



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 15 Tachwedd 2005
Tuesday, 15 November 2005**

Cynnwys
Contents

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister	3
Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning	26
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement	42
Datganiad am Newidiadau Arfaethedig i Strwythur yr Heddlu yng Nghymru Statement on Proposed Changes to the Police Forces in Wales	46
Datganiad am ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, 'Bodloni'r Targedau Tirlenwi ac Ailgylchu' Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report, 'Meeting Landfill and Recycling Targets'	64
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2005	76
Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynghorau Ysgol (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the School Councils (Wales) Regulations 2005	77
Llwybrau Dysgu Learning Pathways	81
Adroddiad Blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ The Annual Report of the House Committee	114

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynnddi yn y
Siambr. Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were
spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been
included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister

Lefelau Anweithgarwch Economaidd Economic Inactivity Levels

C1 Elin Jones: Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Prif Weinidog wedi eu cynnal gyda Gweinidogion y Deyrnas Gyfunol parthed lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd? OAQ0967 (FM)

Q1 Elin Jones: What recent discussions has the First Minister had with UK Government Ministers regarding economic inactivity levels? OAQ0967 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan): Trafodais y mater hwn â John Hutton, yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol newydd dros Waith a Phensiynau, ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf.

The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan): I discussed this issue with John Hutton, the new Secretary of State for Work and Pensions, at the end of last week.

Elin Jones: Mae eich Llywodraeth yn aml yn brolio unrhyw lwyddiant yr ydych yn tybio ichi'i gael yn eich polisi economaidd, ond mae lefelau anweithgarwch economaidd ymysg dynion wedi cynyddu unwaith eto y flwyddyn hon, a gwelwyd newidiadau a cholli swyddi sylweddol yn y diwydiannau traddodiadol ym maes gweithgynhyrchu. A ydych yn credu ei bod yn bryd i chi, fel Llywodraeth, edrych yn benodol ar strategaeth weithgynhyrchu a fydd yn mynd i'r afael â'r lefelau anweithgarwch yr ydym yn eu gweld yn cynyddu ymysg dynion ac yn y sectorau traddodiadol?

Elin Jones: Your Government often boasts about any perceived successes in your economic policy, but levels of economic inactivity among men have increased once again this year, and significant changes and job losses have been experienced in the traditional manufacturing industries. Do you believe that it is now time for you, as a Government, to give specific consideration to a strategy for manufacturing that will deal with the increasing levels of inactivity that we see among men and in the traditional sectors?

Y Prif Weinidog: Y cwbl yr wyf yn gofyn amdano gan y gwrthbleidiau yw ffeithiau, ffeithiau, ffeithiau. Mae lefelau anweithgarwch wedi cwmpo yn ystod y flwyddyn ddiwethaf, o 25.4 y cant i 24.6 y cant. Credaf fod hynny'n dilyn y patrwm a welwyd dros y pum neu chwe mlynedd ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad. [*Torri ar draws.*]

The First Minister: All I ask from the opposition is facts, facts, facts. Inactivity levels have fallen over the last year, from 25.4 per cent to 24.6 per cent. I believe that that follows the pattern that we have seen over the last five or six years since the Assembly was established. [*Interruption.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Nid yw'n briodol gweiddi 'dynion', Elin. Yr wyf wedi galw'r cwestiwn atodol, a dyna hi.

The Presiding Officer: Order. It is not appropriate to shout 'men', Elin. I have called the supplementary question, and that is that.

Alun Cairns: First Minister, do you recognise that high levels of inactivity contribute enormously to our low levels of gross value added per capita? Do you not

Alun Cairns: Brif Weinidog, a ydych yn cydnabod bod lefelau uchel o anweithgarwch yn cyfrannu'n sylweddol at ein lefelau isel o werth ychwanegol crynswth y pen? Onid

recognise that the stubbornly high levels of inactivity are an indication of your failing policy, and that you cannot move GVA per capita to the levels seen in England? That is why we have the widest wealth gap since records began.

The First Minister: None of those propositions are factual—I give you the same response that I gave to Elin Jones. If you try to measure the difference that economic inactivity makes to the GVA differential, it accounts for about one third of the gap; two thirds of the gap is the higher level of earnings in the UK as a whole compared with Wales. That is a result of the well-known problem of Wales being a branch-factory economy, in that we do not have senior jobs. Therefore, two thirds of the gap is because of the quality of jobs, and one third is because of the lower activity rate. That is one of the reasons why I discussed this raft of issues with John Hutton at the end of last week, as part of his introduction to the Welsh perspective of the job. We co-operate closely with the Department for Work and Pensions on the welfare to work agenda.

ydych yn cydnabod bod y lefelau ystyfnig o uchel o anweithgarwch yn brawf o fethiant eich polisi, ac na allwch symud gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen at y lefelau a welir yn Lloegr? Dyna pam mae'r bwlch cyfoeth mwyaf a welwyd ers dechrau cadw cofnodion gennym.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes yr un o'ch gosodiadau'n ffeithiol—cewch yr un ymateb ag a roddais i Elin Jones. Os ydych yn ceisio mesur y gwahaniaeth a wna anweithgarwch economaidd i'r gwahaniaeth yn y gyfradd o ran gwerth ychwanegol crynswth y pen, mae'n cyfrif am tua thraean o'r bwlch; lefel uchaf enillion yn y DU yn ei chyfanrwydd o'i chymharu â Chymru yw dwy ran o dair o'r bwlch. Mae hyn yn ganlyniad i'r broblem hysbys mai economi ffatrioedd cangen sydd gan Gymru, hynny yw nid oes gennym uwch swyddi. Felly, y rheswm dros ddwy ran o dair o'r bwlch yw ansawdd y swyddi, a'r rheswm dros draean yw'r gyfradd gweithgarwch is. Dyna un o'r rhesymau pam y trafodais yr amrywiol faterion hyn gyda John Hutton ddiwedd yr wythnos diwethaf wrth ei gyflwyno i'r perspectif Cymreig i'w swydd. Yr ydym yn cydweithredu'n agos â'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau ar agenda budd-dâl i waith.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 2, OAQ0975 (FM), yn ôl.

The Presiding Officer: Question 2, OAQ0975 (FM), has been withdrawn.

Sefyllfa Gyllidol GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru Funding Position of the North West Wales NHS Trust

C3 Alun Ffred Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am sefyllfa gyllidol Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru? OAQ0968 (FM)

Q3 Alun Ffred Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on the funding position of North West Wales NHS Trust? OAQ0968 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru wedi hysbysu Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru y bydd yn cyrraedd cydbwysedd ariannol yn ystod y flwyddyn ariannol bresennol o fewn yr adnoddau sydd ar gael iddi.

The First Minister: The North West Wales NHS Trust has informed the Welsh Assembly Government that it will achieve financial balance during this financial year within the resources made available to it.

Alun Ffred Jones: Mae'r Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi cyfeirio at yr ymddiriedolaeth hon fel un lwyddiannus, sy'n esiampl i ymddiriedolaethau eraill. Beth yr ydych yn ei

Alun Ffred Jones: The Minister for Health and Social Services has referred to this trust as a successful trust, and as an example to others. What are you doing to ensure that good practice within this trust is repeated in

wneud i sicrhau bod yr arferion da o fewn yr ymddiriedolaeth hon yn cael eu hailadrodd mewn ymddiriedolaethau eraill? Ynteu, ai'r ateb yw rhoi rhagor o adnoddau a chyllid i ymddiriedolaethau sy'n methu â rheoli eu cyllidebau eu hunain?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am y cwestiwn, gan ei fod yn rhoi cyfle i mi ailadrodd yr hyn yr wyf wedi bod yn ei ddweud yn gyson. Mae angen i ymddiriedolaethau eraill arddangos hunanddisgyblaeth ar yr un raddfa ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gogledd Orllewin Cymru. Mae'r esiampl a osodwyd yno yn dangos bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn gallu byw o fewn ei hadnoddau. Os yw'r un ymddiriedolaeth honno yn gallu gwneud hynny, pam na all ymddiriedolaethau eraill wneud yr un peth? Yr wyf fi yn derbyn y gosodiad yn llwyr—ac yr wyf yn siŵr bod Brian Gibbons a Sue Essex yn cytuno—nad ydych yn gallu disgwyl i ymddiriedolaethau a chanddynt hunanddisgyblaeth ddigonol, fel gogledd orllewin Cymru, roi cymhorthdal i ymddiriedolaethau eraill sydd mewn mwy o ddyled. Mae'n rhaid i'r ymddiriedolaethau hynny ddysgu'r wers.

Eleanor Burnham: Yr ydym yn falch o groesawu'r ffaith bod yr ymddiriedolaeth hon yn gwneud mor dda, ond mae pryderon drwy'r ardal gyfan, a gweddill gogledd Cymru, ynglŷn â chwtogi gwasanaethau. A allwch chi gadarnhau mai arolwg wedi'i seilio ar arferion da ac nid ar gwtogi cyllid yw hwn?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae agenda Wanless yn golygu newid. Nid yw peidio newid darpariaeth gwasanaethau yn opsiwn realistig. Felly, rhaid cael opsiynau, dealltwriaeth ac arweiniad er mwyn newid, yn unol ag agenda Wanless. Nid yw hynny'n golygu cwtogi nac ychwaith yn golygu peidio gwneud newidiadau.

Brynle Williams: As you are well aware, there is a serious need to address the funding gap within NHS trusts. This has led to a ward with 28 beds being closed in Glan Clwyd hospital. What assurance can you give—

other trusts? Or is the answer to allocate more resources and funding to trusts that fail to manage their own budgets?

The First Minister: I am grateful for that question, as it gives me an opportunity to repeat what I have been saying constantly. Other trusts need to demonstrate self-control on the same scale as that seen in the North West Wales NHS Trust. The example set there demonstrates that the trust is able to survive on its resources. If that trust is able to do so, why can other trusts not do the same? I fully accept the statement—as I am sure do Brian Gibbons and Sue Essex—that you cannot expect trusts with adequate self-control, such as north west Wales, to subsidise other trusts with higher debts. Those trusts must learn that lesson.

Eleanor Burnham: We are happy to welcome how well this trust is doing, but there are concerns throughout the area, and across north Wales, about service cutbacks. Can you confirm that the review will be based on best practice and not on funding cutbacks?

The First Minister: The Wanless agenda means change. Making no changes whatsoever to the provision of services is not a realistic option. Therefore, we must have options, understanding and leadership in order to make changes, in line with the Wanless agenda. That does not mean cutbacks, and it does not mean not making changes either.

Brynle Williams: Fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, mae gwir angen rhoi sylw i'r bwlch o ran cyllid yn ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG. Mae hyn wedi arwain at gau ward gyda 28 o welyau yn ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi—

The Presiding Officer: Order. The question is about north-west Wales, not Clwyd.

Brynle Williams: I will rephrase my question, if I may. What assurance can you give, First Minister, that there will be no further cutbacks in north-west Wales?

The First Minister: Far from there being cutbacks, you will be aware that this trust is commencing work based on the £15 million investment in the north Meirionnydd/east Dwyfor community hospital, which is sometimes known as ysbyty Alltwen, and which is in the Tremadog/Porthmadog area.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Sôn am y gogledd-orllewin y mae'r cwestiwn, nid Clwyd.

Brynle Williams: Aralleiraf fy nghwestiwn, os caf. Pa sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi, Brif Weinidog, na cheir rhagor o doriadau yn y gogledd-orllewin?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid toriadau sy'n digwydd o gwbl, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod yr ymddiriedolaeth hon yn dechrau ar y gwaith sydd yn seiliedig ar y buddsoddiad gwerth £15 miliwn yn ysbyty cymuned gogledd Meirionnydd/dwyrain Dwyfor, a elwir ambell waith yn ysbyty Alltwen, ac a leolir yn ardal Tremadog/Porthmadog.

Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg The Welsh Language Board

C4 Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones): A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddyfodol Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg? OAQ0970 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn amodol ar gydymffurfio â'r cynnig a dderbyniwyd ar 11 Hydref, bydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg yn uno gyda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar 1 Ebrill 2007.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolch am ymateb mewn ffordd gadarnhaol, yn dilyn pwynt o drefn yr wythnos diwethaf ac yn sgîl y ffaith bod rhaid inni weithio yng nghyd-destun y cynnig a dderbyniwyd ym mis Hydref. Gobeithiaf y gallwn symud ymlaen o drafod a yw'r Llywodraeth yn parchu'r cynnig hwnnw, i drafod beth fydd yn digwydd yn y pen draw. Gwyddoch fod pobl yn pryderu am yr hyn a ddaw yn sgîl diddymu'r bwrdd. Mae pobl hefyd yn pryderu am rôl y dyfarnydd a beth fydd y rôl honno, oherwydd os mai dim ond dyfarnu fydd y dyfarnydd yn yr un modd ag y gwna Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ni fydd gan y dyfarnydd waith i'w wneud. A wnewch chi ystyried ehangu rôl y dyfarnydd fel ei fod ef neu hi nid yn unig yn gallu dyfarnu yn y pen draw ond yn gallu ymyrryd yn gynt yn y broses er mwyn esmwytho ffordd trafodaethau ar gynlluniau iaith a chynnig syniadau a sylwadau? Ni fyddai'r person hwn yn cael ei weld fel rhywun pleidiol wleidyddol ond fel rhywun a fyddai o gymorth i bob plaid. A ydych yn agored i'r

Q4 The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones): Will the First Minister make a statement on the future of the Welsh Language Board? OAQ0970 (FM)

The First Minister: On condition that it conforms to the motion carried on 11 October, the Welsh Language Board will merge with the Assembly Government on 1 April 2007.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Thank you for responding in a positive manner, following last week's point of order and in light of the fact that we must work within the context of the motion carried in October. I hope that we can move on from discussing whether the Government respects that motion to discussions on what the eventual position will be. You know that people are concerned about what will be put in place when the board is abolished. People are also concerned about what the role of the dyfarnydd will be, because if the dyfarnydd's sole function will be to adjudicate in the same way as the Secretary of State for Wales adjudicates, he or she will not have any work to do. Will you consider extending the role so that he or she can not only adjudicate at the end of a process, but intervene earlier on in order to facilitate discussions on language schemes, and make suggestions and comments? This person would not be seen in a party-political vein, but as someone who would be of assistance to all parties. Are you open to that

syniad hwnnw?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydym yn gwbl agored. Y pwynt yn hyn o beth yw pryd y dylid ymgynghori. Yn ôl y drefn arferol, byddem yn ymgynghori ar ôl cyhoeddi drafft o ddeddfwriaeth uno. Yn sgîl y cynnig a dderbyniwyd ar 11 Hydref, efallai fod rhaid i'r pleidiau drafod pryd y dylid dechrau'r broses ymgynghori ar swyddogaeth y dyfarnydd a materion eraill.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Edrychwn ymlaen at gyfrannu at y broses o ddod i ddealltwriaeth. Yr ydych wedi cyfeirio at y ffaith mai eich bwriad yw diddymu bwrdd yr iaith erbyn 2007, er ei bod yn bosibl na fydd y ddeddfwriaeth i sefydlu'r dyfarnydd yn ei lle erbyn hynny. Mae pryder ynghylch y bwlch a allai fodoli rhwng y ddau ddigwyddiad. Nid wyf fi, na nifer o bobl yn y maes, yn gweld pam yr ydych yn rhuthro i wneud un peth cyn bod y peth arall yn ei le. A wnewch chi ystyried sicrhau bod y ddau beth yn eistedd ochr yn ochr, fel bod pawb yn hapus gyda'r drefn newydd?

2.10 p.m.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni fyddwn yn awyddus i ohirio'r uno—sef y digwyddiad ei hun—tu hwnt i 1 Ebrill 2007 os mai'r unig reswm dros wneud hynny fyddai'r ffaith bod y dyfarnydd heb ei sefydlu ar sail statudol. Nid oes un enghraifft o alw'r swyddogaethau dyfarnu i rym yn y 13 blynedd ers pasio'r Ddeddf a oedd yn creu bwrdd yr iaith ar ei ffurf bresennol. Byddai hynny'n caniatáu i'r gynffon siglo'r ci yn ormodol. Yr ydym wedi addo, a gallaf ail-wneud hynny yn awr, y bydd swyddogaeth y dyfarnydd yn parhau yn ddi-dor, boed ar raddfa statudol neu beidio, yn ystod y flwyddyn o 1 Ebrill 2007 hyd, dyweder, 1 Ebrill 2008.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae gwahaniaeth barn rhyngom ar y mater hwnnw, Brif Weinidog, ar hyn o bryd o leiaf. Nid wyf wedi fy argyhoeddi bod angen gwneud yr un heb y llall. Ni allaf weld pam mae angen gwthio ymlaen gydag un pan fo trafodaethau yn mynd rhagddynt am natur swyddogaeth y person hwn yr ydym yn ei alw'n 'dyfarnydd'. Mae'n debyg mai mater i'w drafod

idea?

The First Minister: We are completely open. The salient point is when consultation should take place. Usual practice dictates that we would consult following publication of draft merger legislation. In light of the motion carried on 11 October, it may be that we need cross-party discussion on when the consultation process on the role of the dyfarnydd and other matters should commence.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: We look forward to participating in that process of coming to an understanding. You referred to the fact that it is your intention to abolish the language board by 2007, even though legislation to establish the dyfarnydd may not be in place by that time. There is concern regarding the possible gap between these events. Neither I nor several other people in the field can see why you would want to rush to do one thing before the other is in place. Will you consider ensuring that both aspects sit side by side, so that everyone can be content with the new system?

The First Minister: I would not be eager to defer the merger—and I refer to the event itself—beyond 1 April 2007 if the only reason for doing so were that the dyfarnydd had not been established on a statutory basis. There is not a single instance of calling in the adjudicatory functions in the 13 years since the Act that created the language board in its present form was passed. That would permit the tail to wag the dog too much. We have pledged, and I am happy to reaffirm that now, that the dyfarnydd's function will continue without interruption, whether it is on a statutory footing or not, during the year from 1 April 2007 to, say, 1 April 2008.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: There is a difference of opinion between us on this matter, First Minister, at least for the time being. I am not convinced that we need to do one without the other. I cannot see why we would need to press on with one when discussions are ongoing about the nature of the function of this person whom we call the 'dyfarnydd'. That seems to be a matter for further

ymhellach yw hynny.

Yr oeddwn am ddwyn eich sylw at un mater arall, Brif Weinidog, sef natur yr uned bolisi iaith a ddaw yn dilyn diddymu'r bwrdd, a beth yn union fydd ei rôl, swyddogaeth a'i statws. Ar bwynt o egwyddor, a ydych yn derbyn bod yn rhaid i'r uned, er mwyn iddi fod yn effeithiol, gael y capasiti i edrych yn drawsbynciol ar bob maes sy'n ymwneud â'r iaith, beth bynnag y bo'r maes pwnc?

Y Prif Weinidog: Dyna fantais fawr uno Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a'r is-adran sydd y tu mewn i'n strwythur lywodraethol. Caiff mwy o bobl a mwy o alluoedd eu huno o fewn un strwythur, a fydd felly yn gallu gwneud llawer mwy ar hyd y llinellau y bu ichi eu hamlinellu yn awr.

Jenny Randerson: First Minister, as you will be well aware, the Welsh Liberal Democrats do not share your view that bringing the Welsh Language Board in-house will do the Welsh language any good. However, looking at the board's work, it is virtually unknown for it to use its regulatory powers. It does its work entirely through persuasion, and providing advice and education to the organisations for which it has responsibility. Where will your regulator fit into this structure, and where will the advice and regulation interface take place? I am sure that you would agree that it would be extremely bad if there were a division between the advice and education role in relation to the Welsh language, and the regulatory role.

The First Minister: I do not think that you are right, but there may be a simple misunderstanding over the exact meaning of a word. It is the adjudicatory role, which comes into play when there is a dispute over the adequacy of a Welsh language scheme, that has never been used in the 13 years of the board's existence. The regulatory function has certainly been used, and we see that as essentially governmental, rather than quasi-judicial, in character. However, you are right in the big point that you are making—on which I hope that we can agree—which is

discussion.

I also wanted to draw your attention to another matter, First Minister, namely the make-up of the language policy unit that will be formed following the abolition of the board, and what exactly its role, function and status will be. On a point of principle, do you accept that, in order for it to be effective, the unit must have the capacity to look in a cross-cutting manner at all matters pertaining to the language, whatever the subject area?

The First Minister: That is the great advantage of integrating the Welsh Language Board and the division already within our governmental structure. More people and more skills will be brought together under one structure, and so the unit will be able to do far more along the lines that you have just outlined.

Jenny Randerson: Brif Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch yn iawn, nid yw Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru o'r un farn â chi y bydd dod â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad o unrhyw fudd i'r iaith Gymraeg. Fodd bynnag, wrth edrych ar waith y bwrdd, pur anaml y mae wedi defnyddio ei bwerau rheoliadol. Mae'n gweithio'n gyfan gwbl drwy ddwyn perswâd ar sefydliadau, a darparu cyngor ac addysg i'r sefydliadau y mae'n gyfrifol amdanynt. Beth fydd lle eich rheolydd yn y strwythur hwn, a ble y bydd y rhyng-gysylltiad rhwng cynghori a rheoleiddio'n digwydd? Yr wyf yn siŵr eich bod yn cytuno y byddai'n beth drwg iawn petai hollt rhwng y swyddogaeth sy'n ymwneud â chynghori ac addysgu gyda golwg ar yr iaith Gymraeg, a'r swyddogaeth reoleiddiol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn credu eich bod yn iawn, ond efallai fod camddealltwriaeth syml ynghylch union ystyr gair. Y swyddogaeth ddyfarnu a ddaw ar waith pan geir anghydfod ynghylch a yw cynllun iaith Gymraeg yn ddigonol. Ni ddefnyddiwyd y swyddogaeth honno erioed yn ystod y 13 blynedd y mae'r bwrdd wedi bod mewn bodolaeth. Mae'r swyddogaeth reoleiddiol yn sicr wedi cael ei defnyddio, a gwelwn honno fel swyddogaeth lywodraethol yn ei hanfod, yn hytrach na swyddogaeth led-farnwrol ei natur. Fodd bynnag, yr ydych yn llygad eich

that the board has been remarkably successful in using persuasion with the private sector. That is why it has been able to do what it has done with Sainsbury's, Tesco, Arriva Trains Wales, Network Rail, and so forth. It is in using its regulatory powers over public bodies as a template for what it does solely by virtue of persuasion with the private sector that the Welsh Language Board has been, to me, surprisingly successful over the past 13 years. I hope that that is what you are also saying, in which case we can agree. I am sure that other Members would also agree on that.

The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne): We should probably declare an interest. First Minister, I certainly share your view that the Welsh Language Board has been successful since its inception as a champion for the language and also in ensuring that our languages have not been divisive issues in Welsh politics. You asked earlier for reasons for deferring the decision, and is that not one? The board has been remarkably successful, and bringing it in-house runs every risk of making the language a divisive and party-political issue.

The First Minister: Not at all. It is a combination of the board's advocacy role, its policy, and its ability to use good persuasion techniques with the private sector, based on the template of what it can do with statutory backing. It is also, of course, based on 'Iaith Pawb', which is our strategy, because the Welsh Language Board cannot commit Government resources to anything. That is the big advantage of bringing the functions into Government: you can marry the resource allocation process with the regulatory functions much better.

Nick Bourne: The position is exactly the same in that regard; it does not alter. It is a question of what priority it has for political parties. The First Minister will have received a letter in September 2004 from the chair of the Welsh Language Board that expressly stated that the main advantage of keeping

lle gyda'ch prif bwynt—a hyderaf y gallwn gytuno ar hyn—sef bod y bwrdd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben wrth ddwyn perswâd yn y sector preifat. Dyna pam y mae wedi gallu gwneud yr hyn y mae wedi'i wneud gyda Sainsbury's, Tesco, Trenau Arriva Cymru, Network Rail, ac yn y blaen. Yn fy marn i mae Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi bod yn rhyfeddol o lwyddiannus dros y 13 blynedd diwethaf oherwydd iddo ddefnyddio ei bwerau rheoleiddiol dros gyrff cyhoeddus fel templed ar gyfer yr hyn a wna drwy ddwyn perswâd ar y sector preifat. Gobeithiaf mai hynny a olygwch chithau hefyd, ac os felly, yr ydym o'r un farn. Yr wyf yn ffyddiog y byddai Aelodau eraill hefyd yn cytuno ynghylch hynny.

Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne): Mae'n debyg y dylem ddatgan buddiant. Brif Weinidog, yr wyf yn sier o'r un farn â chi fod Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg wedi bod yn llwyddiannus ers ei greu fel hyrwyddwr yr iaith a hefyd drwy sicrhau nad yw ein hieithoedd wedi bod yn faterion cynhennus yng ngwleidyddiaeth Cymru. Gofynasoch yn gynharach am resymau dros ohirio'r penderfyniad, ac onid yw hynny'n un? Mae'r bwrdd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben, ac mae dod ag ef dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn golygu y gallai'r iaith ddod yn fater cynhennus ac yn fater gwleidyddol o safbwynt pleidiau.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ddim o gwbl. Cyfuniad ydyw o swyddogaeth eiriol y bwrdd, ei bolisi, a'i allu i ddefnyddio technegau perswadio da gyda'r sector preifat, ar sail y templed o'r hyn y gall ei wneud gyda chefnogaeth statudol. Mae hefyd, wrth gwrs, yn seiliedig ar 'Iaith Pawb', sef ein strategaeth ni, oherwydd ni all Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg rwympo adnoddau'r Llywodraeth i ddim byd. Dyna fantais fawr dod â'r swyddogaethau i mewn i'r Llywodraeth: gallwch gysylltu'r broses o ddyrannu adnoddau â'r swyddogaethau rheoleiddiol yn llawer gwell.

Nick Bourne: Mae'r sefyllfa yr un fath yn union yn hynny o beth; nid yw'n newid. Y cwestiwn yw pa flaenoriaeth a roddir iddi gan bleidiau gwleidyddol. Bydd y Prif Weinidog wedi derbyn llythyr ym Medi 2004 oddi wrth gadeirydd Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a ddatganodd yn benodol mai prif fantais cadw

decisions at arm's length from the Government is that it ensures that the discussions and debates are apolitical, and avoids the language becoming a political football. What does the First Minister say in response to that very valid point in the letter that he received?

The First Minister: Naturally, if we as Government propose that the work done by a quango now is done by a part of Government in the future, under our general policy to reduce the quango state, quango chairs will not be overjoyed by that. I do not accept your point about this politicising it. Ultimately, almost every decision that you make is, at one level, political, because someone has to take responsibility for allocating the resources, defending the allocation of those resources to taxpayers, and explaining why it has been done. In a way, a lot is to be said for democracy in this forum.

Nick Bourne: Obviously, Governments make spending decisions and decide on policy priorities: that much is true. However, at the moment, the Welsh Language Board is an arm's-length body. In terms of advocacy, and acting as a champion for the language, it is not within Government. That will be lost by bringing it in-house. That was the point in the letter, and it should not be dismissed along the lines of 'They would say that, would they not?'. There is a serious issue there, and you did not address it by saying that chairs were speaking from their own position, and that therefore their views could be disregarded. There is an issue there, which I hope that you will now address.

The First Minister: I did not say that their views should be disregarded, but the key decisions have to be made by the Government. Aside from the adjudicatory role of the Secretary of State, it is fair to say that, by and large, the work of the language board is governmental. By bringing that governmental role into the Government, we can have a bigger language policy unit, and marry language policy with resource allocation. Rather than the language board

penderfyniadau hyd braich oddi wrth y Llywodraeth yw bod hynny'n sicrhau y bydd y trafodaethau a'r dadleuon yn anwleidyddol, gan osgoi gwneud pêl-droed wleidyddol o'r iaith. Beth a ddywed y Prif Weinidog mewn ymateb i'r pwynt dilys iawn hwnnw yn y llythyr a dderbyniodd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yn naturiol, os cynigiwn ni fel Llywodraeth y dylai'r gwaith a wneir gan gwango ar hyn o bryd gael ei wneud gan ran o'r llywodraeth yn y dyfodol, dan ein polisi cyffredinol i leihau'r wladwriaeth gwangos, ni fydd cadeiryddion cwangos yn rhy hapus ynglŷn â hynny. Nid wyf yn derbyn eich pwynt bod hyn yn ei wneud yn fater gwleidyddol. Yn y pen draw, mae bron bob penderfyniad a wnewch, ar ryw lefel, yn wleidyddol, oherwydd y mae'n rhaid i rywun gymryd cyfrifoldeb dros ddyrannu'r adnoddau, amddiffyn dyraniad yr adnoddau hynny gerbron y trethdalwyr, ac esbonio pam y gwnaethpwyd hynny. Mewn ffordd, mae llawer i'w ddweud dros ddemocratiaeth yn y fforwm hwn.

Nick Bourne: Yn amlwg, bydd Llywodraethau'n gwneud penderfyniadau gwario ac yn penderfynu ar flaenoriaethau polisi: mae hynny'n wir. Fodd bynnag, ar y funud, corff hyd braich yw Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. O ran eiriolaeth, a gweithredu fel hyrwyddwr dros yr iaith, nid yw o fewn y Llywodraeth. Collir hynny drwy ddod ag ef dan adain y Llywodraeth. Dyna oedd y pwynt yn y llythyr, ac ni ddylid ei wftio drwy awgrymu 'Fe fyddent hwy'n dweud hynny, oni fyddent?'. Mae yno gwestiwn difrifol, ac ni wnaethoch ei ateb drwy ddweud bod cadeiryddion yn siarad o'u safbwynt eu hunain, ac felly y gellid diystyru eu sylwadau. Y mae yno gwestiwn, un y gobeithiaf y rhoddwch sylw iddo'n awr.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ni ddywedais y dylid diystyru eu sylwadau, ond rhaid i'r penderfyniadau allweddol gael eu gwneud gan y Llywodraeth. Ar wahân i swyddogaeth ddyfarnol yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, teg dweud mai gwaith llywodraethol, ar y cyfan, yw gwaith bwrdd yr iaith. Trwy ddod â'r swyddogaeth lywodraethol honno i mewn i'r Llywodraeth, gallwn gael uned polisi iaith fwy, a chysylltu polisi iaith â dyraniad adnoddau. Yn hytrach na bod gan fwrdd yr

having a language policy, and us having a language policy through 'Iaith Pawb', it is much better to have one language policy and to ensure that it is as adequately resourced as possible.

Nick Bourne: I understand that, and there can only be one language policy, but at the moment it seems to work successfully, as the First Minister himself seemed to indicate, in relation to the Welsh Language Board. Should there not be, to use his own phrase, 'clear red water' between the Welsh Language Board and the Welsh Assembly Government? That is what the issue is here, and I think that there are benefits to that for Wales, the language, and political life in Wales in general.

The First Minister: We gave that due consideration, but we still believed that, as part of a general policy of trying to transfer as much of quango Wales into governmental Wales, it was a healthy sign for democracy. It has been a sub-text of the whole devolution agenda since the devolution manifesto commitment given by Labour in 1997. I believe that that is right.

iaith bolisi iaith, a bod gennym ninnau bolisi iaith drwy 'Iaith Pawb', mae'n llawer gwell cael un polisi iaith a sicrhau bod hwnnw'n cael adnoddau mor ddigonol ag sydd yn bosibl.

Nick Bourne: Deallaf hynny, a dim ond un polisi iaith a all fodoli, ond ar hyn o bryd mae'n debyg ei fod yn gweithio'n llwyddiannus, fel yr oedd y Prif Weinidog ei hun fel pe bai'n nodi, mewn perthynas â Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg. Oni ddylai fod 'dŵr coch clir', a defnyddio'i ymadrodd ef ei hun, rhwng Bwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg a Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru? Dyna yw'r cwestiwn yma, ac yr wyf yn meddwl bod manteision yn hynny i Gymru, yr iaith, a bywyd gwleidyddol yng Nghymru'n gyffredinol.

Y Prif Weinidog: Rhoesom ystyriaeth ddyladwy i hynny, ond yr oeddem yn dal i gredu, fel rhan o bolisi cyffredinol o geisio trosglwyddo cymaint o Gymru'r cwngos i Gymru lywodraethol, ei fod yn arwydd iach i ddemocratiaeth. Mae wedi bod yn is-destun i'r holl agenda ddatganoli ers yr ymrwymiad yn y manifesto ar gyfer datganoli a roddwyd gan Lafur ym 1997. Credaf fod hynny'n iawn.

Y Dreth Gyngor Council Tax

C5 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am lefelau'r dreth gyngor? OAQ0964 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae lefel y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru, yn gyffredinol, yn awr 27 y cant yn is nag yw yn Lloegr. Er enghraifft, yng Nghaerdydd, mae'n £846 y flwyddyn, ac ym Mryste mae'n £971 y flwyddyn.

David Lloyd: Mae tlodi yn waeth yng Nghymru nag yw yn Lloegr, a chan fod y dreth gyngor wedi codi 186 y cant ers 1993, onid yw'n amser ystyried treth decach, megis treth incwm leol?

Y Prif Weinidog: Derbyniaf eich pwynt ar dlodi, ac mae henaint, wrth gwrs, yn fwy o broblem o ran adnoddau yng Nghymru nag yw yn Lloegr, ond, o gofio bod y dreth

Q5 David Lloyd: Will the First Minister make a statement on council tax levels? OAQ0964 (FM)

The First Minister: The level of council tax in Wales now is 27 per cent lower, in general, than it is in England. For example, in Cardiff it is £846 a year, and in Bristol it is £971 a year.

David Lloyd: Poverty is worse in Wales than in England, and given that council tax has risen 186 per cent since 1993, is it not time to consider a fairer tax, such as a local income tax?

The First Minister: I take your point about poverty, and old age, of course, is more of a problem in terms of resources in Wales than it is in England, but, given that council tax

gyngor 19 y cant yn is yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr ar ddechrau'r Cynulliad, ac, erbyn hyn, 27 y cant yn is yng Nghymru, yr ydym wedi gwneud llawer i sicrhau nad yw'r dreth gyngor yn taro'r bobl na allant fforddio talu'r lefelau presennol.

2.20 p.m.

The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German): For several weeks, I have been asking you and your colleagues about several issues relating to the effects of the threatened police reorganisation on Wales, including the council tax levels that will be paid in Wales, and where the funding will come from to pay for the reorganisation. Do you not agree that it is disgraceful that the Home Secretary has announced that only one outcome will fit his straitjacket for Wales, before anyone, including the National Assembly, has had time to consider the matter and fully think through all the options?

The First Minister: He has not said that it is only one option. He has ruled out one option, which has been clear from the start, namely no change. However, he is consulting with the Assembly on the range of other possibilities, including the one to which you referred at the beginning of your supplementary question about financing and precepting.

Michael German: He has said that only one option will be acceptable to him, namely a single police force for Wales. If anyone else had set up a three-month review period to examine the structure of something of this importance to the people of Wales, and then, halfway through it, had turned it upside down and said, 'I will only accept one answer', do you not believe that we would have the right to feel upset about it? Has the Home Secretary not ridden roughshod over the National Assembly?

The First Minister: No; he has consulted on everything except what you might call the no change option. Your original point on precepting, and how that intersects with council tax levels, is a huge issue, especially given the different levels of precepting

was 19 per cent lower in Wales than in England when the Assembly was established, and now is 27 per cent lower in Wales, we have done a great deal to ensure that the council tax does not hit those people who cannot afford to pay the current levels.

Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German): Ers rhai wythnosau, yr wyf wedi bod yn eich holi chi a'ch cyd-Weinidogion ynghylch sawl mater cysylltiedig â'r modd y bydd yr ad-drefnu a fygythir ar yr heddlu yn effeithio ar Gymru, gan gynnwys lefelau'r dreth gyngor a delir yng Nghymru, ac o ble y daw'r arian i dalu am yr ad-drefnu. Oni chytunwch ei bod yn warthus bod yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi cyhoeddi mai dim ond un canlyniad wnaiff ffitio ei gynllun pendant i Gymru, a hynny cyn i neb, gan gynnwys y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, gael amser i ystyried y mater a meddwl yn drwyadl ofalus am yr holl bosibiliadau?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw wedi dweud mai dim ond un dewis sydd. Mae wedi dweud ei fod yn diystyru un dewis, a hynny'n glir ers y dechrau, sef dim newid. Fodd bynnag, mae'n ymgynghori gyda'r Cynulliad ynghylch yr amrywiol bosibiliadau eraill, gan gynnwys yr un y cyfeiriasoch chi ato ar ddechrau eich cwestiwn atodol ynghylch ariannu a phraeseptu.

Michael German: Mae wedi dweud mai dim ond un dewis fydd yn dderbyniol ganddo, sef un heddlu i Gymru. Pe bai rhywun arall wedi sefydlu cyfnod adolygu tri mis i archwilio strwythur rhywbeth mor bwysig â hyn i bobl Cymru, ac wedyn, hanner ffordd drwyddo, wedi ei droi ar ei ben a dweud, 'Dim ond un ateb a dderbyniaf', onid ydych yn credu y byddai gennym yr hawl i deimlo inni gael ein tramgwyddo gan hynny? Onid yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi sathru'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol dan draed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nac ydyw; mae wedi ymgynghori ynghylch popeth ac eithrio'r hyn y gallech ei alw'n opsiwn dim newid. Mae eich pwynt gwreiddiol ar braeseptu, a'r modd y mae hynny'n croestorri â lefelau'r dreth gyngor, yn bwynt hollbwysig, yn enwedig o

between north Wales and the rest of Wales. The level of political and operational accountability below the all-Wales level is all up for grabs, as is how you cause the best possible fit at that kind of regional level with the fire and ambulance service. That goes down to the basic command unit and whether that should coincide with the 22 local authorities and, by and large, the 22 community safety partnerships, which is also all up for grabs. Therefore, the only thing that is not up for grabs is no change. It is fair to say that it is all to play for, except in ruling out no change.

Michael German: I accept that you have to put a brave face on this matter, but Charles Clarke has said that the only option that he wants is a single police force for Wales. There is a difference of view between your interpretation of his comments and my interpretation. The headline is clear—he will not see anything but a single police force for Wales. Given that we, as council tax payers and the National Assembly for Wales, pay half the costs of funding the police service in Wales do you not think that we deserve some answers on this matter? Are you prepared to invite Charles Clarke to come to the National Assembly to put his point of view to us, so that we can have a dialogue with him, since we are being run roughshod over by his statements in London?

The First Minister: There is no question of being ridden roughshod over. This is a Westminster responsibility; the Home Office is in charge of all operational policing matters—all structural and management issues. That has been clear from the beginning. It is true that, when he made his announcement about proposals to drastically shrink the number of constabularies in England and Wales, he wrote to Edwina Hart, saying that he wished to consult the National Assembly on this matter. Janice Gregory's committee has been, since then, considering all the options. It was clear from the start that a no change option of retaining the four separate constabularies in Wales, was being ruled out. All the other issues that I have mentioned—the real nitty-gritty issues—are of enormous importance. He wants to hear

ystyried y lefelau gwahanol o braeseptu rhwng y gogledd a gweddill Cymru. Mae lefel atebolrwydd gwleidyddol a gweithredol islaw lefel Cymru gyfan yn faterion i'w trafod, yn ogystal â sut y mae sicrhau bod hyn yn cyd-fynd yn y modd gorau posibl â'r gwasanaeth tân ac ambiwlans ar y math hwnnw o lefel ranbarthol. Mae hynny'n mynd hyd at yr uned reoli sylfaenol ac a ddylai honno gyd-daro â'r 22 awdurdod lleol ac, at ei gilydd, y 22 partneriaeth diogelwch cymunedol, sydd hefyd yn faterion i'w trafod i gyd. Felly, yr unig beth nad yw'n rhywbeth y gellir ei ystyried yw dim newid. Mae'n deg dweud bod popeth yn bosibl, heblaw nad ystyrir dim newid.

Michael German: Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid i chi wynebu'r mater hwn orau y gallwch, ond mae Charles Clarke wedi dweud mai'r unig ddewis y mae arno ef ei eisiau yw un heddlu i Gymru. Mae gwahaniaeth barn rhwng eich dehongliad chi o'i sylwadau a'm dehongliad i. Mae'r pennawd yn glir—nid yw am weld dim ac eithrio un heddlu i Gymru. Gan mai ni, fel talwyr y dreth gyngor a Chynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, sydd yn talu hanner costau ariannu'r gwasanaeth heddlu yng Nghymru onid ydych yn credu ein bod yn haeddu atebion ar y mater hwn? A ydych yn barod i wahodd Charles Clarke i ddod i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol i gyflwyno'i safbwynt inni, fel y gallwn gael deialog gydag ef, gan fod ei ddatganiadau yn Llundain yn ein sathru dan draed?

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid oes dim cwestiwn o sathru dan draed. Cyfrifoldeb San Steffan yw hwn; y Swyddfa Gartref sydd yn gyfrifol am bob mater yn ymwneud â phlisma gweithredol—pob mater strwythurol a rheolaethol. Mae hynny'n glir ers y dechrau. Mae'n wir, pan wnaeth ei gyhoeddiad ynghylch cynigion i gwtogi'n sylweddol nifer yr heddluoedd yng Nghymru a Lloegr, iddo ysgrifennu at Edwina Hart, gan ddweud y dymunai ymgynghori â'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ar y mater hwn. Ers hynny, mae pwyllgor Janice Gregory wedi bod yn ystyried yr holl bosibiliadau. Yr oedd yn glir o'r dechrau na ellid ystyried dewis dim newid, sef cadw'r pedwar heddlu ar wahân yng Nghymru. Mae'r holl faterion eraill a grybwyllais—y glo mân go iawn—o bwys aruthrol. Mae arno eisiau clywed ein barn ar

from us on all those issues, because he recognises that we have a financial involvement through the revenue support grant, and that we take a huge interest in the precepting issue, as it impacts so much on council tax levels. However, everything is up for grabs, other than saying that we are not having any change.

yr holl faterion hynny, oherwydd y mae'n sylweddoli ein bod yn ymwneud â hyn o safbwynt ariannol drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw, a'n bod yn ymddiddori'n fawr yn y praeseptu, gan ei fod yn effeithio cymaint ar lefelau'r dreth gyngor. Fodd bynnag, mae modd trafod popeth, ar wahân i ddweud nad ydym am gael newid o gwbl.

Datblygu Economaidd Economic Development

Q6 Nick Bourne: Will the First Minister make a statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's priorities for economic development? OAQ0977 (FM)

C6 Nick Bourne: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am flaenoriaethau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ar gyfer datblygu economaidd? OAQ0977 (FM)

The First Minister: Our original priorities were to bring unemployment down—it was 30 per cent above the UK average; it is now slightly below the UK average. Having done that, the key issue now is to concentrate on the quality of jobs, which I mentioned earlier to Alun Cairns.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ein blaenoriaethau gwreiddiol oedd dod â diweithdra i lawr—yr oedd 30 y cant yn uwch na chyfartaledd y Deyrnas Unedig; bellach mae ychydig o dan gyfartaledd y DU. Wedi gwneud hynny, y mater allweddol yn awr yw canolbwyntio ar ansawdd swyddi, rhywbeth y soniais amdano'n gynharach wrth Alun Cairns.

Nick Bourne: On the closure of the fast jet facility at St Athan, specifically, First Minister, which has been condemned by virtually everyone in Wales, as far as I am aware, and knowing that the First Minister was due to have discussions with the Secretary of State for Defence, I wonder, once again, if there is evidence of clear red water here. Can he tell us, perhaps in general, rather than specific, terms, what he said to the Secretary of State for Defence about this decision?

Nick Bourne: Ynghylch cau'r ganolfan trwsio awyrennau jet yn Sain Tathan, yn benodol, Brif Weinidog, rhywbeth a gondemniwyd gan bawb yng Nghymru fwy neu lai, hyd y gwn, ac o wybod bod y Prif Weinidog i fod i gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Amddiffyn, tybed, unwaith eto, a oes tystiolaeth o ddŵr coch clir yma? A all ddweud wrthym, a hynny efallai mewn termau cyffredinol, yn hytrach na phenodol, beth a ddywedodd wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Amddiffyn am y penderfyniad hwn?

The First Minister: We said that we disagreed with it profoundly. We believe that the Royal Air Force and the Ministry of Defence will live to regret it, because you need a concentrated deep-repair facility that will be able to do jobs at a level of complexity that RAF technicians are simply not trained to do. That is our position and we continue to hold it, but, in the end, if the MOD says, 'We do not need the Jaguar fleet anymore because of the cold war dividend and there are no Russian MiGs and Sukhois up there to shoot down and so on, so we can reduce the size of the RAF's fleet of fast jets', then that is what it says. The issue then

Y Prif Weinidog: Dywedasom ein bod yn anghytuno'n chwyrn ag ef. Credwn y bydd yn edifar gan y Llu Awyr Brenhinol a'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn iddynt ei wneud, oherwydd y mae angen canolfan atgyweirio manwl mewn un lle a fydd yn gallu gwneud tasgau ar lefel o gymhlethdod nad yw technegwyr yr RAF wedi'u hyfforddi i'w wneud. Dyna'n safbwynt ni o hyd, ond, yn y pen draw, os yw'r Weinyddiaeth Amddiffyn yn dweud, 'Nid oes arnom angen yr awyrennau Jaguar mwyach oherwydd diwedd y rhyfel oer ac am nad oes dim MiGs a Sukhois yn yr awyr inni eu saethu i lawr, ac yn y blaen, felly gallwn leihau nifer yr

is can we create alternative jobs? We have had a good start with ATC Lasham Ltd, but we must go much further, while welcoming the retention of the jobs to repair VC10 aircraft at St Athan.

awyrennau jet cyflym sydd gan y Llu Awyr', yna dyna beth y mae'n ei ddweud. Y cwestiwn wedyn yw a allwn greu swyddi eraill yn eu lle? Yr ydym wedi cael dechrau da gydag ATC Lasham Ltd, ond rhaid inni fynd yn llawer pellach, gan groesawu'r ffaith bod y swyddi trwsio awyrennau VC10 wedi'u cadw yn Sain Tathan.

Cytundeb Llwyth Gwaith Athrawon Teachers' Workload Agreement

Q7 Janet Ryder: Will the First Minister make a statement on the teachers' workload agreement? OAQ0965 (FM)

C7 Janet Ryder: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon? OAQ0965 (FM)

The First Minister: The implementation of the teachers' workload agreement has proceeded positively in Wales, supported by £70 million of Assembly Government funding. As the third phase of that agreement is now beginning, renewed attention will inevitably focus on identifying and sharing best practice, as well as remaining responsive to any new implementation issues, should any arise.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae gweithredu cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon wedi mynd rhagddo mewn modd cadarnhaol yng Nghymru, gyda chymorth £70 miliwn o arian Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Gan fod trydydd cam y cytundeb hwnnw bellach yn dechrau, yn anochel canolbwyntir sylw o'r newydd ar nodi a rhannu arferion gorau, yn ogystal â pharhau i fod yn ymatebol i unrhyw broblemau newydd gyda'r gweithredu, os cyfyd rhai.

Janet Ryder: The funding of this scheme, since its inception, has been a big bone of contention between your Government and local government, represented by the Welsh Local Government Association. Local government must make this scheme work; it is basing its cost estimates on what it takes to make this scheme work. You, presumably, base your estimates on having to make them fit into your budget. There is yet another disagreement this year, with the expenditure sub-group saying that it needs an additional £12 million to make the teachers' workload agreement work. Is it not time that, when new initiatives such as the teachers' workload agreement are introduced, we have a totally independent assessment of the costs, and that we do not see providers coming up with one cost and providers of the money coming up with a different cost?

Janet Ryder: Mae'r modd yr ariennir y cynllun hwn wedi bod yn dipyn o asgwrn cynnen ers y dechrau rhwng eich Llywodraeth chi a llywodraeth leol, a gynrychiolir gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru. Rhaid i lywodraeth leol wneud i'r cynllun hwn weithio; mae'n seilio'i hamcangyfrifon o ran y costau ar yr hyn a gymer i wneud i'r cynllun hwn weithio. Mae'n debyg eich bod chi'n seilio'ch amcangyfrifon yr angen i sicrhau eu bod yn ffitio i mewn i'ch cyllideb. Mae anghytundeb arall eto fyth eleni, wrth i'r is-grŵp gwariant ddatgan fod angen £12 miliwn ychwanegol i wneud i gytundeb llwyth gwaith yr athrawon weithio. Onid yw'n bryd, pan gyflwynir pethau newydd fel cytundeb llwyth gwaith athrawon, inni gael asesiad cwbl annibynnol o'r costau, fel na welwn ddarparwyr yn dyfynnu un gost a darparwyr yr arian yn dyfynnu cost wahanol?

The First Minister: Our cost estimates, and the assumptions that underlie them, are in the public domain for anyone who wants to scrutinise them in more detail. We do not believe that the WLGA estimates to which you referred—and with which you inevitably

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae ein hamcangyfrifon o ran y costau, a'r rhagdybiaethau sydd yn sail iddynt, ar gael i'r sawl a hoffai graffu'n fanylach arnynt. Nid ydym yn credu bod yr amcangyfrifon gan Gymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru y cyfeiriasoch atynt—

agree; it would never cross your mind to examine those estimates, would it, Janet—take into account the good practice already in place in schools in Wales, or the changing roles of support staff, namely higher-level teaching assistants already working with teachers. I suggest that you visit local schools to see how well they are getting on with the job and how delighted they are with the way in which the teachers' workload agreement is impacting on practice in our primary schools.

William Graham: Under the current proposals, teachers are allowed to spend around 10 per cent of the work day on activities other than teaching in the classroom. This can lead to a problem in terms of supervision. Are you sure that the present agreement will enable teachers to carry out adequate supervision during sport, which is such a prominent part of life in Wales?

The First Minister: I agree with your latter point that sport is terribly important, and I regret the general drift away from sport and physical education since the days when I was in school, and the problems with maintaining teenage girls' interest in sport and PE; but that is down to the changing society that we live in. I would not have thought that having a considerable workforce of qualified, higher-level teaching assistants and a static number of teachers in schools is part of that deterioration. I do not see any reason why HLTAs could not participate in sport supervision as much as in classroom supervision.

Peter Black: One of the consequences of the Assembly Government's school breakfast scheme is that it extends the length of time that children must be supervised during the working day and teachers have, obviously, been involved in that. As part of the assessment of the school breakfast scheme, have you looked at how much additional supervision teachers are having to undertake, what that costs, and whether that extra cost will be passed on to local authorities?

amcangyfrifon yr ydych chi'n anochel yn cytuno â hwy; ni fydddech byth yn meddwl am archwilio'r amcangyfrifon hynny, na fydddech, Janet—yn cymryd i ystyriaeth yr arferion da sydd eisoes yn digwydd mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru, na rolau staff cymorth—rolau sy'n newid—hynny yw cynorthwywyr addysgu lefel uwch sydd eisoes yn gweithio gydag athrawon. Awgrymaf y dylech ymweld ag ysgolion lleol i weld mor dda y maent yn ymdopi â'r gwaith ac mor falch ydynt o'r ffordd y mae cytundeb llwyth gwaith yr athrawon yn effeithio ar arferion yn ein hysgolion cynradd.

William Graham: Dan y cynigion presennol, caniateir i athrawon dreulio tua 10 y cant o'r diwrnod gwaith ar weithgareddau ar wahân i ddysgu yn yr ystafell ddosbarth. Gall hyn arwain at broblem gyda goruchwyliaeth. A ydych yn siŵr y bydd y cytundeb presennol yn galluogi athrawon i oruchwyllo'n ddigonol yn ystod chwaraeon, sydd yn rhan mor flaenllaw o fywyd yng Nghymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cytunaf â'ch pwynt diwethaf fod chwaraeon yn ofnadwy o bwysig, a gresynaf at y symudiad cyffredinol i ffwrdd oddi wrth chwaraeon ac addysg gorfforol ers y dyddiau pan oeddwn i yn yr ysgol, a'r problemau gyda chynnal diddordeb merched yn eu harddegau mewn chwaraeon ac AG; ond y newid yn y gymdeithas yr ydym yn byw ynddi sydd i gyfrif am hynny. Ni fyddwn wedi meddwl y byddai cael gweithlu sylweddol o gynorthwywyr addysgu lefel uwch a nifer sefydlog o athrawon mewn ysgolion yn rhan o'r dirywiad hwnnw. Ni welaf reswm pam na allai cynorthwywyr addysgu lefel uwch gymryd rhan mewn goruchwyllo chwaraeon gymaint ag mewn goruchwyllo dosbarthiadau.

Peter Black: Un o ganlyniadau cynllun brecwast ysgol Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yw ei fod yn ymestyn yr amser y mae'n rhaid i blant gael eu goruchwyllo yn ystod y diwrnod gwaith ac mae athrawon, wrth reswm, wedi bod yn ymwneud â hynny. Fel rhan o'r asesiad o'r cynllun brecwast ysgol, a ydych wedi edrych ar faint o oruchwyllo ychwanegol y mae athrawon yn gorfod ei wneud, beth yw cost hynny, ac a gaiff y gost ychwanegol honno ei throsglwyddo i'r

awdurdodau lleol?

2.30 p.m.

The First Minister: We anticipated that, but the amount of adverse reaction to the length of the working day in that respect has been far smaller than I would have anticipated, and I think it is because of the enthusiasm with which the early schools, at least, have signed up to and accepted the scheme. They have said, 'This is a really good scheme; we are going to go with this, because we think it is going to improve attendance and school behaviour'. If you come in half an hour early in order to supervise a school breakfast, you will get repaid 10 times over by how well the kids are concentrating between 9.00 a.m. and 12.00 p.m., and by the time that they get their lunch. That is the general experience of how well it has gone.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr oeddem wedi rhagweld hynny, ond mae maint yr ymateb negyddol i hyd y diwrnod gwaith yn hynny o beth wedi bod yn llawer llai nag y byddwn wedi'i rhagweld a chredaf fod hynny oherwydd y brwdfrydedd a ddangosodd yr ysgolion cynnar, o leiaf, wrth ymuno â'r cynllun a'i dderbyn. Dywedasant, 'Mae hwn yn gynllun da iawn; yr ydym am fwrw ymlaen â hyn oherwydd credwn ei fod am wella presenoldeb ac ymddygiad yn yr ysgol'. Os deuwch i mewn hanner awr yn gynnar er mwyn goruchwyllo brechwast ysgol, bydd yn talu ar ei ganfed ichi oherwydd bydd y plant yn canolbwyntio'n dda rhwng 9.00 a.m. a 12 p.m., ac erbyn hynny byddant yn cael eu cinio. Dyma'r profiad cyffredinol o ran pa mor dda y mae wedi gweithio.

Cynlluniau Pensiwn Hunanfuddsoddi Self-invested Pension Plans

Q8 Leanne Wood: Will the First Minister make a statement on self-invested pension plans? OAQ0966 (FM)

C8 Leanne Wood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau pensiwn hunanfuddsoddi? OAQ0966 (FM)

The First Minister: Self-invested pension plans have existed as an option for savers since 1990. New rules will come in on 1 April next year. They are a form of personal pension, the rules of which are prescribed by Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs, and, therefore, this is clearly not a devolved matter.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae cynlluniau pensiwn hunanfuddsoddi wedi bodoli fel dewis ar gyfer pobl sy'n cynilo ers 1990. Daw rheolau newydd i rym ar 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf. Maent yn fath o bensiwn personol, a'r rheolau wedi'u pennu gan Gyllid a Thollau Ei Mawrhydi, ac felly, yn amlwg, nid yw hwn yn fater a ddatganolwyd.

Leanne Wood: The week before last, the Assembly carried a motion opposing the new rules for SIPP. Plaid Cymru proposed that motion down because we are concerned that New Labour's tax breaks for the rich will have a major impact on the availability of affordable housing in Wales. When will you support our proposal to change planning law to require potential sellers of second homes to apply for a change of use for that property? Following that motion, what representations are you making to your counterparts in Westminster to try to stop this right-wing policy from being implemented in Wales?

Leanne Wood: Yr wythnos cyn yr wythnos diwethaf, pasiwyd cynnig yn y Cynulliad yn gwrthwynebu'r rheolau newydd ar gyfer SIPP. Cynigiodd Plaid Cymru y dylid gwrthod y cynnig hwnnw oherwydd ein bod yn bryderus y bydd buddion treth Llafur Newydd ar gyfer y cyfoethog yn cael effaith sylweddol ar argaeledd tai fforddiadwy yng Nghymru. Pa bryd y gwnewch gefnogi ein cynnig i newid deddfwriaeth gynllunio i'w gwneud yn ofynnol i ddarpar werthwyr ail gartrefi wneud cais i newid defnydd yr eiddo hwnnw? Yn dilyn y cynnig hwnnw, pa sylwadau yr ydych yn eu cyflwyno i'ch cymheiriaid yn San Steffan i geisio atal y polisi adain dde hwn rhag cael ei weithredu

yng Nghymru?

The First Minister: You have got this slightly wrong; I do not think that you realise that this has been available to the rich and speculative wealthy, shall we say, since 1990. What is new about this scheme is that it is extended to a far wider category of people. As of 1 April next year, many others will be looking at using this scheme. I commend to you an article on this issue by Anthony Hilton, the City editor of the *Evening Standard*, yesterday. A key phrase in the article is

‘Any fair judgment of the new Sipp regime should recognise that the current system is not perfect and this goes some way to mitigating its faults’.

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr ydych yn cyfeiliorni braidd ynglŷn â hyn; ni chredaf eich bod yn sylweddoli bod hyn wedi bod ar gael i'r cyfoethog a'r rhai a aeth yn gyfoethog drwy fentro, dyweder, ers 1990. Yr hyn sy'n newydd am y cynllun hwn yw ei fod yn cael ei ymestyn i gategori llawer ehangach o bobl. O 1 Ebrill y flwyddyn nesaf, bydd llawer o bobl eraill yn ystyried defnyddio'r cynllun hwn. Yr wyf yn eich annog i ddarllen erthygl ar y mater hwn gan Anthony Hilton, golygydd yr *Evening Standard*, ddoe. Un frawddeg allweddol yn yr erthygl yw

Wrth bwysu a mesur y drefn Sipp newydd mewn modd teg dylid cydnabod nad yw'r system bresennol yn berffaith a bod hyn yn gwneud cryn dipyn i liniaru ei beiau.

Polisi Cynllunio Planning Policy

Q9 Kirsty Williams: Will the First Minister outline how the Welsh Assembly Government's planning policy impacts on provision of services in rural communities? OAQ0954 (FM)

The First Minister: Planning policy for rural areas has not changed in many decades across all the parties. It is based on encouraging the reinforcement of the settlement pattern of our rural communities to support the provision of sustainable services.

Kirsty Williams: You may or may not be aware of the case of the Old Barn Inn in Three Cocks, which developers wished to knock down in order to build houses on the site. Powys County Council twice objected to and turned down those proposals, believing that the last pub in the village was an important rural facility. Despite that, the applicant went to appeal and the planning inspectorate found in his favour and gave him permission to knock down the pub. Luckily, the applicant has subsequently sold the pub and it will survive. However, do you not believe that a village pub is an important facility in many rural communities, and planning policy should reflect that?

C9 Kirsty Williams: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog amlinellu sut y mae polisi cynllunio Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn effeithio ar ddarparu gwasanaethau mewn cymunedau gwledig? OAQ0954 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid yw'r polisi cynllunio ar gyfer ardaloedd gwledig wedi newid ers degawdau lawer a hynny ar draws pob plaid. Mae'n seiliedig ar annog atgyfnerthu patrwm anheddiad ein cymunedau gwledig i gefnogi darparu gwasanaethau cynaliadwy.

Kirsty Williams: Ni wn a ydych yn ymwybodol ai peidio o achos yr Old Barn Inn yn Three Cocks, yr oedd datblygwyr yn dymuno'i dymchwel er mwyn adeiladu tai ar y safle. Gwrthwynebwyd a gwrthodwyd y cynigion hyn ddwywaith gan Gyngor Sir Powys, gan gredu bod y dafarn olaf yn y pentref yn adnodd pwysig yng nghefn gwlad. Er gwaethaf hynny, aeth yr ymgeisydd i apêl a phenderfynodd yr arolygiaeth gynllunio o'i blaid gan roi caniatâd iddo ddymchwel y dafarn. Yn ffodus, mae'r ymgeisydd wedi gwerthu'r dafarn ers hynny, a bydd yn goroesi. Fodd bynnag, onid ydych yn credu bod tafarn bentref yn adnodd pwysig mewn sawl cymuned wledig, ac y dylai polisi cynllunio adlewyrchu hynny?

The First Minister: I will call in there the next time I am in Three Cocks. That is the key to it. I would not put a pub above the village school or the village post office, but if there were a four-legged stool here, it would be made up of a church or chapel, a pub, a post office and a village school. Not every community will be able to sustain all four, but the more new housing that you direct into settlements, clearly, the better off you are.

Y Prif Weinidog: Galwaf yno y tro nesaf y byddaf yn Three Cocks. Dyna'r allwedd i'r mater. Ni fyddwn yn gosod tafarn goruwch ysgol y pentref neu swyddfa bost y pentref, ond pe byddai pedwar conglfaen i bentref, byddai'n cynnwys capel neu eglwys, tafarn, swyddfa bost ac ysgol bentref. Ni fydd modd i bob cymuned gynnal y pedair elfen, ond po fwyaf o dai newydd a sianelir i aneddiadau, yna, yn amlwg, mwyaf yn y byd o lewyrch a geir.

Argaeledd Deintyddion y GIG Availability of NHS Dentists

Q10 Jenny Randerson: Will the First Minister make a statement on the availability of NHS dentists? OAQ0950 (FM)

C10 Jenny Randerson: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ar argaeledd deintyddion y GIG? OAQ0950 (FM)

The First Minister: On 30 September this year—the latest date for which figures are available—there were 1,080 dentists in Wales providing at least some NHS care, compared with 1,024 a year ago, and 975 when the Assembly was established six and a half years ago.

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar 30 Medi eleni—y dyddiad diweddaraf y mae ffigurau ar gael ar ei gyfer—yr oedd 1,080 o ddeintyddion yng Nghymru yn darparu o leiaf beth gofal GIG, o'i gymharu â 1,024 flwyddyn yn ôl, a 975 pan sefydlwyd y Cynulliad chwe blynedd a hanner yn ôl.

Jenny Randerson: Those statistics are interesting because they reveal a pattern of dentists increasingly reducing their NHS commitment and increasing their private work. They are flocking away from the NHS in the face of fears about the new contract. The number of people registered with an NHS dentist has reduced by 200,000 in the last 10 years. In that time, there has been a big increase in funding for the health service, but that increase in funding has passed by dentistry. Are you prepared to commit to a review of funding for dentistry in Wales along with a new contract?

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r ystadegau hynny'n ddiddorol gan eu bod yn datgelu patrwm sy'n dangos bod deintyddion yn lleihau eu hymrwymiad i'r GIG ac yn cynyddu eu gwaith preifat. Mae llawer iawn yn cefnu ar y GIG yn wyneb pryderon am y contract newydd. Mae nifer y bobl sydd wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd y GIG wedi gostwng 200,000 yn y 10 mlynedd diwethaf. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw bu cynnydd mawr yn y cyllid ar gyfer y gwasanaeth iechyd, ond mae'r cynnydd mewn cyllid wedi anwybyddu deintyddiaeth. A ydych yn barod i ymrwymo i adolygu'r cyllid ar gyfer deintyddiaeth yng Nghymru ynghyd â chontract newydd?

The First Minister: At the latest date for which we have statistics, which is 30 September 2005, 48.5 per cent of the population of Wales were registered with a dentist for NHS care. I accept what you said about the difficult negotiations that are going on between the British Dental Association, us and our counterparts in Westminster. It is tricky. However, I would deprecate opposition politicians mindlessly supporting the dentists' case because that will only make it more difficult to try to achieve the kind of

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar y dyddiad diweddaraf y mae gennym ystadegau ar ei gyfer, sef 30 Medi 2005, yr oedd 48.5 o boblogaeth Cymru wedi cofrestru gyda deintydd i gael gofal dan y GIG. Yr wyf yn derbyn yr hyn a ddywedasoeh am y trafodaethau anodd sy'n mynd rhagddynt rhyngom ni, y Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig, a'n cymheiriaid yn San Steffan. Mae'n ddrys. Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn anghymeradwyo gwleidyddion y gwrthbleidiau sy'n cefnogi achos y deintyddion yn ddifeddwl, oherwydd ni

general agreement with the BDA that we need to get the new dental contract in place, without any scare stories.

wnaiff hynny ond ei gwneud yn anos ceisio cael y math o gytundeb cyffredinol gyda'r Gymdeithas Ddeintyddol Brydeinig y mae angen inni ei gael i sicrhau contract deintyddol newydd, heb straeon i godi ofn.

Colli Swyddi yn y Diwydiant Gweithgynhyrchu Job Losses Within the Manufacturing Industry

Q11 Jocelyn Davies: Will the First Minister make a statement on job losses within the manufacturing industry? OAQ0973 (FM)

C11 Jocelyn Davies: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch y swyddi sydd wedi eu colli yn y diwydiant gweithgynhyrchu? OAQ0973 (FM)

The First Minister: The latest figures that we have show that, at June 2005, there were 176,000 manufacturing jobs in Wales, down 1.8 per cent on the previous year. Over the six-and-a-half years of the Assembly's existence, we have seen the smallest percentage decline in manufacturing jobs of 14 per cent, compared with a figure of 21 per cent across the UK.

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae'r ffigurau diweddaraf sydd gennym yn dangos, ym mis Mehefin 2005, fod 176,000 o swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru, gostyngiad o 1.8 y cant o gymharu â'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Yn ystod chwe blynedd a hanner bodolaeth y Cynulliad, yr ydym wedi gweld y ganran leiaf o ddirywiad mewn swyddi gweithgynhyrchu o 14 y cant, o'i gymharu â ffigur o 21 y cant ledled y DU.

Jocelyn Davies: According to your employment churn figures, there has been a net loss of 6,000 jobs in the relatively well paid manufacturing industries, although the number of call-centre jobs is certainly up. Do you think that a manufacturing job for a call-centre job is a fair swap?

Jocelyn Davies: Yn ôl eich ffigurau trosiant cyflogaeth, cafwyd colled net o 6,000 o swyddi yn y diwydiannau gweithgynhyrchu sy'n talu'n gymharol dda, er bod nifer y swyddi mewn canolfannau galwadau yn sicr yn uwch. A ydych yn credu bod cyfnewid swydd ym maes gweithgynhyrchu am swydd mewn canolfan alwadau yn gyfnewid boddhaol?

The First Minister: I am not sure that anyone is making that proposition. The figures that I gave you were strictly for manufacturing in Wales and the UK. They show that there has been a far smaller decline in the number of manufacturing jobs in Wales than in the UK as a whole. You should not ignore the major successes that we have had recently either in, or near, your constituency, such as the Barlo-Quinn £170-million new radiator plant on the LG site in the western half of Newport, and the developments nearby at Sogefi and Doncasters Blaenavon.

Y Prif Weinidog: Nid wyf yn sicr a oes neb yn awgrymu hynny. Yr oedd y ffigurau a roddais i chi ar gyfer gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru a'r DU yn unig. Maent yn dangos bod dirywiad llawer llai wedi bod yn nifer y swyddi gweithgynhyrchu yng Nghymru nag yn y DU yn gyffredinol. Ni ddylech anwybyddu'r llwyddiannau mawr a gawsom yn ddiweddar un ai yn eich etholaeth neu yn agos ati, megis ffatri rheiddiaduron newydd £170 miliwn Barlo-Quinn ar safle LG yn rhan orllewinol Casnewydd a'r datblygiadau gerllaw yn Sogefi a Doncasters Blaenafon.

Gwasanaethau Iechyd Plant Children's Health Services

Q12 Mark Isherwood: Will the First Minister make a statement on children's

C12 Mark Isherwood: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau iechyd

health services in Wales? OAQ0962 (FM)

The First Minister: On 30 September, Brian Gibbons, Jane Hutt and I launched the national service framework for children, young people and maternity services, a 10-year programme to transform the quality of services for those allied groups in Wales. The national service framework sets standards and is backed by specific and measurable key actions to contribute to their delivery.

Mark Isherwood: On 12 September, while you were on Ynys Môn, you accepted a petition including over 10,000 signatures from a brilliant young campaigner, Llinos Thomas, a cancer survivor who has just started her degree at the University of Wales, Aberystwyth. The petition opposed the new Assembly building and called for the establishment of a children's hospital in north Wales. It is clearly too late for the opposition to the building, but, having accepted the petition, what action are you going to take to improve intensive care for children in north Wales, noting that the number of children's hospital beds are currently being cut at weekends?

The First Minister: I had a long discussion with Llinos in Llangefni about six months ago, and an impressive young citizen of the new Wales she is. On the points that you made about it being far too late to explore issues relating to not having a new Assembly building and about to what degree should north Wales continue to depend on Alder Hey Hospital in Liverpool as a specialist children's hospital, as it has done for the past 150 years or thereabouts, Llinos and I discussed these subjects. I explained to her that it was our policy to continue to direct the complex tertiary cases to Alder Hey, while not excluding the development of services, where appropriate, in north Wales.

plant yng Nghymru? OAQ0962 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Ar 30 Medi, bu i Brian Gibbons, Jane Hutt a minnau lansio'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol ar gyfer plant, pobl ifanc a gwasanaethau mamolaeth, rhaglen 10 mlynedd i weddnewid ansawdd y gwasanaethau ar gyfer y grwpiau cysylltiedig hynny yng Nghymru. Mae'r fframwaith gwasanaeth cenedlaethol yn gosod safonau ac fe'i cefnogir gan gamau allweddol penodol a mesuradwy i gyfrannu at eu cyflawni.

Mark Isherwood: Ar 12 Medi, tra oeddech ar Ynys Môn, derbyniaisoch ddeiseb yn cynnwys dros 10,000 o lofnodion gan ymgyrchwraig ifanc anhygoel, Llinos Thomas, un sydd wedi goroesi canser ac sydd newydd ddechrau ar ei chwrs gradd ym Mhrifysgol Cymru, Aberystwyth. Yr oedd y ddeiseb yn gwrthwynebu adeilad newydd y Cynulliad ac yn galw am sefydlu ysbyty plant yn y gogledd. Mae'n amlwg bod y gwrthwynebiad i'r adeilad yn rhy hwyr, ond, ar ôl derbyn y ddeiseb, pa gamau yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd i wella gofal dwys ar gyfer plant yn y gogledd, gan nodi bod nifer y gwelyau i blant mewn ysbytai'n cael ei gwtogi ar benwythnosau ar hyn o bryd?

Y Prif Weinidog: Cefais drafodaeth hir gyda Llinos yn Llangefni tua chwe mis yn ôl, ac mae hi'n ddinesydd trawiadol iawn o'r Gymru newydd. Ynglŷn â'r pwyntiau a wnaed gennyh ei bod yn llawer rhy hwyr i edrych ar faterion o ran peidio â chael adeilad newydd i'r Cynulliad ac ynglŷn ag i ba raddau y dylai'r gogledd barhau i ddiybennu ar Ysbyty Alder Hey yn Lerpwl fel ysbyty plant arbenigol, fel y mae wedi gwneud ers tua 150 mlynedd, trafodwyd y pynciau hyn gan Llinos a mi. Esboniais iddi mai ein polisi oedd parhau i gyfeirio'r achosion trydyddol cymhleth at Alder Hey, er nad oeddem yn cau allan y posibilrwydd o ddatblygu gwasanaethau yn y gogledd, lle y bo'n briodol.

Anghydraddoldebau Triniaeth Feddygol Inequalities of Medical Treatment

Q13 William Graham: Will the First Minister make a statement concerning the inequalities of medical treatment in Wales? OAQ0976 (FM)

C13 William Graham: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am anghydraddoldebau triniaeth feddygol yng Nghymru? OAQ0976 (FM)

The First Minister: It is one of our prime aims to improve patient access and reduce the time that patients have to wait for treatment. We are making significant progress in improving health in Wales and tackling health inequalities, increasing capacity, supporting NHS staff in the excellent work that they do, and dealing with waiting times and emergency pressures.

William Graham: I am looking, in particular, at studies that suggest that people on lower incomes are more likely to suffer a long-term illness or disability than those on higher incomes. Studies also show that people from black and other ethnic minority groups are much more likely to be compulsorily admitted to mental health units than whites. This is true inequality. Can you do something about it?

The First Minister: The inverse law of care is a famous and substantial principle that has never been disproved, as far as I am aware. It is true that people on lower incomes have more long-term disease and they also tend to ask for medical attention far later than those of a middle-class or professional background.

2.40 p.m.

Likewise, it is true that black and ethnic minorities have some specific and some more general propensities to seek treatment later or to have higher morbidity in some cases. It is part of the health inequalities project to try to compensate for those difficult long-term issues. You are certainly right about the problem with mental health in relation to black and ethnic minorities.

Jeff Cuthbert: Do you agree that the substantial investment that the Welsh Assembly Government should be making in the building of the new hospital for the mid Rhymney valley will improve massively the health and medical facilities of the people of the borough of Caerphilly?

The First Minister: Yes. There are two

Y Prif Weinidog: Un o'n prif nodau yw gwella mynediad i gleifion a lleihau'r amser y mae cleifion yn gorfod aros am driniaeth. Yr ydym yn gwneud cynnydd sylweddol yn y gwaith o wella iechyd yng Nghymru a mynd i'r afael ag anghydraddoldeb iechyd, cynyddu capasiti, cefnogi staff y GIG yn y gwaith ardderchog a wneir ganddynt, a delio ag amseroedd aros a phwysau argyfwng.

William Graham: Yr wyf yn edrych yn benodol ar astudiaethau sy'n awgrymu bod pobl ar incwm is yn fwy tebygol o ddiodeff afiechyd hirdymor neu anabled, na rhai ar incwm uwch. Mae astudiaethau hefyd yn dangos bod pobl o grwpiau du a lleiafrifoedd ethnig eraill yn llawer mwy tebygol o gael eu derbyn yn orfodol i unedau iechyd meddwl, na phobl wyn. Mae hyn yn wir anghydraddoldeb. A allwch wneud rhywbeth yn ei gylch?

Y Prif Weinidog: Mae deddf gwrthgyfartaledd gofal yn egwyddor enwog a sylweddol nas gwrthbrofwyd erioed hyd y gwn. Mae'n wir bod gan bobl ar incwm is fwy o afiechyd hirdymor ac maent hefyd yn tueddu i ofyn am sylw meddygol yn llawer hwyrach na rhai o gefndir dosbarth canol neu broffesiynol.

Yn yr un modd, mae'n wir bod gan bobl dduon ac o leiafrifoedd ethnig rai tueddiadau penodol a rhai mwy cyffredinol tuag at ofyn am driniaeth yn hwyrach neu fod â morbidrwydd uwch mewn rhai achosion. Mae'n rhan o'r prosiect anghydraddoldebau iechyd geisio gwneud iawn am y problemau anodd a hirdymor hynny. Yr ydych yn sicr yn gywir ynglŷn â'r broblem gydag iechyd meddwl yng nghyswllt pobl dduon a lleiafrifoedd ethnig.

Jeff Cuthbert: A ydych yn cytuno y bydd y buddsoddiad sylweddol y dylai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru fod yn ei wneud wrth adeiladu ysbyty newydd ar gyfer canol Cwm Rhymni yn golygu gwelliant mawr iawn o ran iechyd a chyfleusterau meddygol pobl bwrdeistref Caerffili?

Y Prif Weinidog: Ydwyf. Mae dau beth o

notable things in that regard. That is the only new, major, greenfield hospital that we are proposing in a major capital programme, but it is also one that we have to get right in making sure that it is not a behemoth full of beds and bedpans that would be suitable for the last half of the twentieth century but of no relevance to the healthcare needs of this emerging century. As I have said on many occasions, it will have far more out-patient attendances and diagnostic kit than you would have expected for a hospital of that size, and far fewer in-patient beds to go with that, because that is the emerging pattern for hospitals that all hospital designers around the world say will be needed in 2020 to 2040.

Jonathan Morgan: William Graham is right about the inequalities that exist in Wales, but there is a sharper inequality between Wales and England. Do you therefore accept the criticism of Chris Bryant—a Member of Parliament from your party—who said that clear red water for his constituents means a poorer health service delivery and, in some cases, many of the lower-paid of his constituents seeking private treatment?

The First Minister: A pamphlet is a pamphlet and nothing more, and, by its nature, a pamphlet is not based on any serious research. On the issue of the kind of health services the people of Wales get, particularly those on a low income, you will find that, in the Communities First areas or those areas that have been beneficiaries of the health inequalities fund, which certainly includes the Rhondda, you have some highly innovative primary care treatment, the like of which you will not find in comparable areas in England.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You say that it is merely a pamphlet, but Chris Bryant's accusation is that your policies are forcing people to turn to the private sector for medical and dental care. Do you accept that criticism?

The First Minister: No, not at all. As I said, a pamphlet is not based on research or figures; it is pamphleteering. I have never written one myself—I am told that they take

bwys yn y cyswllt hwn. Dyna'r unig ysbyty mawr newydd ar faes glas yr ydym yn ei gynnig mewn rhaglen gyfalaf sylweddol, ond mae hefyd yn un y mae'n rhaid i ni ei gael yn iawn, wrth sicrhau nad yw'n fehmooth yn llawn o welyau a phadelli gwelyau a fyddai'n addas ar gyfer ail hanner yr ugeinfed ganrif ond yn amherthnasol i anghenion gofal iechyd y ganrif hon. Fel yr wyf wedi dweud ar sawl achlysur, bydd ganddo lawer mwy o gleifion allanol ac offer diagnostig nag a ddisgwylid ar gyfer ysbyty o'i faint, a llawer llai o welyau ar gyfer cleifion mewnol i gyd-fynd â hynny, oherwydd mai dyna'r patrwm sy'n datblygu ar gyfer ysbytai y dywedir gan bob cynllunydd ysbyty ledled y byd y bydd ei angen rhwng 2020 a 2040.

Jonathan Morgan: Mae William Graham yn iawn ynglŷn â'r anghydraddoldebau sy'n bodoli yng Nghymru, ond ceir anghydraddoldeb mwy trawiadol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. A ydych yn derbyn beirniadaeth Chris Bryant—Aelod Seneddol o'ch plaid chi—a ddywedodd fod dŵr coch clir i'w etholwyr ef yn golygu darparu gwasanaeth iechyd o ansawdd gwaeth, ac mewn rhai achosion, fod llawer o'i etholwyr ar gyflogau is yn mynd i gael triniaeth breifat?

Y Prif Weinidog: Pamffled yw pamffled a dim byd mwy, ac oherwydd ei natur, nid yw pamffled yn seiliedig ar ymchwil ddifrifol. O ran y math o wasanaeth iechyd y mae pobl Cymru'n ei gael, yn enwedig y rhai ar incwm is, fe welwch, yn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf neu'r ardaloedd hynny sydd wedi derbyn budd o'r gronfa anghydraddoldebau iechyd, sydd yn sicr yn cynnwys y Rhondda, fod gennych rai triniaethau gofal sylfaenol arloesol iawn, o fath na ddeuwch o hyd iddynt mewn ardaloedd cymharol yn Lloegr.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedwch mai pamffled yn unig ydyw, ond cyhuddiad Chris Bryant yw bod eich polisiau yn gorfodi pobl i droi at y sector preifat am ofal meddygol a deintyddol. A ydych yn derbyn y feirniadaeth honno?

Y Prif Weinidog: Na, ddim o gwbl. Fel y dywedais, nid yw pamffled yn seiliedig ar ymchwil na ffigurau; pamffletirio ydyw. Nid wyf erioed wedi ysgrifennu un fy hun—yr

hours to write, but I have never devoted hours of my time to writing pamphlets. I would direct your attention to—
[*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I wish to hear the First Minister's reply.

The First Minister: Have a read—
[*Interruption.*] If I have a bit of quiet, I will tell you to have a read of the article in today's *Public Finance*. The article by Steve Davies of Cardiff University contains some more serious research in comparing England and Wales and the approach to public services. I commend that to you, and possibly to some MPs with twitchy hands as well. Have a read of it, because it attempts to give a balanced view, and it is the kind of research that we would all look forward to seeing more of.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 14, OAQ0959(FM), yn ôl.

wyf yn deall eu bod yn cymryd oriau i'w hysgrifennu, ond nid wyf erioed wedi rhoi oriau o'm hamser i ysgrifennu pamffledi. Byddwn yn cyfeirio eich sylw at—[*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Yr wyf yn dymuno clywed ateb y Prif Weinidog.

Y Prif Weinidog: Darllenwch—[*Torri ar draws.*] Os caf ddistawrwydd, fe ddywedaf wrthy ch am ddarllen yr erthygl yn *Public Finance* heddiw. Mae'r erthygl gan Steve Davies o Brifysgol Caerdydd yn cynnwys ymchwil fwy difrifol wrth gymharu Cymru a Lloegr a'r agwedd tuag at wasanaethau cyhoeddus. Yr wyf yn ei chymeradwyo ichi, ac efallai i rai Aelodau Seneddol â dwylo aflonydd hefyd. Darllenwch hi, gan ei bod yn ceisio rhoi barn gytbwys, a dyma'r math o ymchwil y byddem oll yn edrych ymlaen at weld mwy ohoni.

The Presiding Officer: Question 14, OAQ0959(FM), has been withdrawn.

Pwysau ar Dai Housing Pressures

Q15 Helen Mary Jones: Will the First Minister make a statement on housing pressures? OAQ0971 (FM)

The First Minister: The comprehensive paper to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee in February demonstrated the range of mechanisms and support available to local housing authorities to react to the housing pressures of most concern to them. The Minister, Edwina Hart, reminded Members of the support that is available during the debate on affordable housing only last Wednesday.

Helen Mary Jones: Do you accept that, in large parts of mid and west Wales, and especially along the coast, the second homes market contributes seriously to housing pressures? If you do accept that, and following your rather inadequate answer to Leanne Wood's question, what do you propose to do to communicate to Gordon Brown and your colleagues at Westminster—or maybe not, after that last question—the Assembly's concerns, as reflected by the

C15 Helen Mary Jones: A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am y pwysau ar dai? OAQ0971 (FM)

Y Prif Weinidog: Dangosodd y papur cynhwysfawr i'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio ym mis Chwefror yr ystod o fecanweithiau a chymorth sydd ar gael i awdurdodau tai lleol i ymateb i'r pwysau o ran tai sy'n achosi'r pryder mwyaf iddynt. Atgoffodd y Gweinidog, Edwina Hart, yr Aelodau o'r cymorth sydd ar gael yn ystod y ddadl ar dai fforddiadwy, mor ddiweddar â dydd Mercher diwethaf.

Helen Mary Jones: A ydych yn derbyn, mewn rhannau helaeth o'r canolbarth a'r gorllewin, ac yn enwedig ar hyd yr arfordir, fod y farchnad ail gartrefi'n cyfrannu'n ddifrifol tuag at y pwysau ar dai? Os ydych yn derbyn hynny, ac yn sgîl yr ateb braidd yn annigonol a roddwyd gennych i gwestiwn Leanne Wood, beth yr ydych yn bwriadu ei wneud i gyfleu i Gordon Brown a'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan—neu efallai na wnewch hynny ar ôl y cwestiwn diwethaf—

Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, about the possible impact of including second homes in pensions? What discussions do you propose to have, and will you make the outcome of those discussions public so that we can all see what you are doing to fight Wales's corner?

The First Minister: The social housing grant programme, as you know, is rising from £59 million last year to £96 million by the year after next. That is a substantial increase in the grant, and we will continue to fund the homebuy programme. It is up to every local authority in Wales to work out its housing strategy. Now, if additional problems are emerging, rather than being feared, in the areas that you described, then, obviously, those local authorities will then adjust for that in the way in which they use their share of the £96 million available in 2007-08. That is why the article from which I quoted—and I recommend that you read it, because it is very balanced—indicates that we should not go on the fears about what self-investment personal pension schemes will do. However, if some of the fears turn out to be correct, the policy will have to adjust to the impact of the new rules on SIPPS.

David Melding: Care leavers often face difficulties in maintaining tenancies, and need a lot of support to ensure that their housing remains stable. Do you agree that, in terms of supporting care leavers, it is one of the main areas that need to be examined?

The First Minister: I entirely accept that care leavers have specific housing needs, because they will frequently be grouped together in twos, threes and fours in a flat. They will not have carried that type of responsibility and they will perhaps have far fewer role models than other leavers. They usually leave 'home' three or four years earlier than the average young citizen—at age 18 rather than 21 or 22 years, so they have

bryderon y Cynulliad, fel yr adlewyrchwyd hwy gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ynglŷn ag effaith bosibl cynnwys ail gartrefi mewn pensiynau? Pa drafodaethau yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cynnal, ac a gyhoedddech ganlyniad y trafodaethau hynny fel y gallwn i gyd weld beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i ymladd dros achos Cymru?

Y Prif Weinidog: Fel y gwyddoch, mae'r rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol yn codi o £59 miliwn y llynedd i £96 miliwn erbyn y flwyddyn ar ôl y nesaf. Mae hynny'n gynydd sylweddol yn y grant, a byddwn yn parhau i ariannu'r rhaglen cymorth prynu. Mater i bob awdurdod lleol yng Nghymru yw llunio'i strategaeth dai. Yn awr, os oes problemau ychwanegol yn dod i'r amlwg, yn hytrach na bod ofn bod rhai, yn yr ardaloedd a ddisgrifwyd gennych, yna, yn amlwg, bydd yr awdurdodau lleol hynny, wedyn, yn addasu ar gyfer hynny yn y modd y maent yn defnyddio eu cyfran o'r £96 miliwn sydd ar gael yn 2007-08. Dyna paham mae'r erthygl y dyfynnais ohoni—ac yr wyf yn argymhell eich bod yn ei darllen, oherwydd ei bod yn erthygl gytbwys dros ben—yn nodi na ddylem farnu ar sail yr ofnau ynghylch yr hyn a wna cynlluniau pensiwn personol hunanfuddsoddi. Fodd bynnag, os gwelir bod rhai o'r ofnau yn gywir, bydd rhaid i'r polisi addasu ar gyfer effaith y rheolau newydd ar gynlluniau pensiwn personol hunanfuddsoddi.

David Melding: Bydd pobl sy'n gadael gofal, yn aml, yn wynebu anawsterau wrth geisio cynnal tenantiaethau, ac mae angen llawer o gymorth arnynt i sicrhau bod eu cartrefi yn aros yn ddiogel. A ydych yn cytuno bod hyn, o ran rhoi cymorth i bobl sy'n gadael gofal, yn un o'r prif feysydd y mae angen ymchwilio iddynt?

Y Prif Weinidog: Yr wyf yn derbyn yn llwyr fod gan bobl sy'n gadael gofal anghenion penodol ym maes tai, oherwydd byddant yn aml yn cael eu grwpio fesul dau, tri a phedwar mewn fflat. Ni fyddant wedi ysgwyddo cyfrifoldeb o'r fath a byddant, o bosibl, â llawer llai o fodelau rôl na rhai eraill sy'n gadael. Byddant, fel arfer, yn gadael 'cartref' dair neu bedair blynedd yn gynt na'r dinesydd ifanc cyffredin—yn 18 oed yn

additional problems. Therefore, I agree that they need the support that you are calling for.

hytrach nag yn 21 neu'n 22 oed, felly bydd ganddynt broblemau ychwanegol. Felly, cytunaf fod arnynt angen y cymorth yr ydych yn galw amdano.

Y Llywydd: Mae pob cwestiwn wedi'i ateb, Brif Weinidog, felly symudwn at yr eitem nesaf.

The Presiding Officer: Every question has been answered, First Minister, so we will move to the next item.

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes Questions to the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning

Ymddygiad mewn Ysgolion Behaviour in Schools

Q1 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the measures that she has taken to improve behaviour in schools? OAQ0544(ELL)

C1 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y camau a gymerwyd ganddi i wella ymddygiad mewn ysgolion? OAQ0544(ELL)

Q12 William Graham: Will the Minister make a statement on improving classroom discipline? OAQ0490(ELL)

C12 William Graham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wella disgyblaeth yn y dosbarth? OAQ0490(ELL)

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): It is important for schools to have an orderly environment in which pupils can focus on learning. All maintained schools must have a clear behaviour policy setting. Advice for schools on improving behaviour is set out in the inclusion and pupil support consultation. We will also look at the recommendations from the report, 'Learning Behaviour', which was published alongside the English White Paper.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Mae'n bwysig bod gan ysgolion amgylchedd trefnus y gall disgyblion ganolbwyntio ar ddysgu ynddo. Rhaid i bob ysgol a gynhelir fod â pholisi clir ar ymddygiad. Mae cyngor i ysgolion ynghylch gwella ymddygiad i'w weld yn yr ymgynghoriad ar gynnwys a chefnogi disgyblion. Edrychwn hefyd ar yr argymhellion yn yr adroddiad, 'Learning Behaviour', a gyhoeddwyd ochr yn ochr â'r Papur Gwyn i Loegr.

Laura Anne Jones: You are on record as saying that bad pupil behaviour and discipline are not a problem in Wales. However, every day, teachers are verbally or physically abused, pupils are bullied and there is destruction across classrooms in Wales. The measures that you have stated are not strong enough. What are you doing to protect teachers, pupils and education in Wales? It is a huge problem—I know it, and unions, parents, teachers and pupils across Wales know it. Why do you not know it?

Laura Anne Jones: Mae wedi ei gofnodi eich bod wedi dweud nad yw ymddygiad a disgyblaeth wael ymysg disgyblion yn broblem yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, bob dydd, caiff athrawon eu cam-drin yn eiriol neu'n gorfforol, caiff disgyblion eu bwlio a gwelir distryw mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth ledled Cymru. Nid yw'r mesurau a nodwyd gennych yn ddigon cryf. Beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i amddiffyn athrawon, disgyblion ac addysg yng Nghymru? Mae'n broblem enfawr—yr wyf fi'n gwybod hyn, ac mae undebau, rhieni, athrawon a disgyblion ledled Cymru yn gwybod hyn. Pam nad ydych chi'n gwybod hyn?

Jane Davidson: It is because I work on the basis of evidence, Laura. From looking at the work of schools in Wales, and in my regular discussions with the unions, I know that there are issues around pupil behaviour, which is why we issued a consultation on inclusion and pupil support at the beginning of May this year. I recommend that you read that document. The final guidance document will be produced in spring 2006. I have already indicated that I am happy to look at the 'Learning Behaviour' report, which I also recommend that you read, and which was published alongside the White Paper in England. We will look at the issues to be incorporated into legislation through the new Education Bill. I have already indicated both in committee and publicly that we will look with interest at legislative proposals in this context.

William Graham: In my respectful submission for evidence, would you consider this? In 2003-04, 16,950 pupils were suspended from Welsh schools, which equates to 87 pupils a day, yet you say that discipline is not a problem in schools. Surely it is your attitude that has contributed to the disasters that we have heard about in recent attacks in schools.

Jane Davidson: I do not say that discipline is not a problem in schools. I have engaged with the unions over a number of years, looking at ways to enhance our guidance in terms of support for teachers. The practitioners' group, which wrote the 'Learning Behaviour' report, has asked for further power to clarify the arrangement in one legal requirement, in terms of teachers' powers. So, it is an issue that we have already indicated that we are happy to look at.

2.50 p.m.

However, I would point out that, when the chief inspector came to committee, for example, she did not say that issues around discipline were a major problem in Welsh schools, which is why I say that we have to look at evidence. Schools already have a substantial number of powers to ensure that,

Jane Davidson: Y rheswm dros hyn yw fy mod yn gweithio ar sail tystiolaeth, Laura. O edrych ar waith ysgolion yng Nghymru, ac yn fy nhrafodaethau rheolaidd â'r undebau, gwn fod materion yn codi ynghylch ymddygiad disgyblion a dyna paham y cyflwynwyd ymgynghoriad ar gynnwys a chefnogi plant ddechrau mis Mai eleni. Yr wyf yn argymhell eich bod yn darllen y ddogfen honno. Cyhoeddir y ddogfen gyfarwyddyd derfynol yn y gwanwyn yn 2006. Yr wyf eisoes wedi nodi fy mod yn fodlon edrych ar yr adroddiad 'Learning Behaviour', yr wyf hefyd yn argymhell eich bod yn ei ddarllen, ac a gyhoeddwyd ochr yn ochr â'r Papur Gwyn yn Lloegr. Edrychwn ar y materion sydd i'w hymgorffori'n rhan o ddeddfwriaeth drwy gyfrwng y Mesur Addysg newydd. Yr wyf eisoes wedi dweud yn y pwyllgor ac yn gyhoeddus y byddwn yn edrych gyda diddordeb ar gynigion deddfwriaethol yn y cyd-destun hwn.

William Graham: Wrth i mi gyflwyno'n barchus y dystiolaeth ganlynol, a fydddech yn ystyried hyn? Yn 2003-04, gwaharddwyd 16,950 o ddisgyblion dros dro o ysgolion Cymru, sy'n cyfateb i 87 disgybl y dydd, ac eto yr ydych yn dweud nad yw disgyblaeth yn broblem mewn ysgolion. Eich agwedd chi, siawns, sydd wedi cyfrannu at y trychinebau yr ydym wedi clywed amdanynt mewn ymosodiadau diweddar mewn ysgolion.

Jane Davidson: Nid wyf yn honni nad yw disgyblaeth yn broblem mewn ysgolion. Yr wyf wedi gweithio'n agos â'r undebau ers sawl blwyddyn, gan edrych ar ffyrdd o wella ein canllawiau o ran rhoi cymorth i athrawon. Mae'r grŵp ymarferwyr, a ysgrifennodd yr adroddiad 'Learning Behaviour', wedi gofyn am bwerau pellach i egluro'r trefniant mewn un gofyniad cyfreithiol, o ran pwerau athrawon. Felly, mae'n fater yr ydym eisoes wedi dweud ein bod yn fodlon edrych arno.

Fodd bynnag, byddwn yn tynnu eich sylw at y ffaith, pan ddaeth y prif arolygydd i gyfarfod y pwyllgor, er enghraifft, na ddywedodd fod materion yn gysylltiedig â disgyblaeth yn broblem fawr yn ysgolion Cymru, a dyna paham yr wyf yn dweud bod rhaid inni edrych ar y dystiolaeth. Mae gan

if a child is affecting other children's learning, he or she can be removed as appropriate from the classroom, and that is reflected in the figures that you have just announced.

Leighton Andrews: I was discussing this issue with secondary headteachers in my local school on Friday. I think that they would agree that the Welsh Assembly Government guidance is pretty clear on teachers' powers but, in some areas, such as the question of the presumption of guilt if a teacher intervenes, they think that perhaps—and this may be a matter, as you have said, to look at it in the context of possible forthcoming legislation—there may need to be greater clarity in future.

Jane Davidson: There are some key issues around the anonymity of professionals who are accused, who work with children. We have been looking closely at that issue with our colleagues in Westminster.

Peter Black: The evidence shows that a significant proportion of pupils excluded from school has special educational needs. What guidance are you considering to try to address that issue?

Jane Davidson: The report, 'Learning Behaviour', devotes one of its chapters to issues around special educational needs and also looks at ways in which Government in England, in the sense that this was a report to Government in England, can better exchange good practice, which is a key agenda for us here. The obligation is to ensure that, if a child is excluded from his or her school setting, the child then receives subsequent education. The Assembly Government has been strong on that. This report recommends that this should be put in place more quickly and I will want to look at that to see whether we can make that effective here.

Nick Bourne: The serious issue of bullying has again presented itself in Wales, with the 15-year-old Danielle Price ending up in

ysgolion eisoes nifer o bwerau sylweddol er mwyn sicrhau, os bydd plentyn yn effeithio ar addysg plentyn arall, y gellir ei dynnu neu ei thynnu, fel sy'n briodol, o'r ystafell ddosbarth, ac adlewyrchir hynny yn y ffigurau yr ydych newydd eu cyhoeddi.

Leighton Andrews: Yr oeddwn yn trafod y mater hwn gyda phenaethiaid ysgolion uwchradd yn fy ysgol leol ddydd Gwener. Yr wyf yn credu y byddent yn cytuno bod canllawiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn eithaf clir ynghylch pwerau athrawon ond, mewn rhai meysydd, megis rhagdybiaeth o euogrwydd os bydd athro neu athrawes yn ymyrryd, maent yn credu y dylid, o bosibl—a gall hwn, fel y dywedasoch, fod yn fater i'w drafod yng nghyd-destun deddfwriaeth bosibl yn y dyfodol—sicrhau mwy o eglurder yn y dyfodol.

Jane Davidson: Cyfyd rhywfaint o faterion allweddol ynghylch sicrhau bod gweithwyr proffesiynol a gyhuddir ac sy'n gweithio gyda phlant, yn aros yn ddiennw. Yr ydym wedi bod yn edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y mater hwnnw gyda'n cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan.

Peter Black: Yn ôl y dystiolaeth, mae gan gyfran sylweddol o'r disgyblion a waherddir o'r ysgol anghenion addysgol arbennig. Pa ganllawiau yr ydych yn ystyried eu rhoi er mwyn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwnnw?

Jane Davidson: Yn yr adroddiad, 'Learning Behaviour', neilltuir un o'r penodau i faterion sy'n ymwneud ag anghenion addysgol arbennig ac mae hefyd yn edrych ar ffyrdd y bydd y Llywodraeth yn Lloegr, o gofio mai adroddiad i Lywodraeth Lloegr ydoedd, yn gallu cyfnewid arferion da yn well, sy'n agenda bwysig i ni yma. Mae'n ddyletswydd sicrhau, os caiff plentyn ei wahardd o'i ysgol, y bydd y plentyn wedyn yn derbyn addysg wedi hynny. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn gadarn ar y pwynt hwnnw. Yn yr adroddiad hwn, argymhellir y dylid rhoi hyn ar waith yn gyflymach a byddaf am edrych ar hynny er mwyn gweld a allwn wneud hyn yn effeithiol yma.

Nick Bourne: Mae mater difrifol bwlio wedi codi i'r wyneb eto yng Nghymru, gyda Danielle Price, 15 oed, yn gorfod mynd i'r

hospital after seemingly being badly beaten by a fellow pupil at her comprehensive school in Neath. Is the Minister satisfied that she has a sufficiently robust strategy in relation to bullying? The unions think that urgent action is needed on this front and we keep hearing of these bullying incidents—across the United Kingdom, in fairness, and not just in Wales. This is a serious issue. What is the Minister's response to the latest serious case that we have heard about?

Jane Davidson: We have a strong strategy in Wales. We published our guidance, which relates to the statutory responsibility of schools to have an anti-bullying policy in, I think December, 2003. I gave schools a year but I warned headteachers that I would not just be issuing guidance on this matter; I would be following it through. Last year, we asked schools to present their anti-bullying policies for consideration to the Assembly Government, and Cardiff University is currently analysing the policies of schools in Wales. We have made it absolutely clear that we will ensure that every school has an anti-bullying policy and that it is fit for purpose, is not just taken off the shelf, and that pupils, parents, teachers and governing bodies can sign up to it.

Today we will be passing regulations that will mean that pupil councils are statutory, and that only in Wales, so it is a significant day for Wales. Pupil councils are a good mechanism by which pupils can talk to each other, ensuring that bullying is properly dealt with in the school and that policies are appropriately carried out.

Nick Bourne: Has the Minister checked whether Llangatwg Comprehensive School in Neath has such a policy, and has she spoken to the school about this serious incident?

Jane Davidson: All incidences of bullying are serious. I understand that, in this case, charges may be preferred, and we have to ensure that we have the whole picture before we consider making any statements from the

ysbyty ar ôl cael ei churo'n wael gan ddisgybl arall, mae'n ymddangos, yn ei hysgol gyfun yng Nghastell-nedd. A yw'r Gweinidog yn sicr bod ganddi strategaeth ddigon cadarn ar waith o ran bwlio? Yn ôl yr undebau, mae angen gweithredu ar frys ar y mater hwn ac yr ydym yn dal i glywed am y digwyddiadau hyn lle y mae bwlio'n digwydd—ledled y Deyrnas Unedig, a bod yn deg, ac nid yng Nghymru'n unig. Mae hwn yn fater difrifol. Beth yw ymateb y Gweinidog i'r achos difrifol diweddaraf y clywsom amdano?

Jane Davidson: Mae gennym strategaeth gadarn yng Nghymru. Cyhoeddasom, ym mis Rhagfyr 2003, yr wyf yn credu, ein canllawiau sy'n berthnasol i gyfrifoldeb statudol ysgolion i gael polisi gwrth-fwlio. Rhoddais flwyddyn i ysgolion ond rhybuddiais y penaethiaid nad cyhoeddi canllawiau yn unig y byddwn yn ei wneud ynghylch y mater hwn; y byddwn i'n rhoi sylw pellach iddo. Y llynedd, gofynasom i ysgolion gyflwyno eu polisiau gwrth-fwlio i'w hystyried i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad, ac mae Prifysgol Caerdydd wrthi'n dadansoddi polisiau ysgolion Cymru. Yr ydym wedi nodi'n gwbl glir y byddwn yn sicrhau bod gan bob ysgol bolisi gwrth-fwlio a'i fod yn addas i'w ddiben, nad yw'n defnyddio polisiau parod oddi ar y silff, a bod disgyblion, rhieni, athrawon a chyrff llywodraethol yn gallu ei dderbyn.

Heddiw, byddwn yn pasio rheoliadau a fydd yn golygu bod cynghorau disgyblion yn statudol, a hynny dim ond yng Nghymru, felly mae'n ddiwrnod arwyddocaol i Gymru. Mae cynghorau disgyblion yn fecanwaith da i ddisgyblion siarad â'i gilydd, gan sicrhau bod delio'n iawn â bwlio a gweithredu polisiau mewn modd priodol yn digwydd yn yr ysgol.

Nick Bourne: A yw'r Gweinidog wedi holi a oes gan Ysgol Gyfun Llangatwg yng Nghastell-nedd bolisi o'r fath, ac a ydyw wedi siarad â'r ysgol ynghylch y digwyddiad difrifol hwn?

Jane Davidson: Mae pob bwlio'n ddifrifol. Yr wyf yn deall ei bod yn bosibl y caiff achos ei ddwyn, y tro hwn, ac mae'n rhaid i ni sicrhau bod y darlun yn gyflawn cyn inni ystyried cyhoeddi unrhyw ddatganiadau gan

Assembly.

y Cynulliad.

Nick Bourne: With respect, I asked you—

Nick Bourne: Gyda pharch, gofynnais i chi—

The Presiding Officer: Order. If there are potential criminal proceedings, it is clearly a sub-judice matter.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Os oes achos troseddol yn yr arfaeth, mae'n amlwg yn fater *sub judice*.

Nick Bourne: Whether the school has a policy on bullying is a simple factual issue.

Nick Bourne: Cwestiwn ffeithiol syml yw a oes gan ysgol bolisi ar fwlio.

Jane Davidson: The school has a policy on bullying and it submitted it for consideration by Cardiff University.

Jane Davidson: Mae gan yr ysgol bolisi ar fwlio a chyflwynwyd hwnnw i'w ystyried gan Brifysgol Caerdydd.

Hybu Addysg Gymraeg Promotion of Welsh-medium Education

C2 Alun Ffred Jones: Pa gamau newydd sydd ar y gweill i hybu addysg Gymraeg? OAQ0517(ELL)

Q2 Alun Ffred Jones: What new proposals are in the pipeline to promote Welsh-medium education? OAQ0517(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Yr oedd ein hymrwymiad yn glir yn 'Iaith Pawb' i gynnal amrywiaeth o fentrau i gefnogi'r Gymraeg ac addysg a hyfforddiant cyfrwng Cymraeg, a hynny ar draws y sbectrum oed, o'r blynyddoedd cynnar i ddysgu gydol oes. Mae'r mentrau hyn yn cael eu datblygu a'u gweithredu yn unol â'r ymrwymiad hwnnw.

Jane Davidson: 'Iaith Pawb' made clear our commitment to take forward a wide range of initiatives in support of the Welsh language and Welsh-medium education and training right across the age spectrum, from early years to lifelong learning. These initiatives are being developed and implemented in line with that commitment.

Alun Ffred Jones: Os ydym am hybu addysg Gymraeg ar unrhyw lefel, un o'r pethau sylfaenol sydd ei angen yw ffeithiau, wrth gwrs. Pam felly nad yw'r ystadegau 'Y Gymraeg yn yr Ysgol' wedi eu cyhoeddi am 2004? Beth y mae hynny'n ei ddweud ynghylch agwedd y Llywodraeth tuag at addysg Gymraeg?

Alun Ffred Jones: If we are to promote Welsh-medium education at any level, it is fundamental that we will require facts, of course. Why then have the 'Welsh in Schools' statistics for 2004 not been published? What does that say about the Government's attitude towards Welsh-medium education?

Jane Davidson: Ni wn yr ateb i'ch cwestiwn, ond byddwn yn hapus i ofyn i'r adran am hyn ac ysgrifennu atoch yn ei gylch.

Jane Davidson: I do not know the answer to your question, but I would be happy to ask the department about this and write to you about it.

Alun Cairns: Special educational needs are an area that the Welsh Assembly Government and local education authorities have greatly neglected. We have highlighted significant deficiencies in the number of speech, language and occupational therapists across the board. However, the problem is even greater in relation to Welsh-medium education, in having such therapists who can

Alun Cairns: Mae anghenion addysgol arbennig yn faes y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru ac awdurdodau addysg lleol wedi ei esgeuluso'n fawr iawn. Yr ydym wedi tynnu sylw at brinder sylweddol yn nifer y therapyddion lleferydd, therapyddion iaith a therapyddion galwedigaethol yn gyffredinol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r broblem hyd yn oed yn fwy mewn perthynas ag

communicate in the preferred language of the pupil. In view of the fact that the Minister is an evidence-based Minister, what analysis has she made of this and what conclusions has she drawn?

Jane Davidson: This matter is within the portfolio of my colleague, Brian Gibbons, because speech therapists are employed by the NHS. However, there has been substantial analysis in terms of workforce planning. We have regularly reported to committee on the fact that we have increased the numbers of speech therapists in training. We are also considering issues around educational psychologists. The Assembly Government will continue to provide incentives and support to try to ensure that we train enough for the future.

Kirsty Williams: You will be aware of the concerns of parents in Brecon whose children attend the Welsh-medium setting for three-year-olds. Given the failures of Powys County Council, money allocated by you and the Government has not been spent, and that project has now been lost. Powys County Council is about to submit a new plan and bid for more money from the Assembly to provide a purpose-built setting for those three-year-olds whose parents wish them to learn through the medium of Welsh. Will you look favourably on that bid and ensure that the inadequacies of the county council do not deprive those children of the opportunities that they deserve?

Jane Davidson: The obligation in terms of the delivery mechanisms is, as always, down to the county council. The Assembly Government provides additional funding to ensure that every three-year-old can have a part-time place paid for by the Government. However, where that is located is a matter for engagement at the local level.

addysg drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg, o ran cael therapyddion o'r fath a all gyfathrebu yn newis iaith y disgybl. Yn wyneb y ffaith bod y Gweinidog yn Weinidog sy'n gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth, pa ddadansoddiad y mae hi wedi'i wneud o hyn a pha gasgliadau y mae hi wedi dod iddynt?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r mater hwn yn rhan o bortffolio fy nghyd-Aelod, Brian Gibbons, gan mai'r GIG sy'n cyflogi therapyddion lleferydd. Fodd bynnag, cafwyd cryn dipyn o ddadansoddi o ran cynllunio'r gweithlu. Yr ydym wedi adrodd i'r pwyllgor yn rheolaidd ynghylch y ffaith ein bod wedi cynyddu nifer y therapyddion lleferydd sy'n derbyn hyfforddiant. Yr ydym hefyd yn ystyried materion sy'n ymwneud â seicolegwyr addysgol. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i ddarparu cynlluniau a chefnogaeth i geisio sicrhau ein bod yn hyfforddi digon ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Kirsty Williams: Gwyddoch am bryderon rhieni plant yn Aberhonddu, sy'n mynychu'r ddarpariaeth cyfrwng Cymraeg ar gyfer plant tair oed. O gofio methiannau Cyngor Sir Powys, nid yw'r arian a ddyrannwyd gennych chi a'r Llywodraeth wedi cael ei wario, ac mae'r prosiect hwnnw bellach wedi'i golli. Mae Cyngor Sir Powys ar fin cyflwyno cynllun newydd a chais am ragor o arian gan y Cynulliad i ddarparu lleoliad pwrpasol ar gyfer y plant tair oed hynny yr hoffai eu rhieni iddynt ddysgu drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg. A wnewch ymateb yn ffafriol i'r cais hwnnw a sicrhau na fydd diffygion y cyngor sir yn amddifadu'r plant hynny o'r cyfleoedd y maent yn eu haeddu?

Jane Davidson: Y cyngor sir, fel bob amser, sy'n gyfrifol am y mecanweithiau ar gyfer cyflwyno addysg. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn darparu cyllid ychwanegol i sicrhau bod pob plentyn tair blwydd oed yn gallu cael lle rhan-amser y telir amdano gan y Llywodraeth. Fodd bynnag, mater i'w drafod ar lefel leol yw lleoliad y ddarpariaeth honno.

Cynllun Moderneiddio Addysg yn Sir Gaerfyrddin Modernising Carmarthenshire Education Programme

C3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Pa drafodaethau diweddar y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u cael

Q3 Rhodri Glyn Thomas: What recent discussions has the Minister had with

gyda Chyngor Sir Caerfyrddin ar y cynllun Moderneiddio Addysg yn sir Gaerfyrddin, a'i effaith ar gymunedau a'r iaith Gymraeg? OAQ0515(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Dim. Yr wyf yn falch o weld bod awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio mewn ffordd strategol ac yn sicrhau bod ganddynt y nifer gywir o ysgolion yn y manau cywir, boed yn gyfrwng Cymraeg neu Saesneg, o gofio y bydd 114,000 o leoedd gwag yn ysgolion Cymru erbyn 2013.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: Dywedwch fod y cyngor sir yn gweithredu'n strategol. A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryder bod Cyngor Sir Caerfyrddin fel pe bai'n credu mai un ateb sydd ar gyfer pob ysgol yn y sir, beth bynnag fo'r amgylchiadau yn yr ysgolion hynny? A gredwch y dylai'r cyngor sicrhau bod asesiad effaith yn cael ei gynnal ar effaith cau ysgol ar y gymuned a'r iaith Gymraeg?

Jane Davidson: Cyn y gall y cyngor, neu gynghorau ledled Cymru, gyflwyno cynnig i gau ysgol, rhaid iddynt gynnal ymgynghoriad arno. Dyna'r peth mwyaf pwysig. Bydd yn rhaid iddynt gynnal ymgynghoriad ar y cynnig. Dyna sut y byddwn yn sicrhau y bydd y bobl leol yn gallu ymateb i'r cynnig arbennig.

3.00 p.m.

Lisa Francis: Doubtless, Minister, you will say that the modernising education programme is a matter for Carmarthenshire County Council, but your Government's school organisation proposals under school closure proposals for rural schools mentions that particular considerations should include the home-to-school transport implications and increased journey times. In addition to Welsh language issues, these considerations have not been properly taken into account by Carmarthenshire County Council in this consultation. Are you not concerned that this consultation does not reach out to local people?

Jane Davidson: When the county council makes any proposal about changes to an individual school, it has to consult formally,

Carmarthenshire County Council regarding the Modernising Education programme in Carmarthenshire and its effect on Welsh-speaking communities? OAQ0515(ELL)

Jane Davidson: None. I welcome local authorities taking a strategic approach, ensuring that they have the right number of schools in the right places whether Welsh-medium or English-medium, in recognition of the fact that there will be 114,000 empty places in Welsh schools by 2013.

Rhodri Glyn Thomas: You say that the county council is working strategically. Do you share my concern that Carmarthenshire County Council seems to think that there is only one solution for every school in the council, whatever the circumstances in those schools? Do you believe that the council should carry out an impact assessment on the effect that closing a school would have on communities and the Welsh language?

Jane Davidson: Before the council, or councils throughout Wales, can make proposals to close a school, they must hold a consultation on those proposals. That is the most important thing. They will have to consult on the proposal. That is how we will ensure that local people have the opportunity to respond to the specific proposal.

Lisa Francis: Yn ddiaw, Weinidog, byddwch yn dweud mai mater i Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yw'r rhaglen moderneiddio addysg, ond mae sôn yng nghynigion eich Llywodraeth o ran trefn ysgolion, dan y cynigion i gau ysgolion gwledig, y dylai ystyriaethau penodol gynnwys goblygiadau cludiant o'r cartref i'r ysgol a siwrneiau hwy. Nid yw'r materion hyn wedi'u hystyried yn ddigon manwl gan Gyngor Sir Caerfyrddin yn yr ymgynghoriad hwn, heb sôn am y materion yn ymwneud â'r iaith Gymraeg. Onid ydych yn pryderu nad yw'r ymgynghoriad hwn yn ymestyn allan i gynnwys pobl leol?

Jane Davidson: Pan fydd cyngor sir yn gwneud unrhyw gynnig ynghylch newidiadau i ysgol unigol, rhaid iddo ymgynghori'n

as you know from the guidance on school organisation. When it consults formally and there are objections, those are sent into the Assembly Government to see whether or not the council has carried out its consultation properly and according to law, and whether all the other aspects of the guidance are met. In order for the council to be successful in any bid to change provision, it will have to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Assembly Government's lawyers that those issues are taken into account in the individual proposal. I assure you that we look to ensure that every concern registered by objectors—and I read every letter from every objector in relation to the cases that I determine—is adequately answered by the council, if we then proceed to support the council's bid. If the concerns are not adequately answered, we do not proceed to support the council's bid.

ffurfiol, fel yr ydych yn gwybod o'r canllawiau ar drefn ysgolion. Pan geir gwrthwynebiadau wrth ymgynghori'n ffurfiol, anfonir y rheini at Lywodraeth y Cynulliad i weld a yw'r Cyngor wedi dilyn y drefn ymgynghori'n briodol ac yn unol â'r gyfraith, ac a yw pob agwedd arall ar y canllawiau wedi'i bodloni. Er mwyn i'r cyngor fod yn llwyddiannus mewn unrhyw gynnig i newid darpariaeth, bydd rhaid iddo brofi nes bodloni cyfreithwyr Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ei fod wedi ystyried y materion hynny yn y cynnig unigol. Carwn eich sicrhau, os byddwn yn penderfynu bwrw ymlaen â chefnogi cynnig y cyngor, ein bod yn gwneud yn siŵr bod pob mater sy'n peri pryder a godir gan wrthwynebwyr—ac yr wyf yn darllen pob llythyr gan bob gwrthwynebydd mewn perthynas â'r achosion yr wyf yn penderfynu arnynt—yn cael eu hateb yn briodol gan y cyngor. Os na roddir ateb priodol i'r pryderon, ni fyddwn yn bwrw ymlaen â chefnogi cynnig y cyngor.

Mynediad i Addysg Uwch Access to Higher Education

Q4 Lynne Neagle: What action is the Minister taking to improve access to higher education for people from deprived backgrounds? OAQ0505(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Widening access is a key priority in 'Reaching Higher' and, since 2002-03, we have invested £2 million each year on widening access initiatives throughout Wales. Welsh higher education institutions consistently out-perform institutions in the UK on average in attracting a wide social mix of students, and are at the forefront in terms of increasing participation from under-represented groups.

Lynne Neagle: As you know, the UK Government is currently consulting on the introduction of post-qualification applications for university places. An improved application system could help ensure that more of the brightest students from every background will go to university, not just those who are expected to attend. As you know, almost half of all predicted A-level results are wrong and it is more likely that

C4 Lynne Neagle: Pa gamau a gymerir gan y Gweinidog i wella mynediad i addysg uwch ar gyfer pobl o gefndiroedd difreintiedig? OAQ0505(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae ehangu mynediad yn un o flaenoriaethau allweddol 'Anelu'n Uwch' ac, ers 2002-03, yr ydym wedi buddsoddi £2 filiwn yn flynyddol ar gynlluniau ehangu mynediad ledled Cymru. Yn gyson, mae sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru yn perfformio'n well ar gyfartaledd na sefydliadau yn y DU o ran denu myfyrwyr o gefndiroedd cymdeithasol eang, ac maent ar y blaen o ran cynyddu cyfranogiad ymysg grwpiau sy'n cael eu tangynrychioli.

Lynne Neagle: Fel y gwyddoch, mae Llywodraeth y DU wrthi'n ymgynghori ar hyn o bryd ar gyflwyno ceisiadau am leoedd mewn prifysgolion ar ôl derbyn graddau. Byddai system well o wneud cais yn gallu helpu i sicrhau bod rhagor o'r myfyrwyr disgleiriaf o bob cefndir yn gallu mynd i brifysgol, yn hytrach na dim ond y rhai y mae disgwyl iddynt fynd i'r brifysgol. Fel y gwyddoch, mae bron hanner y canlyniadau

students from poor backgrounds have their results under-predicted by teachers. The PQA system is designed to get the right people into university, and by 'right', I mean bright, and not just privileged. Do you share my welcome for the UK Government's initiative and what assurance can you give that should such a system be introduced, following the consultation, it will equally apply in Wales?

Jane Davidson: I was pleased to see consultation on post-qualification admissions. The consultation is endorsed by all Ministers across the UK, because we believe that any system needs to operate in a similar way across the UK, so that it does not restrict the mobility of students across the UK.

Janet Ryder: One of the main benefits to people from a deprived background entering higher education, as you have often stressed, along with Professor Teresa Rees, is the work undertaken in the early years. Can you tell us why, therefore, you have delayed the roll-out of the foundation phase?

Jane Davidson: I gave the reasons clearly to the committee. It was to ensure that we have adequately trained professionals to deliver what is the biggest life-changing education agenda that Wales has ever seen. That is being taken forward by this Labour Assembly Government.

Professionals in the sector are fully signed up to the delivery of the foundation phase, but we all want to ensure that we can benefit from the messages of the pilot schemes, and we will not be getting the final report on those until next year. I am sure that your party would want to support the foundation phase and ensure that the children of Wales can benefit from hugely increased investment in them, and in the staff to support them in future.

William Graham: The Sutton Trust suggests that students from the poorest backgrounds

Safon Uwch a ragwelir yn anghywir, ac mae'n fwy tebygol bod athrawon yn rhagweld canlyniadau rhy isel i fyfyrwyr o gefndir tlawd. Lluniwyd y system o dderbyn ar ôl cymhwyso i sicrhau bod y bobl gywir yn mynd i brifysgol, ac wrth ddefnyddio 'cywir' yn y fan hon, yr wyf yn golygu'r rhai disglair ac nid y rhai breintiedig yn unig. A ydych chi, yr un fath â finnau, yn croesawu'r cynllun hwn gan Lywodraeth y DU a pha sicrwydd y gallwch ei roi pe byddai system o'r fath yn cael ei chyflwyno, wedi'r ymgynghoriad, y bydd yn cael ei rhoi ar waith yng Nghymru yr un modd?

Jane Davidson: Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld yr ymgynghori ar dderbyn ar ôl cymhwyso. Caiff yr ymgynghoriad ei gymeradwyo gan bob Gweinidog ledled y DU, oherwydd credwn fod rhaid i unrhyw system gael ei rhoi ar waith yn yr un modd ledled y DU, fel nad yw'n cyfyngu ar allu myfyrwyr i symud o gwmpas y DU.

Janet Ryder: Un o'r prif fanteision er mwyn i bobl o gefndiroedd difreintiedig gael addysg uwch, fel yr ydych chi a'r Athro Teresa Rees wedi pwysleisio droeon, yw'r gwaith a gyflawnir yn y blynyddoedd cynnar. A allwch ddweud wrthym, felly, pam yr ydych chi wedi gohirio cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen?

Jane Davidson: Rhoddais y rhesymau'n hollol glir i'r pwyllgor. Gwnaethpwyd hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ddigon o weithwyr proffesiynol hyfforddedig i gyflawni'r agenda addysg fwyaf, a hynny o ran newid cwrs bywyd disgyblion, a welwyd yng Nghymru erioed. Ein Llywodraeth Lafur yn y Cynulliad sy'n bwrw ymlaen â hyn.

Mae gweithwyr proffesiynol yn y sector yn gefnogol iawn i gyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen, ond yr ydym i gyd am sicrhau y gallwn gael budd o'r negeseuon a ddaw i law o'r cynlluniau peilot. Ni fyddwn yn cael yr adroddiad terfynol ar y rhain tan y flwyddyn nesaf. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai eich plaid am gefnogi'r cyfnod sylfaen i sicrhau bod plant Cymru'n gallu elwa o'r buddsoddiad cynyddol ynddynt, ac yn y staff a fydd yno i'w cefnogi i'r dyfodol.

William Graham: Mae Ymddiriedolaeth Sutton yn awgrymu mai myfyrwyr o'r

now make up 8 per cent of the intake of British universities, compared with 6 per cent in 1997. That is encouraging. Will you redouble your efforts to increase those figures again for next year?

Jane Davidson: Early indicators demonstrate that we had a particular success in our policies with regard to a growing number of people from Communities First areas going on to higher education. That was partly as a result of our widening access partnerships, and the work that those are doing in Communities First areas to encourage young people to consider higher education. Along with other Ministers, I will continue to ensure that we try to build up those numbers.

Jenny Randerson: The post-92 institutions make an enormous contribution in this field. The recent Cooke and Bull report, commissioned by the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales, pointed to the need for increasing collaboration, possibly leading to a merger, between the University of Glamorgan, the University of Wales, Newport and the University of Wales Institute, Cardiff. Glamorgan university recently announced a new campus for the creative industries in my constituency. Although I am delighted to welcome even more students to my constituency, can you explain how the fact that the new Glamorgan campus, which is literally next door to the UWIC campus, is dealing with the same area, will aid the collaboration, rather than the competition agenda?

Jane Davidson: The First Minister and I have strongly encouraged the three institutions to plan their futures together. I hope that you would do the same. I met sector representatives this morning, and I reiterated that message.

cefnidroedd tlotaf bellach yw 8 y cant o'r cyfanswm sy'n mynd i brifysgolion Prydain, o'i gymharu â 6 y cant yn 1997. Mae hynny'n galondid mawr. A wnewch fwy fyth o ymdrech i gynyddu'r ffigurau hyn eto y flwyddyn nesaf?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r dangosyddion cynnar yn dangos bod ein polisiau wedi bod yn hynod lwyddiannus o ran cynyddu nifer y bobl o ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf sy'n mynd ymlaen i addysg uwch. Daw hyn, i raddau, yn sgîl ein partneriaethau ehangu mynediad, a'r gwaith a wneir mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf i annog pobl ifanc i ystyried addysg uwch. Ar y cyd â'r Gweinidogion eraill, byddaf yn parhau i sicrhau ein bod yn ceisio cynyddu'r ffigurau hynny.

Jenny Randerson: Mae'r sefydliadau ôl-92 wedi gwneud cyfraniad aruthrol i'r maes hwn. Yn adroddiad diweddar Cooke a Bull, a gomisiynwyd gan Gyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru, tynnwyd sylw at yr angen i gael mwy o gydweithio rhwng Prifysgol Morgannwg, Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd ac Athrofa Prifysgol Caerdydd, gan arwain, o bosibl, at uniad. Cyhoeddodd Prifysgol Morgannwg yn ddiweddar y byddai ganddi gampws newydd ar gyfer y diwydiannau creadigol yn fy etholaeth i. Er fy mod wrth fy modd o gael croesawu mwy fyth o fyfyrwyr i'm hetholaeth, a allwch esbonio sut y bydd y ffaith bod campws newydd Prifysgol Morgannwg, sydd yn llythrennol y drws nesaf i gampws yr athrofa, yn delio â'r un maes, yn hwyluso agenda o gydweithredu yn hytrach nag o gystadlu?

Jane Davidson: Mae'r Prif Weinidog a finnau wedi pwyso'n daer ar y tri sefydliad i gynllunio'u dyfodol gyda'i gilydd. Yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddech chithau'n gwneud yr un peth. Cefais gyfarfod â chynrychiolwyr o'r sector y bore yma, ac ailadroddais y neges honno.

Dysgu Ieithoedd Tramor Modern Teaching Modern Foreign Languages

Q5 Denise Idris Jones: Will the Minister make a statement about the teaching of modern foreign languages in Wales?
OAQ0535(ELL)

C5 Denise Idris Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yng Nghymru?
OAQ0535(ELL)

Jane Davidson: I am committed to encouraging the learning of modern foreign languages in Wales. Our 'Languages Count' strategy details measures to back this commitment, including the establishment of the Centre for Information on Language Teaching and Research Cymru, the piloting of language learning at key stage 2, guidance from Estyn and the Qualifications, Curriculum and Assessment Authority for Wales, and the inclusion of a language module in the Welsh baccalaureate.

Denise Idris Jones: Do you agree that if Wales is to be an outward-looking, forward-thinking country with a modern economy, and competitive on the global stage, we must prioritise the teaching of modern foreign languages in Wales? What action is being taken to ensure that pupils across Wales have the opportunity to study a range of languages in school?

Jane Davidson: The work of CILT Cymru is to do exactly that. We also have the very successful key stage 2 modern foreign language pilot project. It is a three-year project, and the evaluation is looking very positive. We hope that those children will take their language skills forward from the primary sector into the secondary sector, and encourage them to continue in future. It is heartening to see that standards at GCSE level are continuing to rise, with regard to the achievement of grades A* to C in modern foreign languages. Entries for AS-levels have risen substantially, from 1,944 in 2004 to 2,022 in 2005. We want to see that increase sustained.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf wedi ymrwymo i hybu dysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yng Nghymru. Ceir manylion yn ein strategaeth 'Ieithoedd sy'n Cyfrif' am fesurau sy'n cefnogi'r ymrwymiad hwn, gan gynnwys sefydlu Canolfan Wybodaeth ac Ymchwil Cymru ar Ddysgu Ieithoedd, cynlluniau peilot sy'n dysgu ieithoedd yng nghyfnod allweddol 2, canllawiau gan Estyn ac Awdurdod Cymwysterau, Cwricwlwm ac Asesu Cymru, a chynnwys modiwl ar iaith ym magloriaeth Cymru.

Denise Idris Jones: A ydych yn cytuno os yw Cymru am fod yn wlad sy'n edrych tuag allan ac yn flaengar ei meddwl, gydag economi fodern sy'n cystadlu ar lefel fyd-eang, y bydd rhaid i ni roi blaenoriaeth i ddysgu ieithoedd tramor modern yng Nghymru? Pa gamau sy'n cael eu cymryd i sicrhau bod disgyblion ledled Cymru'n cael cyfle i astudio amrywiol ieithoedd yn yr ysgol?

Jane Davidson: Dyna fydd union waith y Ganolfan Wybodaeth ac Ymchwil (CILT Cymru). Hefyd, mae'r prosiect peilot ieithoedd tramor modern yng nghyfnod allweddol 2 sy'n hynod lwyddiannus. Prosiect tair blynedd yw hwn, ac mae'r gwerthusiad yn edrych yn gadarnhaol iawn. Gobeithio y bydd y plant hynny'n dal ati â'u sgiliau ieithyddol yn y sector uwchradd ar ôl bod yn y sector cynradd, ac y byddant yn cael eu hannog i'w defnyddio yn y dyfodol. Mae'n galonogol gweld bod safonau TGAU yn parhau i godi, o ran llwyddo i gael graddau A* i C mewn ieithoedd tramor modern. Mae'r nifer sy'n cofrestru ar gyrsiau safon AS wedi codi'n sylweddol, o 1,944 yn 2004 i 2,022 yn 2005. Yr ydym am weld y twf hwn yn cael ei gynnal.

Llywyddiaeth yr UE EU Presidency

Q6 Val Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on the youth event of the EU Presidency? OAQ0546(ELL)

Jane Davidson: The EU youth event was held in Cardiff and attended by 103 young people from European Union member states

C6 Val Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y digwyddiad i ieuencid a gynhelir i nodi Llywyddiaeth yr UE? OAQ0546(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Cynhaliwyd digwyddiad ieuencid yr UE yng Nghaerdydd a mynychwyd ef gan dros 103 o bobl ifanc o

and European Economic Area accession countries. The theme of the conference was promoting the participation of young people in local life. The event programme was planned, co-ordinated and chaired by 22 young people from the UK.

Val Lloyd: Thank you for putting your congratulations and thanks to those 22 young people on record. They revolutionised the concept of the youth event by making it youth-led. Those 22 young people, who were between the ages of 16 and 21, planned and delivered the entire event, which helped to ensure that young people from across Europe made their voices heard. Do you agree that the UK has now set an excellent precedent for Europe to follow of supporting young people from across Europe in influencing the decision-making process at home and in Europe?

3.10 p.m.

Jane Davidson: I hope so. Eight young people from Wales were among those 22 involved. We were told by the commission and others, that this was probably the most youth-led event that it had seen. The 22 young people planned every element of the event, including the gift that the European Commission traditionally gives to delegates attending such conferences. Many of you will know that our young people decided that there should be the purchase of a piece of Ecuadorian rainforest—a sustainable gift—rather than each delegate being given a pen or suchlike. Austria, which has the next presidency, would do well to have a dialogue with these young people about how it takes forward its event.

aelod-wladwriaethau'r Undeb Ewropeaidd a gwledydd sydd wedi'u derbyn i Ardal Economaidd Ewrop. Thema'r gynhadledd oedd hyrwyddo cyfranogiad pobl ifanc mewn bywyd lleol. Lluniwyd y rhaglen gan 22 o bobl ifanc o'r DU a hwythau hefyd a oedd yn gyfrifol am gydlynw a chadeirio'r gynhadledd.

Val Lloyd: Diolch am ddatgan ar goedd ein llongyfarchiadau a'n gwerthfawrogiad i'r 22 o bobl ifanc. Llwyddasant i chwyldroi'r cysyniad o ddigwyddiad ieuenctid drwy ei wneud yn ddigwyddiad dan arweiniad pobl ifanc. Bu'r 22 hynny, a oedd rhwng 16 a 21 oed, wrthi'n ddyfal yn cynllunio ac yn cyflwyno'r digwyddiad cyfan, a oedd yn fodd i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc o bob cwr o Ewrop yn cael dweud eu dweud. A ydych yn cytuno bod y DU wedi gosod cysail ardderchog y bydd rhaid i Ewrop ei ddilyn o ran cefnogi pobl ifanc ledled Ewrop wrth ddylanwadu ar y broses o wneud penderfyniadau yn eu gwledydd hwy ac yn Ewrop?

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn gobeithio hynny. Yr oedd wyth o'r 22 o Gymru. Dywedwyd wrthym gan y comisiwn a chan eraill, mai hwn fwy na thebyg oedd y digwyddiad gorau o ran pobl ifanc yn arwain yr oeddent wedi bod yn rhan ohono. Aeth y 22 o bobl ifanc drwy bob elfen o'r digwyddiad â chrib mân, gan gynnwys yr anrheg a roddir, yn ôl traddodiad, gan y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd i bobl sy'n mynychu cynadleddau o'r fath. Fel y gŵyr rhai ohonoch, penderfynodd y bobl ifanc roi anrheg gynaliadwy - prynwyd darn o fforest law yn Ecuador i bawb - yn hytrach na rhoi beiro neu rywbeth cyffelyb am ddim. Nid drwg o beth fyddai i Awstria, a fydd yn derbyn y llywyddiaeth nesaf, gynnal trafodaeth gyda'r bobl ifanc hyn ynghylch trefnu eu digwyddiad hwythau.

Gwaith Maes Cymunedol ym Myd Addysg Community Outreach in Education

Q7 John Griffiths: Will the Minister make a statement on community outreach in education? OAQ0486(ELL)

C7 John Griffiths: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am waith maes cymunedol ym myd addysg? OAQ0486(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Community outreach in

Jane Davidson: Sicrheir gwaith maes

education is secured through providers of community and adult education, including provision made under the Education and Learning Wales community learning programme, further and higher education institutions, and the use of schools as a community facility.

John Griffiths: At the moment, the University of Wales, Newport runs effective and impressive schemes to bring into higher education sections of the population that have not, traditionally, benefited from it. These projects are funded through European funding. Unfortunately, there is a gap between the end of that funding and the expected commencement of the next round of European funding, which, hopefully, would allow for the continuation of those projects. The university is concerned that if that gap is not bridged in some way, a great deal of the benefit of these schemes will be lost. Will you look at these problems and at ways in which they could be addressed?

Jane Davidson: We all await with interest the outcome of the summit, which will be held just before Christmas, in relation to ensuring, we hope, the budget for the European Commission.

cymunedol ym myd addysg drwy ddarparwyr addysg gymunedol ac addysg i oedolion, gan gynnwys y ddarpariaeth a wnaed dan raglen dysgu cymunedol Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru, sefydliadau pellach ac uwch, a defnyddio ysgolion fel cyfleuster cymunedol.

John Griffiths: Ar hyn o bryd, mae Prifysgol Cymru, Casnewydd yn rhedeg cynlluniau effeithiol a nodedig i ddenu adrannau o'r boblogaeth i addysg uwch nad ydynt, yn draddodiadol, wedi elwa ohoni. Noddir y prosiectau hyn gan gyllid o Ewrop. Yn anffodus, ceir bwlch rhwng diwedd y cyllid hwn a'r dyddiad disgwylidig y bydd y cylch nesaf o arian Ewrop yn dechrau, a fydd, gobeithio, yn galluogi'r prosiectau hyn i oroesi. Pryder y brifysgol yw oni lenwir y bwlch hwn mewn rhyw ffordd, yna y bydd llawer iawn o fanteision y cynlluniau hyn yn mynd i ddifancoll. A wnewch daro golwg ar y problemau hyn ac edrych ar ffyrdd i fynd i'r afael â hwy?

Jane Davidson: Yr ydym i gyd yn edrych ymlaen yn eiddgar at ganlyniad yr uwch-gynhadledd, a gynhelir ychydig cyn y Nadolig, o ran pennu cyllideb y Comisiwn Ewropeaidd, gobeithio.

Cynlluniau Cyngor Dinas a Sir Abertawe i Ad-drefnu Ysgolion Swansea City and County Council's Schools Reorganisation Plans

C8 David Lloyd: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am gynlluniau cyngor Abertawe i ad-drefnu ysgolion? OAQ0525(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Cyhoeddodd Abertawe dri chynnig yn ddiweddar i ad-drefnu ysgolion cynradd, ac mae pob un ohonynt wedi denu gwrthwynebiadau. Daw'r cynigion hynny ger fy mron felly, imi benderfynu arnynt. Deallaf fod ymgynghoriad yn cael ei gynnal ar ad-drefnu ysgolion uwchradd. O gofio fy rôl, ni allaf gynnig barn ar rinweddau neu ffaeledau'r cynlluniau hyn.

David Lloyd: Yn gyffredinol, oni fyddai'n well cynnal ymgynghoriad am ddyfodol ysgolion Abertawe heb enwi ysgolion i'w cau, yn hytrach nag enwi ysgolion i'w cau, fel Ysgol Dylan Thomas, ac yna cynnal ymgynghoriad â'r cyhoedd?

Q8 David Lloyd: Will the Minister make a statement on Swansea council's schools reorganisation plans? OAQ0525(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Swansea recently published three proposals for primary school reorganisation, all of which have attracted objections. The proposals will therefore come to me for determination. I understand that consultation is under way on secondary school reorganisation. Given my role, I cannot comment on the merits or otherwise of any of these plans.

David Lloyd: In general, would it not be better to conduct a consultation on the future of Swansea's schools without naming the schools that are to be closed, rather than naming the schools to be closed, such as Dylan Thomas School, and then holding a consultation with the public?

Jane Davidson: Os yw cyngor am newid trefniadau'r ardal, yn statudol byddai'n rhaid iddo enwi'r ysgolion i'w cau, gan fod rhaid ymgynghori ar y cynnig i gau ysgol benodol.

Jane Davidson: If a council wants to change local arrangements, by statute it would have to name the schools to be closed, since there has to be consultation on the proposal to close a particular school.

School Discipline Disgyblaeth mewn Ysgolion

Q9 Laura Anne Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the rights of teachers in Wales with regard to school discipline? OAQ0543(ELL)

C9 Laura Anne Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am hawliau athrawon yng Nghymru o ran disgyblaeth mewn ysgolion? OAQ0543(ELL)

Jane Davidson: I fully support teachers in tackling challenging behaviour in our schools and welcome any opportunity to clarify this right. There is already detailed guidance on school-based actions to tackle poor behaviour, the use of exclusion and the use of reasonable force to control or restrain pupils. As I said earlier, the Education Bill will clarify this further.

Jane Davidson: Yr wyf yn gwbl gefnogol i athrawon wrth iddynt fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad heriol yn ein hysgolion ac yn croesawu unrhyw gyfle i egluro'r hawl hon. Ceir eisoes ganllawiau manwl ar y camau y gall ysgolion eu cymryd i fynd i'r afael ag ymddygiad gwael, sef gwahardd a defnyddio grym rhesymol i reoli neu ffrwyno disgyblion. Fel y dywedais yn gynharach, bydd y Mesur Addysg yn egluro hyn ymhellach.

Laura Anne Jones: We need to send a clear message to people across Wales that bad behaviour in the classroom is simply not acceptable. Lack of discipline is a growing problem in our schools because teachers no longer have the power to deal firmly with disruptive children. Do you agree, therefore, that teachers urgently need stronger legal rights to restrain and punish badly behaved children?

Laura Anne Jones: Mae angen inni anfon neges glir at bobl Cymru yn datgan nad yw ymddygiad gwael yn y dosbarth yn dderbyniol. Mae diffyg disgyblaeth yn broblem gynyddol yn ein hysgolion oherwydd nad oes gan athrawon y pŵer i ddelio'n gadarn â phlant aflonyddgar. A ydych yn cytuno, felly, fod angen hawliau cyfreithiol cryfach ar athrawon ar fyrder i ffrwyno a chosbi plant sy'n ymddwyn yn wael?

Jane Davidson: The recommendation from the learning behaviour report asks the Government to introduce a single new piece of legislation to make clear the overall right to discipline pupils. This should be framed in such a way as not to diminish existing wide legal rights to provide a clear read-across to the duties and responsibilities of parents and reaffirm teachers' rights to restrain pupils using reasonable force.

Jane Davidson: Gofynna'r argymhelliad yn yr adroddiad am ymddygiad dysgu i'r Llywodraeth gyflwyno un ddeddfwriaeth newydd a fydd yn egluro'r hawl gyffredinol i ddisgyblu plant. Dylid gwneud hyn mewn ffordd nad yw'n gwanhau'r hawliau cyfreithiol eang a geir ar hyn o bryd i roi cyfarwyddyd pendant ynghylch dyletswyddau a chyfrifoldebau rhieni ac ailddatgan yr hawl sydd gan athrawon i ffrwyno disgyblion gan arfer grym rhesymol.

The Government is consulting on this report and we will be looking with interest at the outcome of that consultation and the proposals that will feed through into the

Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ymgynghori ar yr adroddiad hwn a byddwn yn edrych gyda diddordeb ar ganlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw a'r cynigion a ddaw drwodd i'r

education Bill. Such proposals will then be discussed in our committee.

Mesur addysg. Bydd cynigion o'r fath yn cael eu trafod yn ein pwyllgor wedyn.

Datblygiad Proffesiynol Athrawon Professional Development of Teachers

Q10 Eleanor Burnham: Will the Minister make a statement on the professional development of teachers? OAQ0500(ELL)

C10 Eleanor Burnham: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am ddatblygiad proffesiynol athrawon? OAQ0500(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Teachers can access a range of professional development opportunities throughout their careers, from induction and early professional development through individual development opportunities to middle-management leadership and headship training. To maximise impact, I am promoting discussion of best practice, launching the pedagogy debate and supporting the induction of a professional development framework.

Jane Davidson: Caiff athrawon fanteisio ar amryw o gyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygiad proffesiynol drwy gydol eu gyrfa, o'u hymsefydlu a'u datblygiad proffesiynol cynnar hyd at gyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygiad yr unigolyn ac arweiniad gan reolwyr canol, a hyfforddiant i benaethiaid ysgol. Er mwyn cael yr effaith fwyaf posibl, yr wyf yn hyrwyddo trafodaeth ar yr arferion gorau, yn lansio'r ddadl ar addysgeg ac yn cefnogi'r bwriad i sefydlu fframwaith datblygiad proffesiynol.

Eleanor Burnham: Thank you for the wholesome and fulsome reply. Have you made an assessment of the impact of the continuing professional development funding programme on the retention of teachers in Wales, and, if not, will you assure that you undertake such an assessment as soon as possible?

Eleanor Burnham: Diolch i chi am yr ateb buddiol a helaeth. A ydych wedi asesu effaith y rhaglen ar gyfer ariannu datblygiad proffesiynol parhaus ar y gallu i gadw athrawon yng Nghymru, ac, os nad ydych, a wnewch ein sicrhau y byddwch yn cynnal asesiad o'r fath cyn gynted ag y bo modd?

Jane Davidson: To date, over 19,000 development opportunities have been funded by the General Teaching Council for Wales. If you want to see an assessment about how effective the council has been, you can look at the General Teaching Council's website.

Jane Davidson: Hyd yn hyn, mae mwy na 19,000 o gyfleoedd ar gyfer datblygiad wedi'u hariannu gan Gyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol Cymru. Os ydych am weld asesiad o effeithiolrwydd y cyngor, gallwch edrych ar wefan y Cyngor Addysgu Cyffredinol.

Addysg Iaith Gymraeg yn Ynys Môn Welsh Language Education in Ynys Môn

C11 Ieuan Wyn Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am addysg iaith Gymraeg yn Ynys Môn? OAQ0527(ELL)

Q11 Ieuan Wyn Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on Welsh language education in Ynys Môn? OAQ0527(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Mae pob un o'r 47 o ysgolion cynradd yn Ynys Môn yn defnyddio'r Gymraeg fel cyfrwng dysgu. Yn Ionawr 2005, yr oedd 44 yn ysgolion categori A, a thair ohonynt yn ysgolion categori B. Mae pob un o'r pedair ysgol uwchradd yn y sir yn dysgu chwech neu fwy o bynciau yn gyfan gwbl drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg neu'n

Jane Davidson: All 47 primary schools in Ynys Môn use Welsh as a medium of instruction. In January 2005, 44 were category A schools, and three were category B schools. All four secondary schools in the county teach six or more subjects entirely through the medium of Welsh or bilingually.

ddwyieithog.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae'n siŵr gennyf bod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r cyfnod peilot hynod lwyddiannus ar gyfer cynlluniau trochi a hyrwyddwyd gan Fwrdd yr Iaith Gymraeg—yr oedd Ynys Môn yn un o'r ardaloedd peilot—a oedd yn galluogi disgyblion ysgol uwchradd i ddysgu'r Gymraeg ar garlam gan elwa mwy o addysg ddwyieithog. Mae pryder na fydd y cyrsiau hyn yn gallu parhau ar ôl y cyfnod peilot oherwydd diffyg cyllid. A fydddech yn fodlon dangos eich cefnogaeth lwyr i'r cynllun hwnnw heddiw?

Jane Davidson: Cyflwynais y cynllun hwnnw ar ôl ymweld â Chanada i weld yr hyn sy'n digwydd yno. Bydd rhaid inni feddwl am ddyfodol cynlluniau o'r fath ar ôl iddynt gael eu gwerthuso.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Gwn mai chi a gyflwynodd y cynllun hwn, a chefnogaf hynny, ond hoffai'r ysgolion wybod a oes modd iddynt gynllunio i'r dyfodol. Byddai cael ateb buan yn hyn o beth yn gymorth mawr i ysgolion. Maent yn sylweddoli pa mor werthfawr yw'r cynllun. Mae'n rhaid iddynt gael ateb eithaf buan er mwyn rhoi cynllun ar waith.

Jane Davidson: Mae prosiectau trochi yn wahanol ledled Cymru, felly mae gofyn imi gynnal gwerthusiad i ddarganfod y ffordd orau o gynnal prosiectau o'r fath.

Y Llywydd: Tynnwyd cwestiwn 13, OAQ0519(ELL), a chwestiwn 14, OAQ0545(ELL), yn ôl.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I am sure that the Minister will be aware of the extremely successful pilot phase of the immersion schemes promoted by the Welsh Language Board—Ynys Môn was one of the pilot areas—which enabled secondary school pupils to learn Welsh by means of immersion processes and benefit to a greater degree from bilingual education. There is concern that these courses will not be able to continue after the pilot phase due to a lack of funding. Would you be willing to give your full support to that scheme today?

Jane Davidson: I introduced that scheme after visiting Canada to see what was happening there. We will have to consider the future of such schemes following their evaluation.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I know that you introduced this scheme, and I support that, but the schools would like to know whether they will be able to plan for the future. An early response to this would be of great assistance to schools. They realise how worthwhile this scheme is. They need a fairly quick response so that they can implement their plans.

Jane Davidson: Immersion projects are different across Wales, so I need to evaluate them in order to identify the best way of operating such projects.

The Presiding Officer: Question 13, OAQ0519(ELL), and question 14, OAQ0545(ELL), have been withdrawn.

Dechrau'n Deg Flying Start

Q15 Ann Jones: Will the Minister make a statement on the Flying Start initiative?
OAQ0508(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Flying Start will target children from birth to 3 years of age in the most deprived communities of Wales, investing intensely based on international evidence. Proposed interventions include free good quality childcare for 2-year-olds, additional health visiting and parenting

C15 Ann Jones: A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am y fenter Dechrau'n Deg?
OAQ0508(ELL)

Jane Davidson: Bydd Dechrau'n Deg yn targedu plant o'u geni nes eu bod yn dair blwydd oed yn y cymunedau mwyaf difreintiedig yng Nghymru, gan fuddsoddi'n helaeth ar sail tystiolaeth ryngwladol. Ymysg yr ymyriadau arfaethedig y mae gofal plant o safon dda am ddim i rai dwy flyydd oed, a

programmes. A public consultation will commence on 28 November.

Ann Jones: I welcome this initiative. It will start to bring together all the initiatives that we have been trying to implement within Communities First areas and in areas where communities need them. During the consultation, will you undertake to look at working with those who are already providing that sort of care via nurseries, so that they can be integrated into the system to ensure that we have a full range of nurseries and childcare provision for children from birth to 3 years of age?

3.20 p.m.

Jane Davidson: As people will see when the consultation goes out, this is about joining up a vision between Sure Start and other kinds of provision. There will be a menu that people can operate from to ensure that all aspects are properly taken forward. It is an exciting initiative, and it goes back to the point that, if we really want to change young children's lives in education, we do it as early as possible.

rhaglenni ychwanegol ar gyfer ymwelwyr iechyd a rhianta. Bydd ymgynghoriad cyhoeddus yn dechrau ar 28 Tachwedd.

Ann Jones: Croesawaf y fenter hon. Bydd yn dechrau cyfuno'r holl fentrau eraill yr ydym wedi ceisio'u rhoi ar waith mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf ac mewn ardaloedd lle y mae ar gymunedau eu hangen. Yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad, a wnewch ymrwymo i ystyried gweithio gyda'r rhai sydd eisoes yn darparu gofal o'r fath drwy feithrinfeydd, fel y gellir eu hintegreiddio â'r system er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym ddarpariaeth gyflawn o feithrinfeydd a gofal plant ar gyfer plant o'u geni nes eu bod yn dair blwydd oed?

Jane Davidson: Fel y gwelir pan ddechreuir ar yr ymgynghoriad, mae hyn yn ymwneud â chyfuno gweledigaeth rhwng Dechrau'n Deg a mathau eraill o ddarpariaeth. Bydd dewislen y gall pobl ei dilyn er mwyn sicrhau bod sylw priodol yn cael ei roi i bob agwedd ar hyn. Mae'n fenter gyffrous, ac mae'n mynd yn ôl at y pwynt bod rhaid inni ddechrau mor gynnar ag y bo modd os ydym o ddifrif ynghylch newid bywydau plant mewn addysg.

Datganiad Busnes Business Statement

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I have two changes to report to this week's business. Following this statement, Edwina Hart will make a statement on the proposed changes to police forces in Wales, and the motions to approve, under Standing Order No. 24.25, the Education (Recognised Bodies) (Wales) Order 2005 and the Fishery Products (Official Controls Charges) (Wales) Regulations 2005, have been postponed until 29 November. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement, which can be found on the Chamberweb under supporting documents. Following the Business Committee's meeting this morning, it has been determined that the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Adoption Information and Intermediary Services (Pre-

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Mae gennyf ddau newid i'w hadrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon. Yn dilyn y datganiad hwn, bydd Edwina Hart yn gwneud datganiad am y newidiadau arfaethedig i heddluoedd yng Nghymru, ac mae'r cynigion i gymeradwyo Gorchymyn Addysg (Cyrff sy'n Cael eu Cydnabod) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Pysgodfeydd (Taliadau Rheolaethau Swyddogol) (Cymru) 2005, o dan Reol Sefydlog 24.25, wedi'u gohirio tan 29 Tachwedd. Mae'r busnes ar gyfer y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi'i nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft, y gellir ei weld ar we'r Siambr o dan ddogfennau ategol. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynwyd nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Gwybodaeth Mabwysiadu a

Commencement Adoptions) (Amendment) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the National Assistance (Assessment of Resources) (Amendment No. 2) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Common Agricultural Policy Single Payment and Support Schemes (Cross Compliance) (Wales) (Amendment) Regulations 2005, and the Bovine Products (Restriction on Placing on the Market) (No.2) (Wales) Regulations 2005.

Y Llywydd: A oes gwrthwynebiad i'r datganiad busnes drafft? Gwelaf fod o leiaf 10 gwrthwynebiad, felly gofynnaf i'r Trefnydd gynnig y datganiad busnes yn ffurfiol ac, o dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 5.4, galwaf ar un Aelod o bob grŵp gwleidyddol i ymateb yn fyr i'r cynnig.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales adopts the business statement.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: The Government puts a brave face on Charles Clarke's latest intervention on restructuring the police service, but you have to take it from us, Minister, that we as opposition members regard his latest intervention as an insult to the people of Wales. He has entered into a consultation procedure, but, in the middle of it, he has told us what his preferred option is. That is taking a hard attitude to the Assembly. The Assembly should be treated with greater respect than that from the Home Secretary. I understand that there is to be a statement by the feisty Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, but we need a debate. The only way that the National Assembly can put forward, on record, how we think the police should be structured in Wales is by having a full debate. I understand that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee is looking at various options, but it may well be too late by the time that that committee reports, because the Home Secretary is clearly not interested in the National Assembly's views. Will you think again on this issue, Minister? The people of Wales expect this Government to stand up for Wales, not to kowtow to the Home Secretary in London.

Gwasanaethau Cyfryngol (Mabwysiadu Cyn-gychwyn) (Diwygio) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cymorth Gwladol (Aseu Adnoddau) (Diwygio Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Cynllun Taliad Sengl a Chynlluniau Cymorth y Polisi Amaethyddol Cyffredin (Trawsgydymffurfio) (Cymru) (Diwygio) 2005, a Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Buchol (Cyfyngu ar eu Rhoi ar y Farchnad) (Rhif 2) (Cymru) 2005.

The Presiding Officer: Are there any objections to the draft business statement? I see that there are at least 10 objections, so I ask the Minister to formally propose the business statement, and, under Standing Order No. 5.4, I call one Member from each political group to respond briefly.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiau fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru'n derbyn y datganiad busnes.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Mae'r Llywodraeth yn ceisio dal ei thir yn wyneb yr ymyriad diweddaraf gan Charles Clarke ynghylch ad-drefnu'r gwasanaeth heddlu, ond rhaid ichi dderbyn ein gair ni, Drefnydd, ein bod ni fel aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau'n ystyried ei ymyriad diweddaraf yn sarhad ar bobl Cymru. Mae wedi dechrau gweithdrefn ymgynghori, ond, ar ei chanol, mae wedi dweud wrthym pa ddewis sydd orau ganddo. Mae hynny'n amlygu agwedd ddideimlad at y Cynulliad. Dylai'r Cynulliad gael ei drin gyda mwy o barch na hynny gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Deallaf fod datganiad i'w roi gan y Gweinidog eofn dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, ond rhaid inni gael dadl. Yr unig fodd y gall y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol ddatgan ar goedd sut y credwn y dylai'r heddlu gael ei drefnu yng Nghymru yw drwy gael dadl lawn. Deallaf fod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio'n ystyried gwahanol ddewisiadau, ond mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd yn rhy hwyr erbyn i'r pwyllgor roi ei adroddiad, gan ei bod yn amlwg nad yw'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn ymddiddori ym marn y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol. A wnewch ailfeddwl ynghylch y mater hwn, Drefnydd? Mae pobl Cymru'n disgwyl i'r Llywodraeth hon achub cam Cymru, yn hytrach na moesyngrymu i'r

Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn Llundain.

David Melding: The Home Secretary has taken the Henry Ford approach to this question—you can have anything that you want as long as it is one police force. Our genteel, seemly consultation process, through the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee, has now been completely stymied and fundamentally undermined. Unless we only want the outcome of one police force for the whole of Wales, we have to get our act together now, and debate an amendable motion now, so that we can speak up for the people of Wales. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: ‘Oh.’]

Kirsty Williams: It is all very well for Labour Members to groan, but the opposition parties have co-operated fully with the approach that the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration wished to pursue on this matter. We have engaged in that process of consultation. It was bad enough when the Secretary of State for Wales felt that he should put his oar in and prejudge the outcome of that consultation, but now Charles Clarke has done the same. I am not prepared to go back to my constituents and explain to them how one police force will benefit rural communities, where it is difficult enough to convince chief constables to put resources anyway, let alone convince a chief constable of a police force for the whole of Wales. We need the debate now, as has been said. We cannot support the business statement until we have the opportunity to debate this in the Chamber.

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): It is surprising to hear this response because we have the most robust Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, who immediately these proposals came before us—although it is a non-devolved issue—said, ‘I am going to go through the process that we have adopted, and that you have embraced in the Assembly, to ensure that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee gives full consideration to these proposals’. The proposals have more than one option, and I do not intend to pre-empt Edwina Hart’s statement. She has come here in good faith to give you a statement and to report on her

David Melding: Mae’r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi ystyried y mater hwn yn null Henry Ford—cewch unrhyw beth a fynnoch ar yr amod mai un heddlu ydyw. Mae ein proses ymgynghori weddus a syber, drwy’r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, wedi’i rhwystro’n llwyr a’i thanseilio’n sylfaenol. Oni bai mai un heddlu i Gymru gyfan yw’r unig ganlyniad a ddymunwn, rhaid inni gael trefn ar bethau’n awr, a chael dadl ar gynnig y gellir ei ddiwygio’n awr, fel y gallwn godi llais dros bobl Cymru. [AELODAU’R CYNULLIAD: ‘O.’]

Kirsty Williams: Mae’n ddigon hawdd i Aelodau Llafur gwynfan, ond mae’r gwrthbleidiau wedi cydweithredu’n llwyr â’r dull yr oedd y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio’n dymuno ei ddilyn ar y mater hwn. Yr ydym wedi cymryd rhan yn y broses ymgynghori honno. Yr oedd yn ddigon drwg pan farnodd Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru y dylai roi ei big i mewn a rhagfarnu canlyniad yr ymgynghoriad hwnnw, ond bellach mae Charles Clarke wedi gwneud yr un peth. Nid wyf yn barod i fynd yn ôl at fy etholwyr ac esbonio iddynt sut y bydd un heddlu o fantais i gymunedau gwledig, gan ei bod yn ddigon anodd perswadio prif gwnstablaid i ddyrannu adnoddau fel y mae, heb sôn am berswadio prif gwnstabl heddlu ar gyfer Cymru gyfan. Rhaid inni gael y ddatl yn awr, fel y dywedwyd. Ni allwn gefnogi’r datganiad busnes hyd nes y cawn gyfle i gael dadl ar hyn yn y Siambr.

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Syndod yw clywed yr ymateb hwn gan fod gennym Weinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio sydd gyda’r mwyaf cadarn, a ddywedodd ar unwaith, pan ddaeth y cynigion hyn ger ein bron—er nad yw’n fater sydd wedi’i ddatganoli—‘Yr wyf am ddilyn y broses yr ydym wedi’i mabwysiadu, ac yr ydych wedi’i derbyn yn y Cynulliad, i sicrhau bod y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio’n rhoi pob ystyriaeth i’r cynigion hyn’. Mae’r cynigion yn rhoi mwy nag un dewis, ac nid wyf yn bwriadu achub y blaen ar ddatganiad Edwina Hart. Daeth yma gyda phob ewyllys da i roi datganiad i chi ac

discussions and on the work of the committee, which is, in due process, receiving representation— [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. I wish to hear the Minister reply to the debate on the Business Statement.

Jane Hutt: The committee is receiving representations and it is doing the job that it set out to do. We must go through this process in terms of handling those proposals. The debate on the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's report is tabled, as you know, for 6 December. During that debate, the Minister will be responding—she will not wait for six weeks to do so. Following that debate, the recommendations and views of the committee, and the expression of the Assembly, will be fed back to Charles Clarke. Finally, the Welsh Assembly Government will be bringing the issues back for a full, amendable Government debate at the earliest opportunity in the new year. I am sure that that will meet your requirements, and it will be in line with our agreed procedures and processes.

adrodd ar ei thrafodaethau ac ar waith y pwyllgor sydd, yn ôl y drefn briodol, yn cymryd sylwadau— [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Dymunaf glywed y Trefnydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl ar y Datganiad Busnes.

Jane Hutt: Mae'r pwyllgor yn cymryd sylwadau ac mae'n gwneud y gwaith yr aeth ati i'w wneud. Rhaid inni ddilyn y broses hon o drafod y cynigion hynny. Mae'r ddadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio wedi'i chyflwyno, fel y gwyddoch, ar gyfer 6 Rhagfyr. Yn ystod y ddadl honno, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymateb—ni wnaiff aros am chwe wythnos i wneud hynny. Ar ôl y ddadl honno, bydd argymhellion a barn y pwyllgor, a safbwynt y Cynulliad, yn cael eu cyfleu i Charles Clarke. Yn olaf, bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n dwyn y materion hyn gerbron eto ar gyfer dadl lawn ar gynnig y gellir ei ddiwygio yn amser y Llywodraeth cyn gynted ag y bo modd yn y flwyddyn newydd. Yr wyf yn siŵr y bydd hynny'n ateb eich gofynion, a bydd yn unol â'r gweithdrefnau a'r prosesau yr ydym wedi cytuno arnynt.

Cynnig: O blaid 28, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.

Motion: For 28, Abstain 0, Against 29.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Cairns, Alun
Davies, David
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Law, Peter
Lloyd, David
Marek, John
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John

Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig.
Motion defeated.*

Datganiad am Newidiadau Arfaethedig i Strwythur yr Heddlu yng Nghymru Statement on Proposed Changes to the Police Forces in Wales

The Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration (Edwina Hart): I do not know whether I will make a feisty or robust statement, but I will make a statement. [*Interruption.*]

The Presiding Officer: Order. Whatever it is, Minister, I will ensure that you are heard in silence.

Edwina Hart: I felt it was important to make a further statement on the possible restructuring of the police in Wales. It would be helpful for me to remind Members of the process for considering the options for the future structures for police in Wales and to explain where we currently are in that process. The Home Secretary's letter of 22 September to the chairs of police authorities and to chief constables clearly sets out the process for consultation with the police, which involves three stages. We have only just completed the first stage of that process, so the matter is far from settled. In my statement on 28 September, I referred to a letter that I had received from the Home Secretary, stating that he would welcome the Assembly's views on the 'Closing the Gap' report and our involvement in the consultation process.

When I met the Home Secretary on 23 October, we discussed the timetable for the review that the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee was undertaking on behalf of the Assembly. While the Home Secretary was unable to extend the timetable for the submission of the Committee's review, he fully appreciated that the preparation of the report was a very important part of the consultation process in Wales. In accordance with the timetable for the first stage, the chairs of police authorities and chief officers undertook an initial

Y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio (Edwina Hart): Ni wn a fyddaf yn gwneud datganiad eofn neu gadarn, ond gwnaaf ddatganiad. [*Torri ar draws.*]

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Pa beth bynnag a fydd, Weinidog, sicrhaf y gwrandewir arnoch mewn distawrwydd.

Edwina Hart: Yr oeddwn yn teimlo ei bod yn bwysig rhoi datganiad pellach ar yr ad-drefnu posibl ar yr heddlu yng Nghymru. Byddai'n fuddiol imi atgoffa'r Aelodau am y broses ar gyfer ystyried y dewisiadau ar gyfer strwythurau'r heddlu yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol ac esbonio lle'r ydym arni yn y broses honno ar hyn o bryd. Mae llythyr yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref a anfonwyd ar 22 Medi at gadeiryddion awdurdodau heddlu ac at brif gwnstablaiad yn egluro'r broses ar gyfer ymgynghori â'r heddlu, sydd yn cynnwys tair rhan. Newydd gwblhau rhan gyntaf y broses honno yr ydym, felly mae'r mater ymhell o fod wedi'i benderfynu. Yn fy natganiad ar 28 Medi, cyfeiriais at lythyr a gefais oddi wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, yn datgan y byddai'n falch o gael barn y Cynulliad am yr adroddiad 'Closing the Gap' ac o'n gweld yn cymryd rhan yn y broses ymgynghori.

Pan gyfarfûm â'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ar 23 Hydref, trafodasom yr amserlen ar gyfer yr adolygiad yr oedd y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio'n ei gynnal ar ran y Cynulliad. Er nad oedd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn gallu ymestyn yr amserlen ar gyfer cyflwyno adolygiad y Pwyllgor, yr oedd yn llwyr sylweddoli bod y gwaith o baratoi'r adroddiad yn rhan bwysig iawn o'r broses ymgynghori yng Nghymru. Yn unol â'r amserlen ar gyfer y rhan gyntaf, ymgymerodd cadeiryddion yr awdurdodau heddlu a'r prif swyddogion â dadansoddiad

analysis of options for the future structure of police forces in Wales and produced an emerging findings note, which was sent to the Home Secretary at the end of last month. Members of the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee are aware, from the evidence given to the committee by chairs of police authorities and chief constables on 2 November that, according to the initial appraisal work, the single force for Wales scored most highly of the options. However, the chairs and chief officers were absolutely clear that there remained much work to do under stage two of the process on each of the options they had considered before finally identifying the preferred option.

3.30 p.m.

While the press notice issued by the Home Office states that the single force option has emerged most strongly in stage one, this should not be a surprise given the information that has been submitted to it so far. The important point to stress, however, is that stage 1 is exactly what it says it is—the first stage in a three-stage process. Indeed, the Home Secretary sought to assure me again yesterday that no decision has been taken for Wales. He is anxious not to pre-empt the results of the inquiry by the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. He was also keen to emphasise that it remains a matter for individual police authorities to determine which option to propose in December.

I took the opportunity to discuss the next steps in the process with the chief constables when I met them yesterday. I can confirm that, in line with their statements at committee, the chief constables and the chairs of the police authorities in Wales are continuing to examine three options, which were set out in the evidence that they provided to the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee. Those three options are: no change from the existing four-force structure, with North Wales forging stronger links with Cheshire; a two-force structure, involving the merger of the South

dechreuol o'r dewisiadau ar gyfer strwythur heddluoedd yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol a pharatoi nodyn ar y canfyddiadau a oedd yn dod i'r golwg, a anfonwyd at yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ddiwedd y mis diwethaf. Gŵyr aelodau'r Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, yn ôl y dystiolaeth a roddwyd i'r pwyllgor gan gadeiryddion awdurdodau heddlu a phrif gwnstabiliaid ar 2 Tachwedd, mai'r dewis a gafodd y sgôr uchaf, yn ôl y gwaith arfarnu dechreuol, oedd un heddlu i Gymru. Er hynny, yr oedd y cadeiryddion a'r prif swyddogion yn gwbl bendant bod llawer o waith i'w wneud eto yn ail gam y broses ar bob un o'r dewisiadau yr oeddent wedi'u hystyried cyn penderfynu pa ddewis sydd orau ganddynt yn y diwedd.

Er bod yr hysbysiad i'r wasg a gyhoeddwyd gan y Swyddfa Gartref yn datgan mai un heddlu yw'r dewis sydd ar y blaen yn y cam cyntaf, ni ddylai hynny beri syndod o ystyried y wybodaeth sydd wedi'i chyflwyno iddi hyd yma. Y pwynt pwysig y dylid ei bwysleisio, fodd bynnag, yw mai dyna'n union ydyw cam 1—y cam cyntaf mewn proses tri cham. Yn wir, yr oedd ar yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref eisiau fy sicrhau eto ddoe na wnaethpwyd dim penderfyniad ar gyfer Cymru. Yr oedd yn awyddus iawn i beidio ag achub y blaen ar ganlyniadau'r ymchwiliad gan y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Yr oedd hefyd yn awyddus i bwysleisio mai mater i'r awdurdodau heddlu unigol o hyd yw penderfynu pa opsiwn i'w gynnig ym mis Rhagfyr.

Achubais ar y cyfle i drafod y camau nesaf yn y broses gyda'r prif gwnstabiliaid pan gyfarfûm â hwy ddoe. Gallaf gadarnhau bod y prif gwnstabiliaid a chadeiryddion awdurdodau'r heddlu yng Nghymru, yn unol â'u datganiadau yn y pwyllgor, yn parhau i archwilio tri opsiwn, opsiynau a nodwyd yn y dystiolaeth a roddasant gerbron y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio. Y tri opsiwn hynny yw: dim newid i'r strwythur pedwar heddlu presennol, gyda Gogledd Cymru yn meithrin cysylltiadau cryfach gyda Swydd Gaer; strwythur dau heddlu, sy'n golygu uno heddlu De Cymru a heddlu

Wales and Gwent forces and of Dyfed-Powys and North Wales; and a single force for Wales. The police are now consulting with the public and their partners on all three options. The police authorities will consider the more detailed information and costings that are currently being worked up before they take a view on which is the preferred option in early December. As you can see, this matter is far from settled.

My purpose in making this statement today is to ensure that, at the Assembly, we do not lose sight of the need to continue to carefully consider what the best structure for the police force in Wales is and to press our case with the Home Office. As I have already made clear, I believe that it is important that any new structure paves the way for what could be the future devolution of policing in Wales and also ensures that there are strong links with our local communities. The Home Secretary said again to me yesterday that he would welcome our views on the democratic structure that will underpin any new force or forces in Wales, and it is crucial that we take this opportunity to make our views known.

The time for us to respond on these matters is very short. We need to face up to the fact that, while the Home Secretary is keen for us to be a part of the consultation process, he is determined to stick to the timetable that he has set out. Instead of speculating on what decisions have or have not been taken, I suggest that we concentrate our efforts on forming our views on these important issues to ensure that we have a say in this crucial debate on the future of policing in Wales.

Leanne Wood: In the first meeting at which the Social Justice and Regeneration Committee's review into police restructuring was discussed, I asked the Chair whether we were about to engage in a worthwhile exercise or whether we would be wasting our time. At that time, the Chair said that she would be deeply unhappy if she felt that we were wasting our time.

Gwent, a Dyfed-Powys a Gogledd Cymru; ac un heddlu i Gymru. Mae'r heddlu yn awr yn ymgynghori â'r cyhoedd a'u partneriaid ynghylch y tri opsiwn hyn. Bydd awdurdodau'r heddlu yn ystyried y wybodaeth fanylach a'r costau sydd yn cael eu cyfrifo ar hyn o bryd cyn iddynt farnu pa un yw'r opsiwn sy'n cael ei ffafrio ddechrau Rhagfyr. Fel y gwelwch, mae'r mater hwn ymhell o gael ei ddatrys.

Fy niben wrth wneud y datganiad hwn heddiw yw sicrhau nad ydym, fel Cynulliad, yn colli golwg ar yr angen i barhau i ystyried yn ofalus pa un yw'r strwythur gorau ar gyfer yr heddlu yng Nghymru a dadlau ein hachos gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref. Fel yr wyf wedi ei gwneud yn glir eisoes, credaf ei bod yn bwysig bod unrhyw strwythur newydd yn paratoi'r ffordd ar gyfer yr hyn a allai fod yn ddatganoli plismona yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol a hefyd yn sicrhau bod cysylltiadau cryf gyda'n cymunedau lleol. Dywedodd yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref unwaith eto ddoe y byddai'n croesawu ein barn am y strwythur democrataidd a fydd yn sylfaen i unrhyw heddlu neu heddluoedd newydd yng Nghymru, ac mae'n hanfodol inni achub ar y cyfle hwn i leisio ein barn.

Mae'r amser sydd gennym i ymateb i'r materion hyn yn brin iawn. Rhaid inni wynebu'r ffaith, er bod yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn awyddus inni fod yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori, ei fod yn benderfynol o lynu wrth yr amserlen y mae wedi ei phennu. Yn hytrach na dyfalu ynghylch pa benderfyniadau a wnaethpwyd neu na wnaethpwyd, awgrymaf ein bod yn canolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar lunio ein barn am y materion pwysig hyn er mwyn sicrhau bod gennym lais yn y ddadl hollbwysig hon am ddyfodol plismona yng Nghymru.

Leanne Wood: Yn y cyfarfod cyntaf pryd y trafodwyd adolygiad y Pwyllgor Cyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio o ailstrwythuro'r heddlu, gofynnais i'r Cadeirydd a oeddem ar fin ymroi i ymarferiad gwerth chweil ynteu ai gwastraffu ein hamser a fyddem. Bryd hynny, dywedodd y Cadeirydd y byddai'n anhapus dros ben pe teimlai ein bod yn gwastraffu ein hamser.

Charles Clarke's announcement last week shows utter contempt for the Assembly and for Wales as a whole. He may have told you that he is prepared to consider other options, but, frankly, given last week's announcement, I find that highly unlikely. We in Plaid Cymru have been of the view all along that police services should be devolved to Wales. This reorganisation is meant to equip the police to better deal with cross-border crime and terrorism. Having two emergency services devolved to the Assembly and one not devolved does not bode well for a joined-up Government response to any new threats that we might face.

Scotland is not reorganising its police forces. Does this mean that the terrorist threat does not exist in the same way in Scotland? Scottish politicians are deciding the way forward in Scotland, so, surely, it makes sense for Welsh politicians to decide the way forward in Wales.

This episode has shown utter contempt from the Westminster Government; it talks of Wales as being a 'region' and it has made this decision without being prepared to wait for our views on the matter. The question to you, Minister, is whether your Government has the guts to stand up for Wales on this issue, or will it cave in and agree to what the Home Secretary wants?

Edwina Hart: I still believe that it is a worthwhile exercise to try to take evidence from across Wales, and for the committee to produce a report. That report will be debated in this Chamber, and it was my intention to respond to that report and to send it to Charles Clarke as the views of the National Assembly for Wales, if it gained consensus across the four parties.

I am acutely aware that this is not a devolved matter; if it were, we would be going about things in a slightly different way if we were discussing reconfigurations and various other issues. However, Leanne, we are where we are. For me, the ultimate game plan must be that, whatever comes out of this, we have a

Mae cyhoeddiad Charles Clarke yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos dirmyg llwyr tuag at y Cynulliad a thuag at Gymru gyfan. Efallai ei fod wedi dweud wrthyech ei fod yn barod i ystyried opsiynau eraill, ond, o ystyried y cyhoeddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, credaf fod hynny'n gwbl annhebygol. Yn ôl ein barn ni ym Mhlaid Cymru ar hyd yr amser, dylai'r gwasanaethau heddlu gael eu datganoli i Gymru. Bwriedir i'r ad-drefnu hwn arfogi'r heddlu i ddelio'n well â therfysgaeth a throseddau trawsffiniol. Nid yw dau wasanaeth brys sydd wedi eu datganoli i'r Cynulliad ac un sydd heb ei ddatganoli yn argoeli'n dda ar gyfer ymateb gydgyssylltiedig gan y Llywodraeth i unrhyw fygythiadau newydd y gallem fod yn eu hwynebu.

Nid yw'r Alban yn ad-drefnu ei heddluoedd. A yw hyn yn golygu nad yw'r bygythiad oddi wrth derfysgwyr yn bodoli yn yr un modd yn yr Alban? Gwleidyddion yr Alban sy'n penderfynu ar y ffordd ymlaen yn yr Alban, felly, yn ddiamau, mae'n gwneud synnwyr i wleidyddion Cymru benderfynu ar y ffordd ymlaen yng Nghymru.

Mae hyn wedi dangos dirmyg llwyr o du Llywodraeth San Steffan; mae'n cyfeirio at Gymru fel 'rhanbarth' ac mae wedi gwneud y penderfyniad hwn heb fod yn barod i aros nes cael ein barn ni ar y mater. Y cwestiwn i chi, Weinidog, ydyw a oes gan eich Llywodraeth ddigon o asgwrn cefn i sefyll yn y bwlech dros Gymru ynghylch y mater hwn, ynteu a fydd yn ildio ac yn cydsynio â'r hyn sydd ar yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref ei eisiau?

Edwina Hart: Yr wyf yn dal i gredu ei fod yn ymarferiad gwerth chweil ceisio cymryd tystiolaeth o bob cwr o Gymru, ac i'r pwyllgor lunio adroddiad. Caiff yr adroddiad hwnnw ei drafod yn y Siambr hon, a'm bwriad oedd ymateb i'r adroddiad hwnnw a'i anfon at Charles Clarke fel barn Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, pe byddai'n sicrhau consensws gan y pedair plaid.

Yr wyf yn dra ymwybodol nad yw hwn yn fater datganoledig; pe byddai, byddem yn mynd i'r afael â phethau mewn ffordd ychydig yn wahanol pe byddem yn trafod ailgyflunio ac amrywiol faterion eraill. Serch hynny, Leanne, hon yw'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni. Y nod yn y pen draw yn ddiamau, i mi, beth

structure that is fit for purpose, so that communities can believe in it. It is also important that it is fit for purpose for the future devolution of the police service. We must not take our eye off the ball now, however agitated we might be and however much we might dislike the language of a Home Office announcement and a press release. I have to recognise that Charles Clarke has written to me about the issues, and I believe that he has done so in good faith. He has indicated to me that he wants this report and he is prepared to consider it. I have to take that on board as he has given it to me. I had a meeting with him and I did not sense that he did not want to take our views into account.

We also have to be acutely aware, Leanne, that the views expressed in another place will also be taken into account. The Welsh MPs are discussing the matter and, across the board, they have particular views about whether the police should be devolved and what will happen to the structures. We have to be aware of that. Therefore, I say to you, we can get the anger and frustration out today, but let us not take our eye off the ball.

I understand that the committee is doing a good job in taking evidence—it is likely to reach a conclusion—therefore let me then put that to Charles Clarke. I am not saying that we will win the day, because the day that we have to win might not be next year, but in a few years' time, when we will have a structure that could then be satisfactorily devolved to us.

Nick Bourne: Minister, the business statement was defeated today for one simple reason, which is that we need an urgent debate in the Chamber on the police force merger. I hope that that has been taken on board by the Government. I think that people are comfortable with the committee looking at the issue, but, given the timescale that has been announced, we know that we have to give the corporate view of all Assembly Members quickly, which means everyone

bynag a ddeillia o hyn, yw bod gennym strwythur sy'n addas at ei ddiben, fel y gall cymunedau ymddiried ynndo. Mae hefyd yn bwysig iddo fod yn addas at ei ddiben ar gyfer datganoli gwasanaeth yr heddlu i'r dyfodol. Rhaid inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y nod yn awr, ni waeth pa mor anniddig ydym, na pha mor anhapus ydym gyda iaith datganiad i'r wasg a chyhoeddiad gan y Swyddfa Gartref. Rhaid imi gydnabod bod Charles Clarke wedi ysgrifennu ataf ynghylch y materion dan sylw, a chredaf ei fod wedi gwneud hynny gyda phob ewyllys da. Mae wedi cyfleu wrthyf fod arno eisiau'r adroddiad hwn a'i fod yn barod i'w ystyried. Rhaid imi dderbyn hynny fel y mae wedi dweud hynny wrthyf. Cefais gyfarfod gydag ef ac ni synhwyras nad oedd am ystyried ein barn.

Rhaid inni hefyd fod yn gwbl ymwybodol, Leanne, fod y safbwyntiau a fynegwyd mewn man arall hefyd yn cael eu hystyried. Mae'r ASau Cymreig yn trafod y mater ac, yn gyffredinol, mae ganddynt safbwyntiau penodol ynghylch a ddylai'r heddlu gael eu datganoli a beth a fydd yn digwydd i'r strwythurau. Rhaid inni fod yn ymwybodol o hynny. Felly, meddaf wrthyf, cawn wyntyllu'r dicter a'r rhwystredigaeth heddiw, ond gadewch inni beidio â cholli golwg ar y nod.

Deallaf fod y pwyllgor yn gwneud gwaith da wrth gymryd tystiolaeth—mae'n debygol o ddod i gasgliad—felly gadewch imi roi hynny gerbron Charles Clarke. Nid wyf yn dweud y byddwn yn ennill y dydd, oherwydd y mae'n bosibl na ddaw'r dydd y mae'n rhaid inni ei ennill y flwyddyn nesaf, ond ymhen rhai blynyddoedd, pan fydd gennym strwythur a allai wedyn gael ei ddatganoli yn foddhaol inni.

Nick Bourne: Weinidog, trechwyd y datganiad busnes heddiw am un rheswm syml, sef am fod angen inni gynnal dadl frys yn y Siambr ynghylch uno'r heddluoedd. Gobeithiaf fod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn hynny. Credaf fod pobl yn gyfforddus gyda'r ffaith bod y pwyllgor yn edrych ar y mater, ond, o ystyried yr amserlen a gyhoeddwyd, gwyddom fod yn rhaid inni roi barn gorfforaethol holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn gyflym, ac mae hyn yn golygu rhoi'r cyfle i

having the opportunity to speak on what is an issue of crucial importance. I know that the issue is not devolved, but because you have many dealings with the police—you also command broad support across the Chamber in much that you do—you will know that a lot of what we do impacts on law and order, policing, drugs issues and so on. Therefore, it is vital that we express a view. It is only a view, but it needs to be clear.

Although we welcome what the committee is doing, it should not be just the committee working on this matter, but the committee work could continue in parallel. It is important that we have an early and urgent debate, and I hope that the Minister will recognise that and indicate that she thinks that it would be valuable. That might strengthen her hand because she has indicated that there has been an exchange of words—with her feisty and robust reputation preceding her, no doubt—therefore I do not doubt that she has told the Home Secretary, and perhaps even the Secretary of State for Wales, that this body should be able to express a view. These are important issues, and I think that it is important that we get in at ground level and express our views early on.

You referred in your statement to the importance of forming our views, and I think that that means all of us, not just the committee. I welcome the statement insofar as it goes, but we only have a brief window of opportunity, as an Assembly, to get our views across. I think that it is important that we do that quickly, and that means a full debate, if not this week, then certainly next week, on the issue. I would welcome the Minister's response to that.

Edwina Hart: This is a matter for the Business Minister because of the pressure of business on the schedule. However, I know that the Business Minister noted all your comments.

In the spirit that you made your comments, you were right to say that what happens to policing is essential to many of our policies. We have relationships with the police across a whole range of agenda issues, particularly

bawb siarad am rywbeth sy'n fater o bwysigrwydd mawr. Gwn nad yw'n fater datganoledig, ond oherwydd eich bod yn cael llawer o gyswllt gyda'r heddlu—yr ydych hefyd yn derbyn cefnogaeth eang ar draws y Siambr gyda llawer a wnewch—gwyddoch fod llawer o'r hyn a wnawn yn effeithio ar gyfraith a threfn, plismona, problemau cyffuriau ac yn y blaen. Felly, mae'n hanfodol inni fynegi safbwynt. Safbwynt yn unig ydyw, ond rhaid iddo fod yn glir.

Er ein bod yn croesawu'r hyn a wna'r pwyllgor, nid y pwyllgor yn unig a ddylai fod yn gweithio ar y mater hwn, ond gallai gwaith y pwyllgor barhau yn gyfochrog â hyn. Mae'n bwysig inni gael dadl frys ar fyrder, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod hynny ac yn dangos ei bod yn credu y byddai hynny yn werthfawr. Mae'n bosibl y byddai hynny'n cryfhau ei sefyllfa oherwydd y mae wedi dweud bod ffeirio geiriau wedi bod—a'r enw sydd ganddi o fod yn eofn a chadarn wedi ei rhagflaenu, yn ddi-os—felly nid wyf yn amau nad yw wedi dweud wrth yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref, a hyd yn oed Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, y dylai'r corff hwn allu mynegi barn. Mae'r rhain yn faterion pwysig, a chredaf ei bod yn bwysig inni gamu i mewn yn y dechrau a mynegi ein barn yn fuan.

Cyfeiriasoch yn eich datganiad at bwysigrwydd llunio ein barn, a chredaf fod hynny'n golygu pawb ohonom, nid y pwyllgor yn unig. Croesawaf y datganiad cyn belled ag y mae'n mynd, ond nid oes gennym, fel Cynulliad, lawer o gyfle i gyfleu ein barn. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig inni wneud hynny yn gyflym, ac mae hynny'n golygu dadl lawn, os nad yr wythnos hon, yna yn bendant yr wythnos nesaf, ar y mater. Byddwn yn croesawu ymateb y Gweinidog i hynny.

Edwina Hart: Mater i'r Trefnydd yw hyn oherwydd y baich o ran busnes ar yr amserlen. Fodd bynnag, gwn fod y Trefnydd wedi nodi eich holl sylwadau.

Yn yr ysbryd y gwnaethoch eich sylwadau, yr oeddech yn iawn wrth ddweud bod yr hyn sy'n digwydd i blismona yn hanfodol i lawer o'n polisïau. Mae gennym berthynas â'r heddlu ar draws amrywiaeth o feysydd, yn

across my portfolio. What happens in terms of policing impacts a lot on my portfolio, so it is important that our views are taken into account.

As regards the Secretary of State for Wales, I have not had an opportunity to raise the matter with him, but I would be pleased to do so, if Members so wish. I think that there has to be an understanding in Wales that although this matter is not devolved, it is essential in relation to the issues that we are developing on drugs, substance misuse and other areas. It is important that our cross-party views are taken into account, so that anything that comes out of this report will be for future good. Nothing should come out of this that will undermine people's confidence in the police and some of the excellent arrangements that we now have in terms of community policing.

There must also be recognition of the differences across Wales. These must be taken into account. I am not saying that one police force could not achieve that, but what democratic structures would be underneath that, if it did come about, for people to be certain that their views would be taken into account and what would happen in terms of real policing? All these issues are worthy of being discussed in the Assembly.

3.40 p.m.

Mick Bates: I am sure that we all have some sympathy for you today, as you try to defend the indefensible. There are two issues that have already emerged in the evidence that the committee has gathered. One is haste and the democratic deficit that that is leading to. It was clear that, in some of these models, the 22 local authorities would not have any democratic route by which their voice would be heard in the police authorities. Can you give us some insight into the type of conversations that you have had with your colleagues in Westminster as to how that democratic deficit will be resolved? We understand the democratic deficit that exists between Westminster and ourselves, and we know that you are quite robust—I think that that is the word that has been used—or feisty, or even, at times, dare I say it, slightly

enwedig ar draws fy mhortffolio i. Mae'r hyn sy'n digwydd o safbwynt plismona yn effeithio llawer ar fy mhortffolio, felly mae'n bwysig i'n barn gael ei hystyried.

O safbwynt Ysgrifennydd Gwladol Cymru, ni chefais gyfle i godi'r mater gydag ef, ond byddwn yn falch o wneud hynny, os yw'r Aelodau yn dymuno hynny. Credaf fod yn rhaid cael dealltwriaeth yng Nghymru er nad yw'r mater hwn wedi ei ddatganoli, ei fod yn fater hollbwysig o safbwynt y materion yr ydym yn eu datblygu ynghylch cyffuriau, camddefnyddio sylweddau a meysydd eraill. Mae'n bwysig i'n barn drawsbleidiol gael ei hystyried, fel bod unrhyw beth a ddeillia o'r adroddiad hwn er lles i'r dyfodol. Ni ddylai dim byd ddeillio o hyn a fydd yn tanseilio hyder pobl yn yr heddlu nac yn rhai o'r trefniadau ardderchog sydd gennym yn awr o safbwynt plismona cymunedol.

Rhaid cael cydnabyddiaeth hefyd o'r gwahaniaethau ar draws Cymru. Rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth i'r rhain. Nid wyf yn dweud na allai un heddlu wneud hynny, ond pa strwythurau democrataidd a fyddai oddi tan hynny, pe byddai'n cael ei wireddu, i bobl fod yn bendant y rhoddid ystyriaeth i'w safbwyntiau, a beth a fyddai'n digwydd o safbwynt plismona gwirioneddol? Mae'r holl faterion hyn yn haeddu cael eu trafod yn y Cynulliad.

Mick Bates: Yr wyf yn sicr bod gennym oll ryw gymaint o gydymdeimlad â chi heddiw, wrth ichi geisio amddiffyn yr hyn nad oes modd ei amddiffyn. Mae dwy ystyriaeth sydd eisoes wedi dod i'r amlwg yn y dystiolaeth a gasglodd y pwyllgor. Brys a'r diffyg democrataidd y mae hyn yn arwain ato yw un. Yr oedd yn amlwg, yn rhai o'r modelau hyn, na fyddai gan y 22 awdurdod lleol lwybr democrataidd ar gyfer lleisio eu barn o fewn awdurdodau'r heddlu. A allwch roi inni ryw gipolwg ar y math o sgysiau a gawsoch gyda'ch cyd-aelodau yn San Steffan ynghylch sut y gwneir iawn am y diffyg democrataidd hwn? Deallwn y diffyg democrataidd sy'n bodoli rhwng San Steffan a ni, a gwyddom eich bod yn eithaf cadarn—credaf mai hwnnw yw'r gair a ddefnyddiwyd—neu eofn, neu hyd yn oed, ar

aggressive in your desire to take on more powers for this institution. *[Interruption.]* Sorry, I withdraw the word 'aggressive'.

The Presiding Officer: Order. The Minister is a most pleasant person, in my experience.

Mick Bates: I withdraw the word 'aggressive' and replace it with 'assertive'. *[Interruption.]*

The Presiding Officer: Order. I would like Mick Bates to ask his questions.

Mick Bates: Thank you.

The second issue that emerged in the evidence is that of cost. Of course, we may be led to believe that the three options presented to us are cost neutral, but it has emerged that the potential increase in the business plans is already of the order of an additional £57 million. This substantial amount of money, as it appears to many, would be spent on an unnecessary reorganisation. Do you not think, Minister, that it may be better to provide us with more police with that £57 million, or more community support officers? I have spoken to a great many serving officers whose morale is being lowered by their not being part of this consultative process, and there are severe concerns about the impact on morale and the possible loss of services. An issue that has been raised with me is that this review, 'Closing the Gap', is actually widening the gap, because, on average, our forces already perform better than those in England. You have to answer the fundamental question as to why such radical reforms as proposed in two of the options are necessary at all.

Edwina Hart: I concur with Mick that this is all quite quick, and I have made my views about that known, in that we needed a longer period for consultation, but this is the timetable that the Home Secretary has decided upon. I am aware of some of the cost issues, and I have raised financial issues in this respect.

adegau, a feiddiaf ei ddweud, ychydig yn ymosodol yn eich awydd i gael rhagor o bwerau i'r sefydliad hwn. *[Torri ar draws.]* Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, tynnaf y gair 'ymosodol' yn ôl.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Mae'r Gweinidog yn berson tra dymunol, yn ôl fy mhrofiad i.

Mick Bates: Tynnaf y gair 'ymosodol' yn ôl a rhoddaf 'pendant' yn ei le. *[Torri ar draws.]*

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hoffwn i Mick Bates ofyn ei gwestiwn.

Mick Bates: Diolch yn fawr.

Yr ail fater a ddaeth i'r amlwg yn y dystiolaeth yw'r gost. Wrth gwrs, mae'n bosibl y cawn ein harwain i gredu bod y tri opsiwn a gyflwynir inni yn niwtral o ran cost, ond daeth i'r amlwg bod y cynnydd posibl yn y cynlluniau busnes eisoes tua £57 miliwn yn ychwanegol. Byddai'r swm sylweddol hwn o arian, fel yr ymddengys i lawer, yn cael ei wario ar ad-drefnu diangen. Oni chredwch, Weinidog, y byddai efallai'n well rhoi inni ragor o heddlu gyda'r £57 miliwn hwnnw, neu ragor o swyddogion cymorth cymunedol? Yr wyf wedi siarad â llawer iawn o blismyn sy'n gweithio, sy'n gwangalonni rhywfaint oherwydd nad ydynt yn rhan o'r broses ymgynghori hon, a cheir pryderon difrifol am yr effaith ar forâl pobl a'r gwasanaethau a gollir o bosibl. Un mater a godwyd gyda mi yw bod yr adolygiad hwn, 'Closing the Gap', mewn gwirionedd yn lledaenu'r bwlch, oherwydd bod ein heddluoedd, ar gyfartaledd, eisoes yn perfformio'n well na'r rhai yn Lloegr. Rhaid ichi ateb y cwestiwn sylfaenol pam mae diwygiadau mor radical ag a gynigir mewn dau o'r opsiynau yn angenrheidiol o gwbl.

Edwina Hart: Cytunaf gyda Mick fod hyn oll wedi digwydd yn eithaf sydyn, ac yr wyf wedi cyfleu fy marn am hynny, o ran bod arnom angen cyfnod hwy i ymgynghori, ond hon yw'r amserlen y mae'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref wedi penderfynu arni. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o rai o'r ystyriaethau o ran y gost, ac yr wyf wedi codi materion ariannol yn y cyswllt hwn.

However, in terms of reorganisation, there will never be a right time to discuss it if you have a vested interest in something. The same was probably true in the 1960s, when they last reorganised police and so on, and the same siren voices will be heard today. We know from our own lives, from reorganisations that have occurred in companies where we have worked, that we all say, 'Oh, this is going to be a disaster', because, ultimately, you are always thinking a little bit about yourself and your colleagues, and you perhaps do not have the full picture. We are where we are, I am afraid, Mick, and, ultimately, we have to present our views as best we can on the key issues that affect us, and I still believe that the key issues for us are those of the nature of community policing and the type of response that the public expects to receive. Ultimately, what most people want from the police service is a police officer when they want one.

Sandy Mewies: I know that you, Minister, as is the committee Chair and the committee members, are of the mind that this will be a meaningful consultation. I have already raised with you the issues of a north Wales regional identity and the concerns, among other matters, with regard to community policing. I was therefore glad to hear you say that there is still an opportunity for forces to put forward the options of their desire to the Home Secretary.

Another issue of concern is the funding of police forces. Do you, as I do, see this as an opportunity to look, perhaps in future, at the way in which police forces are funded? In committee, I was glad to hear the statement that noted that it will not matter, whatever happens in future, in north Wales in particular, as arrangements that have existed in the past between Cheshire and Merseyside, for example, will be maintained, because this has been a concern for people who thought that that would not be the case.

Finally, I totally agree with you, Minister, that, in future, we need to see the best

Fodd bynnag, o safbwynt ad-drefnu, ni fydd fyth amser iawn i'w drafod os oes ichi fudd o rywbeth. Yr oedd yr un peth yn wir o bosibl yn y 1960au, pan ad-drefnwyd yr heddlu ddiwethaf ac yn y blaen, a bydd yr un lleisiau croch i'w clywed heddiw. Gwyddom oddi wrth ein bywydau ein hunain, yn sgîl ad-drefnu a ddigwyddodd mewn cwmnïau yr ydym wedi gweithio ynddynt, ein bod oll yn dweud, 'O, bydd hyn yn drychineb', oherwydd, yn y pen draw, yr ydych bob amser yn meddwl ychydig amdanoch eich hun a'ch cydweithwyr, ac mae'n bosibl nad yw'r darlun cyflawn gennych. Dyma'r sefyllfa sydd ohoni, mae'n ddrwg gennyf, Mick, ac, yn y pen draw, rhaid inni gyflwyno ein safbwyntiau yn y ffordd orau posibl am y materion allweddol sy'n effeithio arnom, a chredaf o hyd mai'r materion allweddol i ni yw'r rhai ynghylch natur plismona cymunedol a'r math o ymateb y mae'r cyhoedd yn disgwyl ei gael gennym. Yn y pen draw, yr hyn y mae ar y rhan fwyaf o bobl ei eisiau oddi wrth wasanaeth yr heddlu yw bod plismon ar gael pan fydd angen un arnynt.

Sandy Mewies: Gwn eich bod chi, Weinidog, fel y mae Cadeirydd y pwyllgor ac aelodau'r pwyllgor, o'r farn y bydd hwn yn ymgynghoriad ystyrllon. Yr wyf eisoes wedi codi gyda chi'r cwestiynau'n ymwneud â hunaniaeth ranbarthol yn y Gogledd a'r pryderon, ymysg materion eraill, o safbwynt plismona cymunedol. Yr oeddwn felly yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud bod cyfle o hyd i heddluoedd gyflwyno'r opsiynau a ddymunant i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref.

Mater arall sy'n peri pryder yw ariannu heddluoedd. A ydych chi, fel finnau, yn gweld hyn yn gyfle i edrych, o bosibl yn y dyfodol, ar y ffordd yr ariennir heddluoedd? Yn y pwyllgor, yr oeddwn yn falch o glywed y datganiad a nodai na fydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth, beth bynnag a ddigwydd yn y dyfodol, yn y gogledd yn enwedig, oherwydd y bydd y trefniadau sydd wedi bodoli yn y gorffennol rhwng swydd Gaer a Glannau Mersi, er enghraifft, yn parhau, oherwydd y mae hyn wedi bod yn bryder i bobl a feddyliai nad felly y byddai.

Yn olaf, cytunaf yn llwyr â chi, Weinidog, fod angen inni weld yn y dyfodol, y

policing service for Wales at the right price. Like you, Minister, I hope that any development will be all for the good, and that people will see a better service, not a changed service.

Edwina Hart: I hope that a better service will emerge from any reforms that may occur, and perhaps a more transparent service. Your point on funding is well made—I would regard it as an opportunity to look at the funding issues for the police. At the end of the day, when you consider the burden on local taxpayers through the council tax precept, and the fact that it is not the same across Wales, you see that there are issues that need to be discussed, and perhaps a simpler system is needed for the public to understand how policing is funded. We should use this opportunity to raise those issues.

The links between north Wales, Cheshire and Merseyside will remain whatever happens, because those links are used in operations on drug trafficking and so on. The same arrangements will exist for the southern police forces in Wales, linking in to Avon and Somerset. Those are operational issues, and this change will not affect any of the operational arrangements on that type of level when you are fighting crime. It is important that people remember that.

I am aware of your views and those of north Wales Labour Members who have expressed their concerns to me regarding the north Wales identity, as well as concerns about the location of the headquarters, and so on. There is no reason why such things must not remain as they are if there are changes. If anything comes to fruition in terms of one or two police forces for Wales, we must look at these issues, and I hope that the Assembly will have a role to play in doing so, whether the service is devolved or not. It is the Assembly that links into the partnerships on a local level. It is the Assembly that understands the needs and requirements of individuals regarding policing.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: I thank the Minister for her statement—I have no doubt where her

gwasanaeth plismona gorau i Gymru am y pris cywir. Fel chi, Weinidog, gobeithiaf y bydd unrhyw ddatblygiad er lles ym mhob ffordd, ac y bydd pobl yn gweld gwell gwasanaeth, nid gwasanaeth sydd wedi newid.

Edwina Hart: Gobeithiaf y bydd gwell gwasanaeth yn deillio o unrhyw ddiwygiadau a wneir, a gwasanaeth mwy tryloyw efallai. Mae eich pwynt ynghylch cyllido yn un da—byddwn yn ei ystyried yn gyfle i edrych ar faterion yn ymwneud â chyllido'r heddlu. Yn y pen draw, wrth ystyried y baich ar drethdalwyr lleol drwy braesept y dreth gyngor, a'r ffaith nad yw'r un faint ar draws Cymru, gwelwch fod materion y mae angen eu trafod, ac efallai fod angen system symlach er mwyn i'r cyhoedd ddeall sut y cyllidir plismona. Dylem achub ar y cyfle hwn i godi'r materion hynny.

Bydd y cysylltiadau rhwng gogledd Cymru, swydd Gaer a Glannau Mersi yn parhau beth bynnag a ddigwydd, oherwydd defnyddir y cysylltiadau hynny mewn gweithrediadau yn ymwneud â masnachu mewn cyffuriau ac yn y blaen. Bydd yr un trefniadau yn bodoli i'r heddluoedd yn ne Cymru, yn cysylltu ag Avon a Gwlad yr Haf. Materion gweithredol yw'r rheini ac ni fydd hyn yn effeithio ar unrhyw drefniadau gweithredol ar y math hwnnw o lefel wrth ymladd trosedd. Mae'n bwysig i bobl gofio hynny.

Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'ch barn ac o farn yr Aelodau Llafur hynny o ogledd Cymru sydd wedi mynegi eu pryderon wrthyf ynghylch hunaniaeth gogledd Cymru, yn ogystal â phryderon am leoliad y pencadlys, ac yn y blaen. Nid oes dim rheswm pam na chaiff pethau o'r fath aros fel y maent os bydd newidiadau. Os ceir y maen i'r wal o ran un neu ddau heddlu i Gymru, rhaid inni edrych ar y materion hyn, a gobeithiaf y bydd gan y Cynulliad rôl i'w chwarae wrth wneud hynny, pa un a yw'r gwasanaeth wedi ei ddatganoli ai peidio. Y Cynulliad sy'n cysylltu â'r partneriaethau ar lefel leol. Y Cynulliad sy'n deall anghenion a gofynion unigolion o ran plismona.

Ieuan Wyn Jones: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am ei datganiad—nid oes gennyf amheuaeth

feelings lie on this issue. I am sure that she would want to see an entirely devolved policing structure in Wales, so that the National Assembly, in its own way, could make decisions about the future structure. The Minister tells us that we are where we are, but I am pretty sure that, given a blank sheet of paper, she and I would write virtually identical solutions for Wales, because there is a common interest to ensure effective policing in Wales.

As someone who has spent some time in Westminster, I know that whenever reforms were published in England on education or health they dealt with urban issues in England and were often unsuitable for a country such as Wales, which has a different geography and a different balance between rural and urban areas. The structures that happen in England are often totally unsuitable for Wales. Will the Minister make it clear to the Home Secretary that those wishes really must be taken into account under the new system? Given that the Minister has made it clear in her statement that she wants to see policing devolved to the National Assembly, why not let the people of Wales decide on the future of policing?

This debate is an effort to ensure that the Assembly as a body can put its views forward to the Home Secretary, which will undoubtedly help the Minister in her further discussions with Charles Clarke.

Edwina Hart: You are right to say that my aim in the long run—and I may make no secret of it—would be to devolve the police in Wales. However, I will not have the police devolved without the correct cash settlement and arrangements in terms of money, because that would be crucial. We do not want to do a disservice to the people of Wales by getting devolution on the cheap. When certain elements are devolved, we must ensure that we have the correct financial settlement, that it is the correct time to take it, and that we have the correct structures in place. You must put logic before your wishes on some of the issues, and certainly in terms of the police. We must look at this as a long-term aim for

sut y mae hi'n teimlo am y mater hwn. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddai am weld strwythur plismona sydd wedi ei ddatganoli'n llwyr yng Nghymru, fel y gallai'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, yn ei ffordd ei hun, wneud penderfyniadau am y strwythur i'r dyfodol. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym mai dyma sut y mae pethau, ond yr wyf yn bur siŵr y byddai hi a minnau, o gael dalen wag, yn ysgrifennu atebion a fyddai bron yn union yr un fath ar gyfer Cymru, oherwydd ein bod ein dau'n awyddus i sicrhau plismona effeithiol yng Nghymru.

Fel rhywun sydd wedi treulio peth amser yn San Steffan, gwn, pa bryd bynnag y câi diwygiadau eu cyhoeddi yn Lloegr ar addysg neu iechyd, eu bod yn delio â materion trefol yn Lloegr a'u bod yn aml yn anaddas i wlad fel Cymru, sydd â daearyddiaeth wahanol a chydbwysedd gwahanol rhwng ardaloedd gwledig a threfol. Mae'r strwythurau a geir yn Lloegr yn aml yn gwbl anaddas i Gymru. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ei gwneud yn glir i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref fod rhaid ystyried y dymuniadau hynny o ddifrif o dan y system newydd? O ystyried bod y Gweinidog wedi ei gwneud yn glir yn ei datganiad ei bod am weld plismona yn cael ei ddatganoli i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, pam na ellid gadael i bobl Cymru benderfynu ar ddyfodol plismona?

Ymgais yw'r ddadl hon i sicrhau bod y Cynulliad fel corff yn gallu cyflwyno ei farn i'r Ysgrifennydd Gwladol, a bydd hynny'n siŵr o fod yn help i'r Gweinidog yn ei thrafodaethau pellach gyda Charles Clarke.

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud mai fy nod yn y tymor hir—ac ni cheisiaf gelu hynny—fyddai datganoli'r heddlu yng Nghymru. Fodd bynnag, ni fynnwn i'r heddlu gael ei ddatganoli heb y setliad ariannol priodol a threfniadau priodol o safbwynt arian, oherwydd byddai hynny'n dyngedfennol. Nid ydym am wneud tro sâl â phobl Cymru drwy gael datganoli yn rhad. Pan gaiff rhai elfennau eu datganoli, rhaid inni sicrhau ein bod yn cael y setliad ariannol priodol, fod yr amser yn iawn i dderbyn y newid, a bod y strwythurau iawn gennym. Rhaid ichi roi rhesymeg o flaen eich dymuniadau ar rai o'r materion, ac yn sicr o ran yr heddlu. Rhaid inni edrych ar hyn fel

the National Assembly, and everything must be correct underneath it.

You are also right to say that reforms are sometimes done elsewhere on the basis of urban communities, which is why I have argued so strongly about the top-slicing and the police formula. When the funding is top-sliced for projects and criteria agreed by the Home Office, it is usually only South Wales Police that is entitled to bid, because it is the only police force broadly comparable to those in England. I have argued very strongly about that issue, in that there should not be that type of top-slicing of police funding on criteria agreed in England. If there are to be criteria on funds, we should have a role and function in deciding what the funds and criteria are.

3.50 p.m.

Our policing requirements in Barmouth or Carmarthen might be quite different to those in Liverpool, which is why it is important that we have these discussions and continue to press home those points, and, whatever happens on this, I will continue to do that. I have heard what you have said in the debate and I will discuss it with my colleague, the Business Minister.

Jeff Cuthbert: Putting aside the issue that this is not a devolved matter, do you agree that it is crucial that sufficient decentralisation to ensure that community policing is organised properly on the basis of local knowledge emerges from whatever the final decision is? The people in my constituency want that level of security in a police service to deal with the so-called low-level crime that blights far too many neighbourhoods in terms of anti-social behaviour.

Edwina Hart: Absolutely, when we are talking about the issues of structure, reform, and what might happen in devolution, we must always remember that the key person is the taxpayer who wants to know that they will have the service that you have talked about. Therefore, it is essential that we

nod hirdymor i'r Cynulliad, a rhaid i'r seiliau i gyd fod yn iawn.

Yr ydych yn llygad eich lle hefyd wrth ddweud bod diwygiadau'n digwydd mewn mannau eraill weithiau ar sail cymunedau trefol, a dyna pam yr wyf wedi dadlau mor gryf ynghylch y brigdorri a fformiwla'r heddlu. Pan fydd cyllid yn cael ei frigdorri ar gyfer prosiectau a meini prawf y cytunir arnynt gan y Swyddfa Gartref, dim ond Heddlu De Cymru sydd â hawl i wneud cais fel arfer, oherwydd dyma'r unig heddlu y mae modd ei gymharu'n fras â heddluoedd Lloegr. Yr wyf wedi dadlau'n gryf am y mater hwnnw, na ddylid gwneud y math hwnnw o frigdorri ar gyllid yr heddlu ar sail meini prawf y cytunir arnynt yn Lloegr. Os ydym i gael meini prawf ynghylch arian, dylai fod gennym rôl a swyddogaeth wrth benderfynu beth yw'r arian a'r meini prawf.

Gallai ein gofynion plismona ni yn Abermaw neu Gaerfyrddin fod yn wahanol iawn i'r rhai yn Lerpwl, a dyna pam mae'n bwysig inni gael y trafodaethau hyn a'n bod yn dal i bwysleisio'r pwyntiau hynny, a, beth bynnag a ddigwydd o ran hyn, byddaf yn parhau i wneud hynny. Yr wyf wedi clywed yr hyn a ddywedasoeh yn y ddadl ac fe'i trafodaf gyda'm cyd-Weinidog, y Trefnydd.

Jeff Cuthbert: A rhoi o'r neilltu y ffaith nad yw'r mater hwn wedi cael ei ddatganoli, a ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn hanfodol bod y penderfyniad terfynol, beth bynnag a fydd, yn arwain at ddigon o ddatganoli i sicrhau bod plismona cymunedol yn cael ei drefnu'n briodol ar sail gwybodaeth leol? Mae'r bobl yn fy etholaeth i am gael y lefel honno o ddiogelwch mewn gwasanaeth heddlu i ddelio â'r hyn sy'n cael ei alw'n droseddau lefel isel sydd yn felltith ar ormod o gymdogaethau ar ffurf ymddygiad gwrthgymdeithasol.

Edwina Hart: Yn bendant, wrth inni siarad am faterion strwythur, diwygio, a'r hyn a allai ddigwydd wrth ddatganoli, rhaid inni gofio bob amser mai'r un sy'n allweddol yw'r trethdalwr sydd am wybod y bydd yn cael y gwasanaeth yr ydych wedi sôn amdano. Felly, mae'n hanfodol inni ddeall yr

understand local needs. There is no doubt that the basic command units and the way in which we develop the partnerships make a difference in dealing with policing issues. We do not want to lose any of that, whatever might happen in terms of structural change.

It is also important that, if there is any element of change and if any opportunity comes out of this, as a National Assembly, we should have a role in deciding police priorities. Perhaps there should be a three-way communication between the Home Office, us and the police authorities on what we see as priorities for policing. That is essential in the development of policing structures in Wales.

Mark Isherwood: I welcome many of your responses, Minister. We need to remember the contribution that the Welsh Local Government Association made last week. It said that this is being driven by a political imperative, with a timescale that is lunatic. Most of us would endorse that.

Will you ask the Home Secretary to help us to understand where the figure of 8,000 for a force comes from? The evidence that the committee has so far received suggests that that is arbitrary. If there is evidence, could we see it?

I note your comments about the projected cost of £47 million to £57 million, which the chief constables said would be even higher and about the need to consider the impact on the precept, namely the need to level up or level down were the forces to be united. How would you respond to the other evidence that we received about the costs and savings to be generated through the reorganisation, when we were told that the Home Secretary's figures assume that savings would be delivered in year 1 but that the actual savings, if any, would take five to 10 years to be achieved? How will we fund that alongside the other costs that have already been referred to?

How will we recognise—this information was given to me over the weekend—that North Wales Police Authority believes that it

anghenion lleol. Nid oes amheuaeth nad yw'r unedau rheoli sylfaenol a'r ffordd yr ydym yn datblygu'r partneriaethau yn gwneud gwahaniaeth wrth ymdrin â materion plismona. Nid ydym am golli hynny, beth bynnag a ddigwydd o ran newid strwythurol.

Mae hefyd yn bwysig, os oes unrhyw elfen o newid ac os daw unrhyw gyfle allan o hyn, fod gennym ni, fel Cynulliad Cenedlaethol, rôl wrth benderfynu ar flaenoriaethau'r heddlu. Efallai y dylai fod cyfathrebu tair ffordd rhwng y Swyddfa Gartref, ni ac awdurdodau'r heddlu ynghylch yr hyn a welwn fel y blaenoriaethau ar gyfer plismona. Mae hynny'n hanfodol wrth ddatblygu strwythurau plismona yng Nghymru.

Mark Isherwood: Yr wyf yn croesawu llawer o'ch atebion, Weinidog. Mae angen inni gofio'r cyfraniad a wnaeth Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yr wythnos diwethaf. Dywedodd fod hyn yn cael ei yrru gan orfodaeth wleidyddol, gydag amserlen sy'n wallgof. Byddai'r rhan fwyaf ohonom yn cefnogi hynny.

A wnewch ofyn i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref ein helpu i ddeall o ble y daw'r ffigur o 8,000 i heddlu? Mae'r dystiolaeth a ddaeth gerbron y pwyllgor hyd yma yn awgrymu mai ffigur mympwyol ydyw. Os oes tystiolaeth, a oes modd i ni gael ei gweld?

Nodaf eich sylwadau am y gost ragamcanedig o £47 miliwn i £57 miliwn, a fyddai'n uwch byth yn ôl y prif gwnstabiliaid, ac am yr angen i ystyried yr effaith ar y praesept, sef yr angen i'w godi neu ei ostwng pe bai'r heddluoedd yn cael eu huno. Sut y byddech yn ymateb i'r dystiolaeth arall a gawsom am y costau a'r arbedion a grëir drwy'r ad-drefnu, pan ddywedwyd wrthym fod ffigurau'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref yn rhagdybio y câi arbedion eu gwneud ym mlwyddyn 1 ond y byddai'r arbedion gwirioneddol, pe bai rhai, yn cymryd pump i 10 mlynedd i gael eu gwireddu? Sut y gwnawn ni gyllido hynny ochr yn ochr â'r costau eraill y cyfeiriwyd atynt eisoes?

Sut y byddwn yn cydnabod—rhoddwyd y wybodaeth hon imi dros y penwythnos—fod Awdurdod Heddlu Gogledd Cymru o'r farn y

could meet all the Home Secretary's requirements at a cost of £7 million, pointing out that it has already had a front-line role in tackling terrorism and high-level crime because of its geographical position, adjacent to Ireland, as well as—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I would like succinct questions, please.

Mark Isherwood: Finally, how can we recognise the co-operation and collaboration that was already moving forward between the Welsh forces to share efficiencies in backroom services, which appear to have been overridden through this initiative?

Edwina Hart: If this evidence has come before the committee, I will review it when I read the committee's report and make my response. If I am perfectly honest, I tend not to listen or watch from a distance on the television screen when committees are undertaking their reports; I wait until they have compiled the lot and then make my response on that basis. Therefore, I will review anything that has come out in that way. There are issues about costs and so on and I would be delighted to take up those points. Following this debate, I intend to write to Charles Clarke to indicate the tenor of the discussions here on my statement, and so various points can be taken up in that way.

The Presiding Officer: Thank you for being so helpful, as always, Minister.

Carl Sargeant: We need to be clear that this is not a devolved matter; it is a matter for Members of Parliament, such as Peter Law and David Davies, who are absent from the Chamber and who have not made any interjection, not even to vote the business statement down on the basis that they wanted to talk about police structures. This is about operational issues. All that my constituents in north Wales, particularly in Alyn and Deeside, are concerned about is whether a police officer will turn up after they have picked up the phone. That is more important to them than who is paying the overall bill, or who is dealing with it. This is not about the

gallai gyflawni holl ofynion yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref am gost o £7 miliwn, gan dynnu sylw at y ffaith ei fod eisoes wedi cael rôl rheng flaen wrth fynd i'r afael â therfysgaeth a throseddu ar lefel uchel oherwydd ei sefyllfa ddaeryddol, gerllaw Iwerddon, yn ogystal â—

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hoffwn gael cwestiynau cryno, os gwelwch yn dda.

Mark Isherwood: Yn olaf, sut y gallwn gydnabod y cydweithredu a'r cydweithio a oedd eisoes ar waith rhwng heddluoedd Cymru er mwyn rhannu arbedion effeithlonrwydd o ran gwasanaethau'r ystafell gefn, y mae'n ymddangos bod y cynllun hwn yn eu diystyru?

Edwina Hart: Os yw'r dystiolaeth hon wedi dod gerbron y pwyllgor, fe'i hadolygaf wrth ddarllen adroddiad y pwyllgor a llunio fy ymateb. A bod yn gwbl onest, byddaf yn tueddu i beidio â gwranddo na gwyllo o bell ar sgrin deledu pan fydd pwyllgorau'n gwneud eu hadroddiadau; byddaf yn disgwyl nes eu bod wedi casglu'r cyfan cyn ymateb ar sail hynny. Felly, adolygaf unrhyw beth sydd wedi dod i'r amlwg yn y ffordd honno. Mae materion yn ymwneud â chostau ac yn y blaen a byddwn yn falch o fynd ynglŷn â'r pwyntiau hynny. Ar ôl y ddatl hon, bwriadaf ysgrifennu at Charles Clark i gyfleu swm a sylwedd y trafodaethau yma am fy natganiad, felly mae modd codi pwyntiau amrywiol drwy hynny.

Y Llywydd: Diolch am fod mor barod i helpu, fel arfer, Weinidog.

Carl Sargeant: Mae angen inni fod yn glir nad yw hwn yn fater datganoledig; mater ydyw i Aelodau Seneddol, megis Peter Law a David Davies, sy'n absennol o'r Siambr ac sydd heb ddweud na bw na be, ac sydd heb hyd yn oed drechu'r datganiad busnes ar y sail eu bod am siarad am strwythurau'r heddlu. Â materion gweithredol y mae a wnelo hyn. Y cyfan sy'n poeni fy etholwyr yng ngogledd Cymru, yn Alun a Glannau Dyfrdwy yn arbennig, yw a fydd heddwys yn dod i'w gweld ar ôl iddynt godi'r ffôn. Mae hynny'n bwysicach iddynt na phwy sy'n talu'r bil drwyddo draw, neu pwy sy'n delio ag ef. Nid balchder prif gwnstabiaild sydd

vanity of chief constables—

dan sylw yma—

The Presiding Officer: Order. I would like to hear a question.

Y Llywydd: Trefn. Hoffwn glywed cwestiwn.

Carl Sargeant: Will you ensure me, Minister, that the funding issue, and particularly the precept, which is in a pretty damned mess because of the differences between north and south Wales, will be equalised, and that the people of north Wales will not lose out and have fewer police officers?

Carl Sargeant: A wnewch fy sicrhau, Weinidog, y bydd y mater yn ymwneud â chyllido, a'r braesept yn arbennig, sydd mewn tipyn o lanast oherwydd y gwahaniaethau rhwng y gogledd a'r de, yn cael ei wneud yn gyfartal, ac na fydd pobl gogledd Cymru ar eu colled ac na fydd ganddynt lai o blismyn?

Edwina Hart: You are quite right to reiterate that this is not a devolved matter. It is quite important that we recognise that the decisions will be taken in another place, as it will be a matter for the Home Secretary. Members of Parliament will debate the issue, and so it is for Welsh MPs to make their views strongly known on this. I also agree with you that people on the street or those making telephone calls to the police just want to know that the service will be delivered.

Edwina Hart: Yr ydych yn gwbl gywir wrth ailadrodd nad yw hwn yn fater sydd wedi cael ei ddatganoli. Mae'n bur bwysig inni gydnabod mai mewn man arall y gwneir y penderfyniadau, gan mai mater i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref fydd hwn. Bydd Aelodau Seneddol yn trafod y mater, felly mater i ASau Cymru yw datgan eu barn yn rymus ar hyn. Yr wyf hefyd yn cytuno â chi mai'r cyfan y mae pobl ar y stryd, neu'r rhai sy'n gwneud galwadau ffôn at yr heddlu, am ei wybod yw y bydd y gwasanaeth yn cael ei ddarparu.

On the precept, and I refer back to an issue that I raised earlier, this might be an opportunity for us to look at some of the funding issues. When you have to work through the nuances of how police forces are funded and what bits come from where and so on, as I did as Finance Minister and as the current Finance Minister does, you see that it would be nice to have greater transparency.

O ran y praesept, ac fe'ch cyfeiriau yn ôl at fater a godais yn gynharach, gallai hyn fod yn gyfle inni edrych ar rai o'r materion yn ymwneud â chyllido. Pan fo gofyn ichi weithio'ch ffordd drwy holl fanylion sut y mae heddluoedd yn cael eu cyllido a pha bethau sy'n dod o ble ac yn y blaen, fel y gwneuthum i fel Gweinidog Cyllid ac fel y mae'r Gweinidog Cyllid presennol yn gwneud, yr ydych yn gweld y byddai'n dda o beth cael mwy o dryloywder.

Laura Anne Jones: Getting the balance right between community policing and level 2 national security policing, without one being at the expense of the other, is our key aim. Do you agree that, before any decision is made, hopefully after the consultation, we must be assured that the money will follow that decision? The council tax in Monmouthshire is currently so high that people cannot afford to pay any more. What effect do you think this merger will have on council tax in Wales?

Laura Anne Jones: Cael y cydbwysedd yn iawn rhwng plismona cymunedol a phlismona diogeled cenedlaethol lefel 2, heb i un fod ar draul y llall, yw ein nod allweddol. A ydych yn cytuno, cyn y gwneir unrhyw benderfyniad, ar ôl yr ymgynghori gobeithio, fod yn rhaid inni gael sicrwydd y bydd arian yn dod i ganlyn y penderfyniad hwnnw? Mae'r dreth gyngor yn sir Fynwy mor uchel ar hyn o bryd fel nad yw pobl yn gallu fforddio ei thalu mwyach. Pa effaith, meddwch, a gaiff yr uno hwn ar y dreth gyngor yng Nghymru?

Edwina Hart: The way in which the police

Edwina Hart: Mae'r ffordd yr ymdrinnir â

precept is dealt with is complex, and there are variances across Wales. As we know, North Wales Police has been successful, as the chief constable said to the citizens of north Wales, 'Pay a bit more money and you will get a police officer'. However, it is essential that you recognise from what I have said today that I do not want to take any risks with the balance between community policing and what is happening on strategic policing issues.

On finance, I will have to raise these issues, because if I think that any costs will come my way, I would certainly expect somebody to pay for them.

John Griffiths: Given the Assembly's responsibilities, I agree that there should be an input into policing in Wales at a strategic level. However, in terms of relaying the contents of your statement and the questions and answers today to the Home Secretary, I wish to reiterate those issues that concern Gwent, namely community policing and accountability, which have been aired. It is clear that they are seen in Gwent as being key. People wish to be reassured that, whatever structure comes about as a result of any changes, the strong community policing aspect in Gwent and the local accountability whereby local communities, Assembly Members and others can influence direction, are preserved and protected. Will you ensure that that feeling is transmitted to the Home Secretary?

Edwina Hart: I know that Gwent Police feels particularly vulnerable in terms of these discussions as it is the smallest force. I understand why it feels that way because it is so close to South Wales Police, and the operational relationships between the south Wales forces are quite strong. Therefore, I would be happy to pass on your concerns.

However, the most important concern, which you reiterated, is about community policing. There is no doubt that we have good quality community policing in place in Wales. In Communities First areas, we have had the benefit of designated police teams, which have made a tremendous difference to the people in those areas in terms of having a

phraesept yr heddlu yn gymhleth, ac mae'n amrywio ledled Cymru. Fel y gwyddom, mae Heddlu Gogledd Cymru wedi llwyddo, fel y dywedodd y prif gwnstabl wrth ddinasyddion gogledd Cymru, 'Talwch ychydig yn rhagor o arian ac fe gewch blismon'. Fodd bynnag, mae'n hanfodol ichi sylweddoli yn ôl yr hyn yr wyf wedi ei ddweud heddiw nad ydwyf am gymryd dim risg gyda'r cydbwysedd rhwng plismona cymunedol a'r hyn sy'n digwydd o ran materion plismona strategol.

O ran cyllid, bydd yn rhaid imi godi'r materion hyn, oherwydd os wyf yn meddwl y bydd unrhyw gostau yn dod i mi, byddwn yn sicr yn disgwyl i rywun dalu amdanynt.

John Griffiths: O ystyried cyfrifoldebau'r Cynulliad, cytunaf y dylai fod mewnbwn i blismona yng Nghymru ar lefel strategol. Fodd bynnag, o ran cyfleu cynnwys eich datganiad a'r cwestiynau a'r atebion heddiw i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref, hoffwn ailadrodd y materion hynny sy'n peri pryder yng Ngwent, sef plismona cymunedol ac atebolrwydd, sydd wedi cael eu mynegi. Mae'n amlwg eu bod yn cael eu hystyried yn allweddol yng Ngwent. Mae pobl am gael sicrwydd, pa strwythur bynnag a geir o ganlyniad i unrhyw newidiadau, y bydd yr elfen gref o blismona cymunedol yng Ngwent a'r atebolrwydd lleol, sy'n golygu bod cymunedau lleol, Aelodau'r Cynulliad ac eraill yn gallu dylanwadu ar gyfeiriad, yn cael eu cadw a'u diogelu. A wnewch sicrhau bod y teimlad hwnnw yn cael ei gyfleu i'r Ysgrifennydd Cartref?

Edwina Hart: Gwn fod Heddlu Gwent yn teimlo'n arbennig o fregus yng nghyswllt y trafodaethau hyn gan mai ef yw'r llu lleiaf. Yr wyf yn deall pam mae'n teimlo felly gan ei fod mor agos at Heddlu De Cymru, ac mae'r berthynas weithredol rhwng heddluoedd y de yn eithaf cryf. Felly, byddwn yn fodlon cyfleu eich pryderon.

Fodd bynnag, mae a wnelo'r pryder pwysicaf, yr ydych wedi ei ailadrodd, â phlismona cymunedol. Nid oes amheuaeth nad oes gennym blismona cymunedol o ansawdd da ar waith yng Nghymru. Mewn ardaloedd Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, yr ydym wedi elwa o gael timau heddlu dynodedig, sydd wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth enfawr i bobl

sense of security and knowing what is going on. The police in many ways have come full circle in terms of public recognition in those areas. Youngsters go up to talk to them now and people are confident in speaking to them, which is good. We do not want to lose any of that, and I do not think that we will, whatever changes are made.

It is important to reiterate that that is the key message that we have to get across. Community policing must be protected, and these changes, if they are made, should not impact on it. I am hopeful that, when the committee has finished its deliberations and its report goes forward, I will be able to articulate its views fully, which will probably reflect the discussions relating to my statement today.

Michael German: I share your ambition for the devolution of police services and the funding that goes with it. I only wish that that could happen more rapidly. However, the danger of the Home Secretary's announcement is that he may have frustrated the opportunity for a particularly Welsh solution to a Welsh problem. Specifically on this matter, did the Home Secretary inform or consult you on his statement before he made it?

4.00 p.m.

If he did consult you, what did you say to him? If he did not consult you at the time, do you think that that was disrespectful to the Welsh Assembly Government?

Edwina Hart: I am rarely consulted on statements on non-devolved matters coming from the Home Office. I am consulted if the matter is to do with both the Assembly and the Westminster Government. For example, I was consulted on youth justice board issues, as this was in an England and Wales capacity. I would not expect to be consulted on a press statement, and I do not feel particularly insulted. There has been a great deal of running around on the back of this statement, but I was happy, from the response I had when I spoke to him and in our

yn yr ardaloedd hynny o safbwynt teimlo'n ddiogel a gwybod beth sy'n digwydd. Mewn llawer ffordd mae'r rhod wedi troi'n llwyr i'r heddlu o ran cydnabyddiaeth gyhoeddus yn yr ardaloedd hynny. Mae pobl ifanc yn mynd atynt i siarad â hwy yn awr ac mae pobl yn hyderus ynghylch siarad â hwy, sy'n beth da. Nid ydym am golli dim o hynny, ac ni chredaf y gwnawn, pa newidiadau bynnag a wneir.

Mae'n bwysig ailadrodd mai dyma'r neges allweddol y mae'n rhaid inni ei chyfleu. Rhaid gwarchod plismona cymunedol ac ni ddylai'r newidiadau hyn, os gwneir hwy, effeithio ar hynny. Pan fydd y pwyllgor wedi cwblhau ei drafodaethau a'i adroddiad yn cael ei gyflwyno, yr wyf yn gobeithio y byddaf yn gallu lleisio ei farn yn llwyr, ac mae'n debyg y bydd yn adlewyrchu'r trafodaethau ynglŷn â'm datganiad heddiw.

Michael German: Mae'r un uchelgais ag sydd gennych chi gennyf finnau o blaid datganoli gwasanaethau'r heddlu a'r cyllid sy'n mynd law yn llaw â hynny. Byddai'n dda gennyf pe bai hynny'n digwydd yn gynt. Fodd bynnag, y perygl o ran cyhoeddiad yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref yw y gallai fod wedi llesteirio'r cyfle i gael ateb cwbl Gymreig i broblem Gymreig. Yn benodol ar y mater hwn, a wnaeth yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref eich hysbysu neu ymgynghori â chi am ei ddatganiad cyn iddo ei wneud?

Os ymgynghorodd â chi, beth a ddywedasoch wrtho? Os nad ymgynghorodd â chi ar y pryd, a ydych yn credu bod hynny'n sarhad ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru?

Edwina Hart: Anaml iawn yr ymgynghorir â mi ynglŷn â datganiadau sy'n cael eu gwneud gan y Swyddfa Gartref ar faterion nad ydynt wedi eu datganoli. Ymgynghorir â mi os oes a wnelo'r mater â'r Cynulliad a Llywodraeth San Steffan ill dau. Er enghraifft, ymgynghorwyd â mi ynglŷn â materion byrddau cyfiawnder ieuencid, gan fod yr ymgynghoriad yn ymwneud â Chymru a Lloegr. Ni fyddwn yn disgwyl iddo ymgynghori â mi ynglŷn â datganiad i'r wasg, ac nid wyf yn teimlo llawer o sarhad. Bu'r datganiad hwn yn destun cryn siarad,

meetings, that he wants to take into account the Assembly's views following our consultation.

Janice Gregory: You will know that I was surprised to read the headlines last week on this, on behalf of committee members. I felt that we had undertaken a tremendous amount of work on this review. I had concerns about it, but when I read the police structures review unit letter, I realised that although it was headed as from the Home Office, it was the police structures review unit letter. I believe that it has been stated on the Plaid Cymru website that the Home Office hurriedly issued a letter to Assembly Members. However, that letter from the police structures review unit, dated 9 November, was expected by the chief constables and they stated as much when they came to committee.

Leanne is right—she did ask me the question, as we entered into this review. I remember saying that I was deeply unhappy, because I could not think of a stronger word, frankly, but I also said, at the time, that no committee member had a gun held to his or her head to undertake this review. They all undertook the review quite happily and wanted to take evidence properly. In the evidence that we have taken, we took a huge range of views from different people throughout Wales.

Do you agree that it is more important than ever to concentrate our efforts on the evidence that we have taken, and to ensure that our views are now heard in terms of restructuring the police service in Wales? I expect a robust and frank exchange in committee tomorrow at 9 a.m.. I am sure that we will air these views then and that they will be properly considered and taken forward.

Edwina Hart: The committee's views will be taken forward properly and, hopefully, considered properly by the Home Secretary. I think it important that the committee continues with its work. I understand Members' frustrations on seeing the Home

and yr oeddwn yn fodlon, yn ôl yr ymateb a gefais pan siaredais ag ef ac yn ein cyfarfodydd, fod arno eisiau ystyried barn y Cynulliad ar ôl ein hymgyngoriad.

Janice Gregory: Gwyddoch fy mod wedi synnu pan ddarllenais y penawdau yr wythnos diwethaf am hyn, ar ran aelodau'r pwyllgor. Teimlwn ein bod wedi gwneud llawer iawn o waith ar yr adolygiad hwn. Yr oedd gennyf bryderon yn ei gylch, ond pan ddarllenais lythyr uned adolygu strwythurau'r heddlu, sylweddolais, er bod y pennawd yn dweud ei fod gan y Swyddfa Gartref, mai llythyr uned adolygu strwythurau'r heddlu ydoedd. Credaf i wefan Plaid Cymru nodi bod y Swyddfa Gartref wedi anfon llythyr ar frys at Aelodau'r Cynulliad. Fodd bynnag, yr oedd y prif gwnstabiliaid yn disgwyl y llythyr hwnnw gan uned adolygu strwythurau'r heddlu, dyddiedig 9 Tachwedd, a dywedasant hynny pan ddaethant i'r pwyllgor.

Mae Leanne yn iawn—gofynnodd y cwestiwn imi, ar ddechrau'r adolygiad hwn. Cofiaf ddweud fy mod yn anhapus iawn, oherwydd ni allwn feddwl am air cryfach, a bod yn onest, ond dywedais hefyd, ar y pryd, nad oedd dim un aelod o'r pwyllgor wedi cael ei orfodi i wneud yr adolygiad hwn. Ymgwymerodd pob un â'r adolygiad yn ddigon bodlon ac yr oedd arnynt eisiau cymryd tystiolaeth yn briodol. Yn y dystiolaeth a gymerwyd gennym, clywsom ystod eang iawn o safbwyntiau gan wahanol bobl o bob cwr o Gymru.

A ydych yn cytuno ei bod yn bwysicach nag erioed inni ganolbwyntio ein hymdrechion ar y dystiolaeth yr ydym wedi ei chymryd, a sicrhau bod ein safbwyntiau ynglŷn ag ailstrwythuro gwasanaeth yr heddlu yng Nghymru yn cael eu clywed yn awr? Disgwyliaf drafodaeth fywiog a di-flewyn-ardafod yn y pwyllgor yfory am 9 a.m.. Yr wyf yn sicr y byddwn yn mynegi'r safbwyntiau hyn yno, ac y byddant yn cael eu hystyried yn briodol a'u trosglwyddo.

Edwina Hart: Bydd safbwyntiau'r pwyllgor yn cael eu trosglwyddo'n briodol ac yn cael eu hystyried yn briodol, gobeithio, gan yr Ysgrifennydd Cartref. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig i'r pwyllgor barhau â'i waith. Gallaf ddeall rhwystredigaeth yr Aelodau o weld

Office press statement, but we need to consider where it has come from and the underlying issues. We expected something to emerge at the first stage. I do not think that we should be put off from making our views known because of something that happened elsewhere. We must ensure even more that our views are known via the committee report, and if Jane decides to table a debate, we will have a further opportunity to discuss this here.

I will ensure that Charles Clarke is made aware of the Assembly's views from the discussion on this statement today. Ultimately, we want policing that is right for the people of Wales: good community policing, and a police force that we can be proud of, whether it is based on the current or any other structure. We also want a police force that is democratically accountable. There are issues here relating to democracy, as well as funding. We require more transparency, and we must look towards the future because anything we do now will have an impact. We must get it right if we are to attain our goal, which I believe all parties now support, of getting responsibility for the police devolved to us.

datganiad y Swyddfa Gartref i'r wasg, ond mae angen inni ystyried beth sy'n sail iddo a'r materion sydd wrth ei wraidd. Yr oeddem yn disgwyl i rywbeth ymddangos yn ystod y cam cyntaf. Nid wyf yn credu y dylem beidio â mynegi ein barn oherwydd rhywbeth a ddigwyddodd yn rhywle arall. Mae'n bwysicach fyth inni fynegi ein barn drwy adroddiad y pwyllgor, ac os bydd Jane yn penderfynu cyflwyno dadl, bydd gennym gyfle arall i drafod hyn yma.

Sicrhaf fod Charles Clarke yn cael gwybod beth yw barn y Cynulliad yn sgîl y drafodaeth ar y datganiad hwn heddiw. Yn y pen draw, mae arnom eisiau cael plismona sy'n iawn i bobl Cymru: plismona cymunedol da, a heddlu y gallwn fod yn falch ohono, pa un a yw'n seiliedig ar y strwythur presennol neu unrhyw strwythur arall. Mae arnom hefyd eisiau heddlu sy'n atebol yn ddemocrataidd. Mae materion yma sy'n ymwneud â democratiaeth, yn ogystal ag ariannu. Mae arnom angen rhagor o dryloywder, a rhaid inni edrych i'r dyfodol, oherwydd bydd unrhyw beth a wnawn yn awr yn cael effaith ar y dyfodol. Rhaid inni gael pethau'n iawn os ydym am gyrraedd ein nod, rhywbeth sy'n cael ei gefnogi, yr wyf yn tybio, gan bob plaid erbyn hyn, sef sicrhau bod cyfrifoldeb am yr heddlu'n cael ei ddatganoli i ni.

Datganiad am ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i Adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad, 'Bodloni'r Targedau Tirlenwi ac Ailgylchu'

Statement on the Welsh Assembly Government's response to the Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee's Report, 'Meeting Landfill and Recycling Targets'

The Minister for Environment, Planning and Countryside (Carwyn Jones): I commend the committee for considering this important subject. I am referring, of course, to the landfill inquiry, and the written statement tabled last week.

Y Gweinidog dros yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad (Carwyn Jones): Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r pwyllgor am ystyried y pwnc pwysig hwn. Cyfeiriaf, wrth gwrs, at yr ymchwiliad i dirlenwi, a'r datganiad ysgrifenedig a gyflwynwyd yr wythnos diwethaf.

Waste management is the most pressing environmental issue facing Wales. The Assembly Government is implementing the national waste strategy for Wales, 'Wise about Waste', which not only seeks to improve the sustainability of waste management in Wales, in line with our

Rheoli gwastraff yw'r mater amgylcheddol pwysicaf sy'n wynebu Cymru. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithredu strategaeth wastraff genedlaethol Cymru, 'Yn Gall gyda Gwastraff', sydd nid yn unig yn ceisio gwella cynaliadwyedd rheoli gwastraff yng Nghymru, yn unol â'n dyletswydd

statutory duty to promote sustainable development, but also to meet our obligations under UK and EU legislation.

The main EU requirement addressed by the waste strategy is the need to meet the requirements of the landfill directive to divert biodegradable municipal waste from landfill in accordance with the strict criteria in the directive. The Environment, Planning and Countryside Committee report deals with these issues.

The Assembly Government has been able to accept nearly all the recommendations that the committee has made—indeed, in many cases the recommendations reflect current policy and activity. Where we have not been able to accept a recommendation, the paper that I have presented to Plenary makes clear the reasons why.

The Assembly Government recognises that landfill capacity will reduce across Wales in future. However the policies that the Assembly Government has been implementing have already resulted in a reduction in the amount of municipal waste being sent to landfill; this has reduced in each of the last two years. There have also been reductions in the amount of industrial and commercial waste being sent to landfill, including hazardous waste. It will be important to ensure that alternatives to landfill are put into place, and the Assembly Government is working with the Environment Agency and other stakeholders to ensure that these facilities are developed.

We have provided local authorities with substantial financial support in recognition of the changes that they will have to make and we have provided clear direction through the Wales waste strategy. We are also funding a material action programme to assist businesses in Wales to reduce their waste and to manage it more sustainably. We have also worked closely with a range of stakeholders in local government, the community sector, industry and more widely, and we will continue to do so.

statudol i hybu datblygu cynaliadwy, ond hefyd yn ceisio cyflawni ein dyletswyddau dan ddeddfwriaeth y DU a'r UE.

Un o'r prif ofynion a nodwyd gan yr UE, sy'n cael sylw yn y strategaeth wastraff, yw'r angen i gyflawni gofynion y gyfarwyddeb tirlenwi er mwyn sicrhau nad yw gwastraff trefol pydradwy yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi yn unol â meini prawf llym y gyfarwyddeb. Mae adroddiad Pwyllgor yr Amgylchedd, Cynllunio a Chefn Gwlad yn ymdrin â'r materion hyn.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gallu derbyn bron bob un o'r argymhellion a wnaethpwyd gan y pwyllgor—yn wir, mewn sawl achos mae'r argymhellion yn adlewyrchu polisiau a gweithgareddau cyfredol. Lle nad ydym wedi gallu derbyn argymhelliad, mae'r papur a gyflwynais i'r Cyfarfod Llawn yn nodi'n glir beth yw'r rhesymau dros hynny.

Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cydnabod y bydd llai o gapasiti ar gyfer tirlenwi yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r polisiau y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi bod yn eu gweithredu eisoes yn golygu bod llai o wastraff trefol yn cael ei anfon i safleoedd tirlenwi; mae hyn wedi lleihau yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf. Gwelwyd lleihad hefyd yn y gwastraff diwydiannol a masnachol a anfonir i safleoedd tirlenwi, gan gynnwys gwastraff peryglus. Mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gennym bosibiliadau eraill yn lle tirlenwi, ac mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio gydag Asiantaeth yr Amgylchedd a rhanddeiliaid eraill er mwyn sicrhau bod y cyfleusterau hyn yn cael eu datblygu.

Yr ydym wedi rhoi cymorth ariannol sylweddol i awdurdodau lleol, gan ein bod yn cydnabod y newidiadau y byddant yn gorfod eu gwneud, ac yr ydym wedi rhoi arweiniad clir drwy strategaeth wastraff Cymru. Yr ydym hefyd yn ariannu rhaglen weithredu berthnasol er mwyn helpu busnesau yng Nghymru i leihau eu gwastraff ac i'w reoli yn fwy cynaliadwy. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gweithio mewn cysylltiad agos ag ystod o randdeiliaid mewn llywodraeth leol, yn y sector cymunedol, mewn diwydiannau ac yn ehangach, a byddwn yn parhau i wneud hynny.

I welcome the committee's report and I will continue to keep both the committee and the Assembly as a whole informed of developments in this important matter.

Helen Mary Jones: I endorse everything that the Minister has said about what was a thorough and focused investigation by the committee. I would like to repeat the thanks that have already been given to all those who gave evidence, and to the committee staff, who helped us to produce a very good report.

The report raises real concerns about the capacity to reach the 25 per cent target, but the real challenge is the 40 per cent target. In that context, the Minister's full written response to the committee's report is disappointing. Where he accepts recommendations, he asks us to accept that he is already doing what we are asking him to do, which is contrary to the evidence that was placed before us in many cases. That displays a complacency that is quite staggering, given the size of the challenge. It is even more worrying that those recommendations that the Minister rejects—I acknowledge that they are few—are among the most crucial and challenging, and those most often asked for by our witnesses. We need to challenge the Minister in detail on these issues in committee and in further debates. However, I will concentrate my questioning today on some of the recommendations that he has refused.

Recommendation 5 asks the Minister to institute targets for bulk, as well as weight, in terms of material diverted from landfill. The Minister is unable to accept this at this time. This was requested by almost all of our witnesses, including those from local authorities, the private sector, and the voluntary sector. I am glad that the Minister has said that he will undertake some research to see how such targets could be implemented. However, can the Minister give an indication as to how long such research might take, and when he will be able to report to the committee and to the Assembly? It is a major disincentive to effective recycling for a recycle for which

Yr wyf yn croesawu adroddiad y pwyllgor a byddaf yn parhau i hysbysu'r pwyllgor a'r Cynulliad cyfan ynglŷn â datblygiadau yn y mater pwysig hwn.

Helen Mary Jones: Yr wyf yn cefnogi popeth y mae'r Gweinidog wedi ei ddweud am ymchwiliad trylwyr y pwyllgor a'i ffocws penodol. Hoffwn ddiolch unwaith yn rhagor i bob un a roddodd dystiolaeth, a hefyd i staff y pwyllgor, a'n cynorthwyodd i gynhyrchu adroddiad da iawn.

Mae'r adroddiad yn codi amheuaeth wirioneddol ynglŷn â'n gallu i gyrraedd y targed o 25 y cant, ond yr her fwyaf yw'r targed o 40 y cant. Yn y cyswllt hwnnw, mae ymateb ysgrifenedig llawn y Gweinidog i adroddiad y pwyllgor yn siomedig. Lle y bo'n derbyn argymhellion, mae'n gofyn inni dderbyn ei fod eisoes yn gwneud yr hyn yr ydym yn gofyn iddo ei wneud, sy'n groes i'r dystiolaeth a roddwyd ger ein bron mewn sawl achos. Mae hynny'n dangos hunanfodlonrwydd sy'n bur echrydus, o ystyried gymaint yw'r her. Yr hyn sy'n achosi mwy fyth o bryder yw'r ffaith bod yr argymhellion hynny y mae'r Gweinidog yn eu gwrthod—yr wyf yn cydnabod nad oes llawer ohonynt—ymhlith yr argymhellion pwysicaf, sy'n cynnig yr her fwyaf, ac y gofynnir amdanynt amlaf gan ein tystion. Mae angen inni holi'r Gweinidog yn fanwl ynglŷn â'r materion hyn yn y pwyllgor ac mewn dadleuon eraill. Fodd bynnag, canolbwyntiaf fy nghwestiynau heddiw ar rai o'r argymhellion y mae wedi eu gwrthod.

Mae argymhelliad 5 yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog sefydlu targedau ar gyfer swmp, yn ogystal â phwysau, y deunydd na fydd yn mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi mwyach. Mae'r Gweinidog yn methu â derbyn hyn ar hyn o bryd. Gwnaethpwyd y cais hwn gan bron bob un o'n tystion, gan gynnwys y rhai o awdurdodau lleol, y sector preifat, a'r sector gwirfoddol. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi dweud y bydd yn gwneud gwaith ymchwil er mwyn gweld sut y gellid gweithredu targedau o'r fath. Fodd bynnag, a all y Gweinidog roi rhyw syniad faint o amser y gallai ymchwil o'r fath ei gymryd, a pha bryd y bydd yn gallu adrodd i'r pwyllgor ac i'r Cynulliad? Nid yw'n gwneud dim byd

there could be markets. Therefore, this needs to be addressed.

Recommendation 8 asks the Minister to put the regional plans on a statutory basis. I understand what the Minister says in his response about the practicalities of this, but had he the political will, he could make these plans statutory. The reason that the committee has asked for this, as he knows, is that the amount of co-operation between local authorities varies greatly across Wales. Can the Minister say a bit more today about his rationale for refusing to go back to the beginning and to put the regional plans on a statutory footing? If he will not do that, can he tell us what else he will do to challenge the issues around regional co-operation, as some local authorities are much keener to co-operate than others?

Recommendation 12 asks for clearer guidance for local authorities on what technologies the Government of Wales expects them to use, and what technologies it does not want them to use. This recommendation came out of what local authorities asked committee members to request of the Minister.

4.10 p.m.

His response says that he refuses the recommendation. However, he talks about producing more guidance. Perhaps I am being slightly dense, but can the Minister tell me what the difference is between more guidance and clearer guidance? Are we talking about quality and quantity? Will the additional guidance that he is going to produce be clearer and stronger? That was something that the voluntary sector, business and local authorities asked for.

I ask the Minister to reconsider his overall response. His tone suggests that he thinks that everything in the garden is lovely. We know that we are going to run out of landfill space shortly, and I think that there is an

o gwbl i annog ailgylchu deunydd eildro y mae'n bosibl bod marchnad ar ei gyfer mewn modd effeithiol. Felly, mae angen rhoi sylw i hyn.

Mae argymhelliad 8 yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog osod y cynlluniau rhanbarthol ar sail statudol. Deallaf yr hyn y mae'r Gweinidog yn ei ddweud yn ei ymateb am agweddau ymarferol hyn, ond pe bai'r ewylllys gwleidyddol ganddo, gallai wneud y cynlluniau hyn yn statudol. Y rheswm pam mae'r pwyllgor wedi gofyn am hyn, fel y gŵyr, yw bod y cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol yn amrywio'n fawr drwy Gymru. A all y Gweinidog ddweud ychydig bach mwy heddiw am ei resymau dros wrthod mynd yn ôl i'r dechrau a gosod y cynlluniau rhanbarthol ar sail statudol? Os na wnaiff hynny, a all ddweud wrthym beth arall a wnaiff er mwyn datrys y problemau sy'n ymwneud â chydweithio rhanbarthol, gan fod rhai awdurdodau lleol yn llawer mwy awyddus na'i gilydd i gydweithio?

Mae argymhelliad 12 yn gofyn am ganllawiau cliriach i awdurdodau lleol ynglŷn â pha dechnolegau y mae Llywodraeth Cymru'n disgwyl iddynt eu defnyddio, a pha dechnolegau nad yw am iddynt eu defnyddio. Mae'r argymhelliad hwn yn deillio o'r hyn y gofynnodd awdurdodau lleol i aelodau'r pwyllgor ei ofyn i'r Gweinidog.

Dywed ei ymateb ei fod yn gwrthod yr argymhelliad. Fodd bynnag, mae'n siarad am gynhyrchu mwy o ganllawiau. Efallai fy mod braidd yn dwp, ond a all y Gweinidog ddweud wrthyf beth yw'r gwahaniaeth rhwng mwy o ganllawiau a chanllawiau cliriach? A ydym yn siarad am ansawdd a nifer? A fydd y canllawiau ychwanegol y mae'n mynd i'w cynhyrchu yn gliriach ac yn gryfach? Yr oedd hynny'n rhywbeth y gofynnodd y sector gwirfoddol, busnesau ac awdurdodau lleol amdano.

Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog ailystyried ei ymateb cyffredinol. Mae naws ei ymateb yn awgrymu ei fod yn meddwl bod popeth yn iawn. Gwyddom y bydd safleoedd tirlenwi'n darfod cyn bo hir, a thybiaf fod elfen o

element of complacency, which, when he responds in more detail, the Minister may wish to address. I sincerely hope that he will.

Carwyn Jones: First, I reject any suggestion of complacency. The committee undertook a thorough review, and I have accepted the majority of the recommendations. I do not seek to pretend that everything is right in the garden. We have some pretty tough targets to meet between now and 2009-10, when we will look for 40 per cent of waste to be recycled. There was some scepticism about whether the target of recycling 15 per cent of waste could be achieved by 2003-04. That was done across Wales, and we are confident that the same thing will happen with this target. We have invested to the tune of £93 million over the next three years in projects to ensure that that happens.

On recommendation 5, I do not think that I can take it much further. I will report back to the committee on the timescale for the research. It is a fair question, and I will ensure that it is answered. On recommendation 8, I am aware that there may be difficulties with regard to co-operation among some local authorities. I am keeping a close eye on what is going on. Should I feel that co-operation is not occurring, I will consider further steps to ensure that it does. On recommendation 12, Helen Mary asked what the difference was between more guidance and clearer guidance. It is hoped that the guidance that is provided is clearer. More guidance is needed to make it clearer, if I can put it that way—if that does not complicate matters even further.

On the guidance itself, there will inevitably be certain types of waste that have gone into landfill sites in the past that, because of better technology, will now be able to be recycled. It is important that local authorities get further guidance so that they know what to do with that waste. We are very aware of that issue, and the guidance will be issued in sufficient volume and with clarity.

hunanfodlonrwydd, y byddai'r Gweinidog, efallai, pan fydd yn ymateb yn fanylach, yn hoffi rhoi sylw iddi. Yr wyf yn gobeithio'n fawr y bydd yn gwneud hynny.

Carwyn Jones: Yn gyntaf, yr wyf yn gwrthod unrhyw awgrym bod hunanfodlonrwydd. Cynhaliodd y pwyllgor adolygiad trylwyr, ac yr wyf wedi derbyn y rhan fwyaf o'r argymhellion. Nid wyf yn ceisio cymryd arnaf fod popeth yn iawn. Mae gennym rai targedau anodd iawn eu cyrraedd rhwng hyn a 2009-10, pan fyddwn yn ceisio ailgylchu 40 y cant o'n gwastraff. Yr oedd rhywfaint o amheuaeth a oedd y targed o ailgylchu 15 y cant o'n gwastraff erbyn 2003-04 o fewn ein cyrraedd. Cyrhaeddwyd y targed ym mhob rhan o Gymru, ac yr ydym yn ffyddiog y bydd yr un peth yn digwydd â'r targed hwn. Yr ydym wedi buddsoddi tua £93 miliwn dros y tair blynedd nesaf mewn prosiectau a fydd yn sicrhau bod hyn yn digwydd.

O ran argymhelliad 5, nid wyf yn credu y gallaf wneud llawer mwy yn ei gylch. Adroddaf yn ôl i'r pwyllgor ynglŷn â'r amserlen ar gyfer yr ymchwil. Mae'n gwestiwn teg, a gwnaf yn siŵr ei fod yn cael ei ateb. O ran argymhelliad 8, gwn ei bod yn bosibl y bydd anawsterau o ran sicrhau cydweithrediad rhwng rhai awdurdodau lleol. Yr wyf yn cadw llygad barcud ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd. Os byddaf yn teimlo nad ydynt yn cydweithio, byddaf yn ystyried camau eraill y gellir eu cymryd er mwyn sicrhau eu bod yn cydweithio. O ran argymhelliad 12, gofynnodd Helen Mary beth oedd y gwahaniaeth rhwng mwy o ganllawiau a chanllawiau cliriach. Gobeithir y bydd y canllawiau a ddarperir yn gliriach. Mae angen mwy o ganllawiau er mwyn eu gwneud yn gliriach, os caf ei ddweud felly—os nad yw hynny'n cymhlethu mwy fyth ar bethau.

O ran y canllawiau eu hunain, mae'n anrffod y bydd rhai mathau o wastraff sydd wedi mynd i safleoedd tirlenwi yn y gorffennol a fydd bellach, oherwydd gwell technoleg, yn gallu cael eu hailgylchu. Mae'n bwysig i awdurdodau lleol gael rhagor o ganllawiau fel eu bod yn gwybod beth i'w wneud â'r gwastraff hwnnw. Yr ydym yn ymwybodol iawn o'r mater hwnnw, a bydd y canllawiau a

gyhoeddir yn gynhwysfawr ac yn eglur.

Glyn Davies: Minister, you began your statement by appreciating the scale of the problem. We all agree that waste management is one of the biggest problems that we face. I have two points to raise with regard to delivering answers to this serious problem. First, on achieving the targets, one of our problems is that many local authorities have not delivered to the extent that others have. They have simply not taken the issue seriously enough. What steps have you taken, or do you plan to take, to target these local authorities specifically—whether by providing help or by explaining why they have got to agree and move forward? We will deliver more at a national level by bringing those laggards up to the level of the others. What steps are you taking with those authorities that are not keeping pace with the average, as it were?

The second issue is that of making this a statutory responsibility. When it was discussed in the committee, I was not particularly happy with putting this on a statutory basis. However, in the end, I agreed that we had to do so, simply because of the scale of the problem. If we are to deal with the problem, we must recognise that there are big difficulties with regard to planning permission, and that there will be people who will not take difficult decisions. We must do something about that.

It depends on how long you assess the timescale to be. You have said that you are going to look at the matter and perhaps come back to it if it is not delivered. We have seen years and years when it has not been delivered. It was not an easy decision for the committee to take, but we have now reached the stage where we have looked on for long enough. It is now enough of a problem for us to have to put this on a statutory basis, so that we get delivery very quickly.

Carwyn Jones: On targets, when I saw the list of local authorities and the figures for recycling that they had produced up until

Glyn Davies: Weinidog, dechreuasoch eich datganiad drwy gydnabod maint y broblem. Mae pob un ohonom yn cytuno mai rheoli gwastraff yw un o'r problemau mwyaf yr ydym yn ei hwynebu. Mae gennyf ddau bwynt i'w codi mewn perthynas ag atebion i'r broblem ddifrifol hon. Yn gyntaf, o ran cyrraedd y targedau, un o'n problemau yw nad yw pob awdurdod lleol mor weithgar â'i gilydd yn y maes hwn. Nid yw pob un wedi ystyried y mater yn ddigon difrifol. Pa gamau yr ydych wedi eu cymryd, neu y bwriadwch eu cymryd, er mwyn targedu'r awdurdodau lleol hyn yn benodol—drwy gynnig cymorth neu drwy esbonio pam mae'n rhaid iddynt gytuno a symud ymlaen? Byddwn yn cyflawni mwy yn genedlaethol drwy wneud i'r awdurdodau diog hyn ddilyn esiampl y lleill. Pa gamau yr ydych yn eu cymryd gyda'r awdurdodau hynny sydd ar ei hôl hi, fel petai, o'u cymharu â'r cyfartaledd?

Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud â gwneud hyn yn gyfrifoldeb statudol. Pan drafodwyd hyn yn y pwyllgor, nid oeddwn yn orawyddus i osod hyn ar sail statudol. Fodd bynnag, yn y diwedd, cytunwn fod rhaid inni wneud hynny, yn syml iawn oherwydd maint y broblem. Os ydym am ddelio gyda'r broblem, rhaid inni gydnabod bod anawsterau mawr o ran caniatâd cynllunio, ac y bydd rhai pobl yn gwrthod derbyn penderfyniadau anodd. Rhaid inni wneud rhywbeth ynglŷn â hynny.

Mae'n dibynnu faint o amser yr ydych yn meddwl y bydd hyn yn ei gymryd. Yr ydych wedi dweud eich bod yn mynd i edrych ar y mater a dod yn ôl ato efallai os nad yw'r gwaith yn cael ei wneud. Yr ydym wedi gweld blynyddoedd ar flynyddoedd heb i ddim gael ei wneud. Nid oedd yn benderfyniad hawdd i'r pwyllgor, ond yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y pwynt yn awr lle yr ydym wedi treulio hen ddigon o amser yn edrych ar y broblem. Mae'r broblem mor ddifrifol bellach nes bod rhaid inni osod hyn ar sail statudol, fel bod rhywbeth yn cael ei wneud yn sydyn iawn.

Carwyn Jones: O ran y targedau, pan welais y rhestr o awdurdodau lleol a'r ffigurau ar gyfer ailgylchu a gyhoeddwyd ganddynt hyd

2003-04, it was clear that some of them had not reached those targets. I investigated why those targets had not been reached. There were particularly specific problems in those local authorities that had been, or were being, overcome. I suppose that a prime example is Neath Port Talbot County Borough Council and the difficulties that it has experienced at Crymlyn Burrows.

The situation is being monitored. Should I find that we are slowing down in terms of reaching the targets, more drastic action will be needed. I am not considering that now because the present approach is working. The target across Wales was reached in 2003-04. For local authorities, it is important that they get the financial assistance that they need in order to reach their targets. They are getting that assistance. The present system is working and I see no need to change it, but if it starts to fail we may have to consider action beyond what is currently being done.

Turning back to the statutory plan, I am not persuaded to follow it at present as our present system is working. Nevertheless, as I have said before, that may change in the future.

You asked what incentives or disincentives there are for local authorities to move towards higher recycling targets. The most potent of them is cost. The more that they use landfill, the more it will cost them. There is inevitably a financial incentive to recycle, especially given that many recyclable products have a vibrant market and are worth a lot of money. It is in the interests of councils and council tax payers that councils make sure that they recycle as much as possible. Ultimately, they will save money.

Mick Bates: I thank the Minister for the statement in response to the Committee's report, and I reinforce the views of other Members that it was a thorough report undertaken with some terrific evidence.

I think that there is a certain lack of urgency

at 2003-04, yr oedd yn amlwg bod rhai ohonynt heb gyrraedd y targedau hynny. Ymchwiliais i weld pam na chyrhaeddwyd y targedau hynny. Yr oedd problemau penodol iawn yn yr awdurdodau lleol hynny a oedd wedi cael eu datrys, neu a oedd wrthi'n cael eu datrys. Mae'n debyg bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Castell-nedd Port Talbot a'r anawsterau y mae wedi eu cael yn Nhywyn Crymlyn yn enghraifft nodedig o hyn.

Mae'r sefyllfa'n cael ei monitro. Pe gwelwn ein bod yn arafu o ran cyrraedd y targedau, bydd angen cymryd camau llymach. Nid wyf yn ystyried hynny ar hyn o bryd gan fod y dull presennol yn gweithio. Cyrhaeddwyd y targed ledled Cymru yn 2003-04. Yn achos awdurdodau lleol, mae'n bwysig iddynt gael y cymorth ariannol sydd ei angen arnynt i gyrraedd eu targedau. Maent yn cael y cymorth hwnnw. Mae'r system bresennol yn gweithio ac ni welaf fod angen ei newid, ond os bydd yn dechrau methu efallai y bydd rhaid inni ystyried cymryd camau heblaw'r hyn sy'n cael ei wneud ar hyn o bryd.

A throi'n ôl at y cynllun statudol, nid wyf wedi fy narbwyllo y dylid ei ddilyn ar hyn o bryd gan fod ein system bresennol yn gweithio. Er hynny, fel y dywedais eisoes, gall hynny newid yn y dyfodol.

Yr ydych wedi gofyn pa gymhellion neu anghymhellion sydd ar gael i awdurdodau lleol i'w galluogi i anelu at dargedau ailgylchu uwch. Y mwyaf grymus ohonynt yw'r gost. Po fwyaf o dirlenwi a ddefnyddir ganddynt, po fwyaf fydd hynny'n ei gostio iddynt. Mae'n anochel bod cymhelliad ariannol ynghlwm wrth ailgylchu, yn enwedig o gofio bod marchnad ffyniannus yn bodoli i lawer o nwyddau wedi'u hailgylchu ac maent yn werth llawer o arian. Mae o fudd i gynghorau a thalwyr y dreth gyngor fod cynghorau'n sicrhau eu bod yn ailgylchu cymaint â phosibl. Yn y pen draw, byddant yn arbed arian.

Mick Bates: Diolchaf i'r Gweinidog am y datganiad mewn ymateb i adroddiad y Pwyllgor, ac yr wyf yn ategu sylwadau'r Aelodau eraill ei fod yn adroddiad trylwyr a wnaed gyda pheth tystiolaeth ragorol.

Nid wyf yn teimlo bod rhyw lawer o frys yn

in your response, particularly in terms of some of the necessary enabling investment to achieve some of the recommendations. I am thinking, in particular, of the exemplar projects and making sure that the end product is a commercial product and that the markets for those are developed here in Wales. To expand on this theme, particularly given your recognition of sustainability, what are you doing to ensure that joint working between local authorities on landfill and recycling does not undermine sustainability and social justice? I ask this with reference to two particular factors: increasing the distance that landfill waste is carried across Wales, or increasing the tendency for the rubbish from richer areas in Wales to be disposed of in poorer communities.

I believe that there is a recognition embodied in this report that we will continue with a system that moves rubbish around and may reduce the number of landfills. The evidence that we heard was that landfill capacity may run out by 2007. How do you reconcile that, in terms of sustainability, with sending articulated lorries all across Wales?

The second focus, particularly in recommendation 12, which we have already heard about, looks at alternative methods of disposal. Only last week, in the debate about energy in the energy route-map, we heard about developing anaerobic digestion as a source of energy. What views do you have on making sure that this becomes a viable alternative for local authorities to dispose of biodegradable waste? There are some blockages to this; I will raise one with you today, although I do not expect an immediate answer. Currently, as you may be aware, biogas, which is methane, is not recognised as a renewable source of energy once it enters the mains system. This holds back a great deal of development. As you are aware, the Government has incentives in the form of renewable energy certificates, but biogas does not currently meet those requirements. Are you prepared to lobby on that score, so that we can see these innovative alternatives develop? Returning to my theme, there does not appear to be any urgency in your response in terms of getting these alternatives

eich ymateb, yn enwedig o ran rhywfaint o'r buddsoddiad galluogi angenrheidiol i gyflawni rhai o'r argymhellion. Yr wyf yn cyfeirio, yn fwyaf arbennig, at y prosiectau enghreifftiol a sicrhau bod y cynnyrch terfynol yn gynnyrch masnachol a bod y marchnadoedd ar gyfer hynny'n cael eu datblygu yma yng Nghymru. Ac ymhelaethu ar y thema hon, yn enwedig o gofio eich cydnabyddiaeth o gynaliadwyedd, beth yr ydych yn ei wneud i sicrhau nad yw cydweithio rhwng awdurdodau lleol ar dirlenwi ac ailgylchu'n tansilio cynaliadwyedd a chyfiawnder cymdeithasol? Gofynnaf hyn gan gyfeirio at ddau ffactor penodol: cynyddu'r pellter a deithir i gludo gwastraff tirlenwi ar draws Cymru, neu gynyddu'r duedd i waredu sbwriel yr ardaloedd cyfoethog yng Nghymru mewn cymunedau tlotach.

Credaf fod yr adroddiad hwn yn cydnabod y byddwn yn parhau gyda system sy'n symud sbwriel o gwmpas ac a all leihau nifer y safleoedd tirlenwi. Yn ôl y dystiolaeth a glywsom, gall y safleoedd tirlenwi fod yn llawn erbyn 2007. Sut yr ydych yn cysoni hynny, o safbwynt cynaliadwyedd, ag anfon lorïau cymalog ar hyd a lled Cymru?

Mae'r ail bwyslais, yn enwedig yn argymhelliad 12, yr ydym wedi clywed amdano eisoes, yn edrych ar ddulliau amgen o waredu gwastraff. Yr wythnos diwethaf, yn y ddadl ar ynni yn y map llwybr ynni, clywsom am ddatblygu treulio anerobig fel ffynhonnell ynni. Beth yw eich barn chi ynglŷn â sicrhau bod hyn yn datblygu'n ddull amgen dichonadwy i awdurdodau lleol waredu gwastraff bioddiraddadwy? Mae rhai rhwystrau rhag cyflawni hyn; crybwyllaf un heddiw, er nad wyf yn disgwyl ateb ar unwaith. Ar hyn o bryd, fel y gwyddoch efallai, nid yw bionwy, methan, yn cael ei gydnabod fel ffynhonnell ynni adnewyddadwy wedi iddo gyrraedd y prif gyflenwad. Mae hyn yn rhwystr i lawer o ddatblygiadau. Fel y gwyddoch, mae gan y Llywodraeth gymhellion ar ffurf tystysgrifau ynni adnewyddadwy, ond nid yw bionwy'n bodloni'r gofynion hynny ar hyn o bryd. A ydych yn barod i lobïo ar y mater hwn, fel y gallwn weld y dulliau amgen arloesol hyn yn datblygu? A dychwelyd at fy thema, nid yw'n ymddangos bod dim math o frys yn eich

into the marketplace, with the necessary investment and with real alternatives so that we can meet ambitious targets. A lot of local authorities are trying to do that.

4.20 p.m.

In Powys, because of the success of a box collection scheme, there is not enough money in the settlement to meet their own high targets. What would you do about practical issues, and ensuring that local authorities have the money to meet their aims? This is particularly true in a sparsely populated area, where the transport to pick up all the waste plays a significant part.

Finally, I mentioned the issue in the report of looking at the footprint of waste collection. Although you have undertaken to conduct research into bulky wastes, such as plastics, what often happens to that plastic is that it is sent halfway around the world to China—as you know—because containers can be filled with manufactured goods from China and brought back. Therefore, it is a good proposition. This does not meet your Government's definition of sustainability. What work will you undertake to ensure that our waste is dealt with sustainably?

Carwyn Jones: There are several questions there. On joint working and the regional waste plans, I expect local authorities to work together to provide solutions for the future. There are some good examples of that happening; it is not even across Wales. On whether we are sitting back and watching the world disappear, the answer is 'no'. We have reached the targets for 2003-04. I accept your analysis that there would be some crisis in the offing if we had not met those targets, but we have. We are also online to meet the targets that we have set for the subsequent years. I have heard it said before that landfill will run out by 2007—I do not think that that is correct, although there are some who assert it, and some who assert other dates. What is right is that, eventually, at some point in time, we will run out of landfill capacity.

ymateb o ran cael y dulliau amgen hyn ar y farchnad, gyda'r buddsoddiad angenrheidiol a chyda dewisiadau eraill sy'n rhai gwirioneddol fel y gallwn fodloni'r targedau uchelgeisiol. Mae llawer o awdurdodau lleol yn ymdrechu i wneud hynny.

Ym Mhowys, oherwydd llwyddiant cynllun casglu blychau, nid oes digon o arian yn y setliad i gyrraedd eu targedau uchel eu hunain. Beth fydddech yn ei wneud ynglŷn â'r agweddau ymarferol, a sicrhau bod gan awdurdodau lleol yr arian angenrheidiol i gyflawni eu nodau? Mae hyn yn arbennig o wir mewn ardal denau ei phoblogaeth, lle y mae'r cludiant i gasglu'r holl wastraff yn fater pwysig.

Yn olaf, codais y pwynt a geir yn yr adroddiad ynglŷn ag edrych ar fater ôl-troed casglu gwastraff. Er eich bod wedi ymrwymo i gynnal ymchwil i wastraff swmpus, megis plastigau, yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn aml yw bod y plastig hwnnw'n cael ei anfon hanner ffordd ar draws y byd i Tsieina—fel y gwyddoch—gan fod modd llenwi'r llongau gyda nwyddau wedi'u cynhyrchu yn Tsieina a'u dychwelyd yma. Felly, mae'n gynllun sy'n talu. Nid yw hyn yn cyd-fynd â diffiniad eich Llywodraeth o gynaliadwyedd. Pa waith y byddwch yn barod i'w wneud i sicrhau bod ein gwastraff yn cael ei drin mewn modd cynaliadwy?

Carwyn Jones: Yr ydych yn gofyn sawl cwestiwn. O ran cydweithio a'r cynlluniau gwastraff rhanbarthol, disgwyliaf i awdurdodau lleol weithio gyda'i gilydd i ddod o hyd i atebion ar gyfer y dyfodol. Ceir rhai enghreifftiau da sy'n dangos bod hynny'n digwydd eisoes; nid yw'n gyson ar draws Cymru. Ynglŷn â'r honiad ein bod yn eistedd yn ôl ac yn edrych ar y byd yn diflannu, yr ateb yw 'na'. Yr ydym wedi cyrraedd y targedau ar gyfer 2003-04. Yr wyf yn derbyn eich dehongliad y byddai rhyw fath o argyfwng yn yr arfaeth pe na baem wedi bodloni'r targedau hynny, ond yr ydym wedi gwneud hynny. Yr ydym hefyd ar y ffordd i gyrraedd y targedau a bennwyd gennym ar gyfer y blynyddoedd dilynol. Clywais rai'n dweud eisoes y bydd safleoedd tirlenwi'n llawn erbyn 2007—nid wyf yn

That is why it is important that we examine all our options for the future regarding waste disposal.

One of those options has to be to minimise the amount of waste at the beginning—and European law is useful in that regard—as well as recycling as much as possible. Inevitably, some products become easier to recycle over time—plastic is one of them, which you gave as an example. Until recently it was difficult to recycle plastic. The current economics of plastics recycling mean that it goes to China and the far east for recycling. The reason for that, I understand, is because it is still very much a manual job. Because there is no machinery at present to sort out different coloured bottles, as there is for glass, it has to be done manually, which inevitably means, unfortunately, that it will go to the place where the cheapest manual labour is available. That is just how it is at present. In time, I would want to see that come to an end. I want to see a situation where we have machinery, particularly, and technology that can do that job, so that it does not have to travel as far as it does now.

On alternative means of disposal, and biogas particularly, biogas sits more easily in Andrew Davies's portfolio as an energy source. I am aware of the situation and of the fact that biogas does not count in the way that you describe. However, I will discuss that with Andrew Davies to see where we go on that.

You talked about the footprint of waste collection. It is right to say that we should, as much as possible, minimise the distance that waste travels. That said, the means of recycling and processing waste need to be positioned in a place where they can be reached by five or six different local authorities, which means, inevitably, that some travel will be involved. The economics of it mean that it is difficult to have a recycling plant in every local authority

credu bod hynny'n wir, er bod rhai'n honni hynny, a bod eraill yn cynnig dyddiadau eraill. Yr hyn sy'n wir yw na fydd gennym le, yn y diwedd, rywbyrd yn y dyfodol, mewn safleoedd tirlenwi. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig inni edrych ar bob opsiwn ar gyfer y dyfodol o ran gwaredu gwastraff.

Un o'r opsiynau hynny yw lleihau maint y gwastraff yn y lle cyntaf—ac mae cyfraith Ewrop yn ddefnyddiol yn hyn o beth—yn ogystal ag ailgylchu cymaint â phosibl. Mae'n anochel ei bod yn dod yn haws ailgylchu rhai pethau o dipyn i beth—ac mae plastig, a ddefnyddiwyd fel enghraifft gennych, yn un ohonynt. Tan yn ddiweddar yr oedd yn anodd ailgylchu plastig. Mae'r economeg o ran ailgylchu plastig ar hyn o bryd yn golygu ei fod yn cael ei anfon i Tsieina a'r dwyrain pell i gael ei ailgylchu. Y rheswm am hynny, yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, yw mai gwaith y mae'n rhaid ei wneud â llaw yw hyn o hyd. Oherwydd nad oes peiriannau ar gael ar hyn o bryd i ddioli poteli o wahanol liwiau, fel sydd ar gael ar gyfer gwydr, rhaid ei wneud â llaw, sy'n golygu, yn anffodus, y bydd yn mynd i ble bynnag y mae'r gweithwyr llaw rhataf ar gael. Dyna yw'r sefyllfa ar hyn o bryd. Dros amser, hoffwn weld hynny'n dod i ben. Yr wyf am weld sefyllfa lle y bydd gennym beiriannau, yn arbennig, a thechnoleg a all wneud y gwaith, fel nad oes rhaid ei gludo mor bell ag a wneir ar hyn o bryd.

O ran dulliau amgen o waredu gwastraff, a bionwy yn arbennig, mae bionwy yn gweddu'n well i bortffolio Andrew Davies fel ffynhonnell ynni. Yr wyf yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa a'r ffaith nad yw bionwy'n cyfrif yn y ffordd a ddisgrifir gennych. Fodd bynnag, trafodaf hynny gydag Andrew Davies i weld beth y gallwn ei wneud yn ei gylch.

Soniasoch am ôl-troed casglu gwastraff. Mae'n iawn dweud y dylem, hyd y bo modd, leihau'r pellter a deithir gan wastraff. Wedi dweud hynny, rhaid i ailgylchu a phrosesu gwastraff gael ei leoli mewn man sydd o fewn cyrraedd pump neu chwe awdurdod lleol gwahanol, sy'n golygu, yn anffodus, y bydd rhaid teithio rhywfaint. Mae economeg hyn yn golygu ei bod yn anodd cael canolfan ailgylchu o fewn ardal pob awdurdod lleol—rhaid i un ganolfan wasanaethu sawl

area—one plant must serve several different local authorities to make it economically viable. Therefore, some travel will be involved, which we cannot get away from. However, the fact that we are recycling more would offset the fact that material is travelling distances that are a little longer than they would otherwise be. We need to try to avoid travelling great distances for landfill in the future, and we are monitoring that.

John Griffiths: Since I have been an Assembly Member, I have watched the Waste Savers organisation in Newport grow impressively, in partnership with the local authority. Do you agree that we can learn a lot from Waste Savers' achievements? For example, it has been able to change attitudes. It has an educational role—it is getting into schools and getting children to its new centre or premises, and when those children take on board good, positive environmental messages, they tend to educate their parents, which is an effective way of changing attitudes.

At the same time, we have now moved to fortnightly collections of landfill waste in some areas of Newport, and, although the prophets of doom said that people would never accept it—that people with large families, for example, would find that they were simply not able to have their waste collected on a fortnightly basis without it overflowing the landfill bin and creating all sorts of unpleasant consequences in their back gardens and so on—that has not proved to be the case. In addition, because of the Waste Savers kerbside collections, and the composters and garden waste bins that are available in Newport, people are able to put out their waste for landfill on a fortnightly basis and are recycling a great deal more. This shows that it is possible to educate people and change attitudes, even though many people said it was not possible. Are there lessons here, Carwyn, for us to spread across Wales?

Carwyn Jones: Yes. Newport is a good example of how to spread the message when it comes to recycling. I notice two things when I discuss recycling with people, the first of which is that children see recycling as normal. Often, when you visit schools, you

awdurdod lleol gwahanol er mwyn bod yn hyfyw o safbwynt economaidd. Felly, bydd rhaid teithio rhywfaint, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth na ellir ei osgoi. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffaith ein bod yn ailgylchu mwy yn gwneud iawn am y ffaith bod gwastraff yn teithio ychydig ymhellach nag a fyddai fel arall. Rhaid inni geisio osgoi teithio pellteroedd mawr i safleoedd tirlenwi yn y dyfodol, ac yr ydym yn monitro hynny.

John Griffiths: Ers pan wyf yn Aelod o'r Cynulliad, yr wyf wedi gweld y mudiad Waste Savers yng Nghasnewydd yn tyfu'n sylweddol, mewn partneriaeth â'r awdurdod lleol. A ydych yn cytuno y gallwn ddysgu llawer yn sgîl yr hyn y mae Waste Savers wedi'i gyflawni? Er enghraifft, mae wedi llwyddo i newid agweddau. Mae ganddo rôl addysgol—mae'n gwahodd ysgolion a phlant i'w ganolfan neu ei adeilad newydd, a phan fydd y plant hynny yn derbyn negeseuon amgylcheddol da a phositif, maent yn dueddol o addysgu eu rhieni, sy'n ffordd effeithiol o newid agweddau.

Ar yr un pryd, yr ydym wedi cyflwyno casglu gwastraff tirlenwi bob pythefnos mewn rhai rhannau o Gasnewydd ac, er bod y proffwydi gwae wedi dweud na fyddai pobl yn barod i dderbyn hynny—y byddai pobl gyda theuluoedd mawr, er enghraifft, yn gweld na fyddent yn gallu dygymod â chasglu eu gwastraff bob pythefnos heb i hwnnw orlenwi'r bin gwastraff tirlenwi ac achosi pob math o ganlyniadau anghynnes yn eu gerddi ac yn y blaen—gwelwyd nad yw hynny'n wir. Hefyd, oherwydd casgliadau Waste Savers ar fin y ffordd, a'r compostwyr a'r biniau gwastraff gardd sydd ar gael yng Nghasnewydd, mae pobl yn gallu rhoi eu bin gwastraff tirlenwi allan bob pythefnos ac maent yn ailgylchu llawer mwy. Mae hyn yn dangos bod modd addysgu pobl a newid agweddau, er bod llawer o bobl wedi dweud na fyddai modd gwneud hynny. A oes gwersi yma, Carwyn, y gallwn eu lledaenu ar draws Cymru?

Carwyn Jones: Oes. Mae Casnewydd yn enghraifft dda o sut y mae lledaenu'r neges o ran ailgylchu. Yr wyf yn sylwi ar ddau beth pan fyddaf yn trafod ailgylchu gyda phobl, y cyntaf yw bod plant yn gweld ailgylchu fel rhywbeth cwbl naturiol. Yn aml, pan

see that children who are involved with recycling believe it is normal to recycle and think that that is how they will live in the future. That mindset did not exist 20 or 30 years ago. Adults tend to be more difficult to persuade, although people tend to want to do their bit as long as what they put out is collected from outside their front doors. That is why it is so important that more local authorities develop kerbside schemes. However, a scheme that my local authority in Bridgend introduced last month to collect bottles in an open plastic container has led to many people complaining that they do not want their neighbours to know what they have drunk over the past fortnight. I suppose, therefore, that there are also some downsides to it. However, in the main, the scheme has been very successful, and we need to encourage its introduction across the rest of Wales.

David Lloyd: When will the Welsh Assembly Government explicitly rule out incineration as an option for local authorities?

Carwyn Jones: If Plaid Cymru has an alternative, I would be very happy to hear what it is. We are, inevitably, keen to encourage energy from waste, but all these things must go through the normal planning process—it is axiomatic that people want their rubbish collected but not disposed of near them, and that is something that the planning system must always contend with.

Brynle Williams: I welcome the opportunity to speak to this matter this afternoon. I also commend the Welsh Assembly Government's response to, and endorsement of, the majority of the committee's recommendations. As many of my colleagues have touched upon other issues, I draw attention in particular to recommendation 22. I am glad that the problem of farm plastics waste is recognised by the Government. With an estimated 18,000 tonnes of black plastic waste on farms alone, it is obviously a serious issue that needs urgent action. Will the Minister give confirmation that private

fyddwch yn ymweld ag ysgolion, gwelwch fod plant sydd wedi arfer ailgylchu'n credu ei fod yn rhywbeth naturiol a'u bod yn credu mai dyna sut y byddant yn byw yn y dyfodol. Nid oedd meddylfryd o'r fath yn bod 20 neu 30 mlynedd yn ôl. Mae'n dueddol o fod yn anos ceisio perswadio oedolion, er bod pobl yn tueddu i fod yn awyddus i wneud eu rhan ar yr amod bod yr hyn y maent yn ei roi allan yn cael ei gasglu o'r tu allan i'w drws ffrynt. Dyna pam mae mor bwysig bod mwy o awdurdodau lleol yn datblygu cynlluniau casglu ar fin y ffordd. Fodd bynnag, arweiniodd cynllun a gyflwynwyd gan fy awdurdod lleol i ym Mhen-y-bont ar Ogwr y mis diwethaf lle y cesglir poteli mewn cynhwysydd plastig agored at nifer o gwynion gan bobl nad oeddent am i'w cymdogion weld faint yr oeddent wedi'i yfed yn ystod y pythefnos diwethaf. Mae'n debyg, felly, fod iddo rai anfanteision. Fodd bynnag, at ei gilydd, mae'r cynllun wedi bod yn llwyddiannus dros ben, ac mae angen inni annog ei gyflwyno ledled Cymru.

David Lloyd: Pa bryd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru am ddatgan yn ddiamwys nad yw llosgi'n opsiwn i awdurdodau lleol?

Carwyn Jones: Os oes gan Blaid Cymru opsiwn arall, byddwn yn falch iawn o glywed beth ydyw. Yr ydym, wrth reswm, yn awyddus i weld ynni'n cael ei gynhyrchu allan o wastraff, ond rhaid i'r holl bethau hyn fynd drwy'r broses gynllunio arferol—mae'n amlwg bod pobl am i'w sbwriel gael ei gasglu ond ar yr un pryd nid ydynt am ei weld yn cael ei waredu'n agos atynt, ac mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i'r system gynllunio ddelio ag ef bob amser.

Brynle Williams: Yr wyf yn croesawu'r cyfle i siarad ar y mater hwn y prynhawn yma. Yr wyf hefyd yn canmol ymateb Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac yn falch iddi gefnogi'r rhan fwyaf o argymhellion y pwyllgor. Gan fod llawer o fy nghyd-Aelodau wedi crybwyll materion eraill, hoffwn dynnu sylw'n fwyaf arbennig at argymhelliad 22. Yr wyf yn falch bod problem gwastraff plastig ffermydd yn cael ei chydnabod gan y Llywodraeth. Gydag amcangyfrif o 18,000 tunnell o wastraff plastig du ar ffermydd yn unig, mae'n amlwg yn fater pwysig y mae'n rhaid gweithredu

companies will receive sufficient encouragement from the Welsh Assembly Government, particularly in the development of marketing recyclates, so that the task of recycling this plastic waste can begin as soon as possible?

Carwyn Jones: Several new companies are coming into the market to deal with waste plastics from farms. They see that there is a market there, and they are seeking to fulfil the demand. The concerns that existed at one time, that we may end up in a situation where farm plastics were not being dealt with, have largely been overcome.

arno ar fyrder. A wnaiff y Gweinidog gadarnhau y bydd cwmnïau preifat yn derbyn anogaeth ddigonol gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, yn enwedig o ran datblygu marchnata defnyddiau wedi'u hailgylchu, fel bod modd dechrau ar y dasg o ailgylchu gwastraff plastig cyn gynted â phosibl?

Carwyn Jones: Mae nifer o gwmnïau'n awr yn ymuno â'r farchnad i ddelio â gwastraff plastig ffermydd. Maent yn gweld bod marchnad ar ei gyfer, ac maent yn ceisio diwallu'r galw. Mae'r pryderon a fodolai ar un adeg, y gallem yn y diwedd gael sefyllfa lle nad oedd neb yn delio â phlastigau ffermydd, wedi'u tawelu i raddau helaeth.

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) 2005 Approval of the Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2005

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that

the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 25 section 3:

1. *approves the draft Plant Protection Products (Amendment) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 November 2005; and*

2. *notes the explanatory memorandum for this Order laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 November 2005. (NDM2668)*

Y Llywydd: Nid oes unrhyw un am siarad ar y cynnig hwn, felly symudwn yn syth at bleidlais.

4.30 p.m.

*Cynnig (NDM2668): O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2668): For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Chapman, Christine

Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynig iaf fod

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 25 adran 3:

1. *yn cymeradwyo drafft y Rheoliadau Cynhyrchion Diogelu Planhigion (Diwygio) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 8 Tachwedd 2005; a*

2. *yn nodi'r memorandwm esboniadol ar gyfer y Gorchymyn hwn a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2668)*

The Presiding Officer: No-one wishes to speak on this motion, so we will move directly to the vote.

Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davies, Andrew
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Gibbons, Brian
 Graham, William
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

Cymeradwyo Rheoliadau Cyngorau Ysgol (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the School Councils (Wales) Regulations 2005

The Business Minister (Jane Hutt): I propose that
Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt): Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales considers the principle of the School Councils (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005. (NDM2670)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Cyngorau Ysgol (Cymru) 2005 y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2670)

I propose that

Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 November 2005 in relation to the draft School Councils (Wales) Regulations 2005; and

1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 8 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Rheoliadau Cyngorau Ysgol (Cymru) 2005; a

2. approves that the School Councils (Wales)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau

Regulations 2005 are made in accordance with:

i) the draft laid in the Table Office on 1 November 2005;

ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 7 November 2005; and

iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 8 November 2005. (NDM2671)

William Graham: I am sorry that the Minister is not here to hear these words of congratulation. This is a first for Wales. School councils can be a powerful aid for improvement in schools, uniting staff and students. Some people think that it is a takeover, but it will not be that, but rather an extension of a partnership that can lead to significant changes in the relationships between pupils and staff. Pilot schemes in England have already shown that school councils lead to substantial reductions in truancy and in bullying.

A school council can change the behaviour of pupils and lead to improved academic achievement, an increase in community involvement and, as I said before, a reduction in bullying, which is to be welcomed. It also introduces participation in a voting process, and that of itself is an aid to citizenship, as, hopefully, voting will become a habit in young people that extends into their adult lives. It also gives new skills in terms of negotiation, debating, action planning, decision making and consultation. This is a real first for Wales and should be greatly encouraged.

Mark Isherwood: I support school councils. Only yesterday, I was in the North Wales Visitor Centre in Colwyn Bay meeting a primary school council from Hawarden, and, not so long ago, I met a secondary school council in the Wrexham area. In both cases, I was hugely impressed by the calibre and the interest of the young people, by the standard of the questions that they put to us and by

Cynghorau Ysgol (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

i) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 1 Tachwedd 2005;

ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 7 Tachwedd 2005; a

iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2671)

William Graham: Mae'n drueni nad yw'r Gweinidog yma i glywed y llongyfarchiadau hyn. Mae hyn yn beth newydd sbon yng Nghymru. Gall cynghorau ysgolion fod yn ffordd rymus o wella ysgolion, gan uno'r staff a'r myfyrwyr. Cred rhai pobl fod myfyrwyr yn cymryd yr awenau, ond nid felly y bydd, ond estyniad o bartneriaeth a all arwain at newidiadau mawr yn y berthynas rhwng y disgyblion a'r staff. Mae cynlluniau peilot yn Lloegr wedi dangos eisoes fod cynghorau ysgolion yn arwain at ostyngiadau sylweddol o ran triwantiaeth a bwlio.

Gall cyngor ysgol newid ymddygiad y disgyblion ac arwain at well llwyddiant academiaidd, cynnydd o ran cyfranogiad cymunedol ac, fel y dywedais o'r blaen, llai o fwlio, ac mae hynny i'w groesawu. Mae hefyd yn cyflwyno'r syniad o gyfranogi mewn proses o bleidleisio, ac mae hynny ynddo'i hun yn cynorthwyo dinasyddiaeth, a'r gobaith yw y bydd pleidleisio'n dod yn arferiad ymhlith y bobl ifanc a fydd yn ymestyn i'w bywydau fel oedolion. Mae hefyd yn rhoi sgiliau newydd iddynt o ran negodi, cynnal dadl, cynllunio camau gweithredu, gwneud penderfyniadau ac ymgynghori. Mae Cymru'n wirioneddol flaengar yn hyn o beth a dylid ei annog i'r eithaf.

Mark Isherwood: Yr wyf yn cefnogi cynghorau ysgolion. Ddoe, yr oeddwn yng Nghanolfan Ymwelwyr Gogledd Cymru ym Mae Colwyn yn cwrdd â chyngor ysgol gynradd o Benarlâg, ac, yn weddol ddiweddar, cyfarfûm â chyngor ysgol uwchradd yn ardal Wrecsam. Yn y ddau achos, gwnaed argraff fawr arnaf gan galibr a diddordeb y bobl ifanc, gan safon y

their thirst for knowledge about the Assembly and life in general. My only concern, and I hope that the Minister will address this, is that, at present, success is achieved through the enthusiasm and support provided by teachers, headteachers and governing bodies. How are we going to ensure that that enthusiasm and support will be achieved in schools that are required to do this, because, for some reason, they have not already opted to do it?

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I am absolutely delighted to bring these regulations before the Assembly today, because this is not just a Wales first, it is a UK first. No other part of the United Kingdom is making regulations to ensure that all schools have school councils. These regulations will also provide opportunities for associate pupil governors to go on to governing bodies. This is a really important development in our participation agenda. I am grateful for Members' support.

We have put additional funding into the budget to ensure that the statutory development can be taken forward appropriately. There will be £400,000 in the 2006-07 financial year. This is the part-year cost because the requirement commences from November next year. In 2007-08 and 2008-09, £680,000 will be provided to local education authorities to take this forward. This is a piece of Welsh history, and I encourage Members to support the motion.

cwestiynau y bu iddynt eu gofyn inni a'u hawch am wybodaeth am y Cynulliad a bywyd yn gyffredinol. Yr unig bryder sydd gennyf, a gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn rhoi sylw i hyn, yw bod y llwyddiant yn digwydd ar hyn o bryd drwy frwdfrydedd a chefnogaeth yr athrawon, y penaethiaid a'r cyrff llywodraethol. Sut y gallwn sicrhau y ceir y brwdfrydedd hwnnw a'r gefnogaeth honno mewn ysgolion y bydd yn ofynnol iddynt wneud hyn, a hwythau, am ryw reswm, heb ddewis gwneud hyn eisoes?

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Pleser o'r mwyaf yw i mi ddwyn y rheoliadau hyn gerbron y Cynulliad heddiw, oherwydd nid peth newydd i Gymru'n unig yw hyn, mae'n newydd i'r Deyrnas Unedig. Nid oes yr un rhan arall o'r Deyrnas Unedig yn gwneud rheoliadau i sicrhau bod gan bob ysgol gyngor ysgol. Bydd y rheoliadau hyn hefyd yn rhoi cyfle i ddisgyblion fod yn ddisgyblion-lywodraethwyr cyswllt ar gyrff llywodraethol. Mae hyn yn ddatblygiad pwysig iawn yn ein hagenda gyfranogi. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar am gefnogaeth yr Aelodau.

Rhoesom gyllid ychwanegol yn y gyllideb i sicrhau y bydd modd bwrw ymlaen â'r datblygiad statudol mewn modd priodol. Bydd £400,000 ym mlwyddyn ariannol 2006-07. Cost rhan o'r flwyddyn yw hyn oherwydd y mae'r gofyniad yn dechrau ym mis Tachwedd y flwyddyn nesaf. Yn 2007-08 a 2008-09, rhoddir £680,000 i awdurdodau addysg lleol i fwrw ymlaen â hyn. Mae hyn yn rhan o hanes Cymru, ac anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig.

Cynnig (NDM2670): O blaid 45, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.

Motion (NDM2670): For 45, Abstain 0, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn

Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2671): O blaid 44, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2671): For 44, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise

Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.35 p.m.
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.35 p.m.*

Llwybrau Dysgu Learning Pathways

The Deputy Presiding Officer: I have selected amendments 1, 7 and 8 in the name of David Melding, and amendments 2, 3, 4, 5 and 6 in the name of Kirsty Williams.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 7 ac 8 yn enw David Melding, a gwelliannau 2, 3, 4, 5 a 6 yn enw Kirsty Williams.

The Deputy Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Christine Chapman): I propose that

Y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Christine Chapman): Cynigiad fod

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the report of the Deputy Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, '14-19 Learning Pathways in Wales';

1. yn nodi adroddiad y Dirprwy Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, 'Llwybrau Dysgu 14 -19 yng Nghymru';

2. notes the recommendations made by the Deputy Minister for taking forward the 14-19 agenda;

2. yn nodi argymhellion y Dirprwy Weinidog ar gyfer bwrw ymlaen ag agenda 14-19;

3. agrees that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning should develop an action plan for 14-19 learning pathways. (NDM2672)

3. yn cytuno y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer llwybrau dysgu 14-19. (NDM2672)

I am pleased that we have an opportunity today to debate the ambitious and radical

Yr wyf yn falch bod cyfle heddiw inni drafod yr agenda uchelgeisiol a radical yr

agenda that we are planning for learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds. The recommendations that I made for taking this forward, in the report that I launched on 9 November, will drive the next stages of transforming the agenda even further. Learning pathways is one of the Welsh Assembly Government's flagship policies, and we have developed it in a unique way, involving all the stakeholder organisations and young people themselves.

Why are we carrying out this major piece of educational reform? After all, our GCSE, AS and A-level results are at an all-time high, and we now enter more young people for these awards than at any other time in our history. However, this masks a situation that we cannot allow to continue if our young people are to receive education and training that prepares them appropriately for employment in a modern economy and/or progression into further and higher education.

The first reason for reforming education and training for 14 to 19-year-olds is that we cannot accept a situation where nearly 50 per cent of our young people do not achieve the equivalent of five A* to C GCSE grades at the age of 16, and thereafter do not involve themselves in any further education and training. We must find a way of ensuring that young people participate in education up to the age of 19 in far greater numbers than at present, in a wider range of courses and qualifications that interest and motivate them to achieve the highest levels of achievement of which they are capable and to stay involved thereafter in lifelong learning. Secondly, we need to attain greater collaboration between schools, colleges and training organisations to offer young people the widest possible range of courses. Thirdly, we have to ensure that vocational learning becomes at least as strong in our education system for 14 to 19-year-olds as traditional academic courses. To achieve anything else would be to sell short the needs of employers in Wales and young people themselves. As in other parts of the UK, we have talked about achieving parity of esteem between academic and vocational qualifications for far too long.

ydym yn ei chynllunio ar gyfer llwybrau dysgu i rai 14 hyd 19 oed. Bydd yr argymhellion a wneuthum o ran bwrw ymlaen â hyn, yn yr adroddiad a lansiais ar 9 Tachwedd, yn sbarduno rhannau nesaf y gwaith o drawsffurfio'r agenda ymhellach fyth. Mae'r llwybrau dysgu'n un o brif bolisiau Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, ac yr ydym wedi ei ddatblygu mewn modd unigryw, gan gynnwys yr holl gyrrff sy'n rhanddeiliaid a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain.

Pam yr ydym yn cyflawni'r diwygiad addysgol enfawr hwn? Wedi'r cwbl, mae ein canlyniadau TGAU, Uwch Gyfrannol a Safon Uwch yn well nag erioed, a bellach mae mwy o bobl ifanc yn sefyll yr arholiadau hynny nag erioed o'r blaen. Fodd bynnag, mae hyn yn celu sefyllfa na allwn adael iddi barhau os yw ein pobl ifanc am gael addysg a hyfforddiant a fydd yn eu paratoi'n briodol ar gyfer gwaith mewn economi fodern a/neu fynd yn eu blaenau i addysg bellach ac uwch.

Y rheswm cyntaf dros ddiwygio addysg a hyfforddiant i rai 14 hyd 19 oed yw'r ffaith na allwn dderbyn sefyllfa lle nad yw bron 50 y cant o'n pobl ifanc yn llwyddo i gael pum A* i C yn eu graddau TGAU yn 16 oed, ac wedi hynny nid ydynt yn cael dim addysg bellach na hyfforddiant. Rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd o sicrhau bod llawer mwy o bobl ifanc yn cyfranogi mewn addysg hyd nes byddant yn 19 oed nag sydd ar hyn o bryd, a hynny mewn amrywiaeth helaethach o gyrsiau a chymwysterau sy'n eu diddori a'u hysgogi i gyflawni'r lefelau uchaf y medrant ymgynraedd atynt o ran cyflawniad a pharhau i gyfranogi mewn dysgu gydol oes wedi hynny. Yn ail, rhaid inni sicrhau mwy o gydweithio rhwng yr ysgolion, y colegau a'r cyrff hyfforddi er mwyn cynnig y dewis helaethaf posibl o gyrsiau i bobl ifanc. Yn drydydd, rhaid inni sicrhau bod dysgu galwedigaethol yn tyfu nes ei fod o leiaf cyn gryfed yn ein system addysg i rai 14 hyd 19 oed â'r cyrsiau academaidd traddodiadol. Byddai cyflawni unrhyw beth arall yn bradychu anghenion cyflogwyr Cymru a'r bobl ifanc eu hunain. Fel rhannau eraill o'r Deyrnas Unedig, yr ydym wedi sôn am sicrhau'r un parch at gymwysterau academaidd a galwedigaethol ers gormod o lawer o amser.

Eleanor Burnham: Why are many further education colleges, particularly those that I am aware of in north Wales, having funding difficulties in maintaining vocational courses? In my opinion, those courses are the key to lifelong learning and dipping in and out of education.

Christine Chapman: You will know, Eleanor, that there has been a lot of discussion about funding, and we must put the learner at the heart of those discussions. For too many years, there has been far too much competition, and with FE colleges, schools and training organisations working as equal partners, I think that we will do a far better job to suit the needs of our learners and the economy.

The learning pathways programme provides an opportunity to finally achieve this in a way that will act as a beacon to the rest of the UK. We particularly need to do all this in some of our most deprived areas, where the disengagement of young people and the consequent low level of their skills and qualifications is most critical. We must change 14-19 education and training to achieve social justice for these young people.

Since January, when I was asked by the Minister to undertake this review, I have visited all the networks that are developing the 14-19 reforms in each of our 22 local authorities, as well as a large number of key organisations. First-rate work is already going on, and we need to ensure that that is replicated in all parts of Wales. I pay tribute to the organisations and individuals that I visited; I was struck by their enthusiasm, commitment and innovation. It was good to hear about what they are doing and to hear their views on 14-19 developments at ground level.

4.40 p.m.

The report provides recommendations with regard to several key areas. On the section dealing with courses, curriculum and learning pathways, work-focused experience must play a stronger part in the education and training of 14 to 19-year-olds, so that their

Eleanor Burnham: Pam mae llawer o golegau addysg bellach, yn enwedig y rhai y gwn amdanynt yn y Gogledd, yn wynebu anawsterau o ran cynnal cyrsiau galwedigaethol? Yn fy marn i, y cyrsiau hynny yw'r allwedd i ddysgu gydol oes a mynd i mewn ac allan o addysg.

Christine Chapman: Gwyddoch, Eleanor, fod llawer o drafod wedi bod ar gyllid, a rhaid inni roi'r dysgwr yng nghanol y trafodaethau hynny. Ers gormod o flynyddoedd, mae llawer gormod o gystadleuaeth, ac wrth i'r colegau addysg bellach, yr ysgolion a'r cyrff hyfforddi weithio fel partneriaid cyfartal, credaf y byddwn yn gwneud pethau'n well o lawer ar gyfer anghenion ein dysgwyr a'r economi.

Mae rhaglen y llwybrau dysgu'n gyfle inni gyflawni hyn o'r diwedd mewn modd a fydd yn esiampl i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Mae gwir angen inni wneud hyn oll yn rhai o'n hardaloedd mwyaf difreintiedig, lle y mae ymddieithriad y bobl ifanc a lefel isel y sgiliau a'r cymwysterau sydd ganddynt o ganlyniad i hynny'n bur enbyd. Rhaid inni newid addysg a hyfforddiant 14-19 er mwyn sicrhau cyfiawnder cymdeithasol ar gyfer y bobl ifanc hyn.

Ers mis Ionawr, pan ofynnodd y Gweinidog imi wneud yr adolygiad hwn, yr wyf wedi ymweld â phob rhwydwaith sydd wrthi'n datblygu'r diwygiadau 14-19 ym mhob un o'r 22 awdurdod lleol, ynghyd â nifer fawr o gyrff allweddol. Mae gwaith rhagorol yn mynd rhagddo eisoes, ac mae angen inni sicrhau y bydd hynny'n digwydd ym mhob rhan o Gymru. Talaf deyrnged i'r cyrff a'r unigolion hynny yr ymwelais â hwy; yr oeddwn yn rhyfeddu at eu brwdfrydedd, eu hymroddiad a'u dyfeisgarwch. Yr oedd yn braf clywed am yr hyn y maent yn ei wneud a chlywed eu barn am y datblygiadau 14-19 ar lawr gwlad.

4.40p.m.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnig argymhellion ynghylch nifer o feysydd allweddol. O ran yr adran sy'n ymwneud â chysiau, y cwricwlwm a llwybrau dysgu, rhaid i brofiadau sy'n canolbwyntio ar waith chwarae rhan gryfach yn addysg a

learning is authentic and related to real-life situations. We must ensure equality of opportunity for all young people, breaking down, for example, stereotyping in relation to vocational learning. The Welsh baccalaureate, subject to evaluation, should be made available to all schools, colleges and work-based trainers as soon as possible. The national curriculum for 14 to 16-year-olds will need to be changed so that it is aligned with 14-19 reforms, and for seven to 14-year-olds, so that they are prepared appropriately for the new 14-19 curriculum.

On learner support, the role of the learning coach and training for that role will need to be further developed. Personal support services, including counselling, will need to be provided. On networks and collaboration, greater collaboration at local level between various stakeholders and providers of 14-19 education and training will be essential if our ambitions for reform are to be achieved.

The report contains a section on the future role of the community consortia for education and training, and that needs to be looked at. It is also essential to involve employers in the 14-19 agenda as fully as possible.

Owen John Thomas: You will agree that a sea change is needed if we are to really persuade youngsters who are not academically inclined to take up these opportunities. More than that, we have to provide the opportunities for them to use their skills and hone them to then get jobs as plumbers, electricians and bricklayers and so on, and reduce the fees charged by these people so that we can be more competitive as a nation. Where will you find the trainers to teach these skills? At present, the teachers in our schools are academically trained, so how will we provide that workforce? When you tell me that, and when you show me the programme—

hyfforddiant y rhai 14 hyd 19 oed, fel y bydd eu dysgu'n ddilys ac yn ymwneud â sefyllfaoedd yn y byd go iawn. Rhaid inni sicrhau cyfle cyfartal i'r holl bobl ifanc, gan chwalu, er enghraifft, y stereoteipio o ran dysgu galwedigaethol. Dylai bagloriaeth Cymru, wedi iddi gael ei gwerthuso, fod ar gael i bob ysgol, pob coleg a phob hyfforddydd yn y gweithle cyn gynted ag y bo modd. Bydd angen newid y cwricwlwm cenedlaethol ar gyfer rhai 14 hyd 16 oed fel y bydd wedi ei wneud yn gydnaws â'r diwygiadau 14-19, ac ar gyfer rhai saith hyd 14 oed, fel eu bod yn cael eu paratoi'n iawn ar gyfer y cwricwlwm newydd 14-19.

O ran cynnal y dysgwr, bydd angen datblygu rhagor ar rôl yr hyfforddydd dysgu a'r hyfforddiant a roddir ar gyfer y rôl honno. Bydd angen cynnig gwasanaethau cymorth personol, gan gynnwys cwnsela. O ran rhwydweithiau a chydweithio, bydd rhagor o gydweithio lleol ymhlith yr amrywiol randdeiliaid a'r rhai sy'n darparu addysg a hyfforddiant 14-19 yn hanfodol os ydym am wireddu'r uchelgeisiau sydd gennym ar gyfer y diwygiadau.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys adran am rôl y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant at y dyfodol, ac mae angen edrych ar hynny. Mae hefyd yn hanfodol cynnwys cyflogwyr yn yr agenda 14-19 a hynny yn y modd llawnaf posibl.

Owen John Thomas: Cytunwch fod angen newid pethau'n ddirfawr os ydym mewn gwirionedd am berswadio pobl ifanc nad oes ganddynt ddiddordeb mewn pynciau academiaidd i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd hyn. Yn fwy na hynny, rhaid inni gynnig y cyfleoedd iddynt ddefnyddio eu sgiliau a'u hogi er mwyn cael swyddi fel plymwr, trydanwyr a bricwyr ac yn y blaen, a gostwng y ffioedd y mae'r bobl hyn yn eu codi fel y medrwn fod yn fwy cystadleuol fel cenedl. Ym mha le y cewch yr hyfforddwyr i ddysgu'r sgiliau hyn? Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r athrawon sydd yn ein hysgolion wedi cael hyfforddiant academiaidd, felly sut y darparwn y gweithlu hwnnw? Wedi i chi ddweud hynny wrthyf, a phan ddangoswch y rhaglen imi—

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Order. **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Trefn. Dylai

Interventions should be brief.

Christine Chapman: I want to address that issue in the point about vocational skills, because that is a huge agenda, but we have to start properly on this as well. On vocational qualifications, we need major initiatives led by the sector skills councils and the Vocational Skills Champion for Wales, whose appointment by the Minister has been widely welcome. Also, in my report, I state that a taskforce should be set up by the Assembly Government to transform the status and take-up of vocational learning routes for our 14 to 19-year-olds.

On funding, careful consideration will need to be given to the funding mechanisms to be employed in supporting and enabling 14-19 reform to take place. On communication, my recommendations emphasise how important it is that we provide clear and concise information on learning pathways to everyone. The development of a high-profile communications strategy—and work on this is well developed—will ensure that everyone who needs to know about this will become aware of this exciting programme. I look forward to the forthcoming discussions on these recommendations, which include two regional conferences in December 2005, before the development of an action plan to take forward the learning pathways agenda.

Briefly, with regard to the amendments tabled to today's motion, we are in support of amendments 1, 3, 4, 5 and 7, but we cannot, however, support amendments 2, 6 and 8. On amendment 2, we agree with the general principle, but we cannot realistically direct employer organisations to ensure that places are made available, because we need to work in partnership with employers. This is what the Welsh Assembly Government is doing and will continue to do, and that is where the emphasis lies. With regard to amendment 6, I have already mentioned CCETs, but I will emphasise further that, due to time constraints, it was impossible for me to meet all the CCETs, and I therefore felt that more work needed to be done before a firm decision on their future was made.

ymyriadau fod yn fyr.

Christine Chapman: Yr wyf am roi sylw i'r mater hwnnw yn y pwynt sy'n ymwneud â sgiliau galwedigaethol, oherwydd y mae honno'n agenda enfawr, ond rhaid inni ddechrau'n briodol yn hyn o beth hefyd. O ran cymwysterau galwedigaethol, mae arnom angen mentrau sylweddol dan adain y cynghorau sgiliau sector a'r Hyrwyddwr Sgiliau Galwedigaethol dros Gymru, y cafwyd croeso mawr i'w benodiad gan y Gweinidog. Hefyd, yn fy adroddiad, dywedaf y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sefydlu tasglu i drawsffurfio statws llwybrau dysgu galwedigaethol ar gyfer y rhai 14-19 a'r niferoedd sy'n dilyn y llwybrau hynny.

O ran cyllid, bydd rhaid ystyried yn ofalus y mecanweithiau cyllido a ddefnyddir i gefnogi'r diwygiadau 14-19 a'u galluogi i ddigwydd. O ran cyfathrebu, mae fy argymhellion yn pwysleisio pwysigrwydd rhoi gwybodaeth glir a chryno ynghylch llwybrau dysgu i bawb. O ddatblygu strategaeth gyfathrebu a fydd yn cael cryn sylw—ac mae'r gwaith o wneud hynny'n mynd rhagddo'n dda—sicrheir y bydd pawb y mae angen iddo/iddi wybod am hyn yn ymwybodol o'r rhaglen gyffrous hon. Edrychaf ymlaen at y trafodaethau a ddaw ynghylch yr argymhellion hyn, gan gynnwys dwy gynhadledd ranbarthol ym mis Rhagfyr 2005, cyn datblygu cynllun gweithredu i frw ymlaen ag agenda'r llwybrau dysgu.

Yn gryno, o ran y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd i'r cynnig heddiw, yr ydym yn cefnogi gwelliannau 1, 3, 4, 5 a 7, ond ni allwn, fodd bynnag, gefnogi gwelliannau 2, 6 ac 8. Ynghylch gwelliant 2, cytunwn â'r egwyddor gyffredinol, ond o fod yn realistig ni allwn gyfarwyddo cyrff y cyflogwyr i sicrhau bod lleoedd ar gael, oherwydd bod rhaid inni weithio mewn partneriaeth gyda'r cyflogwyr. Dyna y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ei wneud a dyna y bydd yn parhau i'w wneud, a dyna lle y mae'r pwyslais. O ran gwelliant 6, yr wyf eisoes wedi crybwyll CCET, ond pwysleisiaf ymhellach, oherwydd cyfyngiadau amser, na fu'n bosibl imi gwrdd â phob CCET, ac felly teimlwn fod angen gwneud rhagor o waith cyn gwneud penderfyniad terfynol ynghylch eu dyfodol.

In my recommendations, I gave two possible routes by which we could seek to address this issue. Therefore, we do not accept the amendment, but further work needs to be done as soon as possible.

We do not accept amendment 8, as it is not clear what exactly it means. If it means the independent sector running education in Wales, we wholeheartedly reject the principle. If it means the involvement of external partners, including employers, their organisations, and the voluntary sector and so on, it is already a feature of learning pathways.

I regard the 14-19 programme to be of fundamental importance to the future prosperity and wellbeing of Wales. It is essential that we equip our young people with the skills, experiences, knowledge and understanding that will enable them to succeed in the Wales of the twenty-first century. My report suggests that we are well on the way towards achieving this ambition. It is encouraging to hear that the highly prestigious Nuffield Foundation, which is carrying out a major review of the 14-19 curriculum in England and Wales, and which launched its second annual report on 2 November, believes that what we are doing in Wales points the way ahead for the rest of the UK.

The Deputy Presiding Officer: Before I call for comments on the amendments, a number of speakers wish to contribute on this important matter, and Members will have five minutes to make their contribution. However, I appeal to Members to make short contributions where they can, because it is possible, subject to the wishes of Plenary, for us to finish by about 5.40 p.m., without necessitating a motion to allow an extension.

William Graham: I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: insert at the end of point 3:

and believes that the action plan should recognise the value of vocational studies that enable students to seek highly skilled employment, as well as the qualifications that prepare students for further and higher

Yn fy argymhellion, cynigiais ddwy ffordd bosibl o geisio mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn. Felly, nid ydym yn derbyn y gwelliant, ond mae angen gwneud gwaith pellach cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Nid ydym yn derbyn gwelliant 8, oherwydd nid yw'n glir beth yn union y mae'n ei olygu. Os yw'n golygu y byddai'r sector annibynnol yn rhedeg addysg yng Nghymru, yr ydym yn erbyn yr egwyddor yn llwyr. Os yw'n golygu cynnwys partneriaid allanol, gan gynnwys cyflogwyr, eu sefydliadau, a'r sector gwirfoddol ac yn y blaen, mae eisoes yn nodwedd ar lwybrau dysgu.

Yr wyf yn barnu bod y rhaglen 14-19 yn sylfaenol bwysig i ffyniant a lles Cymru yn y dyfodol. Mae'n hanfodol inni arfogi ein pobl ifanc â'r sgiliau, y profiadau, y wybodaeth a'r ddealltwriaeth a fydd yn eu galluogi i lwyddo yng Nghymru yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain. Mae fy adroddiad yn awgrymu ein bod wedi dod ymhell o ran gwireddu'r uchelgais hwn. Mae'n galonogol clywed bod Sefydliad Nuffield, y corff hynod nodedig sy'n cynnal adolygiad eang o'r cwricwlwm 14-19 yng Nghymru a Lloegr, ac a lansiodd ei ail adroddiad blynyddol ar 2 Tachwedd, yn credu bod yr hyn yr ydym yn ei wneud yng Nghymru yn dangos y ffordd ar gyfer gweddill y Deyrnas Unedig.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd: Cyn imi ofyn am sylwadau ar y gwelliannau, mae ar nifer o siaradwyr eisiau cyfrannu ar y pwynt pwysig hwn, a bydd gan Aelodau bum munud i wneud eu cyfraniad. Er hynny, gofynnaf i Aelodau wneud cyfraniadau byr lle y gallant, oherwydd y mae'n bosibl, os mai hynny yw dymuniad y Cyfarfod Llawn, y gallwn orffen erbyn tua 5.40 p.m., heb orfod cael cynnig i ganiatáu estyniad.

William Graham: Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: cynnwys ar ddiwedd pwynt 3:

ac yn credu y dylai'r cynllun gweithredu gydnabod gwerth astudiaethau galwedigaethol sy'n galluogi myfyrwyr i geisio cael swyddi sy'n gofyn am sgiliau arbennig, yn ogystal â'r cymwysterau sy'n

education studies.

I propose amendment 7. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

welcomes the acknowledgement of a 'need for a step change in employer engagement' in the development of learning pathways.

I propose amendment 8. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

calls on the Welsh Assembly Government to increase the involvement of the independent sector in the development of learning pathways.

In moving the amendments, I am grateful to the Minister for indicating that she will accept amendments 1 and 7, but I am very concerned that she will not accept amendment 8. She has got the wrong end of the stick completely on that one. We are discussing the need to:

'increase the involvement of the independent sector in the development of learning pathways'.

It is perfectly clear—we are saying that you must get employers to tell you exactly what they need in terms of the skills to be developed. It is no good for you to set out things. That is not our intention. I hope that it is something that you will consider in your final remarks. In saying so, we broadly welcome the objectives outlined in the report, although we note with a degree of concern that the Deputy Minister indicates in her introduction that there were time constraints placed upon her wider considerations of the proposed programme. Perhaps they were time constraints largely forced on the Deputy Minister by the incorporation of Education and Learning Wales into the Assembly Government—political considerations not considerations solely for providing better education.

Setting those objections aside, the report contains an unnecessary amount of verbiage. Within the proposals put forward, we share two major concerns. It is good to set aspirations for having 95 per cent of the

paratoi myfyrwyr ar gyfer astudiaethau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch.

Cynigiaf welliant 7. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth bod 'angen newid sylweddol yn y ffordd y mae cyflogwyr yn ymwneud â' datblygu llwybrau dysgu.

Cynigiaf welliant 8. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i gynyddu cyfranogaeth y sector annibynnol yn y broses o ddatblygu llwybrau dysgu.

Wrth gynnig y gwelliannau, yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am nodi y bydd yn derbyn gwelliannau 1 a 7, ond yr wyf yn bryderus iawn na fydd yn derbyn gwelliant 8. Mae wedi camddeall yn llwyr ynghylch hwnnw. Yr ydym yn trafod yr angen i:

'gynyddu cyfranogaeth y sector annibynnol yn y broses o ddatblygu llwybrau dysgu'.

Mae'n berffaith glir—dweud yr ydym fod yn rhaid ichi gael gan gyflogwyr ddweud wrthy ch beth yn union sydd arnynt ei angen o ran pa sgiliau i'w datblygu. Ni thâl i chi ddweud sut mae am fod. Nid dyna ein bwriad. Gobeithio ei fod yn rhywbeth y byddwch yn ei ystyried yn eich sylwadau terfynol. Wrth ddweud hynny, yr ydym yn croesawu'r amcanion a gyflwynir yn yr adroddiad at ei gilydd, er ein bod yn nodi gyda pheth pryder fod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn dweud yn ei rhagarweiniad na chafodd ddigon o amser i ystyried mwy ar y rhaglen arfaethedig. Efallai mai cyfyngiadau amser oeddent a orfodwyd yn bennaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog yn sgîl ymgorffori Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru o fewn Llywodraeth y Cynulliad—ystyriaethau gwleidyddol ac nid ystyriaethau i ddarparu gwell addysg yn unig.

A rhoi'r gwrthwynebiadau hynny heibio, mae'r adroddiad yn oreiriog. O fewn y cynigion a roddir gerbron, mae gennym ddau bryder mawr. Mae'n beth da anelu at gael 95 y cant o bobl Cymru yn barod ar gyfer

people in Wales ready for university or high-skilled employment by the age of 25. We must be realistic about the opportunities to allow people to take the education and the skills that they acquire into their workplaces, or be able to use them within their wider communities. We require an action plan that fully recognises the value of vocational studies and which enables students to seek highly skilled employment, as well as the qualifications to prepare students for further and higher education studies. We must set out clearly defined pathways to achieve that requirement. Sadly, these proposals are often confusing and layers overlap, preventing a pure clarity of direction.

I note that the proposals introduce learning coaches, but we need the Minister or her deputy to confirm the qualification pathway and reassure us that it is not a way of doing things on the cheap, as NUT Cymru fears. The role of the teacher and a teaching qualification must not only be retained; it should also be enhanced. Teachers groups have described the report as meaningless and lacking clarity. In responding to the points made during the debate, we hope that the Deputy Minister can provide that meaning and clarity.

We also need to incorporate more fully the impact of pupil exclusion and truancy on the overall attainment of qualifications, where they are for more skilful employment or as an entry into further or higher education.

The Deputy Minister also proposes recognition for partly completing a baccalaureate course, recognising our concerns about the numbers of students dropping out of the education pathway.

4.50 p.m.

There are points that deserve welcoming, and we urge the Minister to take them forward. One of these is the acknowledgement of a need for a step change in employer engagement in the development of such pathways. We must engage more effectively with the independent sector to ensure that we

prifysgol neu waith hyfedr erbyn eu bod yn 25 oed. Rhaid inni fod yn realistig ynghylch y cyfleoedd sy'n caniatáu i bobl drosglwyddo'r addysg a'r sgiliau a gânt i'r gweithle, neu i fedru eu defnyddio o fewn eu cymunedau ehangach. Mae angen cynllun gweithredu sy'n llwyr gydnabod gwerth astudiaethau galwedigaethol ac sy'n galluogi myfyrwyr i geisio cael swyddi sy'n gofyn am sgiliau arbennig, yn ogystal â'r cymwysterau i'w paratoi ar gyfer astudiaethau addysg bellach ac uwch. Rhaid inni gynnig llwybrau wedi eu diffinio'n glir i gyflawni'r gofyniad hwnnw. Gwaetha'r modd, mae'r cynigion hyn yn aml yn ddryslyd ac mae elfennau'n gorgyffwrdd, gan atal unrhyw eglurder gwirioneddol o ran cyfeiriad.

Nodaf fod y cynigion yn cyflwyno hyfforddwyr dysgu, ond mae angen i'r Gweinidog neu ei dirprwy gadarnhau'r llwybr cymhwyster, a'n sicrhau nad ffordd o wneud pethau'n rhatach ydyw, fel y mae NUT Cymru'n ofni. Rhaid sicrhau bod rôl yr athro a'r cymhwyster dysgu nid yn unig yn cael ei chadw; dylid hefyd ei gwella. Mae grwpiau athrawon wedi disgrifio'r adroddiad fel un diystyr ac aneglur. Wrth ymateb i'r pwyntiau a wneir yn ystod y ddadl, yr ydym yn gobeithio y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog roi'r ystyr a'r eglurder hwnnw.

Hefyd mae angen inni ymgorffori'n llawnach yr effaith y mae gwahardd disgyblion a thriwantiaeth yn ei chael ar ennill cymwysterau yn gyffredinol, boed y rheini ar gyfer cael swydd sy'n gofyn am well sgiliau neu er mwyn symud ymlaen at addysg bellach neu uwch.

Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog hefyd yn cynnig cydnabyddiaeth am gwblhau cwrs bagloriaeth yn rhannol, gan gydnabod ein pryderon ynghylch nifer y myfyrwyr sy'n rhoi'r gorau i'r llwybr addysg.

Mae rhai pwyntiau sy'n haeddu cael eu croesawu, a phwyswn ar y Gweinidog i weithredu ar y rhain. Un ohonynt yw cydnabod bod angen newid sylweddol yn y ffordd y mae cyflogwyr yn ymwneud â datblygu'r llwybrau hyn. Rhaid inni ymgysylltu'n fwy effeithiol â'r sector

are meeting its requirements for jobs in our education pathways. We need a role for the private sector, but it is not about wholesale privatisation; it is about acting as a spur and a challenge for innovation and improvement. That was said by Bill Rammell, the Labour Minister of State for Lifelong Learning, Further and Higher Education.

We must see this report in the light of Sir Andrew Foster's comments about the United Kingdom education system as a whole. Sadly, we continue to fall behind other countries, particularly those in the far east, in investing in the country's future through education. As he comments, we are not just 100 metres behind in the education race but we are in danger of being lapped. These views, from a report commissioned by the Labour Westminster Government, specify the requirements outlined in the Conservative amendments, about wider engagement with the independent sector. The report was prepared by the UK education Minister, who can fully focus on the best educational needs of students and not on trying to be different for the sake of it. This view is increasingly shared by Welsh Labour MPs, as they see the variation in service provision between England and Wales, and conclude that this Labour Assembly administration is failing.

If the Deputy Minister can lead a pathway through the verbiage, ensure a more positive engagement with the independent sector, which directs curriculum content towards meeting those requirements, reassure teachers that their role will not be diminished, and outline how these proposals are better for Wales and not simply different for Wales, then we have a potential pathway forwards for all our students.

Peter Black: I propose the following amendments in the name of Kirsty Williams. Amendment 2: add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that in considering the development of 'work-focused learning pathways' the Minister should ensure that practical

annibynnol i sicrhau ein bod yn cwrdd â'i ofynion ar gyfer swyddi yn ein llwybrau addysg. Mae angen inni gael rôl i'r sector preifat, ond nid mater o breifateiddio ar raddfa eang ydyw; mater o herio a sbarduno nes peri bod arloesi a gwella'n digwydd ydyw. Dywedwyd hyn gan Bill Rammell, y Gweinidog Gwladol Llafur dros Ddysgu Gydol Oes, Addysg Bellach ac Uwch.

Rhaid inni weld yr adroddiad hwn yng ngoleuni sylwadau Syr Andrew Foster am system addysg y Deyrnas Unedig yn gyfan gwbl. Gwaetha'r modd, yr ydym yn parhau ar ei hôl hi yn ymyl gwledydd eraill, yn enwedig rhai yn y dwyrain pell, o ran buddsoddi yn nyfodol ein gwlad drwy addysg. Fel y dywed, nid 100 metr ar ei hôl hi yn y ras addysg yr ydym; mae perygl inni gael ein lapio. Mae'r farn hon, mewn adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth Lafur yn San Steffan, yn nodi'r gofynion a amlinellir yng ngwelliannau'r Ceidwadwyr, ynghylch ymgysylltu'n ehangach â'r sector annibynnol. Paratowyd yr adroddiad gan Weinidog Addysg y DU, sy'n gallu canolbwyntio'n llawn ar anghenion addysgol gorau myfyrwyr ac nid ar geisio bod yn wahanol er ei fwyn ei hun. Yn gynyddol, mae Aelodau Seneddol Llafur Cymru'n cyd-fynd â'r farn hon, gan eu bod yn gweld y gwahaniaeth o ran darparu gwasanaethau rhwng Cymru a Lloegr, ac yn dod i'r casgliad bod gweinyddiaeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn methu.

Os gall y Dirprwy Weinidog dorri llwybr drwy'r geiriogrwydd, sicrhau ymgysylltu mwy cadarnhaol â'r sector annibynnol, sy'n cyfeirio cynnwys y cwricwlwm at fodloni'r gofynion hynny, tawelu meddyliau athrawon i'w darbwylllo na fydd eu rôl yn cael ei lleihau, ac amlinellu sut y mae'r cynigion hyn yn well i Gymru yn hytrach na'u bod yn wahanol i Gymru, yna bydd gennym lwybr posibl ymlaen i'n myfyrwyr i gyd.

Peter Black: Cynigiaf y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw Kirsty Williams. Gwelliant 2: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu wrth ystyried datblygu 'llwybrau dysgu sy'n canolbwyntio ar waith' y dylai'r Gweinidog sicrhau bod profiad ymarferol o

experience of working in the appropriate environment is fundamental to gaining a qualification and directs the Minister to liaise with the relevant employers' organisations to ensure that appropriate places are made available.

I propose amendment 3. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

welcomes the commitment that the Welsh baccaulaureate qualification will be made available to all schools, colleges and training organisations in Wales from September 2007.

I propose amendment 4. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

believes that the new role of learning coaches should not undermine the need for learning to be led by fully qualified teachers.

I propose amendment 5. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

notes the continuing concern of Estyn at the variable quality of work-based learning experiences and calls on the Minister to address this in her action plan.

I propose amendment 6. Add as a new point at the end of the motion:

regrets that the report fails to make clear recommendations on the future of community consortia for education and training (CCETs) and calls on the Minister to clarify her intentions in this regard as soon as possible.

I welcome the report in general, but it is long overdue that we have this study of learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds. I have several concerns about the report and a number of issues with it. Overall, we have started on a path that will, hopefully, take us in the right direction and to the right conclusions. My concern is that the pathway set out in this report is so overgrown with jargon that we are having problems getting down to the nitty-gritty of what it recommends. However, that is a rather petty complaint, so I will move on to the substance of the report.

weithio yn yr amgylchedd priodol yn hanfodol er mwyn sicrhau cymhwyster ac yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i gysylltu â sefydliadau perthnasol y cyflogwyr er mwyn sicrhau bod lleoedd priodol ar gael.

Cynigiaf welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad y bydd cymhwyster bagloriaeth Cymru ar gael i bob ysgol, coleg a sefydliad hyfforddi yng Nghymru o fis Medi 2007 ymlaen.

Cynigiaf welliant 4. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn credu na ddylai swyddogaeth newydd hyfforddwyr dysgu danseilio'r ffaith bod angen i'r dysgu fod dan ofal athrawon sydd wedi cymhwyso'n llawn.

Cynigiaf welliant 5. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn nodi pryder parhaus Estyn am ansawdd amrywiol profiadau dysgu yn y gwaith ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i fynd i'r afael â hyn yn ei chynllun gweithredu.

Cynigiaf welliant 6. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

yn gresynu at y ffaith nad yw'r adroddiad yn gwneud argymhellion clir ynghylch dyfodol consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant (CAAH) ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i egluro'i bwriadau yn y cyswllt hwn cyn gynted ag y bo modd.

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad ar y cyfan, ond yr oedd yn hen bryd inni gael yr astudiaeth hon o lwybrau dysgu i rai 14-19 oed. Mae gennyf sawl pryder ynghylch yr adroddiad a nifer o faterion i'w codi yn ei gylich. Yn gyffredinol, yr ydym wedi cychwyn ar hyd llwybr a fydd, gobeithio, yn ein harwain i'r cyfeiriad iawn ac at y casgliadau iawn. Fy mhryder yw bod y llwybr a gyflwynir yn yr adroddiad hwn yn cynnwys cymaint o jargon fel ein bod yn cael trafferth deall glo mân ei argymhellion. Fodd bynnag, cwyn braidd yn ddiwbys yw hynny, felly symudaf ymlaen at sylwedd yr

adroddiad.

I note from the report that this is work in progress, certainly in terms of vocational qualifications. We have had a study by the Deputy Minister and she has come out of that study with a recommendation that we now have a taskforce. That is an indication that the Government is still feeling its way in terms of coming to a settled conclusion on what it wants to do with vocational qualifications. That is a concern and I would hope that we could have more clarity, from the Minister or the Deputy Minister, whoever will respond to this debate, on what exactly we expect to come out of that taskforce, what we are expecting it to do and what sort of timescale it will be working to.

The amendment that we have tabled in terms of work experience is crucial. In the report, the Deputy Minister recommends that we develop a programme combining workplace learning with study at school or college. The vocational element, she says, within the 14-19 learning pathways could be devised from learning frameworks based on industry standards set by sector skills councils, and she talks about combined apprenticeships to create quality routes for young people who are attracted to a more practical style of learning. All of those are worthy and supportable. However, although I welcome this development, we should not underestimate the problems faced by those who choose a vocational route in consolidating their training.

An article in the *Western Mail* last week identified, for example, that, in the last 12 months, 3,740 students completed plumbing courses at Welsh colleges, but, according to the British Plumbing Employers Council, only 43 have gained Welsh modern apprenticeship certificates, which require practical experience of working in a plumbing business. At a minimum cost of £2,600 per student, Education and Learning Wales has invested a total of £9.7 million of public money to secure only 43 fully qualified plumbers. This is not just about value for money, however; it is also about the frustration and disillusionment felt by those

Nodaf o'r adroddiad mai gwaith sy'n mynd rhagddo yw hyn, yn sicr o ran cymwysterau galwedigaethol. Cawsom astudiaeth gan y Dirprwy Weinidog, ac yn sgîl yr astudiaeth honno cawsom argymhelliad ganddi i sefydlu tasglu. Mae hynny'n awgrymu bod y Llywodraeth yn dal i ymbalfalu o ran dod i gasgliad pendant ynghylch yr hyn y mae arni eisiau ei wneud gyda chymwysterau galwedigaethol. Mae hynny'n peri pryder a byddwn yn gobeithio y gallem gael mwy o eglurder, gan y Gweinidog neu'r Dirprwy Weinidog, pwy bynnag fydd yn ymateb i'r ddadl hon, ynghylch beth yn union yr ydym yn ei ddisgwyl gan y tasglu hwnnw, beth yr ydym yn disgwyl iddo ei wneud, a pha fath o amserlen a fydd ganddo.

Mae'r gwelliant yr ydym wedi ei gyflwyno ynglŷn â phrofiad gwaith yn hanfodol. Yn yr adroddiad, mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn argymhell ein bod yn datblygu rhaglen i gyfuno dysgu yn y gweithle ag astudio yn yr ysgol neu'r coleg. Mae'n dweud y gellid llunio'r elfen alwedigaethol yn y llwybrau dysgu 14-19 o fframweithiau dysgu a fyddai'n seiliedig ar safonau mewn diwydiant, wedi eu gosod gan y cynghorau sgiliau sector, ac mae'n sôn am brentisiaethau cyfun i greu llwybrau o safon i bobl ifanc sy'n cael eu denu gan ddull mwy ymarferol o ddysgu. Mae'r rhain i gyd yn werth chweil ac i'w cefnogi. Fodd bynnag, er fy mod yn croesawu'r datblygiad hwn, ni ddylem ddibrisio'r problemau a wynebir gan rai sy'n dewis llwybr galwedigaethol wrth gwblhau eu hyfforddiant.

Er enghraifft, yn ôl erthygl yn y *Western Mail* yr wythnos diwethaf, yr oedd 3,740 o fyfyrwyr yn y 12 mis blaenorol wedi cwblhau cyrsiau plymio mewn colegau yng Nghymru, ond, yn ôl Cyngor Cyflogwyr Plymio Prydain, dim ond 43 a enillodd dystysgrifau prentisiaeth fodern yng Nghymru, sy'n gofyn am brofiad ymarferol o weithio mewn busnes plymio. Drwy dalu £2,600 o leiaf am bob myfyriwr, mae Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru wedi buddsoddi cyfanswm o £9.7 miliwn o arian cyhoeddus i gael dim ond 43 o blymwyr cwbl gymwysedig. Ond nid mater o werth am arian yn unig yw hyn; mae'n ymwneud hefyd â'r rhwystredigaeth a'r dadrithiad a deimlir

students who are not able to acquire the certificate because of the lack of opportunity to consolidate their training.

Jeff Cuthbert: I accept that there has to be proper joined-up thinking between educationalists and employers; I do not think that anyone would deny that, and that is the thrust of this. However, in terms of your amendment 2 on work-focused learning pathways, can you clarify what you mean when you say that practical experience of working in the appropriate environment is fundamental to gaining a qualification? Are you saying that, unless there is work experience in a workplace, students cannot gain the qualification? If so, what are you going to say to those colleges that have good simulated environments capable of delivering practical experience?

Peter Black: Actually, I was just giving you an example of exactly what I meant by that. Only those 43 plumbers received a certificate because they were the ones who got work experience. The problem in that regard seems to be the cost to employers of taking on apprenticeships. There is no support from the Government to cover the cost of trainees, which can include covering time off to study, which amounts to 30 days out of a working year of 220 days. The Government needs to consider that particular issue, and try to address where work experience is needed and where it is provided. That is the problem.

On our other amendments, we welcome the Welsh baccalaureate being rolled out from 2007. This initiative was pioneered under the partnership Government, of course, and it is important in terms of developing a student-centred education system. It is interesting to note that the report states that many students have found the task of completing the key skills element onerous, and that this has led to a lower completion rate. I hope that that will be addressed.

I have also referred to Estyn's report on the variable quality of work-based learning, and, as time is short, I am sure that that can be picked up when we consider it in the

gan y myfyrwyr hynny nad ydynt yn gallu cael y dystysgrif oherwydd diffyg cyfle i gwblhau eu hyfforddiant.

Jeff Cuthbert: Derbyniaf fod yn rhaid I addysgwyr a chyflogwyr feddwl yn gydlynol; ni chredaf y byddai neb yn gwadu hynny, a dyna fyrdwn hyn. Fodd bynnag, o ran eich gwelliant 2 ynghylch llwybrau dysgu sy'n canolbwyntio ar waith, a allwch egluro beth a feddylwch wrth ddweud bod profiad ymarferol o weithio yn yr amgylchedd priodol yn hanfodol i ennill cymhwyster? Ai dweud yr ydych, os nad yw profiad gwaith ar gael mewn gweithle, na fydd myfyrwyr yn gallu ennill eu cymhwyster? Os yw hynny'n wir, beth a ddywedwch wrth y colegau hynny sydd ag amgylcheddau efelychiadol da a all gynnig profiad ymarferol?

Peter Black: A dweud y gwir, rhoi enghraifft ichi yr oeddwn o'r hyn yr oeddwn yn ei feddwl yn union wrth ddweud hynny. Dim ond 43 o'r plymwyr hynny a enillodd dystysgrif gan mai hwy oedd y rhai a gafodd brofiad gwaith. I bob golwg, y broblem yn y cyswllt hwnnw yw'r gost i gyflogwyr o dderbyn prentisiaid. Nid oes dim cymorth gan y Llywodraeth i dalu am gost hyfforddeion, sydd weithiau'n golygu talu am roi amser i astudio, sy'n 30 diwrnod allan o flwyddyn waith 220 diwrnod. Rhaid i'r Llywodraeth ystyried y broblem benodol honno, a cheisio rhoi sylw i ble y mae angen profiad gwaith, ac ym mhle y'i darperir. Dyna'r broblem.

O ran ein gwelliannau eraill, yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith bod bagloriaeth Cymru'n cael ei rhoi ar waith fesul cam o 2007 ymlaen. Wrth gwrs, arloeswyd y fenter hon o dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth, ac mae'n bwysig o safbwynt datblygu system addysg myfyriwr-ganolog. Diddorol yw gweld bod yr adroddiad yn nodi bod llawer o fyfyrwyr yn cael y dasg o gwblhau'r elfen sgiliau allweddol yn feichus, a bod hyn wedi arwain at lai'n cwblhau'r fagloriaeth. Gobeithio y bydd hynny'n derbyn sylw.

Yr wyf hefyd wedi cyfeirio at adroddiad Estyn ar ansawdd amrywiol y dysgu yn y gweithle, a, chan fod amser yn brin, yr wyf yn siŵr y gellir sôn ymhellach am hyn pan

Education and Lifelong Learning Committee.

fyddwn yn ei ystyried yn y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes.

I conclude by referring to community consortia for education and training. The lack of substance and direction in terms of this particular issue is the most disappointing part of this report. We are debating the legislation for the merger of ELWa next week, but we still do not know how we are going to take forward the regional partnerships and what will happen to the CCETs in the future. There is a reference to sub-regional CCETs, but I am not quite sure what those are. I would like, as I am sure would the consortia, some form of timetable and a mechanism to take forward this particular recommendation, so that we and the people who are involved with CCETs know exactly if and when they will come to an end, and what their future is. I hope that the Minister can provide that information.

Yr wyf am gloi drwy gyfeirio at y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant. Y diffyg sylwedd a chyfeiriad yn y cyswllt arbennig hwn yw'r rhan fwyaf siomedig o'r adroddiad hwn. Byddwn yn cynnal dadl ar y ddeddfwriaeth ar gyfer uno ELWa yr wythnos nesaf, ond ni wyddom o hyd sut y byddwn yn symud ymlaen gyda'r partneriaethau rhanbarthol na beth fydd yn digwydd i'r consortia yn y dyfodol. Mae cyfeiriad at gonsortia is-ranbarthol, ond nid wyf yn siŵr iawn beth ydynt. Hoffwn gael rhyw fath o amserlen a mecanwaith ar gyfer gweithredu'r argymhelliad arbennig hwn, ac yr wyf yn siŵr yr hoffai'r consortia gael hynny hefyd, fel ein bod ni a'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â'r consortia yn gwybod yn union a ydynt yn dod i ben, pryd y dônt i ben a beth fydd eu dyfodol. Gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog yn gallu rhoi'r wybodaeth honno.

Irene James: This report is a welcome consolidation of current practice, and provides a benchmark for improvement to learning services for 14 to 19-year-olds. It is vital that young people have a clear learning pathway, whether their individual abilities are vested in academic achievement, craftsmanship, vocational excellence or the modern business environment.

Irene James: Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn atgyfnerthu'r arferion presennol, rhywbeth sydd i'w groesawu, ac yn rhoi meincnod ar gyfer gwella gwasanaethau dysgu i rai 14-19 oed. Mae'n hollbwysig bod gan bobl ifanc lwybr dysgu clir, boed eu galluoedd unigol yn ymwneud â chyflawniad academaidd, crefft, rhagoriaeth alwedigaethol neu â'r amgylchedd busnes modern.

We are trailblazing modern learning in Wales, with entrepreneurship now being part of the national curriculum, free breakfasts for the youngest learners and targeted investment where it can provide the most difference, namely during the earliest years of learning when deprivation, poverty and circumstance rob many of any career aspiration or ambition.

Yr ydym yn torri tir newydd yng nghyswllt dysgu modern yng Nghymru; mae entrepreneuriaeth bellach yn rhan o'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, darperir brecwastau am ddim i'r dysgwyr ieuengaf a thargedir buddsoddiad lle y gall wneud y gwahaniaeth mwyaf, sef ym mlynnyddoedd cynharaf y dysgu ar adeg pan fo amddifadedd, tlodi ac amgylchiadau yn gallu mygu sawl uchelgais neu ddyhead o ran gyrfa.

Feedback from a pathfinder project in England has shown the positive impact that a broadened 14-19 agenda, tailored to individual aptitudes and with more complete support, can deliver for young people. Highlights noted in the first and second year evaluation of the pathfinder project include better-than-expected collaboration, greater choice, including work-based and vocational-

Mae adborth gan brosiect braenaru yn Lloegr wedi dangos yr effaith gadarnhaol y gall agenda 14-19 ehangach, wedi ei haddasu ar gyfer galluoedd unigol a chyda chefnogaeth lwyrach, ei chael ar bobl ifanc. Ymhlith yr uchafbwyntiau yng ngwerthusiad blwyddyn gyntaf ac ail flwyddyn y prosiect braenaru yr oedd cydweithrediad gwell na'r disgwyl, mwy o ddewis, gan gynnwys dysgu yn y

based learning, improved advice and guidance for those passing through the 14-19 phase, and greater provision for variations in the pace of learning for higher achieving students. I am pleased to see successful elements of that strategy reflected in the report.

Learning pathways must be about delivering for all young learners in Wales.

Janet Ryder: You have talked about increasing support for those students who are more academic and who choose to follow an academic path. What are you going to say to those students at a high school in Merthyr Tydfil who want to study four A-levels, but have been told that they will be expelled if they do not follow the core baccalaureate?

5.00 p.m.

Irene James: We will have to address that, and I believe that I do so later in my speech.

In developing the action plan for learning pathways, I urge the Minister to reflect on the findings of this report, learn from experiences in England, develop and flesh out ideas such as the learning coach, and provide a framework to meet some of the challenges in the report, such as the greater involvement of employers and the business sector, given their competing priorities, highlighted in the report.

I would like to see provision in the action plan for special educational needs, and how it fits into the learning pathways agenda. This is where I will answer your question, Janet. If we are to achieve our vision of Wales, we must provide every learner in Wales with the opportunity to maximise their talents and skills—*[Interruption.]* I am about to finish, Janet.

Moreover, broader learning opportunities will allow young people to study their interests, providing a more enjoyable learning experience, and they are then more likely to continue with education into adult life.

gweithle a dysgu galwedigaethol, gwell cyngor ac arweiniad i rai'n pasio drwy'r cyfnod 14-19, a mwy o hyblygrwydd i amrywio cyflymder y dysgu i fyfyrwyr uwch eu cyrhaeddiad. Yr wyf yn falch o weld elfennau llwyddiannus o'r strategaeth honno yn cael eu hadlewyrchu yn yr adroddiad.

Rhaid i lwybrau dysgu gynnig darpariaeth i bob dysgwr ifanc yng Nghymru.

Janet Ryder: Yr ydych wedi siarad am roi mwy o gymorth i'r myfyrwyr hynny sy'n fwy academiaidd ac yn dewis dilyn llwybr academiaidd. Beth a ddywedwch wrth y myfyrwyr hynny mewn ysgol uwchradd ym Merthyr Tudful sydd eisiau astudio pedwar pwnc Safon Uwch, ond sydd wedi cael gwybod y cânt eu gwahardd os na fyddant yn dilyn y fagloriaeth graidd?

Irene James: Bydd yn rhaid inni roi sylw i hynny, a chredaf fy mod yn gwneud hynny'n ddiweddarach yn fy araith.

Wrth iddi ddatblygu'r cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer llwybrau dysgu, anogaf y Gweinidog i ystyried canfyddiadau'r adroddiad hwn, dysgu oddi wrth brofiadau yn Lloegr, datblygu a rhoi cig am esgryn syniadau fel yr hyfforddwr dysgu, a chynnig fframwaith i ateb rhai o'r heriau a geir yn yr adroddiad, fel y rhan fwy sydd i'w rhoi i gyflogwyr a'r sector busnes, o ystyried y blaenoriaethau gwahanol sydd ganddynt, y tynnwyd sylw atynt yn yr adroddiad.

Carwn weld darpariaeth yn y cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer anghenion addysgol arbennig, a'r modd y mae hynny'n cyd-fynd â'r agenda ar lwybrau dysgu. Yn y fan hon yr atebaf eich cwestiwn, Janet. Os ydym i wireddu ein gweledigaeth o Gymru, rhaid inni roi cyfle i bob dysgwr yng Nghymru gael datblygu ei dalentau a'i sgiliau i'r eithaf—*[Torri ar draws.]* Yr wyf ar fin gorffen, Janet.

Yn ogystal â hynny, drwy ymestyn cyfleoedd i ddysgu bydd modd i bobl ifanc astudio'r hyn sydd o ddiddordeb iddynt, gan roi profiad dysgu mwy pleserus, ac yna byddant yn fwy tebygol o barhau ag addysg yn eu bywyd fel oedolion.

Janet Ryder: Allowing children from the age 14 onwards, if they want to follow a more vocational pathway, to develop vocational qualifications on an equal basis to academic qualifications is certainly the right way to go for Welsh education. As the Deputy Minister said, this is a major piece of educational reform. The policies put forward in this document have the potential to change education completely. It is for that reason that the total lack of detail, structure and planning in some of these areas is quite frightening. It is frightening because if we are to embark on a major piece of educational reform, it needs to be thought through at every level. We need to think through the implications.

This document talks not only about a learning coach, but the learning support that a child might have. It also talks about young people who might need extra support outside of the learning situation, perhaps through youth and other community centres. We need clarification on what that will be. The document talks about a learning coach who might work with a group of young people, but if you are to have young people from the age of 14 onwards choosing to perhaps go to college for part of a week, and school for the other part, where will pastoral care for that individual child come from? That needs to be made clear. How will one person track, follow and work with that child? Will it be the learning coach, learning support, or this other person from the community who will provide support? Many of these young people, although aged 14, are quite immature. They are still quite young and need a lot of support, and we know that that pastoral support is not always provided in colleges.

There is another concern in that courses in many colleges change, and are not as fixed as they are in schools. Also, colleges change in terms of their organisation. Many schools are concerned that their students might apply for college courses, start them and then find that the funding in the college has changed and they cannot finish their course. Schools are greatly concerned about that.

Janet Ryder: Mae'n sicr mai'r ffordd iawn ymlaen i addysg yng Nghymru yw gadael i blant o 14 oed ymlaen ymgymryd â chymwysterau galwedigaethol sydd yn gyfartal â chymwysterau academiaidd, os ydynt yn dymuno dilyn llwybr mwy galwedigaethol. Fel y dywedodd y Dirprwy Weinidog, mae hyn yn ddiwygiad o bwys mewn addysg. Mae'r polisiau sydd wedi'u cyflwyno yn y ddogfen hon yn rhai a allai newid addysg yn llwyr. Oherwydd hynny, mae'r diffyg hollol o ran manylder, strwythur a chynllunio yn rhai o'r meysydd hyn yn ddigon i godi ofn ar rywun. Mae'n codi ofn oherwydd, os ydym yn ymgymryd â diwygiad addysgol o bwys, rhaid ei ystyried yn drwyadl ar bob lefel. Rhaid inni ystyried y goblygiadau i'r pen.

Mae'r ddogfen hon yn sôn nid yn unig am yr hyfforddwr dysgu, ond hefyd am y cymorth y gellid ei roi i'r plentyn ar gyfer dysgu. Mae'n sôn am bobl ifanc y gallai fod arnynt angen cymorth ychwanegol y tu allan i'r sefyllfa ddysgu, efallai drwy ganolfannau ieuenticid a chanolfannau cymunedol eraill. Rhaid inni gael eglurhad ynghylch yr hyn a gynigir. Mae'r ddogfen yn sôn am hyfforddwr dysgu a allai weithio gyda grŵp o bobl ifanc, ond os bydd pobl ifanc o 14 oed ymlaen yn dewis mynd i goleg am ran o'r wythnos o bosibl, ac i'r ysgol am y rhan arall, o ble y ceir y gofal bugeiliol ar gyfer plentyn o'r fath? Rhaid gwneud hynny'n glir. Sut y bydd un unigolyn yn gallu cadw golwg ar y plentyn hwnnw, a'i ddilyn a gweithio gydag ef? Ai'r hyfforddwr dysgu, y rhai sydd yn rhoi cymorth ar gyfer dysgu, neu rywun arall yn y gymuned a fydd yn ei helpu? Mae llawer o'r bobl ifanc hyn, er eu bod yn 14 oed, yn eithaf anaeddfed. Maent yn eithaf ifanc o hyd ac mae arnynt angen llawer o gymorth, a gwyddom na roddir cymorth bugeiliol bob amser mewn colegau.

Testun pryder arall yw bod cyrsiau mewn llawer o golegau'n newid, ac nad ydynt mor sefydlog â'r rhai mewn ysgolion. Hefyd, bydd trefniadaeth colegau'n newid. Mae llawer o ysgolion yn pryderu y gallai eu myfyrwyr wneud cais am gyrsiau mewn coleg, dechrau ar y cwrs a chanfod wedyn fod y dull o ariannu yn y coleg wedi newid ac na allant orffen eu cwrs. Mae ysgolion yn pryderu'n fawr am hynny.

The document clearly states that all children should have access, and that nothing should prevent someone from fulfilling his or her true potential. No-one can disagree with that, but how, in rural settings, will you provide access to all courses for all students? How will you bring that about? That is a major issue. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales is waiting to see the Government's response to that. How will you organise greater co-operation between schools, colleges and employers? There is no decision in this document, and no firm way forwards. In fact, the document states

'while there is no consensus around any single alternative, clearly this issue needs to be addressed.'

If this is to be the major pathway and major reform in education, Plaid Cymru needs a little more than that from the Government before we can fully support this document. Which will it be? Will it be the CCETs, the learning networks, or the young-people's partnerships? Which will take the lead in co-ordinating this work? How will you fund this? A young person will be in a secondary school setting from the age of 12 to 14, and that will be funded through the core funding for the whole school. The school will have a cohort that arrives at 14, and has to plan its funding for children aged 14 to 16. However, at 14, it will have a cohort for which it may not receive all of the funding for each pupil. If the young person chooses to study at college for some of the time, part of the funding will go to the college. What portion of that funding will go to the college? How will that be worked out? How will the funding follow the learner? What will the impact be on the school's core budget? The school has to be kept going.

There is not even a continuum for school funding for the ages of 14 to 19, as when pupils reach the age of 16 another funding mechanism kicks in; it moves over to ELWa funding, which is yet another funding mechanism. Far too many questions are left unanswered. Plaid Cymru would like to support this, but I am afraid that we will abstain until we get a better, and firmer

Mae'r ddogfen yn datgan yn glir y dylai pob plentyn gael mynediad, ac na ddylai dim atal rhywun rhag gwireddu ei wir botensial. Ni all neb anghytuno â hynny, ond sut y byddwch yn rhoi mynediad i'r holl gyrsiau i'r holl fyfyrwyr mewn lleoliadau gwledig? Sut y byddwch yn sicrhau hynny? Mae hynny'n fater o bwys. Mae Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales yn aros i weld beth fydd ymateb y Llywodraeth i hynny. Sut y byddwch yn trefnu mwy o gydweithredu rhwng ysgolion, colegau a chyflogwyr? Nid oes dim penderfyniad yn y ddogfen hon, na dim ffordd bendant ymlaen. Mewn gwirionedd, dywed y ddogfen

er nad oes dim consensws ar unrhyw ddewis penodol arall, mae'n amlwg bod angen ystyried y mater hwn.

Os mai hwn yw'r prif lwybr a'r diwygiad mawr sydd i fod mewn addysg, rhaid i Blaid Cymru gael ychydig mwy na hynny gan y Llywodraeth cyn y gallwn lwyr gefnogi'r ddogfen hon. Pwy a wnaiff hyn? Ai'r CCAH, y rhwydweithiau dysgu, neu'r partneriaethau pobl ifanc? Pa un a fydd yn arwain wrth gyd-drefnu'r gwaith hwn? Sut y byddwch yn ariannu hyn? Bydd disgybl mewn ysgol uwchradd rhwng 12 a 14 oed, a cheir arian ar gyfer y cyfnod hwnnw drwy'r cyllid craidd ar gyfer yr ysgol gyfan. Bydd carfan yn cyrraedd yr ysgol yn 14 oed, a rhaid i'r ysgol gynllunio ei chyllid ar gyfer plant 14 i 16 oed. Fodd bynnag, bydd ganddi garfan 14 oed na fydd efallai'n derbyn arian ar gyfer pob disgybl sydd ynddi. Os yw'r disgybl yn dewis astudio yn y coleg am ran o'r amser, aiff rhan o'r cyllid i'r coleg. Pa gyfran o'r cyllid hwnnw a aiff i'r coleg? Sut y cyfrifir hynny? Sut y bydd yr arian yn dilyn y dysgwr? Pa effaith a geir ar gyllideb graidd yr ysgol? Rhaid sicrhau bod yr ysgol yn dal i fynd.

Nid oes continwwm hyd yn oed ar gyfer cyllid ysgolion i'r oedran 14 i 19 oherwydd, pan fydd disgyblion yn cyrraedd 16 oed, bydd mecanwaith ariannu arall yn dechrau; mae'n troi'n gyllid gan ELWa, sef mecanwaith ariannu arall eto. Mae gormod o lawer o gwestiynau heb eu hateb. Carai Plaid Cymru gefnogi hyn, ond mae arnaf ofn y byddwn yn ymatal hyd nes y cawn arweiniad

direction from the Government. Unless we get clear answers, we will have to reconsider our support.

Denise Idris Jones: Thank you for that, Janet, we listened to everything that you said; it was very interesting. I welcome the report, '14-19 Learning Pathways in Wales', and I congratulate Christine Chapman, our Deputy Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning, on all the hard work that has gone into it. As a former secondary school teacher, I know how important it is for all young people aged between 14 and 19 to have a suitable learning pathway, whatever programme they follow, so that they have the experiences that will help them to develop the skills, competence and confidence to realise their potential in learning, employment and life.

In order to avoid pupil disengagement, it is vital that we listen to young people and offer them the best advice and experience, so that they either go into work, or into further or higher education, depending on what best suits them. That is a very important phrase—'that best suits them'. Offering young people high-quality work placements is vital. However, to be realistic, this is not always possible in all areas. For example, offering good-quality experiences through the medium of Welsh could be a challenge in some areas of my constituency. The learning coach is an encouraging concept. Good personal one-to-one support will help to tackle the problems of young people who are not in employment, education or training. These young people need support to give them the confidence to follow the pathway to learning, and eventually, hopefully, to employment.

For too long, possibly, young people have been encouraged to take the academic route. However, through the 14-19 phase and beyond, more young people have opportunities to acquire technical and vocational skills. This report will definitely fill the gap that has long existed in secondary schools and further education colleges, and will encourage the middle-range pupils into the workplace of their choice.

gwell a chadarnach gan y Llywodraeth. Os na chawn atebion pendant, bydd yn rhaid inni ailystyried ein cefnogaeth.

Denise Idris Jones: Diolch i chi am hynny, Janet, gwrandawsom ar bopeth a ddywedaso; yr oedd yn ddi-ddorol iawn. Croesawaf yr adroddiad, 'Llwybrau Dysgu 14-19 yng Nghymru', a llongyfarchaf Christine Chapman, ein Dirprwy Weinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, ar yr holl waith caled a wnaed arno. Fel cyn-athrawes ysgol uwchradd, gwn mor bwysig ydyw i'r holl bobl ifanc rhwng 14 a 19 oed gael llwybr dysgu addas, ni waeth pa raglen y maent yn ei dilyn, fel y cânt y profiadau a fydd yn eu helpu i feithrin y sgiliau, y cymhwysedd a'r hyder angenrheidiol i wireddu eu potensial wrth ddysgu ac mewn gwaith a bywyd.

Er mwyn osgoi ymddieithrio ymysg disgyblion, mae'n hollbwysig inni wrando ar bobl ifanc a chynnig y cyngor a'r profiad gorau, fel y byddant un ai'n mynd i weithio, neu'n mynd ymlaen i addysg bellach neu uwch, yn ôl yr hyn sydd fwyaf addas iddynt. Ymadrodd pwysig iawn yw hwnnw—'yr hyn sydd fwyaf addas iddynt'. Mae'n hollbwysig cynnig lleoliadau gwaith o safon dda i bobl ifanc. Fodd bynnag, a bod yn ymarferol, nid yw hynny'n bosibl bob amser ym mhob ardal. Er enghraifft, gallai fod yn anodd cynnig profiadau da drwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg mewn rhai rhannau o'm hetholaeth. Mae cysyniad yr hyfforddwr dysgu yn un calonogol. Bydd cymorth personol da fesul un yn fanteisiol wrth ddelio â phroblemau pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn gwaith, addysg neu hyfforddiant. Mae ar y bobl ifanc hynny angen cymorth i feithrin digon o hyder i ddilyn y llwybr at ddysgu ac, yn y pen draw, gobeithio, at waith.

Ers gormod o amser, o bosibl, mae pobl ifanc wedi'u hannog i ddilyn y llwybr academaidd. Fodd bynnag, drwy'r cyfnod 14-19 oed ac wedyn, mae mwy o bobl ifanc yn cael cyfleoedd i ddysgu sgiliau technegol a galwedigaethol. Bydd yr adroddiad hwn yn sicr o lenwi'r bwlch sy'n bod ers tro mewn ysgolion uwchradd a cholegau addysg bellach, a bydd yn cymell y disgyblion canolig i fynd i'r gweithle y maent yn ei ddewis.

Mark Isherwood: Action must be taken to ensure that young people in Wales are ready for high-skilled employment, further or higher education. This must be based on equality of opportunity and parity of esteem for all. However, we must despair of ever achieving this when the more that the Welsh Assembly Government boasts of evidence-led policy, the more the opposite becomes evident. It is time for empty consultation to end and to be replaced with real planning and delivery by front-line educational professionals and the business sector.

After eight years of Labour in London, and six in Cardiff, the reality is that 52,300 young people in Wales, 16 per cent of the total, are not in education, training or employment. It is a disgrace that so many young people have not been given the skills to improve themselves and the communities in which they live. The proportion of young people not continuing in education, training or employment has increased since the Assembly came into being in 1999. Even among those in work, one third are not in any form of training or education. Careers Wales figures show that the number of pupils not continuing in education, training or employment increased last year. The number of young people with missed special educational needs entering the youth justice system has increased. Assaults on teachers in Wales have increased, and the number of temporary exclusions of pupils in Wales has doubled. The way in which the Welsh Assembly Government has frozen out Resolv, after it produced the groundbreaking 'Lost Children of Wales' report, is unforgivable.

5.10 p.m.

That report found that, today, in Welsh schools, too many young people are made economically disabled, entering the workforce with results that alarm employers. It found that young people want to succeed, yet employers complain that school ill-equips them and leaves them poorly motivated; and young people agreed with that assessment.

Mark Isherwood: Rhaid cymryd camau i sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yng Nghymru'n barod ar gyfer cyflogaeth hyfedr neu addysg bellach neu uwch. Rhaid seilio hynny ar gyfle cyfartal a pharch cydradd i bawb. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn sicr o anobeithio ynghylch cyflawni hynny byth oherwydd po fwyaf y bydd Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n ymffrostio am bolisi sydd yn cael ei arwain gan dystiolaeth, mwyaf yn y byd a welir i'r gwrthwyneb. Mae'n bryd rhoi'r gorau i ymgynghori dibwrpas ac yn ei le cael cynllunio a gweithredu go iawn gan weithwyr addysg proffesiynol y rheng flaen a'r sector busnes.

Ar ôl wyth mlynedd o Lafur yn Llundain, a chwech yng Nghaerdydd, y gwir yw nad yw 52,300 o bobl ifanc yng Nghymru, 16 y cant o'r cyfanswm, mewn addysg, hyfforddiant na gwaith. Mae'n warthus bod cynifer o bobl ifanc heb gael y sgiliau y mae arnynt eu hangen i'w gwella eu hunain a'r cymunedau lle y maent yn byw. Mae cyfran y bobl ifanc nad ydynt yn parhau mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu waith wedi tyfu ers sefydlu'r Cynulliad yn 1999. Hyd yn oed ymysg y rhai sydd mewn gwaith, ceir un rhan o dair nad ydynt yn derbyn dim math o hyfforddiant neu addysg. Mae ffigurau Gyrfa Cymru yn dangos bod nifer y disgyblion nad ydynt yn parhau mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu waith wedi codi y llynedd. Mae nifer y bobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion addysgol arbennig na sylwyd arnynt sydd yn mynd i mewn i'r system cyfiawnder ieuencid wedi codi. Bu mwy o ymosodiadau ar athrawon yng Nghymru, ac mae nifer y gwaharddiadau dros dro ar ddisgyblion yng Nghymru wedi dyblu. Mae'r modd y mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wedi anwybyddu Resolv, wedi iddo lunio'r adroddiad arloesol 'Lost Children of Wales', yn anfaddeuol.

Canfu'r adroddiad hwnnw fod gormod o bobl ifanc mewn ysgolion yng Nghymru heddiw yn cael eu gwneud yn analluog yn economaidd, a'u bod yn ymuno â'r gweithlu gyda chanlyniadau sydd yn codi braw ar gyflogwyr. Canfu fod pobl ifanc yn dymuno llwyddo, ond mae cyflogwyr yn cwyno nad yw'r ysgol yn eu paratoi'n ddigonol a'i bod

That is of particular concern when headteachers state that these forgotten young people can represent up to 50 per cent of a year group. The research found that we must remove the wall between work and what is taught in schools, by teaching the curriculum in a work-related context, rather than simply bussing young people around between providers on short-term work experience placements.

The report concluded that the 14-19 agenda is not being addressed by the Welsh Assembly Government, which has instead taken a long and expensive time to regurgitate what people already know and to confirm what was said in its previous report, four years earlier. If Wales is to achieve growth and close the prosperity gap, our education system must stop betraying this lost generation. Even the areas of Wales that boast of low unemployment, such as Flintshire and Wrexham, suffer from high economic inactivity among the young. Eighty per cent of applicants for the Airbus apprenticeship scheme fail their basic literacy and numeracy tests. However, rather than tackle this, we are presented today with a list of recommendations that suggest that Sir Humphrey fathered a brood of Welsh children who are now alive and well and working for the Welsh Assembly Government.

What, for instance, does the section on transparency and strategic continuity of funding actually mean? Is it just another attempt to conceal the fact that, once again, the Welsh Assembly Government is putting policy before planning, procedure and pricing—and clear red water between Labour in London and Rhodri in Cardiff? It is not only profoundly unprofessional; it is a breach of duty and a betrayal of the pupils, teachers and employers of Wales. As the chief executive of my professional body states:

‘while schools can and should play a key role in preparing young people for the world of

yn eu gadael heb fawr o gymhelliant; ac yr oedd pobl ifanc yn cytuno â'r asesiad hwnnw. Mae hynny'n peri pryder neilltuol o gofio bod penaethiaid ysgolion yn dweud y gall y bobl ifanc anghofiedig hyn fod yn gymaint â 50 y cant o'r grŵp mewn blwyddyn. Canfu'r ymchwil fod rhaid inni ddymchwel y mur rhwng gwaith a'r hyn a ddysgir mewn ysgolion, drwy ddysgu'r cwricwlwm mewn cyd-destun sydd yn gysylltiedig â gwaith, yn hytrach na dim ond gyrru pobl ifanc mewn bysiau rhwng darparwyr ar leoliadau profiad gwaith tymor byr.

Daeth yr adroddiad i'r casgliad nad yw Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n rhoi sylw i'r agenda 14-19 a'i bod, yn hytrach, wedi treulio amser maith, ac wedi gwario arian mawr, i ailddatgan yr hyn y mae pobl yn ei wybod eisoes ac i gadarnhau'r hyn a ddywedwyd yn ei hadroddiad blaenorol, bedair blynedd yn gynharach. Os yw Cymru i sicrhau twf a chau'r bwlch cyfoeth, rhaid i'n system addysg beidio â bradychu'r genhedlaeth goll hon. Hyd yn oed yn y rhannau o Gymru lle y ceir diweithdra isel, fel sir y Flint a Wrecsam, ceir anweithgarwch economaidd uchel ymysg yr ifanc. Mae 80 y cant o'r rhai sydd yn ymgeisio am le yng nghynllun prentisiaeth Airbus yn methu eu profion llythrennedd a rhifedd sylfaenol. Fodd bynnag, yn hytrach na delio â hynny, rhoddir rhestr o argymhellion ger ein bron heddiw sydd yn awgrymu bod Syr Humphrey wedi cenhedlu haid o blant yng Nghymru sydd yn fyw ac yn iach ac yn gweithio i Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

Beth yw ystyr yr adran ar dryloywder a dilyniant strategol mewn ariannu, er enghraifft? Ai rhyw ymgais arall i gelu'r ffaith bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru, unwaith eto, yn rhoi polisi o flaen cynllunio, gweithdrefnau a phrisio—a dŵr coch clir rhwng Llafur yn Llundain a Rhodri yng Nghaerdydd? Mae hynny nid yn unig yn gwbl amhroffesiynol; mae'n dor-dyletswydd ac yn bradychu disgyblion, athrawon a chyflogwyr Cymru. Fel y dywed prif weithredwr y corff proffesiynol yr wyf yn perthyn iddo:

er y gall ac y dylai ysgolion chwarae rhan allweddol wrth baratoi pobl ifanc ar gyfer

work, that preparation also calls for a good general education that includes numeracy and literacy skills, as well as values that lead to good citizenship.'

It is not an either/or situation, which, unfortunately, is the mindset of our confrontational political classes. For so long, anything vocational has had a bad press. It was considered to be something a student did if he or she did not have the ability to follow old-fashioned academic pathways. Now there is a drive to focus on the vocational, to the exclusion of the academic, more generalist subjects. This is exemplified in the demand for skills. However, skills cannot be built in a vacuum, on demand, without engagement. It smacks of command-led economy Gosplans, of developing ultimatums in the interests of the latest state five and 10-year plans and targets.

Labour has taken a simple, meritocratic education system and transformed it into an unwieldy, complicated mess. I say to the Minister, keep on with your recommendations, but please let the experts develop a costed, measurable and achievable action plan that will actually work.

Jeff Cuthbert: I welcome the chance to discuss learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds and the recent report written by the Deputy Minister. The report tackles the dual challenges of addressing the skills needs of our economy and developing a broader and more flexible curriculum for 14 to 19-year-olds that is in step with that skills need. Delivering high-quality vocational routes that are universally available and highly regarded is critical to meeting our nation's skills gap and to giving young people a bright and independent future.

Eleanor Burnham: Do you not think that, as it is such a crucial affair, this should have been tackled before we try to shove, willy-nilly, 50 per cent of young people into higher education, when it is not appropriate for most, and while we have such a shortage of plumbers, electricians and people in all the

byd gwaith, mae'r gwaith paratoi hwnnw'n galw hefyd am addysg gyffredinol dda sydd yn cynnwys sgiliau rhifedd a llythrennedd, yn ogystal â gwerthoedd sydd yn arwain at ddinasyddiaeth dda.

Nid dewis rhwng y naill sefyllfa a'r llall yw hyn, sef cyfeiriad meddwl ein gwleidyddion sy'n mynnu cael gwrthdaro, gwaetha'r modd. Ers tro byd, mae unrhyw beth galwedigaethol wedi cael sylw gwael. Fe'i hystyrid yn rhywbeth a wnâi myfyriwr os nad oedd yn meddu ar y gallu i ddilyn llwybrau academiaidd hen ffasiwn. Erbyn hyn, ceir ymgyrch i ganolbwyntio ar bethau galwedigaethol, gan gau allan y pynciau academiaidd, mwy cyffredinol. Gwelir enghraifft o hynny yn y galw am sgiliau. Fodd bynnag, ni ellir meithrin sgiliau mewn gwagle, yn ôl y galw, heb ymgysylltu. Mae hyn yn sawru o economi dan orchymyn Gosplan, ac o wltimata sydd wedi'u rhoi er mwyn cyflawni cynlluniau a thargedau pump a 10 mlynedd diweddaraf y wladwriaeth.

Mae Llafur wedi cymryd system addysg syml, feritocrataidd a'i throi'n llastr anhyllaw a chymhleth. Dywedaf wrth y Gweinidog, daliwch ati â'ch argymhellion ond, da chi, gadewch i'r arbenigwyr ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu mesuradwy ac ymarferol sydd wedi'i brisio a fydd yn gweithio mewn gwirionedd.

Jeff Cuthbert: Croesawaf y cyfle i drafod llwybrau dysgu ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 blwydd oed a'r adroddiad diweddar a ysgrifennwyd gan y Dirprwy Weinidog. Mae'r adroddiad yn delio â'r ddwy her o ymdrin â'r galw am sgiliau yn ein heconomi a datblygu cwricwlwm ehangach a mwy hyblyg ar gyfer rhai 14 i 19 blwydd oed sydd yn gyson â'r galw am sgiliau. Mae'n hollbwysig darparu llwybrau galwedigaethol o safon dda sydd ar gael i bawb ac yn ennyn parch er mwyn llenwi'r bwlch sgiliau yn ein gwlad a chynnig dyfodol disglair ac annibynnol i bobl ifanc.

Eleanor Burnham: Oni chredwch, gan fod hyn yn fater mor bwysig, y dylid bod wedi ymdrin â hyn o'r blaen cyn inni geisio gwthio 50 y cant o bobl ifanc, o'u bodd neu eu hanfodd, i addysg uwch, gan nad yw'n addas i'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt, a thra bo gennym y fath brinder o ran plymwyd, trydanwyr a rhai

worthy trades that the Deputy Minister spoke of in her very good report?

Jeff Cuthbert: What a long time to say not very much. That does not apply here. We are not putting 50 per cent of young people into higher education. The whole purpose of the report is to raise the issue of vocational education and to provide choice. Rather than carping, it would be nice to hear positive ideas—if you have any. The most important aspect of the report is the need for greater engagement with employers across Wales. If we want to truly engage business in Wales in the learning pathways, the sector skills councils and business representatives, such as the Confederation of British Industry and the Federation of Small Businesses, need to work with us on this agenda.

Many good reports have been written on skills needs. The Future Skills Wales survey and the skills and employment action plans all map business needs, but more now needs to be done by business itself. The CBI's companies and classrooms model is an example of how business organisations in Wales are starting to do their bit to engage their members. However, this report today makes clear that business organisations need to start to put the same effort into engaging in our nation's vocational educational needs.

The predominance of small and medium-sized enterprises in Wales and their relative lack of resources will clearly impact on the forthcoming learning pathways action plan. The Assembly has been responsive to this issue with employers; now is the time for employers to realise the tangible benefits that they will reap by engaging with the Assembly on this issue. Local engagement is crucial to maximising the benefits for learners. Filling local skills gaps in deprived communities will only be done by ensuring that educational courses match local skills needs. We need to engage the sector skills councils in Wales in delivering a range of work-focused learning pathways that are appropriately broad and relevant. Such a

sydd yn dilyn yr holl grefftau buddiol y cyfeiriodd y Dirprwy Weinidog atynt yn ei hadroddiad rhagorol?

Jeff Cuthbert: Y fath amser a gymerwyd heb ddweud fawr ddim yn y diwedd. Nid yw hynny'n berthnasol i hyn. Nid ydym yn rhoi 50 y cant o bobl ifanc mewn addysg uwch. Holl bwrpas yr adroddiad yw codi mater addysg alwedigaethol a chynnig dewis. Yn hytrach na chwyno, byddai'n braf clywed syniadau buddiol—os oes gennych rai. Yr agwedd bwysicaf ar yr adroddiad yw'r angen am fwy o ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr ar draws Cymru. Os ydym o ddifrif am gynnwys busnes yng Nghymru yn y llwybrau dysgu, mae angen i'r cynghorau sgiliau sector a chynrychiolwyr byd busnes, megis Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain a Ffederasiwn y Busnesau Bach, weithio gyda ni ar yr agenda hon.

Mae llawer o adroddiadau da wedi cael eu hysgrifennu am yr anghenion o ran sgiliau. Mae arolwg Sgiliau Dyfodol Cymru a'r cynlluniau gweithredu sgiliau a chyflogaeth i gyd yn mapio anghenion busnesau, ond mae angen i fyd busnes ei hun wneud mwy erbyn hyn. Mae model cwmnïau ac ystafelloedd dosbarth y CBI yn enghraifft o sut y mae sefydliadau busnes yng Nghymru yn dechrau gwneud eu rhan i ennyn cyfranogiad eu haelodau. Fodd bynnag, mae'r adroddiad hwn heddiw yn ei gwneud yn glir bod angen i sefydliadau busnes ddechrau gwneud yr un ymdrech i ymwneud ag anghenion ein cenedl ym maes addysg alwedigaethol.

Yn amlwg, bydd y ffaith bod cynifer o fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru a'u diffyg adnoddau cymharol yn effeithio ar y cynllun gweithredu llwybrau dysgu sydd ar fin ymddangos. Mae'r Cynulliad wedi bod yn barod i ymateb ar y mater hwn gyda chyflogwyr; bellach mae'n bryd i gyflogwyr sylweddoli'r manteision gwirioneddol a ddaw i'w rhan hwy drwy weithio gyda'r Cynulliad ar y mater hwn. Mae ymgysylltu'n lleol yn hanfodol er mwyn cynyddu'r manteision i ddysgwyr i'r eithaf. Dim ond drwy sicrhau bod cyrsiau addysgol yn cyfateb i'r anghenion sgiliau yn lleol y caiff bylchau o ran sgiliau yn lleol eu llenwi mewn cymunedau difreintiedig. Mae angen inni weithio gyda'r cynghorau sgiliau sector yng

programme will fit in well given Wales's mixture of SMEs and public sector providers. I look to the vocational skills champion to take these issues on board in the coming months.

I use this opportunity to draw Members' attention to an exciting project in Sheffield that uses Objective 1 money to achieve many of the aims of our learning pathways. The Learning for Life project is a city-wide initiative that develops vocational pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds that are linked to the needs of local industry sectors. Fuelled by Objective 1 money, the project has changed the landscape of learning in the city and is being heralded by many as a beacon of best practice. Having got the evidence that more engineering students were needed, the project went to the local colleges to fund the appropriate accredited courses, but the colleges did not have the capacity. The project, therefore, established its own engineering college that is now turning out over 300 qualified engineering students per year. Most of these students have found work locally after graduating from their courses. Since 2002, the number of Sheffield pupils entered for a GNVQ, BTEC or NVQ in construction, has risen from 20 to 300.

In addition, the Learning for Life project has gone into schools to ensure that pupils gain experience of the workplace. After operating for only four years, the programme has ensured that over 60 per cent of school students are involved in vocational educational programmes, and 30 non-school providers are involved in the delivery of this annual programme.

Sheffield's Learning for Life project is a success story. I am confident that Wales is able to deliver an equally successful project, especially in its deprived communities. I am pleased that opposition parties finally accept the value of vocational education and choice for young people. I commend this report.

Nghymru i gyflwyno ystod o lwybrau dysgu yn canolbwyntio ar waith sy'n ddigon eang a pherthnasol. Bydd rhaglen o'r fath yn gweddu'n dda i'r sefyllfa o gofio'r cymysgedd o fusnesau bach a chanolig a darparwyr sector cyhoeddus sydd yng Nghymru. Disgwyliaf i'r hyrwyddwr sgiliau galwedigaethol roi sylw i'r materion hyn yn ystod y misoedd nesaf.

Yr wyf am achub ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw'r Aelodau at brosiect cyffrous yn Sheffield sy'n defnyddio arian amcan 1 i gyflawni llawer o nodau ein llwybrau dysgu. Mae'r prosiect Learning for Life yn rhaglen i'r ddinas gyfan sy'n datblygu llwybrau galwedigaethol i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed sy'n gysylltiedig ag anghenion sectorau diwydiant lleol. Mae'r prosiect, sy'n cael arian Amcan 1, wedi gweddnewid dysgu yn y ddinas ac mae'n cael ei ganmol gan lawer fel esiampl o'r arferion gorau. Ar ôl cael tystiolaeth bod angen rhagor o fyfyrwyr peirianeg, aeth y prosiect i'r colegau lleol i gyllido'r cyrsiau achrededig priodol, ond nid oedd lle gan y colegau. Felly, sefydlodd y prosiect ei goleg peirianeg ei hun sydd erbyn hyn yn cynhyrchu dros 300 o fyfyrwyr peirianeg cymwysedig y flwyddyn. Mae'r rhan fwyaf o'r myfyrwyr hyn wedi dod o hyd i waith yn lleol ar ôl graddio yn eu cyrsiau. Ers 2002, mae nifer y disgyblion o Sheffield sy'n ymgeisio am GNVQ, BTEC neu NVQ mewn adeiladu wedi codi o 20 i 300.

Yn ychwanegol, mae'r prosiect Learning for Life wedi mynd i ysgolion i sicrhau bod disgyblion yn cael profiad o'r gweithle. Ar ôl pedair blynedd yn unig o weithredu, mae'r rhaglen wedi sicrhau bod dros 60 y cant o fyfyrwyr ysgol yn ymwneud â rhaglenni addysg galwedigaethol, ac mae 30 o ddarparwyr ar wahân i ysgolion yn ymwneud â darparu'r rhaglen flynyddol hon.

Mae prosiect Learning for Life Sheffield yn hanes o lwyddiant. Yr wyf yn hyderus y gall Cymru gynnal prosiect yr un mor llwyddiannus, yn enwedig yn ei chymunedau difreintiedig. Yr wyf yn falch bod y gwrthbleidiau yn derbyn gwerth addysg alwedigaethol a dewis galwedigaethol i bobl ifanc o'r diwedd. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad.

Alun Ffred Jones: Y gamp wrth geisio gweithredu unrhyw gynllun fel hyn yw sicrhau cyllid cyhoeddus cyson i'r rhai sy'n darparu'r addysg. Mae'n rhaid gofalu bod darpariaeth ddigonol ar gyfer hyfforddiant alwedigaethol ac addysg academiaidd, fel ei gilydd. Mae'r pryderon yn amlwg, fel y mae Janet Ryder wedi cyfeirio atynt, o gofio bod cyllido ar gyfer addysg ôl-16 yn dod o'r Cynulliad a bod goblygiadau cyllidol i'r argymhellion ar gyfer addysg disgyblion 14-16 oed.

O safbwynt y consortia cymunedol addysg a hyfforddiant y cyfeirir atynt yn y ddogfen hon, bydd y bobl sydd wedi cymryd rhan ynddynt yn dweud wrthy ch mai dyna'r gwastraff mwyaf o ran amser ac egni a gafwyd erioed.

Fodd bynnag, mae'r Cynulliad yn ceisio cynllunio gwasanaeth addysg cydlynol yng Nghymru. Nodaf sylwadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog ynghylch arwain y ffordd i weddill y Deyrnas Unedig. Rhyfeddais wrth glywed Chris Bryant, Aelod Seneddol y Rhondda, yn dweud y bore yma ei fod yn credu bod Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad yn gwneud camgymeriad wrth ddilyn y llwybrau presennol a'i fod o blaid y drefn optio allan.

5.20 p.m.

Os cofiaf yn iawn, dyna'r polisi yr oedd y Toriaid yn ei ddilyn wyth mlynedd yn ôl. Fe'i dilewyd gan Lafur Newydd pan ddaeth i rym, ond, yn awr, mae am ailsefydlu'r un drefn. Mae hyn yn ddryslyd. Yr oedd hwn yn rhan o fanifesto Llafur—manifesto yr oedd Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad, mae'n debyg, yn ei gefnogi hefyd. Felly, mae gennym sefyllfa sgitsoffrenig yng Nghymru lle mae Aelodau Llafur y Cynulliad o blaid un polisi yng Nghymru, ond yn cefnogi Aelodau Seneddol Llafur sy'n credu rhywbeth cwbl wahanol, ac yn ymgyrchu drostynt. Pan fo Chris Bryant yn dweud y dylai Aelodau Seneddol Llafur gael mwy o berchnogaeth dros y Cynulliad, beth y mae'n ei feddwl yn nhermau addysg?

Pwy felly sy'n siarad dros Lafur Newydd yng Nghymru ar addysg—y manifesto, Aelodau Seneddol, neu Aelodau'r Cynulliad? Mae

Alun Ffred Jones: The aim in trying to implement such a scheme is to ensure consistent public funding for education providers. We must ensure that there is adequate provision for vocational training and academic education. The concerns are obvious, as Janet Ryder has outlined, bearing in mind that post-16 education funding is in the hands of the Assembly and that there will be financial implications for the education of pupils between 14 and 16 years of age.

In respect of the community consortia for education and training referred to in this document, people who have taken part in them will tell you that that is the greatest waste of time and energy that they have ever seen.

However, the Assembly is trying to plan a co-ordinated education service in Wales. I note the Deputy Minister's comments regarding leading the way for the rest of the United Kingdom. I was surprised to hear Chris Bryant, the Member of Parliament for Rhondda, saying this morning that he thought that the Labour Assembly Government was making a mistake in taking the current routes and that he is in favour of the opting out route.

If I remember correctly, that was the policy that the Tories espoused eight years ago. It was abolished by New Labour when it came to power, but it now wants to reinstate that same system. This is confusing. This was contained in Labour's manifesto—a manifesto that Labour Assembly Members, I assume, supported. Therefore, we have this schizophrenic situation in Wales where Labour Assembly Members espouse one policy in Wales, but support, and campaign for, Labour Members of Parliament who believe something completely different. When Chris Bryant says that Labour Members of Parliament should have more ownership of the Assembly, what does he mean in terms of education?

Who therefore speaks for New Labour in Wales on education—the manifesto, Members of Parliament, or Assembly

angen sefydlogrwydd a pharhad ar ein haddysgwyr. Maent wedi cael digon ar y newidiadau diddiwedd hyn, ac nid yw ymyrraeth Aelodau Seneddol fel hyn yn gwneud dim ond dadsefydlogi'r sefyllfa.

The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson): I thank Members for their contribution to this debate. I publicly thank Christine, in particular—now that I have my voice back—for the work that she has done in preparation for this report, which is before Members today.

This report is a significant contribution to the debate. Many Members have acknowledged that, if we change the provision in the way that we intend, it will be a fundamental sea change in delivery. Therefore, we have to take this at the right time, ensuring that the additional resources are in place, and they are outlined in the budget. We need to ensure that we discuss this with stakeholders, which is why Christine is speaking at regional conferences. We need to ensure that this is updated by professionals, which is why the learning pathways guidance, which was written by professionals, is being updated by professionals. We have European social fund funding for training learning coaches, which will start in the new year. A DVD about learning pathways is soon to be circulated to colleagues in education, employment and training. I have asked the Deputy Minister to complete an action plan by the end of next February to set out strategies and completion dates for taking forward the recommendations.

Before I deal with Members' contributions, I will pick up on the community consortia for education and training issue, which many Members have raised. I undertake to announce our decision on their future in the action plan. The key thing has been how we get employers' advice into this context. We want to look at that issue about employers' advice at the local and regional level, particularly with ELWa and ACCAC coming into the Assembly Government.

On the independent sector, William, I have done a straw poll, and asked people—some

Members? Our educators need stability and continuity. They have had enough of these constant changes, and such interference from Members of Parliament does nothing but destabilise the situation.

Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson): Diolchaf i'r Aelodau am eu cyfraniad i'r ddadl hon. Yr wyf am ddiolch yn gyhoeddus i Christine, yn arbennig—gan fy mod bellach wedi cael fy llais yn ôl—am y gwaith y mae wedi ei wneud wrth baratoi'r adroddiad hwn, sydd gerbron yr Aelodau heddiw.

Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn gyfraniad pwysig i'r ddadl. Mae llawer o Aelodau wedi cydnabod, os newidiwn y ddarpariaeth yn y modd y bwriadwn, y bydd yn newid cwbl sylfaenol o ran cyflwyno'r addysg. Felly, rhaid inni wneud hyn ar yr adeg iawn, gan sicrhau bod yr adnoddau ychwanegol ar gael, a'u bod wedi cael eu hamlinellu yn y gyllideb. Mae angen inni sicrhau ein bod yn trafod hyn gyda'r rhanddeiliaid, a dyna pam y mae Christine yn siarad mewn cynadleddau rhanbarthol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei ddiweddarau gan weithwyr proffesiynol, a dyna pam y mae'r canllawiau ar lwybrau dysgu, a gafodd eu hysgrifennu gan weithwyr proffesiynol, yn cael eu diweddarau gan weithwyr proffesiynol. Mae DVD am lwybrau dysgu i gael ei ddosbarthu yn fuan i gydweithwyr ym meysydd addysg, cyflogaeth a hyfforddiant. Yr wyf wedi gofyn i'r Dirprwy Weinidog gwblhau cynllun gweithredu erbyn diwedd mis Chwefror nesaf i nodi strategaethau a dyddiadau cwblhau er mwyn gweithredu'r argymhellion.

Cyn imi ddelio â chyfraniadau'r Aelodau, yr wyf am gyfeirio at y consortia cymunedol dros addysg a hyfforddiant, mater a godwyd gan nifer o Aelodau. Yr wyf yn ymrwymo i gyhoeddi ein penderfyniad am eu dyfodol yn y cynllun gweithredu. Y cwestiwn allweddol inni oedd sut yr oedd cael cyngor cyflogwyr yn y cyd-destun hwn. Yr ydym am edrych ar y cwestiwn hwnnw ynglŷn â chyngor gan gyflogwyr ar y lefel leol a rhanbarthol, yn enwedig gydag ELWa ac ACCAC yn dod yn rhan o Lywodraeth y Cynulliad.

O ran y sector annibynnol, William, yr wyf wedi cynnal pŵl ar antur, ac wedi gofyn i

politicians, some not—what is understood by the term ‘independent sector’ in education. Universally, they have responded that it is private sector schools. Therefore, if you had meant the independent sector to cover employers, you should have said so in the amendment, and we would have been happy to support it. We have indicated all the way through the learning pathways guidance that this is about engaging effectively with employers.

On learning coaches, I assure people, publicly, that the learning coach programme is a new professional programme—it is not intended in any way to replace teachers through the back door, or to undermine the learning role of teachers. This has been developed in partnership with education professionals and young people, who wanted to see this role introduced. That is why I am delighted that we have the ESF funding to develop this, and we will continue to report to committee on this new approach.

Peter, you raised the issue of plumbers. You used statistics in your press release, and I have asked ELWa, as the organisation responsible for post-16 education, what your statistics represent. It had some difficulty. It tells me that it thinks the 3,740 that you describe may reflect the total number of students that have studied a wide range of different courses that contain a plumbing-related element, as there has not been this level of individuals commencing a plumbing apprenticeship. We know that last year’s funded figures were 512 modern apprenticeships and 425 foundation modern apprenticeships. However, we are discussing in committee issues around work-based learning in terms of improving that in the longer term.

You also expressed your concern, as we have done previously, on Welsh baccalaureate completions. We know that those people who took the Welsh baccalaureate acquired more key skills than they would have done hitherto, but we want to ensure that that issue is addressed in the evaluation. A number of other speakers supported the development of

bobl—rhai’n wleidyddion, rhai heb fod yn wleidyddion—beth yw ystyr y term ‘sector annibynnol’ ym maes addysg iddynt. Yn ddiwahân, maent wedi ateb mai ysgolion sector preifat a olygir. Felly, os oeddech wedi bwriadu i’r sector annibynnol gwmpasu cyflogwyr, dylech fod wedi dweud hynny yn y gwelliant, a byddem wedi bod yn barod i’w gefnogi. Yr ydym wedi nodi bob cam o’r ffordd drwy’r canllawiau ar y llwybrau dysgu mai’r hyn sydd dan sylw yw ymwneud yn effeithiol â chyflogwyr.

O ran hyfforddwyr dysgu, hoffwn sicrhau pobl, yn gyhoeddus, mai rhaglen broffesiynol newydd yw’r rhaglen hyfforddwyr dysgu—nid yw wedi ei bwriadu mewn modd yn y byd i ddisodli athrawon drwy’r drws cefn, nac i danseilio rôl ddysgu athrawon. Cafodd hyn ei ddatblygu mewn partneriaeth â gweithwyr proffesiynol ym myd addysg a phobl ifanc, a oedd am weld y rôl hon yn cael ei chyflwyno. Dyna pam yr wyf mor falch bod y cyllid ESF gennym i ddatblygu hyn, a byddwn yn parhau i adrodd i’r pwyllgor am y dull newydd hwn o weithredu.

Peter, codasoch y mater yn ymwneud â phlymwyr. Defnyddiasoch ystadegau yn eich datganiad i’r wasg, ac yr wyf wedi gofyn i ELWa, y corff sy’n gyfrifol am addysg ôl-16, beth y mae eich ystadegau yn ei olygu. Cafodd beth anhawster. Dywed wrthyf ei fod yn credu y gallai’r ffigur o 3,740 a ddisgrifiwch gyfeirio at gyfanswm y myfyrwyr sydd wedi astudio ystod eang o gyrsgiau gwahanol oedd â rhyw elfen yn ymwneud â gwaith plymwr, gan nad oes cynifer â hyn o unigolion wedi dechrau ar brentisiaeth plymio. Gwyddom mai’r niferoedd a gyllidwyd y llynedd oedd 512 o brentisiaethau modern a 425 o brentisiaethau modern sylfaen. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym wrthi’n trafod materion yn ymwneud â dysgu yn y gwaith, o ran gwella hynny yn y tymor hir, yn y pwyllgor.

Mynegasoch eich pryder hefyd, fel yr ydym ninnau wedi gwneud cyn hyn, am y niferoedd sydd wedi cwblhau bagloriaeth Cymru. Gwyddom fod y bobl hynny a ymgymerodd â bagloriaeth Cymru wedi magu mwy o sgiliau allweddol nag y byddent wedi eu cael cyn hynny, ond yr ydym am sicrhau bod sylw’n cael ei roi i’r mater hwnnw yn y gwerthusiad.

this agenda. Mark talked about real planning and delivery by front-line educational professionals—that is what this agenda is. We are not planning the delivery; it is front-line education professionals who are doing so. You talk about good literacy, numeracy and citizenship—that is at the core of the Welsh baccalaureate and it is the learning core of the learning pathways for 14 to 19-year-olds. I will support my Deputy Minister and bring forward the action plan with her for discussion in committee, and we will take that forward to deliver the best kind of education in Wales.

Yr oedd nifer o siaradwyr eraill o blaid datblygu'r agenda hon. Soniodd Mark am gynllunio a chyflwyno go iawn gan weithwyr addysg proffesiynol rheng flaen—dyna yw hanfod yr agenda hon. Nid yni sy'n cynllunio'r gwaith o gyflwyno'r addysg; gweithwyr addysg proffesiynol rheng flaen sy'n gwneud hynny. Yr ydych yn sôn am lythrennedd, rhifedd a dinasyddiaeth dda—mae hynny wrth graidd bagloriaeth Cymru a dyna graidd dysgu'r llwybrau dysgu i bobl ifanc 14 i 19 oed. Cefnogaf fy Nirprwy Weinidog a dof â'r cynllun gweithredu gerbron gyda hi i'w drafod yn y pwyllgor, a bwriwn ymlaen â hynny er mwyn darparu'r math gorau o addysg yng Nghymru.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 1: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan

Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 24, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.
 Amendment 2: For 24, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 34, Ymatal 7, Yn erbyn 11.
 Amendment 3: For 34, Abstain 7, Against 11.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
 Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Bourne, Nick
 Davies, Glyn
 Francis, Lisa

Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Kirsty

Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Ryder, Janet

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 4: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 5: O blaid 52, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 5: For 52, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 Isherwood, Mark
 James, Irene
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, David
 Lloyd, Val
 Melding, David
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Morgan, Rhodri
 Neagle, Lynne
 Pugh, Alun
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet
 Sargeant, Carl
 Sinclair, Karen
 Thomas, Catherine
 Thomas, Gwenda
 Thomas, Owen John
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
 Williams, Brynle
 Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 6: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 27.
 Amendment 6: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
 The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
 Bates, Mick
 Black, Peter
 Bourne, Nick
 Burnham, Eleanor
 Davies, Glyn
 Davies, Jocelyn
 Francis, Lisa
 German, Michael
 Graham, William
 Isherwood, Mark
 Jones, Alun Ffred
 Jones, Elin
 Jones, Helen Mary
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn
 Jones, Laura Anne
 Lloyd, David
 Melding, David
 Morgan, Jonathan
 Randerson, Jenny
 Ryder, Janet

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
 Chapman, Christine
 Cuthbert, Jeff
 Davidson, Jane
 Davies, Andrew
 Dunwoody, Tamsin
 Essex, Sue
 Gibbons, Brian
 Gregory, Janice
 Griffiths, John
 Gwyther, Christine
 Hart, Edwina
 Hutt, Jane
 Idris Jones, Denise
 James, Irene
 Jones, Ann
 Jones, Carwyn
 Lewis, Huw
 Lloyd, Val
 Mewies, Sandy
 Morgan, Rhodri

Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 7: O blaid 53, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Amendment 7: For 53, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment carried.*

5.30 p.m.

*Gwelliant 8: O blaid 15, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 38.
Amendment 8: For 15, Abstain 0, Against 38.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Davies, Glyn
Francis, Lisa
German, Michael
Graham, William
Isherwood, Mark
Jones, Laura Anne
Melding, David
Morgan, Jonathan
Randerson, Jenny
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Jocelyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Gibbons, Brian
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.
Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig NDM2672 fel y'i diwygiwyd:
Motion NDM2672 as amended:

the National Assembly for Wales:

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

1. notes the report of the Deputy Minister for *1. yn nodi adroddiad y Dirprwy Weinidog*

- Education and Lifelong Learning, '14-19 Learning Pathways in Wales';*
- dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes, 'Llwybrau Dysgu 14 -19 yng Nghymru';*
2. *notes the recommendations made by the Deputy Minister for taking forward the 14 - 19 agenda;*
2. *yn nodi argymhellion y Dirprwy Weinidog ar gyfer bwrw ymlaen ag agenda 14-19;*
3. *agrees that the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning should develop an action plan for 14-19 learning pathways and believes that the action plan should recognise the value of vocational studies that enable students to seek highly skilled employment, as well as the qualifications that prepare students for further and higher education studies;*
3. *yn cytuno y dylai'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes ddatblygu cynllun gweithredu ar gyfer llwybrau dysgu 14-19 ac yn credu y dylai'r cynllun gweithredu gydnabod gwerth astudiaethau galwedigaethol sy'n galluogi myfyrwyr i geisio cael swyddi sy'n gofyn am sgiliau arbennig, yn ogystal â'r cymwysterau sy'n paratoi myfyrwyr ar gyfer astudiaethau addysg bellach ac addysg uwch;*
4. *welcomes the commitment that the Welsh baccalaureate qualification will be made available to all schools, colleges and training organisations in Wales from September 2007;*
4. *yn croesawu'r ymrwymiad y bydd cymhwyster bagloriaeth Cymru ar gael i bob ysgol, coleg a sefydliad hyfforddi yng Nghymru o fis Medi 2007 ymlaen;*
5. *believes that the new role of learning coaches should not undermine the need for learning to be led by fully qualified teachers;*
5. *yn credu na ddylai swyddogaeth newydd hyfforddwyr dysgu danseilio'r ffaith bod angen i'r dysgu fod dan ofal athrawon sydd wedi cymhwyso'n llawn;*
6. *notes the continuing concern of Estyn at the variable quality of work based learning experiences and calls on the Minister to address this in her action plan.*
6. *yn nodi pryder parhaus Estyn am ansawdd amrywiol profiadau dysgu yn y gwaith ac yn galw ar y Gweinidog i fynd i'r afael â hyn yn ei chynllun gweithredu.*
7. *welcomes the acknowledgement of a 'need for a step change in employer engagement' in the development of learning pathways.*
7. *yn croesawu'r gydnabyddiaeth bod 'angen newid sylweddol yn y ffordd y mae cyflogwyr yn ymwneud â' datblygu llwybrau dysgu.*

Cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio: O blaid 43, Ymatal 10, Yn erbyn 0.

Amended motion: For 43, Abstain 10, Against 0.

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton
Barrett, Lorraine
Bates, Mick
Black, Peter
Bourne, Nick
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine
Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Andrew
Davies, Glyn
Dunwoody, Tamsin
Essex, Sue
Francis, Lisa

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:
The following Members voted against:

German, Michael
Gibbons, Brian
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Ann
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Morgan, Rhodri
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Sargeant, Carl
Sinclair, Karen
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Williams, Brynle
Williams, Kirsty

Ymataliodd yr Aelodau canlynol:
The following Members abstained:

Davies, Jocelyn
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Elin
Jones, Helen Mary
Jones, Ieuan Wyn
Lloyd, David
Ryder, Janet
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.
Amended motion carried.*

*Daeth y Llywydd i'r Gadair am 5.31 p.m.
The Presiding Officer took the Chair at 5.31 p.m.*

Adroddiad Blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ The Annual Report of the House Committee

**The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek):
Marek):** I propose that Cynigiaf fod

the National Assembly for Wales, in accordance with Standing Order 18.12, notes the annual report of the House Committee for 2004-05, which was laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Members on 8 November 2005. (NDM2667)

Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 18.12, yn nodi adroddiad blynyddol Pwyllgor y Tŷ ar gyfer 2004-05, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at yr Aelodau ar 8 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2667)

I will be brief. First of all, in presenting this annual report, I thank the members of the committee, and all the staff, without whom the National Assembly for Wales would not function. I will outline some of the highlights of the past year. We had the report of the Senior Salaries Review Body, and the Assembly accepted all the recommendations made by the review body. On the committee and research support side, we have appointed a European officer, based in Brussels, who is able to brief committees in Cardiff and help Members when they visit Brussels.

The Members' research service started to produce debate packs on relevant issues during the year, and these have been a useful source of information. We have also seen improvements in relation to the record of Assembly proceedings. We now have a fully bilingual record of Plenary within 24 hours, which is very important as far as a bilingual Assembly is concerned, and a verbatim report of committees. On the Richard commission and the 'Better Governance for Wales' White Paper, we are preparing for the separation of the Assembly Parliamentary Service from those who assist the Welsh Assembly Government.

On buildings, we have arranged for finance to be put in place in order to repair and put right the fabric, and, importantly, the outside fabric, of the Pierhead building. I am particularly pleased that we have this priceless gem in Cardiff in a very good condition; it will be able to withstand the ravages of the weather for the next 25 years. On the new Assembly building, the House Committee has been consulted on aspects of design and has made decisions about the future operation of the building.

The report contains details of the work of committees during 2004-05, some breakdown of budgets and staffing numbers, and some key performance indicators. It also contains details of individual Members' expenses. I commend the report to Plenary.

Byddaf yn gryno. Yn gyntaf oll, wrth gyflwyno'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn, diolchaf i aelodau'r pwyllgor, a'r holl staff, gan na fyddai Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n gweithredu hebddynt. Amlinellaf rai o uchafbwyntiau'r flwyddyn ddiwethaf. Cawsom adroddiad Corff Adolygu Cyflogau Uwch-Swyddogion a derbyniodd y Cynulliad yr holl argymhellion a wnaethpwyd gan y corff adolygu. Gyda golwg ar gymorth ymchwil a'r pwyllgor, yr ydym wedi penodi swyddog Ewropeaidd, sydd wedi'i leoli ym Mrwsel, sy'n gallu briffio pwyllgorau yng Nghaerdydd a helpu Aelodau pan fyddant yn ymweld â Brwsel.

Dechreuodd gwasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau lunio pecynnau dadl ar faterion perthnasol yn ystod y flwyddyn, ac mae'r rhain wedi bod yn ffynhonnell ddefnyddiol o ran gwybodaeth. Yr ydym hefyd wedi gweld gwelliannau ynglŷn â chofnod y trafodion. Erbyn hyn, mae gennym gofnod hollol ddwyieithog o'r Cyfarfod Llawn o fewn 24 awr, sy'n bwysig iawn o ran Cynulliad dwyieithog, ac adroddiad gair am air ar gyfer pwyllgorau. O ran comisiwn Richard a'r Papur Gwyn, 'Trefn Lywodraethu Well i Gymru', yr ydym yn paratoi ar gyfer gwahanu Gwasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad oddi wrth y rhai sy'n cynorthwyo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru.

O ran yr adeiladau, yr ydym wedi trefnu y bydd cyllid ar gael i atgyweirio ac adfer yr adeiladwaith, ac, yn bwysig, adeiladwaith allanol adeilad y Pierhead. Yr wyf yn arbennig o falch bod y perl amhrisiadwy hwn gennym yng Nghaerdydd mewn cyflwr da iawn; bydd yn gallu gwrthsefyll effeithiau tywydd mawr dros y 25 mlynedd nesaf. Gyda golwg ar adeilad newydd y Cynulliad, ymgynghorwyd â Phwyllgor y Tŷ ynghylch agweddau ar y dyluniad ac mae wedi gwneud penderfyniadau ynghylch gweithrediad yr adeilad yn y dyfodol.

Mae'r adroddiad yn cynnwys manylion ynghylch gwaith y pwyllgorau yn ystod 2004-05, rhywfaint o ddadansoddiad o niferoedd staffio a chyllidebau, a rhai dangosyddion perfformiad allweddol. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys manylion treuliau Aelodau unigol. Yr wyf yn cymeradwyo'r adroddiad

i'r Cyfarfod Llawn.

Owen John Thomas: Mae amser yn brin ac mae gweithgareddau Pwyllgor y Tŷ yn niferus. Fodd bynnag, yn yr amser sydd gennyg, croesawaf nifer o'r newidiadau pwysig a wnaed eleni. Er enghraifft, mae cofnodion llawn o gyfarfodydd pwyllgorau pwnc ar gael yn awr, ac mae hynny yn gwneud ein gwaith yn haws. Hefyd, mae cymorth ar gael i'r pwyllgorau ac i Aelodau yn uniongyrchol o Ewrop. Mae pecynnau dadl ar gael gan wasanaeth ymchwil yr Aelodau, ac yr ydym wedi sicrhau bod gan staff Aelodau gyflogau a chyfleoedd gwaith sydd yn decach nag a oeddent o'r blaen. Yr ydym hefyd yn edrych ymlaen at sicrhau bod y gwaith o reoli'r adeilad newydd mewn dwylo da yn y flwyddyn newydd.

William Graham: In view of the lateness of the hour, I will curtail my remarks. I wish to record the appreciation of the Welsh Conservatives of the way in which the committee has operated, and particularly for the work of the Chair. The meetings were not too long, but were, perhaps, long enough. I want to express our total appreciation of our staff. This is well-recorded in the report. Many people who look at our proceedings see us in all our guises—I will say 'glory' if you prefer—in Plenary and in committee. However, we would find it difficult to function without the work that is put in front of us by our staff. We are very grateful for that, and we look forward to the increasing work that APS will have to do.

The Deputy Presiding Officer (John Marek): I thank the Members who have spoken for their kind words, especially those about the work and effort of the staff.

Owen John Thomas: Time is short and the House Committee's activities are numerous. However, in the time available, I welcome many of the important changes made during the year. For example, all subject committees now have full records of their proceedings, and that makes our work easier. Also, there is direct support for committees and Members from Europe. We have debate packs provided by the Members' research service, and we have ensured that Members' support staff have fairer salaries and opportunities than previously. We also look forward to ensuring that the management of the new building will be in good hands in the new year.

William Graham: Oherwydd ei bod yn hwyr yn y dydd, cwtogaf fy sylwadau. Dymunaf gofnodi gwerthfawrogiad Ceidwadwyr Cymru o'r ffordd y mae'r pwyllgor wedi gweithredu, a gwaith y Cadeirydd yn arbennig. Nid oedd y cyfarfodydd yn rhy hir, ond yr oeddent, efallai, yn ddigon hir. Yr wyf am fynegi ein gwerthfawrogiad llwyr o'n staff. Cofnodir hyn yn dda yn yr adroddiad. Mae llawer o bobl sy'n edrych ar ein cyfarfodydd yn ein gweld ar ein holl weddau—dywedaf 'yn ein holl gogoniant' os yw hynny'n well gennyf—yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ac yn y pwyllgorau. Fodd bynnag, byddem yn ei chael yn anodd gweithredu heb y gwaith sy'n cael ei roi o'n blaenau gan ein staff. Yr ydym yn ddiolchgar iawn am hynny, ac edrychwn ymlaen at y gwaith cynyddol y bydd yn rhaid i Wasanaeth Seneddol y Cynulliad ei wneud.

Y Dirprwy Lywydd (John Marek): Diolchaf i'r Aelodau sydd wedi siarad am eu geiriau caredig, yn enwedig y rhai am waith ac ymdrech y staff.

*Cynnig (NDM2667): O blaid 39, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.
Motion (NDM2667): For 39, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:
The following Members voted for:

Barrett, Lorraine
Black, Peter
Burnham, Eleanor
Chapman, Christine

Cuthbert, Jeff
Davidson, Jane
Davies, Glyn
Davies, Jocelyn
Francis, Lisa
Graham, William
Gregory, Janice
Griffiths, John
Gwyther, Christine
Hart, Edwina
Hutt, Jane
Idris Jones, Denise
Isherwood, Mark
James, Irene
Jones, Alun Ffred
Jones, Carwyn
Jones, Elin
Jones, Laura Anne
Lewis, Huw
Lloyd, David
Lloyd, Val
Melding, David
Mewies, Sandy
Morgan, Jonathan
Neagle, Lynne
Pugh, Alun
Randerson, Jenny
Ryder, Janet
Sargeant, Carl
Thomas, Catherine
Thomas, Gwenda
Thomas, Owen John
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn
Williams, Brynle
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.
Motion carried.*

Y Llywydd: Dyna ddiwedd ein trafodion am **The Presiding Officer:** That brings today's proceedings to a close.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.35 p.m.
The meeting ended at 5.35 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)

Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)
 Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)
 Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)
 Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)
 Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)
 Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)
 Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)
 Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)
 Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)
 Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)
 Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)
 Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)
 Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)
 Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)
 Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)
 Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)
 Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)
 Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)
 Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)
 Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)
 Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)
 Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)
 Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)