



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 22 Tachwedd 2005
Tuesday, 22 November 2005**

Cynnwys Contents

Ethol i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol Election to the Local Government Partnership Council	3
Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	4
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	31
Datganiad am Gwmni Pacio Caws Dyffryn Aeron Statement on the Aeron Valley Cheese Packing Company.....	33
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchymynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders.....	44
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005 a Gorchymyn Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Cyngor) 2005 Approval of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005.....	46
Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005 a Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005 Approval of the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 and the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005	65
Cynllun Oes—Strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol Designed for Life—10-year Strategy for Health and Social Care.....	92
Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion.....	114
Cynllun Oes—Strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol: Parhad Designed for Life—10-year Strategy for Health and Social Care: Continued.....	115

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y Siambr.
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

**Ethol i Gyngor Partneriaeth Llywodraeth Leol
Election to the Local Government Partnership Council**

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod
propose that

the Assembly, in accordance with paragraphs 1(1), (3) and 4 of Schedule 11 to the Government of Wales Act 1998, appoints the following persons to be members of the Local Government Partnership Council:

1. Councillor Bob Dutton of Wrexham County Borough Council in place of Councillor Emlyn Davies of Conwy County Borough Council;

2. Councillor Derek Vaughan of Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council in place of Councillor Alex Aldridge of Flintshire County Council. (NDM2677)

*Cynnig (NDM2677): O blaid 32, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2677): For 32, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl

Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Mentrau Cymunedol Community Enterprise

Q1 Catherine Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing to support community enterprise? OAQ1000(FM)

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): Four of my Ministers took part in events across Wales to help celebrate Enterprise Week, last week, and Social Enterprise Day, last Thursday. The events were aimed at raising the profile of social enterprise across the UK. On 1 December, we will host a social enterprise and state aid seminar to identify ways of tackling state aids, and removing them as a barrier to social enterprise development.

Catherine Thomas: Thank you for that response. Will you join me in commending the way in which the community of Hendy is working tirelessly, through discussions with Carmarthenshire County Council, to try to secure funding for the restoration and reopening of Hendy outdoor pool? The pool is an example of early community enterprise, having been financed and built by the people of the community, and the amenity has been enjoyed and treasured for generations. First Minister, what role can the Assembly Government play in assisting local authorities to take the lead in operating community ventures such as that so that they are financially sustainable, while keeping local people closely involved in shaping these services, so that they have a secure future?

The First Minister: We would all commend

C1 Catherine Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y gall Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru gefnogi mentrau cymunedol? OAQ1000(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Bu pedwar o fy Ngweinidogion yn cymryd rhan mewn digwyddiadau ledled Cymru i ddathlu Wythnos Fenter, yr wythnos diwethaf, a Diwrnod Menter Gymdeithasol, ddydd Iau diwethaf. Nod y digwyddiadau oedd codi proffil menter gymdeithasol ledled y DU. Ar 1 Rhagfyr, byddwn yn cynnal seminar menter gymdeithasol a chymorth gwladwriaethol i ganfod dulliau o fynd i'r afael â chymhorthion gwladwriaethol, a chael gwared arnynt fel rhwystr i ddatblygiad menter gymdeithasol.

Catherine Thomas: Diolch am yr ymateb hwnnw. A ymunwch â mi i gymeradwyo'r ffordd y mae cymuned Hendy'n gweithio'n ddiflino, drwy drafodaethau gyda Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin, i geisio sicrhau cyllid i adnewyddu ac ailagor pwll awyr agored Hendy? Mae'r pwll yn enghraifft o fenter gymunedol gynnar, gan iddo gael ei gyllido a'i adeiladu gan bobl y gymuned, ac mae cenedlaethau o bobl wedi mwynhau a thrysori'r amwynder hwn. Brif Weinidog, pa rôl y gall Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei chwarae i helpu awdurdodau lleol i gymryd yr awenau o ran rhedeg mentrau cymunedol o'r fath er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn gynaliadwy'n ariannol gan sicrhau, yr un pryd, fod pobl leol ynghlwm wrth y gwaith o lunio'r gwasanaethau hyn er mwyn iddynt gael dyfodol sicr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddai pob un ohonom yn

social enterprise efforts at the bottom-up, community-based level, because they help to reach the parts that the conventional economy, both private and public sector, cannot reach. There is a range of possibilities here, sometimes involving having to ensure that petty rules along the state aids frontier do not inhibit the creation of jobs by social enterprise. That is one area on which we will concentrate in the seminar on 1 December, with participation from the state aids unit and the Department of Trade and Industry. People involved in credit union funding will also be there to help to highlight the range of funding that is available to promote social enterprise.

Owen John Thomas: Butetown, a community on the doorstep of the National Assembly, has been marginalised by the huge investment in Cardiff bay rather than benefiting from it. Will you explain what steps your Government is taking to promote community enterprise in what is now the most socially deprived community in Wales?

The First Minister: Everyone recognises the irony of having the two communities of old Tiger Bay and new Atlantic Wharf next door to each other. It is never easy to blend urban regeneration projects with communities of high levels of deprivation when they are side by side. However, I have not seen any figures that show that Butetown has not benefited at all from the presence of the Assembly, the Wales Millennium Centre, or those two bodies, together with all the other new investment in this area, though it is certainly the case that it has not transformed the lives of people in Tiger Bay. We have to give more attention to the way in which we work urban regeneration, so that it is not to the disadvantage of old, established local communities.

William Graham: You will know that one of the best examples of community enterprise is Newport Wastesavers, which was recently voted the best recycling project in the United Kingdom. Would you support its efforts to obtain finance for a new education centre in the Cleanstream Resource Centre, which

cymeradwyo ymdrechion menter gymdeithasol sy'n dechrau ar lawr gwlad, ar lefel y gymuned, gan eu bod yn helpu i gyrraedd y rhannau hynny na all yr economi gonfensiynol, yn y sector preifat na'r sector cyhoeddus, eu cyrraedd. Ceir ystod o bosibiliadau yma, sydd weithiau'n golygu gorfod sicrhau nad yw rheolau pitw o ran cymorth gwladwriaethol yn llesteirio creu swyddi gan fenter gymdeithasol. Dyna un maes y byddwn yn canolbwyntio arno yn y seminar ar 1 Rhagfyr, gyda chyfraniadau gan yr uned cymorth gwladwriaethol a'r Adran Masnach a Diwydiant. Bydd pobl sy'n ymwneud â chyllid undebau credyd yno hefyd i helpu i dynnu sylw at yr ystod o gyllid sydd ar gael i hyrwyddo menter gymdeithasol.

Owen John Thomas: Mae Butetown, cymuned sydd yn ymyl y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, wedi cael ei gwthio i'r cyrion gan y buddsoddiad aruthrol ym mae Caerdydd, yn hytrach nag elwa ohono. A wnewch esbonio pa gamau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i hyrwyddo menter gymunedol yn yr ardal sydd bellach yn gymuned fwyaf difreintiedig Cymru yn gymdeithasol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae pawb yn cydnabod yr eironi bod dwy gymuned—hen a newydd—Tiger Bay a Glanfa'r Iwerydd y drws nesaf i'w gilydd. Nid yw byth yn rhwydd asio prosiectau adfywio trefol gyda chymunedau sydd ag amddifadedd sylweddol pan fyddant y drws nesaf i'w gilydd. Fodd bynnag, nid wyf wedi gweld dim ffigurau sy'n dangos nad yw Butetown wedi elwa o gwbl o bresenoldeb y Cynulliad, Canolfan Mileniwm Cymru, na'r ddau gorff hynny, er ei bod yn sicr yn wir nad yw wedi gweddnewid bywydau pobl yn Tiger Bay. Mae'n rhaid inni roi mwy o sylw i'r ffordd yr ydym yn gweithredu adfywio trefol, er mwyn sicrhau nad yw'n digwydd ar draul hen gymunedau lleol sefydledig.

William Graham: Fe wyddoch mai un o'r enghreifftiau gorau o fenter gymunedol yw Newport Wastesavers, a ddewiswyd mewn pleidlais yn ddiweddar yn brosiect ailgylchu gorau'r Deyrnas Unedig. A fydddech yn cefnogi ei hymdrechion i gael cyllid ar gyfer canolfan addysg newydd yng Nghanolfan

would focus on schools and local education groups and ensure that recycling is very much at the top of the agenda?

The First Minister: Recycling enterprises of that kind are at the heart of successful social enterprise. Indeed, I visited one such scheme in the Caernarfon area quite recently, and a very well-known scheme serves the western half of Cardiff, in my constituency and that of Lorraine Barrett. Such schemes are very successful at reaching the parts of the community that conventional employment does not reach, as well as having a good cause to promote in terms of recycling. If you would write to me about the particular issue in relation to the education centre, I will ensure that either I or Andrew Davies replies, possibly with advice from Carwyn Jones.

Mick Bates: I am sure that we would all agree that community enterprise is one of the best ways of empowering local communities. However, evidence shows that a great many social and community enterprises fail for the sake of a small amount of money, often less than £5,000. What action is your Government taking to bring financial sustainability to community enterprises, so that they can build up capacity and serve the communities that develop them?

The First Minister: I cannot give a guarantee, standing here now, that every community enterprise that is close to, but does not quite achieve, financial viability or grant funding to get going will get whatever it needs. That is not the proper way to run Government or finance. I am sure that there are many cases of that nature, but I would not like to speculate about the number of such projects that have failed, and ignore the number of projects that have got off the ground successfully. The biggest problem that I have been aware of as First Minister is to do with over-legalistic interpretation of state aid rules and the impact that those rules are deemed to have on the possibility of getting a social enterprise going. People think that if you put grants into a project that has some parallel with private sector activity, it distorts competition. Usually it does not, but sometimes there is over-legalistic interpretation on that particular point.

Adnoddau Ffrydlan, i ganolbwyntio ar ysgolion a grwpiau addysg lleol a sicrhau bod ailgylchu yn gadarn ar frig yr agenda?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae mentrau ailgylchu o'r fath wrth galon menter gymdeithasol lwyddiannus. Yn wir, ymwelais â chynllun o'r fath yn ardal Caernarfon yn eithaf diweddar, ac mae cynllun amlwg iawn yn gwasanaethu hanner gorllewinol Caerdydd yn fy etholaeth i a Lorraine Barrett. Mae cynlluniau o'r fath yn llwyddiannus iawn o ran cyrraedd y rhannau hynny o'r gymuned nas cyrhaeddir gan gyflogaeth gonfensiynol, yn ogystal â hyrwyddo achos da, sef ailgylchu. Pe baech yn ysgrifennu ataf ynglŷn â mater penodol y ganolfan addysg, sicrhaf y byddaf fi neu Andrew Davies yn ateb, o bosibl gyda chynngor gan Carwyn Jones.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn sicr y byddem oll yn cytuno bod menter gymunedol yn un o'r dulliau gorau o rymuso cymunedau lleol. Fodd bynnag, dengys tystiolaeth fod nifer fawr o fentrau cymdeithasol a chymunedol yn methu oherwydd symiau bach o arian, llai na £5,000 yn aml. Pa gamau y mae eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i ddod â chynaliadwyedd ariannol i fentrau cymunedol, er mwyn iddynt allu cynyddu eu gallu a gwasanaethu'r cymunedau sy'n eu datblygu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf roi gwarant ichi, y funud hon, y bydd pob menter gymunedol sydd bron â sicrhau hyfywedd ariannol neu gymorth grant i'w chael ar ei thraed, ond sydd heb lwyddo i wneud hynny'n hollol, yn derbyn beth bynnag sydd ei angen arni. Nid dyna'r ffordd briodol o redeg na Llywodraeth na chyllid. Yr wyf yn sicr bod llawer o achosion o'r fath, ond nid wyf am fwrw amcan ynglŷn â nifer y prosiectau o'r fath sydd wedi methu, ac anwybyddu nifer y prosiectau sydd wedi llwyddo i gael eu traed danynt. Y broblem fwyaf y deuthum ar ei thraws fel Prif Weinidog yw dehongliad gorgyfreithiol o reolau cymorth gwladwriaethol a'r effaith y bernir bod y rheolau hynny'n ei chael ar y posibilrwydd o gael menter gymdeithasol ar ei thraed. Mae pobl yn credu bod rhoi grantiau i brosiect sydd rywsut yn debyg i weithgarwch sector preifat yn llurgunio cystadleuaeth. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd, fel arfer, ond weithiau ceir

dehongliad gorgyfreithiol ar y pwynt arbennig hwnnw.

Marchnata Twristiaeth Marketing Tourism

Q2 Lisa Francis: Will the First Minister make a statement on marketing tourism in Wales? OAQ1010(FM)

The First Minister: The 'Big Country' television campaign, which I am sure that you are familiar with, was a breakthrough in terms of public sector tourism advertising. The Wales Tourist Board and the Welsh Assembly Government are very proud of it. Below the all-Wales level, we are assured that local authorities will continue to advertise tourism in Wales, as will private sector companies with tourist facilities to advertise.

Lisa Francis: I have been asking written questions of the Minister for Economic Development and Transport about the roles and responsibilities of the personnel who will be employed by your Government to undertake tourism marketing following the merger, after April 2006. All of my questions have been rejected, because they refer, apparently, to the roles and responsibilities of personnel who will be civil servants, and thus cannot be answered by the Minister. Is this indicative of the openness and transparency and increased democracy that you expected to achieve through your 'Making the Connections' policy, and how are we expected to find out what kind of marketing roles and responsibilities the new Government department will have?

The First Minister: We have been extremely open about how we want to establish a clear and consistent overall brand message for Wales, and that exercise has been led by the Wales Tourist Board specialists in this field, and the consultants working for them, but going well beyond the tourism area. We believe that they have a very successful track record, and there is no way that that will be inhibited from continuing when the particular personnel transfer to employment as civil servants from employment as officers of an Assembly sponsored public body. I am unsighted as to the particular point you raise

C2 Lisa Francis: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am farchnata twristiaeth yng Nghymru? OAQ1010(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Roedd yr ymgyrch deledu 'Y Wlad Fawr', sy'n gyfarwydd i chi, mi dybiaf, yn torri tir newydd o ran hysbysebu twristiaeth yn y sector cyhoeddus. Mae Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymhyfrydu ynddi. Ar lefel is na lefel Cymru gyfan, cawn ein sicrhau y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yn parhau i hysbysebu twristiaeth yng Nghymru, fel y bydd cwmnïau sector preifat sydd â chyfleusterau twristiaeth i'w hysbysebu.

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf wedi bod yn gofyn cwestiynau ysgrifenedig i'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth ynglŷn â rolau a chyfrifoldebau'r personél a gyflogir gan eich Llywodraeth i ymgymryd â marchnata twristiaeth wedi i'r uno ddigwydd, ar ôl Ebrill 2006. Gwrthodwyd pob un o'm cwestiynau, am eu bod yn cyfeirio, yn ôl a ddeallaf, at rolau a chyfrifoldebau personél a fydd yn weision sifil, sy'n golygu na all y Gweinidog eu hateb. A yw hyn yn arwydd o'r ysbryd agored a thryloyw a'r ddemocratiaeth gynyddol yr oeddech yn disgwyl eu cael drwy eich polisi 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', a sut y mae disgwyl i ni ganfod sut fath o rolau a chyfrifoldebau marchnata a fydd gan yr adran newydd yn y Llywodraeth?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym wedi bod yn hynod agored ynghylch sut yr ydym am sefydlu brand cyffredinol clir a chyson i Gymru, a gwnaed yr ymarferiad hwnnw dan arweiniad arbenigwyr Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn y maes hwn, a'r ymgynghorwyr a oedd yn gweithio iddynt, ond gan fynd ymhell y tu hwnt i'r maes twristiaeth. Credwn fod ganddynt hanes hynod lwyddiannus, ac ni lesteirir parhad y llwyddiant hwnnw pan fydd y personél penodol yn trosglwyddo i gael eu cyflogi fel gweision sifil yn hytrach nag fel swyddogion corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad. Nid wyf yn deall yr union bwynt a

about individual duties of civil servants; perhaps if you were to write to the Permanent Secretary, with a copy to me, I could take up the matter and I will see that a reply is arranged appropriately.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I may be able to help. If the questions were rejected at the point of tabling in the Table Office, I take full responsibility for that.

Denise Idris Jones: Would you agree, First Minister, that the way that Llandudno is moving into higher-quality tourism, offering golfing and cricketing weekends and tours into Snowdonia National Park, and encouraging tourism across the board, from young families to pensioners, is boosting the area's economy?

The First Minister: Yes, because ensuring that resorts that have a heavy concentration of hotel bedrooms—at one time, I believe that 25 per cent of all the hotel bedrooms in Wales were in Llandudno, although I do not think that the percentage is as high now—are modernised is important, so that they do not get trapped into the Saga holiday market. There was a danger of that happening a few years ago. Diversifying into the kinds of weekend special breaks that you mention, and the attraction of younger families to use the wonderful hotel facilities and to see the fantastic Victorian promenade and terrace of hotels, is the right way forward. After visiting Llandudno once, people always want to return.

2.10 p.m.

Janet Davies: I will pick up on your answer to Lisa Francis. Could you outline the roles and responsibilities that officials will have, so that we can see how policy is arrived at and marketed? It seems to me that we have problems in terms of accountability, openness and transparency.

The First Minister: If you are asking me to tell you the names of civil servants, you are turning a non-problem into a problem. The real issues are: what is the budget, what is the policy, how will it compare with today's policy, will there be a continuation of the

godwch am ddyletswyddau unigol gweision sifil; pe baech yn ysgrifennu at yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol, gyda chopi i mi, gallwn weithredu ar y mater ac fe sicrhaf fod ateb yn cael ei drefnu'n briodol.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'n bosibl y gallaf fi helpu. Os cafodd y cwestiynau eu gwrthod adeg eu cyflwyno yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno, cymeraf y cyfrifoldeb llwyr dros hynny.

Denise Idris Jones: A fydddech yn cytuno, Brif Weinidog, fod y ffordd y mae Llandudno yn symud i faes gwyliau o safon uwch, gan gynnig penwythnosau golff a chriced, a theithiau o amgylch Parc Cenedlaethol Eryri, a hyrwyddo twristiaeth yn ehangach, o deuluoedd ifanc i bensiynwyr, yn hybu economi'r ardal?

Y Prif Weinidog: Byddwn, oherwydd y mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod cyrchfannau sydd â chrynodiad sylweddol o loffydd gwestai—ar un adeg, credaf fod 25 y cant o holl loffydd gwestai Cymru yn Llandudno, er nad yw'r ganran mor uchel erbyn heddiw, fe dybiaf—yn cael eu moderneiddio, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydynt yn cael eu dal ym marchnad wyliau Saga. Yr oedd perygl i hynny ddigwydd rai blynyddoedd yn ôl. Arallgyfeirio gyda'r mathau o wyliau penwythnos arbenigol y cyfeiriwch atynt, a denu teuluoedd ifanc i ddefnyddio cyfleusterau ardderchog y gwestai a gweld y promenâd a'r teras o westai Fictorianaid ysblynydd yw'r ffordd briodol ymlaen. Ar ôl ymweld â Llandudno unwaith, mae pobl wastad am ddychwelyd yno.

Janet Davies: Carwn ymdrin â'ch ateb i Lisa Francis. A allech amlinellu'r rolau a'r cyfrifoldebau a fydd gan y swyddogion, er mwyn inni allu gweld sut y bydd polisïau'n cael eu llunio a'u marchnata? Ymddengys i mi fod gennym broblemau o ran bod yn atebol, yn agored ac yn dryloyw.

Y Prif Weinidog: Os ydych yn gofyn i mi roi enwau gweision sifil ichi, yr ydych yn creu problem lle nad oes un yn bod. Dyma'r cwestiynau allweddol: beth yw'r gyllideb, beth yw'r polisi, sut y mae'n cymharu â'r polisi heddiw, a fydd ymgyrch 'Gwlad Fawr'

Wales Tourist Board's 'Big Country' campaign, and how does that fit in with other public sector advertising? I have mentioned all those as being important issues. You are drilling down into the wrong area. There is no issue here about transparency. Reducing the size of the quango state means that Ministers are properly responsible for their budget allocations. You have the ability to put questions to us on what we are doing about specific aspects of the branding of tourism—and we have the ability to answer those questions—in fora such as this and in committees. You are surely not interested in the names of individual posts. I do not think that it would be advisable for you to go down that road.

Kirsty Williams: What kind of resources will the new department have to market Welsh tourism products? That is the key question. The way in which the budget is currently structured would suggest that the money that will be available to the new department for marketing is less than the amount highlighted in the Wales Tourist Board's plans for the next few years. Can you clarify how much money will be available specifically for the new super-department to market the tourism product, rather than for all its other functions?

The First Minister: I cannot give you the precise figure now, but I will arrange for Andrew Davies to write to you.

Bwrdd Croeso Cymru'n parhau, a sut y mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â hysbysebion eraill y sector cyhoeddus? Yr wyf wedi cyfeirio at y rhain fel materion pwysig, bob un ohonynt. Yr ydych yn codi ysgyfarnog. Nid oes a wnelo hyn ddim â bod yn dryloyw. Mae lleihau maint y wladwriaeth gwango'n golygu bod Gweinidogion yn gyfrifol am eu dyraniadau cyllideb, a phriodol hynny. Cewch ofyn cwestiynau i ni am yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud ynghylch agweddau penodol ar frandio twristiaeth—ac yr ydym ninnau'n gallu ateb y cwestiynau hynny—mewn fforymau fel hyn ac mewn pwyllgorau. Go brin bod diddordeb gennych yn enwau'r swyddi unigol. Nid wyf yn credu y byddai'n ddoeth ichi ddilyn y trywydd hwnnw.

Kirsty Williams: Pa fath o adnoddau a fydd gan yr adran newydd i farchnata cynhyrchion twristiaeth Cymru? Dyna'r cwestiwn allweddol. Mae'r ffordd y strwythurir y gyllideb ar hyn o bryd yn awgrymu y bydd yr arian a fydd ar gael i'r adran newydd ar gyfer marchnata'n llai na'r swm a nodwyd yng nghynlluniau Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ar gyfer y blynyddoedd nesaf. A allwch egluro faint o arian a fydd ar gael yn benodol ar gyfer yr uwch-adran newydd i farchnata'r cynnyrch twristiaeth, yn hytrach nag ar gyfer ei holl swyddogaethau eraill?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni allaf roi'r union ffigur i chi ar hyn o bryd, ond fe drefnaf i Andrew Davies ysgrifennu atoch.

Cyllid Llywodraeth Leol Funding for Local Government

Q3 Karen Sinclair: Will the First Minister make a statement on Welsh Assembly Government funding for local government? OAQ0999(FM)

The First Minister: The provisional settlement for local government provides for local authorities in Wales to receive, in the next financial year, an increase of 5.1 per cent on the revenue settlement after adjusting for transfers. This amounts to £3.5 billion in unhypothecated funding and £400 million in specific grants.

Karen Sinclair: Since the publication of the

C3 Karen Sinclair: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gyllid Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i lywodraeth leol? OAQ0999(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r setliad dros dro ar gyfer llywodraeth leol yn peri y bydd yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, yn y flwyddyn ariannol nesaf, yn derbyn cynnydd o 5.1 y cant at y setliad refeniw ar ôl addasu ar gyfer trosglwyddiadau. Mae hyn yn golygu cyfanswm o £3.5 biliwn mewn cyllid heb ei neilltuo a £400 miliwn mewn grantiau penodol.

Karen Sinclair: Ers cyhoeddi'r setliad

draft local government settlement, the biggest issue raised in my constituency—in the same way as last year—has been the many people hard hit by rebanding due to the buoyancy, over the years, of the local housing market in north-east Wales. As you know, people on income support, jobseekers' allowance, and low incomes consistently do not claim the support to which they are entitled, but it is pensioners who miss out on the greatest amount. Research shows that four out of 10 older people do not claim help with their annual bills, which is shocking. Whatever the reason for that, what are we actively doing, or thinking of doing, to put in place a mechanism that will ensure, as far as possible, that everyone who qualifies for benefit is encouraged or helped to claim?

The First Minister: You raise one of the great mysteries of our era. There is a huge hue and cry over the way in which people are penalised by council tax rebanding, but we do not manage to get even 50 per cent of those who are eligible for council tax benefits to apply for them. I am told that, as far as council tenant pensioners are concerned, the matter is dealt with fairly well, as they are in regular contact with a body able to give them advice at the same time as collecting rent. However, getting private sector tenants or owner-occupiers to apply is a real problem. We accept that the forms are complicated, but we must make a much bigger effort to help people fill in forms to claim benefits to which they are entitled. That would take a lot of the heat out of the council tax issue, including the rebanding issue.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): One of the savings that local government will have to make next year is the 1 per cent efficiency savings that you announced last year. Can you confirm that this 1 per cent goes right across local authority budgets, including schools' delegated budgets?

llywodraeth leol drafft, y pwnc mwyaf sydd wedi'i godi yn fy etholaeth—yr un fath â'r llynedd—yw nifer y bobl sydd wedi eu bwrw'n galed gan yr ailfandio oherwydd bywiogrwydd y farchnad dai leol yn y gogledd-ddwyrain dros y blynyddoedd. Fel y gwyddoch, yn aml iawn nid yw pobl sy'n derbyn cymhorthdal incwm, lwfans ceiswyr gwaith ac incwm isel yn hawlio'r cymorth y mae ganddynt hawl i'w dderbyn, ond pensiynwyr sydd fwyaf ar eu colled. Dengys ymchwil nad yw pedwar o bob 10 o bobl hŷn yn hawlio cymorth gyda'u biliau blynyddol, ac mae hynny'n peri syndod mawr. Beth bynnag fo'r rheswm dros hynny, beth yn union yr ydym yn ei wneud, neu'n bwriadu ei wneud, i sefydlu mecanwaith a fydd yn sicrhau, cyn belled ag y bo hynny'n bosibl, fod pawb sy'n gymwys i gael budd-dal yn cael eu hannog neu eu helpu i'w hawlio?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi un o ddirgelion mwyaf ein hoes. Ceir wylofain a rhincian dannedd ynghylch y ffordd y cosbir pobl gydag ailfandio'r dreth gyngor, ond nid ydym yn llwyddo i gael hyd yn oed 50 y cant o'r bobl sy'n gymwys i dderbyn budd-daliadau'r dreth gyngor i ymgeisio amdanynt. Dywedir wrthyf, cyn belled ag y mae pensiynwyr sy'n denantiaid cyngor yn bod, fod y mater yn cael ei drin yn weddol, gan eu bod mewn cyswllt rheolaidd â chorff sy'n gallu rhoi cyngor iddynt pan fyddant yn casglu eu rhent. Fodd bynnag, mae cael gan denantiaid sector preifat neu berchenfeddianwyr ymgeisio yn broblem ddybryd. Yr ydym yn derbyn bod y ffurflenni'n astrus, ond rhaid i ni wneud ymdrech lawer mwy sylweddol i helpu pobl i lenwi ffurflenni er mwyn hawlio budd-daliadau y mae ganddynt hawl i'w derbyn. Byddai hynny'n tawelu tipyn ar ddyfroedd storm y dreth gyngor, gan gynnwys mater yr ailfandio.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Un o'r arbedion y bydd rhaid i lywodraeth leol ei wneud y flwyddyn nesaf yw'r arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant a gyhoeddwyd gennych y llynedd. A allwch gadarnhau bod yr 1 y cant hwn yn berthnasol i holl gyllidebau'r awdurdodau lleol, gan gynnwys cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion?

The First Minister: I can confirm everything that I have said previously on this matter. I could put the whole issue in writing and send it to you, or I will make sure that Sue Essex does so.

Michael German: Perhaps I could help you with the correspondence from Assembly officials to local government, which says that the 1 per cent figure applies across the board of local government spend. Given that individual school budgets represent about 40 per cent of local authorities' spend, and if you are not going to apply this saving to schools' delegated budgets, the amount of efficiency savings to be made increases. Do you expect local authorities to make this 1 per cent efficiency saving across the board, thereby including schools' delegated budgets?

The First Minister: I do not have anything to add to my previous answer, save to say that the whole public sector is expected to make an annual efficiency gain of 1 per cent. The efficiency gains of £33 million that are programmed in, and which are the equivalent of 1 per cent of the revenue support grant, will be available to finance the increasing costs of front-line local government services, thereby contributing to the growth in social care and to extra support for teachers in the classroom.

Michael German: It is my understanding that your Government has cut £33 million from the local government revenue support grant settlement in anticipation of the efficiency gains that it will make. If schools' delegated budgets are included in the efficiency gain of 1 per cent, and is not to be taken from the front-line service of schools, it means that the rest of local government will have to make up that saving. That amounts to additional savings of £26 million to £27 million to be made by local authorities. Local authorities have to make the choice. Are you expecting local government to make the 1 per cent saving across the board, thereby including schools' delegated budgets, or are you asking it not to touch those budgets and to find another £26 million to £27 million of savings in other services? That means an

Y Prif Weinidog: Gallaf gadarnhau popeth yr wyf wedi'i ddweud am y mater hwn o'r blaen. Gallwn ysgrifennu popeth a'i anfon atoch, neu gwnaf yn siŵr bod Sue Essex yn gwneud hynny.

Michael German: Efallai y gallwn eich helpu gyda'r ohebiaeth gan swyddogion y Cynulliad at lywodraeth leol, sy'n nodi bod y ffigur o 1 y cant yn berthnasol i wariant llywodraeth leol yn gyffredinol. O gofio bod cyllidebau ysgolion unigol tua 40 y cant o wariant awdurdodau lleol, ac os nad ydych yn mynd i gymhwyso'r arbediad hwn at gyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion, bydd maint yr arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd sydd i'w gwneud yn cynyddu. A ydych yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol sicrhau'r 1 y cant o arbediad effeithlonrwydd yn gyffredinol, gan gynnwys cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion felly?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes gennyf ddim byd arall i'w ychwanegu at fy ateb blaenorol, heblaw dweud bod disgwyl i'r sector cyhoeddus cyfan sicrhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd blynyddol o 1 y cant. Bydd yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd o £33 miliwn sydd wedi'u rhaglennu, ac sy'n cyfateb i 1 y cant o'r grant cynnal refeniw, ar gael i ariannu costau cynyddol gwasanaethau llywodraeth leol rheng flaen gan gyfrannu, felly, at y twf ym maes gofal cymdeithasol ac at ddarparu cymorth ychwanegol i athrawon yn yr ystafell ddosbarth.

Michael German: Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae eich Llywodraeth wedi torri £33 miliwn o'r setliad grant cynnal refeniw i lywodraeth leol wrth ragddisgwyl yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd a wna. Os caiff cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion eu cynnwys yn yr arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant, ac nad yw i fod i gael ei dynnu o wasanaeth rheng flaen ysgolion, golyga hyn y bydd rhaid i weddill y llywodraeth leol ddod o hyd i'r arbedion hynny. Mae hynny'n golygu bod rhaid i awdurdodau lleol wneud arbedion ychwanegol o £26 miliwn i £27 miliwn. Mae'n rhaid i'r awdurdodau lleol wneud y dewis. A ydych yn disgwyl i lywodraeth leol wneud 1 y cant o arbedion yn gyffredinol, gan gynnwys cyllidebau dirprwyedig ysgolion felly, neu a ydych yn gofyn iddynt beidio â chyffwrdd â'r

efficiency rate of about 1.8 per cent.

cyllidebau hynny a dod o hyd i £26 miliwn i £27 miliwn arall o arbedion mewn gwasanaethau eraill? Golyga hynny gyfradd effeithlonrwydd o tua 1.8 y cant.

The First Minister: The allocation of revenue support grant to our unitary authorities takes account of an efficiency gain of 1 per cent on local authorities' expenditure. That is equivalent to £33 million. You cannot exempt local government from the expectation of a 1 per cent efficiency gain this year, which is being applied across the board. I make no apologies for that. I think that a 1 per cent efficiency gain is achievable, both within the public services that we control directly and within those controlled by local government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Wrth ddyrannu grant cynnal refeniw i'n hawdurdodau unedol, rhoddir ystyriaeth i arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant ar wariant yr awdurdodau lleol. Mae hynny'n cyfateb i £33 miliwn. Ni allwch eithrio'r awdurdodau lleol rhag gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant eleni, a hynny'n cael ei roi ar waith yn gyffredinol. Nid ymddiheuraf am hynny. Credaf fod modd gwneud arbedion effeithlonrwydd o 1 y cant, o fewn y gwasanaethau cyhoeddus a reolwn yn uniongyrchol ac o fewn y rhai a reolir gan lywodraeth leol, fel ei gilydd.

Blaenoriaethau Cyllidebol Budgetary Priorities

C4 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau cyllidebol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? OAQ0997(FM)

Q4 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's budgetary priorities? OAQ0997(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel yr amlinellwyd yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar 1 Tachwedd, ein blaenoriaethau amlwg yw iechyd, sicrhau mynediad i driniaeth yn gynt, cryfhau gofal cymdeithasol, adnewyddu addysg blynyddoedd cynnar, a chymryd ein cyfrifoldebau newydd yng nghyd-destun addysg uwch.

The First Minister: As set out in the draft budget on 1 November, our clear priorities include health, ensuring earlier access to treatment, the strengthening of social care, the reform of early years education, and assuming our new responsibilities in relation to higher education.

David Lloyd: Beth yw maint y gagendor hanesyddol rhwng y gwariant ar brifysgolion yng Nghymru a phrifysgolion yn Lloegr?

David Lloyd: What is the size of the historic funding gap between Welsh and English universities?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae astudiaethau yn mynd rhagddynt i weld a oes gwahaniaeth rhwng yr adnoddau a roddir i sector addysg uwch Cymru a'r sector yn Lloegr. Mae hwn yn bwnc cymhleth, fel yr wyf wedi dweud wrth ateb cwestiynau ar brynhawniau Mawrth yn ddiweddar. Pe baech yn ystyried y pwnc ar sail adnoddau y pen, ac felly yn cymharu poblogaethau, mae'r gagendor i'w weld ar ochr Lloegr. Serch hynny, pe baech yn ystyried yr adnoddau fesul myfyriwr, mae'r ffigurau yn awgrymu nad ydym ni'n rhoi'r un faint o adnoddau ag a roddir gan Loegr. Felly, wrth ystyried tegwch y sefyllfa, rhaid gofyn pa un yw'r gymhariaeth yn berthnasol.

The First Minister: Studies aimed at establishing whether there is a difference between the resources given to the higher education sector in Wales and that in England are ongoing. This is a complex subject, as I have said in answer to Tuesday-afternoon questions in recent weeks. If you were to consider the position on a resource-per-capita basis, thereby comparing populations, the gap appears to be on the English side. However, if you were to consider the resources provided per student, the figures suggest that we do not provide as much as in England. Therefore, in assessing the equity of the situation, we must turn to the relevant

Yr ydym yn ceisio gwneud yn siŵr bod y ffigurau cywir gennym wrth gymharu sectorau addysg uwch Cymru a Lloegr.

comparison. We are trying to make sure that we have the right figures when it comes to comparing the higher education sectors in Wales and England.

2.20 p.m.

Peter Black: As education is one of your Government's priorities, I wanted to return to the issue of the effect of efficiency savings on schools. In the current financial year, over half the local authorities in Wales applied the 1 per cent efficiency saving to schools, and many more will do so next year because you are withholding that money from them. Given that the point of the efficiency savings is to allow councils and the Government to be able to reinvest that money in their priorities, would it not be more sensible to allow local authorities to have the £33 million so that they could apply the savings to their priorities and ours, namely better education for the children of Wales?

Peter Black: Gan fod addysg yn un o flaenoriaethau'ch Llywodraeth, yr oeddwn am ddychwelyd at effaith arbedion drwy wella effeithlonrwydd ar ysgolion. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol gyfredol, llwyddodd dros hanner yr awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru i sicrhau'r 1 y cant o arbedion effeithlonrwydd mewn ysgolion, a bydd llawer mwy ohonynt yn gwneud hynny y flwyddyn nesaf am eich bod yn cadw'r arian hwnnw oddi wrthynt. O gofio mai holl bwrpas yr arbedion effeithlonrwydd yw caniatáu i gynghorau a'r Llywodraeth ailfuddsoddi'r arian hwnnw yn y meysydd sy'n flaenoriaeth iddynt, oni fyddai'n ddoethach caniatáu i lywodraeth leol gael y £33 miliwn er mwyn iddynt allu defnyddio'r arbedion yn eu meysydd blaenoriaeth hwy a'n rhai ninnau, sef gwell addysg i blant Cymru?

The First Minister: The whole of the public sector is expected to make 1 per cent efficiency savings. That applies to central departments that we run directly as well as the whole of local government, and we make no apologies for that. I do not think that anyone should be exempt from looking at how they do things to see whether they could do them more efficiently. We expect that to occur at an approximate rate, across the board, of 1 per cent. That is set out, without exemption, for the whole of the public sector in Wales that we fund directly and indirectly, as in the case of local government.

Y Prif Weinidog: Disgwyli'r sector cyhoeddus cyfan sicrhau 1 y cant o arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Mae hynny'n berthnasol i adrannau canolog a redwn yn uniongyrchol yn ogystal â llywodraeth leol yn ei chyfanrwydd, ac nid ymddiheurwn am hynny. Ni chredaf y dylai neb gael ei eithrio rhag gorfod edrych ar sut y maent yn cyflawni pethau er mwyn iddynt weld a allent eu gwneud yn fwy effeithlon. Disgwyliwn i hynny ddigwydd ar gyfradd fras o 1 y cant, yn gyffredinol. Dyna'r sefyllfa, yn ddieithriad, ar gyfer y sector cyhoeddus cyfan yng Nghymru a ariannwn yn uniongyrchol ac yn anuniongyrchol, fel sy'n wir am lywodraeth leol.

The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): It seems as though Welsh Labour Members of Parliament in London do not share the priorities that you have in your budget. Last week, you dismissed the criticisms made by Chris Bryant, the MP for the Rhondda, as criticisms made by someone who had written a mere 'pamphlet', if I remember the wording correctly. I wanted to test you a little more on your response to what Mr Bryant said in that so-called

Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Ymddengys nad yw Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru yn Llundain yn rhannu'r blaenoriaethau sydd gennych yn eich cyllideb. Yr wythnos diwethaf, diystyrasoch y feirniadaeth a wnaed gan Chris Bryant, AS y Rhondda, fel beirniadaeth a wnaed gan rywun a oedd wedi ysgrifennu pwt o 'bamffledyn', os cofiaf y geiriad yn iawn. Yr oeddwn am brofi ychydig bach mwy arnoch ynghylch eich ymateb i'r hyn a

pamphlet. *[Interruption.]* I can see that Labour Members are getting excited already, Presiding Officer, but I am afraid that they will get more excited as I cite passages from the document. *[Interruption.]*

I will refer to the document in my own words, not in those of Brian Gibbons. The document says that

‘Welsh Labour MPs need to have a far greater sense of ownership of their Welsh Assembly Government’.

He is saying that you have not been listening to Welsh Labour MPs. How are you going to address that?

The First Minister: That was rather a vague proposition to ask me to address. If you could put it a bit more precisely, perhaps there would be a question to answer.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Just answer the question.

The First Minister: There is no question.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: This is getting interesting, First Minister. You are not prepared to address the trenchant criticisms of your policies by Welsh Labour MPs. Let me come to specifics and quote to you directly. Welsh Labour AMs might want to read this document, in which Mr Chris Bryant is saying that because of your Labour policies in the Assembly, you may inadvertently be creating more private healthcare in Wales. The reason that he is saying that is perfectly clear: in the first four years of your Assembly Government, more people were going for private healthcare for out-patient treatment than under the previous Conservative Government. Address that complaint, First Minister.

The First Minister: I do not know whether he quoted any evidence; I am not aware of any evidence to support that claim. If you are able to cite the evidence that he has, I would be interested in reading it because I have not seen any such thing. Priorities will not always be the same when you have devolution. As you lead an independence-oriented party, to put it kindly, I guess that, if your party was in

ddywedodd Mr Bryant yn y pamffledyn bondigrybwyll hwnnw. *[Torri ar draws.]* Gallaf weld bod aelodau Llafur yn cyffroi drwyddynt yn barod, Lywydd, ond byddant yn cyffroi mwy wrth i mi ddyfynnu darnau o'r ddogfen. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Cyfeiriaf at y ddogfen yn fy ngeiriau fy hun, nid yng ngeiriau Brian Gibbons. Dywed y ddogfen fod

rhaid i ASau Llafur Cymru gael mwy o ymdeimlad o berchnogi eu Llywodraeth yng Nghynulliad Cymru.

Mae'n dweud nad ydych wedi bod yn gwrandao ar ASau Llafur Cymru. Sut yr ydych yn mynd i ymateb i hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oedd y cynnig hwnnw'n un braidd yn amwys i ofyn imi ymateb iddo. Pe gallech fynegi'r peth ychydig yn fanylach, efallai y ceid cwestiwn i'w ateb.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Atebwch y cwestiwn.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes cwestiwn.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae hyn yn mynd yn ddiddorol, Brif Weinidog. Nid ydych yn barod i ymateb i feirniadaeth lem ar eich polisïau gan ASau Llafur Cymru. Gadewch i mi fanylu a dyfynnu'n uniongyrchol. Efallai y bydd ACau Llafur Cymru am ddarllen y ddogfen hon, lle y mae Mr Chris Bryant yn dweud y gallech, yn anfwriadol, fod yn creu mwy o ofal iechyd preifat yng Nghymru oherwydd eich polisïau Llafur yn y Cynulliad. Mae'n gwbl glir pam mae'n dweud hyn: ym mhedair blynedd cyntaf eich Llywodraeth yn y Cynulliad, yr oedd mwy o bobl yn dewis gofal iechyd preifat ar gyfer triniaethau i gleifion allanol nag a oedd dan law Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr yn flaenorol. Beth am ymateb i'r gŵyn honno, Brif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni wn a ddyfynnodd unrhyw dystiolaeth; nid wyf yn ymwybodol o unrhyw dystiolaeth i gefnogi'r honiad hwnnw. Os ydych yn gallu dyfynnu'r dystiolaeth sydd ganddo, byddai gennyf ddiddordeb mewn darllen hynny am nad wyf wedi gweld dim byd o'r fath. Ni fydd blaenoriaethau yr un fath bob amser mewn sefyllfa lle y ceir datganoli. Gan eich bod yn

power, there would be even bigger differences between Wales and England. I thought that you would be the last person to say, à la Chris Bryant, that all services must be delivered in exactly the same way in Wales as in England. For example, in terms of 24-hour access to primary care, compared with 48 hours in England, we are faster, but of course you do not wish to refer to that, and Chris Bryant probably does not either. Likewise, in terms of waiting lists, we are learning as much as we can, by hiring staff and consultants and so on from successful English health authorities and trusts, about how to bring down our waiting lists, because we do not wish to see people waiting longer in Wales than in England for elective surgery or for out-patient consultations that may lead to elective surgery. That is why we have set out the targets that we have for the end of 2009.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am surprised by that response. You say that he does not quote any figures. Actually, if you look at the Government's website, where statistics are published by the Welsh Assembly Government—though, for some reason, they stop in 2004, maybe because they are too embarrassing now—you will see figures that show that out-patient attendances for private patients in NHS hospitals went up 20 per cent between 1989-99, a period which includes the last years of the Conservative Government, and 2002-03. As Chris Bryant says, because waiting lists in Wales are going up faster than those in England, and coming down at a slower rate than those in England, it means that Welsh patients in the Rhondda—as quoted by Chris Bryant in his document—are going private because they cannot wait 18 months on an out-patient list and then wait another 18 months on an in-patient list. Are you denying your own figures, First Minister?

The First Minister: Those are not the same figures as those which you implied were in existence earlier, or had been quoted by Chris Bryant. You have quoted no figures from

arwain plaid sy'n gogwyddo at annibyniaeth, a dweud yn garedig, yr wyf yn tybio, pe bai eich plaid wrth y llyw, y byddai mwy fyth o wahaniaethau rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Yr oeddwn yn credu mai chi fyddai'r olaf i ddweud, yn yr un modd â Chris Bryant, y dylid darparu'r holl wasanaethau yr un fath yn union yng Nghymru ag y darperir hwy yn Lloegr. Er enghraifft, o ran mynediad 24-awr at ofal sylfaenol, o'i gymharu â 48 awr yn Lloegr, yr ydym yn gyflymach ond, wrth gwrs, nid ydych yn dymuno cyfeirio at hynny, ac nid yw Chris Bryant chwaith yn ôl pob tebyg. Yn yr un modd, o ran y rhestrau aros, yr ydym yn dysgu cymaint ag a allwn, drwy gyflogi staff ac ymgynghorwyr ac yn y blaen o awdurdodau ac ymddiriedolaethau iechyd llwyddiannus yn Lloegr, ynghylch sut i gwtogi ein rhestrau aros, oherwydd nad ydym am weld pobl yn aros yn hwy yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr ar gyfer llawdriniaeth ddewisol neu ar gyfer ymgynghoriad fel claf allanol a allai arwain at lawdriniaeth ddewisol. Dyna pam yr ydym wedi pennu'r targedau sydd gennym ar gyfer diwedd 2009.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr wyf yn synnu at yr ymateb hwnnw. Yr ydych yn dweud nad yw'n dyfynnu ffigurau. Mewn gwirionedd, os edrychwch ar wefan y Llywodraeth, lle y cyhoeddir ystadegau gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru—er eu bod, am ryw reswm, yn dod i ben yn 2004, efallai am eu bod yn codi gormod o gywilydd erbyn hyn—gwelir ffigurau sy'n dangos bod nifer y cleifion allanol a aeth yn gleifion preifat mewn ysbytai'r GIG wedi cynyddu 20 y cant rhwng 1989-99, cyfnod sy'n cynnwys blynyddoedd olaf Llywodraeth y Ceidwadwyr, a 2002-03. Fel y dywed Chris Bryant, oherwydd bod rhestrau aros yng Nghymru yn cynyddu'n gynt na rhestrau Lloegr, a'u bod yn gostwng yn arafach na hwy, golyga fod cleifion Cymru yn y Rhondda—fel y cyfeiriodd Chris Bryant yn ei ddogfen—yn mynd yn breifat am nad ydynt yn gallu aros 18 mis ar restr cleifion allanol ac yna aros am 18 mis ar restr cleifion mewnol. A ydych yn gwadu eich ffigurau eich hun, Brif Weinidog?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yr un ffigurau yw'r rhain â'r rhai yr awgrymasoch eu bod yn bodoli'n gynharach, neu a oedd wedi cael eu dyfynnu gan Chris Bryant. Nid ydych wedi

Chris Bryant that indicate a greater rise than in England in the use of private out-patient treatment. Furthermore, we have seen a huge improvement in the length of time that people spend on the waiting lists for out-patient treatments. The number of people waiting more than 12 months for out-patient consultations has come down sharply in the past 12 months. Likewise, the number of people waiting for in-patient and day-case treatment is now the lowest that it has been since September 1996.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Is it not the case that you are finding that Chris Bryant is not isolated in this matter, but that you are constantly being attacked by Welsh Labour MPs for failing to deliver on health and education? For some reason, you will not engage in that debate. You say that this is a pamphlet, but Welsh Labour MPs are telling you that you have got it wrong on health and education. Is it not also the case that all these Welsh Labour MPs want you to toe the Labour line? Is it not true that they are the boss, and you will have to listen to them?

The First Minister: I do not think that you can put those two propositions together. You are either saying that they are the boss and I have to do what they say, or you are saying that I am resolutely refusing to do what they say. Which way do you want it? You cannot put both of those propositions forward. It is quite clear that services such as health and education, with tiny exceptions, are devolved, and have been so for six and a half years. Throughout the United Kingdom, there is now deviation of policy priorities on health and education as between the four dispensations of Wales, Scotland, England and, to a lesser extent, Northern Ireland. In some areas, we are in the lead. In other areas, England is in the lead, while in yet other areas, Scotland is in the lead, and Northern Ireland is too, probably, although I am less familiar with it. Everyone has to learn from everyone else. As Bill Clinton used to say of the USA, you have 50 living laboratories, and every governor of every state borrows the best ideas from the others. On the matter of

dyfynnu'r un ffigur gan Chris Bryant sy'n dangos cynnydd mwy nag a welir yn Lloegr yn y defnydd a wneir o driniaeth breifat ar gyfer cleifion allanol. Hefyd, yr ydym wedi gweld gwelliant mawr o ran yr amser a dreulia pobl ar restrau aros ar gyfer triniaethau cleifion allanol. Mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros mwy na 12 mis am ymgynghoriadau cleifion allanol wedi gostwng yn sylweddol yn y 12 mis diwethaf. Yn yr un modd, mae nifer y bobl sy'n aros am driniaeth fel claf mewnol a thriniaeth fel claf allanol bellach ar ei isaf ers mis Medi 1996.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Onid yw'n wir nad Chris Bryant yn unig sy'n codi'r materion hyn, ond eich bod yn gyson yn wynebu ymosodiadau o du ASau Llafur Cymru am fethu â chyflawni ym maes iechyd ac addysg? Am ryw reswm, nid ydych yn fodlon cymryd rhan yn y ddadl honno. Yr ydych yn dweud mai pamffled yw hwn, ond dywed ASau Llafur Cymru wrthy ch eich bod ar y trywydd anghywir o ran iechyd ac addysg. Onid yw'n wir hefyd fod yr holl ASau Llafur hyn o Gymru'n dymuno eich gweld yn cydymffurfio â safbwynt Llafur? Onid yw'n wir mai hwy yw'r meistr ac y bydd rhaid i chi wrando arnynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu y gallwch roi'r ddau osodiad hynny gyda'i gilydd. Naill ai yr ydych yn dweud mai hwy yw'r meistr a bod rhaid i mi wneud yr hyn y maent hwy'n ei ddweud, neu yr ydych yn dweud fy mod yn gwrthod yn llwyr wneud yr hyn y maent yn ei ddweud. Pa un yw i fod? Ni allwch gynnig y ddau osodiad. Mae'n gwbl glir bod gwasanaethau megis iechyd ac addysg, gyda mân eithriadau, wedi'u datganoli, ac wedi bod felly ers chwe blynedd a hanner. Ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, gwelir, erbyn hyn, wyro oddi wrth flaenoriaethau polisi ar iechyd ac addysg rhwng Cymru, yr Alban, Lloegr, ac i raddau llai, Gogledd Iwerddon. Mewn rhai meysydd, ni sydd ar y blaen. Mewn meysydd eraill, Lloegr sydd ar y blaen, ond mewn meysydd eraill eto, yr Alban sydd ar y blaen, a Gogledd Iwerddon hefyd, mae'n siŵr, er nad wyf mor gyfarwydd â hynny. Mae'n rhaid i bawb ddysgu oddi wrth bawb arall. Fel yr arferai Bill Clinton ddweud am yr UDA, mae gennych 50 labordy byw, ac mae pob

waiting lists, is it the case that we are borrowing, or are we too proud to borrow from English waiting-list elective-surgery success? Certainly not, which is why we have hired a lot of staff from England to run our second-offer scheme, and that is why that is a great success story that is bringing waiting lists down sharply.

llywodraethwr ym mhob talaith yn benthyca'r syniadau gorau gan y lleill. O ran y rhestrau aros, a yw'n wir ein bod yn benthyca, neu a ydym yn rhy falch i fenthyca syniadau yn sgîl llwyddiant rhestrau aros Lloegr ar gyfer triniaeth ddewisol? Nac ydym yn wir, a dyna paham yr ydym wedi cyflogi llawer o staff o Loegr i redeg ein cynllun ail gynnig, a dyna paham mae'n stori wych o lwyddiant sy'n peri bod rhestrau aros yn gostwng yn sylweddol.

Datblygiadau Tai Cymdeithasol yn Sir y Fflint Social Housing Developments in Flintshire

Q5 Sandy Mewies: Will the First Minister make a statement on social housing developments in Flintshire? OAQ0993(FM)

C5 Sandy Mewies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiadau tai cymdeithasol yn sir y Fflint? OAQ0993(FM)

The First Minister: Flintshire received a social housing grant of £3.2 million in this financial year for social housing developments, and has bid for over £3.4 million against the indicative budget for each of the next two years.

Y Prif Weinidog: Derbyniodd Sir y Fflint grant tai cymdeithasol o £3.2 miliwn yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon ar gyfer datblygiadau tai cymdeithasol, ac mae wedi gwneud cais am dros £3.4 miliwn yn erbyn y gyllideb ddangosol ar gyfer pob un o'r ddwy flynedd nesaf.

Sandy Mewies: The Assembly's new homelessness strategy recognises the breadth of homelessness throughout Wales, and has come up with many ways of addressing it. One way is a new unit for single homeless people, the opening of which I attended recently, which is run by Clwyd Alyn Housing Association and well supported by Flintshire County Council. I was able to talk to some of the single homeless young adults who live there, and they were proud of having turned their lives around, and proud of having had the opportunity to do so. Will you join me in congratulating those responsible for setting up this new unit, which helps young people to develop the skills that they will need for the future? Could you also assure me that the Welsh Assembly Government will continue to take this sort of initiative to address these problems throughout Wales?

Sandy Mewies: Mae strategaeth ddigartrefedd newydd y Cynulliad yn cydnabod mor eang yw digartrefedd ledled Cymru, ac wedi cyflwyno sawl ffordd o fynd i'r afael â hyn. Un o'r ffyrdd hyn yw sefydlu uned newydd ar gyfer pobl sengl ddigartref. Yr oeddwn yn bresennol pan agorwyd uned yn ddiweddar, a gaiff ei rhedeg gan Gymdeithas Dai Clwyd Alyn ac a gefnogir yn dda gan Gyngor Sir y Fflint. Cefais gyfle i siarad â rhai o'r oedolion ifanc, sengl a digartref sy'n byw yno, ac yr oeddent yn falch eu bod wedi gwednewid eu bywydau ac yn falch eu bod wedi cael cyfle i wneud hynny. A wnewch ymuno â mi i longyfarch y rhai sy'n gyfrifol am sefydlu'r uned newydd hon, sy'n helpu pobl ifanc i ddatblygu'r sgiliau y bydd eu hangen arnynt yn y dyfodol? A allech roi sicrwydd i mi hefyd y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n parhau i fwrw ymlaen â mentrau tebyg er mwyn rhoi sylw i'r problemau hyn ledled Cymru?

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: I agree with you that an essential part of our function as Assembly Members, whether we are Ministers or

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn cytuno â chi mai rhan allweddol o'n swyddogaeth fel Aelodau o'r Cynulliad, boed ni'n

backbench Members, is to go around key projects of this kind and to talk to those who are experiencing problems, and discuss the turn-around from those problems and addressing them. In terms of what we can do, running these projects relies on very good leadership at a local level, which is not always the easiest thing to do, and then we provide the budget. There has been an 800 per cent increase in the homelessness grant that we have distributed since 1998, and it was distributed to 102 projects across Wales last year, including, I presume, the project that you visited.

Weinidogion neu'n Aelodau o'r meinciau cefn, yw mynd o gwmpas prosiectau allweddol o'r math hwn a siarad â'r rhai sy'n cael problemau, a thrafod ffyrdd o ddatrys y problemau hynny a mynd i'r afael â hwy. O ran yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud, mae rhedeg y prosiectau hyn yn dibynnu ar arweiniad da iawn ar lefel leol, ac nid yw hynny'n beth hawdd ei wneud bob amser, ac yna byddwn yn darparu'r gyllideb. Cafwyd cynnydd o 800 y cant yn y grant digartrefedd a ddosbarthwyd gennym ers 1998, ac fe'i dosbarthwyd i 102 o brosiectau ledled Cymru y llynedd, gan gynnwys, fe dybiaf, y prosiect y buoch yn ymweld ag ef.

Mynediad at Wasanaethau'r GIG Access to NHS Services

C6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Beth yw blaenoriaethau'r Prif Weinidog ar gyfer gwella mynediad at wasanaethau'r GIG? OAQ0990(FM)

Q6 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What are the First Minister's priorities for improving access to NHS services? OAQ0990(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ein hymrwymiad i ddarparu mynediad i'r gwasanaeth gofal iechyd sylfaenol o fewn 24 awr wedi ei gyflawni mewn 93 y cant o feddygfeydd meddygon teulu. Mae'r rhestr aros cleifion mewnol ac achosion undydd â'r cyfanswm isaf ers mis Medi 1996.

The First Minister: Our commitment to providing access to the primary healthcare service within 24 hours has been achieved in 93 per cent of general practitioner surgeries. The waiting lists for in-patients and day cases are at their lowest level since September 1996.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Yr ydych yn dweud bod sicrhau mynediad i wasanaethau gofal iechyd sylfaenol o fewn 24 awr yn flaenoriaeth. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud ynghylch ehangu'r ystod o wasanaethau yn y sector sylfaenol? Yn Lloegr, mae canolfannau galw mewn a arweinir gan nyrsys, ac mae sôn am ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn cael eu cyflwyno gan fferyllwyr. Nid oes un o'r gwasanaethau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno yng Nghymru. A ydych yn bwriadu datblygu gwasanaethau unigol neu a ydych yn ystyried gwasanaethau cyfansawdd, lle cyflwynir gwasanaethau gan feddygon, nyrsys, fferylllyddion a therapyddion yn yr un ganolfan? Pam mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd yn Lloegr, ac nad oes dim i'w weld yn digwydd yng Nghymru?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You say that ensuring access to primary healthcare services within 24 hours is a priority. What are you doing to extend the range of services in the primary sector? In England, there are walk-in centres led by nurses, and there is talk of services being delivered by pharmacists. None of these services are being introduced in Wales. Do you intend to develop individual services or are you considering the introduction of composite services, whereby services are delivered by doctors, nurses, pharmacists and therapists in the same centre? Why is it that these developments are happening in England, and nothing seems to be happening in Wales?

Y Prif Weinidog: A ydych wedi bod yn darllen llyfr Chris Bryant hefyd, Rhodri Glyn? Mae fel pe bai rhyw seicoleg yn dod mewn i'r chwarae hwn, lle mae popeth yn

The First Minister: Have you been reading Chris Bryant's book as well, Rhodri Glyn? It is as if some psychology comes into this game, whereby everything has to be better,

gorfod bod yn well ar yr ochr arall, a'r borfa yn frasach ar yr ochr arall i'r bryn. Yr ydym yn gosod y safon yng Nghymru o ran rhoi addewid o fynediad o fewn 24 awr. Yn Lloegr, mae'r amser aros yn ddwywaith cymaint, sef 48 awr. Felly, mae hynny'n well nag ydyw yn Lloegr. Efallai eu bod wedi dysgu symiau yn wahanol yn eich ysgol chi i leoedd eraill yn y byd, Rhodri Glyn, ond mae hynny yn golygu bod eich gosodiad bod pethau'n waeth yng Nghymru yn gwbl anghywir, gan fod safon Lloegr ddwywaith ein safon ni o ran yr addewid ar yr amser a gymerir i weld aelod o'r tîm gofal sylfaenol.

Christine Chapman: The health policies of the Assembly Government have rightly placed the service user at centre stage, and have encouraged people to be more involved and take more responsibility for their health. One condition for which it is crucial that people receive information to manage their condition is diabetes. Empowering sufferers to take personal control over their diabetes was a key aim of the national service framework for diabetes in Wales. What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to ensure that the delivery of structured education for patients, their families and carers is achieved? The evidence suggests that it is not reaching everyone with diabetes across Wales.

The First Minister: You raise an important point about the participation of the intelligent patient in managing conditions. Diabetes is the outstanding example because it is not, by and large, a life-threatening condition, although people do die from it. In a way, diabetes has been joined by many other long-term conditions in that regard. People might in the past have responded that a cancer patient will not be with us for very long, so why involve them in their own care? However, cancer patients can now survive for 30, 40 or 50 years and therefore they now also come into the intelligent patient category. Many other conditions that used to be considered so acute that it was not worth trying to involve the patient are now considered to be on the margin between acute and chronic conditions. Diabetics have much longer experience of doing this, and they should participate fully in improving their own care, and in telling the medical

and the grass greener, on the other side. We have set the standard in Wales in terms of promising access within 24 hours. In England, the waiting time is twice as long, at 48 hours. That is better than it is in England. Perhaps they taught sums differently in your school than in other parts of the world, Rhodri Glyn, but that means that your claim that things are worse in Wales is completely wrong, because England's standard is twice ours in terms of the promise made on the time taken to see a member of the primary care team.

Christine Chapman: Mae'n gwbl iawn bod polisïau iechyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi rhoi'r defnyddiwr ar ganol y llwyfan, ac wedi annog pobl i gymryd rhan amlycach ac i dderbyn mwy o gyfrifoldeb dros eu hiechyd. Un cyflwr lle y mae'n hanfodol i bobl gael gwybodaeth i reoli eu cyflwr yw diabetes. Yr oedd grymuso dioddefwyr i gymryd rheolaeth bersonol dros eu diabetes yn un o nodau allweddol y fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer diabetes yng Nghymru. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud i sicrhau bod addysg strwythuredig yn cael ei darparu ar gyfer cleifion, eu teuluoedd a'u gofalwyr? Mae'r dystiolaeth yn awgrymu nad yw ar gael i bawb sydd â diabetes ym mhob rhan o Gymru.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn codi pwynt pwysig ynglŷn â chyfraniad y claf deallus wrth reoli cyflyrau. Mae diabetes yn enghraifft arbennig oherwydd nad ydyw, at ei gilydd, yn gyflwr sy'n peryglu bywyd, er bod pobl yn marw o ganlyniad iddo. Mewn ffordd, mae llawer o gyflyrau hirdymor eraill wedi mynd yr un fath â diabetes yn hynny o beth. Yn y gorffennol, efallai y byddai pobl wedi dweud na fyddai claf â chanser gyda ni am amser hir iawn, felly pam eu hannog i gyfrannu at eu gofal eu hunain? Fodd bynnag, erbyn hyn gall cleifion â chanser fyw am 30, 40 neu 50 mlynedd ac felly maent hwythau hefyd yn dod o fewn y categori cleifion deallus. Mae llawer o gyflyrau eraill yr arferid eu hystyried yn rhai mor ddifrifol fel nad oedd yn werth ceisio cynnwys y claf bellach yn cael eu hystyried yn gyflyrau sydd ar y ffin rhwng cyflyrau aciwt a chronig. Mae gan bobl â diabetes brofiad llawer hwy o wneud hyn, a dylent gyfranogi'n llawn yn y

profession where it needs to improve, because they will know, as they are at the sharp end.

gwaith o wella eu gofal eu hunain, a dweud wrth y proffesiwn meddygol ble y mae angen iddo wella, oherwydd hwy sy'n gwybod, gan mai hwy sydd â phrofiad uniongyrchol o fyw gyda'r cyflwr.

Economi Cymru The Welsh Economy

Q7 Alun Cairns: Will the First Minister make a statement on how much the Welsh economy will have to grow in order to achieve 90 per cent of UK GDP by 2010? OAQ0983(FM)

C7 Alun Cairns: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch faint y bydd rhaid i economi Cymru dyfu er mwyn cyrraedd 90 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y DU erbyn 2010? OAQ0983 (FM)

The First Minister: There is no immediate answer to that because it would depend on the rate of growth in the UK economy, as any serious inquiry would have recognised at the outset.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes modd rhoi ateb pendant i'r cwestiwn gan y byddai'n dibynnu ar gyfradd twf economi'r DU, fel y byddai unrhyw ymholiad difrifol wedi cydnabod o'r dechrau.

Alun Cairns: I can accept that in one way, but the reality is that, based on historic records, it would need to grow by close to 5 per cent when, at best, we are nudging the 2 per cent mark. It would have to grow twice as fast as it is growing at the moment in order to achieve the First Minister's target of 90 per cent by 2010. This is an opportune question because, tomorrow, the Welsh Assembly Government will launch its WAVE document, 'Wales: A Vibrant Economy'. Will you confirm that that will include the target of achieving 90 per cent of average UK gross domestic product or UK gross value added by 2010, as you said in the Chamber a long time ago? I have read the record of that many times.

Alun Cairns: Gallaf dderbyn hynny mewn un ffordd, ond y gwir yw, yn seiliedig ar gofnodion hanesyddol, y byddai angen iddi dyfu ar gyfradd o bron 5 y cant a ninnau, ar y gorau, bron â chyrraedd 2 y cant. Byddai'n rhaid iddi dyfu ddwywaith yn gyflymach nag y mae'n tyfu ar hyn o bryd er mwyn cyflawni targed y Prif Weinidog o 90 y cant erbyn 2010. Mae hwn yn gwestiwn amserol oherwydd, yfory, bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n lansio ei dogfen 'Cymru: Economi yn Ffynnu'. A wnewch gadarnhau y bydd yn cynnwys y targed o gyrraedd 90 y cant o gynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth cyfartalog y DU neu werth ychwanegol crynswth y DU erbyn 2010, fel y dywedasoeh yn y Siambr amser maith yn ôl? Yr wyf wedi darllen y cofnod hwnnw nifer o weithiau.

The First Minister: I deprecate the practice of reading halfway through someone's sentences and then stopping and changing the meaning, if you are referring to your previous efforts in this area, Alun. That is a thoroughly reprehensible practice.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn anghymeradwyo'r arfer o ddarllen hanner ffordd drwy frawddegau rhywun ac yna aros a newid yr ystyr, os ydych yn cyfeirio at eich ymdrechion blaenorol yn y maes hwn, Alun. Mae hynny'n arfer gwrthun.

It never was a target, it was a goal or an aim, and I cannot confirm what will be in tomorrow's document any more than I could in replying to your previous effort, when you asked me, or Andrew Davies, to confirm that that target would not be included. Now you want us to confirm the opposite of what you asked us to confirm before, so you are getting

Ni fu erioed yn darged, amcan neu nod ydoedd, ac ni allaf gadarnhau beth fydd yn y ddogfen yfory mwy nag y gallwn wrth ymateb i'ch ymdrech flaenorol, pan ofynasoch i mi, neu i Andrew Davies, gadarnhau na fyddai'r targed hwnnw'n cael ei gynnwys. Yn awr yr ydych am inni gadarnhau'r gwrthwyneb i'r hyn y

into a terrible tangle over this. The key issue is how we are doing on the key measures and, as of last week's figures, employment is up 10 per cent, from 1,219,000, I think, to 1,338,000, since the Assembly came into being. That is the highest rate of increase in any part of the 12 constituent regions or countries of the United Kingdom. Unemployment in Wales is down at well over double the rate at which it has come down in the United Kingdom, and we are the only part of the UK where private sector growth exceeds public sector growth and, as I say, jobs are at an all-time record.

Elin Jones: Mae'n amlwg o'r ateb hwnnw, eich bod yn bwriadu gollwng y targed o 90 y cant o'ch strategaeth economaidd newydd. Nid yw'n bosibl ichi gydag unrhyw hygredd wadu nad oedd hynny yn darged, o'r hyn yr ydych wedi'i ddweud yn y Siambr yn y gorffennol. A ydych yn bwriadu, felly, pan ydych yn cyhoeddi eich strategaeth newydd yfory, ollwng pob targed economaidd yr ydych yn methu eu cyrraedd, er enghraifft honno ar y nifer a'r stoc o fusnesau, sydd i lawr i 91 y cant o gyfartaledd Prydeinig o 93 y cant ohono? A ydych yn bwriadu gollwng pob targed dim ond oherwydd eich bod methu eu cyrraedd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Anghywir, anghywir, anghywir—dyna i gyd y gallaf ei ddweud. Bwriad yn hytrach na tharged oedd y codiad yng nghynnyrch mewnwladol crynswth y pen o'i gymharu gyda gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae'n glir ein bod wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben o ran codi'r cyfanswm o swyddi a dod â diweithdra i lawr ac o ran y codiad enfawr mewn allforion o Gymru.

O ran yr hyn fydd yn ail fersiwn y strategaeth economaidd, fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi yfory, mae arnaf ofn eich bod yn gorfod bod yn amyneddgar ac aros tan yfory.

gofynasoch chi inni ei gadarnhau o'r blaen, felly yr ydych yn drysu'n lân ynglŷn â'r mater hwn. Y peth pwysig yw sut yr ydym yn llwyddo o ran y mesurau allweddol ac, yn ôl y ffigurau yr wythnos diwethaf, mae cyflogaeth wedi cynyddu 10 y cant, o 1,219,000, fe gredaf, i 1,338,000, ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. Dyna'r gyfradd uchaf o ran cynnydd mewn unrhyw ran o'r 12 rhanbarth neu wlad sy'n perthyn i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Mae cyfradd y gostyngiad mewn diweithdra yng Nghymru gymaint ddwywaith â'r hyn a gafwyd yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a ni yw'r unig ran o'r DU lle y mae twf y sector preifat yn fwy na thwf y sector cyhoeddus ac, fel y dywedais, mae nifer y swyddi'n uwch nag erioed.

Elin Jones: It is clear from that answer that you intend to drop the target of 90 per cent from your new economic development strategy. You cannot with any credibility deny that that was a target, given what you have said in the Chamber in the past. Do you intend, therefore, when you announce your new strategy tomorrow, to drop all of the economic targets that you cannot meet, for example that on the number and stock of businesses, which is down to 91 per cent of the British average from 93 per cent of it? Are you going to drop every target just because you cannot meet them?

The First Minister: Wrong, wrong, wrong—that is all that I can say. The increase in gross domestic product per head compared to the rest of the United Kingdom was an aim rather than a target. It is clear that we have been extremely successful in increasing the number of jobs and bringing down unemployment and in terms of the substantial increase in exports from Wales.

In terms of what will be included in the second version of the economic strategy, which will be published tomorrow, I am afraid that you will have to be patient and wait until tomorrow.

Amserau Aros Ysbytai Hospital Waiting Times

Q8 Jonathan Morgan: Is it the aim of the Welsh Assembly Government to match

C8 Jonathan Morgan: Ai nod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yw cael yr un amserau aros

hospital waiting times in England?
 OAQ1009(FM)

The First Minister: That is broadly correct, but, for obvious statistical reasons, we cannot be 100 per cent precise about it because Wales and England data on this subject are collected in a different way. In England, it is only general practitioner referrals for out-patient consultations that are included whereas, in Wales, we include all referrals.

Jonathan Morgan: I hope that we will aim to match these targets because we know that, in Wales, you have set a target that, by 2009, patients will not wait longer than some 26 weeks, but, of course, in England, the target is somewhat different: by 2008, patients will wait no longer than 18 weeks for treatment. So there is still a marked difference, and patients throughout Wales want to know why they are being discriminated against and when the Assembly Government will commit to matching the target that we face in England and provide that comparable system, which is not there at the moment.

The First Minister: I do not agree. It is simply that, since Ian Grist's time as the Minister with responsibility for health, back in the late 1980s, we have not had consistency in the statistical treatment of how in-patient and out-patient data is collected in Wales and England. The biggest difference, insofar as it affects this particular area of treatment targets, is that, as I mentioned, only GP referrals are in the English data and it is only to GP referrals that the 18-week target will apply. In Wales, we are setting a much bigger target in that we include all referrals. It is my understanding that that increases the number of referrals by some 50 per cent for out-patient consultations. If you balance out that factor with the longer weeks and the fact that we are a year later, we believe that there is approximate parity. There is no question at all of there being any discrimination against Welsh patients.

ar gyfer ysbytai ag sydd yn Lloegr?
 OAQ1009(FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny fwy neu lai'n gywir, ond, am resymau ystadegol amlwg, ni allwn fod yn hollol fanwl gywir yn ei gylch gan fod data Cymru a Lloegr ar y pwnc hwn yn cael eu casglu mewn ffordd wahanol. Yn Lloegr, dim ond atgyfeiriadau meddygon teulu ar gyfer ymgynghoriadau cleifion allanol sy'n cael eu cynnwys tra ydym ni, yng Nghymru, yn cynnwys pob atgyfeiriad.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddwn yn ymdrechu i gyrraedd y targedau hyn oherwydd gwyddom ein bod, yng Nghymru, wedi pennu targed sy'n golygu na fydd cleifion, erbyn 2009, yn gorfod aros mwy na 26 wythnos, ond, wrth gwrs, yn Lloegr, mae'r targed ychydig yn wahanol: erbyn 2008, ni fydd cleifion yn aros mwy na 18 wythnos am driniaeth. Felly mae gwahaniaeth amlwg o hyd, ac mae cleifion ledled Cymru am gael gwybod pam maent yn dioddef gwahaniaethu a pha bryd y bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ymrwymo i gyrraedd yr un targed ag yr ydym yn ei wynebu yn Lloegr a darparu system debyg i honno, nad yw'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn cytuno. Y gwir yw nad ydym wedi cael, ers dyddiau Ian Grist fel Gweinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros iechyd, yn niwedd yr 1980au, dim cysondeb o ran y driniaeth ystadegol o'r modd y cesglir data am gleifion mewnol a chleifion allanol yng Nghymru a Lloegr. Y gwahaniaeth mwyaf, i'r graddau y mae'n effeithio ar y maes penodol hwn o dargedau triniaethau, yw, fel y dywedais, mai dim ond atgyfeiriadau meddygon teulu sydd wedi eu cynnwys yn nata Lloegr a bydd y targed o 18 wythnos yn cyfeirio at atgyfeiriadau meddygon teulu yn unig. Yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn pennu targed llawer mwy gan y byddwn yn cynnwys pob atgyfeiriad. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf bydd hynny'n golygu cynnydd o tua 50 y cant yn nifer yr atgyfeiriadau ar gyfer ymgynghoriadau cleifion allanol. Wrth gydbwysu'r ffactor hwnnw gyda'r wythnosau hwy a'r ffaith ein bod flwyddyn ar ei hôl hi, credwn ein bod yn weddol agos ati. Nid oes dim sail i'r honiadau bod gwahaniaethu yn erbyn cleifion Cymru.

2.40 p.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): The First Minister claimed earlier that there had been outstanding success in terms of the waiting list position; I think that I quote him accurately. I found this claim extraordinary in light of the fact that it has increased resolutely under your stewardship, and is only now showing signs of nudging downwards. It went up massively on your watch; that is the truth. We have heard before the excuse about the statistics being collected differently previously—the stuffing-them-in-drawers syndrome that you once referred to, which, again, was extraordinary. Chris Bryant, who represents one of the poorest parts of Wales, has recently claimed that people are being forced to go private, which the statistics bares out, and you did not satisfactorily deal with that. We also know now that we are facing cut-backs in rural Wales, with the threatened withdrawal of services in hospitals in mid and west Wales, such as Tregaron, Cardigan, Withybush, Bronllys and Builth Wells. How can you claim this to be a great success story? When can we expect the same level of treatment for patients in Wales as in England?

The First Minister: The total number of patients on the in-patient day-case waiting list is 64,459. That is the lowest that it has been since September 1996. Likewise, the number of patients recorded as waiting over 12 months for out-patient appointments is at its lowest since April 2000. I accept that it did increase, but I do not accept that there was anything to be criticised. You have never tried to pursue this with me. You have never written to me or anyone else about it. You just make an assertion that there is something wrong about the claim that I have made about the way in which out-patient figures have only recently been collected efficiently and consistently. You have never tested that proposition. You just make this glib assertion that in some way people do not agree with it. If you do not agree with it, why do you not ask questions about it? I find it odd that you would much rather rely on the airy-fairy

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Honnodd y Prif Weinidog yn gynharach ein bod wedi gweld llwyddiant eithriadol o ran sefyllfa rhestrau aros; credaf fy mod yn ei ddyfynnu'n gywir. Yr wyf o'r farn bod yr honiad hwn yn un hynod ac ystyried y ffaith eu bod wedi cynyddu'n ddiamheuol o dan eich gofal chi, a dim ond yn awr y maent yn dangos arwyddion eu bod yn dechrau gostwng. Bu cynnydd anferthol yn ystod eich gofal chi: dyna'r gwir amdani. Yr ydym wedi clywed yr esgus bod yr ystadegau'n cael eu casglu mewn ffordd wahanol o'r blaen—y syndrom o'u cuddio yn y drôr y cyfeiriasoch ato unwaith, a oedd, unwaith eto, yn hynod iawn. Yn ddiweddar honnodd Chris Bryant, sy'n cynrychioli un o'r rhannau tlotaf o Gymru, fod pobl yn cael eu gorfodi i fynd yn breifat, rhywbeth sy'n cael ei amlygu yn yr ystadegau, ac ni wnaethoch ddelio'n foddhaol â hynny. Gwyddom hefyd bellach ein bod yn wynebu toriadau yn y Gymru wledig, gyda bygythiad i ddiddymu gwasanaethau mewn ysbytai yn y canolbarth a'r gorllewin, megis Tregaron, Aberteifi, Llwyn Helyg, Bronllys a Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Sut y gallwch honni bod hyn yn llwyddiant mawr? Pa bryd y gallwn ddisgwyl yr un lefel o driniaeth i gleifion yng Nghymru ag sydd yn Lloegr?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae cyfanswm nifer y cleifion ar restr aros cleifion allanol a chleifion mewnol yn 64,459. Dyma'r isaf y mae wedi bod ers Medi 1996. Yn yr un modd, mae nifer y cleifion, yn ôl yr hyn sydd wedi'i gofnodi, sy'n aros dros 12 mis am apwyntiadau fel cleifion allanol yn is nag a fu ers Ebrill 2000. Derbyniaf ei fod wedi cynyddu, ond ni dderbyniaf fod rheswm dros feirniadu. Nid ydych erioed wedi ceisio codi hyn gyda mi. Nid ydych erioed wedi ysgrifennu ataf nac at neb arall yn ei gylch. Yr ydych yn ensynio bod rhywbeth yn bod ar yr honiad yr wyf wedi ei wneud ynglŷn â'r ffaith mai dim ond yn ddiweddar y mae ffigurau cleifion allanol wedi cael eu casglu'n effeithlon a chyson. Nid ydych erioed wedi profi'r gosodiad hwnnw. Y cwbl yr ydych yn ei wneud yw gwneud yr honiad parod hwn nad yw pobl yn cytuno ag ef mewn rhyw fodd. Os nad ydych yn cytuno ag ef, pam nad

claim that there was something wrong about me making this claim. I am sorry, but that is the advice that I have received, and that is the advice that I give to the people of Wales, and to you when you ask questions. You have never taken the matter further, and now you make this airy-fairy claim that no-one else agrees with it. Sorry, Nick, but if you want to disagree with it, you have to put that in writing and ask for it.

Nick Bourne: First, I ask you to publish the advice. Let us test it. I thought that this was such an extraordinary claim that I did not think that you believed that it was serious. It is only recently that you have made this extraordinary claim that the figures were collected differently—you have not done it year-in year-out. Publish the advice, and give us the opportunity to question you on it, and I will gladly do so.

You suggested that I do not write to you on this issue: I could present you with a bundle of cases that I have written to you about in terms of the waiting list position. I hope that you will withdraw that particular extraordinary claim. If you publish the advice, I will certainly come back to you with some questions on that. We have never seen that advice.

I wish to come back to the point about the waiting list figures increasing. The in-patient and out-patient figures combined have increased every month for the past six months, so the suggestion that the position is improving and that we all face this wonderful world with blue skies and fluffy white clouds is not borne out in practice. We know from our postbags, as do Labour Members of Parliament such as Chris Bryant in the Rhondda, that the position is far from ideal and is worse than it is in England. I will repeat the clear question that I asked: what are you doing to ensure that we are in at least as good a position as England? We are well behind England and it has happened on your

ydych yn gofyn cwestiynau amdano? Mae'n ymddangos yn rhyfedd i mi ei bod yn llawer gwell gennyh ddbynnu ar yr honiad disylwedd bod rhywbeth o'i le ynghylch y ffaith fy mod yn gwneud yr honiad hwn. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ond dyna'r cyngor a gefais, a dyna'r cyngor yr wyf yn ei roi i bobl Cymru, ac i chithau pan fyddwch yn gofyn cwestiynau. Nid ydych erioed wedi mynd â'r mater ymhellach, ac yr ydych yn awr yn gwneud yr honiad disylwedd hwn nad oes neb arall yn cytuno ag ef. Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Nick, ond os ydych yn anghytuno ag ef, rhaid i chi roi hynny ar bapur a gofyn amdano.

Nick Bourne: Yn gyntaf, gofynnaf i chi gyhoeddi'r cyngor. Gadewch inni ei brofi. Yr oeddwn yn credu bod hwn yn honiad mor hynod fel nad oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod yn credu ei fod o ddifrif. Dim ond yn ddiweddar yr ydych wedi gwneud yr honiad hynod hwn bod y ffigurau'n cael eu casglu mewn ffordd wahanol—nid ydych wedi'i wneud flwyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn. Cyhoeddwch y cyngor, a rhowch gyfle inni eich holi yn ei gylch, a byddaf yn falch o gael gwneud hynny.

Awgrymasoch nad wyf yn ysgrifennu atoch ynglŷn â'r mater hwn: gallwn gyflwyno pentwr o achosion i chi yr wyf wedi ysgrifennu atoch yn eu cylch ynglŷn â rhestrau aros. Gobeithiaf y gwnewch dynnu'r honiad hynod hwn yn ôl. Os cyhoeddwch y cyngor, byddaf yn siŵr o ddod yn ôl atoch gyda chwestiynau am hynny. Nid ydym wedi gweld y cyngor hwnnw erioed.

Hoffwn ddychwelyd at y pwynt ynglŷn â'r cynnydd yn ffigurau'r rhestrau aros. Mae'r ffigurau ar gyfer cleifion mewnol a chleifion allanol gyda'i gilydd wedi cynyddu bob mis dros y chwe mis diwethaf, felly nid oes sail mewn gwirionedd i'r awgrym bod y sefyllfa'n gwella a'n bod i gyd yn byw mewn byd perffaith gydag awyr las a chymylau gwyn braf. Gwyddom o'r llythyrau yr ydym yn eu derbyn, ac mae hyn yn wir hefyd am Aelodau Seneddol Llafur megis Chris Bryant yn y Rhondda, fod y sefyllfa ymhell o fod yn ddelfrydol a'i bod yn waeth na'r sefyllfa yn Lloegr. Ailadroddaf y cwestiwn clir a ofynnais: beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau ein bod mewn sefyllfa sydd o leiaf cystal â'r

watch and that of the Minister for Health and Social Services.

The First Minister: I am glad that you have confirmed what I said, namely that you never sought to pursue this matter with me and that you have never written to me about it. You prefer to make airy-fairy claims in this Chamber instead.

As regards facts about waiting lists, the total number of patients on the in-patients day-case waiting list has now fallen to 64,459, which is the lowest it has been since September 1996. That is a fact. As regards the out-patient waiting list, as I say, the figure is at its lowest in terms of those waiting over 12 months since April 2000. That is a fact. You cannot deny those facts as they are published statistics. If you seek to deny those facts, I think that you will be casting considerable doubts over your own seriousness on this matter.

Nick Bourne: I notice that you have not answered any of the questions that I asked. There was a clear question about what you are doing to put us in the same position as England, but you gave no answer. I repeat the point about the figures that are being shoved in drawers. Publish the advice for all of us and then we will question you on it. I have not taken the assertion seriously because I thought it was one of those things that are said in the heat of the moment. You said that you had advice, so publish it. We could then question you on it. I see you shaking your head. If you publish your advice I will gladly question you on it. I have not questioned you so far because I did not think it was serious. Coming back to the position, which you do not question, the in-patient and out-patient combined measure of the waiting list, namely the waiting list position in totality, has gone up every month for the last six months. We are lagging behind England. What are you doing to put us in a better position than England, other than threatening all the services at the hospitals that I mentioned earlier, which will make the position worse?

sefyllfa yn Lloegr? Yr ydym ymhell ar ôl Lloegr ac mae hynny wedi digwydd yn ystod eich gofal chi a gofal y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch eich bod wedi cadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedais, sef nad ydych erioed wedi cysylltu â mi ynglŷn â'r mater hwn ac nad ydych erioed wedi ysgrifennu ataf yn ei gylch. Mae'n well gennych yn hytrach wneud honiadau disylwedd yn y Siambr hon.

O ran y ffeithiau ynglŷn â rhestrau aros, mae cyfanswm nifer y cleifion ar y rhestr aros cleifion mewnol a chleifion allanol wedi gostwng i 64,459, sef yr isaf y mae wedi bod ers Medi 1996. Mae hynny'n ffaith. O ran y rhestr aros i gleifion allanol, fel y dywedais, mae'r ffigur ar ei isaf o ran y rhai sy'n aros dros 12 mis ers Ebrill 2000. Mae hynny'n ffaith. Ni allwch wadu'r ffeithiau hyn gan eu bod yn ystadegau cyhoeddedig. Os ydych am wadu'r ffeithiau hyn, credaf y byddwch yn bwrw amheuaeth fawr ar eich difrifoldeb eich hun ynglŷn â'r mater.

Nick Bourne: Sylwaf nad ydych wedi ateb dim un o'r cwestiynau a ofynnais. Yr oedd cwestiwn eglur ynglŷn â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud i'n rhoi yn yr un sefyllfa â Lloegr, ond nid ydych wedi ei ateb. Yr wyf yn ailadrodd y pwynt ynglŷn â ffigurau sy'n cael eu cuddio mewn droriau. Cyhoeddwch y cyngor ar ein cyfer ni i gyd, ac wedyn byddwn yn eich cwestiynu ar hynny. Nid wyf wedi cymryd yr honiad o ddifrif gan fy mod yn teimlo mai rhywbeth a ddywedir yng ngwres y funud ydoedd. Dywedasoed fod gennych gyngor, felly cyhoeddod hwnnw. Gallem wedyn eich cwestiynu yn ei gylch. Gwelaf eich bod yn ysgwyd eich pen. Os cyhoeddwch eich cyngor byddaf yn falch o'ch cwestiynu yn ei gylch. Nid wyf wedi'ch cwestiynu hyd yma gan nad oeddwn yn meddwl ei fod o ddifrif. A dod yn ôl at y sefyllfa, nad ydych yn ei chwestiynu, mae nifer y cleifion mewnol ac allanol gyda'i gilydd ar y rhestr aros, sef sefyllfa'r rhestr aros yn ei chyfanrwydd, wedi codi bob mis yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf. Yr ydym ar ei hôl hi o'n cymharu â Lloegr. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i'n rhoi mewn gwell sefyllfa na Lloegr, ar wahân i fygwth yr holl wasanaethau yn yr ysbytai a grybwyllais yn

gynharach, a fydd yn gwaethygu'r sefyllfa?

The First Minister: None of those things are true. The factual position is exactly as I gave it. I gave direct, factual, statistical information about the level of people on the in-patient day-case list, which is now at its lowest since September 1996. I have given figures showing that it is at its lowest in terms of out-patient waits of over 12 months since 2000. On whether or not we are on track to deliver the interim targets at the end of March 2007, in terms of a combined 16-month waiting list, the advice that we are receiving is that we are on track, even though it will be a struggle. We are not behind, but we are on track. The same applies to 31 December 2009. The figures are on track to deliver that 26-week waiting list, which I mentioned in my answer to Jonathan's question—his was a serious question—but there is a substantial difference between the inclusiveness of our data on waiting lists and those in England. If England collected its out-patient waiting list figures on the same basis as we do, I think that the English out-patient waiting list would be something like 50 per cent higher than it is now. We include all referrals; England only includes GP letter referrals.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim o'r pethau hyn yn wir. Mae'r sefyllfa ffeithiol yn union fel y'i rhoddais. Rhoddais wybodaeth ystadegol, ffeithiol, uniongyrchol am lefel y bobl ar y rhestr cleifion allanol a chleifion mewnol, sydd yn awr ar ei hisaf ers Medi 1996. Yr wyf wedi rhoi ffigurau sy'n dangos ei bod ar ei hisaf o ran cleifion allanol sy'n disgwyl dros 12 mis ers 2000. Ynghylch a ydym ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r targedau interim ar ddiwedd Mawrth 2007, o ran rhestr aros 16-mis cyfun, y cyngor yr ydym yn ei gael yw ein bod ar y trywydd iawn, er y bydd yn dipyn o ymdrech. Nid ydym ar ei hôl hi, ond yr ydym ar y trywydd iawn. Mae'r un peth yn wir am 31 Rhagfyr 2009. Mae'r ffigurau ar y trywydd iawn i gyflawni'r rhestr aros o 26 wythnos, y soniais amdani yn fy ateb i gwestiwn Jonathan—yr oedd ei gwestiwn ef yn un difrifol—ond mae gwahaniaeth sylweddol rhwng cynwysoldeb ein data ar restrau aros a'r rhai yn Lloegr. Petai Lloegr yn casglu ffigurau ei rhestr aros cleifion allanol yn yr un ffordd â ni, credaf y byddai rhestr aros cleifion allanol Lloegr ryw 50 y cant yn uwch nag y mae yn awr. Yr ydym yn cynnwys pob atgyfeiriad; dim ond atgyfeiriadau llythyrau meddygon teulu y mae Lloegr yn eu cynnwys.

Cyswllt-Oed Cymru Link-Age Wales

Q9 Gwenda Thomas: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Link-Age Wales consultation? OAQ0985(FM)

C9 Gwenda Thomas: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr ymgynghori ar gynllun Cyswllt-Oed Cymru? OAQ0985(FM)

The First Minister: This joint consultation with the Department for Work and Pensions involved a wide range of stakeholders, including older people, and was completed on 30 September. The consultation report shows that the response was very positive, particularly on how Link-Age Wales supports our strategy for older people.

Y Prif Weinidog: Bu amrediad eang o randdeiliaid, gan gynnwys pobl hŷn, yn gysylltiedig â'r ymgynghoriad ar y cyd hwn gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, ac fe'i cwblhawyd ar 30 Medi. Dengys adroddiad yr ymgynghoriad fod yr ymateb wedi bod yn gadarnhaol iawn, yn arbennig ynghylch sut y mae Cyswllt-Oed Cymru yn cefnogi ein strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn.

Gwenda Thomas: The unveiling has taken place, and the unveiling of this initiative by the Welsh Assembly Government and the Department for Work and Pensions is to be welcomed. The information sharing is bound

Gwenda Thomas: Mae'r dadlennu wedi digwydd, ac mae dadlennu'r fenter hon gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i'w groesawu. Mae'r rhannu gwybodaeth yn siŵr o leihau'r

to ease the difficulties that are encountered when attempting to access services. Duplication can now be avoided and help regarding a variety of services will be available in one place. Do you agree that maximising benefit entitlement, and increasing the percentage of people claiming their entitlement, is important if the commitment in the strategy for older people to tackle poverty is to be taken forward?

The First Minister: Yes, and I am pleased that John Griffiths was able to launch this yesterday as the Deputy Minister with responsibility for older people. It is a good example of cross-boundary working between a Westminster Government department, namely DWP, and us to ensure that people maximise their entitlement in a problem area. People will sometimes take advice in a certain way that makes them willing to fill in a form or to have help to fill it in, but then to sign it when they are sure that all the facts in it are correct, in a way that they will not if it is simply sent to them through the post. That sort of one-stop shop for providing better benefit advice that we are now working on with the DWP is an ideal example of how we can correct some of the issues that were raised earlier, such as the low take-up of council tax benefit. However, there are many other benefits, some of which relate to sickness and some to a lack of means.

anawsterau a wynebwr wrth geisio cael mynediad at wasanaethau. Bellach gellir osgoi dyblygu a bydd cymorth ar gyfer amrywiaeth o wasanaethau ar gael mewn un man. A ydych yn cytuno bod sicrhau bod pobl yn cael yr holl fudd-daliadau y mae ganddynt hawl iddynt, a gwella canran y bobl sy'n hawlio'r hyn y mae ganddynt hawl iddo, yn bwysig os yw'r ymrwymiad yn y strategaeth ar gyfer pobl hŷn i fynd i'r afael â thlodi i gael ei wireddu?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf, ac yr wyf yn falch bod John Griffiths wedi gallu lansio hyn ddoe fel y Dirprwy Weinidog sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros bobl hŷn. Mae'n enghraifft dda o weithio trawsffiniol rhwng un o adrannau Llywodraeth San Steffan, sef yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau, a ninnau i sicrhau bod pobl yn cael popeth y mae ganddynt hawl iddo mewn maes anodd. Bydd pobl weithiau'n derbyn cyngor mewn modd neilltuol sy'n eu gwneud yn fodlon llenwi ffurflen neu dderbyn help i'w llenwi, ond wedyn yn ei llofnodi pan fyddant yn sicr bod yr holl ffeithiau ynddi yn gywir, mewn modd na fyddant yn gwneud os yw'r ffurflen yn cael ei hanfon atynt drwy'r post. Mae'r math hwnnw o siop-un-stop ar gyfer darparu gwell cyngor ynghylch budd-daliadau yr ydym yn gweithio arno gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau yn enghraifft ddelfrydol o sut y gallwn unioni rhai o'r materion a godwyd yn gynharach, megis y nifer isel sy'n hawlio budd-dal treth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, mae llawer o fudd-daliadau eraill, rhai yn gysylltiedig â salwch a rhai â diffyg modd.

'Cyflawni ein Haddewidion' 'Delivering our Promises'

Q10 Jeff Cuthbert: Will the First Minister make a statement on how 'Delivering our Promises' will affect the lives of the people of Caerphilly? OAQ1011(FM)

C10 Jeff Cuthbert: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sut y bydd 'Cyflawni ein Haddewidion' yn effeithio ar fywydau pobl Caerffili? OAQ1011(FM)

The First Minister: I am pleased that 'Delivering Our Promises' involves 16 schools in Caerphilly participating in the free breakfasts initiative, with a further two starting in January 2006. Caerphilly County Borough Council has issued 32,000 free bus travel passes. I can confirm that, although it would not deliver our promises on

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn falch iawn bod 'Cyflawni Ein Haddewidion' yn golygu bod 16 ysgol yng Nghaerffili yn cymryd rhan yn y cynllun brechwast am ddim, a dwy arall yn dechrau ym mis Ionawr 2006. Mae Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili wedi darparu 32,000 o docynnau teithio am ddim ar fws. Gallaf gadarnhau, er na fyddai'n cyflawni ein

community hospitals, that does not mean a lack of commitment to an early start on the major new hospital serving the Rhymney valley.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that building partnerships with local voluntary groups and Communities First partnerships, particularly in our more deprived areas, is key to helping our strategy to build stronger and safer communities? A good example of this would, perhaps, be the £130,000 that has been awarded to the Cascade Methodist Church, in my constituency to help build a better facility for local groups, particularly youth groups.

haddewidion ar ysbytai cymuned, nad yw'n golygu diffyg ymrwymiad i ddechrau'n gynnar ar yr ysbyty newydd mawr a fydd yn gwasanaethu cwm Rhymni.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno bod datblygu partneriaethau gyda grwpiau gwirfoddol lleol a phartneriaethau Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yn arbennig yn ein hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, yn allweddol i helpu ein strategaeth ar gyfer adeiladu cymunedau cryfach a mwy diogel? Enghraifft dda o hyn, efallai, fyddai'r £130,000 a ddyfarnwyd i Eglwys Fethodistaidd Cascade yn fy etholaeth i er mwyn adeiladu gwell cyfleuster ar gyfer grwpiau lleol, yn enwedig grwpiau ieuencid.

2.50 p.m.

The First Minister: Indeed. That is another classic example of how we are trying to assist bottom-up community development in areas like Caerphilly—in the whole of the borough, and the whole of the Valleys—to make sure that we release the tremendous energy that is there to improve people's communities and build stronger communities. One of the best ways to do it is to award a grant rather than have us taking over the whole thing and saying, 'This is what you are going to have'. It is better that they come to us and tell us what they need and ask for assistance to achieve this.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn sicr. Mae hynny'n enghraifft glasurol arall o sut yr ydym yn ceisio helpu datblygu cymunedol o'r gwaelod i fyny mewn ardaloedd megis Caerffili—yn y fwrdeistref gyfan, a'r Cymoedd i gyd—i sicrhau ein bod yn rhyddhau'r egni anferthol sydd ar gael yno i wella cymunedau pobl ac adeiladu cymunedau cryfach. Un o'r ffyrdd gorau o wneud hyn yw dyfarnu grant yn hytrach na'n bod ni'n cymryd yr holl beth dan ein hadain a dweud, 'Dyma beth yr ydych am ei gael'. Mae'n well eu bod hwy yn dod atom ni a dweud beth sydd ei angen arnynt a gofyn am gymorth i gyflawni hyn.

Trefniadau Etholiadol Electoral Arrangements

C11 Alun Ffred Jones: Pa drafodaethau a fu rhwng y Prif Weinidog a Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch argymhellion ar gyfer newidiadau i'r trefniadau etholiadol yng Nghymru? OAQ1013 (FM)

Q11 Alun Ffred Jones: What discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding proposals to change electoral arrangements in Wales? OAQ1013 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn trafod y cynigion yn y Papur Gwyn, gan gynnwys y rhai sy'n ymwneud â threfniadau etholiadol, yn gyson gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol. Cododd y pwnc mewn sesiwn ddwyawr a gefais i a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol gerbron Pwyllgor Dethol Materion Cymreig Tŷ'r Cyffredin yn ddiweddar.

The First Minister: I often discuss the White Paper proposals, including those relating to electoral arrangements, with the Secretary of State. The subject arose in a two-hour session that I and the Secretary of State had with the House of Commons Welsh Affairs Select Committee recently.

Alun Ffred Jones: Efallai eich bod yn cael

Alun Ffred Jones: You might have regular

trafodaethau cyson, ond nid oes unrhyw beth yn y ddeddfwriaeth newydd ynglŷn â'r problemau sydd wedi codi gyda phleidleisio drwy'r post nac ynglŷn â phleidleisio electronig. Yn wir, mae nifer yn ystyried hwn fel cyfle wedi ei golli. A ydych yn cytuno â hynny?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae hynny yn cael ei ystyried ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig gyfan. Mater i uned etholiadol y Swyddfa Gartref yn dilyn cyngor gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol yw hwnnw. Maent yn gwestiynau sydd yn berthnasol i etholiadau i Senedd y Deyrnas Unedig, i'r Cynulliad, i lywodraeth leol, a hefyd i Senedd Ewrop.

Carl Sargeant: First Minister, you are obviously very aware of my concerns about regional Members and their duties under the electoral system. Do you agree that, if electoral legislation is passed, it would be useful to have clear definitions of what regional Members should be called, and how they should present themselves to the press and media? They should certainly not call themselves local Members in press releases.

The First Minister: The Government considered the Scottish approach, as I think that you are aware, Carl, and has decided to include a provision in the Government of Wales Bill, which we hope to see published shortly, that will build on the Scottish experience, though it will not ape it completely.

Glyn Davies: Both you and the Secretary of State want to change the electoral arrangements for the next Assembly election to make sure that Members cannot stand on the constituency list and on the regional list. The advice that you received from the Electoral Commission said that this was so designed to help one party that it would persuade people not to vote because of its cynical nature. That is my interpretation. What notice did you take of the Electoral Commission? How much time did you spend considering the advice that you received from the body that you would normally listen to? How often have you ignored the Electoral Commission in the past?

discussions, but there is nothing in the new legislation on the problems that have arisen with postal voting or on electronic voting. Indeed, many people consider this to be a missed opportunity. Do you agree with that?

The First Minister: That is considered on a UK-wide level. That is a matter for the Home Office electoral unit, following the advice of the Electoral Commission. Those are questions that are relevant to elections to the United Kingdom Parliament, the Assembly, local government, and also the European Parliament.

Carl Sargeant: Brif Weinidog, mae'n amlwg eich bod yn ymwybodol iawn o'm pryderon ynghylch Aelodau rhanbarthol a'u dyletswyddau dan y system etholiadol. Os bydd y ddeddfwriaeth etholiadol yn cael ei phasio, a ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael diffiniadau clir o beth y dylid galw Aelodau rhanbarthol a sut y dylent gyflwyno'u hunain i'r cyfryngau a'r wasg? Yn sicr ni ddylent alw'u hunain yn Aelodau lleol mewn datganiadau i'r wasg.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ystyried dull yr Alban, fel y gwyddoch, fe gredaf, Carl, ac mae wedi penderfynu cynnwys darpariaeth ym Mesur Llywodraeth Cymru, a fydd yn cael ei gyhoeddi yn y man yr ydym yn gobeithio, a fydd yn adeiladu ar brofiad yr Alban, er na fydd yn ei efelychu'n llwyr.

Glyn Davies: Mae arnoch chi a'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol eisiau newid y trefniadau etholiadol ar gyfer etholiad nesaf y Cynulliad i wneud yn siŵr na all Aelodau sefyll ar y rhestr etholaethol ac ar y rhestr ranbarthol. Dywedodd y cyngor a gawsoch gan y Comisiwn Etholiadol fod hyn wedi'i gynllunio i helpu un blaid i'r fath raddau fel y byddai'n darbwylo pobl i beidio â phleidleisio oherwydd ei natur sinigaidd. Dyna fy nehongliad i. Pa sylw a gymerasoch o'r Comisiwn Etholiadol? Faint o amser a dreuliasoch yn ystyried y cyngor a gawsoch gan y corff y byddech fel arfer yn gwrando arno? Sawl gwaith yr ydych wedi anwybyddu'r Comisiwn Etholiadol yn y gorffennol?

The First Minister: I referred to this as not being their finest hour in the House of Commons when I gave evidence on this issue to the Welsh Affairs Select Committee, and I maintain that view. We looked at a wide range of advice, involving what people in New Zealand had said about the issue, and at the evidence from New Brunswick and Prince Edward Island, where they have recently considered making changes. Not long after New Zealand introduced a mixed-member system, with exactly the same criticisms of what those who had stood for single constituencies but who were elected on the list system did with their access to constituency funds, Helen Clarke, the Prime Minister, said to me, 'These things are never a finished work of art; it is always possible to tweak them afterwards in order to make the system work better'. That is the attitude that we have taken.

Huw Lewis: First Minister, do you agree that nothing promotes cynicism among the electorate more than the idea that it is almost impossible to get rid of a named individual as a public representative in the kind of system that we have now? Do you not agree that it would be much more democratic, and likely to inspire much more confidence among voters, if they had the right to reject a named individual as their representative? [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Hear, hear.']

The First Minister: Politics is a hard game; we are all in it. We all recognise that part of the hard stuff is that politics involves the risk of being defeated and rejected. That is a healthy part of democracy although it is hard for someone, personally, when it happens. [Interruption.]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I do not want this place to deteriorate even further.

The First Minister: As an article in *The Canadian Parliamentary Review* noted, New Zealand's dual candidacy list MPs who lose their ridings but are elected in any case, suffer particular disdain. It says that many

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedais yn Nhŷ'r Cyffredin nad hyn oedd eu hawr ddisgleiriaf pan roddais dystiolaeth ar y mater hwn i'r Pwyllgor Dethol ar Faterion Cymreig, ac yr wyf yn dal at hynny. Edrychasom ar amrediad eang o gyngor, gan gynnwys yr hyn yr oedd pobl Seland Newydd wedi'i ddweud am y mater, ac ar y dystiolaeth o Brunswick Newydd ac Ynys Prince Edward, lle y maent wedi ystyried gwneud newidiadau'n ddiweddar. Ychydig ar ôl i Seland Newydd gyflwyno system aelodau cymysg, gyda'r un feirniadaeth yn union o'r hyn yr oedd y rhai a oedd wedi sefyll ar gyfer etholaethau unigol ond a gafodd eu hethol ar y system restr wedi'i wneud o ran defnyddio cronfeydd etholaethau, dywedodd Helen Clarke, y Prif Weinidog, wrthyf, 'Nid yw'r pethau hyn yn waith gorffenedig byth; mae wastad yn bosibl newid rhyw ychydig arnynt wedyn er mwyn i'r system weithio'n well'. Dyna'r agwedd yr ydym ni wedi'i chymryd.

Huw Lewis: Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno nad oes dim yn creu mwy o sinigiaeth ymysg yr etholwyr na'r syniad ei bod bron yn amhosibl cael gwared ar unigolyn a enwir fel cynrychiolydd cyhoeddus yn y math o system sydd gennym ar hyn o bryd? Onid ydych yn cytuno y byddai'n llawer mwy democrataidd, ac yn debyg o ennyn llawer mwy o hyder ymysg y pleidleiswyr, petai ganddynt hawl i wrthod unigolyn a enwir yn gynrychiolydd arnynt?

[AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Clywch, clywch.']

Y Prif Weinidog: Gêm anodd yw gwleidyddiaeth; yr ydym i gyd yn rhan ohoni. Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod mai rhan o'r gwaith anodd yw'r perygl mewn gwleidyddiaeth ichi gael eich trechu a'ch gwrthod. Mae hynny'n rhan iach o ddemocratiaeth er ei fod yn anodd i rywun, yn bersonol, pan ddigwydd hynny.

[Torri ar draws.]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid wyf am weld y lle hwn yn dirywio mwy byth.

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y nododd erthygl yn *The Canadian Parliamentary Review*, mae ASau rhestr ymgeisyddiaeth ddeuol Seland Newydd sy'n colli eu hetholaethau ond a etholir beth bynnag, yn dioddef amarch

New Zealanders continue to resent their presence in Parliament, still more so in the Cabinet. That is the kind of thing that we have also seen happening in Wales.

neilltuol. Dywed fod llawer o bobl Seland Newydd yn parhau i wrthwynebu eu presenoldeb yn y Senedd, ac yn fwy byth yn y Cabinet. Dyna'r math o beth yr ydym wedi'i weld yn digwydd yng Nghymru hefyd.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have one change to report to this week's business. Following the business statement, the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside will make a statement on the proposed closure of the Aeron Valley cheese packing factory in Ceredigion.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Yn dilyn y datganiad busnes, bydd y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn gwneud datganiad ynghylch cau ffatri pecynnu caws Dyffryn Aeron yng Ngheredigion, sydd yn arfaethedig.

Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Following the Business Committee's meeting this morning, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Valuation Tribunals (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Non-Domestic Rating Contributions (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, the Historic Buildings Council for Wales (Abolition) Order 2006, the Ancient Monuments Board for Wales (Abolition) Order 2006, and the Children Act 2004 (Commencement No. 5) (Wales) Order 2005.

Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y'i nodir yn y datganiad busnes drafft, a welir ar we'r Siambr dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Tribiwnlysoedd Prisio (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cyfraniadau Ardrethu Annomestig (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005, Gorchymyn Cyngor Adeiladau Hanesyddol Cymru (Diddymu) 2006, Gorchymyn Bwrdd Henebion Cymru (Diddymu) 2006, a Gorchymyn Deddf Plant 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 5) (Cymru) 2005.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad, felly galwaf am sylwadau.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are none, so I call for comments.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith y bydd y Gweinidog yn gwneud datganiad ar y colli swyddi tebygol yng Ngheredigion yn y sector prosesu bwyd. Gobeithiwn y bydd y Gweinidog yn ateb y cwestiynau pan ddaw'r cyfle.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We welcome the fact that the Minister will be making a statement on the likely job losses in the food processing sector in Ceredigion. We hope that the Minister will respond to questions when the opportunity arises.

Byddem yn croesawu dadl ar ddigartrefedd yn y dyfodol agos. Mae'n debyg eich bod yn ymwybodol bod nifer y bobl sy'n ddigartref yng Nghymru wedi codi i ryw 10,000. Mae nifer sylweddol uwch o bobl erbyn hyn yn gorfod cael cartref dros dro ac yn gorfod bod

We would welcome a debate on homelessness in the near future. You are probably aware that the number of homeless people in Wales has risen to almost 10,000. A significantly higher number of people now have to be accommodated in temporary

mewn sefyllfaoedd gwely a brecwast. Yn aml iawn mae hyn yn cynnwys teuluoedd â phlant ac mae'n gwbl anaddas gan fod y sefyllfa'n effeithio ar eu bywydau o safbwynt iechyd ac addysg. Mae'n siŵr gennyf eich bod yn ymwybodol bod pryder mawr yn Ynys Môn, er enghraifft, lle mae'r cyngor yn gwario bron £0.5 miliwn ar gartrefu pobl mewn sefydliadau gwely a brecwast. A fyddech yn fodlon ystyried cael dadl ar y mater pwysig hwn yn y dyfodol agos?

David Melding: We welcome the fact that you have respected the wishes of most Assembly Members for a debate on an amendable motion on the future of police forces in Wales, which I think is appropriate.

You will also know that I have asked for an oral or written statement on the latest position with regard to routine flu vaccinations. I also join the leader of the opposition in calling for a debate on homelessness, as the issue is of pressing concern.

Kirsty Williams: I thank the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside for his willingness to come to the Chamber to make a statement on the potential job losses in Ceredigion, and also the Minister for Health and Social Services for his written statement this morning about the ongoing E.coli situation in Brecon and Radnorshire.

We would also welcome a debate on homelessness given that repossession figures have increased by 50 per cent in the last year; it is a huge area of concern. We are also concerned about the large amount of work that is currently building up and the short amount of time that we have left in Plenary. You will be aware of the desirability of bringing forward the report of the committee on the inquiry into the E.coli outbreak in Wales before the Christmas recess rather than after it. I suggest that it is now the time to consider either extending Plenary sessions in the run up to the Christmas recess, or it may be necessary to have an additional Plenary session to accommodate all the business that should be accommodated prior to the Christmas recess. You have not even begun

accommodation or placed in bed and breakfast settings. These often include families with children, which is totally inappropriate as the situation has a detrimental impact on their health and education. I am sure that you will be aware that there is great concern in Anglesey, for example, where the council spends approximately £0.5 million on housing people in bed and breakfast establishments. Would you consider holding a debate on this important issue in the near future?

David Melding: Croesawn y ffaith eich bod wedi parchu dymuniadau'r rhan fwyaf o Aelodau'r Cynulliad am ddadl ar gynnig y gellid ei ddiwygio ar ddyfodol heddluoedd Cymru, sydd yn briodol yn fy marn i.

Gwyddoch hefyd fy mod wedi gofyn am ddatganiad llafar neu ysgrifenedig am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf gyda golwg ar frechiadau fflw arferol. Ymunaf hefyd ag arweinydd yr wrthblaid i ofyn am ddadl ar ddigartrefedd, gan fod y mater yn un sy'n peri pryder mawr.

Kirsty Williams: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad am fod yn fodlon dod i'r Siambr i wneud datganiad am y colli swyddi a allai ddigwydd yng Ngheredigion a hefyd i'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol am ei ddatganiad ysgrifenedig y bore yma ar y sefyllfa sy'n parhau gydag E.coli ym Mrycheiniog a sir Faesyfed.

Byddem ninnau hefyd yn croesawu dadl ar ddigartrefedd o wybod bod y ffigurau ailfeddiannu wedi cynyddu 50 y cant yn y flwyddyn diwethaf; mae'n faes sy'n pryder enfawr. Yr ydym hefyd yn bryderus ynghylch yr holl waith sy'n cronni ar hyn o bryd a'r cyfnod byr sydd gennym ar ôl yn y Cyfarfod Llawn. Byddwch yn ymwybodol pa mor ddymunol fyddai cyflwyno adroddiad y pwyllgor ar yr ymchwiliad i'r achosion E.coli yng Nghymru cyn gwyliau'r Nadolig yn hytrach nag ar ôl y gwyliau. Awgrymaf mai dyma'r amser i ystyried naill ai ymestyn sesiynau'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn y cyfnod sy'n arwain at doriad y Nadolig, neu efallai y bydd angen cael Cyfarfod Llawn ychwanegol i drafod yr holl fusnes y dylid ei drafod cyn toriad y Nadolig. Nid ydych hyd yn oed wedi

to schedule time for the ongoing budget debates, which is a concern. We need to know now what your intentions are in relation to accommodating all this business before Christmas.

3.00 p.m.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Diolch yn fawr am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes.

It is the Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside who is making the statement this afternoon. On the issues that you have all raised—Ieuan, David and Kirsty—we will issue a written statement on homelessness before the end of this term in December. However, we are also scheduling time for a debate on this important issue early in the new year, and we will confirm the date of the debate in next week's meeting of the Business Committee. On your point about the time that we have made available to include all the requests for statements and debates during this term, Kirsty, in terms of the business statement, we have taken on board every request that has come before us. It means that we are pressed, and we are seeking to ensure that we can take on board opposition will as far as possible.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.
Business statement adopted.*

Datganiad am Gwmni Pacio Caws Dyffryn Aeron Statement on the Aeron Valley Cheese Packing Company

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): It is with regret that I have to inform the National Assembly of Dairygold's announcement of the possible closure of its packaging plant, Aeron Valley Cheese, at Felin-fach. I understand that senior management based in Ireland made the decision to initiate a 90-day consultation with staff as part of the strategic review of operations.

The decision reflects the overcapacity in cheese packing across the UK, which has led to decreasing volumes of cheese being

dechrau trefnu amser ar gyfer y dadleuon rheolaidd ar y gyllideb, sydd yn destun pryder. Mae angen inni gael gwybod yn awr beth yw eich bwriadau ar gyfer trafod yr holl fusnes hwn cyn y Nadolig.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): Thank you for supporting the business statement.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad sydd yn gwneud y datganiad y prynhawn yma. O ran y materion yr ydych i gyd wedi'u codi—Ieuan, David a Kirsty—byddwn yn cyhoeddi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar ddigartrefedd cyn diwedd y tymor hwn ym mis Rhagfyr. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym hefyd yn trefnu amser ar gyfer dadl ar y pwnc pwysig hwn yn gynnar yn y flwyddyn newydd, ac fe gadarnhawn ddyddiad y ddadl yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes yr wythnos nesaf. Ynglŷn â'ch pwynt am yr amser yr ydym wedi ei ganiatáu ar gyfer trafod pob cais am ddatganiadau a dadleuon yn ystod y tymor hwn, Kirsty, o safbwynt y datganiad busnes, yr ydym wedi derbyn pob cais a ddaeth ger ein bron. Mae hynny'n golygu bod pwysau arnom, ac yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau y gallwn dderbyn ewyllys y gwrthbleidiau cyn belled ag y bo modd.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Gyda gofid y mae'n rhaid imi hysbysu'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol am gyhoeddiad Dairygold ei bod yn bosibl y bydd yn cau ei waith pecynnu, Caws Dyffryn Aeron, yn y Felin-fach. Deallaf i uwch-reolwyr y cwmni yn Iwerddon wneud y penderfyniad i ddechrau ymgynghoriad 90 diwrnod gyda'r staff fel rhan o'r adolygiad strategol o'r gweithrediadau.

Mae'r penderfyniad yn adlewyrchu'r gorgapasiti ym maes pacio caws ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig, sydd wedi arwain at bacio

packed at the site. The company hopes to find a solution that will maintain a viable operation at the plant. At this stage, several options are being considered, which, sadly, may include closure. The consultation period should allow for discussions with any parties that might be interested in purchasing the site, but it is too early to predict the final outcome.

The Assembly Government's immediate priority is to work with partner organisations to help to identify potential buyers, and to ensure that the plant has a sustainable future. We will, of course, consider any approach for support, including financial assistance from either the company or any prospective buyers or investors in the plant. I intend to meet Dairygold's senior management later this week to explore possible options and opportunities for Assembly support.

Elin Jones: Diolch, Weinidog, am gytuno i wneud y datganiad hwn y prynhawn yma. Mae'n debyg i chi gael yr un sioc a'r un siom ag a gefais i neithiwr o glywed y newyddion bod 105 o weithwyr wedi clywed oddi wrth eu cyflogwr, Dairygold yn Felin-fach, fod y cwmni yn ystyried cau'r safle hwnnw.

Yr ydym wedi bod yma o'r blaen, Weinidog, wrth i chi ddod i'r Cynulliad i sôn am gollu capasiti prosesu llaeth o orllewin Cymru. Er ein bod ni yng Nghymru, ac yn y gorllewin, yn parhau i fod yn gynhyrchwr llaeth sylweddol, ymddengys bod eich bwriad fel Llywodraeth i gynyddu'r sector prosesu ac ychwanegu gwerth yn cael ei danseilio yn aml gan benderfyniadau cwmnïau yn y diwydiant hwn.

Bu buddsoddiad sylweddol o £1.2 miliwn yn y ffatri hon, wedi'i ariannu gan gynllun marchnata a phrosesu eich Llywodraeth. Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a adeiladodd y ffatri hon, a chi a'i hgorodd tua phum mlynedd yn ôl. Efallai eich bod mewn sefyllfa, gan na fu i chi gyfeirio at hyn yn eich datganiad, i gadarnhau a oes unrhyw fath o adfachiad ar yr £1.2 miliwn hwnnw o arian cyhoeddus. A yw'n gymwys i'r Cynulliad hawlio'r arian hwnnw yn ôl?

llai a llai o gaws ar y safle. Mae'r cwmni'n gobeithio dod o hyd i ateb a fydd yn cynnal gwaith hyfyw yn y ffatri. Ar hyn o bryd, mae sawl posibilrwydd yn cael ei ystyried, a all, ysywaeth, gynnwys cau'r ffatri. Dylai'r cyfnod ymgynghori ganiatáu trafodaethau gydag unrhyw bartïon a allai fod â diddordeb mewn prynu'r safle, ond mae'n rhy gynnar i broffwydo'r canlyniad terfynol.

Blaenoriaeth gyntaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw gweithio gyda chyrrff sy'n bartneriaid i helpu i ganfod darpar brynwyr, ac i sicrhau y bydd gan y gwaith ddyfodol cynaliadwy. Wrth gwrs, ystyriwn unrhyw gais am gymorth, gan gynnwys cymorth ariannol, naill ai gan y cwmni neu gan unrhyw ddarpar brynwyr neu fuddsoddwyr yn y ffatri. Bwriadaf gwrdd ag uwch reolwyr Dairygold yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon i ymchwilio i ddewisiadau a chyfleoedd posibl i'r Cynulliad roi cymorth.

Elin Jones: Thank you, Minister, for agreeing to make this statement this afternoon. It appears that you were as shocked and disappointed as I was last night to hear the news that 105 workers had been told by their employer, Dairygold in Felin-fach, that that company was considering closing that site.

We have been here before, Minister, with you coming to the Assembly to report on the loss of dairy processing capacity in west Wales. Although we in Wales, and in west Wales, remain a significant producer of milk, your intention as a Government to expand the processing and added-value sector in Wales seems to be undermined very often by decisions taken by companies in this industry.

There was a considerable investment of £1.2 million in this factory, funded by your Government's processing and marketing scheme. The Welsh Development Agency built this factory, and you opened it some five years ago. You may be in a position, since you did not refer to this in your statement, to confirm whether there will be any clawback of that £1.2 million of public money. Would the Assembly be in a position to claw back that money?

Yr wyf yn falch eich bod yn bwriadu cyfarfod â rheolwyr Dairygold. Gobeithiaf yn fawr y cewch chi ryw fath o berswâd arnynt i newid eu penderfyniad i gau'r ffatri hon oherwydd, er ei fod wedi cyhoeddi'r bwriad i gynnal ymgynghoriad statudol o 90 diwrnod, yn fy mhrofiad i, pan fydd cwmni yn gwneud y cyhoeddiad hwnnw, mae eisoes wedi gwneud y penderfyniad i gau'r ffatri dan sylw.

Yr wyf hefyd yn falch eich bod yn cytuno, os nad yw hi'n bosibl i gadw Dairygold fel perchennog y ffatri yn Felin-fach, ei bod hi'n bwysig bod yr asedau, yr adnoddau a'r offer yn Felin-fach yn cael eu cadw yn y ffatri a bod pob ymdrech yn cael ei wneud i werthu'r ffatri fel busnes gweithredol i gynhyrchydd arall sy'n barod i gefnogi pacio caws yn nyffryn Aeron. Efallai y gallech chi awgrymu ac amlinellu pa fath o fesurau, adnoddau ac arian fydd ar gael gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i hyrwyddo'r ffatri hon fel busnes gweithredol i ddarpar brynwyr yn y diwydiant hwn.

Yn olaf, dymunaf bob hwyl ichi yn eich trafodaethau gyda Dairygold, ac yn eich gwaith wrth hyrwyddo'r ffatri hon i ddarpar brynwyr. Efallai y gallech chi roi ymrwymiad i adrodd yn ôl ar eich trafodaethau, naill ai i'r Cynulliad, neu i Bwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad.

Carwyn Jones: Gwnaf fi hynny, wrth gwrs. Mae gwahaniaeth rhwng y ffatri hon yn Felin-fach a'r ffatri yn Llangadog, er enghraifft. Yr oedd problemau yn Llangadog o ran y peiriannau, a oedd yn gymharol hen, ac yr oedd eisiau buddsoddiad mawr er mwyn gwneud yn siŵr bod y peiriannau yn cyrraedd y safonau modern yr oedd eu hangen yno. Mae'n wahanol yn Felin-fach; mae'r offer yno o'r radd flaenaf oherwydd y buddsoddiad a wnaed yno. O ganlyniad i hynny, credaf y bydd y ffatri yn Felin-fach yn denu diddordeb darpar brynwyr. Yr wyf finnau am weld gwaith y ffatri yn parhau, ond mae'n bosibl nad Dairygold fydd yn ei rhedeg. Gobeithiaf y daw prynwr arall ymlaen, oherwydd mae hon yn ffatri fodern a bydd, felly, o ddiddordeb i'r diwydiant.

Ynglŷn â'r arian sydd ar gael, nid oes swm

I am glad to hear that you will meet the managers of Dairygold. I very much hope that you will have some influence on them to change their decision to close this factory because, even though it has publicly stated that a 90-day consultation will be held, in my experience, when a company makes that announcement, it has already made the decision to close the factory in question.

I am also very pleased that you agree, if it is not possible to retain Dairygold as the owner of the Felin-fach factory, that it is important that the assets, resources and equipment in Felin-fach are kept in the factory and that every effort is made to sell the factory as a going concern to another producer who is willing to support cheese packing in the Aeron valley. Perhaps you could suggest and outline to us what kind of measures, resources and funding will be made available by the Assembly Government to promote this factory as a going concern for any prospective buyers in this industry.

Finally, I wish you well in your discussions with Dairygold and in your work in promoting this factory to prospective buyers. Perhaps you will give us a commitment that you will report back on your discussions, either to the Assembly, or to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee.

Carwyn Jones: I will do that, of course. There is a difference between this factory in Felin-fach and the factory in Llangadog, for example. There were problems in Llangadog regarding the machinery, which was relatively old, and significant investment was required in order to bring it up to the modern standards required. It is different in Felin-fach; the factory has state-of-the-art equipment because of the investment made there. As a result, I think that Felin-fach is a factory that will attract the interest of prospective buyers. I want to see work at the factory continue, but it may not be Dairygold that runs the factory. I hope that the factory finds another buyer because it is a modern factory and will, therefore, be of interest to the industry.

With regard to the funding available, no sum

wedi'i nodi ar hyn o bryd, ond mae'r grantiau prosesu a marchnata, a grant datblygu marchnadoedd, ar gael. Dyna'r grantiau sydd ar gael yn y maes hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai'n bosibl rhoi pecyn at ei gilydd pe bai prynwr yn dangos diddordeb yn y ffatri.

O ran y grantiau, rhoddwyd dau grant i'r ffatri. Darparwyd un ym Mehefin 1999, cyn i'r Cynulliad ddod i rym, a rhoddwyd y grant hwnnw i Aeron Valley Cheese Cyf. Ym Mehefin 2002, cynigiwyd grant arall o oddeutu £660,000, a hynny i ddatblygu llinellau pecynnu. Rhoddwyd dau swm felly, a chyfrannodd y grant cyntaf at brosesu caws. O ran yr adfachiad, mae hynny'n cael ei ystyried ar hyn o bryd, a gobeithiaf y byddaf mewn gwell sefyllfa o ran rhoi mwy o fanylion am hynny yn y dyfodol agos.

Lisa Francis: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich datganiad heddiw.

The potential loss of 115 jobs is very concerning for Ceredigion and for the wider travel-to-work area. You mentioned that the company has launched a 90-day statutory consultation, which may lead to closure. It has been suggested that the cheese-packing operation at this plant is to move elsewhere; in fact, Scotland has been mentioned. Can you confirm whether that is likely to be the case? That is very worrying, because is there not a danger that if Welsh produce is transported to Scotland for packing, then the produce could, in essence, no longer be branded as Welsh? Are you able to indicate at this stage who the partner organisations you are working with are, in identifying potential buyers, or is this information commercially confidential? In the past, every effort has gone into promoting the Welsh brand at this plant, and this is a serious blow to the morale of the dairy industry in Wales. The dairy industry was led to believe, when this plant was set up, that it was a state-of-the-art complex, as you have just mentioned, that it would be the most modern in the UK and that the facilities were second to none. If the problem is one of significant overcapacity, why has this state-of-the-art plant failed, or why is it failing? If it is going to relocate, as is rumoured, is that not a reflection of your Government's economic policies in Wales?

has been allocated as yet, but the processing and marketing grants, and the market development grants, are available. Those are grants that are available in this area. I am sure that it would be possible to put a package together if a prospective buyer showed interest in the factory.

In terms of the grants, the factory received two grants. One was provided in June 1999, before the Assembly's inception, and that grant was given to Aeron Valley Cheese Ltd. In June 2002, a second grant of around £660,000 was given to develop packaging lines. Two amounts were provided therefore, and the first grant contributed to the cheese-processing work. On the clawback, this is being considered, and I hope that I will be in a better position with regard to giving you more details on that in the near future.

Lisa Francis: Thank you, Minister, for your statement today.

Mae'r posibilrwydd o golli 115 o swyddi'n destun pryder mawr i Geredigion ac i'r ardal ehangach o ran teithio i'r gwaith. Soniasoch fod y cwmni wedi dechrau ymgynghoriad statudol 90 diwrnod, a all arwain at gau'r ffatri. Mae rhywrai wedi awgrymu y bwriedir symud y gwaith pacio caws o'r ffatri hon i rywle arall; yn wir crybwyllwyd enw'r Alban. A allwch gadarnhau a yw hynny'n debygol o fod yn wir? Mae hynny'n destun pryder mawr, oherwydd onid oes perygl os caiff cynnyrch Cymru ei gludo i'r Alban i'w bacio, na ellid wedyn, yn y bôn, ei frandio fel cynnyrch Cymru? A allwch roi syniad ar hyn o bryd pwy yw'r cyrff sy'n bartneriaid yr ydych yn gweithio gyda hwy, wrth geisio canfod darpar brynwyr, ynteu a yw'r wybodaeth hon yn fasnachol gyfrinachol? Yn y gorffennol, gwnaed pob ymdrech i hyrwyddo'r brand Cymreig yn y ffatri hon, ac mae hyn yn ergyd ddifrifol i forâl y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru. Arweiniwyd y diwydiant llaeth i gredu, pan sefydlwyd y ffatri hon, ei bod yn ffatri a gynhwysai offer o'r radd flaenaf, fel yr ydych newydd ddweud, mai hon fyddai'r ffatri fwyaf modern yng ngwledydd Prydain a bod y cyfleusterau heb eu hail. Os mai gorgapasiiti sylweddol yw'r broblem, pam mae'r ffatri newydd sbon hon wedi methu, neu pam mae hi'n methu? Os yw'r gwaith am gael ei

symud, yn unol â'r si, onid yw hynny'n adlewyrchiad o bolisiâu economaidd eich Llywodraeth yng Nghymru?

3.10 p.m.

Obviously, much will hinge on the outcome of your discussions with Dairygold's senior management. Will you please ensure that, following those discussions, you come back and involve all the constituency and regional Assembly Members and communicate regularly with them? Also, will you monitor developments closely, so that you can give us updated reports over this 90-day statutory consultation period?

Carwyn Jones: I will, of course, keep the National Assembly informed of what is going on. In terms of the plant going to Scotland, I had not heard that point and I would be surprised if that happened, because the problem that the plant has is due to overcapacity in packaging, and moving it somewhere else in the UK will not help with that. We understand that the plant is in difficulty because there have been difficulties with obtaining contracts. I cannot say more than that at this moment in time, but, hopefully, that will be made clear towards the end of this week, when I meet the senior management. However, moving to Scotland is certainly not something that I have heard about, nor do I believe that it would be sensible, given the situation. It is important to clarify that we are discussing the packaging plant, not the cheese-making plant, which will continue, and that is where the Welsh brand comes in; the packaging is not a branding exercise, but it is clearly important in terms of jobs in the local economy.

In terms of the partner organisations that are involved, initially, the Welsh Development Agency is monitoring the situation. We would expect to be involved with the county council as well. Let us take it one step at a time: first, it is important to find out exactly what the situation is; secondly, we have to see what interest there might be from buyers; and, thirdly, we have to see what kind of package needs to be put together, either in terms of enabling the factory to stay open, or to deal with the worst-case scenario.

Yn amlwg, bydd llawer yn dibynnu ar ganlyniad eich trafodaethau gydag uwch reolwyr Dairygold. A wnewch sicrhau, os gwelwch yn dda, y deuwch yn ôl wedi'r trafodaethau hynny a chynnwys yr holl Aelodau Cynulliad etholaethol a rhanbarthol a chysylltu'n rheolaidd â hwy? Hefyd, a wnewch fonitro'r datblygiadau'n ofalus, fel y gallwch roi'r adroddiadau diweddaraf inni drwy gydol y cyfnod ymgynghori statudol 90 diwrnod hwn?

Carwyn Jones: Wrth gwrs, fe sicrhaf y caiff y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol bob gwybodaeth am yr hyn sydd yn digwydd. O ran symud y gwaith i'r Alban, nid oeddwn wedi clywed y pwynt hwnnw a byddai'n syndod i mi pe bai hynny'n digwydd, oherwydd y broblem sydd gan y gwaith yw bod gorgapasiti o ran pacio, ac ni wnaiff ei symud i rywle arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig helpu gyda hynny. Deallwn fod y ffatri mewn trafferth oherwydd bod trafferthion wedi bod wrth gael contractau. Ni allaf ddweud mwy na hynny ar hyn o bryd, ond gobeithio y gwneir hynny'n glir tua diwedd yr wythnos hon, pan gyfarfyddaf â'r uwch reolwyr. Serch hynny, nid yw symud i'r Alban yn rhywbeth y clywais i amdano, ac ni chredaf ychwaith y byddai'n symudiad call, o gofio'r sefyllfa. Mae'n bwysig nodi'n glir mai trafod y gwaith pacio yr ydym, nid y gwaith cynhyrchu caws, a fydd yn aros, a dyna lle y mae'r brand Cymreig yn berthnasol; nid ymarferiad brandio yw'r pecynnu, ond yn amlwg mae'n bwysig o ran swyddi yn yr economi leol.

O ran y cyrff sy'n bartneriaid sydd yn ymwneud â hyn, ar y dechrau, mae Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru'n monitro'r sefyllfa. Byddem yn disgwyl gweithio gyda'r cyngor sir hefyd. Gadewch inni weithredu fesul cam: yn gyntaf, mae'n bwysig canfod beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa; yn ail, rhaid inni weld pa ddiddordeb a all fod mewn prynu'r gwaith; ac, yn drydydd, rhaid inni weld pa fath o becyn y mae angen ei lunio, un ai o ran galluogi'r ffatri i aros ar agor, neu i ddelio â'r sefyllfa waethaf a allai ddigwydd. Fodd

However, given what we know about the state of the machinery being as up to date as it could be, there has to be some optimism that a buyer can be found, and that is my hope at the moment.

Mick Bates: Thank you for your statement, Minister, and for the rational things that you have said. I am sure that we are all thinking about the 115 employees whose jobs are threatened, particularly at this time of the year, when the pressures of families, Christmas and the mortgage payments all bear down on them. I am sure that we all hope that you can find a solution.

There are three key issues that I would like you to address on the back of your statement. First, what business intelligence was forthcoming to the Government in view of its large investment in cheese processing at this plant, with particular reference to the fact that the parent company returned a loss of some €39 million in 2003? What process exists within the Government to look at early action when there are obviously weaknesses in a business?

Secondly, at the time of the award of this grant, what indications were used to award such a large grant, when, as you say, there was overcapacity? Overcapacity is not a new phenomenon, and there have been many problems within the Welsh dairy industry for years. Thirdly, unions have long brought to your attention the fragility of integration between the producer, the processor and the retailer in Wales. Would you undertake, on the back of this and after your discussions, which, I am sure, will be commercially confidential, to carry out a more detailed analysis of why, with all this investment and a large parent company, this plant has failed? It seems to me that there are many messages within the dairy industry that we need real partnership between the Government and the private sector. Unfortunately, as you are well aware, 60 per cent of dairy farmers fail to cover their production costs at the moment. This is not an unrelated issue to that of this cheese-processing plant, because profits are not fair at each and every stage of the industry in Wales.

bynna, o wybod yr hyn a wyddom am gyflwr y peiriannau sydd mor newydd ag y gallent fod, rhaid bod yn weddol ffyddiog y gellir canfod prynwr, a dyna fy ngobaith ar hyn o bryd.

Mick Bates: Diolch am eich datganiad, Weinidog, ac am y pethau rhesymol a ddywedaso. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn meddwl am y 115 o weithwyr y mae eu swyddi dan fygythiad, yn enwedig yr adeg hon o'r flwyddyn, pan fo pwysau teulu, y Nadolig a thaliadau morgais i gyd yn pwysu arnynt. Yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn gobeithio y gallwch ganfod ateb.

Mae tri chwestiwn allweddol yr hoffwn ichi roi sylw iddynt yn sgîl eich datganiad. Yn gyntaf, pa wybodaeth o ran busnes a oedd ar gael i'r Llywodraeth o gofio ei buddsoddiad mawr mewn prosesu caws yn y gwaith hwn, gan gyfeirio'n arbennig at y ffaith bod y prif gwmni wedi cyhoeddi colled o ryw €39 miliwn yn 2003? Pa broses sy'n bodoli o fewn y Llywodraeth i ystyried gweithredu cynnar pan ddaw'n amlwg bod gwendidau mewn busnes?

Yn ail, pan roddwyd y grant hwn, pa fesuriadau a ddefnyddiwyd i roi grant mor fawr, pan oedd gorgapasiti, fel y dywedwch? Nid ffenomen newydd yw gorgapasiti, ac mae'n rhaid bod problemau lu wedi bodoli o fewn diwydiant llaeth Cymru ers blynyddoedd. Yn drydydd, mae'r undebau wedi tynnu'ch sylw ers tro at freuder y berthynas rhwng y cynhyrchydd, y prosesydd a'r manwerthwr yng Nghymru. A fyddech yn ymrwymo, yn sgîl hyn ac ar ôl eich trafodaethau, a fydd, yr wyf yn siŵr, yn fasnachol gyfrinachol, i wneud dadansoddiad manylach o'r rheswm pam mae'r ffatri hon wedi methu, er gwaethaf yr holl fuddsoddiad a wnaed ac er bod y rhiant-gwmni'n un mawr? Mae'n ymddangos i mi fod llawer yn dweud o fewn y diwydiant llaeth bod angen gwir bartneriaeth rhwng y Llywodraeth a'r sector preifat. Yn anffodus, fel y gwyddoch yn dda, nid yw 60 y cant o ffermwyr llaeth yn llwyddo i adennill eu costau cynhyrchu ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw hyn yn fater sydd heb gysylltiad â'r gwaith prosesu caws hwn, oherwydd nid yw'r modd y rhennir yr elw yn deg ym mhob un cam o'r diwydiant yng Nghymru.

I have long called for the Government to champion a fair deal brand on dairy products. I wonder whether this will give you an extra impetus to take a very sensible view and to sit producers and retailers down with processors to say that there must be recognition that the dairy industry in Wales is disappearing, and that the added value that we have long striven to bring to Wales is also diminishing. This cannot be allowed to happen. It is happening because there is not a fair deal for each part of the food chain in Wales. The retailers bear a large responsibility for squeezing the producers and, it now seems, another producer that was adding value to the rural economy, out of business.

Carwyn Jones: First of all, I have to make it clear that we are not talking about the processing plant, which remains. We are talking about the packaging plant. I do not really follow the argument that the difficulties experienced by the packaging plant are to do with the price paid to farmers. Although I understand that point, I do not see the connection between the two at this stage.

We did not know about the decision. The decision came from Ireland, and it may not be surprising that the decision was not taken locally. I would caution against using a phrase such as 'the plant has failed'. We do not know whether the plant has been losing money. As you stated, we know about the parent company, but we do not know the financial situation of this plant. Until I know that, I am not going to say that the plant is in trouble—rather that there is a problem with the parent company. We will look at that towards the end of the week.

It is right to say that there is overcapacity at the plant, but it was certainly not known that the undercapacity was such that it was causing the plant to lose money. It was operating below capacity, but that does not mean that it was losing money as a result. We do not yet know the state of the plant with regard to its viability or any potential buyers. However, it has advantages that, for example, Llangadog, and Whitland before it, did not

Yr wyf wedi galw ers tro ar y Llywodraeth i hyrwyddo brand bargaen deg ar gyfer cynnyrch llaeth. Ys gwn i a wnaiff hyn roi hwb ychwanegol ichi arddel safbwynt synhwyrol iawn a threfnu i'r cynhyrchwyr a'r manwerthwyr eistedd i lawr gyda'r proseswyr a dweud bod rhaid cydnabod bod y diwydiant llaeth yng Nghymru'n diflannu, a bod y gwerth ychwanegol y buom yn ymdrechu cyhyd i'w greu yng Nghymru hefyd yn lleihau. Ni ellir caniatáu i hyn ddigwydd. Mae'n digwydd oherwydd nad yw pob rhan o'r gadwyn fwyd yng Nghymru'n cael chwarae teg. Y manwerthwyr sy'n gyfrifol i raddau helaeth am wasgu'r cynhyrchwyr ac, mae'n ymddangos yn awr, am wasgu cynhyrchydd arall a oedd yn ychwanegu gwerth at economi cefn gwlad, allan o fusnes.

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, rhaid i mi ei gwneud yn glir nad sôn am y ffatri brosesu yr ydym. Mae honno'n dal i fodoli. Sôn yr ydym am y ffatri becynnu. A dweud y gwir, nid wyf yn dilyn y ddadl mai'r pris a delir i ffermwyr sy'n gyfrifol am anawsterau'r ffatri becynnu. Er fy mod yn deall y pwynt hwnnw, ni welaf y cysylltiad rhwng y ddau beth ar hyn o bryd.

Nid oeddem yn gwybod am y penderfyniad. Daeth y penderfyniad o Iwerddon, ac efallai nad yw'n syndod na chafodd y penderfyniad ei wneud yn lleol. Byddwn yn eich rhybuddio rhag defnyddio ymadrodd megis 'mae'r ffatri wedi methu'. Ni wyddom a yw'r ffatri wedi bod yn colli arian ai peidio. Fel y dywedaso, gwyddom am y rhiant-gwmni, ond ni wyddom beth yw sefyllfa ariannol y ffatri hon. Hyd nes y caf wybod hynny, nid wyf am ddweud bod y ffatri'n wynebu trafferthion—ond yn hytrach fod problem gyda'r rhiant-gwmni. Edrychwn ar hynny tua diwedd yr wythnos.

Mae'n wir dweud bod gorgapasiti, ond yn sicr ni wyddid bod tangapasiti i'r fath raddau neu ei fod yn peri i'r ffatri golli arian. Yr oedd yn gweithredu o dan ei chapasiti, ond nid yw hynny'n golygu ei bod yn colli arian oherwydd hynny. Ni wyddom eto beth yw sefyllfa'r ffatri o ran ei hyfywedd nac o ran unrhyw ddarpar brynwyr. Fodd bynnag, mae iddi fanteision nad oeddent gan Langadog a'r Hendy-gwyn o'i blaen, er enghraifft,

have because of years of underinvestment.

To clarify the grants that were awarded, the first grant of £611,000 was awarded to Aeron Valley Cheese, which was a different company at the time, in order to assist with processing and packaging. That grant offer was made in June 1999 in the days of the Welsh Office. The second limb of the grant was for £664,000 and was made in June 2002, when your party leader was the Minister with responsibility for rural development.

Nick Bourne: I thank the Minister for making the statement so promptly; it is an important issue. I will take up a couple of the points that he has mentioned. First, our thoughts obviously go out to the people affected. The uncertainty for them and their families in the run-up to Christmas must be dreadful. I visited Aeron Valley Cheese before the packaging plant opened. The Minister said that a grant offer was made in June 1999. I think that the Assembly was in place by then. Perhaps the transfer Order had not happened at that stage, but the Assembly existed from May 1999. Will the Minister clarify that point, as I was a bit bemused by that? There is the issue of clawback, so it is important whether it was before or after power was transferred to us. If the packaging plant should close, there is an issue of public money.

Aeron Valley Cheese was very excited about the plant doing all the packaging being next door. I do not want to create any real concern, but I hope that this does not now affect its viability. What is happening to the business that was being run there locally? Lisa Francis mentioned some of the rumours that are circulating. There is now a very important issue of where the packaging will be done. Could the Minister pick up on that issue? I am grateful that the Minister has undertaken to keep us informed, but, in the meantime, perhaps he could address those two issues.

Carwyn Jones: If I remember rightly, the

oherwydd blynyddoedd o danfuddsoddi.

Ac egluro'r grantiau a ddyfarnwyd, dyfarnwyd y grant cyntaf o £611,000 i gwmni Caws Dyffryn Aeron, a oedd yn gwmni gwahanol bryd hynny, er mwyn eu cynorthwyo gyda'r prosesu a'r pecynnu. Cynigiwyd y grant ym mis Mehefin 1999 yn nyddiau'r Swyddfa Gymreig. Rhoddwyd yr ail grant, £664,000, ym mis Mehefin 2002, pan oedd arweinydd eich plaid yn Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu cefn gwlad.

Nick Bourne: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am wneud y datganiad mor ddiymdroi; mae'n fater pwysig. Ymdriniaf â dau bwynt a godwyd ganddo. Yn gyntaf, mae'n amlwg ein bod yn meddwl am y bobl y bydd hyn yn effeithio arnynt. Mae'n siŵr bod yr ansicrwydd iddynt hwy a'u teuluoedd wrth ddynesu at y Nadolig yn ofnadwy. Ymwelais â chwmni Caws Dyffryn Aeron cyn i'r ffatri becynnu agor. Dywedodd y Gweinidog iddi gael cynnig grant ym mis Mehefin 1999. Credaf fod y Cynulliad wedi'i sefydlu erbyn hynny. Efallai nad oedd y Gorchymyn trosglwyddo wedi digwydd bryd hynny, ond yr oedd y Cynulliad yn bodoli o fis Mai 1999 ymlaen. A wnaiff y Gweinidog egluro'r pwynt hwnnw, gan iddo fy synnu braidd? Mae adfachu'r arian yn fater i'w ystyried, felly mae'n bwysig gwybod ai cyn i'r grym gael ei drosglwyddo i ni y digwyddodd hyn ai peidio. Petai'r ffatri becynnu'n cau, mae'r ffaith mai arian cyhoeddus oedd hwn yn fater i'w ystyried.

Yr oedd cwmni Caws Dyffryn Aeron wrth ei fodd o gael y ffatri a oedd yn gwneud ei holl waith pecynnu y drws nesaf iddo. Nid wyf am greu gwir bryder, ond gobeithiaf nad yw hyn yn awr yn mynd i effeithio ar ei hyfywedd. Beth sy'n digwydd i'r busnes a oedd yn cael ei redeg yno'n lleol? Soniodd Lisa Francis am rai o'r sibrydion sydd ar led. Mae mater pwysig iawn i'w ystyried yn awr, sef ym mhle y gwneir y pecynnu. A allai'r Gweinidog ymateb i'r pwynt hwnnw? Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog wedi addo rhoi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf inni am y sefyllfa, ond, yn y cyfamser, tybed a allai roi sylw i'r ddau fater hyn?

Carwyn Jones: Os cofiaf yn iawn,

powers were transferred to the Assembly on 1 July 1999. If you want to be pedantic about it, we were here, but we did not have the powers. Nevertheless, a grant was made at the time, which turned into a packaging facility in a cold storage area that had been built at the plant. There is no doubt that it has helped Aeron Valley Cheese to carry on with cheese making.

The point about packaging is fair, and something that I want to explore. I do not want to see the question mark over the packaging plant creating a problem for the processing plant. That thought struck me when I heard the announcement, and I will explore that this week.

3.20 p.m.

Glyn Davies: Yesterday's announcement by Dairygold was a massive blow to the Aeron valley and the wider area, all the more because it was so unexpected. I know this sector quite well, and it seemed to me that this plant was the best possible example of integrated development. Closely linked with the development of a primary product from the area, it seemed almost perfect. The announcement is a massive blow.

I believe that it is a consequence of the pressure that the major retailers are putting on producers and processors. I was pleased to hear you say that you will meet the company. I am looking for a reversal of what has been proposed within the 90-day period, although I must say that previous experience suggests that, when we go into a 90-day period, the chance of reversing a company's decision is somewhat slim. Of course, because it is a state-of-the-art plant, you are right to say that it may well be the case that another company can be attracted to the area. However, a principle reason given for its closure was overcapacity in the UK market, and so it seems as though that will be a tall order.

I know that you will do these things and go forward with the best will in the world, but will you also, when you meet the company, try to establish what influence the pressure being brought to bear by major retailers has

trosglwyddwyd y pwerau i'r Cynulliad ar 1 Gorffennaf 1999. Os ydych am fod yn bedantig yn ei gylch, yr oeddem yma, ond nid oedd y pwerau gennym. Fodd bynnag, rhoddwyd grant ar y pryd, grant a barodd greu'r ganolfan becynnu mewn storfa oer a oedd wedi'i hadeiladu yn y ffatri. Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw wedi helpu Caws Dyffryn Aeron i fwrw ymlaen â gwneud caws.

Mae'r pwynt am y pecynnu'n un teg, ac yn rhywbeth yr wyf am edrych arno. Nid wyf am weld yr ansicrwydd ynghylch y ffatri becynnu'n peri problem i'r ffatri brosesu. Daeth hynny i'm meddwl pan glywais y cyhoeddiad, ac edrychaf ar hynny yr wythnos hon.

Glyn Davies: Yr oedd cyhoeddiad Dairygold ddod yn ergyd anferth i ddyffryn Aeron a'r cyffiniau, ac yn fwy felly oherwydd ei fod mor annisgwyl. Yr wyf yn eithaf cyfarwydd â'r sector hwn, ac yr oedd yn ymddangos i mi mai'r ffatri hon oedd yr enghraifft orau posibl o ddatblygu integredig. Gyda'i chysylltiad clòs â datblygu cynnyrch cynradd o'r ardal, yr oedd i bob golwg bron yn berffaith. Mae'r cyhoeddiad yn ergyd anferth.

Credaf ei fod yn ganlyniad i'r pwysau y mae'r prif fanwerthwyr yn ei roi ar gynhyrchwyr a phroseswyr. Yr oeddwn yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud y byddwch yn cyfarfod â'r cwmni. Yr wyf yn gobeithio gweld gwrthdroi'r hyn sydd wedi'i gynnig o fewn y cyfnod 90 diwrnod, er bod rhaid i mi ddweud yn sgîl profiadau'r gorffennol, pan fyddwn yn mynd i'r cyfnod 90-diwrnod, mai anaml y llwyddir i wrthdroi penderfyniad cwmni. Wrth gwrs, oherwydd bod y ffatri hon yn un o'r rhai diweddaraf, yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud y gall fod modd denu cwmni arall i'r ardal. Fodd bynnag, un o'r prif resymau a roddwyd dros ei chau oedd gorgapasiti ym marchnad y DU, ac felly, mae'n ymddangos y bydd hynny'n dipyn o dasg.

Gwn y byddwch yn gwneud y pethau hyn ac yn bwrw ymlaen gyda'r ewyllys gorau yn y byd, ond a wnewch hefyd, wrth gyfarfod â'r cwmni, geisio gweld pa ddylanwad y mae'r pwysau o du'r prif fanwerthwyr wedi'i gael

had on this process? That is behind an awful lot of pressure, and we need to understand that dynamic properly if we are to avoid having the same kind of announcement coming out of the blue and shocking us in the future.

Carwyn Jones: I will certainly explore that. I would want to know exactly what problems there were, if indeed it is a problem with this plant, and we do not yet know that it is. The plant itself has several advantages, one of which is its state-of-the-art laser cutting facility that minimises the loss of cheese, which inevitably means that costs are minimised as a result. It has that ability to save costs. When I meet the company, at this stage, we need to know exactly what the situation is. Frankly, I do not think that it matters who runs the plant, as long as someone does. If a buyer can be found, that is all well and good, and the plant can continue operating. We are not talking about a plant that has suffered from underinvestment for many years and therefore needs a lot of money spent on it to bring it up to standard; it is quite different now, and I think that that will stand the plant in good stead and give it a fighting chance of survival.

Brynle Williams: Thank you for your statement this afternoon, although it contained sad news. I sympathise with the 115 people who might lose their jobs. If, regrettably, it goes to the far end, it troubles me that this plant may be stripped out, asset-stripped, or whatever you want to say—plant gone back to Ireland, something like that—and I ask for some assurance on that. Let us hope that it can be sold in its entirety.

I would also like to mention the delicacy of the milk industry and, regrettably, this is the third plant in Wales that has gone out of production in the last 12 months. I know that we cannot interfere politically in the free market, but, as Glyn Davies said, we should be looking at the other side of the issue. Contracts for dairy products, milk and so on, are issued for only six or maybe nine months. Should we be looking to ask the dairy companies to honour those contracts or to extend them to two or three years, to get

ar y broses hon? Hynny sydd y tu ôl i lawer iawn o'r pwysau, a rhaid inni ddeall y ddeinameg yn iawn os ydym am osgoi cael ein hysgwyd gan yr un math o gyhoeddiad disymwth yn y dyfodol.

Carwyn Jones: Yn sicr, edrychaf ar hynny. Byddwn am wybod pa broblemau yn union a oedd, os ydyw'n broblem yn wir gyda'r ffatri hon, ac ni wyddom eto mai dyna'r sefyllfa. Mae i'r ffatri ei hun sawl mantais, ac un o'r rheini yw'r offer laser diweddaraf i dorri caws sy'n golygu mai ychydig iawn o gaws o gollir. Mae hyn yn anochel yn golygu bod y costau'n llai. Mae'r gallu ganddi i arbed costau. Pan fyddaf yn cyfarfod â'r cwmni, ar yr adeg hon, rhaid i ni gael gwybod beth yn union yw'r sefyllfa. Yn blwmp ac yn blaen, ni chredaf fod ots pwy sy'n rhedeg y ffatri, cyn belled â bod rhywun yn gwneud hynny. Os oes modd dod o hyd i brynwr, gorau oll, a gall y ffatri barhau i weithio. Nid ydym yn sôn am ffatri sydd wedi dioddef oherwydd tanfuddsoddi ers blynyddoedd lawer ac felly sy'n gofyn am wario llawer o arian i godi ei safon; mae'n wahanol iawn yn awr, a chredaf y bydd hynny'n gaffaeliad i'r ffatri ac yn rhoi cyfle teg iddi oroesi.

Brynle Williams: Diolch am eich datganiad y prynhawn yma, er ei fod yn cynnwys newyddion trist. Cydymdeimlaf â'r 115 o bobl a allai golli eu swyddi. Os bydd hyn, yn anffodus, yn mynd i'r pen, mae'n fy mhoeni i y gellid gwagio'r ffatri hon, gwerthu ei hasedau, neu beth bynnag y dymunwch ei alw—yr offer wedi mynd yn ôl i Iwerddon, rhywbeth felly—a gofynnaf am rywfaint o sicrwydd ynghylch hynny. Gadewch inni obeithio y gellir ei gwerthu yn ei chyfanrwydd.

Byddwn hefyd yn hoffi sôn am natur fregus y diwydiant llaeth, ac, yn anffodus, dyma'r drydedd ffatri yng Nghymru sydd wedi rhoi'r gorau i gynhyrchu yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf. Gwn na allwn ymyrryd yn wleidyddol yn y farchnad rydd, ond, fel y dywedodd Glyn Davies, dylem fod yn edrych ar yr ochr arall i'r broblem. Dim ond am chwe neu naw mis efallai y rhoddir contractau ar gyfer cynnyrch llaeth, llaeth ac yn y blaen. A ddylem fod yn ystyried gofyn i'r cwmnïau llaeth anrhydeddu'r contractau

stability in the market? We know that it is a cut-throat business. Not so long ago, we were importing cheese from South Africa; now we have our own cheese products here and we are shutting plants down, because of overcapacity. Could we please look at the market? Once again, I reiterate, will you please take heed of the delicacy of the milk industry?

Carwyn Jones: I can only repeat what I have said before. Nothing that I say, or anyone else, can ease the worries of the people who work in Felin-fach. I know the area and I know how important the packaging plant is to the area. What the people of Felin-fach and that part of the Aeron valley need to know is that no stone will be left unturned.

Initially, we will try to see whether Dairygold will continue, but I think that, realistically, we will have to try to find another buyer for the plant, given its importance and the fact that it is next door to, or at least not far away from, a cheese-making plant. That plant is possibly too small to keep the packaging plant going on its own, but it is important.

We need to see what contracts are available to be able to sell the plant and say, 'Look, this is a good plant'. It may not be the case that the plant is losing money, but it is a state-of-the-art plant with a loyal workforce, in an area that has a strong and long tradition of processing and packaging in the dairy industry, and it would be an excellent asset to any company that wanted to get involved. Dairygold clearly has its problems, and we want to see who else will come along to ensure that the plant stays open.

Alun Ffred Jones: Ychwanegu at y sector bwyd drwy ddatblygu'r sector prosesu yw strategaeth y Llywodraeth, ond, yn y diwydiant llaeth, ymddengys ein bod yn mynd i'r cyfeiriad arall, gan gollu busnesau prosesu, fel y cyfeiriodd Brynle Williams ato. Pam ein bod yn eu colli, ac a yw hynny'n awgrymu bod eich strategaeth yn wallus?

Mae hufenfa yn fy etholaeth innau, yng

hynny neu eu hymestyn hyd at ddwy neu dair blynedd, er mwyn creu sefydlogrwydd yn y farchnad? Gwyddom fod y busnes hwn yn fusnes didrugaredd. Ychydig yn ôl yr oeddem yn mewnforio caws o Dde Affrica; mae gennym ein cynnyrch caws ein hunain yma bellach ac yr ydym yn cau ein ffatrioedd, oherwydd gorgapasiti. A allem edrych ar y farchnad os gwelwch yn dda? Unwaith eto, ac ailadroddaf hyn, a fydddechystal â rhoi sylw i natur fregus y diwydiant llaeth?

Carwyn Jones: Ni allaf ond ailadrodd yr hyn a ddywedais. Ni all un dim a ddywedaf fi, na neb arall, leddfdu pryderon y bobl sy'n gweithio yn Felin-fach. Yr wyf yn adnabod yr ardal a gwn pa mor bwysig yw'r ffatri becynnu iddi. Yr hyn y mae pobl Felin-fach a'r rhan honno o ddyffryn Aeron am ei wybod yw nad adewir yr un garreg heb ei throï.

I ddechrau, ceisiwn weld a fydd Dairygold yn parhau, ond credaf, yn realistig, y bydd rhaid inni geisio canfod prynwr arall ar gyfer y ffatri, o ystyried ei phwysigrwydd a'r ffaith ei bod y drws nesaf i ffatri gaws, neu o leiaf, wrth ei hymyl. Mae'n bosibl bod y ffatri honno'n rhy fach i gadw'r ffatri becynnu i fynd ar ei phen ei hun, ond mae'n bwysig.

Rhaid inni weld pa gontractau sydd ar gael er mwyn gallu gwerthu'r ffatri a dweud, 'Edrychwch, mae'r ffatri hon yn un dda'. Efallai nad yw'r ffatri'n colli arian, ond mae'r ffatri'n un o'r rhai diweddaraf sydd â gweithlu triw, mewn ardal sydd â thraddodiad cryf ers tro o brosesu a pheccynnu yn y diwydiant llaeth, a byddai'n ased rhagorol i unrhyw gwmni a ddymunai fod yn rhan o'r diwydiant. Mae'n amlwg bod gan Dairygold ei broblemau, ac yr ydym am weld pwy arall a ddaw i'r fei i sicrhau bod y ffatri'n aros ar agor.

Alun Ffred Jones: It is the Government's strategy to augment the food sector by developing the processing sector, but, in the dairy industry, it appears as though we are going in the opposite direction, with businesses being lost, as Brynle Williams said. Why are we losing them, and does that suggest that your strategy is flawed?

There is a creamery in my constituency, in

Ngwynedd, a chyda'r diwydiant llaeth a'r proseswyr mewn sefyllfa fregus, a yw hi'n werth i chi neu Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru gynnal arolwg o'r busnesau hyn i weld a allwn ragweld problemau, fel na fyddwn yn cyrraedd sefyllfa fel yr un yr ydym ynddi yn nyffryn Aeron sef ein bod yn wynebu cau busnes? A ydych yn barod i ymgymryd ag arolwg o'r fath?

Carwyn Jones: Byddai'n anghywir dweud nad oes diddordeb mewn buddsoddi mewn prosesu llaeth yng Nghymru, oherwydd y mae diddordeb. Yr oedd problemau gan rai o'r ffatrioedd a gollwyd, ac yr wyf wedi sôn am y broblem yn Llangadog o ran lefel y buddsoddiad yr oedd ei heisiau. Wrth i ffatri a'i pheiriannau fynd yn hen, a hwythau'n dechrau torri, ceuch eich hunan yn colli contractau, felly bydd gennych fwy o broblemau, ac nid oes dim y gall unrhyw Lywodraeth ei wneud am hynny. Nid felly y mae hi yn achos Felin-fach, a dyna sy'n wahanol i rai o'r ffatrioedd prosesu a gollwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf.

Credaf fod y system yn gweithio, a bod pobl yn gweld bod cyfleoedd yng Nghymru, a chawn weld beth fydd yn digwydd yn awr o ran diddordeb yn y diwydiant ac o ran prynu'r ffatri hon. Gan fynd yn ôl at yr hyn a ddywedais, mae gan y ffatri lawer o fanteision nad oeddent gan y ffatrioedd eraill a gollwyd.

Y Llywydd: Diolch, Weinidog, am eich parodrwydd i wneud datganiad.

Gwynedd. Given that the dairy industry and processors are in such a precarious situation, would it be worthwhile for you or the Welsh Development Agency to conduct an audit of these businesses to see whether we could forestall problems and avoid the same situation that we now face in the Aeron valley, namely business closure? Are you prepared to undertake such an audit?

Carwyn Jones: It is wrong to say that there is no interest in investing in the dairy industry in Wales, because there is. Some of the other factories that were lost had problems, and I have mentioned the problem at Llangadog with regard to the level of investment required there. As factories and their machinery get older, and they start to break down, you find yourself losing contracts, and then you experience more problems, and there is nothing that any Government can do about that. That is not the case in Felin-fach, and that is the difference with some of the processing factories that have been lost in recent years.

I believe that the system works, and that people see that there are opportunities in Wales. We will see what happens now with regard to interest in the industry and in purchasing this factory. Returning to my earlier remarks, this factory has many advantages that the other factories, which closed, did not have.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you, Minister, for your willingness to make that statement.

Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders

Y Llywydd: O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn.

The Presiding Officer: Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:

1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-

1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno

- mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 on the draft Food Labelling (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) (Amendment) Regulations 2005; and*
- ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Rheoliadau Labelu Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) 2005; a*
- b) approves that the Food Labelling (Amendment) (Wales) (No. 2) (Amendment) Regulations 2005 be made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Labelu Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005;*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005;*
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005; and*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005; a*
- iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005;*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005;*
- 2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 on the draft Housing Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2005; and*
- 2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Gorchymyn Deddf Tai 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2005; a*
- b) approves that the Housing Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2005 be made in accordance with the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005. (NDM2678)*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn Deddf Tai 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2678)*

*Cynnig (NDM2678): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2678): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene

Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005 a Gorchymyn Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Cyngor) 2005

Approval of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd a phleidleisio arnynt ar wahân, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next two items be debated together with votes held separately, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2681 yn enw Kirsty Williams, David Melding a Jocelyn Davies a gwelliant 1 i NDM2682 yn enw Kirsty Williams, David Melding a Jocelyn Davies.

I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2681 in the name of Kirsty Williams, David Melding and Jocelyn Davies and amendment 1 to NDM2682 in the name of Kirsty Williams, David Melding and Jocelyn Davies.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005. (NDM2679)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2679)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 in relation to the draft Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005; and*

2. *approves that the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 be made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005; and*

b) *the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005. (NDM2680)*

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005. (NDM2681)

I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. *considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 in relation to the draft National Council for Education and Training for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005, and*

2. *approves that the National Council for Education and Training for Wales (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 be made in accordance with:*

a) *the draft laid in the Table Office on 1*

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft Gorchymyn Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005; a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005; a*

b) *yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2680)*

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Cyngor) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2681)

Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. *yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft Gorchymyn Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Cyngor) 2005, a*

2. *yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Cyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Cyngor) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*

a) *y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno*

November 2005;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005; and

c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly members on 15 November 2005. (NDM2682)

These Orders provide for the transfer of the staff and functions from Education and Learning Wales and Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales to the National Assembly for Wales and for the abolition of both those bodies. Members have been sent additional documentation, in the form of an aide-mémoire, explaining each Order in detail by listing the transferring functions and clarifying the effect of their transfer to the Assembly. I am looking forward to working closely with colleagues from ACCAC and ELWa in developing our learning country agenda.

In light of the amendments, I would like to draw Members' particular attention to the handling of sixth-form reorganisation proposals post merger. ELWa's current powers are designed to facilitate a strategic approach to post-16 provision in response to Estyn area inspections or other local reviews of existing provision. They enable complex reorganisations covering school sixth forms, including foundation and voluntary-aided schools, and further education institutions to be taken forward, particularly where reorganisation proposals extend across more than one local authority area, where this offers the best way of improving provision for learners.

I respect and support the objective that appears to be behind the amendments to preserve and, where appropriate, enhance the role of the local education authority in the strategic planning of post-16 education within its community. It has never been my view that a sixth form reorganisation or closure should be achieved without the involvement and support of the relevant LEA or LEAs.

ar 1 Tachwedd 2005;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005; ac

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2682)

Mae'r Gorchmynion hyn yn darparu ar gyfer trosglwyddo staff a swyddogaethau o Ddysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a diddymu'r ddau gorff hynny. Anfonwyd dogfennau ychwanegol at yr Aelodau ar ffurf *aide-memoire*, yn esbonio pob Gorchmyn yn fanwl drwy restru'r swyddogaethau a drosglwyddir ac yn egluro effaith eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad. Edrychaf ymlaen at weithio'n agos gyda chydweithwyr o ACCAC ac ELWa wrth ddatblygu ein hagenda ar gyfer y wlad sy'n dysgu.

Yng ngoleuni'r gwelliannau, hoffwn dynnu sylw penodol yr Aelodau at sut yr ymdrinnir â'r cynigion ar gyfer ad-drefnu'r chweched dosbarth ar ôl yr uno. Bwriedir i'r pwerau sydd gan ELWa ar hyn o bryd hwyluso dull strategol o ymdrin â'r ddarpariaeth ôl-16 mewn ymateb i arolygiadau ardal Estyn neu adolygiadau lleol eraill o'r ddarpariaeth sy'n bodoli eisoes. Mae'r rhain yn galluogi bwrw ymlaen ag ad-drefnu cymhleth sy'n ymwneud â'r chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion, gan gynnwys ysgolion sefydledig ac ysgolion gwirfoddol a gynorthwyr, a sefydliadau addysg uwch, yn enwedig lle y bo'r cynigion ad-drefnu'n ymestyn dros ardal mwy nag un awdurdod lleol, lle y bo hyn yn cynnig y ffordd orau o wella'r ddarpariaeth i ddysgwyr.

Parchaf a chefnogaf yr amcan sydd i bob golwg y tu ôl i'r gwelliannau i gadw, a, lle y bo'n briodol, i gryfhau swyddogaeth yr awdurdod addysg lleol yn y broses o gynllunio addysg ôl-16 yn strategol yn ei gymuned. Nid wyf erioed wedi meddwl y dylid mynd at ati i ad-drefnu'r chweched dosbarth na chau unrhyw chweched dosbarth heb gynnwys na heb gefnogaeth yr awdurdod neu'r awdurdodau addysg lleol perthnasol.

3.30 p.m.

I need to stress again that the existing power of a local education authority to re-organise its own school provision, under the School Standards and Framework Act 1998, is not affected by this Order.

It is also my view that the amendment to the Order could lead to a fragmented approach and return to the problems that preceded the creation of ELWa, when the LEA planned for school provision, and the Further Education Funding Council planned for further education. I am willing to make a commitment that will enhance the role of the local education authority beyond that which would be achieved by the amendment. The key issue is to ensure that there can be a mechanism to improve the planning of provision at a local level across a range of providers in the interest of the learner. Therefore, I commit the Assembly Government to bringing forward for consultation proposals to delegate to local authorities, under section 41 of the Government of Wales Act 1998, responsibility for developing proposals, in partnership with all interested parties, for the future organisation of post-16 provision in maintained schools, which includes faith and foundation schools and further education.

The LEA or LEAs would have the leadership role of building local consensus around a future integrated strategy for the local area. The arrangements would replicate the current pre-16 arrangements, whereby the local authority proposes, and the Assembly Minister has the role of determination. Management of the further education sector and faith and foundation schools would remain independent of the local authority.

I believe that the proposal to delegate such responsibilities to LEAs could meet the objectives of all parties in the Assembly more effectively than an amendment to the Order. If this approach is agreed, I would bring to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee in January draft proposals for delegation, which would then be subject to consultation with key stakeholders and more

Rhaid i mi bwysleisio drachefn nad yw'r Gorchymyn hwn yn effeithio ar rym presennol awdurdod addysg lleol i ad-drefnu ei ddarpariaeth ysgolion ei hun, dan Ddeddf Safonau a Fframwaith Ysgolion 1998.

Yr wyf hefyd o'r farn y gallai'r gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn arwain at ddull tameidiog o weithredu a dychwelyd at y problemau a gafwyd cyn creu ELWa, pan arferai'r AALI gynllunio ar gyfer darpariaeth ysgolion, a phan gynlluniai'r Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Bellach ar gyfer addysg bellach. Yr wyf yn barod i wneud ymrwymiad a fydd yn gwella rôl yr awdurdod addysg lleol yn fwy na'r hyn y byddai'r gwelliant yn ei gyflawni. Y mater allweddol yw sicrhau bod modd cael mecanwaith i wella'r broses o gynllunio'r ddarpariaeth ar lefel leol ar draws ystod o ddarparwyr er budd y dysgwr. O'r herwydd, yr wyf yn rhwymo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i gyflwyno cynigion i ymgynghori arnynt i ddirprwyo i'r awdurdodau lleol, dan adran 41 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998, y cyfrifoldeb dros lunio cynigion, mewn partneriaeth â'r holl bartïon cyfrannog, er mwyn dyfodol trefniant darpariaeth ôl-16 mewn ysgolion a gynhelir, gan gynnwys ysgolion ffydd ac ysgolion sefydledig ac addysg bellach.

Byddai gan yr AALI neu'r AALLau y rôl arweiniol o feithrin consensws lleol o amgylch strategaeth integredig i'r dyfodol ar gyfer yr ardal leol. Byddai'r trefniadau'n dyblygu'r trefniadau cyn-16 presennol, gyda'r awdurdod lleol yn gwneud cynigion, a Gweinidog y Cynulliad yn meddu ar rôl benderfynu. Byddai rheolaeth y sector addysg bellach ac ysgolion ffydd ac ysgolion sefydledig yn aros yn annibynnol ar yr awdurdod lleol.

Credaf y gallai'r cynnig i ddirprwyo cyfrifoldebau o'r fath i AALLau fodloni amcanion pob plaid yn y Cynulliad yn fwy effeithiol na gwelliant i'r Gorchymyn. Os cytunir ar y dull hwn, byddwn yn cyflwyno gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ym mis Ionawr gynigion drafft ar gyfer dirprwyo, yna byddai ymgynghoriad yn cael ei gynnal ar y cynigion hyn ymysg y

generally.

However, this can only happen if Members consider withdrawing the amendments so that the powers are transferred to the Assembly. We can then make a formal delegation under section 41 of the Government of Wales Act 1998. I urge Members to support the motion as unamended.

Peter Black: I will start by responding to the Minister's offer in terms of the consultation, and the changes that she is prepared to introduce with regard to the local authority's role in relation to sixth forms, faith and foundation schools and further education. Having discussed the issue with the other opposition parties, we are happy to accept the Minister's assurance and the commitment that she has given to bring forward for consultation proposals to delegate to local authorities the responsibility for developing proposals. We believe that this, as the Minister said, goes further than the amendments that we have tabled, and will provide an important role for local education authorities in terms of taking forward and developing their strategic role, in partnership with the Assembly Government. Given that we are happy to accept that, we are also happy to formally withdraw our amendments to the principle and the text of the legislation before us, in relation to ELWa.

It is important that we have that role for local education authorities, and, as the Minister knows, we have expressed for some time our concern with regard to the role of local education authorities in relation to sixth forms, when it seemed that there was a parallel power in ELWa to be taken into the Assembly Government. The fact that local education authorities are now being recognised and given this prominence in terms of their strategic role as part of the framework, shows that those concerns are being addressed. I think that local education authorities will also welcome that. When the consultation goes out in the new year, and the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee has an opportunity to consider its results, I hope that we will be able to take forward the proposals as set out by the Minister.

rhanddeiliaid allweddol ac yn fwy cyffredinol.

Fodd bynnag, ni all hyn ond digwydd os bydd yr Aelodau yn ystyried tynnu'r gwelliannau'n ôl fel bod y pwerau'n cael eu trosglwyddo i'r Cynulliad. Yna gallwn wneud dirprwyaeth ffurfiol dan adran 41 Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 1998. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig heb ei ddiwygio.

Peter Black: Dechreuaf drwy ymateb i gynnig y Gweinidog o safbwynt yr ymgynghoriad, a'r newidiadau y mae'n barod i'w cyflwyno o ran rôl yr awdurdod lleol o safbwynt y chweched dosbarth, ysgolion sefydledig, ysgolion ffydd ac addysg bellach. Ar ôl trafod y mater gyda'r gwrthbleidiau eraill, yr ydym yn fodlon derbyn sicrhad y Gweinidog a'r ymrwymiad a roddodd i gyflwyno cynigion i ymgynghori arnynt i ddirprwyo i'r awdurdodau lleol y cyfrifoldeb dros lunio cynigion. Credwn fod hyn, fel y dywed y Gweinidog, yn mynd ymhellach na'r gwelliannau a gyflwynasom, ac y bydd yn rhoi rôl bwysig i'r awdurdodau addysg lleol o ran gweithredu a datblygu eu rôl strategol, mewn partneriaeth â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. O ystyried ein bod yn fodlon derbyn hynny, yr ydym hefyd yn fodlon tynnu'n ôl yn ffurfiol ein gwelliannau i egwyddor a thestun y ddeddfwriaeth sydd ger ein bron, yng nghyswllt ELWa.

Mae'n bwysig inni gael y rôl honno ar gyfer awdurdodau addysg lleol, ac, fel y gŵyr y Gweinidog, yr ydym wedi mynegi ers cryn amser ein pryder ynghylch rôl awdurdodau addysg lleol mewn perthynas â'r chweched dosbarth, pan ymddangosai fod grym cyfochrog yn ELWa i'w ddwyn dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Mae'r ffaith bod awdurdodau addysg lleol bellach yn cael eu cydnabod ac yn cael yr amlygrwydd hwn o safbwynt eu rôl strategol fel rhan o'r fframwaith, yn dangos bod sylw'n cael ei roi i'r pryderon hyn. Credaf y bydd yr awdurdodau addysg lleol hefyd yn croesawu hyn. Pan gynhelir yr ymgynghoriad yn y flwyddyn newydd, a phan gaiff y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes gyfle i ystyried ei ganlyniadau, gobeithiaf y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â'r cynigion fel y'u disgrifir gan y Gweinidog.

We will also need to take on board the views of the further education sector, which will be part of the consultation. In light of that, we are happy to withdraw the amendments, and to accept the Minister's commitments and assurances in that regard. It is an important way forward, which has been achieved in partnership with all the parties in the Assembly. It is also useful for us in terms of ensuring that we strengthen the role of local education authorities in that regard.

In terms of the motions before us, the Welsh Liberal Democrats will support the merger of ACCAC and ELWa into the Assembly Government. That does not mean that we do not have reservations about not only the way that this has been done but the outcome—the new structure—that will be in place. Much of the detail of that is still to be seen and we are being asked to vote on the Order now, without yet knowing, for example, the situation with regards to the community consortia for education and training. What will happen to those? The Minister gave an undertaking last week that she would come forward in February with some proposals on that, but we are being asked to make a decision now without knowing the outcome of that. Importantly, too—because this is not just about improved accountability; it is being sold to us on the basis of making savings—we are still not entirely clear what exactly the savings will be with regard to these two particular mergers.

The regulatory assessment for this legislation refers to all the Assembly sponsored public body mergers, not just to those involving Education and Learning Wales and the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, and no disaggregated figure has been given for ELWa and ACCAC in that assessment. It says that we will be looking to produce recurring savings of some £10 million per annum from 2009. I note that it is possible to break down the costs so that ELWa is showing an additional cost of over £1 million for 2005-06 and another £1 million for 2006-07 and that ACCAC's costs will be £238,000 in 2005-06 and £245,000 in

Bydd yn rhaid inni hefyd ystyried safbwyntiau'r sector addysg bellach, a fydd yn rhan o'r ymgynghoriad. Yng ngoleuni hynny, yr ydym yn fodlon tynnu'r gwelliannau'n ôl, a derbyn ymrwymadau a sicrhad y Gweinidog i'r perwyl hwnnw. Mae'n ffordd bwysig ymlaen, ffordd a sicrhawyd mewn partneriaeth â holl bleidiau'r Cynulliad. Mae hefyd yn ddefnyddiol inni o safbwynt sicrhau ein bod yn cryfhau rôl awdurdodau addysg lleol i'r perwyl hwnnw.

O safbwynt y cynigion sydd ger ein bron, bydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi uno ACCAC ac ELWa â Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Nid yw hynny'n golygu nad oes gennym amheuon ynghylch nid yn unig y modd y mae hyn wedi cael ei wneud ond am y canlyniad hefyd—y strwythur newydd—a sefydlir. Mae llawer o'r manylion ynghylch hynny heb ddod i'r amlwg eto a gofynnir inni bleidleisio ynghylch y Gorchymyn yn awr, heb wybod eto, er enghraifft, beth yw'r sefyllfa o safbwynt y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant. Beth a fydd yn digwydd i'r rheini? Rhoddodd y Gweinidog addewid yr wythnos diwethaf y byddai'n cyflwyno yn Chwefror gynigion ynghylch hynny, ond gofynnir inni wneud penderfyniad yn awr heb wybod canlyniad hynny. Mater pwysig arall, hefyd—oherwydd nid mater o well atebolrwydd yn unig yw hyn; yr ydym yn cael ein hannog i'w gefnogi ar sail gwneud arbedion—nid ydym eto yn gwbl glir beth yn union a fydd yr arbedion ynglŷn â'r ddau uniad penodol hyn.

Mae'r asesiad rheoliadol ar gyfer y ddeddfwriaeth hon yn cyfeirio at uniad pob corff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad, nid yn unig y rhai sy'n cynnwys Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, ac ni roddwyd dim ffigur wedi ei ddadgyfuno ar gyfer ELWa ac ACCAC yn yr asesiad hwnnw. Dywed y byddwn disgwyl sicrhau arbedion rheolaidd o tua £10 miliwn y flwyddyn o 2009 ymlaen. Sylwaf ei bod yn bosibl dadansoddi'r costau fel bod ELWa yn dangos cost ychwanegol o dros £1 miliwn ar gyfer 2005-06 a £1 miliwn arall ar gyfer 2006-07 ac y bydd costau ACCAC yn £238,000 yn

2006-07, but we do not have that disaggregation in relation to the savings. It would be useful, at some stage, to have that information in front of us.

The general policy of bringing ASPBs into the Assembly may or may not produce savings—again, there is very little detail available in the regulatory assessment—but we are being asked to vote on ELWa and ACCAC today and we still do not know that information with regard to those particular bodies. That is unfortunate and I would hope that it would be addressed very quickly, and possibly even by the Minister in her reply to the debate today.

Leighton Andrews: ELWa goes to the quango graveyard entirely unlamented by me. I arrived here as the constituency Member for the Pop Factory, I spent the first 18 months here as a member of the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee and I have spent my entire time here as a member of the Audit Committee. I witnessed a shocking abnegation of leadership over the whole situation with regard to the Pop Factory at the beginning. In my time on the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, I and many others, struggled for a long time to get sense into the national planning and funding system to ensure that there were proper cushioning and dampening measures and, above all, that factors such as deprivation were properly taken into consideration in the new system.

ELWa has recently been engaged in a pathfinder project in Rhondda Cynon Taf, where its consultants managed to produce, in a presentation to sixth-form and college heads in RCT, a series of options. The consultants presented an option for the Rhondda on a slide headed 'Rhondda Preferred Option', which would have made most people think that that was the preferred option for the Rhondda. It involved getting rid of sixth forms, centralising all post-16 education at a tertiary learning campus at Porth and several other measures. When you dug into it and protested to ELWa, you found out that this was not the preferred option, I am relieved to say. I have subsequently had

2005-06 ac yn £245,000 yn 2006-07, ond nid yw'r dadgyfuniad hwnnw o safbwynt yr arbedion gennym. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol, rywbyrd, cael y wybodaeth honno ger ein bron.

Mae'n bosibl y bydd y polisi cyffredinol o ddwyn cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad dan adain y Cynulliad yn sicrhau arbedion, neu efallai na wnaiff hynny—unwaith eto, ychydig iawn o fanylion sydd ar gael yn yr asesiad rheoliadol—ond gofynnir inni bleidleisio ynghylch ELWa ac ACCAC heddiw ac ni wyddom eto beth yw'r wybodaeth honno o safbwynt y cyrff penodol hynny. Mae hyn yn anffodus a byddwn yn gobeithio y byddai'n cael sylw yn ddi-oed, ac o bosibl hyd yn oed gan y Gweinidog yn ei hateb i'r ddadl heddiw.

Leighton Andrews: Mae ELWa'n mynd i fynwent y cwangos heb ddim galar ar ei ôl gennyf fi. Cyrhaeddais yma fel yr Aelod etholaethol dros y Ffatri Bop, treuliais y 18 mis cyntaf yma fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ac yr wyf wedi treulio fy holl amser yma fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Archwilio. Bûm yn dyst i ymwadu llwyr â chyfrifoldeb ynghylch yr holl sefyllfa o ran y Ffatri Bop ar y dechrau. Yn fy amser ar y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, bûm i a llawer o rai eraill, yn ymlafnio am gryn amser i geisio cael synnwyr i'r system gynllunio a chyllido genedlaethol i sicrhau bod mesurau lliniaru a lleddfu priodol ac, yn anad dim, fod ystyriaeth briodol yn cael ei rhoi i ffactorau megis amddifadedd yn y system newydd.

Yn ddiweddar mae ELWa wedi bod yn gysylltiedig â phrosiect braenaru yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, lle y llwyddodd ei ymgynghorwyr, mewn cyflwyniad gerbron penaethiaid colegau a chweched dosbarth yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, i gynhyrchu cyfres o opsiynau. Cyflwynodd yr ymgynghorwyr opsiwn ar gyfer y Rhondda ar sleid o'r enw 'Rhondda Preferred Option', teitl a fyddai wedi gwneud i'r rhan fwyaf o bobl gredu mai hwn oedd y dewis a oedd yn cael ei ffafrio ar gyfer y Rhondda. Golygai gael gwared â phob chweched dosbarth, canoli'r holl addysg ôl-16 mewn campws dysgu trydyddol yn y Porth ynghyd â sawl mesur arall. Wrth ichi dyrchu iddo a phrotestio wrth ELWa, yr

an apology from ELWa for that and reassurances from the Minister and the chair of ELWa that the proposals are not the preferred option for the Rhondda, despite its consultants saying that they were. This comes down again to leadership. If the consultants are working for ELWa, they are ELWa's responsibility and it has a responsibility to consult sensibly with local communities and engage them properly in those processes and not to set off alarm bells. It is ridiculous.

I recognise there are many good people working in ELWa, and I have had many good discussions with them about aspects of its policies, and I think that they will be liberated by the process that we are going through now of abolishing ELWa as a quango. It has been too technocratic. It has needed political leadership and it has needed to operate as though it understands what common sense is from time to time, and that is widely felt within the education and training communities.

3.40 p.m.

I say goodbye to ELWa, but I do not say thank you. I say thank you to those who have worked for the organisation, who, I am sure will, within the Assembly Government, be able to work in a way that will make for a better deal for my constituents and people throughout Wales.

Owen John Thomas: I welcome the Minister's eleventh-hour conversion on the issue of sixth forms. However, I feel the need to outline the arguments that underpin this case. Currently, if ELWa recommends the closure of a school sixth form, the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning would have to consider the proposal. In practice, her officials would examine ELWa's case and then prepare a report for her. When ELWa is abolished, the process of closing a school sixth form will be drastically curtailed and the Minister alone can make decisions based on recommendations from her officials. There must be a clear distinction between those proposing the closure of a sixth form,

oeddech yn canfod nad hwn oedd y dewis a oedd yn cael ei ffafrio, mae'n dda gennyf ddweud. Yr wyf wedi cael ymddiheuriad wedyn oddi wrth ELWa am hynny a sicrwydd oddi wrth y Gweinidog a chadeirydd ELWa nad y cynigion hyn yw'r dewis sy'n cael ei ffafrio ar gyfer y Rhondda, er bod ei ymgynghorwyr wedi dweud hynny. Mater o arweiniad yw hyn eto. Os yw'r ymgynghorwyr yn gweithio i ELWa, cyfrifoldeb ELWa ydynt ac mae ganddo gyfrifoldeb i ymgynghori yn synhwyrol gyda chymunedau lleol a'u cynnwys yn briodol yn y prosesau hynny ac nid codi ofn. Mae'n hollol wallgof.

Cydnabyddaf fod llawer o bobl dda yn gweithio i ELWa, a chefais nifer o drafodaethau da gyda hwy ynghylch agweddau ar ei bolisiâu, a chredaf y cânt eu rhyddhau gan y broses yr awn drwyddi yn awr o ddiddymu ELWa fel cwango. Mae wedi bod yn rhy dechnocrataidd. Yr oedd angen arweiniad gwleidyddol arno ac angen iddo weithredu fel petai'n deall beth yw synnwyr cyffredin o bryd i'w gilydd, a theimlir hyn yn gyffredinol o fewn y cymunedau addysg a hyfforddiant.

Ffarwelïaf ag ELWa, ond ni ddywedaf diolch. Diolchaf i'r rhai sydd wedi gweithio i'r sefydliad, rhai a fydd, yr wyf yn sicr, o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, yn gallu gweithio mewn modd a fydd yn sicrhau gwell bargaen i'm hetholwyr ac i bobl ledled Cymru.

Owen John Thomas: Croesawaf dröedigaeth unfed awr ar ddeg y Gweinidog ynghylch mater y chweched dosbarth. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod angen amlinellu'r dadleuon sy'n sylfaen i'r achos hwn. Ar hyn o bryd, os yw ELWa yn argymhell cau chweched dosbarth mewn ysgol, byddai'n rhaid i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ystyried y cynnig. Yn ymarferol, byddai ei swyddogion yn pwysu a mesur dadl ELWa cyn paratoi adroddiad iddi. Pan ddiddymir ELWa, bydd y broses o gau'r chweched dosbarth mewn ysgol yn cael ei chwtoegi yn aruthrol a chaiff y Gweinidog ei hun wneud penderfyniadau ar sail argymhellion oddi wrth ei swyddogion.

those considering the proposal and those dealing with appeals.

Sixth forms are a fundamental part of many of our secondary schools. These schools come within the auspices of local authorities, and the future of sixth forms should be allowed to fit comfortably within the same remit. Some onlookers may ask why the Labour Government was unable to see the logic of this amendment. The answer, purely and simply, is that the Government did not seek a logical arrangement for school sixth forms. Its not-so-well-hidden agenda was based on a false economy. It believed that by removing the academic excellence of many sixth forms, closing them and squashing more and more pupils into colleges of further education, it would provide education at a lower cost—regardless of the educational outcome.

Anyone familiar with the education system will recognise the important contribution that a sixth form makes to the ethos of a school. Not only are these older pupils, who have chosen to extend their studies for two years, good role models to younger pupils, their presence enables highly qualified staff members to enhance their teaching skills.

On 4 November 2003, the First Minister stated:

‘If schools provide sixth-form places that are more expensive than comparable provision in a college within a reasonable travelling distance, there will tend to be a switch to funding such education in further education colleges rather than in schools.’

The intention was clear. Only a body such as ELWa or the Labour Assembly Government could have the power to make that switch, or would want to make it. In December 2003, Mr Morgan said that he thought that there would be a gradual transfer of post-16 students to further education colleges. Such a move, gradual or otherwise, would undermine the academic and vocational

Rhaid bod gwahaniaeth pendant rhwng y rhai sy'n cynnig cau chweched dosbarth, y rhai sy'n ystyried y cynnig a'r rhai sy'n delio â'r apeliadau.

Mae'r chweched dosbarth yn rhan hanfodol o lawer o'n hysgolion uwchradd. Daw'r ysgolion hyn o dan nawdd yr awdurdodau lleol, a dylid caniatáu i ddyfodol y chweched dosbarth gyd-fynd yn hwylus â'r un cylch gwaith. Mae'n bosibl y bydd rhai o'r tu allan yn gofyn paham na lwyddodd y Llywodraeth Lafur i weld rhesymeg y gwelliant hwn. Yr ateb, yn gwbl syml, yw oherwydd na cheisiodd y Llywodraeth gael trefniant rhesymegol ar gyfer y chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion. Yr oedd ei hagenda nad-yw-mor-gudd-â-hynny yn seiliedig ar ffug arbedion. Credai drwy gael gwared â rhagoriaeth academiaidd llawer chweched dosbarth, gan eu cau a gwasgu mwy a mwy o ddisgyblion i golegau addysg bellach, y byddai'n darparu addysg yn rhatach—ni waeth beth fyddai'r canlyniad addysgol.

Bydd unrhyw un sy'n gyfarwydd â'r system addysg yn cydnabod y cyfraniad pwysig a wna'r chweched dosbarth i ethos ysgol. Mae'r disgyblion hyn hyn, a ddewisodd ymestyn eu hastudiaethau am ddwy flynedd, nid yn unig yn fodelau rôl da i ddisgyblion iau, ond mae eu presenoldeb hefyd yn galluogi aelodau o'r staff sydd â chymwysterau da i wella eu sgiliau addysgu.

Ar 4 Tachwedd 2003, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog:

‘Os yw ysgolion yn darparu lleoedd mewn chweched dosbarth sy'n ddrutach na darpariaeth debyg mewn coleg sydd o fewn pellter teithio rhesymol, bydd tuedd i newid at gyllido addysg o'r fath mewn colegau addysg bellach yn hytrach nag mewn ysgolion.’

Yr oedd y bwriad yn glir. Dim ond corff megis ELWa neu Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a allai feddu ar y grym i gyflawni'r newid hwnnw, neu a fyddai eisiau ei gyflawni. Yn Rhagfyr 2003, dywedodd Mr Morgan y credai y byddai myfyrwyr ôl-16 yn cael eu trosglwyddo'n raddol i golegau addysg bellach. Byddai symudiad o'r fath, boed hynny'n raddol ai peidio, yn tanseilio

sectors of our education system. An increase in the number of students concentrating on academic courses in colleges of further education would reduce the number of vocational courses, and the reduction of the number of sixth forms in our secondary schools would reduce academic standards.

Jenny Randerson: Are you saying that further education establishments cannot supply excellent education? Are you ignoring the fact that the vast majority of pupils taking A-levels or equivalent qualifications at an advanced level do so in further education establishments? Should they not be funded, as well as schools, rather than be put down in that way?

Owen John Thomas: I am not putting them down. What I am saying is that, if you force children of an academic tendency out of sixth forms, you diminish the schools themselves and you put the vocational bias in further education at risk. I would like to see more pupils being given the opportunity to pursue a vocational education in an atmosphere in which they feel that they are at the top, and not second string to children following academic courses.

If we are to help more pupils to fulfil their potential in vocational and academic fields of study, we must ensure that powers in terms of the future organisation of sixth forms are restored to local authorities to avoid what is a clearly dangerous move towards mediocrity. I am glad that the Minister has belatedly come to share that point of view.

Jonathan Morgan: I was a member of the Post-16 Education and Training Committee when it established what was then the National Council for Education and Training in Wales, and I do not recall there being the level of disquiet among your colleagues that you are now expressing.

Owen John Thomas: Clearly, Jonathan, you did not listen as well as you should have.

Jeff Cuthbert: In response to the points

sector academaidd a sector galwedigaethol ein system addysg. Byddai cynnydd yn nifer y myfyrwyr a fyddai'n canolbwyntio ar gyrisiau academaidd mewn colegau addysg bellach yn gostwng nifer y cyrsiau galwedigaethol, a byddai gostwng nifer y dosbarthiadau chwech yn ein hysgolion uwchradd yn gostwng y safonau academaidd.

Jenny Randerson: Ai dweud yr ydych na all sefydliadau addysg bellach ddarparu addysg ardderchog? A ydych yn anwybyddu'r ffaith bod mwyafrif helaeth y disgyblion sy'n dilyn cyrsiau safon uwch neu gymwysterau cyfatebol ar lefel uwch yn gwneud hynny mewn sefydliadau addysg bellach? Oni ddylent gael eu hariannu, yn ogystal ag ysgolion, yn hytrach na chael eu sarhau fel hyn?

Owen John Thomas: Nid wyf yn eu sarhau. Yr hyn yr wyf yn ei ddweud ydyw, os gorfodwch ddisgyblion sydd â thueddiad academaidd i fynd o'r chweched dosbarth, yr ydych yn gwanychu'r ysgolion eu hunain gan roi'r pwyslais galwedigaethol mewn addysg bellach yn y fantol. Hoffwn weld rhagor o ddisgyblion yn cael y cyfle i ddilyn addysg alwedigaethol mewn awyrgylch lle y teimlant eu bod ar y brig, ac nid yn eilradd o'u cymharu â phlant sy'n dilyn cyrsiau academaidd.

Os ydym am helpu rhagor o ddisgyblion i wireddu eu potensial mewn meysydd astudio galwedigaethol ac academaidd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod y pwerau ynglŷn â threfniant y chweched dosbarth i'r dyfodol yn cael eu hadfer i'r awdurdodau lleol er mwyn osgoi'r hyn sy'n symudiad tuag at gyffredinedd, symudiad sy'n amlwg yn un peryglus. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog yn ddiweddar wedi dod i gyd-fynd â'r safbwynt hwn.

Jonathan Morgan: Yr oeddwn yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Hyfforddiant Ôl-16 pan sefydlodd yr hyn a elwid y pryd hynny yn Gyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant, ac ni chofiaf fod cymaint o anesmwythyd ymysg eich cyd-Aelodau ag a fynegwch yn awr.

Owen John Thomas: Mae'n amlwg, Jonathan, na wrandawasoch mor astud ag y dylech.

Jeff Cuthbert: Mewn ymateb i'r pwyntiau a

made by Owen John, it is quite outrageous to suggest that anyone on this side of the house has suggested that young people would be forced against their will, presumably, out of a school setting into a college setting, if that was not the right choice for them. We have pursued the issues loyally and honestly, in the spirit of collaboration, and this move, outlined by the Minister, supports that.

I agree with Leighton Andrews that it is right and proper that ELWa comes in-house, particularly if the WDA is involved, because that will allow us to produce joined-up thinking in terms of lifelong learning and economic development. I have made those points a number of times. The only assurance that I would seek, at this stage, is that, in this collaborative agenda, if local authorities are to be the prime movers, we do not end up with a situation where FE colleges and work-based learning providers are somehow sidelined. They should be full partners in any discussion. The outcome of those discussions will reflect the overall package based on what is best for the learner, whether that be traditional academic education or vocational education. I particularly endorse the points made by a number of speakers today that the colleges that provide A-level courses do so in the right environment for the learner and that their results are as good as anyone else's.

William Graham: The Welsh Conservatives broadly welcome the Minister's intentions today. We have no qualms about the end of ELWa. We welcome the realisation that the responsibility will now be administered by the LEA. We hope that the Minister has taken on board representations made by the WLGA. Secondary schools throughout Wales will no doubt welcome the clarity of funding streams that will help restore opportunities for promoting sixth-form education in our schools and enable them to respond to the specific needs of their local communities. We welcome and look forward to the consultation and trust that, when this is properly discussed in the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee, further points can be made.

wnaeth Owen John, cwbl warthus yw awgrymu bod unrhyw un ar yr ochr hon i'r tŷ wedi awgrymu y câi pobl ifanc eu gorfodi yn groes i'w hewyllys, gellir cymryd, i ymadael â'r ysgol a mynd i goleg, os nad hwnnw oedd y dewis priodol iddynt. Yr ydym wedi ymdrin â'r materion hyn yn onest ac yn ddidwyll, o ran awydd i gydweithio, ac mae'r newid hwn, a amlinellwyd gan y Gweinidog, yn ategu hynny.

Cytunaf â Leighton Andrews ei bod yn iawn ac yn briodol ymgorffori ELWa, yn enwedig os yw'r WDA yn rhan o hyn, gan y bydd hynny'n cynnig cyfle inni feddwl mewn modd cydgysylltiedig yng nghyd-destun dysgu gydol oes a datblygu economaidd. Yr wyf wedi gwneud y pwyntiau hynny amryw o weithiau. Yr unig sicrwydd y byddwn yn gofyn amdano, ar hyn o bryd, yn yr agenda gydweithredol hon, os mai'r awdurdodau lleol fydd y prif ysgogwyr, yw na chawn sefyllfa yn y diwedd lle y mae colegau addysg bellach a darparwyr dysgu seiliedig ar waith wedi'u gwthio o'r neilltu, mewn rhyw fodd. Dylent fod yn bartneriaid llawn mewn unrhyw drafodaeth. Bydd canlyniadau'r trafodaethau hynny'n adlewyrchu'r pecyn cyfan a fydd yn seiliedig ar yr hyn sydd orau i'r dysgwr, boed hynny'n addysg academiaidd draddodiadol neu'n addysg alwedigaethol. Cymeradwyaf yn benodol y pwyntiau a wnaeth sawl siaradwr heddiw i'r perwyl bod y colegau sydd yn cynnig cyrsiau Safon Uwch yn gwneud hynny mewn amgylchiadau sydd yn addas i'r dysgwr a bod eu canlyniadau cystal â rhai pawb arall.

William Graham: Mae Ceidwadwyr Cymru'n croesawu bwriadau'r Gweinidog heddiw, at ei gilydd. Nid ydym yn gofidio dim ynghylch tranc ELWa. Croesawn y ffaith y bydd y cyfrifoldeb yn cael ei weinyddu gan yr AALI bellach. Gobeithiwn fod y Gweinidog wedi ystyried y sylwadau a wnaeth CLILC. Mae'n sicr y bydd ysgolion uwchradd ledled Cymru'n falch o weld y ffrydiau ariannu eglur a fydd o gymorth i adfer cyfleoedd i hyrwyddo addysg chweched dosbarth yn ein hysgolion ac yn eu galluogi i ymateb i anghenion penodol eu cymunedau lleol. Croesawn ac edrychwn ymlaen at yr ymgynghoriad gan hyderu, pan gaiff hyn ei drafod yn iawn yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, y gellir gwneud

However, as I said, I concur with comments made by previous speakers.

Jocelyn Davies: I will speak briefly on post-16 provision in the south-east, which has been the subject of considerable controversy, particularly that of Coleg Gwent. You must remember that in some areas of the south-east, there is little sixth-form provision. Some communities rely almost entirely on colleges for post-16 provision and some of those communities are deprived, particularly in Torfaen and Blaenau Gwent. It is vital, therefore, that provision inspires learners and potential learners to raise their expectations and ambitions.

You will know, Minister, that I have raised concerns before in the Chamber about provision at the Ebbw Vale and Pontypool campuses, where courses were cut because they were considered uneconomic. We have seen a reduction in the range of subjects on offer and courses for each subject. In Pontypool, you cannot now undertake courses as basic as GCSE science or art to A-level or foundation level. I attended a grammar school and I do not advocate sixth forms; I did not enter the sixth form in my grammar school. I took my A-levels at the local college and managed to get three 'A' grades, so you can have excellent provision outside the school setting and I assure you that Crosskeys College offers excellent provision. However, when my old school ceased to be a grammar school and became a comprehensive, the best teachers immediately applied for jobs at Crosskeys College because they wanted to teach sixth-form, A-level students. So, there may be something in what Owen John is saying, but we certainly should not think that colleges cannot offer academic excellence.

On the problems in Ebbw Vale and Pontypool, you can no longer take engineering in Ebbw Vale; you have to travel all the way to Nash in Newport for that. There is little or no competition with sixth forms, so market forces do not improve matters for learners or potential learners. It is

rhagor o bwyntiau. Fodd bynnag, fel y dywedais, yr wyf yn cyd-fynd â sylwadau a wnaed gan siaradwyr blaenorol.

Jocelyn Davies: Siaradaf yn fyr am y ddarpariaeth ôl-16 yn y de-ddwyrain, y bu cryn ddadlau yn ei chylch, yn enwedig yr hyn a geir yng Ngholeg Gwent. Rhaid ichi gofio nad oes fawr o ddarpariaeth o ran addysg chweched dosbarth mewn rhai rhannau o'r de-ddwyrain. Mae rhai cymunedau'n dibynnu'n llwyr bron ar golegau am ddarpariaeth ôl-16 ac mae rhai o'r cymunedau hynny'n ddifreintiedig, yn enwedig yn Nhor-faen a Blaenau Gwent. Mae'n hollbwysig, felly, y bydd y ddarpariaeth yn rhoi hwb i ddisgwyliadau a dyheadau dysgwyr a darpar ddysgwyr.

Gwyddoch, Weinidog, fy mod wedi mynegi pryderon o'r blaen yn y Siambr ynghylch y ddarpariaeth ar gampysau Glynebwy a Phont-y-pŵl, lle y diddymwyd cyrsiau gan eu bod yn cael eu hystyried yn aneconomaidd. Gwelsom gwtogi'r dewis o bynciau a gynigir a'r cyrsiau ar gyfer pob pwnc. Ym Mhont-y-pŵl, ni allwch bellach ddilyn cyrsiau mor sylfaenol â TGAU mewn gwyddoniaeth neu gelf ar Safon Uwch neu lefel sylfaen. Derbyniais fy addysg mewn ysgol ramadeg ac nid wyf yn bleidiol i ddosbarthiadau chwech; nid euthum i'r chweched dosbarth yn fy ysgol ramadeg. Sefais fy arholiadau Safon Uwch yn y coleg lleol a llwyddo i gael tair gradd 'A', felly gellir cael darpariaeth ragorol y tu allan i'r ysgol ac yr wyf yn eich sicrhau bod Coleg Crosskeys yn cynnig darpariaeth ragorol. Fodd bynnag, pan beidiodd fy hen ysgol â bod yn ysgol ramadeg a throi'n ysgol gyfun, ymgeisiodd yr athrawon gorau am swyddi yng Ngholeg Crosskeys yn syth oherwydd bod arnynt eisiau dysgu myfyrwyr Safon Uwch, chweched dosbarth. Felly, mae'n bosibl bod rhywbeth yn yr hyn a ddywed Owen John ond, yn sicr, ni ddylem gredu na all colegau gynnig rhagoriaeth academaidd.

Ynghylch y problemau yng Nglynebwy a Phont-y-pŵl, ni allwch wneud peirianeg yng Nglynebwy bellach; rhaid ichi fynd yr holl ffordd i Nash yng Nghasnewydd i wneud hynny. Nid oes fawr ddim cystadleuaeth â dosbarthiadau chwech, felly nid yw grymoedd y farchnad yn gwella pethau i

a fact that many learners will choose from the courses that are on offer at their local college rather than travel to other centres for a course that might suit them better, particularly in areas where public transport is poor.

3.50 p.m.

We have heard in the Chamber that ELWa's powers extend to being able to propose that a sixth form should open. The Minister told us that herself, but I cannot think of one example where that is happening. If it is not needed in places like Torfaen and Blaenau Gwent, then I do not know where extra provision is needed. If it does not happen in areas where you have a sufficient population and where current provision is poor, then it will not happen anywhere. The free market does not have a place in education, because learners in some areas are not true customers who can shop around for what they want. It is a myth that sixth forms will wither away because provision is better in local colleges and cheaper to deliver, because, in some areas, the provision is simply not there. We often hear assumptions that urban areas are well catered for and that learners are spoiled for choice. This is not always the case. To finish, will the Minister explain under what circumstances she envisages sixth forms being created, and, under her proposals, what role would she play in that process? Who would take the strategic view where provision is lacking?

Mark Isherwood: Although this is a debate about motions to transfer functions to the National Assembly for Wales from, and to abolish, ACCAC and ELWa, its implications are highly significant. Introduced by the Welsh Assembly Government in the name of democratic accountability, its implications could, in the wrong hands—and I will not say whose those are—deny real accountability to front-line professionals. As with the Welsh Development Agency and the Wales Tourist Board, the priority must be to ensure that the resulting new Government department becomes, above all, a customer service department, responsive and accountable to

ddysgwyr neu ddarpar ddysgwyr. Mae'n wir y gwnaiff llawer o ddysgwyr ddewis o blith y cyrsiau sydd ar gael yn eu coleg lleol yn hytrach na theithio i ganolfannau eraill i gael cwrs a allai fod yn fwy addas iddynt, yn enwedig mewn ardaloedd lle y mae trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yn wael.

Clywsom yn y Siambr fod pwerau ELWa yn cynnwys y gallu i gynnig y dylid agor chweched dosbarth. Dywedodd y Gweinidog hynny wrthym ei hun, ond ni allaf feddwl am yr un enghraifft lle y mae hynny'n digwydd. Os nad oes ei hangen mewn lleoedd fel Torfaen a Blaenau Gwent, ni wn ym mhle y mae angen darpariaeth ychwanegol. Os na ddigwydd hyn mewn ardaloedd lle y ceir poblogaeth ddigonol a lle y mae'r ddarpariaeth bresennol yn wael, ni ddigwydd yn unman. Nid oes lle i'r farchnad rydd mewn addysg, oherwydd nid yw'r dysgwyr mewn rhai ardaloedd yn wir gwsmeriaid sydd yn gallu chwilio am y fargen orau. Nid oes sail i'r gred y bydd dosbarthiadau chwech yn edwino am fod y ddarpariaeth yn well ac yn rhatach mewn colegau lleol oherwydd, mewn rhai ardaloedd, nid oes darpariaeth o gwbl. Clywn ragdybiaethau'n aml fod darpariaeth dda ar gyfer ardaloedd trefol a bod gormod o ddewis i ddysgwyr. Nid yw hynny'n wir bob tro. I gloi, a wnaiff y Gweinidog esbonio ym mha amgylchiadau y mae'n rhagweld y bydd dosbarthiadau chwech yn cael eu creu, ac, o dan ei chynigion, pa ran y byddai hi'n ei chwarae yn y broses honno? Pwy a fyddai'n penderfynu, o safbwynt strategol, fod prinder darpariaeth?

Mark Isherwood: Er bod y ddatl hon yn ymwneud â chynigion i ddiddymu ACCAC ac ELWa a throsglwyddo swyddogaethau oddi wrthynt i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, mae goblygiadau pwysig iawn i hynny. A'r newid wedi'i gyflwyno gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn enw atebolrwydd democrataidd, gallai ei oblygiadau, yn y dwylo anghywir—ac ni ddywedaf yn nwylo pwy—fod yn fodd i omedd gwir atebolrwydd i weithwyr proffesiynol y rheng flaen. Yn yr un modd ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, rhaid sicrhau'n gyntaf fod yr adran newydd yn y Llywodraeth a geir o ganlyniad

the needs of those delivering post-16 education and to students.

As stated, we welcome the Minister's agreement to consult on proposals to delegate the organisation of post-16 provision to local authorities. This is a step in the right direction, but it is only one step on a journey. Effective post-16 education and training will rely on working partnerships that provide real choice and responsiveness to local economic needs. To achieve this, we must move beyond purely consultative bodies and answer the call by further education colleges and others for the establishment of an effective regional structure within a strong national framework with responsibility for funding, developing and ensuring a quality learning infrastructure. This must involve not only local education authorities, but also school sixth forms, further education colleges, work-based training providers, adult education and voluntary providers and, crucially, representatives from the local and regional business sector. With increased reconfiguration and collaboration between further and higher education gathering pace, representatives of the higher education sector in the region should also be included.

We must liberate and empower by letting go from the centre and by removing the culture of covert ministerial diktat. Only in this way will we finally address the situation where the latest Careers Wales figures show a decline in the percentage of pupils in year 13, and a rise in the percentage of the year 13 age group not in education, training or employment. Only in this way will we address the situation where the UK is in twenty seventh place out of 30 in participation among 17-year-olds in education in the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, where the participation rate for Wales is even lower than that of the rest of the United Kingdom. Only in this way will we address the situation where a third of young people working in Wales are not in any form of education or training. Only in this way will we address the

yn adran sydd yn gwasanaethu cwsmeriaid, yn anad dim arall, ac yn un a fydd yn atebol ac yn ymatebol i anghenion y rhai sydd yn darparu addysg ôl-16 ac i fyfyrwyr.

Fel y dywedwyd, yr ydym yn croesawu bod y Gweinidog wedi cytuno i ymgynghori ynghylch y cynigion i ddirprwyo trefnu'r ddarpariaeth ôl-16 i awdurdodau lleol. Mae hyn yn gam i'r cyfeiriad cywir, ond nid yw ond yn un cam ar y daith. Os yw addysg a hyfforddiant ôl-16 i fod yn effeithiol, rhaid wrth bartneriaethau gweithredol sydd yn cynnig dewis gwirioneddol ac sydd yn ymateb i anghenion economaidd lleol. Er mwyn sicrhau hynny, rhaid inni fynd ymhellach na chyrrff sydd yn rhai ymgynghorol yn unig ac ateb yr alwad gan golegau addysg bellach ac eraill am sefydlu strwythur rhanbarthol effeithiol o fewn fframwaith cenedlaethol cadarn a chanddo gyfrifoldeb dros ariannu, datblygu a sicrhau seilwaith dysgu o ansawdd da. Yn ogystal ag awdurdodau addysg lleol, rhaid i hynny gynnwys dosbarthiadau chwech mewn ysgolion, colegau addysg bellach, darparwyr hyfforddiant seiliedig ar waith, addysg i oedolion a darparwyr gwirfoddol ac, yn hollbwysig, cynrychiolwyr y sector busnes lleol a rhanbarthol. Wrth i'r ailgyflunio a'r cydweithio cynyddol rhwng addysg bellach ac addysg uwch ddatblygu fwyfwy, dylid cynnwys cynrychiolwyr y sector addysg uwch yn y rhanbarth hefyd.

Rhaid inni ryddhau a grymuso drwy ollwng gafael yn y canol a dileu'r arfer o roi dictadau gweinidogol cudd. Dim ond felly y gallwn ymdrin o'r diwedd â'r sefyllfa lle y mae ffigurau diweddaraf Gyrfa Cymru yn dangos gostyngiad yng nghanran y disgyblion ym mlwyddyn 13, a chynnydd yng nghanran y grŵp oedran ym mlwyddyn 13 nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth. Dim ond felly yr ymdriniwn â'r sefyllfa lle y mae'r DU yn y seithfed safle ar hugain o blith 30 o ran cyfranogiad rhai 17 oed mewn addysg yn y Sefydliad Cydweithrediad a Datblygiad Economaidd, lle y mae'r gyfradd gyfranogi ar gyfer Cymru'n is hyd yn oed na gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Dim ond felly yr ymdriniwn â'r sefyllfa lle y mae un rhan o dair o'r bobl ifanc sydd yn gweithio yng Nghymru heb fod mewn dim math o addysg na hyfforddiant. Dim ond felly yr ymdriniwn

situation where the proportion of young people not in education, training or employment in Wales has increased since 1999.

Above all, with the 14-19 agenda debated here last week introducing a system of selection that dare not speak its name, with the strength and abilities of each young person to be identified, and many then moved around between different education and training providers, we must allow regional common sense to prevail so that young people of similar strengths and abilities may instead be taught together in the most appropriate learning environment, with parity of esteem between each provider, be it school, college or workplace. We must put behind us the stale selection debate of yesteryear and instead recognise that efficiency, education, training and the social skills required by employers are best delivered in an environment where young people learn together with their peers rather than in isolation all over the place.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I thank Members for their contribution to the debate, and the willingness of all parties to look at getting the right mechanisms in place to have a strategic overview at the local level and for local authorities to have that function delegated to them on behalf of the Assembly Government.

It is important to say, as I have done on many occasions in the Chamber and in committee, that the Assembly Government welcomes quality provision in school sixth-forms, work-based learning and colleges. The whole of our agenda over the last few years has been about driving up the quality of provision. It is an extremely important agenda to us all. However, it is also important that we give young people more choices so that they can develop their own learning pathway and that we provide the right support for them to do so. Our agenda has also been about the right collaboration between schools, between schools and colleges, and between schools, colleges and

â'r sefyllfa lle y mae cyfran y bobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na chyflogaeth yng Nghymru wedi cynyddu ers 1999.

Yn anad dim, gan fod yr agenda 14-19 y cafwyd dadl arni yma yr wythnos diwethaf yn cyflwyno system o ddethol heb fentro cyfaddef hynny, gan y bydd cryfder a galluoedd pob unigolyn ifanc yn cael eu nodi, a llawer ohonynt yn cael eu symud o gwmpas wedyn rhwng gwahanol ddarparwyr addysg a hyfforddiant, rhaid inni adael i synnwyr cyffredin y rhanbarthau ennill y dydd fel y gellir, yn lle hynny, ddysgu pobl ifanc a chanddynt gryfderau a galluoedd tebyg gyda'i gilydd yn yr amgylchedd dysgu mwyaf addas, gan ddangos yr un parch at bob darparwr, boed hynny'n ysgol, yn goleg neu'n weithle. Rhaid inni anghofio'r hen ddadlau am ddethol a gafwyd yn y dyddiau a fu a chydabod, yn lle hynny, mai'r lle gorau i sicrhau'r effeithlonrwydd, yr addysg, yr hyfforddiant a'r sgiliau cymdeithasol a ofynnir gan gyflogwyr yw amgylchedd lle y mae pobl ifanc yn cyd-ddysgu gyda'u cyfoedion yn hytrach na bod ar wahân i'w gilydd ac ar wasgar.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniad i'r ddadl hon, ac am barodrwydd yr holl bleidiau i ystyried sicrhau'r mecanweithiau cywir fel y gellir cael trosolwg strategol ar lefel leol ac fel y gellir dirprwyo'r swyddogaeth honno i awdurdodau lleol ar ran Llywodraeth y Cynulliad.

Mae'n bwysig dweud, fel yr wyf wedi gwneud ar lawer achlysur yn y Siambr ac yn y pwyllgor, fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn croesawu darpariaeth o safon dda yn y chweched dosbarth mewn ysgolion, mewn dysgu seiliedig ar waith ac mewn colegau. Pwrpas ein hagenda drwyddi draw dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf fu gwella ansawdd y ddarpariaeth. Mae'n agenda sydd yn bwysig iawn i bob un ohonom. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd yn bwysig inni roi mwy o ddewisiadau i bobl ifanc fel y gallant ddatblygu eu llwybr dysgu eu hunain, ac inni roi'r cymorth priodol iddynt gael gwneud hynny. Mae ein hagenda wedi ymwneud hefyd â sicrhau'r cydweithio priodol rhwng ysgolion, rhwng

work-based learning providers. The additional funding for our 14 to 19-year-olds will reflect that agenda's move forward.

If we are to deliver on this in Wales we need to ensure that, if changes are made—about whether provision is the right provision, whether there is duplication of provision, whether you need to open some provision where there are gaps, and, in doing so, whether you need to change provision in other places where there is duplication or the wrong kind of provision—dialogue needs to be continuous and strategic. That is why it is important that one body has the functions delegated to it to be able to lead that sort of dialogue at the local level.

There have not been any bids to open new sixth-forms in Wales. When you look at the number of children who are likely to be absent from our education system by 2013, it behoves us even more to ensure that the provision we have is utterly appropriate to the needs of the learner. Mark talked about working in partnership with a responsiveness to local economic needs; that is right at the heart of the 14 to 19 agenda changes.

Not only is there no selection in any covert way in Wales; there is no selection in Wales in an overt way. We fully support our comprehensive system. However, we want to ensure the best possible opportunities for learners and I am grateful to Members for enabling us to work together on achieving that through this important transfer of functions. Let us not lose sight of the opportunities that will come to all of us, politically, as a result of ELWa and ACCAC coming into the Assembly Government and the increased political accountability that follow.

*Cynnig (NDM2679): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2679): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick

ysgolion a cholegau, a rhwng ysgolion, colegau a darparwyr dysgu seiliedig ar waith. Bydd y cyllid ychwanegol ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 oed yn dangos bod yr agenda'n symud ymlaen.

Os ydym i fynd â'r maen i'r wal ar y mater hwn yng Nghymru, rhaid inni sicrhau, os gwneir newidiadau—ynghylch a yw'r ddarpariaeth yn briodol, a oes dyblygu yn y ddarpariaeth, a oes angen cynnig darpariaeth i lenwi bylchau, ac, wrth wneud hynny, a oes angen newid darpariaeth mewn mannau eraill lle y mae dyblygu neu ddarpariaeth anaddas—rhaid i'r ddeialog fod yn barhaus ac yn strategol. Dyna pam y mae'n bwysig dirprwyo'r swyddogaethau i un corff fel y gall ddechrau deialog o'r fath ar lefel leol.

Ni chafwyd dim ceisiadau i agor dosbarthiadau chwech newydd yng Nghymru. O ystyried nifer y plant sydd yn debygol o fod yn absennol o'n system addysg erbyn 2013, dylem wneud mwy byth i sicrhau bod y ddarpariaeth sydd gennym yn gwbl addas i ddiwallu anghenion y dysgwyr. Soniodd Mark am weithio mewn partneriaeth gan fod yn ymatebol i anghenion economaidd lleol; mae hynny wrth wraidd y newidiadau yn yr agenda 14 i 19.

Nid oes dethol mewn modd dirgel yng Nghymru, ac nid oes dethol mewn modd agored yng Nghymru ychwaith. Llwyf gefnogwn ein system ysgolion cyfun. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym am sicrhau'r cyfleoedd gorau posibl i ddysgwyr ac yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Aelodau am ein galluogi i weithio gyda'n gilydd i sicrhau hynny drwy'r trosglwyddo pwysig hwn ar swyddogaethau. Na foed inni gollu golwg ar y cyfleoedd a ddaw i ran pob un ohonom, yn wleidyddol, o ganlyniad i gynnwys ELWa ac ACCAC yn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r cynnydd yn yr atebolrwydd gwleidyddol a fydd yn dilyn.

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Derbyniwyd y cynnig.

Motion carried.

Cynnig (NDM2680): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2680): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 1
Amendment 1 not proposed*

*Cynnig (NDM2681): O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2681): For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane

Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Ni chynigiwyd gwelliant 1
Amendment 1 not proposed*

4.00 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2682): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2682): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine

Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005 a Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Awdurdod) 2005
Approval of the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 and the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005

Y Llywydd: Cynigir trafod y ddwy eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd a phleidleisio ar wahân, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

The Presiding Officer: It is proposed that the next two items be debated together, with separate votes, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliant 1 i NDM2683 yn enw Kirsty Williams, a gwelliant 1 i

I have selected amendment 1 to NDM2683 in the name of Kristy Williams, and amendment

NDM2685 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

1 to NDM2685 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 1 November 2005. (NDM2683)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2683)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 in relation to the draft the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005 a

2. approves that the draft the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

2. yn cymeradwyo bod drafft Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005; and

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005; a

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005. (NDM2684)

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2684)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 a copy of which was laid in Table Office on 1 November 2005. (NDM2685)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2685)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau

Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005 in relation to the draft of the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005; and

2. approves that the draft the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 is made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005;

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 8 November 2005; and

c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 15 November 2005. (NDM2686)

On 14 July last year, the First Minister announced his intention to merge the Welsh Development Agency, the Wales Tourist Board, and the National Council for Education and Training for Wales into the National Assembly for Wales. The decision to abolish the WDA and the WTB, and transfer their functions into the Assembly, is part of the wider Welsh Assembly Government agenda, 'Making the Connections: Delivering Better Services for Wales'. This is to deliver quality public services to the people and citizens of Wales. I propose that the National Assembly for Wales approves that the Wales Tourist Board (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 and the Welsh Development Agency (Transfer of Functions to the National Assembly for Wales and Abolition) Order 2005 be made in accordance with the drafts laid in the Table Office on 15 November 2005.

These Orders provide for the transfer of functions, property, rights and liabilities, including the staff, from the WDA and the WTB to the National Assembly, primarily by making textual amendments to the Welsh

a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch y Gorchymyn drafft, Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu) 2005; a

2. yn cymeradwyo bod drafft Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:

a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005;

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 8 Tachwedd 2005; ac

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 15 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2686)

Ar 14 Gorffennaf y llynedd, cyhoeddodd y Prif Weinidog ei fwriad i ddod ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a Chyngor Cenedlaethol Cymru dros Addysg a Hyfforddiant dan adain Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae'r penderfyniad i ddiddymu'r awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso, a throsglwyddo eu swyddogaethau i'r Cynulliad, yn rhan o agenda ehangach Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau: Gwell Gwasanaethau i Gymru'. Gwneir hyn er mwyn darparu gwasanaethau o safon dda i bobl a dinasyddion Cymru. Cynigiau fod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Bwrdd Croeso Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu'r Bwrdd) 2005 a Gorchymyn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru (Trosglwyddo Swyddogaethau i Gynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru a Diddymu) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol â'r Gorchymynion drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 15 Tachwedd 2005.

Mae'r Gorchymynion hyn yn darparu ar gyfer trosglwyddo swyddogaethau, eiddo, hawliau a rhwymedigaethau, gan gynnwys y staff, o'r awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn bennaf drwy

Development Agency Act 1975, the Development of Tourism Act 1969, and the Tourism (Overseas Promotion) (Wales) Act 1992. The Orders also provide for the abolition of the WDA and the WTB following the transfer, and consequential amendments to primary and secondary legislation. They aim to transfer functions, effecting minimal change for the functions themselves. In accordance with standard practice, drafts of the Orders have been considered previously by the Economic Development and Transport Committee and the Business Committee.

I commend these Orders to Members.

Kirsty Williams: I propose amendment 1 to NDM2683 in my name. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the manner in which the Welsh Assembly Government implemented the merger of the Wales Tourist Board with the Assembly Government has undermined the morale of the workforce, created confusion, and will not improve Wales's initiatives to promote tourism.

I propose amendment 1 to NDM2685 in my name. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the manner in which the Welsh Assembly Government implemented the merger of the Welsh Development Agency with the Assembly Government has undermined the morale of the workforce, created confusion, and will not improve Wales's economic development initiatives.

These amendments highlight the key difficulties that we have had with this process. The die is cast, and the Minister will have his way today. However, I cannot believe that he can look back over his handling of this situation with any pride, but, if he does, then it is misplaced and misjudged pride. The whole situation has been a poor reflection on the so-called new Government of Wales, and how we intend to do things in the National Assembly. The initial decision,

newid geiriad Deddf Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru 1975, Deddf Datblygu Twristiaeth 1969 a Deddf Twristiaeth (Hybu Tramor) (Cymru) 1992. Mae'r Gorchmynion hefyd yn darparu ar gyfer diddymu'r awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso ar ôl trosglwyddo'r swyddogaethau, a diwygiadau canlyniadol i ddeddfwriaeth sylfaenol ac is-ddeddfwriaeth. Wrth drosglwyddo'r swyddogaethau maent yn ceisio sicrhau y bydd cyn lleied o newid ag sy'n bosibl i'r swyddogaethau eu hunain. Yn unol â'r trefniadau arferol, mae fersiynau drafft o'r Gorchmynion wedi eu hystyried yn barod gan y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a'r Pwyllgor Busnes.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r Gorchmynion hyn i'r Aelodau.

Kirsty Williams: Cynigïaf welliant 1 i NDM2683 yn fy enw i. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dod â Bwrdd Croeso Cymru dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi tanseilio morâl y gweithlu, creu dryswch, ac na fydd yn gwella mentrau Cymru i hyrwyddo twristiaeth.

Cynigïaf welliant 1 i NDM2685 yn fy enw i. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu bod y ffordd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi dod ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi tanseilio morâl y gweithlu, creu dryswch, ac na fydd yn gwella mentrau datblygu economaidd Cymru.

Mae'r gwelliannau hyn yn dangos y prif anawsterau a welsom â'r broses hon. Ni allwn droi'r cloc yn ôl, a bydd y Gweinidog yn cael ei ffordd ei hun heddiw. Fodd bynnag, ni allaf gredu y bydd, wrth edrych yn ôl, yn ymfalchïo yn y modd y mae wedi delio â'r sefyllfa hon, ond, os bydd yn ymfalchïo ynddo, yna mae'n gwneud camsyniad. Mae'r holl sefyllfa wedi adlewyrchu'n wael ar Lywodraeth newydd Cymru, fel y'i gelwir, a sut y bwriadwn wneud pethau yn y Cynulliad

and its announcement, drove a coach and horses through any facade of wanting to do things openly, accountably and in partnership.

The way in which the Minister has sought to denounce the performance of certain key individuals and departments of the WDA has been hugely damaging to the morale of past and existing staff, and was done not out of a genuine criticism of those departments, but more out of a need to deflect from his own poor performance in the past. The way in which he announced his due diligence review was, again, disgraceful. It comes to something when you see the Minister, in an Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting, lean quickly over to a key person heading up one of these quangos to whisper in his ear, 'Oh, by the way, if you have not heard, I have just announced a due diligence report into your organisation.' That individual had no previous knowledge of that. That is not how we should treat our key professionals if we want to keep them engaged with the Assembly and with the work of the public sector in Wales.

Therefore, one of our key concerns is that this process will lead, and has already led, to key individuals' expertise, knowledge and skills leaving Wales because of their dissatisfaction with how the process has been handled. That is not to say that the WDA and the WTB got everything right. Indeed, over the course of the last six years, I have had many causes to write to both organisations on constituency matters and to sometimes be critical of how they have handled individual cases. However, there is a widespread feeling among organisations that deal with both these agencies that this merger will make things worse and not better. Many businesses in my own area of mid-Wales lament the passing of the Development Board for Rural Wales and have found it much more difficult to engage with the organisations as they are currently structured—[*Interruption.*]

I do not believe for a moment that they are referring to anything that Glyn Davies was

Cenedlaethol. Dangosodd y penderfyniad gwreiddiol, a'r modd y cafodd ei gyhoeddi, mai rhith yn unig yw'r awydd i fod yn agored ac yn atebol ac i weithio mewn partneriaeth.

Mae'r modd y mae'r Gweinidog wedi mynd ati i feirniadu perfformiad rhai unigolion ac adrannau allweddol yn yr awdurdod datblygu wedi bod yn niweidiol iawn i forâl y staff, y cyn-aelodau a'r aelodau presennol. Gwnaeth hyn nid yn gymaint er mwyn beirniadu'r adrannau hynny, ond yn bennaf er mwyn tynnu sylw oddi wrth ei berfformiad gwael ei hun yn y gorffennol. Yr oedd y modd y cyhoeddodd ei adolygiad diwydrwydd dyladwy hefyd yn gywilyddus. Mae wedi mynd i'r pen pan welwch y Gweinidog, mewn cyfarfod o'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, yn gwyrô'n sydyn at rywun allweddol sy'n arwain un o'r cwangos hyn ac yn sibwrdd yn ei glust, 'O, gyda llaw, rhag ofn nad ydych wedi clywed, yr wyf newydd gyhoeddi adroddiad diwydrwydd dyladwy ar eich sefydliad.'. Nid oedd yr unigolyn hwnnw wedi clywed dim am y peth cyn hynny. Nid felly y dylem drin ein gweithwyr proffesiynol allweddol os ydym am sicrhau eu bod yn dal i ymgysylltu â'r Cynulliad a gwaith y sector cyhoeddus yng Nghymru.

Felly, un o'n prif bryderon yw y bydd y broses hon yn golygu, a'i bod eisoes yn golygu, fod Cymru'n colli arbenigedd, gwybodaeth a sgiliau unigolion allweddol oherwydd eu bod yn anfodlon â'r modd yr ymdriniwyd â'r broses. Nid dweud yr wyf fod yr awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso wedi gwneud popeth yn iawn. Yn wir, yn ystod y chwe mlynedd diwethaf, yr wyf wedi gorfod ysgrifennu at y ddau sefydliad ynglŷn â materion etholaethol a'u beirniadu weithiau oherwydd y modd y maent wedi ymdrin ag achosion unigol. Fodd bynnag, mae ymdeimlad cyffredinol ymhlith sefydliadau sy'n delio â'r ddwy asiantaeth hyn y bydd yr uno hwn yn gwneud pethau'n waeth ac nid yn well. Mae llawer o fusnesau yn fy ardal i yn y canolbarth yn gweld colli Bwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig ac yn ei chael yn llawer anos gweithio gyda'r sefydliadau presennol—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Nid wyf yn credu am eiliad eu bod yn cyfeirio at ddim byd y bu Glyn Davies yn

ever in charge of, and I can only assume that they are referring to the time when my colleague, Roger Williams, was a DBRW board member. However, they feel that it has been more difficult for them to engage in what they regard as Cardiff-centric and south-Wales-centric organisations, and the move into the Assembly structure makes them even more fearful.

We must also look at whether this will mean a reduction in the quango state. When one looks at the advisory boards and the number of the great and the good that will be giving advice to the Minister, it seems that we have created a quango state, but in a slightly different guise, and we are simply giving it a different name. We have done that, as I said, at the expense of the morale, time and effort of many of the people involved in the organisation. The Minister will have his way today, but we cannot support the motions unless the amendments are passed, and I only hope that his leap in the dark—for that is what I truly believe it to be—will not be of huge detriment to the business and tourism industries of Wales.

Leighton Andrews: I am pleased to support today's motion, and I do so in a different tone from the tone of my comments on ELWa. The WDA and the WTB have had different histories and have had many achievements to their names in the past, but it is a different reading of history when it comes to the history of ELWa. I was slightly surprised at the tone of today's amendments. The Minister is being accused of damaging morale in the WDA and the WTB, although not a single reason was advanced as to why this was true, particularly in respect of the WTB.

It is important, in any new structure, as we go forward, that we preserve the best of the WTB and the WDA in respect of their commercial knowledge and nous, but we should never make the mistake in the Assembly, or anywhere else in Wales, of thinking that the WDA itself is the private sector. One of the complaints that I have often received from people in business is that they themselves believed that the WDA

gyfrifol amdano, a thybiaf eu bod yn cyfeirio at yr adeg pan oedd fy nghyd-aelod, Roger Williams, yn aelod o Fwrdd Datblygu Cymru Wledig. Fodd bynnag, maent yn teimlo ei bod yn anos iddynt weithio gyda sefydliadau sydd yn eu barn hwy yn canolbwyntio ar Gaerdydd a'r de, ac mae'r ffaith bod y sefydliadau'n mynd i fod dan adain y Cynulliad yn eu gwneud yn fwy pryderus byth.

Rhaid inni hefyd ystyried a fydd hyn yn lleihau gwladwriaeth y cwangos. Os edrychwn ar y byrddau cynghori a'r holl bobl bwysig a fydd yn rhoi cyngor i'r Gweinidog, ymddengys ein bod wedi creu gwladwriaeth gwangos, ond bod ei ffurf ychydig yn wahanol, a bod yr enw'n wahanol. Yr ydym wedi gwneud hyn, fel y dywedais, ar draul morâl, amser a gwaith caled llawer o'r bobl sy'n gysylltiedig â'r sefydliad. Bydd y Gweinidog yn cael ei ffordd ei hun heddiw, ond ni allwn gefnogi'r cynigion oni dderbynnir y gwelliannau, ac ni allaf ond gobeithio na fydd y llam y mae'n ei gymryd i'r tywyllwch—oherwydd dyna'n union beth yw hyn yn fy marn i—yn cael effaith andwyol ar ddiwydiannau busnes a thwristiaeth Cymru.

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf yn falch o gael cefnogi'r cynnig heddiw, ac mae naws fy sylwadau ar y cynnig hwn yn wahanol i naws fy sylwadau am ELWa. Mae gan yr awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso gefndir gwahanol, ac maent wedi llwyddo i gyflawni llawer iawn yn y gorffennol, ond mae hanes ELWa yn wahanol iawn. Yr wyf yn synnu braidd at naws y gwelliannau a gynigiwyd heddiw. Mae'r Gweinidog yn cael ei gyhuddo o achosi morâl isel yn yr awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso, er na chynigiwyd dim un rheswm pam yr oedd hyn yn wir, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt y bwrdd croeso.

Mae'n bwysig, mewn unrhyw strwythur newydd, ein bod wrth fynd yn ein blaenau yn cadw elfennau gorau'r bwrdd croeso a'r awdurdod datblygu, o ran eu gwybodaeth a'u dealltwriaeth fasnachol, ond ni ddylem fyth wneud y camsyniad yn y Cynulliad, nac yn unman arall yng Nghymru, o feddwl mai'r awdurdod datblygu ei hun yw'r sector preifat. Un o'r cwynion yr wyf wedi eu cael yn aml gan bobl ym myd busnes yw eu bod hwy eu

believed that it spoke on behalf of the private sector and, to a degree, that it was the private sector, when it patently is not. I spent half of my working life, before coming to the Assembly, in the private sector, and I think that these debates can sometimes get a little out of kilter with reality. I have listened to a debate on the branding issues in Wales recently, and, over the past six months or so, anyone with any degree of knowledge of branding whom I have spoken to has been absolutely emphatic that the brand we are marketing globally is Wales. The WDA—

Alun Cairns: I can only assume from your last comment that you have not spoken to the Secretary of State for Wales.

Leighton Andrews: I have had a conversation with the Secretary of State for Wales, and I have pointed out to him that the brand that we are marketing is Wales. In that regard, I have heard some interesting discussions here, but the WDA brand is simply a business-to-business brand; we are marketing Wales. We are marketing it, and we should be using the full force of our marketing spend, whether across the tourism sector or across inward investment and trade, and this will give us an opportunity to do that. I am glad that we are preserving much of the marketing skill that exists within the WTG and the WDA within the Welsh Assembly Government as we move forward in this process.

4.10 p.m.

However, as a constituency Member, I have had some issues in respect of the WDA. My first meeting with representatives of the WDA after being elected to the Assembly gave me the sense that their approach to the Rhondda—and perhaps this was common across the Valleys—could be summed up in the phrase, ‘Let them commute’. I was not clear that the WDA had much of a vision for the Valleys that was separate from that for south-east Wales as a whole. That is why I am glad that the Minister has been looking at new strategies for the Valleys.

hunain yn credu bod yr awdurdod datblygu'n credu ei fod yn siarad ar ran y sector preifat ac, i raddau, mai ef oedd y sector preifat, er ei bod yn amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir. Treuliais hanner fy oes weithio, cyn dod i'r Cynulliad, yn y sector preifat, a chredaf fod tuedd i'r dadleuon hyn ambell waith golli gafael ar realiti. Yr wyf wedi gwranddo ar ddadl ar faterion yn ymwneud â brandio yng Nghymru yn ddiweddar, ac, yn ystod y chwe mis diwethaf, mae pob un sy'n gwybod rhywfaint am frandio yr wyf fi wedi siarad ag ef wedi dweud yn gwbl bendant mai'r brand yr ydym yn ei farchnata drwy'r byd yw Cymru. Mae'r awdurdod datblygu—

Alun Cairns: Yr wyf yn cymryd yn ôl eich sylw diwethaf nad ydych wedi siarad gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru.

Leighton Andrews: Yr wyf wedi bod yn sgwrsio gydag Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ac yr wyf wedi nodi wrtho mai'r brand yr ydym yn ei farchnata yw Cymru. Yn y cyswllt hwn, yr wyf wedi clywed rhai trafodaethau diddorol yma, ond dim ond brand busnes-i-fusnes yw brand yr awdurdod datblygu; Cymru yr ydym yn ei marchnata. Yr ydym yn ei marchnata, a dylem fod yn defnyddio holl rym ein gwariant ar farchnata, boed hynny yn y sector twristiaeth neu wrth ddenu buddsoddiad a masnach, a bydd hyn yn rhoi cyfle inni wneud hynny. Yr wyf yn falch bod llawer o'r sgiliau marchnata sydd yn y bwrdd croeso a'r awdurdod datblygu yn mynd i gael eu cadw yn Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wrth inni symud ymlaen â'r broses hon.

Fodd bynnag, fel Aelod etholaethol, yr wyf wedi cael rhai problemau gyda'r awdurdod datblygu. Yr argraff a gefais yn fy nghyfarfod cyntaf â chynrychiolwyr yr awdurdod datblygu ar ôl imi gael fy ethol i'r Cynulliad, oedd y gellid crynhoi eu hagwedd at y Rhondda—a'r Cymoedd eraill hefyd o bosibl—â'r frawddeg, ‘Gadewch iddynt gymudo’. Nid oeddwn yn teimlo bod gweledigaeth yr awdurdod datblygu ar gyfer y Cymoedd yn wahanol iawn i'w weledigaeth ar gyfer y de-ddwyrain yn gyffredinol. Dyna pam yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi bod yn edrych ar strategaethau newydd ar

gyfer y Cymoedd.

I wondered whether, to some degree, the WDA's strategy had become overdominated by land development and reclamation rather than by the more business-focused areas of attracting investment, investing in SMEs and so on. So, in those regards, as long as we are protecting the commercial skills and knowledge that currently exist within the WDA and WDB, it makes absolute sense for us to bring these resources together within the Welsh Assembly Government.

Bûm yn meddwl tybed a oedd gormod o bwyslais yn strategaeth yr awdurdod datblygu, i ryw raddau, ar ddatblygu ac adennill tir yn hytrach na meysydd fel denu buddsoddiad, buddsoddi mewn busnesau bach a chanolig, ac yn y blaen, sy'n canolbwyntio mwy ar fusnes. Felly, yn y cyswllt hwn, cyn belled â'n bod yn cadw'r sgiliau a'r wybodaeth fasnachol sy'n bodoli ar hyn o bryd yn yr awdurdod datblygu a'r bwrdd croeso, mae'n gwneud synnwyr inni ddod â'r adnoddau hyn at ei gilydd dan adain Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

It is time that people accepted that that is what is going to happen. It is also time that we focused on ensuring that the opportunities exist for business—in the tourism sector and more widely—to engage with the new structures that are being created, that we focused on getting the business plan for the new operations, and that we ensured that business knows where to go when it needs advice.

Mae'n bryd i bobl dderbyn mai dyma beth sy'n mynd i ddigwydd. Mae hefyd yn bryd inni ganolbwyntio ar sicrhau bod cyfleoedd i fusnesau—yn y sector twristiaeth ac yn ehangach—ymgysylltu â'r strwythurau newydd sy'n cael eu creu, inni ganolbwyntio ar gael y cynllun busnes ar gyfer y gweithrediadau newydd, a sicrhau bod busnesau'n gwybod i ble i droi er mwyn cael cymorth.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon. Er y bydd yn syndod i Leighton Andrews glywed hyn, yr wyf yn cytuno â llawer o'i sylwadau. Yr unig wahaniaeth rhyngom heddiw yw ein bod ni, fel plaid, yn cefnogi gwelliant Kirsty Williams, oherwydd ein bod yn teimlo y bu diffygion yn y broses. Fodd bynnag, teimlaf fod y gwahaniaeth a amlinellodd, er enghraifft, rhwng record ELWa ac ACCAC ar y naill law a record Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru ar y llall, yn un cywir, oherwydd y mae cyfraniad yr awdurdod datblygu ers ei sefydlu yn 1975 a record y bwrdd croeso ar hyd y blynyddoedd wedi bod, ar y cyfan, yn ardderchog. Mae'n rhaid inni dalu teyrnged iddynt heddiw am eu gwaith fel cyrff unigol. Er ein bod yn cefnogi, mewn egwyddor, yr hyn y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ei wneud, nid yw hynny'n newid y ffaith ein bod yn teimlo bod angen diolch, o waelod calon, i'r ddau gorff am yr hyn a wnaed ganddynt dros Gymru.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Thank you for the opportunity to participate in this debate. Leighton Andrews may be surprised to hear this, but I agree with many of his comments. The only difference between us today is that, as a party, we support Kirsty Williams's amendment, because we feel that there were deficiencies in the process. However, I believe that the distinction that he drew, for example, between ELWa and ACCAC's records on the one hand, and the records of the WDA and the WTB on the other, is accurate, for the WDA's contribution since its inception in 1975 and the tourist board's record, throughout the years have, on the whole, been excellent. We must pay tribute to them today for their work as individual bodies. Although we support, in principle, the Government's actions, that does not detract from our feeling that we need to pay both organisations a sincere vote of thanks for their work on behalf of Wales.

Nid wyf yn sicr a fyddwn yn cael trafodaeth ar ryw adeg gyda Leighton Andrews ynglŷn â'r hyn a ddywedodd Chris Bryant ar faterion eraill ond, heddiw, mae cytundeb ar draws y

I am not sure whether we will have a discussion at some point with Leighton Andrews regarding what Chris Bryant had to say on other issues, but certainly, for today,

Siambr, neu o leiaf o'r ochr hon, gyda'r Llywodraeth.

Mae tri pheth pwysig i'w pwysleisio. Er ein bod wedi cytuno mewn egwyddor â'r Llywodraeth ynglŷn â'r ffaith bod eisiau lleihau nifer y cwangos yng Nghymru, a'n bod wedi dweud wrth y Llywodraeth nad yw wedi mynd yn ddigon pell, yn sicr ym maes iechyd, mae'r ffordd y mae wedi mynd ati wedi codi nifer o gwestiynau ynglŷn â'r broses. Y peth cyntaf i'w ddweud o blaid diddymu'r cwangos yw eich bod yn cael eglurder o safbwynt atebolrwydd. Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol y bydd mwy o bwysau arno ef ac ar ei adran i fod yn fwy agored a thryloyw gyda'r Cynulliad nid yn unig mewn Cyfarfodydd Llawn, ond mewn pwyllgorau ac yn yr adroddiadau y maent yn eu paratoi. Hyd at y pwynt hwnnw, yr ydym yn gytûn.

Fel yr oeddwn yn dweud, mae tri pheth pwysig i sôn amdanynt, a'r cyntaf yw'r diffyg ymgynghori. Mae'n amlwg—yr oedd Leighton Andrews yn cyfeirio at yr angen am dystiolaeth—bod y penderfyniad hwn wedi cael effaith ar forâl ac ysbryd nifer o bobl sydd yn gweithio i'r ddau gorff.

Dywedaf wrth Leighton Andrews fod nifer ohonynt wedi cysylltu â mi, yn breifat, i fynegi'r pryder hwnnw. Yn naturiol, nid wyf am dorri cyfrinachedd ond, yn sicr, mae nifer ohonynt wedi mynegi pryderon o'r fath. Mae'r diffyg ymgynghoriad ac arweiniad clir o'r dechrau un, ynglŷn â beth a ddisgwylid gan yr uno hwn, wedi cael effaith ar forâl y staff.

Leighton Andrews: I do not want to labour the point but would you not accept that, in any merger process, whether in the private or public sector, it is not unnatural for staff to feel unsettled when it is going through? There is nothing unusual about this process in that regard.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: What Leighton Andrews is missing here is that people were not only concerned about their positions, which I fully appreciate, but they had serious concerns about the process. For example, the chief executive and the chairman of the WDA were

there is consensus across the Chamber, or certainly from this side, with the Government.

There are three things that it is important to emphasise. Although we agreed in principle with the Government on the need to reduce the number of quangos in Wales, and that we have told the Government that it has not gone far enough, particularly in the field of health, the way that it has set about this has raised a number of questions about the process. The first thing that needs to be said in favour of abolishing the quangos is that you have clarity in terms of accountability. The Minister will be aware that there will be greater pressure on him and his department to be more open and transparent with the Assembly not only in Plenary, but in the committees and in the reports that they produce. Up to that point, we are in agreement.

As I said, there are three important point to be made, the first of which is the lack of consultation. It is clear—Leighton Andrews referred to the need for evidence—that this decision has had an impact on the morale and spirit of many people who work for both bodies.

I say to Leighton Andrews that a number of those have contacted me, privately, to express that concern. Naturally, I will not breach their confidence, but a number of them have certainly expressed such concerns. The lack of consultation and clear leadership right from the start, about what was expected from this merger, has affected staff morale.

Leighton Andrews: Nid wyf am rygnu ymlaen ar y pwynt ond oni fydddech yn derbyn, mewn unrhyw broses uno, boed yn y sector preifat neu gyhoeddus, nad yw'n annaturiol i staff deimlo'n ansicr pan fydd yn digwydd? Nid oes dim byd anghyffredin am y broses hon yn hynny o beth.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Y pwynt y mae Leighton Andrews yn methu â'i weld yma yw bod pobl nid yn unig yn poeni am eu swyddi, a gallaf ddeall hynny'n iawn, ond bod ganddynt hefyd bryderon difrifol am y broses. Er enghraifft, ni chafodd prif weithredwr na

not warned that this was going to happen. It is simply intolerable that people were not told beforehand that these major changes were being considered, and that also goes for a number of other senior executives in both organisations. Let us put that behind us now. There is clearly a difference of opinion on that, which is why I will be supporting the amendment and Leighton Andrews will not.

The other point that I wanted to make concerns the lack of clarity regarding the financial implications of the merger and recognition of the fact that there is a shortfall in terms of a certain amount of the pension arrangements. It is incumbent on the Government to tell us much more clearly what the cost of the merger will be and, eventually, what arrangements are being made with regard to the associated costs of any redundancies and adjusting IT items.

I will end with the comment that was made that we are now going to brand Wales rather than the WDA. All I would say, and I am sure that Leighton Andrews would accept this, is that, in the market place, creating a brand costs substantial sums of money. If you were trying to create a WDA brand today, it would probably cost, at a conservative estimate, between £3 million and £4 million. I do not understand the lack of common sense of a Government that says that it is prepared to throw all that away and forget about the fact that the WDA brand is recognised not only in Wales or the United Kingdom, but throughout the world. The Secretary of State for Wales has also recognised that this process means throwing away a valuable asset.

Leighton Andrews *rose—*

Ieuan Wyn Jones: In view of the time, Leighton, I had better sit down.

Michael German: I am sure that Leighton Andrews will want to readdress his question, because I presume that he will have the same one about branding in a moment.

When the First Minister made his

chadeirydd yr awdurdod datblygu eu rhybuddio y byddai hyn yn digwydd. Mae'n gwbl annioddefol na chafodd pobl wybod ymlaen llaw fod y newidiadau mawr hyn yn cael eu hystyried, ac mae hynny'n wir am nifer o uwch swyddogion eraill yn y ddau sefydliad. Gadewch inni ollwng hynny dros gof bellach. Mae gwahaniaeth barn amlwg ynghylch hynny, a dyna pam y byddaf yn cefnogi'r gwelliant ac y bydd Leighton Andrews yn ei erbyn.

Yr oedd y pwynt arall yr oeddwn am ei wneud yn ymwneud â'r diffyg eglurder ynghylch goblygiadau ariannol yr uno a chydabod y ffaith bod diffyg yng nghyswllt rhai o'r trefniadau pensiwn. Mae'n ddyletswydd ar y Llywodraeth ddweud wrthym yn llawer cliriach faint fydd cost yr uno ac, yn y pen draw, pa drefniadau sy'n cael eu gwneud ynghylch y costau sydd ynghlwm wrth unrhyw swyddi a gollir ac addasu cyfarpar technoleg gwybodaeth.

Yr wyf am gloi gyda'r sylw a wnaed y byddwn yn awr yn brandio Cymru yn hytrach na'r awdurdod datblygu. Y cyfan a ddywedaf, ac yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai Leighton Andrews yn derbyn hyn, yw bod creu brand, yn y farchnad, yn costio llawer iawn. Pe baech yn ceisio creu brand yr awdurdod datblygu heddiw, mae'n debyg y byddai'n costio, drwy roi ffigur eithaf ceidwadol, rhwng £3 miliwn a £4 miliwn. Nid wyf yn deall y diffyg synnwyr cyffredin gan Lywodraeth sy'n dweud ei bod yn barod i gael gwared ar hynny i gyd ac anghofio am y ffaith bod brand yr awdurdod datblygu'n cael ei gydnabod nid yn unig yng Nghymru neu yn y Deyrnas Unedig, ond ar draws y byd. Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru hefyd wedi cydnabod bod y broses hon yn golygu bwrw heibio ased gwerthfawr.

Leighton Andrews *a gododd—*

Ieuan Wyn Jones: O ystyried yr amser, Leighton, gwell imi eistedd.

Michael German: Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd Leighton Andrews am ailgyfeirio ei gwestiwn, gan y bydd yr un cwestiwn ganddo ynghylch brandio yn y munud mae'n debyg.

Pan wnaeth y Prif Weinidog ei gyhoeddiad ar

announcement on Bastille Day, it obviously took the chair of one body that was to be abolished by surprise because he was on his way out of the country and he had to get off the aeroplane. As Kirsty Williams said, the chair of one of the other Assembly sponsored public bodies was told that a review was being undertaken after the announcement, therefore you can see the manner in which the Assembly Government has treated two of the bodies that have served us well in the past.

On the day that the First Minister made his announcement, I set three tests that I am still going to pursue. The first was whether or not, from day 1—1 April 2006—the people of Wales would get a better service than that which they get now, because customer service matters most, above all else. The second test was whether we would lose key staff. We have certainly lost some key staff already and if you, on the other side of the Chamber, have not heard those moans, you have missed what has become obvious to many of us, namely that morale, particularly in the Welsh Development Agency, is at a low ebb. In fact, it has been described to me as the Titanic going down into the waters with the management on deck trying to keep the deckchairs stuck to it. In other words, they are trying to keep some semblance of an organisation while it disappears without trace. That is a sad reflection of the manner in which this whole job has been done.

4.20 p.m.

The third test that I set the First Minister was what I called ‘fleetness of foot’ or, if you like, the ability to have a culture that could deal with the service that we are trying to provide in what is essentially a business culture. Although I accept Leighton Andrews’s view that the WDA is a public body that must serve the public purse, it is its ability to act in a quick and fleet-footed way that has served the country of Wales and some of our greatest inward investments well in the past.

The trouble is that we are trying to merge a civil service culture with a public sector culture, and the two are somewhat different. I

Ddydd y Bastille, yr oedd yn amlwg yn syndod mawr i gadeirydd un corff a oedd i’w ddileu gan ei fod ar ei ffordd allan o’r wlad a bu’n rhaid iddo ddod oddi ar yr awyren. Fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams, dywedwyd wrth gadeirydd un o’r cyrff eraill a noddir gan y Cynulliad y byddai adolygiad yn cael ei wneud ar ôl y cyhoeddiad, felly gallwch weld sut y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi trin dau o’r cyrff sydd wedi ein gwasanaethu’n dda yn y gorffennol.

Ar y diwrnod y gwnaeth y Prif Weinidog ei gyhoeddiad, gosodais dri phrawf yr wyf yn bwriadu bwrw ymlaen â hwy o hyd. Y cyntaf oedd a fyddai pobl Cymru, o’r diwrnod cyntaf un—1 Ebrill 2006—yn derbyn gwasanaeth gwell na’r un a roddir iddynt ar hyn o bryd, oherwydd y mae’r gwasanaeth i’r cwsmer yn bwysicach na dim. Yr ail brawf oedd a fyddwn yn colli staff allweddol. Yr ydym yn sicr wedi colli rhai staff allweddol yn barod, ac os nad ydych chi, ar yr ochr arall i’r Siambr, wedi clywed yr ochneidiau hynny, yr ydych chi wedi colli rhywbeth sydd wedi dod yn amlwg i lawer ohonom, sef bod morâl, yn enwedig yn yr awdurdod datblygu, yn bur isel. Yn wir, fe’i disgrifiwyd imi fel y Titanic yn suddo gyda’r rheolwyr ar y dec yn ceisio cadw’r cadeiriau rhag dod yn rhydd. Mewn geiriau eraill, maent yn ceisio cadw rhywfaint o drefn wrth i’r sefydliad ddiflannu o’r golwg am byth. Mae hynny’n adlewyrchiad trist o’r modd y mae’r holl broses wedi digwydd.

Y trydydd prawf a osodais i’r Prif Weinidog oedd yr hyn yr oeddwn yn ei alw’n ‘droed chwim’ neu, os dymunwch, y gallu i fod â diwylliant a allai ddelio â’r gwasanaeth yr ydym yn ceisio ei ddarparu mewn rhywbeth sy’n ddiwylliant busnes yn y bôn. Er fy mod yn derbyn barn Leighton Andrews bod yr awdurdod datblygu’n gorff cyhoeddus y mae’n rhaid iddo wasanaethu’r pwrs cyhoeddus, ei allu i ymateb yn sydyn ac yn chwim ei droed sydd wedi bod o fudd mawr i Gymru a rhai o’n mewnfuddsoddiadau mwyaf yn dda yn y gorffennol.

Y drafferth yw ein bod yn ceisio uno diwylliant gwasanaeth sifil â diwylliant sector cyhoeddus, ac mae’r ddau yn bur

have asked about this several times. Nothing in these Orders addresses the issue. They talk about the transfer of functions, property, rights and liabilities to the Assembly. They do not talk about the nature of the organisation in terms of its internal culture. There will undoubtedly be a change in culture in all new organisations, and in this one in particular.

The only answer that the First Minister could ever give me was that there would be no change to these issues, but I do not see how there could be no change. When asking what the delegation changes would be for members of staff or what alterations there will be to the existing powers to spend money and take decisions, we need to know whether we will have that fleetness of foot.

I know that the civil service is trying to change its culture, but it has a tendency towards the bureaucratic structure. Reports and issues to be determined are passed up a long chain, eventually arriving on a Minister's desk for determination. What matters more than anything is whether people can make decisions at much earlier points on that chain, without having to refer everything up to the Minister or to a very high level. It is that fleetness of foot that has served the WDA and our people well. Whether or not we are going to have a long bureaucratic line relates back to the issue of a private sector culture, or rather a culture that suits the private sector. The civil service is trying to determine a culture that suits the private sector—

The First Minister: I hope that you are not trying to imply that I said that there would be no change in the culture of the new department. I have said the exact reverse of that.

Michael German: I am sorry. I did not mean to say that you said that there would be no change in the culture. What I should have said, and meant to say, concerned there being no change in the delegations that people have, which are the responsibilities that people have and can hold at each level. It is important that we should hear from the Minister today what changes in delegation

wahanol. Yr wyf wedi holi ynghylch hyn droeon. Nid oes dim yn y Gorchmynion hyn yn rhoi sylw i'r mater. Maent yn sôn am drosglwyddo swyddogaethau, eiddo, hawliau a rhwymedigaethau i'r Cynulliad. Nid ydynt yn sôn am natur y sefydliad o ran ei ddiwylliant mewnol. Diau y bydd newid mewn diwylliant ym mhob sefydliad newydd, ac yn hwn yn enwedig.

Yr unig ateb y gallai'r Prif Weinidog ei gynnig imi oedd na fyddai'r pethau hyn yn newid, ond ni allaf weld sut na fydd newid yn digwydd. Wrth ofyn beth fydd y newidiadau o ran dirprwyo i'r staff neu pa newidiadau sydd i ddigwydd i'r pwerau presennol i wario arian ac i wneud penderfyniadau, bydd angen inni wybod a fydd gennym y troed chwim hwnnw.

Yr wyf yn gwybod bod y gwasanaeth sifil yn ceisio newid ei ddiwylliant, ond mae ganddo duedd i fod yn fiwrocraidd o ran strwythur. Mae adroddiadau a materion i'w penderfynu yn mynd ar hyd cadwyn faith, gan gyrraedd desg y Gweinidog er mwyn cael penderfyniad yn y pen draw. Yr hyn sy'n bwysicach na dim yw a fydd pobl yn gallu gwneud penderfyniadau yn gynt o lawer yn y gadwyn honno, heb orfod cyfeirio popeth at y Gweinidog neu at lefel uchel iawn. Y troed chwim hwnnw sydd wedi bod o fudd mawr i'r awdurdod datblygu ac i'n pobl. Mae'r cwestiwn a fydd gennym linell fiwrocraidd faith ai peidio'n mynd yn ôl at fater diwylliant sector preifat, neu'n hytrach ddiwylliant sy'n gweddu i'r sector preifat. Mae'r gwasanaeth sifil yn ceisio dod o hyd i ddiwylliant sy'n gweddu i'r sector preifat—

Y Prif Weinidog: Gobeithio nad ydych yn ceisio awgrymu fy mod wedi dweud na fyddai dim newid yn niwylliant yr adran newydd. Dweud i'r gwrthwyneb yn llwyr a wneuthum.

Michael German: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf. Nid oeddwn am awgrymu eich bod wedi dweud na fyddai dim newid yn y diwylliant. Yr oedd yr hyn y dylwn fod wedi'i ddweud, ac yr oeddwn yn meddwl ei ddweud, yn ymwneud â'r ffaith nad oes newid yn yr hyn a ddirprwyir i bobl, sef y cyfrifoldebau sydd gan bobl ac a all fod ganddynt ar bob lefel. Mae'n bwysig inni glywed gan y Gweinidog

are proposed and what changes there will be in the nature of the culture.

Lisa asked a good question earlier, though we were batted away and told that we cannot ask questions about individuals. This is not a question about individuals; it is a question about the culture of the organisation that is being brought about. We need to know now whether, in those two key areas—the power to take decisions and the power to take money—we are going to have a culture of a long bureaucratic chain.

I will turn quickly to the issue of branding, because I know that my time is up. I say to Leighton Andrews that the position that he is trying to espouse, unlike that of the Secretary of State for Wales, is rather like saying that Cadbury should be divorced from chocolate. Finally, I ask the Minister—

Leighton Andrews: Will the Member give way?

Michael German: I now have to finish, but, if I can have time to answer, I will give you the opportunity.

The Presiding Officer: You have had only one occasion of injury time, so I think that you are due one more.

Michael German: Thank you.

Leighton Andrews: Mike, I suggest that you have a consultation with the one marketing expert in your party: Kirsty Williams. Any child could tell you that Cadbury is to chocolate what Wales is to nation, and that is why we are absolutely right to be promoting Wales.

Michael German: I thought that you were proposing that Cadbury equals Wales. If you look at your own analogy, that is precisely what you were proposing. That is precisely what the Secretary of State for Wales is trying to object to. That is the point that he says and that you are missing. I have no objection to a change of brand being brought about over time, but you do not chuck away a name that has value in an instant, because, in doing so, you lose the opportunity to deal

heddiw pa newidiadau o ran dirprwyo y bwriedir eu gwneud a pha newidiadau a fydd yn natur y diwylliant.

Gofynnodd Lisa gwestiwn da yn gynharach, er inni gael ein hysgubo o'r neilltu a dywedwyd wrthym na allwn ofyn cwestiynau am unigolion. Nid cwestiwn am unigolion yw hwn; cwestiwn ydyw am ddiwylliant y sefydliad a fydd yn cael ei greu. Mae angen inni gael gwybod yn awr a fydd gennym, yn y ddau faes allweddol hyn—y pŵer i wneud penderfyniadau a'r pŵer i gymryd arian—ddiwylliant o gadwyn fiwrocraidd faith.

Trof yn sydyn at gwestiwn brandio, gan fod fy amser bron ar ben. Dywedaf wrth Leighton Andrews fod y safbwynt y mae'n ceisio ei gefnogi, yn wahanol i un Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, yn debyg braidd i ddweud y dylid gwahanu Cadbury a siocled. Yn olaf, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog—

Leighton Andrews: A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Michael German: Rhaid imi orffen yn awr, ond, os rhoddir amser imi ateb, rhof gyfle ichi.

Y Llywydd: Dim ond unwaith y rhoddyd amser ychwanegol ichi, felly yr wyf yn meddwl bod hawl gennych i gael un arall.

Michael German: Diolch yn fawr.

Leighton Andrews: Mike, awgrymaf eich bod yn ymgynghori â'r unig arbenigwr ar farchnata yn eich plaid: Kirsty Williams. Gallai unrhyw blentyn ddweud wrthyf fod Cadbury a siocled yn mynd gyda'i gilydd fel Cymru a chenedl, a dyma pam mae'n hollol iawn inni hyrwyddo Cymru.

Michael German: Yr oeddwn yn meddwl eich bod yn awgrymu bod Cadbury yr un fath â Chymru. Os edrychwch ar eich cyfatebiaeth eich hun, dyna'n union yr oeddech yn ei awgrymu. Dyna'n union yr hyn y mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru yn ceisio ei wrthwynebu. Dyna'r pwynt sydd ganddo a'r un yr ydych chi'n methu â'i weld. Nid oes gennyf ddim gwrthwynebiad i newid brand o dipyn i beth, ond nid ydych yn bwrw ymaith enw sydd â gwerth iddo ar amrantiad,

with it.

Finally, will the Minister tell us whether all these advisory panels will have the open policy of appointment in the same way as the Assembly has had with other appointments to the boards of the ASPBs? Will a full process be carried out in the same way as it is at present?

Lisa Francis: I will confine my comments to the matter of the Wales Tourist Board, and my colleague, Alun Cairns, will deal with the WDA.

The Wales Tourist Board is currently winning on many tracks, but the driver, it seems, is changing. Is he qualified? Is he responsible? Can he win? Although we debated the outcomes of the consultation exercise that was carried out on the mergers on 8 June, we have not had a Plenary debate on the policies of the merger. That is what operators in the tourism industry would like to see. They have noted that we have not had such a debate, and, at the Wales Tourism Alliance conference three weeks ago, which you attended, Minister, they told me to tell you that. They want to know the tangible outcomes and benefits of this merger.

In response to the 'Making the Connections' document, the Confederation of British Industry said that it was concerned about your Government's lack of a business plan for this merger. Let us face it; any private business worth its salt would have clearly set out a series of deliverables, including costs and benefits, before considering any kind of merger at all. This has never been set out, and it does not send any kind of message of clarity or confidence to tourism businesses. Conversely, many tourism businesses that have been applying for assistance from the Wales Tourist Board would have had to set out a clear and precise business plan before accessing funding. When the Minister therefore talks of 'customer focus' and 'best in class', should the Government not be leading by example?

For those who work in the industry, the

oherwydd, drwy wneud hynny, yr ydych yn colli'r cyfle i ddelio ag ef.

Yn olaf, a wnaiff y Gweinidog ddweud wrthym a fydd gan yr holl baneli cynghori hyn bolisi agored wrth benodi yn yr un modd ag sydd wedi bod gan y Cynulliad gyda'r penodiadau eraill i fyrddau'r cyrff cyhoeddus a noddir gan y Cynulliad? A fydd proses lawn yn cael ei dilyn yn yr un modd ag y mae ar hyn o bryd?

Lisa Francis: Yr wyf am gyfyngu fy sylwadau i fater Bwrdd Croeso Cymru, a bydd fy nghyd-Aelod, Alun Cairns, yn delio â'r awdurdod datblygu.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r bwrdd croeso'n ennill mewn sawl cyswllt, ond ymddengys fod y gyrrwr yn newid. A ydyw'n gymwys? A ydyw'n gyfrifol? A fydd yn gallu ennill? Er ein bod wedi trafod canlyniadau'r ymgynghoriad a wnaed ar uno'r cyrff ar 8 Mehefin, nid ydym wedi cael dadl mewn Cyfarfod Llawn ar bolisiau'r uno. Dyna fyddai gweithredwyr yn y diwydiant twristiaeth yn hoffi ei weld. Maent wedi nodi nad ydym wedi cael y ddadl honno, ac yng nghynhadledd Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru dair wythnos yn ôl, a fynychwyd gennych, dywedwyd wrthyf am ddweud hynny wrthyf. Mae arnynt eisiau gwybod beth fydd canlyniadau a manteision gweladwy'r uno hwn.

Wrth ymateb i'r ddogfen 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', dywedodd Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain ei fod yn poeni nad oedd gan eich Llywodraeth gynllun busnes ar gyfer yr uno hwn. Y gwir yw y byddai unrhyw fusnes preifat gwerth ei halen wedi nodi cyfres glir o dargedau o ran yr hyn y gellir ei gyflawni, gan gynnwys costau a manteision, cyn ystyried unrhyw fath o uno o gwbl. Ni wnaed hyn erioed, ac nid yw'n anfon dim math o neges o eglurder na hyder at fusnesau twristiaeth. I'r gwrthwyneb, byddai'n rhaid i nifer o fusnesau twristiaeth sydd wedi bod yn gwneud cais am gymorth gan y bwrdd croeso fod wedi paratoi cynllun busnes clir a chryno cyn cael dim cyllid. Pan fo'r Gweinidog felly'n sôn am 'ffocws ar y cwsmer' a'r 'gorau yn y dosbarth', oni ddylai'r Llywodraeth fod yn arwain drwy esiampl?

I'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y diwydiant, nid yw

regional powers and delegated budgets of the regional tourism partnerships, which the Minister for Economic Development and Transport has said will be key to delivering tourism locally, are still unknown, as is the dedicated marketing of tourism budget within the main department, which was pointed out by Kirsty Williams. We still do not know what kind of independent monitoring of customer service delivery is likely in future.

On the matter of branding, it is ridiculous that the Wales Tourist Board brand, which is recognised around the world for its excellent marketing—indeed, the First Minister paid tribute to that earlier during questions to him, referring to the Big Country campaign—will apparently be replaced by the mind-numbingly bland title, the Welsh Assembly Government department of tourism and leisure.

Leighton Andrews: Lisa, what the Wales Tourist Board is marketing is not the Wales Tourist Board, but Wales.

Lisa Francis: You keep making that point, Leighton, but Mike's point was equally important. Look at what the Wales Tourist Board has done, and the profile that it has raised. Why throw that away? What is the point to all of this?

The new title is hardly likely to enjoy the support and confidence of tourism operators and visitors alike. Perhaps the Minister, in his response, if he does respond, will confirm that this wonderful title is actually the one that he has chosen. We would like to know because, when I asked the Business Minister, who was covering for the First Minister some weeks ago, she did not know the answer to that, so it would be useful to know. The people out there who operate tourism businesses would also like to know.

The merger of the Wales Tourist Board with the Government was a snap decision for which there was scant and ill-thought-out research—if any—carried out beforehand. It is obvious that little has been done in the wake of that decision. The lack of any clear, tangible deliverables and achievements as a

pwerau rhanbarthol a chyllidebau dirprwyedig y partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, sef y pethau y mae'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth wedi dweud y byddant yn allweddol o ran darparu twristiaeth yn lleol, yn wybyddus byth, felly hefyd y gyllideb ddynodedig ar gyfer marchnata twristiaeth o fewn y brif adran, fel y dywedodd Kirsty Williams. Ni wyddom o hyd pa fath o fonitro annibynnol ar ddarparu gwasanaethau i gwsmeriaid sy'n debygol o ddigwydd yn y dyfodol.

O ran brandio, mae'n chwerthinllyd y bydd brand y bwrdd croeso, sy'n cael ei gydnabod ar draws y byd oherwydd ei farchnata rhagorol—yn wir, talodd y Prif Weinidog deyrnged i hynny yn gynharach yn ystod y cwestiynau iddo, gan gyfeirio at ymgyrch y Wlad Fawr—i bob golwg yn cael ei ddisodli gan deitl hynod o ddi-fflach, sef adran twristiaeth a hamdden Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Leighton Andrews: Lisa, yr hyn y mae'r bwrdd croeso'n ei farchnata yw Cymru, nid y bwrdd croeso.

Lisa Francis: Yr ydych wedi gwneud y pwynt hwnnw droeon, Leighton, ond yr oedd pwynt Mike yr un mor bwysig. Edrychwch ar yr hyn y mae'r bwrdd wedi'i wneud, a'r proffil y mae wedi'i godi. Pam ei daflu o'r neilltu? Beth yw diben hyn oll?

Nid yw'r teitl newydd yn debygol iawn o ennill cefnogaeth na hyder gweithredwyr twristiaeth ac ymwelwyr fel ei gilydd. Efallai y gwnaiff y Gweinidog, wrth ymateb, os bydd yn ymateb, gadarnhau mai'r teitl gwych hwn yw'r un y mae ef wedi'i ddewis mewn gwirionedd. Hoffem wybod, oherwydd, pan ofynnais i'r Trefnydd, a oedd yn ateb yn lle'r Prif Weinidog rai wythnosau yn ôl, ni wyddai'r ateb, felly byddai'n ddefnyddiol cael gwybod. Byddai'r bobl sy'n rhedeg busnesau twristiaeth hefyd yn hoffi gwybod.

Yr oedd uno'r bwrdd croeso â'r Llywodraeth yn benderfyniad byrffyr na wnaed fawr o ymchwil iddo ymlaen llaw, a hynny o ymchwil a wnaed heb ei hystyried yn ofalus, os gwnaed unrhyw ymchwil o gwbl. Mae'n amlwg mai ychydig iawn sydd wedi'i wneud yn sgîl y penderfyniad hwnnw. Mae diffyg

result of this merger makes business and business organisations, as well as us, ask the question, 'What is it really for?'

Alun Cairns: This Order and motion shows that we are approaching the end of the Government's policy on quangos, which is an ill-thought-out, written-on-the-back-of-a-fag-packet policy that is really based in dogma. Now, I was not the strongest advocate of everything that the WDA said and did, but, in general, it did a pretty good job. Our manifesto policy for the last Assembly elections clearly showed that we were calling for it to be streamlined, as we felt that staff numbers were too big and that the organisation has become cumbersome. However, you do not throw the baby out with the bath water.

I say 'approaching the end', but we are not actually at the end, because there is still an awful lot of work to do and an awful lot of uncertainties for the staff involved, which I will come on to later.

4.30 p.m.

This is clearly a sad day for business, a sad day for government, and a sad day for Wales. These key levers of implementing Government policy are now being removed. This is an organisation that was supported by him when he was the first Minister with responsibility for economic development, and then became First Minister. He said at that time, when a new Welsh Assembly Government was being formed, that the quangos would be under immediate threat. That was what was anticipated, because the First Minister was the chief quango-basher when he was a Member of Parliament in opposition. However, at that time he showed maturity, in that he was prepared to work with the quangos, and seek to influence them to go in the direction that he saw fit. Having done that for five years, he showed a clear inconsistency in policy—we are used to seeing that from the First Minister—in that he decided to wind it up. The inconsistency is breathtaking, because our previous debate was about winding-up ELWa, and this is the Welsh Assembly Government which, in its

targedau clir, gweladwy o ran gweithredu a chyflawni o ganlyniad i'r uno yn gwneud i fusnes a sefydliadau busnes, yn ogystal â ninnau, ofyn y cwestiwn, 'Beth yw ei ddiben mewn gwirionedd?'

Alun Cairns: Mae'r Gorchymyn a'r cynnig hwn yn dangos ein bod yn nesáu at ddiwedd polisi'r Llywodraeth ar gwangos, sy'n hances boced ddisylwedd o bolisi ac yn seiliedig ar ddogma mewn gwirionedd. Yn awr, nid oeddwn yn un o'r dadleuwyr mwyaf brwd o blaid popeth a wnaeth ac a ddywedodd yr awdurdod datblygu, ond, ar y cyfan, mae wedi gwneud gwaith da. Yr oedd ein polisi yn y maniffesto ar gyfer etholiad diwethaf y Cynulliad yn dangos yn glir ein bod yn galw am ei ailwampio, gan ein bod yn teimlo bod gormod o staff a bod y sefydliad wedi mynd yn rhy feichus. Er hynny, nid yw rhywun yn taflu'r llo a chadw'r brych.

Dywedaf 'nesáu at y diwedd', ond nid ydym wedi dod at y diwedd, oherwydd y mae llawer iawn o waith i'w wneud o hyd a llawer iawn o ansicrwydd i'r staff sydd yn gysylltiedig â hyn, rhywbeth y soniaf amdano'n ddiweddarach.

Mae'n amlwg bod heddiw'n ddiwrnod trist i fusnesau, yn ddiwrnod trist i lywodraeth, ac yn ddiwrnod trist i Gymru. Mae'r cyfryngau allweddol hyn ar gyfer rhoi polisi'r Llywodraeth ar waith yn cael eu dileu'n awr. Mae hwn yn gorff a gefnogwyd ganddo pan oedd yn Weinidog cyntaf a chanddo gyfrifoldeb dros ddatblygu economaidd, cyn dod yn Brif Weinidog. Dywedodd bryd hynny, pan oedd Llywodraeth Lafur newydd yn cael ei ffurfio, y byddai'r cwangos dan fygythiad ar unwaith. Yr oedd hynny'n cael ei ragweld, gan mai'r Prif Weinidog oedd prif golbiwr y cwangos pan oedd yn Aelod Seneddol yn yr wrthblaid. Fodd bynnag, bryd hynny amlygodd aeddfedrwydd, gan ei fod yn barod i weithio gyda'r cwangos, a cheisio dylanwadu arnynt i beri iddynt fynd i'r cyfeiriad a ddymunai. Ar ôl gwneud hynny am bum mlynedd, dangosodd anghysondeb amlwg o ran polisi—yr ydym wedi arfer gweld hynny gan y Prif Weinidog—gan iddo benderfynu ei ddirwyn i ben. Mae'r anghysondeb hwn yn syfrdanol, gan fod ein dadl flaenorol yn ymwneud â dirwyn ELWa i

first months, focused on the creation of ELWa. Yet, five years down the road, it has moved to wind it up.

Various Ministers have supported the Welsh Development Agency, and have stood shoulder to shoulder in heaping praise on the board members, the chairman, the chief executive and the key personnel within the organisation. Whenever a factory is opened, the First Minister is there, joined at the hip to the key people in the Welsh Development Agency. Whenever those people came to the Economic Development Committee or Economic Development and Transport Committee, the Minister was always jumping to their defence amid concerns by the opposition parties that the organisation had become a little fat here and there, and needed slimming down as per our manifesto.

The branding issue is breathtaking. Even the Secretary of State for Wales recognises the position of the opposition parties. For Leighton Andrews, in his blind loyalty to the Welsh Assembly Government, to seek to make interventions line after line on any criticism of the branding, does not do his political career any good; he is questioning the judgment of the Secretary of State for Wales. I see that Leighton has got up; I was half-hoping that he would make an intervention.

Leighton Andrews: The Secretary of State for Wales is a very fine and intelligent man, but he is wrong on branding.

Alun Cairns: I beg to differ on him being a fine and intelligent man, but on the issue of the branding of the Welsh Development Agency, he is absolutely right. Let us face it—when he was the Minister with responsibility for trade in the Welsh Office, he would have worked very closely and been on many trade missions with the Welsh Development Agency, and would have appreciated the brand that was recognised overseas, which the Minister wants to do away with for reasons of dogma.

This policy has resulted in turning staff

ben, ac am mai hon yw'r Llywodraeth a ganolbwyntiodd, yn ei misoedd cyntaf, ar greu ELWa. Ac eto, bum mlynedd yn ddiweddarach, mae wedi cymryd camau i'w ddirwyn i ben.

Mae amryw o Weinidogion wedi cefnogi Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac wedi bod wrthi gyda'i gilydd yn clodfori aelodau'r bwrdd, y cadeirydd, y prif weithredwr a'r prif weithwyr yn y corff hwnnw. Pryd bynnag yr agorir ffatri, bydd y Prif Weinidog yno, yn sefyll wrth ochr y bobl bwysig yn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru. Pryd bynnag y deuai'r bobl hynny i'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd neu'r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, byddai'r Gweinidog bob amser yn neidio i'w hamddiffyn yn wyneb pryderon ymhlith y gwrthbleidiau fod y corff hwnnw wedi mynd yn rhy flonegog mewn rhai mannau, a bod angen iddo golli'r bloneg yn unol â'n maniffesto.

Mae'r mater sydd yn ymwneud â brandio'n syfrdanol. Mae hyd yn oed Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n cydnabod safbwynt y gwrthbleidiau. Nid yw Leighton Andrews, drwy ei deyrngarwch difeddwl i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, wrth geisio ymyrryd dro ar ôl tro pan geir unrhyw feirniadaeth ar y brandio, yn gwneud dim lles i'w yrfa wleidyddol; mae'n amau barn Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru. Gwelaf fod Leighton wedi codi ar ei draed; yr oeddwn yn hanner gobeithio y byddai'n ymyrryd.

Leighton Andrews: Mae Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru'n ŵr bonheddig a deallus iawn, ond mae'n camgymryd ynghylch brandio.

Alun Cairns: Mae arnaf ofn na allaf gytuno ei fod yn ŵr bonheddig a deallus, ond ar fater brandio Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, mae yn llygad ei le. Gadewch inni wynebu'r ffaith—pan oedd yn Weinidog a chanddo gyfrifoldeb dros fasnach yn y Swyddfa Gymreig, byddai wedi cydweithio'n agos ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru, ac wedi bod ar lawer o deithiau masnach, a byddai wedi sylweddoli bod y brand yn cael ei gydnabod dramor, ac mae'r Gweinidog yn dymuno cael gwared â hynny am resymau dogmatig.

Mae'r polisi hwn wedi arwain at droi staff yn

against staff, and the staff within the Welsh Development Agency against the civil service. We noted that the staff survey, which the Welsh Assembly Government sought to bury, showed that 45 per cent of staff had considered leaving the Welsh Development Agency within the six months leading up to the survey. In response to Mike German, the First Minister asked, 'Do you think that we will accept the culture of the civil service when we merge with the Welsh Development Agency?'. I took from that that he wanted to influence that in a positive way. First Minister, it is fair to say that even Margaret Thatcher failed to break the culture of the civil service, and you now think that simply by merging the Welsh Development Agency with former Welsh Office civil servants you can change the culture. Even large organisations on the stock market are still battling over cultures that they sought to bring together 10 years after merging on the stock market and the high street. Changing the culture is not easy—that is why many international brands develop subsidiaries, because they recognise that it is not that easy. If you think that it is, First Minister, the policy is as ill-thought-out as I stated at the outset.

Staff morale is exceptionally low, and we will support the amendment tabled by the Liberal Democrats. There are key issues that still need answering. The Welsh Assembly Government has still not answered the issue of pension funds. When questioned at last week's Economic Development and Transport Committee meeting, they could not come up with clear answers and are working on the assumption that most employees will remain within the pension scheme linked to Rhondda Cynon Taf. That clearly is not the case and even a straw poll would show that most people would want to take the pension benefits that the civil service scheme offers. Therefore, you still cannot provide answers on the deficit of £40 million, and that needs answers to preserve benefits for those people.

This is a terrible policy for the Welsh economy—[*Interruption.*] I think that the

erbyn staff, a'r staff yn Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn erbyn y gwasanaeth sifil. Nodasom fod yr arolwg o'r staff, y ceisiodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ei anghofio, yn dangos bod 45 y cant o'r staff wedi ystyried ymadael ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru yn y chwe mis cyn cynnal yr arolwg. Mewn ymateb i Mike German, dywedodd y Prif Weinidog, 'A ydych yn tybio y derbyniwn ddiwylliant y gwasanaeth sifil wrth inni uno ag Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru?'. Bernais ar sail hynny ei fod yn dymuno cael dylanwad cadarnhaol ar hynny. Brif Weinidog, teg yw dweud bod hyd yn oed Margaret Thatcher wedi methu â dryllio diwylliant y gwasanaeth sifil, ac yr ydych chi'n credu'n awr, drwy wneud dim ond uno Awdurdod Datblygu Cymru â gweision sifil y Swyddfa Gymreig gynt, y gallwch newid y diwylliant hwnnw. Mae hyd yn oed cyrff mawr sydd ar y farchnad stoc yn dal i frwydro ynghylch diwylliannau y ceisiasant ddod â hwy at ei gilydd 10 mlynedd ar ôl uno ar y farchnad stoc ac yn y stryd fawr. Nid peth hawdd yw newid diwylliant—dyna pam y mae llawer o frandiau rhyngwladol yn datblygu is-gwmnïau, gan eu bod yn cydnabod nad yw'n hawdd. Os ydych yn credu ei fod yn hawdd, Brif Weinidog, mae'r polisi hwn mor fyrbwyll ag y dywedais ar y dechrau.

Mae'r staff yn ddigalon iawn, a chefnogwn y gwelliant a gyflwynwyd gan y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol. Mae rhai materion allweddol sydd yn galw am ateb o hyd. Nid yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru byth wedi ateb ynghylch problem y cronfeydd pensiwn. Pan holwyd hwy yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf, ni allent roi atebion clir ac maent yn cymryd y bydd y rhan fwyaf o'r staff yn aros yn y cynllun pensiwn sydd yn gysylltiedig â Rhondda Cynon Taf. Mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir a byddai hyd yn oed pŵl ar antur yn dangos y byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt am gael y manteision o ran pensiwn yng nghynllun y gwasanaeth sifil. Felly, nid ydych byth wedi gallu cynnig atebion ynghylch y diffyg o £40 miliwn, a rhaid ateb hynny er mwyn cadw'r buddion i'r bobl hynny.

Mae'r polisi hwn yn un trychinebus i economi Cymru—[*Torri ar draws.*] Credaf

First Minister is seeking to make an intervention. I will happily give way if he wants.

The Presiding Officer: Order. I think that you were about to conclude.

Alun Cairns: I was about to conclude, Llywydd, by underlining that Welsh business will look back on this day as a terrible day for closing the wealth gap between Wales and England, because, as the First Minister rightly acknowledges—and he says that he deals in facts—we now have the widest wealth gap since records began, and that is under his leadership.

The Minister for Economic Development and Transport (Andrew Davies): This has been an interesting debate and interesting points have been made. I will, however, try to restrict my response to the Orders and the amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams.

I echo what Leighton Andrews said in an earlier contribution—[ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’] Opposition members are rather like Pavlov’s dogs: they start jeering before hearing what I have to say.

I accept that change is difficult, particularly for those working in the WDA and the Wales Tourist Board, and also for the civil servants and staff who work for the Economic Development and Transport Committee, who are often left out of the equation. It is an unsettling time; I accept that. However, the WDA staff were facing a great deal of uncertainty, particularly those in the regions of the WDA, as a result of the former chief executive’s proposals, under the organisation design and development scheme, to centralise services. We have met with the unions from the beginning—in fact, within two days of his announcement, the First Minister and I met the staff of the WDA and the Wales Tourist Board at mass meetings. I have subsequently met WDA and WTB staff and their unions on many occasions. We gave a commitment to the unions that we would involve them in the work of the mergers, and all the relevant unions have been involved in that from the

fod y Prif Weinidog yn ceisio ymyrryd. Byddaf yn falch o ildio os yw’n dymuno gwneud hynny.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Credaf eich bod ar fin gorffen.

Alun Cairns: Yr oeddwn ar fin gorffen, Lywydd, drwy bwysleisio y bydd busnesau yng Nghymru’n edrych yn ôl ar y diwrnod hwn gan ei weld yn ddiwrnod ofnadwy o ran cau’r bwloch cyfoeth rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, oherwydd, fel y mae’r Prif Weinidog yn cydnabod—a dywed ei fod yn delio â ffeithiau—erbyn hyn mae gennym y bwloch mwyaf o ran cyfoeth ers dechrau cadw cofnodion, a chafwyd hynny o dan ei arweinyddiaeth ef.

Y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth (Andrew Davies): Mae hon wedi bod yn ddadl ddiddorol a gwnaed pwyntiau diddorol. Fodd bynnag, ceisiaf gyfyngu fy ymateb i’r Gorchmynion a’r gwelliannau yn enw Kirsty Williams.

Ategef yr hyn a ddywedodd Leighton Andrews mewn cyfraniad cynharach—[AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’] Mae aelodau’r gwrthbleidiau’n debyg braidd i gŵn Pavlov: dechreuant hwtian cyn clywed beth sydd gennyf i’w ddweud..

Derbyniat fod newid yn anodd, yn enwedig i’r rhai sydd yn gweithio yn y WDA ac ym Mwrdd Croeso Cymru, a hefyd i’r gweision sifil a’r staff sydd yn gweithio i’r Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth, sydd yn aml yn cael eu hanghofio. Mae’n amser annifyr; yr wyf yn derbyn hynny. Er hynny, yr oedd staff y WDA yn wynebu llawer iawn o ansicrwydd, yn enwedig y rhai yn rhanbarthau’r WDA, o ganlyniad i gynigion y cyn brif weithredwr, dan y cynllun ar gyfer cynllunio a datblygu’r corff, i ganoli gwasanaethau. Yr ydym wedi cwrdd â’r undebau ers y dechrau—a dweud y gwir, cyn pen deuddydd ar ôl y cyhoeddiad hwn, cyfarfu’r Prif Weinidog a minnau â staff y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru mewn cyfarfodydd torfol. Cyfarfûm wedyn â staff y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru a’u hundebau ar lawer achlysur. Rhoesom ymrwymiad i’r undebau y byddem yn eu cynnwys yn y gwaith o uno’r cyrff, ac mae’r holl undebau

beginning, including in the nine work streams, which we established to shape the new organisation. There have been regular communications and bulletins from me and senior staff, including the Permanent Secretary.

In answer to the canard that business has not been involved in this process, I have had nearly 80 meetings with a range of business organisations, including the Confederation of British Industry, the Federation of Small Businesses, the Institute of Directors, tourism organisations, such as the Wales Tourism Alliance, the British Hospitality Association and the regional tourism partnerships, and the trade unions. The consistent message has been that they are not interested in structures or organisations; they want a service that is focused on their needs as users of the public sector—

Alun Cairns: Will you give way?

Andrew Davies: No. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Give way.']

The Presiding Officer: Order, the Minister may give way later.

Andrew Davies: They want commercial and customer-focused services for business. I accept that it is a difficult time, but we are now moving towards greater certainty in terms of the organisation and where the majority of staff will be within it.

Alun Cairns: I am staggered by your statement in relation to your discussions with businesses. You might well have met them, but you certainly have not listened to them, because most of those leading bodies that you have just highlighted are clearly opposed to this. However, they recognised that you had taken the decision and wanted to move forward, because they knew that you would not do a u-turn twice in the same month.

Andrew Davies: As I was about to respond to the point that Ieuan Wyn Jones made, I accept that we did not consult on the principle, and I think that it was right that we, as a Government, did not do that. However,

perthnasol wedi cymryd rhan yn hynny ers y dechrau, gan gynnwys y naw ffrwd gwaith, a sefydlasom i lunio'r corff newydd. Cafwyd negeseuon a bwletinâu rheolaidd oddi wrthyf fi ac uwch aelodau o'r staff, gan gynnwys yr Ysgrifennydd Parhaol.

Ac ateb y chwedl wag nad yw byd busnes wedi ymwneud â'r broses hon, cefais bron 80 cyfarfod ag amrywiaeth o gyrff busnes, gan gynnwys Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain, Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, Sefydliad y Cyfarwyddwyr, gyrff twristiaeth, fel Cynghrair Twristiaeth Cymru, Cymdeithas Lletygarwch Prydain a'r partneriaethau twristiaeth rhanbarthol, a'r undebau llafur. Y neges gyson a gafwyd yw nad ydynt yn ymddiddori mewn strwythurau neu gyrff; maent am gael gwasanaeth sydd yn canolbwyntio ar eu hanghenion fel defnyddwyr y sector cyhoeddus—

Alun Cairns: A wnewch ildio?

Andrew Davies: Na wnaf. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ildiwch.']

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Efallai y gwnaiff y Gweinidog ildio'n ddiweddarach.

Andrew Davies: Maent am gael gwasanaethau masnachol sydd yn canolbwyntio ar y cwsmer ar gyfer busnes. Derbyniaf fod hwn yn amser anodd, ond bellach yr ydym yn symud i gyfeiriad mwy o sicrwydd o ran y corff a lle'r rhan fwyaf o'r staff ynddo.

Alun Cairns: Synnaf yn fawr at eich datganiad ynglŷn â'ch trafodaethau â busnesau. Efallai eich bod wedi cwrdd â hwy ond, yn sicr, ni wrandawasoch arnynt, gan fod y rhan fwyaf o'r prif gyrff hynny yr ydych newydd gyfeirio atynt yn gwrthwynebu hyn yn llwyr. Serch hynny, yr oeddent yn cydnabod eich bod wedi penderfynu ar hyn a'ch bod am symud ymlaen, gan y gwyddent na wnaech dro pedol ddwywaith yn yr un mis.

Andrew Davies: Fel yr oeddwn ar fin dweud mewn ymateb i'r pwynt a wnaeth Ieuan Wyn Jones, derbyniaf nad ymgynghorasom ar yr egwyddor, a chredaf ei bod yn iawn na wnaethom hynny, fel Llywodraeth. Er hynny,

having made the decision, we have consulted on the shape of the new organisation and the type of services that we will provide within the Welsh public service.

I have given a commitment to listen to business, whether it is in terms of the services that are delivered or the independent advice that we will be accepting from the business community and those with real business expertise. As the First Minister pointed out in his statement on the advisory panel structures, it is the sign of a listening Government and Minister.

4.40 p.m.

The world has moved on. Members have referred to services provided by the WDA and the WTB in the past and, to some extent, at present. There are some excellent staff within the WDA and the WTB. I have never criticised any individuals within those organisations. However, we live in an increasingly competitive global economy, and we have to be much smarter and more adaptive to the needs of that economy and Welsh business and industry. A country with fewer than 3 million people cannot afford inefficiencies, restrictive organisations or duplication and complication if it is to provide focused services for the business community.

In terms of greater accountability and transparency, I welcome the challenge that Ieuan Wyn Jones has thrown down. As a Minister, I welcome that I will be more accountable in terms of the decisions that I make and that they will be more transparent, because I believe that decisions made in that way are better for business and the people of Wales.

In response to Mike German and his point about delegation, I do not know what happened when he was a Minister, but I make few decisions on funding applications, whether they are for large regional selective assistance grants, smaller grants, or the Assembly investment grant. When it comes to delegations, I make few decisions. The most powerful and empowered organisations, whether in the public or private sectors, are

ar ôl penderfynu ar hyn, yr ydym wedi ymgynghori ar ffurf y corff newydd a'r math o wasanaethau a ddarparwn yng ngwasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymru.

Yr wyf wedi rhoi ymrwymiad i wrando ar byd busnes, boed hynny yng nghyd-destun y gwasanaethau a ddarperir neu'r cyngor annibynnol y byddwn yn ei gael gan bobl busnes a'r rhai sydd â gwir arbenigedd mewn busnes. Fel y nododd y Prif Weinidog yn ei ddatganiad ar strwythurau'r panel ymgynghorol, mae hyn yn arwydd o Lywodraeth a Gweinidog sydd yn gwranddo.

Mae'r byd wedi symud ymlaen. Mae Aelodau wedi cyfeirio at wasanaethau a ddarperid gan y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru yn y gorffennol ac, i ryw raddau, rhai a ddarperir yn awr. Mae rhai aelodau staff rhagorol yn y WDA a Bwrdd Croeso Cymru. Nid wyf erioed wedi beirniadu unigolion yn y cyrff hynny. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn byw mewn economi fyd-eang sydd yn fwyfwy cystadleuol a rhaid inni fod yn llawer mwy effro ac yn fwy parod i ymateb i anghenion yr economi honno a busnes a diwydiant yng Nghymru. Nid yw gwlad o lai na thair miliwn o bobl yn gallu fforddio aneffeithlonrwydd, cyrff cyfyngol neu ddyblygu neu gymhlethdod os ydyw i ddarparu gwasanaethau pwrpasol ar gyfer pobl busnes.

O ran cynnig mwy o atebolrwydd a thryloywder, croesawaf yr her a gynigiodd Ieuan Wyn Jones. Fel Gweinidog, croesawaf y ffaith y byddaf yn fwy atebol am y penderfyniadau a wnaaf ac y byddant yn fwy tryloyw, gan fy mod yn credu bod penderfyniadau a wneir felly'n well i fusnes ac i bobl Cymru.

Mewn ymateb i Mike German a'r pwynt a wnaeth am ddirprwyo, ni wn beth a ddigwyddai pan oedd ef yn Weinidog, ond ychydig o benderfyniadau a wnaaf ar geisiadau am gyllid, pa un a ydynt am grantiau mawr ar ffurf cymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, grantiau llai, neu grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad. O ran dirprwyo, ychydig o benderfyniadau a wnaaf. Y cyrff mwyaf pwerus a grymus, yn y sector cyhoeddus a'r

those in which staff and employees have greater responsibility delegated to them. I make few decisions in terms of funding or finance, and that is how it should be. Certainly, in the new organisation, we will be delegating responsibility to the lowest appropriate level.

Michael German: You have answered my question in one sense, because I was going to ask when we are going to see these delegations. Quite clearly, the right culture is the one that you outlined, in which the Minister does not make these decisions on a day-by-day basis and runs with his hand on the tiller all the time, but rather there is freedom of action and fleetness of foot. However, we do not know when we will see these new delegations and the new structure. Are we going to be told that that will come some time in the future? Can we now establish that so that we know what the culture of the new organisation will be?

Andrew Davies: All I can say in response is that, in terms of responsiveness, civil servants within my department already provide a service that is as good as anything provided in the private sector or any other public sector organisation, whether it is in terms of responsiveness to, for example, applications for regional selective assistance or the Assembly investment grant, or the help provided by WalesTrade International to small companies that wish to trade overseas. We are already providing an excellent service. Some of what the WDA did and a lot of what the WTB did was extremely good, and we are creating a new culture within the new organisation, which will be taking the best of the staff, the talent and the culture.

On the canard about key staff leaving, I accept that some people have left, including some at a senior management team level, particularly at the WDA, and at other levels within the organisation. However, if you consider the figures—and I have repeatedly monitored them—the turnover of staff since the First Minister's announcement last year has been lower than it was in previous years. We are now openly advertising for the brightest and the best, whether they live in

sector preifat, yw'r rhai lle y mae mwy o gyfrifoldeb wedi'i ddirprwyo i'r staff a'r gweithwyr. Ychydig o benderfyniadau a wnaif o ran ariannu neu gyllid, ac felly y dylai fod. Yn sicr, yn y corff newydd, byddwn yn dirprwyo cyfrifoldeb i'r lefel isaf sydd yn briodol.

Michael German: Yr ydych wedi ateb fy nghwestiwn ar un ystyr, gan fy mod ar fin gofyn pa bryd y gwelwn y dirprwyo'n digwydd. Y diwylliant priodol yw'r un a amlinellasoch, wrth gwrs, lle nad yw'r Gweinidog yn gwneud penderfyniadau o'r fath o ddydd i ddydd ac yn gafael yn sownd yn y llyw drwy'r amser, ond yn hytrach lle y ceir rhyddid i weithredu a'r gallu i gymryd camau buan. Er hynny, ni wyddom pa bryd y gwelwn y dirprwyo newydd a'r strwythur newydd. A ddywedir wrthym y digwydd hynny rywdro yn y dyfodol? A gawn gadarnhad o hynny'n awr fel y byddwn yn gwybod beth fydd diwylliant y corff newydd?

Andrew Davies: Y cwbl y gallaf ei ddweud mewn ymateb i hynny, o ran ymatebolrwydd, yw bod gweision sifil yn fy adran eisoes yn cynnig gwasanaeth sydd cystal â dim a ddarperir yn y sector preifat neu mewn unrhyw gorff arall yn y sector cyhoeddus, boed hynny o ran y gallu i ymateb i geisiadau am gymorth rhanbarthol dewisol, er enghraifft, neu am grant buddsoddi'r Cynulliad, neu am y cymorth a roddir gan MasnachCymru Rhyngwladol i gwmnïau bach sydd yn dymuno masnachu dramor. Yr ydym eisoes yn darparu gwasanaeth rhagorol. Yr oedd rhywfaint o'r hyn a wnâi'r WDA a llawer o'r hyn a wnâi Bwrdd Croeso Cymru'n dda dros ben, ac yr ydym yn creu diwylliant newydd yn y corff newydd, a fydd yn defnyddio'r nodweddion gorau o ran y staff, y doniau a'r diwylliant.

Ynghylch y chwedl wag bod staff allweddol yn ymadael, derbynïaf fod rhai pobl wedi ymadael, gan gynnwys rhai o blith yr uwch dîm rheoli, yn enwedig yn y WDA, ac ar lefelau eraill yn y corff. Er hynny, os ystyriwch y ffigurau—ac yr wyf wedi'u monitro dro ar ôl tro—mae nifer y staff sydd wedi ymadael ers cyhoeddiad y Prif Weinidog y llynedd wedi bod yn is nag mewn blynyddoedd blaenorol. Yr ydym yn hysbysebu'n gyhoeddus yn awr i ddenu'r rhai

Wales or outside Wales, and it is interesting that many staff from English regional development agencies are applying for jobs within the new organisation. Following the announcement, it was thrown in our face that WDA staff would be poached by English RDAs. In fact, it is the other way around because people working for the English RDAs see what is happening in Wales, find the whole agenda extremely exciting and want to be part of it.

Ieuan made a point about the cost of the merger. I will write to him on this. It has been discussed in the Economic Development and Transport Committee on many occasions. I have kept Members up to date on the costs involved in the merger. Clearly your spokesperson has not passed on that information, Ieuan, so I will write to you with that in mind.

As of April next year, we will have a Welsh public service providing better services than we have had in the past. In many cases, we are not waiting until 1 April to improve those services. There are many examples of us delivering better services. My pledge to the Assembly, as to the people of Wales, is that we will provide a commercially orientated service that is customer-focused, which is in tune with the needs of business in the twenty-first century, which follows the strategies that the Assembly Government has put to the Assembly and that have been approved by it. In order to deliver that and to make the step-change needed in the Welsh economy, we need a Welsh public service that is best in class. That is what we will deliver.

gorau a mwyaf disglair, pa un a ydynt yn byw yng Nghymru neu y tu allan i Gymru, ac mae'n ddiddorol bod llawer o staff yn asiantaethau datblygu rhanbarthol Lloegr yn ymgeisio am swyddi yn y corff newydd. Ar ôl y cyhoeddiad, bu edliw i ni y byddai staff y WDA yn cael eu dwyn gan yr asiantaethau datblygu rhanbarthol yn Lloegr. Fel arall y mae, mewn gwirionedd, gan fod rhai sydd yn gweithio i'r asiantaethau datblygu rhanbarthol yn Lloegr yn gweld beth sydd yn digwydd yng Nghymru, yn cael bod yr agenda gyfan yn gyffrous dros ben ac yn dymuno bod â rhan ynddi.

Gwnaeth Ieuan bwynt ynghylch cost yr uno. Ysgrifennaf ato ynghylch hynny. Mae wedi cael ei drafod yn y Pwyllgor Datblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth lawer gwaith. Yr wyf wedi rhoi costau diweddaraf yr uno i'r Aelodau yn gyson. Yn amlwg, nid yw eich llefarydd wedi trosglwyddo'r wybodaeth honno ichi, Ieuan, felly ysgrifennaf atoch gyda hynny mewn golwg.

O fis Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd gennym wasanaeth cyhoeddus Cymreig yn darparu gwell gwasanaethau nag sydd wedi bod gennym yn y gorffennol. Mewn llawer o achosion, nid ydym yn aros tan 1 Ebrill i wella'r gwasanaethau hynny. Mae llawer o enghreifftiau lle'r ydym yn darparu gwell gwasanaethau. Fy addewid i'r Cynulliad, ac i bobl Cymru, yw y byddwn yn darparu gwasanaeth masnachol ei ogwydd sy'n canolbwyntio ar gwsmeriaid, sy'n gweddu i anghenion busnes yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, sy'n dilyn y strategaethau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi eu rhoi gerbron y Cynulliad ac sydd wedi cael eu cymeradwyo ganddo. Er mwyn cyflawni hynny a gwneud y newid sylweddol y mae ei angen yn economi Cymru, mae angen gwasanaeth cyhoeddus o'r radd flaenaf arnom yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn cyflawni hynny.

Gwelliant 1: O blaid 25, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.

Amendment 1: For 25, Abstain 0, Against 28.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary

Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2683): O blaid 38, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
 Motion (NDM2683): For 38, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2684): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.
Motion (NDM2684): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton

Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Cynnig (NDM2685): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 16.
 Motion (NDM2685): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 16.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2686): O blaid 37, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 15.
Motion (NDM2686): For 37, Abstain 0, Against 15.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.49 p.m.
The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.49 p.m.*

**Cynllun Oes—Strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol
Designed for Life—10-year Strategy for Health and Social Care**

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of David Melding, amendments 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 in the name of Jocelyn Davies, and amendments 9, 10 and 11 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw David Melding, gwelliannau 4, 5, 6, 7 ac 8 yn enw Jocelyn Davies a gwelliannau 10, 11 a 12 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I propose that

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Cynigiau fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. recognises the need for long-term and substantive changes in health and social care services in response to the Wanless report;

1. yn cydnabod bod angen newidiadau hirdymor a sylweddol yn y gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol mewn ymateb i adroddiad Wanless;

2. welcomes 'Designed for Life' as the framework to deliver radical improvement in health services in Wales.(NDM2687)

2. yn croesawu 'Cynllun Oes' fel fframwaith i wella'r gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru mewn modd radical.(NDM2687)

4.50 p.m.

Other than the issues of our budget settlement, and the wide range of contractual reform that the NHS is undergoing at the moment, there is nothing more fundamental to the future of the NHS in Wales than 'Designed for Life', our 10-year strategy to create a world-class service.

Ar wahân i'r materion yn ymwneud â setliad y gyllideb, a'r ystod eang o ddiwygiadau cytundebol sydd ar waith yn y GIG ar hyn o bryd, nid oes dim yn fwy sylfaenol i ddyfodol y GIG yng Nghymru na 'Cynllun Oes', ein strategaeth 10 mlynedd i greu gwasanaeth gyda'r gorau yn y byd.

In May 2005, the Welsh Assembly Government published 'Designed for Life', a blueprint that identifies the values, principles and objectives needed to reform health and social care. There is a consensus that change is needed and that reform is due. The decision to launch 'Designed for Life' at Tredegar, the birthplace of Nye Bevan, was no coincidence, because the strategy is firmly based in the public service values that imbued the establishment of the NHS and the nature and scale of the change that we need to achieve to make the NHS fit for purpose in the twenty-first century is no less radical. The necessity for change was summed up in the Wanless review. The NHS is overly dependent on acute hospital services, and is consequently not sustainable. Too many people end up in hospital because there is no

Ym mis Mai 2005, cyhoeddodd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru 'Cynllun Oes', glasbrint sy'n nodi'r gwerthoedd, yr egwyddorion a'r amcanion sy'n ofynnol i ddiwygio iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol. Mae consensws bod angen newid a'i bod yn bryd diwygio. Nid cyd-ddigwyddiad oedd y penderfyniad i lansio 'Cynllun Oes' yn Nhrefdegar, man geni Nye Bevan, oherwydd y mae'r strategaeth wedi ei seilio'n gadarn ar y gwerthoedd yn ymwneud â gwasanaeth cyhoeddus a oedd mor ganolog wrth sefydlu'r GIG ac nid yw natur a maint y newid y mae angen inni ei gyflawni i wneud y GIG yn addas i'w bwrpas yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain fymryn yn llai radical na hynny. Cafodd y rheidrwydd i newid ei grynhoi yn adolygiad Wanless. Mae'r GIG yn orddibynnol ar wasanaethau ysbyty aciwt, ac nid yw'n gynaliadwy o'r

other way to manage non-routine clinical problems. There are too many breakdowns in the planned delivery of anticipatory care for long-term chronic illness, and too many people end up in hospital due to the breakdown or absence of effective social care. We need a system that will prevent the breakdown of health and social care at a much earlier stage. This is better for patients, which must be our first and overriding concern. It also delivers a more effective and efficient NHS.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: On that point, I will ask you the question that I asked the First Minister, but to which I did not receive a reply. If you are saying that too many people end up in hospital and that that is not the appropriate location for them, what range of services are you now offering in the primary sector that will allow people to get the service that they need before they have to go to hospital?

Brian Gibbons: The work that is going on, for example, in the delivering emergency care services project will develop the alternative pathways.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What is it?

Brian Gibbons: I do not have time to go into it. The DECS projects, as you should know, is about developing our response to unscheduled care. [*Interruption.*]

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. We should not have sedentary interventions. It is fine if you want to intervene, but do not do it sitting down.

Brian Gibbons: Equally, if Rhodri got out and about a bit more often and spoke to those working for the health service, he might know of the many innovative projects that are going on in Cardiff and across Wales, such as the re-ablement scheme that is run from Rookwood Hospital, the early intervention schemes in north Wales, and the re-ablement schemes in Neath Port Talbot. However,

herwydd. Mae gormod o bobl yn gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty am nad oes ffordd arall o reoli problemau clinigol nad ydynt yn rhai rheolaidd. Ceir gormod o fethiannau o ran darparu gofal sydd wedi'i gynllunio ymlaen llaw ar gyfer salwch cronig hirdymor, ac mae gormod o bobl yn gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty oherwydd diffyg gofal cymdeithasol effeithiol neu oherwydd methiant o ran y gofal hwnnw. Mae angen inni gael system a fydd yn atal gofal iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol rhag methu yn llawer cynharach. Mae hyn yn well i gleifion, a rhaid i hynny fod yn brif ystyriaeth inni. Mae hefyd yn rhoi inni GIG mwy effeithiol ac effeithlon.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Ar y pwynt hwnnw, yr wyf am ofyn i chi y cwestiwn a ofynnais i'r Prif Weinidog, ond na chefais ateb iddo. Os ydych yn dweud bod gormod o bobl yn gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty ac nad ysbyty yw'r lle priodol iddynt, pa ystod o wasanaethau yr ydych yn eu cynnig yn awr yn y sector sylfaenol a fydd yn caniatáu i bobl gael y gwasanaeth y mae ei angen arnynt cyn iddynt orfod mynd i'r ysbyty?

Brian Gibbons: Bydd y gwaith sydd ar y gweill, er enghraifft, yn y prosiect darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys yn datblygu'r llwybrau amgen.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Beth yw hynny?

Brian Gibbons: Nid oes gennyf amser i fanylu ar hynny. Hanfod y prosiectau darparu gwasanaethau gofal brys, fel y dylech wybod, yw datblygu ein hymateb i ofal nad yw wedi cael ei drefnu. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Ni ddylech ymyrryd heb godi. Mae popeth yn iawn os ydych am ymyrryd, ond peidiwch â gwneud hynny ar eich eistedd.

Brian Gibbons: Yn yr un modd, pe bai Rhodri'n codi allan ychydig yn amlach ac yn siarad â'r rhai sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth iechyd, efallai y byddai'n gwybod am y lluo o brosiectau arloesol sydd ar waith yng Nghaerdydd a ledled Cymru, megis y cynllun ailalluogi sy'n cael ei redeg o Ysbyty Rookwood, y cynlluniau ymyrryd cynnar yng ngogledd Cymru, a'r cynlluniau ailalluogi

Rhodri exists in total isolation from what is happening in the world of the health service, so it is not surprising that he is totally ignorant of these developments.

‘Designed for Life’ provides a framework that will deliver the change that we need over the next 10 years. Since the launch of ‘Designed for Life’, Assembly officials have met over 2,000 people including local government members and officers, NHS trusts, local health boards, senior clinicians, the voluntary sector and NHS staff. These meetings are continuing, and provide the opportunity to discover what people think of the proposals in ‘Designed for Life’, and to consider the implications for change. It also helps us to plan how we will take this framework forward to the next stage—the implementation phase.

There are certain givens that we cannot ignore, and which everyone who is concerned about the future of the health service, both locally and nationally, must address. In many key specialist areas, there needs to be a critical mass of patients to optimise safe, quality care, and services must be redesigned to achieve that. Equally, we must be consistent in guaranteeing clinical governance and sustainability so that services can be delivered as locally as possible. In short, people should be assured that the quality and safety of services that they receive locally will not be compromised in any way, and that, where travel is necessary, this will be solely determined by the need to provide sustainable, safe services. People will not be expected to travel to centres of excellence many miles from their homes unless there is a clear and demonstrable clinical or sustainability gain.

David Lloyd: Will you take an intervention?

Brian Gibbons: No; wait until I have gone a little further.

With the advent of new technology and new techniques, much of what would only have been possible in centres of excellence years

yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Fodd bynnag, mae Rhodri mewn byd hollol ar wahân i’r hyn sy’n digwydd ym myd y gwasanaeth iechyd, felly nid yw’n syndod nad yw’n gwybod dim am y datblygiadau hyn.

Mae ‘Cynllun Oes’ yn darparu fframwaith a fydd yn gweithredu’r newid y mae ei angen arnom dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf. Ers lansio ‘Cynllun Oes’, mae swyddogion y Cynulliad wedi cwrdd â thros 2,000 o bobl, gan gynnwys aelodau a swyddogion llywodraeth leol, ymddiriedolaethau’r GIG, byrddau iechyd lleol, uwch glinigwyr, y sector gwirfoddol a staff y GIG. Mae’r cyfarfodydd hyn yn parhau, ac maent yn gyfle i ddarganfod beth yw barn pobl am y cynigion yn ‘Cynllun Oes’, ac i ystyried y goblygiadau o ran y newid. Mae hefyd yn help inni gynllunio sut y byddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â’r fframwaith hwn yn y cam nesaf—sef gweithredu’r cynllun.

Mae rhai pethau na allwn eu hanwybyddu, ac y mae’n rhaid i bawb sy’n ymddiddori yn nyfodol y gwasanaeth iechyd, yn lleol ac yn genedlaethol, roi sylw iddynt. Mewn llawer o feysydd arbenigol allweddol, mae angen màs critigol o gleifion er mwyn cael y gofal gorau o ran safon a diogelwch, a rhaid ailgynllunio gwasanaethau i gyflawni hynny. Yn yr un modd, rhaid inni fod yn gyson wrth warantu llywodraethu clinigol a chynaliadwyedd fel bod modd darparu gwasanaethau mor lleol ag sy’n bosibl. Yn fyr, dylai pobl fod yn sicr na fydd ansawdd a diogelwch y gwasanaethau y maent yn eu cael yn lleol yn cael eu peryglu mewn modd yn y byd ac, os bydd rhaid teithio, mai ar sail yr angen i ddarparu gwasanaethau diogel, cynaliadwy, yn unig y gwneir hynny. Ni fydd disgwyl i bobl deithio i ganolfannau rhagoriaeth filltiroedd lawer o’u cartrefi oni bai fod i hynny fantais glir a phendant o safbwynt clinigol neu o safbwynt cynaliadwyedd.

David Lloyd: A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad?

Brian Gibbons: Na wna, arhoswch nes y byddaf wedi mynd ychydig ymhellach.

Gyda dyfodiad technoleg newydd a thechnegau newydd, mae modd darparu llawer o’r hyn na fyddai ond wedi bod yn

ago can now be delivered in local general hospitals or even in a community setting. This is what we want to achieve wherever possible. We must also make the most effective and safe use of investment in high-technology, high-cost services. We cannot ignore the implications of the European working time directive. To train the next generation of healthcare workers we must make sure that our training systems are robust and able to deliver quality.

From April 2006, I will be delivering 'Designed to Deliver'. This document will describe in detail how we will deliver the first strategic framework identified in 'Designed for Life'.

Eleanor Burnham *rose*—

Brian Gibbons: 'Designed to Deliver' has five key elements, the first of which is project 2009, the delivery plan on waiting lists. The second is a new commissioning framework which will bring incentives to the service to improve efficiency and change how we commission these services. The third element is the regional commission and reconfiguration project, which will identify the next steps in regional reconfiguration of services. The fourth element is clinical leadership through professional and clinical quality improvement, which will drive the quality of services in the future in a clear direction that guarantees quality and safety. Finally, there will be a quality strategy which will identify how clinical standards will be at the heart of the services that we wish to deliver in the future.

Eleanor Burnham: Will you take an intervention now, please?

Brian Gibbons: Yes.

Eleanor Burnham: These are warm words but, in view of the fact that so many trusts and local health boards are having real difficulties with their existing funding, do you not think that this is whistling in the wind?

Brian Gibbons: It is precisely because trusts

bosibl mewn canolfannau rhagoriaeth flynyddol yn ôl mewn ysbytai cyffredinol lleol neu hyd yn oed mewn sefydliad cymunedol erbyn hyn. Rhaid inni hefyd wneud y defnydd mwyaf effeithiol a diogel o fuddsoddiad mewn gwasanaethau uwch dechnoleg, cost uchel. Ni allwn anwybyddu goblygiadau'r gyfarwyddeb oriau gwaith Ewropeaidd. I hyfforddi'r genhedlaeth nesaf o weithwyr gofal iechyd rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr bod ein systemau hyfforddi'n drylwyr a bod yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud o safon dda.

O fis Ebrill 2006, byddaf yn rhoi 'Designed to Deliver' ar waith. Bydd y ddogfen hon yn disgrifio'n fanwl sut y byddwn yn rhoi'r fframwaith strategol cyntaf a nodir yn 'Cynllun Oes' ar waith.

Eleanor Burnham *a gododd*—

Brian Gibbons: Mae pum elfen allweddol i 'Designed to Deliver', a'r gyntaf yw prosiect 2009, y cynllun gweithredu ar restrau aros. Yr ail yw fframwaith comisiynu newydd a fydd yn dod â chymhellion i'r gwasanaeth i wella effeithlonrwydd a newid y modd yr ydym yn comisiynu'r gwasanaethau hyn. Y drydedd elfen yw'r prosiect comisiynu ac ailgyflunio rhanbarthol, a fydd yn nodi'r camau nesaf yn y gwaith o ailgyflunio gwasanaethau yn rhanbarthol. Y bedwaredd elfen yw arweiniad clinigol drwy wella ansawdd yn broffesiynol a chlinigol, a fydd yn peri bod ansawdd y gwasanaethau yn y dyfodol yn mynd i gyfeiriad pendant sy'n gwarantu ansawdd a diogelwch. Yn olaf, bydd strategaeth ansawdd a fydd yn nodi sut y bydd safonau clinigol yn ganolog yn y gwasanaethau yr ydym am eu darparu yn y dyfodol.

Eleanor Burnham: A wnewch dderbyn ymyriad yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda?

Brian Gibbons: Gwnaf.

Eleanor Burnham: Mae'r rhain yn eiriau hyfryd ond, o ystyried bod cynifer o ymddiriedolaethau a byrddau iechyd lleol yn cael anawsterau gwirioneddol gyda'u cyllid ar hyn o bryd, onid ydych yn meddwl mai gobaith ffôl yw hyn?

Brian Gibbons: Y ffaith nad yw'r

are not working efficiently and effectively that we need to deliver the Wanless reform agenda. The problem that you describe is precisely what Derek Wanless dictated in his document; a symptom of the unsustainable type of health service that we have. These problems will persist unless we engage in the radical thoroughgoing reform which 'Designed for Life' outlines.

Linked to this is the need for public engagement. A key component in making change happen is making sure that we listen to what the people of Wales want. Therefore, not only must we explain the case for change, but we must also listen to individuals as they respond to that case. The process is clear. We must set out the case for change, explain and listen to the public and those who are involved in service delivery, and then take the lessons that we have learned to inform the process of service reconfiguration and redesign.

It goes without saying that this is not a one-off process. It needs to repeat itself at each stage as we move forward. This is real consultation and it is not our intention to impose on the service what we are hoping to do.

People across Wales must engage and tell us what they want through an open and informed debate. Equally, we must have clinical engagement and leadership to inform us how we will meet the public's aspirations. Only at this point can we design the services to deliver the need. This is not a fragmented or confused response, as amendment 1 suggests. Our response to the Wanless review has been clear and consistent, led by a Wanless project board. Learning from the experience of local Wanless action plans, it is now possible to move to devise 'Designed for Life' as part of an overall 10-year strategy. It is this interactive process that will provide the range of outcomes that amendment 3 seems to request. We do not need the instruction of amendment 3, because the Assembly Government is doing it for itself.

ymddiriedolaethau'n gweithio'n effeithlon ac yn effeithiol yw'r union reswm pam mae angen inni weithredu agenda ddiwygio Wanless. Y broblem a ddisgrifiwch yw'r union beth a nodwyd gan Derek Wanless yn ei ddogfen; symptom o'r math anghynaliadwy o wasanaeth iechyd sydd gennym. Bydd y problemau hyn yn parhau onid awn ati i weithredu'r diwygiadau trylwyr a amlinellir yn 'Cynllun Oes'.

Ynghlwm wrth hyn y mae'r angen i ennyn cefnogaeth y cyhoedd. Un elfen allweddol wrth wireddu newid yw gwneud yn siŵr ein bod yn gwrando ar yr hyn y mae pobl Cymru yn dymuno'i gael. Felly, mae'n rhaid inni nid yn unig esbonio'r ddadl o blaid newid, ond rhaid inni hefyd wrando ar unigolion wrth iddynt ymateb i'r ddadl honno. Mae'r broses yn glir. Rhaid inni gyflwyno'r ddadl o blaid newid, esbonio a gwrando ar y cyhoedd a'r rhai sy'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaethau, ac yna cymryd y gwersi yr ydym wedi eu dysgu i lywio'r broses o ailgyflunio ac ailgynllunio gwasanaethau.

Nid oes angen dweud nad proses untro yw hyn. Mae angen iddi ailadrodd ei hun ym mhob cam wrth inni symud ymlaen. Mae hyn yn ymgynghori gwirioneddol ac nid gorfodi'r hyn yr ydym yn gobeithio ei wneud ar y gwasanaeth yw ein bwriad.

Rhaid i bobl ledled Cymru gyfrannu a dweud wrthym beth y maent am ei gael drwy ddadl agored, wedi'i seilio ar ffeithiau. Yn yr un modd, rhaid cael ymgysylltu clinigol â hyn ac arweiniad clinigol i ddweud wrthym sut y gallwn fodloni dyheadau'r cyhoedd. Dim ond bryd hynny y gallwn gynllunio'r gwasanaethau i ddiwallu'r angen. Nid ymateb tameidiog na dryslyd yw hyn, fel y mae gwelliant 1 yn awgrymu. Mae ein hymateb i adolygiad Wanless wedi bod yn glir a chyson, o dan arweiniad bwrdd prosiect Wanless. Gan ddysgu o brofiad cynlluniau gweithredu Wanless lleol, mae'n bosibl mynd ati erbyn hyn i ddyfeisio 'Cynllun Oes' fel rhan o strategaeth 10 mlynedd gyffredinol. Y broses ryngweithiol hon a fydd yn darparu'r ystod o ganlyniadau y mae'n ymddangos bod gwelliant 3 yn gofyn amdani. Nid oes angen cyfarwyddyd gwelliant 3 arnom, oherwydd y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwneud hyn drosti ei hun.

Finally, all of this is entirely in line with the overall Welsh Assembly Government approach outlined in 'Making the Connections'. This strategy and the parallel process in our redesign for social care, form part of the Health and Social Care Department's response to this important agenda. Both frameworks put citizens at the centre. Both are committed to pursuing stronger joint working between NHS bodies, local authorities, voluntary and private sectors. Where there is more efficient working we will release the necessary resources which will be directed to improving front-line services.

David Lloyd: Would you agree that the success of 'Designed for Life' is predicated on the development of services in the community? That is why so many people end up in hospital in the first place. What directions are you giving in this document 'Designed for Life' so that we see the development of primary care services, and community services in general, so that you can support the vision of 'Designed for Life'?

5.00 p.m.

Brian Gibbons: This is happening on a day-to-day basis. That is similar to Rhodri Glyn's question. What is going on? It is amazing that anyone who goes out and meets front-line people in the NHS does not come across legions of practical examples of what is happening on a day-to-day basis. There is probably scarcely a community across Wales where there is not two or three such practical examples. The challenge for us is to build on those examples and make them more uniformly available across all communities, so that that is universally available.

I commend 'Designed for Life' to the Assembly, and declare our support for the motion.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call speakers, I inform Members that this debate will take an hour. I have many speakers, and I intend to impose a three-minute time limit on speakers after those Members who

Yn olaf, mae hyn oll yn cyd-fynd yn llwyr â dull gweithredu cyffredinol Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru a amlinellir yn 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Mae'r strategaeth hon a'r broses gyfatebol wrth inni ailgynllunio gofal cymdeithasol, yn rhan o ymateb yr Adran Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol i'r agenda bwysig hon. Mae'r naill fframwaith a'r llall yn rhoi'r lle canolog i ddinasyddion. Mae'r ddau'n ymrwymo i sicrhau cydweithio cryfach rhwng cyrff y GIG, yr awdurdodau lleol, y sectorau gwirfoddol a phreifat. Lle y ceir gweithio mwy effeithlon byddwn yn rhyddhau'r adnoddau angenrheidiol a gaiff eu cyfeirio tuag at wella gwasanaethau rheng flaen.

David Lloyd: A fydddech yn cytuno bod llwyddiant 'Cynllun Oes' yn seiliedig ar ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn y gymuned? Dyna pam y mae cynifer o bobl yn gorfod mynd i'r ysbyty yn y lle cyntaf. Pa gyfarwyddiadau yr ydych yn eu rhoi yn y ddogfen hon 'Cynllun Oes' fel ein bod yn gallu gweld gwasanaethau gofal sylfaenol, a gwasanaethau cymunedol yn gyffredinol, yn datblygu, fel bod modd ichi gynnal y weledigaeth yn 'Cynllun Oes'?

Brian Gibbons: Mae hynny'n digwydd o ddydd i ddydd. Mae hyn yn debyg i gwestiwn Rhodri Glyn. Beth sy'n bod? Mae'n rhyfeddol nad yw'r sawl sy'n mynd allan ac yn cwrdd â phobl yn y rheng flaen yn y GIG yn dod ar draws llu o enghreifftiau ymarferol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd o ddydd i ddydd. Mae'n debyg nad oes yr un gymuned yng Nghymru heb ddwy neu dair enghraifft ymarferol o'r fath. Yr her i ni yw adeiladu ar yr enghreifftiau hynny a sicrhau eu bod ar gael yn ehangach i bob cymuned fel ei gilydd, fel bod hynny ar gael i bawb.

Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo 'Cynllun Oes' i'r Cynulliad, ac yn datgan ein cefnogaeth i'r cynnig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi alw ar y siaradwyr, yr wyf am hysbysu'r Aelodau y bydd y ddadl hon yn para awr. Mae gennyf lawer o siaradwyr, ac yr wyf yn bwriadu cyfyngu pob siaradwr i dri munud ar ôl i'r

propose amendments have spoken. I will also invite someone to propose a half-hour extension at 5.30 p.m.. We should finish at about 5.50 p.m..

Jonathan Morgan: I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: insert at the end of point 1:

but criticises the Assembly Government's fragmented and confused adoption of the Wanless agenda

I propose amendment 2. Delete point 2 and replace with:

acknowledges the contribution of 'Designed for Life' to the implementation of the Wanless agenda.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

instructs the Assembly Government to review the effectiveness of existing NHS structures and targets in light of 'Designed for Life'.

After listening to that rather confused and muddled introduction to this grand new design for the NHS, it is difficult to know exactly where to start. However, I will start with the Wanless agenda. The Government's handling of the Wanless agenda has been shambolic. Instead of leading the case for change and the need for a strategic approach, it waited first for local health boards to come up with their ideas, in the guise of 22 mini local Wanless action plans. It then waited again until the regional plans could be put together, and now we have this 'Designed for Life' strategy. It is a case of this Government waiting to be led by others instead of taking the lead on this issue.

We all accepted the urgency of the Wanless report—it was certainly accepted by the opposition parties—to ensure that the system became more efficient, that services were reconfigured, and that the more efficient use of beds was to be more apparent than it is now. All these things were of an urgent nature in the Wanless review, but they seem

Aelodau sy'n cynnig gwelliannau siarad. Byddaf hefyd yn gwahodd rhywun i gynnig estyniad o hanner awr am 5.30 p.m.. Dylem orffen tua 5.50 p.m.

Jonathan Morgan: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: cynnwys ar ddiwedd pwynt 1:

ond yn beirniadu Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am y modd dryslyd a darniog y mabwysiadodd agenda Wanless

Cynigiau welliant 2. Dileu pwynt 2 a rhoi yn ei le:

yn cydnabod cyfraniad 'Cynllun Oes' at roi agenda Wanless ar waith.

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygu effeithiolrwydd strwythurau a thargedau cyfredol y GIG yng ngoleuni 'Cynllun Oes'.

Ar ôl gwranddo ar y cyflwyniad dryslyd braidd i'r cynllun mawreddog newydd hwn ar gyfer y GIG, mae'n anodd gwybod ble yn union i ddechrau. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf am ddechrau gydag agenda Wanless. Mae'r modd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi delio ag agenda Wanless wedi bod yn draed moch. Yn hytrach nag arwain y ddadl o blaid newid a'r angen i fabwysiadu dull strategol, arhosodd yn gyntaf i'r byrddau iechyd lleol feddwl am syniadau, ar ffurf 22 o gynlluniau gweithredu Wanless bach lleol. Yna arhosodd unwaith eto hyd nes y gellid rhoi'r cynlluniau rhanbarthol at ei gilydd, ac yn awr mae gennym y strategaeth hon, 'Cynllun Oes'. Mae hyn yn enghraifft o'r Llywodraeth yn aros i gael ei harwain gan eraill yn hytrach na chymryd yr awenau ei hun ar y mater.

Yr oeddem i gyd wedi derbyn y brys a oedd yn adroddiad Wanless—yn sicr derbyniodd y gwrthbleidiau hynny—o ran sicrhau bod y system yn datblygu'n fwy effeithlon, fod gwasanaethau'n cael eu hailgyflunio, a bod defnyddio gwelyau mewn modd mwy effeithlon yn amlycach nag ydyw ar hyn o bryd. Yr oedd yr holl bethau hyn yn faterion

to have been missed by the Assembly Government.

When I consider this strategy, I am rather concerned that, in essence, it takes no real account of the pressures that exist with regard to the targets that are set. It takes no real account of the structures that exist for commissioning and service provision. All of that may have to change to cope with these sorts of changes, yet the Government is oblivious to this, towing the line set by Labour's little friends down in the local health boards. The people who were appointed to push through this agenda in the first place may not have the capacity to cope with some of the changes that you suggest, Minister.

There are two bits in here—and I struggle to get to two—that I welcome. The first is the fact that we will now look at a three-year strategic framework. Year-to-year planning is unstable; it does not provide any degree of certainty to people commissioning and providing services. I agree that this should be patient-centred. I am yet to be convinced that what you suggest will lead to that, but at least referring to it points you in the right direction.

There are several bits that concern me. The project is uncoded, and you have no idea how you will deliver this. You have no idea what it will cost, how it will be paid for, who will be responsible for covering the costs, and what the ultimate bill will be for leading to the final part of the 'Designed for Life' strategy. It is confused, because we have gone from local Wanless action plans, to regional plans, to 'Designed for Life', and now to something else that you called 'Designed to Deliver'. This is the first time that I have heard of that; you will no doubt go into detail on that later on. This is another action plan for next year and beyond to put into place 'Designed for Life', which was put into place to implement the Wanless review. Therefore, this is an exceptionally muddled and confused project, and I do not believe that you have understood for a second what it will cost.

brys yn adolygiad Wanless, ond ymddengys fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad heb eu hamgyffred.

Pan fyddaf yn ystyried y strategaeth hon, yr wyf yn bryderus braidd nad yw, yn ei hanfod, yn rhoi ystyriaeth wirioneddol i'r pwysau sy'n bodoli o ran y targedau sydd wedi'u pennu. Nid yw'n rhoi gwir ystyriaeth i'r strwythurau sy'n bodoli ar gyfer comisiynu a darparu gwasanaethau. Mae'n bosibl y bydd rhaid newid hyn i gyd er mwyn ymdopi â newidiadau fel y rhain, ond nid yw'r Llywodraeth yn cymryd dim sylw o hyn, ac mae'n fodlon dilyn y trywydd a osodwyd gan ffrindiau bach Llafur yn y byrddau iechyd lleol. Efallai nad oes gan y bobl a benodwyd i gyflawni'r agenda hon yn y lle cyntaf y gallu i ymdopi â rhai o'r newidiadau a awgrymir gennych, Weinidog.

Mae dau beth yma—ac yr wyf yn ei chael yn anodd meddwl am ddau—yr wyf yn eu croesawu. Y cyntaf yw'r ffaith y bydd rhaid inni bellach edrych ar fframwaith strategol tair blynedd. Mae cynllunio o flwyddyn i flwyddyn yn ansefydlog; nid yw'n rhoi dim sicrwydd i bobl sy'n comisiynu ac yn darparu gwasanaethau. Cytunaf y dylai hyn ganolbwyntio ar y cleifion. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi y bydd yr hyn a awgrymir gennych yn arwain at hynny, ond o leiaf mae cyfeirio ato'n eich troi i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

Mae llawer o bethau sy'n peri pryder imi. Nid yw'r prosiect wedi'i gostio, ac nid oes gennych syniad sut y byddwch yn cyflawni hyn. Nid oes gennych syniad faint y bydd yn ei gostio, sut y telir amdano, pwy fydd yn gyfrifol am dalu'r costau, a beth fydd cost arwain at ran olaf strategaeth 'Cynllun Oes' yn y pen draw. Mae'n ddryslyd, oherwydd ein bod wedi symud o gynlluniau gweithredu Wanless lleol, i gynlluniau rhanbarthol, 'Cynllun Oes', ac yn awr rhywbeth arall yr ydych wedi'i alw'n 'Designed to Deliver'. Dyma'r tro cyntaf imi glywed am hwnnw; yr wyf yn siŵr y byddwch yn ymhelaethu arno'n ddiweddarach. Mae hwn yn gynllun gweithredu arall ar gyfer y flwyddyn nesaf ac wedi hynny i roi 'Cynllun Oes' ar waith, a hwnnw wedi ei roi ar waith i weithredu adolygiad Wanless. Mae hwn, felly, yn brosiect hynod o gymysglyd a drslyd, ac ni chredaf eich bod yn sylweddoli am eiliad

faint y bydd yn ei gostio.

This relates solely to the national health service. However, in the last six years, you, as a Government, have relied increasingly heavily on other providers to get patients treated. The second offer scheme has spent in excess of £8 million of public money on treating NHS patients in the private sector. Therefore, you are using the private sector, but there is no mention of any other organisation, other than that which is delivered through the NHS. It is very much a one size to fit all, without recognising the fact that you are now relying on other service providers to get people treated.

Mae hyn yn ymwneud â'r gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn unig. Fodd bynnag, yn ystod y chwe mlynedd diwethaf yr ydych chi, fel Llywodraeth, wedi dibynnu fwyfwy ar ddarparwyr eraill i drin cleifion. Mae cynllun yr ail gynnig wedi gwario dros £8 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus i drin cleifion y GIG yn y sector preifat. Yr ydych, felly, yn defnyddio'r sector preifat, ond nid oes sôn am sefydliad arall, heblaw'r hyn sy'n cael ei ddarparu drwy'r GIG. Yr hyn sy'n digwydd yw canolbwyntio ar un ddarpariaeth, heb gydnabod y ffaith eich bod yn awr yn dibynnu ar ddarparwyr gwasanaeth eraill i drin pobl.

The achievements in 2.4 stretch the truth. For example, there is the reference to people being seen very quickly in accident and emergency departments. They may be seen fairly quickly in accident and emergency departments, but they are waiting many hours—days in some cases—to get beds in our hospital wards. The wait for cardiac surgery is still much longer in Wales than it is in England, but you seem to trumpet that in this document. Unless you can show me how this document will extend the choices that are available to patients to get that quick, accessible treatment, unless you can show me how it will extend the clinical independence of hospitals and medical professionals, and unless you can show me how this document will reduce the amount of bureaucracy within the health system and put more resources into front-line care, this document will not get the support of the Welsh Conservative Party. What you are doing is typical of a Labour politician—you present as many glossy documents, briefing notes and confusion as possible to tie people up in knots, without a clear, definable strategy. I listened to you introduce this debate this afternoon, and you spent 10 minutes saying a great deal about very little.

Mae'n amheus a yw'r hyn a gyflawnwyd yn ôl 2.4 yn gywir. Er enghraifft, cyfeirir at bobl yn cael eu gweld yn gyflym mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Efallai eu bod yn cael eu gweld yn gyflym iawn mewn adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ond maent yn aros oriau lawer—dyddiau mewn rhai achosion—i gael gwely yn wardiau ein hysbytai. Mae'n rhaid aros yn llawer hwy am lawdriniaeth gardiaidd yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr, ond yr ydych fel petaech yn canu clodydd hynny yn y ddogfen hon. Oni allwch ddangos imi sut y bydd y ddogfen hon yn cynyddu'r dewis sydd ar gael i gleifion gael y driniaeth briodol yn gyflym, oni allwch ddangos imi sut y bydd yn hybu annibyniaeth glinigol ysbytai a gweithwyr meddygol proffesiynol, ac oni allwch ddangos imi sut y bydd y ddogfen hon yn lleihau biwrocratiaeth o fewn y system iechyd a rhoi mwy o adnoddau i ofal rheng flaen, ni fydd y ddogfen hon yn derbyn cefnogaeth Plaid Geidwadol Cymru. Mae'r hyn yr ydych yn ei wneud yn gwbl nodweddiadol o wleidydd Llafur—yr ydych yn cyflwyno cynifer o ddogfennau sgleiniog, nodiadau briffio a dryswch â phosibl i gymysgu pawb yn llwyr, a hynny heb strategaeth eglur, ddiffiniedig. Gwrandewais arnoch yn cyflwyno'r ddadl hon y prynhawn yma, a threuliasoch 10 munud yn dweud llawer am y nesaf peth i ddim.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Gwelliant 4: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: I propose the following amendments in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Amendment 4: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn credu bod yn rhaid cyllido mentrau newydd a chyfrifoldebau newydd yn llawn, fel yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', cyn eu trosglwyddo i gyrff iechyd.

believes that new initiatives and new responsibilities, such as 'Agenda for Change', must be fully funded before they are passed on to health bodies.

Cynigiad welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i rewi ad-daliadau dyled hanesyddol cyrff iechyd os;

calls on the Assembly Government to freeze the historic debt repayment of health bodies where;

(i) bu tangyllido hanesyddol,

(i) there has been historic underfunding,

(ii) yw ad-daliadau'r ddyled yn peryglu'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir i gleifion,

(ii) the debt repayments endanger the provision of services for patients,

(iii) yw'r cynlluniau ariannol cyfredol ac ar gyfer y dyfodol yn gynaliadwy ac y cytunir arnynt gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

(iii) current and future financial plans are sustainable and are agreed by the Welsh Assembly Government.

Cynigiad welliant 6. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point:

yn mynegi pryder bod polisiau iechyd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gorfodi cleifion yng Nghymru i dalu am eu gofal iechyd eu hunain yn y sector preifat.

expresses concern that the Assembly Government's health policies are forcing patients in Wales to pay for their own healthcare within the private sector.

Cynigiad welliant 7. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi'r gorau i roi cymhorthdal cyhoeddus i unrhyw bractis preifat a wneir yn eiddo'r GIG.

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to stop the public subsidy of any private practice undertaken on NHS premises.

Cynigiad welliant 8. Ychwanegu fel pwynt newydd:

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i ddiddymu taliadau cyfalaf a delir gan ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG.

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to abolish capital charges paid by NHS trusts.

Ategaf yn llwyr sylwadau Jonathan Morgan ar ddiwedd ei gyfraniad. Clywsom lawer o eiriau a datganiadau gan y Gweinidog wrth gyflwyno'r ddadl hon, ond ni chawsom unrhyw fanylion. Yr oedd yn ddadlennol iawn, er ei fod wedi cael dau gyfle i ddweud wrthym beth oedd yr ystod o wasanaethau yr oedd yn bwriadu eu cyflwyno i'r sector sylfaenol er mwyn galluogi pobl i gael mynediad i wasanaethau eu cymunedau, iddo

I fully endorse Jonathan Morgan's comments at the end of his contribution. We heard many words and statements from the Minister in introducing this debate, but we were given no details. It was very revealing that, although he had two opportunities to tell us what range of services he intended to introduce in the primary sector in order to enable people to access services in their communities, he failed completely to name more than three

fethu'n llwyr ag enwi mwy na tri pheth sy'n digwydd. Mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod cystal â minnau, a phawb arall yn y Siambr, fod llu o bethau yn digwydd yn Lloegr, ac ymddengys mai bach iawn sy'n digwydd yng Nghymru.

Dywedodd nad oeddwn—

Jenny Randerson: Are you aware that in Cardiff, for example, the range of services available through primary care has been cut back because the local health board, which is strapped for cash, has reduced the number of services, and has, for example, completely taken away its minor surgery through primary care for part of this year?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: The fact of the matter, Jenny, is that it does not just happen in Cardiff; we are seeing a reduction in those services throughout Wales. You challenged me, Minister, and said that I do not get out and about and talk to people. Let me show you correspondence from the professional bodies representing health professionals in Wales, who are asking exactly the same questions, and who are saying that they need to see these changes being introduced.

Brian Gibbons: You sit in your office, Rhodri, remote from what is going on.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. The comments that I made about sedentary interventions applies also applies to Ministers.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: These organisations, Minister, are asking you the question, which you have avoided, of what is happening in the service, where these things are happening, and will you point them out to them, because they need reassurance that something is happening. As far as they are concerned, nothing is happening; you seem to be the only person who thinks that something is happening.

Trof at ein gwelliannau a'n rhesymau dros eu cyflwyno. O ran y weledigaeth deiran,

things that are in progress. He knows as well as I do, and everyone else in the Chamber, that many things are taking place in England, and very little seems to be happening in Wales.

He said that I was not—

Jenny Randerson: A ydych yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, lle y mae amrywiaeth y gwasanaethau sydd ar gael drwy ofal sylfaenol wedi'i chwtdogi oherwydd bod y bwrdd iechyd lleol, sy'n brin o arian, wedi lleihau nifer o wasanaethau, ac mae, er enghraifft, wedi cau'n gyfan gwbl ei adran mân lawdriniaethau drwy ofal sylfaenol am ran o'r flwyddyn eleni?

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Y gwir amdani, Jenny, yw nad yng Nghaerdydd yn unig y mae hynny'n digwydd, yr ydym yn gweld lleihad yn y gwasanaethau hynny ledled Cymru. Yr ydych wedi fy herio, Weinidog, a dywedasoch nad wyf yn mynd allan ac yn sgwrsio â phobl. Gadewch imi ddangos llythyrau ichi gan y cyrff proffesiynol sy'n cynrychioli gweithwyr iechyd proffesiynol yng Nghymru, sy'n gofyn yr un cwestiynau'n union, ac sy'n dweud eu bod am weld y newidiadau hyn yn cael eu cyflwyno.

Brian Gibbons: Yr ydych yn eistedd yn eich swyddfa, Rhodri, ymhell oddi wrth yr hyn sy'n digwydd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'r sylwadau a wneuthum ynghylch ymyrryd ar eich eistedd yn cyfeirio at Weinidogion hefyd.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Mae'r sefydliadau hyn, Weinidog, yn gofyn cwestiwn i chi, cwestiwn yr ydych wedi'i osgoi, sef beth sy'n digwydd yn y gwasanaeth, ym mhle y mae'r pethau hyn yn digwydd, ac a wnewch dynnu eu sylw atynt, oherwydd eu bod am gael sicrwydd bod rhywbeth yn digwydd. Cyn belled ag y maent hwy yn y cwestiwn, nid oes dim yn digwydd; mae'n ymddangos mai chi yw'r unig un sy'n credu bod rhywbeth yn digwydd.

I turn to our amendments and our reasons for tabling them. In terms of the tripartite vision,

Weinidog, ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno â'r weledigaeth gyffredinol yn y ddogfen hon, wrth ichi sôn am wasnaethau iechyd gydol oes, gwasanaethau a gyflwynir yn gyflym, yn ddiogel ac effeithiol, a gofal o'r radd flaenaf. Ni fyddai neb yn anghytuno â hynny. Yr hyn y mae pawb am ei wybod yw sut yr ydych yn bwriadu cyflwyno'r weledigaeth hon, ac yr ydych yn methu'n lân ag ateb y cwestiwn hwnnw. Hyd nes y cawn yr ateb hwnnw, ni allwn gefnogi'r ddogfen hon. Gallwn groesawu'r weledigaeth, ond yr ydym am wybod beth yw'r manylion.

no-one is going to disagree with the general vision outlined in this document, where you talk about lifelong health services, services that are provided quickly, safely and effectively, and care of the highest possible quality. No-one is going to disagree with that. What everyone wants to know is how you intend to introduce this vision, and you have singularly failed to answer that question. Until we get that answer, we cannot support this document. We can welcome the vision, but we want to know the details.

O ran gwelliant 4, a allwch chi ddweud wrthym y prynhawn yma y bydd yr holl newidiadau sydd i'w cyflwyno o dan 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' a phethau eraill yn cael eu hariannu'n llawn gan Lywodraeth Cymru? A gawn ni yr ymrwymiad hwnnw y prynhawn yma?

On amendment 4, can you tell us this afternoon that all of the changes to be made under 'Agenda for Change' and other things will be fully funded by the Government of Wales? Can we have that commitment this afternoon?

5.10 p.m.

O ran y problemau cyllidebol sy'n wynebu'r ymddiriedolaethau a'r ddyled hanesyddol sydd gan lawer ohonynt, lle mae'r ddyled hanesyddol honno sydd wedi ei hetifeddu yn effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar wasanaethau—ac, fel y gwyddoch, mae'n digwydd yn y gogledd, yn Abertawe, yng Ngheredigion a thrwy Gymru—a rowch chi ymrwymiad i ymyrryd?

In terms of the funding problems that the trusts face and the historic debt that many of them owe, where that inherited historic debt affects services directly—and, as you know, it is happening in the north, in Swansea, in Ceredigion and throughout Wales—will you give a commitment to intervene?

Mae'r holl gynllun wedi ei seilio ar fuddsoddiad cyfalaf yn yr ymddiriedolaethau. A wnewch chi edrych ar y sefyllfa lle mae pob ymddiriedolaeth sy'n derbyn buddsoddiad cyfalaf ar gyfer adeiladau yn gorfod talu'r llog arno? Mae hynny'n effeithio'n uniongyrchol ar eu cyllidebau gan greu problemau enfawr. A wnewch chi edrych ar y sefyllfa hon ac ystyried dileu'r broses honno, neu, fel arall, sut y byddwch yn cyflwyno'r buddsoddiadau hyn? Bydd pob ymddiriedolaeth yn gorfod dod o hyd i'r arian yn eu cyllidebau i dalu'r llog ar y buddsoddiad, a bydd hynny'n creu mwy o broblemau yn eu cyllidebau ac yn golygu bod mwy o wasanaethau yn cael eu colli yng Nghymru.

The whole scheme is based on capital investment in the trusts. Will you look at the current situation where every trust which receives capital investment for buildings has to pay the interest on that? That will affect their budgets directly and create huge problems. Will you look at this situation and consider abolishing that process, otherwise, how will you introduce these investments? Every trust will have to find the money in their budgets to pay the interest on the investment, and that will create further problems within their budgets and will lead to the loss of more services in Wales.

It seems to me that you are trying to avoid every question that has been asked of you in terms of this strategy. I refer you to the

Mae'n ymddangos i mi eich bod yn ceisio osgoi pob cwestiwn a ofynnwyd i chi ynglŷn â'r strategaeth hon. Yr wyf am eich cyfeirio

document 'Building local, safe and sustainable services for Mid and West Wales: The Case for Change'. I will refer to two bullet points, the first of which states that,

'we will focus on redesign, not relocation'.

It then says,

'some highly specialised services can only be provided in larger centres'.

If you are not relocating, what do those two sentences mean? You are avoiding all the issues and failing to give us any detail or substance on these changes, and that is what we need to hear.

Jenny Randerson: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 9: add a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that in order to achieve the ambitious vision contained in 'Designed for Life' the Assembly Government needs to take immediate and radical steps to improve the current state of the health service in Wales.

I propose amendment 10. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the parallel social care and social services framework has not been developed simultaneously.

I propose amendment 11. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

notes that 'Designed for Life', as with any strategy, will only result in improvements if it is properly implemented.

The Welsh Liberal Democrats cautiously welcome 'Designed for Life', but we felt compelled to make amendments that point out the gap between the vision, or nirvana, that the Minister paints in this strategy and the reality of the current situation. Derek Wanless stated in his report, and I quote verbatim, that, 'A radical redesign is

at y ddogfen 'Building local, safe and sustainable services for Mid and West Wales: The Case for Change'. Cyfeiriaf at ddau bwynt bwled, ac mae'r cyntaf ohonynt yn datgan,

byddwn yn canolbwyntio ar ailgynllunio, ac nid ar adleoli.

Yna dywed,

dim ond yn y canolfannau mwyaf y gellir darparu rhai gwasanaethau arbenigol iawn.

Os nad ydych yn adleoli, beth yw ystyr y ddwy frawddeg uchod? Yr ydych yn osgoi'r holl faterion ac yn gwrthod rhoi dim manylion na sylwedd inni ynglŷn â'r newidiadau hyn, a dyna'r hyn yr ydym am ei glywed.

Jenny Randerson: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 9: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu er mwyn cyflawni'r weledigaeth uchelgeisiol sydd yn 'Cynllun Oes' fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau radical ar unwaith i wella cyflwr cyfredol y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru.

Cynigiaf welliant 10. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu na ddatblygwyd y fframwaith gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol paralel ochr yn ochr.

Cynigiaf welliant 11. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi mai dim ond os caiff ei weithredu'n iawn y bydd 'Cynllun Oes' yn arwain at welliannau, yn yr un modd â chydag unrhyw strategaeth.

Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n rhoi croeso gofalus i 'Cynllun Oes', ond yr oeddem yn teimlo bod rhaid inni gynnig gwelliannau sy'n tynnu sylw at yr agendor rhwng y weledigaeth, neu'r nirvana, y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei phortreadu yn y strategaeth a realiti'r sefyllfa. Nododd Derek Wanless yn ei adroddiad, a dyfynnaf air am air, fod 'rhaid

imperative'. Two years on, there is still no detail. I appreciate that this Labour Government appears to like to make people wait, not just for this response to Wanless, but for their operations, but it is time that we had the nitty-gritty, the hard detail, of what is going to be a difficult process in many respects.

Our first amendment points out that having a long-term vision should not mean that we forget pressing current issues. We cannot allow the staff of the health service to carry on scrabbling around from day to day in a hand-to-mouth existence, while pursuing this ultimate vision. We have to deal with the problems as they are now.

Wanless, among other things, stressed the need for increased joint-working and co-ordination between health services and social care; it is disappointing that, as our second amendment highlights, the social care and social services framework has not been developed simultaneously. I am sure that the Minister will tell us that it is on its way, but the important thing was that they came out together, because of the importance of their equal status and of joint working.

There are good projects going on, but there is a great deal of concern, for example, from physiotherapists, that they are working for two masters and to two separate agendas. Although there is some good practice going on, not just in Cardiff, but in Ysbyty Glan Clwyd and in Gwent, for example, that does not make up for the lack of strategic vision. In some ways, we are going backwards, as I pointed out in my intervention to Rhodri Glyn Thomas, with underfunded LHBs, and Cardiff being one of them. They are underfunded according to the Townsend formula and are saddled with massive debt that is inherited from the health authorities, and they freely admit that they are forced to make cuts that go against the strategic direction.

'Designed for Life' emphasises the need for

ailgynllunio mewn modd radical'. Ddwy flynedd yn ddiweddarach, ni chafwyd dim manylion. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli ei bod yn ymddangos bod y Llywodraeth Lafur hon yn hoffi gwneud i bobl aros, nid yn unig am yr ymateb hwn i Wanless, ond hefyd am eu llawdriniaethau, ond mae'n bryd inni gael yr hanfodion, y manylion sylfaenol, am yr hyn sy'n mynd i fod yn broses anodd mewn sawl ffordd.

Mae ein gwelliant cyntaf yn datgan na ddylai mabwysiadu gweledigaeth hirdymor olygu ein bod yn anghofio am faterion pwysig y presennol. Ni allwn ganiatáu i staff y gwasanaeth iechyd ddal ati i ymlafnio o ddydd i ddydd a byw ar fin y gyllell, wrth geisio gwireddu'r weledigaeth eithaf hon. Rhaid delio â'r problemau fel y maent ar hyn o bryd.

Pwysleisiodd Wanless, ymhlith pethau eraill, fod angen mwy o gydweithio a chydlynw rhwng gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol; mae'n siomedig, fel y mae ein hail welliant yn nodi, nad yw'r fframwaith gofal cymdeithasol a gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wedi cael ei ddatblygu ar yr un pryd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd y Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym fod hynny ar y ffordd, ond y peth pwysig oedd eu bod yn cael eu cyhoeddi gyda'i gilydd, oherwydd pwysigrwydd eu statws cyfartal a phwysigrwydd cydweithio.

Mae prosiectau da ar waith, ond mynegwyd cryn bryder gan ffisiotherapyddion, er enghraifft, eu bod yn gweithio i ddau feistr ac ar ddwy agenda wahanol. Er bod arferion da i'w gweld, nid yn unig yng Nghaerdydd, ond yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd ac yng Ngwent, er enghraifft, nid yw hynny'n gwneud iawn am y diffyg gweledigaeth strategol. Mewn rhai ffyrdd, yr ydym yn camu'n ôl, fel y dywedais pan ymyrrais ag anerchiad Rhodri Glyn Thomas, gyda byrddau iechyd lleol heb adnoddau digonol, ac mae Caerdydd yn un ohonynt. Nid ydynt yn derbyn adnoddau digonol yn ôl fformiwla Townsend ac maent yn gorfod ysgwyddo dyledion anferthol a etifeddwyd gan yr awdurdodau iechyd, ac maent yn ddigon parod i gyfaddef eu bod yn cael eu gorfodi i wneud toriadau sy'n mynd yn groes i'r cyfeiriad strategol.

Mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn pwysleisio bod angen

services like minor surgery to be developed in primary care, yet the additional services provided by primary care teams are being reversed, rather than rolled out.

There is also the question of the aim to promote lifelong health—to create a health service rather than an illness service. That is very laudable, but to do this, primary care teams need to be providing a full range of support for those with chronic illnesses and those in higher risk groups, so that they stay out of hospital. The primary care teams cannot do that under the current funding regime in many parts of Wales.

The schedule of milestones lays out a lengthy set of targets. I think that there are six pages of them; there are certainly 55 targets. It is interesting to see how many of these are due to be met by next March. I warn you that an awful lot of health announcements will have to be made between now and March if the targets are truly going to be met by then. Some of those milestones, such as service development closer to where people live, are very thorny issues. The recent announcement of a consultation on west Wales has not allayed people's concerns or reassured them that services will be provided close to where they live. It has sown seeds of fear and concern among many people, for example, on the future of Worthybush Hospital. Therefore, we need to have the detail very quickly.

The commitment to providing additional nurses is welcome, but we are faced with appalling retention rates and, until very recently, an escalating reliance on agency nurses, which has boomed totally out of control. How will that picture be set against that bald target on additional nurses?

Our amendment 11 highlights a crucial point about implementation. The vision is great, but so is the vision of an end to world poverty. To be honest, I do not think that we are any closer to achieving your vision of the health service than we are, sadly, to achieving the end of world poverty.

datblygu gwasanaethau fel mân lawdriniaethau mewn gofal sylfaenol, eto mae'r gwasanaethau ychwanegol a ddarperir gan dimau gofal sylfaenol yn cael eu cildroi, yn hytrach na'u rhoi ar waith fesul cam.

Hefyd rhaid ystyried y nod o hybu iechyd gydol oes—creu gwasanaeth iechyd yn hytrach na gwasanaeth salwch. Mae hynny'n glodwiw iawn, ond i wneud hyn, mae angen i dimau gofal sylfaenol fod yn darparu ystod lawn o gymorth i bobl â salwch cronig a rhai mewn grwpiau risg uwch, i'w cadw allan o'r ysbyty. Ni all y timau gofal iechyd sylfaenol wneud hynny dan y drefn ariannu bresennol mewn llawer rhan o Gymru.

Mae'r rhestr o gerrig milltir yn gosod set hirfaith o dargeddi. Credaf fod chwe thudalen ohonynt; yn sicr mae 55 o dargedau. Mae'n ddi-ddorol gweld faint o'r rhain sydd i fod i gael eu cyrraedd erbyn mis Mawrth nesaf. Rhybuddiaf y bydd yn rhaid gwneud peth wmbredd o gyhoeddiadau iechyd o hyn i fis Mawrth os am gyflawni'r targedau erbyn hynny mewn gwirionedd. Mae rhai o'r cerrig milltir hynny, megis datblygu gwasanaethau'n nes at ble y mae pobl yn byw, yn bynciau dadleuol iawn. Nid yw'r cyhoeddiad diweddar y bwriedir ymgynghori ynghylch gorllewin Cymru wedi tawelu ofnau pobl na rhoi sicrwydd iddynt y darperir gwasanaethau'n agos at ble y maent yn byw. Mae wedi codi ofn a phryder ymysg llawer o bobl, er enghraifft, ynglŷn â dyfodol Ysbyty Llwynhelyg. Felly, mae angen cael y manylion ar fyrder.

Croesewir yr ymrwymiad i ddarparu nyrsys ychwanegol, ond yr ydym yn wynebu ffigurau ofnadwy o wael o ran cadw staff a, than yn ddiweddar, dibyniaeth gynyddol ar nyrsys asiantaeth, sydd wedi cynyddu y tu hwnt i bob rheolaeth. Sut y gosodir y darlun hwnnw yn erbyn y targed moel hwnnw ar gyfer nyrsys ychwanegol?

Mae ein gwelliant 11 yn pwysleisio pwynt allweddol ynghylch gweithredu. Mae'r weledigaeth yn wych, ond felly hefyd y weledigaeth o roi terfyn ar dlodi'r byd. A bod yn onest, nid wyf yn meddwl ein bod gam yn nes at wireddu eich gweledigaeth ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd nag a ydym, ysywaeth, at sicrhau terfyn ar dlodi'r byd.

Irene James: ‘Designed for Life’ is an important strategy that ensures that, over the next 10 years, everyone will be working together with the same vision to overcome one of the most challenging elements of Welsh public service improvement. We recognise that overcoming sustained ill health in Wales will not be achieved within the remit of one Minister’s portfolio, or by improving health treatment alone. Community regeneration, good health promotion, education and economic prosperity each have an impact on health. It is those who live in the greatest poverty who suffer the greatest health inequalities, and for whom a designed-for-life health service often seems the most distant.

A long-term vision that sets reform and improvement in context is a vital part of engaging with current and future users of the national health service, and an essential foundation of a patient-centred service. We have made the biggest ever investment in health services. We are building and opening new hospitals and surgeries, and training more doctors and nurses in new Welsh clinical facilities. We are ensuring that we have the resources to deliver better health services in Wales. The people of Crumlin in my constituency look forward to a new fit-for-purpose surgery, and people across Islwyn and the Caerphilly area will soon benefit from a new hospital.

This is a new modern framework for the delivery of modern healthcare to those who need it most. It is in the interests of those with the greatest health needs that we overcome vested interests and sometimes take difficult decisions redesigning care. In order to provide targeted health provision, the current phase of health improvement in Wales must direct new resources on the basis of need. The effective and efficient implementation of the Wanless and Townsend reports, and reform and redistribution on the basis of need must be our overarching priorities. Delivering better health—

Jocelyn Davies: Will the Member take an

Irene James: Mae’r ‘Cynllun Oes’ yn strategaeth bwysig sydd yn sicrhau y bydd pawb, dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf, yn gweithio gyda’i gilydd gyda’r un weledigaeth i oresgyn un o elfennau mwyaf heriol gwella gwasanaethau cyhoeddus Cymru. Sylweddolwn na lwyddir i oresgyn iechyd gwael parhaus yng Nghymru o fewn cylch gwaith portffolio un Gweinidog, na thrwy wella triniaeth iechyd yn unig. Mae adfywio cymunedau, hybu iechyd da, addysg a ffyniant economaidd i gyd yn effeithio ar iechyd. Y rhai sydd yn byw yn y tlogi mwyaf sy’n dioddef yr anfanteision iechyd mwyaf, ac iddynt hwy y mae gwasanaeth iechyd cynllun oes yn aml yn ymddangos bellaf i ffwrdd.

Mae gweledigaeth hirdymor sy’n gosod diwygio a gwella o fewn cyd-destun yn rhan allweddol o greu perthynas gyda defnyddwyr y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yn awr ac yn y dyfodol, ac yn sylfaen hanfodol i wasanaeth sy’n canolbwyntio ar y claf. Yr ydym wedi gwneud y buddsoddiad mwyaf erioed mewn gwasanaethau iechyd. Yr ydym yn adeiladu ac yn agor ysbytai a meddygfeydd newydd, ac yn hyfforddi mwy o feddygon a nyrsys mewn cyfleusterau clinigol newydd yng Nghymru. Yr ydym yn sicrhau bod yr adnoddau gennym i roi gwasanaethau iechyd gwell yng Nghymru. Mae pobl Crymlyn yn fy etholaeth yn edrych ymlaen at feddygfa newydd addas i’r pwrpas, a bydd pobl ar draws Islwyn ac ardal Caerffili cyn hir yn elwa o gael ysbyty newydd.

Mae hyn yn fframwaith cyfoes newydd ar gyfer rhoi gofal iechyd modern i’r rhai sydd arnynt ei angen fwyaf. Mae er budd y rhai sydd â’r anghenion iechyd mwyaf inni oresgyn buddiannau breintiedig a gwneud penderfyniadau anodd weithiau i ailgynllunio gofal. Er mwyn targedu darpariaeth iechyd, rhaid i’r cam cyfredol yn y broses o wella iechyd yng Nghymru gyfeirio adnoddau newydd ar sail yr angen. Rhaid inni roi ein blaenoriaeth bennaf i weithredu adroddiadau Wanless a Townsend yn effeithiol ac yn effeithlon, a diwygio ac ailddosbarthu ar sail yr angen. Darparu gwell iechyd—

Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff yr Aelod dderbyn

intervention on that point?

Irene James: Sorry, Jocelyn, I have about four words to go. Delivering better health across Wales is our overriding aim and policy.

5.20 p.m.

Elin Jones: Un o elfennau creiddiol ‘Cynllun Oes’ yw integreiddio gwasanaethau ac efallai fod hynny yn bwysicach mewn ardal wledig fel fy etholaeth i nag ydyw yn unman arall. Yr oedd y gwaith integreiddio gwasanaethau hwnnw yn mynd yn ei flaen yn ardal Aberteifi, Tregaron ac Aberaeron. Yr oeddent yn cynllunio gwasanaeth iechyd a gofal gyda’r addewid bendant o arian cyfalaf gan y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol i ariannu adeiladau newydd yn y tair tref hynny—£21 miliwn yn gyfan gwbl. Yn greiddiol i’r datblygiadau yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi yr oedd gwelyau’r ysbytai cymunedol ond, fel fflach o’r gwyll, daeth y newyddion bod Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ceredigion a Chanolbarth Cymru yn awgrymu cau gwelyau GIG Aberteifi a Thregaron oherwydd yr angen i gwrdd â diffyg ariannol o £1.1 filiwn.

Ers i’r newyddion hyn dorri, mae’r ymddiriedolaeth wedi gwneud ei gorau glas i gyflwyno’r newidiadau fel rhai sy’n digwydd er mwyn ailgynllunio’r gwasanaeth iechyd yng nghyd-destun ‘Cynllun Oes’. Mae gennyf ddau ymateb i hynny. Yn gyntaf, nid oedd neb yn crybwyll gwaredu gwelyau GIG yn Aberteifi nac yn Nhregaron hyd nes i faint y broblem ariannol amlygu ei hun. Yn ail, yr un ymddiriedolaeth sy’n awgrymu cau ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi ag sydd wedi gwrthwynebu cau ysbyty Tywyn oherwydd y gallai hynny arwain at flocio gwelyau yn Ysbyty Bronglais. Yr unig wahaniaeth, o safbwynt yr ymddiriedolaeth, rhwng Tywyn ar yr un llaw a Thregaron ac Aberteifi ar y llall, yw nad Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Ceredigion a Chanolbarth Cymru sy’n ariannu Ysbyty Tywyn.

Byddai cau ysbytai Tregaron ac Aberteifi yn cynyddu’r pwysau yn sylweddol ar ysbytai cyffredinol Bronglais, Glangwili a Llwynhelyg. Gŵyr unrhyw un sy’n adnabod y tri ysbyty hynny y bydd yn amhosibl iddynt

ymyriad ar y pwynt hwnnw?

Irene James: Mae’n ddrwg gennyf, Jocelyn, rhyw bedwar gair sydd gennyf i fynd. Darparu gwell iechyd ledled Cymru yw ein prif nod a’n polisi.

Elin Jones: The integration of services is a core element of ‘Designed for Life’ and perhaps that is more important in a rural area, such as my constituency than anywhere else. That service-integration work was under way in Cardigan, Tregaron and Aberaeron. They were planning a health and social care service with the concrete promise of capital funds from the Minister for Health and Social Services to fund new buildings in those three towns—£21 million in total. At the core of the developments in Tregaron and Cardigan were community hospital beds, but then, like a bolt from the blue, came the news that the Ceredigion and Mid Wales NHS Trust was proposing to close NHS beds in Cardigan and Tregaron because it needed to fill a financial deficit of £1.1 million.

Since that news broke, the trust has done its best to present these changes as being essential to the reconfiguration of the health service in the context of ‘Designed for Life’. I have two responses to that. First, no-one had hinted at getting rid of NHS beds in Cardigan or Tregaron until the scale of the financial problem came to light. Secondly, it is the same trust that is suggesting the closure of Tregaron and Cardigan hospitals as that which opposed the closure of Tywyn Hospital stating that that could lead to bedblocking in Bronglais Hospital. The only difference, from the trust’s point of view, between Tywyn on one hand and Tregaron and Cardigan on the other, is that Ceredigion and Mid Wales NHS Trust does not fund Tywyn Hospital.

The closure of the hospitals in Tregaron and Cardigan would significantly increase the pressure on Bronglais, Glangwili and Withybush general hospitals. Anyone who knows those three hospitals will be aware

allu cynnwys y 50 o welyau'r GIG a fydd yn cael eu colli o Geredigion os bydd y cynlluniau hyn yn dwyn ffrwyth. Mae hynny hefyd yng nghyd-destun y ffaith bod diffyg capasiti sylweddol yn yr ardal o ran cartrefi nyrsio preifat, a phwysau sylweddol ar wasanaethau cymdeithasol Ceredigion. Nid oes gennyf unrhyw amheuaeth mai problem ariannol yn unig sydd wedi arwain at y cynnig i gau gwelyau GIG yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi.

Mae dau o welliannau Plaid Cymru yn cyfeirio'n benodol at ddwy elfen o'r broblem ariannol hon. Yn gyntaf, mae ymddiriedolaeth Ceredigion yn wynebu ad-dalu dyled hanesyddol, o'r flwyddyn nesaf, o dros £700,000 y flwyddyn. Mae'r ffigur hwnnw tua'r un swm â chost cadw ysbyty Tregaron ar agor. Yn ogystal, mae ymddiriedolaeth Ceredigion wedi ei thangyllido o ryw £600,000 oherwydd yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'.

Huw Lewis *rose*—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. It is time to wind up now; your three minutes are up.

Elin Jones: Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Huw, ond mae fy amser ar fin dod i ben.

Mae'n gwbl annheg bod y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r gwasanaeth i gleifion yng Ngheredigion yn dirywio oherwydd diffyg cyllid gan y Llywodraeth hon.

Huw Lewis: 'Designed for Life' is a comprehensive response to the recommendations set out in the Wanless report and, as such, it underlines the commitment of Labour in Wales to provide a first-class health service, free at the point of use, for future generations. In 1999, the Assembly inherited a £2.8 billion health budget and, by 2007-08, that budget will be more than £5 billion—we will have doubled health spending over nine years. That level of commitment explains why only one party is trusted by people in Wales to maintain and develop their health service. However, we will never take that trust and responsibility for granted.

that it will be impossible for them to accommodate the 50 NHS beds that will be lost from Ceredigion should these plans come to fruition. That is also in the context of the fact that there is a significant lack of capacity in the area in terms of private nursing homes, and there is considerable pressure on Ceredigion's social services. I have no doubt that financial problems alone are at the root of the proposal to close NHS beds in Tregaron and Cardigan.

Two of Plaid Cymru's amendments refer specifically to two elements of this financial predicament. First, Ceredigion NHS trust faces repaying a historical debt, from next year, of more than £700,000 a year. That figure is akin to the cost of keeping Tregaron hospital open. In addition, Ceredigion NHS trust is underfunded by about £600,000 because of 'Agenda for Change'.

Huw Lewis *a gododd*—

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. Mae'n amser dirwyn i ben yn awr; mae eich tri munud ar ben.

Elin Jones: I am sorry, Huw, but my time is about to run out.

It is completely unfair that the health service and the service for patients in Ceredigion are deteriorating because of a lack of funding from this Government.

Huw Lewis: Mae'r 'Cynllun Oes' yn ymateb cynhwysfawr i'r argymhellion a wneir yn adroddiad Wanless ac, yn hynny o beth, mae'n tanlinellu ymrwymiad Llafur yng Nghymru i ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd o'r radd flaenaf, yn rhad ac am ddim yn y man lle y'i defnyddir, i'r cenedlaethau a ddaw. Yn 1999, etifeddodd y Cynulliad gyllideb iechyd o £2.8 biliwn ac, erbyn 2007-08, bydd y gyllideb honno'n fwy na £5 biliwn—byddwn wedi dyblu gwariant ar iechyd dros naw mlynedd. Mae'r lefel honno o ymrwymiad yn esbonio pam mai dim ond un blaid y mae pobl Cymru'n ymddiried ynddi i gynnal a datblygu eu gwasanaeth iechyd. Fodd bynnag, ni wnawn fyth gymryd yr ymddiriedaeth a'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw yn

ganiataol.

Mark Isherwood *rose*—

Huw Lewis: While we have made many hard yards in health, there are still weaknesses in the system, inequalities that must be eradicated as a matter of urgency at this time, in the foundation phase. As with any foundation, one weakness can lead to collapse. According to the 2005 index of multiple deprivation, half of the output areas in Merthyr Tydfil are among the most deprived 10 per cent in Wales in terms of health.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. Are you giving way to Mark Isherwood?

Huw Lewis: Yes, I am.

Mark Isherwood: Referring to your initial comments about the financial position, could you therefore explain why, from looking at the three north Wales trusts, it appears as though Conwy and Denbighshire NHS Trust is running a significant current deficit that is forcing it to consider closing children's wards and so on at weekends, and why the other two north Wales trusts are expecting to fall into deficit next year? Why are community hospitals from Flint to Prestatyn threatened with closure? Why are some of the communities that want the new health centres being told that they cannot have them because they may not meet the Minister's new locality rules?

Huw Lewis: I am pleased that you made that intervention, Mark, because this reflects on an intervention that I attempted to make when Elin was speaking. You and Elin represent perhaps the healthiest parts of the country while I represent, without a shadow of a doubt, the unhealthiest. What you are asking is for past financial mismanagement to be rewarded and cross-subsidised by people in constituencies such as mine, because, frankly, management in areas in north and west Wales has not got its act together. I applaud the Minister for standing up to those vested interests.

Mark Isherwood *a gododd*—

Huw Lewis: Er ein bod wedi cyflawni llawer ym maes iechyd, mae gwendidau yn y system o hyd, anghydraddoldebau y mae'n rhaid eu dileu fel mater o frys yn awr, wrth adeiladu'r sylfaen. Fel gydag unrhyw sylfaen, gall un gwendid arwain at gwmp. Yn ôl mynegai amddifadedd lluosog 2005, mae hanner yr ardaloedd cynnyrch ym Merthyr Tudful ymhlith y 10 y cant mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru o ran iechyd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Trefn. A ydych yn ildio i Mark Isherwood?

Huw Lewis: Ydwyf.

Mark Isherwood: A chyfeirio at eich sylwadau ar y dechrau ynglŷn â'r sefyllfa ariannol, a allech esbonio felly pam, o edrych ar dair ymddiriedolaeth gogledd Cymru, yr ymddengys fel pe bai gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Conwy a Sir Ddinbych ddiffyg cyfredol sylweddol sydd yn ei gorfodi i ystyried cau wardiau plant ac yn y blaen ar benwythnosau, a pham mae'r ddwy ymddiriedolaeth arall yn y gogledd yn disgwyl y bydd ganddynt ddiffyg y flwyddyn nesaf? Pam mae bygythiad i gau ysbytai cymuned o'r Fflint i Brestatyn? Pam y dywedir wrth rai o'r cymunedau sy'n awyddus i gael y canolfannau iechyd newydd na allant eu cael am nad ydynt efallai'n bodloni rheolau newydd y Gweinidog ar gyfer cyfleusterau lleol?

Huw Lewis: Yr wyf yn falch ichi wneud yr ymyriad hwnnw, Mark, oherwydd y mae a wnelo hyn ag ymyriad y ceisiais ei wneud pan oedd Elin yn siarad. Yr ydych chi ac Elin yn cynrychioli'r rhannau iachaf o'r wlad, o bosibl, a minnau'n cynrychioli, heb rithyn o amheuaeth, y fwyaf afiach. Yr hyn yr ydych yn gofyn amdano yw bod camreolaeth ariannol y gorffennol yn cael ei gwobrwyo a'i thraws-sybsideiddio gan bobl mewn etholaethau fel f'un i, oherwydd, a siarad yn blaen, fod y rheolaeth mewn ardaloedd yn y gogledd a'r gorllewin wedi bod yn dipyn o siop siafins. Cymeradwyaf y Gweinidog am wrthsefyll y buddiannau breintiedig hynny.

Janet Davies *rose*—

Huw Lewis: I do not have time for another intervention.

The Welsh Cancer Information and Surveillance Unit has noted that, clearly and consistently, the most deprived people experience the lowest cancer survival. Which LHB, according to the unit, had the lowest one-year relative survival rate for men and women between 1990 and 1999? Which LHB had the lowest five-year relative survival rate for men and women between 1990 and 1999? Yes, it is the same area as that where the children reportedly have the worst teeth in the United Kingdom, and where women are said to die younger than women anywhere else in the UK. It is the same area that comes consistently bottom on a whole range of health indicators. This is the area that does not even have its own MRI scanner, which is a basic tool in helping to identify the cancers that place its citizens at the top of the mortality league. The place that I am talking about is, of course, Merthyr Tydfil.

Where the need is most acute, there is a need to act. In its local Wanless action plan, Merthyr LHB clearly cites the need for an MRI scanner for Prince Charles Hospital. The demand is clearly there. Patients at the hospital should not have to travel down—

Jocelyn Davies: Will you give way?

Huw Lewis: I will, if the DPO will allow it.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You have only half a minute.

Jocelyn Davies: You will be aware that Labour has been in charge of the health service in Wales since 1997. Eight years is a long time, and so you must be as bitterly disappointed as the rest of us that conditions in Merthyr are still as appalling as you describe.

Janet Davies *a gododd*—

Huw Lewis: Nid oes gennyf amser ar gyfer ymyriad arall.

Mae Uned Gwybodaeth ac Arolygaeth Canser Cymru wedi nodi mai'r bobl fwyaf difreintiedig, yn glir ac yn gyson, sydd leiaf tebygol o oroesi cancr. Yn ardal pa fwrdd iechyd lleol, yn ôl yr uned, yr oedd y gyfradd oroesi gymharol isaf ar ôl blwyddyn i ddynion a menywod rhwng 1990 a 1999? Yn ardal pa fwrdd iechyd lleol yr oedd y gyfradd oroesi gymharol isaf wedi pum mlynedd i ddynion a menywod rhwng 1990 a 1999? Ie, yr un ardal â honno lle'r adroddir bod gan y plant y dannedd gwaethaf yn y Deyrnas Unedig, a lle y dywedir bod menywod yn marw'n iau na menywod yn unman arall yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Yr un ardal sydd ar y gwaelod yn gyson o ran cryn amrywiaeth o ddangosyddion iechyd. Dyma'r ardal nad oes ganddi hyd yn oed ei sganiwr MRI ei hun, sydd yn arf sylfaenol i helpu i ganfod y canserau sy'n rhoi ei dinasyddion ar ben y gynghrair o ran marwolaethau. Y lle yr wyf yn sôn amdano, wrth gwrs, yw Merthyr Tudful.

Lle y mae'r angen mwyaf, mae angen gweithredu. Yn ei gynllun gweithredu Wanless lleol, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol Merthyr yn nodi'n glir yr angen am sganiwr MRI i Ysbyty'r Tywysog Charles. Mae'r galw yno yn amlwg. Ni ddylai cleifion yn yr ysbyty orfod teithio i lawr—

Jocelyn Davies: A wnewch ildio?

Huw Lewis: Gwnaf, os gwnaiff y Dirprwy Lywydd ganiatáu hynny.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Hanner munud yn unig sydd gennych.

Jocelyn Davies: Byddwch yn ymwybodol bod Llafur yn gyfrifol am y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru ers 1997. Mae wyth mlynedd yn amser maith, felly rhaid eich bod wedi'ch siomi mor enbyd â'r gweddill ohonom fod amodau ym Merthyr yn dal i fod mor ofnadwy â'r hyn yr ydych yn ei ddisgrifio.

Huw Lewis: The difference here is that Labour grapples with the complexity of how to put these things right, while the opposition offers simplistic prescriptions that are barely a degree above heckling from the sidelines. That is the difference.

It takes many years to sort out the underinvestment that the last Tory Government inflicted on the NHS. That is enough work for a generation, let alone eight years.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: You need to wind up now, Huw.

Huw Lewis: I will wind up simply by appealing to the Minister, in his work, as 'Designed for Life' is rolled out, to look specifically at the problems of Merthyr Tydfil in scanner provision and primary healthcare and neighbourhood hospital provision. There is a need for a sense of urgency in this matter.

Kirsty Williams: Without doubt, the challenge to the Minister is to get the public to engage with 'Designed for Life' and the need to fundamentally redesign services in the way that he described. Brian has made his job 10 times harder in that respect because of the current financial situation in which health organisations find themselves.

He is going into a series of public consultations on 'Designed for Life' proposals on the back of swingeing cuts to many services in many areas. You simply cannot expect the public to divorce the two in their minds. The public in Ceredigion, in Tregaron and Cardigan will not accept proposals that come forward, perhaps with the best will in the world, to redesign their services, thinking that that is because they are being redesigned in their best interests. They will see it as cuts to save you money, just as the people of Bronllys and Builth will feel when the local health board tells them that beds in community hospitals there will have to close this winter to save money and bring them into balance before the end of this financial year. Brian, you have queered your pitch before you have even run onto it, and you have made your job 10 times harder.

Huw Lewis: Y gwahaniaeth yma yw bod Llafur yn ymrafael â chwestiwn cymhleth sut i gywiro'r pethau hyn, tra bod y gwrthbleidiau'n cynnig presgripsiynau gorsymml nad ydynt fawr gwell na heclo o'r ymylon. Dyna'r gwahaniaeth.

Mae'n cymryd blynyddoedd lawer i ddatrys tanfuddsoddiad y Llywodraeth Doriaidd ddiwethaf yn y GIG. Mae hynny'n ddigon o waith i genhedlaeth gyfan, heb sôn am wyth mlynedd.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Mae angen ichi ddirwyn i ben yn awr, Huw.

Huw Lewis: Fe wnaif ddirwyn i ben drwy apelio ar y Gweinidog, yn ei waith, wrth i'r 'Cynllun Oes' gael ei gyflwyno, edrych yn benodol ar broblemau Merthyr Tudful o ran darpariaeth sganiwr a gofal iechyd sylfaenol a darpariaeth ysbyty cymdogaeth. Mae angen ymdeimlad o frys yn y mater hwn.

Kirsty Williams: Heb os, yr her i'r Gweinidog yw cael gan y cyhoedd deimlo bod y 'Cynllun Oes' yn berthnasol iddynt, a'r angen i ailgynllunio gwasanaethau'n sylfaenol yn y modd a ddisgrifiodd. Mae Brian wedi gwneud ei waith 10 gwaith yn anos yn hynny o beth oherwydd y sefyllfa ariannol gyfredol y mae cyrff iechyd yn eu cael eu hunain ynddi.

Mae'n dechrau ar gyfres o ymgynghoriadau cyhoeddus ynghylch cynigion y 'Cynllun Oes' ar ôl i doriadau llym gael eu gwneud mewn llawer o wasanaethau mewn llawer o ardaloedd. Ni allwch ddisgwyl i'r cyhoedd wahanu'r ddau beth yn eu meddyliau. Ni wnaiff y cyhoedd yng Ngheredigion, yn Nhregaron ac Aberteifi dderbyn cynigion a roddir gerbron, efallai gyda'r ewyllys gorau yn y byd, i ailgynllunio'u gwasanaethau, gan feddwl eu bod yn cael eu hailgynllunio er budd iddynt hwy. Byddant yn ei weld fel toriadau i arbed arian i chi, yn union fel y bydd pobl Bronllys a Llanfair ym Muallt yn teimlo pan ddywed y bwrdd iechyd lleol wrthynt y bydd yn rhaid cau gwelyau mewn ysbytai cymuned yno y gaeaf hwn i arbed arian a sicrhau na fydd ganddynt ddyled cyn diwedd y flwyddyn ariannol hon. Brian, yr ydych wedi difetha'ch maes cyn ichi redeg allan arno hyd yn oed, ac yr ydych wedi

gwneud eich gorchwyl 10 gwaith yn anos.

Community hospitals can play a vital role in delivering on the 'Designed for Life' agenda, yet they are among the most vulnerable services. However, they can offer solutions to some of the problems that you face in acute hospitals. People who live in the vicinity of community hospitals realise that things need to change. There is no good in keeping a building open if there are no services within. However, we need a clear direction from you, Minister, as to the role and status that you and your administration believe community hospitals can and should have. With the right type of leadership, vision and investment, they can provide the answer.

Gall ysbytai cymuned chwarae rhan hanfodol o ran cyflwyno agenda'r 'Cynllun Oes', eto maent ymhlith y gwasanaethau mwyaf bregus. Fodd bynnag, gallant gynnig atebion i rai o'r problemau a wynebwyd mewn ysbytai aciwt. Mae pobl sydd yn byw yng nghyffiniau ysbytai cymuned yn sylweddoli bod angen i bethau newid. Nid oes dim diben cadw adeilad yn agored os nad oes gwasanaethau ynddo. Fodd bynnag, mae angen cyfarwyddyd clir gennych, Weinidog, ynglŷn â'r rôl a'r statws y credwch chi a'ch gweinyddiaeth y gall ac y dylai ysbytai cymuned eu cael. Gyda'r math iawn o arweiniad, gweledigaeth a buddsoddiad, ganddynt hwy y mae'r ateb.

5.30 p.m.

The Minister says that what the public wants is at the forefront of his mind. I will tell you what the 600 people of Builth Wells who attended the meeting last Wednesday night want—a community hospital, integrated with social care facilities, which allows them to access as many services as possible in their home environment. They realise that they must travel for acute services, because they have done so all their lives. However, they want the other services to be delivered closer to home. One of the ways in which you can make community hospitals more viable is to tackle the disincentive to bring people home out of district general hospitals back into the community. Powys gains nothing if it brings back patients from Shrewsbury or Hereford hospital into its own hospital, because it must pay on each completed consultant episode. It does not matter how long the episode is—they do not have any incentive to bring people back, because they must pay twice. They must pay for Hereford hospital and their local hospitals. It is basic issues like that which must be addressed, and which can help the finances of community hospitals to stack up.

Mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud bod yr hyn sydd ar y cyhoedd ei eisiau yn flaenllaw yn ei feddwl. Gallaf ddweud wrthyfch yr hyn sydd ei eisiau ar 600 o bobl Llanfair-ym-Muallt a fynychodd y cyfarfod nos Fercher diwethaf—ysbyty cymuned, wedi'i integreiddio â chyfleusterau gofal cymdeithasol, fel y gallant ddefnyddio cymaint o wasanaethau â phosibl yn eu cynefin. Maent yn sylweddoli bod yn rhaid iddynt deithio i dderbyn gwasanaethau aciwt, gan eu bod wedi gwneud hynny erioed. Ond mae arnynt eisiau derbyn y gwasanaethau eraill yn nes adref. Un ffordd y gallwch wneud ysbytai cymunedol yn fwy hyfyw yw drwy roi sylw i'r diffyg cymhelliad i ddod â phobl adref ac allan o ysbytai cyffredinol ac yn ôl i'r gymuned. Nid yw Powys ar ei ennill o gwbl os yw'n dod â chleifion o ysbyty'r Amwythig neu Henffordd i'w ysbyty ei hun, oherwydd rhaid iddo dalu am bob ymgynghoriad a gwblheir. Nid oes ots pa mor hir yw'r ymgynghoriad—nid oes dim cymhelliad i ddod â phobl yn ôl, oherwydd rhaid iddynt dalu ddwywaith. Rhaid iddynt dalu am ysbyty Henffordd a'u hysbytai lleol. Problemau sylfaenol fel hyn y mae'n rhaid eu hateb, a gallai hynny helpu sefyllfa ariannol ysbytai cymuned.

Cynnig Trefniadol Procedural Motion

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that **Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Cynigaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, under Standing Order No. 6.21(iii), extends Plenary to 6 p.m. in order to complete business.

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 6.21(iii), yn ymestyn y Cyfarfod Llawn hyd 6 p.m. er mwyn cwblhau'r busnes.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I accept that this is not an abuse of Assembly procedure. At least 10 Members must support the motion. I see that that is the case, therefore we will move to a vote.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Derbyniaf nad yw hyn yn gamddefnydd o weithdrefn y Cynulliad. Rhaid i o leiaf 10 Aelod gefnogi'r cynnig. Gwelaf fod hynny'n digwydd, felly symudwn at bleidlais.

Cynnig: O blaid 36, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 2.

Motion: For 36, Abstain 0, Against 2.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Jones, Helen Mary
Lewis, Huw

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

**Cynllun Oes—Strategaeth 10 mlynedd ar gyfer Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol:
Parhad
Designed for Life—10-year Strategy for Health and Social Care: Continued**

Val Lloyd: The public's expectations and requirements of healthcare are changing, but so is healthcare itself. Just as there are changes in what patients expect and require from services, there are developments in how healthcare is to be delivered. The delivery of healthcare is at quite a critical juncture, with services needing to be reconfigured, placing quality and access, especially in the community, at the heart of healthcare delivery.

The primary concern must be to drive forward reforms and engage with the public locally, so that every step of the path to reform is taken with local needs in mind. One of the questions that we should ask today is how we can drive forward 'Designed for Life' to reshape the current, less-than-efficient system of healthcare, and deliver a modern and sustainable service for patients at local level.

While 'Designed for Life' sets out a comprehensive framework for change over the next 10 years, my constituents are not necessarily concerned about its contents, but more about its effect. How will it affect them? What will it mean for their local services? It is important that we deliver a positive message to our constituents about the case for change, and what the change will mean for them.

Currently, in my constituency, as I am sure is the case in most Members' constituencies, there are several issues about reconfiguration. My priority is to engage with constituents and share information and views about the proposal for changes to our local services. We must ensure that the public are informed and enabled to understand the reasons why change within the healthcare system is necessary. 'Designed for Life' prescribes an approach that aims to make services more accessible, focusing on patients' needs and improving health and quality of life for everyone.

Val Lloyd: Mae disgwyliadau a gofynion y cyhoedd o ran gofal iechyd yn newid, ond mae gofal iechyd ei hun yn newid hefyd. Fel y ceir newidiadau yn yr hyn y mae cleifion yn ei ddisgwyl ac yn gofyn amdano gan wasanaethau, ceir datblygiadau hefyd yn y modd y darperir gofal iechyd. Mae darparu gofal iechyd wedi cyrraedd pwynt tyngedfennol, lle y mae angen ailgyflunio gwasanaethau, gan roi'r lle canolog i ansawdd a mynediad, yn enwedig yn y gymuned, o ran darparu gofal iechyd.

Rhaid bwrw ymlaen â diwygiadau ac ymgysylltu â'r cyhoedd yn lleol, a rhaid i hynny fod yn brif gonsŷrn i ni, fel bod pob cam ar y llwybr tuag at ddiwygio yn cael ei gymryd gydag anghenion lleol mewn golwg. Un o'r cwestiynau y dylem ei ofyn heddiw yw sut y gallwn fwrw ymlaen â'r 'Cynllun Oes' i ailwampio'r system gofal iechyd bresennol, nad yw'n effeithlon iawn, a darparu gwasanaeth modern a chynaliadwy i gleifion yn lleol.

Er bod y 'Cynllun Oes' yn cynnig fframwaith cynhwysfawr ar gyfer newid dros y 10 mlynedd nesaf, nid yw fy etholwyr o anghenraid yn ymboeni ynghylch ei gynnwys, ond am ei effaith. Sut y bydd yn effeithio arnynt? Beth fydd yn ei olygu i'w gwasanaethau lleol? Mae'n bwysig inni roi neges gadarnhaol i'n hetholwyr ynghylch y rheswm dros newid, a'r hyn y bydd y newid hwnnw yn ei olygu iddynt.

Ar hyn o bryd, yn fy etholaeth i, fel yn etholaethau y rhan fwyaf o'r Aelodau yr wyf yn siŵr, mae sawl problem ynghylch ailgyflunio. Fy mlaenoriaeth yw ymgysylltu â'r etholwyr a rhannu gwybodaeth a barn am y cynnig i newid ein gwasanaethau lleol. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y cyhoedd yn cael gwybod am y rhesymau pam mae angen newid y system gofal iechyd a'u bod yn cael eu galluogi i wneud hynny. Mae'r 'Cynllun Oes' yn cynnig dull sy'n anelu at wneud gwasanaethau yn fwy hygyrch, drwy ganolbwyntio ar anghenion y cleifion a gwella iechyd ac ansawdd bywyd i bawb.

Huge progress has been made at a local level in terms of implementing the foundations for change, with every locality, after intensive consultation, publishing their own strategy for health, social care and wellbeing, which is now followed by the regional case for change. There are three priority areas: first, providing services that meet demand more effectively, secondly, providing strong financial management, and, thirdly, more involvement of people in decisions about services and their own health and treatment.

I hope that, from 'Designed for Life', a local programme of reform will develop that provides community-based care reflecting the needs of each patient and providing a pathway to a healthier NHS in Wales and healthier patients.

David Melding: While I generally support the criticisms that have come from this side of the Chamber, I want to commend a few points to the Minister to make the programme, 'Designed for Life', more coherent. The first relates to promoting the independence of patients, which is an admirable aim. Services must be designed with this in mind. The patient should be at the heart of the process. We often forget that the patient is in a social situation. We try to tackle ill health without looking at the person's job, how they get to hospital, how their family is affected, how their children are cared for, how education can continue and so forth. These issues are important, particularly in the treatment of chronic disease.

Chronic disease management offers some of the greatest public health gains that we could see in the next 10 years and the patient model has to be furthered and enhanced, especially in mental health services, which are in need of perhaps the most dramatic improvement. If I can use a bit of jargon, I know that the Tidal Model has impressed the Health and Social Services Committee and I hope that the Minister will look at that.

On delivering safe and high-quality care, I think that we all believe that that should be as

Mae cynnydd aruthrol wedi'i wneud yn lleol o ran gosod y sylfeini ar gyfer newid, a phob ardal, ar ôl ymgynghori eang, wedi cyhoeddi ei strategaeth ei hun ar gyfer iechyd, gofal cymdeithasol a lles, a hynny bellach yn cael ei ddilyn gan yr achos rhanbarthol dros newid. Mae tri maes blaenoriaeth: yn gyntaf, darparu gwasanaethau sy'n ateb y galw yn fwy effeithiol, yn ail, darparu rheolaeth ariannol gref, ac, yn drydydd, cynnwys pobl i raddau llawer mwy yn y penderfyniadau ynghylch gwasanaethau, a'u hiechyd a'u triniaeth.

Gobeithio y bydd rhaglen leol o ddiwygiadau yn datblygu o'r 'Cynllun Oes' i ddarparu gofal yn y gymuned a fydd yn adlewyrchu anghenion pob claf ac yn arwain y ffordd at GIG iachach yng Nghymru, a chleifion iachach.

David Melding: Er fy mod ar y cyfan yn cefnogi'r beirniadu a ddaeth o'r ochr yma i'r Siambr, yr wyf am gymeradwyo rhai pwyntiau i'r Gweinidog fel bod y rhaglen 'Cynllun Oes' yn fwy cydlynol. Mae'r cyntaf yn ymwneud â hybu annibyniaeth cleifion, sy'n nod clodwiw. Rhaid cynllunio gwasanaethau gyda hyn mewn golwg. Y claf ddylai fod yn ganolog yn y broses. Yr ydym yn aml yn anghofio bod y claf mewn sefyllfa gymdeithasol. Ymdrechwn i ddelio ag afiechyd heb edrych ar waith rhywun, sut y maent wedi cyrraedd yr ysbyty, sut yr effeithir ar eu teuluoedd, sut y gofeligir am eu plant, sut y gall eu haddysg barhau, ac yn y blaen. Mae'r pethau hyn yn bwysig, yn enwedig wrth drin clefydau cronig.

Mae rheoli clefydau cronig yn cynnig rhai o'r manteision mwyaf posibl o ran iechyd y cyhoedd yn y 10 mlynedd nesaf a rhaid datblygu a gwella model y cleifion, yn enwedig yng nghyswllt gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl, lle y mae angen y gwelliannau mwyaf dramatig o bosibl. Os gallaf ddefnyddio mymryn o jargon, gwn fod Model y Llanw wedi gwneud argraff ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol a gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn edrych ar hynny.

O ran darparu gofal diogel ac o ansawdd da, credaf ein bod i gyd yn teimlo y dylai hynny

near home as possible or in the home, if possible. Quality and safety has to be key, which means that there will be cases when patients will have to travel away from their neighbourhood to receive care. We must remember that they, or their family, might need help in terms of accommodation, how to get to the hospitals, transport and how these things are arranged. We should also remember that, when centres of excellence are used, they can still support services in the community, by having out-patient clinics that are near to where people live, for example. We must consider the complete health system, because if we want people to accept that not everything can be delivered on the doorstep, we have to reassure them that they will get the service when they need it and safely. That is key.

Also on safety, I commend to the Minister an examination of how acute services in child and adolescent mental health are delivered. The standard of service at the moment is lamentable, has been for generations and it needs to be improved quickly.

On design, my time on the Health and Social Services Committee is probably coming to an end; I have been a member of it since 1999—*[Interruption.]* You are very kind. To criticise myself, the need for flexibility was not grasped, certainly by me, early enough. We must be more flexible. That means that some facilities will close. We may need to use more private finance initiatives. We may need other approaches such as treatment centres and midwife-led maternity services, which were highly controversial at first, but are now reaping great dividends. If we are to deliver an effective health service that is comprehensive and universal, we need to use all the tricks in the book.

Eleanor Burnham: There is no doubt that this document, 'Designed for Life', contains some sound principles and high aspirations. Pie in the sky also comes to mind. As a qualified aromatherapist, I particularly

ddigwydd mor agos at gartrefi pobl ag sydd bosibl, neu yn y cartref os yn bosibl. Rhaid i ansawdd a diogelwch fod yn allweddol, sy'n golygu y bydd achosion pan fydd angen i gleifion fynd allan o'u cymdogaeth i dderbyn gofal. Rhaid inni gofio y gall fod angen cymorth ar y bobl hyn, neu ar eu teuluoedd, o ran dod o hyd i rywle i aros, cyrraedd yr ysbty, trafnidiaeth, a sut i drefnu'r pethau hyn. Dylem hefyd gofio, pan ddefnyddir canolfannau rhagoriaeth, y gallant gynorthwyo gwasanaethau yn y gymuned o hyd, er enghraifft drwy fod â chlinigau cleifion allanol yn agos at y fan lle y mae pobl yn byw. Rhaid inni ystyried y system iechyd yn ei chyfanrwydd, oherwydd, os ydym am i bobl dderbyn na ellir darparu popeth ar garreg eu drws, rhaid eu sicrhau y byddant yn derbyn y gwasanaeth pan fydd ei angen arnynt, a hynny'n ddiogel. Mae hynny'n hanfodol bwysig.

Hefyd ynghylch diogelwch, yr wyf yn argymhell bod y Gweinidog yn edrych ar sut y darperir gwasanaethau aciwt yng nghyswllt iechyd meddwl plant a'r glasoed. Mae safon y gwasanaeth ar hyn o bryd yn druenus, ac wedi bod felly ers cenedlaethau, a rhaid ei wella ar fyrder.

O ran cynllunio, mae fy nghyfnod ar y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yn dod i ben mae'n debyg; yr wyf wedi bod yn aelod ohono ers 1999—*[Torri ar draws.]* Yr ydych yn garedig iawn. A beirniadu fy hun, ni chafodd yr angen am hyblygrwydd ei ddeall, yn sicr nid gennyf i, yn ddigon buan. Rhaid inni fod yn fwy hyblyg. Mae hynny'n golygu y bydd rhai cyfleusterau'n cau. Efallai y bydd angen inni ddefnyddio mwy o fentrau cyllid preifat. Efallai y bydd angen ystyried pethau eraill fel canolfannau triniaeth a gwasanaethau mamolaeth dan ofal bydwagedd, a oedd ar y dechrau yn ddadleuol iawn, ond sydd bellach wedi hen ennill eu plwyf. Os ydym am ddarparu gwasanaeth iechyd effeithiol sy'n gynhwysfawr ac i bawb, rhaid inni ddefnyddio pob arf sydd ar gael inni.

Eleanor Burham: Nid oes dim amheuaeth nad yw'r ddogfen hon, 'Cynllun Oes', yn cynnwys rhai egwyddorion cadarn a dyheadau clodwiw. Mae rhywun yn meddwl hefyd am freuddwyd gwrrach. Fel

commend the emphasis on prevention and wellbeing and on reducing health inequalities to try to create a health, as opposed to an ill health, service. I am also pleased to see recognition of the important role of the pharmacist, whose advice is vital to many patients and communities.

'Designed for Life' is also extremely important because, in it, for the first time, the Labour Assembly Government is facing up to, and beginning to address, the thorny issue of reconfiguration. We all know about Wanless—I will not go on about that, because we do not have time—and we have a mountain to climb. The Labour Assembly Government has a long record of making impressive-sounding announcements that do not always deliver, particularly because of inadequate funding, and, let us face it, deficits have already been illustrated. Ysbyty Glan Clwyd, for instance, has a huge asbestos clearance problem, let alone anything else and, as a result, is having to close wards. It has also had to start charging patients, and the friends and relatives who come to visit them, to park. People in north Wales are tired of waiting on long waiting lists and are tired of waiting for improved local facilities, such as those that I saw last week in the Holywell Community Hospital. As Kirsty has mentioned, community hospitals are of great use and we should make better use of them. The hospital is working effectively, but has been waiting 20 years to be improved. I believe that its bid is now being processed.

5.40 p.m.

In reconfiguration, we must not lose sight of ensuring locally accessible quality healthcare for my constituents across north Wales, as well as others. Local communities need to be at the forefront of healthcare provision, particularly as we have an ageing population. Local community hospitals should be at the core of communities, because inadequate transport will be a continuing hindrance to many constituents if healthcare services continue to be moved further afield. Conwy LHB, for example, has been

aromatherapydd cymwysedig, yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'n arbennig y pwyslais ar atal a lles ac ar leihau anghydraddoldebau iechyd er mwyn ceisio creu gwasanaeth iechyd, yn hytrach na gwasanaeth afiechyd. Yr wyf hefyd yn falch o weld rôl bwysig y fferyllydd yn cael ei chydabod, gan fod cyngor y fferyllydd yn hollbwysig i nifer o gleifion a chymunedau.

Mae'r 'Cynllun Oes' hefyd yn eithriadol bwysig oherwydd bod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, am y tro cyntaf, yn wynebu cwestiwn anodd ad-drefnu ac yn dechrau rhoi sylw iddo, ynddo. Yr ydym i gyd yn gwybod am Wanless—ni fanylaf ar hynny, oherwydd y mae amser yn brin—ac mae gennym dasg enfawr. Mae gan Lywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad hanes hir o wneud cyhoeddiadau sy'n swnio'n wych nad ydynt bob amser yn dwyn ffrwyth, yn enwedig oherwydd cyllid annigonol, a'r gwir yw ein bod eisoes wedi clywed am ddiffygion penodol. Mae gan Ysbyty Glan Clwyd, er enghraifft, broblem anferth o ran clirio asbestos, heb sôn am ddim byd arall, ac, o ganlyniad, mae'n gorfod cau wardiau. Mae hefyd wedi gorfod dechrau codi tâl ar gleifion, ac ar y ffrindiau a'r perthnasau sy'n dod i'w gweld, am barcio. Mae pobl yn y gogledd wedi hen flino aros ar restrau aros hir ac wedi blino aros am gyfleusterau lleol gwell, fel y rhai a welais yr wythnos diwethaf yn Ysbyty Cymuned Treffynnon. Fel y soniodd Kirsty, mae ysbytai cymuned yn fendith fawr a dylem wneud gwell defnydd ohonynt. Mae'r ysbyty yn gweithio'n effeithiol, ond mae wedi gorfod aros am 20 mlynedd i gael gwelliannau. Credaf fod ei gais yn cael ei brosesu erbyn hyn.

Wrth ad-drefnu, ni ddylem golli golwg ar sicrhau gofal iechyd lleol o ansawdd da i'm hetholwyr ar draws y gogledd, yn ogystal ag i eraill. Rhaid i gymunedau lleol gael lle blaenllaw wrth ddarparu gofal iechyd, yn enwedig gan fod ein poblogaeth yn heneiddio. Dylai ysbytai cymuned fod wrth graidd cymunedau, oherwydd bydd trafndiaeth annigonol yn rhwystr parhaus i nifer o etholwyr os bydd gwasanaethau gofal iechyd yn cael eu symud ymhellach i ffrwrdd o hyd. Er enghraifft, mae Bwrdd Iechyd Lleol

undemocratically and inappropriately trying to remove the main surgery in Cerrigydrudion and make it a satellite to Corwen. I think that it has now seen the light, because 75 per cent of people in Cerrigydrudion want the surgery to remain there.

As a former home-care manager, I am greatly heartened by Labour's assertion that more services will be provided at home in the local community or in supported housing. However, these are merely warm words when nothing appears to happen and no improvements are made. I ask you to face the facts and review the Barnett formula to secure far more funding, and to consult appropriately and widely with the public so as to support sustainable and quality health services, which my constituents in north Wales rightly deserve.

The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons): I wish to deal with the amendments, and I will try to deal with some of the points that were made. In terms of the question about what type of activities go on in the NHS that would typify the Wanless agenda in the future, let us take examples such as the GP special interest clinic in Barry Hospital, physiotherapy-led orthopaedic services in Ysbyty Gwynedd and Newport Hospital, telemedicine-led and multi-disciplinary-led services in Bronglais District General Hospital, minor accidents units using multi-disciplinary teams and telemedicine in north-west Wales, dermatology clinics in north Wales, the LHB single referral pilot schemes in Rhondda Cynon Taf and the Vale of Glamorgan, ambulance services, thrombolysis services and access and referral schemes, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease reablement in RCT, nurse triage in virtually every accident and emergency service in Wales, which has led to the improvement of 92 per cent of patients being seen within target times, smart-house technology in Tredegar and Anglesey, and pharmacy-led consultation in Neath Port Talbot. Those are only some of the services that Rhodri Glyn, and possibly Jonathan Morgan, if they got out a bit more often, would see taking place right across Wales.

Conwy, yn annemocrataidd ac yn amhriodol, wedi bod yn ceisio diddymu'r brif feddygfa yng Ngherrigydrudion a'i gwneud yn is-feddygfa i'r un yng Nghorwen. Yr wyf yn deall ei fod bellach wedi ailfeddwl, gan fod 75 y cant o bobl Cerrigydrudion am i'r feddygfa aros yno.

Fel cyn reolwr gofal cartref, yr oedd yn galonidid mawr imi glywed Llafur yn dweud y bydd rhagor o wasanaethau'n cael eu darparu mewn cartrefi yn y gymuned leol neu mewn tai â chymorth. Er hynny, geiriau rhy barod yw'r rhain pan fo'n ymddangos nad oes dim yn digwydd ac nad oes dim gwelliannau'n cael eu gwneud. Gofynnaf ichi wynebu'r ffeithiau ac adolygu fformiwla Barnett i sicrhau llawer mwy o gyllid, ac ymgynghori'n briodol ac yn eang â'r cyhoedd er mwyn cynnal gwasanaethau iechyd cynaliadwy ac o safon, ac mae fy etholwyr yn y gogledd yn haeddu hynny.

Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons): Yr wyf yn dymuno delio â'r gwelliannau, a cheisaf ateb rhai o'r pwyntiau a wnaed. O ran y cwestiwn ynghylch pa fath o bethau sy'n digwydd yn y GIG a fyddai'n nodweddiadol o agenda Wanless yn y dyfodol, gadewch inni gymryd enghreifftiau fel y clinig meddygon teulu diddordeb arbennig yn Ysbyty'r Barri, y gwasanaethau orthopedig sy'n rhoi pwyslais ar ffisiotherapi yn Ysbyty Gwynedd ac Ysbyty Casnewydd, y gwasanaethau a sy'n rhoi pwyslais ar dimau aml-ddisgyblaeth a thelefeddygaeth yn Ysbyty Cyffredinol Bronglais, yr unedau mân ddamweiniau sy'n defnyddio timau aml-ddisgyblaeth a thelefeddygaeth yn y gogledd-orllewin, y clinigau dermatoleg yn y gogledd, y cynlluniau peilot un atgyfeiriad gan fyrddau iechyd lleol yn Rhondda Cynon Taf a Bro Morgannwg, gwasanaethau ambiwlans, gwasanaethau thrombolysis a'r cynlluniau mynediad a atgyfeirio, y trefniadau ailalluogi yng nghyswllt clefyd ysgyfeintiol cronig rhwystredig yn Rhondda Cynon Taf, brysbennu nyrsio ym mhob gwasanaeth damweiniau ac achosion brys bron yng Nghymru, sydd wedi arwain at weld 92 y cant o gleifion o fewn yr amseroedd targed, y tŷ technoleg yn Nhredeg ar Ynys Môn, a'r ymgynghori â fferyllwyr yng Nghastell-nedd Port Talbot. Dim ond rhai o'r

gwasanaethau y byddai Rhodri Glyn, ac efallai Jonathan Morgan, pe baent yn mynd allan ychydig yn amlach, yn eu gweld ledled Cymru yw'r rhain.

Jonathan Morgan: Will you give way?

Jonathan Morgan: A wnewch ildio?

Brian Gibbons: No, I do not have time.

Brian Gibbons: Na wnaaf, nid oes gennyf amser.

On amendments 4 and 5, it is true that all new initiatives need to be resourced, and, in part, this will be from new money. However, the virtual doubling of NHS money and the prospect of an 8 per cent to 9 per cent increase in next year's budget means that there is no doubt about the Assembly Government's commitment to extra funding for the NHS. Extra money will also be released by the redesign of services. Therefore, delivering new services is about extra money, but it is also about increased efficiencies.

O ran gwelliannau 4 a 5, mae'n wir bod yn rhaid ariannu pob menter newydd, ac, yn rhannol, bydd hwn yn arian newydd. Er hynny, mae bron â dyblu'r arian i'r GIG a'r disgwyl y bydd cynnydd o rhwng 8 a 9 y cant yng nghyllideb y flwyddyn nesaf yn golygu nad oes dim amheuaeth ynghylch ymrwymiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi cyllid ychwanegol i'r GIG. Bydd arian ychwanegol hefyd yn cael ei ryddhau drwy ailgynllunio gwasanaethau. Felly, mae darparu gwasanaethau newydd yn golygu arian ychwanegol, ond hefyd yn golygu gwasanaethau mwy effeithlon.

It is difficult to make sense of amendment 5, which seems to call for a freeze in debt repayments, even when there are agreed and sustainable financial plans in place. We all know about the confusion regarding Plaid Cymru's health policy, but I think that this particular amendment brings that to a new level.

Mae'n anodd gwneud synnwy'r o welliant 5, sydd i bob golwg yn galw am rewi ad-dalu dyledion, hyd yn oed lle y bo cynlluniau ariannol cynaliadwy y cytunwyd arnynt. Gwyddom i gyd am y dryswch ynghylch polisi iechyd Plaid Cymru, ond credaf fod y gwelliant arbennig hwn yn dyrchafu hynny i lefel uwch fyth.

The Welsh Assembly Government is committed to addressing historical underfunding in absolute and relative terms. The inverse care law still exists, as Huw Lewis said, but that is not a reason or an excuse for providing extra resources where financial underperformance exists. The reality is that much of the debt in the national health service in Wales is in relatively well-resourced areas where people have better than average health. In those cases, the organisations need to get their financial houses in order. This is what the Wanless report is all about. Throwing money at it will not solve the problem. It is service redesign that will do that, and the days of rewarding failure and underachievement with more resources are over.

Mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi ymrwymo i fynd i'r afael â'r diffyg cyllid hanesyddol yn yr ystyr absoliwt a chymharol. Mae'r ddeddf gofal gwrthgyfartal yn dal i fodoli, fel y dywedodd Huw Lewis, ond nid yw hynny nac yn rheswm nac yn esgus dros ddarparu rhagor o adnoddau lle y mae tanberfformiad ariannol yn bodoli. Y realiti yw bod llawer o'r dyledion yn y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru mewn ardaloedd cymharol ffyniannus lle y mae gan bobl iechyd gwell na'r cyfartaledd. Yn yr achosion hyn, rhaid i'r sefydliadau roi trefn ar eu pethau yn ariannol. Dyna holl bwynt adroddiad Wanless. Ni fydd taflu arian at y broblem yn ei datrys. Ailgynllunio gwasanaethau fydd yn gwneud hynny, ac mae'r cyfnod o wobrwyo methiant a thangyflawni gyda mwy o adnoddau wedi dod i ben.

One of the purposes of capital charges is to introduce financial discipline into our capital programme. That discipline is needed to give us value for money. I recognise that there are cases where capital charges can be a real barrier to service development, and we must consider these on a case-by-case basis.

If people want to use private medical care, as one of the amendments suggests, they are free to do so. However, by delivering our waiting times target by 2009, underpinned by the externally validated and inspected healthcare standards, hopefully, no-one will need to use private medical care because of the length of time that they have to wait or because of concerns about service quality.

In conclusion, 'Designed for Life' offers a real and radical way forward. It addresses the agenda laid out by Derek Wanless, and it is only by actively engaging with, and listening to, the community and professional people who are involved in service delivery, and by drawing on the practical experience that has been gained through the development of the Wanless agendas at a local level, that we will achieve a 10-year strategy that will deliver world-class health services here in Wales.

Un o ddibenion y taliadau cyfalaf yw rhoi disgyblaeth ariannol i'n rhaglen gyfalaf. Mae angen y ddisgyblaeth honno i roi gwerth am arian inni. Yr wyf yn cydnabod bod rhai achosion lle y gallai taliadau cyfalaf fod yn rhwystr gwirioneddol i ddatblygu gwasanaethau, a rhaid inni ystyried y rhain ar sail pob achos yn unigol.

Os yw pobl am ddefnyddio gofal meddygol preifat, fel yr awgryma un o'r gwelliannau, mae ganddynt hawl i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, drwy gyrraedd ein targed ar gyfer amseroedd aros erbyn 2009, ynghyd â'r safonau gofal iechyd a ddilysir ac a arolygir yn allanol yn sail i hynny, gobeithir na fydd angen i neb ddefnyddio gofal meddygol preifat oherwydd bod rhaid iddynt ddisgwyl yn hir neu oherwydd eu bod yn pryderu am ansawdd y gwasanaeth.

I gloi, mae 'Cynllun Oes' yn cynnig ffordd real a radical inni fwrw ymlaen. Mae'n rhoi sylw i'r agenda a ddisgrifiwyd gan Derek Wanless, a dim ond drwy fynd ati i ymgysylltu â'r gymuned ac â phobl broffesiynol sy'n darparu'r gwasanaeth a gwrando arnynt a thrwy elwa o'r profiad ymarferol a gafwyd wrth ddatblygu agendâu Wanless ar lefel leol y gallwn wireddu strategaeth 10-mllynedd a fydd yn darparu gwasanaethau iechyd sydd gyda'r gorau yn y byd yma yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 1: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw

Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 21, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 2: For 21, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 6.
Amendment 3: For 45, Abstain 0, Against 6.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bourne, Nick
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
German, Michael
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Kirsty

Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 4: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Morgan, Jonathan

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn

Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 17, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 32.
Amendment 5: For 17, Abstain 1, Against 32.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:
The following Member abstained:

Morgan, Jonathan

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 6: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 42, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 9.
Amendment 7: For 42, Abstain 0, Against 9.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 14, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 37.
 Amendment 8: For 14, Abstain 0, Against 37.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 German, Michael
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bourne, Nick
 Butler, Rosemary
 Cairns, Alun
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.

Amendment defeated.

*Gwelliant 9: O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 9: For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 10: O blaid 51, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 10: For 51, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Cairns, Alun
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 11: O blaid 22, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
Amendment 11: For 22, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine

Burnham, Eleanor
 Cairns, Alun
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Janet
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Kirsty

Butler, Rosemary
 Chapman, Christine
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

Motion NDM2687 as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales:

1. recognises the need for long-term and substantive changes in health and social care services in response to the Wanless report;

2. welcomes 'Designed for Life' as the framework to deliver radical improvement in health services in Wales;

3. instructs the Assembly Government to review the effectiveness of existing NHS structures and targets in light of 'Designed for Life';

4. calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to stop the public subsidy of any private practice undertaken on NHS premises;

5. believes that in order to achieve the ambitious vision contained in 'Designed for Life' the Assembly Government needs to take immediate and radical steps to improve the current state of the health service in Wales; and

Cynnig NDM2687 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. yn cydnabod bod angen newidiadau hirdymor a sylweddol yn y gwasanaethau iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol mewn ymateb i adroddiad Wanless;

2. yn croesawu 'Cynllun Oes' fel fframwaith i wella'r gwasanaethau iechyd yng Nghymru mewn modd radical;

3. yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i adolygu effeithiolrwydd strwythurau a thargedau cyfredol y GIG yng ngoleuni 'Cynllun Oes';

4. yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi'r gorau i roi cymhorthdal cyhoeddus i unrhyw bractis preifat a wneir yn eiddo'r GIG;

5. yn credu er mwyn cyflawni'r weledigaeth uchelgeisiol sydd yn 'Cynllun Oes' fod angen i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad gymryd camau radical ar unwaith i wella cyflwr cyfredol y gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru; ac

6. *regrets that the parallel social care and social services framework has not been developed simultaneously.* 6. *yn gresynu na ddatblygwyd y fframwaith gwasanaethau cymdeithasol a gofal cymdeithasol paralel ochr yn ochr.*

*Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 42, Ymatal 9, Yn erbyn 0.
Amended motion: For 42, Abstain 9, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Butler, Rosemary
Chapman, Christine
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Janet
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Bourne, Nick
Cairns, Alun
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

The Deputy Presiding Officer: That brings **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â
today's proceedings to a close. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.52 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.52 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)

Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)