



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mercher, 30 Tachwedd 2005  
Wednesday, 30 November 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

- 3 Atal Rheolau Sefydlog  
Suspension of Standing Orders
- 4 Ethol Aelodau i Banel y Cadeiryddion  
Election of Members to the Panel of Chairs
- 5 Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc  
Election of Members to Subject Committees
- 9 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol  
Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services
- 32 Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon  
Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language, and Sport
- 46 Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Ty  
Questions to the House Committee
- 47 Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion  
Composite Motion: Approval of Orders
- 49 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under the Railways Act 2005 to the First Minister
- 70 Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodi)  
(Rhif 2) a Gorchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodi) (Rhif 3) i'r Prif Weinidog  
Delegation of Functions under the European Communities Designation (No. 2) Order  
and the European Communities Designation (No. 3) Order to the First Minister
- 73 Cymeradwyo'r Amserlen Gyfnodol  
Approval of the Periodic Timetable
- 75 Adolygiad Polisi gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio:  
Ailstrwytho'r Heddlu  
Policy Review by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee: Restructuring the  
Constabulary
- 98 Dadl Fer: Diogelu Gwasanaethau GIG Hollbwysig i Gleifion yn y Canolbarth a'r  
Gorllewin  
Short Debate: Safeguarding Vital NHS Services for Patients in Mid and West Wales

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were  
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been  
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair*

### **Atal Rheolau Sefydlog Suspension of Standing Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 37.6, yr wyf wedi caniatáu cynnig i atal Rheolau Sefydlog er mwyn i gynigion i ethol Aelodau i bwyllgorau pwnc gael eu cynnig. Yr wyf yn atgoffa Aelodau bod angen pleidlais o fwyafrif o ddwy ran o dair o blaid y cynnig er mwyn iddo gael ei dderbyn.

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 37.6, I have allowed the proposal of a motion to suspend Standing Orders so that motions to elect Members to subject committees may be proposed. I remind Members that the motion requires a two-thirds majority vote in favour of the motion for it to be carried.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order No. 37.5,*

*suspends Standing Order No. 6.13 to allow the following no named day motions, tabled on Wednesday 30 November for the election of Members to subject committees, to be considered in Plenary on Wednesday 30 November: a) NNDM2738; b) NNDM2739; c) NNDM2740; d) NNDM2741; e) NNDM2742; f) NNDM2743; g) NNDM2744. (NDM2737)*

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 37.5,*

*yn atal Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.13 er mwyn caniatáu i'r cynigion canlynol heb ddyddiad trafod, a gyflwynwyd ar 30 Tachwedd er mwyn ethol Aelodau i bwyllgorau pwnc, gael eu hystyried yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ddydd Mercher 30 Tachwedd: a) NNDM2738; b) NNDM2739; c) NNDM2740; d) NNDM2741; e) NNDM2742; f) NNDM2743; g) NNDM2744. (NDM2737)*

*Cynnig (NDM2737): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2737): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Ethol Aelodau i Banel y Cadeiryddion Election of Members to the Panel of Chairs**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigiau fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3,*

*yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3,*

*elects the following Members to the panel  
from which the chairs of the subject  
committees are to be selected:*

*yn ethol yr Aelodau canlynol i'r panel ar  
gyfer dethol cadeiryddion y pwyllgorau  
pwnc:*

*Rosemary Butler (Labour), Janice Gregory  
(Labour), Christine Gwyther (Labour), Ann  
Jones (Labour), Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid  
Cymru), Glyn Davies (Conservative), Peter  
Black (Liberal Democrat). (NDM2705)*

*Rosemary Butler (Llafur), Janice Gregory  
(Llafur), Christine Gwyther (Llafur), Ann  
Jones (Llafur), Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid  
Cymru), Glyn Davies (Ceidwadwyr), Peter  
Black (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol).  
(NDM2705)*

*Cynnig (NDM2705): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2705): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

### **Ethol Aelodau i'r Pwyllgorau Pwnc Election of Members to Subject Committees**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod  
 propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

*1. in accordance with Standing Order 8.4, elects the following members to its Education and Lifelong Learning Committee:*

*1. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes:*

*Christine Chapman (Labour); Jeff Cuthbert (Labour); Irene James (Labour); Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru); Owen John Thomas (Plaid Cymru); William Graham (Conservative);*

*Christine Chapman (Llafur); Jeff Cuthbert (Labour); Irene James (Llafur); Janet Ryder (Plaid Cymru); Owen John Thomas (Plaid Cymru); William Graham (Ceidwadwyr);*

*2. in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Peter Black (Liberal Democrat) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and*

*2. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Peter Black (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a*

3. agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2738)

3. yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2738)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee:

1. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad:

*Tamsin Dunwoody (Labour); Lorraine Barrett (Labour); Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru); Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru); Brynle Williams (Conservative); Mick Bates (Liberal Democrat);*

*Tamsin Dunwoody (Llafur); Lorraine Barrett (Llafur); Elin Jones (Plaid Cymru); Jocelyn Davies (Plaid Cymru); Brynle Williams (Ceidwadwyr); Mick Bates (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol);*

2. in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Glyn Davies (Conservative) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and

2. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Glyn Davies (Ceidwadwyr) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a

3. agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2739)

3. yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2739)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Social Justice and Regeneration Committee:

1. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio:

*Huw Lewis (Labour); Sandy Mewies (Labour); Leanne Wood (Plaid Cymru); Mark Isherwood (Conservative); Laura Ann Jones (Conservative); Mick Bates (Liberal Democrat);*

*Huw Lewis (Llafur); Sandy Mewies (Llafur); Leanne Wood (Plaid Cymru); Mark Isherwood (Ceidwadwyr); Laura Ann Jones (Ceidwadwyr); Mick Bates (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol);*

2. in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Janice Gregory (Labour) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and

2. yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Janice Gregory (Llafur) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a

3. agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2740)

3. yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2740)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Economic Development and Transport Committee:*

*Leighton Andrews (Labour); Carl Sargeant (Labour); Alun Ffred Jones (Plaid Cymru); Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru); Alun Cairns (Conservative); Kirsty Williams (Liberal Democrat);*

2. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Christine Gwyther (Labour) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and*

3. *agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2741)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

1. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Health and Social Services Committee:*

*John Griffiths (Labour); Lynne Neagle (Labour); Karen Sinclair (Labour); Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru); Jonathan Morgan (Conservative); Jenny Randerson (Liberal Democrat);*

2. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and*

3. *agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2742)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales*

1. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee:*

*Denise Idris Jones (Labour); Val Lloyd (Labour); Owen John Thomas (Plaid Cymru); Lisa Francis (Conservative); Laura*

1. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth:*

*Leighton Andrews (Llafur); Carl Sargeant (Llafur); Alun Ffred Jones (Plaid Cymru); Janet Davies (Plaid Cymru); Alun Cairns (Ceidwadwyr); Kirsty Williams (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol);*

2. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Christine Gwyther (Llafur) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a*

3. *yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2741)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol:*

*John Griffiths (Llafur); Lynne Neagle (Llafur); Karen Sinclair (Llafur); Helen Mary Jones (Plaid Cymru); Jonathan Morgan (Ceidwadwyr); Jenny Randerson (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol);*

2. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Rhodri Glyn Thomas (Plaid Cymru) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a*

3. *yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2742)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Diwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon:*

*Denise Idris Jones (Llafur); Val Lloyd (Llafur); Owen John Thomas (Plaid Cymru); Lisa Francis (Ceidwadwyr); Laura Ann*

*Ann Jones (Conservative); Eleanor Burnham (Liberal Democrat);* *Jones (Ceidwadwyr); Eleanor Burnham (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol);*

2. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Rosemary Butler (Labour) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and* 2. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Rosemary Butler (Llafur) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a*

3. *agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2743)* 3. *yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2743)*

I propose that

Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru*

1. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 8.4, elects the following members to its Local Government and Public Services Committee:* 1. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 8.4, yn ethol yr aelodau canlynol i'w Bwyllgor Llywodraeth Leol a Gwasanaethau Cyhoeddus:*

*Gwenda Thomas (Labour); Catherine Thomas (Labour); Dai Lloyd (Plaid Cymru); David Melding (Conservative); Mike German (Liberal Democrat); Peter Law (Independent);* *Gwenda Thomas (Llafur); Catherine Thomas (Llafur); Dai Lloyd (Plaid Cymru); David Melding (Ceidwadwyr); Mike German (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol); Peter Law (Annibynnol);*

2. *in accordance with Standing Order No. 9.3, selects Ann Jones (Labour) from the panel to be the Chair of the committee; and* 2. *yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 9.3, yn dethol Ann Jones (Llafur) o'r panel i fod yn Gadeirydd y pwyllgor; a*

3. *agrees that the election to the committee shall not take effect until 1 January 2006. (NNDM2744)* 3. *yn cytuno na ddaw canlyniad yr etholiad i'r pwyllgor i rym tan 1 Ionawr 2006. (NNDM2744)*

*Cynigion (NNDM2738, NNDM2739, NNDM2740, NNDM2741, NNDM2742, NNDM2743, NNDM2744): O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motions (NNDM2738, NNDM2739, NNDM2740, NNDM2741, NNDM2742, NNDM2743, NNDM2744): For 42, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa



German, Michael  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynigion.  
 Motions carried.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol** **Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services**

### **Cymhorthion Clyw Digidol** **Digital Hearing Aids**

**Q1 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the availability of NHS digital hearing aids in Wales? OAQ0510(HSS)

**C1 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gymhorthion clyw digidol y GIG sydd ar gael yng Nghymru? OAQ0510(HSS)

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** Significant work has been undertaken in modernising audiology departments since 2001-02. As a result, all trusts are able to assess and fit patients with digital hearing aids. Wales leads the way in this respect. Since 2002, approximately 80,000 digital hearing aids have been fitted to patients in Wales.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Mae llawer o waith wedi ei wneud i foderneiddio adrannau awdioleg er 2001-02. O ganlyniad, gall pob ymddiriedolaeth asesu cleifion a gosod cymhorthion clyw digidol ar eu cyfer. Mae Cymru ar flaen y gad yn hyn o beth. Er 2002, mae tua 80,000 o gymhorthion clyw digidol wedi eu gosod i gleifion yng Nghymru.

**Ann Jones:** I am pleased that Wales continues to roll out digital hearing aids. When we started doing this some three years ago, which was an advance on what England was doing, we had no idea of the level of unmet demand. I am sure that this has been of

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch bod Cymru yn parhau i gyflwyno cymhorthion clyw digidol. Pan ddechreusom wneud hyn tua thair blynedd yn ôl, a oedd yn gynnydd ar yr hyn a oedd yn digwydd yn Lloegr, nid oedd gennym syniad o lefel y galw a heb oedd heb

huge benefit to people's lives and ability to communicate, which have been transformed by digital hearing aids. Substantial investment has been made by the Assembly Government, for which we say 'thank you', in modernising audiology departments. However, according to research by the British Society of Hearing Aid Audiologists, the average wait in Wales for a hearing aid is still longer than the national average. In my area, the average number of weeks that people must wait for a first appointment and fitting is between 60 and 78 weeks. Not all NHS trusts monitor waiting times for first appointments.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You must ask a question.

**Ann Jones:** I am coming to it.

Will you consider adding hearing aid and audiology waiting times to the waiting times initiative?

**Brian Gibbons:** Each trust manages its own waiting lists. Given that well in excess of 10,000 hearing aids are fitted every year, the number of people waiting over 36 weeks is probably in the hundreds. I am surprised to hear the figure that you quoted. Could you write to me to inform me of which trust you are talking about—I realise that it could be the Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust—and we can then make inquiries in relation to that?

**David Melding:** We still need more specialists. Digital hearing aids improve the quality of life of many people, but they need to be fitted and used properly. People need this advance as soon as possible. Waiting six months, or longer, is really not good enough if you are in your advanced years and you want to improve your hearing.

**Brian Gibbons:** I think that you are quite right, which is why we have trained more

ei fodloni. Yr wyf yn siwr i hynny fod o fudd enfawr i fywydau pobl a'u gallu i gyfathrebu, sydd wedi eu trawsnewid gan gymhorthion clyw digidol. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi buddsoddi'n sylweddol yn y gwaith o foderneiddio adrannau awdioleg, ac yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iddi am hynny. Fodd bynnag, yn ôl gwaith ymchwil gan Gymdeithas Awdiolegwyr Cymhorthion Clyw Prydain, mae'r cyfnod aros am gymorth clyw yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd yn dal yn hirach na'r cyfartaledd cenedlaethol. Yn fy ardal i, mae nifer yr wythnosau y mae'n rhaid i bobl aros am apwyntiad cyntaf ac apwyntiad gosod, ar gyfartaledd, rhwng 60 a 78 o wythnosau. Nid yw pob un o ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yn monitro amseroedd aros ar gyfer apwyntiadau cyntaf.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Rhaid ichi ofyn cwestiwn.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn dod at hynny.

A ystyriwch ychwanegu amseroedd aros am gymhorthion clyw ac awdioleg at y fenter amseroedd aros?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae pob ymddiriedolaeth yn rheoli ei rhestrau aros ei hun. O gofio bod llawer mwy na 10,000 o gymhorthion clyw yn cael eu gosod bob blwyddyn, mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros am fwy na 36 wythnos yn debygol o fod yn gannoedd. Synnaf glywed y ffigur a ddyfynnwyd gennych. A allech ysgrifennu ataf i ddweud wrthyf am ba ymddiriedolaeth yr ydych yn sôn—sylweddolaf efallai mai Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Conwy a Sir Ddinbych ydyw—a gallwn wedyn wneud ymholiadau mewn cysylltiad â hynny?

**David Melding:** Mae angen mwy o arbenigwyr arnom o hyd. Mae cymhorthion clyw digidol yn gwella ansawdd bywyd llawer o bobl, ond mae angen iddynt gael eu gosod a'u defnyddio'n gywir. Mae angen i bobl allu manteisio ar y datblygiad hwn cyn gynted â phosibl. Nid yw aros am chwe mis, neu fwy, yn ddigon da os ydych yn oedrannus ac am wella eich clyw.

**Brian Gibbons:** Credaf eich bod yn llygad eich lle, a dyna pam yr ydym wedi hyfforddi

audiology scientists to fit these hearing aids. One way in which we have tried to improve access for patients is by enabling GPs, if they are happy that the patient requires only a hearing aid, to make a direct referral to the audiology department rather than going through consultants.

**Peter Black:** Minister, my understanding is that delays in appointments vary around Wales, depending on whether you are referred from an ear, nose and throat consultant. When people are referred from a consultant, the delay in getting an appointment can be up to two years, but when a referral is made directly from a GP, it is much quicker. Could you consider the different ways of referring patients to audiology departments, possibly via GPs if necessary, to see whether we can get a consistent approach that will cut the waiting list? Could you also ensure that trusts have a common method of collecting statistics, so that we can monitor progress on this issue?

**Brian Gibbons:** What you say is quite right, and one of the big challenges for the NHS in Wales is to develop the most appropriate clinical pathways for referral. It would not be good practice for a patient to be referred routinely through an ear, nose and throat specialist simply to secure a hearing aid, though there may be occasions when the referring doctor feels that there is some other underlying pathology and, in those circumstances, it would be appropriate to ask a specialist opinion before referring the patient for an audiology fitting. However, in general, when it is simply a case of supplying a hearing aid, then bypassing the ear, nose and throat specialist would seem to be the most appropriate way forward.

mwy o wyddonwyr awdioleg i osod y cymhorthion clyw hyn. Un ffordd yr ydym wedi ceisio gwella mynediad i gleifion yw drwy alluogi meddygon teulu, os ydynt yn fodlon mai dim ond cymorth clyw sydd ei angen ar y claf, i atgyfeirio'n uniongyrchol i'r adran awdioleg yn hytrach na threfnu i weld meddygon ymgynghorol.

**Peter Black:** Weinidog, deallaf fod oedi o ran apwyntiadau yn amrywio ledled Cymru, yn dibynnu ar ba un a gewch eich atgyfeirio gan feddygon ymgynghorol clust, trwyn a llwnc ai peidio. Pan gaiff pobl eu hatgyfeirio gan feddygon ymgynghorol, gall yr oedi wrth gael apwyntiad fod hyd at ddwy flynedd, ond pan gaiff atgyfeiriad ei wneud yn uniongyrchol gan feddyg teulu, mae'n llawer cyflymach. A allech ystyried y ffyrdd gwahanol o atgyfeirio cleifion i adrannau awdioleg, o bosibl drwy feddygon teulu os bydd angen, i weld pa un a allwn sicrhau ymagwedd gyson a fydd yn cwotgi'r rhestr aros? A allech hefyd sicrhau bod gan ymddiriedolaethau ddull cyffredin o gasglu ystadegau, er mwyn inni allu monitro cynnydd ar y mater hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gywir, ac un o'r heriau mawr sy'n wynebu'r GIG yng Nghymru yw datblygu'r llwybrau clinigol mwyaf priodol ar gyfer atgyfeirio. Ni fyddai'n arfer da i glaf gael ei atgyfeirio'n arferol drwy arbenigwr clust, trwyn a llwnc a hynny ddim ond i sicrhau cymorth clyw, er efallai y bydd adegau pan fydd y meddyg sy'n atgyfeirio yn teimlo bod yna batholeg sylfaenol arall ac, yn yr amgylchiadau hynny, byddai'n briodol gofyn am farn arbenigwr cyn atgyfeirio'r claf i gael apwyntiad gosod yn yr adran awdioleg. Fodd bynnag, yn gyffredinol, os yw'n achos syml o gyflenwi cymorth clyw, yna ymddengys mai osgoi'r arbenigwr clust, trwyn a llwnc fyddai'r ffordd fwyaf priodol ymlaen.

### Gwasanaethau Rhiwmatoleg Rheumatology Services

**C2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fynediad at wasanaethau rhiwmatoleg yng Nghymru? OAQ0552(HSS)

**Q2 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on access to rheumatology services in Wales? OAQ0552(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Rheumatology services are planned and commissioned by local health boards and are provided at district general hospitals across Wales, as well as in primary care. Policy guidance is currently being developed to tackle highly prevalent chronic conditions, such as arthritis, and to improve musculoskeletal health generally. It is likely that the document will be consulted on in the new year.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Gwelaf eich bod yn parhau'r arfer, Weinidog, o drosglwyddo pob cyfrifoldeb dros wasanaethau i gyrff ac eithrio Llywodraeth Cymru.

Beth yw eich ymateb i'r sefyllfa yn hen sir Dyfed, lle mai dim ond un arbenigwr sy'n gweithio yn rhan amser i wasanaethu siroedd Caerfyrddin, Ceredigion a Phenfro? Beth am bobl o Geredigion sy'n gorfod teithio am bedair awr am apwyntiad i weld arbenigwyr yn Lloegr? Beth am y diffyg o ran timau aml-ddisgyblaeth i ddelio â rhiwmatoleg yng Nghymru? Weinidog, rhaid i chi dderbyn bod y gwasanaeth yn un amrywiol sy'n dibynnu ar godau post. Beth sydd wedi digwydd i'r cynllun gweithredu arthritis i Gymru? Pryd fydd hwnnw'n cael ei gyhoeddi, a sut y byddwch chi yn ei fonitro?

**Brian Gibbons:** First of all, it would be premature to say how we will monitor the scheme until the consultation has taken place; that would be a case of putting the cart well and truly before the donkey, though I suppose in terms of Plaid Cymru policy that that would not surprise me. The number of whole-time equivalent consultants appointed for rheumatology over recent years, from 1997 to the present, has gone up by 75 per cent. As for multidisciplinary teams, the number of physiotherapists in west Wales, in Carmarthenshire, has gone up by 13 per cent. By using the opportunities in the new GP contract, more services can be delivered in the community. I am sure that you will know that the local health board is in active discussions with Bro Morgannwg NHS Trust in terms of developing waiting list initiatives, to shorten the length of time that patients wait in Carmarthenshire. If Bro Morgannwg trust

**Brian Gibbons:** Caiff gwasanaethau rhiwmatoleg eu cynllunio a'u comisiynu gan fyrdau iechyd lleol a'u darparu mewn ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth ledled Cymru, yn ogystal ag ym maes gofal sylfaenol. Caiff canllawiau polisi eu datblygu ar hyn o bryd i fynd i'r afael â chyflyrau cronig cyffredin, megis arthritis, ac i wella iechyd cyhyrsgerbydol yn gyffredinol. Mae'n debygol y bydd ymgynghori am y ddogfen yn y flwyddyn newydd.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I see you are keeping up the tradition of transferring all responsibility for services to bodies other than the Government of Wales, Minister.

What is your response to the situation in the former county of Dyfed, where there is only one part-time specialist to serve the whole of Carmarthenshire, Ceredigion and Pembrokeshire? What about the people of Ceredigion who must travel for four hours for appointments to see a specialist in England? What about the lack of multidisciplinary teams to deal with rheumatology in Wales? Minister, you must accept that there are great discrepancies in the service available, depending on people's postcodes. What has happened to the arthritis action plan for Wales? When will that be published and how will you monitor it?

**Brian Gibbons:** I ddechrau, byddai'n gynamserol dweud sut y byddwn yn monitro'r cynllun nes bydd yr ymgynghori wedi digwydd; byddai hynny'n achos go iawn o roi'r cert o flaen y ceffyl, er mae'n debyg na fyddai hynny'n fy synnu o ran polisi Plaid Cymru. Mae nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol amser cyflawn cyfatebol a benodwyd ym maes rhiwmatoleg yn ddiweddar, o 1997 hyd heddiw, wedi cynyddu 75 y cant. O ran timau aml-ddisgyblaeth, mae nifer y ffisiotherapyddion yn y gorllewin, yn sir Gaerfyrddin, wedi cynyddu 13 y cant. Drwy ddefnyddio'r cyfleoedd yn y contract meddygon teulu newydd, gellir darparu mwy o wasanaethau yn y gymuned. Yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn gwybod bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol wrthi'n trafod gydag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Bro Morgannwg am ddatblygu mentrau rhestrau aros, i gwtogi'r amser y mae cleifion

is successful in appointing a new consultant in the new year, that consultant will be spending more time in Carmarthenshire, particularly in Llanelli.

**Glyn Davies:** In general, Minister, you seem to have a problem in dealing with rheumatology patients in Wales. The number of those going out of Wales has gone up 30 per cent, standing at almost 60,000 patients in the current year. You have talked about it specifically in relation to Rhodri Glyn Thomas's question, but do you have a strategy for avoiding these long journeys and the inconvenience for people who are in pain and suffering from this illness?

2.10 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** The number of consultants has increased by 75 per cent, and the number of specialist registrars—in other words, doctors in training—has increased by 300 per cent. Also, with regard to the length of time that someone has to wait for rheumatology as an out-patient in Wales, virtually three-quarters of such people are seen within six months. Therefore, I think that the service is improving. Approval has been given for additional consultant posts; the only barrier there is the actual recruitment. Once the consultation document on arthritis and musculoskeletal conditions has been published, that will be a further step forward in the delivery of quality care. We are not there yet, but we are making good progress in multi-disciplinary working, consultant appointment, and developing an overall strategy.

yn aros yn sir Gaerfyrddin. Os bydd ymddiriedolaeth Bro Morgannwg yn llwyddo i benodi meddyg ymgynghorol newydd yn y flwyddyn newydd, bydd y meddyg ymgynghorol hwnnw'n treulio mwy o amser yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yn arbennig yn Llanelli.

**Glyn Davies:** Yn gyffredinol, Weinidog, ymddengys fod gennych broblem wrth ymdrin â chleifion rhiwmatoleg yng Nghymru. Mae nifer y rheini sy'n mynd y tu allan i Gymru wedi cynyddu 30 y cant, sef bron i 60,000 o gleifion yn ystod y flwyddyn bresennol. Yr ydych wedi trafod y broblem hon yn benodol mewn perthynas â chwestiwn Rhodri Glyn Thomas, ond a oes gennych strategaeth ar gyfer osgoi'r teithiau hir hyn a'r anghyfleustra i bobl sydd mewn poen neu sy'n dioddef o'r salwch hwn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae nifer y meddygon ymgynghorol wedi cynyddu 75 y cant a nifer y cofrestryddion arbenigol—hynny yw, meddygon dan hyfforddiant—wedi cynyddu 300 y cant. Yn ogystal, o ran faint o amser y mae'n rhaid i rywun aros am driniaeth rhiwmatoleg fel claf allanol yng Nghymru, caiff bron i dri chwarter o'r bobl hynny eu gweld cyn pen chwe mis. Felly, credaf fod y gwasanaeth yn gwella. Rhoddwyd cymeradwyaeth ar gyfer swyddi ymgynghorol ychwanegol; yr unig rwystr yw'r ymgyrch recriwtio ei hun. Pan fydd y ddogfen ymgynghori ar arthritis a chyflyrau cyhyrysgerbydol wedi ei chyhoeddi, bydd hynny'n gam pellach ymlaen yn y gwaith o ddarparu gofal o safon. Nid ydym wedi cyrraedd y cam hwnnw eto, ond yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd wrth weithio rhwng disgyblaethau, penodi meddygon ymgynghorol a datblygu strategaeth gyffredinol.

### Brechiadau rhag y Ffliw Influenza Vaccinations

**Q3 Ann Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the delivery of free flu vaccinations in Denbighshire?  
OAQ0515(HSS)

**C3 Ann Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddarparu brechiadau rhag y ffliw am ddim yn sir Ddinbych?  
OAQ0515(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Demand for seasonal flu

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r galw am y brechlyn

vaccine has been high this year. This is consistent with an increase in demand worldwide for flu vaccines. Suppliers have indicated that they can meet all prior GP orders for vaccine. Nevertheless, GPs have been asked to ensure that all vaccine is prioritised to those most at risk.

**Ann Jones:** I am pleased to see that we are on course to meet the targets that we have set. In view of the fact that we are almost meeting the 70 per cent target for the vaccination of those designated as at risk, is there now a case for revising that target and setting it higher to ensure that we can protect more vulnerable people from the seasonal flu that occurs every year?

**Brian Gibbons:** There are grounds for great improvement. I and my Deputy Minister, John Griffiths, launched the 'Keep Well This Winter' campaign in north and south Wales to make sure that this had a massive impact, because we wanted more people to come forward for vaccination. We are almost there in terms of meeting the target for vaccination of older people, but only about a third of younger people in at-risk groups are taking up flu vaccination. That is a significant problem, because those with heart disease, renal disease, liver disease and so on should also come forward for the vaccination. We need to do more work to make sure that they benefit from this protection.

**Mark Isherwood:** When the UK Government announced a shortage of flu vaccine, it stated that there were fewer people at risk than there actually were, having just counted the figures for England, rather than for all of the UK. You said, as we heard, that supplies of the flu vaccine in Wales should be sufficient to meet demand. Is there not an apparent contradiction there, and how can we be sure that demand has not, and will not, outstrip supplies in Denbighshire and the rest of Wales, or was it that the UK Government was wrong in its initial analysis?

ffliw tymhorol wedi bod yn uchel eleni. Mae hyn yn gyson â chynnydd yn y galw byd-eang am frechlynnau ffliw. Mae cyflenwyr wedi nodi y gallant fodloni'r holl archebion am frechlynnau a wneir ymlaen llaw gan feddygon teulu. Er hynny, gofynnwyd i feddygon teulu sicrhau, o ran pob brechlyn, y rhoddir blaenoriaeth i'r bobl hynny sydd fwyaf mewn perygl.

**Ann Jones:** Yr wyf yn falch o weld ein bod ar y ffordd i gyrraedd y targedau a osodwyd gennym. Gan ein bod bron iawn yn cyrraedd y targed o 70 y cant ar gyfer brechu'r bobl hynny y dynodir eu bod mewn perygl, a oes achos yn awr dros adolygu'r targed hwnnw a'i osod yn uwch er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn gallu diogelu mwy o bobl ddiamddiffyn rhag y ffliw tymhorol sy'n digwydd bob blwyddyn?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae yna sail ar gyfer gwelliant sylweddol. Lanswyd yr ymgyrch 'Gofal Piau Hi y Gaeaf Hwn' gennyf fi a'm Dirprwy Weinidog, John Griffiths, yn y gogledd a'r de i sicrhau ei bod yn cael effaith aruthrol, oherwydd yr oeddem am i fwy o bobl gael eu brechu. Yr ydym yn agos at gyrraedd y targed ar gyfer brechu pobl hyn, ond dim rhyw draean o bobl iau o'r grwpiau mewn perygl sy'n cymryd y brechlyn ffliw. Mae hynny'n broblem fawr, oherwydd dylai'r rheini sydd â chlefyd y galon, clefyd yr aren, clefyd yr afu, ac ati, hefyd gael eu brechu. Mae angen inni wneud mwy o waith i sicrhau eu bod yn elwa o'r amddiffyniad hwn.

**Mark Isherwood:** Pan gyhoeddodd Llywodraeth y DU fod prinder brechlyn ffliw, dywedodd fod llai o bobl mewn perygl nag a oedd mewn gwirionedd, gan mai'r ffigurau ar gyfer Lloegr yn unig a ystyriwyd ganddi, yn hytrach nag ar gyfer y DU gyfan. Dywedasoch, fel y clywsom, y dylai cyflenwadau'r brechlyn ffliw yng Nghymru fod yn ddigonol i ateb y galw. Onid yw hynny'n wrth-ddweud amlwg, a sut y gallwn fod yn siwr nad yw ac na fydd y galw yn mynd yn drech na'r cyflenwadau yn sir Ddinbych a gweddill Cymru, neu a oedd Llywodraeth y DU yn anghywir yn ei dadansoddiad cychwynnol?

**Brian Gibbons:** There are two ways in which flu vaccine is generally supplied. The main way is through clinicians, in other words, general practitioners or pharmacists, ordering the supply that they think that they are likely to need for the coming winter. In placing their orders, the GPs and pharmacists clearly did not anticipate the current level of uptake. That level of uptake is happening, I would suggest, because of the concern about pandemic flu, and the confusion that exists within the public's mind about that and avian flu. Thankfully, more people are coming forward for flu vaccination, but that has created a problem in terms of the orders that were placed by the clinicians in the first instance.

**Brian Gibbons:** Caiff y brechlyn ffliw ei gyflenwi mewn dwy ffordd yn gyffredinol. Y brif ffordd yw'r system lle mae clinigwyr, hynny yw, meddygon teulu neu fferyllwyr, yn archebu'r cyflenwad y mae'n debygol o fod ei angen arnynt, yn eu barn hwy, ar gyfer y gaeaf i ddod. Wrth archebu, mae'n amlwg na ragwelodd y meddygon teulu na'r fferyllwyr lefel bresennol y bobl a fyddai am gael eu brechu. Mae'r lefel honno wedi codi, fe awgrymaf, oherwydd y pryder am ffliw pandemig, a'r dryswch sy'n bodoli ym meddwl y cyhoedd am hynny a'r ffliw adar. Diolch byth, mae mwy o bobl yn dod i gael eu brechu rhag y ffliw, ond mae hynny wedi creu problem o ran yr archebion a wnaed gan y clinigwyr yn y lle cyntaf.

### Gwasanaethau Iechyd Meddwl Mental Health Services

**Q4 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on mental health services in Wales? OAQ0543(HSS)

**C4 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru? OAQ0543(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** Mental health is one of the Assembly Government's highest priorities. We are committed to improving mental health services and the experience of service users, including older people and working age adults, as well as children and young people.

**Brian Gibbons:** Iechyd meddwl yw un o flaenoriaethau pennaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl a phrofiad pobl sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau, gan gynnwys pobl hyn ac oedolion o oed gweithio, yn ogystal â phlant a phobl ifanc.

**Denise Idris Jones:** I am sure that you welcome the additional £5 million being invested to improve mental health services across Wales. Would you agree that, with one in five people likely to experience stress, anxiety or depressive disorders at some point in their lives, it is vital that support and information about mental health is readily available?

**Denise Idris Jones:** Yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn croesawu'r £5 miliwn ychwanegol sy'n cael ei fuddsoddi i wella gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ledled Cymru. Gydag un o bob pump yn debygol o ddiodeff anhwylder straen, pryder neu iselder rywbyrd yn eu bywyd, a fyddech yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol fod cymorth a gwybodaeth am iechyd meddwl ar gael yn rhwydd?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. We have recently had a series of reviews on the performance of mental health services and, while there was an acknowledgement of improvement, the conclusion was that we need to do considerably better. One area that was highlighted as being weak was that of services at a community level—in other words, people with everyday problems as well as more severe mental health problems.

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwn. Cawsom gyfres o adolygiadau ar berfformiad gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl yn ddiweddar, ac er ei fod yn cydnabod bod gwelliant, y casgliad oedd bod angen inni wneud lawer yn well. Un maes y tynnwyd sylw ato fel maes gwan oedd gwasanaethau ar lefel gymunedol—mewn geiriau eraill, pobl sydd â phroblemau pob dydd yn ogystal â phroblemau iechyd meddwl mwy difrifol. Mae'n bwysig inni

It is important that we put in those resilience services at a community level in order to treat people at an earlier stage and prevent them from deteriorating unnecessarily and ending up in hospital.

**David Lloyd:** Credaf eich bod yn cydnabod yr angen dybryd i ddatblygu mwy o wasanaethau iechyd meddwl, gan ein bod ar ei hôl hi yn gyffredinol yn y maes hwn. Gan eich bod wedi crybwyll gwasanaethau yn y gymuned, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i gyllido gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl newydd yn y gymuned?

**Brian Gibbons:** You will be pleased to know that spending on mental health services has gone up by more than 40 per cent since the establishment of the Assembly. Spending in England on these services in 2003-04 was 10.9 per cent of the English NHS budget; in Wales it was 11.8 per cent, which is a higher proportion. We are committed to continuing with that increase.

**Irene James:** Would you agree that the voluntary sector, through organisations such as Hafal, offers invaluable support to sufferers of mental illnesses? Would you also agree that, by working in the community with local schools on community-based projects and building relationships with local organisations, groups such as Hafal are raising the profile of mental illness and helping improve our communities?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. The voluntary sector, in the context of mental health services, has a vital role to play. It can be an advocate for sufferers of mental health problems, because people with mental health problems, as a result of stigma and marginalisation, are often unable to get their voice heard when decisions are being made. The voluntary sector also has a key role to play in being an enabler of services and programmes, such as the healthy minds at work programme, which encourages people with mental illnesses to get into work. Organisations such as Hafal are also important providers of mental health services. The voluntary sector has a crucial role to play, which is one of the reasons why we have two or three specific grant schemes for the voluntary sector, to ensure that they

ddarparu'r gwasanaethau gwrthsefyll hynny ar lefel y gymuned er mwyn trin pobl ynghynt a'u hatal rhag gwaethygu'n ddiangen a gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty yn y pen draw.

**David Lloyd:** I believe you acknowledge the dire need to develop more mental health services, given that we are lagging behind in relation to these services in general. Since you mention community services, what are you doing to fund new mental health services in the community?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwch yn falch o wybod bod gwariant ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl wedi cynyddu dros 40 y cant ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Yr oedd gwariant Lloegr ar y gwasanaethau hyn yn 2003-04 yn 10.9 y cant o gyllideb GIG Lloegr; yng Nghymru yr oedd yn 11.8 y cant, sy'n gyfran uwch. Yr ydym wedi ymrwymo i barhau â'r cynnydd hwnnw.

**Irene James:** A fydddech yn cytuno bod y sector gwirfoddol, drwy sefydliadau fel Hafal, yn cynnig cymorth gwerthfawr i'r rheini sy'n dioddef gan salwch meddwl? A fydddech yn cytuno hefyd fod grwpiau fel Hafal yn codi proffil salwch meddwl ac yn helpu gwella'n cymunedau drwy weithio yn y gymuned gydag ysgolion lleol ar brosiectau cymunedol a thrwy feithrin cydberthynas â sefydliadau lleol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Byddwn. Mae gan y sector gwirfoddol, yng nghyd-destun gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, ran hanfodol i'w chwarae. Gall fod yn eiriolwr dros bobl sy'n dioddef gan broblemau iechyd meddwl, oherwydd bydd pobl sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, oherwydd stigma ac ymyleiddio, yn aml yn ei chael yn anodd mynegi eu barn pan wneir penderfyniadau. Mae gan y sector gwirfoddol ran allweddol i'w chwarae hefyd wrth alluogi gwasanaethau a rhaglenni, fel y rhaglen meddwl iach yn y gwaith, sy'n annog pobl sydd â salwch meddwl i gael swydd. Mae sefydliadau fel Hafal hefyd yn ddarparwyr gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl pwysig. Mae gan y sector gwirfoddol ran hanfodol i'w chwarae, sy'n un o'r rhesymau pam mae gennym ddau neu dri chynllun



receive the central support that we can offer.

grant penodol ar gyfer y sector gwirfoddol, er mwyn sicrhau y bydd yn cael y gefnogaeth ganolog y gallwn ei gynnig.

**Brynle Williams:** I welcome quite a few of your answers, but the strain on mental health services is being compounded by an overdependence on an institutional model of care. According to a report, the Welsh Assembly Government was warned about this in 2003. Yet, since then, average mental health illness occupancy rates have increased, and have exceeded 100 per cent in some units. What assurances can you give that this trend of increasing overoccupancy will be reversed?

**Brynle Williams:** Croesawaf rai o'ch atebion, ond ychwanegir at y straen ar wasanaethau iechyd meddwl gan orddibyniaeth ar fodel sefydliadol o ofal. Yn ôl adroddiad, rhybuddiwyd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am hyn yn 2003. Eto, ers hynny, mae nifer y bobl sydd â salwch iechyd meddwl ac sy'n cael eu derbyn mewn unedau ar gyfartaledd wedi codi, ac wedi codi dros 100 y cant mewn rhai unedau. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi y caiff y duedd hon, lle caiff gormod o bobl eu derbyn mewn unedau, ei wrth-droi?

**Brian Gibbons:** What you say is correct, and you outlined one of the reasons why we have a target for local health communities to put crisis intervention teams in place. Such teams are predominantly community based. We know, from research evidence, that crisis intervention teams and community mental health teams intervening at an earlier stage in the disease process can prevent people from being admitted to hospital, and also facilitate earlier discharge.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'r hyn a ddywedwch yn gywir, ac yr ydych wedi amlinellu un o'r rhesymau pam y mae gennym darged i gymunedau iechyd lleol roi timau ymyriad argyfwng ar waith. Yn y gymuned yn bennaf mae timau o'r fath. Gwyddom, o dystiolaeth ymchwil, y gall timau ymyriad argyfwng a thimau iechyd meddwl cymunedol sy'n ymyrryd yn gynharach ym mhroses y clefyd, atal pobl rhag mynd i'r ysbyty, a sicrhau y cânt eu rhyddhau ynghynt hefyd.

2.20 p.m.

**Jenny Randerson:** You will be aware of the problems throughout Wales in setting up crisis teams. The problems are caused by the lack of specific funding for this. One of the knock-on problems is delayed transfers of care because far too many people are admitted to hospital with mental illness. Here in Cardiff, the planned closure of Whitchurch Hospital has been delayed, and there will not be sufficient money to establish all the crisis teams in Cardiff until the savings from the closure of the hospital have filtered through. Do you agree that this will create a dangerous gap in provision that is already poor, and what do you plan to do about it? Do you plan to restore the funding that your predecessor indicated would be available?

**Jenny Randerson:** Fe wyddoch am y problemau ledled Cymru o ran sefydlu timau argyfwng. Achosir y problemau oherwydd diffyg arian penodol ar gyfer hyn. Un o'r problemau yn sgîl hynny yw achosion o oedi wrth drosglwyddo gofal oherwydd bod gormod o bobl o lawer yn cael eu derbyn i'r ysbyty gyda salwch meddwl. Yma yng Nghaerdydd, mae'r bwriad i gau Ysbyty'r Eglwys Newydd wedi'i ohirio, ac ni fydd digon o arian ar gael i sefydlu'r holl dimau argyfwng yng Nghaerdydd nes bydd yr arbedion o gau'r ysbyty wedi dod i'r amlwg. A gytunwch y bydd hyn yn creu bwlch peryglus mewn darpariaeth sydd eisoes yn wael, a beth y bwriadwch ei wneud ynghylch hynny? A ydych yn bwriadu adfer yr arian yr awgrymodd eich rhagflaenydd a fyddai ar gael?

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the reasons why I announced on World Mental Health Day an

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r rhesymau penodol imi gyhoeddi £5 miliwn ychwanegol ar gyfer

additional £5 million for mental health services was specifically to start to lever-in the type of change that you mention, which, in many cases, is long overdue. Linked to that, we have the £75 million capital programme, which will allow the various health communities to have the necessary resources to invest in facilities to allow services to be devolved from the overcrowded hospital setting, which Brynle alluded to.

gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar Ddiwrnod Iechyd Meddwl y Byd oedd er mwyn dechrau gwireddu'r math o newid yr ydych yn sôn amdano ac y bu disgwyl hir amdano mewn llawer achos. Ynglwm â hynny, mae gennym y rhaglen gyfalaf £75 miliwn, a fydd yn caniatáu i'r amrywiol gymunedau iechyd gael yr adnoddau angenrheidiol i fuddsoddi mewn cyfleusterau, fel y gall gwasanaethau gael eu datganoli oddi wrth yr ysbytai gorlawn, fel y cyfeiriodd Brynle.

### **Blaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ym Maes Iechyd The Government's Priorities for Health**

**Q5 Helen Mary Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on the Government's priorities for health? OAQ0558(HSS)

**C5 Helen Mary Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau'r Llywodraeth ym maes iechyd? OAQ0558(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** 'Designed for Life' includes action to improve health, social care and wellbeing for all, and to transform services. It will focus in the first three years on improving coronary heart disease, cancer and mental health services and services for older people, children, those with chronic diseases and those awaiting elective treatment.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn cynnwys camau gweithredu i wella iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles pawb, ac i drawsnewid gwasanaethau. Bydd yn canolbwyntio yn y tair blynedd cyntaf ar wella gwasanaethau clefyd coronaidd y galon, canser ac iechyd meddwl, a gwasanaethau i bobl hyn, plant, pobl sydd â chlefyd cronig a phobl sy'n aros am driniaeth ddewisol.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I am sure that you will agree that there is a need, particularly in relation to cancer services, for end-of-life care and palliative care to receive priority. What plans do you have to ensure that services that were funded by the special grant to hospices three years ago are protected and, preferably, enhanced once the current underspend has been exhausted next year?

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yr wyf yn siwr y cytunwch fod angen rhoi blaenoriaeth i ofal diwedd oes a gofal lliniarol, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â gwasanaethau canser. Pa gynlluniau sydd gennych i sicrhau y bydd gwasanaethau a ariannwyd gan y grant arbennig i hosbisau dair blynedd yn ôl yn cael eu diogelu, ac o ddewis yn cael eu gwella pan fydd y tanwariant presennol wedi dod i ben y flwyddyn nesaf?

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the key aspects of ensuring that end-of-life services are provided is that they have become integrated into mainstream commissioning activity. It would be fair to say that there is some disappointment that that does not seem to have happened on a consistent basis. This is one of the reasons why, in allocating the residue of the money that went to the voluntary and private sector hospices, that is linked with the cancer networks and the local health boards, to ensure that those

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r agweddau allweddol ar sicrhau darparu gwasanaethau diwedd oes yw eu bod wedi'u hintegreiddio mewn gweithgarwch comisiynu prif ffrwd. Byddai'n deg dweud ei bod braidd yn siomedig nad yw hynny i'w weld wedi digwydd yn gyson. Dyna un o'r rhesymau, wrth glustnodi gweddill yr arian a aeth i hosbisau'r sector gwirfoddol a'r sector preifat, fod hynny wedi ei gysylltu â'r rhwydweithiau canser a'r byrddau iechyd lleol, er mwyn sicrhau bod y cysylltiadau

commissioning links have been created. In speaking about palliative care and end-of-life services, we also need to remember that the NHS provides the majority of those services, so we need to ensure that we are commissioning the full range of services and not just one particular aspect.

**Christine Chapman:** In the debate last week, you stated the importance of continuous consultation with the people of Wales for the success of the 'Designed for Life' programme, and I am sure that you are aware that, in Cynon valley, we have a good example of good practice with the Cynon valley forum, which was highlighted in the Wanless report. It is about developing appropriate priorities for my constituency. How can you ensure that the people of Wales continue to be placed at centre stage, as the people of Cynon valley have been, and that there are sufficient avenues to voice their opinions effectively?

**Brian Gibbons:** Health and social care services are about people looking after people, and, if you do not engage with the professionals delivering the service and the care recipients, you will almost certainly get the service reconfiguration wrong. Therefore, it is crucial that any organisation planning healthcare services needs to engage with the local community. How it does that will vary depending on the parts of Wales that people live in, but each local health board has people from carers' groups, the voluntary sector, service users, members of the public, as well as clinicians, so that is a good starting point. In the process of developing the health, social care and wellbeing plans, it is important that they go out to the widest range of organisations within an LHB area to ensure that the fullest level of engagement takes place.

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** From your seat last week, you sought to support the First Minister in his defence of the attack made by one of your colleagues in Westminster, Chris Bryant, on the health

comisiynu hynny wedi'u creu. Wrth siarad am ofal lliniarol a gwasanaethau diwedd oes, mae angen inni gofio hefyd mai'r GIG sy'n darparu'r rhan fwyaf o'r gwasanaethau hynny. Felly, mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn comisiynu'r amrywiaeth lawn o wasanaethau, nid un agwedd benodol yn unig.

**Christine Chapman:** Yn y ddafl yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddech yn sôn am bwysigrwydd ymgynghori'n barhaus â phobl Cymru er mwyn sicrhau llwyddiant y rhaglen 'Cynllun Oes', ac yr wyf yn siwr eich bod yn gwybod bod gennym ni yng nghwm Cynon enghraifft dda o arfer da gyda fforwm cwm Cynon. Tynnwyd sylw ato yn adroddiad Wanless. Mae a wnelo â datblygu blaenoriaethau priodol ar gyfer fy etholaeth. Sut y gallwch sicrhau bod pobl Cymru yn parhau i chwarae rhan allweddol, fel mae pobl cwm Cynon wedi'i wneud, a bod ganddynt ffyrdd digonol i leisio eu barn yn effeithiol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae a wnelo gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol â phobl yn gofalu am bobl, ac os na fyddwch yn ymgysylltu â'r gweithwyr proffesiynol sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth a'r bobl sy'n cael y gofal, yr ydych bron yn siwr o ailgyflunio'r gwasanaeth yn anghywir. Felly, mae'n hanfodol fod angen i unrhyw sefydliad sy'n cynllunio gwasanaethau gofal iechyd ymgysylltu â'r gymuned leol. Bydd y dull a ddefnyddia i wneud hynny yn amrywio yn ôl y rhannau o Gymru lle mae pobl yn byw. Ond mae pob bwrdd iechyd lleol yn cynnwys pobl o grwpiau gofalwyr, y sector gwirfoddol, defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, y cyhoedd, yn ogystal â chlinigwyr, ac felly mae hynny'n fan cychwyn da. Yn y broses o ddatblygu'r cynlluniau iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles, mae'n bwysig iddynt gael eu darparu i'r amrywiaeth ehangaf o sefydliadau o fewn ardal BILL, er mwyn sicrhau bod y nifer mwyaf posibl yn cymryd rhan.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** O'ch sedd yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddech yn ceisio cefnogi'r Prif Weinidog wrth iddo amddiffyn yr ymosodiad a wnaed gan un o'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan,

service in Wales. You will now have the opportunity to answer for yourself. I will quote a comment from Chris Bryant's paper. He said that

'to reject policy ideas that do seem to have delivered improvements in England and to do so purely as to establish clear red water would be irresponsible and wrong. Moreover, I worry that to adopt a political stance that rejects any element of choice in the NHS in effect sides with a producer-driven rationale for the service'.

Do you agree with that?

**Brian Gibbons:** I would probably agree with three quarters of the quote; I would not agree with the last part of it. I am not convinced that competition, and commercially driven competition in particular, is necessarily going to deliver the best outcomes for patients in Wales. However, I would totally agree with some of the points that Chris Bryant made on pursuing non-dogmatic policy and being willing to learn from the best, whether it is in Wales, England, the United States or any other part of the world.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That is clear, perhaps. I will put to you another point that Chris Bryant makes in his paper. It is quite a devastating attack on the Welsh Assembly Government's health policy. He says:

'but the evidence suggests that our Welsh NHS is not improving as fast as its English counterpart—and this is despite receiving more funding per head of population than in England'.

That is true on both counts, is it not?

**Brian Gibbons:** One of the problems with Chris Bryant's leaflet, and the quote that you gave, is that, if what he has said is accurate, the NHS Confederation is incorrect in its estimation of the type of convergence that is taking place between spending in Wales and in England. Chris Bryant and the NHS

Chris Bryant, ar y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru. Cewch y cyfle yn awr i ateb drosoch eich hun. Dyfynnaf sylw o bapur Chris Bryant. Meddai

byddai gwrthod syniadau polisi yr ymddengys iddynt sicrhau gwelliannau yn Lloegr, a gwneud hynny dim ond er mwyn creu gwahaniaeth clir rhwng y Blaid Lafur yn San Steffan ac ym Mae Caerdydd, yn anghyfrifol ac yn anghywir. Yn ogystal, pryderaf y byddai mabwysiadu safiad gwleidyddol sy'n gwrthod unrhyw elfen o ddewis yn y GIG yn y bôn yn ochri gyda rhesymeg sy'n seiliedig ar gynhyrchwyr ar gyfer y gwasanaeth.

A ydych yn cytuno â hynny?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae'n siwr y byddwn yn cytuno â thri chwarter y dyfyniad; ni fyddwn yn cytuno â'r rhan olaf. Nid wyf wedi fy narbwylllo mai cystadleuaeth, a chystadleuaeth yn seiliedig ar fasnach yn benodol, a fydd o reidrwydd yn sicrhau'r canlyniadau gorau i gleifion Cymru. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn cytuno'n llwyr â rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Chris Bryant am fynd ar drywydd polisi amhendant a bod yn fodlon dysgu gan y goreuon, boed yng Nghymru, Lloegr, yr Unol Daleithiau neu unrhyw ran arall o'r byd.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n glir, efallai. Codaf bwynt arall a wnaeth Chris Bryant yn ei bapur. Mae'n ymosodiad digon chwyrn ar bolisi iechyd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru. Meddai:

ond mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu nad yw GIG Cymru yn gwella mor gyflym â GIG Lloegr—a hynny er cael mwy o arian y pen o'r boblogaeth na Lloegr.

Mae'r ddau sylw hynny'n wir, onid ydynt?

**Brian Gibbons:** Un o'r problemau gyda thaflen Chris Bryant, a'r dyfyniad a roesoch, yw hyn: os yw'r hyn a ddywedodd yn gywir, mae Cydffederasiwn y GIG yn anghywir yn ei amcangyfrif o'r math o gydgyfeirio sy'n digwydd rhwng gwariant yng Nghymru ac yn Lloegr. Ni all Chris Bryant a

Confederation cannot both be right. If I had to choose between the two, I would suspect that the NHS Confederation was correct.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** That is an interesting response. Let me put something else to you; this is quite devastating, Minister, and it does not come from the opposition. This is a Labour MP telling you that you are going down the wrong path. He talks about the need to refocus public services and says that

‘The belief that because we are a relatively small country our public services do not suffer from the dangers of monopoly, institutional conservatism or excessive size could be dangerously naïve’.

He is saying that you have taken a conservative approach to running the health service, that you do not want to see any change and that you want to see producer-driven policies. Are you agreeing with Chris Bryant? What sort of pressure is Westminster putting on you to change your policies? That is what we want to know.

**Brian Gibbons:** I can give you a short answer: zero.

**The Presiding Officer:** Who is this Chris Bryant? I call on Leighton Andrews.

**Leighton Andrews:** Do you agree that Chris Bryant welcomes in this pamphlet the work that you have done through the second offer scheme and other measures to improve the situation in Wales? I am pleased—*[Interruption.]*

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I want to hear this interesting supplementary question.

**Leighton Andrews:** I am pleased that I will be welcoming you to the Rhondda in January for the start of the work on the new Rhondda hospital. Do you not agree that that hospital, when it is completed, will make a major contribution to the health and wellbeing of my constituents in the Rhondda?

Chyddfederasiwn y GIG fod yn gywir. Pe bai'n rhaid imi ddewis rhwng y ddau, byddwn yn tybio mai Cyddfederasiwn y GIG sy'n gywir.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae hynny'n ymateb diddorol. Gadewch imi godi rhywbeth arall gyda chi; mae hyn yn sylw digon hallt, Weinidog, ac nid yr wrthblaid sy'n ei ddweud. Dyma AS Llafur yn dweud wrthyhych eich bod yn mynd ar hyd y trywydd anghywir. Mae'n sôn am yr angen am ailffocysu gwasanaethau cyhoeddus, ac meddai

Gallai credu nad yw ein gwasanaethau cyhoeddus yn dioddef oherwydd peryglon monopoli, ceidwadaeth sefydliadol na maint gormodol oherwydd ein bod yn wlad gymharol fach yn beryglus o naif.

Mae'n dweud eich bod wedi mabwysiadu ymagwedd geidwadol tuag at redeg y gwasanaeth iechyd, nad ydych am weld unrhyw newidiadau, a'ch bod am gael polisiau sy'n seiliedig ar y cynhyrhydd. A ydych yn cytuno â Chris Bryant? Pa fath o bwysau y mae San Steffan yn eu rhoi arnoch i newid eich polisiau? Dyna'r hyn yr ydym am ei wybod.

**Brian Gibbons:** Gallaf roi ateb byr ichi: dim.

**Y Llywydd:** Pwy yw'r Chris Bryant hwn? Galwaf ar Leighton Andrews.

**Leighton Andrews:** A gytunwch fod Chris Bryant, yn yn daflen hon, yn croesawu'r gwaith a wnaethoch drwy gynllun yr ail gynnyg a mesurau eraill i wella'r sefyllfa yng Nghymru? Yr wyf yn falch—*[Torri ar draws.]*

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf am glywed y cwestiwn atodol diddorol hwn.

**Leighton Andrews:** Yr wyf yn falch o ddweud y byddaf yn eich croesawu i Rhondda ym mis Ionawr i weld dechrau'r gwaith ar ysbyty newydd Rhondda. Oni chytunwch y bydd yr ysbyty hwnnw, pan gaiff ei gwblhau, yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr i iechyd a lles fy etholwyr yn Rhondda?

**Brian Gibbons:** Absolutely. Anyone who is taken as a serious commentator on the NHS in Wales having said that policy development is driven by conservatism, particularly when we are developing 'Designed for Life' and 'Designed with Care', undertaking the delivering of emergency care services project and delivering project 2009 to achieve shorter waiting times, must be sadly ill-informed about what is happening in Wales.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Palliative care hospices provide valuable and essential services to many people, many of whom are coming to the end of their lives. In England, those hospices receive around 40 per cent of their funding from the public purse to help with the costs of running, administering and providing treatment to those patients who are in those hospices. In Wales, the picture is very different. A hospice that receives between 10 per cent and 15 per cent is exceptionally lucky. Are you not the slightest bit ashamed of this dreadful inequality between Wales and England?

2.30 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** You are not taking into account the fact that the majority of palliative care services here in Wales is provided by the NHS and not the voluntary sector, as I said to Helen Mary. When you look at the statistics and take the full picture into account, you may wish to reconsider your point.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I will leave the invitation from Leighton Andrews for you to take your shovel to the Rhondda for the people there to dig holes for you.

Turning to another of your targets, the official statistics have been published today and they show that the number of people waiting more than 12 months for a first outpatient appointment is 10,077. Last year, 11 months ago, your predecessor said that, by the end of March, that figure would be zero. Will you reach that target?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Mae'n rhaid bod unrhyw un a ystyrir yn sylwebydd go iawn ar y GIG yng Nghymru, ar ôl dweud y caiff y broses o ddatblygu polisiau ei llywio gan geidwadaeth, yn enwedig a ninnau'n datblygu 'Cynllun Oes' a 'Cynllun Gofal', yn ymgymryd â'r gwaith o ddarparu prosiect gwasanaethau gofal brys, ac yn darparu prosiect 2009 er mwyn sicrhau amseroedd aros byrrach, wedi cael gwybodaeth anghywir am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Mae hosbisau gofal lliniarol yn darparu gwasanaethau gwerthfawr a hanfodol i nifer o bobl, nifer ohonynt yn dod i ddiwedd eu hoes. Yn Lloegr, mae'r hosbisau hynny'n cael tua 40 y cant o'u harian o bwrs y wlad i helpu gyda'r costau rhedeg, gweinyddu a rhoi triniaeth i'r cleifion hynny yn yr hosbisau hynny. Yng Nghymru, mae'r darlun yn wahanol iawn. Mae hosbis sy'n cael rhwng 10 y cant a 15 y cant yn ffodus iawn. Onid ydych yn teimlo cywilydd braidd am yr anghydraddoldeb ofnadwy hwn rhwng Cymru a Lloegr?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid ydych yn ystyried y ffaith fod y mwyafrif o wasanaethau gofal lliniarol yma yng Nghymru yn cael eu darparu gan y GIG, nid gan y sector gwirfoddol, fel y dywedais wrth Helen Mary. Pan edrychwch ar yr ystadegau ac ystyried y darlun llawn, efallai y byddwch am ailystyried eich pwynt.

**Arweinydd Grwp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Gadawaf y gwahoddiad gan Leighton Andrews ichi fynd â'ch rhaw i Rondda er mwyn i'r bobl yno dorri tyllau ichi.

I droi at un o'ch targedau eraill, cyhoeddwyd yr ystadegau swyddogol heddiw ac maent yn dangos bod 10,077 o bobl yn aros mwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad cyntaf fel cleifion allanol. Y llynedd, 11 mis yn ôl, dywedodd eich rhagflaenydd na fyddai neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth. A fyddwch yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw?

**Brian Gibbons:** We are optimistic that we will achieve that target. It is challenging, but compared with this time last year, if you look at the number of patients that had to come off the waiting list to deliver the 18-month target, the number of patients is roughly of similar proportions. Therefore, on the basis of past experience and given the commitment and dedication of staff in the NHS in Wales, I am fairly confident that we will reach it.

**Michael German:** You are right to say that it is a challenging target, given where you are now. Over the last 12 months, the number of people waiting has reduced by just over 1,100 every month on average, which means that, if you continue at the rate of decline that you have been talking about, by the time you reach your zero target date, 5,205 patients will still be waiting more than 12 months for out-patient care. Given that you have got so far and are so optimistic that you will reach the target by the end of March, could you tell me what you are doing this month that is so different from what you did in previous months and from what you will do next month to double the number of people coming off those waiting lists? What are you doing this month that is twice as good as what you were doing last month?

**Brian Gibbons:** If you look at the patterns of how the service is taking people off waiting lists, you will see that the rate is speeding up. If you look at the profile, even of last year's performance, you will see that there was—as there usually is in the first quarter or first four to five months of any new financial year—either a bounce backwards or a period where the performance reaches a plateau and then starts to pick up again. That is what happened last year and what has happened every year in which we have had well-driven targets. That is probably the way in which things will go again.

There is probably a more important issue here and I hope that we will be able to address it in moving towards our more longer term targets, namely that the stop that usually

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn obeithiol y byddwn yn cyrraedd y targed hwnnw. Mae'n heriol, ond o'i gymharu â'r adeg hon y llynedd, os edrychwch ar nifer y cleifion y bu'n rhaid iddynt ddod oddi ar y rhestr aros er mwyn cyrraedd y targed 18 mis, mae nifer y cleifion yr un fath, fwy neu lai. Felly, ar sail profiadau'r gorffennol ac ymrwymiad ac ymroddiad staff y GIG yng Nghymru, yr wyf yn weddol hyderus y byddwn yn ei gyrraedd.

**Michael German:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle pan ddywedwch ei fod yn darged heriol, o ystyried y sefyllfa bresennol. Dros y 12 mis diwethaf, mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros wedi gostwng ychydig dros 1,100 bob mis ar gyfartaledd. Mae hynny'n golygu, os parhewch ar y gyfradd ostwng yr ydych wedi bod yn sôn amdani, erbyn ichi gyrraedd eich dyddiad targed o ran sicrhau nad oes neb yn aros, bydd 5,205 o gleifion yn dal i aros mwy na 12 mis am ofal fel cleifion allanol. O gofio eich bod wedi cyrraedd y fan hon a'ch bod mor obeithiol y byddwch yn cyrraedd y targed erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth, a allech ddweud wrthyf beth yr ydych yn ei wneud y mis hwn sydd mor wahanol i'r hyn a wnaethoch mewn misoedd blaenorol a'r hyn a wnewch y mis nesaf i ddyblu nifer y bobl sy'n dod oddi ar y rhestrau aros hynny? Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud y mis hwn sydd ddwywaith cystal â'r hyn a wnaethoch fis diwethaf?

**Brian Gibbons:** Os edrychwch ar batrymau'r ffordd mae'r gwasanaeth yn cymryd pobl oddi ar restrau aros, fe welwch fod y gyfradd yn cyflymu. Os edrychwch ar y proffil, hyd yn oed ar gyfer perfformiad y llynedd, fe welwch—fel sy'n arferol yn chwarter cyntaf neu bedwar neu bum mis cyntaf unrhyw flwyddyn ariannol newydd—fod naill ai cam yn ôl neu gyfnod lle mae'r perfformiad yn sefydlogi ac yna'n dechrau cynyddu unwaith eto. Dyna a ddigwyddodd y llynedd, a dyna sydd wedi digwydd bob blwyddyn lle yr ydym wedi gosod targedau da. Dyna a fydd yn digwydd unwaith eto, fwy na thebyg.

Mae'n debyg fod yma fater pwysicach, a gobeithio y gallwn fynd i'r afael ag ef wrth symud tuag at ein targedau tymor hwy, sef bod y saib sydd fel rheol yn digwydd yn

takes place in the first quarter of every financial year is a significant barrier towards our being able to maintain consistency and a smoother pattern of reducing waiting times. With a bit of luck in relation to the draft budget statement, if we can give the NHS the certainty of continued funding year on year going up to 2009, this consolidation of further progress will be replaced by consistent progress to 2009.

**Michael German:** I hope that you are not saying that the short-term target will not be met and that we will, therefore, move on to a longer term target at some time in the distance without realising that your Government has set a target of zero, namely that no-one should be waiting more than 12 months for a first out-patient appointment, by the end of March. As you have rightly admitted, you will have to deal with winter pressures in the next month or two, but you still have not convinced me that that target is achievable given the likely pressures in January and February. You have not told us what you will do that is twice as good this month, next month and the month after that. That is what we need to hear because, otherwise, you will not meet your target. If you do not meet your target, how can we believe in any of the targets that you set?

**Brian Gibbons:** If you went to the trouble of looking at what happened last year, you would see that we managed to reduce the number of patients on the waiting list over this period last year to the end of March. That is roughly equivalent to what we have to achieve from this time to the end of March next year. The level of performance required to deliver the waiting times this year is no different from that which was achieved last year. The best way of predicting what will happen in future is to look at what has happened in the past. We did it last year, and I have no doubt that we will do it this year.

ystod chwarter cyntaf pob blwyddyn ariannol yn rhwystr sylweddol sy'n ein hatal rhag gallu cynnal cysondeb a phatrwm mwy llyfn ar gyfer lleihau amseroedd aros. Gyda rhywfaint o lwc mewn perthynas â'r datganiad am y gyllideb ddrafft, os gallwn roi'r sicrwydd arian parhaus o flwyddyn i flwyddyn i'r GIG tan 2009, bydd y broses hon o atgyfnerthu cynnydd pellach yn cael ei disodli gan gynnydd cyson erbyn 2009.

**Michael German:** Gobeithio nad ydych yn dweud na chaiff y targed byrdymor ei gyrraedd ac y byddwn, felly, yn symud ymlaen i darged tymor hwy rywbryd yn y dyfodol, heb sylweddoli bod eich Llywodraeth wedi gosod targed lle na fydd neb yn aros mwy na 12 mis am apwyntiad cyntaf fel claf allanol, erbyn diwedd mis Mawrth. Fel yr ydych wedi cyfaddef, a hynny'n gywir, bydd rhaid ichi ymdrin â phwysau'r gaeaf yn yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf, ond nid ydych wedi llwyddo i'm darbwyllo eto y gellir cyrraedd y targed hwnnw o ystyried y pwysau tebygol ym mis Ionawr a mis Chwefror. Nid ydych wedi dweud wrthym beth y byddwch yn ei wneud sydd ddwywaith cystal y mis hwn, y mis nesaf a'r mis wedyn. Dyna y mae angen inni ei glywed oherwydd, fel arall, ni fyddwch yn cyrraedd eich targed. Os na fyddwch yn cyrraedd eich targed, sut y gallwn gredu unrhyw un o'r targedau yr ydych yn eu gosod?

**Brian Gibbons:** Pe baech yn trafferthu edrych ar yr hyn a ddigwyddodd y llynedd, byddech yn gweld inni lwyddo i ostwng nifer y cleifion ar y rhestr aros dros y cyfnod hwn y llynedd hyd at ddiwedd mis Mawrth. Mae hynny'n cyfateb yn fras i'r hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei gyflawni o hyn tan ddiwedd mis Mawrth y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid yw'r perfformiad angenrheidiol i gyflawni'r targed o ran amseroedd aros eleni yn wahanol i'r hyn a gyflawnwyd y llynedd. Y ffordd orau i rag-weld yr hyn a fydd yn digwydd yn y dyfodol yw edrych ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd yn y gorffennol. Gwnaethom hynny y llynedd, ac nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth y byddwn yn llwyddo eleni.



**Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Canolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru)**  
**Health and Social Care (Mid and West Wales)**

**Q6 Lisa Francis:** Will the Minister make a statement on his priorities in health and social care in Mid and West Wales?  
 OAQ0513(HSS)

**C6 Lisa Francis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ei flaenoriaethau mewn iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru?  
 OAQ0513(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** ‘Designed for Life’ involves action to improve health, social care and wellbeing for all, and to transform services. It will focus on preventing the unnecessary deterioration of patients and undertaking more activity to promote their independence and autonomy.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae ‘Cynllun Oes’ yn golygu cymryd camau i wella iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles pawb, ac i drawsnewid gwasanaethau. Bydd yn canolbwyntio ar atal cleifion rhag gwaethygu’n ddiangen a gwneud mwy i hyrwyddo eu hannibyniaeth.

**Lisa Francis:** The acting chief executive of Pembrokeshire and Derwen NHS Trust considers that Withybush Hospital will not be downgraded, but improved. She speaks of clinical networking and specialist hospital centres. Meanwhile, the hospital consultants—many of whom are here today—have gone on record as saying that service cuts could result in the death of patients because of the extra travelling needed to reach other hospitals. It stuns me, Minister, to know that you have lived in Wales for most of your life, and yet you still do not seem to understand that the very geography of Mid and West Wales is the reason why front-line services need to be kept open. How many deaths will it take for you to make those a priority?

**Lisa Francis:** Mae prif weithredwr Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro a Derwen dros dro o’r farn na fydd Ysbyty Llwynhelyg yn cael ei israddio, ond y bydd yn cael ei wella. Mae’n cyfeirio at rwydweithio clinigol a chanolfannau ysbyty arbenigol. Yn y cyfamser, mae meddygon ymgynghorol yr ysbyty—ac mae nifer ohonynt yma heddiw—wedi dweud yn swyddogol y gallai cwtogi gwasanaethau olygu bod cleifion yn marw oherwydd bod angen iddynt deithio ymhellach i gyrraedd ysbytai eraill. Mae’n fy syfrdanu, Weinidog, i wybod eich bod wedi byw yng Nghymru am y rhan fwyaf o’ch oes, ac eto nid yw’n ymddangos eich bod yn deall mai daearyddiaeth y canolbarth a’r gorllewin yw’r rheswm pam mae angen cadw gwasanaethau rheng flaen ar agor. Faint o farwolaethau fydd eu hangen cyn ichi eu gwneud yn flaenoriaeth?

**Brian Gibbons:** The challenge to you, Lisa, is what needs to be done to ensure that people in south-west Wales get safe, quality-assured services. The purpose of our strategy is to put in place a type of health service that will deliver just that. If you have an alternative strategy to ‘Designed for Life’ and the principles that underpin it, I would be very grateful if you would send it to me. Otherwise, what you have said is absolutely empty rhetoric. If you have an alternative policy to ‘Designed for Life’, let us see it. If you have a better solution, we are always ready to listen and to engage in dialogue and debate. [*Interruption.*]

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr her i chi, Lisa, yw’r hyn y mae angen ei wneud i sicrhau bod pobl yn y de-orllewin yn cael gwasanaethau diogel o safon sicr. Diben ein strategaeth yw darparu gwasanaeth iechyd a fydd yn cyflawni hynny. Os oes gennych strategaeth arall i’w chynnig yn lle ‘Cynllun Oes’ a’r egwyddorion sy’n sylfaen iddi, byddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn pe byddech yn ei hanfon ataf. Fel arall, mae’r hyn yr ydych wedi ei ddweud yn rhethreg hollol wag. Os oes gennych bolisi arall yn lle ‘Cynllun Oes’, gadewch inni ei weld. Os oes gennych ateb gwell, yr ydym bob amser yn barod i wrando ac i gymryd rhan mewn trafodaeth a dadl. [*Torri ar draws.*]

**The Presiding Officer:** Order.

**Brian Gibbons:** However, I do not suspect that I will receive any correspondence on this, because you have no alternative strategy.

**Val Lloyd:** People value their local health services, and they understandably become anxious at the thought of change. If the proposals in 'Designed for Life' for improved-quality services are to be a success, it is very important that there is public engagement and consultation that provides factual and correct information on the benefits to be gained. In light of that, what are you doing to ensure that the media are not the only source of information so that my constituents and others in the Mid and West Wales region receive timely and accurate information?

**Brian Gibbons:** You make a very important point. People must understand the challenges that we face if we are to deliver world-class services for all parts of Wales. People need the reassurance that the type of service that they are receiving is, first, sustainable, and, secondly, safe and of a high quality. That is why we published, for example, in Mid and West Wales, 'The Case for Change', which we have tried to distribute as widely as possible in south-west Wales. My officials have been to numerous meetings in south-west Wales on this issue. I have also met several key stakeholders in south-west Wales in order to listen to their concerns. I will be meeting more this afternoon. The level of engagement with the public and clinicians is a priority, because if the clinicians do not believe that the service is going to deliver quality care and if the public is not reassured, delivering progress will be extremely difficult and probably self-defeating.

**Elin Jones:** Minister, you are recorded as having directed the Pembrokeshire NHS trust not to close beds at Tenby hospital as part of its recent cost-saving exercise. Will you commit to giving a similar direction to the Ceredigion and Mid Wales NHS Trust not to close beds in Cardigan and Tregaron

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn.

**Brian Gibbons:** Fodd bynnag, nid wyf yn meddwl y caf unrhyw ohebiaeth am hyn, am nad oes gennych strategaeth arall.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae pobl yn gwerthfawrogi eu gwasanaethau iechyd lleol, ac yn naturiol maent yn pryderu wrth feddwl am newid. Er mwyn i'r cynigion yn 'Cynllun Oes' ar gyfer gwasanaethau o well ansawdd lwyddo, mae'n bwysig iawn ymgysylltu ac ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd er mwyn casglu gwybodaeth ffeithiol a chywir am y manteision. Yng ngoleuni hynny, beth a wnewch i sicrhau nad y cyfryngau yw'r unig ffynhonnell wybodaeth, fel y bydd fy etholwyr ac eraill yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin yn cael gwybodaeth amserol a chywir?

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gennych bwynt pwysig iawn. Rhaid i bobl ddeall yr heriau sy'n ein hwynebu os ydym i ddarparu gwasanaethau o'r radd flaenaf i bob rhan o Gymru. Mae angen sicrhau pobl bod y math o wasanaeth a gânt yn gynaliadwy yn gyntaf, ac yn ail yn ddiogel ac o safon uchel. Dyna pam y bu inni gyhoeddi 'The Case for Change', yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, ac yr ydym wedi ceisio ei ddsbarthu mor eang â phosibl yn y de-orllewin. Mae fy swyddogion wedi bod mewn nifer o gyfarfodydd yn y de-orllewin ar y mater hwn. Yr wyf fi hefyd wedi cyfarfod â nifer o randdeiliaid allweddol yn y de-orllewin i wrando ar eu pryderon. Byddaf yn cyfarfod â mwy ohonynt y prynhawn yma. Mae lefel yr ymwneud â'r cyhoedd a chlinigwyr yn flaenoriaeth, oherwydd os nad yw'r clinigwyr yn credu bod y gwasanaeth yn mynd i ddarparu gofal o safon, ac os nad yw'r cyhoedd yn teimlo'n sicr o hynny, bydd sicrhau cynnydd yn anodd iawn ac yn debygol o drechu ei hun.

**Elin Jones:** Weinidog, cofnodir ichi gyfarwyddo Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Sir Benfro i beidio â chau gwelyau yn ysbyty Dinbych-y-pysgod fel rhan o'i hymarfer i arbed costau'n ddiweddar. Yn yr un modd, a fyddwch yn ymrwymo i gyfarwyddo Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ceredigion a

hospitals?

Chanolbarth Cymru i beidio â chau gwelyau yn ysbytai Aberteifi a Thregaron?

2.40 p.m.

**Brian Gibbons:** All that was said in relation to Tenby hospital was that the local health board should honour its agreement with local people in terms of the way in which that would be managed. That is reasonable. If people engage with the health service, then we have to work to our side of the deal as well. I do not know of any clear proposals to close beds in Tregaron hospital, but if you want to write to me giving me the chapter and verse on that, I would be grateful to see it.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** The Minister for Health and Social Services seems defensive about 'Designed for Life', at least insofar as it impacts on Mid and West Wales, and with good reason. It is absolutely correct that you are protecting Tenby hospital, and it is quite right that you should. However, it raises questions about all of the other hospitals where services are being cut back or are under threat of being cut back. You have certainly received a letter from me about Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals, and I have had a response from you, but it does not deal with the core issue of what you are doing to ensure that there will not be any cuts to the services in Ceredigion. It is all very well asking Lisa Francis for a strategy, but we thought that you were the one responsible for the strategy. What are you doing about the threats to the services at Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals specifically?

**Brian Gibbons:** If we have outlined our strategy in 'Designed for Life', and you do not think that that is fit for purpose, I think that it is reasonable to ask for your alternative proposals to inform the debate. If you do not have any proposals, which I suspect is the case, clearly, we will not hear from you. However, if you have an alternative set of proposals in contradistinction to 'Designed for Life', we would certainly be pleased to hear them. However, 'Designed for Life' is not a defensive strategy; it is a positive step for the NHS and social care towards ensuring

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr hyn a ddywedwyd mewn perthynas ag ysbyty Dinbych-y-pysgod oedd y dylai'r bwrdd iechyd lleol anrhydeddu ei gytundeb gyda phobl leol o ran y modd y byddai hynny'n cael ei reoli. Mae hynny'n rhesymol. Os yw pobl yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd, yna rhaid i ni anrhydeddu ein hochr ni o'r fargen hefyd. Ni wn am unrhyw gynigion clir i gau gwelyau yn ysbyty Tregaron, ond os hoffech ysgrifennu ataf i draethu am hynny, byddwn yn ddiolchgar am gael ei weld.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Ymddengys fod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn amddiffyn 'Cynllun Oes', o leiaf i'r graddau y mae'n effeithio ar y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, a chyda rheswm da. Mae'n hollol gywir eich bod yn diogelu ysbyty Dinbych-y-pysgod, ac yr ydych yn iawn i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n codi cwestiynau am yr holl ysbytai eraill lle caiff gwasanaethau eu cwtogi neu lle mae bygythiad o hynny. Yr ydych yn sicr wedi cael llythyr gennyf fi am ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi, ac yr wyf wedi cael ymateb gennych. Ond nid yw'n mynd i'r afael â mater craidd yr hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau na fydd y gwasanaethau yng Ngheredigion yn cael eu cwtogi. Digon hawdd gofyn i Lisa Francis am strategaeth, ond yr oeddem yn credu mai chi oedd yn gyfrifol am y strategaeth. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud am y bygythiadau i'r gwasanaethau yn ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi yn benodol?

**Brian Gibbons:** Os ydym wedi amlinellu ein strategaeth yn 'Cynllun Oes', ac os na chredwch fod hwnnw'n addas at y diben, credaf ei bod yn rhesymol gofyn am eich cynigion gwahanol chi i ychwanegu at y ddadl. Os nad oes gennych unrhyw gynigion, fel yr wyf yn amau, yna yn amlwg ni chlywn gennych. Fodd bynnag, os oes gennych gynigion gwahanol sy'n groes i 'Cynllun Oes', byddem yn falch o'u clywed yn sicr. Fodd bynnag, ni strategaeth amddiffynnol yw 'Cynllun Oes'; mae'n gam cadarnhaol i'r GIG a gofal cymdeithasol tuag at sicrhau bod

that we have a world-class health service that we can be proud of in Wales.

**Nick Bourne:** I notice that you have not answered the specific question that I asked about Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals. You are the Minister for Health and Social Services. You are not the one asking the questions; we are. I look forward to the day when it will be otherwise, but, at the moment, you answer our questions. What are you doing about the services in Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals, which are threatened with cutbacks? It is a clear question; let us have a clear answer.

**Brian Gibbons:** In the last two to three years, the level of resources that have gone into the Ceredigion health community has gone up by 25 per cent. I understand, in relation to Tregaron hospital, that the local health board and partners are engaging in a discussion regarding the future use of the beds in Tregaron Hospital. I am not aware of any specific proposals to close them, as you are suggesting, but there is certainly a debate regarding the use of those beds. In Cardigan, the outline business plan is being worked up so that we can look at a capital bid to improve the range of services being delivered at Cardigan, to deliver the type of integrated primary and social care services that that type of community needs. I have previously told Elin Jones that if the local health community is able to work up the plans in Cardigan it will be the type of innovative exemplar practice that epitomises the ethos of 'Designed for Life'.

**Nick Bourne:** Cutting through a certain amount of waffle there, you obviously know a bit about the threat to these beds, which you previously suggested that you did not. It is clear that in discussing the future use of these beds they are talking about withdrawing some of them. It is about nothing else, let me assure you. You will find that out if you go into the communities. It is not limited to Tregaron and Cardigan; the same thing is happening in Llanidloes and Builth Wells, and we have seen that you have had to intervene in the case of Tenby. Can we have some equity across the whole of Mid and West Wales so that we ensure that none of

gennym wasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf y gallwn ymfalchio ynddo yng Nghymru.

**Nick Bourne:** Sylwaf nad ydych wedi ateb y cwestiwn penodol a ofynnais am ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi. Chi yw'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol. Nid chi sy'n gofyn y cwestiynau, ond ni. Edrychaf ymlaen at y diwrnod pan fydd y gwrthwyneb yn wir, ond ar hyn o bryd, chi sy'n ateb ein cwestiynau ni. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud am y gwasanaethau yn ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi, lle mae bygythiad cwtogi? Mae'n gwestiwn clir; gadewch inni gael ateb clir.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn ystod y ddwy neu dair blynedd diwethaf, mae'r adnoddau a ddyrannwyd ar gyfer cymuned iechyd Ceredigion wedi cynyddu 25 y cant. O ran ysbyty Tregaron, deallaf fod y bwrdd iechyd lleol a'i bartneriaid yn trafod defnyddio gwelyau yn Ysbyty Tregaron yn y dyfodol. Ni wn am unrhyw gynigion penodol i'w cau, fel yr awgrymwch, ond yn sicr mae dadl ynghylch defnyddio'r gwelyau hynny. Yn Aberteifi, mae'r cynllun busnes amlinellol yn cael ei lunio er mwyn inni allu edrych ar gynig cyfalaf i wella'r amrywiaeth gwasanaethau a ddarperir yn Aberteifi, er mwyn darparu'r math o wasanaethau gofal sylfaenol a gofal cymdeithasol integredig y mae eu hangen ar y math hwnnw o gymuned. Yr wyf wedi dweud wrth Elin Jones yn y gorffennol, os gall y gymuned iechyd leol lunio'r cynlluniau yn Aberteifi, dyna'r math o arfer enghreifftiol arloesol sy'n adlewyrchu ethos 'Cynllun Oes'.

**Nick Bourne:** Gan anwybyddu tipyn o siarad gwag, yr ydych yn amlwg yn gwybod rhywfaint am y bygythiad i gau'r gwelyau hyn, er eich bod yn awgrymu gynt nad oeddech yn gwybod. Mae'n amlwg, wrth drafod defnyddio'r gwelyau hyn yn y dyfodol, eu bod yn siarad am gael gwared ar rai ohonynt. Nid yw'n golygu dim byd arall, gallaf eich sicrhau. Fe welwch hynny os ewch i mewn i'r cymunedau. Nid yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi yn unig y mae hyn yn digwydd; mae'r un peth yn digwydd yn Llanidloes a Llanfair-ym-Muallt, a gwelsom eich bod wedi gorfod ymyrryd yn achos Dinbych-y-pysgod. A allwn gael rhywfaint o

these hospitals faces the serious withdrawal of some of these services or cutbacks? That is what we are asking for.

**Brian Gibbons:** Your last point is the kernel of the issue, namely that the community hospital network in Wales exists to provide services. The key challenge for all community hospital networks is whether they provide the best-quality services for their community. If, in particular situations, those hospitals do not provide the best quality of service for their communities, for example, those hospitals are preventing service redesign, which means that people are automatically admitted to these community hospitals rather than being looked after in their home. Quite rightly, the services at those hospitals should be looked at and I would hope that you would agree with that principle.

We have to look at the role that community hospitals play, not as bricks and mortar but in terms of the services that they provide, and whether they are delivering quality services to the community. If they are, then, in many instances, the community hospitals will have a bright future. If a community hospital is such that it is not conducive to delivering quality services, its future must be looked at. However, that must be the criterion.

**Kirsty Williams:** To enlighten you and Mr Bourne on the true situation at Builth Wells hospital, the local health board has withdrawn its threat to temporarily close beds, because any savings associated with that would not simply be accrued between now and April. Instead, the local health board, in partnership with the local health forum, has agreed to submit to you a capital bid to develop a primary community and social care unit in the hospital in Builth Wells to address the needs in that community. Will you look favourably at such a bid, which I believe truly sits at the heart of what 'Designed for Life' is all about?

**Brian Gibbons:** Absolutely. 'Designed for Life' is underpinned by tens of millions of

degwch ar draws y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, fel y gallwn sicrhau na fydd yr un o'r ysbytai hyn yn wynebu colli rhai o'r gwasanaethau hyn neu eu cwtogi, sy'n fater difrifol? Dyna yr ydym yn gofyn amdano.

**Brian Gibbons:** Eich pwynt olaf yw cnewyllyn y mater, sef bod y rhwydwaith ysbytai cymuned yng Nghymru yn bodoli i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Yr her allweddol sy'n wynebu pob rhwydwaith ysbytai cymuned yw a yw'n darparu gwasanaethau o'r safon orau i'w gymunedau. Os nad yw'r ysbytai hynny, mewn rhai sefyllfaoedd, yn darparu gwasanaeth o'r safon orau i'w gymunedau, er enghraifft, mae'r ysbytai hynny'n rhwystro'r broses o ailgynllunio'r gwasanaeth, sy'n golygu bod pobl yn cael eu derbyn i'r ysbytai cymuned hyn yn awtomatig yn hytrach na chael gofal yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Mae'n hollol iawn y dylid edrych ar y gwasanaethau yn yr ysbytai hynny, a byddwn yn gobeithio y byddech yn cytuno â'r egwyddor honno.

Rhaid inni edrych ar rôl ysbytai cymunedol, nid fel adeiladau ond o ran y gwasanaethau y maent yn eu darparu, ac a ydynt yn darparu gwasanaethau o safon uchel i'r gymuned. Os ydynt, yna mewn llawer achos bydd dyfodol disglair i'r ysbytai cymunedol. Os nad yw ysbyty cymunedol yn gydnaws â darparu gwasanaethau o safon, rhaid edrych ar ei ddyfodol. Fodd bynnag, rhaid gosod hynny fel y maen prawf.

**Kirsty Williams:** I'ch goleuo chi a Mr Bourne ynghylch y sefyllfa wirioneddol yn ysbyty Llanfair-ym-Muallt, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol wedi tynnu'n ôl ei fygythiad i leihau nifer y gwelyau dros dro, gan na ellid cronni unrhyw arbedion a ddôl yn sgîl hynny rhwng nawr a mis Ebrill. Yn hytrach, mae'r bwrdd iechyd lleol, ar y cyd â'r fforwm iechyd lleol, wedi cytuno i gyflwyno cais cyfalaf ichi i ddatblygu uned gymunedol a gofal cymdeithasol sylfaenol yn yr ysbyty yn Llanfair-ym-Muallt i ddiwallu'r anghenion yn y gymuned honno. A fyddwch yn edrych yn ffafriol ar gais felly, sy'n rhywbeth y credaf sy'n wirioneddol wrth wraidd 'Cynllun Oes'?

**Brian Gibbons:** Yn sicr. Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn cael ei ategu gan ddegau o filiynau o

pounds in a capital programme to deliver precisely the type of facilities change that is needed to deliver 'Designed for Life'. It would be inappropriate for me to give a particular verdict on a particular application without even the outline business case having been drawn up. This is precisely the type of imaginative, innovative process that is needed. If capital investment is required to change the way in which a community hospital is operating in order for it to deliver better services for the community, that is the way forward, rather than preserving antiquated services that do not provide quality care.

bunnoedd mewn rhaglen gyfalaf i gyflwyno'n union y math o newid mewn cyfleusterau sy'n ofynnol i ddarparu 'Cynllun Oes'. Byddai'n amhriodol imi roi dyfarniad y naill ffordd neu'r llall ar gais penodol cyn i amlinellid o achos busnes gael ei lunio hyd yn oed. Dyna'n union y math o broses flaengar a llawn dychymyg y mae ei hangen arnom. Os oes angen buddsoddiad cyfalaf i newid y ffordd y mae ysbyty cymunedol yn gweithredu, er mwyn iddo ddarparu gwell gwasanaeth ar gyfer y gymuned, dyna'r ffordd ymlaen, yn hytrach na chadw gwasanaethau hynafol nad ydynt yn darparu gofal o safon.

### **Nyrsio a Gofal Cartref** **Nursing and Domiciliary Care**

**Q7 Alun Cairns:** What steps is the Minister taking to ensure that the health authorities and social services work together to cut delays in securing care packages for those individuals who need both nursing and domiciliary care? OAQ0536(HSS)

**C7 Alun Cairns:** Pa gamau y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod awdurdodau iechyd a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn cydweithio i leihau'r oedi wrth sicrhau pecynnau gofal i'r unigolion hynny sydd ag angen gofal nyrsio a gofal cartref? OAQ0536(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** We are working with all partners to implement the unified assessment process, to finalise the implementation of the national service framework for older people, and taking other measures to ensure that statutory partners work together to commission and provide services in a timely way.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydym yn gweithio gyda'r holl bartneriaid i weithredu proses asesu unedig, i gwblhau gweithredu'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer pobl hyn, ac yr ydym yn cymryd camau eraill i sicrhau bod partneriaid statudol yn cydweithio i gomisiynu a darparu gwasanaethau mewn dull amserol.

**Alun Cairns:** If that is the case is it not reasonable for a middle-aged severely mentally and physically handicapped individual, who needs a urostomy and a shower every day, to expect them both to be provided at the same time by one individual? If that is the case, why is that not happening for one of my constituents? The local health board will not talk to the social services department and vice versa.

**Alun Cairns:** Os felly, onid yw'n rhesymol i unigolyn canol oed sydd ag anfanteision meddyliol a chorfforol dybryd, ac sydd ag angen wrostomi a chawod bob dydd, ddisgwyl i'r rheini gael eu darparu ar yr un pryd gan un unigolyn? Os felly, pam nad yw hynny'n digwydd i un o'm hetholwyr? Nid yw'r bwrdd iechyd lleol yn fodlon siarad â'r adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol, ac nid yw'r adran gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn fodlon siarad â'r bwrdd.

**Brian Gibbons:** I am not au fait with the details of the case. I do not know whether you have written to me about it. If you have, hopefully, I will have an opportunity to study the details. If you have not written to me, I am rather surprised by that, but, hopefully,

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid wyf yn gyfarwydd â manylion yr achos. Ni wn a ydych wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch. Os ydych wedi gwneud hynny, gobeithio y caf gyfle i astudio'r manylion. Os nad ydych wedi ysgrifennu ataf, mae hynny'n fy synnu, ond

you will do so, having raised the question here this afternoon.

gobeithio y gwnewch hynny, gan ichi godi'r mater yma y prynhawn yma.

### **Anghydraddoldebau Iechyd Health Inequalities**

**Q8 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the Minister make a statement on health inequalities in Wales? OAQ0546(HSS)

**C8 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru? OAQ0546(HSS)

**Brian Gibbons:** It is one of our prime aims to improve patient access and reduce the time that patients have to wait for treatment. We are making significant progress in improving health in Wales and tackling health inequalities, increasing capacity, supporting NHS staff and dealing with waiting times and emergency pressures.

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gwella mynediad i gleifion a lleihau'r amser y mae'n rhaid i gleifion aros am driniaeth yn un o'n prif nodau. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd sylweddol o ran gwella iechyd yng Nghymru a mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd, cynyddu capasiti, cefnogi staff y GIG ac ymdrin ag amseroedd aros a phwysau mewn argyfwng.

**Jocelyn Davies:** It is perhaps the biggest disappointment that Labour has not closed the health inequality gap for poor communities. As the Minister is aware, we are still awaiting the full implementation of the Townsend formula. For example, funding for Caerphilly Local Health Board is the furthest from target—there is a massive £16 million gap. Can the Minister declare a definite date for the implementation to be made in full so that some more headway can be made in addressing health inequalities in Caerphilly?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Y siom fwyaf efallai yw nad yw Llafur wedi cau'r bwlch anghydraddoldeb iechyd i gymunedau tlawd. Fel y gwyr y Gweinidog, yr ydym yn dal i aros i fformiwla Townsend gael ei gweithredu'n llawn. Er enghraifft, cyllid Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Caerffili yw'r pellaf o'r targed—mae yna fwch enfawr o £16 miliwn. A all y Gweinidog gyhoeddi dyddiad pendant ar gyfer gweithredu'r fformiwla yn llawn, fel y gellir gwneud rhywfaint o gynnydd wrth fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghaerffili?

**Brian Gibbons:** Not just in Caerphilly; you probably know, Jocelyn—and I think that I heard Rhodri Glyn mention Carmarthen—that there are four local health boards that are some distance from their indicative Townsend allocation.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid yng Nghaerffili yn unig; mae'n siwr eich bod yn gwybod, Jocelyn—a chredaf imi glywed Rhodri Glyn yn crybwyll Caerfyrddin—fod yna gryn fwch rhwng dyraniad dangosol Townsend a chyllid gwirioneddol pedwar bwrdd iechyd lleol.

2.50 p.m.

If we are to tackle inequalities in health in Wales, it is clearly not possible for us to do that and to bail out inefficient health communities on the other. Therefore, there is a clear link between the broader 'Designed for Life' agenda and addressing the issue that you raised. Professor Townsend is producing a final report, which will come to the Assembly in the next few months. He will look at the new Welsh health survey and

Os ydym i fynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldebau iechyd yng Nghymru, mae'n amlwg nad yw'n bosibl inni wneud hynny ac achub croen cymunedau iechyd aneffeithlon ar yr un pryd. Felly, mae cysylltiad pendant rhwng yr agenda 'Cynllun Oes' ehangach a mynd i'r afael â'r mater a godwyd gennych. Mae'r Athro Townsend yn cynhyrchu adroddiad terfynol, a gyflwynir i'r Cynulliad yn ystod yr ychydig fisoedd nesaf.

apply that data to the local health communities across Wales to see what progress has been made. We will then have to make decisions in light of the new application of the Welsh health survey data in line with that. The new data may show that further progress has been made in addressing some of Professor Townsend's concerns.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am sure that everyone in Caerphilly accepts that more work is to be done through the local health board. However, do you not agree, Minister, that the massive investment that the Welsh Assembly Government is planning to make in the new hospital development for the borough of Caerphilly shows our firm commitment to reducing health inequalities in an area such as Caerphilly, which has 13 Communities First wards or sub-wards? This contrasts sharply with the previous Tory administration's management of the health service.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yes. It is interesting that we have invested in excess of £40 million to address the inequalities that Professor Townsend highlighted. Activities such as tackling long waiting lists will also benefit disadvantaged communities. The policies that we in the Assembly Government are pursuing are practical policies to address the unacceptable inequalities in the health experience in Wales.

Bydd yn edrych ar yr arolwg newydd o iechyd Cymru ac yn cymhwyso'r data hynny i gymunedau iechyd lleol ledled Cymru i weld pa gynnydd a wnaed. Yna bydd yn rhaid inni wneud penderfyniadau yng ngoleuni defnyddio o'r newydd y data o arolwg iechyd Cymru yn unol â hynny. Gall y data newydd ddangos bod cynnydd pellach wedi ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â rhai o bryderon yr Athro Townsend.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn siwr fod pawb yng Nghaerffili yn derbyn bod angen gwneud mwy o waith drwy'r bwrdd iechyd lleol. Fodd bynnag, oni chytunwch, Weinidog, fod y buddsoddiad enfawr y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn bwriadu ei wneud i ddatblygu ysbyty newydd ar gyfer bwrdeistref Caerffili yn dangos ein hymrwymiad cadarn i leihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd mewn ardal fel Caerffili, lle mae 13 o wardiau neu is-wardiau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf? Mae hyn yn gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â'r ffordd yr oedd y weinyddiaeth Doriaidd flaenorol yn rheoli'r gwasanaeth iechyd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Ydy. Mae'n ddiddorol ein bod wedi buddsoddi dros £40 miliwn i fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau yr oedd yr Athro Townsend yn tynnu sylw atynt. Bydd gweithgareddau fel mynd i'r afael â rhestrau aros hir hefyd o fudd i gymunedau difreintiedig. Mae'r polisiau yr ydym yn eu dilyn yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn bolisiau ymarferol i fynd i'r afael â'r anghydraddoldebau annerbyniol yn y maes iechyd yng Nghymru.

## **Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon Questions to the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language, and Sport**

### **Trosglwyddiad Digidol yng Nghymru Digital Switchover in Wales**

**C1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael ynglyn â'r trosglwyddiad digidol yng Nghymru? OAQ0523(CWS)

**Q6 Kirsty Williams:** What discussions has the Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding the impact of the digital switchover on Wales? OAQ0513(CWS)

**Q1 Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** What recent discussions has the Minister had on digital switchover in Wales? OAQ0523(CWS)

**C6 Kirsty Williams:** Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi eu cael gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynglyn ag effaith y newid i deledu digidol ar Gymru?



OAQ0513(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw darlledu wedi ei ddatganoli. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn cael trafodaethau rheolaidd â Llywodraeth y Deyrnas Unedig a'r Swyddfa Gyfathrebu ynglyn â materion darlledu, gan gynnwys y newid i'r digidol.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** When I last asked you this question, I referred to the opportunities that arise from the freeing up of the spectrum following the switchover. At that time, you were certain that there were not many options, and said:

'I do not think that it is fair to say that there will be a free amount of bandwidth out there.'

Recently, in a Royal Television Society conference in Cambridge, Tessa Jowell said that

'A key benefit of digital switchover is that it will allow a large amount of spectrum to be released for new uses'.

Is Tessa Jowell wrong, or were you wrong in your initial answer to me? You will know that Ofcom has now published a review of the digital dividend. It says that this project will examine the options arising from the release of spectrum afforded by the digital switchover programme. Are you now telling us that there are opportunities for Wales, and that you were just not aware of them the last time that I asked you the question?

**Alun Pugh:** I think that you are confusing 'free of charge' and 'free for alternative use'. Some spectrum will be freed up, but it is a valuable resource, as was shown with the recent auction of 3G licences.

**Kirsty Williams:** The Department for Culture, Media and Sport is due to publish its estimates of the costs of the switchover assistance scheme, which will help the most vulnerable in society with the costs of switchover. What actions have you taken to ensure that Wales receives the money that it needs for the switchover assistance scheme,

**Alun Pugh:** Broadcasting is not a devolved matter. However, we have regular discussions with the United Kingdom Government and the Office of Communications regarding broadcasting issues, including digital switchover.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Pan ofynnais y cwestiwn hwn ichi ddiwethaf, cyfeiriais at y cyfleoedd sy'n codi o ryddhau'r sbectwm ar ôl y newid i'r digidol. Bryd hynny, yr oeddech yn sicr nad oedd llawer o ddeusiadau, a dywedasocho:

'Ni chredaf ei bod yn deg dweud y bydd digonedd o led band ar gael.'

Yn ddiweddar, mewn cynhadledd gan y Gymdeithas Deledu Frenhinol yng Nghaergrawnt, dywedodd Tessa Jowell mai

Un o fanteision allweddol newid i'r digidol yw y bydd yn rhyddhau llawer iawn o sbectwm ar gyfer defnydd newydd.

A yw Tessa Jowell yn anghywir, neu a oeddech chi yn anghywir yn eich ateb cyntaf i mi? Gwyddoch fod Ofcom wedi cyhoeddi adolygiad o'r difidend digidol erbyn hyn. Dywed y bydd y prosiect hwn yn archwilio'r dewisiadau sy'n codi o ryddhau sbectwm a ddaw yn sgîl y rhaglen newid i'r digidol. A ydych yn dweud wrthym bellach fod cyfleoedd i Gymru, ac nad oeddech yn ymwybodol ohonynt y tro diwethaf imi ofyn y cwestiwn ichi?

**Alun Pugh:** Credaf eich bod yn drysu rhwng 'am ddim' a 'rhydd'. Bydd rhywfaint o sbectwm yn cael ei ryddhau, ond mae'n adnodd gwerthfawr, fel y gwelwyd pan gynhaliwyd arwerthiant o drwyddedau 3G yn ddiweddar.

**Kirsty Williams:** Mae disgwyl i'r Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon gyhoeddi ei amcangyfrif o gostau'r cynllun i gynorthwyo newid i'r digidol, a fydd yn cynorthwyo'r rhai mwyaf bregus yn y gymdeithas gyda chostau newid. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd i sicrhau y bydd Cymru yn cael yr arian y mae arni ei angen ar

given that, in many respects, we have higher levels of disadvantage and disability, and, therefore, will potentially need greater levels of financial assistance to pass on to those people affected?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to say that there are higher levels of deprivation in some parts of Wales. We also have the highest take-up of digital TV anywhere in the UK. Around 73 per cent of households have digital television in Wales, compared with a UK average of 63 per cent. However, that means that there is a significant amount of extra distance to go with digital switchover, and the business of providing special assistance to the most vulnerable members of society—the aged and people with disabilities—will be an important factor in our continuing discussions with Ofcom.

**Leighton Andrews:** Take-up of digital television in Wales would be even higher if more communities could access the Freeview service. When you next meet the BBC, will you press it on the development of the Freesat service that it has been talking about, which would complement the Freeview service, as many of my constituents want to receive digital television, but cannot do so without paying subscriptions for satellite services?

**Alun Pugh:** You are right to point out that many people at the moment cannot receive the Freeview service, and there are limits to how far that service can be extended before the analogue switch-off. At the moment, many people think that when the analogue signal is switched off, they will not be able to get digital terrestrial signals because they cannot get them now. That is not the case, but due to the complex topography of Wales, there will always be significant numbers of people who will not be able to receive a terrestrial-based television signal, and that is why Freesat, and the free service that is available via the Sky satellite, is very important to fill in those last available gaps.

**Mark Isherwood:** Digital UK has embarked on a communications strategy, with advertisements in the Welsh media. How will

gyfer y cynllun i gynorthwyo newid i'r digidol, gan fod gennym, ar lawer ystyr, fwy o anfantais ac anabled, ac felly gall fod arnom angen lefelau uwch o gymorth ariannol i'w drosglwyddo i'r rheini yr effeithir arnynt?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch fod mwy o amddifadedd mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Mae mwy o bobl hefyd wedi newid i deledu digidol yma nag mewn unrhyw le arall yn y DU. Mae gan ryw 73 y cant o gartrefi Cymru deledu digidol, o'u cymharu â chyfartaledd o 63 y cant yn y DU. Fodd bynnag, golyga hynny fod ffordd sylweddol i fynd eto gyda newid i'r digidol, a bydd y gwaith o ddarparu cymorth arbennig i'r rhai mwyaf bregus mewn cymdeithas—yr henoed a phobl ag anabledau—yn ffactor bwysig yn ein trafodaethau parhaus gydag Ofcom.

**Leighton Andrews:** Byddai mwy byth o bobl yn dewis teledu digidol yng Nghymru pe gallai mwy o gymunedau ddefnyddio gwasanaeth Freeview. Pan fyddwch yn cwrdd â'r BBC nesaf, a bwyswch arno ynghylch datblygu'r gwasanaeth Freesat y mae wedi bod yn sôn amdano ac a fyddai'n ategu'r gwasanaeth Freeview? Mae nifer o'm hetholwyr i yn awyddus i allu cael teledu digidol, ond ni allant wneud hynny heb dalu tanysgrifiadau am wasanaethau lloeren?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr ydych yn gywir i ddweud bod nifer o bobl ar hyn o bryd yn methu cael y gwasanaeth Freeview, ac mae terfynau i'r graddau y gellir ymestyn y gwasanaeth hwnnw cyn diffodd teledu analog. Ar hyn o bryd, mae nifer o bobl yn credu, pan ddiffoddir y signal analog, na fyddant yn gallu cael signal digidol daearol gan na allant ei gael yn awr. Nid yw hynny'n wir, ond oherwydd topograffeg gymhleth Cymru, bydd niferoedd sylweddol o bobl o hyd yn methu cael signal teledu daearol, a dyna pam mae Freesat, a'r gwasanaeth am ddim sydd ar gael drwy loeren Sky, yn bwysig iawn i lenwi'r bylchau olaf hynny.

**Mark Isherwood:** Mae Digital UK wedi dechrau ar strategaeth gyfathrebu, gyda hysbysebion yn y cyfryngau yng Nghymru.

Digital UK raise awareness about the switchover in Wales? With talk in Westminster of a new tax on the digital spectrum, will you oppose any tax on television that would handicap the switchover in Wales?

**Alun Pugh:** We are not in the business of putting any artificial barriers in the way of the switchover in Wales. Digital switchover offers many benefits. Welsh television viewers will be able to get many more channels, and, in many cases, they will be able to get a better quality of signal. There are many important benefits. For example, both Channel 4 and S4C will be available to people throughout Wales, and that is not currently the case for many people.

**Eleanor Burnham:** This is a very complex issue for most of us. I am the worst when it comes to technical matters; I am sure that many people share in this. From the last pilot scheme in west Wales, it is obvious that people need a lot of help. As I have asked before, Minister, how are you ensuring that there is help available not only for television viewers, but also for the suppliers? Very often, the suppliers do not have a clue what they are supplying and whether people can access the television channels that they wish to access, particularly on the borders where many people will still have difficulty accessing Welsh television.

**Alun Pugh:** You mentioned the digital trial; the trial in the Ferryside area was very successful, but it highlighted the importance of ensuring that accurate information, at an appropriate level, is available to the various communities, including people with disabilities, and also to the specialist communities, such as the aerial riggers.

Sut y bydd Digital UK yn cynyddu ymwybyddiaeth ynghylch newid i'r digidol yng Nghymru? Gan fod sôn yn San Steffan am dreth newydd ar y sbectrum digidol, a fyddwch yn gwrthwynebu unrhyw dreth ar deledu a fyddai'n amharu ar y newid i'r digidol yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid yw'n fwriad gennym i greu unrhyw rwystrau ffug i'r newid i'r digidol yng Nghymru. Mae nifer o fanteision i newid i'r digidol. Bydd gwylwyr teledu yng Nghymru yn gallu gweld llawer mwy o sianelau, ac mewn llawer achos byddant hefyd yn gallu cael signal gwell. Mae yna nifer o fanteision pwysig. Er enghraifft, bydd Channel 4 ac S4C ar gael i bobl ledled Cymru, ac i lawer nid felly y mae hi ar hyn o bryd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Mae hwn yn fater cymhleth iawn i'r rhan fwyaf ohonom. Yr wyf yn anobeithiol o ran materion technegol; yr wyf yn siwr fod nifer o bobl yn teimlo felly. Yn sgîl y cynllun peilot diwethaf yn y gorllewin, mae'n amlwg fod angen llawer o gymorth ar bobl. Fel yr wyf wedi ei ofyn o'r blaen, Weinidog, sut yr ydych yn sicrhau bod cymorth ar gael, nid yn unig i wylwyr teledu, ond i ddarparwyr teledu hefyd? Yn aml iawn, nid oes gan y darparwyr syniad beth y maent yn ei ddarparu nac a yw pobl yn gallu gweld y sianelau teledu y maent am eu gweld, yn enwedig ar y gororau lle bydd nifer o bobl yn dal i'w chael yn anodd i weld teledu o Gymru.

**Alun Pugh:** Yr oeddech yn crybwyll y treial digidol; yr oedd y treial yn ardal Glanyfferi yn llwyddiannus iawn, ond yr oedd yn tynnu sylw at bwysigrwydd sicrhau bod gwybodaeth gywir ar gael ar lefel briodol i'r amrywiol gymunedau, gan gynnwys pobl ag anableddau, a hefyd i'r cymunedau arbenigol, fel gosodwyr erialau.

### Safleoedd treftadaeth yng Nghymru Heritage sites in Wales

**Q2 William Graham:** What is the Minister doing to promote heritage sites in Wales?  
OAQ0532(CWS)

**C2 William Graham:** Beth mae'r Gweinidog yn ei wneud i hyrwyddo safleoedd treftadaeth yng Nghymru?  
OAQ0532(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Assembly Government works vigorously to promote heritage sites. We produce millions of pieces of literature annually to promote the castles and monuments in our care and we work in partnership with a range of organisations, such as the Wales Tourist Board.

**William Graham:** You will know that, five years ago, the Blaenavon was declared a world heritage site, so it ranks with the Taj Mahal and the Pyramids. It has brought around £25 million of investment into a deprived area. However, there are no signs to Blaenavon on the M4. Will you ensure that signs are erected as soon as possible?

**Alun Pugh:** I will discuss that with my colleague, the Minister for Economic Development and Transport, who has responsibility for signage on motorways.

**John Griffiths:** Newport's transporter bridge is a very important part of local and national heritage, and is linked to transporter bridges across the globe. It was saved for local people by local government some years ago, at considerable expense, and is very much valued by them. Do you agree that the transporter bridge deserves to be promoted, and will you join me in congratulating Newport friends of the transporter bridge on all their hard work in promotion and raising awareness?

**Alun Pugh:** The transporter bridge is an excellent example of a rare structure. There are very few of those bridges in the world; I believe that there is only one other in the UK, in Middlesbrough. I have cycled across it and it is a wonder of engineering and it is certainly a monument that is worthy of special protection.

3.00 p.m.

**Elin Jones:** Mae Menter Aberteifi ar hyn o bryd yn ceisio adnewyddu hen adeilad y Guildhall yn y dref, ond mae Cadw yn gosod rhwystrau annerbyniol yn ei ffordd. A ydych yn cytuno mai'r hyn a ddylai nodweddu gwaith Cadw yw cydweithio yn hytrach na llesteirio?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio'n ddygn i hybu safleoedd treftadaeth. Yr ydym yn cynhyrchu miliynau o ddarnau o lenyddiaeth bob blwyddyn i hybu'r cestyll a'r henebion sydd yn ein gofal, ac yr ydym yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth ag amrywiaeth o sefydliadau, fel Bwrdd Croeso Cymru.

**William Graham:** Gwyddoch fod Blaenavon wedi ei enwi'n safle treftadaeth y byd bum mlynedd yn ôl, felly, mae i'w gymharu â'r Taj Mahal a'r Pyramidiau. Mae wedi denu tua £25 miliwn o fuddsoddiad i ardal ddifreintiedig. Fodd bynnag, nid oes unrhyw arwydd i Flaenavon ar yr M4. A sicrhewch fod arwyddion yn cael eu codi cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

**Alun Pugh:** Trafodaf hynny gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, sy'n gyfrifol am arwyddion ar draffyrdd.

**John Griffiths:** Mae pont gludo Casnewydd yn rhan bwysig iawn o dreftadaeth leol a chenedlaethol, ac mae cael ei chysylltu â phontydd cludo ym mhedwar ban y byd. Cafodd ei harbed i'r bobl leol gan lywodraeth leol rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, am gost enfawr, ac fe'i gwerthfawrogir yn fawr ganddynt. A gytunwch fod y bont gludo yn haeddu cael ei hybu, ac a ymunwch â mi i longyfarch cyfeillion y bont gludo yng Nghasnewydd am eu holl waith caled yn hybu a gwneud pobl yn ymwybodol?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae'r bont gludo yn enghraifft ardderchog o adeiledd prin. Ychydig iawn o'r pontydd hynny sydd yn y byd; credaf mai dim ond un arall sydd yn y DU, a honno yn Middlesbrough. Yr wyf wedi seiclo drosti ac mae'n gampwaith peirianegol ac yn sicr yn heneb sy'n deilwng o warchodaeth arbennig.

**Elin Jones:** Menter Aberteifi is currently trying to renew the old Guildhall building in Cardigan, but Cadw is placing unacceptable obstacles in its way. Do you not agree that the work of Cadw should be characterised by co-operation rather than obstruction?

**Alun Pugh:** Cadw has special legal responsibilities. I am not familiar with the difficulties with that particular building, but I will write to you on this.

**Rosemary Butler:** I echo John Griffiths's thanks to Friends of Newport Transporter Bridge, of which I have the privilege of being the president. People will like to know that Jamie Baulch has just agreed to be our patron. Apart from the transporter bridge, Newport has other wonderful heritage sites: Tredegar House, the Roman amphitheatre and barracks, Newport castle and also a very fine cathedral. The dean of the cathedral recently launched a large restoration appeal, as the church is in need of a great amount of restoration. I wonder if you would like to come to see this cathedral for yourself, especially as you have a particular interest in heritage sites.

**Alun Pugh:** I would be happy to take up that invitation. You are right to point out that Newport has both a special place in Welsh history and many fine civic buildings. I would be happy to come on that tour with you.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Cadw gyfrifoldebau cyfreithiol arbennig. Ni wn am yr anawsterau gyda'r adeilad arbennig hwnnw, ond ysgrifennaf atoch ynglyn â hyn.

**Rosemary Butler:** Yr wyf yn adleisio diolchiadau John Griffiths i Gyfeillion Pont Gludo Casnewydd, ac yr wyf wedi cael y fraint o fod yn llywydd arni. Bydd pobl am wybod bod Jamie Baulch wedi cytuno'n ddiweddar i fod yn noddwr ein cymdeithas. Ar wahân i'r bont gludo, mae yng Nghasnewydd safleoedd treftadaeth arbennig eraill: Ty Tredegar, yr amffitheatr a'r barics Rhufeinig, castell Casnewydd a hefyd eglwys gadeiriol wych iawn. Yn ddiweddar, lansiodd deon yr eglwys gadeiriol apêl adfer fawr, gan fod angen gwneud llawer iawn o waith adfer ar yr eglwys. Tybed a hoffech ddod i weld yr eglwys gadeiriol hon drosoch eich hun, yn enwedig gan fod gennych ddiddordeb arbennig mewn safleoedd treftadaeth.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn falch derbyn y gwahoddiad hwnnw. Yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud bod gan Gasnewydd le arbennig yn hanes Cymru a nifer o adeiladau dinesig godidog. Byddwn yn barod i ddod ar y daith honno gyda chi.

### **Trefniadau Trafnidiaeth ar gyfer Ymwelwyr â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru Transport Arrangements for Visitors to the Millenium Centre**

**Q3 Laura Anne Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement on transport arrangements for visitors to the Wales Millennium Centre? OAQ0499(CWS)

**C3 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am drefniadau trafniadaeth ar gyfer ymwelwyr â Chanolfan Mileniwm Cymru? OAQ0499(CWS)

**C5 Owen John Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am faes parcio newydd i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru? OAQ0484(HSS)

**Q5 Owen John Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on a new car park for the Wales Millennium Centre? OAQ0484(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** There are regular bus services, every 10 minutes, into Cardiff bay and there are regular train services, every 15 minutes, into Cardiff bay. Tour operators are increasingly organising bus trips from across Wales and beyond to a variety of performances and events at the centre.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gwasanaethau bws rheolaidd bob 10 munud i Fae Caerdydd a gwasanaethau trênn rheolaidd bob 15 munud i Fae Caerdydd. Mae trefnwyr teithiau yn gynyddol yn trefnu teithiau bws o fannau ar draws Cymru a thu hwnt i weld amrywiaeth o berfformiadau a digwyddiadau yn y ganolfan.

**Laura Anne Jones:** I understand, of course, that transport is not your portfolio, but it has a huge impact on the success of cultural

**Laura Anne Jones:** Deallaf, wrth gwrs, nad yw trafniadaeth yn rhan o'ch portffolio, ond mae'n cael effaith fawr ar lwyddiant

facilities in Wales, including in Cardiff bay, and on your cultural portfolio. I am deeply concerned that plans to introduce a car park in Cardiff bay have not come to fruition, although you assured us in the Chamber that it would be in place a year before the opening of the Wales Millennium Centre. The situation causes inconvenience to many people, and it worries me that people will not come or return to Cardiff bay to enjoy the Wales Millennium Centre if this car parking problem is not resolved. I realise that plans are finally in place for a car park, but I would like you to tell us how they are progressing. How you are working with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to improve links between Cardiff bay and Cardiff, the rest of Wales and England?

**Alun Pugh:** Before the Wales Millennium Centre opened, many Members were confidently predicting traffic chaos and gridlock in the bay when it opened; that did not happen. However, the car parking situation in the bay is not ideal. I understand that a planning application will go before a Cardiff County Council planning committee meeting on 14 December and, if that is approved, a 1,200 space multi-storey car park will be developed next year.

**Owen John Thomas:** Mae llawer o'r hyn yr oeddwn am ei ofyn wedi'i ofyn yn barod, ond, mewn cyfarfod pwyllgor ar 17 Tachwedd, dywedasoch bod cais cynllunio i adeiladu maes parcio wedi cael ei dderbyn. Y gwir yw, yn ôl yr hyn y mae cyngor Caerdydd yn ei ddweud wrthyf, bod y cais wedi'i dderbyn ond nad yw'r penderfyniad wedi'i wneud arno eto. A wnewch chi sefyll ar eich bai?

**Alun Pugh:** As I said, the application goes before a planning committee on 14 December, and we anticipate, if it is accepted, that building work will start next year.

**Alun Cairns:** Do you recognise the damage that the lack of car parking space in Cardiff bay is causing the wider economy of the bay?

cyfleusterau diwylliannol yng Nghymru, gan gynnwys ym Mae Caerdydd, ac ar eich portffolio diwylliannol. Yr wyf yn pryderu'n fawr nad yw'r cynlluniau i ddarparu parc ceir ym Mae Caerdydd wedi dwyn ffrwyth, er ichi roi sicrwydd i ni yn y Siambr y byddai'n barod flwyddyn cyn agor Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru. Mae'r sefyllfa'n achosi anghyfleustra i nifer o bobl, ac yr wyf yn pryderu na fydd pobl yn dod nac yn dychwelyd i Fae Caerdydd i fwynhau Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru os na chaiff y broblem hon o barcio ceir ei datrys. Sylweddolaf fod cynlluniau ar waith o'r diwedd ar parc ceir, ond hoffwn ichi ddweud wrthym sut y maent yn dod ymlaen. Sut yr ydych yn gweithio gyda'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i wella cysylltiadau rhwng Bae Caerdydd a Chaerdydd, gweddill Cymru a Lloegr?

**Alun Pugh:** Cyn i Ganolfan Mileniwm Cymru agor, yr oedd nifer o'r Aelodau yn rhag-weld yn hyderus y byddai anhrefn a thagfeydd traffig yn y bae pan fyddai'n agor; ni ddigwyddodd hynny. Fodd bynnag, nid yw'r sefyllfa o ran parcio ceir yn y bae yn ddelfrydol. Deallaf y bydd cais cynllunio yn mynd gerbron cyfarfod o bwyllgor cynllunio Cyngor Sir Caerdydd ar 14 Rhagfyr, ac os caiff ei gymeradwyo caiff parc ceir aml-lawr gyda 1,200 o lefydd parcio ei ddatblygu flwyddyn nesaf.

**Owen John Thomas:** Much of what I was going to ask has already been asked, but in a committee meeting on 17 November you said that a planning application to build a car park had been accepted. The truth is, according to what Cardiff council tell me, that the application has been received but it has not been decided as yet. Will you stand corrected?

**Alun Pugh:** Fel y dywedais, bydd y cais yn cael ei gyflwyno gerbron pwyllgor cynllunio ar 14 Rhagfyr, ac yr ydym yn rhag-weld, os caiff ei dderbyn, y bydd gwaith adeiladu yn dechrau flwyddyn nesaf.

**Alun Cairns:** A ydych yn cydnabod y niwed y mae prinder llefydd parcio ceir ym Mae Caerdydd yn ei wneud i economi ehangach y

There is no doubt that Cardiff bay has been a fantastic success, coming, of course, from the Conservative Party. Do you not accept that swift action from the Welsh Assembly Government at the early stages would have meant that a car park was in place now, as was originally promised?

**Alun Pugh:** I have already said that the car parking situation is not perfect, but I do not think that it is fair to say that there is an economic stranglehold on businesses in the bay because of the lack of car parking opportunities. That simply is not the case. I also know that my colleague, Andrew Davies, is working hard on a range of public transport projects and there are regular bus and train services into the heart of Cardiff bay. I use those services and I can heartily recommend them.

bae? Yn sicr. mae Bae Caerdydd wedi bod yn llwyddiant aruthrol, a darddodd, wrth gwrs, o'r Blaid Geidwadol. Onid ydych yn derbyn y byddai gweithredu'n gyflym gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn ystod y camau cynnar wedi golygu bod parc ceir ar gael yn awr, fel yr addawyd yn wreiddiol?

**Alun Pugh:** Yr wyf wedi dweud eisoes nad yw'r sefyllfa o ran parcio ceir yn ddelfrydol. Ond ni chredaf ei bod yn deg dweud bod economi busnesau yn y bae yn cael ei thagu oherwydd diffyg cyfleoedd i barcio ceir. Nid yw hynny'n wir o gwbl. Gwn hefyd fod fy nghyd-Aelod, Andrew Davies, yn gweithio'n galed ar amrywiaeth o brosiectau cludiant cyhoeddus a bod gwasanaethau bws a thrên rheolaidd ar gael i ganol Bae Caerdydd. Yr wyf yn defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hynny a gallaf eu hargymell yn hyderus.

### Cynhyrchu Ffilmiau yng Nghymru Film Production in Wales

**Q4 Mick Bates:** Will the Minister make a statement on support and funding for film production in Wales? OAQ0495(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The Assembly Government is fully committed to supporting the film industry in Wales, and a significant amount of public funding is available to support and promote the industry.

**Mick Bates:** The Welsh film industry, as you know, is growing and an increasing number of films and programmes, such as *Neverland* and *Doctor Who*, are being shot in Wales. The tremendous success could be described in Welsh as '*hybcreadus*'. However, the growth of the Welsh film industry is now being threatened by plans to scrap the Welsh funding agency, Sgrîn Cymru. What negotiations have you had with Sgrîn Cymru about its impending closure? What action are you taking to safeguard the Welsh film industry?

**Alun Pugh:** There is no threat to the home-made Welsh film product or to the process of attracting films that are being made in other parts of the world to Wales for location shots. There are certainly no plans to discontinue

**C4 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gefnogaeth a chyllid ar gyfer cynhyrchu ffilm yng Nghymru? OAQ0495(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo'n llwyr i gefnogi'r diwydiant ffilm yng Nghymru, ac mae swm sylweddol o arian cyhoeddus ar gael i gefnogi'r diwydiant a'i hyrwyddo.

**Mick Bates:** Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r diwydiant ffilm yng Nghymru yn tyfu, ac mae nifer gynyddol o ffilmiau a rhaglenni, fel *Neverland* a *Doctor Who*, yn cael eu ffilmio yng Nghymru. Gellid disgrifio'r llwyddiant aruthrol fel '*hybcreadus*'. Fodd bynnag, mae twf y diwydiant ffilm yng Nghymru yn awr yn cael ei fygwth gan gynlluniau i ddiddymu asiantaeth ariannu Cymru, Sgrîn Cymru. Pa drafodaethau a gawsoch gyda Sgrîn Cymru ynglyn â'r bwriad i'w chau? Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd i ddiogelu'r diwydiant ffilm yng Nghymru?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid oes unrhyw fgythiad i ffilmiau Cymreig sy'n cael eu ffilmio yng Nghymru nac i'r broses o ddenu ffilmiau sy'n cael eu gwneud mewn rhannau eraill o'r byd i Gymru ar gyfer ffilmio ar leoliad. Yn

that service and you are right in saying that it includes everything from Bollywood films to UK films. There is also a growing TV market; I am proud of the quality of the *Doctor Who* product. A number of other major TV series, including shows from *Top Gear* and *Casualty* to *Time Team* and *Hollyoaks*, are being filmed in various locations in Wales.

**Lisa Francis:** Minister, we are still awaiting the final version of the Arts Council of Wales's published review into cultural film in Wales. Can you tell us when we will receive that review and whether it will have any bearing on who will fund the new organisation which is to replace Sgrîn Cymru after March 2006? Apparently, we should have been issued with a written statement on film, but it seems that it is yet to materialise. When can we expect that statement?

**Alun Pugh:** The written statement on film was filed on 11 November 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** Grwpwyd cwestiynau 5 a 6 gyda chwestiynau 1 a 3.

bendant, nid oes unrhyw gynlluniau i derfynu'r gwasanaeth hwnnw, ac yr ydych yn iawn i ddweud ei fod yn cynnwys popeth o ffilmiau Bollywood i ffilmiau'r DU. Mae'r farchnad deledu yn tyfu hefyd; yr wyf yn falch o ansawdd y rhaglenni *Doctor Who*. Mae nifer o gyfresi teledu poblogaidd eraill, gan gynnwys sioeau o *Top Gear* a *Casualty* i *Time Team* a *Hollyoaks*, yn cael eu ffilmio mewn amrywiol leoliadau yng Nghymru.

**Lisa Francis:** Weinidog, yr ydym yn dal i aros am y fersiwn terfynol o'r adolygiad a gyhoeddwyd gan Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru o ffilmiau diwylliannol yng Nghymru. A allwch ddweud wrthym pryd y byddwn yn cael yr adolygiad hwnnw, ac a fydd yn cael unrhyw ddylanwad ar pwy fydd yn ariannu'r sefydliad newydd sydd i gymryd lle Sgrîn Cymru ar ôl mis Mawrth 2006? Mae'n debyg y dylem fod wedi cael datganiad ysgrifenedig am ffilm, ond ymddengys nad yw hyn wedi dod i'r golwg eto. Pryd y gallwn ddisgwyl y datganiad hwnnw?

**Alun Pugh:** Ffeiliwyd y datganiad ysgrifenedig ar ffilm ar 11 Tachwedd 2005.

**The Presiding Officer:** Questions 5 and 6 were grouped with questions 1 and 3.

### **Tîm Gemau Olympaidd Arbennig Cymru Wales Special Olympics Team**

**Q7 Catherine Thomas:** Will the Minister make a statement on measures to support the Wales Special Olympics team? OAQ0506(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** I know that you have a long-standing interest in this area. I was pleased to support the Wales Special Olympics team in Glasgow, financially, through the Welsh Assembly Government, and by making a trip to Glasgow myself to see the final day's competitions. We have had great successes in the past. We have not yet had any specific approaches concerning future support for the Special Olympics.

**Catherine Thomas:** The Wales team appreciated the support that it received from

**C7 Catherine Thomas:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am fesurau i gefnogi tîm Gemau Olympaidd Arbennig Cymru? OAQ0506(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Gwn fod gennych ddiddordeb yn y maes hwn ers tro. Yr oeddwn yn falch cael cefnogi tîm Gemau Olympaidd Arbennig Cymru yn Glasgow, yn ariannol, drwy Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, a thrwy deithio i Glasgow fy hun i weld y cystadlaethau ar y diwrnod olaf. Yr ydym wedi cael llwyddiannau mawr yn y gorffennol. Hyd yn hyn nid ydym wedi cael unrhyw gynigion i gefnogi'r Gemau Olympaidd Arbennig yn y dyfodol.

**Catherine Thomas:** Yr oedd tîm Cymru yn gwerthfawrogi'r gefnogaeth a gafodd



you to enable it to go to the Olympics in Glasgow. The team included over 300 athletes and a significant number came from Llanelli. Minister, will you bear in mind that many of the athletes will be taking part in the Special Olympics World Summer Games in Shanghai and in the national games in 2007? Do you agree that it would be a good way forward to secure funding for these athletes, not just during the lead-up to special events such as the Olympics, but on a regular basis, to assist them?

**Alun Pugh:** That is a fair point. Wales has an excellent and deserved reputation in disability sport. The Sports Council for Wales is currently investing £450,000 in that area. Glasgow, as you pointed out, was very successful. I know that a number of Special Olympic events are coming up and I believe that the next one will be held either in London or Birmingham, but then there is the whole question of overseas representation. We would want to look at all those things in a positive light.

**Owen John Thomas:** In the Sydney 2000 Paralympic Games, our Paralympians won 18 medals and represented 6 per cent of Team GB. In Athens, last year, we made up 14 per cent of Team GB and had a medal tally of 26, or 30 per cent of the total number of medals won by Team GB. These achievements can be attributed to the excellent work of the Disability Sport Academy in identifying and developing future Paralympians. Will you give an undertaking to support the continuing investment in the academy to build on this success?

3.10 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I can certainly assure you that we will continue to invest in Paralympic sport.

gennyh i'w alluogi i fynd i'r Gemau Olympaidd yn Glasgow. Yr oedd y tîm yn cynnwys dros 300 o athletwyr a nifer sylweddol ohonynt yn dod o Lanelli. Weinidog, a fydddech cystal â chadw mewn cof y bydd nifer o'r athletwyr yn cymryd rhan yng Ngemau Olympaidd Arbennig Gemau Haf y Byd yn Shanghai ac yn y gemau cenedlaethol yn 2007? A gytunwch y byddai'n ffordd dda ymlaen i sicrhau arian i gynorthwyo'r athletwyr hyn, nid yn unig yn y cyfnod cyn digwyddiadau arbennig fel y Gemau Olympaidd, ond yn rheolaidd?

**Alun Pugh:** Mae hwnnw'n bwynt teg. Mae gan Gymru enw da, yn haeddiannol, ym maes chwaraeon anabled. Ar hyn o bryd, mae Cyngor Chwaraeon Cymru yn buddsoddi £450,000 yn y maes hwnnw. Yr oedd Glasgow, fel yr oeddech yn egluro, yn llwyddiant mawr. Gwn fod nifer o ddigwyddiadau Gemau Olympaidd Arbennig ar ddod, a chredaf y bydd yr un nesaf naill ai yn Llundain neu yn Birmingham. Ond yna mae holl gwestiwn cynrychiolaeth dramor yn codi. Byddem am edrych ar yr holl bethau hynny mewn ffordd gadarnhaol.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yn y Gemau Paralympaidd yn Sydney yn 2000, enillodd ein hathletwyr 18 o fedalau ac yn cynrychioli 6 y cant o Dîm Prydain Fawr. Yn Athen, y llynedd, yr oedd athletwyr Cymru yn cynrychioli 14 y cant o Dîm Prydain Fawr ac enillwyd cyfanswm o 26 o fedalau ganddynt, neu 30 y cant o gyfanswm y medalau a enillwyd gan Dîm Prydain Fawr. Gellir priodoli'r llwyddiannau hyn i waith rhagorol yr Academi Chwaraeon Anabled yn darganfod ac yn datblygu athletwyr Gemau Paralympaidd y dyfodol. A allwch ymrwymo i gefnogi'r buddsoddiad parhaol yn yr academi er mwyn adeiladu ar y llwyddiant hwn?

**Alun Pugh:** Gallaf eich sicrhau yn bendant y byddwn yn parhau i fuddsoddi ym maes chwaraeon Paralympaidd.

### **Effaith Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg ar Gymru The Impact of the Welsh Language Act on Wales**

**Q8 Leanne Wood:** What assessment has the Minister made of the impact of the Welsh Language Act 1993 on Wales? OAQ0522(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** The impact of the Welsh Language Act 1993 on Wales has been, and continues to be, significant in promoting and facilitating the use of the Welsh language. The Act is one of the reasons why the historic decline in the number of Welsh speakers has been reversed.

**Leanne Wood:** Minister, you will be aware of the current campaign, spearheaded by Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, for a new Welsh language Act, and you will be aware of your colleague's description of this campaign as extremist and anti-social behaviour. Do you agree with your colleague's interpretation, or do you agree with me that non-violent direct action is a valid form of campaigning for justice for the Welsh language, just as it was for the suffragette movement and the civil rights movement?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly do not accept that criminal damage is valid. This has cost thousands of pounds to put right, and I would rather be spending public money on promoting the Welsh language than on cleaning paint from our buildings.

**Lorraine Barrett:** I am the 'colleague' just referred to. Will you condemn the Welsh Language Society, which wants a new Welsh language Act and whose members have defaced Assembly buildings, and call for it to pay for the thousands of pounds' worth of damage that they have caused?

**Alun Pugh:** The issue of civil recovery of costs is not a matter for me. I will simply repeat that I would far rather spend public money on investing in the Welsh language and in projects such as Twf, which encourages parents to pass on the gift of bilingualism to their children, than on wasting it on cleaning paint from public buildings.

**Brynle Williams:** Pa sicrwydd a rowch inni na throsglwyddir costau Deddf Iaith i

**C8 Leanne Wood:** Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o effaith Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 ar Gymru? OAQ0522(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae effaith Deddf yr Iaith Gymraeg 1993 wedi bod, ac yn parhau i fod, yn sylweddol wrth hyrwyddo a hwyluso defnyddio'r iaith Gymraeg. Y Ddeddf yw un o'r rhesymau pam mae'r gostyngiad hanesyddol yn nifer y siaradwyr Cymraeg wedi ei wrthdroi.

**Leanne Wood:** Weinidog, fe fyddwch yn ymwybodol o'r ymgyrch bresennol, dan arweiniad Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, i gael Deddf Iaith Gymraeg newydd, ac fe fyddwch yn ymwybodol o ddisgrifiad eich cyd-Aelod o'r ymgyrch hon fel ymddygiad eithafol a gwrthgymdeithasol. A ydych yn cytuno â dehongliad eich cyd-Aelod, neu a ydych yn cytuno â mi bod camau gweithredu uniongyrchol di-drais yn ffordd ddilys i ymgyrchu dros gyfiawnder i'r iaith Gymraeg, fel yr oedd ar gyfer y mudiad swffragét a'r mudiad hawliau sifil?

**Alun Pugh:** Yn sicr nid wyf yn derbyn bod difrod troseddol yn ddilys. Mae hyn wedi costio miloedd o bunnoedd i'w unioni, a byddai'n well gennyf wario arian cyhoeddus ar hyrwyddo'r iaith Gymraeg na glanhau paent oddi ar ein hadeiladau.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Fi yw'r 'cyd-Aelod' y cyfeiriwyd ati. A wnewch chi gondemnio Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, sydd am weld Deddf Iaith Gymraeg newydd ac sydd â'i haelodau wedi difwyno adeiladau'r Cynulliad, a galw arni i dalu am y miloedd o bunnoedd o ddifrod a achoswyd ganddynt?

**Alun Pugh:** Nid mater i mi yw adennill costau sifil. Yn syml, ailadroddaf y byddai'n well o lawer gennyf wario arian cyhoeddus ar fuddsoddi yn yr iaith Gymraeg ac ar brosiectau fel Twf, sy'n annog rhieni i drosglwyddo rhodd dwyieithrwydd i'w plant, na'i wastraffu ar lanhau paent oddi ar adeiladau cyhoeddus.

**Brynle Williams:** What assurance will you give us that the costs of the Language Act

fusnesau bach, a fyddai'n codi'r pwysau sydd arnynt?

**Alun Pugh:** I certainly agree that we should not seek to impose the Welsh language on private businesses as a matter of regulation. The way forward in this matter is by encouragement. I see many good examples of work in the private sector, in small and large companies alike, in terms of the positive promotion of Welsh. I look forward to visiting Bangor next Monday to meet representatives of Marks and Spencer, which, as a company, has exemplary use of the Welsh language in its shop.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Fe'ch clywais yn canmol y Ddeddf bresennol ac yn dweud sut y mae wedi hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg ac wedi arwain at fwy o ddefnydd ohoni, yn sicr yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae penderfyniad eich Llywodraeth i ddiddymu Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg naill ai'n gyfle i symud yn ôl o'r fan honno a gwanhau sefyllfa'r Gymraeg, neu mae'n gyfle i gryfhau'r Gymraeg. A ydych yn derbyn bod llawer o waith i'w wneud ar sicrhau trefniadau newydd, os bydd y Llywodraeth yn diddymu'r bwrdd? Dylid edrych yn ofalus ar rôl y dyfarnydd i ehangu ei bwerau ac i sicrhau na fydd heb waith i'w wneud, ac y bydd ganddo rym i sicrhau bod cynlluniau iaith yn cael eu gweithredu yn iawn.

**Alun Pugh:** I can certainly offer you the assurance that the reason for our bringing the Welsh Language Board into the Government is not to weaken the role of the Welsh language in Welsh society. Let me make clear that we want to move to a bilingual society. At present, just 20 per cent of Wales's population speaks both our national languages: we want to see that growing, census after census. Let us all be clear about that.

Much detailed work must be done before we can merge the board with the Assembly Government, not least on the work and the role of the dyfarnydd. I am happy, as is the First Minister, to talk to you in detail about that before we issue the formal consultation.

will not be transferred to small businesses, which would increase the pressures on them?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf yn bendant na ddylem orfodi'r iaith Gymraeg ar fusnesau preifat fel mater o reoleiddio. Y ffordd ymlaen yn y mater hwn yw drwy annog. Gwelaf nifer o enghreifftiau da o waith yn y sector preifat, mewn cwmnïau bach a mawr fel ei gilydd, i ran hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg mewn ffordd gadarnhaol. Edrychaf ymlaen at fy ymweliad â Bangor ddydd Llun nesaf, pan fyddaf yn cyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr Marks and Spencer sydd, fel cwmni, yn gwneud defnydd rhagorol o'r Gymraeg yn ei siop.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I heard you praising the current Act and saying that it has promoted the Welsh language and led to its greater use, certainly in the public sector. The decision of your Government to abolish the Welsh Language Board is either an opportunity to reverse that situation and weaken the Welsh language, or it is an opportunity to strengthen the language. Do you accept that much work needs to be done on the new arrangements, if the Government abolishes the board? Careful consideration should be given to the role of the dyfarnydd to widen his powers, and to ensure that he does not find himself with no work to do, and that he will have power to ensure that language schemes are implemented properly.

**Alun Pugh:** Yn bendant gallaf eich sicrhau nad gwanhau rôl y Gymraeg mewn cymdeithas yng Nghymru yw'r rheswm dros wneud Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn rhan o'r Llywodraeth. Gadewch imi wneud yn glir ein bod am symud tuag at gymdeithas ddwyieithog. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 20 y cant o boblogaeth Cymru sy'n siarad ein dwy iaith genedlaethol: yr ydym am weld y nifer hwnnw'n tyfu, cyfrifiad ar ôl cyfrifiad. Gadewch inni fod yn glir ynglyn â hynny, bob un ohonom.

Mae llawer o waith manwl i'w wneud cyn y gallwn uno'r bwrdd â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn bennaf o ran gwaith a rôl y dyfarnydd. Yr wyf fi, fel y mae'r Prif Weinidog, yn fodlon trafod hyn gyda chi yn fanwl cyn inni gyhoeddi'r ymgynghoriad ffurfiol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yn ogystal â datganiad cyffredinol am gefnogaeth i Gymru ddwyieithog, mae pobl am weld gweithredu ymarferol a fydd yn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd. Yr wyf yn falch o'r cyfle i drafod rôl y dyfarnydd ymhellach, ac edrychaf ymlaen at wneud hynny gyda chi a'r Prif Weinidog.

Mae gennyf un pwynt hynod o bwysig arall i'w wneud. Os bydd y bwrdd yn cael ei ddiddymu, bydd mwy o gyfrifoldeb uniongyrchol ar y Llywodraeth o ran datblygu polisi i hyrwyddo'r Gymraeg, ac yn y blaen. Pe bai hynny'n digwydd, ac er mwyn i hynny'n weithio'n effeithiol, a ydych yn derbyn bod angen i uned bolisi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fod yn uned bwerus wedi ei staffio'n gywir gyda digon o gyllid i sicrhau ei bod yn gweithredu'n effeithiol, a bod ganddi drosolwg strategol ar y defnydd o'r Gymraeg yn uniongyrchol ac ar draws y meysydd polisi i sicrhau y gwneir cynnydd ym meysydd addysg, tai a chynllunio, neu pa bynnag faes y mae'r Gymraeg yn greiddiol iddo, fel bod modd i'r Llywodraeth gael trosolwg ar y cyfan?

**Alun Pugh:** I agree with you on much of that. It is entirely fair to make the point that the expanded Welsh language unit needs to have a powerful presence in the Welsh Assembly Government to lead the process of mainstreaming, which we would all want to see. There is no dispute about that.

As far as leadership is concerned, leading the work towards a more bilingual Wales rests with the Assembly and the Assembly Government. We all have a responsibility to work on that area, and I look forward to those detailed discussions with you during the coming weeks.

### **Hyrwyddo Diwylliant Cymru Promotion of Welsh Culture**

**Q9 Denise Idris Jones:** Will the Minister make a statement about the promotion of Welsh culture? OAQ0498(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Wales has a rich cultural heritage, which the Assembly Government is

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** As well as a general statement of support for a bilingual Wales, people want to see practical action to ensure that that happens. I am pleased to have the opportunity to discuss the role of the dyfarnydd further, and I look forward to doing that with you and the First Minister.

I have one further extremely important point to make. If the board is to be disbanded, the Government will have more direct responsibility to develop policy to promote the Welsh language, and so on. If that were to happen, and for that to work effectively, do you accept that the Assembly Government's policy unit should be a powerful unit with adequate staffing and sufficient funding to ensure that it operates effectively, and that it also has a strategic overview on the use of the Welsh language directly and across policy areas, to ensure that progress is made in the fields of education, housing and planning, or whatever area that has the Welsh language at its core, so that the Government can have an overview of the whole picture?

**Alun Pugh:** Cytunaf â chi ar y rhan fwyaf o'r hyn a ddywedwch. Mae'n hollol deg gwneud y pwynt fod angen i'r uned Gymraeg estynedig gael presenoldeb grymus yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, er mwyn arwain y broses o brif-ffrydio, fel y byddem i gyd yn dymuno'i weld. Nid oes dadl ynglyn â hynny.

O ran arweiniad, y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad fydd yn gyfrifol am arwain y gwaith tuag at Gymru fwy dwyieithog. Mae cyfrifoldeb arnom bob un i weithio ar y maes hwnnw, ac edrychaf ymlaen at gael y trafodaethau manwl hynny gyda chi yn ystod yr wythnosau nesaf.

**C9 Denise Idris Jones:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hyrwyddo diwylliant Cymru? OAQ0498(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Mae gan Gymru dreftadaeth ddiwylliannol gyfoethog, y mae Llywodraeth

fully committed to developing and preserving. In your constituency alone in the last 12 months, the Assembly Government has supported the National Eisteddfod of Wales the Faenol Festival and a series of exhibitions at Oriel Mostyn, which I was pleased to visit recently to open the latest exhibition.

**Denise Idris Jones:** You took the words out of my mouth. I was going to say that my constituency has been rich in culture throughout 2005, having hosted the national eisteddfod in Bangor, Bryn Terfel's annual Faenol Festival and the Welsh National Opera, which visited Llandudno on two occasions. Would you agree that, with the extension of the Oriel Mostyn in progress, tourists will have the opportunity to view a variety of art forms from many parts of the world? It is an excellent example of one area promoting culture in many forms.

**Alun Pugh:** Llandudno is a great tourist town in many cultural respects, ranging from the magnificent architectural sweep of the bay, with which we are all familiar, to a variety of events. The return of the WNO a couple of years ago, after an absence of many years, was hugely welcomed on the ground. I have seen many of the excellent WNO performances in Llandudno. The additional capacity that will come from the redevelopment of Oriel Mostyn will also be welcomed—it will give more space to hold challenging and contemporary exhibitions.

y Cynulliad yn gwbl ymrwymedig i'w datblygu a'i diogelu. Yn eich etholaeth chi yn unig yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi cefnogi Eisteddfod Genedlaethol Cymru, Gwyl y Faenol a chyfres o arddangosfeydd yn Oriel Mostyn, yr oedd yn bleser gennyf ymweld â hi yn ddiweddar i agor yr arddangosfa ddiweddaraf.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Dyna'n union beth yr oeddwn yn bwriadu ei ddweud. Yr oeddwn yn bwriadu dweud inni weld cyfoeth o ddiwylliant yn fy etholaeth drwy gydol 2005, ar ôl cynnal yr eisteddfod genedlaethol ym Mangor, Gwyl y Faenol a gynhelir bob blwyddyn gan Bryn Terfel ac Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru, a ymwelodd â Llandudno ar ddau achlysur. A gytunech, o gofio'r estyniad i Oriel Mostyn sy'n cael ei adeiladu ar hyn o bryd, y caiff twristiaid gyfle i weld amrywiaeth o fathau o gelf o sawl rhan o'r byd? Mae'n enghraifft ardderchog o un ardal yn hyrwyddo sawl math o ddiwylliant.

**Alun Pugh:** Mae Llandudno yn dref wych i dwristiaid ar sawl cyfrif o ran diwylliant, yn amrywio o'r bensaerniaeth odidog o amgylch y bae, sy'n gyfarwydd i bob un ohonom, i amrywiaeth o ddigwyddiadau. Croesawyd penderfyniad OCC i ddychwelyd ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, ar ôl absenoldeb o sawl blwyddyn, yn fawr iawn gan bobl leol. Yr wyf wedi gweld llawer o berfformiadau ardderchog gan OCC yn Llandudno. Bydd y lle ychwanegol a ddaw yn sgîl ailddatblygu Oriel Mostyn hefyd i'w groesawu—bydd yn rhoi mwy o le i gynnal arddangosfeydd heriol a chyfoes.

### Gweithgareddau Diwylliannol ym Merthyr Tudful Cultural Activities in Merthyr Tydfil

**Q10 Huw Lewis:** Will the Minister make a statement on cultural activities in Merthyr Tydfil? OAQ0497(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** You will be aware that the Arts Council of Wales recently published a major survey of arts participation and attendance. It reveals that Merthyr Tydfil, in common with other deprived areas, is below the national average. This is something that I am

**C10 Huw Lewis:** A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am weithgareddau diwylliannol ym Merthyr Tudful? OAQ0497(CWS)

**Alun Pugh:** Fe wyddoch i Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru gyhoeddi arolwg mawr o gyfranogi yn y celfyddydau a mynychu digwyddiadau celfyddydol yn ddiweddar. Dengys fod Merthyr Tudful, fel ardaloedd difreintiedig eraill, yn is na'r cyfartaledd

committed to rectifying.

cededlaethol. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i'w unioni.

**Huw Lewis:** I recognise and applaud that commitment. As you know, Merthyr does not have its own working theatre, which, for a town of its size, is quite astonishing. In your answer to me on 2 November, you made reference to a feasibility study into transforming the old Theatre Royal in Merthyr, which is a fine example of a historic Victorian theatre that could be restored and become a treasure for Merthyr and the surrounding area. Will you therefore instruct the Arts Council of Wales to go back to the local authority and the feasibility study to pursue this option, maybe as an element of the Heads of the Valleys strategy? This might go some way to redressing the historic lack of arts council investment in my constituency. Will you also consider visiting the theatre with me to take a look?

**Huw Lewis:** Cydnabyddaf a chymeradwyaf yr ymrwymiad hwnnw. Fel y gwyddoch, nid oes gan Ferthyr ei theatr weithredol ei hun, sy'n eithaf syfrdanol o gofio maint y dref. Yn eich ateb imi ar 2 Tachwedd, cyfeiriwyd at astudiaeth dichonoldeb ar drawsnewid yr hen Theatre Royal ym Merthyr, sy'n enghraifft wych o theatr hanesyddol o oes Fictoria a allai gael ei hadfer a dod yn adeilad gwerthfawr i Ferthyr a'r ardal o'i hamgylch. Felly, a wnewch chi ddweud wrth Gyngor Celfyddydau Cymru am fynd yn ôl at yr awdurdod lleol a'r astudiaeth dichonoldeb i ystyried yr opsiwn hwn ymhellach, efallai fel elfen o strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd? Gallai hyn wneud cryn dipyn i unioni'r diffyg buddsoddiad gan gyngor y celfyddydau yn fy etholaeth yn hanesyddol. A wnewch chi hefyd ystyried ymweld â'r theatr gyda mi er mwyn ei gweld?

3.20 p.m.

**Alun Pugh:** I would be very happy to take up that invitation. Major Assembly strategies such as the Heads of the Valleys strategy have several different threads. In this instance, transport and economic development are important aspects, but man and woman cannot live by bread alone. The development of cultural infrastructure is important in the Heads of the Valleys area. The previous theatre project did not materialise for a variety of reasons, but I am happy to revisit that with you.

**Alun Pugh:** Byddwn yn fwy na pharod i dderbyn y gwahoddiad hwnnw. Mae i strategaethau mawr y Cynulliad megis strategaeth Blaenau'r Cymoedd sawl llinyn gwahanol. Yn yr achos hwn, mae trafndiaeth a datblygu economaidd yn agweddau pwysig, ond nid ar fara yn unig y bydd byw pobl. Mae datblygu seilwaith diwylliannol yn bwysig yn ardal Blaenau'r Cymoedd. Ni ddatblygwyd y prosiect theatr blaenorol am lawer rheswm, ond yr wyf yn barod i ystyried hynny eto gyda chi.

**Y Llywydd:** Trosglwyddwyd cwestiwn 11 i'w ateb yn ysgrifenedig.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11 is transferred for written answer.

### **Cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Ty Questions to the House Committee**

**Y Llywydd:** Ni chyflwynwyd cwestiynau i Bwyllgor y Ty.

**The Presiding Officer:** No questions to the House Committee were tabled.

**Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion**  
**Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

**The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005 on the draft the Fishery Products (Official Controls Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*1a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y Rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Pysgodfeydd (Taliadau Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*b) approves that the Fishery Products (Official Controls Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Pysgodfeydd (Taliadau Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 17 November 2005; and*

*i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Tachwedd 2005; a*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005; a*

*iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 2 November 2005;*

*iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 2 Tachwedd 2005;*

*2a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 22 November 2005 on the draft Bovine Products (Restriction on Placing on the Market (No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 22 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y rheoliadau drafft, Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Buchol (Cyfyngu ar eu Rhoi ar y Farchnad) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) 2005; a*

*b) approves that the Bovine Products (Restriction on Placing on the Market (No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:*

*b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Buchol (Cyfyngu ar eu Rhoi ar y Farchnad) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 15 November 2005; and*

*i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Tachwedd 2005; a*

*ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 November 2005; and*

*ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Tachwedd 2005; a*

*iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 23 November 2005. (NDM2713)*      *iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 23 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2713)*

*Cynnig (NDM2713): O blaid 47, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2713): For 47, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*



## **Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 i'r Prif Weinidog Delegation of Functions under the Railways Act 2005 to the First Minister**

**Y Llywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2, 3 a 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies, a gwelliant 5 yn enw David Melding.

**The Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2, 3, and 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendment 5 in the name of David Melding.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Cynigiad fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the Railways Act 2005 to the Assembly First Minister, save those which by law cannot be so delegated. (NDM2714)*

*yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw. (NDM2714)*

The purpose of this motion is to seek your agreement to the functions contained in the Railways Act 2005 being delegated to the First Minister. This delegation will be made in the knowledge that the functions will be further delegated to the appropriate Assembly Minister and, when necessary or appropriate, to officials.

Diben y cynnig hwn yw ceisio eich cytundeb i'r swyddogaethau yn Neddf Rheilffyrdd 2005 gael eu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog. Gwneir y dirprwyo hwn ar y ddealltwriaeth y dirprwyir y swyddogaethau ymhellach i'r Gweinidog Cynulliad priodol a, phan fo'n angenrheidiol neu'n briodol, i swyddogion.

The Act gave certain powers regarding the railways in Wales. The most important regards the ability to be a joint partner, with the Secretary of State, in franchise agreements that provide services in Wales and the power to provide financial assistance to any such franchisee. The motion as drafted proposes that these powers should be delegated to the First Minister so that business can be dealt with on an effective, day-to-day basis. If the motion were to pass as drafted, I would continue my practice of reporting to the Economic Development and Transport Committee on any significant rail issues affecting Wales.

Yr oedd y Ddeddf yn rhoi pwerau penodol o ran y rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru. Mae'r rhai pwysicaf yn ymwneud â'r gallu i fod yn gydbartner, gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, mewn cytundebau masnachfaint sy'n darparu gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, a'r pwr i roi cymorth ariannol i'r sawl sy'n dal masnachfaint felly. Mae'r cynnig fel y'i drafftwyd yn cynnig dirprwyo'r pwerau hyn i'r Prif Weinidog, fel y gellir ymdrin â busnes yn effeithiol o ddydd i ddydd. Pe bai'r cynnig yn cael ei basio fel y mae wedi ei ddrafftio, byddwn yn parhau fy arfer o gyflwyno adroddiad i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ar unrhyw faterion o bwys sy'n effeithio ar Gymru o ran y rheilffyrdd.

On the amendments, any powers of direction would give the Assembly consultative powers. Five amendments have been tabled. I may not have any problem with the points of principle, but I suggest that they should be

O ran y gwelliannau, byddai unrhyw bwerau cyfarwyddo yn rhoi pwerau ymgynghori i'r Cynulliad. Cyflwynwyd pum gwelliant. Efallai nad wyf yn gwrthwynebu'r egwyddorion ynddynt, ond awgrymaf y dyliid

opposed from the point of view of their practical application. I will go through the amendments as some of them are fairly technical. Section 3(9) relates to consultation on guidance that the Secretary of State may wish to give the Office of Rail Regulation from time to time. That could, and often has in the past, mean the guidance being issued at frequent intervals on any number of issues relating to railway services in England and Wales—not just those in Wales. It would not be appropriate to bring such issues frequently to Plenary sessions. We all know how pressurised Plenary can be in terms of tabling business, and one of the practical points that we will have to bear in mind is whether sufficient Plenary time would be available for Members to consult guidance issued by the Secretary of State. In addition, as there may be an emergency or some substantial change, the Secretary of State may—I will not say ‘will’—have to issue guidance at short notice. Therefore, if Plenary had to be consulted, given our timetable for tabling business, it may not always be practicable to consult Members in a Plenary session. The perverse outcome could be that we, as a body, would lose the ability to be consulted, or comment, on any guidance or decisions made by the Secretary of State.

On amendment 2, the Assembly appointment to the Rail Passengers’ Council, under section 19(2)(c) of the Railways Act 2005, is regarded as an upper-tier public appointment in Wales and is being made in accordance with the National Assembly code of practice. As such, it will be subject to consultation with the subject committee nominees on public appointments. Again, from a practical point of view—[*Interruption.*] May I have Members’ attention?

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I am grateful for your assistance, Minister. I had noticed that there is a bit of restiveness. As far as I know, there is no Conservative contender outside the building today.

eu gwrthwynebu o safbwynt y ffordd y byddent yn gweithredu’n ymarferol. Ymdriniaf â’r gwelliannau fesul un gan fod rhai ohonynt yn lled dechnegol. Mae adran 3(9) yn ymwneud ag ymgynghori am ganllawiau y bydd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, hwyrach, yn dymuno eu rhoi i’r Swyddfa Rheoleiddio Rheilffyrdd o bryd i’w gilydd. Gallai hynny olygu bod y canllawiau'n cael eu cyhoeddi’n aml ar nifer fawr o faterion sy’n ymwneud â gwasanaethau rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru a Lloegr—nid dim ond y rheini yng Nghymru, ac yn aml mae wedi golygu hynny yn y gorffennol. Ni fyddai’n briodol cyflwyno materion felly gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn yn aml. Gwyddom oll am y pwysau sydd arnom o ran cyflwyno busnes yn y Cyfarfod Llawn, ac un o’r pwyntiau ymarferol y bydd yn rhaid inni ei gofio yw a fyddai digon o amser mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn i’r Aelodau edrych ar ganllawiau wedi eu cyhoeddi gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Yn ogystal â hynny, os bydd argyfwng neu ryw newid mawr, efallai y bydd yn rhaid i’r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol—ond nid o reidrwydd bob tro—gyhoeddi canllawiau ar fyr rybudd. Felly, pe bai’n rhaid ymgynghori â’r Cyfarfod Llawn, o gofio ein hamserlen ar gyfer cyflwyno busnes efallai na fyddai’n ymarferol bob amser i ymgynghori â’r Aelodau mewn Cyfarfod Llawn. Yr hyn a allai ddigwydd, yn groes i bob rheswm, yw y byddem ni, fel corff, yn colli’r gallu i ymgynghori â ni neu i roi sylwadau ar unrhyw ganllawiau neu benderfyniadau a wneir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol.

O ran gwelliant 2, ystyrir bod penodiad y Cynulliad i’r Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd, o dan adran 19(2)(c) Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, yn benodiad cyhoeddus haen uchaf yng Nghymru ac yn cael ei wneud yn unol â chod ymarfer y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Fel y cyfryw, bydd yn rhaid ymgynghori amdano ag enwebeion y pwyllgorau pwnc ar benodiadau cyhoeddus. Unwaith eto, o safbwynt ymarferol—[*Torri ar draws.*] A wnaiff yr Aelodau roi sylw?

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am eich cymorth, Weinidog, Yr oeddwn wedi sylwi bod tipyn o aflonyddwch. Hyd y gwn, nid oes ymgeisydd Ceidwadol y tu allan i’r adeilad heddiw.

**Andrew Davies:** I wish to point out that there is a pressing practical issue regarding the appointment to the Rail Passengers' Council. As I have just said, this is a Nolan appointment. An appointment panel has been appointed and it has made a recommendation regarding the Wales member on the RPC. I am in the process of writing, as I always do on these public appointments, to the Chair of the Economic Development and Transport Committee and a committee member, who, in this case, is Elin Jones, to point out that this is a public appointment, that a recommendation has been made and that we have been asked to make a recommendation as to whom should be appointed by the end of December.

There is a practical point in that, if this now has to go to Plenary for a decision, given our timetable for the rest of this term, our nomination may be late and that nominee may not be able to take up his or her place on the RPC when it meets in the new year. I am just pointing out the practical problems.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** The Minister seems to be suggesting that there are practical problems here. Would he not accept that some other public appointments are made by reference to the Assembly? There is nothing new in that. He says that it will be a practical difficulty for a fortnight, or whatever it might be. If there is no contention about a particular appointment, it often goes through without debate. I am sure that the Minister, as a former Business Minister, recognises that that could take two or three minutes. There is an important point of principle here, namely that the Assembly should be the final arbiter on that appointment. The practical difficulties that he refers to are easily overcome through consultation with the parties.

**Andrew Davies:** I said in my opening remarks on the amendments that I had no point of principle in terms of opposing them; I am just pointing out that there are practical problems. If this is the will of the Assembly, that is fine.

**Andrew Davies:** Hoffwn egluro bod mater ymarferol pwysig dan sylw o ran y penodiad i'r Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd. Fel yr wyf newydd ei ddweud, mae hwn yn benodiad dan egwyddorion Nolan. Penodwyd panel penodi ac mae wedi gwneud argymhelliad ynglyn ag aelod y cyngor dros Gymru. Yr wyf yng nghanol ysgrifennu, fel y gwnaf bob amser am y penodiadau cyhoeddus hyn, at Gadeirydd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ac aelod o'r pwyllgor, sef Elin Jones yn yr achos hwn, i egluro bod hwn yn benodiad cyhoeddus, bod argymhelliad wedi'i wneud, a bod gofyn inni wneud argymelliad ynglyn â phwy ddylai gael ei benodi erbyn diwedd mis Rhagfyr.

Cyfyd pwynt ymarferol yn yr ystyr os oes rhaid i hyn fynd gerbron y Cyfarfod Llawn i'w benderfynu, o gofio ein hamserlen am weddill y tymor hwn, y gall ein henwebiad fod yn hwyr ac na fydd yr enwebai hwnnw efallai'n gallu cymryd ei le neu ei lle ar y cyngor pan fydd yn cyfarfod yn y flwyddyn newydd. Dim ond nodi'r problemau ymarferol yr wyf.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Ymddengys fod y Gweinidog yn awgrymu bod problemau ymarferol yn codi. Oni fyddai'n derbyn bod rhai penodiadau cyhoeddus eraill yn cael eu gwneud drwy gyfeirio at y Cynulliad? Nid oes dim yn newydd yn hynny. Dywed y bydd yn anhawster ymarferol am bythefnos, neu beth bynnag. Os nad oes dadlau ynglyn â phenodiad penodol, mae'n aml yn cael ei gymeradwyo heb drafodaeth. Yr wyf yn siwr fod y Gweinidog, fel cyn-Drefnydd, yn cydnabod y gallai hynny gymryd dwy neu dair munud. Mae yma bwynt pwysig o egwyddor, sef mai'r Cynulliad ddylai benderfynu'r penodiad hwnnw yn derfynol. Gellir yn hawdd oresgyn yr anawsterau ymarferol y mae'n cyfeirio atynt drwy ymgynghori â'r pleidiau.

**Andrew Davies:** Dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol ar y gwelliannau nad oeddwn yn gwrthwynebu eu hegwyddor; dweud yr wyf fod problemau ymarferol yn codi. Os dyna yw ewyllys y Cynulliad, popeth yn iawn.

On amendment 3, Schedule 1, paragraph 15(5) requires the Secretary of State to consult the National Assembly before issuing a statement or policy on franchise agreements. Again, it would not be appropriate, for example, for the Assembly to be consulted on franchises that do not affect Wales. However, the Assembly is consulted when issues affect this body and Wales, and the Economic Development and Transport Committee, for example, was fully involved in the arrangements of the Great Western franchise.

Schedule 15, part 4, paragraph 11(3)(c) requires the Rail Passengers' Council to send a copy of its annual reports to the National Assembly. Again, this is a matter of practical application or balance of judgment. We believe that it would not be appropriate to devote a whole Plenary session to this, but, again, that is a matter for this body to decide upon.

**Jenny Randerson:** Do you accept the fact that the Assembly might be happier to leave matters in your hands and those of the Welsh Assembly Government had you made a more robust case in negotiating with the Secretary of State powers for Wales in relation to the railways that were consistent with those given to Scotland?

**Andrew Davies:** No, because, ultimately, it is a matter for the Secretary of State and the UK Parliament to decide on the content of legislation. We felt that we had a good deal on the Wales and borders franchise and the transfer of functions under the Railways Act 2005. I have made this point in the Chamber and in committee. People often say that we should have gone for what the Scots have gone for. The Scots now have responsibility for rail and the infrastructure in Scotland, and they had an additional financial settlement to accommodate the upkeep of that infrastructure. However, as I have said, it is all very well when things are going well, but things can go badly, as was the case with the flooding on the Conwy valley line recently. If we had been responsible, as a legislature and a Government, for repairing that

O ran gwelliant 3, mae Atodlen 1, paragraff 15(5) yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn cyhoeddi datganiad neu bolisi ar gytundebau masnachfrait. Unwaith eto, ni fyddai'n briodol, er enghraifft, ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad ar fasnachfreintiau nad ydynt yn effeithio ar Gymru. Fodd bynnag, ymgynghorir â'r Cynulliad pan fydd materion yn effeithio ar y corff hwn ac ar Gymru, ac yr oedd gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, er enghraifft, ran lawn yn nhrefniadau masnachfrait Great Western.

Mae Atodlen 15, rhan 4, paragraff 11(3)(c) yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd anfon copi o'i adroddiadau blynyddol i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Unwaith eto, mae hwn yn fater ymarferol neu'n fater o farn. Yn ein barn ni, ni fyddai'n briodol neilltuo Cyfarfod Llawn cyfan ar gyfer hyn, ond unwaith eto, mater i'r corff hwn ei benderfynu yw hynny.

**Jenny Randerson:** A dderbyniwch y ffaith y byddai'r Cynulliad hwyrach yn barotach i adael materion yn eich dwylo chi a dwylo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru pe baech wedi cyflwyno dadl fwy cadarn wrth negodi â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol am bwerau i Gymru mewn perthynas â'r rheilffyrdd a oedd yn gyson â'r rheini a roddwyd i'r Alban?

**Andrew Davies:** Nid wyf yn derbyn hynny oherwydd, yn y pen draw, mater i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a Senedd y DU yw penderfynu cynnwys deddfwriaeth. Ein teimlad ni oedd ein bod wedi cael bargaen dda ar fasnachfrait Cymru a'r gororau a throsglwyddo swyddogaethau dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y pwynt hwn yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgor. Bydd pobl yn aml yn dweud y dylem fod wedi gofyn am yr hyn y gofynnodd yr Albanwyr amdano. Erbyn hyn mae gan yr Albanwyr gyfrifoldeb dros y rheilffyrdd a'r seilwaith yn yr Alban, ac maent wedi cael setliad ariannol ychwanegol i ddarparu ar gyfer cynnal a chadw'r seilwaith hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, mae hynny'n iawn pan fydd pethau'n mynd yn dda, ond gall pethau fynd yn ddrwg, fel gyda'r

infrastructure, which can often be expensive, the current settlement, as an equivalent to what the Scots had, would not have put us in the financial position to be able to do that without taking money away from other services, be they EDT services or other Assembly Government services.

llifogydd ar linell dyffryn Conwy yn ddiweddar. Pe baem wedi bod yn gyfrifol, fel deddfwrfa ac fel Llywodraeth, am atgyweirio'r seilwaith hwnnw, a all yn aml fod yn gostus, ni allem fod wedi gwneud hynny gyda'r setliad cyfredol, fel swm sy'n cyfateb i'r hyn a gafodd yr Albanwyr, heb gymryd arian oddi ar wasanaethau eraill, boed yn wasanaethau ADETh neu'n wasanaethau eraill gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

3.30 p.m.

As I said, that is a practical issue. We felt that we had a good settlement. On the Scots' settlement, in terms of their need to maintain and keep up the infrastructure north of the border, they may feel that it is a bit of a poisoned chalice, but we think that we got a good deal.

Fel y dywedais, mater ymarferol yw hynny. Yr oeddem yn teimlo inni gael setliad da. Ynglyn â setliad pobl yr Alban, o ran eu hangen i gynnal a chadw'r seilwaith i'r gogledd o'r ffin, efallai eu bod yn teimlo mai cwpan gofidiau yw hyn, ond credwn i ni gael bargaen dda.

On amendment 5, section 10(1) requires a Secretary of State to consult the National Assembly before issuing an invitation to tender for, or enter into, a franchise agreement that includes Welsh services. As before, and I mentioned it in dealing with a previous amendment, I will undertake to discuss consultation on franchise agreements involving Welsh services within the Economic Development and Transport Committee, as I did during the recent discussion when the member of the Strategic Rail Authority and the Department for Transport came to consult the committee on the Great Western franchise. To the best of my memory, it was one of the only times when all members of committee, irrespective of their political parties, were unanimous in their view that the proposals being put forward were not satisfactory. On the basis of that, the Chair of the committee and I both wrote to the Secretary of State and the SRA, as it was, pointing out that we did not feel that the proposals were satisfactory. Therefore, once again, I would suggest voting against that amendment. However, as I said, these are mainly on practical points and not on points of principle.

O ran gwelliant 5, mae adran 10(1) yn ei gwneud yn ofynnol i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol cyn cyhoeddi gwahoddiad i dendro am gytundeb masnachfrait sy'n cynnwys gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, neu lunio cytundeb felly. Fel o'r blaen, a soniais am hyn wrth ymdrin â gwelliant blaenorol, addawaf drafod ymgynghori am gytundebau masnachfrait sy'n cynnwys gwasanaethau yng Nghymru yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, fel y gwneuthum yn ystod y drafodaeth ddiweddar pan ddaeth yr aelod o'r Awdurdod Rheilffyrdd Strategol a'r Adran Drafnidiaeth i ymgynghori â'r pwyllgor am fasnachfrait Great Western. Hyd y cofiaf, yr oedd yn un o'r unig achlysuron pan oedd holl aelodau'r pwyllgor, waeth beth fo'u plaid wleidyddol, yn unfrydol nad oedd y cynigion a gyflwynwyd yn foddhaol. Ar sail hynny, ysgrifennodd Cadeirydd y pwyllgor a minnau at yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ac at SRA, fel yr oedd, i ddweud nad oeddem yn teimlo bod y cynigion yn foddhaol. Felly, unwaith eto, hoffwn awgrymu y dylem bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant hwnnw. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, pwyntiau ymarferol ymarferol yn bennaf yw'r rhain, nid pwyntiau o egwyddor.

**Janet Davies:** I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 1. After 'save' insert:

**Janet Davies:** Cynigiad y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 1. Ar ôl 'ac eithrio'r' rhoi:

*those under section 3(9) and*

*rhai dan adran 3(9) a'r*

I propose amendment 2. After 'save' insert:

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ar ôl 'ac eithrio'r' rhoi:

*those under section 19(2)(c) and*

*rhai dan adran 19(2)(c) a'r*

I propose amendment 3. After 'save' insert:

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ar ôl 'ac eithrio'r' rhoi:

*those under Schedule 1, paragraph 15(5) and*

*rhai dan Atodlen 1, paragraff 15(5) a'r*

I propose amendment 4. After 'save' insert:

Cynigiau welliant 4. Ar ôl 'ac eithrio'r' rhoi:

*those under Schedule 5, Part 4, paragraph 11(3)(c) and*

*rhai dan Atodlen 5, Rhan 4, paragraff 11(3)(c) a'r*

A general point needs to be made about the railways: as a proportion of the railways budget, we in Wales get an extremely poor deal. It is very much below what you would get under the Barnett formula, for example. I am pleased to hear that the Minister is happy with the amendments in principle, but sorry that he does not feel able to support them in practice. That seems to happen often in the Chamber.

Mae angen gwneud pwynt cyffredinol ynghylch y rheilffyrdd: fel canran o gyllideb y rheilffyrdd, cyfran fechan iawn a gawn ni yma yng Nghymru. Mae'n is o lawer na'r hyn a gaech dan fformiwla Barnett, er enghraifft. Yr wyf yn falch o glywed bod y Gweinidog yn fodlon ag egwyddor y gwelliannau, ond mae'n ddrwg gennyf nad yw'n teimlo y gall eu cefnogi'n ymarferol. Ymddengys fod hynny'n digwydd yn aml yn y Siambr.

On amendment 1 on the Office of Rail Regulation and the Minister's concerns about bringing things to the Assembly quickly, my experience of the railways, since we have been in the Assembly, is that nothing has ever happened with them quickly. Railways and the word 'quickly' seem to be a contradiction in terms. I am sure that we can find time for this. Some of these issues are more interesting than those that usually come to the Chamber because, at the end of the day, a good railway system in Wales is the matrix on which so much else is built.

O ran gwelliant 1 am bryderon y Swyddfa Rheoleiddio Rheilffyrdd a'r Gweinidog ynghylch cyflwyno pethau i'r Cynulliad yn gyflym, fy mhrofiad i o'r rheilffyrdd, ers inni fod yn y Cynulliad, yw nad oes dim erioed wedi digwydd yn gyflym gyda hwy. Ymddengys fod rheilffyrdd a'r gair 'cyflym' yn gwrth-ddweud ei gilydd. Yr wyf yn siwr y gallwn neilltuo amser ar gyfer hyn. Mae rhai o'r materion hyn yn fwy diddorol na'r rheini sydd fel rheol yn cael eu trafod yn y Siambr, oherwydd yn y pen draw system reilffordd dda yng Nghymru yw'r matrices y mae cynifer o bethau eraill yn seiliedig arno.

On amendment 2 on the appointment of a member to the Rail Passengers' Council, what some Members here may not be aware of is the fact that we used to have a Rail Passengers' Committee for Wales before the recent Railways Bill went through the House of Commons. We no longer have that; we have one delegate instead. It is not unreasonable to ask for the Assembly to be able to appoint that delegate. I am sure that if the Minister wanted to send in a provisional

O ran gwelliant 2 am benodi aelod i'r Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffordd, efallai na fydd rhai Aelodau yma yn gwybod bod gennym Bwyllgor Teithwyr Rheilffordd dros Gymru gynt cyn i'r Mesur Rheilffyrdd fynd drwy Dy'r Cyffredin. Nid yw'n bodoli mwyach; yn hytrach maen gennym un cynrychiolydd. Nid yw'n afresymol gofyn i'r Cynulliad allu penodi'r cynrychiolydd hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siwr, pe byddai'r Gweinidog am gyflwyno enw dros dro—os y cyfan sydd ei angen yw

name—if all that it takes is a quick decision—he could send it in provisionally and I am sure that the Assembly would be happy to agree to support him on that. We need that power. I really cannot see why asking for the Rail Passengers' Council's report to come to the National Assembly is such a big deal. Why can it not come to Assembly Members instead of going to the First Minister or the Minister for Economic Development and Transport?

We need a statement of policy on franchising to come through the Assembly. We are not asking for the commercial details. This has nothing to do with commercial transactions, but with making policy, which the Assembly needs the power to do. Therefore, I hope that the Assembly will back these amendments. There is an issue of democracy here and one of achieving a good railway system.

Although Jenny Randerson is no longer in the Chamber, she raised an issue about the last franchising. Once again, I must say that if we got proper funding for railways in Wales, not from the Welsh Assembly Government but from the money coming in the block grant, we would be much better off and could afford to tackle anything that happened.

**Alun Cairns:** I propose the following amendment in the name of David Melding. Amendment 5. After 'save' insert:

*those under section 10(1) and*

I am grateful for the opportunity to speak in this debate. The amendment refers to section 10(1) of the Railways Act 2005. As the Minister highlighted in his introduction, the purpose of the section is to make it a requirement that the Secretary of State consults the Assembly before issuing an invitation to tender or before entering into a franchise agreement that includes Welsh services. The Minister's reason for not accepting this amendment is that, in the past, he has consulted with the Economic Development and Transport Committee where committee members have had the opportunity to pass on information, urge

penderyniad cyflym—y gallai ei gyflwyno dros dro ac yr wyf yn siwr y byddai'r Cynulliad yn fodlon cytuno i'w gefnogi yn hynny. Mae angen inni gael y pŵer hwnnw. Ni allaf weld pam mae gofyn i adroddiad y Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd gael ei anfon i'r Cynulliad yn achosi cymaint o broblem. Pam na all gael ei anfon at Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn hytrach nag at y Prif Weinidog neu'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth?

Mae angen i ddatganiad polisi ar fasnachfaint ddod drwy'r Cynulliad. Nid ydym yn gofyn am y manylion masnachol. Nid oes gan hyn yr un dim i'w wneud â thrafodion masnachol, ond â llunio polisi, ac mae angen i'r Cynulliad gael y pŵer i wneud hynny. Felly, gobeithio y bydd y Cynulliad yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn. Mater o ddemocratiaeth sydd yma a mater o sicrhau system reilffyrdd dda.

Er nad yw Jenny Randerson yn y Siambr bellach, cododd bwynt am y broses fasnachfreinio ddiwethaf. Unwaith eto, rhaid imi ddweud, pe baem yn cael arian priodol ar gyfer rheilffyrdd yng Nghymru, nid gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ond o'r arian sy'n dod i mewn yn y grant bloc, y byddem lawer yn well ein byd a gallem fforddio mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw beth a ddigwydd.

**Alun Cairns:** Cynigïaf y gwelliant canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 5. Ar ôl 'ac eithrio' rhoi:

*rhai dan adran 10(1) a'r*

Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl hon. Cyfeiria'r gwelliant at adran 10(1) Deddf Rheilffyrdd 2005. Fel y tynnodd y Gweinidog sylw yn ei gyflwyniad, diben yr adran hon yw galw ar yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol i ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad cyn cyhoeddi gwahoddiad i dendro neu cyn llunio cytundeb masnachfaint sy'n cynnwys gwasanaethau yng Nghymru. Rheswm y Gweinidog dros beidio â derbyn y gwelliant hwn yw ei fod, yn y gorffennol, wedi ymgynghori â'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth lle cafodd aelodau'r pwyllgor gyfle i drosglwyddo gwybodaeth, pwyso am bolisiâu a gwneud

policies and make recommendations.

I am quite encouraged by the Minister's conciliatory approach. He is conciliatory in tone, if not in reality in accepting the amendments. This Minister is probably the most gung-ho Minister that we have ever experienced. He keeps everything to himself until the least appropriate moment for the committee to have any real influence. Only this week, for example, the Minister launched the 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy' document. It has been trailed in the press by a number of us on the opposition benches seeking to find out something. It was launched outside the Chamber, and opposition researchers and Assembly Members were not even allowed in the room when it was being launched to the press. That demonstrates the status that the Minister considers the opposition to have.

**Janet Davies:** You refer to the 'WAVE' document. I do not know how many copies you have received, but since the press conference three have appeared in my post box. [*Laughter.*]

**Alun Cairns:** That demonstrates the point that I am trying to make. The Minister is all too happy for us to have a say or a view, or for us to lobby after the event. That is the key point. The purpose of section 10(1) is to ensure that we have an input when it really matters—before the tender is issued—so that we can make our case, and so that the Secretary of State and even the franchisees have an opportunity to listen to the priorities in the Assembly. On several occasions, the Economic Development and Transport Committee has been left with nothing more than lobby status. That is precisely the attitude with which the Minister approaches the committee.

In the past, the committee has formally asked the Minister to bring any significant announcement to the committee for consultation before making it. That request was made before the last Assembly elections, and, even in the months leading up to the elections, there was a blatant disregard for the wishes and demands of the committee. I have regularly questioned the Chair of the

argymhellion.

Caf fy nghalonogi gan ymagwedd gymodlon y Gweinidog. Mae'n gymodlon ei dôn, hyd yn oed os nad ydyw mewn gwirionedd, wrth dderbyn y gwelliannau. Mae'n debyg mai dyma'r Gweinidog mwyaf byrbwyll a gawsom erioed. Mae'n cadw popeth iddo'i hun tan y funud leiaf priodol i'r pwyllgor gael unrhyw ddylanwad gwirioneddol. Er enghraifft, yr wythnos hon lansiodd y Gweinidog y ddogfen 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. Bu nifer ohonom ar feinciau'r wrthblaid yn dilyn ei hynt yn y wasg i geisio cael gwybod rhywbeth. Fe'i lanswyd y tu allan i'r Siambr, ac ni chaniatawyd i ymchwilyr y gwrthbleidiau nac Aelodau'r Cynulliad hyd yn oed fod yn yr ystafell pan gafodd ei lansio i'r wasg. Dengys hynny statws y gwrthbleidiau ym marn y Gweinidog.

**Janet Davies:** Yr ydych yn cyfeirio at y ddogfen 'WAVE'. Ni wn faint o gopïau a gawsoch chi, ond ers y gynhadledd i'r wasg mae tri chopi wedi ymddangos yn fy mlwch llythyrau [*Chwerthin.*]

**Alun Cairns:** Mae hynny'n dangos y pwynt yr wyf yn ceisio'i wneud. Mae'r Gweinidog yn fodlon iawn gadael inni roi safbwynt neu farn, neu i lobïo ar ôl y digwyddiad. Dyna'r pwynt allweddol. Diben adran 10(1) yw sicrhau ein bod yn cael cyfrannu pan fydd hynny'n cyfrif mewn gwirionedd—cyn cyhoeddi'r tendr—er mwyn inni allu cyflwyno'n hachos, ac er mwyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol a hyd yn oed y sawl sy'n dal masnachfreintiau gael cyfle i wrando ar y blaenoriaethau yn y Cynulliad. Gadawyd y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth droeon gyda statws lobïo yn unig. Dyna'n union agwedd y Gweinidog tuag at y pwyllgor.

Yn y gorffennol, mae'r pwyllgor wedi gofyn yn ffurfiol i'r Gweinidog ddod ag unrhyw gyhoeddiad pwysig gerbron y pwyllgor i ymgynghori arno cyn ei gyhoeddi. Gwnaed y cais hwnnw cyn etholiadau diwethaf y Cynulliad, a hyd yn oed yn y misoedd cyn yr etholiadau, gwelwyd achosion amlwg o ddiystyru dymuniadau a gofynion y pwyllgor. Yr wyf wedi holi Cadeirydd y



Economic Development and Transport Committee, and when the Chair is so close to the Minister that she will not have open meetings with the Minister—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I will have no questioning of the impartiality of colleagues on the Panel of Chairs. I want that remark withdrawn immediately.

**Alun Cairns:** I will certainly withdraw that comment. However, I would like to highlight the best practice of Peter Black when he chairs the committee. The meetings with the Minister always include the party spokesman, and there is no private meeting before committee meetings on any other occasion. That demonstrates the transparency that the Assembly needs and demands. This is what section 10(1) comes to—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The debate is about the deregulation—[*Laughter.*] I am sorry. It is about the delegation of powers under the Act. I would be grateful if, instead of referring to other matters, Alun Cairns would adhere strictly to the subject matter of the debate.

3.40 p.m.

**Alun Cairns:** I am grateful to have the opportunity to come back to section 10(1) of the Act. [*Laughter.*] In all seriousness, there is an extremely important issue in the motion. Section 10(1) preserves the rights and privileges that are bestowed on Assembly Members. To allow such important issues to stay with the committee excludes any other Assembly Member from having the opportunity to express concerns and to outline the priorities. That would aid the franchisees, and would also demonstrate the priorities of opposition parties—not forgetting that, at the moment, we are in the majority, and we expect the Labour Party to be in the minority well into the next franchise agreement, although it has a number of years to run.

**Glyn Davies:** Could I ask Alun Cairns, during his very good contribution to this debate, whether he would welcome a removal

Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yn rheolaidd, a chan fod y Cadeirydd mor agos at y Gweinidog fel na chaiff gyfarfodydd agored gyda'r Gweinidog—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chaniatâf ichi holi ynghylch natur ddiuedd cydweithwyr ar Banel y Cadeiryddion. Hoffwn ichi dynnu'r sylw hwnnw yn ôl ar unwaith.

**Alun Cairns:** Yn sicr yr wyf yn tynnu'r sylw hwnnw yn ôl. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn dynnu sylw at arfer gorau Peter Black pan fydd yn cadeirio'r pwyllgor. Mae'r cyfarfodydd gyda'r Gweinidog bob amser yn cynnwys llefarydd y blaid, ac ni fydd cyfarfod preifat cyn cyfarfodydd y pwyllgor ar unrhyw adeg arall. Dengys hyn yr eglurder y mae ar y Cynulliad ei angen ac y mae'n galw amdano. Dyma a nodir yn adran 10(1)—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae'r ddadl yn ymwneud â dadreoleiddio—[*Chwerthin.*] Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Mae'n ymwneud â dirprwyo pwerau dan y Ddeddf. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe byddai Alun Cairns yn cadw'n fanwl at bwnc y ddadl, yn lle cyfeirio at faterion eraill.

**Alun Cairns:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cyfle i ddychwelyd at adran 10(1) y Ddeddf. [*Chwerthin.*] O ddifrif, mae mater hynod o bwysig yn y cynnig. Mae adran 10(1) yn cadw'r hawliau a'r breintiau a roddir i Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Mae caniatáu i faterion pwysig felly aros gyda'r pwyllgor yn eithrio unrhyw Aelod arall o'r Cynulliad rhag cael y cyfle i fynegi pryderon ac i amlinellu'r blaenoriaethau. Byddai hynny'n cynorthwyo'r rheini sydd â masnachfaint, a byddai hefyd yn dangos blaenoriaethau'r gwrthbleidiau—heb anghofio, ar hyn o bryd, ein bod yn y mwyafrif, a disgwyliwn i'r Blaid Lafur fod yn y lleiafrif ymhell i mewn i'r cytundeb masnachfaint nesaf, er bod llawer blwyddyn ohono ar ôl.

**Glyn Davies:** Hoffwn ofyn i Alun Cairns, yn ystod ei gyfraniad da iawn at y ddadl hon, a fyddai'n croesawu dileu'r blaid Lafur o

of Labour from Government as well as welcoming the fact that it is in the minority?

**Alun Cairns:** That is precisely the point, and that is what it comes down to. Section 10(1) seeks to preserve the privileges and rights of opposition Members knowing that, whatever party is in Government in the future, we will have the opportunity—no matter on which side of the Chamber you sit—to express your concerns and priorities.

**Kirsty Williams:** I would like to place on record the support of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group for the amendments that have been tabled by Plaid Cymru and the Conservative Party this afternoon. It strikes me as slightly ironic that the Minister—who expects us all to have the faith and trust in him to run one of the largest departments of Government, and which will include the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board from next year, along with other extremely important functions that will dictate the economic success and wealth of this country—cannot find a mechanism to get a report sent to Assembly Members. The person in charge of this department cannot find a mechanism to lay a name before the Assembly and get it voted upon. He cannot find a mechanism to allow us to have what I believe is a legitimate say in how we believe a franchise for Welsh railways should be put forward. I know that the Minister likes to keep it simple, but this is taking simplicity to a new level. I cannot believe that it is beyond the wit of the Welsh civil service to find a way to overcome Andrew Davies's concerns about the practicalities of implementing these amendments.

**Jocelyn Davies:** The Minister says that he supports these ideas in principle, but lacks the imagination to find a mechanism through which the Assembly could carry out these functions. I am sure that the members of the Business Committee could find a way of accommodating these matters easily and quickly.

**Kirsty Williams:** Indeed, as it is the role of the Business Committee to ensure that the will of the Assembly is actioned on the floor of the Chamber. I am sure that if it were the

Lywodraeth yn ogystal â chroesawu'r ffaith fod Llafur yn y lleiafrif?

**Alun Cairns:** Dyna'r pwynt yn union, a dyna y mae'n ei olygu. Mae adran 10(1) yn ceisio cadw breintiau a hawliau Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau gan wybod, pa bynnag blaid fydd yn llywodraethu yn y dyfodol, y byddwn yn cael y cyfle—waeth ar ba ochr o'r Siambr yr ydych yn eistedd—i fynegi eich pryderon a'ch blaenoriaethau.

**Kirsty Williams:** Hoffwn gofnodi bod Grwp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd gan Blaid Cymru a'r Blaid Geidwadol y prynhawn yma. Ymddengys braidd yn eironig i mi na all y Gweinidog—sy'n disgwyl i bob un ohonom gael ffydd ac ymddiriedaeth ynddo i redeg un o adrannau mwyaf y Llywodraeth, a fydd yn cynnwys Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru o'r flwyddyn nesaf ymlaen, ynghyd â swyddogaethau hynod bwysig eraill a fydd yn pennu llwyddiant a chyfoeth economaidd y wlad hon—ddod o hyd i fecanwaith i anfon adroddiad at Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Ni all y sawl sy'n gofalu am yr adran hon ddod o hyd i fecanwaith i gyflwyno enw gerbron y Cynulliad a phleidleisio arno. Ni all ddod o hyd i fedcanwaith i ganiatáu inni leisio'r hyn a gredaf sy'n farn ddilys am y modd y credwn y dylid cyflwyno masnachfaint ar gyfer rheilffyrdd Cymru. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn hoffi cadw pethau'n syml, ond mae hyn yn mynd yn rhy bell. Ni allaf gredu na all y gwasanaeth sifil yng Nghymru ddod o hyd i ffordd i oresgyn pryderon Andrew Davies ynghylch ymarferoldeb gweithredu'r gwelliannau hyn.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Dywed y Gweinidog ei fod yn cefnogi egwyddor y syniadau hyn, ond nid oes ganddo'r dychymyg i ddod o hyd i fecanwaith fel y gallai'r Cynulliad gyflawni'r swyddogaethau hyn. Yr wyf yn siwr y gallai aelodau'r Pwyllgor Busnes ddod o hyd i ffordd i ddelio â'r materion hyn yn hawdd ac yn gyflym.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn wir, gan mai rôl y Pwyllgor Busnes yw sicrhau gweithredu ewyllys y Cynulliad yn y Siambr. Yr wyf yn siwr, pe bae'r Cynulliad yn dymuno hynny, y

will of the Assembly, we could help the Minister to find a way to ensure that the ideas that we have before us today, which he supports in principle and has no great objections to, could become a reality for him.

As we have heard, it is not unusual for the Chamber to endorse appointments; this was the case for the appointment of the auditor general, the children's commissioner and the commissioner for standards. All of their names, having gone through the Nolan principles that the Minister outlined, came before the Chamber and were then voted upon. The reason for that is that it gives those individuals the credibility of being a ministerial appointment, as well as having the backing of the National Assembly for Wales. That sends a strong and positive message to that person as they undertake their duties and tasks on our behalf. They know that they cannot be accused of being a Minister's lackey. They know that they have support in what they are doing—not only from the governing party, but from all parties in the National Assembly. Any Welsh representative on the Rail Passengers' Council would be grateful to know that that was the case.

The Minister says that there is a great deal of urgency about this particular appointment. However, as he also outlined, the old Rail Passengers' Committee for Wales was got rid of and a new national body was set up. We have not had a person on that body since it was established. Why is there now this sudden rush? For the last few months, we have not had a person formally representing Welsh interests. Why is it that there is now a big rush, and we cannot possibly accommodate a vote here in the Assembly? It does not stack up. It is in the interests of that particular person, and of Wales with regard to the railway service, that he or she has the backing of the entire Assembly.

The Minister also referred to the Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting to which representatives came to discuss the franchise. He was quite right; universally across the committee, people were appalled by the level of understanding, knowledge and empathy that those

gallem helpu'r Gweinidog i ddod o hyd i ffordd i sicrhau y gallai'r syniadau sydd ger ein bron heddiw, ac sy'n cael eu cefnogi ganddo o ran egwyddor ac nad yw'n eu gwrthwynebu'n fawr, ddod yn realiti iddo.

Fel y clywsom, nid yw'n anarferol i'r Siambr gymeradwyo penodiadau; dyna a ddigwyddodd ar gyfer penodi'r archwilydd cyffredinol, y comisiynydd plant a'r comisiynydd safonau. Cyflwynwyd enw pob un ohonynt, ar ôl dilyn egwyddorion Nolan a amlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog, ger bron y Siambr a phleidleisiwyd arnynt. Y rheswm dros hynny yw ei fod yn rhoi hygredded i'r unigolion hynny ei fod yn benodiad a wnaed gan weinidogion, yn ogystal â chael ei gefnogi gan Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae hynny'n anfon neges gref a chadarnhaol i'r person hwnnw wrth iddo ymgymryd â'i ddyletswyddau a'i dasgau ar ein rhan. Mae'n gwybod na ellir ei gyhuddo o fod yn was bach i Weinidog. Mae'n gwybod ei fod yn cael ei gefnogi yn yr hyn a wna—nid yn unig gan y blaid sy'n llywodraethu, ond gan bob plaid yn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Byddai unrhyw gynrychiolydd o Gymru ar y Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd yn falch o wybod hynny.

Dywed y Gweinidog fod brys mawr i wneud y penodiad arbennig hwn. Fodd bynnag, fel y mae hefyd wedi ei amlinellu, cafwyd gwared ar hen Bwyllgor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd Cymru a sefydlwyd corff cenedlaethol newydd yn ei le. Ni fu gennym gynrychiolydd ar y corff hwnnw ers ei sefydlu. Pam y brys sydyn yn awr? Dros yr ychydig fisoedd diwethaf, nid oes neb wedi bod yn cynrychioli buddiannau Cymru yn ffurfiol. Pam mae cymaint o frys yn awr a pham nad oes modd inni gynnal pleidlais yma yn y Cynulliad? Nid yw'n gwneud synnwyr. Mae o fudd y person penodol hwnnw, ac i Gymru o ran y gwasanaeth rheilffyrdd, fod y Cynulliad cyfan yn ei gefnogi.

Cyfeiriodd y Gweinidog hefyd at gyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth pan ddaeth cynrychiolwyr gerbron i drafod y fasnachfaint. Yr oedd yn llygad ei le; yr oedd pobl ar draws y pwyllgor i gyd yn arswydo o weld cyn lleied o ddealltwriaeth, gwybodaeth ac empathi a

individuals displayed in respect of the Welsh railway system. People were genuinely concerned that these people were potentially making a judgment as to what we needed in Wales without even a basic knowledge. Although I accept that there was a legitimate role here for the Minister and for members of the Economic Development and Transport Committee, our speaking collectively as a whole Assembly is a more powerful way of demonstrating our commitment to the service. I would have thought that the Minister would welcome the Assembly taking an interest in his portfolio, and the fact that the Assembly is so committed to issues around railways that we see it as a priority for our time here in this Chamber, rather than saying that it would be an inconvenience. I am sure that few Ministers would take the step of saying: 'Actually, I do not want to be able to be at the podium, talking about the portfolio that I represent'. Perhaps the Minister is uncomfortable coming to the podium to speak to Assembly Members about his portfolio.

**Lorraine Barrett:** Could you give us an idea, Kirsty, as to how much longer you are going to filibuster, so that we can go for a cup of tea? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. There can be no filibustering in this Chamber as long as I am sitting here. Kirsty's five minutes will be up soon and she will sit down.

**Kirsty Williams:** By all means, Lorraine; I understand that it is difficult for you to get through the afternoon without your daily cup of tea—please feel free to go to the tea room at any point. I am sure that you will not be missed. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Oh.']

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I have allowed injury time for two interventions. I believe that Kirsty Williams is about to resume her seat with dignity.

**Kirsty Williams:** Thank you, Presiding Officer. In conclusion, I believe that, as the Minister said, there are no principled objections to these amendments. If Members on the other side of the Chamber have

oedd gan yr unigolion hynny o ran system reilffyrdd Cymru. Yr oedd pobl yn wirioneddol bryderus fod y bobl hyn, o bosibl, yn llunio barn am yr hyn yr oedd ei angen arnom ni yng Nghymru heb hyd yn oed ddealltwriaeth sylfaenol. Er fy mod yn derbyn bod rôl ddilys yma i'r Gweinidog ac i aelodau'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, mae datgan ag un llais fel Cynulliad yn ei gyfanrwydd yn ffordd fwy pwerus i ddangos ein hymrwymiad i'r gwasanaeth. Byddwn wedi meddwl y byddai'r Gweinidog yn croesawu'r ffaith fod y Cynulliad yn ymddiddori yn ei bortffolio, a'r ffaith fod y Cynulliad wedi ymrwymo i'r fath raddau i faterion yn ymwneud â rheilffyrdd fel ein bod yn ei ystyried yn flaenoriaeth tra byddwn yma yn y Siambr, yn hytrach na dweud y byddai'n anghyfleus. Yr wyf yn siwr mai prin yw'r Gweinidogion a fyddai'n dweud; 'Mewn gwirionedd, nid wyf am fod wrth y ddarllenfa yn trafod y portffolio a gynrychiolaf'. Efallai fod y Gweinidog yn anghyfforddus wrth ddod at y ddarllenfa i siarad ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad am ei bortffolio.

**Lorraine Barrett:** A allwch roi syniad inni, Kirsty, am ba hyd yr ydych yn bwriadu herwddadlau, fel y gallwn ni fynd am banded o de? [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni fydd unrhyw herwddadlau yn y Siambr hon cyhyd ag y byddaf fi'n eistedd yma. Daw pum munud Kirsty i ben yn fuan a bydd yn eistedd.

**Kirsty Williams:** Wrth gwrs, Lorraine; deallaf ei fod yn anodd ichi fynd drwy'r prynhawn heb eich paned dyddiol o de—mae croeso ichi fynd i'r ystafell de unrhyw bryd. Yr wyf yn siwr na fydd neb yn gweld eich eisiau. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'O.']

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Yr wyf wedi caniatáu amser anafiadau ar gyfer dau ymyriad. Credaf fod Kirsty Williams ar fin eistedd yn urddasol.

**Kirsty Williams:** Diolch, Lywydd. I gloi, credaf, fel y dywedodd y Gweinidog, nad oes gwrthwynebiadau i egwyddor y gwelliannau hyn. Os oes gan Aelodau ar ochr arall y Siambr egwyddorion, byddant yn cefnogi'r

principles, they will support the amendments. gwelliannau.

**John Marek:** I rise to comment upon a very curious speech by the Minister, who said that he has no objections whatsoever to the amendments in principle. He could raise no political argument as to why these amendments could not be voted for today. He then gave various reasons, which amounted to procrastination and difficulties with time. I will go through them individually.

In respect of amendment 1, the Minister said that general guidance could be quick and that there would not be any time. If it is general guidance, I would have thought that in its generality it would be guidance that should be considered carefully and sent not in response to any emergency that might arise, but as strategic guidance for the body. I do not really understand what the Minister was saying when he was trying to urge his supporters to vote against the amendment.

Amendment 2, which is important, is so that the Assembly may appoint a member of the Rail Passengers' Council. Members have already said that we used to have the Rail Passengers' Committee for Wales, which was abolished, and that we now have just one body for England and Wales. The Minister said that the subject committee would be consulted. It may well be consulted but to be consulted is not the same as making the decision. You can consult anyone you want and then make up your mind afterwards. I rather doubt that we would have a member representing us or nominated by us who would speak for us at the Rail Passengers' Council, unless the Assembly was able to pass a motion confirming that that person would be its representative. The difference is crucial. That person then would owe his or her loyalty to us—the Assembly in Plenary—and not to the First Minister, because he has appointed that person. That is a deep, philosophical difference in principle.

3.50 p.m.

**John Marek:** Codaf i gynnig sylwadau am araith ryfedd iawn gan y Gweinidog, a ddywedodd nad oes ganddo wrthwynebiadau o gwbl i egwyddor y gwelliannau. Ni allai godi unrhyw ddadl wleidyddol pam na ellid pleidleisio dros y gwelliannau hyn heddiw. Yna, rhoddodd amryw resymau, a oedd i bob pwrpas yn ddim ond gohirio a chreu anawsterau o ran amser. Trafodaf bob un yn unigol.

O ran gwelliant 1, dywedodd y Gweinidog y gallai canllawiau cyffredinol fod yn gyflym ac na fyddai dim amser. Os canllawiau cyffredinol ydynt, oni ddylent, oherwydd eu cyffredinolrwydd, fod yn ganllawiau i'w hystyried yn ofalus a'u hanfon fel canllawiau strategol ar gyfer y corff hwnnw, yn hytrach nag i ymateb i unrhyw argyfwng a all godi. Nid wyf yn deall yn iawn yr hyn yr oedd y Gweinidog yn ei ddweud pan oedd yn ceisio annog ei gefnogwyr i bleidleisio yn erbyn y gwelliant.

Bwriad gwelliant 2, sy'n bwysig, yw galluogi'r Cynulliad i benodi aelod o'r Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd. Mae Aelodau eisoes wedi dweud yr arferai fod gennym Bwyllgor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd Cymru, a ddiddymwyd, ac mai un corff yn unig sydd gennym bellach dros Gymru a Lloegr. Dywedodd y Gweinidog y byddid yn ymgynghori â'r pwyllgor pwnc. Mae'n ddigon bosibl yr ymgynghorir ag ef, ond nid yw ymgynghori yr un fath â gwneud y penderfyniad. Gallwch ymgynghori ag unrhyw un a fyynnwch a dod i benderfyniad wedyn. Yr wyf yn amau a fyddai gennym aelod i'n cynrychioli neu aelod wedi ei enwebu gennym a fyddai'n siarad drosom yn y Cyngor Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd, oni fyddai'r Cynulliad yn gallu pasio cynnig i gadarnhau mai'r person hwnnw fyddai'n ei gynrychioli. Mae'r gwahaniaeth yn allweddol. Byddai teyrngarwch y person hwnnw wedyn i ni—Cyfarfod Llawn y Cynulliad—ac nid i'r Prif Weinidog, oherwydd ei fod wedi penodi'r person hwnnw. Mae hynny'n wahaniaeth athronyddol dwfn mewn egwyddor.

Secondly, I am worried about it, because, no doubt, the First Minister would appoint some Labour crony—not him personally, but the Labour system; I will not attack the First Minister personally. For example, if any of you have £250,000 and give it to Mr Blair as a donation to the Labour Party, you can confidently expect a seat in the House of Lords within the next year. You only have to look at the lists to see that that is so. For lesser sums, knighthoods are available. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘How much?'] I would be straying from the rather narrow range of this motion, were I to answer that.

I do not trust this Labour administration to appoint a person who will speak for Wales and for the Assembly, unless we can have a motion and confirm our confidence in that person. I would be happy for the First Minister to table a motion, after the various interviews had been held.

**Helen Mary Jones:** As well as that person owing their loyalty to the Assembly, would you agree with Kirsty Williams that that person would also have the strength of speaking with the authority of the whole Assembly when speaking at a British level?

**John Marek:** That makes it clear. I agree with what Kirsty said. If the Transport Minister were listening to this debate, I am sure that he would jump up and seek to intervene and say that he would support this amendment, which is a central amendment to this delegation motion.

Therefore, I fear that cronies will live long if this amendment is not carried. Amendment 3 is about the Secretary of State consulting the Assembly before preparing, altering or replacing a statement of policy on franchising. Is this something that we do every week? I doubt it very much. A principal policy on franchising is not something that is thought of in bed on Tuesday nights and tabled as a no-named day motion on Wednesday. It is something that is carefully considered. The Minister said that there is an issue of timing here—that is his

Yn ail, yr wyf yn pryderu am hyn oherwydd y byddai'r Prif Weinidog, yn ddiaw, yn penodi rhyw ffrind Llafur—nid ffrind i'r Prif Weinidog ei hun, ond i'r system Lafur; nid ymosodaf ar y Prif Weinidog yn bersonol. Er enghraifft, os oes gan unrhyw un ohonoch £250,000 ac os rhwch ef i Mr Blair fel cyfraniad i'r Blaid Lafur, gallwch ddisgwyl yn hyderus y byddai gennych sedd yn Nhy'r Arglwyddi o fewn y flwyddyn nesaf. Nid oes ond rhaid ichi edrych ar y rhestrau i weld mai dyna'r sefyllfa. Am symiau llai, cewch eich urddo'n farchogion. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Faint?'] Byddwn yn gwro'n ormodol o gwmpas cyfyng y cynnig hwn pe byddwn yn ateb hynny.

Nid wyf yn ymddiried yn y weinyddiaeth Lafur hon i benodi person a fydd yn siarad dros Gymru a thros y Cynulliad, oni allwn gael cynnig a chadarnhau ein hyder yn y person hwnnw. Byddwn yn hapus i'r Prif Weinidog gyflwyno cynnig ar ôl i'r amrywiol gyfweiliadau gael eu cynnal.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Yn ogystal â'r ffaith y byddai teyrngarwch y person hwnnw i'r Cynulliad, oni chytunwch â Kirsty Williams y byddai gan y person hwnnw hefyd y cryfder i siarad ag awdurdod y Cynulliad cyfan pan fyddai'n siarad ar lefel Brydeinig?

**John Marek:** Mae hynny'n ei wneud yn glir. Cytunaf â'r hyn a ddywedodd Kirsty. Pe byddai'r Gweinidog Trafnidiaeth yn gwranddo ar y ddadl hon, yr wyf yn siwr y byddai'n neidio ar ei draed ac yn ceisio ymyrryd a dweud y byddai'n cefnogi'r gwelliant hwn, sy'n welliant canolog i'r cynnig dirprwyo hwn.

Felly, ofnaf y bydd oes hir i ffrindiau Llafur os na dderbynnir y gwelliant hwn. Mae gwelliant 3 yn ymwneud â'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad cyn paratoi, addasu neu gyfnewid datganiad polisi am fasnachfaint. Ai rhywbeth a wnawn bob wythnos yw hyn? Yr wyf yn amau hynny'n fawr. Nid rhywbeth y mae rhywun yn ei ystyried yn y gwely ar nos Fawrth a'i gyflwyno fel cynnig heb ddyddiad trafod ar ddydd Mercher yw polisi pwysig ar fasnachfaint. Mae'n rhywbeth a ystyrir yn ofalus iawn. Dywedodd y Gweinidog fod

only problem with it. However, this is carefully considered; there would be ample opportunity for Plenary to consider any such measures if it so wished.

**Lisa Francis:** I agree with you about how important the role of the franchisee is here. Arriva Trains Wales currently has a 15-year franchise. It has been said that it should be reviewed every five years, especially when we know the subsidy that it is getting, which is £120 million a year, and especially when we hear that it will possibly cut jobs in Aberystwyth. I cannot understand why the Minister is opposed to this.

**John Marek:** No, I cannot understand it. My injury time has almost run out. I only have about 20 seconds, so I will attempt to finish, although I am only halfway through the speech that I intended to make.

Moving quickly to amendment 4, the Minister says—and I listened to him carefully—that it would not be appropriate to take up the time of a whole Plenary meeting. With respect, it is up to us whether we take up that time, not him. Similar arguments were applied to amendment 5, which I think were specious on the part of the Minister. He is trying to retain power for no good reason. If these amendments are not carried, I urge all Assembly Members to vote against this delegation motion in its entirety.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I am sure that most of you know that I am passionate about trains and their improvement, particularly the north-south connection, which, in my humble opinion, is a democratic right in a devolved nation such as Wales. Given that, we need a robust Minister for transport, not someone wishy-washy who does not stand up to the Welsh—

**Glyn Davies:** Will you take an intervention?

**Eleanor Burnham:** I have hardly got going, but okay.

yma broblem amseru—dyna'i unig broblem yma. Fodd bynnag, ystyrir hyn yn ofalus; byddai digon o gyfle i'r Cyfarfod Llawn ystyried unrhyw fesurau felly pe byddai'n dymuno.

**Lisa Francis:** Cytunaf â chi mor bwysig yw rôl y sawl sy'n dal masnachfaint yn y cyddestun hwn. Ar hyn o bryd mae gan Trenau Arriva Cymru fasnachfaint o 15 mlynedd. Dywedwyd y dylid ei adolygu bob pum mlynedd, yn enwedig gan y gwyddom faint o gymhorthdal a gaiff, sef £120 miliwn y flwyddyn, ac yn enwedig pan glywn y bydd, o bosibl, yn cael gwared â swyddi yn Aberystwyth. Ni allaf ddeall pam mae'r Gweinidog yn gwrthwynebu hyn.

**John Marek:** Na, ni allaf ddeall. Mae fy amser anafiadau innau bron ar ben. Dim ond rhyw 20 eiliad sydd gennyf, felly, ceisiaf dynnu at y terfyn, er nad wyf ond hanner ffordd drwy'r araith y bwriadwn ei thraddodi.

I symud yn gyflym at welliant 4, dywed y Gweinidog—a gwrandewais arno'n ofalus—na fyddai'n briodol cymryd holl amser Cyfarfod Llawn. Gyda phob parch, ni a ddylai benderfynu a ydym am ddefnyddio'r amser hwnnw, nid efe. Defnyddiwyd dadleuon tebyg gyda gwelliant 5, a oedd, yn fy marn i, yn dwyllodrus ar ran y Gweinidog. Mae'n ceisio cadw pŵer heb reswm da. Os na chaiff y gwelliannau hyn eu derbyn, anogaf bob un o Aelodau'r Cynulliad i bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig dirprwyo hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yr wyf yn siwr fod y mwyafrif ohonoch yn gwybod bod gennyf ddiddoreb angerddol mewn trenau a'u gwella, yn enwedig y cyswllt rhwng y gogledd a'r de, sydd, yn fy marn fach i, yn hawl ddemocrataidd mewn cenedl ddatganoledig fel Cymru. O gofio hynny, mae arnom angen Gweinidog cadarn dros drafnidiaeth, nid rhywun gwan nad yw'n sefyll yn gadarn i'r—

**Glyn Davies:** A gymerwch ymyriad?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Prin fy mod wedi dechrau, ond o'r gorau.

**Glyn Davies:** Would Eleanor Burnham agree that, as well as the north-south road, the east-west road is equally important?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, and I was going to come on to that in my short speech. The Minister needs to show a little bit more of a 'can do' mentality. Perhaps he should have read the article on motivation in *The Western Mail*, by a woman from America; he should discuss it with her. We need to stand up for the railways. We are in a sorry state at the moment, and if some of you had come up with me last week—I was up and down like a yo-yo to north Wales, which I adore doing because there is a wonderful view out of the window—you would have seen that the state of the rolling stock is appalling. I will return to the motion in hand.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I know your passion about railways, which is shared by me on many occasions as we make this journey. [*Laughter.*] I said 'passion about railways'. Does the Member recall the number of times on that journey that we have had to stand outside Crewe station for quarter of an hour while the Virgin train from London arrives and we miss our connection to north Wales? Is that not a disgrace?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Yes, it is. It is more akin to being in India, although its rail service is probably far superior to ours. What is more important than Wales being properly connected by a decent, reliable, clean and affordable service? These amendments deserve democratic discussion in Plenary; these matters should not rest with the First Minister. I urge Members to try to give the Minister for Economic Development and Transport some kind of hook on which to hang our passion and tell the Secretary of State that we deserve this service. I urge you to vote for these amendments—let us go for it.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Mae'r Gweinidog o'r diwedd wedi fy mherswadio ei fod yn ddyn

**Glyn Davies:** A fyddai Eleanor Burnham yn cytuno bod y ffordd o'r dwyrain i'r gorllewin yr un mor bwysig â'r ffordd o'r gogledd i'r de?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Byddwn, ac yr oeddwn yn bwriadu cyfeirio at hynny yn fy araith fer. Mae angen i'r Gweinidog ddangos agwedd ychydig yn fwy rhagweithiol. Efallai y dylai fod wedi darllen yr erthygl ar gymhelliant yn *The Western Mail* gan ddynes o America; dylai ei thrafod gyda hi. Mae angen inni sefyll i fyny dros y rheilffyrdd. Yr ydym mewn sefyllfa druenus ar hyn o bryd, a phe byddai rhai ohonoch wedi dod gyda mi yr wythnos diwethaf—yr oeddwn i fyny ac i lawr fel io-io i'r gogledd, sef rhywbeth yr wyf wrth fy modd yn ei wneud oherwydd yr olygfa odidog drwy'r ffenestr—byddech wedi gweld bod cyflwr y cerbydau yn echrydus. Dychwelaf at y cynnig dan sylw.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Gwn fod gennych ddiddordeb angerddol mewn rheilffyrdd, a minnau hefyd ar lawer achlysur wrth inni wneud y daith hon. [*Chwerthin.*] 'Diddordeb angerddol mewn rheilffyrdd' a ddywedais. A yw'r Aelod yn cofio sawl gwaith ar y daith honno y bu'n rhaid inni sefyll y tu allan i orsaf Crewe am chwarter awr nes i'r trê Virgin gyrraedd o Lundain, a ninnau'n colli'n cysylltiad i'r gogledd. Onid yw hynny'n warthus?

**Eleanor Burnham:** Ydy. Mae'n fwy tebyg i fod yn India, er bod gwasanaeth rheilffordd India, mae'n siwr, yn well o lawer na'n gwasanaeth ni. Beth sy'n bwysicach na sicrhau bod Cymru yn cael ei chysylltu gan wasanaeth fforddiadwy, glân, dibynadwy a da? Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn haeddu trafodaeth ddemocrataidd yn y Cyfarfod Llawn; nid y Prif Weinidog ddylai benderfynu'r materion hyn. Anogaf yr Aelodau i geisio rhoi rhyw fath o fachyn i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i gyfleu ein hangerdd a dweud wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ein bod yn haeddu'r gwasanaeth hwn. Anogaf chi i bleidleisio dros y gwelliannau hyn—awn amdani.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** The Minister has at last persuaded me that he is a man of



egwyddorol, ei fod yn teimlo bod y gwelliannau hyn yn faterion o egwyddor sylfaenol, ei fod yn awyddus i weld y Cynulliad yn cadarnhau'r apwyntiad i Bwyllgor y Teithwyr Rheilffyrdd, a'i fod yn awyddus i ddod â'r materion hyn yn ôl i'r Siambr i'w trafod yn llawn. Gan fod hyn yn fater o egwyddor i'r Gweinidog, mae'n gyfrifoldeb mawr arnom i gyd i gefnogi'r gwelliannau hyn i'w alluogi ef i weithredu'n egwyddorol fel Gweinidog.

**The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies):** I will be brief. On a few factual points, Lisa Francis was wrong to say that the Wales and the border franchise will not be subject to five-year reviews; it will be. On John Marek's comments, I did not say that I had no objections to the amendments; I said that I had no objections in principle, but that there are practical issues. As a legislature, we must deal with both the principle and the practical application of any legislation we pass. As I said in my opening remarks, these amendments are about powers of consultation, not powers of direction. In many cases, even if the Assembly were to carry a motion directing the Secretary of State for Transport to do something, he would clearly be within his rights to ignore that advice. On Kirsty Williams and Eleanor Burnham's points, I will quote from a document, and it is not one of mine.

'This is a fantastic time for railways in Wales, a time of growth that even the most enthusiastic doubted they would ever see'.

That was a press release from Kirsty Williams.

4.00 p.m.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 1: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter

principle, that he feels these amendments are matters of fundamental principle, that he is eager to see the Assembly confirm the appointment to the RPC, and that he is eager to bring these matters back to the Chamber to be discussed in full. As this is a matter of principle for the Minister, we all have a great responsibility to support these amendments to enable him to act with principle as a Minister.

**Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies):** Byddaf yn gryno. Ar ychydig o bwyntiau ffeithiol, yr oedd Lisa Francis yn anghywir i ddweud na fydd adolygiadau pum mlynedd o fasnachfaint Cymru a'r gororau; fe fydd. O ran sylwadau John Marek, ni ddywedais nad oeddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r gwelliannau; dywedais nad oeddwn yn gwrthwynebu'r egwyddor, ond bod yna broblemau ymarferol. Fel corff deddfwriaethol, rhaid inni ymdrin ag egwyddor unrhyw ddeddfwriaeth a grëir gennym a'i hymarfer yn ymarferol. Fel y dywedais yn fy sylwadau agoriadol, mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn ymwneud â phwerau ymgynghori, nid pwerau cyfarwyddo. Mewn llawer achos, hyd yn oed pe byddai'r Cynulliad yn derbyn cynnig yn cyfarwyddo'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Ddrafnidiaeth i wneud rhywbeth, byddai'n amlwg o fewn ei hawliau i anwybyddu'r cyngor hwnnw. O ran pwyntiau Kirsty Williams ac Eleanor Burnham, dyfynnaf o ddogfen, ond nid dogfen gen i ydyw.

Mae hwn yn amser gwych i reilffyrdd yng Nghymru, cyfnod o dwf yr oedd y bobl fwyaf brwd hyd yn oed yn amau y byddent yn ei weld.

Datganiad i'r wasg oedd hynny gan Kirsty Williams.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine

Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 2: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 3: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lloyd, David  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
Amendment 4: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Graham, William  
Isherwood, Mark  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Gibbons, Brian  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise

Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 29, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 5: For 29, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

Motion NDM2714 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting  
 under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of  
 Wales Act 1998,*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

Cynnig NDM2714 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan  
 weithredu dan adran 62(1)(b) Deddf  
 Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*resolves to delegate all functions of the National Assembly contained in or under the Railways Act 2005 to the Assembly First Minister, save those under section 3(9), those under section 19(2)(c), those under Schedule 1, paragraph 15(5), those under Schedule 5, Part 4, paragraph 11(3)(c), those under section 10(1) and those which by law cannot be so delegated.*

*yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol a gynhwysir yn neu o dan Ddeddf Rheilffyrdd 2005, ac eithrio'r rhai dan adran 3(9), dan adran 19(2)(c), dan Atodlen 1, paragraff 15(5), dan Atodlen 5, Rhan 4, paragraff 11(3)(c), dan adran 10(1) a'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw.*

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 55, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion: For 55, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Marek, John  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny

Ryder, Janet  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.  
 Amended motion carried.*

**Dirprwyo Swyddogaethau o dan Orchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodi)  
 (Rhif 2) a Gorchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodi) (Rhif 3) i'r Prif  
 Weinidog**

**Delegation of Functions under the European Communities Designation (No. 2)  
 Order and the European Communities Designation (No. 3) Order to the First  
 Minister**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigiwyd fod y ddau gynnig hyn yn cael eu trafod gyda'i gilydd, gyda phleidlais ar wahân. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad i hynny.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that these motions be debated together but voted upon separately. I see there are no objections.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62 (1) (b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*resolves to delegate to the First Minister all the functions of the National Assembly (save those which by law cannot be so delegated) contained in or under regulations made by:*

*yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw) a gynhwysir yn neu o dan reoliadau a wneir gan:*

*a) the National Assembly (whether made by the National Assembly alone or together with a UK Minister, UK Government Department or the Scottish or Northern Ireland Executives) under section 2(2) of the European Communities Act 1972 pursuant to the functions conferred on the Assembly by the European Communities (Designation) (No. 2) Order 2005 (SI 2005, No 1971) (available on the HMSO website at <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/si/si2005/20051971.htm>: or*

*a) y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (boed wedi eu gwneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ei ben ei hun, neu gydag un o Weinidogion y DU, Adran o Lywodraeth y DU neu Weithrediaeth yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon) dan adran 2(2) Deddf Cymunedau Ewropeaidd 1972 yn unol â'r swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad gan Orchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 2) 2005 (SI 2005, Rhif 1971) (ar gael ar wefan y Llyfrfa <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/si/si2005/20051971.htm>: neu*

*b) a UK Minister under his or her concurrent powers, under the said section 2(2) in*

*b) un o Weinidogion y DU dan ei b/phwerau cyfochrog, dan yr adran 2(2) ddywededig*

*relation to any of the measures in respect of which functions were conferred on the National Assembly in the designation Order. (NDM2715)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly, acting under section 62(1)(b) of the Government of Wales Act 1998,*

*resolves to delegate to the First Minister all the functions of the National Assembly (save those which by law cannot be so delegated) contained in or under regulations made by:*

*a) the National Assembly (whether made by the National Assembly alone or together with a UK Minister, UK Government Department or the Scottish or Northern Ireland Executives) under section 2(2) of the European Communities Act 1972 pursuant to the functions conferred on the Assembly by the European Communities (Designation) (No. 3) Order 2005 (SI 2005, No. 2766) (available on the HMSO website at <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/si/si2005/20052766.htm>;*

*b) a UK Minister under his or her concurrent powers, under the said section 2(2) in relation to any of the measures in respect of which functions were conferred on the National Assembly in the designation Order. (NDM2716)*

The purpose of the No. 2 Order is to delegate functions in relation to implementing community regulations on food and drink, including the primary production of food and feed. The primary purpose of the No. 3 Order is, similarly, to delegate functions in relation to the common agricultural policy of the European Community. The Assembly has previously had functions delegated in relation to both food and feed and the CAP.

**Y Llywydd:** Nid oes unrhyw siaradwyr ar y cynnig hwn.

*mewn perthynas ag unrhyw un o'r mesurau sy'n ymwneud â pha swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y Gorchymyn dynodi. (NDM2715)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan adran 62 (1) (b) Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998,*

*yn penderfynu dirprwyo i'r Prif Weinidog holl swyddogaethau'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (ac eithrio'r rhai na ellir, yn ôl y gyfraith, eu dirprwyo yn y modd hwnnw) a gynhwysir yn neu o dan reoliadau a wneir gan:*

*a) y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol (boed wedi eu gwneud gan y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar ei ben ei hun, neu gydag un o Weinidogion y DU, Adran o Lywodraeth y DU neu Weithrediaeth yr Alban neu Ogledd Iwerddon) dan adran 2(2) Deddf Cymunedau Ewropeaidd 1972 yn unol â'r swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad gan Orchymyn y Cymunedau Ewropeaidd (Dynodiad) (Rhif 3) 2005 (SI 2005, Rhif 2766) (ar gael ar wefan y Llyfrfa <http://www.opsi.gov.uk/si/si2005/20052766.htm>;*

*b) un o Weinidogion y DU dan ei b/phwerau cyfochrog, dan yr adran 2(2) ddywededig mewn perthynas ag unrhyw un o'r mesurau sy'n ymwneud â pha swyddogaethau a roddwyd i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn y Gorchymyn dynodi. (NDM2716)*

Diben Gorchymyn Rhif 2 yw dirprwyo swyddogaethau mewn perthynas â gweithredu rheoliadau'r gymuned ar fwyd a diod, gan gynnwys prosesau sylfaenol cynhyrchu bwyd a phorthiant. Prif ddiben Gorchymyn Rhif 3, yn yr un modd, yw dirprwyo swyddogaethau mewn perthynas â pholisi amaethyddol cyffredin y Gymuned Ewropeaidd. Dirprwywyd swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad mewn perthynas â bwyd a phorthiant a PAC yn y gorffennol.

**The Presiding Officer:** There are no speakers on this motion.

*Cynnig (NDM2715): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2715): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2716): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2716): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*



Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Elin  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Law, Peter  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, Val  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

### **Cymeradwyo'r Amserlen Gyfnodol Approval of the Periodic Timetable**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod  
propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales acting under Standing Order No. 5.1,*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.1,*

*notes the proposed 15-month timetable of Assembly Business e-mailed to Assembly Members on 23 November 2005. (NDM2717)*

*yn nodi'r amserlen 15 mis arfaethedig ar gyfer Busnes y Cynulliad a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 23 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2717)*

**Lisa Francis:** There is little to say on this except that we are opposed, in principle, to the reduction in committees from 10 to eight. However, we are obviously supportive, and always have been, of the fact that these committees will meet fortnightly.

**Lisa Francis:** Nid oes llawer i'w ddweud ar hyn heblaw ein bod yn gwrthwynebu egwyddor y cynnig i ostwng nifer y pwyllgorau o ddeg i wyth. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn amlwg o blaid y ffaith y bydd y pwyllgorau hyn yn cyfarfod bob pythefnos, fel y buom erioed.

**Kirsty Williams:** We will also support the periodic timetable. I thank the Business Minister for the way in which she has carried out her review of how the committees are working and for the hard work that she has put in to achieving this deal, which we can all support today.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddwn ni hefyd yn cefnogi'r amserlen gyfnodol. Diolchaf i'r Trefnydd am y ffordd y mae wedi gwneud ei hadolygiad o'r ffordd y mae'r pwyllgorau'n gweithio, ac am ei gwaith caled i sicrhau'r ddêl hon. Gallwn oll ei chefnogi heddiw.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Thank you. I think that it has been an important review. I built on the groundwork laid by my predecessor and I believe that we are paving the way for the new regime, which we anticipate will be in place post May 2007.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Diolch. Credaf iddo fod yn adolygiad pwysig. Yr oeddwn yn adeiladu ar y sylfeini a osodwyd gan fy rhagflaenydd, a chredaf ein bod yn paratoui'r ffordd ar gyfer y gyfundrefn newydd, a rhagwelwn y bydd honno ar waith o fis Mai 2007.

*Cynnig (NDM2717): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2717): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.07 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.07 p.m.*

**Adolygiad Polisi gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio:  
 Ailstrwytho'r Heddlu  
 Policy Review by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee: Restructuring  
 the Constabulary**

**Janice Gregory:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting  
 under Standing Order No. 6.6,*

*notes the report of the Social Justice and  
 Regeneration Committee titled 'Restructuring  
 the Constabulary', which was laid in the  
 Table Office and e-mailed to all Members on  
 23 November 2005.(NDM2718)*

In September 2005, the Home Secretary, Charles Clarke, wrote to the Assembly Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration to inform her of his proposal to accept the findings of the 'Closing the Gap' report. He reported his intention to consult with chief constables and police authorities throughout England and Wales on how those findings could best be implemented and he invited the

**Janice Gregory:** Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan  
 weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 6.6,*

*yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder  
 Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio dan y teitl  
 'Ailstrwythuro'r Heddlu', a osodwyd yn y  
 Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr holl  
 Aelodau ar 23 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2718)*

Ym mis Medi 2005, ysgrifennodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, Charles Clarke, at Weinidog y Cynulliad dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio i'w hysbysu o'i gynig i dderbyn darganfyddiadau'r adroddiad 'Cau'r Bwlch'. Nododd ei fwriad i ymgynghori â phrif gwnstabiailid ac awdurdodau'r heddlu ledled Cymru a Lloegr am y ffordd orau i weithredu'r

Assembly's views. The Minister, in turn, asked the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee to undertake a review of the report's findings, to take evidence and to consider ways in which the aims of the Home Secretary to close the gap in level 2 policing might be achieved in Wales. The committee was happy to oblige.

Our work started immediately. I can recall that, at the first meeting, Leanne Wood asked me, as Chair, if, in fact, there was any purpose to our review as it appeared that the decision had already been made. I gave my opinion that, although I had no direct line to the Home Office, I believed that our review would have an impact; if I had thought otherwise, I would not have been happy to participate. I was, of course, disappointed by subsequent events and comments that emanated from the Home Office. However, I believe that we have carried out a most worthwhile study that includes a number of important conclusions and recommendations. I accept that it was not helpful to receive the report from the director of the police structures review unit at the Home Office, which suggested that the only option for Wales was a single force. This was before the committee had finalised its fact-finding mission, let alone completed its report.

4.10 p.m.

I admit that some of us, at that stage, may have questioned our purpose. However, reflection showed us that the initial response from the Home Office should have come as no surprise. The initial consultation from the Home Secretary laid down several parameters for responses. Essentially, these were that the minimum size for a force should be over 4,000 officers or 6,000 staff, that existing force areas should not be subdivided, and that political and regional boundaries should be maintained. Strictly within these parameters, a single force would be the only option for Wales. The committee's report challenges these criteria. I believe that it is right to do so.

We are unanimous in our belief that the

darganfyddiadau hynny a gofynnodd am farn y Cynulliad. Yn ei thro, gofynnodd y Gweinidog i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wneud adolygiad o ddarganfyddiadau'r adroddiad, i gymryd tystiolaeth ac i ystyried sut y gellid cyflawni nodau'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref i gau'r bwlch o ran plismona lefel 2 yng Nghymru. Yr oedd y pwyllgor yn fwy na pharod i wneud y gwaith.

Dechreuodd ein gwaith ar unwaith. Cofiaf, yn y cyfarfod cyntaf, i Leanne Wood ofyn i mi, fel Cadeirydd, a oedd unrhyw bwrpas, mewn gwirionedd, i'n hadolygiad gan ei bod yn ymddangos bod y penderfyniad eisoes wedi'i wneud. Rhoddais fy marn, er nad oedd gennyf unrhyw linell uniongyrchol i'r Swyddfa Gartref, fy mod yn credu y byddai ein hadolygiad yn cael effaith; pe byddwn yn credu yn wahanol, ni fyddwn wedi bod yn barod i gymryd rhan. Cefais fy siomi, wrth gwrs, gan ddigwyddiadau dilynol a sylwadau a wnaed gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Fodd bynnag, credaf ein bod wedi gwneud astudiaeth werthfawr iawn sy'n cynnwys nifer o gasgliadau ac argymhellion pwysig. Derbyniaf nad oedd yn ddefnyddiol cael yr adroddiad gan gyfarwyddwr uned adolygu strwythurau'r heddlu yn y Swyddfa Gartref, a awgrymai mai'r unig ddewis i Gymru oedd un heddlu. Yr oedd hynny cyn i'r pwyllgor orffen ei genhadaeth i ddarganfod ffeithiau, heb sôn am gwblhau ei adroddiad.

Cyfaddefaf fod rhai ohonom, bryd hynny, efallai yn amau ein pwrpas. Fodd bynnag, o edrych yn ôl, ni ddylai ymateb cychwynnol y Swyddfa Gartref fod wedi ein synnu. Yr oedd yr ymgynghoriad cychwynnol gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn gosod nifer o baramedrau ar gyfer ymatebion. Yn y bôn, yr oeddent yn dweud y dylai unrhyw heddlu gynnwys o leiaf 4,000 o swyddogion neu 6,000 o staff, na ddylid isrannu ardaloedd heddlu presennol, ac y dylid cadw ffiniau gwleidyddol a rhanbarthol. Gan gadw'n fanwl o fewn y paramedrau hyn, un heddlu fyddai'r unig ddewis i Gymru. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn herio'r meini prawf hyn. Credaf ei fod yn iawn wrth wneud hynny.

Yr ydym yn credu'n unfrydol fod yr holl

whole consultation process has been carried out in unseemly haste. The committee, and any other stakeholder for that matter, has not had the time and, therefore, the opportunity, to assess the opinion of the general public. Let us not forget that it is their police force, and it is they who will most likely be affected by any change. The committee's report, therefore, calls for more time to conduct a meaningful consultation during which recipients of the service as well as stakeholders are consulted.

The committee is also concerned about the cost of reorganising police structures. Who will pay? We are adamant that it should be neither the Welsh taxpayer nor the Assembly. The Home Office's assumption of optimum savings from day one is extremely optimistic. We need a commitment that it will be responsible for additional annual costs arising from restructuring for as long as such costs persist.

The committee and all who responded to our consultation recognise that, from the point of view of most people, the most important aspect of policing is not the structure or size of the force, or even how it responds to international terrorism—although, no-one would wish to ignore that threat—but how it handles low-level crime and anti-social behaviour.

My final point on the report, although others will doubtless pick up on other aspects, is on probably its most controversial conclusion. I refer, of course, to the reference to future devolution of responsibility for the police service in Wales to the Assembly. I realise that such a move is not in accord with the wishes of all Members, including some in my own party. I point out, however, that this is a committee report, and the conclusions and recommendations reflect the views of the majority of the committee. This committee report has not been influenced by party policy, and it is all the better for that.

I conclude by saying that the committee has produced a good report. In doing so, it has been greatly assisted by the various

broses ymgynghori wedi digwydd yn rhy gyflym o lawer. Ni chafodd y pwyllgor, nac unrhyw randdeiliad arall o ran hynny, yr amser na'r cyfle, felly, i asesu barn y cyhoedd. Peidiwn ag anghofio mai eu heddlu hwy ydyw, ac mai arnynt hwy y bydd unrhyw newid yn debygol o effeithio fwyaf. Felly, mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn galw am fwy o amser i ymgynghori'n ystyrllon â'r rheini sy'n cael y gwasanaeth yn ogystal â rhanddeiliaid.

Mae'r pwyllgor hefyd yn bryderus ynghylch cost ad-drefnu strwythurau'r heddlu. Pwy fydd yn talu? Yr ydym yn benderfynol na ddylai trethdalwyr Cymru na'r Cynulliad dalu. Mae rhagdybiaeth y Swyddfa Gartref o arbedion uchel o'r cychwyn cyntaf yn hynod optimistaidd. Mae arnom angen ymrwymiad mai hi fydd yn gyfrifol am gostau blynyddol ychwanegol yn deillio o ailstrwythuro cyhyd ag y bydd costau felly'n parhau.

Mae'r pwyllgor a phob un a ymatebodd i'n hymgyngoriad yn cydnabod, o safbwynt y mwyafrif o bobl, nad strwythur na maint yr heddlu, na hyd yn oed sut y mae'n ymateb i derfysgaeth ryngwladol—er na fyddai neb am anwybyddu'r bygythiad hwnnw—yw'r agwedd bwysicaf ar blismona, ond yn hytrach sut y mae'n ymdrin â throseddau lefel isel ac ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf am yr adroddiad, er y bydd eraill yn siwr o godi pwyntiau eraill, yn cyfeirio, mae'n fwy na thebyg, at ei gasgliad mwyaf dadleuol. Cyfeiriaf, wrth gwrs, at y cyfeiriad at ddatganoli cyfrifoldeb dros wasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru i'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol. Sylweddolaf nad yw symudiad felly yn cyd-fynd â dymuniadau pob Aelod, gan gynnwys rhai o aelodau fy mhlaidd fy hun. Fodd bynnag, hoffwn egluro mai adroddiad pwyllgor yw hwn, a bod y casgliadau a'r argymhellion yn adlewyrchu safbwyntiau mwyafrif y pwyllgor. Nid yw polisi plaid wedi dylanwadu ar yr adroddiad pwyllgor hwn, ac mae'n well o lawer o'r herwydd.

Hoffwn gloi drwy ddweud bod y pwyllgor wedi cynhyrchu adroddiad da. Wrth wneud hynny, cafodd gymorth sylweddol gan yr

organisations that have made such high quality and comprehensive presentations to the committee. The committee has received the co-operation of all main stakeholders in providing oral and written evidence, and I thank them most sincerely for that. The committee's review began at the beginning of October, and here we are, on the last day of November, debating its report. That is a short timescale by any standard. It could not have been achieved without the co-operation of many of the Assembly's backroom staff, who regularly go about their work unheralded and unseen. Without the co-operation of the people who work on producing the Record of Proceedings, those in the print room, the translation service, the text processing service and the information technology branch, the final report would never have materialised, and I thank them all. I pay special thanks to Roger Chaffey, clerk to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, whose work on the report went above and beyond the call of duty. He was, of course, ably assisted by his clerking team, Claire Griffiths and Alun Davidson, who both did sterling work in arranging all our meetings, liaising with presenters and generally enabling everything to run smoothly to allow the committee to produce its report. Thank you to them and to the Members' Research Service, and to Graham Winter for his committee briefings.

Last, but not least, I thank my fellow committee members. At the outset of our deliberations, I am sure that we all had our preconceived ideas of what the report should and should not include. Such ideas, however, were put to one side, and a report was produced that relied on the evidence provided by the witnesses who appeared before us. That is how policy reviews should be conducted, and I congratulate the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in its members' adherence to this principle. I am delighted to present this report to Plenary.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** At least a dozen speakers wish to catch my eye, so not

amrywiol sefydliadau a wnaeth gyflwyniadau mor safonol a chynhwysfawr i'r pwyllgor. Cafodd y pwyllgor gydweithrediad gan yr holl brif randdeiliaid wrth ddarparu tystiolaeth lafar ac ysgrifenedig, a diolchaf yn ddiwyll iddynt am hynny. Dechreuodd adolygiad y pwyllgor ddechrau mis Hydref, a dyma ni, ar ddiwrnod olaf mis Tachwedd, yn trafod ei adroddiad. Mae hynny'n amserlen fer yn ôl unrhyw safon. Ni ellid bod wedi gwneud hynny heb gydweithrediad nifer o staff ystafell gefn y Cynulliad, sy'n rheolaidd yn mynd o gwmpas eu gwaith heb ganmoliaeth a heb eu gweld. Heb gydweithrediad y bobl sy'n gweithio i gynhyrchu Cofnod y Trafodion, y rheini yn yr ystafell argraffu, y gwasanaeth cyfieithu, y gwasanaeth prosesu testun a'r gangen technoleg gwybodaeth, ni fyddai'r adroddiad terfynol wedi gweld golau dydd, a diolchaf iddynt bob un. Yr wyf yn diolch yn arbennig i Roger Chaffey, clerc y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, am ei waith ar yr adroddiad a oedd y tu hwnt i'w ddyletswyddau arferol. Wrth gwrs, cafodd gymorth parod ei dîm clericio, Claire Griffiths ac Alun Davidson. Gwnaeth y ddau waith clodwiw yn trefnu ein holl gyfarfodydd, yn cysylltu â chyflwynwyr ac yn gyffredinol yn galluogi popeth i redeg yn ddiraffferth er mwyn i'r pwyllgor allu cynhyrchu ei adroddiad. Diolch iddynt hwy ac i Wasanaeth Ymchwil yr Aelodau, ac i Graham Winter am y wybodaeth a ddarparodd i'r pwyllgor.

Ac i gloi, yn anad neb, diolchaf i'm cyd-Aelodau ar y pwyllgor. Ar ddechrau ein trafodaethau, yr oedd gennym oll, mae'n siwr, ein syniadau parod am yr hyn y dylai'r adroddiad ei gynnwys a'r hyn na ddylai ei gynnwys. Fodd bynnag, rhoddwyd syniadau felly o'r neilltu, a chynhyrchwyd adroddiad a oedd yn dibynnu ar y dystiolaeth a ddarparwyd gan y tystion a ymddangosodd ger ein bron. Dyna sut y dylid cynnal adolygiadau polisi, a hoffwn longyfarch y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am i'w aelodau gydymffurfio â'r egwyddor hon. Mae'n bleser gennyf gyflwyno'r adroddiad hwn i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae o leiaf ddwsin o siaradwyr yn awyddus i ddal fy sylw, felly, ni

everybody will be able to get in. I have considered limiting contributions to three minutes, but that would not be fair in view of the fact that an amendable debate has been tabled for next week. I will therefore allow the normal rules of debate, which mean five minutes in which to speak. Not everyone will get in, but for those Members who do not get in this afternoon, they will have every possible chance of catching my eye next week, should they so wish.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolchaf yn gynnes am y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y drafodaeth. Talaf deyrnged i'r pwyllgor am gyhoeddi adroddiad unedig, sydd hefyd yn heriol o ran ei gasgliadau. Llongyfarchaf y Cadeirydd am y ffordd y bu iddi gyflwyno ei hadroddiad ar ran y pwyllgor, ac am y ffordd yr aeth y pwyllgor ati i wneud ei waith. I'r rhai ohonom sy'n pryderu o bryd i'w gilydd fod ein pwyllgorau yn hollti ar faterion pleidiol, mae'n dda clywed y Cadeirydd yn mynegi'r farn fod yr adroddiad a gyflwynwyd yn mynd ar draws y pleidiau, a bod mwyafrif aelodau'r pwyllgor yn teimlo, er enghraifft, y dylid datganoli pwerau dros yr heddlu a'i strwythurau i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. Mae'r ffordd deg, gytbwys ac aeddfed a fabwysiadodd i gyflwyno'r adroddiad yn ei gwneud yn haws i lais y Cynulliad fod yn unedig a chlir.

Mae gennyf ychydig o bwyntiau—a gobeithio y bydd cyfle i Aelodau eraill wneud pwyntiau cryfach, o bosibl, yn ystod y ddadl yr wythnos nesaf—ynghylch proses y Cynulliad a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i fynegi barn am yr hyn a gynigiwyd gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Byddwch chi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a'r Prif Weinidog ac eraill ohonom a dreuliodd amser yn Nhy'r Cyffredin wedi hen arfer clywed syniadau ar lawr Ty'r Cyffredin mewn ymateb i ddigwyddiadau yn Llundain, Manceinion, Lerpwl a dinasoedd mawr eraill yn Lloegr nad ydynt yn berthnasol o gwbl i'r hyn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Hynny yw, nid ydynt yn ystyried y sefyllfa wahanol yng Nghymru a'r ffaith bod ein daearyddiaeth yn ei gwneud yn anodd i feddu ar gyrff sy'n cyfannu Cymru gyfan ar bob achlysur.

Y Swyddfa Gartref yw un o'r adrannau yn y

chaiff pawb gyfle i gyfrannu. Yr wyf wedi ystyried cyfyngu cyfraniadau i dair munud, ond ni fyddai hynny'n deg o gofio bod dadl ar welliant wedi'i chyflwyno ar gyfer yr wythnos nesaf. Felly, dilynaf y rheolau arferol ar gyfer dadl, sy'n golygu pum munud i siarad. Ni fydd pawb yn llwyddo i gyfrannu, ond i'r Aelodau hynny na fyddant yn llwyddo y prynhawn yma, cânt bob cyfle posibl i ddal fy sylw yr wythnos nesaf, os dymunant.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** My warmest thanks for the opportunity to participate in the debate. I pay tribute to the committee for publishing a united report, which is also challenging in its conclusions. I congratulate the Chair on the way in which she has presented her report on behalf of the committee, and on the way the committee has approached its work. For those of us who worry occasionally that our committees divide on party-political matters, it is good to hear the Chair express the view that this report crosses all parties, and that the majority of the committee's members feel, for example, that the powers for the police and its structures should be devolved to the National Assembly. The fair, balanced and mature manner in which she has presented the report makes it easier for the voice of the Assembly to be united and clear.

I have a few points—and I hope other Members will have the opportunity to make stronger points, possibly, during next week's debate—regarding the process in the Assembly and the Assembly Government to express an opinion on the Home Secretary's proposals. The Deputy Presiding Officer, the First Minister and other of us who have spent time in the House of Commons are used to hearing comments on the floor of the House of Commons in response to events in London, Manchester, Liverpool and other large English cities that have no relevance to what is happening in Wales. In other words, they do not consider the different situation in Wales and the fact that our geography makes it difficult to have bodies that can encompass the whole of Wales on all occasions.

The Home Office is one of the Government

Llywodraeth sy'n lleiaf tebygol o ystyried buddiannau Cymru a gwrando ar ystyriaethau, oni bai eu bod yn dod o Lundain. Nid yw'n gorff sydd wedi ymateb bob amser yn ffafriol i ddatganoli. Yn y cyddestun hwn felly, mae'n briodol fod y Cynulliad a, gobeithiaf, Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn mynegi pryder ynghylch y ffordd yr aeth Ysgrifennydd Gwladol ati i ymgynghori ar y mater hwn. Yng nghanol yr hyn yr oedd y pwyllgor yn ceisio ei wneud—a chyfeiriodd y Cadeirydd at hynny—gwnaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol yn glir ei fod yn dymuno gweld un heddlu i Gymru. Fodd bynnag, fel plaid, yr ydym am lynu at y safbwynt a fynegwyd gennym ar y dechrau, sydd â chefnogaeth mwyafrif clir yn y Cynulliad, sef mai pobl Cymru ddylai benderfynu ar strwythur ein heddlu. Mater i ni yw ystyried maint yr heddlu yng Nghymru a pha fath o wasanaethau y dylai eu darparu, er enghraifft. Holodd y Cadeirydd beth oedd blaenoriaeth pobl Cymru o safbwynt plismona, a chredaf iddi daro'r tant cywir ynghylch hynny.

Yr hyn yr hoffem ei weld—a gobeithiaf y gall y Gweinidog ymateb i hyn—yw unrhyw ymgynghoriad ar ddyfodol strwythurau ein heddlu yn cael ei ohirion tan i'r Cynulliad gael mwy o gyfle i gymryd rhan yn y broses. Yn ddelfrydol, dylid gohirio'r penderfyniad hyd nes y datganolir y mater hwn. Edrychaf ymlaen i glywed yr hyn fydd gan y Gweinidog i'w ddweud am hynny.

Yr wyf yn croesawu penderfyniad y Gweinidog i beidio bod yn rhan o drafodaethau ffurfiol y pwyllgor, ond yn hytrach i ymateb yn ffurfiol ar ran y Llywodraeth. Pan ddaw pwerau newydd y Cynulliad i rym, gobeithiaf mai dyna fydd y sefyllfa ym mhob pwyllgor.

4.20 p.m.

**Leighton Andrews:** I congratulate Janice and the members of the committee on the report that they have undertaken and the wide range of evidence that they have gathered. In terms of the structure of the police service, they have brought together a lot of important material, which I hope will go some way towards informing the decisions that are

departments least likely to consider the interests of Wales and to listen to representations, unless they derive from London. It is not a body that has always responded favourably to devolution. Therefore, in this context, it is appropriate that the Assembly and, I hope, the Assembly Government, should express concern at the way in which the Secretary of State has consulted on this matter. During the committee's deliberations on this issue—to which the Chair referred—the Secretary of State made it clear that he favoured a single police force for Wales. However, as a party, we adhere to our original view, which is supported by a clear majority in the Assembly, namely that it is the people of Wales who should decide the structure of our police. It is for us to consider the size of the police force in Wales and what kind of services it should provide, for example. The Chair asked what the priorities of the people of Wales were with regard to policing, and I believe she has struck the right chord in that regard.

We wish to see—and I hope the Minister can respond to this—a postponement of any consultation on the future structure of our police force until the Assembly has more opportunity to participate in the process. Ideally, the decision should be postponed until the matter has been devolved. I look forward to the Minister's comments on that.

I welcome the Minister's decision not to participate in the committee's formal discussions, but rather to respond formally on the Government's behalf. When the Assembly's new powers come into force, I hope that will be the case in every committee.

**Leighton Andrews:** Hoffwn longyfarch Janice ac aelodau'r pwyllgor ar yr adroddiad a wnaethant a'r ystod eang o dystiolaeth a gasglwyd ganddynt. O ran strwythur gwasanaeth yr heddlu, maent wedi dwyn ynghyd lawer o ddeunydd pwysig a fydd, gobeithio, yn gwneud rhywfaint i lywio'r penderfyniadau a wneir. Cefais i'r fantais, fel



taken. I have had the benefit, as have one or two other Assembly Members, of being a member of the South Wales Police joint Assembly scheme and seeing the operation of that service on a day-to-day basis over the course of the last 18 months or so. It has been a privilege to be a member of that scheme and to learn more about the operations of the police.

In relation to my constituents, I believe that structure is not the main issue on the ground. The main issue on the ground is that our constituents can see the police: that they are visible, that they are seen as being responsive and that people can get through to them when they need to, and that the police service is seen as being delivered in the way that they need it to be delivered. I am pleased that the police have, on many occasions, attended community meetings in my constituency to discuss issues that are important to local people. That is important.

However, it is understandable that there are concerns throughout Wales about the structural issues at other levels. There are concerns that, in any restructuring, the needs of different communities are appreciated, and there needs to be sensitivity to issues of regional accountability with whatever structure comes forward in due course. People have benefited from a particular structure in Wales in the past and have operated in a particular kind of way. There are also issues relating to the funding of the police service through the precept, which need to be considered carefully. I know that the Minister and members of the committee have been thinking about that matter.

I am not convinced of the proposal that, should there be an all-Wales committee, the best way forward would be for every unitary authority to be to be represented on the board. That also needs to be discussed.

I am not persuaded that this is the time to seek the devolution of the police service. Nor is it my party's policy. Welsh Labour's policy on this issue is clear:

'Westminster would retain responsibility for policing, home affairs, justice'

un neu ddau o Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad, o fod yn aelod o gynllun Heddlu De Cymru a'r Cynulliad ar y cyd a gweld y gwasanaeth hwnnw'n gweithredu o ddydd i ddydd dros y 18 mis diwethaf neu oddeutu hynny. Yr oedd yn ffrainc cael bod yn aelod o'r cynllun hwnnw ac i ddysgu mwy am weithrediadau'r heddlu.

Mewn perthynas â'm hetholwyr, credaf nad strwythur yw'r mater pwysicaf ar lawr gwlad. Y mater pwysicaf ar lawr gwlad yw y gall ein hetholwyr weld yr heddlu: eu bod yn weladwy, y cânt eu gweld fel heddlu sy'n ymateb ac y gall pobl gael gafael arnynt pan fydd angen iddynt wneud hynny, a bod gwasanaeth yr heddlu yn cael ei gyflwyno yn y ffordd y maent am iddo gael ei gyflwyno. Yr wyf yn falch bod yr heddlu, lawer gwaith, wedi mynychu cyfarfodydd cymunedol yn fy etholaeth i drafod materion sy'n bwysig i bobl leol. Mae hynny'n bwysig.

Fodd bynnag, mae'n ddealladwy fod pryderon ledled Cymru am y materion strwythurol ar lefelau eraill. Mae yna bryderon, mewn unrhyw ailstrwythuro, fod anghenion cymunedau gwahanol yn cael eu gwerthfawrogi, ac mae angen bod yn sensitif i faterion am atebolrwydd rhanbarthol, beth bynnag yw'r strwythur sy'n datblygu maes o law. Mae pobl wedi elwa o strwythur penodol yng Nghymru yn y gorffennol ac wedi gweithredu mewn ffordd arbennig. Mae yna faterion hefyd yn ymwneud ag ariannu gwasanaeth yr heddlu drwy'r praesept, ac mae angen eu hystyried yn ofalus. Gwn fod y Gweinidog ac aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi bod yn ystyried y mater hwnnw.

Nid yw'r cynnig wedi fy argyhoeddi, pe bai pwyllgor Cymru gyfan ar gael, mai'r ffordd orau ymlaen fyddai i bob awdurdod unedol gael ei gynrychioli ar y bwrdd. Mae angen trafod hynny hefyd.

Ni chaf fy narbwylllo mai dyma'r adeg i geisio datganoli gwasanaeth yr heddlu. Ac nid dyna yw polisi fy mhlaid. Mae polisi Llafur Cymru ar y mater hwn yn glir:

Byddai San Steffan yn parhau i fod yn gyfrifol am blismona, materion cartref,

cyfiawnder

and other such functions. That was set out clearly in our document, 'Better Governance for Wales', which was adopted at our special conference last year. This is the weakest part of the committee's report. I welcome what the committee says, and I do not disagree that any future restructuring should not be done in such a way as to rule out the possible devolution of the police service at some stage in the future; I can go along with that. I also welcome the committee's statement that it

a swyddogaethau eraill o'r fath. Nodwyd hynny yn glir yn ein dogfen, 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru', a fabwysiadwyd yn ein cynhadledd arbennig y llynedd. Dyna rhan wannaf yn adroddiad y pwyllgor. Croesawaf yr hyn a ddywed y pwyllgor, ac nid wyf yn anghytuno na ddylid gwneud unrhyw waith ailstrwythuro yn y dyfodol yn y fath fodd fel ei fod yn diystyru'r posibilrwydd o ddatganoli gwasanaeth yr heddlu rywbyrd yn y dyfodol; gallaf gytuno â hynny. Croesawaf hefyd ddatganiad y pwyllgor ei fod

'recognises that the desirability for devolution of the Police Services to the National Assembly for Wales must not be achieved at any price'.

yn cydnabod na ddylai'r dymuniad i ddatganoli Gwasanaethau'r Heddlu i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru gael ei gyflawni ar unrhyw gyfrif.

**Leanne Wood:** Two of the three emergency services are already under the responsibility of the National Assembly. Surely it makes sense, in terms of joined-up responses to things like major terrorist incidents, for the three emergency services to be under the responsibility of the National Assembly for Wales. How do you square that circle with the position that you are outlining?

**Leanne Wood:** Mae'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol eisoes yn gyfrifol am ddau o blith tri o'r gwasanaethau brys. Onid yw'n gwneud synnwyr, o ran ymatebion cydgysylltiedig i bethau fel digwyddiadau terfysgaeth mawr, i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru fod yn gyfrifol am y tri gwasanaeth brys? Sut yr ydych yn sgwario'r cylch hwnnw â'r sefyllfa yr ydych yn ei hamlinellu?

**Leighton Andrews:** Thank you for demonstrating what I see as the complete lack of intellectual rigour in this part of the report. I do not buy the argument that simply because two of the three emergency services are devolved, the third should be. Key inter-relationships with the criminal justice system, the prison service—

**Leighton Andrews:** Diolch ichi am ddangos yr hyn a ystyriaf yn brinder manyldeb deallusol llwyr yn y rhan hon o'r adroddiad. Ni dderbyniaf y ddadl y dylai'r trydydd gwasanaeth brys gael ei ddatganoli am fod y ddau arall yn cael eu datganoli. Mae cydberthynas allweddol â'r system cyfiawnder troseddol, y gwasanaeth carchardai—

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Will you give way?

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** A ildiwch?

**Leighton Andrews:** I will in a moment.

**Leighton Andrews:** Gwnaf ymhen eiliad.

Key inter-relationships with the criminal justice, prison and probation services, the Crown Prosecution Service and so on have to be considered in relation to any issues and judgments that are made about the future devolution of the police service. These matters are not gone into in the text of the report, and that is a weakness. I have read the

Mae cydberthynas allweddol â'r system cyfiawnder troseddol, y gwasanaeth carchardai a'r gwasanaeth prawf, Gwasanaeth Erlyn y Goron ac yn y blaen yn gorfod cael eu hystyried mewn perthynas ag unrhyw faterion a safbwyntiau a wneir am ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth heddlu yn y dyfodol. Nid ymdrinnir yn ddigonol â'r materion hyn

evidence given by the probation service, and it is clear that it is not seeking to be devolved at this point. Therefore, I do not see the case being made in this report for the request to be made to the Home Secretary to take this as an opportunity to suggest that the time is now appropriate to start consultations on the devolution of the police service.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I think that Leighton forgets that there are real differences between operational matters, which are the responsibility of the police, and structural, legal matters. The structure of the legal system is entirely separate. That is something about which some of us have a little knowledge. Would he not recognise, despite his objection regarding the inter-relationship, that the chief constables in Wales, because, for example, we already make a big contribution to the financing of the police, are persuaded of the argument for devolution?

**Leighton Andrews:** There are issues regarding timing and when that discussion should take place. I respect your experience in terms of the legal system, and I do not wish to detract from that in any way, but it seems to me that if you are going to embark on a discussion about when the police service should be devolved, you need to be discussing issues such as criminal justice and others, which you have also referred to. There is no reference to those in this committee report, and, on that basis, I do not believe that those issues have been properly thought through. I disagree with that aspect of the report. This is a take-note debate. I am happy to vote in favour of noting the report. However, if it were a motion that demanded our complete support for every recommendation, I would not be able to support it today.

**Mark Isherwood:** I also wish to thank Roger Chaffey and his team for their patience and hard work within a tight timescale, and the Chair for the manner in which she has conducted the hearings with the many witnesses that have come before us.

yn nhestun yr adroddiad, ac mae hynny'n wendid. Yr wyf wedi darllen y dystiolaeth a roddwyd gan y gwasanaeth prawf, ac mae'n amlwg nad yw'n ceisio cael ei ddatganoli ar hyn o bryd. Felly, ni welaf fod dadl yn yr adroddiad hwn dros wneud y cais i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref gymryd hyn fel cyfle i awgrymu mai dyma'r adeg briodol i ddechrau ymgynghori ar ddatganoli'r gwasanaeth heddlu.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Credaf fod Leighton yn anghofio bod gwahaniaethau gwirioneddol rhwng materion gweithredol, sef cyfrifoldeb yr heddlu, a materion strwythurol, cyfreithiol. Mae strwythur y system gyfreithiol yn hollol ar wahân. Mae hynny'n rhywbeth nad oes gan lawer ohonom ddealltwriaeth ohono. Oni fyddai'n cydnabod, er ei wrthwynebiad o ran y gydberthynas, fod y prif gwnstabiliaid yng Nghymru, oherwydd, er enghraifft, ein bod yn gwneud cyfraniad mawr eisoes i'r broses o ariannu'r heddlu, wedi eu darbwylllo bod dadl dros ddatganoli?

**Leighton Andrews:** Mae problemau o ran amseru a phryd y dylid cynnal y drafodaeth honno. Yr wyf yn parchu eich profiad o'r system gyfreithiol, ac nid wyf am dynnu oddi ar hynny mewn unrhyw ffordd. Ond ymddengys i mi, os ydych yn mynd i ddechrau trafodaeth ynglyn â phryd y dylid datganoli'r gwasanaeth heddlu, fod angen i chi drafod materion megis cyfiawnder troseddol a phethau eraill yr ydych hefyd wedi cyfeirio atynt. Nid oes unrhyw gyfeiriad at y rheini yn yr adroddiad hwn gan y pwyllgor, ac ar y sail honno ni chredaf fod y materion hynny wedi eu hystyried yn ddigon trwyadl. Anghytunaf â'r agwedd honno ar yr adroddiad. Mae hon yn ddadl y mae angen rhoi sylw iddi. Yr wyf yn fodlon pleidleisio o blaid nodi'r adroddiad. Fodd bynnag, pe bae'n gynnig a oedd yn hawlio ein cefnogaeth lwyr i bob argymhelliad, ni fyddwn yn gallu ei gefnogi heddiw.

**Mark Isherwood:** Hoffwn i hefyd ddiolch i Roger Chaffey a'i dîm am eu hamynedd a'u gwaith caled o fewn amserlen dynn, ac i'r Cadeirydd am y ffordd y mae wedi cynnal y gwrandawriadau gyda'r tystion niferus sydd wedi dod ger ein bron.

By endorsing 'Closing the Gap', the Home Secretary loaded the dice. Wales can have any outcome provided that it is the outcome that meets his criteria, namely having an integrated single Welsh police force. As the Welsh police authorities told us, this is being driven by a political imperative. Virtually every organisation that gave evidence to the committee criticised the timescale, and the Welsh Local Government Association went as far as to describe it as 'lunatic'. It is therefore to the credit of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee that it has refused to recommend any of the four options put forward by the police authorities and the chief constables of Wales.

Some committee members have stated that they do not consider the consultation's undertakings to have been a meaningless exercise, although many hold a contrary view. As North Wales Police Authority stated, before any meaningful consultation among the people of north Wales has taken place, the Home Office has decreed unilaterally that the north Wales force will be subsumed into an all-Wales entity. However, a week is a long time in politics, and what appears certain one week may well appear less certain the next. I hope that that is right, although we cannot ignore recent statements by the Home Office and the Secretary of State for Wales, Peter Hain, which suggest that the UK Government has already made up its mind that Wales will have a single police force.

Rather than conducting a consultation, the Home Secretary appears to have presented our chief constables with an ultimatum, with the most fundamental restructuring of Britain's police forces to be rushed through in a matter of weeks and with the proposed outcome strangely modelled on the 10 Euro-regions of England and Wales rather than on operational effectiveness and reality. The Home Secretary states that the minimum number of officers a force can have is 4,000, or 6,000 staff in total. Where is the evidence base for this? As the WLGA told us, this is a subjective view and one that is not being

Drwy gymeradwyo 'Cau'r Bwlch', mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi dylanwadu ar y canlyniad. Gall Cymru gael unrhyw ganlyniad ar yr amod mai'r canlyniad sy'n bodloni ei feini prawf ef yw hwnnw, sef cael un heddlu integredig yng Nghymru. Fel y dywedodd awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru wrthym, caiff hyn ei lywio gan orchymyn gwleidyddol. Beirniadwyd yr amserlen gan bron bob sefydliad a roddodd dystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor, ac aeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru mor bell â'i galw yn 'wirion'. Felly, mae'n glod i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ei fod wedi gwrthod argymhell unrhyw un o'r pedwar dewis a gyflwynwyd gan awdurdodau'r heddlu a phrif gwnstabiiaid Cymru.

Mae rhai o aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi dweud nad ydynt yn ystyried mai ymarfer disystyr oedd y gwaith ymgynghori, er bod nifer yn credu i'r gwrthwyneb. Fel y dywedodd Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, cyn i unrhyw ymgynghori ystyrion ymhlith pobl y gogledd gael ei gynnal, mae'r Swyddfa Gartref wedi deddfu'n unfrydol y caiff Heddlu Gogledd Cymru ei gynnwys mewn un endid i Gymru gyfan. Fodd bynnag, mae wythnos yn amser hir mewn gwleidyddiaeth, a gall yr hyn sy'n ymddangos yn sicr mewn un wythnos ymddangos yn llai sicr yr wythnos ganlynol. Gobeithio bod hynny'n iawn, er na allwn anwybyddu datganiadau'n ddiweddar gan y Swyddfa Gartref ac Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, Peter Hain, sy'n awgrymu bod Llywodraeth y DU eisoes wedi penderfynu y bydd gan Gymru un heddlu.

Yn hytrach na chynnal ymgynghoriad, ymddengys fod yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi rhoi wltimatwm i'n prif gwnstabiiaid, a'r gwaith mwyaf sylfaenol o ailstrwythuro heddluoedd Prydain i gael ei ruthro drwodd ymhen wythnosau, a'r canlyniad arfaethedig wedi ei fodelu'n rhyfeddol ar 10 rhanbarth Ewro Cymru a Lloegr, yn hytrach nag ar effeithiolrwydd a realiti gweithredol. Dywed yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref mai'r nifer lleiaf o swyddogion y gall heddlu eu cael yw 4,000 neu cyfanswm o 6,000 o staff. Ble mae'r dystiolaeth ar gyfer hyn? Fel y dywedodd CLILC wrthym, barn oddrychol yw hon, a

pursued by the Scottish Executive.

Almost all the population of Wales lies along the M4 and A55 corridors, and it is separated, as the report states, by a vast expanse of rural hinterland, geography, history, transport links and different policing requirements. Some have suggested that North Wales Police should combine with forces in north-west England. However, the only credible option, which came from the North Wales Police Authority, called instead for the development of a closer partnership arrangement with the Cheshire constabulary, or, by definition, its successor. This recognises the operational reality that: Operation Tarian, used by Welsh police forces to combat illegal drug use, excludes north Wales; that at the time of the Caia Park riots in Wrexham, North Wales Police was supported by officers from Cheshire, Merseyside and Manchester, but not south Wales; that at the time of the Warrington bombings a few years ago, North Wales Police supported Cheshire Police on the ground; that because north Wales is the entry point for those travelling from Ireland and north-west England, North Wales Police has a long history of dealing with organised and serious crime and terrorism; and that North Wales Police Authority believes that a budget increase of as little as £3 million would allow it to meet the service levels specified by the Home Secretary. We need time to explore this.

This figure contrasts with the additional all-Wales annual cost identified by the police authorities of up to £57 million, plus the up-front costs. We are also told that it could take 10 years to generate savings that would fund the reorganisation. As we have heard, we must consider the impact on council tax and the consequences of levelling up or down police precepts if forces were to merge.

This reinforces the argument put forward by

barn un nad yw'n cael ei harddel gan Weithrediaeth yr Alban.

Mae poblogaeth Cymru bron i gyd ar hyd coridorau'r M4 a'r A55 ac yn cael ei gwahanu, fel y dywed yr adroddiad, gan ehanger enfawr o gefn wlad wledig, daearyddiaeth, hanes, cysylltiadau trafniadaeth a gofynion plismona gwahanol. Mae rhai wedi awgrymu y dylai Heddlu Gogledd Cymru gyfuno â heddluoedd yng ngogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd yr unig ddewis credadwy, a awgrymwyd gan Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, yn galw yn hytrach am drefniant partneriaeth agosach â heddlu Swydd Gaer neu, drwy ddiffiniad, ei olynnydd. Mae hyn yn cydnabod y realiti gweithredol sef: bod Ymgyrch Tarian, a ddefnyddiwyd gan heddluoedd Cymru i atal defnyddio cyffuriau'n anghyfreithlon, yn eithrio'r gogledd; ar adeg terfysgoedd Parc Caea yn Wrecsam fod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi ei gefnogi gan swyddogion o swydd Gaer, Glannau Mersi a Manceinion, ond nid de Cymru; ac adeg y bomiau yn Warrington ychydig flynyddoedd yn ôl, fod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru Heddlu wedi cefnogi Swydd Gaer ar lawr gwlad; a chan mai gogledd Cymru yw'r mynediad i'r rheini sy'n teithio o Iwerddon a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr, fod gan Heddlu Gogledd Cymru hanes maith o ddelio â gangiau troseddwr a throeddau difrifol a therfysgaeth; a bod Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn credu y byddai cynnydd yn y gyllideb o ddim mwy na £3 miliwn yn caniatáu iddo fodloni'r lefelau gwasanaeth a bennir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Mae angen amser arnom i ymchwilio i hyn.

Mae'r ffigur hwn yn cyferbynnu â'r gost flynyddol ychwanegol i Gymru gyfan a nodwyd gan awdurdodau'r heddlu o hyd at £57 miliwn, ynghyd â'r blaengostau. Dywedir wrthym hefyd y gallai gymryd 10 mlynedd i gynhyrchu arbedion a fyddai'n ariannu'r gwaith ad-drefnu. Fel y clywsom, rhaid inni ystyried yr effaith ar y dreth gyngor a chanlyniadau codi neu ostwng praeseptau'r heddlu pe bai heddluoedd yn uno.

Mae hyn yn atgyfnerthu'r ddadl a

the Police Federation and others for a royal commission on policing to be set up, which would include an independent evaluation of the effectiveness of community safety officers.

4.30 p.m.

Local accountability must be assured and all local authorities must be represented on any resultant national police authority. Denbighshire County Council stated that if separate police forces cannot be retained each basic command unit should also have a statutory board, including representatives of community councils. Her Majesty's Court Service stated that were there to be a single all-Wales force that would require regional, operational sub-divisions.

Clearly, I welcome the committee's recommendation that the headquarters of an all-Wales police force be located in north Wales, but our chief constables are already discussing proposals for shared, back-office services that need not be centralised at one location and which recognise that operational integration between north and south Wales has never and can never truly exist. Furthermore, every opportunity must be taken to liberate police officers from paperwork, thereby creating employment opportunities for police staff whose jobs may otherwise be threatened.

I refer briefly to statements within the report concerning the desirability and inevitability of the devolution of police services to Wales. Wales must be recognised as a nation and not just another region. There must be greater consultation between the Home Office and the National Assembly for Wales on policing matters. However, we must recognise that policing in England and Wales has been integrated and interdependent since the Assembly's inception and that joint policing at organised crime and terrorism level 3 is best done at the UK level. Effective co-operation between North Wales Police and bodies such as North Wales Fire and Rescue Service already exists, and makes a mockery of the claim that only devolution will facilitate this.

gyflwynwyd gan Ffederasiwn yr Heddlu ac eraill dros sefydlu comisiwn brenhinol ar blismona a fyddai'n cynnwys gwerthusiad annibynnol o effeithiolrwydd swyddogion diogelwch cymunedol.

Rhaid sicrhau atebolrwydd lleol, a rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol gael ei gynrychioli ar unrhyw awdurdod heddlu cenedlaethol a gaiff ei greu. Dywedodd Cyngor Sir Ddinbych, os na ellir cadw heddluoedd gwahanol, y dylai pob uned reoli sylfaenol gael bwrdd statudol hefyd, yn cynnwys cynrychiolwyr o gynghorau cymuned. Dywedodd Gwasanaeth Llysoedd Ei Mawrhydi, pe bai un heddlu i Gymru gyfan, y byddai angen is-ranbarthau gweithredol.

Yn amlwg, yr wyf yn croesawu argymhelliad y pwyllgor y dylai pencadlys heddlu Cymru gyfan fod yn y gogledd. Ond mae ein prif gwnstablaid eisoes yn trafod cynigion ar gyfer rhannu gwasanaethau swyddfa gefn nad oes angen iddynt gael eu canoli mewn un man ac sy'n cydnabod nad yw integreiddio gweithredol rhwng y gogledd a'r de erioed wedi bodoli mewn gwirionedd, ac na all byth fodoli. Yn ogystal, rhaid manteisio ar bob cyfle i ryddhau swyddogion heddlu o waith papur, gan greu cyfleoedd swyddi i staff heddlu y gallai eu swyddi fod dan fygythiad fel arall.

Cyfeiriai yn fyr at y datganiadau yn yr adroddiad ynghylch pa mor ddymunol yw datganoli'r gwasanaethau heddlu i Gymru a pha mor anochel yw hynny. Rhaid i Gymru gael ei chydabod fel cenedl, nid fel dim ond rhanbarth arall. Rhaid sicrhau gwell ymgynghori rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru ar faterion yn ymwneud â phlismona. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni gydnabod bod plismona yng Nghymru a Lloegr wedi bod yn integredig ac yn rhyngddibynnol ers dyfodiad y Cynulliad, ac mai'r ffordd orau i gyd-blismona troseddau cyfundrefnol a therfysgaeth lefel 3 yw drwy blismona ar lefel y DU. Mae yna gydweithredu effeithiol rhwng Heddlu Gogledd Cymru a chyrff fel Gwasanaeth Tân ac Achub Gogledd Cymru eisoes, ac mae hynny'n gwawdio'r honiad mai dim ond

datganoli a fydd yn hwyluso hyn.

**Ann Jones:** Before I start, I declare an interest in that my son and his partner are both serving officers of North Wales Police. Like Leighton, I pay tribute to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee and to its Chair, Janice Gregory, for how they have turned this comprehensive report around. It certainly gives us thoughts and ideas to go ahead with. Like Leighton again, I have taken part in the Assembly police scheme. I trialled the scheme in north Wales, along with Mr Brunstrom, who was very obliging and who gave me an insight into how the police in north Wales work. We must always focus on that. This is about what the public expects from our police forces.

North Wales Police Authority has made the decision to set a higher precept than most police authorities in Wales in order to take on the role of community policing. That has gone down extremely well in north Wales, which has led to the north Wales police inspection report by Her Majesty's Inspectorate of Constabularies, which gave us an excellent showing in north Wales. We must protect that at all costs. I am sure that the committee is aware of that. This is about level-2 crime and about closing the gap, which relates to drug and human trafficking and other factors that—thank God—we do not experience in north Wales at the moment. I hope that that continues to be the way.

We also need to consider some accountability issues. When restructuring any organisation—in this case, the police authorities—we must look at how accountability will be maintained. Whatever happens, we, in north Wales, would like some accountability to be devolved and to remain in north Wales so that people feel that there is some direct accountability there. I do not know whether having 22 unitary authorities is the way forward—I am not expert enough to say that—but I do want to protect what north Wales already has. In

**Ann Jones:** Cyn imi ddechrau, hoffwn ddatgan buddiant gan fod fy mab a'i bartner yn gweithio fel swyddogion heddlu i Heddlu Gogledd Cymru. Fel Leighton, yr wyf yn rhoi teyrnged i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ac i'w Gadeirydd, Janice Gregory, am y ffordd y maent wedi cyhoeddi'r adroddiad cynhwysfawr hwn. Mae'n sicr yn rhoi pethau inni feddwl amdanynt a syniadau inni eu datblygu. Fel Leighton unwaith eto, yr wyf wedi cymryd rhan yng nghynllun heddlu'r Cynulliad. Bwm yn treialu'r cynllun yn y gogledd, ar y cyd â Mr Brunstrom, a oedd yn barod iawn ei gymorth ac a roddodd gipolwg imi o'r ffordd y mae'r heddlu yn y gogledd yn gweithio. Rhaid inni ganolbwyntio ar hynny bob amser. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r hyn y mae'r cyhoedd yn ei ddisgwyl gan ein heddluoedd.

Mae Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi gwneud y penderfyniad i bennu praesept uwch na'r rhan fwyaf o awdurdodau heddlu yng Nghymru er mwyn ymgymryd â'r rôl plismona cymunedol. Cafodd hynny goeso brwd yn y gogledd, sydd wedi arwain at yr adroddiad arolygu ar heddlu gogledd Cymru gan Arolygiaeth Cwnstabliaeth Ei Mawrhydi, a roddodd adroddiad gwych inni yn y gogledd. Rhaid inni ddiogelu hynny, doed a ddelo. Yr wyf yn siwr fod y pwyllgor yn ymwybodol o hynny. Mae hyn yn ymwneud â throeddau lefel 2 ac â chau'r bwlch, sy'n ymwneud â thraffig cyffuriau a thraffig dynol a ffactorau eraill nad ydynt—diolch i Dduw—yn amlwg yn y Gogledd ar hyn o bryd. Gobeithio y pery'r sefyllfa honno.

Mae angen inni hefyd ystyried rhai materion atebolrwydd. Pan fyddwn yn ailstrwythuro unrhyw sefydliad—yr awdurdodau heddlu yn yr achos hwn—rhaid inni edrych ar y ffordd caiff atebolrwydd ei sicrhau. Beth bynnag a ddigwydd, hoffem ni, yn y gogledd, weld rhywfaint o atebolrwydd yn cael ei ddatganoli ac yn parhau yn y gogledd er mwyn i bobl deimlo bod rhywfaint o atebolrwydd uniongyrchol yno. Ni wn ai cael 22 o awdurdodau unedol yw'r ffordd ymlaen—nid wyf yn ddigon o arbenigwr i ddweud hynny—ond yr wyf am ddiogelu'r

some ways, we have made the decision in north Wales by increasing that precept, as I said, so we should protect that and the resources that it has brought with it, at any cost.

We must also realise that this is not a devolved matter and that links with our MPs at the moment are vital. I know that my MP met with Charles Clarke, along with his north Wales colleagues. He put forward my views, as well as his own, on how we should protect the north Wales force. I am not saying this from the perspective of not wanting any change in north Wales. I simply want to preserve the scenario that, when someone in north Wales calls for a police officer, they know that they will get one.

I have to agree with Leighton; I am glad that this is a take-note motion only, as I do not think that I can support it. I remain unconvinced that the police should be devolved to the Assembly. There are many issues in the criminal justice system that would need to be addressed. People say that it could be done in Scotland, but there is a different legal system there. I would want to be convinced that it is the way forward for us, as an Assembly. However, today is not the day for that debate. That is not the ballgame at the moment.

What we must do in north Wales is protect what we have: an excellent community policing system, an excellent police force, dedicated police staff, dedicated police officers, and a chief constable who knows what he wants to do for the people of north Wales. Together with the North Wales Police Authority, we must have that mature debate—[*Interruption.*] You may laugh at what Mr Brunstrom tries to do for north Wales, but he has north Wales's interests at heart. We might not always agree with him on some issues, but he has created a very effective and efficient way of policing in north Wales.

We must have a mature debate on this. I am

hyn sydd gan y gogledd eisoes. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, yr ydym wedi gwneud y penderfyniad yn y Gogledd drwy gynyddu'r presept hwnnw, fel y dywedais. Felly, dylem ddiogelu hynny a'r adnoddau a ddaeth yn ei sgîl, doed a ddelo.

Rhaid inni hefyd sylweddoli nad yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi ei ddatganoli a bod ein cysylltiadau â'n Haelodau Seneddol ar hyn o bryd yn hollbwysig. Gwn fod fy AS wedi cyfarfod â Charles Clarke, ynghyd â'i gydweithwyr yn y gogledd. Cyflwynodd fy safbwyntiau, yn ogystal â'i safbwyntiau ei hun, ar y ffordd y dylem ddiogelu heddlu'r gogledd. Nid wyf yn dweud hyn am nad wyf yn awyddus i weld unrhyw newid yn y gogledd. Ond yr wyf am gadw'r sefyllfa lle y bydd rhywun yn gwybod y bydd yn cael ymateb pan fydd yn galw am swyddog heddlu yn y gogledd.

Rhaid imi gytno â Leighton; yr wyf yn falch mai cynnig i'w nodi yn unig yw hwn, gan na chredaf y gallaf ei gefnogi. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi o hyd y dylai'r heddlu gael ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad. Mae llawer mater yn y system cyfiawnder troseddol y byddai angen mynd i'r afael ag ef. Dywed pobl y gellid ei wneud yn yr Alban, ond mae system gyfreithiol wahanol yno. Hoffwn gael fy argyhoeddi mai dyma'r ffordd ymlaen inni, fel Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, nid heddiw yw'r diwrnod ar gyfer y ddadl honno. Nid dyna sydd dan sylw ar hyn o bryd.

Yr hyn y mae'n rhaid inni ei wneud yn y gogledd yw diogelu'r hyn sydd gennym: system ragorol o blismona cymunedol, heddlu rhagorol, staff heddlu ymroddedig, swyddogion heddlu ymroddedig, a phrif gwnstabl sy'n gwybod beth y mae am ei wneud dros pobl y gogledd. Ar y cyd ag Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru, rhaid inni gael y drafodaeth aeddfed honno—[*Torri ar draws.*] Digon hawdd ichi chwethin am yr hyn y mae Mr Brunstrom yn ceisio'i wneud ar gyfer y gogledd, ond gwneud hynny er budd y gogledd y mae. Efallai na fyddwn yn cytuno ag ef bob amser ar rai pethau, ond mae wedi creu ffordd effeithlon ac effeithiol iawn o blismona yn y gogledd.

Rhaid inni gael trafodaeth aeddfed ar hyn. Yr



pleased that Charles Clarke has recognised that the Assembly has a role, even though the matter is not devolved. For that, I thank him. I know that our Minister will always protect the interests of the people of Wales with regard to the future of policing in Wales.

**Mick Bates:** I start by thanking the Chair of the committee, Janice, and the clerk, Roger Chaffey, for the way in which they put this report together, and for their very responsible handling of the process. I believe that that is in stark contrast to the way in which Charles Clarke and Peter Hain have offered their opinions on 'Closing the Gap'. That stark contrast is about a democratic deficit, and I will refer to the evidence shortly. We had a situation in which we were presented with 'Closing the Gap', which embodied the destruction of a democratic process that engaged everyone from local authorities through to the police board. That point is exemplified by the written statement from the Police Federation of Wales, which states:

'The ultimate aim for such major restructuring must be to dramatically improve the quality of service delivered to our communities'.

Many speakers, particularly Leighton Andrews, referred to this point. The speed at which we were expected to undertake the review is a reflection of people's anxiety about the outcomes. Furthermore, the valid point made by Leighton Andrews about the legal services reinforces the view that the report had to be undertaken with too much haste, which meant that we could not discuss in detail the issue of legal services and their possible devolution to Wales. The Police Federation of Wales also points out that

'Structural reform is accompanied by financial reform aimed at reducing labour costs. This has typically meant more intensive working, worse promotion chances, less clear accountability, deskilling of officers, endless references to leadership and good management without the requisite training and understanding'.

wyf yn falch fod Charles Clarke wedi cydnabod bod gan y Cynulliad rôl, er nad yw'r mater wedi ei ddatganoli. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar iddo am hynny. Gwn y bydd ein Gweinidog bob amser yn gwarchod buddiannau pobl Cymru o ran dyfodol plismona yng Nghymru.

**Mick Bates:** Dechreuaf drwy ddiolch i Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, Janice, a'r clerc, Roger Chaffey, am y ffordd y maent wedi llunio'r adroddiad hwn, ac am y ffordd gyfrifol iawn y maent wedi ymdrin â'r broses. Credaf fod hynny'n gwrthgyferbynnu'n llwyr â'r ffordd y mae Charles Clarke a Peter Hain wedi mynegi eu barn am 'Cau'r Bwlch'. Mae'r gwrthgyferbyniad hwnnw'n ymwneud â diffyg democrataidd, a chyfeiriat at y dystiolaeth yn y man. Yr oedde gennym sefyllfa lle y cyflwynwyd 'Cau'r Bwlch' inni, sy'n ymgorffori dinistrio proses ddemocrataidd a oedd yn cynnwys pawb, o'r awdurdodau lleol i fwrdd yr heddlu. Profir y pwynt hwnnw gan y datganiad ysgrifenedig gan Ffederasiwn Heddlu Cymru, sy'n dweud: Rhaid i wella'n sylweddol ansawdd y gwasanaeth a ddarperir i'n cymunedau fod yn brif nod mewn proses ailstrwythuro fawr o'r fath.

Cyfeiriodd nifer o siaradwyr, yn arbennig Leighton Andrews, at y pwynt hwn. Mae'r cyflymder y mae disgwyl inni gynnal yr adolygiad hwn yn adlewyrchu pryder pobl am y canlyniadau. Yn ogystal, mae'r pwynt dilys a wnaed gan Leighton Andrews am y gwasanaeth cyfreithiol yn atgyfnerthu'r farn fod yr adroddiad wedi ei lunio'n rhy fryslog, gan olygu na allem drafod gwasanaethau cyfreithiol yn fanwl a'u datganoli i Gymru. Mae Ffederasiwn Heddlu Cymru hefyd yn egluro

Mae ad-drefnu ariannol yn mynd law yn llaw ag ad-drefnu strwythurol, a'r nod yw lleihau costau llafur. Mae hyn yn nodweddiadol wedi golygu mwy o weithio dwys, gwaeth cyfleoedd dyrchafiad, llai o eglurder ynghylch atebolrwydd, swyddogion yn colli sgiliau, cyfeiriadau di-ben-draw at arweinyddiaeth a rheolaeth dda heb yr hyfforddiant a'r dealltwriaeth angenrheidiol.

This view is emphatically reinforced by Unison, which also looked at the impact of restructuring on back-office jobs. It estimated that 1,000 jobs are possibly at stake. During the taking of evidence, I started to question the premise on which 'Closing the Gap' was built. That was reinforced when I looked at the performance indicators of our police forces in Wales on average, as compared with the forces in England. On all performance indicators, our four forces were better than the English forces. Surely there is the evidence and, as I said during evidence-taking, 'If it ain't broke, don't fix it'.

4.40 p.m.

One of the premises of 'Closing the Gap'—and I see the Minister looking at me, but I never had my question on this answered—was that there should be 4,000 officers, because forces of fewer than 4,000 officers are deemed to be ineffective. As I have mentioned, the performance indicators show quite clearly that our forces are operating very well, so why change? These were unanswered questions. In fact, the performance of some of the larger forces in England was much worse than that of our forces.

In terms of the issues of funding, it emerged from questioning the police authorities that the anticipated cost of the restructuring was anything between £47 million and £57 million. There was no clear indication, given Charles Clarke's view—[*Interruption.*] That must be him on the phone, ringing to correct me on a few points. There was no clear indication that that money would be given to the Assembly to undertake the restructuring programme.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mick, do you share my concern that, at the South Wales Police public consultation meeting last week, the commander in charge of the unit that is looking at this reorganisation admitted upfront that the costings had been done in great haste over two weeks and that they were rough and sketchy? Under questioning, he

Atgyfnerthir y farn hon yn bendant gan Unsain, a oedd hefyd yn edrych ar effaith ailstrwythuro ar swyddi'r swyddfa gefn. Amcangyfrifir efallai fod 1,000 o swyddi yn y fantol. Yn ystod y sesiwn i gymryd tystiolaeth, dechreuais amau'r sail ar gyfer creu 'Cau'r Bwlch'. Atgyfnerthwyd hynny pan edrychais ar ddangosyddion perfformiad ein heddluoedd yng Nghymru ar gyfartaledd, o'u cymharu â heddluoedd yn Lloegr. Ar gyfer pob dangosydd perfformiad, yr oedd ein pedwar heddlu ni yn well na heddluoedd Lloegr. Dyna yw'r dystiolaeth, onid e, ac fel y dywedais yn ystod y sesiwn i gymryd tystiolaeth, beth yw diben ei drwsio os nad yw wedi torri.

Un o'r tybiaethau yn 'Cau'r Bwlch'—ac fe welaf y Gweinidog yn edrych arnaf, ond nid wyf erioed wedi cael ateb i'r cwestiwn hwn—yw y dylai nifer y swyddogion heddlu fod yn 4,000, oherwydd tybir bod heddluoedd sydd â llai na 4,000 o swyddogion yn aneffeithiol. Fel y soniais, mae'r dangosyddion perfformiad yn dangos yn gwbl glir fod ein heddluoedd yn gweithredu'n dda iawn, felly pam eu newid? Nid atebwyd y cwestiynau hyn. Yn wir, yr oedd perfformiad rhai o'r heddluoedd mwy o faint yn Lloegr lawer yn waeth na pherfformiad ein heddluoedd ni.

O ran ariannu, wrth holi'r awdurdodau heddlu daeth yn amlwg fod yr amcangyfrif o gost ailstrwythuro yn amrywio o £47 miliwn i £57 miliwn. Nid oedd unrhyw arwydd pendant, o gofio barn Charles Clarke—[*Torri ar draws.*] Mae'n siwr mai ef sydd ar y ffôn, yn ffonio i'm cywiro am ambell bwynt. Nid oedd unrhyw arwydd pendant y byddai'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei roi i'r Cynulliad i ymgymryd â'r rhaglen ailstrwythuro.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mick, a ydych chi, fel finnau, yn pryderu bod y rheolwr sy'n gyfrifol am yr uned sy'n edrych ar yr ad-drefnu hwn, yng nghyfarfod ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf, wedi cyfaddef bod yr argostau wedi eu llunio ar frys gwyllt dros gyfnod o bythefnos, a'u bod yn fras ac

also admitted that they did not take into account the cost of co-ordinating IT or moving the headquarters.

**Mick Bates:** Thank you for that information. I am sure that it is helpful for us to see, yet again, that this was undertaken in unnecessary haste, and that it was a foregone conclusion from the point of view of Charles Clarke, that we would accept his edict.

To close, I hope that this committee report has emphasised our cross-party stance that says that we are not prepared to accept this edict from the Home Office, that we go one step further and say that we have tremendous forces in Wales, which operate effectively and that, therefore, there is no argument for change at this particular time.

**Sandy Mewies:** I would like to add my thanks to those of the other members of the committee and other Assembly Members to Janice Gregory for the way in which she chaired the committee. I would also like to thank our staff and colleagues who contributed to this particular report. Those who gave evidence were frank, and I was glad to hear the information that we received, as people were straightforward. I did not always agree with what people had to say, but they were straightforward and honest in giving us information and in answering questions.

I have to reiterate the points that have been made about the lack of time for consultation, which I think has been one thing that has set many hares running. It has caused problems because fears have been raised, and there has not been time to deal with those fears.

One issue in relation to north Wales—though it is not just a north-Wales issue—has been cross-border working. We were assured by the police authorities bar one, and by other people who gave evidence that cross-border working would continue in exactly the same way as it had before, as a procedural issue. I, for one, was glad to hear that. The point has also been made that regional identities—both for Wales and for the regions of Wales—should be retained. You have already heard about community policing, which works very

annelwig? Pan gafodd ei holi, cyfaddefodd hefyd nad oeddent wedi ystyried cost cydlynu TG na symud y pencadlys.

**Mick Bates:** Diolch ichi am y wybodaeth honno. Yr wyf yn siwr ei bod yn ddefnyddiol inni weld, unwaith eto, fod hyn wedi ei wneud ar frys diangen, a bod Charles Clarke wedi cymryd yn ganiataol y byddem yn derbyn ei orchymyn.

I gloi, gobeithio bod yr adroddiad pwyllgor hwn wedi pwysleisio ein safbwynt trawsbleidiol sy'n dweud nad ydym yn barod i dderbyn y gorchymyn hwn gan y Swyddfa Gartref, a'n bod yn mynd gam ymhellach gan ddweud bod gennym heddluoedd gwych yng Nghymru sy'n gweithredu'n effeithlon, ac felly nid oes dadl dros eu newid ar hyn o bryd.

**Sandy Mewies:** Hoffwn ychwanegu fy niolch i at ddiolchiadau aelodau eraill o'r pwyllgor ac Aelodau eraill y Cynulliad i Janice Gregory am y ffordd y mae wedi cadeirio'r pwyllgor. Hoffwn ddiolch hefyd i'n staff a'n cydweithwyr sydd wedi cyfrannu at yr adroddiad arbennig hwn. Yr oedd y rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth yn agored, ac yr oeddwn yn falch clywed y wybodaeth a gawsom, gan fod pobl yn onest. Nid oeddwn bob amser yn cytuno â'r hyn yr oedd gan bobl i'w ddweud, ond yr oeddent yn agored ac yn onest yn rhoi gwybodaeth inni ac yn ateb cwestiynau.

Rhaid imi ailadrodd y pwyntiau a wnaed ynghylch y prinder amser ar gyfer ymgynghori, a chredaf fod hynny yn un peth sydd wedi codi llawer ysgyfarnog. Mae wedi achosi problemau oherwydd codi ofnau, ac nid oedd amser i ymdrin â'r ofnau hynny.

Un mater yn ymwneud â'r gogledd—er nad yw'n fater sy'n gyfyngedig i'r gogledd—yw gweithio ar draws ffiniau. Cawsom sicrwydd gan bob awdurdod heddlu ac eithrio un, a chan bobl eraill a roddodd dystiolaeth, y byddai gweithio ar draws ffiniau'n parhau yn union yr un fath, fel mater gweithdrefnol. Yr oeddwn i, yn bersonol, yn falch o glywed hynny. Gwnaed y pwynt hefyd y dylid cadw hunaniaeth ranbarthol—ar gyfer Cymru a rhanbarthau Cymru. Yr ydym eisoes wedi clywed sôn am blismona cymunedol, sy'n

well in north Wales, and we would not like to lose that. Community policing has helped to make North Wales Police one of the best forces in the country. As Mick Bates said, police forces in Wales generally do better than their counterparts in England.

During the debate, it was stated that perhaps we should concentrate not on the structures but on the outcomes for the public. I feel very strongly that, whatever happens, members of the public should not notice any difference in the service from the police, unless it is to note that it is better. We should not be asked to carry the cost, which would be, I think, between £47 million and £53 million on an annual basis. There would also be an additional £6 million of start-up costs. The Chair has already said that it would be totally unacceptable for the Assembly or the Welsh taxpayer to have to pick up those costs. Those of us who have had previous experience of local government restructuring and so on would realise that there are always a lot of promises about how you can make economy savings and so forth. The reality never matches up. There will be additional costs involved.

I was also concerned to hear suggestions put forward about getting rid of backroom operations. I view calling people 'backroom personnel' in the same way as I view people calling others 'faceless bureaucrats', as though their jobs are worthless and do not mean anything to them or to their families. They do mean something; these are people that we are talking about. Labelling them just makes it easier for some people to dismiss them. I therefore support a staff commission's being set up, whatever the outcome, if there is any restructuring.

Local accountability does have to be retained. If you are asking local authorities to pay, they then want to play. It is as simple as that. There has to be some way of dealing with that. I was the person who asked the question about whether, if there is an all-Wales structure, the headquarters had to be in south Wales. The answer was 'no', that does not have to be in south Wales and could be

gweithio'n dda iawn yn y gogledd, ac ni fyddem am golli hynny. Mae plismona cymunedol wedi helpu gwneud Heddlu Gogledd Cymru yn un o'r heddluoedd gorau yn y wlad. Fel y dywedodd Mick Bates, ar y cyfan mae heddluoedd Cymru yn gwneud yn lawer yn well na heddluoedd Lloegr.

Yn ystod y ddadl, dywedwyd y dylem efallai ganolbwyntio nid ar y strwythurau ond ar y canlyniadau i'r cyhoedd. Yr wyf yn teimlo'n gryf iawn, beth bynnag a digwydd, na ddylai'r cyhoedd weld unrhyw wahaniaeth yn y gwasanaeth gan yr heddlu, ond i sylwi ei fod yn well. Ni ddylid gofyn i ni ysgwyddo'r gost, a fyddai, mi gredaf, rhwng £47 miliwn a £53 miliwn y flwyddyn. Byddai costau cychwynnol hefyd o £6 miliwn. Mae'r Cadeirydd eisoes wedi dweud y byddai'n gwbl annerbyniol i'r Cynulliad neu drethdalwyr Cymru orfod talu'r costau hynny. Mae'r rhai ohonom sydd wedi cael profiad blaenorol o ailstrwythuro llywodraeth leol ac ati yn sylweddoli bod yna nifer o addewidion bob amser am y ffordd y gallwch wneud arbedion darbodusrwydd ac ati. Ni fyddant byth yn cael eu gwireddu mewn gwirionedd. Bydd yna gostau ychwanegol.

Yr oeddwn yn pryderu hefyd i glywed awgrymiadau a gynigiwyd yn ymwneud â chael gwared â gweithrediadau ystafell gefn. Yr wyf yn teimlo'r un fath ynglyn â galw pobl yn 'staff ystafell gefn' ag a deimlaf am bobl sy'n galw eraill yn 'fiwrocratiaid anhysbys', fel pe bai eu swyddi'n ddiwerth ac nad ydynt yn golygu dim iddynt hwy na'u teuluoedd. Maent yn golygu rhywbeth; siarad am bobl yr ydym. Mae eu labelu yn ei gwneud yn haws i rai pobl eu hanwybyddu. Felly, cefnogaf y syniad o sefydlu comisiwn staff, beth bynnag fo'r canlyniad, os bydd unrhyw ailstrwythuro.

Rhaid cadw atebolrwydd lleol. Os ydych yn gofyn i awdurdodau lleol dalu, yna maent am chwarae rhan. Mae mor syml â hynny. Rhaid bod modd i fynd i'r afael â hynny. Myfi a ofynnodd y cwestiwn a fydd yn rhaid i'r pencadlys, os bydd strwythur Cymru gyfan, fod yn y de. Yr ateb oedd 'nad oedd', nid oes raid iddo fod yn y de a gallai fod rywle arall.

located elsewhere.

I see this as an instrument for debate, if you like. I think that there has to be more debate on this issue, not least because it is about time that we looked at the whole funding system for the police. It would be nice for the whole of Wales to have the consistency of approach that we have in north Wales. Like Ann Jones, I am supportive of our chief constable, whom I think has good ideas. Whatever other people might think, I think that the public in general feel that his ideas are good and that he provides us with a good policing service.

To summarise, in many ways I see this perhaps as something that we are doing to spark off more debate. I hope that that will happen, and we will, of course, return to this subject ourselves.

**The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart):** It is unusual to respond to a committee report whose recommendations are not for me, but for the Home Secretary.

I thank the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee for all its hard work in producing this report. I know that all members of the committee went out of their way to undertake this review in the short space of time that was available. I also put on record my thanks to those organisations that took the time to present evidence to the committee either in person or by means of written statements. These submissions have enabled us to gain a really good grasp of the issues for Wales. That is a very different picture, I understand, from what has been happening in the English regions.

Members will know that I share their frustration about the amount of time that the Home Secretary has allowed for this work to be done. However, despite the limitations on what it was possible for the committee to do within the time constraints, I believe that its report highlights all the main issues that will be of concern to the Assembly.

Time has not been our only concern. I made it clear in my earlier statements to the

Yr wyf yn gweld hyn fel arf ar gyfer dadl, os mynnwch. Credaf fod angen trafodaeth bellach am y mater hwn, yn bennaf am ei bod yn bryd inni edrych ar yr holl system ariannu ar gyfer yr heddlu. Byddai'n braf i Gymru gyfan gael y cysondeb sydd gennym yn y gogledd. Fel Ann Jones, yr wyf yn gefnogol i'n prif gwnstabl. Y mae ganddo syniadau da, yn fy marn i. Beth bynnag yw barn pobl eraill, credaf fod y cyhoedd ar y cyfan yn teimlo bod ei syniadau, rhai da a'i fod yn rhoi gwasanaeth plismona da inni.

I grynhoi, mewn llawer ffordd ystyriaf fod hyn, efallai, yn rhywbeth yr ydym yn ei wneud i ysgogi trafodaeth bellach. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n digwydd ac y byddwn, wrth gwrs, yn dychwelyd at y pwnc hwn ein hunain.

**Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart):** Mae'n anarferol ymateb i adroddiad pwyllgor nad yw ei argymhellion yn berthnasol i mi, ond i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Diolch i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio am ei holl waith caled wrth gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Gwn fod holl aelodau'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud popeth o fewn eu gallu i gynnal yr adolygiad hwn o fewn yr amser prin a oedd ar gael. Cofnodaf fy niolch hefyd i'r sefydliadau hynny a roddodd yr amser i gyflwyno tystiolaeth i'r pwyllgor naill ai'n bersonol neu drwy ddatganiadau ysgrifenedig. Mae'r cyflwyniadau hyn wedi'n galluogi i ddeall yn llawn y problemau ar gyfer Cymru. Deallaf fod y darlun yn wahanol iawn i'r hyn sydd wedi bod yn digwydd yn rhanbarthau Lloegr.

Gwyr yr aelodau fy mod yn rhannu eu rhwystredigaeth am yr amser a ganiataodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref i wneud y gwaith hwn. Fodd bynnag, er y cyfyngiadau ar yr hyn yr oedd yn bosibl i'r pwyllgor ei wneud o fewn y terfynau amser, credaf fod ei adroddiad yn tynnu sylw at yr holl brif faterion a fydd yn achosi pryder i'r Cynulliad.

Nid amser yn unig sydd wedi achosi pryder inni. Eglurais yn fy natganiadau cynharach

Assembly and in my discussions and correspondence with the Home Secretary that we will require assurances on how the costs involved in this exercise will be met. As you will see from the committee's report, these costs are not only in relation to the restructuring exercise itself, but in terms of meeting the level 2 capability gap and also delivering neighbourhood policing, which is vital to our communities. That has been reiterated in everyone's comments today. It is what is on the ground and what people see as the issues surrounding policing. The Home Secretary has now agreed to set up a working group, involving Assembly officials, to look at these costs, but I will continue to push for assurances about how the identified costs will be met.

I strongly support the committee's view in relation to the basic command units. The Home Secretary has said that these units will remain intact following any restructuring, but we need to ensure that resources will not be diverted away from basic command units and local community policing to deliver level 2 capability. As an Assembly, we have some concerns and we need the necessary assurances.

The committee's report also draws attention to the crucial issue of local accountability. I fully understand that it was difficult for the committee to reach a view on possible future local democratic structures within the constraints of its review. I have already made the case to the Home Secretary for us to be given the flexibility to determine the shape of these structures in Wales and I will continue to press for this freedom.

I also wish to support the committee's recommendations regarding police staff. I have already said that I would like to see a staff commission established to look at these issues, and I hope that this will happen in the event of any restructuring.

4.50 p.m.

The final recommendation of the report relates to the possible devolution of policing to the Assembly in the future; the emphasis in the report is on 'in the future'. I do not

i'r Cynulliad, ac yn fy nhrafodaethau a'm gohebiaeth gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, y bydd angen sicrwydd arnom sut y caiff costau'r ymarfer hwn eu talu. Fe welwch o adroddiad y pwyllgor nad costau'n ymwneud â'r ymarfer ailstrwythuro ei hun yn unig sydd dan sylw, ond o ran cau'r bwloch gallu lefel 2 a hefyd ddarparu plismona cymdogaeth, sy'n hanfodol i'n cymunedau. Ailadroddwyd hyn yn sylwadau pawb heddiw. Dyna sy'n digwydd ar lawr gwlad a dyna y mae pobl yn ei weld fel y materion sy'n ymwneud â phlismona. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref bellach wedi cytuno i sefydlu gweithgor, sy'n cynnwys swyddogion o'r Cynulliad, i edrych ar y costau hyn, ond byddaf yn dal i bwysu am sicrwydd sut y caiff y costau hyn eu talu.

Cytunaf yn gryf â barn y pwyllgor am yr unedau rheoli sylfaenol. Mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi dweud y bydd yr unedau hyn yn parhau'n ddigyfnawid yn dilyn unrhyw ailstrwythuro. Ond mae angen inni sicrhau na chaiff adnoddau eu tynnu oddi wrth yr unedau rheoli sylfaenol a phlismona cymunedol lleol er mwyn darparu gallu lefel 2. Fel Cynulliad, yr ydym yn pryderu ac mae arnom angen y sicrwydd angenrheidiol.

Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor hefyd yn tynnu sylw at fater hanfodol atebolrwydd lleol. Deallaf yn llwyr ei bod yn anodd i'r pwyllgor gytuno ar strwythurau democrataidd lleol posibl yn y dyfodol o fewn cyfyngiadau ei adolygiad. Yr wyf eisoes wedi cyflwyno'r achos i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref dros roi'r hyblygrwydd inni benderfynu ffurf y strwythurau hynny yng Nghymru, a byddaf yn parhau i bwysu am y rhyddid hwnnw.

Dymunaf gefnogi argymhellion y pwyllgor hefyd o ran staff yr heddlu. Yr wyf wedi dweud eisoes yr hoffwn weld sefydlu comisiwn staff i edrych ar y materion hyn, a gobeithio y bydd hyn yn digwydd os bydd unrhyw ailstrwythuro.

Mae argymhelliad olaf yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â phosibilrwydd datganoli plismona i'r Cynulliad yn y dyfodol; mae'r pwyslais yn yr adroddiad ar 'yn y dyfodol'.

believe that any of us would like structures to be established now that would prevent discussions on that in the future. There are issues about what would happen to probation services and so on, but we would have to look at that in the future. Furthermore, a big issue in any such discussions is the financial agreement. Currently, there is no financial transparency in how we fund the police, and there are also issues around that.

Ultimately, we must accept that there was a cross-party approach to this, and that these are the views that have been established. We will have an opportunity to debate the issues in a full Plenary debate next week.

The committee has done an excellent job of work for the Assembly on this issue, and should receive due credit from the whole Chamber for that. While the committee felt unable to recommend a preference for any of the options put forward by the police authorities and the chief constables in Wales, it has reached important conclusions and made recommendations that would benefit policing in Wales in the future, whatever form any new structure might take. It also noted that, in terms of the options that have been evaluated to date, a single police force has emerged as the strongest option by some distance.

I will forward this committee report in its entirety to the Home Secretary. I will also pass on to the Home Secretary any individual comments and representations that have been made to me from Assembly Members on this issue. This includes an important point made by Gwenda Thomas, which has not been raised in any other forum. Gwenda has pointed out the benefits in relation to child protection from the greater ease in sharing information that having one force could bring about. We have to take these issues about children's protection seriously. The Assembly can be assured that I will continue to press the Home Secretary on all the issues that we have discussed today, with the aim of ensuring that any restructuring delivers the best possible police service for the people of Wales.

Ni chredaf y byddai neb ohonom am weld sefydlu strwythurau yn awr a fyddai'n rhwystro trafodaethau am hynny yn y dyfodol. Mae materion yn codi am yr hyn a fyddai'n digwydd i'r gwasanaethau prawf ac ati, ond byddai'n rhaid inni edrych ar hynny yn y dyfodol. At hynny, un mater hanfodol bwysig mewn unrhyw drafodaethau felly yw'r cytundeb ariannol. Ar hyn o bryd, nid oes unrhyw eglurder ariannol yn y ffordd yr ydym yn ariannu'r heddlu, a chyfyd materion hefyd ynglyn â hynny.

Yn y pen draw, rhaid inni dderbyn ein bod wedi trafod hyn ar draws y pleidiau, ac mai dyma'r farn y daethpwyd iddi. Cawn gyfle i drafod y materion mewn dadl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn yr wythnos nesaf.

Mae'r pwyllgor wedi gwneud gwaith ardderchog ar ran y Cynulliad ar y mater hwn, a dylai gael y clod dyledus am hynny gan y Siambr gyfan. Er nad oedd y pwyllgor yn teimlo y gallai argymhell unrhyw un o'r dewisiadau a gyflwynwyd gan yr awdurdodau heddlu a'r prif gwnstabiliaid yng Nghymru, mae wedi dod i gasgliadau pwysig ac wedi gwneud argymhellion a fyddai o fudd i blismona yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol, pa ffurf bynnag a all fod i'r strwythur newydd. Dywedodd hefyd, o ran y dewisiadau a werthuswyd hyd yn hyn, fod cael un gwasanaeth heddlu wedi dod i'r amlwg fel y dewis cryfaf o lawer.

Byddaf yn anfon yr adroddiad pwyllgor hwn yn ei gyfanrwydd at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Byddaf hefyd yn cyflwyno i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref unrhyw sylwadau unigol a chyflwyniadau a wnaed imi gan Aelodau'r Cynulliad am y mater hwn. Mae hyn yn cynnwys pwynt pwysig a wnaeth Gwenda Thomas ac nad yw wedi ei godi mewn unrhyw fforwm arall. Mae Gwenda wedi nodi'r manteision o ran amddiffyn plant a allai ddeillio o gael un gwasanaeth heddlu drwy hwyluso rhannu gwybodaeth. Rhaid inni ystyried o ddifrif y materion hyn sy'n ymwneud ag amddiffyn plant. Gallaf sicrhau'r Cynulliad y byddaf yn parhau i bwysu ar yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar yr holl faterion a drafodwyd gennym heddiw, gyda'r nod o sicrhau y bydd unrhyw ailstrwythuro yn cynnig y gwasanaeth heddlu gorau sy'n

bosibl i bobl Cymru.

The important thing is that it is a police service for the people of Wales. Some contributors indicated that people are not really interested in structures, but in what happens when they pick up the telephone. It is important that we have assurances about community policing. We must build on the best practice and the good standards that we have in Wales, so that we get a better service out of any possible restructuring. That is the important message that comes across in the committee's report.

I look forward to our debate next week. All the information that has come to me will be passed to the Home Secretary, to show the maturity of the debate that we have had in such a short space of time in the Assembly. However, there must be future debates. If there is restructuring, we must have a voice in the discussion about democratic structures.

**Janice Gregory:** I thank everyone for their contributions. I will curtail my remarks, because of the time constraint.

From the discussions that we have had this afternoon, you can understand how difficult it was for the committee to come to recommendations and conclusions to which we could all sign up. Obviously, we all had to sign up to them, as this was a committee report. There was no party political bias. As Chair of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, while we all had strong party political views—and you heard what Leighton Andrews said about my own party and our policies—I was proud that we were able to conduct this in a non-partisan way, and go forward with the Minister's request and conduct the review in the way in which we did.

The devolution issue was important, Leighton, and we felt that that could not be fudged—it had to be put into the report, whatever anyone's views were. I am sure that I will be corrected by my fellow committee members if I am wrong, but what we said as a committee was that, whatever reorganisation, if any, is to take place, it has to be right for

Y peth pwysig yw mai gwasanaeth heddlu i bobl Cymru ydyw. Soniodd rhai cyfranwyr nad oes gan bobl ddiddordeb mewn gwirionedd mewn strwythurau, ond yn yr hyn sy'n digwydd pan fyddant yn codi'r teleffon. Mae'n bwysig inni gael sicrwydd am blismona cymunedol. Rhaid inni adeiladu ar yr arfer gorau a'r safonau da sydd gennym yng Nghymru, fel y cawn well gwasanaeth o unrhyw ailstrwythuro posibl. Dyna'r neges bwysig a ddaw o adroddiad y pwyllgor.

Edrychaf ymlaen at ein dadl yr wythnos nesaf. Caiff yr holl wybodaeth a roddwyd imi ei chyflwyno i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, er mwyn dangos aeddfedrwydd y drafodaeth a gafwyd mewn cyn lleied o amser yn y Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, rhaid cael trafodaethau yn y dyfodol. Os bydd ailstrwythuro, rhaid inni gael llais yn y drafodaeth am strwythurau democrataidd.

**Janice Gregory:** Diolch i bawb am eu cyfraniadau. Byddaf fy sylwadau yn fyr oherwydd y cyfyngiad amser.

O'r trafodaethau a gawsom y prynhawn yma, gallwch ddeall mor anodd ydoedd i'r pwyllgor lunio argymhellion a chasgliadau y gallem i gyd gytuno arnynt. Yn amlwg, yr oedd yn rhaid i ni bob un gytuno arnynt, gan mai adroddiad pwyllgor oedd hwn. Nid oedd unrhyw dueddfryd wleidyddol bleidiol. Fel Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, er bod gan bawb ddaliadau gwleidyddol pleidiol cryf—a chlywsoch yr hyn a ddywedodd Leighton Andrews am fy mhlaid fy hun a'n polisiau—yr oeddwn yn falch inni allu cynnal hyn mewn modd amhleidiol, a gweithredu ar gais y Gweinidog a chynnal yr adolygiad fel y gwnaethom.

Yr oedd y mater datganoli yn bwysig, Leighton, a themlem na allai hwnnw gael ei osgoi—yr oedd yn rhaid ei roi yn yr adroddiad, beth bynnag oedd barn unrhyw un. Yr wyf yn siwr y caf fy nghywiro gan fy nghyd-aelodau ar y pwyllgor os wyf yn anghywir, ond yr hyn a ddywedwyd gennym fel pwyllgor oedd, pa ailstrwythuro bynnag a



any future devolution of policing to Wales. There is no point in reorganising the police service now, and then finding, five or 10 years down the line, that we have to do it again. Therefore, that was why we discussed this, but it was an issue that was brought up time and again.

I apologise to everyone who has made a contribution whom I have not named. Mick, I understand what you say about Charles Clarke and Peter Hain. However, let us not forget that policing is not devolved to the Assembly; Peter Hain is the Secretary of State for Wales, and we would be disgusted if he did not have an opinion on the future of the police service in Wales.

On Sandy's point, I used the term 'back-room' in my speech, but I did not intend it to be derogatory in any way about people who work in back-room occupations. They are more important, in my opinion, than those who are perhaps front-line staff. I thank the Minister for her remarks on the committee report, but there is no doubt that, throughout this, we kept at the forefront of our mind that what we wanted was the best possible police service for the people of Wales.

fydd yn digwydd, os o gwbl, rhaid i hynny fod yn iawn ar gyfer unrhyw ddatganoli plismona i Gymru yn y dyfodol. Nid oes diben ailstrwythuro'r gwasanaeth heddlu ar hyn o bryd, a gweld wedyn, ymhen 5 neu 10 mlynedd, ei bod yn rhaid inni wneud hynny eto. Felly, dyna pam y trafodwyd hyn, ond yr oedd yn fater a godwyd dro ar ôl tro.

Ymddiheuraf i bawb a wnaeth gyfraniad ac nad wyf wedi eu henwi. Mick, yr wyf yn deall yr hyn a ddywedwch am Charles Clarke a Peter Hain. Fodd bynnag, peidiwn ag anghofio nad yw plismona wedi ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad; Peter Hain yw Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, a byddem yn siomedig tu hwnt pe na bai ganddo farn am ddyfodol y gwasanaeth heddlu yng Nghymru.

O ran pwynt Sandy, defnyddiais yr ymadrodd 'ystafell gefn' yn fy araith, ond ni fwriadwn i hynny fychanu pobl sy'n gweithio mewn galwedigaethau ystafell gefn. Mae'r bobl hynny'n bwysicach, yn fy marn i, na'r rheini sydd, efallai, yn staff rheng flaen. Diolch i'r Gweinidog am ei sylwadau am adroddiad y pwyllgor, ond nid oes amheuaeth nad ydym, drwy gydol hyn, wedi cadw mewn cof mai'r hyn yr oeddem am ei gael oedd y gwasanaeth heddlu gorau posibl i bobl Cymru.

*Cynnig (NDM2718): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2718): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine

Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

## **Dadl Fer Short Debate**

### **Diogelu Gwasanaethau GIG Hollbwysig i Gleifion yn y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin Safeguarding Vital NHS Services for Patients in Mid and West Wales**

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Diolch am y cyfle i leisio'r pryder sy'n bodoli yng nghanolbarth a de-orllewin Cymru ynglyn â'r ffaith ein bod ni i gyd, ar hyn o bryd, yn gweld gwasanaethau yn cael eu torri ac amserau aros yn cynyddu. Mae hyn yn wyneb y strategaeth y mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn sôn amdano—y 'Cynllun Oes'. Yr wyf wedi caniatâu munud yr un i Elin Jones, Helen Mary Jones, Lisa Francis, Kirsty Williams a Christine Gwyther gyfrannu at y ddadl, felly cadwaf at 10 munud o'r 15 sydd gennyf, a cheisiaf amlinellu rhai o'r problemau hyn.

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod cyfeillion o Sir Benfro wedi bod gyda ni y prynhawn yma, a'u bod wedi cyflwyno ger ein bron ddadleuon cryf a sylweddol ynglyn â'u pryder. Arbenigwyr yw'r rhain yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg yn Sir Benfro; nid

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Thank you for the opportunity to voice the concern in mid and south-west Wales about the fact that all of us, at present, see services being cut and waiting times increase. This is despite the strategy which the Minister for Health and Social Services is talking about—'Designed for Life'. I have allowed a minute each for Elin Jones, Helen Mary Jones, Lisa Francis, Kirsty Williams and Christine Gwyther to contribute, so I will keep to 10 of the 15 minutes that I have available, and try to outline some of these problems.

The Minister will be aware that colleagues from Pembrokeshire have been with us this afternoon, and that they presented us with strong and substantial arguments regarding their concerns. They are specialists at Withybush General Hospital in

gwleidyddion neu bobl sy'n ymwneud â dadleuon gwleidyddol ydynt, ond pobl sy'n gweithio yn y profesiwn iechyd ydynt, ac maent yn poeni ynglyn â'r gwasanaeth y gallant ei gynnig i gleifion yn Sir Benfro. Maent hefyd yn poeni ynglyn ag ansawdd ac ystod y gwasanaeth y byddant yn gallu'i gynnig yn y dyfodol.

Dyma'r broblem, Weinidog, gyda'ch cynllun. Dywedwch bod strategaeth yn perthyn i'r 'Cynllun Oes': nid oes. Yr hyn sydd yn 'Cynllun Oes' yw disgrifiad o'r sefyllfa fel ag y mae yn awr, a'r sefyllfa y gobeithiwyd ei chyrraedd yn 2010. Yr ydych wedi anghofio dweud wrthom beth fydd yn digwydd yn y cyfamser. Nid oes manylion ynglyn â sut y bydd y newid yn cael ei gyflwyno. Pan mae pobl yng Ngheredigion yn clywed bod ysbytai cymunedol dan fygythiad ac y gall gwelyau gael eu colli yno ac ym Mhowys, pan mae pobl yn Sir Benfro yn clywed bod wardiau yn mynd i gael eu cau yno, pan mae pobl yn Sir Gaerfyrddin yn cael gwybod fod yr ymddiriedolaeth yno yn wynebu colledion mawr hanesyddol yn ei gyllideb, a phan glywsant fod y nifer o bobl sy'n methu cael eu trosglwyddo o ysbytai i'r sector gofal yn cynyddu o hyd yn Sir Gaerfyrddin, yr hyn sy'n digwydd yw fod pobl, yn ogystal â'r bobl broffesiynol yn y maes, yn cysylltu'ch cynlluniau chi ar gyfer newid gyda thoriadau a cholledion yn y gwasanaeth.

Gwyddom beth sy'n digwydd pan mae ad-drefnu, oherwydd yr hyn a ddigwyddodd yn Abertawe gyda'r gwasanaeth niwrolegol ar gyfer plant. Nid wyf am ddadlau ynglyn â pham y penderfynwyd symud y gwasanaeth hwnnw i Gaerdydd, ond i bobl Abertawe, yr hyn y mae adlunio'r gwasanaeth, fel yr ydych yn sôn amdano yn 'Cynllun Oes', yn ei olygu yw eu bod yn colli gwasanaethau y maent wedi dibynnu arnynt am flynyddoedd. Byddwch yn ei chael yn anodd iawn darbwylo pobl yng nghanolbarth a de-orllewin Cymru y bydd yr hyn yr ydych yn ei gynnig yn gwella eu sefyllfa—yn sicr os nad ydych yn gallu rhoi'r manylion inni.

5.00 p.m.

Yr wyf wedi siarad yn ystod yr wythnosau

Pembrokeshire; they are not politicians or people involved in political arguments—they are health service professionals, and they are concerned about the service they are able to provide to the people of Pembrokeshire. They are also concerned about the quality and range of services they will be able to provide in the future.

This is the problem, Minister, with your scheme. You say there is a strategy in 'Designed for Life': there is not. What we have in 'Designed for Life' is a description of the situation as it is now, and the situation that you hope to reach by 2010. You have forgotten to tell us what will happen in the meantime. There are no details as to how this change will be introduced. When people in Ceredigion hear that community hospitals are under threat and that beds will possibly be lost in those areas and in Powys, when people in Pembrokeshire hear that wards will be closed there, when people in Carmarthenshire are told that the trust there is facing huge historical shortfalls in its budget, and when they hear that the number of people who cannot be transferred from hospital to the care sector is still increasing in Carmarthenshire, what is happening is that people, as well as health service professionals in the field, link your plans for change with cuts and losses in the service.

We know what happens when there is reorganisation, because of what happened in Swansea with the children's neurological service. I do not want to argue about why it was decided to move that service to Cardiff, but to the people of Swansea what restructuring the service, as you state in 'Designed for Life', means is that they lose services that they have depended upon for many years. You will find it very difficult to convince people in mid and south-west Wales that what you are offering will improve their situation—most certainly if you cannot give us the details.

During the past few weeks, I have spoken to

diwethaf gyda phobl sydd yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd ar bob lefel. Yr wyf wedi siarad â'r comisiynwyr a'r darparwyr—y bobl broffesiynol sydd yn ceisio cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth—ac nid oes yr un ohonynt yn gwybod sut yn union yr ydych yn mynd i'n symud o'r sefyllfa yr ydym ynddi yn awr i'r sefyllfa yr ydych yn gobeithio y byddwn ynddi yn 2010. I fod yn deg â chi, Weinidog, nid oes gormod o bobl yn cwestiynu'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddarlunio ar gyfer 2010, ond maent am wybod beth yr ydych yn mynd i'w wneud yn y cyfamser i sicrhau bod y newid hwn yn digwydd ac nad ydynt, yn y broses, yn colli gwasanaethau hanfodol yn eu cymunedau. Dyna a welant yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd.

You know that we have had people here from Pembrokeshire this afternoon, who have outlined to us their concerns about Withybush Hospital. They and their supporters in the Save Withybush Action Team, otherwise known as SWAT, are very concerned about the situation. If we apply the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats test to 'Designed for Life', we see that there are some strengths to it. There are certainly strengths in the grand vision and the general statements: we all want to sign up to a world-class service in the future. We all accept that the status quo is not an option and that we have to change and adapt to the circumstances that we are facing. All those general statements are strengths.

The weaknesses are that there is little or no detail there in terms of how you are going to achieve that change. Reconfiguration is fine, as long as you can outline to us how that process evolves. I will put one point to you, Minister, to which you may like to respond in your speech. There are many references in the document to 'clinical networks'. I have asked health professionals, including the providers, to explain what a 'clinical network' is and where they can currently be found in Wales. If you are putting that in as something that can work, you have to tell me where it works at the moment. I have not been able to get an answer to that from anyone else. That is our real fear and concern for 'Designed for Life'; we want to know

a number of people involved with the health service at all levels. I have spoken to the commissioners and to the providers—the healthcare professionals who try to provide the service—and not one of them knows exactly how you are going to take us from our current situation to the situation that you hope to reach by 2010. To be fair to you, Minister, not many people are questioning what you are outlining for 2010, but they want to know what you will do in the meantime to ensure that you achieve this change, and that they will not, in the process, lose crucial services from their communities. That is what they see happening at present.

Fe wyddoch fod pobl o sir Benfro wedi bod gyda ni y prynhawn yma, ac y maent wedi amlinellu eu pryderon ynghylch Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Maent hwy a'u cefnogwyr yn y Tîm Gweithredu i Achub Ysbyty Llwynhelyg, neu SWAT yn Saesneg, yn pryderu'n fawr am y sefyllfa. Os cymhwyswn y prawf cryfderau, gwendidau, cyfleoedd a bygythiadau i 'Cynllun Oes', gwelwn fod iddo rai cryfderau. Mae'n sicr fod yna gryfderau yn y weledigaeth fawr a'r gosodiadau cyffredinol: mae pob un ohonom am gael gwasanaeth o'r radd flaenaf yn y dyfodol. Mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn na all y sefyllfa bresennol barhau a bod yn rhaid inni newid ac addasu yn ôl yr amgylchiadau a wynebwn. Mae'r holl osodiadau cyffredinol hynny yn gryfderau.

Y gwendidau yw nad oes llawer o fanylion yno, os o gwbl, am y modd y byddwch yn cyflawni'r newid hwnnw. Mae ailgyflunio yn iawn, cyhyd ag y gallwch roi amlinelliad inni o'r ffordd sut y bydd y broses honno'n datblygu. Hoffwn wneud un pwynt, Weinidog, ac efallai yr hoffech ymateb iddo yn eich araith. Ceir sawl cyfeiriad yn y ddogfen at 'rwydweithiau clinigol'. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i weithwyr iechyd proffesiynol, gan gynnwys darparwyr, egluro beth yw 'rhwydwaith clinigol' a ble y gellir dod o hyd iddynt ar hyn o bryd yng Nghymru. Os ydych yn cynnwys hynny fel rhywbeth a all weithio, rhaid ichi ddweud wrthyf ble y mae'n gweithio ar hyn o bryd. Nid wyf wedi llwyddo i gael ateb i'r cwestiwn hwnnw gan

what the detail is and how the changes will be achieved. We want to know how that will impact on the services that exist within our communities.

In Carmarthenshire, we have a problem; you referred earlier this afternoon to the situation in terms of the Townsend formula. If the Townsend formula were fully implemented, then the budget of the local health board in Carmarthen would be some £11 million greater than it is at the moment. There is £11 million-worth of services that are not being commissioned in Carmarthen at the moment, because the money is not there.

Then you have the situation in terms of the providers. The trust in Carmarthenshire has a historical deficit, which you tell me that you will not address, as that would mean rewarding bad practise. That deficit is inherited, and the budget is now under control. It is not the management that is being penalised by your decision not to address that issue; it is front-line services. Those services are being cut back, because they have to account for the deficit within their budgets.

If we are talking about bad management and front-line services, I think that you would agree that bedblocking is a major problem. It is an increasing problem in Carmarthenshire; we had come down to around 30 beds, but the number has now gone back up to 48, and it looks as though it is going to get worse. There is no immediate funding available to the local authority to secure greater capacity in the care sector to deal with it, and you are putting no structures in place to care for people in their homes. Therefore, it is difficult to release people from hospital. The trust tells me that it will face costs of £2 million, in this financial year, directly attributed to bedblocking. That comes out of the budget of the local trust.

That means that services cannot be provided with that £2 million. They also tell me, Minister, that whenever there is a capital

neb arall. Dyna yw ein hofn a'n pryder gwirioneddol am 'Cynllun Oes'; yr ydym am gael gwybod y manylion a sut y cyflawnir y newidiadau. Yr ydym am wybod sut y bydd hynny'n effeithio ar y gwasanaethau sy'n bodoli yn ein cymunedau.

Yn sir Gaerfyrddin, mae gennym broblem; yr oeddech yn cyfeirio'n gynharach y prynhawn yma at y sefyllfa o ran y fformiwla Townsend. Pe bae'r fformiwla Townsend yn cael ei gweithredu'n llawn, byddai cyllideb y bwrdd iechyd lleol yng Nghaerfyrddin ryw £11 miliwn yn fwy nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Nid oes gwasanaethau gwerth £11 miliwn yn cael eu comisiynu yng Nghaerfyrddin ar hyn o bryd, am nad oes arian ar gael.

Wedyn mae'r sefyllfa o ran y darparwyr. Mae gan yr ymddiriedolaeth yn sir Gaerfyrddin ddiffyg hanesyddol, a dywedwch wrthyf na fyddwch yn ymdrin â hynny, oherwydd byddai hynny'n golygu gwobrwyo arfer gwael. Mae'r diffyg hwnnw wedi'i etifeddu, ac mae'r gyllideb bellach o dan reolaeth. Nid y rheolwyr a gaiff eu cosbi gan eich penderfyniad i beidio ag ymdrin â'r mater hwnnw; gwasanaethau rheng flaen a gaiff eu cosbi. Mae'r gwasanaethau hynny'n cael eu cwtogi, oherwydd rhaid iddynt roi cyfrif am y diffyg yn eu cyllidebau.

Os ydym yn sôn am reoli a gwasanaethau rheng flaen gwael, credaf y byddech yn cytuno bod blocio gwelyau yn broblem fawr. Mae'n broblem gynyddol yn sir Gaerfyrddin; yr oeddem wedi dod i lawr i ryw 30 o welyau, ond mae'r nifer bellach wedi cynyddu eto i 48, ac ymddengys y bydd y sefyllfa'n gwaethygu. Nid oes arian ar gael ar hyn o bryd i'r awdurdod lleol sicrhau bod y sector gofal yn gallu ymdrin â'r broblem yn well, ac nid ydych yn trefnu unrhyw strwythurau i ofalu am bobl yn eu cartrefi. Felly, mae'n anodd rhyddhau pobl o'r ysbyty. Dywed yr ymddiriedolaeth wrthyf y bydd yn wynebu costau o £2 filiwn, yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon, o ganlyniad uniongyrchol i flocio gwelyau. Daw hynny o gyllideb yr ymddiriedolaeth leol.

Golyga hynny na ellir defnyddio'r £2 filiwn hwnnw i ddarparu gwasanaethau. Dywedant wrthyf hefyd, Weinidog, pryd bynnag y bydd

investment in the trust, they have to pay capital charges. Therefore, whenever there is a capital investment, they have to find money to pay those charges and, again, services are cut in other departments in order to pay for that. If we are talking about front-line services being improved and enhanced for people in 'Designed for Life', you have to tell us how you are going to achieve that.

People in mid and south-west Wales will not accept cuts to their services until you explain to them how those services will be delivered under the new regime and how they will be enhanced. What we have at the moment are piecemeal decisions. It seems to me, Minister, that you are just waiting to see how it all rolls out and then you will decide how you are going to reconfigure the services throughout Wales. That is not good enough and will mean that, in reality, services that people receive will get worse.

Gadewch imi sôn wrthyhych am realiti'r sefyllfa oherwydd, yn y pen draw, pobl sydd yn dioddef. Beth fydddech chi'n ei ddweud wrth wraig yn fy etholaeth i sydd wedi bod yn aros am bedair blynedd i gael sgan dwysedd esgyrn? Beth fydddech chi'n ei ddweud wrth ddydd sydd wedi bod yn aros am bum mlynedd i gael triniaeth prostatad? Beth fydddech chi'n ei ddweud wrth blentyn dwy flwydd a hanner oed sy'n aros am saith mis i gael apwyntiad gydag arbenigwr? Dyma realiti'r sefyllfa a'r bobl sy'n dioddef. Weinidog, mae'n gyfrifoldeb arnoch chi i esbonio sut yn union y byddwch yn newid y sefyllfa hon a sut y bydd gwasanaethau hanfodol yn cael eu cynnal a'u cadw yn y cyfamser a sut y bydd hynny yn gwella'r sefyllfa i gleifion. Heb hynny, ni chewch ein cefnogaeth ni, na chefnogaeth y bobl broffesiynol na'r mudiadau sy'n gofalu am fuddiannau pobl sy'n gweithio o fewn y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** There are five speakers, so you will have less than a minute each.

**Elin Jones:** Yr wyf am gywiro camargraff a roddwyd gan y Gweinidog yn ystod y sesiwn

buddsoddiad cyfalaf yn yr ymddiriedolaeth, fod yn rhaid iddynt dalu costau cyfalaf. Felly, pryd bynnag y ceir buddsoddiad cyfalaf, rhaid iddynt ddod o hyd i'r arian i dalu'r costau hynny, ac unwaith eto caiff gwasanaethau mewn adrannau eraill eu cwtogi er mwyn talu am hynny. Os ydym yn sôn am wella gwasanaethau rheng flaen i bobl yn 'Cynllun Oes', rhaid ichi ddweud wrthym sut y byddwch yn cyflawni hynny.

Ni fydd pobl yn y canolbarth a'r de-orllewin yn derbyn toriadau yn eu gwasanaethau nes ichi egluro wrthynt sut y darperir y gwasanaethau hynny dan y gyfundrefn newydd a sut y cânt eu gwella. Yr hyn sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd yw penderfyniadau tameidiog. Ymddengys i mi, Weinidog, eich bod yn aros i weld beth fydd yn digwydd ac wedyn yn penderfynu sut y byddwch yn ailgyflunio'r gwasanaethau ledled Cymru. Nid yw hynny'n ddigon da, a bydd yn golygu mewn gwirionedd y bydd y gwasanaethau a gaiff pobl yn gwaethygu.

Let me tell you about the reality of the situation because, in the end, it is people who suffer. What would you say to a woman in my constituency who has been waiting for four years for a bone density scan? What would you say to a man who has been waiting for five years for prostate treatment? What would you say to a two-and-a-half-year-old child who has been waiting seven months for an appointment with a specialist? That is the reality of the situation and it is the people who suffer. Minister, it is your responsibility to explain exactly how you intend to change this situation, and how essential services will be maintained and sustained in the meantime and how that will help matters for patients. Without that, you will not have our support, or the support of the professionals or the organisations which look after the interests of people who work in the health service in Wales.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae pum siaradwr, felly, bydd gennych lai na munud yr un.

**Elin Jones:** I want to correct a false impression given by the Minister during this

gwestiynau y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf am gadarnhau ar gyfer y cofnodion fy mod wedi ysgrifennu ato ynglyn â chau ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn ateb ganddo. Yr oedd yr ateb hwnnw yn dweud ei fod yn ystyried y mater hwn yn bennaf yn fater lleol, nid yn fater iddo ef. Nid wyf yn gallu deall pam ei bod yn iawn i'r Gweinidog ymyrryd i wrthwynebu cau gwelyau yn Ninbych-y-Pysgod tra'i fod yn gwrthod ymyrryd i achub ysbytai a gwelyau yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi, lle mae gwrthwynebiad mawr yn lleol i'r perygl a wynebri gan y ddau ysbyty hynny.

**Helen Mary Jones:** I would like to give the Minister one simple message today, in the short time that I have. That message is to tell him, if he does not already know, that there is real fear in Mid and West Wales, and in my home community in Llanelli, about a tendency under his plans to centralise services. No-one is arguing that highly specialised services do not need to be provided in centres with experts, but most health provision is not that specialised and people need services in their communities. Whatever plans we are making for the future, they need to take geographical reality into account, otherwise safety will be seriously compromised in a different way.

5.10 p.m.

**Lisa Francis:** Over the past few days, you have seen a scenario of bad weather in Preseli, Pembrokeshire, as we all have, where the main arteries into the county, the A40 and the A477, were completely obstructed by snow and ice. Geography has to be the single most important reason why front-line services cannot be cut or downgraded at Withybush Hospital. You have to see that. Ambulances carrying casualties would have been unable to reach Carmarthen and Swansea. That is the point. All I ask of you today is that you do not ignore the geography, Minister.

**Kirsty Williams:** In my constituency, we are reliant on a network of community hospitals, and my constituents are accustomed to

afternoon's questions. I want to confirm, for the record, that I have written to him about the closure of Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals, and I have received a reply. That reply stated that he considers this matter to be mainly a local matter, not a matter for him. I cannot understand why it is right for the Minister to intervene to oppose the closure of beds in Tenby, while he will not intervene to save hospitals and beds in Tregaron and Cardigan, where there is great local opposition to the danger facing those two hospitals.

**Helen Mary Jones:** Hoffwn gyfleu un neges syml i'r Gweinidog heddiw, yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf. Y neges honno yw dweud wrtho, os na wyr eisoes, fod ofn gwirioneddol yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, ac yn fy nghymuned i yn Llanelli, am duedd yn ei gynlluniau i ganoli gwasanaethau. Nid oes neb yn dadlau nad oes angen i wasanaethau arbenigol iawn gael eu darparu mewn canolfannau gydag arbenigwyr. Ond nid yw'r rhan fwyaf o'r ddarpariaeth iechyd mor arbenigol â hynny, ac mae angen gwasanaethau ar bobl yn eu cymunedau. Pa gynlluniau bynnag a wnawn ar gyfer y dyfodol, mae angen iddynt ystyried realiti daearyddol, neu bydd diogelwch mewn perygl difrifol mewn ffordd wahanol.

**Lisa Francis:** Yn ystod yr ychydig ddiwrnodau diwethaf, yr ydych chi, fel ninnau, wedi gweld tywydd gwael ym Mhreseli, sir Benfro, lle y cafodd y prif ffyrdd i mewn i'r sir, yr A40 a'r A477, eu rhwystro'n llwyr gan eira a rhew. Rhaid mai daearyddiaeth yw'r rheswm pwysicaf pam na ellir cwtogi nac israddio gwasanaethau rheng flaen yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Rhaid eich bod yn deall hynny. Ni fyddai wedi bod yn bosibl i gerbydau ambiwlans yn cludo cleifion gyrraedd Caerfyrddin ac Abertawe. Dyna'r pwynt. Yr unig beth a ofynnaf heddiw yw ichi beidio ag anwybyddu'r ddaearyddiaeth, Weinidog.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yn fy etholaeth i yr ydym yn dibynnu ar rwydwaith o ysbytai cymuned, ac mae fy etholwyr yn gyfarwydd â gweld

change in those community hospitals. We have seen changes in service over the last couple of years because of issues of clinical governance, and the community has embraced those changes and accepted them. There are, however, services that community hospitals can deliver safely. Indeed, there are services that could be returned to community hospitals from district general hospitals that are actually taking up time at district general hospitals when they do not need to be there. Community hospitals in Brecon and Radnorshire have a role to play in helping you to deliver 'Designed for Life', but to do that, we need a vision for community hospitals and the investment to back it up.

**Christine Gwyther:** Brian Gibbons was right to save the beds at Tenby because they contribute to helping alleviate the problems of bedblocking at Withybush. However, the problems that we foresee at Withybush are what some people have called 'salami-slicing' of services. It is important that we retain the services that we already have at Withybush, that we strengthen them and see them continue in future. I hope that the consultation that you are currently undertaking, Minister, will deliver that, and that the clinicians and the public of Pembrokeshire will make our needs clear to you as part of that consultation.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I am obliged that everybody got in. It shows that we can pace ourselves if we need to.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** On Elin's point, the issue with regard to Tenby was that the local community and the health service came to certain understandings in relation to the staging of certain changes. Chris Gwyther informed us that there was a prospect that the staging, which had been agreed, would not be adhered to, so we did intervene, not to do something that had not been agreed, but rather to ensure that the initial staging of the realignment of services would take place as

newidiadau yn yr ysbytai cymuned hynny. Mae gwasanaethau wedi newid yn ystod yr ychydig flynyddoedd diwethaf oherwydd materion llywodraethu clinigol, ac mae'r gymuned wedi croesawu'r newidiadau hynny a'u derbyn. Fodd bynnag, mae yna wasanaethau y gall ysbytai cymuned eu darparu'n ddiogel. Yn wir, mae yna wasanaethau a allai gael eu darparu gan ysbytai cymuned yn hytrach nag ysbytai cyffredinol dosbarth lle y neilltuir amser iddynt ar hyn o bryd er nad oes angen iddynt gael eu darparu yno. Mae gan ysbytai cymuned ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed ran i'w chwarae i'ch helpu i ddarparu 'Cynllun Oes'. Ond i wneud hynny, mae angen gweledigaeth arnom ar gyfer ysbytai cymuned a'r buddsoddiad i'w hategu.

**Christine Gwyther:** Yr oedd Brian Gibbons yn llygad ei le i achub y gwelyau yn Ninbych-y-pysgod am eu bod yn helpu lleddfu'r problemau blocio gwelyau yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Fodd bynnag, y problemau a ragwelwn yn yr ysbyty hwnnw yw'r hyn a alwyd gan rai pobl yn broses o gwtogi gwasanaethau'n raddol. Mae'n bwysig inni gadw'r gwasanaethau sydd gennym eisoes yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg, inni eu hatgyfnerthu a'u bod yn parhau yn y dyfodol. Gobeithio y bydd yr ymgynghori sydd gennych ar droed ar hyn o bryd, Weinidog, yn gwneud hynny ac y bydd clinigwyr a'r cyhoedd yn sir Benfro yn egluro ein hanghenion ichi fel rhan o'r ymgynghori hwnnw.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar fod pawb wedi cael cyfle i siarad. Mae'n dangos y gallwn gadw at yr amser os bydd angen.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Ar bwynt Elin, y mater yn Ninbych-y-pysgod oedd fod y gymuned leol a'r gwasanaeth iechyd wedi dod i ryw fath o ddealltwriaeth o ran cyflwyno rhai newidiadau fesul cam. Dywedodd Chris Gwyther wrthym fod posibilrwydd na fyddid yn cadw at y broses o gyflwyno fesul cam, fel y cytunwyd, ac felly bu inni ymyrryd, nid i wneud rhywbeth nad oedd wedi ei gytuno, ond yn hytrach er mwyn sicrhau y byddai'r broses gychwynnol



agreed. That is an important point—the service and the local community did agree on a certain staging of service reconfiguration, and we intervened to ensure that the deal that was agreed between the local community and the NHS was adhered to. That is the way it should be, and I congratulate Christine Gwyther for her intervention on that. I think that I was in mid Wales when I got the telephone call from Christine alerting me to that possibility. That is an example of how we in the Assembly Government want to show that, if people do work with the health service, we will work with them to ensure that the service will deliver for them.

Safeguarding the NHS for patients in mid and west Wales is a priority, certainly for the Assembly Government. In a Plenary debate last week, we all recognised the need for long-term and substantial change in health and social care services. We were, in fact, merely reiterating what the Wanless report had told us that, otherwise, health services would be simply unsustainable. In that debate, the Assembly Government was asked to review the effectiveness of existing NHS structures; we agreed to do that, and that is what we are doing. We are looking at structures, and where radical change is needed, then we are prepared to undertake the analysis and give political lead to deliver that.

**Glyn Davies:** We all accept that radical change is difficult and that, often, difficult decisions have to be taken, but do you recognise that there has to be great openness in mid and west Wales, as with everywhere else? Does not the air of suspicion surrounding the Withybush issue, which we heard about when we met people today, mean that your ambitions simply cannot be met? You must create an air of openness, where everyone knows what is happening, and sweep away this sense of secrecy that is causing so much damage to what you are trying to do in mid and west Wales.

**Brian Gibbons:** You are absolutely right, Glyn. People think that there is some secret

o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn digwydd fel y cytunwyd. Mae hwnnw'n bwynt pwysig—cytunodd y gwasanaeth a'r gymuned leol ar broses ailgyflunio gwasanaethau fesul cam, a bu inni ymyrryd i sicrhau y cedwid at y ddêl y cytunwyd arni gan y gymuned leol a'r GIG. Dyna'r ffordd y dylai fod, a llongyfarchaf Christine Gwyther am ymyrryd. Credaf fy mod yn y canolbarth pan gefais yr alwad ffôn gan Christine yn fy rhybuddio o'r posibilrwydd hwnnw. Dyna enghraifft o'r ffordd yr ydym ni yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am ddangos, os bydd pobl yn gweithio gyda'r gwasanaeth iechyd, y byddwn ni'n gweithio gyda hwy i sicrhau y bydd y gwasanaeth yn darparu ar eu cyfer.

Rhoddir blaenoriaeth i'r ddiogelu'r GIG i gleifion yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, yn sic gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mewn dadl yn un o'r Cyfarfodydd Llawn yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oeddem i gyd yn cydnabod yr angen am newid sylweddol a hirdymor mewn gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mewn gwirionedd, yr oeddem yn ailadrodd yr hyn yr oedd adroddiad Wanless wedi'i ddweud wrthym sef, fel arall, na fyddai gwasanaethau iechyd yn gynaliadwy. Yn y ddadl honno, gofynnwyd i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad adolygu effeithiolrwydd strwythurau presennol y GIG; cytunwyd i wneud hynny, a dyna a wnawn. Yr ydym yn edrych ar strwythurau, a lle y mae angen newid sylweddol yna yr ydym yn barod i wneud y dadansoddiad a rhoi arweiniad gwleidyddol i gyflawni hynny.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae pob un ohonom yn derbyn bod newid sylweddol yn anodd a bod yn rhaid gwneud penderfyniadau anodd yn aml, ond a gydnabyddwch fod yn rhaid bod yn agored yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, fel ym mhobman arall? Onid yw'r amheuan o ran Ysbyty Llwynhelyg, a glywsom pan gyfarfuom â phobl heddiw, yn golygu na ellir cyflawni eich uchelgeisiau? Rhaid ichi greu hinsawdd agored, lle y gwyr pawb yr hyn sy'n digwydd, a dileu'r cyfrinachedd sy'n gwneud cymaint o niwed i'r hyn yr ydych yn ceisio ei wneud yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin.

**Brian Gibbons:** Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle, Glyn. Mae pobl yn credu bod yna ryw

plan that has been hidden away, but there is no such secret plan. You are also right that there does need to be full and total engagement with the public and the clinicians with regard to service delivery, whether it is in Withybush or anywhere else. As one who has been an active campaigner against the health service plans of previous Governments, I see the importance of having open engagement; I have campaigned for that throughout my career, and unless the public is engaged and on-side with these changes, they will not happen and the services will not be there.

**Lisa Francis** *rose*—

**Brian Gibbons:** I have a reasonably long speech, Deputy Presiding Officer, and I am a little concerned that I will not have enough time to complete it.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** You have 15 minutes. He is not giving way, Lisa, at the moment.

**Brian Gibbons:** Let me move a little further on in my speech, Lisa.

Not changing is not an option, but, if it means safeguarding all services, it is what we should do unless it will compromise the future of quality delivery in some way.

Over the last three years, we have seen an increase in resources to the health service in south-west Wales in excess of 25 per cent. I am sure that everyone in the Assembly welcomes this record increase over such a short period of time. Equally, across mid and west Wales, between 1999, when the Assembly came into being, and 2004, there has been an increase of 16 per cent in the level of NHS staff, 15 per cent in non-medical staff and 27 per cent in medical and dental staff. In many areas, this investment, in terms of money, resources and people, has produced excellent outcomes for the people of south-west Wales.

Initially, only a handful of people in mid and

gynllun dirgel sydd wedi ei guddio o'r golwg, ond nid oes cynllun dirgel o'r fath. Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle hefyd pan ddywedwch fod angen ymgysylltu'n llawn â'r cyhoedd a'r clinigwyr o ran darparu gwasanaethau, boed yn Ysbyty Llwynhelyg neu unrhyw le arall. Fel rhywun sydd wedi ymgyrchu'n frwd yn erbyn cynlluniau Llywodraethau blaenorol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd, gwelaf bwysigrwydd ymgysylltu'n agored; yr wyf wedi ymgyrchu dros hynny drwy gydol fy ngyrfa, ac oni chaiff y cyhoedd eu cynnwys yn y newidiadau hyn a'u cefnogi, ni fyddant yn digwydd ac ni fydd y gwasanaethau'n cael eu darparu.

**Lisa Francis** *a gododd*—

**Brian Gibbons:** Mae gennyf araith gymharol hir, Ddirprwy Lywydd, ac yr wyf yn pryderu na fydd gennyf ddigon o amser i'w chwblhau.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae gennych 15 munud. Nid yw'n ildio, Lisa, ar hyn o bryd.

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadewch imi barhau ychydig gyda'm haraith, Lisa.

Nid yw peidio â newid yn ddewis, ond os yw'n golygu diogelu'r holl wasanaethau, dyna y dylem ei wneud oni fydd yn peryglu darparu gwasanaeth o safon yn y dyfodol mewn rhyw ffordd.

Dros y tair blynedd diwethaf, yr ydym wedi gweld cynnydd o fwy na 25 y cant mewn adnoddau i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y de-orllewin. Yr wyf yn siwr fod pawb yn y Cynulliad yn croesawu'r cynnydd hwn, y cynnydd mwyaf erioed, dros gyfnod mor fyr. Yn yr un modd, ledled y canolbarth a'r gorllewin rhwng 1999, pan grëwyd y Cynulliad, a 2004 bu cynnydd o 16 y cant yn lefel staff y GIG, 15 y cant yn y staff nad ydynt yn staff meddygol a 27 y cant mewn staff meddygol a deintyddol. Mewn llawer maes mae'r buddsoddiad hwn o ran arian, adnoddau a phobl, wedi golygu canlyniadau gwych i bobl y de-orllewin.

Ar y cychwyn, dim ond llond dwrn o bobl yn

west Wales were waiting over 12 months for in-patient or day-care treatment. For out-patients who have a wait of over 12 months, there is less than 1,000 if we exclude Swansea and Bro Morgannwg, out of a total of 10,000 in the rest of Wales.

In terms of accident and emergency waits, the departments in Carmarthenshire, Pembrokeshire and Derwen and Ceredigion have been consistently above the 90 per cent level, and, on occasions, they have exceeded the 95 per cent level, which is record performance. Linked to this, we have had a range of capital schemes, amounting to well over £20 million. In terms of primary care services, there has been top-quality delivery in areas such as the quality outcome framework and 24-hour access to primary care services.

These achievements are evidence of the Assembly Government's commitment to the national health service in mid and west Wales. Moreover, they are a tribute to the quality, commitment and dedication of the staff in the NHS and social care services who serve the people of mid and west Wales. So, if all of this is true, what is the issue and why do we need change?

First of all, we need to be able to give a guarantee the people of mid and west Wales that these services can be sustained. We also need to ensure that these services are capable of meeting future need that will arise from demographic changes and other patterns of patient expectation, as well as the patterns of morbidity and risk that flow from that. We also need to ensure that every benefit from progress that is taking place in healthcare will accrue to the people of mid and west Wales. Wherever we are making the case for change, we must assure them that it is to ensure, as Kirsty said, that care is delivered in people's homes or in their own communities in a timely way, and which is sensitive to people's needs wherever possible. If people must travel, they need to know that the journey is dictated solely by the need to deliver a safe and quality-assured service.

**Lisa Francis:** You will know from the

y canolbarth a'r gorllewin a oedd yn aros dros 12 mis am driniaeth fel claf mewnol neu ofal dydd. Mae llai na 1,000 o gleifion allanol yn gorfod aros dros 12 mis, os na chynhwyswn Abertawe a Bro Morgannwg, o gyfanswm o 10,000 yng ngweddill Cymru.

O ran aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, mae'r adrannau yn sir Gaerfyrddin, sir Benfro a Derwen a Cheredigion yn gyson uwch na'r lefel o 90 y cant, ac ar brydiau maent wedi bod dros 95 y cant, sef y perfformiad gorau erioed. Yn gysylltiedig â hyn, cawsom amrywiaeth o gynlluniau cyfalaf, gwerth ymhell dros £20 miliwm. O ran gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, mae'r gwasanaethau a ddarparwyd wedi bod o'r safon uchaf mewn meysydd megis y fframwaith canlyniadau o safon a gallu cael gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol 24 awr y dydd.

Mae'r llwyddiannau hyn yn tystio i ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. At hynny, maent yn glod i ansawdd, ymrwymiad ac ymroddiad staff yn y GIG a gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol sy'n gwasanaethu pobl y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Felly, os yw hyn i gyd yn wir, beth yw'r broblem a pham mae angen inni newid?

Yn gyntaf oll, mae angen inni allu rhoi gwarant i bobl y canolbarth a'r gorllewin y gellir cynnal y gwasanaethau hyn. Mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau y gall y gwasanaethau hyn ddiwallu anghenion yn y dyfodol a fydd yn codi o newidiadau demograffig a phatrymau disgwyliadau eraill gan gleifion, yn ogystal â phatrymau morbidrwydd a'r peryglon sy'n deillio o hynny. Mae angen hefyd inni sicrhau y bydd pob buddiant o'r cynnydd sy'n digwydd ym maes gofal iechyd yn dod i ran pobl y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Lle bynnag y dadleuwn dros newid, rhaid inni eu sicrhau, fel dywedodd Kirsty, fod gofal yn cael ei ddarparu yng nghartrefi pobl neu yn eu cymunedau mewn modd amserol, a hwnnw'n sensitif i anghenion pobl ble bynnag y mae'n bosib. Os yw'n rhaid i bobl deithio, mae angen iddynt wybod mai dim ond er mwyn sicrhau gwasanaeth diogel o safon y mae angen iddynt deithio.

**Lisa Francis:** Byddwch yn gwybod, o'r

delegation of people who came to the Assembly today from Pembrokeshire, to whom you spoke, that they are concerned about the evidence being put forward for this need for change. Evidence file 1 and 2 in the 'The Case for Change', the document to which you refer, are Welsh Assembly Government documents, but consultants say that these documents are misleading and inaccurate. Will you look again at this evidence?

**Brian Gibbons:** If people feel that any of the evidence base on which the case has been made is inaccurate, then we would want to know. That is why it is crucially important to have the clinical engagement, and if the evidence base is incorrect, or if the value judgments that we make in terms of patient access and so forth are incorrect, it is vitally important that the public engages with this. So, if people feel that the evidence base is incorrect, I would be more than pleased to have—indeed, I would positively welcome—the submissions from those clinicians, as I said to them today.

So, we need to ensure that if we are to deliver these objectives in terms of quality services, we need a service that is sufficiently resilient to meet certain unavoidable challenges, and to ensure that we make the most efficient use of the level of resources that is provided. Waste and inefficient services will mean—

5.20 p.m.

**Owen John Thomas:** Will you give way?

**Brian Gibbons:** Let me just finish.

Waste and inefficiency in service delivery will mean that services are more difficult to sustain. Equally, those inefficiencies of service in one particular area will consume an unnecessary amount of resources and so prohibit the very redistribution of services that Rhodri Glyn asked for in terms of communities such as Carmarthen. Service levels in mid and west Wales are as good as those anywhere else in Wales, but their future is being compromised by inefficiencies in the service, which, in turn is leading to financial

ddirprwyaeth o bobl a ddaeth i'r Cynulliad heddiw o sir Benfro y buoch yn siarad â hwy, eu bod yn pryderu am y dystiolaeth a gyflwynir dros yr angen hwn am newid. Mae ffeiliau tystiolaeth 1 a 2 yn 'The Case for Change', y ddogfen yr ydych yn cyfeirio ati, yn ddogfennau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ond mae meddygon ymgynghorol yn dweud eu bod yn gamarweiniol ac yn wallus. A wnewch chi edrych ar y dystiolaeth hon eto?

**Brian Gibbons:** Os yw pobl yn teimlo bod unrhyw ran o'r dystiolaeth y mae'r dadl yn seiliedig arni yn wallus, yna byddem am gael gwybod. Dyna pam mae'n hollbwysig cael gwybodaeth gan glinigwyr, ac os yw'r dystiolaeth yn wallus, neu os yw'r casgliadau y deugn iddynt o ran mynediad cleifion ac ati yn wallus, mae'n hollbwysig i'r cyhoedd fod yn rhan o hynny. Felly, os yw pobl yn teimlo bod y dystiolaeth yn wallus, byddwn yn fwy na pharod—yn wir, byddwn yn croesawu—cael y cyflwyniadau gan y clinigwyr hynny, fel y dywedais wrthynt heddiw.

Felly, mae angen inni sicrhau bod angen gwasanaeth digon gwydn arnom i ateb heriau anochel penodol os ydym i gyflawni'r amcanion hyn o ran ansawdd gwasanaethau, ac i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y defnydd mwyaf effeithlon o'r adnoddau a ddarperir. Bydd gwastraff a gwasanaethau aneffeithlon yn golygu—

**Owen John Thomas:** A wnewch chi ildio?

**Brian Gibbons:** Gadewch imi orffen.

Bydd gwastraff ac aneffeithlonrwydd wrth ddarparu gwasanaethau yn golygu bod gwasanaethau'n fwy anodd eu cynnal. Yn yr un modd, bydd yr aneffeithlonrwydd hwnnw mewn gwasanaeth mewn un maes penodol yn defnyddio swm diangen o adnoddau ac felly yn atal yr union aildosbarthu gwasanaethau y gofynnodd Rhodri Glyn amdano o ran cymunedau megis Caerfyrddin. Mae lefelau gwasanaeth yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin cystal ag ydynt mewn unrhyw ran arall o Gymru, ond mae eu dyfodol yn y fantol

pressures, which are not necessarily replicated consistently across the region, even in communities with lower resource allocations and sicker patients.

Some parts of mid and west Wales have the lowest rates of delayed transfers of care in Wales, but also some of the highest rates, leading to 8 to 10 per cent of hospital beds being unavailable. They have examples of some of the best waiting list management and some of the not so good. There is some of the best performance in terms of accident and emergency waits and some of the lowest. There are high rates of people not attending at some hospital clinics, while there are other clinics where the rates are much lower. There is a high level of usage of bank and agency nursing in some trusts, and, in others, the levels are lower. The rates of cancelled operations are just as variable. This uneven performance is compromising the patient experience and the ability of the health service in those communities to deliver care of the best quality.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I am loath to intervene; you have about four minutes left for your speech and I know that it is difficult to respond with a speech that was prepared before you had heard what I had to say. However, I asked several specific questions about how we get from where we are now to 2010. That is what people in mid and west Wales want to know. You could have been reading 'Designed for Life' for the last 10 minutes, because you have just made general statements that do not mean anything in terms of the way that services are delivered on the ground.

**Brian Gibbons:** You are not doing people a service if you do not explain the context in terms of the excellent performance that is to be seen in mid and west Wales. It is uneven in places, and we need to get the lower-performing services up to the levels of the best in mid and west Wales. That is a real and immediate challenge for the service, and you are asking what should be done straight

oherwydd aneffeithlonrwydd yn y gwasanaeth, sydd yn ei dro yn arwain at bwysau ariannol, nad ydynt o reidrwydd i'w gweld ym mhob rhan o'r rhanbarth, hyd yn oed mewn cymunedau gyda llai o adnoddau a chleifion mwy sâl.

Mewn rhannau o'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin y mae'r cyfraddau oedi isaf wrth drosglwyddo gofal yng Nghymru, ond hefyd rhai o'r cyfraddau uchaf, sy'n golygu bod 8 i 10 y cant o welyau ysbyty heb fod ar gael. Yno mae enghreifftiau o reoli rhestrau aros ar ei orau, ac enghreifftiau sydd heb fod cystal. Gwelir enghreifftiau o'r perfformiad gorau o ran aros mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ac o'r perfformiad gwaethaf. Mae cyfraddau uchel o bobl nad ydynt yn mynychu rhai clinigau ysbyty, ond mae clinigau eraill lle mae'r cyfraddau lawer yn is. Mae defnyddio mawr ar nyrsys banc ac asiantaeth mewn rhai ymddiriedolaethau, ac mewn eraill mae'r lefelau'n is. Mae cyfraddau'r llawdriniaethau sy'n cael eu canslo yr un mor amrywiol. Mae'r perfformiad anwastad hwn yn peryglu profiad y claf a gallu'r gwasanaeth iechyd yn y cymunedau hynny i ddarparu gofal o'r safon orau.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr wyf yn anfodlon ymyrryd; mae gennych tua phedair munud o'ch araith yn weddill, a gwn ei bod yn anodd ymateb gydag araith a baratowyd cyn ichi glywed yr hyd sydd gennyf i'w ddweud. Fodd bynnag, gofynnais nifer o gwestiynau penodol ynglyn â sut yr awn o'r sefyllfa bresennol i 2010. Dyna y mae pobl yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin am ei wybod. Gallech fod wedi bod yn darllen 'Cynllun Oes' am y 10 munud ddiwethaf, oherwydd dim ond datganiadau cyffredinol a wnaed gennych nad ydynt yn golygu dim am y modd y darperir gwasanaethau ar lawr gwlad.

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid ydych yn gwneud cymwynas â phobl drwy beidio ag egluro'r cyd-destun o ran y perfformiad rhagorol sydd i'w weld yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae'n anghyson mewn rhannau, ac mae angen inni godi'r gwasanaethau sy'n perfformio'n is i'r lefelau gorau yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Mae hynny'n her wirioneddol ac uniongyrchol i'r gwasanaeth,

away. Ensuring that the underperforming parts of the service are up to the levels of the service that are delivering better is something that should be, and is being, done straight away. That is immediate and pragmatic action, and we need to be able to show that it is happening across the community in south-west Wales.

We also have other challenges to face, which we cannot avoid, such as the 20 to 25 per cent reduction in doctors' hours due to the European working times directive. How are we going to meet clinical governance requirements in terms of optimising patient outcomes? If these clinical governance standards are not being met, what will that say for patient care? If those clinical governance standards are not there, how will we maintain the training status of these hospitals? If the training status cannot be retained, how will we be able to secure recruitment and retention policies in these trusts? We need to engage in a full and open debate on all these issues.

In terms of moving the agenda forward, in January, a project board will review the outcome of the consultation on these matters and will start developing the real, pragmatic options for formal consultation. To answer Rhodri Glyn's question, the specific, detailed proposals will become available in January, or the beginning of February, for consultation, and that will take place in each community across the region. Emerging from that will be a regional plan that will also be subject to local consultation.

In these options, there is no suggestion that acute services in Withybush General Hospital will be downgraded as was suggested in earlier contributions, particularly Lisa's, because if the services are going to be fit for purpose, they must be able to respond to the particular acute situation that exists.

Rhodri Glyn asked specifically what clinical networks are. They have been in existence for a number of years. They provide a model of care that was traditionally provided in a

ac yr ydych yn gofyn beth y dylid ei wneud yn syth. Mae sicrhau bod y rhannau o'r gwasanaeth sy'n tanberfformio yn cyrraedd lefelau'r gwasanaeth sydd yn darparu'n well yn rhywbeth y dylid ei wneud yn syth, ac mae hynny'n cael ei wneud. Dyna yw camau gweithredu ymarferol ar unwaith, ac mae angen inni allu dangos bod hynny'n digwydd drwy'r gymuned gyfan yn y de-orllewin.

Mae heriau eraill hefyd yn ein hwynebu na allwn eu hosgoi, megis lleihau oriau meddygon o 20 i 25 y cant oherwydd cyfarwydddeb oriau gwaith Ewrop. Sut y byddwn yn ateb gofynion llywodraethu clinigol o ran cael y canlyniadau gorau i gleifion? Os na chyrhaeddir y safonau llywodraethu clinigol hyn, beth fydd hynny'n ei ddweud am ofal cleifion? Os na chyrhaeddir y safonau llywodraethu clinigol hynny, sut y gallwn gynnal statws hyfforddi'r ysbytai hyn? Os na ellir cadw'r statws hyfforddi, sut y gallwn sicrhau polisïau recriwtio a chadw yn yr ymddiriedolaethau hyn? Mae angen inni gael dadl lawn ac agored ar yr holl faterion hyn.

O ran symud yr agenda yn ei blaen, ym mis Ionawr bydd bwrdd prosiect yn adolygu canlyniad yr ymgynghori am y materion hyn, a bydd yn dechrau datblygu dewisiadau gwirioneddol ac ymarferol ar gyfer ymgynghori ffurfiol. I ateb cwestiwn Rhodri Glyn, bydd y cynigion penodol, manwl ar gael ym mis Ionawr neu ddechrau mis Chwefror, ar gyfer ymgynghori, a bydd hynny'n digwydd ymhob cymuned ledled y rhanbarth. Yn codi o hynny bydd cynllun rhanbarthol a fydd hefyd yn destun ymgynghori lleol.

Yn y dewisiadau hyn, nid oes awgrym y bydd gwasanaethau aciwt yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Llwynhelyg yn cael eu hisraddio, fel yr awgrymwyd mewn cyfraniadau cynharach, yn enwedig gan Lisa, oherwydd er mwyn i wasanaethau fod yn addas at y diben, rhaid iddynt ymateb i'r sefyllfa aciwt benodol sy'n bodoli.

Gofynnodd Rhodri Glyn yn benodol beth yw rhwydweithiau clinigol. Maent wedi bodoli ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Model o ofal ydynt a ddarperid yn draddodiadol mewn adran

single department within a single hospital, which is now provided across a range of departments, hospitals or trusts in a single coherent delivery service. Examples of that type of service would be the genetic services that are being delivered from Cardiff to all parts of south and west Wales, and many of the organ-specific cancer services, which are again being delivered in south-west Wales. Therefore, there is excellent work taking place in many areas in mid and west Wales. The challenge for us—

unigol mewn ysbyty unigol, ond a ddarperir erbyn hyn ar draws ystod o adrannau, ysbytai neu ymddiriedolaethau mewn un gwasanaeth cydlynol. Enghreifftiau o'r math hwnnw o wasanaeth fyddai'r gwasanaethau geneteg a ddarperir o Gaerdydd i bob rhan o'r de a'r gorllewin, a nifer o'r gwasanaethau canser ar gyfer organau penodol, a ddarperir eto yn y de-orllewin. Felly, gwneir gwaith arbennig mewn llawer ardal yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin. Yr her inni—

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Order. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Daw hynny â chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.26 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.26 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)

Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)