



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 31 Ionawr 2006
Tuesday, 31 January 2006**

Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	4
Cwestiwn Brys: Colli Swyddi yn Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd Urgent Question: Job Losses at the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research	27
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	31
Cymeradwyo o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 25.2 a 24.25 Approval under Standing Orders Nos. 25.2 and 24.25.....	34
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Ysgolion Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the New School (Admission) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006	36
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2006, and the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2006	51
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cymeradwyo Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Rheoli (Eiddo Preswyl) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Approval of Codes of Management Practice (Residential Property) (Wales) Order 2005.....	58
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27, a Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27 Approval of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006 under Standing Order 24.27, and the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27	61
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygiad Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 Approval of the NHS (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006	74
Cymeradwyo Dyfarniad Cymhorthdal y Cyfrif Refeniw Tai (Cymru) 2006-2007, a'r Dyfarniad Cyffredinol (Cymru) o Gredyd Eitem 8 a Debyd Eitem 8: 2006-2007 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29 Approval of the Housing Revenue Account Subsidy (Wales) Determination 2006-2007, and	

the (Wales) General Determination of the Item 8 Credit and Item 8 Debit 2006-07 under
Standing Order No. 29..... 78

Y Chweched Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Gydraddoldeb
The Sixth Equality Annual Report 85

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber.

In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Maes Gweithgarwch y Banc Gwybodaeth The Knowledge Bank's Areas of Activity

Q1 Kirsty Williams: Will the First Minister make a statement on the knowledge bank's areas of activity? OAQ1180 (FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): It is still early days, but the knowledge bank's team of officials has initiated discussions with around 50 companies and is actively engaged with around half of this client group at present, and is looking to accelerate their growth opportunities.

Kirsty Williams: Cardiff University's *The Welsh Economic Review* of autumn last year identified two crucial potential failings within the knowledge bank—the lack of objective economic analysis to guide the selection of the companies involved, and

'the apparent lack of any sort of measurable targets for success'.

Will you discuss this with your Minister for Economic Development and Transport to ensure that these weaknesses are overcome?

The First Minister: You claim that these were identified as weaknesses; that is an allegation, not a fact. The companies were proposed on the basis of activities by professional service companies, such as accountancy firms and so forth, and by our own Trade and Invest Wales team and by the Welsh Development Agency. Therefore, it was done objectively. We will have to see at the end of the pathfinder year whether we think the list needs to be expanded. I think that your issue was with the selection criteria, and we believe that they were objective.

Alun Ffred Jones: Pa griteria fyddwch chi yn eu mabwysiadu, neu yr ydych wedi eu

Q1 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am faes gweithgarwch y banc gwybodaeth? OAQ1180 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Mae'n gynnar o hyd, ond mae tîm swyddogion y banc gwybodaeth wedi dechrau trafodaethau gyda rhyw 50 o gwmnïau ac wrthi'n trafod gyda thua hanner y grŵp cleientiaid hwn ar hyn o bryd, ac yn ceisio cynyddu eu cyfleoedd o ran twf.

Kirsty Williams: Yn ôl *Welsh Economic Review* Prifysgol Caerdydd yr hydref diwethaf, mae dau bwynt a allai fod yn wendidau allweddol o fewn y banc gwybodaeth—sef diffyg dadansoddiad economaidd gwrthrychol i roi arweiniad wrth ddewis y cwmnïau i'w cynnwys, ac

yn ôl pob golwg, diffyg unrhyw fath o dargedau mesuradwy ar gyfer llwyddiant.

A wnewch drafod hyn gyda'ch Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i sicrhau y goresgynnir y gwendidau hyn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Honnwyd fod y rhain wedi eu nodi fel gwendidau; haerid yw hynny, nid ffaith. Cynigiwyd y cwmnïau ar sail gweithgareddau gan gwmnïau gwasanaeth proffesiynol, megis cwmnïau cyfrifyddiaeth ac yn y blaen, a chan ein tîm Masnach a Buddsoddi Cymru ni a chan Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Felly, gwnaethpwyd hynny'n wrthrychol. Bydd rhaid gweld ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn fraenaru a ydym yn meddwl bod angen ehangu'r rhestr. Credaf mai â'r meini prawf yr oeddech yn anghydweld, a chredwn ni eu bod yn wrthrychol.

Alun Ffred Jones: What criteria will you adopt, or have you adopted, to measure the

mabwysiadu, i fesur llwyddiant unrhyw fuddsoddiad yn y cwmnïau hyn yn y dyfodol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y peth allweddol fydd dyfeisio pecyn cymorth i helpu'r cwmnïau ar y rhestr i dyfu'n gyflymach. A oes gwendidau yn y ffordd yr ydym yn darparu cymorth yn awr, am nad yw'r ffordd honno wedi'i theilwra i ateb gofynion cwmnïau, yn enwedig gofynion y rhai sydd am dyfu'n gyflym iawn?

Alun Cairns: The initial communication that the Welsh Assembly Government made with the knowledge bank companies was last June, or thereabouts, depending on the company. The list was made public in November, but nothing else has happened since June. Many of these companies are becoming frustrated. The Minister has staked a lot of his credibility on this policy, but as far as the companies can see, there is nothing but inaction. What do you say to their accusations?

The First Minister: I do not take accusations repeated by you, Alun. You obviously did not listen to what I said in answer to Kirsty Williams. Discussions have been initiated with around 50 companies and the bank is actively engaged with around half of the client group at present. We will have to see what comes out of those discussions in detail with 25-odd of the 50 companies on the list. Let us hope that the bank can identify during the pathfinder year what more needs to be done and how you can package a tailor-made set of business support solutions that can enable these companies with the potential for rapid growth to grow rapidly.

Toriadau Arfaethedig i Wasanaethau'r GIG yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin Proposed Cuts to NHS Services in Mid and West Wales

Q2 Lisa Francis: Will the First Minister make a statement on proposed cuts to NHS services in Mid and West Wales? OAQ1184 (FM)

The First Minister: The facts, rather than the allegations, about healthcare in the Mid and West Wales region show an increase of

success of any investment in these companies in future?

The First Minister: The key point will be the devising of a support package to help the companies on the list to grow faster. Are there deficiencies in the way in which we provide support now, because it is not tailored to companies' needs, especially the needs of those which want to grow very quickly?

Alun Cairns: Ym mis Mehefin y llynedd, neu tua'r adeg honno, gan ddbynnu ar y cwmni, y cysylltodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru â chwmnïau'r banc gwybodaeth gyntaf. Cyhoeddwyd y rhestr ym mis Tachwedd, ond nid oes dim byd arall wedi digwydd ers Mehefin. Mae llawer o'r cwmnïau hyn yn dechrau teimlo'n rhwystredig. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi mentro llawer o'i hygredd ar y polisi hwn, ond hyd y gall y cwmnïau weld, nid oes dim ond diffyg gweithredu. Beth yw eich ymateb i'w cyhuddiadau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn derbyn cyhuddiadau a ailadroddir gennych chi, Alun. Yn amlwg, ni wrandawsoch ar yr hyn a ddywedais wrth ateb Kirsty Williams. Mae trafodaethau wedi'u dechrau gyda rhyw 50 o gwmnïau ac mae'r banc wrthi'n trafod ar hyn o bryd gyda thua hanner y grŵp cleientiaid. Bydd yn rhaid inni weld beth a fydd yn deillio o'r trafodaethau manwl hynny gyda rhyw 25 o'r 50 cwmni ar y rhestr. Gadewch inni obeithio y gall y banc weld yn ystod y flwyddyn fraenaru beth yn rhagor sydd angen ei wneud a sut y gallwch baratoi set bwrpasol o atebion cymorth busnes a all alluogi'r cwmnïau hyn sydd â'r potensial i dyfu'n gyflym i wneud hynny.

Q2 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch y toriadau arfaethedig i wasanaethau'r GIG yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ1184 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ffeithiau, yn hytrach na'r honiadau, am ofal iechyd yn rhanbarth Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru'n

more than 25 per cent in funding over the past two years, and an increase in staffing since the Assembly came into being of 15 per cent in non-medical staff and 27 per cent in medical and dental staff.

Lisa Francis: ‘The Case for Change’ for Mid and West Wales is an issues paper, and, by the end of March, the project team associated with it will generate proposals that will be put into a consultation document. That may lead to cuts being proposed in services. What were the public engagement events that led to this feedback, and how many such events will have been held between October of last year and March this year?

The First Minister: We all accept the need for change. We have debated Wanless here, and Wanless said that there had to be change in the way in which healthcare is delivered. The problem is that every time you try to turn that generalised case for change, which we all support, into an individual case for actual changes, those changes, where they are negative rather than positive, cause public anger and frustration. The public likes the positive but not the negative, though it still accepts the case for change—we all accept the case for change. We now have to see what emerges from the application of that general principle, which we support, to the Mid and West Wales region.

Elin Jones: Mae Patricia Hewitt heddiw wedi cyhoeddi moratoriwm ar gau ysbytai cymunedol yn Lloegr. A oes unrhyw fwriad gan eich Llywodraeth i roi cyfarwyddyd tebyg i fyrddau ac ymddiriedolaethau iechyd yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddem yn dilyn polisi o fuddsoddi yn ein hysbytai cymunedol ymhell cyn i Loegr wneud. Credaf ichi holi ynghylch hyn yr wythnos diwethaf, ac atebais y cwestiwn. Dywedais wrthyhych chi a’r Cynulliad bryd hynny ein bod yn sôn am fuddsoddi mwy nag £20 miliwn yn ysbytai cymunedol Aberteifi, Aberaeron a Thregaron. Dyna swm sylweddol sy’n dangos ein parodrwydd i fuddsoddi cyfalaf yn ein

dangos cynnydd o fwy na 25 y cant yn yr cyllid dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, a chynnydd mewn staffio ers i’r Cynulliad ddod i fodolaeth o 15 y cant mewn staff afeddygol a 27 y cant mewn staff meddygol a deintyddol.

Lisa Francis: Papur materion yw ‘The Case for Change’ i Ganolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru, ac erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth, bydd y tîm prosiect sy’n ymwneud ag ef yn cynhyrchu cynigion a roddir mewn dogfen ymgynghori. Gall hynny arwain at gynnig cwtogi gwasanaethau. Beth oedd y digwyddiadau’n ymwneud ag ymgysylltu â’r cyhoedd a arweiniodd at yr adborth hwn, a sawl digwyddiad o’r fath a fydd wedi’i gynnal rhwng mis Hydref y llynedd a Mawrth eleni?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn yr angen am newid. Yr ydym wedi trafod Wanless yma, a dywedodd Wanless fod rhaid cael newid yn y modd y darperir gofal iechyd. Y broblem yw bob tro y ceisiwch droi’r achos cyffredinol hwnnw dros newid, a gefnogir gan bawb ohonom, yn achos unigol dros newidiadau gwirioneddol, mae’r newidiadau hynny, lle y bônt yn negyddol yn hytrach nag yn gadarnhaol, yn achosi dicter a rhwystredigaeth ymysg y cyhoedd. Mae’r cyhoedd yn hoffi’r cadarnhaol ond nid y negyddol, er eu bod yn dal i dderbyn yr achos dros newid—yr ydym i gyd yn derbyn yr achos dros newid. Rhaid inni weld yn awr beth a ddaw o weithredu’r egwyddor gyffredinol honno, a gefnogir gennym, yn rhanbarth Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru.

Elin Jones: Patricia Hewitt has today declared a moratorium on the closure of community hospitals in England. Does your Government have any intention of issuing a similar direction to local health boards and trusts in Wales?

The First Minister: We have followed a policy of investing in our community hospitals long before England. I think that you asked a similar question last week, to which I responded. I told you and the Assembly at that time that we were talking about investing more than £20 million in community hospitals at Cardigan, Aberaeron and Tregaron. That is a substantial sum, which shows our willingness to make capital

hysbytai cymunedol, er na fydd hynny'n dilyn y patrwm presennol, wrth gwrs. Ni allwch fuddsoddi a gosod y patrwm presennol mewn asbig. Rhaid cael newidiadau er mwyn cyfiawnhau'r lefel honno o fuddsoddi cyfalaf.

investment in our community hospitals, albeit not following the same pattern as currently, of course. You cannot have investment and set the current trend in aspic. You have to have change in order to justify that level of capital investment.

Polisïau i Ddatblygu Chwaraeon yng Nghymru Policies to Develop Sport in Wales

Q3 Alun Cairns: Will the First Minister make a statement on his policies to develop sport in Wales? OAQ1172 (FM)

Q3 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ei bolisïau i ddatblygu chwaraeon yng Nghymru? OAQ1172 (FM)

The First Minister: Our policy is to ensure that, within the next 20 years, sport and physical activity are at the heart of Welsh life so that we are a fitter and healthier Wales. It is also to beat England on Saturday. [*Laughter.*]

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein polisi yw sicrhau, o fewn yr 20 mlynedd nesaf, y bydd chwaraeon a gweithgaredd corfforol yn rhan ganolog o fywyd Cymru fel y byddwn yn Gymru iachach a mwy heini. Ein polisi hefyd yw curo Lloegr ddydd Sadwrn. [*Chwerthin.*]

Alun Cairns: I rarely agree with the First Minister, but that is something on which we are united, and will remain united until Saturday.

Alun Cairns: Anaml y cytunaf â'r Prif Weinidog, ond mae hynny'n rhywbeth yr ydym yn gytûn arno, a byddwn yn parhau'n gytûn tan ddydd Sadwrn.

The development of sport is important, and yesterday's news that Cardiff is more likely to attract the FA Cup final for yet another year is good for the Welsh economy. Looking beyond the football festivals that we have attracted to Cardiff through the Millennium Stadium, what about the opportunity of attracting test-match cricket to Cardiff? It would take only £3 million-worth of funding, which would come from a range of sources, not just the Assembly or the local authority. Do you give your full commitment to exploring every opportunity to bring test-match cricket to Cardiff? If you and Glamorgan County Cricket Club act quickly, there is every prospect of bringing the Ashes to Cardiff by 2009. Are you determined to succeed in that?

Mae datblygu chwaraeon yn bwysig, ac mae'r newyddion ddoe fod Caerdydd yn fwy tebygol o ddenu rownd derfynol Cwpan Lloegr am flwyddyn arall yn newydd da i economi Cymru. O edrych y tu hwnt i'r gwyliau pêl-droed yr ydym wedi'u denu i Gaerdydd drwy Stadiwm y Mileniwm, beth am y cyfle i ddenu gemau prawf criced i Gaerdydd? Dim ond gwerth rhyw £3 miliwn o arian a gymerai, a ddeuai o amrywiaeth o ffynonellau, nid dim ond y Cynulliad neu'r awdurdod lleol. A roddwch eich ymroddiad llawn i ymchwilio i bob cyfle i ddod â gemau prawf criced i Gaerdydd? Os gweithredwch chi a Chlwb Criced Sir Morgannwg yn gyflym, mae cryn bosibilrwydd o ddod â'r Llundw i Gaerdydd erbyn 2009. A ydych yn benderfynol o lwyddo yn hynny o beth?

The First Minister: There is stiff competition in any attempt to bring test-match cricket to Wales from other grounds, such as Lord's, the Oval, Trent Bridge, the Rose Bowl in Hampshire, and so on. My constituents, I am sure, and I, welcome your occasional visitations, Alun, but you have to be aware that the first stage is to establish full credibility in terms of one-day games. There will be a very important game this year

Y Prif Weinidog: Ceir cystadleuaeth galed mewn unrhyw ymgais i ddod â gemau prawf criced i Gymru gan feysydd eraill, fel Lord's, yr Oval, Trent Bridge, y Rose Bowl yn Hampshire, ac yn y blaen. Mae fy etholwyr, yr wyf yn siŵr, a mi, yn croesawu eich ymweliadau achlysurol, Alun, ond rhaid ichi sylweddoli mai'r cam cyntaf yw sefydlu hygredd llwyr o ran gemau undydd. Bydd gêm bwysig iawn eleni rhwng Lloegr a

between England and Pakistan at Sophia Gardens. That is the first home day/night game to be played outside England, and we hope that it will be a sell-out. The problem with test-match cricket is that you cannot really make a big investment if you have only one test match every year, or one every other year, with that capacity not used the rest of the year. You have to have alternative sources of revenue and alternative times of the year when a 17,000-seater stadium would be used. How often can you do that without placing stress on the parking and access facilities of the area? Those are the issues that my constituents and I have been seeking to balance over the past, difficult 12 months.

Val Lloyd: In the Communities First area of Penderry in Swansea East, the community coaches and Rugbywise social inclusion projects have provided young people with opportunities to gain coaching qualifications that boost their employability. A recent evaluation has shown that, among other benefits, the locality has seen a 42 per cent drop in youth annoyance over the first three months. Do you agree that such sports-based projects, which have the capacity to improve health, provide wider life skills and reduce neighbourhood crime, could be replicated as policy initiatives across Wales?

2.10 p.m.

The First Minister: I would have thought that it could. That is a classic diversion tactic. If you can divert people aged between 13 and 16 away from anti-social activities into sport, as the French have done in their deprived areas and communities, not only do you get people coming through who can reach the peaks of professional sport, you also get a reduced level of anti-social behaviour. It is a win-win situation. I commend what is being done in Penderry, and advise other areas with similar youth annoyance problems and so on to consider copying what has been done there.

Phacistan yng Ngerddi Sophia. Honno yw'r gêm ddydd/nos gartref gyntaf i'w chwarae y tu allan i Loegr, a gobeithiwn y gwerthir y tocynnau i gyd. Y broblem gyda gemau prawf criced yw na allwch wneud buddsoddiad mawr mewn gwirionedd os mai dim ond un gêm brawf a gewch mewn blwyddyn, neu un bob yn ail flwyddyn, heb ddefnyddio'r cyfleuster hwnnw weddill y flwyddyn. Rhaid cael ffynonellau refeniw eraill ac adegau eraill o'r flwyddyn pryd y byddai defnydd ar stadiwm 17,000 sedd. Pa mor aml y gellir gwneud hynny heb roi pwysau ar gyfleusterau parcio a mynediad yr ardal? Dyna'r materion y mae fy etholwyr a minnau wedi bod yn ceisio'u mantoli dros y 12 mis anodd diwethaf.

Val Lloyd: Yn ardal Cymunedau'n Gyntaf Penderi yn Nwyrain Abertawe, mae'r prosiect hyfforddwyr cymunedol a phrosiect cynhwysiant cymdeithasol Rugbywise wedi darparu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ennill cymwysterau hyfforddi a fydd yn hwb i'w gallu i gael gwaith. Dangosodd gwerthusiad diweddar fod yr ardal, ymhlith manteision eraill, wedi gweld gostyngiad o 42 y cant mewn ymddygiad annifyr gan bobl ifanc yn y tri mis cyntaf. A ydych yn cytuno y gallai prosiectau chwaraeon fel hyn, sydd â'r gallu i wella iechyd, ehangu sgiliau bywyd a lleihau troseddu yn y gymdogaeth, gael eu copïo fel mentrau polisi ledled Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn wedi tybio y byddai hynny'n bosibl. Mae hynny'n dacteg arallgyfeirio glasurol. Os gallwch droi pobl rhwng 13 ac 16 oed oddi wrth weithgareddau gwrthgymdeithasol at chwaraeon, fel y mae'r Ffrancod wedi gwneud yn eu hardaloedd a'u cymunedau difreintiedig hwy, yr ydych nid yn unig yn cael bod pobl yn gallu cyrraedd uchelfannau chwaraeon proffesiynol, ond hefyd cewch lai o ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Mae pawb ar ei ennill. Cymeradwyaf yr hyn sydd yn cael ei wneud ym Mhenderi, a chynghoraf ardaloedd eraill sydd â phroblemau tebyg o ran annifyrrwch gan bobl ifanc ac yn y blaen i ystyried copïo'r hyn sydd wedi'i wneud yn y fan honno.

Yfed Alcohol Dan Oed **Under-age Consumption of Alcohol**

Q4 Eleanor Burnham: Will the First Minister make a statement on combating under-age consumption of alcohol? OAQ1167 (FM)

The First Minister: We want to reduce under-age consumption of alcohol, in collaboration with the police and community safety partnerships. I am sure that you will be pleased to hear that, over the Christmas period, trading standards officers carried out more than 800 sting operations across Wales, using under-age volunteers who tried to purchase alcohol.

Eleanor Burnham: What is your Labour Assembly Government doing to help educate Welsh youth regarding the perils of excessive binge drinking, and, perhaps, to encourage a healthier, European cafe-culture mentality in our city and town centres, making them more family friendly?

The First Minister: During the academic year to last July, the anti-alcohol education programme was delivered in 1,851 schools, which equates to 97 per cent of the total number of schools in Wales. That police-led initiative involved 464,760 pupils, and it is being rolled out to virtually every school in Wales.

Mark Isherwood: A crackdown on under-age drinking by police and trading standards officers in Corwen and Llangollen has led to the confiscation of large amounts of alcohol from under-age drinkers, fines for those caught buying alcohol for younger people, and prosecutions of those selling alcohol to minors. However, as recently as yesterday, a front-page headline in a Flintshire newspaper referred to anti-social behaviour being linked to alcohol consumption by under-age drinkers. Common sense dictates that we need to tackle causes as well as symptoms. With the new licensing laws, the problems could become more apparent as daylight hours extend and as days and nights become warmer. What actions are you taking with the police and other agencies to tackle this in

Q4 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am fynd i'r afael ag yfed alcohol dan oed? OAQ1167 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae arnom eisiau lleihau'r nifer sydd yn yfed alcohol dan oed, mewn cydweithrediad â'r heddlu a phartneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd yn dda gennyh glywed bod swyddogion safonau masnach, dros gyfnod y Nadolig, wedi cynnal dros 800 o ymarferion rhwydo ledled Cymru, gan ddefnyddio gwirfoddolwyr dan oed a geisiodd brynu alcohol.

Eleanor Burnham: Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad yn ei wneud i helpu i addysgu pobl ifanc Cymru am beryglon goryfed mewn pyliau, ac, efallai, i annog meddylfryd iachach y diwylliant caffis Ewropeaidd yn ein dinasoedd a'n trefi, a'u gwneud yn lleoedd brafach i deuluoedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn ystod y flwyddyn academiaidd hyd at fis Gorffennaf diwethaf, cyflwynwyd y rhaglen addysg wrth-alcohol mewn 1,851 o ysgolion, sef 97 y cant o'r holl ysgolion yng Nghymru. Cysylltodd y fenter honno, dan arweiniad yr heddlu, â 464,760 o ddisgyblion, a chaiff ei chyflwyno i bob ysgol yng Nghymru, fwy neu lai.

Mark Isherwood: Wrth i'r heddlu a swyddogion safonau masnach syrthio'n drwm ar yfed dan oed yng Nghorwen a Llangollen, aethpwyd â symiau mawr o ddiodydd alcoholaidd oddi ar yfwyr dan oed, dirwywyd pobl a ddaliwyd yn prynu alcohol i bobl iau, ac erlynwyd pobl a werthai alcohol i rai dan oed. Fodd bynnag, ddoe ddiwethaf, yr oedd pennawd ar dudalen flaen papur newydd yn sir y Fflint yn cyfeirio at gysylltiad rhwng ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac yfed alcohol dan oed. Dywed synnwyr cyffredin fod angen mynd i'r afael â'r achosion yn ogystal â'r symptomau. Gyda'r deddfau trwyddedu newydd, gallai'r problemau ddod yn amlycach wrth i oriau golau dydd ymestyn ac wrth iddi gynhesu yn ystod y dydd a'r nos. Pa

advance? I note, for example, the wristband scheme that is designed to tackle under-age drinking and which was launched last month across west Suffolk.

The First Minister: We are dodging back and forth between the question of binge drinking and the question of under-age drinking—they are linked, of course, but they tend to have slightly different focuses. We are trying to suppress both problems. You would be a fair enough observer of the social scene, Mark, to say that the introduction of the new licensing laws has not led to the explosion in binge drinking that was feared at one time. We are all pleased about that. I note what you said about the difference that longer daylight hours might make—you may be right, but we will have to wait to see. We hope that our social action programmes, the leadership that we provide, be it in campaigning by the BBC or in the close collaboration between the police and trading standards departments, and the education programmes in schools on under-age drinking, will be successful in making people see that this will seriously damage young people's health.

gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd gyda'r heddlu ac asiantaethau eraill i fynd i'r afael â hyn ymlaen llaw? Nodaf, er enghraifft, y cynllun bandiau garddwrn y bwriedir iddo fynd i'r afael ag yfed dan oed ac a lanswyd y mis diwethaf ar draws gorllewin Suffolk.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn pigo'n ôl a blaen rhwng cwestiwn goryfed mewn pyliau a chwestiwn yfed dan oed—mae cysylltiad rhyngddynt, wrth reswm, ond mae ffocws y ddau beth yn tueddu i fod ychydig yn wahanol. Yr ydym yn ceisio trechu'r ddwy broblem. Sylw digon teg gennyh ar y sefyllfa gymdeithasol, Mark, fyddai dweud nad yw cyflwyno'r deddfau trwyddedu newydd wedi arwain at y cynnydd anferth mewn goryfed mewn pyliau a ofnid ar un adeg. Yr ydym i gyd yn falch o hynny. Nodaf yr hyn a ddywedasoich am y gwahaniaeth y gallai mwy o oriau golau dydd ei wneud—efallai eich bod yn iawn, ond bydd yn rhaid inni aros i weld. Gobeithiwn y bydd ein rhaglenni gweithredu cymdeithasol, yr arweiniad a rown, boed drwy ymgyrchu gan y BBC neu yn y cydweithio agos rhwng yr heddlu ac adrannau safonau masnach, a'r rhaglenni addysg mewn ysgolion am yfed dan oed, yn llwyddo i wneud i bobl weld y gwnaiff hyn niwed difrifol i iechyd pobl ifanc.

Llwyddiant Rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf The Success of the Communities First Programme

Q5 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement concerning the success of the Communities First programme in tackling deprivation and poverty in Wales? OAQ1169 (FM)

Q5 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf o ran mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a thlodi yng Nghymru? OAQ1169 (FM)

The First Minister: The interim evaluation will report this summer on the success and progress of the programme in tackling deprivation and poverty in the 137 Communities First partnership areas across Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y gwerthusiad interim yn rhoi adroddiad yr haf hwn ar lwyddiant a chynnydd y rhaglen o ran mynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a thlodi yn y 137 o ardaloedd partneriaeth Cymunedau'n Gyntaf ledled Cymru.

William Graham: The communities of Trevethin, Penygarn and St Cadocs, in Pontypool, received nearly £4 million in grants for Communities First, which is well deserved. However, nearly two thirds of that money is for salaries alone. That seems to do very little to tackle deprivation or poverty.

William Graham: Derbyniodd cymunedau Trefddyn, Pen-y-garn a St Cadocs ym Mhont-y-pŵl bron £4 miliwn mewn grantiau ar gyfer Cymunedau'n Gyntaf, a hynny'n haeddiannol iawn. Fodd bynnag, mae dwy ran o dair bron o'r arian hwnnw ar gyfer cyflogau'n unig. Mae'n ymddangos mai

Would you look at those figures and comment appropriately?

The First Minister: I cannot comment in detail, as you would expect, but the important point is that priorities on how money is spent are set by local partnerships. This is, right at its heart, a bottom-up, rather than a top-down, programme. We need to encourage and facilitate areas that have not been doing well, economically and socially, and which have multiple deprivation, to raise themselves by their own bootstraps. We facilitate it by the aim that they choose the priorities. However, I will look into the case that you have raised, and I will ask Edwina Hart to respond to you.

Jeff Cuthbert: Building on what you have said, do you agree that one of the great strengths and benefits of the Communities First programme is that it has empowered local residents, together with local voluntary groups, to work in partnership with organisations such as the Gwent Association of Voluntary Organisations, the Groundwork Trust and local authorities to improve significantly the communities in which they live and work? Do you also agree that it is right and proper that we work with those groups and individuals, even if, at times, we cannot be sure that the outcome will be as perfect as we want it to be?

The First Minister: I agree. This is about capacity building. Almost by definition, the areas that we are talking about are not areas where you will find a large number of bank managers, university professors, architects and other professionals living. That is the nature of the Communities First partnership. That does not mean that these areas do not have leadership, but that it needs to be drawn out. Sometimes, it will be more collective than it is in areas with a higher percentage of people in white-collar occupations, or people retired from those occupations, who have the time, ability and knowledge from their jobs to organise something. That does not mean that you cannot have leadership. However, you must draw it out, provide training and

ychedig iawn a wnaiff hynny i fynd i'r afael ag amddifadedd a thlodi. A wnewch edrych ar y ffigurau hynny a chyflwyno sylwadau'n briodol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf gyflwyno sylwadau manwl, fel y disgwyliech, ond y pwynt pwysig yw mai partneriaethau lleol fydd yn pennu blaenoriaethau ynghylch y modd y caiff arian ei wario. Rhaglen o'r gwaelod i fyny, yn hytrach nag o'r brig i lawr, yw hon yn ei hanfod. Mae angen inni annog a hwyluso ardaloedd sydd heb fod yn gwneud yn dda, yn economaidd ac yn gymdeithasol, ac sydd yn dioddef gan amddifadedd lluosog, i'w hadfer eu hunain drwy eu hymdrechion eu hunain. Byddwn yn hwyluso hyn drwy osod y nod mai hwy sy'n dewis y blaenoriaethau. Fodd bynnag, edrychaf ar yr achos a godwyd gennych, a gofynnaf i Edwina Hart ymateb ichi.

Jeff Cuthbert: Yn sgîl yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, a gytunwch mai un o gryfderau a manteision mawr rhaglen Cymunedau yn Gyntaf yw ei bod wedi grymuso trigolion lleol, ynghyd â grwpiau gwirfoddol lleol, i weithio mewn partneriaeth â mudiadau megis Cymdeithas Mudiadau Gwirfoddol Gwent, Ymddiriedolaeth Groundwork ac awdurdodau lleol i wella'n sylweddol y cymunedau y maent yn byw ac yn gweithio ynddynt? A ydych hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn iawn ac yn briodol inni weithio gyda'r grwpiau a'r unigolion hynny, hyd yn oed os na allwn, ar brydiau, fod yn sicr y bydd y canlyniad mor berffaith ag y dymunwn iddo fod?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Mater o ddatblygu gallu yw hyn. Mae'r ardaloedd yr ydym yn sôn amdanynt, oherwydd eu natur i raddau helaeth, yn ardaloedd lle na welwch nifer fawr o reolwyr banc, athrawon prifysgol, penseiri a phobl broffesiynol eraill yn byw. Hynny yw natur partneriaeth Cymunedau yn Gyntaf. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes gan yr ardaloedd hyn arweinwyr, ond bod angen meithrin yr arweinwyr hynny. Weithiau bydd mwy o gydweithio nag a welir mewn ardaloedd sydd â chanran uwch o bobl mewn swyddi coler wen, neu bobl sydd wedi ymddeol o'r swyddi hynny, sydd â'r amser, y gallu a'r wybodaeth yn sgîl eu swyddi i drefnu rhywbeth. Nid yw hynny'n golygu na allwch gael arweinwyr. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i

build the capacity.

chi eu meithrin, darparu hyfforddiant a datblygu'r gallu.

Targedau Economaidd Economic Targets

Q6 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lwyddiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o ran cyrraedd targedau economaidd? OAQ1193 (FM)

Q6 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's success in achieving economic targets? OAQ1193 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Y llwyddiant pwysicaf yw bod nifer y bobl mewn gwaith yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu o fwy na 100,000, neu 10 y cant, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Hwn yw'r cynnydd mwyaf ymhlith gwledydd y Deyrnas Unedig a naw rhanbarth Lloegr. Yn ystod yr un cyfnod, mae cyflogaeth yn y DU gyfan wedi cynyddu ychydig yn fwy na 6 y cant.

The First Minister: The most important achievement is that employment in Wales has increased by more than 100,000, or 10 per cent, since the Assembly's inception. That is the biggest increase out of any of the countries of the United Kingdom or the nine English regions. Over the same period, employment has increased by just over 6 per cent across the UK as a whole.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae eich Llywodraeth wedi methu â chyrraedd nifer o dargedau economaidd, er gwaethaf yr ateb hwnnw. Er enghraifft, mae targed o gyrraedd gwerth ychwanegol crynswth o 90 y cant mor bell ag y bu erioed, ac, wrth gwrs, nid yw hwnnw bellach yn darged. Mae rhaglen Amcan 1 yn cynnwys targed i greu swyddi a chynyddu gwerth mewnwladol crynswth, ac mae 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu' bellach wedi mabwysiadu dangosyddion olrhain i fesur datblygiad economaidd. A yw hyn yn arwydd eich bod yn rhoi'r gorau i osod targedau sy'n debygol o fod yn anodd eu cyrraedd?

Alun Ffred Jones: Despite that response, your Government has failed to meet several economic targets. For example, meeting the target of achieving 90 per cent of gross value added is as distant as it ever was, and, of course, it is no longer a target. A target on job creation and increasing gross domestic product is contained in the Objective 1 programme, and 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' has now adopted tracking indicators to measure economic development. Is this an indication of the fact that you no longer intend to set targets that will be difficult to achieve?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddwn yn deall bod tua 10 o dargedau yn 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Os wyf yn anghywir ynghylch hynny, gofynnaf i Andrew Davies ysgrifennu atoch.

The First Minister: It is my understanding that 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' contains around 10 targets. If I am wrong about that, I will ask Andrew Davies to write to you.

Jonathan Morgan: You were clear in the debate held on 13 December 2001 that the wish to reach the target of 90 per cent of average UK GDP was just that—a target. Those were your words in the Chamber. If the Government cannot reach targets or is keen to fudge or ditch them, what is the point of announcing them in the first place? Without targets, how can the public measure the achievement and success of the National Assembly?

Jonathan Morgan: Yr oeddech yn glir yn ystod y ddadl a gynhaliwyd ar 13 Rhagfyr 2001 mai targed mewn gwirionedd oedd y dymuniad i gyrraedd y targed o 90 y cant o gyfartaledd CMC y DU. Eich geiriau chi yn y Siambr oedd hynny. Os na all y Llywodraeth gyrraedd targedau neu os yw'n awyddus i'w cymylu neu i gael gwared â hwy, beth yw diben eu cyhoeddi yn y lle cyntaf? Heb dargedau, sut y mae modd i'r cyhoedd fesur a ydyw'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn cyflawni ac yn llwyddo?

The First Minister: That was expressed as an aim and not a target because there were too many factors beyond our control. It is as simple as that. The 10 targets in 'WAVE' are closer to what is under our control. You will see that that is the target information that we are using. They are all good ways of measuring success, but they do not depend so much on external factors over which we have no control. For example, these would include the sterling-euro exchange rate, which went catastrophically against the interests of manufacturing in this country in 2000. At that time, the euro was worth 56p, as opposed to its 71p launch rate the previous year.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nod yn hytrach na tharged oedd hynny oherwydd bod gormod o ffactorau y tu hwnt i'n rheolaeth. Mae mor syml â hynny. Mae'r 10 targed yn 'WAVE' yn nes at yr hyn y gallwn ei reoli. Gwelwch mai hynny yw'r wybodaeth darged yr ydym yn ei defnyddio. Maent i gyd yn ddulliau da o fesur llwyddiant, ond nid ydynt yn dibynnu cymaint ar ffactorau allanol nad oes gennym reolaeth drostynt. Er enghraifft, byddai'r rhain yn cynnwys y gyfradd gyfnewid sterling-ewro, a gafodd effaith drychinebus ar fuddiannau gweithgynhyrchu yn y wlad hon yn 2000. Bryd hynny, yr oedd yr ewro'n werth 56c, o'i gymharu â'i gyfradd o 71c pan lanswyd ef yn y flwyddyn flaenorol.

Jenny Randerson: I listened with interest as you quoted the figures for jobs created. The figure that you did not quote was the 13 per cent increase in the number claiming jobseekers' allowance in Cardiff Central between December 2004 and December 2005. The number went up from 1,177 claimants to 1,330. You are fond of claiming success with your economic development policies, but can you explain this obvious failure?

Jenny Randerson: Gwrandewais gyda diddordeb wrth i chi ddyfynnu'r ffigurau ar gyfer y swyddi a grewyd. Y ffigur na wnaethoch ei ddyfynnu oedd y cynnydd o 13 y cant yn y nifer a oedd yn hawlio'r lwfans ceisio gwaith yng Nghanol Caerdydd rhwng Rhagfyr 2004 a Rhagfyr 2005. Cynyddodd y nifer o 1,177 o hawlwyd i 1,330. Yr ydych yn hoff o honni ichi lwyddo gyda'ch polisiau datblygu economaidd, ond a allwch esbonio'r methiant amlwg hwn?

2.20 p.m.

The First Minister: Everything is relative. However, over the life of the Assembly, the big picture is how many more people now have jobs compared with the figure when the Assembly started. That is the big picture. We are no. 1 out of the 12 constituent parts of the UK. That is the big, important picture, and that is the most comprehensive picture of success—to be first of 12, and with a 10 per cent increase in jobs, compared with 6 per cent in the UK. The UK is doing well by European standards, and we are well ahead of the rest of the UK, and first out of 12. That is pretty good.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae popeth yn gymharol. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod oes y Cynulliad, y darlun mawr yw faint yn rhagor o bobl sydd â swydd yn awr o'i gymharu â'r ffigur pan ddechreuodd y Cynulliad. Dyna'r darlun mawr. O blith 12 rhan gyfansoddol y DU, ni sydd ar y brig. Dyna'r darlun mawr, pwysig, a dyna'r darlun mwyaf cynhwysfawr o lwyddiant—mai ni sydd ar y blaen o blith 12, a chyda chynnydd o 10 y cant yn nifer y swyddi, o'i gymharu â 6 y cant yn y DU. Mae'r DU yn gwneud yn dda o'i gymharu â safonau Ewrop, ac yr ydym ninnau ymhell ar y blaen i weddill y DU, ac ar y brig o blith 12. Mae hynny'n bur dda.

You are right to say that the economy slowed down in 2005, and that, over Wales as a whole, the claimant count went up by 5,000, from 39,500 to 44,500. However, compare that with figures three and four times bigger during the bulk of the period when the Conservatives were in office, and you can see

Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod yr economi wedi arafu yn 2005, a bod nifer yr hawlwyd, yng Nghymru, drwyddi draw, wedi cynyddu 5,000, o 39,500 i 44,500. Fodd bynnag, cymharwch hynny â ffigurau deirgwaith a phedair gwaith yn fwy yn ystod y rhan fwyaf o'r cyfnod pan oedd y

how successful that is, relative to anything that happened when the Conservatives were around.

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Hoffwn ddod â chi yn ôl at yr adroddiad hanner tymor ar raglenni Amcan 1. Mae'r adroddiad hwn, a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth, yn gweld sut yr ydych wedi mesur yn erbyn y targedau yr oeddech wedi eu gosod i chi eich hun ar ddechrau'r rhaglen. Mae'r adroddiad yn ei gwneud yn glir eich bod wedi methu ar y targed o ran nifer y swyddi yr oeddech yn mynd i'w creu, wedi methu ar y targed o greu busnesau newydd, ac wedi methu ar y targed o gyrraedd eich nod cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth.

Gan fod y Llywodraeth wedi methu ar gymaint o dargedau allweddol, sut y medrwn fod yn hyderus, o dan y Llywodraeth Lafur hon, y bydd Cymru'n well o dan raglen 2007-13?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r ffigurau manwl hynny gennyf ar hyn o bryd er mwyn gwirio yr hyn a ddywedwch. Gwn fod y gwerthuso hanner ffordd wedi digwydd, a gwn fod cwestiwn ynglŷn â chysoni'r ffigurau a ddefnyddiwyd yn y broses werthuso hon ac mewn gwledydd neu ardaloedd eraill sydd wedi cael yr un broses werthuso. Mae elfen o anghysondeb yn rhai o'r dadleuon ynghylch yr ystadegau. Y peth pwysig yw gofyn a yw Cymru'n tyfu'n economaidd. Mae hi. A yw hi wedi gorffen y broses o ddal i fyny? Nac ydyw, o bell ffordd. Yn ffodus, oherwydd ein bod wedi cymryd cipolwg ar a ydym yn haeddu cael statws Amcan 1 eto i orllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd, ac am fod y gwerthuso wedi'i seilio ar ffigurau a oedd yn bodoli bedair neu bum mlynedd yn ôl, cyn bod Amcan 1 wedi cael siawns i roi unrhyw fath o hwb i'n heconomi, yr ydym yn cael ail sesiwn o Amcan 1, gan ddechrau 11 mis i heddiw.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Synnaf nad yw'r ffigurau hyn gennyf. Comisiynwyd yr adroddiad hwn gan y Llywodraeth, fe'i cwblhawyd ers mis Rhagfyr 2005, ac fe'i lluniwyd gan rywun a oedd yn ymgynghorydd arbennig i Alun Michael. Ni allwch ddweud, felly, nad yw'r adroddiad yn wybyddus i'ch

Ceidwadwyr mewn grym, ac fe welwch pa mor llwyddiannus yw hynny, o'i gymharu ag unrhyw beth a ddigwyddodd pan oedd y Ceidwadwyr wrthi.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): I want to bring you back to the half-term report on Objective 1 programmes. This report, commissioned by the Government, examines how you measure against the targets that you set yourselves at the outset of the programme. The report makes it clear that you have failed to meet the target on the number of jobs that you were going to create, you have failed to meet the target of creating new businesses, and you have failed to meet the target of reaching your gross domestic product aim.

Given that the Government has failed on so many crucial targets, how can we be confident that, under this Labour Government, Wales will be better off under the 2007-13 programme?

The First Minister: I do not have those detailed figures to hand at present to check what you say. I know that the half-term evaluation has taken place, and I know that there was a question over regulating the figures used in this evaluation report and those in other countries or regions that have undergone the same evaluation process. There is an element of inconsistency in some of the arguments relating to the statistics. The important thing is to ask whether Wales is growing economically. It is. Has it completed the process of catching up? No, far from it. Fortunately, because we have taken a snapshot of whether we deserve Objective 1 status again for west Wales and the Valleys, and because the evaluation was based on figures that existed four or five years ago, before Objective 1 had had an opportunity to give the economy any sort of boost, we are having a second round of Objective 1, beginning 11 months today.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am surprised that you do not have these figures to hand. This report was commissioned by the Government, it was completed in December 2005, and was drafted by someone who was a special adviser to Alun Michael. You cannot say, therefore, that your Government is not aware

Llywodraeth. Synnaf yn fawr nad ydych wedi sylweddoli bod hwn yn dangos yn glir eich bod wedi methu yn eich targedau.

Mae dau beth arall ymhlyg yn yr adroddiad. Un yw, hyd yn oed gyda'r swyddi sydd wedi eu creu, mae lefelau cyflogau yn 'sylweddol is' na chyfartaledd cyflogaeth yng Nghymru. Felly, mae'r swyddi newydd hyn wedi creu swyddi lle mae cyflogau yn isel. Yn ail, oherwydd nad oes busnesau newydd wedi'u creu yn ôl y targed, mae'r economi yn yr ardal Amcan 1 yn llai cynaliadwy nag y gallai fod. Oni dderbyniwch fod hynny, gan adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gennych, yn feirniadaeth ddeifiol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr hyn a ddywedais oedd nad yw'r adroddiad, na'r ffigurau sydd ynddo, gennyf ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn ymwybodol o fodolaeth yr adroddiad gwerthuso hanner ffordd hwn, a gwn pwy a'i hysgrifennodd. Gwn hefyd y bu dadlau ynglŷn â chysondeb sut yn union i fesur beth yw ennill swyddi newydd net a bras. Dyna'r ddadl rhwng y broses a'r mesur gwerthuso a wnaed yng Nghymru, o'i chymharu â gwledydd eraill sy'n derbyn arian Amcan 1.

Gan nad yw'r ffigurau gennyf, dywedaf hyn. Mae pawb yn derbyn bod gennym lawer o ffordd i fynd i ailwampio ein heconomi. Fodd bynnag, ar ôl dirywiad hir o dan y Toriaid, yr ydym wedi gweld, yn ystod bodolaeth y Cynulliad, na fu dirywiad, ac mae'r broses o ennill tir wedi dechrau.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: That is trying to wriggle out of your responsibility. As an opposition, we are entitled to ask why you have failed to meet your specific targets. You have failed to meet your targets on jobs, on business creation, and you have also failed in terms of your GDP levels. Given the fact that these are targets that you set and which you said that your Government wanted to achieve under this programme, are the people of Wales not entitled, given that this was a Government-commissioned report, to say that Labour has failed the people of Wales on Objective 1, and that they had better look for someone else to do a better job next time?

of this report. I am very surprised that you have not realised that this shows clearly that you have missed your targets.

Two other issues are implicit in this report. One is that, even with the jobs that have been created, salary levels are 'significantly less' than average employment in Wales. Therefore, these new jobs that have been created are jobs on low incomes. Secondly, because no new businesses have been created in line with the target, the economy in the Objective 1 area is less sustainable than it could be. Do you not accept that that, in a report commissioned by you, is a harsh criticism?

The First Minister: What I said was that I did not have the report, or the figures contained in it, to hand. However, I am aware of the existence of this halfway evaluation report, and I know who wrote it. I also know that there has been some dispute about the consistency of how exactly to measure the creation of new net and gross jobs. That is the argument between the evaluation process and measurement that took place in Wales, compared with other countries that receive Objective 1 funding.

As I do not have the figures to hand, I will just say this. Everyone accepts that we have a long way to go in regenerating our economy. However, following a long period of decline under the Tories, we have seen, since the Assembly's inception, a halt in that decline. The process of gaining ground has begun.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Ceisio osgoi eich cyfrifoldeb yw hynny. Fel gwrthblaid, mae gennym hawl i ofyn pam yr ydych wedi methu â chyrraedd eich targedau penodol. Yr ydych wedi methu â chyrraedd eich targedau ar gyfer swyddi, ar gyfer creu busnes, ac yr ydych hefyd wedi methu o ran eich lefelau CMC. Gan mai targedau a osodwyd gennych chi yw'r rhain, rhai y dywedasoich fod eich Llywodraeth yn dymuno'u cyflawni dan y rhaglen hon, onid oes gan bobl Cymru yr hawl, gan mai adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth oedd hwn, i ddweud bod Llafur wedi gwneud cam â hwy o ran Amcan 1, ac y byddai'n well iddynt chwilio am rywun arall i wneud gwell sioe ohoni y tro nesaf?

The First Minister: I do not think that they will see as failure being no. 1 out of the 12 constituent parts of the United Kingdom. Over the six and a half years in which the Assembly has been in existence, who has been the champion of the premier division in net job creation in the UK? It is Wales. It is not Scotland, Northern Ireland or any of the nine English regions, but Wales. People will therefore say, 'Well, that is a pretty good start'. The single biggest, most general measure of relative economic success is the job total now compared with what it was in May 1999 when we took over our responsibilities. We are first out of 12, and you cannot gainsay that. Out of a very successful UK economy compared with that of Europe, we are still first out of the 12 constituent parts of the UK.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni chredaf y byddant yn barnu mai methiant yw bod ar y brig o blith 12 rhan gyfansoddol y Deyrnas Unedig. Yn ystod chwe blynedd a hanner oes y Cynulliad, pwy sydd wedi bod yn bencampwr yr uwch gynghrair o ran creu swyddi net yn y DU? Cymru. Nid yr Alban, Gogledd Iwerddon na dim un o'r naw rhanbarth yn Lloegr, ond Cymru. Felly, bydd pobl yn dweud, 'Wel, mae hynny'n ddechrau pur dda'. Yr un mesur mwyaf, mwyaf cyffredinol o lwyddiant economaidd cymharol yw cyfanswm y swyddi yn awr o'i gymharu â'r hyn ydoedd ym Mai 1999 pan wnaethom ysgwyddo'n cyfrifoldebau. Ni sydd ar y brig o blith 12, ac ni allwch wadu hynny. O ran economi'r DU, sy'n llwyddiannus iawn o'i chymharu ag economi Ewrop, yr ydym yn dal i fod ar y brig o blith 12 rhan gyfansoddol y DU.

On your points about the process of evaluating Objective 1, I do not have the figures before me, but I recall that there was an argument about the way in which the net and gross jobs and the particular application of the measurement of jobs was done relative to how it was done in other Objective 1 areas. I will have to write to you on that particular issue.

Ynglŷn â'ch pwyntiau ynghylch proses gwerthuso Amcan 1, nid yw'r ffigurau gennyf o'm blaen, ond cofiaf fod dadl wedi bod ynghylch y modd y cafodd y swyddi net a chryswth eu cyfrifo a'r dull penodol a ddefnyddiwyd i fesur y swyddi o'i gymharu â'r modd y gwnaed hynny mewn ardaloedd Amcan 1 eraill. Bydd rhaid i mi ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â'r mater penodol hwnnw.

Rôl Llywodraeth Leol yng Nghymru The Role of Local Government in Wales

Q7 David Melding: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies to develop and enhance the role of local government in Wales? OAQ1175(FM)

Q7 David Melding: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatblygu a gwella rôl llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru? OAQ1175(FM)

The First Minister: It will draw on an increased willingness to work across boundaries, both within and between councils. The annual report of the chief inspector of social services, published last week, recorded a renewed commitment to improvement, with strong leadership from the Welsh Local Government Association in taking collective responsibility for the good reputation and performance of all social services in Wales.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd yn defnyddio'r parodrwydd cynyddol i weithio ar draws ffiniau, o fewn cynghorau a rhyngddynt. Yn adroddiad blynyddol prif arolygydd y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a gyhoeddwyd yr wythnos diwethaf, cofnodwyd ymrwymiad newydd i wella, gydag arweiniad cadarn gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wrth iddynt ysgwyddo cydgyfrifoldeb dros enw da a pherfformiad yr holl wasanaethau cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

David Melding: Do you agree that the changes introduced to the way in which local

David Melding: A ydych yn cytuno bod y newidiadau a gyflwynwyd i'r modd y mae

councils deliver their executive functions are now bedding in, and that we can see the advantages in terms of accountability and also the possibility of driving up the standards of public services? However, do you also agree that there is now a need to improve the scrutiny function of local government, where perhaps we have not made as much progress as we should have in the past five or six years?

The First Minister: Psychologically, I am sure that you are correct. People do not understand their scrutiny function, in that if they are not on the front bench or the so-called 'cabinet', they wonder what their exact function is. They have not really grasped the vital function that scrutiny can perform. However, I think that that is catching up quite quickly, and few authorities now are as unhappy as they were when the new pattern was introduced two or three years ago.

David Lloyd: Pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi'u cynnal gyda llywodraeth leol parthed cost cyflog cyfartal?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny'n rhan o'n polisi ni, sef y dylai llywodraeth leol fod yn cynnal adolygiadau i ganfod gwendidau. Wedyn, bydd angen inni weld unrhyw ffeithiau sy'n codi o'r adolygiadau hynny. Yr ydym wedi gwneud yr un peth o fewn y Cynulliad a'r cwangos, ond nid wyf yn siŵr beth yw'r darlun o fewn llywodraeth leol. Byddaf yn ysgrifennu atoch, neu yn gofyn i Jane Hutt wneud ar y pwnc hwn.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): Last year, your Finance Minister threatened to cap local councils in Wales, which was a measure that even John Redwood had turned his back on. Will you be threatening to cap local authorities this year?

The First Minister: Most people living in most local authority areas in Wales, especially in Cardiff, will be saying 'Thank God she did'. If you walk around the streets of Cardiff and ask people, 'Do you think that

cynghorau lleol yn cyflawni eu swyddogaethau gweithredol yn ymsefydlu erbyn hyn, a'n bod yn gallu gweld y manteision o ran atebolrwydd a hefyd y posibilrwydd o godi safonau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus? Fodd bynnag, a ydych hefyd yn cytuno bod angen inni yn awr wella swyddogaeth graffu llywodraeth leol, a ninnau efallai heb wneud cymaint o gynnydd ag y dylem fod wedi'i wneud yn ystod y pum neu'r chwe mlynedd diwethaf?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn seicolegol, yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn gywir. Nid yw pobl yn deall eu swyddogaeth graffu, am eu bod yn pendroni ynghylch beth yn union yw eu swyddogaeth os nad ydynt ar y fainc flaen neu'n aelod o'r 'cabinet' bondigrybwyll. Nid ydynt mewn gwirionedd wedi deall y swyddogaeth hanfodol y gall craffu ei chyflawni. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y sefyllfa'n gwella'n weddol gyflym, ac ychydig o awdurdodau erbyn hyn sydd mor anhapus ag a oeddent pan gyflwynwyd y patrwm newydd ddwy neu dair blynedd yn ôl.

David Lloyd: What discussions have you had with local government regarding the cost of equal pay?

The First Minister: That is part of our policy, namely that local government should be conducting reviews to identify weaknesses, and that we then will need to look at any facts that arise from those reviews. We have done the same within the Assembly and the quangos, but I am not sure what the picture is in local government. I will write to you, or I will ask Jane Hutt to do so on this issue.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Y llynedd, cafwyd bygythiad gan eich Gweinidog dros Gyllid i gapio cynghorau lleol yng Nghymru, cam yr oedd hyd yn oed John Redwood wedi ymwrthod ag ef. A fyddwch yn bygwth capio awdurdodau lleol eleni?

Y Prif Weinidog: Bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sy'n byw yn y rhan fwyaf o ardaloedd yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig yng Nghaerdydd, yn dweud 'Diolch i Dduw ei bod wedi gwneud hynny'. Os cerddwch o

Sue Essex was right to do this?', you will find that they say, 'Thank God she did'. In the end, it was not necessary, because the Liberal Democrat-controlled council backed off what appeared to be a course hell-bent on some sort of political set-to, which was quite unnecessary. It is not a pleasant thing to do but, on the other hand, sometimes you have to face up to those responsibilities, because you realise that bigger issues are at stake.

gwmpas strydoedd Caerdydd a gofyn i bobl 'A ydych yn credu bod Sue Essex yn iawn wrth wneud hyn?', yr ateb a gewch fydd 'Diolch i Dduw ei bod wedi gwneud hynny'. Yn y pen draw, ni fu'n rhaid cymryd y cam, oherwydd bod y cyngor, dan reolaeth y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, wedi troi'n ôl oddi ar lwybr a oedd yn sicr o arwain at ymrafael gwleidyddol, sefyllfa gwbl ddianghenraid. Nid yw'n beth braf i'w wneud, ond ar y llaw arall, weithiau, mae'n rhaid wynebu'r cyfrifoldebau hynny, oherwydd eich bod yn sylweddoli bod materion pwysicach yn y fantol.

2.30 p.m.

Michael German: I will take that as a 'yes' and that you are intent on capping again this year or that there is a threat of capping this year, especially as your regime last year was threatening to cap Cardiff council with a negative increase. In other words, you told it that it had to make a reduction in its council tax—the previous Labour administration had obviously gone wrong somewhere, because you had to correct that when there was a different administration in. First Minister, currently £8 out of every £10 that local government in Wales spends comes from the National Assembly. Where is the local democracy in that and what are you doing to ensure that local authorities have more opportunity to develop their own policies and that real devolution is at work in Wales?

Michael German: Cymeraf mai'r ateb oedd 'byddwn'a'ch bod yn benderfynol o gapio eto eleni neu fod bygythiad i gapio eleni, yn enwedig o gofio bod eich Llywodraeth wedi bygwth capio cyngor Caerdydd y llynedd drwy roi cynnydd negyddol. Mewn geiriau eraill, dywedasoeh wrtho fod rhaid iddo ostwng ei dreth gyngor—mae'n amlwg bod y weinyddiaeth Lafur flaenorol wedi gwneud rhyw gamgymeriad, gan eich bod wedi gorfod cywiro hynny pan oedd gweinyddiaeth arall mewn grym. Brif Weinidog, ar hyn o bryd mae £8 o bob £10 y mae llywodraeth leol yng Nghymru'n ei wario'n dod oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Sut y gellir galw hynny'n ddemocratiaeth leol a pha gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod yr awdurdodau lleol yn cael mwy o gyfle i ddatblygu eu polisiau eu hunain a bod datganoli gwirioneddol ar waith yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: Actually, I think what happened is that the Lib-Dem council in Cardiff was spoken to by Lib-Dem councils in Swansea and Bridgend, who said 'Don't do anything so foolish'. Thank God that they did. The important thing then is to say 'Okay, 20 per cent of funding comes from central Government and the revenue support grant covers 80 per cent of expenditure'. Local authorities put a lot of emphasis on an expectation that if we give them a job to do they are funded through the revenue support grant or hypothecated grants to cover that expenditure. That is a good principle: if we give them more jobs, we pay them to do those jobs. If we intend for them to carry out

Y Prif Weinidog: Mewn gwirionedd, yr wyf yn credu mai'r hyn a ddigwyddodd oedd bod cynghorau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn Abertawe a Phen-y-bont ar Ogwr wedi cael gair â chyngor y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yng Nghaerdydd, a'u bod wedi dweud 'Peidiwch â bod mor wirion'. Diolch byth eu bod wedi gwneud hynny. Y peth pwysig wedyn yw dweud 'O'r gorau, mae 20 y cant o'r arian yn dod oddi wrth Lywodraeth ganolog ac mae'r grant cynnal refeniw'n gofalu am 80 y cant o'r gwariant'. Mae awdurdodau lleol yn rhoi llawer o bwyslais ar ddisgwyl y byddant yn cael arian, os byddwn yn rhoi gwaith iddynt, drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw neu grantiau sydd wedi eu clustnodi

increased responsibilities, then we need to refund them for the cost of carrying them out.

Unfortunately, it has the effect that you are describing, but I do not want you to go to the other extreme—the William Hague extreme of his last year, when he decided that we had to have a kind of stealth tax in Wales, by which local government council tax had to increase by 18 per cent, if you recall, compared to 9 per cent in England.

Michael German: The question that I was asking you, beyond the bits of mythology that we are having this afternoon, was whether it is right, when you have local government, local democracy and devolution at work, that £8 out of every £10 that local councils spend should come from the National Assembly? Should there not be more devolution? Should local government not be set free by you, and, if you think so, how do you intend to do it?

The First Minister: That is precisely the point: if we give local authorities a job to do, that is, to run the schools and to pay the teachers, then they will say, 'Okay, well, you give us the money to pay the teachers and we will pay the teachers'. That is a huge expenditure. We expect them to look after children, and therefore they will say, 'Okay, well, you pay the social workers, or we will have to pay the social workers.' We have to give them the money. I do not know what you are advocating other than the Hagueite point of, 'Well, you have to reduce this amount, and therefore you are more on your own'. That would be absurd; I do not think that we want to go down that road at all. I do not ever want to see 18 per cent increases in council tax in Wales, as we had under William Hague. What is important is, if you give local government a job to do, that you have to find the money for it to do it. That does have the consequences that you have expressed, but I do not see any alternative.

ar gyfer y gwariant hwnnw. Mae honno'n egwyddor dda: os rhoddwn fwy o waith iddynt, talwn iddynt am wneud y gwaith hwnnw. Os ydym yn bwriadu iddynt gyflawni mwy o gyfrifoldebau, rhaid inni adalu iddynt am gost eu cyflawni.

Gwaetha'r modd, caiff hynny'r effaith yr ydych yn ei disgrifio, ond nid wyf am ichi fynd i'r eithaf arall—a mynd dros ben llestri fel y gwnaeth William Hague yn ystod ei flwyddyn olaf, pan benderfynodd fod rhaid inni gael rhyw fath o dreth lechwraidd yng Nghymru, a olygai fod rhaid i dreth gyngor llywodraeth leol godi 18 y cant, os cofiwch, o'i gymharu â 9 y cant yn Lloegr.

Michael German: Y cwestiwn a ofynnais i chi, gan anghofio'r hanesion di-sail yr ydym yn eu clywed y prynhawn yma, oedd a ydyw'n iawn, pan fo llywodraeth leol, democratiaeth leol a datganoli ar waith, fod £8 o bob £10 y mae cynghorau lleol yn ei wario'n dod oddi wrth y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol? Oni ddylid cael mwy o ddatganoli? Oni ddylech ryddhau llywodraeth leol, ac, os credwch y dylech, sut yr ydych yn bwriadu gwneud hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna daro'r hoelen ar ei phen: os rhoddwn waith i'w wneud gan awdurdodau lleol, hynny yw, rhedeg yr ysgolion a thalu i'r athrawon, byddant yn dweud, 'O'r gorau, rhowch chi'r arian i ni i dalu i'r athrawon ac fe dalwn i'r athrawon'. Mae hwnnw'n swm anferth o wariant. Yr ydym yn disgwyl iddynt ofalu am blant, ac felly byddant yn dweud, 'O'r gorau, talwch chi i'r gweithwyr cymdeithasol, neu byddwn ni'n gorfod talu iddynt.' Rhaid inni roi'r arian iddynt. Nid wyf yn gwybod beth yr ydych yn ei argymhell heblaw'r pwynt a wnaeth Hague, sef, 'Wel, rhaid ichi ostwng y swm hwn, ac felly yr ydych ar eich pen eich hun i fwy o raddau'. Byddai hynny'n hurt; nid wyf yn credu ein bod am ddilyn y llwybr hwnnw o gwbl. Nid wyf byth am weld y dreth gyngor yn codi 18 y cant yng Nghymru, fel y digwyddodd dan William Hague. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw, os rhoddwch waith i lywodraeth leol, fod rhaid ichi ddod o hyd i'r arian iddi gael ei wneud. Mae hynny'n arwain at y canlyniadau yr ydych wedi eu disgrifio, ond nid wyf yn gweld bod dewis arall.

Diogelwch Plant yn yr Ysgol Children's Safety in Schools

Q8 Laura Anne Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the measures in place to ensure children's safety in Welsh schools? OAQ1170(FM)

The First Minister: On 24 January, Jane Davidson wrote to those working in education, setting out the strengthened arrangements in Wales for safeguarding children, and how Ruth Kelly's proposals will have an impact here and in England. We remain totally committed to promoting children's safety in schools in Wales.

Laura Anne Jones: Parents throughout my constituency and throughout Wales are desperately worried for their children's safety since it was highlighted that there are flaws in the system used to prevent registered sex offenders from teaching in schools. With this being first and foremost in people's minds, First Minister, I urge you strongly to ensure that our children's safety is first and foremost in your mind in implementing these proposals as soon as possible. However, in general, it has come to light that nearly one in 10 primary schools in Wales have shortcomings in child-protection measures as a whole. How are you tackling this and ensuring our children's safety across the board?

The First Minister: If you read—it is a very long letter, but it needs to be—the letter that Jane Davidson sent out on 24 January, you will see that it covers every aspect of the necessary changes that will cover the gaps that I think that you are referring to between the sex offenders register, List 99 and the Protection of Children Act 1999 list, which covers people who are not directly in education, and ensure that there is a seamless protection of children. If you have not had a copy, I am sure that I can supply one to Assembly Members. We do not know of any individual case that would have slipped through that net, so, on the 'desperately worried' point, I would press you not to encourage parents' worries, but to encourage their reassurance, because we have no knowledge of anyone who has slipped

Q8 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y mesurau sydd ar waith er mwyn sicrhau diogelwch plant yn ysgolion Cymru? OAQ1170(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar 24 Ionawr, ysgrifennodd Jane Davidson at y rhai sydd yn gweithio ym myd addysg, gan ddisgrifio'r trefniadau cadarnach yng Nghymru ar gyfer diogelu plant, a'r effaith a gaiff cynigion Ruth Kelly yma ac yn Lloegr. Yr ydym wedi llwyr ymrwymo o hyd i hyrwyddo diogelwch plant mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru.

Laura Anne Jones: Mae rhieni ledled fy etholaeth a ledled Cymru'n poeni'n ddirfawr ynghylch diogelwch eu plant er pan dynnwyd sylw at y ffaith bod diffygion yn y system a ddefnyddir i atal troseddwy'r rhyw cofrestredig rhag dysgu mewn ysgolion. Gan mai am hyn y mae pobl yn meddwl yn anad dim, Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn eich taer annog i sicrhau mai am ddiogelwch ein plant yn anad dim y byddwch yn meddwl wrth roi'r cynigion hyn ar waith cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, cafwyd gwybod bod diffygion yn y mesurau amddiffyn plant mewn un o bob 10 bron o'r ysgolion cynradd yng Nghymru at ei gilydd. Sut yr ydych yn delio â hynny ac yn gofalu am ddiogelwch ein plant yn gyffredinol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Os darllenwch y llythyr—mae'n llythyr hir iawn, ond rhaid iddo fod yn hir—a anfonodd Jane Davidson ar 24 Ionawr, gwelwch ei fod yn ymdrin â phob agwedd ar y newidiadau angenrheidiol a fydd yn cau'r bylchau yr wyf yn credu eich bod yn cyfeirio atynt rhwng y gofrestr troseddwy'r rhyw, Rhestr 99 a rhestr Deddf Amddiffyn Plant 1999, sydd yn cynnwys rhai nad ydynt yn ymwneud ag addysg yn uniongyrchol, ac yn sicrhau bod amddiffyniad di-fwlch ar gyfer plant. Os na chawsoch gopi, yr wyf yn siŵr y gallaf roi un i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Nid ydym yn gwybod am ddim un achos unigol a fyddai wedi mynd drwy'r rhwyd, felly, ynghylch y pwynt am 'boeni'n ddirfawr', yr wyf yn eich annog i beidio ag ennyn pryderon rhieni ond, yn hytrach, i dawelu eu meddyliau, gan nad ydym yn gwybod am neb

through the net. I believe that that has been the case for considerable time. What is important is that schools realise that, as employers, they have to take the responsibility of making sure that they undertake those checks. That applies to schools in the private, the diocesan, the voluntary-aided and the state sectors.

Gwenda Thomas: Do you agree that, later this afternoon, the discussion on the regulation for the commencement of section 175 of the Education Act 2002 will mean that the protection of our children in schools will be considerably improved?

The First Minister: We certainly expect that local education authorities, governing bodies, and further education institutions will make arrangements under section 175 to safeguard and promote the welfare of children. The consultation on the accompanying statutory guidance highlights the need for policies and procedures to be in place. However, they are all based on the premise of employers accepting their responsibility to carry out the checks, the checks being done in a relatively easy way, and, when they are done, there being no gap between those checks through which any kind of predatory paedophile could creep.

Janet Ryder: Minister, it is two years after the Clywch report and we are still waiting for the Government to implement some of the major recommendations that Peter Clarke made in that report. They will have an immediate impact on children's safety. The Minister guaranteed that we would have an update on where we are in implementing those, but we still have not had it. When will we at least receive a statement from the Government saying when Peter Clarke's recommendations will be implemented?

The First Minister: I am not familiar with the particular aspects that Peter Clarke highlighted, apart from what is in the Bichard report. As I do not have that information, I will ask Jane Davidson to write to you to make sure that we cover both angles.

sydd wedi mynd drwy'r rhwyd. Yr wyf yn credu bod hynny'n wir ers cryn amser. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod ysgolion yn sylweddoli bod rhaid iddynt dderbyn cyfrifoldeb, fel cyflogwyr, dros sicrhau eu bod yn gwneud y gwiriadau hynny. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i ysgolion yn y sector preifat, y rhai esgobaethol, y rhai gwirfoddol a gynorthwyr a'r rhai yn y sector gwladol.

Gwenda Thomas: A ydych yn cytuno y bydd y drafodaeth ar y rheoliad i gychwyn adran 175 o Ddeddf Addysg 2002, yn ddiweddarach y prynhawn yma, yn golygu y bydd ein plant yn cael eu hamddiffyn yn well o lawer mewn ysgolion?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn sicr yn disgwyl y bydd awdurdodau addysg lleol, cyrff llywodraethu a sefydliadau addysg bellach yn gwneud trefniadau o dan adran 175 i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant. Mae'r ymgynghoriad ar y canllawiau statudol sydd yn cyd-fynd â hynny'n tynnu sylw at yr angen i roi polisïau a gweithdrefnau ar waith. Fodd bynnag, maent i gyd wedi eu seilio ar y rhagdybiaeth bod cyflogwyr yn derbyn eu cyfrifoldeb i gwblhau'r gwiriadau, y caiff y gwiriadau eu gwneud mewn modd cymharol rwydd, ac, ar ôl eu gwneud, na fydd dim bwlch rhwng y gwiriadau hynny y gallai unrhyw fath o bedoffil sy'n ceisio manteisio ar rywun sleifio drwyddo.

Janet Ryder: Weinidog, aeth dwy flynedd heibio ers cyhoeddi adroddiad Clywch ac yr ydym yn dal i ddisgwyl i'r Llywodraeth roi ar waith rai o'r argymhellion pwysig a wnaeth Peter Clarke yn yr adroddiad hwnnw. Cânt effaith uniongyrchol ar ddiogelwch plant. Rhoddodd y Gweinidog sicrwydd y caem adroddiad am y datblygiadau diweddaraf o ran eu rhoi ar waith, ond nid ydym wedi ei gael byth. Pa bryd y cawn o leiaf ddatganiad gan y Llywodraeth yn dweud pa bryd y bydd argymhellion Peter Clarke yn cael eu rhoi ar waith?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r agweddau penodol y tynnodd Peter Clarke sylw atynt ar wahân i'r hyn sydd yn adroddiad Bichard. Gan nad yw'r wybodaeth honno gennyf, gofynnaf i Jane Davidson ysgrifennu atoch i sicrhau ein bod yn ymdrin â'r ddwy agwedd ar hyn.

Datblygu Gwasanaethau Gwledig
The Development of Rural Services

Q9 Elin Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygu gwasanaethau gwledig yng Nghymru? OAQ1195(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae polisiau a chynlluniau cyllid cysylltiol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sy'n mynd law yn llaw â blaenoriaethau strategol 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', yn helpu i sicrhau bod gwasanaethau lleol ledled Cymru yn cael eu cefnogi.

Elin Jones: Byddwch yn gwybod am gyhoeddiad y Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd yn Aberystwyth yr wythnos diwethaf y bydd 40 o bobl yn colli'u swyddi oherwydd rhyw £3 miliwn na fydd yn cael ei dderbyn gan Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig ar gyfer gwaith ymchwil. Brif Weinidog, chi yw'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am wyddoniaeth, felly a ydych yn barod i gynnal trafodaethau brys gyda DEFRA i ddiogelu gwaith ymchwil IGER, sef un o'r ychydig sefydliadau ymchwil swyddogol sydd gennym yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno mai hwnnw yw'r unig sefydliad ymchwil sylweddol. Er fy mod yn gyfrifol am y portffolio gwyddoniaeth, nid yw'r portffolio wedi ei ddatganoli. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod y Cyngor Ymchwil Biotechnoleg a'r Gwyddorau Biolegol wedi penderfynu targedu pethau sy'n cynyddu o ran diddordeb cyhoeddus, er enghraifft cynhesu byd-eang, sy'n golygu llai o flaenoriaeth i gnydau newydd a ffyrdd newydd o ddefnyddio gwair a phorfa o fathau newydd, sef y math o bethau y mae IGER yn arbenigo ynddynt. Mae'n drueni mawr ond, wrth gwrs yr ydym wedi dechrau trafodaethau ar raddfa swyddogion ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o aildefnyddio neu ailwampio'r sgiliau sydd gan staff IGER yn y meysydd hollbwysig hyn er, efallai, nad yw'r cyhoedd a'r byd gwleidyddol yn eu hystyried gymaint â chynhesu byd-eang.

Lisa Francis: Ceredigion County Council cabinet members say that they have been left with no choice but to cut services and save money because of pressures from the

Q9 Elin Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the development of rural services in Ceredigion? OAQ1195(FM)

The First Minister: The Assembly Government's policies and related funding plans, aligned to the strategic priorities of 'Wales: A Better Country', help ensure support for local services across Wales.

Elin Jones: You will know about last week's announcement by the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research in Aberystwyth that 40 people will lose their jobs because of some £3 million that will not be received from the Department of the Environment, Food and Rural Affairs for research work. First Minister, you are the Minister with responsibility for science, therefore will you conduct urgent talks with DEFRA to secure IGER's research work, as IGER is one of the few official research institutions that we have in Wales?

The First Minister: I agree that that is the only major research institution. Although I am responsible for the science portfolio, it has not been devolved. It is important to realise that the Biotechnology and Biological Sciences Research Council has decided to target issues that are increasingly in the public eye, for example, global warming, which means less emphasis on new crops and new ways of using new grasses, which is the kind of thing that IGER specialises in. It is a great pity, but, of course, we have started discussions at official level about the possibility of reusing or revamping the skills of IGER's staff in these all-important fields, although, perhaps, the public and the political world do not consider them to be as important as global warming.

Lisa Francis: Mae aelodau cabinet Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yn dweud nad oes dewis ganddynt ond cwtogi gwasanaethau ac arbed arian oherwydd pwysau o du'r Cynulliad.

Assembly. Brynherbert and Ferwig schools may close and others may follow suit. It is proposed that changes will also be made to school transport. What steps will your Government take if the county council decides that it needs to axe more educational facilities in the future to make the books balance?

The First Minister: You have twice, in that question, put an interpretation on matters that I am not sure exists in the minds of Ceredigion county councillors. Are you saying that these changes to the school pattern are caused by budgetary pressures? You said that twice and I am surprised that you did so because, as far as I am aware, Brynherbert school has only three pupils and Ferwig, a school that I know well, has only eight pupils. Therefore, I would have thought that those decisions were taken for educational reasons—there have not been any parental objections, therefore the cases have not come to the Minister for statutory adjudication. It is up to Ceredigion County Council how it decides to spend its money. However, every local authority, to a degree, has to decide on the budget and how we make the best use of it. You cannot therefore say that such and such a rural school has closed because of financial pressures, when it only has three or eight pupils. You said it twice, which probably means that you do not even believe that interpretation yourself.

Mae'n bosibl y bydd ysgolion Brynherbert a'r Ferwig yn cau a gallai eraill wneud yr un fath. Cynigir newidiadau hefyd i gludiant i'r ysgol. Pa gamau y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd os bydd y cyngor sir yn penderfynu bod rhaid iddo gael gwared ar ragor o gyfleusterau addysgol yn y dyfodol er mwyn mantoli'r cyfrifon?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych wedi dehongli pethau ddwy waith yn y cwestiwn hwnnw mewn modd nad wyf yn sicr a yw'n bod ym meddyliau cynghorwyr sir Ceredigion. A ydych yn dweud bod y newidiadau hyn i batrwm ysgolion yn ganlyniad i bwysau cyllidebol? Dywedasoeh hynny ddwy waith ac yr wyf yn synnu eich bod wedi gwneud hynny oherwydd, hyd y gwn, dim ond tri disgybl sydd yn ysgol Brynherbert ac yn ysgol y Ferwig, sydd yn ysgol yr wyf yn ei hadnabod yn dda, nid oes ond wyth disgybl. Felly, byddwn wedi tybio bod y penderfyniadau hynny wedi eu gwneud am resymau addysgol—ni chafwyd dim gwrthwynebiad gan rieni, felly nid yw'r achosion hyn wedi dod gerbron y Gweinidog ar gyfer dyfarniad statudol. Lle Cyngor Sir Ceredigion yw penderfynu sut y mae'n gwario ei arian. Fodd bynnag, mae pob awdurdod lleol, i ryw raddau, yn gorfod penderfynu ar y gyllideb a sut i wneud y defnydd gorau ohoni. Ni allwch ddweud, felly, fod rhyw ysgol wledig neu'i gilydd wedi cau oherwydd pwysau ariannol, a hithau â dim ond tri neu wyth ddisgybl. Dywedasoeh hynny ddwy waith, ac mae hynny'n dangos nad ydych yn credu'r dehongliad hwnnw eich hun hyd yn oed, yn ôl pob tebyg.

2.40 p.m.

Gweithredu Ymrwymadau Maniffesto The Implementation of Maniffesto Commitments

Q10 Leanne Wood: Will the First Minister give a progress report on the implementation of the Welsh Assembly Government's maniffesto commitments? OAQ1166(FM)

Q10 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog roi adroddiad cynnydd am weithredu ymrwymadau maniffesto Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ1166(FM)

The First Minister: We continue to make good progress on the introduction of free school breakfasts across 19 local education authorities, and we have initiated a free

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn dal i wneud cynnydd da o ran cyflwyno brecwastau am ddim yn yr ysgol mewn 19 o awdurdodau addysg lleol, ac yr ydym wedi sefydlu polisi

prescription policy that will see charges dropped to £3 an item in April 2006, with no charges from April 2007.

Leanne Wood: Returning to the matter of schools, Blaenclydach Infants School will close in July, if the Labour-run Rhondda Cynon Taf council has its way. That is just two months before the children are due to celebrate the school's centenary year. This school has around 90 pupils, it has spent tens of thousands of pounds in recent years and it is a real asset to the community, providing breakfast clubs, after-school clubs, youth clubs, and so on. Why did you not mention your schools closure programme in Labour's last manifesto?

The First Minister: Because we do not have one. That is a bizarre question, Leanne. Perhaps you are taking lessons in how to ask bizarre and irrelevant questions. You have to be aware that the rate of school closures—sometimes small schools, sometimes not so small—has been at roughly the same rate for the past 20 to 30 years. Some school closures have been objected to, as at Blaenclydach, while others have not, such as Ysgol y Ferwig and Brynherbert, as I understand it. The rate is roughly the same. Therefore, it is part of life. You cannot modernise the school estate to achieve delivery of the national curriculum in modern surroundings and say that the pattern of schools that we inherited from the Victorian or Edwardian eras must remain the same half way through the twenty-first century, especially when the number of children is falling. It is not the Assembly Government's fault if the number of children is falling—one thing that I cannot take responsibility for is the Welsh birth rate. The fact is that the number of children is falling, and the number of old schools that we have is much higher than the average. Therefore, when you modernise, you have to make a decision. Do you go for one for two, two for three, or do you modernise all three schools in your area? Those are the considerations that local government has to face up to.

presgripsiynau am ddim a fydd yn peri y bydd taliadau'n gostwng i £3 yr eitem yn Ebrill 2006, ac na fydd dim taliadau o Ebrill 2007.

Leanne Wood: Gan droi'n ôl at fater ysgolion, bydd Ysgol Babanod Blaenclydach yn cau ym mis Gorffennaf, os bydd cyngor Rhondda Cynon Taf, sydd yn cael ei redeg gan Lafur, yn cael ei ffordd. Nid yw hynny ond dau fis cyn bod y plant i fod i ddatlu canmlwyddiant yr ysgol. Mae tua 90 o ddisgyblion yn yr ysgol dan sylw, mae wedi gwario degau o filoedd o bunnoedd yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf ac mae o fudd gwirioneddol i'r gymuned, gan ei bod yn darparu clybiau brechwast, clybiau ar ôl yr ysgol, clybiau ieuenctid, ac yn y blaen. Pam na chyfeiriasoch at eich rhaglen ar gyfer cau ysgolion ym maniffesto diwethaf Llafur?

Y Prif Weinidog: Am nad oes gennym un. Mae hwnnw'n gwestiwn rhyfedd gennyh, Leanne. Efallai'ch bod yn cael gwersi ynghylch sut i ofyn cwestiynau rhyfedd ac amherthnasol. Yr ydych yn sicr o wybod bod y gyfradd ar gyfer cau ysgolion—ysgolion bach weithiau, ac weithiau rhai nad ydynt mor fach—wedi bod yn weddol gyson ers 20 i 30 mlynedd. Cafwyd gwrthwynebiad i'r bwriad i gau rhai ysgolion, megis ym Mlaenclydach, tra na chafwyd gwrthwynebiad mewn achosion eraill, fel Ysgol y Ferwig a Brynherbert, fel yr wyf yn deall. Mae'r gyfradd yr un fath yn fras. Felly, mae'n rhan o'r drefn mewn bywyd. Ni ellir moderneiddio adeiladau ysgolion er mwyn darparu'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol mewn amgylchoedd modern a dweud wedyn fod rhaid i'r patrwm ysgolion a etifeddasom o oes Fictoria neu Edward barhau hyd ganol yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, yn enwedig o gofio bod nifer y plant yn gostwng. Nid Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd ar fai am fod nifer y plant yn gostwng—un peth na allaf dderbyn cyfrifoldeb amdano yw'r gyfradd genedigaethau yng Nghymru. Y gwir amdani yw bod nifer y plant yn gostwng, a bod nifer yr hen ysgolion sydd gennym yn uwch o lawer na'r cyfartaledd. Felly, pan fyddwch yn moderneiddio, rhaid ichi wneud penderfyniad. A ydych yn mynd ati i foderneiddio un ysgol am bob dwy, dwy am bob tair, neu a ydych yn moderneiddio pob un o'r tair ysgol yn eich ardal? Dyna'r

ystyriaethau y mae llywodraeth leol yn gorfod eu hwynebu.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): In the foreword to Labour's 2003 Assembly election manifesto, the First Minister spoke of the importance of gaining money over and above the Barnett block in terms of extra funds to exploit the opportunities presented under Objective 1. Is it his intention to go to the Treasury again to ask for money over and above Barnett so that we can do that again in this second round of what is now called convergence funding?

The First Minister: We have done it, because of the point that was in the small print of the budget. The £1.3 billion for the Objective 1 successor programme, or convergence, no longer requires a specific negotiation because the Government has now done what Alun Michael asked for five years ago, and has taken it outside the block. The next big issue for us, therefore, is to negotiate with the EU what the intervention rate will be on Objective 1, and at the same time, negotiate with the UK authorities how much money should come to east Wales under the competitiveness programme. Those are our two priorities. Obviously, the money coming to the Objective 2 east Wales areas will not be anything like as great as that for Objective 1, but that will also be above the Barnett formula following the change made by Gordon Brown in the pre-budget report.

Nick Bourne: I accept the importance of European money for east Wales, but that was not the question. The question was specific, and I did not have a specific answer to it. Will you, in principle, ask the Treasury for money above the Barnett block for match funding in this next round of convergence funding? You do not need to know the intervention rate to make the decision in principle as to whether you will ask for such money.

The First Minister: When you read the Record tomorrow, I think that you will find that you did not actually mention match funding. You were just asking for money

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Yn y rhagair i fanifesto Llafur ar gyfer etholiad y Cynulliad yn 2003, cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog at bwysigrwydd sicrhau arian yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett er mwyn cael cyllid ychwanegol i achub ar y cyfleoedd a geir o dan Amcan 1. A yw'n bwriadu mynd at y Trysorlys eto i ofyn am arian yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett fel y gallwn wneud hynny eto yn ail gylch yr hyn a elwir bellach yn gyllid cydgyfeirio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi llwyddo, oherwydd y pwynt a oedd ym mhrint mân y gyllideb. Bellach nid oes angen negodi'n benodol ynghylch yr £1.3 biliwn ar gyfer y rhaglen sydd yn olynu Amcan 1, neu'r rhaglen gydgyfeirio, gan fod y Llywodraeth wedi gwneud yr hyn y gofynnodd Alun Michael amdano bum mlynedd yn ôl, ac wedi peri ei fod y tu allan i'r bloc. Y pwnc pwysig nesaf i ni, felly, fydd negodi â'r UE ar y gyfradd ymyrryd ar gyfer Amcan 1 ac, ar yr un pryd, negodi ag awdurdodau'r DU ynghylch pa faint o arian a ddylai ddod i ddwyrain Cymru dan y rhaglen cystadleurwydd. Dyna'r ddwy flaenoriaeth sydd gennym. Wrth gwrs, ni fydd cymaint o arian o bellffordd yn dod i'r ardaloedd Amcan 2 yn y dwyrain â hynny ar gyfer Amcan 1, ond bydd hwnnw hefyd yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett wedi'r newid a wnaed gan Gordon Brown yn yr adroddiad rhag-gyllidebol.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn derbyn bod arian Ewropeaidd ar gyfer dwyrain Cymru'n bwysig, ond nid am hynny yr oedd y cwestiwn. Yr oedd y cwestiwn yn un penodol, ac ni roesoch ateb penodol iddo. A fyddwch, mewn egwyddor, yn gofyn i'r Trysorlys am arian yn ychwanegol at floc Barnett ar gyfer arian cyfatebol yn y cylch nesaf o gyllid cydgyfeirio? Nid oes angen ichi wybod beth yw'r gyfradd ymyrryd er mwyn penderfynu mewn egwyddor a fyddwch yn gofyn am arian o'r fath.

Y Prif Weinidog: Pan ddarllenwch y Cofnod yfory, yr wyf yn credu y gwelwch na soniasoch am arian cyfatebol mewn gwirionedd. Dim ond holi yr oeddech am

above the Barnett formula. The money for east Wales, if we are successful in negotiating an east Wales programme, will be above the Barnett formula because the change made by Gordon Brown covers that area as well. I have said it before, and I say it again, that when we know the intervention rates, when we know whether we have been successful and to what degree vis-à-vis the east Wales programme, which is extremely important, although the money is not as great as it is for west Wales and the Valleys, then we will have some idea of how much match funding there is in the system, and therefore whether there is a case for going to the Treasury. We do not rule anything in or out at this stage.

Nick Bourne: When the First Minister consults the Record he will see that I, quite advisedly, said that I am not asking about east Wales. I am asking about west Wales and the Valleys and the convergence funding. I am asking, not whether you have ruled anything in or out, but whether you will now give a commitment—bearing in mind how you came to power and what happened to your predecessor—to seek match funding money, over and above Barnett, for convergence funding of projects in the second round. We have had resounding silence from you as to whether, in principle, you are prepared to say, ‘Of course, for the sake of Wales, I will do that’. You have not answered that very specific and simple question.

The First Minister: For the sake of Wales, you must understand that the east Wales funding will also be over and above the Barnett formula. You may not be interested in east Wales, but there are, potentially, very big sums at stake here. We want to negotiate and fight for every last penny that we can get for Wales. Following Gordon Brown’s decision, it will be over and above the Barnett formula. You may not be able to appreciate the attractions of doing that, when we know, in advance, that this is going to be over and above the Barnett formula. That is a negotiation that we do not undertake with the EU. We undertake that negotiation with the UK authorities, including the Scottish Executive. It is an extremely important

arian ar ben fformiwla Barnett. Bydd yr arian ar gyfer dwyrain Cymru, os llwyddwn i negodi rhaglen ar gyfer y dwyrain, yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett gan fod y newid a wnaeth Gordon Brown yn cynnwys hynny hefyd. Yr wyf wedi dweud hyn o’r blaen, ac fe’i dywedaf eto, ar ôl cael gwybod beth yw’r cyfraddau ymyrryd, ac a ydym wedi llwyddo ac i ba raddau mewn cysylltiad â’r rhaglen ar gyfer y dwyrain, sydd yn dra phwysig, er nad yw’r arian ar ei chyfer yn gymaint â hynny ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd, y bydd gennym wedi hynny ryw syniad ynghylch faint o arian cyfatebol a fydd ar gael, ac felly a oes dadl dros fynd at y Trysorlys. Nid ydym yn cynnwys nac yn diystyru dim byd ar hyn o bryd.

Nick Bourne: Pan fydd y Prif Weinidog yn edrych ar y Cofnod bydd yn gweld imi ddweud, yn weddol bwylllog, nad holi am ddwyrain Cymru yr wyf. Holi yr wyf am orllewin Cymru a’r Cymoedd a’r cyllid cydgyfeirio. Nid wyf yn gofyn a ydych wedi cynnwys neu ddiystyru unrhyw beth, ond a fyddwch yn awr yn ymrwymo—gan gadw mewn cof sut y daethoch i rym a’r hyn a ddigwyddodd i’ch rhagflaenydd—i geisio cael arian cyfatebol, yn ychwanegol at arian Barnett, ar gyfer cyllid cydgyfeirio i brosiectau yn yr ail rownd. Yr ydym wedi cael tawelwch llethol gennych ynghylch a ydych, mewn egwyddor, yn fodlon dweud, ‘Wrth gwrs, er mwyn Cymru, gwnaf hynny’. Nid ydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn syml a phenodol iawn hwnnw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Er mwyn Cymru, rhaid i chi ddeall y bydd cyllid dwyrain Cymru hefyd yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett. Efallai nad oes gennych ddi-ddordeb yn nwyrain Cymru, ond gall fod symiau mawr yn y fantol yma. Mae arnom eisiau negodi a brwydro dros bob ceiniog y gallwn ei hennill i Gymru. Yn sgîl penderfyniad Gordon Brown, bydd yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett. Efallai nad ydych yn gallu sylweddoli atyniad gwneud hynny, a ninnau’n gwybod, ymlaen llaw, y bydd hyn yn ychwanegol at fformiwla Barnett. Mae hynny’n drafodaeth nad ydym yn ei chynnal gyda’r UE. Yr ydym yn cyd-drafod hynny gydag awdurdodau’r DU, gan gynnwys Gweithrediaeth yr Alban. Mae’n broses

bargaining process, and we will be giving a very high priority to it.

fargeinio bwysig dros ben, a byddwn yn rhoi blaenoriaeth uchel iawn iddi.

Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question

Colli Swyddi yn Sefydliad Ymchwil Tir Glas a'r Amgylchedd Job Losses at the Institute of Grassland and Environmental Research

Nick Bourne: Will the Minister make a statement about job losses at IGER near Aberystwyth? (EAQ0573)

Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y swyddi sydd i'w colli yn IGER ger Aberystwyth? (EAQ0573)

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I have raised with the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs the potential difficulties at IGER, and I have emphasised how important the institute is to science in England and Wales. I have already written to Lord Bach on the matter, and my senior officials are meeting with DEFRA officials on Monday to discuss the matter.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwald (Carwyn Jones): Yr wyf wedi tynnu sylw Adran yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig at yr anawsterau posibl yn IGER, ac yr wyf wedi pwysleisio pwysigrwydd y sefydliad i wyddoniaeth yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Yr wyf eisoes wedi ysgrifennu at yr Arglwydd Bach ynghylch y mater, ac mae fy uwch swyddogion yn cwrdd â swyddogion DEFRA ddydd Llun i drafod y mater.

Nick Bourne: I am grateful to the Minister for answering the question, and I accept that he has already taken action. Has he had any assurance from DEFRA that it is looking seriously at the cut of £2 million a year in IGER's annual budget of £17 million? It is a massive chunk of the budget, and it represents a reallocation of money to climate change and alternative energy, away from sustainable food and farming.

Nick Bourne: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ateb y cwestiwn, ac yr wyf yn derbyn ei fod eisoes wedi cymryd camau. A yw wedi derbyn unrhyw sicrwydd gan DEFRA fod yr adran yn edrych o ddifrif ar y toriad gwerth £2 filiwn y flwyddyn yng nghyllideb flynyddol IGER o £17 miliwn? Mae'n rhan enfawr o'r gyllideb, ac mae'n golygu ailddyrrannu arian at y newid yn yr hinsawdd ac ynni amgen, yn hytrach na ffermio a bwyd cynaliadwy.

The more than 40 jobs that it has been announced will be lost in Aberystwyth are highly paid, specialist jobs. It is clearly a serious blow to the people involved and their families. I extend our sympathy to them. What is the Minister doing to offer assistance to them in finding alternative employment in the agricultural sector, given that these job losses are going to bite, and that there are probably not any obvious suitable jobs around?

Mae'r 40 a mwy o swyddi y cyhoeddwyd y byddant yn cael eu colli yn Aberystwyth yn swyddi arbenigol sydd â thâl uchel. Mae'n amlwg yn ergyd ddifrifol i'r bobl dan sylw a'u teuluoedd. Yr wyf yn anfon ein cydymdeimlad atynt. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i'w helpu i ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth arall yn y sector amaethyddol, o ystyried y caiff colli'r swyddi hyn gryn effaith, ac mae'n debyg nad oes dim swyddi addas amlwg ar gael?

My second question relates to DEFRA, in this instance, failing to support sustainable food and farming. It is a serious blow to Wales and the whole of the United Kingdom. Is the Minister making that point forcibly? Will that be addressed, and will the Minister

Mae fy ail gwestiwn yn ymwneud â DEFRA, y tro hwn, yn methu â chefnogi ffermio a bwyd cynaliadwy. Mae'n ergyd ddifrifol i Gymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig yn ei chyfanrwydd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn cyfleu'r pwynt hwnnw'n gryf? A roddir sylw i hynny,

come back to the Assembly as negotiations go on with DEFRA to make an announcement about that? There is concern about the loss of these specialist jobs; they are clearly important in this area, as there is a long way to the next town from Aberystwyth. However, quite apart from that, there is a serious agricultural interest and a serious research aspect to this, and this switch of funding to climate change and alternative energy—and I am not speaking against that, but in favour of sustainable food and farming—is a blow, I would have thought, to the Minister's agenda and the Assembly's agenda. That cannot be given enough emphasis in the discussions that you are having with DEFRA.

Carwyn Jones: The immediate priority is to try to find a solution to the shortfall. If that solution is not found, it is right to say that there is a likelihood of job losses. It is not pleasant for those involved to have that hanging over their heads, and that must be accepted. However, the first step is to deal with the issue of the shortfall. I wrote to Lord Bach on 30 January. It was a full letter, which I have in front of me, that emphasised the concerns that we have as a Government. It emphasises the need for an institution such as IGER to be able to deliver on the Welsh Assembly Government's research priorities and its wider strategic objectives. I will keep the committee informed on progress, and, as I mentioned earlier, officials are meeting with DEFRA on Monday to discuss this.

Elin Jones: Diolch, Weinidog, am ateb y cwestiwn brys hwn. Yr oedd newyddion yr wythnos diwethaf yn dipyn o sioc i weithwyr IGER, gan nad oedd y rhan fwyaf ohonynt wedi rhagweld y math hwn o gyhoeddiad. Siaradais â'r Athro Pollock, pennaeth IGER, ddoe. Mae agweddau pwysig ar waith IGER yn cael eu colli oherwydd y toriadau ariannol hyn o gyfeiriad DEFRA.

2.50 p.m.

Gwyddom mai diffyg ariannu DEFRA sy'n gyfrifol am hyn ac, yng Ngheredigion, yr ydym wedi dod yn weddol gyfarwydd, yn anffodus, gydag adrannau o Lywodraeth San Steffan yn tynnu buddsoddiad yn ôl—mae'r

ac a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddod yn ôl at y Cynulliad wrth i'r trafodaethau fynd rhagddynt gyda DEFRA i wneud cyhoeddiad ynghylch hynny? Mae pryder ynghylch colli'r swyddi arbenigol hyn; yn amlwg maent yn bwysig yn yr ardal hon, gan fod y dref nesaf gryn bellter o Aberystwyth. Fodd bynnag, ar wahân i hynny, mae buddiannau amaethyddol pwysig yn gysylltiedig â hyn ac agwedd o bwys o safbwynt ymchwil, ac mae symud y cyllid hwn at y newid yn yr hinsawdd ac ynni amgen—ac nid wyf yn siarad yn erbyn hynny, ond o blaid ffermio a bwyd cynaliadwy—yn ergyd, byddwn yn tybio, i agenda'r Gweinidog ac agenda'r Cynulliad. Ni ellir gorbwysleisio hynny yn y trafodaethau a gewch gyda DEFRA.

Carwyn Jones: Y flaenoriaeth yn awr yw ceisio dod o hyd i ateb ar gyfer y diffyg. Oni ellir dod o hyd i'r ateb hwnnw, mae'n iawn dweud ei bod yn debygol y collir swyddi. Mae'n annifyr i'r rhai sydd dan y cwmwl hwn, a rhaid derbyn hynny. Fodd bynnag, y cam cyntaf yw delio â phroblem y diffyg. Ysgrifennais at yr Arglwydd Bach ar 30 Ionawr. Yr oedd yn llythyr llawn, ac mae o fy mlaen yn awr, a oedd yn pwysleisio'r pryderon sydd gennym fel Llywodraeth. Yr oedd yn pwysleisio bod angen i sefydliad fel IGER allu gwireddu blaenoriaethau ymchwil Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'i hamcanion strategol ehangach. Byddaf yn parhau i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r pwyllgor, ac, fel y dywedais yn gynharach, bydd y swyddogion yn cwrdd â DEFRA ddydd Llun i drafod hyn.

Elin Jones: Thank you, Minister, for responding to the urgent question. Last week's news came as quite a shock to IGER workers, as most of them had not foreseen such an announcement. I spoke to Professor Pollock, the head of IGER, yesterday. Important aspects of the work of IGER will be lost because of these financial cuts from DEFRA.

We know that it is the cut in DEFRA funding which is responsible, and, in Ceredigion, unfortunately, we have become relatively familiar with Westminster Government departments withdrawing investment—the

Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn wedi gwneud hynny, ac mae'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau hefyd yn gwneud hynny ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r gwaith ymchwil sydd o dan fygythiad yn IGER yn berthnasol i'ch portffolio o ran bwyd, amaethyddiaeth a'r amgylchedd yn gyffredinol, fel yr ydych wedi sôn yn barod, ac yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cymryd camau i ysgrifennu at yr Arglwydd Bach. Yn dibynnu ar yr ei ateb, byddwn yn dymuno eich bod yn gweld ei fod yn fater o bwysigrwydd, nid i'r economi leol yng Ngheredigion yn unig, ond hefyd i Gymru gyfan, gan mai hwn yw un o'n sefydliadau ymchwil pwysicaf. Mae'n bwysig eich bod yn cynnal cyfarfod gyda'r Gweinidog perthnasol yn DEFRA i sicrhau nid yn unig yr agweddau sydd o dan fygythiad yn y tymor byr, ond i sicrhau bod DEFRA yn ymwybodol o bwysigrwydd IGER i'r tymor hir, o ran yr hyn yr ydym yn ceisio ei gyflawni yn y Cynulliad ar gyfer datblygu cynaliadwy yn gyffredinol.

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydym am sicrhau bod llawer o gapasiti ymchwil yng Nghymru. Mae'n wir dweud bod y swyddi hyn yn swyddi arbenigol, mewn ffordd, a'i bod yn anodd iawn, os nad yn amhosibl, i'r deiliaid ddod o hyd i gyflogaeth yn yr un math o swyddi yn unman arall yng Nghymru. Yr wyf am aros am ateb yr Arglwydd Bach, ac, os bydd raid, byddaf yn cwrdd ag ef er mwyn sicrhau bod y pwyntiau a godais yn y llythyr yn cael eu hailbwysleisio.

Mick Bates: Thank you for your answer, Minister. I take some heart from the fact that it appears that you are committed to minimising the impact on the staff and the work of the institute, as you said in your previous statement. However, I have particular concerns, and the first is for the staff to be made redundant. Will you make a commitment to speak with the Minister responsible for pensions, because, as you are well aware, a great many staff have concerns for their pension rights when they are made redundant? I hope that you will confirm, through channels and through your good offices, that the workers made redundant will receive their full pension rights.

My other concern is on strategic issues. Others have expressed concern about your

Ministry of Defence has done so, and the Department for Work and Pensions is doing so at the moment. The research work which is under threat at IGER is relevant to your portfolio in terms of food, agriculture and the environment in general, as you have already mentioned, and I am glad that you have already taken steps to write to Lord Bach. Depending on his response, I would like you to treat this as an important matter, not only for the local economy in Ceredigion, but also for the whole of Wales, as this is one of our most important research institutions. It is important that you hold a meeting with the relevant DEFRA Minister to secure not only the aspects that are under threat in the short term, but also to ensure that DEFRA is aware of IGER's importance in the long term in terms of what we are trying to achieve in the Assembly for sustainable development in general.

Carwyn Jones: We wish to ensure that there is a great deal of research capacity in Wales. It is true to say that these are specialist jobs, in a sense, and that it will be very difficult, if not impossible, for the jobholders to find employment in the same line of work anywhere else in Wales. I will await Lord Bach's response, and, if needs must, I will meet with him to ensure that the points which I emphasised in the letter are re-emphasised.

Mick Bates: Diolch am eich ateb, Weinidog. Mae'n galonid ei bod yn ymddangos eich bod wedi ymrwymo i leihau'r effaith ar y staff a gwaith y sefydliad, fel y dywedasocho yn eich datganiad blaenorol. Fodd bynnag, mae gennyf bryderon penodol, ac mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r staff a fydd yn colli eu swyddi. A wnewch ymrwymo i siarad â'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am bensiynau, oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch yn dda, mae llawer iawn o'r staff yn pryderu ynghylch eu hawliau o ran eu pensiwn pan fyddant yn colli eu swyddi? Gobeithiaf y gwnewch gadarnhau, drwy sianelau a thrwy fod yn gyfyngwr, y bydd y gweithwyr a fydd yn colli eu swyddi yn derbyn eu hawliau pensiwn llawn.

Mae fy mhryder arall yn ymwneud â materion strategol. Mae eraill wedi mynegi

Government's duty under clause 121 of the Government of Wales Act 1998 to sustainable development. That means that there needs to be an integrated approach from the Government, and sustainable development is, of course, part of your portfolio. Can you give more details about the reasons given by DEFRA as to why a centre responsible for integrated research into grassland management, livestock production and climate change is suffering such a cut? I have not heard a good reason why an international institute for research is losing part of its integrated research work under DEFRA cuts.

How will the rest of the stakeholders in Wales be consulted in respect of the future development of IGER? I understand that it is a commercial operation and that the funding comes directly from DEFRA, but there seems to be a need to bring some security to what is now a situation of anxiety. Elin Jones, the local Member, has outlined the impact on the local economy, but there also needs to be some statement that the work of IGER will be maintained and retained with possible support from this Government. Can you also give an assurance that you will keep us informed of what takes place in your discussions with DEFRA and of the details that emerge in the days to come?

Carwyn Jones: The answer is 'yes' to your final question, as I mentioned in my reply to Nick Bourne. We do not have the full details, yet, beyond the announcement that was made by Professor Chris Pollock. I hope to have the full details in response to my letter, and we will continue to pursue with DEFRA the importance of IGER, both as a research institute and an employer in north Ceredigion, in particular, and emphasising the fact that these are highly specialised jobs that are not easily transferable, as I mentioned earlier, in Wales. Pension rights and the assistance that might be offered will need to be considered but, for the moment, we are concentrating on trying to see whether the supposed funding shortfall can be addressed and the staff positions saved.

Kirsty Williams: The immediate threat to

pryder ynghylch dyletswydd eich Llywodraeth dan gymal 121 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998 o ran datblygu cynaliadwy. Mae hynny'n golygu bod angen dull integredig o weithredu gan y Llywodraeth, ac mae datblygu cynaliadwy, wrth gwrs, yn rhan o'ch portffolio. A allwch roi rhagor o fanylion ynghylch y rhesymau a roddwyd gan DEFRA ynghylch pam mae canolfan sy'n gyfrifol am ymchwil integredig i reoli tir glas, cynhyrchu da byw a'r newid yn yr hinsawdd yn dioddef toriad o'r fath? Nid wyf wedi clywed rheswm da pam mae sefydliad ymchwil rhyngwladol yn colli rhan o'i waith ymchwil integredig dan doriadau DEFRA.

Sut yr ymgynghorir â gweddill y rhanddeiliaid yng Nghymru ynghylch datblygu IGER yn y dyfodol? Yr wyf yn deall mai menter fasnachol ydyw ac y daw'r cyllid yn uniongyrchol oddi wrth DEFRA, ond ymddengys fod angen dod â rhywfaint o sicrwydd i'r hyn sy'n sefyllfa o bryder bellach. Mae Elin Jones, yr Aelod lleol, wedi amlinellu'r effaith ar yr economi leol, ond hefyd mae angen rhyw fath o ddatganiad y caiff gwaith IGER ei gynnal a'i gadw gyda chymorth posibl gan y Llywodraeth hon. A allwch hefyd sicrhau y byddwch yn rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni ynghylch yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn eich trafodaethau gyda DEFRA a'r manylion a geir dros y dyddiau nesaf?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ateb i'ch cwestiwn olaf yw 'gallaf', fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Nick Bourne. Nid yw'r manylion llawn gennym eto, dim ond y cyhoeddiad a wnaed gan yr Athro Chris Pollock. Gobeithio y caf y manylion llawn yn yr ateb i'm llythyr, a byddwn yn parhau i drafod pwysigrwydd IGER gyda DEFRA, fel sefydliad ymchwil a chyflogwr yng ngogledd Ceredigion, yn enwedig, ac yn pwysleisio'r ffaith bod y rhain yn swyddi arbenigol dros ben nad yw'n hawdd eu trosglwyddo yng Nghymru, fel y dywedais yn gynharach. Bydd angen ystyried hawliau pensiwn a'r cymorth y gellid ei gynnig ond, ar hyn o bryd, yr ydym yn canolbwyntio ar geisio gweld a ellir rhoi sylw i'r diffyg tybiedig mewn cyllid ac a ellir arbed swyddi'r staff.

Kirsty Williams: Yn ardal gogledd

jobs is in the north Ceredigion area, but you will be aware that IGER has a field station in the constituency of Brecon and Radnorshire, at Mynydd Mawr, just outside Trecastle. Will you commit to ensure that, when you are discussing the immediate situation with regards to the jobs at Aberystwyth, you will also keep in mind the need to continue the research and employment at Mynydd Mawr, in my constituency? It would be a severe blow if that were also lost.

Carwyn Jones: I will emphasise the importance of all the jobs at IGER and we will be approaching our discussions with DEFRA on that basis.

Ceredigion y mae'r bygythiad uniongyrchol i swyddi, ond gwyddoch fod gan IGER orsaf maes yn etholaeth Brycheiniog a Sir Faesyfed ym Mynydd Mawr, ar gyrion Trecastell. A wnewch ymrwymo i sicrhau, pan fyddwch yn trafod y sefyllfa gyfredol ynghylch y swyddi yn Aberystwyth, y byddwch hefyd yn ystyried yr angen i barhau â'r ymchwil a'r gwaith ym Mynydd Mawr, yn fy etholaeth i? Byddai colli'r orsaf honno hefyd yn ergyd drom.

Carwyn Jones: Pwysleisiaf bwysigrwydd yr holl swyddi yn IGER a byddwn yn cynnal ein trafodaethau gyda DEFRA ar sail hynny.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have one change to report to this week's business. The statement on the new Assembly building has been deferred until next Tuesday. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. There will be three motions relating to the local government finance reports relating to the police settlement on Wednesday, 8 February.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf un newid i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Gohiriwyd y datganiad am adeilad newydd y Cynulliad tan ddydd Mawrth nesaf. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad drafft, a welir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol. Bydd tri chynnig sy'n ymwneud ag adroddiadau cyllid llywodraeth leol sy'n ymwneud â setliad yr heddlu ddydd Mercher, 8 Chwefror.

Following this morning's Business Committee meeting, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration. They are: the Health and Social Care (Community Health and Standards) Act 2003 Commencement (Wales) (No. 4) Order 2006, the General Dental Services and Personal Dental Services Transitional Provisions (Wales) Order 2006, the Functions of Local Health Boards (Dental Public Health) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Local Government (Improvement Plans) (Wales) Order 2006, the Contaminants in Food (Wales) Regulations 2006 and the Transition from Primary to Secondary School (Wales) Regulations 2006.

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach, sef: Gorchymyn Cychwyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Iechyd Cymunedol a Safonau) 2003 (Rhif 4) (Cymru) 2006, Gorchymyn Darpariaethau Trosiannol Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Cyffredinol a Gwasanaethau Deintyddol Personol (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Swyddogaethau Byrddau Iechyd Lleol (Iechyd Deintyddol y Cyhoedd) (Cymru) 2006, Gorchymyn Llywodraeth Leol (Cynlluniau Gwella) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Halogion mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2006 a Rheoliadau Trosglwyddo o'r Ysgol Gynradd i'r Ysgol Uwchradd (Cymru) 2006.

Y Llywydd: A oes 10 gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes draft? Mae'n ymddangos bod. Felly, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4,

The Presiding Officer: Are there 10 objections to the draft business statement? It seems that there are. Therefore, under

galwaf ar y Trefnydd i gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly adopts the business statement.

Helen Mary Jones: We are grateful that you have conceded that there needs to be a discussion on NHS trust finances and deficits, but we do not believe that you have responded to the matter with sufficient urgency. We are concerned, as a group, about the impact that the trust deficits may be having on services now and ask you to reconsider having a proper debate on this at the earliest possible opportunity.

I also refer to some requests that we made to you last week, one of which was for a statement in response to the Welsh Language Board's comments and the other of which was for a statement on the progress of free homecare for the disabled. The term that you used then was 'in due course' and you will forgive me if I do not find that reassuring. I hope that you can come back with a fresh business statement that has a more definite timescale for those items but, particularly, for a full debate, as a matter of urgency, on the current state of trust finances.

Lisa Francis: We cannot support the statement today for the same reasons. To say that the Minister for Health and Social Services will come before the Assembly when the outturn figures are known is not what was requested and, in mid and west Wales alone, Powys, Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS trusts are identifying deficits of £13.5 million, which has serious implications for NHS services in that area. It is affecting the provision of services now. People want answers. The issues will not go away and it is important that you come back and give us a debate on this in Government time.

Peter Black: Like the previous two

Standing Order No. 5.4, I call on the Business Minister to formally propose the business statement.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigaf fod

y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar eich bod wedi cydsynio bod angen trafodaeth ynghylch cyllid a diffygion ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG, ond nid ydym o'r farn eich bod wedi ymateb i'r mater yn ddigon diymdroi. Fel grŵp yr ydym yn pryderu am yr effaith y mae diffygion yr ymddiriedolaethau'n ei chael o bosibl ar wasanaethau yn awr a gofynnwn ichi ailystyried cynnal dadl iawn ynghylch hyn pan geir y cyfle cyntaf i wneud hynny.

Cyfeiriaf hefyd at rai ceisiadau a gawsoch gennym yr wythnos diwethaf, un ohonynt yn gofyn am ddatganiad i ymateb i sylwadau Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a'r llall yn gofyn am ddatganiad am y cynnydd o ran gofal cartref rhad ac am ddim i bobl anabl. Y term a ddefnyddiasoch bryd hynny oedd 'maes o law' a maddeuwch imi os nad yw hynny'n tawelu fy meddwl. Gobeithiaf y gallwch ddod yn ôl gyda datganiad busnes o'r newydd sydd ag amserlen fwy penodol ar gyfer yr eitemau hynny ond, yn benodol, ar gyfer dadl lawn, fel mater o frys, ynghylch gyflwr cyfredol cyllid ymddiriedolaethau.

Lisa Francis: Ni allwn gefnogi'r datganiad heddiw am yr un rhesymau. Nid yw dweud y daw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol gerbron y Cynulliad pan fydd y ffigurau alldro yn hysbys yn ateb y cais a gyflwynwyd ac, yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru yn unig, mae ymddiriedolaethau GIG Powys, Ceredigion a Sir Benfro a Derwen yn dweud bod ganddynt ddiffygion o £13.5 miliwn, sydd â goblygiadau difrifol i wasanaethau'r GIG yn yr ardal honno. Mae'n effeithio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau yn awr. Mae ar bobl eisiau atebion. Ni fydd y problemau'n diflannu ac mae'n bwysig ichi ddod yn ôl a rhoi dadl inni am hyn yn ystod amser y Llywodraeth.

Peter Black: Yn yr un modd â'r ddau Aelod

Members, we consider the issue of trust deficits to be urgent and that it cannot be deferred until the financial outturn figures are available. The Swansea NHS Trust faces a £3 million deficit and cuts are already being made to patient services as a result. We believe that this needs to be debated as a matter of urgency. Therefore, we will not be supporting the business statement today and we would like to see that debate tabled as soon as possible.

3.00 p.m.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I am surprised. You obviously decided this morning that you were going to oppose the business statement, come what may. On every occasion, I have tried to meet your requests. None of you mentioned the fact that you asked for a statement on the business incentive grant. The Finance Minister will present a statement on the interim distribution scheme next week.

Helen Mary, I can inform you, and you will be pleased to hear, that the Minister for Health and Social Services will be making a statement in Plenary on Wednesday 15 February on free home care for disabled people. I can also tell you that the Minister will also be coming back to the Assembly and will offer a debate on NHS finances, once the financial outturn figures are published at the end of this year. Therefore, will you change your minds, because I am testing you on this? I have delivered what you wanted. Will you now withdraw your objections and support the business statement?

blaenorol, yr ydym yn barnu bod brys ynghlwm wrth broblem diffygion ymddiriedolaethau ac na ellir gohirio'r mater nes y bydd y ffigurau alldro ariannol ar gael. Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Abertawe yn wynebu diffyg o £3 miliwn ac mae toriadau eisoes yn cael eu gwneud i wasanaethau cleifion o ganlyniad i hynny. Credwn fod angen cynnal dadl ar hyn ar frys. Felly, ni fyddwn yn cefnogi'r datganiad busnes heddiw a hoffem weld y ddadl honno'n cael ei chyflwyno cyn gynted ag sy'n bosibl.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn synnu. Mae'n amlwg eich bod wedi penderfynu y bore yma eich bod am wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes, doed a ddêl. Ar bob achlysur, yr wyf wedi ceisio bodloni eich gofynion. Ni soniodd yr un ohonoch eich bod wedi gofyn am ddatganiad am y grant cymell busnesau. Bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn cyflwyno datganiad am y cynllun dosbarthu interim yr wythnos nesaf.

Helen Mary, gallaf eich hysbysu, a byddwch yn falch o glywed, y bydd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn gwneud datganiad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 15 Chwefror am ofal cartref am ddim i bobl anabl. Gallaf hefyd ddweud wrthyhych y bydd y Gweinidog hefyd yn dod yn ôl at y Cynulliad ac yn cynnig dadl ynghylch cyllid y GIG, wedi i'r ffigurau alldro ariannol gael eu cyhoeddi ar ddiwedd y flwyddyn hon. O'r herwydd, a wnewch newid eich meddwl, oherwydd yr wyf yn eich rhoi ar brawf ynghylch hyn? Yr wyf wedi gwneud yr hyn yr oedd arnoch ei eisiau. A wnewch dynnu eich gwrthwynebiadau yn ôl yn awr a chefnogi'r datganiad busnes?

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn

Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Law, Peter
 Lloyd, David
 Marek, John
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
 Motion defeated.*

**Cymeradwyo o dan Reolau Sefydlog Rhifau 25.2 a 24.25
 Approval under Standing Orders Nos. 25.2 and 24.25**

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl am y cynnig hwn.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 on the draft Plant Health (Import Inspection Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Iechyd Planhigion (Ffioedd Arolygu Mewnforio) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. approves that the Plant Health (Import Inspection Fees) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Iechyd Planhigion (Ffioedd Arolygu Mewnforio) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 17 January 2006; and

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Ionawr 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 January 2006. (NDM2788)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2788)

*Cynnig (NDM2788): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion (NDM2788): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Ysgolion Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006, a Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006
Approval of the Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the New School (Admission) (Wales) Regulations 2006, the Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, and the Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y pedair eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next four items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2789)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2789)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006. (NDM2790)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2790)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the New School

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Ysgolion

(Admission) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2791)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft New School (Admission) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft New School (Admission) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006. (NDM2792)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2793)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2791)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Ysgolion Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Ysgolion Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2792)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2793)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006.*(NDM2794)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2795)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006. (NDM2796)

I will be covering items 5 to 8 on this afternoon's agenda as they are interrelated. In accordance with the usual procedure, separate votes will be taken at the end. I am grateful to the Presiding Officer for his support on this. I will then be covering items 9 and 10, on which there will be separate votes.

I propose that the Assembly approves the above listed draft regulations, associated explanatory memoranda and regulatory appraisals. This suite of regulations applies to the admission authorities for all maintained schools in Wales. The admission authority of a community or voluntary controlled school is the local education authority. In the case of

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2794)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2795)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2796)

Byddaf yn rhoi sylw i eitemau 5 i 8 ar yr agenda y prynhawn yma oherwydd bod cysylltiad rhyngddynt. Yn unol â'r weithdrefn arferol, cymerir pleidleisiau ar wahân ar y diwedd. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywydd am ei gefnogaeth ynghylch hyn. Yna rhoddaf sylw i eitemau 9 a 10, a chynhelir pleidleisiau ar wahân ynghylch y rhain.

Cynigiaf fod y Cynulliad yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft a restrir uchod, y memoranda esboniadol cysylltiedig a'r arfarniadau rheoliadol. Mae'r gyfres o reoliadau yn berthnasol i awdurdodau derbyn pob ysgol a gynhelir yng Nghymru. Yr awdurdod addysg lleol yw'r awdurdod derbyn ar gyfer ysgol gymunedol neu ysgol

a foundation or voluntary aided school, the admission authority is the school's governing body.

The Education (Determination of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 set out the procedures that admission authorities should follow when determining their admission arrangements, including the requirements for consultation and notification. The new regulations largely re-enact the existing 1999 regulations, but they have been revised to reflect amendments made by the Education Act 2002. The first key change is the clarification that consultation on admission arrangements should not take place before 1 September in the relevant year. Since consultation must be completed by 1 March of the following year, that allows a full five months for the consultation process. There is a new duty when setting the admission number of a school to have regard to the capacity of the school, as measured by the assessment method set out in the new Assembly guidance, 'Measuring the capacity of schools in Wales'. In future, when an admission authority determines an admission number that is lower than the number indicated by the capacity assessment, this must be published in a local newspaper. The notice must explain that parents may object to this lower admission number.

Further key changes include the clarification that the governing body's duty is to consult those LEAs whose areas fall within or adjoin the school's relevant area, and the fact that schools which set their own admission arrangements will be able to suspend annual consultation for up to three years provided the arrangements remain unchanged.

The Education (Objections to Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 prescribe the conditions under which objections to admission arrangements may be referred to the Assembly for determination, and they make provision for the implementation of any decisions. These regulations again replace the existing 1999 regulations, with changes to reflect amendments made by the Education Act

wirfoddol a reolir. Yn achos ysgol wirfoddol a gynorthwyr neu ysgol sefydledig, corff llywodraethu'r ysgol yw'r awdurdod derbyn.

Mae Rheoliadau Addysg (Penderfynu Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn esbonio'r gweithdrefnau y dylai awdurdodau derbyn eu dilyn wrth bennu eu trefniadau derbyn, gan gynnwys y gofynion ar gyfer ymgynghori a hysbysu. Ailddeddfu rheoliadau presennol 1999 a wna'r rheoliadau newydd i raddau helaeth, ond cawsant eu hadolygu i adlewyrchu diwygiadau a wnaed yn sgîl Deddf Addysg 2002. Y newid allweddol cyntaf yw'r eglurhad na ddylai ymgynghoriadau ar drefniadau derbyn gael eu cynnal cyn 1 Medi yn y flwyddyn berthnasol. Gan fod rhaid cwblhau'r ymgynghoriad erbyn 1 Mawrth y flwyddyn ddilynol, mae hyn yn caniatáu pum mis llawn ar gyfer y broses ymgynghori. Ceir dyletswydd newydd wrth bennu'r nifer a dderbynnir i ysgol i roi ystyriaeth i gapasiti'r ysgol, sy'n cael ei fesur gan y dull asesu a nodir yng nghanllawiau newydd y Cynulliad, 'Measuring the capacity of schools in Wales'. I'r dyfodol, pan fydd awdurdod derbyn yn pennu nifer derbyn sy'n is na'r nifer a ddynodir gan yr asesiad capasiti, rhaid cyhoeddi hyn mewn papur newydd lleol. Rhaid i'r hysbysiad esbonio bod gan rieni hawl i wrthwynebu'r nifer derbyn is hwn.

Ymysg newidiadau allweddol eraill y mae'r eglurhad mai dyletswydd y corff llywodraethu yw ymgynghori â'r AALlau hynny y mae eu hardaloedd o fewn ardal berthnasol yr ysgol neu y mae eu hardaloedd yn gyffiniol â'r ardal honno, a'r ffaith y bydd ysgolion sy'n pennu eu trefniadau derbyn eu hunain yn gallu gohirio'r ymgynghoriad blynyddol am hyd at dair blynedd cyn belled â bod y trefniadau yn aros yn ddigyfnewid.

Mae'r Rheoliadau Addysg (Gwrthwynebiadau i Drefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn nodi dan ba amodau y gellir cyfeirio gwrthwynebiadau i drefniadau derbyn at y Cynulliad iddo benderfynu yn eu cylch, a gwnânt ddarpariaeth ar gyfer gweithredu unrhyw benderfyniadau. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn unwaith eto yn disodli rheoliadau presennol 1999, gyda newidiadau i adlewyrchu'r diwygiadau a wnaed yn sgîl

2002. The first key change is that the 2002 Act extends the right to be consulted to community and voluntary controlled schools within a relevant area. Their right to object is limited by these regulations to the admission number for their own school or to the admission arrangements of a voluntary aided or foundation school. The regulations give five or more parents the right to object to an admission number that has been set lower than the number indicated by the capacity of the school. They also give five or more parents the right to object to pre-existing selective admission arrangements. This halves the current arrangements whereby at least 10 parents must register an objection before the matter can be referred to the Assembly for determination.

The New School (Admissions) (Wales) Regulations 2006 set out the procedures for consulting on and determining the admission arrangements for new schools. They largely re-enact the procedures that were previously in place to ensure that new schools can have admission arrangements in place from the time they open. Changes from the existing regulations reflect amendments made to the School Standards and Framework Act 1998 by the Education Act 2002, and the regulations also make small adjustments to bring the requirements for new schools into line with those for existing schools.

The Education (Variation of Admission Arrangements) (Wales) Regulations 2006 provide that an admission authority may vary an admission number, which has already been determined, in circumstances where a variation is necessary as a result of a school reorganisation proposal that has been published under Section 28 of the School Standards and Framework Act 1998. The regulations ensure that there is no separate need to refer the matter to the National Assembly for determination or to notify those who were consulted during the determination of admission arrangements. The normal arrangements for consultation, publication, objections and Assembly determination—

Deddf Addysg 2002. Y newid allweddol cyntaf yw bod Deddf 2002 yn ymestyn yr hawl i gael eu cynnwys mewn ymgynghoriad i ysgolion cymunedol a rhai gwirfoddol a reolir o fewn ardal berthnasol. Cyfyngir ar eu hawl i wrthwynebu gan y rheoliadau hyn i'r nifer derbyn ar gyfer eu hysgol eu hunain neu i drefniadau derbyn ysgol wirfoddol a gynorthwyir neu ysgol sefydledig. Rhydd y rheoliadau hawl i bump neu ragor o rieni wrthwynebu os bydd nifer y derbyniadau a bennwyd yn is na'r nifer a ddynodwyd wrth fesur capasiti'r ysgol. Rhoddant hefyd yr hawl i bump neu ragor o rieni wrthwynebu trefniadau derbyn dethol sy'n bod eisoes. Mae hyn yn haneru'r trefniadau cyfredol sy'n pennu bod yn rhaid i o leiaf 10 o rieni gofrestru gwrthwynebiad cyn y gellir cyfeirio'r mater at y Cynulliad iddo benderfynu yn ei gylch.

Mae'r Rheoliadau Ysgolion Newydd (Derbyniadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn esbonio'r gweithdrefnau ar gyfer ymgynghori ynghylch trefniadau derbyn ar gyfer ysgolion newydd a phenderfynu arnynt. Ailddeddfu'r gweithdrefnau a oedd ar waith o'r blaen y maent i raddau helaeth i sicrhau bod ysgolion newydd yn gallu sefydlu trefniadau derbyn o'r adeg y maent yn agor. Mae'r newidiadau o'r rheoliadau presennol yn adlewyrchu diwygiadau a wnaed i Ddeddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998 yn sgîl Deddf Addysg 2002, ac mae'r rheoliadau hefyd yn gwneud mân addasiadau i sicrhau bod y gofynion ar gyfer ysgolion newydd yn cydfynd â'r rhai ar gyfer ysgolion sy'n bodoli eisoes.

Mae Rheoliadau Addysg (Amrywio Trefniadau Derbyn) (Cymru) 2006 yn ei gwneud yn bosibl i awdurdod derbyn amrywio nifer y derbyniadau, nifer sydd eisoes wedi cael ei bennu, mewn amgylchiadau lle y bo amrywio'n angenrheidiol o ganlyniad i gynnig i ad-drefnu ysgol a gyhoeddwyd dan Adran 28 Deddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998. Mae'r rheoliadau'n sicrhau nad oes dim angen ar wahân i gyfeirio'r mater at y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i benderfynu yn ei gylch na hysbysu'r rhai yr ymgynghorwyd â hwy wrth bennu'r trefniadau derbyn. Byddai trefniadau arferol Adran 28 ar gyfer ymgynghori, cyhoeddi, gwrthwynebiadau a

where there are objections—of Section 28 statutory proposals would apply.

Consultation on proposals for the changes to the schools admissions framework, which led to these regulations, initially took place in July 2003, with further, more detailed consultation in July 2005. This included the draft regulations and the new capacity assessment formula, which is not of itself part of this legislative package. The regulations being debated today reflect the comments received from both consultations. I invite Members to approve the regulations.

Janet Ryder: Plaid Cymru supports these regulations. One of the interesting points is that they place a new duty on admission authorities to have regard for the Assembly's guidance, as set out in 'Measuring the capacity of schools in Wales', which is a new measure of capacity. Admission authorities must take account of that when setting their admission numbers. This recalculation of how school places are measured is likely to have the biggest impact on school numbers throughout Wales. Teachers and headteachers have been waiting a long time for this, as they are tired of having areas that they would class as broom cupboards being classed as teaching areas. So, it is the measuring and calculation of school capacity that will have the biggest impact. I understand that Cardiff County Council anticipates that the number of its empty school places could be cut by 1,500 when this new measure comes in. It will be interesting to see the impact of the new measure across Wales.

During the consultation on these regulations and during the debate in committee, a question was raised as to who would monitor and audit the process of suspending annual consultation under certain circumstances. The Minister has referred to the ability of parents to object, but we are still waiting for guidance on who will monitor schools or areas that choose to suspend that annual consultation. The papers laid before us today state that further guidance on monitoring the suspension of consultation will be included in a revised code of practice, which is due in

phenderfyniad gan y Cynulliad—os oes gwrthwynebiadau—yn weithredol.

Cynhaliwyd yr ymgynghoriad ynghylch y cynigion i newid fframwaith derbyn ysgolion, sef y cynigion a arweiniodd at y rheoliadau hyn, i ddechrau yng Ngorffennaf 2003, gydag ymgynghoriad pellach, manylach yng Ngorffennaf 2005. Yr oedd hyn yn cynnwys y rheoliadau drafft a'r fformiwla newydd i asesu capasiti, fformiwla nad yw ynddi'i hun yn rhan o'r pecyn deddfwriaethol hwn. Mae'r rheoliadau y cynhelir dadl arnynt heddiw yn adlewyrchu'r sylwadau a gafwyd oddi wrth y ddau ymgynghoriad. Gwahoddaf yr Aelodau i gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau.

Janet Ryder: Mae Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Un o'r pwyntiau diddorol yw eu bod yn rhoi dyletswydd newydd ar awdurdodau derbyn i roi ystyriaeth i ganllawiau'r Cynulliad, fel y'u gwelir yn 'Measuring the capacity of schools in Wales', sy'n ffordd newydd o fesur capasiti. Rhaid i awdurdodau derbyn roi ystyriaeth i hyn wrth bennu'r nifer a dderbynnir. Y dull hwn o ailgyfrifo sut y mesurir lleoedd ysgolion sy'n debygol o gael yr effaith fwyaf ar niferoedd mewn ysgolion ledled Cymru. Bu athrawon a phenaethiaid yn disgwyl yn hir am hyn, oherwydd eu bod wedi blino ar y sefyllfa lle y mae manau y byddent yn eu hystyried yn gypyrddau dan grisiau yn cael eu galw'n fannau dysgu. O'r herwydd, y modd y mesurir ac y cyfrifir capasiti ysgol a fydd yn cael yr effaith fwyaf. Deallaf fod Cyngor Sir Caerdydd yn rhagweld y gallai nifer y lleoedd gwag sydd ganddo mewn ysgolion ostwng 1,500 pan gyflwynir y mesur newydd hwn. Bydd yn ddiddorol gweld effaith y mesur newydd ar draws Cymru.

Yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad ynghylch y rheoliadau hyn ac yn ystod y ddadl yn y pwyllgor, codwyd cwestiwn ynghylch pwy a fyddai'n monitro ac yn archwilio'r broses o ohirio'r ymgynghoriad blynyddol dan rai amgylchiadau. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi cyfeirio at allu'r rhieni i wrthwynebu, ond yr ydym yn dal i aros am ganllawiau ynghylch pwy a fydd yn monitro ysgolion neu ardaloedd sy'n dewis gohirio'r ymgynghoriad blynyddol hwnnw. Mae'r papurau sydd ger ein bron heddiw yn nodi y bydd canllawiau pellach ar fonitro'r broses o ohirio

2006. Can the Minister tell us when that code of practice is due to be issued?

ymgyngoriadau yn cael eu cynnwys mewn cod ymarfer diwygiedig sydd i fod i gael ei gyhoeddi yn 2006. A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa bryd y bwriedir cyflwyno'r cod ymarfer hwnnw?

3.10 p.m.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservatives offer qualified support for these regulations. They outline a number of significant changes to the regulations that govern schools admission policy. We welcome the easing of the administrative burden on schools, particularly voluntary aided and foundation schools, the redefining of relevant admission areas to more accurately reflect travel to school areas, and the framework by which parents may register objections regarding inappropriate admission numbers.

William Graham: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn gydag ambell eithriad. Amlinellant nifer o newidiadau pwysig i'r rheoliadau sy'n rheoli polisïau derbyn ysgolion. Croesawn ysgafnhau'r baich gweinyddol ar ysgolion, yn enwedig ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynorthwyr ac ysgolion sefydledig, ailddiffinio ardaloedd derbyn perthnasol i adlewyrchu'n gywirach yr ardaloedd teithio i'r ysgol, a'r fframwaith y gall rhieni ei ddefnyddio i gofrestru gwrthwynebiadau i nifer derbyn amhriodol.

We have a number of concerns, and we ask the Minister to clarify or amend the guidelines to be issued to ensure the uniform application of these regulations throughout Wales. Will the Minister confirm that the current appeal procedures will continue to apply for parents whose children are not allowed admission to the school of their choice? If appeals are allowed, the capacity of the school increases and they are resourced accordingly, will that number remain the designated number? Who will monitor the implementation of these arrangements and how will they report on discrepancies within these regulations, particularly with regard to proposals to enlarge a school or change the age range of pupils? Does the setting of admission numbers so far in advance restrict the flexibility of these regulations? There are no financial costs associated with implementing these regulations. However, the need to consult and publish proposals in local newspapers may require significant expenditure for some LEAs. Has the Minister secured additional funding to cover these costs?

Mae gennym nifer o bryderon, a gofynnwn i'r Gweinidog egluro neu ddiwygio'r canllawiau sydd i'w cyhoeddi er mwyn sicrhau bod y rheoliadau hyn yn cael eu gweithredu'n unffurf ledled Cymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau y bydd y gweithdrefnau apelio cyfredol yn dal i fod mewn grym ar gyfer rhieni na dderbynnir eu plant i'w dewis ysgol? Os caniateir apelïadau, os cynyddir capasiti'r ysgol a hithau'n cael adnoddau ar gyfer hynny, ai'r nifer hwn a fydd y nifer dynodedig o hyd? Pwy a fydd yn monitro'r modd y gweithredir y trefniadau hyn a sut y byddant yn adrodd am anghysonderau o fewn y rheoliadau hyn, yn enwedig o safbwynt cynigion i ehangu ysgol neu newid ystod oedran y disgyblion? A yw pennu nifer y derbyniadau gymaint ymlaen llaw yn cyfyngu ar hyblygrwydd y rheoliadau hyn? Nid oes dim costau ariannol ynghlwm wrth weithredu'r rheoliadau hyn. Serch hynny, mae'n bosibl y bydd y ffaith bod rhaid ymgynghori a chyhoeddi cynigion mewn papurau newydd lleol yn golygu gwariant sylweddol i rai AALLau. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi sicrhau cyllid ychwanegol i dalu'r costau hyn?

Peter Black: The Welsh Liberal Democrats also support these regulations. The issue raised by Janet Ryder about the measurement of capacity is important. The Minister has reported to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee regarding the number of

Peter Black: Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru hefyd yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn. Mae'r mater a gododd Janet Ryder ynghylch mesur capasiti'n bwysig. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi adrodd wrth y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ynghylch nifer y lleoedd

surplus places and the number of projected surplus places across Wales. Cardiff County Council has already anticipated that its calculation will change as a result of this new measurement of capacity. As this new measure is rolled out across Wales, we are concerned about the impact on the current and future school reorganisation plans of the other 21 local education authorities in Wales. We have already had some discussion in the Chamber about the possibility of schools being closed, and all local education authorities have to come to terms with the number of surplus places and the cost of maintaining those surplus places, which they face as part of their budget discussions. Therefore, it is important that the Minister comes back to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in the near future with some revised figures on surplus places and on how this will impact upon that, so that we can assess the impact of these changes on those school reorganisation plans and on the education system in Wales as a whole. It would help everyone, not just the education authorities, but parents, teachers, headteachers, governors and so on, if they were to have an early indication regarding how these changes will impact on the future of their schools.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): Before we can issue guidance, we have to agree the regulations; that is the normal process of business. We will look at the issue of guidance once the regulations have been agreed, and guidance on the new capacity assessment methodology will be issued when the regulations come into effect.

You raised an important point, Peter, regarding the cost of monitoring surplus places in authorities. Our officials have been in close dialogue with Cardiff over the misapplication of some elements of the formula. From discussions with all local authorities in Wales, it has become clear that the new formula, which will lead to consistency across Wales, is unlikely to lead to dramatic changes to the existing arrangements. I am happy to bring forward the officials' advice when that guidance has been completed. As I said, these regulations

gwag ar draws Cymru. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd eisoes wedi rhagweld y bydd ei gyfrifiad yn newid yn sgîl y dull newydd hwn o fesur capasiti. Wrth i'r mesurydd newydd hwn gael ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru, yr ydym yn bryderus ynghylch yr effaith ar y cynlluniau cyfredol a rhai'r dyfodol o ran ad-drefnu ysgolion yr 21 awdurdod addysg lleol arall yng Nghymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi cael peth trafodaeth yn y Siambr am y posibilrwydd y bydd ysgolion yn cael eu cau, a rhaid i'r holl awdurdodau addysg lleol ddygymod â nifer y lleoedd gwag a chost cynnal y lleoedd gwag hynny, rhywbeth a wynebant fel rhan o'u trafodaethau cyllidebol. O'r herwydd, mae'n bwysig bod y Gweinidog yn dod yn ôl at y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn y dyfodol agos gyda rhai ffigurau diwygiedig ynghylch lleoedd gwag ac ynghylch sut y bydd hyn yn effeithio ar hynny, fel y gallwn asesu effaith y newidiadau hyn ar gynlluniau ad-drefnu'r ysgolion hynny ac ar y system addysg yng Nghymru drwyddi draw. Byddai o gymorth i bawb, nid i'r awdurdodau addysg yn unig, ond i rieni, athrawon, penaethiaid, llywodraethwyr ac yn y blaen, pe byddent yn cael rhyw syniad mewn da bryd ynghylch sut y bydd y newidiadau hyn yn effeithio ar ddyfodol eu hysgolion.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cyn y gallwn gyflwyno canllawiau, rhaid inni gytuno ar y rheoliadau; dyna yw'r broses arferol. Edrychwn ar gwesitwn y canllawiau wedi inni gytuno ar y rheoliadau, a chyhoeddir y canllawiau ar y fethodoleg newydd i asesu capasiti pan ddaw'r rheoliadau i rym.

Codasoch bwynt pwysig, Peter, ynghylch cost monitro lleoedd gwag mewn awdurdodau. Bu ein swyddogion yn trafod yn ddyfal gyda Chaerdydd ynghylch camddefnyddio rhai elfennau o'r fformiwla. Yn ôl y trafodaethau a gafwyd gyda'r holl awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, daeth yn amlwg bod y fformiwla newydd, a fydd yn arwain at gysondeb ar draws Cymru, yn annhebygol o arwain at newidiadau dramatig yn y trefniadau presennol. Yr wyf yn fodlon cyflwyno cyngor y swyddogion pan gwblheir y canllawiau hyn. Fel y dywedais, nid yw'r

do not in themselves put in place a new method for measuring the capacity of schools. The need to have a proper assessment that operated throughout Wales in exactly the same way came out of a committee chaired by Cynog Dafis in the first Assembly. That is why the local authorities have supported that agenda.

In respect of the second point in terms of monitoring, because the guidance will come forward afterwards, we can make sure that all members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee are given copies when it is issued.

In terms of issues around appeals procedures and designated numbers, William, I can tell you that where there is a change in age ranges it leads to statutory proposals in terms of school reorganisation. However, in terms of the capacity number being affected by appeals mechanisms and the legal outcome, therefore, I will write to you, if I may, and copy the letter to all members of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

rheoliadau hyn ynddynt eu hunain yn sefydlu dull newydd o fesur capasiti ysgolion. Yn sgîl pwyllgor a gadeiriwyd gan Cynog Dafis yn ystod y Cynulliad cyntaf y gwelwyd bod angen cael asesiad priodol sy'n cael ei roi ar waith yn gyson ledled Cymru. Dyna pahan y mae'r awdurdodau lleol wedi cefnogi'r agenda honno.

O ran yr ail bwynt yng nghyswllt monitro, gan y bydd y canllawiau yn cael eu cyflwyno wedyn, gallwn wneud yn siŵr y bydd holl aelodau'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn derbyn copïau pan gyhoeddir hwy.

O ran y materion yn ymwneud â gweithdrefnau apelio a niferoedd dynodedig, William, gallaf ddweud wrthy, pan fo newid o ran ystodau oedran, ei fod yn arwain at gynigion statudol o ran ad-drefnu ysgolion. Fodd bynnag, o ran bod mecanweithiau apelïadau a'r canlyniad cyfreithiol, o'r herwydd, yn effeithio ar y nifer o ran capasiti, ysgrifennaf atoch, os caf wneud hynny, a rhoi copi o'r llythyr i bob aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

*Cynnig (NDM2789): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2789): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred

Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2790): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2790): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun

Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2791): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2791): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2792): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2792): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2793): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2793): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2794): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2794): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2795): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2795): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William

Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2796): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2796): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann

Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

3.20 p.m.

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006,
 a Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpapiaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau
 Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006**
**Approval of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order
 2006, and the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential
 Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2006**

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2797)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2797)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft Education Act 2002 (Commencement No. 8) (Wales) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch drafft y Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. approves that the Education Act 2002 (Commencement No.8) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2798)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

considers the principle of the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2799)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft The Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the Education Act 2002 (Transitional Provisions and Consequential Amendments) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006.(NDM2800)

I will briefly introduce these measures. The main purpose of the commencement Order is to complete the package of changes that we have debated today. It commences provisions in the Education Act 2002 that implement the move to admission numbers in place of standard numbers, and makes some other, largely technical, changes to the admissions framework. The purpose of the transitional regulations is to ensure that all new provisions affecting the admissions framework, including those relating to

2. yn cymeradwyo bod drafft y Gorchymyn Deddf Addysg 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 8) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2798)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2799)

Cynigiaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch drafft y Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Deddf Addysg 2002 (Darpariaethau Trosiannol a Diwygiadau Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2800)

Cyflwynaf yn fyr y ddau fesur hyn. Prif bwrpas y Gorchymyn cychwyn yw cwblhau'r pecyn newidiadau yr ydym wedi cynnal dadl arnynt heddiw. Mae'n cychwyn darpariaethau yn Neddf Addysg 2002 sy'n gweithredu'r symudiad at niferoedd derbyn yn lle niferoedd safonol, ac yn gwneud newidiadau eraill, technegol yn bennaf, i'r fframwaith derbyn. Pwrpas y rheoliadau trosiannol yw sicrhau bod yr holl ddarpariaethau newydd sy'n effeithio ar y fframwaith derbyn, gan gynnwys rhai'n

admission numbers, will apply from the school year 2008-09.

The Order also commences section 175 of the 2002 Act, which introduces a statutory duty on local education authorities, governing bodies and further education institutions to exercise their functions with a view to safeguarding and promoting children's welfare. The commencement of section 175 fulfils the commitment that I gave to Members during the debate in Plenary on 23 November 2005, as part of Gwenda Thomas's debate under Standing Order No. 31, which received unanimous support from the Assembly. Guidance to support LEAs and governing bodies to meet their duties under section 175 will be the subject of consultation before being issued.

I invite Members to approve these regulations.

William Graham: In voting for these regulations, the Welsh Conservatives welcome the confirmation of support for parental choice for which school their child attends. This must be ensured within the regulations that we have just approved, detailing a framework within which parents may register objections against inappropriate admission numbers.

Will the Minister clarify why nursery provision must be excluded when calculating admission numbers for a school? The Minister will no doubt be aware that there has been significant nursery school development on the Ponthir Primary School site, together with the financial investment in buildings, and the attraction of nursery pupils. Nurseries on the sites of primary schools fulfil an obvious feeder route to these schools, and, as such, have a major significance for future admission numbers, particularly for those schools presently under threat of closure.

Will the Minister also provide assurance on the widest possible consultations on proposals for reorganisation, change of category, or any changes to sixth forms?

Gwenda Thomas: I am delighted, Minister, that you stuck to the commitment contained

ymwneud â niferoedd derbyn, yn dod i rym o'r flwyddyn ysgol 2008-09 ymlaen.

Mae'r Gorchymyn hefyd yn cychwyn adran 175 Deddf 2002, sy'n rhoi dyletswydd statudol ar awdurdodau addysg lleol, cyrff llywodraethu a sefydliadau addysg bellach i gyflawni eu swyddogaethau gyda golwg ar ddiogelu a hyrwyddo lles plant. Mae cychwyn adran 175 yn cyflawni'r ymrwymiad a roddais i'r Aelodau yn ystod y ddadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 23 Tachwedd 2005, fel rhan o ddadl Gwenda Thomas o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, a dderbyniodd gefnogaeth unfrydol gan y Cynulliad. Bydd canllawiau i helpu awdurdodau addysg lleol a chyrff llywodraethu i gyflawni eu dyletswyddau o dan adran 175 yn mynd drwy broses o ymgynghori cyn eu cyhoeddi.

Yr wyf yn gwahodd yr Aelodau i gymeradwyo'r rheoliadau hyn.

William Graham: Wrth bleidleisio dros y rheoliadau hyn, mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n croesawu cadarnhau'r gefnogaeth i adael i'r rhieni ddewis pa ysgol y mae eu plentyn yn ei mynychu. Rhaid sicrhau hyn o fewn y rheoliadau yr ydym newydd eu cymeradwyo, gan roi manylion fframwaith i alluogi rhieni i gofrestru unrhyw wrthwynebiad yn erbyn niferoedd derbyn amhriodol.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro pam mae'n rhaid eithrio darpariaeth feithrin wrth gyfrifo niferoedd derbyn ysgol? Diau y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod datblygiad meithrin sylweddol wedi bod ar safle Ysgol Gynradd Pont-hir, ynghyd â buddsoddi ariannol mewn adeiladau, a denu disgyblion meithrin. Mae meithrinfeydd ar safleoedd ysgolion cynradd yn cynnig llwybr bwydo amlwg i'r ysgolion hyn, ac, o'r herwydd, maent yn bwysig iawn o ran niferoedd derbyn yn y dyfodol, yn enwedig i ysgolion sydd ar hyn o bryd yn wynebu bygythiad y byddant yn cael eu cau.

A wnaiff y Gweinidog hefyd ein sicrhau y bydd ymgynghori mor eang â phosibl ar gynigion i ad-drefnu, newid categori, neu unrhyw newidiadau i'r chweched dosbarth?

Gwenda Thomas: Yr wyf yn falch iawn, Weinidog, eich bod wedi cadw at yr

in your response to my debate under Standing Order No. 31, by today introducing this commencement Order, which will enable section 175 of the Education Act 2002 to be in force by the beginning of the new school year in September.

As I have mentioned in the Assembly many times, the protection and the welfare of our children must be a priority for us all. There is no doubt that, by commencing section 175 of the Education Act 2002, the protection of our children will be significantly improved, as the First Minister mentioned earlier.

I note the assurance from you, Minister, that the second aspect of my proposal under Standing Order No. 31, concerning the designation of a governor with specific responsibility for child protection issues, and, I am sure, the development of a database of such governors in each of Wales's 22 local education authorities, will be included as part of the consultation on the guidance that will now take place.

Peter Black: I am grateful to Gwenda Thomas for giving us a timescale for the introduction of the regulations. We would like to see them introduced as quickly as possible for the protection of children. September this year would be an apposite deadline. I hope, therefore, that the Minister will be able to bring these regulations to the committee at the earliest possible moment, so that we are able to go through them and scrutinise them appropriately. I look forward to an assurance from the Minister that that will happen, as well as some idea of when she will be able to enable the committee to have a look at that, and to go out to consultation on them.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): First, I will deal with the issues that Gwenda and Peter raised. I am happy to give the same reassurance as I did back in November in terms of the designation of a governor with specific responsibility for child protection issues, and for local education authorities to maintain a database of such governors. That will be included in the consultation on the regulations. We will, obviously, bring those regulations to committee, but our

ymrwymiad a wnaed yn eich ymateb i'm dadl o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, drwy gyflwyno'r Gorchymyn cychwyn hwn heddiw, a fydd yn golygu y daw adran 175 Deddf Addysg 2002 i rym erbyn dechrau'r flwyddyn ysgol newydd ym mis Medi.

Fel yr wyf wedi sôn droeon yn y Cynulliad, rhaid i ddiogelwch a lles ein plant fod yn flaenoriaeth i bawb ohonom. Nid oes dim amheuaeth, drwy gychwyn adran 175 o Ddeddf Addysg 2002, na fydd diogelwch ein plant yn cael ei wella'n sylweddol, fel y soniodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach.

Nodaf y sicrwydd a roddwch, Weinidog, y bydd yr ail agwedd ar fy nghynnig o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 31, yng nghyswllt dynodi llywodraethwr i fod â chyfrifoldeb penodol dros faterion amddiffyn plant, ac, yr wyf yn siŵr, datblygu cronfa ddata o'r llywodraethwyr hyn ym mhob un o'r 22 awdurdod addysg lleol yng Nghymru, yn cael ei chynnwys fel rhan o'r ymgynghori ar y canllawiau a gynhelir yn awr.

Peter Black: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Gwenda Thomas am roi amserlen inni ar gyfer cyflwyno'r rheoliadau. Byddem yn hoffi eu gweld yn cael eu cyflwyno cyn gynted â phosibl er mwyn amddiffyn plant. Byddai mis Medi eleni yn derfyn amser priodol. Gobeithio, felly, y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu dod â'r rheoliadau hyn i'r pwyllgor cyn gynted ag y bo modd, fel y gallwn fynd drwyddynt a chraffu arnynt yn briodol. Edrychaf ymlaen at dderbyn sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog y bydd hynny'n digwydd, yn ogystal â chael rhywfaint o syniad ynghylch pryd y bydd yn gallu trefnu bod y pwyllgor yn cael golwg arnynt, ac y bydd yn ymgynghori arnynt.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Yn gyntaf oll, deliaf â'r materion a godwyd gan Gwenda a Peter. Yr wyf yn foldon rhoi'r un sicrwydd ag a roddais ym mis Tachwedd o ran dynodi llywodraethwr i fod yn gyfrifol yn benodol am faterion amddiffyn plant, a bod awdurdodau addysg lleol yn cadw cronfa ddata o lywodraethwyr o'r fath. Bydd hynny'n cael ei gynnwys yn yr ymgynghori ar y rheoliadau. Byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn dod â'r rheoliadau hynny i'r pwyllgor, ond nid yw

commitment to ensure that the duty is in place by September 2006 has not changed. We will, however, bring them to committee at the first available opportunity.

I am afraid that it is not appropriate for me to address any requests from Members about individual schools in the context of areas in which I must make statutory decisions. However, it is worth saying that this debate is mostly about introducing admission numbers based on a schools capacity, rather than historic numbers on roll at some distant point in time, which was operating very unfairly across Wales. It is also about making the necessary consequential amendments to the process for determining admission arrangements. Essentially, therefore, what we have been agreeing upon this afternoon is how to make the system fairer, and I know that that is something that all Assembly Members will support.

ein hymrwymiad i sicrhau y bydd y ddyletswydd mewn grym erbyn Medi 2006 wedi newid. Er hynny, byddwn yn dod â hwy i'r pwyllgor cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Mae arnaf ofn nad yw'n briodol imi roi sylw i unrhyw geisiadau gan Aelodau ynghylch ysgolion unigol yng nghyd-destun y meysydd y bydd yn rhaid imi wneud penderfyniadau statudol yn eu cylch. Fodd bynnag, mae'n werth dweud mai dadl yw hon yn bennaf am gyflwyno niferoedd derbyn ar sail capasiti ysgolion, yn hytrach na'r nifer a oedd ar y gofrestr, rywbyrd ymhell yn ôl, a hynny'n cael ei weithredu'n annheg iawn ar draws Cymru. Mae hefyd yn golygu gwneud y diwygiadau canlyniadol angenrheidiol i'r broses o benderfynu ynghylch trefniadau derbyn. Yn ei hanfod, felly, yr hyn yr ydym wedi bod yn cytuno arno y prynhawn yma yw sut i wneud y system yn decach, a gwn fod hynny'n rhywbeth y bydd holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi.

*Cynnig (NDM2797): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2797): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw

Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2798): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2798): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine

Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2799): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2799): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2800): O blaid 46, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2800): For 46, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Cymeradwyo Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Rheoli (Eiddo
Preswyl) (Cymru) 2005
Approval of the Approval of Codes of Management Practice (Residential
Property) (Wales) Order 2005**

**The Minister for Social Justice and Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder
Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I propose that Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart:**

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

considers the principle of the Approval of Codes of Management Practice (Residential Property) (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 10 January 2006. (NDM2801)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cymeradwyo Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Rheoli (Eiddo Preswyl) (Cymru) 2006, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2801)

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006 in relation to the draft the Approval of Codes of Management Practice (Residential Property) (Wales) Order 2006; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch drafft y Gorchymyn Cymeradwyo Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Rheoli (Eiddo Preswyl) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. approves that the draft the Approval of Codes of Management Practice (Residential Property) (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod drafft y Gorchymyn Cymeradwyo Codau Ymarfer ar gyfer Rheoli (Eiddo Preswyl) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 10 January 2006; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Ionawr 2006; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 11 January 2006. (NDM2802)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2802)

There are no separate issues from the general ones, and the main amendments are: new provisions to ensure that tenancy agreements contain fair terms in plain language, which I think that we would agree with; new sections on disability and racial discrimination; new sections on emergency access and general access for repairs inspection; additional advice on inventories and dilapidations; details of legislative changes; and guidance on new procedures and relevant caselaw. The guidance notes read very well and will be of help to all within the sector.

Nid oes dim materion sydd ar wahân i'r rhai cyffredinol, a'r prif ddiwygiadau yw: darpariaeth newydd i sicrhau bod cytundebau tenantiaeth yn cynnwys telerau teg mewn iaith sml, sy'n rhywbeth y teimlaf y byddem yn cytuno ag ef; adrannau newydd ar anabledd a gwahaniaethu ar sail hil; adrannau newydd ar fynediad brys a mynediad cyffredinol i archwilio ar gyfer gwneud gwaith atgyweirio; cyngor pellach ar restrau eiddo a dadfeilio; manylion newidiadau deddfwriaethol; a chanllawiau ar weithdrefnau newydd a'r gyfraith achosion berthnasol. Mae'r nodiadau cyfarwyddyd yn darllen yn rhwydd iawn a byddant o gymorth i bawb yn y sector.

Cynnig (NDM2801): O blaid 46, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2801): For 46, Abstain 1, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Jones, Laura Anne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2802): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2802): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter

Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

3.30 p.m.

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27, a Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.27
Approval of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006 under Standing Order 24.27, and the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 under Standing Order No. 24.27

Y Llywydd: Mae wedi ei awgrymu bod y rheoliadau—[*Torri ar draws.*]

The Presiding Officer: It is been proposed that the regulations—[*Interruption.*]

Trefn. Gobeithio y byddwch yn bihafio yn well drws nesaf yn y Siambr newydd. Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i

Order. I hope that you will be better behaved next door in the new Chamber. It is proposed that the next two items be debated together,

gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.	unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.
Motion (NDM2803): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	Cynnig (NDM2803): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>considers the principle of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.</i>	<i>yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.</i>
Amendment 1 in the name of Lisa Francis. Insert a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Cynnwys ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>notes the inadequate surveillance for illegal imports of foreign meat and meat products at UK ports, and calls on the Minister to press the UK Government to put in place stronger controls to prevent the foot and mouth disease virus entering Wales.</i>	<i>yn nodi'r wylidwriaeth annigonol i ganfod mewnfurion cig a chynhyrchion cig tramor anghyfreithlon ym mhorthladdoedd y DU, ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i gyflwyno rheolaeth gadarnach er mwyn rhwystro feirws clwy'r traed a'r genau rhag dod i Gymru.</i>
Motion (NDM2804): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	Cynnig (NDM2804): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>approves that the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.</i>	<i>yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.</i>
Motion (NDM2805): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	Cynnig (NDM2805): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>considers the principle of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.</i>	<i>yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.</i>
Motion (NDM2806): to propose that <i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	Cynnig (NDM2806): cynnig bod <i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>approves that the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.</i>	<i>yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.</i>

The Presiding Officer: I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2803 in the name of Lisa Francis.

Y Llywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2803 yn enw Lisa Francis.

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2803)

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2803)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

approves that the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006 is made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2804)

yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2804)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2805)

yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2805)

I propose that

Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

approves that the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006 are made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2806)

yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2806)

There are two pieces of legislation that the Assembly is asked to approve this afternoon; the first of which is the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006. The Order transposes the bulk of the FMD directive and retains some provisions from existing

Mae dau ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth y gofynnir i'r Cynulliad eu cymeradwyo y prynhawn yma; y cyntaf yw Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006. Mae'r Gorchymyn yn trosi'r rhan fwyaf o gyfarwydddeb clwy'r traed a'r genau ac yn cadw rhai darpariaethau

legislation. It deals with the slaughter of susceptible animals on infected premises and with the procedures and controls required on suspicion and confirmation of foot and mouth disease, as well as the provision of a number of zones of different levels of control. It also introduces a number of treatments such as heat treatment, deboning and maturation, which will be applied to meat and other animal products in infected areas, should that be necessary.

The second piece of legislation is the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006, which deals with vaccination, obviously, and moves emergency vaccination to the forefront of FMD-control strategies, alongside the basic policy of slaughter of susceptible animals on infected premises and those defined as dangerous contacts.

I turn to the amendment in the name of Lisa Francis that has been tabled to the first motion. It is impossible to prevent the movement of any disease anywhere in the world, so the idea that we can prevent foot and mouth disease entering Wales is a forlorn hope. All that we can do is to seek to minimise the possibility of the disease entering the UK, and, ultimately, Wales. However, the question that I pose to the proposer of the amendment is this: the amendment states that there is,

‘inadequate surveillance for illegal imports of foreign meat’.

In this year, 2006, what is the basis for suggesting that the surveillance is inadequate and secondly, what would the proposer of the amendment put in its place? What does the Conservative Party say needs to be put into place in order, as it would see it, to tighten up on dealing with import controls? It should bear in mind that during the financial year 2004-05, 25,610 seizures were made, totalling 220,155 kg in illegally imported animal products, and that there have been innovations such as the baggage x-ray scanners at selected major airports, including Cardiff international airport, which I have had the opportunity of seeing for myself. I believe that reasonable and proper controls

o'r ddeddfwriaeth bresennol. Mae'n delio â lladd anifeiliaid a allai gael eu heintio ar eiddo sydd wedi'i heintio ac â'r gweithdrefnau a'r mesurau rheoli sy'n ofynnol pan amheuir ac y cadarnheir clwy'r traed a'r genau, yn ogystal â darparu nifer o barthau ar wahanol lefelau rheoli. Mae hefyd yn cyflwyno nifer o driniaethau megis triniaeth gwres, tynnu esgyrn ac aeddfedu, a gaiff eu defnyddio gyda chig a chynhyrchion anifeiliaid eraill mewn ardaloedd sydd wedi'u heintio, pe bai hynny'n ofynnol.

Yr ail ddarn o ddeddfwriaeth yw rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006, sy'n delio â brechu, yn amlwg, ac yn rhoi lle blaenllaw i frechu brys yn y strategaethau i reoli clwy'r traed a'r genau, ochr yn ochr â'r polisi sylfaenol o ladd anifeiliaid a allai gael eu heintio ar eiddo sydd wedi'i heintio a'r rhai a ddiffinnir fel cysylltiadau peryglus.

Trof at y gwelliant yn enw Lisa Francis sydd wedi ei gyflwyno i'r cynnig cyntaf. Mae'n amhosibl atal symudiad unrhyw glefyd mewn unrhyw le yn y byd, felly gobaieth truenus yw'r syniad y gallwn atal clwy'r traed a'r genau rhag dod i Gymru. Y cyfan y gallwn ei wneud yw ceisio lleihau'r posibilrwydd y daw'r clefyd i'r DU ac, yn y pen draw, i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, y cwestiwn a ofynnaf i gynigydd y gwelliant yw hwn: dywed y gwelliant fod,

‘gwyliadwriaeth annigonol i ganfod mewnforion cig tramor anghyfreithlon’.

Yn y flwyddyn hon, 2006, beth yw'r sail dros awgrymu bod yr wyliadwriaeth yn annigonol ac yn ail, beth fyddai cynigydd y gwelliant yn ei roi yn ei lle? Beth, yn ôl y Blaid Geidwadol, sydd angen ei roi ar waith er mwyn tynhau'r rheolaeth dros fewnforio, yn ôl ei barn hi? Dylid cofio, yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol 2004-05, fod 25,610 o atafaeliadau wedi cael eu gwneud, cyfanswm o 220,155 kg o gynhyrchion anifeiliaid a fewnforiwyd yn anghyfreithlon, a bod arloesi wedi bod gyda phethau fel sganwyr bagiau pelydr X mewn rhai meysydd awyr mawr, gan gynnwys maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, yr wyf wedi cael y cyfle i'w weld dros of hun. Credaf fod mesurau rheoli

are in place to deal with the import of illegal meat, as the figures show, and will be interested to hear what exactly the Conservatives would do to change that.

Brynle Williams: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2803 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point to the end of the motion:

notes the inadequate surveillance for illegal imports of foreign meat and meat products at UK ports, and calls on the Minister to press the UK Government to put in place stronger controls to prevent the foot and mouth disease virus entering Wales.

First of all, I welcome these regulations, but only, as I have said in the amendment, if biosecurity is tightened up. You are well aware, Minister, that I believe that some 12,500 tonnes of illegal meat is entering the UK each year. That is one point. As far as meat entering the UK via other European Community routes is concerned, I believe that, once meat in a consignment or lorry-load is within the confines of the EC, it can freely move around the whole of the EC. At the moment, I am afraid that the security of some of the eastern new members is not what it should be. We are bordering countries that have endemic foot and mouth disease.

I ask today, Minister, that we use a little common sense. We can use the island geography of the UK and fortify the ports with more customs officers, not less. Minister, you led Wales and the industry through one of the most traumatic periods in agriculture in the last 100 years, so you are well aware of this matter. I beg you today to support amendment 1 and make sure that we can tighten this up so that foot and mouth disease does not enter the UK once again.

Elin Jones: Bydd Plaid Cymru yn cefnogi'r Gorchmynion hyn heddiw ac yn gobeithio na fydd fyth rhaid i ni eu gweithredu. Yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi ysbryd gwelliant 1 y Toriaid oherwydd y mae'n wir mai ychydig o hyder sydd gan y diwydiant amaethyddol bod

rhesymol a phriodol wedi cael eu sefydlu i ddelio â mewnfario cig anghyfreithlon, fel y dengys y ffigurau, a bydd gennyf ddiddordeb mewn clywed beth yn union y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei wneud i newid hynny.

Brynle Williams: Cynigaf welliant 1 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi'r wyladwriaeth annigonol i ganfod mewnfario cig a chynhyrchion cig tramor anghyfreithlon ym mhorthladdoedd y DU, ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i bwysu ar Lywodraeth y DU i gyflwyno rheolaeth gadarnach er mwyn rhwystro feirws clwy'r traed a'r genau rhag dod i Gymru.

Yn gyntaf, croesawaf y rheoliadau hyn, ond dim ond, fel y dywedais yn y gwelliant, os caiff bioddiogelwch ei dynhau. Gwyddoch yn iawn, Weinidog, fy mod yn credu bod rhyw 12,500 tonnall fetrig o gig anghyfreithlon yn dod i'r DU bob blwyddyn. Dyna un pwynt. Cyn belled ag y mae cig yn dod i'r DU drwy rannau eraill o'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd yn bod, pan fo cig mewn llwyth neu ar lori o fewn terfynau'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd, credaf y gall wedyn symud yn ddi-rwystr ar draws y gymuned gyfan. Ar hyn o bryd, mae arnaf ofn nad yw diogelwch rhai o'r aelodau newydd dwyreiniol cystal ag y dylai fod. Yr ydym yn ffinio â gwledydd sydd â chlwy'r traed a'r genau endemig.

Gofynnaf heddiw, Weinidog, inni ddefnyddio ychydig o synnwyr cyffredin. Gallwn ddefnyddio daearyddiaeth y DU fel ynys ac atgyfnerthu'r porthladdoedd â rhagor o swyddogion tollau, nid llai. Weinidog, arweiniasoeh Gymru a'r diwydiant drwy un o'r cyfnodau mwyaf trawmatig mewn amaethyddiaeth yn y 100 mlynedd diwethaf, felly yr ydych yn ymwybodol iawn o'r mater hwn. Erfyniaf arnoch heddiw gefnogi gwelliant 1 a gwneud yn siŵr fod modd inni dynhau hyn fel na fydd clwy'r traed a'r genau yn dod i'r DU unwaith eto.

Elin Jones: Plaid Cymru will support these Orders today and hopes that we will never have to implement them. I also support the spirit of the Tories' amendment 1 because it is true to say that the agricultural industry has little confidence that sufficient measures have

mesurau digonol wedi'u sefydlu i sicrhau bod llai o gig yn cael ei fewnforio yn anghyfreithlon i ynysydd Prydain.

Yr wyf am grybwyll dau fater penodol ar y Rheoliadau Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Rheoli Brechiadau) (Cymru) 2006. Yn gyntaf, pa wybodaeth all y Gweinidog ei roi i ni heddiw ynglŷn â pha mor eang fyddai'n rhaid i ni frechu pe bai achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau a phe bai'n rhaid gweithredu'r rheoliadau hyn? Yn ail, mae'r mater hwn yn ymwneud ag iechyd anifeiliaid, sy'n gyfrifoldeb y Llywodraeth, felly a yw'r Gweinidog yn cytuno y dylai'r gost o frechu, pe bai'n rhaid ei wneud, orffwys gyda'r Llywodraeth yn hytrach na pherchnogion yr anifeiliaid?

Mick Bates: We welcome the detail of these regulations. However, I would like to comment that no regulatory appraisal was presented with these regulations; I think that it is available on request. As a matter of process, that point should be addressed and it should not happen again. It has happened in the past. All information should be sent to Members so that they can assess the merit of any legislation with some independent advice.

Minister, your aggressive attitude towards my colleague, Brynle Williams, regarding amendment 1 was quite uncalled for. The sentiment in the industry, of which you will be aware, is that there is a need to use modern technological aids to aid surveillance at all ports of entry. As you are well aware, this has not been the case. Foot and mouth disease has devastated great tracts of rural Wales. It is necessary that we should feel that the Government is putting in place every possible measure to stop the disease from entering through illegal meat imports. I do not think that your answer, Minister, was at all a satisfactory response to the amendment from the Welsh Conservatives.

I hope that, in your summing up, you will indicate that you are totally committed to stopping illegal meat imports and that there is greater co-ordination between all the bodies that are responsible for that and a substantial budget to ensure that every port of entry is equipped with the latest x-ray machinery, so

been put in place to ensure that less meat is illegally imported into the British isles.

I will refer to two specific matters on the Foot and Mouth (Control of Vaccination) (Wales) Regulations 2006. First, what information can the Minister give us today about how widely we would have to vaccinate if there were an outbreak of foot and mouth disease and these regulations had to be implemented? Secondly, this matter concerns animal health, which is a Government responsibility, therefore does the Minister agree that the cost of vaccination, if it had to be done, should fall on the Government rather than the owners of the animals?

Mick Bates: Yr ydym yn croesawu manylion y rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn gyfeirio at y ffaith na chyflwynwyd arfarniad rheoliadol gyda'r rheoliadau hyn; credaf ei fod i'w gael drwy ofyn amdano. Fel mater o broses, dylid rhoi sylw i'r pwynt hwnnw ac ni ddylai ddigwydd eto. Mae wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Dylai'r holl wybodaeth gael ei hanfon at Aelodau er mwyn iddynt allu pwyso a mesur unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth yng ngoleuni cyngor annibynnol.

Weinidog, nid oedd angen o gwbl am eich agwedd ymosodol tuag at fy nghyd-Aelod, Brynle Williams, ynglŷn â gwelliant 1. Y teimlad yn y diwydiant, fel y byddwch yn gwybod, yw bod angen defnyddio cymhorthion technolegol modern i gynorthwyo'r goruchwyllo ym mhob porthladd mynediad. Mae clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi anrheithio rhannau enfawr o gefn gwlad Cymru. Rhaid inni deimlo bod y Llywodraeth yn rhoi pob mesur posibl ar waith i atal y clefyd rhag dod i mewn drwy fewnforion cig anghyfreithlon. Ni chredaf fod eich ateb, Weinidog, yn ymateb boddhaol o gwbl i'r gwelliant gan Geidwadwyr Cymru.

Gobeithiaf y byddwch, wrth grynhai, yn dangos eich bod yn ymrwymo'n llwyr i atal mewnforion cig anghyfreithlon a bod mwy o gydweithredu rhwng yr holl gyrff sy'n gyfrifol am hynny ynghyd â chyllideb sylweddol i sicrhau bod gan bob porthladd mynediad y peiriannau pelydr X diweddaraf,

that we know that you are playing your part in controlling this disease.

It would be well if you, in commenting on this legislation, said what testing regime is in place. People have generally accepted the three zones—protection, surveillance and vaccination—however, I think that they need to know about the testing regime that will assist us in the identification of the necessary zones for vaccination.

There is also some confusion over the border issue when surveillance zones of 3 km or 10 km will be implemented, and the position of slaughter houses on one side of the border that are not declared to be in either protection, surveillance or vaccination zones. I hope that you can assure us that your civil servants are in close contact with those who operate in England to ensure that when a zone would be identified that there is no confusion over the policing of those zones.

3.40 p.m.

Finally, it appears from the legislation that, if a zone is identified, you or someone in the Welsh Assembly Government will have the responsibility for identifying the size of the zone. Can you clarify that? Who would be responsible for determining the size of any zone in the three categories?

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I will deal with the substantive points first. The size of the zones is a matter for the State Veterinary Service. It is the body with responsibility for dealing with an outbreak and its officials will take decisions as to how big a zone should be. For any zone that crosses the border, it is sensible that the border is ignored for those purposes, and I would fully expect that to happen, with SVS officers on one side of the border working with those on the other side. That is not insurmountable, and to all intents and purposes, the political boundary would not exist in such circumstances, because similar, if not identical, Orders would be in place in England.

er mwyn inni wybod eich bod yn chwarae eich rhan i reoli'r clefyd hwn.

Byddai'n dda o beth pe baech, wrth sôn am y ddeddfwriaeth hon, yn dweud pa gyfundrefn brofi sydd wedi cael ei sefydlu. Yn gyffredinol mae pobl wedi derbyn y tri pharth—gwarchod, goruchwyllo a brechu—fodd bynnag, credaf fod angen iddynt gael gwybod y bydd y gyfundrefn brofi yn gymorth inni i ddynodi'r parthau brechu angenrheidiol.

Mae peth dryswch hefyd ynglŷn â mater y ffin lle y caiff parthau goruchwyllo o 3 km neu 10 km eu gweithredu, a sefyllfa lladd-dai ar un ochr i'r ffin na ddatganwyd eu bod mewn parthau gwarchod, goruchwyllo na brechu. Gobeithiaf y gallwch ein sicrhau bod eich gweision sifil mewn cysylltiad agos â'r rhai sy'n gweithredu yn Lloegr i sicrhau, pan gâi parth ei ddynodi, nad oes dim dryswch ynglŷn â phlisma'r parthau hynny.

Yn olaf, mae'n ymddangos oddi wrth y ddeddfwriaeth, os caiff parth ei ddynodi, y byddwch chi neu rywun yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gyfrifol am ddynodi maint y parth. A allwch fwrw goleuni ar hynny? Pwy fyddai'n gyfrifol am bennu maint unrhyw barth yn y tri chategori?

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Deliaf â'r pwyntiau o sylwedd yn gyntaf. Mater i'r Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol yw maint y parthau. Ef yw'r corff sy'n gyfrifol am ddelio ag achos o'r clwy a'i swyddogion ef fydd yn penderfynu pa mor fawr y dylai parth fod. Gydag unrhyw barth sy'n croesi'r ffin, mae'n synhwyrol anwybyddu'r ffin at y dibenion hynny, a byddwn yn llwyr ddisgwyl mai dyna a fyddai'n digwydd, gyda swyddogion y Gwasanaeth Milfeddygol Gwladol ar un ochr i'r ffin yn gweithio gyda'r rhai ar yr ochr arall. Nid yw hynny'n rhywbeth na ellir ei oresgyn, ac i bob diben, ni fyddai'r ffin wleidyddol yn bodoli o dan amgylchiadau felly, oherwydd byddai Gorchmynion tebyg, os nad yn union yr un fath, mewn grym yn Lloegr.

In terms of vaccination, the cost of dealing with outbreak control is a matter for the Government.

I'r Llywodraeth y mae hynny. DEFRA sy'n gyfrifol am dalu i ddelio â'r clwy, ac nid y Cynulliad.

The size of a vaccination zone would depend on where the disease is. If I remember rightly, the spread of the particular type of foot and mouth disease virus that existed in the UK in 2001 meant that it took about five days for symptoms to appear. Had there been a vaccination zone at that time, it would have to have taken account of five days' spread of the disease and to have taken into account a number of animals that appeared to be free of the disease. So, for that particular virus, five days was regarded as the right time, from contraction by the animal to appearance of symptoms. There were great practical difficulties with vaccination in 2001, not least with the fact that those farmers who were in the five-day zone, if I can put it like that, but who had animals that were free of disease would have had something to say about it, and would no doubt have resisted it. There is also the fact that, in Wales, as in many other parts of the UK, sheep wander. In many parts of Europe, they are fenced in or enclosed. To make it easier to vaccinate in Wales, we would have had to fence a large area of land. Therefore, the size of the zone would depend on the outbreak and the type of virus.

During my opening speech, I asked for evidence of inadequate surveillance at the ports. The answer? None. I also asked what the Conservatives would do to tighten up on the surveillance at the ports that they say is inadequate. The answer? Nothing. I see that Brynle wishes to answer those points.

Brynle Williams: To be fair, we have seen a reduction over the last five to six years in customs officers in the ports. I am concerned about trying to stop this disease before it gets here. I take your point that you cannot stop every disease, but let us at least try to do something about it. With regard to the illegal meat that is smuggled through Heathrow,

O ran brechu, mater i'r Llywodraeth yw cost delio â rheoli achos.

That is a matter for the Government. DEFRA is responsible for paying to deal with the disease, and not the Assembly.

Byddai maint parth brechu yn dibynnu ar ble y mae'r clefyd. Os cofiaf yn iawn, golygai lledaeniad y math neilltuol o feirws clwy'r traed a'r genau a fodolai yn y DU yn 2001 ei fod yn cymryd pum diwrnod i symptomau ymddangos. Pe bai parth brechu ar y pryd, byddai wedi gorfod cymryd pum diwrnod o ledaeniad y clwy i ystyriaeth ac wedi gorfod ystyried nifer o anifeiliaid a oedd yn ymddangos fel pe baent yn lân o'r clwy. Felly, o ran y feirws neilltuol hwnnw, ystyrir mai pum diwrnod oedd y cyfnod cywir, o'r adeg pan gâi'r anifail y clwy hyd nes i symptomau ymddangos. Yr oedd anawsterau ymarferol mawr gyda brechu yn 2001, yn enwedig oherwydd y ffaith y byddai gan y ffermwyr hynny a oedd yn y parth pum diwrnod, os gallaf ei roi felly, ond a oedd ag anifeiliaid a oedd yn lân o'r clefyd, rywbeth i'w ddweud am hynny, a byddent yn sicr wedi ei wrthsefyll. Hefyd mae'r ffaith bod defaid yn crwydro, yng Nghymru megis mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU. Mewn llawer o rannau o Ewrop, maent wedi eu ffensio neu eu cau i mewn. I'w gwneud yn haws brechu yng Nghymru, byddem wedi gorfod ffensio ardal eang o dir. Felly, byddai maint y parth yn dibynnu ar yr achos a'r math o feirws.

Yn ystod fy araith agoriadol, gofynnais am dystiolaeth o oruchwylio annigonol yn y porthladdoedd. Yr ateb? Dim. Gofynnais hefyd beth y byddai'r Ceidwadwyr yn ei wneud i dynhau'r oruchwyliaeth yn y porthladdoedd sydd, meddant hwy, yn annigonol. Yr ateb? Dim. Gwelaf fod Brynle am ateb y pwyntiau hynny.

Brynle Williams: A bod yn deg, yr ydym wedi gweld gostyngiad dros y pump neu chwe mlynedd diwethaf mewn swyddogion tollau yn y porthladdoedd. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ymboeni yn ei gylch yw ceisio atal y clefyd hwn cyn iddo gyrraedd yma. Derbynias eich pwynt na allwch atal pob clefyd, ond gadewch inni o leiaf geisio gwneud rhywbeth

Manchester and other places, you have been at presentations, Minister, at which the evidence was laid before you. What have we got? We have an extra couple of beagles to sniff it out. I am sorry, but that is rather complacent. We have to look at this matter and sort it out. It is a serious thing. I was not talking lightly when I said that you have taken us through one of the worst experiences ever in the agricultural and rural community. Let us not go there again.

The Presiding Officer: Order. That was beginning to sound like a third speech.

Carwyn Jones: If there is one thing that I can promise you with my hand on my heart, it is that I do not want to see foot and mouth disease back in this country while I or anyone else is in charge. I remember full well the difficulties that everybody faced, not least the farmers, who were on the front line in dealing with the disease and suffering its consequences. However, it is important, if there is a suggestion that surveillance is inadequate, that there is evidence to back it up. It is also important that, if it is the case that surveillance is inadequate, suggestions are made as to how to deal with that. As I said before, there is major surveillance of those ports of entry at most risk. Heathrow is obviously one of them, and Manchester is another, as is Cardiff. Some ports do not have any exports from outside the EU, and there is little point in putting that kind of surveillance in those ports if the risk is very low. The UK is not an island, remember: it is an island and a bit. It has one of the longest land borders in all Europe, and it is a completely un-policed and open border. I know it well, and it is easy to move people and animals across that border.

The border controls have disappeared over the past seven or eight years. Bearing that in mind, we have to take an EU-wide approach, and that means accepting, when meat comes into the UK at an EU port of entry, that it is being dealt with properly. All countries have

amdano. O ran y cig anghyfreithlon sy'n cael ei smyglo drwy Heathrow, Manceinion a mannau eraill, yr ydych wedi bod mewn cyflwyniadau, Weinidog, lle y rhoddwyd y dystiolaeth o'ch blaen. Beth sydd gennym? Mae gennym gwpl o gorhelgwn ychwanegol i ffroeni amdano. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond mae hynny braidd yn hunanfodlon. Rhaid inni edrych ar y mater hwn a'i ddatrys. Mae'n beth difrifol. Nid siarad yn ysgafn yr oeddwn pan ddywedais eich bod wedi mynd â ni drwy un o'r profiadau gwaethaf erioed yn y gymuned amaethyddol a gwledig. Gadewch inni beidio â mynd i'r sefyllfa honno eto.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr oedd hynny'n dechrau swnio fel trydedd araith.

Carwyn Jones: Os oes un peth y gallaf ei addo â'm llaw ar fy nghalon, nid wyf am weld clwy'r traed a'r genau yn ôl yn y wlad hon tra wyf fi na neb arall wrth y llyw. Cofiaf yn dda iawn yr anawsterau a wynebai pawb, yn enwedig y ffermwyr, a oedd ar flaen y gad wrth ddelio â'r clefyd a dioddef ei ganlyniadau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n bwysig, os oes awgrym bod y goruchwyllo'n annigonol, fod tystiolaeth i ategu hynny. Mae hefyd yn bwysig, os yw'n wir bod y goruchwyllo'n annigonol, fod awgrymiadau'n cael eu gwneud ynghylch sut y mae delio â hynny. Fel y dywedais o'r blaen, mae goruchwyllo mawr ar y porthladdoedd mynediad hynny lle y mae'r perygl mwyaf. Mae Heathrow yn amlwg yn un ohonynt, a Manceinion yn un arall, a Chaerdydd hefyd. Nid oes dim allforion o'r tu allan i'r DU mewn rhai porthladdoedd, ac nid oes fawr o ddiben rhoi'r math hwnnw o oruchwyllo yn y porthladdoedd hynny os yw'r perygl yn fach iawn. Nid ynys yw'r DU, cofiwch: ynys a rhyw fymryn ydyw. Mae iddi un o'r ffiniau tir hwyaf yn Ewrop gyfan, ac mae'n ffin gwbl agored nad yw'n cael ei phlisma o gwbl. Yr wyf yn gyfarwydd iawn â hi, ac mae'n hawdd symud pobl ac anifeiliaid ar draws y ffin honno.

Mae rheoli ffiniau wedi dod i ben yn ystod y saith neu wyth mlynedd diwethaf. O gadw hynny mewn cof, rhaid inni fabwysiadu dull o weithredu ar draws yr UE i gyd, ac mae hynny'n golygu derbyn, pan fydd cig yn dod i mewn i'r DU drwy un o borthladdoedd

an interest in ensuring that foot and mouth disease does not arrive at their shores.

However, we cannot impose internal import controls on other EC countries, because they will do the same to us, and, before you know it, there will be obstacles to exporting, and Wales is an exporting country, particularly to southern Europe. Therefore, I have to oppose the amendment. I take it in the spirit in which it is proposed, but I must say that no evidence has been put before the Assembly of any kind of shortcoming, and there is no evidence on what should be done about the alleged shortcoming. Therefore, I propose that the motions be accepted as they are.

mynediad yr UE, ei fod yn cael ei drin yn briodol. Mae o fudd i bob gwlad sicrhau nad yw clwy'r traed a'r genau'n cyrraedd eu glannau.

Fodd bynnag, ni allwn orfodi rheolau mewnfario mewnol ar wledydd eraill y Gymuned Ewropeaidd, gan y byddant hwy'n gwneud yr un peth i ni a, chyn pen dim, bydd rhwystrau wedi eu cyflwyno i atal allfario, ac mae Cymru'n wlad sy'n allfario, yn enwedig i dde Ewrop. Felly, rhaid imi wrthwynebu'r gwelliant. Yr wyf yn ei gymryd yn yr ysbryd y mae'n cael ei gynnig, ond rhaid imi ddweud nad oes dim tystiolaeth wedi ei rhoi gerbron y Cynulliad o ddiffyg o fath yn y byd, ac nid oes dim tystiolaeth ynghylch yr hyn y dylid ei wneud ynglŷn â'r diffyg honedig. Felly, cynigiaf fod y cynigion yn cael eu derbyn fel y maent.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2803): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2803): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

considers the principle of the Foot and Mouth Disease (Wales) Order 2006, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.

yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Clwy'r Traed a'r Genau (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Ionawr 2006 ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.

*Cynnig (NDM2803): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2803): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2804): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2804): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2805): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2805): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2806): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2806): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor

Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol
 Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig
 Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygiad Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006
 Approval of the NHS (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and
 (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment)
 (Wales) Regulations 2006**

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that
Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

considers the principle of the National yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r

Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 3 January 2006. (NDM2807)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 17 January 2006 in relation to the draft The National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and

2. approves that the draft the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 3 January 2006; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 December 2005. (NDM2808)

These regulations will require local health boards to maintain a supplementary list of optometrists who are not eligible to join the existing ophthalmic list. The list will include, for example, locums and employed optometrists. The supplementary list introduced by these regulations will be for individual practitioners who undertake sight tests, but who are unable to fully comply with terms of service. The regulations will ensure that all optometrist practitioners are subject to the same high level of appropriate standards.

The regulations will also extend the existing legislation to allow sight tests to be carried out in a patient's home by providers who do not have fixed premises in the area. The current restrictive legislation states that general ophthalmic services can be provided

Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygiad Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2807)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Ionawr 2006 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygiad Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygiad Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 3 Ionawr 2006; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Rhagfyr 2005. (NDM2808)

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i fyrddau iechyd lleol gadw rhestr atodol o optometryddion nad ydynt yn gymwys i ymuno â'r rhestr offthalmig bresennol. Bydd y rhestr yn cynnwys, er enghraifft, locymau ac optometryddion cyflogedig. Bydd y rhestr atodol a gyflwynir yn sgîl y rheoliadau hyn ar gyfer ymarferwyr unigol sy'n cynnal profion golwg, ond na allant gydymffurfio'n llwyr ag amodau'r gwasanaeth. Bydd y rheoliadau'n sicrhau bod pob ymarferydd optometreg yn gweithio o fewn yr un lefel uchel o safonau priodol.

Bydd y rheoliadau hefyd yn ymestyn y ddeddfwriaeth bresennol i ganiatáu cynnal profion golwg yng nghartrefi cleifion gan ddarparwyr sydd heb ganolfan sefydlog yn yr ardal. Mae'r ddeddfwriaeth gyfyngol bresennol yn datgan mai dim ond darparwyr

at an individual's home only by a provider with community premises in the area, and not by mobile services. Finally, the regulations will allow ophthalmic opticians, providing general ophthalmic services, to refer patients directly to a hospital service, rather than referring them initially through their general practitioner, thus saving time for the patient and the health service.

sydd â chanolfan gymunedol yn yr ardal, ac nid gwasanaethau symudol, sydd â hawl i ddarparu gwasanaethau offthalmig cyffredinol yng nghartref yr unigolyn. Yn olaf, bydd y rheoliadau'n caniatáu i optegwyr offthalmig, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau offthalmig cyffredinol, atgyfeirio cleifion yn uniongyrchol at wasanaeth ysbyty, yn hytrach na'u hatgyfeirio i ddechrau drwy eu meddyg teulu, a thrwy hynny arbed amser i'r claf ac i'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

Helen Mary Jones: We are content to formally support the regulations.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau yn ffurfiol.

Jenny Randerson: We are content to support the regulations.

Jenny Randerson: Yr ydym yn fodlon cefnogi'r rheoliadau.

Y Llywydd: Awn yn syth at bleidlais, felly.

The Presiding Officer: Therefore, we will move directly to the vote.

3.50 p.m.

Cynnig (NDM2807): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2807): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn

Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2808): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2808): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri

Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Dyfarniad Cymhorthdal y Cyfrif Refeniw Tai (Cymru) 2006-2007, a'r Dyfarniad Cyffredinol (Cymru) o Gredyd Eitem 8 a Debyd Eitem 8: 2006-2007 o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 29
Approval of the Housing Revenue Account Subsidy (Wales) Determination 2006-2007, and the (Wales) General Determination of the Item 8 Credit and Item 8 Debit 2006-07 under Standing Order No. 29

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):

considers the principle of the Housing Revenue Account Subsidy (Wales) Determination 2006-07 a draft of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2809)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):

approves the Housing Revenue Account Subsidy (Wales) Determination 2006-2007 which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2810)

I propose that

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):

yn ystyried egwyddor Dyfarniad Cymhorthdal Cyfrif Refeniw Tai (Cymru) 2006-07 y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2809)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):

yn cymeradwyo Dyfarniad Cymhorthdal y Cyfrif Refeniw Tai (Cymru) 2006-2007 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2810)

Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):

considers the principle of the (Wales) General Determination of the Item 8 Credit and Item 8 Debit 2006-2007 a draft of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2811)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 29.3(iii):

approves the (Wales) General Determination of the Item 8 Credit and Item 8 Debit 2006-2007 which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2812)

Both determinations are made annually for each financial year. They provide the basis for calculating the local authorities housing revenue account subsidy, and local government has been consulted on both determinations. The HRAS is an annual managed expenditure which does not impact on Assembly budgets and determinations are made at this time to meet local authority budgeting timetables for 2006-07. The differential between rent benchmarks for registered social landlords and guideline rents for local authorities has been maintained at 1 per cent, thereby aiding the achievement of social housing rent convergence. The management of maintenance has increased by 4.7 per cent from the previous year, which is equal to a real terms increase of 2 per cent, as based on a gross domestic product deflator of 2.7 per cent. The average all-Wales guideline rent increase of 4.7 per cent from the previous year, which is equal to a real terms increase of 2 per cent, is based on the GDP deflator of 2.7 per cent. There is an increase in individual local authority unencumbered borrowing, and an increase in individual local authority leasing subsidy limits, to meet the cost of leasing property from the private sector to provide temporary accommodation for homeless people. There are no other substantive changes to the previous year's regulations.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):

yn ystyried egwyddor Dyfarniad Cyffredinol (Cymru) o Gredyd Eitem 8 a Debyd Eitem 8: 2006-2007 y gosodwyd drafft ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2811)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 29.3(iii):

yn cymeradwyo Dyfarniad Cyffredinol (Cymru) o Gredyd Eitem 8 a Debyd Eitem 8: 2006-2007 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2812)

Gwneir y ddau ddyfarniad yn flynyddol ar gyfer pob blwyddyn ariannol. Maent yn sail i gyfrifo cymhorthdal cyfrif refeniw tai awdurdodau lleol, ac ymgynghorwyd â llywodraeth leol ynghylch y ddau ddyfarniad. Mae'r CCRT yn wariant a reolir yn flynyddol nad yw'n effeithio ar gyllidebau'r Cynulliad a gwneir y dyfarniadau ar yr adeg hon i gyd-fynd ag amserlenni cyllidebu'r awdurdodau lleol ar gyfer 2006-07. Mae'r gwahaniaeth rhwng meincnodau rhent ar gyfer landlordiaid cymdeithasol cofrestredig a'r rhenti awgrymedig ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol wedi cael ei gadw'n 1 y cant, a thrwy hynny'n cynorthwyo i gysoni rhenti tai cymdeithasol. Mae rheoli gwaith cynnal a chadw wedi cynyddu 4.7 y cant ers y flwyddyn flaenorol, sy'n gyfystyr â chynnydd mewn termau real o 2 y cant, a hynny'n seiliedig ar ddatchwyddiant cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth o 2.7 y cant. Mae'r cynnydd cyfartalog yn y rhent awgrymedig drwy Gymru gyfan o 4.7 y cant ers y flwyddyn flaenorol, sy'n gyfystyr â chynnydd o 2 y cant mewn termau real, yn seiliedig ar ddatchwyddiant cynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth o 2.7 y cant. Ceir cynnydd mewn benthyca â chymorth heb ei neilltuo gan awdurdodau lleol unigol, a chynnydd mewn terfynau cymhorthdal prydlesu awdurdodau lleol unigol, i dalu'r gost o brydlesu eiddo o'r sector preifat i ddarparu llety dros dro i bobl

ddigartref. Nid oes newidiadau sylweddol eraill i reoliadau'r flwyddyn flaenorol.

Mark Isherwood: We will support the motions, which, as the Minister says, are effectively procedural and follow consultation with local authorities and other relevant bodies. However, I will raise two of the main consultation points detailed in the draft housing revenue account determination for 2006-07.

Mark Isherwood: Byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynigion sydd, fel y dywed y Gweinidog, yn rhai gweithdrefnol i bob pwrpas ac maent yn dilyn ymgynghoriad gydag awdurdodau lleol a chyrrff perthnasol eraill. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am grybwyll dau o'r prif bwyntiau ymgynghori sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn y dyfarniad cyfrif refeniw tai drafft ar gyfer 2006-07.

The first relates to the management and maintenance allowance per dwelling for each local authority. I would be grateful for further clarification, because my local county council has written to its council-house tenants telling them that their homes will not be repaired unless they are at risk of injury or death, because of the black hole in its housing budget. What are the council's duties in this respect and in the context of this determination?

Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r lwfans rheoli a chynnal yr annedd i bob awdurdod lleol. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar am eglurhad pellach, oherwydd y mae fy nghyngor sir lleol wedi ysgrifennu at ei denantiaid tai cyngor i ddweud wrthynt na fydd eu cartrefi'n cael eu trwsio oni bai fod perygl i anaf neu farwolaeth ddigwydd, oherwydd diffyg yn ei gyllideb tai. Beth yw dyletswyddau'r cyngor yn hyn o beth ac yng nghyd-destun y dyfarniad hwn?

My second point relates to leasing subsidy limits. I share the concern about the number of homeless households which are still being placed in bed and breakfast accommodation and support funding for private sector leasing to provide alternative temporary accommodation for homeless people. Noting the increase in homelessness and housing waiting lists reported by local authorities and housing charities, what research has been undertaken to establish the real level of need for leasing subsidy?

Mae fy ail bwynt yn ymwneud â therfynau cymhorthdal prydlesu. Yr wyf ffinau'n bryderus ynglŷn â nifer y teuluoedd digartref sy'n parhau i gael eu lleoli mewn llety gwely a brechwast a chyllid cymorth ar gyfer prydlesu o'r sector preifat i ddarparu llety arall dros dro i bobl ddiartref. Gan nodi'r cynnydd mewn digartrefedd a rhestrau aros am dai yr hysbysir amdanynt gan awdurdodau lleol ac elusennau tai, pa ymchwil a wnaethpwyd i wybod beth yw gwir lefel yr angen am gymhorthdal prydlesu?

I raise this matter, in particular, in the context of concerns raised with me regarding the effect of homelessness legislation on north Wales coastal towns. The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has written to me stating that if an applicant has no connection with an area, the local authority can refer them to another authority where they have a connection, and that local people are not being disadvantaged in favour of socially excluded people moving into an area. However, I am advised by county councillors in north Wales that advantage has been taken, in their opinion, of the priority-needs-group provisions, as well as the normal homelessness priority to secure housing ahead of local people. The situation applying

Yr wyf yn codi'r mater hwn, yn enwedig, yng nghyd-destun y pryderon a leisiwyd wrthyf o ran effaith deddfwriaeth digartrefedd ar drefi arfordir y gogledd. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi ysgrifennu ataf gan ddatgan os nad oes gan yr ymgeisydd gysylltiad ag ardal, y gall yr awdurdod lleol eu cyfeirio at awdurdod arall lle y mae ganddynt gysylltiad, ac nad yw pobl leol yn wynebu anfantais o'u cymharu â phobl wedi'u hallgáu'n gymdeithasol sy'n symud i ardal. Fodd bynnag, cefais wybod gan gynghorwyr sir yn y gogledd fod rhai pobl wedi cymryd mantais, yn eu barn hwy, o'r darpariaethau ar gyfer grŵp anghenion blaenoriaeth, yn ogystal â'r flaenoriaeth arferol yn sgîl digartrefedd, i sicrhau eu bod

to qualification criteria and local connection is such that an urgent review is required, and a far more robust system of control needs to be introduced where community sustainability is at risk.

I cite, in conclusion, a judgment of maladministration by the local government ombudsman for Wales against a north Wales local authority, of which I know the Minister is aware. The council has failed to rehouse a family from north-west England under its old housing allocation policy, where there had been a reluctance on the part of the elected members to implement a new housing allocation policy which they believed disadvantaged local people at a time of growing local housing need, combined with growing pressures on local services created by an influx of people into the area. What evidence is there to show that the leasing subsidy limit for 2006-07 now detailed will be sufficient to meet demand in these circumstances when the Minister introduces planned legislation to restrict a local authority's ability to place homeless people in bed and breakfast accommodation?

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I do not believe that it would be appropriate for me to go into some of the points that you have raised in detail, Mark. If you can send me the relevant correspondence, which is to do with the local authority's tenants, repairs and so on, I would be happy to deal with the matter.

During the consultation process, we invited authorities to apply for an increase to the subsidy limit for the private sector lease and to provide temporary accommodation for homeless people, as we recognised that there was an issue and my officials advised me that it would be appropriate to undertake that work and those changes. On the further points that you make concerning another nameless north Wales authority, I do not accept that any changes that we have made have adversely impacted on local authorities and this has already been subject to rather detailed correspondence between the Member and me. I commend these determinations.

yn cael tai o flaen pobl leol. Mae'r sefyllfa sy'n ymwneud â meini prawf cymhwysedd a chysylltiadau lleol yn golygu bod angen cynnal adolygiad ar unwaith, a bod angen cyflwyno system reoli sy'n llawer cadarnach pan fo cynaliadwyedd y gymuned mewn perygl.

Dyfynnaf, i gloi, ddyfarniad o gamweinyddu gan ombwdsmon llywodraeth leol Cymru yn erbyn awdurdod lleol yn y gogledd, achos y gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol ohono. Methodd y cyngor ag ailgartrefu teulu o ogledd-orllewin Lloegr o dan ei hen bolisi dyrannu tai, lle y buasai amharodrwydd ar ran yr aelodau etholedig i weithredu polisi dyrannu tai newydd gan eu bod yn credu ei fod yn rhoi pobl leol o dan anfantais ar adeg pan welir cynnydd yn yr angen am dai, ynghyd â phwysau cynyddol ar wasanaethau lleol a achoswyd gan fewnlifiad o bobl i'r ardal. Pa dystiolaeth sydd ar gael i ddangos y bydd y terfyn cymhorthdal prydlesu ar gyfer 2006-07 a amlinellir yn awr yn ddigon i ateb y galw yn yr amgylchiadau hyn pan fydd y Gweinidog yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth a gynlluniwyd i gyfyngu ar allu awdurdod lleol i leoli pobl ddigartref mewn llety gwely a brecwast?

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Nid wyf yn credu y byddai'n briodol imi fanylu ar rai o'r pwyntiau yr ydych wedi eu codi, Mark. Pe baech yn anfon yr ohebiaeth berthnasol ataf, sy'n ymwneud â thenantiaid yr awdurdod lleol, gwaith trwsio ac yn y blaen, byddwn yn fodlon delio â'r mater.

Yn ystod y broses ymgynghori, gwahoddwyd awdurdodau i wneud cais am gynnydd yn y terfyn cymhorthdal ar gyfer prydlesu oddi wrth y sector preifat ac i ddarparu llety dros dro i bobl ddigartref, gan ein bod yn cydnabod y broblem ac fe'm cynghorwyd gan fy swyddogion y byddai'n briodol gwneud y gwaith hwnnw a'r newidiadau hynny. Ynglŷn â'r pwyntiau eraill a wnaethpwyd gennych ynglŷn ag awdurdod dienw arall yn y Gogledd, nid wyf yn derbyn bod y newidiadau yr ydym wedi eu gwneud wedi cael effaith andwyol ar awdurdodau lleol ac mae hyn eisoes wedi bod yn destun gohebiaeth fanwl rhwng yr Aelod a minnau. Cymeradwyaf y dyfarniadau hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM2809): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2809): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2810): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2810): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2811): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2811): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2812): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2812): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 3.58 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 3.58 p.m.*

Y Chweched Adroddiad Blynyddol ar Gydraddoldeb The Sixth Equality Annual Report

Motion (NDM2787): to propose that

Cynnig (NDM2787): cynnig bod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

acting under Standing Order No. 6.6 notes the National Assembly's sixth equality annual report: 'National Assembly for Wales: Arrangements to Promote Equality of Opportunity—Financial Year 2004-2005', which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.

gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6, yn nodi chweched adroddiad blynyddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gydraddoldeb: 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: Trefniadau i Hyrwyddo Cyfle Cyfartal—Blwyddyn Ariannol 2004-2005' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.

Amendment 1 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Gwelliant 1 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

believes that the Welsh Assembly Government and Assembly Parliamentary Service, in advertising job vacancies, must take further and urgent action to ensure that

yn credu bod rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, wrth hysbysebu swyddi gwag, gymryd camau pellach ar frys i sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd y

<i>the widest and most diverse group of people are reached.</i>	<i>grŵp ehangaf a mwyaf amrywiol o bobl.</i>
Amendment 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>regrets the absence of equality issues in the forward work programme of each subject committee.</i>	<i>yn gresynu nad yw materion sy'n ymwneud â chydraddoldeb wedi'u cynnwys ym mlaenraglen waith pob pwyllgor pwnc.</i>
Amendment 3 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 3 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>notes that further progress is required in transforming the Assembly's equality annual report into a living document focused on action planning.</i>	<i>yn nodi bod angen rhagor o gynnydd o ran troi adroddiad cydraddoldeb blynyddol y Cynulliad yn ddogfen fyw sy'n canolbwyntio ar gynllunio gweithredu.</i>
Amendment 4 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 4 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>notes that further action is required to address barriers to staff recruitment and development.</i>	<i>yn nodi bod angen camau pellach er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r rhwystrau ym maes recriwtio a datblygu staff.</i>
Amendment 5 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:	Gwelliant 5 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:
<i>notes that further action will be required to promote equality of opportunity in the new public service departments created by the merger with the ASPBs.</i>	<i>yn nodi y bydd angen camau pellach i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal yn yr adrannau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus newydd a grëir drwy uno gyda'r CCNC.</i>
The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams, and amendments 3, 4, and 5 in the name of Lisa Francis.	Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliannau 3, 4, a 5 yn enw Lisa Francis.
Gwenda Thomas: Cynigiau fod	Gwenda Thomas: I propose that
Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru	the National Assembly for Wales
<i>gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6, yn nodi chweched adroddiad blynyddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gydraddoldeb: 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: Trefniadau i Hyrwyddo Cyfle Cyfartal—Blwyddyn Ariannol 2004-2005' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006. (NDM2787)</i>	<i>acting under Standing Order No. 6.6 notes the National Assembly's sixth equality annual report: 'National Assembly for Wales: Arrangements to Promote Equality of Opportunity—Financial Year 2004-2005', which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006. (NDM2787)</i>
Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cynulliad. Mae'n amlinellu'r camau	It is my pleasure to present this report to the Assembly. It outlines the steps that the

a gymerwyd gan y Cynulliad i gyflawni ei ddyletswydd i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal i bawb, fel a nodir yn Neddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Mae hyn yn rhan bwysig o'r weledigaeth ar gyfer llywodraeth ddatganoledig yng Nghymru. Mae gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi bod yn allweddol o ran cyflawni'r ddyletswydd honno.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cwmpasu blwyddyn ariannol 2004-05. Mae rhan gyntaf yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal ac mae'r ail ran yn ymwneud â gwaith Swyddfa'r Llywydd, a elwir bellach yn Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Mae'r rhan olaf, sy'n ffurfio trwch yr adroddiad, yn amlinellu gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

4.00 p.m.

Carwn ddiolch i wahoddedigion sefydlog y pwyllgor am eu cyfraniad, sef y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb Hiliol, y Comisiwn Hawliau Anabledd, y Comisiwn Cyfle Cyfartal, Stonewall Cymru a Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Bu eu cyfraniad at waith y pwyllgor drwy gydol y flwyddyn yn amhrisiadwy. Carwn ddiolch hefyd i'r unigolion a'r sefydliadau eraill a roddodd o'u hamser i roi cyngor a thystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor.

My final tribute is to the Minister, Jane Hutt. Following her first full year of having assumed Cabinet responsibility for equality of opportunity issues, I—and I am sure that I can speak for the rest of the committee on this point—am most appreciative of the support that she has given to the committee.

This debate is taking place 10 months after the end of the year to which the equality report relates. During 2004-05, the Committee on Equality of Opportunity considered a wide range of issues, including matters relating to the Assembly's internal processes, the operation of organisations under the Assembly's remit and issues relating to the wider community in Wales. I take this opportunity to draw attention to some of the key areas that the committee considered, and, hopefully, set out how we are taking them forward.

Assembly has taken to fulfil its duty to promote equality of opportunity for all, as noted in the Government of Wales Act 1998. This is an important part of the vision for devolved government in Wales. The work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity has been key in terms of fulfilling that duty.

The report encompasses the 2004-05 financial year. The first part deals with the work of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity and the second part refers to the work of the Presiding Office, which is now called the Assembly Parliamentary Service. The final part, which forms the bulk of the report, outlines the work of the Assembly Government.

I wish to thank the committee's standing invitees for their contribution, namely the Commission for Racial Equality, the Disability Rights Commission, the Equal Opportunities Commission, Stonewall Cymru and the Welsh Language Board. Their contribution to the committee's work throughout the year has been invaluable. I also wish to thank the other individuals and institutions that have given of their time to give advice and evidence to the committee.

Hoffwn ddiolch yn olaf i'r Gweinidog, Jane Hutt. Yn dilyn ei blwyddyn lawn gyntaf â chyfrifoldeb am faterion cyfle cyfartal yn y Cabinet, yr wyf—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y gallaf siarad ar ran gweddill y pwyllgor ar y mater hwn—yn ddiolchgar iawn iddi am y gefnogaeth y mae wedi ei rhoi i'r pwyllgor.

Cynhelir y ddadl hon 10 mis ar ôl diwedd y flwyddyn y mae a wnelo'r adroddiad cydraddoldeb â hi. Yn ystod 2004-05, bu'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn ystyried amrediad eang o faterion, gan gynnwys materion yn ymwneud â phrosesau mewnol y Cynulliad, gweithrediad sefydliadau yn unol â chylch gwaith y Cynulliad a materion yn ymwneud â'r gymuned ehangach yng Nghymru. Hoffwn fanteisio ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at rai o'r prif feysydd a ystyriwyd gan y pwyllgor, ac i nodi, gobeithio, sut yr ydym yn gweithredu mewn perthynas â hwy.

As its first policy review during the second Assembly, the committee identified the need to assess the Assembly's success in terms of mainstreaming equality. During the year, the committee completed its evidence taking and published its report in July 2004. Responses were received from the Cabinet, the Permanent Secretary, and the Deputy Presiding Officer on behalf of the House Committee, and were considered in committee in January 2005. The Minister established a mainstreaming task and finish group to take forward the recommendations for the Welsh Assembly Government. An equality steering group has subsequently been set up within the Assembly Parliamentary Service with a similar remit. The committee continues to monitor the implementation of its recommendations throughout 2005-06.

It is important to point out that in producing its annual report for 2004-05, there was no dissent among Members on its content. It is therefore disappointing for me, as committee Chair, to see the amendments to today's motion in the names of Kirsty Williams and Lisa Francis. Not only is it unusual for amendments to be tabled to motions that merely ask the Assembly to note a document, but it is surely strange that political parties should introduce a note of censure to a document of which their nominated representatives are co-authors.

I am particularly concerned with the amendment that regrets the absence of equality issues—

Peter Black: Do you not accept that this report relates not just to the committee's work, but to that of the Government, and that it is therefore perfectly proper for the opposition to seek to make political points and to table amendments, particularly when it seems that little progress has been made in the last few years on some of the issues raised in those amendments?

Gwenda Thomas: I draw your attention to Standing Order No. 6.15, under which

Ar gyfer ei adolygiad polisi cyntaf yn ystod yr ail Gynulliad, gwelodd y pwyllgor fod angen asesu a oedd y Cynulliad yn llwyddo i brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb. Yn ystod y flwyddyn, cwblhaodd y pwyllgor y dasg o gymryd tystiolaeth a chyhoeddodd ei adroddiad yng Ngorffennaf 2004. Cafwyd ymatebion gan y Cabinet, yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, a'r Dirprwy Lywydd ar ran Pwyllgor y Tŷ, ac fe'u hystyriwyd yn y pwyllgor yn Ionawr 2005. Sefydlodd y Gweinidog grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar brif ffrydio i weithredu'r argymhellion ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Sefydlwyd grŵp llywio cydraddoldeb wedi hynny yng Ngwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad â chylch gwaith cyffelyb. Mae'r pwyllgor yn parhau i fonitro'r gwaith o weithredu ei argymhellion drwy gydol 2005-06.

Mae'n bwysig tynnu sylw at y ffaith nad oedd dim anghytundeb ynglŷn â'r cynnwys ymhlith yr Aelodau wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad blynyddol ar gyfer 2004-05. Mae'n siom i mi felly, fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor, weld y gwelliannau i gynnig heddiw yn enwau Kirsty Williams a Lisa Francis. Mae'n anarferol i welliannau gael eu cyflwyno i gynigion nad ydynt yn gwneud dim ond gofyn i'r Cynulliad nodi dogfen, ond mae hefyd yn beth rhyfedd, onid yw, fod pleidiau gwleidyddol yn ceryddu dogfen y mae eu cynrychiolwyr enwebedig yn gydawduron iddi.

Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â'r gwelliant sy'n gresynu nad yw materion sy'n ymwneud â chydraddoldeb wedi'u cynnwys—

Peter Black: Onid ydych yn derbyn bod yr adroddiad hwn yn ymwneud nid yn unig â gwaith y pwyllgor, ond hefyd â gwaith y Llywodraeth, a'i bod felly'n gwbl briodol i'r wrthblaid geisio gwneud pwyntiau gwleidyddol a chyflwyno gwelliannau, yn enwedig pan fo'n ymddangos mai prin iawn yw'r cynnydd sydd wedi ei wneud yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf o ran rhai o'r materion sy'n cael eu codi yn y gwelliannau hynny?

Gwenda Thomas: Tynnaf eich sylw at Reol Sefydlog 6.15. O dan y rheol honno gellir

amendments can be tabled to reports produced by subject committees. As it refers specifically to subject committees, I accept that, technically, it was right and proper for the amendments to be tabled. However, I believe that the spirit of that Standing Order has been contravened by these amendments. That Standing Order was amended in order to protect the report of the Committee on the 'Better Governance for Wales' White Paper, and I must ask, 'What will be next? Will it be the Committee on Standards of Conduct, or the Audit Committee?'. I will now be writing to the Presiding Officer to suggest that that Standing Order be permanently amended.

I am particularly concerned about the amendment that regrets the absence of equality issues in the forward work programmes of each subject committee.

Peter Black *rose*—

Gwenda Thomas: I am not giving way again; I have already given you my explanation.

I draw Members' attention to paragraph 20 of the committee's report, which makes this very point. I remind Members that recommendation 26 of the committee's mainstreaming report deals with this subject. It recommends that other Assembly committees submit their forward work programmes to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, which would then consider whether the forward work programmes pay due regard to equality and comment as appropriate.

The mainstreaming report was only published in July 2004, giving subject committees in particular only two or three weeks to adjust to this new requirement. It is hardly surprising therefore that their initial efforts were not up to scratch. In responding to the committee's criticism of their efforts, Chairs of committees should be congratulated on their initiative in seeking guidance on how their performance in this respect could be improved. They attended briefing sessions during the year from the standing invitees of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity,

cyflwyno gwelliannau i adroddiadau a gynhyrchwyd gan bwyllgorau pwnc. Gan ei bod yn cyfeirio'n benodol at bwyllgorau pwnc, derbyniam, yn dechnegol, ei bod yn iawn ac yn briodol i'r gwelliannau gael eu cyflwyno. Fodd bynnag, credaf fod y gwelliannau hyn yn mynd yn groes i ysbryd y Rheol Sefydlog honno. Diwygiwyd y Rheol Sefydlog honno er mwyn amddiffyn adroddiad y Pwyllgor ar y Papur Gwyn 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru', a rhaid imi ofyn, 'Beth fydd nesaf? Ai'r Pwyllgor Safonau Ymddygiad, ynteu'r Pwyllgor Archwilio?'. Ysgrifennaf at y Llywydd yn awr i awgrymu bod y Rheol Sefydlog honno'n cael ei diwygio'n barhaol.

Yr wyf yn bryderus iawn ynglŷn â'r gwelliant sy'n gresynu nad yw materion sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb wedi'u cynnwys ym mlaenraglenni gwaith pob pwyllgor pwnc.

Peter Black *a gododd*—

Gwenda Thomas: Nid wyf yn ildio eto; yr wyf wedi rhoi fy esboniad ichi yn barod.

Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at baragraff 20 yn adroddiad y pwyllgor, sy'n gwneud yr union bwynt hwn. Yr wyf yn atgoffa'r Aelodau bod argymhelliad 26 yn adroddiad y pwyllgor ar brif ffrydio yn delio â'r pwnc hwn. Mae'n argymhell y dylai pwyllgorau eraill y Cynulliad gyflwyno eu blaenraglenni gwaith i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, a fyddai wedyn yn ystyried a yw'r blaenraglenni gwaith yn rhoi sylw priodol i gydraddoldeb ac yn cyflwyno sylwadau fel y bo'n briodol.

Yng Ngorffennaf 2004 y cyhoeddwyd yr adroddiad ar brif ffrydio, felly dim ond dwy neu dair wythnos a gafodd y pwyllgorau pwnc yn fwyaf arbennig i addasu i'r gofyniad newydd hwn. Nid yw'n syndod felly nad oedd eu hymdrechion cyntaf cystal â'r disgwyl. Wrth ymateb i feirniadaeth y pwyllgor ar eu hymdrechion, dylid llongyfarch Cadeiryddion y pwyllgorau am fod yn flaengar wrth ofyn am ganllawiau ynglŷn â sut y gellid gwella eu perfformiad. Aethant i sesiynau briffio yn ystod y flwyddyn gyda gwahoddedigion sefydlog y

and the report on progress made in this respect will be included in next year's report. In the light of this information, I ask Kirsty to withdraw amendment 2.

The other amendments are beyond my remit. They relate to issues for which responsibility lies either with the Minister, the Permanent Secretary or the Clerk to the Assembly. I will, therefore, leave it to the Minister and the House Committee to respond to those issues.

During the year, the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, through its Gypsy and Travellers working group, continued to monitor the implementations of the previous committee's report on Gypsies and Travellers. The working group met three times, and the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning and the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside appeared before the committee to discuss progress. The committee will maintain its vigilance over this in subsequent years to ensure that the interests of this often misunderstood group continue to be near the top of our agenda.

The committee also began its policy review into service provision for disabled young people. I am particularly proud of the fact that the committee has decided to carry out this review by utilising the resources of a reference group of disabled young people to advise it. This is in line with the young people's motto, 'Nothing about us without us'. I know that it has been an education to us all to have been involved with this unique group.

The committee responded to the UK consultation on the White Paper proposals for a new Commission for Equality and Human Rights. It held discussions with the Welsh Local Government Association about its equality unit's annual report, and considered the revised National Assembly for Wales's race equality scheme before it was debated in Plenary. It also received updates on Stonewall Cymru's reports 'Counted Out' and 'Count Us In', and a presentation from the Children's Commissioner for Wales on his annual report for 2003.

Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, a bydd yr adroddiad ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd yn cael ei gynnwys yn adroddiad y flwyddyn nesaf. Yng ngoleuni'r wybodaeth hon, gofynnaf i Kirsty dynnu gwelliant 2 yn ôl.

Mae'r gwelliannau eraill y tu hwnt i'm cylch gwaith i. Maent yn ymwneud â materion y mae'r Gweinidog, yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol neu Glerc y Cynulliad yn gyfrifol amdanynt. Byddaf, felly, yn gadael i'r Gweinidog a Phwyllgor y Tŷ ymateb i'r materion hynny.

Yn ystod y flwyddyn, parhaodd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, drwy ei weithgor Sipsiwn a Theithwyr, i fonitro sut y gweithredir adroddiad y pwyllgor blaenorol ar Sipsiwn a Theithwyr. Cyfarfu'r gweithgor deirgwaith, ac ymddangosodd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes a'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad gerbron y pwyllgor i drafod y cynnydd a wnaed. Bydd y pwyllgor yn dal i gadw golwg ar hyn yn ystod y blynyddoedd sydd i ddod er mwyn sicrhau bod buddiannau'r grŵp hwn, sy'n cael ei gamddeall yn aml, yn parhau'n agos at y brig ar ein hagenda.

Dechreuodd y pwyllgor hefyd ar ei adolygiad polisi o wasanaethau a ddarperir i bobl ifanc anabl. Yr wyf yn hynod falch o'r ffaith bod y pwyllgor wedi penderfynu gwneud yr adolygiad hwn gan ddefnyddio adnoddau a derbyn cyngor gan grŵp cyfeirio sy'n cynnwys pobl ifanc anabl. Mae hyn yn cydfynd ag arwyddair y bobl ifanc, 'Dim byd amdanom ni hebom ni'. Gwn fod pob un ohonom wedi dysgu llawer iawn drwy ymwneud â'r grŵp unigryw hwn.

Ymatebodd y pwyllgor i ymgynghoriad y DU ar gynigion y Papur Gwyn ar gyfer Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol newydd. Cynhaliodd drafodaethau gyda Chymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru ynglŷn ag adroddiad blynyddol ei huned gydraddoldeb, a bu'n ystyried cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol diwygiedig Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru cyn cynnal dadl arno yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Cafodd y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf hefyd am adroddiadau Stonewall Cymru 'Eich Cyfrif neu'ch Eithrio' a 'Ninnau Hefyd', ynghyd â chyflwyniad gan Gomisiynydd Plant Cymru ar ei adroddiad blynyddol ar gyfer 2003.

In February 2005, a significant change to Standing Orders was agreed to allow primary legislation to be formally remitted to relevant committees, not just subject committees. As a result, the Committee on Equality of Opportunity was able to scrutinise the Disability Discrimination Bill and lay a report before the Assembly.

In terms of our future work, we have identified a number of key issues to focus on. These include access to services for disabled young people, the implementation of the responses to the mainstreaming equality report, follow-up work on the review of service provision for Gypsies and Travellers, implementation of the Assembly's race equality scheme, scrutiny of equality-related legislation and the Welsh dimension of the proposed Commission for Equality and Human Rights, as well as holding Ministers to account.

In considering the annual report of the Welsh Assembly Government, the committee welcomed the fuller account that has been provided for 2004-05, setting out divisional objectives aimed at promoting equality, reporting outcomes and identifying strand-specific activities. The committee hopes that future reports will demonstrate positive equality outcomes rather than simply report outputs.

4.10 p.m.

As a further positive step towards mainstreaming equality, the Panel of Chairs recently agreed to the committee's request that subject committees scrutinise the parts of the report that relate to ministerial portfolios. This should assist the future scrutiny process. In the meantime, I commend this report to you and hope that we will have an interesting debate on it and on the wider equality of opportunity issues. The Business Minister and I will respond jointly to the debate. I will pick up points relating to the work of the committee and the Minister will respond to

Yn Chwefror 2005, cytunwyd ar newid sylweddol i'r Rheolau Sefydlog er mwyn caniatáu i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol gael ei chyfeirio'n ffurfiol at bwyllgorau perthnasol, ac nid at bwyllgorau pwnc yn unig. O ganlyniad, yr oedd modd i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal graffu ar y Mesur Gwahaniaethu ar sail Anabledd a rhoi adroddiad gerbron y Cynulliad.

O ran ein gwaith ar gyfer y dyfodol, yr ydym wedi nodi nifer o faterion allweddol i ganolbwyntio arnynt. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys mynediad at wasanaethau i bobl ifanc anabl, gweithredu'r ymatebion i'r adroddiad ar brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, gwaith dilynol ar yr adolygiad o wasanaethau a ddarperir i Sipsiwn a Theithwyr, gweithredu cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol y Cynulliad, craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb a dimensiwn Cymreig y Comisiwn Cydraddoldeb a Hawliau Dynol arfaethedig, yn ogystal â sicrhau bod Gweinidogion yn gyfrifol am eu gweithredoedd.

Wrth ystyried adroddiad blynyddol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, croesawodd y pwyllgor yr adroddiad llawnach a ddarparwyd ar gyfer 2004-05, sy'n pennu amcanion ar gyfer is-adrannau gyda'r bwriad o hybu cydraddoldeb, adrodd am ganlyniadau a nodi gweithgareddau sy'n ymwneud â meysydd penodol. Mae'r pwyllgor yn gobeithio y bydd adroddiadau yn y dyfodol yn dangos canlyniadau cadarnhaol o safbwynt cydraddoldeb yn hytrach na dim ond adrodd am allbynnau.

Fel cam cadarnhaol arall tuag at brif ffrydio cydraddoldeb, cytunodd Panel y Cadeiryddion yn ddiweddar i ganiatáu cais y pwyllgor y dylai pwyllgorau pwnc graffu ar y rhannau o'r adroddiad sy'n ymwneud â phortffolios gweinidogion. Dylai hyn fod o gymorth i'r broses graffu yn y dyfodol. Yn y cyfamser, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad hwn i chi gan obeithio y cawn ddadl ddiddorol arno ac ar faterion cyfle cyfartal yn gyffredinol. Bydd y Trefnydd a minnau'n ymateb ar y cyd i'r ddadl. Byddaf fi'n ymdrin â'r pwyntiau sy'n ymwneud â gwaith y

issues raised about the work of the Assembly Government. I have not been informed of how it is proposed to deal with the amendments relating to the work of the Assembly Parliamentary Service.

Jenny Randerson: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the Welsh Assembly Government and Assembly Parliamentary Service, in advertising job vacancies, must take further and urgent action to ensure that the widest and most diverse group of people are reached.

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets the absence of equality issues in the forward work programme of each subject committee.

I would like to preface my remarks by saying that I believe that both the Minister and the Chair of the committee are doing an extremely good job on equality issues in Wales. I know that they work very hard. I would particularly like to congratulate Gwenda on the work that she did to raise equality issues to a higher position on the UK Government's agenda as regards securing a more prominent place for equality issues from our perspective in the Better Governance for Wales Bill than was the case with the White Paper.

I am sorry that the Chair is concerned that we have tabled amendments. I would like to point out that this is not a committee report in the true sense, because it is a hybrid report; it is a joint Welsh Assembly Government and Assembly Parliamentary Service report. I believe that these amendments are a sign that we are taking equal opportunities issues seriously. It would be easy for us all to stand up, give ourselves a pat on the back and pretend that everything is going swimmingly. We know that that is not necessarily the case, although we are making progress. It is understandable that there are amendments, because we have been in existence for nearly seven years, and some of us begin to get

pwyllgor a bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb i faterion a godir ynglŷn â gwaith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nid wyf wedi cael gwybod sut y bwriedir delio â'r gwelliannau sy'n ymwneud â gwaith Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigïaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod rhaid i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, wrth hysbysebu swyddi gwag, gymryd camau pellach ar frys i sicrhau eu bod yn cyrraedd y grŵp ehangaf a mwyaf amrywiol o bobl.

Cynigïaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu nad yw materion sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb wedi'u cynnwys ym mlaenraglen waith pob pwyllgor pwnc.

Cyn dechrau ar fy sylwadau, hoffwn ddweud fy mod yn credu bod y Gweinidog a Chadeirydd y pwyllgor yn gwneud gwaith arbennig o dda o safbwynt materion cydraddoldeb yng Nghymru. Gwn eu bod yn gweithio'n galed iawn. Hoffwn yn arbennig longyfarch Gwenda ar y gwaith y mae wedi ei wneud i godi materion cydraddoldeb i safle uwch ar agenda Llywodraeth y DU o ran sicrhau lle amlycach i faterion cydraddoldeb o'n safbwynt ni yn y Mesur Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru nag a welwyd yn y Papur Gwyn.

Mae'n flin gennyf fod y Cadeirydd yn siomedig ein bod wedi cyflwyno gwelliannau. Hoffwn nodi nad adroddiad pwyllgor yw hwn yng ngwir ystyr y term, oherwydd adroddiad hybrid ydyw; mae'n adroddiad ar y cyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Credaf fod y gwelliannau hyn yn arwydd ein bod yn cymryd materion cyfle cyfartal o ddifrif. Byddai'n hawdd inni i gyd godi ar ein traed, curo cefnau'n gilydd a chymryd arnom fod popeth yn iawn. Gwyddom nad yw hynny'n wir o reidrwydd, er ein bod yn gwneud cynnydd. Mae'n ddealladwy bod gwelliannau, oherwydd yr ydym wedi bod mewn bodolaeth ers bron

impatient that progress in some simple, basic areas is so slow. That said, the Government's report this year was much better than last year's and had a more even approach across departments.

On the amendments, I would first like to refer to the issue of advertising for posts. I know that Huw Lewis shares my concerns—and I am sorry that he is not here—about the way in which posts for this organisation are advertised. If you advertise in the *Western Mail*, you get the usual suspects. If you advertise in the *South Wales Echo*—and I take this from a Cardiff perspective—you get a totally different type of readership. I know that Lorraine agrees with me, and I can see her nodding. Only a tiny proportion of jobs for this organisation have been advertised in the *South Wales Echo*, as the *Western Mail* takes the lion's share. I have asked about this time and again, and there has been no change. Therefore, I was frustrated enough to ensure that the Welsh Liberal Democrats tabled this amendment. We have to appeal to those people who would not naturally think of applying for a job in this organisation. The web-based advertisements are a good idea, but they do not reach those who are not looking for a job; they only reach those who are looking on the web for jobs. Furthermore, we continue to have real problems with our website.

I welcome the clearer format for advertisements, but progress is still slow. Despite the circulation of job advertisements to minority ethnic organisations, there has been no improvement in take-up. I would like to emphasise that this is because the vast majority of the minority ethnic population do not have contact with specific organisations; they are part of the mainstream of society, rather than being in contact with specific representative organisations.

I am sorry, but we will not withdraw amendment 2. The Committee on Equality of Opportunity has looked carefully at the work

saith mlynedd, ac mae rhai ohonom yn dechrau colli amynedd wrth weld mor araf yw'r cynnydd mewn rhai meysydd elfennol, syml. Wedi dweud hynny, yr oedd adroddiad y Llywodraeth eleni yn llawer gwell nag un y llynedd ac yn delio'n fwy cyson â'r gwahanol adrannau.

O ran y gwelliannau, hoffwn gyfeirio yn gyntaf at y cwestiwn yn ymwneud â hysbysebu swyddi. Gwn fod yr un pryderon gan Huw Lewis—a gresyn na fyddai yma—ynglŷn â'r ffordd yr hysbysebwr swyddi ar gyfer y sefydliad hwn. Os ydych yn hysbysebu yn y *Western Mail*, cewch y math arferol o ddarllenwyr. Os ydych yn hysbysebu yn y *South Wales Echo*—ac yr wyf yn edrych ar hyn o safbwynt Caerdydd—cewch fath hollol wahanol o ddarllenwyr. Gwn fod Lorraine yn cytuno â mi, a gallaf ei gweld yn nodio'i phen. Dim ond cyfran fach o swyddi ar gyfer y sefydliad hwn sydd wedi cael eu hysbysebu yn y *South Wales Echo*, gan fod y rhan fwyaf yn mynd i'r *Western Mail*. Yr wyf wedi holi ynglŷn â hyn dro ar ôl tro, a heb weld dim newid. Felly, yr oeddwn yn teimlo'n ddigon rhwystredig i sicrhau bod Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cyflwyno'r gwelliant hwn. Rhaid inni apelio at y bobl hynny na fyddent yn meddwl yn naturiol am ymgeisio am swydd yn y sefydliad hwn. Mae'r hysbysebion ar y we yn syniad da, ond nid ydynt yn cyrraedd y rhai nad ydynt yn chwilio am waith; yr unig rai y maent yn eu cyrraedd yw'r rhai sydd yn chwilio am swyddi ar y we. Ar ben hynny, mae gennym broblemau mawr â'n gwefan o hyd.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r fformat cliriach ar gyfer hysbysebion, ond mae'r cynnydd yn araf o hyd. Er bod hysbysebion swyddi'n cael eu cylchredeg i sefydliadau lleiafrifoedd ethnig, ni welwyd cynnydd yn nifer yr ymgeiswyr. Hoffwn bwysleisio mai'r rheswm am hyn yw nad yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sy'n byw mewn cymunedau lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn dod i gysylltiad â sefydliadau penodol; maent yn rhan o brif ffrwd y gymdeithas, ac nid ydynt yn dod i gysylltiad â sefydliadau cynrychioladol penodol.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond nid ydym am dynnu gwelliant 2 yn ôl. Mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal wedi edrych yn ofalus ar

programme of committees, and, for some committees, it is difficult to see an overt reference to equality. I will quote Lorraine Barrett's comment when the committee discussed this on 24 November 2005.

'I do not think that we scrutinise our Ministers that much on the equality aspect of their portfolios.'

I also quote the Minister's reply.

'Therefore, we need to put it onto committee agendas, which is key, although it is not for me to say.'

Some committees are better at it than others. I believe that the Panel of Chairs is discussing this soon, which I welcome.

Like all cross-cutting issues—the Welsh language is one and sustainability is another—real progress will only be made when all Ministers and committees feel ownership, rather than paying lip service.

I am sorry if we have ruffled some feathers by tabling these amendments. I think that amendments on this topic are a symptom and a sign that our parties are taking equality issues seriously, which occasionally involves a challenge to the Government and, indeed, to the Assembly Parliamentary Service.

Mark Isherwood: I propose the following amendments in the name of Lisa Francis.

Amendment 3: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that further progress is required in transforming the Assembly's equality annual report into a living document focused on action planning.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that further action is required to

raglen waith pwyllgorau, ac, mewn rhai pwyllgorau mae'n anodd gweld cyfeiriad amlwg at gydraddoldeb. Yr wyf am ddyfynnu'r hyn a ddywedodd Lorraine Barrett pan drafododd y pwyllgor hyn ar 24 Tachwedd 2005.

Ni chredaf inni graffu rhyw lawer ar yr hyn y mae ein Gweinidogion yn ei wneud o ran yr agwedd ar eu portffolio sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb.

Dyfyddaf ateb y Gweinidog hefyd.

Felly, mae angen ei roi ar agendâu'r pwyllgorau, canys dyna'r allwedd, er nad fy lle i yw dweud.

Mae rhai pwyllgorau'n cael gwell hwyl ar hyn na'i gilydd. Credaf y bydd Panel y Cadeiryddion yn trafod hyn cyn hir, ac yr wyf yn falch o hynny.

Fel sy'n wir am bob pwnc trawsbynciol—megis yr iaith Gymraeg a chynaliadwyedd—ni wnawn gynnydd gwirioneddol oni fydd pob Gweinidog a phob pwyllgor yn teimlo bod ganddynt berchenogaeth dros hyn, yn hytrach na chymryd arnynt eu bod yn rhoi sylw i'r mater.

Mae'n ddrwg gennyf os ydym wedi tarfu ar rai drwy gynnig y gwelliannau hyn. Credaf fod gwelliannau ar y pwnc hwn yn symptom ac yn arwydd bod ein pleidiau'n cymryd materion sy'n ymwneud â chydaddoldeb o ddifrif, sydd weithiau'n golygu herio'r Llywodraeth ac, yn wir, herio Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad.

Mark Isherwood: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Lisa Francis.

Gwelliant 3: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod angen rhagor o gynnydd o ran troi adroddiad cydraddoldeb blynyddol y Cynulliad yn ddogfen fyw sy'n canolbwyntio ar gynllunio gweithredu.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi bod angen camau pellach er mwyn

address barriers to staff recruitment and development.

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that further action will be required to promote equality of opportunity in the new public service departments created by the merger with the ASPBs.

In acknowledging the sixth equality annual report and seeking to drive the equality agenda forwards in the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government, I rise to move these amendments in the name of Lisa Francis. We will also support amendments 1 and 2 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I regret Gwenda's comments, because I also commend her as Chair of this committee. No criticism is implied of you, Gwenda, your clerks or any other members of the committee in this respect. These amendments arose directly out of the scrutiny of non-committee members in relation to this report in committee, and I think that they fairly reflect concerns raised cross-party in committee on that occasion.

When we reviewed this report in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, I noted that we had moved from famine to feast in terms of information. To an extent, this was a fairly defensive report in that it went through the Assembly's activities over a 12-month period and appeared to record anything that fitted to an objective rather than providing a plan that worked from the first column to the last—what, when by, action taken, and outcomes—using measurable, achievable, realistic and timed action points.

Such a living document focused on action planning should not be feared as a mechanism to criticise, but rather welcomed as a mechanism to identify what works well and what we can do differently to improve matters in the future, by following a plan that can be accessed and understood by everyone—hence amendment 3.

rhoi sylw i'r rhwystrau ym maes recriwtio a datblygu staff.

Cynigiau welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi y bydd angen camau pellach i hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal yn yr adrannau gwasanaethau cyhoeddus newydd a grëir drwy uno gyda'r CCNC.

Wrth gydnabod y chweched adroddiad blynyddol ar gydraddoldeb a cheisio hybu agenda cydraddoldeb yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, codaf i gynnig y gwelliannau hyn yn enw Lisa Francis. Cefnogwn hefyd welliannau 1 a 2 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Yr wyf yn gresynu at sylwadau Gwenda, gan fy mod innau hefyd yn ei chymeradwyo fel Cadeirydd y pwyllgor hwn. Nid oes argoel o feirniadaeth amoch, Gwenda, na'ch clerod na dim un aelod arall o'r pwyllgor yn hyn o beth. Cododd y gwelliannau hyn yn uniongyrchol yn sgîl craffu gan aelodau nad ydynt ar y pwyllgor o ran yr adroddiad hwn yn y pwyllgor, a chredaf eu bod yn unol â'r pryderon trawsbleidiol a godwyd yn y pwyllgor y pryd hwnnw.

Pan fu inni adolygu'r adroddiad hwn yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, nodais ein bod wedi symud o brinder o wybodaeth i ddigonedd ohoni. I raddau, yr oedd hwn yn adroddiad eithaf amddiffynnol gan ei fod wedi mynd drwy weithgareddau'r Cynulliad dros gyfnod o 12 mis gan ymddangos fel petai'n cofnodi popeth a oedd yn cyd-fynd ag amcan yn hytrach na chynnig cynllun a weithiai o'r golofn gyntaf hyd yr olaf—beth, erbyn pryd, pa gamau a gymerwyd, a'r canlyniadau—gan ddefnyddio pwyntiau gweithredu mesuradwy, cyraeddadwy, realistig wedi eu hamseru.

Ni ddylid ofni'r fath ddogfen fyw sy'n canolbwyntio ar gynllunio gweithredu fel mecanwaith i feirniadu, yn hytrach dylid ei chrosawu fel mecanwaith i ganfod beth sy'n gweithio'n dda a beth y gallwn ei wneud yn wahanol i wella pethau at y dyfodol, drwy ddilyn cynllun y gall pawb ei weld a'i ddeall—dyna'r rheswm dros welliant 3.

In committee, I also noted Sir Jon Shortridge's comments that recruitment had not improved with regard to targeted populations in the last period despite training in performance management. Are we therefore still failing to identify the barriers to access? How are we trying to overcome these barriers in terms of the format of interviews, including interview technique and the interview environment? Why is it that the people whom we want to apply are still not applying? That is a question that ties in with the advertising of job vacancies, a matter referred to by Jenny earlier in this debate.

Sir Jon Shortridge stated that some progress had been made on advertising, but he acknowledged that this was not as much progress as the committee would like. He referred to some research that had been undertaken, looking at perceptions of the Assembly and the Welsh Assembly Government as employers, and stated that it contained some pretty hard messages to which we will have to respond. We look forward to his sharing these with us in the future.

He also stated that further research would be carried out as to the most appropriate way of advertising our jobs in order to secure the equality ambition while also taking account of value for money. He added that we need some evidence base so that we can respond properly, and so we also look forward to his sharing that with us in future. It is for all of these reasons that amendment 4 notes the need for further action to address barriers to staff recruitment and development.

In committee, I also highlighted a reference made to an expected change over the next six months because of the merger with the Assembly sponsored public bodies, noting that this presumably reflected the current make-up of their employees. In response, Sir Jon clarified his concern that, certainly at the more senior ends of the public bodies, they are even more disproportionately dominated by white males than the Assembly, and that that will affect the gender and black minority

Yn y pwyllgor, nodais hefyd sylwadau Syr Jon Shortridge i'r perwyl nad oedd recriwtio wedi gwella o ran y poblogaethau a dargedir yn ystod y cyfnod diwethaf er gwaethaf yr hyfforddiant a roddwyd mewn rheoli perfformiad. A ydym felly'n dal i fethu â chanfod beth yw'r rhwystrau sy'n atal mynediad? Sut yr ydym yn ceisio goresgyn y rhwystrau hyn o ran fformat cyfweliadau, gan gynnwys techneg cyfweliadau ac amgylchedd cyfweliadau? Pam nad yw'r bobl yr ydym am iddynt ymgeisio'n ymgeisio? Mae a wnelo'r cwestiwn hwnnw â hysbysebu swyddi gwag, mater y cyfeiriodd Jenny ato yn gynharach yn y ddadl hon.

Dywedodd Syr Jon Shortridge fod peth cynnydd wedi digwydd o ran hysbysebu, ond cydnabyddai na lwyddwyd i sicrhau'r cynnydd yr hoffai'r pwyllgor ei weld. Cyfeiriodd at ryw ymchwil a wnaethpwyd, a edrychai ar ganfyddiadau o'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fel cyflogwyr, a dywedodd fod ynddi negeseuon eithaf dyrus y bydd yn rhaid inni ymateb iddynt. Edrychwn ymlaen at ei glywed yn rhannu'r rhain gyda ni yn y dyfodol.

Dywedodd hefyd y byddid yn gwneud rhagor o ymchwil ynghylch y dull mwyaf addas o hysbysebu ein swyddi er mwyn ceisio sicrhau cydraddoldeb gan gadw gwerth am arian mewn cof hefyd. Ychwanegodd fod angen rhyw sylfaen o dystiolaeth arnom er mwyn inni allu ymateb yn briodol, ac felly edrychwn ymlaen hefyd at ei glywed yn rhannu hynny gyda ni yn y dyfodol. Am y rhesymau hyn oll y mae gwelliant 4 yn nodi'r angen am ragor o weithredu i roi sylw i'r rhwystrau ym maes recriwtio a datblygu staff.

Yn y pwyllgor, tynnais sylw hefyd at gyfeiriad a wnaethpwyd at newid a ddisgwylir yn ystod y chwe mis nesaf oherwydd yr uno â'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, gan nodi bod hyn, fe gymerir, yn adlewyrchu cyfansoddiad cyfredol eu gweithwyr. Wrth ateb, eglurodd Syr Jon ei bryder, yn sicr yn haenau uchaf y cyrff cyhoeddus, fod dynion gwyn yn trarglwyddiaethu mewn modd mwy anghymesur hyd yn oed na'r hyn a welir yn y

ethnic balance at the top of the Welsh Assembly Government when these public bodies come in-house. He added that we will have to do more and better to address that legacy when we get it—hence amendment 5 noting that further action will be required accordingly.

Cynulliad, ac yr effeithiant ar y cydbwysedd o ran rhyw a phobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn yr uwch swyddi yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru pan ddaw'r cyrff cyhoeddus hyn yn rhan ohoni. Ychwanegodd y bydd yn rhaid inni wneud mwy a gwneud yn well o ran rhoi sylw i'r broblem honno pan ddaw i'n rhan—dyna'r rheswm dros welliant 5 sy'n nodi y bydd angen rhagor o weithredu fel y bo'n briodol.

4.20 p.m.

We must integrate a respect for equality of opportunity that includes equality from the outset in policy making and service delivery, where equality informs all aspects of the work of every individual in an organisation, and success is measured by evaluating the reduction in inequality. However, to tackle the causes of inequality, we must also embrace a positive action development programme based on equality of opportunity for a diverse range of staff, reflecting the diversity of the population that they serve.

Mae'n rhaid inni integreiddio parch at gyfle cyfartal sy'n cynnwys cydraddoldeb o'r dechrau un wrth lunio polisiau a darparu gwasanaethau, fel bod cydraddoldeb yn sylfaen i bob agwedd ar waith pob unigolyn mewn sefydliad, a bod llwyddiant yn cael ei fesur drwy gloriannu'r gostyngiad mewn anghydraddoldeb. Fodd bynnag, er mwyn mynd i'r afael ag achosion anghydraddoldeb, mae'n rhaid inni hefyd gofleidio rhaglen o ddatblygu gweithredu cadarnhaol sydd wedi ei seilio ar gyfle cyfartal i amrywiaeth o staff, gan adlewyrchu amrywiaeth y boblogaeth y maent yn ei gwasanaethu.

Training students, staff, the trainers, and those responsible for managing the implementation of the equality agenda is necessary, but not sufficient without a parallel positive action development programme. That should include recognition, responsibility and practices such as work sharing, job shadowing, and sharing best practice as components of personal development programmes within a continuous development framework.

Mae angen hyfforddi myfyrwyr, y staff, yr hyfforddwyr a'r rhai sy'n gyfrifol am reoli'r modd y gweithredir agenda cydraddoldeb, ond nid yw hyn yn ddigon heb raglen i ddatblygu gweithredu cadarnhaol yr un pryd. Dylai honno gynnwys cydnabyddiaeth, cyfrifoldeb ac arferion megis rhannu gwaith, cysgodi swyddi a rhannu'r arferion gorau fel elfennau o raglenni datblygu personol mewn fframwaith o ddatblygu parhaus.

Direct discrimination can occur in recruitment where a candidate from an underrepresented background did not get a job despite being as qualified as, or better qualified than, the successful candidate. As David Cameron stated yesterday,

Gall gwahaniaethu uniongyrchol ddigwydd wrth recriwtio pan fydd ymgeisydd o gefndir sydd heb gynrychiolaeth ddigonol yn methu â chael swydd er bod gan yr ymgeisydd gymwysterau cystal neu well na'r ymgeisydd llwyddiannus. Ys dywedodd David Cameron ddoe,

'We believe that people with disabilities should have the same opportunities to reach their full potential as everyone else. We believe that people with disabilities should be valued for what they can contribute rather than being judged by what they cannot'.

Credwn y dylai pobl sydd ag anableddau gael yr un cyfleoedd i gyflawni eu potensial llawn â phawb arall. Credwn y dylai pobl sydd ag anableddau gael eu parchu am yr hyn y gallant ei gyfrannu yn hytrach na chael eu barnu yn ôl yr hyn na allant ei gyfrannu.

The same must apply to people from all backgrounds and all equality strands.

Lorraine Barrett: Wearing my House Committee hat for a moment, I want to say that I have spoken to the Chair, who has assured me that any issues arising from today's debate will be placed on the agenda of the next committee meeting. Having said that, and as Jenny Randerson alluded to, we have discussed job advertising on many occasions in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, and have come up with quite a few suggestions as to how to reach the parts that the *Western Mail* cannot or does not reach. Therefore, if Members have any further specific suggestions, they should e-mail them to the House Committee clerk ready for the next meeting, and they will then be considered as an agenda item.

Putting my Committee on Equality of Opportunity hat back on, I welcome the opportunity to speak today. I believe that Helen Mary Jones and I are the longest serving members on that committee, and I think that it is one of our favourite committees. While I am glad to see that this report shows significant progress, I think that we would all agree that several issues still need to be addressed.

The first is ensuring that the widest and most diverse groups of people are reached. The outreach work that the Assembly has done in terms of targeting the black minority ethnic community in Cardiff, particularly, is welcome. However, Huw Lewis often makes a point regarding the make-up of staff in this building. He is right that people from the black minority ethnic community are often represented in catering or cleansing employment, but we rarely see them accessing the fifth floor, or in senior civil servant positions. We have to ask ourselves why.

On Thursday, I will launch a project designed to support and help integrate the Somali community in Wales. The Somali community has existed in south Wales for more than 100 years. Over the years, family ties and years of civil war in Somalia have led to new arrivals, and the Welsh Somali community is now

Dylai'r un peth fod yn wir am bobl o bob cefndir a phob agwedd ar gydraddoldeb.

Lorraine Barrett: Wrth wisgo fy het Pwyllgor y Tŷ am ennyd, yr wyf am ddweud imi siarad gyda'r Cadeirydd, sydd wedi fy sicrhau y rhoddir unrhyw faterion a gyfyd o'r ddadl heddiw ar agenda cyfarfod y pwyllgor nesaf. Wedi dweud hynny, ac fel y soniodd Jenny Randerson, yr ydym wedi trafod hysbysebu swyddi lawer gwaith yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, gan lunio nifer o awgrymiadau ynglŷn â sut y mae cyrraedd y bobl hynny nad yw'r *Western Mail* yn gallu eu cyrraedd neu nad yw'n eu cyrraedd. Felly, os oes gan yr Aelodau unrhyw awgrymiadau penodol eraill, dylent eu he-bostio at glerc Pwyllgor y Tŷ ar gyfer y cyfarfod nesaf, ac fe'u hystyrir fel eitem ar gyfer yr agenda.

Gan wisgo het y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal unwaith yn rhagor, yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i siarad heddiw. Credaf mai Helen Mary Jones a minnau yw'r aelodau sydd wedi gwasanaethu hwyaf ar y pwyllgor hwnnw, a chredaf ei fod yn un o'n hoff bwyllgorau. Er fy mod yn falch o weld bod yr adroddiad hwn yn dangos cynnydd sylweddol, credaf y byddem oll yn cytuno bod angen rhoi sylw i nifer o faterion o hyd.

Y cyntaf yw sicrhau ein bod yn cyrraedd y grwpiau mwyaf eang ac amrywiol o bobl. Mae'r gwaith y mae'r Cynulliad wedi ei wneud i estyn allan a thargedu cymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig Caerdydd, yn benodol, yn glodwiw. Fodd bynnag, bydd Huw Lewis yn aml yn gwneud pwynt ynghylch cyfansoddiad staff yr adeilad hwn. Mae'n iawn wrth ddweud bod pobl o'r gymuned pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn aml mewn swyddi arlwygo neu lanhau, ond pur anaml y gwelwn hwy'n cyrraedd y pumed llawr, neu mewn uwch swyddi yn y gwasanaeth sifil. Mae'n rhaid inni ofyn i ni ein hunain pam y mae hynny'n bod.

Ddydd Iau, byddaf yn lansio prosiect sydd â'r nod o roi cymorth i'r gymuned Somali yng Nghymru a'u helpu i integreiddio. Mae'r gymuned Somali yn ne Cymru ers dros 100 mlynedd. Dros y blynnyddoedd, oherwydd cysylltiadau teuluol a rhyfel cartref yn Somalia mae newydd-ddyfodiaid wedi

around 7,000-strong. Survey after survey shows that that community still feels isolated. A recent survey of the Somali community in Newport showed major political apathy—55 per cent of those questioned, and who were eligible to vote, had never taken part in voting. Why should we be surprised when we see so few members of the Somali community employed here in this building or in Cathays park, for instance? With no role models, how can we expect that community to apply for the jobs in the first place, or even to access political parties? It is a lesson that we all need to learn.

That leads me to my second point on accessing information, and about opportunities in the National Assembly for Wales. Another issue that is constantly raised in committee is the advertising of jobs for the Welsh Assembly Government or the Assembly Parliamentary Service. This point has been raised by other Members. However, we must ask ourselves why we continue to spend tens of thousands of pounds advertising in that one paper which Jenny Randerson mentioned. Despite its self-proclaimed status as the national paper of Wales, it simply does not reach all parts of Wales for all sorts of reasons. It certainly does not reach the black minority ethnic communities in my constituency. How much are we spending on advertising?

Jonathan Morgan: Thank you for giving way. I completely agree that the way in which we advertise jobs in Wales does not reach all parts of Wales, and that, sadly, we do not have a newspaper network that can live up to that title of being a national newspaper. I understand that the *Western Mail* has a circulation of somewhere in the region of 40,000 copies, read, I suspect, mostly by people like us.

Lorraine Barrett: I occasionally read the *Western Mail*, but I take your point, Jonathan.

I want to know how much is spent on advertising jobs in the *Western Mail*—I think that we have had some figures in reports to

cyrraedd yma, a bellach mae tua 7,000 o bobl yn perthyn i gymuned Somali Cymru. Mae pob arolwg yn dangos bod y gymuned yn dal i deimlo'n ynysig. Dangosodd arolwg diweddar o'r gymuned Somali yng Nghasnewydd fod difaterwch gwleidyddol mawr—nid oedd 55 y cant o'r rhai a holwyd, ac a oedd yn gymwys i bleidleisio, erioed wedi pleidleisio. Pa syndod, felly, o weld cyn lleied o aelodau o'r gymuned Somali'n gweithio yma yn yr adeilad hwn neu ym mharc Cathays, er enghraifft? Heb fodelau rôl, sut y gallwn ddisgwyl i'r gymuned honno ymgeisio am y swyddi yn y lle cyntaf, neu hyd yn oed ddilyn pleidiau gwleidyddol? Mae hynny'n wers y mae gofyn i bawb ohonom ei dysgu.

Mae hynny'n arwain at yr ail bwynt sydd gennyf ynglŷn â chael gwybodaeth, ac ynglŷn â chyfleoedd yng Nghynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mater arall a godir yn fynych yn y pwyllgor yw hysbysebu swyddi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru neu Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Mae Aelodau eraill wedi codi'r pwynt hwn. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid gofyn pam yr ydym yn dal i wario degau o filoedd o bunnoedd yn hysbysebu yn yr un papur hwnnw y cyfeiriodd Jenny Randerson ato. Er ei fod yn honni bod iddo statws fel papur cenedlaethol Cymru, nid yw'n cyrraedd pob rhan o Gymru am nifer o resymau. Yn sicr ddigon nid yw'n cyrraedd cymunedau'r bobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig yn fy etholaeth i. Faint yr ydym yn ei wario ar hysbysebu?

Jonathan Morgan: Diolch i chi am ildio. Cytunaf yn llwyr nad yw'r modd yr ydym yn hysbysebu swyddi yng Nghymru'n cyrraedd pob rhan o Gymru, a'r tristwch yw nad oes gennym rwydwaith papurau newydd sy'n haeddu'r teitl papur cenedlaethol. Deallaf mai tua 40,000 o gopïau yw cylchrediad y *Western Mail*, a thylbiaf mai pobl fel ni sy'n ei ddarllen gan mwyaf.

Lorraine Barrett: Byddaf yn darllen y *Western Mail* weithiau, ond yr wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt, Jonathan.

Hoffwn wybod faint sy'n cael ei wario ar hysbysebu swyddi yn y *Western Mail*—credaf inni gael rhai ffigurau mewn

the Committee on Equality of Opportunity—and how many people from black minority ethnic communities have applied and been successful in gaining employment since 1999. I am willing to be proved wrong, but I suspect that very few applications have been made, particularly from my constituents.

However, one thing that continues to impress me is the way in which the National Assembly for Wales attempts to reach out to communities. I have been to some of the regional information team sessions in supermarkets and leisure centres throughout my constituency, and the staff from the Assembly Parliamentary Service, who are there to tell people about how the Assembly works, are very enthusiastic. I wonder whether it would be possible for any job applications, or opportunities for work in the Assembly, to be included in the information packs that are made available on the stands when the regional information staff go out to our various communities. I think that they go all over Wales. People would be far more willing to engage in the work of the Assembly if the outreach work was targeted specifically to illustrate what the employment opportunities might be here.

Finally, I welcome this report. We have done a lot of good work, but the main message from all of us is that there is still a lot to do.

Helen Mary Jones: I find myself in some difficulty with regard to the structure of this debate. In deference to the convention to which the Chair referred in introducing the debate, we chose not to table amendments, but I have a great deal of sympathy with the points that have been made by the Conservative Party and the Liberal Democrats about the actions that need to be taken. It seems to be that it is the hybrid nature of this report that is a problem, and I suggest that, for future years, we have a separate report on the committee's activities, a separate report on the work of APS, which could perhaps be scrutinised through the House Committee, and a separate report, with a full debate, on the Government's equality agenda, because we ought to be able to amend that.

adroddiadau i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal—a faint o bobl o gymunedau pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig sydd wedi ymgeisio a llwyddo i gael gwaith ers 1999. Yr wyf yn fodlon cael fy ngwrthbrofi ond tybiaf mai prin iawn yw'r ceisiadau, yn enwedig o du fy etholwyr i.

Fodd bynnag, un peth sy'n dal i wneud argraff arnaf yw'r modd y mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'n ceisio estyn allan at gymunedau. Bûm yn rhai o sesiynau'r tîm gwybodaeth rhanbarthol mewn archfarchnadoedd a chanolfannau hamdden yn fy etholaeth, ac mae staff Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, sydd yno i ddweud wrth bobl sut y mae'r Cynulliad yn gweithio, yn frwdfrydig iawn. Tybed a fyddai modd rhoi hysbysebion swyddi, neu gyfleoedd gwaith yn y Cynulliad, yn y pecynnau gwybodaeth sydd ar gael ar y stondinau pan fydd y staff gwybodaeth rhanbarthol yn mynd i'r gwahanol gymunedau? Credaf eu bod yn mynd i bob cwr o Gymru. Byddai pobl yn llawer mwy parod i ymwneud â gwaith y Cynulliad petai'r gwaith estyn allan wedi ei dargedu'n benodol i ddarlunio'r cyfleoedd gwaith a allai fod ar gael yma.

Yn olaf, croesawaf yr adroddiad hwn. Yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer o waith da, ond y brif neges oddi wrthym ni oll yw bod llawer o waith i'w wneud eto.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn cael rhywfaint o drafferth o ran strwythur y ddadl hon. O barch at y confensiwn y cyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd ato wrth gyflwyno'r ddadl, dewisasom beidio â chyflwyno gwelliannau, ond mae gennyf lawer iawn o gydymdeimlad â'r pwyntiau a wnaethpwyd gan y Blaid Geidwadol a'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynglŷn â'r camau y mae angen eu cymryd. Ymddengys mai natur gymysg yr adroddiad hwn yw'r broblem, ac awgrymaf, at y dyfodol, y dylem gael adroddiad ar wahân ynghylch gweithgareddau'r pwyllgor, adroddiad ar wahân ynghylch gwaith Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad, y gallai Pwyllgor y Tŷ graffu arno o bosib, ac adroddiad ar wahân, gyda dadl lawn, ar agenda cydraddoldeb y Llywodraeth, oherwydd dylem allu cynnig gwelliannau i honno.

I associate myself with the concerns that have already been raised by all other speakers, and particularly by my colleagues in opposition. It is only fair to say that the report, particularly the Government's report, has improved year on year. It has been like pulling teeth—and I am sure that Lorraine Barrett would agree with me on that, as would the Minister, frankly—but there has been real progress. However, I will make some further comments in addition to what has already been said about the nature of the Government's report.

I am still concerned to see that there are very variable responses from different departments, and we must ask how consistent the Minister's priorities are with those of each particular Minister. I suspect that I can see the attitudes and concerns of each individual Minister when I look at the quantity of information that has come from his or her department. We still need to look for consistency.

The Chair was quite right to mention the problem of measuring outputs not outcomes. After six years, I am, quite frankly, beginning to lose interest in what is being done; I want to know what difference is being made. I think that the Minister has acknowledged that in committee, so we need to look at that. It does not matter what we do unless it makes a difference. As I am sure the Minister will acknowledge, we still, for example, have a great deal of difficulty in tracing spending on equality issues in different divisions, and some do not seem to have made any effort to do so.

With regard to the Government side of the report, I want to hear from the Minister today how the Government proposes Welsh language issues to be represented in the equality agenda, and on our committee once the Welsh Language Board has been brought in-house. I hope very much that it will be represented through the offices of a strong language commissioner for Wales, but we do not yet have the Government's response to that.

Yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â'r pryderon a godwyd eisoes gan bob un o'r siaradwyr eraill, ac yn enwedig gan fy nghyd-Aelodau yn y gwrthbleidiau. Teg yw dweud bod yr adroddiad, yn enwedig adroddiad y Llywodraeth, wedi gwella o'r naill flwyddyn i'r llall. Mae wedi bod yn debyg i dynnu dannedd—ac yr wyf yn siŵr y cytunai Lorraine Barrett â mi yn hynny o beth, fel y byddai'r Gweinidog, a bod yn onest—ond cafwyd cynnydd gwirioneddol. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am gyflwyno rhagor o sylwadau yn ychwanegol at yr hyn a ddywedwyd eisoes ynglŷn â natur adroddiad y Llywodraeth.

Pryderaf o hyd o weld bod atebion amrywiol iawn gan wahanol adrannau, ac mae'n rhaid gofyn pa mor gyson yw blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog â rhai pob Gweinidog unigol. Tybiaf y gallaf weld agweddau a diddordebau pob Gweinidog unigol pan edrychaf ar faint o wybodaeth a ddaeth o'i adran ef neu ei hadran hi. Mae'n rhaid inni geisio cael cysondeb o hyd.

Yr oedd y Cadeirydd yn llygad ei lle pan soniodd am broblem mesur allbynnau yn lle canlyniadau. Wedi chwe blynedd, a bod yn onest, yr wyf yn dechrau colli diddordeb yn yr hyn sy'n cael ei wneud; hoffwn wybod pa wahaniaeth sy'n cael ei wneud. Credaf i'r Gweinidog gydnabod hynny yn y pwyllgor, felly mae angen inni edrych ar hynny. Nid yw o bwys pa beth a wnawn oni bai ei fod yn gwneud gwahaniaeth. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod, er enghraifft, ein bod yn ei chael yn anodd iawn o hyd olrhain gwariant ar faterion cydraddoldeb mewn gwahanol is-adrannau, ac ymddengys nad yw rhai wedi gwneud dim ymdrech i wneud hynny.

Ynghylch ochr y Llywodraeth i'r adroddiad, yr wyf am glywed gan y Gweinidog heddiw sut y mae'r Llywodraeth yn bwriadu ymdrin â materion sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg yn yr agenda ar gydraddoldeb, ac yn ein pwyllgor wedi i Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg ddod yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth. Yn wyf yn gobeithio'n wir y caiff ei chynrychioli drwy gyfrwng comisiynydd iaith cryf dros Gymru, ond nid yw'r Llywodraeth wedi ymateb i hynny eto.

With regard to the parliamentary side—and I take Lorraine Barrett's point about how this may be responded to at another time and in another place—I am still not sure about the extent to which equality is being mainstreamed. There have been some very positive, specific actions. There is, as has already been said, a lot to do on recruitment, and, of course, there are no presents for children in this place.

4.30 p.m.

The lack of childcare in the Assembly is becoming a national embarrassment. We are a very poor example to employers across Wales. When I speak in my region to employers about what I expect them to do to support the families that are working for them, I get a quizzical raising of the eyebrow, and a 'Well, they have got childcare in the Scottish Parliament, why haven't you?'. We need to do something about this. I felt constrained about speaking out when my child was small and could have taken advantage of that. She is much too old for a crèche now, so it is gloves off.

On both sides, we need to examine how mainstreaming is operating and we need to look at the consequences that there should be for Ministers and for senior civil servants if the mainstreaming agenda is not delivered. The Government Ministers on their side have to take responsibility.

As we look towards the future, the Assembly is facing major changes, which will be welcome to many of us. However, we must not lose the gains that we have made as we move towards becoming a full legislative body. We will need to ensure much more effective scrutiny on equality, and not just by the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. It is going to be more of a challenge when we are scrutinising legislation and we will all have to prepare for that.

In addition, there are our working practices; we all acknowledge that we will need to sit longer, but I will fight tooth and nail to ensure that we continue to sit in professional hours. The National Assembly advisory

O ran yr ochr seneddol—a derbyniaf bwynt Lorraine Barrett ynghylch sut y gellid ymateb i hyn ryw dro arall mewn lle arall—yr wyf yn dal yn ansicr i ba raddau y mae cydraddoldeb yn cael ei brif ffrydio. Cafwyd rhai camau penodol, cadarnhaol iawn. Mae llawer i'w wneud o ran recriwtio, fel y dywedwyd eisoes, ac, wrth gwrs, nid yw plant yn cael anrhegion yn y lle hwn.

Mae diffyg gofal plant yn y Cynulliad yn prysur ddod yn gywilydd cenedlaethol. Yr ydym yn esiampl wael iawn i gyflogwyr ledled Cymru. Pan fyddaf yn siarad yn fy rhanbarth â chyflogwyr am yr hyn y disgwyliaf iddynt ei wneud i gynorthwyo'r teuluoedd sy'n gweithio iddynt, codi eu haeliau a wnânt, a holi 'Wel, mae gofal plant yn Senedd yr Alban, pam nad yw'r un peth gennych chi?'. Rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynghylch hyn. Pan oedd fy mhlentyn yn fach ac wedi gallu elwa o hynny, teimlwn na ddylwn godi fy llais. Mae'n rhy hen o lawer i fynd i feithrinfa bellach, felly gallaf siarad yn blaen.

Mae angen inni, ar y ddwy ochr, weld sut y mae prif ffrydio yn digwydd, a rhaid inni edrych ar y canlyniadau a ddylai ddeillio o hynny i Weinidogion ac uwch-weision sifil oni chyflwynir yr agenda ar brif ffrydio. O'u hochr hwy, rhaid i Weinidogion y Llywodraeth gymryd y cyfrifoldeb.

Wrth inni edrych tua'r dyfodol, mae'r Cynulliad yn wynebu newidiadau mawr, y bydd llawer ohonom yn eu croesawu. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni osgoi colli'r gwelliannau yr ydym wedi eu sicrhau wrth inni symud tuag at ddod yn gorff deddfwriaethol llawn. Bydd gofyn inni sicrhau bod craffu llawer mwy effeithiol ar bwnc cydraddoldeb, ac nid gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal yn unig. Bydd yn fwy o her pan fyddwn yn craffu ar ddeddfwriaeth a rhaid inni oll baratoi ar gyfer hynny.

Yn ogystal, mae ein harferion gweithio; yr ydym oll yn cydnabod y bydd yn rhaid inni eistedd am gyfnodau hwy, ond ymladdaf hyd yr eithaf i ofalu y byddwn yn dal i eistedd yn ystod oriau proffesiynol. Ymgynghorodd

group consulted widely about this, and the people of Wales were clear that they wanted full-time Assembly Members who went to work in the morning and stopped work in the evening. We have to consider the effects of any potential changes on staff. There may be some voices in the Assembly who think that proper parliamentary practice is synonymous with some of the bad, old gentlemen's club ways of Westminster. They can rest assured that there are enough of us here to ensure that our new legislative Assembly does not throw out the equality baby with the weak powers bathwater.

Finally, I want to cite one dreadful public example of just how far we have to go. I do not know how many of you read our so-called national newspaper on Friday, but I was appalled and horrified—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. You will notice that you are running out of time.

Helen Mary Jones: Very briefly, then, I was appalled and horrified by an article that said,

'Personally, I have to say that I don't think gay men make good party leaders or Prime Ministers'.

and

'Their lifestyles are too divorced from the norm'.

This kind of attitude is what we have to fight against, and this is why the Assembly must keep equality right at the top of our agenda.

Laura Anne Jones: We should all see today's report as a great opportunity to take stock of how we have progressed with the equality agenda in the Assembly. We can all congratulate ourselves in the committee, as can the Government and the Assembly, on doing a great deal, but there is still a lot more to be done. That is widely recognised by people in my area and by everyone in Wales. It is also recognised by Jon Shortridge. He recognises that there is still a lot to be done,

grŵp ymgynghorol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn eang ar hyn, ac yr oedd pobl Cymru yn glir bod arnynt eisiau Aelodau Cynulliad llawnamser a oedd yn mynd i'r gwaith yn y bore ac yn gorffen gweithio gyda'r nos. Bydd yn rhaid inni ystyried effeithiau unrhyw newidiadau posibl ar y staff. Efallai fod rhai lleisiau yn y Cynulliad sy'n tybio bod arferion seneddol priodol yn gyfystyr â rhai o hen arferion drwg y clwb bonheddwyr yn San Steffan. Gallant fod yn dawel eu meddwl fod digon ohonom yma i sicrhau na fydd ein Cynulliad deddfwriaethol newydd yn cael gwared ag egwyddor cydraddoldeb ar yr un pryd â phwerau gwan.

Yn olaf, carwn ddyfynnu un esiampl gyhoeddus arswydus o'r ffordd bell sydd gennym eto i deithio. Ni wn faint ohonoch a ddarllenodd ein papur cenedlaethol bondigrybwyll ddydd Gwener, ond dychrynais a ffeiddio—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Sylwch fod eich amser yn dod i ben.

Helen Mary Jones: Yn fyr iawn, felly, dychrynais a ffeiddio wrth ddarllen erthygl a ddywedai,

Yn bersonol, rhaid i mi ddweud nad yw dynion hoyw, yn fy marn i, yn gwneud arweinyr pleidiau na Phrif Weinidogion da.

a

Mae eu dulliau o fyw yn rhy wahanol i'r norm.

Dyma'r math o agwedd y mae'n rhaid i ni ei gwrthweithio, a dyna pam mae'n rhaid i'r Cynulliad gadw cydraddoldeb ar frig ein hagenda.

Laura Anne Jones: Dylem oll weld adroddiad heddiw fel cyfle gwych i fesur faint o gynnydd yr ydym wedi'i wneud gyda'r agenda ar gydraddoldeb yn y Cynulliad. Mae lle inni oll longyfarch ein hunain yn y pwyllgor; felly hefyd y Llywodraeth a'r Cynulliad, am wneud llawer, ond erys llawer mwy i'w wneud. Mae pobl ledled fy ardal yn cydnabod hyn, fel y mae pawb yng Nghymru. Mae'n cael ei gydnabod hefyd gan Jon Shortridge. Mae ef yn

as has been said, in terms of advertising, recruitment and committee work.

Picking up quickly on what Helen Mary said about the Scottish Parliament, I understand what she said about childcare facilities and how important it is for equality of opportunity to have that here in our workplace and to set an example. However, the Scottish Parliament, I understand, has those childcare facilities for visitors, not for its employees or the Members of the Scottish Parliament. Therefore, it still has a long way to go, as well, I think.

We should also perhaps go back, as Lorraine Barrett said, to our communities and ask them what they think the way forward is. This obviously affects them, and in terms of how best to reach them, it may be something that we should ask them: what do they do, what papers do they read, where do they go to search for jobs?

I welcome the work that we have already done in the committee in the field of equality of opportunity and I agree with everything that has been said on this side of the Chamber, and I thank the Assembly for what it has done so far. As a committee, we have highlighted many issues to be tackled, but now is the time to act on them, and to put it in simple terms for people out there to understand, as well as us, and so that we can work on clear, concise action points to further equality of opportunity. Many times in the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, we have noted that Ministers and other committees have not recognised the importance of equality of opportunity and have sidelined the issue. It is seen as an add-on policy in those committees, rather than part of the core policy, which is a failure, really, across the board. It is not just certain committees, although it is true that some are better than others. It is for us all, as Assembly Members, to recognise on a daily basis that we must ensure that equality of opportunity is integral to everything that we do.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I welcome the opportunity to speak in this debate, conscious of the challenges that were set for me as I took on ministerial responsibility for the Assembly

cydnabod bod llawer eto i'w wneud, fel y dywedwyd, o ran hysbysebu, recriwtio a gwaith pwyllgor.

A chyfeirio'n sydyn ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Helen Mary am Senedd yr Alban, yr wyf yn deall yr hyn a ddywedodd am gyfleusterau gofal plant a pha mor bwysig o ran cyfle cyfartal yw inni ei gael yma yn ein man gwaith ni, a rhoi esiampl. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl a ddeallaf, ar gyfer ymwelwyr y mae'r cyfleusterau gofal plant hynny yn Senedd yr Alban, nid ar gyfer ei gweithwyr nac Aelodau Senedd yr Alban. Felly mae ganddi hithau ffordd bell i deithio hefyd, yn fy marn i.

Efallai y dylem fynd yn ôl hefyd, fel y dywedodd Lorraine Barret, i'n cymunedau a gofyn iddynt am eu barn am y ffordd ymlaen. Mae hyn yn amlwg yn effeithio arnynt, ac o ran y ffordd orau i'w cyrraedd, efallai y dylem ofyn iddynt: beth y maent hwy'n ei wneud, pa bapurau y maent yn eu darllen, i ble y maent yn mynd i chwilio am swyddi?

Croesawaf y gwaith a wnaethom eisoes ym maes cyfle cyfartal, a chytunaf â phopeth a ddywedwyd ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, gan ddiolch i'r Cynulliad am yr hyn a wnaeth hyd yma. Fel pwyllgor, yr ydym wedi tynnu sylw at lawer o bynciau i fynd i'r afael â hwy, ond bellach mae'n amser gweithredu arnynt, a'i gyfleu mewn iaith syml er mwyn i bobl ei ddeall, yn ogystal â ninnau, fel y gallwn weithio ar bwyntiau gweithredu clir a chryno er mwyn hyrwyddo cyfle cyfartal. Lawer gwaith yn y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, yr ydym wedi nodi bod Gweinidogion a phwyllgorau eraill heb gydnabod pwysigrwydd cyfle cyfartal a'u bod yn gwrthio'r pwnc i'r ymylon. Mae'n cael ei weld fel polisi ychwanegol yn y pwyllgorau hynny, yn hytrach na rhan o'r polisi craidd, ac mae hyn mewn gwirionedd yn fethiant cyffredinol. Nid mewn rhai pwyllgorau yn unig y mae'n digwydd, er ei bod yn wir dweud bod rhai'n well na'i gilydd. Mae'n fater inni oll, fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, gydnabod yn ddyddiol fod rhaid inni sicrhau bod cyfle cyfartal yn rhan annatod o bopeth a wnawn.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon, gan fy mod yn ymwybodol o'r heriau a osodwyd imi wrth imi gymryd cyfrifoldebau gweinidogol dros bolisiau cydraddoldeb

Government's equality policies last year. I thank Gwenda Thomas, the Chair of the Committee on Equality of Opportunity, for her leadership and inclusive approach, which is evidenced in the committee's report and deliberations.

Equality remains at the heart of Assembly Government policy making. Laura Anne, it is key that we recognise the development of a distinctive equality agenda in Wales because of our statutory duties to promote equality. This will be further reflected in the new Government of Wales Bill, ensuring that there is a duty on Ministers to deliver their responsibilities and a parallel duty on the legislature with regard to the conduct of business and proceedings.

Moving forward from last year, I am glad that there is recognition that the Assembly Government's annual report offers a new style, building significantly on last year's report. This reflects a real change in how we are conducting our business in relation to equality. Again, Laura Anne, this is not seen as an add-on or a final thought in the policy-making process. It is important that we recognise that, during 2005, I established the mainstreaming task and finish group in response to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity's 'Report on Mainstreaming Equality in the Work of the National Assembly'.

Mainstreaming must start in the Assembly and, for the Government, this has included establishing new equality champions in each Assembly department, ensuring an internal equality network throughout the organisation. Mark and Helen Mary, we want to ensure that this report is more outcome based—as you said, it is about what you deliver. We have done a great deal to not just list activities, but to assess impact. The way in which we approached the annual report was to ask each department to identify its top five objectives, stating how equality was built in, and asking it to identify any positive equality outcomes. There are specific policy and business functions relating to equality, case studies with individual success stories, and areas of good practice in promoting equality

Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y llynedd. Carwn ddiolch i Gwenda Thomas, Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal, am ei harweiniad a'i hagwedd gynhwysol, sydd yn amlwg yn adroddiad a thrafodaethau'r pwyllgor.

Erys cydraddoldeb wrth graidd y broses o lunio polisiau Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Laura Anne, mae'n allweddol ein bod yn cydnabod datblygiad agenda gydraddoldeb unigryw yng Nghymru oherwydd ein dyletswyddau statudol i hybu cydraddoldeb. Adlewyrchir hyn ymhellach ym Mesur newydd Llywodraeth Cymru, gan sicrhau y bydd dyletswydd ar Weinidogion gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau, a dyletswydd hefyd ar y ddeddfwrfa o ran cynnal busnes a thrafodion.

A symud ymlaen o'r llynedd, yr wyf yn falch o'r gydnabyddiaeth bod adroddiad blynyddol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cynnig arddull newydd, gan adeiladu'n sylweddol ar adroddiad y llynedd. Mae hyn yn adlewyrchu newid gwirioneddol yn y ffordd yr ydym yn cynnal ein busnes o ran cydraddoldeb. Unwaith eto, Laura Anne, nid yw hyn yn cael ei weld fel rhywbeth ychwanegol na rhywbeth a ddaeth ar gynffon y broses o lunio polisiau. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cydnabod fy mod, yn ystod 2005, wedi sefydlu'r grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar brif ffrydio fel ymateb i'r 'Adroddiad ar Brif ffrydio Cydraddoldeb yng Ngwaith y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol' gan y Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal.

Rhaid i brif ffrydio ddechrau yn y Cynulliad, ac o ran y Llywodraeth, mae hyn wedi golygu sefydlu hyrwyddwyr cydraddoldeb newydd ym mhob adran o'r Cynulliad, a fydd yn sicrhau rhwydwaith cydraddoldeb mewnol ledled y sefydliad. Mark a Helen Mary, yr ydym am sicrhau bod yr adroddiad hwn yn fwy seiliedig ar ganlyniadau—fel y dywedaso, mae'n ymwneud â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei gyflawni. Gwnaethom lawer iawn, nid yn unig i restru gweithgareddau, ond asesu'r effeithiau. Aethom ati i lunio'r adroddiad blynyddol drwy ofyn i bob adran nodi ei phum prif amcan, gan ddatgan sut yr oedd cydraddoldeb wedi ei gynnwys yn rhan o hynny, a gofyn iddynt nodi unrhyw ganlyniadau cadarnhaol o ran cydraddoldeb. Mae swyddogaethau penodol o ran polisi a

of opportunity. We can see some of those key achievements in promoting equality, as well as the progressing of our vision in 'Wales: A Better Country', during 2004-05.

I will mention only a few significant developments. The Genesis Wales project is providing a package of advice, guidance, support and childcare using European structural funds, and has been a key step forward in addressing barriers. The Cyfenter Development Partnership is promoting new ways of tackling all forms of discrimination and inequalities in the labour market. The British Sign Language project is aiming to increase the number of sign language interpreters in Wales, and there is the health programme. In education, we have seen work on gender stereotyping in modern apprenticeships and Stonewall Cymru has launched an 'Education for All' campaign.

We are doing a lot to promote equality, but I recognise the challenges that have been mentioned in this debate and during scrutiny in committee. It is important that we look at our own workforce, as we have done this afternoon. We have to be a model for good practice in promoting equality and diversity. If we are to have equality and diversity in service delivery, we must ensure that our workforce reflects the people whom we serve.

There have been many achievements in taking this forward. The Permanent Secretary's report identifies some of these: the launch of our internal race equality scheme, which set its own challenges; our graduate fast-track recruitment for under-represented groups, which brought many people into the Assembly; recognition by Race for Opportunity that we are one of the top 10 most improved UK employers on diversity and equality issues; and our scoring consistently higher than other public sector organisations in the employers' forum. However, of course, it is about the next steps and the report highlights examples of good

busnes yn ymwneud â chydaddoldeb, astudiaethau achos gyda hanesion am lwyddiannau unigol, a meysydd lle y ceir arferion da o ran hybu cyfle cyfartal. Gallwn weld rhai o'r llwyddiannau allweddol hynny ym maes hybu cydraddoldeb, yn ogystal â hyrwyddo ein gweledigaeth yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well', yn ystod 2004-05.

Soniaf am rai datblygiadau arwyddocaol yn unig. Mae prosiect Genesis Cymru yn darparu pecyn o gyngor, cyfarwyddyd, cymorth a gofal plant gan ddefnyddio cronfeydd strwythurol Ewrop, a bu'n gam allweddol ymlaen i oresgyn rhwystrau. Mae Partneriaeth Ddatblygu Cyfenter yn hybu ffyrdd newydd o fynd i'r afael â phob math o wahaniaethu ac anghydaddoldebau yn y farchnad lafur. Nod y prosiect Iaith Arwyddion Prydain yw cynyddu nifer y lladmeryddion iaith arwyddion yng Nghymru, ac mae rhaglen iechyd. Mewn addysg, gwelsom waith ar stereoteipio o ran rhyw mewn prentisiaethau modern, ac mae Stonewall Cymru wedi lansio ymgyrch 'Addysg i Bawb'.

Yr ydym yn gwneud llawer i hybu cydraddoldeb, ond yr wyf yn cydnabod yr heriau y soniwyd amdanynt yn y ddadl hon ac yn ystod y craffu yn y pwyllgor. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn edrych ar ein gweithlu ein hunain, fel yr ydym wedi gwneud y prynhawn yma. Rhaid inni fod yn esiampl o arferion da o ran hybu cydraddoldeb ac amrywiaeth. Os am gael cydraddoldeb ac amrywiaeth wrth gyflwyno gwasanaethau, rhaid inni ofalu bod ein gweithlu yn adlewyrchu'r bobl yr ydym yn eu gwasanaethu.

Cafwyd nifer o lwyddiannau wrth wneud hyn. Mae adroddiad yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol yn nodi rhai o'r rhain: lansio ein cynllun cydraddoldeb hiliol mewnol ein hunain, sydd â'i heriau ei hun; ein cynllun recriwtio graddedigion llwybr carlam i grwpiau a dangynrychiolir, a ddaeth â llawer o bobl i'r Cynulliad; cydnabyddiaeth gan Race for Opportunity ein bod yn un o'r 10 cyflogwr uchaf yn y DU o ran gwella ar bynciau amrywiaeth a chydaddoldeb; a'n sgoriau cyson uwch na sefydliadau eraill yn y sector cyhoeddus yn fforwm y cyflogwyr. Fodd bynnag, wrth gwrs, mae'n fater o gymryd y camau nesaf ac mae'r adroddiad yn tynnu

practice and innovation.

Helen Mary Jones: Minister, do you share my view that it would be easier to scrutinise progress in future if we separated the Government's report from that of the committees?

4.40 p.m.

Jane Hutt: We will look at that in the light of the Government of Wales Bill as we separate.

Finally, the mergers present real challenges and opportunities, such as our having to absorb around 2,000 additional staff. As the Permanent Secretary says, in terms of reaching out, it is about bringing talents into the Assembly Government in terms of our workforce. The networks and partnerships that we have in place will help us to deliver equality.

Gwenda Thomas: This debate has been on the committee's report on the National Assembly's arrangements to promote equality as required under section 120 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. The reports from the Welsh Assembly Government, the committee and APS are mere appendices, which is why the amendments are not appropriate. However, Jenny, I take your point on the amendments and respect your opinion. Your commitment to equality of opportunity is not in question. I still think, however, that the amendments set a precedent. I also note your point on the forward work programmes.

Mark, you made comments on the scrutiny of non-committee members. The committee scrutinises the Welsh Assembly Government and the Assembly Parliamentary Service. Most of your points were on the work of the Welsh Assembly Government. It is still not clear to me how the amendments, if accepted, would be taken forward as part of policy development, other than if they were fed back to the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. The amendments affecting the Assembly Parliamentary Service should be channelled, I understand from Lorraine, via the House Committee. If that is the case, then I hope that the House Committee will feed back to

sylw at enghreifftiau o arferion da ac arloesi.

Helen Mary Jones: Weinidog, a ydych o'r un farn â mi y byddai'n haws craffu ar gynnydd yn y dyfodol petaem yn gwahanu adroddiad y Llywodraeth oddi wrth un y pwyllgorau?

Jane Hutt: Edrychwn ar hynny yng ngoleuni Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru wrth inni wahanu.

Yn olaf, mae'r uno'n cyflwyno heriau a chyfleoedd gwirioneddol, megis ein bod yn gorfod ymgorffori rhyw 2,000 o staff ychwanegol. Fel y dywed yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, o ran estyn allan, mater ydyw o ddod â thalentau i mewn i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o ran ein gweithlu. Bydd y rhwydweithiau a'r partneriaethau sydd ar waith gennym yn help inni gyflwyno cydraddoldeb.

Gwenda Thomas: Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl ar adroddiad y pwyllgor ar drefniadau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i hybu cydraddoldeb yn ôl gofynion adran 120 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Atodiadau yn unig yw'r adroddiadau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, y pwyllgor a GSC, a dyna pam nad yw'r gwelliannau'n briodol. Fodd bynnag, Jenny, yr wyf yn gweld eich pwynt am y gwelliannau ac yn parchu eich barn. Nid oes amheuaeth am eich ymrwymiad i gyfle cyfartal. Yr wyf yn dal o'r farn, fodd bynnag, fod y gwelliannau yn gosod cysail. Nodaf hefyd eich pwynt ynghylch y blaenraglenni gwaith.

Mark, cyflwynasoch sylwadau ynghylch craffu gan rai nad ydynt yn aelodau o'r pwyllgor. Mae'r pwyllgor yn craffu ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad. Am waith Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yr oedd y rhan fwyaf o'ch pwyntiau. Nid yw'n glir i mi byth sut y byddai'r gwelliannau, o'u derbyn, yn cael eu rhoi ar waith fel rhan o ddatblygu polisi, oni bai eu bod yn cael eu bwydo'n ôl i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Deallaf gan Lorraine y dylai'r gwelliannau sy'n effeithio ar Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad gael eu sianelu drwy Bwyllgor y Tŷ. Os mai felly y mae, yna gobeithio y bydd Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn

the Committee on Equality of Opportunity. That is the confusion in the situation as it stands.

I thank Lorraine for her work on sub-committees, and I point out that the main difficulty is that we are discussing the 2004-05 report, which is 10 months old. Some of the criticisms that all Members have made relate to matters that have been discussed in committee during this year. I know that time is limited, but I will quickly say, Helen, that I agree with you that there is a need for clarification, and I hope that the committee set up to discuss the Government of Wales Bill will seek clarification on issues such as those that we are dealing with this afternoon. I thank you, too, Helen, for your work with Lorraine on the sub-committees.

bwydo'n ôl i'r Pwyllgor Cyfle Cyfartal. Dyna yw'r dryswch yn y sefyllfa fel y mae ar hyn o bryd.

Carwn ddiolch i Lorraine am ei gwaith ar yr is-bwyllgorau, a dymunaf nodi mai'r prif anhawster yw ein bod yn trafod adroddiad 2004-05, sydd yn 10 mis oed. Mae a wnelo peth o'r feirniadaeth a wnaeth yr holl Aelodau â materion a drafodwyd yn y pwyllgor eleni. Gwn fod yr amser yn brin, ond dywedaf yn gyflym, Helen, fy mod yn cytuno â chi fod angen cael eglurhad, a gobeithiaf y bydd y pwyllgor a sefydlwyd i drafod Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru yn ceisio cael eglurhad ar bynciau megis y rhai yr ydym yn ymdrin â hwy y prynhawn yma. Diolch i chi hefyd, Helen, am eich gwaith gyda Lorraine ar yr is-bwyllgorau.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 3: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne

Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lloyd, David
Melding, David
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 23, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 5: For 23, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John

Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion (NDM2787): to propose that

the National Assembly for Wales

acting under Standing Order No. 6.6 notes the National Assembly's sixth equality annual report: 'National Assembly for Wales: Arrangements to Promote Equality of Opportunity—Financial Year 2004-2005', which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 24 January 2006.

Cynnig (NDM2787): cynnig bod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru

gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6, yn nodi chweched adroddiad blynyddol y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar gydraddoldeb: 'Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru: Trefniadau i Hyrwyddo Cyfle Cyfartal—Blwyddyn Ariannol 2004-2005' a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 24 Ionawr 2006.

*Cynnig (NDM2787): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
 Motion (NDM2787): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina

Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
 today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 4.45 p.m.
 The meeting ended at 4.45 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)

Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)