



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 15 Chwefror 2006
Wednesday, 15 February 2006**

Cynnwys
Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside.....	19
Datganiad am Ofal Cartref am Ddim i Bobl Anabl Statement on Free Homecare for Disabled People.....	35
Datganiad am Gyllid y GIG Statement on NHS Finances.....	48
Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Cymru 2006) ar Gronfa Datblygu Rheoli Perfformiad y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol Approval of Special Grant Report (Wales 2006) Social Services Performance Management Development Fund	62
Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales	66
Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion.....	93
Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru: Parhad The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales: Continued.....	94
Dadl Fer: Addysg Celf a Chrefft ar gyfer Pobl dros 60 oed—'Dawn neu Dystysgrif' Short Debate: Art and Craft Education for the over 60s—A 'Qualified Disaster'	117

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Dirprwy Lywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Deputy Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Cyllid Questions to the Finance Minister

Y Fenter Cyllid Preifat The Private Finance Initiative

Q1 Peter Black: Will the Minister make a statement on the total amount of money spent on the private finance initiative since 1999? OAQ0464(FIN)

C1 Peter Black: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gyfanswm yr arian a wariwyd ar y fenter cyllid preifat er 1999? OAQ0464 (FIN)

The Finance Minister (Sue Essex): For the financial years 1999-2000 to 2004-05, payments made by the Assembly Government both to service PFI contracts entered into by Assembly Government departments and as contributions to PFI contracts entered into by unitary authorities amounted to £193 million. In addition, health trusts paid £57 million of PFI costs.

Y Gweinidog Cyllid (Sue Essex): Ar gyfer y blynyddoedd ariannol 1999-2000 i 2004-05, £193 miliwn oedd cyfanswm y taliadau a wnaed gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i dalu am contractau gwasanaeth PFI a wnaed gan adrannau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ac fel cyfraniadau i contractau PFI a wnaed gan awdurdodau unedol. Ar ben hynny, talodd ymddiriedolaethau iechyd £57 miliwn o gostau PFI.

Peter Black: Many PFI schemes have involved schools, and you have used some of that expenditure to claim that you have met your targets on the amount of capital spent on schools in the current Assembly. Given the evidence submitted to the Committee on School Funding that most local authorities will not meet the target of making schools fit for purpose by 2010, do you not think that you need to reconsider whether there should be more PFI rounds in relation to schools?

Peter Black: Mae llawer o gynlluniau PFI wedi bod yn gysylltiedig ag ysgolion, ac yr ydych wedi defnyddio cyfran o'r gwariant hwnnw i honni eich bod wedi cyrraedd eich targedau o ran gwariant cyfalaf ar ysgolion yn yr ail Gynulliad. O ystyried y dystiolaeth a gyflwynwyd i'r Pwyllgor ar Ariannu Ysgolion, na fydd y rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau lleol yn cyrraedd y targed o wneud ysgolion yn addas at y diben erbyn 2010, oni chredwch fod angen ichi ailystyried a ddylai fod mwy o gylchoedd PFI yng nghyd-destun ysgolion?

Sue Essex: You are right to say that we have included those PFI approvals in our total capital sum. However, with prudential borrowing to local authorities, the need for us to fund PFI schemes—and they were PFI pathfinder schemes—disappeared. Indeed, that decision was made nearly three years ago. The prudential borrowing scheme introduced by the Government changed things fairly dramatically for local authorities, and that should be the way in which they move forwards. However, that does not mean that they cannot undertake PFI projects if they think them appropriate.

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan ddywedwch ein bod wedi cynnwys y cymeradwyaethau PFI hynny yn ein cyfanswm cyfalaf. Fodd bynnag, drwy fenthyca'n ddarbodus i awdurdodau lleol, diflannodd yr angen inni ariannu cynlluniau PFI—a chynlluniau braenaru PFI oeddent. Yn wir, gwnaed y penderfyniad hwnnw bron i dair blynedd yn ôl. Drwy'r cynllun benthyca darbodus a gyflwynwyd gan y Llywodraeth, newidiodd pethau'n ddigon dramatig i awdurdodau lleol, ac i'r cyfeiriad hwnnw y dylent symud ymlaen. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hynny'n golygu na allant

ymgymryd â phrosiectau PFI os credant eu bod yn briodol.

Janet Davies: Despite Assembly Government opposition, the case for new nuclear power stations is being promoted by the UK Government, yet the economics do not add up for purely private enterprise. Can you assure me that the Assembly Government will not take part in a PFI scheme to build a nuclear power station, or support any such UK Government initiative?

Janet Davies: Er gwaethaf gwrthwynebiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, mae Llywodraeth y DU yn dadlau dros sefydlu gorsafoedd niwclear newydd, ac eto nid yw gwneud hynny fel menter breifat yn unig yn gwneud synnwyr yn ariannol. A allwch fy sicrhau na fydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd rhan mewn cynllun PFI i adeiladu gorsaf niwclear, nac yn cefnogi unrhyw fenter o'r fath gan Lywodraeth y DU?

Sue Essex: As far as I am aware, building nuclear power stations is a non-devolved activity.

Sue Essex: Hyd y gwn i, nid yw adeiladu gorsafoedd niwclear yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli.

Glyn Davies: PFI can sometimes be a controversial principle. I suspect that sometimes it is beneficial and sometimes not in delivering public services. What assessments are you making of projects for which you have used PFI, in order to understand and to inform us for when we are looking at involving PFI in future projects?

Glyn Davies: Gall PFI fod yn egwyddor ddadleuol weithiau. Tybiaf ei bod yn fuddiol weithiau, ond nid dro arall wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus. Pa asesiadau yr ydych yn eu gwneud o brosiectau yr ydych wedi defnyddio PFI ar eu cyfer, er mwyn deall a rhoi gwybodaeth inni pan fyddwn yn ystyried cynnwys PFI mewn prosiectau yn y dyfodol?

Sue Essex: Of all the schemes that we have supported, whether directly or through local authorities, there had to be a very strong business case to prove that PFI was the correct route, so they have all been underpinned by such an assessment.

Sue Essex: O bob cynllun yr ydym wedi ei gefnogi, boed yn uniongyrchol neu drwy awdurdodau lleol, yr oedd yn rhaid cael achos busnes cryf i brofi mai PFI oedd y llwybr cywir. Felly, cafwyd asesiad felly i ategu pob un ohonynt.

In terms of looking backwards at value for money, which I think you were hinting at, Glyn, some work has been going on. For example, the National Audit Office looked at the A55 in particular. In addition to that, I commissioned some work to look at that aspect of capital procurement. There are other models of public-private partnership around that may be equally useful to us in the public sector, and so that work is ongoing.

O ran edrych yn ôl ar werth am arian, sef yr hyn yr oeddech yn ei awgrymu, mi gredaf, Glyn, mae rhywfaint o waith wedi bod yn mynd ymlaen. Er enghraifft, bu'r Swyddfa Archwilio Genedlaethol yn edrych ar yr A55 yn benodol. Ar ben hynny, comisiynais innau waith i edrych ar yr agwedd honno ar gaffael cyfalaf. Mae yna fodelau eraill o bartneriaeth gyhoeddus-breifat a allai fod yr un mor fuddiol inni yn y sector cyhoeddus, ac felly mae'r gwaith hwnnw yn mynd yn ei flaen.

Cronfeydd Strwythurol Ewrop European Structural Funds

C2 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am effaith y gronfa strwythurol Ewropeaidd ar broses cyllideb y Cynulliad? OAQ0438(FIN)

Q2 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the impact of European structural funding on the Assembly budget process? OAQ0438(FIN)

Sue Essex: Following the recent round undertaken by the Treasury, all structural funds are transferred automatically to the Assembly. That ensures that there is no need to negotiate Barnett plus.

Alun Ffred Jones: If we look at the historical situation and the latest figures given to the Economic Development and Transport Committee, we see that £1.2 billion has been committed to the Objective 1 programme in Wales, which means a total project investment of £3 billion in Wales. Given that 37 per cent of that match funding has been provided by the private sector, that leaves around £1 billion unaccounted for. Did some, most or all of that money come from the Welsh block grant?

Sue Essex: I do not have the details to hand of the public sector funding and where it came from. As you know, there was a mixture of funding beyond the 37 per cent, some of which would have come from the voluntary sector and from the public sector through Government or local authority funding. I can give you that disaggregation if that is what you would like.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): What we can say, Minister, is that those budgets that we have been able to identify show that £443 million of match funding came from the Welsh block, which amounts to an average of £63 million a year between 2000 and 2007. Do you agree that had that match funding come from the Treasury, the £63 million could have been used for health and education?

Sue Essex: I think that you are referring to the aggregation of the Pathway to Prosperity funding and the local regeneration fund. Those are the budgets that you are talking about. It would be worth your remembering that these budgets were set up specifically to support schemes that, despite all other endeavours, could not be funded through alternative means of match funding. They are almost exclusively economic development schemes. The schemes that have come through those programme funding streams are

Sue Essex: Yn dilyn y cylch diwethaf a gynhaliodd y Trysorlys, trosglwyddir yr holl gronfeydd strwythurol yn awtomatig i'r Cynulliad. Mae hynny'n sicrhau nad oes angen cael trafodaethau ynglŷn â Barnett a mwy.

Alun Ffred Jones: Os edrychwn ar y sefyllfa hanesyddol a'r ffigurau diweddaraf a roddwyd i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, gwelwn fod £1.2 biliwn wedi ei neilltuo ar gyfer rhaglen Amcan 1 yng Nghymru, sy'n golygu cyfanswm o £3 biliwn o fuddsoddiad mewn prosiectau yng Nghymru. O ystyried bod 37 y cant o'r arian cyfatebol hwnnw wedi ei ddarparu gan y sector preifat, mae hynny'n gadael tuag £1 biliwn na roddwyd cyfrif amdano. A ddaeth rhywfaint o'r arian hwnnw, y rhan fwyaf neu'r cyfan o grant bloc Cymru?

Sue Essex: Nid oes gennyf fanylion wrth law am gyllid y sector cyhoeddus ac o ble y daeth. Fel y gwyddoch, yr oedd cyfuniad o gyllid y tu hwnt i'r 37 y cant, a byddai rhywfaint ohono wedi dod o'r sector gwirfoddol a'r sector cyhoeddus drwy gyllid y Llywodraeth neu awdurdodau lleol. Gallaf roi dadgyfuniad o hwnnw ichi os dyna ddymunwch.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Yr hyn y gallwn ei ddweud, Weinidog, yw bod y cyllidebau hynny yr ydym wedi gallu eu nodi yn dangos bod £443 miliwn o arian cyfatebol wedi dod o flocc Cymru, sef £63 miliwn y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, rhwng 2000 a 2007. A gytunwch y gellid bod wedi defnyddio'r £63 miliwn hwnnw ar gyfer iechyd ac addysg pe bai'r arian cyfatebol hwnnw wedi dod o'r Trysorlys?

Sue Essex: Credaf eich bod yn cyfeirio at gyfuno arian Ffordd i Ffyniant a'r gronfa adfywio lleol. Dyna'r cyllidebau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt. Byddai'n werth ichi gofio bod y cyllidebau hynny wedi eu sefydlu'n benodol i gefnogi cynlluniau na ellid, er gwaethaf pob ymdrech, eu hariannu drwy arian cyfatebol gwahanol. Cynlluniau datblygu economaidd ydynt bron yn ddiethriad gyd. Mae'r cynlluniau sydd wedi dod drwy'r ffrydiau ariannu rhaglenni hynny yn gynlluniau datblygu economaidd

essential economic development schemes, which I think we would have wanted to support anyway. Therefore, I do not think that you can make the automatic assumption that that money, had it not been spent on those schemes, would have been spent on health and education. That does not follow at all.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: You are talking about priorities, and I appreciate that your priority might be economic development, Minister, but another Government's priorities might be health and education. I think that you would have to accept that that £63 million a year would have been available for other purposes if you had secured match funding from the Treasury. You would surely have welcomed that as Finance Minister. If you can get match funding and the European component from the Treasury, it gives you much more freedom to determine how you spend your money. Is that not the case?

Sue Essex: I find it odd that you suggest that we would not have put that money into economic development. The main thrust of the structural funds was to promote economic development in whatever form it took. I understand your point, but, in reality, you would have to admit that we put the money in the Pathway to Prosperity pot and the local regeneration fund to support good economic development proposals. As you will understand, economic development was one of our primary priorities at the time. Therefore, I do not think that what I am saying is inconsistent.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservative (Nick Bourne): One of the main reasons—if not the only reason—why Alun Michael was effectively voted out of office was his failure to go to the Treasury to seek additional money over and above the Barnett block for match funding purposes. The point has been made that the block is there to meet our needs, quite separate from convergence funding. We have had the approach in the Assembly of seeking additional funding over and above the Barnett block for match funding purposes. Will you be making the same case to the Treasury, bearing in mind the political history that I mentioned, as well as the need to ensure that we use the Barnett

hanfodol, rhai y credaf y byddem wedi bod yn awyddus i'w cefnogi beth bynnag. Ni chredaf, felly, y gallwch dybied o reidrwydd y byddai'r arian hwnnw, pe na bai wedi ei wario ar y cynlluniau hynny, wedi ei wario ar addysg ac iechyd. Nid yw hynny'n dilyn o gwbl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydych yn sôn am flaenoriaethau, a sylweddolaf mai datblygu economaidd, efallai, yw eich blaenoriaeth, Weinidog, ond gallai iechyd ac addysg fod yn flaenoriaeth i Lywodraeth arall. Credaf y byddai'n rhaid ichi dderbyn y byddai'r £63 miliwn hwnnw wedi bod ar gael at ddibenion eraill pe baech wedi sicrhau arian cyfatebol gan y Trysorlys. Mae'n sicr y byddech wedi croesawu hynny, fel Gweinidog Cyllid. Os gallwch gael arian cyfatebol a'r elfen Ewropeaidd gan y Trysorlys, mae'n rhoi llawer mwy o ryddid ichi benderfynu sut i wario'ch arian. Onid dyna'r gwir?

Sue Essex: Mae'n rhyfedd eich bod yn awgrymu na fyddem wedi rhoi'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer datblygu economaidd. Prif nod y cronfeydd strwythurol oedd hybu datblygu economaidd o ba fath bynnag. Deallaf eich pwynt, ond mewn gwirionedd rhaid i chithau gyfaddef ein bod wedi rhoi'r arian yn y gronfa Ffordd i Ffyniant a'r gronfa adfywio lleol i gefnogi cynigion datblygu economaidd da. Fel y deallwch, yr oedd datblygu economaidd yn un o'n prif flaenoriaethau ar y pryd. Nid wyf yn credu, felly, fod yr hyn a ddywedaf yn anghyson.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Un o'r prif resymau—os nad yr unig reswm—pam y pleidleisiwyd i gael gwared ar Alun Michael i bob pwrpas oedd iddo fethu â mynd at y Trysorlys i gael arian yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett at ddibenion arian cyfatebol. Gwnaed y pwynt mai diben y bloc yw diwallu ein hanghenion, rhywbeth gwahanol iawn i arian cydgyfeirio. Ceisio cael arian yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett oedd y nod yn y Cynulliad ar gyfer arian cyfatebol. A fyddwch yn cyflwyno'r un ddadl i'r Trysorlys, gan gofio'r hanes gwleidyddol y soniais amdano, yn ogystal â'r angen am sicrhau ein bod yn defnyddio bloc Barnett at ddibenion eraill a bod angen gweld hyn fel

block for other purposes and for this to be seen as something separate? We will need additional money—I do not say how much—from the Treasury in order to take full advantage of convergence funding in the next round.

Sue Essex: There were many premises there that I do not necessarily agree with. Moving away from the Alun Michael story, we have delivered extraordinarily well on structural funds. That was recognised by Europe, and, as a result, it has given us more money than was allocated. Alun Michael primarily went back on securing Barnett plus. We have had a Barnett plus deal in the past two comprehensive spending rounds. We do not need that from now on because the Treasury will automatically put that money into our budget. Like me, you heard the First Minister say that there is a long way to go before we will know what the intervention rates will be and what the match funding should be. It is essential to understand that the primary point of match funding—and, as Finance Minister, I have said this many times—is that it should be sought elsewhere. If that can come from outside sources, then that is what should happen. I have been criticised many times during Plenary questions for not putting match funding in our budgets, but you are now saying that I should not put any in because it should all come from the Treasury. You know the Treasury's view, in that it has not supported match funding anywhere else. The First Minister is right; let us see what the intervention rates are, and let us see what situation exists by the time we get close to defining these sums. An assessment will then be made.

2.10 p.m.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. I appeal for short questions and very short answers. I have just received another request to speak, and I want to get Members in. I will not be able to do so unless I prolong the time for questions, which I do not want to do.

Nick Bourne: It seems that you ran up the white flag there, Minister. It was revealing

rhywbeth ar wahân? Bydd arnom angen arian ychwanegol gan y Trysorlys—nid wyf am ddweud faint—i fanteisio'n llawn ar arian cydgyfeirio yn y cylch nesaf.

Sue Essex: Gwnaethoch sawl gosodiad nad wyf yn cytuno â hwy o reidrwydd. I symud oddi wrth hanes Alun Michael, yr ydym wedi darparu'n anghyffredin o dda o ran cronfeydd strwythurol. Mae Ewrop wedi cydnabod hynny, ac o ganlyniad cawsom fwy o arian oddi yno nag a ddyrannwyd yn wreiddiol. Torri ei air ar sicrhau Barnett a mwy a wnaeth Alun Michael yn bennaf. Yr ydym wedi sicrhau cytundeb Barnett a mwy yn y ddau gylch gwariant cynhwysfawr diwethaf. Nid oes angen hynny o hyn allan oherwydd bydd y Trysorlys yn rhoi'r arian hwnnw yn ein cyllideb yn awtomatig. Fel finnau, clywsoch y Prif Weinidog yn dweud bod tipyn o ffordd i fynd cyn y byddwn yn gwybod beth fydd y cyfraddau ymyrryd a beth ddylai'r arian cyfatebol fod. Mae'n hanfodol deall mai prif bwynt arian cyfatebol—ac fel Gweinidog Cyllid, yr wyf wedi dweud hyn droeon—yw y dylid ei gael o rywle arall. Os gall ddod o ffynonellau allanol, yna hynny ddylai ddigwydd. Cefais fy meirniadu droeon yn ystod cwestiynau'r Cyfarfod Llawn am beidio â rhoi arian cyfatebol yn ein cyllidebau. Ond yr ydych yn dweud erbyn hyn na ddylwn roi dim oherwydd y dylai'r cyfan ddod o'r Trysorlys. Fe wyddoch farn y Trysorlys, gan nad yw wedi cefnogi arian cyfatebol yn unman arall. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn llygad ei le; gadewch inni weld beth yw'r cyfraddau ymyrryd, a gadewch inni weld beth fydd y sefyllfa erbyn inni ddod yn agos at bennu'r symiau hyn. Gwneir asesiad bryd hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Erfyniaf am gwestiynau byrion, ac am atebion byrion iawn. Yr wyf newydd gael cais arall gan rywun sydd am siarad, ac yr wyf am roi amser i Aelodau. Ni fydd modd imi wneud hynny heb estyn yr amser ar gyfer cwestiynau, ac nid wyf am wneud hynny.

Nick Bourne: Mae'n ymddangos eich bod yn dangos y faner wen, Weinidog. Yr oedd eich

that you said that I knew what the Treasury's view is—I do not know, as that is your job. I assume, from what you said, that the Treasury's view is 'no'. You then went on to make a distinction, saying that the First Minister has said that we do not yet know what we are doing. However, this is an important issue of principle. You do not need to know the intervention rate before making a decision, in principle, on going to the Treasury for some match funding. That is a complete non sequitur. You exposed a very revealing truth in saying that I know what the Treasury's view is; I do not, but, presumably, you do. We have just heard that view, which is that will not provide any match funding whatsoever.

Sue Essex: As I said to Ieuan, the Treasury has never provided match funding. It has not provided it to Objective 1 areas in England or Scotland, and we have not had it here. Whenever there is good news on structural funds, you always roll out the old argument about match funding—there is too little match funding, the private sector is not putting any money in, or we should be arguing with the Treasury. We are about delivering structural funds in Wales, and that is what we are doing. You do not like it; that is your fault, but that is what we are doing.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Let us have short answers.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree, Minister, that it is amazing that every time the issue of structural funds comes up, opposition parties never refer to the benefits brought to the people of Wales, such as the tens of thousands of jobs created and safeguarded? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Answer'.]

Sue Essex: I will answer, by providing facts. I have travelled to all parts of Wales since the very welcome announcement on structural funds providing Wales with more money in the future. People everywhere are talking about what they can do with the money. I have not heard one question about match

sylw fy mod yn gwybod barn y Trysorlys yn ddadlennol—nid wyf yn gwybod: eich gwaith chi yw hynny. Yr wyf yn cymryd o'r hyn a ddywedwch mai 'na' yw barn y Trysorlys. Yr oeddech wedyn yn gwahaniaethu, gan ddweud bod y Prif Weinidog wedi dweud nad ydym yn gwybod eto beth yr ydym yn ei wneud. Fodd bynnag, mae hwn yn fater pwysig o egwyddor. Nid oes angen ichi wybod y gyfradd ymyrryd cyn penderfynu, mewn egwyddor, fynd at y Trysorlys i gael arian cyfatebol. Nid yw'r ddau beth yn dilyn o gwbl. Yr oeddech yn datgelu gwirionedd sy'n dweud llawer iawn wrth ddweud fy mod yn gwybod beth yw barn y Trysorlys; nid wyf yn gwybod, ond mae'n debyg eich bod chi'n gwybod. Yr ydym newydd glywed y farn honno, sef na fydd yn darparu unrhyw arian cyfatebol o gwbl.

Sue Essex: Fel y dywedais wrth Ieuan, nid yw'r Trysorlys wedi darparu arian cyfatebol erioed. Nid yw wedi ei ddarparu i ardaloedd Amcan 1 yn Lloegr nac yn yr Alban, ac nid ydym wedi ei gael yma. Pryd bynnag y bydd newyddion da am gronfeydd strwythurol, yr ydych yn ailgodi'r hen ddadl am arian cyfatebol—nid oes digon o arian cyfatebol, nid yw'r sector preifat yn rhoi dim i mewn, neu dylem fod yn dadlau â'r Trysorlys. Ein nod yw cael cronfeydd strwythurol i Gymru, a dyna yr ydym yn ei wneud. Nid ydych yn hoffi hynny; eich bai chi yw hynny, ond dyna yr ydym yn ei wneud.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Gadewch inni gael atebion byrion.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, ei bod yn rhyfeddol nad yw'r gwrthbleidiau, pan gwyd mater cronfeydd strwythurol, byth yn cyfeirio at y manteision a ddaeth i ran pobl Cymru, megis y degau o filoedd o swyddi sydd wedi eu creu a'u diogelu? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Atebwch'.]

Sue Essex: Fe atebaf, drwy roi ffeithiau. Yr wyf wedi teithio i bob rhan o Gymru ers y datganiad calonogol iawn ar gronfeydd strwythurol i roi mwy o arian i Gymru yn y dyfodol. Mae pobl ym mhobman yn siarad am yr hyn y gallant ei wneud â'r arian. Nid wyf wedi clywed yr un cwestiwn am arian

funding. The issue does not come up. What does come up is how we can work together to make the most of this money. That is the difference between you and us. We are delivering on practical schemes, in partnership with others, rather than just bleating on about match funding.

cyfatebol. Ni fydd y mater yn codi o gwbl. Yr hyn sydd yn codi yw sut y gallwn gydweithio i wneud y gorau o'r arian hwn. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhyngoch chi a ni. Yr ydym ni'n darparu cynlluniau ymarferol, ar y cyd ag eraill, yn hytrach na chwyno byth a hefyd am arian cyfatebol.

Y Portffolio Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus The Local Government and Public Services Portfolio

C3 David Lloyd: Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u derbyn gyda golwg ar yr arian a ddyrennir yn gyffredinol i bortffolio llywodraeth leol a gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? OAQ0423(FIN)

Q3 David Lloyd: What representations has the Minister received regarding the overall allocation of funding to the local government and public services portfolio? OAQ0423(FIN)

Sue Essex: I consult widely with Cabinet Ministers and colleagues in local government across Wales, particularly through the expenditure sub-group. I also, as you know, take account of the views of the subject committee.

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn ymgynghori'n eang â Gweinidogion y Cabinet a llywodraeth leol ledled Cymru, yn arbennig drwy'r is-grŵp gwariant. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf hefyd yn ystyried barn y pwyllgor pwnc.

David Lloyd: Pa strategaeth sydd ar waith i ddelio â sefyllfa lle mae cyngor, fel Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe, mewn dyled, yn brin o £6 miliwn ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf, ac yn talu cyfanswm o £170 miliwn am e-lywodraeth yn dilyn cynnydd yn y costau hynny?

David Lloyd: What strategy do you have in place to deal with a situation whereby a council, such as Swansea City and County Council, is in debt, has a deficit of £6 million for the forthcoming year, and pays £170 million for e-government following an increase in those costs?

Sue Essex: As you know, Swansea council has been duly elected as a democratic organisation. We expect it to manage its own finances. I would not automatically jump in to help with any deficits.

Sue Essex: Fel y gwyddoch, etholwyd cyngor Abertawe yn briodol fel sefydliad democrataidd. Disgwyliwn iddo reoli ei gyllid ei hun. Ni fyddwn yn rhuthro i helpu gydag unrhyw ddiffygion o reidrwydd.

David Melding: Minister, you will be pleased to hear that Care Forum Wales held a very successful event at the Assembly, which was well attended by Members from all parties. The forum is highlighting the fact that it is facing higher levels of care costs because of increases in standards, which we welcome. The Welsh Local Government Association has developed a toolkit to try to assess the actual costs of residential and nursing care. I hope that you will be encouraging the take-up of this excellent development by local authorities, and that we will have a renewed partnership between the nursing and residential home sector and local government.

David Melding: Weinidog, byddwch yn falch clywed bod Fforwm Gofal Cymru wedi cynnal digwyddiad llwyddiannus iawn yn y Cynulliad, digwyddiad lle yr oedd nifer da o Aelodau o bob plaid yn bresennol. Mae'r fforwm yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith ei fod yn wynebu costau gofal uwch oherwydd bod safonau wedi codi, sy'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei groesawu. Mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi datblygu pecyn cymorth i geisio asesu costau gwirioneddol gofal preswyl a nyrsio. Gobeithio y byddwch yn annog awdurdodau lleol i fanteisio ar y datblygiad ardderchog hwn, ac y cawn bartneriaeth o'r newydd rhwng y sector cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio a llywodraeth leol.

Sue Essex: I am sorry that I could not attend that event, as a school from my constituency was visiting. However, I appreciate the important part that these homes play in care, particularly, but not exclusively, for the elderly. It was certainly one of the things at the back of my mind over the last few years, in providing increased funding for social care. I know that some of that has gone towards meeting increased charges. The whole of the care sector is very important to us. We need to provide good-quality care for those in need, and good rates of remuneration for the staff involved, because they do an important job.

Jenny Randerson: Minister, as I never tire of telling you, Cardiff received the lowest increase in local government funding for next year from your Government, and less money from you means more money from council tax payers. The problem is that council tax payers in Cardiff are facing a double whammy. They will face an increase not just in council tax, but in their police precept, if the Government's proposals for a unified police force for Wales go ahead. As you know, the police precept for south Wales is much lower than that for the rest of Wales, and there is bound to be a levelling up. What discussions and negotiations have you had with the Home Office to ensure that there is a fair and reasonable approach to the costs of reorganising the police force, and that this impact on people in Cardiff is buffered?

Sue Essex: I will start with your first premise, because you keep trotting this one out, as if it is just my decision, or the Labour Government's decision, as to what Cardiff gets in its settlement. I point out to you, and everyone else—as I am sure that you know—that what Cardiff gets in its settlement is the result of a considerable amount of cross-party, cross-sector work, done by a group made up of local government representatives and our representatives across all political parties. The formula—not my formula, but everyone else's—is agreed and then it is applied. When it is applied, I expect all those Members who take part in drawing up that formula, across the political parties, to accept its impact. I accept its impact as a Cardiff AM. You need to understand that, and not try

Sue Essex: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad oeddwn wedi gallu bod yn y digwyddiad hwnnw gan fod ysgol o'm hetholaeth ar ymweliad. Fodd bynnag, deallaf swyddogaeth bwysig sydd y cartrefi hyn ym maes gofal i'r henoed, yn arbennig, ond nid yn unig. Yn sicr, yr oedd yn un o'r pethau yng nghefn fy meddwl yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf wrth ddarparu mwy o arian ar gyfer gofal cymdeithasol. Gwn fod rhywfaint o hwnnw wedi mynd tuag at dalu'r costau uwch. Mae'r sector gofal i gyd yn bwysig iawn inni. Mae angen inni ddarparu gofal o safon i bobl mewn angen, a thâl da i'r staff dan sylw, oherwydd maent yn gwneud gwaith pwysig.

Jenny Randerson: Weinidog, fel yr wyf yn barod i ddweud wrthyf bob amser, Caerdydd a gafodd y cynnydd lleiaf mewn arian llywodraeth leol gan eich Llywodraeth am y flwyddyn nesaf, ac mae llai o arian gennych chi yn golygu mwy o arian gan bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor. Y broblem yw bod pobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor yng Nghaerdydd yn wynebu dwy ergyd. Byddant yn wynebu cynnydd, nid yn unig yn eu treth gyngor, ond yn y praesept i'r heddlu, os bydd cynigion y Llywodraeth yn mynd yn eu blaenau i greu heddlu unedig i Gymru. Fel y gwyddoch, mae praesept yr heddlu ar gyfer y de lawer yn is nag yng ngweddill Cymru, ac mae'n siŵr o gael ei godi'n uwch. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref i sicrhau y bydd ymagwedd deg a rhesymol at gostau ad-drefnu'r heddlu, ac y lleddfir effaith hyn ar bobl Caerdydd?

Sue Essex: Dechreuaf gyda'ch gosodiad cyntaf, oherwydd yr ydych yn mynnu ailadrodd hyn o hyd, fel pe bai penderfynu faint a gaiff Caerdydd yn ei setliad yn benderfyniad i mi neu i'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn unig. Tynnaf eich sylw chi, a phawb arall, at y ffaith—fel y gwyddoch mae'n siŵr—mai'r hyn a gaiff Caerdydd yn ei setliad yw canlyniad llawer o waith ar draws y pleidiau ac ar draws sectorau, gan grŵp sy'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr llywodraeth leol a'n cynrychiolwyr ni o bob plaid wleidyddol. Cytunir ar y fformiwla—nid fy fformiwla i, ond fformiwla pawb arall—ac yna caiff ei defnyddio. Pan gaiff ei defnyddio, disgwyliaf i bob un o'r Aelodau hynny sy'n cymryd rhan wrth lunio'r fformiwla honno, ar draws pob plaid wleidyddol, dderbyn ei heffaith. Yr wyf

to give the impression that I or the Labour Government have somehow done Cardiff down. Nothing could be further from the truth: it is an agreed approach.

fi'n derbyn ei heffaith fel AC yng Nghaerdydd. Rhaid ichi ddeall hynny, a pheidio â cheisio rhoi'r argraff fy mod i neu'r Llywodraeth Lafur wedi gwneud tro gwael â Chaerdydd mewn rhyw ffordd. Nid oes gwir yn hynny o gwbl: ymagwedd wedi ei chytuno yw hi.

In terms of the police precept, south Wales has already made its considerations. I am not sure whether it is in the public domain, but I understand that it is at a reasonable level, so I do not think that there is any point in your question about discussions.

O ran praesept yr heddlu, mae heddlu de Cymru wedi ei ystyried eisoes. Nid wyf yn siŵr a yw'n gyhoeddus, ond deallaf ei fod yn rhesymol, felly ni chredaf fod unrhyw ddiben i'ch cwestiwn ynghylch trafodaethau.

Y Portffolio Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes The Education and Lifelong Learning Portfolio

Q4 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget provision for the education and lifelong learning portfolio? OAQ0457(FIN)

C4 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb a ddarperir ar gyfer y portffolio addysg a dysgu gydol oes? OAQ0457(FIN)

Sue Essex: The budget allocation for the education and lifelong learning main expenditure group will rise from £1.5 million in 2006-07 to over £1.6 billion in 2008-09. This represents an increase of 24 per cent between 2005-06 and 2008-09.

Sue Essex: Bydd dyraniad y gyllideb ar gyfer y prif grŵp gwariant addysg a dysgu gydol oes yn codi o £1.5 miliwn yn 2006-07 i fwy na £1.6 biliwn yn 2008-09. Golyga hyn gynnydd o 24 y cant rhwng 2005-06 a 2008-09.

Mark Isherwood: In recent years, unit cost funding for students in further education colleges has fallen. The numbers of further education staff and courses have fallen, and thousands of students have been turned away. We are told that the third year of the pay settlement for further education teachers will be funded in full, but I am advised that this excludes the cost of increments as staff move up the pay scales, and the additional costs of national insurance and pensions. What provisions have you made in your budget to meet these costs, or, as colleges fear, will this, added to the 1 per efficiency gains expected of them, lead to further job losses in this very labour-intensive sector?

Mark Isherwood: Yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, gostyngodd cyllid yn ôl cost yr uned i fyfyrwyr mewn colegau addysg bellach. Mae nifer y staff a'r cyrsiau addysg bellach wedi gostwng, a miloedd o fyfyrwyr wedi eu troi ymaith. Dywedir wrthym y bydd y drydedd blwyddyn yn setliad cyflogau athrawon addysg bellach yn cael ei chyllido'n llawn. Ond deallaf nad yw hyn yn cynnwys costau cynyddiadau wrth i staff symud i ben y raddfa gyflog, na chostau ychwanegol yswiriant gwladol a phensiynau. Pa ddarpariaethau yr ydych wedi eu gwneud yn eich cyllideb i dalu'r costau hyn? Neu a ychwanegir hyn at yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant y mae disgwyl iddynt eu cyflawni, fel y mae colegau'n ei ofni, gan arwain at golli rhagor o swyddi yn y sector llafurddwys iawn hwn?

Sue Essex: Jane Davidson is responsible for bidding for and dealing with the settlements, so I cannot answer that, but I will talk to her and give you an answer.

Sue Essex: Jane Davidson sy'n gyfrifol am wneud cais am setliadau ac ymdrin â hwy, felly, ni allaf ateb hynny, ond byddaf yn siarad â hi a chewch ateb.

Irene James: Would you agree that it is vital to financially prioritise early years education to encourage positive learning experiences and to ensure that young people are given the best opportunity to raise their long-term educational and career expectations, and to overcome the poverty of aspiration present in our poorest communities, opening up further and higher education to everyone across Wales?

Sue Essex: You are absolutely right. Evidence shows us that the best thing that you can do for children is to give them a solid education early on. By that, I mean education in the widest sense, so that those children feel part of society. Initiatives such as the free school breakfasts are important, as is Flying Start. The development of the foundation phase—and Jane has already put in some money in for preparatory work—will be increasingly important in terms of the early years in school.

2.20 p.m.

Janet Ryder: I think that you are aware that many headteachers and governors are going through a painful process of re-evaluating their staff structures. Many teachers are facing the loss of allowances that they have held for many years and, to help them, schools are doing their best to bring in a three or four-year damping period, so that it does not hit too hard, too quickly. Increasingly, headteachers are having to take that money out of their school reserves, and they are saying that it is a totally unsustainable situation. What assessment have you made of schools in Wales and their need to provide money for this damping mechanism, and what provision have you made in your budget to help schools in that situation?

Sue Essex: We are going through a period of change in education, as you know, because falling school rolls have enormous implications for schools. It is difficult because pupil numbers are an essential element of school budgets. I understand why it is difficult for headteachers, who are making these changes, but they have to do it.

Irene James: A fyddech yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol blaenoriaethu addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar o ran cyllid er mwyn annog profiadau dysgu cadarnhaol, ac i sicrhau rhoi'r cyfle gorau i bobl ifanc i godi eu disgwyliadau addysgol a gyrfaol hirdymor, ac i goresgyn y diffyg uchelgais a welir yn ein cymunedau tlotaf, gan wneud addysg bellach ac addysg uwch yn agored i bawb yng Nghymru?

Sue Essex: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle. Dengys tystiolaeth inni mai'r peth gorau y gallwch ei wneud dros blant yw rhoi addysg gadarn iddynt yn gynnar. Golygaf wrth hynny addysg yn ei hystyr ehangach, fel y bydd y plant hynny'n teimlo'n rhan o gymdeithas. Mae mentrau fel brechwast am ddim yn yr ysgol yn bwysig, fel y mae Dechrau'n Deg. Bydd datblygu'r cyfnod sylfaen—ac mae Jane eisoes wedi rhoi arian ar gyfer gwaith paratoi—yn gynyddol bwysig o ran y blynyddoedd cynnar yn yr ysgol.

Janet Ryder: Credaf eich bod yn ymwybodol fod nifer o benaethiaid a llywodraethwyr yn mynd drwy broses boenus o ail-werthuso eu strwythurau staff. Mae llawer athro yn wynebu colli lwfansau a fu ganddynt ers blynyddoedd. Er mwyn eu helpu, mae ysgolion yn gwneud eu gorau glas i gyflwyno cyfnod dampio o dair i bedair blynedd, fel nad fydd hynny'n taro'n rhy galed yn rhy gyflym. Mae penaethiaid yn gynyddol yn gorfod cymryd yr arian hwnnw o'u cronfeydd ysgol wrth gefn, ac maent yn dweud ei bod yn sefyllfa gwbl anghynaliadwy. Pa asesiad yr ydych wedi ei wneud o ysgolion yng Nghymru a'u hangen i ddarparu arian ar gyfer y dull dampio hwn? A pha ddarpariaeth yr ydych wedi ei gwneud yn eich cyllideb i helpu ysgolion yn y sefyllfa honno?

Sue Essex: Yr ydym yn wynebu cyfnod o newid ym myd addysg, fel y gwyddoch, oherwydd mae'r gostyngiad mewn cofrestrau ysgolion yn cael effaith enfawr ar ysgolion. Mae'n anodd am fod niferoedd disgyblion yn elfen hanfodol yng nghyllidebau ysgolion. Deallaf pam y mae'n anodd i benaethiaid, sy'n gwneud y newidiadau hyn, ond rhaid iddynt eu gwneud.

It is interesting that reserve levels, overall, in schools in Wales are particularly high—I think that they went up by 14 per cent on average last year. Therefore, there is a place for reserves and, sometimes, that can enable schools to account for that transitional change.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 5 OAQ0465(FIN), question 6 OAQ0466(FIN) and question 7 OAQ0425(FIN) have been withdrawn.

Mae'n ddiddorol fod lefelau cronfeydd wrth gefn, ar y cyfan, mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru yn arbennig o uchel—credaf eu bod wedi codi 14 y cant ar gyfartaledd y llynedd. Felly, mae lle i gronfeydd wrth gefn, ac weithiau gall hynny alluogi ysgolion i roi cyfrif am y newid trosiannol hwnnw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Tynnwyd Cwestiwn 5 OAQ0465(FIN), cwestiwn 6 OAQ0466(FIN) a chwestiwn 7 OAQ0425(FIN) yn ôl.

Uno'r Cyrff Cyhoeddus a Noddir gan y Cynulliad The Assembly Sponsored Public Bodies' Merger

Q8 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on the cost of the Assembly sponsored public bodies' merger with the Assembly Government? OAQ0455(FIN)

C8 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gost uno'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAQ0455(FIN)

Sue Essex: A provision of £4.7 million has been made for this year to meet the costs of the mergers that cannot be met from within existing resources. Further detail of the costs of mergers will be published in the Assembly and ASPBs' accounts later this year.

Sue Essex: Gwnaed darpariaeth o £4.7 miliwn ar gyfer eleni i dalu costau uno'r CCNCau na ellir eu talu o adnoddau sydd eisoes yn bod. Cyhoeddir manylion pellach am gostau uno'r CCNCau yng nghyfrifon y Cynulliad a'r CCNCau yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Lisa Francis: I am concerned, because I have heard that the work that was to be undertaken immediately after the merger process in April, looking into the roles and responsibilities of regional tourism partnerships, has now been shelved. How will that important omission affect the budgets of the RTPs over the next year, and has the process been shelved to save money?

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf yn pryderu oherwydd imi glywed bod y gwaith a oedd i'w wneud yn syth ar ôl y broses uno ym mis Ebrill, sef edrych ar rolau a chyfrifoldebau partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, yn awr wedi ei roi o'r neilltu. Sut y bydd yr hepgoriad pwysig hwnnw'n effeithio ar gyllidebau'r partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol dros y flwyddyn nesaf, ac a yw'r broses wedi'i rhoi o'r neilltu er mwyn arbed arian?

Sue Essex: That comes under the responsibility of Andrew Davies and I imagine that that question would have been best targeted at him. However, I will ensure that the question is transferred to him and that you get a reply.

Sue Essex: Andrew Davies sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, a hwyrach y byddai wedi bod yn well gofyn y cwestiwn hwnnw iddo ef. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn sicrhau bod y cwestiwn yn cael ei drosglwyddo iddo a'ch bod yn cael ateb.

Eleanor Burnham: How much will the shift of former ASPB employees into the civil service pension fund cost the Assembly? Have you not failed staff because their pension funds have not been transferred automatically to the civil service scheme?

Eleanor Burnham: Faint fydd y broses o drosglwyddo cyn weithwyr CCNCau i gronfa pensiwn y gwasanaeth sifil yn ei gostio i'r Cynulliad? Onid ydych wedi siomi staff am nad yw eu cronfeydd pensiwn wedi eu trosglwyddo'n awtomatig i gynllun y

gwasanaeth sifil?

Sue Essex: As I understand it, staff still have the chance to make choices and I thought that the First Minister dealt with those points in his statement.

Sue Essex: Yn ôl a ddeallaf, mae gan staff y cyfle o hyd i wneud dewisiadau, ac yr oeddwn yn credu bod y Prif Weinidog wedi delio â'r pwyntiau hynny yn ei ddatganiad.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Af â chi yn ôl at y cwestiwn gwreiddiol. A allwch roi gwarant i ni na fydd effaith ar y gwasanaethau y mae'r cyrff hyn yn eu cynnig nac ar yr hyn y maent yn ei gyflawni oherwydd y costau sydd ynghlwm wrth eu tynnu i mewn i'r Cynulliad?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I refer you back to the original question. Can you give us a guarantee that the services provided by these bodies and what they achieve will not be affected because of the costs involved in bringing them into the Assembly?

Sue Essex: The whole point of the merger was to bring organisations in so that they could work better than they have done as individual organisations; the intention was not to diminish services. As I have said up front, we know that we need to put more money in to help the integration and that is what we have done. Over a period of years, there will be some savings, but we understand that, at the beginning, costs will be involved in order to get the best meshing of the organisations.

Sue Essex: Holl ddiben uno'r CCNCau oedd dod â sefydliadau i mewn er mwyn iddynt allu gweithio'n well nag y maent wedi'i wneud fel sefydliadau unigol; nid lleihau gwasanaethau oedd y bwriad. Fel yr wyf wedi ei ddweud yn gwbl agored, gwyddom fod angen inni fuddsoddi mwy o arian i helpu'r broses integreiddio, a dyna yr ydym wedi ei wneud. Dros gyfnod o flynyddoedd, bydd rhai arbedion, ond deallwn, ar y dechrau, y bydd costau er mwyn sicrhau uno'r sefydliadau yn y ffordd orau.

Blaenoriaethau Ariannu Funding Priorities

Q9 Alun Cairns: Will the Minister make a statement on her funding priorities for the Assembly Government reserve?
OAO0458(FIN)

C9 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei blaenoriaethau ariannu ar gyfer cronfa wrth gefn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad? OAO0458(FIN)

Sue Essex: I am sure that you will agree that it is good financial management to maintain a prudent level of reserves. I will use those to manage unforeseen pressures that arise during the year.

Sue Essex: Yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunwch mai rheolaeth ariannol dda yw cadw lefel ddarbodus o gronfeydd wrth gefn. Byddaf yn defnyddio'r rheini i reoli pwysau sydd heb eu rhag-weld ac sy'n codi yn ystod y flwyddyn.

Alun Cairns: It is also good financial management and prudent to have a modelling system in place for the likelihood of pension transfers from the ASPBs, particularly the Welsh Development Agency. In your response to Eleanor Burnham, you said that the First Minister had answered these issues in his statement, yet he has not conducted any modelling of what is likely to happen. The simplistic argument of year-for-year benefit not accounting for a full year within the civil service pension scheme is simply not good enough, because people in the civil service

Alun Cairns: Mae hefyd yn rheolaeth ariannol dda ac yn ddarbodus rhoi system fodelu ar waith ar gyfer y tebygolrwydd o drosglwyddo pensiynau o'r CCNCau, yn enwedig Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Yn eich ymateb i Eleanor Burnham, yr oeddech yn dweud bod y Prif Weinidog wedi ateb y materion hynny yn ei ddatganiad. Ac eto nid yw wedi modelu'r hyn sy'n debygol o ddigwydd o gwbl. Nid yw'r ddadl syml nad yw budd o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yn cyfrif am flwyddyn gyfan o fewn cynllun pensiwn y gwasanaeth sifil yn ddigon da, oherwydd

pension scheme will be able to retire earlier than people in the WDA pension scheme. That is one factor. Similarly, the cash value calculation on a like-for-like basis, although it is not a full year in the civil service benefit scheme, is not as simple as the Minister suggests. Would it not be prudent—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You must be coming to the end of your speech, now. You are taking advantage.

Alun Cairns: I apologise. Would it not be prudent and right, Finance Minister, to conduct a modelling arrangement to work out the number of staff likely to receive advice that it would be better for them to transfer to the civil service pension scheme? That is—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You may reply if you wish, Minister.

Sue Essex: Existing WDA staff must be crying buckets of tears having heard your great defence of the situation, Alun. It is difficult to model choice, is it not? That is the answer. People are being given a choice and independent advice. You are trying to intimate that we should already decide for them what they should do. That is not fair and that is not the option. Independent financial advice is available at no cost to them on what the best course might be for them. It is not for me to pre-empt their decisions.

Jocelyn Davies: I wish to bring you back to the reserves. You are on record as saying that you intend to keep an adequate reserve to tackle unforeseen disasters—I think that your example was avian flu. A cynic might suspect the Government of building up reserves in order to have a spending spree in the time leading up to an election. Will you assure us that that is not the case, and will you reiterate the level of reserve that you consider it prudent to keep?

Sue Essex: I can assure you that that is not the case, Jocelyn, so you can now sleep

bydd pobl yng nghynllun pensiwn y gwasanaeth sifil yn gallu ymddeol yn gynharach na phobl yng nghynllun pensiwn WDA. Dyna un ffactor. Yn yr un modd, nid yw'r cyfrifiad gwerth arian parod ar sail tebyg am debyg, er nad yw'n flwyddyn gyfan yng nghynllun buddiannau'r gwasanaeth sifil, mor syml ag y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei awgrymu. Oni fyddai'n ddarbodus—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Rhaid ichi dynnu at ddiwedd eich araith yn awr. Yr ydych yn cymryd mantais.

Alun Cairns: Ymddiheuraf am hynny. Oni fyddai'n ddarbodus ac yn gywir, Weinidog Cyllid, i wneud trefniant modelu er mwyn gweithio allan nifer y staff sy'n debygol o gael eu cynghori y byddai'n well iddynt drosglwyddo i gynllun pensiwn y gwasanaeth sifil? Hynny yw—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Cewch ateb os dymunwch, Weinidog.

Sue Essex: Rhaid bod staff presennol WDA yn llefain y glaw wrth eich clywed yn amddiffyn y sefyllfa mor lew, Alun. Mae'n anodd modelu dewis, onid yw? Dyna'r ateb. Mae pobl yn cael dewis a chynghor annibynnol. Yr ydych yn ceisio awgrymu y dylem eisoes benderfynu drostynt beth y dylent ei wneud. Nid yw hynny'n deg ac nid dyna'r dewis. Mae cynghor ariannol annibynnol ar gael am ddim iddynt am yr hyn a allai fod orau iddynt. Nid wyf mewn sefyllfa i ragdybio eu penderfyniadau.

Jocelyn Davies: Hoffwn ddychwelyd at y cronfeydd wrth gefn. Yr ydych wedi cofnodi eich bod yn bwriadu cadw cronfa ddigonol wrth gefn er mwyn mynd i'r afael â thrychinebau sydd heb eu rhag-weld—credaf mai ffliw adar oedd eich enghraifft. Efallai y byddai sinig yn amau bod y Llywodraeth yn adeiladu cronfeydd wrth gefn er mwyn gallu gwario'n ddi-baid yn ystod y cyfnod yn arwain at etholiad. A wnewch ein sicrhau nad yw hynny'n wir, ac a ddywedwch eto faint yw lefel y gronfa wrth gefn sy'n ddarbodus ei chadw yn eich barn chi?

Sue Essex: Gallaf eich sicrhau nad dyna'r gwir, Jocelyn, felly gallwch gysgu'n dawel

soundly in your bed. As if I would do such a thing. I am honest about this, though, and we must move towards having an adequate reserve. I come from a local government background, and we were advised by the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy to have a level of 5 per cent. It worries me if we do not build up an adequate level of reserve, though it does not necessarily have to be 5 per cent—we are starting off this year with £100 million in usable reserves, which is only 0.75 per cent of our total spend. I hope that we can double that by next year, and that was my provision within the budget. However, we do not know because events might happen between now and then. However, like you, I think that we would all agree that we need the security of having that money there. The event may not be dramatic as avian flu—it could just be a nasty bout of ordinary flu—but these things come along and you have to ensure that you have protection to deal with them.

yn awr. Ni fyddwn hyd yn oed yn ystyried gwneud y fath beth. Yr wyf yn onest ynghylch hyn, serch hynny, a rhaid inni symud tuag at gael cronfa ddigonol wrth gefn. Llywodraeth leol yw fy nghefnidir, ac fe'n cynghorwyd gan y Sefydliad Siartredig Cyllid Cyhoeddus a Chyfrifyddiaeth i gael lefel o 5 y cant. Yr wyf yn pryderu, os nad adeiladwn gronfa ddigonol wrth gefn, er nad oes rhaid iddi fod yn 5 y cant o reidrwydd—y byddwn yn cychwyn eleni gyda £100 miliwn mewn cronfeydd y gellir eu defnyddio, sy'n ddim ond 0.75 y cant o'n cyfanswm gwariant. Gobeithio y gallwn ddyblu hynny erbyn y flwyddyn nesaf, a dyna oedd fy narpariaeth yn y gyllideb. Fodd bynnag, ni wyddom, oherwydd gallai pethau ddigwydd rhwng nawr a'r pryd hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel chi yr wyf yn credu y byddem i gyd yn cytuno bod angen y sicrwydd o gael yr arian hwnnw yno. Efallai na fydd y digwyddiad mor ddramatig â ffliw adar—gallai fod yn ddim ond achos cas o ffliw cyffredin—ond mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd a rhaid ichi sicrhau bod gennych ddiogelwch i ymdrin â hwy.

Y Portffolio Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol **The Health and Social Services Portfolio**

C10 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Pa sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu derbyn gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gyda golwg ar yr arian a ddyrennir yn gyffredinol i'r portffolio hwn? OAQ0428(FIN)

Q10 Ieuan Wyn Jones: What representations has the Minister received from the Minister for Health and Social Services with regard to the overall allocation of funding for this portfolio? OAQ0428(FIN)

Sue Essex: I have regular discussions with the Minister for Health and Social Services on a number of issues, including finance.

Sue Essex: Byddaf yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ar nifer o faterion, gan gynnwys cyllid.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolch am yr ateb cynhwysfawr hwnnw. A fyddai'r Gweinidog yn cadarnhau mai £22 miliwn oedd dyledion y 12 ymddiriedolaeth iechyd ar ddiwedd mis Rhagfyr y llynedd? Mae'n ymwybodol bod pwysau cynyddol ar y cyrff hyn o safbwynt methu â chyflogi staff. Maent hefyd yn gweld eu gwasanaethau i gleifion yn cael eu heffeithio oherwydd bod yn rhaid iddynt ystyried sut i dalu'r arian yn ôl. Flwyddyn nesaf, maent yn disgwyl dyledion pellach. Sut mae'r Gweinidog yn credu y gall helpu'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Thank you for that comprehensive answer. Would the Minister confirm that, at the end of December last year, the deficit for the 12 health trusts was £22 million? She is aware that there is increasing pressure on these bodies in terms of failing to recruit staff. They also see their services to patients being affected because they must contemplate how they will repay these debts. They expect additional debts next year. How does the Minister think she can assist the Minister for Health and Social Services to overcome that serious problem?

Cymdeithasol i oresgyn y broblem ddifrifol hon?

Sue Essex: I am not sure whether Brian needs any help from me, because, like his predecessor, Jane Hutt, he has kept good control of health finances. We have been trying to remove what we inherited, which was the acceptance of a deficit culture. That was not the case right across the board, but it was in certain areas. You know, and all of us agree, that that is not a healthy situation to be in, so there has been help and a great deal of support to try to move away from that particular situation.

I acknowledge that that is difficult for trusts. I talk to them and I know that it is difficult, but we have to move away from automatically thinking that we can run up deficits at the end of the financial year and that we will be bailed out, if for no other reason than that it does not encourage and support those trusts that are managing within their budgets and are doing an effective job. Therefore, I think that the approach that we have taken is fair and realistic. Brian is also making a statement later this afternoon.

2.30 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan: Minister, your Government has trumpeted the 'Agenda for Change' programme. Many people in the nursing profession do not believe that the Minister for Health and Social Services is funding the 'Agenda for Change' programme fully. Will you confirm whether there is a problem with the funds allocated for this particular scheme within the health budget? Are you aware that there are those within the nursing profession who believe that the shortfall is somewhere in the region of £24 million? If you are aware of that, what will you do about it as the Finance Minister?

Sue Essex: I am not aware of it, Jonathan, and I have not had any representations from Brian. I know that, when we had discussions on the budget, the whole agenda for change, which is wider than the technical view of 'Agenda for Change', was at the core of our deliberations in terms of funding, because, if they are pay settlements, they are pay settlements. So I believe that we have, and I

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn siŵr a oes angen fy help i ar Brian, oherwydd fel ei ragflaenydd, Jane Hutt, mae wedi llwyddo i reoli cyllid iechyd yn dda. Yr ydym wedi bod yn ceisio dileu'r hyn a etifeddwyd gennym, sef derbyn diwylliant o ddiffyg. Nid oedd hynny'n wir yn gyffredinol, ond roedd yn wir mewn rhai meysydd. Fe wyddoch, ac mae pob un ohonom yn cytuno, nad yw hon yn sefyllfa iach, felly, cafwyd help a llawer iawn o gefnogaeth i geisio symud i ffwrdd o'r sefyllfa benodol honno.

Cydnabyddaf fod hynny'n anodd i ymddiriedolaethau. Byddaf yn siarad â hwy, a gwn ei bod yn anodd, ond rhaid inni roi'r gorau i feddwl yn awtomatig y gallwn gael diffyg ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn ariannol ac y byddwn yn cael help, a hynny, yn anad dim, i sicrhau nad yw'n annog ac yn cefnogi'r ymddiriedolaethau hynny sy'n ymdopi o fewn eu cyllidebau ac sydd mor effeithiol. Felly, credaf fod yr ymagwedd yr ydym wedi ei mabwysiadu yn deg ac yn realistig. Bydd Brian hefyd yn gwneud datganiad yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma.

Jonathan Morgan: Weinidog, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi canu clodydd y rhaglen 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Mae nifer o bobl yn y proffesiwn nyrsio nad ydynt yn credu bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn ariannu'r rhaglen 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn llawn. A allwch gadarnhau a oes problem gyda'r cyllid a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer y cynllun penodol hwn o fewn y gyllideb iechyd? A ydych yn ymwybodol fod rhai yn y proffesiwn nyrsio sy'n credu bod yna ddiffyg o tua £24 miliwn? Os ydych yn ymwybodol o hynny, beth fyddwch yn ei wneud ynghylch hynny fel y Gweinidog Cyllid?

Sue Essex: Nid wyf yn ymwybodol o hynny, Jonathan, ac nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau gan Brian. Pan gawsom drafodaethau am y gyllideb, gwn mai'r agenda gyfan ar gyfer newid, sy'n ehangach na'r safbwynt technegol yn 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', oedd wrth wraidd yr hyn a drafodwyd gennym o ran cyllid, oherwydd, os ydynt yn setliadau cyflog, maent yn

have not had any representations from Brian to say anything different.

setliadau cyflog. Felly credaf ein bod wedi, ac nid wyf wedi cael unrhyw sylwadau gan Brian yn datgan unrhyw beth i'r gwrthwyneb.

Y Portffolio Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio The Social Justice and Regeneration Portfolio

Q11 Mark Isherwood: Will the Minister make a statement on the budget provision for the social justice and regeneration portfolio? OAQ0456(FIN)

C11 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y gyllideb a ddarperir ar gyfer y portffolio cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio? OAQ0456(FIN)

Sue Essex: The budget allocation for social justice and regeneration will rise from £592 million in 2006-07 to £635 million in 2008-09, representing an average 12 per cent increase between 2005-06 and 2008-09.

Sue Essex: Bydd y dyraniad cyllidebol ar gyfer cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio yn cynyddu o £592 miliwn yn 2006-07 i £635 miliwn yn 2008-09, sef cyfartaledd cynnydd o 12 y cant rhwng 2005-06 a 2008-09.

Mark Isherwood: What do you think is the relationship between the continuing rise in homelessness and housing waiting lists in Wales since devolution and your Government's massive housing cuts, both to date and projected forward to 2008?

Mark Isherwood: Beth a gredwch yw'r gydberthynas rhwng y cynnydd parhaus mewn digartrefedd a rhestrau aros am dai yng Nghymru ers datganoli a thoriadau tai aruthrol eich Llywodraeth, hyd yma a chan ragamcanu hyd at 2008?

Sue Essex: We are all worried about the growth in homelessness, but we took the brave step of putting in the right definition of homelessness. That inevitably led to an increase in numbers. We are not only worried about it, we are doing something about it; a range of initiatives have been implemented over recent years to help on that. This is primarily around grants; an extra £5 million in grants will be available this year for organisations to help work with people who are homeless or at risk of homelessness. The other thing that I think that it is important to say is that work is being done on the root causes of homelessness. It is quite a complicated issue, as I am sure you will appreciate, and as I know myself. There are many categories of people who unfortunately become homeless and you have to deal with it in a sensitive and sophisticated way, otherwise you are not dealing with the root causes of homelessness.

Sue Essex: Yr ydym oll yn pryderu am y twf mewn digartrefedd, ond bu inni gymryd cam dewr wrth nodi'r diffiniad cywir o ddigartrefedd. Yn anochel, arweiniodd hynny at gynnydd mewn niferoedd. Yn ogystal â phryderu, yr ydym yn gweithredu; rhoddwyd ystod o fentrau ar waith yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf i helpu yn hynny o beth. Maent yn bennaf seiliedig ar grantiau; bydd £5 miliwn ychwanegol o grantiau ar gael eleni ar gyfer sefydliadau i hwyluso gwaith gyda phobl sy'n ddigartref neu mewn perygl o fod yn ddigartref. Y peth arall sy'n bwysig ei nodi, yn fy marn i, yw bod gwaith yn mynd rhagddo ar achosion sylfaenol digartrefedd. Mae'n fater cymhleth iawn, fel y gwerthfawrogwch mae'n siŵr, ac fel y gwn i fy hun. Mae sawl categori o bobl a ddaw, yn anffodus, yn ddigartref ac mae'n rhaid ymdrin â hynny mewn ffordd sensitive a soffistigedig, neu fel arall nid ydych yn ymdrin ag achosion sylfaenol digartrefedd.

Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth Economic Development and Transport

C12 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa flaenoriaethau a ystyriwyd gan y Gweinidog wrth ddyrannu'r gyllideb ar gyfer datblygu economaidd a thrafnidiaeth? OAQ0422(FIN)

Q12 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What priorities were considered by the Minister when allocating the budget for economic development and transport? OAQ0422(FIN)

Sue Essex: I considered the strategic priorities as set out in 'Wales: A Better Country'.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: A dderbyniwch, gan rywun sy'n cynrychioli etholaeth yn ne-orllewin Cymru, bod teimlad yn yr ardal bod coridorau'r M4 a'r A55 yn cael eu blaenoriaethu o ran arian ar gyfer datblygu economaidd, a bod ardaloedd gwledig, felly, ar eu colled? A ystyriwch roi blaenoriaeth i drafnidiaeth a datblygu economaidd mewn ardaloedd fel Sir Caerfyrddin? Fel arall, bydd hi'n anodd iawn i sicrhau gwaith a chyflogau da i'n pobl.

Sue Essex: The M4 obviously affects Carmarthenshire, so I am not sure about your geography there. South-west Wales has had some exciting investments and, from my visits, it has seemed quite buoyant. I have not had the kind of complaints that you mentioned. However, you are right to say that transport is an important part of economic development, and that is why the Minister for Economic Development and Transport announced £125-million worth of transport grants last week, which go to all local authorities in Wales. From the perspective of the spatial plan, the south-west group and the Pembrokeshire area are two distinct regions, and the plan has highlighted the importance of transport. Programmes will be put in place to support some of the schemes that they want to develop in the south-west.

Sue Essex: Ystyriais y blaenoriaethau strategol fel y'u nodir yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well'.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Would you accept, from someone who represents a constituency in south-west Wales, that there is a feeling in the area that the M4 and A55 corridors are prioritised in terms of money for economic development, and that rural areas therefore lose out? Will you consider prioritising transport and economic development in areas such as Carmarthenshire? Otherwise, it will be difficult to ensure work and salaries of high quality.

Sue Essex: Mae'r M4 yn amlwg yn effeithio ar Sir Gaerfyrddin, felly nid wyf yn siŵr am eich daearyddiaeth. Mae de-orllewin Cymru wedi elwa ar fuddsoddiadau cyffrous, ac, o'r hyn a welaf wrth ymweld â'r ardal, ymddengys ei bod yn gymharol ffyniannus. Ni chlywais y math o gwynion a grybwyllwyd gennych. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich lle wrth nodi bod trafnidiaeth yn rhan bwysig o ddatblygu economaidd, a dyna pam y cyhoeddodd y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth werth £125 miliwn o grantiau trafnidiaeth yr wythnos ddiwethaf, a gaiff eu dosbarthu i'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. O safbwynt y cynllun gofodol, mae grŵp y de-orllewin ac ardal Sir Benfro yn ddau ranbarth ar wahân, ac mae'r cynllun wedi amlygu pwysigrwydd trafnidiaeth. Caiff rhaglenni eu sefydlu i gefnogi rhai o'r cynlluniau y maent am eu datblygu yn y de-orllewin.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad Questions to the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside

Llosgi Gwastraff Incineration of Waste

Q1 The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Will the Minister make a statement on the incineration of waste? OAQ0620 (EPC)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): The Wales waste strategy identifies energy from

C1 Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am losgi gwastraff? OAQ0620 (EPC)

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Mae strategaeth wastraff Cymru yn nodi ynni

waste as an option for the treatment of residual municipal waste, subject to certain conditions.

Michael German: I thank the Minister for that comprehensive answer. Would he agree that waste reduction and recycling are higher up the priority list for the removal of waste in our system? It has been put to me by local authorities that if you want to reduce waste and recycle more you will have to separate waste at home. More separation at home means more activity and collections by local councils. Do you agree, Minister, that separation at home is the only way to ensure that we have more recycling and meet the Welsh Assembly Government's recycling targets?

Carwyn Jones: It is certainly a way of ensuring that recycling is more effective. We know that if people separate at home, it means that they will develop good habits for the future and they will have a greater buy-in towards recycling.

Michael German: It has been put to me by local councils that the only way in which your targets can be met is by increasing the amount of waste that is separated at home. Mechanical separation cannot remove enough of the particulates from the waste stream. If that is the case, councils will be engaged in it far more than is the case at present, and will be collecting more. A cost will fall on local authorities for that. What provision have you made within your budget for those extra costs to local authorities?

Carwyn Jones: £93 million over the next three years.

Christine Chapman: As Mike German mentioned, it is important to try to cut down on the amount of waste that we create. Disposable nappies are the largest single component of household waste, at 2 to 3 per cent. Almost 8 million nappies are thrown away in the UK each day, with the vast majority of these going to landfill. How does the Welsh Assembly Government intend to engage with the Real Nappy Week initiative at the end of April to raise awareness of the

o wastraff fel dewis ar gyfer trin gwastraff trefol gweddilliol, gyda rhai amodau penodol.

Michael German: Diolch i'r Gweinidog am yr ateb cynhwysfawr. A fyddai'n cytuno bod lleihau gwastraff ac ailgylchu yn uwch ar y rhestr blaenoriaethau ar gyfer cael gwared â gwastraff yn ein system? Mae awdurdodau lleol yn dweud wrthyf y bydd yn rhaid ichi wahanu gwastraff yn y cartref er mwyn lleihau gwastraff ac ailgylchu mwy. Mae mwy o wahanu yn y cartref yn arwain at fwy o weithgarwch a chasgliadau gan gynghorau lleol. A ydych yn cytuno, Weinidog, mai gwahanu yn y cartref yw'r unig ffordd i sicrhau mwy o ailgylchu a bodloni targedau ailgylchu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Yn sicr, mae'n ffordd i wneud yn siŵr fod ailgylchu'n fwy effeithiol. Gwyddom os bydd pobl yn gwahanu defnyddiau yn y cartref fod hynny'n golygu y byddant yn magu arferion da ar gyfer y dyfodol ac y bydd ganddynt fwy o ddiddordeb mewn ailgylchu.

Michael German: Mae cynghorau lleol yn dweud wrthyf mai'r unig ffordd y gellir bodloni eich targedau yw drwy gynyddu'r faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei wahanu yn y cartref. Ni all gwahanu mecanyddol gael gwared â digon o'r gronynnau o'r llif gwastraff. Os felly, bydd cynghorau'n cymryd llawer mwy o ran yn y broses nag ar hyn o bryd, a byddant yn casglu mwy. Bydd cost ychwanegol i ran awdurdodau lleol o ganlyniad. Pa ddarpariaeth a wnaed gennych yn eich cyllideb i gynnwys y costau ychwanegol hynny i awdurdodau lleol?

Carwyn Jones: £93 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf.

Christine Chapman: Fel y dywedodd Mike German, mae'n bwysig ceisio lleihau faint o wastraff sy'n cael ei greu gennym. Cewynnau untro yw'r elfen unigol fwyaf mewn gwastraff cartrefi, sy'n gyfrifol am 2 i 3 y cant. Caiff bron i 8 miliwn o gewynnau eu taflu yn y DU bob dydd, a'r mwyafrif helaeth yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi. Sut mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu cydweithio â'r fenter Wythnos Cewynnau Go Iawn ddiwedd mis Ebrill i wneud pobl yn

advantages of using reusable nappies?

Carwyn Jones: I would certainly support that, in principle. I took part in the first Real Nappy Week. It involved me changing a nappy for the first time ever at that time, before I become more expert at it—it filled me with terror at the time but I managed it successfully, and the baby as well, for that matter. It is important to make sure that people have an alternative to disposable nappies and that laundry facilities, for example, are in place so that people can exercise that choice. There has been support in the past and it is something that we will consider in future to see what can be done.

William Graham: Returning to Mike German's point, you will know that in Cardiff, where households separate their waste, it is, unfortunately then combined and re-sorted, as it were. It is an unpleasant and unnecessary job. Wastesavers in Newport takes the waste sorted by the household and maintains that individual collection, therefore getting a much higher price for its product. Would you like to standardise that throughout Wales?

Carwyn Jones: I would hope that local authorities could learn from good practice elsewhere. As I mentioned earlier, we have provided £93 million over three years to assist with recycling. It is a matter for local authorities how much of the money that they have received they will invest in kerbside recycling. However, it is obviously more effective, in terms of raising the rate of recycling, if it is done as close to source as possible.

David Lloyd: Gan gydnabod y problemau o sefydlu cyfleusterau trin gwastraff mewn unrhyw gymuned, beth a wnewch i annog awdurdodau lleol i rannu'r baich a chydweithio yn nhermau costau, technoleg a lleoliad?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym wedi dweud wrth awdurdodau lleol ei bod yn hanfodol iddynt gydweithio, yn enwedig i sicrhau bod ganddynt safleoedd i drin gwastraff ar lefel ranbarthol. Nid oes pwynt cael amryw o safleoedd yng Nghymru nad ydynt yn

fwy ymwybodol o fanteision defnyddio cewynnau y gellir eu haildefnyddio?

Carwyn Jones: Byddwn yn sicr yn cefnogi hynny, mewn egwyddor. Cymerais ran yn yr Wythnos Cewynnau Go Iawn gyntaf. Bryd hynny, bu'n rhaid imi newid cewyn am y tro cyntaf erioed, cyn imi ddod yn fwy o arbenigwr—ar y pryd, yr oedd yn brofiad brawychus, ond llwyddais i ddelio â'r dasg, a'r babi hefyd, o ran hynny. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gan bobl ddewis yn lle cewynnau untro a bod cyfleusterau golchi, er enghraifft, ar gael er mwyn i bobl allu arfer y dewis hwnnw. Cafwyd cefnogaeth yn y gorffennol, ac mae'n rhywbeth y byddwn yn ei ystyried yn y dyfodol i weld beth ellir ei wneud.

William Graham: Gan ddychwelyd at bwynt Mike German, fe wyddoch yng Nghaerdydd, lle y mae cartrefi yn gwahanu eu gwastraff, fod y gwastraff hwnnw wedyn, yn anffodus, yn cael ei gyfuno a'i ail-ddidoli, fel petai. Mae'n dasg amhleserus a diangen. Mae Wastesavers yng Nghasnewydd yn mynd â'r gwastraff a wahenir gan y cartref ac yn cadw'r casgliad unigol hwnnw, gan dderbyn pris llawer uwch am ei gynnyrch. A hoffech safoni'r drefn honno ledled Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Gobeithiwn y gallai awdurdodau lleol ddysgu o arfer da mewn mannau eraill. Fel y crybwyllais yn gynharach, yr ydym wedi darparu £93 miliwn dros dair blynedd i gynorthwyo cynlluniau ailgylchu. Penderfyniad awdurdodau lleol fydd faint o'r arian a gânt a gaiff ei fuddsoddi mewn cynlluniau ailgylchu min ffordd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n amlwg yn fwy effeithiol, o ran cynyddu'r gyfradd ailgylchu, os caiff ei wneud mor agos i'r ffynhonnell â phosibl.

David Lloyd: Given the problems of establishing waste treatment facilities in any community, what are you doing to encourage local authorities to share the burden and to collaborate in terms of costs, technology and location?

Carwyn Jones: We have told local authorities that it is essential that they collaborate, particularly to ensure that they have sites to treat waste on a regional level. There is no point having a number of sites in Wales that do not work together. It is

gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Mae'n bwysig bod awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud hyn. Mae enghreifftiau o hyn yn digwydd dros Gymru, ond mae'n rhaid sicrhau bod hynny'n parhau yn y dyfodol.

important that local authorities do this. There are examples of this happening across Wales, but we have to ensure that that continues in the future.

Gwella Lles Anifeiliaid Improving the Welfare of Animals

Q2 Lorraine Barrett: What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to improve the welfare of animals? OAQ0592(EPC)

C2 Lorraine Barrett: Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i wella lles anifeiliaid? OAQ0592(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Under the Animal Welfare Bill currently going through Parliament, the National Assembly will have wide powers to introduce subordinate regulations and codes of practice to improve standards of animal welfare.

Carwyn Jones: O dan y Mesur Lles Anifeiliaid sy'n cael ei drafod gan y Senedd ar hyn o bryd, bydd gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bwerau eang i gyflwyno is-reoliadau a chodau ymarfer i wella safonau lles anifeiliaid.

Lorraine Barrett: What sort of timetable do you envisage once the Bill becomes an Act, and when will we be able to start implementing our own welfare standards in Wales?

Lorraine Barrett: Pa fath o amserlen a ragwelwch ar ôl i'r Mesur ddod yn Ddeddf, a phryd y byddwn yn gallu dechrau gweithredu ein safonau lles ein hunain yng Nghymru?

Carwyn Jones: It depends how long the primary legislation takes in its passage through Westminster. I would hope that we could begin considering some of the issues as soon as possible, but, at this stage, it is not possible to give a definite timetable. I look forward to the debate that will take place over the next months and years.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n dibynnu faint o amser a gymer y ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol i fynd drwy San Steffan. Byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem ddechrau ystyried rhai o'r materion cyn gynted â phosibl. Ond ar hyn o bryd nid yw'n bosibl rhoi amserlen bendant. Edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl a fydd yn digwydd yn ystod y misoedd a'r blynyddoedd nesaf.

2.40 p.m.

Brynle Williams: There is a serious problem with the irresponsible breeding of dogs for fashion, or through negligence. Increasing numbers of dogs are suffering from defective traits such as breathing disorders, hip displacement, and many other problems. What consideration would you give to a licensing system for those who breed for profit, so that the best codes of practice can be enforced, and so that fewer animals, hopefully, are bred to suffer in this way?

Brynle Williams: Mae problem ddifrifol o ran magu cŵn yn anghyfrifol at ddibenion ffasiwn, neu drwy esgeulustod. Mae nifer cynyddol o gŵn yn dioddef oherwydd nodweddion diffygiol megis anhwylderau anadlu, dadleoli'r cluniau, a nifer o broblemau eraill. Pa ystyriaeth y byddech yn ei rhoi i system drwyddedu ar gyfer y bobl hynny sy'n magu er mwyn gwneud elw, fel y gellir gorfodi'r codau ymarfer gorau, gan sicrhau, gobeithio, y caiff llai o anifeiliaid eu magu i ddioddef fel hyn?

Carwyn Jones: It is an interesting suggestion. It would depend on the secondary powers that were devolved to us. We know that a licensing system for individual owners

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n awgrym diddorol. Byddai'n dibynnu ar yr is-bwerau sydd wedi eu datganoli inni. Gwyddom na fyddai system drwyddedu ar gyfer perchnogion

would not be cost-effective, or effective generally. However, that suggestion may be considered, certainly when the Bill has passed through Westminster and has become law.

Kirsty Williams: Have you given any consideration to, and investigated, the possible impact on animal welfare and husbandry standards in the uplands should you decide to get rid of the Tir Mynydd scheme?

Carwyn Jones: Taxpayers expect a return on the money that they provide. That is why we are looking to consult on the scheme's future, and to see whether there are more effective ways of ensuring that our uplands are preserved.

Mick Bates: I welcome your responses on welfare. One way to improve welfare is to control the spread of disease, particularly among farm animals. Why, then, are you allowing a disease such as TB to spread through Wales at a rate of 18 per cent a year? Last year alone, it caused the slaughter of 6,639 cattle, which is six times more than were slaughtered in 1998.

Carwyn Jones: As you know, the Wales TB action group is looking to propose ways of dealing with the disease. At present, we are looking to cut off the vector of cattle-to-cattle transfer. In due course, the Wales TB action group will give its recommendations in terms of what should be done regarding the link between wildlife and cattle.

unigol yn gost-effeithiol, nac yn effeithiol yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bosibl y caiff yr awgrym hwnnw ei ystyried, yn sicr pan fydd y Mesur wedi ei basio yn San Steffan ac wedi dod yn ddeddf.

Kirsty Williams: A ydych wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r effaith bosibl ar les anifeiliaid a safonau hwsmonaeth yn yr ucheldiroedd os penderfynwch gael gwared ar y cynllun Tir Mynydd ac a ydych wedi ymchwilio i'r effaith honno?

Carwyn Jones: Mae trethdalwyr yn disgwyl rhywbeth am yr arian a ddarparant. Dyna pam yr ydym yn bwriadu ymgynghori ar ddyfodol y cynllun, a gweld a oes ffyrdd mwy effeithiol i ddiogelu ein ucheldiroedd.

Mick Bates: Croesawaf eich ymatebion ar les. Un ffordd i wella lles yw rheoli'r ffordd mae afiechyd yn lledaenu, yn arbennig ymhlith anifeiliaid fferm. Pam, felly, yr ydych yn caniatáu i glefyd megis TB ledaenu drwy Gymru ar gyfradd o 18 y cant y flwyddyn? Yn ystod y llynedd yn unig, bu'n rhaid lladd 6,639 o wartheg o ganlyniad i hynny, sy'n chwe gwaith yn fwy nag a laddwyd yn 1998.

Carwyn Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, mae grŵp gweithredu Cymru ar TB yn bwriadu cynnig ffyrdd i ymdrin â'r clefyd. Ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn ceisio atal gwartheg rhag trosglwyddo'r clefyd i'w gilydd. Maes o law, bydd grŵp gweithredu Cymru ar TB yn cyflwyno ei argymhellion ar yr hyn y dylid ei wneud mewn perthynas â'r cyswllt rhwng bywyd gwylt a gwartheg.

Cerbydau Maes Off-Road Vehicles

Q3 Lynne Neagle: Will the Minister provide an update on any emerging proposals from the strategic steering group looking at off-road vehicle use which may impact upon the Welsh Assembly Government's countryside policy? OAQ0639(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: I expect to receive the report of the steering group that is considering this issue by the end of this month. I have asked the group to identify actions and to improve

C3 Lynne Neagle: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r sefyllfa ddiweddaraf am unrhyw gynigion gan y grŵp llywio strategol sy'n edrych ar ddefnyddio cerbydau maes a allai effeithio ar bolisi cefn gwlad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0639(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn disgwyl cael adroddiad y grŵp llywio sy'n ystyried y mater hwn erbyn diwedd y mis. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r grŵp nodi camau gweithredu a

the current situation. I will give careful consideration to its recommendations when I receive that report.

Lynne Neagle: Thank you for your answer, and for your recent written answer on this matter. You may be aware that recent local press coverage on this issue has focused on the needs of those who participate in off-road motorcycling. This has raised concerns—certainly in my constituency—that protecting local communities from the anti-social effects of off-road vehicles has not been sufficiently prioritised by the steering group. I therefore welcome the guidance issued today, which underlines a zero-tolerance approach to illegal off-road vehicle use. However, will you take this opportunity to restate your commitment, and also the commitment of the steering group, to prioritising the needs of communities?

Carwyn Jones: It is exceptionally important. It is a growing problem in terms of the nuisance that is caused to residents and to the environment, as well as the need to ensure that legitimate off-road sites are available so that the activity can be pursued. We want to deal with this as effectively as possible. At your invitation, I visited your constituency to see the problem at first hand. Once again, it brought home to me the need to ensure that action is as swift as possible after the report is published.

Glyn Davies: The anti-social use by off-road vehicles of bridle-ways and other places used by horse riders is causing a particular problem to the horse-riding industry. Will you ensure that local authorities ensure that our bridle-ways, and such places, are open for horse riding, because of its benefit to the Welsh economy?

Carwyn Jones: It is fair to say that this issue is becoming more and more of a priority for local authorities, as well as for the police. I know that in various parts of Wales—for example, the three valleys that lead off from Bridgend: the Garw, the Ogmere and the Llynfi valleys—concentrated and focused police action has an effect. I am sure that that

gwella'r sefyllfa bresennol. Rhoddaf ystyriaeth ofalus i'w argymhellion pan gaf yr adroddiad hwnnw.

Lynne Neagle: Diolch am eich ateb, ac am eich ateb ysgrifenedig yn ddiweddar ar y mater hwn. Hwyrach eich bod yn gwybod bod sylw yn y wasg leol yn ddiweddar ar y mater hwn wedi canolbwyntio ar anghenion y rheini sy'n cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau beiciau modur maes. Mae hyn wedi codi pryderon—yn sicr yn fy etholaeth i—nad yw'r grŵp llywio wedi rhoi digon o flaenoriaeth i ddiogelu cymunedau lleol rhag effeithiau gwrthgymdeithasol cerbydau maes. Felly, croesawaf y canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd heddiw ac sy'n tanlinellu dull dim goddefgarwch tuag at ddefnyddio cerbydau maes yn anghyfreithlon. Fodd bynnag, a fanteisiwch ar y cyfle hwn i ailddatgan eich ymrwymiad, ac ymrwymiad y grŵp llywio, i flaenoriaethu anghenion cymunedau?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n eithriadol o bwysig. Mae'n broblem gynyddol o ran y niwsans a achosir i drigolion ac i'w hamgylchedd, yn ogystal â'r angen am sicrhau bod safleoedd maes cyfreithlon ar gael er mwyn i bobl allu cymryd rhan yn y gweithgaredd. Yr ydym am ymdrin â hyn mewn ffordd mor effeithiol â phosibl. Yn dilyn eich gwahoddiad, ymwelais â'ch etholaeth i weld y broblem fy hun. Unwaith eto, amlygodd yr angen am sicrhau gweithredu cyn gynted â phosibl ar ôl i'r adroddiad gael ei gyhoeddi.

Glyn Davies: Mae defnyddio llwybrau ceffyl, a manau eraill a ddefnyddir gan bobl ar gefn ceffylau, yn wrthgymdeithasol gan gerbydau maes yn peri problem fawr i'r diwydiant marchogaeth. A sicrhewch y bydd awdurdodau lleol yn sicrhau bod ein llwybrau ceffyl, a manau felly, ar agor i farchogaeth ceffylau, o gofio'r budd i economi Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n deg dweud bod y mater hwn yn dod yn flaenoriaeth gynyddol uwch i awdurdodau lleol, ac i'r heddlu. Gwn mewn amrywiol rannau o Gymru—er enghraifft, y tri chwm sy'n dechrau ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr: cwm Garw, cwm Ogwr a chwm Llynfi—fod camau gweithredu grymus a phendant gan yr heddlu yn cael

will be replicated across Wales.

effaith. Yr wyf yn siŵr y caiff hynny ei ailadrodd ledled Cymru.

Amddiffynfeydd rhag Llifogydd Arfordirol Coastal Flood Defences

Q4 Lisa Francis: Will the Minister make a statement on coastal flood defences in Mid and West Wales? OAQ0598(EPC)

C4 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am amddiffynfeydd llifogydd arfordirol yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin? OAQ0598(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Operational responsibility for coastal defence rests with the statutory authority, which would either be the Environment Agency or the local authority, as appropriate.

Carwyn Jones: Yr awdurdod statudol sy'n gyfrifol am weithredu amddiffynfeydd arfordirol, sef naill ai Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd neu'r awdurdod lleol, fel sy'n briodol.

Lisa Francis: Your Government has indicated that the most recent coastal defence project in Tywyn, Gwynedd, could qualify for 100 per cent grant aid if it satisfies all criteria. Such a scheme would stop overtopping of the Victorian sea wall in the town—you many know that the road behind that wall was breached last November—protect the town and enhance tourism. Have you, or any of your officials, been in contact with Gwynedd Council to advise on ways in which any shortfall in funds for this very important project may be provided for?

Lisa Francis: Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi dweud y gallai'r prosiect diweddaraf i amddiffyn yr arfordir yn Nhywyn, Gwynedd, fod yn gymwys ar gyfer cymorth grant 100 y cant os yw'n bodloni'r holl feini prawf. Byddai cynllun o'r fath yn rhwystro dŵr rhag llifo dros y morglawdd o gyfnod Victoria yn y dref—efallai eich bod yn gwybod bod y ffordd y tu ôl i'r morglawdd wedi ei bylchu fis Tachwedd diwethaf—diogelu'r dref a gwella twristiaeth. Ydych chi, neu unrhyw un o'ch swyddogion, wedi cysylltu â Chyngor Gwynedd i'w cynghori ar ffyrdd y gellir darparu ar gyfer unrhyw ddiffyg ariannol ar gyfer y prosiect pwysig iawn hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Gwynedd Council has, this month, submitted an application for funding to support the scheme at Tywyn, and it is under consideration as we speak.

Carwyn Jones: Mae Cyngor Gwynedd, y mis hwn, wedi cyflwyno cais am gyllid i gefnogi'r cynllun yn Nhywyn, ac mae'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd.

Ailgylchu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf Recycling in Rhondda Cynon Taf

Q5 Leighton Andrews: Will the Minister make a statement on recycling in Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0610(EPC)

C5 Leighton Andrews: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ailgylchu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? OAQ0610(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Data for 2004-05 shows that Rhondda Cynon Taf recycled and composted 14.7 per cent of its waste, as measured by the performance indicators. There are also exciting plans in the pipeline in terms of improving that performance in the future.

Carwyn Jones: Mae data ar gyfer 2004-05 yn dangos bod Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi ailgylchu a chompostio 14.7 y cant o'i wastraff, fel y mae'n cael ei fesur gan y dangosyddion perfformiad. Mae cynlluniau cyffrous yn yr arfaeth hefyd i wella'r perfformiad hwnnw yn y dyfodol.

Leighton Andrews: Are you aware that the incoming Labour council inherited a

Leighton Andrews: A wyddoch chi mai cyfradd ailgylchu o ddim ond tua 10 y cant a

recycling rate of only around 10 per cent, and that it is now, according to its own figures, approaching 19 per cent? It provides 100 per cent kerbside recycling. Is this not evidence that it is making excellent progress in improving the recycling situation in Rhondda Cynon Taf? In particular, it is involving schoolchildren in that project through a number of celebrity-based schemes, which are making a real impact. Should it not be congratulated on that work?

Carwyn Jones: Yes. It is also worth emphasising that Rhondda Cynon Taf has recently opened the new materials recovery facility at Bryn Pica, and is investigating, together with the University of Glamorgan, appropriate treatment for food waste, which will help it to meet the landfill directive requirements to divert biodegradable waste from landfill disposal. It is also renewing its waste management vehicle fleet, including new vehicles for recycling. All these things, taken with the other plans that it has, show that the local authority is dedicated to improving its recycling and composting rates in the future.

Janet Davies: You will be aware that, in 1999, the Plaid Cymru administration inherited a recycling rate of less than 2 per cent. Will you congratulate it on its successful 'Respecting Waste' strategy during 2001-02, which led to the 100 per cent kerbside recycling scheme achieved this January? However, the types of waste collected at the kerbside for recycling in Rhondda Cynon Taf, five years on, do not yet include Tetra Pak packaging, thin plastic, batteries, and used paint tins, for example. What guidance and support are you giving local authorities to extend the types of waste recycled?

Carwyn Jones: There are facilities available to recycle a number of materials in Wales, and not far beyond our border. However, it is also worth remembering that I do not believe that the Plaid-Cymru-led council took all the steps that I have already mentioned to improve recycling and composting

etifeddwyd gan y cyngor Llafur newydd, a bod y gyfradd honno yn awr, yn ôl ei ffigurau ei hun, yn agos at 19 y cant? Mae'n darparu gwasanaeth ailgylchu ar ymyl y ffordd i 100 y cant o'i drigolion. Onid yw hyn yn dystiolaeth ei fod yn gwneud cynnydd ardderchog wrth wella'r sefyllfa ailgylchu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf? Yn arbennig, mae'n cynnwys plant ysgol yn y prosiect hwnnw drwy nifer o gynlluniau sy'n defnyddio pobl enwog, a hynny'n cael effaith wirioneddol. Oni ddylid ei longyfarch ar y gwaith hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: Yn wir. Mae'n werth pwysleisio hefyd fod Rhondda Cynon Taf wedi agor cyfleuster newydd yn ddiweddar i adfer deunyddiau ym Mryn Pica, a'i fod yn ymchwilio, ar y cyd â Phrifysgol Morgannwg, i driniaeth briodol ar gyfer gwastraff bwyd, a fydd yn ei helpu i fodloni gofynion y gyfarwyddeb tirlenwi i ddargyfeirio gwastraff bioddiraddadwy o safleoedd tirlenwi. Mae hefyd yn adnewyddu ei fflyd o gerbydau rheoli gwastraff, gan gynnwys cerbydau newydd ar gyfer ailgylchu. Mae'r holl bethau hyn, ynghyd â'r cynlluniau eraill sydd ar waith, yn dangos bod yr awdurdod lleol wedi ymrwymo i wella ei gyfraddau ailgylchu a chompostio yn y dyfodol.

Janet Davies: Fel y gwyddoch, yn 1999 etifeddodd gweinyddiaeth Plaid Cymru gyfradd ailgylchu o lai na 2 y cant. A wnewch chi ei llongyfarch ar ei strategaeth lwyddiannus 'Respecting Waste' yn ystod 2001-02, a arweiniodd at y gyfradd o 100 y cant yn y cynllun ailgylchu ar ymyl y ffordd ym mis Ionawr? Fodd bynnag, bum mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, nid yw'r mathau o wastraff a gesglir ar ymyl y ffordd i'w hailgylchu yn Rhondda Cynon Taf yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, pecynnau Tetra Pak, plastig tenau, batris, a hen duniau paent hyd yn hyn. Pa arweiniad a chymorth yr ydych yn ei roi i awdurdodau lleol i ymestyn y mathau o wastraff sy'n cael eu hailgylchu?

Carwyn Jones: Mae cyfleusterau ar gael i ailgylchu nifer o ddeunyddiau yng Nghymru, ac nid nepell y tu hwnt i'n ffin. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth cofio hefyd nad wyf yn credu bod y cyngor dan arweiniad Plaid Cymru wedi cymryd pob un o'r camau yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn amdanynt i wella perfformiad

performance. Rather, I understand that it said that it would close down a landfill site, which subsequently was not closed.

ailgylchu a chompostio. Yn hytrach, deallaf iddo ddweud y byddai'n cau safle tirlenwi ond na chafodd hwnnw ei gau yn y diwedd.

Carbon Deuocsid sy'n cael ei Ryddhau Carbon Dioxide Emissions

Q6 Jocelyn Davies: Will the Minister make a statement on the level of carbon dioxide emissions in Wales? OAQ0580(EPC)

C6 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am lefel y carbon deuocsid sy'n cael ei ryddhau yng Nghymru? OAQ0580(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The most recent figures for Wales, produced by the National Environmental Technology Centre, show that, in 2003, emissions of carbon dioxide were 11.6 mega tonnes of carbon. Disaggregated figures for Wales for 2004 will not be available until later this year.

Carwyn Jones: Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf ar gyfer Cymru, a gynhyrchwyd gan y Ganolfan Technoleg Amgylcheddol Genedlaethol, yn dangos bod y carbon deuocsid a ryddhawyd yn 2003 yn cyfateb i 11.6 mega dunnell o garbon. Ni fydd ffigurau wedi'u dadgyfuno ar gyfer Cymru am 2004 ar gael tan yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Jocelyn Davies: Plaid Cymru, along with four other political parties, supports the call for an independent body that would set up and monitor annual targets for reducing greenhouse gases. The UK Government has rejected this idea. Will you now demonstrate your commitment to sustainable development and support this new body?

Jocelyn Davies: Mae Plaid Cymru, ynghyd â phedair plaid wleidyddol arall, yn cefnogi'r galw am gorff annibynnol a fyddai'n sefydlu ac yn monitro targedau blynyddol ar gyfer lleihau nwyon tŷ gwydr. Mae Llywodraeth y DU wedi gwrthod y syniad hwn. A wnewch chi yn awr ddangos eich ymrwymiad i ddatblygiad cynaliadwy a chefnogi'r corff newydd hwn?

Carwyn Jones: I do not think that extra layers of bureaucracy, with the attached costs, are necessary needed. We have our sustainable development action plan and, in April, we will publish the environment strategy and the action plan that will follow from that. All these things, taken together, will provide an effective way of ensuring that, in the future, carbon dioxide emissions in Wales move towards a longer-term trend of reducing.

Carwyn Jones: Ni chredaf fod angen haenau ychwanegol o fiwrocratiaeth o reidrwydd, gyda'r costau cysylltiedig. Mae gennym gynllun gweithredu ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy ar waith, ac ym mis Ebrill byddwn yn cyhoeddi'r strategaeth amgylcheddol a'r cynllun gweithredu dilynol. Bydd yr holl bethau hyn, gyda'i gilydd, yn ffordd effeithiol i sicrhau, yn y dyfodol, fod lefelau rhyddhau carbon deuocsid yng Nghymru yn gostwng yn y tymor hwy.

Lleihau Gollyngiadau Nwyon Tŷ Gwydr Reducing Greenhouse Gas Emissions

Q7 Jeff Cuthbert: Will the Minister give an update on progress in reducing greenhouse gas emissions in Wales? OAQ0615(EPC)

C7 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y cynnydd wrth leihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru? OAQ0615(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: In 2003, emissions of greenhouse gases fell by 3.6 per cent compared with base-year emissions. We have identified reducing greenhouse gas emissions

Carwyn Jones: Yn 2003, cafwyd gostyngiad o 3.6 y cant mewn gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr o'u cymharu â gollyngiadau yn y flwyddyn gymharu gychwynnol. Yr ydym

as a key priority, and it is a central theme of the environment strategy that I mentioned in my response to the last question.

2.50 p.m.

Jeff Cuthbert: It is pleasing to note, in the greenhouse gas inventories report, that emissions of greenhouse gases in Wales in 2003 were 0.6 million tonnes lower than in 1990, although I acknowledge that Friends of the Earth thinks that that is not quite the right figure. Nevertheless, clear improvements have been made. Do you agree that it is important to ensure that we balance our energy-production needs through the use of existing facilities, plus an increased reliance on sustainable methods? Furthermore, do you not think that it is the duty of us all to encourage more people to leave their private cars at home and to use public transport to a far greater extent to reduce the overall effect of emissions?

Carwyn Jones: There is a duty on us all to set an example. Of course, the Rhymney Railway, which runs through much of your constituency, is heavily used; the excellent transport interchange at Caerphilly is also heavily used. I understand that I am the only Assembly Member to have applied for funding for a railway season ticket, as someone who travels to the Assembly by train on most days. I would encourage others to follow that example.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Gan eich bod yn brolio eich defnydd o'r trênn, beth yr ydych yn bwriadu'i wneud dros y gweddill ohonom nad ydym yn gallu manteisio ar wasanaethau cyhoeddus i'n cludo yn ôl ac ymlaen o'r Cynulliad neu i'n cludo o fewn ein hetholaethau? A fydd eich Llywodraeth yn buddsoddi mewn trafniadaeth gyhoeddus yn nghefn gwlad ac mewn ardaloedd yn y de-orllewin, y gogledd-orllewin a chanolbarth Cymru er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gallu gwneud yr hyn yr ydych chi yn ei wneud? Ynteu a oes gwahaniaeth rhwng dinasyddion ardaloedd gwledig a phobl sydd yn byw mewn ardaloedd trefol a dinesig?

wedi nodi lleihau gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr fel blaenoriaeth allweddol, ac mae'n un o themâu canolog y strategaeth amgylcheddol y soniais amdani yn fy ymateb i'r cwestiwn diwethaf.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mae'n bleser sylwi, yn yr adroddiad ar restr nwyon tŷ gwydr, fod gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr yng Nghymru yn 2003 0.6 miliwn o dunelli yn is nag yn 1990, er fy mod yn cydnabod nad yw Cyfeillion y Ddaear yn creduo mai dyna'r ffigur cywir. Serch hynny, cafwyd gwelliannau amlwg. A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysig inni sicrhau cydbwysedd yn ein hanghenion cynhyrchu ynni drwy ddefnyddio cyfleusterau sydd eisoes yn bod, ynghyd â dibyniaeth gynyddol ar ddulliau cynaliadwy? At hynny, onid ydych yn credu ei bod yn ddyletswydd ar bob un ohonom i annog mwy o bobl i adael eu ceir preifat gartref a defnyddio cludiant cyhoeddus i raddau llawer mwy er mwyn lleihau effaith gyffredinol gollyngiadau?

Carwyn Jones: Mae'n ddyletswydd ar bob un ohonom i osod esiampl. Wrth gwrs, mae Rheilffordd Rhymni, sy'n rhedeg drwy ran sylweddol o'ch etholaeth, yn cael ei defnyddio'n helaeth; mae'r gyfnewidfa drafnidiaeth ardderchog yng Nghaerffili yn cael ei defnyddio'n helaeth hefyd. Deallaf mai fi yw'r unig Aelod o'r Cynulliad sydd wedi gwneud cais am arian ar gyfer tocyn tymor ar y trênn, fel rhywun sy'n teithio i'r Cynulliad ar y trênn bron bob dydd. Byddwn yn annog eraill i ddilyn yr esiampl honno.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Since you praise your use of the train, what do you intend to do for those of us who cannot take advantage of public services to transport us back and forth to the Assembly, or to transport us within our constituencies? Will your Government invest in public transport in rural areas and in parts of south-west, north-west and mid Wales to ensure that we can do as you do? Or, is there a difference between the citizens of rural areas and those who live in towns and cities?

Carwyn Jones: Nid oes problem gyda dal y trê'n yng Nghaerfyrddin, sir Benfro neu'r gogledd. Fel un sydd yn teithio i'r gogledd ar y trê'n, credaf mai esgus yw hynny. Mae gorsafoedd i'w cael yn y rhan fwyaf o etholaethau, ac mae'n bosibl defnyddio'r rheilffyrdd. Gyda thipyn bach o ymdrech, byddai mwy ohonom yn teithio ar drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus.

David Melding: The motor car is mostly responsible for the increase in greenhouse emissions, so I wonder whether there is a way for us to try to tackle this by reducing its usage and introducing schemes such as park-and-ride facilities and so forth. Unless we limit the demand, we are going to face an ever-increasing strain on the environment.

Carwyn Jones: You are right and the Government's efforts speak for themselves in that regard. The opening of the Vale of Glamorgan railway line has been a tremendous success—I see the fruits of that success every day, as I see the train departing and arriving, and the numbers of passengers who are using it. Similarly, the Government is committed to opening the Ebbw valley railway and other transport improvements have been made that show the Government's commitment to public transport and to reducing dependence on cars.

Carwyn Jones: There is no problem with catching a train in Carmarthen, Pembrokeshire or in north Wales. As someone who travels to north Wales by train, I believe that is an excuse. There are railway stations in most constituencies, and it is possible to use trains. With a little effort, more of us would travel by public transport.

David Melding: Y car sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am y cynnydd mewn gollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr, felly, tybed a oes ffordd inni geisio mynd i'r afael â hyn drwy ei ddefnyddio'n llai aml a chyflwyno cynlluniau fel cyfleusterau parcio a theithio, ac ati? Oni fyddwn yn cyfyngu'r galw, byddwn yn wynebu straen cynyddol ar yr amgylchedd.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, ac mae ymdrechion y Llywodraeth yn siarad drostynt eu hunain yn hynny. Mae'r penderfyniad i agor llinell rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg wedi bod yn llwyddiant ysgubol—gwelaf dystiolaeth o'r llwyddiant hwnnw bob dydd, wrth weld y trê'n yn gadael ac yn cyrraedd, a nifer y teithwyr sy'n ei ddefnyddio. Yn yr un modd, mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i agor rheilffordd Glynebwy, a gwnaed gwelliannau cludiant eraill sy'n dangos ymrwymiad y Llywodraeth i gludiant gyhoeddus ac i leihau dibyniaeth ar geir.

Pysgota Eog Salmon Fishing

C8 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar bwysigrwydd pysgota eog yn afonydd Cymru i ffyniant yr economi wledig? OAQ0633(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Gwyddom, ar hyn o bryd, bod pysgodfeydd hamdden yn cyfrannu tua £69 miliwn i'r economi yng Nghymru. Mae pysgodfeydd brithyll ac eog yn gyfrifol am tuag 20 y cant o'r cyfanswm hwnnw.

Alun Ffred Jones: Cymeraf eich bod yn ymwybodol o'r broblem fawr o rwydo eog oddi ar arfordir y gorllewin. Daw cwynion sylweddol ynglŷn â hynny o Iwerddon a Chymru, ac o Wlad yr Iâ, gan ei fod yn

Q8 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the importance of salmon fishing in Welsh rivers to the prosperity of the rural economy? OAQ0633(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: We know that, at present, recreational fisheries contribute about £69 million to the Welsh economy. Trout and salmon fisheries are responsible for about 20 per cent of that total.

Alun Ffred Jones: I take it you are aware of the significant problem caused by salmon netting off the coast of west Wales. Serious complaints about that are made in Ireland and Wales, and in Iceland, as it leads to stock

lleihau'r stociau. A ydych wedi pwyso ar Lywodraeth Iwerddon i atal yr arfer hwn, neu i gyfyngu arno, gan ei fod yn cael effaith andwyol ar y stoc pysgod yn afonydd Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Mae hyn yn achosi pryder i mi, ac i bob pysgotwr. Yr ydym, drwy Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig, wedi mynegi ein pryder ynglŷn â'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Iwerddon o ran rhwydau. Gobeithiwn, yn y dyfodol agos, weld diwedd ar ddefnyddio rhwydau.

Laura Anne Jones: I am a keen fisherman, and I was lucky enough to grow up on a farm alongside the river Usk, which is a renowned salmon-fishing river. Its impact on tourism in Usk has been huge, where people come from far and wide to use the river, boosting tourism in the area. It is vital, as Alun Ffred has said, to preserve our fish stocks, but it is also essential that we keep our rivers clean because without good water quality everything else becomes insignificant. Pollution by sheep dip must be treated as a priority. Could you take positive action on this, Minister, promoting better dialogue between the farming and fishing industries, but also ensuring that liming schemes are continued to neutralise the effects of acidity?

Carwyn Jones: Salmon stocks are not healthy, but we know that sewin stocks are, which suggests that, because salmon go further out to sea than sewin do, something is happening out at sea that is reducing their numbers. In terms of sheep dip, we are talking entirely nowadays about cypermethrin, which poses a difficult issue because of its potency as a veterinary medicine and the effect that it can have on the environment. I will be asking the agencies concerned with this issue to look at this matter carefully over the coming year to see if there is an alternative way forward.

reduction. Have you pressed the Irish Government to stop or limit this practice, since it is having a detrimental effect on fish stocks in Welsh rivers?

Carwyn Jones: This is a cause of concern to me, and to all fishermen. Through the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, we have expressed our concern about what is happening in Ireland with netting. We hope to see an end to the use of nets in the near future.

Laura Anne Jones: Yr wyf yn bysgotwraig frwd, a bŵm yn ddigon ffodus i gael fy magu ar fferm ar lan afon Wysg, afon sy'n adnabyddus am bysgota eog. Mae ei heffaith ar dwristiaeth ym Mrynbuga wedi bod yn aruthrol, a daw pobl o bob man i ddefnyddio'r afon, gan hybu twristiaeth yn yr ardal. Mae'n hanfodol, fel y dywedodd Alun Ffred, inni warchod ein stociau pysgod. Ond mae hefyd yn hanfodol inni gadw ein hafonydd yn lân, oherwydd heb ansawdd dŵr da, mae popeth arall yn ddibwys. Rhaid trin llygredd oherwydd dip defaid fel blaenoriaeth. A allwch gymryd camau cadarnhaol ar hyn, Weinidog, gan hybu gwell trafodaeth rhwng y diwydiannau ffermio a physgota, ond hefyd gan sicrhau bod cynlluniau calchu yn parhau er mwyn niwtraleiddio effeithiau asidedd?

Carwyn Jones: Nid yw lefel y stociau eog yn dda, ond gwyddom fod lefel dda o stociau sewin, sy'n awgrymu, gan fod eogiaid yn teithio ymhellach allan i'r môr o'u cymharu â sewin, fod rhywbeth yn digwydd allan yn y môr sy'n gostwng eu niferoedd. O ran dip defaid, yr ydym yn sôn am cypermethrin yn llwyr erbyn hyn, sy'n achosi problem anodd oherwydd ei gryfder fel meddyginiaeth filfeddygol a'r effaith y gall ei chael ar yr amgylchedd. Byddaf yn gofyn i'r asiantaethau sy'n gysylltiedig â'r mater hwn ei ystyried yn ofalus yn ystod y flwyddyn nesaf i weld a oes ffordd arall ymlaen.

Tai Fforddiadwy Affordable Housing

Q9 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to ensure that the

C9 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ei wneud i sicrhau bod y

planning system addresses issues of affordable housing in Wales? OAQ0614(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Following consultation, revised guidance to assist local planning authorities in the delivery of affordable housing through the planning system is currently being finalised. Revised technical advice notes 1 and 2 and the related ministerial interim planning policy statement on housing are due to be published later this year.

Val Lloyd: I am sure that you will agree that maintaining the affordable housing stock remains a problem. If affordable houses are sold on at market prices, we are faced with a vicious circle. Can you give details of what you are doing to address this issue in planning terms, or in any other terms?

Carwyn Jones: Much of the scope for doing this lies in the portfolio of my colleague, Edwina Hart. In terms of planning, I have already mentioned the two TANs. We are also looking—I have also mentioned this before—at using land that is being managed by the Forestry Commission, but is owned by us, to enable affordable housing to be provided in areas where it is required. There is one site in Powys that is being considered at the moment in terms of leading the way in that regard.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Weinidog, gofynnaf am eich cefnogaeth i'r syniad o sefydlu ymddiriedolaethau tir cymunedol ar draws Cymru. Byddant o gymorth sylweddol yn y symudiad tuag at gael mwy o dai fforddiadwy. A ydych yn ymwybodol bod cynlluniau llwyddiannus yn yr Alban, mewn rhannau o Loegr ac yn yr Unol Daleithiau? A fydddech yn fodlon sefydlu uned o fewn eich adran i roi cymorth i awdurdodau lleol sy'n edrych ar ddewis y llwybr hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Mater i adran Edwina Hart yw hwn ac yr wyf yn siŵr ei bod wedi ei ystyried eisoes ac y bydd yn ei ystyried eto.

Eleanor Burnham: Minister, do you not agree that Mick Bates started this argument and discussion years ago, and that Plaid

system gynllunio yn rhoi sylw i faterion tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru? OAQ0614(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Yn sgil ymgynghori, mae canllawiau diwygiedig i gynorthwyo awdurdodau cynllunio lleol i ddarparu tai fforddiadwy drwy'r system gynllunio yn cael eu cwblhau ar hyn o bryd. Disgwylir i nodiadau cyngor technegol 1 a 2 wedi eu diwygio a'r datganiad polisi cynllunio interim cysylltiedig gan weinidogion ar dai gael eu cyhoeddi yn ddiweddarach eleni.

Val Lloyd: Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn cytuno bod cynnal y stoc tai fforddiadwy yn broblem o hyd. Os caiff tai fforddiadwy eu gwerthu am bris y farchnad, yr ydym yn wynebu cylch cythreulig. A allwch fanylu ar yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn o ran cynllunio, neu o ran unrhyw beth arall?

Carwyn Jones: Mae llawer o'r cyfle i wneud hyn yn rhan o bortffolio fy nghyd-Aelod, Edwina Hart. O ran cynllunio, yr wyf eisoes wedi sôn am y ddau TAN. Yr ydym hefyd-a soniais am hyn hefyd o'r blaen-yn ystyried defnyddio tir a reolir gan y Comisiwn Coedwigaeth, ond sy'n eiddo i ni, i alluogi darparu tai fforddiadwy mewn ardaloedd lle mae eu hangen. Mae un safle ym Mhowys yn cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd i arwain y ffordd yn hynny.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Minister, I ask for your support for the idea of establishing community land trusts across Wales. They will be of great assistance in moving towards securing more affordable homes. Are you aware that there are very successful schemes in Scotland, parts of England and the United States? Would you be willing to establish a unit within your department to assist local authorities who are considering taking this route?

Carwyn Jones: This is a matter for Edwina Hart's department, and I am sure she has already considered it and will do so again.

Eleanor Burnham: Weinidog, onid ydych yn cytuno mai Mick Bates a gychwynnodd y ddadl a'r drafodaeth hon flynyddoedd yn ôl,

Cymru are now following suit? Do you agree that it is the high cost of land that it is the critical factor? What are you and your Labour Government doing about that? Young people who are already indebted as a result of the costs of going to university and so on now have a real problem with their credit rating in terms of getting a foothold on the ladder.

Carwyn Jones: That is due to the high cost of agricultural land. Part of the reason for that, of course, is the previous subsidy regime that drove the price up beyond what it should have been. As regards the fact that Mick Bates started an argument, I can only take your word for that.

Mark Isherwood: Technical advice note 2, to which you referred, stated that rural exception sites can provide additional housing in rural areas to meet the needs of local people. What action are you, therefore, taking to ensure that local authority development plans take account of that and alternative types of quality low-cost housing, such as those made of timber and factory-built constructions?

Carwyn Jones: We have TAN 12, which is the design TAN, but it is a matter for local authorities to produce unitary development plans. All local development plans address this issue, taking into account the guidance provided in TANs 1 and 2. All these tools taken together, as well as the affordable housing toolkit and the housing needs assessments that local authorities should be making—and which some have made already—should mean that there is an adequate supply of affordable housing in future.

3.00p.m.

Anifeiliaid Trig Fallen Stock

Q10 David Melding: Will the Minister make a statement on the fallen stock collection and disposal scheme for South Wales Central? OAQ0586(EPC)

a bod Plaid Cymru bellach yn dilyn ei esiampl? A ydych yn cytuno mai cost uchel tir yw'r ffactor allweddol? Beth yr ydych chi a'ch Llywodraeth Lafur yn ei wneud ynglŷn â hynny? Mae pobl ifanc sydd eisoes mewn dyled oherwydd costau mynd i brifysgol ac ati bellach yn wynebu problem wirioneddol gyda'u statws credyd wrth geisio cymryd y cam cyntaf ar yr ysgol.

Carwyn Jones: Mae hynny oherwydd cost uchel tir amaethyddol. Rhan o'r rheswm am hynny, wrth gwrs, yw'r gyfundrefn gymorthdaliadau flaenorol, a achosodd i'r pris godi y tu hwnt i'r hyn a ddylai fod. O ran y ffaith mai Mick Bates a ddechreuodd y ddadl, bydd yn rhaid imi gymryd eich gair ynglŷn â hynny.

Mark Isherwood: Yr oedd nodyn cyngor technegol 2 yr oeddech yn cyfeirio ato yn dweud y gall safleoedd eithriedig yng nghefn gwlad ddarparu tai ychwanegol mewn ardaloedd gwledig i ddiwallu anghenion pobl leol. Pa gamau, felly, yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod cynlluniau datblygu awdurdodau lleol yn ystyried hynny a mathau eraill o dai rhad o safon, fel rhai wedi eu gwneud o bren ac adeiladwaith wedi ei lunio mewn ffatri?

Carwyn Jones: Mae gennym TAN 12, sef y TAN sy'n ymwneud â dylunio, ond mater i awdurdodau lleol yw cynhyrchu cynlluniau datblygu unedol. Mae pob cynllun datblygu lleol yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, gan ystyried y canllawiau a ddarperir yn TAN 1 a TAN 2. Dylai'r holl ddulliau hyn gyda'i gilydd, ynghyd â'r pecyn cymorth tai fforddiadwy a'r asesiadau o anghenion tai y dylai awdurdodau lleol fod yn eu gwneud—ac y mae rhai eisoes wedi eu gwneud—olygu bod yna gyflenwad digonol o dai fforddiadwy yn y dyfodol.

C10 David Melding: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynllun casglu a gwaredu anifeiliaid trig yng Nghanol De Cymru? OAQ0586(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: No difficulties are anticipated with the fallen stock scheme in South Wales Central.

David Melding: What is the Minister doing to promote further use of Dolavs, which I understand are now proving to be very successful with farmers?

Carwyn Jones: Some collectors are looking at that system, particularly in the north where there were problems last year. It is a matter for the National Fallen Stock Company to investigate and a matter for the companies to provide. However, this system can certainly provide an effective way to deal with the problem that arises, particularly at lambing time.

Carwyn Jones: Ni ragwelir unrhyw anawsterau gyda'r cynllun anifeiliaid trig yng Nghanol De Cymru?

David Melding: Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo defnyddio hambyrddau Dolav yn helaethach sydd, yn ôl a ddeallaf, yn llwyddiannus iawn ymhlith?

Carwyn Jones: Mae rhai casglwyr yn ystyried y system honno, yn enwedig yn y gogledd lle cafwyd problemau y llynedd. Mater i'r Cwmni Stoc Trig Cenedlaethol yw ymchwilio i'r system, a mater i'r cwmnïau yw ei darparu. Fodd bynnag, mae'r system hon yn sicr yn gallu bod yn ffordd effeithiol i ymdrin â'r broblem sy'n codi, yn enwedig adeg wyna.

Gollwng Elifant Discharge of Effluent

Q11 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on the discharge of effluent into coastal waters surrounding Wales? OAQ0591(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: The discharge of effluent into Welsh coastal waters is subject to standards set in regulations and is regularly monitored by the Environment Agency.

William Graham: You will be aware that the Bossiney sewage treatment works in Cornwall is to release effluent into the Bristol Channel, and that this is the subject of an inquiry. Do you have any plans to make representations to that inquiry?

Carwyn Jones: I am aware of what is happening at Bossiney and at Tintagel. We do not propose to make representations to the inquiry as the discharges are small and not anticipated to have an effect on the Welsh coast.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 12, OAQ0609(EPC), has been transferred for written answer.

C11 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ollwng elifiant i ddyfroedd yr arfordir o gwmpas Cymru? OAQ0591(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Mae gollwng elifiant i ddyfroedd arfordir Cymru yn amodol ar safonau sy'n cael eu gosod mewn rheoliadau, a chaiff hyn ei fonitro'n rheolaidd gan Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd.

William Graham: Fe wyddoch y bydd gwaith trin carthion yn Bossiney yng Nghernyw yn gollwng elifiant i Fôr Hafren, a bod hyn yn destun ymchwiliad. A ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno sylwadau i'r ymchwiliad hwnnw?

Carwyn Jones: Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd yn Bossiney ac yn Nindagwl. Ni fwriadwn gyflwyno sylwadau i'r ymchwiliad gan fod yr elifion sy'n cael eu gollwng yn fach ac ni ragwelir y byddant yn cael effaith ar arfordir Cymru.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 12, OAQ0609(EPC), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**Mynediad Agored i Gefn Gwlad
Open Access to the Countryside**

Q13 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on progress in developing open access to the countryside in Wales? OAQ0616(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Together with our partners, we have successfully introduced a new public right of access across Wales under the Countryside and Rights of Way Act 2000. That was introduced in May last year, and 22 per cent of Wales is now available on a statutory basis for walking. That is a threefold increase in the amount of land previously available.

John Griffiths: If we were able to open access to land right around the coast of Wales, it would bring many advantages in terms of marketability for tourism, greater economic benefit to all areas concerned, and great improvements to the quality of life for the people of Wales and others who would use the access. How far forward are we in developing access along the coast of Wales?

Carwyn Jones: As you will be aware, John, 'Wales: A Better Country' commits the Government to improving access to the coast by 2008-09. The Countryside Council for Wales is considering the possible options for taking this forward and will be making recommendations to us shortly.

Brynle Williams: I welcome the access to the countryside through the Act. However, I am concerned that the Welsh Assembly Government underestimated the cost of implementing and enforcing the Act. As we heard earlier, we are having problems with off-road users, and not just on byways and highways. Can we put more money into policing this and into adequate signage and ensuring that these routes are maintained properly?

Carwyn Jones: It is for local authorities to do that, and they receive £2.4 million per year for that purpose. The evidence suggests that most of that money is being spent by most of the local authorities. However, I

C13 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y cynnydd sydd wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu mynediad agored i gefn gwlad Cymru? OAQ0616(EPC)

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym, gyda'n partneriaid, wedi cyflwyno hawl mynediad cyhoeddus newydd yn llwyddiannus ar draws Cymru o dan Ddeddf Cefn Gwlad a Hawliau Tramwy 2000. Fe'i cyflwynwyd ym mis Mai y llynedd, ac mae 22 y cant o Gymru bellach ar gael yn statudol i gerddwyr. Mae hynny wedi treblu faint o dir a oedd ar gael gynt.

John Griffiths: Pe baem yn gallu sicrhau mynediad i dir o gwmpas arfordir Cymru gyfan, byddai'n creu nifer o fanteision o ran hybu twristiaeth, mwy o fudd economaidd i'r holl ardaloedd dan sylw, a gwelliannau mawr yn ansawdd bywyd pobl Cymru ac eraill a fyddai'n manteisio ar y mynediad. Pa gynnydd yr ydym wedi'i wneud i ddatblygu mynediad ar hyd arfordir Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Fel y gwyddoch, John, mae 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' yn ymrwymo'r Llywodraeth i wella mynediad i'r arfordir erbyn 2008-09. Mae Cyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru yn ystyried y dewisiadau posibl ar gyfer gweithredu hyn, a bydd yn cyflwyno argymhellion inni cyn hir.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r mynediad i gefn gwlad drwy'r Ddeddf. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Crymu wedi tanamcangyfrif y gost o weithredu'r Ddeddf a'i gorfodi. Fel y clywsom yn gynharach, yr ydym yn cael problemau gyda defnyddwyr cerbydau maes, ac nid ar gilffyrdd a phriffyrdd yn unig. A allwn neilltuo mwy o arian i blismona hyn ac i ddarparu arwyddion digonol a sicrhau bod y llwybrau hyn yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw'n briodol?

Carwyn Jones: Cyfrifoldeb awdurdodau lleol yw hynny, ac y maent yn cael £2.4 miliwn y flwyddyn at y diben hwnnw. Awgryma'r dystiolaeth fod y rhan fwyaf o'r arian yn cael ei wario gan y rhan fwyaf o'r

would encourage all those responsible for opening and maintaining access land in Wales to devote as much resource as possible to ensuring that the land can be enjoyed by as wide a range of people as possible.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Question 14, OAQ0608(EPC), has been transferred for written answer. Question 15, OAQ0579(EPC), has been withdrawn.

awdurdodau lleol. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn annog pawb sy'n gyfrifol am agor a chynnal a chadw tir mynediad yng Nghymru i neilltuo cymaint o adnoddau â phosibl i sicrhau y gall y tir gael ei fwynhau gan gynifer â phosibl o bobl.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 14, OAQ0608(EPC), i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig. Tynnwyd cwestiwn 15, OAQ0579(EPC), yn ôl.

Datganiad am Ofal Cartref am Ddim i Bobl Anabl Statement on Free Homecare for Disabled People

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): Today, I am announcing a considerable package of investment that will reduce the impact of charging on disabled people, while offering an additional range of initiatives that will improve the quantity and quality of domiciliary care for recipients and carers. Although the package will not allow us to deliver our manifesto pledge of a total abolition of homecare charges, it will keep faith with that commitment by providing more financial support for care recipients and carers than was initially envisaged. At the same time, it will further ease the financial burden on those most financially vulnerable.

First, for domiciliary personal care, I am proposing that we increase from 25 per cent to 35 per cent the margin above income support levels before charging takes effect. This measure is aimed at all recipients of this care and it targets financial help at those whose disposable charging income is close to income support levels. On average, people below 60 years of age with a disposable charging income below £110, and people over 60 with around £143 in this income, will be exempt from charges. Where their disposable charging income is above these levels, people below 60 years old could be better off by an average of £8 per week, and those over 60 by £10 per week. I will need to consult on this change. However, I would want to see it take effect at the first opportunity.

Secondly, with regard to carers, we know from our constituents that those who care for people with mental health problems and,

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Heddiw, cyhoeddaf becyn sylweddol o fuddsoddi a fydd yn lleihau effaith codi tâl ar bobl anabl, ac ar yr un pryd yn cynnig cyfres ychwanegol o fentrau a fydd yn gwella ansawdd a safon gofal yn y cartref i bobl sy'n cael gofal ac i'w gofalwyr. Er na fydd y pecyn yn gyfle inni gadw'r addewid yn ein maniffesto i ddileu taliadau gofal cartref yn llwyr, bydd yn unol ag ysbryd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw drwy roi mwy o gymorth ariannol i'r rheini sy'n cael gofal a'u gofalwyr nag a ragwelwyd ar y cychwyn. Ar yr un pryd, bydd yn ysgafnhau'r baich ariannol ar y bobl dlotaf.

Yn gyntaf, ar gyfer gofal personol yn y cartref, cynigiau ein bod yn codi o 25 y cant i 35 y cant y terfyn uwchlaw lefelau cymhorthdal incwm cyn codi tâl. Mae'r mesur hwn yn anelu at bawb sy'n cael y gofal hwn, ac mae'n targedu cymorth ariannol at y rheini sydd â'u eu hincwm gwario at ddibenion talu yn agos at lefelau cymhorthdal incwm. Ar gyfartaledd, bydd pobl o dan 60 oed sydd ag incwm gwario at ddibenion talu yn llai na £110, a phobl dros 60 oed sydd â thua £143 o'r incwm hwn, yn cael eu heithrio rhag talu. Pan fydd eu hincwm gwario at ddibenion talu yn uwch na'r lefelau hyn, gallai pobl o dan 60 oed fod yn well eu byd o £8 yr wythnos, a phobl dros 60 o £10 yr wythnos. Bydd angen imi ymgynghori am y newid hwn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn weld hyn yn dod i rym mor fuan â phosibl.

Yn ail, o ran gofalwyr, gwyddom o'r hyn a ddywed ein hetholwyr mai'r rhai sy'n gofalu am bobl â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, ac yn

especially, dementia sufferers, are often those who most need support. Around half of the current carers grant—just under £3 million—goes to support the carers of people who have a mental illness. I am now proposing to double that by adding a further £3 million a year. In 2006-07, this money will be ring-fenced, and I will need to be assured that it will be used to provide additional support following assessments of carers' needs.

Thirdly, I am proposing to improve the community equipment services on which so many disabled adults and children rely. The present services are fragmented and in need of modernisation. The equipment could be used more efficiently, and people would get a faster, more responsive service if we had a more joined-up approach. Over the next three years, I am proposing to invest £12.5 million in capital on the development of stores, decontamination equipment, IT, transport and demonstration facilities. Our aim is to deliver a fully integrated health and social care community equipment service serving every part of Wales.

Fourthly, developments in technology open up exciting new prospects of being able to allow more vulnerable people to remain in their own homes for longer, knowing that they are in a safe environment and that help can be summoned when they need it. There has been much useful progress in the use of telecare around Wales, but I want to see this gathering pace. Telecare could become a new platform for services for the disabled and the elderly. I now intend to give this a real boost by making available just under £9 million in capital over future years, with the aim of supporting an extra 10,000 people receiving telecare facilities.

Fifthly, in the context of this package, we will continue to keep domiciliary care charging arrangements under review and to make reforms when there is an opportunity and when we can afford to do so. For the moment, I have asked that further work be done on the treatment of disability-related expenditure in domiciliary care charging

arbennig, pobl sydd â dementia, yn aml sydd â'r angen mwyaf am gymorth. Mae tua hanner y grant cyfredol i ofalwyr—ychydig yn llai na £3 miliwn—yn cael ei wario ar helpu gofalwyr pobl sydd â salwch meddwl. Cynigiau yn awr y dylid dyblu hynny drwy ychwanegu £3 miliwn arall y flwyddyn. Yn 2006-07, bydd yr arian hwn wedi'i glustnodi, a bydd angen imi gael sicrwydd y caiff ei ddefnyddio i roi cymorth ychwanegol ar ôl asesu anghenion gofalwyr.

Yn drydydd, cynigiau wella'r gwasanaethau cyfarpar cymunedol y mae cynifer o oedolion a phlant anabl yn dibynnu arnynt. Mae'r gwasanaethau presennol yn ddarniog ac mae angen eu moderneiddio. Gallai'r cyfarpar gael eu defnyddio'n fwy effeithlon, a byddai pobl yn cael gwasanaeth cyflymach a mwy ymatebol pe baem yn mynd ati i gydgyfylltu gwasanaethau. Yn ystod y tair blynedd nesaf, yr wyf yn cynnig y dylid buddsoddi £12.5 miliwn mewn cyfalaf ar ddatblygu storffeydd, cyfarpar dadlygru, TG, cludiant a chyfleusterau arddangos. Ein nod yw darparu gwasanaeth cyfarpar cymunedol cwbl integredig ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol sy'n gwasanaethu pob rhan o Gymru.

Yn bedwerydd, mae datblygiadau technolegol yn esgor ar gyfleoedd newydd a chyffrous i adael i bobl fwy bregus allu aros yn eu cartrefi eu hunain am gyfnod hwy, gan wybod eu bod mewn amgylchedd diogel ac y gellir galw am gymorth pan fydd arnynt ei angen. Gwnaed llawer o gynnydd buddiol wrth ddefnyddio teleofal yng Nghymru, ond hoffwn weld hyn yn datblygu'n gyflymach. Gallai teleofal ddod yn llwyfan newydd ar gyfer gwasanaethau i bobl anabl a'r henoed. Bwriadaf yn awr roi hwb gwirioneddol i hyn drwy ddarparu ychydig yn llai na £9 miliwn mewn cyfalaf yn y blynyddoedd i ddod, gyda'r nod o gefnogi 10,000 o bobl yn ychwanegol i gael cyfleusterau teleofal.

Yn bumed, yng nghyd-destun y pecyn hwn, byddwn yn parhau i adolygu'r trefniadau ar gyfer codi tâl am ofal yn y cartref, ac i'w diwygio pan fydd cyfle a phan allwn fforddio gwneud hynny. Am y tro, yr wyf wedi gofyn am i ragor o waith gael ei wneud ar drin gwariant yn ymwneud ag anabledd yn y trefniadau ar gyfer codi tâl am ofal yn y

arrangements to ensure greater clarity and consistency. We will work closely with stakeholders and consult widely before making changes to the statutory guidance.

In my written statement of 21 March last year, I said that I would seek an independent and authoritative costing of the policy for free homecare for the disabled. Subsequently, I invited Professor David Bell from the University of Stirling to undertake this work. I am publishing this report on the website today.

The cost of compensating local authorities for charging income forgone for eligible services is nearly £23 million per annum, but we must also recognise the wider effects of making services free. Professor Bell's report clearly identifies the potential for substantial growth in costs as demand rises when services are made free. He describes three broad scenarios with costs ranging from £46 million to £79 million per year. It will take time for this demand to build, but it would quickly become unsustainable.

I have also taken into account the interplay between free services and the benefits system. In Wales, the independent living fund supports nearly 1,350 of the most severely disabled people, accounting for around 10 per cent of the UK budget. Because the calculation of benefits for ILF claimants already takes account of local authority charges, there would be no gain for clients if services were delivered free, but there would be a cost to the Assembly. In effect, we would be subsidising the benefits system.

3.10 p.m.

To establish a clear and consistent approach to eligibility for free services, we are currently modelling a resource tool called the index of relative need in four local authorities linked to the unified assessment process. The modelling continues until May. Local authorities are interested in developing the use of the IoRN as it has the potential to improve the assessment of care needs. I

cartref, er mwyn sicrhau mwy o eglurder a chysondeb. Byddwn yn gweithio'n agos gyda rhanddeiliaid ac yn ymgynghori'n eang cyn newid y canllawiau statudol.

Yn fy natganiad ysgrifenedig ar 21 Mawrth y llynedd, dywedais y byddwn yn gofyn am gostio'r polisi ar ofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl yn annibynnol ac yn awdurdodol. Yna, gwahoddais yr Athro David Bell o Brifysgol Stirling i ymgymryd â'r gwaith hwnnw. Yr wyf yn cyhoeddi'r adroddiad hwn ar y wefan heddiw.

Mae'n costio'n agos i £23 miliwn y flwyddyn i ddiogolledu awdurdodau lleol am incwm o godi taliadau na chodwyd am wasanaethau cymwys, ond rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod yr effeithiau ehangach os cynigir gwasanaethau am ddim. Mae adroddiad yr Athro Bell yn nodi'n glir y posibilrwydd o gynnydd sylweddol mewn costau wrth i'r galw gynyddu pan gynigir gwasanaethau am ddim. Mae'n disgrifio tair sefyllfa gyffredinol gyda chostau'n amrywio o £46 miliwn i £79 miliwn y flwyddyn. Bydd yn cymryd amser i'r galw hwn gynyddu, ond buan y byddai'n mynd yn amhosibl ei gynnal.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi ystyried y berthynas rhwng gwasanaethau am ddim a'r system budd-daliadau. Yng Nghymru, mae'r gronfa byw'n annibynnol yn helpu bron i 1,350 o bobl sydd â'r anabledau mwyaf difrifol, sy'n cyfrif am ryw 10 y cant o gyllideb y DU. Gan fod taliadau a godir gan awdurdodau lleol eisoes wedi'u hystyried wrth gyfrifo budd-daliadau i'r rheini sy'n hawlio o dan y Gronfa Byw'n Annibynnol, ni fyddai unrhyw fantais i gleientiaid pe bai gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu am ddim, ond byddai cost i'r Cynulliad. Byddem yn cymorthdalur system budd-daliadau i bob diben.

Er mwyn sefydlu ymagwedd glir a chyson tuag at gymhwyster i gael gwasanaethau am ddim, yr ydym wrthi'n modelu adnodd a elwir yn fynegai angen gmharol mewn pedwar awdurdod lleol sy'n gysylltiedig â'r broses asesiad unedig. Bydd y modelu'n arhau tan fis Mai. Mae gan awdurdodau lleol ddiddordeb mewn datblygu defnyddio'r mynegai hwn oherwydd gallai wella'r ffordd

intend that this modelling work should run its full course.

However, in view of all that we now know, it is clear that we cannot put in place our original plans equitably and affordably. The alternative package that I have announced today will further reduce the burden of charges, which our initial proposal was intended to achieve, and it will make substantial improvements in the lives of many service users and carers. It also represents a much larger investment than we had originally planned. Our baseline projection for the original policy was £55 million over three years. The package that I have announced is worth £76 million in capital and revenue over the same period. This is on top of the £45 million that we are already making available next year for adult social services. [*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

Helen Mary Jones: It is customary to thank a Minister for a statement, but, sadly, I find myself unable to do so today. There are some specific positives in his statement, and I particularly welcome the extra money to support the carers of people suffering from severe mental illness. However, the Minister cannot deny—although he is not really seeking to do so—that he has broken his party's promise, and his excuses are feeble. He and his Government have betrayed some of the most vulnerable people in our communities. Some of us may not have very high expectations of his Government, but disabled people and their carers did. A very specific promise has been broken, and he and his Government should be ashamed.

Can the Minister explain the way in which his party came to make this promise in the first place if it was not costed? It is inexcusable. If it does not represent good value for money now, why did it represent good value for money in 2003 when he was seeking the votes of disabled people in Wales? How does the Minister specifically answer the powerful case made by the Coalition on Charging Cymru on free home care? I see nothing in this statement that

y caiff anghenion gofal eu hasesu. Fy mwriad i'r gwaith modelu hwn fynd rhagddo hyd ei derfyn.

Fodd bynnag, ar sail popeth a wyddom erbyn hyn, mae'n amlwg na allwn roi ein cynlluniau gwreiddiol ar waith mewn ffordd deg a fforddiadwy. Bydd y pecyn amgen a gyhoeddais heddiw yn lleihau'r baich taliadau ymhellach—rhywbeth y bwriadwyd i'n cynnig cyntaf ei gyflawni—a bydd yn gwella bywydau nifer o ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau a gofalwyr yn sylweddol. Mae hefyd yn fuddsoddiad llawer mwy nag a fwriadwyd gennym yn wreiddiol. Ein rhagamcan sylfaenol ar gyfer y polisi gwreiddiol oedd £55 miliwn dros dair blynedd. Mae'r pecyn a gyhoeddais yn werth £76 miliwn mewn cyfalaf a refeniw yn ystod yr un cyfnod. Mae hyn ar ben y £45 miliwn yr ydym eisoes yn ei ddarparu y flwyddyn nesaf ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

Helen Mary Jones: Mae'n arferol diolch i Weinidog am ddatganiad, ond yn anffodus, ni allaf wneud hynny heddiw. Mae rhai agweddau cadarnhaol yn ei ddatganiad, a chrosawaf yn arbennig yr arian ychwanegol i gefnogi gofalwyr pobl sydd â salwch meddwl difrifol. Fodd bynnag, ni all y Gweinidog wadu—er nad yw'n ceisio gwneud hynny—ei fod wedi torri addewid ei blaid, ac mae ei esgusodion yn wan. Mae ef a'i Lywodraeth wedi bradychu rhai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymunedau. Hwyrach nad oedd rhai ohonom yn disgwyl rhyw lawer gan ei Lywodraeth, ond yr oedd disgwyliadau mawr gan bobl anabl a'u gofalwyr. Torrwyd addewid penodol iawn, a dylai fod cywilydd arno ef a'i Lywodraeth.

A all y Gweinidog esbonio'r ffordd y gwnaeth ei blaid yr addewid hwn yn y lle cyntaf os nad oedd wedi'i gostio? Nid oes unrhyw esgus dros hynny. Os nad yw'n rhoi gwerth am arian yn awr, pam yr oedd yn rhoi gwerth da am arian yn 2003 pan oedd yn ceisio ennill pleidleisiau pobl anabl yng Nghymru? Yn benodol, sut y mae'r Gweinidog yn ateb y ddadl gref a wnaed gan Coalition of Charging Cymru dros ofal cartref am ddim? Hyd y gwelaf, nid oes dim

answers some of the specific points that it has made in recent days, particularly with regard to the end of the postcode lottery in terms of charging for care across Wales.

Will the Minister tell us how he will ensure that those elements of the additional money that he is promising today and which are not ring-fenced will be spent on what he wants them to be spent on? We all share a concern that it will simply disappear into the overall pot for the various bodies through which the money will go. I press the Minister further for urgency. He mentioned a review of the domiciliary care charges, but I would argue that that needs to be done as a matter of urgency in the light of the broken promise, so that if people are still paying when they had been told that they would not have to, at least they will pay equitably across the nation.

Finally, I ask the Minister to apologise on behalf of the Government for misleading some of the most vulnerable disabled people in our communities and their carers.

Rhag eich cywilydd.

Brian Gibbons: Although we cannot take any pride from the fact that we are not able to deliver our manifesto promise, I think that the rhetoric was a little hyperbolic from Helen Mary. She asked a number of questions which I will try to answer. The amount of money that we have put into the budget to deliver the original proposal in the manifesto was in the order of £15 million last year, and £20 million in subsequent years. If you look at the work of David Bell and others, you will see that that would be sufficient to meet the requirements of providing free personal care. However, we now have the information following the implementation of free personal care in Scotland, which we did not have previously. The information from Scotland shows that the number of people who have moved into domiciliary care following the introduction of a free package has doubled. This is new information.

If I remember correctly, in some of the debates that we have had on free personal care, many Members in favour of introducing

yn y datganiad hwn sy'n ateb y pwyntiau penodol a wnaed yn ddiweddar, yn enwedig o ran rhoi terfyn ar y loteri cod post wrth godi tâl am ofal ar draws Cymru.

A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym sut y bydd yn sicrhau bod yr elfennau hynny yn yr arian ychwanegol y mae'n ei addo heddiw, ac nad yw wedi ei glustnodi, yn cael ei wario ar yr hyn y mae am iddo gael ei wario arno? Mae pob un ohonom yn pryderu mai diflannu a wnaiff yn y cyllid cyffredinol i'r amrywiol gyrff a fydd yn trafod yr arian. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog eto i weithredu ar fyrder. Soniodd am adolygiad o'r taliadau am ofal cartref, ond byddwn i'n dadlau bod angen gwneud hyn ar fyrder yng ngoleuni'r addewid a dorwyd, er mwyn sicrhau os bydd pobl yn parhau i dalu, a hwythau wedi cael ar ddeall na fyddent yn gorfod talu, o leiaf y byddant yn talu'r un faint ym mhob rhan o'r wlad.

Yn olaf, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ymddiheuro ar ran y Llywodraeth am gamarwain rhai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymunedau a'u gofalwyr.

Shame on you.

Brian Gibbons: Er na allwn ymfalchïo yn y ffaith nad ydym yn gallu cadw addewid yn ein manifestto, credaf mai gormodiaith gan Helen Mary oedd y rhethreg honno. Gofynnodd nifer o gwestiynau a cheisiaf eu hateb. Tua £15 miliwn y llynedd ac £20 miliwn mewn blynyddoedd dilynol yw'r swm yr ydym wedi'i neilltuo yn y gyllideb i weithredu'r cynnig gwreiddiol yn y manifestto. Os edrychwch ar waith David Bell ac eraill, fe welwch y byddai hynny'n ddigonol i fodloni gofynion darparu gofal personol am ddim. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl gweithredu gofal personol am ddim yn yr Alban, mae gennym erbyn hyn y wybodaeth nad oedd gennym o'r blaen. Dengys y wybodaeth o'r Alban fod nifer y bobl sydd wedi newid i ofal cartref wedi dyblu ar ôl cyflwyno pecyn am ddim. Mae hynny'n yn wybodaeth newydd.

Os cofiaf yn iawn, yn rhai o'r dadleuon a gawsom ar ofal personol am ddim, yr oedd nifer o Aelodau a oedd o blaid ei gyflwyno

it were very reluctant to acknowledge that introducing free personal care would result in a substantial increase in demand. We did not know that at that stage, but we do now because of the empirical evidence from Scotland.

The money will be targeted at local authorities to ensure that they deliver additionality. Carers' local authorities will be asked to provide that specific guarantee in relation to the community equipment, and, again, the health and social care communities will be asked to provide a plan to be able to draw the money down. The money for the 10,000 telecare protected homes will be in response to specific requests to achieve that ambitious target.

I do not think that anyone can take any pleasure from the fact that we are not able to deliver the manifesto promises, but we have maintained faith with the people, particularly by ensuring that the £50 million that we originally allocated to this sum has not only been increased but increased by 50 per cent.

Jonathan Morgan: I congratulate the Minister for Health and Social Services. I did not realise that the Olympic Games had come early and that we had set a new sport: rushing through a ministerial statement as quickly as possible. You seem to have achieved a gold medal in that this afternoon. I have never heard a Minister rush through a Cabinet statement with such nerves, panic and embarrassment. You have only to look at the faces of your colleagues behind you to see the embarrassment that they feel about your dreadful performance and that of your colleagues on the front bench. You and your colleagues made a clear and direct commitment to the people of Wales in your 2003 manifesto.

'In the next Welsh Assembly term Labour will...Scrap homecare charges for disabled people.'

That is a clear, unequivocal, and pretty simple and straightforward commitment. However, in response to Helen Mary Jones, and some of the heckling from behind you, you said that, at the time, the party was not sure whether these promises could be

yn amharod iawn i gydnabod y byddai cyflwyno gofal personol am ddim yn golygu cynnydd sylweddol yn y galw. Ni wyddem hynny ar y pryd, ond gwyddom hynny yn awr oherwydd y dystiolaeth empirig o'r Alban.

Bydd yr arian yn targedu awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau eu bod yn darparu ychwanegedd. Gofynnir i awdurdodau lleol gofaluwr ddarparu'r sicrwydd penodol hwnnw mewn cysylltiad ag offer cymunedol, ac unwaith eto gofynnir i'r cymunedau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ddarparu cynllun er mwyn gallu defnyddio'r arian. Darperir yr arian ar gyfer y 10,000 o gartrefi a ddiogelir gan teleofal mewn ymateb i geisiadau penodol i gyflawni'r targed uchelgeisiol hwnnw.

Ni chredaf y gall neb gael unrhyw bleser o'r ffaith na allwn wireddu addewidion y manifesto, ond yr ydym wedi llwyddo i gadw ffydd y bobl, yn enwedig drwy sicrhau bod y £50 miliwn a ddyrannwyd gennym i'r swm hwn yn wreiddiol nid yn unig wedi cynyddu, ond wedi cynyddu 50 y cant.

Jonathan Morgan: Hoffwn longyfarch y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Nid oeddwn yn sylweddoli bod y Gemau Olympaidd wedi cyrraedd yn gynnar a'n bod wedi dyfeisio math newydd o chwaraeon: brysio drwy ddatganiad gweinidogol cyn gynted â phosibl. Ymddengys eich bod wedi ennill medal aur yn hynny y prynhawn yma. Nid wyf erioed wedi clywed Gweinidog yn rhuthro drwy ddatganiad Cabinet mewn ffordd mor nerfus, yn llawn panig ac embaras. Edrychwch ar wynebau eich cyd-Aelodau ac fe welwch yr embaras a deimlant am eich perfformiad difrifol chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau ar y fainc flaen. Gwnaethoch chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau ymrwymiad clir ac uniongyrchol i bobl Cymru yn eich manifesto yn 2003.

'Yn ystod tymor nesaf y Cynulliad bydd Llafur...Yn dileu taliadau gofal cartref i bobl anabl.'

Mae'n ymrwymiad clir, pendant, a digon syml ac uniongyrchol. Fodd bynnag, mewn ymateb i Helen Mary Jones, a'r heclo y tu ôl ichi, yr oeddech yn dweud bryd hynny nad oedd y blaid yn siŵr a oedd yn bosibl gwireddu'r addewidion hyn, ac eto

achieved, and yet you decided to put that as a clear commitment in Welsh Labour's manifesto.

I want to ask first about the process since this became apparent. Many months ago, my colleague, David Melding, asked you and your predecessor about this issue. The response was that the Government was having difficulty defining the term 'disabled'. That was your reason for kicking this into the long grass. Can you confirm whether you have yet been able to define the term 'disabled'? When were you made aware of the financial cost of this project, and can you confirm to the Assembly that the only reason at the time for kicking this into the long grass was because you could not define the term 'disabled' and not because you had serious reservations about whether you could afford this very ambitious commitment?

I also ask you to apologise, given that you have not done so. Helen Mary Jones also asked you to apologise for not being able to fulfil this manifesto commitment. I think that the previous Minister for health, Jane Hutt, should also apologise, along with the First Minister. You were not the Minister for health at the time, so we cannot blame you entirely for this, but you, or someone in your Government, should apologise for not being able to live up to this commitment. You put this commitment in your manifesto to convince the people of Wales to re-elect the Labour Assembly Government. On that basis, you should have at least a degree of dignity as a Government Minister and you, collectively as a Government, should apologise for not being able to fulfil this commitment.

I do not doubt that there is extra support in this statement, and I will be keen to see how this is implemented, but it is no real comfort to the people of Wales who were looking forward to free homecare for disabled individuals. Those people who felt that the Labour Party was on their side will see this as a sop. On the first page of your statement, Minister, you said,

'it will keep faith with that commitment'.

dywedwyd hynny gennych fel ymrwymiad clir ym maniffesto Llafur Cymru.

Yn gyntaf, yr wyf am holi ynglŷn â'r broses ers i hyn ddod i'r amlwg. Fisoedd yn ôl, holodd fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding, chi a'ch rhagflaenydd am y mater hwn. Yr ymateb oedd bod y Llywodraeth yn cael anhawster wrth ddiffinio'r term 'anabl'. Dyna oedd eich rheswm dros roi'r mater hwn o'r neilltu. A allwch gadarnhau a ydych wedi llwyddo i ddiffinio'r term 'anabl' eto? Pryd y daethoch yn ymwybodol o gost ariannol y prosiect hwn, ac a allwch gadarnhau i'r Cynulliad mai'r unig reswm ar y pryd dros roi'r mater hwn o'r neilltu oedd am na allech ddiffinio'r term 'anabl', nid am fod gennych amheuan cryf a allech fforddio'r ymrwymiad uchelgeisiol iawn hwn?

Gofynnaf ichi ymddiheuro hefyd, o weld nad ydych wedi gwneud hynny. Gofynnodd Helen Mary Jones hefyd ichi ymddiheuro am fethu â chyflawni'r ymrwymiad maniffesto hwn. Credaf y dylai'r cyn-Weinidog dros iechyd, Jane Hutt, hefyd ymddiheuro, ynghyd â'r Prif Weinidog. Nid chi oedd y Gweinidog dros iechyd ar y pryd, felly, ni allwn eich beio'n llwyr am hyn. Ond dylech chi, neu rywun yn eich Llywodraeth, ymddiheuro am fethu â chyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn. Rhoesoch yr ymrwymiad hwn yn eich maniffesto er mwyn darbwyllo pobl Cymru i ailethol Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad. Ar y sail honno, dylech o leiaf ddangos rhywfaint o urddas fel un o Weinidogion y Llywodraeth, a dylech chi, fel Llywodraeth gyfan, ymddiheuro am fethu â chyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwn.

Nid wyf yn amau nad oes cymorth ychwanegol yn y datganiad hwn, a byddaf yn awyddus i weld sut y caiff ei roi ar waith. Ond nid yw o unrhyw gysur i bobl Cymru, a oedd yn edrych ymlaen at ofal cartref am ddim i unigolion anabl. Bydd y bobl hynny a oedd yn teimlo bod y Blaid Lafur ar eu hochr hwy yn gweld hyn fel llwgrwobrwyo. Ar dudalen gyntaf eich datganiad, Weinidog, yr oeddech yn dweud,

bydd yn unol ag ysbryd yr ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Keeping faith with a commitment is honouring a commitment and seeing it through. That is what you do if you make a manifesto promise. You have not honoured the commitment that you have made. Therefore, I fail to understand—though perhaps you can explain this—why you feel that this announcement keeps faith with that commitment.

3.20 p.m.

Finally, I put it to you that, in 1999, your party made a series of manifesto commitments on health, many of which you failed to realise or keep. In 2003, you made more commitments and manifesto pledges on health, one of which you admit you are failing to meet now. How on earth can the people of Wales have any confidence in your Government and your party in whatever you promise in the run-up to next year's election?

Brian Gibbons: I will deal with the substance of the questions that Jonathan asked, rather than the froth and foam of his rhetoric. In terms of trying to define the term 'disabled', the definition that we are using is that which is used for the delivery of free personal care, namely care that involves intimate personal contact in the basic requirements of living, such as bathing, feeding, washing, toileting and so forth. That is fairly common currency, and I am a bit surprised that Jonathan needed further elaboration on that, but, then again, nothing should surprise me in that regard.

In trying to assess this, the initial commitment was made on the basis of the number of people who were in receipt of domiciliary care at that time. The amount of money in the budget was sufficient for us to deliver that commitment to the defined number of people at that time. What is different is the empirical evidence that we have received from Scotland, which is new information. While people may say that we should have known that, when we discussed free personal care on previous occasions, I do not remember anyone in the Chamber suggesting that there would be any dramatic increase. Indeed, I well remember Members

Mae gweithredu yn unol ag ysbryd ymrwymiad yn golygu parchu ymrwymiad a'i gyflawni. Dyna a wnewch wrth wneud ddewid maniffesto. Nid ydych wedi parchu'r ymrwymiad a wnaethoch. Felly, ni allaf deall—er y gallwch esbonio hyn, efallai—pam yr ydych yn teimlo bod y cyhoeddiad hwn yn unol â'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Yn olaf, hoffwn nodi, yn 1999, fod eich plaid wedi gwneud cyfres o ymrwymadau maniffesto ar iechyd ac na lwyddwyd i wireddu na chadw llawer ohonynt. Yn 2003, gwnaethoch ragor o ymrwymadau ac addewidion maniffesto ar iechyd, ac yr ydych yn cyfaddef yn awr eich bod yn methu â gwireddu un ohonynt. Sut ar wyneb daear y gall pobl Cymru deimlo'n hyderus yn eich Llywodraeth a'ch plaid am unrhyw beth y byddwch yn ei addo yn ystod y cyfnod cyn yr etholiad y flwyddyn nesaf?

Brian Gibbons: Ymdriniaf â hanfod y cwestiynau a ofynnodd Jonathan, yn hytrach na chleber ei rethreg. O ran ceisio diffinio'r term 'anabl', y diffiniad yr ydym yn ei ddefnyddio yw'r hyn a ddefnyddir i ddarparu gofal personol am ddim, sef gofal sy'n cynnwys cyswllt personol agos sy'n angenrheidiol i fywyd bob dydd, fel cael bath, bwydo, ymolchi, mynd i'r tŷ bach, ac ati. Mae hynny'n lled hysbys i bawb, ac yr wyf yn synnu braidd fod angen esboniad pellach ar Jonathan ar hynny, ond wedi dweud hynny, ni ddylai unrhyw beth fy synnu yng nghyswllt hynny.

Wrth geisio asesu'r mater, gwnaed yr ymrwymiad cychwynnol ar sail nifer y bobl a oedd yn cael gofal cartref bryd hynny. Yr oedd wm yr arian yn y gyllideb yn ddigonol inni gyflawni'r ymrwymiad hwnnw i nifer y bobl a oedd wedi eu diffinio bryd hynny. Yr hyn sy'n wahanol yw'r dystiolaeth empirig a gawsom o'r Alban, sy'n wybodaeth newydd. Er y gallai rhai ddweud y dylem fod wedi gwybod hynny, pan fuom yn trafod gofal personol am ddim yn y gorffennol, ni chofiaf i neb yn y Siambr awgrymu y byddai unrhyw gynnydd sylweddol. Yn wir, cofiaf yn glir fod Aelodau wedi dweud y byddai cost gofal personol am ddim yng Nghymru yn amlwg

saying that the cost of free personal care in Wales would be eminently affordable precisely because it involved a relatively stable number of people.

I said that we have kept faith, but, obviously, we have not been able to keep faith with the letter of the manifesto commitment. We have kept faith by targeting those who would have benefited from the free personal care programme. The level of money that would have been available in the initial manifesto commitment was £52 million, but we have added to that, and have effectively increased that commitment by 50 per cent. Vulnerable people the length and breadth of Wales will see a real improvement in the quality and range of services, which they would not otherwise receive, because of the policies of this Labour administration.

Jenny Randerson: Well, well. I suppose that we have to give you full marks for honesty, Minister, even at this late stage. At last, you have come clean. We have waited for three years, more or less, and, at last, you have admitted that the Labour Government cannot afford this. How long have you known that you could not afford this? The silence on this has been pretty deafening. This is yet another uncosted, untested empty Labour promise. It is not a flip-flop—which is the fashionable word at the moment—but a good old-fashioned u-turn. I give a warning now to the electors of Wales: next time, trust the Labour Party according to its deeds and not its words.

Disabled people and their carers have had high expectations for the past three years, as they waited and waited for this announcement. I put it to you, Minister, that this is poor prioritisation by the Labour Government, even within the health budget. I hope that disabled people and their carers will now take note that the wealthy and relatively healthy—those who enjoy the kind of income that the Minister receives—will be able to get their free prescriptions for their coughs and colds, but the disabled will not be able to get free homecare.

yn fforddiadwy, am yr union reswm ei fod yn berthnasol i nifer cymharol sefydlog o bobl.

Dywedais ein bod wedi cadw at ein gair, ond yn amlwg nid ydym wedi llwyddo i gadw at ein gair o ran union eiriad yr ymrwymiad maniffesto. Yr ydym wedi cadw at ein gair drwy dargedu'r rheini a fyddai wedi elwa o'r rhaglen gofal personol am ddim. Lefel yr arian a fyddai wedi cael ei ryddhau yn yr ymrwymiad maniffesto cychwynnol oedd £52 miliwn, ond yr ydym wedi ychwanegu at hynny, ac i bob pwrpas yr ydym wedi cynyddu'r ymrwymiad hwnnw 50 y cant. Bydd pobl sy'n agored i niwed ar hyd a lled Cymru yn gweld gwelliant sylweddol yn ansawdd ac amrywiaeth y gwasanaethau, na fyddent wedi eu cael fel arall, diolch i bolisiau'r weinyddiaeth Lafur hon.

Jenny Randerson: Wel, wel. Mae'n debyg y bydd yn rhaid inni roi marciau llawn ichi am eich gonestrwydd, Weinidog, hyd yn oed mor hwyr â hyn. O'r diwedd, yr ydych wedi bod yn onest. Yr ydym wedi aros am dair blynedd, fwy neu lai, ac o'r diwedd yr ydych wedi cyfaddef na all y Llywodraeth Lafur fforddio hyn. Ers pryd yr ydych yn gwybod na allech fforddio hyn? Bu'r tawelwch ar hyn yn hollol fyddarol. Dyma addewid gwag arall heb ei gostio, heb ei brofi gan y blaid Lafur. Nid yw fflip-fflop yw hyn—sef y gair ffasiynol ar hyn o bryd—ond tro pedol hen ffasiwn. Rhybuddiaf etholwyr Cymru yn awr: y tro nesaf, ymddiriedwch yn y Blaid Lafur yn ôl ei gweithredoedd yn hytrach na'i geiriau.

Bu gan bobl anabl a'u gofalwyr ddisgwyliadau mawr yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf, wrth iddynt aros ac aros am y cyhoeddiad hwn. Awgrymaf ichi, Weinidog, fod hyn yn enghraifft o flaenoriaethu gwael ar ran y Llywodraeth Lafur, hyd yn oed o fewn y gyllideb iechyd. Gobeithio y bydd pobl anabl a'u gofalwyr bellach yn sylwi y bydd pobl gyfoethog a phobl gymharol iach—sef y rheini sy'n mwynhau'r un math o incwm â'r Gweinidog—yn gallu cael presgripsiynau am ddim i drin eu peswch a'u hannwyd, ond na fydd yr anabl yn gallu cael gofal cartref am ddim.

I have a specific question about your summary of the analysis in Professor Bell's report. It contrasts considerably with the conclusions of the Rowntree report on the Scottish experience. I must take issue with you, Minister, on the claim that you gave this untested, uncoded promise at the time of the last election because there was no evidence from Scotland; there was already evidence from Scotland, and the Rowntree report says that it has not cost more than they thought that it would, because some increases in cost were offset by savings elsewhere. You should have looked at Scotland a little earlier.

In relation to the charade of the current desk-based exercise in four local authorities in Wales, of preparing for free homecare for the elderly, when will you tell those people why they are really undertaking the work that they think is to prepare for free homecare?

I must also question the £9 million on telecare. Disabled people and carers who were expecting a financial lifeline will not be content with a telephone lifeline instead. You have a lot of explaining to do regarding how that will be a decent substitute for free homecare.

There are, of course, items that are very welcome here, and I especially welcome the targeting of help for those with dementia and those suffering from mental illness. However, when will this additional £3 million become available, and how do you intend to ensure that it is truly additional, as you state that you intend to do?

The new money for equipment is also welcome, but, to be honest, I tend to think that you have looked through your budget and thought, 'What can I possibly tack on to a statement on free homecare that is not about free homecare?', because that is the sort of work that should have been done anyway under other headings.

I want to ask you about domiciliary care charges, which vary considerably across Wales. I welcome that, but where will the money to support a change to a fairer system

Mae gennyf gwestiwn penodol am eich crynodeb o'r dadansoddiad yn adroddiad yr Athro Bell. Mae'n cyferbynnu'n sylweddol â chasgliadau adroddiad Rowntree ar brofiad yr Alban. Mae'n rhaid imi anghytuno â chi, Weinidog, ar yr honiad eich bod wedi gwneud yr addewid hwn heb ei brofi, heb ei gostio, adeg yr etholiad diwethaf am nad oedd tystiolaeth o'r Alban; yr oedd tystiolaeth o'r Alban eisoes, ac mae adroddiad Rowntree yn dweud nad yw wedi costio mwy nag a gredid y byddai'n ei gostio, am fod rhai codiadau yn y gost wedi eu dileu gan arbedion rywle arall. Dylech fod wedi edrych ar yr Alban ychydig ynghynt.

Mewn cysylltiad â'r esgus o ymarfer desg presennol mewn pedwar awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru, o baratoi ar gyfer gofal cartref am ddim i'r henoed, pryd y byddwch yn dweud wrth y bobl hynny beth yw'r rheswm go iawn pam maent yn gwneud y gwaith a fydd, yn eu barn hwy, yn paratoi at gyfer gofal iechyd am ddim?

Rhaid imi hefyd gwestiynu'r £9 miliwn ar deleofal. Ni fydd pobl anabl a gofalwyr a oedd yn disgwyl cymorth ariannol yn fodlon ar gael cymorth ffôn yn lle hynny. Mae gennych lawer o waith i'w wneud i esbonio sut y bydd hynny'n ateb priodol yn lle gofal cartref am ddim.

Wrth gwrs, mae yma eitemau sy'n cael eu croesawu, ac yr wyf yn croesawu'n arbennig fod cymorth yn cael ei dargedu at bobl sydd â dementia ac sydd â salwch meddwl. Fodd bynnag, pryd fydd y £3 miliwn ychwanegol hwn ar gael, a sut y bwriadwch sicrhau ei fod yn arian gwirioneddol ychwanegol, fel y dywedwch yr ydych yn ei fwriadu?

Croesewir yr arian newydd ar gyfer offer hefyd, ond a bod yn onest, tueddaf i gredu eich bod wedi edrych drwy eich cyllideb a meddwl, 'Beth gallaf ei ychwanegu at ddatganiad ar ofal cartref am ddim nad yw a wnelo â gofal cartref am ddim?', am mai dyma'r math o waith y dylid fod wedi'i wneud o dan benawdau eraill beth bynnag.

Yr wyf am eich holi am daliadau gofal cartref, sy'n amrywio'n sylweddol ledled Cymru. Croesawaf hynny, ond o ble y daw'r arian i gefnogi newid i system decach? Ni

come from? I see nothing in your statement that deals with that.

Finally, Minister, I would like to add my voice to those of my two colleagues who have spoken already. Please could you say 'sorry'?

Brian Gibbons: There is no doubt that we are sorry and we regret that we have not been able to implement this. I do not think that that is in dispute.

I will deal with the specific questions that you raised. How long did we know? When we looked at the sums and at the evidence from Scotland, it became apparent that there were real issues surrounding affordability and equity, even as people were working on the issue, through the task and finish group. We looked at a range of different ways in which we could try to implement that particular commitment by targeting the assistance on those with the greatest relative need. We decided to use the indicator of relative need to see whether there was a mechanism to identify a group that would be entitled to free personal care, as a halfway house towards implementing the full policy.

However, as the work on the index of relative need was being implemented, it became apparent that it was not realistic to continue along that road, because it was leading to anomalies and inequities at a relatively early stage. Consequently, we made a decision to look at an alternative package of care. Contrary to what you said about empty promises and not delivering, we created a package worth £76 million. If you do not call that 'delivery', I do not know what is. If 50 per cent more than the original targeted baseline to deliver free personal care is not delivery, I do not know what is.

3.30 p.m.

We are committed to delivering our policies on free prescriptions as well as the commitment that we are outlining today. Sometimes it amazes me what people say. To refer to a £9 million package of telecare as a telephone line displays an appalling

welaf unrhyw beth yn eich datganiad sy'n ymdrin â hynny.

Yn olaf, Weinidog, hoffwn ychwanegu fy llais at eiriau fy nau gyd-Aelod sydd wedi siarad eisoes. A wnewch chi ddweud 'mae'n ddrwg gennyf'?

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'n ddrwg gennym a'i fod yn edifar gennym na allem weithredu hyn. Ni chredaf fod unrhyw amheuaeth am hynny.

Ymdriniat â'r cwestiynau penodol a godwyd gennych. Ers pryd yr oeddem yn gwybod? Pan edrychwyd ar y symiau a'r dystiolaeth o'r Alban, daeth yn amlwg fod problemau gwirioneddol gyda fforddiadwyedd ac thegwch, hyd yn oed wrth i bobl weithio ar y mater, drwy'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen. Buom yn edrych ar amrywiaeth o ffyrdd gwahanol inni geisio gweithredu'r ymrwymiad penodol hwnnw drwy dargedu'r cymorth at y rhai yr oedd ei angen arnynt fwyaf. Penderfynwyd defnyddio dangosydd angen cymharol i weld a oedd yna fecanwaith i nodi grŵp y byddai ganddynt hawl i gael gofal personol am ddim, fel man canol tuag at weithredu'r polisi llawn.

Fodd bynnag, wrth i'r gwaith ar y mynegai o angen cymharol gael ei weithredu, daeth yn amlwg nad oedd yn realistig parhau ar hyd y trywydd hwnnw, am ei fod yn arwain at anghysondebau ac anghydraddoldebau yn gymharol gynnar. O ganlyniad, gwnaethom benderfyniad i edrych ar becyn gofal amgen. Yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedwyd gennych am addewidion gwag a methu â chyflawni, crewyd pecyn gennym gwerth £76 miliwn. Os nad ydych yn ystyried bod hynny yn 'gyflawni', ni wn beth yw ei ystyr. Os nad yw 50 y cant yn fwy na'r gwaelodlin a dargedwyd yn wreiddiol i ddarparu gofal personol am ddim yn gyfystyr â chyflawni, ni wn beth yw ei ystyr.

Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i gyflwyno ein polisiau ar bresgripsiynau am ddim yn ogystal â'r ymrwymiad yr ydym yn ei amlinellu heddiw. Byddaf yn rhyfeddu weithiau at yr hyn mae pobl yn ei ddweud. Mae cyfeirio at becyn £9 miliwn o deleofal

ignorance of the developments in telecare across Wales. The developments in telecare are exciting and dramatic, and will make a massive difference to providing people with the opportunity to stay in their own homes and communities in a way that would not have been conceivable before telemedicine became available. It will also provide reassurance to carers. Often, it is the lack of information about what is happening to the cared-for person that puts stress on the carer. However, telemedicine will allow them to get information. This will be a real benefit for carers and care recipients. I am surprised that you should dismiss it with such a throwaway comment.

It will be truly additional, particularly in relation to the carers grant, which is being assimilated into the revenue support grant. We are concerned that, with the assimilation of the existing carers grant into the revenue support grant, there could be a reduction in the commitment to carers in any event. Therefore, a monitoring process is already in place to make sure that the gains that have been made through the existing carers grant are maintained. We have that baseline information and monitoring in place as I speak. This extra £3 million will be on top of that, and we will be asking for that additionality.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I close this statement, I remind Members that we have spent nearly 28 minutes just on the frontbench questions. That is a bit too long. Luckily, only two other Members want to speak. I ask them to ask their questions quickly, please.

David Melding: This is another Normandy moment for the Welsh Assembly Government. It is not often in political life that you see the complete collapse of a policy, but that is what we have seen this afternoon. Minister, will you apologise to the disabled community for raising their hopes and for stringing them along for three years, saying that you were going to deliver this policy? Will you accept that you initially assessed this policy as costing £18 million? You now think that it will cost as much as

fel llinell ffôn yn dangos anwybodaeth ddychrynlyd o'r datblygiadau mewn teleofal ledled Cymru. Mae'r datblygiadau ym maes teleofal yn gyffrous ac yn ddramatig, a bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth mawr o ran rhoi'r cyfle i bobl aros yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau eu hunain mewn modd na ellid ei ddychmygu cyn bod telefeddygaeth ar gael. Bydd hefyd yn rhoi sicrwydd i ofalwyr. Yn aml, diffyg gwybodaeth am yr hyn sy'n digwydd i'r person y gofelig amdano sy'n rhoi straen ar y gofalwr. Fodd bynnag, bydd telefeddygaeth yn caniatáu iddynt gael gwybodaeth. Bydd hyn yn fantais wirioneddol i ofalwyr a'r rheini sy'n cael gofal. Yr wyf yn synnu eich bod yn diystyru hyn mewn sylw mor ddirmygus.

Bydd yn elfen ychwanegol wirioneddol, yn arbennig mewn perthynas â'r grant gofalwyr, sy'n cael ei gynnwys yn y grant cymorth refeniw. Yr ydym yn pryderu y bydd cynnwys y grant gofalwyr presennol yn y grant cynnal refeniw yn golygu gostyngiad yn yr ymrwymiad i ofalwyr beth bynnag. Felly, sefydlwyd proses fonitro eisoes i sicrhau bod yr enillion a gafwyd drwy'r grant gofalwyr presennol yn parhau. Mae'r wybodaeth sylfaenol a'r broses fonitro honno ar waith ar hyn o bryd. Bydd y £3 miliwn ychwanegol hwn ar ben hynny, a byddwn yn gofyn am yr ychwanegedd hwnnw.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi ddirwyn y datganiad hwn i ben, hoffwn atgoffa'r Aelodau ein bod wedi treulio bron i 28 munud ar gwestiynau i'r meinciau blaen. Mae hyn ychydig yn rhy hir. Yn ffodus, dim ond dau Aelod arall sydd am siarad. Gofynnaf iddynt ofyn eu cwestiynau'n gyflym, os gwelwch yn dda.

David Melding: Mae hon yn sefyllfa drychinebus arall i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Anaml y gwelwch bolisi'n methu'n llwyr yn y byd gwleidyddol, ond dyna a welwyd y prynhawn yma. Weinidog, a ymddiheurwch wrth y gymuned anabl am godi eu gobeithion ac am roi addewidion gwag iddynt am dair blynedd, gan ddweud y byddech yn gweithredu'r polisi hwn? A dderbyniwch eich bod wedi asesu'n wreiddiol y byddai'r polisi hwn yn costio £18 miliwn? Erbyn hyn, credwch y bydd yn

£78 million. How can we ever believe anything that comes out of your department? Perhaps, to be fair to your civil servants, it came out of Transport House again.

Brian Gibbons: Thank you, David. [*Laughter.*] I have already said that we regret that we have not been able to deliver on our initial manifesto commitment, and we apologise for that. However, we are increasing the allocation for this particular segment of the population, and in the context of delivering real, concrete service improvement. I think that it is true that the people of Wales will be disappointed that we have not been able to deliver free personal domiciliary care, but I think that they will be grateful for the extra £75 million that we will give for this particular project, which is 50 per cent above what was originally envisaged. I am sure that they will see the benefit of that and will be grateful to Welsh Labour for delivering for them.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You have reluctantly, and at a late point in this statement, now apologised. In terms of policy, I suggest that you put a health warning on your next manifesto stating clearly on the front page: 'If you believe anything in this manifesto you are seriously deluding yourself and in danger of creating false expectations'. You may smile, Minister, but that is exactly what you have done. You have strung these people along for three years, saying that it is difficult to get a definition of 'disabled'. You know full well, Minister, that there is legal advice that you do not need a definition of 'disabled' in order to deliver this policy.

You are now telling us that you are unable to deliver this policy. Will you assure us this afternoon that you will take this new package to the Health and Social Services Committee, because I can assure you that we will want to scrutinise it carefully.

Brian Gibbons: I am more than willing to do that. I am sure that, once the package is in place across Wales, people will see substantial improvement in the quality of life of some of the most vulnerable people in our communities. I am sure that they will

costio cymaint â £78 miliwn. Sut y gallwn gredu unrhyw beth a ddaw o'ch adran? Efallai, a bod yn deg i'ch gweision sifil, mai o Transport House y daeth hyn eto.

Brian Gibbons: Diolch, David. [*Chwerthin.*] Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud ei bod yn ddrwg gennym na lwyddwyd i weithredu'r ymrwymiad cychwynnol yn ein maniffesto, ac ymddiheurwn am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cynyddu'r dyraniad ar gyfer yr adran benodol hon yn y boblogaeth, ac yng nghyd-destun sicrhau gwelliant gwirioneddol a chadarn i'r gwasanaeth. Credaf ei bod yn wir y bydd pobl Cymru'n siomedig nad ydym wedi gallu darparu gofal cartref personol am ddim. Ond credaf y byddant yn ddiolchgar am y £75 miliwn ychwanegol y byddwn yn ei roi ar gyfer y prosiect penodol hwn, sydd 50 y cant yn fwy nag a ragwelwyd yn wreiddiol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddant yn gweld budd hynny ac yn ddiolchgar i Lafur yng Nghymru am weithredu ar eu rhan.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych wedi ymddiheuro o'ch anfodd a hynny ar ddiwedd y datganiad hwn. O ran polisi, awgrymaf y dylech roi rhybudd iechyd ar eich maniffesto nesaf a nodi'n glir ar y dudalen flaen: 'Os credwch unrhyw beth yn y maniffesto hwn, byddwch yn twyllo'ch hun ac mewn perygl o godi disgwyliadau'n ofer'. Mae'n ddigon hawdd i chi wenu, Weinidog, ond dyna'n union yr ydych wedi'i wneud. Yr ydych wedi camarwain y bobl hyn am dair blynedd, gan ddweud ei bod yn anodd cael diffiniad o 'anabl'. Fe wyddoch yn iawn, Weinidog, fod cyngor cyfreithiol yn dweud nad oes arnoch angen diffiniad o 'anabl' er mwyn gweithredu'r polisi hwn.

Yn awr yr ydych yn dweud wrthym na allwch weithredu'r polisi hwn. A rowch sicrhau inni y prynhawn yma y byddwch yn cyflwyno'r pecyn newydd hwn gerbron y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, oherwydd gallaf eich sicrhau y byddwn am graffu arno'n ofalus.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn fwy na bodlon gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn siŵr, ar ôl i'r pecyn gael ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru, y bydd pobl yn gweld gwelliant sylweddol yn ansawdd bywyd rhai o'r bobl fwyaf diamddiffyn yn ein cymunedau. Yr wyf yn

recognise the massive investment that we as an Assembly Government are putting into this package—£75 million on top of the additional £45 million that we are putting into the budget for adult social services next year. If that is not delivering for people with a disability and care needs in Wales, I do not know what is.

siŵr y byddant yn cydnabod y buddsoddiad anferth yr ydym ni fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud yn y pecyn hwn—£75 miliwn ar ben y £45 miliwn ychwanegol yr ydym yn ei roi yn y gyllideb ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion flwyddyn nesaf. Os nad yw hynny'n darparu ar gyfer pobl ag anabledd ac anghenion gofâl yng Nghymru, ni wn beth sydd.

Datganiad am Gyllid y GIG Statement on NHS Finances

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): It is not my day today.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Nid yw'r ddiwrnod da imi heddiw.

The NHS in Wales has faced a significant financial challenge in 2005-06. It has been asked to maintain important reductions in patient waiting times, to implement the new contracts for pay modernisation, the consultants' contract, and 'Agenda for Change', while also delivering efficiency savings.

Mae'r GIG yng Nghymru wedi wynebu her ariannol sylweddol yn 2005-06. Gofynnwyd iddo barhau â gostyngiadau pwysig mewn amseroedd aros i gleifion, gweithredu'r contractau newydd ar gyfer moderneiddio tâl, y contract meddygon ymgynghorol, a'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', ac ar yr un pryd darparu arbedion effeithlonrwydd.

*Daeth Peter Black i'r Gadair am 3.36 p.m.
Peter Black took the Chair at 3.36 p.m.*

The current financial forecast across Wales is for a net deficit at the year end of approximately £20 million, similar to the position reported at the end of September. This represents 0.5 per cent of the NHS budget allocation.

Y rhagolwg ariannol presennol ledled Cymru yw y bydd diffyg net o tuag £20 miliwn ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn, sefyllfa debyg i'r hyn a nodwyd ddiwedd mis Medi, sef 0.5 y cant o'r gyllideb a ddyrennir i'r GIG.

The financial pressures facing the NHS in Wales have existed for many years. The pressures have been subject to substantial public scrutiny by the Assembly's Audit Committee, and several high-profile publications have covered this area, including the Wanless review, as well as the annual reports produced by the Auditor General for Wales on the finances of NHS Wales.

Mae'r pwysau ariannol sy'n wynebu'r GIG yng Nghymru yn bod ers llawer blwyddyn. Mae'r pwysau wedi eu harchwilio'n gyhoeddus yn sylweddol gan Bwyllgor Archwilio'r Cynulliad, ac mae nifer o gyhoeddiadau amlwg wedi trafod y maes hwn, gan gynnwys adolygiad Wanless, yn ogystal â'r adroddiadau blynyddol a gynhyrchwyd gan Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru ar gyllid GIG Cymru.

The review of health and social care carried out by Derek Wanless identified that the current NHS service configuration in Wales and the funding requirements were unsustainable in the long term. The report clearly identified that there was a need to modernise the NHS to ensure that clinical

Yr oedd yr adolygiad o iechyd a gofâl cymdeithasol gan Derek Wanless yn dweud nad oedd cyfluniad presennol y GIG yng Nghymru a'r gofynion ariannol yn gynaliadwy yn y tymor hir. Dywedai'r adroddiad yn glir fod angen moderneiddio'r GIG er mwyn sicrhau bod gwasanaethau

services and the financial outlook were substantially improved for the benefit of patient care.

Despite the fact that the NHS and social care budget has almost doubled since 1999, to just under £5 billion in 2005-06, NHS organisations continue to report adverse financial pressures, and not all organisations are managing the services within their allocated budgets. There has been significant criticism of the NHS in Wales in the past, due to the perceived deficit culture and financial management problems. There has also been criticism surrounding the inability of some NHS organisations to produce robust financial forecasts.

All organisations are statutorily required to live within their funded resources each and every year. As part of the actions to strengthen financial management across the NHS in Wales, and to remove the deficit culture, measures have been introduced whereby individual organisations that are forecasting that they are unable to achieve this break-even target in any given year must produce strategic change and efficiency plans to return the organisation to financial balance within an agreed period.

These recovery plans, once agreed, are being closely monitored by the regional offices. Any loans granted to an NHS organisation during the period of recovery must be repaid. The First Minister made it clear in October that we would not subsidise those organisations continuing to run up a deficit.

The NHS is facing another challenging year in 2006-07. We all, quite rightly, have great expectations of our health services in Wales. The modernisation of pay, and the new contracts for primary care contractors, will continue to require increased funding. In 2006-07 we have also set aside additional funds—for example, for the dental contract. We have also invested an additional £80 million in reducing waiting times. It is clear across the United Kingdom, as well as in Wales, that public expectations for the health service to pay for new and expensive drugs, to make service improvements, and to reduce

clinigol a'r rhagolwg ariannol yn gwella'n sylweddol er lles gofal cleifion.

Er bod cyllideb y GIG a gofal cymdeithasol wedi dyblu bron er 1999, i ychydig yn llai na £5 biliwn yn 2005-06, mae sefydliadau'r GIG yn parhau i sôn am bwysau ariannol andwyol, ac nid yw pob sefydliad yn rheoli'r gwasanaethau o fewn y cyllidebau a ddyrannwyd iddynt. Bu cryn feirniadaeth o'r GIG yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol, oherwydd y canfyddiad o ddiwylliant diffyg a phroblemau mewn rheolaeth ariannol. Bu beirniadaeth hefyd o anallu rhai o sefydliadau'r GIG i gynhyrchu rhagolygon ariannol cadarn.

Mae'n ofynnol yn statudol i bob sefydliad fyw o fewn yr adnoddau a gaiff bob blwyddyn. Fel rhan o'r camau i gryfhau rheolaeth ariannol ledled y GIG yng Nghymru, ac i ddileu'r diwylliant diffyg, cyflwynwyd mesurau sy'n golygu y bydd yn rhaid i sefydliadau unigol, sy'n rhag-weld na allant gyrraedd y targed hwn i fantoli'r gyllideb yn ystod unrhyw flwyddyn, gynhyrchu cynlluniau strategol ac effeithlonrwydd i sicrhau bod y sefydliad yn mantoli'r gyllideb o fewn cyfnod wedi ei gytuno.

Ar ôl cytuno ar y cynlluniau adfer hyn, cânt eu monitro'n ofalus gan y swyddfeydd rhanbarthol. Rhaid ad-dalu unrhyw fenthyciadau i un o sefydliadau'r GIG yn ystod y cyfnod adfer. Eglurodd y Prif Weinidog ym mis Hydref na fyddem yn rhoi cymhorthdal i'r sefydliadau hynny sy'n parhau i gael ddiffyg ariannol.

Mae'r GIG yn wynebu blwyddyn arall llawn her yn 2006-07. Mae'n briodol inni bob un gael disgwyliadau mawr o'n gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru. Bydd angen mwy o arian i foderneiddio cyflogau ac ar gyfer y contractau newydd i gontractwyr gofal sylfaenol. Yn ystod 2006-07 yr ydym hefyd wedi neilltuo mwy o arian—er enghraifft, ar gyfer y contract deintyddol. Yr ydym hefyd wedi buddsoddi £80 miliwn yn ychwanegol i leihau amseroedd aros. Mae'n amlwg ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, yn ogystal ag yng Nghymru, y bydd disgwyliadau'r cyhoedd i'r gwasanaeth iechyd dalu am gyffuriau

waiting times, will mean that the NHS will be under continuing financial pressure next year.

There is no doubt that some organisations will need to improve their financial management arrangements even further to ensure that they meet their statutory responsibilities. This will continue to be subject to even more stringent monitoring and performance arrangements during the challenging year ahead.

As set out in the 'Designed for Life' strategy, the financial pressures being faced require a more fundamental change in the services in Wales. The implementation of the 'Designed for Life' strategy, and the current reconfiguration plans being developed for each region are therefore fundamental to addressing the clinical and financial problems across Wales. The recovery plans that are currently being developed by a number of NHS bodies need to be more robust and they need to fully reflect these modernisation developments and challenges.

3.40 p.m.

Helen Mary Jones: As the Minister has already acknowledged, it really is not his afternoon, is it? In his statement today, he outlined the position, which is fair enough, but he has appeared to seek to pretend that it is almost nothing to do with him. Given that he appoints the boards of the trusts, sets the guidelines to which they work, and sets their budgets, I begin by asking him to accept that this is fundamentally his responsibility. He appoints these people, and if there are management inefficiencies, he needs to sort them out. I have never quite understood this concept of debt from one public body to another. As far as I can see, these are services that are being provided in communities that need them, which brings me on to my second point about what analysis the Minister has made, looking at the debts of some of the NHS trusts, with regard to the failure to implement Townsend in full. Would these ongoing debts be being run up by all these trusts if the formula was being implemented thoroughly?

newydd a chostus, i wneud gwelliannau gwasanaeth, ac i leihau amseroedd aros yn golygu y bydd y GIG o dan bwysau ariannol parhaus flwyddyn nesaf.

Heb os, bydd angen i rai sefydliadau wella'u trefniadau rheolaeth ariannol ymhellach fyth i sicrhau cyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau statudol. Bydd hyn yn parhau i gael ei fonitro drwy drefniadau monitro a pherfformiad llymach byth yn ystod y flwyddyn heriol o'n blaen.

Fel sydd wedi ei osodo allan yn y strategaeth 'Cynllun Oes', mae angen newid mwy sylfaenol yn y gwasanaethau yng Nghymru oherwydd y pwysau ariannol a wynebwn. Felly, mae gweithredu'r strategaeth 'Cynllun Oes', a'r cynlluniau ail-gyflunio sy'n cael eu datblygu ar gyfer pob rhanbarth, yn gam sylfaenol i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau clinigol ac ariannol ledled Cymru. Mae angen i'r cynlluniau adfer sy'n cael eu datblygu gan nifer o gyrff y GIG ar hyn o bryd fod yn fwy cadarn, a rhaid iddynt adlewyrchu'r datblygiadau a'r heriau moderneiddio hyn.

Helen Mary Jones: Fel y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi ei gydnabod, nid yw'n cael prynhawn da, nac ydyw? Yn ei ddatganiad heddiw, amlinellodd y sefyllfa, sy'n ddigon teg, ond ymddengys ei fod yn ceisio esgus nad oes a wnelo'r mater bron ddim ag ef. O gofio mai ef sy'n penodi byrddau'r ymddiriedolaethau, yn gosod allan y canllawiau y maent yn eu dilyn, ac yn pennu eu cyllidebau, hoffwn ddechrau drwy ofyn iddo dderbyn mai ei gyfrifoldeb ef yw hyn yn y bôn. Ef sy'n penodi'r bobl hyn, ac os oes aneffeithlonrwydd rheoli, mae angen iddo fynd i'r afael â hwy. Nid wyf erioed wedi deall yn iawn y cysyniad o ddyled rhwng cyrff cyhoeddus. Hyd y gwelaf, gwasanaethau yw'r rhain sy'n cael eu darparu yn y cymunedau lle mae eu hangen, sy'n dod â mi at fy ail bwynt ynghylch dadansoddiad y Gweinidog, o gofio dyledion rhai o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, mewn perthynas â methu gweithredu Townsend yn llawn. A fyddai'r holl ymddiriedolaethau hyn yn wynebu dyledion parhaus pe bai'r fformiwla'n cael ei gweithredu'n drylwyr?

I refer the Minister to the effects of capital charging. I realise that this is a non-devolved matter, and the Government seems to be divided at the moment as to whether it comments on non-devolved matters or not. However, I ask the Minister to accept the good example of those of his colleagues who will comment on non-devolved matters when they have huge effects on us here in Wales, and I refer him to capital charging. Has he undertaken any measurement of the effects of capital charging on trusts' debts? He will recall that he refused to answer a question placed to him last June by Rhodri Glyn Thomas about the effects of capital charging on each NHS trust, because he said that it would be a disproportionate cost to make that assessment. If he is not prepared to tell us, I very much hope that he would know. If he has not made an assessment of the effect on the NHS of this Conservative tax, which the Labour Party is continuing, will he make that assessment, gather the evidence and make strong representations to the Treasury to end this burden, which not only has an effect—we cannot know this, because we do not have the information, but trusts tell us that it is the case—on the level of debt and deficit, but is also a disincentive to future investment?

I will finish by asking the Minister to take responsibility for this; it cannot be allowed to continue. Will the Minister acknowledge that this is having an effect on services? We know that some trusts are leaving posts vacant for example and not filling them. These deficits are not just on paper; they are having an effect on services in our communities. Thank you, Minister, for your explanation today, but will you take some strong action to end this anomaly, and will you look, in particular, at the effects of capital charges?

Brian Gibbons: There is no doubt that we, as an administration, must take responsibility for the operation of the health service in Wales. One of the first statements that I made as Minister was that we would not tolerate the culture of failure, and of funding and

Tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at effeithiau codi tâl cyfalaf. Sylweddolaf nad yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, ac ymddengys fod y Llywodraeth yn rhanedig ar y funud ynghylch a yw'n rhoi sylwadau ar faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli ai peidio. Fodd bynnag, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog dderbyn esiampl dda ei gyd-Aelodau a fydd yn rhoi sylwadau ar faterion nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli pan fyddant yn effeithio'n fawr arnom ni yma yng Nghymru, a thynnaf ei sylw at godi tâl cyfalaf. A yw wedi gwneud unrhyw fesuriadau o effeithiau codi tâl cyfalaf ar ddyledion ymddiriedolaethau? Bydd yn cofio iddo wrthod ateb cwestiwn a ofynnwyd iddo fis Gorffennaf diwethaf gan Rhodri Glyn Thomas am effeithiau codi tâl cyfalaf ar bob un o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, oherwydd iddo ddweud y byddai gwneud yr asesiad hwnnw'n anghyfartal o gostus. Os nad yw'n barod i ddweud wrthym, gobeithio'n wir ei fod yn gwybod. Os nad yw wedi asesu effaith y dreth Geidwadol hon ar y GIG, sy'n cael ei pharhau gan y Blaid Lafur, a wnaiff yr asesiad hwnnw, casglu'r dystiolaeth a phwyso ar y Trysorlys i ddileu'r baich hwn, sydd nid yn unig yn cael effaith—ni allwn wybod hyn, oherwydd nid yw'r wybodaeth gennym, ond mae ymddiriedolaethau'n dweud wrthym mai felly y mae—ar lefel dyled a diffyg, ond sydd hefyd yn wrthanogaeth i fuddsoddi yn y dyfodol?

I gloi, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gymryd y cyfrifoldeb am hyn; ni ellir gadael i'r sefyllfa barhau. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gydnabod bod hyn yn effeithio ar wasanaethau? Gwyddom fod rhai ymddiriedolaethau'n gadael swyddi'n wag, er enghraifft, heb eu llenwi. Nid diffygion ar bapur yn unig yw'r rhain; maent yn effeithio ar wasanaethau yn ein cymunedau. Diolch, Weinidog, am eich esboniad heddiw, ond a fyddwch yn cymryd camau cadarn i ddatrys yr anghysondeb hwn, ac a edrychwch, yn benodol, ar effeithiau codi tâl cyfalaf?

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes raid inni, fel gweinyddiaeth, gymryd y cyfrifoldeb am weithredu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Un o'r datganiadau cyntaf a wneuthum fel Gweinidog oedd na fyddem yn goddef diwylliant o fethu, ac o

rewarding debt and poor performance management. That is why organisations that are not displaying good management skills and good custodianship of resources should not in any way be bailed out of the situation, as some seem to be suggesting. The question has been asked as to whether Townsend makes any difference to this. There certainly is an arguable case in one or two areas where the level of funding going into that health community may be less than what it requires, and the Townsend allocation has outlined that. However, many of the organisations that are most consistently in debt are those that are getting above-Townsend allocations. Therefore, this particular issue cannot be blamed on systemic underfunding à la Townsend—it is about the way in which those organisations are managing themselves.

Through our regional offices, we are implementing a much stricter performance management regime, and where individual organisations, with assistance, do not seem to be capable of managing their own financial pressures, then, where necessary, the delivery and support unit will assist. Therefore, we are taking an active approach to this to ensure that these organisations get their house in order. It would be entirely inappropriate for the answer to this to be, instead of urging these organisations to deal with their internal financial management, to suggest that additional resources should be given to them—certainly above their Townsend allocation.

In terms of capital charges, one of the key ways of monitoring their effect on the health service is through the presentation of a business case for individual projects. This is very much part of the assessment process that takes place when individual projects are submitted. From looking at the business cases as they are submitted, we know that a wide number of projects and a large number of organisations are able to use the capital funding to engineer change and, consequently, to deliver a more efficient and effective service. However, in looking at some of the business cases, there are clearly situations in which the capital charges are an obstacle, and we are working specifically with those organisations to find ways

ariannu a gwobrwyo dyled a rheoli perfformiad gwael. Dyna pam na ddyldid achub croen sefydliadau nad ydynt yn dangos sgiliau rheoli da a gofalu am adnoddau'n dda, fel y mae rhai'n awgrymu mae'n ymddangos. Gofynnwyd y cwestiwn a yw Townsend yn gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i hyn. Yn bendant, gellir dadlau bod hynny'n digwydd mewn un neu ddwy o ardaloedd lle gall lefel yr arian sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi yn y gymuned iechyd honno fod yn llai na'r hyn sydd ei angen, ac mae dyraniad Townsend wedi amlinellu hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o'r sefydliadau hynny sydd mewn dyled yn fwyaf cyson yn sefydliadau sy'n cael mwy na dyraniadau Townsend. Felly, ni ellir beio'r broblem benodol hon ar danariannu systematig yn null Townsend-mae'n ymwneud â'r modd y mae'r sefydliadau hynny'n rheoli eu hunain.

Drwy ein swyddfeydd rhanbarthol, yr ydym yn gweithredu cyfundrefn rheoli perfformiad lawer llymach a lle mae'n ymddangos nad yw sefydliadau unigol, gyda chymorth, yn gallu rheoli eu pwysau ariannol eu hunain, bydd yr uned cyflawni a chymorth yn helpu. Felly, mae gennym ymagwedd weithredol tuag at hyn i sicrhau bod y sefydliadau hyn yn rhoi trefn ar bethau. Byddai'n gwbl amhriodol datrys hyn drwy awgrymu y dylid rhoi adnoddau ychwanegol i'r sefydliadau hyn—yn uwch na'u dyraniad Townsend yn bendant—yn hytrach na'u hannog i fynd i'r afael â'u prosesau rheoli ariannol mewnol.

O ran taliadau cyfalaf, un ffordd allweddol i fonitro eu heffaith ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yw drwy gyflwyno achos busnes ar gyfer prosiectau unigol. Mae hyn yn rhan annatod o'r broses asesu sy'n digwydd pan gyflwynir prosiectau unigol. O edrych ar yr achosion busnes wrth iddynt gael eu cyflwyno, gwyddom y gall nifer fawr o brosiectau a nifer fawr o sefydliadau ddefnyddio'r arian cyfalaf i greu newid, ac o ganlyniad i ddarparu gwasanaeth mwy effeithlon ac effeithiol. Fodd bynnag, o edrych ar rai o'r achosion busnes, mae'n amlwg bod yna sefyllfaoedd lle mae'r taliadau cyfalaf yn rhwystr, ac yr ydym yn gweithio'n benodol gyda'r sefydliadau hynny i ddod o hyd i ffyrdd o oresgyn hynny. Os bydd pobl yn

through. If people look at the budget, they will see reference to capital charges systems in the budget lines of health and social care, which was approved by the Assembly before Christmas.

However, I do not want to send out a message that capital charge assistance is a free good, because one of the things that Wanless has told us is that the way that services are configured in Wales at the moment is unsustainable. They are inefficient in clinical and financial terms. Implementing the Wanless agenda and the 'Agenda for Change' is the key mechanism for those organisations to deliver better clinical care for patients and better financial management.

Jonathan Morgan: First, I thank you for the statement. You have said that the NHS in Wales has faced a significant financial challenge in 2005-06. I put it to you that that is not the first financial year within which the NHS in Wales has faced significant challenges. The people who commission services from local health boards will tell you that they have faced challenges before this particular financial year, and I am sure that the people who run the finances of NHS trusts will tell you that this particular year is not the only year in which those challenges have been faced.

Some people who work for these organisations believe that you have not fully costed many of the programmes that the Government has brought in, particularly the new contracts, the pay modernisation, the consultants' contract, 'Agenda for Change', and, of course, the general medical services contract. Some people, particularly within the nursing profession, believe that the 'Agenda for Change' programme is facing a shortfall of some £24 million. Can you confirm whether there is a shortfall and whether that shortfall matches that figure of £24 million?

The auditor general, in March 2005, in his executive summary, when looking at the balances for the NHS in 2004-05, said that the total net debtor balances across all NHS bodies was approximately £190 million. That is a figure that Jeremy Colman has come up

edrych ar y gyllideb, fe welant gyfeiriad at systemau taliadau cyfalaf yn y llinellau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yn y gyllideb, a gafodd ei gymeradwyo gan y Cynulliad cyn y Nadolig.

Fodd bynnag, nid wyf am gyfleu'r neges fod cymorth taliadau cyfalaf i'w gael am ddim, oherwydd un o'r pethau y mae Wanless wedi ei ddweud wrthym yw bod y ffordd y caiff gwasanaethau eu cyflunio yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd yn anghynaliadwy. Maent yn aneffeithlon yn glinigol ac yn ariannol. Gweithredu agenda Wanless a'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yw'r dull allweddol i'r sefydliadau hynny ddarparu gwell gofal clinigol i gleifion a gwell prosesau rheoli ariannol.

Jonathan Morgan: Yn gyntaf, diolch ichi am y datganiad. Yr oeddech yn dweud bod y GIG yng Nghymru wedi wynebu her ariannol sylweddol yn 2005-06. Awgrymaf ichi nad honno yw'r flwyddyn ariannol gyntaf i'r GIG yng Nghymru wynebu heriau sylweddol. Bydd y bobl sy'n comisiynu gwasanaethau gan fyrdau iechyd lleol yn dweud wrthyh eu bod wedi wynebu heriau cyn y flwyddyn ariannol benodol hon, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am gyllid ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn dweud wrthyh nad y flwyddyn benodol hon yw'r unig flwyddyn i'r heriau hynny gael eu hwynebu.

Cred rhai pobl sy'n gweithio dros y sefydliadau hyn eich bod heb gostio'n llawn lawer o'r rhaglenni y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu cyflwyno, yn arbennig y contractau newydd, moderneiddio cyflogau, y contract meddygon ymgynghorol, 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' ac, wrth gwrs, y contract gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol. Cred rhai pobl, yn arbennig yn y proffesiwn nyrsio, fod y rhaglen 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn wynebu diffyg o ryw £24 miliwn. A allwch gadarnhau a oes diffyg, ac a yw'r diffyg yn cyfateb i'r ffigur hwnnw o £24 miliwn?

Dywedodd yr archwilydd cyffredinol, ym mis Mawrth 2005, yn ei grynodeb gweithredol wrth edrych ar y balansau ar gyfer y GIG yn 2004-05, fod cyfanswm y balansau dyledwyr net ar draws holl gyrff y GIG tua £190 miliwn. Dyna'r ffigur mae Jeremy Colman

with. Would you like to comment on it? Perhaps you can explain how that figure was reached and whether or not the Government accepts that there is a net debtor balance across the whole of the NHS—I presume that that would include bodies such as Health Commission Wales—of £190 million. It is in his report, which was published in March 2005.

When you look at the figures, particularly the figures from 2003-04 and 2004-05, there has been a significant increase in the cumulative deficit of NHS trusts. The cumulative deficit in 2003-04 was just short of £43 million, and, during 2004-05, that rose to just over £51 million—roughly, a £10 million increase in the cumulative deficits of NHS trusts. Cardiff and the Vale NHS Trust was up by over £2 million, and Carmarthenshire NHS Trust was up by over £4 million. However, it was not just the trusts. You need to explain why the trusts are struggling to manage their budgets in the light of the additional pressures that they face.

3.50 p.m.

The trusts do not face the pressures on their own as they are also being faced by local health boards. Cardiff LHB strategic change and efficiency plan funding, which is, presumably, the loan that you use to bail them out, required £4 million more in 2004-05 than during 2003-04. Similarly, the Vale of Glamorgan LHB required a loan of some £3.8 million in 2004-05 compared with £2.66 million in the previous financial year. Can you explain why local health boards continue to struggle with their finances? What is it about the agenda that you, as a Government, are setting that is causing financial constraint to the extent that LHBs have required more Government loans in each financial year, since they were introduced in 2003-04 to bail out struggling LHBs?

Do you accept the criticism levelled by people working in the NHS Confederation

wedi ei gynnig. A hoffech roi sylwadau arno? Efallai y gallwch esbonio sut y lluniwyd y ffigur hwnnw ac a yw'r Llywodraeth yn derbyn bod yna falans dyledwyr net o £190 miliwn yn y GIG yn gyfan—cymeraf y byddai hynny'n cynnwys cyrff megis Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru. Mae hyn yn ei adroddiad, a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Mawrth 2005.

Pan edrychwch ar y ffigurau, yn arbennig y ffigurau o 2003-04 a 2004-05, cafwyd cynnydd sylweddol yn niffyg cronol ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG. Yr oedd y diffyg cronol yn 2003-04 ychydig yn llai na £43 miliwn, ac yn ystod 2004-05 cododd y ffigur hwnnw i ychydig dros £51 miliwn—yn fras, cynnydd o £10 miliwn yn niffygion cronol ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG. Yr oedd cynnydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro dros £2 filiwn, a chynnydd Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Gaerfyrddin dros £4 miliwn. Fodd bynnag, nid yn yr ymddiriedolaethau'n unig yr oedd hyn. Mae angen ichi esbonio pam y mae'r ymddiriedolaethau'n cael anhawster i reoli eu cyllidebau yng ngoleuni'r pwysau ychwanegol a wynebant.

Nid yw'r ymddiriedolaethau'n wynebu'r pwysau ar eu pen eu hunain, gan fod byrddau iechyd lleol hefyd yn eu hwynebu. Yr oedd angen i gynllun newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd BILl Caerdydd gael £4 miliwn yn fwy yn 2004-05 nag yn 2003-04 sef y benthyciad a ddefnyddiwyd, mae'n debyg, i achub eu croen. Yn yr un modd, yr oedd angen i BILl Bro Morgannwg gael benthyciad o ryw £3.8 miliwn yn 2004-05 o'i gymharu â £2.66 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol flaenorol. A allwch esbonio pam mae byrddau iechyd lleol yn parhau i gael trafferthion ariannol? Beth sydd yn yr agenda yr ydych chi, fel Llywodraeth, yn ei gosod sy'n achosi cyfyngiadau ariannol i'r graddau bod BILlau wedi gorfod cael mwy o fenthyciadau gan y Llywodraeth ym mhob blwyddyn ariannol ers eu cyflwyno yn 2003-04, er mwyn achub croen BILlau sydd mewn trafferthion?

A ydych yn derbyn y feirniadaeth a fynegwyd gan bobl sy'n gweithio yng

and in the LHBs and trusts, that you are putting responsibilities on LHBs and trusts, but that adequate finance to cover those responsibilities is not being made available? The sole concern of these professionals is that they are unable to deliver the agenda that you and your colleagues have set because the finances are not there to match the targets and the changes that the Government has introduced.

Brian Gibbons: I will deal with the last point first. Wanless looked at this and said that the fundamental reason for the financial pressures on and the unsustainability of the NHS in Wales was not the one that you outlined about a lack of finance for increased responsibilities. He said that the underlying problem was that those organisations were inappropriately configured for the challenges of the next decade. That is the key message that Wanless gave us and, because it attracts consensus in the Assembly, that is why 'Designed for Life' is the fundamentally important way of addressing this.

In many instances, one has to ask a number of the organisations that are still showing the greatest level of debt how they are addressing the challenges in the Wanless report and 'Designed for Life'. If they can answer honestly that they are delivering the Wanless and 'Designed for Life' agendas and if they can demonstrate that their performance management in terms of daycase waiting, cancelled operations and other elements is up to the best in Wales, then they have a legitimate case for saying that they are not getting the resources or the tools to deliver. However, many of the organisations that are most severely in debt are not able to demonstrate that they are implementing best practice, either in terms of benchmarking performance or engaging constructively with the Wanless agenda.

There is no doubt that contractual changes and workforce modernisation have put a massive pressure on the health service, but, over the last three years, we have given something in the order of £1 billion to the service in Wales to deliver the new contractual change. This is clear evidence of

Nghydfederasiwn y GIG ac yn y BILlau a'r ymddiriedolaethau eich bod yn gosod cyfrifoldebau ar BILlau ac ymddiriedolaethau, ond heb sicrhau bod arian digonol ar gael i gynnwys y cyfrifoldebau hynny? Unig bryder y gweithwyr proffesiynol hyn yw na allant gyflawni'r agenda a bennwyd gennych chi a'ch cyd-Aelodau, am nad yw'r arian yno i gyd-fynd â'r targedau a'r newidiadau y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi eu gosod.

Brian Gibbons: Deliaf â'r pwynt olaf yn gyntaf. Edrychodd Wanless ar hyn a dweud nad y rheswm a amlinellwyd gennych ynglŷn â diffyg arian ar gyfer mwy o gyfrifoldebau oedd y rheswm sylfaenol dros y pwysau ariannol ar y GIG yng Nghymru a'i anghynaliadwyedd. Dywedodd mai'r broblem sylfaenol oedd bod y sefydliadau hynny wedi eu cyflunio'n amhriodol ar gyfer heriau'r degawd nesaf. Dyna'r neges allweddol a roddodd Wanless inni, ac oherwydd bod hyn yn arwain at gonsensws yn y Cynulliad, dyna pam mai 'Cynllun Oes' yw'r ffordd bwysig sylfaenol i fynd i'r afael â hyn.

Mewn llawer achos, rhaid gofyn i nifer o'r sefydliadau sy'n dal i ddangos y lefel uchaf o ddyled sut y maent yn mynd i'r afael â'r heriau yn adroddiad Wanless a 'Cynllun Oes'. Os gallant ateb yn onest eu bod yn darparu agendâu Wanless a 'Cynllun Oes', ac os gallant ddangos bod eu rheoli perfformiad o ran amseroedd aros cleifion dydd, llawdriniaethau sy'n cael eu canslo ac elfennau eraill cystal â'r gorau yng Nghymru, yna mae ganddynt achos dilys dros ddweud nad ydynt yn cael yr adnoddau a'r offer i gyflawni hyn. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o'r sefydliadau sydd â'r ddyled fwyaf yn methu dangos eu bod yn gweithredu arfer gorau, naill ai o ran meincnodi perfformiad neu ymgysylltu'n adeiladol ag agenda Wanless.

Mae newidiadau cytundebol a moderneiddio'r gweithlu yn ddiau wedi rhoi pwysau aruthrol ar y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond yn ystod y tair blynedd diwethaf yr ydym wedi rhoi oddeutu £1 biliwn i'r gwasanaeth yng Nghymru i sicrhau'r newid cytundebol newydd. Mae hyn yn dystiolaeth glir o

a commitment by us, the Assembly Government, not to ask the service to implement change without further financial support. That £1 billion is clear evidence of our commitment. I recognise the figure of £24 million under 'Agenda for Change', although I think that it is very difficult to work out where it comes from, and I suspect that it is just an extrapolation from some of the figures that Patricia Hewitt gave for England. The extent of assimilation into 'Agenda for Change' in Wales does not allow us to make the type of precise prediction that Jonathan is asking for. Therefore, the figure of £24 million, at this stage, must be purely a figure of conjecture. It may be right, but it could equally be wrong. As I said, it is almost certainly derived from the figure that Patricia Hewitt gave for England.

I have to admit that I do not recognise the figure of £190 million. In view of the fact—

Jonathan Morgan: I told you the source of that amount.

Brian Gibbons: Yes, I know that you told me the source. I will take that away and have a further look at what the auditor general is saying. However, that is not a figure that I recognise, and I wonder what the components of the calculation are.

Jenny Randerson: It really is a case of a good day to release bad news, is it not, Minister? If you have to do something awful, such as make the previous statement—which was really bad news—it is a good day to cover up another piece of bad news: the announcement of the deficits, which would normally have received a great deal of publicity in their own right.

I greatly regret that the statement lacks detail. It has many general must-do-better comments for local health boards and trusts, but it lacks the detail on where the deficits have been built up. The devil is in the detail, which is the key to knowing what has gone wrong. You have a simplistic approach in saying that all areas that are not working within their

ymrwymiad gennym ni, Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, i beidio â gofyn i'r gwasanaeth weithredu newid heb gymorth ariannol pellach. Mae'r £1 biliwn hwnnw yn dystiolaeth glir o'n hymrwymiad. Cydnabyddaf y ffigur o £24 miliwn o dan 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' er fy mod yn credu ei bod yn anodd iawn gweithio allan o ble y daw. Yr wyf yn amau mai wedi ei gymryd y mae o rai o'r ffigurau a roddodd Patricia Hewitt ar gyfer Lloegr. Nid yw graddau'r cymathiad i 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yng Nghymru yn ein galluogi i wneud y math o ragfynegiad manwl gywir y mae Jonathan yn gofyn amdano. Felly, rhaid i'r ffigur o £24 miliwn, ar hyn o bryd, fod yn ffigur damcaniaethol yn unig. Hwyrach ei fod yn gywir, ond yn yr un modd gallai fod yn anghywir. Fel y dywedais, mae bron yn sicr yn tarddu o'r ffigur a roddodd Patricia Hewitt ar gyfer Lloegr.

Rhaid imi gyfaddef nad wyf yn cydnabod y ffigur o £190 miliwn. Yng ngoleuni'r ffaith fod—

Jonathan Morgan: Dywedais wrthyf o ble y daeth y swm hwnnw.

Brian Gibbons: Do, gwn ichi ddweud wrthyf o ble y daeth. Byddaf yn ystyried hynny ac yn edrych eto ar yr hyn y mae'r archwilydd cyffredinol yn ei ddweud. Fodd bynnag, nid yw hwnnw'n ffigur yr wyf yn ei gydnabod, a thybed beth oedd yr elfennau wrth ei lunio.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'n wir yn ddiwrnod da i roi newyddion drwg, onid ydyw, Weinidog? Os oes rhaid ichi wneud rhywbeth ofnadwy, fel gwneud y datganiad blaenorol—a oedd yn newyddion drwg iawn—mae'n ddiwrnod da i guddio darn arall o newyddion drwg: cyhoeddi'r diffygion, a fyddai fel arfer wedi cael llawer iawn o gyhoeddusrwydd ynddynt eu hunain.

Yr wyf yn gresynu'n fawr nad yw'r datganiad yn cynnwys llawer o fanylion. Mae'n cynnwys nifer o sylwadau cyffredinol ar gyfer byrddau iechyd lleol ac ymddiriedolaethau ei bod yn rhaid gwneud yn well. Ond nid yw'n cynnwys y manylion am y manau lle mae'r diffygion wedi crynhoi. Rhaid edrych yn fanwl ar y

funding are inefficient. There are serious issues with regard to the way that Townsend has been worked out to date. Given the number of areas that still have to work towards their Townsend targets, there are serious issues because the constraints on the budget for the NHS this year and next year will mean that that progress will not be made. I asked the First Minister about this yesterday, and he seemed not to be aware of the issue of making progress towards Townsend targets. He seemed to think that those had already been achieved. However, you and I know that many areas are still working towards the targets.

Looking at the deficits for last year, you will see a clear correlation in most cases between those LHBs that had to go for strategic change and efficiency plan funding—effectively borrow from you—and the trusts that found themselves falling further into deficit. Therefore, it is unlikely, is it not, that both the LHBs and the trusts would be badly managed? Minister, have you considered the issue of the management of specific trusts and LHBs and looked at whether they are, in practice, badly managed or whether they are under-resourced? Do you have any intention of introducing special measures for trusts or LHBs that you say are consistently not doing well?

manyllion, sy'n allweddol i wybod beth sydd wedi mynd o'i le. Mae gennych ymagwedd syml wrth ddweud bod pob ardal nad yw'n gweithio o fewn yr arian sydd ganddi yn aneffeithlon. Mae yna broblemau difrifol yn y ffordd y cyfrifwyd Townsend hyd yma. O gofio nifer yr ardaloedd sy'n dal heb weithio at eu targedau Townsend, mae yna broblemau difrifol oherwydd bydd y cyfyngiadau ar y gyllideb ar gyfer y GIG eleni a'r flwyddyn nesaf yn golygu na fydd y cynnydd hwnnw'n digwydd. Holais y Prif Weinidog ynglŷn â hyn ddoe, ac nid oedd yn ymddangos yn ymwybodol o'r broblem o wneud cynnydd tuag at dargedau Townsend. Yr oedd fel pe bae'n credu bod y rheini eisoes wedi eu cyflawni. Fodd bynnag, fe wyddoch chi a minnau fod llawer ardal yn dal i weithio tuag at y targedau.

O edrych ar y diffygion am y llynedd, fe welwch gydberthynas glir yn y rhan fwyaf o achosion rhwng y BILlau hynny y bu'n rhaid iddynt gael arian ar gyfer cynllun newid strategol ac effeithlonrwydd-benthyca gennych chi i bob diben-a'r ymddiriedolaethau a oedd yn wynebu mwy o ddiffyg. Felly, mae'n annhebygol, onid ydyw, y byddai'r BILlau a'r ymddiriedolaethau yn cael eu rheoli'n wael? Weinidog, a ydych wedi ystyried mater rheoli ymddiriedolaethau a BILlau penodol ac wedi edrych ar y cwestiwn a ydynt, mewn gwirionedd, yn cael eu rheoli'n wael neu a oes ganddynt ddiffyg adnoddau? A oes gennych unrhyw fwriad i gyflwyno mesurau arbennig ar gyfer ymddiriedolaethau neu BILlau y dywedwch eu bod yn gyson yn methu perfformio'n dda?

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.58 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.58 p.m.*

You need to look at the history of particular areas. Taking the area of Cardiff, we moved from a health authority that was wildly in deficit to an LHB that inherited the deficit and the debt. That LHB has had trouble living within its means and has a trust that does not live within its means. I do not believe that the previous health authority, the LHB and the trust are all badly managed. I think that the system does not take proper account of the specific health needs of Cardiff. I would welcome your comments on

Mae angen ichi edrych ar hanes ardaloedd penodol. Os cymerwch ardal Caerdydd, symudwyd o awdurdod iechyd a oedd yn wynebu diffyg aruthrol i BILl a etifeddodd y diffyg a'r ddyled. Mae'r BILl hwnnw wedi cael trafferth i wario o fewn ei gyllideb, ac mae ganddo ymddiriedolaeth sy'n gwario mwy nag sydd ganddi. Nid wyf yn credu bod yr awdurdod iechyd blaenorol, y BILl a'r ymddiriedolaeth i gyd yn cael eu rheoli'n wael. Credaf nad yw'r system yn ystyried anghenion iechyd penodol Caerdydd yn

how rapidly we are going to move towards taking into account the latest index of multiple deprivation, which goes down to a lower level in looking at deprivation, health needs and so on in smaller population sizes. It recognises the specific issues in Cardiff and many other areas. Will that be taken into account in future in looking at the Townsend formula?

4.00 p.m.

Structures alone will not work. When are you going to recognise that to make LHBs and trusts more effective where they lack capability, you need to take a strong lead in terms of the Wanless agenda? It is not possible for LHBs, given the size of the areas in which they operate, to develop the Wanless agenda as little islands on their own. Leadership is needed from the top, Minister, to develop that agenda.

Brian Gibbons: I am speaking now in response to a request from opposition parties that I should make statements. The fact that I am here, making these statements has nothing to do with me; it was you who asked me to make them. That is precisely what I have done, so it is taking conspiracy theory to the nth degree of absurdity to suggest otherwise.

I did not say that every organisation in the NHS in Wales that is in debt is inefficient. In fact, I thought that I went out of my way to clarify precisely the circumstances in which individual organisations, if they can demonstrate that they are working to the Wanless agenda, if they are able to demonstrate that they are achieving best practice in terms of their balanced scorecard against a wide range of other benchmarking performance measures, and if they are still in financial deficit, would have a reasonable case to argue that they are being underfunded. When we look at the individual organisations in terms of their financial position, in fairness, we would have to say that, in almost all instances, there is significant room for financial improvement and greater efficiencies in service delivery and so on. That does not apply to all organisations; I recognise that there are one or two organisations for which the Townsend

briodol. Byddwn yn croesawu eich sylwadau ar ein cyflymdra wrth symud tuag at ystyried y mynegai amddifadedd lluosog diweddaraf, sy'n mynd i lefel is wrth edrych ar amddifadedd, anghenion iechyd ac ati mewn poblogaethau llai o faint. Mae'n cydnabod y problemau penodol yng Nghaerdydd a llawer ardal arall. A roddir ystyriaeth i hynny yn y dyfodol wrth edrych ar fformiwla Townsend?

Ni fydd beirniadu'n unig yn gweithio. Pryd y byddwch yn cydnabod, er mwyn gwneud BILlau ac ymddiriedolaethau yn fwy effeithiol, pan nad yw'r adnoddau ganddynt, fod angen ichi roi arweiniad cryf o ran agenda Wanless? Nid yw'n bosibl i BILlau, o ystyried maint yr ardaloedd lle maent yn gweithredu, ddatblygu agenda Wanless fel ynysoedd bach ar eu pen eu hunain. Mae angen arweiniad o'r brig, Weinidog, i ddatblygu'r agenda honno.

Brian Gibbons: Yr wyf yn siarad yn awr i ymateb i gais gan y gwrthbleidiau y dylwn gwneud datganiadau. Nid yw'r ffaith fy mod yma, yn gwneud y datganiadau hyn, yn ddim oll i'w gwneud â mi; chi a ofynnodd imi eu gwneud. Dyna'n union yr wyf wedi ei gwneud, felly, mae y tu hwnt i bob rheswm i awgrymu i'r gwrthwyneb.

Ni ddywedais fod pob sefydliad yn y GIG yng Nghymru sydd mewn dyled yn aneffeithlon. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oeddwn yn meddwl fy mod wedi ymdrechu'n galed i geisio egluro'r union amgylchiadau pan fyddai gan sefydliadau unigol, os gallant ddangos eu bod yn gweithio yn ôl agenda Wanless, os gallant ddangos eu bod yn sicrhau arfer gorau o ran eu cerdyn sgorio cytbwys yn erbyn amrywiaeth eang o fesurau perfformiad meincnodi eraill, ac os ydynt yn dal mewn dyled ariannol, achos rhesymol dros ddadlau eu bod yn cael eu tanariannu. Wrth inni edrych ar y sefydliadau unigol o ran eu sefyllfa ariannol, a bod yn deg, byddai'n rhaid inni ddweud bod lle sylweddol i sicrhau gwelliannau ariannol a gwell effeithlonrwydd wrth ddarparu gwasanaeth ac yn y blaen, bron ym mhob achos. Nid yw hynny'n wir am bob sefydliad; yr wyf yn cydnabod bod un neu ddau sefydliad lle mae elfen Townsend yn ffactor,

element is a factor, but we can only come to the Townsend factor once we know that all these organisations are performing to standard. Until they are performing to standard, it is not reasonable that we should be asked to provide extra finance.

I do not want to make Cardiff a special case any more than any other, but in the context of the Townsend allocation, Cardiff is pretty smack on. It may be 1 to 3 per cent either side, but to say that the problems in Cardiff are likely to be related to Townsend is not factually true, because Cardiff is not one of those health communities that is wide of the Townsend allocation.

You spoke of the index of multiple deprivation and its impact on resource allocation in the health service, but the whole point of the Townsend allocation is the direct needs formula, which is a completely different mechanism for allocating resources. Professor Townsend pointed out that indices such as that for multiple deprivation are indirect measures of need, and he argued, in his report, that using the direct needs formula is a more accurate way of measuring healthcare need and, therefore, a better basis for resource allocation. Clearly, we are working through, with the special group that we established following Peter Townsend's latest report, the implications of what that expert group is feeding back to us in terms of how the direct needs formula is working since the most recent Wales health survey, which covered some 30,000 people.

Finally, it is true that size does affect the organisations' capacity to commission services, and this is why we have cardiac networks and cancer networks, and it is also why we are moving towards commissioning networks for child and adolescent mental health services. We recognise the fact that there are some instances in which size is a factor with regard to commissioning, and we are trying to put in place the commissioning structure to address that. Equally, however, coterminosity between local health boards and local authorities is crucial, and that is one of the key messages of the Wanless review.

ond dim ond pan wyddom fod pob un o'r sefydliadau hyn yn cyrraedd y safon y gallwn ystyried ffactor Townsend. Nes iddynt gyrraedd y safon, nid yw'n rhesymol y dylai fod angen inni ddarparu cyllid ychwanegol.

Nid yw'n fwriad gennyf wneud Caerdydd yn achos arbennig yn fwy nag unman arall, ond yng nghyd-destun dyraniad Townsend, mae Caerdydd yn lled agos at y marc. Efallai ei bod 1 i 3 y cant y naill ochr, ond nid yw'n ffeithiol gywir dweud bod problemau Caerdydd yn debygol o fod yn gysylltiedig â Townsend, am nad yw Caerdydd yn un o'r cymunedau iechyd hynny sydd ymhell o'r dyraniad Townsend.

Yr oeddech yn sôn am y mynegai amddifadedd lluosog a'i effaith ar ddyrannu adnoddau yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Ond holl ddiben dyraniad Townsend yw'r fformiwla anghenion uniongyrchol, sy'n ddull hollol wahanol o ddyranu adnoddau. Eglurodd yr Athro Townsend mai mesurau anuniongyrchol o angen yw mynegeion, megis hwnnw ar gyfer amddifadedd lluosog, a dadleuai yn ei adroddiad fod defnyddio'r fformiwla anghenion uniongyrchol yn ffordd fwy cywir o fesur anghenion gofaliad iechyd a'i fod, felly, yn sail well ar gyfer dyrannu adnoddau. Yn amlwg, yr ydym, gyda'r grŵp arbennig a sefydlwyd gennym yn dilyn adroddiad diweddaraf Peter Townsend, yn gweithio drwy oblygiadau'r hyn y mae'r grŵp arbenigol hwnnw yn ei gyflwyno inni am y modd y mae'r fformiwla anghenion uniongyrchol yn gweithio ers yr arolwg iechyd diweddaraf yng Nghymru, a oedd yn cynnwys tua 30,000 o bobl.

Yn olaf, mae'n wir fod maint yn effeithio ar allu sefydliad i gomisiynu gwasanaethau, a dyna pam y mae gennym rwydweithiau cardiaidd a rhwydweithiau canser. Dyna hefyd pam yr ydym yn symud tuag at rwydweithiau comisiynu ar gyfer gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed. Yr ydym yn cydnabod bod yna rai enghreifftiau lle mae maint yn ffactor o ran comisiynu, ac yr ydym yn ceisio rhoi strwythur comisiynu ar waith i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Yn yr un modd, fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith fod byrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau lleol yn cydffinio yn hollbwysig,

So, we need to build on the strengths of coterminosity and the crucial role that it has to play as part of the Wanless message. Where necessary, we will look at the commissioning structures and put better structures in place if the local health board is not sufficiently fit for purpose.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call for the final three short questions, to try to help Plenary business, there is a certain invariance in that the first three questions seem to have taken half an hour, which is the official total allowed for the statement. We have an Order to pass after this item, and even with a three-minute time limit on speakers in the debate on the annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, I will need to start it by 4.15 p.m. if I am to agree to a vote at 5.00 p.m. before the short debate. Otherwise, we will have to seek an extension. Therefore, I ask for three quick questions.

Elin Jones: Yr ydych wedi dweud mai rheoli gwael a diffyg effeithlonrwydd sy'n arwain at ddiffyg ariannol nifer o'r ymddiriedolaethau a'r byrddau iechyd lleol. Felly, yr hyn na allaf ddeall yw pam mai gwasanaethau i gleifion sydd bob tro dan fygythiad o ganlyniad i ddiffyg ariannol, yn hytrach na'r ochr weinyddo. Yng Ngheredigion, mae'n costio dwywaith gymaint i redeg dau gwango iechyd nag ydyw i redeg dau ysbyty cymunedol, ond gwelyau yn yr ysbytai hynny ac yn Ysbyty Bronglais sydd o dan fygythiad, yn hytrach na'r ochr weinyddol.

Brian Gibbons: My predecessor, Jane Hutt, told a number of health communities in Wales that if they wanted to put forward proposals to merge and amalgamate, we would be more than willing to consider that. Those proposals have not come forward, so if Elin is suggesting enforced mergers of health and social care communities, fair enough, but if we are to proceed on that basis, we may end up worse off than better off.

Mark Isherwood: You referred to the Townsend funding formula, but you failed to

a dyna un o negeseuon allweddol adolygiad Wanless. Felly, rhaid inni adeiladu ar gryfderau cydffinio a rôl hanfodol hynny fel rhan o neges Wanless. Lle bydd angen, byddwn yn edrych ar y strwythurau comisiynu ac yn rhoi strwythurau gwell ar waith os nad yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn ddigon addas at y diben.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw amy tri chwestiwn byr olaf, er mwyn ceisio helpu busnes y Cyfarfod Llawn, mae peth anghyfnawidioldeb yn y ffaith ei bod yn ymddangos i'r tri chwestiwn cyntaf gymryd hanner awr, sef cyfanswm yr amser swyddogol a ganiateir ar gyfer y datganiad. Mae gennym Orchymyn i'w basio ar ôl yr eitem hon, a hyd yn oed gyda chyfyngiad amser o dair munud ar siaradwyr yn y ddadl ar adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, bydd angen imi ddechrau arni erbyn 4.15 p.m. er mwyn imi gytuno i gynnal pleidlais am 5.00 p.m. cyn y ddadl fer. Fel arall, bydd yn rhaid inni ofyn am estyniad. Felly, gofynnaf am dri chwestiwn cyflym.

Elin Jones: You have stated that it is poor management and lack of efficiency that has led to the financial deficit in many health trusts and local health boards. Therefore, what I cannot understand is why it should be patient services that are always under threat when there is financial deficit, rather than the administrative side. In Ceredigion, it costs twice as much to run two health quangos than it does to run two community hospitals, but it is beds in those hospitals and in Ysbyty Bronglais that are at risk, rather than the administrative side.

Brian Gibbons: Dywedodd fy rhagflaenydd, Jane Hutt, wrth nifer o gymunedau iechyd yng Nghymru, os oeddent am gyflwyno cynigion i uno a dod ynghyd, y byddem yn fwy na bodlon ystyried hynny. Ni chyflwynwyd y cynigion hynny, felly, os yw Elin yn awgrymu y dylem orfodi cymunedau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol i uno, mae hynny'n ddigon teg. Ond os ydym i symud ymlaen ar y sail honno, gallai pethau fod yn waeth yn hytrach nag yn well yn y pen draw.

Mark Isherwood: Yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at fformiwla ariannu Townsend, ond nid

mention that north Wales has suffered a big cut in real terms, although not in absolute terms, and this must have had an impact. What consideration are you giving to comparative management costs to ensure that good practice is rewarded and not penalised? What consideration are you giving to the fact that north Wales has the largest proportion of older people in Wales? We talk about providing care closer to home under 'Designed for Life' and the secondary care review, but why do we see a continuing reduction in the number of local beds for dependent care, respite care, palliative care and dementia care, with campaign groups fighting community hospital closures throughout Wales, and particularly in Prestatyn and Flint in my area? Care Forum Wales has said that the underfunding of the service has contributed to the reduction of the nursing care capacity available to Welsh citizens. Why are hospices writing to me to say that they will have to cut back because of funding problems? Finally, why has the National Council for Palliative Care identified north Wales as having a third-world provision in terms of specialist palliative care?

Brian Gibbons: Having been to north Wales during the summer, I saw that some of the palliative care provided there is first class, and it is totally inaccurate to describe its quality as third class or anything approaching that. I pay tribute to the people who provide first-class palliative care to patients in north Wales. It is not true to suggest that the health service in north Wales is facing cuts. Health expenditure in the NHS has increased year on year, and it has effectively doubled since the Assembly came into being. If your party had had the same commitment over the same period, the challenges facing the NHS would not be anything like they are now.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: One of the most telling parts of your statement was your acknowledgment that although you have doubled the health budget since 1999, you are still facing massive deficits in the health trusts. You seem to be telling us that you are pinning all your faith on the Wanless review and the reconfiguration in 'Designed for

oeddech yn sôn bod y gogledd wedi dioddef toriad mawr mewn termau gwirioneddol, er nad mewn termau absoliwt, a rhaid bod hynny wedi cael effaith. Pa ystyriaeth a roddwch i gostau rheoli cymharol i sicrhau y caiff arfer da ei wobrwyo, nid ei gosbi? Pa ystyriaeth a roddwch i'r ffaith mai yn y gogledd y mae'r gyfran fwyaf o bobl hŷn yng Nghymru? Yr ydym yn siarad am ddarparu gofal yn nes at y cartref o dan 'Cynllun Oes' a'r adolygiad o ofal eilaidd. Ond pam yr ydym yn gweld gostyngiad parhaus yn nifer y gwelyau lleol ar gyfer gofal dibynnol, gofal seibiant, gofal lliniarol a gofal demensia, a grwpiau ymgyrchu yn brwydro yn erbyn cau ysbytai cymuned ledled Cymru, yn arbennig ym Mhrestatyn a'r Fflint yn fy ardal i? Mae Fforwm Gofal Cymru wedi dweud bod tanariannu'r gwasanaeth wedi cyfrannu at y gostyngiad yn yr adnoddau gofal nyrsio sydd ar gael i bobl Cymru. Pam mae hosbisau yn ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud y bydd yn rhaid iddynt wneud toriadau oherwydd problemau ariannu? Yn olaf, pam mae'r Cyngor Cenedlaethol dros Ofal Lliniarol wedi dweud mai darpariaeth y trydydd byd sydd yn y gogledd o ran gofal lliniarol arbenigol?

Brian Gibbons: Ar ôl bod yn y gogledd yn ystod yr haf, gwelais fod rhyfaint o'r gofal lliniarol a ddarperir yno o'r radd flaenaf, ac mae'n hollol anghywir disgrifio safon y gofal hwnnw fel rhywbeth trydydd dosbarth na dim byd tebyg i hynny. Yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r bobl sy'n darparu gofal lliniarol o'r radd flaenaf i gleifion yn y gogledd. Nid yw'n wir awgrymu bod y gwasanaeth iechyd yn y gogledd yn wynebu toriadau. Mae gwariant ar iechyd yn y GIG wedi cynyddu o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, ac mewn gwirionedd mae wedi dyblu ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Pe bai eich plaid chi wedi dangos yr un ymrwymiad dros yr un cyfnod, ni fyddai'r heriau sy'n wynebu'r GIG ddim byd yn debyg i'r hyn ydynt erbyn hyn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Un o rannau mwyaf dadlennol eich datganiad oedd eich cydnabyddiaeth eich bod yn dal i wynebu diffygion anferth yn yr ymddiriedolaethau iechyd, er ichi ddyblu'r gyllideb iechyd er 1999. Ymddengys eich bod yn dweud wrthym eich bod yn rhoi eich ffydd yn llwyr yn adolygiad Wanless a'r broses ailgyflunio

Life'. That will take a very long time to work through, as you know, because reconfigurations upset everyone in the short term, and that means that it could be many years before we see some of the benefits that you hope will come through.

4.10 p.m.

I will put a short-term problem to you. Capital charges have meant that Porthmadog hospital has been put on hold. When will that restart?

Brian Gibbons: I am not sure that capital charges are the fundamental problem with Porthmadog hospital. I understand that it is more to do with some of the infrastructure and groundwork costing more than was originally expected.

Deficits of £20 million or so is not acceptable for the health service in Wales—although calling 0.5 per cent off the total budget 'massive' is a slight exaggeration and overstates the problem—and we expect the service to work its way through improving that, not just through the Wanless reconfiguration, which is an important part of it, but through other factors that can be implemented straight away, such as having better waiting-list management, more efficient use of theatres, better use of nurses, less use of agency nurses and so forth. So, there is the bigger, longer-term picture but there are also some local, immediate things that need to be addressed as part of improved performance management and service delivery to patients.

yn 'Cynllun Oes'. Bydd hynny'n cymryd amser hir i'w gyflawni, fel y gwyddoch, oherwydd bod ailgyflunio'n tarfu ar bawb yn y tymor byr, ac mae hynny'n golygu y gallai gymryd blynyddoedd lawer cyn inni weld rhai o'r manteision yr ydych yn gobeithio'u sicrhau.

Dyma ichi broblem tymor byr. Mae costau cyfalaf wedi golygu bod gwaith ar ysbyty Porthmadog wedi'i ohirio. Pryd fydd y gwaith hwnnw'n ailgychwyn?

Brian Gibbons: Nid wyf yn siŵr ai costau cyfalaf yw'r broblem sylfaenol gydag ysbyty Porthmadog. Deallaf ei fod yn ymwneud mwy â'r ffaith fod rhywfaint o'r seilwaith a'r gwaith sylfeini yn costio mwy nag a ddisgwyliwyd yn wreiddiol.

Nid yw diffygion o ryw £20 miliwn yn dderbyniol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru—er bod defnyddio'r gair 'anferth' i ddisgrifio gostyngiad o 0.5 y cant oddi ar y gyllideb gyfan yn gor-ddweud y broblem i raddau—a disgwyliwn i'r gwasanaeth weithio'i ffordd drwy hynny, nid yn unig drwy broses ailgyflunio Wanless, sy'n rhan bwysig ohono, ond drwy ffactorau eraill y gellir eu gweithredu ar unwaith, megis rheoli rhestrau aros yn well, defnyddio ystafelloedd llawdriniaeth yn fwy effeithlon, defnyddio nyrsys yn well, defnyddio llai o nyrsys asiantaeth, ac ati. Felly, mae yna ddarlun ehangach dros gyfnod hwy, ond mae rhai materion lleol hefyd y mae angen mynd i'r afael â hwy ar unwaith fel rhan o wella rheoli perfformiad a darparu gwell gwasanaeth i gleifion.

**Cymeradwyo Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Cymru 2006) ar Gronfa Datblygu
Rheoli Perfformiad y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol
Approval of Special Grant Report (Wales 2006) Social Services Performance
Management Development Fund**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

under section 88B of the Local Government Finance Act 1988, and in accordance with Standing Order No. 21.11, approves the Local Government Finance (Wales) Special Grant Report (Wales) (2006) on the social services performance management development fund, which was laid in the Table Office on 7 February 2006. (NDM2851)

This special grant was introduced in 2001-02 and is relevant to the previous discussions and debate. It is about improving performance management and providing the necessary information to allow the most effective use of the resources that have been made available to various health and social care communities across Wales. The grant was intended to improve performance management and information systems in social services authorities, which were described at the time as being very variable, with few authorities having information systems that were good enough to manage effectively.

The first four years of the special grant has seen the emergence of consortium working as a cost-effective way for local authorities to achieve economies of scale in the complex business of acquiring and supporting social services information systems. It has also seen improvements to the information systems used by social services authorities to cope with the demands of the unified assessment process and the integrated children's system, improvements in the quality of information produced by authorities, and the development of performance measurement skills in the senior management of social services to ensure that money is made to work most effectively for care providers.

dan adran A88B Deddf Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol 1988, ac yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 21.11, yn cymeradwyo Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol (Cymru) Adroddiad Grant Arbennig (Cymru) (2006) ar gronfa datblygu rheoli perfformiad y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Chwefror 2006. (NDM2851)

Cyflwynwyd y grant arbennig hwn yn 2001-02 ac mae'n berthnasol i'r trafodaethau a'r ddadl flaenorol. Mae a wnelo â gwella rheoli perfformiad a darparu'r wybodaeth angenrheidiol i ganiatau defnyddio yn y ffordd fwyaf yr adnoddau a ddarparwyd i amrywiol gymunedau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ledled Cymru. Bwriad y grant oedd gwella systemau rheoli perfformiad a gwybodaeth mewn awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a gafodd eu disgrifio ar y pryd fel rhai amrywiol iawn, gydag ychydig iawn o awdurdodau yn berchen ar systemau a oedd yn ddigon da i reoli'n effeithiol.

Yn ystod pedair blynedd cyntaf y grant arbennig, datblygodd y cysyniad o weithio mewn consortiwm fel ffordd gost-effeithiol i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau arbedion maint yn y busnes cymhleth o gaffael systemau gwybodaeth gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a'u cynnal. Gwelwyd gwelliannau hefyd yn y systemau gwybodaeth a ddefnyddir gan awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i ymdopi â gofynion y broses asesu unedig a'r system blant integredig, gwelliannau yn ansawdd y wybodaeth a gynhyrchir gan awdurdodau, a datblygu sgiliau mesur perfformiad ymhlith uwch reolwyr gwasanaethau cymdeithasol er mwyn sicrhau defnyddio'r arian yn y ffordd fwyaf effeithiol ar gyfer darparwyr gofal.

The programme and action plan, 'Informing Social Care', published in 2004, focuses attention directly on the promotion of a more strategic approach to the provision and use of information and information systems in social services systems and on encouraging closer working arrangements between social care authorities, healthcare providers and other providers in other sectors. The principles and objectives of 'Informing Social Care' are reflected in the special grant arrangements and support individual local authorities' implementation of the integrated children's system and the unified assessment process, in the active promotion to, and encouragement of, local authorities to ensure that their information systems have the capacity to communicate electronically between themselves, with the healthcare system and with other key partner organisations, for example, the education system, in the development of protocols to ensure secure, legal, and confidential transfers of information and communication, and in the provision of continuing support to improve the quality of management information and the ways in which it is collected and distributed.

While the management and control of social care information rests with the social services authorities, they are in discussion with other local authorities on how best to exchange information and with health trusts to consider how summary social and healthcare information can best be shared. The early benefits from these types of initiatives should become apparent during 2006-07. The performance management project and the special grant have an important role to play in improving the performance of health and social care across Wales.

Jenny Randerson: I welcome this additional money. However, why was the decision made to use a formula basing 70 per cent on the standard spending assessments using relevant performance indicators and 30 per cent on a basic amount per local authority area? Can you tell us why the decision was made to split the money in that way? It reduces the amount of money available for the large authorities, which generally have the greatest social services requirements.

Mae'r rhaglen a'r cynllun gweithredu 'Hysbysu Gofal Cymdeithasol', a gyhoeddwyd yn 2004, yn canolbwyntio sylw'n uniongyrchol ar hyrwyddo ymagwedd fwy strategol tuag at ddarparu a defnyddio gwybodaeth a systemau gwybodaeth mewn systemau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac annog trefniadau gweithio agosach rhwng awdurdodau gofal cymdeithasol, darparwyr gofal iechyd a darparwyr eraill mewn sectorau eraill. Caiff egwyddorion ac amcanion 'Hysbysu Gofal Cymdeithasol' eu hadlewyrchu yn y trefniadau grant arbennig, ac maent yn cefnogi awdurdodau lleol unigol wrth iddynt weithredu'r system blant integredig a'r broses asesu unedig, wrth chwarae rhan yn y gwaith o hyrwyddo ac annog awdurdodau lleol i sicrhau bod gan eu systemau gwybodaeth y gallu i gyfathrebu'n electronig â'i gilydd, â'r system gofal iechyd ac â sefydliadau partner allweddol eraill, er enghraifft y system addysg, wrth ddatblygu protocolau i sicrhau y caiff gwybodaeth ei throsglwyddo'n ddiogel, yn gyfreithlon ac yn gyfrinachol, ac wrth ddarparu cymorth parhaus i wella ansawdd gwybodaeth reoli a'r modd y caiff ei chasglu a'i dosbarthu.

Er mai awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol sy'n gyfrifol am reoli gwybodaeth gofal cymdeithasol, maent yn trafod gydag awdurdodau lleol eraill am y ffordd orau i gyfnewid gwybodaeth, a chydag ymddiriedolaethau iechyd i ystyried y ffordd orau i rannu gwybodaeth gryno am ofal cymdeithasol a gofal iechyd. Dylai manteision cynnar y mathau hyn o fentrau ddod yn amlwg yn ystod 2006-07. Mae gan y prosiect rheoli perfformiad a'r grant arbennig ran bwysig i'w chwarae wrth wella perfformiad iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol ledled Cymru.

Jenny Randerson: Croesawaf yr arian ychwanegol hwn. Fodd bynnag, pam y penderfynwyd defnyddio fformiwla sy'n seilio 70 y cant ar yr asesiadau o wariant safonol, gan ddefnyddio dangosyddion perfformiad perthnasol a 30 y cant ar swm sylfaenol fesul ardal awdurdod lleol? A allwch ddweud wrthym pam y penderfynwyd rhannu'r arian fel hynny? Mae'n lleihau'r arian sydd ar gael i'r awdurdodau mawr, sydd â'r gofynion mwyaf o ran gwasanaethau

cymdeithasol ar y cyfan.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): The reason is that every organisation, regardless of its size, has certain standing costs, which are necessary to put a system in place. Therefore, the cost of acquiring a new information technology system will be largely similar in a big or a small organisation. The operational and marginal costs of using that system will be different, depending on the size and the complexity of need, and the distribution mechanism is geared to reflect that. The basic start-up costs are probably largely similar across all organisations, regardless of their size.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Y rheswm yw fod gan bob sefydliad, waeth beth fo'i faint, rai costau sefydlog, sy'n angenrheidiol i roi system ar waith. Felly, bydd y gost o gaffael system technoleg gwybodaeth newydd yn debyg mewn sefydliad mawr neu fach i bob pwrpas. Bydd y costau gweithredol a ffiniol o ddefnyddio'r system honno yn wahanol, yn ôl maint yr angen a pha mor gymhleth ydyw, ac mae'r dull dosbarthu wedi'i baratoi i adlewyrchu hynny. Mae'n debyg bod y costau cychwynol sylfaenol yn debyg ar draws pob sefydliad ar y cyfan, waeth beth fo'i faint.

*Cynnig (NDM2851): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2851): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Mike
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Chris
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Dai
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales

Motion (NDM2852): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2852): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. welcomes the fourth annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on 7 February 2006;

1. yn croesawu pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 7 Chwefror 2006;

2. notes that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will draw up a response from the Welsh Assembly Government and report to the National Assembly on this by 31 March 2006.

2. yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn llunio ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynghylch hyn erbyn 31 Mawrth 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
 Add as a new point:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
 Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

notes with concern that it has been 19 months since the publication of 'Clywch' and that the Assembly still awaits the Government and other bodies' implementation of many of the recommendations.

yn nodi gyda phryder bod 19 mis wedi mynd heibio ers cyhoeddi 'Clywch', a bod y Cynulliad hwn yn dal i ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth a chyrff eraill roi llawer o'r argymhellion ar waith.

Amendment 2 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
 Add as a new point:

Gwelliant 2 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
 Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

regrets the time taken by the Government and other bodies to develop the advocacy, complaints, and whistleblowing procedures recommended by the children's commissioner.

yn gresynu at yr amser a gymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth a chyrff eraill i ddatblygu'r gweithdrefnau ar gyfer eiriolaeth, cwyno a chwythu chwiban a argymhellwyd gan y comisiynydd plant.

Amendment 3 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
 Add as a new point:

Gwelliant 3 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
 Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

calls on the Assembly Government to review advocacy contracts.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygu contractau eiriolaeth.

- Amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add as a new point:
- calls on the Assembly Government to ensure sufficient additional funding to enable the implementation of standards contained within the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services.*
- Amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add as a new point:
- expresses concern at the slow progress made in implementing the child and adolescent mental health strategy, and believes that child and adolescent mental health services should be commissioned and resourced to provide services to all young people up to the age of 18.*
- Amendment 6 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add as new point:
- calls on the Assembly Government to commit funding, and set targets for the recruitment of school nurses across Wales.*
- Amendment 7 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add as new point:
- expresses concern at the continued prevalence of child poverty in Wales and calls on the Assembly Government to give greater urgency to developing an action plan.*
- Amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.
Add as new point:
- notes with concern the lack of services for young people in Wales suffering from an eating disorder.*
- Amendment 9 in the name of Lisa Francis.
Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review the legal powers of the Children's Commissioner for Wales in circumstances where failure of co-operation by another agency leaves the rights and welfare of children unaddressed.*
- Gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau digon o arian ychwanegol fel y gellir gweithredu'r safonau a gynhwysir yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth.*
- Gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:
- yn mynegi pryder ynghylch arafwch y cynnydd o ran gweithredu'r strategaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc, ac yn credu y dylid comisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc a darparu adnoddau ar eu cyfer er mwyn i'r gwasanaethau fod ar gael i bob person ifanc hyd at 18 oed.*
- Gwelliant 6 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymrwymo arian a gosod targedau ar gyfer recriwtio nyrsys ysgol ledled Cymru.*
- Gwelliant 7 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:
- yn mynegi pryder bod tlodi ymhlith plant yn dal yn gyffredin yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd ati ar fwy o frys i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu.*
- Gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.
Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:
- yn nodi gyda phryder y diffyg gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc sy'n dioddef o anhwylder bwyta yng Nghymru.*
- Gwelliant 9 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu pwerau cyfreithiol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru mewn amgylchiadau pan fydd methiant asiantaeth arall i gydweithredu'n golygu na roddir sylw i hawliau a lles plant.*

- Amendment 10 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to prioritise the provision of consistent independent advocacy services.*
- Amendment 11 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- expresses concern about the gap between Welsh Assembly Government policy rhetoric and reality on issues such as the national service framework for children and school nurses.*
- Amendment 12 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes the importance of independence in staff disciplinary investigation.*
- Amendment 13 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes with concern Welsh Assembly Government failure to develop a child poverty action plan.*
- Amendment 14 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- expresses concern about the continued failure to provide an adequate response by child and adolescent mental health services and supports the recommendation that child and adolescent mental health services should be commissioned for all young people up to the age of 19.*
- Amendment 15 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:
- notes the need to build capacity and establish structures as a basis for a sustainable anti-bullying strategy.*
- Gwelliant 10 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth annibynnol cyson.*
- Gwelliant 11 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y bwlch rhwng rhethreg polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r realiti ynghylch materion fel y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant a nyrsys ysgol.*
- Gwelliant 12 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth mewn ymchwiliadau i ddisgyblaeth staff.*
- Gwelliant 13 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi gyda phryder fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu ar dlodi plant.*
- Gwelliant 14 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y methiant parhaus i ddarparu ymateb digonol gan wasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc ac yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad y dylid comisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc ar gyfer pob person ifanc hyd at 19 oed.*
- Gwelliant 15 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
- yn nodi'r angen i feithrin gallu a sefydlu strwythurau fel sylfaen ar gyfer strategaeth gwrthfwlio gynaliadwy.*

Amendment 16 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the need for support for all those responsible for raising children which will lead to the development of accessible new services.

Gwelliant 16 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r angen am gefnogaeth i bawb sy'n gyfrifol am fagu plant a fydd yn arwain at ddatblygu gwasanaethau newydd sydd o fewn cyrraedd pawb.

Amendment 17 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that any review of advocacy contracts should be carried out working in full partnership with all advocacy service providers to produce a seamless service for children.

Gwelliant 17 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu y dylai unrhyw adolygiad o gontractau eiriolaeth gael ei gynnal drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth lawn â'r holl ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eiriolaeth i gynhyrchu gwasanaeth di-dor i blant.

Amendment 18 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that local bodies are adequately funded to implement the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services.

Gwelliant 18 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod cyrff lleol yn cael digon o gyllid i weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth.

Amendment 19 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to effectively communicate and encourage parents, carers and children on the safe usage of the internet and new technologies.

Gwelliant 19 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfathrebu'n effeithiol â rhieni, gofalwyr a phlant ynghylch defnyddio'r rhyngwyd a thechnolegau newydd yn ddiogel ac i'w hannog i wneud hynny.

Amendment 20 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to publish a list of all the recommendations from recent child protection reports and provide regular updates to the National Assembly for Wales on its progress in their implementation.

Gwelliant 20 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi rhestr o'r holl argymhellion o adroddiadau amddiffyn plant yn ddiweddar a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am ei hynt o ran eu rhoi ar waith.

Amendment 21 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to

Gwelliant 21 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i

make tackling child poverty a priority.

Amendment 22 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the continued slow progress made by the Welsh Assembly Government in implementing the child and adolescent mental health services strategy.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, amendments 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 and 16 in the name of Lisa Francis, and amendments 17, 18, 19, 20, 21 and 22 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I will impose a strict three-minute time limit on every speaker after the amendments have been moved.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. welcomes the fourth annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on 7 February 2006.

2. notes that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will draw up a response from the Welsh Assembly Government and report to the National Assembly on this by 31 March 2006. (NDM2852)

It is a pleasure to introduce for debate the annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which, once again, has all the hallmarks of readability, thoroughness and challenge that we have come to expect from Peter Clarke. Peter has chosen respect as his headline issue this year, and he rightly reminds us that, in talking about respect, we need to be careful about using the right currency. We should not focus on the negatives, but accentuate the positives, and recognise that respect works both ways. The launch of our play implementation plan this morning contributes to this agenda.

roi blaenoriaeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant.

Gwelliant 22 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at arafwch parhaus cynnydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran rhoi'r strategaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc ar waith.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, gwelliannau 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15 ac 16 yn enw Lisa Francis a gwelliannau 17, 18, 19, 20, 21 a 22 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Byddaf yn gosod terfyn amser llym o dair munud i bob siaradwr ar ôl i'r gwelliannau gael eu cynnig.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn croesawu pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 7 Chwefror 2006.

2. yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn llunio ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynghylch hyn erbyn 31 Mawrth 2006. (NDM2852)

Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru i gael dadl arno; adroddiad sydd, unwaith eto, yn hawdd iawn ei ddarllen, yn drylwyr ac yn heriol, fel yr ydym yn bellach wedi dod i'w ddisgwyl gan Peter Clarke. Mae Peter wedi dewis parch fel ei brif fater eleni, ac mae'n ein hatgoffa, yn gywir ddigon, wrth sôn am barch, fod angen inni fod yn ofalus ynglŷn â defnyddio'r ystyr briodol. Ni ddylem ganolbwyntio ar yr agweddau negyddol, ond pwysleisio'r agweddau cadarnhaol, a chydnabod bod parch yn gweithio'r ddwy ffordd. Mae lansio ein cynllun gweithredu ar chwarae y bore yma yn cyfrannu at yr agenda

hon.

One of the respect issues picked up by the commissioner again this year is bullying. As education Minister, I have taken forward a number of projects to help to combat bullying in schools, including the first Respecting Others week, held on the week commencing 10 October 2005. That included the setting up of a new website to share good practice, the launch of the new anti-bullying network in Wales, and our summary report assessing school anti-bullying policies. Further work on this is being carried out by Cardiff University.

It is also important that we respect and support parents and carers. I am pleased that, since the commissioner's last report, we have published our first parenting action plan, which he mentions, to ensure that all those involved in raising children have the support and information that they need. Significant additional resources being put into Cymorth from 2006-07 should increase the range of targeted and universal support services available locally. Nationally, we are working to establish a bilingual telephone helpline and booklets for parents on managing children's behaviour.

We are making demonstrable progress on advocacy and complaints. We now have national advocacy standards. Vulnerable children, those in need, looked-after children and care leavers have a statutory right to access an advocacy service. There are new regulations and guidance for complaints in social services, and guidance on complaints arrangements in schools. We have completed the most thorough consultation with children and young people ever undertaken by the Assembly and we have published a comprehensive study undertaken on advocacy and complaints arrangements across health and social care. In the summer, we will consult on the development of a new integrated advocacy service model across health, social care and education.

4.20 p.m.

Un o'r materion am barch a drafodwyd gan y comisiynydd unwaith eto eleni yw bwlio. Fel y Gweinidog addysg, yr wyf wedi datblygu nifer o brosiectau i helpu atal bwlio mewn ysgolion, gan gynnwys yr wythnos gyntaf Parchu Eraill, a gynhaliwyd yn ystod yr wythnos yn dechrau ar 10 Hydref 2005. Yr oedd hynny'n cynnwys sefydlu gwefan newydd i rannu arferion da, lansio'r rhwydwaith gwrth-fwlio newydd yng Nghymru, a'n hadroddiad cryno yn asesu polisïau atal bwlio mewn ysgolion. Mae Prifysgol Caerdydd yn gwneud gwaith pellach ar hyn.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig inni barchu a chefnogi rhieni a gofalwyr. Yr wyf yn falch, ers adroddiad diwethaf y comisiynydd, ein bod wedi cyhoeddi ein cynllun gweithredu cyntaf ar rianta, ac mae'r Comisiynydd yn cyfeirio ato, er mwyn sicrhau y caiff pawb sy'n gysylltiedig â magu plant y cymorth a'r wybodaeth y mae arnynt eu hangen. Dylai'r adnoddau ychwanegol sylweddol a neilltuir ar gyfer Cymorth o 2006-07 gynyddu amrywiaeth y gwasanaethau cymorth penodol a chyffredinol sydd ar gael yn lleol. Yn genedlaethol, yr ydym yn gweithio i sefydlu llinell gymorth ddwyieithog a llyfrynnau i rieni ar reoli ymddygiad plant.

Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd amlwg o ran eiriolaeth a chwynion. Bellach mae gennym safonau eiriolaeth cenedlaethol. Mae gan blant diamddiffyn, y rhai mewn angen, plant sy'n cael gofal a'r rhai sy'n gadael gofal hawl statudol i gael gwasanaeth eiriolaeth. Mae yna reoliadau a chanllawiau newydd ar gyfer cwynion mewn gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a chanllawiau ar drefniadau cwyno mewn ysgolion. Yr ydym wedi cwblhau'r ymgynghori mwyaf trylwyr â phlant a phobl ifanc a gyflawnwyd erioed gan y Cynulliad, ac wedi cyhoeddi astudiaeth gynhwysfawr a wnaed ym maes trefniadau eiriolaeth a chwyno mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Yn ystod yr haf, byddwn yn ymgynghori ar ddatblygu model gwasanaeth eiriolaeth integredig newydd mewn iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol ac addysg.

I welcome the commissioner's continued interest in our proposals for implementing the 'Clyweh' report. I presented an update to the last meeting of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. I am pleased that the commissioner commends our work in relation to new disciplinary arrangements, and I pledge to continue to ensure that we deliver on the areas that we agreed.

On school nursing, we share the commissioner's concern about addressing the variation in provision revealed across Wales by the mapping of school nursing, undertaken in December 2004. The main findings of the mapping exercise were discussed by the Cabinet sub-committee on children and young people in October 2005. A cross-cutting group has been formed to agree a national consensus on the role of school nurses and an action plan to establish a modern school nursing service in Wales.

I am also pleased that the commissioner recognises the significance of the standards set out in the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services, which was launched in September last year. The NSF sets out the quality of service that children, young people and their families have a right to receive, and aims to drive up quality and reduce variations in service delivery. It is backed by specific and measurable key actions that will contribute to the delivery of the standards set.

The Assembly Government is already committing resources to a number of strategies and policies that will contribute to delivery of the NSF, including the Children First programme, the food and fitness programme and Cymorth. We expect local partners to deliver the NSF by identifying and making best use of all available resources, including the additional resources put into the NHS in Wales over the past five years.

We also continue to make steady progress in implementing the child and adolescent mental health service strategy, 'Everybody's Business', which has been a regular feature

Yr wyf yn croesawu ddiddordeb parhaus y comisiynydd yn ein cynigion ar gyfer gweithredu adroddiad 'Clyweh'. Cyflwynais y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Yr wyf yn falch fod y comisiynydd yn canmol ein gwaith mewn perthynas â threfniadau disgyblu newydd, ac yr wyf yn addo parhau i sicrhau y byddwn yn cyflawni yn y meysydd y cytunwyd arnynt.

O ran nyrsys ysgol, yr ydym mi fel y comisiynydd yn pryderu ynghylch ymdrin â'r amrywiaeth yn y ddarpariaeth a ddatgelwyd ledled Cymru drwy fapio nyrsys ysgol, a wnaed ym mis Rhagfyr 2004. Trafodwyd prif ddarganfyddiadau'r ymarfer mapio gan is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc ym mis Hydref 2005. Mae grŵp trawsbynciol wedi ei sefydlu i gytuno ar gonsensws cenedlaethol ar rôl nyrsys ysgol, a chynllun gweithredu i sefydlu gwasanaeth nyrsys ysgol modern yng Nghymru.

Yr wyf yn falch hefyd fod y comisiynydd yn cydnabod pwysigrwydd y safonau sydd wedi eu gosod allan yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, a lansiwyd ym mis Medi y llynedd. Mae'r fframwaith yn gosod allan ansawdd y gwasanaeth y mae gan blant, pobl ifanc a'u teuluoedd hawl i'w gael, ac mae'n ceisio gwella ansawdd a lleihau amrywiadau yn y gwasanaethau a ddarperir. Fe'i hategir gan gamau gweithredu allweddol penodol a mesuradwy a fydd yn cyfrannu at ddarparu'r safonau a bennwyd.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes yn neilltuo adnoddau ar gyfer nifer o strategaethau a pholisïau a fydd yn cyfrannu at weithredu'r fframwaith, gan gynnwys y rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf, y rhaglen bwyd a ffitrwydd a Chymorth. Yr ydym yn disgwyl i bartneriaid lleol weithredu'r fframwaith drwy nodi'r holl adnoddau sydd ar gael a manteisio i'r eithaf arnynt, gan gynnwys yr adnoddau ychwanegol a roddwyd i'r GIG yng Nghymru yn ystod y pum mlynedd diwethaf.

Yr ydym yn parhau i wneud cynnydd cyson hefyd wrth weithredu strategaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasod, 'Busnes Pawb', sydd wedi cael sylw

of the commissioner's annual report. We are currently revising a draft costed plan for CAMHS, which has been developed by Health Commission Wales in consultation with local health boards and local child and adolescent services. Health Commission Wales is also working closely with local health boards in the development of CAMHS commissioning networks at three regional levels in Wales, and with NHS trusts in north and south Wales to finalise plans to replace both the Harvey Jones Adolescent Unit in Cardiff and Cedar Court in north Wales. A specific CAMHS target is set in the service and financial framework process linked to the NSF. Children and young people's partnerships will be required to report on achieving outcomes by March 2007. Funding has been given to the University of Glamorgan and Bangor University for a CAMHS nursing course, and Health Commission Wales is setting up an eating disorder service in south Wales.

Important progress is also being made in addressing child poverty. The child poverty strategy, 'A Fair Future for our Children', sets out how we will meet our commitment to eradicate child poverty by 2020 and halve it by 2010. The Deputy Minister for social justice and regeneration, Huw Lewis, is currently finalising our implementation plan in this respect.

As for the prevalence of child poverty in Wales, the recent monitoring report by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation showed real progress. Thanks to sizeable reductions in recent years, the proportion of children living in low-income households in Wales is now the same as the average for the UK as a whole. We accept that more needs to be done, but we should recognise this as progress towards our stated aim. The child poverty implementation plan will ensure that we stay focused on the goal.

The Assembly Government is taking the commissioner's concerns seriously and is making progress. I am happy to accept

rheolaidd yn adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd. Yr ydym wrthi'n diwygio cynllun drafft wedi'i gostio ar gyfer CAMHS, a ddatblygwyd gan Gomisiwn Iechyd Cymru drwy ymgynghori â byrddau iechyd lleol a gwasanaethau lleol ar gyfer plant a'r glasoed. Mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru hefyd yn gweithio'n agos gyda byrddau iechyd lleol i ddatblygu rhwydweithiau comisiynu CAMHS ar y tair lefel ranbarthol yng Nghymru, a chydag ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn y gogledd a'r de i gwblhau cynlluniau i gael unedau newydd yn lle Uned Harvey Jones i'r Glasoed yng Nghaerdydd a Cedar Court yn y gogledd. Caiff targed CAMHS penodol ei osod yn y broses gwasanaeth a fframwaith cyllid yn gysylltiedig â'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol. Bydd yn ofynnol i bartneriaethau plant a phobl ifanc gyflwyno adroddiad ar sicrhau canlyniadau erbyn mis Mawrth 2007. Rhoddwyd arian i Brifysgol Morgannwg a Phrifysgol Bangor ar gyfer cwrs nyrsio CAMHS, ac mae Comisiwn Iechyd Cymru yn sefydlu gwasanaeth yn y de ar anhwylderau bwyta.

Gwneir cynnydd pwysig hefyd i fynd i'r afael â thlodi ymhlith plant. Mae'r strategaeth tlodi ymhlith plant, 'Dyfodol Teg i'n Plant', yn gosod allan sut y byddwn yn bodloni'n hymrwymiad i ddileu tlodi ymhlith plant erbyn 2020 a'i haneru erbyn 2010. Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac adfywio, Huw Lewis, wrthi'n cwblhau ein cynllun cyflawni yn y cyswllt hwn.

O ran graddau'r tlodi ymhlith plant yng Nghymru, yr oedd yr adroddiad monitro gan Sefydliad Joseph Rowntree yn ddiweddar yn dangos cynnydd gwirioneddol. Diolch i ostyngiadau sylweddol yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf, mae cyfran y plant sy'n byw mewn cartrefi incwm isel yng Nghymru bellach ar yr un cyfartaledd ag yn y DU gyfan. Derbyniwn fod angen gwneud mwy, ond dylem gydnabod hyn fel cynnydd tuag at ein nod. Bydd y cynllun cyflawni ar dlodi ymhlith plant yn sicrhau ein bod yn parhau i ganolbwyntio ar y nod.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cymryd pryderon y comisiynydd o ddifrif ac yn gwneud cynnydd. Yr wyf yn fodlon derbyn

amendments 10, 12, 15, 16, 19 and 21. We are already giving priority to action on advocacy, child poverty, and responding to 'Clywch', including recommendations on staff disciplinary investigation in schools, bullying, parenting support and internet safety. I reject the remaining amendments. I believe that our response to 'Clywch', our approach to improving advocacy arrangements, and the imminent publication of our implementation plan on child poverty represent the urgency with which we are taking action in these areas. In respect of child protection, the safeguarding vulnerable children review has taken evidence from over 50 organisations and is due to report in the next few weeks.

Furthermore, the amendments fail to take account of all that we are doing to implement the NSF, to develop CAMHS, to address eating disorders and to develop a modern school nursing service. There are resources available to support the NSF, and additional funding has been provided for CAMHS in both 2004-05 and 2005-06. As the commissioner acknowledges, we are implementing a 10-year strategy for CAMHS that will support children and young people up to their eighteenth birthday. I believe that we can now demonstrate steady progress in achieving this goal.

I also reject the call to review the legal powers of the commissioner. These powers were derived from an all-party report of the Health and Social Services Committee. They are based on the clear principle that, while the commissioner has an entitlement to information, as an unelected individual, he should not dictate to a democratically elected body such as a local authority. Instead, we require the body concerned to make a public response to him.

In conclusion, I welcome the commissioner's fourth annual report, which demonstrates, once again, the rigour and diligence with which Peter Clarke and his staff fulfil their roles as independent champions for children and young people in Wales. They deserve no less.

gwelliannau 10, 12, 15, 16, 19 ac 21. Yr ydym eisoes yn rhoi blaenoriaeth i gamau gweithredu ym meysydd eiriolaeth, tlodi ymhlith plant, ac ymateb i 'Clywch', gan gynnwys argymhellion ar ymchwiliadau disgyblu staff mewn ysgolion, bwlio, cymorth i rieni a diogelwch y rhyngrwyd. Yr wyf yn gwrthod y gwelliannau eraill. Credaf fod ein hymateb i 'Clywch', ein hymagwedd at wella trefniadau eiriolaeth, a'n cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer tlodi ymhlith plant sydd ar fin cael ei gyhoeddi yn dangos ein bod yn cymryd camau ar frys yn y meysydd hyn. O ran amddiffyn plant, mae'r adolygiad o ddiogelu plant diamddiffyn wedi cael tystiolaeth gan fwy na 50 o sefydliadau, a disgwylir iddo gyflwyno adroddiad yn ystod yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf.

At hynny, nid yw'r gwelliannau yn ystyried popeth a wnawn i weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, i ddatblygu CAMHS, i ymdrin ag anhwylderau bwyta ac i ddatblygu gwasanaeth nyrsys ysgol modern. Mae adnoddau ar gael i gefnogi'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, ac mae arian ychwanegol wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer CAMHS yn 2004-05 a 2005-06. Fel y mae'r comisiynydd yn ei gydnabod, yr ydym yn gweithredu strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer CAMHS a fydd yn cefnogi plant a phobl ifanc nes iddynt gyrraedd 18 oed. Credaf y gallwn ddangos cynnydd cyson bellach wrth gyflawni'r nod hwn.

Gwrthodaf hefyd yr alwad i adolygu pwerau cyfreithiol y comisiynydd. Deilliodd y pwerau hyn o adroddiad gan yr holl bleidiau gan y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Maent yn seiliedig ar yr egwyddor glir na ddylai'r comisiynydd, fel unigolyn anetholedig, er bod ganddo'r hawl i gael gwybodaeth, roi gorchmynion i gorff a etholwyd yn ddemocrataidd, fel awdurdod lleol. Yn lle hynny, yr ydym yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r corff dan sylw ymateb iddo'n gyhoeddus.

I gloi, yr wyf yn croesawu pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd, sy'n dangos unwaith eto mor drwyadl a diwyd y mae Peter Clarke a'i staff yn cyflawni eu rôl fel hyrwyddwyr annibynnol dros blant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Nid ydynt yn haeddu ddim llai.

Janet Ryder: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

Janet Ryder: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Amendment 1: add as a new point:

Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

notes with concern that it has been 19 months since the publication of 'Clywch' and that the Assembly still awaits the Government and other bodies' implementation of many of the recommendations.

yn nodi gyda phryder bod 19 mis wedi mynd heibio ers cyhoeddi 'Clywch', a bod y Cynulliad hwn yn dal i ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth a chyrff eraill roi llawer o'r argymhellion ar waith.

I propose amendment 2. Add as a new point:

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

regrets the time taken by the Government and other bodies to develop the advocacy, complaints, and whistleblowing procedures recommended by the children's commissioner.

yn gresynu at yr amser a gymerwyd gan y Llywodraeth a chyrff eraill i ddatblygu'r gweithdrefnau ar gyfer eiriolaeth, cwyno a chwythu chwiban a argymhellwyd gan y comisiynydd plant.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point:

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

calls on the Assembly Government to review advocacy contracts.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygu contractau eiriolaeth.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point:

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

calls on the Assembly Government to ensure sufficient additional funding to enable the implementation of standards contained within the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i sicrhau digon o arian ychwanegol fel y gellir gweithredu'r safonau a gynhwysir yn y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth.

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point:

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

expresses concern at the slow progress made in implementing the child and adolescent mental health strategy, and believes that child and adolescent mental health strategy should be commissioned and resourced to provide services to all young people up to the age of 18.

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch arafwch y cynnydd o ran gweithredu'r strategaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc, ac yn credu y dylid comisiynu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc a darparu adnoddau ar eu cyfer er mwyn i'r gwasanaethau fod ar gael i bob person ifanc hyd at 18 oed.

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point:

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

calls on the Assembly Government to commit funding, and set targets for the recruitment of school nurses across Wales.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i ymrwymo arian a gosod targedau ar gyfer recriwtio nyrsys ysgol ledled Cymru.

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point: Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

expresses concern at the continued prevalence of child poverty in Wales and calls on the Assembly Government to give greater urgency to developing an action plan. yn mynegi pryder bod tlodi ymhlith plant yn dal yn gyffredin yng Nghymru ac yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd ati ar fwy o frys i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu.

I propose amendment 8: add as new point: Cynigiad welliant 8. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

notes with concern the lack of services for young people in Wales suffering from an eating disorder. yn nodi gyda phryder y diffyg gwasanaethau i bobl ifanc sy'n dioddef o anhwylder bwyta yng Nghymru.

I concentrate my comments mainly on that part of the report which refers to the 'Clywch' report. First, like many other people, I thank Peter Clarke and his team once again for their valuable work and congratulate them on producing this report. Yr wyf yn canolbwyntio'n bennaf ar y rhan honno o'r adroddiad sy'n cyfeirio at adroddiad 'Clywch'. Yn gyntaf, fel llawer o bobl eraill, yr wyf yn diolch i Peter Clarke a'i dîm unwaith eto am eu gwaith gwerthfawr, ac yr wyf yn eu llongyfarch ar gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn.

Like many other Members, I am sure, I have called upon Peter Clarke's help many times on issues in my constituency. Recently, I had to ask his advice on the provision of speech therapy and additional educational support in Conwy, and we have had many discussions on that issue. I am pleased that he has gone out of his way to come to meet parents and listen to the concerns that they have for their children. I have had the honour of holding meetings with him and young children to discuss bullying, especially aspects of telephone, text and mobile phone bullying. Fel nifer o Aelodau eraill, mae'n siŵr, yr wyf wedi gofyn am gymorth Peter Clarke droeon ar faterion yn fy etholaeth. Yn ddiweddar, bu'n rhaid imi ofyn am ei gyngor ar ddarpariaeth therapi lleferydd a chymorth addysgol ychwanegol yng Nghonwy, a chawsom nifer o drafodaethau ar y mater hwnnw. Yr wyf yn falch ei fod wedi mynd i'r drafferth o ddod i gyfarfod â rhieni a gwranddo ar y pryderon sydd ganddynt am eu plant. Cefais y ffrind o gynnal cyfarfodydd gydag ef a phlant ifanc i drafod bwlio, yn enwedig agweddau ar fwlio dros y ffôn, drwy negeseuon testun a thrwy ffonau symudol.

I would like it to be noted that each time I make contact with the children's commissioner's office, there is always a helpful response and an eagerness to take the concerns of children in Wales forward quickly and promptly. That eagerness to respond and to act on behalf of children, unfortunately, is in total contrast to the way in which this Minister has responded to the recommendations made in the commissioner's 'Clywch' report. Hoffwn gofnodi ymateb buddiol ac awydd i weithredu ar bryderon plant yng Nghymru yn gyflym ac yn brydlon bob amser pan fyddaf yn cysylltu â swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant. Yn anffodus, mae'r awydd hwnnw i ymateb ac i weithredu ar ran plant yn hollol wahanol i'r ffordd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ymateb i'r argymhellion a wnaed yn yr adroddiad 'Clywch' gan y comisiynydd.

In June 2005, the parent who first raised concerns about John Owen said that she was disappointed that, a year on, so little had changed. She said at the time that Peter's work seemed to go unnoticed by the majority. Ym mis Mehefin 2005, dywedodd y rhiant a fynegodd bryderon ynghylch John Owen gyntaf ei bod yn siomedig bod cyn lleied wedi newid, flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach. Dywedodd ar y pryd fod gwaith Peter fel pe

and his recommendations not implemented. The Minister's response was that she had accepted nearly all of the recommendations but that the children's commissioner's office understood why there was a problem in implementing some. I think that everyone accepts that there would be problems in implementing some of those recommendations. She went on to say that what was important was implementing them no matter when. Is it no matter when? That seems to give the Minister rather an open-ended invitation to act. It is worrying that we are now two years on from the publication of 'Clywch', and we are still waiting, so how long is 'no matter when'?

We all accept that some of the recommendations were never going to be easy to implement, but that is no reason to not take action. Nearly all of us sat in the Chamber when we debated the response to Waterhouse. We all heard those cries of, 'This should never happen again', but then there was 'Clywch'. We all watched the events at Soham unfurl on the television and heard Michael Bichard make his recommendations. We then had the controversy of List 99 and the checking of people who work with children.

Bichard made the recommendations that might have prevented the recent problems over List 99. Waterhouse made similar recommendations to 'Clywch'. They included having good advocacy services, having open and accessible complaints procedures and ensuring that all those concerned were aware of how to access those services, establishing whistleblowing procedures that everyone knew about and that were adhered to, and which worked across all departments and all bodies that worked with children implemented. After 'Clywch', there were similar calls of 'This kind of thing must never happen again' and 'Action must be swift'. However, actions have not been swift.

In the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting on 8 February 2006, the Minister said, referring to recommendation

bae'n cael ei anwybyddu gan y mwyafrif a'i argymhellion heb eu rhoi ar waith. Ymatebodd y Gweinidog drwy ddweud ei bod wedi derbyn bron pob un o'r argymhellion, ond bod swyddfa'r comisiynydd plant yn deall pam yr oedd problem yn codi wrth weithredu rhai ohonynt. Credaf fod pawb yn derbyn y byddai problemau wrth weithredu rhai o'r argymhellion. Aeth ymlaen i ddweud mai'r hyn a oedd yn bwysig oedd eu gweithredu, ni waeth pryd. A yw hynny'n wir? Ymddengys fod hynny'n rhoi gwahoddiad braidd yn benagored i'r Gweinidog weithredu. Mae'n peri pryder bod dwy flynedd bellach ers cyhoeddi 'Clywch', ac yr ydym dal i ddisgwyl. Felly, pa mor hir yw 'ni waeth pryd'?

Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn na fyddai'n hawdd rhoi rhai o'r argymhellion ar waith, ond nid yw hynny'n rheswm dros beidio â gweithredu. Yr oedd bron pob un ohonom yn y Siambr pan gynhaliwyd dadl ar yr ymateb i Waterhouse. Clywsom i gyd bobl yn dweud 'Ni ddylai hyn ddigwydd byth eto'. Ond yna daeth 'Clywch'. Buom i gyd yn gwyllo'r digwyddiadau yn Soham ar y teledu a chlywed Michael Bichard yn cyflwyno'i argymhellion. Wedyn cawsom fater dadleuol Rhestr 99 a'r broses o wirio pobl sy'n gweithio gyda phlant.

Gwnaeth Bichard yr argymhellion a allai fod wedi atal y problemau'n ddiweddar gyda Rhestr 99. Cyflwynodd Waterhouse argymhellion tebyg i 'Clywch'. Roeddent yn cynnwys cael gwasanaethau eiriolaeth da, cael gweithdrefnau cwyno agored a hwylus, a sicrhau bod pawb dan sylw yn ymwybodol sut i fanteisio ar y gwasanaethau hynny, sefydlu gweithdrefnau chwythu'r chwiban y byddai pawb yn gwybod amdanynt a phawb yn cadw atynt, a'r rheini'n gweithio ym mhob adran a phob corff a oedd yn gweithio gyda phlant yn eu gweithredu. Ar ôl 'Clywch', dywedwyd pethau tebyg fel 'Ni ddylai rhywbeth fel hyn ddigwydd byth eto' a 'Rhaid cymryd camau gweithredu cyflym'. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r camau gweithredu wedi bod yn gyflym.

Yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ar 8 Chwefror 2006, dywedodd y Gweinidog fel hyn wrth gyfeirio at

21.5 of the 'Clywch' report, on whistleblowing, that,

'Some LEAs have made it clear in those policies that they apply both to LEA-based and school staff'.

However, the Minister is still doing an analysis of them. At the last meeting of the committee, the Minister was not able to tell me how many local education authorities had whistleblowing procedures in place that applied to everyone. She admitted that the outstanding issue was in relation to governing bodies and that a document would be issued for consultation in the spring. Why have we had to wait two years since Clywch to hear that report?

4.30 p.m.

Recommendation 21.9 relates to counselling strategies. Again, the Minister admitted that only in a small part of Wales were those counselling strategies 'very good'. She has just finished a two-month scoping exercise to map out provision in Wales. Why have we had to wait two years, post-Clywch, just to finish the mapping exercise? When will 'no matter when' be past its sell-by date, Minister? No-one doubts your sincerity, but we want to see these recommendations implemented for all our children.

Mark Isherwood: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. Amendment 9: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to review the legal powers of the Children's Commissioner for Wales in circumstances where failure of cooperation by another agency leaves the rights and welfare of children unaddressed.

I propose amendment 10: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the WAG to prioritise the provision of consistent independent advocacy services.

argymhelliad 21.5 yn adroddiad 'Clych', ar chwythu'r chwiban.

Mae rhai AALlau wedi egluro yn y polisiau hynny eu bod yn gymwys i staff AALl a staff ysgolion.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r Gweinidog yn parhau i'w dadansoddi. Yng nghyfarfod diwethaf y pwyllgor, ni allai'r Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf faint o awdurdodau addysg lleol a oedd â gweithdrefnau chwythu'r chwiban ar waith a oedd yn gymwys i bawb. Cyfaddefodd fod y mater a oedd heb ei benderfynu yn ymwneud â chyrrff llywodraethu ac y byddai dogfen ymgynghori'n cael ei chyhoeddi yn y gwanwyn. Pam y bu'n rhaid inni aros dwy flynedd ers Clywch i glywed yr adroddiad hwnnw?

Mae argymhelliad 21.9 yn ymwneud â strategaethau cynghori. Unwaith eto, cyfaddefodd y Gweinidog mai mewn rhan fach o Gymru yn unig yr oedd y strategaethau cynghori hynny'n 'dda iawn'. Mae hi newydd orffen ymarfer cwmpasu o ddau fis i fapio'r ddarpariaeth yng Nghymru. Pam y bu'n rhaid inni aros dwy flynedd, ar ôl Clywch, dim ond er mwyn gorffen yr ymarfer mapio? Pryd y gallwn roi'r gorau i'r ymadrodd 'ni waeth pryd', Weinidog? Nid oes neb yn amau eich diffuantrwydd, ond yr ydym am weld yr argymhellion hyn yn cael eu gweithredu ar gyfer ein plant i gyd.

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis. Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i adolygu pwerau cyfreithiol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru mewn amgylchiadau pan fydd methiant asiantaeth arall i gydweithredu'n golygu na roddir sylw i hawliau a lles plant.

Cynigiau welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu gwasanaethau

eiriolaeth annibynnol cyson.

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern about the gap between WAG policy rhetoric and reality on issues such as the national service framework for children and school nurses.

Cynigiaf welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y bwch rhwng rhethreg polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r realiti ynghylch materion fel y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant a nyrsys ysgol.

I propose amendment 12. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the importance of independence in staff disciplinary investigation.

Cynigiaf welliant 12. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth mewn ymchwiliadau i ddisgyblaeth staff.

I propose amendment 13. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes with concern WAG failure to develop a child poverty action plan.

Cynigiaf welliant 13. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi gyda phryder fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu ar dlodi plant.

I propose amendment 14. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

expresses concern about the continued failure to provide an adequate response by child and adolescent mental health services and supports the recommendation that CAMHS should be commissioned for all young people up to the age of 19.

Cynigiaf welliant 14. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y methiant parhaus i ddarparu ymateb digonol gan Wasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Plant a Phobl Ifanc ac yn cefnogi'r argymhelliad y dylid comisiynu Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Plant a Phobl Ifanc ar gyfer pob person ifanc hyd at 19 oed.

I propose amendment 15. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the need to build capacity and establish structures as a basis for a sustainable anti-bullying strategy.

Cynigiaf welliant 15. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r angen am feithrin gallu a sefydlu strwythurau fel sylfaen ar gyfer strategaeth gwrth-fwllo gynaliadwy.

I propose amendment 16: Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the need for support for all those responsible for raising children which will lead to the development of accessible new services.

Cynigiaf welliant 16. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r angen am gefnogaeth i bawb sy'n gyfrifol am fagu plant ac a fydd yn arwain at ddatblygu gwasanaethau newydd a fydd o fewn cyrraedd pawb.

We thank Peter Clarke for another characteristically robust annual report. Following last year's annual report, we learned that almost all of the cases referred to the children's commissioner had been

Diolchwn i Peter Clarke am adroddiad blynyddol arall sy'n nodweddiadol gadarn. Yn dilyn adroddiad blynyddol y llynedd, clywsom fod bron pob un o'r achosion a gyfeiriwyd at y comisiynydd plant wedi'u

resolved. However, a small number had been outstanding for many years. In answer to my question at that time, the deputy children's commissioner confirmed that additional legal powers were needed in certain circumstances.

One of these cases concerned the Finnegan family in Flintshire—a family that I have to refer to again in the Chamber because the children are still, another year down the road, being forced to live in atrocious conditions. The county council continues to deny them their rights to social justice. As the years go by, each day is 'Groundhog Day' for this family, with another set of costly reasons given for further delay, additional requests made for information already provided, and denial of the housing standards required by legislation.

If this can happen to these children, it can happen to any children. Hence, I propose amendment 9, which calls for a review of the commissioner's legal powers in circumstances where the failure of another agency to co-operate leaves the rights and welfare of children unaddressed.

Despite Sir Ronald Waterhouse's identification of the importance of independent advocacy for children, the children's commissioner has highlighted concerns about the lack of strategic vision in this area, and about the degree of real independence enjoyed by advocates when they are directly beholden to their paymasters. He stated that not one of the younger people leaving care who contacted his office felt that their personal advisers had represented their views or negotiated on their behalf. As the children's commissioner states, the risks of not acting are likely to be great. He says that he is at a loss to understand why the Welsh Assembly Government has not pursued these matters more vigorously. That is why we have tabled amendment 10.

In the context of school nurses, the children's commissioner states that it is of considerable concern that the policy rhetoric is not being made a reality simply because of a lack of

datrys. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd nifer fach nad aethpwyd i'r afael â hwy am flynyddoedd lawer. Mewn ymateb i'm cwestiwn bryd hynny, cadarnhaodd y dirprwy gomisiynydd plant fod angen pwerau cyfreithiol ychwanegol mewn rhai amgylchiadau.

Yr oedd un o'r achosion hyn yn ymwneud â'r teulu Finnegan yn Sir y Fflint—teulu y mae'n rhaid imi gyfeirio atynt eto yn y Siambur oherwydd bod y plant, flwyddyn yn ddiweddarach, yn dal i orfod byw mewn amodau erchyll. Mae'r cyngor sir yn dal i wrthod iddynt eu hawliau i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol. Wrth i'r blynyddoedd fynd heibio, mae pob diwrnod yn 'Ddiwrnod Groundhog' i'r teulu hwn, gyda chyfres arall o resymau costus yn cael eu rhoi dros oedi pellach, ceisiadau ychwanegol yn cael eu gwneud am wybodaeth a ddarparwyd eisoes, a'r safonau tai sy'n ofynnol gan ddeddfwriaeth yn cael eu gwrthod.

Os gall hyn ddigwydd i'r plant hyn, gall ddigwydd i unrhyw blant. Felly, cynigiai welliant 9, sy'n galw am adolygiad o bwerau cyfreithiol y comisiynydd mewn amgylchiadau lle mae methiant asiantaeth arall i gydweithredu yn golygu nad yw hawliau a lles plant yn cael sylw.

Er i Syr Ronald Waterhouse nodi pwysigrwydd eiriolaeth annibynnol i blant, mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi tynnu sylw at bryderon ynglŷn â diffyg gweledigaeth strategol yn y maes hwn, a faint o annibyniaeth mewn gwirionedd sydd gan eiriolwyr pan fyddant yn uniongyrchol ddyledus i'r sawl sy'n eu cyflogi. Dywedodd nad oedd yr un o'r bobl ifanc a oedd yn gadael gofal ac wedi cysylltu â'i swyddfa yn credu bod eu hymgynghorwyr personol wedi cyfleu eu safbwyntiau neu wedi trafod ar eu rhan. Fel y dywed y comisiynydd plant, mae'r peryglon o beidio â gweithredu yn debygol o fod yn sylweddol. Dywed nad yw'n gallu deall pam nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi mynd i'r afael â'r materion hyn yn fwy grymus. Dyna'r rheswm inni gyflwyno gwelliant 10.

Yng nghyd-destun nyrsys ysgol, dywed y comisiynydd plant fod cryn bryder am nad yw'r rhethreg polisi yn cael ei thro'i'n realiti dim ond oherwydd diffyg arweiniad strategol

strategic lead and funding. In the context of the national service framework for children, the children's commissioner also expresses concern that there has been no indication of the level of funding that may be expected to begin the process of implementation. This is why I propose amendment 11.

Referring to the Clywch report recommendation on the conduct of staff at disciplinary investigations, the children's commissioner highlights Assembly Government proposals for establishing an independent investigation agency, and for independent and legally qualified members of school disciplinary committees. In this context, I propose amendment 12, noting again the need for real independence in areas where conflicts of interest may arise.

The children's commissioner records his disappointment with the rate of progress since the publication of the Assembly Government's strategy to tackle child poverty, noting that an action plan is yet to be developed, and expressing his concern about the lack of urgency on an issue that he described in 2002 as a national disgrace. We know that the Institute for Public Policy Research states that the gap between the rich and the poor has widened since 1997. We also know that research by the Child Poverty Action Group stated that children are more likely to come from families on low incomes in Wales than in other parts of the UK: a third of Welsh children live in homes with less than half the UK average income. One in five Welsh working-age households now has no-one in employment, and 16 per cent of Welsh children are being brought up in households where no-one works—hence the concern expressed in amendment 13.

The children's commissioner details concerns about the continuing failure in Wales of child and adolescent mental health services to provide an adequate response. He also highlights the gap in mental health services for many 16 to 18-year-olds. I am well aware of these concerns in the context of young people on the autistic spectrum, who, I believe, are excluded from the CAMHS criteria—hence amendment 14.

ac arian. Yng nghyd-destun y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, mae'r comisiynydd plant hefyd yn mynegi pryder na chafwyd unrhyw arwydd o lefel yr ariannu y gellir ei ddisgwyl i ddechrau'r broses weithredu. Dyna pam yr wyf yn cynnig gwelliant 11.

I gyfeirio at argymhelliad adroddiad Clywch ar ymddygiad staff mewn ymchwiliadau disgyblu, mae'r comisiynydd plant yn tynnu sylw at gynigion Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar gyfer sefydlu asiantaeth ymchwilio annibynnol, a chael aelodau annibynnol gyda chymwysterau cyfreithiol ar bwyllgorau disgyblu ysgolion. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, cynigiau welliant 12, gan nodi unwaith eto fod angen annibyniaeth wirioneddol mewn meysydd lle gellid cael gwrthdaro rhwng buddiannau.

Mae'r comisiynydd plant yn cofnodi ei siom am y cynnydd ers cyhoeddi strategaeth Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, gan ddweud nad oes cynllun gweithredu wedi'i ddatblygu eto, a chan fynegi ei bryder am y diffyg brys ar fater a ddisgrifiwyd ganddo yn 2002 fel gwarth cenedlaethol. Gwyddom fod y Sefydliad Ymchwil Polisi Cyhoeddus yn datgan bod y bwlb rhwng y cyfoethog a'r tlawd wedi ehangu er 1997. Gwyddom hefyd fod ymchwil gan y Grŵp Gweithredu ar Dlodi Plant wedi datgan bod plant yn fwy tebygol o ddod o deuluoedd ar incwm isel yng Nghymru nag mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU: mae traean plant Cymru yn byw mewn cartrefi sydd â llai na hanner incwm cyfartalog y DU. Mae un cartref o bob pump o oedran gweithio yng Nghymru bellach heb neb mewn cyflogaeth, ac mae 16 y cant o blant Cymru yn cael eu magu mewn cartrefi lle nad oes neb yn gweithio—sy'n egluro'r pryder a fynegir yng ngwelliant 13.

Mae'r comisiynydd plant yn rhestru pryderon am fethiant parhaus gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru i ddarparu ymateb digonol. Mae hefyd yn tynnu sylw at y bwlb mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar gyfer nifer o bobl ifanc 16 i 18 oed. Gwn yn dda am y pryderon hyn yng nghyd-destun pobl ifanc ar y sbectrwm awtistig, sydd, mi gredaf, yn cael eu heithrio o'r meini prawf CAMHS—felly

dyna welliant 14.

Amendment 15 supports the statement by the children's commissioner that bullying has continued to be an issue raised by children and young people, and his conclusion that fixed-term projects should focus not only on direct work with children and young people, but also on building capacity and establishing structures within schools, youth groups and communities to ensure that the lessons learned are not lost and a sustainable legacy remains—those are his words. Amendment 16 reflects the children's commissioner's goal of ensuring that all those responsible for raising children and young people in Wales are able to access support, information and advice when they need it. I note, in particular, the parents of children with additional learning needs who have come to me for help, unaware of the existence even of parent partnerships. We must now await the outcome of consultation on the parenting action plan, in the hope that the rhetoric, in this instance, becomes a reality. I am pleased that the Minister states that she will support amendments 10, 12, 15 and 16, but all our amendments, apart from amendment 9, are taken directly from this report. I therefore point out to Members that they cannot vote against those other amendments without also appearing to vote against this report. With reference to amendment 9, your vote today will be a judgment on your real commitment to social justice and to the wellbeing of two young children who have already suffered more than we should ask of any child in Wales today.

Peter Black: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 17: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that any review of advocacy contracts should be carried out working in full partnership with all advocacy service providers to produce a seamless service for children.

I propose amendment 18. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Mae gwelliant 15 yn cefnogi'r datganiad gan y comisiynydd plant fod bwlio wedi parhau'n fater a godir gan blant a phobl ifanc, a'i gasgliad y dylai prosiectau cyfnod sefydlog ganolbwyntio nid yn unig ar waith uniongyrchol gyda phlant a phobl ifanc, ond hefyd ar gynyddu gallu ac adnoddau a sefydlu strwythurau mewn ysgolion, grwpiau ieuenctid a chymunedau i sicrhau nad yw'r gwersi a ddysgwyd yn mynd yn angof a bod etifeddiaeth gynaliadwy yn parhau—dyna ei eiriau ef. Mae gwelliant 16 yn adlewyrchu nod y comisiynydd plant o sicrhau bod pawb sy'n gyfrifol am fagu plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru yn gallu cael cymorth, gwybodaeth a chyngor pan fydd arnynt eu hangen. Soniaf yn arbennig am rieni plant ag anghenion dysgu ychwanegol sydd wedi dod ataf am gymorth, heb wybod am fodolaeth partneriaethau rhieni hyd yn oed. Rhaid inni yn awr aros am ganlyniad ymgynghori am y cynllun gweithredu rhianta, gan obeithio y daw'r rhethreg, yn yr achos hwn, yn realiti. Yr wyf yn falch fod y Gweinidog yn datgan y bydd yn cefnogi gwelliannau 10, 12, 15 ac 16, ond daw pob un o'n gwelliannau, ar wahân i welliant 9, yn uniongyrchol o'r adroddiad hwn. Esboniaf wrth yr Aelodau, felly, na allant bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliannau eraill hynny heb hefyd ymddangos fel pe baent yn pleidleisio yn erbyn yr adroddiad hwn. Gan gyfeirio at welliant 9, bydd eich pleidlais heddiw yn arwydd o'ch ymrwymiad gwirioneddol i gyfiawnder cymdeithasol ac i les dau blentyn ifanc sydd eisoes wedi dioddef mwy nag y dylem ei ddisgwyl i unrhyw blentyn ei ddioddef yng Nghymru heddiw.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 17: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu y dylai unrhyw adolygiad o gontractau eiriolaeth gael ei gynnal drwy weithio mewn partneriaeth lawn â'r holl ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eiriolaeth i gynhyrchu gwasanaeth di-dor i blant.

Cynigiaf welliant 18. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to ensure that local bodies are adequately funded to implement the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i sicrhau bod cyrff lleol yn cael digon o gyllid i weithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth.

I propose amendment 19. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiad welliant 19. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to effectively communicate and encourage parents, carers and children on the safe usage of the internet and new technologies.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfathrebu'n effeithiol â rhieni, gofalwyr a phlant ynghylch defnyddio'r rhyngwyd a thechnolegau newydd yn ddiogel ac i'w hannog i wneud hynny.

I propose amendment 20. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiad welliant 20. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to publish a list of all the recommendations from recent child protection reports and provide regular updates to the National Assembly for Wales on its progress in their implementation.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyhoeddi rhestr o'r holl argymhellion o adroddiadau amddiffyn plant yn ddiweddar a rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf yn rheolaidd i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru am ei hynt o ran eu rhoi ar waith.

I propose amendment 21. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiad welliant 21. ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make tackling child poverty a priority.

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant.

I propose amendment 22. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiad welliant 22. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

regrets the continued slow progress made by the Welsh Assembly Government in implementing the CAMHS strategy.

yn gresynu at arafwch parhaus cynnydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran rhoi'r strategaeth gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl plant a phobl ifanc ar waith.

The importance of this report lies not in the fact that it details the work of the children's commissioner over the last year, but in the issues that it raises. Although 22 amendments seem like a lot, they at least have the merit of drawing out some of the more important points from the report and putting them on the table so that the Minister can answer them. On 13 March, the combined membership of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, the Health and Social Services Committee and the Equality of Opportunity Committee will scrutinise this

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn bwysig nid am ei fod yn manylu ar waith y comisiynydd plant dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, ond oherwydd y materion y mae'n eu codi. Er bod 22 o welliannau yn ymddangos yn niferus, maent o leiaf yn tynnu sylw at rai o'r pwyntiau pwysicaf yn yr adroddiad ac yn eu cyflwyno gerbron fel y gall y Gweinidog eu hateb. Ar 13 Mawrth, bydd aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal gyda'i gilydd yn craffu ar yr adroddiad hwn. Gan mai'r Pwyllgor Addysg

report. As the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee is the lead committee on this, I will be chairing that meeting, and I would encourage the four Ministers concerned to make every effort to attend. That is because it seems to me that, with regard to this report, there are more questions to be answered by them than by the commissioner.

The Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has already questioned the Minister on the Government's progress in implementing the recommendations of the Clywch report, and Janet Ryder also dealt with that. However, I note from the report that although the Assembly Government has said that it will implement the recommendations of the commissioner's report on children's complaints and advocacy arrangements, concern remains about the development of children's complaints officers within social services departments. At the time of writing the report, the commissioner was aware of only 10 local authorities that had developed the role of a children's complaints officer. This is something that I hope the Minister will be able to address in her response, and, no doubt, is something that will be brought up in the joint committee session. A lot of coverage is being given today to the children's commissioner's views on the Government's respect agenda. Although I would not state the issue in the same way as Peter Clarke, I believe that there is a valid issue here that requires some mature reflection.

All politicians receive complaints about anti-social behaviour and have sought to respond to these issues by involving the police or seeking suitable powers to deal with persistent offenders. Under this Government, there has been a succession of Acts of Parliament creating those powers, whether anti-social behaviour orders, exclusion zones or some other device. However, what has been missing in all of this, and particularly in the rhetoric around it, is balance. It is inevitable that if politicians continually demonise young people, then those youngsters will feel devalued. I do not often hear about those instances where young people have made a positive contribution to

a Dysgu Gydol Oes yw'r pwyllgor arwain ar hyn, fi fydd yn cadeirio'r cyfarfod hwnnw, a byddwn yn annog y pedwar Gweinidog dan sylw i ymdrechu'n galed i fod yn bresennol. Y rheswm am hynny yw ei bod yn ymddangos i mi, o ran yr adroddiad hwn, fod mwy o gwestiynau i'w hateb ganddynt hwy na chan y comisiynydd.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes eisoes wedi holi'r Gweinidog ynghylch cynnydd y Llywodraeth wrth weithredu argymhellion adroddiad Clywch, ac ymdriniodd Janet Ryder â hynny hefyd. Fodd bynnag, sylwaf o'r adroddiad, er bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi dweud y bydd yn gweithredu argymhellion adroddiad y comisiynydd ar drefniadau cwyno ac eiriolaeth plant, fod pryder o hyd ynglŷn â datblygiad swyddogion cwynion plant mewn adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Adeg ysgrifennu'r adroddiad, dim ond 10 awdurdod lleol y gwyddai'r comisiynydd amdanynt a oedd wedi datblygu rôl swyddogion cwynion plant. Mae hwn yn rhywbeth y gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog fynd i'r afael ag ef yn ei hymateb, ac yn sicrhau mae'n rhywbeth a fydd yn cael ei godi yn sesiwn y cydbwyllgor. Rhoddir llawer o sylw heddiw i safbwyntiau'r comisiynydd plant ar yr agenda parch gan y Llywodraeth. Er na fyddwn yn gosod y mater yn yr un ffordd â Peter Clarke, credaf fod yma fater dilys sy'n gofyn am ystyriaeth aeddfed.

Bydd pob gwleidydd yn cael cwynion am ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac wedi ceisio ymateb i'r materion hyn drwy gynnwys yr heddlu neu geisio cael pwerau addas i ddelio â throseddwr parhaus. O dan y Llywodraeth hon, cafwyd cyfres o Ddeddfau Seneddol i greu'r pwerau hynny, boed yn orchmynion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, ardaloedd dan waharddiad neu ryw ddyfais arall. Fodd bynnag, yr hyn sydd wedi bod ar goll yn hyn oll, ac yn enwedig yn y rhethreg o'i gwmpas, yw cydbwysedd. Mae'n anochel, os bydd gwleidyddion yn pardduo pobl ifanc yn barhaus, y bydd y bobl ifanc hynny'n teimlo'n ddiwerth. Ni fyddaf yn clywed yn aml am yr achosion hynny lle mae pobl ifanc

their community or to society. We all now make efforts to elicit young people's views through youth councils, school councils and so on, but we do not often trust them with real responsibility, by, for example, allowing them to vote at the age of 16, or funding them to run their own facilities, and nor do we tend to respond to issues of anti-social behaviour by investing in young people, and by providing funding streams for proper facilities to engage them. I have been arguing for years for such a fund, yet we have made no progress. Instead, valuable facilities, such as the KPC Youth Project in Bridgend, which regularly takes 70 to 100 youngsters off the streets of Kenfig Hill, Pyle and Cornelly, now face closure because they cannot secure core funding.

wedi gwneud cyfraniad cadarnhaol i'w cymuned neu i gymdeithas. Yr ydym i gyd bellach yn gwneud ymdrech i gael safbwyntiau pobl ifanc drwy gyfrwng cynghorau ieuencid, cynghorau ysgol, ac ati. Ond nid ydym yn aml yn ymddiried ynddynt i roi cyfrifoldeb gwirioneddol iddynt, er enghraifft, drwy ganiatáu iddynt bleidleisio yn 16 oed, neu eu hariannu i redeg eu cyfleusterau eu hunain. Nid ydym ychwaith yn dueddol o ymateb i faterion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol drwy fuddsoddi mewn pobl ifanc, a thrwy ddarparu ffrydiau ariannu ar gyfer cyfleusterau priodol er mwyn eu cynnwys. Bûm yn dadlau ers blynyddoedd am gronfa o'r fath, eto ni wnaethom ddim gynydd. Yn hytrach, mae cyfleusterau gwerthfawr, fel Prosiect Ieuencid KPC ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr, sy'n aml yn denu 70 i 100 o bobl ifanc oddi ar y strydoedd ym Mynydd Cynffig, y Pîl a Chorneli, nawr mewn perygl o gael eu cau oherwydd na allant sicrhau arian craidd.

4.40 p.m.

I will conclude by quickly addressing the amendments that were tabled by the Liberal Democrats. We will vote for all 22 of the amendments in front of us. However, on advocacy in particular, we believe that the Welsh Assembly Government must take a proactive role in engaging all partner agencies in reviewing this provision. In particular, we want to see a more comprehensive advocacy service for young people, so that they have a more effective voice in dealing with often faceless and difficult agencies. We believe that the proper funding of a national service framework for children, young people and maternity services is essential, and we will be looking for further assurances on this.

Deuaf i ben drwy fynd i'r afael yn gyflym â'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Byddwn yn pleidleisio dros bob un o'r 22 o welliannau ger ein bron. Fodd bynnag, o ran eiriolaeth yn arbennig, credwn y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gymryd rôl ragweithiol wrth gynnwys yr holl asiantaethau partner i adolygu'r ddarpariaeth hon. Yn arbennig, yr ydym am weld gwasanaeth eiriolaeth mwy cynhwysfawr ar gyfer pobl ifanc, fel y bydd ganddynt lais mwy effeithiol wrth ddelio ag asiantaethau sy'n aml yn ddiwyneb ac anodd. Credwn ei bod yn hanfodol ariannu fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth yn briodol, a byddwn yn disgwyl sicrwydd pellach ar hyn.

Like the children's commissioner, we are also concerned at the new threats to children that arise as technology advances, and would like to see the Welsh Assembly Government take a more positive and proactive role in informing people about those threats. We remain concerned about lack of progress on tackling child poverty, although we acknowledge that some progress has been made. In particular, we remain concerned

Fel y comisiynydd plant, yr ydym hefyd yn pryderu ynghylch y bygythiadau newydd i blant sy'n deillio wrth i dechnoleg ddatblygu, a hoffem weld Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cymryd rôl fwy cadarnhaol a rhagweithiol i roi gwybod i bobl am y bygythiadau hynny. Yr ydym yn dal yn bryderus am y diffyg cynnydd wrth fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant, er y cydnabyddwn fod rhywfaint o gynnydd wedi'i wneud. Yn arbennig, yr ydym yn dal

about the child and adolescent mental health services, and want to see more focus on both of these issues and more resources put into them.

Finally, we feel that, given the proliferation of reports on child protection issues, there is merit in bringing together all of the recommendations in one document, so that the Assembly can better scrutinise how they are being implemented. This is a huge agenda, which is increasingly critical. The appointment of a children's commissioner has enabled us to highlight these issues as never before. For that, we owe Peter Clarke and his staff a big debt.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I remind Members that I will impose a time limit of three minutes to the second.

Janice Gregory: This report demonstrates the positive effect of the office of the children's commissioner on the lives of children and young people in Wales. For that, I pay tribute to the commissioner and his team, some of whom I see in the public gallery here today. I note that the commissioner has highlighted the issue of homelessness among children in his report, and, as Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, I welcome that recognition of an issue that seriously affects children and young people. We all want to tackle homelessness, but when a child is made homeless, it is all the more distressing.

The Social Justice and Regeneration Committee has agreed to conduct a review of youth homelessness; I hope that the review will also look at cases where families with children are made homeless. I would also like to think that, unlike with the substance misuse review, this time, the commissioner will come and give evidence to the committee, because I am sure that committee members would welcome and value his input. The Assembly Government is also well aware of the problem—the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, Edwina Hart, recently opened a new hostel for up to 26 homeless families in Cardiff.

yn bryderus am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc, ac yr ydym am weld mwy o ffocws ar y ddau fater hyn a mwy o adnoddau'n cael eu neilltuo ar eu cyfer.

Yn olaf, o ystyried yr adroddiadau niferus ar faterion amddiffyn plant, teimlwn ei bod yn werth dod â'r holl argymhellion at ei gilydd mewn un ddogfen, fel y gall y Cynulliad graffu'n well ar y ffordd y cânt eu gweithredu. Mae hon yn agenda enfawr, sy'n gynyddol bwysig. Mae penodi comisiynydd plant wedi ein galluogi i dynnu sylw at y materion hyn yn well nag erioed o'r blaen. Am hynny, yr ydym yn ddyledus iawn i Peter Clarke a'i staff.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Atgoffaf Aelodau y byddaf yn gosod terfyn amser o dri munud i'r eiliad.

Janice Gregory: Dengys yr adroddiad hwn effaith gadarnhaol swydd y comisiynydd plant ar fywydau plant a phobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Am hynny, yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r comisiynydd a'i dîm. Gwelaf fod rhai ohonynt yma heddiw yn yr oriel gyhoeddus. Sylwaf fod y comisiynydd wedi tynnu sylw at fater digartrefedd ymhlith plant yn ei adroddiad, ac fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, yr wyf yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth honno i fater sy'n effeithio'n ddifrifol ar blant a phobl ifanc. Yr ydym oll am fynd i'r afael â digartrefedd, ond pan gaiff plentyn ei wneud yn ddigartref, mae'n fater llawer mwy gofidus.

Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi cytuno i wneud adolygiad o ddigartrefedd ymhlith pobl ifanc; gobeithio y bydd yr adolygiad hefyd yn edrych ar achosion lle mae teuluoedd sydd â phlant yn cael eu gwneud yn ddigartref. Hoffwn feddwl hefyd, yn wahanol i'r adolygiad o gamddefnyddio sylweddau, y bydd y comisiynydd y tro hwn yn dod i roi tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai aelodau'r pwyllgor yn croesawu ac yn gwerthfawrogi ei gyfraniad. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad hefyd yn ymwybodol iawn o'r broblem—agorwyd hostel newydd ar gyfer hyd at 26 o deuluoedd digartref yng Nghaerdydd Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio,

Edwina Hart yn diweddar.

The children's commissioner's report not only highlights the many achievements so far, but also maps out the challenges ahead. One such challenge that has occupied my thoughts recently has been Wales's high rate of teenage suicide. Recent statistics have revealed that Welsh teens are five times more likely to commit suicide than youths in England. These statistics came to light following the death of a young man at Pencoed train station. The people of Pencoed in my constituency—indeed, it is the village in which I live—were deeply shocked and distressed at such a tragic death and have asked questions as to what circumstances could have driven a teenager to such desperate measures and what can be done to stop future tragedies.

In order to address the issue and to prevent other tragedies from happening, we need to find out what drives young people to take their own life, why they feel that they have no other option open to them, and also to examine how best we could have supported them. As part of the strategy to tackle the problem, we need to ensure that counselling services are developed across Wales, and that young people who have particular worries or concerns are encouraged to seek the help and advice of counsellors.

I therefore welcome the Assembly Government's scoping exercise examining the current provision in Wales and its acceptance that a national strategy and counselling for schoolchildren should be developed. I also welcome the children's commissioner's plans to launch a dedicated freephone line for children and young people. The children and young people of Wales are our future and we need to make sure that we protect their future.

Leanne Wood: I welcome the opportunity to contribute to this debate, particularly in the light of the children's commissioner's comments in today's *Western Mail*. I welcome Peter Clarke's intervention in the

Mae adroddiad y comisiynydd plant nid yn unig yn tynnu sylw at y llwyddiannau niferus hyd yma, ond mae hefyd yn mapio'r heriau sydd o'n blaenau. Un her felly y bwm yn meddwl llawer amdani'n ddiweddar yw cyfradd uchel yr achosion o hunanladdiad ymhlith plant yn eu harddegau yng Nghymru. Dangosodd ystadegau'n ddiweddar fod pobl ifanc yn eu harddegau yng Nghymru bum gwaith yn fwy tebygol o gyflawni hunanladdiad na phobl ifanc yn Lloegr. Daeth yr ystadegau hyn i'r wyneb yn dilyn marwolaeth dyn ifanc yng ngorsaf drenau Pen-coed. Yr oedd y bobl o Ben-coed yn fy etholaeth i—yn wir, dyna'r pentref lle yr wyf yn byw—wedi'u harswydo'n fawr ac yn flin iawn i glywed am farwolaeth mor drasig. Maent wedi gofyn cwestiynau ynglŷn â pha amgylchiadau a allai fod wedi gyrru person ifanc yn ei arddegau i'r fath anobaith, a beth y gellir ei wneud i atal trasiediau yn y dyfodol.

Er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn ac atal trasiediau eraill rhag digwydd, mae angen inni gael gwybod beth sy'n gyrru pobl ifanc i ladd eu hunain, pam maent yn teimlo nad oes ganddynt unrhyw ddewis arall, a hefyd i archwilio sut y gallem fod wedi eu cefnogi orau. Fel rhan o'r strategaeth i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem, mae angen inni sicrhau y caiff gwasanaethau cynghori eu datblygu ledled Cymru, ac y caiff pobl ifanc sydd â gofidiau neu bryderon arbennig eu hannog i ofyn am help a chynghor gan gynghorwyr.

Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r ymarfer cwmpasu gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad sy'n archwilio'r ddarpariaeth gyfredol yng Nghymru a'i bod yn derbyn y dylid datblygu strategaeth genedlaethol a gwasanaeth cynghori i blant ysgol. Croesawaf hefyd gynlluniau'r comisiynydd plant i lansio llinell ffôn benodedig am ddim i blant a phobl ifanc. Plant a phobl ifanc Cymru yw ein dyfodol, ac mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn amddiffyn eu dyfodol.

Leanne Wood: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl hon, yn enwedig yng ngoleuni sylwadau'r comisiynydd plant yn y *Western Mail* heddiw. Croesawaf ymyriad Peter Clarke yn y ddadl ar agenda parch

debate on New Labour's respect agenda, despite the fact that that contribution has been attacked by at least two New Labour Members of Parliament. In his contribution to the debate, Peter Clarke has said that politicians have taken a shoddy lead in the respect debate. He argues that the debate has all been about young people not showing enough respect to older people and that it has not been a two-way process—there has been no call for adults to show more respect for children and young people. He suggests that senior political leaders should demonstrate respect for our young people rather than preach at them, and I fully support that suggestion.

In my opinion, young people are in danger of being turned into scapegoats for almost all of society's ills. If you listen to the debate on drugs, binge drinking, anti-social and criminal behaviour, and even issues such as teenage pregnancy, these are all areas where young people are in danger of being demonised. If you listen to the New Labour Government's anti-social behaviour propaganda, you can easily be left with the impression that all crime, and the fear that that brings, is caused by young people. It is said that, most of the time, young people are hanging around street corners, but they do that because there is nothing else to do. I would suggest that this is not a new situation. I used to hang around on street corners when I was a teenager and I would bet that the majority of Members have done the same thing, and engaged in binge drinking.

Contrary to the popular belief that things are getting worse, I do not believe that they are. The things that are said about young people today are exactly the same things as were said about the young people of my generation, and I would argue that they were also said about the young people of Gwenda Thomas's generation. It does not take us long to forget what it is like to be young. You want to be with your mates, not adults, and if the street is the only place where you can do that, that is obviously where you will go. Peter Clarke has acknowledged that the debate on the respect agenda has been less bad in Wales. However, it would serve us all well to try to remember what it is like to feel young and marginalised in society. If we all

Llafur Newydd er bod o leiaf ddau Aelod Seneddol Llafur Newydd wedi ymosod ar y cyfraniad hwnnw. Yn ei gyfraniad at y ddadl, dywedodd Peter Clarke nad oedd gwleidyddion wedi dangos arweiniad digonol yn y ddadl ar barch. Maentumia fod y ddadl wedi ymwneud yn llwyr â diffyg parch pobl ifanc at bobl hŷn ac na fu'n broses ddwy ffordd—ni fu galw ar oedolion i ddangos mwy o barch at blant a phobl ifanc. Awgryma y dylai prif arweinwyr gwleidyddol ddangos parch at ein pobl ifanc yn hytrach na phregethu wrthynt, a llwyr gefnogaf yr awgrym hwnnw.

Yn fy marn i, mae perygl i bobl ifanc gael eu gwneud yn fychod dihangol am ddiffygion cymdeithas ymron i gyd. O wrando ar y ddadl ar gyffuriau, goryfed, ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol a throseddol, a hyd yn oed faterion fel beichiogi ymhlith merched yn eu harddegau, maent i gyd yn feysydd lle mae perygl i bobl ifanc gael eu pardduo. O wrando ar bropaganda Llywodraeth Llafur Newydd ar ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, gallwch yn hawdd gael yr argraff mai pobl ifanc sy'n achosi pob trosedd a'r ofn a ddaw yn sgil hynny. Dywedir bod pobl ifanc, gan amlaf, yn loetran ar gorneli strydoedd, ond gwnânt hynny am nad oes ganddynt ddim arall i'w wneud. Awgrymaf nad sefyllfa newydd yw hon. Arferwn innau loetran ar gorneli strydoedd yn fy nglasod, a mentrwn fod mwyafrif yr Aelodau wedi gwneud yr un fath, a goryfed hefyd.

Yn groes i'r farn boblogaidd fod pethau'n mynd yn waeth, nid wyf fi'n credu hynny. Yr un yw'r pethau sy'n cael eu dweud am bobl ifanc heddiw ag a ddywedid am bobl ifanc fy nghenedlaeth i, a byddwn yn dadlau iddynt gael eu dweud hefyd am bobl ifanc cenedlaeth Gwenda Thomas. Buan iawn y byddwn yn anghofio sut beth yw bod yn ifanc. Yr ydych am fod gyda'ch ffrindiau, nid gydag oedolion, ac felly os y stryd yw'r unig le ichi wneud hynny, dyna'n amlwg ble fyddwch yn mynd. Mae Peter Clarke wedi cydnabod nad yw'r ddadl ar yr agenda parch wedi bod cynddrwg yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, byddai'n dda o beth inni geisio cofio sut beth yw bod yn ifanc a bod ar y cyrion mewn cymdeithas. Pe baem i gyd yn gwneud

did that, I am sure that we could all look at this issue from a much more sympathetic perspective.

Denise Idris Jones: I also welcome this fourth annual report of the children's commissioner. When I took the report home, I read it on the train, and it reminded me of when I was working in a school, handing out school reports to pupils in brown envelopes. I am sure that many of those reports were pushed to the back of a drawer. This report looks far more upfront, but it is still concentrating on reasons as to why a child would want to push that school report to the back of the drawer, due to a lack of confidence and probably to try to hide his or her problems. This report draws on children's concerns and fears, but, at the same time, makes respect for others, especially respect for themselves—that is hugely important—a priority.

I well remember that sad time in Wrexham, prior to the publication of Sir Ronald Waterhouse's report, 'Lost in Care'. However, the Labour Government in the National Assembly appointed a children's commissioner because of that report and, in fact, he was the first ever children's commissioner. I very much agree with the fourth point on page 7 that says that children must play as full a part as possible in decisions that affect them—'them' meaning the children. For too long, parents have been the sole voice of the child, deciding which school they should attend—be it Welsh-medium or English-medium—whether they should study French and whether they need to be statemented. As a teacher, I often wondered why parents were not offered more support when invited into school to take part in their children's options choices. How are parents to instinctively know what their children would like to study in the future? Of course, we have to ensure that all recommendations made by the commissioner should be taken on board and delivered.

4.50p.m.

All schools should, during their personal and social education lessons, ensure that pupils are made aware that there is such a person as

hynny, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallem edrych ar y mater hwn gyda llawer mwy o gydymdeimlad.

Denise Idris Jones: Yr wyf fi hefyd yn croesawu pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant. Pan euthum â'r adroddiad adref, fe'i darllenais ar y trê'n ac atgoffwyd fi o'r adeg pan oeddwn yn gweithio mewn ysgol, yn dosbarthu adroddiadau ysgol i ddisgyblion mewn amlenni brown. Yr wyf yn siŵr fod lawer o'r adroddiadau hynny wedi eu gwrthio i gefn rhyw ddrôr. Mae'r adroddiad hwn i'w weld lawer yn fwy gonest, ond mae'n dal i ganolbwyntio ar y rhesymau pam y byddai plentyn am wrthio'r adroddiad ysgol hwnnw i gefn y drôr, oherwydd diffyg hyder a hwyrach i geisio cuddio'i broblemau. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn cyfeirio at bryderon ac ofnau plant, ond ar yr un pryd mae'n gwneud parch at eraill, yn enwedig parch atynt eu hunain-mae hynny'n hynod bwysigyn flaenoriaeth.

Cofiaf yn dda yr adeg drist honno yn Wrecsam cyn cyhoeddi adroddiad Syr Ronald Waterhouse, 'Ar Goll mewn Gofal'. Fodd bynnag, penododd Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gomisiynydd plant oherwydd yr adroddiad hwnnw, ac yn wir ef oedd y comisiynydd plant cyntaf erioed. Cytunaf yn gryf â'r pedwerydd pwynt ar dudalen 7 sy'n dweud ei bod yn rhaid i blant gael rhan mor llawn â phosibl mewn penderfyniadau sy'n effeithio arnynt hwy—wrth 'hwy', golygaf y plant. Ers yn rhy hir, y rhieni fu unig lais y plentyn, yn penderfynu i ba ysgol y dylent fynd—ysgol cyfrwng Cymraeg neu gyfrwng Saesneg—a ddylent astudio Ffrangeg ac a oes angen datganiad arnynt. Fel athrawes, byddwn yn pendroni'n aml pam na chynigid mwy o gymorth i rieni wrth gael eu gwahodd i'r ysgol i gymryd rhan yn newsiadau eu plant. Sut y mae rhieni i wybod yn reddfól pa bynciau yr hoffai eu plant eu hastudio yn y dyfodol? Wrth gwrs, rhaid inni sicrhau yr ystyrir pob un o argymhellion y comisiynydd a'u cyflawni.

Yn ystod eu gwersi addysg bersonol a chymdeithasol, dylai pob ysgol sicrhau bod disgyblion yn gwybod am fodolaeth y

the children's commissioner; that they can get in touch with someone who can give them some kind of help; that Wales has changed its approach; that there is someone to act as their champion. There is a lot more work to be done. In fact, where children are concerned, work is never done. The Labour Welsh Assembly Government has prioritised delivering improved services for children. The national service framework, Children First programme and an increased budget are just small examples—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Sadly, time has run out.

Denise Idris Jones: May I just—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order.

David Melding: I congratulate the children's commissioner, Peter Clarke, on the continued success of his office. We must remember that his was the inaugural appointment. It has set a standard that future children's commissioners will seek to emulate. He now heads for the final stage of his term. He will serve for seven years, and the appointment is not renewable, in order to preserve his independence. It is important that the office is independent of Government and any other institution that he or any future children's commissioner may have to comment on.

In this respect, I ask the Government to look at the Government of Wales Bill, and particularly at the explanatory notes, which say that in future the children's commissioner will be appointed by the Welsh Assembly Government. I do not think that that is a good way to operate. The appointment should be made in the same way as that of the auditor general and the public administration ombudsman. It should be an appointment made by the National Assembly. I hope that, at a later date, an amendment could be made. There may be a technical problem at the moment with primary law, but that appointment should not rest with the Government.

I congratulate the Government on

comisiynydd plant, y gallant gysylltu â rhywun a all gynnig cymorth o ryw fath iddynt; bod Cymru wedi newid ei hagwedd; bod yna rywun i weithredu fel eiriolwr iddynt. Mae llawer mwy o waith i'w wneud. Yn wir, yng nghyd-destun plant, nid oes terfyn ar y gwaith. Mae Llywodraeth Lafur Cynulliad Cymru wedi blaenoriaethau'r gwaith o ddarparu gwasanaethau gwell i blant. Ymhlith yr enghreifftiau mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol, rhaglen Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf a chynnydd yn y gyllideb—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Yn anffodus, yr ydym wedi rhedeg allan o amser.

Denise Idris Jones: A gaf fi—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn.

David Melding: Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y comisiynydd plant, Peter Clarke, ar lwyddiant parhaus ei swyddfa. Rhaid inni gofio mai ei benodiad ef oedd y penodiad cychwynnol. Mae wedi gosod safon y bydd comisiynwyr plant y dyfodol yn ceisio'i hefelychu. Mae bellach yn wynebu cyfnod olaf ei dymor. Bydd yn gwasanaethu am saith mlynedd ac nid oes modd ei ailbenodi, er mwyn diogelu ei annibyniaeth. Mae'n bwysig i'r swydd fod yn annibynnol ar y Llywodraeth ac unrhyw sefydliad arall y gallai fod gofyn iddo ef, neu unrhyw gomisiynydd plant yn y dyfodol, wneud sylwadau amdano.

Yn y cyd-destun hwn, gofynnaf i'r Llywodraeth edrych ar Fesur Llywodraeth Cymru, ac yn enwedig y nodiadau esboniadol sy'n dweud mai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a fydd yn penodi'r comisiynydd plant yn y dyfodol. Nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n ffordd dda i weithredu. Dylai'r penodiad gael ei wneud yn yr un modd â phenodiad yr archwilydd cyffredinol a'r ombwdsmon gweinyddiaeth gyhoeddus. Dylid ei benodi gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Gobeithio y gellid diwygio hyn yn ddiweddarach. Gall fod problem dechnegol ar hyn o bryd gyda deddfwriaeth sylfaenol, ond nid y Llywodraeth ddylai fod yn gyfrifol am ei benodi.

Yr wyf yn llongyfarch y Llywodraeth am

establishing the office in co-operation with the opposition parties, all of which were involved in the appointment. It was an inclusive approach, and I do not have any argument, but of course it was then a corporate body making the appointment. That is all I have to say on process.

School nursing is vital in promoting wellbeing in young people. Children will be more likely to access a school nursing service to talk about some of the difficulties and intimacies of adolescent life. We should all remember how traumatic adolescence can be, physically and mentally. We have heard about teenage suicides, but accidents also account for many deaths among young people. About half of these sudden deaths are thought to be preventable, but to prevent them takes great skill and requires a service that people can rely on. They need to know that it is there when they feel great anxiety or when they suffer some sort of overwhelming crisis. When that happens to you when you are young, you think that it happens only to you, that it is forever and that you will never get over it. When you are young, such experiences are particularly dangerous. We must work very hard to reduce the level of sudden death among young people.

Karen Sinclair: I thank the children's commissioner for his report. It helps us to track the progress of the policies that we, as the National Assembly, have followed across a range of children's issues, and it is, therefore, extremely useful. The development of a national service framework for children, young people and maternity services is rightly welcomed as a move forward in the way that we design and deliver health services for young people, as is the work of the Assembly Government to take forward the parenting action plan, which further supports parents and families.

Sadly, however, some of the issues that the commissioner brings to our attention highlight a concerning stagnation in certain areas of children's policy. Perhaps the most worrying issue, which is one that I have raised on many occasions, is the poor progress in improvement in child and

sefydlu'r swydd mewn cydweithrediad â'r gwrthbleidiau, a chafodd pob un ohonynt eu cynnwys yn y penodiad. Yr oedd yn dull cynhwysol, ac nid wyf yn gwrthwynebu hynny, ond wrth gwrs, corff corfforaethol a wnaeth y penodiad bryd hynny. Dyna'r oll sydd gennyf i'w ddweud am y broses.

Mae nyrsio mewn ysgolion yn hanfodol i hyrwyddo lles pobl ifanc. Bydd pobl ifanc yn fwy tebygol o ddefnyddio gwasanaeth nyrsio mewn ysgol i drafod rhai o anawsterau a phroblemau personol bywyd glasod. Dylem i gyd gofio mor drawmatig y gall y cyfnod glasod fod, yn gorfforol ac yn feddyliol. Clywsom am hunanladdiad ymhlith pobl yn eu harddegau, ond mae damweiniau hefyd yn gyfrifol am nifer o farwolaethau ymhlith pobl ifanc. Credir y gellid bod wedi atal tua hanner y marwolaethau sydyn hyn, ond mae gofyn cael medr aruthrol i'w hatal a gwasanaeth y gall pobl ddibynnu arno. Rhaid iddynt wybod ei fod yno pan fyddant yn teimlo pryder mawr neu'n wynebu rhyw argyfwng sy'n eu llethu. Pan fydd hynny'n digwyddi ichi pan fyddwch yn ifanc, yr ydych yn credu mai i chi'n unig mae hynny'n digwydd ac na fyddwch byth yn dod i delerau â'r peth. Pan fyddwch yn ifanc, mae profiadau felly'n arbennig o beryglus. Rhaid inni weithio'n galed i ostwng lefel y marwolaethau sydyn ymhlith pobl ifanc.

Karen Sinclair: Diolch i'r comisiynydd plant am ei adroddiad. Mae'n ein helpu i olrhain cynnydd y polisiau yr ydym ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wedi eu dilyn ar draws ystod o faterion plant, ac felly mae'n ddefnyddiol iawn. Croesewir datblygu fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol i blant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, a hynny'n gwbl briodol, fel cam ymlaen yn y modd yr ydym yn cynllunio a darparu gwasanaethau iechyd i bobl ifanc, fel y mae gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu rhianta, sy'n rhoi cymorth pellach i rieni a theuluoedd.

Yr wyf yn gresynu, fodd bynnag, fod rhai o'r materion y mae'r comisiynydd yn dwyn i'n sylw yn dangos bod y sefyllfa'n sefyll yn ei hunfan mewn rhai meysydd polisi sy'n ymwneud â phlant, ac mae hyn yn achosi pryder. Hwyrach mai'r mater sy'n achosi'r pryder mwyaf, mater yr wyf wedi'i godi

adolescent mental health services in Wales. Publication of the Assembly CAMHS strategy, 'Everybody's Business', received widespread support when it was announced because, for the first time, we had a dedicated and overarching plan to take forward the issue of children's mental health.

Although investment has been made, professionals and key workers on the ground still make the point to me that the service is in need of significant and long-term investment if the strategy's long-term goals are to be realised.

Regrettably, we still have a system of mental care for young people that is reactive and illness-based. Early intervention is absolutely key—I cannot stress that enough. The benefits to our young people of designing a system that seeks to be interventionist and pre-emptive, and which can adequately tackle the first signs of emotional and mental stress, would save many families from the agony of feeling that they have to face total crisis before they receive any help.

We wonder why we take so many of our young people into care. Part of the way in which we should be looking to tackle this issue is in recognising that we still do not offer support and expert help early enough. Early intervention would allow us to lessen the mental health problems later on, and it would also help to take the pressure off other social services that deal with more serious illnesses later. We could also avoid the tragedy of family breakdown, which people never get over.

I have not doubt that there is a will to get this service right, Jane, and not just in the Assembly, but with the staff who are expected to deliver. However, to date, families and young people are still being failed due to a lack of early intervention, and they will live with the consequences of that lack of service for the rest of their lives. I welcome your opening speech, Jane, and I will watch your progress carefully. There is no doubt that we need urgent action.

droeon, yw'r diffyg cynnydd i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed yng Nghymru. Cafodd strategaeth CAMHS y Cynulliad, 'Busnes Pawb', gefnogaeth eang pan gafodd ei chyhoeddi, oherwydd am y tro cyntaf yr oedd gennym gynllun penodedig ac eang ei gwmpas i ddatblygu maes iechyd meddwl plant.

Er y buddsoddiad, mae gweithwyr proffesiynol a gweithwyr allweddol yn y maes yn parhau i dynnu fy sylw at y ffaith fod angen buddsoddiad sylweddol a hirdymor ar y gwasanaeth os yw nodau hirdymor y strategaeth i gael eu gwireddu.

Yn anffodus, mae gennym system gofal iechyd meddwl i bobl ifanc sy'n dal yn ymatebol ac yn seiliedig ar salwch. Mae ymyrryd yn gynnar yn gwbl allweddol—ni allaf bwysleisio hynny ddigon. Byddai'r manteision i bobl i fanc o gynllunio system yn seiliedig ar ymyrryd a rhagweithredu ac sy'n gallu mynd i'r afael yn ddigonol ag arwyddion cyntaf straen emosiynol a meddyliol, yn arbed llawer o deuluoedd rhag y boen o deimlo'u bod yn gorfod wynebu argyfwng llwyr cyn cael unrhyw gymorth.

Yr ydym yn dyfalu pam yr ydym yn rhoi cynifer o'n pobl ifanc mewn gofal. O edrych ar y modd y dylem fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, dylem gydnabod nad ydym eto'n cynnig cefnogaeth a chymorth arbenigol yn ddigon cynnar. Byddai ymyrryd yn gynnar yn caniatáu inni leihau'r problemau iechyd meddwl yn ddiweddarach, a byddai hefyd yn gymorth i leihau'r pwysau ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol eraill sy'n ymdrin â salwch mwy difrifol yn ddiweddarach. Gallem hefyd osgoi trasiedi chwalu teuluoedd—rhywbeth sy'n effeithio ar bobl am byth.

Yr wyf yn sicr fod yna ewylllys i sicrhau'r gwasanaeth gorau posibl, Jane, ac nid yn y Cynulliad yn unig ond gyda'r staff y mae disgwyl iddynt ddarparu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, hyd yma mae teuluoedd a phobl ifanc yn cael eu siomi o hyd oherwydd diffyg ymyrryd yn gynnar, a byddant yn byw gyda chanlyniadau'r diffyg hwnnw mewn gwasanaeth am weddill eu hoes. Yr wyf yn croesawu'ch araith agoriadol, Jane, a byddaf yn gwylio'ch cynnydd yn ofalus. Yn ddiamau, mae angen

gweithredu.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Deputy Presiding Officer: As we are overrunning and cannot continue this debate after 5 p.m., I invite the Business Minister to propose an extension of 20 minutes, which should cover it easily.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Gan ein bod yn rhedeg yn hwyr, a chan na allwn barhau â'r ddadl hon ar ôl 5 p.m., gwahoddaf y Trefnydd i gynnig estyniad o 20 munud, a ddylai fod yn ddigon.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21, extends the time available for this debate by 20 minutes.

Cynulliad cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21, yn ychwanegu 20 munud at yr amser a ganiateir ar gyfer y ddadl hon.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: At least 10 Members must support the motion. I see that at least 10 Members support the motion, so we will move to a vote.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Rhaid i o leiaf 10 Aelod gefnogi'r cynnig. Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 Aelod yn ei gefnogi, felly, symudwn at bleidlais.

*Cynnig Trefniadol: O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 2.
Procedural Motion: For 32, Abstain 0, Against 2.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Butler, Rosemary
Idris Jones, Denise

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru: Parhad
The Annual Report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales: Continued

Jenny Randerson: In 2002-03, the children's commissioner criticised, as a key issue, children and adolescent mental health services. In 2003-04, the children's commissioner criticised those same services again as a key issue, saying:

'I regret to say that I am far less impressed with progress in the area of Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services. While the Health and Children's Minister's announcement of an additional £700,000 for these services after my last year's report was welcome, it is totally inadequate in the face of the continuing crisis in provision.'

Yesterday, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning referred in a briefing to the £1.2 million available, but I am sure that the children's commissioner will continue to regard the amount of money available as inadequate because this year, he has again criticised these same services. He has been specific this year in criticising the gap in service for those aged between 16 and 18, because child and adolescent mental health services operate for children up to the age of 16, unless they are in full-time education, and adult mental health services are for those aged from 18. Therefore, there is a specific gap for 16 to 18-year-olds. He has specifically criticised the disgrace—his word, not mine—of sending young people aged between 16 and 18 out of Wales for mental health treatment. He has also criticised the treatment of children on adult wards.

We are all well aware of the real and serious problems in mental health services in general, but I will take this opportunity, briefly, to emphasise the importance of dealing with this gap. For example, 18 months on from an announcement of £0.5 million to provide emergency beds for children and young people with mental health problems, those beds are still not being provided according to

Jenny Randerson: Yn 2002-03, yr oedd y comisiynydd plant, fel mater allweddol, yn beirniadu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed. Yn 2003-04, yr oedd y comisiynydd plant yn beirniadu'r union wasanaethau eto fel prif fater gan ddweud:

'Mae'n flin gennyf ddweud fy mod yn llawer llai bodlon ar y cynnydd ym maes Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl i Blant a Phobl Ifanc. Er bod cyhoeddiad y Gweinidog Iechyd a Phlant ynghylch £700,000 ychwanegol i'r gwasanaeth hyn yn dilyn fy adroddiad y llynedd i'w groesawu, mae'n gwbl annigonol yn wyneb yr argyfwng sy'n parhau o ran darpariaeth.'

Ddoe, cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes mewn briff at y £1.2 miliwn sydd ar gael, ond yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y comisiynydd plant yn dal i ystyried bod yr arian sydd ar gael yn annigonol am ei fod, eleni eto, wedi beirniadu'r union wasanaethau hyn. Mae wedi bod yn benodol eleni yn beirniadu'r bwllch yn y gwasanaeth i'r rheini rhwng 16 a 18 oed, oherwydd mae gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed yn gweithredu ar gyfer plant hyd at 16 oed, oni bai eu bod mewn addysg llawn amser, ac mae gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i oedolion ar gyfer pobl o 18 oed. Felly, mae bwllch penodol ar gyfer pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed. Mae wedi beirniadu'n benodol y gwarth—ei air ef, nid fy ngair i—o anfon pobl ifanc rhwng 16 a 18 oed allan o Gymru i gael triniaeth iechyd meddwl. Beirniadodd hefyd achosion o drin plant ar wardiau oedolion.

Gwyddom i gyd yn dda iawn am y problemau real a difrifol mewn gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn gyffredinol, ond manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn, yn fyr, i bwysleisio pwysigrwydd mynd i'r afael â'r bwllch hwn. Er enghraifft, 18 mis ar ôl cyhoeddi £0.5 miliwn i ddarparu gwelyau brys i blant a phobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, yn ôl seiciatryddion mae'r gwelyau hynny yn dal

psychiatrists.

heb eu darparu.

5.00 p.m.

So, the speed of delivery leaves a great deal to be desired. I very much hope that Peter Clarke will not criticise the Government next year for the lack of action that has been the subject of criticism for the last three years.

Felly, mae cyflymder y cyflwyniad ymhell o fod yn foddhaol. Gobeithio'n fawr na fydd Peter Clarke yn beirniadu'r Llywodraeth flwyddyn nesaf am y diffyg gweithredu sydd wedi bod yn destun beirniadaeth am y tair blynedd diwethaf.

Jeff Cuthbert: As Chair of the all-party group on healthy living, I am glad that the all-party group is mentioned in the report on page 17. The commissioner is an observer at the group's meetings, and we very much appreciate the support that he has given for the first National Healthy Living Day in February last year, and we are confident of further involvement as we plan for National Healthy Living Week in May this year.

Jeff Cuthbert: Fel Cadeirydd y grŵp hollbleidiol ar fyw'n iach, yr wyf yn falch fod y grŵp hollbleidiol yn cael sylw yn yr adroddiad ar dudalen 17. Mae'r comisiynydd yn arsylwr yng nghyfarfodydd y grŵp, ac yr ydym yn gwerthfawrogi'r gefnogaeth a roddodd i'r Diwrnod Cenedlaethol Byw'n Iach cyntaf ym mis Chwefror y llynedd. Yr ydym yn hyderus o ymrwymiad pellach wrth inni gynllunio ar gyfer yr Wythnos Genedlaethol Byw'n Iach ym mis Mai eleni.

Ensuring that young people have a balanced diet is one of the key challenges that we face. The Assembly Government has been very active in this area with the free school breakfast schemes, the healthy schools initiative and the piloting of healthy vending machines. A great deal of work has been done in this area, but the commissioner fails to mention much of it in his report. Healthy food is mentioned, but only from the school nurse's point of view. Worryingly, the report suggests that schools should keep some fatty foods so as not to force children into eating healthily. I am not sure that this is the right message, and I urge the commissioner to review this.

Mae sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael deiet cytbwys yn un o'r prif heriau a wynebwn. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn weithgar iawn yn y maes hwn gyda chynlluniau brecwast am ddim mewn ysgolion, y fenter ysgolion iach a threialu peiriannau gwerthu iach. Gwnaed llawer iawn o waith yn y maes hwn, ond nid yw'r comisiynydd yn sôn am lawer ohono yn ei adroddiad. Sonnir am fwyd iach, ond o safbwynt y nyrs ysgol yn unig. Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder yw bod yr adroddiad yn awgrymu y dylai ysgolion gadw rhai bwydydd seimlyd er mwyn peidio â gorfodi plant i fwyta'n iach. Nid wyf yn siŵr ai dyna'r neges gywir, ac anogaf y comisiynydd i adolygu hyn.

However, giving our youngest the best start in life starts with giving them the best start to the day. It is widely recognised that there is a direct and powerful link between nutritional breakfasts and levels of pupil attainment. Three schools in my constituency that fall under the Communities First banner have taken part in the pilot scheme since September 2004. The schools are Bargoed Infants School, St Gwladys Junior School and Hengoed Primary School. The feedback has been overwhelmingly positive. The enthusiasm of the pupils, staff and parents is unmistakable. This is important because there should be more emphasis on the needs

Fodd bynnag, mae rhoi'r dechrau gorau i'n plant ieuengaf yn dechrau gyda rhoi'r dechrau gorau i'r diwrnod. Cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol fod cysylltiad uniongyrchol a phwerus rhwng brecwastau maethlon a lefelau cyrhaeddiad disgyblion. Mae tair ysgol yn fy etholaeth i o dan faner Cymunedau yn Gyntaf wedi cymryd rhan yn y cynllun peilot er mis Medi 2004. Yr ysgolion yw Ysgol Fabanod Bargoed, Ysgol Iau Santes Gwladys ac Ysgol Gynradd Hengoed. Bu'r adborth bod yn arbennig o gadarnhaol. Mae brwdfrydedd y disgyblion, y staff a'r rhieni yn ddigamsyniol. Mae hyn yn bwysig oherwydd dylid rhoi mwy o bwyslais

of children from deprived communities.

ar anghenion plant o gymunedau difreintiedig.

A particularly high number of cases with which the commissioner has dealt appear to have involved children aged between 13 and 17. I wonder whether more work can be done on pushing the policy changes for that particular age group, rather than concentrating on airing the views of much younger children, although that is also important. It would be a mistake if the commissioner gave the youngest in our country a voice only to leave the older voices in the shadows.

Mae nifer arbennig o uchel o achosion y bu'r comisiynydd â hwy fe pe baent yn ymwneud â phlant rhwng 13 a 17 blwydd oed. Tybed a ellir gwneud mwy o waith ar weithredu'r newidiadau polisi ar gyfer y grŵp oedran arbennig hwnnw, yn hytrach na chanolbwyntio ar gael barn plant llawer iau, er bod hynny hefyd yn bwysig. Byddai'n gamgymeriad pe bai'r comisiynydd yn rhoi llais i'r ieuegaf yn ein gwlad a gadael y lleisiau hŷn yn y cysgodion.

The commissioner represents young adults from 16 to over 18 years old. A pressing need of those within this age bracket is employment opportunities and the provision of skills to get a decent job. I hope that he will be proactive in this regard and visit further education colleges and other places to see what action his office can take to press this need to those in charge.

Mae'r comisiynydd yn cynrychioli oedolion ifanc o 16 i dros 18 oed. Mae cyfleoedd cyflogaeth a darpariaeth sgiliau i gael swydd iawn yn angen dybryd i'r rhai yn y grŵp oedran hwn. Gobeithio y bydd yn rhagweithiol yn hyn ac yn ymweld â cholegau addysg bellach a llefydd eraill i weld pa gamau y gall ei swyddfa eu cymryd i bwysu'r ar y rhai cyfrifol am yr angen hwnnw.

The commissioner is doing some great work. I hope that he continues this work and brings the benefit that he has brought to certain groups of young people to all young people in Wales who fall within his remit.

Mae'r comisiynydd yn gwneud gwaith gwych. Gobeithio y bydd yn parhau ei waith ac yn dod â'r buddiannau y mae wedi eu sicrhau i grwpiau penodol o bobl ifanc i holl bobl ifanc Cymru sy'n rhan o'i gylch gwaith.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'n amlwg fod pob Aelod yn gytŷn bod angen cydnabod a chanmol y gwaith mawr a gyflawnir gan y comisiynydd plant a'i staff.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: It is evident that every Member agrees that the tremendous work done by the children's commissioner and his staff is to be acknowledged and praised.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â sylwadau David Melding am y gwasanaeth nyrsio mewn ysgolion; mae'n wasanaeth hanfodol, ac er bod cost ynghlwm wrth hynny, bydd y gost yn llawer llai na'r gost i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwaldol o ddelio â'r problemau hynny yn ddiweddarach mewn bywyd.

I agree entirely with David Melding's comments about the nursing service in schools; it is an essential service, and although there will a cost, it will be far less than the cost to the national health service of dealing with those problems later in life.

Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â sylwadau Jenny Randerson am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl. Mynegwyd pryder mewn tri adroddiad bellach gan y comisiynydd plant am y gwasanaethau hyn. Hoffwn ddatblygu hyn mewn ffordd benodol nad yw'n gwbl berthnasol i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ond sy'n fwy perthnasol

I agree entirely with Jenny Randerson's comments about mental health services. Concern has now been expressed about these services in three reports by children's commissioner. I wish to develop this in a specific way which is not wholly relevant to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, but which is more relevant to the

i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Credaf fod lle i ystyried comisiynu'r gwasanaethau hanfodol hyn ar lefel genedlaethol. Maent yn wasanaethau a anghofir yn aml yn y broses o gomisiynu'n lleol, gan eu bod yn isel ar y rhestr flaenoriaethau. Mae llawer o'r arian a bennwyd yn mynd at brosiectau eraill, a chaiff y gwasanaethau hyn eu gwasgu.

Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o'r angen dwys o ran gwasanaethau i blant a phobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, ond gallwch ychwanegu at hynny. Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog at blant a phobl ifanc gyda phroblemau bwyta, Mae hwn hefyd yn faes lle mae comisiynu lleol yn aml yn methu pobl ac yn arwain at ddarpariaeth sy'n amrywio yn ôl cod post. Byddwn hefyd yn dadlau bod lle i gomisiynu gwasanaethau ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau o ran cam-drin sylweddau ac alcohol. Mae'r gwasanaeth hwnnw hefyd yn amrywio yn fawr, a byddai comisiynu cenedlaethol yn mynd i'r afael â hynny.

Mae'n anrhydedd gennyf gadeirio'r grŵp trawsbleidiol ar awstiaeth, ac, amser cinio, cawsom gyflwyniad a roddodd ddarlun trychinebus o'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i blant a phobl ifanc ag awstistiaeth yng Nghymru. Byddai comisiynu cenedlaethol yn mynd i'r afael â hynny hefyd. Deallaf fod problemau, ond byddwn yn falch pe byddai'r Gweinidog yn trafod gyda'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a oes modd symud ymlaen gyda chomisiynu cenedlaethol ar gyfer y meysydd hyn. Byddai hynny'n sicrhau y ddarpariaeth sydd ei hangen ar ein plant a'n pobl ifanc a'r ddarpariaeth y mae'r comisiynydd plant wedi bod yn brwydro yn arwrol i'w sicrhau.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): This has been a wide-ranging and constructive debate, and it has shown the positive impact that the children's commissioner's annual report can have on what I believe is the collective will of the Assembly to back children and young people. The six key issues that he has highlighted, which are relevant to the rights and welfare of children, are concerns that we share and which have been expressed today. We are responding, as a Welsh Assembly Government, underpinned

Minister for Health and Social Services. I believe there is scope to consider commissioning these essential services on a national level. These services are often forgotten in the local commissioning process, because they are low on the list of priorities. Much of the allocated funding goes on other projects, and these services are then under pressure.

We are aware of the serious need in terms of services for children and young people with mental health problems, but you can add to that. The Minister referred to children and young people with eating disorders. This is also an area where local commissioning often fails people and leads to a situation where provision varies according to people's postcodes. I would also argue that there is scope to commission services for children and young people who have substance and alcohol misuse problems. That service also varies greatly, and national commissioning would get to grips with that.

I have the honour of chairing the cross-party group on autism, and at lunch time today we heard a presentation that painted an appalling picture of the services available for children and young people with autism in Wales. National commissioning would also deal with that. I understand that there are problems, but I should be grateful if the Minister would discuss with the Minister for Health and Social Services whether there is any way to move forward with national commissioning for these areas. That would ensure the provision that our children and young people need, and the provision which the children's commissioner has been heroically fighting to secure.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl eang ac adeiladol ac mae wedi dangos yr effaith gadarnhaol y gall adroddiad blynyddol y comisiynydd plant ei chael ar yr hyn y mae'r Cynulliad yn gyfan, mi gredaf, yn ei ewyllysio i gefnogi plant a phobl ifanc. Mae'r chwe phrif fater y mae'n tynnu atynt, ac sy'n berthnasol i hawliau a lles plant, yn bryderon yr ydym yn eu rhannu ac sydd wedi eu mynegi heddiw. Yr ydym yn ymateb fel Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, gyda chefnogaeth Confensiwn y Cenhedloedd

by the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child.

As David said, the independence of the role of the office of the children's commissioner has been key to our growing together in terms of understanding that respect, challenge and independence. The report on the safeguarding vulnerable children review, led by Gwenda Thomas, will be of crucial importance in relation to the response from the Welsh Assembly Government in respect of the effectiveness of policies and practices for safeguarding children in Wales. Many of the issues raised in this debate provide the wider context for that review and are key points regarding child protection.

I am disappointed, Janet, that you do not recognise the more positive response to the Clywch recommendations by the children's commissioner in his report. This is key, and, at the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee meeting last week, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning gave a detailed report on the recommendations, with dates for implementation. That is key, Janet.

Janet Ryder: I quoted the written record of that response. The Minister clearly said that no-one is doubting that some of these are difficult to implement, and there has been progress, but it has not been quick enough. Why, after two years, have we only just finished a mapping exercise of the services out there?

Jane Hutt: What is important, particularly in relation to counselling, which you mentioned earlier in the debate, is that we consulted children and young people to see what they wanted. That is the whole essence of how we empower and respect children and young people—we ask them what they would like in terms of an effective counselling service. The pilot schemes have taken place and £200,000 has been made available. We must work together responsibly by ensuring that we monitor how we implement those recommendations and give the dates for that, as the Minister has done. Again, we see a recognition of the partnership approach in the report. So, there is partnership within that independence and challenge.

Unedig ar Hawliau'r Plentyn.

Fel y dywedodd David, mae annibyniaeth rôl y comisiynydd plant wedi bod yn allweddol wrth i ni dyfu gyda'n gilydd i ddeall y parch, yr her a'r annibyniaeth honno. Bydd yr adroddiad ar ddiogelu plant sy'n agored i ddioddef, dan arweiniad Gwenda Thomas, yn hollbwysig mewn perthynas â'r ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i effeithiolrwydd polisiâu ac arferion ar gyfer diogelu plant yng Nghymru. Mae nifer o'r materion a godwyd yn y ddadl hon yn gosod y cyd-destun ehangach ar gyfer yr adolygiad hwnnw ac maent yn bwyntiau allweddol o ran amddiffyn plant.

Yr wyf yn siomedig, Janet, nad ydych yn cydnabod yr ymateb mwy cadarnhaol i argymhellion Clywch gan y comisiynydd plant yn ei adroddiad. Mae hyn yn allweddol, ac yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yr wythnos diwethaf rhoddodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes adroddiad manwl ar yr argymhellion, gyda dyddiadau i'w gweithredu. Mae hynny'n allweddol, Janet.

Janet Ryder: Dyfynnais y cofnod ysgrifenedig i'r ymateb hwnnw. Dywedodd y Gweinidog yn glir nad oes neb yn amau nad yw rhai o'r rhain yn anodd eu gweithredu, a bod cynnydd wedi bod, ond na fu'n ddigon cyflym. Pam, ar ôl dwy flynedd, nad ydym ond newydd orffen ymarfer mapio'r gwasanaethau sydd ar gael?

Jane Hutt: Yr hyn sy'n bwysig, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â chwnsela, fel yr oeddech yn sôn yn gynharach yn y ddadl, yw ein bod wedi ymgynghori â phlant a phobl ifanc i weld beth yr oeddynt am ei weld. Dyna yw gwir hanfod y ffordd yr ydym yn grymuso ac yn parchu plant a phobl ifanc—byddwn yn gofyn iddynt beth yr hoffent ei gael o ran gwasanaeth cwnsela effeithiol. Mae'r cynlluniau peilot wedi eu cynnal a £200,000 wedi ei ddarparu. Rhaid inni gydweithio'n gyfrifol drwy sicrhau ein bod yn monitro sut y byddwn yn gweithredu'r argymhellion hynny a rhoi dyddiadau ar gyfer hynny, fel y gwnaeth y Gweinidog. Eto, gwelwn gydnabod y dull partneriaeth yn yr adroddiad. Felly, mae yna bartneriaeth o fewn yr

annibyniaeth a'r her honno.

Many have spoken about the child and adolescent mental health strategy, 'Everybody's Business', which was launched in 2001. It set out a vision for a 10-year development of the CAMHS strategy and clarified that these services are the responsibility not just of health, but of education and other areas across the board. The fact that I announced £1.2 million of funding in 2004, increasing to £2.4 million in 2005-06, and that we have the service and financial framework targets and indicators for Children First, means that we are requiring action.

It is important—and Karen Sinclair and others made this point—that we look to workforce issues and to early intervention. Karen you referred to the importance of the roll-out of The Incredible Years, the Webster-Stratton programme, which is at the interface of recognising, at early stages, the issues that might lead to mental health distress in later years. We are addressing those issues.

5.10 p.m.

It is important that we recognise that we are developing a workforce that includes primary mental health workers. Significant progress has been made in terms of employing and training such workers, and there are currently in excess of 27.5 whole-time equivalent primary mental health workers in Wales. This is above the ratio of workers to children recommended by the commissioner in his report.

It is also key that we recognise, as we link through the CAMHS strategy, the points about school nursing, which many Members have made. As a result of the Cabinet sub-committee's discussions on children and young people, and as a result of a mapping exercise, an action plan is being developed to consider the role of school nurses. This, again, is an important response to the important points raised by the children's commissioner on school nursing policy, and we are recognising that school nursing has a key role to play in terms of the interface that school nurses have in every respect. That relates to the issues that you raised, Jeff, in

Mae nifer wedi sôn am y strategaeth iechyd meddwl i blant a'r glasoed, 'Busnes Pawb', a lanswyd yn 2001. Yr oedd yn gosod allan weledigaeth ar gyfer datblygu'r strategaeth CAMHS dros 10 mlynedd, ac eglurai nad cyfrifoldeb y maes iechyd yn unig oedd y gwasanaethau hyn, ond addysg a meysydd eraill yn gyffredinol. Mae'r ffaith imi gyhoeddi bod £1.2 miliwn ar gael yn 2004, yn cynyddu i £2.4 miliwn yn 2005-6, a bod gennym y targedau gwasanaeth a fframwaith ariannol a'r dangosyddion ar gyfer Rhoi Plant yn Gyntaf, yn golygu ein bod am weld cymryd camau gweithredu.

Mae'n bwysig—a gwnaeth Karen Sinclair ac eraill y pwynt hwn—inni edrych ar faterion y gweithlu ac ar ymyrryd yn gynnar. Karen, yr oeddech yn cyfeirio at bwysigrwydd cyflwyno 'The Incredible Years', y rhaglen Webster-Stratton, sy'n cydnabod yn gynnar y problemau a allai arwain at ofid iechyd meddwl mewn blynyddoedd i ddod. Yr ydym yn mynd i'r afael â'r materion hynny.

Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod ein bod yn datblygu gweithlu sy'n cynnwys gweithwyr iechyd meddwl sylfaenol. Gwnaed cynnydd sylweddol i gyflogi a hyfforddi gweithwyr felly, ac ar hyn o bryd mae mwy na 27.5 o weithwyr iechyd meddwl sylfaenol amser cyflawn cyfatebol yng Nghymru. Mae hyn yn uwch na'r gymhareb gweithwyr i blant a argymhellir gan y comisiynydd yn ei adroddiad.

Mae hefyd yn allweddol inni gydnabod, wrth inni wneud cysylltiadau drwy'r strategaeth CAMHS, y pwyntiau ynglŷn â nyrsys ysgol a wnaed gan nifer o Aelodau. O ganlyniad i drafodaethau is-bwyllgor y Cabinet ar blant a phobl ifanc, ac o ganlyniad i ymarfer mapio, mae cynllun gweithredu'n cael ei ddatblygu i ystyried rôl nyrsys ysgol. Mae hyn, eto, yn ymateb pwysig i'r pwyntiau pwysig a godwyd gan y comisiynydd plant ar bolisi nyrsys ysgol, ac yr ydym yn cydnabod bod gan nyrsys ysgolion rôl allweddol yn y cysylltiadau sydd gan nyrsys ysgol ym mhob ffordd. Mae hynny'n ymwneud â'r materion a godwyd gennyh, Jeff, am y datblygiadau

terms of the all-party healthy living developments, which are key in terms of children and young people.

Rhodri Glyn mentioned eating disorders, which have an interface in relation to the CAMHS strategy. We are anticipating the provision of 14 in-patient eating disorder service beds in south Wales by the summer of this year, and similar and equitable access to specialist eating disorder services for patients in north Wales. Therefore, we are moving on to recognise that responses have been given.

Jane has responded to your amendments, Mark, in relation to the children's commissioner and the appropriateness of legal powers. In terms of bullying, it is key that we recognise some of the points that the commissioner has made, because he is carrying out a thematic review and he says that now is not the time to make sweeping statements. Let us move forward and recognise that these are the issues that he is taking forward.

Finally, I turn to the points that have been made about respecting our children and young people in Wales. In bringing this debate to a conclusion, I think that we would all want to ensure that the Assembly sends out a clear and confident message that children's issues and interests are at the top of our agenda, and that we are determined to ensure that Wales continues to offer a safe and secure environment in which children can grow as informed, aware and engaged citizens. As David said, the office of the children's commissioner helps us to achieve this, and the commissioner's report and this debate has demonstrated that today.

byw'n iach gan yr holl bleidiau, sy'n allweddol o ran plant a phobl ifanc.

Soniodd Rhodri Glyn am anhwylderau bwyta, sy'n berthnasol i'r strategaeth CAMHS. Rhagwelwn y caiff 14 o welyau gwasanaeth anhwylderau bwyta i gleifion mewnol eu darparu erbyn yr haf eleni, a mynediad tebyg a theg i wasanaethau anhwylderau bwyta arbenigol i gleifion yn y gogledd. Felly, yr ydym yn cydnabod bod ymatebion wedi eu darparu.

Mae Jane wedi ymateb i'ch gwelliannau, Mark, o ran y comisiynydd plant a phriodoldeb pwerau cyfreithiol. O ran bwlio, mae'n allweddol inni gydnabod rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan y comisiynydd, gan ei fod yn gwneud adolygiad thematig ac yn dweud nad dyma'r adeg i wneud gosodiadau ysgubol. Gadewch inni symud ymlaen a chydabod mai'r rhain yw'r materion y mae'n gweithredu arnynt.

I orffen, trof at y pwyntiau a wnaed am barchu ein plant a'n pobl ifanc yng Nghymru. Wrth ddod â'r ddadl hon i ben, credaf y byddwn i gyd am sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn cyfleu neges glir a hyderus fod materion a buddiannau plant ar frig ein hagenda a'n bod yn benderfynol o sicrhau bod Cymru'n dal i gynnig amgylchedd diogel a sicr lle gall plant dyfu fel dinasyddion hyddysg, ymwybodol a chysylltiedig. Fel y dywedodd David, mae rôl y comisiynydd plant yn ein helpu i gyflawni hyn, ac mae adroddiad y comisiynydd a'r ddadl hon wedi dangos hynny heddiw.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 2: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 3: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 4: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 5: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 6: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice

Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 7: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 8: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 9: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun

Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 10: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 11: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 12: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 12: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue

Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 13: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 13: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

5.20 p.m.

*Gwelliant 14: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 14: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 15: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 15: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 16: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 16: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 17: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 17: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 18: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 18: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 19: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 1.
 Amendment 19: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 1.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 20: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
Amendment 20: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Gibbons, Brian

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 21: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 21: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 22: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.
 Amendment 22: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2852) as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. welcomes the fourth annual report of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, which was e-mailed to Assembly Members on 7 February 2006;

2. notes that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will draw up a response from the Welsh Assembly Government and report to the National Assembly on this by 31 March 2006;

3. calls on the WAG to prioritise the provision of consistent independent advocacy services;

4. notes the importance of independence in staff disciplinary investigation;

5. notes the need to build capacity and establish structures as a basis for a sustainable anti-bullying strategy;

6. notes the need for support for all those responsible for raising children which will lead to the development of accessible new services;

7. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to effectively communicate and encourage parents, carers and children on the safe usage of the internet and new technologies;

8. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to make tackling child poverty a priority.

Cynnig (NDM2852) fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn croesawu pedwerydd adroddiad blynyddol Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 7 Chwefror 2006;

2. yn nodi y bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn llunio ymateb gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac yn cyflwyno adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ynghylch hyn erbyn 31 Mawrth 2006;

3. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i ddarparu gwasanaethau eiriolaeth annibynnol cyson;

4. yn nodi pwysigrwydd annibyniaeth mewn ymchwiliadau i ddisgyblaeth staff;

5. yn nodi'r angen i feithrin gallu a sefydlu strwythurau fel sylfaen ar gyfer strategaeth gwrthfwlio gynaliadwy;

6. yn nodi'r angen am gefnogaeth ar gyfer pawb sy'n gyfrifol am fagu plant a fydd yn arwain at ddatblygu gwasanaethau newydd sydd o fewn cyrraedd pawb;

7. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gyfathrebu'n effeithiol â rhieni, gofalwyr a phlant ynghylch defnyddio'r rhyngwrwyd a thechnolegau newydd yn ddiogel ac i'w hannog i wneud hynny;

8. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi blaenoriaeth i fynd i'r afael â thlodi plant.

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary

Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
 Amended motion carried.*

Dadl Fer Short Debate

Addysg Celf a Chrefft ar gyfer Pobl dros 60 oed—‘Dawn neu Dystysgrif’ Art and Craft Education for the over 60s—A ‘Qualified Disaster’

Rosemary Butler: Four people have indicated to me that they wish to speak—Jeff Cuthbert, Owen John Thomas, Lisa Francis and Eleanor Burnham.

Rosemary Butler: Mae pedwar o bobl wedi dangos eu bod am siarad—Jeff Cuthbert, Owen John Thomas, Lisa Francis ac Eleanor Burnham.

Part-time art and craft classes, together with Mae dosbarthiadau celf a chrefft rhan amser,

other non-vocational classes, have always been popular with retired people in Wales. In the past, many of the students have been men and women who had always wanted to draw or paint, make pots, or have a go at weaving, but never had the time while they were earning a living or bringing up children. They signed up for part-time classes at the nearby local community education centre, and benefited from enthusiastic tuition by dedicated teachers.

Many of them attended classes year after year, and, while the standards achieved may have been variable, the added value of the fun and joy of meeting other like-minded people was immeasurable; because the students enjoyed the class, they persevered and improved at their own rate.

Attending classes encouraged people to leave their armchairs and television sets and make new friends. It also enhanced their self-confidence through the acquisition of new skills. An added bonus was that these classes provided paid employment for many of our skilled artists and craftspeople, who would otherwise have found it difficult to make a living on their art work alone.

However, the part-time education system was altered in England and Wales a few years ago to encourage people to gain new qualifications and skills for use in the workplace. Major changes were introduced in the teaching of all subjects, including non-vocational subjects. Adult part-time education is now organised in such a way that students must meet the requirements of Open College Network courses. Students work through a system of levels, and, as they gain ability, their progress is recognised by the awarding of credits and certificates.

Undoubtedly, that is extremely beneficial for the many students attending vocational courses, as the certificates that they are awarded can be presented to potential employers, giving proof of acquired skills.

ynghyd â dosbarthiadau nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol, yn boblogaidd erioed gyda phobl sydd wedi ymddeol yng Nghymru. Yn y gorffennol, dynion a menywod a oedd wedi bod ag awydd erioed i arlunio neu beintio, creu potiau neu roi cynnig ar wehyddu oedd nifer o'r myfyrwyr hyn, ond heb amser erioed pan oeddent yn ennill bywoliaeth neu'n magu plant. Byddent yn cofrestru ar gyfer dosbarthiadau rhan amser yn y ganolfan addysg gymunedol leol gyfagos, ac yn cael budd o hyfforddiant brwdfrydig gan athrawon ymroddedig.

Byddai nifer ohonynt yn mynd i ddosbarthiadau flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ac er bod y safonau cyrhaeddiad hwyrach yn amrywiol, yr oedd y gwerth ychwanegol o'r hwyl a'r pleser o gwrdd â phobl o anian debyg yn anfesuradwy. Oherwydd bod y myfyrwyr yn mwynhau'r dosbarth, byddent yn dyfalbarhau ac yn gwella yn eu pwysau.

Byddai mynd i ddosbarthiadau yn annog pobl i adael eu seddau cysurus a'u setiau teledu a gwneud ffrindiau newydd. Datblygai eu hunanhyder hefyd drwy feithrin sgiliau newydd. Bonws ychwanegol oedd bod nifer o'r dosbarthiadau hyn yn rhoi cyflogaeth am dâl i nifer o'n hartistiaid a'n crefftwyr medrus, a fyddai, fel arall, wedi ei chael yn anodd gwneud bywoliaeth gyda'u gwaith celf yn unig.

Fodd bynnag, newidiwyd y system addysg ran amser yng Nghymru a Lloegr rai blynyddoedd yn ôl i annog pobl i gael cymwysterau a sgiliau newydd i'w defnyddio yn y gweithle. Cyflwynwyd newidiadau mawr wrth ddysgu pob pwnc, gan gynnwys pynciau nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol. Mae addysg ran amser i oedolion bellach yn cael ei threfnu yn y fath fodd fel ei bod yn rhaid i fyfyrwyr fodloni gofynion cyrsiau Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored. Bydd myfyrwyr yn gweithio drwy system o lefelau, ac wrth iddynt ddod yn fwy medrus caiff eu cynnydd ei gydnabod drwy ddyfarnu credydau a thystysgrifau.

Mae hynny'n sicr yn eithriadol o fuddiol i'r myfyrwyr niferus sy'n mynychu cyrsiau galwedigaethol, oherwydd gall y tystysgrifau a ddyfernir iddynt gael eu cyflwyno i ddarpar gyflogwyr, yn brawf o'r sgiliau y maent wedi

However, I am told by many people living in my constituency who have either attended or tutored non-vocational leisure courses that, for them, these changes have proved nothing less than a disaster.

Students enrol on leisure courses because they want to meet other people with similar interests, or to enrich their lives by gaining additional skills and knowledge. They have no interest in gaining any sort of qualification, and yet OCN art and craft programmes are rigidly prescribed to meet a set level of accreditation, as if assuming that the student intends to make a career in the arts.

OCN courses are extremely prescriptive. They do not allow a student to develop at his or her own pace, or to follow up individual interests. That is particularly unfortunate in non-vocational courses, such as art and crafts, as it hinders the ambitions of some of the more experienced students who just want to do their own thing with the help of the tutor when necessary. The overly bureaucratic approach inherent in OCN courses is inappropriate to the teaching of non-vocational subjects. The rigidity of the classes, with their compulsory programmes and rolling examinations, is extremely off-putting to the over-60s—the very people whom we should aim to encourage into lifelong learning.

This sector of our community derives the most benefit from leisure classes, and is the most averse to the thought of having its work submitted for any formal examination or testing. To make matters worse, since 2005, the limited numbers of retired people who attend these classes are no longer eligible for a reduction in the cost of course fees; they now have to pay the full amount. As there are usually no non-vocational classes for people to join, other than those regulated by OCN, it is hardly surprising that the number of people taking up arts and crafts has fallen dramatically.

eu dysgu. Fodd bynnag, mae nifer o bobl sy'n byw yn fy etholaeth ac sydd naill ai wedi mynychu cyrsiau hamdden nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol, neu wedi bod yn diwtoriaid arnynt, yn dweud wrthyf fod y newidiadau hyn, iddynt hwy, wedi bod yn ddim llai na thrychineb.

Bydd myfyrwyr yn cofrestru ar gyrsiau hamdden am eu bod am gwrdd â phobl eraill sydd â diddordebau tebyg, neu i gyfoethogi eu bywydau drwy ddysgu sgiliau a gwybodaeth ychwanegol. Nid oes diddordeb ganddynt mewn ennill unrhyw fath o gymhwyster, ac eto mae rhaglenni celf a chreffft Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored wedi eu pennu'n llym i fodloni lefel achrediad benodol, fel pe baent yn cymryd yn ganiataol fod y myfyrwyr yn bwriadu dilyn gyrfa yn y celfyddydau.

Mae cyrsiau Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored yn gyfarwyddol iawn. Nid ydynt yn caniatáu i'r myfyrwr ddatblygu yn ei bwysau, na dilyn diddordebau unigol. Mae hyn yn arbennig o anffodus mewn cyrsiau nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol, megis celf a chreffft, gan ei fod yn rhwystro uchelgeisiau rhai o'r myfyrwyr mwy profiadol sydd am wneud dim mwy na dilyn eu trywydd eu hunain, gyda chymorth y tiwtor pan fydd angen. Mae'r ymagwedd fiwrocraidaidd iawn sy'n amlwg yng nghyrsiau Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored yn amhriodol i ddysgu pynciau nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol. Mae anhyblygrwydd y dosbarthiadau, gyda'u rhaglenni gorfodol a'u harholiadau treigl, yn digalonni pobl dros 60 oed—yr union bobl y dylem fod yn ceisio'u hannog i mewn i ddysgu gydol oes.

Y sector hwn yn ein cymuned sy'n cael y budd mwyaf o ddosbarthiadau hamdden, a dyma'r sector sydd fwyaf gwrthwynebus i'r syniad o gael ei waith wedi ei gyflwyno ar gyfer unrhyw arholiad neu brawf ffurfiol. I wneud pethau'n waeth, er 2005 nid yw'r niferoedd cyfyngedig o bobl wedi ymdeol sy'n mynychu'r dosbarthiadau hyn yn gymwys mwyach i gael gostyngiad yng nghost ffioedd cyrsiau; rhaid iddynt dalu'r swm llawn bellach. Gan nad oes dosbarthiadau nad ydynt yn rhai galwedigaethol ar gael i bobl ymuno â hwy fel rheol, heblaw'r rheini sy'n cael eu

rheoleiddio gan Rwydwaith y Coleg Agored, nid yw'n syndod fod nifer y bobl sy'n dilyn cyrsiau celf a chreffft wedi gostwng yn sylweddol.

Part-time leisure-based classes in Wales, such as courses in arts and crafts should no longer be subject to the straitjacket imposed by OCN regulations. I would like to see our community education centres bursting at the seams with older people, as they were just a few years ago, taking part in classes on embroidery, upholstery, pottery, carpentry, painting, sculpture, patchwork, the history of art, music appreciation, cake decorating, soft furnishing, basketry, jewellery making, and film and video classes.

Ni ddylai dosbarthiadau hamdden rhan amser yng Nghymru, fel cyrsiau mewn celf a chreffft, fod yn agored mwyach i'r cyfyngiadau llym a osodir gan reoliadau Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored. Hoffwn weld ein canolfannau addysg gymunedol yn llawn i'r ymylon o bobl hŷn, fel yr oeddent ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, yn cymryd rhan mewn dosbarthiadau ar frodwaith, clustogwaith, crochenwaith, gwaith coed, peintio, cerflunwaith, clytwaith, hanes celfyddyd, gwerthfawrogi cerddoriaeth, addurno cacennau, dodrefnu meddal, basgedwaith, gwneud gemwaith a dosbarthiadau ffilm a fideo.

In the past, I am sure that, like me, many Members will have been to wonderful exhibitions and open days of art and craftwork produced at leisure classes. Sadly, I have not been to such an exhibition for at least two years. The last one was a huge success, but the work is not there now to hold these exhibitions.

Yn y gorffennol, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd nifer o'r Aelodau, fel finnau, wedi bod mewn arddangosfeydd a diwrnodau agored gwych o waith celf a chreffft wedi ei gynhyrchu mewn dosbarthiadau hamdden. Yn anffodus, nid wyf wedi bod mewn arddangosfa felly ers dwy flynedd o leiaf. Yr oedd yr un ddiwethaf yn llwyddiant mawr, ond nid yw'r gwaith yno mwyach i gynnal yr arddangosfeydd hyn.

5.30 p.m.

The Welsh Assembly Government has put the welfare of elderly people at the top of its agenda. There is a strategy for older people, and soon there will be a commissioner for older people. Priority has been given to ensuring that older generations live in decent homes, and much attention is paid to improving their physical wellbeing. They benefit from free bus passes, free access to national museums, and now have the opportunity of free swimming. However, little is being done to expand their intellect and to give them healthy minds to match these newly healthy bodies. This afternoon, I ask the Minister to have discussions with leaders of Welsh local government to look at ways of providing assessment-free art and craft classes to older people in Wales for a nominal fee, or, preferably, free of charge. If she can do this, then the qualified disaster that I described will become an unqualified success story, with thousands of seniors

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi rhoi lles yr henoed ar frig ei hagenda. Mae yna strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, a chyn hir bydd comisiynydd ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Rhoddwyd blaenoriaeth i sicrhau bod cenedlaethau hŷn yn byw mewn cartrefi gweddus, a rhoddir llawer o sylw i wella'u lles corfforol. Maent yn elwa o docynnau bws am ddim, mynediad am ddim i amgueddfeydd cenedlaethol, a gallant bellach nofio am ddim. Fodd bynnag, prin yw'r gwaith a wneir i ymestyn eu deallusrwydd a rhoi meddyliau iach iddynt i gyd-fynd â'u cyrff iach newydd. Y prynhawn yma, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gael trafodaethau gydag arweinwyr llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru i edrych ar ffyrdd i ddarparu dosbarthiadau celf a chreffft i bobl hŷn nad ydynt yn cael eu hasesu yng Nghymru, am ffi fechan, neu am ddim, os oes modd. Os gall wneud hyn, yna bydd y ddawn neu dystysgrif a ddisgrifiais yn dod yn stori o lwyddiant

signing up again.

Jeff Cuthbert: I thank Rosemary for introducing this debate and for allowing me to speak. As a former principal of a part-time adult education centre, I absolutely understand the points that are being made, and I know all too well how important it is to many groups of people, particularly older people, to be able to come to art and craft classes and enjoy the experience. It is clearly quite wrong if they are obliged to have their work submitted for assessment. However, in my experience, I have found that their fears are often unfounded, and that the assessment is not as demanding as they may have first thought—very often, they become motivated by the experience. However, any form of compulsion is wrong, and therefore I fully support Rosemary's call. There needs to be balance and freedom of choice, without financial penalty to the learners involved.

Owen John Thomas: Cytunaf gyda phopeth sydd wedi cael ei ddweud, yn arbennig yr hyn y mae Jeff newydd ei ddweud. Mae'n bwysig iawn bod gan bobl dros 60 oed ddewis. Dylent allu dewis cyrsiau lle y gallant ennill tystysgrif, neu gael rhyw fath o gydnabyddiaeth o'r ffaith eu bod wedi cyflawni tasg arbennig, neu ddysgu rhyw sgil arbennig neu wybodaeth newydd. Fodd bynnag, ni ddylent gael eu gorfodi i wneud hynny. Dylai fod un dewis i bwy bynnag sydd eisiau gwneud hynny mewn un ffordd, a dewis arall i'r bobl sydd am gael tystysgrif.

Lisa Francis: I thank Rosemary for bringing forward this very important debate. What you have told us today is that taking part in arts and crafts is not just a question of rates or levels of participation, but of the kind of participation. You used a very important phase—'doing your own thing'. Just recently, we had a presentation in Brecon from the University of the Third Age, and retired people there were saying, 'We want to take part in all of these things, but once it becomes prescriptive, it's a bore'. There are people who just want to spectate and enjoy. They do not want to sit tests, exams and so on. That is true of the world of arts in general, in a way. When I visited the Community Arts Rhayader and District in

diamodol, a bydd miloedd o bobl hŷn yn cofrestru unwaith eto.

Jeff Cuthbert: Hoffwn ddiolch i Rosemary am gyflwyno'r ddadl hon ac am ganiatáu imi siarad. Fel cyn bennaeth canolfan addysg i oedolion rhan-amser, yr wyf yn deall yn iawn y pwyntiau a wneir, a gwn yn rhy dda mor bwysig ydyw i lawer grŵp o bobl, yn enwedig pobl hŷn, allu dod i ddisbarthiadau celf a chreffft a mwynhau'r profiad. Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn gwbl anghywir eu gorfodi i gyflwyno'u gwaith i'w asesu. Fodd bynnag, o'm profiad i, yn aml nid oes sail i'w hofnau, ac nid yw'r asesiad mor anodd ag y gallent ei ddychmygu i gychwyn—yn aml iawn, mae'r profiad yn eu cymell. Fodd bynnag, mae unrhyw fath o orfodaeth yn anghywir, ac felly cefnogaf Rosemary yn llwyr. Mae angen sicrhau cydbwysedd a rhyddid dewis, heb gosbi'r dysgwyr dan sylw yn ariannol.

Owen John Thomas: I agree with everything that has been said, particularly with what Jeff has just said. It is very important for people aged over 60 to have a choice. They should be able to choose courses where they can gain a certificate or have some kind of acknowledgement of the fact that they have completed a particular task, or learned a particular skill or gained new information. However, they should not be forced to do that. One choice should be available to those who want to do it in one way, and another to those who want to gain a certificate.

Lisa Francis: Hoffwn ddiolch i Rosemary am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig iawn hon. Yr hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddweud wrthym heddiw yw bod cymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau celf a chreffft yn ymwneud â'r math o gyfranogiad a wneir, yn hytrach na chyfraddau neu lefelau cyfranogiad yn unig. Yr oeddech yn defnyddio ymadrodd pwysig iawn—'dilyn eu trywydd eu hunain'. Gwelsom gyflwyniad gyflwyniad yn Aberhonddu yn ddiweddar gan Brifysgol y Drydedd Oes ac yr oedd pobl wedi ymddeol yno yn dweud, 'Yr ydym am gymryd rhan yn yr holl bethau hyn, ond pan gânt eu rhagnodi, maent yn mynd yn ddiflas'. Mae yna bobl sydd am wyllo a mwynhau yn unig. Nid ydynt am gael profion, arholiadau, ac ati.

Rhayader, I was informed of the 'have-a-go Shakespeare' that took place there for people of all ages and how remarkable it was, because it enabled people to cross boundaries and brought together people who would ordinarily not speak to each other on the street. It is that kind of activity that we want to see.

Eleanor Burnham: Diolchaf Rosemary am y cyfle i ddweud gair byr. Fel rhywun sy'n cymryd rhan mewn dysgu gydol oes pan gaf gyfle, yr wyf yn credu bod yr hyn a ddywedodd Rosemary yn hynod o bwysig. Yn y pen draw, cyn belled bod ansawdd y dysgu yn dda—ac mae angen rhyw fonitro o hynny—dylai pobl hŷn yn enwedig gael y siawns i fwynhau eu hunain, i gymdeithasu ac i gymryd rhan mewn unrhyw fath o gelf a chreffft. Gobeithiaf felly y bydd Jane Davidson yn gwranddo, ac edrychaf ymlaen i glywed ei sylwadau.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am grateful to Rosemary for this opportunity to emphasise the Assembly Government's commitment to supporting lifelong learning for all people in Wales. Learning opportunities and activities for older learners are an important part of our policy to create truly lifelong learning. New skills, new opportunities and new friends beckon in exactly the way that you have described for many people, who take the chances to learn that may not have been available to them when they were younger. We agree that it is important that these opportunities are not limited to those which are 'economically useful', because the confidence that comes from learning can come from learning to paint as much as from learning to use spreadsheets.

I am pleased that John Griffiths was here for your contribution, as he is the Deputy Minister for Older People, and he and I have been discussing these issues in the context of the older people's strategy. We want to continue to encourage people aged over 60 to take up the many and varied learning opportunities that are now open to them, and we know that there will be a great many more people over the ages of 60 and 65 in future

Mae hynny'n wir am fyd y celfyddydau'n gyffredinol, mewn ffordd. Pan ymwelais â Chelfyddydau Cymunedol Rhaeadr Gwy a'r Ardal yn Rhaeadr Gwy, cefais wybod am y prosiect 'rhoi cynnig ar Shakespeare' a gynhaliwyd yno i bobl o bob oed a pha mor rhyfeddol ydoedd, am ei fod yn galluogi pobl i groesi ffiniau ac yn uno pobl na fyddent fel arfer yn siarad â'i gilydd ar y stryd. Dyna'r math o weithgarwch yr ydym am ei weld.

Elaenor Burnham: I thank Rosemary for the opportunity to say a few words. As someone who participates in lifelong learning when the opportunity arises, I think what Rosemary has said is extremely important. At the end of the day, as long as the quality of the teaching is good—and some monitoring of that is necessary—older people in particular should have the opportunity to enjoy themselves, to socialise and to participate in any kind of arts and crafts. I hope, therefore, that Jane Davidson will listen, and I look forward to hearing her comments.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Hoffwn ddiolch i Rosemary am y cyfle hwn i bwysleisio ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gefnogi dysgu gydol oes i bawb yng Nghymru. Mae cyfleoedd a gweithgareddau dysgu i ddysgwyr hŷn yn rhan bwysig o'n polisi i greu dysgu gydol oes gwirioneddol. Cynigir sgiliau newydd, cyfleoedd newydd a ffrindiau newydd, fel y disgrifiwyd gennych, i nifer o bobl sy'n achub ar y cyfleoedd i ddysgu nad oeddent ar gael iddynt efallai pan oeddent yn iau. Cytunwn ei bod yn bwysig nad pobl sy'n 'ddefnyddiol yn economaidd' yn unig sy'n cael y cyfleoedd hyn, oherwydd gall yr hyder sy'n deillio o ddysgu ddod o ddysgu sut i beintio yn gymaint ag o ddysgu defnyddio taenlenni.

Yr oeddwn yn falch gweld John Griffiths yma ar gyfer eich cyfraniad, gan mai ef yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog dros Bobl Hŷn. Mae ef a minnau wedi bod wrthi'n trafod y materion hyn yng nghyd-destun y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Yr ydym am barhau i annog pobl dros 60 oed i achub ar y cyfleoedd dysgu niferus ac amrywiol sydd ar gael iddynt yn awr, a gwyddom y bydd yma lawer iawn mwy o bobl dros 60 a 65 oed yn y

years. We want to ensure, through our older persons' strategy, that we can keep them healthy for far longer and able to participate in activities that support their minds as well as their bodies.

The last year for which figures have been collected is 2003-04, when 15,000 people aged 60 or over took part in 23,000 local-authority-provided community learning activities, which are the kinds of learning activities that Rosemary is concerned about. Overall, more than 24,000 people aged 60 or over took part in further education courses across Wales. People are making active choices about whether or not to take a course that will have accreditation or a course that is, in a sense, more club-like and has a greater social commitment.

It is a tribute to older learners that they are such a large part of our community-learning contingent, and a real tribute to the providers and the tutors that they continue to offer courses across the range of learning that so many people want to join. While learners aged 60 or over took part in 6,700 arts and craft learning activities that year—it was the most popular area of community learning for that group—they also took part in well over 6,000 information technology learning activities. Older learners are clearly taking the opportunity to gain a wide range of skills in a number of different environments.

People are different: some want to be able to build up their skills piece by piece, and, for them, the opportunity to build up credits or to gain Open College Network or other qualifications is an important part of the attraction of learning. In fact, OCN qualifications allow people to build up portfolios to prove their competence in many different skills, and are a very flexible route to learning. Credits and qualifications for such part-time courses add to the value of learning for some older learners, as well as the rest of the population. We know, therefore, that many appreciate the opportunities that credits and qualifications offer and choose their learning route accordingly.

blynyddoedd i ddod. Yr ydym am sicrhau y gallwn, drwy ein strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn, eu cadw'n iach lawer yn hwy ac yn alluog i gymryd rhan mewn gweithgareddau sy'n cynnal eu meddyliau yn ogystal â'u cyrff.

Y flwyddyn olaf pan gasglwyd ffigurau oedd 2003-04, pan fu 15,000 o bobl 60 mlwydd a hŷn yn cymryd rhan mewn 23,000 o weithgareddau dysgu cymunedol yn cael eu darparu gan awdurdodau lleol, sef y math o weithgareddau dysgu y mae Rosemary yn pryderu amdanynt. Ar y cyfan, bu dros 24,000 o bobl 60 oed a hŷn yn cymryd rhan mewn cyrsiau addysg bellach ledled Cymru. Mae pobl yn gwneud dewisiadau gweithredol a ddylent ddilyn cwrs ag achrediad neu gwrs sydd, ar un olwg, yn debycach i glwb ac sydd â mwy o ymrwymiad cymdeithasol.

Mae'n deyrnged i ddysgwyr hŷn eu bod yn rhan mor fawr o'n carfan dysgu cymunedol, ac mae'n deyrnged wirioneddol i'r darparwyr a'r tiwtoriaid eu bod yn parhau i gynnig cyrsiau ar draws yr amrywiol feysydd dysgu y mae cynifer o bobl am ymuno â hwy. Tra oedd dysgwyr 60 mlwydd oed a hŷn wedi cymryd rhan mewn 6,700 o weithgareddau dysgu celf a chrefft y flwyddyn honno—dyna oedd y maes mwyaf poblogaidd mewn dysgu cymunedol ar gyfer y grŵp hwnnw—yr oeddent hefyd yn cymryd rhan mewn dros 6,000 o weithgareddau dysgu technoleg gwybodaeth. Mae dysgwyr hŷn yn amlwg yn achub ar y cyfle i feithrin ystod eang o sgiliau mewn nifer o amgylcheddau gwahanol.

Mae pobl yn wahanol: mae rhai am allu datblygu eu sgiliau'n raddol, ac i'r rheini mae'r cyfle i ennill credydau neu ennill cymhwyster Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored neu gymwysterau eraill yn rhan bwysig o atyniad dysgu. Yn wir, mae cymwysterau Rhwydwaith y Coleg Agored yn galluogi pobl i greu portffolios i brofi eu cymhwysedd mewn llawer sgil wahanol, ac maent yn llwybr hyblyg iawn i ddysgu. Mae credydau a chymwysterau ar gyfer cyrsiau rhan-amser o'r fath yn ychwanegu at werth dysgu i rai dysgwyr hŷn, yn ogystal â gweddill y boblogaeth. Gwyddom, felly, fod nifer o bobl yn gwerthfawrogi'r cyfleoedd y mae credydau a chymwysterau yn eu cynnig ac yn dewis eu llwybr dysgu yn unol â hynny.

However for others—particularly older learners—the idea of assessment in something that they enjoy risks ruining that enjoyment. Memories of exams and the fear of failure may colour people's expectations of assessment, yet much of the assessment in non-academic subjects, as Jeff said, involves the submission of a portfolio of work as evidence of learning, rather than formal end-of-course examinations. Often the fear of the kind of assessment is not borne out in fact. The concept of credit is founded upon a presumption of incremental learning at a pace that suits the learner, building confidence as well as competence as the learning progresses and the credits accumulate. It is difficult to create courses that involve assessment for some and not for others. However, with the flexibility that we are creating through the credit and qualifications framework, I hope that more people will give it a try.

I was pleased to visit a new learning centre in Bedwas with Jeff, which is a couple of miles from the edge of Rosemary's constituency, and is supported by the RISE network of the five former Gwent authorities. That centre, newly refurbished by the local partnership—and there are similar centres in Newport that are formally opening next month—offers facilities for learners of all ages in many different areas. Jeff and I met a number of older learners, who were extremely happy undertaking tapestry work, and traditional art and craft work, such as using the pottery kiln. Such mixed provision is very welcome, because alongside that the centre is running courses in automotive skills, which are targeted at younger learners.

5.40 p.m.

I have been to a number of exhibitions, as a local Assembly Member, in the Pontypridd area by local arts and crafts groups exhibiting in our local facilities. We want to encourage learning throughout life and our strategy for older people provides a coherent and joined-up approach to addressing the implications of an ageing society. Through the strategy, we aim to widen people's participation in learning, because that participation offers

Fodd bynnag, i eraill—yn enwedig dysgwyr hŷn—mae'r syniad o asesu rhywbeth y maent yn ei fwynhau yn peryglu dinistrio'r mwynhad hwnnw. Gall atgofion am arholiadau ac ofn methu liwio disgwyladau o asesiadau. Ond eto mae llawer o'r asesu mewn pynciau nad ydynt yn rhai academiaidd, fel y dywedodd Jeff, yn cynnwys cyflwyno portffolio o waith fel tystiolaeth o ddysgu, yn hytrach nag arholiadau ffurfiol ar ddiwedd y cwrs. Yn aml, ni wireddir ofn asesiad o'r fath. Seilir y cysyniad o gredyd ar y rhagdybiaeth o ddysgu cynyddol yn ôl cyflymder sy'n briodol i'r dysgwr, gan gynyddu hyder yn ogystal â chymhwysedd wrth i'r broses ddysgu a'r credydau Gronni. Mae'n anodd creu cyrsiau sy'n golygu asesu rhai ond nid eraill. Fodd bynnag, gyda'r hyblygrwydd yr ydym yn ei greu drwy'r fframwaith credydau a chymwysterau, gobeithio y bydd mwy o bobl yn rhoi cynnig arni.

Yr oeddwn yn falch ymweld â chanolfan ddysgu newydd ym Medwas gyda Jeff, sydd ychydig o filltiroedd o ffiniau etholaeth Rosemary ac yn cael ei chefnogi gan rwydwaith RISE pum hen awdurdod Gwent. Cynigia'r ganolfan honno, sydd newydd ei hadnewyddu gan y bartneriaeth leol—ac mae canolfannau tebyg yng Nghasnewydd a fydd yn agor yn ffurfiol fis nesaf—gyfleusterau i ddysgwyr o bob oed mewn nifer o feysydd gwahanol. Cyfarfu Jeff a minnau â nifer o ddysgwyr hŷn, a oedd yn hapus dros ben yn gwneud gwaith tapestri a gwaith celf a chreffft traddodiadol, megis defnyddio'r olyn lestri. Croesewir darpariaeth gymysg o'r fath yn fawr, oherwydd yn ogystal â hynny mae'r ganolfan yn cynnal cyrsiau mewn sgiliau cerbydau modur, sy'n anelu at ddysgwyr iau.

Yr wyf wedi bod mewn nifer o arddangosfeydd, fel Aelod Cynulliad lleol, yn ardal Pontypridd gan grwpiau celf a chreffft lleol sy'n arddangos yn ein cyfleusterau lleol. Yr ydym am annog dysgu gydol oes, ac y mae ein strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn yn ddull cydlynol ac unedig i fynd i'r afael â goblygiadau cymdeithas sy'n heneiddio. Drwy'r strategaeth, anelwn at ehangu cyfranogiad pobl ym maes dysgu, oherwydd

such benefits. We will want to develop that strategy in more concrete ways over the next few years. It is about encouraging older people back into learning, helping to build confidence, sustaining mental alertness and helping with the development of new skills. For some it is about becoming involved in community activity or improvement, or simply about coping with the demands of modern life.

While some of the wider benefits are difficult to pin down, it is accepted that continuing to study and learn keeps both mind and body active. People develop new social circles and routines that make them less likely to become dependent on social care: keeping a strong social network is important to keeping healthy. However, we must all recognise that resources are limited, in the Assembly Government as well as in the many learning providers. Therefore, we always have to concentrate resources where they are most needed. One particular issue for us is the lower-than-average level of qualifications among people aged over 50 in terms of basic skills. Improving basic literacy and numeracy does encourage people to come out of the house. We know that we have 440,000 adults aged between 16 and 65 who are without level 1 literacy skills and almost 1 million without level 1 numeracy skills. We know that Wales is worse than England in this regard, and the UK as a whole is significantly worse than countries such as Germany, Sweden and the Netherlands.

It is faced with facts and evidence such as that that we have to decide how to support the many different calls on the education and lifelong learning budget. However, we still offer support to learners who want to learn for learning's sake. The amount devoted to community learning represents a continuing commitment to the principle that people should be able to take up learning opportunities throughout life. That does not mean that we can afford to support every learner who wants to do the same course again and again. It does not mean that we can support learning that has no accredited outcomes regularly, but it does mean that we will continue to encourage people to learn at any age.

mae i'r cyfranogiad hwnnw fanteision felly. Byddwn am ddatblygu'r strategaeth honno mewn ffyrdd mwy cadarn dros yr ychydig flynyddoedd nesaf. Mae a wnelo ag annog pobl hŷn yn ôl i ddysgu, gan helpu magu hyder, cynnal craffter meddwl a helpu datblygu sgiliau newydd. I rai, mae'n golygu cymryd rhan mewn gweithgaredd cymunedol neu welliant, neu'n syml ymdopi â galwadau bywyd modern.

Er bod rhai o'r manteision ehangach yn anodd eu nodi, derbynnir bod parhau i astudio a dysgu yn cadw'r meddwl a'r corff yn weithgar. Mae pobl yn datblygu cylchoedd cymdeithasol ac arferion newydd sy'n eu gwneud yn llai tebygol o ddibyynu ar ofal cymdeithasol: mae cynnal rhwydwaith cymdeithasol cryf yn bwysig i gadw'n iach. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni bob un gydnabod mai prin yw'r adnoddau, yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ogystal ag yn y darparwyr dysgu niferus. Felly, rhaid inni bob amser ddyrannu adnoddau i'r meysydd lle mae eu hangen fwyaf. Un broblem benodol sy'n ein hwynebu yw'r lefel is na'r cyfartaledd o gymwysterau ymhlith pobl dros 50 oed o ran sgiliau sylfaenol. Mae gwella llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol yn annog pobl i adael y tŷ. Gwyddom nad oes gan 440,000 o oedolion rhwng 16 a 65 oed sgiliau llythrennedd lefel 1, ac nad oes gan bron i filiwn sgiliau rhifedd lefel 1. Gwyddom fod Cymru yn waeth na Lloegr, ac mae'r DU gyfan lawer yn waeth na gwledydd megis yr Almaen, Sweden a'r Iseldiroedd.

Yn wyneb ffeithiau a thystiolaeth fel hynny y mae'n rhaid inni benderfynu sut i gefnogi'r galwadau gwahanol a niferus ar y gyllideb addysg a dysgu gydol oes. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn dal i roi cymorth i ddysgwyr sydd am ddysgu er mwyn dysgu. Mae'r arian a ddyrennir i ddysgu cymunedol yn ymrwymiad parhaus i'r egwyddor y dylai pobl allu achub ar gyfleoedd dysgu gydol oes. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na allwn fforddio cynorthwyo pob dysgwr sydd am ddilyn yr un cwrs dro ar ôl tro. Nid yw'n golygu y gallwn gefnogi dysgu heb unrhyw achrediad yn rheolaidd, ond mae'n golygu y byddwn yn parhau i annog pobl o bob oed i ddysgu.

One possibility is to use a mechanism that works well elsewhere, particularly in countries such as Australia, which is that once people have been through courses, they establish clubs. That enables those who are participating for social reasons to be able to continue to do so, without the cost of regularly using tutors and other resources, while being able to use the people who particularly want to carry on developing their art work, for example. We could happily look at ways in which we could work with local authorities to support that agenda. They might, for example, bring a tutor in on an ad-hoc basis when they want to make further progress.

I again underline the commitment of the Assembly Government to trying to find ways of using the funding that we have available to create a system of lifelong learning for all in our society, whatever their age, whatever their existing qualifications, and whatever their background. I understand Rosemary's concerns, and those of many older learners, and I will continue, along with John Griffiths, to look at ways in which we can expand opportunities for older learning through the older person's strategy. I think that we also have a strong message about dispelling the negative associations that assessment, credit and qualifications seem to create for some learners until it is adequately explained, and then they embrace the agenda.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Un posibilrwydd yw defnyddio dull sy'n gweithio'n dda mewn mannau eraill, yn enwedig mewn gwledydd fel Awstralia, sef pan fydd pobl wedi cwblhau cyrsiau, byddant yn sefydlu clybiau. Mae hynny'n galluogi'r rheini sy'n cymryd rhan am resymau cymdeithasol i barhau i wneud hynny, heb y gost o ddefnyddio tiwtoriaid yn rheolaidd ac adnoddau eraill, tra byddant yn gallu defnyddio'r bobl sy'n arbennig o awyddus i barhau i ddatblygu eu gwaith celf, er enghraifft. Gallem edrych ar ffyrdd o weithio gydag awdurdodau lleol i gefnogi'r agenda honno. Er enghraifft, gallent ddod â thiwtor i mewn nawr ac yn y man pan fyddant am wneud cynnydd pellach.

Unwaith eto, pwysleisiaf ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i geisio cael ffyrdd i ddefnyddio'r arian a ddarperir gennym i greu system dysgu gydol oes i bawb yn ein cymdeithas, beth bynnag fo'u hoed, beth bynnag fo'u cymwysterau presennol a beth bynnag fo'u cefndir. Gallaf ddeall pryderon Rosemary, a phryderon llawer dysgwr hŷn, a chyda John Griffiths byddaf yn parhau i edrych ar ffyrdd i ehangu cyfleoedd i ddysgwyr hŷn drwy'r strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn. Credaf hefyd fod gennym neges gref ynghylch dileu'r cysylltiadau negyddol y mae asesiadau, credydau a chymwysterau fel pe baent yn eu creu i rai dysgwyr, nes i hynny gael ei egluro'n ddigonol a nes iddynt hwy groesawu'r agenda.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.44 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.44 p.m.*

Aelodau a'u Pleidiau Members and their Parties

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)