



**Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru  
Cofnod y Trafodion**

**The National Assembly for Wales  
The Record of Proceedings**

**Dydd Mawrth, 8 Tachwedd 2005  
Tuesday, 8 November 2005**

**Cynnwys**  
**Contents**

Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister .....	3
Datganiad Busnes Business Statement.....	27
Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders.....	30
Cymeradwyo Gorchmyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 11) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu heb fod drwy Asiantaeth) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadu gydag Elfen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005 Approval of the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 11) (Wales) Order 2005, the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005, the Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees) (Adoptions with a Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005 .....	32
Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol): Ysgolion Minority Party Debate (Liberal Democrat Party): Schools.....	49
Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales.....	76

Yn y golofn chwith, cofnodwyd y trafodion yn yr iaith y llefarwyd hwy ynndi yn y Siambr.  
Yn y golofn dde, cynhwyswyd cyfieithiad o'r areithiau hynny.

In the left-hand column, the proceedings are recorded in the language in which they were spoken in the Chamber. In the right-hand column, a translation of those speeches has been included.

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 2 p.m. gyda'r Llywydd yn y Gadair.  
The Assembly met at 2 p.m. with the Presiding Officer in the Chair.*

## **Cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog Questions to the First Minister**

### **'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' 'Agenda for Change'**

**Q1 Jocelyn Davies:** Will the First Minister make a statement on 'Agenda for Change'? OAQ0932 (FM)

**C1 Jocelyn Davies:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'? OAQ0932 (FM)

**The First Minister (Rhodri Morgan):** Currently, 60 per cent of the 80,000 staff involved in Wales have been matched and nearly 20 per cent have been assimilated to 'Agenda for Change' pay. The agreement in Wales, reached in partnership, is that the matching and assimilation process should be broadly complete by the end of next month.

**Y Prif Weinidog (Rhodri Morgan):** Ar hyn o bryd, mae 60 y cant o'r 80,000 o staff yng Nghymru wedi'u paru a bron 20 y cant wedi'u cymathu â chyflogau'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Y cytundeb yng Nghymru, a gafwyd drwy bartneriaeth, yw y dylai'r broses gyfatebu a chymathu gael ei chwblhau fwy neu lai erbyn diwedd y mis nesaf.

**Jocelyn Davies:** Ambulance staff have spoken to us about their concerns regarding the decision that meal breaks will be classified as 'exclusive' in the new contract. Therefore, an emergency service will not be available during the meal break period. Do you believe that this is acceptable, or will you ensure that sufficient money is available to fund the inclusive option?

**Jocelyn Davies:** Mae staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans wedi sôn wrthym am eu pryderon ynghylch y penderfyniad na fydd toriadau ar gyfer prydau bwyd yn cael eu cynnwys yn y contract newydd. Felly, ni fydd gwasanaeth brys ar gael yn ystod cyfnod toriad ar gyfer bwyd. A ydych yn credu bod hyn yn dderbyniol, ynteu a wnewch sicrhau bod digon o arian ar gael i dalu am yr opsiwn cynhwysol?

**The First Minister:** Ambulance staff are an extremely important part of the whole exercise, but I cannot get involved in what is trying to be as objective as possible measurement of the relative value, difficulty, training requirements, and pre-qualification requirements of all of the jobs involved. To get involved in one particular aspect of staffing, as you suggest, would not be appropriate.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae staff y gwasanaeth ambiwlans yn rhan hynod bwysig o'r holl ymarferiad, ond ni allaf fod yn rhan o'r hyn sy'n ceisio bod yn ffordd mor wrthrychol ag y bo modd o fesur gwerth pob un o'r swyddi sy'n gysylltiedig, y gofynion o ran hyfforddiant a'r gofynion cyn-cymhwyso, a pha mor anodd ydynt, a hynny i gyd o safbwynt cymharol. Ni fyddai'n briodol imi ymyrryd mewn un agwedd benodol ar staffio, fel yr ydych yn awgrymu.

**Jenny Randerson:** School nurses, general practice nurses, and nurse educators working in the higher education sector are all groups that feel that 'Agenda for Change' has not worked for them. The guidelines for general practice are simply that, rather than an enforcement of 'Agenda for Change'. School nurses are employed by a variety of organisations and nurse educators have their

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae nyrsys ysgol, nyrsys practis cyffredinol, a nyrsys addysgu sy'n gweithio yn y sector addysg uwch i gyd yn grwpiau sy'n teimlo nad yw'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' wedi gweithio iddynt hwy. Nid yw'r canllawiau ar gyfer practis cyffredinol yn ddim mwy na hynny, yn hytrach nag yn ffordd o orfodi'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. Caiff nyrsys ysgol eu cyflogi gan amrywiaeth

own form of 'Agenda for Change' under higher education, which is not yet in force. What is your Government doing to ensure that there is a comprehensive view across all forms of nursing to ensure that this is applied equally?

**The First Minister:** When you say that it has not worked for them, I assume that you mean that they are not included in the 'Agenda for Change' exercise, because that is my information. Eighty thousand people is an awful lot, but it does not include everyone, and clearly it does not include doctors, junior doctors, consultants, dentists and so on, though there are massive changes going on in terms of contract negotiations in that regard. 'Agenda for Change' is such a big exercise that I do not think that one would criticise it for the fact that there will be small numbers of people around the edges who are not covered by it.

**Jonathan Morgan:** 'Agenda for Change' was seen by the nursing profession in general, and the Royal College of Nursing in particular, as an opportunity to improve recruitment into the nursing profession. In evidence to the Health and Social Services Committee some time ago, the royal college cast a huge degree of doubt over whether your target for nurse recruitment would plug the gap. In light of its evidence, do you intend to review your target for recruiting nurses to ensure that there is not a deficiency?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure how the different parts of your question connect up. Clearly, first-level nurses are the biggest group covered by 'Agenda for Change'. Of the 80,000 staff, 27.5 per cent are first-level nurses. I do not think that we suffer from big recruitment problems in Wales. Individual trusts suffer from retention problems, usually, and from getting into overdependence on agency and bank nurses, and the loss of continuous knowledge of the patient that you get with permanent staff. Usually, good personnel practice by the trust can address that. You will be as familiar as I am with the Cardiff and Vale NHS Trust, which is now giving the serious attention that it should

o sefydliadau ac mae gan nyrsys addysgu eu fersiwn eu hunain ar yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' dan addysg uwch, nad yw mewn grym eto. Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i sicrhau y bydd pob math o nyrsio'n cael ei ystyried mewn modd cynhwysfawr er mwyn sicrhau bod hyn yn cael ei roi ar waith yn deg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pan ddywedwch nad yw wedi gweithio iddynt hwy, tybiaf eich bod yn golygu nad ydynt wedi'u cynnwys yn yr ymarferiad 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid', oherwydd dyna'r wybodaeth sydd gennyf fi. Mae 80,000 o bobl yn nifer sylweddol iawn, ond nid yw'n cynnwys pawb, ac mae'n amlwg nad yw'n cynnwys meddygon, meddygon iau, meddygon ymgynghorol, deintyddion ac yn y blaen, er bod newidiadau anferth ar y gweill o ran negodi contractau yn y cyswllt hwnnw. Mae'r 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn ymarferiad mor fawr fel nad ydwyf yn meddwl y byddai neb yn ei feirniadu oherwydd bod niferoedd bach o bobl ar y cyrion sydd heb eu cynnwys.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Ystyrid yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' gan y proffesiwn nyrsio yn gyffredinol, a'r Coleg Nyrsio Brenhinol yn benodol, yn gyfle i wella'r drefn recriwtio i'r proffesiwn nyrsio. Wrth roi tystiolaeth i'r Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol ychydig yn ôl, bwriodd y coleg brenhinol gryn amheuaeth ynghylch a fyddai eich targed ar gyfer recriwtio nyrsys yn llenwi'r bwlch. Yng ngoleuni ei dystiolaeth, a ydych yn bwriadu adolygu'ch targed ar gyfer recriwtio nyrsys i sicrhau nad oes diffyg?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr sut y mae gwahanol rannau eich cwestiwn yn cysylltu â'i gilydd. Mae'n amlwg mai nyrsys ar y lefel gyntaf yw'r grŵp mwyaf sy'n dod o dan yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid'. O blith yr 80,000 o staff, mae 27.5 y cant ohonynt yn nyrsys ar y lefel gyntaf. Ni chredaf fod gennym broblemau mawr o ran recriwtio yng Nghymru. Mae gan ymddiriedolaethau unigol broblemau o ran cadw staff, fel arfer, ac oherwydd mynd i orddibynnu ar nyrsys asiantaeth a nyrsys cronfa, a cholli'r wybodaeth ddi-fwelch am y claf y gall staff parhaol ei chynnig. Fel arfer, os bydd yr ymddiriedolaeth yn dilyn arferion personél da, mae modd rhoi sylw i hynny. Yr ydych yr

have given years ago to the issue of reducing dependency on agency and bank nurses and trying to increase the percentage of full-time nursing staff it retains. That is much better for everyone.

un mor gyfarwydd â mi ag Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Caerdydd a'r Fro sydd erbyn hyn yn rhoi'r sylw difrifol y dylai fod wedi'i roi flynyddoedd yn ôl i leihau ei dibyniaeth ar nyrsys asiantaeth a nyrsys cronfa ac yn ceisio cynyddu'r ganran o staff nyrsio llawnamser y mae'n eu cadw. Mae hynny'n well o lawer i bawb.

### **Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau, Abertawe The National Waterfront Museum, Swansea**

**Q2 Laura Anne Jones:** Will the First Minister make a statement on the naming of the National Waterfront Museum, Swansea? OAQ0925 (FM)

**C2 Laura Anne Jones:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch enwi Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau, Abertawe? OAQ0925 (FM)

**The First Minister:** This was a matter for the board of the National Waterfront Museum, Swansea, which was the company founded to deliver the project.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mater i fwrdd Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau, Abertawe, sef y cwmni a sefydlwyd i wireddu'r prosiect hwn oedd hyn.

**Laura Anne Jones:** What process was used to decide upon the name of the National Waterfront Museum, and what other names were considered as part of this process? Were consultants employed at any time to generate and provide naming and branding suggestions, and, if so, what were these suggestions and were any of them adopted? Finally, what were the costs incurred in employing branding consultants, if, indeed, any were employed?

**Laura Anne Jones:** Pa broses a ddefnyddiwyd i benderfynu ar enw Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau, a pha enwau eraill a ystyriwyd fel rhan o'r broses hon? A gyflogwyd ymgynghorwyr ar unrhyw adeg i gynhyrchu a darparu awgrymiadau ar gyfer yr enw a'r brand, ac, os gwnaed hynny, beth oedd yr awgrymiadau hyn ac a fabwysiadwyd rhai ohonynt? Yn olaf, beth oedd y costau a oedd ynghlwm wrth gyflogi ymgynghorwyr brandio, os cyflogwyd rhai, wrth gwrs?

**The First Minister:** I am not sure that you paid full attention to my answer, Laura Anne, which indicated that this was not, and is not, a matter for us. It was a matter for the board of the National Waterfront Museum, as it was founded in order to deliver the project. It has, indeed, delivered a fantastic project.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn sicr a roesoch sylw llawn i'm hateb, Laura Anne, sef nad oedd hyn, ac nad ydyw, yn fater i ni. Mater i fwrdd Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau oedd hyn, gan iddo gael ei sefydlu er mwyn gwireddu'r prosiect. Yn wir, mae wedi gwireddu prosiect anhygoel.

**Rosemary Butler:** If the Member writes to me, I will ensure that her questions are answered. It was a fantastic opening event and, in the following fortnight, over 23,000 people visited the museum.

**Rosemary Butler:** Os gwnaiff yr Aelod ysgrifennu ataf, sicrhaf y caiff ateb i'w chwestiynau. Yr oedd yr agoriad yn anhygoel ac, yn ystod y pythefnos dilynol, daeth 23,000 i ymweld â'r amgueddfa.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You might like to remind us that you are the chair of the august body referred to in the question.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Efallai yr hoffech ein hatgoffa mai chi yw cadeirydd y corff mawreddog y cyfeirir ato yn y cwestiwn.

**Rosemary Butler:** Okay; I was chair of that august body. I had the privilege of chairing

**Rosemary Butler:** Iawn, fi oedd cadeirydd y corff mawreddog hwnnw. Cefais y fraint o

the board.

gadeirio'r bwrdd.

### **Buddsoddiad mewn Addysg Uwch Investment in Higher Education**

**Q3 Peter Black:** Will the First Minister make a statement on increased investment in higher education? OAQ0942 (FM)

**The First Minister:** Our budget spending plans propose a generous increase in funding for higher education which should ensure that HE institutions are well placed when flexible tuition fees are introduced in England in the next academic year.

**Peter Black:** The Assembly is, in effect, paying the top-up fees for Welsh domiciled students, but is it not the case that Welsh universities have been told that they should not be recruiting any more Welsh students than they should do, simply because the Assembly's budget will not meet the cost?

**The First Minister:** I have never heard such a ludicrous suggestion. Where could that suggestion have come from? The fundamental problem with higher education in Wales is that, because we are net importers—we import 28,000 students and export 21,000 students—the additional burden of 7,000 students comes out of our budget, and we are, in effect, subsidising the English higher education system. Insofar as English higher education tends to have more people from the relatively well-off classes going to university, by way of a kind of rite of passage, we should be paying more attention to expanding opportunities for Welsh students to go to HE rather than subsidising that little bit of the English system. That is a fact of life and has been around for a long time. You cannot make that sort of adjustment overnight. However, that is the reverse of the scenario that you have just described to us.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** In her report, Professor Rees talked about the importance of getting young people HE-ready. Do you agree that, when we talk about increased investment in higher education, it is important to remember that we also need to increase investment in things such as early years and comprehensive and

**C3 Peter Black:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad ynghylch cynyddu'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg uwch? OAQ0942 (FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein cynlluniau gwario yn y gyllideb yn cynnig cynnydd hael yn yr arian ar gyfer addysg uwch a ddylai sicrhau bod sefydliadau AU mewn sefyllfa dda pan gyflwynir ffioedd dysgu hyblyg yn Lloegr yn y flwyddyn academaidd nesaf.

**Peter Black:** Mae'r Cynulliad, mewn gwirionedd, yn talu'r ffioedd atodol ar gyfer myfyrwyr sy'n hanu o Gymru, ond onid yw'n wir bod prifysgolion Cymru wedi cael eu hysbysu na ddylent fod yn recriwtio mwy o fyfyrwyr o Gymru nag y maent yn eu recriwtio eisoes, a hynny oherwydd na fydd cyllideb y Cynulliad yn cwrdd â'r gost?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chlywais erioed y fath awgrym hurt. O ble y gallai'r awgrym hwnnw fod wedi dod ys gwn i? Y broblem sylfaenol gydag addysg uwch yng Nghymru yw, oherwydd ein bod yn fewnforwyr net—yr ydym yn mewnfario 28,000 o fyfyrwyr ac yn allfario 21,000 o fyfyrwyr—fod rhaid talu am y baich ychwanegol o 7,000 o fyfyrwyr o'n cyllideb, ac yr ydym, mewn gwirionedd, yn rhoi cymhorthdal i system addysg uwch Lloegr. Gan fod addysg uwch yn Lloegr yn tueddu i ddenu mwy o bobl i'r brifysgol o'r dosbarthiadau hynny sy'n gymharol gefnog, yn rhinwedd rhyw fath o ddefod newid byd, dylem fod yn rhoi mwy o sylw i ehangu'r cyfleoedd i fyfyrwyr Cymru fynd i addysg uwch yn hytrach na rhoi cymhorthdal i'r darn bach hwnnw o system Lloegr. Mae hynny'n un o ffeithiau bywyd sy'n bod ers tro byd. Ni allwch newid pethau fel hyn dros nos. Fodd bynnag, mae'n groes i'r senario yr ydych newydd ei ddisgrifio inni.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yn ei hadroddiad, soniodd yr Athro Rees am bwysigrwydd cael pobl ifanc yn barod ar gyfer AU. A ydych yn cytuno, pan fyddwn yn sôn am gynyddu'r buddsoddiad mewn addysg uwch, ei bod yn bwysig cofio bod angen inni hefyd gynyddu'r buddsoddiad mewn pethau megis y

further education, as a means of ensuring that if young people wish to go on to higher education, they are better placed to do so?

**The First Minister:** Our early years strategy is intended to avoid the long tail that is traditional in British education, whereby a fair proportion of kids at the age of eight, when they go to junior school, have already decided that school is not for them. They do not then play their full part in education. The 14 to 19 strategy is also along those lines. Removing the stigma, or lack of parity of esteem between vocational and higher education, is a fundamental part of this Assembly Government's overall education strategy.

**Janet Ryder:** I am sure that you are aware that a group of students from the National Union of Students and different student unions throughout Wales have been demonstrating outside the Assembly this morning to highlight the marketplace that is developing within higher education due to the introduction of top-up fees by your Labour Government in Westminster. Will you join the three parties that turned up to speak to those students at lunchtime—Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, the Liberal Democrats and the Tories—in condemning the development of a marketplace in higher education and reaffirm that Wales believes that everybody has a right to a free, quality higher education?

**The First Minister:** We have made our views on higher education clear, and our policies have been devised accordingly. We are making budget provision accordingly. However, we always need to be aware of the point that I made a few minutes ago to Peter Black, in that you cannot have an ever-expanding budget allocation from the scarce budget resources of the Assembly, which are meant to meet the needs of the people of Wales, as, in effect, a subsidy for the higher education needs of England. At the present level, it is not too bad, but if it got bigger than that, it would not be good.

**William Graham:** In terms of investment in higher education, and lifelong learning, the suggestion is that pupils will have to increase

blynyddoedd cynnar ac addysg gyfun a phellach, fel modd o sicrhau bod pobl ifanc mewn gwell sefyllfa i fynd i addysg uwch os mai dyna yw eu dymuniad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Bwriedir i'n strategaeth ar gyfer y blynyddoedd cynnar osgoi traddodiad y gynffon hir sydd gennym yn system addysg Prydain, lle y bydd cyfran sylweddol o blant wyth oed, wrth fynd i'r ysgol iau, eisoes wedi penderfynu nad yw'r ysgol ar eu cyfer hwy. Yna, ni fyddant yn chwarae eu rhan lawn ym myd addysg. Mae'r strategaeth 14 i 19 hefyd yn dilyn yr un trywydd. Mae dileu'r stigma neu'r diffyg parch cydradd rhwng addysg alwedigaethol ac addysg uwch yn rhan hanfodol o strategaeth addysg gyffredinol y Llywodraeth hon.

**Janet Ryder:** Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn ymwybodol bod grŵp o fyfyrwyr o Undeb Cenedlaethol y Myfyrwyr a gwahanol undebau myfyrwyr o bob cwr o Gymru wedi bod yn protestio y tu allan i'r Cynulliad y bore yma i dynnu sylw at y farchnad sy'n datblygu ym maes addysg uwch oherwydd bod eich Llywodraeth Lafur chi yn San Steffan wedi cyflwyno ffioedd atodol. A wnewch ymuno â'r tair plaid a fu yno'n siarad â'r myfyrwyr hynny amser cinio—Plaid Cymru—the Party of Wales, y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol a'r Torïaid—i gondemnio datblygu marchnad ym maes addysg uwch ac i ailddatgan bod Cymru'n credu bod gan bawb hawl i gael addysg uwch o safon am ddim?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi gwneud ein barn am addysg uwch yn glir, ac mae ein polisiau wedi cael eu llunio yn unol â hynny. Bydd darpariaeth yn ein cyllideb yn unol â hynny. Fodd bynnag, rhaid inni bob amser gofio'r pwynt a wneuthum ychydig funudau yn ôl wrth Peter Black, sef nad oes modd ehangu dyraniad y gyllideb yn ddi-ben-draw ar sail adnoddau ariannol prin Cynulliad, y bwriedir iddynt ddiwallu anghenion pobl Cymru, fel cymhorthdal, i bob diben, i anghenion addysg uwch Lloegr. Fel y mae ar hyn o bryd, nid yw'n rhy ddrwg, ond petai'n tyfu'n fwy na hynny, ni fyddai'n beth da.

**William Graham:** O ran buddsoddi mewn addysg uwch, a dysgu gydol oes, yr awgrym yw y bydd rhaid i ddisgyblion gynyddu eu

their contribution from the present 27 per cent to 37 per cent by 2007. Is this not contrary to your expressed wish that Wales should be an educationally forward country?

cyfraniad o'r 27 y cant presennol i 37 y cant erbyn 2007. Onid yw hyn yn groes i'r dymuniad a fynegwyd gennych y dylai Cymru fod yn wlad flaengar o ran ei haddysg?

2.10 p.m.

**The First Minister:** I do not think that we have ever said that every single provision of education should be free at all times and at all stages of life. There have always been fees charged for forms of adult education. Jeff has made the point on many occasions that, in all those decades when people would laud, quite rightly, the benefits of free higher education—as, I understand, Cherie Blair did yesterday—further education was not free. People who did not get good A-levels and go on, like Cherie Blair, to study law at university, went, for example, to do engineering in the local college of further education. People who follow this course have been paying fees for decades. We are trying to ensure that there is proper parity of esteem between the attitude towards further education and higher education, and we have taken many steps in the right direction, but you cannot do everything overnight.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni chredaf inni erioed ddweud y dylai pob un ddarpariaeth o ran addysg fod am ddim bob amser ac yn ystod pob cyfnod o fywyd. Mae ffioedd wedi'u codi erioed ar gyfer mathau o addysg oedolion. Mae Jeff wedi gwneud y pwynt sawl tro, ym mhob un o'r degawdau hynny pan fyddai pobl yn canmol, yn gwbl briodol, fanteision addysg uwch am ddim—fel y gwnaeth Cherie Blair ddoe, yn ôl a ddeallaf—nid oedd addysg bellach ar gael am ddim. Aeth pobl na chawsant ganlyniadau safon uwch da a mynd yn eu blaen, fel y gwnaeth Cherie Blair, i astudio'r gyfraith yn y brifysgol, er enghraifft, i astudio peirianeg yn eu coleg addysg bellach lleol. Mae pobl sy'n dilyn y trywydd hwn wedi bod yn talu ffioedd ers degawdau. Yr ydym yn ceisio sicrhau bod parch cydradd tuag at addysg bellach ac addysg uwch, ac yr ydym wedi cymryd llawer o gamau i'r cyfeiriad iawn, ond ni allwch wneud popeth dros nos.

### Cysylltiadau Rhyngwladol Cymru Wales's International Links

**Q4 John Griffiths:** Will the First Minister make a statement on Wales's international links? OAQ0949 (FM)

**C4 John Griffiths:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am gysylltiadau rhyngwladol Cymru? OAQ0949 (FM)

**The First Minister:** You will be aware, John, that Wales has a number of links with countries and regions overseas, both formal and informal, which benefit both parties if they are pursued in a practical way. During the recess, I visited Buenos Aires and the Chubut province in Patagonia, and, later this month, I will visit Silesia. We have formal memoranda of understanding with both Silesia and Chubut.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwyddoch, John, fod gan Gymru nifer o gysylltiadau â gwledydd a rhanbarthau tramor, yn ffurfiol ac yn anffurfiol, sydd er budd y naill ochr a'r llall o fynd ati mewn modd ymarferol. Yn ystod y toriad, bûm yn ymweld â Buenos Aires a thalaith Chubut ym Mhatagonia, ac yn ddiweddarach yn y mis, byddaf yn ymweld â Silesia. Mae gennym femoranda dealltwriaeth ffurfiol gyda Silesia a Chubut ill dau.

**John Griffiths:** Wales has long-standing and well-developed links with Lesotho through Dolen Cymru and others, which I saw for myself during a recess visit with our branch of the Commonwealth Parliamentary

**John Griffiths:** Mae gan Gymru gysylltiadau sydd wedi'u hen ddatblygu ers tro â Lesotho drwy Ddolen Cymru ac eraill, a gwelais y rhain dros fy hun pan fûm yn ymweld yn ystod y toriad gyda'n cangen o Gymdeithas



Association. We met Ministers and MPs in Lesotho, visited schools and hospitals, and met teachers from Wales on exchange placements. We learnt of the great difficulties facing the country, difficulties made much worse by the HIV/AIDS epidemic, which, it is estimated, has affected a third of adults between the ages of 15 and 45. Sadly, many of the children who sang and danced for us are orphans who care for younger siblings, and some of them are also infected. Given the close relationship between Wales and Lesotho, the country's need for help and our development of an international sustainable development framework, would you agree that Lesotho is an obvious country for us to focus on so that we build on and strengthen our relationship and provide the assistance that it so badly needs?

**The First Minister:** There are long-standing educational links between Wales and Lesotho, which originally arose from the work of Dolen Cymru. I could hardly be unaware of those, as Elaine Morgan, one of the Dolen Cymru founders, was, for many decades, a constituent of mine before retiring back to St David's. We have added to the Christian church's voluntary sector involvement through the current teacher engagement. That does not mean that the Assembly Government should focus exclusively on Lesotho in its international links because the present range of programmes in Uganda and Ethiopia, where Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust has a particular interest, also need consideration.

**The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat Group (Michael German):** I also had the privilege of visiting Lesotho. This country, as you rightly said, has had a link with Wales for the last 20 years, not just in education, but in health and agriculture and throughout civic society. Unlike other African countries, Lesotho's national debt has not been written off, and, as John said, a third of the population has HIV/AIDS. Health and education are of crucial importance. I understand your statement that you do not want to focus exclusively on one country,

Seneddol y Gymanwlad. Cyfarfuom â Gweinidogion ac ASau yn Lesotho, gan ymweld ag ysgolion ac ysbytai, a chyfarfod ag athrawon o Gymru ar leoliadau cyfnewid. Dysgasom am yr anawsterau mawr sy'n wynebu'r wlad, anawsterau sydd gymaint yn waeth oherwydd epidemig HIV/AIDS, sydd, yn ôl yr amcangyfrifon, wedi effeithio ar draean yr oedolion rhwng 15 a 45 oed. Yn anffodus, mae llawer o'r plant a fu'n canu ac yn dawnsio inni yn blant amddifad sy'n gofalu am frodyr a chwiorydd iau, ac mae rhai ohonynt hwythau wedi'u heintio hefyd. O ystyried y berthynas glòs rhwng Cymru a Lesotho, fod angen help ar y wlad a'n bod yn datblygu fframwaith datblygu cynaliadwy rhyngwladol, a fyddech yn cytuno bod Lesotho'n wlad amlwg inni ganolbwyntio arni er mwyn inni adeiladu ar sail ein perthynas a chryfhau'r berthynas honno gan ddarparu'r cymorth y mae cymaint o'i angen arni?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae cysylltiadau addysgol ers tro rhwng Cymru a Lesotho, a ddeilliodd yn wreiddiol o waith Dolen Cymru. Prin y gallwn beidio â bod yn ymwybodol o'r rhain gan fod Elaine Morgan, un o sylfaenwyr Dolen Cymru, am ddegawdau lawer, yn un o'm hetholwyr cyn iddi ymddeol a dychwelyd i Dŷ Ddewi. Yr ydym wedi ychwanegu at gyfraniad sector gwirfoddol yr eglwys Gristnogol drwy gyfrwng y cynllun darparu athrawon ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw hyn yn golygu y dylai Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ganolbwyntio ar Lesotho yn unig yn ei chysylltiadau rhyngwladol oherwydd y mae angen ystyried yr ystod o raglenni sydd ar waith ar hyn o bryd yn Uganda ac Ethiopia hefyd, lle y mae gan Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent ddiddordeb arbennig.

**Arweinydd Grŵp Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru (Michael German):** Cefais innau'r ffrainc o ymweld â Lesotho. Yr oeddech yn llygad eich lle bod cysylltiad wedi bod rhwng y wlad hon a Chymru ers 20 mlynedd bellach, nid un unig ym maes addysg, ond hefyd ym maes iechyd ac amaethyddiaeth ac mewn sawl agwedd ar gymdeithas ddinesig. Yn wahanol i wledydd eraill yn Affrica, nid yw dyled genedlaethol Lesotho wedi'i dileu, ac, fel y dywedodd John, mae HIV/AIDS ar draean y boblogaeth. Mae iechyd ac addysg o'r pwys mwyaf.

but, given the extensive, important links that already exist with Lesotho, do you not consider it important for the Government of Wales to create a specific focus and add to the work that has been done by so many in Wales to help a country that is deserving of our support?

**The First Minister:** Perhaps I should apologise if I did not make my previous statement as clear as I should have. When Dolen Cymru started over 20 year ago, it was not involved in teacher exchanges. It is us, as an Assembly Government, who have added that element to this broad charitable arrangement in terms of building up the cadres of expertise in farming, health and so on that you rightly referred to. I think that it was in July of last year that I said that we would be producing an international strategy.

We are continuing to work on that, and I think that we have a proposal to bring forward a more finely honed document before too long. Alongside the principle of recognising this long-standing link with Lesotho, we do not want to take anything away from more specific links, such as that which the dental school has with Makerere University in Uganda, for instance, or that Gwent Healthcare NHS Trust has with southern Ethiopia.

**The Leader of the Welsh Conservatives (Nick Bourne):** I am strongly in support of those links, but the question that I want to ask relates to our international reputation, and links fostered by arts bodies, such as the Welsh National Opera. The company has a great reputation overseas and has operated successfully when funding decisions have been taken at arm's length. I am concerned, as are many others, about the potential politicisation of these organisations now that they—or at least their funding decisions—are being brought in-house, as it were. Now that the Assembly Government is politicising those organisations, we could be jeopardising their international reputation.

Deallaf eich datganiad nad ydych am ganolbwyntio ar un wlad yn unig, ond, o gofio bod gennym eisoes gysylltiadau helaeth, pwysig â Lesotho, oni chredwch ei bod yn bwysig i Lywodraeth Cymru greu ffocws penodol ac ychwanegu at y gwaith a wnaethpwyd eisoes gan gynifer yng Nghymru i helpu gwlad sy'n haeddu ein cefnogaeth?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Efallai y dylwn ymddiheuro os nad oedd fy natganiad blaenorol mor glir ag y dylasai fod. Pan ddechreuodd Dolen Cymru dros 20 mlynedd yn ôl, nid oedd yn ymwneud â chyfnewid athrawon. Ni, fel Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, sydd wedi ychwanegu'r elfen honno at y trefniant elusennol eang hwn er mwyn meithrin corff o arbenigedd ym maes ffermio, iechyd ac yn y blaen y cyfeiriasoch ato, a hynny'n gwbl briodol. Credaf mai ym mis Gorffennaf y llynedd y dywedais y byddem yn cynhyrchu strategaeth ryngwladol.

Yr ydym yn parhau i weithio ar hynny, a chredaf fod gennym fwriad i gynhyrchu dogfen fwy manwl cyn bo hir iawn. Ochr yn ochr â'r egwyddor o gydnabod y cyswllt hir-sefydlog hwn â Lesotho, nid ydym am fychanu dim ar gysylltiadau mwy penodol, megis hwnnw rhwng yr ysgol ddeintyddol a Phrifysgol Makerere yn Uganda, er enghraifft, neu'r un rhwng Ymddiriedolaeth GIG Gofal Iechyd Gwent a de Ethiopia.

**Arweinydd Ceidwadwyr Cymru (Nick Bourne):** Yr wyf yn cefnogi'r cysylltiadau hynny'n gadarn, ond mae'r cwestiwn y dymunaf ei ofyn yn ymwneud â'n henw da rhyngwladol, a'r cysylltiadau a feithrinnir gan gyrff celfyddydol, megis Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru. Mae gan y cwmni enw ardderchog dramor ac mae wedi gweithredu'n llwyddiannus wrth i benderfyniadau cyllido gael eu gwneud o hyd braich. Yr wyf yn bryderus, fel y mae sawl un arall, ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd o wleidyddoli'r cyrff hyn gan eu bod yn awr—neu o leiaf y penderfyniadau i'w cyllido—yn dod dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, fel petai. Gan fod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gwleidyddoli'r cyrff hyn, fe allem fod yn peryglu eu henw da rhyngwladol.

**The First Minister:** We will not politicise them at all. Alun Pugh has made this clear on previous occasions in his inimitable and humorous way. It is not the job of a Minister here, neither Alun Pugh nor John Griffiths, to tell the Welsh National Opera that it must perform *Rigoletto* in a particular city, or even to perform *Lettorigo*, which, in case you did not know, is *Rigoletto* performed backwards. There is no suggestion that we will have any control over artistic performances. The same applies to Camarata, the chamber orchestra recently formed by Owain Arwel Hughes. From small beginnings this year, it has the potential to be a major promoter of Wales's good reputation for music all over the world. Culture and the individual choice of what to play is not a matter for political engagement.

**Nick Bourne:** I am relieved to hear you say that, and it sounded like a very powerful advocacy of the status quo. Alun Pugh's approach may be inimitable, and possibly humorous, but it is wrong. You are politicising these organisations by bringing them in-house. You would have brought the whole lot in-house had it not been for the royal charter. You gave a powerful defence of the status quo then. If the status quo is so good and sensible, why are you bringing those organisations in-house?

**The First Minister:** You are confusing the status quo as regards the names or status of agencies with Ministers making decisions on what pieces they will play or perform. That is not a matter for Ministers.

**Nick Bourne:** It clearly is, as has been demonstrated in the Culture, Welsh Language and Sport Committee. The Minister said that he intends to have a 'close working relationship' with these organisations when approaching funding decisions. The WNO thinks so; it is in the process of forming relationships with Assembly Members because of this. You say that there is no change on the funding decisions, but that is plainly not true. Would you agree with Rosemary Butler when she says that there should be 'healthy space' between

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni fyddwn yn eu gwleidyddoli o gwbl. Mae Alun Pugh wedi gwneud hyn yn gwbl glir yn ei ffordd ddihafal a doniol ei hun. Nid gwaith Gweinidog yma, nac Alun Pugh na John Griffiths, yw dweud wrth Opera Cenedlaethol Cymru fod rhaid iddo berfformio *Rigoletto* mewn rhyw ddinas benodol, neu hyd yn oed berfformio *Lettorigo*, sef *Rigoletto* wedi ei berfformio am yn ôl, rhag ofn nad oeddech yn gwybod. Nid oes dim awgrym y bydd gennym reolaeth dros berfformiadau artistig. Mae'r un peth yn wir am Camarata, y gerddorfa siambr a ffurfiwyd yn ddiweddar gan Owain Arwel Hughes. Wedi dechrau distadl eleni, mae ganddo'r potensial i gyfrannu'n helaeth at hybu enw da Cymru ym myd cerddoriaeth ledled y byd. Nid mater ar gyfer ymwneud gwleidyddol yw diwylliant a'r dewis unigol ynghylch beth i'w chwarae.

**Nick Bourne:** Yr wyf yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud hynny, a swniai fel dadl gref iawn o blaid y *status quo*. Gall agwedd Alun Pugh fod yn ddihafal, ac o bosibl yn ddoniol, ond mae'n anghywir. Yr ydych yn gwleidyddoli'r cyrff hyn drwy ddod â hwy dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad. Byddech wedi dod â phob un ohonynt dan eich adain oni bai am y siarter brenhinol. Cyflwynasoch amddiffyniad grymus i'r *status quo* bryd hynny. Os yw'r *status quo* mor wych a synhwyrol, pam yr ydych yn dod â'r cyrff hynny dan adain Llywodraeth y Cynulliad?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn drysu rhwng y *status quo* gydag enwau neu statws asiantaethau a Gweinidogion yn gwneud penderfyniadau ynghylch pa ddarnau a chwaraeant neu a berfformiant. Nid mater i Weinidogion yw hynny.

**Nick Bourne:** Ond mae'n gwbl amlwg taw dyna'n union ydyw, fel y gwelwyd yn y Pwyllgor Diwylliant, yr Iaith Gymraeg a Chwaraeon. Dywedodd y Gweinidog ei fod yn bwriadu cael 'perthynas waith agos' â'r cyrff hyn wrth ystyried penderfyniadau cyllido. Mae'r cwmni opera yn credu hynny; mae wrthi'n creu perthynas ag Aelodau'r Cynulliad oherwydd hyn. Yr ydych yn dweud nad oes dim newid o ran y penderfyniadau cyllido, ond mae'n amlwg nad yw hynny'n wir. A gytunech â Rosemary Butler, pan ddywed y dylid cael 'bwllch iach' rhwng y

Government and artists, as well as with the comments of Leighton Andrews—and it pains me to say it, but he was right on this occasion—when he said that

‘there are good reasons why, historically, since 1944, there has been an intermediary structure for the awarding of grants to arts organisations, not least to ensure a degree of independence to allow free artistic expression’?

That is absolutely right. Why have you gone against that?

**The First Minister:** You are confusing the Minister ringing up the WNO to tell it what and where to perform with the function of the Arts Council of Wales. The issue about the arts council is quite different. You are confusing what you might call ‘cultural vetoes’ by Ministers, which are clearly not acceptable but which have nothing to do with speaking to the arts council or changing the relationship with it. That does not involve the Minister having the ability to instruct bodies on what to perform.

Llywodraeth ac artistiaid, yn ogystal ag â sylwadau Leighton Andrews—ac mae’n loes gennyf gyfaddef hyn, ond yr oedd yn iawn y tro hwn—pan ddywedodd

‘mae rhesymau da pam y cafwyd trefniadaeth ryngol, yn hanesyddol, er 1944, ar gyfer rhoi grantiau i gyrff celfyddydol, gyda’r angen i sicrhau rhywfaint o annibyniaeth i ganiatáu mynegiant celfyddydol dirwyrstr yn uchel yn eu plith’?

Mae hynny’n hollol wir. Pam yr ydych wedi mynd yn groes i hynny?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydych yn drysu rhwng y Gweinidog yn ffonio Cwmni Opera Cymru i ddweud wrtho beth i’w berfformio a lle i berfformio a swyddogaeth Cyngor Celfyddydau Cymru. Mae’r sefyllfa gyda chyngor y celfyddydau yn gwbl wahanol. Yr ydych yn drysu gyda’r hyn y gallech ei alw’n ‘fetos diwylliannol’ gan Weinidogion, sydd yn amlwg yn annerbyniol ond sydd heb fod a wnelont ddim â siarad â chyngor y celfyddydau na newid y berthynas ag ef. Nid yw hynny’n cynnwys Gweinidog yn meddu ar y grym i ddweud wrth gyrff beth i’w berfformio.

### Diogelwch ar y Ffyrdd Road Safety

**Q5 Michael German:** Will the First Minister make a statement on road safety? OAQ0940 (FM)

**The First Minister:** Under our Safe Routes to School initiative, more than £18 million has been made available to local authorities to implement projects in their areas in this important field. Approximately 300 schools are now benefiting from capital infrastructure works to improve safety in and around schools.

**Michael German:** While that is a laudable policy, and one which is being carried out across Wales, unfortunately the number of child pedestrians killed or seriously injured in Wales rose from 85 in 2003 to 92 in 2004. What specific measures do you intend to take under the new road safety Act to ensure that this figure falls?

**C5 Michael German:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddiogelwch ar y ffyrdd? OAQ0940 (FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Dan ein menter Llwybrau Diogel i’r Ysgol, rhyddhawyd dros £18 miliwn i’r awdurdodau lleol i weithredu prosiectau yn eu hardaloedd yn y maes pwysig hwn. Mae tua 300 o ysgolion yn elwa bellach o waith seilwaith cyfalaf i wella diogelwch mewn ysgolion ac yn eu cyffiniau.

**Michael German:** Er bod y polisi hwnnw’n un clodwiw, ac yn un a weithredir ledled Cymru, yn anffodus, cododd nifer y cerddwyr o blant a laddwyd neu a anafwyd yn ddifrifol yng Nghymru o 85 yn 2003 i 92 yn 2004. Pa fesurau penodol yr ydych yn bwriadu eu cymryd dan y Ddeddf newydd ar ddiogelwch y ffyrdd i sicrhau bod y ffigur hwn yn gostwng?

**The First Minister:** We are supporting all manner of road-safety awareness initiatives. You are right to say that the number of people killed in Wales is high, though I do not recognise that actual figure for children. The figure that I have for all those killed in 2004 is 201—still far too high, of course.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn cefnogi pob math o gynlluniau i godi ymwybyddiaeth ynglŷn â diogelwch y ffyrdd. Yr ydych yn gywir pan ddywedwch fod nifer y bobl sy'n cael eu lladd yng Nghymru yn uchel, er nad wyf yn gyfarwydd â'r union ffigur hwnnw ar gyfer plant. Y ffigur sydd gennyf ar gyfer pawb a laddwyd yn 2004 yw 201—sydd eto'n llawer rhy uchel, wrth gwrs.

2.20 p.m.

That figure includes adults, so it does not seem to correspond with your figure, although you may be right. It is important that we have a programme of awareness for young drivers, drivers of stolen cars and pedestrians to ensure that they know how to reduce speeds on roads or that they only cross when there is a pedestrian crossing showing green, permitting them to cross. In that way, Britain, including Wales, will continue to have its pretty healthy road safety record by all European standards.

Mae'r ffigur hwnnw'n cynnwys oedolion, felly ymddengys nad yw'n cyfateb â'ch ffigur chi, er y gallech fod yn gywir. Mae'n bwysig bod gennym raglen ymwybyddiaeth ar gyfer gyrywyr ifanc, gyrywyr ceir sydd wedi eu dwyn a cherddwyr i sicrhau eu bod yn gwybod sut i leihau cyflymder ar ffyrdd neu na ddylent groesi oni bai fod croesfan yn dangos golau gwyrdd, sy'n caniatáu iddynt groesi. Fel hyn, bydd Prydain, gan gynnwys Cymru, yn parhau i fod â record eithaf iach, yn ôl holl safonau Ewrop.

**Michael German:** What worries me is that, on the one hand, you have a strict regime like Safe Routes to School, which gives schools and local authorities important guidelines, but on the other hand, there is a totally inconsistent regime on speed limits. For example, on the only set of traffic lights between Cardiff and Birmingham, there is a 70 mph speed limit. Children have been killed and there have been serious accidents on that road in the recent past and yet, your Minister consistently refuses to act on the grounds that the guidance is not clear enough to give him a route by which he can change speed limits. Do you not think that we need the powers to alter the speed limits on our trunk roads so that the Assembly can produce safe routes with particular emphasis on the route around Monmouth?

**Michael German:** Yr hyn sy'n fy mhoeni yw bod gennych, ar y naill law, drefn gaeth megis Llwybrau Diogel i'r Ysgol, sy'n rhoi canllawiau pwysig i ysgolion ac awdurdodau lleol, ond ar y llaw arall, drefn gwbl anghyson ynglŷn â chyfyngiadau cyflymder. Er enghraifft, ar yr unig set o oleuadau traffig rhwng Caerdydd a Birmingham, ceir cyfyngiad cyflymder o 70 mya. Mae plant wedi eu lladd yno a gwelwyd damweiniau difrifol ar y ffordd honno yn ddiweddar iawn ac eto, mae eich Gweinidog yn gyson yn gwrthod gweithredu ar y sail nad yw'r canllawiau'n ddigon clir iddo allu newid cyfyngiadau cyflymder. Onid ydych yn credu bod angen pwerau arnom i newid cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar ein cefnffyrdd fel bod y Cynulliad yn gallu cynhyrchu ffyrdd diogel, gan ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar y ffordd o gwmpas Mynwy?

**The First Minister:** We are all aware of that particular set of traffic lights at the Wye bridge in Monmouth. It is the anomaly on what is, by and large, a dual carriageway from Cardiff to Birmingham, linking up the M4, M50 and M5. I do not want to go into the particular circumstances of the accidents in May, one of which I think involved a

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae pob un ohonom yn gyfarwydd â'r set honno o oleuadau traffig ar bont afon Gwy ym Mynwy. Mae'n anomali ar ffordd sydd, fwy na heb, yn ffordd ddeuol rhwng Caerdydd a Birmingham, gan gysylltu'r M4, yr M50 a'r M5. Nid wyf am gyfeirio at amgylchiadau penodol y damweiniau ym mis Mai, gyda rhywun yn

fatality, and another, more recently, involved four Cardiff youth footballers, which fortunately did not result in a fatality, because there may be police investigations into those circumstances.

**Michael German:** On speed signs, ludicrously, on the road to Builth Wells, there is a 40 mph section sandwiched between two 30 mph sections, and we are told that we cannot change it because regulations on repeater signs are not included in the powers of the National Assembly. Do you believe that we have the tools to do the job, and, if not, when will we get them in order to do the job properly and put the right speed limits in the right areas so that we can create safe roads for the children of Wales?

**The First Minister:** If you had rephrased your previous question on the traffic lights in Monmouth and asked whether the police advised that speed restrictions in the run up to those traffic lights would have made any difference to either of the two accidents that I mentioned, I could have told you that the police stated that speed restrictions would have made no difference whatsoever. So, it is not as easy as you imply to go from two high-profile, and, in one case, fatal, road accidents, and say, 'Well, if there had been a speed limit, they would not have happened, therefore, why is there no speed limit on that section of road?'. It is never that simple. If you want an answer, write to the Minister for Economic Development and Transport and put your question in these terms: would a speed limit have made any difference in those cases? I think you will have the answer that I just gave you.

**David Davies:** You said that you did not want to look at the specifics of those two cases, but the fact is that there have been numerous accidents at that location. It is not just down to the traffic lights, but there is also the fact that there are three left turns in a lane used by heavy goods vehicles and a roundabout that is generally accepted to have been badly configured. Could you please consider why it appears to be more difficult

marw yn un, fe gredaf, a damwain arall, yn fwy diweddar, gyda phedwar o bêl-droedwyr ifanc o Gaerdydd pan na laddwyd neb, yn ffodus, gan fod yr heddlu, o bosibl, yn ymchwilio i'r amgylchiadau hynny.

**Michael German:** Ar arwyddion cyflymder ar y ffordd i Lanfair-ym-Muallt, mae'n gwbl ynfyd bod darn 40 mya rhwng dau ddarn 30 mya, a dywedir wrthym na allwn ei newid gan nad yw rheoliadau ynglŷn ag arwyddion ailadrodd wedi eu cynnwys ym mhwerau'r Cynulliad. A ydych yn credu bod yr arfau gennym i wneud y gwaith ac, os nad ydynt, pryd y cawn hwy er mwyn gwneud y gwaith yn iawn a gosod y cyfyngiadau cyflymder yn y lleoedd iawn er mwyn creu ffyrdd diogel ar gyfer plant Cymru?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Pe baech wedi aralleirio eich cwestiwn blaenorol ynglŷn â'r goleuadau traffig ym Mynwy a gofyn a ddywedodd yr heddlu y byddai cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar y ffordd yn arwain at y goleuadau traffig hynny wedi gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth i un o'r ddwy ddamwain y cyfeiriais atynt, gallwn fod wedi dweud wrthyhch fod yr heddlu wedi datgan na fyddai cyfyngiadau cyflymder wedi gwneud dim gwahaniaeth o gwbl. Felly, nid yw'n fater mor rhwydd ag yr ydych yn awgrymu i neb ddweud yn sgîl dwy ddamwain ffordd a gafodd gryn sylw, ac un ohonynt yn anghueol, 'Wel, pe bai cyfyngiad cyflymder yno, ni fyddent wedi digwydd, felly pam nad oes cyfyngiad cyflymder ar y darn hwnnw o ffordd?' Nid yw byth mor syml â hynny. Os ydych am gael ateb, ysgrifennwch at y Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth a gofynnwch gwestiwn tebyg i hwn: a fyddai cyfyngiad cyflymder wedi gwneud unrhyw wahaniaeth yn yr achosion hynny? Credaf y cewch yr ateb yr wyf newydd ei roi ichi.

**David Davies:** Dywedasoeh nad oeddech yn dymuno ystyried amgylchiadau penodol y ddau achos hynny, ond y gwir yw bod sawl damwain wedi digwydd yn y fan honno. Nid y goleuadau traffig yw'r unig broblem, yn ogystal â hynny mae tri throad i'r chwith mewn lôn a ddefnyddir gan lorïau nwyddau trwm, a chylchfan y cydnabyddir yn gyffredinol ei bod yn un a gynlluniwyd yn wael. A fydddech cystal ag ystyried pam

to get speed limits on dual carriageways in Wales than in England? Five miles to the north on that particular road, in England, there is a speed limit. Could you look at the specifics of this case? Your Minister has said that it is not a particularly dangerous stretch of road, but everyone who knows it agrees that it is and even you seem to imply as much. Could you please have a word with the Minister for Economic Development and Transport to sort this out because it is a dangerous stretch of road and it will not be long before there is another serious accident there?

**The First Minister:** Contrary to what you are saying, Andrew Davies has urged Gwent County Council to prioritise Dixton roundabout so that work can be progressed.

**Catherine Thomas:** Do you share my concern and that of my constituents living in Tumble and Cross Hands about the routes that their children have to walk to school? Although the local authority is of the view that the routes present no significant risk, my constituents feel that they most certainly do. We now have a situation where children are walking along questionable routes because they may not be eligible for a free bus pass and may not have a family car to take them to school. We feel that, on this occasion, the voices and the concerns of many children and young people in my constituency are simply not being taken on board.

**The First Minister:** I am sure that you are aware of what the procedure should be. I realise that it produces results that are very controversial in certain areas. Independent assessors are appointed and are supposed to rule on whether a particular road has a continuous pavement—which is highly desirable, but which is not always there—and whether that road is unsafe or not. It is the high-standard appointment of independent assessors that enable councillors to take the decisions regarding whether they wish to allow parents and children to have free bus transport because the route is unsafe, even though it is less than the distance prescribed for statutory free school transport.

mae'n ymddangos yn anos cael cyfyngiadau cyflymder ar ffyrdd deuol yng Nghymru nag ydyw yn Lloegr? Bum milltir i'r gogledd ar y ffordd benodol honno, yn Lloegr, ceir cyfyngiad cyflymder. A fydddech cystal â chael golwg ar fanylion yr achos hwn? Dywedodd eich Gweinidog nad yw'n ddarn arbennig o beryglus, ond y mae pawb sy'n gyfarwydd ag ef yn cytuno ei fod, ac yr ydych chi hyd yn oed fel pe baech yn awgrymu hynny. A fydddech cystal â chael gair â'r Gweinidog dros Ddatblygu Economaidd a Thrafnidiaeth i ddatrys hyn, oherwydd y mae'n ddarn peryglus a dim ond mater o amser ydyw cyn y bydd damwain ddifrifol arall yn digwydd yno?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yn groes i'r hyn a ddywedwch, mae Andrew Davies wedi annog Cyngor Sir Gwent i roi blaenoriaeth i gylchfan Dixton, er mwyn i waith ddechrau yno.

**Catherine Thomas:** A ydych yn rhannu fy mhryderon i a'm hetholwyr sy'n byw yn y Tymbl a Cross Hands ynglŷn â'r ffyrdd y mae gofyn i'w plant eu cerdded i'r ysgol? Er bod yr awdurdod lleol yn credu nad oes dim perygl arwyddocaol ar y ffyrdd, mae fy etholwyr yn credu yn bendant fel arall. Mae gennym sefyllfa yn awr lle y ceir plant yn cerdded ar hyd ffyrdd amheus oherwydd nad ydynt yn gymwys i dderbyn tocyn mantais i deithio ar fws, o bosibl, ac nad oes car gan y teulu i fynd â hwy i'r ysgol, efallai. Credwn, yn y sefyllfa hon, fod lleisiau a phryderon llawer o blant a phobl ifanc yn fy etholaeth yn cael eu hanwybyddu.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn sicr eich bod yn gyfarwydd â'r drefn a ddylai fodoli. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli ei bod yn creu canlyniadau hynod ddadleuol mewn rhai ardaloedd. Penodir aseswyr annibynnol, a'u gwaith yw dyfarnu a oes palmant di-dor ar ffordd benodol—sy'n hynod ddymunol, ond nad yw yno bob tro—ac a yw'r ffordd honno'n beryglus ai peidio. Penodi aseswyr annibynnol o safon uchel sy'n caniatáu i gynghorwyr benderfynu a ydynt yn dymuno caniatáu i rieni a phlant gael cludiant am ddim ar fsys oherwydd bod y llwybr i'r ysgol yn beryglus, hyd yn oed pan fydd y pellter yn llai na'r hyn a bennir ar gyfer cludiant rhad ac am ddim statudol i'r ysgol.

**Arweinydd yr Wrthblaid (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** Brif Weinidog, byddwch yn ymwybodol bod problemau trafndiaeth difrifol a thagfeydd difrifol ar bont Britannia, sydd yn cario trafndiaeth o Wynedd i Fôn. Mae hon hefyd yn ffordd bwysig i Iwerddon. Gwyddoch fy mod wedi pwysu am rai blynyddoedd bellach i sicrhau cynllun tymor byr i wella'r sefyllfa, gyda thair lôn ar bont Britannia. Fodd bynnag, mae hefyd angen ateb tymor hir. Pa bryd y gwneir penderfyniad i sicrhau, yn y lle cyntaf, fod tair lôn, ac, yn ail, fod astudiaeth ddichonoldeb yn cael ei gwneud i gael ateb mwy tymor hir i'r broblem hon, sydd yn amlwg yn un ddifrifol iawn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym wedi talu am astudiaeth ddichonoldeb gan Capital Symonds, a ddaeth i'r casgliad bod llif llanw yn weithredol ar bont Britannia. Ar sail argymhellion y mae'r cwmni wedi'u gwneud mewn egwyddor, yr ydym wedi bwrw ymlaen gydag astudiaeth fanylach i weld beth sydd angen ei wneud er mwyn gweithredu'r egwyddor hon o gael y llif llanw, a sut y gellid gwneud hynny.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Mae'n amlwg bod rhyw symud ar y mater. Hoffwn syniad gennych am amserlen, oherwydd, fel y gwyddoch, yr wyf wedi gohebu â'r Gweinidog, a bûm yn gohebu â Sue Essex pan oedd hi'n Weinidog â chyfrifoldeb am drafnidiaeth. Mae'r mater hwn, felly, wedi bod yn mynd ymlaen ers tro. Pa bryd yr ydych yn disgwyl bod mewn sefyllfa i gyhoeddi canlyniad yr adroddiad, a phryd y bydd y gwaith yn cael ei wneud?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ni allaf ddweud pryd yn union, ond bydd, mewn egwyddor, yn cael ei gynnwys yng nghanam 3 blaenraglen y cefnffyrdd. Dyna'r cyfan y gallaf ei ddweud. Nid wyf yn siŵr beth y mae hynny yn ei olygu o ran blynyddoedd, felly gofynnaf i Andrew Davies ysgrifennu atoch gydag ateb mwy manwl a mwy penodol.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Yr wyf yn ymwybodol y bydd y Gweinidog yn trafod y mater ymhellach gyda swyddogion y cyngor sir yn y dyddiau nesaf. Fel y cofiwch, yn fy

**The Leader of the Opposition (Ieuan Wyn Jones):** First Minister, you will also be aware that there have been serious traffic problems and serious traffic jams on Britannia bridge, which carries traffic from Gwynedd to Anglesey. It is also an important route to Ireland. You will know that I have been pressing for a number of years for a short-term scheme to be put in place to improve the situation, which includes having three lanes on the bridge. However, we also need a long-term solution. When will a decision be taken to ensure, in the first place, that three lanes are installed, and, secondly, that a feasibility study is undertaken to get a longer-term solution to this problem, which is obviously a very serious one?

**The First Minister:** It is a serious problem, and we have commissioned a feasibility study from Capital Symonds. The study came to the conclusion that the tidal flow is operational on Britannia bridge. Given the company's in-principle recommendations, we have proceeded with a more detailed study to see exactly what needs to be done in order to implement this principle of having a tidal flow, and how that could be achieved.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** There is obviously some movement on this issue. I would like some indication of a timetable, because, as you know, I have been in correspondence with the Minister, and I was in correspondence with Sue Essex when she was the Minister with responsibility for Transport. The matter, therefore, has been ongoing for some time. When do you expect to be in a position to announce the outcome of that study, and when will the work begin?

**The First Minister:** I cannot tell you exactly when, but, in principle, it will be included in phase 3 of the trunk road forward programme. That is all I can say. I do not know what that means in terms of years, and I will, therefore, ask Andrew Davies to write to you with a more detailed and more specific response.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am aware that the Minister will discuss this matter further with the county council officers over the next few days. As you will recall, in my first question,



nghwestiwn cyntaf, gofynnais a fyddai modd cael astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i gael ateb mwy tymor hir, oherwydd y mae arbenigwyr trafnidiaeth yn dweud wrthyf na fyddai tair lôn ond yn ein cario ni am rai blynyddoedd, a byddai angen ateb mwy tymor hir eto. A fydddech yn fodlon i'r Llywodraeth gynnal trafodaethau gyda'r cyngor sir ynglŷn â'r bwriad o gael ateb hyd yn oed yn fwy parhaol?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Wrth gwrs, ond, fel y dywedais yn fy ateb i'ch cwestiwn cyntaf, yr ydym wedi symud ymlaen o'r astudiaeth ddichonoldeb ar sail egwyddor i astudiaeth fanylach ynglŷn â'r ffordd o gynllunio llif llanw.

I asked whether it would be possible to commission a feasibility study in order to get a longer-term solution, because transport experts tell me that three lanes would only carry us for some years, and then we would need a longer-term solution. Would you be willing for the Government to hold negotiations with the county council in order to achieve a solution that is even more long-term?

**The First Minister:** Of course, but, as I said in my response to your first question, we have moved on from the feasibility study on a principle basis to a more detailed study on how to plan the tidal flow.

### Tlodi Tanwydd Fuel Poverty

**Q6 Janet Ryder:** What discussions has the First Minister held with UK Government Ministers regarding fuel poverty? OAQ0935 (FM)

**The First Minister:** Edwina Hart, the Minister for Social Justice and Regeneration, leads on matters relating to fuel poverty. The Minister represents the Assembly Government on the inter-ministerial group on fuel poverty, through which Ministers from across the UK discuss how to work together to help households in fuel poverty to deal with this winter.

2.30 p.m.

**Janet Ryder:** In 2003-04, over 1,500 people aged over 65 died of cold-related illnesses in Wales, an increase of 160 on the previous year. If the weather forecasts for the coming winter are to be believed, we might unfortunately see a rise again this year of deaths due to cold-related illnesses.

Many people receive a winter fuel payment, but it is given in cash. For understandable reasons many people, particularly older people, do not always use the cash to provide heating for their homes. Will you make approaches to your Government to consider changing that payment into a fuel credit, which would guarantee that they would

**C6 Janet Ryder:** Pa drafodaethau a gynhaliwyd gan y Prif Weinidog gyda Gweinidogion Llywodraeth y DU am dlodi tanwydd? OAQ0935 (FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Edwina Hart, y Gweinidog dros Gyfiawnder Cymdeithasol ac Adfywio, sydd yn gofalu am faterion yn ymwneud â thlodi tanwydd. Mae'r Gweinidog yn cynrychioli Llywodraeth y Cynulliad ar grŵp y Gweinidogion ar dlodi tanwydd, lle y bydd Gweinidogion ledled y DU yn trafod sut i weithio ar y cyd i helpu aelwydydd sy'n dioddef tlodi tanwydd i ddelio â'r gaeaf hwn.

**Janet Ryder:** Yn 2003-04, bu farw 1,500 o bobl dros 65 oed o ganlyniad i salwch a oedd yn ymwneud ag oerni yng Nghymru, sef 160 yn fwy na'r flwyddyn flaenorol. Os rhoir coel ar ragolygon y tywydd ar gyfer y gaeaf sydd i ddod, gallew weld cynnydd eto eleni yn nifer y marwolaethau o ganlyniad i salwch sydd yn ymwneud ag oerni, gwaetha'r modd.

Mae llawer o bobl yn cael taliad tanwydd gaeaf, ond fe'i rhoddir ar ffurf arian. Am resymau dealladwy, nid yw llawer o bobl, a phobl hŷn yn enwedig, bob tro'n defnyddio'r arian hwn i wresogi eu cartrefi. A wnewch gysylltu â'ch Llywodraeth i ofyn iddi ystyried newid y taliad yn gredyd tanwydd, a fyddai'n gwarantu eu bod yn cael tanwydd a

receive fuel and heating in their homes so that we can start cutting back on the number of cold-related deaths this winter?

**The First Minister:** It is a long-standing puzzle to everyone in social science or fuel economics as to why we have a higher level of excess deaths in the winter than Scandinavia, which has much colder winters. That goes right to the heart of it. It is the fact that you do not anticipate that the winter will be cold, and think that you will manage without heating or double-glazing or whatever else it might be, that causes the death. It is not the cold itself, but the failure to prepare for it in the way that Scandinavians always do.

You are right again about the winter fuel payment. That also goes to the heart of it. People do not always anticipate that you might have a hard January or February—we have not had one for 43 years. Some people say that there will be one this winter, due to it being freezing cold in the Bermuda triangle or some other meteorological phenomenon that rarely comes along.

You are right that the winter fuel allowance is generous. I believe that some 130,000 people aged 80 had £300, and 0.5 million people aged 60 and over had £200 in the last year for which we have figures. These are large sums, but they are not always used for what they are needed because people do not always realise that there could be a hard winter around the corner. We assume that we will have the kind of weather that we are having now in November, which you expect to have in September, and think it will last throughout the winter. Perhaps it will not. Getting people to take this seriously is important. Your particular point about credits is the kind of subject that can be raised at the inter-ministerial meeting. I will draw it to Edwina Hart's attention.

**Denise Idris Jones:** Would you agree that, with over £645,000 spent on improving 600 homes in Conwy this year, the home energy efficiency scheme is helping many of the poorest pensioners? It is assistance that is being warmly welcomed by many local older people in Conwy at a number of workshops

gwres yn eu cartrefi fel y gallwn ddechrau gostwng nifer y marwolaethau sydd yn gysylltiedig ag oerni y gaeaf hwn?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae pawb sydd yn ymwneud â gwyddor cymdeithas neu economeg tanwydd mewn penbleth ers amser maith ynghylch y rheswm dros y ffaith bod gennym lefel uwch o farwolaethau ychwanegol yn y gaeaf na Llychlyn, lle y ceir gaeafau oerach o lawer. Dyna wraidd y mater. Y ffaith nad ydych yn disgwyl y bydd y gaeaf yn oer, a'ch bod yn tybio y gallwch wneud heb wres neu wydro dwbl neu beth bynnag arall y bo, sydd yn achosi marwolaeth. Nid yr oerni ei hun sydd, ond methu â pharatoi ar ei gyfer fel y gwnaiff y Llychlynwyr.

Yr ydych yn gywir hefyd ynghylch y taliad tanwydd gaeaf. Mae hynny hefyd yn mynd at wraidd y mater. Nid yw pobl bob amser yn disgwyl y gallech gael Ionawr neu Chwefror caled—ni chawsom un ers 43 blynedd. Dywed rhai y ceir un y gaeaf hwn, gan ei bod yn rhewi o oer yn nhriongl Bermwda neu oherwydd rhyw ffenomen feteorolegol arall sy'n digwydd yn anaml iawn.

Yr ydych yn iawn wrth ddweud bod y lwfans tanwydd gaeaf yn un hael. Credaf fod tua 130,000 o bobl 80 oed wedi cael £300, a 0.5 miliwn o bobl 60 oed a throsodd wedi cael £200 yn y flwyddyn ddiwethaf y mae gennym ffigurau ar ei chyfer. Mae'r rhain yn symiau mawr, ond nis defnyddir bob amser at eu diben gan nad yw pobl bob amser yn sylweddoli y gallai gaeaf caled fod ar gyrraedd. Cymerwn y cawn y math o dywydd sydd gennym yn awr ym mis Tachwedd, y mae rhywun yn disgwyl ei gael ym mis Medi, gan gredu y bydd yn para drwy'r gaeaf. Efallai na wnaiff. Mae'n bwysig peri i bobl gymryd hyn o ddifrif. Mae'r pwynt penodol a wnaethoch am greddyau yn bwnc o'r math y gellir ei godi yn y cyfarfod rhyngweinidogol. Tynnaf sylw Edwina Hart ato.

**Denise Idris Jones:** A gytunech, o gofio bod £645,000 wedi'i wario ar wella 600 o gartrefi yng Nghonwy eleni, fod y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yn helpu llawer o'r pensiynwyr tlotaf? Mae'n gymorth y rhoddir croeso cynnes iddo gan lawer o bobl hŷn leol yng Nghonwy mewn nifer o

for older people that I am holding across the constituency. This week, I am doing that in Llanfairfechan.

**The First Minister:** I am pleased to hear that, because that is part of consciousness-raising, which is how you should prepare people just in case it turns out to be a cold winter. The home energy efficiency scheme is our vehicle as the Assembly. Gordon Brown's payment represents the Westminster Government's vehicle—the £200 and £300 for those aged over 80 provides a pot of money that is available to spend on fuel. However, you have to get your house into a condition where it does not leak heat during cold periods, which is what Germany, Scandinavian countries and Finland concentrate on. Your house should be well-prepared. That is what the home energy efficiency scheme does, because it gives you cavity wall installation, draught-proofing, boiler lagging and sometimes central heating.

**Glyn Davies:** Fuel poverty is a serious matter. Affordable energy is a key issue for all of us. We have a duty to ensure that energy delivered at a cheap price is part of our policies, and consistent with our concerns about climate change. Do you accept that the Government must have a policy of affordable energy underlying all of its principles, particularly in terms of renewable energy?

**The First Minister:** It is a difficult thing to do. You cannot target a price of a heavily-speculated-upon, highly-cyclical commodity such as oil. That, in turn, means that gas and coal are dragged up and down—not to the extremes of the oil market, but almost as much. You could say, 'We will guarantee cheap fuel', and the price of oil goes up from \$30 to \$60 and then comes back down. It is difficult to guarantee that a particular commodity, such as fuel, will be exempted from the increases in price that speculation can cause.

We must all accept that fuel is expensive now. It was expensive in 1979 and 1980, as it was between 1973 and 1976. It then became cheap from 1986, when the oil price broke, and it went from \$30 a barrel to \$10 a barrel

weithdai i bobl hŷn yr wyf yn eu cynnal ledled yr etholaeth. Yr wythnos hon, yr wyf yn gwneud hynny yn Llanfairfechan.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch o glywed hynny, gan fod hynny'n rhan o'r gwaith o hybu ymwybyddiaeth, sef y modd y dylid paratoi pobl rhag ofn y ceir gaeaf oer. Y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref yw ein cyfrwng ni fel y Cynulliad. Taliadau Gordon Brown yw cyfrwng Llywodraeth San Steffan—mae'r £200 a'r £300 ar gyfer rhai dros 80 oed yn rhoi swm o arian sydd ar gael i'w wario ar danwydd. Fodd bynnag, rhaid i rywun beri i'w dŷ fod mewn cyflwr fel nad yw'n gollwng gwres yn ystod cyfnodau oer, ac ar hynny y mae'r Almaen, gwledydd Llychlyn a'r Ffindir yn canolbwyntio. Dylai'ch tŷ fod wedi'i baratoi'n dda. Dyna a wnaiff y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, gan ei fod yn rhoi waliau dwbl, yn atal drafftiau, yn lapio boeleri ac weithiau'n darparu gwres canolog.

**Glyn Davies:** Mae tlodi tanwydd yn fater difrifol. Mae ynni fforddiadwy'n bwnc allweddol i bob un ohonom. Mae'n ddyletswydd arnom sicrhau bod ynni sy'n cael ei ddarparu'n rhad yn rhan o'n polisiau, ac yn gyson â'n pryderon ynghylch y newid yn yr hinsawdd. A ydych yn derbyn bod rhaid i'r Llywodraeth fod â pholisi o sicrhau ynni fforddiadwy fel sylfaen i'w holl egwyddorion, yn enwedig o ran ynni adnewyddadwy?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'n rhywbeth anodd ei wneud. Ni ellir targedu pris nwydd tra chylchol y ceir llawer o hapfasnachu arno fel olew. Mae hynny, yn ei dro, yn golygu bod prisiau nwy a glo'n cael eu llusgo i fyny ac i lawr—nid i'r un eithafion â'r farchnad olew, ond yn agos iawn at hynny. Gallech ddweud, 'Byddwn yn gwarantu tanwydd rhad', a bydd pris olew'n codi o \$30 i \$60 ac yn gostwng eto. Mae'n anodd gwarantu y bydd nwydd penodol, fel tanwydd, wedi'i eithrio rhag y codiadau mewn pris y gall hapfasnachu eu hachosi.

Rhaid inni oll dderbyn bod tanwydd yn ddrud yn awr. Yr oedd yn ddrud yn 1979 ac yn 1980, fel yr oedd rhwng 1973 a 1976. Daeth yn rhad wedyn o 1986, pan dorrodd pris olew, a gostyngodd o \$30 y barilaid i \$10 y

overnight. Therefore, these speculative breaks, upwards and downwards, will occur. There is nothing that we can do about them; if you try to do something about them, you will fail. What we can do is have campaigns on keeping warm, keeping healthy, keeping fit, keeping wise and insulating homes—you then spend less on fuel, and you waste less on fuel that escapes as heat through your walls and roof. That is why the home energy efficiency scheme that Denise is publicising in the Conwy borough area is so vital.

**Kirsty Williams:** You will be aware that, in many parts of my constituency, people do not have access to the gas network. Therefore, their ability to fully benefit from the home energy efficiency scheme is somewhat curtailed. What can your Government do to make that scheme more flexible, to allow people who cannot have access to Wales's gas system to be able to install central heating systems that are based on a more readily available fuel supply in rural Wales, such as wood burning systems and biomass systems, which are readily available to them, and more affordable?

**The First Minister:** I am in the same position—anyone who lives 100 yards from a road, or who lives in a small hamlet, is in the same position; Powys would be full of such locations. The difficulty is the design of boilers; you can standardise on a particular type of gas boiler. Those who do not have access to gas are disadvantaged to that extent, although the price of gas has rocketed over the past 12 months. However, people can benefit from other aspects of the home energy efficiency scheme, such as double glazing, having draught-proofing, or roof insulation. The £200 and the £300 for those aged over 60 and over 80 will also be of great value in combating the high price of oil-fired central heating.

barilaid dros nos. Felly, ceir troeon o'r fath, i fyny ac i lawr, oherwydd hapfasnachu. Nid oes dim y gallwn ei wneud yn eu cylch; os ceisiwch wneud rhywbeth yn eu cylch, byddwch yn methu. Yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yw cynnal ymgyrchoedd ar gadw'n gynnes, cadw'n iach, cadw'n heini, bod yn gall ac insiwleiddio cartrefi—byddwch wedyn yn gwario llai ar danwydd, ac yn gwastraffu llai ar danwydd sydd yn dianc ar ffurf gwres drwy'r waliau a'r to. Dyna pam y mae'r cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref y mae Denise yn rhoi cyhoeddusrwydd iddo yn ardal bwrdeistref Conwy'n hollbwysig.

**Kirsty Williams:** Byddwch yn ymwybodol nad yw pobl, mewn llawer rhan o'm hetholaeth, yn gallu cael mynediad at y rhwydwaith nwy. Oherwydd hynny, maent yn cael eu hamddifadu o rai o fanteision y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref. Pa gamau y gall eich Llywodraeth eu cymryd i beri i'r cynllun hwnnw fod yn fwy hyblyg, i alluogi rhai nad ydynt yn gallu cael mynediad at system nwy Cymru i osod systemau gwres canolog sydd yn rhedeg ar gyflenwad tanwydd y mae'n haws ei gael yng Nghymru wledig, fel systemau sydd yn llosgi coed a systemau bio-màs, sydd ar gael yn hwylus iddynt, ac sydd yn fwy fforddiadwy?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf finnau yn yr un sefyllfa—mae unrhyw un sydd yn byw 100 llath o'r ffordd, neu sydd yn byw mewn pentref bach, yn yr un sefyllfa; ceir lleoliadau o'r fath ledled Powys. Y mater sydd yn peri anhawster yw cynllun boeleri; gellir pennu math penodol o foeler nwy fel safon. Mae'r rhai nad ydynt yn gallu cael nwy o dan anfantais i'r graddau hynny, er bod pris nwy wedi codi i'r entrychion dros y 12 mis diwethaf. Er hynny, gall pobl fanteisio ar agweddau eraill ar y cynllun effeithlonrwydd ynni cartref, fel gwydro dwbl, atal drafftiau, neu insiwleiddio toau. Bydd y £200 a'r £300 ar gyfer rhai dros 60 oed a thros 80 oed yn werthfawr iawn hefyd o ran gwrthweithio pris uchel gwresogi canolog sydd yn rhedeg ar olew.

### **Dosbarthu Cyllid y Loteri The Distribution of Lottery Funding**

**C7 Owen John Thomas:** Pa drafodaethau a gafodd y Prif Weinidog gyda'r Adran

**Q7 Owen John Thomas:** What discussions has the First Minister had with the

Diwylliant, Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ynglŷn â dosbarthu cyllid y loteri? OAQ0947 (FM)

Department for Culture, Media and Sport regarding the distribution of lottery funding? OAQ0947 (FM)

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym mewn cysylltiad cyson â Gweinidogion yr Adran Diwylliant, Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon ynglŷn ag amrywiaeth o faterion sy'n ymwneud â'r Loteri Genedlaethol.

**The First Minister:** We are in regular contact with Ministers at the Department for Culture, Media and Sport on a range of issues relating to the National Lottery.

**Owen John Thomas:** Yr ydych yn ymwybodol, yr wyf yn siŵr, ein bod yn disgwyl gostyngiad o 50 y cant mewn arian loteri o 2008 ymlaen. Bydd hyn yn bwrw'r Gymraeg, diwylliant a chwaraeon yng Nghymru. Beth yr ydych chi'n mynd i'w wneud i sicrhau y gallwn gynnal y maes pwysig hwnnw ar ôl 2008?

**Owen John Thomas:** You are aware, I am sure, that we are expecting a 50 per cent drop in lottery funding from 2008 onwards. This will be a blow to the Welsh language, culture and sport in Wales. What will you do to ensure that we can sustain that important area post 2008?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Nid wyf yn siŵr o ble y mae'r ffigur hwnnw o 50 y cant o gwmp yn yr arian ar gael i ni drwy'r loteri yng Nghymru yn dod, ond nid wyf yn ei adnabod. Derbyniwn y bu haelioni o ran Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri, oherwydd cyfrannodd £11 miliwn i Amgueddfa Genedlaethol y Glannau yn Abertawe, yr oedd Rosemary Butler, Laura Anne Jones a minnau yn ei thrafod tua hanner awr yn ôl. Felly, ni ddylem fod yn esgeulus am gydnabod yr hyn sydd wedi cael ei wneud ar gefn haelioni a blaenoriaethau rhai agweddau ar y Loteri Genedlaethol, nad ydynt yn wrth-Gymreig.

**The First Minister:** I am not sure where that figure of a 50 per cent drop in the lottery funding available to us in Wales has come from, but I do not recognise it. We accept that we have benefited from the generosity of the Heritage Lottery Fund, because it contributed £11 million to the National Waterfront Museum in Swansea, which Rosemary Butler, Laura Anne Jones and I discussed some half an hour ago. Therefore, we should not neglect recognising what has been done in terms of the generosity and priorities of some aspects of the lottery, which are not anti-Welsh.

**Irene James:** Across the UK, lottery grants, since their inception, have been shown to underperform in former coalfield areas. Figures for the Heritage Lottery Fund, for example, show that the difference between the lowest allocations in Valleys areas and those for other comparable areas across Wales is consistently up to £10 million less. Do you agree that calls for greater strategic action, overlooked in the past, must now be taken seriously by lottery distributors to ensure that people in our poorest communities, who largely fund lottery grants, benefit the most?

**Irene James:** Ledled y DU, dangoswyd bod grantiau'r loteri, ers dechrau eu rhoi, wedi tanberfformio yn ardaloedd y cyn-feysydd glo. Mae ffigurau ar gyfer Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri, er enghraifft, yn dangos bod y gwahaniaeth rhwng y dyraniadau lleiaf yn ardaloedd y Cymoedd a'r rhai ar gyfer ardaloedd tebyg ledled Cymru hyd at £10 miliwn yn llai yn wastad. A ydych yn cytuno y dylai dosbarthwyr y loteri ystyried o ddifrif yn awr y galwadau am fwy o weithredu strategol, sydd wedi'u hanwybyddu yn y gorffennol, er mwyn sicrhau mai'r rhai yn ein cymunedau tlotaf, sydd yn ariannu grantiau'r loteri gan mwyaf, a gaiff y budd mwyaf?

2.40 p.m.

**The First Minister:** We all accept the irony of the National Lottery, namely that there is an inverse relationship between the social

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym oll yn derbyn bod eironi ynglŷn â'r Loteri Genedlaethol, sef bod perthynas wrthgyfartal rhwng

class of the people who contribute to it—that is, the further down the income scale you go, the greater the number of tickets purchased—and that of its beneficiaries. We accept that London has had a lion's share of the UK funds. We accept that within Wales, Cardiff originally, and, more recently, Cardiff and Swansea, and Carmarthenshire and Llanelli have done extremely well; Llanelli with regard to the Millennium Coastal Park, and Carmarthenshire in terms of the National Botanic Garden of Wales. The Valleys, as you say, is a problem area, because it does not generate the projects. It does not have the kind of income to generate its half of the project in order to go to the lottery and say, 'Okay, we have £10 million, give us another £10 million and we have a project'. That tends not to happen in the Valleys. It is areas along the coastal belt, including some areas that are former coal mining areas, such as Llanelli and Swansea, which have done well. I accept what you say about the Valleys, but finding a solution to that problem when the projects must be generated, which means having that bit of starting capital, which is largely absent in the Valleys, is difficult.

**Lisa Francis:** As indicated by the previous questioner, the Heritage Lottery Fund is currently working to policy directions that were issued by the Department for Culture, Media and Sport prior to devolution. In the light of the huge and overwhelming response in Wales to the review of good causes post-2009, what discussions have you had with the Minister for Culture, Welsh Language and Sport, Alun Pugh AM, and what discussions do you intend to have with the DCMS, if you have not had any already, to ensure that all parts of Wales receive an adequate and appropriate share of the Heritage Lottery Fund?

**The First Minister:** Most Ministers are AMs, Lisa, last time I checked. It is important that we get a priority for what we regard as the priority activities in Wales. They may not always be the same as the priorities in England, and we have to be very persuasive in ensuring that our priorities hold sway. I do not know whether we can get

dosbarth cymdeithasol y rhai sydd yn cyfrannu iddi—hynny yw, po isaf ar y raddfa incwm yr eir, mwyaf o docynnau'r loteri a brynir—a dosbarth cymdeithasol y rhai sydd yn cael budd ohoni. Derbyniwn mai Llundain a gaiff y gyfran fwyaf o arian y DU. Derbyniwn, o fewn Cymru, fod Caerdydd i ddechrau, ac yn fwy diweddar, Caerdydd ac Abertawe, a sir Gaerfyrddin a Llanelli wedi gwneud yn dda dros ben; Llanelli mewn cysylltiad â Pharc Arfordirol y Mileniwm, a sir Gaerfyrddin mewn cysylltiad â Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru. Fel y dywedwch, mae'r Cymoedd yn ardal anodd, gan nad yw'n creu digon o brosiectau. Nid oes ganddi ddigon o incwm i gynhyrchu ei hanner hi o'r prosiect er mwyn gallu mynd at y loteri a dweud, 'O'r gorau, mae gennym £10 miliwn, rhwch £10 miliwn arall inni a bydd prosiect gennym'. Nid yw hynny'n digwydd yn aml yn y Cymoedd. Ardaloedd ar yr arfordir, gan gynnwys rhai ardaloedd glofaol gynt fel Llanelli ac Abertawe, sydd wedi gwneud yn dda. Derbyniaf yr hyn a ddywedwch am y Cymoedd, ond anodd yw cael ateb i'r broblem honno gan fod rhaid creu'r prosiectau, sydd yn gofyn am ychydig o gyfalaf dechreuol, nas ceir yn y Cymoedd gan mwyaf.

**Lisa Francis:** Fel y nododd yr holwr blaenorol, ar hyn o bryd mae Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri yn dilyn cyfarwyddiadau polisi a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Adran dros Ddiwylliant, y Cyfryngau a Chwaraeon cyn dyfodiad datganoli. Yn sgîl yr ymateb aruthrol ac ysgubol a gafwyd yng Nghymru i'r adolygiad o'r achosion da ar ôl 2009, pa drafodaethau yr ydych wedi eu cynnal â'r Gweinidog dros Ddiwylliant, y Gymraeg a Chwaraeon, Alun Pugh AC, a pha drafodaethau y bwriadwch eu cynnal gyda'r DCMS, os na chawsoch rai eisoes, i sicrhau y bydd pob rhan o Gymru'n cael cyfran ddigonol a phriodol o Gronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri?

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae'r rhan fwyaf o Weinidogion yn ACau, Lisa, y tro diwethaf y bu imi holi. Mae'n bwysig inni sicrhau blaenoriaeth i'r hyn a ystyriwn yn weithgareddau sydd â blaenoriaeth yng Nghymru. Mae'n bosibl na fyddant bob amser yr un fath â'r blaenoriaethau yn Lloegr, a rhaid inni fod yn berswadiol iawn

around the problem that Irene James talked about a few seconds ago, because of this problem of the match funding or the ability to generate the projects. Lottery funding, certainly in terms of the Heritage Lottery Fund, will tend to go to country houses and so on, rather than to the Newbridge Institute or some of the other type of projects that you would expect to see emerging from the Valleys, provided that there is the originating capital that can match the lottery money. Lottery money never pays for 100 per cent of a project, and it does not pay for Government projects, but it must try to reflect our priorities in Wales.

wrth sicrhau mai ein blaenoriaethau ni a ddilynir. Ni wn a oes modd inni ddatrs y broblem y soniodd Irene James amdani ychydig eiliadau'n ôl, sydd yn ganlyniad i'r anhawster o gael arian cyfatebol neu'r gallu i greu'r prosiectau. Bydd arian y loteri, o ran Cronfa Dreftadaeth y Loteri'n sicr, yn mynd gan mwyaf at blastai ac yn y blaen, yn hytrach nag Institiwt Trecelyn neu rai o'r mathau eraill o brosiectau y disgwyliech eu gweld yn codi yn y Cymoedd, ar yr amod bod cyfalaf dechreuol ar gael i gyfateb i arian y loteri. Ni fydd arian y loteri byth yn talu'n gyfan gwbl am brosiect, ac nid yw'n talu am brosiectau'r Llywodraeth, ond rhaid iddo geisio adlewyrchu ein blaenoriaethau yng Nghymru.

### **Darpariaeth y Blynyddoedd Cynnar Early Years Provision**

**Q8 Catherine Thomas:** Will the First Minister make a statement on early years provision? OAQ0923 (FM)

**C8 Catherine Thomas:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am ddarpariaeth y blynyddoedd cynnar? OAQ0923 (FM)

**The First Minister:** For the first time in the history of British education, we in Wales have determined that early years education is to be based on the principle—well tried and tested in Scandinavia—that the best progress for three to seven-year-olds is made by learning through play rather than learning through learning.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Am y tro cyntaf yn hanes addysg ym Mhrydain, yr ydym ni yng Nghymru wedi penderfynu bod addysg y blynyddoedd cynnar i'w seilio ar yr egwyddor—sydd wedi'i hen brofi yn Llychlyn—fod y cynnydd gorau ymysg rhai tair i saith mlwydd oed yn digwydd drwy ddysgu drwy chwarae yn hytrach na dysgu drwy ddysgu.

**Catherine Thomas:** Do you also agree that it is crucial that we ensure that new plans, such as that for our foundation phase, are rolled out carefully and realistically to ensure that teachers and schools can meet the extra demands that this will inevitably place on them? Will you assure me of the Government's commitment to a realistic timetable for the roll-out of the foundation phase, and will you also ensure that there is adequate support throughout these crucial developments?

**Catherine Thomas:** A ydych hefyd yn cytuno ei bod yn hollbwysig inni sicrhau bod cynlluniau newydd, fel hwnnw ar gyfer ein cyfnod sylfaen, yn cael eu rhoi ar waith yn ofalus ac mewn modd ymarferol er mwyn sicrhau bod athrawon ac ysgolion yn gallu ateb y galwadau ychwanegol y mae hyn yn sicr o'u rhoi arnynt? A wnewch fy sicrhau bod y Llywodraeth wedi ymrwymo i osod amserlen ymarferol ar gyfer cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen, ac a wnewch sicrhau hefyd y bydd digon o gymorth ar gael drwy gydol y datblygiadau hollbwysig hyn?

**The First Minister:** I can, and that point was made by Jane Davidson last Friday, when she spoke at the sixth annual congress of the National Primary Centre Cymru. The foundation phase was very much at the heart of what she was talking about, in addition to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Gwnaf, a gwnaed y pwynt hwnnw gan Jane Davidson ddydd Gwener diwethaf, pan fu'n siarad yn chweched gyngres flynyddol Canolfan Addysg Gynradd Genedlaethol Cymru. Y cyfnod sylfaen a oedd wrth wraidd yr hyn yr oedd yn sôn

the Flying Start programme, for children aged up to three, to go alongside the provision for three to seven-year-olds. We are clear that the principles are: affordable high-quality childcare from the age of two onwards, and learning through play rather than learning through learning as the main emphasis for three to seven-year-olds. It must be well-piloted—we are in the middle of the pilot phase now—properly evaluated, and then rolled out on that realistic basis. You always find problems when you are carrying out a pilot phase, and you always discover that you can tweak something to make it much better. This is a revolution in British education; no-one has tried this before in Britain, although it has been very well tried and tested in the three Scandinavian countries and Finland. I am sure that we can make a success of it, but you only make a success of something if you pilot it and roll it out after piloting and evaluating it.

amdano, yn ogystal â'r rhaglen Dechrau'n Deg, ar gyfer plant hyd at dair oed, i gyd-fynd â'r ddarpariaeth ar gyfer rhai tair i saith mlwydd oed. Dywedwn yn glir mai'r egwyddorion yw: gofal plant fforddiadwy o safon dda o ddwyflwydd oed ymlaen, a dysgu drwy chwarae yn hytrach na dysgu drwy ddysgu fel y prif bwyslais ar gyfer rhai tair i saith mlwydd oed. Rhaid ei threialu'n drwyadl—yr ydym ar ganol y cyfnod peilot yn awr—ei gwerthuso'n iawn, a'i chyflwyno wedyn yn y modd realistig hwnnw. Ceir problemau bob amser wrth gynnal cyfnod peilot, a cheir bob amser fod modd gwneud mân newidiadau i rywbeth i'w wneud yn well o lawer. Mae hyn yn chwyldro yn addysg Prydain: nid oes neb wedi rhoi cynnig ar hyn o'r blaen ym Mhrydain er ei fod wedi'i brofi'n helaeth yn nhair gwlad Llychlyn a'r Ffindir. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gallwn fynd â'r maen i'r wal, ond ni wneir hynny ond drwy dreialu rhywbeth a'i roi ar waith ar ôl ei dreialu a'i werthuso.

### **Cyrhaeddiad Addysgol Educational Attainment**

**Q9 David Melding:** What is the Welsh Assembly Government doing to improve the educational attainment of looked-after children and care leavers? OAQ0946 (FM)

**C9 David Melding:** Beth a wneir gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant sy'n derbyn gofal a phlant sy'n gadael gofal? OAQ0946 (FM)

**The First Minister:** Our guidance for local education authorities and schools on the education of looked-after children and the introduction of personal education plans has helped raise achievement in this area. The implementation of the Children Act 2004, requiring local education authorities to promote the educational achievement of looked-after children, will give a further guarantee of improvement.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae ein canllawiau i awdurdodau addysg lleol ac ysgolion ynghylch addysg plant sydd yn derbyn gofal a chyflwyno cynlluniau addysg personol wedi helpu i hybu'r cyrhaeddiad yn y maes hwn. Bydd rhoi Deddf Plant 2004 ar waith, sy'n gofyn bod awdurdodau addysg lleol yn hyrwyddo cyrhaeddiad addysgol plant sy'n derbyn gofal, yn gwarantu gwelliannau pellach.

**David Melding:** I accept that there has been some progress, and this issue is certainly much higher up the agenda, which I welcome. However, we need to set ambitious targets. At the moment, only 6 per cent of care leavers achieve five good GCSE grades, and, in the last cohort of 204 care leavers that reached the age of 19, only six were in higher education. That really does demonstrate how poorly we are currently serving looked-after children.

**David Melding:** Derbyniaf fod rhywfaint o gynnydd wedi bod, a bod y mater hwn yn sicr yn llawer uwch ar yr agenda, a chroesawaf hynny. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid inni bennu targedau uchelgeisiol. Ar hyn o bryd, dim ond 6 y cant o'r rhai sy'n gadael gofal sy'n cael pum TGAU da ac, yn y garfan ddiwethaf o 204 o bobl a adawodd ofal yn 19 oed, dim ond chwech a oedd mewn addysg uwch. Mae hynny'n dangos mewn difrif pa mor wael yr ydym yn gwasanaethu plant sy'n derbyn gofal ar hyn o bryd.



**The First Minister:** Yes, but things are pointing in the right direction. Local authorities believe that 55 per cent of the young people who had their nineteenth birthday in the year ending 31 March 2004—and given the slight caveat that only 70 per cent of care leavers had been contacted by their local authority—were in education, training or employment in that year. Now, that is not wonderful. There is a long way to go if that number is only 55 per cent. However, we do believe that it represents progress.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Ydyw, ond mae pethau'n symud i'r cyfeiriad cywir. Cred yr awdurdodau lleol fod 55 y cant o'r bobl ifanc a gafodd eu pen-blwydd yn bedair ar bymtheg oed yn y flwyddyn yn diweddu 31 Mawrth 2004 mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu waith yn y flwyddyn honno—a chadw mewn cof y cafeiat bach mai dim ond â 70 y cant o'r rhai a oedd yn gadael gofal yr oedd eu hawdurdod lleol wedi cysylltu. Yn awr, nid yw hynny'n wych. Mae cryn waith i'w wneud eto os mai dim ond 55 y cant yw'r nifer. Fodd bynnag, yr ydym yn credu ei fod yn gynydd.

### **Prynu Tai am y Tro Cyntaf mewn Ardaloedd Gwledig First-time Buyers in Rural Areas**

**Q10 Mick Bates:** Will the First Minister make a statement on what his Government is doing to help first-time buyers in rural areas? OAQ0945 (FM)

**C10 Mick Bates:** A wnaiff y Prif Weinidog ddatganiad am yr hyn a wneir gan ei Lywodraeth i gynorthwyo'r rhai sy'n prynu tai am y tro cyntaf mewn ardaloedd gwledig? OAQ0945 (FM)

**The First Minister:** I am pleased that the social housing grant programme will allocate in full the local authority bids for funding under the homebuy scheme for the period from 2005-06 up to 2007-08.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr wyf yn falch y bydd y rhaglen grantiau tai cymdeithasol yn dyrannu'n llwyr geisiadau'r awdurdodau lleol am gyllid dan y cynllun cymorth prynu ar gyfer y cyfnod o 2005-06 hyd at 2007-08.

**Mick Bates:** Last week, the Assembly carried a motion calling for restrictions on the right to buy in areas of high demand. That is good news for young people in Montgomeryshire, where the average house price is now £160,000. One of the reasons for this, but by no means the only one, is the dramatic rise in the amount of houses that have been taken off the market because of the right to buy. What will your Government do to give local authorities the power to suspend the right to buy, in line with the Assembly's wishes?

**Mick Bates:** Yr wythnos diwethaf, derbyniodd y Cynulliad gynnig yn galw am gyfyngiadau ar yr hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd lle y ceir galw sylweddol. Mae hynny'n newyddion da i bobl ifanc yn sir Drefaldwyn, lle y mae'r pris cyfartalog am dŷ bellach yn £160,000. Un o'r rhesymau dros hyn, ond nid yr unig reswm o bellffordd, yw'r cynnydd dramatig yn nifer y tai a dynnwyd oddi ar y farchnad oherwydd yr hawl i brynu. Beth a wnaiff eich Llywodraeth i roi'r pŵer i awdurdodau lleol atal yr hawl i brynu, yn unol â dymuniadau'r Cynulliad?

**The First Minister:** That is slightly overdramatic. They are still in the housing market, even if they have been bought. It is simply that they are not in the social housing market, which is a far narrower point. We made an Order recently to give social landlords priority to repurchase former right-to-buy homes for reletting to those in housing need. You are right to refer to the fact that we have made Orders restricting the right to

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Mae hynny'n orddramatig braidd. Maent yn dal i fod yn y farchnad dai, hyd yn oed os ydynt wedi cael eu prynu. Yn syml iawn, nid ydynt yn y farchnad dai cymdeithasol, sy'n bwynt llawer mwy cyfyng. Gwnaethom Orchymyn yn ddiweddar i roi blaenoriaeth i landlordiaid cymdeithasol ailbrynu tai a arferai fod yn dai hawl i brynu ar gyfer eu hailosod i bobl sydd arnynt angen tai. Yr ydych yn iawn wrth

acquire and resell former right-to-buy properties in rural areas, and reducing the maximum discount. It is very difficult to get the balance right over the right to buy and the right to rent in social housing areas, particularly rural areas, where you have a parallel market in which wages may be low, but house prices can be high, causing huge problems for first-time buyers or those in social housing need. It is not impossible, and we believe that the steps that we have made take us in the right direction.

gyfeirio at y ffaith ein bod wedi gwneud Gorchmynion yn cyfyngu ar yr hawl i gaffael ac ailwerthu eiddo a arferai fod yn eiddo hawl i brynu mewn ardaloedd gwledig, a lleihau'r gostyngiad mwyaf. Mae'n anodd dros ben cael cydbwysedd o ran yr hawl i brynu a'r hawl i rentu mewn ardaloedd tai cymdeithasol, yn enwedig ardaloedd gwledig, lle y mae gennyh farchnad gyfochrog lle y mae'r cyflogau yn isel efallai, ond lle y gall prisiau'r tai fod yn uchel, gan achosi problemau enfawr i'r rhai sy'n prynu tai am y tro cyntaf neu'r rhai sydd arnynt angen tai cymdeithasol. Nid yw'n amhosibl, ac yr ydym yn credu bod y camau yr ydym wedi'u cymryd yn mynd â ni i'r cyfeiriad cywir.

**Y Llywydd:** Tynnwyd cwestiwn 11, OAQ0938 (FM), yn ôl.

**The Presiding Officer:** Question 11, OAQ0938 (FM), has been withdrawn.

### **Sefyllfa Ariannol Sefydliadau Addysg Uwch The Financial Position of Higher Education Institutions**

**Q12 Glyn Davies:** What plans does the First Minister have to change the Welsh Assembly Government's draft budget to improve the financial position of higher education institutions in Wales? OAQ0936 (FM)

**C12 Glyn Davies:** Pa gynlluniau sydd gan y Prif Weinidog i newid cyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i wella sefyllfa ariannol sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru? OAQ0936 (FM)

**The First Minister:** We are moving forward with the supplementary income stream, which we believe will do the job to which you refer.

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Yr ydym yn symud yn ein blaenau gyda'r llif incwm ategol, a chredwn y bydd hyn yn cyflawni'r hyn y cyfeiriwch ato.

**Glyn Davies:** While help for council tax payers has always been my personal priority, the proper funding of higher education institutions is also crucial in the budget discussions. Do you accept that there is a funding gap between higher education institutions in Wales and England? At what stage is the research that you have commissioned into this subject to identify whether there is a funding gap? Has it been made available to other parties, and will it eventually be made public?

**Glyn Davies:** Er mai rhoi cymorth i bobl sy'n talu'r dreth gyngor sydd wastad wedi bod yn flaenoriaeth bersonol i mi, mae darparu cyllid digonol i sefydliadau addysg uwch hefyd yn hollbwysig yn y trafodaethau ynghylch y gyllideb. A ydych yn derbyn bod bwch o ran cyllid rhwng sefydliadau addysg uwch yng Nghymru a'r rhai yn Lloegr? Ym mha gam y mae'r gwaith ymchwil a gomisiynwyd gennyh ar y pwnc hwn i weld a oes bwch o ran cyllid? A yw wedi bod ar gael i bleidiau eraill, ac a fydd, yn y pen draw, ar gael i'r cyhoedd?

**The First Minister:** All of those things will be done, but the research may or may not show the kind of funding gap that you are talking about. On one basis, it shows a funding gap in England, not in Wales, and that is on the point that I made earlier to Peter Black. If you ask what the expenditure on

**Y Prif Weinidog:** Caiff pob un o'r rheini eu gwneud, ond efallai y bydd neu na fydd y gwaith ymchwil yn dangos y math o fwch o ran cyllid yr ydych yn sôn amdano. Ar sail un peth, mae'n dangos bwch o ran cyllid yn Lloegr, nid yng Nghymru, ac mae hynny ynglŷn â'r pwynt a wneuthum yn gynharach

higher education per head of population is, the answer is that we spend more per head of population on higher education than England does.

The reason for that is the 7,000 net import of students coming into Wales, whom we have to fund from our scarce resources, and if those 7,000 were 70,000, it would bankrupt us completely. Per head of population, the funding gap is in England; per student, it is probably in Wales. How big it is depends on whether you include the Oxbridge universities, which have a tutorial system—and no university in Wales provides a tutorial system—or whether you take out Oxbridge and the London universities, with the excessively high rental costs that have to be paid there.

2.50 p.m.

All of that will be covered in the Higher Education Funding Council for Wales's report, which we hope to make available soon. However, it is a complex subject and, depending on which basis you use, the funding gap can go either way.

wrth Peter Black. Os gofynnwch beth yw'r gwariant ar addysg uwch fesul pen o'r boblogaeth, yr ateb yw ein bod yn gwario mwy fesul pen o'r boblogaeth ar addysg uwch nag a wna Lloegr.

Y rheswm dros hynny yw'r ffaith ein bod yn mewnfario 7,000 o fyfyrwyr i Gymru o ran nifer net, a bod rhaid inni eu cyllido o'n hadnoddau prin, a phe bai'r 7,000 hynny'n 70,000, byddai hynny'n ein gwneud yn fethdalwyr llwyr. Fesul pen o'r boblogaeth, yn Lloegr y mae'r bwlch o ran cyllid; fesul myfyriwr, mae'n debyg mai yng Nghymru y mae'r bwlch. Mae pa mor fawr ydyw yn dibynnu ar a ydych yn cynnwys prifysgolion Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt, sydd â system diwtorial—ac nid oes yr un brifysgol yng Nghymru yn darparu system diwtorial—neu a ydych yn anwybyddu prifysgolion Rhydychen a Chaergrawnt a Llundain, sydd â chostau rhent uchel iawn i'w talu yno.

Caiff hyn i gyd ei gynnwys yn adroddiad Cyngor Cyllido Addysg Uwch Cymru a fydd, gobeithio, ar gael yn fuan. Fodd bynnag, mae'n faes cymhleth a gall y bwlch o ran cyllid fynd y naill ffordd neu'r llall, mae'n dibynnu ar ba sail a ddefnyddiwyd.

## **Datganiad Busnes Business Statement**

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** I have one change to report to this week's business: tomorrow's statement on nutrition in schools has been postponed until Wednesday, 16 November. Business for the next three weeks is as set out in the draft business statement that can be found on the Chamberweb under 'supporting documents'. Following the Business Committee's meeting this morning, the Deputy Presiding Officer has determined that, under Standing Order No. 2.25, the following items of subordinate legislation need not be referred to a subject committee for extended consideration: the Official Feed and Food Controls (Wales) Regulations 2005; the Health and Social Care (Community Health and Standards) Act 2003 Commencement (Wales) (No. 3) Order 2005; the Food Labelling (Amendment) (Wales)

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Mae gennyf un newid i'w adrodd i fusnes yr wythnos hon: gohiriwyd y datganiad yfory ynghylch maeth mewn ysgolion tan ddydd Mercher, 16 Tachwedd. Mae busnes y tair wythnos nesaf fel y mae wedi ei nodi yn y datganiad busnes drafft a welir ar we'r Siambr dan 'ddogfennau ategol'. Yn dilyn cyfarfod y Pwyllgor Busnes y bore yma, penderfynodd yr Is-lywydd, dan Orchymyn Sefydlog Rhif 2.25, nad oes angen cyfeirio'r eitemau canlynol o is-ddeddfwriaeth at bwyllgor pwnc i'w hystyried ymhellach: Rheoliadau Rheolau Bwyd a Phorthiant Swyddogol (Cymru) 2005; Gorchymyn Deddf Iechyd a Gofal Cymdeithasol (Iechyd Cymunedol a Safonau) 2003 Cychwyn (Cymru) (Rhif 3) 2005; Rheoliadau Labelu Bwyd (Diwygio) (Cymru) (Rhif 2) (Diwygio) 2005;

(No. 2) (Amendment) Regulations 2005; the Housing Act 2004 (Commencement No. 2) (Wales) Order 2005; the Civil Partnership Act 2004 (Consequential Amendments to Subordinate Legislation) (Wales) Order 2005; the Social Services Complaints Procedure (Wales) Regulations 2005; and the Representations Procedure (Children) (Wales) Regulations 2005.

**Y Llywydd:** A oes gwrthwynebiadau i'r datganiad busnes? Gwelaf nad oes. A oes sylwadau?

**Elin Jones:** Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod bod Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn galw dros yr wythnosau diwethaf am ddatganiad ar ysbytai cymunedol. Mae diffyg ariannol y GIG yn arwain at dorri gwasanaethau drwy Gymru. Yng Ngheredigion, yn ystod yr wythnos diwethaf, daeth i'r amlwg bod yr ymddiriedolaeth yn ystyried cau ysbytai cymunedol Tregaron ac Aberteifi oherwydd y diffyg ariannol. Gwelaf yn y datganiad busnes y bydd datganiad am 'Cynllun Oes' ymhen pythefnos, ond credwn ni ym Mhlaid Cymru fod angen dadl benodol ar y diffyg ariannol yn y GIG a goblygiadau dinistriol hynny ar wasanaethau cymunedol a gwasanaethau cyffredinol y GIG drwy Gymru.

**David Melding:** Minister, we welcome the fact that one of your colleagues has agreed to provide a written statement on film. I would like an indication of when that will be available.

**Kirsty Williams:** Minister, the Welsh Liberal Democrats were grateful that the Minister for Health and Social Services provided a written statement this morning on the latest situation regarding the E.coli outbreak and the incidence at Abercynon Infants School. We would be grateful for assurances that the Minister will continue to keep the Assembly informed, by written and, if necessary, oral statement, of what is happening with that outbreak and related issues.

Elin Jones referred to issues in the Ceredigion constituency, but these are

Gorchymyn Deddf Tai 2004 (Cychwyn Rhif 2) 2005 (Cymru); Gorchymyn Deddf Partneriaeth Sifil 2004 (Diwygiadau Canlyniadol i Is-ddeddfwriaeth) (Cymru) 2005; Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Gwynion y Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Cymru) 2005; a Rheoliadau Gweithdrefn Sylwadau (Plant) (Cymru) 2005.

**The Presiding Officer:** Are there any objections to the business statement? I see that there are none. Are there any comments?

**Elin Jones:** The Minister will know that, over the past few weeks, Plaid Cymru has been calling for a statement on community hospitals. The NHS financial deficit has led to cuts in services throughout Wales. In Ceredigion, during the past week, it has come to light that the trust is giving consideration to closing Tregaron and Cardigan community hospitals because of the lack of funding. I see in the business statement that a statement on 'Designed for Life' is scheduled for a fortnight's time, but we in Plaid Cymru believe that there should be a specific debate on the NHS shortfall and its detrimental implications for community services and general NHS services throughout Wales.

**David Melding:** Weinidog, yr ydym yn croesawu'r ffaith bod un o'ch cyd-Aelodau wedi cytuno i roi datganiad ysgrifenedig ar ffilm. Hoffwn wybod pryd y bydd hynny ar gael.

**Kirsty Williams:** Weinidog, yr oedd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru yn ddiolchgar bod y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol wedi rhoi datganiad ysgrifenedig y bore yma am y sefyllfa ddiweddaraf ynghylch yr achosion E.coli a'r digwyddiad yn Ysgol Babanod Abercynon. Byddem yn ddiolchgar o dderbyn sicrwydd y bydd y Gweinidog yn parhau i roi gwybod i'r Cynulliad, drwy gyfrwng datganiadau ysgrifenedig ac, os oes rhaid, drwy ddatganiadau ar lafar, am yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran yr haint hwnnw a materion perthnasol.

Cyfeiriodd Elin Jones at faterion yn etholaeth Ceredigion, ond mae'r rhain i'w gweld ledled

repeated throughout Wales. We have seen that most recently in the north Wales area. I spent two hours in a meeting last night with local general practitioners discussing the fact that, because of a £1.4 million overspend, Powys may close wards in the hospitals at Bronllys and Builth. There is a need to debate these issues. I understand that other LHBs have an excess of funds, so there has been a degree of mismatching in the distribution of health service spending.

**Carl Sargeant:** Minister, will you consider allocating some time to discuss economic performance in Wales? I bring this to your attention because of the Wales Fast Growth 50 businesses, particularly Edwards Homes Ltd in my constituency, at Connah's Quay, which came fourth in Wales and first in the north Wales region.

I would also welcome a discussion, as would my colleague, David Melding, on the electoral arrangements of this establishment, following the suggestion about regional Members and their ability to take part in the Chamber. I would welcome a debate on that.

Finally, I would also welcome a debate on general dental contracts and an update on where we are with this. Some dentists have behaved disgracefully, saying that the NHS has left them when that is clearly not the case; it is the other way around.

**The Business Minister (Jane Hutt):** Thank you for supporting the business statement. I appreciate that from opposition colleagues. Elin and Kirsty raised two issues. First, on the 'Designed for Life' debate, Elin, I think that you referred to issues surrounding the reconfiguration of community hospitals. That debate has been scheduled, but you and Kirsty also raised the issue of NHS trust funding. In fact, the Minister for Health and Social Services outlined the position on NHS trust finances at last week's committee meeting, and he circulated a paper on the issues to committee members. However, Brian has agreed to issue a written statement to all Assembly Members outlining the position.

Cymru. Yr ydym wedi gweld hynny'n ddiweddar yn ardal y gogledd. Treuliais ddwy awr mewn cyfarfod neithiwr gyda meddygon lleol yn trafod y ffaith y gallai Powys, oherwydd eu bod wedi gorwario £1.4 miliwn, gau wardiau yn ysbytai Bronllys a Llanfair-ym-Muallt. Mae angen cynnal dadl ar y materion hyn. Yr wyf yn cael ar ddeall fod gan fyrddau iechyd lleol eraill arian dros ben, felly gwelir bod rhywfaint o anghysondeb wedi bod o ran dyrannu gwariant y gwasanaeth iechyd.

**Carl Sargeant:** Weinidog, a wnewch ystyried rhoi rhywfaint o amser i drafod perfformiad economi Cymru? Yr wyf yn dwyn hyn i'ch sylw oherwydd y busnesau sy'n perthyn i'r 50 sy'n Ehangu'n Gyflym yng Nghymru, yn arbennig Edwards Homes Ltd yn fy etholaeth, yng Nghei Conna, a ddaeth yn bedwerydd drwy Gymru ac yn gyntaf yn rhanbarth y gogledd.

Byddwn hefyd yn croesawu trafodaeth, fel y byddai fy nghyd-Aelod, David Melding, ynghylch trefniadau etholaethol y sefydliad hwn, yn sgîl yr awgrym ynghylch Aelodau rhanbarthol a'u gallu i gymryd rhan yn y Siambr. Byddwn yn croesawu dadl ar hynny.

Yn olaf, byddwn hefyd yn croesawu dadl ynghylch contractau deintyddol cyffredinol a'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y sefyllfa hon. Mae rhai deintyddion wedi ymddwyn yn warthus, gan ddweud bod y GIG wedi eu gadael hwy pan nad yw hyn, yn amlwg, yn wir; fel arall y bu.

**Y Trefnydd (Jane Hutt):** Diolch am gefnogi'r datganiad busnes. Yr wyf yn gwerthfawrogi hynny gan gyd-Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau. Cododd Elin a Kirsty ddau fater. Yn gyntaf, ynghylch y ddadl am 'Cynllun Oes', yr wyf yn credu, Elin, i chi gyfeirio at faterion yn ymwneud ag ail-gyflunio ysbytai cymuned. Mae amser wedi'i drefnu ar gyfer y ddadl honno, ond codwyd gennych chi a Kirsty hefyd y mater sy'n ymwneud â chyllido ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG. Mewn gwirionedd, amlinellodd y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol y sefyllfa ynghylch cyllido ymddiriedolaethau'r GIG yng nghyfarfod y pwyllgor yr wythnos diwethaf, a dosbarthodd bapur am y materion ymysg aelodau'r

pwyllgor. Fodd bynnag, mae Brian wedi cytuno i gyflwyno datganiad ysgrifenedig i holl Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn amlinellu'r sefyllfa.

Kirsty, on the issue of E.coli, you know that Brian has come forward on every occasion. There was a written statement this morning, and an oral statement. You have our assurance that that will be the case as we take this forward. Hopefully, we will not have to, but he will as and when.

Kirsty, o ran E.coli, yr ydych yn gwybod bod Brian wedi cyflwyno datganiadau bob tro. Cafwyd datganiad ysgrifenedig y bore yma, ynghyd â datganiad ar lafar. Rhoddwn sicrwydd i chi y bydd hyn yn digwydd bob tro wrth inni fwrw ymlaen â'r mater hwn. Gobeithio na fydd rhaid inni wneud hyn, ond bydd Brian yn gwneud, pryd bynnag y bydd angen.

David, yes, certainly, the statement on film will be available later this week. I can give you that assurance.

David, yn sicr, bydd y datganiad ar ffilm ar gael yn ddiweddarach yr wythnos hon. Gallaf addo hynny ichi.

Carl, I am not sure about all your questions and I do not intend to respond to them all. Having had the opportunity to learn a lot about the knowledge bank for Wales last week, your company in Connah's Quay might be a candidate for the north Wales economy. The debate on dentistry will also enable you to give your views. Of course, we all await with great interest the Bill that will enhance powers for Wales.

Carl, nid wyf yn sicr ynghylch pob un o'ch cwestiynau ac nid wyf yn bwriadu ateb pob un ohonynt. Ar ôl cael cyfle i ddysgu llawer am y banc gwybodaeth i Gymru yr wythnos diwethaf, mae'n ddigon posibl y bydd eich cwmni yng Nghei Conna yn ymgeisydd ar gyfer economi'r gogledd. Cewch hefyd gyfle i fynegi'ch barn yn y ddadl am ddeintyddiaeth, Wrth gwrs, disgwyliwn gyda chryn ddiddordeb am y Mesur a fydd yn cynyddu'r pwerau i Gymru.

*Derbyniwyd y datganiad busnes.  
Business statement adopted.*

### **Cynnig Cyfansawdd: Cymeradwyo Gorchmynion Composite Motion: Approval of Orders**

**Y Llywydd:** O dan Reol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25, ni chynhelir dadl ar y cynnig hwn

**The Presiding Officer:** Under Standing Order No. 24.25, this motion is not subject to debate.

**The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning (Jane Davidson):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes (Jane Davidson):** Cynigiaf fod

*the National Assembly for Wales, acting under Standing Order No. 24.25:*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru, gan weithredu'n unol â Rheol Sefydlog Rhif 24.25:*

*1. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 November 2005 on the draft the Education (Free School Lunches) (State Pension Credit) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

*1. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol am Ddim) (Credyd Pensiwn y Wladwriaeth) (Cymru) 2005; a*

- b) approves that the Education (Free School Lunches) (State Pension Credit) (Wales) Order 2005 be made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Gorchymyn Addysg (Ciniawau Ysgol am Ddim) (Credyd Pensiwn y Wladwriaeth) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 11 October 2005; and*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 11 Hydref 2005; a*
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 14 October 2005.*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 14 Hydref 2005.*
- 2. a) considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 November 2005 on the draft the Tryptophan in Food (Wales) Regulations 2005 and*
- 2. a) yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Rheoliadau Tryptoffan mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2005 a*
- b) approves that the Tryptophan in Food (Wales) Regulations 2005 be made in accordance with:*
- b) yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Tryptoffan mewn Bwyd (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*
- i) the draft Order laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005; and*
- i) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005; a*
- ii) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005; and*
- ii) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005; a*
- iii) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 November 2005. (NDM2654)*
- iii) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Tachwedd 2005. (NDM2654)*

*Cynnig (NDM2654): O blaid 57, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2654): For 57, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

**Cymeradwyo Gorchymyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 11)  
 (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu heb fod drwy  
 Asiantaeth) (Cymru) 2005, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd  
 Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadu gydag Efen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005 a Rheoliadau  
 Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005  
 Approval of the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 11)  
 (Wales) Order 2005, the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales)  
 Regulations 2005, the Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees) (Adoptions with a  
 Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005 and the Local Authority Adoption  
 Service (Wales) Regulations 2005**

**Y Llywydd:** Cynigir trafod y pedair eitem nesaf gyda'i gilydd, oni bai fod Aelod yn gwrthwynebu. Gwelaf nad oes gwrthwynebiad.

**The Presiding Officer:** It is proposed that the next four items be debated together, unless any Member objects. I see that there are no objections.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiad fod



*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 11) (Wales) Order 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2005. (NDM2661)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office and e-mailed to Assembly Members on 1 November 2005 in relation to the draft the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 11) (Wales) Order 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Adoption and Children Act 2002 (Commencement No. 11) (Wales) Order 2005 be made in accordance with the draft laid in the Table Office on 17 October 2005. (NDM2662)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*considers the principle of the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005. (NDM2655)*

I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005 in relation to the draft the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and*

*2. approves that the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 be made in accordance with:*

*a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005; and*

*b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2005. (NDM2656)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Gorchymyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant (2002) (Cychwyn Rhif 11) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohono yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2005. (NDM2661)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ac a e-bostiwyd at Aelodau'r Cynulliad ar 1 Tachwedd 2005 ynghylch drafft y Gorchymyn Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 11) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod y Gorchymyn Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 (Cychwyn Rhif 11) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael ei wneud yn unol â'r drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 17 Hydref 2005. (NDM2662)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu heb fod drwy Asiantaeth) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005. (NDM2655)*

Cynigiaf fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005 ynghylch drafft Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu heb fod drwy Asiantaeth) (Cymru) 2005; a*

*2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu heb fod drwy Asiantaeth) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:*

*a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005; a*

*b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2005.*

	(NDM2656)
I propose that	Cynigiaf fod
<i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	<i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>considers the principle of the Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees) (Adoptions with a Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005 a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005. (NDM2657)</i>	<i>yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadu gydag Elfen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005. (NDM2657)</i>
I propose that	Cynigiaf fod
<i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	<i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru</i>
<i>1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005 in relation to the draft the Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees) (Adoptions with a Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005; and</i>	<i>1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005 ynghylch drafft Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadu gydag Elfen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005; a</i>
<i>2. approves that the Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees) (Adoptions with a Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005 be made in accordance with:</i>	<i>2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadu gydag Elfen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:</i>
<i>a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005; and</i>	<i>a) y drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005; a</i>
<i>b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2005. (NDM2658)</i>	<i>b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2005. (NDM2658)</i>
I propose that	Cynigiaf fod
<i>the National Assembly for Wales</i>	<i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>considers the principle of the Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005, a copy of which was laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005. (NDM2659)</i>	<i>yn ystyried egwyddor Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005, y gosodwyd copi ohonynt yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005. (NDM2659)</i>
I propose that	Cynigiaf fod
<i>the National Assembly for Wales:</i>	<i>Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:</i>
<i>1. considers the report of the Legislation Committee laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005 in relation to the draft the Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005 and</i>	<i>1. yn ystyried adroddiad y Pwyllgor Deddfau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005 ynghylch drafft Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005; a</i>

2. approves that the Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005 be made in accordance with:

a) the draft laid in the Table Office on 4 October 2005; and

b) the regulatory appraisal laid in the Table Office on 10 October 2005; and

c) the memorandum of corrections laid in the Table Office on 18 October 2005. (NDM2660)

This afternoon, we are considering one commencement Order and three sets of regulations. Together, these complete the secondary legislation package that we need to give full effect to the Adoption and Children Act 2002. Under this commencement Order, and one being made by the Secretary of State for Education and Skills covering non-devolved functions, the whole of the Act and its associated regulations will be brought into force by 30 December 2005. In passing these regulations, we are completing an important journey of reform that was triggered by the Children and Adoption Act 2002 and related legislation. The adoption regime established under the Adoption Act 1976 was clearly in need of major overhaul to provide an up-to-date adoption service and to ensure that children are placed at the centre of the adoption process.

The regulations that we are considering do not make significant changes to the current adoption regime, but are needed to ensure that existing arrangements can continue with the repeal of the 1976 Act. The first step, the Local Authority (Non-agency Adoptions) (Wales) Regulations 2005 are the regulations under which local authority adoption services are inspected and regulated by the care inspectorate. The only change is that the regulations introduce, as part of the inspection regime, the new responsibility placed on local authorities to make provision for adoption support agencies. I know that this was a concern raised by Jenny Randerson at an earlier stage in the introduction of this series of regulations.

The Local Authorities (Prescribed Fees)

2. yn cymeradwyo bod Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005 yn cael eu gwneud yn unol ag:

a) y Gorchymyn drafft a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 4 Hydref 2005; a

b) yr arfarniad rheoliadol a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 10 Hydref 2005; ac

c) y memorandwm cywiriadau a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Hydref 2005. (NDM2660)

Y prynhawn yma, yr ydym yn ystyried un Gorchymyn cychwyn a thair set o reoliadau. Gyda'i gilydd, mae'r rhain yn cwblhau'r pecyn o is-ddeddfwriaethau sydd ei angen arnom er mwyn rhoi Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 ar waith yn llawn. Dan y Gorchymyn cychwyn hwn, ac un a wneir gan yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau sy'n ymwneud â swyddogaethau nas datganolwyd, daw'r Ddeddf gyfan a'i holl reoliadau cysylltiedig i rym erbyn 30 Rhagfyr 2005. O basio'r rheoliadau hyn, yr ydym yn cwblhau llwybr diwygio pwysig a sbardunwyd gan Ddeddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 a deddfwriaeth gysylltiedig. Yr oedd gwir angen gweddnewid y drefn fabwysiadu, a sefydlwyd dan Ddeddf Mabwysiadu 1976, yn llwyr er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth mabwysiadu cyfoes ac i sicrhau bod plant yn ganolog yn y broses fabwysiadu.

Nid yw'r rheoliadau yr ydym yn eu hystyried yn golygu newidiadau sylweddol i'r drefn fabwysiadu bresennol, ond mae eu hangen er mwyn sicrhau y gall y trefniadau presennol barhau o ran diddymu Deddf 1976. Y cam cyntaf, Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Mabwysiadu Anasiantaethol) (Cymru) 2005, yw'r rheoliadau a ddefnyddir gan yr arolygiaeth gofal i arolygu a rheoleiddio gwasanaethau mabwysiadu awdurdodau lleol. Yr unig newid yw bod y rheoliadau yn cyflwyno, fel rhan o'r drefn arolygu, y cyfrifoldeb newydd a osodir ar awdurdodau lleol i ddarparu ar gyfer asiantaethau cymorth mabwysiadu. Gwn fod hyn yn bryder a fynegwyd gan Jenny Randerson yn gynharach yn y broses o gyflwyno'r gyfres hon o reoliadau.

Mae Rheoliadau Awdurdodau Lleol (Ffioedd

(Adoptions with a Foreign Element) (Wales) Regulations 2005 provide a discretionary power for local authorities to charge inter-country adopters for a range of facilities provided to them in connection with the adoption of children from foreign countries. This mainly relates to counselling and the preparation of assessments on the suitability of those wishing to adopt a child from a specific country.

3.00 p.m.

The Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005 make provision for people wishing to adopt children who are not placed for adoption with them by an adoption agency. This covers prospective adopters such as those who live overseas, service personnel, and members of the diplomatic service who may wish to apply for an adoption order. They also cover such adoptions as those by step-parents and other carers where a child has not been formally placed by a local authority.

All these elements add to the final pieces of the jigsaw that will provide a modern comprehensive adoption service for the future. None of the regulations will make a significant change to current adoption arrangements, but they will update them to ensure that all aspects of the adoption process are adequately covered in legislation within a system that aims to produce the best possible outcomes for children and others affected by adoption.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau hyn fel cam arall ymlaen. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Gweinidog am ymdrin â mater ffioedd a godir ar rieni maeth sy'n mabwysiadu plant o wledydd tramor—mae hwnnw'n bwynt o bwys.

Wrth groesawu'r rheoliadau hyn, yr wyf am godi tri mater nad ydynt yn ymwneud yn uniongyrchol â'r rheoliadau, ond sy'n cael effaith arnynt. Y mater cyntaf yw'r gofyn i awdurdodau lleol, wrth ystyried rhieni ar gyfer mabwysiadu, gynnal asesiad gyda'r Swyddfa Cofnodion Troseddol. Dim ond ar

Rhagnodedig) (Mabwysiadau gydag Eifen Dramor) (Cymru) 2005 yn rhoi pŵer dewisol i awdurdodau lleol godi tâl ar fabwysiadwyr rhyng-wladol am ystod o gyfleusterau a ddarperir ar eu cyfer mewn cysylltiad â mabwysiadu plant o wledydd tramor. Mae hyn yn gysylltiedig yn bennaf â chwnsela a pharatoi asesiadau ynghylch pa mor addas yw'r rhai sy'n dymuno mabwysiadu plentyn o wlad benodol.

Mae Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005 yn darparu ar gyfer pobl sy'n dymuno mabwysiadu plentyn na chaiff ei leoli gyda hwy i'w fabwysiadu gan asiantaeth fabwysiadu. Mae hyn yn cynnwys darpar fabwysiadwyr fel y rhai sy'n byw dramor, personél y lluoedd arfog, ac aelodau o'r gwasanaeth llysgenhadol a allai ddewis gwneud cais am orchymyn mabwysiadu. Mae hefyd yn cynnwys enghreifftiau fel llys-rieni a gofalwyr eraill yn mabwysiadu plant nad ydynt wedi eu lleoli'n ffurfiol gan awdurdod lleol.

Mae'r holl elfennau hyn yn ychwanegu at ddarnau olaf y jig-so a fydd yn darparu gwasanaeth mabwysiadu cynhwysfawr a chyfoes i'r dyfodol. Ni fydd yr un o'r rheoliadau'n gwneud newid arwyddocaol i'r trefniadau mabwysiadu cyfredol, ond fe wnânt eu diweddarau i sicrhau bod pob agwedd ar y broses fabwysiadu wedi'i chynnwys yn ddigonol yn y ddeddfwriaeth o fewn system sydd â'r nod o gynhyrchu'r canlyniadau gorau posibl i blant ac eraill y mae mabwysiadu'n effeithio arnynt.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** We welcome these regulations as another step forward. I am grateful to the Minister for dealing with the issue of the fees charged on foster parents who adopt children from abroad—that is an important point.

In welcoming these regulations, I will raise three issues which do not directly pertain to the regulations, but which have an effect on them. The first issue is the requirement on local authorities, in considering potential adoptive parents, to undertake a Criminal Records Bureau assessment. Such

aelodau'r teulu sydd dros 18 oed y gwneir yr asesiad hwnnw. A yw'r Gweinidog wedi rhoi unrhyw ystyriaeth i'r angen i edrych ar gofnodion troseddol aelodau o'r teulu a allai fod dan 18 oed? Pam fod y trothwy hwnnw yn ei le?

Bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol bod adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar gyfer 2004-05 wedi cofnodi diffygion o ran staffio ac adnoddau ar gyfer y math o waith sydd angen ei wneud yn y maes hwn. Mae'n briodol cael y rheoliadau yn eu lle, ond mae'n rhaid eu gweithredu. A ydych yn hyderus bod yr adnoddau dynol a'r adnoddau ariannol yn eu lle?

Bydd y rheoliadau hyn, gobeithio, yn hwyluso'r broses i rieni sy'n dymuno mabwysiadu. Fodd bynnag, byddwch yn ymwybodol nad yw rhieni a chanddynt blentyn wedi'i fabwysiadu yn gallu cael mynediad i driniaeth ffrwythlondeb. A ydych o'r farn y gwnaiff hynny arwain at sefyllfa lle bydd rhieni yn ymwrthod â'r cyfle i fabwysiadu oherwydd ei fod yn peryglu eu cyfle i dderbyn triniaeth ffrwythlondeb a chael plant yn y ffordd honno hefyd?

Yr ydym yn croesawu'r rheoliadau, ond byddem yn falch o gael eglurhad ar y pwyntiau cyffredinol yr wyf wedi eu codi.

**Mark Isherwood:** My party supported the Adoption and Children Act 2002 in Westminster and the Welsh Conservative Party will continue to support it in the Assembly. Therefore, we will support commencement Order number 11. We welcome regulations that will bring step-parent adoptions more in line with other type of adoptions, and ensure that adequate safeguards are provided so that children are not left at risk.

Given the financial difficulties currently faced by local authorities in Wales, caused in large part by unfunded burdens imposed upon them, we recognise the need for local social services authorities to have a discretionary power to charge inter-country adopters for a range of facilities provided to them. There has been one particularly high profile case of inter-country adoption in Wales, and it highlighted the fact that high profile press

assessments are only undertaken on members of the family over the age of 18. Has the Minister given any consideration to the need to look at the criminal records of family members who may be under 18 years of age? Why is that threshold in place?

The Minister will be aware that the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales's annual report for 2004-05 identified deficiencies in terms of staffing and resources for the type of work that needs to be undertaken in this area. It is right to have the regulations in place, but they must be implemented. Are you confident that the human resources and financial resources are in place?

The regulations will hopefully simplify the process for parents wishing to adopt. However, you will be aware that parents who have an adopted child will be prevented from accessing fertility treatment. Do you believe that this will lead to a situation where parents reject the opportunity to adopt because it places their opportunity to have fertility treatment and to have children in that way at risk?

We welcome the regulations, but we would be grateful for an explanation on the general points that I have raised.

**Mark Isherwood:** Cefnogodd fy mhlaidd Ddeddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 yn San Steffan a bydd y Blaid Geidwadol Gymreig yn parhau i'w chefnogi yn y Cynulliad. Felly, cefnogwn Orchymyn cychwyn rhif 11. Croesawn reoliadau a ddaw â mabwysiadu gan lys-rieni'n agosach at fathau eraill o fabwysiadu, gan sicrhau y darperir mesurau diogelu digonol fel na fydd plant yn cael eu gadael mewn sefyllfa beryglus.

Yn wyneb yr anawsterau ariannol a wynebir ar hyn o bryd gan awdurdodau lleol yng Nghymru, a achoswyd i raddau helaeth gan feichiau a orfodwyd arnynt heb gyllid ar eu cyfer, sylweddolwn fod angen i awdurdodau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol lleol gael hawl disgresiwn i godi tâl ar fabwysiadwyr rhyng-wladol am ystod o gyfleusterau a ddarperir iddynt. Cafwyd un achos arbennig o amlwg o fabwysiadu rhyng-wladol yng Nghymru, a

and political involvement can push the wellbeing of children into second place. The evidence and the law must, therefore, be rigorously complied with. The qualifications of officers and professionals to make judgments or issue reports must be clarified and stipulated, and officers must be required to either produce all medical reports or validate claims that they do not exist.

We will also support the Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005 so that the Adoption and Children Act 2002 may be brought fully into force when the Adoption Act 1976 is repealed and the 2003 regulations cease to have effect on 30 December 2005.

As stated at the outset, we support the Act, although the concerns expressed by my colleagues in Westminster remain, that people who adopt children may not receive adequate support from their local social services departments. As I stated in Plenary on 19 April this year, my understanding is that the Act requires social services departments only to review the support that they provide to parents of adopted children. A department can decide not to implement any of the review's recommendations. We called for this to be made a statutory requirement because social services departments have so many requirements that providing support for parents of adopted children can get pushed down the list.

Another serious concern that I raised was that some social services departments could become more zealous in their implementation of adoption procedures for young children and babies. This is because it is often easier to provide homes for them than for older children. With current adoption rates largely static, we must avoid any risk of councils feeling pressured into raising their quota of adoptions in this way. There is also an urgent need to concentrate on older children. We therefore suggest that there must be greater incentives to tackle the education and health inequalities faced by children who are more difficult to adopt. Although we support these

ddangosodd yn glir y gall y ffaith bod y wasg a'r gwleidyddion yn ymhel â'r mater mewn modd amlwg wthio lles plant i safle eilradd. Felly, rhaid cydymffurfio'n drylwyr â'r dystiolaeth a'r gyfraith. Rhaid egluro a phennu cymwysterau swyddogion a gweithwyr proffesiynol i roi dyfarniadau neu gyhoeddi adroddiadau, a rhaid mynnu bod swyddogion naill ai'n dangos pob adroddiad meddygol neu'n dilysu honiadau nad ydynt yn bodoli.

Byddwn hefyd yn cefnogi Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu (Cymru) 2005 fel y gellir dod â Deddf Mabwysiadu a Phlant 2002 i rym yn llwyr pan ddiddymir Deddf Mabwysiadu 1976 a phan beidia rheoliadau 2003 â bod yn weithredol ar 30 Rhagfyr 2005.

Fel y dywedwyd ar y dechrau, cefnogwn y Ddeddf, er bod y pryderon a fynegwyd gan fy nghyd-aelodau yn San Steffan yn parhau, na fydd pobl sydd yn mabwysiadu plant efallai'n cael cymorth digonol gan eu hadrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol lleol. Fel y dywedais yn y Cyfarfod Llawn ar 19 Ebrill eleni, dim ond mynnu bod adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol yn adolygu'r cymorth a roddant i rieni plant a fabwysiadwyd a wna'r Ddeddf, yn ôl a ddeallaf. Gall adran benderfynu peidio â gweithredu dim un o argymhellion yr adolygiad. Galwasom am wneud hyn yn ofyniad statudol oherwydd y mae cynifer o ofynion ar adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol nes y gall darparu cymorth i rieni plant a fabwysiadwyd gael ei wthio i lawr y rhestr.

Pryder difrifol arall a godais oedd y gallai rhai adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol fynd yn fwy eiddgar yn y modd y gweithredant drefniadau mabwysiadu ar gyfer plant ifanc a babanod, a hynny am ei bod yn aml yn haws darparu cartrefi iddynt hwy nag i blant hŷn. Gyda'r cyfraddau mabwysiadu cyfredol yn ddisymud i raddau helaeth, rhaid osgoi unrhyw berygl y gallai cynghorau deimlo dan bwysau i godi eu cwota o fabwysiadu yn y modd hwn. Hefyd mae gwir angen canolbwyntio ar blant hŷn. Awgrymwn felly fod yn rhaid cynnig cymhellion mwy i fynd i'r afael â'r annhegwch o ran addysg ac iechyd a wynebir

measures, we strongly urge the Welsh Assembly Government to give these additional matters its consideration.

**Jenny Randerson:** The Welsh Liberal Democrats support these regulations and the intentions behind them. Everyone must welcome the ideals of having national standards, consistency across Wales, a high quality service, trained and qualified staff, and an appropriate complaints procedure, as set out in the Local Authority Adoption Service (Wales) Regulations 2005.

This will be inspected by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales on behalf of the Assembly. With reference to that, I draw the Minister's attention to this year's CSIW report, which we will debate later. It makes the points that staffing levels give cause for concern across Wales, particularly given the demands of the new legislative framework; that it is concerned about strategies to recruit and support carers; and that there is concern about the vetting processes for staff. Specifically, the CSIW report points out that, across the whole of Wales,

'In only one agency were the detailed vetting checks required by the regulations being fully carried out. This applied equally to staff and managers'.

The report goes on to say:

'In six agencies it was felt that the service was inadequately staffed to undertake the range and level of work handled. Few had a workload management system and some were relying heavily on independent social workers complementing the existing staff'.

The report goes on in that way. In other words, we have a very imperfect picture, and I would welcome the Minister's comments on how he and his Government are going to supply the additional financial resources that are necessary for local government and social services departments to do the job properly, because do this job properly they must. It is

gan blant sydd yn anos eu mabwysiadu. Er ein bod yn cefnogi'r mesurau hyn, anogwn Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn gryf i ystyried y materion ychwanegol hyn.

**Jenny Randerson:** Mae Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru'n cefnogi'r rheoliadau hyn a'r hyn sy'n sail iddynt o ran bwriad. Rhaid i bawb groesawu'r delfrydau o gael safonau cenedlaethol, cysondeb ar draws Cymru, gwasanaeth o ansawdd da, staff hyfforddedig a chymwys, a threfn gwyno briodol, a nodir yn Rheoliadau Gwasanaeth Mabwysiadu Awdurdodau Lleol (Cymru) 2005.

Arolygir hyn gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar ran y Cynulliad. Gan gyfeirio at hynny, tynnaf sylw'r Gweinidog at adroddiad yr arolygiaeth eleni, a fydd yn destun dadl gennym yn ddiweddarach. Mae'n gwneud y pwyntiau bod lefelau staffio'n achosi pryder ledled Cymru, yn enwedig o gofio gofynion y fframwaith deddfwriaethol newydd; ei bod yn pryderu am strategaethau i recriwtio a rhoi cymorth i ofalwyr; a bod pryder ynghylch y prosesau fetio i'r staff. Yn benodol, noda adroddiad yr arolygiaeth, yng nghyd-destun Cymru gyfan,

[mai] dim ond mewn un asiantaeth yr oedd yr archwiliadau fetio manwl a fynnir gan y rheoliadau yn cael eu cynnal yn llawn. Yr oedd hyn yr un mor wir am y staff a'r rheolwyr.

Â'r adroddiad ymlaen i ddweud:

Mewn chwe asiantaeth teimlid nad oedd y gwasanaeth wedi'i staffio'n ddigonol i ymgymryd ag amrediad a lefel y gwaith a oedd yn cael ei wneud. Ychydig oedd yn rhedeg system rheoli llwyth gwaith ac yr oedd rhai'n dibynnu'n drwm ar weithwyr cymdeithasol annibynnol i ategu'r staff presennol.

Aiff yr adroddiad ymlaen yn y modd hwnnw. Mewn geiriau eraill, darlun amherffaith iawn sydd gennym, a byddwn yn croesawu sylwadau'r Gweinidog ynghylch sut y mae ef a'i Lywodraeth yn mynd i ddarparu'r adnoddau ariannol ychwanegol sydd yn angenrheidiol i lywodraeth leol ac adrannau gwasanaethau cymdeithasol wneud y gwaith

time to stop cutting corners. The need for a stringent approach to checking and assessing proposed adopters—the need for local authorities to carry out criminal records checks—is something on which we would all unite.

On the restrictions on what local authorities can charge, I think that there is an understanding that we probably all share that there are only limited ways in which local authorities should properly charge, but that it is important that the Government funds them for those things contained in the regulations for which they will not be able to charge. That includes complex issues involving inter-country adoptions.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I will start with the question that I cannot answer, which was Rhodri Glyn's on the limitation with regard to 18-year-olds. I will try to get further advice on that in order to explain the rationale of the limitation. Everyone knows that the amount of investment in children's services in Wales is increasing year on year by a massive amount, mainly through the Children First grant fund.

3.10 p.m.

If the Assembly approves the draft budget without too much interference with it and, if it goes ahead, there will be substantial increases in it this year for children's services. Therefore, hopefully, Members will bear in mind the concerns that they have expressed in relation to funding children's services when they come to consider the future draft budget statement.

We should also remember that, in relation to funding, local government has asked that more of the money should be allocated through the revenue support grant. That is what we are doing and a significant element of the Children First grant is now being allocated directly, in an unhypothecated way, to local government through the revenue support grant. If people are just looking at the pure budget tables and do not remember that

yn iawn, oherwydd y mae'n rhaid iddynt wneud y gwaith hwn yn iawn. Mae'n bryd rhoi'r gorau i dorri corneli. Mae'r angen i fynd ati'n drwyadl i wirio ac asesu darpar fabwysiadwyr—yr angen i awdurdodau lleol gynnal archwiliadau cofnodion troseddol—yn rhywbeth y byddem i gyd yn cytuno yn ei gylch.

Ynglŷn â'r cyfyngiadau ar y tâl y gall awdurdodau lleol ei godi, yr wyf yn meddwl ein bod i gyd, mae'n debyg, yn cyd-fynd mai dim ond mewn ffyrdd cyfyngedig y dylai awdurdodau lleol godi tâl yn briodol, ond ei bod yn bwysig bod y Llywodraeth yn eu hariannu ar gyfer y pethau hynny a geir yn y rheoliadau na fyddant yn gallu codi tâl amdanynt. Mae hynny'n cynnwys materion cymhleth yn ymwneud â mabwysiadu rhyng-wladol.

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Dechreuaf gyda'r cwestiwn na allaf ei ateb, sef cwestiwn Rhodri Glyn am y cyfyngiad o ran pobl dan 18 mlwydd oed. Ceisiaf gael rhagor o gyngor am hynny er mwyn esbonio'r rheswm dros y cyfyngiad. Gŵyr pawb fod y swm a fuddsoddir mewn gwasanaethau plant yng Nghymru'n codi'n aruthrol yn flynyddol, yn bennaf drwy gronfa grantiau Plant yn Gyntaf.

Os cymeradwya'r Cynulliad y gyllideb ddrafft heb ymyrryd gormod â hi ac, os aiff yn ei blaen, bydd yn cynnwys codiadau sylweddol eleni ar gyfer gwasanaethau plant. Felly, gobeithio, bydd yr Aelodau'n cofio'r pryderon y maent wedi'u mynegi yng nghyswllt ariannu gwasanaethau plant pan ânt ati i ystyried datganiad cyllideb ddrafft y dyfodol.

Dylem gofio hefyd, o ran ariannu, fod llywodraeth leol wedi gofyn am ddyrannu mwy o'r arian drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Dyna beth yr ydym yn ei wneud a chaiff elfen arwyddocaol o'r grant Plant yn Gyntaf ei dyrannu'n uniongyrchol bellach, a hynny heb ei neilltuo, i lywodraeth leol drwy'r grant cynnal refeniw. Os mai dim ond edrych ar dablau'r gyllideb a wneir, heb gofio bod llawer o arian Plant yn Gyntaf yn mynd i



much of the Children First money is going into the RSG, they may get a slightly misleading picture of what is happening. That is particularly important in relation to the points that Jenny Randerson and Mark Isherwood made in their submissions.

On fertility services, I would hope that this would not have a significant impact. The guidance that we have issued on fertility services has been a genuine attempt to deal with the postcode lottery in relation to in vitro fertilisation services and bringing some sort of justice and equity across Wales should not be a reason why we should not go ahead with these regulations.

If you look at the draft budget statement, you will see that a considerable amount of money—many millions of pounds—is given over to regulation and external inspection, which is at the core of the concerns that Jenny Randerson raised in the light of the CSIW report. Hopefully, that money will be well spent. Some Members have spoken of the red tape in terms of the regulation that services face in Wales and have said that it is an unnecessary burden. You cannot have it both ways. We need to have proper regulation and external inspection to ensure that proper standards are in place. The inspection needs to be proportionate and targeted where the need is greatest. We need a properly regulated system to ensure that children's interests are properly looked after.

mewn i'r grant cynnal refeniw, gellid cael darlun braidd yn gamarweiniol o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Mae hynny'n arbennig o bwysig mewn perthynas â'r pwyntiau a wnaeth Jenny Randerson a Mark Isherwood yn eu cyflwyniadau.

O ran gwasanaethau ffrwythlondeb, gobeithiwn na fyddai hyn yn cael effaith sylweddol. Mae'r canllawiau a gyhoeddwyd gennym ynghylch gwasanaethau ffrwythlondeb wedi bod yn ymgais wirioneddol i ddelio â'r loteri cod post ym maes gwasanaethau ffrwythlondeb *in vitro* ac ni ddylai cyflwyno rhyw fath o gyfiawnder a thegwch ledled Cymru fod yn rheswm pam na ddylem fynd ymlaen â'r rheoliadau hyn.

Os edrychwch ar ddatganiad y gyllideb ddrafft, fe welwch fod cryn dipyn o arian—miliynau lawer o bunnoedd—wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer rheoleiddio ac archwilio allanol, sydd wrth graidd y pryderon a gododd Jenny Randerson yng ngoleuni adroddiad Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru. Caiff yr arian hwnnw ei wario'n ddoeth, gobeithio. Mae rhai Aelodau wedi siarad am y fiwrocratiaeth o ran y rheoleiddio y mae gwasanaethau'n ei wynebu yng Nghymru ac wedi dweud ei fod yn faich diangen. Ni allwch ei chael hi'r ddwy ffordd. Mae angen cael trefn reoleiddio ac archwilio allanol i sicrhau bod safonau priodol yn bod. Mae angen i'r arolygu fod yn gymesur a chael ei dargedu at yr ardaloedd sydd â'r angen mwyaf. Mae angen system sy'n cael ei rheoleiddio'n iawn i sicrhau bod buddiannau plant yn cael eu gwarchod yn iawn.

*Cynnig (NDM2661): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2661): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin

Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2662): O blaid 48, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2662): For 48, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John

Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2655): O blaid 49, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2655): For 49, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn

Jones, Helen Mary  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2656): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2656): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy

Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2657): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2657): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2658): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2658): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn

Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2659): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Motion (NDM2659): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
Motion carried.*

*Cynnig (NDM2660): O blaid 50, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.*

*Motion (NDM2660): For 50, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:

The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, David  
Davies, Glyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Morgan, Rhodri  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion carried.*



**Dadl Plaid Leiafrifol (Plaid y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol)  
Minority Party Debate (Liberal Democrat Party)**

**Ysgolion  
Schools**

**Peter Black:** I propose that

*the National Assembly for Wales:*

*1. recognises the importance of safe and modern school facilities to their communities;*

*2. instructs the Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning to commission a full, detailed and up-to-date assessment of the school repair and maintenance backlog and to bring that assessment to the education subject committee by 10 July 2006; and*

*3. instructs the Welsh Assembly Government to ring-fence the resources available to small schools within one special grant regime, to end the practice of counting funding for small schools with workload agreement funding and other initiatives, and to recognise the contribution, both educationally and socially, that small schools make to their communities.*  
(NDM2664)

The motion that we have tabled is in two parts. The first half deals with the need to carry out a proper assessment of the condition of school buildings across Wales. We believe that this is necessary as a first step towards making them fit for purpose by 2010. It is also essential if we are to effectively judge the Government on its pledge to do this. The second half of the motion calls for the reinstatement of the small-schools fund, set up under the partnership Government. It mirrors a clause in our amendment to the draft budget, and my colleague Mick Bates will deal with that part of the motion.

The one point on which we can all agree is that school buildings should be of a decent standard so that every child can get the best out of them. That is an ambition held by parents, teachers, governors and politicians of every stripe. No-one wants to see children in

**Peter Black:** Cynigiau fod

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:*

*1. yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw cyfleusterau ysgol diogel a modern i'w cymunedau;*

*2. yn cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes i gomisiynu asesiad llawn, manwl a chyfredol gywir o'r gwaith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw sydd wedi cronni mewn ysgolion, a chyflwyno'r asesiad hwnnw i bwyllgor pwnc addysg erbyn 10 Gorffennaf 2006; a*

*3. yn cyfarwyddo Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i neilltuo'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i ysgolion bach mewn un cynllun grant arbennig, er mwyn rhoi terfyn ar yr arfer o gyfrif cyllid ar gyfer ysgolion bach gyda chyllid cytundeb llwyth gwaith a chynlluniau eraill, a chydnabod y cyfraniad addysgol a chymdeithasol, y naill a'r llall, y mae ysgolion bach yn ei wneud i'w cymuned.*  
(NDM2664)

Mae'r cynnig a gyflwynasom mewn dwy ran. Mae'r hanner cyntaf yn ymwneud â'r angen i gynnal asesiad priodol o gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion ledled Cymru. Credwn fod hyn yn angenrheidiol fel cam cyntaf tuag at eu gwneud yn addas i'w diben erbyn 2010. Mae hefyd yn hanfodol os ydym am farnu'n iawn a yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwireddu ei haddewid i wneud hyn. Mae ail hanner y cynnig yn galw am ailsefydlu'r gronfa ar gyfer ysgolion bach a sefydlwyd dan y Llywodraeth bartneriaeth. Mae'n adlewyrchu cymal yn ein gwelliant i'r gyllideb ddrafft, a bydd fy nghyd-Aelod Mick Bates yn ymdrin â'r rhan honno o'r cynnig.

Un pwynt y gallwn oll gytuno arno yw y dylai adeiladau ysgolion fod o safon weddus fel y gall pob plentyn gael y gorau ohonynt. Mae hyn yn uchelgais sydd gan rieni, athrawon, llywodraethwyr a gwleidyddion o bob lliw. Nid oes ar neb eisiau gweld plant

classrooms with leaking roofs, draughty windows or crumbling walls, and yet they are placed in these situations every day of the week. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning will no doubt tell us that Wales is on target to make all schools fit for purpose by 2010. That is the Labour Assembly Government's pledge, but we do not even know at this stage what fit for purpose means, and, therefore, we cannot quantify the amount of money needed to achieve it. In that sense, the pledge cannot be tested or measured, and that undermines accountability and transparency.

mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth gyda thoeau sy'n gollwng, ffenestri drafftiog na waliau sy'n syrthio'n dipiau, ond eto fe'u rhoddir yn y sefyllfaoedd hyn bob dydd o'r wythnos. Bydd y Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn ddiamau yn dweud wrthym fod Cymru ar drywydd y targed i wneud pob ysgol yn addas i'w diben erbyn 2010. Dyna yw addewid Llywodraeth Lafur y Cynulliad, ond nid ydym hyd yn oed yn gwybod ar hyn o bryd beth y mae addas i'w diben yn ei olygu, ac, felly, ni allwn fesur faint o arian sy'n angenrheidiol i gyflawni'r addewid. Yn yr ystyr hwnnw, ni ellir profi na mesur yr addewid, ac mae hyn yn tansilio atebolrwydd a thryloywder.

3.20 p.m.

What is even more disturbing is that when you ask the Minister what the cost of achieving this pledge is, you find that she does not know. In response to my questions, the Minister has said that the Welsh Assembly Government does not hold information on the condition of individual schools in Wales. That is why this motion is necessary, because it will force the Government to commission a full, detailed, up-to-date assessment of the school repair and maintenance backlog. Only when we know how big the gap is, will we be able to fill it.

Yr hyn sy'n peri mwy fyth o bryder yw pan ofynnwch i'r Gweinidog beth yw cost cyflawni'r addewid hon, fe welwch nad yw'n gwybod. Wrth ateb fy nghwestiynau, mae'r Gweinidog wedi dweud nad oes gan Lywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru wybodaeth am gyflwr ysgolion unigol yng Nghymru. Dyna paham mae'r cynnig yn angenrheidiol, oherwydd y bydd yn gorfodi'r Llywodraeth i gomisiynu asesiad llawn, manwl a chyfredol gywir o'r gwaith atgyweirio a chynnal a chadw sydd wedi cronni mewn ysgolion. Dim ond o wybod pa mor fawr yw'r bwlch, y gallwn ei lenwi.

At present, the Minister is on a journey and her destination is ill-defined. She is moving forwards, but she has no idea where she is on her route.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r Gweinidog ar ganol siwrnai ac nid yw pen ei thaith wedi ei ddiffinio'n bendant. Mae'n symud ymlaen, ond nid oes ganddi ddim syniad ym mhle y mae ar ei llwybr.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** I am grateful to you for giving way. Your second point is to call for an assessment, but I understand that it is being done by local authorities as we speak, and I am quite sure that Caerphilly County Borough Council is conducting an assessment now, the results of which should be known much earlier than July 2006.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar ichi am ildio. Eich ail bwynt yw galw am asesiad, ond deallaf fod hyn yn cael ei wneud gan awdurdodau lleol ar hyn o bryd, ac yr wyf yn eithaf sicr bod Cyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili yn cynnal asesiad yn awr, ac y bydd canlyniadau'r asesiad hwn yn hysbys yn gynt o lawer na Gorffennaf 2006.

**Peter Black:** If that is being carried out by local authorities and those results are known before July 2006, then that is welcome, but you will find that not all local authorities are carrying out the assessment on the same basis or even consistently. It is important that the

**Peter Black:** Os yw'r awdurdodau lleol yn gwneud hynny ac y bydd y canlyniadau yn hysbys cyn Gorffennaf 2006, yna mae hynny i'w groesawu, ond fe welwch nad yw pob awdurdod lleol yn cynnal yr asesiad ar yr un sail na hyd yn oed yn gyson. Mae'n bwysig

Welsh Assembly Government gets its information itself. We are effectively two years into the programme, for which £560 million was promised, and yet we do not have an answer on how much money we need to spend to get schools up to scratch. That is what is important and why we need to have that information. As I said, the Minister is on a journey and we do not yet know what destination she will reach. However, we acknowledge that she is moving forwards and that there is progress, but, because we do not know where that destination is, it is difficult to hold her to account on her pledge. So, if this motion is carried, we and the Minister will know the scale of the problem at the earliest possible moment, and certainly by the end of the current school year. If the answer is known before that time, then that would be welcome.

We know that all existing estimates are largely out of date. Most are five years old or more, and many are based on cursory inspections or table-top assessments. The true cost will only become apparent when detailed work is carried out on individual schools. Without more relevant and up-to-date surveys, the Assembly Government is working in the dark.

The Labour 2003 Assembly manifesto promised an investment of £560 million over the four years of this Assembly. In reality, the published budget shows an investment of only £529 million. The £31 million shortfall could, of course, build several new schools. We are told that the difference is being made up from private finance initiative schemes. PFI is acceptable and convenient to help the Government out of a bind, but it seems that it is not to be used to add further to the money available for schools. The danger is, of course, that in relying on this device, the Government may find that the school building schemes in the present programme are never followed or do not come to fruition, and the amount claimed as being spent on schools may not materialise.

bod Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru yn cael ei gwybodaeth ei hun. I bob pwrpas mae'r rhaglen wedi dechrau ers dwy flynedd, rhaglen yr addawyd £560 miliwn ar ei chyfer, ac eto nid oes gennym ateb i'r cwestiwn faint o arian y bydd angen inni ei wario i godi ysgolion at y safon. Dyna beth sy'n bwysig a phaham mae angen y wybodaeth honno arnom. Fel y dywedais, mae'r Gweinidog ar ganol siwrnai ac ni wyddom eto ble y bydd pen ei thaith. Fodd bynnag, cydnabyddwn ei bod yn symud ymlaen a bod cynnydd, ond, oherwydd na wyddom ble y mae pen y daith honno, mae'n anodd ei dwyn i gyfrif ynghylch ei haddewid. Felly, os derbynnir y cynnig hwn, byddwn ni a'r Gweinidog yn gwybod maint y broblem cyn gynted â phosibl, ac yn bendant erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn ysgol gyfredol. Os yw'r ateb yn hysbys cyn yr adeg honno, yna byddai hynny i'w groesawu.

Gwyddom fod yr holl amcangyfrifon presennol wedi dyddio i raddau helaeth. Mae'r rhan fwyaf ohonynt yn bum mlwydd oed neu ragor, ac mae llawer yn seiliedig ar archwiliadau bras neu asesiadau pen bwrdd. Ni ddaw'r wir gost i'r amlwg nes gwneir gwaith manwl ar ysgolion unigol. Heb arolygon mwy perthnasol a chyfredol gywir, mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn gweithio yn y tywyllwch.

Addawai maniffesto Cynulliad y Blaid Lafur yn 2003 fuddsoddiad o £560 miliwn dros bedair blynedd y Cynulliad hwn. Mewn gwirionedd, mae'r gyllideb sydd wedi'i chyhoeddi yn dangos buddsoddiad o £529 miliwn yn unig. Gallai'r diffyg o £31 miliwn, wrth gwrs, adeiladu nifer o ysgolion newydd. Dywedir wrthym fod y gwahaniaeth yn cael ei unioni drwy gynlluniau menter cyllid preifat. Mae mentrau cyllid preifat yn dderbyniol ac yn hwylus i helpu'r Llywodraeth i ddianc rhag trafferthion, ond ymddengys nad ydynt i gael eu defnyddio i ychwanegu rhagor at yr arian sydd ar gael i ysgolion. Y perygl yw, wrth gwrs, fod y Llywodraeth, wrth ddibynnu ar y ddyfais hon, yn gweld nad yw cynlluniau adeiladau ysgolion yn y rhaglen bresennol fyth yn cael eu dilyn neu nad ydynt yn dwyn ffrwyth, ac mae'n bosibl na wireddir y swm yr honnir ei fod yn cael ei wario ar ysgolion.

Poor school buildings have a huge impact on a child's education and on the ability of teachers to deliver it. I have been in schools where wind and rain come through badly fitted metal windows, where flat roofs are in need of replacement, where ceilings are coming down and where stairwells have to be closed off every time it rains. I have spoken to headteachers who cannot trust the safety of the electrics in their schools, whose displays will not stay on walls because of damp and who have had to close off school halls because of dry rot. I have also seen the huge benefits that come when a school occupies a new building and for the first time enjoys safe play areas, warm, clean and dry teaching spaces and appropriate break-out spaces for children.

We all want our children to have the best possible learning experience. To achieve that, we have an obligation to provide them with the best possible learning environment. Teachers need to provide stimulating lessons without worrying about the condition of their classrooms or the safety of sports fields and communal areas. We are all agreed on these things, but what is missing is the cost of this commitment—of knowing what is needed to give teachers the tools they need to do the job.

The Government has been thrashing around in the dark for too long on this issue. It may be in discussions with councils and there may well be complicating factors such as the number of surplus places and the way that schools need to be reorganised to meet that challenge. That does not make the task of putting together a definitive estimate of the cost an impossible one, nor does it absolve the Assembly Government of its duty to do so and to provide the necessary funding. That is why we have proposed this motion today. If it is carried, we expect the Assembly Minister to comply with it and to provide the information by the middle of next year; if she can bring it earlier, then we will welcome that. Only then will we be able to assess the progress that has been made towards making all schools fit for purpose. Only then will we be able to hold the Government to account on its pledge.

Mae adeiladau gwael mewn ysgol yn cael effaith anferthol ar addysg plentyn ac ar allu athrawon i'w chyflwyno. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn ysgolion lle y mae'r gwynt a'r glaw yn dod drwy'r ffenestri metel, a'r rheini wedi'u gosod yn wael, lle y mae angen adnewyddu'r toeau gwastad, lle y mae'r nenfydau'n disgyn a lle y mae'n rhaid cau'r grisiau bob tro y mae'n bwrw glaw. Yr wyf wedi siarad â phenaethiaid na allant ymddiried yn niogelwch y trydan yn eu hysgolion, nad yw eu harddangosfeydd yn aros ar y waliau oherwydd tampirwydd ac y bu'n rhaid iddynt gau neuaddau'r ysgolion oherwydd pydredd sych. Yr wyf hefyd wedi gweld y manteision anferthol a geir pan fydd ysgol yn symud i adeilad newydd ac am y tro cyntaf yn mwynhau mannau chwarae diogel, mannau addysgu cynnes, glân a sych a mannau addas i'r plant ymrannu'n grwpiau.

Mae arnom oll eisiau i'n plant gael y profiad dysgu gorau posibl. Er mwyn sicrhau hyn, mae'n rheidrwydd arnom ddarparu ar eu cyfer yr amgylchedd dysgu gorau posibl. Rhaid i athrawon ddarparu gwersi sy'n ysgogi heb boeni am gyflwr eu dosbarthiadau na diogelwch y meysydd chwaraeon a'r mannau cyffredin. Yr ydym oll yn gytún am y pethau hyn, ond yr hyn sydd yn eisiau yw cost yr ymrwymiad hwn—gwybod beth sy'n angenrheidiol i roi i athrawon yr adnoddau sydd eu hangen arnynt i wneud y gwaith.

Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn ymbalfalu yn y tywyllwch yn rhy hir ynghylch y mater hwn. Mae'n bosibl ei bod yn trafod gyda'r cynghorau ac mae'n eithaf posibl bod ffactorau sy'n peri cymhlethdod megis nifer y lleoedd gwag a sut i ad-drefnu ysgolion er mwyn ymateb i'r her hon. Nid yw hyn yn gwneud y dasg o wneud amcangyfrif pendant o'r gost yn dasg amhosibl, ac nid yw ychwaith yn peri bod Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn cael osgoi ei dyletswydd i wneud hynny a darparu'r cyllid angenrheidiol. Dyna paham yr ydym wedi cyflwyno'r cynnig hwn heddiw. Os derbynir ef, disgwyliwn i Weinidog y Cynulliad gydymffurfio ag ef a darparu'r wybodaeth erbyn canol y flwyddyn nesaf; os gall ei chyflwyno yn gynt, yna byddwn yn croesawu hynny. Bryd hynny yn unig y gallwn asesu'r cynnydd a wnaed tuag at wneud pob ysgol yn addas i'w diben. Bryd hynny yn unig y

gallwn ddwyn y Llywodraeth i gyfrif ynghylch ei haddewid.

**Janet Ryder:** I thank the Liberal Democrats for proposing this motion for debate today. It puts two issues on the table for us to talk about. One is the condition of school buildings, in which many of our children sometimes have to endure their education rather than enjoy it fully. The other is the issue of small schools, which is crucial to many communities, both urban and rural.

Looking at the building aspect of the debate, I was amazed at last week's meeting of the Committee on School Funding to hear the Welsh Local Government Association say that it had no idea how much it would cost to address the condition of school buildings in Wales. When the WLGA, the body that represents councils, says that, a Minister who so often proclaims herself to be an evidence-based Minister has a problem. Yet, she is a Minister who is making millions of pounds available within the budget to this end. We need firm guidelines; we need to know what state our schools are in.

As an AM, I have been to many schools, some of which were not even built in the last century, but the century before last. However, it is often not those schools that suffer because of their buildings, but the schools that were built in the 1960s and the 1970s. These are schools where the flat roofs leak, the windows do not work, where water is leaking and the concrete is crumbling, where there is no air-conditioning in IT rooms and which cannot, therefore, be used in hot conditions, where there are areas where rain comes in, and where teaching unions are saying that they want to close the building because it is a health hazard. In many areas, our schools are not, unfortunately, fit for purpose. However, it is a true testament to the quality of the teaching staff that we have in Wales that they are, despite those conditions, producing such excellent results from our young people. The older schools, those which were built in perhaps the nineteenth century, may be slightly better buildings, but they do

**Janet Ryder:** Diolchaf i'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol am gyflwyno'r cynnig hwn yn destun dadl heddiw. Rhydd ddau fater ar y bwrdd i ni eu trafod. Cyflwr adeiladau ysgolion yw un, adeiladau lle y mae'n rhaid i lawer o blant weithiau ddioddef eu haddysg yn hytrach na'i mwynhau yn llawn. Ysgolion bach yw'r mater arall, mater sy'n hollbwysig i nifer o gymunedau, yn gymunedau gwledig a threfol fel ei gilydd.

O edrych ar yr agwedd yn ymwneud ag adeiladau, cefais fy syfrdanu yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor ar Gyllid Ysgolion yr wythnos diwethaf wrth glywed Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru yn dweud nad oedd ganddi ddim syniad faint y byddai yn ei gostio i roi sylw i gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion yng Nghymru. Pan fydd Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru, y corff sy'n cynrychioli cynghorau, yn dweud hynny, mae gan Weinidog sy'n datgan mor aml ei bod yn Weinidog sy'n gweithredu ar sail tystiolaeth, broblem. Er hynny, mae hi'n Weinidog sy'n rhyddhau miliynau o bunnoedd o fewn y gyllideb i'r perwyl hwn. Mae arnom angen canllawiau pendant; mae angen inni wybod ym mha gyflwr y mae ein hysgolion.

Fel AC, yr wyf wedi bod mewn llawer o ysgolion, a rhai o'r ysgolion hyn heb eu hadeiladu yn y ganrif ddiwethaf hyd yn oed, ond yn y ganrif cyn y ddiwethaf. Fodd bynnag, nid yr ysgolion hynny yn aml sydd yn dioddef oherwydd eu hadeiladau, ond yr ysgolion a adeiladwyd yn ystod y 1960au a'r 1970au. Y rhain yw'r ysgolion lle y mae'r toeau gwastad yn gollwng, lle nad yw'r ffenestri yn gweithio, lle y mae dŵr yn gollwng a lle y mae'r concrit yn dadfeilio, lle nad oes systemau awyru mewn ystafelloedd TG ac na ellir, o'r herwydd, eu defnyddio mewn tywydd poeth, lle y ceir mannau lle y daw'r glaw i mewn, a lle y mae undebau'r athrawon yn dweud bod arnynt eisiau cau'r adeilad oherwydd ei fod yn beryglus i iechyd. Mewn sawl ardal, nid yw ein hysgolion, yn anffodus, yn addas i'w diben. Serch hynny, mae'n wir dystiolaeth o ansawdd y staff addysgu sydd gennym yng Nghymru eu bod, er gwaethaf yr amodau hyn, yn sicrhau canlyniadau mor ardderchog gan ein pobl

not allow teachers to deliver the modern curriculum, which is fit for purpose, in today's schools. That needs to be addressed. A massive building programme is needed, and this needs to be properly organised, funded, and based on evidence, as the Minister is always telling us.

We are on the verge of seeing major changes within the education system. It seems, if we are being driven by this agenda, that we are moving away from educating children close to their community. Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales believes that it is important that children, particularly young children, are educated close to their home communities. That is why it is interesting, and not always pleasing, to see some of the ideas that come forward.

We are being driven by a number of agendas. In Ceredigion, we have the idea of closing many community schools and housing them in one large central school, and this seems to be the ethos that drives many local authority decisions. We have to question whether that is the right thing to do for children of a young age. It does not necessarily correlate that small schools have falling numbers. We have to look at the issue of surplus places within schools, but small schools do not always have falling rolls, nor is it the case that small schools always have falling educational standards and attainment. Quite often, they are full and they have high levels of educational attainment. Why, therefore, are they being closed? Is there something else driving the decision? In an era of falling rolls, a funding formula driven largely by pupil numbers will inevitably have the greatest impact on smaller schools, those which lack the resources and the flexibility to adapt. Some authorities may be using the requirement on them to review surplus places as an opportunity to close smaller schools. Is it a coincidence that those schools earmarked for closure in Denbighshire recently were the smaller schools and the most expensive to run in terms of cost per pupil? The two are inextricably linked for obvious reasons. We are devising an education policy and system

ifanc. Efallai fod yr ysgolion hŷn, y rhai a adeiladwyd yn y bedwaredd ganrif ar bymtheg o bosibl, yn adeiladau ychydig yn well, ond nid ydynt yn caniatáu i athrawon gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm modern, sydd yn addas i'w ddiben, yn yr ysgolion heddiw. Rhaid rhoi sylw i hynny. Mae angen rhaglen adeiladu anferthol, a rhaid i hyn gael ei drefnu a'i gyllido'n briodol, a bod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, fel y mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud wrthym drwy'r amser.

Yr ydym ar fin gweld newidiadau pwysig yn y system addysg. Mae'n ymddangos, os ydym yn cael ein rheoli gan yr agenda hon, ein bod yn symud oddi wrth addysgu plant yn agos i'w cymunedau. Cred Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales ei bod yn bwysig bod plant, yn enwedig plant ifanc, yn cael eu haddysgu gerllaw eu cymunedau cartref. Dyna paham y mae'n ddiddorol, ac nid bob amser yn ddymunol, gweld rhai o'r syniadau a gyflwynir.

Yr ydym yn cael ein rheoli gan nifer o agendâu. Yng Ngheredigion, mae gennym y syniad o gau nifer o ysgolion cymunedol a'u symud i un ysgol ganolog fawr, ac ymddengys mai dyma'r ethos sy'n rheoli nifer o benderfyniadau'r awdurdodau lleol. Rhaid inni holi ai hyn yw'r peth iawn i'w wneud i blant ifanc. Nid yw o anghenraid yn dilyn bod y niferoedd mewn ysgolion bach yn gostwng. Rhaid inni edrych ar gwestiwn lleoedd gwag mewn ysgolion, ond nid yw'r niferoedd mewn ysgolion bach bob amser yn gostwng, ac nid yw'n wir ychwaith fod gan ysgolion bach safonau a chyrhaeddiad addysgol is bob amser. Yn aml iawn, maent yn llawn ac mae ganddynt lefelau uchel o ran cyrhaeddiad addysgol. Paham, felly, y maent yn cael eu cau? A oes rhywbeth arall yn peri i'r penderfyniad gael ei wneud? Mewn cyfnod pan fo'r niferoedd yn gostwng, bydd fformiwla gyllido a reolir i raddau helaeth gan niferoedd disgyblion, yn anochel, yn cael yr effaith fwyaf ar ysgolion llai, y rhai sy'n brin o adnoddau ac nad oes ganddynt yr hyblygrwydd i addasu. Mae'n bosibl y bydd rhai awdurdodau yn defnyddio'r ffaith bod gofyn iddynt adolygu lleoedd gwag yn gyfle i gau ysgolion llai. Ai cyd-ddigwyddiad ydy mai'r ysgolion hynny a glustnodwyd yn rhai i'w cau yn sir Ddinbych yn ddiweddar oedd yr ysgolion llai a'r drutaf i'w cynnal o ran y

based on cost rather than on the quality of education and the needs of the child and the community.

3.30 p.m.

We have seen the Liberal Democrats coming forward with plans to close schools, including schools that are full, such as the Dylan Thomas Community School in Swansea. It does not have falling rolls, but it is a small school. Therefore, why are the Liberal Democrats closing it? Please explain that, Peter.

**Peter Black:** Essentially, it is being merged with Bishop Gore Comprehensive School because it has falling rolls, and in a few years' time would have less than 500 pupils.

**Janet Ryder:** I think that if you look at the number of pupils that it is supposed to have, it is something like a maximum of 578. At present, it has 572 pupils. According to the county council this morning, there are only some five empty places. We have to be careful that we do not close small schools simply to meet an agenda to cut surplus places, because we could be doing irreparable damage to communities that need their local schools, particularly in more rural areas. We are forcing people to move into larger centres for more and more services. A school should be seen as a community asset, and housed in its local community, particularly for when children are young. That is very important. That is why we need to look at a specific fund to aid, support and maintain those vital schools in urban and rural areas.

**Mick Bates:** First, I declare an interest in that my wife is in charge of a small schools collaboration project in Powys.

No-one is pretending that all small schools should be kept open regardless of how many children there are and regardless of the quality of education they provide. The essence of the second part of our debate

gost fesul disgybl? Mae cyswllt annatod rhwng y ddau beth ac mae'r rhesymau dros hynny'n amlwg. Yr ydym yn llunio polisi a system addysg sy'n seiliedig ar y gost yn hytrach na safon yr addysg ac anghenion y plentyn a'r gymuned.

Gwelsom y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn cyflwyno cynlluniau i gau ysgolion, gan gynnwys ysgolion sy'n llawn, megis Ysgol Gymunedol Dylan Thomas yn Abertawe. Nid yw ei niferoedd yn gostwng, ond ysgol fach ydyw. Felly, pam y mae'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ei chau? Esboniwch hynny, Peter.

**Peter Black:** Yn y bôn, mae'n cael ei huno gydag Ysgol Gyfun Bishop Gore am fod ei niferoedd yn gostwng, ac ymhen ychydig o flynyddoedd byddai ganddi lai na 500 o ddisgyblion.

**Janet Ryder:** Credaf petaech yn edrych ar nifer y disgyblion a ddylai fod ynddi, fod yr uchafswm tua 578. Ar hyn o bryd, mae ganddi 572 o ddisgyblion. Yn ôl y cyngor sir y bore yma, nid oes ond tua phump o leoedd gwag. Rhaid inni ochel rhag cau ysgolion bach dim ond er mwyn cyflawni agenda i gwtogi lleoedd gwag, oherwydd o wneud hynny gallew wneud drwg anadferadwy i gymunedau y mae arnynt angen eu hysgolion lleol, yn enwedig yn yr ardaloedd mwy gwledig. Yr ydym yn gorfodi pobl i symud i ganolfannau mwy i gael mwy a mwy o wasanaethau. Dylid ystyried ysgol yn gaffaeliad i'r gymuned, yn rhan o'r gymuned leol, yn enwedig pan fo plant yn ifanc iawn. Mae hynny'n bwysig iawn. Dyna pam y mae angen inni edrych ar gronfa benodol i gynorthwyo, cefnogi a chynnal yr ysgolion hanfodol hynny yn yr ardaloedd trefol a gwledig.

**Mick Bates:** Yn gyntaf oll, yr wyf yn datgan buddiant gan fod fy ngwraig â gofal am brosiect cydweithrediad rhwng ysgolion bach ym Mhowys.

Nid oes neb yn smalio y dylid cadw pob ysgol fach ar agor ni waeth faint o blant sydd ac ni waeth beth yw safon yr addysg y maent yn ei darparu. Hanfod ail ran ein dadl heddiw yw sicrhau dewis ac adfer mewn modd cwbl

today is to ensure choice and to reinstate in a clear way the special grant that was first instigated in 2002-03.

The special grant for small schools has been disaggregated into so many different grants that it is difficult to follow what your aim is, Minister. The intention of the small schools grant was clearly to improve school organisation and standards by particular methods, supporting innovation, and assisting with developing schemes for schools to work together through informal association, collaboration, clustering, federation or IT networks.

Analysis of the 2003-04 expenditure shows that those aims were being met. However, I sometimes wonder about your party's motives on this. There was much discussion at the time of the formula to distribute the small schools grant, because 70 per cent was based on sparsity. We deserve to hear from the Labour Party whether or not its intention is to remove the concept of sparsity altogether from so many things.

We have heard Members on the other side of the Chamber criticise the inclusion of measures to address sparsity on the grounds that people in rural areas have more money. If you are poor or cannot access services, whether you are in Llanrhaeadr-ym-Mochnant or Merthyr Tydfil, you are in the same situation. By disaggregating this grant, you are sending a negative message to many rural parts of Wales.

The particular aspect that I would like to hear you address is a school's importance to the community. You have recognised that the criteria for school closure has to be based on

'the overall effect on the community of the closure and the extent to which the school is serving the whole community as a learning resource'.

That was in a letter that I received from the Minister a few months ago about school closure. I welcome your saying that when you look at school closures, you will take

glir y grant arbennig a sefydlwyd am y tro cyntaf yn 2002-03.

Mae grant arbennig yr ysgolion bach wedi ei ddadgyfuno'n gynifer o wahanol grantiau nes ei bod yn anodd deall beth yn union yw eich nod, Weinidog. Mae'n amlwg mai diben grant yr ysgolion bach oedd gwella trefniadaeth a safonau'r ysgolion drwy ddulliau penodol, cefnogi dyfeisgarwch, a chynorthwyo i ddatblygu cynlluniau fel y gallai ysgolion weithio gyda'i gilydd drwy gydgyfylltu'n anffurfiol, cydweithio, clystyru, ffedereiddio neu rwydweithiau technoleg gwybodaeth.

O ddadansoddi gwariant 2003-04 gwelir bod y nodau hynny'n cael eu cyflawni. Fodd bynnag, byddaf yn pendroni weithiau ynglŷn â chymhellion eich plaid yn hyn o beth. Ar y pryd bu llawer o drafod ar y fformiwla i ddosbarthu grant yr ysgolion bach, oherwydd yr oedd 70 y cant yn seiliedig ar deneurwydd y boblogaeth. Mae'n iawn inni glywed gan y Blaid Lafur ai ei bwriad yw dileu cysyniad teneurwydd y boblogaeth yn llwyr o gynifer o bethau ai peidio.

Clywsom Aelodau ar ochr yr arall i'r Siambr yn beirniadu'r bwriad i gynnwys mesurau i roi sylw i deneurwydd poblogaeth am fod gan bobl mewn ardaloedd gwledig fwy o arian. Os ydych yn dlawd neu'n methu â chael gwasanaethau, p'un ai a ydych yn Llanrhaeadr-ym-Mochnant neu ym Merthyr Tudful, yr un yw'r sefyllfa. Drwy ddadgyfuno'r grant hwn, yr ydych yn anfon neges negyddol at nifer o ardaloedd gwledig yng Nghymru.

Yr agwedd benodol y carwn ichi roi sylw iddi yw pwysigrwydd yr ysgol i'r gymuned. Yr ydych wedi cydnabod bod rhaid seilio'r meini prawf wrth gau ysgolion ar

effaith gyffredinol y cau ar y gymuned a'r graddau y mae'r ysgol yn gwasanaethu'r gymuned gyfan fel adnodd dysgu.

Yr oedd hynny mewn llythyr a gefais oddi wrth y Gweinidog ychydig fisoedd yn ôl ynghylch cau ysgolion. Yr wyf yn falch o'ch clywed yn dweud pan fyddwch yn ystyried



into account the overall effect on the community. That is an extremely important aspect that you have highlighted in your response. All too often, the very age balance of communities, whether urban or rural, is affected by the retention of certain services. Small schools are one of those services.

If you close schools, or threaten to close them, local authorities do not bother building affordable houses in those communities. The age balance of the community is affected—you do not have children for the schools, and the community becomes a retirement zone. You have a responsibility, Minister, to discuss the spatial planning aspects of this with other Ministers, so that, when we look at our communities, we take an integrated view of this, and ensure that, through the planning processes, we have age-balanced communities. We need to ensure that we have the choice to keep that school open by reinstating the small schools grant.

I know that area schools work. In my constituency, years ago, the old Montgomeryshire District Council had a policy of having area schools. However, I am sure that, as has been mentioned before, you recognise, on the basis of evidence, that times change, and that there are new desires expressed by our communities, particularly in relation to accountability. Closing schools as a result of an edict from on high is considered as the taking away of people's choice. I want to see the Assembly empowering people. How can you help with that agenda? Rural Wales needs to see that you care about the structures of communities and their age balance, and the retention of our language and culture in many rural parts of Wales.

This motion, in calling for an assessment of the amount of money that we need for maintenance, and for the reinstatement of our small schools grant, is a fundamental part of not only keeping schools alive, but our communities and culture alive.

**William Graham:** It is universally accepted that when young people are taught in well-

cau ysgolion y byddwch yn ystyried yr effaith gyffredinol ar y gymuned. Mae hynny'n agwedd hynod bwysig yr ydych wedi ei phwysleisio yn eich ymateb. Yn amlach na pheidio, mae cadw rhai gwasanaethau yn effeithio ar gydbwysedd oed cymunedau, boed y rheini'n drefol neu'n wledig. Mae ysgolion bach ymhlith y gwasanaethau hynny.

O gau ysgolion, neu o fygwth eu cau, ni fydd awdurdodau lleol yn trafferthu codi cartrefi fforddiadwy yn y cymunedau hynny. Mae'n effeithio ar gydbwysedd oed y gymuned—nid oes plant ar gyfer yr ysgolion, ac mae'r gymuned yn troi'n ardal ymddeol. Mae cyfrifoldeb arnoch, Weinidog, i drafod yr agweddau sy'n ymwneud â chynllunio gofodol yn hyn o beth gyda Gweinidogion eraill, fel y byddwn, o edrych ar ein cymunedau, yn cymryd agwedd integredig at hyn, gan sicrhau, drwy'r drefn gynllunio, fod gennym gymunedau sy'n gytbwys o ran oed. Rhaid inni sicrhau bod y dewis gennym i gadw'r ysgol honno ar agor drwy adfer grant yr ysgolion bach.

Gwn fod ysgolion ardal yn gweithio. Yn fy etholaeth i, flynyddoedd yn ôl, yr oedd gan hen Gyngor Dosbarth Maldwyn bolisi a oedd yn bleidiol i ysgolion ardal. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn sicr, fel y soniwyd o'r blaen, eich bod yn cydnabod, yn ôl y dystiolaeth, fod yr oes yn newid, a bod ein cymunedau'n lleisio dyheadau newydd, yn enwedig o ran atebolrwydd. Ystyrir bod cau ysgolion oherwydd rhyw orchymyn oddi fry'n gyfystyr â dileu'r cyfle i bobl ddewis. Hoffwn weld y Cynulliad yn grymuso pobl. Sut y gallwch helpu gyda'r agenda honno? Mae angen i'r Gymru wledig weld bod strwythurau'r cymunedau a'u cydbwysedd o ran oed o bwys i chi, ynghyd â chadw ein hiaith a'n diwylliant mewn sawl rhan wledig o Gymru.

Mae'r cynnig hwn, wrth alw am asesu faint o arian y mae ei angen arnom ar gyfer cynhaliaeth, ac am ailsefydlu grant yr ysgolion bach, yn rhan sylfaenol nid yn unig o gadw ysgolion yn fyw, ond o gadw ein cymunedau a'n diwylliant yn fyw hefyd.

**William Graham:** Mae pawb yn derbyn pan gaiff pobl ifanc eu dysgu mewn adeiladau

designed buildings, with modern facilities and equipment, together with safe play areas for individual and team exercises, learning opportunities are enhanced, and, equally important, teachers can reach their full potential.

We recognise that there is general disbelief in the Assembly Government's claim that the current backlog in school repairs will be cleared by 2010. We note that throughout the United Kingdom this matter receives substantial funding. Last month in Westminster, the Secretary of State for Education and Skills announced that schools across England will benefit from a share of more than £1 billion to improve classroom buildings and facilities for sport, science, technology, languages and music, special educational needs provision, as well as extended schools facilities. The money was allocated as a targeted capital fund to allow LEAs to meet their most immediate local school building needs.

I hope today that the Minister can confirm how much of this money will be allocated to Wales, and whether it will be used to directly fund the improvement of schools facilities throughout Wales. It appears that the UK Minister understands the requirement for additional funding to address this problem. Is the Assembly administration confident that all authorities in Wales receive significant Assembly support for the improvement of school buildings and associated facilities? We know that, at the beginning of this academic year, schools in Wales faced a repairs backlog of more than £785 million, with some councils claiming that they can only afford to undertake essential safety work. We note that a degree of adaptations and additions were required to enable schools to comply with disability access laws. We need to address this backlog, and ensure that our children are taught in well-designed buildings, with modern facilities and equipment. We hope that there will be no more headlines such as 'Single Burst Pipe Forces Secondary School with more than 750 Pupils to Close'.

sydd wedi eu cynllunio'n dda, gyda chyfleusterau a chyfarpar modern, ynghyd â lleoedd chwarae diogel ar gyfer ymarferion i unigolion a thimau, fod y cyfleoedd dysgu'n well, a'r un mor bwysig â hynny, gall yr athrawon gyrraedd eu potensial yn llawn.

Yr ydym yn cydnabod na roir coel at ei gilydd ar honiad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad y bydd yr ôl-groniad yn atgyweiriadau'r ysgolion wedi ei glirio erbyn 2010. Nodwn fod y mater hwn yn cael cyllid sylweddol ar draws y Deyrnas Unedig. Y mis diwethaf yn San Steffan, cyhoeddodd yr Ysgrifennydd Gwladol dros Addysg a Sgiliau y bydd ysgolion Lloegr yn elwa o gyfran o ragor na £1 biliwn i wella adeiladau ystafelloedd dosbarth a chyfleusterau chwaraeon, gwyddoniaeth, technoleg, ieithoedd a cherddoriaeth, y ddarpariaeth anghenion addysg arbennig, ynghyd â chyfleusterau ehangach i'r ysgolion. Dyrannwyd yr arian ar ffurf cronfa gyfalaf sydd wedi ei thargedu i ganiatáu i awdurdodau addysg lleol ddiwallu eu hanghenion mwyaf o ran adeiladau eu hysgolion lleol.

Gobeithiaf heddiw y gall y Gweinidog gadarnhau faint o'r arian hwn a gaiff ei ddyrannu i Gymru, ac a fydd yn cael ei ddefnyddio'n uniongyrchol i wella cyfleusterau'r ysgolion ledled Cymru. Ymddengys fod Gweinidog y Deyrnas Unedig yn deall yr angen am gyllid ychwanegol i unioni'r broblem hon. A yw gweinyddiaeth y Cynulliad yn hyderus bod pob awdurdod yng Nghymru yn cael cefnogaeth sylweddol gan y Cynulliad ar gyfer gwella adeiladau'r ysgolion a'r cyfleusterau cysylltiedig? Gwyddom, ar ddechrau'r flwyddyn academaidd hon, fod ysgolion Cymru'n wynebu ôl-groniad atgyweiriadau o ragor na £785 miliwn, a bod rhai cynghorau'n honni na allant fforddio gwneud ond gwaith diogelwch hanfodol. Nodwn fod angen peth gwaith addasu ac ychwanegu i alluogi ysgolion i gydymffurfio â'r cyfreithiau sy'n ymwneud â mynediad i'r anabl. Rhaid inni roi sylw i'r ôl-groniad hwn, a sicrhau bod ein plant yn cael eu dysgu mewn adeiladau sydd wedi eu cynllunio'n dda, gyda chyfleusterau a chyfarpar modern. Gobeithiwn na welwn benawdau megis 'Un Bibell yn Torri gan Orfodi Ysgol Uwchradd sydd â rhagor na 750 o Ddisgyblion i Gau'.

There remains cross-party recognition of the educational benefits to pupils and teachers of well-designed schools. We need to be fully aware of the total costs of meeting this priority, to allow us to know how it can be funded. This is why the Conservative group will support the Liberal Democrat motion today, in instructing the Minister to commission a full assessment of the school repair and maintenance backlog, and to bring that assessment to the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee by the end of this academic year. Information in that report on the incidence of vandalism would also be helpful.

There are several perceived disadvantages to smaller schools in urban and rural areas. Such schools are said to be too expensive. Is this because fixed costs appear to be higher, such as teacher salary costs per pupil? It is said that teachers are isolated and lack opportunities for professional development; teachers do work in a different environment. What are the effects of classes that are vertically grouped, with mixed ages, as well as mixed ability? It is said that pupils lack adequate peer group interaction, yet studies indicate that children in small schools develop friendship patterns that are more extensive in terms of age and gender. It is said that such schools are unable to deliver an appropriate curriculum, and therefore the pupils' educational performance is lower than that of their peers in larger schools. However, small schools are more innovative, with more examples of experimentation, coupled with strong curriculum planning and organisation, and greater ease in monitoring pupils, because all the teachers know the pupils. We need to address all these issues and consult widely to establish which of these factors enhance or hinder the ability of all our children to realise their potential in full.

3.40 p.m.

The local school is more than bricks and mortar; in many areas it is the heart of the

Mae'r pleidiau oll yn cydnabod bod manteision addysgol i ddisgyblion ac athrawon mewn ysgolion sydd wedi eu cynllunio'n dda. Mae angen inni fod yn gwbl ymwybodol o'r holl gostau wrth gyflawni'r flaenoriaeth hon, fel y medrwn wybod sut y gellir ei chyllido. Dyna pam y bydd grŵp y Ceidwadwyr yn cefnogi cynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol heddiw, gan gyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i gomisiynu asesiad llawn o ôl-groniad atgyweiriadau a chynnal a chadw'r ysgolion, a dod â'r asesiad hwnnw gerbron y Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes erbyn diwedd y flwyddyn academiaidd hon. Byddai'n ddefnyddiol petai'r adroddiad hwnnw'n cynnwys gwybodaeth am gyfraddau fandaliaeth hefyd.

Mae tybiaeth bod nifer o anafanteision i ysgolion bach mewn ardaloedd trefol a gwledig. Dywedir bod ysgolion o'r fath yn rhy ddrud. A yw hyn oherwydd bod y costau sefydlog i'w gweld yn uwch, megis costau cyflogau'r athrawon fesul disgybl? Dywedir bod yr athrawon ar eu pennau eu hunain ac nad oes ganddynt gyfleoedd o ran datblygiad proffesiynol; mae'r athrawon yn gweithio mewn amgylchedd gwahanol. Beth yw effeithiau dosbarthiadau sydd wedi eu grwpio'n fertigol, a'r oedrannau'n gymysg, ynghyd â gallu cymysg? Dywedir na chaiff disgyblion ddigon o gyfle i ymwneud â chyfoedion, ond dengys astudiaethau fod plant mewn ysgolion bach yn datblygu patrymau cyfeillgarwch sy'n ehangach o ran oed a rhyw. Dywedir na all ysgolion o'r fath ddarparu cwricwlwm priodol, a bod perfformiad addysgol y disgyblion felly'n is nag eiddo eu cyfoedion mewn ysgolion mwy. Fodd bynnag, mae ysgolion bach yn fwy arloesol, ac mae ynddynt fwy o enghreifftiau o arbrofi, ac mae'r cwricwlwm wedi ei gynllunio a'i drefnu'n gadarn, ac mae'n haws monitro'r plant, am fod pob un o'r athrawon yn adnabod y disgyblion. Mae angen inni roi sylw i'r materion hyn oll ac ymgynghori'n helaeth i weld pa rai o'r ffactorau hyn sy'n gwella neu'n rhwystro gallu pob un o'n plant i gyflawni eu potensial yn llawn.

Mae'r ysgol leol yn fwy na brics a mortar yn unig; mewn nifer o ardaloedd hi yw calon y

community. The local school is often the focal point of a community development plan, integral to attracting new people to the area and to trying to attain sustainability. If we recognise this fact, we need to make use of funding from a wider budget than that directed simply at education. Other Assembly portfolios can benefit directly from maintaining smaller schools within developing communities, and there is a probability that the achievement of many of their long-term aims may be dependent upon having a school at the heart of the community. One of the barriers to wealth creation in Britain today is the fact that we are not doing enough to nurture the skills and talent of our people. The purpose of education is to bring out people's potential; at its highest level, it is both a spiritual and intellectual adventure, but it has economic consequences. So much potential is wasted by the Government here and in Westminster. There is a devastating lack of vigour in primary and secondary education, and we have an examination system in which universities and employers have less and less confidence. There is a complete absence, after eight years, of any kind of coherent strategy for vocational education. Universities are held back by a centralised bureaucracy that tells them how much they can spend, what they should teach, and now, even, whom they should admit. Our universities need more resources and less Government action and I would welcome the Minister's assurance on that today.

**Eleanor Burnham:** I will focus on the second part of our motion, in respect of the school repairs and maintenance backlog. As a former peripatetic teacher in north Wales, I was very aware of the poor conditions of many school buildings and the hugely negative impact upon the long-suffering, hardworking and dedicated teachers and pupils alike. Indeed, many of my underachievers asked why, if adults could not be bothered to provide a decent school environment, they should be bothered to attend school or take part in education. Now, as a regional Member, I have seen many more examples of poor maintenance and the chronic problems that plague school buildings. Cash-strapped local education authorities do their best to address the

gymuned. Yn aml yr ysgol leol yw canolbwynt cynllun datblygu'r gymuned, ac mae'n hanfodol o ran denu pobl newydd i'r ardal a cheisio ymgynraedd at gynaliadwyedd. O gydnabod y ffaith hon, bydd angen inni fedru defnyddio cyllid o gyllideb ehangach na'r un a gyfeirir at addysg yn unig. Gallai portffolios eraill y Cynulliad elwa'n uniongyrchol o gynnal yr ysgolion llai mewn cymunedau sy'n datblygu, ac mae'n debygol bod cyflawni llawer o'u nodau hirdymor yn dibynnu ar fodolaeth ysgol yng nghalon y gymuned. Un rhwystr i ffyniant ym Mhrydain heddiw yw'r ffaith nad ydym yn gwneud digon i feithrin sgiliau a thalent ein pobl. Pwrpas addysg yw cyflawni potensial ein pobl; ar y lefel uchaf un, mae'n antur ysbrydol a deallusol, ond mae iddi ganlyniadau economaidd. Mae'r Llywodraeth hon a Llywodraeth San Steffan yn gwastraffu cymaint o botensial. Mae diffyg egni aruthrol mewn addysg gynradd ac uwchradd, ac mae gennym system arholi y mae hyder y prifysgolion a'r cyflogwyr ynddi'n lleihau'n feunyddiol. Ar ôl wyth mlynedd nid oes strategaeth gydlynol ar gyfer addysg alwedigaethol. Caiff y prifysgolion eu rhwystro gan fiwrocratiaeth ganolog sy'n dweud wrthynt faint y cânt ei wario, yr hyn y dylent ei ddysgu, ac yn awr, hyd yn oed, pwy y dylent eu derbyn. Mae angen rhagor o adnoddau ar ein prifysgolion a llai o weithredu gan y Llywodraeth a hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ynghylch hynny heddiw.

**Eleanor Burnham:** Canolbwyntiaf ar ail ran ein cynnig, ynglŷn â'r ôl-groniad o ran atgyweiriadau a chynnal a chadw yn yr ysgolion. Fel cyn athrawes beripatetig yn y gogledd, gwyddwn yn iawn am gyflwr gwael llawer o adeiladau'r ysgolion a'r effaith negyddol aruthrol ar yr athrawon a'r disgyblion hiramyneddgar, diwyd ac ymroddgar fel ei gilydd. Yn wir, gofynnai llawer o'm tangyflawnwyr, oni allai'r oedolion drafferthu i ddarparu amgylchedd ysgol iawn, pam y dylent hwythau drafferthu dod i'r ysgol neu gymryd rhan mewn addysg. Bellach, fel Aelod rhanbarthol, yr wyf wedi gweld llawer mwy o enghreifftiau o gynnal a chadw gwael a'r problemau affwysol sy'n bla ar adeiladau ysgolion. Mae awdurdodau addysg lleol prin eu harian yn gwneud eu

problems, but the challenge is huge and requires strategic and appropriate long-term funding from the Assembly.

I will give some graphic examples of some schools' real-life challenges. I visited Gwersyllt school with some other Assembly Members back in June, and there was sweltering heat in an entire wing of the school. The headmaster said that temperatures of 80 to 90 degrees Fahrenheit were common in the summer, affecting the IT suite and two Welsh classrooms. Adults would not be asked to tolerate such unhealthy and unreasonable conditions at work, and would probably be allowed home on the basis that it would impair their ability to work effectively. Mold Alun School in Flintshire has had a severely leaking roof for several years, badly affecting the use of a computer suite. Only following massive lobbying and some direct help from the director of education this summer has some essential maintenance begun. However, much more work needs to be done to ensure the full use of this vital area of this excellent school. Things should never have deteriorated into such a sorry state; surely a stitch in time saves nine. This lack of appropriate investment allows problems to build up, and we desperately need a more strategic long-term approach to school maintenance.

Darland High School in Rosset is another school that needs completely rebuilding. The fabric of the building is in very poor condition and there are many health and safety issues. Wrexham local education authority simply does not have sufficient funding. Darland High School, Minister, secures excellent science results every year, but does not have a purpose-built science laboratory. Its science technicians are magicians, really, because they face considerable challenges in servicing these facilities and have to run up and down stairs and corridors, which is a health and safety issue in itself. Think how much better schools' results would be if they had buildings to match their diligent teachers, and the abilities and facilities to develop their

gorau i roi sylw i'r problemau, ond mae'r her yn un enfawr ac mae angen cyllid hirdymor strategol a phriodol gan y Cynulliad.

Rhoddaf enghreifftiau byw o'r sialensiau gwirioneddol sy'n wynebu ysgolion. Ymwelais ag ysgol Gwersyllt gydag Aelodau eraill o'r Cynulliad ym mis Mehefin, ac yr oedd yn affwysol boeth mewn un adain gyfan o'r ysgol. Dywedodd y pennaeth fod tymheredd rhwng 80 a 90 gradd Fahrenheit yn gyffredin yn yr haf, a bod hynny'n effeithio ar yr ystafelloedd technoleg gwybodaeth a dau ddsbarth Cymraeg. Ni fyddai disgwyl i oedolion ddioddef y fath amodau afiach ac afresymol yn y gwaith, ac mae'n debygol y caent fynd adref am y byddai'n effeithio ar eu gallu i wneud eu gwaith yn iawn. Mae to Ysgol Alun yr Wyddgrug yn sir y Fflint wedi bod yn gollwng yn ddifrifol ers blynyddoedd, gan effeithio'n ddirfawr ar y defnydd a wneir ar ystafelloedd cyfrifiaduron. Dim ond yn sgîl lobio helaeth a pheth help uniongyrchol gan y cyfarwyddwr addysg yr haf hwn y dechreuwyd gwneud peth gwaith cynnal a chadw hanfodol. Fodd bynnag, mae angen gwneud llawer mwy o waith i sicrhau bod y rhan hanfodol hon o'r ysgol wych hon yn cael ei defnyddio'n llawn. Ni ddylasai pethau ddirywio i'r fath gyflwr truenus; onid yw pwyth mewn llaw yn arbed naw? Oherwydd diffyg buddsoddiad priodol mae'r problemau'n cynyddu, ac mae gwir angen agwedd fwy strategol a hirdymor at gynnal a chadw ysgolion.

Ysgol arall y mae angen ei hailadeiladu'n llwyr yw Ysgol Uwchradd Darland yn yr Orsedd. Mae adeiladwaith yr ysgol mewn cyflwr gwael iawn ac mae nifer o broblemau iechyd a diogelwch yno. Nid oes gan awdurdod addysg lleol Wrecsam ddigon o gyllid. Mae Ysgol Uwchradd Darland, Weinidog, yn cael canlyniadau rhagorol yn y gwyddorau bob blwyddyn, ond nid oes ganddi labordy gwyddoniaeth pwrpasol. Mae ei thechnegwyr gwyddoniaeth yn ddewiniaid, mewn gwirionedd, am eu bod yn wynebu sialensiau mawr o ran trin y cyfleusterau hyn ac mae'n rhaid iddynt redeg i fyny ac i lawr coridorau, sy'n broblem ynddi ei hunan o ran iechyd a diogelwch. Ystyriwch y gwelliant a ddeuai i ran canlyniadau'r ysgolion petai ganddynt adeiladau cystal â'u hathrawon

pupils' talents to their full potential.

I discussed these three schools with their respective headteachers before coming here to talk today, as a matter of simple courtesy, and so that no-one could accuse me of misrepresentation. While we spend so much money on Iraq and have an insufficient settlement from Westminster in the form of an insufficient Barnett formula, these schools and others will continue to be problems for teachers, parents and pupils alike. My constituents are disgusted at having to put up with the bad state of these school buildings, and the repair and maintenance backlog, which impinge sharply on their children's ability to make the most of their education. After all, these kids have only one chance; let us not forget that.

To be frank, Minister, you and the Labour Party should be ashamed of yourselves for bleating about improving the fabric of our schools by 2010, when you do not even know the overall scale of the challenge and have no idea of the cost. A reality gap does exist, I am afraid, and it is about time you addressed it.

**Nick Bourne:** Thank you for the chance to contribute to this important debate. I should say at the outset that we will be supporting this motion. I want to say a little about the position on small schools, about some general concerns that I have, and then a little about school maintenance.

On small schools, I am far from saying that no small school should ever close. The rolls are so small at some schools that they are more like large families. Therefore, some small schools are clearly going to be too small. However, I have two particular concerns, and they relate partly to what is being discussed on the draft budget, both here and elsewhere. We need to look in the rural—

**Carl Sargeant:** Will you give way?

**Nick Bourne:** I will give way, provided that it is brief.

**Carl Sargeant:** It is very brief. How would

diwyd, a'r galluoedd a'r cyfleusterau i ddatblygu talentau eu disgyblion i'w potensial llawn.

Trafodais y tair ysgol hyn gyda'u penaethiaid cyn dod yma i siarad heddiw, fel mater o gwrteisi, ac fel na allai neb fy nghyhuddo o gamliwio. Tra byddwn yn parhau i wario cymaint ar Irac ac yn dal i dderbyn setliad annigonol o San Steffan ar sail fformiwla Barnett anfoddhaol, bydd yr ysgolion hyn ac eraill yn parhau'n broblem i athrawon, rhieni a disgyblion fel ei gilydd. Mae fy etholwyr wedi cael llond bol ar gyflwr gwael adeiladau'r ysgolion hyn, a'r gwaith trwsio a chynnal a chadw sy'n cronni. Mae hyn yn amharu'n bendant ar allu eu plant i fanteisio i'r eithaf ar eu haddysg. Wedi'r cwbl, dim ond un cyfle sydd gan y plant hyn; rhaid cofio hynny.

A siarad yn blaen, Weinidog, rhag cywilydd i chi a'r Blaid Lafur am sôn o hyd am wella adeiladwaith ein hysgolion erbyn 2010, a chithau heb wybod hyd yn oed beth yw maint yr her a heb syniad o'r gost. Mae bwlch realiti yn hyn o beth, mae arnaf ofn, ac mae'n hen bryd ichi roi sylw iddo.

**Nick Bourne:** Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y ddadl bwysig hon. Dylwn ddweud ar y dechrau y byddwn yn cefnogi'r cynnig hwn. Hoffwn ddweud ychydig am y sefyllfa yng nghyswllt ysgolion bach, am rai pryderon cyffredinol sydd gennyf, cyn dweud ychydig am gynnal a chadw ysgolion.

Yng nghyswllt ysgolion bach, nid wyf yn dweud o gwbl na ddylai dim un ysgol fach byth gau. Mae'r nifer mor fach mewn rhai ysgolion fel eu bod yn debycach i deuluoedd mawr. Felly, yn amlwg, bydd rhai ysgolion yn rhy fach. Er hynny, mae gennyf ddau bryder arbennig, sy'n ymwneud yn rhannol â'r hyn sy'n cael ei drafod ynglŷn â'r gyllideb ddrafft, yma ac mewn manau eraill. Rhaid inni edrych yn y—

**Carl Sargeant:** A ildiwch?

**Nick Bourne:** Ildiaf, ar yr amod eich bod yn gryno.

**Carl Sargeant:** Byddaf yn gryno iawn. Sut y

you describe 'small'? What is the formula that you would use to describe a school as 'small'?

**Nick Bourne:** That is a fair question, and I was going to come to that. Particularly in the context of rural Wales, many community schools are necessarily small. I do not think that one can have a hard-and-fast figure and say, for example, that 30 or 40 pupils constitute 'small'. However, the figure is somewhere in that region. If it is much below 30, there are questions of viability; if it is above 30, in some communities, particularly if the school is put to community use and it demonstrates that it is delivering the national curriculum, there is a case to keep it open, particularly if, for example, a new development is coming to the community and young families will be moving in. There are many considerations, but that is one point.

The second point in relation to small schools is the notice of closure, which is something that we have to look at. If parents consider sending their child to a school, they may be put off doing so if they fear that it may close, and so, in a sense, that is a self-fulfilling prophecy. We need to give far more notice, so that, when parents send a child to a school, they can be confident that that child will go all the way through that school, and we do not get that distorting factor. That is all that I wanted to say on the small-schools situation, except to say that, at the moment, it is being looked at in Carmarthenshire, certainly in Powys, and in Ceredigion. There are also issues to do with the Welsh language, which we should not lose sight of.

On the maintenance angle, there are particular problems, and, in many areas, teachers are coping with poor facilities and inadequate classrooms. I have mentioned Trefonnen Primary School previously, which is in Llandrindod, an area that I represent. I know that the Minister is aware of the situation there, and, to be fair, has said that, if she can, she will visit the school.

**Kirsty Williams:** I, too, am very familiar with the situation at Trefonnen, but would

byddech yn disgrifio 'bach'? Beth yw'r fformiwla y byddech yn ei defnyddio i ddisgrifio ysgol fel un 'fach'?

**Nick Bourne:** Mae hynny'n gwestiwn teg, ac yr oeddwn am ddod at hynny. Yn enwedig yng nghyd-destun y Gymru wledig, mae llawer o ysgolion cymunedol o reidrwydd yn fach. Nid wyf yn credu y gall rhywun gael ffigur haearnaidd a dweud, er enghraifft, fod 30 neu 40 disgybl yn ysgol 'fach'. Fodd bynnag, mae'r ffigur o gwmpas hynny. Os yw'n llawer is na 30, mae cwestiynau'n codi ynghylch hyfywedd; os yw'n fwy na 30, mewn rhai cymunedau, yn enwedig os defnyddir yr ysgol gan y gymuned a'i bod yn dangos ei bod yn cyflwyno'r cwricwlwm cenedlaethol, bydd dadl dros ei chadw ar agor, yn enwedig, er enghraifft, os oes datblygiad newydd yn dod i'r gymuned a bod teuluoedd newydd yn symud yno. Mae amryw o ystyriaethau, ond hynny yw un pwynt.

Yr ail bwynt ynghylch ysgolion bach yw'r hysbysiad cau, sy'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid inni edrych arno. Os yw rhieni'n ystyried anfon eu plentyn i ysgol, efallai y byddant yn gyndyn o wneud hynny os ydynt yn ofni y gallai gau, ac felly, mewn ffordd, mae hynny'n broffwydoliaeth sy'n ei gwireddu ei hun. Rhaid inni roi llawer mwy o rybudd, fel y gall rhieni sy'n anfon plentyn i ysgol fod yn ffyddiog y bydd y plentyn yn mynd yr holl ffordd drwy'r ysgol honno, ac fel nad oes ffactor sy'n gwyrddroi pethau. Dyna'r cwbl yr oeddwn am ei ddweud am sefyllfa ysgolion bach, ar wahân i'r ffaith bod y mater yn cael sylw ar hyn o bryd yn sir Gaerfyrddin, yn sicr ym Mhowys, ac yng Ngheredigion. Mae materion sy'n ymwneud â'r Gymraeg hefyd yn codi, ac ni ddylem golli golwg ar hynny.

O ran cynnal a chadw, ceir problemau penodol, ac, mewn nifer o ardaloedd, mae athrawon yn ymdopi â chyfleusterau gwael ac ystafelloedd dosbarth anfodddhaol. Soniais o'r blaen am Ysgol Gynradd Trefonnen, sydd yn Llandrindod, ardal yr wyf yn ei chynrychioli. Gwn fod y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol o'r sefyllfa yno, ac, a bod yn deg, mae wedi dweud y bydd yn ymweld â'r ysgol os gall.

**Kirsty Williams:** Yr wyf finnau, hefyd, yn gyfarwydd iawn â'r sefyllfa yn Nhrefonnen,

you agree that the problem is the way in which Powys County Council is funded at present? To do up what is necessary in Trefonnen school means that Crossgates Primary School, just up the road, would not get the money that it needs to develop. I hope that you are not suggesting that we should rob Peter to pay Paul. What we need to do is ensure that Powys County Council has an adequate capital programme so that all the schools that need work done on them are addressed in a timely fashion.

**Nick Bourne:** Yes. I was making the point that we need to pay both Peter and Paul. I accept absolutely that Crossgates school needs the money just as much as Trefonnen, for different reasons. I wanted to highlight the problems of Trefonnen rather than say, 'Take it from elsewhere'. I am referring to the general funding issues, and, certainly, Powys does need more money.

I will return specifically to Trefonnen, though in no way do I suggest that money should come from Crossgates to help it out; it is money that needs to come from the Assembly Government. At Trefonnen, children are being taught in corridors, there is a cacophony of noise as there is no separate classroom experience, people are walking through, children cannot see the whiteboards, all of which cause a real problem for the children of Llandrindod Wells, many of whom come from disadvantaged backgrounds. There is an excellent headteacher there, there are excellent governors, the parents are committed to the school, but they cannot do anything unless these matters of capital spending are put right. Again, I put in a special plea to the Minister—I know that she is busy, and whatever else we say about the Minister, I know that she is committed to education—to try to fit this into her busy schedule, if possible, when she has recovered from the loss of her voice—and I am sorry about that. If so, we would be most grateful. If you went to the school, Jane, you would see the real problems that are being experienced there.

3.50 p.m.

We support the motion. There are real

ond a fyddech yn cytuno mai'r broblem yw'r modd y caiff Cyngor Sir Powys ei ariannu ar hyn o bryd? Mae gwneud yr hyn y mae angen ei wneud yn ysgol Trefonnen yn golygu na fyddai Ysgol Gynradd Crossgates, i fyny'r ffordd, yn derbyn yr arian y mae ei angen arni i ddatblygu. Gobeithio nad ydych yn awgrymu y dylid dwyn o'r naill law i dalu'r llall. Yr hyn sydd angen ei wneud yw sicrhau bod gan Gyngor Sir Powys raglen gyfalaf ddigonol fel bod yr holl ysgolion y mae angen gwneud gwaith arnynt yn derbyn sylw mewn da bryd.

**Nick Bourne:** Ie. Yr oeddwn yn gwneud y pwynt bod angen talu'r naill law a'r llall. Derbyniaf yn llwyr fod angen yr arian ar ysgol Crossgates gymaint â Threfonnen, am resymau gwahanol. Yr oeddwn am dynnu sylw at broblemau Trefonnen yn hytrach na dweud, 'Ewch â'r arian o rywle arall'. Cyfeirio'r wyf at y materion cyffredinol yn ymwneud ag ariannu, ac yn sicr mae angen rhagor o arian ar Bowys.

Deuaf yn ôl yn benodol at Drefonnen, er nad wyf yn awgrymu am funud y dylai'r arian ddod o Crossgates i'w helpu; mae angen i'r arian ddod gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad. Yn Nhrefonnen, mae'r plant yn cael eu dysgu yn y coridorau, mae yno sŵn byddarol gan nad yw'r dosbarthiadau ar wahân, mae pobl yn cerdded drwodd, ac ni all y plant weld y byrddau gwyn, sydd i gyd yn creu problem fawr i blant Llandrindod, a llawer ohonynt yn dod o gefndiroedd dan anfantais. Mae yno bennaeth rhagorol, llywodraethwyr gwych, a rhieni sy'n ymroddedig i'r ysgol, ond ni allant wneud dim os na chaiff y problemau hyn o ran gwariant cyfalaf eu datrys. Eto, hoffwn ymbil yn arbennig ar y Gweinidog—gwn ei bod yn brysur, a beth bynnag arall a ddywedwn am y Gweinidog, gwn ei bod yn ymroddedig i addysg—i geisio dod o hyd i amser yn ei rhaglen brysur, os oes modd, pan fydd wedi cael ei llais yn ôl—ac mae'n flin gennyf ynghylch hynny. Os gall wneud hynny, byddem yn ddiolchgar dros ben. Pe baech yn mynd i'r ysgol, Jane, byddech yn gweld y problemau gwirioneddol sydd ganddynt yno.

Yr ydym yn cefnogi'r cynnig. Mae'r rhain yn



concerns here about small schools generally and the issues in relation to maintenance, and I just wanted to highlight that particular one in Powys.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** Diolch am y cyfle i gyfrannu at y drafodaeth hon. Yr wyf am wneud ychydig o sylwadau ar y darn hwnnw o'r cynnig sy'n cyfeirio at ysgolion bach. Cefnogwn yr egwyddor o sicrhau bod yr arian sydd yn y gronfa ar gyfer ysgolion bach yn cael ei neilltuo ar gyfer ei bwrpas gwreiddiol.

Yn ystod y drafodaeth hon, cawsom sawl cyfeiriad at werth ysgolion bach i'r gymuned leol, nid yn unig yn addysgol, ond fel cyfraniad tuag at gadw'r gymuned yn fyw. Credaf mai William Graham ddywedodd fod ysgol yn golygu mwy i gymuned na'r adeilad ei hun, mwy na'r briciau a'r mortar, a'i bod yn rhan o galon cymuned. Credaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth y gallem ni oll gytuno arno, ar draws y Cynulliad.

Un peth sy'n dod i'r amlwg yn y drafodaeth ar ysgolion bach—neu 'ysgolion llai' fel y dylwn ei ddweud—yw bod pob awdurdod lleol yn edrych ar y broblem, a hynny oherwydd pwysau gan y Llywodraeth. Yr ydym yn cydnabod ei fod yn fater sensitif mewn nifer o gymunedau. Er bod nifer o awdurdodau lleol wedi gwneud eu cynlluniau drafft neu eu dogfennau ymgynghorol yn hysbys, gwyddom fod cynghorau eraill yn gwneud y gwaith ar hyn o bryd ond nad ydynt eto wedi cyhoeddi eu casgliadau. Mae Cyngor Sir Ynys Môn yn un o'r cynghorau sydd wedi sefydlu panel i ystyried y mater, gan gynnwys pobl sydd â diddordeb ym maes addysg, megis athrawon a rhieni, yn ogystal â chynghorwyr. Mae'n amlwg bod pob cyngor yn edrych ar y sefyllfa hon.

Yr hyn sy'n peri pryder i nifer ohonom yw'r ffaith nad yw'r meini prawf a ddefnyddir i ystyried hyfywedd ysgolion bach bob amser yn cyfateb i'r hyn y teimlwn ni a chymunedau yw anghenion y gymuned y mae'r ysgol yn ei gwasanaethu. Nid wyf yn credu bod neb yn y Cynulliad yn dadlau o blaid cadw pob ysgol, beth bynnag ei maint, ond mae enghreifftiau o ysgolion sy'n

bryderon gwirioneddol ynghylch ysgolion bach yn gyffredinol a'r problemau yng nghyswllt cynnal a chadw, a'r cyfan yr oeddwn am ei wneud oedd tynnu sylw at yr ysgol benodol honno ym Mhowys.

**Ieuan Wyn Jones:** I am grateful for the opportunity to contribute to this debate. I want to make a few comments on that section of the motion that refers to small schools. We support the principle of ensuring that the money that is in the budget for small schools is ring-fenced for its original purpose.

During this debate, we have heard many references to the value of small schools to the local community, not only educationally, but in their contribution towards keeping the community active. I think that it was William Graham who said that a school means more to a community than the building itself, more than the bricks and mortar; it is at the heart of a community. I think that that is something that we could all agree on, across the Assembly.

One thing that has become evident in the discussion on small schools—or 'smaller schools' as I should say—is that every local authority is exploring the problem, because of Government pressure. We acknowledge that it is a sensitive issue in many communities. Although a number of local authorities have published their draft plans or consultation documents, we know that other councils are doing the work at the moment, but have not yet published their conclusions. The Isle of Anglesey County Council is one council that has established a panel to consider the matter, including people who have an interest in education, such as teachers and parents, as well as councillors. It is obvious that every council is investigating this matter.

What causes concern for many of us is the fact that the criteria used to measure the viability of small schools do not always correspond to what we and communities believe to be the needs of the community that that school serves. I do not think that anyone in the Assembly is advocating keeping every school open, whatever its size, but there are examples of schools that do far more than

gwneud llawer mwy na darparu addysg yn y gymuned. Rhaid i mi gyfaddef bod yr addysg yn aml o safon hynod uchel ac yr wyf yn falch i mi gael y rhan fwyaf o'm haddysg gynradd mewn ysgol fach wledig—ysgol sydd bellach yn cael ei chau, yng Ngarnswllt. Yr oeddwn am ddweud rhywbeth am werth ysgol gymunedol leol, yn yr ystyr ei bod yn fwy na dim ond adeilad addysgol i'r plant rhwng 9 a.m. a 3 p.m.. Nid yw'n wir bob amser, ond, yn aml, yr ysgol yw unig adeilad cymunedol y pentref ac unwaith y mae'n cau, mae gwerth yr adeilad fel adeilad cymunedol gymaint â hynny yn llai.

Nid sôn am addysg gynradd yn unig yr ydym mewn nifer o'r ysgolion bach gwledig hyn; mae gwerth addysgol gydol oes hefyd iddynt, pan fo cyrsiau yn cael eu cynnal yno gyda'r nos, oherwydd dyna'r unig le y gall y gymuned ddod at ei gilydd i gynnal gwasanaethau felly. Yr wyf yn gweld bod angen pwysu i gynnal y gronfa ysgolion bach er mwyn sicrhau bod ysgolion sy'n gwneud mwy na darparu dim ond addysg, ysgolion sy'n adnodd cymunedol, yn gallu parhau i weithredu. Gobeithiaf y bydd nodi ein bod am weld y gronfa ysgolion bach yn cael ei defnyddio ar gyfer y pwrpas y'i bwriadwyd yn rhoi arwydd clir i'n cynghorau sir a'r bobl sy'n gorfod ystyried y mater yn ddifrifol, fod angen edrych yn fanwl ar unrhyw gynllun i gau ysgolion.

Wrth gloi, mae'n bwysig nad yw cynghorau sir, wrth iddynt gyflwyno syniadau, yn teimlo bob amser fod rhaid iddynt osod rhestr o ysgolion sydd dan fygythiad. Mae hynny o reidrwydd yn golygu bod rhai rhieni, wrth benderfynu i ba ysgol y byddant yn anfon eu plant, yn gwybod bod yr ysgol a'r ysgol dan fygythiad, a byddant o bosibl yn symud eu plant i ysgol mewn ardal arall. Gobeithio bod awdurdodau lleol yn sensitif wrth gyflwyno eu sylwadau.

**The Deputy Minister with Responsibility for Education and Finance (Christine Chapman):** In opposing this motion, as worded, the Welsh Assembly Government is clear that its commitment to school buildings remains unchanged. We therefore share the concerns of the Liberal Democrat Members in relation to ensuring investment in schools, small and large. I am aware that several

just provide education in a community. I must admit that the education provided is often of an extremely high standard, and I am proud that I had the majority of my primary education in a small rural school—a school that is now being closed, in Garnswllt. I wanted to say something about the value of a small community school, in the sense that it is more than just an educational facility for children between 9 a.m. and 3 p.m.. It is not always true, but, often, the school is the only community building in a village and, once it closes, that building's value as a community building is that much less.

We are not talking only about primary education in many of these small, rural schools; there is also merit in terms of lifelong learning, when courses are held there in the evenings, as that is the only place where the community can come together to provide such services. I see the need to press for maintaining the small schools fund to ensure that schools that do more than just provide education, schools that are a community facility, can continue to operate. I hope that flagging up the fact that we want to see the small schools fund being used for the purpose for which it was intended will give a clear indication to our county councils and to the people who must consider this matter in earnest, that any plan to close schools must be looked at closely.

To conclude, it is important that county councils, when they submit ideas, do not feel that they have to provide a list every time of threatened schools. Inevitably, that means that some parents, in deciding which school to send their children to, will know that such and such a school is under threat and so will possibly move their children to a school in another area. I hope that local authorities show sensitivity in presenting their views.

**Y Dirprwy Weinidog gyda Chyfrifoldeb dros Addysg a Chyllid (Christine Chapman):** Wrth wrthwynebu'r cynnig hwn, fel y geiriwyd ef, mae Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru'n glir nad yw ei hymrwymiad i adeiladau ysgolion wedi newid. Yr ydym, felly, yn rhannu pryderon Aelodau'r Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol ynghylch sicrhau buddsoddi mewn ysgolion, bach a mawr. Yr

Members have raised individual cases. However, the motion as drafted is unnecessary and, in some respects, inaccurate.

We all recognise the importance of safe and modern school facilities if teaching and learning are to be fully effective, and if schools are to be able to deliver the curriculum. That is why the Assembly Government has made investment in school buildings one of its top 10 commitments. We are providing funding of £629 million in the lifetime of the Assembly. Annual funding has risen to £143 million this year, and it will continue at this level, at least, until the end of the decade. I take issue with those Members who said that we are not committed to this, because the facts speak for themselves. Ring-fenced grant provided since 2002 has supported 1,400 projects, 66 of which are major projects costing more than £0.5 million. In addition, 49 major projects, costing £81 million, have been approved so far from authorities' £9 million lump-sum shares of school building improvement grant.

Yes, there is more to do, but it takes time to reverse the 20 years of neglect in investment in schools that we saw under Conservative administrations. As a result of that neglect, local authorities failed to assess the state of school buildings and make investment plans, and that, too, has taken time to reverse. All authorities in Wales now have condition surveys for school buildings.

**Mark Isherwood:** Do you agree that we should not continue to fight yesterday's battles and focus instead on the core issues facing us today? Will you therefore recognise that this is a joint issue, because funding for school buildings by local authorities in the first five years after 1997 was also cut on the previous years and the 1990 figures? Let us stop fighting those battles and focus on the issue today. [*Interruption.*] You cut as well. The schools in your constituency have a major problem, Carl. They are listening to you laughing.

wyf yn ymwybodol bod nifer o Aelodau wedi codi achosion unigol. Fodd bynnag, mae'r cynnig fel y geiriwyd yn ddiangen, ac, yng nghyswllt rhai agweddau, yn anghywir.

Yr ydym i gyd yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw cyfleusterau diogel a chyfoes mewn ysgolion os yw'r dysgu a'r addysgu i fod yn gwbl effeithiol, fel bod ysgolion yn gallu cyflwyno'r cwricwlwm. Dyna pam y mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi gwneud buddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion yn un o'i 10 prif ymrwymiad. Yr ydym yn darparu cyllid o £629 miliwn dros oes y Cynulliad. Mae'r cyllid blyneddol wedi codi i £143 miliwn eleni, a bydd yn parhau ar y lefel honno, o leiaf hyd at ddiwedd y degawd. Anghytunaf â'r Aelodau hynny sy'n dweud nad ydym wedi ymrwymo i hyn, gan fod y ffeithiau yn siarad drostynt eu hunain. Ers 2002, mae grant a glustnodwyd wedi cynorthwyo 1,400 o brosiectau, 66 ohonynt yn brosiectau mawr yn costio mwy na £0.5 miliwn. Yn ogystal, mae 49 o brosiectau mawr, yn costio £81 miliwn, wedi eu cymeradwyo hyd yma o gyfrannau cyfandaliad y grant gwella adeiladau ysgolion sy'n werth £9 miliwn gan yr awdurdodau.

Oes, mae mwy i'w wneud, ond mae'n cymryd amser i wrthdroi'r 20 mlynedd o esgeulustod o ran buddsoddi mewn ysgolion a welsom o dan lywodraethau'r Ceidwadwyr. O ganlyniad i'r diffyg hwnnw, nid asesodd awdurdodau lleol gyflwr adeiladau ysgolion na pharatoi cynlluniau buddsoddi, ac mae hynny, hefyd, wedi cymryd amser i'w wrthdroi. Erbyn hyn, mae gan bob awdurdod yng Nghymru arolygon o gyflwr yr adeiladau ar gyfer yr ysgolion.

**Mark Isherwood:** A ydych yn cytuno na ddylem barhau i ymladd brwydrau ddoe a chanolbwyntio yn hytrach ar y materion craidd sy'n ein hwynebu heddiw? A wnewch felly gydnabod mai problem ar y cyd yw hon, gan fod cyllid i wella adeiladau ysgolion gan awdurdodau lleol yn y pum mlynedd cyntaf ar ôl 1997 hefyd wedi'i dorri o'i gymharu â'r blyneddodded cyn hynny a ffigurau 1990? Gadewch inni roi'r gorau i ymladd y brwydrau hynny a chanolbwyntio ar y mater gerbron heddiw. [*Torri ar draws.*] Torasoch chithau hefyd. Mae gan yr ysgolion yn eich

etholaeth chi broblem fawr, Carl. Maent yn gwrandao arnoch yn chwerthin.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. You cannot address one of your esteemed colleagues across the Chamber. Please address your remarks to the Deputy Minister on whose speech you are intervening, or to the Chair.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni chewch annerch un o'ch cyd-Aelodau anrhydeddus ar draws y Siambr. A wnewch annerch y Dirprwy Weinidog gan mai ei hanerchiad hi yr ydych yn torri ar ei draws, neu'r Gadair, os gwelwch yn dda?

**Christine Chapman:** I remind you, Mark, that, in 1997, we were left with a £1 billion backlog as a result of your party's administration. It takes time to put that right.

**Christine Chapman:** Hoffwn eich atgoffa, Mark, ein bod, yn 1997, wedi etifeddu ôl-groniad gwerth £1 biliwn gan weinyddiaeth eich plaid chi. Mae'n cymryd amser i unioni hynny.

All authorities in Wales now have condition surveys for school buildings. Some are more thorough than others, some were conducted around five years ago and are being updated, and the part of the motion that would direct the Minister to carry out a survey to assess the state of buildings is unnecessary. The work is the responsibility of local authorities and it is largely complete.

Mae gan bob awdurdod yng Nghymru bellach arolygon cyflwr ar gyfer adeiladau eu hysgolion. Mae rhai yn fwy trylwyr na'i gilydd, cynhaliwyd eraill tua phum mlynedd yn ôl ac maent yn cael eu diweddarau, ac mae'r rhan o'r cynnig a fyddai'n cyfarwyddo'r Gweinidog i gynnal arolwg i asesu cyflwr yr adeiladau yn ddiangen. Cyfrifoldeb yr awdurdodau lleol yw'r gwaith hwn, ac mae wedi'i wneud i raddau helaeth.

If we look at the state of buildings, and, therefore, at the backlog of repair and maintenance work, we think that this is still only a starting point.

Os edrychwn ar gyflwr adeiladau, ac, felly, ar y gwaith trwsio a chynnal a chadw sydd wedi cronni, credwn mai dim ond man cychwyn yw hyn.

**Peter Black:** I accept that it is the local authorities that have responsibility for doing this work, but it is your Government that is saying that it can meet this target by 2010. You are the ones saying that you will put the money in the budget, but do you know how much money you need to put in the budget? Do you know exactly how to achieve this target? The answer, surely, is 'No, you do not'.

**Peter Black:** Derbyniaf mai'r awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am wneud y gwaith hwn, ond eich Llywodraeth chi sy'n dweud y bydd yn gallu cwrdd â'r targed hwn erbyn 2010. Chi sy'n dweud y byddwch yn rhoi'r arian yn y gyllideb, ond a wyddoch faint o arian y mae angen ei roi yn y gyllideb? A wyddoch yn union sut i gyrraedd y targed hwn? Yr ateb, onid e, yw 'Na, ni wyddoch'.

**Christine Chapman:** I will come to that point later on.

**Christine Chapman:** Deuaf at y pwynt hwnnw yn nes ymlaen.

4.00 p.m.

Local authorities need to use that information along with information on projected pupil numbers to decide what investment is needed in school buildings. Remember, we are looking at 114,000 empty places in our schools by 2013, and local authorities need to decide which buildings should continue to be

Mae angen i awdurdodau lleol ddefnyddio'r wybodaeth honno ynghyd â gwybodaeth am y rhagamcanion ar gyfer niferoedd disgyblion i benderfynu faint sydd angen ei fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion. Cofiwch ein bod yn edrych ar 114,000 o leoedd gwag yn ein hysgolion erbyn 2013, ac mae'n rhaid i

in use, which buildings need major investment and rebuilding, and which community or dual-use—community and school use—facility should be provided. The key question is to know what investment is needed, and that is the information that the Assembly Government and the authorities need so that we can move forward.

Following visits to all local authorities, our officials concluded, with one or two exceptions, that local authorities have a reasonably clear picture of what investment is needed to bring their schools to a fit state to deliver the curriculum of the twenty-first century, although that has not been properly quantified in all cases.

**Helen Mary Jones** *rose*—

**Christine Chapman:** I will carry on, as time is getting short.

We need to critically scrutinise and test the information, pursue any gaps or uncertainties and consider whether or not available resources are adequate, taking into account the need for authorities to use their own resources as well as Assembly Government ring-fenced capital grant for school buildings. We expect the assessment to be completed in the early part of 2006. So, Peter, we are not on an ill-defined journey, as you stated—we have some figures and a deadline to meet. As usual, the Minister will be happy to share the information with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee. The assessment will go further than the information which would be required by the motion, and it would be available earlier than July 2006. Therefore, the second part of the motion is unnecessary.

On the third element of the motion, as my colleagues Sue Essex and Jane Davidson said, we have agreed to bring the elements of specific grants already ring-fenced for small and rural schools together in one budget line for 2006-07. Currently, the additional funding for small schools sits at £3.5 million and the Finance Minister will address this

awdurdodau lleol benderfynu pa adeiladau y dylid parhau i'w defnyddio, pa adeiladau y mae angen buddsoddi symiau mawr o arian ynddynt a'u hailadeiladu, a pha gyfleusterau cymunedol neu ddau ddefnydd—defnydd gan y gymuned a'r ysgol—y dylid eu darparu. Y mater allweddol yw canfod pa fuddsoddiad sydd ei angen, a dyna'r wybodaeth sydd ei hangen ar Lywodraeth y Cynulliad a'r awdurdodau er mwyn ein galluogi i fwrw ymlaen.

Wedi ymweld â phob awdurdod lleol, daeth ein swyddogion i'r casgliad, gydag un neu ddau o eithriadau, fod gan awdurdodau lleol ddarlun gweddol eglur o'r buddsoddiad sydd ei angen i sicrhau bod ysgolion mewn cyflwr sy'n addas i gyflwyno cwricwlwm sy'n perthyn i'r unfed ganrif ar hugain, er nad yw hynny wedi'i fesur yn llawn ym mhob achos.

**Helen Mary Jones** *a gododd*—

**Christine Chapman:** Yr wyf am fwrw ymlaen, gan fod amser yn brin.

Rhaid inni graffu'n feirniadol ar y wybodaeth a'i phrofi, rhaid mynd i'r afael ag unrhyw fylchau neu ansicrwydd ac ystyried a yw'r adnoddau sydd ar gael yn ddigonol, gan ystyried yr angen i'r awdurdodau ddefnyddio eu hadnoddau eu hunain yn ogystal â grant cyfalaf Llywodraeth y Cynulliad sydd wedi'i neilltuo ar gyfer adeiladau ysgolion. Disgwylir y bydd yr asesiad wedi'i gwblhau yn gynnar yn 2006. Felly, Peter, nid ydym ar daith na wyddom i ble y mae'n ein harwain, fel y dywedaso chi—mae gennym rai ffigurau a dyddiad pendant i anelu ato. Yn ôl yr arfer, bydd y Gweinidog yn fodlon rhannu'r wybodaeth gyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes. Bydd yr asesiad yn mynd yn bellach na'r wybodaeth a fyddai'n ofynnol yn ôl y cynnig, a byddai ar gael cyn Gorffennaf 2006. Felly, mae ail hanner y cynnig yn ddiangen.

O ran trydedd elfen y cynnig, fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelodau Sue Essex a Jane Davidson, yr ydym wedi cytuno i ddod ag elfennau'r grantiau penodol sydd eisoes yn cael eu neilltuo ar gyfer ysgolion bach a gwledig at ei gilydd mewn un llinell yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2006-07. Ar hyn o bryd, mae'r arian ychwanegol ar gyfer ysgolion

issue when she presents her revised budget before the Assembly. That money is made up of £1.5 million in funding to support innovative and collaborative working between small rural schools, handled within the better schools fund; £1 million in funding to support the heads of small schools with a substantial teaching commitment, currently handled as an additional revenue funding grant; and £1 million in funding for developing greater community use of small schools, which is handled as part of the community focused schools grant.

There are no specifically identified elements for small schools within other budgets, so the motion is factually incorrect. The funding for workload reform is provided within the local government revenue settlement. The £1 million in funding given to heads of small schools with a substantial teaching commitment is additional money, over and above the workload funding, in recognition of the particular issues that they face.

All schools, large and small, receive a delegated budget from their local authority education budget, and that budget is funded from the revenue support grant, the Education and Learning Wales post-16 grant and local taxation. The existence of the specific funding for small schools already demonstrates a recognition of the roles that small schools have to play in securing high educational standards, and the potential that they have to serve the community. It also recognises that, like all schools, they need to develop and improve to address the needs of pupils in the twenty-first century. I know that a number of Members are concerned about the issue around small schools, and that should address the issue.

This motion is unnecessary, because the work of assessing the need for investment in school buildings is already being undertaken by local authorities, and is well advanced. Knowing about the current state of school buildings is necessary, but it is only a stage in the process. To require the Assembly Government to repeat work which has largely been done would make no sense. The results of the assessment will be shared with the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee

bach yn £3.5 miliwn a bydd y Gweinidog Cyllid yn rhoi sylw i hyn pan fydd yn cyflwyno ei chyllideb ddiwygiedig gerbron y Cynulliad. Mae'r cyllid hwnnw'n cynnwys £1.5 miliwn o arian i gefnogi'r gwaith arloesol a chydweithredol sy'n digwydd rhwng ysgolion bach gwledig, ac sy'n dod o'r gronfa ysgolion gwell; £1 miliwn i gefnogi penaethiaid ysgolion bach sydd ag ymrwymadau dysgu sylweddol, sydd ar hyn o bryd yn rhan o grant reffeniw ychwanegol; a £1 miliwn i ddatblygu defnydd ehangach o ysgolion bach gan y gymuned, sy'n cael ei drin fel rhan o'r grant ysgolion bro.

Nid oes elfennau penodol i ysgolion bach o fewn cyllidebau eraill, felly mae'r cynnig yn ffeithiol anghywir. Darperir yr arian i ddiwygio llwyth gwaith o fewn setliad reffeniw llywodraeth leol. Mae'r £1 miliwn a roddir i benaethiaid ysgolion bach sydd ag ymrwymadau dysgu sylweddol yn arian ychwanegol, ar ben yr arian ar gyfer llwyth gwaith, i gydnabod yr anawsterau arbennig y maent yn eu hwynebu.

Mae pob ysgol, mawr a bach, yn derbyn cyllideb ddirprwyedig gan eu hawdurdod addysg lleol, ac mae'r gyllideb honno'n cael ei hariannu o'r grant cynnal reffeniw, grant ôl-16 oed Dysgu ac Addysgu Cymru a threthi lleol. Mae bodolaeth y cyllid penodol i ysgolion bach eisoes yn cydnabod y rolau sydd gan ysgolion bach i'w chwarae mewn sicrhau safonau addysgol uchel, a'r potensial sydd ganddynt i wasanaethu'r gymuned. Mae'n cydnabod hefyd fod angen iddynt ddatblygu a gwella i ddiwallu anghenion disgyblion yn yr unfed ganrif ar hugain, yr un fath â phob ysgol arall. Gwn fod nifer o Aelodau'n bryderus ynglŷn â materion yn ymwneud ag ysgolion bach, a dylai hynny roi sylw i'r mater.

Mae'r cynnig hwn yn un diangen, oherwydd bod y gwaith o asesu'r angen i fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion yn cael ei wneud eisoes gan yr awdurdodau lleol, ac mae llawer wedi'i wneud eisoes. Mae'n angenrheidiol inni wybod beth yw cyflwr presennol adeiladau ysgolion, ond dim ond un cam o'r broses yw hynny. Ni fyddai'n gwneud synnwyr gorfodi Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i ail-wneud gwaith sydd wedi'i wneud eisoes i raddau helaeth. Bydd

when it has been completed.

Action to bring together the elements of specific grant funding for small schools in the budget for 2006-07 is already in hand in response to the earlier motion on the draft budget for 2006-07. Again, an instruction to do what is already being done serves no purpose. Therefore, I invite Members to vote against the motion.

**Michael German:** If the motion was redundant, the Education and Lifelong Learning Committee would have been told all the answers, which the Government seems to think that it has, to these questions. Therefore, the reason for the motion is quite clear: to elicit some action from the Government. We appear to have some action, at least on the funding for school buildings, so perhaps we will get this information earlier. If that is the case, I thank the Government for acting swiftly to bring it forward. However, we did not know the answers to those questions when we asked, so it would seem that the only surprising thing about this motion is that it was needed at all.

If the Government expected to reach its commitment, but without knowing what the backlog was, the motion was intended to describe how big the mountain was that it had to climb. Now we know that the Government does not know the answer, because it says that it will have to produce the figures and that it will take some time to do that. However, it will have them slightly earlier than the motion requires. Well, hooray. That is a victory, and I am sure we are all pleased about that. I am grateful to the Government for moving a little more swiftly, since the motion was tabled.

Let us have a look at the Government's proposal. After all, it has a target to eliminate a problem and a significant sum of money allocated to it. It has admitted that it does not know how big the problem is, and therefore

canlyniadau'r asesiad yn cael eu rhannu gyda'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes pan fydd y gwaith wedi'i gwblhau.

Mae'r gwaith i ddwyn ynghyd elfennau'r cyllid grant penodol i ysgolion bach yn y gyllideb ar gyfer 2006-07 eisoes ar y gweill mewn ymateb i'r cynnig blaenorol ar y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2006-07. Unwaith eto, nid oes diben cyflwyno cyfarwyddyd i wneud rhywbeth sy'n cael ei wneud eisoes. Felly, gwahoddaf yr Aelodau i bleidleisio yn erbyn y cynnig.

**Michael German:** Pe bai'r cynnig yn ddianghenraid, byddai'r Pwyllgor Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes wedi derbyn yr holl atebion i'r cwestiynau hyn, sef rhywbeth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn credu ei fod wedi digwydd. Felly, mae'r rheswm dros y cynnig yn ddigon eglur: mynnu bod gweithredu'n digwydd o du'r Llywodraeth. Ymddengys fod peth gwaith wedi'i wneud, o leiaf o ran arian tuag at adeiladau ysgolion, felly efallai y cawn y wybodaeth hon yn gynt. Os yw hynny'n wir, diolchaf i'r Llywodraeth am weithredu'n gyflym i gyflawni hynny. Fodd bynnag, ni wyddem beth oedd yr ateb i'r cwestiynau hynny pan ofynnwyd hwy gennym, felly ymddengys mai'r unig syndod ynglŷn â'r cynnig hwn yw bod ei angen o gwbl.

Os oedd y Llywodraeth yn disgwyl cyflawni ei hymrwymiad, ond heb wybod beth oedd maint yr ôl-groniad, diben y cynnig oedd disgrifio pa mor fawr oedd y mynydd yr oedd yn rhaid iddi ei ddringo. Gwyddom bellach nad yw'r Llywodraeth yn gwybod yr ateb, oherwydd ei bod yn dweud y bydd rhaid iddi ddod o hyd i'r ffigurau ac y cymer beth amser i wneud hynny. Fodd bynnag, bydd y ffigurau ar gael ychydig yn gynt na'r hyn sy'n ofynnol yn ôl y cynnig. Wel, hwrê. Mae hynny'n fuddugoliaeth, ac yr wyf yn siŵr ein bod i gyd yn falch o hynny. Yr wyf yn ddiolchgar i'r Llywodraeth am weithredu ychydig yn gyflymach, ers i'r cynnig gael ei gyflwyno.

Gadewch inni edrych ar gynnis y Llywodraeth. Wedi'r cyfan, mae ganddi darged i gael gwared ar broblem ac mae swm sylweddol o arian wedi'i ddyrannu ar gyfer hynny. Mae wedi cyfaddef nad yw'n gwybod

how much needs to be done to address it. It is almost like saying that it has a target, that it knows what the start and end points are, but that it does not know where it is on that journey.

Many Members will have visited school buildings that are in need of repair. Safe and secure buildings are an essential part of our children's education. Even the ancient Greeks learnt the lesson. They found that flat roofs leak. It is a fault of our society that for the past 150 years, we have continued to build schools with flat roofs, and we have not learned that lesson. Those leaky roofs mean that people have to move out of the way when they leak. I have been to classrooms—as have many Members have—with buckets waiting to collect the water. I have been to classrooms in this country where you can see right through the outside walls. I have been to classrooms that are demountables far beyond their sell-by date.

In such circumstances, children cannot get the best education. Poor quality surroundings have an impact on the high quality education that the children need. There is little point in engaging in all the other education initiatives if children cannot be taught in safe, warm and comfortable surroundings. As another Member said, adults have the right to say that they will not work in the sort of conditions that some of our children are in. We do not expect adults to work in such conditions, and we should not tolerate them for our children. We need to build on experience and skills, including local authorities' skills, in compiling the survey of repair and maintenance needs.

We should invest in school buildings, because it is an invest-to-save measure. We are not doing it simply because we want to have smart new buildings. It will produce a better education experience, and the money currently spent patching up school buildings and fixing leaks could be better and more efficiently spent on front-line education. Once the figure has been established, we will

maintain the problem, and felly beth yn union y mae angen ei wneud i'w datrys. Mae hyn bron fel dweud bod ganddi darged, ei bod yn gwybod beth yw'r manau cychwyn a gorffen, ond nad yw'n siŵr pa mor bell y mae wedi teithio ar y daith honno.

Bydd llawer o Aelodau wedi ymweld ag adeiladau ysgolion y mae angen eu hatgyweirio. Mae adeiladau diogel a chadarn yn elfen hanfodol o addysg plant. Dysgodd yr hen Roegwyr hyd yn oed y wers honno. Bu iddynt ddarganfod bod toeau fflat yn gollwng dŵr. Un o feiau ein cymdeithas yn ystod y 150 mlynedd diwethaf yw ein bod wedi parhau i adeiladu ysgolion gyda thoeau fflat, ac nid ydym wedi dysgu'r wers honno. Pan fydd toeau'n gollwng bydd rhaid i bobl symud oddi ar y ffordd. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth—fel llawer o Aelodau eraill—lle y ceir bwcedi wrth law yn barod i gasglu'r dŵr. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth yn y wlad hon lle y gallwch weld drwy'r waliau allanol. Yr wyf wedi bod mewn ystafelloedd dosbarth dros dro sydd wedi hen gyrraedd diwedd eu hoes.

Ni all plant dderbyn yr addysg orau mewn amgylchiadau o'r fath. Mae amgylchiadau gwael yn cael effaith andwyol ar yr addysg o safon uchel sydd ei hangen ar blant. Nid oes llawer o bwrpas mewn ymgymryd â'r holl fentrau addysgol eraill os nad oes modd dysgu'r plant mewn amgylchiadau diogel, cynnes a chyfforddus. Fel y dywedodd Aelod arall, mae gan oedolion hawl i ddweud nad ydynt yn fodlon gweithio o dan amodau tebyg i'r rhai y mae rhai o'n plant yn cael eu haddysgu ynddynt. Nid ydym yn disgwyl i oedolion weithio o dan y fath amodau, ac ni ddylem eu goddef i'n plant. Mae'n rhaid inni adeiladu ar brofiad a sgiliau, gan gynnwys sgiliau'r awdurdodau lleol, wrth gynnal arolwg o'r anghenion o ran trwsio a chynnal a chadw.

Dylem fuddsoddi mewn adeiladau ysgolion, gan fod hynny'n fesur buddsoddi er mwyn arbed. Nid ydym yn ei wneud er mwyn cael adeiladau newydd braf yn unig. Bydd yn arwain at brofiad addysgol gwell, a byddai'n well ac yn fwy effeithlon pe bai'r arian sy'n cael ei wario ar hyn o bryd ar atgyweirio adeiladau ysgolion a thrwsio toeau sy'n gollwng yn cael ei wario ar addysg rheng



have to return to the matter of the money needed to clear and fund the backlog. Allocating money through the local government formula will not necessarily work because some local authorities will inevitably have bigger backlogs than others. Therefore, we will have to find a better way to deal with the condition of school buildings.

Turning to the issue of small schools, more than one Member has mentioned that no-one in the Chamber would advocate that no small school should ever be closed. There are matters concerning the quality of education provided. However, if we are going to have a policy that states that education priorities come first, we must examine all the ways in which the changes in education policy can be achieved, to ensure that the right choices are made. There are many ways in which schools can collaborate. That is why the special grant was set up in the first place.

4.10 p.m.

I am afraid that it is not good enough, Deputy Minister, to say that there are three funds that are going to be brought into one fund, because some Members have been told by Ministers this week that the revenue support grant settlement contains money for small schools. It is not just three grant funds being brought into one. We must have transparency in this funding. There is one fund for which people can bid to fund the sort of activity and work that would avoid the necessity for some small schools to close, whether that be through federation, collaboration or other forms of sharing activity. Clearly, it is not just school buildings at stake here; it is the whole heart of the community. The most distressing thing for any community, whether it is in a rural or urban area, is to face that choice of whether or not it should close its local school.

**David Lloyd:** How do you view the Liberal Democrat proposal to close Dylan Thomas Community School in Swansea?

**Michael German:** As you know, I am not the local authority for Swansea, but all local authorities currently have to deal with this

flaen. Pan fydd y ffigur wedi'i bennu, bydd rhaid inni ddychwelyd at y cwestiwn faint o arian y bydd ei angen i glirio ac ariannu'r ôl-groniad. Ni fydd dyrannu arian drwy'r fformwla llywodraeth leol yn gweithio o reidrwydd gan ei bod yn anochel bod gan rai awdurdodau ôl-groniadau mwy na'i gilydd. Felly, bydd rhaid inni ddod o hyd i ffordd well o ddelio â chyflwr adeiladau ysgolion.

A throi at bwnc ysgolion bach, mae mwy nag un Aelod wedi dweud na fyddai neb yn y Siambr yn dadlau na ddylid byth gau ysgol fach. Mae'n rhaid ystyried materion yn ymwneud â safon yr addysg a ddarperir. Fodd bynnag, os ydym am gael polisi sy'n datgan bod rhaid i flaenoriaethau addysgol ddod yn gyntaf, mae'n rhaid inni edrych ar bob ffordd bosibl o gyflawni newidiadau mewn polisïau addysg, i sicrhau ein bod yn gwneud y dewisiadau cywir. Gall ysgolion gydweithredu mewn sawl ffordd. Dyna pam y cafodd y grant arbennig ei sefydlu yn y lle cyntaf.

Mae arnaf ofn nad yw'n ddigon da, Ddirprwy Weinidog, ichi ddweud bod tair cronfa'n mynd i gael eu cyfuno'n un gronfa, gan fod Gweinidogion wedi dweud wrth rai Aelodau yr wythnos hon fod y setliad grant cynnal refeniw yn cynnwys arian i ysgolion bach. Nid cyfuno tair cronfa grant yn un yw'r unig beth. Rhaid inni gael tryloywder ynglŷn â'r arian hwn. Mae un gronfa y gall pobl wneud cais am arian ganddi i ariannu'r math o weithgarwch a gwaith a fyddai'n osgoi'r angen i gau rhai ysgolion bach, boed hynny drwy ffedereiddio, cydweithredu neu fathau eraill o rannu gweithgareddau. Mae'n amlwg bod mwy nag adeiladau ysgolion yn y fantol yma; mae calon y gymuned yn y fantol. Y gofid mwyaf i unrhyw gymuned, boed mewn ardal wledig neu drefol, yw gorfod wynebu'r dewis hwnnw o orfod cau'r ysgol leol neu beidio.

**David Lloyd:** Beth yw eich barn am gynnig y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol i gau Ysgol Gymunedol Dylan Thomas yn Abertawe?

**Michael German:** Fel y gwyddoch, nid y fi yw awdurdod lleol Abertawe, ond mae pob awdurdod lleol yn gorfod delio â'r mater hwn

issue. It is not unique, and it is a case of each local authority having to examine all the options before them. However, if there are alternative methods, and this funding was meant and designed to allow alternative funding to be drawn down to examine alternatives to closure, they should be examined and used.

**Janet Ryder:** Will you give way?

**Michael German:** If you are going to ask me what the local authority should do, I will answer that I am not the local authority for Swansea, and nor is the National Assembly.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree—[*Interruption.*]

**Michael German:** I am sorry, I cannot hear because the Minister was interjecting—

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. I cannot have this. You are giving way to Janet Ryder.

**Janet Ryder:** Do you agree that a local authority should consult on the shape of the education within its county with the parents and communities concerned first, rather than publish a list of schools that it is going to close? That gives those schools the kiss of death. A county should not do it that way around. If you agree with that, what will you say to your colleagues in Swansea who have announced the names of the schools that they are going to close first?

**Michael German:** My understanding is that the schools in Swansea have been announced as part of a consultation exercise. If that is not the case, I am sure that you will let me know.

**Val Lloyd:** Will you give way?

**Michael German:** In a moment. [ASSEMBLY MEMBERS: 'Give way.'] I would like to finish my sentence.

**The Presiding Officer:** Order. The leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrat group is replying to an earlier intervention and I am waiting to hear his reply.

ar hyn o bryd. Nid yw'n unigryw, ac mae'n golygu bod rhaid i bob awdurdod lleol edrych ar bob opsiwn sydd ar gael iddynt. Fodd bynnag, os oes dulliau eraill, a bwriadwyd a chynlluniwyd yr arian hwn i ddarparu cyllid amgen i edrych ar ddewisiadau heblaw cau, dylid edrych arnynt a'u defnyddio.

**Janet Ryder:** A wnewch ildio?

**Michael German:** Os ydych am ofyn imi beth y dylai'r awdurdod lleol ei wneud, atebaf drwy ddweud nad y fi yw'r awdurdod lleol dros Abertawe, ac mae hynny'n wir am y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol hefyd.

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn cytuno—[*Torri ar draws.*]

**Michael German:** Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, ni allaf glywed gan fod y Gweinidog yn torri ar draws—

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Ni allaf ganiatáu hyn. Yr ydych yn ildio i Janet Ryder.

**Janet Ryder:** A ydych yn cytuno y dylai awdurdod lleol ymgynghori â'r rhieni a'r cymunedau dan sylw yn gyntaf ynghylch ffurf yr addysg o fewn ei sir, yn hytrach na chyhoeddi rhestr o ysgolion y mae am eu cau? Mae hynny'n ergyd farwol i'r ysgolion hynny. Nid dyna sut y dylai sir fynd ati i wneud pethau. Os ydych yn cytuno â hynny, beth a ddywedwch wrth eich cyd-aelodau yn Abertawe sydd wedi cyhoeddi enwau'r ysgolion y maent am eu cau gyntaf?

**Michael German:** Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae enwau'r ysgolion yn Abertawe wedi cael eu cyhoeddi fel rhan o ymgynghoriad. Os nad yw hynny'n wir, yr wyf yn siŵr y rhowch wybod imi.

**Val Lloyd:** A wnewch ildio?

**Michael German:** Mewn munud. [AELODAU'R CYNULLIAD: 'Ildiwch.'] Hoffwn gael gorffen fy mrawddeg.

**Y Llywydd:** Trefn. Mae arweinydd grŵp y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol yn ateb ymyriad cynharach ac yr wyf yn aros i glywed ei ateb.

**Michael German:** When I have finished, I will ask Val Lloyd whether she wants to intervene.

The process of consultation is important and if people have to ask questions and invite answers to those questions, you are bound to ask the questions around the area that you are discussing.

**Val Lloyd:** You have been concentrating on small rural schools. I would like to hear your justification, as a Liberal Democrat, for closing Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Garnswllt, which is a very small rural school, like those that you have been describing today.

**Michael German:** That is fine. If you would like to invite me to visit the school, I will probably have a look and see for myself, but I am afraid that I cannot answer for the consultation exercise, of which I have no knowledge.

It is clear, is it not, that local authorities have to consult and that that is a long process? When you have to consult, you have to talk to people about the roles that they have to play. This motion is about local authorities finding that they have more tools to do the job, because this provides them with an opportunity to examine alternatives and other ways of moving forward. A fund that has been diverted, split up into other funds and placed in the RSG is not a clear, transparent and available fund.

When deciding how to vote in this motion, remember that, if closing schools is the most difficult choice that any community has to face, is it not better in this case that local authorities have that choice and the option to have that funding available to them?

**Michael German:** Pan fyddaf wedi gorffen, gofynnaf i Val Lloyd a yw am ymyrryd.

Mae'r broses ymgynghori'n bwysig ac os oes rhaid i bobl ofyn cwestiynau a gwahodd atebion i'r cwestiynau hynny, yr ydych yn rhwym o ofyn y cwestiynau sy'n ymwneud â'r maes yr ydych yn ei drafod.

**Val Lloyd:** Yr ydych wedi bod yn canolbwyntio ar ysgolion bach gwledig. Hoffwn glywed eich cyfiawnhad, fel Democrat Rhyddfrydol, dros gau Ysgol Gynradd Gymraeg Garnswllt, sy'n ysgol wledig fach iawn, fel y rhai yr ydych wedi bod yn eu disgrifio heddiw.

**Michael German:** Mae hynny'n iawn. Pe baech yn hoffi fy ngwahodd i ymweld â'r ysgol, mae'n debygol y caf weld dros of fy hun, ond mae arnaf ofn na allaf ateb dros yr ymgynghoriad, gan nad oes gennyf wybodaeth amdano.

Mae'n amlwg, onid yw, fod rhaid i awdurdodau lleol ymgynghori a bod hynny'n broses hir? Pan fyddwch yn ymgynghori, mae'n rhaid ichi siarad â phobl ynglŷn â'r rolau sydd ganddynt i'w chwarae. Mae'r cynnig hwn yn ymwneud ag awdurdodau lleol yn canfod bod ganddynt fwy o arfau i wneud y gwaith, oherwydd bod hyn yn rhoi cyfle iddynt edrych ar opsiynau eraill a ffyrdd eraill o symud ymlaen. Nid yw cronfa sydd wedi cael ei dargyfeirio, ei rhannu'n gronfeydd eraill a'i gosod yn y gronfa cynnal refeniw yn gronfa eglur, dryloyw nac yn un sydd ar gael.

Wrth benderfynu sut i bleidleisio ar y cynnig hwn, cofiwch, os mai cau ysgolion yw'r dewis anoddaf y mae'n rhaid i unrhyw gymuned ei wynebu, onid yw'n well yn yr achos hwn fod y dewis hwnnw gan awdurdodau lleol a'r opsiwn o fod â'r arian hwnnw ar gael iddynt?

*Cynnig (NDM2664): O blaid 30, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 29.*

*Motion (NDM2664): For 30, Abstain 0, Against 29.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
The following Members voted against:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, David  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Elin  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Law, Peter  
 Lloyd, David  
 Marek, John  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leann

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Rhodri  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig.  
 Motion carried.*

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd i'r Gadair am 4.15 p.m.  
 The Deputy Presiding Officer took the Chair at 4.15 p.m.*

### **Adroddiad Blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru Annual Report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales**

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** I have selected amendments 1, 2 and 3 in the name of David Melding, and amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yr wyf wedi dethol gwelliannau 1, 2 a 3 yn enw David Melding a gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I propose that

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Cynigiau fod

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the publication of the annual report of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales for the period 2004-05. (NDM2663)*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar gyfer y cyfnod 2004-05. (NDM2663)*

I welcome the opportunity to debate the CSIW annual report for 2004-05, which provides the most comprehensive overview of individual services in Wales to date. The CSIW now regulates some 6,000 settings across social care, early years, and private

Croesawaf y cyfle i gynnal dadl ar adroddiad blynyddol ASGC ar gyfer 2004-05, sy'n darparu'r trosolwg mwyaf cynhwysfawr hyd yn hyn o wasanaethau unigol yng Nghymru. Mae ASGC bellach yn rheoleiddio tua 6,000 o leoliadau ym maes gofal cymdeithasol, y

and voluntary healthcare services. The report describes the key trends and service quality issues that the care sector faces and provides essential information for providers, service users, commissioners and policy makers.

The report indicates that there are a significant number of examples of good practice in the care sector. Additionally, it points to the improvements in a number of service sectors this year. Overall, it is clear that the regulatory changes introduced in 2002 have begun to pay dividends. However, there is still work to be done. A number of core areas still need to be addressed by providers. These include understanding what individuals require, good-quality support for staff, and vigilance in terms of safeguarding and protecting the interests of service users.

Tens of thousands of people across Wales use social care services, and it is essential that they are of the highest quality. I will continue to support the work of service commissioners, providers and users, as well as the inspectorate, in terms of how the issues identified in this report can be advanced and how we can build upon the improvements that have been achieved to date.

The report also describes all the new areas that have been subject to regulation during 2004-05, for example, domiciliary care and adult placement schemes. These have involved extensive preparatory work by CSIW and providers, but these major new areas are providing significantly increased safeguards for patients who use these services. The aim that we set ourselves of putting in place arrangements that will ensure that those using social care services have the protection of the regulation has now been achieved.

The image that many have of the CSIW as being substantially an inspectorate for care homes is now outdated. There is now a much

blynyddoedd cynnar a gwasanaethau gofal iechyd preifat a gwirfoddol. Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'r prif dueddiadau a'r problemau o ran ansawdd y gwasanaeth a wynebwr gan y sector gofal, ac yn darparu gwybodaeth hanfodol i ddarparwyr, defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, comisiynwyr a llunwyr polisiau.

Mae'r adroddiad yn nodi bod llawer iawn o enghreifftiau o arferion da yn y sector gofal. Mae hefyd yn cyfeirio at y gwelliannau a welwyd eleni mewn llawer o sectorau gwasanaeth. Yn gyffredinol, mae'n amlwg bod y newidiadau rheoleiddio a gyflwynwyd yn 2002 wedi dechrau dwyn ffrwyth. Fodd bynnag, mae mwy o waith i'w wneud. Mae llawer o feysydd craidd y mae angen i ddarparwyr roi sylw iddynt o hyd. Mae'r rhain yn cynnwys deall beth sydd ar unigolion ei angen, rhoi cefnogaeth dda i staff, a bod yn wyliadwrus wrth ddiogelu a gwarchod buddiannau defnyddwyr gwasanaethau.

Mae degau o filoedd o bobl ledled Cymru'n defnyddio gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol, ac mae'n hanfodol eu bod o'r safon uchaf. Byddaf yn parhau i gefnogi gwaith comisiynwyr, darparwyr a defnyddwyr gwasanaethau, yn ogystal â'r arolygiaeth, er mwyn gweld sut y gallwn weithredu ar sail y materion a nodir yn yr adroddiad hwn ac adeiladu ar y gwelliannau sydd wedi eu gwneud yn barod.

Mae'r adroddiad hefyd yn disgrifio'r holl feysydd newydd sydd wedi bod yn cael eu rheoleiddio yn ystod 2004-05, er enghraifft, gofal cartref a chynlluniau lleoliadau oedolion. Mae'r rhain wedi golygu llawer iawn o waith paratoawl ar ran ASGC a darparwyr, ond mae'r meysydd newydd pwysig hyn yn rhoi llawer mwy o ddiogelwch i gleifion sy'n defnyddio'r gwasanaethau hyn. Mae'r nod a osodasom i ni ein hunain, sef sefydlu trefniadau a fydd yn sicrhau bod y rhai sy'n defnyddio gwasanaethau gofal cymdeithasol yn cael eu diogelu gan y rheoliadau, bellach wedi ei gyflawni.

Mae'r ddelwedd sydd gan lawer o ASGC fel arolygiaeth ar gyfer cartrefi gofal yn bennaf bellach yn hen ffasiwn. Erbyn hyn mae'r

broader remit with a significant emphasis on work with children and young people. I have been particularly pleased to note the changes, referred to in the report as reform of regulation, which have commenced this year. These are significant changes to the way in which regulation will be delivered in Wales. They address the key aims of 'Making the Connections', which include: ensuring that service users and their experiences are at the centre of the regulatory process; ensuring that inspections are proportionate to need and are targeted at areas where there is the most need, with a lower intensity of inspection where services are performing well; and placing an emphasis on providers' own quality assurance schemes, which, together with close joint working with the inspectorate, seek to lessen any unnecessary administrative burdens on providers, and self-assessment will be a key part of that.

The report also provided information on the way in which CSIW has undertaken its role and how it has worked closely with other partners. While these partners have different contributions to make in terms of safeguarding people and improving the quality of services, I am pleased to see that CSIW recognises this and is making a reality of my expectation of good-quality collaborative working. This will enable any unnecessary burden of regulation on providers to be reduced wherever possible.

Therefore, I welcome the work that is being carried out on joint protocols, such as that between CSIW, the Care Council for Wales, Estyn and local health boards. The pilot schemes to test these new ways of working, for example, in children's homes, child minders' homes and care homes, are now being evaluated and will then become an operational part of the scheme across Wales from next April. Other services will also be subject to a new regulatory approach in line with CSIW's three-year strategic plan.

4.20 p.m.

I will now comment on the amendments. I support David Melding's amendment 1, which expresses regret that some children's

cyloch gwaith yn llawer ehangach a rhoddir cryn bwyslais ar waith gyda phlant a phobl ifanc. Yr oeddwn yn falch iawn o weld y newidiadau, y cyfeirir atynt yn yr adroddiad fel diwygio'r rheoleiddio, sydd wedi eu cyflwyno eleni. Mae'r rhain yn newidiadau arwyddocaol i'r ffordd y bydd rheoleiddio'n digwydd yng Nghymru. Maent yn rhoi sylw i nodau allweddol 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau', sy'n cynnwys: sicrhau bod defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a'u profiadau yn ganolog yn y broses reoleiddio; sicrhau bod arolygiadau yn gymesur â'r angen ac yn cael eu targedu tuag at feysydd lle y mae'r angen mwyaf, gydag arolygiad heb fod mor drwyadl lle y bo gwasanaethau'n perfformio'n dda; a rhoi pwyslais ar gynlluniau sicrhau ansawdd y darparwyr eu hunain, sydd, ynghyd â chydweithio agos gyda'r arolygiaeth, yn ceisio lleihau unrhyw faich gweinyddol diangen ar ddarparwyr, a bydd hunanasesu yn rhan allweddol o hynny.

Yr oedd yr adroddiad hefyd yn darparu gwybodaeth am y ffordd y mae ASGC wedi ymgymryd â'i rôl a sut y mae wedi gweithio mewn cysylltiad agos â phartneriaid eraill. Er bod gan y partneriaid hyn gyfraniadau gwahanol i'w gwneud o ran diogelu pobl a gwella ansawdd gwasanaethau, yr wyf yn falch o weld bod ASGC yn cydnabod hyn a'i bod yn gwireddu fy nisgwyliadau i, sef cydweithio'n dda. Bydd hyn yn help i leihau'r baich rheoleiddio diangen sydd ar ysgwyddau darparwyr lle bynnag y bo modd.

Felly, yr wyf yn croesawu'r gwaith sy'n cael ei wneud ar brotocolau ar y cyd, fel yr un rhwng ASGC, Cyngor Gofal Cymru, Estyn a byrddau iechyd lleol. Mae'r cynlluniau peilot er mwyn profi'r ffyrdd newydd hyn o weithio, er enghraifft, mewn cartrefi plant, cartrefi gwarchodwyr plant a chartrefi gofal, bellach yn cael eu gwerthuso a byddant yn dod yn rhan weithredol o'r cynllun ledled Cymru o fis Ebrill nesaf ymlaen. Bydd y dull newydd o reoleiddio'n berthnasol i wasanaethau eraill hefyd gan gyd-fynd â chynllun strategol tair blynedd ASGC.

Cyflwynaf sylwadau am y gwelliannau yn awr. Cefnogaf welliant 1 David Melding, sy'n gresynu bod rhai cartrefi plant yn dal i

homes are still failing to meet statutory requirements. While there are several examples of good-quality care in children's homes and evidence of significant progress in the quality of care that children receive, there are areas where further improvement is needed. Despite the improvements outlined in the report, there remain issues that require attention to promote children's welfare, including care planning, protection, behavioural management, statements of purpose, record keeping, staffing levels and training and support. The Assembly Government will continue to work with partners to ensure that statutory obligations are met and that these issues are addressed.

David Melding's amendment 2 on the alleged failure of the Assembly Government to adequately fund the residential and nursing home sector is inappropriate and unnecessary and, consequently, I cannot support it. Local funding issues are, in the first instance, a matter for local commissioners. The revenue support given to local authorities is unhypothecated, and decisions about the budget and spending are, therefore, for individual authorities to take. Care homes close for a variety of reasons, and it is wrong to suggest that it is all about funding levels. Nevertheless, additional recurrent funding for adult social services has already been provided in the form of £19.5 million to address key priorities in health and social care and a further £12 million in recognition of the particular pressures in the area of elderly social care, including increases in care home fees.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I accept your point that care homes close for a variety of reasons, but you must accept that care home owners are telling us that there is a shortfall in the fees that they are paid by local authorities as compared with the cost of caring for people in their homes. The shortfall is around £80 per bed, per week. Are you prepared to address that as Minister?

**Brian Gibbons:** It is not for me personally to address. This is why the Welsh Local Government Association has developed the toolkit that it is pioneering in Wrexham and

fethu â chyflawni ymrwymïadau statudol. Er bod sawl enghraifft o ofal da mewn cartrefi plant a thystiolaeth o welliant sylweddol yn ansawdd y gofal y mae plant yn ei dderbyn, mae angen rhagor o welliannau mewn rhai meysydd. Er gwaethaf y gwelliannau a amlinellir yn yr adroddiad, erys materion y mae angen rhoi sylw iddynt er mwyn hybu lles plant, gan gynnwys cynllunio gofal, amddiffyn, rheoli ymddygiad, datganiadau o ddiben, cadw cofnodion, lefelau staffio a hyfforddiant a chefnogaeth. Bydd Llywodraeth y Cynulliad yn parhau i weithio gyda phartneriaid er mwyn sicrhau bod y dyletswyddau statudol hyn yn cael eu cyflawni a bod sylw'n cael ei roi i'r materion hyn.

Mae gwelliant 2 David Melding ynghylch methiant honedig Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi cyllid digonol i'r sector cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio yn amhriodol a diangen ac, o ganlyniad, ni allaf ei gefnogi. Mater i'r comisiynwyr lleol, yn y lle cyntaf, yw problemau cyllido lleol. Nid yw'r cymorth refeniw a roddir i awdurdodau lleol wedi ei neilltuo ac, o ganlyniad, mae'r penderfyniadau ynglŷn â'r gyllideb a'r gwariant yn cael eu gwneud gan yr awdurdodau unigol. Mae cartrefi gofal yn cau am resymau amrywiol, ac mae'n anghywir awgrymu mai prinder arian yw'r unig reswm. Er hyn, mae arian rheolaidd ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol oedolion wedi ei ddarparu'n barod ar ffurf £19.5 miliwn i roi sylw i flaenoriaethau allweddol ym maes iechyd a gofal cymdeithasol a £12 miliwn arall i gydnabod y pwysau penodol ym maes gofal cymdeithasol yr henoed, gan gynnwys cynnydd yn ffioedd cartrefi gofal.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Derbyniaf eich pwynt bod cartrefi gofal yn cau am resymau amrywiol, ond rhaid ichi dderbyn bod perchenogion cartrefi gofal yn dweud wrthym nad yw'r ffioedd a delir iddynt gan awdurdodau lleol yn cyfateb i gost gofalu am bobl yn eu cartrefi. Mae'r diffyg tua £80 y gwely, bob wythnos. A ydych yn barod i roi sylw i hynny fel Gweinidog?

**Brian Gibbons:** Nid fy nghyfrifoldeb i'n bersonol yw rhoi sylw i hynny. Dyma pam mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru wedi datblygu'r pecyn cymorth a

on which we are receiving some preliminary reports. In the draft budget statement, you will see that, if the Assembly can approve it, there will be financial recognition of the important role that that toolkit plays. I am sure that you would welcome that, and, hopefully, you will be in a position to support the Assembly Government's draft budget to ensure that that happens.

In addition to the money that I have announced in relation to the toolkit, the draft budget for 2005 confirms the Assembly Government's intention to further increase resources by £35 million, which is already in the baseline, in addition to another £9.9 million. That increased funding for local authorities will support a range of adult social care costs and address service pressures. The Government has sought to support open and transparent negotiations in fee setting through its statutory commissioning guidance, which the WLGA uses, and through developing the work on the fees toolkit.

I support David Melding's amendment 3, which proposes to congratulate the CSIW on its work in protecting vulnerable adults and children. I add my congratulations to the CSIW on its good work in this area and on its contribution to driving up standards in service for many of our most vulnerable people. I am sure that Rob Pickford and his staff will be pleased to have the Assembly's support in their work.

Finally, amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies calls on the Government to address the alleged lack of care home provision for the elderly and mentally infirm and the deficiencies in mental health services for children and adolescents. There is certainly a shortage of provision for the elderly and mentally infirm in some parts of Wales. Again, local commissioners are expected to address that. We are taking action to help local commissioners improve their needs assessment and long-term planning arrangements. The Assembly Government has put in place a framework of regulation and guidance that assists local authorities in fulfilling their roles and responsibilities, and

gyflwynwyd yn Wrecsam ac yr ydym yn cael rhai adroddiadau rhagarweiniol amdano. Yn natganiad y gyllideb ddrafft, fe welwch, os gall y Cynulliad ei gymeradwyo, y bydd cydnabyddiaeth ariannol o'r rôl bwysig a chwaraeir gan y pecyn cymorth hwnnw. Yr wyf yn siŵr y byddech yn croesawu hynny, a gobeithio y byddwch yn gallu cefnogi cyllideb ddrafft Llywodraeth y Cynulliad er mwyn sicrhau bod hynny'n digwydd.

Yn ogystal â'r arian yr wyf wedi ei gyhoeddi mewn perthynas â'r pecyn cymorth, mae'r gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer 2005 yn cadarnhau bwriad Llywodraeth y Cynulliad i roi £35 miliwn yn rhagor o adnoddau, sydd eisoes yn y llinell sylfaen, yn ogystal â £9.9 miliwn arall. Bydd y cynnydd hwn yn yr arian ar gyfer awdurdodau lleol yn cynorthwyo amrediad o gostau gofal cymdeithasol oedolion ac yn rhoi sylw i bwysau ar wasanaethau. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi ceisio cefnogi trafodaethau agored a thryloyw wrth bennu ffioedd drwy ei chanllawiau comisiynu statudol, a ddefnyddir gan CLILC, a thrwy ddatblygu'r gwaith ar y pecyn cymorth ffioedd.

Yr wyf yn cefnogi gwelliant 3 David Melding, sy'n cynnig llongyfarch ASGC ar ei gwaith wrth amddiffyn oedolion a phlant sy'n agored i niwed. Hoffwn innau longyfarch ASGC ar y gwaith da y mae'n ei wneud yn y maes hwn a'r modd y mae wedi helpu i godi safonau gwasanaeth ar gyfer llawer o'n pobl hawsaf eu niweidio. Yr wyf yn sicr y bydd Rob Pickford a'i staff yn falch o glywed bod y Cynulliad yn cefnogi eu gwaith.

Yn olaf, mae gwelliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i roi sylw i'r honiad bod prinder cartrefi gofal ar gyfer yr henoed a phobl fregus eu meddwl, a phrinder gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc. Yn sicr, mae prinder darpariaeth ar gyfer yr henoed a phobl fregus eu meddwl mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru. Unwaith eto, disgwylir i gomisiynwyr lleol roi sylw i hyn. Yr ydym yn cymryd camau er mwyn helpu comisiynwyr lleol i wella eu hasesiadau o'r anghenion a'u trefniadau cynllunio hirdymor. Mae Llywodraeth y Cynulliad wedi sefydlu fframwaith rheoliadau a chanllawiau sy'n helpu awdurdodau lleol i gyflawni eu rolau



has provided significant additional funding for adult social services along the lines that I have outlined. However, amendment 4 is further flawed in that the provision of mental health services for children and adolescents do not fall within the scope of the Care Standards Act 2000 or the remit of the CSIW as a regulator, so, clearly, we cannot accept it.

In conclusion, the CSIW report is an important document in relation to the development of social care provision in Wales, and I look forward to other Members' comments on the document.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** Several Members wish to speak, so I would welcome short speeches where possible.

**Jonathan Morgan:** I propose the following amendments in the name of David Melding. Amendment 1: add a new point at the end of the motion:

*regrets that some children's homes are still failing to meet statutory obligations.*

I propose amendment 2. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*condemns the Welsh Assembly Government's failure to adequately fund the residential and nursing home sectors, which has led to the closures of many homes.*

I propose amendment 3. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*congratulates the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales on its work in protecting vulnerable adults and children.*

I welcome the report and the work of the CSIW. I would like to pay tribute to its professionalism, attention to detail and commitment to raising standards. I feel that these reports add a considerable amount of weight not only to the work of the Assembly Government, but to the scrutiny that the Assembly can undertake of the way in which services are provided to some of the most vulnerable groups of adults and children in

a'u cyfrifoldebau, ac mae wedi darparu swm sylweddol o arian ychwanegol ar gyfer gwasanaethau cymdeithasol i oedolion i'r perwyl a amlinellwyd gennyf. Fodd bynnag, mae gwendidau eraill yng ngwelliant 4 gan nad yw darparu gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl i blant a phobl ifanc o fewn terfynau Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 na chylch gwaith ASGC fel corff rheoleiddio, felly, yn amlwg, ni allwn ei dderbyn.

I gloi, mae adroddiad ASGC yn ddogfen bwysig o safbwynt datblygu'r ddarpariaeth gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed sylwadau'r Aelodau eraill ar y ddogfen.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Mae nifer o'r Aelodau'n awyddus i siarad, felly byddwn yn falch pe byddech yn gryno pan fo hynny'n bosibl.

**Jonathan Morgan:** Cynigiau y gwelliannau canlynol yn enw David Melding. Gwelliant 1: ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn gresynu bod rhai cartrefi plant yn dal i fethu â chyflawni ymrwymadau statudol.*

Cynigiau welliant 2. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn condemnio methiant Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru i roi cyllid digonol i'r sectorau cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio, sydd wedi arwain at gau nifer o gartrefi.*

Cynigiau welliant 3. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

*yn llongyfarch Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru ar ei gwaith o amddiffyn oedolion a phlant sy'n agored i niwed.*

Yr wyf yn croesawu'r adroddiad a gwaith ASGC. Hoffwn dalu teyrnged i'w phroffesiynoldeb, ei sylw i fanylion a'i hymrwymiad i godi safonau. Teimlaf fod yr adroddiadau hyn yn cyfrannu llawer iawn, nid yn unig at waith Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, ond hefyd o ran y modd y mae'n galluogi'r Cynulliad i graffu ar y ffordd y darperir gwasanaethau i rai o'r grwpiau o oedolion a phlant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed

society.

Its job as an organisation is not an easy one; we know that there have been some rapid changes in the mixture of provision in Wales in recent years. Between 2003 and 2004, the number of registered adult care home places fell by some 1,124. Between 2004 and 2005, there was a further loss of 642 adult care home places. According to the CSIW report, it appears that the reduction in the number of care homes—bearing in mind that we seem to have lost 144 registered adult care homes in the last year—has slowed down significantly. However, as was the case last year, the service remains fluid. For people involved in service provision, whether they run homes or are trained in the social care professions, this fluidity points to a degree of uncertainty, which I suspect is not particularly helpful for those trying to plan provision. Thank goodness it has slowed down, as I do not think that we could afford to lose many more places or many more homes. If this worrying reduction in capacity is not slowed down or halted, things do not bode well for the future.

In children's services, there are examples of good practice and improvements in care. However, a significant minority of homes do not meet the regulations. Some 14 per cent of homes had child protection policies that did not meet regulatory requirements. More worryingly, 29 per cent of homes had not undertaken reviews of the quality of care as required by the regulations. I am delighted that the Minister has accepted the amendment that refers to this, but it merely outlines what is in the report.

In terms of adult services, I welcome the improvements on last year's areas of concern, particularly with regard to staffing. However, the training of staff remains an issue for the sector. It is of particular concern that, in terms of adult protection, there has been an increase in the number of investigations. There were 161 investigations relating to

yn ein cymdeithas.

Nid yw ei thasg fel sefydliad yn un hawdd; gwyddom fod y cyfuniad o ddarpariaethau sydd ar gael yng Nghymru wedi newid yn sydyn iawn yn ystod y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Rhwng 2003 a 2004, gwelwyd gostyngiad o 1,124 yn nifer y lleoedd mewn cartrefi gofal cofrestredig ar gyfer oedolion. Rhwng 2004 a 2005, collwyd 642 yn rhagor o leoedd mewn cartrefi gofal ar gyfer oedolion. Ymddengys, yn ôl adroddiad ASGC, bod y gostyngiad yn nifer y cartrefi gofal—a ninnau, mae'n ymddangos, wedi colli 144 o gartrefi gofal cofrestredig ar gyfer oedolion y llynedd—wedi arafu cryn dipyn. Fodd bynnag, fel y llynedd, mae'r gwasanaeth yn dal i fod yn ansefydlog. I'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â darparu gwasanaeth, pa un a ydynt yn rhedeg cartrefi neu'n bobl sydd wedi eu hyfforddi yn y proffesiynau gofal cymdeithasol, mae'r ansefydlogrwydd hwn yn achosi rhywfaint o ansicrwydd, a byddwn yn tybio nad yw hynny'n helpu llawer ar y rhai sy'n ceisio cynllunio'r ddarpariaeth. Diolch byth ei fod wedi arafu, oherwydd nid wyf yn credu y gallem fforddio colli llawer mwy o leoedd na llawer mwy o gartrefi. Oni ellir arafu neu atal y gostyngiad hwn yn nifer y lleoedd, nid yw pethau'n argoeli'n dda ar gyfer y dyfodol.

O ran gwasanaethau plant, ceir enghreifftiau o arferion da a gwelliannau mewn gofal. Fodd bynnag, mae lleiafrif arwyddocaol o gartrefi nad ydynt yn cydymffurfio â'r rheoliadau. Yr oedd gan tua 14 y cant o'r cartrefi bolisiau amddiffyn plant nad oeddent yn cydymffurfio â'r gofynion rheoleiddio. Rhywbeth sy'n peri mwy o bryder yw nad oedd 29 y cant o'r cartrefi wedi adolygu ansawdd y gofal fel sy'n ofynnol dan y rheoliadau. Yr wyf yn falch bod y Gweinidog wedi derbyn y gwelliant sy'n cyfeirio at hyn, ond nid yw'n gwneud fawr mwy nag amlinellu'r hyn sydd yn yr adroddiad.

O ran y gwasanaethau i oedolion, croesawaf y gwelliannau i'r meysydd a oedd yn achosi pryder y llynedd, yn enwedig o ran staffio. Fodd bynnag, mae hyfforddi staff yn parhau'n broblem i'r sector. Un mater sy'n peri cryn bryder, o ran amddiffyn oedolion, yw'r cynnydd yn nifer yr ymchwiliadau. Cynhaliwyd 161 o ymchwiliadau yn

physical abuse, and 154 investigations relating to neglect. When you consider the overall number of people in adult care homes, this is obviously a small number. However, it remains the case that too many people face too many problems. While the overall number of people working in this area of social care do so with care and with the utmost of respect, there are clearly problems that still need to be addressed. Whatever the difficulties faced by staff working in these circumstances, the figures are still unacceptable. I believe that they warrant further consideration by the Assembly Government of how we can ensure that staff are aware of their obligations, to ensure that we have the right sort of people entering the profession and that they are properly rewarded for the difficult job that they do.

I will comment briefly on the welcome shift in emphasis on the provision of domiciliary care. We know that there has been a shift towards provision by voluntary and private organisations and that there has been an expansion of domiciliary care provision. We must ensure that there is an appropriate mix between what can be provided to an elderly person in his or her own home and the level of provision needed for someone who needs to go into a residential care home. There are some people who cannot be cared for in their own homes simply because of the pressure that it puts on family members, or because they have particular care needs. In looking at those needs on a case-by-case basis, it is important to ensure that we have an appropriate mix of provision so that those who can be cared for within their own home environment can have that provision, and those who need more specialist care can have it when they need it. There is a problem with the mix at present; we are not getting it right. I welcome the limited improvements, but we have a long way to go.

4.30 p.m.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** Cynigiaf welliant 4 yn enw Jocelyn Davies. Ychwanegu pwynt newydd ar ddiwedd y cynnig:

ymwneud â cham-drin yn gorfforol, a 154 o ymchwiliadau yn ymwneud ag esgeulustod. O ystyried yr holl bobl sydd mewn cartrefi gofal ar gyfer oedolion, mae'n amlwg bod y ffigurau hyn yn isel iawn. Fodd bynnag, y ffaith amdani yw bod gormod o bobl yn wynebu gormod o broblemau. Er bod y rhan fwyaf o'r bobl sy'n gweithio yn y maes gofal cymdeithasol hwn yn gwneud hynny gyda gofal, a chyda'r parch mwyaf, mae'n amlwg bod problemau i'w datrys o hyd. Beth bynnag yw'r anawsterau a wynebir gan y staff sy'n gweithio yn yr amgylchiadau hyn, mae'r ffigurau'n dal yn annerbyniol. Credaf eu bod yn teilyngu ystyriaeth bellach gan Lywodraeth y Cynulliad o'r modd y gallwn sicrhau bod y staff yn ymwybodol o'u cyfrifoldebau, er mwyn sicrhau bod y math iawn o bobl yn ymuno â'r proffesiwn a'u bod yn cael eu gwobrwyo'n briodol am y gwaith anodd y maent yn ei wneud.

Soniaf yn fyr am y newid pwyslais sydd i'w groesawu o ran darparu gofal yn y cartref. Gwyddom fod symudiad wedi bod tuag at ddarpariaeth gan sefydliadau gwirfoddol a phreifat a bod y ddarpariaeth gofal yn y cartref wedi ei hehangu. Rhaid inni sicrhau cyfuniad priodol o ran yr hyn y gellir ei ddarparu i rywun sy'n oeddrannus yn ei gartref ei hun a'r ddarpariaeth sydd ei hangen ar gyfer rhywun y mae angen iddo fynd i gartref gofal preswyl. Mae rhai pobl na ellir gofalu amdanynt yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, yn syml iawn oherwydd y pwysau y mae hynny'n ei roi ar aelodau o'r teulu, neu oherwydd bod ganddynt anghenion gofal penodol. Wrth edrych ar yr anghenion hyn fesul achos, mae'n bwysig sicrhau bod gennym ddarpariaeth sydd â chymysgedd addas fel bod modd darparu ar gyfer y rhai y gellir gofalu amdanynt yn eu cartrefi eu hunain, ac fel y gellir cynnig gofal mwy arbenigol i'r rhai y mae arnynt ei angen yn ôl y gofyn. Mae rhywbeth o'i le ar y cymysgedd ar hyn o bryd; nid yw'n iawn gennym. Croesawaf yr ychydig welliannau a fu, ond mae gennym lawer o waith i'w wneud.

**Rhodri Glyn Thomas:** I propose amendment 4 in the name of Jocelyn Davies. Add a new point at the end of the motion:

*yn galw ar y Llywodraeth i fynd i'r afael â'r prinder darpariaeth cartrefi gofal ar gyfer yr henoed a phobl eiddil eu meddwl, a'r diffygion yn y gwasanaethau iechyd meddwl ar gyfer plant a'r glasoed.*

*calls on the Government to address the lack of care home provision for the elderly and mentally infirm, and the deficiencies in mental health services for children and adolescents.*

Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau yn enw David Melding. Atefais fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd gan yr arolygiaeth. Credais fod pawb yn cydnabod fod yr adroddiad hwn yn bwysig, cynhwysfawr a darllenadwy. Mae'n hawdd darllen drwy'r dystiolaeth yn yr adroddiad a chael darlun clir o'r hyn sy'n digwydd. Mae'n bwysig nodi bod llawer o bethau da yn digwydd. Byddwn yn barod i gydnabod hefyd fod pethau da yn digwydd o ran Llywodraeth Cymru a rhai o'r pethau y soniodd y Gweinidog amdanynt wrth gyflwyno'r adroddiad.

We will support the amendments in the name of David Melding. I also express my appreciation of the inspectorate's work. I think that we all recognise that this is an important, comprehensive and readable report. It is easy to read through the evidence in the report and get a clear picture of what is happening. It is also important to note that many good things are happening. We would also be willing to recognise that good things are happening with regard to the Government of Wales and some of the matters to which the Minister referred in presenting this report to us.

Cyfeiria ein gwelliant yn benodol at y lleihad yn nifer y cartrefi gofal a gwelyau. Pan edrychwn ar y sefyllfa yn 1999—pan ddaeth Llywodraeth Lafur i fodolaeth yn y Cynulliad—ac ar y sefyllfa yn 2005, gwelwn fod bron i 2,000 o welyau wedi'u colli. Yr oedd 29,041 o welyau yn 1999. Erbyn 2005, gostyngwyd y nifer i 27,103. Mae hynny bron 2,000 o welyau. Gobeithiaf nad oes neb am ddadlau bod y galw neu'r angen yn llai. Nid yw'r lleihad yn nifer y gwelyau i'w briodoli i hynny, ond i'r ffaith bod cartrefi'n cau. Fel y dywedais, derbynias yr hyn a ddywed y Gweinidog, eu bod yn cau am nifer o resymau, ond mae hyn yn fater o bwys y mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth fynd i'r afael ag ef. Mae ffioedd yn rhan o'r broblem. Mae problem hefyd ynglŷn â'r cyflogau a delir i staff, sydd yn effeithio ar safon y gofal. Mae'n rhaid meddwl hefyd am oblygiadau hyn i rai o'r henoed yn arbennig. Mae'n amlwg bod y lleihad yn nifer y gwelyau sydd ar gael ar gyfer yr henoed yn fater o bwys mawr. Er bod yr arolygiaeth yn datgan yn ei hadroddiad mai 2 y cant yw'r lleihad yn gyffredinol, yr oedd arolwg y llynedd, a gomisiynwyd gan y Llywodraeth, yr wyf yn credu, yn dangos mai 6 y cant o leihad a gafwyd o ran gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal i'r henoed. Mae'r gostyngiad felly yn llawer mwy o ran gwelyau ar gyfer yr henoed, ac mae goblygiadau i hynny. Mae pobl hŷn yn ein cymdeithas yn gorfod symud o gartrefi sy'n cau. Maent yn aml yn gweld y cartrefi

Our amendment refers specifically to the decline in the number of care homes and beds. When we look at the situation in 1999—when the Labour Government came to power in the Assembly—and compare it to that in 2005, we see that nearly 2,000 beds have been lost. There were 29,041 beds in 1999. By 2005, the number dropped to 27,103. That is almost 2,000 beds. I hope that no-one would argue that the demand or need has reduced. The reduction in the number of beds cannot be attributed to that, but to the fact that care homes are closing. As I said, I accept what the Minister has said, that they close for a number of reasons, but this is an important issue that the Government must address. Fees are part of the problem. There is also a problem in terms of the wages paid to staff, which impacts on the standard of care. We must also bear in mind the implications of this for some elderly people in particular. It is clear that the reduction in the number of beds available for the elderly is a very important issue. Although the inspectorate stated in its report that the reduction in general is 2 per cent, a review last year, commissioned by the Government, I believe, showed that the reduction in beds in care homes for the elderly was 6 per cent. Therefore, the reduction is much greater in terms of beds for the elderly, and there are implications to that. Elderly people in our society have to move from care homes that are closing. They often regard those care

gofal hynny fel eu cartrefi hwy, gyda rhai ohonynt wedi bod yno am flynyddoedd lawer. Hefyd, cânt eu symud ymhellach oddi wrth eu teuluoedd. Mae'n rhaid inni fynd i'r afael â hynny.

I will briefly—taking note of your appeal for short speeches, Deputy Presiding Officer—look at the situation in terms of children's homes. This particular report looks at 30 per cent of children's homes across Wales and notes a number of issues, as follows:

'20% of the sample showed inadequacies in placement planning for children';

'32% showed requirements against the promotion, by the home, of educational attainment...14% showed inadequate arrangements for ensuring that health needs were met, including access to appropriate support and advice; 10% showed insufficient planning arrangements for contact with family and friends'

and

'47 per cent of children's plans were felt to be unsatisfactory.'

Therefore, there is a whole range of issues that, as I hope you will agree, need to be addressed.

Finally, to turn to the issue of children and young people with mental health needs, I refer you to the two last annual reports of the Children's Commissioner for Wales, in which he makes clear that he is unhappy with the situation. He says:

'I am aware that in England £80 million was allocated to CAHMS with a further £140 million promised over the next 3 years. It is about time the WAG either directly funded its much applauded strategy or gave up the pretence that it was committed to it'.

I believe that we all respect the children's commissioner and the work that he carries out. I ask you, Minister, to take note of his views on this serious matter.

homes as their own homes, with some of them having been there for many years. Also, they are moved further away from their families. We must address this issue.

Edrychaf yn fyr—gan nodi'ch apêl am areithiau byr, Ddirprwy Lywydd—ar y sefyllfa o ran cartrefi plant. Mae'r adroddiad hwn yn edrych ar 30 y cant o'r cartrefi plant ledled Cymru ac yn nodi nifer o faterion, fel a ganlyn:

'Dangosodd 20% o'r sampl ddiffygion mewn cynllunio lleoliadau i blant';

'dangosodd 32% ofynion yn erbyn hyrwyddo cyrhaeddiad addysgol gan y cartref...dangosodd 14% drefniadau annigonol ar gyfer sicrhau y bodlonir anghenion iechyd, gan gynnwys mynediad at gymorth a chyngor priodol; dangosodd 10% gynllunio a threfniadau annigonol ar gyfer cysylltiadau â theulu a ffrindiau'

a theimlid

'bod mwy na 47% o gynlluniau plant yn anfodddhaol'.

Felly, mae cryn amrywiaeth o faterion y mae angen delio â hwy, fel y byddwch yn cytuno, yr wyf yn gobeithio.

Yn olaf, gan droi at fater plant a phobl ifanc sydd ag anghenion o ran iechyd meddwl, fe'ch cyfeirïaf at ddau adroddiad blynyddol diwethaf Comisiynydd Plant Cymru, lle y mae'n ei gwneud yn glir ei fod yn anfodlon ar y sefyllfa. Dywed:

'Rwy'n ymwybodol fod £80 miliwn wedi'i ddyrannu i CAMHS yn Lloegr, ynghyd â £140 miliwn arall wedi'i addo dros y 3 mlynedd nesaf. Mae'n bryd i LICC naill ai ariannu'i strategaeth sydd wedi derbyn cymaint o ganmoliaeth yn uniongyrchol neu roi'r gorau i honni ei fod wedi ymrwymo iddi.'

Credaf ein bod oll yn parchu'r comisiynydd plant a'r gwaith y mae'n ei wneud. Gofynnaf i chi, Weinidog, gymryd sylw o'i farn am y mater difrifol hwn.

**Sandy Mewies:** Like everyone else here, I welcome the development of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales, which has given us the opportunity to monitor and regulate services for vulnerable people—be they young or old, be they in residential care or at home—in a better way. I have had experience, as have perhaps many people here, of the work that people do in care homes, and we owe them a great debt. It is not the most salubrious work, and the people whom I have met work with great dedication. I know that that is not always the case, but we should recognise that.

I congratulate the CSIW on the progress it has made so far, particularly on the recognition that service users must be given a strong voice in the regulation procedure. It is doing this by engaging with groups such as old people's fora and, I hope, by looking at young people's groups in children's homes in residential care. The important thing then is not just meeting these people, but listening to what they say, and coming forward with recommendations. It is then our job to listen to those recommendations and do something about them. The point has already been well made that there are defects in some areas. I hope that the Minister will recognise those defects, and ensure that those gaps are filled in future years. However, you can have as many complaints policies or procedures as you like, but unless they are carried out and put into practice, they are no good at all. It is not always about writing down policies on paper, it is about carrying them out.

Engagement with groups such as the older people's fora is important, as is listening to carers, and allowing them not to be afraid of voicing their views, which can be different from the views of those whom they care for. Some do it well. Flintshire County Council, for example, has won the social accolade 2005 for carers' participation. I have seen at first hand how it works with all agencies, and with carers, in enabling carers to do their job properly and giving them the support that they need.

We are talking about listening to people in various contexts, whether residential or otherwise. However, I am concerned, as I

**Sandy Mewies:** Fel pawb arall sydd yma, croesawaf y ffaith bod Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru wedi'i datblygu, gan fod hynny wedi rhoi cyfle inni fonitro a rheoleiddio'n well y gwasanaethau ar gyfer pobl sydd yn agored i niwed—boed hwy'n ifanc neu'n hen, boed hwy mewn gofal preswyl neu gartref. Mae gennyf brofiad, fel llawer sydd yma efallai, o waith y rhai mewn cartrefi gofal, ac yr ydym yn ddyledus iawn iddynt. Nid yw'n waith sydd gyda'r mwyaf iachusol, ac mae'r rhai y cyfarfûm â hwy'n ymroddedig iawn iddo. Gwn nad yw hynny'n wir bob tro, ond dylem gydnabod hynny.

Llongyfarchaf ASGC ar y cynnydd a wnaeth hyd yma, yn enwedig am gydnabod bod rhaid i ddefnyddwyr gwasanaethau gael dweud eu barn yn glir yn y weithdrefn reoleiddio. Gwnaiff hynny drwy ymwneud â grwpiau fel fforymau hen bobl ac, yr wyf yn gobeithio, drwy ystyried grwpiau pobl ifanc mewn cartrefi plant ym maes gofal preswyl. Nid cwrdd â'r bobl hyn yn unig sydd yn bwysig, felly, ond gwrando ar eu geiriau, a chyflwyno argymhellion. Ein gwaith ni wedyn yw gwrando ar yr argymhellion hynny a gwneud rhywbeth yn eu cylch. Nodwyd yn huawdl eisoes fod diffygion mewn rhai meysydd. Gobeithiaf y bydd y Gweinidog yn cydnabod y diffygion hynny, ac yn sicrhau y caiff y bylchau hynny eu cau yn y dyfodol. Er hynny, gellir cael faint a fynner o bolisiau neu weithdrefnau cwynion, ond os na roddir hwy ar waith, maent yn ddiwerth. Nid ysgrifennu polisiau ar bapur sydd yn bwysig bob amser, ond eu rhoi ar waith.

Mae'r ymwneud â grwpiau fel fforymau pobl hyn yn bwysig, fel y mae'r camau a gymerir i wrando ar ofalwyr, a pheri na fyddant yn ofni datgan eu barn, a all fod yn wahanol i farn y rhai y maent yn gofalu amdanynt. Mae rhai'n gwneud hynny'n dda. Mae Cyngor Sir y Fflint, er enghraifft, wedi ennill y wobwr gymdeithasol yn 2005 am gyfranogiad gan ofalwyr. Yr wyf wedi gweld drosof fy hun y modd y mae'n gweithio gyda'r holl asiantaethau, a chyda gofalwyr, i alluogi gofalwyr i wneud eu gwaith yn iawn ac i roi iddynt y cymorth y mae arnynt ei angen.

Yr ydym yn sôn am wrando ar bobl mewn gwahanol gyd-destunau, rhai preswyl ac eraill. Fodd bynnag, yr wyf yn pryderu, fel y

have said before, about people with dementia, particularly those who do not have any support at all. It is difficult for anyone to engage with some people, particularly those in the later stages of dementia. I would like to see, perhaps in the next report, good practice examples in that regard—there are good practice examples here, but they are not examples of how people are doing well in engaging with such groups of people, and taking their views forward. It is important, and it needs a lot of support.

Like everyone else, I will keep my comments brief. I am glad that the CSIW has identified working with people and listening to them, and giving people a stronger voice in developing future regulatory procedures. I hope that the Welsh Assembly Government will do everything that it can to support those aims.

**David Melding:** I will focus on two issues briefly. However, before I do that it is right that we commend CSIW on its work, and this excellent report, which contains a comprehensive review of the sector, and manages information skilfully. It has enabled us to do a good job of scrutiny in the committee, and now to engage in this important debate.

The first area that I want to look at is planning for quality care, particularly in children's services, and the whole issue of educational attainment. I made the point earlier today, in questions to the First Minister, that only 6 per cent of looked-after children achieve five good GCSEs, compared to about 50 per cent of the population as a whole. Insofar as we have figures, only about 3 per cent of care leavers at the age of 19 are in higher education. Again, that falls way short of the figure for the population as a whole. Yet, we read on page 21 of the report that 68 per cent of care settings meet the current requirements in terms of promoting educational attainment, which means that children have a place where homework can be done, and that school attendance and the like are being encouraged, but it still highlights graphically the challenge that we face.

dywedais o'r blaen, ynghylch pobl sydd â demensia, yn enwedig y rhai nad ydynt yn cael dim cymorth o gwbl. Mae'n anodd i neb ymwneud â rhai pobl, yn enwedig y rhai sydd wedi dioddef gan ddemensia ers amser maith. Carwn weld enghreifftiau o arferion da yn hynny o beth, yn yr adroddiad nesaf efallai—mae enghreifftiau o arferion da yma, ond nid ydynt yn enghreifftiau o'r modd y mae pobl yn llwyddo i ymwneud â grwpiau o bobl o'r fath, ac yn ystyried eu barn. Mae hynny'n bwysig, ac mae'n galw am lawer o gymorth.

Fel pawb arall, siaradaf yn fyr. Yr wyf yn falch bod ASGC wedi sôn am weithio gyda phobl a gwranddo arnynt, a rhoi mwy o lais iddynt wrth ddatblygu gweithdrefnau rheoleiddiol yn y dyfodol. Gobeithiaf y gwnaiff Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru bopeth yn ei gallu i hyrwyddo'r nodau hynny.

**David Melding:** Canolbwyntiaf ar ddau fater yn fyr. Fodd bynnag, cyn imi wneud hynny, mae'n briodol inni ganmol ASGC ar ei gwaith, ac ar yr adroddiad rhagorol hwn, sydd yn cynnwys adolygiad cynhwysfawr o'r sector, ac yn trin gwybodaeth yn fedrus. Mae wedi ein galluogi i wneud gwaith da o ran craffu yn y pwyllgor, ac i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl bwysig hon yn awr.

Y maes cyntaf y dymunaf ei ystyried yw cynllunio ar gyfer gofal o safon dda, yn enwedig mewn gwasanaethau plant, a holl fater cyrhaeddiad addysgol. Gwneuthum y pwynt hwn yn gynharach heddiw, mewn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog, sef mai dim ond 6 y cant o'r plant sy'n derbyn gofal sydd yn ennill pum TGAU da, o'i gymharu â thua 50 y cant o'r boblogaeth gyfan. Yn ôl hynny o ffigurau sydd gennym, dim ond tua 3 y cant o'r rhai sydd yn ymadael â gofal yn 19 oed sydd mewn addysg uwch. Unwaith eto, mae hynny ymhell iawn o'r ffigur ar gyfer y boblogaeth gyfan. Ac eto, gwelwn wrth ddarllen tudalen 21 o'r adroddiad fod 68 y cant o'r manau sydd yn cynnig gofal yn ateb y gofynion presennol o ran hybu cyrhaeddiad addysgol, sydd yn golygu bod gan blant rywle i wneud gwaith cartref, a bod presenoldeb yn yr ysgol a phethau o'r fath yn cael eu hyrwyddo, ond mae'n tynnu sylw'n effeithiol at yr her a wynebwn, er hynny.

4.40 p.m.

In a general inspection, we regard the physical requirements and the encouragement given to these children to be adequate, but the outcomes are still very poor. One of the things that we must start to look at is when care settings change. Many children in care will have more than two placements in any one year, so it can be quite a disruptive process. We must at least try to ensure that the child goes to the same school, because, at present, care planning does not necessarily take that factor into account, and children can be moved from one area within an authority and their school placements can be disrupted. We need to be much better in managing the educational side of a child's care.

The second issue relates to the physical standards that are now expected from care homes, and generally, certainly with new build, there has been a flexible approach, which is appropriate. We have allowed practices such as the use of double rooms to continue in older homes, while trying to phase it out in the new build, which is appropriate. However, we must be careful with some of the standards that we are now seeing through other areas of regulation, such as the fire standard that means that a room must now be protected for an hour, instead of half an hour, as it is at the moment. That will have quite an impact on building requirements and on the way in which staff must manage the situation. That may be the gold standard that we set, but it will have an effect on fees unless homes become unviable, and we certainly would not want to see that. If we set these high standards, we must ensure that the funding is available to implement means of meeting them.

With those two points, I will conclude. I hope that the Minister will have a chance to respond to those specific issues. I will end as I started by commending the work of the care standards inspectorate and thanking it for this report.

**Karen Sinclair:** I also welcome this report from the chief executive of the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales and his team of inspectors. As mentioned in the

Mewn archwiliad cyffredinol, barnwn fod y gofynion ffisegol a'r anogaeth a gynigir i'r plant hyn yn ddigonol, ond mae'r canlyniadau'n wael iawn, er hynny. Un o'r pethau y mae'n rhaid inni ddechrau eu hystyried yw symud o'r naill fan gofal i'r llall. Bydd llawer o blant sydd mewn gofal yn cael mwy na dau leoliad mewn unrhyw flwyddyn, felly gall fod yn broses sy'n amharu tipyn arnynt. Rhaid inni o leiaf geisio sicrhau bod y plentyn yn mynd i'r un ysgol, oherwydd, ar hyn o bryd, nid ystyrir y ffactor hwnnw o reidrwydd wrth gynllunio gofal, a gellir symud plant o un ardal mewn awdurdod ac amharu ar eu lleoliad mewn ysgol. Rhaid inni reoli'r agwedd addysgol ar ofal y plentyn yn llawer gwell.

Mae'r ail fater yn ymwneud â'r safonau ffisegol a ddisgwylir bellach mewn cartrefi gofal, ac yn gyffredinol, ac yn sicr o ran y rhai a adeiledir o'r newydd, cafwyd ymagwedd hyblyg, sydd yn briodol. Yr ydym wedi gadael i arferion megis defnyddio ystafelloedd dwbl barhau mewn cartrefi hŷn, gan geisio dod ag ef i ben yn raddol yn y rhai sy'n cael eu codi o'r newydd, sydd yn briodol. Serch hynny, rhaid inni fod yn ofalus ynghylch rhai o'r safonau a welwn yn awr mewn meysydd rheoleiddio eraill, fel y safon tân sydd yn golygu bod rhaid diogelu ystafell am awr o hyn ymlaen, yn lle hanner awr fel y mae ar hyn o bryd. Caiff hynny gryn effaith ar ofynion adeiladu ac ar y modd y mae'n rhaid i'r staff ddelio â'r sefyllfa. Gallwn osod safon uchel o'r fath, ond caiff effaith ar ffioedd oni bai fod y cartrefi'n mynd yn anhyfyw, ac ni charem weld hynny, yn sicr. Os gosodwn safonau uchel o'r fath, rhaid inni sicrhau bod arian ar gael i ddarparu modd i'w cyrraedd.

Gyda'r ddau bwynt hynny, terfynaf. Gobeithiaf y caiff y Gweinidog gyfle i ymateb i'r materion penodol hynny. Gorffennaf fel y dechreuais drwy ganmol gwaith yr arolygiaeth safonau gofal a diolch iddi am yr adroddiad hwn.

**Karen Sinclair:** Yr wyf finnau'n croesawu'r adroddiad hwn gan brif weithredwr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru a'i dim o arolygwyr. Fel y nodir yn y rhagair i'r



foreword to the annual report, the services looked at affect thousands of people in Wales and some of the most vulnerable in our society. The report indicates some first-rate work being done in our local communities by 70,000 people in the social care sector. Staffed by conscientious, committed and talented individuals, this report tells the story of a care sector that is, on the whole, improving. However, it would be remiss of us not to acknowledge and pick out those parts of the report that highlight the gaps that still exist within the system.

One such issue raised in the report is in relation to children's homes and services for looked-after children in general—and Brian knows quite well that I am passionate about that. The care standards inspectorate's report identifies two particular areas of concern in relation to children's homes. One is with regard to the running of the service, with the support structures, training and levels of staff who work in homes being of particular concern. However, the second area of concern, and the one upon which I will concentrate today, is the issue of the promotion of the welfare of looked-after children.

As highlighted in the report, particular disparity still exists with regard to ensuring basic standards of educational attainment for looked-after children. As the Assembly has seen before, the figures on educational attainment are stark and quite shocking, and have been touched upon by a number of speakers in this debate. Between 62 per cent and 64 per cent of all children looked after by local authorities have some degree of difficulty with at least writing, reading or mathematics. When compared with other children of a similar age, 68 per cent of looked-after children were at least one year behind in intellectual development, 47 per cent were at least two years behind, and 21.3 per cent were three or more years behind.

Similar concerns exist as to the mental welfare of some of our most vulnerable children, with five to 10-year-olds in care

adroddiad blynyddol, mae'r gwasanaethau dan sylw'n effeithio ar filoedd o bobl yng Nghymru ac ar rai o'r bobl sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas. Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod gwaith rhagorol yn cael ei wneud yn ein cymunedau gan 70,000 o bobl yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol. Ac yntau'n cael ei staffio gan unigolion cydwybodol, ymroddedig a thalentog, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn rhoi hanes sector gofal sydd, at ei gilydd, yn gwella. Er hynny, byddem ar fai pe na fyddem yn cydnabod ac yn cyfeirio at y rhannau hynny o'r adroddiad sydd yn tynnu sylw at y bylchau sy'n dal i fod yn y system.

Mae un mater o'r fath a godir yn yr adroddiad yn ymwneud â chartrefi plant a gwasanaethau i blant sy'n derbyn gofal yn gyffredinol—a gŵyr Brian o'r gorau fy mod yn teimlo'n gryf ynghylch hynny. Mae adroddiad yr arolygiaeth safonau gofal yn nodi dau faes penodol sydd yn peri pryder mewn cysylltiad â chartrefi plant. Mae un ohonynt yn ymwneud â'r dull o redeg y gwasanaeth, gan fod lefelau'r staff sydd yn gweithio mewn mewn cartrefi, ynghyd â'r trefniadau cymorth a'r hyfforddiant ar eu cyfer, yn peri pryder mawr. Fodd bynnag, yr ail faes sydd yn peri pryder, a'r un y canolbwyntiaf arno heddiw, yw mater hybu lles plant sy'n derbyn gofal.

Fel y pwysleisir yn yr adroddiad, ceir cryn anghyfartaledd o hyd o ran sicrhau safonau sylfaenol o gyrhaeddiad addysgol ymysg plant sy'n derbyn gofal. Fel y mae'r Cynulliad wedi gweld o'r blaen, mae'r ffigurau ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol yn ddigalon ac yn eithaf brawychus, ac mae nifer o siaradwyr wedi cyfeirio atynt yn y ddadl hon. O'r holl blant sy'n derbyn gofal gan awdurdodau lleol, mae rhwng 62 y cant a 64 y cant ohonynt yn cael rhyw fath o anhawster gyda'f ysgrifennu, darllen neu fathemateg o leiaf. O'u cymharu â phlant eraill o oedran tebyg, yr oedd 68 y cant o blant sy'n derbyn gofal o leiaf flwyddyn ar ei hôl hi o ran datblygiad deallusol, yr oedd 47 y cant o leiaf ddwy flynedd ar ei hôl hi, ac yr oedd 21.3 y cant dair blynedd neu fwy ar ei hôl hi.

Ceir pryderon tebyg ynglŷn â lles meddyliol rhai o'n plant mwyaf bregus, ac mae plant rhwng pum mlwydd a dengmlwydd oed sydd

being eight times more likely to have a mental disorder than those who are not in care. Unfortunately, this report again reaffirms what we already know about the system for looked-after children in Wales: sadly, they are left trailing behind their peers by a system that still needs further reform.

However, we must not throw out the baby with the bath water. Despite their many flaws, children's homes should remain the cornerstone of the way that we look after children in Wales. They provide structures of guardianship that other forms of care cannot fulfil and we must protect that.

We have been told many times that the system of care that we provide for looked-after children in Wales still does not meet the high standards that we set for our children in other sectors of society. We have to work far harder to give our looked-after children the access to life chances that they deserve. I therefore strongly urge the Minister to make looked-after children a key priority for the Assembly Government in the next few years.

**Jenny Randerson:** I also want to thank the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales for the vital job that it does. It is a complex job, because of the difficulties of inspecting such a diverse sector.

On children, I want to start by raising my own concerns, as well as repeating those concerns raised by others, at some of the gaps that appear to be in what one could, for shorthand, term as the 'bureaucracy' associated with child protection—the variable level of child protection notifications, the fact that one fifth of homes had inadequate policies or none at all on dealing with behaviour, problems with the fostering services with one third of them not undertaking the full range of checks on carers, over a quarter not undertaking annual reviews of carers, and many not updating medical records and criminal checks on carers. When I called it 'bureaucracy', I did so as shorthand; in practice, it is the difference between a safe and a dangerous

mewn gofal wyth gwaith yn fwy tebygol o ddiodef anhwylder meddyliol na rhai nad ydynt mewn gofal. Yn anffodus, mae'r adroddiad hwn yn ailgadarnhau eto yr hyn a wyddom yn barod am y system ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru: ysywaeth, maent ar ei hôl hi o'u cymharu â'u cyfoedion oherwydd system sydd angen ei diwygio ymhellach o hyd.

Ond rhaid inni beidio â llosgi'r fatres i ladd chwannen. Er gwaethaf eu beiau niferus, dylai cartrefi plant barhau'n gonglfaen y modd y gofalwn am blant yng Nghymru. Maent yn darparu strwythurau gwarcheidiaeth na all ffurfiau eraill ar ofal eu cyflawni, a rhaid inni warchod hynny.

Dywedwyd wrthym lawer gwaith nad yw'r system ofal a ddarparwn ar gyfer plant sy'n derbyn gofal yng Nghymru ddim yn cyflawni'r safonau uchel a osodwn ar gyfer ein plant mewn sectorau eraill o'r gymdeithas. Rhaid inni weithio'n llawer caletach i roi i'n plant sy'n derbyn gofal y mynediad a haeddant at gyfleoedd bywyd. Felly anogaf y Gweinidog yn gryf i drefnu bod plant sy'n derbyn gofal yn flaenoriaeth allweddol i Lywodraeth y Cynulliad yn ystod y blynyddoedd nesaf.

**Jenny Randerson:** Hoffwn innau ddiolch i Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru am y gwaith hanfodol y mae'n ei gyflawni. Mae'n waith cymhleth, oherwydd anawsterau arolygu sector mor amrywiol.

Ynglŷn â phlant, hoffwn ddechrau drwy fynegi fy mhryderon fy hun, yn ogystal ag ailadrodd y pryderon hynny a fynegwyd gan eraill, ynghylch rhai o'r bylchau sydd i'w cael, fe ymddengys, yn yr hyn y gellid, er mwyn bod yn gryno, ei alw y 'fiwrocraetiaeth' sydd yn gysylltiedig ag amddiffyn plant—lefel amrywiol hysbysiadau amddiffyn plant, y ffaith bod gan un cartref o bob pump bolisiau annigonol neu eu bod heb rai o gwbl ar gyfer delio ag ymddygiad, problemau gyda'r gwasanaethau maethu gyda thraean ohonynt heb wneud yr amrediad llawn o archwiliadau ar ofalwyr, dros eu chwarter heb ymgymryd ag adolygiadau blynyddol ar ofalwyr, a llawer heb ddiweddarau cofnodion meddygol a gwiriadau troseddol ar ofalwyr. Pan elwais y peth yn 'fiwrocraetiaeth',

environment for our young people. The reality of these gaps is that tragedies are still waiting to happen out there, and we still have a situation in which our most vulnerable children are at risk.

I now turn to adults, and repeat the concerns expressed earlier about the loss of care beds. There is an uneven picture across Wales, but I know the picture in Cardiff best, and the situation here is very serious. It is closely related to the key issue of bedblocking, which, in turn, is closely related to the efficiency and effectiveness of our hospitals, through to the accident and emergency departments and the ambulance service; it is all an interlinked chain. If we could get the issue of the number of care home beds right, then we would be well on the way to solving the problem. My colleagues have already raised the number of beds lost, but I will just say that, in one year, 640 beds went, which is a 2 per cent loss. We should be working in the other direction of course.

There are tremendous challenges facing care homes at the moment, the first of which is staffing. I believe that there is a 40 per cent annual turnover in staffing in the sector. That is not surprising, because staff, generally, are very poorly paid, and they will not be affected by 'Agenda for Change'. If anything, it will put them at even more of a disadvantage in relation to carers working in the NHS.

There is also the issue of safety and the new care home regulations. We all support those, but they will have a financial impact on the sector. David Melding has raised the impact of the Regulatory Reform (Fire Safety) Order 2005, and the problems associated with not just the cost of reaching those standards, but also the timescale. How is this possibly going to be implemented by 1 April, as suggested by the Office of the Deputy Prime Minister?

4.50 p.m.

All these issues link to the core issue of care

gwneuthum hynny er mwyn bod yn gryno; yn ymarferol, dyna'r gwahaniaeth rhwng amgylchedd diogel a pheryglus i'n pobl ifanc. Y gwir ynglŷn â'r bylchau hyn yw bod perygl i drychinebau ddigwydd o hyd, ac mae gennym sefyllfa o hyd lle y mae ein plant mwyaf bregus mewn perygl.

Trof yn awr at oedolion, ac ailadrodd y pryderon a leisiwyd yn gynharach ynghylch colli gwelyau gofal. Ceir darlun anwastad ar draws Cymru, ond y sefyllfa yng Nghaerdydd yw'r un yr wyf fwyaf cyfarwydd â hi, ac mae'r sefyllfa yma'n ddifrifol iawn. Mae'n perthyn yn agos i broblem allweddol blocio gwelyau, sydd, yn ei thro, â chysylltiad agos ag effeithlondeb ac effeithiolrwydd ein hysbytai, ac â'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys a'r gwasanaeth ambiwlans; mae'r cyfan yn gadwyn gydgysylltiol. Pe gallem ateb cwestiwn nifer y gwelyau mewn cartrefi gofal, yna byddem wedi gwneud llawer i ddatrys y broblem. Mae fy nghyd-Aelodau eisoes wedi crybwyll nifer y gwelyau a gollwyd, ond ni wnaf ond dweud bod 640 o welyau wedi diflannu mewn un flwyddyn, sef colled o 2 y cant. Dylem fod yn gweithio i'r cyfeiriad arall, wrth gwrs.

Mae sawl her enfawr yn wynebu cartrefi gofal ar hyn o bryd, a'r un gyntaf yw staffio. Credaf fod trosiant blyneddol o 40 y cant yn staff y sector. Nid yw hynny'n syndod, oherwydd y mae'r staff, ar y cyfan, ar gyflogau gwael iawn, ac ni fydd yr 'Agenda ar gyfer Newid' yn effeithio dim arnynt. Os rhywbeth, bydd yn eu rhoi dan anfantais fwy fyth o'u cymharu â gofalwyr sydd yn gweithio yn y GIG.

Hefyd mae diogelwch a'r rheoliadau newydd ar gyfer cartrefi gofal. Yr ydym i gyd yn cefnogi'r rhain, ond fe gânt effaith ariannol ar y sector. Mae David Melding wedi crybwyll effaith Gorchymyn Diwygio Rheoliadol (Diogelwch Tân) 2005, a'r problemau sy'n gysylltiedig nid yn unig â chost cyrraedd y safonau hynny, ond hefyd â'r amserlen. Sut yn y byd y gellir gweithredu hyn erbyn 1 Ebrill, fel yr awgrymodd Swyddfa Dirprwy Brif Weinidog y Deyrnas Unedig?

Mae'r materion hyn i gyd yn gysylltiedig â

home fees. Sector 7 guidance says that people should not have to pay top-up fees in care homes as a matter of course. However, in Cardiff, for example, it is virtually impossible to get a nursing home place without paying such a fee. Cardiff County Council now pays more to care home providers. It is working with the toolkit, and I am told by those who own care homes that it is making substantial progress and is ahead of many other local authorities.

The situation for those who are elderly mentally ill, those who suffer from dementia and Alzheimer's disease, is particularly serious in the Cardiff area. Minister, I would like you to be specific on this matter. We have been told, and the WLGA seems to think, that the toolkit will be out this autumn, but could you tell us whether it is expected this autumn? It costs roughly £325 to be kept in a hospital bed for a day, but it costs roughly the same amount to be kept in a care home bed for a week. Care homes provide extremely good value for money.

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** According to the indicative time, I would now normally call the Minister to reply, but I want to get the three Labour Members in who have not yet spoken, but I would appreciate short speeches, where possible.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** The Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales plays a crucial role in ensuring that all residential homes in Wales fulfil their statutory obligations to provide a high-quality professional service to older people. I use this opportunity to highlight a most concerning case in the Caerphilly borough that was first raised by Wayne David MP and has since resulted in the removal of all residents from the care home in question.

Wayne David MP looked into the standards of care at Holly House Nursing Home in Maesycwmer, Caerphilly, after a number of constituents came to him with their concerns. Holly House, a 35-bed private nursing home, registered to Puretruce Healthcare Ltd, has consistently broken care standards to the

chwestiwn craidd ffioedd cartrefi gofal. Dywed canllawiau Sector 7 na ddylai pobl orfod talu ffioedd atodol mewn cartrefi gofal fel arfer. Serch hynny, yng Nghaerdydd, er enghraifft, mae fwy neu lai'n amhosibl cael lle mewn cartref nyrsio heb dalu ffi o'r fath. Mae Cyngor Sir Caerdydd erbyn hyn yn talu mwy i ddarparwyr cartrefi gofal. Mae'n gweithio gyda'r pecyn cymorth, a dywed perchenogion cartrefi gofal wrthyf ei fod yn cymryd camau breision a'i fod ar y blaen i lawer o awdurdodau lleol eraill.

Mae'r sefyllfa i'r henoed sâl eu meddwl, rhai sydd yn dioddef gan ddemensia a chlefyd Alzheimer, yn arbennig o ddifrifol yn ardal Caerdydd. Weinidog, hoffwn ichi fod yn benodol ynghylch y mater hwn. Dywedwyd wrthym y bydd y pecyn cymorth ar gael yr hydref hwn, ac mae Cymdeithas Llywodraeth Leol Cymru fel pe bai'n credu hynny, ond a allwch ddweud wrthym a ddisgwylir ef yr hydref hwn? Mae'n costio £325 yn fras i gael eich cadw mewn gwely mewn ysbyty am ddiwrnod, ond mae'n costio tua'r un faint i gael eich cadw mewn gwely mewn cartref gofal am wythnos. Mae cartrefi gofal yn rhoi gwerth hynod o dda am yr arian.

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Yn ôl yr amser dangosol, fel arfer yn awr byddwn yn galw ar y Gweinidog i ymateb, ond mae arnaf eisiau rhoi cyfle i'r tri Aelod Llafur sydd heb siarad eto, ond byddwn yn gwerthfawrogi areithiau byr, lle y bo modd.

**Jeff Cuthbert:** Mae Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru'n chwarae rhan allweddol o ran sicrhau bod pob cartref preswyl yng Nghymru'n cyflawni ei ddyletswyddau statudol i ddarparu gwasanaeth proffesiynol o ansawdd da i bobl hŷn. Manteisiaf ar y cyfle hwn i dynnu sylw at achos sy'n destun cryn bryder ym mwrdeistref Caerffili, a godwyd gyntaf gan Wayne David AS ac sydd bellach wedi achosi i'r holl breswylwyr gael eu tynnu allan o'r cartref gofal dan sylw.

Ymchwiliodd Wayne David AS i'r safonau gofal yng Nghartref Nyrsio Holly House ym Maesycwmer, Caerffili, wedi i nifer o etholwyr ddod ato gyda'u pryderon. Mae Holly House, cartref nyrsio preifat 35 gwely, sydd wedi'i gofrestru yn enw Puretruce Healthcare Ltd, wedi torri safonau gofal yn

detriment of its residents. Holly House and a number of other care homes in Wales are owned by a Dr Prana Das. The Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales has played a crucial role in enforcing high standards in this case, and thanks must go to the inspectorate for its investigations.

Breaches in care reported at Holly House include one resident being found wandering in a car park even though it was a secure home, a resident being discovered asleep in a laundry cupboard and another on the floor of the lounge. In September 2003, an anonymous call was received from a member of staff at the care home, reporting that another member of staff physically restrained and struck a resident. That resulted in the suspension of the staff member and a police investigation. No action was taken, however, as the complainant refused to provide a witness statement. A month later, another resident was admitted to Caerphilly District Miners' Hospital, suffering from hypothermia.

As a result of Wayne David's consistent campaigning on the issue, a major breach of gas regulations, and an investigation by the care standards inspectorate, Holly House is currently not open for business. The inspectorate ruled that its residents were subject to institutional abuse. As a result, Holly House has been deregistered and is no longer able to receive residents from Caerphilly County Borough Council. However, Holly House has appealed to the Care Standards Tribunal and the hearing is set for January 2006.

The position in law of the Care Standards Tribunal is of central concern. I would be grateful, Minister, if your officials could look into the status of the Care Standards Tribunal to see whether it is the responsibility of Westminster or us in the Assembly, and whether we have power, under secondary legislation, to amend the regulations that govern the tribunal when it operates in Wales. I would be grateful if the Minister would also consider toughening the regulations that relate to the Care Standards Tribunal.

The Holly House debacle has highlighted an

gyson gan beri niwed i'w drigolion. Mae Holly House a nifer o gartrefi gofal eraill yng Nghymru yn eiddo i Dr Prana Das. Mae Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru wedi chwarae rhan allweddol o ran gorfodi safonau uchel yn yr achos hwn, a rhaid diolch i'r arolygiaeth am ei hymchwiliadau.

Ymhlith y diffygion yn y gofal yr adroddwyd amdanynt yn Holly House, canfuwyd un preswlydd yn crwydro mewn maes parcio er ei fod i fod yn gartref diogel, darganfuwyd preswlydd yn cysgu mewn cwpwrdd dillad ac un arall ar lawr y lolfa. Ym Medi 2003, cafwyd galwad ffôn ddienw oddi wrth aelod o staff y cartref gofal, yn dweud bod aelod arall o'r staff wedi dal preswlydd i lawr yn gorfforol ac wedi ei daro. Canlyniad hynny oedd atal yr aelod o'r staff o'i waith ac ymchwiliad gan yr heddlu. Ni weithredwyd, serch hynny, gan i'r achwynwr wrthod rhoi datganiad tyst. Fis yn ddiweddarach, derbyniwyd preswlydd arall i Ysbyty Glowyr Dosbarth Caerffili yn dioddef gan hypothermia.

O ganlyniad i ymgyrchu cyson Wayne David ar y mater, achos difrifol o dorri rheoliadau nwy, ac ymchwiliad gan yr arolygiaeth safonau gofal, nid yw Holly House yn gweithredu fel busnes ar hyn o bryd. Dyfarnodd yr arolygiaeth fod ei drigolion wedi dioddef cam-drin sefydliadol. O ganlyniad, datgofrestrowyd Holly House ac ni all dderbyn preswylwyr mwyach oddi wrth Gyngor Bwrdeistref Sirol Caerffili. Fodd bynnag, mae Holly House wedi apelio i'r Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal a gwrandewir yr achos yn Ionawr 2006.

Mae sefyllfa gyfreithiol y Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal o bwys canolog. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar, Weinidog, pe gallai eich swyddogion ymchwilio i statws y Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal i weld ai cyfrifoldeb San Steffan ynteu ein cyfrifoldeb ni yn y Cynulliad ydyw, ac yw'r grym gennym, dan is-ddeddfwriaeth, i ddiwygio'r rheoliadau sydd yn rheoli'r tribiwnlys pan fydd yn gweithredu yng Nghymru. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Gweinidog hefyd yn ystyried llymhau'r rheoliadau sy'n ymwneud â'r Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal.

Mae chwalfa Holly House wedi amlygu

anomaly that flows from the Care Standards Act 2000, whereby the tribunal now decides appeals on the basis of the current situation in a care home. Formerly, the Registered Homes Act 1984 ensured that the tribunal made decisions on the situation at the time that the regulatory authority took the decision to deregister a home. The Care Standards Act 2000 gives care homes too much leeway by allowing them a window of opportunity during which they can promise all manner of things to win an appeal.

Since the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales was established in 2001, only six homes have had their registration cancelled for failing in the care that they provide. Holly House has recently changed its name to Riverdale in an attempt to distance itself from this sad episode. This cannot be allowed to happen. I ask you, Minister, to give serious consideration to toughening up the legislation in Wales to ensure that older people receive only the highest possible care from private care homes.

**Lynne Neagle:** One of our greatest responsibilities as an Assembly and as a society is the protection of those members of that society who are the most vulnerable. I am sure that Assembly Members will join me in recognising the vital role played in this regard by the Care Standards Inspectorate for Wales. Caring for people who cannot care for themselves is a huge task. It takes good, dedicated staff, it takes the right systems and procedures, and it takes resources. However, for all the excellent staff, the facilities and the resources, if C SIW can find even one care setting that is lacking, then we must sit up and take notice. When the safety and wellbeing of vulnerable people is in the balance, it is time for action, vigilance and even legislation.

Amendment 2 seeks to condemn the Assembly Government for failing to adequately fund the residential and nursing home sectors. However, the most serious concern at a local level in my constituency is the failure on the part of one provider in the private sector—the aforementioned Dr Das—to adequately manage his operations, thus

anghysondeb sydd yn deillio o Ddeddf Safonau Gofal 2000, sef bod y tribiwnlys bellach yn penderfynu ar apeliadau ar sail y sefyllfa gyfredol mewn cartref gofal. Gynt, byddai Deddf Cartrefi Cofrestredig 1984 yn sicrhau y byddai'r tribiwnlys yn gwneud penderfyniadau ar sail y sefyllfa a fodolai ar yr adeg y gwnaeth yr awdurdod rheoleiddio y penderfyniad i ddatgofrestru cartref. Mae Deddf Safonau Gofal 2000 yn rhoi gormod o raff i gartrefi gofal drwy ganiatáu cyfle iddynt addo pob math o bethau er mwyn ennill apêl.

Ers sefydlu Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru yn 2001, dim ond chwe chartref y mae eu cofrestriad wedi ei ganslo oherwydd diffygion yn y gofal a ddarparant. Mae Holly House yn ddiweddar wedi newid ei enw i Riverdale er mwyn ceisio ymbellhau oddi wrth y bennod drist hon. Ni ellir caniatáu i hyn ddigwydd. Gofynnaf i chi, Weinidog, ystyried o ddifrif wneud y ddeddfwriaeth yn llymach yng Nghymru i sicrhau mai dim ond y gofal gorau posibl a gaiff pobl hŷn oddi wrth gartrefi gofal preifat.

**Lynne Neagle:** Un o'n cyfrifoldebau mwyaf fel Cynulliad ac fel cymdeithas yw amddiffyn yr aelodau hynny o'r gymdeithas honno sydd fwyaf bregus. Yr wyf yn siŵr y gwnaiff Aelodau'r Cynulliad ymuno â mi i gydnabod y rôl allweddol a chwaraeir yn hyn o beth gan Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru. Mae gofalu am bobl sydd yn methu gofalu amdanynt eu hunain yn dasg aruthrol. Mae'n galw am staff da, ymroddedig, mae'n galw am y systemau a'r gweithdrefnau iawn, ac mae'n galw am adnoddau. Fodd bynnag, er yr holl staff gwych, y cyfleusterau a'r adnoddau, os gall yr Arolygiaeth ddod o hyd i hyd yn oed un lleoliad gofal sydd yn ddiffygiol, yna rhaid inni roi sylw i hynny. Pan fo diogelwch a lles pobl fregus yn y fantol, mae'n amser i weithredu, bod yn wylidwrus a hyd yn oed ddeddfu.

Mae gwelliant 2 am gondemnio Llywodraeth y Cynulliad am fethu â darparu cyllid digonol i'r sectorau cartrefi preswyl a nyrsio. Fodd bynnag, y pryder mwyaf difrifol ar lefel leol yn fy etholaeth i yw methiant un darparwr yn y sector preifat—sef Dr Das y soniwyd amdano eisoes—i reoli ei fusnesau'n effeithiol, gan arwain felly at beryglu iechyd,

leading to the health, safety and wellbeing of vulnerable people being jeopardised.

It is rare for the CSIW to take the drastic step of cancelling the registration of a care provider, but that is what happened to one private provider in Torfaen, Dr Das, owing to a failure to ensure decent, appropriate and acceptable standards of care. CSIW recently took the decision to cancel the registration of the Beeches Residential Home in Blaenavon. The most recent inspection report was made public this week, and it details a whole raft of serious failings in the homes. As the cancellation of this registration may be subject to appeal, I do not wish to talk in too much detail about the case. Suffice it to say that this course of action is so rare, it tells us about the gravity of the situation. Indeed, CSIW has only ever issued six cancellation decisions on care homes since its inception in 2002, and, incredibly, four of those have been for homes with the same owner, including the Beeches and Holly House, which Jeff Cuthbert has just mentioned. However, due to the current legal framework, each of these closures has had to be pursued separately through the Care Standards Tribunal.

The annual report that we are considering today clearly points to the fact that there is still plenty of work to be done in improving care standards in Wales. It is vital therefore that the regulating body has available to it all the necessary tools to do the job. That is why I echo the call of my colleague, Jeff Cuthbert, and Wayne David MP for a change in how the Care Standards Tribunal operates. Account must be taken of the complete background to a case, including the record of an owner, rather than judging each case in isolation. I would perhaps go further still and suggest that reported systemic failure in one care home should trigger the immediate inspection of other homes owned by the same proprietor. To my mind, this would be consistent with the philosophy behind the Assembly Government's 'Making the Connections' agenda. It should be unacceptable that a care home owner could have owned eight care homes, overseen seven cancelled registrations, for example,

diogelwch a lles pobl fregus.

Peth prin yw i'r Arolygiaeth gymryd y cam difrifol o ddiddymu cofrestriad darparwr gofal, ond dyna beth a ddigwyddodd i un darparwr preifat yn Nhor-faen, Dr Das, oherwydd iddo fethu â sicrhau safonau gofal gweddus, priodol a derbynol. Yn ddiweddar, penderfynodd yr arolygiaeth ddiddymu cofrestriad Cartref Preswyl y Beeches ym Mlaenafon. Cyhoeddwyd adroddiad yr archwiliad diweddaraf yr wythnos hon, ac mae'n rhestru llu o ddiffygion difrifol yn y cartrefi. Gan y gall diddymu'r cofrestriad hwn fod yn destun apêl, nid oes arnaf eisiau siarad gormod am fanylion yr achos. Digon yw dweud bod gweithredu fel hyn yn beth mor brin, nes ei fod yn dweud wrthym am ddifrifoldeb y sefyllfa. Yn wir, dim ond chwe phenderfyniad i ddiddymu a gyhoeddodd yr arolygiaeth erioed ar gartrefi gofal ers ei sefydlu yn 2002, ac, yn anhygoel, bu pedwar o'r rheini ar gyfer cartrefi dan yr un perchennog, gan gynnwys y Beeches a Holly House, y mae Jeff Cuthbert newydd ei grybwyll. Fodd bynnag, oherwydd y fframwaith cyfreithiol cyfredol, bu'n rhaid gweithredu ym mhob un o'r achosion cau hyn ar wahân drwy'r Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal.

Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol yr ydym yn ei ystyried heddiw'n pwyntio'n glir at y ffaith bod digonedd o waith i'w wneud o hyd i wella safonau gofal yng Nghymru. Mae'n hanfodol felly fod yr holl arfau angenrheidiol ar gael i'r corff rheoleiddio i'w alluogi i wneud y gwaith. Dyna pam yr ategaf alwad fy nghyd-Aelod, Jeff Cuthbert, a Wayne David AS am newid yn y modd y mae'r Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal yn gweithredu. Rhaid rhoi ystyriaeth i holl gefndir achos, gan gynnwys hanes perchennog, yn hytrach na barnu pob achos ar ei ben ei hun. Efallai yr awn ymhellach fyth ac awgrymu y dylai adroddiad am fethiant systemig mewn un cartref gofal ysgogi arolwg yn syth o gartrefi eraill sydd ym meddiant yr un perchennog. Yn fy marn i, byddai hyn yn gyson â'r athroniaeth y tu ôl i agenda Llywodraeth y Cynulliad, 'Creu'r Cysylltiadau'. Dylai fod yn annerbynol iddi fod wedi bod yn bosibl i berchennog cartref gofal fod yn berchen ar wyth cartref gofal, bod yn gyfrifol am saith

and this not be taken into account should an inspector call for the closure of the eighth home. Such an owner cannot be allowed to get away with consistently failing to meet decent standards of care, including anything from chronic underinvestment, bad management and systemic neglect of service users, without facing tougher scrutiny and without robust action being taken.

The practice of running care homes into the ground for the sake of profit is morally repugnant and it cannot be allowed to continue in Wales. I know that the chief executive of CSIW will be meeting the president of the Care Standards Tribunal to discuss their experiences over the past two years, and I look forward to hearing the conclusions of that meeting. In the meantime, I ask the Minister to give serious consideration to how we can better help CSIW to do its job, and thereby to secure the consistently safe and decent care environment that vulnerable adults and children in Wales deserve.

5.00 p.m.

**Val Lloyd:** This annual report, as has been stated already by most speakers, is a welcome aid to the assessment of the effectiveness of the care services sector. As David said, it is also a readable document.

The amended approach to regulation, introduced some three years ago, as the report states, is paying dividends and the benefits of the new regulations and monitoring arrangements are clearly discernible within the current report. Having said that, progress must be built upon to reduce some of the failings illustrated by previous speakers, which remain within the service.

One way to address this issue in the future is to involve, in more detail, service users and their experiences to inform the process, and I am pleased that CSIW has identified the need for this and is already piloting several schemes to this end. As Sandy said, the focus on the service user must be strengthened, and I would be interested to learn of the outcomes of the pilot schemes.

cofrestrriad a gafodd eu diddymu, er enghraifft, a bod hyn heb gael ei ystyried pe bai arolygydd yn galw am gau'r wythfed cartref. Ni ellir caniatáu i berchennog o'r fath ddal ati i fethu'n gyson â sicrhau safonau gofal gweddus, gan gynnwys ffaeledau'n amrywio o danfuddsoddi cronig, rheoli gwael ac esgeuluso systemig ar ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaethau, heb iddo wynebu craffu llymach a heb i weithredu cadarn ddigwydd.

Mae'r arfer o redeg cartrefi gofal mewn modd esgeulus er mwyn elw yn atgas o safbwynt moesol ac ni ellir caniatáu iddo barhau yng Nghymru. Gwn y bydd prif weithredwr Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal Cymru'n cyfarfod â llywydd y Tribiwnlys Safonau Gofal i drafod eu profiadau yn ystod y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf, ac edrychaf ymlaen at glywed casgliadau'r cyfarfod hwnnw. Yn y cyfamser, gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog roi ystyriaeth ddirifol i sut y gallwn roi gwell help i'r arolygiaeth gyflawni ei gwaith, ac felly sicrhau'r amgylchedd gofal cyson ddiogel a gweddus y mae oedolion a phlant bregus yng Nghymru yn ei haeddu.

**Val Lloyd:** Mae'r adroddiad blynyddol hwn, fel y dywedwyd eisoes gan y rhan fwyaf o'r siaradwyr, yn gymorth i'w groesawu i asesu effeithiolrwydd y sector gwasanaethau gofal. Fel y dywedodd David, mae hefyd yn ddogfen ddarllenadwy.

Mae'r dull diwygiedig o ymdrin â rheoleiddio, a gyflwynwyd ryw dair blynedd yn ôl, fel y dywed yr adroddiad, yn talu ar ei ganfed ac mae manteision y rheoliadau a'r trefniadau monitro newydd yn amlwg yn yr adroddiad presennol. Wedi dweud hynny, rhaid adeiladu ar y cynnydd i leihau rhai o'r diffygion a ddangoswyd gan siaradwyr blaenorol, sy'n dal i fodoli yn y gwasanaeth.

Un ffordd o fynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn yn y dyfodol yw cynnwys defnyddwyr gwasanaethau a'u profiadau, yn fanylach, i ddylanwadu ar y broses, ac yr wyf yn falch bod ASGC wedi nodi'r angen am hyn a'i bod eisoes yn treialu amryw o gynlluniau i'r perwyl hwn. Fel y dywedodd Sandy, rhaid cryfhau'r ffocws ar ddefnyddwyr y gwasanaethau, a byddai gennyf ddiddordeb



mewn clywed am ganlyniadau'r cynlluniau peilot.

New inspection processes are being rolled out over a three-year period. I note that one of CSIW's key aims over this period of change is to develop

Mae prosesau arolygu newydd yn cael eu cyflwyno'n raddol dros gyfnod o dair blynedd. Nodaf mai un o nodau allweddol ASGC dros y cyfnod hwn o newid yw datblygu

'A new streamlined regulation-focused inspection which will include a significant element of self-assessment, placing a lesser burden on the provider and allowing inspectors to spend more time with service users'.

'Arolygiad newydd wedi'i symleiddio sy'n canolbwyntio ar reoleiddio a fydd yn cynnwys elfen sylweddol o hunanasesu, gan roi llai o faich ar y darparwr a galluogi arolygwyr i dreulio mwy o amser gyda defnyddwyr gwasanaethau'.

I hope that the results of the pilot schemes will inform the reforms to the system and assist in achieving a more user-centred focus. By having such an approach, I hope that we can eliminate some of the issues that remain in terms of service delivery. On care homes, specifically, children in these homes, as we already know, are likely to be more vulnerable and have a range of special needs that must be addressed if they are to build solid foundations for the future. It is somewhat reassuring to know that CSIW achieved a 100 per cent inspection target in respect of children's homes, with nearly an additional 4,000 monitoring visits made throughout the year. There has been an increase in the child protection work and the improvements within the sector have been identified, but it is still not enough.

Gobeithiaf y bydd canlyniadau'r cynlluniau peilot yn sail i'r diwygiadau i'r system ac y byddant o gymorth i sicrhau ffocws sy'n canolbwyntio mwy ar ddefnyddwyr. Drwy weithredu felly, gobeithiaf y gallwn gael gwared â rhai o'r problemau sy'n parhau o ran darparu gwasanaethau. O safbwynt cartrefi gofal, yn benodol, mae plant yn y cartrefi hyn, fel y gwyddom yn barod, yn debygol o fod yn fwy agored i niwed ac o fod ag amryw o anghenion arbennig y mae'n rhaid rhoi sylw iddynt os ydynt i sefydlu seiliau cadarn ar gyfer y dyfodol. Mae'n rhywfaint o galonddid gwybod bod ASGC wedi cyrraedd targed arolygu 100 y cant yng nghyswllt cartrefi plant, a bod bron 4,000 o ymweliadau monitro ychwanegol wedi cael eu cynnal yn ystod y flwyddyn. Cafwyd cynnydd yn y gwaith o amddiffyn plant a dynodwyd gwelliannau yn y sector, ond nid yw'n ddigon o hyd.

Some issues of concern remain, notably, as has been mentioned already, in terms of promoting the welfare of looked-after children and delivering universal high quality services. In areas of such importance, I would like to see further evaluation carried out to identify a strategic plan to drive up standards and build on the progress achieved in recent years. I would like the Minister's assurance that his team continues to work closely with CSIW to develop regulation and inspection services that will protect the most vulnerable children.

Erys rhai materion sy'n peri pryder, yn arbennig, fel y nodwyd eisoes, o ran hyrwyddo lles plant sy'n derbyn gofal a darparu gwasanaethau o ansawdd da bob amser. Mewn meysydd mor bwysig â hyn, hoffwn weld gwerthuso pellach yn cael ei wneud er mwyn cael cynllun strategol a fyddai'n gwella'r safonau ac yn adeiladu ar y cynnydd a wnaethpwyd dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf. Hoffwn gael sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog fod ei dîm yn dal i weithio'n agos gydag ASGC i ddatblygu gwasanaethau rheoleiddio ac arolygu a fydd yn amddiffyn y plant sydd fwyaf agored i niwed.

**The Minister for Health and Social Services (Brian Gibbons):** I will try to deal

**Y Gweinidog dros Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol (Brian Gibbons):** Ceisiaf

with as many as possible of the issues that were raised, but you will appreciate that a considerable number of points were raised in many contributions. I am pleased at the virtually universal agreement on the quality of the report, on its importance and on the general process adopted by CSIW in making a significant difference to the quality of social care in Wales.

Lynne Neagle and Jeff Cuthbert raised specific circumstances, and I will consider some of the wider generic issues that they raised. As you probably know, CSIW's chief executive is meeting the president of the tribunal and we need to receive a report on the outcome of the meeting before making any decisions.

In terms of managing the quality of care, the managers of homes, as well as the owners, are key factors. We need to ensure that managers are capable of delivering quality services and, where there is concern, for whatever reason, that CSIW is always allowed to make unannounced visits.

One of the issues that a number of speakers raised was the number of care beds currently in the sector. Notwithstanding Jenny Randerson's point, it is important that greater emphasis is placed on treating people and managing their care in their own homes. It is people's preference to be monitored and looked after in their own homes and communities, and that must be our priority.

The report shows that, although there is fluidity in the sector, there is also growing stability in the number of care places available. As we heard in the Health and Social Services Committee meeting, it is slightly artificial to look at pure numbers because a number of homes have reregistered their positions, particularly for adult placements and so on. Therefore, while the number of care home beds may have gone down, that figure may not fully reflect the overall situation with care home placement numbers. My understanding is that, largely, there is a balance between the number of homes deregistering and the number of new homes coming on stream.

ddelio â chynifer â phosibl o'r materion a godwyd, ond byddwch yn sylweddoli bod nifer sylweddol o bwyntiau wedi cael eu codi mewn llawer o'r cyfraniadau. Yr wyf yn falch bod pawb bron yn cytuno ar ansawdd yr adroddiad, ar ei bwysigrwydd ac ar y broses gyffredinol a fabwysiadwyd gan ASGC wrth wneud gwahaniaeth arwyddocaol i ansawdd gofal cymdeithasol yng Nghymru.

Cododd Lynne Neagle a Jeff Cuthbert amgylchiadau penodol, ac ystyriaf rai o'r materion cyffredinol ehangach a godwyd ganddynt. Fel y gwyddoch mae'n debyg, mae prif weithredwr ASGC yn cwrdd â llywydd y tribiwnlys ac mae angen inni gael adroddiad ar ganlyniad y cyfarfod cyn gwneud unrhyw benderfyniadau.

O ran rheoli ansawdd gofal, mae rheolwyr cartrefi, yn ogystal â'r perchenogion, yn ffactorau allweddol. Mae angen inni sicrhau bod rheolwyr yn gallu darparu gwasanaethau o safon a, lle y bo pryder, am ba reswm bynnag, fod ASGC bob amser yn cael ymweld yn ddirybudd.

Un o'r materion a godwyd gan nifer o siaradwyr oedd nifer y gwelyau gofal sydd yn y sector ar hyn o bryd. Er gwaethaf pwynt Jenny Randerson, mae'n bwysig bod mwy o bwyslais yn cael ei roi ar drin pobl a rheoli eu gofal yn eu cartrefi eu hunain. Mae'n well gan bobl gael eu monitro a chael gofal yn eu cartrefi a'u cymunedau eu hunain, a rhaid inni roi blaenoriaeth i hynny.

Mae'r adroddiad yn dangos, er bod y sector yn gyfnewidiol, fod sefydlogrwydd cynyddol hefyd o ran nifer y lleoedd gofal sydd ar gael. Fel y clywsom yng nghyfarfod y Pwyllgor Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol, mae rhywbeth yn artiffisial mewn edrych ar niferoedd yn unig oherwydd y mae nifer o gartrefi wedi ailgofrestru eu lleoedd, yn enwedig o ran lleoli oedolion ac yn y blaen. Felly, tra bo nifer gwelyau cartrefi gofal wedi gostwng efallai, mae'n bosibl nad yw'r ffigur hwnnw yn llwyr adlewyrchu'r sefyllfa drwyddi draw o ran nifer y lleoliadau mewn cartrefi gofal. Yn ôl yr hyn a ddeallaf, mae cydbwysedd, ar y cyfan, rhwng nifer y cartrefi sy'n datgofrestru a nifer y cartrefi newydd sy'n agor.

There is no doubt that one of the main ways of driving up quality is through improving staff performance. I was pleased last Friday to attend the Care Forum Wales awards in Cardiff. It was a tremendous evening, and I thank Care Forum Wales for the effort that it put into rewarding the people who provide good quality care. That follows on from the point that Sandy Mewies made about social care accolades. Again, those are a welcome recognition of the key contribution that staff in the social care sector make to the quality of life of those that they care for.

There is a need for more training. The social care development partnerships, which place a particular emphasis on the importance of training, and the increased responsibility that the Care Council for Wales is taking on in this area, mean that there will be increased investment in, and attention paid to, improving the quality of training and the level of qualifications of care standard staff.

Several Members referred to the situation in relation to children, particularly those with difficulties. It is a matter of concern that we have heard evidence on a number of occasions that up to 50 per cent of looked-after children have mental health problems. Obviously, some of their underlying mental health problems have contributed to their finding themselves in care, but there is evidence that some of the mental health problems that these children have arise from their experience of the care setting. That is not satisfactory, and it is important that the care setting does not induce such an adverse reaction in children.

The need for improved educational performance is important. The Minister for Education and Lifelong Learning is paying particular attention to the matter, because the level of educational achievement is much too low.

We all agree that the issue of fire safety is important. In fact, we know that in several circumstances, the risk of fire has become a reality for some care home residents, with serious and adverse effects. Bearing in mind that many people in care homes are there

Nid oes amheuaeth nad un o'r prif ffyrdd o wella ansawdd yw drwy wella perfformiad y staff. Ddydd Gwener diwethaf yr oeddwn yn falch o fynd i wobrau Fforwm Gofal Cymru yng Nghaerdydd. Yr oedd yn noson arbennig, a diolchaf i Fforwm Gofal Cymru am yr ymdrech a wnaeth i wobrwyo'r bobl sy'n darparu gofal safonol. Mae hynny'n dilyn y pwynt a wnaeth Sandy Mewies am anrhydeddau ym maes gofal cymdeithasol. Eto, maent yn gydnabyddiaeth i'w chroesawu o'r cyfraniad allweddol y mae staff yn y sector gofal cymdeithasol yn ei wneud tuag at ansawdd bywyd y rhai y maent yn gofalu amdanynt.

Mae angen rhagor o hyfforddiant. Mae'r partneriaethau datblygu gofal cymdeithasol, sy'n rhoi pwyslais neilltuol ar bwysigrwydd hyfforddiant, a'r cyfrifoldeb cynyddol y mae Cyngor Gofal Cymru yn ei ysgwyddo yn y maes hwn, yn golygu y ceir mwy o fuddsoddi i wella ansawdd hyfforddiant a lefel cymwysterau staff gofal cymdeithasol, ac y rhoddir mwy o sylw i hynny.

Cyfeiriodd sawl Aelod at y sefyllfa mewn perthynas â phlant, yn enwedig y rhai sydd ag anawsterau. Mae'n peri pryder ein bod wedi clywed tystiolaeth droeon fod gan hyd at 50 y cant o'r plant sy'n derbyn gofal broblemau iechyd meddwl. Yn amlwg, mae rhai o'u problemau iechyd meddwl gwaelodol wedi cyfrannu at y sefyllfa sydd wedi peri iddynt gael eu rhoi mewn gofal, ond mae tystiolaeth bod rhai o broblemau iechyd meddwl y plant hyn wedi deillio o'u profiad o'r sefydliad gofal. Nid yw hynny'n foddhaol, ac mae'n bwysig nad yw'r sefydliad gofal yn ennyn y fath ymateb andwyol mewn plant.

Mae'r angen i wella perfformiad addysgol yn bwysig. Mae'r Gweinidog dros Addysg a Dysgu Gydol Oes yn rhoi sylw arbennig i'r mater, gan fod lefel y cyrhaeddiad addysgol yn llawer rhy isel.

Yr ydym i gyd yn cytuno bod diogelwch rhag tân yn fater pwysig. Yn wir, gwyddom mewn amryw o amgylchiadau, fod y perygl o dân wedi dod yn realiti i rai trigolion mewn cartrefi gofal, gydag effeithiau difrifol ac andwyol. O gofio bod llawer o bobl mewn

because of their lack of mobility or cognitive function, making it difficult for them to react quickly to a challenge, particularly one such as fire, it is clear that we cannot allow the importance of improving fire standards to be underestimated. I recognise the challenge for the sector, but there is a significant increase in investment contained in the draft budget for this year. There is also a relatively small budget line for the toolkit, which is not the total amount that should be spent on implementing the toolkit. However, that small amount is there to reflect our recognition of the toolkit's importance.

To deal with Jenny Randerson's point, I am not in a position to give a precise date for the start of the toolkit's regular use. However, I hope that, through the assistance provided in the draft budget, many of the issues concerning the quality and appropriate location of care will be addressed.

5.10 p.m.

I thank the Assembly for its positive recognition of the work of CSIW in improving care for some of the most vulnerable in our society.

cartrefi gofal yno oherwydd eu diffyg symudedd neu oherwydd eu bod yn ddiffygiol o ran gweithrediad gwybyddol, sy'n ei gwneud yn anodd iddynt ymateb yn gyflym i her, yn enwedig her megis tân, mae'n amlwg na allwn ganiatáu i bwysigrwydd gwella'r safonau tân gael ei ddiystyru. Yr wyf yn sylweddoli'r her i'r sector, ond mae cynnydd sylweddol o ran buddsoddiad wedi ei gynnwys yn y gyllideb ddrafft ar gyfer y flwyddyn hon. Mae hefyd linell gymharol fach yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y pecyn cymorth, ac nid hynny yw'r cyfanswm a ddylai gael ei wario ar weithredu'r pecyn. Fodd bynnag, mae'r swm bach hwnnw yno i adlewyrchu ein cydnabyddiaeth o bwysigrwydd y pecyn cymorth.

A delio â phwynt Jenny Randerson, nid wyf yn gallu rhoi dyddiad manwl ar gyfer dechrau defnyddio'r pecyn cymorth yn rheolaidd. Fodd bynnag, gobeithiaf, drwy'r cymorth a ddarperir yn y gyllideb ddrafft, y bydd llawer o'r materion yn ymwneud ag ansawdd y gofal a lleoli'r gofal yn briodol yn cael sylw.

Diolchaf i'r Cynulliad am ei gydnabyddiaeth gadarnhaol o waith ASGC wrth wella'r gofal i rai o'r unigolion sydd fwyaf agored i niwed yn ein cymdeithas.

*Gwelliant 1: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 1: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian

Graham, William  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, David  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Melding, David  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 2: O blaid 26, Ymatal 1, Yn erbyn 27.  
 Amendment 2: For 26, Abstain 1, Against 27.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Neagle, Lynne

Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

Pugh, Alun  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda

Ymataliodd yr Aelod canlynol:  
The following Member abstained:

Mewies, Sandy

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
Amendment defeated.*

*Gwelliant 3: O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amendment 3: For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet

Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment carried.*

*Gwelliant 4: O blaid 26, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 28.  
 Amendment 4: For 26, Abstain 0, Against 28.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
 The following Members voted for:

Bates, Mick  
 Black, Peter  
 Bourne, Nick  
 Burnham, Eleanor  
 Cairns, Alun  
 Davies, Glyn  
 Davies, Janet  
 Davies, Jocelyn  
 Francis, Lisa  
 German, Michael  
 Graham, William  
 Isherwood, Mark  
 Jones, Alun Ffred  
 Jones, Helen Mary  
 Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
 Jones, Laura Anne  
 Lloyd, David  
 Melding, David  
 Morgan, Jonathan  
 Randerson, Jenny  
 Ryder, Janet  
 Thomas, Owen John  
 Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
 Williams, Brynle  
 Williams, Kirsty  
 Wood, Leanne

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol yn erbyn:  
 The following Members voted against:

Andrews, Leighton  
 Barrett, Lorraine  
 Butler, Rosemary  
 Chapman, Christine  
 Cuthbert, Jeff  
 Davidson, Jane  
 Davies, Andrew  
 Dunwoody, Tamsin  
 Essex, Sue  
 Gibbons, Brian  
 Gregory, Janice  
 Griffiths, John  
 Gwyther, Christine  
 Hart, Edwina  
 Hutt, Jane  
 Idris Jones, Denise  
 James, Irene  
 Jones, Ann  
 Jones, Carwyn  
 Lewis, Huw  
 Lloyd, Val  
 Mewies, Sandy  
 Neagle, Lynne  
 Pugh, Alun  
 Sargeant, Carl  
 Sinclair, Karen  
 Thomas, Catherine  
 Thomas, Gwenda

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant.  
 Amendment defeated.*

Cynnig NDM2663 fel y'i diwygiwyd:  
 Motion NDM2663 as amended:

*the National Assembly for Wales notes the  
 publication of the annual report of the Care  
 Standards Inspectorate for Wales for the  
 period 2004-05,*

*regrets that some children's homes are still  
 failing to meet statutory obligations, and*

*congratulates the Care Standards*

*Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn nodi  
 cyhoeddi adroddiad blynyddol Arolygiaeth  
 Safonau Gofal Cymru ar gyfer y cyfnod  
 2004-05,*

*yn gresynu bod rhai cartrefi plant yn dal i  
 fethu â chyflawni ymrwymadau statudol, ac*

*yn llongyfarch Arolygiaeth Safonau Gofal*

*Inspectorate for Wales on its work in Cymru ar ei gwaith o amddiffyn oedolion a phlant sy'n agored i niwed.*

*Cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd (NDM2663): O blaid 54, Ymatal 0, Yn erbyn 0.  
Amended motion (NDM2663): For 54, Abstain 0, Against 0.*

Pleidleisiodd yr Aelodau canlynol o blaid:  
The following Members voted for:

Andrews, Leighton  
Barrett, Lorraine  
Bates, Mick  
Black, Peter  
Bourne, Nick  
Burnham, Eleanor  
Butler, Rosemary  
Cairns, Alun  
Chapman, Christine  
Cuthbert, Jeff  
Davidson, Jane  
Davies, Andrew  
Davies, Glyn  
Davies, Janet  
Davies, Jocelyn  
Dunwoody, Tamsin  
Essex, Sue  
Francis, Lisa  
German, Michael  
Gibbons, Brian  
Graham, William  
Gregory, Janice  
Griffiths, John  
Gwyther, Christine  
Hart, Edwina  
Hutt, Jane  
Idris Jones, Denise  
Isherwood, Mark  
James, Irene  
Jones, Alun Ffred  
Jones, Ann  
Jones, Carwyn  
Jones, Helen Mary  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn  
Jones, Laura Anne  
Lewis, Huw  
Lloyd, David  
Lloyd, Val  
Melding, David  
Mewies, Sandy  
Morgan, Jonathan  
Neagle, Lynne  
Pugh, Alun  
Randerson, Jenny  
Ryder, Janet  
Sargeant, Carl  
Sinclair, Karen  
Thomas, Catherine  
Thomas, Gwenda  
Thomas, Owen John  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn  
Williams, Brynle  
Williams, Kirsty  
Wood, Leanne

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd.*



*Amended motion carried.*

**The Deputy Presiding Officer:** That **Y Dirprwy Lywydd:** Daw hynny â completes business for this afternoon. chyfarfod heddiw i ben.

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 5.13 p.m.  
The meeting ended at 5.13 p.m.*

**Aelodau a'u Pleidiau  
Members and their Parties**

Andrews, Leighton (Llafur – Labour)  
Barrett, Lorraine (Llafur – Labour)  
Bates, Mick (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Black, Peter (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Bourne, Nick (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Burnham, Eleanor (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Butler, Rosemary (Llafur – Labour)  
Cairns, Alun (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Chapman, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Cuthbert, Jeff (Llafur – Labour)  
Davidson, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, Andrew (Llafur – Labour)  
Davies, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Glyn (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Davies, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Davies, Jocelyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Dunwoody, Tamsin (Llafur - Labour)  
Elis-Thomas, Dafydd (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Essex, Sue (Llafur – Labour)  
Francis, Lisa (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
German, Michael (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Graham, William (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Gregory, Janice (Llafur – Labour)  
Griffiths, John (Llafur – Labour)  
Gibbons, Brian (Llafur – Labour)  
Gwyther, Christine (Llafur – Labour)  
Hart, Edwina (Llafur – Labour)  
Hutt, Jane (Llafur – Labour)  
Idris Jones, Denise (Llafur – Labour)  
Isherwood, Mark (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
James, Irene (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Alun Ffred (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ann (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Carwyn (Llafur – Labour)  
Jones, Elin (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Helen Mary (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Ieuan Wyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Jones, Laura Anne (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Law, Peter (Annibynnol – Independent)  
Lewis, Huw (Llafur – Labour)  
Lloyd, David (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Lloyd, Val (Llafur – Labour)  
Marek, John (Cymru Ymlaen – Forward Wales)  
Melding, David (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Mewies, Sandy (Llafur – Labour)  
Morgan, Jonathan (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Morgan, Rhodri (Llafur – Labour)  
Neagle, Lynne (Llafur – Labour)  
Pugh, Alun (Llafur – Labour)  
Randerson, Jenny (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Ryder, Janet (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Sargeant, Carl (Llafur – Labour)  
Sinclair, Karen (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Catherine (Llafur – Labour)

Thomas, Gwenda (Llafur – Labour)  
Thomas, Owen John (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Thomas, Rhodri Glyn (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)  
Williams, Brynle (Ceidwadwyr Cymru – Welsh Conservatives)  
Williams, Kirsty (Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru – Welsh Liberal Democrats)  
Wood, Leanne (Plaid Cymru – The Party of Wales)