



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 6 Rhagfyr 2005  
Tuesday, 6 December 2005**

## Cynnwys Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	3
Cwestiwn Brys: Grŵp Trinity Mirror Urgent Question: Trinity Mirror Group .....	27
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	33
Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order.....	37
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2005.....	38
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Tribiwlynsoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Valuation Tribunal (Wales) Regulations 2005.....	39
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005, a Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Gŵynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2005, and the Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	42
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 .....	50
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Hylendid a Gorfodi) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Feed Hygiene and Enforcement (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	56
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cig (Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Meat (Official Controls) (Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	62
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981 (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Animal Health Act 1981 (Amendment) Regulations 2005 .....	65
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol): Seilwaith y Rheilffyrdd Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party): Rail Infrastructure .....	72
Cynigion ar gyfer Ailstrwythuro Gwasanaeth yr Heddlu Proposed Restructuring of the Police Service .....	99

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynddi yn y  
Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **Gorddyled Overindebtedness**

**Q1 Irene James:** What action has the Welsh Assembly Government taken to address overindebtedness in Wales? OAQ1051(FM)

**C1 Irene James:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â gorddyled yng Nghymru? OAQ1051(FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Our concern over this issue has caused us to welcome the Department of Trade and Industry's new £45 million face-to-face debt advice fund, which covers Wales and England. We hosted a DTI-led seminar on 11 November for those organisations in Wales that wish to apply to the fund.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Mae ein pryder ynglŷn â'r mater hwn yn golygu ein bod yn croesawu cronfa newydd £45 miliwn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant i roi cyngor wyneb yn wyneb ar ddyled, sydd ar gyfer Cymru a Lloegr. Bu inni gynnal seminar a arweiniwyd gan yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant ar 11 Tachwedd ar gyfer y mudiadau hynny yng Nghymru sy'n dymuno gwneud cais i'r gronfa.

**Irene James:** Research commissioned by the Scottish Executive about life in low-income families highlighted that Christmas is viewed as an obligatory part of life with children. It places great strain on family budgets, so much so that, for many, accumulating debt through Christmas is a fact of life. With pronounced levels of overindebtedness already affecting the poorest families in Wales, as highlighted in a recent review, would you encourage people who find themselves in financial difficulties to approach organisations such as Citizens Advice and seek advice that can help alleviate the financial burden that often becomes greatest at this time of year?

**Irene James:** Tynnodd ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban ar fywyd mewn teuluoedd ar incwm isel sylw at y ffaith bod y Nadolig yn cael ei ystyried yn rhan orfodol o fywyd gyda phlant. Mae'n rhoi pwysau mawr ar gyllidebau teuluoedd, i'r fath raddau nes bod cronni dyledion dros gyfnod y Nadolig yn ffordd o fyw i lawer. Gyda lefelau uchel iawn o orddyled eisoes yn effeithio ar y teuluoedd tlotaf yng Nghymru, fel y nodwyd mewn arolwg diweddar, a fydddech yn annog pobl sy'n wynebu trafferthion ariannol i fynd at fudiadau megis Cyngor ar Bopeth i ofyn am gyngor a all gynorthwyo i leihau'r baich ariannol sydd yn aml ar ei waethaf yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn?

**The First Minister:** I entirely agree with you. The peer-group pressure on children to demand the same presents as those demanded by children of wealthier families is enormous. Parents do not want to let their children down and, therefore, they sometimes accept loans from loan sharks before Christmas, which are to be repaid at usurious rates just afterwards and which can sometimes lead to huge problems. That is why advice on a face-to-face basis from

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno'n llwyr â chi. Mae'r pwysau ar blant gan eu cyfoedion i fynnu cael yr un anrhegion â'r rhai y gelwir amdanynt gan blant o deuluoedd cyfoethocach, yn enfawr. Nid oes ar rieni eisiau siomi eu plant, ac felly byddant weithiau'n derbyn benthyciadau gan usurwyr cyn y Nadolig, y mae'n rhaid eu talu'n ôl ar gyfraddau afresymol o uchel yn union wedyn, ac a all weithiau arwain at broblemau anferthol. Dyna paham mai cyngor wyneb yn

Citizens Advice is the right course to take. It should not be a case of simply thinking that taking a loan from a loan shark and having to repay it will provide a way out of the problems that occur at this time of year.

**Leanne Wood:** What support will your Government give to those workers who are mortgaged to the hilt, who are deeply in debt in the run-up to Christmas, and who have recently lost their jobs, particularly in the manufacturing sector? We received news that Gate UK Ltd and Electronic Harnesses (UK) Ltd, both in Llantrisant and both in an Objective 1 area, are to close, with the loss of around 70 jobs. Will you agree to contact these Llantrisant companies to see what financial packages can be put in place to protect the jobs? Failing that, what will you do to ensure jobs of equal value to replace the ones that are soon to be lost?

**The First Minister:** There is never a good time to lose your job, but losing it just before Christmas is particularly difficult for families, because it is the time of peak commitments during the year. At the same time, relative to other periods of job losses, the buoyancy of the labour market currently means that people have a better chance of accessing other jobs, with a record 1,338,000 jobs in Wales. Therefore, the chance of getting another job is much better. The myth that people can get alternative jobs only at lower pay rates is not much more than a myth.

**Peter Black:** Good advice services are crucial in tackling debt, and what is offered by Citizens Advice is important. In Swansea, the citizens advice bureau is open for just 10 hours a week and is struggling to maintain even that level of service. Benefit offices are, effectively, closing their doors and forcing people to use call centres instead and, as a result, the number of inquiries has doubled. Do you not think that there is a case for the Assembly Government to take the same line with CABx as it does with councils for voluntary service and to provide a level of core funding for this vital service?

wyneb gan Gyngor ar Bopeth yw'r llwybr cywir. Ni ddylai neb feddwl y bydd cymryd benthygiad gan usuriwr a gorfod ei ad-dalu'n rhoi cyfle i ddatrys y problemau sy'n digwydd yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn.

**Leanne Wood:** Pa gymorth a roddir gan eich Llywodraeth i'r gweithwyr hynny sydd â morgaeisi uchel iawn ac sydd mewn dyledion enbyd yn ystod y cyfnod cyn y Nadolig, ac sydd wedi colli eu swyddi'n ddiweddar, yn enwedig yn y sector gweithgynhyrchu? Yr ydym wedi cael gwybod bod Gate UK Ltd ac Electronic Harnesses (UK) Ltd, y ddau yn Llantrisant, a'r ddau yn ardal Amcan 1, yn mynd i gau, a thua 70 o swyddi'n cael eu colli. A gytunwch i gysylltu â'r cwmnïau hyn yn Llantrisant i weld pa becynnau ariannol y gellir eu trefnu i amddiffyn eu swyddi? Yn niffyg hynny, beth a wnewch i sicrhau swyddi sy'n gyfwerth yn lle'r rhai sydd ar fin cael eu colli?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid oes fyth adeg dda i golli eich swydd, ond mae ei cholli cyn y Nadolig yn arbennig o anodd i deuluoedd, oherwydd dyma'r amser pryd y ceir yr ymrwymadau mwyaf yn ystod y flwyddyn. Ar yr un pryd, o'i gymharu â chyfnodau eraill o golli swyddi, mae bywiogrwydd y farchnad lafur ar hyn o bryd yn golygu bod gan bobl well siawns o gael swyddi eraill, gyda'r nifer uchaf erioed o 1,338,000 o swyddi yng Nghymru. Felly, mae'r siawns o gael swydd arall yn llawer gwell. Nid yw'r myth na all pobl gael swyddi eraill ond ar gyfraddau cyflog is, yn ddim byd ond myth.

**Peter Black:** Mae gwasanaethau cynghori da'n hanfodol wrth fynd i'r afael â dyled, ac mae'r hyn a gynigir gan Gyngor ar Bopeth yn bwysig. Yn Abertawe, nid yw swyddfa Cyngor ar Bopeth yn agored ond am 10 awr yr wythnos, ac mae'n ei chael yn anodd cynnal hyd yn oed y lefel honno o wasanaeth. Mae swyddfeydd budd-dal, i bob diben, yn cau eu drysau ac yn gorfodi pobl i ddefnyddio canolfannau galw yn eu lle, ac o'r herwydd, mae nifer yr ymholiadau wedi dyblu. Onid ydych yn credu bod lle i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ddilyn yr un trywydd gyda chanolfannau cyngor ar bopeth ag a wneir gyda chynghorau gwasanaeth gwirfoddol, a darparu lefel o arian craidd ar gyfer y gwasanaeth hanfodol hwn?

**The First Minister:** I think that CABx have traditionally been funded by central Government, but I will have to check that. That certainly used to be the case, because the bureaux were seen as falling within the sphere of consumer advice, which comes closer to the DTI's basic responsibilities. The issue about the range of advice available to poor communities and to people suffering temporary difficulties is something that we need to look at. We need to do that jointly with central Government, because we do not want to cross each other's bootlaces but make sure that a range of services is available, some from central Government, some from us and some from local government. We must ensure that we have a seamless web of services, and that we avoid duplication.

**Glyn Davies:** My experience, First Minister, is that citizens advice bureaux have usually been funded from local government in its different forms, through various partnerships. That has led to what might be patchy provision across Wales and a huge amount of exhaustive effort being made by Citizens Advice in putting core funding together. Do you think that it would be sensible for your Government to establish some sort of standard practice across Wales, so that citizens advice bureaux can put more effort into the good job that they do in helping people with their overindebtedness rather than having to chase around after money all the time?

**The First Minister:** You are right to say that Citizens Advice goes through a financial crisis from time to time, as is true of any body partially based on voluntary effort. The nature of the voluntary sector is that sometimes it shrinks, and sometimes it expands. However, it is an incredibly useful form of giving advice to people in times of crisis. We do what we can to make sure that a core service is available and is reasonably accessible in all parts of Wales.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn credu bod canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth wedi'u hariannu'n hanesyddol gan Lywodraeth ganolog, ond bydd yn rhaid imi edrych a yw hynny'n wir. Yn sicr, dyna a arferai ddigwydd, gan yr ystyrid bod y canolfannau'n dod o fewn cwmpas cyngor i ddefnyddwyr, sy'n nes at gyfrifoldebau sylfaenol yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Mae'r cwestiwn ynghylch yr amrediad o gyngor sydd ar gael i gymunedau tlawd ac i bobl sy'n dioddef trafferthion dros dro'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni edrych arno. Mae angen inni wneud hynny ar y cyd â Llywodraeth ganolog, gan nad oes arnom eisiau baglu ar draws ein gilydd, ond sicrhau bod amrediad o wasanaethau ar gael, rhai gan Lywodraeth ganolog, rhai gennym ni a rhai gan lywodraeth leol. Mae'n rhaid inni sicrhau bod gennym rwydwaith di-fwlch o wasanaethau, ac osgoi dyblygu.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn fy mhrofiad i, Brif Weinidog, arferai canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth gael eu hariannu gan lywodraeth leol yn ei gwahanol ffurfiau, drwy wahanol bartneriaethau. Mae hynny wedi arwain at yr hyn a allai fod yn ddarpariaeth anghyson ar draws Cymru, gydag ymdrech enfawr yn cael ei gwneud gan Gyngor ar Bopeth i geisio cael cyllid craidd. A ydych yn credu y byddai'n beth synhwyrol i'ch Llywodraeth sefydlu rhyw fath o drefn safonol ar draws Cymru fel y gall canolfannau cyngor ar bopeth ganolbwyntio mwy ar y gwaith da a wneir ganddynt wrth gynorthwyo pobl sydd â gorddyled, yn hytrach na gorfod rhedeg o gwmpas yn chwilio am arian drwy'r amser?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gywir wrth ddweud bod Cyngor ar Bopeth yn wynebu argyfwng ariannol o dro i dro, ac mae hyn yn wir am unrhyw gorff sy'n rhannol seiliedig ar ymdrechion gwirfoddol. Mae'n rhan o natur y sector gwirfoddol ei fod weithiau'n crebachu ac weithiau'n ehangu. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ffordd hynod o ddefnyddiol o roi cyngor i bobl ar adegau o argyfwng. Yr ydym yn gwneud yr hyn a allwn i sicrhau bod gwasanaeth craidd ar gael ym mhob rhan o Gymru a'i bod yn weddol hawdd i bobl gael y gwasanaeth hwnnw.

**Llywyddiaeth y DU**  
**The UK Presidency**

**Q2 Janet Davies:** What recent discussions has the First Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding the UK presidency of the European Union? OAQ1072(FM)

**The First Minister:** I have had many such discussions with UK Government Ministers, both individually and in the context of the Joint Ministerial Committee on Europe. A further meeting of that committee will take place a week today.

**Janet Davies:** In June, the Prime Minister's speech to the European Parliament upset other member states quite badly, and this situation has been left to smoulder during the intervening months. However, in the past 10 days, he has made frantic visits to try to restore his credibility. Among other proposals that the PM is now putting forward is one that suggests removing £7 billion from rural development. Do you welcome that?

**The First Minister:** The proposals for the financial perspective period 2007-13 were tabled yesterday, and they will then proceed through a network of meetings of the General Affairs and External Relations Council and the ambassadors' meeting, or Coreper as it is called for short, of the 25 member states to the EU. It will then go to the summit meeting on 15 and 16 December to try to reach agreement on the next financial perspective. I think that those proposals are sound, but they involve all parts of the EU having some pain in order to make some gain in having an agreed budget for the next seven years.

**Jonathan Morgan:** One big issue over the past week or so has been the UK's rebate. Of course, contrary to what the Prime Minister said in the House of Commons, that he would not negotiate the rebate away, it is now fairly clear that we will lose at least part of that rebate. Have you had discussions with departments in London about the impact on Wales?

**C2 Janet Davies:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch llywyddiaeth y DU o'r Undeb Ewropeaidd? OAQ1072(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf wedi cynnal sawl trafodaeth o'r fath gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU, yn unigol ac yng nghydestun Cydbwyllgor y Gweinidogion ar Ewrop. Bydd cyfarfod pellach o'r pwyllgor hwnnw'n cael ei gynnal wythnos i heddiw.

**Janet Davies:** Ym mis Mehefin, bu i araith Prif Weinidog Prydain i Senedd Ewrop ddigio aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yn fawr, a gadawyd i'r sefyllfa hon fudlosgi yn ystod y misoedd a aeth heibio ers hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod y 10 diwrnod diwethaf, mae wedi bod yn rhuthro yma ac acw i geisio adfer ei hygredd. Ymysg cynigion eraill y mae Prif Weinidog Prydain yn eu cynnig erbyn hyn y mae un sy'n awgrymu tynnu £7 biliwn oddi ar ddatblygu gwledig. A ydych yn croesawu hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Cyflwynwyd y cynigion ar gyfer cyfnod persbectif ariannol 2007-13 ddoe, a byddant wedyn yn mynd rhagddynt drwy rwydwaith o gyfarfodydd y Cyngor Materion Cyffredinol a Chysylltiadau Allanol a chyfarfod llysgenhadon y 25 o aelod-wladwriaethau'r UE, neu Coreper fel y'i gelwir. Wedyn aiff ymlaen i'r uwchgynhadledd sy'n cyfarfod ar 15 a 16 Rhagfyr i geisio cael cytundeb ar y persbectif ariannol nesaf. Yr wyf o'r farn bod y cynigion yn rhai cadarn, ond maent yn cynnwys yr angen i bob rhan o'r UE ddiodef peth poen er mwyn elwa drwy gael cyllideb y cytunir arni ar gyfer y saith mlynedd nesaf.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Un mater o bwys dros yr wythnos diwethaf fu ad-daliad y DU. Wrth gwrs, yn wahanol i'r hyn a ddywedodd Prif Weinidog Prydain yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin, na fyddai'n peri i'r ad-daliad gael ei golli wrth negodi, mae bellach yn eithaf amlwg y byddwn yn colli rhan o leiaf o'r ad-daliad hwnnw. A ydych wedi cynnal trafodaethau gydag adrannau yn Llundain ynghylch yr effaith ar Gymru?

**The First Minister:** It is not so much the impact on Wales if there were any kind of loss of the rebate—which will be going up anyway, of course—but the impact on Wales of the loss of the increase in the rebate to the full extent that would otherwise occur. I am certainly aware of that proposal and the details that emerged yesterday, but the important point is to note that there is no proposal to reduce the expansion of the rebate where it arises from the distortion in the EU budget caused by the common agricultural policy. The rebate will carry on increasing. The only thing that the Prime Minister has proposed to exchange is that part of the rebate that arises from accession. That is, the part of the rebate that would be paid by Poland, Hungary and the Czech Republic and so forth to the UK. He has proposed trading that away in return for an agreed budget.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Yr oeddwn yn synnu braidd o glywed eich bod yn cefnogi safbwynt y Prif Weinidog yn Llundain, a'r cynnig a wnaed am y gyllideb, oherwydd pe bai hynny'n cael ei dderbyn, byddai cwtogiad eithaf sylweddol yn y math o bethau y soniodd Janet Davies amdanynt, sef y polisi rhanbarthol ac, wrth gwrs, yr effaith ystadegol. I ddychwelyd at y cynnig, yr ydych yn ymwybodol iawn, Brif Weinidog, o bwysigrwydd Amcan 1 i Gymru, oherwydd gwyddom yn awr fod lefelau incwm hanner pobl Cymru, ar gyfartaledd, yn llai na £10,400 y flwyddyn. Felly, mae'n bwysig ein bod yn cael yr arian hwn. A yw'r Prif Weinidog yn dweud ein bod yn fwy neu yn llai tebyg o gael cytundeb ar y gyllideb o ganlyniad i gynigion Tony Blair?

2.10 p.m.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn gwneud y gosodiad y bydd cwtogiad yn yr adnoddau a fydd yn dod i ni drwy gronfeydd strwythurol, ond nid wyf yn derbyn hynny. Nid ydych yn gywir ynghylch hynny. O ran ein hincwm, yr hyn sydd yn cyfrif yw ein CMC y pen o'i gymharu â CMC y pen rhanbarthau eraill Ewrop. Ar yr amod bod cytundeb yr wythnos nesaf yn yr uwchgynhadledd, sydd yn dechrau ddydd Iau ac yn parhau tan ddydd Gwener, bydd Cymru ar ei hennill, a bydd

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid yn gymaint yr effaith ar Gymru pe byddid mewn rhyw fodd yn colli'r ad-daliad—a fydd yn cynyddu beth bynnag, wrth gwrs—ond yr effaith ar Gymru o golli'r cynnydd yn yr ad-daliad i'r graddau a fyddai'n digwydd fel arall. Yr wyf yn sicr yn ymwybodol o'r cynnig hwnnw a'r manylion a ddaeth i'r amlwg ddoe, ond y pwynt pwysig i'w nodi yw nad oes dim cynnig i leihau ehangu'r ad-daliad lle y bo'n codi o'r ystumio ar gyllideb yr UE a achosir gan y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin. Bydd yr ad-daliad yn parhau i gynyddu. Yr unig beth y mae Prif Weinidog Prydain wedi cynnig ei gyfnewid yw'r rhan honno o'r ad-daliad sy'n digwydd wrth ymaelodi. Hynny yw, y rhan o'r ad-daliad a fyddai'n cael ei dalu gan Wlad Pwyl, Hwngari a'r Weriniaeth Tsiec ac yn y blaen, i'r DU. Mae wedi cynnig cyfnewid hynny am gyllideb y cytunir arni.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** I was rather surprised to hear you say that you support the Prime Minister's stance on this, and the motion tabled on the budget, because if that were to be carried, there would be quite a substantial cutback on the type of things that Janet Davies is talking about, namely regional policy and, of course, statistical effect. To return to the motion, you are well aware, First Minister, of the importance of Objective 1 to Wales, because we now know that the income levels of half the people of Wales are, on average, below £10,400 per annum. Therefore, it is important that we get this money. Is the First Minister saying that we would be more or less likely to reach an agreement on the budget as a result of Tony Blair's proposals?

**The First Minister:** You make the assertion that there will be a cutback in the resources that will come to us through the structural funds, but I do not accept that. You are not right about that. In terms of our income, what counts is our GDP per capita as compared to that of other European regions. Provided that there is an agreement next week in the summit, which begins on Thursday and continues into Friday, Wales will gain, and west Wales and the Valleys will continue to

gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn parhau i gael rhywbeth tebyg i Amcan 1, er y bydd yr enw yn newid.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei ofyn oedd pa mor debygol yw hi, wedi i Tony Blair bitsio'r gyllideb ar bwynt mor isel—llai nag 1 y cant erbyn 2013—y bydd gwledydd dwyrain Ewrop yn cytuno â hi. Maent i gyd yn dweud bod y cynigion hyn yn annerbyniol. Mae'r Prif Weinidog yn gwybod na fyddwn yn debygol o gael Amcan 1 eto os nad oes cytundeb. Sut all y Prif Weinidog sefyll fan hyn a dweud y byddai'r math hwn o gytundeb yn dda i Gymru, pan mae'n gwybod bod Prif Weinidog y DU wedi pitsio'r gyllideb yn rhy isel o lawer?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ddim o gwbl. Mae'r fargen y mae'n ceisio ei tharo gyda'r 10 aelod wladwriaeth newydd o ddwyrain Ewrop a de Ewrop yn cynnwys derbyn cwtogiad o 10 y cant yn y swm a dderbyniant drwy gronfeydd strwythurol, gan ei gwneud yn haws iddynt wario'r arian. Yn lle gorfod dod o hyd i arian cyfatebol o 50 y cant, ni fydd yn rhaid iddynt ddod o hyd i ddim ond 15 y cant. Felly, mae'n llawer haws iddynt gael hyd i arian cyfatebol er mwyn gwario'r arian o Ewrop.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Frankly, First Minister, he has gone down Europe and upset everyone. He has got virtually everyone lined up against him. As I understand it, only two member states have shown any inclination to consider the UK position. Instead of rushing around Europe, trying to cobble together a last-minute deal, should not Tony Blair have been working on this months before, so that countries such as Wales would continue to benefit from Objective 1 funding? Has he not thrown it all away, and what does this say about your influence with Tony Blair, First Minister?

**The First Minister:** It seems to me a bit of a mug's game to predict failure before the summit meeting begins. You have to give credence to the fact that the sharing of pain in order to have an agreed EU budget is something that everyone goes through every seven years. There is pain involved for the UK with regard to the rebate; there is pain

get something similar to Objective 1, although it will be called something else.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** What I was asking was how likely it is, after Tony Blair has pitched the budget at such a low point—less than 1 per cent by 2013—that the eastern European countries will agree to it. They all say that these proposals are unacceptable. The First Minister knows that if there is no agreement, we are not likely to get Objective 1 again. How can the First Minister stand here and tell us that this kind of agreement would be good for Wales, when he knows that the Prime Minister has pitched the budget much too low?

**The First Minister:** Not at all. The bargain that he is trying to strike with the 10 new member states from eastern and south Europe is to accept a cut of 10 per cent in the amount of money that they get through structural funds, but to make it easier for them to spend the money. Instead of having to find match funding of 50 per cent, they will only have to find 15 per cent. Therefore, it is much easier for them to find match funding in order to spend the money from Europe.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A bod yn onest, Brif Weinidog, mae wedi mynd i Ewrop a chodi gwrychyn pawb. Mae wedi llwyddo i sicrhau bod ymron pawb am ei waed. Yn ôl a ddeallaf, dim ond dwy aelod-wladwriaeth sydd wedi dangos unrhyw barodrwydd i ystyried sefyllfa'r DU. Yn hytrach na rhuthro o gwmpas Ewrop yn ceisio taflu cytundeb munud olaf at ei gilydd, oni ddylai Tony Blair fod wedi gweithio ar hyn fisoedd lawer ynghynt, fel y gallai gwledydd fel Cymru barhau i gael budd o gyllid Amcan 1? Onid ydyw wedi rhoi'r cyfan heibio, a beth a ddywed hyn am eich dylanwad gyda Tony Blair, Brif Weinidog?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ymddengys i mi'n nad yw'n werth y drafferth rhagweld methiant cyn i'r uwchgynhadledd ddechrau. Mae'n rhaid i chi roi gredu'r ffaith bod rhannu'r boen er mwyn cael cyllideb y cytunir arni ar gyfer yr UE yn rhywbeth y mae pawb yn ei brofi bob saith mlynedd. Mae poen i'r DU o ran yr ad-daliad; mae poen i'r aelod-



involved for the new member states in terms of the cut, at least in the headline figure, in how much they would get from structural funds, and there is pain for France and some of the existing member states in terms of making commitments about the future reform of the common agricultural policy. Pain all round, for the collective good of Europe, is what it is about. Everyone agrees that they do not want a budget that goes much above the 1.0 per cent. I think that the budget pitched at 1.03 per cent will gain fairly widespread support, and then it is just a matter of whether you can fit everything into that 1.03 per cent budget figure.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** You said on Friday that you wanted an early deal on the EU budget, but not at any price. Can you tell us what that price is?

**The First Minister:** Had there been any proposal that would have reduced the funds available for public expenditure in Wales by trading away large chunks of the rebate, so that there was less rebate available—clearly, that could not be done without some impact on public expenditure in Wales—that would have been a deal at any price that would have been a bad deal for Wales.

**Michael German:** If Wales were to lose the £34 million a year that should be its share of the rebate that the UK will pay into the pot if the UK gets its deal through, and Wales also lost the opportunity of full structural funds, would that not be a bad deal for Wales? Would you say that this was a price that we should not have to pay?

**The First Minister:** It is anticipated that the rebate will go up from its current level of £3.5 billion a year to £4.7 billion a year, so there is no suggestion that the rebate would do anything other than rise. It is a question of how much of that rebate is given away in return for concessions from other parties around the table. You have made a calculation of how much that involves in terms of public expenditure for Wales, and it

wladwriaethau newydd o ran y toriad, o leiaf yn y prif ffigur, yn yr hyn y byddent yn ei dderbyn o gronfeydd strwythurol, ac mae poen i Ffrainc a rhai o'r aelod-wladwriaethau presennol o ran gwneud ymrwymiadau ynghylch diwygio'r polisi amaethyddol cyffredin yn y dyfodol. Poen i bawb, er budd Ewrop yn ei chyfanrwydd, dyna sy'n digwydd. Mae pawb yn gytûn nad oes arnynt eisiau cyllideb sydd ryw lawer yn uwch nag 1.0 y cant. Yr wyf o'r farn y bydd cyllideb ar 1.03 y cant yn derbyn cefnogaeth eithaf eang, ac yna dim ond mater o allu ffitio pob peth i mewn i'r ffigur hwnnw o 1.03 y cant ar gyfer y gyllideb ydyw.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Dywedasoch ddydd Gwener eich bod am gael cytundeb buan ar gyllideb yr UE, ond nid ar unrhyw bris. A allwch ddweud wrthym beth yw'r pris hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe byddai unrhyw gynnig a fyddai wedi gostwng yr arian sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru drwy roi rhannau helaeth o'r ad-daliad wrth fargeinio, fel y byddai llai o ad-daliad ar gael—yn amlwg ni ellid gwneud hynny heb rywfaint o effaith ar wariant cyhoeddus yng Nghymru—byddai hynny wedi bod yn gytundeb ar unrhyw bris, a fyddai wedi bod yn fargen wael i Gymru.

**Michael German:** Pe byddai Cymru'n colli'r £34 miliwn y flwyddyn, sef ei chyfran hi o'r ad-daliad y bydd y DU yn ei thalu i mewn i'r gronfa ganolog os caiff cytundeb y DU ei dderbyn, a bod Cymru hefyd yn colli'r cyfle i gael cronfeydd strwythurol llawn, oni fyddai hynny'n fargen wael i Gymru? A fydddech yn dweud bod hyn yn bris na ddylem orfod ei dalu?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Rhagwelir y bydd yr ad-daliad yn cynyddu o'i lefel bresennol o £3.5 biliwn y flwyddyn i £4.7 biliwn y flwyddyn, felly nid oes dim awgrym y byddai'r ad-daliad yn gwneud dim byd ond cynyddu. Y cwestiwn yw faint o'r ad-daliad hwnnw a roddir yn gyfnewid am gonsesiynau gan bartïon eraill o amgylch y bwrdd. Yr ydych wedi cyfrifo faint y mae hynny'n ei olygu o ran gwariant cyhoeddus i Gymru, ac yn

is clearly in our interest that there should be an agreement at the summit. However, to play this in a one-sided way, as you and Ieuan are doing, by saying that other countries must not give anything away and that Tony Blair must give everything away to achieve a budget, seems not to be describing the processes that always occur at this time every seven years. Every party must give something away in order to reach an agreement. If we have an agreement, west Wales and the Valleys will continue to benefit from something very similar to Objective 1.

**Michael German:** The figure that I quoted, of £34 million a year, is the 15 per cent rebate that we would have to contribute. Wales would have to contribute part of that loss in terms of public expenditure. If you put that alongside the figure of 10 per cent of structural funds—not just Objective 1, but Objective 2, Objective 3 and everything else that follows from those—is that a better case? In other words, is the £38 million that we would lose because of this offer from Tony Blair equivalent to, less than or the same as the amount of European money that we would receive if there was a budget deal at this point in time?

**The First Minister:** We all have the details of the UK tabled proposal available to us. However, those proposals will change during negotiations on 15 and 16 December. It is clear to me that we can continue to entertain a reasonable hope in this regard, with maybe a 50:50 chance—or maybe slightly less, given the unknown quantity of things like the new German Government. The UK Government knows that we want an early deal, but it also knows that you cannot give everything else away in order to achieve it. That would make no sense. No-one would expect us to press the British Government to trade away the whole of the rebate, which is what the other member states are applying a lot of pressure to achieve. They regard the rebate as an anomaly. The British Government would say—and we would support it—that it is only an anomaly caused by another anomaly, namely the distortion of the EU budget caused by the sheer size of the common agricultural policy.

amlwg mae er budd i ni fod cytundeb yn digwydd yn yr uwchgynhadledd. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymddangos i mi nad yw chwarae hyn mewn ffordd unochrog, fel yr ydych chi a Ieuan yn gwneud, drwy ddweud fod yn rhaid i wledydd eraill beidio â rhoi dim a bod rhaid i Tony Blair roi popeth i sicrhau cyllideb, yn ddisgrifiad cywir o'r prosesau a fydd bob amser yn digwydd ar yr adeg hon bob saith mlynedd. Rhaid i bob parti ildio rhywbeth er mwyn cael cytundeb. Os cawn gytundeb, bydd gorllewin Cymru a'r Cymoedd yn dal i elwa o rywbeth tebyg iawn i Amcan 1.

**Michael German:** Y ffigur a ddyfynnais i, sef £34 miliwn y flwyddyn, yw'r 15 y cant o ad-daliad y byddai'n rhaid i ni ei gyfrannu. Byddai'n rhaid i Gymru gyfrannu rhan o'r golled honno o ran gwariant cyhoeddus. Os rhowch hynny ochr yn ochr â'r ffigur o 10 y cant o gronfeydd strwythurol—nid Amcan 1 yn unig, ond Amcan 2, Amcan 3 a phopeth arall sydd yn dilyn o'r rheini—a yw hynny'n well sefyllfa? Mewn geiriau eraill, a ydyw'r £38 miliwn a gollem oherwydd y cynnig hwn gan Tony Blair yn gyfwerth â'r swm o arian Ewropeaidd a gaem pe bai dêl ynghylch y gyllideb ar hyn o bryd, yn llai na hynny, neu yr un fath â hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae holl fanylion y cynnig sydd wedi'i gyflwyno gan y Deyrnas Unedig ar gael inni. Fodd bynnag, bydd y cynigion hynny'n newid yn ystod y trafodaethau ar 15 ac 16 Rhagfyr. Mae'n glir i mi y gallwn barhau i fyw mewn gobaith rhesymol yn hyn o beth, gyda chyfle 50:50 efallai—neu efallai ychydig yn llai, o gofio mor anhysbys yw ffactorau megis Llywodraeth newydd yr Almaen. Mae Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig yn gwybod bod arnom eisiau cytundeb cynnar, ond gŵyr hefyd na allwch roi popeth arall er mwyn ei gael. Ni fyddai hynny'n gwneud dim synnwyr. Ni fyddai neb yn disgwyl inni bwyso ar Lywodraeth Prydain i roi'r cyfan o'r ad-daliad wrth fargeinio, sef yr hyn y mae'r aelod-wladwriaethau eraill yn pwyso'n drwm i geisio'i sicrhau. Maent hwy'n gweld yr ad-daliad fel rhywbeth afreolaidd. Byddai Llywodraeth Prydain yn dweud—a byddem ni'n ei chefnogi—nad yw ond afreoleidd-dra a achosir gan afreoleidd-dra arall, sef y llurgunio ar gyllideb yr UE a achosir gan

faint enfawr y polisi amaethyddol cyffredin.

**Pecyn Adfywio Corus (Glynebwy)  
The Corus Regeneration Package (Ebbw Vale)**

**Q3 Peter Law:** What progress is the Welsh Assembly Government making with regard to the Corus regeneration package (Ebbw Vale)? OAQ1054(FM)

**The First Minister:** Reclamation works, thought to be worth about £15 million, began on the 200-acre former Corus tinplate works site at Ebbw Vale last month. That will help to lever in work on this major redevelopment site, which involves a new community hospital, learning campus, primary school, some 500 houses and other features that you get in a big urban regeneration scheme on this scale.

**Peter Law:** We were pleased to hear about the package, but I hope that you will appreciate the view of many of my constituents who feel that progress has been disappointing. The railway was to reopen at the beginning of 2005—11 months ago—but there is nothing yet running on it. The learning campus has disappeared into thin air and the opening of the community hospital, which is vitally important, has been put back to 2009, and no bricks have yet been laid. Is it not time that somebody did something to deliver the package that was announced in 2003?

**The First Minister:** I understand the sense of disappointment that things do not happen overnight, but you and I have seen the complexity of the demolition project. There are huge voids under the site because of mineshafts that were there even before the tinplate works were opened in the 1930s. Those voids have to be filled and capped. The site is hugely complex. You will be aware of the Felindre tinplate works site, where very little has happened in 23 years, so progress is pretty quick in Ebbw Vale. However, I understand the sense of disappointment within the community.

I will ask Jane Davidson to write to you about the learning campus because, although it might be less than people expected, it has not vanished into thin air, as far as I am

**C3 Peter Law:** Pa gynnydd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ei wneud gyda phecyn adfywio Corus (Glynebwy)? OAQ1054(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dechreuodd gwaith adfer, y tybir ei fod yn werth rhyw £15 miliwn, ar safle 200 erw hen waith tunplat Corus yng Nglynebwy y mis diwethaf. Bydd hynny'n gymorth i ddod â gwaith ar y safle ailddatblygu pwysig hwn, sy'n cynnwys ysbyty cymuned newydd, campws dysgu, ysgol gynradd, rhyw 500 o dai a nodweddion eraill a geir mewn cynllun adfywio trefol mawr o'r maint hwn.

**Peter Law:** Yr oedd yn dda gennym glywed am y pecyn, ond gobeithiaf y byddwch yn deall barn llawer o'm hetholwyr sydd yn teimlo bod yr hyn a gyflawnwyd hyd yma yn siomedig. Yr oedd y rheilffordd i fod i ailagor ar ddechrau 2005—11 mis yn ôl—ond nid oes dim byd yn rhedeg arni eto. Mae'r campws dysgu wedi diflannu i'r gwynt ac mae agoriad yr ysbyty cymuned, sydd yn hollbwysig, wedi'i ohirio tan 2009, ac nid oes bricsen wedi'i gosod eto. Onid yw'n bryd i rywun wneud rhywbeth i wireddu'r pecyn a gyhoeddwyd yn 2003?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Deallaf y siom a deimlir nad yw pethau'n digwydd dros nos, ond yr ydych chi a mi wedi gweld cymhlethdod y prosiect dymchwel. Mae gwagleoedd enfawr dan y safle oherwydd siaffftiau pyllau a oedd yno hyd yn oed cyn agor y gwaith tunplat yn y 1930au. Mae'n rhaid llenwi'r gwagleoedd hynny a gosod caead arnynt. Mae'r safle'n aruthrol o gymhleth. Byddwch yn gwybod am safle gwaith tunplat Felindre, lle nad oes fawr ddim wedi digwydd ers 23 o flynyddoedd, felly mae pethau'n digwydd yn eithaf cyflym yng Nglynebwy. Fodd bynnag, deallaf y siom a deimlir o fewn y gymuned.

Gofynnaf i Jane Davidson ysgrifennu atoch am y campws dysgu oherwydd, er ei fod efallai'n llai nag yr oedd pobl yn disgwyl iddo fod, nid yw wedi diflannu i'r gwynt, hyd

aware.

**Laura Anne Jones:** This regeneration scheme, particularly the rail link, is vital to Blaenau Gwent and the surrounding area. I understand why Peter Law and his constituents are so frustrated at the fact that it has not yet come about. The southern part of the Ebbw Vale site has been acquired by the health authority for a new hospital. If capital has been released, will it go to Corus or will it go back into the scheme?

2.20 p.m.

**The First Minister:** The programme over the 200-acre site involves a thriving new community—something between an urban village and a new urban settlement. There will be new employment opportunities for 1,500 people, a primary school, 500 houses, a new higher education establishment, a local general hospital and a new railway station. Beat that. It is not happening overnight because the demolition has taken a long time, but the regeneration contract has now been let. The railway contract has also been let. The outline business case for the new hospital has been approved, and we are waiting for the full business case. Therefore, this is a very major new urban regeneration programme that will be delivered.

y gwn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** Mae'r cynllun adfywio hwn, yn enwedig y cyswllt rheilffordd, yn hanfodol i Flaenau Gwent a'r cylch. Deallaf pam y mae Peter Law a'i etholwyr yn teimlo cymaint o rwystredigaeth ynglŷn â'r ffaith nad yw wedi digwydd eto. Mae rhan ddeheuol safle Glynebwy wedi'i phrynu gan yr awdurdod iechyd ar gyfer ysbyty newydd. Os oes cyfalaf wedi'i ryddhau, a aiff i Corus ynteu a aiff yn ôl i mewn i'r cynllun?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r rhaglen ar gyfer y safle 200 erw yn cynnwys cymuned newydd ffyniannus—rhywbeth rhwng pentref trefol a thref newydd. Bydd cyfleoedd cyflogaeth newydd i 1,500 o bobl, ysgol gynradd, 500 o dai, sefydliad addysg uwch newydd, ysbyty cyffredinol lleol a gorsaf rheilffordd newydd. Anodd gwneud yn well na hynny. Nid yw'n digwydd dros nos oherwydd y mae'r gwaith dymchwel wedi cymryd amser maith, ond mae'r contract adfywio bellach wedi'i osod. Mae contract y rheilffordd wedi'i osod hefyd. Mae'r achos busnes amlinellol ar gyfer yr ysbyty newydd wedi'i gymeradwyo, ac yr ydym yn aros am yr achos busnes llawn. Felly, dyma raglen adfywio trefol newydd fawr iawn a gaiff ei chyflawni.

### **Cefnffordd yr A55 The A55 Trunk Road**

**Q4 Brynle Williams:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the future development of the A55 in north Wales? OAQ1068(FM)

Prynhawn da i chi, Brif Weinidog.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Prynhawn da i chi hefyd, Brynle, a chyfarchion y tymor.

The trunk road forward programme update, published in 2004, includes three A55 schemes in phase 2, namely the pre-2010 start category. Those three are: the A55/A494 Ewloe interchange, the A55 stretch from Ewloe to Northop scheme, and the A55 from Aber to Tai'r Meibion scheme.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for that comprehensive answer. Given the high

**C4 Brynle Williams:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiad yr A55 yn y gogledd i'r dyfodol? OAQ1068(FM)

Good afternoon to you, First Minister.

**The First Minister:** Good afternoon to you, too, Brynle, and season's greetings.

Mae diweddariad y flaenraglen gefnffyrdd, a gyhoeddwyd yn 2004, yn cynnwys tri chynllun ar yr A55 yng nghanam 2, sef y categori dechrau cyn 2010. Dyma'r tri: cyfnewidfa'r A55/A494 yn Ewloe, cynllun yr A55 o Ewloe i Laneurgain, a chynllun yr A55 o Aber i Dai'r Meibion.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch am yr ateb cynhwysfawr hwnnw. O ystyried y nifer fawr

volume of heavy goods vehicle traffic on the A55 in north Wales, and the recent high-profile publicity campaign by North Wales Police, the absence of a truck stop is a serious matter. Is the Welsh Assembly Government currently looking at any way of resolving the fact that the heavy goods industry does not have a truck stop between Holyhead and the English border?

**The First Minister:** As a one-man truck stop in your earlier days, Brynle, you have a great deal of expertise on this subject. [*Laughter.*] I accept what you say. It is important for truckers to have facilities at services to stop and to sleep because it is important that we do not have tired lorry drivers driving HGVs through Wales and then onwards into England or over into Ireland.

**Carl Sargeant:** The A55 is an important trunk road across the east to the west of north Wales. Do you agree that it is also vital to support local business and major industry in the area? The A55 trunk road should be serving local need as well as major infrastructure for the industrial areas, for example, Raytheon and Airbus. There is a small town in that area serviced by poor roads around a local village. They should have some access to the A55.

**The First Minister:** I am not certain of the details of interchanges that you mention, but the A55 is one of those strange roads that is not quite a motorway. It also serves as a local collecting road. The junction where the A55 goes into Chester and Wrexham and then across into Queensferry is an extremely important part of the infrastructure of north-east Wales and north-west England.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Yn ysbryd y prynhawn, dymunaf Nadolig llawen i chi, Brif Weinidog.

Mae'r A55 wedi ysbarduno gweithgarwch economaidd ar hyd ei llwybr, yn enwedig yn y dwyrain. A gytunwch fod cysylltiadau trafniadaeth gwell i'r de ac i'r gorllewin o'r A55 yn hanfodol er mwyn rhoi cyfle teg i'r ardaloedd hynny i ddatblygu'n economaidd?

o gerbydau nwyddau trwm ar yr A55 yn y gogledd, a'r ymgyrch cyhoeddusrwydd amlwg iawn yn ddiweddar gan Heddlu'r Gogledd, mae diffyg arhosfan i lorïau'n fater difrifol. A ydyw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n edrych ar hyn o bryd ar unrhyw ffordd o ddatrys y ffaith nad oes gan y diwydiant cerbydau nwyddau trwm arhosfan i lorïau rhwng Caergybi a'r ffin â Lloegr?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Fel ataliwr lorïau un dyn yn eich dyddiau gynt, Brynle, mae gennych gryn arbenigedd ar y pwnc hwn. [*Chwerthin.*] Derbyniat yr hyn a ddywedwch. Mae'n bwysig i yrwyr lorïau gael cyfleusterau mewn mannau gwasanaeth i aros a chysgu oherwydd y mae'n bwysig nad oes gennym yrwyr lorïau blinedig yn gyrru cerbydau nwyddau trwm drwy Gymru ac yna ymlaen i Loegr neu drosodd i Iwerddon.

**Carl Sargeant:** Mae'r A55 yn gefnffordd bwysig ar draws y dwyrain i orllewin y gogledd. A gytunwch ei bod hefyd yn allweddol cefnogi busnesau lleol a diwydiant mawr yn yr ardal? Dylai cefnffordd yr A55 fod yn gwasanaethu'r angen lleol yn ogystal â'r seilwaith pwysig i'r ardaloedd diwydiannol, er enghraifft, Raytheon ac Airbus. Mae tref fach yn yr ardal honno a wasanaethir gan ffyrdd gwael o amgylch pentref lleol. Dylent gael rhyw fodd o fynd ar yr A55.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr am fanylion y cyfnewidfeydd yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt, ond mae'r A55 yn un o'r ffyrdd od hynny nad ydynt yn draffyrdd yn hollol. Mae hefyd yn gwasanaethu fel ffordd gasglu lleol. Mae'r gyffordd lle yr aiff yr A55 i mewn i Gaer a Wrecsam ac wedyn ar draws i Queensferry yn rhan eithriadol o bwysig o seilwaith gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr.

**Alun Ffred Jones:** In the spirit of the afternoon, I wish you a merry Christmas, First Minister.

The A55 has stimulated economic activity along its entire route, particularly in the east. Do you agree that better transport links to the south and the west of the A55 are vital in order to give those areas a fair opportunity to develop economically? If so, is your

Os felly, a yw eich Llywodraeth yn ymrwymo i wneud hynny?

Government committing itself to doing that?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym bob amser wedi ystyried yr A55, nid yn unig fel heol sy'n mynd o Ddulyn i Lundain drwy Gymru, ond fel heol a fydd yn dod â mwy o ffyniant i'r economi ar draws gogledd-orllewin a gogledd-ddwyrain Cymru. Ni allwch wneud hynny os nad oes heolydd yn cysylltu â'r A55. Os oes cyfleoedd sydd heb eu cymryd, yn eich barn chi, byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe baech yn ysgrifennu ataf â'r manylion. Diolch am eich cyfarchion a dymunaf yr un i chi.

**The First Minister:** We have always considered the A55, not only as a road that goes from Dublin to London through Wales, but as a road that will bring greater prosperity to the economy across the north-west and north-east of Wales. You cannot do that unless you have roads linking in to the A55. If you know of any missed opportunities, I would be grateful if you would write to me with the details. Thank you for your greetings and I wish the same to you.

### **Polisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym Maes Tai The Welsh Assembly Government's Policies on Housing**

**Q5 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's policies on housing? OAQ1073(FM)

**C5 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ym maes tai? OAQ1073(FM)

**The First Minister:** Our policies continue to develop within the framework established by our national housing strategy, 'Better Homes for People in Wales'.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein polisiau'n parhau i ddatblygu o fewn y fframwaith a sefydlwyd gan ein strategaeth dai genedlaethol, 'Cartrefi Gwell i Bobl Cymru'.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Are you as pleased as Plaid Cymru that Gordon Brown has now recognised his self-investment personal pension schemes for what they are, namely an appalling scheme allowing and encouraging wealthy people to buy second homes as part of their pension pot?

**Jocelyn Davies:** A ydych chithau mor falch â Phlaid Cymru fod Gordon Brown bellach wedi cydnabod beth yw ei gynlluniau pensiwn personol hunan-fuddsoddiad, sef cynllun enbyd a fyddai'n caniatáu i bobl gyfoethog brynu ail gartrefi fel rhan o'u cronfa bensiwn, ac yn eu hannog i wneud hynny?

**The First Minister:** A fair point, I think, and I believe that we have made the same point to the Chancellor. That does not mean that self-investment personal pension schemes have disappeared; it means that they have been tweaked. Anyone with a self-directed pension plan can put their money into property, and that on a tax-exempt basis. However, they cannot do it directly. It has to be done via a real estate investment trust, which is a welcome development.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pwynt teg, fe dybiaf, a chredaf ein bod wedi gwneud yr un pwynt i'r Canghellor. Nid yw hynny'n golygu bod cynlluniau pensiwn personol hunan-fuddsoddiad wedi diflannu; mae'n golygu eu bod wedi'u haddasu. Gall unrhyw un â chynllun pensiwn hunan-gyfeiriedig roi eu harian mewn eiddo, a hynny'n ddi-dreth. Fodd bynnag, ni allant wneud hynny'n uniongyrchol. Rhaid ei wneud drwy ymddiriedolaeth sy'n buddsoddi mewn eiddo tiriog, sydd yn ddatblygiad i'w groesawu.

**John Griffiths:** Do you agree that politics is the art of the possible and, as far as stock transfers are concerned in relation to housing in Wales, although there are issues around

**John Griffiths:** A gytunwch mai celfyddyd y posibl yw gwleidyddiaeth ac, o ran trosglwyddo stoc mewn perthynas â thai yng Nghymru, er bod cwestiynau ynghylch

local democracy and accountability, it offers some positive possibilities for community regeneration that might be particularly aimed at benefiting disadvantaged communities?

**The First Minister:** If stock transfer takes place beyond the Valleys-to-coast area, which is the council housing stock of Bridgend County Borough Council, then it will certainly be on the basis that the tenants have a veto. We hope that many people living in those communities will have new job and skills opportunities in upgrading the houses. Some local authorities say that they can bring houses up to the Welsh housing quality standard by 2012 without stock transfer. Others have accepted that it is almost impossible unless there is stock transfer. The important thing is that we have the houses improved to the WHQS by 2012 and that we get as many jobs and as much investment as possible into our communities through that mechanism.

**Mark Isherwood:** Yesterday, the Chancellor re-announced his affordable-homes policy with the added bonus that, this time, he had the agreement of the mortgage lenders first. What Christmas message do you have, First Minister, for the growing numbers in Wales trapped on housing waiting lists, and living in unfit properties, as well as the growing number of homeless people in Wales under your Government?

**The First Minister:** I think that it is fair to say that the Chancellor recognised the need for an increased priority to be given to increasing the supply of affordable homes. There are questions regarding the definition of a lack of affordable homes, such as whether it is a lack of social housing, an insufficient number of homes, or a lack of low-cost private sector homes. The Chancellor concentrated on the shared-equity issue, which we strongly support because many people would like to get a foot on the property ladder but cannot because house prices are high, although the rise in interest rates has caused that rise in house prices to stop for a year or so. It is important that people, especially young couples, access the shared-equity schemes that will now become

democratiaeth ac atebolrwydd lleol, ei fod yn cynnig rhai posibiladau cadarnhaol ar gyfer adfywio cymunedau y gellid eu hanelu'n arbennig at roi manteision i gymunedau difreintiedig?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Os digwydd trosglwyddo stoc y tu hwnt i'r ardal rhwng y Cymoedd a'r arfordir, sef stoc dai cyngor Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Pen-y-bont ar Ogwr, yna yn sicr fe ddigwydd hynny ar y sail bod gan y tenantiaid fetu. Gobeithiwn y caiff llawer o bobl sydd yn byw yn y cymunedau hynny gyfleoedd i gael gwaith a sgiliau newydd wrth uwchraddio'r tai. Dywed rhai awdurdodau lleol y gallant godi eu tai hyd at safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012 heb drosglwyddo stoc. Mae eraill wedi derbyn ei bod bron yn amhosibl heb drosglwyddo stoc. Y peth pwysig yw inni sicrhau bod y tai'n cael eu gwella hyd at safon ansawdd tai Cymru erbyn 2012 a'n bod yn cael cynifer o swyddi a chymaint o fuddsoddiad ag sy'n bosibl i'n cymunedau drwy'r mecanwaith hwnnw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Ddoe, ailgyhoeddodd y Canghellor ei bolisi tai fforddiadwy gyda'r bonws ychwanegol ei fod, y tro hwn, wedi cael cytundeb y benthycewyr morgeisi yn gyntaf. Pa neges Nadolig sydd gennych, Brif Weinidog, i'r niferoedd cynyddol yng Nghymru sydd wedi'u dal ar restrau aros am dai, ac sy'n byw mewn adeiladau anaddas, yn ogystal â'r nifer gynyddol o bobl ddigartref yng Nghymru dan eich Llywodraeth chi?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf ei bod yn deg dweud bod y Canghellor wedi gweld yr angen i roi mwy o flaenoriaeth i gynyddu'r cyflenwad o gartrefi fforddiadwy. Mae cwestiynau ynghylch y diffiniad o ddiffyg cartrefi fforddiadwy, megis ai diffyg tai cymdeithasol ydyw, dim digon o gartrefi, ynteu diffyg cartrefi cost isel yn y sector preifat. Canolbwyntiodd y Canghellor ar gwestiwn rhannu ecwiti, rhywbeth yr ydym yn gryf o'i blaid oherwydd byddai llawer o bobl yn hoffi cael troed ar yr ysgol eiddo ond yn methu â gwneud hynny am fod prisiau tai'n uchel, er bod y cynnydd mewn cyfraddau llog wedi atal y cynnydd hwnnw mewn prisiau tai am ryw flwyddyn. Mae'n bwysig i bobl, yn enwedig parau ifanc, fanteisio ar y cynlluniau rhannu ecwiti a fydd

available on a wider scale.

**Mick Bates:** Representatives of the Warm Homes campaign, some of which are in the Assembly today, issued me with figures showing that 43 of the deaths in my constituency of Montgomeryshire during the winter over the past five years were the result of poor home heating. They also occurred mainly among the elderly. What is your Government doing to reverse that trend, and to ensure that no elderly people die because their homes are not warm enough?

**The First Minister:** This higher death rate in winter, compared with the summer, especially among elderly people, has been known for some 30 years. At first, people were surprised by it as it does not happen in Sweden or Finland, which are far colder countries. However, here, we tend to just cross our fingers and hope that there will not be a hard winter, but people have realised that this is not good enough, especially at a time of high oil prices, which, in turn, drag up the price of gas. That causes fear among old people, who tend not to use the heating systems that they do have because they fear getting into debt if they do so. I am not familiar with the figure of 43 excess deaths, and I am not sure how you obtained that particular figure. What is important is that the home energy efficiency scheme, which we have promoted heavily and funded very well, continues to expand with the additional funding that we have announced. It will virtually double the amount available for pensioners' home energy efficiency schemes in Wales.

ar gael bellach ar raddfa ehangach.

**Mick Bates:** Rhoddodd cynrychiolwyr yr ymgyrch Cartrefi Cynnes, y mae rhai ohonynt yn y Cynulliad heddiw, ffigurau imi sy'n dangos bod 43 o'r marwolaethau yn fy etholaeth, sef sir Drefaldwyn, yn ystod y gaeaf dros y pum mlynedd diwethaf wedi digwydd o ganlyniad i wresogi gwael yn y cartref. Digwyddasant yn bennaf ymhlith yr henoed hefyd. Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i wrthdroi'r duedd honno, a sicrhau na fydd dim pobl oedrannus yn marw am nad yw eu cartrefi'n ddigon cynnes?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r gyfradd farwolaethau uwch hon yn y gaeaf, o'i chymharu â'r haf, yn enwedig ymysg pobl oedrannus, yn hysbys ers rhyw 30 mlynedd. Ar y dechrau, yr oedd yn syndod i bobl oherwydd nid yw'n digwydd yn Sweden na'r Ffindir, sydd yn wledydd llawer oerach. Fodd bynnag, yma, tueddwn i groesi'n bysedd a gobeithio na chawn aeaf caled, ond mae pobl wedi sylweddoli nad yw hyn yn ddigon da, yn enwedig ar adeg pan fo prisiau olew'n uchel, a'r rheini, yn eu tro, yn peri i bris nwy godi. Mae hynny'n codi ofn ymhlith hen bobl, sy'n tueddu i beidio â defnyddio'r systemau gwresogi sydd ganddynt oherwydd bod arnynt ofn mynd i ddyled os gwnânt. Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r ffigur o 43 o farwolaethau'n ychwanegol, ac nid wyf yn siŵr sut y cawsoch y ffigur penodol hwnnw. Yr hyn sydd yn bwysig yw bod y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, yr ydym wedi'i hyrwyddo'n fawr ac wedi'i ariannu'n dda iawn, yn dal i dyfu gyda'r cyllid ychwanegol yr ydym wedi'i gyhoeddi. I bob pwrpas bydd yn dyblu'r swm sydd ar gael ar gyfer cynlluniau effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref i bensynwyr yng Nghymru.

### **'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru' 'Better Governance for Wales'**

**Q6 Janet Ryder:** What recent discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding 'Better Governance for Wales'? OAQ1074(FM)

**The First Minister:** I meet the Secretary of State for Wales regularly, and the White Paper features in our discussions. I have also

**C6 Janet Ryder:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal yn ddiweddar gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru'? OAQ1074(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Byddaf yn cwrdd ag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n rheolaidd, a soniwn am y Papur Gwyn yn ein



occasionally discussed this matter with other Ministers.

**Janet Ryder:** I understand that the Bill is likely to be published next Thursday. I also understand that the Assembly Government Cabinet has already received a presentation on its content. Since you may be aware of the detail of the Bill, how much notice has the Westminster Government taken of the Assembly's Committee on Better Governance for Wales White Paper and its recommendations?

2.30 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I cannot give you a percentage figure, but it has certainly taken note of the provisions or recommendations of the Assembly committee on the Bill, and many other factors. Ultimately, it is a UK Government responsibility, because it is a UK Government Bill being delivered by a Labour Government because it was a Labour Government manifesto commitment in the last general election.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** Having heard the First Minister's response, I am pleased that attention has been paid to the recommendations of our committee.

In respect of the issue relating to Orders in Council specifically, I know that when the Richard commission report was published, the First Minister welcomed it and seemed to see that as the way forward. Since then, we have a rather different way forward in terms of the White Paper and now the forthcoming Bill, as Janet Ryder has said. How do you anticipate that that will work in terms of the patchy performance of some Westminster Government departments? I am thinking of the Home Office failing to consult us properly on the police, and the slow progress of the Department of Trade and Industry in transferring responsibility over energy projects, for example, which has taken ages. Is the First Minister convinced that, given their performance, this will be carried forward and will work?

trafodaethau. Yr wyf hefyd wedi trafod y mater hwn yn achlysurol gyda Gweinidogion eraill.

**Janet Ryder:** Deallaf fod y Mesur yn debygol o gael ei gyhoeddi ddydd Iau nesaf. Deallaf hefyd fod Cabinet Llywodraeth y Cynulliad eisoes wedi cael cyflwyniad ar ei gynnwys. Gan eich bod efallai'n ymwybodol o gynnwys y Mesur, faint o sylw y mae Llywodraeth San Steffan wedi'i roi i Bwyllgor y Cynulliad ar y Papur Gwyn 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru' a'i argymhellion?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf roi ffigur canrannol i chi, ond yn sicr mae wedi cymryd sylw o ddarpariaethau neu argymhellion pwyllgor y Cynulliad ar y Mesur, a sawl ffactor arall. Yn y pen draw, cyfrifoldeb Llywodraeth y DU ydyw, gan mai Mesur Llywodraeth y DU ydyw a roddir gerbron gan Lywodraeth Lafur am fod ymrwymiad i wneud hynny ym maniffesto'r Llywodraeth Lafur yn yr etholiad cyffredinol diwethaf.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Wedi clywed ymateb y Prif Weinidog, yr wyf yn falch bod sylw wedi'i roi i argymhellion ein pwyllgor.

Gyda golwg ar y mater sydd yn ymwneud â Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn benodol, gwn fod y Prif Weinidog wedi croesawu hynny pan gyhoeddwyd adroddiad comisiwn Richard, ac ymddangosai ei fod yn ystyried mai hynny oedd y ffordd ymlaen. Ers hynny, mae gennym ffordd ymlaen sydd braidd yn wahanol o ran y Papur Gwyn ac yn awr y Mesur sydd ar ddod, fel y dywedodd Janet Ryder. Sut yr ydych yn rhagweld y bydd hynny'n gweithio o gofio am berfformiad anwastad rhai o adrannau Llywodraeth San Steffan? Yr hyn sydd gennyf dan sylw yw bod y Swyddfa Gartref heb ymgynghori'n briodol â ni ynghylch yr heddlu, a'r cynnydd araf yn yr Adran Masnach a Diwydiant wrth drosglwyddo cyfrifoldeb dros brosiectau ynni, er enghraifft, gan fod hynny wedi cymryd hydroedd. A yw'r Prif Weinidog wedi'i argyhoeddi, o gofio am eu perfformiad, y

bydd hyn yn mynd rhagddo ac yn llwyddo?

**The First Minister:** I hesitate to say this, as you are a lawyer and I am not, but I think that you are confusing Orders in Council and transfer of functions Orders. Orders in Council are confined to areas that are devolved, whereas you are talking about issues over which the Assembly has sought to acquire additional powers, or on which the Assembly has indicated that it has strong views, such as police structures, which are not devolved but where we were consulted by the Home Secretary. Orders in Council relate to areas that are devolved, and our asking for the power to legislate in an area that is devolved, and then Parliament agreeing to release that power to us.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn petruso cyn dweud hyn, gan eich bod chi'n gyfreithiwr ac nad wyf fi ddim, ond credaf eich bod yn cymysgu rhwng Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor a Gorchmynion i drosglwyddo swyddogaethau. Mae Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn gyfyngedig i feysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli, ond yr ydych chi'n sôn am faterion y mae'r Cynulliad wedi ceisio cael pwerau ychwanegol drostynt, neu rai y mae wedi nodi bod ganddo farn bendant yn eu cylch, fel strwythurau'r heddlu, nad ydynt wedi'u datganoli ond yr ymgynghorwyd â ni yn eu cylch gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Mae Gorchmynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn ymwneud â meysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli, a cheisiadau gennym ni am bŵer i ddeddfu mewn maes sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, a chytundeb gan y Senedd wedyn i adael i ni gael y pŵer hwnnw.

Transfer of functions can take place at any time at our bid, or sometimes because Westminster thinks that it is better for us to be the responsible level of government for such and such a power. Although you mentioned ones that we do not have, I think that 2004 was a record year in terms of the numbers of additional powers that we did get.

Gellir trosglwyddo swyddogaethau ar unrhyw adeg ar ein cais, neu weithiau am fod San Steffan yn credu bod yn well i ni fod yn lefel o lywodraeth sy'n gyfrifol am ryw bŵer neu'i gilydd. Er eich bod wedi cyfeirio at rai nad ydynt gennym, credaf mai 2004 oedd y flwyddyn orau erioed o ran nifer y pwerau ychwanegol a gawsom.

**Nick Bourne:** I appreciate the distinction; perhaps I did not put it terribly elegantly. Given the attitude that exists in some parts of Whitehall or Westminster to the transfer of functions, that could well carry across to primary powers in relation to some of the devolved areas. The clerk of the House of Commons, I think, has said that it is not exactly clear how this will work. The Home Office has said that there is a need to raise awareness in the Home Office about the political landscape since devolution. How can we ensure that they understand our needs when we make those bids? That is what I was trying to get at.

**Nick Bourne:** Deallaf y gwahaniaeth; efallai nad oeddwn wedi'i eirio'n gelfydd iawn. O ystyried yr agwedd a geir mewn rhai rhannau o Whitehall neu San Steffan at drosglwyddo swyddogaethau, mae'n ddigon posibl y gallai hynny godi hefyd mewn cysylltiad â phwerau deddfu sylfaenol mewn rhai o'r meysydd sydd wedi'u datganoli. Mae clerc Tŷ'r Cyffredin, yr wyf yn meddwl, wedi dweud nad yw'n hollol glir sut y bydd hyn yn gweithio. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi dweud bod angen hybu ymwybyddiaeth yn y Swyddfa Gartref o'r sefyllfa wleidyddol ers datganoli. Sut y gallwn sicrhau eu bod yn deall ein hanghenion pan wnawn y ceisiadau hynny? Hynny a oedd gennyf dan sylw.

**The First Minister:** Fine. I agree that there will be a need for awareness-raising sessions for those involved in policy making in Westminster departments. The Home Office perhaps is not the best example because, generally speaking, it has powers that are not

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Purion. Yr wyf yn cytuno y bydd yn rhaid cael sesiynau hybu ymwybyddiaeth ar gyfer y rhai sydd yn ymwneud â llunio polisi yn adrannau San Steffan. Mae'n bosibl nad y Swyddfa Gartref yw'r enghraifft orau oherwydd, yn

devolved to us. It is departments such as the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister, health, education and so on, covering areas where powers are clearly devolved to us, which probably will be asked to take a decision, make a comment or advise the Minister when it comes to an Order in Council application, provided the Bill becomes law by the time of the commencement of the third Assembly.

**Jenny Randerson:** I do not have the advantage that you have had of having seen the Bill, but from my reading of the White Paper and the memorandum that you sent out, it seems that the gatekeeper role of the Secretary of State with respect to Orders in Council will be crucial. Can I suggest that you make a leap of the imagination for the moment and replace Peter Hain with Bill Wiggin? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.'] Do not laugh; it is possible. We all know that the Tory party is deeply divided on the issue of devolution—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The First Minister has no responsibility for Bill Wiggin, as far as I am aware.

**Jenny Randerson:** He does have an interest in the Secretary of State, Presiding Officer.

In the event of our having a Secretary of State in future who is not a friend of devolution, do you believe that there are sufficient safeguards in the Bill to prevent a Secretary of State from frustrating the will of this Assembly?

**The First Minister:** The matter of replacing Bill Wiggin is an issue for David Cameron and not a matter for me.

The issue of how you get a Secretary of State in a future Conservative Government whenever that might be, and on the assumption that we do not have a Conservative administration in the Assembly at the same time, is the key test of any devolution settlement: how robust is this when different parties are in power in Cardiff and in Westminster. Provided that there have been a few examples of Orders in Council

gyffredinol, nid yw'r pwerau sydd ganddi wedi'u datganoli i ni. Adranau fel Swyddfa'r Dirprwy Brif Weinidog, iechyd, addysg ac yn y blaen, sydd yn gofalu am feysydd lle y mae'n amlwg bod pwerau wedi'u datganoli i ni, yw'r rhai y mae'n debygol y gofynnir iddynt wneud penderfyniad, cyflwyno sylw neu gynghori'r Gweinidog pan wneir cais am Orchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor, ar yr amod y bydd y Mesur wedi'i wneud yn Ddeddf erbyn dechrau'r trydydd Cynulliad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Nid wyf wedi cael y fantais a gawsoch chi o fod wedi darllen y Mesur, ond yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallais o ddarllen y Papur Gwyn a'r memorandwm a ddisbarthasoch, ymddengys y bydd rôl yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol fel porthor ar gyfer Gorchymynion yn y Cyfrin Gyngor yn hollbwysig. A gaf awgrymu eich bod yn dychmygu am funud fod Bill Wiggin yn lle Peter Hain? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.'] Peidiwch â chwerthin; mae'n bosibl. Yr ydym oll yn gwybod bod rhaniad dwfn yn y blaidd Dorïaidd ar fater datganoli—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid oes gan y Prif Weinidog ddim cyfrifoldeb dros Bill Wiggin, hyd y gwn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae ganddo ddiddordeb yn yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, Lywydd.

Os bydd gennym Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn y dyfodol nad yw'n bleidiol i ddatganoli, a ydych yn credu bod amddiffyniadau digonol yn y Mesur i atal Ysgrifennydd Gwladol rhag mynd yn groes i ewyllys y Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i David Cameron yw rhoi rhywun yn lle Bill Wiggin, nid i mi.

Y cwestiwn ynglŷn â sut y cewch Ysgrifennydd Gwladol mewn Llywodraeth Geidwadol yn y dyfodol, pryd bynnag y gallai hynny fod, a chan gymryd na fydd gennym weinyddiaeth Geidwadol yn y Cynulliad yr un pryd, yw'r prawf allweddol ar unrhyw setliad datganoli: pa mor gadarn yw hyn pan fydd pleidiau gwahanol mewn grym yng Nghaerdydd ac yn San Steffan. Pe bai enghreifftiau o Orchymynion yn y Cyfrin

having gone through the whole procedure, it would be a high-risk strategy for a Conservative Secretary of State to reject an application for an Order in Council coming from here, especially if it had been in a manifesto.

Therefore, as parties, we all need to concentrate, when we prepare manifestos for the 2007 election, on ensuring that the bids that we would wish to make if we are in power in the third Assembly are there, plain and simple in the manifesto. I hope that a convention will then arise in our relationships with Westminster, as they do now as regards the House of Lords, with the Salisbury convention, where, if it is in your manifesto and you won a majority, then it is not up to a Secretary of State to say, 'Yes, but I do not like it'. That would be deeply colonial.

Gyngor wedi mynd drwy'r holl weithdrefn, byddai'n beryglus iawn i Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Ceidwadol wrthod cais am Orchymyn yn y Cyfrin Gyngor gan y Cynulliad, yn enwedig pe bai wedi bod mewn maniffesto.

Felly, fel pleidiau, rhaid inni oll ganolbwyntio, wrth baratoi maniffestos ar gyfer etholiad 2007, ar sicrhau bod y ceisiadau y dymunem eu gwneud os byddwn mewn grym yn y trydydd Cynulliad wedi'u cynnwys i bawb gael eu gweld yn y maniffesto. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y bydd confensiwn yn datblygu wedyn yn ein cysylltiadau â San Steffan, fel y'u gwelir yn awr yn achos confensiwn Salisbury ynglŷn â Thŷ'r Arglwyddi, fel na fydd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn gallu dweud, 'Ie, ond nid wyf yn hoffi hynny', os bydd yn eich maniffesto a chithau wedi cael mwyafrif. Byddai hynny'n beth trefedigol iawn.

### **Gwasanaethau Gwledig yng Ngheredigion Rural Services in Ceredigion**

**C7 Elin Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y mae polisiau'r Llywodraeth yn cefnogi gwasanaethau gwledig yng Ngheredigion? OAQ1070(FM)

**Q7 Elin Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on how Government policies support rural services in Ceredigion? OAQ1070(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd y codiad o tua 6 y cant yn yr arian sydd wedi ei glustnodi i Gyngor Sir Ceredigion yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf yn ei helpu i gefnogi gwasanaethau cefn gwlad ar draws y sir.

**The First Minister:** We hope that the increase of some 6 per cent in the funding allocated to Ceredigion County Council in the next financial year will assist it to support rural services across the county.

**Elin Jones:** Polisi eich Llywodraeth chi oedd creu byrddau iechyd lleol. Erbyn hyn, mae'n costio dros £4 miliwn i redeg costau gweinyddol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Ngheredigion. Mae'n costio ychydig dros £2 filiwn i redeg dau ysbyty cymunedol yng Ngheredigion—yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi. A gytunwch mai'r flaenoriaeth ddylai fod i uno'r ddau gorff gweinyddol, ac arbed arian drwy ffyrdd felly, yn hytrach na chau dau ysbyty cymunedol?

**Elin Jones:** It was your Government's policy to create local health boards. By now, it costs over £4 million to run the administrative costs of the national health service in Ceredigion. It costs just over £2 million to run two community hospitals in Ceredigion—at Tregaron and Cardigan. Do you agree that the priority should be to merge both administrative bodies, and to save money in such ways, rather than closing two community hospitals?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr ynglŷn â manylion eich ffigurau. Fodd bynnag, mae hawl gan y byrddau iechyd lleol i gyflwyno cais os ydynt yn awyddus i ymuno â'r ymddiriedolaeth iechyd leol i wneud yn

**The First Minister:** I am not sure about the details of your figures. However, the local health boards have the right to make a proposal if they are keen to join the local health trust to do exactly as has already been

union yr un peth ag sydd wedi digwydd eisoes ym Mhowys, dim ond bod y ffiniau yn union yr un peth, fel ag y maent, fe gredaf, yng Ngheredigion. Y peth pwysig wedyn, pan ydych yn cymharu costau gweinyddol â chostau rhedeg gwasanaeth mewn ysbyty, yw bod yn rhaid i rywun wneud y penderfyniadau ynglŷn â pha wasanaethau iechyd sydd eu heisiau ar yr ardal, beth yw'r galw, a beth yw'r ffordd orau o ateb y galw hwnnw. Dyna lle mae'r ddadl rhwng y bobl yn ardal Tregaron, er enghraifft, ac eraill: beth yn union yw'r galw a sut i ymateb i'r galw'n lleol.

**Lisa Francis:** Ceredigion Health Trust's debt of around £1.4 million is leading to this proposal to cut beds at community hospitals in Tregaron and Cardigan, as we have just heard. This is justified as a means of redesigning services. However, it is interesting that the same trust expressed grave concern last September when it realised that Gwynedd Local Health Board's threat to close beds at Tywyn Community Hospital could lead to bedblocking in Bronglais Hospital, Aberystwyth. The bid to close beds in community hospitals in Ceredigion is a cost-cutting exercise, is it not, First Minister, which is a result of your Government's mismanagement of the NHS service in Wales? This has nothing to do with streamlining or modernisation.

**The First Minister:** It is far too easy to say that without going into it in detail. The Wanless proposals involved a change in service provision. We all support that principle. We cannot have a 'not in my back yard' syndrome about changes in the NHS when it affects a particular hospital. If it is better to provide a service in another way, we should be thinking about the services that are provided, not regarding a set of buildings or a number of beds as a macho symbol of how good the health service is in that area. We all agree with that in principle, but we all do not want it to happen when it affects a hospital in our area.

done in Powys, so far as the borders are coterminous, as they are, I believe, in Ceredigion. The important thing then, when you compare administrative costs with the costs of running services in a hospital, is that someone must take the decision as to what health services are required in that area, what the demand is, and what is the best way to respond to that demand. That is where the debate is between people in the Tregaron area, for example, and others: what exactly the local demand is and how to respond to the demand locally.

**Lisa Francis:** Y ddyled o tua £1.4 miliwn sydd gan Ymddiriedolaeth Iechyd Ceredigion sydd yn arwain at y bwriad hwn i leihau nifer y gwelyau mewn ysbytai cymuned yn Nhregaron ac yn Aberteifi, fel yr ydym newydd glywed. Y cyfiawnhad a roddwyd dros hynny yw ei fod yn fodd i ailgynllunio gwasanaethau. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddi-ddorol bod yr un ymddiriedolaeth wedi mynegi pryder dirfawr fis Medi diwethaf pan sylweddolodd y byddai bygythiad Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Gwynedd i gael gwared â gwelyau yn Ysbyty Cymuned Tywyn yn gallu arwain at flocio gwelyau yn Ysbyty Bronglais, Aberystwyth. Ymgais i dorri'r costau yw'r bwriad i gael gwared â gwelyau yng Ngheredigion, onid e, Brif Weinidog, a hynny o ganlyniad i'r camreoli ar y GIG yng Nghymru gan eich Llywodraeth chi? Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim oll â symleiddio neu foderneiddio.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Hawdd iawn yw dweud hynny heb fanylu yn ei gylch. Yr oedd cynigion Wanless yn ymwneud â newid y dull o ddarparu gwasanaethau. Yr ydym oll o blaid yr egwyddor honno. Ni allwn dderbyn syndrom 'nid yn ein hardal ni' ynglŷn â newidiadau yn y GIG pan fyddant yn effeithio ar ysbyty benodol. Os yw'n well darparu gwasanaeth mewn modd arall, dylem feddwl am y gwasanaethau a ddarperir, yn hytrach nag ystyried bod casgliad o adeiladau neu nifer o welyau'n symbol wrol o safon y gwasanaeth iechyd yn yr ardal honno. Yr ydym oll yn gytûn ar hynny mewn egwyddor, ond nid yw pob un ohonom am ei weld yn digwydd os yw'n effeithio ar ysbyty yn ein hardal ni.

If the trust and the LHB come forward with a proposal, they know that they have to carry the people with them, and that will be true for every area in Wales. There is a wealth of community hospitals in west Wales, and some of them may change. That is just part of change. You will find this in all parts of the NHS, and it has always been true in every decade of the NHS, in every part of the country. Nothing stays the same, otherwise the hospital network that we have now would be exactly the same as it was when the NHS started in 1948.

Os bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth a'r BILl yn rhoi cynnig gerbron, gwyddant y bydd yn rhaid iddynt gael cefnogaeth y bobl, a bydd hynny'n wir am bob ardal yng Nghymru. Mae nifer fawr o ysbytai cymuned yn y gorllewin, ac mae'n bosibl y bydd rhai ohonynt yn newid. Un agwedd ar newid yw hynny. Cewch hyn ym mhob rhan o'r GIG, ac felly y mae wedi bod ym mhob degawd yn y GIG, ym mhob rhan o'r wlad. Nid oes dim yn aros yr un fath oherwydd, fel arall, byddai'r rhwydwaith ysbytai sydd gennym yn awr yn union yr un fath ag ydoedd pan ddechreuodd y GIG yn 1948.

2.40 p.m.

### **Hawlio Budd-daliadau The Take-up of Benefits**

**Q8 Ann Jones:** What discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding measures to improve the take-up of benefits in Wales? OAQ1056(FM)

**C8 Ann Jones:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch mesurau i gael mwy o bobl i hawlio budd-daliadau yng Nghymru? OAQ1056(FM)

**The First Minister:** I am sure that you are aware of our scheme to have council tax benefit, which has the lowest take-up rate, addressed by the £1.5 million additional allocation in the budget that will be before us tomorrow. You will also be aware of a broad-brush campaign on benefits called Link-Age in Wales, which John Griffiths launched as a joint initiative with the Department for Work and Pensions on 21 November.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch am ein cynllun i roi sylw i fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, sydd â'r gyfradd hawlio isaf, drwy ddyrannu £1.5 miliwn yn ychwanegol at hynny yn y gyllideb a fydd ger ein bron yfory. Byddwch hefyd yn gwybod am yr ymgyrch cyffredinol ar fudd-daliadau o'r enw Menter Cyswllt Oed yng Nghymru, a lansiwyd gan John Griffiths fel cynllun ar y cyd â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ar 21 Tachwedd.

**Ann Jones:** I welcome the £1.5 million that is going to be targeted at those pensioners for the take-up of council tax benefits. We should promote the take-up of benefits at all times. Evidence shows that, for every £1 spent on a properly targeted take-up campaign about £5 ends up in the pockets of those who most need it. Furthermore, it shows that most of that money is spent locally, which is another benefit for the communities affected. Will you continue to work with the UK Ministers at UK level, and organisations such as credit unions, which do such a lot, in order that we can move forward together on a joint platform of social justice to eradicate poverty?

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r £1.5 miliwn a fydd yn cael ei dargedu ar y pensiynewyr hynny er mwyn eu hannog i hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor. Dylem annog pobl i hawlio budd-daliadau bob amser. Mae tystiolaeth yn dangos bod pob £1 a gaiff ei gwario ar ymgyrch ar hawlio budd-daliadau sydd wedi'i dargedu'n briodol yn peri i'r rhai mwyaf anghenus gael £5 yn ychwanegol yn eu pocedi. Yn ogystal â hynny, mae'n dangos bod y rhan fwyaf o'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario'n lleol, gan ddod â budd ychwanegol i'r cymunedau yr effeithir arnynt. A wnewch barhau i weithio gyda Gweinidogion y DU ar lefel y DU, a chyrrff fel undebau credyd, sydd yn gwneud cymaint, fel y gallwn symud ymlaen gyda'n

gilydd ar lwyfan cyffredin o blaid cyfiawnder cymdeithasol er mwyn dileu tlodi?

**The First Minister:** Indeed. The under-claiming of council tax benefit, especially among pensioners who are private tenants or private owner-occupiers, is particularly serious. Council tenants tend to receive good advice from the council, and the take-up rate is much higher among council tenants than among those in the private sector. We hope to come back early in the new year, following a report from our council tax benefit working group, with details on exactly how we are going to structure the benefit take-up campaign for the next financial year.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn wir. Mae'r gyfradd isel o ran y nifer sydd yn hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor, yn enwedig ymysg pensïynwyr sydd yn denantiaid preifat neu'n berchenfeddianwyr preifat, yn arbennig o ddifrifol. Mae tenantiaid cyngor yn debygol o gael cyngor da gan y cyngor, ac mae'r gyfradd hawlio'n uwch o lawer ymysg tenantiaid cyngor nag ymysg rhai yn y sector preifat. Gobeithiwn ddod yn ôl ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd, ar ôl cael adroddiad gan ein gweithgor ar fudd-dal y dreth gyngor, gyda manylion am yr union fodd y byddwn yn trefnu'r ymgyrch ar hawlio budd-daliadau ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf.

**David Lloyd:** Research by the University of Warwick found that the one fifth of the population on the lowest incomes spent an average of 4.6 per cent of their income on council tax, even after benefits and discounts had been taken into account, while the fifth of the population on the highest incomes spent just 1.6 per cent of their pay on council tax. Are you happy with such a taxation system?

**David Lloyd:** Mae ymchwil gan Brifysgol Warwick wedi canfod bod y bumed ran o'r boblogaeth sydd â'r incwm isaf wedi gwario 4.6 y cant o'i hincwm, ar gyfartaledd, ar y dreth gyngor, hyd yn oed ar ôl ystyried budd-daliadau a gostyngiadau, tra oedd y bumed ran o'r boblogaeth sydd â'r incwm uchaf wedi gwario dim ond 1.6 y cant o'u cyflog ar y dreth gyngor. A ydych yn fodlon ar system drethu o'r fath?

**The First Minister:** Broadly speaking, if you are going to have a property-based tax, it will have to be levied on property in some way. It tends to get heavily out of line with incomes for the pensioner community. Despite the figures that you have just quoted, it is broadly in line with incomes, except for pensioners, because they have stopped earning an income, and are reliant on fixed incomes or other smaller incomes such as pensions. That is when you get the situation of a big house with high council tax owned by someone on a limited or fixed income. The council tax benefit take-up campaign is so important in correcting that anomaly.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** A siarad yn gyffredinol, os ceir treth sydd yn seiliedig ar eiddo, rhaid ei chodi ar eiddo mewn rhyw fodd. Mae'n dueddol o fod yn anghyson iawn ag incwm yn achos pensïynwyr. Er gwaethaf y ffigurau yr ydych newydd eu dyfynnu, mae'n weddol gyson ag incwm, heblaw yn achos pensïynwyr, gan eu bod wedi peidio ag ennill incwm, a chan eu bod yn dibynnu ar incwm sefydlog neu incwm llai arall fel pensïynau. Mewn sefyllfa felly y ceir tŷ mawr y codir treth gyngor uchel amdano sydd yn eiddo i rywun sydd ag incwm cyfyngedig neu sefydlog. Mae'r ymgyrch i annog pobl i hawlio budd-dal y dreth gyngor yn bwysig iawn er mwyn cywiro'r anghysonder hwnnw.

**William Graham:** Do you not think that one of the problems with the take-up of benefits is simply your party's obsession with means testing? If there were less means testing, more people would take up the benefit available.

**William Graham:** Oni chredwch mai un o'r problemau sydd yn glŷn â hawlio budd-daliadau yw obsesiwn eich plaid â'r prawf modd? Pe defnyddid llai ar y prawf modd, byddai mwy o bobl yn hawlio'r budd-daliadau sydd ar gael.

**The First Minister:** I think that it is fair to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Credaf mai teg yw dweud

say that council tax benefit, by its nature, is means tested, but, for some reason, the stigma attached to it means that only about 50 per cent of pensioners who are eligible for it take it up. In the private sector, it is a lamentably low figure. We hope that we can achieve the kind of levels of improvement that Ann Jones gave, or higher. That was five times the cost of the campaign, at £1.5 million, in additional council tax benefit paid to those who are eligible to get it. If it is a success, I am sure that England will wish to follow our example, and that we will wish to repeat it in the following year.

bod prawf modd ar gyfer budd-dal y dreth gyngor oherwydd ei natur, ond, am ryw reswm, mae'r ymdeimlad o gywilydd sydd ynglŷn â'i hawlio'n peri mai dim ond tua 50 y cant o'r pensïynwyr sydd yn gymwys i'w gael sydd yn ei hawlio. Yn y sector preifat, mae'r ffigur yn druenus o isel. Gobeithiwn allu sicrhau gwelliannau o'r math y cyfeiriodd Ann Jones atynt, neu rai gwell na hynny. Yr oedd hynny bum gwaith cost yr ymgyrch, sef £1.5 miliwn, ar ffurf symiau ychwanegol o fudd-dal y dreth gyngor i'r rhai sydd yn gymwys i'w gael. Os bydd yn llwyddo, yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Lloegr yn dymuno dilyn ein hesiampl, ac y byddwn yn dymuno ei ailadrodd yn y flwyddyn ddilynol.

### **Y Bwlch Cyfoeth The Wealth Gap**

**Q9 Alun Cairns:** What action is the Welsh Assembly Government taking to address the wealth gap between Wales and the rest of the UK? OAQ1065(FM)

**C9 Alun Cairns:** Pa gamau y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael â'r bwlch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a gweddill y DU? OAQ1065(FM)

**The First Minister:** The first priority is to increase the number of jobs, and of the nine English regions plus Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland, there is no question that, in the six and a half years since the Assembly was set up, Wales is number one of the 12 in terms of additional jobs created. The rise in employment in Wales is over 10.5 percentage points, compared to 6.5 for the UK as a whole. If we can continue along those lines, we will address the wealth gap.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Y brif flaenoriaeth yw cynyddu nifer y swyddi ac, o blith naw rhanbarth Lloegr ynghyd â'r Alban, Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon, nid oes amheuaeth nad Cymru a fu ar y blaen o blith y 12 hynny, yn y chwe mlynedd a hanner ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad, o ran nifer y swyddi ychwanegol sydd wedi'u creu. Mae'r cynnydd mewn cyflogaeth yng Nghymru'n fwy na 10.5 y cant, o'i gymharu â 6.5 y cant ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Os gallwn barhau mewn modd tebyg, byddwn yn delio â'r bwlch cyfoeth.

**Alun Cairns:** In view of what has been said in the Chamber on the issue on several occasions, and specific targets on unemployment that you have set, there is only one question that really matters: when do you expect Wales to achieve 90 per cent of average UK gross value added per capita?

**Alun Cairns:** O ystyried yr hyn sydd wedi'i ddweud yn y Siambr ar y pwnc hwn ar sawl achlysur, a'r targedau penodol yr ydych wedi'u gosod ynghylch cyflogaeth, dim ond un cwestiwn sydd yn cyfrif, mewn gwirionedd: pa bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl y bydd Cymru'n sicrhau 90 y cant o'r gwerth ychwanegol crynswth cyfartalog y pen yn y DU?

**The First Minister:** When would you expect to achieve that, by means of any constructive suggestions that you might have? I have never heard you make a constructive suggestion in the six and a half years you have been here. The important point is that if we carry on creating jobs at a rate of 10 per cent more, while the rest of the UK is

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pa bryd y disgwylichi chi sicrhau hynny, drwy unrhyw awgrymiadau adeiladol a allai fod gennych? Nid wyf erioed wedi'ch clywed yn rhoi awgrym adeiladol yn y chwe mlynedd a hanner yr ydych wedi bod yma. Y pwynt pwysig yw os daliwn i greu swyddi ar gyfradd o 10 y cant yn fwy, tra bo gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig yn creu swyddi



creating jobs at the rate of 6 per cent more, then we are bound to close the wealth gap. It is very important that we are first out of 12—the nine English regions and Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland. We are not sixth out of 12; we are first. I would expect you to welcome that if you had a constructive bone in your body.

**Christine Chapman:** Unlike Alun Cairns and his party, do you believe that the wealth gap that we should be concerned about is the one between the poorest and the most affluent in Wales and the UK? Do you not think that the refusal of the Conservatives to help those on low incomes has always been plain to see? For example, we remember what the former Secretary of State for Wales, William Hague, who is tipped for a return to the Tory frontbench, said on working families' tax credit:

'We wouldn't do it. It is a tangible difference between the parties.'

Do you agree with William Hague that an unwillingness to help the poor in society, by reducing the wealth gap, is a tangible difference between the Conservative Party and the Labour Government here in Wales and in Westminster?

**The First Minister:** The minimum wage is another example. It was opposed by the Conservatives on the grounds that it would cost jobs, but, in fact, jobs have been created much faster since the minimum wage was introduced—faster than anything that was seen during the Conservative era. If William Hague returns to the Cabinet of the new Conservative leader—I suppose that is slightly better than John Redwood coming back; I do not expect his return—we must also remember that not only was he opposed to the kinds of measures that you are talking about, he deliberately put council tax up in Wales, as an act of policy, by 18 per cent when he was the Secretary of State for Wales. That is far greater than anything that has occurred under a Labour administration.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** O ystyried yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud, mae'n amlwg eich bod yn benderfynol o geisio lleihau'r bwlch hwn

ar gyfradd o 6 y cant yn fwy, yna yr ydym yn rhwym o gau'r bwlch cyfoeth. Mae'n bwysig iawn mai ni sydd ar y blaen o blith y 12—sef naw rhanbarth Lloegr a'r Alban, Cymru a Gogledd Iwerddon. Nid chweched o 12 ydym; yr ydym yn gyntaf. Disgwylwn ichi groesawu hynny pe bai gennych ryw fymryn o agwedd adeiladol.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn wahanol i Alun Cairns a'i blaid, a gredwch mai'r bwlch cyfoeth y dylem ymboeni amdano yw'r un rhwng y tlotaf a'r cyfoethocaf yng Nghymru a'r Deyrnas Unedig? Oni chredwch ei bod yn amlwg erioed fod y Ceidwadwyr yn gwrthod helpu pobl sydd ar incwm isel? Er enghraifft, cofiwn yr hyn a ddywedodd cyn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, William Hague, y proffwydir y bydd yn dychwelyd i fainc flaen y Torïaid, ynglŷn â chredyd treth i deuluoedd sy'n gweithio:

Ni fyddem ni'n gwneud hyn. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth amlwg rhwng y pleidiau.

A gytunwch â William Hague fod anfodlonrwydd i helpu'r tlodion mewn cymdeithas, drwy leihau'r bwlch cyfoeth, yn wahaniaeth amlwg rhwng y Blaid Geidwadol a'r Llywodraeth Lafur yma yng Nghymru ac yn San Steffan?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r isafswm cyflog yn enghraifft arall. Fe'i gwrthwynebwyd gan y Ceidwadwyr ar y sail y byddai wedi costio swyddi, ond, mewn gwirionedd, crewyd swyddi'n llawer cyflymach ers cyflwyno'r isafswm cyflog—yn gyflymach na dim a welwyd yn ystod cyfnod y Ceidwadwyr. Os dychwela William Hague i Gabinet arweinydd newydd y Ceidwadwyr—mae'n debyg bod hynny fymryn yn well na chael John Redwood yn ôl; nid wyf yn disgwyl i hwnnw ddychwelyd—rhaid inni gofio hefyd nad dim ond gwrthwynebu'r math o fesurau yr ydych yn sôn amdanynt yn awr a wnaeth, aeth ati'n fwriadol i godi'r dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, fel gweithred bolisi, 18 y cant pan oedd yn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Mae hynny'n llawer mwy na dim sydd wedi digwydd dan weinyddiaeth Lafur.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Given what you have said, it is obvious that you are determined to try to narrow the gap between the poor and

rhwng y tlawd a'r cyfoethog yn ein cymdeithas. A dderbyniwch fod y bwlch hwnnw wedi cynyddu bob blwyddyn ers i'r Llywodraeth Lafur ddod i rym yn y Cynulliad yn 1999, a'i fod yn parhau i gynyddu? Beth yn union yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud i leihau'r bwlch hwnnw?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn derbyn ei fod wedi cynyddu.

the wealthy in our society. Do you accept that that gap has widened every year since the Labour Government came to power in the Assembly in 1999, and that it continues to widen? What exactly are you going to do to narrow that gap?

**The First Minister:** I do not accept that it has widened.

### **Cynlluniau Ymddygiad Gwrthgymdeithasol Anti-social Behaviour Schemes**

**Q10 Gwenda Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on anti-social behaviour schemes in Wales? OAQ1067(FM)

**The First Minister:** The Welsh Assembly Government encourages strong partnership working to ensure a joined-up multi-agency approach to combat anti-social behaviour in Wales wherever it occurs.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council has been selected as one of four councils in Wales to run a year-long pilot scheme to tackle anti-social behaviour, funded by the Welsh Assembly Government. The purpose of this pilot scheme is to address anti-social behaviour by encouraging partner agencies, together with Communities First programmes and junior crime prevention panels in secondary schools, to introduce schemes within communities. Do you agree that encouraging children and young people to become involved in their local community, and giving them an insight into the causes of anti-social behaviour, may assist in reducing such behaviour in the future?

**The First Minister:** I agree. It is important, at a young age, to divert people away from thinking that anti-social behaviour is fun or cool. Peer group pressure can mean that people become used to participating in anti-social behaviour. It is much healthier for society, as well as for those young people, if they can be diverted away from it. The pilot project in Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council, in conjunction with the community safety partnerships in that area, is a model for

**C10 Gwenda Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng Nghymru? OAQ1067(FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n annog cydweithio mewn partneriaeth gref i sicrhau bod asiantaethau'n cyfuno mewn ffordd gydlynol i weithio yn erbyn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yng Nghymru lle bynnag y digwyddo.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot wedi'i ddewis yn un o bedwar cyngor yng Nghymru i redeg cynllun peilot am flwyddyn i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, dan nawdd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Pwrpas y cynllun peilot hwn yw mynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol drwy annog asiantaethau sy'n bartneriaid, ynghyd â rhaglenni Cymunedau'n Gyntaf a phaneli atal troseddau plant mewn ysgolion uwchradd, i gyflwyno cynlluniau o fewn cymunedau. A ydych yn cytuno y gall annog plant a phobl ifanc i ymwneud â'u cymuned leol, a rhoi mewnwelediad iddynt i achosion ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol, gynorthwyo i leihau ymddygiad o'r fath yn y dyfodol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn cytuno. Mae'n bwysig peri i bobl ifanc beidio â meddwl bod ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol yn hwyl neu'n cŵl. Gall pwysau grŵp cyfoedion olygu bod pobl yn ymgyfarwyddo â chymryd rhan mewn ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol. Mae'n llawer iachach i gymdeithas, yn ogystal ag i'r bobl ifanc hynny, os gellir peri iddynt ymwrthod â hynny. Mae'r cynllun peilot yng Nghyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot, ar y cyd â'r

the rest of Wales to follow.

partneriaethau diogelwch cymunedol yn yr ardal honno, yn esiampl i weddill Cymru ei dilyn.

### **Cwestiwn Brys Urgent Question**

#### **Grŵp Trinity Mirror Trinity Mirror Group**

**Nick Bourne:** Will the Minister make a statement on job losses in the Trinity Mirror Group? EAQ0551(EDT)

**Nick Bourne:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad ar y swyddi a gollir yng Ngrŵp Trinity Mirror? EAQ0551(EDT)

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** On 28 November, the Trinity Mirror Group announced that 44 jobs, which is 34.5 full-time equivalent jobs, were under threat at the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo*. Upon hearing this news, my officials arranged for Education and Learning Wales, Careers Wales and Jobcentre Plus to contact Keith Dye, the managing director of the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo*, to offer their support services. I have written to Keith Dye to request a meeting with him to seek assurances over the future intentions for the company.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Ar 28 Tachwedd, cyhoeddodd Grŵp Trinity Mirror fod 44 o swyddi, sef cyfwerth â 34.5 o swyddi llawnamser, dan fygythiad yn y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo*. Pan glywsant y newyddion hyn, trefnodd fy swyddogion i ELWa, Gyrfa Cymru a Chanolfan Byd Gwaith gysylltu â Keith Dye, rheolwr gyfarwyddwr y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo*, i gynnig eu gwasanaethau cymorth. Yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu at Keith Dye i ofyn am gyfarfod gydag ef i geisio cael sicrwydd am y bwriadau ar gyfer y cwmni i'r dyfodol.

2.50 p.m.

**Nick Bourne:** I will ask some specific questions on the back of that response. First, as the Minister has indicated, 44 journalism and sales jobs are being lost at the *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo* newspaper group, and, at this time of year, I am sure that we would all wish to offer our sympathy to the people and families affected. What is the Minister doing? He said that he has contacted the company, but it is important that he seeks and gets an early meeting with the management to see what can be done to secure the newspaper industry in Wales. This news comes on the back of 55 jobs lost at Cardiff just two years ago, and on the back of cuts at the *Daily Post*. It is important that we secure a vibrant media for Wales, just as there is in Scotland. The *Western Mail* and *South Wales Echo* have already outsourced information technology matters outside of Wales, and have outsourced human resources to Birmingham. That leads us to question whether there really is an intention to have a

**Nick Bourne:** Gofynnaf rai cwestiynau penodol yn sgîl yr ateb hwnnw. Yn gyntaf, fel y nododd y Gweinidog, caiff 44 o swyddi newyddiaduraeth a gwerthiant eu colli yng ngrŵp papurau newydd y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo* ac, ar yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, yr wyf yn siŵr y dymunai pawb ohonom gynnig ein cydymdeimlad i'r bobl a'r teuluoedd yr effeithir arnynt. Beth y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud? Dywedodd ei fod wedi cysylltu â'r cwmni, ond mae'n bwysig iddo geisio cael cyfarfod cynnar gyda'r rheolwyr i weld beth y gellir ei wneud i ddiogelu'r diwydiant papurau newydd yng Nghymru. Daw'r newyddion hyn yn fuan ar ôl colli 55 o swyddi yng Nghaerdydd ddwy flynedd yn ôl, a thoriadau newydd ddigwydd yn y *Daily Post*. Mae'n bwysig inni ddiogelu cyfryngau bywiog yng Nghymru, yn union fel sydd yn yr Alban. Mae'r *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo* eisoes wedi anfon gwaith technoleg gwybodaeth allan o Gymru, ac wedi symud y gwaith adnoddau dynol i

vibrant media and newspaper industry in Wales and in our capital city.

The job losses, it is worth saying, have been announced even though Trinity Mirror made a £250 million profit last year. Job losses are generally announced when a company is in financial difficulty, but that is not the case here. Indeed, journalists within the group are saying that there is a serious question about the company's intentions with regard to news coverage in Wales, even though the *Western Mail* has increased its coverage and appears to be vibrant.

I would like the Minister's views on another serious issue. In a situation like this, who is guarding the guards? There is no proper coverage of this in the newspapers; there are just a couple of short paragraphs, which raises the issue of *quis custodiet*. Who is going to cover these things, given that the company has a virtual monopoly of printed news coverage, certainly in the capital city, in terms of Welsh affairs?

As the Minister is aware, there has been a unanimous vote of no confidence in the chief executive, Sly Bailey, as I understand he is called. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'She.'] She, I beg her pardon—as she is called; I would not have known that from the name. This comes on the back of wave after wave of cuts, which seem to be wounding our newspaper industry. I urge the Minister to take the urgent steps needed to secure these jobs and the future of this industry. I hope that he will take positive action on what is a very serious issue.

**Andrew Davies:** The first thing that has to be said is that this affects the whole of the Trinity Mirror Group. From press coverage over the weekend, I understand that the group has already closed one or more magazine titles, and that our Scottish colleagues are equally concerned about the impact in Scotland, as are our colleagues in England. Press operations are facing big challenges at the moment in terms of trying to reduce their cost base, and, of course, there is increasing competition at a time when advertising revenue is declining. The role of the internet,

Birmingham. Mae hynny'n peri inni holi a oes bwriad mewn gwirionedd i gael diwydiant cyfryngau a phapurau newydd bywiog yng Nghymru ac yn ein prifddinas.

Mae'n werth nodi bod y colli swyddi wedi'i gyhoeddi er i Trinity Mirror wneud elw o £250 miliwn y llynedd. Fel arfer cyhoeddir bod swyddi'n cael eu colli pan fydd cwmni mewn trafferthion ariannol, ond nid felly y mae hi yma. Yn wir, mae newyddiadurwyr o fewn y grŵp yn dweud bod amheuaeth gref ynghylch bwriadau'r cwmni ar gyfer darparu newyddion yng Nghymru, a hynny er bod y *Western Mail* wedi cynyddu ei ddarpariaeth o ran newyddion ac i'w weld yn ffynnu.

Hoffwn gael sylwadau'r Gweinidog ar fater difrifol arall. Mewn sefyllfa fel hon, pwy sydd yn gwarchod y gwarchodwyr? Nid oes dim trafodaeth iawn ar hyn yn y papurau, dim ond ychydig baragraffau byr, sy'n codi'r cwestiwn *quis custodiet*. Pwy a rydd sylw i'r pethau hyn, a'r cwmni'n meddu ar fonopoli, i bob pwrpas, ar newyddion printiedig, yn sicr yn y brifddinas, o ran materion Cymreig?

Fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, cafwyd pleidlais unfrydol o ddiffyg hyder yn y prif weithredwr, Sly Bailey, fel y'i gelwir ef, yn ôl a ddeallaf. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Hi.'] Hi, maddeued imi—fel y'i gelwir hi; ni fyddwn yn gwybod hynny yn ôl yr enw. Daw hyn yn sgîl ton ar ôl ton o doriadau, yr ymddengys eu bod yn niweidio ein diwydiant papurau newydd. Anogaf y Gweinidog i gymryd y camau brys y mae eu hangen i ddiogelu'r swyddi hyn a dyfodol y diwydiant. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff weithredu'n gadarnhaol ar fater sydd yn un difrifol iawn.

**Andrew Davies:** Y peth cyntaf y mae'n rhaid ei ddweud yw bod hyn yn effeithio ar y cyfan o Grŵp Trinity Mirror. Yn ôl yr hanes yn y wasg dros y penwythnos, deallaf fod y grŵp eisoes wedi cau un neu ddau o deitlau cylchgronau, a bod ein cyd-aelodau yn yr Alban yr un mor bryderus am yr effaith yn y wlad honno, fel y mae ein cyd-aelodau yn Lloegr. Mae gweisg yn wynebu heriau mawr ar hyn o bryd o ran ceisio lleihau eu costau sylfaenol, ac, wrth gwrs, mae mwy a mwy o gystadleuaeth ar adeg pan fo refeniw hysbysebu ar i lawr. Mae rôl y rhyngwyd, o

in terms of advertising, is clearly having an impact on advertising revenue.

Having said that, we are obviously concerned about the jobs. To focus on the jobs, my understanding is that the group has offered what I think is called a voluntary job match, whereby employees currently willing to take voluntary redundancy are matched with the job losses that have been announced. That will hopefully reduce any need for compulsory redundancies. This is one of the issues that I would like to discuss with Mr Dye when I meet him. I understand, however, that he has suffered a very recent family bereavement, so I do not know when I will be able to meet with him.

Clearly, there are issues about media coverage, having a robust and vigorous media market and plurality in Wales. One of the problems that we have in Wales, certainly compared with Scotland, is that we have limited competition on the press side, but also generally in the media. Anything that leads to a reduction or diminution in media plurality in Wales is something that we would all deplore, as politicians, given our commitment to democracy. As you pointed out, Nick, this is not the only newspaper group that has experienced problems recently. I will raise these issues with Keith Dye, when I get to see him, which will be as soon as possible.

**Leighton Andrews:** Are you aware that the National Union of Journalists has now called a ballot on strike action in relation to these issues? Do you agree that it is absolutely disgraceful that not a word of the widespread all-party protests about this issue has appeared in Trinity Mirror Group newspapers? Do you agree that we want strong independent local newspapers, such as the *Rhondda Leader*, not a homogenised corporate media without any interest in local issues or local people? Will you welcome the call by the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee for an inquiry into this issue? Above all, do you agree that it would be good to see a Competition Commission inquiry into the Trinity Mirror Group and its role in Wales and the Welsh newspaper

ran hysbysebu, yn amlwg yn cael effaith ar refeniw hysbysebu.

Wedi dweud hynny, yr ydym wrth reswm yn pryderu am y swyddi. A chanolbwyntio ar y swyddi, fy nealltwriaeth i yw bod y grŵp wedi cynnig yr hyn a elwir yn baru swyddi gwirfoddol, lle y bydd gweithwyr sydd ar hyn o bryd yn fodlon derbyn diswyddiad gwirfoddol yn cael eu paru â'r swyddi y cyhoeddwyd eu bod yn cael eu colli. Gobeithir y bydd hynny'n lleihau unrhyw angen am ddiswyddo gorfodol. Dyma un o'r materion yr hoffwn eu trafod gyda Mr Dye pan gyfarfyddaf ag ef. Deallaf, fodd bynnag, ei fod wedi dioddef profedigaeth yn y teulu'n ddiweddar iawn, felly ni wn pa bryd y byddaf yn gallu cyfarfod ag ef.

Wrth reswm, mae cwestiynau ynghylch sylw'r cyfryngau, cael marchnad gyfryngau gref ac egniol, ac amrywiaeth yng Nghymru. Un o'r problemau sydd gennym yng Nghymru, yn sicr o'n cymharu â'r Alban, yw mai ychydig o gystadleuaeth sydd gennym ar ochr y wasg, a hefyd yn gyffredinol yn y cyfryngau. Mae unrhyw beth sydd yn arwain at leihau neu grebachu amrywiaeth o ran y cyfryngau yng Nghymru'n rhywbeth y byddem i gyd yn gresynu ato, fel gwleidyddion, o gofio ein hymrwymiad i ddemocratiaeth. Fel y dywedaso, Nick, nid hwn yw'r unig grŵp papurau newydd sydd wedi cael problemau'n ddiweddar. Codaf y materion hyn gyda Keith Dye, pan gaf gyfle i'w weld, sef cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

**Leighton Andrews:** A ydych yn ymwybodol bod Undeb Cenedlaethol y Newyddiadurwyr bellach wedi galw am bleidlais ar gwestiwn streicio mewn perthynas â'r materion hyn? Oni chytunwch ei bod yn gwbl warthus nad oes gair am y protestiadau eang gan bob plaid ynglŷn â'r mater hwn wedi ymddangos ym mhapurau newydd Grŵp Trinity Mirror? A gytunwch fod arnom eisiau papurau newydd lleol annibynnol cryf, fel y *Rhondda Leader*, nid cyfryngau corfforaethol unffurf heb ddim diddordeb mewn materion lleol na phobl leol? A wnewch groesawu'r alwad gan y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon am ymchwiliad i'r mater hwn? Yn anad dim, a gytunwch y byddai'n dda gweld ymchwiliad gan y Comisiwn Cystadleuaeth i Grŵp Trinity Mirror a'i rôl

industry?

**Andrew Davies:** As I said in my response to Nick Bourne, anything that reduces what is—as I think that everybody would accept—an unsatisfactory position in terms of media coverage in Wales, is to be deplored. I have concerns, as do you, that local newspaper titles will be affected if the action described in the announcement goes ahead. We are aware of the recent decision by a local newspaper in Swansea, the *Evening Post*, to move the printing from Swansea to Bristol. That has had an impact on the ability of the local paper to respond to immediate news. These are major concerns, at a time when it is said that people are not interested in politics and that civil society is not of major importance, or is of reduced importance, to them. Having a vibrant media in Wales and across the UK is vital in order to address those concerns.

It is not for me, as Minister, to decide what the culture committee should do in terms of a review. I certainly think that the issue of media structure, ownership, and coverage in Wales is of vital public importance and, if the culture committee were to do that, I would certainly think that it was a very welcome step.

**Owen John Thomas:** May I support all the statements made by the two previous speakers on this matter? It seems strangely anomalous that the Trinity Mirror Group, having made a profit of £250 million last year, should not be investing in the *Western Mail* and the *South Wales Echo* to ensure that the post-devolution period is recognised. The group should be developing those papers into first-class national papers, rather than making their viability that much the less by getting rid of, or threatening, 100 jobs over the last two years. It is vital that the people of Wales have an opportunity to learn about the affairs of Wales through a national paper, such as the *Western Mail*. That paper should build itself up, over a period of time, to cover the whole of Wales, as it has been striving to do for some time.

On Thursday last, I made a proposal in the culture committee, which you have learnt of

yng Nghymru a'r diwydiant papurau newydd yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i Nick Bourne, rhaid gresynu at unrhyw beth sydd yn gwaethygu sefyllfa sydd—a chredaf y byddai pawb yn derbyn hyn—yn anfoddhaol o ran darpariaeth y cyfryngau yng Nghymru. Mae gennyf bryderon, fel chithau, yr effeithir ar bapurau newydd lleol os digwydd yr hyn a ddisgrifir yn y cyhoeddiad. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol o benderfyniad diweddar papur newydd lleol yn Abertawe, yr *Evening Post*, i symud yr argraffu o Abertawe i Fryste. Mae hynny wedi effeithio ar allu'r papur lleol i ymateb i newyddion yn y fan a'r lle. Mae'r rhain yn bryderon mawr, ar adeg pryd y dywedir nad oes gan bobl ddiddordeb mewn gwleidyddiaeth ac nad yw cymdeithas sifil o bwys mawr, neu ei bod yn llai pwysig, yn eu golwg. Mae cael cyfryngau bywiog yng Nghymru a ledled Prydain yn allweddol er mwyn delio â'r pryderon hyn.

Nid fy lle i, fel Gweinidog, yw penderfynu beth y dylai'r pwyllgor diwylliant ei wneud o ran adolygiad. Yn sicr, credaf fod cwestiwn strwythur, perchenogaeth a darpariaeth y cyfryngau yng Nghymru o bwysigrwydd cyhoeddus allweddol, a phe gwnâi'r pwyllgor diwylliant hynny, yn sicr fe fyddwn yn croesawu'r cam hwnnw'n fawr.

**Owen John Thomas:** A gaf fi gefnogi pob datganiad a wnaeth y ddau siaradwr blaenorol ar y mater hwn? Mae'n ymddangos yn rhyfedd o anghyson nad yw Grŵp Trinity Mirror, ar ôl gwneud elw o £250 miliwn y llynedd, yn buddsoddi yn y *Western Mail* a'r *South Wales Echo* i sicrhau cydnabyddiaeth i'r cyfnod ôl-ddatganoli. Dylai'r grŵp fod yn datblygu'r papurau hynny'n bapurau cenedlaethol o'r radd flaenaf, yn hytrach na'u gwneud gymaint â hynny'n llai hyfyw drwy gael gwared o 100 o swyddi, neu eu bygwth, dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Mae'n hanfodol i bobl Cymru gael cyfle i ddysgu am faterion Cymru drwy bapur cenedlaethol, fel y *Western Mail*. Dylai'r papur hwnnw fynd ati, dros gyfnod o amser, i ymdrin â Chymru gyfan, fel y mae'n ymdrechu i wneud ers cryn amser.

Ddydd Iau diwethaf, gwneuthum gynnig yn y pwyllgor diwylliant, yr ydych wedi clywed

from Mr Leighton Andrews, who could not make that meeting, unfortunately. I proposed that we should have a review—

amdano oddi wrth Mr Leighton Andrews, na allai fod yn bresennol yn y cyfarfod hwnnw, yn anffodus. Cynigiais y dylem gael adolygiad—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Cwestiwn, os gwelwch yn dda.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. A question, please.

**Owen John Thomas:** It is a long question, Llywydd.

**Owen John Thomas:** Cwestiwn hir ydyw, Lywydd.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. It should not be so.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Nid felly y dylai fod.

**Owen John Thomas:** I am coming to the end now. I called on the Chair of the culture committee, in our meeting on Thursday, to conduct a review of the daily press in Wales so that we can measure the sales figures and viability of papers. I hope that you, Minister, will support us in that and that the Chair will come to a quick decision on that matter, so that we can start the review without much delay.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr wyf yn dod at y diwedd yn awr. Gelwais ar Gadeirydd y pwyllgor diwylliant, yn ein cyfarfod ddydd Iau, i gynnal adolygiad o'r wasg ddyddiol yng Nghymru fel y gallwn fesur y ffigurau gwerthiant a pha mor hyfyw yw'r papurau. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch chi, Weinidog, ein cefnogi yn hynny ac y daw'r Cadeirydd i benderfyniad buan ar y mater hwnnw, fel y gallwn ddechrau'r adolygiad heb lawer o oedi.

**Andrew Davies:** As I said, that is a matter for the committee to decide. I have also already indicated, in my response to Leighton Andrews, that the coverage and ownership of various media outlets in Wales is a matter of legitimate public concern. We do not have a national media to the same extent as the Scots, for example. Unlike the Scots, most people in Wales read a daily morning newspaper that is published in London. We also have a national electronic media and many people on the eastern side and the geographic margins of Wales, for example, watch broadcast news and current affairs programmes from various parts of England. There are major concerns about how the media is organised and owned. As I said, I would welcome a contribution from the culture committee because I think that there are major matters of public concern that need to be addressed.

**Andrew Davies:** Fel y dywedais, mater i'r pwyllgor ei benderfynu yw hynny. Yr wyf wedi nodi hefyd, yn fy ateb i Leighton Andrews, fod ymdriniaeth a pherchenogaeth yr amryfal gyfryngau yng Nghymru'n fater o bryder cyfiawn i'r cyhoedd. Nid oes gennym gyfryngau cenedlaethol i'r un graddau â'r Albanwyr, er enghraifft. Yn wahanol i'r Albanwyr, bydd y rhan fwyaf o Gymry'n darllen papur newydd dyddiol sydd wedi'i gyhoeddi yn Llundain. Mae gennym gyfryngau electronig cenedlaethol hefyd a bydd llawer o bobl ar ochr ddwyreiniol ac ymylon daearyddol Cymru, er enghraifft, yn gwylio rhaglenni newyddion a materion cyfoes a ddarlledir o amryfal rannau o Loegr. Mae pryderon mawr ynghylch y modd y mae'r cyfryngau wedi'u trefnu ac ynglŷn â'u perchenogaeth. Fel y dywedais, byddwn i'n croesawu cyfraniad gan y pwyllgor diwylliant oherwydd credaf fod cwestiynau mawr o bryder cyhoeddus y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt.

3.00 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** It is important that our thoughts are with those affected—it will be a pretty miserable Christmas for many of those

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae'n bwysig bod ein meddyliau gyda'r rhai yr effeithir arnynt—bydd yn Nadolig digalon iawn i lawer o'r rhai

involved. One has great concern for those affected in the sales department, but I am particularly concerned about the loss of jobs in the field of journalism, because I feel that there will be a knock-on effect there. We have a flourishing journalism school in Cardiff—probably the best in the UK—but there is little for journalism students to go on to when they see how the media in Wales is now configured. Minister, what measures have you taken to look at liaison between the journalism school and the press, and do you share my view that it would be appropriate for the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee to find time to look in depth at the nature of the newspaper industry and the press in Wales, with a view to the concern that the democratic deficit will increase, given the apparent dismantling of our national press?

**Andrew Davies:** I agree wholeheartedly with you about the need for plurality. We do not have national media, as I said, compared with those in Scotland. I have not had specific discussions with the school of journalism on this specific matter, but, certainly in recent years, the few career and progression opportunities available in Wales has always been an issue and has meant that, unfortunately, many talented young journalists have to leave Wales. The other problem, of course, is that, because of its dominance of the media structure in Wales—for all sorts of reasons—one of the few places that journalists can go for career progression is BBC Wales. The point may be argued that dominance of the media by one particular institution is unhealthy in a vibrant economy, and I am sure that the culture committee would want to look at that if it were to consider the subject.

If the culture committee looks at this matter, I would suggest that it does not just look at the newspaper industry, but at the media generally, and nor would I suggest that it just looks at broadcasting. Major changes are occurring in broadcasting, as you are well aware, Jenny, with the advent of digital

sy'n gysylltiedig. Yr wyf yn pryderu llawer am y rhai yr effeithir arnynt yn adran y gwerthiant, ond yr wyf yn neilltuol o bryderus am y swyddi a gollir ym maes newyddiaduraeth, oherwydd teimlaf y bydd hyn yn cael effaith gynyddol yno. Mae gennym ysgol newyddiaduraeth ffyniannus yng Nghaerdydd—yr orau yn y DU yn ôl pob tebyg—ond nid oes fawr ddim i fyfyrwyr newyddiaduraeth fynd yn eu blaenau iddo pan welant sut drefn sydd ar y cyfryngau yng Nghymru erbyn hyn. Weinidog, pa fesurau yr ydych wedi'u cymryd i edrych ar gyswllt rhwng yr ysgol newyddiaduraeth a'r wasg, ac a ydych o'r un farn â mi y byddai'n briodol i'r Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon ddod o hyd i amser i edrych yn fanwl ar natur y diwydiant papurau newydd a'r wasg yng Nghymru, gyda golwg ar y pryder y bydd y diffyg democrataidd yn cynyddu, yn sgîl y datgymalu ymddangosiadol ar ein gwasg genedlaethol?

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn cytuno gant y cant â chi am yr angen am amrywiaeth. Nid oes gennym gyfryngau cenedlaethol, fel y dywedais, sy'n cymharu â'r rhai yn yr Alban. Nid wyf wedi cynnal trafodaethau penodol gyda'r ysgol newyddiaduraeth ar y mater penodol hwn, ond, yn sicr mewn blynyddoedd diweddar, mae'r ychydig gyfleoedd o ran gyrfa a dyrchafiad sydd ar gael yng Nghymru wastad wedi bod yn broblem ac wedi golygu, yn anffodus, fod llawer o newyddiadurwyr ifanc talentog yn gorfod gadael Cymru. Y broblem arall, wrth gwrs, a hynny oherwydd ei dra-arglwyddiaeth ar strwythur y cyfryngau yng Nghymru—am bob math o resymau—yw mai un o'r ychydig fannau lle y gall newyddiadurwyr fynd i gamu ymlaen yn eu gyrfa yw BBC Cymru. Gellir dadlau'r pwynt bod tra-arglwyddiaeth un sefydliad arbennig ar y cyfryngau yn afiach mewn economi fywiog, ac yr wyf yn sicr y byddai'r pwyllgor diwylliant am edrych ar hynny petai'n ystyried y pwnc.

Os bydd y pwyllgor diwylliant yn edrych ar y mater hwn, awgrymwn ei fod nid yn unig yn edrych ar y diwydiant papurau newydd ond y cyfryngau'n gyffredinol, ac ni fyddwn yn awgrymu ychwaith mai dim ond ar ddarlledu y dylai edrych. Mae newidiadau mawr ar y gweill yn y maes darlledu, fel y gwyrddoch yn



broadcasting, and the proliferation of channels and spectra that would mean that having unified coverage in Wales would be perhaps even more problematic in future. Of course, the other area that will be of increasing importance is the internet and how that can be used not just to disseminate information, but to encourage vigorous debate and address your fundamental question about the democratic deficit.

**Rosemary Butler:** I have had representations from all parties on this issue, and we will look at parameters for the review in tomorrow's meeting of the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee. I assure the Minister that we have already spent a long time on broadcasting, but the suggested review is of the newspaper industry. We have already looked at the timetable to ensure that we have time in the future, quickly, to do the review. You therefore have my assurance that this will be decided tomorrow.

**Andrew Davies:** A problem that newspapers face is the decline in their advertising revenue, and a major reason for that is that, increasingly, people are looking to the internet for the dissemination of ideas and revenue raising. There are, therefore, big challenges to the newspaper industry, and I am sure that the committee will look at that.

dda, Jenny, gyda dyfodiad darlledu digidol a'r holl sianelau a sbectra a fyddai'n golygu y byddai cael darpariaeth unedig yng Nghymru yn fwy byth o broblem o bosibl yn y dyfodol. Wrth gwrs, y maes arall a fydd o bwysigrwydd cynyddol yw'r rhyngwyd a sut y gellir ei ddefnyddio nid yn unig i ledaenu gwybodaeth, ond i hybu dadlau brwd a rhoi sylw i'ch cwestiwn sylfaenol am y diffyg democrataidd.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr wyf wedi cael sylwadau gan yr holl bleidiau am y mater hwn, a byddwn yn edrych ar baramedrau ar gyfer yr adolygiad yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon yfory. Gallaf sicrhau'r Gweinidog ein bod eisoes wedi treulio amser maith ar ddarlledu, ond adolygiad o'r diwydiant papurau newydd sy'n cael ei awgrymu. Yr ydym eisoes wedi edrych ar yr amserlen i sicrhau bod gennym amser yn y dyfodol, yn gyflym, i wneud yr adolygiad. Gallaf eich sicrhau felly y penderfynir ar hyn yfory.

**Andrew Davies:** Problem a wynebwr gan bapurau newydd yw'r dirywiad yn eu refeniw hysbysebu, ac un o'r prif resymau dros hynny yw bod pobl, fwyfwy, yn troi at y rhyngwyd ar gyfer lledaenu syniadau a chodi refeniw. O'r herwydd, mae'r diwydiant papurau newydd yn wynebu heriau mawr, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y pwyllgor yn edrych ar hynny.

### **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have one change to report to this week's business. Tomorrow, the First Minister will make a statement on the European budget discussions and the implications for Wales.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. I draw Members' attention to Wednesday, 11 January, when time has been made available to debate the motion to be tabled by members of the Local Government and Public Services Committee, to call upon the UK Government to amend the Electoral

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Yfory, bydd y Prif Weinidog yn gwneud datganiad am y trafodaethau ar y gyllideb Ewropeaidd a'r goblygiadau i Gymru.

Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Tynnaf sylw'r Aelodau at ddydd Mercher, 11 Ionawr, pryd y mae amser wedi'i neilltuo i drafod y cynnig a fydd yn cael ei gyflwyno gan aelodau'r Pwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth y DU i

Administration Bill under Standing Order 33.9.

Following this morning's meeting of the Business Committee, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development) (Amendment) (Wales) Order 2006; the Waste (Household Waste Duty of Care) (Wales) Regulations 2006; the Assembly Learning Grants and Loans (Higher Education) (Wales) Regulations 2006; and the National Health Service (General Ophthalmic Services Supplementary List) and (General Ophthalmic Services) (Amendment and Consequential Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2006.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Ymddengys fod mwy na 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol ac, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf ar un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol i ymateb yn fyr i'r cynnig.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** Gwrthwynebaf y datganiad busnes gan imi ofyn am ddatganiad gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf ynghylch salwch cryptosporidiosis yn Arfon a Môn. Yr wyf yn eithriadol o siomedig na fydd datganiad yn cael ei wneud. Mae 150 o achosion yn yr ardal ac mae 70,000 o bobl yn gorfod berwi eu dŵr tan ddechrau'r flwyddyn newydd. Bu datblygiadau pellach dros y Sul yn ymwneud â chwynion am ansawdd dŵr Cwellyn ers 2004. Yr wyf wedi bod yn gymhedrol iawn am hyn hyd yma, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig gadael i'r tîm rheoli wneud ei waith. Fodd bynnag, mae angen adroddiad gan y gwasanaeth iechyd cyhoeddus am ymateb yr holl gyrff i'r sefyllfa hon yn Arfon a de Môn. Pe bai'r sefyllfa hon wedi digwydd yn ardal

ddiwygio'r Mesur Gweinyddiaeth Etholiadol dan Reol Sefydlog 33.9.

Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Gorchymyn Cynllunio Gwlad a Thref (Datblygu Cyffredinol a Ganiateir) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Gwastraff (Dyletswydd Gofal Gwastraff Cartrefi) (Cymru) 2006; Rheoliadau Benthyciadau a Grantiau Dysgu'r Cynulliad (Addysg Uwch) (Cymru) 2006; a Rheoliadau'r Gwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol (Rhestr Atodol Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol a (Gwasanaethau Offthalmig Cyffredinol) (Diwygio a Diwygio Canlyniadol) (Cymru) 2006.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? It appears that there are more than 10 objections, therefore I ask the Minister to formally propose the business statement, and, under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call one Member from each political group to respond briefly.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn derbyn y datganiad busnes.*

**Alun Ffred Jones:** I oppose the business statement because I asked for a statement from the Minister for Health and Social Services about the latest situation regarding the cryptosporidiosis outbreak in Arfon and Anglesey. I am very disappointed that no statement will be made. There are 150 cases in the area and nearly 70,000 people must boil their water until the new year. There have been further developments over the weekend regarding complaints about the quality of Cwellyn water since 2004. I have been very moderate about this to date, because it is important to let the outbreak control team to get on with its work. However, a report from the public health service is needed about the response of all bodies to this situation in Arfon and south Anglesey. If this situation had arisen in the

Port Talbot, credaf y byddai datganiad yn cael ei wneud yn y Siambr bron bob dydd, os nad bob wythnos.

**Lisa Francis:** The Welsh Conservative group objects to the business statement. In respect of the Welsh Conservatives' request for a statement on the Chancellor's pre-budget statement and its implications for Wales, it is not sufficiently comprehensive to say that the issue will be covered in tomorrow's debate on the final budget. As the Chancellor has given his statement to the House of Commons, it is proper and correct—and it should be custom and practice—for a statement to be issued in the Assembly also, rather than just covered by another item on the agenda.

We are grateful that the Business Minister has agreed to our other request for a statement on the EU council meeting on European budget discussions and the implications for Wales. We note that this statement will be made tomorrow.

We welcome the fact that you have agreed to discuss the possibility of a statement on the report of the Turner commission at the next meeting of the Business Committee. It is essential that your Government puts as much pressure as possible on Westminster colleagues to secure the best possible deal for the Welsh workforce.

**Kirsty Williams:** We also share concerns about the Welsh Assembly Government's lack of commitment to a statement on Gordon Brown's statement yesterday on the budget. It has severe consequences for local government in Wales, and we fear that there will not be enough time in the Assembly budget debate tomorrow to look at the consequences of Gordon Brown's announcement for Wales.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** It was too much to hope for the season of goodwill to break out in one of the Assembly's last meetings before Christmas. The grounds for opposing the business statement were pretty limp.

3.10 p.m.

Port Talbot area, I believe that a statement would have been made in the Chamber almost every day, if not every week.

**Lisa Francis:** Mae grŵp Ceidwadwyr Cymru yn gwrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes. Gyda golwg ar gais Ceidwadwyr Cymru am ddatganiad ar ddatganiad rhag-gyllidebol y Canghellor a'i oblygiadau i Gymru, nid yw'n ddigon cynhwysfawr dweud y bydd y mater yn cael ei gynnwys yn y ddadl yfory ar y gyllideb derfynol. Gan fod y Canghellor wedi rhoi ei ddatganiad i Dŷ'r Cyffredin, mae'n iawn ac yn briodol—a dylai hynny fod yn arfer—fod y Cynulliad yn cyhoeddi datganiad hefyd, yn hytrach na bod yn rhan o eitem arall ar yr agenda'n unig.

Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar bod y Trefnydd wedi cydsynio â'n cais arall am ddatganiad ar gyfarfod cyngor yr UE ar drafodaethau'r cyllid Ewropeaidd a'r goblygiadau i Gymru. Nodwn y gwneir y datganiad hwn yfory.

Croesawn y ffaith eich bod wedi cytuno i drafod y posibilrwydd o ddatganiad ar adroddiad comisiwn Turner yng nghyfarfod nesaf y Pwyllgor Busnes. Mae'n hanfodol i'ch Llywodraeth roi cymaint o bwysau ag y bo modd ar gyd-aelodau yn San Steffan er mwyn cael y fargen orau posibl i weithlu Cymru.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr ydym ninnau'n pryderu hefyd am ddiffyg ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddatganiad ar ddatganiad Gordon Brown ddoe ar y gyllideb. Mae ganddo ganlyniadau difrifol i lywodraeth leol yng Nghymru, ac ofnwn na fydd digon o amser yn y ddadl ar gyllideb y Cynulliad i edrych ar ganlyniadau cyhoeddiad Gordon Brown ar gyfer Cymru.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Ofer oedd gobeithio cael gweld tymor ewyllys da yn amlygu'i hun yn un o gyfarfodydd olaf y Cynulliad cyn y Nadolig. Digon gwan oedd y rhesymau dros wrthwynebu'r datganiad busnes.

I cannot believe what Alun Ffred said—it is absolutely appalling that that kind of comment was made. The Minister for Health and Social Services always responds, on a weekly basis if necessary, with oral statements on important public health issues such as E.coli and the safety of the water supply in north Wales. He issued a written statement and made an oral statement in the Chamber last week. He will update his written statement early next week. That is what we expect and get from our Minister for Health and Social Services.

I want to lift this up. This is our last business statement. Tomorrow, we will discuss the final Assembly Government budget that you have so constructively engaged with. We will not be debating the UK Government pre-budget statement tomorrow; we will be debating our budget. Of course Sue will refer to the implications and impacts of the UK Government pre-budget statement.

Lisa, thank you for welcoming how we have responded to your requests. Although the Turner commission is non-devolved, it has impacts and we will be returning to it in the new year.

Ni allaf gredu'r hyn a ddywedodd Alun Ffred—mae'n gwbl warthus bod y math hwnnw o sylw wedi cael ei wneud. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol bob amser yn ymateb, yn wythnosol, os oes raid, gyda datganiadau llafar ar faterion pwysig o ran iechyd y cyhoedd megis E.coli a diogelwch y cyflenwad dŵr yng ngogledd Cymru. Cyhoeddodd ddatganiad ysgrifenedig a gwnaeth ddatganiad llafar yn y Siambr yr wythnos diwethaf. Bydd yn diweddarau ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig yn gynnwys yr wythnos nesaf. Dyna'r hyn yr ydym yn ei ddisgwyl ac yn ei gael gan ein Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Yr wyf am godi'r safon. Hwn yw ein datganiad busnes olaf. Yfory, byddwn yn trafod cyllideb derfynol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yr ydych wedi bod yn ymwneud mor adeiladol â hi. Ni fyddwn yn trafod datganiad rhag-gyllidebol Llywodraeth y DU yfory; byddwn yn trafod ein cyllideb ni. Wrth gwrs bydd Sue yn cyfeirio at oblygiadau ac effeithiau datganiad rhag-gyllidebol Llywodraeth y DU.

Lisa, diolch i chi am groesawu sut yr ydym wedi ymateb i'ch ceisiadau. Er nad yw comisiwn Turner wedi'i ddatganoli, mae iddo effeithiau a byddwn yn dychwelyd ato yn y flwyddyn newydd.

*Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.  
Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David

Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion defeated.*

### **Pwynt o Drefn Point of Order**

**Christine Gwyther:** Point of order. I raise this on conduct in the Chamber and it relates to the comments made just now by Alun Ffred Jones. I consider that his comments were an allegation of geographic discrimination by the Minister for Health and Social Services. I ask for your ruling on this matter and on whether the Member should be asked to withdraw his comments.

**The Presiding Officer:** I heard a geographical argument used, but I would not describe the expression as disorderly in terms of our normal expressions of debate in the Chamber. It is normally accusations against individuals that are regarded as disorderly.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Further to this point of order, I take great exception to the accusation made by Alun Ffred during his intervention. I am taking a close personal interest in precisely what is going on with the cryptosporidiosis outbreak in north Wales, and any suggestion that there is discrimination in terms of its happening in north-west Wales and in my own constituency of Aberafan is totally out of order and outrageous. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have ruled on this matter—[*Interruption.*] Order. I have however noted that the Minister has at all times responded on this and on other issues in the Chamber and by written statement.

**Christine Gwyther:** Pwynt o drefn. Yr wyf yn codi hyn ynghylch ymddygiad yn y Siambr, ac mae'n ymwneud â'r sylwadau sydd newydd eu cyflwyno gan Alun Ffred Jones. Yr wyf yn barnu bod ei sylwadau'n honni bod gwahaniaethu daearyddol gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Gofynnaf am eich dyfarniad ar y mater hwn ac ynghylch a ddylid gofyn i'r Aelod dynnu ei sylwadau'n ôl.

**Y Llywydd:** Clywais ddadl ddaearyddol yn cael ei defnyddio, ond ni fyddwn yn disgrifio'r ymadrodd yn afreolus o ran yr ymadroddion a ddefnyddiwn yn ein dadlau arferol yn y Siambr. Fel arfer cyhuddiadau yn erbyn unigolion a ystyrir yn afreolus.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Ymhellach i'r pwynt o drefn hwn, yr wyf yn anfodlon iawn ar y cyhuddiad a wnaethpwyd gan Alun Ffred yn ystod ei ymyrraeth. Yr wyf yn cymryd diddordeb personol agos yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd gyda'r haint cryptosporidiosis yng ngogledd Cymru, ac mae unrhyw awgrym bod gwahaniaethu'n digwydd o ran ei fod yn digwydd yn y gogledd-orllewin a'm hetholaeth i yn Aberafan yn gyfan gwbl annerbyniol ac yn warthus [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi dyfarnu ar y mater hwn—[*Torri ar draws.*] Trefn. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf wedi nodi bod y Gweinidog bob amser wedi ymateb i'r mater hwn ac i faterion eraill yn y Siambr a thrwy ddatganiad ysgrifenedig.

Cyn inni symud ymlaen, croesawaf Before we move on with business, I welcome

ddirprwyaeth o—[*Torri ar draws.*] Esgusodwch fi, yr wyf yn siarad ac yn rhoi croeso i ymwelwyr. Hoffwn gael tawelwch ac ychydig o gwrteisi.

a delegation from—[*Interruption.*] Excuse me, I am speaking and welcoming visitors. I would like quiet and a bit of courtesy.

Mae'n rhoi pleser imi groesawu dirprwyaeth i'r Cynulliad o Senedd Teyrnas Tonga, sydd yn cael ei harwain gan y Llefarydd. Croeso mawr ichi. [*Cymeradwyaeth.*]

It gives me great pleasure to welcome a delegation to the Assembly from the Parliament of the Kingdom of Tonga, which is led by its Speaker. Welcome. [*Applause.*]

### **Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2005**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005 on the draft the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

*1a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*b) approves that the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2005 is made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005. (NDM2720)*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2720)*

*Cynnig (NDM2720): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2720): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau'r Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Valuation Tribunal (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
 propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Valuation  
 Tribunals (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy  
 of which was laid in the Table Office on 22  
 November 2005. (NDM2721)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau'r  
 Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005 y  
 gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa  
 Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2721)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation  
 Committee laid in the Table Office and e-  
 mailed to Assembly Members on 29  
 November 2005 in relation to the draft of the*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau  
 a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-  
 bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29  
 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft,*

*Valuation Tribunals (Wales) Regulations 2005; and* *Rheoliadau'r Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005; a*

2. *approves that the Valuation Tribunals (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:* 2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau'r Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005;* a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005;*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005;* b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005;*

c) *the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005. (NDM2722)* c) *y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2722)*

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes neb yn dymuno siarad am y cynnig hwn, felly symudwn i bleidlais.

**The Presiding Officer:** No Members wish to speak to this motion, therefore we move to a vote.

*Cynnig (NDM2721): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2721): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David



Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2722): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2722): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri

Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005, a  
 Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Gŵynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005  
 Approval of the Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations  
 2005, and the Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*considers the principle of the Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005. (NDM2723)*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2723)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005 in relation to the draft Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005 ynglŷn â drafft y Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. approves that the Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005;*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2005; and*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2005; ac*

c) *the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005.* (NDM2724)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*considers the principle of the Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005.* (NDM2725)

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005 in relation to the draft Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 9 November 2005; and*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005.* (NDM2726)

These two sets of regulations, one for children services and the other for adult services, will create a new framework for complaints within social services, which will cover all social services provided by local authorities and all services in the independent sector that are purchased by them. This is the first opportunity that the Assembly has had to replace the regulations and directions made on an England-and-Wales basis in 1990 and 1991. We held our own consultation on social services complaints in 2001, and waited for Westminster legislation in 2002 and 2003 for the powers to make the changes that we proposed then. In terms of children services, this represents another important milestone in

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005.* (NDM2724)

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Gwynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005.* (NDM2725)

Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005 ynglŷn â drafft heoliadau Gweithdrefn Gwynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Gwynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 9 Tachwedd 2005; a*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005.* (NDM2726)

Bydd y ddwy gyfres hyn o reoliadau, un ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant a'r llall ar gyfer gwasanaethau oedolion, yn creu fframwaith newydd ar gyfer cwynion yn y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac yn berthnasol i'r holl wasanaethau cymdeithasol a ddarperir gan awdurdodau lleol a'r holl wasanaethau yn y sector annibynnol a brynir ganddynt. Dyma'r cyfle cyntaf a gafodd y Cynulliad i ddisodli'r rheoliadau a'r cyfarwyddiadau a wnaed ar sail Cymru a Lloegr yn 1990 ac 1991. Cynhaliwyd ein hymgyngoriad ein hunain gennym ar gwynion y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn 2001, ond bu'n rhaid aros tan 2002 a 2003 am ddeddfwriaeth yn San Steffan i gael y pwerau i wneud y newidiadau

our response to the Waterhouse report on child abuse in north Wales.

The children and adults who use social services will benefit in a number of ways. The regulations will create a unified and more coherent set of arrangements, and there will be one volume of guidance. Wherever possible, the differences between the two sets of regulations will be eliminated. The regulations will strengthen the duties on local authorities to safeguard and promote the welfare of service users, and will provide the same three-stage procedure for all social services complaints. They will extend the scope of the procedure within children's services to cover care, supervision and child protection, and will provide arrangements for managing those complex situations in which, for example, the police, the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales or the Care Council for Wales are investigating the same concerns and may need to prosecute.

The regulations will safeguard the existing automatic right to take an unresolved complaint to a panel hearing. However—and perhaps this is the single biggest change—the panels will be independent for the first time. Under the old arrangements, the local authority convened a panel hearing and, typically, one of the three members was independent. Under the new arrangements, both the membership and the administrative support will be wholly separate from the complained-against authority. The regulations and guidance set out new arrangements for links with complaints procedures in the NHS, education and other local authority services. This will be a major step towards a seamless complaints service for public service users in Wales.

These regulations and the associated guidance were developed with the help of a group that brought together all the key interests, including local authorities and those who use these services. It also included representatives of the Public Services Ombudsman for Wales and the Children's Commissioner for Wales. The Assembly Government has consulted widely on these

a gynigiwyd gennym bryd hynny. O ran gwasanaethau plant, mae hyn yn garreg filltir bwysig arall yn ein hymateb i adroddiad Waterhouse ar gam-drin plant yn y gogledd.

Bydd y plant a'r oedolion sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn elwa mewn nifer o ffyrdd. Bydd y rheoliadau yn creu cyfres unedig a mwy cydlynol o drefniadau, a dim ond un gyfrol o ganllawiau. Lle bynnag y bo hynny'n bosibl, bydd y gwahaniaethau rhwng y ddwy gyfres o reoliadau yn cael eu dileu. Bydd y rheoliadau'n cryfhau'r dyletswyddau ar awdurdodau lleol i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo lles defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, ac yn darparu'r un weithdrefn tri cham ar gyfer pob cwyn yng nghyswllt y gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Byddant yn ehangu'r weithdrefn o fewn gwasanaethau plant sy'n ymwneud â gofal, goruchwylio ac amddiffyn plant, ac yn cynnig trefniadau i reoli'r sefyllfaoedd cymhleth hynny pan fydd yr heddlu, Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru neu Gyngor Gofal Cymru, er enghraifft, yn ymchwilio i'r un pryderon ac efallai y bydd angen erlyn.

Bydd y rheoliadau'n diogelu'r hawl awtomatig ar hyn o bryd i fynd â chwyn sydd heb ei datrys o flaen gwrandawriad panel. Fodd bynnag—ac efallai mai dyma'r newid mwyaf—bydd y paneli'n annibynnol am y tro cyntaf. O dan yr hen drefniant, yr awdurdod lleol oedd yn trefnu gwrandawriad panel ac, fel arfer, yr oedd un o'r tri aelod yn annibynnol. O dan y trefniadau newydd, bydd yr aelodaeth a'r cymorth gweinyddol yn gwbl ar wahân i'r awdurdod y cwynir yn ei erbyn. Mae'r rheoliadau a'r canllawiau'n nodi trefniadau newydd ar gyfer cysylltiadau â gweithdrefnau cwyno'r GIG, addysg a gwasanaethau eraill gan awdurdodau lleol. Bydd hyn yn gam mawr ymlaen tuag at gael gwasanaeth cwynion di-dor i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Datblygwyd y rheoliadau a'r canllawiau cysylltiedig hyn gyda chymorth grŵp a ddaeth â'r holl fuddiannau allweddol ynghyd, gan gynnwys awdurdodau lleol a defnyddwyr y gwasanaethau hyn. Yr oedd hefyd yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr Ombwdsmon Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus Cymru a Chomisynydd Plant Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymgynghori'n

proposals. We have made particular efforts to consult directly with children and vulnerable adults who use social services, and the proposals have been overwhelmingly endorsed. I commend the regulations to the Assembly.

**Jenny Randerson:** On behalf of the Welsh Liberal Democrats, I welcome these regulations. However, I wish to make a few comments on them. Bringing together within the regulations the complaints and representations procedures will clearly lead to a more coherent system, which will be easier for people to understand. I welcome the informal process in relation to children. It helps people a lot if they can resolve situations quickly and informally.

3.20 p.m.

I also welcome the independent aspect. There is a great deal of public confidence at stake, as there is a feeling that there will be a truly independent look at people's complaints. However, in bringing these together, new duties in relation to the timeliness of investigations are imposed on local authorities. We welcome the obligation that they will have to deal with investigations quicker than some local authorities have dealt with matters in the past. There are also obligations, such as the duty to ascertain and to take into account the user's wishes and feelings. Those are new issues for local authorities.

Time and again, almost every day that we sit here, we have a new obligation for local authorities. They all cost money and social services departments are not the most generously funded of local authority services. I ask the Minister to ensure that the money is in place to enable these new services to operate properly, and to ensure that the complaints procedures are properly funded so that they work as we would all wish them to work.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Thank you for your positive welcome to these regulations.

eang ar y cynigion hyn. Yr ydym wedi ymdrechu'n arbennig i ymgynghori'n uniongyrchol â phlant ac oedolion agored i niwed sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, a chefnogwyd y cynigion gan y mwyafrif llethol ohonynt. Cymeradwyaf y rheoliadau i'r Cynulliad.

**Jenny Randerson:** Ar ran Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yr wyf yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn. Fodd bynnag, dymunaf gyflwyno ychydig o sylwadau arnynt. Bydd cyfuno'r gweithdrefnau cwyno a gwneud sylwadau o dan y rheoliadau yn amlwg yn creu system fwy cydlynol, a fydd yn haws i bobl ei deall. Croesawaf y broses anffurfiol yng nghyswllt plant. Mae'n gymorth mawr i bobl os gallant ddatrys sefyllfa yn sydyn ac yn anffurfiol.

Yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r agwedd annibynnol. I raddau helaeth iawn, mae hyder y cyhoedd yn y fantol yn y cyswllt hwn, a'r teimlad yw y bydd cwynion pobl yn derbyn sylw gwirioneddol annibynnol. Fodd bynnag, wrth gyfuno'r rhain, bydd gan awdurdodau lleol ddyletswyddau newydd yng nghyswllt amseroldeb ymchwiliadau. Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rhwymedigaeth a fydd ganddynt i ddelio ag ymchwiliadau yn gynt nag y mae rhai awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud yn y gorffennol. Bydd rhwymedigaethau eraill hefyd, megis y ddyletswydd i ganfod beth yw dymuniadau a theimladau'r defnyddiwr ac i ystyried y rheini. Mae'r pethau hyn yn ystyriaethau newydd i awdurdodau lleol.

Dro ar ôl tro, bron bob dydd yr eisteddwn yn y fan hon, mae gennym rwymedigaeth newydd i awdurdodau lleol. Maent i gyd yn costio arian ac nid yw adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ymhlith y rhai sy'n derbyn y cyllid mwyaf gan awdurdodau lleol. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog sicrhau bod arian ar gael fel bod y gwasanaethau newydd hyn yn gallu gweithredu'n foddhaol, a bod y gweithdrefnau cwyno wedi eu cyllido'n iawn fel eu bod yn gweithio fel y byddem i gyd yn dymuno iddynt weithio.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Diolch am eich croeso cadarnhaol i'r rheoliadau hyn.

Everything that you say is true. On the funding, largely regarding children, the increased range of responsibilities will, hopefully, be met through the Children First grant. As for adult services, you will be aware that, pending support from the Assembly tomorrow, an additional £25 million will be provided for adult social services in Wales in an unhypothecated way, which will help to address some of these costs.

Mae popeth yr ydych yn ei ddweud yn wir. O ran y cyllido, yn bennaf yng nghyswllt plant, bydd yr arian ar gyfer yr ystod ehangach o gyfrifoldebau yn dod, gobeithio, o'r grant Plant yn Gyntaf. O ran gwasanaethau oedolion, byddwch yn ymwybodol, gan ddisgwyl y bydd y Cynulliad yn ei gefnogi yfory, fod £25 miliwn ychwanegol i'w roi ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion yng Nghymru, sy'n arian heb ei glustnodi, i helpu i dalu rhai o'r costau hyn.

*Cynnig (NDM2723): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2723): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2724): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2724): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2725): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2725): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*



*Cynnig (NDM2726): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2726): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi  
Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005  
Approval of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support  
Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*considers the principle of the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 15 November 2005. (NDM2727)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005 in relation to the draft the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 15 November 2005;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 November 2005. (NDM2728)*

This is an amendment to the original regulations, as the Assembly can see. The amendment deals primarily with an amendment to the definition of 'good agricultural and environmental condition'. It also deals with soil assessment records, and amends slightly the original regulations with regard to hedge-cutting and hedge-laying.

**Glyn Davies:** As the Minister says, these regulations refer to the single farm payment and to environmental cross-compliant

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2727)*

Cynigiad fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005 ynglŷn â drafft Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Tachwedd 2005;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2728)*

Diwygiad yw hyn i'r rheoliadau gwreiddiol, fel y gall y Cynulliad weld. Mae'r diwygiad yn ymwneud yn bennaf â diwygiad i'r diffiniad o 'gyflwr amaethyddol ac amgylcheddol da'. Mae hefyd yn ymwneud â chofnodion asesu pridd, ac yn newid mymryn ar y rheoliadau gwreiddiol o ran torri a phlygu perthi.

**Glyn Davies:** Fel y mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud, mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn cyfeirio at y taliad sengl a'r rheoliadau trawsgydymffurfio

regulations. I take this opportunity to say how much the industry in Wales applauds the fact that the payments of the single farm payment have been received by a huge number of farmers in Wales. Very often, we, on the opposition benches, criticise the Welsh Assembly Government for failures in its performance—and I think that it gives us quite a few opportunities to do so. However, on this particular issue, farmers and the industry across the rest of Britain, and possibly the rest of Europe, look at what has happened in Wales with great envy. We are probably among the first countries to deal with this issue, and it is only right that that should be properly acknowledged. Devolution delivers great successes as well as services that are sometimes not as well delivered as they may be over the border.

I would like to comment on the environmental condition and the cross-compliance rules, because that is what is referred to here. Generally speaking, we support these, as there has to be a proper and appropriate level of cross compliance before the single farm payment is paid. I hope that the Minister is as good as his word when he maintains that there will be a light touch. That appears to be the case so far.

However, there is one area of the single farm payment that I would like to refer to, as we are discussing the way in which it will proceed and how it is perceived and accepted by the industry. That is the need to be reasonable. We have to be reasonable and deal with everything with common sense. The access to the national reserve is causing huge resentment. More and more people are coming to see me about the unfairness of the panels that are making conclusions about access to the national reserve. Some members of the panels are also talking of the inflexibilities that bind them. I raise this issue because it is seriously damaging the process that has been adopted in Wales of making the single farm payment on an historic basis. I accept that tight rules are probably imposed by the European Union, and that the Minister will not have a great deal of flexibility on this issue. However, it is important that, where there is any sort of flexibility at all—and

amgylcheddol. Achubaf ar y cyfle hwn i ddweud cymaint o groeso sydd yn y diwydiant yng Nghymru i'r ffaith bod nifer fawr o ffermwyr yng Nghymru wedi derbyn y taliad sengl. Yn aml iawn, yr ydym ni ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau yn beirmiadu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru oherwydd methiannau yn ei pherfformiad—a chredaf ei bod yn rhoi digon o gyfle inni wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, o ran y mater penodol hwn, mae ffermwyr a'r diwydiant ledled gweddill Prydain, ac efallai yn y gwledydd Ewropeaidd eraill hefyd, yn genfigennus iawn o'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd yng Nghymru. Mae'n debyg ein bod ymhlith y gwledydd cyntaf i ddelio â'r mater hwn, ac nid yw ond teg cydnabod hynny'n iawn. Mae datganoli yn arwain at lwyddiannau ysgubol yn ogystal â gwasanaethau nad ydynt efallai'n cael eu darparu cystal, weithiau, â'r rhai dros y ffin.

Hoffwn gyflwyno sylwadau ar y cyflwr amgylcheddol a'r rheoliadau trawsgydymffurfio, oherwydd at hynny y cyfeirir yma. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym yn eu cefnogi, gan fod yn rhaid cael lefel iawn a phriodol o drawsgydymffurfio cyn y gellir talu'r taliad sengl. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn cadw at ei air pan fo'n dweud na fydd yn broses lawdrwm. Mae'n ymddangos bod hynny'n wir hyd yma.

Fodd bynnag, mae un maes yng nghyswllt y taliad sengl yr hoffwn gyfeirio ato, gan ein bod yn trafod sut y bydd yn gweithredu a sut yr edrychir arno a sut y caiff ei dderbyn gan y diwydiant. Yr angen i fod yn rhesymol yw hynny. Rhaid inni fod yn rhesymol a delio â phopeth drwy ddefnyddio synnwyr cyffredin. Mae cael arian gan y gronfa genedlaethol yn creu drwgdeimlad aruthrol. Mae mwy a mwy o bobl yn dod i'm gweld i ddweud am annhegwch y paneli sy'n penderfynu ynghylch cael arian gan y gronfa genedlaethol. Mae rhai aelodau o'r paneli hefyd yn sôn am y diffyg hyblygrwydd sy'n cyfyngu arnynt. Codaf y mater hwn gan ei fod yn gwneud niwed difrifol i'r broses sydd wedi'i mabwysiadu yng Nghymru o dalu'r taliad sengl ar sail hanesyddol. Derbyniaf mai'r Undeb Ewropeaidd, mae'n debyg, sy'n gyfrifol am reolau caeth, ac nad oes gan y Gweinidog lawer o hyblygrwydd yn y cyswllt hwn. Er hynny, mae'n bwysig, lle y bo

where there are obvious cases of unfairness completely undermining businesses, making them unviable and causing great hardship to individuals—the maximum level of flexibility should be introduced into the system so that it is perceived as being fair. Otherwise, a number of people will turn against the system that we have, rightly, adopted in Wales. Having said all of that, we very much support the proposals before us today.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this motion, and I wish to endorse the comments made by Glyn about the way in which the Minister has handled the issue of the single farm payment and taken the historic base. I also draw the Minister's attention to the part on soil assessments, which, once again, allows farmers to keep their records on the farm rather than submit them, thereby reducing bureaucracy. That is to be welcomed. However, I would like to raise one critical issue in relation to cross compliance on hedge-trimming.

I am aware that the Minister applied an adaptable view and allowed flexibility when approached by my colleague Kirsty Williams in respect of hedging matches, which take place during the late spring, so that there will be a way for farmers to get written permission to undertake training programmes and hedging matches during April. What plans does the Minister have to undertake environmental assessments to prove that biodiversity will be helped by shortening the period during which farmers can lay their hedges or trim them? There is some contention about this. I know that it is a difficult issue, and a lot of the evidence supports an increase in biodiversity, but it is also important that you, as Minister, provide the evidence. I would like to hear you undertake to take forward evaluations so that you can monitor this to assure us that we will be helping biodiversity by not trimming hedges during the traditional periods.

**Carl Sargeant:** I welcome this legislation, but I hope that the Minister will respond positively to some of the points that I raise

unrhyw hyblygrwydd o gwbl yn bosibl—a lle y ceir achosion amlwg o annhegwch sy'n tanseilio busnesau yn llwyr, gan eu gwneud yn anhyfyw ac yn achosi caledi mawr i unigolion—fod gofyn cyflwyno'r hyblygrwydd mwyaf posibl i'r system fel y gwelir ei bod yn deg. Fel arall, bydd nifer o bobl yn troi yn erbyn y system yr ydym, yn briodol ddigon, wedi'i mabwysiadu yng Nghymru. Wedi dweud hynny, yr ydym yn gefnogol iawn i'r cynigion ger ein bron heddiw.

**Mick Bates:** Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r cynnig hwn, a dymunaf ategu'r sylwadau a wnaed gan Glyn ynghylch y modd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi delio â'r taliad sengl a'i weithredu ar sail hanesyddol. Hoffwn hefyd dynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at y rhan ar asesu pridd, sydd, unwaith eto, yn golygu y gall ffermwyr gadw eu cofnodion ar y fferm yn lle gorfod eu cyflwyno, gan leihau biwrocratiaeth. Mae hynny i'w groesawu. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn godi un mater tra phwysig ynglŷn â thrawsgydymffurfio o ran tocio perthi.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol bod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn fodlon newid a'i fod wedi caniatáu hyblygrwydd pan gysylltodd fy nghyd-Aelod Kirsty Williams ag ef ynghylch y cystadlaethau plygu gwrychoedd, a gynhelir ar ddiwedd y gwanwyn, fel y gall ffermwyr gael caniatâd ysgrifenedig i gynnal rhaglenni hyfforddiant a chystadlaethau plygu gwrychoedd yn ystod mis Ebrill. Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Gweinidog i wneud asesiadau amgylcheddol i brofi y bydd byrhau'r cyfnod sydd gan ffermwyr i blygu neu docio eu perthi o fantais i fioamrywiaeth? Mae'n fater eithaf cynhennus. Gwn ei fod yn gwestiwn anodd, ac mae llawer o'r dystiolaeth o blaid cynnydd mewn bioamrywiaeth, ond mae hefyd yn bwysig eich bod chi, fel Gweinidog, yn darparu'r dystiolaeth. Hoffwn eich clywed yn ymrwymo i gynnal asesiadau fel y gallwch fonitro hyn er mwyn ein sicrhau y byddwn yn helpu bioamrywiaeth drwy beidio â thocio gwrychoedd yn ystod y cyfnodau traddodiadol.

**Carl Sargeant:** Yr wyf yn croesawu'r ddeddfwriaeth hon, ond yn gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb yn gadarnhaol i rai

today. I welcome the soil-management checklist that farmers will now have to fill in to receive payments. Unlike some of my colleagues, I also welcome the amendment on hedge-laying and cutting dates, which has proven popular with colleagues in the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds as it protects endangered species that nest in hedgerows. I fully respect that the farmers' games of hedge-laying and trimming during April are also important.

3.30 p.m.

My primary concern, and this was touched upon by my colleagues, is with the huge amount of payments to farmers in Wales—these were made on time, and the Minister should be given credit for that. However, I am concerned that these huge amounts of money are a kick in the Christmas crackers for my colleagues in other countries, because every £1 spent on CAP subsidies is a nail in the coffin of someone in another country.

I want this Minister to publish the amount of funding that goes to individual farms and farmers, as is done in England and other countries.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** First, in response to the point raised by my colleague, Carl Sargeant, I am aware of the possible change in viewpoint in Scotland. I bear that in mind because the legislation in Scotland is the same as that in Wales. I am giving active consideration to the request that Carl has made, given what has happened elsewhere in the UK. I will be discussing this with colleagues during the course of the week.

In terms of Glyn's point, we have the independent appeals panel, which has to take decisions. None of the panel members have said to me that they feel that their hands are too overtly tied. Nevertheless, we have to apply the rules that we are given from Europe, given that we are seeking to apply a European scheme.

I thank Mick and Glyn for their comments on

o'r pwyntiau a godaf heddiw. Croesawaf y rhestr wirio ar gyfer rheoli pridd y bydd yn rhaid i ffermwyr bellach ei chwblhau i gael taliadau. Yn wahanol i rai o'm cyd-Aelodau, yr wyf hefyd yn croesawu'r diwygiad ynghylch dyddiadau plygu a thorri perthi, sy'n boblogaidd ymhlith cyfeillion yn y Gymdeithas Frenhinol er Diogelu Adar am ei fod yn diogelu rhywogaethau sydd mewn perygl sy'n nythu mewn perthi. Deallaf yn iawn fod gêmâu'r ffermwyr o blygu perthi a'u tocio ym mis Ebrill yn bwysig hefyd.

Mae a wnelo fy mhryder pennaf, a bu i'm cyd-Aelodau grybwyll hyn, â'r taliadau enfawr a wneir i ffermwyr yng Nghymru—cafodd y rhain eu talu'n brydlon, a dylid canmol y Gweinidog am hynny. Fodd bynnag, pryderaf fod y symiau anferthol hyn o arian yn sgwd aruthrol i'm cyfeillion mewn gwledydd eraill, oherwydd bod pob £1 a gaiff ei gwario ar gymorthdaliadau'r polisi amaeth cyffredin yn hoelen yn arch rhywun mewn gwlad arall.

Yr wyf am i'r Gweinidog gyhoeddi faint o gyllid a delir i ffermydd a ffermwyr unigol, fel y gwneir yn Lloegr ac mewn gwledydd eraill.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Yn gyntaf, gan ateb y pwynt a godwyd gan fy nghyd-Aelod, Carl Sargeant, gwn am y newid posibl o ran safbwynt yr Alban. Yr wyf yn cadw hynny mewn cof am fod y ddeddfwriaeth yn yr Alban yr un fath ag yng Nghymru. Yr wyf wrthi'n ystyried cais Carl, o gofio'r hyn sydd wedi digwydd mewn rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Byddaf yn trafod hyn gyda chyd-Aelodau yn ystod yr wythnos.

O ran pwynt Glyn, mae gennym banel apeliadau annibynnol, sy'n gorfod gwneud penderfyniadau. Nid oes neb o aelodau'r panel wedi dweud wrthyf eu bod yn teimlo bod eu dwylo wedi eu clymu'n ormodol. Er hynny, mae'n rhaid inni weithredu'r rheolau a gawn gan Ewrop, o ystyried ein bod yn ceisio gweithredu cynllun Ewropeaidd.

Diolchaf i Mick a Glyn am eu sylwadau am y

the single farm payments. Tribute must go to the officials for the work that they have put in across all our offices in Wales to get the payment out ahead of anyone else, I believe, in the whole of Europe.

Finally, in terms of hedge-cutting and hedge-laying, these dates have been adopted because we know that hedges, through their production of berries, are an important foodstuff for birds. It is widely known that September is an important time in terms of the maximum berry bloom. If those hedges were to be cut too early in the season, there would be a difficulty in terms of the amount of berries available to wildlife and to birds in particular.

Mick asks what measurement would be put in place to see whether there is a positive effect on biodiversity. That would be a matter for the Countryside Council for Wales to consider. I am sure that those figures will be made available over time.

taliadau sengl. Mae'n rhaid canmol y swyddogion am y gwaith a wnaethpwyd yn ein holl swyddfeydd yng Nghymru i wneud y taliadau o flaen pawb arall, yr wyf yn credu, yn Ewrop gyfan.

Yn olaf, o ran torri a phlygu perthi, mabwysiadwyd y dyddiadau hyn am ein bod yn gwybod bod perthi, am eu bod yn cynhyrchu mwyar, yn bwysig o ran bwyd i'r adar. Gwyddys bod mis Medi yn adeg bwysig o ran sicrhau bod cymaint ag sy'n bosibl o fwyar. Pe câi'r perthi hynny eu torri'n rhy gynnar yn ystod y tymor, byddai anhawster o ran nifer y mwyar a fyddai ar gael i fywyd gwyllt ac i adar yn arbennig.

Mae Mick yn gofyn pa ddulliau o fesur a roddid ar waith i weld a oes effaith gadarnhaol ar fioamrywiaeth. Mater i Gyngor Cefn Gwlad Cymru ei ystyried fyddai hynny. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y ffigurau hynny ar gael ymhen amser.

*Cynnig (NDM2727): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2727): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin

Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2728): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2728): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val

Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Hylendid a Gorfodi) (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Feed (Hygiene and Enforcement) (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*considers the principle of the Feed (Hygiene and Enforcement) (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005. (NDM2729)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005 in relation to the draft the Feed (Hygiene and Enforcement) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Feed (Hygiene and Enforcement) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005;*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly*

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Hylendid a Gorfodi) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2729)*

Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Hylendid a Gorfodi) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Rheoliadau Bwyd Anifeiliaid (Hylendid a Gorfodi) (Cymru) yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005;*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at*



*Members on 29 November 2005;*

*d) the report of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 November 2005. (NDM2730)*

These regulations are part of the wider EC regulation 183/2005, which is to protect human and animal health from contaminated or otherwise unsafe feed and food.

These particular regulations provide the legal basis for administrative measures and the enforcement of penalties in relation to these regulations. They do not absolve producers from their responsibility to produce safe, wholesome food. Enforcement relates to receiving applications from feed businesses for the approval, registration, maintenance of lists, the visiting of premises, and from January 2008, making checks on businesses registered or approved for the first time to ensure that they are in compliance with the EC regulations.

We have consulted on these regulations. The estimated cost is of the order of £110,000, and the relevant sum will be transferred into the revenue support grant for 2005-06.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Croesawn y rheoliadau hyn, a gwelwn yr angen amdanynt. Fel y dywed y Gweinidog, yn y pen draw, byddant yn sicrhau y bydd y system o fwydo anifeiliaid, a'r gadwyn fwyd ar gyfer pobl, yn fwy diogel ac o ansawdd gwell yn y wlad hon.

A allwch roi rhywfaint o fanylion inni, Weinidog? Mae'r math o ganllawiau a gaiff eu cynnig i fusnesau a effeithir gan hyn yn bwysig. Pa fath o ganllawiau a gaiff eu cynnig iddynt, a beth fydd yr amserlen o ran pryd yn union y bydd y canllawiau hynny ar gael? O ran rhestru'r busnesau a effeithir yng Nghymru, sut yn union y bydd hynny yn digwydd? Mae cwestiwn cost yn codi eto. Pa fath o gostau a gaiff eu gosod ar fusnesau a effeithir?

Mae cwestiwn o fanylder yma. A yw hyn yn effeithio ar leoliadau lle mae da byw, lle nad ydynt yn cymysgu eu bwyd eu hunain, ond y

*Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005;*

*d) adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2730)*

Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhan o reoliad ehangach 183/2005 y Gymuned Ewropeaidd, sy'n diogelu iechyd pobl ac anifeiliaid rhag bwyd anifeiliaid a bwyd sy'n halogedig neu'n anniogel am resymau eraill.

Mae'r rheoliadau neilltuol hyn yn rhoi'r sail gyfreithiol ar gyfer mesurau gweinyddol a gorfodi cosbau o ran y rheoliadau hyn. Nid ydynt yn rhyddhau cynhyrchwyr rhag eu cyfrifoldeb i gynhyrchu bwyd diogel ac iach. Mae a wnelo gorfodi â chael ceisiadau gan fusnesau bwydydd anifeiliaid i gymeradwyo, cofrestru, cynnal rhestrau, ymweld â safleoedd, ac o fis Ionawr 2008, cynnal archwiliadau ar fusnesau a gofrestrir neu a gymeradwyir am y tro cyntaf er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cydymffurfio â rheoliadau'r Gymuned Ewropeaidd.

Yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ynghylch y rheoliadau hyn. Tybir bod y gost tua £110,000, ac fe gaiff y swm perthnasol ei drosglwyddo i grant cynnal refeniw 2005-06.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We welcome these regulations, and see the need for them. As the Minister says, ultimately, they will ensure that the system of feeding livestock, and the food chain for people, will be safer and of a better quality in this country.

Can you give us some details, Minister? The kind of guidelines that will be offered to businesses affected by this is important. What kind of guidelines will be offered to them, and what is the timetable for when exactly those guidelines will be available? On listing the businesses affected in Wales, how exactly will that occur? The question of cost arises again. What kinds of costs will be placed upon the businesses affected?

There is a question of detail here. Does this affect places where livestock are kept, where they do not mix their own feed, but do store

maent yn storio bwyd? A yw'r rhai hynny yn dod o dan y rheoliadau hyn, neu dim ond y busnesau hynny lle mae'r bwyd ei hun yn cael ei gymysgu?

Finally, you will have received reports, Minister, of studies concerning the ingestion of GM food and animal feed from GM Free Cymru. GM Free Cymru has also asked you to instruct the Food Standards Agency to look seriously at the recommendations made by Dr Stanley Ewen in his report, 'Potential Adverse Human Health Effects of GM Foods', and to immediately instigate research. Do you have any intention of responding to that plea from GM Free Cymru?

**Mick Bates:** I believe that we all welcome the increase in public confidence in the food that we eat. However, I would like to hear your view, Minister, on the continuity of the increased payments to local authorities to deal with these measures. Many local authorities feel that they are already underfunded when it comes to carrying out the enormous weight of legislation that we pass and expect them to implement. It is important to review each regulation so that local authorities can implement the meaning of the regulation. I draw your attention in particular to testing facilities for GM in feed products.

There was some confusion when I asked the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside about what facilities exist to undertake testing for GM in Wales. To maintain confidence it is critical that you are in possession of these facts, so that we can be sure that this food is being tested regularly and that those facilities are at hand in Wales, rather than feed having to be sent long distances, which would increase the cost.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Any GM feed material has to be assessed for safety; that is part of the process. I know, from what you have said on other occasions, that you are not always happy with the robustness of the assessment process. However, that is the process to which we operate in the present legal framework and constraints. Wherever it is pertinent, that assessment takes place. If

feed? Do those places come under these regulations, or is it only businesses where the feed itself is mixed?

Yn olaf, byddwch wedi cael adroddiadau, Weinidog, ynghylch astudiaethau ynglŷn â llyncu bwyd a bwydydd anifeiliaid GM gan GM Free Cymru. Mae GM Free Cymru hefyd wedi gofyn ichi gyfarwyddo'r Asiantaeth Safonau Bwyd i edrych o ddifrif ar argymhellion Dr Stanley Ewen yn ei adroddiad, 'Potential Adverse Human Health Effects of GM Foods', a mynd ati ar unwaith i wneud ymchwil. A ydych yn bwriadu ymateb o gwbl i'r ble honno gan GM Free Cymru?

**Mick Bates:** Credaf fod pawb yn croesawu'r cynnydd mewn hyder cyhoeddus yn y bwyd yr ydym yn ei fwyta. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn glywed eich barn chi, Weinidog, ynghylch parhad y taliadau uwch i awdurdodau lleol i ymdrin â'r mesurau hyn. Mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn teimlo eisoes nad ydynt yn cael digon o arian i ysgwyddo baich enfawr y ddeddfwriaeth yr ydym yn ei phasio gan ddisgwyl iddynt ei gweithredu. Mae'n bwysig adolygu pob rheoliad fel y gall yr awdurdodau lleol weithredu ystyr y rheoliad. Tynnaf eich sylw'n arbennig at gyfleusterau i brofi a oes GM mewn bwydydd.

Bu peth dryswch pan ofynnais i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad ynglŷn â pha gyfleusterau sydd i wneud profion ar gyfer GM yng Nghymru. Er mwyn cadw hyder mae'n hollbwysig bod y ffeithiau hyn gennych, fel y gallwn fod yn sicr bod y bwyd hwn yn cael ei brofi'n rheolaidd a bod y cyfleusterau hynny wrth law yng Nghymru, yn hytrach na gorfod anfon bwydydd ymhell, gan gynyddu'r gost.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae'n rhaid asesu unrhyw fwydydd GM er mwyn diogelwch; mae hynny'n rhan o'r broses. Gwn, yn ôl yr hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud ar adegau eraill, nad ydych wastad yn fodlon ar drylwyredd y broses asesu. Fodd bynnag, dyna'r broses yr ydym yn gweithredu'n unol â hi yn y fframwaith cyfreithiol a'r cyfyngiadau sydd ohoni. Lle bynnag y bo

that process is inadequate, then that needs to be changed, but people have to campaign for that. However, within existing processes, the assessment of GM, and so on, takes place.

3.40 p.m.

It is also important, in terms of research and so forth, that this is looked at on a case-by-case basis. As I am sure you realise, while there is a need for wider generic research, as each individual food item is introduced, it must be considered on a case-by-case basis, rather than as part of a wide generic assessment. I do not know whether some of those assessments take place in Wales. Perhaps I can find out whether that is the case. I have seen some information on this, but I cannot recall it at this moment. I will try to find out, and, if I may, I will get back to you in writing on that.

As I said in my contribution, we consulted the local authorities' co-ordinators of regulatory services. It is on the basis of our consultations with them that we came up with the figure of £110,000. We did not pluck that out of the air. In line with our general commitment to local government, that has been put into the revenue support grant without any ringfencing or hypothecation of those funds. That is the way that local government does things.

Rhodri Glyn spoke about the cost to businesses. The next set of regulations will cover that. If you look at the back of the regulations, you will see indicative charging per animal, which will be pertinent to today's business. On these general food hygiene regulations, it is probably worth saying, in the context of the earlier outburst from Alun Ffred, that one of the new elements of these regulations is the responsibility placed on primary producers—in other words, the farmers—to maintain proper hygiene standards at the point of production and to ensure that, as part of production, they do not allow the contamination of soil, groundwater or other things that could have an ultimately adverse effect for humans. These are fairly comprehensive regulations that, for the first time, deal with the process from the point of

hynny'n briodol, mae'r asesu hwnnw'n digwydd. Os yw'r broses honno'n annigonol, yna mae angen newid hynny, ond mae'n rhaid i bobl ymgyrchu dros hynny. Fodd bynnag, o fewn y prosesau presennol, mae asesu GM, ac yn y blaen, yn digwydd.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig, o ran ymchwil ac yn y blaen, inni edrych ar hyn fesul achos. Fel yr ydych yn sylweddoli, yr wyf yn sicr, er bod angen ymchwil generig ehangach, wrth i bob eitem unigol o fwyd gael ei chyflwyno, mae'n rhaid ei ystyried fesul achos, yn hytrach nag fel rhan o asesiad generig eang. Ni wn a yw rhai o'r asesiadau hynny'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Efallai y gallaf ddarganfod ai felly y mae ai peidio. Yr wyf wedi gweld peth gwybodaeth ynghylch hyn, ond ni allaf ei chofio ar hyn o bryd. Ceisiaf gael gwybod, ac, os caf, ysgrifennaf atoch ar y mater.

Fel y dywedais yn fy nghyfraniad, bu inni ymgynghori â chydlynwyr gwasanaethau rheoleiddio'r awdurdodau lleol. Ar sail yr ymgynghori a wnaethom gyda hwy y pennwyd y ffigur o £110,000. Nid dyfeisio'r ffigur hwnnw o ddim a wnaethom. Yn unol â'r ymrwymiad cyffredinol sydd gennym i lywodraeth leol, rhoddwyd hwnnw yn y grant cynnal refeniw heb neilltuo dim ar y cyllid na'i glustnodi. Dyna sut y mae llywodraeth leol yn gweithio.

Soniodd Rhodri Glyn am y gost i fusnesau. Bydd y set nesaf o reoliadau'n ymdrin â hynny. Os edrychwch yng nghefn y rheoliadau, gwelwch y tâl dangosol fesul anifail, a fydd yn berthnasol i'r busnes heddiw. O ran y rheoliadau hylendid bwyd cyffredinol hyn, mae'n debygol ei bod yn werth dweud, yng nghyd-destun ffrwydrad Alun Ffred yn gynharach, mai un o elfennau newydd y rheoliadau hyn yw'r cyfrifoldeb a roddir ar y cynhyrchwyr cynradd—sef y ffermwyr mewn geiriau eraill—i gynnal safonau hylendid priodol yn y man cynhyrchu a sicrhau, wrth gynhyrchu, na fyddant yn halogi'r pridd, dŵr daear na dim arall a allai gael effaith andwyol yn y pen draw ar fodau dynol. Mae'r rheoliadau hyn yn rhai gweddol gynhwysfawr sy'n ymdrin, am y tro cyntaf, â'r broses o'r man cynhyrchu

initial production through to the point of consumption at the dinner table.

GM products are dealt with on a case-by-case basis. When a product is introduced that includes GM elements, it will have to be individually assessed for its impact. That is what I was explaining to Mick Bates. These are looked at on a case-by-case basis, and a decision is made following a fairly vigorous risk assessment. As I said to Mick Bates, who had some concerns about the process, the due process that is laid down in the regulations is adhered to from the point of view of carrying out the risk assessment.

dechreuol hyd at y pryd bwyd ar y bwrdd cinio.

Ymdrinnir â chynhyrchion GM fesul achos. O gyflwyno cynnyrch sy'n cynnwys elfennau GM, bydd yn rhaid ei asesu'n unigol o ran ei effaith. Hynny yr oeddwn yn ei esbonio wrth Mick Bates. Edrychir ar y rhain fesul achos, a gwneir penderfyniad ar ôl gwneud asesiad risg eithaf cadarn. Fel y dywedais wrth Mick Bates, oedd â rhai pryderon am y broses, cedwir at y broses briodol a bennir yn y rheoliadau o ran cyflawni'r asesiad risg.

*Cynnig (NDM2729): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2729): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2730): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2730): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cig (Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2005  
Approval of the Meat (Official Controls) (Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*considers the principle of the Meat (Official Controls) (Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005. (NDM2731)*

I propose that

*The National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005 in relation to the draft the Meat (Official Controls) (Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Meat (Official Controls) (Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005;*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 23 November 2005;*

*c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005;*

*d) the report of the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee laid in the Table Office on 24 November 2005. (NDM2732)*

Producers already incur a charge for the inspection process. With the new regulations coming into effect in January next year, the legal framework will change. Consequently, these regulations are to give effect to the continuation of the charging regime. Schedule 2 of the regulations gives

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cig (Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2731)*

Cynigïaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cig (Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cig (Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Ffioedd) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005;*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 23 Tachwedd 2005;*

*c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005;*

*d) adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 24 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2732)*

Mae cynhyrchwyr eisoes yn talu ffi am y broses arolygu. Pan ddaw'r rheoliadau newydd i rym ym mis Ionawr y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd y fframwaith cyfreithiol yn newid. O ganlyniad, bydd y rheoliadau hyn yn peri bod y drefn ffioedd yn parhau. Mae Atodlen 2 y rheoliadau'n rhoi cyfrifiadau o

calculations of the official controls charge and details of the indicative cost per animal and so on from the point of view of the inspections. In answer to Rhodri Glyn's earlier question, in relation to storage, businesses will be required to register if they are storing feeds, but there will be no additional cost, as registration is generally required under existing regulations in any event.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats broadly welcome these regulations. However, I reiterate my previous points. The current cost of these regulations to the industry is £1.9 million, and the Federation of Small Businesses is deeply concerned that the nature of the cost, while necessary, is impacting in a bigger and bigger way on smaller businesses. As part of the regulatory appraisal, there is a commitment to a review, and I am particularly concerned that this review takes into account the impact of these charges on smaller businesses. Will you enlighten us as to the timing of that review, or if not, will you ensure that people are informed when that review will take place? I noted that there were not many responses to the consultation, which could mean that people are inclined to accept the charges. If there is an opportunity to reduce them, because the system is effective, I would welcome that, but there cannot be a conclusion unless there is a thorough review.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I made clear in my introductory comments that these particular regulations should have a minimal effect, if any, on the existing set of arrangements. They are, basically, introducing a series of charges that are compliant with the new European Union regulations and ensuring continuity with the old regulations, under which there was also a charge. However, the old regulations became obsolete with the introduction of these new EU regulations. No-one should be facing extra charges; this is merely about regularising the legal framework with the new food hygiene and meat hygiene regulations that will be introduced in 2006 as part of the EU rules.

ffioedd y rheolaethau swyddogol a manylion o'r gost ddangosol fesul anifail ac yn y blaen o safbwynt yr archwiliadau. Er mwyn ateb cwestiwn cynharach Rhodri Glyn, ynghylch storio, bydd rhaid i fusnesau gofrestru os ydynt yn storio bwydydd anifeiliaid, oni ni fydd hynny'n golygu cost ychwanegol, gan fod angen cofrestru fel arfer, beth bynnag, o dan y rheoliadau presennol.

**Mick Bates:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn at ei gilydd. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ailadrodd fy mhwyntiau blaenorol. Mae cost bresennol y rheoliadau hyn i'r diwydiant yn £1.9 miliwn, ac mae Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach yn bryderus iawn bod natur y gost, er yn angenrheidiol, yn cael mwy a mwy o effaith ar fusnesau bach. Fel rhan o'r arfarniad rheoliadol, mae ymrwymiad i gynnal adolygiad, ac mae'n arbennig o bwysig i mi fod yr adolygiad hwn yn ystyried effaith y costau hyn ar fusnesau llai. A wnewch ein goleuo ynglŷn ag amseriad yr adolygiad hwnnw, neu os na allwch wneud hynny, a wnewch sicrhau bod pobl yn cael gwybod pa bryd y cynhelir yr adolygiad hwnnw? Nodais na chafwyd llawer o ymatebion i'r ymgynghoriad, a allai olygu bod pobl yn barod i dderbyn y costau. Os oes cyfle i'w gostwng, oherwydd bod y system yn effeithiol, byddwn yn croesawu hynny, ond ni ellir dod i gasgliad heb adolygiad trylwyr.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir yn fy sylwadau rhagarweiniol na ddylai'r rheoliadau penodol hyn gael fawr ddim effaith, os o gwbl, ar y trefniadau presennol. Maent, yn syml, yn cyflwyno cyfres o gostau sy'n cydymffurfio â rheoliadau newydd yr Undeb Ewropeaidd ac maent yn sicrhau dilyniant gyda'r hen reoliadau, lle y codid tâl hefyd. Fodd bynnag, daeth yr hen reoliadau i ben yn sgîl y rheoliadau newydd hyn a gyflwynwyd gan yr UE. Ni ddylai neb wynebu costau ychwanegol; yr unig beth sy'n digwydd yma yw cysoni'r fframwaith cyfreithiol gyda'r rheoliadau hylendid bwyd a hylendid cig newydd a gaiff eu cyflwyno yn 2006 fel rhan o reolau'r UE.

*Cynnig (NDM2731): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2731): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2732): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2732): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:



Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981 (Diwygio) 2005  
Approval of the Animal Health Act 1981 (Amendment) Regulations 2005**

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that  
**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25.13:*  
*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25.13:*

*approves the draft the Animal Health Act 1981 (Amendment) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005; and notes the explanatory memorandum for these regulations, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 29 November 2005. (NDM2733)*

The purpose of these regulations is to replace the power to slaughter foot and mouth disease-susceptible animals on infected premises, as contained in the Animal Health Act 1981, with a duty to do so. It also outlines the exemptions to that duty, should it need to be carried out.

**Helen Mary Jones:** We will, obviously, support these regulations, as the Minister has made clear in the documentation before us that they are essential in order to ensure that we are complying with EU regulations. We are all hoping very much that this is an eventuality that Wales will never face again; there are farming families and people in rural communities who are still recovering from the trauma of the last time. However, we need to be prepared should the eventuality arise. I will ask the Minister a few specific questions with regard to the implementation and possible implications of these regulations. First, will the Minister clarify what exactly, under this new regulation, constitutes infected premises where the duty applies? Does this refer only to premises where the testing has already taken place, or does it include those premises that have been linked through epidemiological links? If it is the latter, can he provide us with some detail as to what constitutes an epidemiological link that would bring about the duty to cull rather than the discretion to cull?

3.50 p.m.

On the issue of vaccination, the Minister will be well aware that reports following the foot and mouth disease crisis have recommended that vaccination should have been considered

*yn cymeradwyo'r rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Deddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981 (Diwygio) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005; ac yn nodi memorandwm esboniadol y Rheoliadau hyn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 29 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2733)*

Pwrpas y rheoliadau hyn yw disodli'r pŵer i ladd anifeiliaid sy'n dueddol i gael clwy'r traed a'r genau mewn safle sydd wedi'i heintio, fel sydd wedi ei gynnwys yn Neddf Iechyd Anifeiliaid 1981, â dyletswydd i wneud hynny. Mae hefyd yn amlinellu'r eithriadau i'r ddyletswydd honno, pe bai angen ei gweithredu.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Byddwn, yn amlwg, yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn gan eu bod, fel y mae'r Gweinidog wedi dangos yn y dogfennau o'n blaenau, yn hanfodol i sicrhau ein bod yn cydymffurfio â rheoliadau'r UE. Yr ydym i gyd yn gobeithio'n fawr fod hyn yn rhywbeth na fydd yn rhaid i Gymru ei wynebu byth eto; mae teuluoedd amaethyddol a phobl mewn cymunedau gwledig sy'n dal i ddod atynt eu hunain wedi trawma'r tro diwethaf. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni fod yn barod rhag ofn inni orfod wynebu achos arall. Yr wyf am ofyn ychydig o gwestiynau penodol i'r Gweinidog ynglŷn â rhoi'r rheoliadau hyn ar waith a goblygiadau posibl hynny. Yn gyntaf, a wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro beth yn union, o dan y rheoliad newydd hwn, yw safle sydd wedi'i heintio lle y mae'r ddyletswydd yn berthnasol? A yw hyn yn cyfeirio'n unig at safleoedd lle y mae'r profion wedi'u cynnal eisoes, ynteu a yw'n cynnwys y safleoedd hynny sydd wedi'u cysylltu drwy gysylltiadau epidemiolegol? Os mai'r olaf sy'n wir, a all roi manylion inni o'r hyn sy'n cyfrif fel cyswllt epidemiolegol a fyddai'n peri bod dyletswydd i ladd yn hytrach na disgresiwn i ladd?

O ran brechu, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod adroddiadau a gyhoeddwyd ar ôl argyfwng clwy'r traed a'r genau wedi argymhell y dylid bod wedi ystyried brechu ac

and should be considered in future. Does this new duty affect in any way the future possible use of vaccination? Can the Minister tell us what progress has been made in producing contingency plans that might use vaccination to control an outbreak?

I also refer the Minister to the nature of the exemptions. In this case, the discretion remains, so can he tell us in his response what circumstances would prevent a decision to slaughter? How would he define which premises constitute separate holdings and separate production units under the terms of this legislation?

Finally, I will refer to compensation. I raised this issue recently with the Minister and, on 23 November, he rightly told me that we do not pay compensation when it comes to foot and mouth disease, as it is the responsibility of the Department for Environment, Food and Rural Affairs, which we are not keen to have devolved, for obvious reasons. Accepting that, the Minister will be aware of the recent recommendation of the Public Accounts Committee at Westminster that part, or all, of the cost of future disease outbreaks should be transferred from taxpayers to the industry. This is not directly his responsibility, but can he tell us whether he has discussed this suggestion with his Westminster colleagues? Where will he and his Government stand on making further representations if this proposal is further discussed?

**Glyn Davies:** The Conservative group will also be supporting the regulations before us today, which change the discretion to slaughter to a duty to slaughter in most circumstances, with exceptions. It brings policy in Britain into line with policy in Europe and, most importantly, introduces a level of clarity and consistency across Europe that will be helpful to everyone who has to deal with an outbreak of foot and mouth disease, should one occur in the future. One of the problems last time was the absence of clarity, which probably contributed to a great deal of the problems that we saw.

y dylid ei ystyried yn y dyfodol. A yw'r ddyletswydd newydd hon yn effeithio mewn unrhyw ffordd ar y defnydd posibl o frechiadau? A all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym pa gynnydd a wnaethpwyd o ran cynhyrchu cynlluniau wrth gefn a allai ddefnyddio brechu i reoli achos o'r clwy?

Cyfeiriaf y Gweinidog hefyd at natur yr eithriadau. Yn yr achos hwn, mae'r disgresiwn yn parhau, felly a all ddweud wrthym yn ei ateb pa amgylchiadau a fyddai'n atal penderfyniad i ladd? Sut y byddai'n diffinio pa safleoedd sy'n cyfrif fel daliadau ar wahân ac unedau cynhyrchu ar wahân o dan amodau'r ddeddfwriaeth hon?

Yn olaf, yr wyf am gyfeirio at iawndal, Codais y mater hwn yn ddiweddar gyda'r Gweinidog ac, ar 23 Tachwedd, dywedodd wrthyf, yn hollol iawn, nad ydym yn talu iawndal mewn achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau, gan mai'r Adran dros yr Amgylchedd, Bwyd a Materion Gwledig sy'n gyfrifol am hynny, a bod hynny, am resymau amlwg, yn rhywbeth nad ydym yn awyddus i'w ddatganoli. Gan dderbyn hynny, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o argymhelliad diweddar y Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus yn San Steffan y dylai rhan, neu'r cyfan, o gost achosion o afiechydon yn y dyfodol gael ei throsglwyddo oddi wrth y trethdalwyr i'r diwydiant. Nid oes ganddo gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol dros hyn, ond a all ddweud wrthym a yw wedi trafod yr awgrym hwn gyda'i gyd-aelodau yn San Steffan? Beth fydd ei safbwynt ef a'i Lywodraeth ynglŷn â chyflwyno sylwadau pellach os bydd trafodaethau pellach ar y mater hwn?

**Glyn Davies:** Bydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr hefyd yn cefnogi'r rheoliadau sydd gerbron heddiw, a fydd yn newid y disgresiwn i ladd yn ddyletswydd i ladd yn y rhan fwyaf o amgylchiadau, gydag eithriadau. Mae'n golygu y bydd y polisi ym Mhrydain yn cydfynd â'r polisi yn Ewrop ac, yn bwysicach na dim, bydd yn cyflwyno elfen o eglurder a chysondeb ar draws Ewrop a fydd yn ddefnyddiol i bawb sy'n gorfod delio ag achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau, pe bai achosion yn codi yn y dyfodol. Un o'r problemau y tro diwethaf oedd diffyg eglurder, ac mae'n debyg bod hynny wedi cyfrannu llawer at y problemau a welwyd.

I, too, will comment on the role of vaccination following any future outbreak. The European Union has decided that vaccination should play a part in any future controls, but I am not clear about that part. I have two concerns about this. The first is that we have to be clear about exactly when in the process vaccination would be introduced. The second is about the work that the Government is doing on researching and educating the public about the safety of eating vaccinated animals. One huge problem is that any vaccination would, currently, lead to a complete disappearance of a market for vaccinated animals. That has to be addressed. It is no good leaving it until there has been an outbreak—it has to be addressed now, so that it does not create fear that would completely destroy the market.

My final point is the one that Helen Mary Jones raised about meeting the future costs of outbreaks, not only of foot and mouth disease, but of other very expensive problems. We have seen the House of Commons report about the industry having to meet the costs; there will be a debate about that, and about the introduction of a levy. However, introducing a levy is not completely straightforward. It is unfair to introduce a levy on an industry that does not have any control over what might cause the original outbreak. People throughout Britain, within the industry and beyond, still believe that the control of entry points into this country is still far too lax. It would be hugely unfair if, as a result of lax controls at entry points, where the Government's lack of care allowed disease to come into this country, the bill was to be picked up by those who were already suffering in other ways.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats will support this motion. I endorse all the comments made by both Glyn Davies and Helen Mary Jones and add two other issues, to which I would like you to respond, Minister. I note that this piece of legislation does not have a regulatory impact assessment. The reason given for that in the memorandum is that there are no costs to business, but I feel that, in this case, that is an

Yr wyf finnu, hefyd, am wneud sylw ynglŷn â rôl brechu wedi i achos ddigwydd yn y dyfodol. Mae'r Undeb Ewropeaidd wedi penderfynu y dylai brechu chwarae rhan mewn unrhyw ymdrechion i reoli'r afiechyd yn y dyfodol, ond nid wyf yn glir ynglŷn â'r rôl honno. Mae dau beth sy'n peri pryder imi yn hyn o beth. Y cyntaf yw bod rhaid inni fod yn glir ynglŷn â pha bryd yn union yn y broses y byddai brechu'n cael ei gyflwyno. Mae'r ail yn ymwneud â'r gwaith y mae'r Llywodraeth yn ei wneud ar ymchwil ac addysgu'r cyhoedd ynghylch diogelwch bwyta anifeiliaid sydd wedi'u brechu. Un broblem enfawr, ar hyn o bryd, yw y byddai brechu'n arwain at lwyr golli marchnad ar gyfer anifeiliaid wedi'u brechu. Rhaid inni roi sylw i hynny. Ni allwn ei adael nes bod achos wedi digwydd—rhaid rhoi sylw iddo yn awr, er mwyn sicrhau na fyddai'n codi ofn nac yn dinistrio'r farchnad yn llwyr.

Fy mhwynt olaf yw'r un a godwyd gan Helen Mary Jones ynglŷn â thalu costau achosion yn y dyfodol, nid yn unig achosion o glwy'r traed a'r genau, ond problemau costus iawn eraill hefyd. Yr ydym wedi gweld adroddiad Tŷ'r Cyffredin ynglŷn â chael gan y diwydiant dalu'r costau; bydd dadlau ynglŷn â hynny, ac ynglŷn â chyflwyno ardoll. Fodd bynnag, nid yw cyflwyno ardoll yn gwbl syml. Mae'n annheg cyflwyno ardoll ar ddiwydiant sydd heb ddim rheolaeth dros yr hyn a allai achosi'r haint gwreiddiol. Mae pobl ledled Prydain, o fewn y diwydiant a'r tu hwnt i hynny, yn dal i gredu bod rheoli'r pwyntiau mynediad i'r wlad yn parhau'n llawer rhy lac. Byddai'n gwbl annheg pe bai diffyg gofal y Llywodraeth yn gadael afiechyd i mewn i'r wlad, oherwydd rheolaeth lac mewn pwyntiau mynediad, a bod y rhai sydd yn dioddef eisoes mewn ffyrdd eraill yn gorfod talu'r bil.

**Mick Bates:** Bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r holl sylwadau a wnaethpwyd gan Glyn Davies a Helen Mary Jones ac ychwanegaf ddau bwynt arall, Weinidog, yr hoffwn ichi ymateb iddynt. Nodaf nad oes ynghlwm wrth y ddeddfwriaeth hon asesiad effaith reoleiddiol. Y rheswm a roddir am hynny yn y memorandwm yw nad oes costau i fusnesau

unsatisfactory reason, in view of the experience of the foot and mouth disease outbreak, as we know that the costs to individual businesses and the industry as a whole were enormous.

The clarification regarding vaccination that Glyn Davies asked for will be important. However, the experience of the outbreak also showed that the speed of testing is also crucial to control it, but blanket vaccination within a prescribed radius from the initial outbreak may overcome that issue. Minister, could you inform us what work is being done to provide an on-the-spot, reliable and robust test that may reduce the need to vaccinate large areas unnecessarily? Such vaccinations give rise to the lack of consumer confidence referred to by Glyn Davies, unless education programmes are undertaken.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** There were a number of questions in there. In terms of what Helen Mary asked—what discretion exists in terms of determining whether a unit is completely separate and therefore not susceptible to having animals slaughtered on it—the answer is to be found in subsections 6 and 7 of the regulations, which outline what must be met in order to ensure that exemptions can be applied. It is ultimately a scientific decision and it must be taken by the Chief Veterinary Officer and veterinary staff, but they outline what the exemptions should be.

In terms of compensation, I have not discussed this matter with colleagues at Westminster—I certainly have not done so recently—and I have not yet taken a view regarding what the position should be in terms of taking things forward. I will bring in Glyn Davies's point on the levy: I did not quite agree with what he said, but he seemed to be saying that where there is no control over a situation, people should not have to pay insurance premiums. If someone is flooded in a once-in-30-years flood, the implication of what he said was that they should not have to pay insurance premiums or be covered by insurance. There is an

ynghlwm â hi, ond teimlaf, yn yr achos hwn, fod hynny'n rheswm anfodddhaol, o gofio'r profiad a gafwyd yn sgîl clwy'r traed a'r genau, gan ein bod yn gwybod bod y costau i fusnesau unigol ac i'r diwydiant yn gyffredinol yn enfawr.

Bydd yr eglurhad ynglŷn â brechu y gofynnodd Glyn Davies amdano yn bwysig. Fodd bynnag, yn ogystal â hyn dangosodd y profiad adeg y clwy fod cyflymder y profion hefyd yn hanfodol er mwyn ei reoli, ond gall brechu hollgynhwysfawr o fewn radiws penodedig oddi wrth yr achos gwreiddiol oresgyn y broblem honno. Weinidog, a allwch ddweud wrthym pa waith sy'n cael ei wneud i ddarparu prawf yn y fan a'r lle, sy'n ddibynadwy ac yn gadarn a allai leihau'r angen i frechu ardaloedd eang yn ddiangen? Gallai brechu o'r fath achosi'r diffyg hyder gan y cyhoedd y cyfeiriodd Glyn Davies ato, oni bai fod rhaglenni addysg yn cael eu cyflwyno.

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Mae nifer o gwestiynau wedi'u gofyn yma. O ran yr hyn a ofynnwyd gan Helen Mary—pa ddisgresiwn sydd ar gael o ran penderfynu a yw uned yn gwbl ar wahân ac felly nad yw'n ofynnol i anifeiliaid gael eu lladd yno—ceir yr ateb yn isadrannau 6 a 7 y rheoliadau, sy'n amlinellu pa ofynion y mae'n rhaid eu hateb er mwyn sicrhau y gellir cyflwyno'r eithriadau. Penderfyniad gwyddonol ydyw yn y pen draw a bydd rhaid i'r Prif Swyddog Milfeddygol a'r staff milfeddygol wneud y penderfyniad hwnnw, ond maent yn amlinellu beth ddylai'r eithriadau fod.

O ran iawndal, nid wyf wedi trafod y mater hwn gyda'm cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan—yn sicr nid wyf wedi gwneud hynny'n ddiweddar—ac nid wyf wedi mynegi barn eto ynghylch pa safbwynt y dylem ei fabwysiadu o ran symud ymlaen. Symudaf at bwynt Glyn Davies ynglŷn â'r ardoll: nid oeddwn yn cytuno'n llwyr â'r hyn a ddywedodd, ond yr oedd yn ymddangos ei fod yn dweud os nad oes ganddynt reolaeth dros sefyllfa, na ddylai pobl orfod talu premiymau yswiriant. Os yw llifogydd sy'n digwydd unwaith bob 30 mlynedd yn effeithio ar rywun, yr hyn sydd ymhlyg yn yr hyn a ddywedodd yw na ddylai fod rhaid iddynt dalu premiymau yswiriant na

argument for suggesting that a levy should be in place, although it is not something that I have pursued recently with colleagues in Westminster who are responsible for that.

In terms of vaccination, its use lies in slowing or stopping the rate of outbreak before the animals can be slaughtered. There is a particular practical difficulty in Wales because animals are not fenced in. One problem that we had four years ago was that even if we had sought to vaccinate, we would have had to build fences first to contain all the susceptible animals. Considering the fact that the disease takes five days to spread, it would have meant taking into account all the potential spread area and including apparently healthy animals. We would have come up against farmer opposition—there was no doubt about that—and had to fence in all those animals, vaccinate them, and then slaughter them. It works well in situations such as those experienced in the Netherlands, where animals are fenced in. In those circumstances it is far easier, but it is not easy in Welsh circumstances, although vaccination is, and was in 2001, a weapon that could be used if it was found to be practicable. Of course, it was not found to be practicable at the time.

On some of the other points that were made, Mick picked up on the point regarding the regulatory appraisal that no costs to business were identified. That is right. There were costs to business from the foot and mouth disease outbreak, but the relevant point is whether costs to business result from this legislation. He has not pointed out any costs to business that would be incurred as a result of this legislation being passed.

It is important to remember that we faced an unusual situation four years ago. I certainly hope—as do many others inside and outside the Chamber—that we will never face such a situation again. It is important to realise that we must have all the powers that we need, at our disposal, to ensure that we can deal with outbreaks, especially given that the nature of the outbreak four years ago was so different

chael eu diogelu gan yswiriant. Mae dadl dros awgrymu y dylid cyflwyno ardoll, er nad yw hynny'n rhywbeth yr wyf wedi'i godi'n ddiweddar gyda'm cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan sy'n gyfrifol am hynny.

O ran brechu, ei bwrpas yw arafu neu atal haint rhag lledaenu cyn y gellir lladd yr anifeiliaid. Mae hyn yn peri anhawster ymarferol penodol yng Nghymru gan nad yw rhai anifeiliaid yn cael eu cyfyngu gan ffensys. Un broblem a welwyd bedair blynedd yn ôl oedd hyd yn oed pe baem wedi ceisio brechu, y byddai'n rhaid inni fod wedi codi ffensys yn gyntaf i gaethiwo'r holl anifeiliaid a oedd mewn perygl. O gofio bod yr afiechyd yn cymryd pum niwrnod i ledaenu, byddai wedi golygu gorfod ystyried ardal bosibl y lledaeniad yn gyfan gwbl a chynnwys anifeiliaid a oedd yn ôl pob golwg yn iach. Byddem wedi gorfod wynebu gwrthwynebiad o du ffermwyr—nid oes amheuaeth am hynny—ac wedi gorfod ffensio'r holl anifeiliaid hynny i mewn, eu brechu, ac wedyn eu lladd. Mae'n gweithio'n dda mewn sefyllfaoedd fel y rhai a brofwyd yn yr Iseldiroedd, lle y mae anifeiliaid wedi eu ffensio i mewn. Mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath mae'n llawer haws, ond nid yw'n hawdd mewn amgylchiadau fel a geir yng Nghymru, er bod brechu, ac yr oedd hynny'n wir yn 2001, yn erfyn y gellid ei ddefnyddio pe gwelid bod hynny'n ymarferol. Wrth gwrs, gwelwyd nad oedd yn ymarferol ar y pryd.

Ynglŷn â rhai o'r pwyntiau eraill a godwyd, tynnodd Mick sylw at y pwynt yn ymwneud â'r arfarniad rheoliadol nad oedd costau i fusnesau wedi'u nodi. Mae hynny'n gywir. Yr oedd costau i fusnesau wedi deillio o glwy'r traed a'r genau, ond y pwynt perthnasol yw a oes costau i fusnesau'n deillio o'r ddeddfwriaeth hon. Nid yw wedi cyfeirio at gostau i fusnesau a fyddai wedi codi yn sgîl cyflwyno'r ddeddfwriaeth hon.

Mae'n bwysig cofio ein bod wedi wynebu sefyllfa anghyffredin bedair blynedd yn ôl. Yr wyf yn sicr yn gobeithio—fel y mae llawer y tu mewn a'r tu allan i'r Siambr hon—na fydd rhaid inni wynebu sefyllfa o'r fath eto. Mae'n bwysig sylweddoli bod rhaid inni gael yr holl bwerau sydd eu hangen arnom, i sicrhau y gallwn ddelio ag achosion, yn enwedig o gofio bod natur y clwy bedair

to anything that had previously been seen in Great Britain. It was particularly different to what was seen in 1967 and on the Isle of Wight in 1981. I trust that I have answered at least some of the questions.

blynedd yn ôl mor wahanol i unrhyw beth a oedd wedi bod ym Mhrydain Fawr o'r blaen. Yr oedd yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn a welwyd yn 1967 ac ar Ynys Wyth yn 1981. Gobeithiaf fy mod wedi ateb rhai o'r cwestiynau o leiaf.

*Cynnig (NDM2733): O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2733): For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

4.00 p.m.

**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Y Blaid Geidwadol)  
Minority Party Debate (The Conservative Party)**

**Seilwaith y Rheilffyrdd  
Rail Infrastructure**

**Alun Cairns:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.1:*

*a) establishes a committee to make recommendations on improvements in rail infrastructure and improved passenger services affecting Wales.*

*b) The title of the committee shall be the Committee on Rail Infrastructure and Improved Passenger Services.*

*c) Membership of the committee shall comprise three members from the Welsh Labour Party; one member each from Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, the Welsh Conservative Party, and the Welsh Liberal Democrat Party, and one member who does not belong to any political group.*

*d) The terms of reference for the committee shall be:*

*i) to formulate a programme of costed, achievable improvements in rail infrastructure and improved passenger services affecting Wales; and*

*ii) to make recommendations to the Assembly on the improvements identified.*

*e) The committee shall report to the National Assembly before 31 March 2006*

*f) The committee shall cease to exist on 19 May 2006.*

*2. Instructs the Business Minister to include, in a statement made under Standing Order*

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.1:*

*a) yn sefydlu pwyllgor i argymhell gwelliannau i seilwaith y rheilffyrdd a gwasanaethau i deithwyr, a hynny mewn perthynas â Chymru.*

*b) Teitl y pwyllgor fydd y Pwyllgor ar Seilwaith y Rheilffyrdd a Gwella Gwasanaethau i Deithwyr.*

*c) Aelodau'r pwyllgor fydd tri aelod o Blaid Lafur Cymru, un aelod yr un o Blaid Cymru, Plaid Geidwadol Cymru a Phlaid Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, ac un aelod nad yw'n perthyn i unrhyw grŵp gwleidyddol.*

*d) Cylch gorchwyl y pwyllgor fydd:*

*i) llunio rhaglen o welliannau i seilwaith y rheilffyrdd a gwasanaethau i deithwyr, a hynny mewn perthynas â Chymru. Bydd y rhain yn gyraeddadwy ac wedi'u costio; a*

*ii) gwneud argymhellion i'r Cynulliad ynghylch y gwelliannau hynny.*

*e) Bydd y pwyllgor yn adrodd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn 31 Mawrth 2006*

*f) Bydd y pwyllgor yn peidio â bod ar 19 Mai 2006.*

*2. Yn cyfarwyddo'r Trefnydd i gynnwys, mewn datganiad o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif*



*No. 5.3, time for a debate on the report submitted under paragraph 1(e), that debate to take place before 18 May 2006. (NDM2735)*

This motion stems from last week's transfer of functions to the First Minister, when grave concerns were highlighted about the way in which many railway policies are developed. The purpose of this motion is to establish a committee to formulate a programme of costed and achievable improvements in rail infrastructure and passenger services, and to make recommendations to the Assembly on the improvements identified. This follows the precedent established by the Welsh Assembly Government in setting up the Committee on Smoking in Public Places. It also follows the precedent established in setting up the Committee on School Funding and the Committee on the Inquiry into the E.coli Outbreaks in Wales.

*5.3, amser ar gyfer dadl ar yr adroddiad o dan baragraff 1(e), a'r ddadl honno i ddigwydd cyn 18 Mai 2006. (NDM2735)*

Deillia'r cynnig hwn o'r trosglwyddo swyddogaethau yr wythnos diwethaf i Brif Weinidog Cymru, pan amlygwyd pryderon dybryd am y modd y llunnir llawer o bolisiau'r rheilffyrdd. Diben y cynnig hwn yw sefydlu pwyllgor i lunio rhaglen o welliannau i seilwaith y rheilffyrdd a gwasanaethau i deithwyr a'r rheini'n gyraeddadwy ac wedi'u costio, a gwneud argymhellion i'r Cynulliad am y gwelliannau hynny. Mae hyn yn dilyn y cynsail a sefydlwyd gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar Ysmygu mewn Mannau Cyhoeddus. Mae hefyd yn dilyn y cynsail a sefydlwyd wrth sefydlu'r Pwyllgor ar Gyllid Ysgolion a'r Pwyllgor ar yr Ymchwiliad i'r Achosion E.coli yng Nghymru.

*Daeth David Melding i'r Gadair am 4.01 p.m.  
David Melding took the Chair at 4.01 p.m.*

There is no doubt that there are strong precedents for this policy, which has evolved in response to the failure of the Welsh Assembly Government to develop a policy for an integrated transport network with a particular focus on rail. The Assembly has not delivered according to its agenda, and the two obvious examples that come to mind are the Ebbw Vale and the Vale of Glamorgan railway lines. The Vale of Glamorgan line, at the outset, was to be the saviour of Cardiff international airport, because of the lack of an express road to the airport or a commitment of funding for that purpose. However, I would not be breaking any secret in highlighting the lack of use of that line, and especially the minibus that goes from Rhoose station to the airport. That clearly shows the Welsh Assembly Government's lack of vision, and its lack of commitment to railway services. It is always looking to do things on a smaller scale and on a tiny budget rather than take a genuine, strategic approach towards these services.

Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad oes cynseiliau pendant i'r polisi hwn, polisi sydd wedi datblygu mewn ymateb i fethiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i lunio polisi ar gyfer rhwydwaith trafniadaeth integredig gyda ffocws penodol ar y rheilffyrdd. Nid yw'r Cynulliad wedi cyflawni'r hyn sydd yn ei agenda, a'r ddwy esiampl amlwg sydd dan sylw yw lein Glyn Ebwy a lein Bro Morgannwg. O'r dechrau, yr oedd lein Bro Morgannwg i fod i achub maes awyr rhyngwladol Caerdydd, oherwydd nad oes ffordd gyflym i'r maes awyr ac na chafwyd addewid o gyllid i'r diben hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, ni fyddwn yn datgelu cyfrinach wrth dynnu sylw at y diffyg defnydd ar y lein honno, ac yn enwedig y bws mini sy'n teithio o orsaf y Rhws i'r maes awyr. Dengys hyn yn glir ddiffyg gweledigaeth Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a'i diffyg ymrwymiad i wasanaethau'r rheilffyrdd. Mae bob amser yn ceisio gwneud pethau ar raddfa lai ac ar gyllideb bitw yn hytrach nag ymdrin â'r gwasanaethau hyn mewn dull strategol gwirioneddol.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Did the Tory Government, when it ran Wales and the rest of the UK,

**Jeff Cuthbert:** A wnaeth Llywodraeth y Toriaid, pan arferai redeg Cymru a gweddi

show good vision in failing to invest in the railway network for 18 years? Also, was it good vision to break up British Rail in your party's privatisation of the train operating companies and the infrastructure companies, thereby setting them against each other?

**Alun Cairns:** I do not know why I gave way to such a weak intervention, with the greatest respect. It is obvious that the vision of the Labour Party and of Jeff Cuthbert is to look back rather than forwards. The whole purpose of this motion is to establish a committee to look forward because of failure by your administration and by the Minister to create a genuinely integrated transport policy.

Moving from the Vale of Glamorgan line to the Ebbw Vale line, let us not forget that it was promised that the latter, following the Corus closure, would be up and running by 2005. Now, however, work is due to begin on the line in the spring of 2006, and trains to Cardiff are not expected to run on that line until 2007. If there was ever a strong need for such a committee to look at railway policy and Assembly priorities and reconcile the priorities of Network Rail with those of the whole Assembly, and not just with those of the Welsh Assembly Government, then it is now.

**Peter Law:** You mentioned the spring of 2006 and 2007, but this issue is a continuing cycle of reverses. We started in 2003 with the picture of having trains running on this line by 2005. I have a letter from the Minister with responsibility for transport at that time telling me that trains would be running between Cardiff and Ebbw Vale in early 2005, 11 months ago, but those trains must be invisible in my valley, because they are not there. That has not been delivered, and that is what I am concerned about. A serious promise has been broken, and Members know how many times I have spoken in Plenary about this matter. Therefore, if we are to lift people out of social deprivation, do you not agree that the Government has a responsibility to take its promises seriously? In this case, it has not honoured its promise.

y DU, ddangos gweledigaeth dda drwy fethu â buddsoddi yn rhwydwaith y rheilffyrdd am 18 mlynedd? Hefyd, ai gweledigaeth dda oedd diddymu British Rail wrth i'ch plaid breifateiddio'r cwmnïau trenau a'r cwmnïau seilwaith, a thrwy hynny eu rhoi benben â'i gilydd?

**Alun Cairns:** Ni wn paham yr ildiais i ymyriad mor wan, gyda'r parch mwyaf. Mae'n amlwg mai gweledigaeth y Blaid Lafur a Jeff Cuthbert yw edrych yn ôl yn hytrach nag ymlaen. Holl ddiben y cynnig hwn yw sefydlu pwyllgor i edrych ymlaen oherwydd methiant gan eich gweinyddiaeth a chan y Gweinidog i greu polisi trafndiaeth gwirioneddol integredig.

A symud oddi wrth lein Bro Morgannwg i lein Glyn Ebwy, gadewch inni beidio ag anghofio inni gael addewid y byddai'r olaf o'r ddwy, wedi cau Corus, wedi ei sefydlu erbyn 2005. Yn awr, fodd bynnag, mae'r gwaith i fod i ddechrau ar y lein yn ystod gwanwyn 2006, ac ni ddisgwylir i'r trenau i Gaerdydd redeg ar y lein hon tan 2007. Os bu angen pendant erioed am bwyllgor o'r fath i edrych ar bolisiau'r rheilffyrdd a blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad a chysoni blaenoriaethau Network Rail gyda blaenoriaethau'r Cynulliad cyfan, ac nid gyda blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn unig, dyma'r adeg honno.

**Peter Law:** Crybwyllasoch wanwyn 2006 a 2007, ond mae'r mater hwn yn gylch parhaus o anawsterau. Dechreuasom yn 2003 gyda'r darlun o gael trenau yn rhedeg ar y lein hon erbyn 2005. Mae gennyf lythyr oddi wrth y Gweinidog a oedd â'r cyfrifoldeb dros drafndiaeth bryd hynny yn dweud wrthyf y byddai trenau yn rhedeg rhwng Caerdydd a Glynebwy yn nechrau 2005, 11 mis yn ôl, ond mae'n rhaid bod y trenau hynny'n anweledig yn fy nghwm i, oherwydd nid ydynt yno. Ni chyflawnwyd hynny, a dyna beth yr ydwyf yn bryderus yn ei gylch. Mae addewid pwysig wedi cael ei dorri, a gŵyr yr Aelodau sawl tro yr wyf wedi siarad yn y Cyfarfod Llawn am y mater hwn. Felly, os ydym am godi pobl o amddifadedd cymdeithasol, oni chytunwch fod gan y Llywodraeth gyfrifoldeb i gymryd ei haddewidion o ddifrif? Yn yr achos hwn, nid yw wedi cywiro'i haddewid.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Peter Law for that intervention, because he outlined the reason why this committee is needed—it is because of the Labour party's failure to deliver on policies that would help the people of Blaenau Gwent and other parts of Wales. I would not be surprised, Peter Law, if it was delayed yet further, and the Government, in the future, might try to bring Lady Jones or Baroness Jones to open the railway line. The people of Blaenau Gwent certainly showed what they thought of the possibility of Lady or Baroness Jones opening the line.

I ask the Assembly to approve the motion that aims to reconcile the priorities of the Welsh Assembly Government with those of Network Rail, so that Network Rail is clear as to what we expect and demand and what we want delivered.

**Janet Davies:** Whatever other people have done, Plaid Cymru has had a long-standing commitment to rail services, which was for environmental reasons initially. Provided that the level of seats occupied is reasonably high, rail transport produces less in the way of greenhouse gas emissions per passenger than many other forms of powered transport. However, rail is also important for economic reasons, both for passengers and freight. It helps to unite the nation and it allows the public and private sectors to base offices outside Cardiff, thereby relieving pressure on scarce land and spreading employment more widely.

Railways are the foundation into which other forms of transports connect. We have heard that several things have happened during the last six and a half years. Two Bills relevant to the railways in Wales have gone through the House of Commons, but, unfortunately, some opportunities were lost during the passage of those Bills.

The main problem comes from the amount of funding put into the infrastructure of railways in Wales. Wales is a very low priority when it

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Peter Law am yr ymyriad hwnmw, oherwydd iddo amlinellu'r rheswm pam mae'r pwyllgor hwn yn angenrheidiol—oherwydd methiant y blaid Lafur i weithredu polisiau a fyddai'n helpu pobl Blaenau Gwent a rhannau eraill o Gymru. Ni fyddwn yn synnu, Peter Law, pe byddai mwy byth o oedi, a phe bai'r Llywodraeth, yn y dyfodol, yn ceisio dod â'r Fonesig Jones neu'r Farwnes Jones i agor lein y rheilffordd. Dangosodd pobl Blaenau Gwent yn bendant beth oedd eu barn am y posibilrwydd y byddai'r Fonesig neu'r Farwnes Jones yn agor y lein.

Gofynnaf i'r Cynulliad gymeradwyo'r cynnig sy'n ymdrechu i gysoni blaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gyda blaenoriaethau Network Rail, fel bod Network Rail yn sicr o'r hyn a ddisgwyliwn ac a fynnwn a'r hyn yr ydym am ei weld yn cael ei gyflawni.

**Janet Davies:** Beth bynnag y mae pobl eraill wedi ei wneud, mae gan Blaid Cymru ymrwymiad ers tro i wasanaethau'r rheilffyrdd, ymrwymiad a oedd am resymau amgylcheddol i ddechrau. Cyn belled â bod nifer y seddau llawn yn weddol uchel, mae trafniadaeth y rheilffyrdd yn cynhyrchu llai o ollyngiadau nwyon tŷ gwydr am bob teithiwr na sawl math arall o drafnidiaeth sy'n defnyddio pŵer. Serch hynny, mae'r rheilffyrdd hefyd yn bwysig am resymau economaidd, i deithwyr a llwythi fel ei gilydd. Mae'n helpu i uno'r genedl ac mae'n caniatáu i'r sector cyhoeddus a'r sector preifat leoli swyddfeydd y tu allan i Gaerdydd a, thrwy hynny, yn lleddfu'r pwysau sydd ar dir prin a lledaenu cyflogaeth yn ehangach.

Rheilffyrdd yw'r sylfeini y mae mathau eraill o drafnidiaeth yn cysylltu â hwy. Clywsom fod nifer o bethau wedi digwydd yn ystod y chwe mlynedd a hanner diwethaf. Mae dau Fesur a oedd yn berthnasol i'r rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru wedi mynd drwy Dŷ'r Cyffredin, ond, yn anffodus, collwyd rhai cyfleoedd yng nghwrs y Mesurau hynny.

Achosir y brif broblem gan faint o gyllid a roddir i seilwaith y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Mae Cymru'n flaenoriaeth isel iawn o

comes to the work of Network Rail, and significantly less than 5 per cent of the total UK investment comes to Wales. It seems that the existing poor coverage in Wales is entrenched by this low investment. The upgrading of the signalling on the main southern line is under way, there has been improved signalling on the Valleys lines, which has allowed for more frequent services, and some station improvements are planned. However, in total, it cannot be said that this is adequate for the needs of Wales.

Network Rail has big priorities outside Wales, for example, to extend work on the west coast main line northwards, which adds to the tens of billions of pounds already spent there.

**Andrew Davies:** Do you acknowledge that the investment of £400 million that Network Rail is making in upgrading the Great Western line from Port Talbot to Newport is the earliest of the investments in the whole line from south Wales to Paddington, and that it represents one of the largest investments by Network Rail in upgrading the signalling throughout the United Kingdom?

**Janet Davies:** I am delighted that you mentioned that as the first part of the work on the main line from south Wales to Paddington, because, as far as I can gather, the rest of the investment in the line is way below the horizon. Before that happens, there will be work on Thameslink cross-rail through London, which will cost billions of pounds. That is now back in the programme, it is a high priority, and Network Rail is thinking of investing subsequently in the east coast main line. So, the poor old south Wales to London line is quite a low priority.

**Peter Law:** At the beginning of the line between south Wales and London, there is the key junction of the Ebbw valley railway. That is where the problem has been, because there is no signalling that allows access into Newport. So, the station, the rails and the infrastructure are there, but the signalling does not allow access for the people of the Ebbw valley. Is that not ridiculous? Is it not

safbwynt gwaith Network Rail, a daw ffigur llawer llai na 5 y cant o gyfanswm y buddsoddiad yn y DU i Gymru. Mae'n ymddangos bod y ddarpariaeth wael bresennol yng Nghymru yn cael ei dwysáu gan y diffyg buddsoddiad hwn. Mae'r gwaith o uwchraddio'r signalau ar brif lein y de'n mynd rhagddo, cafwyd gwell arwyddion ar leiniau'r Cymoedd ac arweiniodd hyn at wasanaethau amlach, ac mae rhai gwelliannau i orsafoedd ar y gweill. Serch hynny, drwyddo draw, ni ellir dweud bod hyn yn ddigonol ar gyfer anghenion Cymru.

Mae gan Network Rail flaenoriaethau mawr y tu allan i Gymru, er enghraifft, ymestyn gwaith ar brif lein yr arfordir gorllewinol i gyfeiriad y gogledd, ac mae hyn yn ychwanegu at y degau o biliynau o bunnoedd a wariwyd yno eisoes.

**Andrew Davies:** A ydych yn cydnabod mai'r buddsoddiad o £400 miliwn y mae Network Rail yn ei wneud i uwchraddio lein y Great Western rhwng Port Talbot a Chasnewydd yw'r buddsoddiad cynharaf yn y lein gyfan rhwng y de a Paddington, ac mai hwn yw un o fuddsoddiadau mwyaf Network Rail i uwchraddio'r signalau ledled y Deyrnas Unedig?

**Janet Davies:** Yr wyf wrth fy modd eich bod wedi crybwyll hyn fel rhan gyntaf y gwaith ar y brif lein o'r de i Paddington, oherwydd, hyd y gwelaf fi, mae gweddill y buddsoddiad yn y lein ymhell islaw'r gorwel. Cyn i hynny ddigwydd, gwneir gwaith ar draws-reilffordd y Thameslink drwy Llundain, gwaith a fydd yn costio biliynau o bunnoedd. Mae hynny bellach yn ôl yn y rhaglen, mae'n flaenoriaeth uchel, ac mae Network Rail yn ystyried buddsoddi wedi hynny ym mhrif lein yr arfordir dwyreiniol. Felly, blaenoriaeth eithaf isel yw'r hen lein druan rhwng y de a Llundain.

**Peter Law:** Ar ddechrau'r lein rhwng y de a Llundain, mae cyffordd allweddol ar reilffordd Glyn Ebwy. Dyma lle y mae'r broblem wedi bod, oherwydd nad oes dim signalau sy'n caniatáu mynediad i Gasnewydd. Felly, mae'r orsaf, y cledrau a'r seilwaith yno, ond nid yw'r arwyddion yn caniatáu mynediad i bobl o Lynebwy. Onid yw hynny'n hurt? Onid yw'n rhesymol

reasonable to expect for the Minister to direct Network Rail to do this work, so that we have this access for the people of Newport and the Ebbw valley?

4.10 p.m.

**Janet Davies:** That is one of the issues of having a committee that will build up political pressure to drive through these needed changes.

Plaid Cymru appreciates the £60 million that is to be invested in the Cambrian coastline railway and the piloting of an advanced signalling system. The line fits the needs of a simple, single-line service with a system that failed technically when it was tried out elsewhere in the UK. If it can be made to work, it will benefit the whole of the UK, and if proves unworkable, Cambrian coastline railway will have been the guinea pig.

Wales needs more investment to catch up and a bit of lateral thinking and determination from the Assembly. I find it galling to see money coming out of the general Assembly budget when Network Rail should be spending the money. On the other hand, if we do it, we must have a payback in terms of benefits for Wales.

Plaid Cymru supports the establishment of the committee as proposed in the motion because we must raise our eyes and our ambitions for Wales. One part of 'Aim Higher Wales' is getting a modern rail service that brings all parts of Wales—rural and urban—together, that carries urban commuters to work in the north-east as well as in the south-east, that supports tourism and that gets heavy freight traffic off the roads because that causes so much damage to the roads and to the environment. That is an important role for the railways.

**Peter Law:** This is an important debate and I am grateful to the Conservative Party for proposing it, as we need to be asking questions when the Government fails to deliver. I have just outlined why I am concerned: it is because the Government is

disgwyl i'r Gweinidog gyfarwyddo Network Rail i wneud y gwaith hwn, fel bod gennym y mynediad hwn i bobl Casnewydd a Glyn Ebwy?

**Janet Davies:** Dyna yw un o'r ystyriaethau ynglŷn â chael pwyllgor a fydd yn creu pwysau gwleidyddol i fwrw ymlaen â'r newidiadau angenrheidiol hyn.

Mae Plaid Cymru'n gwerthfawrogi'r £60 miliwn a gaiff ei fuddsoddi yn rheilffordd arfordir y Cambrian a'r gwaith o dreialu system signalau flaenllaw. Mae'r lein yn addas i anghenion gwasanaeth syml, un lein gyda system a fethodd yn dechnegol pan brofwyd hi mewn man arall yn y DU. Os gellir gwneud iddi weithio, bydd o fudd i'r DU gyfan, ac os gwelir nad yw'n ymarferol, bydd rheilffordd arfordir y Cambrian wedi bod yn destun arbrawf.

Mae ar Gymru angen rhagor o fuddsoddiadau i ddal i fyny ac ychydig o feddwl ochrol a phenderfyniad oddi wrth y Cynulliad. Mae'n fy nigio gweld arian yn dod o gyllideb gyffredinol y Cynulliad pan ddylai Network Rail fod yn gwario'r arian. Ar y llaw arall, os gwnawn hyn, rhaid inni gael ad-daliad o safbwynt manteision i Gymru.

Mae Plaid Cymru'n cefnogi sefydlu pwyllgor fel sy'n cael ei gynnig yn y cynnig oherwydd bod yn rhaid inni godi ein golygon a'n huchelgais ar gyfer Cymru. Un rhan o 'Anelu'n Uwch Cymru' yw cael gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd modern sy'n dwyn pob rhan o Gymru—yn wledig a threfol—ynghyd, gwasanaeth sy'n cludo cymudwyr trefol i'r gwaith yn y gogledd-ddwyrain yn ogystal ag yn y de-ddwyrain, gwasanaeth sy'n cefnogi twristiaeth ac sy'n mynd â thraffig cludiant trwm oddi ar y ffyrdd oherwydd ei fod yn peri cymaint o ddifrod iddynt ac i'r amgylchedd. Mae hynny'n rôl bwysig i'r rheilffyrdd.

**Peter Law:** Mae hon yn ddadl bwysig ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Blaid Geidwadol am ei chynnig, oherwydd bod yn rhaid inni ofyn cwestiynau pan fydd y Llywodraeth yn methu â chyflawni. Yr wyf newydd amlinellu paham yr wyf yn bryderus: oherwydd bod y

failing to deliver in my community. It has never had any greater support than that from Blaenau Gwent—it might not have had it in May, but it has certainly had it for decades before then. You would expect the Government to react quickly.

When I asked a question of the First Minister today, I said that we in Blaenau Gwent suffer from ultra-social deprivation compared with many. I do not begrudge anybody anything. I am pleased that the people of Rhondda have a railway—Leanne and I were talking about it outside. They have had that for some time—

**Leighton Andrews:** They only have it in Rhondda Fawr.

**Peter Law:** Yes, but they have one. The people of Caerphilly, Merthyr Tydfil, Rhymney and Aberdare have a railway. That says a lot about the former mid Glamorgan council. It was an asset where railways were concerned. However, in Gwent, we did not have that support, and so the people of Ebbw Vale and Abertillery were left. It is because of the initiative that has been taken in the Chamber up until now that the momentum built up to reopen the Ebbw valley line. That is important because upwards of 100,000 people in the Ebbw valley need this opportunity to be able to get to employment and educational opportunities or just to be able to enjoy the social opportunities that many people take for granted in many areas. People in many areas have the opportunities that we never see. That is why I am saying this; it is so important. If we are to change things for the better and take away social exclusion and deprivation, we have to deliver on these promises. You are not delivering on a promise made in 2003 to open something in 2005 when it will not open until 2007, according to the First Minister. That is not good enough, and I am disappointed with it. The people expect far better than what we have heard up until now.

Therefore, the committee that has been suggested would be a good move forward. It would include representatives from all parts of the Assembly. What is important is people

Llywodraeth yn methu â chyflawni yn fy nghymuned. Ni chafodd erioed gymaint o gefnogaeth ag a gafodd oddi wrth Flaenau Gwent—efallai na chafodd y gefnogaeth honno ym Mai, ond mae'n bendant wedi ei chael am ddegawdau cyn hynny. Byddech yn disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth ymateb yn gyflym.

Pan ofynnais gwestiwn i'r Prif Weinidog heddiw, dywedais ein bod ym Mlaenau Gwent yn dioddef gan amddifadedd cymdeithasol mawr iawn o'n cymharu â llawer. Nid wyf yn gwarafun dim i neb. Yr wyf yn falch bod gan bobl y Rhondda reilffordd—yr oeddwn i a Leanne yn siarad amdani y tu allan. Mae honno ganddynt ers cryn amser—

**Leighton Andrews:** Dim ond yn y Rhondda Fawr y mae hi ganddynt.

**Peter Law:** Ie, ond mae ganddynt un. Mae gan bobl Caerffili, Merthyr Tudful, Rhymni ac Aberdâr reilffordd. Mae hyn yn dweud llawer am yr hen gyngor Morgannwg ganol. Yr oedd yn gaffaeliad o safbwynt y rheilffyrdd. Fodd bynnag, yng Ngwent, nid oedd y gefnogaeth honno gennym, ac felly gadawyd pobl Glynebwy ac Abertyleri. Oherwydd y blaengaredd a ddangoswyd yn y Siambr hyd yma y crewyd y momentwm i ailagor reilffordd Glyn Ebwy. Mae hynny'n bwysig oherwydd y mae ar dros 100,000 o bobl yng Nglyn Ebwy angen y cyfle hwn i allu cael cyfleoedd addysgol a chyflogaeth neu allu mwynhau'r cyfleoedd cymdeithasol y mae llawer o bobl yn eu cymryd yn ganiataol mewn llawer ardal. Mae pobl mewn llawer o ardaloedd yn cael y cyfleoedd nad ydym ni byth yn eu cael. Dyna paham y dywedaf hyn; mae mor bwysig. Os ydym am newid pethau er gwell a dileu amddifadedd ac allgáu cymdeithasol, rhaid inni gyflawni'r addewidion hyn. Nid ydych yn cywiro addewid a wnaed yn 2003 i agor rhywbeth yn 2005 pan na fydd yn agor tan 2007, yn ôl y Prif Weinidog. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da, ac mae wedi fy siomi. Mae'r bobl yn disgwyl llawer gwell na'r hyn yr ydym wedi ei glywed hyd yn hyn.

O'r herwydd, byddai'r pwyllgor a awgrymwyd yn gam da ymlaen. Byddai'n cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o bob rhan o'r Cynulliad. Yr hyn sy'n bwysig yw bod pobl

having equal opportunity to travel on a modern, rapid-progress transport system, and it is possible that that can be done.

I have seen the railway line from Ebbw Vale and Abertillery, which is the second phase, and it is all there and feasible. All it needs is for the Minister to instruct Network Rail to get on with laying the track, where that is necessary, and to tell it where to install signals. I find it hard to understand why that is not happening, and also why there are no Members from Newport in the Chamber, because they have an interest in this. Those from Newport who e-mail and write to me say that the signals are there and ask why the line cannot be run through the Gaer tunnel and onto the mainline. We must have the resolve to say that, and to demand that it happens. Now that the Assembly has these powers under the Railways Act 2005, the opportunity is coming for us to change the face of railways in Wales.

The Dyfi junction loop is also important, and we have waited a long time for that. We were talking about that back when I was the Minister responsible for transport in 1999.

**Glyn Davies:** I was interested to hear you talk about Dyfi junction being discussed in 1999. When I was chairman of the Development Board for Rural Wales in 1989, one of the issues that most concerned us was the introduction of the hourly clockface service, which depended on the Dyfi junction. Therefore, this was discussed, with a real promise of success, way back in the 1980s.

**David Melding:** You are into injury time now, Peter. You have around 30 seconds left.

**Peter Law:** Very well. I will conclude by saying that what has been said is fair. I introduced something on behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government, namely a north-to-south link, which was funded especially to get people around the country and to give them that opportunity. I hope that this committee can also consider that in the future, because that is, again, in the interests

yn cael cyfle cyfartal i deithio ar system drafnidiaeth cynnydd cyflym, fodern, ac mae'n bosibl gwneud hynny.

Yr wyf wedi gweld y rheilffordd o Lynebwy ac Abertyleri, sef yr ail gam, ac mae i gyd yno ac yn ddichonadwy. Y cwbl sy'n ofynnol yw bod y Gweinidog yn cyfarwyddo Network Rail i fwrw ymlaen â gosod y cledrau, lle y bo hynny'n angenrheidiol, a dweud wrtho am osod y signalau. Yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd deall pam nad yw hynny'n digwydd, a hefyd pam nad oes Aelodau o Gasnewydd yn y Siambr, oherwydd y mae ganddynt fuddiant yn hyn. Mae'r rhai o Gasnewydd sy'n e-bostio ac yn ysgrifennu ataf yn dweud bod y signalau yno ac yn gofyn pam na ellir rhedeg y lein drwy dwannel y Gaer ac ymlaen at y brif lein. Rhaid inni fod yn ddigon penderfynol i ddweud hynny, a mynnu ei fod yn digwydd. Gan fod gan y Cynulliad y pwerau hyn bellach o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, mae cyfle inni weddnewid y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru.

Mae dolen cyffordd Dyfi'n bwysig hefyd, ac yr ydym wedi aros yn hir am honno. Yr oeddem yn siarad am hynny yn 1999 pan oeddwn i'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth fel Gweinidog.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr oedd yn ddiddorol i mi eich clywed yn sôn am gyffordd Dyfi yn cael ei thrafod yn 1999. Pan oeddwn yn gadeirydd Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig yn 1989, un o'r materion a'n pryderai fwyaf oedd cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth bob awr a ddibynnai ar gyffordd Dyfi. Felly, cafodd hyn ei drafod, gydag addewid gwirioneddol y byddid yn llwyddo, ymhell yn ôl yn y 1980au.

**David Melding:** Yr ydych bellach yn yr amser ychwanegol, Peter. Mae gennych tua 30 eiliad ar ôl.

**Peter Law:** O'r gorau. Yr wyf am orffen drwy ddweud bod yr hyn a ddywedwyd yn deg. Cyflwynais rywbeth ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, sef cyswllt rhwng y gogledd a'r de, a gâi ei ariannu'n arbennig i symud pobl o gwmpas y wlad ac i roi'r cyfle hwnnw iddynt. Gobeithiaf y gall y pwyllgor hwn ystyried hynny hefyd yn y dyfodol, oherwydd y mae hynny, eto, er budd Cymru.

of Wales.

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 4.16 p.m.  
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.16 p.m.*

**Brynle Williams:** I welcome the opportunity, like everyone else, to speak on the issue of rail services in Wales. Establishing this committee would be a real step forwards in improving public transport in Wales, and it would give the rail network the attention and scrutiny that it needs. It would mean that the Assembly's devolved powers would be used more intelligently, would provide a better return on investment, and would ensure that Wales has a totally integrated rail network tailored to its unique needs. Improving the links between north and south Wales, particularly, would bring a long-lasting change for the better. Commuters, tourists and the many businesses that operate within Wales all stand to gain from having a faster, more frequent service that can accommodate the number of passengers wanting to use it. More importantly, it would also go a long way towards combating the sense of isolation often felt by people living in north Wales. I, like many, feel totally isolated because of the rail structure.

When it is quicker to travel from Holyhead to London than from Holyhead to Cardiff, there is clearly a serious issue that needs to be resolved. I strongly urge the Welsh Assembly Government to work with Arriva Trains Wales to invest in developing a faster north-south, or south-north, line, and to begin a study into a business case for increased capacity.

**Ann Jones:** Do you not agree, Brynle, that, as of 12 December, which is next Monday, Arriva Trains Wales will be running a two-hourly service between Holyhead and Cardiff? It has also invested quite a lot of money along the north-Wales coast, with the help of the Assembly Government. We also have additional British Transport Police officers to improve safety on the north-Wales line. I do not know why you feel isolated, because I feel much safer travelling on that line now, knowing that the number of British

**Brynle Williams:** Croesawaf y cyfle, fel pawb arall, i siarad ar fater y gwasanaethau rheilffordd yng Nghymru. Byddai sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn yn gam gwirioneddol ymlaen tuag at wella trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yng Nghymru, a byddai'n rhoi i'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd y sylw a'r craffu y mae eu hangen arno. Byddai'n golygu y câi pwerau datganoledig y Cynulliad eu defnyddio'n fwy deallus, byddai'n rhoi mwy o enillion ar fuddsoddiad, a byddai'n sicrhau bod gan Gymru rwydwaith rheilffyrdd cwbl integredig wedi'i addasu ar gyfer ei hanghenion unigryw. Byddai gwella'r cysylltiadau rhwng gogledd a de Cymru, yn enwedig, yn dod â newid hirbarhaol er gwell. Byddai cymudwyr, twristiaid a'r llu o fusnesau sy'n gweithredu yng Nghymru i gyd yn elwa o gael gwasanaeth cyflymach, amlach, sy'n gallu cymryd nifer y teithwyr sydd am ei ddefnyddio. Yn bwysicach, byddai'n gwneud llawer hefyd i wrthweithio'r teimlad o fod wedi'u hynysu a deimlir yn aml gan bobl sy'n byw yng ngogledd Cymru. Yr wyf fi, fel llawer, yn teimlo fy mod wedi fy ynysu'n llwyr oherwydd strwythur y rheilffyrdd.

A hithau'n gyflymach teithio o Gaerdybi i Lundain nag o Gaerdybi i Gaerdydd, mae'n amlwg bod problem ddifrifol y mae angen ei datrys. Anogaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gryf i weithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru i fuddsoddi er mwyn datblygu rheilffordd gyflymach o'r gogledd i'r de, neu o'r de i'r gogledd, ac i ddechrau ar astudiaeth ar achos busnes o blaid cynyddu'r capasiti.

**Ann Jones:** Onid ydych yn cytuno, Brynle, y bydd Trenau Arriva Cymru, o 12 Rhagfyr, sef dydd Llun nesaf, yn rhedeg gwasanaeth bob dwy awr rhwng Caerdybi a Chaerdydd? Mae hefyd wedi buddsoddi cryn lawer o arian ar hyd arfordir y gogledd, gyda help Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae gennym hefyd swyddogion ychwanegol o Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain i wella'r diogelwch ar reilffordd y gogledd. Ni wn pam yr ydych yn teimlo eich bod wedi eich ynysu, oherwydd yr wyf fi'n teimlo'n llawer mwy diogel wrth



Transport Police officers has increased and that uniformed North Wales Police officers are now allowed to travel on any train in an attempt to keep passenger safety in mind.

**Brynle Williams:** Thank you for those comments, Ann. I strongly urge the Welsh Assembly Government to work with Arriva Trains Wales, to get a faster—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** *rose*—

**Brynle Williams:** Go on.

4.20 p.m.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I was interested to hear the intervention by Ann Jones, as I am sure Brynle was, because when the new service starts in December, all those trains will be stationary in Shrewsbury for between 15 and 20 minutes for no apparent reason. Why should we be treated like second-class citizens?

**Brynle Williams:** Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r hyn y mae fy nghyfaill wedi ei ddweud.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take another intervention?

**Brynle Williams:** Go on.

**Eleanor Burnham:** The new timetable fascinates me. You are given a timetable that does not link up the whole of Wales; it is all in little bits. You have to acquire a whole library of timetables to make sense of anything. When you look at it carefully, you see that it is inconvenient for most people who travel by train daily. According to the new timetable, Assembly Members in north Wales will have to get on the train at Holyhead at around 5.30 a.m. in order to reach Cardiff by 9.30 a.m. Are we in the third world or is this an advanced nation? In Wrexham, we will have to be on the train at 6.20 a.m. and then, if we are lucky, we might be here for around 9.30 a.m.. Some of our committees start at 9 a.m.. What good is that?

deithio ar y rheilffordd honno yn awr, gan wybod bod nifer y swyddogion o Heddlu Trafnidiaeth Prydain wedi cynyddu ac y caniateir erbyn hyn i swyddogion mewn lifrai o Heddlu Gogledd Cymru deithio ar unrhyw drên mewn ymgais i roi sylw i ddiogelwch teithwyr.

**Brynle Williams:** Diolch ichi am y sylwadau hynny, Ann. Anogaf Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gryf i weithio gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru, i gael—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones** *a gododd*—

**Brynle Williams:** Iawn.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr oedd yn ddiddorol i mi, fel yr oedd i Brynle yr wyf yn siŵr, glywed yr ymyriad gan Ann Jones, oherwydd pan fydd y gwasanaeth newydd yn dechrau ym mis Rhagfyr, bydd y trenau hynny i gyd yn aros yn eu hunfan yn Amwythig am 15 i 20 munud heb ddim rheswm amlwg. Pam y dylem gael ein trin fel dinasyddion eilradd?

**Brynle Williams:** I agree entirely with what my colleague has said.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad arall?

**Brynle Williams:** Iawn.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'r amserlen newydd yn rhyfeddol i mi. Yr ydych yn cael amserlen nad yw'n cydgysylltu Cymru gyfan; mae'n fân dameidiau. Rhaid ichi gael llyfrgell gyfan o amserlenni i wneud synnwyr o unrhyw beth. Pan edrychwch arni'n ofalus, fe welwch ei bod yn anhwylyd i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl sy'n teithio ar y trên yn ddyddiol. Yn ôl yr amserlen newydd, bydd yn rhaid i Aelodau'r Cynulliad yng ngogledd Cymru ddal y trên yng Nghaerdydd tua 5.30 a.m. er mwyn cyrraedd Caerdydd erbyn 9.30 a.m. A ydym yn y trydydd byd ynteu a yw hon yn genedl ddatblygedig? Yn Wrecsam, rhaid ichi fod ar y trên am 6.20 a.m. ac yna, os ydym yn lwcus, efallai y byddwn yma tua 9.30 a.m.. Mae rhai o'n pwyllgorau'n dechrau am 9 a.m.. Pa les yw hynny?

**Brynle Williams:** In north Wales, there is great potential for improving rail infrastructure. Currently, the overwhelming majority of traffic on the A55 is heavy goods vehicles, as was alluded to by Janet in relation to road use. That HGV traffic travels non-stop between continental Europe and the Republic of Ireland. A modest investment now, ladies and gentlemen, would put heavy goods on rail, thereby offsetting the major costs of work on the A55, which we will have to incur in years to come. Reducing the number of heavy goods vehicles would also go a long way towards improving road safety in north Wales by cutting down the number of drivers working illegally long hours.

**Brynle Williams:** Yng ngogledd Cymru, mae potensial mawr i wella seilwaith y rheilffyrdd. Ar hyn o bryd, cerbydau nwyddau trwm yw'r rhan fwyaf o ddigon o'r traffig ar yr A55, fel y cyfeiriodd Janet ynglŷn â defnyddio'r ffyrdd. Mae'r cerbydau hynny'n teithio'n ddi-baid rhwng cyfandir Ewrop a Gweriniaeth Iwerddon. Byddai buddsoddiad cymharol fach yn awr, foneddigesau a foneddigion, yn rhoi nwyddau trwm ar y rheilffyrdd, gan wrthbwyso costau mawr gwaith ar yr A55, y bydd yn rhaid inni eu hwynebu yn y blynyddoedd i ddod. Byddai lleihau nifer y cerbydau nwyddau trwm yn gwneud llawer hefyd i wella diogelwch ar y ffyrdd yng ngogledd Cymru drwy leihau nifer y gyrrwyr sy'n gweithio oriau anghyfreithlon o hir.

In conclusion, there is no use in the Welsh Assembly Government's supporting rail improvements without delivering results. If this integrated rail network promised is to be developed, then there has to be action. The Strategic Rail Authority should be pressed on increasing subsidies for an all-Wales franchise and the Welsh Assembly Government needs to work closely with Arriva Trains Wales to put in place a specific infrastructure and services that will benefit Wales as a whole.

I gloi, nid oes diben i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogi gwelliannau i'r rheilffyrdd heb sicrhau canlyniadau. Os yw'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd integredig a addawyd i gael ei ddatblygu, yna rhaid gweithredu. Dylid pwysu ar yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol i gynyddu'r cymorthdaliadau ar gyfer masnachfaint i Gymru gyfan ac mae angen i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru weithio'n agos gyda Threnau Arriva Cymru i sefydlu seilwaith a gwasanaethau penodol a fydd o fudd i Gymru gyfan.

**Leighton Andrews:** About an hour ago, the Conservative Party got a new engine driver. He has already sacked the guard—he has sacked the chief whip—and we guess that the days of the manager of the Welsh branch line are numbered. We are sure that Bill Wiggin will be going soon—

**Leighton Andrews:** Ryw awr yn ôl, cafodd y Blaid Geidwadol yrrwr trên newydd. Mae eisoes wedi diswyddo'r gard—mae wedi diswyddo'r prif chwip—ac yr ydym yn dyfalu bod dyddiau rheolwr rheilffordd gangen Cymru wedi eu rhifo. Yr ydym yn siŵr y bydd Bill Wiggin yn mynd cyn bo hir—

**Alun Cairns:** I resent the comments that Leighton Andrews made about David Maclean, David Cameron's chief whip. Given his health condition, he has indicated for a long time that he wanted to step down. To come up with an outrageous statement about someone suffering from multiple sclerosis is absolutely shameful.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf wedi fy nigio gan y sylwadau a wnaeth Leighton Andrews am David Maclean, prif chwip David Cameron. Oherwydd cyflwr ei iechyd, mae wedi nodi ers tro ei fod am ymddiswyddo. Mae gwneud y fath ddatganiad sarhaus am rywun sy'n dioddef gan sglerosis ymledol yn hollol gywilyddus.

**Leighton Andrews:** If that is the case, then I withdraw what I said. The intimation that I had was that he had been sacked.

**Leighton Andrews:** Os mai dyna'r sefyllfa, yr wyf yn tynnu'r hyn a ddywedais yn ôl. Y si a glywais i oedd ei fod wedi cael ei ddiswyddo.

Let us get back to the real world. I certainly agree that there are issues about train services in Wales. I have raised, on several occasions, the services that are on offer to my constituents in the Rhondda and the performance of the Valley Lines and Arriva Trains Wales, which operates those lines. Our constituents are entitled to receive a higher quality of service than they currently receive from Arriva. I know that the Minister is aware of my concerns.

I have also raised with him the quality of the rolling stock, the condition of the stations, the ludicrous situation in which the issue of leaves on the line has led to the failure of certain trains to stop at certain stations in my constituency. I have also raised the timing of trains. I am still waiting for a reply to my most recent letter that was sent some weeks ago on Arriva Trains.

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you take an intervention?

**Leighton Andrews:** I will in a second.

There are plenty of fora within the Assembly in which to raise these issues. We have an Economic Development and Transport Committee, which has discussed rail issues on a number of occasions over the last year.

**Lisa Francis:** Will you take an intervention?

**Leighton Andrews:** I have a queue, now.

We have discussed them in questions to the Minister, and we have debates on the floor of the Chamber. I do not see the case for another committee. I will allow an intervention from Owen John.

**Owen John Thomas:** You mentioned that you hoped that the Minister responsible for transport would do something about the situation on the Valleys trains—the trains from the Rhondda, Merthyr, Cwm Cynon and Caerphilly to Cardiff. The trains in the mornings are often jam-packed. Sometimes, people cannot get on the trains. You have been an Assembly Member for two and a half

Gadewch inni ddod yn ôl at y byd real. Yr wyf yn sicr yn cytuno bod problemau'n ymwneud â'r gwasanaethau trên yng Nghymru. Yr wyf, ar sawl achlysur, wedi cyfeirio at y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael i'm hetholwyr yn y Rhondda ac at berfformiad Cledrau'r Cymoedd a Threnau Arriva Cymru, sy'n gweithredu'r rheilffyrdd hynny. Mae gan ein hetholwyr hawl i gael gwasanaeth o safon uwch nag y maent yn ei gael gan Arriva ar hyn o bryd. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'm pryderon.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi codi mater ansawdd y cerbydau gydag ef, cyflwr y gorsafoedd, y sefyllfa afresymol lle y mae problem dail ar y rheilffordd wedi golygu bod rhai trenau wedi methu â stopio mewn rhai gorsafoedd yn fy etholaeth. Yr wyf hefyd wedi codi mater amseriad y trenau. Yr wyf yn dal i ddisgwyl am ateb i'm llythyr diweddaraf a anfonwyd rai wythnosau'n ôl ynghylch Trenau Arriva.

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Leighton Andrews:** Gwnaf mewn eiliad.

Mae digon o fforymau o fewn y Cynulliad lle y gellir codi'r materion hyn. Mae gennym Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, sydd wedi trafod materion rheilffyrdd droeon dros y flwyddyn ddiwethaf.

**Lisa Francis:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae gennyf giw, yn awr.

Yr ydym wedi eu trafod mewn cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog, ac yr ydym yn cael dadleuon ar lawr y Siambr. Ni welaf fod dadl o blaid cael pwyllgor arall. Yr wyf am ganiatáu ymyriad gan Owen John.

**Owen John Thomas:** Soniasoch eich bod yn gobeithio y byddai'r Gweinidog sy'n gyfrifol am drafnidiaeth yn gwneud rhywbeth am y sefyllfa ar drenau'r Cymoedd—y trenau o'r Rhondda, Merthyr, Cwm Cynon a Chaerffili i Gaerdydd. Mae'r trenau yn y boreau yn aml yn llawn dop. Weithiau, nid oes lle i bobl fynd ar y trenau. Yr ydych wedi bod yn Aelod Cynulliad ers dwy flynedd a hanner.

years. Other Members have been making these complaints for nearly seven years. Your Government has done nothing about it. It has not put pressure on Arriva or its predecessor to make these changes. Why not?

**Leighton Andrews:** That is simply not the case. The reality is that, in that period, powers have been given to the Assembly, which means that the Minister can intervene. The Minister has assured me that he will take up those issues. One reason that the trains are crowded is that there has been an increase in passenger traffic, which we welcome as we want more people to travel by train. However, there are issues about the number of carriages, and the number of passengers that can get onto them.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**Leighton Andrews:** No, I will not take any more for now. Perhaps later.

The point that I want to make is that all of these issues can be, and are, raised in committee. They can be raised here in Plenary questions and debates. Why do we want a new committee? Why has the opposition decided that it wants to come here and propose the establishment of a new committee on virtually any subject? These are not party-balanced in the way that Assembly subject committees are balanced. Increasingly, we are seeing an opposition that does not want, and is not prepared, to form a Government, but is instead prepared to spend the next 18 months simply trying to wound. It is not prepared to take responsibility. It is simply prepared to govern in a shadow way through this kind of committee. I do not think that that is responsible opposition; I think that that is pathetic.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this debate. To pick up that point first, we have had other committees, some of which have been put forward by the Labour Party, for instance, to look at the issue of smoking in public places.

Mae Aelodau eraill wedi bod yn gwneud y cwynion hyn ers bron saith mlynedd. Nid yw eich Llywodraeth wedi gwneud dim yn ei gylch. Nid yw wedi rhoi pwysau ar Arriva na'i ragflaenydd i wneud y newidiadau hyn. Pam?

**Leighton Andrews:** Nid yw hynny'n wir. Y realiti yw, yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, fod pwerau wedi cael eu rhoi i'r Cynulliad, sy'n golygu y gall y Gweinidog ymyrryd. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi fy sicrhau y bydd yn ymdrin â'r materion hynny. Un rheswm pam y mae'r trenau'n orlawn yw bod cynnydd wedi bod mewn traffig teithwyr, ac yr ydym yn croesawu hynny gan ein bod am i ragor o bobl deithio ar y trenau. Fodd bynnag, mae problemau o ran nifer y cerbydau, a nifer y teithwyr a all fynd ynddynt.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Leighton Andrews:** Na wnaif, ni dderbyniaf ragor ar hyn o bryd. Yn nes ymlaen efallai.

Y pwynt yr wyf am ei wneud yw bod modd codi'r materion hyn i gyd yn y pwyllgor, a bod hynny'n digwydd. Mae modd eu codi yma mewn Cyfarfod Llawn yn ystod y cwestiynau a'r dadleuon. Pam yr ydym am gael pwyllgor newydd? Pam mae'r wrthblaid wedi penderfynu ei bod am ddod yma a chynnig sefydlu pwyllgor newydd ar unrhyw bwnc fwy neu lai? Nid oes cydbwysedd pleidiol ar y rhain yn yr un modd ag y mae pwyllgorau pwnc y Cynulliad yn gytwys. Fwyfwy, yr ydym yn gweld gwrthblaid nad yw am ffurfio Llywodraeth, ac nad yw'n barod i wneud hynny, ond yn hytrach na gwneud hynny mae'n barod i dreulio'r 18 mis nesaf yn ceisio clwyfo. Nid yw'n barod i ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb. Y cwbl y mae'n barod i'w wneud yw llywodraethu mewn modd cysgodol drwy'r math hwn o bwyllgor. Ni chredaf fod hynny'n weithredu cyfrifol gan wrthblaid; credaf fod hynny'n druenus.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Ac ymateb i'r pwynt hwnnw yn gyntaf, yr ydym wedi cael pwyllgorau eraill, a rhai ohonynt wedi cael eu cynnig gan y Blaid Lafur, er enghraifft, i edrych ar fater ysmegu mewn mannau cyhoeddus.

**Leighton Andrews:** Will you take an intervention?

**Nick Bourne:** In a moment. Just let me come to my point.

You say that it would not be party-balanced, but there would be three Welsh Labour Members on it, one each from the opposition parties and one other. I do not think that, because there would be seven people on it—given the clear interest of both Peter Law and John Marek—that that is unreasonable. I give way.

**Leighton Andrews:** As I understand it, the issue of smoking was one where there were conscience issues for Members, not necessarily party issues. That is different for the broad range of committees that the opposition is now bringing forward.

**Nick Bourne:** I accept that point as far as it goes, but the way in which these committees work will possibly be more consensual than the Member anticipates. If I may come to some of the points about the budget discussions, which have prompted this, in a way, there has certainly been some robust negotiation on that, but there has also been give and take on the part of the Government. We have some commitments from the Minister and the Government in relation to improving some of the infrastructure and looking at some of these issues. The new rolling stock will certainly help on the Aberystwyth to Shrewsbury line, the Cambrian coast line, and the Heart of Wales line, on which we hope there will be a fifth service. In addition, feasibility studies will look at Maindee, north of Newport, at the pinch point in west Wales at Gowerton, and at an improvement on the north-to-south services, which is crucial, and will consider whether a business case can be made for that. Surely these are things that we all have an interest in doing together as an Assembly. I do not see these as issues where there is necessarily a political divide, and I would hope that there is not on some of these issues. There are clearly issues of priority, and people may take different views on some, but I do not see it as being a straightforward

**Leighton Andrews:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Nick Bourne:** Mewn munud. Gadewch imi ddod at fy mhwynt.

Yr ydych yn dweud na fyddai'n bleidiol gytbwys, ond byddai tri Aelod o Lafur Cymru arno, un yr un o'r gwrthbleidiau ac un arall. Ni chredaf, oherwydd y byddai saith arno—o ystyried diddordeb amlwg Peter Law a John Marek—fod hynny'n afresymol. Yr wyf yn ildio.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yn ôl fel y deallaf, yr oedd mater ysmegu yn un lle'r oedd ystyriaethau cydwybod i'r Aelodau, nid ystyriaethau pleidiol o reidrwydd. Mae hynny'n wahanol i'r amrywiaeth eang o bwyllgorau y mae'r wrthblaid yn dod â hwy gerbron yn awr.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn derbyn y pwynt hwnnw cyn belled ag y mae'n mynd, ond mae'n bosibl y bydd y modd y mae'r pwyllgorau hyn yn gweithio yn fwy cydsyniol nag y mae'r Aelod yn rhagweld. Os caf ddod at rai o'r pwyntiau ynghylch y trafodaethau ar y gyllideb, sydd wedi arwain at hyn, mewn ffordd, yn sicr cafwyd negodi cryf ar hynny, ond mae'r Llywodraeth hefyd wedi cyfaddawdu. Yr ydym wedi cael rhai ymrwymadau gan y Gweinidog a'r Llywodraeth o ran gwella peth o'r seilwaith ac edrych ar rai o'r materion hyn. Bydd y cerbydau newydd yn sicr yn help ar reilffordd Aberystwyth i Amwythig, rheilffordd arfordir y Cambria, a rheilffordd Calon Cymru, lle yr ydym yn gobeithio y bydd pumed gwasanaeth. Yn ogystal, bydd astudiaethau dichonoldeb yn edrych ar Maendy, i'r gogledd o Gasnewydd, ar y dagfa yng ngorllewin Cymru yn Nhre-gŵyr, ac ar wella'r gwasanaethau rhwng y gogledd a'r de, sy'n dyngedfennol, a bydd yn ystyried a oes modd gwneud achos busnes ar gyfer hynny. Mae'r rhain yn bethau y mae'n sicr o fudd i ni i gyd eu gwneud gyda'n gilydd fel Cynulliad. Ni welaf y rhain fel materion lle y mae rhaniad gwleidyddol o reidrwydd, a byddwn yn gobeithio nad oes rhaniad ar rai o'r materion hyn. Mae'n amlwg bod cwestiynau'n ymwneud â blaenoriaeth, ac

political, dogmatic approach, which we may have on different issues where there may be conceptual or real policy differences. I do not think that that is the nature of what is being suggested here. I hope that Members on the other side may be able to support this.

4.30 p.m.

I think that this is working on what we have done in relation to the draft budget, which will now become the final budget tomorrow. Much work still needs to be done. The Ebbw Vale line, which Peter Law has worked so hard on, needs to be looked at. Alun has mentioned the Vale of Glamorgan line, which is another line in need of vital work in order to make improvements to the airport. This is about approaching this on the basis of trying to achieve something as an Assembly. The motion talks about costed improvements, an action plan and making recommendations. It seems to me to be a very sensible way forward, given the limitations that we sometimes have in committees, and indeed in Plenary, with regard to making sure that we have action points to take forward. This deserves the support of the entire Assembly.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats believe that the establishment of this committee would allow for a proper lengthy review and the preparation of considered cross-party recommendations on how to take the agenda of improving our railways forward in Wales. With the recent abolition of the Rail Passengers Committee for Wales and the Minister's new powers, it is timely that we look at how those powers can help the Welsh Assembly Government to move forward. I trust that any discussions held in the committee would be in the spirit of looking genuinely at providing a route map for how to take railway policy forward in Wales.

It is fair to say—and I will say it again before the Minister reminds me of what I said in my speech on the Heart of Wales line, which he is bound to do—that we have seen a genuine attempt to improve the situation in Wales.

efallai y bydd gan bobl farn wahanol am rai, ond ni welaf hyn fel rhywbeth i ymdrin ag ef yn syml mewn ffordd wleidyddol a dogmatig, sydd yn digwydd efallai ar faterion gwahanol lle y mae gwahaniaethau cysyniadol neu wahaniaethau polisi gwirioneddol. Nid wyf yn credu mai hynny yw natur yr hyn sy'n cael ei awgrymu yma. Gobeithiaf y bydd yr Aelodau ar yr ochr arall yn gallu cefnogi hyn.

Credaf mai gweithio ar yr hyn yr ydym wedi ei wneud mewn perthynas â'r gyllideb ddrafft yw hyn—cyllideb a fydd yn dod yn gyllideb derfynol yfory. Mae llawer o waith i'w wneud eto. Mae angen ystyried rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy, yr un y mae Peter Law wedi gweithio mor galed arni. Soniodd Alun am reilffordd Bro Morgannwg, un arall y mae angen gwaith hanfodol arni er mwyn gwneud gwelliannau i'r maes awyr. Mae a wnelo hyn ag ymdrin â hyn ar sail ceisio cyflawni rhywbeth fel Cynulliad. Mae'r cynnig yn sôn am welliannau wedi eu costio, cynllun gweithredu a gwneud argymhellion. Ymddengys i mi ei bod yn ffordd gall iawn o symud ymlaen, o ystyried y cyfyngiadau a wynebwn weithiau mewn pwyllgorau, ac yn wir yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, o ran sicrhau bod gennym gamau gweithredu. Mae hyn yn haeddu cefnogaeth y Cynulliad cyfan.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o'r farn y byddai sefydlu'r pwyllgor hwn yn hwyluso adolygiad trylwyr a phriodol ac yn fodd i lunio argymhellion trawsbleidiol ynghylch sut i fwrw ymlaen â'r agenda o wella ein rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Yn sgîl dileu Pwyllgor Teithwyr Rheilffordd Cymru yn ddiweddar, a phwerau newydd y Gweinidog, mae'n gyfle da inni edrych ar sut y gall y pwerau hynny helpu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i symud ymlaen. Hyderaf y byddid, mewn modd hollol ddiffuant, yn ceisio darparu map llwybr ar gyfer sut i fwrw ymlaen â'r polisi rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru mewn unrhyw drafodaethau a gynhelir yn y pwyllgor.

Mae'n deg dweud—a dywedaf yr un peth eto cyn i'r Gweinidog fy atgoffa o'r hyn a ddywedais yn fy araith ar reilffordd Calon Cymru, oherwydd mae'n sicr o wneud hynny—ein bod wedi gweld ymdrech

Glyn said that he has been talking about improving the Dyfi loop since 1989. Before it lost power, the Conservative Government had a number of years in which it could have done something about that.

**Glyn Davies:** I hope that Kirsty Williams will recognise the huge amount of capital investment that was made in the Cambrian line. If that had not happened during the 1990s, the Cambrian line would be closed today.

**Kirsty Williams:** I am also aware of the complete fiasco that railway privatisation has created. We are still trying to deal with the consequences of that. It is the way in which privatisation was taken forward and the structures that were put in place that has hampered the ability of the Welsh Assembly Government and the Assembly to make improvements. I will mention again the absolute scandal of the train leasing companies, which hold railway improvements to ransom because of the costs involved in acquiring new rolling stock. We have an opportunity to work collectively as an Assembly to put forward ideas to the Welsh Assembly Government on how we believe that the new powers and resources for the railways can be taken forward.

I suggest a number of headings under which the committee could consider the subject in order to make improvements. Rail must be seen as an integral part of this country's transport system, with stations acting as hubs for other types of transport. We must ensure that they allow for the safe and efficient transfer of passengers, with good ticketing schemes and arrangements. There should be better connections to bus services, and good car and cycle parking facilities at each station. Ann Jones, who is no longer in her seat, mentioned safety, which is crucial in encouraging more people to travel on trains. We must ensure that the trains, as well as stations, are safe and secure places to be.

We need to promote community rail in Wales, particularly in rural areas, which would provide a huge boost to businesses,

ddiffuant i wella'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru. Dywedodd Glyn ei fod wedi bod yn siarad am wella dolen Dyfi ers 1989. Cyn iddi golli grym, yr oedd y Llywodraeth Geidwadol wedi cael blynyddoedd lawer pryd y gallai fod wedi gwneud rhywbeth ynghylch y peth.

**Glyn Davies:** Gobeithio y bydd Kirsty Williams yn cydnabod y buddsoddiad cyfalaf aruthrol a wnaed yn rheilffordd y Cambrian. Pe bai hynny heb ddigwydd yn ystod y 1990au, byddai rheilffordd y Cambrian wedi cael ei chau heddiw.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf hefyd yn ymwybodol o'r llanstr llwyr y mae preifateiddio'r rheilffyrdd wedi'i greu. Yr ydym yn dal i geisio delio â chanlyniadau hynny. Yr hyn sydd wedi rhwystro Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r Cynulliad rhag gwneud gwelliannau yw'r modd y cafodd preifateiddio ei gyflwyno a'r strwythurau a roddwyd ar waith. Soniaf eto am sgandal llwyr y cwmnïau prydlesu trenau, sy'n dal gwelliannau i'r rheilffyrdd yn wystl oherwydd cost prynu cerbydau newydd. Mae gennym gyfle i weithio gyda'n gilydd fel Cynulliad i gynnig syniadau i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ynghylch sut i symud ymlaen â'r adnoddau a'r pwerau newydd ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd.

Yr wyf yn awgrymu nifer o benawdau y dylai'r pwyllgor ystyried y pwnc hwn o danynt er mwyn gwneud gwelliannau. Rhaid gweld y rheilffyrdd fel rhan annatod o system drafnidiaeth y wlad, gyda gorsafoedd yn gweithredu fel canolfannau i fathau eraill o drafnidiaeth. Rhaid inni sicrhau eu bod yn trosglwyddo teithwyr yn ddiogel ac yn effeithlon, a bod ganddynt drefniadau a chynlluniau da o ran tocynnau. Dylai fod cysylltiadau gwell â'r gwasanaethau bysiau, a chyfleusterau da i barcio ceir a beiciau ym mhob gorsaf. Soniodd Ann Jones, nad yw bellach yn ei sedd, am ddiogelwch, sy'n hanfodol i annog rhagor o bobl i deithio ar y trenau. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod trenau, a'r gorsafoedd hefyd, yn lleoedd cwbl ddiogel ar eu cyfer.

Mae angen hyrwyddo rheilffyrdd cymunedol yng Nghymru, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a fyddai'n rhoi hwb anferth i

opportunities for community development, and greater mobility for local people, as well as better tourism links. I will not rehearse the arguments that I made with regard to the Heart of Wales line in my recent short debate.

The services to Swansea and further west are not good enough. Along with mid Wales and the north-west of Wales, there is a danger that these areas will become forgotten parts of the network, when the Welsh Assembly Government is keen to develop other parts of the network. Swansea and west Wales are on the up in terms of growing population, tourism and economic development. The good consistent service that runs between Cardiff and London should be the template for the service that runs between west Wales, Swansea, Cardiff and London. Looking at the pinch point at Gowerton, and what could be done to overcome that, could show us a useful way forward in developing the services west of Swansea.

As we have said, it is clear that there is a welcome growth in the demand for services between the Valleys and Cardiff. It should be welcomed, but the success has come at a cost. We have seen people using overcrowded trains and travelling in less than ideal circumstances.

We have to look at what we can do in terms of improving our rolling stock, not just on this line but on other lines where perhaps similar problems are currently encountered. If we want people to use our trains and to make this difference, we have to have trains that can accommodate people safely, properly and in comfort.

This committee offers us an opportunity to work collectively. I am sure that if the Minister were in a magnanimous mood he would accept that by giving his sanction to this committee, and looking forward to receiving its report, we could move forward in a spirit of co-operation, not just on this side of the Chamber, but across the entire Chamber.

fusnesau, yn creu cyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygu cymunedol, yn ei gwneud yn haws i bobl leol symud o fan i fan a hefyd yn gwella cysylltiadau twristiaeth. Nid ailadroddaf y dadleuon a gyflwynais yng nghyswllt rheilffordd Calon Cymru yn fy nadl fer ar y mater yn ddiweddar.

Nid yw'r gwasanaeth i Abertawe ac ymhellach draw i'r gorllewin yn ddigon da. Ynghyd â'r canolbarth a gogledd-orllewin Cymru, mae perygl y bydd yr ardaloedd hyn yn mynd yn angof yn y rhwydwaith, ar adeg pan fo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn awyddus i ddatblygu rhannau eraill o'r rhwydwaith. Mae Abertawe a gorllewin Cymru'n ffynnu o ran twf eu poblogaeth, twristiaeth a datblygu economaidd. Dylai'r gwasanaeth da a chyson sy'n rhedeg rhwng Caerdydd a Llundain fod yn fodel ar gyfer y gwasanaeth sy'n rhedeg rhwng gorllewin Cymru, Abertawe, Caerdydd a Llundain. Byddai rhoi sylw i'r dagfa yn Nhre-gŵyr, a'r hyn y gellid ei wneud i'w gwella, yn dangos ffordd ddefnyddiol ymlaen inni gyda datblygu'r gwasanaethau i'r gorllewin o Abertawe.

Fel y dywedasom, mae'n glir bod cynnydd sydd i'w groesawu yn y galw am wasanaethau rhwng y Cymoedd a Chaerdydd. Dylid ei groesawu, ond ni ddaeth y llwyddiant hwnnw heb ei bris. Yr ydym wedi gweld pobl yn defnyddio trenau gorlawn ac yn teithio o dan amgylchiadau sydd ymhell o fod yn ddelfrydol.

Rhaid inni edrych ar yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud o ran gwella ein cerbydau, nid ar y rheilffordd hon yn unig ond hefyd ar reilffyrdd eraill sy'n cael problemau tebyg ar hyn o bryd efallai. Os ydym am i bobl ddefnyddio ein trenau a gwneud y gwahaniaeth hwn, rhaid inni gael trenau sy'n gallu derbyn pobl yn ddiogel, yn briodol ac yn gysurus.

Mae'r pwyllgor hwn yn gyfle inni weithio gyda'n gilydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr pe bai'r Gweinidog yn teimlo'n fawrfrydig y byddai'n derbyn, drwy roi sêl ei fendith i'r pwyllgor hwn, ac thrwy edrych ymlaen at dderbyn ei adroddiad, y byddem yn gallu symud ymlaen mewn ysbryd o gydweithrediad, nid yn unig ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambr, ond ar draws y Siambr gyfan.



**The Presiding Officer:** Before I call on the Minister I will allow Glyn Davies and the leader of the opposition two minutes each.

**Glyn Davies:** I will just comment about the Cambrian line in the context of issues relating to mid Wales. I am becoming increasingly concerned about the way in which mid Wales seems to be ignored. Its problems are not reported in anything like the way in which they might be. Yesterday, we had an announcement of 300 likely job losses in Shrewsbury and Telford hospitals, which provide services to mid Wales. This is a massive blow to services in mid Wales, but has hardly received any attention. There is a real danger that unless we focus on the issues of all of Wales, which includes the central Wales area, devolution will not be the success that it might be.

There is no doubt that issues relating to the Cambrian line have been of the deepest concern for many years. Despite Kirsty Williams's comments, throughout the 1980s and 1990s there was a constant need for partnerships of many bodies, including local government, agencies of the Welsh Office, and private companies, to make regular investments to ensure that the line continued. It is true that we have never seen the sort of capital investment in the line that we would like to see to develop the hourly, clockface service that is so important to central Wales.

I hope that the Minister will consider how important that would be. If we are going to find partners to make this capital investment, there must be a commitment by the Government to fund the services that would use it. I hope that the Minister will say, when the capital investment goes into the Cambrian line, and perhaps brings forward a Dyfi loop or whatever other alternative system might be needed, that the Government will fund the extra services. That guarantee has to be in place for the capital investment to go in.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Nid wyf yn gwbl siŵr pam y cred Leighton Andrews fod hyn oll yn rhywfath o fgythiad i'r Llywodraeth.

**Y Llywydd:** Cyn imi alw ar y Gweinidog, yr wyf am roi dau funud yr un i Glyn Davies ac arweinydd yr wrthblaid.

**Glyn Davies:** Yr wyf am wneud sylw ar reilffordd y Cambrian yng nghyd-destun materion sy'n berthnasol i'r canolbarth. Yr wyf yn mynd yn fwyfwy pryderus ynghylch y modd y mae'r canolbarth yn cael ei anwybyddu i bob golwg. Nid adroddir am ei broblemau yn y modd y gallai hynny ddigwydd o gwbl. Ddoe, clywsom gyhoeddi y byddai 300 o swyddi yn debygol o gael eu colli yn ysbytai'r Amwythig a Telford, sy'n darparu gwasanaethau i'r canolbarth. Mae hyn yn ergyd drom iawn i wasanaethau yn y canolbarth, ond prin bod dim sôn wedi bod am y peth. Mae perygl gwirioneddol, oni bai ein bod yn canolbwyntio ar y materion sy'n effeithio ar bob rhan o Gymru, sy'n cynnwys ardal canolbarth Cymru, na fydd datganoli mor llwyddiannus ag y gallai fod.

Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r problemau ynghylch rheilffordd y Cambrian wedi achosi pryder mawr iawn ers blynyddoedd lawer. Er gwaethaf sylwadau Kirsty Williams, drwy gydol y 1980au a'r 1990au, yr oedd angen parhaus i bartneriaethau amryw o gyrff, gan gynnwys llywodraeth leol, asiantaethau'r Swyddfa Gymreig, a chwmnïau preifat, fuddsoddi'n rheolaidd i sicrhau parhad y rheilffordd. Mae'n wir nad ydym erioed wedi gweld y math o fuddsoddiad cyfalaf yn y rheilffordd y byddem yn dymuno ei weld i greu'r gwasanaeth bob awr, ar yr awr sydd mor bwysig i'r canolbarth.

Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn ystyried pa mor bwysig y byddai hynny. Os ydym am ddod o hyd i bartneriaid i wneud y buddsoddiad cyfalaf hwn, rhaid cael ymrwymiad gan y Llywodraeth i ariannu'r gwasanaethau a fyddai'n ei ddefnyddio. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud, pan wneir y buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn rheilffordd y Cambrian, gan gynnwys creu dolen Dyfi efallai neu pa system bynnag arall y byddai ei hangen, y bydd y Llywodraeth yn ariannu'r gwasanaethau ychwanegol. Rhaid cael y sicrwydd hwnnw er mwyn i'r buddsoddiad cyfalaf ddigwydd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am not sure why Leighton Andrews thinks that this is some kind of threat to the Government. It is an

Ymdrech ydyw ar ran y gwrthbleidiau i gynorthwyo'r Llywodraeth i roi pwysau cynyddol ar yr awdurdodau—Network Rail ac Arriva Trains—i sicrhau gwasanaethau da. Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl dda am ei bod wedi cwmpasu'r gwasanaethau ar gyfer y de, y gogledd a'r canolbarth. Yr un mater a darodd dant i mi oedd y pwynt a wnaed gan Brynle Williams, sef eich bod yn gallu gadael gorsaf Bangor a bod yn Llundain ymhenn tair awr a hanner. Serch hynny, ni wyddoch pryd y cyrhaeddwch Gaerdydd gan na wyddoch yn sicr a fydd cysylltiad yn eich disgwyl yn Crewe neu a fydd hwnnw yn cael ei rwystro rhywle rhwng yno a Chaerdydd. Mae'r siwrnai i Gaerdydd yn un ddifrifol i rywun sy'n ei gwneud yn rheolaidd. Nid oes raid ond gwrandao ar Aelodau Cynulliad sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaeth i wybod yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Mae John Marek a minnau yn mynd yn ôl ymhellach na hynny hyd yn oed gan ein bod wedi bod yn teithio ar drenau'r gogledd ers blynnyddoedd. Yr wyf fi wedi bod yn teithio ar y trêen ers 1987, a John Marek am flynyddoedd cyn hynny.

Yr hyn y gofynnwn amdano yw tegwch i bob rhan o Gymru. Yng nghyd-destun y pwyllgor hwn, gobeithiaf y bydd modd inni ddwyn pwysau ar y Llywodraeth i sicrhau bod o leiaf un trêen cyflym y dydd o'r de i'r gogledd ac o'r gogledd i'r de fel y gallwn gyrraedd y Cynulliad mewn amser teilwng a bod pobl sy'n dod i Gaerdydd yn medru cyrraedd cyfarfodydd pwyllgor a dychwelyd ar yr un diwrnod.

Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweld y pwyllgor hwn fel ffordd o roi pwysau ar yr awdurdodau i sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

4.40 p.m.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am fod mor gryno.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I am not sure that I will accede to Kirsty Williams's suggestion that I be magnanimous today. However, it is good to see the Conservative Party taking an interest—Jeff Cuthbert made apposite comments about its belated interest in the railway system in Wales—after, as Kirsty Williams pointed out, its dismantling

attempt on the part of the opposition parties to assist the Government in bringing pressure to bear on the authorities—Network Rail and Arriva Trains—to ensure good services. This has been a good debate because it has encompassed the services for north, south and mid Wales. The issue that struck a particular chord with me was the point that Brynle Williams made, that you can leave Bangor station and be in London in three and half hours' time. However, you do not know when you will arrive in Cardiff because you cannot be certain that there will be a connection waiting for you in Crewe or whether that will be delayed somewhere between there and Cardiff. The journey to Cardiff is a serious one for someone who makes it regularly. You only have to listen to Assembly Members who use the service to know what actually happens. John Marek and I go back even further because we have been travelling on north Wales trains for years. I have been travelling on the train since 1987, and John Marek for years before that.

We are asking for fairness for all parts of Wales. In the context of this committee, I hope that we will be able to put pressure on the Government to ensure that there is at least one fast train per day from north to south Wales and from south to north Wales so that we can reach the Assembly in good time and so that people travelling to Cardiff can arrive in time for their committee meetings and return on the same day.

I hope that the Minister will see this committee as a way to bring pressure to bear on the authorities to ensure that that happens.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for being so succinct.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Nid wyf yn siŵr a wnaef gydsynio ag awgrym Kirsty Williams y dylwn fod yn fawrfrydig heddiw. Er hynny, mae'n dda gweld y Blaid Geidwadol yn dangos diddordeb—mae Jeff Cuthbert yn llygad ei le wrth sôn am ei diddordeb hwyrfrydig yn system y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru—ar ôl iddi

of the railway system through gross privatisation. We as a Government, here and in the UK, have to deal with the vandalism that was imposed on the national rail network and services.

**Mark Isherwood:** Will you give way?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has just started.

**Andrew Davies:** I commend that the Assembly rejects this motion on the basis that such a committee would not add to the existing democratic structures for developing policies and monitoring the effective delivery of the railways in Wales. The opposition's claim that there will be no extra cost attached to its proposal takes no account of costs that would be incurred by the four local authority transport consortia in Wales, the train operating companies, Network Rail, and others, whose input would surely be required for the committee to undertake any meaningful work.

There is already a range of democratic mechanisms for discussing Welsh railway issues. There is the Assembly's Economic Development and Transport Committee. With the honourable exception of Janet Davies, who, on that committee and on the previous Environment, Planning and Transport Committee, as far as I can see, is the only member of the opposition who has shown any consistent interest in railway issues—aside from the Members who raise issues purely of constituency interest. She is the only one to show a wholesale interest in railway services.

Other mechanisms include the Wales Transport Forum. As I mentioned, we have the four regional consortia, including the South-East Wales Transport Alliance, and TAITH in north Wales. We have the national Rail Passengers Council—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister is contributing to the debate on behalf of the

ddatgymalu'r system drwy ei phreifateiddio'n llwyr, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams. Rhaid i ni fel Llywodraeth, yma ac yn y DU, ddelio â'r fandaleiddio a fu ar y rhwydwaith a'r gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd cenedlaethol.

**Mark Isherwood:** A wnewch ildio?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Newydd ddechrau y mae'r Gweinidog.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn argymhell bod y Cynulliad yn gwrthod y cynnig hwn ar y sail na fyddai pwyllgor o'r fath yn gwella'r trefniadau democrataidd presennol ar gyfer datblygu polisiau a monitro darpariaeth effeithiol y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Nid yw honiad yr wrthblaid na fyddai dim cost ychwanegol ynghlwm wrth y cynnig hwn yn ystyried o gwbl y costau i bedwar consortiwm trafniadaeth yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, y cwmnïau trênn, Network Rail, ac eraill, y byddai angen eu mewnbwn yn sicr er mwyn i'r pwyllgor wneud unrhyw waith ystyrlon.

Mae gennym eisoes ystod o drefniadau democrataidd ar gyfer trafod materion rheilffyrdd Cymru. Ceir Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth y Cynulliad. Gydag un eithriad clodwiw, Janet Davies, yr unig aelod o'r wrthblaid sydd, ar y pwyllgor hwnnw ac Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Thrafnidiaeth o'r blaen, wedi dangos unrhyw ddiddordeb cyson, hyd y gwelaf, mewn materion sy'n ymwneud â'r rheilffyrdd—ar wahân i'r Aelodau sy'n codi materion o ddiddordeb i'w hetholaeth yn unig. Hi yw'r unig un sydd wedi dangos unrhyw ddiddordeb gwirioneddol mewn gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd.

Mae mecanweithiau eraill yn cynnwys Fforwm Trafnidiaeth Cymru. Fel y soniais, mae gennym bedwar consortiwm rhanbarthol, gan gynnwys Cynghrair Trafnidiaeth De-ddwyrain Cymru, a TAITH yn y gogledd. Mae gennym y Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd cenedlaethol—

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn myiriad?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn cyfrannu at y drafodaeth ar ran y

Government.

**Andrew Davies:** There is the planned public transport users' committee, subject to the Transport (Wales) Bill reaching the statute book. The Transport (Wales) Bill and the Welsh clauses in the Railways Act 2005 make the biggest transfer of powers to the Assembly since it was established in 1999. We have had a problem in delivering an integrated approach to transport because we did not have the tools to do the job—we did not have the legislative powers to deliver.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention on this point?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. If the Minister is not giving way, it does not help to shout at him.

**Andrew Davies:** The Railways Act 2005, which will be transferred to the Assembly, the Assembly Government, and myself as the Minister, from April next year, together with the Transport (Wales) Bill, will give us the means to deliver an integrated transport system in Wales, and improve services further still, particularly rail services.

Furthermore, work has already started on a rail planning assessment for Wales between officials, management consultants, and stakeholders, including the local authority transport consortia, the train operating companies, and Network Rail. This will deliver an assessment of demand and capacity, and a prioritised statement of achievable rail infrastructure and service improvements to inform the new transport strategy for Wales, which is already being developed.

This proposed committee of Assembly Members would not add value. It would merely duplicate existing efforts and the major contribution by many stakeholders and partners in this area. I know that Kirsty does not like me quoting this, but I will quote her again. In a press release of 17 November she said that:

Llywodraeth.

**Andrew Davies:** Bydd gennym y pwyllgor defnyddwyr trafndiaeth gyhoeddus arfaethedig, ar yr amod y bydd y Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) yn cyrraedd y llyfr statud. Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru) a'r cymalau'n ymwneud â Chymru yn Neddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 yw'r trosglwyddo mwyaf ar bwerau i'r Cynulliad ers ei sefydlu yn 1999. Mae cyflwyno dull integredig o ddarparu gwasanaethau trafndiaeth wedi peri anhawster inni oherwydd nad oedd yr arfau iawn gennym i wneud y gwaith—nid oedd y pwerau deddfu i wneud hynny gennym.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad yn awr?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Os nad yw'r Gweinidog am ildio, nid oes fawr o ddiben gweiddi arno.

**Andrew Davies:** Bydd Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, a drosglwyddir i'r Cynulliad, i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad ac i mi fel y Gweinidog, o fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen, ynghyd â'r Mesur Trafnidiaeth (Cymru), yn peri bod modd inni ddarparu system drafnidiaeth integredig yng Nghymru, a gwella mwy byth ar wasanaethau, yn enwedig gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd.

Yn ogystal, mae gwaith eisoes wedi dechrau ar asesiad cynllunio rheilffyrdd i Gymru rhwng swyddogion, ymgynghorwyr rheoli a rhanddeiliaid, gan gynnwys consortia trafndiaeth yr awdurdodau lleol, y cwmnïau trên, a Network Rail. Bydd hyn yn rhoi asesiad o'r galw a'r capasiti, ynghyd â datganiad o'r blaenoriaethau o ran gwelliannau posibl i'r gwasanaethau a'r seilwaith rheilffyrdd er mwyn llywio'r strategaeth drafnidiaeth newydd i Gymru, sydd eisoes yn cael ei datblygu.

Ni fyddai'r pwyllgor newydd hwn o Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ychwanegu gwerth. Y cwbl y byddai'n ei wneud fyddai dyblygu'r ymdrechion presennol a chyfraniad sylweddol nifer o randdeiliaid a phartneriaid yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn gwybod nad yw Kirsty'n hoffi fy nghlywed yn dyfynnu hyn, ond yr wyf am ei dyfynnu eto. Mewn datganiad i'r wasg ar 17 Tachwedd,

dywedodd:

‘This is a fantastic time for railways in Wales, a time of growth that even the most enthusiastic doubted they would ever see’.

Mae hwn yn gyfnod gwych i'r rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, yn gyfnod o dwf yr oedd hyd yn oed y rhai mwyaf brwdfrydig yn amau na fyddent byth yn ei weld.

We have the largest number of people using rail services in Wales since 1959, before the Beeching cuts of the early 1960s. We are now seeing levels of use that we have not seen for a generation and you must bear in mind that pre-Beeching, the network was twice the size of what it is today. There is increased use, largely because of Labour Government investment at Westminster level, together with the greatly increased investment of the Assembly Government.

Mae'r nifer fwyaf o bobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru heddiw ers 1959, cyn toriadau Beeching ar ddechrau'r 1960au. Yr ydym heddiw'n gweld mwy o ddefnyddio arnynt nag a welwyd ers cenhedlaeth gyfan a rhaid ichi gofio bod y rhwydwaith, cyn dyddiau Beeching, yn gymaint ddwywaith ag ydyw heddiw. Ceir mwy o ddefnydd, yn bennaf oherwydd buddsoddiad y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, ynghyd â'r cynnydd mawr yn y buddsoddiad gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

**Leighton Andrews:** You should put that out in a press release. Would you read it again?

**Leighton Andrews:** Dylech gyhoeddi hynny mewn datganiad i'r wasg. A wnewch ei ddarllen eto?

**Andrew Davies:** We now have more people using the rail services in this country than at any time since the pre-Beeching days of 1959, when the network was twice the size of what it is today. We are now seeing levels of investment that we have not seen before, and not only because of the Assembly or Network Rail. It is easy to dismiss a £400 million investment by Network Rail in the Great Western route—

**Andrew Davies:** Mae mwy o bobl yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yn y wlad hon nag ar unrhyw adeg ers dyddiau Beeching yn 1959, pan oedd y rhwydwaith yn gymaint ddwywaith ag ydyw heddiw. Yr ydym bellach yn gweld lefelau buddsoddi digyffelyb, ac nid oherwydd y Cynulliad na Network Rail yn unig y mae hynny. Hawdd yw wfftio buddsoddiad o £400 miliwn gan Network Rail yn llwybr y Great Western—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Do you agree with Professor Stuart Cole, who states that the present settlement makes a truly sustainable public transport system in Wales impossible?

**Eleanor Burnham:** A ydych yn cytuno â'r Athro Stuart Cole, sydd yn datgan bod y trefniant presennol yn peri ei bod yn amhosibl cael system drafnidiaeth gyhoeddus wirioneddol gynaliadwy yng Nghymru?

**Andrew Davies:** No.

**Andrew Davies:** Nac ydwyf.

**Eleanor Burnham:** He is an expert. [*Laughter.*]

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae'n arbenigwr. [*Chwerthin.*]

**Andrew Davies:** I know Professor Stuart Cole. He has strongly held views, but I disagree with him on this point.

**Andrew Davies:** Yr wyf yn adnabod yr Athro Stuart Cole. Mae ganddo syniadau pendant, ond yr wyf yn anghytuno ag ef ar y pwynt hwn.

A sum of £400 million has been invested in improving the signalling on the Great Western route in south Wales, in advance of what is being done on the English side. I met

Mae swm o £400 miliwn wedi'i fuddsoddi i wella'r signalau ar lwybr y Great Western yn y de, o flaen yr hyn sydd i'w wneud ar ochr Lloegr. Cyfarfûm â Robbie Burns,

with Robbie Burns, Network Rail's route director for the Great Western route, yesterday, and he told me not only about the £400 million investment in the signalling, but about the other major investments in infrastructure, stations, signalling, points and so on in Wales. I asked him whether such extensive investment in a wide range of infrastructure was being made in any other part of the UK, and he said 'no'.

**Janice Gregory:** You mentioned investment in stations; I am sure that you know what I am going to say. You obviously understand that communities feel quite cut off and isolated if they do not have access to a station. I thank you, on behalf of the people who live in Llanharan in my constituency, for signing off the station this morning. I am extremely grateful.

**Andrew Davies:** That is the difference between Government and opposition; they just talk about it, we do it. The Vale of Glamorgan line has been rubbished; I do not remember Alun Cairns showing any interest in the railway system in Wales before.

**Alun Cairns:** Will the Minister give way?

**Andrew Davies:** Let me finish what I was going to say first. The local authorities and Cardiff International Airport are delighted with the level of service, as are Network Rail and Arriva Trains Wales. The use of that service far exceeds the original business plan.

**Janet Davies:** While I am pleased to hear that you signed-off the Llanharan railway station, would it not have been a good idea for you to make an announcement to Members that you had done so? I am very pleased that £400 million is being invested in the Great Western main line, but that does not compare with the billions of pounds—hundreds of billions—that have been invested in the west coast main line.

**Andrew Davies:** When I took over the transport portfolio, one of my first meetings was with Richard Bowker, the former chief

cyfarwyddwr llwybr Network Rail ar gyfer llwybr y Great Western, ddoe, a soniodd wrthyf nid yn unig am y buddsoddiad o £400 miliwn yn y signalau, ond hefyd am y buddsoddiadau mawr eraill mewn seilwaith, gorsafoedd, signalau, pwyntiau atal ac yn y blaen yng Nghymru. Gofynnais iddo a oes buddsoddi helaeth o'r fath mewn amryw o fathau o seilwaith mewn unrhyw ran arall o'r DU, a'i ateb ef oedd 'nac oes'.

**Janice Gregory:** Soniasoch am fuddsoddi mewn gorsafoedd; yr wyf yn siŵr y gwyddoch beth yr wyf am ei ddweud. Mae'n amlwg eich bod yn deall bod cymunedau'n teimlo'n eithaf unig ac ar wahân os nad oes gorsaf ganddynt. Diolchaf i chi, ar ran y bobl sydd yn byw yn Llanharan yn fy etholaeth, am roi sêl bendith ar yr orsaf y bore yma. Yr wyf yn dra diolchgar.

**Andrew Davies:** Dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r gwrthbleidiau; dim ond sôn am y peth y maent hwy; yr ydym ni'n mynd â'r maen i'r wal. Bu wfftio ar reilffordd Bro Morgannwg; nid wyf yn cofio i Alun Cairns ddangos dim diddordeb yn system y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru o'r blaen.

**Alun Cairns:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ildio?

**Andrew Davies:** Gadewch imi orffen yr hyn yr oeddwn am ei ddweud yn gyntaf. Mae'r awdurdodau lleol a Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd wrth eu bodd â lefel y gwasanaeth, fel y mae Network Rail a Trenau Arriva Cymru. Mae mwy o lawer o ddefnyddio ar y gwasanaeth hwnnw nag a nodwyd yn y cynllun busnes gwreiddiol.

**Janet Davies:** Er fy mod yn falch eich bod wedi rhoi sêl bendith ar orsaf rheilffordd Llanharan, oni fuasai'n syniad da ichi hysbysu'r Aelodau eich bod wedi gwneud hynny? Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod £400 miliwn yn cael ei fuddsoddi ym mhrif reilffordd y Great Western, ond nid oes cymhariaeth rhwng hynny a'r biliynau o bunnoedd—cannoedd o biliynau—sydd wedi'u buddsoddi ym mhrif reilffordd arfordir y gorllewin.

**Andrew Davies:** Pan gymerais drosodd y portffolio trafniadaeth, un o'r cyfarfodydd cyntaf a gefais oedd hwnnw gyda Richard

executive and chair of the Strategic Rail Authority. He said that, in terms of improving services, it is better to make small investments rather than big investments in whole route upgrades. His view was that that was the best investment that could be made. That is why, working closely with Network Rail and Arriva Trains Wales, we are making a significant improvement to rail services in Wales.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to Leighton Andrews for giving way. [*Laughter.*] Maybe that will be next week, after this Minister has been sacked.

I am grateful to the Minister for giving way because it gives me an opportunity to put him right. Of course the local authority will be pleased because having a railway line in the Vale of Glamorgan is better than not having a line. Of course Cardiff International Airport will be pleased because having a railway line a couple of miles away is better than not having a line at all. However, this demonstrates lack of vision of behalf of the Welsh Assembly Government. Compare it with Newcastle, where consideration is being given to diverting the north-east coast main line via the airport; that is the vision there, compared with your lack of vision.

4.50 p.m.

**Andrew Davies:** Lack of vision? We are now going to be opening up two railway lines for passenger services for the first time since the Beeching cuts of the early 1960s—the Vale of Glamorgan line and the Ebbw Vale line.

I very much regret any delay on the Ebbw Vale line, Peter, but—and you may not be aware of this—only last month we signed off a design-and-build contract with Amey Rail, which has given a commitment that it will deliver passenger services in the early part of 2007. However, that is not our project; we are funding it, but it is a consortium headed up by three local authorities of Blaenau Gwent, Caerphilly and Newport, working with Network Rail. I have given a commitment to

Bowker, prif weithredwr a chadeirydd blaenorol yr Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol. Dywedodd ef mai gwell, o ran gwella gwasanaethau, yw buddsoddi symiau bach yn hytrach na symiau mawr i wella'r llwybr cyfan. Dyna oedd y buddsoddiad gorau, yn ei farn ef. Drwy wneud hynny, gan gydweithio'n agos â Network Rail a Trenau Arriva Cymru, yr ydym yn gwella gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru'n sylweddol.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i Leighton Andrews am ildio. [*Chwerthin.*] Efallai mai'r wythnos nesaf y bydd hynny, ar ôl diswyddo'r Gweinidog hwn.

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am iddo ildio gan fod hynny'n rhoi cyfle imi ei gywiro. Mae'n naturiol y bydd yr awdurdod lleol yn falch, gan ei bod yn well cael rheilffordd ym Mro Morgannwg na bod heb un o gwbl. Mae'n naturiol y bydd Maes Awyr Rhyngwladol Caerdydd yn falch gan ei bod yn well cael rheilffordd sydd ychydig filltiroedd i ffwrdd na bod heb un o gwbl. Serch hynny, mae hyn yn dangos diffyg gweledigaeth ar ran Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Cymharwch hynny â Newcastle, lle yr ystyrir dargyfeirio prif reilffordd arfordir y gogledd-ddwyrain fel ei bod yn mynd drwy'r maes awyr; dyna'r weledigaeth a geir yn y fan honno, o'i chymharu â'ch diffyg gweledigaeth chi.

**Andrew Davies:** Diffyg gweledigaeth? Yn awr, yr ydym am agor dwy reilffordd ar gyfer gwasanaethau teithwyr am y tro cyntaf ers toriadau Beeching ar ddechrau'r 1960au—rheilffordd Bro Morgannwg a rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy.

Mae'n flin iawn gennyf am unrhyw oedi ar reilffordd Glyn Ebwy, Peter, ond—ac efallai na wyddoch am hyn—mor ddiweddar â'r mis diwethaf gwnaethom contract dylunio ac adeiladu gydag Amey Rail, sydd wedi ymrwymo i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaethau teithwyr yn rhedeg ar ddechrau 2007. Fodd bynnag, nid ein prosiect ni yw hwnnw; yr ydym yn ei ariannu, ond consortiwm ydyw o dan arweiniad tri awdurdod lleol, sef Blaenau Gwent, Caerffili a Chasnewydd, sydd yn

the communities served by that railway that we will deliver this as soon as we possibly can.

**Peter Law** *rose*—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have allowed the Minister significant injury time.

**Andrew Davies:** In conclusion, this Government is committed to Wales's rail system. I am delighted that the opposition is beginning to demonstrate a belated interest.

**Lisa Francis:** In announcing your transport programme, this time last year, Minister, you said that it was designed to

'increase the speed of delivery on transport, support the development of the economy and help to spread prosperity across all parts of Wales.'

Clearly, an effective rail infrastructure and service is integral to a vibrant economy. According to a recently published Confederation of British Industry survey, transport problems are hitting businesses hardest, more than half of businesses thought that the reputation of the UK as a place to do business was being harmed by the issue of poor transport, and 48 per cent thought that their own company's reputation had suffered as a result.

As we have heard from other speakers, from a rail passenger's point of view, there are currently serious problems with overcrowding and gaps in service provision in Wales. The service has to improve. On 3 October, the 1.30 p.m. train from Aberystwyth to Shrewsbury was cancelled and replaced by a motor coach service, which took a long time to arrive, further inconveniencing passengers, who missed rail connections for the north, the west midlands and London. On that day, around 150 students were crammed into three motor coaches, which then had to drive very fast in order to make up for lost time. On the way

gweithio gyda Network Rail. Yr wyf wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i'r cymunedau a wasanaethir gan y rheilffordd honno y byddwn yn cwblhau hyn mor fuan ag y gallwn.

**Peter Law** *a gododd*—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi caniatáu llawer o amser ychwanegol i'r Gweinidog.

**Andrew Davies:** I gloi, mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi ymrwymo i system reilffyrdd Cymru. Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod y gwrthbleidiau'n dechau ymddiddori o'r diwedd.

**Lisa Francis:** Wrth gyhoeddi'ch rhaglen drafnidiaeth, yr adeg hon y llynedd, Weinidog, dywedasoeh mai'r amcan oedd y byddai'n

'mynd â'r maen i'r wal yn gynt mewn cysylltiad â thrafnidiaeth, yn hyrwyddo datblygiad yr economi ac yn helpu i ledaenu ffyniant i bob rhan o Gymru.'

Mae'n amlwg bod seilwaith a gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd effeithiol yn hollbwysig ar gyfer economi ffyniannus. Yn ôl arolwg a gyhoeddwyd yn ddiweddar gan Gydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, busnesau sydd yn cael eu bwrw galetaf gan broblemau trafnidiaeth, yr oedd mwy na hanner y busnesau o'r farn bod trafnidiaeth wael yn gwneud niwed i'r enw da sydd gan y DU fel lle i fasnachu, ac yr oedd 48 y cant yn credu bod enw da eu cwmni eu hunain wedi dioddef o ganlyniad i hynny.

Fel y clywsom gan siaradwyr eraill, o safbwynt teithwyr rheilffyrdd, ceir problemau difrifol ar hyn o bryd o ran gorlenwi cerbydau a bylchau yn y gwasanaeth a ddarperir yng Nghymru. Rhaid i'r gwasanaeth wella. Ar 3 Hydref, cafodd y trên 1.30 p.m. o Aberystwyth i Amwythig ei ganslo a rhoddwyd coets, a gymerodd amser maith i gyrraedd, i redeg yn ei le, gan beri rhagor o anhwylystod i deithwyr, a gollodd gysylltiadau rheilffyrdd ar gyfer teithio i'r gogledd, i orllewin canolbarth Lloegr ac i Lundain. Y diwrnod hwnnw, yr oedd tua 150 o fyfyrwyr wedi'u gwasgu i dair coets, a bu'n rhaid iddynt wedyn yrru'n gyflym iawn i



back in the evening, around 200 people were squeezed onto coaches, so that there was standing room only. Apart from the resulting inconvenience of missed appointments, this surely represents an unsafe service and is an accident waiting to happen.

Two weeks ago, the early morning Aberystwyth to Shrewsbury service, which is the first London train of the day and is always packed to the gunnels, had no heating at all. I do not suppose that Arriva Trains Wales offered any kind of rebate for that inconvenience. I mention all this, not because I want you all to think of me as a parochial trainspotting anorak, but because these are real, everyday examples that demonstrate the serious gaps in service provision. These gaps happen all over Wales, as I know Leighton Andrews would be only too happy to point out, as he has done in the past. They affect the way that we do business in Wales; moreover, they are potentially dangerous.

As Peter Law has outlined, despite warm words and pledged intentions, this Government has, thus far, failed to deliver its promised integrated rail network. Projects have been repeatedly delayed, while others have not even come to fruition. The fact is that a provision in the final budget for rail improvements has only come about as the result of pressure from opposition parties.

New rolling stock on the Cambrian and Heart of Wales lines will alleviate the dangerous problems of overcrowding. A commitment to installing passing loops on the Cambrian line will deliver an hourly service—and they must be loops, probably at Borth and Caersws. This line is a star performer in terms of year-on-year passenger growth, averaging 7 per cent per annum, with footfall figures in excess of half a million a year providing transport to an area with a growing population and which, in transport terms, is isolated and served by poor roads. Just to put things into perspective, the cost of installing those loops would be the equivalent of a quarter of a mile of motorway.

adennill yr amser a gollwyd. Ar y ffordd yn ôl gyda'r nos, yr oedd tua 200 o bobl wedi ymwasgu i goetshis, fel bod rhaid i bawb sefyll. Heblaw'r anhwylystod o'r herwydd wrth golli apwyntiadau, mae'n sicr bod gwasanaeth o'r fath yn annïogel a bod damwain yn siŵr o ddigwydd ryw bryd.

Bythefnos yn ôl, ar y gwasanaeth yn y bore bach o Aberystwyth i Amwythig, sef y trên dyddiol cyntaf i Lundain sydd bob amser yn llawn dop, nid oedd dim gwres o gwbl. Nid yw'n debyg gennyf fod Trenau Arriva Cymru wedi cynnig dim math o ad-daliad am yr anhwylystod hwnnw. Yr wyf yn sôn am hyn oll, nid am fy mod am ichi fy ystyried yn rhyw wylwr trenau plwyfol, ond am mai enghreifftiau bob dydd, go iawn yw'r rhain sydd yn dangos y bylchau yn y gwasanaeth a ddarperir. Ceir bylchau o'r fath ledled Cymru, fel y byddai Leighton Andrews yn falch iawn o nodi, yr wyf yn siŵr, fel y mae wedi gwneud yn y gorffennol. Maent yn effeithio ar y modd yr ydym yn mynd ynghylch pethau yng Nghymru; ar ben hynny, gallent fod yn beryglus.

Fel y mae Peter Law wedi nodi, er gwaethaf y geiriau hynaws a'r addewidion, mae'r Llywodraeth hon wedi methu â darparu'r rhwydwaith rheilffyrdd integredig y mae wedi'i addo, hyd yma. Mae prosiectau wedi'u gohirio dro ar ôl tro, tra bo eraill heb ddechrau hyd yn oed. Y gwir amdani yw nad ydyw'r ddarpariaeth yn y gyllideb derfynol ar gyfer gwelliannau i'r reilffyrdd ond wedi'i sicrhau o ganlyniad i bwysau gan wrthbleidiau.

Bydd cerbydau newydd ar reilffordd y Cambrian a rheilffordd Calon Cymru'n lliniaru'r problemau peryglus o ran gorlenwi. Bydd ymrwymiad i osod dolennau goddiweddyd ar reilffordd y Cambrian yn sicrhau gwasanaeth bob awr—a rhaid cael dolennau, yn y Borth a Chaersŵs yn ôl pob tebyg. Mae'r rheilffordd hon yn perfformio'n rhagorol o ran y twf yn nifer y teithwyr o flwyddyn i flwyddyn, sef 7 y cant y flwyddyn ar gyfartaledd, gyda mwy na hanner miliwn o deithwyr y flwyddyn, ac mae'n darparu trafniadaeth i ardal y mae ei phoblogaeth ar gynydd ac sydd wedi'i hynysu, yng nghydestun trafniadaeth, ac yn cael ei gwasanaethu gan ffyrdd gwael. Er mwyn gweld hyn yn ei

wir oleuni, byddai cost gosod y dolennau hynny'n cyfateb i gost chwarter milltir o draffordd.

Installing those loops was a commitment when Sue Essex was Minister with responsibility for transport. Mysteriously, Welsh Assembly Government officials then informed the Economic Development and Transport Committee that it had become a mere aspiration. That means that your Government, your locomotive, is moving backwards down the track, and we are in reverse. It is exactly that kind of reversal that prompts the need for us to form a committee.

Cafwyd ymrwymiad i osod y dolennau hynny pan oedd Sue Essex yn Weinidog a chanddi gyfrifoldeb dros drafnidiaeth. Yn rhyfedd iawn, rhoddodd swyddogion Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wybod i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wedyn fod hynny wedi troi'n ddyhead yn unig. Mae hynny'n golygu bod eich Llywodraeth, eich locomotif, yn symud yn ei hôl i lawr y lein, ac yr ydym yn mynd wysg ein cefn. Gwrthdroi o'r union fath hwnnw sy'n peri bod angen inni ffurfio pwyllgor.

The budget negotiations have provided several positive developments for railways in Wales and we have to progress those further. We urge the Government that there should be no more delays regarding the contracting, which you mentioned, for reopening the Ebbw Vale line. It would be the responsible thing for your Government to provide regular progress reports on that project. That is why we need this committee.

Mae'r negodiadau ar y gyllideb wedi arwain at sawl datblygiad buddiol ar gyfer y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru a rhaid inni hyrwyddo'r rheini ymhellach. Anogwn y Llywodraeth i sicrhau na fydd dim oedi pellach wrth osod y contractau, y cyfeiriasoch atynt, ar gyfer ailagor rheilffordd Glyn Ebwy. Y peth cyfrifol fyddai i'ch Llywodraeth roi adroddiadau rheolaidd ar gynnydd ar y prosiect hwnnw. Dyna pam y mae arnom angen pwyllgor o'r fath.

Minister, let me refer you to comments that you made in January 2003:

Weinidog, gadewch imi'ch cyfeirio at sylwadau a wnaethoch yn Ionawr 2003:

'The Welsh Assembly Government is...committed to an efficient and reliable rail system in Wales, and there is considerable public backing for this'.

'Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn... ymrwymedig i system rheilffyrdd effeithlon a dibynadwy yng Nghymru, ac mae cryn gefnogaeth i hyn ymhlith y cyhoedd.'

If you truly believe what you said then, and you are a man of conviction, and I hope that you are, you cannot fail to support our motion today. Finally, I ask you to remember that it is your job to hold your own Government to account. That is why you are here and that is why we are all here.

Os ydych yn credu o ddifrif yr hyn a ddywedasoch bryd hynny, ac yn barod i sefyll dros eich egwyddorion, ac yr wyf yn gobeithio mai dyn felly ydych, byddwch yn sicr o gefnogi ein cynnig heddiw. Yn olaf, yr wyf yn gofyn ichi gofio mai'ch gwaith chi yw galw'ch Llywodraeth eich hun i gyfrif. Dyna pam yr ydych yma a dyna pam y mae pob un ohonom yma.

*Cynnig (NDM2735): O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Motion (NDM2735): For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary

Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Cynigion ar gyfer Ailstrwythuro Gwasanaeth yr Heddlu Proposed Restructuring of the Police Service**

**Y Llywydd:** O ystyried nifer yr Aelodau sydd am siarad, ac eithrio'r Gweinidog a'r rhai sy'n cynnig gwelliannau a fydd yn cael eu hamser arferol, byddaf yn cyfyngu'r siaradwyr eraill i dri munud yr un. Byddwn hefyd yn croesawu areithiau byrrach yn wirfoddol.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Kirsty Williams, gwelliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams a Lisa Francis, gwelliannau 6 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. welcomes the work of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in producing its report 'Restructuring the Constabulary', which considers the reform of police boundaries in Wales;*

**The Presiding Officer:** Given the number of Members who wish to contribute, excepting the Minister and those who are proposing amendments who will also have their usual time, I will restrict the other speakers to three minutes each. I would also welcome voluntary shorter speeches.

I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3 and 4 in the name of Kirsty Williams, amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams and Lisa Francis, amendments 6 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. yn croesawu gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder ac Adfywio Cymdeithasol wrth gynhyrchu ei adroddiad 'Restructuring the Constabulary', sy'n ystyried ad-drefnu ffiniau'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru;*

2. notes that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has forwarded this report to the Home Secretary, as part of the consultation exercise in which he is currently engaged. (NDM2734)

Today is the fourth time that we have discussed the possible restructuring of the police in Wales in Plenary in the past two months. While policing is not a devolved matter, creating safe and stronger communities is one of the top-10 commitments in 'Wales: A Better Country' and the police play a vital part in helping us to achieve that aim.

We all know that having a high-quality, high-achieving police service is important to the people of Wales. We all agree that the four existing forces have served us well. I think that we also agree that providing the best possible police service to local communities in the future is of paramount importance. However, the police of today face new challenges and we need to recognise that there may have to be changes in the way that they are run to ensure that the police in Wales are able to meet their new challenges, should the need arise. The report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary, 'Closing the Gap', published in September, cast severe doubts about whether the existing four-force structure in Wales was capable of doing so. That is a fact that we cannot ignore, however attached we might feel to the existing forces.

As you know, the Home Secretary wrote to me in September to inform me that the Westminster Government would be endorsing HMIC's findings, but seeking the Assembly's views on how it could be implemented. At that point, he made it clear that the Westminster Government's view, as a result of the report, was that it would be negligent to retain the current structure of policing. Charles Clarke considers that his first duty as Home Secretary is to ensure that the public is properly protected from a variety of threats to which the police have to respond. It was clear, even at that stage, that he firmly believed that some reorganisation of the forces and reconfiguration of protective services was necessary.

2. yn nodi bod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder ac Adfywio Cymdeithasol wedi anfon yr adroddiad hwn at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, fel rhan o'r ymgynghoriad y mae'n ei gynnal ar hyn o bryd. (NDM2734)

Heddiw yw'r bedwaredd waith inni drafod y posibilrwydd o ad-drefnu'r heddlu yng Nghymru yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yn y ddau fis diwethaf. Er nad yw plismona'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, mae'r bwriad i greu cymunedau diogel a chryfach yn un o'r 10 prif ymrwymiad yn 'Cymru: Gwlad Well' ac mae'r heddlu'n chwarae rhan hollbwysig wrth ein helpu i gyrraedd y nod hwnnw.

Yr ydym oll yn gwybod ei bod yn bwysig gan bobl Cymru gael gwasanaeth heddlu rhagorol a llwyddiannus. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod y pedwar heddlu presennol wedi ein gwasanaethu'n dda. Credaf ein bod hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig darparu'r gwasanaeth heddlu gorau posibl i gymunedau lleol yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r heddlu heddiw'n wynebu heriau newydd a rhaid inni dderbyn ei bod yn bosibl y bydd yn rhaid newid y dull o'u rhedeg er mwyn sicrhau bod yr heddlu yng Nghymru'n gallu ateb yr heriau newydd sydd yn ei wynebu, os bydd angen. Mae adroddiad Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi, 'Closing the Gap', a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Medi, wedi codi amheuan mawr ynghylch a yw'r strwythur presennol o bedwar heddlu yng Nghymru'n gallu gwneud hynny. Ni allwn anwybyddu'r ffaith honno, ni waeth faint o ymlyniad sydd gennym wrth yr heddluoedd presennol.

Fel y gwyddoch, ysgrifennodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref lythyr ataf ym mis Medi yn fy hysbysu y byddai Llywodraeth San Steffan yn cefnogi canfyddiadau Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi, ond yn gofyn am farn y Cynulliad ynghylch sut y gellid rhoi hynny ar waith. Bryd hynny, eglurodd mai barn Llywodraeth San Steffan, o ganlyniad i'r adroddiad, oedd mai esgeulus fyddai cadw'r strwythur heddluoedd presennol. Mae Charles Clarke o'r farn mai ei brif ddyletswydd fel Ysgrifennydd Cartref yw sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael ei ddiogelu'n iawn rhag amrywiaeth o fygythiadau y mae'n rhaid i'r heddlu ymateb iddynt. Yr oedd yn amlwg, yr adeg honno hyd yn oed, ei fod yn credu'n bendant fod

angen rhyw fath o ad-drefnu ar yr heddluoedd ac ailgyflunio'r gwasanaethau diogelu.

The Home Secretary has reiterated his wish to hear the views of the Assembly on this issue. However, I know that many of you are deeply unhappy about the way in which the whole matter has been handled so far and feel that decisions have pre-empted proper consultation. We are all agreed that the timescale has been tight and has not allowed as much time as we would like to undertake a proper consultation. I share your frustration with the way in which this matter has been handled so far. However, despite the difficult deadlines, the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee has prepared an excellent report on our behalf, which we debated last week. This report reflects many of the concerns that have been expressed in the Chamber. This report is now with the Home Secretary and its content will enable him to gain a real understanding of the Welsh perspective. As you know, I have also sent other comments and views to the Home Secretary so that he gets a complete picture of the issues facing Wales.

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi ailddatgan ei ddymuniaid i glywed barn y Cynulliad am y mater hwn. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod llawer ohonoch yn anfodlon iawn ar y modd y mae'r holl fater wedi'i drafod hyd yma a'ch bod yn teimlo bod penderfyniadau wedi'u gwneud cyn cynnal ymgynghori priodol. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod yr amserlen wedi bod yn dynn ac nad yw wedi caniatáu cymaint o amser ag y dymunem ei gael i ymgynghori mewn modd priodol. Teimlaf yr un mor rhwystredig â chi ynghylch y modd y mae'r mater hwn wedi'i drafod hyd yma. Serch hynny, er gwaethaf y terfynau amser anodd, mae'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi paratoi adroddiad rhagorol ar ein rhan, y cawsom ddadl arno yr wythnos diwethaf. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn adlewyrchu llawer o'r pryderon sydd wedi'u mynegi yn y Siambr. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn nwylo'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn awr a bydd ei gynnwys yn ei alluogi i gael gwir ddealltwriaeth o'r persbectif Cymreig. Fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf hefyd wedi anfon sylwadau a safbwyntiau eraill at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref fel y caiff ddarlun cyflawn o'r materion sydd yn wynebu Cymru.

5.00 p.m.

As I said in my first statement on this matter, my wish is to ensure that we support a structure that ensures that the police continue to work in partnership with other local agencies to bear down on crime and anti-social behaviour and ensures that communities receive the quality of service that they have the right to expect. This remains my main concern. However, we need to recognise that expert opinion claims that maintaining the status quo will not enable the police to meet the new challenges that I mentioned earlier. We can then focus our energies on ensuring that we work with the Home Office and all key stakeholders to ensure that the concerns and issues that are expressed in the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's report are addressed in any restructuring process. I commend the resolution to you as it stands

Fel y dywedais yn fy natganiad cyntaf ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, fy nymuniad yw sicrhau ein bod yn cefnogi strwythur sy'n sicrhau bod yr heddlu'n parhau i weithio mewn partneriaeth ag asiantaethau lleol eraill i frwydro yn erbyn troseddu ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol ac sy'n sicrhau bod cymunedau'n derbyn gwasanaeth o'r safon y mae ganddynt hawl i'w ddisgwyl. Dyma yw fy mhryder mwyaf o hyd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni dderbyn na fydd cadw at y drefn bresennol, yn ôl yr arbenigwyr, yn galluogi'r heddlu i wynebu'r heriau newydd a grybwyllais yn gynharach. Gallwn wedyn ganolbwyntio'n hegni ar sicrhau ein bod yn gweithio gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref a phob rhanddeiliad allweddol arall i sicrhau bod y pryderon a'r materion a godir yn adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio'n cael sylw mewn unrhyw broses ailstrwythuro. Cymeradwyaf y

and I look forward to the debate.

cynnig i chi fel y mae ac edrychaf ymlaen at y ddadl.

**Mick Bates:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 1: in point 2, delete all after 'Home Secretary.'

**Mick Bates:** Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 1: ym mhwynt 2, dileu popeth ar ôl 'Ysgrifennydd Cartref.'

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the existing police forces in Wales serve the people of Wales well, and that the current structure of four separate forces should be maintained.*

*yn credu bod heddluoedd Cymru yn darparu gwasanaeth da i bobl Cymru ar hyn o bryd, ac y dylid cadw'r strwythur cyfredol o bedwar heddlu ar wahân.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the cost of restructuring the police forces in Wales would be better spent on front-line services.*

*yn credu y byddai'n well gwario'r arian a werid ar ailstrwythuro'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru ar wasanaethau'r rheng flaen.*

I propose amendment 4. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*believes that the option of one strategic police force for Wales should be rejected.*

*yn credu y dylid gwrthod yr opsiwn o gael un heddlu strategol i Gymru.*

Minister, thank you for your opening statement and your previous statements on this matter. I, too, as do all in the Welsh Liberal Democrat group, support the view that the committee, chaired by Janice Gregory, has undertaken a thorough review in the time allowed, and I commend the work of staff in producing that report. However, I fear that you have failed to dispel the view that the Government had a premeditated view to ensure that the Assembly simply accepted the Home Office diktat that there would be one police force in Wales. The amendments, therefore, relate to the continued references in the evidence that we took in committee to the haste and costs of this possible reorganisation, which will impact on every taxpayer in Wales.

Weinidog, diolch i chi am eich datganiad agoriadol ac am eich datganiadau blaenorol am y mater. Yr wyf finnau, hefyd, fel pawb o fewn grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru, yn cefnogi'r farn bod y pwyllgor, o dan gadeiryddiaeth Janice Gregory, wedi cynnal adolygiad trylwyr yn yr amser a oedd ar gael, a chanmolaf waith y staff wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, mae arnaf ofn nad ydych wedi llwyddo i gael gwared ar yr amheuan bod gan y Llywodraeth farn ragfwiadol i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad yn derbyn dictad y Swyddfa Gartref mai un heddlu a fyddai yng Nghymru. Mae'r gwelliannau, felly, yn ymwneud â'r cyfeiriadau niferus yn y dystiolaeth a glywyd yn y pwyllgor at frys a chostau'r ad-drefnu posibl, a fydd yn effeithio ar bob trethdalwr yng Nghymru.

Looking at the evidence, we see that, for example, the Police Federation of England and Wales's view is that the creation of such a strategic, single force would mean the depletion of resources from more rural areas of Wales. The Police Authorities of Wales's

Wrth edrych ar y dystiolaeth, gwelwn, er enghraifft, fod Ffederasiwn Heddlu Lloegr a Chymru o'r farn y byddai creu un heddlu strategol o'r fath yn golygu mynd ag adnoddau oddi ar ardaloedd mwy gwledig yng Nghymru. Dywed datganiad ysgrifenedig

written statement states that

‘One size does not fit all: there is a need for a well-argued business case for change’.

Victim Support Wales stated that having to consider restructuring the charities again would certainly have significant financial and organisational costs. The Powys community safety partnership stated that there is a certain amount of identity with the current structure that would need to be tackled very sensitively. The police federation further states that it does not want to see a large, remote police force that becomes separated from the community it serves. Finally, the chief constable of North Wales Police, Richard Brunstrom, in a BBC Radio Wales interview on 30 November, said that he considered it unhelpful and unfortunate that more time was not being given to discuss the future of policing with the public

Minister, that was our evidence, and I feel that you have failed to dispel the view that I described earlier, which is why our amendments were tabled and why we will support the other amendments.

With regard to our third amendment on the cost of structuring the police force, it was only through questioning that the figures emerged. This was not well publicised as a part of ‘Closing the Gap’. Generally, on the committee, we failed to understand how the figure of 4,000-officer police force was arrived at. As I have said often in Plenary and in committee, ‘If it ain’t broke, don’t fix it’. It appears that this arbitrary figure of 4,000 was plucked from the air. It is so arbitrary as to be meaningless, because there was no evidence to suggest that performance would be enhanced by having forces of over 4,000. In fact, the evidence on the quality of policing is to the contrary—the four forces in Wales, on average, perform better than their English counterparts, and that is a great credit to the current personnel and structure.

Awdurdodau Heddlu Cymru

Nad yw un maint yn addas i bawb: mae angen achos busnes dros newid sydd wedi’i ystyried yn drylwyr.

Dywed Cymorth i Ddiodefwyr Cymru y byddai gorfod ystyried ailstrwythuro yn golygu y byddai’n rhaid i elusennau unwaith eto wynebu costau ariannol a threfniadol sylweddol. Dywedodd partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol Powys fod rhyw gymaint o hunaniaeth ynghlwm wrth y strwythur presennol ac y byddai’n rhaid mynd i’r afael â hynny mewn modd sensitif iawn. Dywed ffederasiwn yr heddlu hefyd nad yw am weld heddlu mawr, anhygyrch sy’n cael ei ynysu oddi wrth y gymuned y mae’n ei gwasanaethu. Yn olaf, dywedodd prif gwnstabl Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, Richard Brunstrom, mewn cyfweiliad ar BBC Radio Wales ar 30 Tachwedd, ei fod o’r farn ei bod yn anghyfleus ac yn anffodus nad oedd mwy o amser ar gael i drafod dyfodol plismona gyda’r cyhoedd.

Weinidog, dyna oedd ein tystiolaeth, a theimlaf nad ydych wedi llwyddo i leddfu’r pryderon a ddisgrifiais yn gynharach, a dyna pam y cafodd ein gwelliannau eu cyflwyno a pham y byddwn yn cefnogi’r gwelliannau eraill.

O ran ein trydydd gwelliant ynglŷn â chost ailstrwythuro’r heddlu, dim ond drwy holi y daeth y ffigurau i’r amlwg. Ni roddwyd sylw i hyn fel rhan o ‘Closing the Gap’. At ei gilydd, nid oeddem ni ar y pwyllgor yn gallu deall sut y cafwyd y ffigur o heddlu gyda 4,000 o swyddogion. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud yn aml yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y pwyllgor, os nad oes dim o’i le arno, gadewch lonydd iddo. Ymddengys fod y ffigur mympwyol hwn o 4,000 wedi dod o rywle rywle. Mae mor fympwyol nes ei fod yn ddiystyr, oherwydd ni chafwyd tystiolaeth i awgrymu y byddai’r perfformiad yn gwella drwy gael heddluoedd gyda dros 4,000 o swyddogion. Mewn gwirionedd, mae’r dystiolaeth ar ansawdd plismona’n awgrymu’r gwrthwyneb—mae’r pedwar heddlu yng Nghymru, ar gyfartaledd, yn perfformio’n well na’u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr, ac mae hynny’n glod mawr i’r staff a’r strwythur presennol.

Minister, if the £57,000 is available, why can it not be spent on providing more front-line services? When we meet our police forces in our constituencies, we are continually told, 'No, I am sorry, you cannot have more police officers, you cannot have better facilities in police stations, and you cannot have more community support officers'. All these things are limited by finance, and yet, for this outrageous diktat from Westminster, we suddenly find that there may be £57 million available. That remains somewhat of a mystery to me.

A relevant issue that has some bearing is the identification of level 2 policing. There is a concern that the collaboration will not meet the demands of level 2 policing, and I do not think that the engagement in greater collective working within Wales has been fully investigated. Time was too short, so we again find haste, and the evidence that I quoted backs up that statement.

Amendment 4 demonstrates that we believe that the whole concept of one strategic police force for Wales should be rejected. Minister, if you have any evidence to suggest that one police force is best for Wales, please let us see it.

**Leanne Wood:** I propose amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams and Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the recent hurried and superficial consultation by the Home Secretary on restructuring the constabulary, which failed to:*

*a) formally consult the National Assembly;*

*b) fully consider Welsh circumstances; and*

*c) make the case for change.*

I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 6. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

Weinidog, os yw'r £57,000 ar gael, pam na ellir ei wario ar ddarparu mwy o wasanaethau rheng flaen? Pan fyddwn yn cyfarfod ein heddluoedd yn ein hetholaethau, dywedir wrthym dro ar ôl tro, 'Na, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni allwch gael rhagor o swyddogion, ni allwch gael cyfleusterau gwell mewn gorsafoedd heddlu, ac ni allwch gael rhagor o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol'. Cyfyngir ar yr holl bethau hyn gan resymau ariannol, ac eto, er mwyn cyflawni'r dictad gwarthus hwn o San Steffan, gwelwn yn sydyn y gall fod £57 miliwn ar gael. Mae hynny'n parhau'n dipyn o ddirgelwch i mi.

Mater perthnasol o bwys yw pennu beth yw plismona lefel 2. Mae pryder na fydd y cydweithio'n bodloni gofynion plismona lefel 2, ac nid wyf yn credu bod y posibilrwydd o gydweithio mwy yng Nghymru wedi ei archwilio'n llwyr. Nid oedd digon o amser ar gael, felly gwelwn eto fod brys, ac mae'r dystiolaeth yr wyf wedi cyfeirio ati'n cadarnhau'r datganiad hwnnw.

Mae gwelliant 4 yn dangos ein bod yn credu bod yr holl gysyniad o un heddlu strategol i Gymru yn un y dylid ei wrthod. Weinidog, os oes gennych unrhyw dystiolaeth i awgrymu mai un heddlu fyddai orau i Gymru, gadewch inni ei gweld.

**Leanne Wood:** Cynigiau welliant 5 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, Kirsty Williams, a Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio'r ymgynghori brysiog ac arwynebol diweddar gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar ailstrwythuro'r heddluoedd, a fethodd ag*

*a) ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol;*

*b) ystyried amgylchiadau Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd; a*

*c) cyflwyno'r ddadl o blaid newid.*

Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:



*calls for the devolution of responsibility for the police service in Wales to the National Assembly for Wales.*

I propose amendment 8. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*recommends that any restructuring of police forces in Wales that results from the 'Closing the Gap' report should not be prejudicial against the future transfer of responsibility for police forces in Wales from the Home Secretary to the National Assembly for Wales.*

In the first meeting at which the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee discussed the review, I asked the Chair whether our work would be a worthwhile exercise. I was not convinced at the time that the Home Office would really listen to the views of the National Assembly. That belief was confirmed following Charles Clarke's announcement on 10 November that he had already decided that Wales was to have one police force.

There are many compelling arguments against reorganising the police forces at this point in time. As Mick Bates pointed out, Charles Clarke has given the arbitrary figure of 4,000 officers, saying that new forces should not have fewer than that number of officers. Throughout the committee's evidence-taking sessions, I heard no good argument for having 4,000 officers—it appears to have been plucked out of the air.

Charles Clarke says that we must rush through this restructuring process because police forces are not currently equipped to deal with level 2 protective policing. I ask the Minister whether Scotland has a problem with level 2 policing. Are the police services in Scotland equipped to deal with a major terrorist threat, for example? The Minister admits that she has not had any discussions with the Scottish Executive about police reorganisation. Had such discussions taken place, the Minister would have found out that there are no plans to restructure police forces in Scotland. She would also have found out that six of the eight Scottish police forces have fewer than 4,000 officers. The case for

*yn galw am ddatganoli'r cyfrifoldeb dros wasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

Cynigiau welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn argymhell na ddylai unrhyw ailstrwythuro yng nghyswllt heddluoedd Cymru sy'n deillio o'r adroddiad 'Closing the Gap' ragfarnu trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am heddluoedd Cymru yn y dyfodol oddi wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

Yn y cyfarfod cyntaf lle y bu'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio yn trafod yr adolygiad, gofynnais i'r Cadeirydd a fyddai ein gwaith yn ymarferiad gwerth chweil. Nid oeddwn wedi fy argyhoeddi ar y pryd y byddai'r Swyddfa Gartref yn gwrandao o ddifrif ar farn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Cadarnhawyd y farn honno wedi i Charles Clarke gyhoeddi ar 10 Tachwedd ei fod wedi penderfynu eisoes y byddai Cymru'n cael un heddlu.

Mae nifer o ddadleuon cryf yn erbyn ad-drefnu'r heddluoedd ar hyn o bryd. Fel y dywedodd Mick Bates, mae Charles Clarke wedi cynnig y ffigur mympwyol o 4,000 o swyddogion, gan ddweud na ddylai heddluoedd newydd gael llai na'r nifer hwnnw o swyddogion. Drwy gydol sesiynau derbyn tystiolaeth y pwyllgor, ni chlywais yr un ddadl gref dros gael 4,000 o swyddogion—ymddengys fod y ffigur hwn wedi dod o rywle rywle.

Dywed Charles Clarke fod rhaid inni ruthro drwy'r broses ailstrwythuro hon oherwydd nad yw'r heddluoedd yn alluog ar hyn o bryd i ddelio â phlismaona diogelu lefel 2. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog a oes gan yr Alban broblem gyda phlismaona lefel 2. A yw gwasanaethau'r heddlu yn yr Alban yn alluog i ddelio â bygythiad o derfysgaeth ddifrifol, er enghraifft? Cyfaddefa'r Gweinidog nad yw hi wedi cynnal dim trafodaethau gyda Gweithrediaeth yr Alban ynglŷn ag ad-drefnu'r heddlu. Pe bai wedi cynnal trafodaethau o'r fath, byddai'r Gweinidog wedi darganfod nad oes cynlluniau i ailstrwythuro heddluoedd yn yr Alban. Byddai wedi darganfod hefyd fod gan

reorganisation has not been made, and we in Plaid Cymru say that this rushed reorganisation is ill-timed, ill-judged and unjustifiably threatens the jobs of up to 1,000 staff in the police forces. If there is no rush to reorganise Scottish police forces, why is there such a rush to reorganise the police forces in Wales? A rushed decision could well result in a bad decision.

The majority of the members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee were of the view that the police services should be devolved. The Assembly has handed £144 million to police authorities this year. What sense is there in giving them that money when we do not have a proper say on the future structure of the forces? It makes no sense whatsoever for two out of the three emergency services to be under the responsibility of the Assembly, and for the police to remain under Westminster's responsibility. If Charles Clarke was serious about a joined-up response to major incidents, he would have devolved responsibility for the police to Wales.

Given enough time, and after carrying out a proper consultation with the people of Wales, we may have concluded that one force was the best option. On the other hand, we may have concluded that 22 local police authorities was the best option for Wales. The point is that the decision should have been ours to make, and not foisted upon us by the Home Secretary. The Minister should make this point to Charles Clarke in the most forceful manner possible, and I hope that our joint amendment will help her to do that.

I know that there are Members on Labour's benches who support the devolution of the police services—two Members supported me on this issue in committee. I urge the Minister to listen to those Members and not to those who disagree with the committee's approach to these matters. I tell those devolution sceptics to think of their conscience, not of their career, when they vote today. Do not allow this Government to sack up to 1,000 people on a whim, without

chwech allan o wyth heddlu'r Alban lai na 4,000 o swyddogion. Nid yw'r ddadl dros ad-drefnu'n argyhoeddi, ac yr ydym ni ym Mhlaid Cymru yn dweud bod yr ad-drefnu brysiog hwn yn anamserol, yn annoeth ac yn peryglu swyddi hyd at 1,000 o staff yn yr heddluoedd heb ddim cyfiawnhad. Os nad oes brys i ad-drefnu heddluoedd yr Alban, pam mae cymaint o frys i ad-drefnu'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru? Gallai penderfyniad brysiog arwain at benderfyniad gwael.

Yr oedd mwyafrif aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio o'r farn y dylai gwasanaethau'r heddlu gael eu datganoli. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi cyfrannu £144 miliwn i'r awdurdodau heddlu eleni. Pa synnwyr sydd mewn rhoi'r arian hwnnw iddynt a ninnau heb lais iawn yn nyfodol strwythur yr heddluoedd? Nid yw'n gwneud dim synnwyr bod dau allan o'r tri gwasanaeth brys dan ofal y Cynulliad, a'r heddlu'n aros o dan ofal San Steffan. Pe bai Charles Clarke o ddifrif ynglŷn â sicrhau ymateb cydgysylltiedig i ddigwyddiadau mawr, byddai wedi datganoli cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu i'r Cynulliad.

O gael digon o amser, ac ar ôl ymgynghori'n briodol â phobl Cymru, gallem fod wedi dod i'r casgliad mai un heddlu fyddai'r opsiwn gorau. Ar y llaw arall, gallem fod wedi dod i'r casgliad mai 22 awdurdod heddlu lleol fyddai'r opsiwn gorau i Gymru. Y pwynt yw mai ni ddylai gael yr hawl i wneud y penderfyniad, yn hytrach na'i fod yn cael ei orfodi arnom gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Dylai'r Gweinidog ddweud hyn wrth Charles Clarke yn y modd mwyaf grymus posibl, a gobeithiaf y bydd ein gwelliant ar y cyd yn ei chynorthwyo i wneud hynny.

Gwn fod Aelodau ar feinciau Llafur sy'n cefnogi datganoli gwasanaethau'r heddlu—yr oedd dau Aelod yn fy nghefnogi yn hyn o beth yn y pwyllgor. Pwysaf ar y Gweinidog i wrando ar yr Aelodau hynny yn hytrach nag ar y rhai sy'n anghytuno â safbwynt y pwyllgor ar y materion hyn. Dywedaf wrth y rhai sy'n amheus ynghylch datganoli am feddwl am eu cydwybod, yn hytrach na'u gyrrfa, pan fyddant yn pleidleisio heddiw. Peidiwch â gadael i'r Llywodraeth hon

even a whimper coming from the Labour benches.

ddiswyddo hyd at 1,000 o bobl ar sail mympwy, heb wich hyd yn oed gan y meinciau Llafur.

5.10 p.m.

This consultation process has thrown up many questions which are yet to be answered. We cannot say, for example, how local accountability will work, how much this reorganisation will cost, who will pay for it or how many non-uniform jobs will be lost. There has been no assessment of the impact on council tax bills and we cannot say whether or not centralisation will remove the local dimension in terms of intelligence gathering. I hope that, after today, the Minister will be able to get adequate answers to these questions before this reorganisation takes place.

Mae'r broses ymgynghori hon wedi codi llawer o gwestiynau sydd heb eu hateb eto. Ni allwn ddweud, er enghraifft, sut y bydd atebolrwydd lleol yn gweithio, faint y bydd yr ad-drefnu hwn yn ei gostio, pwy fydd yn talu amdano na faint o weithwyr gweinyddol fydd yn colli eu gwaith. Ni chynhaliwyd asesiad o'r effaith ar filiau'r dreth gyngor ac ni allwn ddweud a fydd canoli'n arwain at golli'r dimensiwn lleol ai peidio o ran casglu gwybodaeth. Gobeithiaf, ar ôl heddiw, y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu cael atebion boddhaol i'r cwestiynau hyn cyn y bydd yr ad-drefnu hwn yn digwydd.

I come back to the point that Charles Clarke has treated Wales with contempt on this issue, and he needs to be clear that Assembly Members demand to be treated with respect in future.

Dychwelaf at y pwynt bod Charles Clarke wedi trin Cymru gyda dirmyg yn hyn o beth, a rhaid iddo sylweddoli bod Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn mynnu ei fod yn dangos parch tuag atynt yn y dyfodol.

**Mark Isherwood:** I propose amendment 7 in the name of Lisa Francis. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

**Mark Isherwood:** Cynigiaf welliant 7 yn enw Lisa Francis. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*calls on the Home Office to retain the four Welsh police forces.*

*yn galw ar y Swyddfa Gartref i gadw pedwar heddlu Cymru.*

The Home Secretary has presented our chief constables with an ultimatum. The most fundamental restructuring of Britain's police force is to be rushed through based on regional boundaries imposed more by European Commission diktat than operational reality. I therefore support joint amendment 5. No Member can claim to represent his or her constituents unless they condemn a consultation that failed to formally consult the Assembly, to fully consider Welsh circumstances and to make a case for the change.

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi cyflwyno wltimatwm i'n prif gwnstabiliaid. Bwriedir bwrw ymlaen ar frys â'r ailstrwythuro mwyaf sylfaenol ar heddlu Prydain ar sail ffiniau rhanbarthol sydd wedi'u gorfodi gan ddictad y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd yn fwy na realiti o ran gweithredu. Yr wyf felly'n cefnogi cyd-welliant 5. Ni all yr un Aelod honni ei fod ef neu hi'n cynrychioli ei etholwyr oni bai eu bod yn condemnio ymgynghoriad a fethodd ag ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â'r Cynulliad, nad yw wedi rhoi ystyriaeth lawn i amgylchiadau Cymru nac wedi llwyddo i gyflwyno dadl gref dros newid.

By stipulating the criteria in advance, the Home Secretary is like an end-of-the-pier magician, writing a number on a card, placing the card in his inside pocket and then inviting a member of the audience to select any number that meets his directions, which

Drwy bennu'r meini prawf ymlaen llaw, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref fel consuriwr ar ben y pier, yn ysgrifennu rhif ar gerdyn, rhoi'r cerdyn yn ei boced ac yna'n gwahodd aelod o'r gynulleidfa i ddewis unrhyw gerdyn sy'n cyd-fynd â'i gyfarwyddiadau sydd

miraculously turns out to be the same as the number that he then produces from his inside pocket.

The Home Secretary stipulates a minimum size of force, but where is the evidence base for that? As the Welsh Local Government Association told us, this is a subjective view and not one being pursued by the Scottish Executive. In Home Office questions in London yesterday, it was claimed that these proposals would maintain and develop cross-border working between police regions. However, logic dictates the contrary if regional command structures are imposed on areas that are not integrated geographically or operationally. North Wales has proposed a closer partnership arrangement with Cheshire constabulary or its successor in recognition of their cross-border operational reality. This is not a merger proposal but it is a proposal that will be threatened if the Home Secretary's grandiose schemes become a reality.

Gwent also has strong cross-border ties with forces in south-west England—

**Ann Jones:** On cross-border working, how do you see the operational responsibilities of the police being threatened? They are working together now across borders; they even go further than the Cheshire borders in north Wales. Therefore, how can you say that that will be threatened when we have been assured that the operational workings of the police will carry on in the best interests of the people of north Wales?

**Mark Isherwood:** I can say it because we are talking about a new regional command structure that completely ignores the history, geography and transport links of Wales as well as the operational reality that north Wales, in this instance, has ploughed its own furrow for decades, if not centuries, in terms of dealing with the terrorist threat, west and east, and the high level of crime and drugs that come in from the west and east, and in co-operating with forces across the border in

wedyn, drwy ryw wyrth, yr un rhif â'r un y mae'n ei dynnu allan o'i boced.

Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn pennu isafswm ar gyfer maint heddluoedd, ond lle y mae'r dystiolaeth dros wneud hynny? Fel y dywedodd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wrthym, mae hyn yn safbwynt goddrychol, ac nid yw'n un y mae Gweithrediaeth yr Alban yn ei arddel. Yn ystod cwestiynau'r Swyddfa Gartref yn Llundain ddoe, honnwyd y byddai'r cynigion hyn yn cynnal ac yn datblygu cydweithio ar draws ffiniau rhwng rhanbarthau'r heddlu. Fodd bynnag, mae rhesymeg yn awgrymu'r gwrthwyneb os yw strwythurau rheoli rhanbarthol yn cael eu gorfodi ar ardaloedd nad ydynt yn integredig o safbwynt daearyddol na gweithredol. Mae Gogledd Cymru wedi cynnig trefniant partneriaeth agosach gyda heddlu swydd Gaer neu ei olynydd sy'n cydnabod y realiti eu bod yn gweithredu'n drawsffiniol. Nid yw hwn yn gynnig i uno ond mae'n gynnig a fydd mewn perygl os caiff cynlluniau aruchel yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref eu gwireddu.

Mae gan Went hefyd gysylltiadau trawsffiniol cryf gyda heddluoedd yn ne-orllewin Lloegr—

**Ann Jones:** O safbwynt gweithio'n drawsffiniol, sut yr ydych yn gweld cyfrifoldebau gweithredol yr heddlu o dan fygythiad? Maent yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd ar draws ffiniau yn awr; maent yn mynd ymhellach na ffiniau swydd Gaer hyd yn oed yng ngogledd Cymru. Felly, sut y gallwch ddweud y bydd hynny'n cael ei beryglu a ninnau wedi cael sicrwydd y bydd trefniadau gweithredol yr heddlu'n parhau a hynny er lles pobl gogledd Cymru?

**Mark Isherwood:** Gallaf ddweud hynny am ein bod yn sôn am strwythur rheoli rhanbarthol newydd sy'n diystyru hanes, daearyddiaeth a chysylltiadau trafniadaeth Cymru'n llwyr yn ogystal â'r realiti gweithredol bod gogledd Cymru, yn hyn o beth, wedi torri ei gwys ei hun ers degawdau, os nad canrifoedd, o ran delio â'r bygythiad o derfysgaeth, o'r gorllewin a'r dwyrain, a'r lefel uchel o droseddu a chyffuriau sy'n dod o'r gorllewin a'r dwyrain, a thrwy

both directions when there have been major incidences of public disorder and major terrorist incidences. As Nick said, we risk breaking something that is not broken. The Home Secretary expects this to somehow improve matters when he has not produced any detailed evidence or consultation to support it.

The Chair of the Police Federation of England and Wales states that we cannot isolate ourselves and not share intelligence and operations, whether or not we are linked by a common badge in south Wales. With reference to local accountability, he stated that we have structures and partnerships in place that should be built on and not swept aside. The Gwent branch has stated that the strength of policing in Wales is in the communities. The chief constable of Dyfed-Powys Police voiced concern that there was so little time for consultation when such big changes were being considered. The chief constable of South Wales Police told south Wales Members of Parliament that the expected cost of reorganisation was £10 million, with the final bill likely to be more as the reserve funds of forces' budgets would also be required to fund the policy. The police authorities stated that the additional all-Wales annual cost of reorganisation would, as we heard, be up to £57 million, with the chief constable saying that it would be even more.

Additional set-up costs and the fact that any savings could take up to 10 years to materialise blow a hole in the Home Secretary's uncosted claim that savings will be achieved in the first year. The impact on police precepts and council tax cannot be ignored, and we need time to explore claims, such as that made by North Wales Police Authority that a budget increase of just £3 million would allow it to meet the service levels demanded by the Home Secretary.

Unison has told us that the proposed restructuring could lead to the loss of 1,000 non-police staff jobs. When I questioned it on this, it confirmed that uniformed officers are still carrying out paperwork that would be

gydweithredu gyda heddluoedd ar draws y ffin i'r ddau gyfeiriad pan fu achosion mawr o anhrefn gyhoeddus ac achosion o derfysgaeth ddifrifol. Fel y dywedodd Nick, mae perygl inni chwalu rhywbeth sy'n gyfan ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn disgwyl y bydd hyn yn gwella pethau rywsut er nad yw wedi dangos dim tystiolaeth fanwl nac ymgynghoriad i gefnogi hynny.

Dywed Cadeirydd Ffederasiwn Heddlu Lloegr a Chymru na allwn ynysu ein hunain a pheidio â rhannu gwybodaeth a gweithrediadau, ni waeth a ydym wedi'n cysylltu drwy fathodyn cyffredin yn ne Cymru ai peidio. Gan gyfeirio at atebolrwydd lleol, dywedodd fod gennym strwythurau a phartneriaethau ar waith y dylid ychwanegu atynt ac nid eu hysgubo o'r neilltu. Mae cangen Gwent wedi datgan mai cryfder plismona yng Nghymru yw'r cymunedau. Mae prif gwnstabl Dyfed-Powys wedi mynegi pryder bod cyn lleied o amser ar gael i ymgynghori pan fo newidiadau mor fawr yn cael eu hystyried. Dywedodd prif gwnstabl Heddlu De Cymru wrth Aelodau Seneddol y de y disgwylid i gost yr ad-drefnu fod yn £10 miliwn, gyda'r gost derfynol yn debygol o fod yn fwy gan y byddai'n rhaid gwario cronfeydd wrth gefn cyllidebau'r heddluoedd i ariannu'r polisi. Dywedodd yr awdurdodau heddlu y byddai cost ychwanegol yr ad-drefnu i Gymru gyfan, fel y clywsom, yn gymaint â £57 miliwn, gyda'r prif gwnstabl yn dweud y byddai'n fwy byth.

Mae costau sefydlu ychwanegol a'r ffaith y gallai unrhyw arbedion gymryd hyd at 10 mlynedd i gael eu gwireddu yn dryllio honiad yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, sydd heb ei gostio, y ceir arbedion yn y flwyddyn gyntaf. Ni ellir anwybyddu'r effaith ar braeseptau'r heddlu a'r dreth gyngor, ac mae arnom angen amser i ymchwilio i honiadau, megis hwnnw a wneir gan Awdurdod Heddlu'r Gogledd, y byddai cynnydd o ddim ond £3 miliwn yn y gyllideb yn caniatáu iddo gyflawni'r lefelau gwasanaeth a fyynnir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Mae Unsain wedi dweud wrthym y gallai'r ailstrwythuro arfaethedig arwain at golli 1,000 o swyddi staff nad ydynt yn heddlu. Pan holais yr undeb ynglŷn â hyn, cadarnhaodd fod swyddogion mewn lifrai'n

better carried out by their members. We must therefore remove the perverse incentive that keeps police officers in back rooms rather than on our streets. This reinforces the argument made by the Police Federation for a royal commission into policing to be set up, to include an independent evaluation of the role of community safety officers. Our chief constables were already discussing proposals for shared corporate services that do not need to be centralised at one location, but which recognise that operational integration has never, and can never, truly exist within an all-Wales context.

Effective co-operation between North Wales Police and bodies such as the North Wales Fire and Rescue Service already exists, and makes a mockery of the claim that only devolution will facilitate this. Claims that efficiency can only be achieved within regional boundaries are further undermined by the fact that the judicial system, for example, operates on a Wales and Chester circuit, and that, in a different context, the current secondary healthcare review in north Wales includes the Countess of Chester Hospital. That is operational reality.

Before concluding, I must question whether all Welsh forces perform to a higher standard than their English counterparts, as some claim. Home Office figures for July 2005 show that overall recorded crime across England and Wales is still 9 per cent higher than it was prior to devolution. In Wales—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I allowed you an extra 30 seconds on account of an intervention, so your five-minute time limit is now past. Thank you.

**John Griffiths:** These are important matters, and I would welcome a greater opportunity for communities, partners and stakeholders to engage in the debate in a meaningful way, and for there to be what might best be described as ‘full democratic involvement’. Although we can all appreciate that there are

dal i wneud gwaith papur y byddai'n well pe câi ei wneud gan eu haelodau hwy. Rhaid inni felly ddileu'r cymhelliad gwrthnysig sy'n cadw swyddogion heddlu mewn ystafelloedd cefn yn hytrach nag ar ein strydoedd. Mae hyn yn atgyfnerthu'r ddadl a wnaethpwyd gan Ffederasiwn yr Heddlu dros sefydlu comisiwn brenhinol i ymchwilio i ddulliau plismona, a fyddai'n cynnwys gwerthusiad annibynnol o rôl swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol. Yr oedd ein prif gwnstabiliaid eisoes yn trafod cynigion ar gyfer rhannu gwasanaethau corfforaethol nad oes angen eu canoli mewn un lleoliad, ond gan gydnabod nad yw integreiddio gweithredol erioed wedi bodoli mewn gwirionedd, ac na all fyth wneud hynny, yng nghyd-destun Cymru gyfan.

Mae cydweithredu effeithiol rhwng Heddlu'r Gogledd a chyrff megis Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru eisoes yn bodoli, ac yn bychanu'r honiad mai dim ond datganoli a all hwyluso hyn. Tanseilir ymhellach yr honiadau mai dim ond o fewn ffiniau rhanbarthol y gellir sicrhau effeithlonrwydd gan y ffaith bod y system farnwrol, er enghraifft, yn gweithredu ar gylchdro Cymru a Chaer, ac, mewn cyd-destun gwahanol, fod yr adolygiad o ofal iechyd eilaidd yng ngogledd Cymru ar hyn o bryd yn cynnwys Ysbyty Iarlls Caer. Dyna'r realiti gweithredol.

Cyn cloi, rhaid imi gwestiynu a yw pob heddlu yng Nghymru'n perfformio yn ôl safon uwch na'u cymheiriaid yn Lloegr, fel yr honna rhai. Dengys ffigurau'r Swyddfa Gartref ar gyfer mis Gorffennaf 2005 fod cyfanswm y troseddau a gofnodir ar draws Cymru a Lloegr yn dal i fod 9 y cant yn uwch nag a oedd cyn datganoli. Yng Nghymru—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Caniateais 30 eiliad ychwanegol i chi oherwydd ymyriad, felly mae eich terfyn o bum munud bellach wedi mynd heibio. Diolch.

**John Griffiths:** Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig, a byddwn yn croesawu mwy o gyfle i gymunedau, partneriaid a rhanddeiliaid gymryd rhan yn y ddadl mewn modd ystyrllon, ac inni gael yr hyn y gellid dweud mai'r disgrifiad gorau ohono yw 'ymwneud democrataidd llawn'. Er y gallwn i gyd

imperatives in terms of taking matters forward quickly to have the right structure to deal with terrorism and organised crime, it is also important to get it right. For that to happen, a much wider engagement and consultation is necessary, particularly with the communities in Wales that will be affected.

We know that, although people are not particularly exercised about structures, they are very exercised about delivery. There is a danger in any reorganisation that the eye will be taken off the ball concerning important issues, such as the community policing approach, as people worry about new buildings, top jobs and inevitable transitional difficulties. There are also issues around cost. I know that there are concerns that police reserves would have to be used to take this restructuring forward, and that costs will be involved in improving protective services, which might endanger funding for the local community policing approach that has been so successful in areas such as Gwent, and is much valued by local communities.

I wish to reinforce what I feel is the concern on the ground in areas such as Gwent, where local community policing is valued and where neighbourhood teams have gone forward on an effective basis. That is policing through co-operation and consent, by police engaging with local communities, which produces the important and vital intelligence that allows effective policing.

Whatever the outcome of this exercise, that concentration on a local neighbourhood approach must be safeguarded. In that context, the local democracy and accountability that we have is also important. It is about local decision-making informed by local representatives, with police authorities acting as a bridge between the police and local communities.

In conclusion, I hope that, whatever the outcome, it will allow that community policing approach and local accountability to continue, so that we have a people's police force that is valued and supported by our communities. That must be safeguarded in

sylweddoli bod rhai materion angenrheidiol o ran symud pethau ymlaen yn gyflym er mwyn cael y strwythur iawn i ddelio â therfysgaeth a gangiau troseddwyd, mae'n bwysig ei wneud yn iawn hefyd. Er mwyn i hynny ddigwydd, mae angen ymgysylltu ac ymgynghori'n llawer ehangach, yn enwedig gyda'r cymunedau yng Nghymru yr effeithir arnynt.

Gwyddom, er nad yw pobl yn poeni'n arbennig am strwythurau, eu bod yn poeni'n fawr am y gwasanaeth a ddarperir. Mewn unrhyw ad-drefnu mae perygl inni golli golwg ar y materion pwysig, megis plismona cymunedol, wrth i bobl boeni am adeiladau newydd, uchel swyddi a'r trafferthion anochel wrth newid drosodd. Ceir cwestiynau ynglŷn â'r gost hefyd. Gwn fod pryderon y byddai'n rhaid defnyddio cronfeydd wrth gefn yr heddlu i fwrw ymlaen â'r ailstrwythuro hwn, ac y bydd costau ynghlwm wrth wella gwasanaethau diogelu, a allai beryglu'r cyllid ar gyfer plismona cymunedol lleol sydd wedi bod mor llwyddiannus mewn ardaloedd fel Gwent, ac a werthfawrogir gymaint gan gymunedau lleol.

Hoffwn ategu'r pryder a welaf ar lawr gwlad mewn ardaloedd fel Gwent, lle y gwerthfawrogir plismona cymunedol lleol a lle y mae timau cymdogaeth wedi symud ymlaen ar sail effeithiol. Dyna blismona drwy gydweithrediad a chydysniad, wrth i'r heddlu ymwneud â chymunedau lleol, sy'n rhoi'r wybodaeth bwysig a hanfodol sy'n caniatáu plismona effeithiol.

Beth bynnag fo canlyniad yr ymarferiad hwn, rhaid dal i ganolbwyntio ar weithredu drwy'r gymdogaeth leol. Yn y cyd-destun hwnnw, mae'r ddemocratiaeth a'r atebolrwydd lleol sydd gennym yn bwysig hefyd. Mae'n golygu gwneud penderfyniadau ar sail gwybodaeth gan gynrychiolwyr lleol, gydag awdurdodau heddlu'n gweithredu fel pont rhwng yr heddlu a chymunedau lleol.

I gloi, gobeithiaf, beth bynnag fo'r canlyniad, y bydd yn caniatáu i'r plismona cymunedol hwnnw a'r atebolrwydd lleol hwnnw barhau, fel bod gennym heddlu i'r bobl a werthfawrogir ac a gefnogir gan ein cymunedau. Rhaid diogelu hynny ym mha

whatever structure emerges.

strwythur bynnag a gawn.

5.20 p.m.

**William Graham:** Members will acknowledge that Welsh police forces are consistently at the top of league tables indicating the levels of detecting, reducing, fighting and solving crime. They have also demonstrated the resolve to maximise the efficient use of resources with an all-Wales resilience forum, which deals with potential emergencies and disasters. That is in addition to an all-Wales collaboration board, which is already taking forward a list of options to work together on a range of issues that will provide greater resilience, cost benefits and savings. The Home Secretary suggested five options for review of which, to the majority of people with whom I have spoken, only collaboration and lead regional forces seem to be effective.

**William Graham:** Bydd yr Aelodau'n cydnabod bod heddluoedd Cymru yn gyson ar ben y tablau sy'n dangos lefelau canfod, lleihau, ymladd a datrys troseddau. Maent hefyd wedi dangos penderfyniad i wneud y defnydd mwyaf effeithlon posibl o adnoddau gyda fforwm Cymru gydnerth, sy'n delio ag argyfyngau a thrychinebau posibl. Mae hynny yn ychwanegol at fwrdd cydweithredu i Gymru gyfan, sydd eisoes yn edrych ar restr o opsiynau ar gyfer cydweithio ar amrediad o faterion a fydd yn rhoi mwy o nerth, manteision o ran costau ac arbedion. Awgrymodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref bum dewis ar gyfer yr adolygiad, ac o'r rhain, i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl yr wyf fi wedi siarad â hwy, dim ond cydweithredu a chael heddluoedd rhanbarthol arweiniol sydd yn ymddangos yn effeithiol.

We know that police regulations are nationally agreed and, if managed correctly, are not inflexible regulatory barriers to effective management. It is vital to police officers that the protection currently afforded to them under regulation 21, not to be posted outside of their current force area upon amalgamation, is retained. I ask the Minister to comment on that. The professional consideration of each option to see whether it will provide an acceptable standard of delivery for all protective services is also necessary.

Gwyddom fod cytuno ar reoliadau'r heddlu'n digwydd yn genedlaethol ac, o'u rheoli'n gywir, nad ydynt yn rhwystrau rheoleiddiol anhyblyg i reolaeth effeithiol. Mae'n hanfodol i swyddogion yr heddlu y cedwir y warchodaeth a roddir iddynt ar hyn o bryd dan reoliad 21, sy'n sicrhau na chânt eu hanfon i weithio y tu allan i ardal eu heddlu presennol pan ddigwydd yr uno. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog gyflwyno sylwadau ar hynny. Hefyd mae angen ystyried pob dewis yn broffesiynol i weld a wnaiff roi safon dderbyniol o ddarpariaeth i bob gwasanaeth diogelu.

We might ask what each option would cost, for there is no such thing as a cost-free option. There is an unavoidable future cost commitment in terms of filling a protective services gap, along with the cost of neighbourhood policing, which includes community support officers and for which proper assessment is yet to be agreed. Will there be offsetting savings in terms of modernisation and efficiencies and is there a net additional investment requirement under each option?

Gallem ofyn beth fyddai cost pob dewis, oherwydd nid oes y fath beth â dewis di-gost. Mae ymrwymiad anochel ynglŷn â chost i'r dyfodol o ran llenwi bwlch mewn gwasanaethau diogelu, ynghyd â chost plismona cymdogaeth, sy'n cynnwys swyddogion cymorth cymunedol ac nad oes asesiad priodol wedi'i gytuno ar ei gyfer eto. A fydd arbedion i'w gosod yn erbyn hyn yn nhermau moderneiddio ac effeithlonrwydd, ac a oes gofyniad buddsoddi ychwanegol net dan bob dewis?

I emphasise that there appears to be no new money. Gwent Police has around £38 million in reserve, but only £5 million of that is

Pwysleisias ei bod yn ymddangos nad oes dim arian newydd. Mae gan Heddlu Gwent ryw £38 miliwn wrth gefn, ond dim ond £5



unallocated. All of those moneys have a specific purpose and are not available to subsidise Home Office reorganisation. I mention in passing that the Soham inquiry cost £8.6 million, of which only £2.6 million was paid by the Home Office. Cambridge police had to provide £6 million of that total.

We remain concerned about the time period set out by central Government. The consultation and delivery of proposals fails to take cognisance of the magnitude and expense of the project and we strongly urge the setting up of a royal commission, as has been proposed.

We must consider the totality of policing in Wales, by recognising the widest requirements of local accountability, cross-border co-operation, public confidence and perhaps the re-establishment of regional crime squads. Neighbourhood policing is a recognised foundation of our success in Wales. We have local structures and partnerships in place to deliver a service that needs to be enhanced and further developed.

On the design criteria for 'force restructuring', which include 'criminal markets', to what extent do the proposals take cognisance of the underlying criminal markets and patterns of cross-border criminality? We are all aware of the level of crime committed in Wales by people residing in the Merseyside, Manchester and Bristol areas. Accountability is yet to be taken properly into account. I ask Members to support our motion today.

**The Presiding Officer:** Thank you for your timing, William.

**Gwenda Thomas:** I will concentrate my remarks on the implications for child protection and safeguarding services in a restructured Welsh police force. I was concerned to learn that there has been little or no consultation, either at Westminster or here in Cardiff bay, on the effect that a restructure would have on child protection. I have shared these concerns with the First Minister, the Minister for children and the Minister for

miliwn o hynny sydd heb ei glustnodi. Mae pwrpas penodol i'r arian hwnnw i gyd ac nid yw ar gael i noddi ad-drefniad y Swyddfa Gartref. Soniaf wrth fynd heibio fod ymchwiliad Soham wedi costio £8.6 miliwn, ac mai dim ond £2.6 o hynny a dalwyd gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Bu'n rhaid i Heddlu Caergrawnt roi £6 miliwn o'r cyfanswm hwnnw.

Yr ydym yn parhau'n bryderus am y cyfnod a bennir gan y Llywodraeth ganolog. Nid yw'r ymgynghori a gweithredu'r cynigion yn ystyried maint a chost y prosiect ac anogwn yn gryf y dylid sefydlu comisiwn brenhinol, fel sydd wedi'i gynnig.

Rhaid inni ystyried plismona yng Nghymru yn ei gyfanrwydd, drwy gydnabod y gofynion ehangaf o ran atebolrwydd lleol, cydweithredu trawsffiniol, hyder y cyhoedd ac efallai ailsefydlu sgwadiau troseddau rhanbarthol. Mae plismona cymdogaeth yn sylfaen gydnabyddedig i'n llwyddiant yng Nghymru. Mae gennym strwythurau a phartneriaethau lleol i ddarparu gwasanaeth y mae angen ei wella a'i ddatblygu ymhellach.

O ran meini prawf cynllunio ar gyfer 'ailstrwythuro'r heddlu', sy'n cynnwys 'marchnadoedd troseddol', i ba raddau y mae'r cynigion yn ystyried y marchnadoedd troseddol gwaelodol a phatrymau troseddu trawsffiniol? Yr ydym i gyd yn ymwybodol o lefel y troseddau a gyflawnir yng Nghymru gan bobl sydd yn byw yn ardaloedd Glannau Mersi, Manceinion a Bryste. Nid yw atebolrwydd wedi'i ystyried yn iawn eto. Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau gefnogi ein gwelliant heddiw.

**Y Llywydd:** Diolch am eich amseru, William.

**Gwenda Thomas:** Canolbwyntiaf fy sylwadau ar y goblygiadau ar gyfer amddiffyn plant a diogelu gwasanaethau mewn heddlu Cymreig wedi'i ailstrwythuro. Yr oeddwn yn bryderus o glywed na fu dim neu fawr ddim ymgynghori, yn San Steffan nac yma ym mae Caerdydd, am yr effaith a gâi ad-drefnu ar amddiffyn plant. Yr wyf wedi rhannu'r pryderon hyn gyda'r Prif Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros blant a'r

Social Justice and Regeneration. Edwina Hart has forwarded my concerns to the Home Secretary.

Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Mae Edwina Hart wedi anfon fy mhryderon ymlaen at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Such a perspective is particularly important when we consider that a vulnerable child may be placed at extra risk owing to some incompatible policies between the four current forces. I have been aware of such difficulties, as I live in the vicinity of the boundary between South Wales Police and Dyfed-Powys Police. That has been particularly worrying with regard to policies that deal with convicted paedophiles. One benefit of having an all-Wales police force is that such inconsistent policies would no longer be an issue. Another example would be that an all-Wales force would ease the sharing of information on a Wales-wide basis.

Mae persbectif o'r fath yn arbennig o bwysig pan ystyriwn y gall plentyn bregus gael ei roi mewn perygl ychwanegol oherwydd rhyw bolisiau anghydnaws rhwng y pedwar heddlu cyfredol. Yr wyf wedi bod yn ymwybodol o anawsterau o'r fath, gan fy mod yn byw yng nghyffiniau'r ffin rhwng Heddlu De Cymru a Heddlu Dyfed-Powys. Mae hynny wedi peri pryder arbennig yng nghyswllt polisïau sy'n delio â phedoffiliaid a gafwyd yn euog. Un fantais o gael heddlu i Gymru gyfan yw na fyddai polisïau anghyson o'r fath yn broblem mwyach. Enghraifft arall yw y byddai heddlu i Gymru gyfan yn hwyluso rhannu gwybodaeth ar sail Cymru gyfan.

I am also concerned that children who find themselves within the system have often been lost because of inadequate cross-boundary co-operation between police forces and social services. The most obvious and recent example of inconsistency that will come into most people's minds will be the events surrounding the Soham murders. That terrible tragedy clearly demonstrated the importance of being able to share information quickly and being committed to consistent and compatible working practices.

Yr wyf yn bryderus hefyd fod plant sy'n eu cael eu hunain o fewn y system yn aml wedi cael eu colli oherwydd cydweithredu trawsffiniol annigonol rhwng heddluoedd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol. Yr enghraifft amlycaf a mwyaf diweddar o anghysonder a fydd dan sylw gan y rhan fwyaf o bobl fydd y digwyddiadau'n gysylltiedig â llofruddiaethau Soham. Dangosodd y drasiedi enbyd honno yn glir mor bwysig yw gallu rhannu gwybodaeth yn gyflym a bod wedi ymrwymo i arferion gwaith cyson a chydawns.

A number of general and thematic inspections carried out by HM Inspectorate of Constabularies in England in 2002 covered child protection and safeguarding. These inspections found that, although priority was theoretically given to safeguarding, that was not reflected coherently or consistently in service planning or resource allocation. Variable practices were found with regard to child protection within different police force areas. There were some examples of excellent practices, but child protection units did not have consistent remits and status within the different forces. In one example, ill-informed officers described child protection as 'a job for the girls'. As such inconsistencies and attitudes may well be found in some Welsh forces, it is, in my opinion, exceedingly important that a child's

Ymdriniodd nifer o arolygon cyffredinol a thematig a wnaethpwyd gan Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi yn Lloegr yn 2002 â diogelu ac amddiffyn plant. Canfu'r arolygon hyn, er y rhoddid blaenoriaeth i ddiogelu mewn egwyddor, nad oedd hynny wedi'i adlewyrchu'n gydlynol nac yn gyson yn y modd y cynllunid gwasanaethau neu y dyrennid adnoddau. Gwelwyd arferion amrywiol yng nghyswllt amddiffyn plant o fewn gwahanol ardaloedd heddlu. Yr oedd rhai enghreifftiau o arferion rhagorol, ond nid oedd gan unedau amddiffyn plant gylchoedd gwaith cyson a statws cyson o fewn y gwahanol heddluoedd. Mewn un enghraifft, disgrifiodd swyddogion annoeth waith amddiffyn plant fel 'gwaith i'r merched'. Gan ei bod yn eithaf posibl bod anghysonderau ac agweddau o'r fath yn

perspective is given serious consideration during this debate. Child protection and safeguarding is paramount.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn anfodlon iawn gyda'r broses ymgynghori sydd wedi digwydd, ac yr wyf yn frwd dros weld y pwerau hyn yn cael eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad. Yn ddelfrydol, byddai'r penderfyniad wedi cael ei wneud yma. Gan ein bod yn wynebu'r sefyllfa hon, rhaid i'r Cynulliad wneud rhai pethau'n glir i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Yr ydym am ddiogelu safon y gwasanaeth heddlu sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd, yn enwedig o ran gofal cymunedol. Yr ydym am ddiogelu nifer y swyddogion sy'n gwasanaethu o fewn yr heddlu, a'r staff wrth gefn. Yr ydym am barhau i sicrhau atebolrwydd lleol yr heddlu, hyd yn oed os mai un heddlu yn unig fydd i Gymru gyfan. Yr ydym am sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn cael y cyfle i fod yn rhan o'r broses hon ac yn rhan o'r bwrdd neu'r awdurdod fydd yn rheoli'r heddlu. Yn olaf, yr ydym am sicrhau bod costau unrhyw ad-drefnu yn cael eu cwrdd ag arian ychwanegol, ac nid o gyllideb yr heddlu yng Nghymru.

Credaf fod angen ei gwneud yn glir i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref mai'r lleiaf yr ydym yn ei ddisgwyl o'r ad-drefnu hwn yw bod safon y gwasanaeth yn cael ei diogelu. Disgwyliwn hefyd y dylai unrhyw newid ddod â gwelliant. Yr wyf yn hyderus y bydd y Gweinidog yn gweithredu ar hyn ac yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad ardderchog a baratowyd ar y materion hyn gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio.

**Carl Sargeant:** This is an odd debate, because some people say that they have the facts and figures about how much it will cost, and some people, such as Leanne, have said that they do not know exactly how much it will cost. This should be about the delivery of police services to the constituents that we all represent. I am not sure about amendment 5, as it claims that the Government has failed to formally consult the National Assembly, but this is a devolved matter, and we were consulted on it. [*Interruption.*] I am sorry. I

bresennol mewn rhai heddluoedd yng Nghymru, yn fy marn i mae'n eithriadol o bwysig bod sylw difrifol yn cael ei roi i bersbectif plentyn yn ystod y ddadl hon. Mae diogelu ac amddiffyn plant yn hollbwysig.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am extremely displeased with the consultation process that has taken place, and I am keen to see these powers being devolved to the Assembly. Ideally, the decision would have been made here. Given that we are now faced with this situation, there are certain things that the Assembly must make clear to the Home Secretary.

We want to safeguard the standard of policing that we have at present, especially in terms of community policing. We want to safeguard the number of officers serving in the police forces, and the number of back-office staff. We want to continue to ensure the local accountability of the police, even if there is only one police force for Wales. We want to ensure that local authorities have the opportunity to be a part of this process and that they are a part of the board or authority that will manage the police. Finally, we want to ensure that the costs of any restructuring are met from additional funds, and not from the budgets of the police in Wales.

It must be made clear to the Home Secretary that the least that we expect from this restructuring is that the current standard of the service is safeguarded. We also would expect any change to bring about improvements. I am confident that the Minister will act on this and will commend the excellent report prepared on these matters by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee.

**Carl Sargeant:** Dadl od yw hon, oherwydd y mae rhai pobl yn dweud bod y ffeithiau a'r ffigurau ganddynt ynghylch beth fydd cost hyn, ac mae rhai pobl, fel Leanne, wedi dweud nad ydynt yn gwybod faint yn union fydd y gost. Dylai fod a wnelo hyn â darparu gwasanaethau'r heddlu i'r etholwyr yr ydym i gyd yn eu cynrychioli. Nid wyf yn siŵr am welliant 5, gan ei fod yn honni bod y Llywodraeth heb ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, ond mater datganoledig yw hwn, ac fe ymgynghorwyd â

meant that this is not a devolved matter. I should be quite clear. However, the Assembly was consulted through the appropriate committee, which produced a very good report for the Home Secretary.

You will recall, Minister, that I came to see you—as a Labour Party Assembly Member for north Wales—about this matter, along with my colleagues who represent north Wales. We had some key points to raise about the delivery of service. North Wales Police is one of the best forces in Wales, and we would not want to lose that identity or the level of service delivered to the constituents that we represent.

Finally, I would like an answer to one question. Mark Isherwood mentioned that we had organisational working with Cheshire police force, and rightly so. Nothing has changed with the fire service, either, which currently works very well, operationally, with Merseyside and Cheshire. However, regarding the implication that North Wales Police should work automatically with Cheshire and be joined with it in future, have there been any negotiations between North Wales Police and Cheshire? I do not believe that there has yet been a discussion about developing relationships for the future.

5.30 p.m.

**Michael German:** I want to take the debate a bit further. I welcome the Minister's comments that this is not how she would have wanted to have gone about things, particularly with regard to the short time and the way in which the consultation has taken place. I also support what John Griffiths said about community policing. However, he must remember—and this is crucial to the whole debate—that centralisation often means that the resources that are outside the centre and in communities get sucked in towards the centre. I hope that this issue will be dealt with further.

My principal point is on funding, and I am sure that the Minister will want to comment

ni yn ei gylch. [*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Nid mater datganoledig yw hwn, yw'r hyn yr oeddwn yn ceisio'i ddweud. Dylwn fod yn gwbl eglur. Fodd bynnag, ymgynghorwyd â'r Cynulliad drwy'r pwyllgor priodol, a luniodd adroddiad da iawn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Fe gofiwch, Weinidog, imi ddod i'ch gweld—fel Aelod Cynulliad o'r Blaid Lafur dros ogledd Cymru—ynglŷn â'r mater hwn, gyda'm cyd-Aelodau sydd yn cynrychioli'r gogledd. Yr oedd gennym rai pwyntiau allweddol i'w codi ynghylch y modd y darperir y gwasanaeth. Mae Heddlu'r Gogledd yn un o'r heddluoedd gorau yng Nghymru, ac ni fyddem yn dymuno colli'r hunaniaeth honno na lefel y gwasanaeth a roddir i'r etholwyr a gynrychiolwn.

Yn olaf, hoffwn gael ateb i un cwestiwn. Soniodd Mark Isherwood fod gennym gydweithio cyfundrefnol gyda heddlu swydd Gaer, a gwir hynny. Nid oes dim wedi newid gyda'r gwasanaeth tân, ychwaith, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn gweithio'n dda iawn, yn weithredol, gyda glannau Mersi a swydd Gaer. Fodd bynnag, ynglŷn â'r awgrym y dylai Heddlu'r Gogledd weithio'n awtomatig gyda swydd Gaer a chael ei uno â hwy yn y dyfodol, a fu unrhyw drafodaethau rhwng Heddlu'r Gogledd a swydd Gaer? Nid wyf yn credu bod dim trafodaeth wedi bod eto ynglŷn â datblygu perthynas ar gyfer y dyfodol.

**Michael German:** Hoffwn fynd â'r ddadl ychydig ymhellach. Croesawaf sylwadau'r Gweinidog nad fel hyn y byddai wedi dymuno mynd o'i chwmpas hi, yn enwedig o ran yr amser byr a gafwyd ar gyfer yr ymgynghori a'r modd y mae wedi digwydd. Yr wyf hefyd yn cefnogi'r hyn a ddywedodd John Griffiths am blismona cymunedol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid iddo gofio—ac mae hyn yn hanfodol i'r holl ddadl—fod canoli'n aml yn golygu bod yr adnoddau sydd y tu allan i'r canol ac mewn cymunedau'n cael eu sugno i mewn tua'r canol. Yr wyf yn gobeithio yr ymdrinnir â hyn ymhellach.

Â chyllid y mae a wnelo fy mhrif bwynt, ac yr wyf yn sicr y bydd y Gweinidog yn

on this when she responds. I find it strange that the body that, through its agencies and the local authorities, seeks to provide about half of the funding for the police services in Wales, has to accept a structure without knowing where the costs will fall at the end. From letters that Members have received from chief constables and police authorities, and from the evidence given to the committee, we know that there is grave disquiet among our police authorities about the funding and the costs that will fall upon council tax payers and us in the National Assembly should the proposals be driven through by the Home Secretary.

We know that the figures are in the region of £47 million to £57 million a year, from police authority estimates. That will span perhaps two years, perhaps more. What we do not yet know is where that money will come from. We do not yet know whether it will fall upon our budgets or on council tax payers. Will we see an increased council tax pay element in the whole resourcing issue?

Members will know that, if police authorities have to trim their budgets because they cannot put more of a precept on for council tax or increase the element that comes from the National Assembly and have to meet those demands, they cannot trim from front-line policing. They will have to do it from back-office staff. In reality, that means that police officers will be taken from front-line duties and put behind counters in police stations to do jobs that are currently done by civilians. That is another element that will drive us to obtain an answer to the questions of who pays, and where the money comes from.

We have been offered a sham consultation by Charles Clarke. It is a sham because, halfway through, he told us that he would accept only one option. For those reasons, we should reject change at this stage. We should reject

dymuno rhoi ei sylwadau am hyn wrth ymateb. Fe'i caf yn rhyfedd bod y corff sydd, drwy ei asiantaethau a'r awdurdodau lleol, yn ceisio darparu tua hanner yr arian ar gyfer gwasanaethau'r heddlu yng Nghymru, yn gorfod derbyn strwythur heb wybod pwy fydd yn ysgwyddo'r costau yn y pen draw. Yn ôl y llythyrau y mae Aelodau wedi eu cael oddi wrth brif gwnstabiliaid ac awdurdodau'r heddlu, ac yn ôl y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor, gwyddom fod anfodlonrwydd difrifol ymhlith awdurdodau'r heddlu a'n heddluoedd ynghylch y cyllid a'r costau y bydd rhaid i'n trethdalwyr a ninnau yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol eu hysgwyddo os bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn bwrw ymlaen â'r cynigion hyn.

Gwyddom, ar sail amcangyfrifon awdurdodau'r heddlu, fod y ffigurau tua £47 miliwn i £57 miliwn y flwyddyn. Bydd hynny'n rhychwantu dwy flynedd efallai neu fwy na hynny, o bosibl. Yr hyn nad ydym yn ei wybod eto yw o ba le y daw'r arian hwnnw. Ni wyddom eto ai o'n cyllidebau ni y daw ynteu gan y rhai sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor. A welwn gynnydd yn yr hyn a delir drwy'r dreth gyngor yng nghyswllt holl fater yr adnoddau?

Gŵyr yr Aelodau, os bydd rhaid i awdurdodau'r heddlu docio'u cyllidebau oherwydd nad oes modd iddynt ychwanegu mwy o braesept ar gyfer y dreth gyngor na chynyddu'r elfen a ddaw gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a bod rhaid iddynt fodloni'r gofynion hynny, na allant docio heddlu'r rheng flaen. Bydd rhaid iddynt wneud hynny drwy docio'r staff yn y swyddfa gefn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae hynny'n golygu y bydd swyddogion yr heddlu'n cael eu tynnu oddi ar eu dyletswyddau yn y rheng flaen a'u rhoi y tu ôl i gownteri gorsafoedd yr heddlu i wneud swyddi sy'n cael eu gwneud gan swyddogion sifil ar hyn o bryd. Dyna elfen arall a fydd yn peri inni fynnu ateb i'r cwestiynau ynghylch pwy sy'n talu, ac o ble y daw'r arian.

Cynigiwyd ffug ymgynghori inni gan Charles Clarke. Mae'n broses ffug oherwydd, hanner ffordd drwyddi, dywedodd wrthym mai dim ond un dewis y byddai'n barod i'w dderbyn. Am y rhesymau hynny, dylem wrthod newid

change for the reasons that are clear to us all: we do not have the answers to those complex problems. The motion, the recognition of that process, and the amendments will ensure that we send a powerful message to Charles Clarke today.

**Nick Bourne:** I am grateful for the opportunity to make a contribution to this important debate. Three things are very clear: the first is that we should have been formally consulted, as the National Assembly. I think that the Minister probably agrees with that point. The Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee also probably agrees with that point. We should have been consulted. It is entirely true that policing is not a devolved matter, but as Mike German correctly said, it may be that we are picking up the tab for some or all of the cost of the reorganisation when it goes through, as I have no doubt that it will. Based on estimates brought forward by the police authorities, that cost could be up to £60 million.

The chief constables are giving evidence to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee on the issue today. They cannot necessarily speak out as strongly as they would like, but former chief constable, Ray White, of Dyfed-Powys Police, which is an excellent force in my area, has spoken out. He thinks that we are being bounced into changes and that the proposals risk the politicisation of the police, with super police chiefs being reliant on the Government for appointment and resources. That is to be regretted.

The whole consultation has been rushed. We have not been given nearly enough time, as a nation, to consider the changes that are being proposed by Charles Clarke and Peter Hain. It is an outrage that this consultation is a sham. We are halfway through the process and the Home Secretary has said what he wants the result to be. That is not a proper consultation. There are real concerns about job losses, quite apart from the cost of the reorganisation, which we will have to meet here.

The case for change has not been made. I

ar hyn o bryd. Dylem wrthod newid am y rhesymau sy'n glir i bob un ohonom: nid yw'r atebion gennym i'r problemau cymhleth hynny. Bydd y cynnig, cydnabod y broses honno a'r gwelliannau'n sicrhau ein bod yn anfon neges bwerus at Charles Clarke heddiw.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon. Mae tri pheth yn glir iawn: y cyntaf yw y dylai fod wedi ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â ni, y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Credaf fod y Gweinidog, mae'n debyg, yn cytuno â'r pwynt hwnnw. Mae Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio hefyd, mae'n debyg, yn cytuno â'r pwynt hwnnw. Dylent fod wedi ymgynghori â ni. Mae'n hollol wir nad yw plismona'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, ond fel y dywedodd Mike German, a hynny'n gwbl gywir, mae'n bosibl y byddwn yn cael y bil am ryw faint o gost yr ad-drefnu, neu'r cyfan ohoni pan ddigwydd hynny, ac nid oes gennyf amheuaeth na fydd yn digwydd. Ar sail yr amcangyfrifon a gyflwynwyd gan awdurdodau'r heddlu, gallai'r gost fod yn gymaint â £60 miliwn.

Mae'r prif gwnstabiliaid yn rhoi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig am hyn heddiw. Ni allant o anghenraid leisio'u barn cyn gryfed ag y byddent yn dymuno gwneud, ond mae'r cyn brif gwnstabl, Ray White, o Heddlu Dyfed-Powys, sy'n llw rhagorol yn fy ardal i, wedi lleisio'i farn. Cred ein bod yn cael ein gwthio i wneud newidiadau a bod perygl i'r cynigion wleidyddoli'r heddlu, gydag archbenaethiaid yr heddlu'n dibynnu ar y Llywodraeth o ran eu penodi ac am eu hadnoddau. Mae hynny'n resyn o beth.

Mae'r ymgynghori drwyddo draw wedi digwydd ar frys. Ni chawsom ddigon o amser o bellffordd, fel cenedl, i ystyried y newidiadau a gynigir gan Charles Clarke a Peter Hain. Mae'n wrthun bod yr ymgynghori hwn yn broses mor ffug. A ninnau hanner ffordd drwy'r broses, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi dweud beth y mae'n dymuno'i weld yn ganlyniad iddi. Mae gwir bryderon am golli swyddi, heb sôn am gost yr ad-drefnu, cost y bydd rhaid i ni yma ei thalu.

Nid yw'r ddadl o blaid newid wedi

listened carefully to what Gwenda said. There may be issues that we need to look at. I accept that, but that is why we need longer for the consultation. Reform at the gallop is almost always messed up and bungled.

That is what I fear here. We have four excellent police forces that have served us well. The case for change has to be made strongly if we are to depart from that. I do not believe that it has been made yet, which is why I think that it is important that amendment 5 is carried today. I will also be voting in favour of the status quo, because I do not think that the case for change has yet been made.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n amlwg ei bod yn fater o gryn bwys a phryder i Gymru fod yr ymgynghoriad, a gychwynnwyd gan Charles Clarke, wedi'i wneud mor gyflym, heb gyfle i roi barn yn iawn.

One thing that made sure that amendment 5 was tabled was, as the leader of the Welsh Conservatives has said, the fact that there are three key issues that the Assembly needs to take into account. By carrying amendment 5, we will strengthen the arm of the Minister in sending a clear message to Charles Clarke that he simply cannot treat the National Assembly with contempt. This is not a devolved matter, but it is an issue in which we have a clear interest because a substantial proportion of the funding of our police forces comes from local authorities in Wales. As the police forces have recognised, which is why they are now in favour of the devolution of the police services, a great deal of the work that they do in terms of community policing and other initiatives is done because of money from the National Assembly. Therefore, we are right to condemn the Home Secretary for failing to consult the National Assembly.

Secondly, the Home Secretary has failed to consider Welsh circumstances. He has failed to recognise that there are concerns about geography, rurality, transport links and all those issues that have not been properly taken into account in the changes that he proposes.

argyhoeddi. Gwrandewais yn ofalus ar yr hyn a ddywedodd Gwenda. Efallai fod materion y dylem edrych arnynt. Derbyniaf hynny, ond dyna pam mae angen mwy o amser arnom ar gyfer yr ymgynghori. Mae diwygio ar garlam bob tro'n ddiwygio blêr a thrwsgl.

Dyna'r ofn sydd gennyf yn y cyswllt hwn. Mae gennym bedwar o heddluoedd rhagorol sydd wedi ein gwasanaethu mor dda. Rhaid i'r ddadl o blaid newid fod yn un gref os ydym am newid hynny. Ni chredaf i hynny ddigwydd eto, a dyna paham y credaf ei bod yn bwysig bod gwelliant 5 yn llwyddo heddiw. Byddaf hefyd yn pleidleisio o blaid y *status quo*, oherwydd ni chredaf fod y ddadl o blaid newid wedi argyhoeddi eto.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** It is clearly an issue of great importance and concern to Wales that the consultation, which was initiated by Charles Clarke, has been done so quickly, without the opportunity to properly voice opinions.

Un peth a sicrhodd fod gwelliant 5 yn cael ei gyflwyno, fel y dywedodd arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru, oedd y ffaith bod tri phrif fater y mae angen i'r Cynulliad eu hystyried. Drwy basio gwelliant 5, byddwn yn rhoi mwy o nerth i'r Gweinidog wrth anfon neges glir at Charles Clarke na all drin y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol gyda dirmyg. Nid yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli, ond mae'n fater y mae gennym ddiddordeb amlwg ynddo oherwydd bod cyfran sylweddol o gyllid ein heddluoedd yn dod gan yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru. Mae'r heddluoedd wedi cydnabod, a dyna pam maent bellach o blaid datganoli gwasanaethau'r heddlu, fod llawer iawn o'r gwaith y maent yn ei wneud o ran plismona cymunedol a chynlluniau eraill yn cael ei wneud yn sgîl arian gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Felly, mae'n iawn inni gondemnio'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref am fethu ag ymgynghori a'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol.

Yn ail, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi methu ag ystyried amgylchiadau Cymru. Mae wedi methu â chydabod bod pryderon ynghylch daearyddiaeth, natur wledig, cysylltiadau trafniadaeth a'r holl faterion hynny sydd heb eu hystyried yn iawn yn y newidiadau a gynigir ganddo

Finally, the real issue for us is, if there is a case for one police force, has the Home Secretary made that case in the short time that he has made available for the consultation? I believe that the overwhelming view of the people of Wales is that he has not. I recognise that there may be different views across the Assembly about the future structures for policing in Wales, but in our view none of those decisions should be made until the National Assembly has had the powers transferred and devolved to it. Then it is for this Assembly, not the Home Secretary, to make the choice.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** I reiterate what I said in my statement. I know that many of you are deeply unhappy about the way in which the whole matter has been handled so far, and feel that decisions have pre-empted proper consultation. We are all agreed that the timescale has been very tight, and has not allowed as much time as we would have liked to conduct a proper consultation. I share your frustration. That is my starting ground in terms of my response to this debate.

To respond to Mick, I am not responsible for the police, as it is not a matter devolved to me. I am responsible for the police in terms of the relationship that I have with them on a whole range of policies. I have been pleased to work with the four excellent police forces in Wales, which are delivering key aspects of community policing, with which we are all pleased, as we are with the way in which they are dealing at a democratic level with politicians and so forth, and the discussions that they have.

**Leanne Wood:** I think that we understand that police services are not currently devolved. However, the committee discussed this issue in the review and a number of committee members accepted that there were strong arguments for the devolution of police services. Would you support those committee members on that?

Yn olaf, y mater sydd o wir ddiddordeb i ni, yw, os oes dadl o blaid cael un heddlu, a yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi llwyddo i'n hargyhoeddi yn y cyfnod byr y mae wedi'i bennu ar gyfer yr ymgynghori? Credaf mai barn ddiymwad pobl Cymru yw nad ydyw wedi gwneud hynny. Yr wyf yn cydnabod y gall fod gwahaniaeth barn ymhlith Aelodau'r Cynulliad ynghylch strwythurau'r heddlu yn y dyfodol yng Nghymru, ond yn ein barn ni, ni ddylid gwneud dim un o'r penderfyniadau hynny nes bod y pwerau wedi cael eu trosglwyddo a'u datganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Yna, mater i'r Cynulliad hwn, nid i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, fydd dewis.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Ailadroddaf yr hyn a ddywedais yn fy natganiad. Gwn fod llawer ohonoch yn hynod anhapus ynghylch y modd yr ymdriniwyd â'r holl fater hyd yn hyn a'ch bod yn teimlo bod penderfyniadau wedi cael eu gwneud cyn ymgynghori'n iawn. Yr ydym oll yn cytuno bod yr amserlen wedi bod yn un dynn iawn ac na chawsom gymaint o amser ag y byddem wedi dymuno'i gael i ymgynghori'n iawn. Rhannaf eich rhwystredigaeth. Yn y fan honno y dechreuaf fy ymateb i'r ddadl hon.

Ac ymateb i Mick, nid wyf yn gyfrifol am yr heddlu, gan nad yw'n fater sydd wedi'i ddatganoli i mi. Yr wyf yn gyfrifol am yr heddlu o ran y berthynas sydd gennyf â hwy yng nghyswllt ystod eang o bolisiau. Bu'n bleser gennyf gydweithio a'r pedwar heddlu rhagorol yng Nghymru, sy'n darparu agweddau allweddol ar blismona cymunedol, darpariaeth yr ydym i gyd yn falch ohoni, yn ogystal â'r modd y maent yn ymdrin â gwleidyddion ac yn y blaen ar lefel ddemocrataidd a'r trafodaethau a gânt.

**Leanne Wood:** Credaf ein bod yn deall nad yw gwasanaethau'r heddlu wedi'u datganoli ar hyn o bryd. Fodd bynnag, trafodwyd y mater hwn gan y pwyllgor yn ystod yr adolygiad a derbyniodd nifer o aelodau'r pwyllgor fod dadleuon cryf o blaid datganoli gwasanaethau'r heddlu. A fydddech yn cefnogi'r aelodau hynny o'r pwyllgor yn hynny o beth?



**Edwina Hart:** I have sent the full report to Charles Clarke, indicating that the report has been noted by the National Assembly, and we will support amendment 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

You made some good points, Leanne, when you spoke about some of the policing issues. However, if the committee had had longer, what would it have concluded? It would have probably taken further evidence, perhaps on child protection issues from Gwenda Thomas; it would have looked at how one police force would emerge, and it would have looked at democratic structures. Many of the unanswered questions could have been answered by a full discussion.

5.40 p.m.

However, we are where we are. We also have to recognise that there are many vested interests in the discussions that people have had with us about the future of policing in Wales. It is important to recognise that there are many staff issues. Unison talked about 1,000 staff being made redundant. However, are we sure of these figures? Would there, in fact, not be enhanced services? We do not know the answers to any of these questions. You raised a specific point about Scotland. Responsibility for the police is devolved to Scotland. The Scottish Executive would have to make its own decision if it wanted a similar type of review to the one that Charles Clarke had done by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary.

England and Wales are closely linked in terms of services. To respond to a point raised by Mark Isherwood, operational issues are not changing as a result of any of these proposals. Ultimately, relationships, whether those of Dyfed-Powys, South Wales, and into Gwent, with Avon and Somerset, will remain, in terms of how certain tiers of crime and organised crime are dealt with. The same applies in north Wales, where links are automatically made with Cheshire, Merseyside, and so on. Those will remain. We are talking about a change in structures in Wales, not in a change in how the police will

**Edwina Hart:** Yr wyf wedi anfon yr adroddiad llawn at Charles Clarke, gan ddweud bod yr adroddiad wedi'i nodi gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, a byddwn yn cefnogi gwelliant 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

Gwnaethoch rai pwyntiau da, Leanne, wrth sôn am rai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â phlisma. Fodd bynnag, petai'r pwyllgor wedi cael mwy o amser, beth fuasai ei gasgliadau? Mae'n debyg y byddai wedi derbyn mwy o dystiolaeth, efallai ar faterion sy'n ymwneud ag amddiffyn plant gan Gwenda Thomas; byddai wedi edrych ar sut y byddai un heddlu'n datblygu, a byddai wedi edrych ar strwythurau democrataidd. Gellid bod wedi ateb llawer o'r cwestiynau sydd heb eu hateb yn sgîl trafodaeth llawn.

Fodd bynnag, dyma'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi. Mae'n rhaid inni hefyd gydnabod bod hunan-fudd wrth wraidd llawer o'r trafodaethau a fu rhyngom a phobl am ddyfodol plisma yng Nghymru. Mae'n bwysig cydnabod bod llawer o ystyriaethau ynghylch y staff. Soniodd Unsain am 1,000 o staff yn cael eu diswyddo. Fodd bynnag, a ydym yn sicr am y ffigurau hyn? Oni fyddem, mewn gwirionedd, yn gweld gwell gwasanaethau? Ni wyddom yr atebion i ddim un o'r cwestiynau hyn. Codwyd pwynt penodol gennych am yr Alban. Mae cyfrifoldeb dros yr heddlu wedi'i ddatganoli i'r Alban. Byddai Gweithrediaeth yr Alban wedi gorfod gwneud ei phenderfyniad ei hun petai'n dymuno cael adolygiad tebyg i hwnnw y trefnodd Charles Clarke i Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi ei gynnal.

Mae cysylltiad clòs rhwng Cymru a Lloegr o ran gwasanaethau. Ac ymateb i bwynt a godwyd gan Mark Isherwood, ni fydd materion gweithredol yn newid o ganlyniad i unrhyw un o'r cynigion hyn. Yn y pen draw, bydd y berthynas, boed honno rhwng Dyfed-Powys, De Cymru a hyd at Went, gydag Avon a Gwlad yr Haf, yn dal i fodoli, o ran sut yr ymdrinnir â rhai haenau o droseddau a throseddau gan gangiau o droseddwyr. Mae'r un peth yn wir yn y gogledd, lle y bydd cysylltiadau awtomatig gyda swydd Gaer, glannau Mersi, ac yn y blaen. Bydd y rheini'n parhau. Yr ydym yn sôn am newid mewn

operate at certain levels.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention?

**Edwina Hart:** No. I turn to the amendments. Amendment 1 proposes deleting everything in the motion after 'Home Secretary'. The report was prepared as part of a consultation exercise; the Home Secretary consulted, Kirsty, and asked for my views, as Minister, on behalf of the National Assembly. Therefore, in many ways, consultation has taken place. It might not be the consultation that everyone wants, but it has taken place. Amendment 2 seeks to add a new point, and you cannot have it both ways. You have attacked the consultation process because you are not happy with it, because it was not given sufficient time, yet at the same time you say that you want to keep the existing structures; you cannot have it both ways. We have either had time to consult or we have not; you cannot have it both ways.

On amendment 3, it is much too difficult to reach a conclusion now on restructuring and cost issues. I hear about costs across the board, but the police are still working on some of the cost issues. It is important that we recognise that this is a moveable feast in terms of cost, and figures will emerge in due course. I am mindful that, if costs are associated with restructuring, I would not expect them to be funded through the Welsh block to local government. I would hope that, if there are restructuring costs—if the restructuring comes about—the Home Secretary will recognise this in terms of what he needs to do centrally. The Home Office has indicated that it does not see any costs arising from this and that, in the long term, there might be cost savings. However, what is the long term? Is it five, 10 or 20 years? We must also look at the short-term implications for us, because we have limited resources ourselves, and we must consider the precept, which is different across Wales.

strwythurau yng Nghymru, nid am newid o ran sut y bydd yr heddlu'n gweithredu ar lefelau penodol.

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

**Edwina Hart:** Na wnaif. Trof at y gwelliannau. Mae gwelliant 1 yn cynnig dileu popeth yn y cynnig ar ôl 'Ysgrifennydd Cartref'. Paratowyd yr adroddiad fel rhan o ymgynghoriad; ymgynghorodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, Kirsty, a gofyn am fy marn, fel Gweinidog, ar ran y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Felly, mewn sawl ffordd, mae'r ymgynghori wedi digwydd. Efallai nad hyn yw'r ymgynghoriad y mae pawb yn dymuno'i gael, ond mae wedi digwydd. Mae gwelliant 2 yn ceisio ychwanegu pwynt newydd, ac ni allwch ei chael hi bob ffordd. Yr ydych wedi ymosod ar y broses ymgynghori am nad ydych yn hapus â hi, oherwydd na roddwyd digon o amser ar ei chyfer, eto i gyd, dywedwch eich bod yn awyddus i gadw'r strwythurau presennol, ni allwch ei chael hi bob ffordd. Yr ydym naill ai wedi cael amser i ymgynghori neu heb gael amser; ni allwch ei chael hi bob ffordd.

O ran gwelliant 3, mae'n rhy anodd o lawer inni lunio casgliadau yn awr am faterion sy'n ymwneud ag ailstrwythuro a chostau. Clywaf sylwadau am gostau o bob tu, ond mae'r heddlu'n dal i weithio ar rai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chostau. Mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod mai llwyfan symudol yw hwn o ran costau, ac y bydd y ffigurau'n dod i'r golwg maes o law. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli, os oes costau ynghlwm wrth yr ailstrwythuro, na fyddwn yn disgwyl i'r rheini gael eu hariannu drwy gyfrwng bloc Cymru ar gyfer llywodraeth leol. Byddwn yn gobeithio, os oes costau ynghlwm wrth ailstrwythuro—os digwydd yr ailstrwythuro—y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn cydnabod hyn o ran yr hyn y mae'n rhaid iddo'i wneud yn ganolog. Mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi dweud nad yw'n gweld costau'n codi o hyn ac y gall fod arbedion o ran costau yn y tymor hir. Ai pum mlynedd, ynteu 10 ynteu 20? Rhaid inni hefyd edrych ar y goblygiadau yn y tymor byr i ni, oherwydd bod ein hadnoddau ninnau'n brin, a rhaid inni ystyried y praesept, sy'n wahanol ar hyd a lled Cymru.

On amendment 4—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you give way?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The Minister has indicated that she is not giving way.

**Edwina Hart:** Amendment 4 asks that the option of having one police force be rejected. However, this is one of the options that have been put forward by the Welsh police authorities and forces to the Home Secretary, Kirsty. It would not be prudent for the Assembly to ignore the advice of the police authorities and forces on some of these matters.

On amendment 5 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, the Home Secretary has asked for our views. We have produced a report, which I have sent. He asked for our views on the basis of a report that he had from Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabulary, 'Closing the Gap'. We will also oppose amendment 6. The devolution of any new responsibilities to the Assembly has to be based on a full assessment of the financial and other agreements that underpin the transfer. Fundamental pieces of this jigsaw would have to be negotiated first, should the devolution take place, and we are not at that stage today. We have talked about issues such as the transparency of police funding, and there are issues around that.

On amendment 7—

**Eleanor Burnham:** Will you take an intervention on a financial issue, Minister?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. Everyone knows what the rules are here. If a Member is not giving way to another Member, the Member seeking to intervene should sit down comfortably.

**Edwina Hart:** Amendment 7, like amendment 2, shows the truth of the opposition parties' approach to consultation. On the one hand they attack the consultation process on the grounds that they consider that it is not right, and at the same time they commit themselves to another course of action—to keep things the same. Therefore, I

O ran gwelliant 4—

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch ildio?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud nad yw'n ildio.

**Edwina Hart:** Mae gwelliant 4 yn gofyn inni wrthod yr opsiwn o gael un heddlu. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn un o'r opsiynau sydd wedi'u cynnig gan awdurdodau'r heddlu a heddluoedd Cymru i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, Kirsty. Ni fyddai'n ddoeth i'r Cynulliad anwybyddu cyngor awdurdodau'r heddlu a'r heddluoedd ynghylch rhai o'r materion hyn.

O ran gwelliant 5, yn enw Jocelyn Davies, mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi gofyn am ein barn. Yr ydym wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad ac yr wyf wedi ei anfon. Gofynnodd am ein barn ar sail adroddiad a gafodd gan Arolygiaeth Cwnstabiliaeth Ei Mawrhydi, 'Closing the Gap'. Byddwn hefyd yn gwrthwynebu gwelliant 6. Rhaid seilio datganoli unrhyw gyfrifoldebau newydd i'r Cynulliad ar asesiad llawn o'r cytundebau ariannol a'r cytundebau eraill sy'n sail i'r trosglwyddo hwnnw. Byddai'n rhaid negodi elfennau hanfodol y jig-so hwn gyntaf, pe digwyddai'r datganoli, ac nid ydym wedi cyrraedd y cam hwnnw heddiw. Yr ydym wedi sôn am faterion megis tryloywder cyllido'r heddlu, ac mae ystyriaethau sy'n berthnasol i hynny.

O ran gwelliant 7—

**Eleanor Burnham:** A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad ar fater ariannol, Weinidog?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r rheolau'n hysbys i bawb. Os nad yw Aelod yn ildio i Aelod arall, dylai'r Aelod sy'n ceisio ymyrryd eistedd yn gyfforddus.

**Edwina Hart:** Dengys Gwelliant 7, fel gwelliant 2, beth yw'r gwir am agwedd y gwrthbleidiau at ymgynghori. Ar y naill law, maent yn ymosod ar y broses ymgynghori ar y sail eu bod yn ystyried nad yw'n iawn, ac ar yr un pryd maent yn ymrwymo i lwybr arall—cadw pethau fel y maent. Felly, ni chefnogaf y gwelliant hwnnw. Cefnogwn

will not support that amendment. We will support amendment 8, because it is a proper approach to take to look at particular issues.

Many points have been raised in this debate, and it will be difficult to cover them all. However, I thank William Graham for his points, particularly on the community policing funding issues and the importance of neighbourhood policing in these areas. Gwenda made an important point about child protection, which we need to take on board. Carl is quite right; I am not aware that any formal discussions have been taking place between North Wales Police and Cheshire Police with regard to any arrangements. However, I thank Carl and the north Wales Members who came to see me with regard to the approach that they wish to take. I forwarded their views on to the Home Secretary to indicate feelings in north Wales.

I say to the three party leaders that it is very easy to have a knockabout on the police here and to make all our points. However, at the end of the day, we must recognise that we have to get something consistent across. I appreciate that you are concerned about consultation and financial matters, but it would be nice, if we get an opportunity to respond again, that we do what we did with the committee report and forward our views in that way. I have tried to use the committee report to indicate feelings across the Assembly to the Home Secretary. Nick, or Mike, referred to the politicisation of the police; we do not want anything like that. The police service is a service for everyone, and it is important that we recognise that. Whatever might go on in another place, we will have to decide how to work with those decisions. As a result of any decisions made by the Home Secretary, I will certainly be making more representations about our role in discussing the police's financial settlement, and, importantly, what we can do with regard to the democratic issues if any changes occur as a result of what Charles Clarke may decide.

In that spirit, I thank Members for the debate. I hope that we will ensure, in the long run, that we have the right policing policy that

welliant 8, oherwydd ei fod yn mynd ati yn y ffordd iawn i edrych ar faterion penodol.

Mae llawer o bwyntiau wedi'u codi yn y ddadl hon, a bydd yn anodd rhoi sylw i bob un. Fodd bynnag, diolchaf i William Graham am ei bwyntiau, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt y materion sy'n ymwneud ag ariannu plismona cymunedol a phwysigrwydd plismona cymdogaeth yn yr ardaloedd hyn. Codwyd pwynt pwysig gan Gwenda am amddiffyn plant, ac mae gofyn inni fynd i'r afael â hynny. Mae Carl yn llygad ei le; ni wn am drafodaethau ffurfiol a fu rhwng Heddlu Gogledd Cymru a Heddlu Swydd Gaer ynglŷn ag unrhyw drefniadau. Fodd bynnag, carwn ddiolch i Carl ac Aelodau'r gogledd a ddaeth i'm gweld i drafod y trywydd y dymunant ei ddilyn. Trosglwyddais eu sylwadau i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, er mwyn cyfleu teimladau pobl y gogledd.

Dywedaf wrth arweinwyr y tair plaid ei bod yn hawdd iawn traethu am yr heddlu yma a gwneud ein holl bwyntiau. Fodd bynnag, yn y diwedd, rhaid inni gydnabod bod gofyn i ni gyfleu rhywbeth cyson. Sylweddolaf eich bod yn bryderus ynglŷn ag ymgynghori a materion ariannol, ond os cawn gyfle i ymateb eto, byddai'n braf pe baem yn gweithredu fel y gwnaethom gydag adroddiad y pwyllgor a chyfleu ein barn yn y ffordd honno. Yr wyf wedi ceisio defnyddio adroddiad y pwyllgor i gyfleu teimladau'r Cynulliad i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Cyfeiriodd Nick, neu Mike, at wleidyddoli'r heddlu; nid oes arnom eisiau dim byd o'r fath. Mae'r gwasanaeth heddlu yn wasanaeth i bawb, ac mae'n bwysig inni gydnabod hynny. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd yn rhywle arall, bydd rhaid i ni benderfynu sut i weithio gyda'r penderfyniadau hynny. Yn sgîl unrhyw benderfyniadau a wneir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, byddaf yn sicr yn cyflwyno rhagor o sylwadau am ein rôl wrth drafod setliad ariannol yr heddlu, ac, yn bwysig iawn, yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud ynglŷn â'r materion democrataidd os bydd unrhyw newidiadau'n deillio o unrhyw benderfyniad a wneir gan Charles Clarke.

Yn yr ysbryd hwnnw, carwn ddiolch i'r Aelodau am y ddadl. Gobeithio y byddwn yn sicrhau, yn y tymor hir, fod y polisi plismona

delivers for the citizens of Wales.

cywir gennym sy'n cyflawni dros  
ddinasyddion Cymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Amendment 1: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.*

*Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 19, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Amendment 2: For 19, Abstain 9, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:

The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 3: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 19, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 4: For 19, Abstain 9, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 5: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 17, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.  
 Amendment 6: For 17, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Davies, Janet  
 German, Michael  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine



Thomas, Gwenda  
Williams, Brynle

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 18, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 7: For 18, Abstain 9, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Janet  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lloyd, David  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 44, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 2.  
Amendment 8: For 44, Abstain 9, Against 2.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Cairns, Alun  
Francis, Lisa

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:  
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM2734 as amended:

Cynnig NDM2734 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. welcomes the work of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in producing its* *1. yn croesawu gwaith y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder ac Adfywio Cymdeithasol wrth*

- report 'Restructuring the Constabulary', which considers the reform of police boundaries in Wales;* *gynhyrchu ei adroddiad 'Restructuring the Constabulary', sy'n ystyried ad-drefnu ffiniau'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru;*
- 2. notes that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration has forwarded this report to the Home Secretary;* *2. yn nodi bod y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder ac Adfywio Cymdeithasol wedi anfon yr adroddiad hwn at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol;*
- 3. believes that the cost of restructuring the police forces in Wales would be better spent on front-line services;* *3. yn credu y byddai'n well gwario'r arian a werid ar ailstrwythuro'r heddluoedd yng Nghymru ar wasanaethau'r rheng flaen;*
- 4. condemns the recent hurried and superficial consultation by the Home Secretary on restructuring the constabulary, which failed to:* *4. yn condemnio'r ymgynghori brysiog ac arwynebol diweddar gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ar ailstrwythuro'r heddluoedd, a fethodd ag*
- a) formally consult the National Assembly;* *a) ymgynghori'n ffurfiol â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol;*
- b) fully consider Welsh circumstances; and* *b) ystyried amgylchiadau Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd; a*
- c) make the case for change;* *c) cyflwyno'r ddadl o blaid newid;*
- 5. recommends that any restructuring of police forces in Wales that results from the 'Closing the Gap' report should not be prejudicial against the future transfer of responsibility for police forces in Wales from the Home Secretary to the National Assembly for Wales.* *5. yn argymhell na ddylai unrhyw ailstrwythuro yng nghyswllt heddluoedd Cymru sy'n deillio o'r adroddiad 'Closing the Gap' ragfarnu trosglwyddo'r cyfrifoldeb am heddluoedd Cymru yn y dyfodol oddi wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.*

*Amended motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Butler, Rosemary  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lloyd, Val

Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.  
 Amended motion carried.*

**Y Llywydd:** Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am heddiw. **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.51 p.m.  
 The meeting ended at 5.51 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
 Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
 Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
 Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
 Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)

Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)