern is replicated not just throughout my constituency, but throughout Wales, and, therefore, I am pleased that recommendation 14 proposes that the Assembly sets aside a sum of money centrally to pump-prime initiatives aimed at improving regional and specialist provision, including Welsh-language provision.

I will be brief because of the time. I support recommendation 27, which is considering guidance to support looked-after children and recommendation 25 supporting children whose first language is neither Welsh nor English.

I welcome this report. It is much needed and I look forward to sharing it with my constituents. I congratulate the Chair and the committee, and everybody else involved, on the work that they have done.

Mark Isherwood: As a parent, I know that, without a statement, my son would not have received his passport to entitlement and a place in a special language unit within a mainstream setting, which will now enable him to re-enter mainstream education when he goes to high school this year. For too many, a statement has been used as a rationing process rather than a safety net and a certificate of entitlement to limited resources where the needs of many children are not being identified and met following effective early intervention. For those reasons, I welcome the committee's acknowledgement that the majority of those consulted are in favour of keeping some sort of statementing process, while recognising general dissatisfaction with the way that the process currently works.

We must now look forward to an initial response from the Minister, which we hope will include concrete action points rather than a general list of measures. It must reflect the views of young people and children with special educational needs, and those of their parents, and must promote effective multi-agency working and joint commissioning between health, education and social services staff. It must also promote further regional co-operation between local authorities, based on national standards of need and provision.

Mae'r patrwm hwn yn cael ei ailadrodd nid yn unig ar draws fy etholaeth i, ond ar draws Cymru, ac, felly, yr wyf yn falch bod argymhelliad 14 yn cynnig y dylai'r Cynulliad neilltuo swm o arian yn ganolog i ysgogi mentrau sydd â'r nod o wella'r ddarpariaeth ranbarthol ac arbenigol, gan gynnwys darpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg.

Byddaf yn fyr oherwydd yr amser. Yr wyf yn cefnogi argymhelliad 27, sy'n ystyried canllawiau i gefnogi plant sy'n derbyn gofal ac argymhelliad 25 sy'n cefnogi plant nad yw'r Gymraeg na'r Saesneg yn iaith gyntaf iddynt.

Croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Mae'n wirioneddol angenrheidiol ac edrychaf ymlaen at ei rannu gyda'm hetholwyr. Llongyfarchaf y Cadeirydd a'r pwyllgor, a phawb arall a fu'n ymwneud â hyn, ar y gwaith y maent wedi ei wneud.

Mark Isherwood: Fel rhiant, gwn na fyddai fy mab, heb ddatganiad, wedi cael ei basbort i hawliau a lle mewn uned iaith arbennig mewn sefydliad prif ffrwd, a fydd yn awr yn ei alluogi i ailymuno ag addysg brif ffrwd pan aiff i'r ysgol uwchradd eleni. I ormod o blant, mae datganiad wedi cael ei ddefnyddio fel proses ddogni yn hytrach na rhwyd ddiogelwch a thystysgrif sy'n rhoi hawl i adnoddau cyfyngedig lle nad yw anghenion llawer o blant yn cael eu nodi a'u diwallu ar ôl ymyrryd cynnar effeithiol. Am y rhesymau hynny, croesawaf gydnabyddiaeth y pwyllgor bod y mwyafrif o'r rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy o blaid cadw rhyw fath o broses gwneud datganiadau, er eu bod yn cydnabod anfodlonrwydd cyffredinol â'r ffordd y mae'r broses yn gweithio ar hyn o bryd.

Rhaid inni edrych ymlaen yn awr at ymateb dechreuol gan y Gweinidog, a gobeithiwn y bydd yn cynnwys pwyntiau gweithredu pendant yn hytrach na rhestr gyffredinol o fesurau. Rhaid iddo adlewyrchu barn pobl ifanc a phlant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, a barn eu rhieni, a rhaid iddo hybu gweithio rhyngasiantaethol effeithiol a chyd-gomisiynu rhwng staff iechyd, addysg a'r gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Rhaid iddo hefyd hyrwyddo rhagor o gydweithredu rhanbarthol rhwng awdurdodau lleol, wedi'i

seilio ar safonau cenedlaethol o ran angen a darpariaeth.

When I visited the Scottish Parliament with four other committee members as part of this review, I repeatedly asked how it would ensure that children with less articulate parents received advocacy and advice to ensure that their needs were met. As the Royal College of Speech and Language Therapists stated to us, when I was a member of the committee, the current statementing process can be anti-equity because it favours the children of the most articulate and affluent parents. Recommendation 11 recommends that local education authorities appoint key workers to support parents. However, I would add that the need for independent advocacy for children identified by the Children's Commissioner for Wales extends to children with special educational needs and their parents. Parent partnerships with local education authorities via independent agencies should, therefore, be prioritised and, as recommendation 26 and 27 state, consideration should be given to best practice in supporting parents who themselves have special health and educational needs and looked-after children who have special educational needs.

4.50 p.m.

This report identifies a wide variation in statementing between local education authorities across Wales, from 1.6 per cent to 5.1 per cent. Figures from the Special Educational Needs Tribunal for Wales also identify a wide variation in appeals against decisions made by local education authorities, where, for example, only four out of a total 90 appeals since September 2005 related to north Wales local education authorities. We do not know whether this low incidence in certain areas relates to good or bad practice, and this requires further research. As Lady Warnock stated, what is meant by inclusion may need rethinking. Although children should be educated alongside their peers wherever possible, in many cases, children with severe and complex needs may be better served by special schools or special unit provision. I commend the innovative work being

Pan ymwelais â Senedd yr Alban ynghyd â phedwar aelod arall o'r pwyllgor fel rhan o'r adolygiad hwn, gofynnais dro ar ôl tro sut y byddai'n sicrhau bod plant sydd â rhieni sy'n llai llafar yn cael eiriolaeth a chynghor i sicrhau bod eu hanghenion yn cael eu diwallu. Fel y dywedodd Coleg Brenhinol y Therapyddion Lleferydd ac Iaith wrthym, pan oeddwn yn aelod o'r pwyllgor, mae'r broses gwneud datganiadau ar hyn o bryd yn gallu gweithio yn erbyn cydraddoldeb gan ei bod yn ffafrio plant y rhieni mwyaf llafar a chefnog. Mae argymhelliad 11 yn argymhell bod awdurdodau addysg lleol yn penodi gweithwyr allweddol i gynorthwyo rhieni. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn ychwanegu bod yr angen am eiriolaeth annibynnol i blant a nodir gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru yn ymestyn i blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig a'u rheini. Oherwydd hynny, dylid rhoi blaenoriaeth i bartneriaethau rhieni gydag awdurdodau addysg lleol drwy asiantaethau annibynnol ac, fel y dywed argymhelliad 26 a 27, dylid ystyried yr arferion gorau o ran cynorthwyo rhieni sydd ag anghenion arbennig eu hunain o ran addysg ac iechyd a phlant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn nodi amrywiadau eang o ran gwneud datganiadau rhwng awdurdodau addysg lleol ar draws Cymru, o 1.6 y cant i 5.1 y cant. Mae ffigurau gan Dribiwnlys Anghenion Addysgol Arbennig Cymru hefyd yn nodi amrywiadau eang o ran apeliadau yn erbyn penderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd gan awdurdodau lleol, lle, er enghraifft, nad oedd a wnelo ond pedair o gyfanswm o 90 o apeliadau ers mis Medi 2005 ag awdurdodau addysg lleol gogledd Cymru. Ni wyddom a yw'r nifer isel hwn mewn rhai ardaloedd yn adlewyrchu arferion da ynteu gwael, ac mae angen ymchwil pellach i hyn. Fel y dywedodd yr Arglwyddes Warnock, efallai fod angen ailfeddwl am yr hyn a olygir wrth gynhwysiant. Er y dylai plant gael eu haddysgu ochr yn ochr â'u cyfoedion lle bynnag y mae hynny'n bosibl, mewn llawer o achosion, efallai y byddai plant ag anghenion difrifol a chymhleth yn

undertaken by Ysgol y Gogarth in Llandudno, which I visited last week.

Statements are key to accessing specific provision in such circumstances. We must take note here of the concerns raised by the Disability Rights Commission that some of the proposals in this report may undermine the entitlements provided to disabled pupils under current legislation. In particular, unqualified proposals to limit the use of statements according to severity of need may place disabled pupils in Wales at a distinct disadvantage compared to their counterparts in Scotland.

David Melding: For the benefit of the Assembly, I wish to point out that when Lady Warnock gave evidence—and she did make the points about special schools that you referred to—she also said that when her committee was considering these issues in the early 1970s, it thought that perhaps 0.5 per cent of the population of school-aged children would qualify for a statement. She was concerned that that had gone further than anyone had envisaged. The ethos of this report, therefore, is that we need to get back, if not to that figure, to something more like that figure, rather than having the mushrooming up to 10 per cent or 15 per cent, which is often seen today.

Mark Isherwood: The key priority must be to ensure that all children with learning needs have those needs met. If that requires a safety net, then that needs to be in place for everyone.

In this context, we must be particularly cautious when agreeing a definition of the most severe and complex needs if statements are to be limited to children who meet this definition only. I welcome the replacement of the term 'special educational needs' with 'additional educational needs', which reflects problems relating to issues such as bullying and family breakdown.

cael eu gwasanaethu'n well gan ysgolion arbennig neu ddarpariaeth mewn unedau arbennig. Canmolaf y gwaith arloesol sy'n cael ei wneud gan Ysgol y Gogarth yn Llandudno, yr ymwelais â hi yr wythnos diwethaf.

Mae datganiadau'n allweddol er mwyn cael mynediad at ddarpariaeth benodol o dan amgylchiadau o'r fath. Rhaid inni nodi yma y pryderon a godwyd gan y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd y gallai rhai o'r cynigion yn yr adroddiad hwn danseilio'r hawliau a roddir i ddisgyblion anabl o dan y ddeddfwriaeth gyfredol. Yn arbennig, gallai cynigion diamod i gyfyngu'r defnydd o ddatganiadau yn ôl difrifoldeb yr angen olygu bod disgyblion anabl yng Nghymru dan anfantais glir o'u cymharu â'u cymheiriaid yn yr Alban.

David Melding: Er budd y Cynulliad, hoffwn dynnu sylw at y ffaith i'r Arglwyddes Warnock, pan roddodd dystiolaeth—ac fe wnaeth y pwyntiau am ysgolion arbennig y cyfeiriasoch atynt—ddweud hefyd fod ei phwyllgor hi o'r farn, pan oedd yn ystyried y materion hyn yn yr 1970au cynnar, y byddai 0.5 y cant efallai o blant oedran ysgol yn gymwys i gael datganiad. Yr oedd yn pryderu bod hynny wedi mynd ymhellach nag yr oedd neb wedi ei ragweld. Ethos yr adroddiad hwn, felly, yw bod angen inni fynd yn ôl, os nad at y ffigur hwnnw, at rywbeth yn debycach i'r ffigur hwnnw, yn hytrach na'r cynnydd mawr hyd at 10 y cant neu 15 y cant, sy'n cael ei weld yn aml heddiw.

Mark Isherwood: Y flaenoriaeth allweddol o reidrwydd yw sicrhau bod anghenion pob plentyn sydd ag anghenion dysgu yn cael eu diwallu. Os oes rhaid cael rhwyd ddiogelwch i wneud hynny, yna mae angen iddi fod ar gael i bawb.

Yn y cyd-destun hwn, rhaid inni fod yn arbennig o ofalus wrth gytuno ar ddiffiniad o'r anghenion mwyaf difrifol a chymhleth os yw datganiadau i gael eu cyfyngu i blant sy'n ateb y diffiniad hwn yn unig. Croesawaf y term 'anghenion addysgol ychwanegol', sy'n adlewyrchu problemau'n ymwneud â materion fel bwlio a theluoedd yn chwalu, yn lle 'anghenion addysgol arbennig'.

I note recommendation 8, which calls on the Minister to consider WAGSEN's passport approach to additional educational needs assessment. This is a child-centred approach whereby the passport is the entitlement, provides a continuous record, and is based on school clusters, ring-fenced resources and a whole-school-improvement approach. However, it could only work on this basis if it is subject to a continuing statementing process with tightened procedures and shortened timescales.

The Welsh language and other language needs highlighted in recommendations 19 to 23 must be addressed, and the joint training needs of teachers and staff, identified in recommendations 17 and 18, must be prioritised. Addressing these key issues must be a priority at a time when increasing numbers of young people are leaving school and not going into education, training or employment, when 70 per cent of youth offenders have learning needs, when 35 per cent of those aged under 17 with anti-social behaviour orders have an accepted learning difficulty, and when there is concern at further education college level about delays in provision for learners with learning difficulties and disabilities.

As WAGSEN stated, inclusion cannot be done on the cheap in specialist or mainstream settings. However, this is not just about more resources; it is about better pooling of resources, having a more collegiate approach and sharing problems.

Sandy Mewies: I agree with a lot of what has been said previously, particularly by my colleague, Catherine Thomas. Statementing has always caused polarised views. I congratulate everyone who took part in this review, which reflects that. On the one hand, we have parents and some educationalists saying that perhaps we should only continue using statements—and I agree with this—in the most severe and complex cases. However, I have concerns about how such cases will be identified, because, by definition, only a small proportion of children will come forward for this. I particularly agree with the first recommendation that

Nodaf argymhelliad 8, sy'n galw ar y Gweinidog i ystyried dull pasbort WAGSEN o ymdrin ag asesu anghenion addysgol ychwanegol. Mae hwn yn ddull plentyn-ganolog, sy'n golygu bod y pasport yn rhoi hawliau, yn darparu record barhaus, ac mae wedi'i seilio ar glystyrau o ysgolion, adnoddau wedi'u neilltuo a dull gwella drwy'r ysgol gyfan. Fodd bynnag, dim ond pe bai'n dal i fod yn broses o wneud datganiadau gyda gweithdrefnau tynnach ac amserlenni byrrach y byddai'n gweithio ar y sail hon.

Rhaid rhoi sylw i'r iaith Gymraeg ac anghenion iaith eraill a danlinellir yn argymhellion 19 i 23, a rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i anghenion hyfforddi athrawon a staff ar y cyd, a nodir yn argymhellion 17 ac 18. Rhaid rhoi blaenoriaeth i ymdrin â'r materion allweddol hyn ar adeg pan fo nifer gynyddol o bobl ifanc yn gadael yr ysgol heb fynd ymlaen i addysg, hyfforddiant neu gyflogaeth, pan fo gan 70 y cant o droseddwr ifanc anghenion dysgu, pan fo gan 35 y cant o'r rhai o dan 17 oed sydd â gorchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol anhawster dysgu cydnabyddedig, a phan fo pryder ar lefel colegau addysg bellach am yr oedi yn y ddarpariaeth ar gyfer dysgwyr sydd ag anawsterau ac anabledau dysgu.

Fel y dywedodd WAGSEN, ni ellir sicrhau cynhwysiant yn rhad mewn sefydliadau arbenigol na phrif ffrwd. Fodd bynnag, nid mater o adnoddau yn unig yw hyn; mae'n ymwneud â chronni adnoddau'n well, gweithredu mewn modd mwy colegol a rhannu problemau.

Sandy Mewies: Yr wyf yn cytuno â llawer o'r hyn sydd wedi cael ei ddweud eisoes, yn enwedig gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Catherine Thomas. Mae datganiadau wedi polareiddio barn erioed. Llongyfarchaf bawb a gymerodd ran yn yr adolygiad hwn, sy'n adlewyrchu hynny. Ar y naill law, mae gennym rieni a rhai addysgwyr yn dweud efallai na ddylem barhau i ddefnyddio datganiadau—ac yr wyf yn cytuno â hyn—ond yn yr achosion mwyaf difrifol a chymhleth. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf bryderon am sut y caiff achosion o'r fath eu dynodi, oherwydd, drwy ddiffiniad, dim ond i gyfran fach o blant y bydd hyn yn digwydd. Cytunaf yn arbennig â'r

there should be a wide consultation of all parents and stakeholders, so that they have confidence in the process as it goes forward.

Previous speakers have already said that the concern regarding only identifying for statements those with complex needs relates to what will happen to those who do not have such needs. Many parents currently see statementing as a means of getting the right sort of education for their children. I hope that the consultation process will take that need into account.

I am interested in the idea of having a passport approach and continuous assessment of SEN—and I hope that the committee Chair will expand on this—because one of the problems that I think that we might find is a shortage of staff in mainstream schools to teach mainstream classes and to provide that sort of educated assessment.

I fully agree with the recommendation that suggests asking the children's commissioner, and others, to consider how children can be supported through the statementing process. It has already been said that we should also be supporting parents through this process. They should receive all the advice that is available to them, and, while there are voluntary organisations that can give support, it is incumbent on everyone involved to see that they understand the process, that they are supported in the process, and that they are happy with the outcomes at the end of it.

I support the idea of school clusters having a role in providing SEN support. My concern is that some schools—rural or small schools—may not even have access to a cluster. We have to make sure that those schools do not fall through the net, because it is clear, as is the case in many services, that consistency of approach throughout Wales is lacking. Every child with special educational needs, or additional educational needs, has the right to a consistent service. If you move from one area to another, you should still get the same sort of service, and we need to recognise that.

argymhelliad cyntaf y dylai fod ymgynghori eang â'r holl rieni a rhanddeiliaid, fel bod ganddynt ffydd yn y broses wrth iddi fynd rhagddi.

Mae siaradwyr blaenorol eisoes wedi dweud mai'r hyn sy'n achosi pryder pan nad yw ond y rhai sydd ag anghenion cymhleth yn cael eu dynodi ar gyfer datganiadau yw beth fydd yn digwydd i'r rhai nad oes ganddynt anghenion o'r fath. Mae llawer o rieni yn gweld datganiad ar hyn o bryd fel modd o gael y math iawn o addysg ar gyfer eu plant. Gobeithiaf y bydd y broses ymgynghori'n rhoi ystyriaeth i'r angen hwnnw.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y syniad o ddefnyddio dull pasbort ac asesu AAA yn barhaus—a gobeithiaf y bydd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn ymhelaethu ar hyn—oherwydd un o'r problemau y tybiaf y gallem ei chanfod yw bod prinder staff mewn ysgolion prif ffrwd i ddysgu dosbarthiadau prif ffrwd ac i ddarparu'r math hwnnw o asesu hyddysg.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r argymhelliad sy'n awgrymu gofyn i'r comisiynydd plant, ac eraill, ystyried sut y mae modd cynorthwyo plant drwy'r broses gwneud datganiadau. Dywedwyd eisoes y dylem hefyd fod yn cynorthwyo rhieni drwy'r broses hon. Dylent gael yr holl gyngor sydd ar gael, ac, er bod mudiadau gwirfoddol sy'n gallu rhoi cymorth, mae'n ddyletswydd ar bawb sy'n ymwneud â'r broses weld eu bod yn ei deall, eu bod yn cael eu cefnogi yn y broses, a'u bod yn fodlon â'r canlyniadau ar y diwedd.

Cefnogaf y syniad bod gan glystyrau o ysgolion rôl o ran darparu cymorth AAA. Fy mhryder i yw na fydd clwstwr ar gael hyd yn oed i rai ysgolion, rhai gwledig neu fach. Rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr nad yw'r ysgolion hynny'n disgyn drwy'r rhwyd, oherwydd y mae'n amlwg, fel sy'n wir mewn llawer o wasanaethau, nad oes dull cyson o weithredu ar draws Cymru. Mae gan bob plentyn sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig, neu anghenion addysgol ychwanegol, yr hawl i wasanaeth cyson. Os symudwch o un ardal i ardal arall, dylech ddal i gael yr un math o wasanaeth, ac mae angen inni gydnabod hynny.

The diagnostic test should be carried out not only in Welsh, if that is the first language, but in the first language of the child involved. I foresee some difficulties, and the Welsh Assembly Government will have to play a part in recruiting people who can take part in this process in the future. I suspect that, at the moment, we may not be able to do this properly.

A comment was made in relation to the recognition of child and adolescent mental health issues, and it is important that these are given due attention. It is also important that even if someone has a complex statement of need, they are able to move up and down the register. The continuous assessment process must recognise when progress has been made or when there are additional needs to be met.

Finally, this has been a good review, and I congratulate everyone involved. I am afraid that it was my first reading of the report; I did not watch the committee meetings and therefore did not see what was going on. However, we need to ensure that children in Wales are treated equitably, so I hope that the Chair of the committee will take on board that consistency of support is one of the most important things that the Welsh Assembly Government can provide.

Eleanor Burnham: I was constantly aware of SEN and statements during my work with underachieving young people prior to my becoming an Assembly Member. Therefore, I welcome the report and the good work that has gone into it. Unfortunately, I am currently dealing with a protracted case, and I will not refer to the exact details and the names. It is a case that saddens me, and I hope that, when I read this out, the Minister will assure me that this is a one-off and that she can do something constructive to help. I believe that there is a letter on its way with regard to this issue.

I have been dealing with the case of a nine-year-old whose exasperated parents are awaiting an urgent response from a local authority chief executive on this issue of statementing following dissatisfaction with the way that their son's educational needs

Dylai'r prawf diagnostig gael ei gynnal nid yn unig yn y Gymraeg, os mai honno yw'r iaith gyntaf, ond yn iaith gyntaf y plentyn dan sylw. Rhagwelaf rai anawsterau, a bydd yn rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru chwarae rhan wrth recriwtio pobl a all gymryd rhan yn y broses honno yn y dyfodol. Yr wyf yn amau, ar hyn o bryd, na fyddwn efallai yn gallu gwneud hyn yn iawn.

Gwnaethpwyd sylw ynglŷn â chydabod problemau'n ymwneud ag ieuchyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed, ac mae'n bwysig bod sylw dyledus yn cael ei roi i'r rhain. Mae'n bwysig hefyd, hyd yn oed os oes gan rywun ddatganiad angen cymhleth, ei fod yn gallu symud i fyny ac i lawr y gofrestr. Rhaid i'r broses asesu barhaus gydnabod cynnydd a wneir neu anghenion ychwanegol y mae'n rhaid eu diwallu.

Yn olaf, mae hwn wedi bod yn adolygiad da, a llongyfarchaf bawb a oedd â rhan ynddo. Mae arnaf ofn mai dyma'r tro cyntaf imi ddarllen yr adroddiad; ni wyliais gyfarfodydd y pwyllgor ac ni welais yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd felly. Fodd bynnag, mae angen inni sicrhau bod plant yng Nghymru yn cael eu trin yn deg, felly gobeithiaf y bydd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor yn rhoi sylw i'r ffaith mai cysondeb o ran cymorth yw un o'r pethau pwysicaf y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei ddarparu.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr oeddwn yn ymwybodol bob amser o AAA a datganiadau yn ystod fy ngwaith gyda phobl ifanc a oedd yn tangyflawni cyn dod yn Aelod Cynulliad. Felly, croesawaf yr adroddiad a'r gwaith da sydd yn sail iddo. Yn anffodus, yr wyf yn delio ar hyn o bryd ag achos hir iawn, ac ni chyfeiriaf at yr union fanylion a'r enwau. Mae'n achos sy'n fy nhristáu, a gobeithiaf, wedi imi ddarllen hyn ichi, y bydd y Gweinidog yn fy sicrhau mai eithriad llwyr yw hyn ac y gall wneud rhywbeth adeiladol i helpu. Credaf fod llythyr ar ei ffordd yn ymwneud â'r mater hwn.

Yr wyf wedi bod yn delio ag achos plentyn naw oed y mae ei rieni, sydd wedi colli amynedd, yn aros am ymateb brys gan brif weithredwr awdurdod lleol ynghylch y mater hwn yn ymwneud â gwneud datganiad gan eu bod yn anfodlon â'r ffordd yr ymdrinwyd ag

have been addressed over the years. The parents say in their letter to me that the last five years have been a farce and a nightmare and that the county council, as LEA, is vicariously liable for the deterioration in their nine-year old. He himself realises that he cannot do the work, and it is soul destroying for him and for them as a family. He has only two years left in primary school, and the support he needs must be in place by September 2006.

5.00 p.m.

She obviously goes into detail about the lack of movement on the statementing and educational help for this nine-year-old. Therefore, when the Minister receives my letter about the issue, I urge her to look at it. In view of what has been said and discovered in this report, it is extremely important that this issue is, hopefully, a one-off or involves only a very small minority. Let us hope that the report will be acted upon by the Minister.

Yn fyr, cyfeiriaf at y ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Gymraeg y mae'r adroddiad yn sôn amdani. Mae'n amlwg yn yr adroddiad fod diffyg cysondeb ar draws ardaloedd awdurdodau addysg lleol. Cyfeiriaf hefyd, fel y gwnaed yn gynharach, at y ddarpariaeth i rieni a phlant heb y Gymraeg na'r Saesneg yn iaith gyntaf iddynt. Mae angen i Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad fynd i'r afael â'r materion pwysig hyn.

Alun Cairns: Thank you for the opportunity to contribute briefly to this debate. I thank the chairman, committee members, and the clerks for all the work that they have done in developing the report, which has many positive issues to be raised and discussed and recommendations. I also thank all the speakers who have spoken, because I agree with many of them. I must admit that Catherine Thomas's opening statement has raised many of the points that I wanted to underline and the concerns that I have in the interests of children with special educational needs.

anghenion addysgol eu mab dros y blynyddoedd. Dywed y rhieni yn eu llythyr ataf fod y pum mlynedd diwethaf wedi bod yn ffars ac yn hunllef a bod y cyngor sir, fel AALI, yn atebol yn ddirprwyol am y dirywiad yn eu plentyn naw oed. Mae ef ei hun yn sylweddoli na all wneud y gwaith, ac mae'n dorcalonnus iddo ef ac iddynt hwy fel teulu. Nid oes ganddo ond dwy flynedd ar ôl mewn ysgol gynradd, a rhaid i'r cymorth y mae ei angen arno fod ar gael erbyn mis Medi 2006.

Mae hi'n manylu, wrth gwrs, ynghylch y diffyg symud o ran gwneud datganiad ar gyfer y plentyn naw mlwydd oed hwn a chynnig cymorth addysgol iddo. Felly, yr wyf yn annog y Gweinidog i ddarllen fy llythyr am y mater hwn pan gaiff ef. O ystyried yr hyn a ddywedwyd ac a ddarganfuwyd yn yr adroddiad hwn, mae'n bwysig iawn sicrhau mai mater a fydd yn codi unwaith yn unig fydd hwn, gobeithio, neu'n un a fydd yn ymwneud â lleiafrif bach iawn. Gadewch inni obeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cymryd camau ar sail yr adroddiad.

Briefly, I will refer to the Welsh-medium provision that is talked about in the report. It is evident from the report that there is a lack of consistency across local education authority areas. I also refer, as has already been done, to the provision for parents and children who do not have Welsh or English as their first language. It is incumbent upon the Labour Assembly Government to tackle these issues.

Alun Cairns: Diolch i chi am y cyfle i gyfrannu'n fyr i'r ddadl hon. Diolchaf i'r cadeirydd, i aelodau'r pwyllgor, ac i'r clerod am eu holl waith wrth ddatblygu'r adroddiad hwn, sydd yn cynnwys llawer o faterion buddiol i'w codi a'u trafod ynghyd ag argymhellion. Diolchaf hefyd i bawb sydd wedi siarad, gan fy mod yn cytuno â llawer ohonynt. Rhaid imi gyfaddef bod datganiad agoriadol Catherine Thomas wedi codi llawer o'r pwyntiau yr oeddwn yn dymuno tynnu sylw atynt a'r pryderon sydd gennyf ynghylch buddiannau plant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig.

I also ought to highlight that I have an indirect interest in this, in that my wife is an educational lawyer. I need to place that on the record and ask anyone with concerns to check the register of Members' interests.

It is true to say that statementing is a tortuous process for many. It creates enormous pressures within the family, within the school, and between the various bodies involved—the school, the local education authority, and the family.

It is quite clear that, if the report is to make quite strong recommendations that statementing should be reserved for the more serious cases, and if we are to accept that in the positive spirit in which it is intended, there must be the certainty that parents are looking for, which has been addressed in the chairman's introductory remarks. Parents value their rights—their right to a tribunal, to some form of appeal or arbitration service and, ultimately, to challenge a statement through the courts. If we are talking about a significant change, like continuous assessment, which will no doubt take out that tortuous process for many people, parents must also be reassured that, should they want them, those rights of appeal are there or the right, ultimately and regrettably, to have recourse to the law.

It is quite sad that the number of statements has risen, many of which are given to the children of pushy parents. Often, they are middle-class parents, who believe that they know more than many of the professionals. Through the use of the appeals process, they end up with statements for their children, which may not always be necessary. What frustrates me more than anything are those pupils who do not have pushy or middle-class parents to look to lawyers or voluntary organisations to support them in getting that statement. If we are expressing our concern that statementing, as David Melding said, is up maybe 10 or 15 per cent in some cases, it raises an enormous question. Why are we not meeting the educational needs of those pupils whose needs are not the most severe, meaning that they have to resort to statementing? That is certainly the perception, and it is worrying.

Dylwn dynnu sylw hefyd at y ffaith bod gennyf fuddiant anuniongyrchol yn hyn, gan fod fy ngwraig yn gyfreithiwr addysgol. Rhaid imi ddweud hynny ar goedd a gofyn i unrhyw un sydd yn pryderu am hynny edrych yng nghofrestr buddiannau'r Aelodau.

Mae'n wir dweud bod y broses o wneud datganiad yn un drofaus i lawer o bobl. Mae'n creu pwysau aruthrol o fewn y teulu, o fewn yr ysgol, a rhwng y gwahanol gyrff sydd yn gysylltiedig—yr ysgol, yr awdurdod addysg lleol, a'r teulu.

Mae'n gwbl amlwg, os oes argymhelliad eithaf cryf yn yr adroddiad i'r perwyl y dylid cadw datganiadau ar gyfer yr achosion mwyaf difrifol, ac os ydym i dderbyn hynny yn yr ysbryd cadarnhaol a fwriedir, fod rhaid cael y sicrwydd y mae ar y rhieni eisiau ei gael, y cyfeiriwyd ato yn sylwadau agoriadol y cadeirydd. Mae rhieni'n trysori eu hawliau—eu hawl i gael tribiwnlys, i gael rhyw fath o wasanaeth apelio neu gymrodeddu ac, yn y pen draw, i gael herio datganiad drwy'r llysoedd. Os ydym yn sôn am newid sylweddol, fel asesu parhaus, a fydd yn sicr o olygu na fydd llawer yn gorfod dilyn y broses drofaus honno wedyn, rhaid i rieni gael sicrwydd hefyd fod yr hawliau i apelio ar gael iddynt, os byddant yn dymuno eu harfer, a'r hawl i droi at y gyfraith yn y diwedd, gwaetha'r modd.

Mater eithaf trist yw'r cynnydd yn nifer y datganiadau, y mae llawer ohonynt wedi'u rhoi i blant i rieni ymwithgar. Yn aml, rhieni dosbarth canol ydynt, sydd yn credu eu bod yn gwybod mwy na llawer o'r gweithwyr proffesiynol. Drwy ddefnyddio'r broses apelio, cânt ddatganiadau i'w plant yn y diwedd, a hynny heb iddynt fod yn angenrheidiol bob amser. Yr hyn sydd yn peri rhwystredigaeth i mi, yn fwy na dim, yw'r disgyblion hynny sydd heb rieni ymwithgar neu rai dosbarth canol sydd yn gallu troi at gyfreithwyr neu gyrff gwirfoddol i'w helpu i gael datganiad o'r fath. Os ydym yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y ffaith bod nifer y datganiadau wedi codi tua 10 neu 15 y cant mewn rhai achosion, fel y dywedodd David Melding, mae hynny'n codi cwestiwn pwysig iawn. Pam nad ydym yn diwallu anghenion addysgol y disgyblion hynny nad yw eu hanghenion ymysg y rhai mwyaf difrifol,

sy'n peri eu bod yn gorfod troi at ddatganiadau? Hynny yw'r canfyddiad, yn sicr, ac mae'n peri pryder.

The points have already been made that there is a lack of speech and language therapists, as well as a lack of support for pupils with dyslexia and dyspraxia, and those who suffer from Asperger's syndrome, who would need support such as occupational therapy. Even where statements are in place, I must admit that far too often parents and pupils have to resort to the law to get that statement issued, because of the lack of support in each of those areas. When that is the case, we are supposed to provide reassurance to parents that they have the right to appeal, but if we are not actually delivering on that, it raises a question about the Minister. I put the question directly to you, Minister. You have been in place for an awfully long time, though the administration of the Welsh Assembly Government has not always been in your control. The Welsh Assembly Government has been in place for seven years. There has been a missed opportunity to deliver many of the skills that are needed to answer the needs of many of these pupils.

Mark Isherwood rightly raised the point that the cases of appeals and challenges against some local education authorities in north Wales are limited. That is good news. However, there are some poor performers in this respect, and I have asked the question on several occasions—which local education authorities are the poor performers? They are obviously either missing something or doing something wrong. The Minister needs to take a strategic approach, preventing these people from needing to go to the law to get what is their children's right, because LEAs will already be achieving their obligations without the need for statements or recourse to the law.

Jeff Cuthbert: This latest report from the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee's investigation into additional needs shows that there is a need to do more and do better in our approach to the statementing process. I add my thanks to all those who gave evidence to our committee's

Gwnaethpwyd pwyntiau eisoes ynghylch y ffaith bod diffyg therapyddion iaith a lleferydd, yn ogystal â diffyg cymorth i ddisgyblion sydd â dyslecsia a dyspraxia, a'r rhai sydd â syndrom Asperger, y byddai arnynt angen cymorth fel therapi galwedigaethol. Hyd yn oed os rhoddwyd datganiadau, rhaid imi gyfaddef bod rhieni a disgyblion wedi gorfod troi at y gyfraith yn llawer rhy aml i gael y datganiadau hynny, oherwydd y diffyg cymorth ym mhob un o'r meysydd hynny. Pan ddigwydd hynny, yr ydym i fod i gynnig sicrwydd i rieni fod ganddynt hawl i apelio, ond os nad ydym yn sicrhau hynny, mae'n codi cwestiwn ynghylch y Gweinidog. Gofynnaf y cwestiwn hwn ichi'n uniongyrchol, Weinidog. Yr ydych mewn grym ers cyfnod hir iawn, er na fu gweinyddiaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru dan eich rheolaeth drwy'r amser. Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru mewn grym ers saith mlynedd. Collwyd cyfle i ddarparu llawer o'r sgiliau sydd yn angenrheidiol i ddiwallu anghenion llawer o'r disgyblion hyn.

Cyfeiriodd Mark Isherwood yn briodol at y pwynt mai'n anaml y ceir achosion o apeliadau a heriau yn erbyn rhai awdurdodau addysg lleol yn y gogledd. Mae hynny'n newydd da. Er hynny, mae rhai ohonynt yn perfformio'n wael yn hyn o beth, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn ar sawl achlysur—pa awdurdodau addysg lleol sydd yn perfformio'n wael? Mae'n amlwg eu bod yn methu â gwneud rhywbeth neu'n gwneud rhywbeth o'i le. Rhaid i'r Gweinidog edrych yn strategol ar hyn, fel na fydd y bobl hynny'n gorfod troi at y gyfraith i sicrhau'r hyn y mae gan eu plant hawl iddo, am fod AALlau eisoes yn cyflawni eu rhwymedigaethau heb fod angen cael datganiadau neu droi at y gyfraith.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'r adroddiad diweddaraf hwn ar ymchwiliad y Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau i anghenion ychwanegol yn dangos bod angen inni wneud rhagor, a hynny'n well, wrth ymdrin â'r broses gwneud datganiadau. Yr wyf finnau'n diolch i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth i

review, and I also thank the clerk and the team who worked hard on the report that we debate today.

Having a children's centre in my constituency, and being a governor of Trinity Fields Special School in Ystrad Mynach, I know at first hand the many roles that organisations need to play in the statementing process. Trinity Fields school is a typical example of the best support that we are now offering children and parents in Wales, but the committee has shown that there is a desire to improve the process further.

Despite some concerns expressed during the evidence taken from Baroness Warnock, there is broad support for continuing the inclusion model for those with additional needs. Irrespective of learning disability, the majority of the evidence received supported children being educated alongside their peers as the preferred option, where possible; I fully support that. However, a key challenge remains for the statementing process to be reformed to give better access to the more complex cases that require additional provision. I fully support the view that widespread consultation must take place in order to help us to decide what that better provision should be.

The results of our evidence-taking underline the point that a collaborative approach is essential to the effective statementing process. Multi-agency working between national and local bodies involved in health, education and social services is essential. It is important that we improve the statementing process in the way agreed in committee, so that all the resources available to the child are delivered as early and as effectively as possible.

Young people and their parents must be at the heart of our reforms, and steps must be taken to make their involvement at every stage more meaningful. Making it more user-friendly and understandable to the child and parents involved is critical to boosting

adolygiad ein pwyllgor, a rhoddaf ddiolch hefyd i'r cler a'r tîm a weithiodd yn galed ar yr adroddiad yr ydym yn cynnal dadl arno heddiw.

Gan fod canolfan plant yn fy etholaeth, a chan fy mod yn llywodraethwr yn Ysgol Arbennig Trinity Fields yn Ystrad Mynach, yr wyf yn gwybod o brofiad uniongyrchol am y nifer fawr o rolau y mae'n rhaid i gyrff eu chwarae yn y broses gwneud datganiadau. Mae ysgol Trinity Fields yn enghraifft nodweddiadol o'r cymoth gorau yr ydym yn ei gynnig yn awr i blant a rhieni yng Nghymru, ond mae'r pwyllgor wedi dangos bod awydd i wella'r broses ymhellach.

Er bod rhai pryderon wedi'u mynegi wrth gymryd tystiolaeth gan y Farwnes Warnock, mae cefnogaeth gyffredinol o blaid parhau i ddefnyddio'r model cynhwysiant ar gyfer y rhai sydd ag anghenion ychwanegol. Beth bynnag fo'r anabledd dysgu, yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'r dystiolaeth a gafwyd yn bleidiol i'r amcan o addysgu plant ochr yn ochr â'u cyfoedion fel y dewis gorau, os oedd yn bosibl; yr wyf yn llwyr gefnogi hynny. Er hynny, un o'r heriau mwyaf sydd yn aros yw'r galw am ddiwygio'r broses gwneud datganiadau er mwyn cynnig gwell mynediad i'r achosion mwy cymhleth sydd yn gofyn darpariaeth ychwanegol. Yr wyf yn llwyr ategu'r farn bod rhaid ymgynghori'n eang er mwyn ein helpu i benderfynu ar ffurf y ddarpariaeth well.

Mae canlyniadau ein sesiynau cymryd tystiolaeth yn dangos bod rhaid gweithio ar y cyd i redeg y broses gwneud datganiadau'n effeithiol. Mae gweithio aml-asiantaeth rhwng gyrff cenedlaethol a lleol sydd yn ymwneud ag iechyd, addysg a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn hollbwysig. Mae'n bwysig inni wella'r broses gwneud datganiadau yn y modd a gytunwyd yn y pwyllgor, fel y bydd yr holl adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r plentyn yn cael eu darparu mor gynnar ac mor effeithiol ag y bo modd.

Rhaid i bobl ifanc a'u rhieni fod wrth wraidd ein diwygiadau, a rhaid cymryd camau i roi rhan fwy ystyrlon iddynt ym mhob cam. Mae'n hollbwysig sicrhau bod y broses gwneud datganiadau'n haws ei deall a'i defnyddio gan y plentyn a'r rhieni sydd yn

confidence in the statementing process, and also to ensuring that the level of support received does not differ between children with equal needs, as pointed out by my colleague, Sandy Mewies. The level of support that a child receives must not depend on the parents' ability to fill out the forms, or the parents' perception of the process as a whole. Making the process more understandable is vital, and I am sure that the Assembly Government will work with parents to improve the perceived complexity of the statementing process.

Furthermore, the evidence has shown that those suitably qualified professionals must be more involved throughout the statementing process, so that they can take action to put right any inequities that may arise, and assist parents who require more help. However, we must not forget that the statementing process that the committee investigated in 2006 exists against a background of vastly improved services. Since 1997, we have reformed and improved additional-needs education provision.

Jonathan Morgan: Jeff, could you tell me whether a statement follows a child? I was aware of a case a few years ago where a family moved from one local authority area to another. The child had been statemented in the initial local authority area where the family was resident, but had to be re-statemented in the new authority that they were moving to. Is that still the case? Is that widespread practice in Wales?

5.10 p.m.

Jeff Cuthbert: It is my understanding that that is the case, but the Minister can correct me if I am wrong. The statement should follow the child, and we would want to know if that was not happening.

Some £206 million is spent annually across Wales to support additional needs. The most recent Estyn inspection report concluded that pupils with additional educational needs, whether in special or mainstream schools, are

gysylltiedig fel y bydd ganddynt fwy o ffydd ynnddi, a hefyd er mwyn sicrhau na fydd plant sydd â'r un faint o anghenion yn derbyn gwahanol lefelau o gymorth, fel y nododd fy nghyd-Aelod, Sandy Mewies. Rhaid sicrhau na fydd lefel y cymorth y bydd y plentyn yn ei gael yn dibynnu ar allu'r rhieni i lenwi'r ffurflenni, neu ganfyddiad y rhieni o'r broses yn ei chyfanrwydd. Mae'n hollbwysig peri i'r broses fod yn fwy dealladwy, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio gyda rhieni i wella'r broses gwneud datganiadau, sydd yn gymhleth yn eu golwg hwy.

Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'r dystiolaeth wedi dangos bod rhaid i weithwyr proffesiynol sydd â chymwysterau addas gymryd mwy o ran drwy gydol y broses gwneud datganiadau, fel y gallant gymryd camau i unioni unrhyw annhegwch a allai godi, a helpu rhieni y mae arnynt angen mwy o gymorth. Serch hynny, rhaid inni gofio bod y broses gwneud datganiadau yr ymchwiliodd y pwyllgor iddi yn 2006 yn bod yng nghydestun gwasanaethau sydd wedi gwella'n aruthrol. Ers 1997, yr ydym wedi diwygio a gwella'r ddarpariaeth addysg ar gyfer anghenion ychwanegol.

Jonathan Morgan: Jeff, a allwch ddweud wrthyf a yw datganiad yn dilyn plentyn? Cefais wybod am achos ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl lle'r oedd teulu wedi symud o ardal un awdurdod lleol i un arall. Yr oedd y plentyn wedi cael datganiad yn ardal yr awdurdod lleol cyntaf lle'r oedd y teulu'n byw, ond bu'n rhaid iddo gael datganiad newydd yn ardal yr awdurdod yr oeddent yn symud iddi. A yw hynny'n dal i ddigwydd? A yw hynny'n arfer cyffredin yng Nghymru?

Jeff Cuthbert: Yr wyf yn deall mai felly y mae, ond gall y Gweinidog fy nghywiro os wyf yn camgymryd. Dylai'r datganiad ddilyn y plentyn, a byddem am gael gwybod pe na bai hynny'n digwydd.

Gwerir tua £206 miliwn y flwyddyn ledled Cymru i ddiwallu anghenion ychwanegol. Yn yr adroddiad arolygu diweddaraf gan Estyn, daethpwyd i'r casgliad bod disgyblion sydd ag anghenion addysgol ychwanegol, boed y

achieving better and better results compared with five years ago. Standards are now good or better in about 80 per cent of classes in special schools, compared with 40 per cent just five years ago.

I welcome this report, and I hope that the Assembly Government will take on board the recommendations to improve the statutory assessment framework for children with additional learning needs in Wales. Services are improving, but we can better use the statementing process to deliver better services throughout Wales.

William Graham: The report highlights the cross-party recognition and support for children with special educational needs to be given the best education provision. This means giving them a proper choice between special schools and properly resourced mainstream provision, together with multidisciplinary support for children, parents and teachers. It also means challenging the bias in law in favour of inclusion, together with revising the whole system to allow parents who are disadvantaged by a lack of resources, whether financial or of the resolve to fight legal battles over their child's education, to obtain the best education for their child.

This report is not about scrapping the current system; it is about enhancing the equality of service provision—in its application, the monitoring of progress and its implementation. Continuous monitoring is a necessity, and we are well aware of the impact that parental involvement has upon educational attainment. That impact is equally vital for all children; it is essential not only to recognise that, but also to provide encouragement and support for parents.

In taking evidence for the report, whether from parents or statutory and voluntary support agencies, far too often, we heard the words 'fight', 'struggle' and 'appeal' in the description of a 'battle' to gain recognition of the educational requirements of their children. The battle against local authorities was clearly identified by Baroness Warnock,

rheini mewn ysgolion arbennig neu rai prif ffrwd, yn cael canlyniadau sydd yn gwella fwyfwy o'u cymharu â'r rhai bum mlynedd yn ôl. Erbyn hyn, ceir safonau da neu well mewn tua 80 y cant o'r dosbarthiadau mewn ysgolion arbennig, o'i gymharu â 40 y cant ddim ond pum mlynedd yn ôl.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad hwn, ac yn gobeithio y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn derbyn yr argymhellion i wella'r fframwaith asesu statudol ar gyfer plant sydd ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol yng Nghymru. Mae gwasanaethau'n gwella, ond gallwn wneud gwell defnydd o'r broses gwneud datganiadau er mwyn sicrhau gwell gwasanaethau ledled Cymru.

William Graham: Mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith bod yr holl bleidiau'n cydnabod ac yn derbyn yr angen i roi'r ddarpariaeth addysg orau i blant sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Mae hynny'n golygu cynnig dewis priodol iddynt rhwng ysgolion arbennig a darpariaeth prif ffrwd gydag adnoddau priodol, ynghyd â chymorth amlddisgyblaethol i blant, rhieni ac athrawon. Mae hefyd yn golygu herio'r gogwydd yn y gyfraith o blaid cynhwysiant, a diwygio'r system gyfan fel bod rhieni sydd dan anfantais oherwydd diffyg arian neu ddiffyg penderfyniad i ymladd brwydrau cyfreithiol dros addysg eu plant, yn gallu cael yr addysg orau i'w plentyn.

Nid cael gwared ar y system bresennol yw amcan yr adroddiad hwn; mae'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaeth mwy cyfartal—o ran sut y mae'n cael ei weithredu, wrth fonitro cynnydd ac wrth ei roi ar waith. Rhaid wrth fonitro parhaus, ac yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn o effaith yr ymwneud gan rieni ar gyraeddiad addysgol. Mae'r effaith honno yr un mor bwysig i bob plentyn; mae'n hollbwysig cydnabod hynny a chynnig anogaeth a chymorth i rieni yn ogystal.

Wrth gymryd tystiolaeth ar gyfer yr adroddiad, oddi wrth rieni neu oddi wrth asiantaethau cymorth statudol a gwirfoddol, clywsom yn llawer rhy aml y geiriau 'ymldd', 'ymdrech' ac 'apêl' wrth ddisgrifio 'brwydr' i sicrhau cydnabyddiaeth i anghenion addysgol eu plant. Cafwyd disgrifiad manwl o'r frwydr yn erbyn

who estimated that only 2 per cent of the 20 per cent of children with special needs receive a statement. It is a combat in which local authorities are, in many ways, both judge and jury. The report recommends a transparent system that automatically allows resources to be directed at levels of need. The foundation of all the recommendations is encapsulated in the recommendation to define these children as requiring 'additional educational needs' and not 'special educational needs'.

We also need to note the changing legislation with regard to all disabilities, which was clearly highlighted in evidence by Baroness Warnock. The impact of that is graphically illustrated by the following anomaly. A visually impaired child without a statement has a right to be informed of the menu choices available in the school canteen, as it is a non-educational service under the Disability Discrimination Act 1995. However, the same child does not have a statutory right to ensure that curriculum materials are provided in an alternative format, as that does count as an educational service. However, another visually impaired pupil who has a statement usually has such a right enshrined in the statement.

We must understand the need for flexibility to respond quickly to changes recommended to meet the requirements of children with such needs. I note the ideas outlined by the University of Cambridge report published last week, which was supported by the National Union of Teachers. It suggested that the policy of educating children with special needs in mainstream education is failing the children with special needs, failing the education of other pupils and failing the teaching staff. Do we need to consider increasing the role and provision of special schools, or can service provision be effectively delivered within clusters of schools, sharing expertise and facilities?

The other messages that were clearly delivered by parents, together with the

awdurdodau lleol gan y Farwnes Warnock, a amcangyfrifodd mai dim ond 2 y cant o'r 20 y cant o blant sydd ag anghenion arbennig sydd yn cael datganiad. Mae'n wrthdaro lle y mae'r awdurdodau lleol, ar lawer ystyr, yn farnwr ac yn rheithgor. Mae'r adroddiad yn argymhell system dryloyw sydd yn caniatáu i adnoddau gael eu cyfeirio'n awtomatig at lefelau'r anghenion. Mae hanfod yr holl argymhellion wedi'i grynhoi yn yr argymhelliad i ddiffinio'r plant hynny'n rhai sydd ag 'anghenion addysgol ychwanegol' yn hytrach nag 'anghenion addysgol arbennig'.

Rhaid inni hefyd nodi'r newid mewn deddfwriaeth mewn cysylltiad â phob math o anabledd, y tynnwyd sylw ato mewn tystiolaeth oddi wrth y Farwnes Warnock. Mae effaith hynny i'w gweld yn glir yn yr anghysondeb canlynol. Mae hawl gan blentyn sydd â nam ar ei olwg sydd heb ddatganiad i gael ei hysbysu am y dewisiadau sydd ar gael ar y fwydlen yn ffreutur yr ysgol, gan ei fod yn wasanaeth anaddysgol o dan Ddeddf Gwahaniaethu ar Sail Anabledd 1995. Er hynny, nid oes hawl statudol gan y plentyn hwnnw i sicrhau bod deunyddiau'r cwricwlwm wedi'u darparu ar ffurf arall, gan fod hynny'n cael ei gyfrif yn wasanaeth addysgol. Fodd bynnag, bydd disgybl arall sydd â nam ar ei olwg a chanddo ddatganiad yn meddu ar hawl o'r fath fel arfer gan ei bod wedi'i chynnwys yn y datganiad.

Rhaid inni ddeall yr angen am hyblygrwydd er mwyn ymateb yn gyflym i newidiadau sydd wedi'u hargymhell er mwyn diwallu anghenion plant sydd ag anghenion o'r fath. Nodaf y syniadau sydd wedi'u hamlinellu yn adroddiad Prifysgol Caergrawnt a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, a gefnogwyd gan Undeb Cenedlaethol yr Athrawon. Awgrymai fod y polisi o addysgu plant ag anghenion arbennig mewn addysg prif ffrwd yn gwneud cam â phlant sydd ag anghenion arbennig, yn gwneud cam ag addysg disgyblion eraill ac yn gwneud cam â'r athrawon. A oes angen inni ystyried ehangu rôl a darpariaeth yr ysgolion arbennig, neu a ellir darparu gwasanaethau'n effeithiol mewn clystyrau o ysgolion, sydd yn rhannu arbenigedd a chyfleusterau?

Y negeseuon eraill a gyflewyd yn glir gan rieni, ynghyd â'r asiantaethau cymorth

statutory and voluntary support agencies, were: the need for the consistent application of statementing arrangements across Wales; the need for equitable service provision across Wales to children with statements; and the need for increased access to information and support, together with a far easier procedure for appeals. We have recognised these factors in the report's recommendations, together with the specific challenges for those who require these services to be provided in the Welsh language.

It is the aim of all parties to encourage the equality of service provision—in its application, the monitoring of progress and its implementation. The report provides the structures to achieve the equality of service.

Irene James: I mirror my comments from part 1 of the review, and associate myself with the comments of gratitude made by Peter Black and other members of the Education, Lifelong Learning and Skills Committee, commending the close level of partnership, the broad and informative responses from across public and voluntary organisations, and the efforts of committee officials and of everyone who has contributed to the report. Significantly, around a quarter of the responses were from parents or guardians of children.

As a former special needs teacher, I am particularly aware of the huge partnership between teachers, parents, social services and the children, in working closely to support and care for special educational needs children. The statementing process is the key to initiating that partnership, and must be accessible through multiple agencies and provide wrap-around support. Historically, the overwhelming burden of the statementing process has fallen on parents. They have been the link in the chain of joint working, and the pillar holding together the system, and find that they must be forceful and able to articulate their concerns. These parents face an overwhelming challenge and a disheartening array of barriers at a time when they most need reassurance and support.

statudol a gwirfoddol, oedd: yr angen i weithredu'r trefniadau gwneud datganiadau'n gyson ledled Cymru; yr angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau'n deg i blant sydd â datganiadau ledled Cymru; a'r angen am fwy o fynediad at wybodaeth a chymorth, ynghyd â gweithdrefn apelio lawer haws. Yr ydym wedi cydnabod y ffactorau hyn yn argymhellion yr adroddiad, ynghyd â'r heriau penodol sydd yn wynebu'r rhai sydd yn galw am ddarparu'r gwasanaethau hynny yn y Gymraeg.

Nod yr holl bleidiau yw hyrwyddo cydraddoldeb wrth ddarparu'r gwasanaeth—o ran sut y mae'n cael ei weithredu, wrth fonitro cynnydd ac wrth ei roi ar waith. Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig y strwythurau y mae eu hangen i sicrhau gwasanaeth cyfartal.

Irene James: Gwnaf sylwadau tebyg i'r rhai a wneuthum am ran 1 yr adolygiad, a hoffwn ategu'r sylwadau o ddiolch a wnaed gan Peter Black ac aelodau eraill o'r Pwyllgor Addysg, Dysgu Gydol Oes a Sgiliau, gan gymeradwyo lefel agos y bartneriaeth, yr ymatebion cynhwysfawr a llawn gwybodaeth gan bob math o gyrff cyhoeddus a gwirfoddol, ac ymdrechion swyddogion pwyllgorau a phawb a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad. Yn arwyddocaol, daeth tua chwarter yr ymatebion oddi wrth rieni neu warcheidwaid plant.

Fel cyn athro anghenion arbennig, yr wyf yn arbennig o ymwybodol o'r bartneriaeth enfawr rhwng athrawon, rhieni, gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'r plant, wrth gydweithio'n agos i gynnal a gofalu am blant ag anghenion addysgol arbennig. Y broses gwneud datganiadau yw'r allwedd i agor y bartneriaeth honno, a rhaid iddi fod ar gael drwy sawl asiantaeth a chynnig cymorth gofleidiol. Yn hanesyddol, rhieni sydd wedi ysgwyddo'r rhan fwyaf o lawer o'r broses gwneud datganiadau. Hwy fu'r ddolen yng nghadwyn y cydweithio, a'r golofn a ddaliai'r system at ei gilydd, a gwelant fod yn rhaid iddynt fod yn gryf ac yn gallu lleisio'u pryderon. Mae'r rhieni hyn yn wynebu her aruthrol a llu o rwystrau torcalonnus ar adeg pan fo mwyaf o angen cysur a chymorth arnynt.

As the consultation bears out, statements are often described as bureaucratic and complex, creating barriers between parents, teachers and other professionals. They breed mistrust, isolation and misunderstanding, and leave those who are in greatest need with the least support. There was clear dissatisfaction with the statementing process among the many stakeholders who gave evidence to the committee, qualified with the restatement of the importance of a statutory framework. Everyone needs a safety net, and the statutory entitlement exists within the current system. Overall, the recommendations reflect these competing interests and aim to address the failings and reinforce the strengths that were identified throughout this review. A continuously assessed record of need, through individual educational plans or co-ordinated plans—in other words, a passport approach, as recommended in the report—has emerged as the clear way forward.

Finally, I want to highlight that the measures in this report build on the recommendations of the first review for improving understanding and support for parents. Statementing is often a divisive process that isolates groups that should be working together for the best interests of the child, who must be our paramount concern. Overcoming that culture is a central consequence of these recommendations, which aim to deliver better services for young people with special educational needs across Wales. Once again, I look forward to continuing our review, and continuing the work with all special-needs stakeholders in Wales—teachers, parents and other workers—to ensure that we see the best education and care for all our children across Wales.

Janet Ryder: I am pleased to be able to contribute to this debate. It has been fascinating to sit in the committee and take evidence while this report was being drawn up. After sitting and listening to today's debate on the report, I note that most contributions have concentrated on the statementing process, and I think that everyone—Catherine Thomas started it—has highlighted that there are many difficulties

Fel y cadarnha'r ymgynghoriad, disgrifir datganiadau'n aml fel pethau biwrocraidaidd a chymhleth, sy'n creu rhwystrau rhwng rhieni, athrawon a phobl broffesiynol eraill. Maent yn meithrin amheuaeth, unigrwydd a chamddealltwriaeth, ac yn peri mai'r rhai sydd â'r angen mwyaf a gaiff leiaf o gymorth. Mynegwyd anfodlonrwydd amlwg ynghylch y broses gwneud datganiadau gan nifer fawr o'r rhanddeiliaid a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, ond ar yr un pryd yr oeddent yn ailddatgan pwysigrwydd fframwaith statudol. Mae ar bawb angen rhwyd ddiogelwch, ac mae'r hawl statudol yn bodoli o fewn y system gyfredol. Ar y cyfan, mae'r argymhellion yn adlewyrchu'r gwahanol fuddiannau hyn ac yn ceisio rhoi sylw i'r gwendidau ac atgyfnerthu'r cryfderau a nodwyd drwy'r adolygiad hwn. Daeth yn amlwg mai cofnod o anghenion a asesir yn barhaus, drwy gynlluniau addysgol unigol neu gynlluniau cydlynol—mewn geiriau eraill, dull pasbort, fel yr argymhellir yn yr adroddiad—yw'r ffordd glir ymlaen.

Yn olaf, mae arnaf eisiau pwysleisio bod y mesurau yn yr adroddiad hwn yn adeiladu ar argymhellion yr adolygiad cyntaf ar gyfer gwella dealltwriaeth a chymorth i rieni. Yn aml, mae rhoi datganiadau'n broses sydd yn rhannu ac yn ynysu grwpiau a ddylai fod yn cydweithio er lles y plentyn, sef ein prif gonsŷrn o reidrwydd. Mae goresgyn y diwylliant hwnnw'n ganlyniad canolog i'r argymhellion hyn, sydd â'r nod o ddarparu gwasanaethau gwell i bobl ifanc ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ledled Cymru. Unwaith eto, edrychaf ymlaen at barhau gyda'n hadolygiad, a pharhau'r gwaith gyda holl randdeiliaid anghenion arbennig yng Nghymru—yn athrawon, rhieni a gweithwyr eraill—i sicrhau y gwelwn yr addysg a'r gofal gorau i'n plant i gyd ledled Cymru.

Janet Ryder: Yr wyf yn falch o allu cyfrannu at y ddadl hon. Bu'n hynod ddifyr eistedd yn y pwyllgor a derbyn tystiolaeth wrth i'r adroddiad hwn gael ei lunio. Wedi eistedd a gwrando ar y ddadl ar yr adroddiad heddiw, sylwaf fod y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfraniadau wedi canolbwyntio ar y broses gwneud datganiadau, a chredaf fod pawb—gan ddilyn Catherine Thomas—wedi pwysleisio bod llawer o anawsterau gyda'r

with that system. However, the problem is that parents see the statement as a guarantee to be fought for, and as the only way to ensure that their children will get what they need.

Many people have also highlighted that a number of the children who get statements are those who have more articulate parents, who can use that system. A number of children are losing out because of that. The committee's desire is to see all children's needs met. The way forward, therefore, has to be to look at the statementing process, which sets parents against authorities and which creates, in the parents' eyes, an enemy of the very body that should be helping them to find the solution to deliver their child's needs. The way forward is to look at that and to try to come to a method of continuous assessment with a passport, so that parents know that, once those needs have been assessed, a way of meeting them will be guaranteed and delivered. That can only come about when parents have confidence in the system, and that will take a long time to build. Parents must see that the system is able to deliver those needs first.

5.20 p.m.

For me, the whole report hinges on the recommendations to develop school clusters and centres of excellence. As Sandy Mewies pointed out, we need to increase the skills of our ordinary classroom teachers. They need to increase their skills in the identification of special needs and then in meeting those needs or signposting children onto other areas. If you look at the idea of clusters and developing centres of excellence in the special units that we have throughout Wales, there is already a great deal of expertise in the staff in those units. It is underused expertise, and it should be used to feed out to the rest of the county and to train the teachers in the schools, so that they gain from that expertise. The teachers in those special units would also gain from that, and would benefit greatly from an interchange with teachers in schools, because they need to know what is happening with regard to curriculum development and other developments in education for their own professional

system honno. Fodd bynnag, y broblem yw bod rhieni'n gweld y datganiad fel gwarant y mae'n rhaid iddynt ymladd i'w chael, ac fel yr unig ffordd i sicrhau y caiff eu plant yr hyn y mae arnynt ei angen.

Mae llawer o bobl wedi tynnu sylw hefyd at y ffaith bod nifer o'r plant a gaiff ddatganiadau yn blant sydd â rhieni mwy llafar, sy'n gallu defnyddio'r system honno. Mae nifer o blant ar eu colled oherwydd hynny. Mae'r pwyllgor yn awyddus i weld diwallu anghenion pob plentyn. Y ffordd ymlaen, felly, yn anorfod, yw edrych ar y broses gwneud datganiadau, sydd yn gosod rhieni yn erbyn awdurdodau ac yn creu gelyn, yng ngolwg y rhieni, o'r union gorff a ddylai fod yn eu cynorthwyo i ganfod yr ateb i ddiwallu anghenion eu plentyn. Y ffordd ymlaen yw edrych ar hynny a cheisio sefydlu dull o asesu parhaus gyda phasbort, fel y bydd rhieni'n gwybod, wedi i'r anghenion hynny gael eu hasesu, y caiff ffordd o'u diwallu ei gwarantu a'i chyflawni. Dim ond pan fydd gan rieni hyder yn y system y gall hynny ddigwydd, ac fe gymer hynny amser maith i'w feithrin. Rhaid i rieni weld bod y system yn gallu diwallu'r anghenion hynny yn gyntaf.

I mi, mae'r holl adroddiad yn dibynnu ar yr argymhellion i ddatblygu clystyrau o ysgolion a chanolfannau rhagoriaeth. Fel y dywedodd Sandy Mewies, mae angen gwella sgiliau ein hathrawon cyffredin yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Mae angen gwella eu sgiliau o ran nodi anghenion arbennig ac yna o ran diwallu'r anghenion hynny neu gyfeirio plant at feysydd eraill. Os edrychwech ar y syniad o glystyrau a datblygu canolfannau rhagoriaeth yn yr unedau arbennig sydd gennym ar hyd a lled Cymru, mae llawer iawn o arbenigedd gennym eisoes yn staff yr unedau hynny. Mae'n arbenigedd nad oes digon o ddefnydd arno, a dylid ei ddefnyddio i dreiddio i weddill y wlad ac i hyfforddi'r athrawon yn yr ysgolion, fel y byddant hwythau'n elwa o'r arbenigedd hwnnw. Byddai'r athrawon yn yr unedau arbennig hynny hefyd yn elwa, ac yn cael budd mawr o gyfnewid syniadau ag athrawon yn yr ysgolion, oherwydd y mae angen iddynt wybod beth sydd yn digwydd o ran datblygu'r cwricwlwm a datblygiadau

development, to help them to improve.

The key for me with regard to this report is how we develop those school clusters and the centres of excellence. Through the development of those, and the upskilling of all of our professional staff—although their skills are good at the moment, there is room to utilise the skills that are locked into special units—we will start to ensure that parents can be confident that their child's needs will be met at whatever level, and met adequately. The emphasis will be put where it should be, that is, on the needs of that child and on making sure that those needs are met in whatever circumstances are best for that child. That may involve a mixture of mainstream school and special unit provision, or special unit or mainstream school provision only, but whatever mixture is right for that child, we should be able to achieve it within Wales.

Peter Black: I thank everyone who has taken part in the debate. It was a constructive, thoughtful and intelligent debate and it reflected a lot of the issues that were raised in committee. Catherine Thomas started it, but Alun Cairns and some other Members also raised the issue of the current status of statements and the safety net that parents envisage them as providing. It is only fair to say that we are looking to retain the statementing process for those children who have complex needs, but the continuous record of need that we are envisaging should be in place for other children would also be a statutory record, and therefore would also provide some security for parents in terms of the assessment that was attached to it. It is not the committee's intention to take away potential certainty, but to better focus limited educational resources on meeting the needs of children. We are aware that parents view statements as a legal document that gives them some guarantees for their child, and that is why we want to work with parents in a collaborative way to ensure that any transition to a new system retains their confidence.

Alun Cairns: I am grateful for the fact that Peter Black answered directly one of the

eraill ym myd addysg er mwyn eu datblygiad proffesiynol eu hunain, i'w helpu i wella.

Yr allwedd i mi o safbwynt yr adroddiad hwn yw sut y mae datblygu'r clystyrau ysgolion hyn a'r canolfannau rhagoriaeth. Drwy ddatblygu'r rhain, a gwella sgiliau ein staff proffesiynol i gyd—er bod eu sgiliau'n dda ar hyn o bryd, mae lle i ddefnyddio'r sgiliau sydd ynghlwm wrth unedau arbennig—gallwn ddechrau sicrhau y gall rhieni fod yn hyderus y diwellir anghenion eu plentyn ar ba lefel bynnag, a'u diwallu'n ddigonol. Rhoddir y pwyslais yn y lle y dylai fod, hynny yw, ar anghenion y plentyn hwnnw ac ar wneud yn siŵr y diwellir yr anghenion hynny ym mha amgylchiadau bynnag sydd orau i'r plentyn hwnnw. Gall hynny olygu cymysgedd o ddarpariaeth ysgol brif ffrwd ac uned arbennig, neu ddarpariaeth uned arbennig neu ysgol brif ffrwd yn unig, ond pa gymysgedd bynnag sy'n iawn ar gyfer y plentyn hwnnw, dylem allu cyflawni hynny o fewn Cymru.

Peter Black: Diolch i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddadl. Bu'n ddadl adeiladol, feddylgar a deallus, ac adlewyrchodd lawer o'r materion a godwyd yn y pwyllgor. Catherine Thomas oedd y gyntaf, ond aeth Alun Cairns a rhai Aelodau eraill hefyd ati i godi cwestiwn statws presennol datganiadau a'r rhwyd ddiogelwch a ddarparant yng ngolwg rhieni. Teg dweud mai ein nod yw cadw'r broses gwneud datganiadau ar gyfer y plant hynny sydd ag anghenion cymhleth, ond byddai'r cofnod anghenion parhaus yr ydym yn rhagweld y dylid ei sefydlu ar gyfer plant eraill yn gofnod statudol hefyd, ac felly byddai hwnnw hefyd yn darparu rhyw sicrwydd i rieni o ran yr asesiad a fyddai ynghlwm wrtho. Nid bwriad y pwyllgor yw dileu sicrwydd posibl, ond canolbwyntio adnoddau addysgol cyfyngedig yn well ar ddiwallu anghenion plant. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol bod rhieni'n gweld datganiadau fel dogfennau cyfreithiol sy'n rhoi rhai gwarantau iddynt ar gyfer eu plentyn, a dyna pam y mae arnom eisiau cydweithio gyda rhieni i sicrhau y cedwir eu hyder mewn unrhyw drawsnewid i system newydd.

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y ffaith bod Peter Black wedi ateb un o'r

questions that I raised, in saying that the statement of continuous need would be a legal record. Do you envisage that, if there is disagreement between the parents and the LEA on this issue, there would be a right of appeal as a part of that process?

Peter Black: Yes; I was going to come to that, Alun. In fact, there is a recommendation—I think that it is recommendation 6—in the report that says that we want to retain the right of appeal. However, it is also fair to stress that we received evidence that statements often do not guarantee the support that parents wished for. Therefore, we have to bear that in mind, and that is one of the problems that we have with statements. I am not saying that we are going to solve them all with this, but certainly we want to address that problem by moving away from the statementing process in the cases of most children, except those who have severe needs. Where there are complex or severe needs, the statements will remain, but for other children we need a different, more flexible approach, which we hope will still be statutory.

Mark Isherwood raised a number of points and it is worth stating that we believe that key workers are an important part of our vision for additional needs. Their role in supporting parents will be crucial, but I agree that there remains a vital role for independent advocacy and I am sure that that will continue to exist under the new system, especially if there is an appeal process in place.

Several Members, William in particular, raised the Disability Rights Commission's response to the report. I believe—and I think that others do, too—that it is confusing process with provision. We do not believe that altering the way in which we approach statements will remove rights for children; there will still be a statutory record to identify needs and, hopefully, to ensure that they are met. The Minister will, no doubt, address this concern when she responds to the report, but it is also why we accepted that there may well be a need for a statutory right of appeal, and we have recommended wide consultation. It is important that this is a process in which we move forward together.

cwestiynau a godais yn uniongyrchol, drwy ddweud y byddai'r datganiad anghenion parhaus yn gofnod cyfreithiol. A ydych yn rhagweld, os bydd anghytuno rhwng y rhieni a'r awdurdod addysg lleol ar hyn, y ceid hawl i apelio fel rhan o'r broses honno?

Peter Black: Ydwyf, yr oeddwn yn mynd i ddod at hynny, Alun. Yn wir, mae argymhelliad—credaf mai argymhelliad 6 ydyw—yn yr adroddiad sydd yn dweud bod arnom eisiau cadw'r hawl i apelio. Fodd bynnag, mae'n deg pwysleisio hefyd inni dderbyn tystiolaeth nad yw datganiadau'n aml yn gwarantu'r cymorth yr oedd rhieni yn dymuno'i gael. Felly, rhaid inni gofio hynny, a dyna un o'r problemau sydd gennym gyda datganiadau. Nid wyf yn dweud ein bod yn mynd i'w datrys i gyd drwy hyn, ond yn sicr yr ydym yn awyddus i ateb y broblem honno drwy gefnu ar y broses gwneud datganiadau yn achos y rhan fwyaf o blant, ac eithrio'r rhai ag anghenion difrifol. Lle y ceir anghenion cymhleth neu ddifrifol, cedwir y datganiadau, ond ar gyfer plant eraill mae angen dull gwahanol, mwy hyblyg, a fydd yn dal yn statudol, gobeithio.

Cododd Mark Isherwood nifer o bwyntiau ac mae'n werth datgan ein bod yn credu bod gweithwyr allweddol yn rhan bwysig o'n gweledigaeth ar gyfer anghenion ychwanegol. Bydd eu rôl hwy o ran cefnogi rhieni yn allweddol, ond cytunaf fod rôl hollbwysig o hyd i eiriolaeth annibynnol ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n parhau i fodoli dan y system newydd, yn enwedig os bydd proses apelio wedi'i sefydlu.

Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod, a William yn arbennig, at ymateb y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd i'r adroddiad. Credaf—ac yr wyf yn meddwl bod eraill yn credu hyn hefyd—mai cymysgu proses a darpariaeth yw hynny. Ni chredwn y bydd newid y dull yr awn ati gyda datganiadau'n dileu hawliau i blant; bydd cofnod statudol yn dal i fodoli i nodi anghenion a, gobeithio, i sicrhau y cânt eu diwallu. Bydd y Gweinidog, mae'n siŵr, yn ateb y cwestiwn hwn yn ei hymateb i'r adroddiad, ond dyna pam, hefyd, y bu inni dderbyn y gall yn wir fod angen am hawl apelio statudol, ac yr ydym wedi argymhell ymgynghori eang. Mae'n bwysig bod hon yn broses lle y symudwn ymlaen gyda'n gilydd.

If there are genuine concerns being raised by bodies such as the DRC, then they will need to be addressed as part of that process.

We must bear in mind that statements are not the guarantee that parents think of them as. Often, no additional support or resources follow a statement. Given our record on these, it stands to reason that duties will need to be placed on LEAs and schools to meet the needs. Bear in mind that that will come with part 2.

On clusters, small and rural schools are precisely the ones that can benefit from this approach. They often do not have the resources to deal with the full range of additional needs, and, by working collaboratively with other schools, albeit with some geographical distance between them, they can access resources that are not available to them at the moment.

Sandy raised the issue of continual assessment and the fact that this must recognise improvement. She is absolutely right in that, and statements should also recognise improvements. However, the point of the passport is that it will apply to all pupils. All pupils have additional needs, and the passport will help tremendously if a child has to move school and during the transition between different stages of education, because the passport will move with the child, which is not always the case with statements, which is the point that Jonathan raised with Jeff Cuthbert.

The detailed arrangements will need to be worked out, and that is why we recommend further consultation. However, there are already some models upon which we can build. The individual education plans used in many schools may be a starting point for this—Scotland has also moved in this direction. The important point is that any arrangements should be based on the individual needs of children and should be continuously assessed. Consistency of support will be assisted by the passport approach, and, as I said to Alun, we are proposing to retain the appeals process. However, we need to create a system in

Os oes pryderon gwirioneddol yn cael eu codi gan gyrff fel y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, yna bydd angen rhoi sylw iddynt fel rhan o'r broses honno.

Rhaid inni gofio nad yw datganiadau'n rhoi'r warrant y mae rhieni'n tybio eu bod yn ei rhoi. Yn aml, nid oes dim cymorth nac adnoddau ychwanegol yn dilyn datganiad. O gofio ein hanes gyda'r rhain, mae'n rhesymol cymryd y bydd angen gosod dyletswyddau ar awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion i ddiwallu'r anghenion. Cofiwch y daw hynny gyda rhan 2.

O ran clystyrau, ysgolion bach a gwledig yw'r union rai a all elwa o hyn. Yn aml nid oes ganddynt yr adnoddau i ddelio â'r amrediad llawn o anghenion ychwanegol, a thrwy gydweithio ag ysgolion eraill, er y gall fod cryn bellter daearyddol rhyngddynt, gallant ddefnyddio adnoddau nad ydynt ar gael iddynt ar hyn o bryd.

Cododd Sandy gwestiwn asesu parhaus a'r ffaith bod yn rhaid i hyn gydnabod gwelliant. Mae hi yn llygad ei lle yn hynny o beth, a dylai datganiadau gydnabod gwelliannau hefyd. Fodd bynnag, pwynt y pasbort yw y bydd yn berthnasol i bob disgybl. Mae gan bob disgybl anghenion ychwanegol, a bydd y pasbort yn gymorth aruthrol os bydd rhaid i blentyn symud i ysgol arall, ac yn ystod y trawsnewid rhwng gwahanol gyfnodau addysg, oherwydd bydd y pasbort yn symud gyda'r plentyn, rhywbeth nad yw bob amser yn digwydd gyda datganiadau, sef y pwynt a gododd Jonathan gyda Jeff Cuthbert.

Bydd angen gweithio ar y trefniadau manwl, a dyna pam yr ydym yn argymhell ymgynghori pellach. Fodd bynnag, mae ambell fodel eisoes y gallwn adeiladu arno. Gall y cynlluniau addysg unigol a ddefnyddir mewn llawer o ysgolion fod yn fan cychwyn ar gyfer hyn—mae'r Alban wedi symud i'r cyfeiriad hwn hefyd. Y pwynt pwysig yw y dylid seilio unrhyw drefniadau ar anghenion unigol plant, a'u hasesu'n barhaus. Bydd y dull pasbort yn cynorthwyo cysondeb o ran cymorth, ac, fel y dywedais wrth Alun, bwriadwn gadw'r broses apelio. Fodd bynnag, mae angen creu system lle y bydd rhieni'n teimlo bod anghenion eu plant yn

which parents feel that their children's needs are being met, and not one in which a conflict-based appeals system is the main quoted virtue.

Statements do not always follow the child, but it is important that the record of need and the form of the passport does, as that will provide valuable security and will ensure that work is not repeated.

I thank everybody who has taken part in this debate, and I reiterate my thanks to the committee members, to all those who gave evidence, to the clerk and his staff, and to everybody else who contributed to this report. What we have in this report is a valuable and comprehensive way forward, and I look forward to the Minister's response when she comes back with her statement on how she views the recommendations.

cael eu diwallu, yn hytrach nag un y dywedir mai system apelio sy'n seiliedig ar wrthdaro yw'r prif rinwedd ynddi.

Nid yw datganiadau bob amser yn dilyn y plentyn, ond mae'n bwysig bod y cofnod anghenion a ffurf y pasbort yn gwneud hynny, gan y bydd hynny'n rhoi diogelwch gwerthfawr ac yn gwneud yn siŵr na chaiff gwaith ei ailadrodd.

Diolch i bawb a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon, a diolch unwaith eto i aelodau'r pwyllgor, i bawb a roddodd dystiolaeth, i'r clerck a'i staff, ac i bawb arall a gyfrannodd at yr adroddiad hwn. Yr hyn sydd gennym yn yr adroddiad hwn yw ffordd ymlaen sydd yn werthfawr ac yn gynhwysfawr, ac yr wyf yn edrych ymlaen at ymateb y Gweinidog pan ddaw'n ôl gyda'i datganiad ynglŷn â'i barn hi ar yr argymhellion.

Cynnig (NDM3059): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM3059): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.29 p.m.
 The meeting ended at 5.29 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)

Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)